

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



November 20, 2020

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2020, 9:45 AM**

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. KIMBERLY WOULD YOU DO THE
5 HONORS PLEASE?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. HAGGERTY?

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

16

17 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BRUINS?

20

21 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

24

25 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORTESE?

3

4 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIOCAPINI IS ABSENT. GLOVER IS ABSENT.

7 JOSEFOWITZ?

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO?

12

13 **SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT VIRTUALLY.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MACKENZIE?

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE. I'M PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN IS ABSENT. RABBIT?

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE. AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

24

25 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE -- HERE.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SCHAFF?

3

4 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SLOCUM IS ABSENT. SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** STRACNER IS ABSENT. TAVARES?

11

12 **TONY TAVARES:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

15

16 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KIMBERLY, VERY MUCH. I WOULD
21 NOTE WE NOW HAVE COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI SMILING SO WE HAVE
22 DONE OUR WORK AS A COMMISSION. SO THE NEXT THREE ITEMS ARE
23 MAKE ME HAPPY, THEY MAKE ME SAD. I AM AN IRISH MAN THAT
24 DOESN'T LIKE CHANGE. AND WE HAVE SOME CHANGE COMING TO THIS
25 COMMISSION. ACTUALLY THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF NEW



November 20, 2020

1 MEMBERS, WHEN I THINK ABOUT IT. BUT UNDER THE CHAIR'S REPORT,
2 I'M GOING TO FIRST ASK THAT -- OH, SUPERVISOR SPERING, OR
3 COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER WORTH ON THE
4 RESOLUTION OF 4441 IN APPRECIATION OF DAVE CORTESE HIS
5 DEPARTURE FROM THE COMMISSION TO BECOME A MEMBER OF THE
6 CALIFORNIA STATE SENATE REPRESENTING DISTRICT 15. WAY TO GO
7 DAVE. WE'RE ALL PROUD.

8

9 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** GOING TO MAUI.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YEAH RIGHT. BECAUSE OF THE FRAMED
12 COPIES OF THESE RESOLUTIONS ALREADY BEEN SENT TO DAVE AND TONY
13 AND JEANNE, WHICH I WILL GET TO IN A MINUTE -- I'M GOING TO
14 TRY TO DO THEM SEPARATE AND NOT SCREW THIS UP. SOME MAY EVEN
15 HAVE THEM. I DON'T KNOW, DO ANY OF YOU HAVE YOUR RESOLUTIONS
16 YET? NO. NOPE. OKAY. WELL YOU DON'T. SO, I'M GOING REFRAIN
17 FROM READING THE FULL TEXT OF ANY OF THESE RESOLUTIONS BUT I
18 WANT TO SHARE A FEW HIGHLIGHTS OF THE RESOLUTIONS AND I'M
19 GOING TO START WITH MY GOOD FRIEND DAVE CORTESE. I'M GOING TO
20 JUST SAY, OFF THE RESOLUTION PART OF THIS, IT IS A JOY -- THE
21 JOY OF MY LIFE TO KNOW THIS MAN. HE IS SOMEBODY THAT I HAVE
22 LEARNED FROM IN PUBLIC OFFICE. HE IS SOMEBODY THAT I'M SURE
23 THAT, AT ANOTHER AGENCY THAT WE SAT ON, THAT WAS MERGED INTO
24 THIS AGENCY, MANY TIMES I ASKED DAVE FOR HIS LEGAL ADVICE IN
25 FRONT OF THE ATTORNEY FOR THAT AGENCY, BECAUSE QUITE FRANKLY,



November 20, 2020

1 I RELIED MORE ON DAVE'S WISDOM AND LEGAL EXPERTISE. SO I JUST
2 FELT THAT I WAS JUST MORE COMFORTABLE WITH DAVE. I THINK THE
3 GREAT THING ABOUT THE METRO CENTER WAS IT GAVE US A LITTLE BIT
4 OF FREE TIME BETWEEN MEETINGS AND DAVE AND I FROM TIME TO TIME
5 WOULD GO GRAB DINNER, AND THE GUY'S GOT STORIES. LET ME TELL
6 YOU. MOST OF THEM, THEY STAY IN THE VAULT, WE'LL KEEP THEM TO
7 OURSELVES DAVE. BUT JUST REMEMBER WE WERE ALL YOUNG ONCE BUT
8 IT JUST REALLY IS A JOY TO KNOW YOU AND YOUR WIFE PATTY. AND
9 YOU HAVE AN INVITATION TO MY HOUSE ANY TIME YOU WANT, IN
10 TENNESSEE, WE'LL BE HAPPY TO SHOW YOU AROUND ALL THE CIVIL WAR
11 SITES THAT JAKE KEEPS TELLING ME B SO WITH THAT, I'M GOING SAY
12 DAVE CORTESE SERVED AS CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION FROM 2015 TO
13 2017 HE GUIDED CONSOLIDATION OF MTC STAFF WITH THAT OF THE
14 ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS WORKING CLOSELY WITH JULIE
15 PIERCE TO DESIGN AN AGREEMENT ACCEPTABLE TO BOTH BOARDS AND
16 WHEREAS DAVE HAS CAPTURED 2016 MOVE OF MTC AND ABAG AND THE
17 BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT TO THE NEWLY
18 REDEVELOPED BAY AREA METRO CENTER AND WHILE ALSO WORKING TO
19 SMOOTH THE WAY FOR THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION
20 DEVELOPMENT -- SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT
21 COMMISSIONS LATER MOVE TO THE FACILITY. WHEREAS DAVE'S DECADES
22 OF WORK ON BEHALF OF THE PEOPLE OF SAN JOSE, SANTA CLARA, AND
23 THE BAY AREA REFLECT A LONG FAMILY TRADITION OF PUBLIC SERVICE
24 THAT INCLUDES -- AND I DIDN'T KNOW THIS DAVE -- HIS
25 GRANDFATHER, WHO WAS A SANTA CLARA CITY COUNCILMEMBER -- I DID



November 20, 2020

1 KNOW THIS -- HIS FATHER A SANTA CLARA COUNTY SUPERVISOR AND
2 STATE ASSEMBLYMEMBER NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE
3 STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS OF MTC THANK DAVE FOR HIS SERVICE TO
4 THE AGENCY THANK HIM FOR HIS POISE, PROFESSIONALISM, DIPLOMACY
5 DIGNITY CONGRATULATE HIM ON WINNING THE ELECTION TO HIGHER
6 OFFICE AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH HIM ON ISSUES OF
7 CRITICAL IMPORTANCE TO THE BAY AREA AND THE STATE IN THE
8 COMING YEARS IN SACRAMENTO. DAVE DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO SAY
9 FOR YOURSELF?

10

11 **DAVID CORTESE:** NOT SO MUCH FOR ME, SCOTT, BUT JUST A FEW WORDS
12 OF GRATITUDE TO ALL OF YOU. AND WHEN I SAY ALL OF YOU I MEAN
13 MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION PAST AND PRESENT AND THE
14 ADMINISTRATION OF THE COMMISSION AND ALL OF THE EMPLOYEES
15 INCLUDING OF COURSE THE MERGE STAFF, THAT HAVE DONE JUST A
16 TREMENDOUS PROFESSIONAL JOB ON WHAT A STANDARD THAT YOU HAVE
17 UPHELD, BUT WITH THE YEARS I'VE BEEN HERE I'VE BEEN REALLY
18 FORTUNATE TO PARTICIPATE IN IT, BUT EVEN TO OBSERVE IT, THE
19 LEVEL OF PROFESSIONALISM OF THE ORGANIZATION AND ITS ABILITY
20 TO KEEP UP WITH ANYONE, PUBLIC SECTOR OR PRIVATE SECTOR. IT'S
21 BEEN AN AMAZING THING TO BE PART OF. SO THANK YOU ALL. AND
22 THANK YOU ALL WHO HAVE SUPPORTED US ON THE COMMISSION. JUST IN
23 OUR DAY-TO-DAY ACTIVITIES, GETTING US THE THINGS THAT WE NEED,
24 GETTING ME THE THINGS THAT I NEED, YOU KNOW, TO BE ON TIME AND
25 PREPARED FOR THE MEETINGS. AND THE ACTIONS WE HAVE TAKEN OVER



November 20, 2020

1 THE YEARS. REAL QUICKLY, I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, IN A LITTLE
2 MORE THAN AN INDIVIDUAL WAY, SCOTT, THANK YOU FOR THOSE VERY
3 KIND WORDS. I THINK PEOPLE HAVE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO OBSERVE
4 OUR RELATIONSHIP OVER THE YEARS THEY MIGHT HAVE BEEN SURPRISED
5 THAT SOME OF THE CONVERSATIONS THAT WE HAD WHEN WE DUCKED INTO
6 A CONFERENCE ROOM AND SORT OF HAD IT OUT IT TOOK ME A WHILE
7 UNTIL I REALIZATION THAT WHEN WE DISAGREE WE DISAGREE LIKE
8 BROTHERS. I HAVE TWO BROTHERS IN MY IMMEDIATE FAMILY, TWO
9 SIBLINGS AND TWO SISTER PERCENT AND I THOUGHT, NOW I SEE WHERE
10 THIS RELATIONSHIP IS GOING, AND SOME OF YOU WERE INVOLVED WITH
11 THE ABAG MEETING LAST NIGHT UNDER THEY REFERRED TO SCOTT AS MY
12 BROTHER, AND I MEAN THAT. THANK YOU. HOPEFULLY I CAN CHECK IN
13 WHEN, YOU KNOW, FOR A FEW MINUTES SOMEHOW WHEN IT'S TIME FOR
14 YOU TO RECEIVE YOUR ACCOLADES AS YOU MOVE UP, OFF THE
15 COMMISSION AND INTO RETIREMENT. I KNOW -- I'M NOT GOING TO BE
16 TAKING VACATIONS ANY TIME SOON TO MAUI OR ANYWHERE ELSE.
17 [LAUGHTER] BUT WHEN I DO TAKE A VACATION, WHEN PATTY AND I DO,
18 I CAN ASSURE YOU THAT THE FIRST PLACE WE'RE GOING TO WANT TO
19 GO IS NASHVILLE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

22

23 **DAVID CORTESE:** JULIE, I WENT THROUGH THE WHOLE THING LAST
24 NIGHT AND I DIDN'T MENTION JULIE'S NAME. I KNOW THE RESOLUTION
25 IS TETHERED TO HER WORK, AND TO ME, I KNOW SHE'S NOT HERE



November 20, 2020

1 TODAY BUT HOPEFULLY AMY CAN LET HER KNOW THEY ACKNOWLEDGED HER
2 AT THE HIGHEST LEVEL IN TERMS OF -- AND I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE
3 GENDER NEUTRAL WORD IS FOR STATESMANSHIP, BUT WHATEVER THAT
4 WORD IS, SHE EARNS IT WITH AN A PLUS. AND THEN JIM SPERING IS
5 THE GOLD STANDARD FOR THAT. SOMETIMES I WISH JIM SPERING WAS
6 IN WASHINGTON, D.C. RIGHT NOW, BECAUSE THERE IS NO DOUBT IN MY
7 MIND HE WOULD PULL AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE TOGETHER, AND BRING
8 MITCH McCONNELL AND THE ENTIRE WHITE HOUSE. THAT'S WHAT JIM IS
9 AND TO HAVE SOMEBODY EVEN WHEN MY MODEST SKILL SET WAS
10 ABSOLUTELY FAILING THAT YOU COULD JUST TURN TO HIM AND SAY,
11 JIM, YOU KNOW, HELP ME PULL THIS TOGETHER. WHAT AN AMAZING
12 BLESSING TO HAVE SOMEBODY LIKE THAT. AND WE'RE BLESSED TO HAVE
13 SOMEBODY LIKE THAT IN THE REGION ALL THESE YEARS. TO EVERYONE
14 ELSE, AMY WORTH AND ALL THE PEOPLE I HAVE SERVED WITH,
15 INCLUDING THE SEVEN THAT JOINED AFTER THE REST OF US HAD BEEN
16 ON HERE FOR QUITE A WHILE. YOU KNOW, THERE WAS SOME
17 TREPIDATION AS TO, WOW, WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN NOW. WE HAVE HAD A
18 PRETTY SOLID THING GOING HERE. THIS IS INSIDE BASEBALL, BUT
19 THE COMMISSION HAD BEEN FUNCTIONING PRETTY SMOOTHLY, WHAT
20 HAPPENS WHEN ALL OF A SUDDEN YOU HAVE A BUNCH OF TURN OVER AND
21 ONCE AGAIN WHAT A BLESSING TO HAVE THE COMMISSIONERS WHO HAVE
22 JOINED MORE RECENTLY, TO WORK WITH ALL OF YOU HAVE BEEN JUST
23 REALLY, REALLY GREAT. AND I ALSO DIDN'T MENTION COMMISSIONER
24 MACKENZIE DURING MY ABAG TWO MINUTE SPEECH LAST NIGHT, BUT HIS
25 RELATIONSHIP AND MINE WAS LESS ABOUT ABAG AND MORE ABOUT HERE.



November 20, 2020

1 AND JAKE WAS THE VICE CHAIR WHEN I WAS CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION
2 FOR TWO YEARS. AND, YOU KNOW, WHEN THAT WAS ANNOUNCED HE CAME
3 OVER TO ME RIGHT AWAY AND SAID DAVE I WANT TO BE A TEAM
4 PLAYER, WHEREVER YOU GO, I GO. AND JAKE, YOU CERTAINLY LIVED
5 UP TO THAT TEAM PLAYER, MONIKER. EVERYONE HAS TO SHOW THEIR
6 STRIPES AT SOME POINT. AND YOU DID IN A TERRIFIC WAY. I DON'T
7 THINK EITHER OF US EVER THOUGHT WHEN YOU SAID THAT, THAT WHEN
8 I GO OFF THE COMMISSION, YOU WOULD BE GOING OFF THE
9 COMMISSION, SO I KNOW YOU HAVE A LITTLE BIT MORE TIME HERE ON
10 THE COMMISSION, BUT THANK YOU, THANK YOU FOR ALL OF YOUR
11 SUPPORT. AND ALL -- AGAIN, IF I COULD GO RIGHT DOWN THE ROLL
12 CALL AND THEN WRITE DOWN THE ROSTER OF SEVERAL HUNDRED
13 EMPLOYEES, LITERALLY I WOULD. OBVIOUSLY I CAN'T DO THAT AND
14 OBVIOUSLY SUCH TRIBUTE TO THE REST OF YOU IS, YOU KNOW, IS
15 SORT OF MINIMALIZED BY MY INABILITY TO DO THAT. I WISH IT
16 WASN'T. SO, I'LL BE AROUND, OBVIOUSLY. I'LL BE CONNECTED, AND
17 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL IN MY NEW CAPACITY IN THE
18 FUTURE, AND AGAIN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SO IF THE COMMISSIONERS DON'T MIND, I
21 AM SURE YOU ALL WANT TO SAY SOMETHING, BUT CAN I DO ALL THREE
22 OF THEM, AND THEN WHEN YOU GET THE FLOOR, YOU CAN JUST ADDRESS
23 ALL THREE AT ONE TIME? I'M GETTING SOME HEAD SHAKING. I THINK
24 THAT'S PROBABLY THE MOST EFFICIENT WAY TO DO IT. DAVE, AGAIN,
25 OUR DEEP THANKS TO YOU FOR TRULY UNDERSTANDING SERVICE TO THE



November 20, 2020

1 COMMISSION OVER THE YEARS. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO NOTE THE SANTA
2 CLARA BOARD OF SUPERVISORS DIDN'T GIVE YOUR SEAT ON THE
3 COMMISSION A CHANCE TO EVEN COOL DOWN BEFORE APPOINTING
4 SUPERVISOR CINDY CHAVEZ AS A REPLACEMENT EARLIER THIS WEEK.
5 CINDY IS NO STRANGERS TO MOST OF US SHE'S BEEN A LEADER ON THE
6 ABAG BOARD AND WORKED ON THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
7 AUTHORITY WORKING WITH LEGISLATURE TO ADVANCE ASSEMBLY BILL
8 1487. SORRY TO LOSE YOU TO SACRAMENTO DAVE BUT CERTAINLY WE'RE
9 HAPPY TO HAVE CINDY. I GOT TO WORK WITH YOU CINDY OVER THE
10 YEARS AND SHE'S JUST A MARVELOUS PERSON. MOTION BY SPERING,
11 SECOND BY WORTH. AND I WOULD LIKE TO CALL FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ONE ABSTENTION. MY FATHER SAYS YOU
17 SHOULD VOTE FOR YOURSELF BECAUSE IF YOU LOSE BY ONE VOTE.

