METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
2	TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2020, 3:05 PM
3	
4	CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. IF YOU WOULD RUN THE TAPE, PLEASE?
5	
6	CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. AND WELCOME TO THE NOVEMBER 7TH
7	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING. I'M RANDI KINMAN. IF I COULD
8	HAVE ROLL CALL, PLEASE?
9	
10	MICHAEL BALDINI: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK: I SEE MR. BURNETT IS PRESENT.
13	
14	RICK COATES: HERE. COCHRAN?
15	
16	ABIGAIL COCHRAN: HERE.
17	
18	CHAIR KINMAN: HAS A POWER OUTAGE.
19	
20	CLERK: FLOREZ.
21	
22	MR. GLOVER: HERE.
23	
24	CHRISTINA GOTUACO: PRESENT.
25	



1

RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.

2 3 MICHELLE HERNANDEZ: HERE. 4 5 WENDY KALLINS: HERE 6 7 HERE. 8 9 >> CLERK: LEVIN IS ABSENT. 10 11 MICHAEL LOPEZ: HERE. 12 13 MARC MADDEN: HERE. 14 15 ADRIAN MENDOZA: HERE. 16 CLERK MOMOH IS EXCUSED. MURRY IS EXCUSED. OZIN IS ABSENT. 17 18 SCHWENG? SCHWENG IS ABSENT? SCOTT? 19 >>SPEAKER: HERE. 20 21 22 CLERK: AND WILSON. 23 WALTER WILSON: HERE. I WILL CHANGE MY NAME TO A. WILSON SO 24 THAT I CAN GO FIRST. 25





1 2 CLERK: WE HAVE A QUORUM. [LAUGHTER.] 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT TAKES US TO ITEM 4 5 NUMBER 3, THE CHAIR'S REPORT. AND I'M NOT GOING TO BOTHER YOU WITH ALL THE MEETINGS WE'VE ALL BEEN ATTENDING THIS WEEK. I 6 DID WANT TO TAKE A MINUTE TO CONGRATULATE COUNCILMEMBER WILSON 7 8 ON AN EXCELLENT ARTICLE WRITTEN THIS LAST WEEK CONCERNING HIS CONSORTIUM. WALTER, WOULD YOU LIKE TO TAKE A MINUTE TO LET US 9 KNOW ABOUT THAT? AND THANK YOU FOR HELPING BRING JACKIE'S 10 PLACE BACK TO. 11 12 WALTER WILSON: I KNOW, YEAH, OKAY. SO IT WAS AN INTERVIEW THAT 13 WAS DONE LIKE ABOUT TWO MONTHS AGO, REALLY. AND THE FOCUS OF 14 15 THE INTERVIEW WAS THE IMPACT OF COVID ON MINORITY AND WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESSES, WHICH ARE THE MOST UNDERFUNDED AND GENERALLY 16 MANY OF THEM HAVE FAILED DURING THIS COVID ERA AND NEVER TO 17 RETURN. AND SO, YOU KNOW, MYSELF, I HAD A DOUBLE CONCERN, 18 FIRST OF ALL, THE NUMBERS OF AFRICAN-AMERICAN PEOPLE DYING IN 19 THE COVID WAS JUST OFF THE CHARTS IN THE COUNTRY SO FAR I 20 THINK IT'S SOMETHING LIKE 46,000 JUST YESTERDAY. THE NUMBERS 21 OF LATINOS WHO DECEASED FROM COVID HAVE PASSED US AT 47,000, 22 BUT PERCENTAGE-WISE, IT'S JUST TRAGIC. SO I'VE BEEN CONCERNED 23 ABOUT THAT. BUT THEN I'VE ALSO BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT THE FACT 24 25 THAT PEOPLE WHO I KNOW THAT OWN BUSINESSES, THEIR BUSINESSES,



- 1 YOU KNOW, JUST REALLY IMPACTFUL, MANY OF THEM WILL GO OUT OF
- 2 BUSINESS AND NEVER RETURN. AND MOST OF THOSE ARE MINORITY AND
- 3 WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESSES. AND SO I WAS TALKING TO -- AND I'M
- 4 WORKING WITH THE COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA, DR. CODY AND OTHERS,
- 5 TO TRY TO FIND SOME KIND OF BALANCE. AND I KNOW THIS. I'VE
- 6 ALWAYS KNOWN THIS IS EVEN THOUGH WE'RE SOCIAL DISTANCED, WE'RE
- 7 WEARING MASKS, IF WE GO BACK TO LARGE AMOUNTS OF PEOPLE IN
- 8 GROCERY STORES AND GYMS AND ALL THAT, THE VIRUS IS GOING TO
- 9 SPIKE AND THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT HAPPENED. AND THE ARTICLE WAS
- 10 REALLY ABOUT HOW CAN WE REALLY HELP MAINTAIN THESE SMALL
- 11 BUSINESSES WHO ARE VULNERABLE DURING THIS TIME? AND THAT'S
- 12 LIKE OUR PRIORITY RIGHT NOW.
- 14 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU.
- 16 WALTER WILSON: ONE OTHER THING I WANT TO ANNOUNCE, THE
- 17 MINORITY BUSINESS CONSORTIUM WON THE BID TO BE THE BART PHASE
- 18 2 DBS CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT FOR THE NEXT EIGHT YEARS.
- 20 CHAIR KINMAN: THAT'S TERRIFIC NEWS. THANK YOU.
- 22 WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU.

23

13

15

19



1	CHAIR KINMAN: WITH THAT, WE WILL MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER 4,
2	APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 14TH, 2020, MINUTES. DO I HAVE A
3	MOTION TO APPROVE?
4	
5	SPEAKER: SO MOVED.
6	
7	MICHAEL BALDINI: MICHAEL BALDINI.
8	
9	CHAIR KINMAN: I'LL TAKE RICH AS THE FIRST AND BALDINI AS THE
10	SECOND. THANK YOU. WAS THERE ANY WRITTEN INFORMATION OR PUBLIC
11	INPUT, MARTI?
12	
13	SPEAKER: NO, NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.
14	
15	CHAIR KINMAN: THERE'S NOBODY WAIVING THEIR HAND THAT I COULD
16	SEE. WITH THAT, MAY WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?
17	
18	MICHAEL BALDINI: AYE.
19	
20	RICHARD L. BURNETT: YES.
21	
22	CLERK COULD SAY TEE AND OHS IS EXCUSED. COATES?
23	
24	>>RICK COATES: YES.
25	





1	ABIGAIL COCHRAN: AYE.
2	
3	CLERK: EL DREAD IS EXCUSED. FLOREZ IS ABSENT. GLOVER?
4	
5	SPEAKER: YES.
6	
7	CHRISTINA GOTUACO: AYE.
8	
9	RICHARD HEDGES: YES.
10	
11	MICHELLE HERNANDEZ: YES.
12	
13	WENDY KALLINS: YES.
14	
15	CHAIR KINMAN: YES.
16	
17	CLERK: LEVIN IS ABSENT. LOPEZ.
18	
19	MICHAEL LOPEZ: YES.
20	
21	MARC MADDEN: YES.
22	
23	ADRIAN MENDOZA: YES.





- 1 CLERK MOMOH IS EXCUSED, MURRY IS EXCUSED. OZIM IS ABSENT.
- 2 SCHWENG? IS ABSENT. SCOTT?

3

4 >>SPEAKER: AYE.

5

6 WALTER WILSON: YES.

7

8 CLERK: PASSES UNANIMOUSLY FOR EVERYONE PRESENT.

9

- 10 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. MOVING INTO ITEM NUMBER 6,
- 11 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS, OUR SUBCOMMITTEE ON EQUITY AND ACCESS,
- 12 BOTH THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR ARE NOT HERE. IS THERE ANY
- 13 COMMITTEE MEMBER WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THE EOUITY AND
- 14 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING? SEEING NONE, WE'LL MOVE TO THE
- 15 FAIR COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.

- 17 WENDY KALLINS: OKAY. WE MET ON NOVEMBER 2ND. THE CONSULTANTS
- 18 REPORTED ON THE PROCESS OF THE RESEARCH CONDUCTED SO FAR. THIS
- 19 INCLUDED A PILOT NARRATIVE WORKSHOP WITH 10 TRANSIT RIDERS TO
- 20 STORIES OF THEIR EXPERIENCE CONSIDERING THE COST OF THE
- 21 EXPERIENCE AND EXPERIENCE WITH ACTUAL COST OF THE TRIP. THESE
- 22 STORIES WERE GROUPED INTO 11 ISSUES AND 8 BROAD THEMES
- 23 INCLUDING PAYMENT ISSUES AND RELIABILITY AND THE BROAD THEMES
- 24 OF UNCERTAINTY, FAIRNESS, AND STRESS. NEXT, THESE WILL BE
- 25 DEVELOPED INTO INTERVIEW QUESTIONS FOR ONE-HOUR CONVERSATIONS



- 1 WITH INDIVIDUALS. THE CONSULTANTS THEN REPORTED ON THEIR STUDY
- 2 OF OTHER REGIONS AND HOW THEY HANDLE FAIR INTEGRATIONS. THESE
- 3 REGIONS WERE DR. METRO, L.A. METRO, SEATTLE SOUND TRANSIT,
- 4 SYDNEY AUSTRALIA METRO, MONTREAL AND ZURICH. EACH REGION HAD
- 5 UNIQUE STRUCTURES, SOME SIMILAR TO THE BAY AREA WITH MULTIPLE
- 6 TRANSIT AGENCIES. SOME WITH MULTIPLE AGENCIES BUT WITH ONE
- 7 STRONG AGENCY OVERSEEING ALL OF THAT. AND THOSE WITH THE
- 8 CENTRAL AGENCY. THEY LOOKED AT HOW THE TRIPS WERE PRICED AND
- 9 THE EXTENT OF REGIONAL INTEGRATION AND HOW DECISIONS WERE
- 10 MADE. SOME OF THE COMMENTS FROM THE COMMITTEE: A FEW OF THE
- 11 COMMITTEE MEMBERS REQUESTED THAT THE GOALS OF THE PROJECT
- 12 NEEDS TO BE CLEARER. OTHERS WERE CONCERNED THERE WERE OTHER
- 13 FACTORS THAT WOULD BOOST RIDERSHIP BEE FARE INTEGRATION. SOME
- 14 OF THE AREAS HAD ROBUST TRANSIT USE WHILE OTHERS HAD POOR
- 15 TRANSIT USAGES THAN THE BAY AREA, POORER TRANSIT USAGES THAN
- 16 THE BAY AREA. AND WE WANTED THE KNOW-HOW THAT WOULD BE TAKEN
- 17 INTO ACCOUNT. THE NEXT FULL FARE INTEGRATION COMMITTEE WILL BE
- 18 ON DECEMBER 7TH AT 1 P.M. AND THE SUBCOMMITTEE HAS NOT YET
- 19 BEEN SCHEDULED YET. F.

- 21 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. WE ARE TRYING TO MOVE 11 INTO THE
- 22 ATTENDEES. I SEE A HAPPENED RAISED. RICH HEDGES?
- 24 RICHARD HEDGES: ONE SMALL COMMENT ON THE INTEGRATION MEETING.
- 25 I THINK ONE OF THE MAJOR FOCUSES, FOCUSING ON THE ABILITY TO

20



- 1 GET A PROGRAM MANAGER FOR THE ENTIRE SYSTEM. AND I THINK THAT
- 2 WOULD PROBABLY BE AN IMPORTANT STEP IN TRYING TO RATIONALIZE
- 3 THE 27 OR MORE TRANSIT DISTRICTS. I REALLY THINK 27 TO 29, I
- 4 HAVE NOT PERSONALLY COUNTED EACH AND EVERY ONE. SO THAT'S THE
- 5 ONLY COMMENT I WANTED TO MAKE.

6

- 7 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THE
- 8 FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE? PLEASE NOTE
- 9 CHAIR LEVIN HAS JOINED US. AND WE HAVE NOW VICE CHAIR ELDRED
- 10 OF THE EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE HAS JOINED US. ANNE OLIVIA, WOULD
- 11 YOU LIKE TO GIVE A REPORT ON THE COMMITTEE MEETING?

12

13 SPEAKER: ADINA HAD HER HAND UP.

14

15 CHAIR KINMAN: ADINA TRIED TO JOIN US.

16

17 SPEAKER: NO, SHE'S THERE WITH HER HAND UP.

18

- 19 SPEAKER: ACTUALLY, MY POWER JUST CAME BACK ON. GIVE ME A
- 20 SECOND TO GET SITUATED.

21

22 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ADINA, DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK?

- 24 SPEAKER: YES, SORRY. I WAS LOGGED IN AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
- 25 BECAUSE I USED TO WRONG LINK TO JOIN THE MEETING. APOLOGIES



- 1 FOR THAT. AND JUST THE COMMENT THAT I WOULD ADD HAVING HEARD
- 2 WENDY'S SUMMARY AND NOT BEING ABLE TO ATTEND THAT MEETING DUE
- 3 TO A FAMILY EMERGENCY, I THINK THAT SOME PEOPLE MADE COMMENTS
- 4 THAT THERE ARE OTHER ISSUES OTHER THAN FARE INTEGRATION THAT
- 5 SUPPRESS TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND MAKE IT HARD TO USE, WHICH IS
- 6 TRUE, BUT FARE INTEGRATION IS ALSO "A" VERY POWERFUL TOOL THAT
- 7 DOES HELP TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND THERE ARE SOME
- 8 GOOD CASE STUDIES FROM AROUND THE WORLD SHOWING THAT. SO WHILE
- 9 IT IS CERTAINLY NOT THE ONLY THING THAT IS HELPFUL, IT IS AN
- 10 IMPORTANT THING. AND THAT IS MY COMMENT.

11

- 12 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANYMORE COMMENTS ON THE
- 13 FARE INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE? SKIPPING THAT, WE'LL GO TO THE
- 14 -- IF ANNE OLIVIA IS NOW SETTLED IN?

15

- 16 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: I'M ACTUALLY PHYSICALLY CONNECTING WIRES
- 17 AND THINGS TO MAKE SURE I HAVE INTERNET AS WE DON'T HAVE POWER
- 18 HERE.

- 20 CHAIR KINMAN: WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO IS DELAY THE EQUITY AND
- 21 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT UNTIL AFTER THE BLUE RIBBON
- 22 TASKFORCE. AND THAT WILL ALLOW YOU PLENTY OF TIME. IT WILL
- 23 ALSO ALLOW ME TO BACK UP TO ITEM NUMBER 5, WHICH WAS PUBLIC
- 24 COMMENT. FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA. MARTI, DO WE HAVE ANY
- 25 WRITTEN OR ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC?





1 2 MARTI PASCHAL: NO, WE DID NOT RECEIVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT. 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. SO WE'LL EYE I'M MAKING MYSELF A NOTE 4 5 HERE TO BACK UP AGAIN, GO ON TO ITEM 8 -- NOPE. ITEM 7, THE 6 BLUE RICK ON TASKFORCE RECOVERY UPDATE. AND WE HAVE A STAFF 7 PRESENTATION ON THAT IF STAFF IS READY. 8 SPEAKER: HI, EVERYONE. I'M READY. I THINK THERE'S A 9 10 PRESENTATION. WHILE THAT'S BEING LOADED UP, I'LL GIVE THEM INTRODUCTORY KIND OF COMMENTS. TODAY'S UPDATE ON THE BLUE 11 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASKFORCE WILL ACTUALLY COVER TWO 12 MEETINGS BECAUSE BOTH OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER TASKFORCE MEETINGS 13 WERE HELD SINCE THE LAST TIME THIS COUNCIL HAS MET. SO JUST 14 15 BRIEFLY BEFORE WE GET INTO THE POWERPOINT, IN OCTOBER THERE 16 WERE TWO PRESENTATIONS RELATED TO STAGE 2 RECOVERY. RANDI RENCHLER ALONG WITH MTC'S CONSULTANT REPORTED ON A SYNTHESIS 17 OF SURVEYS ALREADY CONDUCTED BY VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCIES 18 DURING THE PANDEMIC PERIOD ITSELF. AND A CONSULTANT WAS ABLE 19 TO PROVIDE SOME BROAD THEMES FROM THE COLLECTION OF THE 20 21 SURVEYS RELATED TO BARRIERS AND MOTIVATORS RELATED TO 22 RETURNING TO TRANSIT. AND THE PRESENTATION ALSO PROVIDED AN OVERVIEW OF THE RETURN TO TRANSIT RESEARCH AND COMMUNICATION 23 CAMPAIGN THAT MTC WILL BE LAUNCHING IN THE COMING MONTHS. THE 24

RESEARCH WILL HELP TO INFORM THE COMMUNICATIONS EFFORT WHEN





- 1 RIDERS RETURN TO TRANSIT IN GREATER NUMBERS AND TO INFORM
- 2 DECISIONS THAT COULD BE MADE IN THE MEANTIME. FEEDBACK
- 3 RECEIVED ON THIS PRESENTATION EMPHASIS THAT THIS SHOULD BE A
- 4 REGIONAL EFFORT, NOT PIECEMEAL, OPERATOR BY OPERATOR. AND THAT
- 5 THE RESEARCH SHOULD NOT BE HEAVILY TARGETED TO COMMUTERS BUT
- 6 ALSO INCLUDE TRANSIT-DEPENDENT RIDERS, PARATRANSIT RIDERS AND
- 7 IT SHOULD INCLUDE LOCAL PRIORITIES SUCH AS SCHOOL SERVICE, FOR
- 8 EXAMPLE. NEXT TERESA MCMILLEN PROVIDE A PRESENTATION ON MTC'S
- 9 ABILITY TO SHIFT FUNDING TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO HELP
- 10 OPERATORS DEAL WITH THE LOSS OF OPERATING REVENUE BROUGHT ON
- 11 BY THE PANDEMIC. SHE LAID OUT THE SCALE OF THE FUNDING GAP FOR
- 12 OPERATIONS IN FISCAL YEAR '21 AND WHAT'S ANTICIPATED FOR
- 13 FISCAL YEAR '22. SHE DISCUSSED THE FLEXIBLE FUND SOURCES
- 14 AVAILABLE TO MTC, THE TIMING OF WHEN THOSE FUNDS WOULD BE
- 15 AVAILABLE, WHICH IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND THE DIFFICULTIES AND
- 16 TRADEOFFS INVOLVED WITH SHIFTING THESE FUNDS AWAY FROM THEIR
- 17 NORMAL INTENTIONS. SHE ALSO DISCUSSED THE AVAILABILITY AND
- 18 FEASIBILITY OF SHIFTING FUNDS FROM LOCAL AND STATE SOURCES
- 19 WHICH MAKE UP THE BULK OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING. TERESA
- 20 DID MENTION THAT FURTHER INFORMATION ON THAT TOPIC, THE
- 21 SHIFTING OF THE TRANSIT -- OF FUNDING FROM CAPITAL TO TRANSIT
- 22 OPERATIONS WOULD BE BROUGHT TO COMMITTEES AND THE COMMISSION
- 23 IN DECEMBER. SO THAT'S STILL INTENDED. THE FINAL OCTOBER
- 24 PRESENTATION WAS DIRECTED TOWARDS STAGE 3 OF THE TASKFORCE
- 25 WORK, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. THE PRESENTATION WAS





- 1 MADE BY STEVE KINZIE AND THAT WAS CENTERED ON DEVELOPING GOALS
- 2 AND OBJECTIVES FOR THE ACTION PLAN. AND I'M NOT GOING TO GO
- 3 INTO A LOT OF DETAIL ON THE OCTOBER VERSION OF THE GOALS AND
- 4 OBJECTIVES PRESENTATION BECAUSE THAT DISCUSSION THEN CARRIED
- 5 OVER TO THE NOVEMBER MEETINGS WHERE THE FEEDBACK FROM THE
- 6 TASKFORCE WAS INCORPORATED IN THE REVISED GOALS AND OBJECTIVES
- 7 WERE FINALIZED. SO I HAVE THE NOVEMBER PRESENTATION CUED UP SO
- 8 YOU CAN ALL SEE THE FINAL RESULT. SO IF YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT
- 9 SLIDE. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE BASIS FOR REVISING
- 10 THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES FROM THE OCTOBER PROPOSAL INCLUDED
- 11 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT THE OCTOBER TASKFORCE MEETING SUBSEQUENT
- 12 LETTERS AND CORRESPONDENCE THAT STEVE KINZIE RECEIVED AND
- 13 COMMENTS FROM STATE ASSEMBLYMEMBER DAVID CHU. AND BASED ON
- 14 THIS FEEDBACK, NOT ONLY THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES WERE REVISED,
- 15 BUT ALSO THE DEFINITION OF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION OR WHAT THE
- 16 TASKFORCE IS WORKING TOWARDS WAS REFINED. SO YOU CAN SEE THE
- 17 REVISIONS AND STRIKE-THRUS ON THE SLIDE, AND YOU CAN SEE WHAT
- 18 CHANGES WERE MADE THROUGH OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER AND THEY WERE
- 19 FURTHER REFINED DURING THE NOVEMBER MEETING TO ADD THE WORDS
- 20 EQUITABLE AND AFFORDABLE SO THAT NOW IT READS, "THE TRANSIT
- 21 TRANSFORMATION DEFINITION IS TO DESIGN, ADEQUATELY INVESTMENT
- 22 IN AND EFFECTIVELY MANAGE A PUBLIC TRANSIT NETWORK THAT IS
- 23 EQUITABLE, INCLUSIVE, FREQUENT, AFFORDABLE, ACCESSIBLE,
- 24 RELIABLE, AND INTEGRATED WITH THE UNIFIED SERVICE, FARES,
- 25 SCHEDULES, AND CUSTOMER INFORMATION AND IDENTITY, SERVING ALL



