METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD



2	MONDAY, NOVEMBER 16, 2020, 1:35 PM
3	
4	
5	RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON. I WOULD LIKE
6	TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TOGETHER
7	FOR NOVEMBER 16TH, 2020. AND AT THIS POINT, I WOULD LIKE TO
8	REQUEST THAT THE BROADCAST TEAM ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE.
9	DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM
10	WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20
11	WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS
12	MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL
13	CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS
14	BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES
15	BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA
16	WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED
17	THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS
18	AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO
19	SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE,
20	AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
21	TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
22	DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
23	SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING
24	SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
25	RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL



9

12

14

16

19

21

23

25

November 16, 2020

- BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD,

 BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
- 3 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO,
- 4 AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM
- 5 ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR
- 6 ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE
- 7 IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM
- 8 EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.
- 10 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME, ED, I WOULD
- 11 LIKE TO CONDUCT A ROLL CALL PLEASE?
- 13 EDWARD MENG: THANK YOU. CHAIR RAMACIER?
- 15 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: HERE.
- 17 EDWARD MENG: VICE CHAIR POWERS? LOOK LIKE YOU'RE HERE. BUT
- 18 YOU'RE ON MUTE.
- 20 ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: SORRY. HERE.
- 22 EDWARD MENG: BOARD -- [INDISCERNIBLE]
- 24 SPEAKER: PRESENT. LOOKS LIKE BOARD MEMBER HARTNETT IS HERE.



1	JIM HARTNETT: HERE.
2	
3	EDWARD MENG: BOARD MEMBER HURSCH.
4	
5	MICHAEL HURSCH: HERE.
6	
7	EDWARD MENG: MCMILLAN?
8	
9	THERESE MCMILLAN: HERE.
10	
11	EDWARD MENG: THANKS. BOARD MEMBER MULLIGAN?
12	
13	DENNIS MULLIGAN: HERE.
14	
15	EDWARD MENG: BOARD MEMBER RANNELLS?
16	
17	NINA RANNELLS: HERE.
18	
19	EDWARD MENG: AND BOARD MEMBER TUMLIN?
20	
21	JEFFREY TUMLIN: HERE.
22	ODITION TOTAL TOTAL
	EDWADD MENC. WE HAVE A OHODIM
23	EDWARD MENG: WE HAVE A QUORUM.
24	



RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU ED. CAROL BEFORE WE MOVE ON I 1 UNDERSTAND WE NEED TO REMOVE ITEM 3A TODAY DO WE NEED TO DO 2 3 SOMETHING FORMALLY OR JUST DO THAT AS WE GET THERE? 4 5 CAROL KUESTER: I THINK WE JUST NEED TO AGREE TO DO THAT ISN'T THAT RIGHT LESLIE. DO WE NEED TO TAKE A VOTE ON THAT? 6 7 8 LESLIE MEISSNER, COUNSEL: I DON'T THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE VOTED ON, I THINK IT COULD JUST BE REMOVED AND HELD FOR A LATER 9 10 MEETING. 11 CAROL KUESTER: OKAY. YEAH. WE HAVE JUST GOT ONE OUTSTANDING 12 ITEM THAT WE NEED TO WORK. WE'RE HOPING TO BRING THAT BACK TO 13 14 THE DECEMBER MEETING RIGHT AROUND THE CORNER, DECEMBER 7TH. 15 16 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, I'LL SEEK A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR. 17 18 JIM HARTNETT: MOVED. 19 20 21 JEFFREY TUMLIN: SECOND. 22 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: MOVED BY HARTNETT SECOND BY TUMLIN. ED 23

DO WE HAVE COMMENT OR WRITTEN FORM RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

24



EDWARD MENG: NO COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. 1 2 3 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: OKAY. PLEASE CALL THE ROLL ON THIS. 4 5 EDWARD MENG: WHERE IS. [ROLL CALL VOTE] 6 7 EDWARD MENG: THE MOTION IS APPROVED. 8 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU ED THAT BRINGS US TO OUR 9 ACTION ITEMS AS PREVIOUSLY NOTED ITEM 3A WILL BE REFERRED TO A 10 LATER MEETING, AND THREE B CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD CALENDAR 11 2021, ED IS GOING TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. 12 13 EDWARD MENG: I THINK I HAVE A SLIGHT DELAY BUT HOPEFULLY IT 14 WON'T INTERFERE TOO MUCH. ITEM 3D IS THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE 15 16 BOARD CALENDAR. THE BOARD IS REQUIRED TO APPROVE ANNE NULL MEETING CALENDAR EVERY YEAR, THE 2021 FOR THE MOST PART 17 ASSUMES STATUS OUO THAT MEETINGS WILL CONTINUE TO HAPPEN 18 VIRTUALLY, AND WILL HAPPEN ON THE THIRD MONDAY OF THE MONTH AT 19 1:30 UNLESS THERE ARE CONFLICTS WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE FIRST 20 THREE MONTHS OF 2021 IN WHICH THERE ARE CONFLICTS WHETHER 21 22 THEY'RE HOLIDAYS OR PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED APTA OR PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED MEETINGS, WE UNDERSTAND BOARD MEMBERS PARTICIPATE IN 23 THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETINGS AND THE 24

FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETINGS SO THE ALTERNATE DATES



- 1 THAT WE HAVE PROPOSED AND SHOWN, HOPEFULLY DO NOT INTERFERE
- 2 WITH THOSE OTHER MEETINGS WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT WE ALSO
- 3 DON'T WANT TO MONOPOLIZE YOUR TIME ON THOSE DAYS. SO WE
- 4 RECOMMEND APPROVAL FOR THE CALENDAR AND IF SO APPROVED WE WILL
- 5 BE SURE TO SEND OUT CALENDAR INVITES SO THESE MEETINGS ARE ON
- 6 ALL YOUR CALENDARS FOR THE APPROPRIATE HOLDS FOR DATES AND
- 7 TIMES.

8

- 9 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU ED. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OF
- 10 ED FROM BOARD MEMBERS?

11

12 MICHAEL HURSH: I'LL MOVE APPROVAL. HURSH.

13

14 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: IS THERE A SECOND?

15

16 **DENNIS MULLIGAN:** SECOND. MULLIGAN.

17

- 18 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: MOTION FROM HURSH. SECOND FROM MULLIGAN.
- 19 ED, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT PRESENT OR IN WRITTEN FORM FOR THIS
- 20 ITEM.

21

22 EDWARD MENG: NO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

23

24 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.





1 EDWARD MENG: [ROLL CALL VOTE]

2

- 3 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: 3C NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM
- 4 INTEGRATOR CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER, BART SFMTA, CARD READER
- 5 VALIDATOR INTEGRATION WITH THE EXERCISE OF OPEN PAYMENT OPTION
- 6 WITH CUBIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS. KELLY JACKSON WILL PRESENT
- 7 THIS ITEM. IT'S VALUED AT \$13.6 MILLION.

8

9 KELLY JACKSON: ARE YOU GOING TO BE PULLING UP THE SLIDES?

10

11 EDWARD MENG: I BELIEVE MTC WILL BE DOING THAT.

- 13 KELLY JACKSON: GREAT. KELLY JACKSON STAFF, IF WE COULD MOVE
- 14 FORWARD. WHEN WE EXECUTED THE NEXT GENERATION INTEGRATOR
- 15 CONTRACT WITH CUBIC OUR PLAN WAS TO RETREAT TO LEVERAGE THE
- 16 LEGACY CARD VALIDATORS, AND INTEGRATION WHEN WE STARTED
- 17 WORKING CAN MTC, BART AND CUBIC, TO DISCUSS THE ACCOUNT BASED
- 18 DESIGN AND ARCHITECTURE WE TRIED TO MITIGATE THE CONCERNS FOR
- 19 ALL STAKEHOLDERS AND WE ULTIMATELY IDENTIFIED A TWO PRONG
- 20 SOLUTION THAT REQUIRES BART TO IMPLEMENT A SEPARATE NETWORK
- 21 FOR FARE COLLECTION FUNCTIONS ON WHICH CUBIC CAN OPERATE ITS
- 22 NEXT GENERATION CARD VALIDATOR WHICH WE REFER TO AS THE TRIBE
- 23 LEADER OR TR FOUR. THIS SOLUTION REQUIRES A CHANGE ORDER TO
- 24 PURCHASE TR FOURS TO INTEGRATION THE VALIDATORS WITH BART'S
- 25 FARE PAYMENT EQUIPMENT. THE DECISION TO ACCOMPLISHMENT TR4'S