18

19 **DAVID CORTESE:** FOR THE RECORD THAT WAS MY FIRST ABSTENTION IN
20 THE HISTORY OF ALL MY VOTES ON THE COMMISSION. I WANT TO MAKE
21 THAT CLEAR.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THERE YOU GO. GO OUT WITH A BANG.
24 LOOKING FOR A MOTION AND SECOND ON RESOLUTION 1442 FOR OUR
25 GOOD FRIEND TONY TAVARES AT CALTRANS.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JAKE ON THAT.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HILLARY IS WAVING AT ME I'M GOING GIVE
9 IT TO HILLARY. ON A PERSONAL NOTE, I WANT TO SAY I HAVE TRULY
10 LOVED WORKING WITH THIS GUY. I WOULD GIVE HIM A PHONE CALL,
11 AND HE WOULD CALL RIGHT BACK, AND I THINK HE EVEN CALLED ME
12 BACK ONCE ON VACATION. HE WAS ALWAYS THERE TO HELP ME WITH
13 PROBLEMS THEY WAS HAVING MAYBE WITH CALTRANS IN MY OWN
14 DISTRICT. SOMETIMES HE COULD HELP ME, SOMETIMES HE COULD NOT,
15 SOMETIMES WE DON'T HAVE THAT STOP LINE? SUNOL, BUT MAYBE WE'LL
16 GET THERE SOME DAY TONY. I APPRECIATED YOUR WIT. I APPRECIATED
17 YOUR PROFESSIONALISM. YOU HAVE BEEN WONDERFUL TO WORK WITH. I
18 WOULD LIKE TO READ THIS. TONY HAS BEEN A MEMBER OF THE
19 COMMITTEE AND BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY AD-HOC RECOVERY WORKING
20 GROUP HELPING BATA AND CALTRANS SOLVE THE TRANSPORTATION
21 PROBLEMS DUE TO COVID-19 AND SOLVE TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES
22 PRESENTED. CALTRANS DISTRICT FOUR DIRECTOR AND MEMBER OF BAY
23 AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY TONY PLAYED A COOL
24 ROLE -- PLAYED A ROLE IN DEVELOPING -- I'M STARTING TO TALK
25 TOO FAST. IN DEVELOPING THE REGION'S EXPRESS LANE NETWORK AND



November 20, 2020

1 DID NOT FLINCH MAKING CHANGES NEEDED TO ALIGN POLICIES WITH
2 TEMPORARY TRAVEL PATTERNS AND DYNAMICS. WHEREAS TONY WAS
3 COORDINATED THE 19 -- 2019 PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN CALTRANS AND
4 BATA TO COMPLETE THE REPLACEMENT OF 32 EXPANSION JOINTS. WHOA.
5 ON THE UPPER DECK THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE INCLUDING THE
6 SAFETY PROMOTERS AND AVOIDING CLOSURES OF THE SPAN WHEREAS THE
7 BAY AREA LOSS WILL BE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA'S GAIN AS TONY IS
8 LEAVING THE COMMISSION AND CALTRANS DISTRICT FOUR TO BRING HIS
9 CONSIDERABLE SKILLS TO THE CALTRANS DISTRICT BOARD TO HELP LOS
10 ANGELES AND SURROUNDING COMMUNITY PREPARE FOR THE OLYMPIC
11 GAMES TO ELIMINATE MOBILITY CHALLENGES OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
12 IS FAMOUS NOW BE IT RESOLVED COMMISSION STAFF OF MTC THANK
13 TONY FOR HIS MANY CONTRIBUTIONS TO BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION
14 NETWORK, AND USING HIS INNOVATIVE APPROACHES FOR THE PEOPLE OF
15 THE BAY AREA, AND CONTINUING HIS ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION HOBBIES
16 BIKING, RIDING BIKES AND MOTOR VEHICLES. I DIDN'T KNOW YOU
17 RIDE MOTOR VEHICLES MOTOR CYCLES. TONY I WOULD LIKE TO LEARN
18 MY ABOUT THAT. WOULD YOU LIKE TO COMMENT.

19

20 **TONY TAVARES:** THANK YOU CHAIR. FOR THE KIND WORDS. IT'S BEEN
21 AN HONOR AND PRIVILEGE TO SERVE WITH ALL OF YOU AND BE PART OF
22 THIS COMMISSION AND I WANT TO THANK EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE
23 MCMILLAN THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND YOUR GUIDANCE HERE
24 IN THE BAY AREA IN THIS REGION. IT'S INCREDIBLE WHAT YOU'RE
25 DOING AND WHAT YOUR TEAM IS DOING. YOUR TEAM IS SECOND TO NONE



November 20, 2020

1 AND IT'S BEEN AN HONOR TO WORK WITH IN COLLABORATION ON SO
2 MANY PROJECTS AROUND THE BAY AREA TO YOU AND ALL THE
3 COMMISSIONERS ONCE AGAIN THANK YOU FOR THIS PRIVILEGE TO BE
4 HERE AND SERVING WITH ALL OF YOU. I'M GOING TO MISS ALL OF
5 YOU. THE BAY AREA IS MY HOME. I WAS BORN IN OAKLAND. DIDN'T
6 GROW UP IN OAKLAND, BUT THIS IS MY HOME. I HOPE TO RETURN SOME
7 DAY AND I LOOK FORWARD TO ALL OF THE GREAT THINGS YOU WILL BE
8 ACCOMPLISHING IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AGAIN, I'LL GIVE
11 EVERYBODY A CHANCE AT ONCE BUT I REMEMBER THE SECOND WAS
12 HILLARY. WHO WAS THE FIRST? WAS IT JAKE?

13

14 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JAKE, AND HILLARY ON THE MOTION. ROLL
17 CALL PLEASE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE MOTION
20 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANK YOU TONY
23 FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE FOR US. AND IF YOUR REPLACEMENT
24 DOESN'T ANSWER MY PHONE CALL, I'M GOING TO CALL YOU.

25



November 20, 2020

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** [LAUGHTER]

2

3 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SO WITH THAT I'M NOW MOVING TO OUR
4 THIRD RESOLUTION, 1443 FOR JEANNIE BRUINS, AND I CAN TELL YOU,
5 THIS IS A TIME IN WHICH I WILL JUST VERY ELOQUENTLY SAY, I
6 THINK TERM LIMITS SUCK. I THINK THAT JEANNE HAS BEEN SUCH A
7 GREAT ADDITION TO THIS COMMISSION. I ABSOLUTELY LOVE THIS
8 WOMAN. SHE'S BEEN SO FRIENDLY. SHE'S BEEN FUN TO GET TO KNOW,
9 AND YOU KNOW, SHE SOMETIMES GETS VERY PASSIONATE, AND I, FOR
10 ONE, APPRECIATE WHEN YOU GET PASSIONATE IN ELECTED SERVICE.
11 SO, WITH THAT I'M GOING ASK FOR A MOTION ON 1443.

12

13 **SAM LICCARDO:** SO MOVED.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU LICCARDO.

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SECOND DUTRA-VERNACI. ACTUALLY YOU HAVE
20 A LOT OF SECOND THERE IS JEANNE BUT I HAD TO PICK ONE. WHEREAS
21 COMMISSIONER JEANNIE BRUINS IS STEPPING DOWN FROM THE
22 COMMISSION AFTER NEARLY FOUR YEARS OF DEDICATED SERVICE
23 REPRESENTING THE 15 CITIES AND TOWNS OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND
24 AFTER EIGHT YEARS ON THE LOS ALTOS CITY COUNCIL A PERIOD OF
25 WHICH SHE SERVED BOTH TERMS AS MAYOR AND MAYOR PRO TEMPORE AND



November 20, 2020

1 WAS REELECTED TO OFFICE IN 2016 AND WHEREAS IN HER WORK AT MTC
2 JEANNE CONCISELY WAS REPRESENTED IN THE INTEREST OF CITIES IN
3 SANTA CLARA AND THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. HER CAREER AT HEWLETT
4 PACKARD HELPED BRING MTC A TECHNOLOGY UNDERSTANDING OF THE
5 INDUSTRY AND IN ADDITION HER PRIVATE SECTOR EXPERIENCE SHE
6 ALSO HAS AMASSED AN IMPRESSIVE RECORD OF PUBLIC SERVICE THAT
7 INCLUDES A MEMBER OF THE LOS ALTOS PLANNING COMMISSION AS WELL
8 AS SERVICE ON THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS, VTA AND SILICON VALLEY
9 CLEAN ENERGY. NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT STAFF AND
10 COMMISSIONERS AT MTC THANK JEANNE FOR HER SERVICE AND FOR
11 CONSISTENTLY MANNER IN WHICH SHE LEARNED MORE ABOUT THE
12 COMMISSION BUSINESS AND EXTEND TO JEANNE AND HER FAMILY BEST
13 WISHES AND GOOD HEALTH NOW AND IN THE FUTURE. JEANNE DO YOU
14 HAVE THOUGHTS YOU WANT TO LEAVE US WITH?

15

16 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YES FIRST OF ALL, I AGREE WHOLEHEARTEDLY WITH
17 WHAT MY COLLEAGUES, DAVE AND TONY HAVE SAID IN TERMS OF WHAT A
18 PLEASURE IT'S BEEN WORKING WITH THIS GROUP. BUT I HAVE BEEN
19 HONORED AND PRIVILEGED TO SERVE WITH SUCH A DISTINGUISHED
20 GROUP OF PEOPLE. EACH OF US COME WITH OUR LOCAL LENS, YET WE
21 ALL RISE TO THE OCCASION, AND WE ARE SO COMMITTED TO THE
22 REGION AS A WHOLE. AND IT'S AN IMPRESSIVE GROUP OF PEOPLE. AND
23 IT TAKES A LOT OF COURAGE TO BE ABLE TO DO THAT, PARTICULARLY
24 WHEN YOU'RE REPRESENTING YOUR LOCAL AREAS. IT'S ALSO BEEN A
25 PRIVILEGE TO WORK WITH SUCH A WONDERFUL AND TALENTED STAFF. I



November 20, 2020

1 AGREE, SECOND TO NONE, AND I'M SO GLAD THEY WAS INVOLVED
2 ACTIVELY IN THE RECRUITMENT OF YOU, THERESE, BECAUSE I REALLY
3 THINK YOU HELP SET THE STANDARD IN TERMS OF REALLY WORKING
4 COLLABORATIVELY. YOU WORK REALLY WELL WITH ALL OF US AS
5 COMMISSIONERS, BUT TO ME, MOST IMPORTANT, IS ALL THE TRANSIT
6 AGENCIES THAT WE WORK WITH, WITH ALL OF THEIR OWN SPECIAL
7 NEEDS AND INTERESTS, AND CONCERNS AND SUCH, THAT YOU HAVE
8 ALWAYS HAD THAT MAGICAL TOUCH, AND THE REASONS I WANTED TO
9 BRING YOU BACK TO MTC WAS BECAUSE OF THAT PARTICULAR TALENT
10 AND YOU HAVE PUT THAT TO WORK. AND ALL OF YOU, JIM SPERING FOR
11 LEADING THE WHOLE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE I THINK IT'S MADE A
12 BIG DIFFERENCE FOR ALL OF US. SO THANK YOU. AND THE OTHER
13 THING IS, THERESE, FOR YOU AND YOUR STAFF, I DON'T KNOW HOW
14 MANY TIMES YOU HAVE NOTICED, I WEAR A DRAGON FLY PERIODICALLY,
15 THE UNIQUE QUALITIES OF THE DRAGON FLY CAN MOVE FORWARD,
16 BACKWARDS LEFT AND RIGHT AND UP-AND-DOWN AND BEING ABLE TO
17 MOVE IN THOSE THREE DIMENSIONS, I THINK THAT'S WHAT STAFF HAS
18 TO DO SO MANY TIMES WITH THE TUGS AND PULLS, AND I THINK THIS
19 BODY ALLOWS YOU TO DO THAT AND WE ALWAYS HAVE TO BE THINKING
20 IN THOSE TERMS. THANK YOU TO YOU ALL. I WILL MISS YOU GUYS.
21 THIS ISN'T WHAT I WANT, BUT SO BE IT.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND
24 ON 1443. THANK YOU TO THE COMMISSION FOR ALLOWING ME TO DO



November 20, 2020

1 THESE SEPARATELY. I FELT IT WAS IMPORTANT AS OPPOSED TO DOING
2 THEM AS A BATCH. WITH THAT KIMBERLY ROLL CALL VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE MOTION
5 PASSES WITH ONE ABSTENTION.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO AT THIS POINT
8 I'M GOING TO OPEN UP THE PANELIST SECTION TO ANYBODY WHO WOULD
9 LIKE TO SPEAK, THAT INCLUDES STAFF IF THEY WANT TO SAY
10 ANYTHING, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. ANYBODY CERTAINLY HAS A SHOT
11 AT THESE THREE AT WILL. OUR FIRST CONTESTANT IS JAKE
12 MACKENZIE. WHOA, JAKE, KEEP IT CLEAN.

13

14 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** HEY, I'M WEARING MY ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
15 AGENCY SHIRT TODAY IN HONOR OF THE FACTS THAT IT WILL BECOME
16 YET AGAIN THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY AND NOT THE
17 ENVIRONMENTAL POLLUTION AGENCY. JUST NAILING MY COLORS TO THE
18 MASS. CORTESE HAS BEEN KIND TO ME. CORTESE'S PROBLEM WAS HE
19 WAS TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT WHEN HE WAS CHAIR OF MTC, AND I
20 WOULD BE SITTING AT THE DAIS AND LOOKING AT MY PHONE AND
21 DAVE'S TEXT WOULD COME IN THAT BART'S RUNNING TEN MINUTES
22 LATE. IT WAS ALWAYS A PLEASURE WORKING WITH DAVE. I KNEW OF
23 HIM AND HIS FAMILY FROM PAST KNOWLEDGE OF REGIONAL ACTIVITIES,
24 AND IT TURNED OUT TO BE A GREAT PLEASURE WORKING WITH HIM AS
25 CHAIR, AND OBSERVING THE GREAT FINESSE WITH WHICH HE HANDLED A



November 20, 2020

1 VERY, VERY DIFFICULT TIME FOR BOTH MTC AND ABAG. AND I INCLUDE
2 JULIE PIERCE IN THESE REMARKS. AND AS I SAID LAST NIGHT, AT
3 ABAG EXEC COMMITTEE, I HAVE BEEN ON THEIR COAT TAILS, WAS ABLE
4 TO SIGN THE CONTRACT, WHERE THE STAFFS MERGED, BUT DAVE HAD
5 DONE THE HEAVY LIFTING, AND I GOT TO SIGN THE DOCUMENT. BUT
6 DAVE, I KNOW THAT YOU'LL DO JUST A GRAND JOB UP IN SACRAMENTO.
7 TAVARES UP IN LOS ANGELES, I DON'T KNOW, IT SEEMS
8 INSURMOUNTABLE PROBLEM BUT I SUPPORT THAT YOU WILL DO JUST
9 FINE AND I CERTAINLY HAVE ENJOYED THE RELATIVELY SHORT TIME WE
10 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO WORK TOGETHER AND YOU KNOW ME I'M A GUY WHO
11 LIKES TO HAVE FEN. BRUINS, TERM LIMITS, THE ONLY OTHER WAY TO
12 LEAVE MTC IS TO LOSE AN ELECTION WHICH I JUST DID, AND I'M NOT
13 SURE WISH I WOULD RATHER BE DOING STEPPING DOWN BECAUSE OF
14 TERM LIMITS OR STEPPING DOWN BECAUSE I LOST AN ELECTION. BUT I
15 HAD TO KNOW IT'S BEEN A GOOD RUN I'M SORRY TO SEE YOU GO. AN
16 INTELLIGENT PERSON WHO STUCK TO HER GUNS THAT'S WHAT I LIKE.
17 THANK YOU CHAIR FOR ALLOWING THESE COMMENTS.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAKE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO SAY
20 I DON'T THINK WE'VE SEEN THE LAST OF YOU. VICE CHAIR PEDROZA?