- 1 BAY AREA POPULATIONS, RESULTING IN INCREASED TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
- 2 AND REDUCED GROWTH IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED". NEXT SLIDE,
- 3 PLEASE? SO MOVING INTO THE REVISED GOALS GOAL ONE WAS TO
- 4 RECOGNIZE CRITICAL RECOVERY CHALLENGES FACING TRANSIT AGENCIES
- 5 TO DEFER POST RECOVERY SERVICE PLANNING TO ALLOW BAY AREA
- 6 TRANSIT AGENCIES TO PRIORITIZE DIFFICULT FISCAL AND SERVICE
- 7 CHOICES IN THE MIDST OF INCREASING UNCERTAINTY. SO THAT WAS
- 8 GOAL ONE. AND YOU CAN SEE THAT THERE WERE A FEW CHANGES MADE
- 9 IN RED TO THE OBJECTIVES BETWEEN OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER TO
- 10 EMPHASIZE THE NEED TO BE TIMELY AND OBJECTIVE D THERE SUPPORT
- 11 FUNDS FOR RIDER RESEARCH AND RETURN TO. NO FURTHER CHANGES
- 12 WERE MADE TO ITS GOAL OR ASSOCIATED OBJECTIVES DURING THE
- 13 NOVEMBER MEETING LIKEWISE THERE WERE NO CHANGES BETWEEN
- 14 OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER TO GOAL 2, WHICH IS TO ADVANCE EQUITY.
- 15 AND THE OBJECTIVES ASSOCIATED WITH THIS GOAL ARE TO DEVELOP
- 16 SPECIFIC PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PLANNING
- 17 AND TO INCLUDE FOCUSED OUTREACH TO CURRENT RIDERS, UNDERSERVED
- 18 POPULATIONS, AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES TO INFORM THE
- 19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. SO NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? SLIDE 38
- 20 PROBABLY WENT THROUGH THE MOST CHANGES. -- SLIDE 3. GOAL 3 IS
- 21 TO PROPOSE, SORRY, TO IDENTIFY NEAR-TERM ACTIONS TO BENEFIT
- 22 AND GOVERNMENT REFORM ACTIONS. SO THIS ITEM WAS CHANGED IN
- 23 SEVERAL WAYS AND I'LL JUST GO THROUGH WHAT THOSE CHANGES WERE
- 24 ON THIS SLIDE FOR A AND B. USING PRIOR MTC ANALYSES AND
- 25 QUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS EVALUATE REGION-WIDE NETWORK



- 1 MANAGEMENT ALTERNATIVES, ADDRESSING ISSUES OF LEGAL AUTHORITY,
- 2 LABOR, SCOPE OF DUTIES, OVERSIGHT, AND INCREASED BUDGET
- 3 REQUIREMENTS AND SAVINGS, RECOMMENDED NEAR-TERM REFORM
- 4 ACTIONS. SO OBJECTIVE B WAS ONE THAT WAS EDITED BETWEEN
- 5 OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER. AND, AGAIN FINALIZED BASED ON THIS SLIDE
- 6 AT THE NOVEMBER MEETING, AT YESTERDAY'S MEETING. WE CAN GO
- 7 FORWARD ONE SLIDE. OBJECTIVE C USING MTC STAFF AND QUALIFIED
- 8 PROFESSIONALS, IDENTIFY AND SUPPORT NEAR-TERM CONSOLIDATION
- 9 OPPORTUNITIES FOCUSED IN BUT NOT LIMITED TO SMALLER TRANSIT
- 10 MARKETS WITH MULTIPLE TRANSIT OPERATORS TO PROVIDE A MORE
- 11 CONNECTED SERVICE TO THE CUSTOMER WHERE FEASIBLE. AND THIS THE
- 12 ADDITION OF THE "BUT NOT LIMITED TO" WAS A SIGNIFICANT TOPIC
- 13 OF CONVERSATION AND FEEDBACK AT THE COMMITTEE -- AT THE
- 14 TASKFORCE MEETING BECAUSE I THINK THE GENERAL CONSENSUS WAS
- 15 THAT ALTHOUGH, YOU KNOW, NEAR TERM CONSOLIDATIONS MIGHT BE
- 16 MORE APPLICABLE TO THE SMALLER-SIZE SYSTEMS, WE DON'T WANT TO
- 17 RULE OUT NIGH ACTIONS COMING FROM THE TASKFORCE THAT WOULD
- 18 IMPACT SOME OF THE LARGER OPERATORS. AND OBJECTIVE D DID NOT
- 19 CHANGE YESTERDAY, BUT AS THAT STATED PROPOSED STATE AND
- 20 LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND
- 21 EXPEDITE IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSIT PRIORITIES ON STREETS AND
- 22 HIGHWAYS. NEXT SLIDE? THE FINAL GOAL ALSO DID NOT CHANGE
- 23 YESTERDAY. THERE WERE NO WORDING CHANGES. BUT THE GOAL 4 IS TO
- 24 ESTABLISH HOW CURRENT MTC AND STATE TRANSIT INITIATIVES SHOULD
- 25 INTEGRATE WITH NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE REFORMS. THE



Meeting Transcript November 1

METROPOLITAN

- 1 OBJECTIVES INCLUDE RECEIVE PRESENTATIONS ON SEVERAL CURRENT
- 2 MTC TRANSIT INITIATIVES AND COMMENT ON THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO
- 3 MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE REFORMS. RECEIVE STATE PRESENTATION
- 4 ON CALSTA INITIATIVES THAT INFORM MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE
- 5 REFORM. SO THAT WAS IN A NUTSHELL THE PROCESS OF PROPOSING,
- 6 EDITING AND FINALIZING THE REVISED GOALS AND OBJECTIVES FOR
- 7 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT OCCURRED BETWEEN OCTOBER
- 8 AND NOVEMBER TASKFORCE MEETINGS. I THINK WE CAN STOP SHARING
- 9 THIS PRESENTATION. SO, THERE WERE SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO GOAL
- 10 4 AND ITS OBJECTIVES BETWEEN OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER, I'M SORRY.
- 11 BUT THERE WEREN'T ANY FURTHER CHANGES MADE AT YESTERDAY'S
- 12 MEETING. AND THE NOVEMBER MEETING ALSO INCLUDED A PRESENTATION
- 13 BY THERESE MCMILLEN ON EQUITY AND A PRESENTATION BY THE VOICES
- 14 OF PUBLIC TRANSIT ON THEIR PRIORITIES ENVISIONED FOR TRANSFORM
- 15 TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO ALL OF THESE ATTACHMENTS FOR BOTH OCTOBER
- 16 AND NOVEMBER MEETINGS ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR AGENDA. GOING
- 17 FORWARD TO THE DECEMBER MEETING, I BELIEVE THE INTENT IS TO
- 18 BRING FORWARD A SET OF PRINCIPLES OR E EOUITY PRINCIPLES TO
- 19 GUIDE THE OBJECTIVES IN I THINK IT'S GOAL 2. THERE WILL BE
- 20 ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION ABOUT THE NETWORK MANAGER, POTENTIALLY
- 21 THE DEVELOPMENT OF A PROBLEM STATEMENT. AND THAT PROBLEM
- 22 STATEMENT WOULD THEN BE KIND OF FINALIZED IN THE JANUARY
- 23 MEETING. IN DECEMBER THERE WILL ALSO BE A REPORT ON THE
- 24 TRANSIT OPERATOR STATUS RELATIVE TO THEIR RECOVERY, HOW
- 25 THEY'RE DOING, HOW THEY'RE COORDINATING TO IMPROVE THEIR



- 1 SITUATION DURING THE PANDEMIC PHASE. AND WE'LL ALSO BEGIN
- 2 DISCUSSION OF CERTAIN MTC INITIATIVES. I BELIEVE THE ONE THAT
- 3 IS CUED UP RIGHT NOW FOR DECEMBER IS A DISCUSSION ABOUT
- 4 TRANSIT PRIORITY AND TRANSIT ADVANTAGE AND WHAT ARE WE DOING
- 5 AT MTC AND WHAT ARE THE OPERATORS DOING TO SPEED TRANSIT, GET
- 6 IT OUT OF TRAFFIC AND HOW THOSE INITIATIVES MIGHT DOVETAIL
- 7 INTO THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASKFORCE. SO WITH THAT, I'M
- 8 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

9

- 10 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. WELL, THAT LOOKED LIKE JUST A FEW
- 11 WORD CHANGES, WORDSMITHING WHEN YOU'RE IN A ROOM WITH 30
- 12 PEOPLE TAKES A LONG TIME. AND IT WAS INFORMATIVE AS WE WENT
- 13 ALONG. AND I THOUGHT THE MEETING WAS EXTREMELY FRUITFUL. ARE
- 14 THERE ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL ON THIS ITEM?
- 15 I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. TERRY SCOTT'S HAND'S RAISED. GO
- 16 AHEAD, TERRY, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

- 18 TERRY SCOTT: MY OUESTION RELATES TO HOW IS THE SIZING DONE ON
- 19 THESE MULTIPLE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS? I'M TRYING TO FIGURE
- 20 OUT HOW -- THE COMMUNITIES VARY SIGNIFICANTLY IN TERMS OF
- 21 SIZE, POPULATION, WHAT HAVE YOU, AND NEED FOR MULTIPLE
- 22 TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS. AND WE'RE KIND OF -- WE'RE VERY
- 23 DIFFERENT IN NAPA BECAUSE WE ONLY HAVE 140,000 RESIDENTS
- 24 TOTAL. AND WE HAVE ONE LARGE, TO US, A LARGE CITY, THE CITY OF
- 25 NAPA WITH 75,000 RESIDENTS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I'VE



- 1 OBSERVED OVER THE YEARS IS THAT OUR BUS SYSTEM HERE, THE
- 2 TRANSIT BUS SYSTEM, I'VE NEVER SEEN MORE THAN FOUR OR FIVE
- 3 PASSENGERS ON A 30, 40-PERSON BUS. HAVE THERE BEEN ANY STUDIES
- 4 TO INDICATE: ARE THERE MORE EFFECTIVE AND LESS COSTLY
- 5 TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS AVAILABLE SUCH AS SHUTTLES? IF YOU
- 6 DON'T NEED A 40-PERSON BUS, ISN'T IT CHEAPER TO USE SHUTTLES
- 7 AND 8-PERSON VEHICLE? AND IT WOULD SEEM TO ME THAT THAT WOULD
- 8 BE CHEAPER AND MORE EFFICIENT. CAN WE -- DOES THIS COMMITTEE
- 9 LOOK AT ALL THE VARIOUS OPTIONS THAT ARE MOST BEFITTING EACH
- 10 INDIVIDUAL COUNTY AND THE AREAS WITHIN THAT COUNTY? WE JUST
- 11 DON'T HAVE THE SAME -- I DON'T THINK THAT THERE IS ANOTHER
- 12 COUNTY OUT OF THE NINE THAT HAS 140,000 RESIDENTS OR FEWER.
- 13 BUT I'M INTERESTED IN WHETHER OR NOT THERE ARE OPTIONS
- 14 AVAILABLE THAT WOULD MAKE OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS MORE NOT
- 15 ONLY BETTER CONNECTED BUT LESS EXPENSIVE AND LESS WASTEFUL.

- 17 SPEAKER: I THINK THAT'S A REALLY GOOD QUESTION. YOU KNOW, I
- 18 DON'T KNOW THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASKFORCE IS GOING TO TAKE ON
- 19 THAT QUESTION. I THINK THE FOCUS OF THE TASKFORCE WILL REALLY
- 20 BE TOWARDS GOVERNANCE AND A NETWORK MANAGER THAT, ONCE
- 21 ESTABLISHED, COULD POTENTIALLY DEAL WITH SOME OF THOSE
- 22 PLANNING, SERVICE PLANNING QUESTIONS. BUT THE AGENCY ITSELF IS
- 23 RESPONSIBLE FOR ITS SERVICE, ITS OWN SERVICE PLANNING AS IT
- 24 STANDS RIGHT NOW. AND I WILL SAY THAT NAPA, VINE, HAS BEEN
- 25 VERY RESPONSIVE RECENTLY AND IS WORKING TO TRY OUT VARIOUS



- 1 MOBILITY OPTIONS, INCLUDING DEMAND RESPONSE SERVICE BECAUSE
- 2 ESPECIALLY WITH THE PANDEMIC, THEY'VE SEEN THEIR RIDERSHIP
- 3 NUMBERS DWINDLE TO NEARLY NOTHING. SO I DO THINK THAT THERE IS
- 4 THAT KIND OF PLANNING GOING ON AT THE AGENCY LEVEL. BUT I
- 5 THINK THE BLUE RIBBON TASKFORCE'S ROLE WILL REALLY BE TO SEE
- 6 WHAT PIECES OF THAT PLANNING ACTIVITY NEED TO BE ELEVATED TO A
- 7 NETWORK MANAGER RESPONSIBILITY.

- 9 TERRY SCOTT: I UNDERSTAND. IT'S DIFFICULT FROM OUR PLANNING
- 10 PERSPECTIVE. AND I THINK MICHAEL BALDINI WILL AGREE WITH THIS,
- 11 THAT WE -- WE'RE SUCH A SMALL COUNTY. WE ARE TO THE BAY AREA
- 12 COUNTIES WHAT SWITZERLAND IS TO EUROPE. AND SO IT'S VERY
- 13 UNIQUE. AND YET, STRANGELY ENOUGH, WE'VE HAD TWO CHAIRS IN THE
- 14 MTC IN THE LAST 10 YEARS. MAYBE THAT'S ONE OF THE ADVANTAGES
- 15 OF SWITZERLAND, I DON'T KNOW. BUT AT ANY RATE, I THINK THAT
- 16 WHEN WE'RE ABLE TO LOOK AT THIS FROM A LESS OVERVIEW AND MORE
- 17 SPECIFIC DIRECTIONS, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE MANY CLASSIC EXAMPLES
- 18 HERE OF ONE SIZE DOES NOT FIT ALL. AND WE'RE A CLASSIC EXAMPLE
- 19 OF THAT. AND SO I'D LIKE, WHEN THE COMMITTEE IS LOOKING AT
- 20 THIS MASSIVE OVERVIEW, TO RECOGNIZE AND REALIZE THAT THERE ARE
- 21 VERY DIFFERENT BE AND SIGNIFICANTLY MORE MICROSCOPIC ISSUES
- 22 FOR SOME OF US SMALLER GROUPS THAT REALLY DON'T APPLY TO THE
- 23 LARGER COMMUNITIES. AND IN SOME CASES, SOME OF THESE COUNTIES
- 24 HAVE A CITY THAT HAVE MANY MORE RESIDENTS THAN WE DO IN OUR
- 25 ENTIRE COUNTY.



1 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU, TERRY. AS A MEMBER OF THE TASKFORCE, 2 3 I'M GOING TO JUMP IN HERE. ALL OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE REPRESENTED ON THE TASKFORCE. AND EACH COUNTY HAS A 4 5 REPRESENTATIVE ON THE TASKFORCE. AND SO I KNOW THAT WE ARE VERY CONSISTENT ABOUT ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THERE IS NO ONE-SIZE-6 FITS-ALL, THAT THERE ARE RURAL AND URBAN COMMUNITIES, THAT 7 8 THERE ARE TINY AND LARGE ONES. AND YOUR COUNTY IS JUST A TOUCH BIGGER THAN MY COUNCIL DISTRICT. BUT I WAS RAISED IN SALINAS 9 AND LIVED IN NAPA. SO I'M ON BOTH SIDES OF THIS FENCE. THE 10 ISSUE OF CONSOLIDATION OF TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT HAS COME UP IN 11 THAT TOPIC OF CONVERSATION, THERE ARE OTHER COUNTIES WITH 12 MULTIPLE SMALL PROVIDERS THAT DESPERATELY NEED A PATH TO 13 CONSOLIDATE SOME OPERATIONS OR SOME DELIVERY SERVICES OR 14 15 THINGS LIKE THAT, AND THAT'S WHY THAT PARTICULAR ITEM IS IN THERE. HOWEVER, EVERYTHING IS ON THE TABLE LONG-TERM FOR THE 16 TRANSFORMATION PLAN. SO I JUST WANTED YOU TO BE ASSURED THAT 17 WE ARE LOOKING AT THE ISSUES RAISED BY SMALL OPERATORS WHO 18 HAVE NO CHOICE BUT TO BE SOLO OPERATORS AND HOW WE CAN MAKE 19 SURE THAT THEY ARE CONSISTENTLY DELIVERING ECONOMICAL SERVICES 20 AS WELL AS LOOKING AT THE BIG BOYS THAT ARE IN THE MIX. SO 21 22 YOUR COMMENTS ARE NOTED. 23 TERRY SCOTT: I APPRECIATE THAT. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I THINK 24 THAT WE'RE -- MOST OF THE COUNTIES ARE LOOKING AT ARE HOW 25



- 1 THESE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS CAN INTERFACE EFFECTIVELY AND
- 2 EFFICIENTLY. OUR ONLY ONE THAT I CAN THINK OF IS
- 3 TRANSPORTATION THAT CAN GET YOU TO VALLEJO SO YOU CAN USE THE
- 4 FERRY SYSTEM SO YOU CAN GO TO SAUSALITO OR WHEREVER YOU'RE
- 5 GOING. OBVIOUSLY, A NUMBER OF PEOPLE USE THAT. THE PARKING
- 6 LOTS AT THAT FACILITY ARE GENERALLY PRETTY FULL, PARTICULARLY
- 7 DURING THE COMMUTE DAYS AND WHAT HAVE YOU. BUT THERE'S NOT AN
- 8 EFFECTIVE AND AN EFFICIENT AND AN INEXPENSIVE WAY TO GET FROM
- 9 NORTH OR FROM THE CITY OF NAPA OR NORTH OF THE CITY OF NAPA
- 10 WHERE THERE ARE TWO OTHER LARGER CITIES, SMALLER CITIES,
- 11 RATHER, TO GET DOWN TO VILLEJO WITHOUT, YOU KNOW, HITTING
- 12 COMMUTE ON HIGHWAY 29, WHICH IS OUR ONLY HIGHWAY.

14 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. THAT'S NOTED. AND I WILL NOTE THAT VICE

- 15 CHAIR PEDROZA WILL BE THE NEXT INCOMING CHAIR. SO THOSE
- 16 INTERESTS WILL BE PROBABLY WELL ADDRESSED. NOW I'M GOING TO
- 17 MOVE ON TO THE NEXT BLUE HAND THAT IS RAISED IF YOU DON'T HAVE
- 18 ANYMORE? OKAY. THANK YOU. WALTER, YOU'RE UP NEXT. AND THEN
- 19 ADINA.

13

- 21 WALTER WILSON: YEAH, I JUST HAD A COMMENT. I THOUGHT THAT THE
- 22 REPORT WAS VERY INFORM INFORMATIVE. IT CERTAINLY GAVE ME SOME
- 23 IDEAS OF THINGS I WASN'T THINKING ABOUT. I THINK YOU GUYS DID
- 24 A REALLY GOOD JOB OF REVIEWING IT AND MAKING THE
- 25 MODIFICATIONS. THANK YOU, TERESA.





