METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

Policy Advisory Council Equity and Access Committee

Friday, December 4, 2020

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU, AND WELCOME TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. I'M VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR, HERE WITH ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, VICE CHAIR, SO WE'RE MEETING TODAY AT 10:05 A.M. ON DECEMBER 4TH. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER, AND WE HAVE STARTED THE RECORDING. SO MAY I HAVE A ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM A QUORUM?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: PLEASE ROLL THE BROADCASTING TAPE.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: PLEASE ROLL THE BROADCASTING TAPE. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE BAAQMD WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VEDA, YOU ARE MUTED. I AM ASSUMING YOU ASKED FOR A ROLL CALL. FLOREZ?

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ELDRED?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, V. CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: BURNETT? COATS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

RICK COATES: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: GOTUACO?

KRISTINA GOTUACO: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: HEDGES? I SAW YOU.

RICHARD HEDGES: YES. HERE THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: HERNANDEZ? LOPEZ? LOPEZ? MOMOH?

RAHMON MOMOH: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OZIM? KINMAN, ALTERNATE?

RANDI KINMAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCOTT, ALTERNATE?

TERRY SCOTT: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: QUORUM IS PRESENT. ALTERNATES ARE NOT NEEDED FOR A VOTE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: MOVING TO ITEM THREE APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 6TH MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 6TH, 2020 MEETING MINUTES?

RICK COATES: I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THE MINUTES.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: GO AHEAD.

RICK COATES: THEY SEEM RATHER SPARSE. AND I NOTE THAT THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS COMMENTS DON'T SEEM TO BE INCLUDED IN THE MINUTES. IS THAT NORMAL PROCEDURE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. WE SWITCHED TO ACTION MINUTES WHEN WE MOVED TO GRANICUS YEARS AGO.

RICK COATES: I SEE. THANK YOU.

RANDI KINMAN: SO, IF I MIGHT, RICK, IF YOU ARE EVER LOOKING FOR WHAT HAPPENED AT THE MEETING, YOU CAN GO BACK ON TO LEGISTAR AND WATCH THE MEETING.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AND DO I HEAR A MOTION TO ACCEPT THE MINUTES?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, V. CHAIR: SO MOVE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THAT'S ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED. AND DO I HEAR A SECOND?

RAHMON MOMOH: SECOND. RAHMON.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU RAHMON MOMOH, SECOND. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR, MAY I HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE THAT. OKAY. ON TO ITEM NUMBER FOUR, AGENDA ITEM, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 EQUITY ANALYSIS, COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN UPDATE AND EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT FRAMEWORK. SO, PLEASE GO AHEAD AND MAKE YOUR PRESENTATION.

ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU VEDA, AND GOOD MORNING COUNCIL MEMBERS. I WILL JUST WAIT FOR OUR TEAM TO PULL UP THE SLIDES. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, AGAIN, MY NAME IS ANUP TAPASE, PLANNER AT MTC, ABAG AND I AM LEADING THE EQUITY ANALYSIS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I AM ALSO JOINED BY DAVE VAUTIN, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROJECT MANAGER. TODAY, WE ARE BRINGING YOU, AGAIN, THE MATERIALS THAT WERE SHARED ABOUT A MONTH AGO, WITH THE SAME

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE, BUT WITH SOME ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND AND DETAIL,
2 AND ALSO TO ENABLE MORE DISCUSSION, SINCE THE ITEM WAS QUITE
3 RUSHED LAST TIME, GIVEN THE LIMITED TIME WE HAD. SO LET'S
4 START WITH THE AGENDA ON PAGE TWO. WE HAVE -- WE ORGANIZED THE
5 AGENDA TO CREATE MORE BITE SIZED CHUNKS AND WE HAVE DISCUSSION
6 BREAKS AT THE END OF EACH ITEM. WE HAVE COMMUNITIES OF
7 CONCERN, AND LAST TIME THERE WAS SOME CONFUSION ON HOW WE USE
8 THIS NOT ONLY IN THE PLAN BUT OUTSIDE THE PLAN AS WELL, AND
9 ALWAYS BACKGROUND AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. WE WILL GET INTO
10 HOW DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGES USING THE MOST RECENT DATA AFFECTING
11 THE LOCATION OF COCS SINCE LAST TIME THEN GET INTO DISCUSSION
12 WHAT WE THINK LIMITATIONS ARE GIVEN COMMUNITIES ARE CONCERN
13 AND CURRENT METHODOLOGY, AND BEGIN THE CONVERSATION ON HOW WE
14 WANT TO REFRAME THIS IN THE LONGER TERM, BUT WHAT ACTIONS WE
15 CAN TAKE IN THE SHORT-TERM WITHIN THE COURSE OF THE PLAN TO
16 ADDRESS THE LIMITATIONS. AND, WE WILL ALSO TALK ABOUT THE
17 NOMENCLATURE, COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. AND THEN FINALLY, WE
18 WILL GIVE A QUICK OVERVIEW OF WHAT WE PLAN TO INCLUDE IN THE
19 EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT FOR THE PLAN AND ALSO DISCUSS TIMELINE
20 AND NEXT STEPS. SO THERE WERE ALSO ATTACHMENTS POSTED ALONG
21 WITH THE MATERIALS, WHICH ARE THE SAME AS LAND ROUND LAST
22 MONTH, IN ADDITION RESPOND DIRECTLY TO SOME COUNCIL MEMBERS
23 REQUESTS, WE CREATED A SUPPLEMENTAL HAND OUT WHICH WAS POSTED
24 LAST NIGHT, WE CREATED AN INTERACTIVE WEB MAP WITH CREATED
25 CONSENSUS TRACTS WHICH SHOW CHANGES, I APOLOGIZE WE TRIED TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

GET THIS OUT SOONER SO YOU WOULD HAVE TIME TO REVIEW BUT OUR DAYS ARE CRUNCHED WITH FINAL BLUEPRINT RELEASE SO IF DESIRED WE CAN PULL UP THE WEB MAP ON THE SCREEN AND WALK THROUGH SOME TRACKS AS WELL IF YOU WANT TO DURING THE DISCUSSION. I WANT TO MAKE THIS MEETING AS INTERACTIVE AS POSSIBLE DUE TO THE NATURE OF THE CONTENT RATHER THAN ONE WITH JUST PRESENTATIONS, SO FEEL FREE TO ASK QUESTIONS AT ANY POINT. FIRST COMMUNITIES OF BACKGROUND, HOW WE USE THEM AND DEMOGRAPHICS. SOME OF THESE SLIDES GIVEN WE HAVE ALREADY SHARED WITH YOU I MIGHT GO OVER THEM QUICKER BUT WILL TAKE THE NEWER SLIDES SLOWLY. COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN ARE DESIGNATED GEOGRAPHIES, MORE SPECIFICALLY CENSUS TRACTS THAT HAVE HIGH CONCENTRATIONS OF UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS BASED ON PREDETERMINED THRESHOLDS FOR EIGHT DISADVANTAGE FACTORS. AND FACTORS BEYOND INCOME STATUS SUCH AS RACE, ETHNICITY, DISABILITY STATUS AND LANGUAGE. SINCE OUR MODEL CANNOT PREDICT WHERE THESE DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS MAY LOCATE IN THE FUTURE. FOR PURPOSES DISPAR RAT IMPACT ANALYSIS LOCATIONS OF COCS WITHIN BAY AREA ARE ASSUMED TO BE SIMILAR TO TODAY IN 2050. CENSUS DATA AVAILABLE EVERY FOUR YEARS AS PART OF OUR PLANNED BAY AREA PROCESS SINCE 2009 FURTHER AND INTERMITTENT UPDATE PROVIDED IN 20182 YEARS AGO. EVERY TIME WE UPDATE THEM WE SHARE AN UPDATE WITH THIS COUNCIL AND OTHER COMMITTEES, GO OVER THE MAJOR CHANGES. AS MENTIONED LAST MONTH WHEN WE PICKED UP THE PLAN AND ENGAGEMENT WITH THE REGIONAL EQUITY WORKING GROUP IN 2019, WE ACKNOWLEDGED THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 THE PROCESS OF DESIGNATED COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN HAS
2 WEAKNESSES, AND WE DO NEED TO RETHINK THE METHODOLOGY. AND
3 ALSO, THAT THIS WOULD NOT BE FEASIBLE DURING THE PLAN TIMELINE
4 GIVEN WE WANTED TO SPEND STAFF RESOURCES TO TACKLE EQUITY AND
5 JUSTICE IN THE PLAN HEAD ON AND BE UP FRONT HOW WE SHAPE THE
6 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN TO BE MORE EQUITABLE RATHER THAN COMING
7 UP WITH MITIGATED ACTIONS AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PLAN. TODAY
8 IS A PRESENTATION TO MAKE US ALL AWARE OF THE IMPACT, AND
9 START CONVERSATION HOW WE MIGHT REFRAME THE CONCEPT AND
10 METHODOLOGY OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. LET
11 ME ALSO PROVIDE BACKGROUND ON HOW WE USE COMMUNITIES OF
12 CONCERN AND THIS WAS NOT SHARED LAST MONTH. WITHIN PLANNED BAY
13 AREA, WE USE IT FOR, OF COURSE, THE EQUITY ANALYSIS OF PLAN
14 OUTCOMES, THE DISPARATE IMPACT AND ANALYSIS. ALSO WE USED IT
15 FOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECT PERFORMANCE WHEN WE WERE
16 DETERMINING DURING THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE PROCESS WHERE WE
17 WERE PRIORITIZING MAJOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS WE DID AN
18 ANALYSIS OF HOW THEY IMPACT COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN FURTHERMORE
19 ALSO USE IT FOR THE EJ ANALYSIS. ALSO IN MANY OF OUR PLAN
20 STRATEGIES, SUCH AS COMMUNITY LED INVESTMENTS OR EMERGENCY
21 RENTAL ASSISTANCE, OR PARK AND STREET INVESTMENTS WE DO
22 OUTLINE IN THE DEFINITION OF THE STRATEGIES THAT THESE
23 INVESTMENTS WILL BE PRIORITIZED IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SO
24 WHILE THIS IS STILL JUST PLANNED BAY AREA, APART FROM OF PLAN
25 AND PROGRAMS MORE IMPORTANTLY COMMUNITIES ARE CONCERN ARE USED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 IN OTHER FUNDING PROGRAMS TO DETERMINE ALLOCATIONS, ALTHOUGH
2 THEY USE DIFFERENTLY IN DIFFERENT PROGRAMS. FOR EXAMPLE, IN
3 THE REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, THIS PROGRAM
4 ALLOWS AGENCIES TO USE MTC'S COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN DEFINITION
5 TO QUALIFY AS A DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY, AS DEFINED BY SB535
6 STATE PROGRAM GUIDELINES. EACH CYCLE, THE REGION MUST MEET THE
7 STATE'S 25 PERCENT DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY MINIMUM FUNDING
8 REQUIREMENT IN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. SO THE COMMUNITIES OF
9 CONCERN DEFINITION MEETS THE LEGISLATIVE INTENT AND MTC RELIES
10 ON COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN TO MEET THE STATE REQUIREMENTS SINCE
11 THE START OF THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IN 2013. THE
12 BIKESHARE EQUITY PROGRAM USES COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AS A
13 CRITERIA TO INFORM WHERE THEY PRIORITIZE INSTALLATION OF
14 BIKESHARE FACILITIES. IN THE LIFELINE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM
15 COUNTIES CAN APPLY FOR GRANTS TO CREATE COMMUNITY-BASED
16 TRANSPORTATION PLANS FOR COMMUNITIES OR NEIGHBORHOODS OF
17 CONCERN. THE LIFETIME TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM FUNDS PROJECTS
18 RECOMMENDED BY THESE PLANS IN THOSE AREAS. NOT SHOWN ON THE
19 SLIDE HERE, ALSO, FOR THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND SUSTAINABLE
20 COMMUNITIES PROGRAM, COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN ARE USED LIGHTLY,
21 THEY ARE GIVEN THE SAME PRIORITY AS DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES
22 FOR GRANTS. SO, WHY STATE HEAVILY RELIES ON SB 535,
23 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES INFORM BY CALENVIROSCREEN, MTC ABAG
24 USES COC DESIGNATIONS WHERE POSSIBLE AS A CRITERIA BUT THERE
25 ARE QUITE A FEW AREAS THAT COCS CAPTURE, THERE ARE QUITE A FEW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 PARTS OF THE REGION THAT COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN CAPTURE THAT
2 WE DON'T FEEL THE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ADEQUATELY
3 CAPTURE, AT LEAST FOR THE PURPOSES OF RACIAL AND INCOME EQUITY
4 ANALYSIS, ESPECIALLY IN NORTH BAY LIKE SONOMA, NAPA, MARIN,
5 PARTS OF SF, SAN FRANCISCO, LIKE MISSION DISTRICT, FOR
6 EXAMPLE, ARE NOT CAPTURED BY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES
7 ADEQUATELY, AREAS IN HAYWARD, SAN JOSE AS WELL. BEYOND MTC AND
8 ABAG, THIS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN FRAMEWORK IS USED BY OTHER
9 BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AND COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
10 AUTHORITIES AS WELL, AND WE KNOW THAT THIS METHODOLOGY HAS
11 ALSO BEEN USED AS AN INSPIRATION FOR AGENCIES OUTSIDE THE BAY
12 AREA AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE EIGHT DISADVANTAGED
13 FACTORS ARE ON THE NEXT PAGE, THE TWO DEFINITIONS WE USE TO
14 IDENTIFY SENSE US TRACTS, THOSE OF SIGNIFICANT CONCENTRATION
15 OF COLOR AND PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME AND SECOND DEFINITION IS,
16 IF IT HAS A CONCENTRATION OF PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME, AS WELL
17 AS ANY THREE OF THE SIX REMAINING FACTORS. SO WE PROPOSE FOR
18 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT WE WILL RETAIN THESE DEFINITIONS,
19 BUT REFRESH THE UNDERLYING DATA ACKNOWLEDGING THAT LONGER TERM
20 REFINEMENTS MAY BE NEEDED. THIS UPDATE, AS I MENTIONED, LAST
21 MONTH, HAS BEEN POSTED ONLINE WITH THE FULL TECHNICAL
22 DOCUMENTATION AND MAP LAYERS. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. SO, AGAIN,
23 THIS IS WHERE WE CALCULATE THE CONCENTRATION THRESHOLDS, TO
24 DETERMINE THOSE DESIGNATIONS. THE FIRST STEP -- WELL, THE
25 FIRST COLUMN IS THE EIGHT DISADVANTAGED FACTORS. THE FIRST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 STEP IS TO DETERMINE THE SHARE OF BAY AREA POPULATION FOR EACH
2 OF THESE FACTORS. THE FIRST COLUMN WITH THE NUMBERS IS THE
3 SHARE CALCULATED DURING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 SECOND COLUMN
4 SHOWS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. NOW THE REASON WE DO THIS IS TO
5 CAPTURE THE FACT THAT MAYBE CONCENTRATIONS ARE LOWER OR HIGHER
6 ACROSS THE REGION, AS IS THE CASE WITH LOW INCOME. SO YOU CAN
7 SEE IN THE SECOND ROW, PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME, THAT IS BELOW
8 200 PERCENT OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL THAT SHARE DECREASED
9 FROM 25 TO 21 PERCENT ACROSS THE REGION. SHARE OF PEOPLE OF
10 COLOR TWO PERCENT WHEREAS IMPACTORS HAVE CONSISTENTLY CHANGED
11 BY ONE PERCENT. THE CONCENTRATIONS OF THE MAP EXERCISE
12 CALCULATED AS THE MEAN FROM THE FIRST STEP PLUS A HALF
13 STANDARD OF DEVIATION ACROSS CENSUS TRACTS. THIS IS MEANT TO
14 CAPTURE OVERALL TRENDS ACROSS THE REGION, FOR EXAMPLE,
15 GENTRIFICATION IS WIDESPREAD, WHICH WE KNOW THIS IS, IF THEY
16 HAVE DECREASE THAT MEANS TRACTS ARE LESS CONCENTRATED WITH THE
17 DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS THIS METHODOLOGY HELPS CAPTURE SOME
18 OF THAT. JUST GOING OVER THE THRESHOLDS THEMSELVES, IN PLANNED
19 BAY AREA 2040 WE SAID IF A TRACT HAS 70 PERCENT POPULATION OF
20 PERSON OF COLOR AND 30 PERCENT CONCENTRATION OF PEOPLE WITH
21 LOW INCOME THEN THE TRACT QUALIFIES AS IMMEDIATE CONCERN. SO
22 NOW IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE ARE SAYING IF A TRACT HAS 70
23 PERCENT OF PEOPLE OF COLOR BUT 28 PERCENT PEOPLE OF LOW
24 INCOME, IT WILL QUALIFY AS A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN. SAME GOES
25 FOR THE OTHER CONCENTRATION AS WELL. AND YOU CAN SEE THAT MOST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 OF THESE THRESHOLDS HAVE DECREASED, SO IF ALL ELSE BEING EQUAL
2 WE SHOULD BE CAPTURING MORE TRACTS AS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
3 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 VERSUS PLANNED BAY AREA 2040. NEXT
4 PAGE PLEASE. SO, QUICKLY, LET ME WALK THROUGH SOME
5 DEMOGRAPHICS OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SO THEY ARE DEFINITELY
6 DISTINCT FROM THE REGION AS A WHOLE. THESE BARS ARE SHOWING
7 YOU THE CONCENTRATIONS, OR THE SHARE OF POPULATION, THAT A
8 PERSON OF COLOR OR LOW INCOME OR OTHERWISE FOR THE WHOLE BAY
9 AREA FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AND
10 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SO YOU CAN SEE
11 THE SHARE OF POPULATIONS OF PERSONS OF COLOR AND LOW INCOME
12 ARE SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER THAN THE REGIONAL AVERAGE. ALTHOUGH
13 THEY HAVE DECREASED SLIGHTLY WITH THE NEW DESIGNATIONS OF
14 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THE TWO POPULATION TYPES, OLDER ADULT
15 AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY, ARE THE TWO GROUPS THAT ARE
16 GENERALLY MUCH LESS CONCENTRATED AND MORE EVENLY SPREAD OUT
17 ACROSS THE REGION. SO YOU CAN SEE THE BARS ARE ABOUT SIMILAR
18 SIZE FOR THE REGION AS WELL AS THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SO
19 THE EQUITY ANALYSIS MAY NOT DO A GREAT JOB OF CAPTURING
20 IMPACTS ON THESE POPULATIONS, SO THAT IS THE REASONS WE HAVE A
21 COORDINATED PLAN, WHICH IS A SEPARATE PLAN THAT IS REFRESHED
22 EVERY THREE YEARS THE NEXT WILL KICK OFF IN 2021, AND WE WILL
23 BE COORDINATING WITH THAT PLAN EFFORT TO SEE THAT PLANNED BAY
24 AREA, SO THAT PLAN JUMPS OFF SOME OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
25 STRATEGIES. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. NOW, LOOKING AT THE OTHER SIDE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 OF THE COIN, WHICH IS HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, YOU CAN SEE, AGAIN,
2 THAT THEIR DEMOGRAPHICS ARE VERY DIFFERENT FROM COMMUNITIES OF
3 CONCERN, YOU CAN SEE THE BARS ARE VIRTUALLY LOWER MUCH LOWER
4 IN VIRTUALLY EVERY OTHER CATEGORY. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. SO WE'LL
5 JUMP INTO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM AND THEN PAUSE FOR DISCUSSION
6 AFTER THIS. SO I WANT TO GO OVER HOW THESE DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGES
7 HAVE AFFECTED THE LOCATIONS OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. NEXT
8 PAGE PLEASE. SO, THERE ARE THREE MAIN -- COMMUNITIES OF
9 CONCERN, ALL ARE VALIDATED AND I AM SURE NOT SURPRISING TO
10 YOU, DECLINE FROM 365 TO 339, THAT DOESN'T MEAN WE LOST 34 OR
11 NOTHING -- 26 TRACTS, BUT THERE WERE SOME TRACTS THAT WERE
12 ADDED AND SOME TRACTS THAT WERE LOST. AND THIS IS
13 PREDOMINANTLY DRIVEN BY A REDUCTION IN THE SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD
14 IN INCOME BELOW 200 PERCENT OF THE POVERTY LEVEL AS POINTED
15 OUT IN THE CONCENTRATION FACTORS SLIDE. SECOND THE POPULATION
16 SHARING DISADVANTAGED WITH COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN TRACTS HAS
17 MOSTLY DECLINED INCLUDING LOWER GEOGRAPHIC CONCENTRATION OF
18 DISADVANTAGED AND THIRD SHIFTS IN THE LOCATIONS OF TRACTS ARE
19 INDICATIVE OF DISPLACEMENT AND THEY ALIGN WITH OTHER AREAS OF
20 DISPLACEMENT CONCERN. FIRST DECREASE IN NUMBER OF TRACTS
21 DESIGNATED AS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN THIS CHART COMPARES
22 TRACTS WITHIN PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
23 BY DEFINITION USED TO DESIGNATE THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. AS
24 YOU CAN SEE THE DECREASED BY DEFINITION ONE DUE TO THE LOW
25 INCOME SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS. THE REASONS THIS MAY BE HAPPENING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 ARE DISPLACEMENT, GENTRIFICATION, BUT AS POINTED OUT EARLIER
2 THE REGION'S OVERALL SHARE OF LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS IS
3 DECREASING, AND WHILE WE ADJUSTED THE CONCENTRATION HOUSE
4 THRESHOLD TO DETERMINE THE EFFECT, THERE IS STILL DECREASE IN
5 NUMBER OF TRACTS GIVEN THE SPREAD OUT OF THE POPULATION OR
6 MAYBE THERE IS MIGRATION OF LOW LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS OUTSIDE
7 THE BAY AREA, AND PERHAPS MINIMUM WAGE INCREASE AS WELL. THE
8 NEXT SLIDE, WE HAD A TABLE EARLIER, I JUST PUT THIS IN A CHART
9 TO SHOW THAT A SHARE OF UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS THAT LIVES
10 WITHIN THE DESIGNATED COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, BETWEEN PLANNED
11 BAY AREA 2040 AND '50 THEY HAVE DECREASED SLIGHTLY ACROSS THE
12 BOARD. OVERALL, 21 PERCENT OF THE UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS LIVE
13 WITHIN THIS NEWLY DESIGNATED COMMUNITY OF CONCERN INDICATING
14 THAT THE POPULATIONS ARE MORE SPREAD OUT OVER THE REGION. NEXT
15 SLIDE PLEASE. THE SHIFT IN LOCATIONS OF THE TRACTS ARE QUITE
16 INDICATIVE OF DISPLACEMENT TRENDS. I HAVE SHOWN THIS MAP
17 BEFORE BUT LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS SHOWING
18 HOW THE NUMBER OF TRACTS DESIGNATED HAS CHANGED AT THE COUNTY
19 LEVEL. AND YOU CAN SEE THAT, IN TOTAL, 53 TRACT NEWLY DEEMED
20 DEFINITION OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN 79 TRACTS LOST THE
21 DESIGNATION, AND THIS HAPPENED MOST IN ALAMEDA AND SANTA CLARA
22 COUNTIES. SO IN SAN JOSE, WE SAW LARGE DECREASES PARTICULARLY
23 IN THE EASTERN PART OF THE CITY, BUT NEW COMMUNITIES OF
24 CONCERN TRACTS IN SUNNYVALE, AND SANTA CLARA, AND COMMUNITIES
25 NORTHEAST QUADRANT INCLUDING WESTERN, WHILE THERE IS NEW COC