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I THINK YOU HAVE DONE A
23 GREAT JOB. I WANT TO START WITH SENATOR CORTESE E AS A NEWER
24 COMMISSIONER YOU SET THE EXAMPLE OF WHAT A COMMISSIONER SHOULD
25 DO, YOU HAVE ALWAYS CONDUCTED YOURSELF IN A PROFESSIONAL WAY



November 20, 2020

1 AND YOU BROUGHT PEOPLE WITH YOU AND I ENJOY BEING ABLE TO CALL
2 YOU FOR YOUR MENTORSHIP ADVICE, I UNDERSTAND THE HISTORY OF
3 MTC AND THAT'S ALWAYS A GREAT SIGN OF A LEADER. WE CAN
4 COMIMPLEMENT MANY PEOPLE ON THIS SCREEN BUT YOU DESERVE A LOT.
5 WE NEED YOU IN SACRAMENTO. TONY TAVARES, THANK YOU. YOU
6 ANSWERED THE CALL NOT JUST FOR CHAIR HAGGERTY BUT FOR MANY
7 PEOPLE, AND I APPRECIATE YOU CAME DOWN TO NAPA MULTIPLE TIMES
8 YOU MADE US FEEL LIKE WE MATTERED IN THE BIG STATE, KIND OF
9 SYSTEM, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT, BECAUSE WE DID MATTER,
10 AND YOU CONDUCTED YOURSELF IN A WAY THAT YOU BROUGHT
11 IMPORTANCE TO OUR LOCAL ISSUES. SO I APPRECIATE THAT. AND TO
12 COMMISSIONER JEANNIE BRUINS, THANK YOU. SCOTT TALKED ABOUT THE
13 PASSION, AND THAT WAS CLEAR. BUT I THINK WHAT YOU SAID ABOUT
14 THE DRAGON FLY, IT EPITOMIZES WHO YOU ARE AND WHAT WE DO. WE
15 ALWAYS HAVE TO GO UP-AND-DOWN AND LEFT AND RIGHT, AND WE NEED
16 MORE PEOPLE LIKE THAT. AND I'LL JUST SAY THIS, CHAIR, THIS
17 ORGANIZATION HAS A GREAT REPUTATION FOR A LOT OF GREAT REASONS
18 BECAUSE OUR STAFF, BUT IT'S THE PEOPLE BEHIND THE ORGANIZATION
19 THAT GIVE IT CREDIBILITY, THE HARD WORK PEOPLE DON'T SEE.
20 THESE ARE TOUGH DAYS LOSING GOOD PEOPLE. BUT IT'S ALSO THE
21 CULTURE WE HAVE BUILT IN CONTRIBUTING MAKING THE FABRIC OF
22 MTC. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALFREDO GREAT WORDS.
25 COMMISSIONER MAYOR LICCARDO.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **SAM LICCARDO:** I WANT TO CHIME IN AS WELL AND FIRST SAY TO
3 DAVE, YOU KNOW, OUR SHARED FAITH TRADITION TELLS US BLESSED
4 ARE THE PEACE MAKERS, AND I APPRECIATE HOW YOU REALLY
5 ENDEAVORED TO TRY TO MAKE PEACE WHENEVER THERE WAS AN ISSUE
6 AND DISPUTE AND I THINK CLEARLY MOST EVIDENT TO ME WAS THE MTC
7 ABAG MERGER WHERE YOU INVESTED SO MUCH OF YOUR TIME PERSONALLY
8 AND DEEPLY AND I THINK WHEN MANY OF US INCLUDING MYSELF WERE
9 WILLING TO SIT BACK AND LET FOLKS HASH IT OUT, YOU WERE THE
10 ONE WILLING TO HASH AND I APPRECIATE THAT, AND I KNOW THAT HAS
11 BEEN A STANDARD FOR YOU FOR MANY YEARS. I KNOW WE'RE BOTH IS I
12 SICILIAN BUT I AM PROBABLY MORE INCLINED TO BE THE FIGHTING
13 SICILIAN TYPE, YOU ARE CLEARLY THE PEACE MAKERS, AND I FEEL
14 THOSE SKILLS WILL SERVE YOU VERY WELL IN SACRAMENTO WE NEED
15 MORE PEACE MAKERS IN THIS WORLD. TONY, I WANT TO THANK YOU. WE
16 HAVE COME TO YOU SO MANY TIMES FOR HELP, AND FOR THINGS THAT
17 HAVE NOTHING TO DO WITH MOVING PEOPLE ON FREEWAYS, I PROBABLY
18 SPENT MOST OF MY TIME TALKING TO YOU ABOUT HOW GETTING HOUSING
19 BUILT ON CALTRANS SITES AND YOU NEVER HESITATED TO SAY WE'RE
20 GOING TO TRY TO FIND A WAY IF IT'S LAWFUL. WE'RE GOING TO FIND
21 A WAY. I REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR PASSION FOR DOING THE RIGHT
22 THING. LORD KNOWS YOU MUST HAVE PASSION IF YOU'RE GOING DOWN
23 TO LA TO TRY TO FIX THEIR FREEWAY PROBLEMS. GOD LOVE YOU FOR
24 YOUR COMMITMENT TO PUBLIC SERVICE. AND I KNOW YOU'RE GOING TO
25 DO GREAT THINGS DOWN THERE. SO THANK YOU FOR ALL THAT YOU HAVE



November 20, 2020

1 GIVEN TO US UP HERE IN THE BAY AREA WITH YOUR LEADERSHIP. AND
2 FINALLY TO MY FRIEND JEANNE, YOU KNOW, I PROBABLY -- YOU KNOW,
3 I KNOW I TOOK CREDIT FOR SOMETHING YOU SHOULD HAVE GOTTEN MUCH
4 MORE CREDIT FOR, WHICH WAS BACK WHEN WE WERE IN A LOG JAM OVER
5 THIS WHOLE CALTRAIN ISSUE, AND WE HAD A LOT OF FOLKS
6 THROUGHOUT THE REGION THAT WERE GOING TO DIFFERENT DIRECTIONS
7 IT WAS YOU THAT STARTED THE BALL ROLLING AND I REMEMBER YOU
8 CALLING MY ONE NIGHT SAYING WE GOT TO DO SOMETHING GET BACK TO
9 THE TABLE AND PUSH. I THOUGHT YOU WERE CRAZY, BUT YOU WERE
10 RIGHT, IT WAS SOMETHING THAT NEEDED TO BE DONE AND YOU ALWAYS
11 BROUGHT THAT PASSION TO EVERYTHING YOU DO, AND I AM JUST VERY
12 BLESSED TO HAVE SERVED WITH YOU ON VTA AND HERE AT MTC, AND I
13 KNEW YOU ALWAYS CAME INCREDIBLY WELL PREPARED WITH THE FACT
14 FOR EVERY DISCUSSION AND I APPRECIATE THAT DEEPLY. I KNOW IT'S
15 FAR TOO SOON FOR YOU TO BE RETIRING FROM PUBLIC SERVICE SO I
16 KNOW WE'LL BE SEEING YOU IN SOME FORM OR ANOTHER SOON I HOPE.
17 THANKS JEANNE.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL SAID SAM. GREAT JOB. GOING TO MY
20 COLLEAGUE, CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, COMMISSIONER.

21

22 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR HAGGERTY. FIRST
23 I'LL START WITH DAVE BECAUSE HIM AND I SERVED ON THE OFFICE AT
24 BAY SUBCOMMITTEES, I DIDN'T GET TO KNOW DAVE AS WELL AS I DID
25 SOME OF THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS. HOWEVER, THAT BEING SAID, I'M



November 20, 2020

1 HAPPY THE TIME I DID GET TO SPEND WITH HIM, I DID GET TO KNOW
2 HIM A LITTLE BIT SO NOW THAT HE'S GOING TO BE IN SACRAMENTO AS
3 ONE OF OUR SENATORS, I WON'T FEEL SHY CALLING HIM SHOULD THERE
4 BE ANY ISSUES I WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS WITH HIM. DAVE FOR THAT.
5 AND WHEN TONY SHOWED UP WITH THE LAST NAME TAVARES I WAS
6 TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IF WE WERE RELATED, WHO KNOWS, STILL
7 COULD BE, I WANT TO THANK, SAM TALKED ABOUT HOMELESS ON
8 CALTRANS PROPERTY AND IT'S INTERESTING BECAUSE THAT'S
9 CERTAINLY ONE OF THE REASONS I CALLED TONY FOR HELP AS A LAST
10 RESORT IN UNION CITY WHEN WE HAD HOMELESS ON OUR CALTRANS
11 PROPERTY BUT IT WAS A FREEWAY OFFRAMP SO NOT A GREAT LOCATION
12 FOR IT, SO TONY STEPPED IN AND TOOK CARE OF THAT SITUATION,
13 WHICH WE TREMENDOUSLY APPRECIATED. AND EVERYTHING ELSE YOU
14 HAVE DONE FOR THE EAST BAY AS WELL AS THE REGION, TONY, IT WAS
15 APPRECIATED. YOU WERE A GREAT ROLE MODEL IN WHAT IT SHOULD
16 LOOK LIKE WITH COOPERATION BETWEEN OUR AGENCIES. I APPRECIATE
17 THAT, AND STAFF, TO SEE OUR LOSSES WITH YOU LEAVING. AND
18 JEANNE GOODNESS, JEANNE AND I WERE TWO OF THE SEVEN THAT YOU
19 TALKED ABOUT FOUR YEARS AGO COMING IN, THE NEW CLASS, AND
20 THOUGHT WHAT THE HECK. JEANNE BEING ONE OF THOSE CLASS
21 MEMBERS, I GOT TO KNOW, SHE IS PORTUGUESE, AND SHE SPEAKS THE
22 LANGUAGE, AND SHE CERTAINLY ON THE OTHER SIDE OF DUMBARTON
23 BRIDGE, I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS AFTER WE BOTH CAME ON
24 THE BOARD I CALLED HER UP AND SAID LET'S HAVE COFFEE AND



November 20, 2020

1 EXPLAINED TO HER HOW IMPORTANT THE CORRIDOR WAS TO THE SOUTH.
2 THANK YOU JEANNE FOR YOUR SERVICE IT'S JUST SO VERY IMPORTANT.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MAYOR JOSEFOWITZ?

5

6 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO, I JUST WANT TO ALSO JOIN IN. NOTHING
7 PARTICULARLY NEW TO SAY, BUT, YOU KNOW, I HAVE LEARNED SO MUCH
8 FROM YOU, DAVE, ON SO MANY THINGS, AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT
9 PARTICULARLY STANDS OUT WAS SOMETHING THAT HAPPENED WHEN I WAS
10 REALLY NEW ON THE COMMISSION, WHICH WAS AROUND THE MERGER. AND
11 I KNOW HADN'T BEEN AT ALL INVOLVED IN THE MERGER DISCUSSION. I
12 WASN'T ON THE COMMISSION WHEN THE BIG MERGER DISCUSSIONS
13 HAPPENED. BUT THE WAY THAT YOU KIND OF HANDLED THAT AND HOW
14 YOU HAVE HANDLE IT ON AN ONGOING BASIS HAS BEEN REALLY
15 REMARKABLE AND I THINK SPEAKS TO THE POWER THAT REGIONALISM
16 CAN PLAY AND WHAT WE ALL COME HERE TO DO AT MTC AND I HAVE
17 JUST LEARNED A HUGE AMOUNT FROM YOU ABOUT HOW TO HANDLE MYSELF
18 AS KIND OF A REGIONALIST ON THIS COMMISSION. SO THANK YOU. AND
19 TONY, I'M SORRY THAT WE COULDN'T -- MY HOPE IS THAT YOUR
20 LEGACY IN THE BEHAVIOR COULD BE SOME BUS LANES ON THE BAY
21 BRIDGE SORRY WE COULDN'T DELIVER THAT WHILE YOU WERE HERE, BUT
22 MAYBE IN LA, YOU CAN PUT IN SOME BUS PLACE. I APPRECIATE
23 WORKING TOGETHER. AND JEANNE, WE REPRESENT VERY DIFFERENT
24 CITIES, BUT WE HAVE MANAGED TO FIND COMMON GROUND, AND I THINK
25 THAT'S, YOU KNOW, THAT'S A TESTAMENT TO WHAT MTC DOES, FOR



November 20, 2020

1 THIS REGION, THERE IS NOTHING THAT YOU SHARE, BUT WHEN YOU GET
2 TO THE DISCUSSIONS AND SHARE WITH PEOPLE AND REALLY GET TO
3 KNOW THEM AND HEAR THEIR CONCERNS AND THEY DO THE SAME FOR
4 YOU, YOU FIND OUT EXPRESS LANES ARE REALLY SOMETHING THAT YOU
5 CAN GET ON BOARD WITH. SO, I REALLY ENJOYED GETTING TO KNOW
6 YOU AND WORKING TOGETHER, AND I KNOW WE'RE -- IT'S NOT
7 GOODBYE.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU NICK. GOING TO MOVE TO AIM --
10 AMY WORTH. COMMISSIONER WORTH.

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I AM HONORED TO JOIN THE CHORUS
13 OF GREAT RECOGNITION IN OUR THREE COMMISSIONERS THAT ARE GOING
14 TO BE RETIRING AND MOVING ON TO OTHER ADVENTURES I WANT TO
15 START WITH DAVE HE AND I SERVED AS CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THE
16 COMMISSION AND IT WAS A JOY AND HONOR TO WORK WITH DAVE. I
17 THINK EVERYTHING THAT HAS BEEN SAID ABOUT HIM IS SO TRUE. HIS
18 DIPLOMACY, HIS SEEING THE LONG PICTURE BEING ABLE TO BRING
19 PEOPLE TOGETHER IN TOUGH TIMES DURING CONTROVERSIAL ISSUES,
20 AND HIS CALM. I JUST THINK HE HAS GIVEN SO MUCH. AND THE THING
21 ABOUT MTC IS THAT WE UNDERSTAND EACH OTHER'S ISSUES AND
22 PRIORITIES AND ARE ABLE TO COME BELIEVE IT TO FIND THE COMMON
23 CONCURRENCE AND GOOD FOR THE BAY AREA. AND DAVE IS JUST ONE OF
24 THOSE REGIONAL LEADERS THAT DOES THAT SO BEAUTIFULLY. AND SO
25 SINCERELY, AND SO I KNOW THE CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE SENATE IS



November 20, 2020

1 GOING TO BE SO FORTUNATE TO HAVE THAT -- THOSE TALENTS, AND
2 THAT PERSPECTIVE, AND EXPERIENCE. AND, YOU KNOW, IT'S AMAZING,
3 IN CALIFORNIA, RARELY DO YOU SEE, 1, 2, 3 GENERATIONS OF
4 PUBLIC SERVICE THAT'S EMBODIED IN DAVE'S FAMILY. AND HE'S
5 CLEARLY CARRYING THE TORCH, AND AGAIN IT'S BEEN SUCH A JOY TO
6 SERVE TOGETHER. AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK TONY, YOU KNOW, WE
7 HAVE -- AS YOU KNOW, CREATED THIS TASK FORCE, AND HE HAS BEEN
8 A PHENOMENAL MEMBER OF THAT. YOU KNOW, I REMEMBER HIS FIRST
9 DAY ON THE COMMISSION, HE ARRIVED AND WE WERE ALL ON THE METRO
10 CENTER AND EVERYBODY IS COMING TO TONY TO INTRODUCE
11 THEMSELVES, AND I KNOW WE WERE ALL CALLING WITH VARIOUS
12 PRIORITIES AND HE HANDLE IT WITH GRACE AND CHARM AND HIS
13 COLLEAGUES SOME WE KNOW WELL IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY FROM
14 CALTRANS WERE JUST PRAISING HIM AND SAYING WE ARE SO LUCKY TO
15 HAVE TONY TAVARES IN THE BAY AREA. SO OUR GREAT LOSS IS LOS
16 ANGELES'S GAIN. BUT I KNOW HE WILL -- I KNOW HE WILL SEE LOTS
17 OF THIS GREAT STAR IN TRANSPORTATION NOW AND IN THE FUTURE.
18 AND I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU, TOO, THE BRIDGES ARE SO
19 IMPORTANT TO OUR REGION, AND YOU UNDERSTOOD THAT SO DEEPLY AND
20 SO CAREFULLY. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU HAVE DONE FOR
21 ALL THE CITIES AND ALL THE ELECTED'S SERVING ON THIS
22 COMMISSION. GENIE IS NOT IN THE MEETING BUT SHE'S AN ATTENDEE,
23 I LOVED GETTING TO KNOW JEANNE. THERE WERE SEVERAL OF US THAT
24 CAME TO THE COMMISSION MEETINGS BECAUSE WE DIDN'T KNOW WHAT
25 THE TRAFFIC WOULD BE, SO JULIE AND I WOULD BE IN MY LITTLE TWO



November 20, 2020

1 SEE THOR CAR AND HE WOULD ALWAYS GO AND LOOK AT ANDY F'S
2 IMPROVEMENTS TO THE BAY BRIDGE TO INCREASE THOSE CAR POLL
3 LANES AND ACROSS AND CHECK OUT THE FACILITIES AND KEEPING AN
4 EYE ON THE BRIDGES AND JEANNE WOULD BE THERE AND CAROL DUTRA-
5 VERNACI, AND JAKE WOULD COME FROM SONOMA THE FARTHEST AWAY AND
6 WE NEVER ANYHOW WHAT THE TRAFFIC WAS GOING TO BE LIKE AND IT
7 WAS GREAT TO GET TO KNOW YOU JEANNE, YOUR PASSION AND
8 COMMITMENT FOR THE WORK YOU DO, BOTH LOCALLY AND THE
9 CHALLENGES IN YOUR COMMUNITY BUT ALSO REGIONALLY, AND I THINK
10 SAM SPOKE SO WELL ABOUT YOUR COMMITMENT TO CALTRAIN, AND I
11 REMEMBER TALKING WITH YOU WHEN EVERYTHING STARTED TO FALL
12 APART, AND YOU HAD THAT PASSIONATE, YOU KNOW, COMMITMENT TO
13 MAKE THIS WORK. AND I THINK YOU AND SAM WERE FANTASTIC
14 PARTNERS IN WORKING TO BRING EVERYBODY TOGETHER AND SAVE A
15 SITUATION. AND CLEARLY THE VOTERS RECOGNIZED THAT COMMITMENT
16 TO THE SYSTEM. AND THAT'S, IN TODAY'S WORLD, THAT'S A HUGE
17 RECOGNITION IN TERMS OF THE IMPORTANT WORK THAT YOU DID. SO, I
18 ALSO AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES WHO SAID, WE WILL LOOK FORWARD
19 TO SEEING YOU IN DIFFERENT ROLES IN THE FUTURE, AND AGAIN, I
20 WANT TO THANK YOU SO VERY MUCH FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO THIS
21 COMMISSION.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** AMY, THANKS FOR THAT. AND THERE WAS
24 MORE TO THAT COMMUTE IN THAT LITTLE TWO SEATER. I REMEMBER ONE
25 TIME AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, YOU TWO HAD THE TRUNK OF