1 2 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ADINA, YOU'RE NEXT AND THEN, RICK, GO 4 5 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF, ADINA. 6 ADINA LEVIN: SO TO THE POINT ABOUT HAVING SERVICE STANDARDS 7 8 THAT ARE APPROPRIATE TO DIFFERENT SIZE JURISDICTIONS AND DIFFERENT LEVELS OF DENSITY, THIS IS A KIND OF THING THAT 9 LOOKING AT REGIONS AROUND THE WORLD THAT DO A GOOD JOB OF 10 HAVING INTEGRATED SYSTEMS, THE PRACTICE IS TO NOT TO TRY AND 11 TAKE SAN FRANCISCO SERVICE AND MAKE IT LIKE NAPA'S OR TAKE 12 NAPA'S AND MAKE IT LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, BUT TO HAVE DIFFERENT 13 STANDARDS THAT ARE APPROPRIATE FOR DIFFERENT TYPES PLACES AND 14 15 TO MAKE SURE THAT EACH PLACE HAS AN APPROPRIATE BASELINE OF 16 SERVICE. FOR EXAMPLE, WHAT WE ARE SEEING WITH COVID AND THE FINANCIAL CRISIS, WE AREN'T SEEING PIECE PARTS OF THE SYSTEM 17 AT RISK OF DROPPING OUT BECAUSE ONE AREA IS MORE FINANCIALLY 18 FRAGILE THAN IN OTHER. BUT WE SHOULD MAKE SURE THAT EVERYONE 19 CONTINUES TO HAVE APPROPRIATE SERVICE. AND THE EXAMPLE OF 20 21 BEING ABLE TO TAKE TRANSIT TO A FERRY IS A REALLY GOOD EXAMPLE. CALTRAIN'S EQUITY STUDY SHOWED THAT LOW INCOME PEOPLE 22 ARE MUCH MORE LIKELY TO WANT TO TAKE TRANSIT TO THE TRAIN. AND 23 I SUSPECT THAT THAT'S SIMILAR TO THE FERRY. AND SO IF THE 24 TRANSFER IS POORLY TIMED AND EXPENSIVE, THAT IS PROBABLY AN



- 1 EOUITY ISSUE IN ADDITION TO AN INCONVENIENCE ISSUE FOR
- 2 EVERYBODY. AND THAT'S THE KIND OF THING THAT NO INDIVIDUAL
- 3 AGENCY CAN SOLVE ON ITS OWN AND IT WOULD HELP TO HAVE THE
- 4 NETWORK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION TO SOLVE THAT PROBLEM. AND THEN
- 5 LASTLY, I'LL HAVE A REFERENCE TO SOME WORK BY THE TRANSIT
- 6 CONSULTANT JARRETT WALKER WHO'S DONE SOME WORK ON DEMAND
- 7 RESPONSE. IT SEEMS INTUITIVE THAT HAVING SMALLER ON-DEMAND
- 8 VEHICLES MIGHT BE MORE EFFICIENT, BUT IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY
- 9 TURN OUT THAT WAY. AND I WILL TRY TO LOOK UP SOME OF THE
- 10 ARTICLES AND SEND IT TO STAFF FOR DISTRIBUTION BECAUSE SOME OF
- 11 THE OUTCOMES OF EXPERIMENTS ARE COUNTERINTUITIVE.

12

13 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU, ADINA. RICK COATES, YOU'RE NEXT.

- 15 RICK COATES: YEAH, I'M JUST THINKING THAT WITH THE RECOGNITION
- 16 THAT EVERY CRISIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY, IT SEEMS TO ME THAT COVID
- 17 AND ITS ATTENDANT ECONOMIC STRESSES ON THE VARIOUS AGENCIES
- 18 SHOULD BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DRIVE THEM TOGETHER, TO ENCOURAGE
- 19 THEM TO JOIN, TO MERGE TO ELIMINATE THE DUPLICATION. YOU SEE
- 20 THAT ALL THE TIME IN BUSINESS WHEN BUSINESSES JOIN EACH OTHER
- 21 BECAUSE THEIR RESOURCES ARE FALLING, THEY NEED A WIDER SERVICE
- 22 AREA. SO, HAVING SAID THAT, THE PROCESS TO ME -- AND I SEE
- 23 THIS ALL THE TIME, THE PROCESS TO ME SEEMS TO BE INCREDIBLY
- 24 SLOW. I REALIZE THAT WE HAVE A LARGE ORGANIZATION AND A LOT OF
- 25 PLAYERS AND WHATNOT. BUT, GOSH, IT STILL SEEMS LIKE WE'RE



STUDYING RATHER THAN ACTING. AND I'M ONE WHO PREFERS TO SEE 1 2 SOME ACTION HAPPEN, SOME ACTUAL SOLUTION OF PROBLEMS RATHER 3 THAN JUST STUDYING WHAT THE SOLUTIONS MIGHT BE AGAIN. THIS IS MY PERENNIAL COMPLAINT AND I SEE RANDI SMILING AT THAT. SHE 4 5 KNOWS. 6 7 CHAIR KINMAN: I WANTED TO REASSURE YOU THAT IN THE MORE THAN A 8 DECADE THAT I'VE BEEN DOING THIS, WE HAVEN'T EVEN HAD THOSE VARIOUS DISCUSSIONS ABOUT CONSOLIDATION. WE HAVEN'T HAD THOSE 9 SERIOUS, THAT PORTION OF IT HASN'T TAKEN PLACE. WE'VE JUMPED 10 WAY OVER THAT. WE'RE INTO THE AGENCIES WORKING WITH EACH 11 OTHER. WE'RE INTO REALLY GETTING DOWN TO THE MEAT OF WHAT IT'S 12 GOING TO TAKE. BUT I'M GOING TO ASK YOU TO HAVE PATIENCE 13 BECAUSE EACH OF OUR MORE THAN TWO DOZEN AGENCIES HAS ITS OWN 14 15 (AUDIO DISTORTION) IT HAS TO RESPOND BACK TO. SO THIS IS A 16 MATTER OF WE HAVE ON THE BOARDS IT HAS TO COME BACK OUT, THERE'S LEGISLATION THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO GET INVOLVED. BUT 17 I DO WANT TO REASSURE YOU, WE ARE ON THE PATH NOW. COATES 18 THAT'S ENCOURAGING. ARE VERY ENCOURAGING. 19 20 CHAIR KINMAN: WANTED TO ENCOURAGE YOU WITH THAT. I WANT TO 21 KEEP THINGS MOVING. WALTER, I SEE YOUR HAND UP AGAIN? 22 23 WALTER WILSON: I HAVE A QUESTION TO ADINA ABOUT THE REPORT SHE 24

WAS SAYING THAT THINGS DON'T NECESSARILY PLAY OUT THE WAY THAT



- 1 THEY WOULD SEEM TO PLAY OUT AND SHE WAS GOING SHARE THAT WITH
- 2 SOMEONE. I WAS HOPING THAT SHE COULD EITHER SHARE IT WITH
- 3 EVERYONE. CERTAINLY I'D LIKE TO SEE IT.

4

- 5 CHAIR KINMAN: IT WILL GO THROUGH STAFF AND GET DISTRIBUTED TO
- 6 THE ENTIRE BODY.

7

8 WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU.

9

10 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. RICK HEDGES AND THEN WE'LL WRAP UP.

11

- 12 RICHARD HEDGES: I JUST WANT TO FOLLOW ON WITH RICK COATES. I
- 13 WAS AROUND WHEN THERE WAS AN ATTEMPTED MERGER A NUMBER OF AN
- 14 YEARS AGO WITH MTC LEADING IT. THAT PROBABLY DIDN'T LAST 30
- 15 DAYS. I THINK THE ONLY WAY WE'LL EVER HAVE A MERGER OF ANY OF
- 16 THE LARGER ORGANIZATIONS IS WITH REQUIRED LEGISLATION LIKE
- 17 THEY DID WITH WETA. I THINK THE PARAMETERS OF THAT ARE GOING
- 18 TO HAVE TO GIVE A DATE CERTAIN THAT HAS TO BE DONE BY; IF NOT
- 19 THEN THE LEGISLATURE WILL COMPLETE THE PROCESS. WITHOUT THAT,
- 20 I DON'T EVER SEE ANY SERIOUS MELTING OF THESE AGENCIES.
- 21 THEY'RE TOO BIG AND THERE'S TOO MUCH IN NOT MERGING. THANK
- 22 YOU.

- 24 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. MARTI, DO WE HAVE ANY WRITTEN
- 25 SUBMISSIONS FROM THE PUBLIC, OR IS THERE ANY PUBLIC? AND I



- 1 WOULD REMIND THE PUBLIC THAT THEY CAN RAISE THEIR LITTLE BLUE
- 2 HAND OR DIAL STAR 9.

3

- 4 MARTI PASCHAL: NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM
- 5 AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HAVE THEIR HANDS RAISED.

6

- 7 CHAIR KINMAN: THAT IS GREAT. WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM.
- 8 TERESA, THANK YOU. PLEASE EXTENT OUR CONGRATULATIONS TO
- 9 DIRECTOR MCMILLEN WHO IS USUALLY HERE FOR THIS. SHE'S BEEN
- 10 APPOINTED TO THE PRESIDENT-ELECT'S TRANSITION, YEA HER. WE'RE
- 11 GOING TO MOVE BACK UP TO ITEM NUMBER 6, WHICH WAS SUBCOMMITTEE
- 12 REPORTS, TO CATCH UP TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. IS
- 13 THERE SOMEBODY READY TO GIVE THAT REPORT?

- 15 VEDA FLOREZ: YES. THIS IS VEDA FLOREZ. I AM THE CHAIR OF THE
- 16 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. WE MET ON NOVEMBER THE SIXTH
- 17 AND WE RECEIVED AN EQUITY FRAMEWORK FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION
- 18 DEVELOPMENT FOR PLAN BAY AREA 2050. AND WE WENT OVER THE
- 19 EOUITY MARKERS THAT HAVE TAKEN PLACE WITH THE CULMINATION OF A
- 20 PRESENTATION TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE WHICH WILL --
- 21 THE REPORT WILL THEN GO TO REWG TO FINALIZE THINGS BEFORE
- 22 GOING TO FULL COMMISSION. STAFF REFOCUSED ITS EFFORTS TO WEAVE
- 23 EQUITY INTO ALL STRATEGIES. AND THIS IS WHERE THE BLUE RIBBON
- 24 COMMISSION -- COMMITTEE SORT OF OVERLAPS WITH THE E&A
- 25 SUBCOMMITTEE. AND WITH THE DEMOGRAPHICS HAVE CHANGED OVER THE



- 1 LAST 10 YEARS, AND THE CHANGES IN THE THRESHOLDS WERE
- 2 IDENTIFIED AT THE MEETING. IN PAST, MATERIALS WERE GIVEN TO US
- 3 FROM 2016. SO THAT'S A REPORT IN A NUTSHELL. AND THANK YOU
- 4 VERY MUCH. I'M SORRY TO BE LATE. THE RAIN HAD ME OFF SCHEDULE.

5

- 6 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE
- 7 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS? SEEING NO LITTLE BLUE HANDS, I DO WANT
- 8 TO MAKE ONE CORRECTION. THE FINALIZATION ISN'T THROUGH THE
- 9 REWG. EVERYTHING THAT HAPPENS AT THE REWG CIRCLES BACK TO THE
- 10 EQUITY AND ACCESS. SO IT'S A MINOR POINT. BUT YOU'LL BE
- 11 FINALIZING WHAT THEY JUST DID.

12

- 13 SPEAKER: IT'S KIND OF INTERESTING. THE REPORT SHOWED IT WOULD
- 14 GO TO E&A AND IT GOES TO REWG. IT CIRCLES BACK AGAIN.

15

- 16 CHAIR KINMAN: IT CIRCLES BACK IN DECEMBER, YES. OKAY, THANK
- 17 YOU. WITH THAT, MARTI, ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC,
- 18 WRITTEN PREVIOUSLY OR ANY RAISED HANDS?

19

- 20 MARTI PASCHAL: NO. NO COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FROM THE PUBLIC
- 21 AND THERE ARE NO RAISED HANDS.

- 23 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE WILL GO INTO ITEM
- 24 NUMBER 8. PLAN BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN DEVELOPMENT.
- 25 AND WE HAVE A STAFF PRESENTATION?





1
•

- 2 CHIRAG RABARI: HELLO, GOOD AFTERNOON, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS
- 3 CHIRAG RABARI, PRINCIPAL WITH THE REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM
- 4 AND I AM THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE PLAN BAY AREA 2050
- 5 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. AND IF THE TECHNICAL STAFF COULD BRING UP
- 6 THE PRESENTATION, PLEASE? GREAT. NEXT SLIDE? SOME OF YOU MAY
- 7 RECALL THE ACTION PLAN THAT MTC AND ABAG DEVELOPED FOR THE
- 8 PREVIOUS LONG-RANGE PLAN, PLAN BAY AREA 2040. THE ACTION PLAN
- 9 HAD FOCUSED ON AREAS WHERE THE PLAN'S PERFORMANCE WAS MOVING
- 10 IN THE WRONG DIRECTION AND SOUGHT TO ADDRESSEE MERGING POLICY
- 11 ISSUES SUCH AS HOUSING AND RESILIENCE. THE CASA EFFORT WAS ONE
- 12 NOTABLE INITIATIVE THAT GREW OUT OF THE ACTION PLAN. WITH THE
- 13 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, WE'RE HOPING TO BUILD ON THE SUCCESSES OF
- 14 THE ACTION PLAN BY DEVELOPING AN EVEN MORE COMPREHENSIVE
- 15 EFFORT, THIS TIME ONE THAT IS LIKE THE PLAN ITSELF, PLAN BAY
- 16 AREA 2050 ITSELF, MORE STRATEGY-FOCUSED IN NATURE. HERE WE'RE
- 17 GOING LOOK AT ARTICULATING THE SPECIFIC SHORT-TERM ACTIONS
- 18 THAT WE AND OUR PARTNERS CAN TAKE TO FULFILL THE GOALS AND
- 19 VISION OF THE PLAN AND ADVANCE ITS 35 ADOPTED STRATEGIES OVER
- 20 THE NEXT ONE TO FIVE YEARS. WE ENVISION PARTNERSHIP AND
- 21 COLLABORATION AS MAJOR COMPONENTS OF THIS EFFORT. VERY FEW OF
- 22 THE STRATEGIES PROPOSED IN THE PLAN CAN BE IMPLEMENTED BY MTC
- 23 AND ABAG ALONE. OUR INTENTION IS TO ENGAGE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS,
- 24 AGENCIES, THE PUBLIC, CIVIC ORGANIZATIONS, NONPROFITS AND A
- 25 BROAD ARRAY OF STAKEHOLDERS AS WE WORK THROUGH SHARED



- 1 CHALLENGES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? ALTHOUGH WE ANTICIPATE THIS
- 2 COULD CHANGE AND EVOLVE AS THE PROCESS MOVES FORWARD, AN THE
- 3 THIS EARLY STAGE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED FOUR INITIAL
- 4 INTERCONNECTED GOALS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. FIRST AND
- 5 FOREMOST WE WANT TO MAXIMIZE THE VIABILITIES OF THE PLANNED
- 6 STRATEGIES WITH A FOCUS ON EQUITY, EFFECTIVENESS AND
- 7 EFFICIENCY. SECOND, WE WANT TO REINFORCE THE RECOMMENDATIONS
- 8 OF EXISTING INTERNAL, EXTERNAL OR HYBRID INITIATIVES THAT
- 9 COMPLIMENT THE PLANS, STRATEGIES AND VISION. THIS COULD
- 10 INCLUDE, FOR EXAMPLE, IMPLEMENTING THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF
- 11 EFFORTS SUCH AS THE MU RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASKFORCE. WE
- 12 WANT TO BE RESPONSIVE TO ISSUES RAISED BY PARTNERS
- 13 STAKEHOLDERS AND THE PUBLIC, INCLUDING FEEDBACK FROM BODIES
- 14 SUCH AS THIS ONE. AND, FINALLY, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE ARE
- 15 ADDRESSING ALL OF OUR TECHNICAL OBLIGATIONS AS DEFINED FOR THE
- 16 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY
- 17 STRATEGY BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. NEXT SLIDE?
- 18 BEFORE WE DELVE ANY FURTHER, IT'S IMPORTANT TO OFFER A QUICK
- 19 CLARIFICATION ON THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A STRATEGY AND AN
- 20 IMPLEMENTATION ACTION. AS WE'VE PRESENTED BEFORE, WE DEFINE A
- 21 STRATEGY AS EITHER A PUBLIC POLICY OR SET OF INVESTMENTS THAT
- 22 CAN BE IMPLEMENTED OVER THE 30-YEAR PLANNING HORIZON OF PLAN
- 23 BAY AREA 2050. STRATEGIES ARE NOT, THEREFORE, NEAR-TERM
- 24 ACTIONS OR LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS. BY CONTRAST, IMPLEMENTATION
- 25 ACTIVITIES ARE THE SPECIFIC ACTIONS REQUIRED TO MOVE THOSE



- 1 PUBLIC POLICIES AND INVESTMENTS FORWARD. WE SEE THESE AS THE
- 2 WHO, WHAT, WHERE, WHEN AND HOW OF MAKING THE STRATEGIES A
- 3 REALITY WITH THE FOCUS ON THE NEXT 1 TO 5 YEARS. NEXT SLIDE?
- 4 AS THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PROCESS MOVES FORWARD, WE HAVE
- 5 DEFINED SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES FOR EACH PLANNED
- 6 STRATEGY. WE WILL BE WORKING THROUGH THIS IDENTIFICATION AND
- 7 RECOMMENDATION PROCESS COLLECTIVELY WITH OUR PARTNERS AND
- 8 STAKEHOLDERS. FIRST WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE PRIMARY ELEMENTS
- 9 THAT A GIVEN STRATEGY REQUIRES TO SUCCEED, WHETHER THAT'S
- 10 LEGAL AUTHORITY AS DEFINED THROUGH LEGISLATION, FUNDING WITH
- 11 THE REQUISITE CONTROL AND STABILITY, THE INSTITUTIONAL WRAP-
- 12 AROUND OF KNOWLEDGE, STAFFING, PROCESS AND PROCEDURE, WHICH WE
- 13 TERM TECHNICAL CAPACITY, AS WELL AS PUBLIC AND POLITICAL
- 14 SUPPORT. GIVEN THESE STRATEGY SUCCESS REQUIREMENTS, WE WANT TO
- 15 THEN IDENTIFY AN APPROPRIATE MTC/ABAG ROLE FOR IMPLEMENTATION,
- 16 WHETHER TO LEAD, PARTNER OR SUPPORT. AND IMPORTANTLY IDENTIFY
- 17 WHO THE APPROPRIATE PARTNERS ARE AS WELL AS THEIR EXPECTED
- 18 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES. WE WANT TO IDENTIFY THE
- 19 APPROPRIATE VEHICLES FOR STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION, WHETHER
- 20 THAT'S ADVOCACY LEGISLATION, CONVENINGS, A TASKFORCE, A NEW
- 21 PROJECT OR PROGRAM, OR PLANNING AND RESEARCH. AND, FINALLY, WE
- 22 WANT TO IDENTIFY DETAILED IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS INCLUDING
- 23 TIMEFRAMES FOR IMPLEMENTATION. NEXT SLIDE? OUR INITIAL
- 24 INTERNAL WORK HAS FOCUSED ON CONDUCTING AN ASSESSMENT OF THE
- 25 REQUIREMENTS FOR STRATEGY SUCCESS ACROSS THE PLAN'S 35



- 1 STRATEGIES AS WELL AS GETTING THE LAY OF THE LAND IN TERMS OF
- 2 COMPLEMENTARY EFFORTS AND INITIATIVES. AND WE'LL REVIEW A FEW
- 3 INITIAL OUTPUTS FROM THESE EFFORTS IN A MOMENT. THE EXTERNAL
- 4 ENGAGEMENT PHASE HAS JUST KICKED OFF THIS PAST MONTH AND
- 5 INCLUDED ONE LARGE FIRST OF OUR TWO LARGE STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS
- 6 WHICH WAS HELD EARLIER TODAY FOR HOUSING AND THE ECONOMY AND
- 7 THEN ANOTHER WILL BE HELD ON THURSDAY, THE 19TH, FOR
- 8 TRANSPORTATION AND THE ENVIRONMENT. AND THESE WILL BE VIRTUAL
- 9 BRAINSTORMING SESSIONS FOR US AND OUR PARTNERS AND
- 10 STAKEHOLDERS, TO PULL TOGETHER SOME INITIAL IDEAS ON THE
- 11 OBJECTIVES PREVIOUSLY ARTICULATED, THE STRATEGY'S SUCCESS
- 12 REQUIREMENTS, ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES, IMPLEMENTATION
- 13 VEHICLES AS WELL AS DETAILED IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS. THIS WILL
- 14 BE FOLLOWED BY OFFICE HOURS AND SMALL GROUP MEETINGS IN
- 15 DECEMBER AS WE IDENTIFY AREAS WHERE ADDITIONAL DEEPER AND MORE
- 16 FOCUSED CONVERSATIONS ARE REQUIRED. DURING THE EARLY PART OF
- 17 2021, I'VE BEEN DOING SOME PUBLIC OUTREACH PARTICULARLY
- 18 FOCUSED ON LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND THOSE WITHOUT INTERNET,
- 19 NON-ENGLISH SPEAKERS, PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES, YOUTH AS WELL
- 20 AS OUTREACH TO OUR EQUITY CBOS. WE'LL RETURN TO OUR COMMITTEES
- 21 IN FEBRUARY TO PRESENT ON WHAT WE'VE LEARNED AND GIVE A
- 22 PREVIEW OF THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AS WELL AS GET
- 23 GUIDANCE ON CONTINUED POTENTIAL ENGAGEMENT THROUGH THE SPRING
- 24 AND SUMMER. AND THEN THE DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL BE
- 25 RELEASED IN THE SPRING IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE DRAFT PLAN AND