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

TRACT, IN SAN FRANCISCO, THERE ARE LOSSES IN THE SAME AREAS TOO. SO THESE ARE ALL IMPACTS OF THE DATA REFRESHED THEMSELVES. I MEAN WE OBVIOUSLY WANT -- THIS IS WHY WE'RE BRINGING THIS TO YOU TO ROUND TRIP THIS DATA TO UNDERSTAND WHERE DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGES -- WELL, THE DATA SAYS WHAT THE DATA SAYS, BUT OF COURSE WE ARE INTERESTED IN HEARING FROM YOU IF YOU THINK THIS IS NOT MIMIC WHAT YOUR PERCEPTIONS OF THESE AREAS ARE. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. OKAY. SO WE'LL PAUSE FOR DISCUSSION HERE. TO HEAR ANY THOUGHTS, SO FAR. ANY QUESTIONS? IF DESIRED, WE CAN EVEN BRING UP THAT SUPPLEMENTAL HAND OUT THAT WALKS -- THAT GIVES A LITTLE MORE DETAIL ON HOW THESE CONCENTRATIONS CHANGED ACROSS TRACTS WITHIN EACH COUNTY.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION. IT WOULD BE GREAT TO SEE THAT, IF YOU COULD BRING UP THAT A LITTLE BIT LATER, THAT MAP THAT YOU INDICATED, AND I SEE ONE QUESTION FROM RICK COATES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

RICK COATES: YEAH. I HAVE SOME COMMENTS. FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU FOR THE ADDENDUM THERE, THAT WAS HELPFUL IN UNDERSTANDING HOW THIS WAS USED. I'M STILL HAVING A GREAT DEAL OF PROBLEM UNDERSTANDING WHY WE'RE CONNECTING COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN TO CENSUS TRACTS, RATHER THAN CONCENTRATING ON WHAT THEY NEED. YOU KNOW, YOU CAN TAKE ALL OF THE PEOPLE IN A COMMUNITY OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 CONCERN AND SPREAD THEM OUT OVER THE ENTIRE AREA, THE PROBLEMS
2 THEY HAVE DON'T GO AWAY, THEY'RE STILL THERE. AND SO
3 IMPROVEMENT IN THE REDUCTION IN THE NUMBER OF CENSUS TRACTS
4 THAT ARE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN WOULDN'T BE A VERY GOOD
5 MEASURE OF WHETHER YOU HAVE ACTUALLY SOLVED ANY PROBLEMS OR
6 NOT. IT'S THE METHODOLOGY I'M HAVING TROUBLES WITH. AND IT
7 LOOKS TO ME LIKE WE'RE DOING IT PRIMARILY BECAUSE IT'S
8 TRADITIONAL AND IT'S BEEN DONE THAT WAY BEFORE. AND I HAVE
9 NEVER THOUGHT THAT TRADITION WAS A GOOD REASON FOR CONTINUING
10 TO DO SOMETHING. AFTER ALL, RACISM IS TRADITIONAL IN THE
11 UNITED STATES. AND I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD BE CONTINUED. SO, I
12 WISH -- HERE IS ANOTHER SITUATION, ESPECIALLY WITH THE
13 ELDERLY, AND DISABLED, AS YOU HAVE POINTED OUT, THE SENSE YOU
14 TRACTS REALLY DON'T PINPOINT MUCH OF ANYTHING, I THINK. I'M
15 THINKING OF AN AREA IN SONOMA COUNTY CALLED OAKMONT, WHICH IS
16 BASICALLY A REQUIREMENT COMMUNITY OF RELATIVELY AFFLUENT
17 ELDERLY FOLKS, YET, THEY STILL ARE HAMPERED IN REACHING ANY
18 TRANSPORTATION. WE CAN'T ASSUME THAT THEY ALL HAVE CHAUFFEURS.
19 SO, YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOMETHING BASED MORE IN WHAT
20 EACH COMMUNITY OF CONCERN HAS, AS DIFFICULTIES IN ACCESSING
21 TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION. AND I'M WONDERING IF YOU HAVE A --
22 LET'S SAY A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN THAT NEEDS TRANSPORTATION, IF
23 YOU RUN A FREEWAY THROUGH THE MIDDLE OF THAT COMMUNITY OF
24 CONCERN, DOES THAT SOMEHOW ALLEVIATE THEIR PROBLEM? OR DOES IT
25 JUST EXACERBATE ALL OF THE OTHER PROBLEMS THAT THEY MIGHT HAVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

WITH POLLUTION AND WHAT NOT? I'LL -- [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: YOU'RE BREAKING UP A LITTLE BIT, RICK. ANUP, WOULD YOU LIKE TO FOLLOW UP?

ANUP TAPASE: SURE. -- SORRY. GO AHEAD.

RICK COATES: I WAS GOING TO SAY I'M SORRY IF I'M BREAKING UP MY WIFE IS ALWAYS ON ZOOM AND WE HAVE LIMITED BANDWIDTH.

ANUP TAPASE: SURE. RICK, I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH WHAT YOU'RE SAYING, AND THAT IS WHY I THINK WHEN WE DEVISE PLANNED BAY AREA THIS TIME AND THE PROCESS, WE TRY TO TAKE FOCUS AWAY FROM GEOGRAPHY BASED DECISIONS TO DECISIONS BASED ON WHAT IMPACTS PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME AT-LARGE OR PEOPLE OF COLOR, AT-LARGE, SO FOR EXAMPLE, SIGNIFICANT TRANSPORTATION PROJECT PERFORMANCE WE, IN THE PREVIOUS PLANS, WE ARE -- OR THE EQUITY ANALYSIS FOR PROJECTS BASED ON, DOES THE PROJECT TOUCH A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN? BUT THAT DOES NOT GIVE US INSIGHT INTO WHAT ARE PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME OR OTHER DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS ARE ACTUALLY USING IN THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THAT'S WHY WE DID OUR ANALYSIS ON EQUITY ANALYSIS BASED ON RESULTS WITH POPULATIONS AND EVEN WITH THE STRATEGIES FOR EXAMPLE, MEANS BASED DISCOUNTS OR MEANS BASED TOLLS THESE ARE BASED ON

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

POPULATIONS NO MATTER WHERE THEY LIVE. AND WHEN YOU GET INTO CONVERSATIONS ABOUT INVESTMENTS THIS ALWAYS COMES UP TO WHERE SHOULD WE PRIORITIZE THESE INVESTMENTS. SO YES I UNDERSTAND THE CONFLICT BETWEEN THE TWO. IS

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO RANDI, CHRISTINA, AND THEN MICHAEL.