November 20, 2020

1 YOUR CAR OPEN AND THERE WAS NEW PURSE IN THERE AND NEW CLOTHES
2 AND ALL KINDS OF STUFF, SO YOU WEREN'T JUST SAVING GREENHOUSE
3 GASSES TOGETHER. SO WITH THAT I'M GOING TO GO TO SOMEBODY WHO
4 IS MY MENTOR AND I REMEMBER WHEN I FIRST TOOK OFFICE 24 YEARS
5 AGO, THE SUPERVISOR I REPLACED SAID YOU NEED TO GET TO KNOW
6 JIM SPERING. JIM WILL BE A GOOD ALLY, FRIEND, AND SHE'S A
7 STRAIGHT SHOOTER. WITH THAT JIM SPERING.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU SCOTT. DAVE, I WANT TO THANK YOU.
10 THOSE ARE KIND WORDS. IT'S AN EXAMPLE OF YOUR CHARACTER. I
11 REMEMBER THE MEETINGS WHERE YOU WERE CHAIR THE TRADITION OF
12 THESE GREAT LEADERS COMING OUT OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE HAD
13 ROD, DIANE, JIM, REFERRED TO AS THE STATEMENT OF MTC, YOU HAVE
14 A KNACK OF BEING ABLE TO POINTING THOSE ISSUES THAT ARE VERY
15 IMPORTANT AND GIVE ADVICE. OVER THE YEARS. I CAN HONESTLY SAY
16 I DON'T THINK I HAVE BEEN SO HAPPY OR PROUD TO SEE SOMEONE GET
17 ELECTED TO A STATE OFFICE AS I HAVE YOU, DAVE. I THINK IT'S SO
18 WELL DESERVED. THE STATE NEEDS SOMEONE LIKE YOU NOT ONLY THE
19 REGION BUT THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA NEEDS INDIVIDUALS LIKE
20 YOURSELF AND YOU HAVE BEEN A GREAT FRIEND AND MENTOR AND
21 SOMEONE THAT HAS GIVEN ME GOOD ADVICE OVER THE YEARS. DAVE, I
22 CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH. YOU FALL IN THAT CATEGORY AS YOU GET
23 TO MY AGE, YOU LOOK BACK AT PEOPLE THAT YOU REALLY HAVE BEEN
24 BLESSED TO KNOW IN YOUR LIFE AND DAVE CORTESE IS ONE OF THOSE
25 PEOPLE FOR ME IN NEW LIFETIME. SO DAVE, THANK YOU. TONY, YOU



November 20, 2020

1 KNOW, OUT OF ALL THE CALTRANS PEOPLE I'VE WORKED WITH, YOU
2 HAVE BEEN SO RESPONSIVE. YOU KNOW, THE PROJECTS THAT YOU
3 SUPPORTED AND HELP US GET IN SOLANO COUNTY REALLY SERVED THE
4 REGION. SOME OF THEM I DON'T THINK WOULD HAVE HAPPENED WITHOUT
5 YOUR SUPPORT. SO I WANT TO THANK YOU. BUT YOU EVEN TOOK CARE
6 OF THE LITTLE STUFF LIKE THE GRAFFITI ON THE BRIDGE AND LITTLE
7 STUFF, THAT'S IMPORTANT. TONY, THANK YOU, YOU HAVE BEEN A
8 GREAT ASSET TO MTC. AND JEANNE, I HAVE ALWAYS REFERRED TO YOU
9 AS THE COMMISSION'S CONTRARIETY. YOU ALWAYS BRING UP THE
10 ISSUES THAT MOST OF US DON'T THINK ABOUT THAT ARE EXTREMELY
11 IMPORTANT, AND I REALLY FELT THAT QUALITY THAT YOU BROUGHT TO
12 THE COMMISSION HAS REALLY SERVED ALL OF US WELL. WE'RE GOING
13 TO LOSE A STRONG VOICE FOR THE SMALLER COMMUNITY. YOU KNOW, I
14 THINK YOU HAVE ALWAYS SPOKE UP FOR LOCAL CONTROL, YOU KNOW,
15 UNDER THE REGIONAL ENVIRONMENT THAT WE OPERATE WITH, AND THE
16 CITY SHOULD BE ABLE TO DETERMINE THEIR OWN DESTINY WITH HELP
17 AND ASSISTANCE WITHIN A REGION. JEANNE, I'M CERTAINLY GOING TO
18 MISS YOU, YOU REALLY HAVE PROVIDED A LOT OF GOOD GUIDANCE TO
19 THIS COMMISSION. YOU KNOW, OVER THE YEARS, I HAVE SERVED ON
20 THE COMMISSION PROBABLY THE LONGEST, TO THE BEST ELECTED
21 OFFICIALS GENERALLY END UP SERVING ON MTC. JUST GREAT LEADERS
22 AND PEOPLE THAT TAKE THE REGIONAL ROLE VERY SERIOUSLY. AND
23 DAVE, AND JEANNE, YOU HAVE CERTAINLY FULFILLED THAT. GREAT
24 INDIVIDUALS. YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WHO CAN REALLY ACCOMPLISH THINGS
25 AND UNDERSTAND WHAT THE ROLE OF A PUBLIC SERVANT IS OR ELECTED



November 20, 2020

1 OFFICIAL. DAVE, JEANNE AND TONY, THANK YOU. I HAVE REALLY BEEN
2 BLESSED BY ALL THREE OF YOU. THANK YOU.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. NOW THERESE MCMILLAN, OUR
5 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND I'LL BE REACHING OUT
8 TO THE THREE OF YOU INDIVIDUALLY, SO I'LL BE BRIEF HERE. YOU
9 KNOW, DAVE, I -- YOU KNOW, YOU REPRESENT THE WISDOM OF THE
10 LEGACY THAT YOU HAVE HAD HERE WITH MTC, AND PARTICULARLY, AS I
11 CAME BACK TO THE BAY AREA, REGROUNDING IN THAT WISDOM WAS
12 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT AS I GOT STARTED WITH MY TENURE HERE, AND
13 I TRULY LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING CLOSELY WITH YOU IN
14 SACRAMENTO. AND JEANNE, YOU WERE SORT OF THE FRESH FACE, THE
15 NEW WAVE THAT THE COMMISSION SAW, AND THAT PERSPECTIVE WAS
16 ALSO REALLY IMPORTANT. AND I REALLY APPRECIATED AS WELL, YOU
17 KNOW, SHARING, YOU KNOW, BEING A WOMAN LEADER, IN THE SPACE,
18 AND IN THIS REGION, AND THAT I REALLY TRULY VALUE. TONY, WE
19 WORKED IN -- JUMPED IN THE TRENCHES TOGETHER. [LAUGHTER] IN
20 TERMS OF WORKING ON THE GROUND, NOT ONLY AS A ROLE OF
21 COMMISSIONER, BUT AS A COLLEAGUE, YOU KNOW, TRYING TO TACKLE
22 HEAD ON THE ISSUES THAT WE SEE. AND OF COURSE, IF YOU GO TO
23 LA, I STILL KNOW A LOT ABOUT THAT, SO ANY WAY I CAN BE HELPFUL
24 IN THAT ARENA A IT WILL DEFINITELY CONNECT. BUT I WANT TO END,
25 YOU KNOW, SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF, ALTHOUGH OTHERS MAY



November 20, 2020

1 WANT TO SHARE OF COURSE, WE ARE ABLE TO DO OUR JOB, AS WELL AS
2 WE HAVE, BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT WE HAVE THE RESPECT AND SUPPORT
3 OF YOU. THE UNWAVERING, YOU KNOW, SUPPORT FOR US IN OUR WORK,
4 WHICH IS NOT EASY, WHICH IS THE BALANCING ACT, MOVING UPWARDS
5 AND DOWN AND BACK AND FORTH AS JEANNE SAYS. THAT EFFICACY
6 REQUIRES SUPPORT, AND THAT HAS BEEN SO REMARKABLE, AND
7 CONSISTENT, AND APPRECIATED, THAT IN SERVING THE PUBLIC IN
8 TRUST OF ALMOST 800 -- EXCUSE ME -- ALMOST 8 MILLION PEOPLE
9 WHO LIVE IN THE BAY AREA, I REALLY FEEL THAT WE HAVE WORKED AS
10 A TEAM. AND I WILL, YOU KNOW, CARRY THE, YOU KNOW, SUPPORT
11 THAT THE THREE OF YOU HAVE HAD WORKING WITH YOUR REPLACEMENTS
12 AS WE GO FORWARD. AND LOOK FORWARD, AGAIN, TO STAYING
13 CONNECTED. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT THERESE. THANK YOU. I SEE NO
16 OTHER COMMISSIONERS WISHING TO SPEAK. I AM GOING TO MOVE OVER
17 TO THE ATTENDEES. I HAVE ONE, AND I AM WONDERING IF ONE OTHER
18 IS GOING TO RAISE THEIR HAND. WE'LL SEE. ROLAND LE BRUN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. LET ME START WITH SUPERVISOR
21 CORTESE. SUPERVISOR CORTESE, I STILL HAVE YOUR LETTER, AND I
22 NEVER UNDERSTAND WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT -- I [INDISCERNIBLE]
23 I WISH YOU THE BEST IN YOUR NEW ROLE. MACKENZIE, I KNOW WE'RE
24 NO LONGER PATRIOTS BUT IT'S A FIRM RIDE. I FEEL YOUR LARKSPUR
25 CONNECTION AND THIS WILL HAPPEN ONE DAY. I WISH YOU THE BEST.



November 20, 2020

1 THE DIRECTOR WANTED TO TALK ABOUT DIRECTOR BRUINS, AS CHAIR
2 HAGGERTY MENTIONED, IN THIS CASE, TRULY, BASICALLY RESULTING
3 IN A TRAGEDY, MAYOR LICCARDO MENTIONED MEASURE R, SHE WAS THE
4 ONLY DIRECTOR WITH CALTRAIN WHO LISTENED AND GOT THE SIGNALING
5 SYSTEM BACK, AND LET ME WRAP UP BY ASKING THIS COMMISSION TO
6 SERIOUSLY CONSIDER HAVING POSITIONS ON ALL THESE AGENCY,
7 TRANSIT AGENCIES, WITH ELECTED MEMBERS. I THINK SOME OF THEM,
8 AND PREFERABLY WITHOUT NO TERM LIMITS, BUT THE LOSS OF THE
9 INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE IT'S JUST A TRAGEDY. THERE IS NO OTHER
10 WORD FOR IT. THANK YOU AND GOOD LUCK TO ALL OF YOU.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ROLAND, THANK YOU VERY MUCH, FOR THOSE
13 KIND WORDS FOR OUR COLLEAGUES. WITH THAT, I KNEW I COULD COAX
14 HER OUT. I WAS ABLE TO SMOKE JULIE PIERCE OUT. SHE WANTS TO
15 SAY SOME COMMENTS BEFORE SHE GETS THE FLOOR, I WANT TO SAY
16 JULIE IS JUST AN AWESOME INDIVIDUAL, AS ALL OF YOU KNOW. SHE
17 IS A TRUE REGIONALIST IN THE SENSE. SHE IS RESPONSIBLE FOR
18 MERGING THESE TWO AGENCIES ALONG WITH DAVE CORTESE, AND JAKE
19 CAME IN AT THE END, I GUESS, AND PUT THE SPRINKLES ON THE CAKE
20 AND SIGNED THE PAPER. HE KEEPS REMINDING US. I CAN TELL YOU
21 ONE OF MY BIGGEST JOYS BEING AN ELECTED OFFICIAL WAS THE
22 OPPORTUNITY TO GET TO WORK WITH JOWLY AND GET TO KNOW HER
23 FAMILY, AND STEVE. YOU KNOW I CAN'T SAY ENOUGH. SHE WAS A TRUE
24 FRIEND. AND I SAID THIS YESTERDAY, BUT SHE KNOWS MORE ABOUT MY
25 FAMILY THAN MOST OF MY FAMILY MEMBERS SHE WAS SOMEBODY I



November 20, 2020

1 LEANED ON MANY TIMES NOT JUST ON ISSUES THAT WERE FACING THE
2 REGION OR WHATEVER BUT MAYBE ISSUES THAT WERE FACING ME THAT
3 MAYBE I NEEDED SOMEBODY THAT COULD HELP GUIDE ME. JULIE I'M
4 GOING TO GIVE YOU THE FLOOR JUST KNOW I LOVE YOU AND YOU ARE A
5 GREAT PERSON.

6

7 **JULIE PIERCE:** YOU'RE GETTING ME ALL CHOKED UP BEFORE I WANT TO
8 SAY THANK YOU TO OUR COLLEAGUES. THANK YOU SCOTT. THAT WAS
9 VERY SWEET. YOU KNOW, SCOTT TOUCHED ON IT, AND I WILL JUST SAY
10 THAT FOR ALL OF YOU WHO ARE LEAVING MTC AT THIS TIME, I KNOW
11 HOW HARD IT WAS TO HAND OVER THE REINS TO DAVE RABBIT AND
12 LEAVE THAT WONDERFUL GROUP ON THE BOARD AT MTC. AND IT'S HARD
13 TO SEE THE REST OF YOU LEAVE. DAVE, YOU AND I STARTED OUT AS
14 COLLEAGUES ON ABAG, AND THEN I GOT TO JOIN MTC AS THE ABAG
15 REP, AND THEN AS PRESIDENT OF ABAG AND YOU AS CHAIR OF MTC, WE
16 WENT THROUGH A COUPLE OF FAIRLY HARROWING YEARS TRYING TO PULL
17 THIS MERGER TOGETHER, BUT WE DID IT. AND WE DID IT IN A WAY
18 THEY THINK HAS SAVED ABAG FINANCIALLY. I THINK IT'S BEEN A
19 BENEFIT TO THE REGION THE MUCH CLOSER RELATIONSHIP WE HAVE
20 BECAUSE STAFF ARE ALL ONE AND THEY'RE PULLING IN THE SAME
21 DIRECTION INSTEAD OF DIVIDED DIRECTIONS, AND THEY HAVE GOT ONE
22 VISION, AND THAT HAS BEEN TREMENDOUS, WHETHER WE'LL ACTUALLY
23 GET TO THE POINT OF JOINING THE TWO AGENCIES, YOU KNOW, THAT
24 WILL BE LEFT FOR OTHERS TO DECIDE. BUT I THINK WHAT YOU AND I
25 ACCOMPLISHED, ALONG WITH ALL OF OUR TEAM ON BOTH OF THE BOARDS



November 20, 2020

1 WAS REALLY A FEAT WE CAN BE VERY PROUD OF. AND YOUR LEVEL
2 HEAD, AND WILLING TO THINK ABOUT DOING THINGS IN A DIFFERENT
3 WAY HELPED MAKE THAT POSSIBLE. SO, I AM EVER GRATEFUL FOR YOUR
4 FRIENDSHIP, AND I AM SO TICKLED THAT YOU WILL BE IN
5 SACRAMENTO. I CANNOT THINK OF SOMEONE BETTER TO REPRESENT THE
6 BAY AREA RIGHT NOW IN SACRAMENTO. YOUR LEVEL HEAD AS HAS BEEN
7 REFERRED TO, IS GOING TO BE REALLY HELPFUL THERE. SO I
8 APPRECIATE THAT TREMENDOUSLY. JEANNE, I HAVE MISSED YOU SO
9 MUCH IN THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. IT'S GOING TO BE SO HARD
10 KNOWING YOU'RE NOT THERE. AND SEEING YOUR FACE WHEN I TUNE IN,
11 BECAUSE AS A BIT OF A JUNKIE FOR SOME OF THESE MEETINGS, I'M
12 HAVING A HARD TIME TEARING MYSELF AWAY, BUT I'LL GET THERE.
13 AND YOU KNOW, THOSE CONVERSATIONS IN THE GREEN ROOM, AND OUR
14 CONNECTING ON WHAT IT MEANS TO REPRESENT SMALLER JURISDICTIONS
15 AND TRY TO DO THAT ON A REGIONAL FRAMEWORK. YOU DO A REALLY
16 GOOD JOB OF BALANCING THAT. AND YOUR LEADERSHIP WILL BE
17 TREMENDOUSLY MISSED ON THE PENINSULA. I KNOW, AS WELL AS IN
18 THE WHOLE REGION. AND TONY, WE DIDN'T GET TO WORK TOGETHER A
19 WHOLE LOT, BUT IT WAS SURE COMFORTING KNOWING YOU WERE THERE,
20 AND I WISH YOU ALL THE BEST GOING DOWN SOUTH. AND I KNOW JAKE
21 HAS GOT ANOTHER MONTH AND I MAY OR MAY NOT MAKE THAT MEETING.
22 SO JAKE, IT'S BEEN A BLAST. AND I WILL MISS WORKING WITH YOU
23 AND, YES, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE LUNCH TOGETHER, AS HAS BEEN.
24 ANYWAY. SCOTT, THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO THANK THESE



November 20, 2020

1 WONDERFUL FOLKS. AND I WILL SAVE MY COMMENTS ON SCOTT UNTIL
2 THE JANUARY MEETING. THANK YOU ALL.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M SCARED. WELL LISTEN. THANK YOU. I
5 HAVE NO OTHER SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM. I KNOW WE TOOK A LOT OF
6 TIME. BUT IT WAS BEFITTING OF THE PEOPLE THAT WE'RE LOSING ON
7 THIS COMMISSION. IT WAS IMPORTANT THIS WE LET THEM KNOW HOW WE
8 FEEL, AND I'M HOPING THAT THEIR HEADS AREN'T SO SWOLLEN THAT
9 THEY CAN'T GET OUT OF THE ROOM THEY'RE IN THESE ARE HEARTFELT
10 COMMENTS AND WE'RE GOING TO MISS EACH AND EVERY ONE OF YOU,
11 AND JEANNE, I KNOW YOU WILL GET BACK THERE AND DO SOMETHING
12 AGAIN. AND TONY, GOOD LUCK IN LA, AGAIN, AND DAVE, I THINK JIM
13 SAID HOW PROUD. HE'S NEVER BEEN MORE PROUD OF AN ELECTED
14 OFFICIAL AND SOMEBODY WHO HAS BEEN ELECTED TO OFFICE. I SECOND
15 THAT. YOU BELONG THERE. AND YOU WILL DO A GREAT JOB THERE. SO,
16 AND AFTER THAT WHO KNOWS WHERE YOU WILL WIND UP DAVE. WITH
17 THAT I'M GOING TO LEAVE THIS ITEM UNLESS ANYBODY HAS ANYTHING
18 ELSE TO SAY. 1, 2, 3. WE'RE DONE ON THIS ITEM. CONGRATULATIONS
19 TO ALL OF YOU. [APPLAUSE] ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON.
20 RANDI KINMAN, YOU HAVE BEEN VERY PATIENT. THERE YOU ARE DOWN
21 ON THE BOTTOM OF MY SCREEN I DON'T KNOW WHERE YOU ARE ON
22 EVERYBODY'S SCREEN. GO AHEAD POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU DAVE. THIS IS A DAY I ABSOLUTELY DON'T
25 LIKE FOLLOWING THE CHAIR'S REPORT. BECAUSE FOR ME IT'S