- 1 DRAFT E.I.R. THE EXACT SHAPE IS STILL TO BE DETERMINED, BUT WE
- 2 ARE ALSO ANTICIPATING IN THE SPRING AND SUMMER THAT WE MAY
- 3 CONVENE FOCUSED STAKEHOLDER GROUPS TO FURTHER IRON OUT THE
- 4 PARTNERSHIPS NECESSARY TO IMPLEMENT THE STRATEGIES. THIS MAY
- 5 FOCUS ON THE MORE COMPLICATED, COMPLEX, OR POLITICALLY
- 6 DIFFICULT ITEMS THAT EMERGE AS WE ENGAGE WITH STAKEHOLDERS
- 7 OVER THE FALL AND WINTER. AT THIS POINT, WE WILL ALSO BE DOING
- 8 OUR OWN INTERNAL RESOURCE ASSESSMENT AND PRIORITIZATION TO
- 9 MAKE SURE THAT, FOR EXAMPLE, THE WORK WE'VE IDENTIFIED FOR THE
- 10 REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM IS CONSISTENT WITH OUR WORK PLAN AND
- 11 VICE VERSA. AND, FINALLY, THE FINAL PLAN AND E.I.R. WILL BE
- 12 RELEASED IN THE FALL OF 2021. NEXT SLIDE? HERE WE WANTED TO
- 13 PROVIDE A HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY OF THE KIND OF WORK THAT WAS
- 14 BEING PRESENTED IN GREATER DETAIL AT THE STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS
- 15 AND TO GIVE SOME INSIGHT INTO HOW WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE
- 16 FRAMEWORK FOR EVALUATING THE STRATEGIES. ONE OF THE FIRST
- 17 THINGS WE WANTED DO WAS CONDUCT AN ASSESSMENT LOOKING AT THOSE
- 18 FOUR FACTORS FOR STRATEGY SUCCESS DESCRIBED EARLIER. THE IDEA
- 19 HERE IS TO GET AN INITIAL PICTURE THAT WILL FIRST HELP GET US
- 20 ORIENTED WITH RESPECT TO MTC/ABAG'S POTENTIAL ROLE AND
- 21 STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION AND, SECOND, TO IDENTIFY CHALLENGES
- 22 AND OPPORTUNITIES THAT COULD INFORM THE DEVELOPMENT OF
- 23 SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION ACTIVITIES IN CONCERT WITH OUR
- 24 PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS. ON THE QUESTION OF OUR ROLE,
- 25 GENERALLY SPEAKING IF WE ARE GOING TO LEAD, WE WANT TO EITHER



- 1 HAVE OR BE IN A GOOD POSITION TO SECURE ALL THE FOUR FACTORS
- 2 FOR STRATEGIES SUCCESS. IF WE'RE GOING PARTNER, PERHAPS WE MAY
- 3 HAVE, OR BE ABLE TO SECURE, SOME BUT NOT ALL OF THE FOUR
- 4 FACTORS. BY CONTRAST, IN THE SUPPORT ROLE, PERHAPS WE MAY NOT
- 5 BE IN THE BEST POSITION TO SECURE AUTHORITY, FUNDING, OR HAVE
- 6 THE REQUISITE TECHNICAL CAPACITY TO IMPLEMENT A GIVEN
- 7 STRATEGY, BUT MAYBE WE HAVE AN IMPORTANT ROLE TO PLAY IN
- 8 GENERATING PUBLIC AND POLITICAL SUPPORT. AS YOU CAN SEE, MANY
- 9 OF THE STRATEGIES EXIST ON A SPECTRUM. FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE
- 10 MORE LIMITED AUTHORITY IN FUNDING FOR SOME OF THE ECONOMIC AND
- 11 HOUSING STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN WHEREAS WE MAY BE ON FIRMER
- 12 GROUND IN THOSE AREAS FOR SOME OF THE TRANSPORTATION
- 13 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? THERE WERE SIMILAR FINDINGS IN
- 14 THE TECHNICAL CAPACITY AND PUBLIC AND POLITICAL SUPPORT
- 15 REALMS. I DO WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT OUR INTENT ISN'T ONLY TO
- 16 FOCUS ON AREAS WHERE WE SCORE HIGH, PER SE. INSTEAD, IN
- 17 COLLABORATION WITH OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS, WE HOPE THIS
- 18 TYPE OF ASSESSMENT CAN HELP CLARIFY WHERE THE NEEDS ARE, WHERE
- 19 THE OPPORTUNITIES ARE, WHAT THE APPROPRIATE IMPLEMENTATION
- 20 VEHICLES AND ACTIONS ARE, AS WELL AS APPROPRIATE ROLES AND
- 21 RESPONSIBILITIES MOVING FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE? ANOTHER COMPONENT
- 22 OF THE EARLY WORK HAS BEEN LOOKING AT THE COMPLIMENTARY
- 23 INITIATIVES AND PARTNERS. SOME OF THESE EXIST WITHIN OUR
- 24 RESPECTIVE AGENCY, SOME ARE HYBRID IN NATURE, AND SOME ARE
- 25 INITIATIVES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF OUR GOVERNMENT PARTNERS



- 1 AND SOME EXIST OUTSIDE OF GOVERNMENT. IN MANY CASES, THESE ARE
- 2 EFFORTS THAT ARE ALREADY UNDERWAY THAT ARE SUPPORTIVE OF THE
- 3 PLANNED STRATEGIES. WE WANT TO LEVERAGE THIS EXISTING
- 4 EXPERTISE AND THESE EXISTING RESOURCES TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT
- 5 POSSIBLE IN SO FAR AS THEY CAN WORK TOGETHER WITH THE PLAN. I
- 6 SHOULD NOTE THAT OBVIOUSLY THIS LIST IS NOT EXHAUSTIVE AND IT
- 7 WILL BE FURTHER REFINED AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH AN EYE TOWARDS
- 8 MAPPING THESE EXISTING INITIATIVES AND PARTNERS TO THE
- 9 SPECIFIC THEMES AND STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN BAY AREA 2050. NEXT
- 10 SLIDE? AND HERE WE WERE LOOKING TO PAUSE TO GET SOME FEEDBACK
- 11 FROM ALL OF THE MEMBERS OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,
- 12 INCLUDING IF YOU HAVE ANY THOUGHTS ON HIGH PRIORITY
- 13 IMPLEMENTATION AREAS TO ADDRESS, KEY STAKEHOLDERS AND PARTNERS
- 14 THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO YOU THAT WE ENSURE WE'RE ENGAGING WITH,
- 15 GUIDANCE ON AREAS OF POTENTIAL CONTROVERSY, AS WELL AS
- 16 THOUGHTS ON THE OVERALL APPROACH. WAN THAT, I WILL PAUSE FOR A
- 17 MINUTE FOR ANY QUESTIONS.
- 19 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. AND BEFORE I TAKE QUESTIONS, I WANT
- 20 TO ASK THAT ATTENDEES, IF YOU PARTICULARLY HAVE STAKEHOLDERS
- 21 THAT YOU THINK NEED TO BE ENGAGED, THAT YOU TAKE THE TIME TO
- 22 SEND THAT INFORMATION ALONG AND NOT REQUEST TO SEE OUR
- 23 OUTREACH LIST BECAUSE THAT'S JUST NOT AS EFFECTIVE. ARE THERE
- 24 ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL? I SEE NOBODY
- 25 RAISING THEIR HAND. VEDA?



1 VEDA FLOREZ: I HAVE MY PHYSICAL HAND RAISED. I COULDN'T FIND 2 3 MY BLUE HAND FAST ENOUGH. I WANTED TO GO BACK TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS MEETING WE DID DISCUSS OUR OUTREACH AND PARTNERS. 4 5 AND FOR THIS YEAR IT LOOKS AS IF ALL OF THE CONTRACTS ARE SIGNED FOR OUTREACH. BUT IF WE HAVE ADDITIONAL ORGANIZATIONS 6 THAT NEED TO BE ON THE LIST, WE CAN SEND IT TO STAFF. IT 7 8 DOESN'T MEAN THEY WILL BE CONTACTED DURING THIS ROUND OF CONTRACTS BUT THEY WILL BE PUT ON THE LIST. SO THAT WAS A DEEP 9 DIVE CLARIFICATION FROM THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. 10 THANK YOU. 11 12 13 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES? 14 RICHARD HEDGES: COUPLE THINGS ON THE EQUITY. I THINK WE SHOULD 15 16 MOVE FASTER ON THE EXPRESS LANES. I KNOW WE'RE DOING A PILOT PROJECT THERE ON 580 APRIL 680 AND ALSO ON 101 EVENTUALLY. BUT 17 I THINK WE SHOULD MOVE FORWARD MUCH FASTER FOR THESE DISCOUNTS 18 FOR PEOPLE BECAUSE THE EXPRESS LANES WILL BE ALREADY IN 19 OPERATION WHILE WE'RE READY TO DECIDE ON THE DISCOUNTS AS WELL 20 21 AS ON THE LOWERED FARES. I KNOW WE'RE DOING A PROJECT ON THAT, 22 A PILOT PROJECT. BUT I THINK IS WHY I HAD MOVE FASTER ON THAT, AS WELL, BECAUSE PEOPLE REALLY NEED THE HELP RIGHT NOW. THANK 23 YOU. 24



CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OUESTIONS OR COMMENTS 1 2 FROM THE COUNCIL? DO YOU HAVE MORE PRESENTATION TO GO THROUGH? 3 CHIRAG RABARI: I BELIEVE THERE WAS MAYBE ONE REMAINING SLIDE? 4 5 6 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. 7 8 CHIRAG RABARI: NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? OH AND THERE WE GO. WE'RE DONE. SORRY ABOUT THAT. THANK YOU. 9 10 CHAIR KINMAN: CHRISTINA'S HAND IS RAISED. GO AHEAD, CHRISTINA. 11 12 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: CAN WE GO BACK TO THE PRESENTATION, LIKE 13 MAYBE TWO SLIDES PRIOR? 14 15 16 SPEAKER: ARE YOU TALKS ABOUT THE INITIATIVES AND PARTNERS 17 SLIDE? 18 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: THESE ONES. THE LIMITED CAPACITY VERSUS SO 19 IS IT SAYING THAT MTC HAS LIMITED CAPACITY ON THE ONES ON THE 20 21 LEFT BUT HAS GREATER CAPACITY FOR THE ONES ON THE RIGHT? 22 CHIRAG RABARI: YEAH, THESE WERE JUST ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLES. 23 WHAT WE DID WAS -- AND THIS WILL BE SHARED OUT WHEN WE RETURN 24 25 TO THE COMMITTEES EARLY NEXT YEAR, BUT BASICALLY WE LOOKED AT



- 1 EACH OF THE 35 STRATEGIES AND SORT OF RANKED THEM WHETHER
- 2 NONE, PARTIAL OR EXISTING OR LOW, MEDIUM, HIGH FOR EACH OF THE
- 3 35 STRATEGIES ACROSS THESE FOUR DIFFERENT CATEGORIES. SO THE
- 4 EXAMPLES HERE ARE JUST TO BE ILLUSTRATIVE OF SOME OF THE
- 5 STRATEGIES WHERE WE MIGHT HAVE LOWER SCORES. OR MTC/ABAG MIGHT
- 6 SCORE LOWER IN THIS AREA VERSUS OTHER AREAS WHERE WE MAY SCORE
- 7 HIGHER. I THINK WHAT I WAS SAYING IS IT'S NOT MEANT TO BE
- 8 SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO LIKE GUIDE WHAT WE PRIORITIZE, IT'S
- 9 MORE JUST MEANT TO IDENTIFY WHERE POTENTIAL NEEDS ARE IN AREAS
- 10 WHERE MAYBE WE DON'T HAVE THE TECHNICAL CAPACITY, WE WANT TO
- 11 SORT OF IDENTIFY WHO THE PARTNERS ARE THAT ARE THERE THAT MAY
- 12 BE IN A BETTER POSITION VIS-A-VIS THAT CAPACITY AND WORK
- 13 TOGETHER TO TRY TO PUSH THE STRATEGIES FORWARD.
- 15 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: OKAY. SO BASICALLY IT'S JUST THEY'RE ALL
- 16 PRIORITIZED BUT WHICH ONES NEED MORE SUPPORT?
- 18 CHIRAG RABARI: WE'RE GOING TO BE TRYING TO IDENTIFY
- 19 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS FOR ALL OF THE 35 STRATEGIES IN THE
- 20 PLAN. AND WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO FOCUS ON A ONE TO FIVE-YEAR
- 21 PERIOD. BUT WE DO WANT TO BE RESPONSIVE TO FEEDBACK FROM
- 22 BODIES SUCH AS THIS ONE AS WELL AS FEEDBACK FROM OUR PARTNERS
- 23 AND STAKEHOLDERS, AS WELL AS THE PUBLIC, THAT IF FOLKS DO HAVE
- 24 PARTICULAR STRATEGIES THAT THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE ACCELERATED,
- 25 THAT WILL BE SOMETHING THAT WE CERTAINLY TAKE INTO

14



CONSIDERATION AS WE START TO VALIDATE SOME OF THE WORK 1 REQUIREMENTS AGAINST OUR OWN INTERNAL RESOURCES BECAUSE, YOU 2 3 KNOW, WE WILL BE RESOURCE CONSTRAINED IN THE AMOUNT OF WORKWEEK COMMIT TO AND SO WILL OUR PARTNERS. SO I THINK WE'RE 4 5 COMMITTING TO PUSHING ALL THE STRATEGIES FORWARD WE'RE FOCUSED ON THE NEXT ONE TO FIVE YEARS, BUT WE ARE ALSO INTERESTED IN 6 HEARING ABOUT PEOPLE'S PRIORITIES SO THAT WE CAN TAKE THAT 7 8 INTO ACCOUNT AS WE THINK ABOUT THE RESOURCE QUESTION. 9 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. CHRISTINA, DO YOU HAVE ANY OTHER 10 QUESTIONS? 11 12 CHRISTINA GOTUACO: NO. 13 14 CHAIR KINMAN: WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE TO ADINA AND THEN RICK 15 16 COATES? GO AHEAD, ADINA. 17 ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. I'M NOT MUTED ANYMORE. THE QUESTION OR 18 COMMENT I HAVE IS WITH REGARD TO STRATEGY E AND 7. FORMERLY 19 THE 60 PERCENT TELEWORK MANDATE WHICH I SEE IN THE AGENDA FOR 20 21 THE 20TH MTC COMMISSION MEETING THAT THERE IS A STAFF-PROPOSED MODIFICATION TO THAT CHANGING THAT TO A POLICY TO HAVE A -- I 22 CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT IT'S CALLED, BUT TO HAVE A MODE SHARE 23 REQUIREMENT FOR LARGER COMPANIES TO HAVE TO HIRE NOT DRIVE 24

ALONE RATE. WHICH I THINK IS GOING IN A GOOD DIRECTION BUT



- 1 STILL HAS A LOT OF IMPLEMENTATION OUESTIONS. AND I AM
- 2 WONDERING WHETHER BECAUSE OF THE IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES THAT IT
- 3 MAKES SENSE TO WORK ON THAT EARLIER OR WHETHER THAT WILL
- 4 REMAIN AS IT WAS EARLIER AS SOMETHING THAT'S A STRATEGY FOR
- 5 MUCH LATER AND WOULD WELCOME STAFF COMMENT. WHERE MY THOUGHTS
- 6 ARE, IF THIS IS GOING TO BE -- IF THIS IS GOING TO INVOLVE A
- 7 BUNCH OF CHANGE, DOES IT HELP TO START TO THINK ABOUT THEM
- 8 IMPLEMENTATION SOONER VERSUS THAN LATER?

- 10 DAVE VAUTIN: I'LL TACKLE THAT QUESTION. SO, ADINA, I BELIEVE
- 11 YOU'RE REFERRING TO THE COMMISSION ITEM FOR FRIDAY WHERE WE'RE
- 12 BRINGING FORWARD AN ALTERNATIVE TO ONE OF THE 35 STRATEGIES
- 13 THAT THE COMMISSION WANTED TO SEE SOME ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS
- 14 FOR. SO, THEY WILL BE CONSIDERING IT ON FRIDAY. AS YOU NOTED,
- 15 IT'S REALLY BROADENING THE MODAL OPTIONS FOR EMPLOYERS.
- 16 OBVIOUSLY, TELECOMMUTING IS A HUGE PART OF THAT, BUT ALSO
- 17 ENABLING TRANSIT AND WALKING AND BIKING TO BE PART OF THE MIX,
- 18 TOO. YOU KNOW, AS WE LOOK AT THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, WE NEED
- 19 TO COME UP WITH ACTIONS FOR ALL 35 STRATEGIES. SO THIS WILL BE
- 20 ONE OF THEM. THAT PARTICULAR STRATEGY, JUST LIKE ITS
- 21 PREDECESSOR IS SOMETHING THAT IN OUR PLAN, WE ENVISION BY THE
- 22 YEAR 2035. SO IT DOESN'T MEAN IT HAS TO BE FULLY IMPLEMENTED
- 23 BY 2025, BUT THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO THINK ABOUT WHAT EARLY
- 24 ACTIONS ARE APPROPRIATE FOR THAT STRATEGY JUST LIKE ALL THE
- 25 OTHERS IN THE BLUEPRINT. SO, YOU KNOW, AT OUR WORKSHOP ON THIS



- 1 TOPIC ON THURSDAY BUT ALSO OVER THE COMING MONTHS, WE INTEND 2 TO IDENTIFY IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS FOR E AND 7 JUST LIKE WE
- 3 WOULD FOR THE OTHER STRATEGIES.

4

5 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. RICK COATES?

6

- 7 RICK COATES: YES. YOU ASKED WHICH STRATEGIES WE THOUGHT SHOULD
- 8 BE HIGHLIGHTED OR INCREASED. I'M LOOKING AT THE LIST OF
- 9 TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES HERE, AND I THINK THE ENABLE A
- 10 SEAMLESS MOBILITY EXPERIENCE REQUIRES MORE FUNDING MYSELF.
- 11 LOTS MORE CONNECTIVITY TO BE INVOLVED. ALSO DOWN THERE ON
- 12 CREATE HEALTH AND SAFE STREETS, BUILD A COMPLETE STREETS
- 13 NETWORK AND ADVANCE REGIONAL VISION ZERO, WE JUST HAD YET
- 14 ANOTHER PEDESTRIAN DEATH IN SONOMA COUNTY. WE NEED SAFE
- 15 STREETS. SO THOSE WOULD BE MY PRIORITIES.

16

17 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE NEXT TO WALTER?

18

- 19 WALTER WILSON: YES, THANK YOU. SO I WANTED TO FIND OUT ABOUT
- 20 THE FIVE YEARS IN THE PLAN. IS THAT TIED TO A BUDGET CYCLE? OR
- 21 IS IT GOING TO TAKE 60 MONTHS TO DO IT? OR WHAT IS THE NEXUS
- 22 FOR THE FIVE YEARS?