- 1 ON BART DEVICES AFFECT OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE SYSTEM INTEGRATOR
- 2 CONTRACT. FIRST GAIN COST REDUCTIONS AND EFFICIENCIES IF WE
- 3 FURTHER THE SCOPE OF WORK BY UPGRADING THE CARD VALIDATORS AT
- 4 SFMTA GATES AT THE SAME TIME THIS ELIMINATES THE NEED FOR
- 5 CUBIC TO DEVOTE RESOURCES TO THE INTEGRATION NEXT GENERATION
- 6 SYSTEM LEGACY CARD VALIDATORS INCREASE IN CONSISTENT ACROSS
- 7 THE INSTITUTION. WHEN WE EXECUTED THE SI CONTRACT IN 2018, WE
- 8 LOCKED DOWN EQUIPMENT INTEGRATION AND OPERATIONS AND
- 9 MAINTENANCE COSTS F WE WERE TO ELECT TO HAVE CUBIC IMPLEMENT
- 10 AN OPEN PAYMENTS SYSTEM AFTER SYSTEM COMPLETION IN 2024. BY
- 11 IMPLEMENTING THE TR VALIDATOR ON THE BART AND SFMTA WE PAVE
- 12 THE WAY FOR CLIPPER IMPLEMENT OPEN PAYMENTS FOR ALL PAY THING
- 13 OPERATORS BY IMPLEMENTING THE WORK EARLY TO SUPPORT ACCOUNT
- 14 BASED OPERATIONS THE COST OF IMPLEMENTING OPEN PAYMENTS IS A
- 15 DISCRETE PIECE OF WORK INTRODUCED AND NEXT SLIDE ILLUSTRATES
- 16 COST OF IMPLICATIONS. SO THE STATUS OUO COLUMN ON THE LEFT
- 17 IDENTIFIES THE CURRENT SI CONTRACTOR REQUIREMENTS FOR
- 18 IMPLEMENTING OPEN PAYMENTS. WE WOULD BE LOOKING AT \$11.8
- 19 MILLION FOR EQUIPMENT, TAXES AND DEVELOPMENT WORK ON TOP OF
- 20 \$1.5 MILLION FOR OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE SO BY 2020 BEING
- 21 EARLIEST WE COULD OPEN TO IMPLEMENT OPEN PAYMENT SYSTEMS. THE
- 22 FAR RIGHT COLUMN, IT IDENTIFIES THE COST IF WE IMPLEMENT THE
- 23 TR4 VALIDATORS ON BART SFMTA AND IMPLEMENT OPEN PAYMENTS AFTER
- 24 SYSTEM COMPLETION IN 2024. AT THAT POINT THE TOTAL CAPITAL AND
- 25 OPERATING COSTS WOULD BE \$15.5 MILLION. SO THE OPTION STAFF IS



- 1 RECOMMENDING TODAY IS TO EXERCISE THE OPEN PAYMENTS OPTION NOW
- 2 AS COMPANION WORK TO THE TR FOUR VALIDATOR IMPLEMENTATION FOR
- 3 A TOTAL COST OF \$13.6 MILLION. THIS WOULD ALLOW US TO MEET
- 4 BART'S INTEGRATION NEEDS AND IMPLEMENT OPEN PAYMENTS FOR ALL
- 5 PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATORS AS EARLY AS 2022 FOR ONLY
- 6 300,000 MORE DOLLARS THAN WE WOULD HAVE PAID TO EXERCISE THIS
- 7 OPTION IN 2024. THE NEXT SLIDE SUMMARIZES HOW WE ACHIEVE THIS
- 8 TIME AND COST SAVINGS BY EXERCISING THE OPEN PAYMENTS OPTION
- 9 CONCURRENTLY WITH THE TR FOUR IMPLEMENTATION. THIS ACCELERATED
- 10 APPROACH ALLOWS CUBIC ENGINEERING AND PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAMS
- 11 TO COMPLETE THE WORK NEEDED TO SUPPORT ACCOUNT BASED AND OPEN
- 12 PAYMENTS FUNCTIONALITY AS PART OF ONE FOCUSED EFFORT. AT THE
- 13 SAME TIME WE ARE ALSO REDUCING FUTURE LABOR COSTS AND PROJECT
- 14 RISKS THAT CUBIC BUILT INTO THEIR ORIGINAL COST PROPOSAL FOR
- 15 THE OPEN PAYMENTS OPTION. AS CUBIC MOVES FORWARD WITH THEIR
- 16 WORK TO IMPLEMENT OPEN PAYMENTS, MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF WILL
- 17 HAVE TIME TO DEVELOP OPERATING ROLES AND MESSAGING TO SUSPECT
- 18 THE ROLL OUT OF OPEN PAYMENTS. OUR HOPE IS THAT AN OPEN
- 19 PAYMENTS OPTION WILL BENEFIT THE REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS AT
- 20 A TIME WHEN WE WANT TO PROMOTE CONTACTLESS PAYMENT OPTIONS AND
- 21 AFTER TRANSIT RIDERS GREATER FLEXIBILITY. STAFF IS
- 22 RECOMMENDING BOARD'S APPROVAL WITH CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER WITH
- 23 CUBIC IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$13.6 MILLION FOR THE
- 24 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TR SOLUTION AND OPEN PAYMENTS OPTION.
- 25 ANY QUESTIONS?