November 20, 2020

1 PARTICULAR EMOTIONAL. I'M LOSING TWO OF MY COMMISSIONERS. BEST
2 OF LUCK TO EVERYBODY ON BEHALF OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL.
3 WE APPRECIATE THE WORK OF ALL OF THE COMMISSIONERS AND WE KNOW
4 THAT TRANSITIONS ARE GOING TO BE DIFFICULT AND HARD SOMETIMES.
5 BUT IT -- THEY'RE JUST A FACT OF LIFE. AND I'M SORRY TO SEE
6 THEM GO, BUT I AM THRILLED TO SEE DAVE MOVING INTO A POSITION
7 THAT WE CAN ALL COUNT ON, WEARING OUR MTC HATS. WITH THAT I'LL
8 SEGUE INTO MY OFFICIAL REPORT AND TRY TO BE BRIEF. OUR
9 SUBCOMMITTEES ARE MEETING. WE HAVE NOTHING TO BRING TO YOU AS
10 ACTION ITEMS. I'M HOPING THAT WE GET FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
11 FORCE A BRIEFING JUST ON A SNEAK PEAK AT WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO
12 SEE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETS BEFORE WE CAN REPORT-
13 OUT. OUR AGENDAS HAVE BEEN PACKED. WE HAD THE TASK FORCE
14 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW THE 2020
15 LEGISLATIVE ACHIEVEMENTS AND DRAFT 2021 LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY.
16 WHAT I DID WANT TO SPEAK TO TODAY KIND OF SEGUES INTO OPENINGS
17 ON OUR BODY. I WILL SAY THAT AT THIS POINT IN THE GAME, THREE
18 AND A HALF YEARS INTO A FOUR YEAR TERM, THIS -- WE ARE FACING
19 A GROUP WITH THE FEWEST VACANCIES THAT WE HAVE HAD. AND I
20 THINK THAT'S IN LARGE PART TO OUR COVID PROCEDURES WHERE WE'RE
21 ALLOWED TO MEET REMOTELY. WITH THAT SAID I'M CONCERNED ABOUT
22 FILLING A COUPLE OF SLOTS BECAUSE THEY REPRESENT SOME
23 INEQUITIES, SAN FRANCISCO HAS A VACANCY FOR PEOPLE WITH
24 DISABILITIES, SAN MATEO COUNTY HAS TWO VACANCIES, SOLANO HAS
25 ONE WHICH IS REALLY A RECORD F LOW FOR US BUT I. TO MAKE SURE



November 20, 2020

1 THAT WE ARE BALANCED AND EVEN THIS OUT ESPECIALLY FOR
2 CONSIDERING EXTENDING THIS GROUP'S TERM FOR ANOTHER YEAR WHICH
3 CONSIDERING THE TURN OVER IN THE COMMISSION ITSELF, AND THE
4 FACT THAT WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, I'M
5 HOPING THAT WE GET THAT FINALIZED AND THAT WE CAN SPEND THE
6 YEAR DOING THE WORK THAT WE DO AND HELP THE NEW COMMISSIONERS
7 ON BOARD SEAMLESSLY. WITH THAT, THAT'S THE ENDS OF MY REPORT.
8 AND GOOD LUCK TO EVERYBODY.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RANDI. I'M LOOKING TO SEE IF
11 WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE PANELISTS. I DO NOT. IT APPEARS
12 THAT I HAVE A COMMENT FROM RICHARD HEDGES. RICHARD, UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF AND GO FOR IT.

14

15 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANKS VERY MUCH SCOTT. I VERY MUCH WANT TO
16 SAY A SUPPORT RANDY'S REPORT. SHE DOES A VERY GOOD JOB AND I
17 ALSO WANT TO CHIME IN WITH HER. I'M GOING TO MISS OUR TWO
18 COMMISSIONERS WHO ARE LEAVING, JEANNIE, AND DEFINITELY DAVE,
19 HAVE BEEN A LONG-TERM SUPPORTER OF DAVE AND MOST OF HIS
20 POLITICAL UNDER TAKINGS AND HAVE FELT JEANNE AS A FRIEND. SO
21 SORRY TO SEE THEM GO. AND I, FOR ONE, HAVE NEVER BEEN A FAN OF
22 TERM LIMITS. I ALWAYS THOUGHT THAT'S WHAT BOARD ELECTIONS
23 WERE. THANK YOU.

24



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HEY RICH. IS THAT A PICTURE OF YOU AND
2 GAVIN AT THE FRENCH LAUNDRY?

3

4 **RICHARD HEDGES:** NO. I CAN'T AFFORD THE FRENCH LAUNDRY.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SORRY. I COULDN'T RESIST. [LAUGHTER]

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** WHERE YOU WOULDN'T LET ME PUT MY PICTURE ON.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO MOVE ON TO THE EXECUTIVE
11 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THANK YOU RANDI.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU CHAIR HAGGERTY. AND I WILL
14 BE BRIEF, BECAUSE YOU HAVE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT, BUT
15 THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT.
16 KATHLEEN CAIN WILL BE STARTING WITH MTC ON NOVEMBER 30TH IN
17 HER ROLE AS GENERAL COUNSEL AND AT THAT SAME TIME, ADRIENNE
18 WEIL OUR CURRENT GENERAL COUNSEL WILL TRANSITION FROM HER
19 CURRENT POSITION TO SPECIAL COUNSEL OFFICE OF THE JRC ON
20 NOVEMBER 30TH SO WE CAN BENEFIT FROM HER WISDOM IN A REALLY
21 IMPORTANT TRANSITION FOR THE AGENCY. ANOTHER THING I WOULD
22 LIKE TO POINT OUT IS THAT ON MONDAY, THE CALIFORNIA
23 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WILL RELEASED STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
24 FOR OVER \$2 BILLION IN STATE FUNDING MADE AVAILABLE UNDER
25 SENATE BILL ONE, AND BASED ON THE CEC STAFF RECOMMENDATION THE



November 20, 2020

1 BAY AREA IS SLATED TO RECEIVE \$407 MILLION IN NEW SB1 MONEY
2 FOR 11 PROJECTS, A VERY STRONG SHOWING FOR OUR REGION. THERE
3 WAS A TABLE IN MY REPORT THAT HAS THE DETAILS. BUT THAT
4 AMOUNT, SHOULD IT BE CONFIRMED BY THE FULL CEC, WOULD
5 REPRESENT 20 PERCENT OF THE ENTIRE AMOUNT OF AVAILABLE
6 STATEWIDE AND NEARLY EVERY COUNTY IN OUR REGION WAS AWARDED
7 FUNDING. WE WILL WORK CLOSELY WITH OUR COUNTY ASK STATE
8 COUNTERPARTS TO ENSURE SUCCESSFUL DELIVERY OF THESE PROJECTS
9 AND AGAIN THE CPC WILL CONSIDER ADOPTING STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
10 ON DECEMBER 2ND. AND I WANT TO THANK ALL OF YOU AS
11 COMMISSIONERS, MANY OF YOU ADVOCATED STRONGLY FOR OUR PROJECT
12 SUBMITTALS TO TONY, AND CALTRANS DISTRICT FOUR FOR SUPPORTING
13 THE MERIT OF MANY OF THESE PROJECTS. AND TO, YOU KNOW, OUR
14 STAFF, WHO DID INCREDIBLE WORK. I THINK, PULLING TOGETHER THE
15 REQUIRED INFORMATION, ANSWERING QUESTIONS AND IN TOTAL PULLING
16 TOGETHER AN EXTREMELY STRONG SHOWING FOR VERY HIGHLY
17 COMPETITIVE DISCRETIONARY FUNDS AT THE STATE LEVEL. WITH THAT
18 MR. CHAIR I'LL CONCLUDE MY REPORT AND AGAIN JUST POINT TO
19 OTHER IMPORTANT ELEMENTS THAT CAN BE READ IN THE REPORT
20 ITSELF. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS OF OUR
23 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? ALL RIGHT KIMBERLY, WE HAVE TWO ATTENDEES
24 CAN YOU CALL THEM PLEASE?

25



November 20, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. FIRST IS JAVANKA BEKELS.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JAVANKA BECKLES AND I STAND WITH MANY OF
4 THE ORGANIZERS TODAY TO ASK THAT YOU PLEASE COMMIT ACTING ON
5 THE FUNDING ANALYSIS AND STAFF CONDUCTING SUPPORT MAKING FUNDS
6 AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS IN ORDER TO STOP THE FURTHER
7 SERVICE AND JOB CUTS. ADDITIONALLY, WE ASK THAT YOU DIRECT
8 STAFF TO TAKE THE STEPS NECESSARY TO MOVE THIS PROCESS
9 FORWARD. ESSENTIAL WORKERS ARE THE LIFE BLOOD OF OUR SOCIETY
10 RIGHT NOW. THEY'RE KEEPING OUR SOCIETY ALIVE AND RIGHT NOW
11 THEY'RE VERY ANGRY, YOU AND OTHERS OFTEN STATE THAT THEY'RE
12 HEROES BUT YOUR INACTION OFTENTIMES LEAVES THEM FEELING
13 EXPENDABLE. THAT'S WHY ACTIONS SPEAK LOUDER THAN WORDS NOW
14 WHEN AC TRANSIT IS NEEDED MORE THAN EVER TO GET TRANSIT DID
15 DEPENDENT WORKERS AND RIDERS TO THEIR ESSENTIAL WORKPLACES,
16 THE LAYOFFS OF TRANSIT WORKERS HAVE BEGUN BUT HISTORY SHOWS US
17 THAT ONCE YOU LAY OFTEN WORKERS, ANY WORKERS, BUT SPECIFICALLY
18 TRANSIT WORKERS AND CUT SERVICE, THAT LOSS BECOMES PERMANENT.
19 THAT'S WHY I SIGNED ON TO THE LETTER THAT WAS SENT TO YOU,
20 BECAUSE THE SOLUTION TO THIS UNEMPLOYMENT CRISIS THAT WE FACE
21 ISN'T MORE UNEMPLOYMENT. THE SOLUTION TO THE CLIMATE CRISIS
22 ISN'T MORE CARS. THE SOLUTION TO THIS SYSTEMIC RACIAL
23 INJUSTICE ISN'T MORE AUSTERITY FOR WORKERS AND RIDERS OF COLOR
24 WHO ARE THE LARGEST GROUP OF TRANSIT RIDERS RIGHT NOW. THANK



November 20, 2020

1 YOU VERY MUCH FOR HEARING THE VOICES OF THE COMMUNITY. AND WE
2 ASK THAT YOU DO ALL THAT YOU CAN TO STOP CUTS AND LAYOFFS.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I WOULD REMIND THE SPEAKERS
5 THAT WE ARE NOT UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT. THAT WE ARE NOW UNDER
6 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. SO IF YOU WISH TO GIVE
7 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT, I WOULD ASK YOU TO WAIT. BUT WITH THAT
8 WE'LL CALL THE NEXT PERSON.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD MARCANTONIO
11 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I'M RICHARD MARCANTONIO
14 I'M WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
15 COALITION. I AM COMMENTING ON THIS ITEM BECAUSE I REGRET THAT
16 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT DIDN'T MENTION, AND YOUR
17 AGENDA DOESN'T INCLUDE AN ITEM ON TAKING EMERGENCY STEPS TO
18 SAVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION BY MAKING OPERATING EMERGENCY
19 OPERATING FUNDING AVAILABLE. I, YOU KNOW, SOME OF YOU HAVE
20 CHILDREN OR GRANDCHILDREN WHO, BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC, MAY
21 HAVE DEFERRED STARTING COLLEGE THIS YEAR. THE ANALOGY I'M
22 TRYING TO DRAW HERE -- AND YOU KNOW, THAT IS SOMETHING THAT
23 MAKES A LOT OF SENSE RIGHT NOW -- IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE TO
24 LOOK AT WHICH OF THE CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT ARE COMING UP FOR
25 PROGRAMMING OF FUNDS THAT CAN BE SHIFTED TO OPERATIONS OF



November 20, 2020

1 TRANSIT, COULD, YOU KNOW, COULD BE DEFERRED FAIR YEAR. WE'RE
2 NOT TALKING ABOUT NOT DOING THOSE CAPITAL PROJECTS, WE'RE
3 TALKING ABOUT MAKING SURE THERE IS A TRANSIT SYSTEM AROUND TO
4 SERVE US WHEN THOSE CAPITAL PROJECTS ARE DONE. IN DUE COURSE.
5 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS LISTED AS PUBLIC
10 ADVOCATES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I'M SORRY. THIS IS NOT SUPPOSED TO BE MY NAME. MY
17 NAME IS ACTUALLY EMILY WHEELER. I DO -- I WORK AT PUBLIC
18 ADVOCATES. AND I AM A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
19 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. AND LIKE RICHARD, I'M COMMENTING ON
20 THIS ITEM, BECAUSE I FEEL THAT IT IS URGENT TO TALK ABOUT
21 THIS, BUT THERE IS NOT REALLY ANY OTHER PLACE ON THE AGENDA TO
22 DO SO. YOU TALK ABOUT ESSENTIAL WORKERS LIKE THEY'RE HEROES
23 BUT CONSISTENTLY DO NOT PROVIDE THEM THE SUPPORT AND SAFETY
24 MEASURES THAT THEY NEED SO THAT THEY DON'T JUST FEEL
25 EXPENDABLE IN THIS PANDEMIC. NOW TRANSIT IS NEED MORE THAN



November 20, 2020

1 EVER TO GET WORKERS AND TRANSIT RIDERS TO ESSENTIAL
2 WORKPLACES. BUT LAYOFFS OF TRANSIT WORKERS HAVE ALREADY BEGUN.
3 HISTORY LIKE THE 2008 FINANCIAL CRASH HAS SHOWN THAT ONCE
4 TRANSIT WORKERS ARE LAID OFF AND SERVICES CUT, THE LOSS
5 BECOMES PERMANENT. THE SOLUTION TO THIS UNEMPLOYMENT CRISIS IS
6 NOT MORE UNEMPLOYMENT. THE SOLUTION TO THE CLIMATE CRISIS
7 ISN'T MORE CARS. THE SOLUTION TO SYSTEMIC RACIAL INJUSTICE
8 ISN'T MORE AUSTERITY OF WORKERS AND RIDERS WHO ARE THE LARGEST
9 GROUP OF TRANSIT RIDERS RIGHT NOW. I'M ASKING TO YOU SUPPORT
10 MAKING FUNDING AVAILABLE FOR OPERATIONS TO STOP FURTHER
11 SERVICES AND JOB CUTS AND DIRECT STAFF TO TAKE STEPS TO MOVE
12 THE PROCESS FORWARD. AS A BAY AREA NATIVE WHO HAS BEEN RIDING
13 TRANSIT SINCE BEFORE I CAN REMEMBER, AND WHO WAS AFFECTED BY A
14 TRANSIT BUS ROUTE SERVICE CUT, WHEN MY FIRST HIGH SCHOOL JOB,
15 IT REALLY IS SO ESSENTIAL TO ALLOW PEOPLE WHO MIGHT NOT, YOU
16 KNOW -- WHO MIGHT FALL THROUGHOUT CRACKS OF TRADITIONAL
17 MOBILITY TO GET AROUND IT'S ESSENTIAL FOR PEOPLE WHO FOR
18 WHATEVER REASON AREN'T ABLE TO DRIVE A CAR BECAUSE OF
19 ACCESSIBILITY ISSUES OR AFFORDABLE ISSUES OR WHATEVER, REALLY
20 THE BUS IS ONE OF THE MOST AMAZING THINGS ABOUT THE AREA. I
21 HOPE THAT YOU REALLY PRIORITIZE KEEPING SERVICE LEVELS AT 100
22 PERCENT OR EXPANDING THEM AS OPPOSED TO --

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU WRAP IT UP PLEASE?

25



November 20, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. AGAIN. I'M JUST GOING SAY AS A
4 PERSON THAT'S TRYING TO RUN THIS MEETING, YOUR COMMENTS THAT
5 WERE GETTING SO FAR ARE MORE PUBLIC COMMENT, NOT TO THE
6 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. SO I WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF
7 YOU'RE GOING TO MAKE GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS, THAT YOU WAIT.
8 IF NOT, IF IT PERTAINS TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT,
9 THEN FINE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I THINK THIS'S THE LAST SPEAKER
12 ON THIS ITEM, MR. CHAIR.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL THERE WERE THREE, AND I WANT TO
15 JUST SAY THEY APPRECIATE THEM WAITING FOR GENERAL PUBLIC
16 COMMENT. THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE
17 DIRECTOR AT THIS POINT. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO
18 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS ANYBODY GOT ANYTHING? ONE. JAKE, UNMUTE
19 YOURSELF, JAKE.