- 24 CHIRAG RABARI: SO THE GENERAL IDEA BEHIND THE FIVE-YEAR
- 25 TIMELINE IS IT ALIGNS WITH OUR UPDATE CYCLE. WE UPDATE THE



- 1 PLAN EVERY, YOU KNOW, APPROXIMATELY FOUR TO FIVE YEARS. SO I
- 2 THINK OUR THINKING WAS, YOU KNOW, WE WANT TO FOCUS ON THE
- 3 PERIOD BETWEEN THIS PLAN AND THE NEXT PLAN BECAUSE BY THE TIME
- 4 WE GET TO THE NEXT PLAN, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO IDENTIFY --
- 5 HOPEFULLY NOT IDENTIFY A WHOLE BUNCH OF NEW THINGS BUT REFRESH
- 6 THE ACTIONS THAT WERE IDENTIFIED IN THIS PLAN. BUT AS DAVE
- 7 MENTIONED, WE ARE NOT EXCLUSIVELY LIMITED TO THIS FIVE-YEAR
- 8 PERIOD. WE DO NEED TO THINK ABOUT STRATEGIES THAT MIGHT BE
- 9 IMPLEMENTED DURING THE LATTER PART OF THE 30 YEAR PLANNING
- 10 CYCLE AND IDENTIFY NEAR TERM ACTIONS FOR THEM. AND DEPENDING
- 11 UPON CERTAIN STRATEGIES AND THEIR NEEDS, WE MAY DISCUSS LONGER
- 12 TIME HORIZONS ON AN AS-NEEDED BASIS IF IT APPEARS THAT THAT
- 13 WOULD BE SORT OF BENEFICIAL FOR PLANNING PURPOSES. WE MAY GO
- 14 OUT TO AN EIGHT-YEAR PERIOD IF THAT PROVES USEFUL.
- 16 WALTER WILSON: GREAT, THANKS. SO YOU ARE FLEXIBLE. THANK YOU
- 17 SO MUCH FOR THE CLARIFICATION.
- 19 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. WENDY?
- 21 WENDY KALLINS: SORRY. I HAD TO STEP AWAY FROM THE MEETING FOR
- 22 A MINUTE. SO I MISSED ADINA'S QUESTION BUT LISTENING TO DAVE'S
- 23 ANSWER I THINK IT WAS SIMILAR TO THE QUESTION I WANTED TO ASK,
- 24 WHICH IS RELATION TO THE TELECOMMUTING. IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU ARE
- 25 GOING TO BE REVISING THAT. I'M VERY INTERESTED TO KNOW WHAT

15

18



- 1 IT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE AND WOULD BE NICE TO BE DIRECTED TO
- 2 WHERE I CAN FIND THE NEW RECOMMENDATION THAT'S GOING TO
- 3 INCLUDE TRANSIT AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, AS WELL. AND ALSO,
- 4 AS PART OF THAT, AS YOU KNOW, I'VE BEEN PROMOTING
- 5 TELECOMMUTING. WE EVEN PUT ON A LITTLE WEBINAR ABOUT THAT. SO
- 6 I'M ALL IN FAVOR OF IT. I DID THINK THAT THAT RECOMMENDATION
- 7 WAS A LITTLE DRACONIAN. AND UNFORTUNATELY LEFT OUT THE
- 8 IMPORTANCE OF TRANSIT AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. AND FURTHER I
- 9 THINK IT'S ALSO IMPORTANT WHEN PEOPLE ARE TELECOMMUTING, AND,
- 10 DAVE, YOU AND I HAVE DISCUSSED THIS, THE IMPORTANCE OF WHAT
- 11 HAPPENS WHEN PEOPLE ARE TELECOMMUTING AND WHAT ABOUT THE TRIPS
- 12 THEY MAKE FROM HOME TO MEETINGS? AND HOW CAN WE PROMOTE MORE
- 13 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AND TRANSIT USE WHEN PEOPLE ARE
- 14 TELECOMMUTING? YOU COULD DIRECT US TO WHERE WE COULD FIND THE
- 15 NEW RECOMMENDATION, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.
- 17 DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR THE QUESTION. WE CAN WORK WITH MARTI
- 18 FOR THE LINK. IT'S UNDER THE MTC WEBSITE RIGHT NOW UNDER THE
- 19 COMMISSION.
- 21 SPEAKER: I'D RATHER NOT HUNT FOR THINGS. I'D RATHER SOMEBODY
- 22 GIVE ME THE LINK.
- 24 CHAIR KINMAN: I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON WENDY'S. CAN YOU PLEASE
- 25 GIVE US REQUEST, WHICH IS: WE DON'T KNOW BECAUSE WE DON'T

16

20



- 1 FOLLOW THE PLAN BAY AREA WEBSITE AS WE DID OUR OWN AGENDA
- 2 ITEMS. SO WHEN YOU ARE HAVING PUBLIC MEETINGS OR WHEN A
- 3 SIGNIFICANT UPDATE LIKE THAT HAPPENS AND IS AGENDIZED,
- 4 ESPECIALLY ONE THAT WAS NEVER BROUGHT TO US IN THE FIRST PLACE
- 5 AND NOW IS IN REV 2, PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT OUR STAFF PUSHES
- 6 THAT OUT TO US SO THAT WE CAN BE UPDATED ON IT. ESPECIALLY THE
- 7 MEETING SCHEDULES. WE HAVE ANNE OLIVIA NEXT?

- 9 SPEAKER: THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WAS ABLE TO
- 10 FOLLOW MOST OF IT. MY POWER'S ON, YEA, BUT THE INTERNET IS
- 11 STILL BEING KIND OF FUN. I WOULD LIKE TO SECOND THAT SENDING
- 12 US THE MEETINGS. THERE ARE GROUPS THAT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO
- 13 BE PROMOTING THESE MEETINGS TO WHERE I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE
- 14 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT IN SOME OF MY PARTICULAR CONSTITUENCY
- 15 GROUPS. AND ON A COMPLETELY DIFFERENT NOTE, ONE OF THE THINGS
- 16 THAT WORKED REALLY WELL THROUGH EVERY POSSIBLE FUTURE WAS
- 17 FERRIES. AND FERRIES ADDRESS QUITE A LOT OF ISSUES AND PROMOTE
- 18 ACTIVE, LIKE BIKE RIDING AND WALKING AND ALL THOSE KINDS OF
- 19 THINGS. AND I WOULD REALLY LOVE TO, CAN YOU TELL ME WHERE TO
- 20 FIND THE SECTION ON FERRIES AND IF WE CAN EXPAND THEM AND GET
- 21 THEM RUNNING MORE REGULARLY BECAUSE I'M CONSISTENTLY
- 22 CONFRONTED WITH: THEY DON'T RUN DURING THE LUNCH HOURS. LIKE
- 23 IT JUST STOPS FOR 2-1/2 HOURS. SO I CAN'T GET TO OR FROM A
- 24 MEETING IF I DO THAT IN ONE DIRECTION. SO I'D LOVE TO SEE THAT
- 25 PRIMARILY I'D LIKE TO SEE MORE WITH FERRIES, WE WERE TALKING



ABOUT IT IN OUR COMMUNITY IF WE COULD JUST GET TO THAT BOAT. 1 IT'S ABOVE GROUND. IT FEELS SAFER TO BE OUTSIDE WITH THE AIR 2 3 GOING ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF. SO IS THAT IN THERE SOMEWHERE? 4 5 DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR THE QUESTION, ANNE OLIVIA. THAT WAS INCLUDED IN THE ITEM BROUGHT FORWARD TO THE COUNCIL IN JULY, 6 7 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ELEMENT OF THE PLAN. SO IN THAT ITEM YOU 8 CAN SEE A LIST OF THE FERRY IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE PROPOSED ACROSS THE REGION OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS AND THAT INCLUDES A 9 LOT OF THE FERRY IMPROVEMENTS ARE IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE 10 PLAN BECAUSE THEY ARE KIND OF FASTER TO IMPLEMENT THAN 11 TRADITIONAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS. SO YOU CAN TAKE A LOOK 12 THERE AT THE LIST OF NEW FERRY LINES AND THEN THE FERRY 13 FREQUENCY INCREASES THAT ARE ENVISIONED ON SOME OF THE KEY 14 15 LINES IN THE EXISTING NETWORK. 16 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. I WASN'T SURE IF THIS WAS RIGHT 17 18 BUT THANKS. 19 CHAIR KINMAN: WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT NOW. MARTI 20 21 WAS THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED OR ARE THERE ANY 22 PARTICIPANTS? AND I WILL REMIND ATTENDEES TO EITHER RAISE 23 THEIR BLUE HAND OR HIT STAR 9.



MARTI PASCHAL: NO. NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED FOR THIS 1 ITEM AND I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. OR THERE ARE NO RAISED 2 3 HANDS. 4 5 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. THANK YOU. GREAT. I THINK WE WILL MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM, THEN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE 6 7 PRESENTATION. ITEM NUMBER 9, LEGISLATIVE OUTCOMES. 8 SPEAKER: HI THERE, CHAIR KINMAN. REBECCA LONG, MTC/ABAG 9 LEGISLATIVE STAFF. NICE TO SEE YOU ALL. SO I'M GOING TO 10 CHALLENGE YOUR BRAINS TO NOT JUST LOOK AT THE SCREEN IN FRONT 11 OF YOU OR NOT JUST LOOK AT THE ZOOM BUT IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND 12 PULLING UP ON YOUR AGENDA PACKET ITEM 9 BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE 13 SLIDES FOR THIS. BUT I'LL JUST TRY TO WALK THROUGH AND 14 HIGHLIGHT ITEMS. OKAY. THE NTT TEAM IS RIGHT ON IT. I KNOW 15 16 IT'S HARD TO SEE BUT THIS CAN BE A PROMPT NONETHELESS. SO WHAT THIS ITEM IS IS REALLY SUMMARIZING FROM MTC/ABAG'S PERSPECTIVE 17 WHAT WERE THE OUTCOMES THIS PAST SESSION. AND I THINK ONE OF 18 THE FIRST WORDS THERE ARE COVID-19. OBVIOUSLY IT AFFECTED 19 EVERYTHING THIS YEAR. AND THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS IN 20 21 SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON WERE ALSO VERY AFFECTED BY IT. IN 22 SACRAMENTO, MANY BILLS JUST WERE DROPPED, BILLS THAT WE WERE 23 VERY ENGAGED IN SOLUTIONS A LIFETIME AGO THAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT A FUNDING MEASURE FOR TRANSPORTATION TO BE PUT ON THE 24

BALLOT. YOU KNOW, THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHU HAD HIS BILL RELATED



- 1 TO SEAMLESS TRANSIT. SO THERE WERE MANY BIG PROFILE ITEMS THAT
- 2 FELL BY THE WAYSIDE. BUT THERE WERE A FEW BILLS THAT WE DID
- 3 SUPPORT THAT DID MAKE IT TO THE FINISH LINE. AND THOSE ARE
- 4 NOTED IN BULLETS AT THE BOTTOM THERE.

5

- 6 CHAIR KINMAN: IF I CAN JUST STOP YOU FOR A SECOND. FOR THOSE
- 7 OF YOU WHO HADN'T HAD TO DO THIS BEFORE, YOU CAN ENLARGE YOUR
- 8 VIEW OF THAT PAGE. GO UP TO THE TOP OF YOUR SCREEN NEXT TO
- 9 WHERE IT SAYS YOU ARE VIEWING ALEX'S SCREEN. HIT VIEW OPTIONS
- 10 AND HIT 100 PERCENT AND IT WILL MAGICALLY MAKE IT READABLE
- 11 INSTEAD OF YOU HAVING TO GO LOOK FOR A MAGNIFYING GLASS.
- 12 THANKS, REBECCA.

- 14 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU, RANDI. SO S.B.146 WAS A BILL THAT
- 15 RAN ON OUR URGING OR OUR REQUEST TO ALLOW US TO GET CREDIT FOR
- 16 ALL OF THE VIRTUAL MEETINGS WE DID FOR PLAN BAY AREA THIS PAST
- 17 YEAR. AS MANY OF YOU MAY NO, WE HAVE TO DO A VERY ROBUST SET
- 18 OF PUBLIC OUTREACH MEETINGS FOR PLAN BAY AREA UNDER STATE LAW.
- 19 WE HAVE TO HOLD NUMEROUS WORKSHOPS IN EVERY COUNTY. AND OF
- 20 COURSE WE COULDN'T DO THAT IN PERSON. SO WE PIVOTED TO A
- 21 VIRTUAL FORMAT. BUT WE WERE CONCERNED THAT ONCE THE SHELTER IN
- 22 PLACE WAS LIFTED SOMETIME HOPEFULLY NEXT YEAR AND IN-PERSON
- 23 MEETINGS WERE ALLOWED, WE WOULD SUDDENLY STILL BE KIND OF
- 24 CAUGHT HAVING TO DO OVER 20 WORKSHOPS. SO THIS BILL BASICALLY
- 25 ALLOWED US TO HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY TO MEET THOSE REQUIREMENTS



- 1 VIRTUALLY. SO WE WERE HAPPY THAT THAT MADE IT THROUGH. AND
- 2 THEN A LONG-STANDING PRIORITY FOR US HAS BEEN TO GET CEQA
- 3 RELIEF, THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT, FOR
- 4 SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS. SO BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN
- 5 PROJECTS, TRANSITS PROJECTS JUST TO ACCELERATE THE PROJECT.
- 6 AND SENATOR WEINER RAN A BILL, IT ENDED UP BEING SCALED BACK
- 7 TO JUST A TWO-YEAR AUTHORIZATION BUT IT DOES PROVIDE CEQA
- 8 EXEMPTION FOR A NUMBER OF SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS.
- 9 SO THAT BILL DID GET SIGNED. AND FOLKS ARE TRYING TO FIGURE
- 10 OUT EXACTLY HOW TO TAKE MAXIMUM ADVANTAGE OF THAT BECAUSE,
- 11 AGAIN, IT'S JUST FOR TWO YEARS. AND IN WASHINGTON OF COURSE
- 12 THE BIGGEST NEWS WAS THE TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF COVID RELIEF
- 13 FUNDING THAT TRANSIT RECEIVED IN THE BAY AREA THANKS TO THE
- 14 LEADERSHIP OF SPEAKER PELOSI, \$1.3 BILLION. WE'RE WORKING HARD
- 15 BEHIND THE SCENES TO SEE A REPEAT OF THAT AS THOSE FUNDS DRY
- 16 UP. THE BIGGEST NEWS IN WASHINGTON ALONG WITH THE FACT THAT
- 17 THEY DID PASS AN EXTENSION OF THE SURFACE TRANSPORTATION
- 18 PROGRAM. TYPICALLY, CONGRESS HAS A MULTI-YEAR AUTHORIZATION
- 19 FOR TRANSPORTATION. THAT EXPIRED IN OCTOBER. BUT THEY PAST A
- 20 ONE-YEAR EXTENSION. SO THAT BOUGHT SOME TIME TO CONTINUE TO
- 21 WORK ON THAT NEXT YEAR. SO I THINK THAT'S REALLY ALL I NEED TO
- 22 SAY ABOUT THIS ITEM. I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE MORE INTERESTING
- 23 TO TALK ABOUT WHAT WE'RE THINKING FOR NEXT YEAR, WHICH WILL
- 24 KIND OF KEY OFF OF SOME OF THE QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION YOU
- 25 HAD IN CHIRAG'S ITEM ABOUT THE ACTION PLAN. SO FOR THE NTT



- 1 TEAM, I THINK I'M JUST GOING TO DO THIS VERBALLY SO YOU CAN
- 2 REMOVE THE SCREEN SHARE. THANK YOU. OKAY. I GUESS I'LL -- DO
- 3 YOU WANT TO PAUSE TO SEE IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THIS
- 4 BEFORE WE GO TO ITEM 10?

5

6 CHAIR KINMAN: YES. I DO SEE ONE HAND UP. RICK COATES?

7

- 8 RICK COATES: I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS MY OPINION ABOUT THE
- 9 TRYING TO WEAKEN CEQA.

10

- 11 MR. SCOTT: WE KNOW WITHER HAS BEEN TRYING TO DO THAT IN A
- 12 NUMBER OF FRONTS AND HE'S FOUND YET ANOTHER EXCUSE TO DO SO. I
- 13 DON'T THINK IT WILL SPEED UP PROJECTS. I THINK IT WILL JUST
- 14 CUT OUT THE REASONABLE PUBLIC INPUT AND ALTERNATIVES THAT
- 15 SHOULD BE CONSIDERED. IT'S BEEN MY EXPERIENCE THAT GOVERNMENT
- 16 AGENCIES DON'T WANT TO COMPLY WITH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND THEY
- 17 BLAME IT ON CEQA WHEN IN FACT IT'S BECAUSE THEIR PROJECTS THEY
- 18 PROPOSE ARE DEFICIENT. AND CEOA IS ONE OF THE BULWARKS WE HAVE
- 19 AS THE PUBLIC TO PREVENT GOVERNMENT FROM TRASHING THE
- 20 ENVIRONMENT AND PRIVATE INTEREST, AS WELL, I MIGHT ADD. SO I'M
- 21 REALLY OPPOSED TO THIS CONSTANT CHIPPING AWAY AT CEQA, EVEN IF
- 22 IT IS FOR SOMETHING THAT I DEARLY LOVE, WHICH IS PEDESTRIAN
- 23 AND BICYCLE TRANSIT.



- 1 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU, RICK. I DO WANT US TO CONFINE
- 2 OURSELVES BECAUSE WE HAVE A FULL SCHEDULE TO THINGS THAT WE
- 3 CAN EFFECT AND IMPACT. THIS LEGISLATION HAS PASSED. BUT I
- 4 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS. WALTER, YOU'RE NEXT.

5

- 6 WALTER WILSON: YEAH, YOU JUST SHUT ME DOWN BECAUSE I AGREE
- 7 WITH RICK. BUT IT HAS PROJECTS BUT IT IS DESIGNED TO UNDERMINE
- 8 THE PUBLIC'S ACCESS TO THESE CONVERSATIONS. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY, THANK YOU. NORMALLY I WOULD ALLOW
- 11 LENGTHIER CONVERSATION ON THINGS THAT WE HAVE. BUT WE HAVE TO
- 12 MOVE ON TOED'S AGENDA. SO REBECCA, GO AHEAD.

13

- 14 MARTI PASCHAL: NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM. I
- 15 THOUGHT SHE WAS MOVING TO THE NEXT ITEM.

16

17 CHAIR KINMAN: ARE YOU MOVING COMPLETELY TO THE NEXT ITEM?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES.

20

- 21 CHAIR KINMAN: THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT. NO WRITTEN COMMENT
- 22 SUBMITTED. WE WILL DO THE NEXT ITEM. NOW GO AHEAD, REBECCA.

- 24 REBECCA LONG: LET'S SEE. MADAME CHAIR, WOULD YOU LIKE TO SEE
- 25 HOW IT LOOKS TO HAVE THE TEAM PLACE THE NEXT PIECE ON THE



SCREEN? BECAUSE IT IS A LANDSCAPE DOCUMENT THAT MIGHT BE 1 2 EASIER TO READ THAN THE OTHER ONE? 3 CHAIR KINMAN: YEAH, LET'S TRY THAT. 4 5 SPEAKER: REBECCA LONG: LET'S GIVE IT A TRY. SO IF YOU DON'T 6 MIND, NTT, IF YOU COULD PUT THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM, NOT THE 7 8 COVER MEMO BUT STARTING WITH THE LANDSCAPE DOCUMENT THAT SAYS 2021 DRAFT ADVOCACY PROGRAM FOR ITEM 10. NEXT PAGE. THERE WE 9 GO. OKAY. GREAT. SO, WHAT THIS IS, EVERY YEAR MTC/ABAG PUTS 10 TOGETHER OUR DRAFT ADVOCACY PROGRAM. THE LAST ITEM KIND OF 11 COMPARED WHAT OUR GOALS WERE WITH WHAT GOT DONE, LARGELY NOT 12 MUCH GOT DONE LAST YEAR. AND THEN WE STARTED FRESH. AND OFTEN 13 IT'S REVIVING THOSE ITEMS THAT DIDN'T GET DONE BUT SOMETIMES 14 15 THERE'S NEW PRIORITIES. AND SO TODAY I'M PRESENTING OUR DRAFT. 16 THIS WAS SHARED WITH THE MTC/ABAG JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE JUST AS AN INITIAL DRAFT EARLIER THIS MONTH. WE ALWAYS WANT TO 17 GET YOUR INPUT BEFORE WE PRESENT A FINAL TO THAT COMMITTEE. 18 AND THEN WE ALSO SHARE IT WITH OTHER ORGANIZATIONS ACROSS THE 19 STATE AND WHAT NOT. SO TODAY'S REALLY A GREAT OPPORTUNITY FOR 20 21 YOU TO GIVE ME SOME FEEDBACK ON ITEMS THAT YOU EITHER THINK SHOULD BE CHANGED OR IF YOU THINK SOMETHING'S MISSING. I WOULD 22 JUST NOTE ON THE SORT OF IDEA OF SOMETHING BEING MISSING, YOU 23 KNOW, WE DO HAVE TO THINK ABOUT BANDWIDTH, THE SCOPE IS 24

ALREADY QUITE LARGE AS MTC/ABAG'S SORT OF WATERFRONT AND SCOPE





- 1 OF AREAS OF INTEREST GETS LARGER. BUT, YOU KNOW, IF YOU DO
- 2 THINK WE HAVE A BLIND SPOT, PLEASE LET ME KNOW. SO WHAT WE'VE
- 3 DONE HERE JUST TO KIND OF ASSIST IN FOCUSING ON THE AREAS OF
- 4 CHANGE ARE HIGHLIGHTING IN THE SALMON COLOR WHERE THERE ARE
- 5 NEW ITEMS FROM LAST YEAR. THERE MIGHT BE SOME TWEAKS IN THE
- 6 LANGUAGE IN SOME ITEMS BUT WHERE YOU DON'T SEE IT HIGHLIGHTED,
- 7 THAT'S PRETTY MUCH BECAUSE IT'S SIMILAR TO WHAT WE'VE PROPOSED
- 8 LAST YEAR; OKAY? SO, I WOULD NOTE THAT THE VERY FIRST ITEM
- 9 HERE, TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, IT'S NEW FOR US TO HAVE THIS AS
- 10 OUR TOP ITEM. FOR MANY YEARS THAT WAS OUR TOP PRIORITY. AND
- 11 THEN WE WERE FORTUNATE TO GET S.B.1 PASSED IN THE LEGISLATURE
- 12 PROVIDING GAS TAX INCREASE, REGISTRATION FEE INCREASE, ET
- 13 CETERA. BUT WE FACE AN EXTREME CRISIS RIGHT NOW, AS YOU ALL
- 14 KNOW, WITH RESPECT TO TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING IN PARTICULAR.
- 15 SO THIS IS NOW BACK TO NUMBER 1. AND WE ARE HIGHLIGHTING THE
- 16 NEED TO WORK IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE REGION'S OPERATORS AND
- 17 CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION TO SEEK ADDITIONAL STATE
- 18 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. I WOULD NOTE THAT WE VERY MUCH
- 19 THINK THE BEST PLACE TO GO RIGHT NOW IS GOING TO BE CONGRESS
- 20 IN WASHINGTON. THEY DON'T NEED TO BALANCE THEIR BUDGETS. OF
- 21 COURSE I WOULD LIKE, YOU KNOW, IN A PERFECT WORLD, WE'RE NOT
- 22 RACKING UP MORE NATIONAL DEBT, BUT WE ALL KNOW IT'S EASIER TO
- 23 GET FEDERAL FUNDING RIGHT NOW THAN IT IS FROM SACRAMENTO. BUT
- 24 WE DO WANT TO STILL KEEP IT OPEN IN CASE, YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT
- 25 SEEING HELP FROM WASHINGTON. SO THAT'S THAT FIRST ITEM THERE.