1 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: ANY QUESTIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS OF 2 3 STAFF? 4 5 ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S A QUESTION. I'M SORRY. YOU HAD YOUR HAND UP FIRST NURIA. 6 7 8 NURIA FERNANDEZ: WHERE IS THE FUNDING COMING FROM FOR THIS? 9 EDWARD MENG: I CAN TAKE A SHOT AT IT KELLY. 10 11 KELLY JACKSON: YES ED. 12 13 EDWARD MENG: WE WILL BE GOING TO ASK FOR FUNDING FOR THE WORK 14 AS PART OF OUR FUTURE FEDERAL TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITY 15 16 PROGRAM. SO IT'S VERY SIMILAR TO HOW WE HAD OUR INTEGRATOR CONTRACT APPROVED WHICH KIND OF ASKED FOR FUTURE TRANSIT 17 CAPITAL PRIORITY FPA FUNDS SO WE'RE WORKING WITH OUR FUNDING 18 ALLOCATION STAFF TO PRESENT THIS TO OUR COMMISSION AS WELL AS 19 WITH COMMITMENT FOR FUTURE FUNDS. 20 21 22 CAROL KUESTER: IF WE'RE NOT SUCCESSFUL THIS ADVOCATING FOR 23 ADDITIONAL FUNDING NURIA WE DO HAVE A SUFFICIENT AMOUNT IN THE PROJECT CONTINGENCY TO COVER THIS WORK. 24



NURIA FERNANDEZ: OKAY. AND DO WE NEED TO TAKE ANY ACTION FOR A 1 2 CONTINGENCY NOW? 3 CAROL KUESTER: WE SECURED --4 5 NURIA FERNANDEZ: THIS IS FOR CONTRACT RELATED TO THE PROJECT, 6 7 DO WE NEED TO PROTECT IT OR IT'S A GIVEN AND WILL ONLY BE USED 8 IF WE DON'T GET THE FEDERAL FUNDS. 9 EDWARD MENG: IF WE DON'T GET THE FEDERAL FUNDS FROM OUR 10 COMMISSION THEN WE NEED TO USE OUR CONTINGENCY WHICH DOES 11 LIMIT OUR ABILITY TO DO THINGS IN THE FUTURE. 12 13 CAROL KUESTER: THAT BEING SAID HOWEVER WE HAVE MADE SOME 14 PRETTY MAJOR INVESTMENTS OUT OF OUR CONTINGENCY TO DATE AND 15 16 ARE NOW IN THE DESIGN PHASE OF THE WORK. I SHARE AN INTEREST IN PROTECTING THE CONTINGENCY AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. BUT YOU'RE 17 RIGHT, NURIA, I MEAN, WE WOULD BE LEFT WITH A VERY SMALL 18 REMAINDER IF WE NEED TO, YOU KNOW, TAKE THIS ENTIRE AMOUNT OUT 19 OF OUR CONTINGENCY THAT'S WHY WE'RE SEEKING ALTERNATIVE 20 21 FUNDING SOURCES. 22 23 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: JEFF?



JEFFREY TUMLIN: I JUST WANT TO PRAISE STAFF FOR SPOTTING THIS 1 2 OPPORTUNITY, WHICH I THINK IS A WIN-WIN SOLUTION. AND ALLOWS 3 US TO ADVANCE IMPORTANT WORK THAT WILL HELP ALL OF OUR CUSTOMERS. SO THANK YOU FOR FINDING THIS AND ADVANCING IT. 4 5 CAROL KUESTER: YEAH, THERE WERE CERTAINLY A COUPLE OF KEY 6 7 PIECES OF INFORMATION THAT CHANGED BUT I THINK YOU CAN SEE 8 FROM THE PRESENTATION IT'S A VERY SENSIBLE SOLUTION. 9 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: DENIS? 10 11 DENIS MULLIGAN: I MOVE THE ITEM. 12 13 JEFFREY TUMLIN: SECOND TUMLIN. 14 15 16 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: OKAY. I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. 17 EDWARD MENG: CHAIR, WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. 18 19 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: I KNOW. FIRST I'M GOING TO GO TO BOARD 20 21 MEMBER RANNELLS WHO HAS HER HAND UP. 22

NINA RANNELLS: I WANT TO CLARIFY WHEN YOU SAY THIS WILL BE

FUNDED THROUGH TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITY FUNDS, THIS'S FEDERAL

23

24

25

FORMULA FUNDS, RIGHT?





1 2 SPEAKER: YEAH. 3 NINA RANNELLS: I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY UNDERSTOOD 4 5 THAT. 6 7 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: OKAY I'M NOW -- OH, GO AHEAD BOB. 8 ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. ONE, I 9 WANTED TO THANK STAFF FOR THIS AND ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH THE 10 COMMENTS FROM MR. TUMLIN. IT IS TIMELY LOOKED AT AN 11 OPPORTUNITY AND GRABBED T I THINK THAT'S A GOOD THING. I DON'T 12 KNOW, THERESE, AND CAROL, THE FUNCTIONAL REQUIREMENTS, YOU 13 KNOW, THAT ARE GOING TO GO INTO THESE TR FOURS, IT WOULD BE 14 15 GOOD IF THE OPERATORS GOT THOSE FUNCTIONAL REQUIREMENTS AHEAD 16 OF GOING TO THIS OPEN PAYMENT SYSTEM, RIGHT? SO, YOU KNOW, WHETHER IT'S ME OR JEFF, OR WHOEVER, YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE 17 THAT IT FITS WITH OUR -- THE REGULATIONS THAT WE HAVE, 18 BUSINESS RULES, AND I THINK WE HAVE ASKED FOR SOME OF THOSE 19 DESIGN CRITERIA, THE FUNCTIONAL REQUIREMENTS, CAROLE, AND I 20 21 DON'T KNOW IF THEY'RE FORTH COMING, OR WHERE MTC AND CUBIC ARE WITH THAT, BUT AS SOON AS THOSE ARE AVAILABLE -- THE SOONER 22 THEY GET OUT TO THE OPERATORS, THE BETTER OFF, YOU KNOW, WE'LL 23 BE ON THIS. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THEY PUT THAT 24