20

21 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** APOLOGIZE MR. CHAIR.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NO WORRIES.

24



November 20, 2020

1 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I WANT TO CLARIFY MY POSITION ON THIS
2 COMMISSION, SINCE I HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH OUR GENERAL
3 COUNSEL, AS THE CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IN SONOMA
4 COUNTY, AND THE CHAIR OF THE SONOMA COUNTY -- COUNCIL
5 ASSOCIATION. I WILL NO LONGER BE IN OFFICE AFTER DECEMBER 8TH,
6 BUT UNDER OUR STATUTE, IT IS POSSIBLE TO CONTINUE TO SERVE FOR
7 THE REMAINDER OF ONE'S TERM AS A COMMISSIONER WHICH IN MY CASE
8 GOES THROUGH 2023. I DO NOT BELIEVE THAT THAT IS AN
9 APPROPRIATE WAY TO CONDUCT ONES SELF, BUT I DO BELIEVE THAT
10 SONOMA COUNTY SHOULD BE REPRESENTED ON THE COMMISSION,
11 CONTINUOUSLY. SO, I ASK THAT MY SERVICE BE EXTENDED UNTIL SUCH
12 TIME AS A NEW COMMISSIONER, AS APPOINTED BY THE BOARD OF
13 SUPERVISORS, WHICH I BELIEVE WILL, GIVEN THE PROCESS, AND THE
14 SENDING OUT OF THE LETTERS OF INTEREST, ALL THE SERVICE STUFF,
15 I BELIEVE IT WILL BE FEBRUARY BEFORE A NEW COMMISSIONER WILL
16 BE SELECTED BY THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, AND THE NAME BROUGHT
17 FORWARD TO REPLACE ME. SO I'M ANTICIPATING THAT I CAN LEGALLY
18 CONTINUE AS A COMMISSIONER FROM SONOMA COUNTY THROUGH THE
19 DECEMBER AND JANUARY MEETINGS, AND THEN WE'LL SEE HOW THEIR
20 PROGRESS GOES IN FEBRUARY. BUT I JUST WANTED TO GIVE YOU THAT.
21 AND I HAVE BEEN COMMUTING WITH CHAIR HAGGERTY, AND WITH THE
22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, AS WELL, ON THIS MATTER. AND JUST WANTED
23 TO MAKE THAT CLEAR. I'M NOT GOING TO GO AWAY MAD. I'M JUST
24 GOING TO GO AWAY SAD.

25



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAKE FOR EXPLAINING YOURSELF.

2

3 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** [LAUGHTER]

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. I JUST WANTED TO THANK YOU, CHAIR
8 HAGGERTY, YOU ALLUDED TO THE ROUGH ACTC MEETING YESTERDAY. SO
9 I JUST WANTED TO PUBLICLY THANK YOU FOR YOUR SUPPORT ON THE
10 ITEM, AND THAT YOU WERE THE VOICE OF REASON. SO, AGAIN, I DO
11 APPRECIATE IT.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL, YOUR SUPPORT WAS NEEDED, AND I
14 WAS HAPPY TO DO IT. AND NO WORRIES. OKAY. YOU KNOW, I DEBATED
15 DOING THIS. BUT I'M GOING TO DO THIS. BECAUSE I'M KIND OF
16 PROUD. BUT A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO, I WAS GIVEN THE PERSON OF
17 THE YEAR AWARD BY THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION FOUNDATION.
18 AND JUST THE OTHER DAY, I WAS GIVEN THE SMALL OPERATORS
19 COMMITTEE DISTINGUISHED SERVICE AWARD BY THE CALIFORNIA
20 TRANSIT ASSOCIATION. SO, IT IS WELL SAID THAT, WHEN YOU'RE
21 LEAVING, THEY SAY NICE THINGS ABOUT YOU. WHEN THEY'RE THERE,
22 IT'S A DIFFERENT STORY. BUT NO. I WAS JUST KIND OF PROUD OF
23 THAT SO I THOUGHT I WOULD GIVE THAT TO YOU. WITH THAT, I SEE
24 NO OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. AND I WILL MOVE TO THE CONSENT
25 CALENDAR. LET THE FREE-FOR-ALL BEGIN.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I'LL MOVE APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JEANNE, WAY TO GO. SECOND? JAKE, I SEE
5 YOU MOVING. YOU GET IT JAKE.

6

7 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES SECOND.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ANYBODY WISH TO
10 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? YES WE DO. HAYDEN. HAYDEN UNMUTE YOURSELF
11 PLEASE AND YOU'RE UP. HAYDEN? GOING ONCE? HE DROPPED OFF.
12 HAYDEN ARE YOU THERE? DO YOU WANT TO UNMUTE YOURSELF?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. IT WASN'T GIVING ME THE OPTION TO UNMUTE
15 BEFORE. HAYDEN MILLER MY COMMENTS MAINLY PERTAIN TO THE
16 MONTHLY REPORT OF TRANSIT OPERATION -- OPERATORS, AND
17 SPECIFICALLY THE HEALTHY TRANSIT DASHBOARD UPDATE. I'M VERY
18 CONCERNED THAT SFMTA OR MUNI HAS FAILED TO RANK THREE OF THE
19 FOUR. IT'S NOT REFLECTIVE THEY SAY 91 PERCENT OF THE VEHICLES
20 ARE MEETING CAPACITY BUT MUNI'S CAPACITY LIFTS ARE
21 SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER THAN EITHER OPERATORS AND CAPACITY ON A
22 40 FOOT BUS IS DOUBLE THAT OF VTAS THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE OF A
23 STANDARD ON CAPACITY LIMITS SO IT'S THE STATEMENT ACROSS ALL
24 OPERATORS IT'S NOT FAIR THAT AC TRANSIT IS FAILING WHILE MUNI



November 20, 2020

1 IS GETTING 4.5 STARS WHILE CAPACITY IS NEARLY DOUBLE THAT.
2 IT'S NOT SAFE FOR RIDERS.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYTHING IN WRITING?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING IN WRITING.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** LET'S GO TO ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE MOTION
11 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVE TO ITEM
14 SEVEN. JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
15 COMMITTEE, THAT IS CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER SPERING.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. THIS IS THE REPORT
18 FROM THE JOINT COMMITTEE. THIS WAS ON NOVEMBER 20TH. THE JOINT
19 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
20 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE, MET
21 NOVEMBER 6TH MEETING PROVIDED PLANNED BAY AREA FINAL BLUEPRINT
22 ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY EM7 TELECOMMUTING FOR REFERENCE
23 COMMISSION ACTED IN SEPTEMBER ON 35 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AND
24 REQUESTED STAFF BRING BACK ALTERNATIVES FOR FURTHER
25 CONSIDERATION ON THIS PARTICULAR STRATEGY. GIVEN THE CONCERNS



November 20, 2020

1 RAISED AT THE AT THE TIME. IN OCTOBER THE JOINT MTC PLANNING
2 COMMITTEE WITH ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE HEARD A
3 PRESENTATION FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LAYING OUT FURTHER
4 CONTEXT ON THE TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY AS ORIGINALLY CRAFTED AS
5 WELL AS SOME KEY REQUIREMENTS FOR MANY ALTERNATIVE STRATEGIES.
6 SINCE THEN THERE HAVE BEEN PRODUCTIVE CONVERSATIONS WITH KEY
7 BUSINESS ORGANIZATIONS. WE HAD THE WITH THE OAKLAND MAYOR AND
8 MAYOR SAM LICCARDO, AND NICK REPRESENTING SAN FRANCISCO, TO
9 BETTER UNDERSTAND THEIR CONCERNS WITH THE STRATEGY AND STAFF
10 HAS CREATED AN ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY FOR CONSIDERATION. MR.
11 CHAIRMAN, I WANT TO THANK CHAIR HAGGERTY AND VICE CHAIR
12 PEDROZA, MAYOR LICCARDO, MAYOR SCHAFF, NICK, REPRESENTING SAN
13 FRANCISCO, JIM W, JASON BAKER, AND TIM, THEY REPRESENT LARGE
14 CONSTITUENCIES AND HELPED BRING THIS PROPOSAL FORWARD. I WANT
15 TO THANK ALL OF THOSE INDIVIDUALS THERE'S BEEN A LOT OF WORK
16 DONE BEHIND THE SCENES ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. BAY AREA 2050
17 FINAL BLUEPRINT TO STRATEGY EN7 TELECOMMUTING IS PROPOSED
18 ACTION ON MTC RESOLUTION 4437 REVISED INTEGRATING ALTERNATIVE
19 TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGY AND SOMEONE THAT WE'RE
20 ALL FAMILIAR WITH DAVE VAUTIN, ARE YOU GOING TO WALK US
21 THROUGH A QUICK PRESENTATION OF THIS? ALTERNATIVES BEING
22 PRESENTED? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES, I AM CHAIR SPERING. I'LL ASK
23 STAFF TO PULL UP THE SLIDE DECK PLEASE. GOOD MORNING
24 COMMISSIONERS. AS CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED I'M DAVE VAUTIN
25 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROJECT MANAGER. YOU ARE ALL QUITE AWARE



November 20, 2020

1 OF THE CHANGE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGET FOR
2 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE 25 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT
3 BLUEPRINT WERE INSUFFICIENT TO ACHIEVE T TODAY WE'RE COMING
4 BACK WITH AN ALTERNATIVE, STRATEGY EN7 WHICH WOULD REQUIRE
5 OFFICE BASED WORKERS TO SHIFT TO TELECOMMUTING ON A MORE
6 FREQUENT BASIS THAT STRATEGY WAS A KEY PIECE OF THE PUZZLE IN
7 ASSEMBLING A COMPLIANT PLAN THAT ACHIEVES CLIMATE GOALS AND
8 STRATEGIES FROM ELECTRIFICATION INTENSIFIED LAND USE PRICING
9 AND STRATEGY, ENVISION DESIGNED TO SHIFT 25 PERCENT OF
10 WORKFORCE TELECOMMUTING ON A TYPICAL WEEKDAY WITH INTENT OF
11 REDUCING AUTO TRIPS AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WHILE WE
12 RECEIVED STRONG SUPPORT FROM THE PUBLIC ON INCREASED
13 TELECOMMUTING IN A PANDEMIC ENVIRONMENT, WE RECEIVED FEEDBACK
14 ABOUT THE ECONOMIC IMPACTS OF THE EN7 STRATEGY WE HAVE HAD
15 FRUITFUL DISCUSSIONS PARTICULARLY WITH MEMBERS OF THAT
16 COMMUNITY OVER THE PAST FEW MONTHS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND
17 CONCERNS AND IDENTIFY WAYS TO FIND STRATEGIES TO PROVIDE
18 FLEXIBILITY WHILE ACHIEVING THE SAME LEVEL OF GREENHOUSE GAS
19 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS. MANY OF THE IDEAS WE HAVE HEARD IN
20 CONVERSATIONS OVER THE PAST FEW MONTHS IS ALTERNATIVES TO
21 REDUCE EMISSIONS ARE ALREADY FEATURED IN STRATEGIES WE ALL
22 ADOPTED. FOLKS SUGGESTED FOCUSING NEAR TRANSIT BUILDING NEW
23 RAIL LINES INVESTING IN TRANSIT SERVICE INCREASE INCENTIVIZING
24 CARPOOLING ET CETERA ALL OF THESE ARE FEATURED IN THE 25
25 STRATEGIES BLUEPRINT BUT DON'T GO FAR ENOUGH TO HIT THE



November 20, 2020

1 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET. OTHERS SUGGESTED SPENDING MORE MONEY ON
2 SPECIFIC STRATEGIES. YOU ARE ALL AWARE THAT THE TRANSPORTATION
3 FUNDING HAS BEEN ALLOCATED FOR SPECIFIC INVESTMENTS SINCE THE
4 PLAN MUST BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED IDEAS WOULD REQUIRE REMOVING
5 SCALING BACK INVESTMENTS. BOTTOM LINE WITH THE SITUATION IS
6 THERE WERE NO EASY ALTERNATIVES TO THE STRATEGY EN7. I'M GOING
7 TO WALK THROUGH A BIT ON THE STRATEGY CONTEXT. I'LL DISCUSS
8 THE THINKING THAT LEAD TO THE ALTERNATIVE WE'RE PRESENTING
9 TODAY AND SPOTLIGHT THE SIGNIFICANT CHANGES MADE. NEXT SLIDE.
10 MANY OF YOU HAVE SEEN THIS SLIDE BEFORE INCLUDING AT THE
11 OCTOBER COMMITTEE MEETING BUT JUST TO ENSURE THAT EVERYONE'S
12 ON THE SAME PAGE WE WANTED TO PROVIDE THIS REFRESHER. ON THE
13 LEFT SIDE YOU CAN SEE A BREAK DOWN OF COMMUTE MODE CHOICE IN
14 2015 WITH THREE OUT OF FOUR BAY AREA COMMUTERS USING AN AUTO
15 TO GET TO WORK A KEY CONTRIBUTOR TO OUR CLIMATE CHALLENGES
16 SIGNIFICANT -- IN THE BAY AREA. THE STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT
17 BLUEPRINT WERE CRITICAL IN REDUCING AUTO MODE SHARE BY 17
18 POINTS A SIZABLE REDUCTION. OF COURSE WORKING FROM HOME IS
19 ALSO EXPECTED TO GROW IN THE POST COVID ENVIRONMENT ABSENT ANY
20 POLICY INTERVENTION. AND COMBINED WITH THOSE INVESTMENT IN
21 WALKING, BIKING, AND TRANSIT IT CONTRIBUTES TO THAT
22 SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION. OBVIOUSLY THAT WAS NOT ENOUGH TO GET TO
23 THE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET. AND THE STRATEGY REALLY WAS
24 INTENDED TO SHIFT AUTO COMMUTERS TO TELECOMMUTING, REALLY THAT
25 WEDGE THERE OF THE PIE CHART ON THE RIGHT IN ORDER TO REDUCE



November 20, 2020

1 AUTO MODE SHARE AND GROW THE SHARE OF COMMUTES DONE THROUGH A
2 SUSTAINABLE MEANS. NEXT SLIDE. IN CRAFTING ALTERNATIVE
3 STRATEGY IS IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT THE MAGNITUDE OF THE
4 INITIAL STRATEGY. IT PLAYS A KEY ROLE IN ACHIEVING ROUGHLY
5 THREE POINTS OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION. I'M GOING
6 WALK THROUGH THIS SLIDE THAT GIVES YOU A BIT OF A SENSE ALBEIT
7 AT A SKETCH LEVEL HOW CHALLENGING IT IS TO HIT THE 19 PERCENT
8 TARGET AND WHAT STRATEGIES CONTRIBUTE AT THE TOP YOU CAN SEE
9 AN ARROW LABELED NO PROJECT THIS IS REFLECTIVE OF THE FACT
10 THAT IF WE DO NOTHING LOWER GAS PRICES COMBINED WITH THE
11 EMERGENCE OF UBER, LYFT AND AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES IN THE DECADE
12 AHEAD ARE EXPECTED TO WORSEN THE CLIMATE SITUATION EMISSIONS
13 IN THE REGION. OF COURSE WE'RE BUILDING ON A SOLID FOUNDATION
14 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 WITH INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT FOCUSED
15 GROWTH IN PDAS URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARY, AND A SET OF CLIMATE
16 INITIATIVES INCLUDING ELECTRIFICATION AND TRAVEL DEMAND
17 MANAGEMENT. BUT AGAIN PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 WOULD LEAVE US
18 QUITE SHY OF THE 19 PERCENT TARGET. MOVING TO THE THIRD ROW
19 YOU WILL SEE HOW THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT HELPED US CLOSE A SIZABLE
20 CHUNK OF THE REMAINING GAP. WE HAVE EXPANDED INVESTMENT IN
21 OVER 10,000 MILES OF PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLE INVESTMENTS
22 PRICING ON REGION'S FREEWAYS 55 MILE PER HOUR SPEED LIMIT FOR
23 SMOOTHER DRIVING REDUCED EMISSIONS AND STRATEGY EXPANSION OF
24 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN TRANSIT-RICH HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. OVER
25 THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER WE ASKED THE PUBLIC HOW SHOULD WE