- 1 ITEM 1 C IS KIND OF MORE INTERNAL PRIORITY. IT RELATES TO THE
- 2 OVERHEAD THAT WE GET CHARGED BY CALTRANS TO DO WORK ON THE
- 3 BRIDGES. WE HAVE TO PAY QUITE A BIT IN ADMINISTRATIVE
- 4 OVERHEAD. AND SO WE'D LIKE TO SEE SOME CHANGES THERE THAT
- 5 COULD SAFE US, YOU KNOW, SEVERAL MILLION DOLLAR A YEAR THAT IS
- 6 NEEDED FOR BRIDGE REHAB AND OTHER BRIDGE NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE?
- 7 OKAY. YOU CAN KEEP SCROLLING FOR THE ITEMS THAT ARE COLORED,
- 8 COLOR-CODED IN THE SALMON? OKAY. THANK YOU. SO THE NEXT ITEM
- 9 HERE, 2B HIGHLIGHTS THE ACTIVITIES OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
- 10 RECOVERY TASKFORCE THAT YOU HEARD ABOUT EARLIER TODAY. WE, YOU
- 11 KNOW, WANT TO ARTICULATE THAT WE WILL SUPPORT LEGISLATION
- 12 COMING OUT OF THAT. THE AREAS THAT WE'RE ANTICIPATING TO BE
- 13 KIND OF HIGHLIGHTED IN ANY PROPOSED LEGISLATION WOULD BE WAYS
- 14 TO HELP GET TRANSIT OUT OF TRAFFIC. SO THIS COULD BE
- 15 STRATEGIES TO REALLY HELP ACCELERATE THINGS LIKE BUS RAPID
- 16 TRANSIT, DEDICATED LANES FOR BUS SERVICE, BUS IN PARTICULAR.
- 17 IT DOESN'T HAVE ITS OWN RIGHT OF WAY, SO IT OFTEN GETS STUCK
- 18 IN THE SAME TRAFFIC THAT CARS DO. AND THAT UNDERMINES THE
- 19 INCENTIVE FOR PEOPLE TO RIDE TRANSIT. SECONDLY, IDEAS ABOUT
- 20 HOW WE MIGHT MAKE THE RIDER EXPERIENCE MORE SEAMLESS AND
- 21 CONVENIENT. I THINK YOU HEARD A LITTLE BIT ABOUT INTEGRATED
- 22 FARES EARLIER. THAT'S ONE ASPECT. ANOTHER IS MAPPING AND WAY
- 23 FINDING AND MAKING THE EXPERIENCE OF RIDING TRANSIT ACROSS
- 24 DIFFERENT OPERATORS MORE HARMONIOUS. SO THERE MIGHT BE SOME
- 25 IDEAS THERE THAT COULD SHOW UP IN LEGISLATION. AND THEN



- 1 POTENTIALLY GOVERNANCE CHANGES IF APPROPRIATE. SO THAT'S THAT
- 2 ITEM. AND THEN ON HOUSING, THIS WAS A DISAPPOINTING
- 3 LEGISLATIVE YEAR ON HOUSING. I THINK YOU ALL ARE FAMILIAR WITH
- 4 KIND OF THE FRAMING THAT CAME OUT OF THE CASA COMPACT OF THE 3
- 5 PS, THE NEED TO PRODUCE MORE HOUSING, FOR ALL INCOME LEVELS
- 6 PARTICULARLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TO PRESERVE THE AFFORDABLE
- 7 HOUSING AND TO DO MORE FOR TENANT PROTECTION. SO WE'RE
- 8 CONTINUING TO WANT TO SUPPORT ALL P'S. THE HIGHLIGHTED ITEM
- 9 REALLY IS AROUND PRODUCTION. CONTINUING TO SUPPORT LEGISLATION
- 10 AIMED AT BOOSTING DENSITY NEAR JOB-RICH, HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT
- 11 AREAS. I WOULD ALSO NOTE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS IS ANOTHER
- 12 IMPORTANT ONE THAT WE GOT SOME FEEDBACK ABOUT MAKING THIS
- 13 CONSISTENT WITH THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. SO WE'LL BE ADDING THAT.
- 14 AND ALSO LOOKING AT ALLOWING HOUSING IN COMMERCIAL ZONES.
- 15 THERE'S SOME THOUGHT THAT THERE'S SO MUCH PUSHBACK WHEN IT
- 16 COMES TO INCREASING DENSITY IN RESIDENTIAL AREAS THAT ANOTHER
- 17 STRATEGY IS TO ALLOW MORE MIXED USE AND ALLOW MORE HOUSING TO
- 18 BE BUILT POTENTIALLY, FOR EXAMPLE, ON FORMER SHOPPING MALLS
- 19 AND THINGS OF THAT NATURE OR IN COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS. AND THEN
- 20 WE WOULD LIKE TO CONTINUE TO SUPPORT LEGISLATION AIMED AT
- 21 HELPING LOCAL AGENCIES ADJUST THEIR ZONING. SO WHAT'S GOING TO
- 22 HAPPEN AS SORT OF FOLLOWING THE RHNA PROCESS IS THAT LOCAL
- 23 JURISDICTIONS ARE GOING TO NEED TO UPDATE THEIR ZONING TO
- 24 ACCOMMODATE THE ADDITIONAL HOUSING THAT THEY HAVE BEEN
- 25 ASSIGNED, WHICH REQUIRES CHANGES TO ZONING, WHICH CAN BE AN



- 1 EXPENSIVE AND LENGTHY PROCESS. SO WE WANT TO ASSIST LOCAL
- 2 AGENCIES SO THAT THE ZONING CHANGES THEMSELVES AREN'T OVERLY
- 3 BURDENSOME. THIS NEXT ITEM, 3C IS AN IDEA OF SEEKING A SMALL
- 4 AMOUNT OF FUNDING, KNOWING THAT IT'S GOING TO BE HARD TO COME
- 5 BY IN SACRAMENTO. \$5 MILLION TO HELP LAUNCH THE BAY AREA
- 6 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY THROUGH SOME PILOT PROJECTS. AND
- 7 THEN THIS WOULD, THE IDEA IS WE WOULD SEEK MATCHING FUNDS FROM
- 8 THE PHILANTHROPIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR. AND SO SOME OF THE IDEAS
- 9 HERE ALSO WOULD ADVANCE THE 3 P'S AND JUST HELP GET THIS NEW
- 10 ORGANIZATION THAT IS GOVERNED BY MTC, I GUESS I'M GOING TO
- 11 REWIND THE TAPE A TINY BIT JUST FOR THOSE THAT MAYBE WEREN'T
- 12 ON THE COUNCIL AT THE TIME, BUT WE HAD A BILL PASSED I GUESS
- 13 IN 2019, A.B. 1487 WHICH CREATED THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
- 14 AUTHORITY, SORT OF ANOTHER AFFILIATE AGENCY OF MTC THAT CAN
- 15 PUT A MAJOR FUNDING MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. WE COULDN'T DO THAT
- 16 IN 2020. JUST WASN'T THE RIGHT TIME. BUT WE DO WANT TO SORT OF
- 17 BUILD OUR CAPACITY SO THAT WE'RE READY TO GO WHEN THE TIME IS
- 18 RIGHT, WHETHER THAT BE 2022 OR 2024. AND THEN ARTICULATING
- 19 SUPPORT FOR HOMELESSNESS PREVENTION, AS WELL. LET'S SEE. IF
- 20 YOU COULD GO TO THE NEXT PAGE, I'M GOING TO SCROLL ON MY OWN
- 21 SCREEN. YOU CAN GO TWO PAGES AHEAD. YEP. OKAY. PERFECT. THANK
- 22 YOU. THIS NEXT OVERARCHING CATEGORY STILL ON THE STATE SIDE
- 23 HAS TO DO WITH CLIMATE CHANGE. AND THE TOP ITEM HERE, S.B.375
- 24 IMPLEMENTATION AND REFORM. SO YOU GOT A PRESENTATION FROM
- 25 CHIRAG ABOUT THE ACTION PLAN FOR PLAN BAY AREA. JUST A



- 1 REMINDER THAT PLAN BAY AREA IS THE REGION'S SUSTAINABLE
- 2 COMMUNITIES STRATEGY AND NOT AS A REQUIREMENT OF S.B.375.
- 3 THAT'S NOW A 12-YEAR-OLD LAW. IT IS SINGLE FOCUSED REALLY ON
- 4 REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. AND A LOT OF THE KIND OF
- 5 CONTROVERSY THAT CAME UP AROUND THE TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY WAS
- 6 DUE TO THE FACT THAT IT IS EXTREMELY DIFFICULT FOR US TO REACH
- 7 THE G.H.G. TARGET. OF COURSE, WE FULLY RECOGNIZE THAT G.H.G.
- 8 IS A CRITICAL GOAL. BUT WE ARE FINDING THAT THERE ARE OTHER
- 9 STATE REQUIRED GOALS THAT SOMETIMES ARE AT ODDS WITH SOME OF
- 10 THE OTHER STRATEGIES THAT WE MIGHT NEED TO ADOPT IF ALL WE
- 11 CARE ABOUT IS GHG. SO WHAT WE WANT DO IS ENGAGE IN
- 12 CONVERSATIONS WITH THE STATE, WITH THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD,
- 13 WITH OTHERS ABOUT HOW CAN WE BETTER SINK UP ALL THESE
- 14 COMPETING GOALS. TAKE AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING,
- 15 SOCIAL EOUITY AS WELL AS CLIMATE CHANGE AND SO THAT THEY'RE
- 16 NOT COMPETING AT ODDS. AND ALSO SHIFT FROM WHAT I WOULD
- 17 DESCRIBE AS A REALLY COMPETITIVE RELATIONSHIP WITH THE STATE
- 18 ABOUT WHO GETS CREDITED FOR WHAT G.H.G. REDUCTION STRATEGIES
- 19 AND FIND A WAY TO BE MORE IN PARTNERSHIP. RIGHT NOW, OUR STAFF
- 20 SPENDS AN INORDINATE AMOUNT OF TIME ARGUING OVER AIR QUALITY
- 21 EMISSION MODELS WHERE WE WOULD PROBABLY BE MUCH BETTER OFF IF
- 22 WE COULD TALK ABOUT ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTING CLIMATE CHANGE
- 23 REDUCTION STRATEGIES AND ROWING IN THE SAME DIRECTION INSTEAD
- 24 OF ARGUING ABOUT WHO GETS CREDIT FOR WHAT. SO THIS IS MORE OF
- 25 A LONGER-TERM CONVERSATION. WE DON'T NECESSARILY ANTICIPATE A



- 1 BILL NEXT YEAR. BUT WE THINK THE TIME IS RIGHT TO TAKE A LOOK
- 2 AT THIS. AND THEN THE NEXT ITEM HAS TO DO WITH JUST PUTTING ON
- 3 THE RECORD SOMETHING THAT IS IN THE ACTION PLAN OF PLAN BAY
- 4 AREA, OR I THINK IT'S IN THE BLUEPRINT, RATHER, NOT
- 5 NECESSARILY IN THE ACTION PLAN. AND THAT IS THE IDEA OF
- 6 SUPPORTING ADDITIONAL INCENTIVES TO CONVERT AND ELECTRIFY THE
- 7 PASSENGER FLEET. SO PROPOSALS, FOR INSTANCE, TO INCREASE THE
- 8 REGISTRATION FEE FOR HIGHER EMISSION VEHICLES AND THEN HELP
- 9 USE THOSE REVENUES TO FUND REBATES FOR CLEANER, PURCHASE OF
- 10 CLEANER VEHICLES WITH PROVISIONS TO MITIGATE FOR THOSE IMPACTS
- 11 ON LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? OKAY. AND THESE
- 12 LAST FEW ITEMS ON THE STATE SIDE, CLIMATE ADAPTATION. WE HAD
- 13 SOME CONVERSATIONS THIS YEAR WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER MULLEN. HE
- 14 HAD A BILL THAT WAS FOCUSED ON KIND OF CREATING A FRAMEWORK
- 15 FOR CLIMATE ADAPTATION AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. AND SO WE WANT
- 16 TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON THAT. I'D SAY BROADLY SPEAKING WE THINK
- 17 THAT MTC/ABAG HAS AN IMPORTANT ROLE TO PLAY IN CLIMATE
- 18 ADAPTATION; AND WE'D LIKE TO SEE -- WE'D LIKE TO BUILD ON OUR
- 19 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES STRATEGY AS A WAY FOR THE REGION TO DO
- 20 CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING AND NOT STAND IN THE WAY OF LOCAL
- 21 ADAPTATION WORK, WHICH IS CRITICAL. BUT MAKE SURE THAT ANY
- 22 STATE MANDATES AND STATE RESOURCES CAN REALLY SUPPLEMENT THE
- 23 WORK THAT'S ALREADY GOING ON. ITEM 9A IS ACTUALLY NOT AN
- 24 ENTIRELY NEW ITEM, BUT WE'RE KIND OF HONING IN WITH A LITTLE
- 25 BIT MORE SPECIFICITY. SO AT THE STATE LEVEL, THERE WAS A ZERO



- 1 TRAFFIC FATALITIES TASKFORCE. MTC PARTICIPATED IN IT. AND WE'D
- 2 LIKE TO SEE SOME LEGISLATION INTRODUCED TO HELP IMPLEMENT SOME
- 3 OF THE KEY RECOMMENDATIONS HERE. ONE OF THOSE IS MODIFYING THE
- 4 85TH PERCENTILE METHODOLOGY FOR DETERMINING SPEED LIMIT. THIS
- 5 IS SOMETHING THAT MANY OTHER STATES HAVE DONE. IT'S WIDELY
- 6 VIEWED AS KIND OF A BARRIER TO REDUCING SPEEDS. AND THEN WE'D
- 7 LIKE TO SUPPORT AUTHORIZATION OF AUTOMATED SPEED ENFORCEMENT
- 8 IN SPECIFIED AREAS IF THAT'S SOMETHING THAT LOCAL
- 9 JURISDICTIONS WANT TO PURSUE TO REALLY GET AT WHAT TENDS TO BE
- 10 A FEW LOCATIONS THAT ARE THE MOST DANGEROUS. AND IT HAS BEEN A
- 11 PROVEN TOOL ELSEWHERE. AND THEN, LASTLY, ON THE STATE SIDE, WE
- 12 WOULD LIKE TO ENGAGE IN CONVERSATIONS WITH OTHER LOCAL
- 13 ASSOCIATIONS. WE DON'T PLAN TO LEAD ON THIS, BUT WE THINK THAT
- 14 COVID-19 HAS ALLOWED US TO TRY LOTS OF NEW STRATEGIES TO MEET
- 15 OBVIOUSLY VIRTUALLY AND THAT SOME OF THOSE WOULD BE BENEFICIAL
- 16 TO HAVE AS OPTIONS EVEN AFTER SHELTER IN PLACE IS LIFTED. AN
- 17 EXAMPLE WOULD BE THE RIGIDITY OF COMPLYING WITH THE BROWN ACT
- 18 BUT CALLING INTO A MEETING. RIGHT NOW YOU HAVE TO PROVIDE I
- 19 THINK LIKE 72-HOUR NOTICE OF THAT. YOU HAVE TO IDENTIFY THE
- 20 LOCATION THAT YOU'RE CALLING IN FROM. IT HAS TO BE OPEN TO THE
- 21 PUBLIC. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE THINK IS, YOU KNOW, COULD USE
- 22 TO BE UPDATED. AND SO WE'D LIKE TO WORK WITH PARTNER AGENCIES
- 23 ON SOME BROWN ACT REFORMS. SO, I DO HAVE A FEW ITEMS ON THE
- 24 FEDERAL SIDE, BUT I FEEL LIKE I'VE BEEN TALKING FOR A WHILE SO



I'M HAPPY TO PAUSE THERE. RANDI, IF YOU WANT TO SEE IF THERE'S 1 2 ANY QUESTIONS? 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. THERE ARE SEVERAL HAPPENED RAISED. 4 5 I'M GOING TO JUMP REAL OUICK BACK INTO THE CEOA ISSUE. I THINK THAT EVERYBODY'S CEQA OPINIONS ARE VALID. HOWEVER, THIS IS NOT 6 THE FORMAT FOR US DISCUSSING. SO ANYBODY WHO'S RAISED A HAND 7 8 AND WANTS TO TALK CEQA, PUT YOUR HAND BACK DOWN. BUT SEND YOUR -- BECAUSE CHIRAG ASKED YOU SPECIFICALLY FOR WHERE YOU THOUGHT 9 LEGISLATIVE PROBLEMS COULD ARISE DURING THE IMPLEMENTATION 10 PHASE AND WHETHER YOU FEEL STRONGLY ONE WAY OR ANOTHER ABOUT 11 CEOA, THAT INFORMATION NEEDS TO FEED INTO THAT VENUE OVER 12 THERE BECAUSE THERE ARE NO CEQA ISSUES ON OUR AGENDA RIGHT 13 NOW. BUT I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE WAS A PLACE FOR YOU. 14 15 AND NEITHER OF THOSE PEOPLE, GO AHEAD --16 17 18 >>SPEAKER: REBECCA LONG: I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, WE DID HAVE 19 CEOA ON HERE. I DIDN'T DRAW ATTENTION TO IT BECAUSE IT WAS IN 20 21 OUR AGENDA LAST YEAR, AS WELL, OR THE CURRENT YEAR, BUT ITEM 4B DOES SAY BUILDING ON THE SUCCESSES OF S.B.288, MONITOR AND 22 ENGAGE ON LEGISLATION RELATED TO CEOA WITH THE GOAL OF 23 ACCELERATING TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS 24 CONSISTENT WITH LOCAL AND REGIONAL PLANS WITHOUT DIMINISHING 25



- 1 ENVIRONMENTAL SAFEGUARDS. SO THAT IS IN OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM.
- 2 SO I'M OPEN TO FEEDBACK ON THAT.