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. JUST TO KIND OF STEP BACK. THE CENSUS TRACT IS THE ONLY WAY WE HAVE OF ACTUALLY CAPTURING DISCRETE INFORMATION. AND I WOULD LIKE US TO LOOK AT THESE MORE OF AS ABANDONED COMMUNITIES SOMETIMES. THESE ARE COMMUNITIES WITH HISTORICALLY NEGLIGENT -- THAT HAVE SUFFERED FROM HISTORICALLY NEGLIGENT POLICIES THAT DID NOT PROVIDE BASIC INFRASTRUCTURE. JUST -- AND I'M ONLY GOING ON MY COUNTY AND MY NEIGHBORHOODS, AND THE ONES THEY KNOW. BUT I HAVE THE LARGEST COUNTY HERE, SO I'M PRETTY CONVERSANT IN SOME OF THESE COMMUNITIES. SO IT IS A WAY OF IDENTIFYING THEM. AND WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THEM IN THE PAST WHEN TRANSIT ROUTES, FOR INSTANCE, ARE BEING CUT. TRANSIT ROUTES THAT ELIMINATE THAT. I THINK THAT WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN WHEN WE SEE THE MEANS-BASED FARE ANALYSIS THAT COME OUT OF THAT PILOT PROGRAM, WE'RE GOING TO ACTUALLY SEE WHERE THE -- WHERE OUR OUTLYING -- PEOPLE WHO AREN'T IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, BUT WHO USE THAT PROGRAM, THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY BENEFICIAL TO US. MY QUESTION, HOWEVER, IS, ARE YOU LOOKING AT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

STRICTLY COUNTS, OR PERCENTAGES BY CENSUS TRACT? BECAUSE I HAVE ONE HERE THAT I WANT TO TALK ABOUT.

ANUP TAPASE: WITHIN THE CENSUS TRACT, THE TOTAL OF POPULATIONS WITHIN MIGHT CHANGE BUT THOSE CONCENTRATIONS OF BASED ON THE SHARE OF POPULATIONS THAT IS LOW INCOME OR PERSON OF COLOR, ET CETERA.

RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. SO WHEN I HAVE A CENSUS TRACT THAT IS IN THE "TO BE REMOVED" SITUATION, AND I KNOW FOR A FACT THAT WITHIN THAT CENSUS TRACT, THE POPULATION HAS INCREASED BECAUSE WE HAVE DONE INFILL MARKET RATE DEVELOPMENT, HOW DO WE ADDRESS THAT? BECAUSE -- AND THIS IS ONE THING THAT ALL OF US ARE GOING TO HAVE TO KIND OF JUMP IN AND LOOK AT THE MAPS, BECAUSE MY COMMUNITY THAT WAS THERE, THAT WAS UNDERSERVED IS STILL THERE, EVEN THOUGH WE MOVED IN A BUNCH OF TECH PEOPLE. NO OFFENSE TO TECH PEOPLE, BUT THEY HAVE MONEY THAT THE REST OF THE COMMUNITY DOESN'T HAVE.

ANUP TAPASE: YES, I COMPLETELY UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU ARE SAYING. THE -- SO THAT'S WHAT THE SUPPLEMENTAL HANDOUT TRIES TO ILLUSTRATE A BIT ON HOW THE ABSOLUTE NUMBERS OF THE DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS CHANGED. NOW, I DON'T KNOW IF WE WANT TO PULL THAT UP NOW, OR NOT, BUT OF THE 79 TRACTS THAT LOST THE COC DESIGNATION THAT WERE FORMERLY COCS IN PLANNED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

BAY AREA 2040, 69 OF THOSE TRACTS CHANGED THEIR DESIGNATIONS BECAUSE THE LOW INCOME POPULATION SHARE FELL UNDER THE THRESHOLD. AND IN ALL THE 69 TRACTS, THERE WERE ABSOLUTE LOSS IN THE NUMBERS OF HOUSEHOLDS WITH LOW INCOME. BUT IT RANGED WIDELY. SOME LOST QUITE A LOT; SOME LOST AS LITTLE AS 100 HOUSEHOLDS LOW INCOME. AND ON THE OTHER HAND, YOU'RE RIGHT, THE POPULATIONS, NOT WITH LOW INCOME, INCREASED, AGAIN, WITH THE WIDE RANGE, RANGING WITH AS FEW AS 30 TO AS MANY AS MANY HUNDREDS. SO IN THOSE TRACTS WHERE, SAY, THE POPULATION WITH LOW INCOME DECREASED BY A SMALLER MARGIN, BUT THE POPULATION NOT WITH LOW INCOME INCREASED BY A WIDER MARGIN THAT'S EXACTLY THE KIND OF THOUGHT YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT RANDI. AND YES, THAT IS A WEAKNESS OF THIS METHODOLOGY. AND THAT'S WHY WE ARE HERE TO DISCUSS, LIKE, HOW WE DISCUSS THOSE LIMITATIONS IN THE SHORT-TERM AND LONG-TERM.

RANDI KINMAN: SO I KNOW I HAVE ONE CENSUS TRACT WHERE THE IMBALANCE IS BECAUSE WE LEVELED A LARGE APARTMENT COMPLEX AND PUT IN PROBABLY FIVE TIMES THE NUMBER OF MARKET RATE HOUSING, SO THAT ONE, THOSE PEOPLE ARE AWFUL DISPLACED, THEY'RE ALL MOVED OVER TO NEW ZONES. SO THAT ONE I'M NOT AS CONCERNED ABOUT, WHAT I AM CONCERNED ABOUT, IS THAT WE FLAG FOR THE COMMISSION, THE ONES THAT THE LEVEL, THE TRIGGER THAT REMOVES IT AS A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN IS FLAGGED TO NOTE THAT THERE WAS A LARGE POPULATION, SIGNIFICANT POPULATION GROWTH, IN THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

PARTICULAR CENSUS TRACT THAT ACCOUNTS FOR THE FACT THAT THERE IS THIS IMBALANCE NOW. HOW -- CAN WE DO THAT?

ANUP TAPASE: SORRY. I DON'T THINK I UNDERSTOOD EXACTLY. CAN WE DO WHAT?

RANDI KINMAN: SO CAN WE FLAG THE CENSUS TRACTS THAT ARE DUE TO BE REMOVE AS A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN BECAUSE THEY'RE PROPORTIONAL LEVELS HAVE CHANGED DUE TO AN INCREASE IN HOUSING THAT IS MARKET RATE, NOT LOW INCOME. SO IT SERVES A HIGHER ECONOMIC LEVEL OF THE POPULATION. IS THERE A WAY OF FLAGGING THAT? SO, I HAVE 800 UNITS THAT WERE BUILT IN CENSUS TRACT 502201 WHICH HOLDS -- THESE ARE REALLY EXPENSIVE APARTMENTS; AND SO THAT HAS SHIFTED THE BALANCE OF THE POPULATION IN THAT CENSUS TRACT. HOW DO WE DENOTE THE FACT THAT WE DIDN'T REMOVE ANYBODY. THEY HAVEN'T GONE ANYWHERE, THE ONES THAT WERE -- THAT BUILT UP THAT LEVEL TO CALL IT A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN; WE JUST SIMPLY ADDED MORE WEALTHIER PEOPLE. >DAVE VAUTIN: MAYBE I CAN JUMP IN ON THIS QUESTION. THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN FROM PLANNED BAY AREA. SIN.

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. WE HAD THIS CONVERSATION. >DAVE VAUTIN: WITH THE DATA WE WOULD BE ABLE TO PINPOINT CAUSE AND EFFECT HERE BUT FOR REALITY I'LL USE THE HOUSING -- IT'S LIKE SWISS CHEESE THERE IS MANY HOLES AND MISSING PIECES IN THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

MIX. SO WE DID HAVE A PERMIT DATA COLLECTION PROJECT THAT WAS GOING ON FOR A FEW YEARS, IT WASN'T ABOUT WHEN CONSTRUCTION WAS COMPLETED, WHICH MAKES IT TRICKY TO TIE TO CAUSE AND EFFECT TO GIVEN YEAR IN CENSUS DATA WE HAD DATA ON PERMITTING INCLUDING ONES THAT ARE AFFORDABLE IN MARKET RATE. THAT PROJECT HAS BEEN TAKEN ON BY THE STATE, WITH CONSTRUCTION AND PERMIT AND COMPLETION GIVE US THAT IDEAL DATA SET TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION. THAT DATA SET IS STILL A WORK-IN-PROGRESS. THEY ARE CONTINUING TO BUILD-OUT THAT INVENTORY IN TIME WE WILL HAVE AN ANNUAL DATA SET THAT WILL GIVE US THE TYPOLOGY SETS GIVEN IN THE YEAR AND WE'LL BE ABLE TO SORT OUT WHAT CAUSES THAT CHANGE ON A YEAR BY YEAR BASIS BUT FOR NOW THERE IS DEFINITELY A LOT OF THE PIECES OF THE PUZZLE MISSING WHICH DEFINITELY MAKES IT HARD FOR US TO PINPOINT THAT. IN CERTAIN CITIES IN THE RESOURCE DATA IN THE REGION-WIDE PICTURE THAT'S WHERE WE'RE TRYING TO STANDARDIZE ALL THE DATA AND GIVE US THAT CRITICAL INFORMATION SO WE CAN ANSWER QUESTIONS LIKE YOURS GOING FORWARD.

RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. SO WE HAD THIS SAME ISSUE COME UP LAST TIME WITH ALVISO THAT POPPED OFF THE MAP AS A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN. AND I SAID NO THAT'S BECAUSE WE PUT IN SEVERAL LARGE COMPLEXES. IT'S A LOW POPULATION AREA ANYWAY AND THAT'S WHY WE LEFT AS A NON COMMUNITY OF CONCERN BECAUSE I COULD SHOW YOU AND YOU GUYS COULD GO BACK TO THE CITY OF SAN JOSE AND SEE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

THAT SO HOW DO WE -- AND I AM CONCERNED THAT -- AND I'LL THROW THIS AT MY SUPERVISORS IS MAKE THEIR STAFF DO THIS BUT HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT THAT, ON THE GROUND KNOWLEDGE IS BEING INCORPORATED SO WE DON'T ACCIDENTALLY ELIMINATE SOMEBODY THAT QUALIFIES UNDER THESE GUIDELINES? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO MY UNDERSTANDING IS -- MY UNDERSTANDING OF HOW WE HANDLED THIS LAST TIME AND WILL CONTINUE TO HANDLE IT THIS TIME IS WE USE ANALYSIS USING REGIONAL THRESHOLDS SYSTEM DATA AND APPLY IT CONSISTENTLY, BUT WE ALLOW THE COUNTIES TO AUGMENT THE REGIONAL SET OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN BASED ON SITUATIONS LIKE WHAT YOU'RE JUST DESCRIBING.

RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. >DAVE VAUTIN: THIS UPDATE IS CONSISTENT. YOU KNOW, BY THE NUMBERS, YOU KNOW, FOLLOWING THE EXACT METHODOLOGY APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION, BUT ULTIMATELY IN THE CASE OF SOUTH OF SOUTH BAY IT WILL BE VTA STAFF THAT WOULD APPROVE THIS THAT WOULD THEN AUGMENT SITUATIONS LIKE WHAT YOU ARE DESCRIBING.

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. CHRISTINA? DID YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: YES. KIND OF GOING OFF OF WHAT RANDI WAS TALKING ABOUT. ON THE SLIDE WITH ALL THE MAPS, I WAS JUST WONDERING HOW YOU SAW THE SHIFT IN LOCATIONS AS INDICATIVE OF DISPLACEMENT. AND THEN ALSO IN THE SLIDE PRIOR TO THAT, IF -- I DON'T KNOW IN IT -- I'M JUST THROWING AN IDEA OUT THERE, BUT WOULD IT MAKE SENSE TO MAKE THE METHODOLOGY MATCH SO THAT A CERTAIN LEVEL OF THE PERCENTAGE OF THE POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA IS CAPTURED IN THE COC, SO INSTEAD OF, YOU KNOW WHERE YOU SAID IT DROPPED FROM 23 PERCENT TO 21 PERCENT IN THE BAY AREA INSTEAD IF YOU WERE JUST TARGETING THAT 25 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA POPULATION WOULD FALL INTO THESE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN SO THAT IT'S MORE LIKE YOU'RE ADDRESSING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE RATHER THAN JUST THE METHODOLOGY IS DRIVING THE NUMBER.

ANUP TAPASE: CERTAINLY. SO, WHEN I SAID INDICATIVE OF DISPLACEMENT TRENDS IT'S VISIBLE IN PARTS OF SAN FRANCISCO, IN THE MISSION DISTRICT, VISIBLE IN AREAS SUCH AS EAST CONTRA COSTA, WITH NEW TRACTS BEING DESIGNATED AS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN LIKE AROUND OAKLEY AND PITTSBURGH, VARIOUS OTHER AREAS ACROSS THE BOARD. THE SUGGESTION THAT YOU'RE GIVING, YES, I THINK THESE ARE THE KIND OF THINGS WE SHOULD BE TAKING INTO ACCOUNT WHEN WE CONSIDER REVISING THE METHODOLOGY. AGAIN, LIKE THIS PRESENTATION, IT'S -- WE'RE NOT TRYING -- I THINK IT WOULD BE EXTREMELY HARD FOR US TO -- THEY SAY IT'S NOT FEEBLE WITHIN THE 2050 TIMELINE FOR CHANGING THE METHODOLOGY FOR HOW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 WE DESIGNATE THIS, BUT IN THE NEAR-TERM, 2021, OR 2022, WE
2 DEFINITELY WANT TO REVISIT THIS METHODOLOGY, AND THESE ARE THE
3 KIND OF, LIKE WHAT YOU'RE SAYING, WHERE WE TARGET MAYBE A SET
4 PERCENT OF POPULATION THAT SHOULD BE WITHIN THESE COMMUNITIES,
5 THAT'S DEFINITELY A SUGGESTION WE CAN TAKE.
6
7 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MICHAEL?
8
9 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. MY QUESTION IS
10 ABOUT THE DISADVANTAGED FACTOR IS THAT YOU INCLUDE THE SENIORS
11 AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND I'M WONDERING, IN TERMS OF
12 CENSUS TRACTS, HOW DOES THAT REFLECT THE CONCENTRATION OF
13 RETIREMENT COMMUNITIES OR BOARD AND CARE FACILITIES? DOES THAT
14 DISTORT IT AT ALL? DOES THAT EVEN OUT OVER THE LARGE
15 POPULATION YOU'RE LOOKING AT IN IT SEEMS TO ME YOU DON'T HAVE
16 THOSE THINGS IN EVERY CENSUS TRACT SO IT'S KIND OF HARD TO
17 CONSIDER IT EQUALLY DISTRIBUTED. DOES MY QUESTION MAKE SENSE?
18
19 **ANUP TAPASE:** YES IT DOES. I DO BELIEVE THE CENSUS DATA DOES
20 CAPTURE SENIOR LIVING FACILITIES, SO THERE PROBABLY WOULD BE
21 TRACTS WHERE YOU DO SEE THIS HIGHER CONCENTRATION OF SENIOR
22 POPULATIONS OR DISABLED POPULATIONS. BUT I DON'T THINK I CAN
23 ELABORATE FURTHER. I MEAN, THAT'S JUST THE SURVEY DATA THAT IS
24 AVAILABLE.
25

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

MICHAEL LOPEZ: OKAY. THANK YOU.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: RICH HEDGES?