November 20, 2020

1 CLOSE THE REMAINDER OF THE GAP WHILE RECOGNIZING HIGHWAY
2 EXPANSION PROJECTS HAD NOT BEEN INCLUDED IN THE PROJECT WE HAD
3 OVERSHOOT THE 19 PERCENT TARGET THIS IS WHERE EN7 TELEWORK
4 STRATEGY CAME INTO PLAY ALONG WITH EXPANDED INVESTMENT IN
5 ELECTRIC VEHICLES, PARKING, SUSPENDED ROAD PRICING AS WELL AS
6 A SLEW OF OTHER MINOR UPDATES TO THE STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE
7 PLEASE AS WE TAKE A HIGHER LEVEL LOOK AT PLANNED BAY AREA
8 2050, I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF COMMON QUESTIONS WE GOT
9 IN THESE CONVERSATIONS THAT I THINK ARE ILLUSTRATIVE OF THE
10 DIALOGUE THAT REALLY IS ESSENTIAL TO BRING UP TODAY. ONE
11 QUESTION WE OFTEN GET ABOUT THE PLAN IS WHY CAN'T YOU JUST
12 SIMPLY BUILD MORE TRANSIT BAKE LINES ET CETERA AND OF COURSE
13 THE FISCAL CONSTRAINT WHERE MONEYS HAVE BEEN ALLOCATED TOWARDS
14 INVESTMENTS BUT YOU WILL SEE HOW TRADITIONAL APPROACHES
15 RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE ON THEIR OWN WERE NOT
16 A GOOD FIT TO SUBSTITUTE FOR STRATEGIES OF EN7 IN ADDITION
17 WHAT I MENTIONED BEFORE FUNDS WOULD NEED TO BE DRAWN AWAY FROM
18 THE PRIORITY PROJECTS AND THE SCALE OF SHIFTING WOULD NEED TO
19 BE LARGE IF SIZE. ARROWS REFLECT GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS
20 REDUCTION FROM THESE STRATEGIES THROUGH 2035 AND YOU CAN SEE
21 THE STRATEGIES ARE SIZABLE JUST TO ACHIEVE A FEW POINTS OF
22 GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS. IN SHORT THIS HIGHLIGHTS HOW
23 TRADITIONAL TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS ON THEIR OWN SIMPLY
24 AREN'T ENOUGH TO ACHIEVE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS LAND USE
25 PRICING, ELECTRIFICATION AND MORE ARE CRITICAL IN TACKLING



November 20, 2020

1 CLIMATE CHANGE ALL THIS BEING SAID IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER
2 THESE INVESTMENTS ARE IMPORTANT FOR MANY OTHER REASONS BEYOND
3 CLIMATE MOBILITY SAFETY ET CETERA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE ANOTHER
4 COMMON QUESTION WE RECEIVED WAS WHAT'S CONSEQUENCE OF PULLING
5 THE STRATEGY FROM THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WHICH WE KNOW WOULD
6 CAUSE THE REGION TO MISS THE STATE TARGET OF 19 PERCENT. WELL
7 OF COURSE, THE FIRST CONSEQUENCE IS THAT THE REGION WOULD
8 BECOME THE FIRST MAJOR METRO MAYOR IN CALIFORNIA NOT TO HIT
9 THE CLIMATE TARGETS UNDER SB 375. WE HAVE TO PRODUCE A SECOND
10 PLAN AS AN ALTERNATIVE PLANNING STRATEGY THIS WINTER TO SUBMIT
11 IN CONCERT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. FURTHERMORE, AND
12 ESPECIALLY IN THE CURRENT ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT, TRANSPORTATION
13 AGENCIES THROUGHOUT BAY AREA WOULD IMMEDIATELY LOSE
14 ELIGIBILITY FOR 100 MILLION IN ANNUAL STATE FUNDING IN ANNUAL
15 ADOPTION IN EARLY 2022 INCLUDING SEVERAL PROGRAMS UNDER SENATE
16 BILL ONE GAS TAX MONEYS. OF COURSE THIS WOULD LIKELY
17 ACCELERATE NEEDED REFORM OF SB 375 BUT COULD HAVE ADVERSE
18 UNFORESEEN IMPACTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE THE ORIGINAL STRATEGY AS
19 WELL AS THE ALTERNATIVE PRESENTED TODAY DOESN'T LIVE IN A
20 VACUUM IT'S WOVEN TOGETHER WITH ANOTHER 34 STRATEGIES IN THE
21 BLUEPRINT, ELECTRIFICATION, INTERNET SUBSIDIES INFRASTRUCTURE,
22 MEANS-BASED DISCOUNTS FOCUS GROUPS NEAR TRANSIT AND OVER \$400
23 BILLION TO OPERATE MAINTAIN RESTORE AND EXPAND OUR REGION'S
24 TRANSIT NETWORK TO A SIZABLE INVESTMENT EQUITY HAS BEEN WOVEN
25 THROUGHOUT THE 35 STRATEGIES AND IT'S CRITICAL IN THINKING



November 20, 2020

1 ABOUT THE ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY WE'RE SHOWING TODAY. NEXT
2 SLIDE. BECAUSE OF THESE HIGH CLIMATE TARGETS REGIONS
3 THROUGHOUT CALIFORNIA ARE HAVING TO THINK ABOUT INNOVATIVE
4 NON-TRADITIONAL STRATEGIES TO REACH THEM. IN SHORT WE ARE NOT
5 ALONE. THE DEBATE OVER STRATEGY EN7 IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO
6 EXPLAIN THAT MANY OF THESE NEW STRATEGIES ARE ESSENTIAL TO GET
7 TOWARDS THE GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS. AS SHOWN IN THIS SLIDE EVERY
8 REGION AND EVERY MAJOR REGION IN THE STATE IS PURSUING SOME
9 FORM OF ROADWAY PRICING IN THEIR LONG RANGE PLAN AND MANY ARE
10 INTEGRATING EXPANDED PARKING PRICING AND POLICIES TOO. AND THE
11 TELECOMMUTE STRATEGIES ARE INCREASINGLY AN AREA OF DISCUSSION
12 ESPECIALLY IN THE POST COVID ENVIRONMENT. FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE
13 RECENTLY ADOPTED SCAG PLAN FOR THE LOS ANGELES AREA, THEY
14 ASSUMED AN EVEN BOLDER TELECOMMUTE LEVEL THAN MTC ABAG WAS
15 CONTEMPLATING IN THE EN7 STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE. LAST MONTH WE
16 WALKED THROUGH SOME OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR ANY ALTERNATIVE TO
17 EN7 THESE RANGE -- THE OPTIONS RANGE FROM REFINEMENTS TO THE
18 INITIAL STRATEGY TO ELIMINATION OF THE STRATEGY AND
19 REPLACEMENT ELSEWHERE. THREE KEY CRITERIA GUIDED ARE DECISION
20 MAKING. FIRST WAS ENSURING THAT THERE WAS AN ALTERNATIVE
21 STRATEGY THAT HAD SIMILAR GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS TO
22 THE ORIGINAL. SECOND, THE MODIFIED OR ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY
23 COULD NOT DOUBLE COUNT ESTIMATED GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS
24 FROM OTHER FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES OR FROM STATE POLICIES
25 OR STRATEGIES. LASTLY, THE ADJUSTED STRATEGY NEEDED TO FIT



November 20, 2020

1 WITHIN FISCAL CONSTRAINT BECAUSE ALL FUNDING HAS ALREADY BEEN
2 ALLOCATED ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
3 ULTIMATELY THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WE'RE SHARING TODAY FALLS
4 UNDER OPTION A REFINING THE STRATEGY WHILE MEETING THE THREE
5 REQUIREMENTS LISTED. OTHER ALTERNATIVES WERE EXPLORED
6 INCLUDING NOTED ON THE RIGHT MANY IDEAS WERE FOCUSED ON
7 SHIFTING THE BURDEN TO BAY AREA COMMUTERS AND AWAY FROM BAY
8 AREA BUSINESS. THE STRATEGY WAS FOCUSED ON ASKING BUSINESS TO
9 CONTRIBUTE TOWARDS CLIMATE SOLUTIONS TO MATCH THE PUBLIC
10 SECTOR ACTIONS STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS ELSEWHERE IN THE
11 PLAN THE REVISED STRATEGY CONTINUES TO FOCUS ON EMPLOYEES
12 ACHIEVING SYNERGISTIC BENEFITS AND PROVIDING FLEXIBILITY
13 THROUGH A CAFETERIA STYLE APPROACH OF MODE SHIFT OPTIONS. THE
14 ALTERNATIVE IS ENTITLED EXPAND TRIP REDUCTION PROGRAM
15 REDUCTIONS AT MAJOR EMPLOYERS GOES BEYOND TELECOMMUTING TO
16 ALLOW EMPLOYERS TO LEVERAGE INCENTIVES TO SHIFT THEIR
17 WORKFORCE TO TRANSIT, WALKING, BIKING AND OF COURSE
18 TELECOMMUTING. IT ALSO REFOCUSING THE STRATEGY ON EMPLOYERS OF
19 50 OR MORE WORKERS RATHER THAN 25 IN THE ORIGINAL WHICH
20 REDUCES IMPACTS ON SMALL BUSINESS AND TO ACCOMMODATE ALL THESE
21 SHIFTS WHILE KEEPING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS
22 CONSISTENT THE STRATEGY SCOPE WAS EXPANDED BEYOND OFFICE SPACE
23 WORKERS WHICH ALSO MAKES SENSE GIVEN THE PIVOT AWAY FROM
24 TELECOMMUTING AS THE SOLO OPTION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SLIDE 11
25 HAS A LOT OF TEXT. I'LL TRY TO HIGHLIGHT THE KEY INFORMATION



November 20, 2020

1 HERE. IN THE REVISED STRATEGY THE OBJECTIVE MAKES CLEAN CLEAR
2 THAT THE GOAL OF THE REVISED EN7 STRATEGY IS TO PARTNER WITH
3 MAJOR EMPLOYERS TO SHIFT AUTO COMMUTERS TO SUSTAINABLE MODES.
4 THIS GOES BEYOND TELECOMMUTING TO INCLUDE WALKING, BIKING AND
5 TRANSIT AS I MENTIONED EARLIER. THIS WOULD BE DONE BY SETTING
6 WHAT WE CALL A SUSTAINABLE COMMUTE TARGET, FOR MAJOR EMPLOYERS
7 VIA AN EXPANDED COMMUTER BENEFITS PROGRAM. A PROGRAM THAT
8 EXISTS TODAY BUT THAT COULD BE BROUGHT INTO SCOPE INTO THE
9 FUTURE. EMPLOYERS WOULD BE RESPONSIBLE FOR IDENTIFYING AND
10 FUNDING INCENTIVES AND DISINCENTIVES TO INCREMENTALLY WORK
11 TOWARDS REDUCING AUTO TRIPS TO NO MORE THAN 40 PERCENT OF
12 THEIR WORKFORCE ON A TYPICAL WEEKDAY IN THE YEAR 2035.
13 EXEMPTIONS WOULD CONTINUE TO BE PROVIDED FOR SMALL BUSINESSES,
14 AS WELL AS AN ADDITIONAL EXEMPTION HAS BEEN PROVIDED FOR
15 AGRICULTURAL JOBS WHERE ALTERNATIVE MODES ARE OFTEN LIMITED.
16 KEY HE IS FLEXIBILITY EMPLOYERS COULD USE INCENTIVES LIKE
17 TRANSIT PASSES BIKE SUBSIDIES GIVEAWAYS FREE COMMUTER SHUTTLES
18 OR DISINCENTIVES LIKE REDUCING PARKING AVAILABILITY OR SITE
19 REDUCTION NUMBER OF FIXED WORK STATIONS AND OFFICES IN
20 BUILDING TO ACHIEVE SUSTAINABLE COMMUTE TARGET. FURTHER
21 OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE AT THE TOP OF THE SCREEN. THE STRATEGY
22 WORKS IN CONJUNCTION WITH OTHER FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES
23 INCLUDING SIZABLE INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT AND BIKE PED THAT MAKE
24 BUSINESSES ATTAINMENT OF THESE TARGETS MORE FEASIBLE. TO WRAP
25 UP THE REVISED STRATEGY WE BELIEVE ADDRESSES MANY OF THE KEY



November 20, 2020

1 CONCERNS RAISED OVER THE PAST FEW MONTHS PROVIDES MORE MODAL
2 OPTIONS CUSTOMIZES A SUITE OF INCENTIVES, DISINCENTIVES TO
3 RECOGNIZE DIVERSITY OF BUSINESSES ACROSS THE BAY AREA REDUCES
4 IMPACTS ON SMALL BUSINESS AND PROVIDES BENEFITS TO LARGER
5 SHARE OF LOW INCOME WORKERS THAN THE ORIGINAL STRATEGY WOULD
6 HAVE PROVIDED. AND MEETS REQUIREMENTS LAID OUT IN OCTOBER AS
7 SHOWN ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SCREEN. NEXT SLIDE. ULTIMATELY,
8 IT IS IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THIS IS STILL A STRATEGY IN THE
9 CONTEXT A LONG RANGE REGIONAL PLAN MUCH MORE CONSULTATION,
10 DIALOGUE, REFINEMENT AND MORE WOULD BE REQUIRED PRIOR TO
11 ADVANCING ANY STRATEGY, THE ALTERNATIVE, OR THE ORIGINAL,
12 TOWARDS REAL-WORLD -- IMPLEMENTATION, THIS DIALOGUE CAN BEGIN
13 IN THE PLAN PROCESS UNDERWAY COULD INCLUDE STRATEGIES TO
14 TAYLOR NEAR TERM REVISED STRATEGIES. WAVING TOGETHER
15 TELECOMMUTING SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS WHILE
16 ACHIEVING SIMILAR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION THEREFORE
17 OUR RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS TO APPROVE MTC RESOLUTION 4437
18 REVISED. APPROVAL WOULD INTEGRATE THE REVISED STRATEGY INTO
19 ANALYSIS OF THE FINEST BLUEPRINT FOR THE DECEMBER RELEASE AND
20 COME TO THE BOARD IN DECEMBER AND SEEK APPROVAL FOR THE FINAL
21 BLUEPRINT FOR THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA
22 2050 IN JANUARY 2021. AND WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
23 QUESTIONS.
24



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVE. I WANT TO THANK DAVE,
2 AND MATT MALONEY FOR ALL THEIR HARD WORK AND I WANT TO THANK
3 COMMISSIONER SPERING WHO DID A YEOMAN'S JOB WORKING WITH THIS
4 COMMITTEE TO COME TO SOME SORT OF A CONSENSUS THAT WORKS FOR
5 THE REGION. I WANT TO THANK THERESE FOR BEING INVOLVED BUT
6 REALLY THIS IS GOOD WORK BY EVERYBODY AND DON'T EVER SAY MTC
7 DOESN'T LISTEN BECAUSE WE DO. WITH THAT JIM DO YOU WANT TO SAY
8 SOMETHING? SAM, DO YOU STILL HAVE YOUR HAND UP?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SCOTT, I JUST WANTED TO -- DO YOU WANT ME TO
11 MAKE THE MOTION OR DO YOU WANT TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT?

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IT'S UP TO YOU. YOU CAN MAKE THE MOTION
14 RIGHT NOW IF YOU WANT.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN I WOULD MOVE TO APPROVE THE MTC
17 RESOLUTION 4437 PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT ALTERNATIVE
18 STRATEGY EN7 AS PRESENTED TODAY.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HILLARY HAD HER HAND UP FIRST. I HAVE A
21 MOTION AND SECOND.

22

23 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SECOND BUT I WANT TO
24 SAY A COUPLE OF WORDS.

25



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SO YOU WEREN'T SECONDING?

2

3 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** I CAN SECOND.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CLICK THE LITTLE HAND THING RAISE YOUR
6 HAND AND I'LL GET YOU IN LINE. I'M TRYING TO GET A QUESTION
7 OUT OF SAM. IF YOU CAN'T FIND THE LITTLE BLUE HAND HILLARY
8 I'LL COME BACK TO YOU.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SAM DID YOU WANT TO SAY ANYTHING?

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** I WAS GOING TO OFFER MY THANKS. SHOULD I BE
13 WAITING?

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT.

16

17 **SAM LICCARDO:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO OFFER SOME THANKS.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

20

21 **SAM LICCARDO:** I WANTED TO THANK THERESE AND DAVE AND EVERYBODY
22 WHO WORKED SO HARD ON THIS. AND THANKS TO YOU, SCOTT, JIM,
23 ALFREDO, FOR LISTENING, I APPRECIATE THE EXTRAORDINARY EFFORT
24 THAT WAS MADE TO REACH OUT, AND LISTEN TO THE CONCERNS, AND
25 BEING FLEXIBLE AND PIVOT, IT'S REALLY I THINK A GREAT RESULT.



November 20, 2020

1 AND YOU KNOW CERTAINLY I HAVE HEARD A LOT OF RELIEF FROM A LOT
2 OF EMPLOYERS IN SILICON VALLEY. SO I APPRECIATE VERY MUCH, THE
3 DIFFICULTY OF STAFF'S WORK GIVEN HERE A NEARLY IMPOSSIBLE
4 STANDARD TO ACHIEVE FROM THE STATE. BUT I THINK SOME GREAT
5 WORK HAS RESULTED, AND OBVIOUSLY THE REALLY IMPORTANT WORK IS
6 AHEAD OF US. SO THANK YOU EVERYONE.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAM. AGAIN, I THINK OUR
9 CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMITTEE JIM SPERING, DID A WONDERFUL JOB
10 WITH THIS. I'M GOING TO GO TO NICK JOSEFOWITZ, AND THEN
11 HILLARY RONEN.

12

13 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO SAY THE SAME
14 THINGS THAT SAM SAID. I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING, IN
15 PARTICULAR, FOR KIND OF LANDING THIS AIRPLANE, WHICH WAS A
16 MORE DIFFICULT ONE TO LAND THAN THE ONE HE HAS IN HIS
17 BACKGROUND. BUT I THINK THIS IS, YOU KNOW, THIS IS REALLY --
18 THIS NEW STRATEGY IS NOT BACKING TOWN. IT'S A REAL IMPROVEMENT
19 ON WHAT WE HAD BEFORE AND IT'S GOING TO DELIVER THE BENEFIT IN
20 A FLEXIBLE WAY. IT'S IMPRESSIVE, YOU SETUP TO PUT OUT DRAFTS
21 AND YOU IMPROVE AS YOU GO. AND I THINK FOR ME, I'M REALLY
22 APPRECIATIVE OF THAT, AND CHAIR HAGGERTY, AND COMMISSIONER
23 PEDROZA AS WELL, AND OF COURSE, THERESE, AND DAVE, AND MATT,
24 AND STAFF, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR SPENDING SO MUCH TIME ON
25 SUCH A -- ON ONE ELEMENT OF THIS MEGA PLAN. AND MAKING SURE



November 20, 2020

1 THAT THIS DIDN'T SORT OF SLIP THROUGH AND THAT WE GOT IT ALL
2 RIGHT.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU NICK. HILLARY?