3

- 4 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. AND ANOTHER PLACE TO PUT IT, WHICH I THINK
- 5 IS REALLY APPROPRIATE, IS IN THAT IMPLEMENTATION BECAUSE THAT
- 6 COVERS EVERYTHING THAT WE DO. IT'S KNOW THE IN THE
- 7 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, REBECCA CAN'T WORK ON IT. SO THAT'S HOW I
- 8 LOOK AT IT. SO IF WE'RE GOING TO GO FIRST. I WANT EVERYBODY TO
- 9 CONFINE THEIR STATEMENTS OR QUESTIONS TO WHAT WAS REQUESTED OF
- 10 YOU. WHAT'S MISSING? WHAT DO YOU SUPPORT? AND WE'LL START WITH
- 11 ADINA AND THEN RICH HEDGES. ADINA GO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

- 13 ADINA LEVIN: SO GLAD TO SEE TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING HERE AS
- 14 A PRIORITY IN ORDER TO RECOVER FROM THE COVID-19 CATASTROPHE
- 15 ON TRANSIT BUDGETS AND PROVIDE SERVICE FOR TRANSIT DEPENDENT
- 16 PEOPLE AND ANYBODY WHO WANTS ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE
- 17 CHOICES THAT ARE NOT DRIVING CARS. IN TERMS OF HAVING THE
- 18 REGIONAL MEASURE AND THE MTC BEING SUPPORTIVE OF THAT, IT
- 19 WOULD BE REALLY FANTASTIC TO HAVE THE MTC SERVE AS A PUBLIC
- 20 OWNER AND A PUBLIC CONVENER OF A MULTISTAKEHOLDER PROCESS. I
- 21 THINK THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE REALLY HEALTHY AND
- 22 IMPORTANT FOR BUILDING A MULTISTAKEHOLDER CROSS SECTOR, CROSS-
- 23 REGION SUPPORT. TWO-THIRDS IS ALWAYS REALLY HARD. AND,
- 24 THEREFORE, HAVING A PUBLIC PROCESS THAT CAN HAVE PUBLIC INPUT
- 25 WITH A PUBLIC LEADER IS THE WAY THAT CAN HAVE THE MOST



- 1 CREDIBILITY AND REALLY BUILD STRONG SUPPORT FOR SOMETHING THAT
- 2 CAN PASS. LET ME LOOK AT MY NOTES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
- 3 LOOKING AT THE POTENTIAL FOR BROWN ACT REFORM. LEARNING FROM
- 4 SOME OF THE LESSONS FROM COVID, FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC,
- 5 IT'S SOMETHING THAT IS JUST SO MUCH EASIER FOR PEOPLE TO BE
- 6 ABLE TO COMMENT ON, FOR EXAMPLE, A BOARD MEETING WITHOUT
- 7 PEOPLE WHO ARE FAR FROM OAKLAND TO TREK TO OAKLAND. SO I THINK
- 8 THAT THERE'S SOME GOOD LESSONS AND I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT ON THE
- 9 AGENDA. AT THE RISK OF WADING INTO THE CEQA ISSUE, I THINK
- 10 THAT HAVING CEQA PROTECT THE ENVIRONMENT AND NOT HAVE
- 11 POLLUTING POWER PLANTS IN NEIGHBORHOODS IS REALLY IMPORTANT.
- 12 BUT ALSO BEING ABLE TO HAVE ENVIRONMENTALLY BENEFICIAL
- 13 PROJECTS LIKE BIKE LANES BE ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD SPEEDILY
- 14 WITHOUT -- LIKE MY BRAIN REALLY STRUGGLES WITH THE IDEA THAT
- 15 THERE IS AN ENVIRONMENTAL CONCERN WITH A BIKE LANE. AND THERE
- 16 ARE CERTAINLY PUBLIC PROCESS CONCERNS ABOUT BIKE LANES THAT
- 17 NEED TO BE ADDRESSED. BUT USING CEQA TO ADDRESS AND SLOW DOWN
- 18 A BIKE LANE SEEMS KIND OF LIKE A STRETCH. SO I WAS ONE OF THE
- 19 PEOPLE WHO WAS VERY HAPPY TO SEE S.B.288 PASS. THANK YOU.

21 CHAIR KINMAN: SO BEFORE I CALL ON RICH HEDGES, I'M GOING TO

- 22 AGAIN -- WE ARE GOING TO BE FOLLOWING CEQA PROPOSALS. THAT IS
- 23 ON OUR AGENDA. I DON'T WANT US TO GO INTO A BACK AND FORTH FOR
- 24 ALL THE HANDS I'M SEEING RAISED UP HERE ON WHY WE LIKE IT, WHY
- 25 WE DON'T. SO JUST KNOW THAT IT'S ON OUR AGENDA. I WANT YOU TO



- 1 ADDRESS THE OTHER THINGS THAT ARE IN THIS DOCUMENT RIGHT NOW.
- 2 NO PROBLEM, ADINA, I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT I DIDN'T
- 3 HAVE 17 SPEECHES COMING UP. RICH HEDGES?

4

- 5 RICHARD HEDGES: YES, THANK YOU. THREE COMMENTS. THE FIRST IS
- 6 QUESTION. ONE OF THE MEETINGS I ATTENDED TALKING ABOUT FUNDING
- 7 LISTED SEVERAL POSSIBLE AREAS TO GET FUNDING FOR MTC PROJECTS.
- 8 ONE OF THEM WAS UP TO TENS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS FROM THE
- 9 LOCAL COUNTY SALES TAXES THAT WERE PASSED. I'M NOT QUITE SURE
- 10 WHY THAT WAS THERE. I KNOW IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, THE THREE
- 11 MEASURES, RR, W, AND A ALL HAVE TRANCHES THAT WERE SET UP FOR
- 12 THAT MONEY THAT CAN'T BE REVERSED. SO I DON'T SEE -- AND I
- 13 IMAGINE THE OTHER COUNTIES, SELF-HELP COUNTIES HAVE THE SAME
- 14 THING. I WONDER HOW MTC THOUGHT IT COULD LEVERAGE THAT MONEY
- 15 FOR OTHER PROJECTS. THE OTHER ISSUE IS THE 85 PERCENTILE WITH
- 16 THE STATE. I'M E VERY SUPPORTIVE OF CHANGES. THERE'S ONE
- 17 STREET CALLED -- WHERE THE SPEED LIMIT WAS RAISED WHILE THERE
- 18 WERE 2,000 UNITS OF HOUSING ON THE AGENDA TO GO ALONG THAT
- 19 BLOCK AND A BLOCK NORTH AND SOUTH OF IT. AND ALREADY WITH
- 20 HOUSES BEING BUILT AND ANOTHER 960 HAVE ACTUALLY BEEN APPROVED
- 21 AND NOT STARTED YET, IT MAKES NO SENSE TO RAISE SPEED LIMITS
- 22 IN AREAS LIKE THAT. AND IF I CAN MAKE ONE JUST THAT I'M IN
- 23 FAVOR OF THE CEQA, CAN I DO THAT?

24

25 CHAIR KINMAN: NO. I ASKED THAT WE DIDN'T.





1 2 RICHARD HEDGES: I WOULDN'T SURE WHETHER I COULD GIVE A SHORT 3 SENTENCE. 4 5 CHAIR KINMAN: HERE'S WHERE WE STAND ON CEOA. REBECCA WILL GIVE US DISCUSSIONS, YES, NO, UP, DOWN, WE NEVER WANT TO SEE IT 6 7 AGAIN. 8 RICHARD HEDGES: HE ASKED PERMISSION. THAT'S ALL. 9 10 CHAIR KINMAN: WENDY AND THEN VEDA. 11 12 WENDY KALLINS: . OKAY. GOING BACK TO THE DOCUMENT I'M JUST 13 PUTTING IT IN FRONT OF ME THERE. THERE WERE A COUPLE THINGS 14 YOU DIDN'T HIGHLIGHT THAT I WANTED TO COMMENT ON. UNDER 15 16 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING B, WHAT YOU DIDN'T HIGHLIGHT BUT THERE'S A LOT OF DISCUSSION AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC 17 TRANSPORTATION JUST MADE A PRESENTATION TO THE BLUE RIBBON 18 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASKFORCE ABOUT SOME OPTIONS FOR FUNDING. SO 19 IT SEEMS LIKE THE PROCESS IS ALREADY REALLY -- THERE'S ALREADY 20 21 TALK ABOUT PUTTING TOGETHER THAT HIGH-LEVEL TASKFORCE TO COME UP WITH NEW FUNDING SOURCES. I THINK IT'S KIND OF OBVIOUS AT 22 23 THIS POINT THAT THERE'S SALES TAX FATIGUE GOING ON. I KNOW SOME MEASURES DID PASS. BUT I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT SOME 24

ALTERNATIVE FUNDING SOURCES FOR THAT. JUST REAL QUICKLY UNDER



F, ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, WHENEVER WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ACTIVE 1 2 TRANSPORTATION, I REALLY WISH YOU WOULD INCLUDE SAFE ROUTES TO 3 SCHOOLS IN THAT, AS WELL, BECAUSE THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PIECE OF ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. AND WE'RE ALWAYS NEEDING FUNDING. WE'RE 4 5 OFTENTIMES HAVING TO COMPETE WITH ADULT ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS. AND IT ALWAYS WORKED A WHOLE LOT BETTER WHEN SAFE 6 ROUTES TO SCHOOLS HAS ITS OWN POT OF MONEY. AND THEN JUST 7 8 ECHOING RICHARD ON 85TH PERCENTILE SICK TIME TO HERE WITH 85TH PERCENTILE THAT THIS IS SOME KIND OF REASONABLE AND LOGICAL 9 IDEA BECAUSE 85 PERCENT OF THE PEOPLE ARE SPEEDING WE SHOULD 10 LET THEM. I KNOW THAT THERE IS A LOT OF INDUSTRY OPPOSITION TO 11 GETTING RID OF IT ALTOGETHER, BUT I'M WONDERING WHAT KIND OF 12 CHANGES ARE BEING PROPOSED? ARE THEY SIGNIFICANT? AND IS THERE 13 ANY HOPE TO JUST REALLY DEVELOPING A WHOLE NEW WAY OF 14 15 EVALUATING SPEED LIMITS THAT IS RATIONAL AND ACTUALLY TAKES 16 INTO ACCOUNT ACTUAL SAFETY OF ALL USERS ON THE STREET. 17 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU, WENDY. VEDA IS NEXT? 18 19 WENDY KALLINS: THAT WAS A OUESTION. 20 21 22 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. 23

REBECCA LONG: I WASN'T SURE IF I SHOULD ANSWER NOW. THANK

YOU, WENDY, FOR THE FEEDBACK. I'M NOT THE EXPERT ON WHAT WAS

24



- 1 PROPOSED IN THAT ZERO TRAFFIC FATALITIES REPORT. I THINK IT'S
- 2 BASED ON JUST LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES AROUND METRICS, YOU
- 3 KNOW, WHAT IS THE SITUATION IN ANY GIVEN AREA. SO TO RICH'S
- 4 EXAMPLE, IF IT'S A HIGHLY CONCENTRATED RESIDENTIAL AREA, THEN
- 5 THERE SHOULD BE CERTAIN SPEED LIMITS WOULD BE APPROPRIATE. SO
- 6 I THINK IT IS A NEW PARADIGM THAT I CAN'T SPEAK AT THIS TIME
- 7 TO EXACTLY WHAT THAT WOULD LOOK LIKE.

8

- 9 WENDY KALLINS: ALL RIGHT. IT LOOKS LIKE THERE'S A LINK THERE
- 10 TO THE TASKFORCE SO I CAN LOOK IT UP.

11

12 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. VEDA AND THEN WALTER.

13

- 14 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU, REBECCA FOR COMING. LEGISLATION IS MY
- 15 FORTE SO IT'S REALLY FUN FOR ME TO SEE WHAT YOU'RE TOYING. I
- 16 WANTED TO GIVE YOU -- DOING. I WANTED TO GIVE YOU KUDOS FOR 1
- 17 D. ZERO EMISSIONS BUS MANDATE. I THINK THAT'S JUST GREAT THAT
- 18 YOU'VE GOT THAT ON THE LIST AND YOU'RE MOVING THAT FORWARD. MY
- 19 CONCERN IS ITEM 1 E, EQUITY ACCESS TO TRANSPORTATION. WELL, IF
- 20 EQUITY IS REALLY OUR FOCUS AND SOMETHING THAT WE'RE WEAVING
- 21 IN, THIS ITEM 1E SHOULD BE HIGHLIGHTED AS A PRIORITY. AND I
- 22 WOULD URGE YOU TO LOOK AT THAT AND RECONSIDER YOUR HIGHLIGHTED
- 23 AREAS. I'D LIKE TO MOVE OVER TO ITEM HOUSING 3C.



- 1 REBECCA LONG: I WANT A OUICK RESPONSE TO THAT. I DON'T WANT
- 2 PEOPLE TO MISUNDERSTAND. THE HIGHLIGHTS WEREN'T SO MUCH THAT
- 3 THOSE WERE THE PRIORITIES. JUST THOSE ARE WHERE THERE WERE
- 4 CHANGES. THE ITEM WASN'T THERE AT ALL THE PRIOR YEAR. SO WE
- 5 DID HAVE THIS IN THE PROGRAM LAST YEAR, THE 2020 ADVOCACY
- 6 PROGRAM. THAT'S THE ONLY REASON WHY IT'S NOT HIGHLIGHTED.
- 8 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU. IF YOU COULD MAKE IT A PRIORITY, I
- 9 WOULD APPRECIATE IT.
- 11 **SPEAKER:** YEAH.

7

10

- 13 VEDA FLOREZ: AND MOVING ON TO HOUSING ITEM 3C, BAY AREA -- NO.
- 14 3D. PARDON ME. HOMELESSNESS PREVENTION. AND I THINK IT'S
- 15 IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT POVERTY AS PART OF THIS BECAUSE A PORTION
- 16 OF THOSE WHO FIND THEMSELVES HOMELESS ARE -- HAVE MENTAL
- 17 ILLNESS AND OTHER HEALTH ISSUES. HOWEVER, THE MAJORITY OF
- 18 THOSE THAT FIND THEMSELVES HOMELESS ARE THERE BECAUSE THEY'RE
- 19 POOR. SO WE CAN ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS, CANNOT ADDRESS
- 20 HOMELESSNESS IF WE DON'T LOOK AT POVERTY IN CONNECTION. SO
- 21 THAT'S WHAT I'D LIKE TO SAY ABOUT THAT. AND THEN MOVING ON TO
- 22 ITEM NUMBER 10 REGARDING THE BROWN ACT, I THINK THAT IT'S
- 23 REALLY OPPOSES GOOD GOVERNMENT TO TRY AND REFORM THIS. 72
- 24 HOURS IS NEEDED, ESPECIALLY DURING COVID-19, FOR THE COMMUNITY
- 25 TO PAY ATTENTION AND ACTUALLY FIND THINGS ON THE WEBSITE. I



- 1 KNOW THAT YOU'VE REALLY IMPROVED THE WEBSITE; HOWEVER, IT'S
- 2 STILL A LITTLE UN-USER FRIENDLY FOR THOSE OF US WHO HAVE NOT
- 3 EXPERIENCED THE MTC WAY OF LIFE. I JUST THINK ITEM NUMBER 10
- 4 GOES AGAINST GOOD GOVERNANCE. AND PLEASE TAKE A SECOND LOOK AT
- 5 THIS. AND THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS FOR TODAY. THANK YOU.

6

7 SPEAKER: THANK YOU.

8

9 CHAIR KINMAN: WALTER AND THEN MARC MADDEN.

10

- 11 WALTER WILSON: SO I HAVE A COUPLE OF THINGS. FIRST ABOUT CEQA.
- 12 NO, JUST JOKING.

13

14 CHAIR KINMAN: KNEW YOU WERE GOING TO DO THAT.

15

- 16 WALTER WILSON: HEY, THERE'S SOME THINGS TO BE SAID ABOUT THAT.
- 17 BUT ANYWAY.

18

19 CHAIR KINMAN: THERE ARE LOTS OF THINGS.

- 21 WALTER WILSON: SO, REBECCA, I DON'T KNOW WHAT NUMBER THIS IS
- 22 BUT YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT ADD THE ADMINISTRATIVE FEES THAT
- 23 YOU THOUGHT THE STATE WAS BEING HEAVY-HANDED ON. CAN YOU
- 24 EXPOUND ON THAT? CAN YOU SAY WHY THAT'S A WASTE OF MONEY? IF
- 25 IT GOES AWAY, HOW ARE THOSE SERVICES GOING TO BE GIVEN TO THE



9

11

15

November 17, 2020

- 1 TRANSIT AGENCIES GOING TO BE REPLACED WITHOUT THE USE OF THOSE
- 2 FUNDS? THE OTHER THING I WANTED TO TALK ABOUT WAS THE CLIMATE
- 3 PROGRAM YOU TALKED ABOUT AND PARTICULARLY TELECOMMUTING. NOW,
- 4 I MISSED THE LAST MEETING, BUT I KNOW THAT SINCE THE ADVISORY
- 5 BOARD CAME OUT, OR THE BOARD, MTC CAME OUT WITH THEIR PLAN FOR
- 6 TELECOMMUTING, IT WAS A BIG BLOW CERTAINLY WITH SAN FRANCISCO
- 7 AND SAN JOSE. DID WE HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT AT THE LAST
- 8 ONE AND DID WE TAKE ANY POSITION WHATSOEVER?

10 CHAIR KINMAN: NO, WE DID NOT. THIS COMMITTEE DID NOT.

- 12 WALTER WILSON: DO WE INTEND TO HAVE SOME DISCUSSION? BECAUSE
- 13 IT SOUNDS LIKE WE NEED TO SUPPORT THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS. AND
- 14 THERE'S A LOT OF POLITICS GOING ON AROUND IT.
- 16 CHAIR KINMAN: I BELIEVE THAT REBECCA CAN CORRECT ME IF I'M
- 17 WRONG. THERE'S ALWAYS A LOT OF POLITICS GOING AROUND ANYTHING,
- 18 ESPECIALLY THIS. BUT THAT DID NOT COME TO US AS PART OF
- 19 ANYTHING THAT WE DISCUSSED. AND IT'S NOW BEING REVAMPED AND
- 20 CHANGED. AND I EXPECT TO BRING IT TO THIS BODY. IT'S PART OF
- 21 WHAT'S BEING STUDIED AMONG THE 35 OR SO STRATEGIES. BUT
- 22 REBECCA, GO AHEAD.
- 24 WALTER WILSON: HOLD UP, RANDI. BASED ON WHAT REBECCA IS
- 25 TELLING US TO SUPPORT RECOMMENDATIONS, SOUNDS LIKE SHE'S



1

November 17, 2020

SAYING SUPPORT THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ALREADY HAVE BEEN

PUT FORTH AND NOT WHAT'S COMING NEXT. BUT SHE'S HERE. 2 3 CHAIR KINMAN: LET'S LET REBECCA CLEAR IT UP. 4 5 SPEAKER: OKAY. I'M A LITTLE CONFUSED BECAUSE I DON'T REMEMBER 6 TALKING ABOUT THE TELECOMMUTE PIECE. SO LET ME DO MY BEST TO 7 8 CLARIFY. SO THAT TELECOMMUTE MANDATE THAT WAS IN THE ORIGINAL PROPOSED PLAN BAY AREA BLUEPRINT WAS A STRATEGY FOR PLAN BAY 9 10 AREA THAT WOULD HAVE REQUIRED LEGISLATION. BUT WAY IN THE FUTURE BECAUSE IT WASN'T ASSUMED TO TAKE EFFECT UNTIL 2035. 11 THERE WAS, AS YOU KNOW, A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF PUSHBACK ON 12 THAT. SO WHAT'S HAPPENING NOW ON FRIDAY IS THE COMMISSION IS 13 LOOKING AT A REVISED STRATEGY FOR THE PLAN THAT WILL BE, YOU 14 15 KNOW, MANY DIFFERENT WAYS OF REDUCING AUTO TRIPS. SO NOT JUST 16 TELECOMMUTE BUT BASICALLY REQUIRING EMPLOYERS TO FIGURE OUT, 17 HOWEVER THEY CAN, HOW DO YOU GET LESS PEOPLE DRIVING TO WORK SO THAT YOU HAVE I THINK IT'S A MAXIMUM OF 40 PERCENT OF YOUR 18

- 23 TO SACRAMENTO AND REVISE OUR EXISTING COMMUTER BENEFIT
- 24 PROGRAM, WHICH SOME OF YOU, RANDI, I THINK YOU WERE ON THE

WORKFORCE IS COMING IN A SINGLE AUTO. SO THAT'S THE REVISED

PROPOSAL FOR THE PLAN. BUT IT DOESN'T REALLY TIE BACK TO MY

WORK BECAUSE MY WORK IS LIKE: WHAT ARE WE DOING NEXT YEAR? AND

AT SOME POINT IF WE WANT THAT TO BE REAL, WE WITH NEED TO GO

25 COUNCIL WHEN WE ACTUALLY GOT THAT AUTHORIZED. BUT RIGHT NOW

19

20

21



- 1 IT'S A PRETTY, YOU KNOW, LET'S JUST SAY IT'S PRETTY EASY TO
- 2 COMPLY. MANY EMPLOYERS SIMPLY OFFER PRETAX TRANSIT. SO THE
- 3 PROPOSAL THAT THE COMMISSION'S LOOKING AT ON FRIDAY WOULD BE A
- 4 MUCH BEEFED UP VERSION OF THAT COMMUTER BENEFIT PROGRAM. DOES
- 5 THAT HELP?