RICHARD HEDGES: YES, THANK YOU. I HAVE A LOT OF CONCERNS. SOME OF THEM BASED ON WHAT RANDI SAID. SHE'S CERTAINLY RIGHT IN HER OWN AREA, AND IT MAY EXTEND TO OTHER AREAS, BUT WHEN WE HAVE DISAPPEARING CENSUS TRACTS, PEOPLE WHO ARE LESS WELL OFF THAN THE REST OF IT, THAT HAS A LOT OF IMPLICATIONS. FIRST OF ALL, HOW DO WE PLAN FOR HELP THESE FOLKS, AND SECONDLY THESE ARE PEOPLE THAT ARE OFTEN THE BACKBONE OF OUR ECONOMY, AND ARE THEY LEAVING? OR ARE THEY JUST NOT BEING RECOGNIZED AS EXISTING ANYMORE. I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY OF YOU HAVE EVER READ "NICKEL AND DIMED IN AMERICA" OR "NOT GETTING BY IN AMERICA" WHICH IS THE SUBTITLE, BY BARBARA HURLEY. SHE IS A WELL EDUCATED YOUNG WOMAN WHO I THINK WAS WORKING FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES TOOK THREE DIFFERENT JOBS AT MINIMUM WAGE IN VARIOUS INDUSTRIES AND WROTE A BOOK ABOUT HOW SHE COULDN'T DO THESE MINIMUM WAGE JOBS WITHOUT THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN DOING IT FOR SO MANY YEARS BECAUSE IT REQUIRED MORE SKILL THAN HER ECONOMIC STRATA -- I HOPE IT'S CORRECT BY RAISING MINIMUM WAGE AND WITH MULTIPLE FAMILIES HOUSEHOLDS WORKING WE'RE BEGINNING TO RAISE PEOPLE ABOVE THE REST OF THE NUMBERS THAT WE COULD CONSIDER AREAS OF CONCERN BUT I THINK MORE LIKELY PEOPLE ARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

LEAVING OR DISAPPEARING BECAUSE OF INFILLING OF PEOPLE WITH HIGHER INCOMES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AS I LOOK AT THE TIME, WE HAVE ABOUT A HALF HOUR LEFT. AND I WOULD LIKE TO HOLD THE COMMENTS FROM PEOPLE WHO HAVE ALREADY SPOKEN UNTIL OUR NEXT ROUND OF DISCUSSION AT THE END. I'LL GO AHEAD AND ADD MY QUESTIONS. MY -- WE SEEM TO BE BACK AT THE SAME PLACE WE WERE FOUR YEARS AGO WHEN THE METHODOLOGY CHANGED. AND THERE WERE A NUMBER OF ISSUES THAT WERE BROUGHT UP FROM THIS COMMITTEE AT THAT TIME. ABOUT NOT REACHING ALL OF THE CENSUS TRACTS, THE AREAS THAT RANDI HAD MENTIONED. SO HERE WE ARE AGAIN, AND YOU'RE MAKING THOSE SLIGHT ADJUSTMENTS BUT I STILL SEE THOSE PROBLEMS IN THE FUTURE. AND I DON'T -- I GUESS WE'LL HAVE TO WAIT FOR ANOTHER THREE YEARS TO MAKE FURTHER CHANGES TO INCLUDE THE NEW CENSUS AT THAT TIME. SO, I GUESS I JUST HAD A COMMENT RATHER THAN A QUESTION. SO I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THE SECOND PART OF THIS DISCUSSION SO WE CAN MOVE FORWARD. MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AT THIS TIME?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED BUT RANDY AND RICK STILL HAVE THEIR HANDS UP.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** YES, I SEE THAT, AND I'M ASKING THEM TO
2 HOLD THEIR COMMENTS UNTIL AFTER THE SECOND PRESENTATION. >DAVE
3 VAUTIN: IF I MAY, JUST FOR 30 SECONDS RESPOND TO YOUR COMMENT.
4 AS YOU WILL SEE IN THE SECOND HALF OF THE PRESENTATION WE'RE
5 NOT EXPECTING TO WAIT THREE OR FOUR YEARS WE'RE CONSIDERING
6 THIS AS AN IMPLEMENTATION IN THE PLAN AND TACKLE IN THE NEXT
7 ONE AND A HALF YEARS. THE METHODOLOGY WAS OVERHAULED IN THE
8 UPDATE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2040. THIS METHODOLOGY WE'RE NOT
9 CHANGING THE METHODOLOGY, IT'S THE SAME METHODOLOGY WE'RE JUST
10 USING THE LATEST CENSUS DATA. SO SOME CHANGES WERE MADE TO THE
11 METHODOLOGY BASED ON FEEDBACK WE GOT FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
12 COUNCIL IN THE LAST CYCLE. YOU KNOW, I THINK SOME OF THE
13 CRITIQUES OF THE COMMUNITY FRAMEWORK WERE MADE SO THAT'S WHY
14 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE NEXT GENERATION OR WHERE WE GO FROM
15 HERE. THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN ARE NOW BEING USED BY A LOT
16 OF DIFFERENT FOLKS FOR A LOT OF DIFFERENT THINGS SO A VERY
17 THOUGHTFUL DELIBERATIVE PROCESS IS GOING TO BE REQUIRED TO
18 REINVENT THEM AND REDESIGN THEM ESPECIALLY IF WE WANT TO PIVOT
19 AWAY FROM THIS GEOGRAPHY BASED APPROACH THAT A FEW OF THE
20 COMMENTERS HAVE BROUGHT UP SINCE SO MANY PEOPLE RELY ON THE
21 GEOGRAPHY BASED APPROACH TO DOLE OUT MONEY AND LOCATE
22 BIKESHARE STATIONS AND SO O WE UNDERSTAND YOUR CONCERNS AND
23 THAT'S WHY WE WANT TO TACKLE THIS PROJECT IN THE NEXT COUPLE
24 OF YEARS.
25

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANUP WOULD YOU LIKE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH YOUR PRESENTATION?

ANUP TAPASE: SURE. THANK YOU. CAN WE BRING UP THE SLIDES AGAIN, PLEASE? YES. I ALSO WANT TO REITERATE THAT MANY OF THE CONCERNS YOU'RE BRINGING UP ARE CONCERNS THAT WE, AS STAFF, EQUALLY SHARE, AND WANT TO DO SOMETHING ABOUT IT. SO GETTING INTO A THIRD AGENDA ITEM IS, WE WANT TO SHARE WHAT -- OR RAISE SOME QUESTIONS SIMILAR TO THE QUESTIONS YOU ALL HAVE RAISED, AND THINK ABOUT WHAT OUR PROPOSED SUGGESTIONS FOR THE NEAR-TERM AND LONG-TERM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, AS YOU ALL DESIGNATED THERE IS A NEED, AND WE AS STAFF FULLY ACKNOWLEDGE THERE IS A NEED TO REEXAMINE THE METHODOLOGY. THERE ARE SOME SMALL TIME QUESTIONS THAT WE SHOULD BE ASKING LIKE SHOULD WE BE ADJUSTING THE DEFINITIONS OF LOW INCOME IN THE BAY AREA, 200 PERCENT OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL TOO LOW GIVEN THE COST OF LIVING HERE. HOW CAN WE CAPTURE UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN DISPLACED AND THE POPULATIONS OF CONCERN, REALLY QUALIFYING AS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, AND REMAINING CENSUS TRACTS THAT HAVE BEEN GENTRIFIED AT RISK OF DISPLACEMENT THERE ARE LARGER QUESTIONS WE NEED TO BE TALKING ABOUT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. JUST BY USING THIS FRAMEWORK AND HOW WE FRAME THE DISCUSSION IN PLACE YES WE NEED TO BE CAPTURING EFFECTS ON POPULATIONS OF LOW INCOME OR PEOPLE OF COLOR AT-LARGE BUT TIME AND AGAIN THE CONVERSATION WILL COME UP ON HOW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 WE PRIORITIZE PLACES. SO WHEN WE FRAME THE DISCUSSION, ARE WE
2 CONCENTRATING ON POVERTY, ARE WE, BY SPEAKING OF THIS
3 FRAMEWORK, ARE WE POINTING AT POVERTY AS THE PROBLEM HERE? OR
4 ARE THERE LARGER PROBLEMS WE SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT AND
5 SHIFTING THAT NARRATIVE? HOW CAN WE CAPTURE THE INEQUITIES
6 CREATED BY INVESTMENTS AND AFFLUENT WHITE COMMUNITIES. HOW CAN
7 WE CAPTURE HISTORICAL INEQUALITIES AND SEE HOW RED LINING HAVE
8 IMPACTED COMMUNITIES AND TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT AS TO HOW WE
9 PRIORITIZE THIS FRAMING INVESTMENTS. LIKE DAVE SAID ALL THESE
10 QUESTIONS REQUIRE MUCH MORE ENGAGEMENT WITH NOT ONLY YOU ALL
11 BUT ALSO COMMUNITIES THEMSELVES AND UNDERSTANDING WHAT IS THE
12 MEANING OF OPPORTUNITY AND HOW SHOULD WE BE GOING ABOUT
13 SELECTING OR CHOOSING PLACES? IS IT JUST BASED ON FACTORS SUCH
14 AS SHARE OF LOW INCOME POPULATION OR SHARE OF PEOPLE OF COLOR?
15 OR, ALSO, REAL METRICS SUCH AS COMMUTE TIME, FOR EXAMPLE, OR
16 ANY PARK SPACE AND THINGS LIKE THAT. SO, IN THAT COUNCIL,
17 WHICH IS THE MPO OF THE MINNEAPOLIS TWIN CITIES AREA HAS BEEN
18 DOING A STUDY ON THIS, THEY'RE STILL ENGAGED IN THAT, THEY
19 ALSO HAVE SOMETHING LIKE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN WHICH THEY
20 CALL AREAS OF POVERTY, AND THEY ARE DOING AN INVESTIGATION AND
21 STUDY AND ENGAGING IN CONCEPTS AND ADDRESSING THE QUESTION OF
22 WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY A PLACE OF OPPORTUNITY? BECAUSE PEOPLE
23 CHOOSE TO LIVE IN SO-CALLED HIGH PRIORITY NEIGHBORHOODS
24 BECAUSE THEY WANT TO BE THERE, AND THEY HAVE SOCIAL
25 CONNECTIONS AND FAMILY THERE. SO WHY ARE WE TALKING ABOUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 THESE COMMUNITIES AS IF THEY ARE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, OR
2 COMMUNITIES WITH ISSUES. WE SHOULD TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE
3 COMPLEXITY OF THESE NEIGHBORHOODS, THEIR HISTORY, THEIR
4 CULTURES, AND THE EXISTING BUILT IN ENVIRONMENT OR LACK OF
5 HISTORICAL INVESTMENT AND USE THAT ALL INTO ACCOUNT WHEN
6 DETERMINING WHICH PLACES WE PRIORITIZE FOR OUR STRATEGIES AND
7 OUR INVESTMENTS. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. IN THE REGIONAL EQUITY
8 WORKING GROUP, WHICH WE HAD LAST MONTH, WE POSED THE QUESTION,
9 WHICH WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO NOW, BUT WE ASKED IF MTC HAS
10 IDENTIFIED COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AS UNDERSERVED FOR TWO
11 DECADES NOW IT WAS NEW AND WAS A WELL THOUGHT OUT DEFINITION
12 AND METHODOLOGY, AND PERHAPS NOMENCLATURE AT THE TIME. TIMES
13 HAVE CHANGED AND WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT IF THIS
14 TERMINOLOGY APPROPRIATELY CAPTURED THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THESE
15 COMMUNITIES. BECAUSE, AS STAFF, WE WERE -- I COULD SAY NOT TOO
16 HAPPY ABOUT THIS NAME ANYMORE, AT LEAST PERSONALLY, WHEN WE
17 POSED THIS QUESTION TO THE REGIONAL EQUITY WORKING GROUP,
18 ABOUT 40 PERCENT OF THEM WERE AT STRONGLY DISAGREE, ABOUT
19 ANOTHER 40 PERCENT OF THEM WERE AT NEUTRAL, AND THE REMAINING
20 20 PERCENT WERE KIND OF SPLIT MORE IN THE DISAGREE BUCKET.
21 WHEN WE GET TO THE DISCUSSION, I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM YOU
22 ALL AS WELL, WHAT YOU THINK OF THIS TERMINOLOGY. NEXT QUESTION
23 PLEASE. SORRY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE ACKNOWLEDGE THE PART
24 OF LANGUAGE, AND WE ARE SUGGESTING THAT WE CHANGE THE
25 NOMENCLATURE, EVEN FOR USING THIS PLAN. AND I HAVE SHARED THIS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 BEFORE, THERE ARE DIFFERENT TYPOLOGY WHICH IS WE CAN NAME
2 THESE AREAS. SOME OF THEM -- SOME REGIONS DO IT BASED ON JUST
3 CALLING IT ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COMMUNITIES OR ENVIRONMENTAL
4 JUSTICE AREAS. YOU CAN USE THE WORD DISADVANTAGED WHICH
5 EMPHASIZES DISADVANTAGED BUT USES THE DEFICIT BASED NARRATIVE
6 WHICH WE KIND OF WANT TO MOVE AWAY FROM OR WE COULD USE THE
7 TERM LIKE EQUITY AREAS, WHICH MANY REGIONS DO, AS WELL. AND SO
8 ON THE RIGHT, THESE ARE DIFFERENT METROPOLITAN PLANNING
9 ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS HMC, AND THE TERMINOLOGY THEY USE
10 INCLUDING EQUITY ANALYSIS. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. INTERNALLY, WE
11 CAME UP -- WE DID AN EXERCISE WHERE WE DELIBERATED FOR AN HOUR
12 AND WE CAME UP WITH FOUR SUGGESTIONS, EQUITY PRIORITIZED
13 OPPORTUNITY COMMUNITIES EQUITY PRIORITIZED INVESTMENT
14 OPPORTUNITIES, AND EQUITY FOCUS COMMUNITIES EQUITY ACCESS
15 ZONES. WE DON'T WANT TO -- WE WANT TO ENGAGE YOU. WE WILL HAVE
16 A WORKSHOP IN JANUARY AND WANT TO GIVE AN OVERVIEW IN HOW WE
17 WANT TO CHARACTERIZE THESE COMMUNITIES AND WHILE WE DON'T WANT
18 TO CREATE MORE ACRONYMS WE WANT TO DO THE RIGHT THING AND USE
19 THE RIGHT NAME THAT APPROPRIATELY CHARACTERIZES THESE
20 COMMUNITIES BUT WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE OPPORTUNITY AND
21 PRIORITIZE THE COMMUNITIES BECAUSE THAT'S THE MAIN OBJECTIVE
22 HERE. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. HERE ARE THE NEXT STEPS WE ARE
23 PROPOSING. IN THE NEAR-TERM, WITHIN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
24 WHICH IS BASICALLY WITHIN THE NEXT YEAR, WE WANT TO AUGMENT
25 OUR EQUITY ANALYSIS, WITH NOT JUST SHOWING DISPARITIES BETWEEN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN IN THE REST OF THE REGION BUT ALSO WITH
2 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS SO WE CAN ALSO SHOW THE EFFECTS OF
3 CONCENTRATED AFFLUENCE AS WELL, AND THEN AS SOME POINTED OUT,
4 FOCUSING THIS DISPARITY ANALYSIS JUST BASED ON ANALYSIS JUST
5 NOT ENOUGH GIVEN THE SPREAD OF DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS SO WE
6 WANT TO MEASURE DISPARITY BASED ON INCOME STATUS AS WELL
7 UNFORTUNATELY WE'RE NOT ABLE TO DO THIS KIND OF DISPARITY
8 ANALYSIS ON OTHER FACTORS SUCH AS RACE AND ETHNICITY. WE ALSO
9 WANT TO REVISE THE NOMENCLATURE FOR USING THIS DOCUMENT, WE'LL
10 FOCUS IN JANUARY BUT BY FEBRUARY OR MARCH WE HOPE TO LAND A
11 NEW NAME IF YOU ALL THINK THAT'S THE RIGHT PATH TOO. IN THE
12 LONG-TERM AS PART OF THE EQUITY PLATFORM INITIATIVE IN 2021 OR
13 SO, WE WANT TO REEXAMINE AND OVERHAUL THIS METHODOLOGY AND FOR
14 THAT, AS WE HAVE SAID, THIS WILL REQUIRE A SIGNIFICANT
15 ENGAGEMENT WITH EVERYONE. WE WANT TO SURVEY COMMUNITIES THAT
16 IDENTIFY NEEDS AND VALUES, AND PERHAPS ALSO REACH TOOLS AND
17 METHODOLOGIES SO THAT WE CAN FORECAST THIS DISAGGREGATE
18 IMPACTS ON BASIS OF RACE AND ETHNICITY. WE WANT TO SHARE WHAT
19 WE HEARD FROM THE RECENT EQUITY WORKING GROUP A FEW WEEKS AGO.
20 IT'S NOT TOO MUCH BACK AND FORTH DISCUSSION AS WE WOULD HAVE
21 LIKED GIVEN THE WORKSHOP FORMAT. BUT THESE WERE COMMENTS THAT
22 CAME IN. IN THE NEAR-TERM GIVEN PLANNED BAY AREA MORE
23 CONCENTRATION AND DISBURSAL OF LOW INCOME POPULATIONS WE WERE
24 ASKED TO CONDUCT PERFORMANCE BASED EQUITY ANALYSIS ON POLICIES
25 AND INVESTMENTS ON WHO BENEFITS. AGAIN, THIS WAS SORT OF OUR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