5

6 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES. I JUST WANTED TO ECHO YOU ALL AND
7 JUST REALLY THANK YOU. THIS WAS VERY IMPORTANT TO SAN
8 FRANCISCO. AND THE COMPROMISE IS EXCELLENT. I JUST WANTED TO
9 GIVE A SPECIAL THANKS TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ ON BEHALF OF
10 THE SAN FRANCISCO REPRESENTATIVES ON MTC FOR YOUR GREAT WORK
11 ON THIS AS WELL. THANK YOU EVERYONE.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKIE-DOKIE. NOW WE'RE GOING TO GO TO
14 JEANNIE BRUINS.

15

16 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I WANT TO ADD MY THANKS. AND I WILL GO BACK TO
17 MY DRAGON FLIES, I THINK EVERYBODY WHO IS WORKING ON THIS WERE
18 EXCEPTIONAL DRAGON FLIES WORKING ON THIS JIM THANK YOU FOR
19 BEING AT THE HELM OF MAKING THIS HAPPEN. AND NICK, FOR RAISING
20 THE ISSUE. I KNOW I AGONIZED OVER THE VOTE LAST TIME. THIS
21 STRATEGY, I'M SUPPORTIVE OF THIS, AND IT'S A WIN FOR OUR
22 EMPLOYERS BUT FOR OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES WHO WERE FEELING LIKE
23 THEY WERE SACRIFICIAL LAMB IN THIS AND NICK WHERE YOU STARTED
24 OFF IN TERMS OF THE ECONOMIC QUESTION, AND WHAT HAPPENS IN OUR
25 CENTERS NEAR DOWNTOWN AND COMMERCIAL DISTRICTS AND IMPACTS IT



November 20, 2020

1 HAS ON NOT HAVING WORKERS AVAILABLE TO FEED OUR ECONOMY AS
2 WELL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL OF YOUR HARD WORK.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. I SAVE MY VICE CHAIR FOR
5 LAST. HE'S PROBABLY UPSET WITH ME BECAUSE HE CAN SEE THE LINE
6 UP BUT I WANTED HIM TO KIND OF BRING IT HOME.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NOT AT ALL MR. CHAIR, YOU HAVE BEEN GREAT AT
9 LEADING OTHERS. YOU SET THE TONE FOR THESE INTERACTIONS.
10 EVERYONE CAME TO THE TABLE WITH THE SPIRIT OF COMPROMISE FROM
11 OUR MAYORS TO OUR BUSINESS GROUPS, YOU KNOW THIS IS DEMOCRACY
12 IN ACTION. IT DOESN'T FEEL GOOD SOMETIMES, BUT WE ALL HAD THE
13 RIGHT INTENT AND THE RIGHT INTENTIONS. AND I THINK IT STARTS
14 AT THE TOP. SO MR. CHAIR, THANK YOU FOR ACKNOWLEDGING THAT WE
15 HAD MADE THE ORIGINAL MOTION ENVISIONS THAT WE HAD THESE
16 OPPORTUNITIES AND WE DELIVERED FOR THE REGION IN A WAY THAT
17 EVERYONE WAS INCLUDED AND WE LISTENED. I WANT TO THANK AGAIN
18 TO COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR DRIVING THIS PLANE AND LANDING IT
19 SMOOTHLY.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WITH THE AIRPLANE, SEEING
22 HERE TODAY. EDDIE AHN, COMMISSIONER AHN.

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** JUST BRIEFLY, I FELT VERY COMFORTABLE ABSTAINING
25 LAST TIME I WAS UNEMPLOYMENT WITH THE DRAFT BUT I AM



November 20, 2020

1 APPRECIATIVE OF ALL THAT'S GONE INTO IT SO THANKS AGAIN. I'LL
2 BE VOTING IN SUPPORT THIS TIME.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY I'M GOING ASK HAVE WE RECEIVED
5 ANYTHING IN WRITING ON THIS?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES THERE CHAIR THERE WERE SEVERAL WRITTEN
8 COMMENTS I'LL READ THOSE INTO THE RECORD. AC TRANSIT, GENERAL
9 MANAGER MICHAEL HURSH, BART GENERAL MANAGER, ROBERT POWERS,
10 SAMCEDA PRESIDENT, ROSANNE FAUST. TIM FRANCI OF TRIVALLEY
11 INNOVATION LEADERSHIP GROUP. AND STEVE RAINEY.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I BELIEVE THOSE WERE ALL SUPPORT, IF I
14 REMEMBER RIGHT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE FANTASTIC WORK TODAY,
19 KIMBERLY. SO WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO GO TO A ROLL CALL VOTE. A
20 MOTION BY SPERING, SECONDED BY RONEN. YOU MAY GO KIMBERLY.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALL RIGHT. [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE
23 MOTION PASS UNANIMOUSLY.

24



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
2 SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SCOTT, IF YOU WILL PERMIT ME. I WANT TO
5 THANK -- YOU HAD MENTIONED THERESE, MATT, AND DAVE, I WOULD
6 REALLY LIKE TO RECOGNIZE SOME OF THE PEOPLE BEHIND THE SCENES
7 PEOPLE WE DON'T SEE THAT HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS PLAN FOR
8 FOUR YEARS. JUST REAL QUICKLY, LISA ZORN AND HER MODELING
9 TEAM. TERRY SMITH AND HIS DATA FOLKS. DATA ANALYSIS, RALEIGH
10 MCCOY, JAMES CHO MICHAEL JARED AND MARK S THESE PEOPLE HAVE
11 BEEN WORKING BEHIND THE SCENES AND DESERVE NATIONAL
12 RECOGNITION. I WANT TO MENTION THE BEHIND THE SCENES TEAM.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THEY DO GREAT WORK. GOOD JOB
15 ACKNOWLEDGING THEM. HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY'S HAPPY WITH THAT
16 WE'LL FIND OUT TOMORROW WHEN WE READ THE PAPER TOMORROW. WHO
17 KNOWS.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT, A
20 TIME WHICH YOU CAN SPEAK TO ANYTHING NOT ON TODAY AGENDA, I
21 ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT
22 ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM AT INFO@BAYAREA.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.
23 YESTERDAY AND ASK MEMBERS IF THEY WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON ITEMS
24 NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA. RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO
25 SPEAK.



November 20, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED FROM VOICES
3 FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION, ORGANIZATION, MEMBERS,
4 AND SUPPORTERS, THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY GREAT JOB. KIMBERLY.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I'M SHEELA CUSHMAN AND I SECOND WHAT WAS SAID EARLIER
9 FROM PUBLIC VOICES. I AM A DISABILITY RIGHTS ACTIVIST AND
10 COVID HAS OVERTURNED EVERYTHING IN OUR WORLD AND I THINK THE
11 PREVIOUS DISCUSSION HAS KIND OF HIGHLIGHTED THAT. THE PPC
12 NUMBERS THAT GRETA TIMBURG ALWAYS QUOTES ARE TALKING ABOUT
13 THINGS THAT HAPPEN AROUND 2025 SO THE SOONER WE CAN DO
14 ANYTHING AND THE MOST WE CAN DO, BETTER. I HAVE NOT RIDDEN A
15 BUS SINCE MARCH AND THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE RIDING CARS NOW
16 WHO DID RIDE BUSES BECAUSE THEY DON'T KNOW IF BUSES ARE SAFE
17 AND/OR BUSES ARE VERY, LIKE, BUSES WILL PASS YOU BY IF THEY'RE
18 TOO FULL AND SUCH. WE NEED THE MONEY TO GO FROM PROJECTS TO
19 OPS. BECAUSE WE NEED OUR BUSES TO BE THERE WHEN WE CAN
20 ACTUALLY COME OUT AGAIN. I HAVE BEEN A PARATRANSIT RIDER SINCE
21 MARCH BUT I AM ONE PERSON RIDING ON A GREAT BIG BUS. I WOULD
22 LIKE TO SEE BETTER THINGS ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL SIDE. I WOULD
23 LIKE TO BE HEARD WHEN WE SAY THINGS LIKE THIS. I FEEL LIKE
24 THERE WAS AN ERROR DISMISSIVENESS WHEN FOLKS WERE SPEAKING
25 EARLIER, AND I BELIEVE THIS SHOULD HAVE BEEN ON THE AGENDA. I



November 20, 2020

1 AM DISAPPOINTED THAT IT DIDN'T. AND YOU KNOW THAT ELDERLY
2 PEOPLE AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES ARE NOT ON THE BUSES RIGHT
3 NOW BECAUSE WE'RE TRYING TO STAY ALIVE AND EVEN PEOPLE WHO ARE
4 LIFE-LONG TRANSIT RIDERS LIKE MYSELF ARE NOT THERE, BUT IT'S
5 NOT FOR LACK OF DESIRE, IT'S -- I WANT TO LIVE. [LAUGHTER] SO,
6 BUT WE NEED OUR OPS, AND WE NEED BART TAKEN CARE OF, I'M BART
7 AND AC PRIMARILY, I LIVE IN OAKLAND. SO YEAH, THANKS.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GO AHEAD KIMBERLY.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS BA TRUNG. PLEASE UNMUTE
14 YOURSELF.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. HOW LONG DO YOU HAVE TO SPEAK?

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M WITH FRONT SILICON VALLEY WE HAVE
21 ALMOST 2,000 MEMBERS IN THE SOUTH BAY. I AM A MEMBER OF VOICES
22 FOR PUBLIC THOUGHT COALITION. I AM TRANSIT DEPENDENT. I DO NOT
23 OWN A CAR. I AM DEEPLY CONCERNED TO HEAR THAT TRANSIT WORKERS
24 ARE BEING LAID OFF. TRANSIT WORKERS ARE PUTTING THEIR LIVES ON
25 THE LINE EVERY DAY AND AFTER THEIR ENORMOUS DAILY SACRIFICE



November 20, 2020

1 AND ENDANGERING THEIR FAMILIES EVERY DAY THEY'RE BEING LAID
2 OFF WHICH IS UNUSUALLY CRUEL. OVER 30 PERCENT OF TRANSIT
3 RIDERS IN THE BAY AREA ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS. THEY TOO ARE
4 PUTTING THEIR LIVES ON THE LINE TO PROVIDE US WITH THE
5 SERVICES WE NEED. CUTTING SERVICE IS VERY CRUEL TO THEM AS
6 WELL. WE ASK THAT YOU COMMIT TO ACT ON THE FUNDING ANALYSIS
7 THAT STAFF HAS CONDUCTED, AND SUPPORT MAKING FUNDS AVAILABLE
8 FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO STOP FURTHER CUT SERVICE AND JOB
9 CUTS, AND TO DIRECT STAFF TO TAKE THE STEPS NECESSARY TO MOVE
10 THIS PROCESS FORWARD. VTA DID NOT HAVE ENOUGH RIDERS PRE COVID
11 TO STAFF EVERY RUN AND OFTEN HAD TO CANCEL RUNS AND OFTEN
12 LEAVES RIDERS STRANDED BECAUSE OF SOCIAL DISTANCING THOUSANDS
13 OF RIDERS ARE BEING LEFT BEHIND EVERY DAY. WE NEED MORE RIDERS
14 NOT LESS TO HELP THE VTA RIDERS WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND
15 THE 50 PERCENT WHO ARE LOW INCOME. THE LOW INCOME ARE BEING
16 LEFT STRANDED. THIS CAUSES RIDERS TO BE LATE FOR WORK AND
17 CAUSES RIDERS TO LOSE THEIR JOBS. IF THEY TAKE TIME OFF WORK
18 TO GO TO AN APPOINTMENT, THEY MISS WORK AND THIS IMPACTS
19 RIDERS EMPLOYMENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS KEVIN MA.
22 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MTC MEMBERS MY NAME IS KEVIN MA, REPRESENTS
25 VOICES OF TRANSPORTATION COALITION WE TALK ABOUT WORKERS BEING



November 20, 2020

1 HEROES BUT GIVEN THE CURRENT LAYOFFS IN GOLDEN GATE THAT'S
2 MORE USED AS LIP SERVICE THAN REALLY ANYTHING WE CARE ABOUT.
3 AS YOU KNOW YOU HAVE SEEN THE REPORTS FROM STAFF ABOUT THE
4 ANALYSIS OF WHAT KIND OF POLICIES WE CAN HAVE TO DIRECT
5 FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS. ESPECIALLY SINCE THAT GOLDEN GATE
6 APPARENTLY TOLLS ARE -- CAN'T RAISE THEM. RESULT WE HAVE
7 ISSUES LIKE VTA INCREASE BUS SERVICE BECAUSE THEY -- THE
8 COUNTY HEALTH OFFICER SAID WE CANNOT REDUCE TO THREE FEET
9 DISTANCING ON A BUS WE MUST KEEP THE SIX FEET DISTANCING AS
10 SUCH WE SHOULD ALSO RECOGNIZE THE CAPITAL PRODUCTS WE HAVE
11 DON'T MAKE SENSE IF THERE IS NO WORKERS TO ACTUALLY RUN THEM.
12 WITH ALL OF THIS IN MIND I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THAT IT BE
13 AGENDAIZES ON THE LEARNINGS OF THE LAST MEETING HOW TO
14 REDIRECT FUNDS AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE TO KEEP OUR TRANSIT
15 SERVICES ALIVE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS HAYDEN
18 MILLER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI. HAYDEN MILLER. A TALKED ABOUT EARLIER, THE BUSES,
21 THEY'RE JUST SO CROWDED AND UNSAFE RIGHT NOW, AND THOUSANDS OF
22 WORKERS ACROSS THE BAY AREA ARE GETTING PASSED UP EVERY DAY
23 DUE TO INSUFFICIENT OPERATING FUNDS FOR TRANSIT SERVICE. OUR
24 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE HURTING RIGHT NOW, AND WE NEED TO GET
25 MORE OPERATIONS MONEY OUT THERE, SO THEY CAN GET BUSES ON THE



November 20, 2020

1 STREET AND GET ESSENTIAL WORKERS MOVING TO WORK AND PREVENT
2 FURTHER LAYOFFS IN A TIME LIKE THIS. I URGE YOU GUYS TO HELP
3 GET MORE OPERATIONS FUNDING OUT THERE FOR THE BAY AREA TRANSIT
4 AGENCIES. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA
7 MALLON. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALLON AND I AM A MEMBER OF THE
10 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION AND TRANSIT RIDER
11 AND ADVOCATE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY ENCOURAGING YOU TO ACT ON
12 THE FUNDING ANALYSIS THAT HAS BEEN CONDUCTED AND MAKING
13 SUPPORT FUNDS AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES SO THE AGENCIES
14 CAN PREVENT TRANSIT CUTS AND LAYOFFS AND ALSO TO DIRECT STAFF
15 TO TAKE THE STEPS NECESSARY TO MOVE THE DRAFTS FORWARD. I AM
16 23 AND HAVE BEEN TAKING TRANSIT MOST OF MY LIFE AND I HAVE
17 SEEN MY TRANSIT OPTIONS SHRINK OVER THE YEARS. HISTORY HAS
18 SHOWN THAT WHEN SERVICE IS CUT THOSE CUTS BECOME PERMANENT AND
19 WE NEVER GET THEM BACK. I THINK THE OPTIONS NEED TO BE
20 AVAILABLE FOR AGENCIES THAT WANT TO CHOOSE TO USE THEM. THESE
21 CUTS AND LAYOFFS WILL HAVE ARE IMPACTS ON EMPLOYMENT,
22 DEVELOPMENT, AND CLIMATE. PLEASE FORWARD THIS PROCESS AND
23 PROVIDE OPTIONS FOR AGENCIES. THANK YOU.

24



November 20, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MONICA. WITH THAT I HAVE NO
2 OTHER SPEAKERS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT. NEXT ITEM NINE. THE NEXT
3 MEETING OF THE COMMISSION WILL BE SCHEDULED TO BE HELD
4 WEDNESDAY JANUARY 27TH, 2021 IT WILL NOT BE AT THE BAY AREA
5 METRO CENTER SO I'M NOT GOING TO SAY IT. IT WILL BE HELD BY
6 REMOTE WEBCAST AND IF THERE IS ANYTHING THAT DOES CHANGE WE'LL
7 LET YOU KNOW. WITH THAT I WISH EVERYBODY A HAPPY THANKSGIVING,
8 STAY SAFE, HEALTHY, ENJOY TURKEY. ENJOY LIFE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT MEETING SHOULD HAVE BEEN NOTED
11 FOR DECEMBER 16TH, NOT JANUARY 27TH. THAT JUMPED AHEAD.
12 APOLOGIES.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I APOLOGIZE. I JUST READ WHAT WAS GIVEN
15 TO ME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU ARE CORRECT. IT'S -- THE CORRECTION IS
18 DECEMBER 16TH.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JUST ANOTHER SETUP. ALL RIGHT
21 EVERYBODY. HAVE A GREAT THANKSGIVING. [ADJOURNED]

22



Broadcasting Government