25

COMMENT OUT THERE, PUBLICLY.



1	
2	CAROL KUESTER: YEAH. WE AGREE. THIS IS, AS YOU CAN TELL, I
3	HOPE, FROM THE SIZE OF THE CHANGE ORDER HERE, THIS IS A PRETTY
4	SIGNIFICANT PIECE OF WORK THAT REQUIRES US TO WORK QUICKLY
5	WITH BART AND MUNI WHO WILL NOW BE GETTING THE MOST VERSION OF
6	EQUIPMENT RATHER THAN RELYING ON LEGACY EQUIPMENT AND I KNOW
7	WE HAVE MORE DESIGN WORK TO DO THERE. AND I'LL NOTE THAT WITH
8	THIS ACTION, WHAT WE'RE ESSENTIALLY TELLING CUBIC WITH RESPECT
9	TO OPEN PAYMENTS IS GO AHEAD AND GET STARTED ON THE SOFTWARE
10	WORK. I WILL JUST CAUTION THAT WE ALL ARE GOING TO HAVE A LOT
11	OF WORK TO DO TO THINK ABOUT THE BUSINESS RULES ASSOCIATED
12	WITH HOW WE WANT TO USE OPEN PAYMENTS. SO THAT'S GOING TO TAKE
13	SOME TIME. WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW THAT WORK STREAM WILL BE
14	MANAGED. IT WILL BE THE SAME PEOPLE THAT WILL BE SAME FOLKS
15	ON YOUR SIDE ON OUR SIDE AND ON THE CUBIC SYSTEM WHO ARE ALSO
16	TRYING TO GET THE CAFE SYSTEM OUT THE DOOR. SO WE HAVE A WORK
17	PLAN TO DEVELOP, BUT WE DO THINK IT'S RIGHT TO TAKE THIS
18	ACTION TO GET THE TECHNOLOGY PIECE MOVING. AND I ABSOLUTELY
19	AGREE ON THE FUNCTIONAL REQUIREMENTS. JASON, DID YOU HAVE
20	SOMETHING TO ADD?
21	
22	JASON WEINSTEIN: NO. I THINK THAT WAS PERFECT.
23	
24	ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: OKAY GOOD. I'M IN SUPPORT.



RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. BEFORE WE TAKE THE VOTE, 1 LET'S HEAR FROM OUR PUBLIC. WE HAVE AT LEAST ONE PERSON WITH A 2 RAISED HAND. ED, LET'S ROLL THROUGH THAT. 3 4 5 EDWARD MENG: ALETA DUPREE, IT LOOKS LIKE YOU HAVE A COMMENT. 6 7 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR RICK RAMACIER. CAN YOU HEAR ME? 8 EDWARD MENG: YEAH. YOU'RE GOOD. 9 10 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR RAMACIER AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE 11 FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. OPEN SOURCE PAYMENT 12 NEEDS TO BE SOONER RATHER THAN LATER. THIS IS AN INVESTMENT 13 AND COVID OR NOT OPEN SOURCE PAYMENT IS PART OF A SEED CHANGE 14 15 THAT HAS BEEN COMING. I NOTICED WITH MY OWN CREDIT UNION, THEY 16 HAVE RECENTLY MADE THE CHANGE TO ISSUING CONTACTLESS PAYMENT 17 CARDS. TRANSIT HAS REALLY BEEN A DRIVER OF THIS, IN NEW YORK CITY, APPROXIMATELY 400 OF THE 424 STATION COMPLEXES, OF THE 18 NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY HAVE NOW BEEN OUTFITTED WITH THE OMNI 19 FARE PAYMENT SYSTEM AND OTHER SYSTEMS ARE FOLLOWING SUIT, AND 20 I KOBE PUBLIC IS ALSO DOING THE WORK IN NEW YORK CITY. THIS IS 21 MONEY THAT'S GOING TO PAY OFF AS AN INVESTMENT. PEOPLE ARE 22