PROCESS AS PART OF THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT PERFORMANCE, AS PART OF THE HORIZON STUDY WHERE WE DID PERFORMANCE BASED ANALYSIS ON EVERY SINGLE STRATEGY ALL THE EQUITY ANALYSIS, WE'RE FOCUSED ON THE PLAN AS A WHOLE. ON THE NOMENCLATURE THERE WERE SUGGESTIONS FOR USING PRIORITY NEIGHBORHOODS OR AREAS, MAYBE A SINGLE TERM IS NOT THE SOLUTION. AND ALSO USE LANGUAGE TO REFLECT WHAT MTC SPECIFICALLY IS ADDRESSING, THAT IS REGARDING PROBLEM SOLVING FOR PRIORITIZING WHERE RESOURCES AND PLANNING POLICY SOLUTIONS ARE MOST NEEDED. LANGUAGE INTERPRETER CAN BE IMPLEMENTED AND SPECIFIC LANGUAGE WOULD BE BEST. FOR LONG-TERM IN SUGGESTIONS OF HOW WE REIMAGINE THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN FRAMEWORK, LOOKING TO USING SMALLER GEOGRAPHIES RATHER THAN CENSUS TRACTS, NEED TO ADDRESS RURAL POVERTY, MORE EMPHASIS, LOOKING TO CALENVIROSCREEN GEOGRAPHY WITH DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES WORKING WITH CTAS AND LOCAL NON-PROFITS TO DESIGNATE AREAS OF CONCERN. WE DO NOT WANT TO LOSE THE CONCEPT OF PLACE BASED EQUITY THIS WILL BE NEEDED FOR STATE FUNDING PROGRAMS, ENGAGEMENT WITH COMMUNITIES HOW THEY IDENTIFY THEMSELVES BASED ON THEIR NEEDS WITH TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING. MOVING BEYOND TO SEE HOW IMPLEMENTATION WORKS WHEN IT COMES TO FUNDING PROGRAMS, AND METHODOLOGY RESPONDING TO ISSUES WITH THE 2020 CENSUS COLLECTION PROCESS. MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL PAUSE FOR DISCUSSION HERE TO HEAR YOUR THOUGHTS, PLEASE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: FANTASTIC. I'M GOING TO START WITH RANDI AND THEN RICK COATES. RANDI WOULD YOU LIKE TO ASK YOUR QUESTION?

RANDI KINMAN: THE QUESTION FROM BEFORE? OR MY QUESTION NOW?

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: EITHER/OR.

RANDI KINMAN: EITHER/OR. I WANT TO RESPOND TO THE QUESTION ABOUT THE CONCENTRATION OF SENIORS IN CENSUS TRACTS. WE DID DISCUSS THAT LAST TIME SO PLACES LIKE WHERE THE VILLAGES ARE, THE VILLAGE DOES NOT QUALIFY AS LOW INCOME BUT IT QUALIFIES AS SENIORS. SO THERE WAS -- WE HAD ONE COMMUNITY IN SARATOGA THAT WAS DECLARED A COMMUNITY OF CONCERN AND SINCE IT HAD SIX DIFFERENT SENIOR REHAB FACILITIES THERE, WE ELIMINATED THAT, SO MY GOAL, I JUST WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT THERE IS A TRIGGER FOR DOING THAT. MY CONCERN, RIGHT NOW, IS THAT WE ARE KIND OF MIXING TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION WITH OTHER SOCIAL JUSTICE ISSUES. AND IF WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT, AND WE'RE GOING TO RENAME OUR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN BASED ON OTHER SOCIAL JUSTICE ISSUES, THEN ARE WE HAVING THAT CONVERSATION WITH EVERYBODY IN THAT RESPECT? BECAUSE OUR FOCUS IS ON TRANSPORTATION. SO, HOWEVER WE NAME IT, IT -- WE'RE NOT -- WE CANNOT, ON THE BASIS OF TRANSPORTATION, ADDRESS SCHOOL INEQUITIES. WE CANNOT ADDRESS -- WE CAN THROUGH PLANNED BAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

AREA ADDRESS PARK INEQUITIES, BUT THEY NEVER GET ADDRESSED -- SO I'M REALLY CONCERNED THAT WE'RE MIXING THINGS HERE THAT AREN'T NECESSARILY IN OUR BUCKET OF THINGS TO DO. THE REALITY IS, THESE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN -- AND I WILL QUOTE SOMEBODY FROM 20 YEARS AGO WHO SAID THAT "SAN JOSE STRONG NEIGHBORS INITIATIVE WAS A PLAN THROUGH REDEVELOPMENT TO MAKE REPARATIONS FOR DECADES OF NEGLECT" AND I THINK IF WE LOOK AT IT THAT WAY IN SOME RESPECTS THAT THESE ARE NEGLECTED. WE CAN CALL IT WHAT IT IS, RACIAL DISCRIMINATION, RED LINING, BUT WE KNOW WE HAVE PHYSICAL AREAS THAT SUFFER CONTINUALLY FROM THAT. BASED ON THE FOUR -- 1, 2, 3, 4 ABBREVIATIONS THEY SEE HERE, I WOULD REALLY HESITATE TO CALL THEM OPPORTUNITY -- EQUITY PRIORITIZED OPPORTUNITY COMMUNITIES, OR INVESTMENT COMMUNITIES. I WORK WITH A LOT OF -- I DON'T WORK WITH THEM, BUT I DEAL WITH A LOT OF DIRT BAG INVESTORS AND HOUSING DEVELOPERS WHO WOULD TAKE A LOOK AT THAT AND SAY, OH, THIS IS A CHEAP PLACE FOR ME TO DO WHAT I WANT TO DO AND DEVELOP THINGS. SO WE NEED TO BE REALLY CAREFUL OF THAT. WE NEED TO BE REALLY CAREFUL THAT WE'RE NOT CREATING A -- WE'RE NOT HOLDING UP A BIG FLAG AND SAY, HEY, GENTRIFY HERE, OR, HEY, BUILD YOUR WHATEVER HERE THAT DOESN'T HELP THE COMMUNITY THAT LIVES IN. BUT I AM CURIOUS AS TO HOW WE'RE GOING TO COORDINATE THIS WITH ALL THE OTHER AGENCIES THAT CURRENTLY USE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN OR ARE WE PLANNING ON COMING UP WITH A MORE REGIONAL TERM? BECAUSE AIR QUALITY BOARD HAS DIFFERENT THINGS, THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

STATE HAS DIFFERENT NAMES, WE ALL HAVE DIFFERENT NAMES. SO THAT'S IT.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: ANUP, OR DAVE, WOULD YOU LIKE TO COMMENT?
>DAVE VAUTIN: I CAN TACKLE THE LAST PART OF RANDY'S QUESTION. THERE IS A COUPLE OF PIECES THERE I'LL LEAVE THE REST FOR ANUP. ON THE LAST PART, TWO PHASES, THE NEAR-TERM FLESHING OUT WHAT WE'RE DOING FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BEYOND THE GEOGRAPHY BASED APPROACH, THE NOMENCLATURE. WE WANT TO ENGAGE WITH A NUMBER OF FOLKS ON BOTH THOSE FRONTS IN 2021, AND THE SECOND PHASE WILL REQUIRE MORE ENGAGEMENT BECAUSE THERE IS A LONG LIST OF PEOPLE WHO USE THE COC MAPPING FOR DIFFERENT PROJECTS AND SO BEFORE WE OVERHAUL ALL THAT. [LAUGHTER] WE NEED TO TALK TO THE DIFFERENT USERS OF IT. AND SO, WE'RE -- I DON'T THINK IT'S -- I DON'T THINK IT'S REASONABLE TO EXPECT THAT THE AIR DISTRICT OR THE STATE ARE GOING TO, YOU KNOW, STOP USING THEIR OWN UNIQUE EQUITY GEOGRAPHIES AND START USING OURS, BUT FOR FOLKS WHO ARE USING, I THINK WE WANT TO TALK TO THEM TO UNDERSTAND MORE ABOUT WHAT THEY'RE USING IT FOR TALK ABOUT THE INITIAL IDEAS OF PIVOTING TO A DIFFERENT APPROACH ASK SEE IF THAT CONTINUES TO MEET THEIR NEEDS. SO THAT'S PART OF THE REASON WHY THAT SECOND PHASE OF IT IS YOU KNOW PROBABLY AN EFFORT FOR 2022, YOU KNOW IT'S JUST GOING TO TAKE TIME TO HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU.

ANUP TAPASE: I WOULD ADD YES IT'S CHALLENGING TO CHANGE THE NAME ESPECIALLY WHEN IT'S USED SO WIDELY BY DIFFERENT AGENCIES. BUT IS THAT A REASON TO USE A NAME IN A LIVING DOCUMENT IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DOCUMENT, WHICH WILL LIVE ON FOR A WHILE. THAT, TO ME, PERSONALLY, IS JUST, EVOKES SOME SENSE OF SYMPATHY THAT WE'RE HAVING FOR THESE COMMUNITIES OR MAY SEEM A LITTLE PATERNALISTIC IN TERMS OF COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, EXACTLY WHO DO THEY CONCERN OR WHY ARE THEY CONCERNING. THIS WAS MY PERSONAL FEELINGS AS WELL AS SOME OF OUR INTERNAL STAFF'S FEELINGS. AND SO I -- I THINK THAT SHOULD NOT -- IF THAT'S THE CASE, IF THAT'S HOW OTHER PEOPLE FEEL TOO, ABOUT THIS TERM, THEN I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD BE USING THE REASON OF, IT'S ALREADY SO, SO WELL ADOPTED BY VARIOUS AGENCIES, MAYBE WE SHOULD NOT CHANGE THE NAME.

RANDI KINMAN: I'M NOT SAYING CHANGE THE NAME, OR NOT CHANGED NAME. I'M SAYING BE AWARE OF WHAT YOU'RE PUTTING IN HERE. BECAUSE THE REALITIES, WITH THESE COMMUNITIES, AND I HAVE BEEN DOING THIS SINCE WE NAMED THEM THAT FOR A LONG TIME IS WE COULD REALISTICALLY CALL THIS THE COMMUNITIES THAT GOT SCREWED OVER EVERY SINGLE TIME. AND WE DON'T WANT TO DO THAT WE'RE MORE POLITE AND WANT TO FIND A WAY OF SAYING THAT IN A MUCH MORE PRODUCTIVE MANNER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: RICK COATES?

RICK COATES: I WANT TO SUGGEST AN ALTERNATE METHODOLOGY FOR FUTURE, I REALIZES THIS HINGES BY TIME RIGHT NOW, SUPPOSE YOU DEFINE THE COMMUNITIES NOT IN TERMS OF GEOGRAPHY, BUT IN TERMS OF PEOPLE, SO, THE ELDERLY, PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND CONSIDER THOSE A GROUP OF PEOPLE, AND THEN LOOK AT THE CHALLENGES THAT THEY MIGHT HAVE. FOR EXAMPLE, LOW INCOME, MAYBE THEY CAN'T AFFORD A CAR. MAYBE THEY CAN'T EVEN AFFORD THE TRANSIT FARE. DO THEY HAVE BICYCLE ACCESS? SAFE BICYCLE ACCESS? THAT'S AN ELEMENT THAT THEY MIGHT NEED. TO DEVELOP A LIST OF THE ELEMENTS THAT THEY NEED, THAT WOULD MAKE IT -- MAKE THEIR TRANSPORTATION MORE ACCESSIBLE. THEN YOU LOOK AT THE CENSUS TRACTS AND SAY, WHICH CENSUS TRACTS HAVE THESE ELEMENTS, AND WHICH DO NOT. THE CENSUS TRACT OF CONCERN WOULD BE THE ONES THAT LACK THE ELEMENTS THAT SATISFIED THOSE PEOPLE'S NEEDS. HAVE I MADE MYSELF CLEAR HERE?