6

7 WALTER WILSON: YEAH, IT DOES.

8

9 SPEAKER: OKAY, GREAT.

10

- 11 CHAIR KINMAN: WALTER, JUST TO ADDRESS WHY HAVEN'T, YOU DIDN'T
- 12 MISS ANYTHING BECAUSE I DID THE SAME THING. I WAS LIKE WHAT
- 13 DID I MISS THAT THIS CONVERSATION HAPPENED AT THAT
- 14 ANTAGONISTIC LEVEL AT THE COMMISSION AND WE DIDN'T HAVE ANY
- 15 CONVERSATION ABOUT IT. BECAUSE IT'S A LONG-TERM STRATEGY, I'M
- 16 GOING TO LET THEM DUKE IT AROUND FOR ANOTHER MONTH AND BRING
- 17 IT BACK TO US AFTER THE FIRST OF THE YEAR SO THAT WE'RE
- 18 ACTUALLY INFORMED ABOUT WHAT THEY'RE DISCUSSING. BUT RIGHT NOW
- 19 I'M SEEING JUST A LOT OF CHANGES BEING MADE. AND EVEN THOUGH
- 20 IT'S BEING ADOPTED AS A STRATEGY, IT'S A IN 2035 STRATEGY THIS
- 21 IS WHAT OUR GOAL IS, WHICH MEANS THAT WE HAVE TIME RIGHT NOW
- 22 TO SAY LET'S DEAL WITH THE IMMEDIATE NEEDS AND WE CAN PUT THAT
- 23 BACK INTO OUR DISCUSSION.



- 1 WALTER WILSON: BUT HERE'S THE INTERESTING THING ABOUT THAT.
- 2 THEY CAN'T LEGISLATE THIS. THEY CAN'T TELL COMPANIES WHO THEY
- 3 CAN LEAVE AT HOME. COMPANIES ARE DOING THIS, ANYWAY. THE
- 4 LARGEST COMPANIES IN THE COUNTRY ARE PUTTING 30, 40, 50
- 5 PERCENT OF THEIR PEOPLE TO STAY HOME AFTER COVID.

6

7 CHAIR KINMAN: THAT'S A -- YEAH.

8

9 WALTER WILSON: NOTHING WE CAN DO ABOUT THAT.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: RIGHT. THIS GETS BACK TO THE YOU'LL INDULGE ME FOR
- 12 ONE SECOND, RANDI, IT GETS BACK TO KIND OF WHAT I WAS TALKING
- 13 ABOUT WITH THE S.B.375 AND THE WAY WE HAVE TO TRY TO GET
- 14 CREDIT FOR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS SO THAT IF COMPANIES ARE
- 15 DOING IT VOLUNTARILY, WE DON'T GET ANY CREDIT. SO WE HAVE TO
- 16 SAY: WE ARE MANDATING THIS NEW POLICY IN ORDER TO SAY WE GET
- 17 THOSE EMISSION REDUCTIONS. INSTEAD OF LIKE WHY DOES THAT
- 18 MATTER? WHY IS IT ABOUT US GETTING CREDIT? DON'T WE WANT TO
- 19 GET TO SAME GOAL?

20

21 WALTER WILSON: CHEAPER TO STAY AT HOME.

22

23 CHAIR KINMAN: ANYTHING ELSE WALT EAR?



SPEAKER: I DID WANT TO RESPOND TO WALTER'S OTHER OUICK 1 2 QUESTION. 3 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY. 4 5 WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU. 6 7 8 SO WITHOUT GETTING TOO INTO THE WEEDS, SO THIS DEALS WITH CALTRANS. SO CALTRANS OWNS THE STATE HIGHWAY SYSTEM BUT MTC 9 BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY WE ADMINISTER THE TOLL COLLECTION AND 10 SO WE ALSO ASSUME RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE MAINTENANCE OF THE 11 BRIDGES. BUT CALTRANS CHARGES US AS AN EXAMPLE 26 PERCENT 12 ADMINISTRATIVE OVERHEAD TO DO ANY OF THAT WORK. AND SO WE PAY 13 THEM ALREADY AN ADDITIONAL PROGRAM OVERHEAD OF ABOUT 25 14 PERCENT. AND ON TOP OF THAT, WE HAVE TO PAY AN ADDITIONAL 25 15 16 PERCENT. SO WE JUST THINK THAT THEY HAVE PROVIDED SOME REDUCED RATES FOR THE SELF-HELP COUNTIES. AND WE THINK IT'S 17 APPROPRIATE THAT THEY DO THE SAME FOR THE BAY AREA TOLL 18 AUTHORITY. THAT WOULD COME FROM THE CALTRANS BUDGET. SO WE 19 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING THEY WOULD NEED TO ABSORB. 20 BUT WE THINK RIGHT NOW THEY'RE DOING IT ON THE BACK OF THE 21 22 TOLL PAYER. AND GIVEN THE REDUCED TOLL REVENUE FROM COVID AND EVERYTHING ELSE, WE ARE LOOKING FOR SOME COST SAVINGS.

23



- 1 WALTER WILSON: DO YOU SEE IT AS BLOAT FOR CALTRANS? I MEAN, IS
- 2 THAT MONEY ACTUALLY GOING TO SOMETHING THAT'S USEFUL? IS IT
- 3 COMING BACK TO US? OR IT'S SOMETHING THAT THEY ABSOLUTELY HAVE
- 4 TO HAVE?

5

- 6 SPEAKER: IT'S ALL ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW DO YOU DEPLOY YOUR
- 7 RESOURCES? I'M SURE THEY WOULD SAY THAT THEY NEED EVERY PENNY.
- 8 BUT WE WOULD DISAGREE.

9

10 WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY, THANK YOU. MARK AND THEN RICK COATES.

13

- 14 MARC MADDEN: ONE QUESTION, PLEASE, WHICH IS TO REBECCA.
- 15 SPEAKING EXACTLY ABOUT NEXT YEAR, BUT REFERRING BACK TO THE
- 16 RESULTS OF THE NOVEMBER ELECTION WHERE PROPOSITION 15 FAILED.
- 17 DO YOU ANTICIPATE THAT THE LEGISLATURE WILL THINK ABOUT AND
- 18 ACT TO KNOW THE -- AND/OR DO YOU THINK PROPOSITION 15 WILL
- 19 RETURN ON ANOTHER BALLOT MEASURE CONSIDERING THE VAST
- 20 IMPLICATION OF FUNDING?

- 22 SPEAKER: YOU'RE JUST ASKING FOR MY PREDICTION AT THE RISK OF
- 23 THROWING IT OUT THERE, I DOUBT THAT THE LEGISLATURE WILL
- 24 ATTEMPT TO RE-VISIT BASICALLY PROP 13 REFORM. I THINK THEY
- 25 WILL HAVE THEIR HANDS FULL JUST BALANCING THE BUDGET. EVEN



- 1 THOUGH IT GOT RELATIVELY CLOSE. THERE WAS STRONG SUPPORT.
- 2 OBVIOUSLY, IT WASN'T ENOUGH TO CARRY THE DAY. I THINK
- 3 GENERALLY THE LEGISLATURE'S BEEN MORE CONSERVATIVE ON THIS
- 4 THAN THE ADVOCATES. SO IT ALSO REQUIRES, I MIGHT ADD, A
- 5 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT; RIGHT? AND SO THAT HAS TO PASS THE
- 6 LEGISLATURE BY TWO-THIRDS VOTE.
- 8 MARC MADDEN: WHICH LEADS ME TO ASK ANOTHER QUESTION. HAS THE
- 9 COMPOSITION OF THE LEGISLATURE CHANGED SUFFICIENTLY SINCE THIS
- 10 ELECTION?

7

11

16

18

- 12 SPEAKER: I THINK THAT'S A QUESTION. I THINK THEY HAVE PICKED
- 13 UP A FEW REPUBLICAN SEATS PARTICULARLY IN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA,
- 14 YES. NOT IN THE BAY AREA, NO CHANGE IN TERMS OF THE PARTY'S
- 15 CONTROL HERE.
- 17 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. RICK COATES?
- 19 RICK COATES: YES. JUST SO EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT I'M NOT ALWAYS
- 20 NEGATIVE HERE, I WANT TO VOICE MY SUPPORT FOR THE CHANGES THAT
- 21 YOU'VE MADE THAT WERE HIGHLIGHTED THERE. I THINK THAT THEY
- 22 WERE IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND I APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.
- 24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

25



CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO MOVE INTO PUBLIC 1 COMMENT. MARTI, ANYBODY WHO'S FROM THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO 2 3 SPEAK PLEASE RAISE YOUR LITTLE BLUE HAND OR HIT STAR 9. MARTI, WAS THERE ANY COMMENTS SUBMITTED? 4 5 MARTI PASCHAL: NO. NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED AND NO 6 7 HANDS ARE RAISED. 8 CHAIR KINMAN: OKAY, THANK YOU. ON THIS ITEM, I DO WANT TO 9 REITERATE AND EMPHASIZE THAT WE WILL BE DISCUSSING CEOA AS THE 10 ISSUES COME UP AND ARISE. I WILL ASK REBECCA ALSO THAT ANY 11 LEGISLATION THAT PROPOSES OR ANY PROPOSALS THAT COME THROUGH 12 CHANGING COMMERCIAL OR INDUSTRIAL LAND OR ALLOWING HOUSING TO 13 BE BUILT IN THOSE AREAS BE BROUGHT BACK TO US BECAUSE I'M FROM 14 15 SAN JOSE AND WE'RE UPSIDE DOWN ON OUR JOBS/HOUSING. AND IT 16 WOULD IMPACT SEVERAL COMMUNITIES EXTREMELY POORLY BECAUSE ONCE YOU MOVE HOUSES IN, YOU CAN'T MOVE THEM OUT. WE'RE RIGHT NOW 17 IN THE MIDDLE OF A DEBATE ABOUT AN AIRPORT THAT WE BUILT 18 AROUND. ON THE ISSUE OF BROWN ACT REFORM, I WOULD LIKE MTC IN 19 THE DISCUSSIONS TO BRING UP THE EQUITY COMPONENT OF BEING 20 21 AVAILABLE TO ATTEND MEETINGS WHETHER YOU ARE APPOINTED TO THE BODY OR ELECTED TO THE BODY OR YOU ARE A PARTICIPANT IN THE 22 CONVERSATION BY CONTINUING TO HAVE THE ABILITY TO DO NOT IN-23 PERSON ATTENDANCE AT MEETINGS. SO THE REMOTE ATTENDANCE HAS 24

LIFTED UP. I THINK EVERYBODY WHO PARTICIPATES IN A PUBLIC BODY



- 1 HAS SEEN OUR ATTENDANCE GO UP IN THE AUDIENCE SUBSTANTIALLY.
- 2 AND I THINK THAT THAT'S A GOOD THING. SO THAT IS ONE COMPONENT
- 3 OF THE BROWN ACT THAT COULD BE ENHANCED. AND I THINK THAT
- 4 SINCE WE HAVE AN EQUITY PLATFORM, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT NEEDS
- 5 TO BE KIND OF LAID IN ONTO THAT. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO MOVE
- 6 ON TO BECAUSE WE ARE RUNNING LOW ON TIME. LET'S MOVE TO THE
- 7 NEXT ITEM THAT YOU HAVE. OR NO.

8

9 SPEAKER: I'M DONE.

10

- 11 CHAIR KINMAN: OH MY GOODNESS. THANK YOU OF THE THIS WAS GREAT.
- 12 OUR DISCUSSIONS ARE ALWAYS GOD. AND FEEL FREE TO LET ME KNOW
- 13 WHEN YOU WANT TO BRING MORE INDEPTH CONVERSATION TO ANY
- 14 PENDING LEGISLATION THAT'S COMING UP OR DISCUSSION.

15

- 16 SPEAKER: I APPRECIATE THAT. AND I WOULD ALSO JUST OFFER IF ANY
- 17 OF THE MEMBERS HAVE MORE DETAILED FEEDBACK THAT YOU'D LIKE TO
- 18 SEND MY WAY, FEEL FREE TO EMAIL ME. RLONG@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV.
- 19 THANK YOU.

20

- 21 CHAIR KINMAN: GREAT. THANK YOU, REBECCA. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE
- 22 INTO ITEM 11, STAFF LIAISON REPORT. MARTI.

- 24 MARTI PASCHAL: I HAVE NOTHING TO ADD TO MY REPORTS. NO PUBLIC
- 25 COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED AND NO HANDS ARE RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.



1 CHAIR KINMAN: DOES ANYBODY FROM THE COUNCIL HAVE ANY COMMENTS 2 3 ON THE STAFF REPORT? I'M GOING TO QUIZ YOU NEXT MONTH ON WHETHER YOU READ THE STAFF REPORTS JUST BECAUSE I'M A SCHOOL 4 5 TEACHER'S CHILD. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM 12, COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS. MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL REPORT IN LOCALLY RELEVANT 6 7 ISSUES OR EVENTS. I SEE RICH HEDGES. 8 RICHARD HEDGES: I JUST WANT TO REPORT ON MY CONCERN ABOUT 9 THERESE. I WOULD HATE TO LOSE HER. SHE WAS MY FAVORITE COMING 10 FROM L.A. SHE ACTUALLY WORKED AS THE ASSISTANT TO THE DIRECTOR 11 OF TRANSPORTATION UNDER THE OBAMA ADMINISTRATION FOR SIX 12 YEARS. AND WHEN HE RESIGNED RAN THE DEPARTMENT FOR TWO YEARS. 13 AND I'M VERY, VERY FEARFUL THAT, WHICH WOULD BE WONDERFUL FOR 14 15 HER, TO BECOME THE NEW HEAD OF THE DEPARTMENT OF 16 TRANSPORTATION. AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE BAD, ESPECIALLY WITH EVERYTHING THAT'S GOING ON NOW, FOR MTC SHE'S DONE A REALLY 17 GOOD JOB UNDER PRETTY ROUGH CONDITIONS WHEN SHE'S BEEN HERE. 18 THANK YOU. 19 20 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. RICK COATES AND THEN ADINA. 21 22 RICK COATES: YEAH, I JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT SONOMA COUNTY 23 PARKS DEPARTMENT HAS JUST ACQUIRED 300 ACRES NEAR THE SMALL 24

TOWN OF MONTY RIO WHICH WILL INCLUDE A SUBSTANTIAL LENGTH OF



BICYCLE TRAIL HELPING TO CONNECT TO THE RUSSIAN RIVER. THAT'S 1 2 ALL. 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. GOOD NEWS. ADINA? 4 5 ADINA LEVIN: YEAH, AT 5 O'CLOCK TOMORROW EVENING, THE REGIONAL 6 7 THINK TANK SPUR HAS AN EVENT ON FARE INTEGRATION. AND SO FOR 8 THOSE OF US THAT ARE INTERESTED IN THAT TOPIC, THAT'S GOING TO BE A GOOD ONLINE ZOOM EVENT. AND THEIR EVENTS ARE USUALLY 9 RECORDED IF YOU CANNOT MAKE IT AT THAT SAME TIME. 5 O'CLOCK 10 TOMORROW AT SPUR. FARE INTEGRATION. 11 12 CHAIR KINMAN: GREAT, THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER 13 COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS? I'M GOING TO REPORT FOR SOMETHING 14 15 DISAPPOINTING TO ME. I FOUGHT FOR 20 YEARS TO HAVE A SINGLE 16 STREET IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD AND ALL OF THE SURROUNDING NEIGHBORHOODS HAVE FOUGHT FOR THIS REDUCED TO HAVE BIKE LANES, 17 TWO-WAY LEFT TURN LANES, TO REDUCE THE FACT THAT KIDS KEEP 18 GETTING HIT ON THEIR WAY TO SCHOOL. WE HAD ONE MEMORABLE TWO-19 WE CAN PERIOD WHERE WE HAD A TOTAL OF FIVE INDIVIDUALS HIT 20 21 BECAUSE PEOPLE WERE RUNNING STOP SIGNS AND SIGNALS INCLUDING THE CROSSING GUARDS. SO OUT THERE WITH THEIR VESTS AND THEIR 22 23 SIGNS. AND BECAUSE OF A GLITCH IN THE PROGRAM, MY PROGRAM STARTED CONSTRUCTION THIS LAST MONTH AND I GOT REALLY EXCITED 24

AND WAS GOING TO COME TELL YOU HOW IT WAS GOING, BUT IT GOT



- 1 STALLED. SO I LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING IT BACK TO NEXT SPRING.
- 2 BUT IT JUST GOES TO SHOW THAT SOME OF THESE THINGS TAKE A
- 3 REALLY, REALLY LONG TIME. A LONG, LONG, LONG, LONG,
- 4 LONG TIME. SO WE WILL, MARTI, THERE'S NO INPUT FROM THE PUBLIC
- 5 ON COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS?

6

7 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I HAVE A COMMENT.

8

9 CHAIR KINMAN: VEDA, GO AHEAD.

10

- 11 VEDA FLOREZ: SORRY, MARTI. BEFORE WE CLOSE, I HAVE DIFFICULTY
- 12 RAISING MY HAND. MY LINE IS BAD TODAY. BUT I HOPE YOU ENJOY
- 13 THE BEACH IN MARIN COUNTY BEHIND ME. SO THAT BEING SAID, I
- 14 JUST WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT THERE IS A TOWN HALL MEETING
- 15 ON PLAN BAY AREA AND RHNA COMING UP ON SATURDAY THE 21ST IN
- 16 THE MORNING. AND IT'S THROUGH THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF
- 17 THE BAY AREA. SO THEY'RE GOING TALK ABOUT MANY OF THE ISSUES
- 18 THAT WE ENCOUNTER. AND IT WOULD BE GREAT IF THE PAC AND THE
- 19 PUBLIC COULD ATTEND THAT MEETING. AND I WILL SEND A LINK TO
- 20 MARTI TO SHARE WITH YOU ALL. BUT YOU CAN ALSO FIND MORE
- 21 INFORMATION ON THE FACEBOOK PAGE FOR THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN
- 22 VOTERS OF THE BAY AREA.



CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS? 1 MARTI, IS THERE PUBLIC INPUT, WRITTEN OR PEOPLE WAVING THEIR 2 3 HANDS? 4 5 MARTI PASCHAL: NO PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE SUBMITTED AND NO ONE IS RAISING THEIR HAND. 6 7 8 CHAIR KINMAN: THANK YOU. 9 WALTER WILSON: I HAVE A QUESTION. WHAT NEIGHBORHOOD DO YOU 10 11 LIVE IN? 12 CHAIR KINMAN: ME? I LIVE IN SHERMAN OAKS WHICH IS OVER BY SAN 13 14 JOSE CITY COLLEGE. 15 16 WALTER WILSON: I KNOW WHERE THAT IS, THANK YOU. 17 CHAIR KINMAN: I'LL TALK TO YOU OFFLINE ABOUT MY PROJECT. 18 19 WALTER WILSON: OKAY. 20 21 22 CHAIR KINMAN: ANY NEW BUSINESS FROM THE COUNCIL? GOING ONCE, 23 TWICE, THREE TIMES. MARTI, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC ABOUT INPUT ON NEW BUSINESS FOR THE COUNCIL? 24



MARTI PASCHAL: NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED AND NO HANDS 1 2 ARE RAISED. 3 CHAIR KINMAN: THAT BRINGS US TO THE END. AND THANK YOU. THIS 4 5 WAS A JAMPACKED MEETING, EVERYBODY. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATIONS THAT WE HAD. OUR NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY 6 7 ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 9TH, 8 2020, AT OUR USUAL TIME, 1:35 P.M. IT SAYS THAT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, WHICH WE KNOW 9 IS NOT GOING TO HAPPEN. OR REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST AS 10 APPROPRIATE DEPENDING UPON THE STATUS OF ANY SHELTER IN PLACE 11 ORDERS. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICE TODAY 12 THE PUBLIC. AND WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO, BEFORE I OFFICIALLY 13 SAY WE'RE ADJOURNED, SAY EVERYBODY PLEASE BE CAREFUL. PLEASE 14 HAVE A GOOD THANKSGIVING. I KNOW THIS HAS BEEN A TOUGH TEN 15 16 MONTHS OR SO, BUT WE CAN DO THIS. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING

YOU IN DECEMBER. AND OUR MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

18



Broadcasting Government