LOOK FORWARD TO THIS. WHETHER WE GET FEDERAL MONEY OR NOT WE

STILL NEED TO DO THIS BECAUSE IT WILL PAY FOR ITSELF OVER TIME

IN CONVENIENCE TO THE CUSTOMERS AND EFFICIENCIES, WE JUST NEED

23

24



- 1 MORE CREDIT UNION AND LESS COFFEE CAN. SO I BELIEVE THAT THIS
- 2 NEEDS TO BE APPROVED. I ASKED FOR THAT, AND THEN WE CAN
- 3 CONTINUE THIS WORK OF OFFERING MORE SAFER REGISTERED AND USER
- 4 FRIENDLY OPTIONS TO OUR RIDING PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

5

- 6 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU ALETA. ED S THERE ANYONE ELSE
- 7 FROM THE PUBLIC THAT I AM NOT SEEING WANTS THAT TO WEIGH IN?
- 8 OR DID WE RECEIVE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION ON THIS ITEM?

9

- 10 EDWARD MENG: WE DID NOT RECEIVE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION ON
- 11 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 12 THEIR HAND RAISED.

13

- 14 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: MOTION FROM MULLIGAN SECOND FROM TUMLIN.
- 15 THERE ARE ANY OTHER MEMBERS FROM THE BOARD THAT WISH TO WEIGH
- 16 IN BEFORE WE CALL THE VOTE. OKAY. I'M NOT SEEING ANY. ED,
- 17 COULD YOU PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

18

19 EDWARD MENG: YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] THE ITEM PASSES.

20

- 21 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO OUR
- 22 INFORMATION ITEMS. WE HAVE TWO UNDER ITEM 4, 4A UPDATE FROM
- 23 JASON WEINSTEIN ON THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM. JASON.



JASON WEINSTEIN: IN TERMS OF THE CURRENT SYSTEM CLIPPER 1 PROCESSED A LITTLE OVER 3 MILLION TRAUMATICS AND SETTLED A 2 3 LITTLE OVER 7 MILLION IN OCTOBER. THESE NUMBERS ARE GOOD. INCREASES FROM SEPTEMBER BUT DOWN TO PRE COVID AS OF NOVEMBER 4 5 6TH OFFERING FREE TRAVEL DUE TO COVID-19. AND IMPLEMENTATION PROJECTS, CLIPPER HOME AFTER WORK SCHEDULE IS ATTACHED. AND TO 6 7 HIGHLIGHT CLIPPER START PROGRAM NEXT SET OF OPERATORS SHOULD 8 BE LAUNCHING NEXT MONDAY NOVEMBER 23RD AND WE'RE STILL PLANNING ON THE NEXT GROUP OF OPERATORS IN THE MOST RECENT 9 LAUNCH TO ROLL OUT IN JANUARY 2021. SO WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT 10 THAT. THAT IS MY UPDATE. AND I'M AVAILABLE FOR ANY QUESTIONS 11 YOU MAY HAVE. 12 13 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU JASON. ANY QUESTIONS FROM 14 15 BOARD MEMBERS? BOB? 16 ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: YEAH. DO WE KNOW, MAYBE IT'S IN THE 17 18 PACKET AND I MISSED IT JASON -- THE LIST OF OTHER OPERATORS THAT ARE JOINING THE MEANS-BASED FARE PROGRAM? YOU KNOW, THE 19 TWO GROUPINGS, IS THAT IN THE PACKET AND I MISSED IT? 20 21

JASON WEINSTEIN: I DON'T KNOW THAT I HAVE THEM LISTED OUT.

22



ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: AND IT'S NOT PUBLIC OR IT'S NOT --1 I KNOW -- WELL IT'S AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM SO WE CAN DISCUSS 2 3 IT. 4 5 LYSA HALE: YES, THE OPERATORS THAT ARE ROLLING OUT ON NOVEMBER 23RD OF MARIN TRANSIT, SMART, PETALUMA TRANSIT, SANTA ROSA 6 7 CITY BUS, SONOMA COUNTY TRANSIT, AND WETA SO THOSE WILL ALL BE 8 ROLLING OUT ON NOVEMBER 23RD AND THE REMAINING OPERATORS WILL ROLL OUT SOMETIME IN JANUARY PROBABLY CLOSER TO THE END OF THE 9 MONTH, THAT'S OUR CURRENT SCHEDULE, AND WE'RE ON TRACK FOR 10 11 NOVEMBER 23RD. 12 ROBERT POWERS, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. 13 14 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: NINA? 15 16 NINA RANNELLS: THANKS. I JUST WANTED TO THANK THE CLIPPER 17 STAFF FOR WORKING ON THIS AND FOR OPENING THIS UP FOR ALL OF 18 US. IT'S -- WE'RE REALLY EXCITED TO IMPLEMENT IN NOVEMBER. 19 THANK YOU. 20 21 22 JASON WEINSTEIN: EXCELLENT.



RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: ANY OTHER BOARD OUESTIONS? OKAY. ED, I'M 1 NOT SEEING ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC WITH A RAISED HAND. DID WE 2 3 HAVE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION ON THIS ITEM? 4 5 EDWARD MENG: WE DIDN'T RECEIVE ANY COMMUNICATION ON THIS ITEM 6 FROM THE PUBLIC. 7 8 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM 4B A REPORT FROM JASON ON THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER. 9 10 JASON WEINSTEIN: AGAIN I'LL BE BRIEF. ATTACHMENT A HAS ALWAYS, 11 ATTACHED TO YOUR MEMO UPDATE PROVIDED MONTHLY HIGHLIGHTING A 12 FEW ITEMS HERE CLIPPER MOBILE APP MOVING ALONG IN EARNEST 13 TRANSIT OPERATORS TESTERS IN STATION THIS IS MONTH AND 14 RIDERSHIP TESTING SHOULD GUN IN DECEMBER. AS IT RELATES TO 15 16 ACCOUNT BASED DESIGN, AS WE HAVE MENTIONED BEFORE WE HAVE A SERIES OF DESIGN WORKSHOP IN VARIOUS AREAS THAT ARE LISTED IN 17 YOUR MEMO AND ALSO FOR THE CONTRACT, THE CONTRACT SUBMITTALS 18 REOUIRE THAT THE SYSTEM REOUIREMENTS ARE SUBMITTED THREE 19 TIMES. THEY HAVE CONCEPTUAL DESIGN, PRELIMINARY DESIGN AND 20 FINAL DESIGN ALSO KNOWN AS CBD, FDR AND PDR, CUBIC SUBMITTED 21 THEIR CONCEPTUAL DESIGN AND WE MET WITH TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF 22 TWICE LAST WEEK TO WALK THROUGH THAT SUBMISSION IT'S A LARGE 23 ONE AND WE'RE GOING TO MEET AGAIN WITH YOUR STAFF THIS WEEK TO 24

TALK MORE ABOUT THAT AND FINALLY, LAST MONTH, I INDICATED THAT



- 1 CUBIC SCHEDULE HAD A LITTLE BIT OF A DELAY IN IT AND THAT WE
- 2 WERE GOING TO MEET WITH CUBIC WE DID DO THAT TO TALK ABOUT OUR
- 3 CONCERNS AND WHILE STILL REVIEWING OUR CUBIC SCHEDULE WE
- 4 RECEIVED LAST WEEK CHANGES HAVE BEEN MADE IN LOGIC TO CORRECT
- 5 THE ACHIEVEMENT FOR REVIEW READY SYSTEM COMPLETION WE SAW
- 6 POSITIVE RESULTS AND FEEL LIKE WE'RE IN A GOOD PACE THERE.
- 7 THAT IS MY REPORT. I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU
- 8 HAVE.

9

- 10 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU JASON. THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS
- 11 FROM BOARD MEMBERS REGARDING JASON'S REPORT? OKAY I'M NOT
- 12 SEEING ANY. ED, I'M NOT SEEING ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC RAISE
- 13 THEIR HAND. IS THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION THAT WE HAVE
- 14 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

15

- 16 EDWARD MENG: WE DID NOT RECEIVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
- 17 ITEM.

18

- 19 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM FIVE,
- 20 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. CAROL?

- 22 CAROL KUESTER: QUICKLY. WE'RE EXCITED WE WERE ABLE TO WORK OUT
- 23 THIS STRATEGY FOR LAUNCHING WITH OPEN PAYMENTS THAT'S NEW IN
- 24 THE DIRECTION THAT CAL ITP IS TAKING WITH THE OPERATORS AND IS
- 25 GOING TO BE AN IMPROVEMENT IN THE CARD INDUSTRY. AS A