ANUP TAPASE: YES. UH -- YEAH. I THINK THIS'S EXACTLY WHAT WAS ONE OF THE POINTS ON THE SLIDE WHERE I WAS TRYING TO SAY PERHAPS WE DON'T CHARACTERIZE COMMUNITIES BASED ON DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERIZATION, BUT BASED ON TRANSPORTATION NEEDS, THAT ARE THE REASON WHY MANY OF THESE POPULATIONS EXPERIENCE DISADVANTAGE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1

2 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA?

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO I HAVE BEEN
5 LISTENING TO THIS AND I HAVE HAD A LOT OF DIFFERENT THOUGHTS
6 GO THROUGH MY HEAD AND I WISH I HAD LONGER TO SORT THEM SO
7 APOLOGIES FOR INTERRUPTION OF THE NATURE OF THESE COMMENTS. I
8 REALLY APPRECIATE THE FRAMEWORK THAT YOU'RE BRINGING UP, TO
9 WHOM ARE THEY CONCERNING AND WHY ARE THEY CONCERNED IS A
10 REALLY GOOD QUESTION. AND SO -- AND I REALLY APPRECIATE NOT
11 INCLUDING THAT AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN A DOCUMENT THAT'S GOING
12 TO LIVE FOR SO LONG. I ALSO -- I ALSO FEEL LIKE THERE HAS TO
13 BE A WAY TO SAY, LIKE, LIKE, WE WANT TO LIVE IN THESE
14 COMMUNITIES BECAUSE THIS IS MY COMMUNITY, LIKE, I DON'T KNOW
15 WHAT YOUR ISSUE IS, BUT I LIKE IT HERE, AND ALSO IT'S TRUE
16 THAT IT'S HARDER, IN SO MANY WAYS, RIGHT? LIKE, AREN'T
17 ECONOMIC RESOURCES, THERE ARE HIGHER LEVELS OF INTIMIDATING
18 PRESENCE IN ALL KINDS OF WAYS, RIGHT? LIKE, AND THERE ARE LESS
19 ECONOMIC RESOURCES, AND THERE IS BEEN LESS INVESTMENT AND WHEN
20 INVESTMENT DOES COME WHAT IT USUALLY MEANS IS I LOSE MY
21 NEIGHBORS. SO IF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION INCREASES IN
22 NEIGHBORHOODS, I USUALLY LOSE MY NEIGHBORS, THAT'S CURRENTLY
23 HAPPENING IN NEW NEIGHBORHOOD. AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO TIE
24 IDENTIFICATION WITH PRESERVATION OF EXISTING POPULATIONS SO
25 YOU CAN HAVE HIGHER INFILL, SO WE GET HIGHER DENSITY AND MORE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 MIXED USE, WHICH TENDS TO BE GOOD, BUT MAKING SURE THERE IS
2 SOME KIND OF TIE TO PRESERVING EXISTING COMMUNITIES, I THINK
3 THIS'S REALLY IMPORTANT. AND TO ACKNOWLEDGE HISTORICAL
4 DISPARITIES AND NOT JUST GLOSS OVER THE DIS-- LIKE, HOW MUCH
5 HARDER WE'RE ASKING FOLKS TO WORK, TO LIVE IN THE SAME PLACE.
6 AND I DON'T -- I DON'T KNOW HOW TO CAPTURE THE COMMUNITIES
7 THAT ARE STILL THERE, BUT ARE BEING SWALLOWED BY HIGHER INCOME
8 FOLKS MOVING IN, AND SO I WOULD LIKE TO DO SOME OUTREACH IN
9 COMMUNITIES AND BE LIKE, HEY, WHAT DO YOU GUYS THINK OF THIS.
10 WHAT'S -- HOW DO YOU THINK THIS SHOULD BE APPROACHED? BECAUSE
11 I KNOW THOSE CONVERSATIONS HAVE BEEN HAPPENING FOR A LONG
12 TIME. I KNOW THAT UNDERSERVED HAS HAD A LOT OF BACKLASH, AS
13 WELL, BECAUSE FOLKS ARE SERVED LOTS OF THINGS, THEY'RE JUST
14 NOT VERY GOOD THINGS. AND SO I -- IF YOU HAVE OUTREACH
15 MATERIALS, I DON'T THINK A MONTH IS VERY LONG TO HAVE
16 LEGITIMATE INTERACTION WITH THOSE COMMUNITIES IN THOSE KINDS
17 OF DISCUSSIONS BUT I WOULD LOVE TO START DOING THAT TODAY TO
18 START DOING OUTREACH IF YOU HAVE MATERIALS BECAUSE IT'S
19 IMPORTANT DISCUSSION WORTH HAVING. AND REALLY LOOKING AT THE
20 NEEDS, BECAUSE RANDI IS RIGHT, WHEN YOU SAY, HERE IS AN
21 OPPORTUNITY ZONE, LIKE, I'M LIKE, OH NO. [LAUGHTER] LIKE, WHAT
22 THAT MEANS IS A DISPLACEMENT ZONE. AND IF YOU ARE SWITCHING,
23 IF YOU ARE SWITCHING TERMS, IT WOULD ALSO BE REALLY COOL TO
24 SWITCH AWAY FROM WHITE BEING THE -- I DON'T KNOW -- LIKE WHITE
25 AND WEALTHY BEING THE NORM, AS OPPOSED TO THIS -- BECAUSE I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

DON'T THINK THAT'S ACTUALLY NORMAL FOR MOST PLACES. BUT, LIKE, REALLY CALLING OUT, LIKE, HERE IS A PLACE THAT HAS TRADITIONALLY EXCLUDED PEOPLE, OR SHOULD WAY TO CALL THAT OUT TOO. SO I LIKE THAT YOU HAVE CONCENTRATION OF RESOURCES THAT DON'T HAVE MIXED POPULATIONS IN A VARIETY OF FACTORS. SO, I JUST REALLY WANT TO SUPPORT YOUR EFFORT IN THAT AND SAY I WOULD LIKE TO BE A PART OF SUPPORTING OUTREACH BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THAT MONTH IS A VERY LONG TIME FRAME. BUT, WHEN I GET THAT THOUGHT MORE CLEAR, I'LL E-MAIL IT TO YOU.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. TERRY SCOTT, DID YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP? YOU'RE MUTED. I THINK THAT I MAY HAVE LOWERED YOUR HAND WHEN I LOWERED SOMEONE ELSE'S HAND. ANNE OLIVIA. AND YOU ARE CURRENTLY MUTED.

TERRY SCOTT: YES. I WANTED TO REFER BACK TO THE METHODOLOGY AND THE TERMS THAT ANUP WAS REFERRING TO IN HIS REPORT IN REFERENCE TO COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. I, FOR ONE, PREFER THE USE OF ZONES VERSUS COMMUNITIES. AS MANY COMMUNITIES HAVE VARIOUS ECONOMIC ZONES WITHIN IT. SO THERE ARE CERTAIN STRIPS THAT ARE, YOU KNOW, HIGHER ECONOMIC ZONES, ET CETERA BUT THERE ARE AREAS OF, YOU KNOW, POVERTY AND SO FORTH THAT I THINK NEED TO BE ADDRESSED. WE DO NEED TO LOOK AT RURAL COMMUNITIES, THAT YOU MENTIONED EARLIER, BECAUSE THEY'RE VERY -- THEY'RE VERY UNIQUE IN TERMS OF THE RESTRICTIONS, AND THE NEEDS, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 THEY'RE CONCERNS SUCH AS WORKFORCE HOUSING WITHIN VERY SMALL
2 URBAN AREAS. AND THIS PARTICULAR COUNTY, NAPA, IS A GOOD
3 EXAMPLE OF THAT WITH LESS THAN 140,000 RESIDENTS AND FOUR AND
4 A HALF MILLION VISITORS A YEAR. AN EXAMPLE OF THIS HOUSING, IS
5 THAT OUR GENERAL PLAN SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFIES AGRICULTURE AS
6 THE HIGHEST AND BEST USE OF THE LAND. SO ANYTHING ELSE,
7 INCLUDING HOUSING, HAS TO COMPETE WITH THAT, AND WE'RE LIMITED
8 TO FIVE VERY SMALL URBAN AREAS IN TERMS OF THREE CITIES --
9 WELL, FOUR CITIES AND A TOWN, IF YOU WILL. IN THIS PARTICULAR
10 COUNTY. AND THE COMMERCIAL AREAS WITHIN THE COUNTY, THERE ARE
11 ONLY NINE IN THE ENTIRE COUNTY. AND THEY'RE VERY SMALL. AND
12 THEY'RE ALREADY DEVELOPED. SO, IT INVOLVES A CHANGE. THIS
13 FURTHER RESTRICTS THE DEVELOPMENT OF BOTH LOW INCOME AND ENTRY
14 LEVEL HOUSING. AND THAT'S BECOMING CRITICAL, BECAUSE WE NOW
15 HAVE BETWEEN 25 AND 30,000 CARS A DAY THAT ARE COMMUTING IN
16 AND OUT OF NAPA COUNTY. AND THAT'S -- THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT
17 PORTION OF THE COMMUNITY. AND THOSE ARE PEOPLE THAT,
18 BASICALLY, THEY DON'T CHOOSE TO COMMIT HERE; THEY WOULD LIVE
19 HERE IF THEY COULD, AND IF HOUSING WERE AVAILABLE, BUT IT'S
20 VERY RESTRICTIVE. AND THERE ARE, AS YOU WELL KNOW, VERY, VERY
21 DEMANDING ENVIRONMENTAL REQUIREMENTS. AND THEY HAVE TO BE MET.
22 AND FRANKLY IT KIND OF STRANGLES THE DEVELOPMENT OF HOUSING,
23 AT LEAST HERE. THIS MAY BE UNIQUE TO SOME OF THE OTHER
24 COUNTIES AND COMMUNITIES THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. BUT THAT'S

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

ONE THAT I -- AND I AGREE WITH YOU, ANUP, THAT THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. CHRISTINA?

CHRISTINA GOTUACO: I HAD AN IDEA BASED ON WHAT ANNE OLIVIA SAID EARLIER WHICH IS PART OF THE NOMENCLATURE NEEDS TO BE NAMED AS ANTI- DISPLACEMENT AREAS THAT SEEMS TO BE THE MAIN PRIORITY OF DESIGNATING THESE ZONES.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

RICHARD HEDGES: YES, THANK YOU. I ACTUALLY WANTED TO STEP BACK AND DRAW ATTENTION, IT WAS BROUGHT UP BY A COUPLE OF PEOPLE, THE SENIOR POPULATION, ESPECIALLY SENIOR DISABLED POPULATION AND THAT CUTS ACROSS ALL INCOME LINES. AND I KNOW FROM PERSONAL EXPERIENCE, TAKING -- I MET HIM WHEN HE WAS 93, NOW A 99-YEAR-OLD GENTLEMAN WHO HAS PARTICIPATED A LOT IN OUR ECONOMY, FROM WORLD WAR II ON, AND HE LIVES IN A VERY EXPENSIVE NEIGHBORHOOD AND HAS NOT A CENT TO HIS NAME BECAUSE HE SPENT ALL OF HIS RESOURCES, BUT ON PAPER IT LOOKS LIKE HE'S WEALTHY BECAUSE OF THE VALUE OF HIS HOUSE. SO WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT THE PEOPLE AND DIFFICULTY GETTING AROUND EVEN WHEN THEY LIVE IN THE HIGHER INCOME NEIGHBORHOODS BECAUSE THEY HAVE OBVIOUSLY OUTLIVED THEIR MONEY. I SPENT A LOT OF TIME TAKING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 THIS GENTLEMAN AROUND, ALL DAY, BECAUSE HE HAS SO MANY
2 ERRANDS, HAIR CUTS, HE'S ACTUALLY A JOY FOR ME TO DO BECAUSE
3 HE WAS A VERY INTERESTING GENTLEMAN. THIS IS ONE SMALL PORTION
4 OF WHAT WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT, AND I THINK THIS IS ONE THING.
5 JUST A COMMENT ON WHAT TERRY SAID, TERRY, WE REPRESENT A
6 NUMBER OF FARM WORKERS IN THE NAPA AREA AT DIFFERENT VINEYARDS
7 AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S SORELY NEEDED IS HOUSING. I DON'T
8 KNOW HOW THAT COULD BE INCORPORATED, BUT WE NEED TO GET HELP
9 FOR HOUSING THOSE PEOPLE.
10
11 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SOME PEOPLE LIVE IN THESE
12 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN BY CHOICE. I WANT YOU TO KNOW MANY
13 PEOPLE LIVE IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN BECAUSE THEY CAN'T
14 AFFORD TO LIVE ANYWHERE ELSE. BUT ALSO THE OPPORTUNITY FOR
15 MOVING OUT OF THESE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN IS SO EXPENSIVE, SO
16 PEOPLE CAN'T AFFORD TO MOVE OUT OF THEM. SO, THERE IS
17 CERTAINLY A COMMUNITY, BUT THERE IS A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF PEOPLE
18 WHO WERE LOCKED INTO THESE NEIGHBORHOODS. SO IF WE CAN KEEP
19 THAT IN MIND, AS WELL, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT. AND
20 FINALLY, TO BE HONEST WITH YOU, I'M NOT FOND OF ANY OF THE
21 FOUR NAME OPTIONS THAT YOU GAVE US. IN THE REPORT, THERE WAS A
22 MENTION OF ORGANS METRO -- ORGAN METRO AREAS HISTORICALLY
23 MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES, AND I THINK THAT REPRESENTS THE IDEA
24 A LITTLE BIT BETTER. THESE AREAS ARE MARGINALIZED FOR MANY
25 DIFFERENT REASONS, SO IT WOULD BE BETTER IN MY OPINION IF WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

WENT WITH THE HISTORICALLY MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES I ALSO LIKE THE IDEAS OF BREAKING DOWN OUR CENSUS TRACTS INTO ZONES SO WE CAN BE MORE ACCURATE IN OUR CALCULATIONS. SO IF THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF OUR COMMITTEE WHO HAVE QUESTIONS, WE WILL GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. MARTHA DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. ADRIENNE MENDOZA HAS HIS HAND RAISED HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE HIM.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: LET'S GIVE HIM THREE MINUTES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ADRIENNE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

SPEAKER: GREETINGS AND HAPPY HOLIDAYS TO ALL. THIS IS AN INTERESTING DISCUSSION, AND I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT I -- I KIND OF AGREED WITH WHAT CHRISTINA HAD TO SAY IS TO JUST SAY WHAT IT IS, SAY WHAT IT DOES. BUT YOU KNOW, AS SOMEONE WHO WAS FIRST TERM MEXICAN AMERICAN, AND THEN CHICANO AND THEN HISPANIC, NOW THE TERM IS LATINX, THE DYNAMICS OF THE LANGUAGE KIND OF -- KIND OF KEEPS US FROM, AS A COMMUNITY, AND I AM SURE THAT'S THE CASE WITH MANY OTHER ETHNICITIES AS WELL, WHERE, YOU KNOW, WHAT ONE TERM MIGHT GAIN ACCEPTANCE IN ONE COMMUNITY, MIGHT BE UNACCEPTABLE TO OTHERS. FOR EXAMPLE, THERE ARE MANY LATINOS, CHICANOS WHO REJECT THE TERM LATINX AND SAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

THAT DOESN'T APPLY TO ME. WE SHOULD SPEND MORE TIME IN ANALYZING AND DISCUSSING THIS BEFORE DECIDING ON A FINAL RESULT OF THAT. SO THAT'S ALL I REALLY HAVE TO SAY. AND I'LL SEE YOU ALL NEXT WEEK.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YES. TERMINOLOGY IS VERY IMPORTANT THESE DAYS. SO, RANDI, DO YOU WANT TO WRAP IT UP FOR US?

RANDI KINMAN: I DON'T NECESSARILY WANT TO WRAP IT UP, BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WHEN WE LOOKING AT THESE COMMUNITIES, I HAVE A FEELING SUNNYVALE MAY HAVE GROWN BASED ON SOME HOUSING ISSUES WHICH LEADS ME TO WONDER WHAT CENSUS DISTRICTS WHERE WE PUT IN A LOT OF HOUSING -- HOMELESS SHELTERS, OR WHERE WE HAVE A HIGH HOMELESS POPULATION ARE FALLING INTO THIS. SO COORDINATING WITH OUR HOMELESS OUTREACH TEAMS TO IDENTIFY THOSE ZONES AND AREAS WITHIN, WITHIN CENSUS TRACTS WOULD BE A GOOD THING. JUST SO THAT WE HAVE AN OVER-- THEY HAVE A MAP SOMEWHERE, EVERYBODY HAS A MAP SOMEWHERE, SO WE CAN OVERLAY THE MAPS AND MAKE SURE THEY'RE ALL LINING UP.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THAT UP. THE HOMELESS ISSUE IS HUGE, ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WHO LIVE IN MOTOR HOMES WHO CAN BE MOBILE AND MOVE AROUND TO DIFFERENT AREAS. ANY FINAL THOUGHTS ANUP AND DAVE, BEFORE WE MOVE ON?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1

2 **ANUP TAPASE:** WELL, YOU KNOW, WE HAD ONE MORE ITEM ON THE
3 AGENDA.
4
5 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** OH, YES. ITEM NUMBER -- WE'LL MOVE ON TO
6 ITEM NUMBER FIVE, BUT IS YOUR PRESENTATION COMPLETE?
7
8 **ANUP TAPASE:** SORRY. I MEANT ANOTHER ITEM ON MY PRESENTATION.
9
10 **VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. PLEASE.
11
12 **ANUP TAPASE:** OKAY. SO, WE'LL TRY TO KEEP THIS QUICK, BECAUSE I
13 KNOW WE'RE RUNNING OUT OF TIME. SO THIS IS THE FINAL ITEM ON
14 THE AGENDA. AND I WANT TO GIVE A QUICK OVERVIEW OF HOW WE
15 PRESENT THE EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT. SO, AS YOU KNOW, FOR EVERY
16 PLAN, OR EVERY PLANNED BAY AREA WE PRODUCE A SUPPLEMENTAL
17 REPORT CALLED THE EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT. AND SO WE WILL DO
18 THAT THIS TIME AS WELL, AS IN LAST PLANS. SO HERE WE ARE
19 SEEKING GUIDANCE, OR YOUR SUGGESTIONS ON WHAT YOU MIGHT WANT
20 TO SEE IN THE EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. SO WE
21 ARE THINKING THIS REPORT WILL HAVE THREE MAIN SECTIONS. I
22 MEAN, OF COURSE IT WILL HAVE DEMOGRAPHICS ON, SAY, THE
23 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN VERSUS HIGH RESOURCE AREAS FOR THE REST
24 OF THE REGION BUT IN TERMS OF THE MAIN CONTENT OF THE REPORT
25 WE ARE THINKING OF THREE SECTIONS EQUITY LENS IN STRATEGIES,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 THE INVESTMENT ANALYSIS, AND PLAN OUTCOMES ANALYSIS. NEXT PAGE
2 PLEASE. IN THIS PLAN WE REALLY HAVE TAKEN AN EQUITY AND
3 JUSTICE APPROACH TO WAVE INTO ALL THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
4 STRATEGIES AND WE HAVE ENGAGED WITH YOU ALL AND THE EQUITY
5 WORKING GROUP TO MODIFY THEM SEVERAL TIMES THERE ARE PLANS WE
6 HAVE INCLUDED AS PART OF THE STRATEGIES THAT CANNOT BE
7 SUBMITTED IN OUR MODELS FOR EXAMPLE, YOUTH FARE DISCOUNTS OR
8 SUBSIDIES FOR INTERNET ACCESS OR HIGHER SUBSIDIES FOR BUILDING
9 RETROFITS FOR HOUSING WITH LOW INCOME. THIS WOULD NOT BE
10 REFLECTED IN THE METRICS OF THE PLAN SO WE WOULD WANT TO DIVE
11 INTO THE STRATEGY COMPONENTS AS WELL AS FOR TRANSPORTATION
12 PROJECTS SPECIFICALLY WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE COMMITMENTS
13 THAT PROJECT SPONSORS HAVE MADE TOWARDS EQUITY FOCUS POLICIES.
14 THE NEXT SECTION, NEXT PAGE PLEASE. IT IS THE METHODOLOGY
15 WHERE WE WILL SHOW THE DISTRIBUTION OF PLAN FUNDING TOWARDS
16 UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS. SO THERE WAS A VERSION OF THIS IN THE
17 DRAFT BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES DOCUMENT, WHICH IS ALSO ONE OF YOUR
18 ATTACHMENTS. AGAIN, THIS SECTION TRIES TO CAPTURE WHO THE
19 FUNDING IN THE PLAN GOES TOWARDS. DOES IT DIRECTLY BENEFIT LOW
20 INCOME POPULATIONS OR POPULATIONS OF COLOR, OR HOW IT AFFECTS
21 OTHER SEGMENTS OF POPULATION OTHERWISE. AND AS WE HAVE DONE IN
22 THE PAST THIS WILL INCLUDE TITLE SIX ANALYSIS ON TRANSIT
23 INVESTMENTS SPECIFICALLY. THIRD, NEXT PAGE PLEASE. IS THE
24 OUTCOMES ANALYSIS, WHICH WILL MEASURE DISPARITIES AND PLAN
25 OUTCOMES BASED ON METRICS, AND THIS BUILDER METRICS WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 DEVELOPED DURING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 DURING THE HORIZON
2 PROCESS AND HAVE EXPANDED IT QUITE A BIT AS YOU HAVE SEEN
3 DURING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS BUT FOR LOOKING AT
4 DISPARITIES BETWEEN POPULATION GROUPS BETWEEN EXISTING 2050
5 PROJECT SCENARIO WHERE THERE IS NO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION, AND
6 2050 PLAN, AND WE WOULD HIGHLIGHT WHERE THE PLAN IS ABLE TO
7 DEGREES DISPARITIES. AND THIS WILL INFORM THE ENVIRONMENTAL
8 JUSTICE ANALYSIS THAT WE ARE REQUIRED TO INTRODUCE TO THE
9 PLAN. THE TABLE ON THE RIGHT SHOWS TOPICS FOR WHICH WE WOULD
10 MEASURE THESE DISPARITIES, AGAIN IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE HAD
11 METRICS FOR MOST OF THESE. AND WE WILL HAVE A SIMILAR OUTCOMES
12 DOCUMENT FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS WELL, WHICH WE WILL
13 RELEASE LATER THIS MONTH, AND THAT WILL INFORM THIS
14 DISPARITIES ANALYSIS FOR THE EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT. TO WRAP
15 UP, NEXT PAGE PLEASE. HERE IS WHAT YOU CAN EXPECT IN THE NEXT
16 FEW MONTHS. NON-SHOWN -- NOT SHOWN ON THE SLIDE WE KICKED OFF
17 OUR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ENGAGEMENT EFFORT, CRUCIAL PART OF THE
18 PLAN AND STRATEGY THAT GO INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WE HAVE
19 SOME WORKSHOPS NEXT MONTH AND HOPE YOU CAN ATTEND AND THAT
20 PROCESS WILL CONTINUE IN THE NEXT MONTHS. WE WILL REVIEW THE
21 FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES. THEN SEEK APPROVAL FROM OUR BOARD
22 AND COMMISSION TO APPROVE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS THE DRAFT
23 PLAN IN JANUARY. AFTER THIS, WE WOULD BEGIN THE EIR -- WELL, I
24 THINK WE HAVE ALREADY STARTED THE EIR, BUT ONCE WE ADOPT THE
25 DRAFT PLAN THAT WILL BE USED IN THE EIR PROCESS AND THEN WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

WILL ALSO BE DRAFTING THE DOCUMENT PLAN ITSELF AND SUPPLEMENTARY REPORTING INCLUDING EQUITY ANALYSIS REPORT. GIVEN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT TERM POTENTIALLY MARCH, WE HOPE TO SHARE OUR DRAFT OF THE REPORT WITH YOU. AND IF WE REVISE THE NOMENCLATURE THIS IS WHERE WE WILL DISCUSS IT FURTHER. IN APRIL WE WOULD RELEASE THE DRAFT PLAN, AS WELL AS THE TITLE SIX, AND EJ ANALYSIS. I THINK THIS'S OUR LAST SLIDE. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. YEAH. SO, THAT WAS THE LAST SLIDE. SO, ANY THOUGHTS ON OTHER THINGS YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN THE EQUITY AND ANALYSIS REPORT WOULD BE WELCOME NOW.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: I HAVE TO APOLOGIZE TO EVERYONE. I THOUGHT WE JUST HAD TWO STOPS WITHIN THAT PRESENTATION, AND NOT THREE. SO, WE HAVE GOT LIMITED TIME. AND, RICK COATES, CAN YOU GIVE YOUR COMMENT IN ONE MINUTE?

RICK COATES: I THINK SO. UNDER CONNECTED, ON THAT FIRST SLIDE, YOU LISTED PROXIMITY AND ACCESS, ACCESS TO JOBS, PROXIMITY TO TRANSIT, THERE IS SOMETHING IN BETWEEN THERE THAT'S MISSING, AND THAT'S THE TRANSFER FROM ONE MODE TO THE OTHER, INTERMODAL CONNECTEDNESS, AS WELL, THAT NEEDS TO BE IN THERE. SECONDLY, WHEN YOU GO OVER INVESTMENT, YOU SHOULD ACTUALLY ASK WHETHER THE INVESTMENT ACTUALLY ADDRESSES THE NEEDS OF THESE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT JUST SPENDING MONEY THERE DOESN'T NECESSARILY ADDRESS THE ISSUE. THAT'S IT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES.

RICHARD HEDGES: YES, THANK YOU. I HAVE GOT A QUESTION, AND I DON'T THINK IT'S OUT OF BOUNDS HERE, ABOUT HOW SOMETIMES BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING CAN AFFECT THE ECONOMICS OF A NEIGHBORHOOD. I WAS READING AN ARTICLE IN THE "SAN FRANCISCO BUSINESS TIMES" ABOUT THE PROJECT IN MARKET, WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO CHANGE THE ZONING, TALL ZONING A LOT OF UNITS WITH NO BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING HOWEVER THEY'RE TAKING OVER EMISSIONS DEVELOPMENT WHICH HAS BEEN A MONSTER IN MISSION AND MAKE IT BELOW MARKET RATE BUT THOSE HOUSES WILL START IN THE 80 SOME THOUSAND IT SEEMS TO MOST PEOPLE THAT MOVE INTO THAT DEVELOPMENT QUALIFY AT NEAR THE $80,000 LIMIT I THINK IT'S 83,000, FOR INCOME, FOR THE FAMILY, THAT THAT WOULD CHANGE IN MANY WAYS, THE ECONOMICS FOR PEOPLE THAT LIVE IN THAT NEIGHBORHOOD. I WONDER IF STAFF HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THAT, HOW IT COULD SORT OF DISLOCATE THE ACTUAL OVERALL NUMBERS. THANK YOU.

ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU. THANK YOU, RICH. SO, I KNOW IN OUR LAND USE MODEL, TAKES INTO ACCOUNT HOW RELATIVE REALISTIC PRICES MAY CHANGE BASED ON MORE BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING OR MORE ABOUT -- OR MORE HIGH INCOME HOUSING. I'M NOT SURE --

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

1 **RICHARD HEDGES:** 20,000 DOWN TO 30,000. I KNOW THE CITY I LIVE
2 IN HAS TWO LEVELS, 15 PERCENT IF YOU GO WITH ALL LEVELS OF
3 HOUSING, TEN PERCENT IF YOU DO LOW-LOW AND MOST DEVELOPERS DO
4 LOW LOW AND IT MAKES SENSE FOR MORE HOUSING FOR SERVICE
5 WORKERS AND LOW INCOME PEOPLE. WHAT I'M SAYING IS THERE SEEMS
6 TO BE A WIDE VARIETY OF INCOMES AND BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING
7 AND HOW THAT ACCOUNT AFFECT OUR VIEW OF A NEIGHBORHOOD WHETHER
8 OR NOT IT IS IN FACT COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, IF YOU HAVE
9 120,000 INCOME, MARKET RATE DEVELOPMENTS ARE REALLY DEPEND ON
10 WHAT COMMUNITY ALLOWS. >DAVE VAUTIN: THOSE ARE DIFFERENT TYPES
11 OF AFFORDABLE AT DIFFERENT AFFORDABILITY LEVELS ARE GOING TO
12 DRIVEWAY THE CENSUS DEMOGRAPHICS THAT WE'RE USING TO IDENTIFY
13 THE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, SO, THOSE ARE ALL -- I WOULD SAY,
14 ALL KIND OF SORT OF POLICY DRIVERS THAT LEAD TO THE INCOME
15 PATTERN IN DIFFERENT -- IN THESE DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES. YOU
16 KNOW, I THINK, YOU KNOW, THAT -- THE SORT OF DISAGGREGATION
17 THAT WE'RE STARTING TO SEE IN DIFFERENT TYPES OF BELOW MARKET
18 RATE UNITS IS VERY INTERESTING AND IT'S SOMETHING THAT IN OUR
19 MODEL WE'RE ACTUALLY -- SOMETHING WE'LL NEED TO FOCUS ON IN
20 THE YEARS AHEAD AS WE CONTINUE TO ENHANCE HOW WE MODEL THE
21 BELOW MARKET RATE UNITS BUT IT IS SOMETHING THAT WHEN IT COMES
22 TO THE CENSUS DATA, THAT IT WOULD CAPTURE THE SPECTRUM OF THE
23 DIFFERENT INCOMES.
24

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

RICHARD HEDGES: YEAH IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WITH THOSE VARYING RATES THAT COMMUNITIES CAN DO AND BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING THAT ESPECIALLY IN SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES THAT IT MIGHT DRIVE THEM TO CHOOSE A WHOLE DIFFERENT DEMOGRAPHIC BY THE HIGHER NUMBERS. AND SO WHEN WE TALK ABOUT BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING WE'RE DEFINITELY TALKING ABOUT A LOT OF DIFFERENT THINGS. AND WE NEED TO BE MORE SPECIFIC. THAT'S MY MAIN POINT.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RANDI?