- 1 REMINDER, I UNDERSTAND SOME BOARD MEMBERS ARE BEING CONTACT BY
- 2 A VARIETY OF INTERESTED PARTIES WHO MAY WANT TO WORK WITH
- 3 CLIPPER IN VARIOUS WAYS FROM PAYMENTS INDUSTRY TO WEARABLE
- 4 INDUSTRIES, AND THEN WE HAVE VENDORS WHO WANT TO COME AND
- 5 PRESENT HERE AT CBA MY REQUEST IS YOU FORWARD THOSE REQUESTS
- 6 TO JASON WEINSTEIN AND WE WILL KEEP YOU ADVISED AS WE HANDLE
- 7 ACCORDINGLY AND OUR ADDRESSES ARE HANDLED WITH A LOT OF
- 8 CONSISTENCY AND IF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WANT TO SUBMIT
- 9 COMMENT IN WRITING WANT TO COMMENT ON THE WORK OF THIS BOARD
- 10 THEY CAN ALWAYS SUBMIT COMMENT IN WRITING AND THEY'RE ADVISED
- 11 TO CONTACT THE CLERK OF THE BOARD 72 HOURS PRIOR TO THE START
- 12 OF THE MEETING. THAT'S A DIFFERENT CATEGORY. SO I DO THINK
- 13 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF EXCITEMENT AROUND THIS
- 14 OPEN PAYMENTS PIECE, AND WE SHARE THAT EXCITEMENT AND WE WANT
- 15 TO GET IT RIGHT. AND WE'RE COMMITTED TO KEEPING THE CLIPPER
- 16 PROGRAM AT THE FOREFRONT OF NEGOTIATIONS IN THAT REGARD, AND
- 17 WE WILL DEFINITELY KEEP YOU APPRISED. THAT'S ALL I HAD FOR
- 18 TODAY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR -- THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO
- 19 THE WORK ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, I KNOW THAT'S ANOTHER
- 20 BIG COMMITMENT.
- 22 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU CAROL. ANY QUESTIONS FOR BOARD
- 23 MEMBERS, OF CAROL? I'M NOT SEEING ANY RAISED HANDS FROM THE
- 24 PUBLIC. ED, WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION THAT CAME IN
- 25 ON THIS ITEM?



1

November 16, 2020

EDWARD MENG: THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS 2 3 ITEM. 4 5 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: GREAT. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM SIX WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT AND/OR OTHER BUSINESS. AND BEFORE WE GO TO 6 7 THE PUBLIC IS THERE ANYBODY ON THE BOARD THAT WISHES TO SHARE 8 ANYTHING WITH THIS BOARD TODAY? OKAY. I'M NOT SEEING ANYTHING. ED, IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE AT LEAST ONE RAISED HAND FROM THE 9 10 PUBLIC. 11 EDWARD MENG: YEAH. WE HAVE A RAISED HAND FROM ALETA DUPREE. 12 FEEL FREE TO START. 13 14 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR, RICK RAMACIER AND OTHERS. ALETA 15 16 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. GOOD MEETING. GETTING OUR WORK DONE. LOTS OF IMPORTANT THINGS GOING ON. AND SO WE JUST HAVE TO 17 STATE COURSE. I HAVE LOOKED AT THE BART WEB SITE, AND THEY TOO 18 ARE ALMOST FINISHED WITH THEIR CONVERSION OF THEIR STATIONS TO 19 OPERATE ON 100 PERCENT CLIPPER BASED SYSTEM. SO WHOLE BE 20 21 FIRST? NEW YORK CITY OR BART? WE SHALL SEE. BUT BOTH ARE WORTHY EQUALS IN THIS SPACE. IN NEW YORK, THE STATE THROUGH 22 23 WAY JUST TURNED ON THEIR CASHLESS TOLL SYSTEMS ON SATURDAY MORNING SO THE SEED CHANGES CONTINUE TO COME. I AM LOOKING 24 FORWARD TO THE APP, WHICH WILL ALLOW REALTIME ADDITION OF FARE 25



- 1 VALUE AND PASSES, BUT WE ALSO SHOULD ENSURE WE WORK ON
- 2 DECREASING THE AMOUNT OF TIME AND INTERVALS IN ORDER FOR
- 3 PEOPLE TO LOAD THEIR FARE VALUE REMOTELY, BECAUSE NOT
- 4 EVERYBODY HAS SMART PHONES, AND EVEN IF THEY DO, MANY AGENCIES
- 5 REDUCED FARE CARDS ARE NOT ABLE TO BE USED ON THE PHONE DUE TO
- 6 THE VARIOUS NEED FOR IDENTIFICATION, PICTURE, ET CETERA. SO WE
- 7 WANT TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON THAT SO PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO WAIT
- 8 FOR LONG TO GET THEIR FARE PRODUCT LOADED, AT LEAST AT THE
- 9 RAIL GATES. SO LET'S SEE WHAT WE DO NEXT MONTH. BUT I'M
- 10 LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING THIS APP TURNED ON. THANK YOU.
- 12 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: THANK YOU ALETA. ED, DO WE HAVE ANY MORE
- 13 PUBLIC COMMENT?

11

14

16

18

- 15 EDWARD MENG: WE DO NOT HAVE ANY MORE PUBLIC COMMENT.
- 17 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: AND DID WE RECEIVE ANY WRITTEN COMMENT?
- 19 EDWARD MENG: WE DID NOT RECEIVE WRITTEN COMMENTS.
- 21 RICK RAMACIER, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS
- 22 US TO ADJOURNMENT. THIS BOARD WILL ADJOURN, THE CLIPPER
- 23 EXECUTIVE BOARD UNTIL ET CETERA NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING TO BE
- 24 HELD DECEMBER 7TH, 2020 AT 1:45 REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST AS
- 25 APPROPRIATE. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government