RANDI KINMAN: HI. THANK YOU. I JUST WANT US TO BE REALLY CLEAR ABOUT DISAGGREGATING OR MAYBE BEING ABLE TO IDENTIFY THE DIFFERENCES WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ACCESSING TRANSIT OR ACCESSING JOBS ON FOOT, ACCESSING JOBS BY TRANSIT, AND THE AMOUNT OF DISTANCE AND TIME THAT THAT IS, WHEN WE TALKING ABOUT, REALLY, URBAN AREAS, AS OPPOSED TO THE RURAL AREAS. BECAUSE WE COULD MAKE OUR NUMBERS LOOK A WHOLE LOT BETTER IF WE ELIMINATED, YOU KNOW, LIKE NAPA COUNTY, AND SOUTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND SOME OF -- YOU KNOW, LIKE, LET'S HEAD OUT TO THE OTHER COASTAL COUNTIES -- WHICH ISN'T MY POINT. MY POINT IS, THERE IS A DIFFERENT WAY OF MEASURING THOSE, OR WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT A DIFFERENT WAY OF MEASURING THOSE, SO WE'RE NOT SKEWING DATA. WE CAN'T SAY WE'RE BEING SUCCESSFUL IF WE HAVE, YOU KNOW, 15 MINUTE THROUGHPUT TIME ON BUSES YET WE HAVE A COUNTY THAT DOESN'T HAVE ACCESS TO ANYTHING. SO THAT'S PART OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

A TWO-PART THING. AND THE SECOND PART OF THAT IS, DO -- ARE WE TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE NEW RHNA ASSIGNMENTS TO COMMUNITIES THAT HAVEN'T BEEN MEETING LOW INCOME GOALS AND ARE NOW BEING TOLD, YOU HAVE GOT TO INCREASE -- AND I WILL PICK SARATOGA ONLY BECAUSE I GOT A RAMP FROM THEM, THAT THEY'RE BEING TOLD THAT THEY'RE NOW -- THEIR NEW RHNA GOALS ARE TO INCREASE BY 30 PERCENT, THEIR HOUSING FOR LOW INCOME. NOW, THEY DON'T HAVE TRANSIT RUNNING THROUGH THEIR CITY, THEY DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO JOBS. SO THOSE MEASUREMENTS ARE GOING TO SKEW, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE GOING TO BE SKEWED BY THAT, BUT IS ALL OF THIS TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE NEW RHNA ALLOTMENTS? >DAVE VAUTIN: YEAH. I CAN TACKLE THAT ONE. SO, YES, THE PLAN AND RHNA ARE SYNCED WITH ONE ANOTHER. SOME OF THE PLAN DATA USES THE BASELINE FOR RHNA. BUT REALLY IMPORTANT THING IN THE RHNA PROCESS, YOU KNOW, THE STAKEHOLDERS WHO PARTICIPATED AND HOSPITAL DESIGN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY FELT LIKE IT'S MORE IMPORTANT TO GROW IN AREAS THAT ARE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS EVEN IF THEY DON'T HAVE TRANSIT, JUST BECAUSE THEY HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY OF ACCESSING THE SCHOOLS THERE, SOMETIMES BEING VERY CLOSE TO JOB CENTERS, ET CETERA SO WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE RHNA NUMBERS FOR THIS TIME, YOU SEE THAT SOME OF THE JURISDICTIONS THAT MIGHT HAVE MODERATE OR EVEN MORE LIMITED TRANSIT SERVICES ARE HAVING HIGHER HOUSING ALLOCATIONS THAN IN THE PAST AND THAT'S BECAUSE THEY HAVE BEEN HISTORICALLY EXCLUSIONARY PLACE. AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THE EQUITY COMMUNITY FELT STRONGLY ABOUT THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

WHILE TRANSIT IS PART OF THE FORMULA FOR RHNA IT'S A MUCH SMALLER PORTION THAN IN THE PAST.

RANDI KINMAN: THAT'S KIND OF MY POINT. ARE WE WORKING AT ODDS WITH EACH OTHER ON THE RHNA GOALS. I HAVE TO FIGHT FOR ONLY BUS LINE THAT RUNS OUT THERE BECAUSE MY CAMPUS IS OUT THERE. SO I HAVE NO PROBLEM TELLING THEM, SUCK IT UP, YOU HAVEN'T PROVIDED AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR THE PEOPLE THAT ACTUALLY WORK IN YOUR CITY, BUT WHAT I DO HAVE A PROBLEM WITH, IS, IS CREATING THE NEXT GENERATION -- WHAT WE WON'T CALL COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. >DAVE VAUTIN: WELL I GUESS I WOULD SAY THAT SOME OF THE NEIGHBORHOODS IN, ESPECIALLY IN WESTERN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, ARE, WHAT WE WOULD CALL HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, WHICH THEY HAVE BEEN THE VERY AREAS THAT HAVE BEEN EXCLUDING LOW INCOME FOLKS IN THE PAST. SO THE RHNA NUMBERS, THE INTENT IS NOT TO CHANGE THEIR TYPOLOGY FROM DISPROPORTIONATE FROM HIGH INCOME TO LOCATION, THE INTENT IS TO CREATE A BALANCED SET OF DEMOGRAPHICS AND BALANCED SET OF HOUSING OPPORTUNITY IN THOSE PLACES. SO, I DON'T THINK WE'RE WORKING ON THE CROSS PURPOSES HERE. THE PLAN HAS STRATEGIES THAT ARE ALL ABOUT, YOU KNOW, BRINGING TRANSIT SERVICE BACK. MAKING SURE WE'RE NOT LOSING THOSE BUS LINES MAKE SURE WE'RE INVESTING MORE IN TRANSIT AND MODERNIZING AND ALL OF THAT SO WE'RE NOT LEAVING THEM BY THE WAYSIDE BUT WE'RE ALSO SAYING THESE COMMUNITIES NEED TO STEP UP TO THE PLATE ESPECIALLY ON THE AFFORDABLE SIDE BRINGING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

THOSE UNITS INTO THE MARKET SO FOLKS HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY, IF THEY SO CHOOSE, TO LIVE IN PLACES LIKE SARATOGA.

RANDI KINMAN: AND HOW DOES THAT TIE INTO THE RURAL ISSUES? >DAVE VAUTIN: THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTY ISSUE?

RANDI KINMAN: YEAH. I MEAN WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT -- WE HAVE COUNTIES THAT ARE PRIMARILY AGRICULTURE, AND SOUTH SANTA CLARA IS PRIMARILY AGRICULTURE, SO MY CONCERN IS WHEN WE MEASURE HOW LONG DOES IT TAKE FOR SOMEBODY TO GET TO WORK, THAT WE'RE ACKNOWLEDGING THE FACT THAT THE CORE OF THE URBAN AREA MEASURES DIFFERENTLY BECAUSE THERE IS REASON AND WE'RE NOT HOLDING OURSELVES UP BECAUSE WE HAVE THESE OTHER AREAS. >DAVE VAUTIN: UNDERSTOOD. A LOT OF THE RURAL AREAS IN THE RHNA PROCESS -- LET ME CLARIFY, A LOT OF THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS TO BE CLEAR, ARE A MIX OF RURAL, AND ALSO URBAN ISLANDS AND OTHER CHUNKS OF URBANIZED AREAS IT'S NOT JUST THE SOUTH BAY WITH POCKETS ALL OVER INCLUDING STANFORD AREA BUT PLACES LIKE CASTRO VALLEY IN THE EAST BAY THESE ARE UNINCORPORATED AREAS MANY OF THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS IN THE REGION, YOU KNOW, SAY, TEND TO NOT HAVE GOOD ACCESS TO TRANSIT THEY TEND TO BE LOWER RESOURCE AREAS LOOKING AT THE REGION OVERALL BUT THEY ARE GETTING SOME RHNA BECAUSE THERE'S AN EXPECTATION THAT THOSE -- WE'RE NOT SAYING THERE SHOULD BE DEVELOPMENT IN THE RURAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

AREAS, BUT THAT THOSE URBAN ISLANDS ALL OVER THE BAY AREA, THEY SHOULD HAVE ACCOMMODATE AS WELL.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: RANDI, I'M GOING TO HAVE TO CUT YOU OFF, DUE TO TIME. THIS CERTAINLY -- FURTHER CONVERSATION. IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS THAT WE DON'T GET TO, PLEASE FOLLOW UP WITH STAFF AND WE WILL HAVE THEM PUT IN PUBLIC RECORD SO EVERYONE CAN SEE. TERRY SCOTT WILL BE OUR FINAL SPEAKER. IN ONE MINUTE PLEASE.

TERRY SCOTT: THANK YOU. MY QUESTION IS, TO THE METHODOLOGY, THAT DETERMINES THE RHNA NUMBERS FOR EACH OF THE COUNTIES AND THE COMMUNITIES OUT THERE. WE -- IN NAPA COUNTY, FOR EXAMPLE, THE RHNA NUMBERS IN THIS CYCLE MORE THAN DOUBLED. AND THIS IS AN AGRICULTURAL COMMUNITY WHERE AGRICULTURE IS THE HIGHEST BEST USE OF THE LAND ACCORDING TO OUR GENERAL PLAN. SO IT'S DIFFICULT TO ACCOMMODATE THAT KIND OF A LARGE NUMBER OF HOUSING WHEN YOU HAVE SO FEW URBAN AREAS IN THE COUNTY TO DO SO. NOW I RECOGNIZE THAT IT KIND OF CONTRADICTS WITH THE NEED FOR THAT KIND OF HOUSING, BECAUSE IT'S NOT ADVANTAGEOUS TO HAVE 30,000 CARS A DAY COMMUTING INTO A COUNTY OF LESS THAN 140,000 RESIDENTS. SO THAT MEANS THAT, OBVIOUSLY, THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE HOUSING AVAILABLE, BUT IT CONTRADICTS WITH OUR GENERAL PLAN. HOW DO WE GET AROUND THAT? AND HOW DO WE MEET THESE RHNA NUMBERS? NOW I REALIZE THERE IS SOME NEGOTIATIONS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

THAT TAKE PLACE, AND THOSE NUMBERS WILL PROBABLY GO DOWN. BUT IT'S A VERY DIFFICULT POSITION TO HAVE OUR COUNTY AND CITY LEADERS PUT IN, IN TRYING TO NEGOTIATE THOSE NUMBERS, RECOGNIZING THAT THE AREAS AND THE OPPORTUNITIES JUST DON'T EXIST HERE. THIS IS -- OUR BIGGEST BUSINESS IS AGRICULTURE, AND THE BIGGEST PART OF AGRICULTURE IS AGRA-TOURISM, AND THAT DOESN'T LEAD TO AREAS FOR HOUSING. >DAVE VAUTIN: I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, I THINK WE HAVE GOTTEN OFF OF THE AGENDA ITEM HERE AND ON TO THE RHNA TOPIC, I KNOW RHNA IS INTERESTING TO TALK ABOUT AND NEEDS TO BE TALKED ABOUT IT WILL BE TALKED ABOUT THIS MONTH AND NEXT MONTH. TO ADDRESS YOUR QUESTION, EVERY REGIONAL RHNA NUMBER WENT UP ALMOST EVERY JURISDICTION IS SEEING A HIGHER ALLOCATION THIS TIME. SECOND PARTLY OF THAT QUESTION IS YOU'RE CORRECT THERE ARE NEGOTIATIONS IN FACT THERE IS A PROVISION IN LAW THAT ALLOWS UNINCORPORATED COUNTIES TO TRANSFER THEIR RHNA TO NEIGHBORING CITIES IF BOTH PARTIES AGREE IS THAT'S A LAW THAT CAN BE EXERCISED STARTING IN 2021. THERE IS A PROCESS FOR DEALING WITH THIS ISSUE, AND I THINK FOR SOME COUNTIES THEY'RE GOING TO PURSUE THAT PROCESS.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH EVERYONE. I APPRECIATE YOUR FEEDBACK. SO, MARTHA DO WE HAVE -- IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE ONE COMMENT FROM THE PUBLIC.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: FROM WALTER WILSON. WALTER, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

SPEAKER: HELLO GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. HOW ARE YOU DOING? SO LISTEN, SO ONE OF THE THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO ASK A QUESTION ABOUT, THEY SEE IN THE REPORT IS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT EQUITY, AND THE DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION, ABOUT EMPLOYMENT, AND I DON'T SEE ANY OF THAT AND I DON'T KNOW IF THIS COMMITTEE CAN HAVE ANY INFLUENCE ON THE CONTRACTING, THE BILLIONS OF DOLLARS THAT ARE SPENT IN TRANSPORTATION CONTRACTING, AND HOW TO ADDRESS THAT DISPARITY IN TERMS OF DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION FOR MINORITY OWNED BUSINESS AND INCREASING THAT AS WELL, IS THAT SOMETHING THAT WE CAN ADDRESS?

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU. SO, BEFORE WE MOVE ON, WILL WE SEE YOU AGAIN WITHIN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS? ANUP? DAVE?

ANUP TAPASE: YOU CERTAINLY WILL BE SEEING DAVE, AS HE BRINGS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES TO THE LARGER COUNCIL, AND YOU WILL PROBABLY SEE ME IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH WHEN I BRING IN A DRAFT OF THE EQUITY ANALYSIS.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO LET'S MOVE -- CLOSE THIS ITEM OUT, AND MOVING ON TO ITEM FIVE, NEW BUSINESS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO FUTURE AGENDAS.

ANUP TAPASE: THANK YOU.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU ANUP AND DAVE, YOU ARE WELCOME TO STAY IF YOU CHOOSE. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS WITH NEW BUSINESS? SEEING NONE, LET'S MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. ITEM SIX. MARTHA, DO WE HAVE GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS AT THIS TIME?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM.

VEDA FLOREZ, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU EVERYBODY. MOVING ON TO ITEM SEVEN, ADJOURNMENT. SO THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE HELD AT A TIME AND DATE TO BE DULY NOTICED. SO, THANK YOU EVERYONE. I WILL CALL THIS MEETING ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

NTT

Broadcasting Government