



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



November 16, 2020

BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE

MONDAY, NOVEMBER 16, 2020, 9:05 AM

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: IF WE COULD, COULD WE HAVE THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR, PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE



November 16, 2020

1 CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL
2 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE
3 THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO
4 GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR
5 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I HOPE
8 EVERYONE IS READY FOR OUR 9:00 MEETING HERE. WE THOUGHT WE
9 WOULD GET EVERYBODY WHILE THEY'RE FRESH AND FEELING LIKE THEY
10 WANT TO COOPERATE. HOPEFULLY WE'LL MOVE FORWARD. CAN WE HAVE
11 ROLL CALL PLEASE?

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CHAIR SPERING?

14

15 **JIM SPERING, CHAIR:** PRESENT.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ASSEMBLYMEMBER DAVID CHIU? CHAD ADDISON
18 FOR DAVID KIM?

19

20 **CHAD EDISON:** PRESENT.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SENATOR JIM BEALL? JONATHON PEREZ?

23

24 **JONATHAN PEREZ:** PRESENT.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** TASK MEMBERS I'LL CALL YOU BY NAME

2 PLEASE BE READY TO UNMUTE. BAKER?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CURRIER?

7

8 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** HERE.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CORTESE?

11

12 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** FERNANDEZ?

15

16 **NURIA FERNANDEZ:** PRESENT.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** FORD?

19

20 **JOHN FORD:** PRESENT.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** GRIFFITHS.

23

24 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HERE.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:**

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HAGGERTY?

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HERE.

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HALLS?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HARNETT?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE. JOSEFOWITZ? KINMAN?

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LINDSAY?

18

19 **JAMES LINDSAY:** PRESENT.

20

21 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MCMILLAN?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** HERE.

24

25 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MULLIGAN?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **DENNIS MULLIGAN:** PRESENT.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MURPHY? PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** PEDROZA?

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** POWERS?

13

14 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** RABBIT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** RAMACIER.

21

22 **RICK RAMACIER:** HERE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ROTCHY? TREE? TUMLIN?

25



November 16, 2020

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WHELAN?

4

5 **NANCY WHELAN:** HERE.

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WORTH?

8

9 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WU?

12

13 **ELLEN WU:** HERE.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WUNDERMAN?

16

17 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HERE.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WE ARE A QUORUM.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WELCOME BACK FROM OUR LAST MEETING. I

22 AM PLEASED IN OUR PROGRESS ON THE GOALS LAST MONTH OR PROGRESS

23 ALLOWS US TODAY TO CONSIDER THE REVISED VERSIONS GOALS AND

24 OBJECTIVES AND FOCUS ON FINAL REFINEMENT AND APPROVE THOSE

25 TODAY. TODAY'S DECISION ON THE GOALS IS A MILESTONE FOR THIS



November 16, 2020

1 COMMITTEE, AND HOPEFULLY WE'VE CAPTURED EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS
2 FROM THE LAST MEETING AND STAFF WILL BE PRESENTING THAT VERY
3 SHORTLY. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN WILL INTRODUCE
4 THE DISCUSSION ON THE TRANSIT EQUITY ISSUES AND ASK FOR TASK
5 FORCE MEMBER INPUT ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE DRAFT EQUITY
6 PRINCIPLES WORK. THIS IS TIME TO DISCUSS VOICES OF PUBLIC
7 THOUGHT TO SHARE THEIR WORK AND PRIORITIES HOPEFULLY YOU HAVE
8 ALL HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW THE MATERIAL THAT WAS SENT
9 OUT IT'S VERY GOOD REFERENCE MATERIAL, AND THEY'LL BE GOING
10 OVER THAT IN THEIR PRESENTATION. STEVE KINSEY WILL GUIDE US
11 THROUGH THE PROPOSED REVISION OF OUR DECISION MAKING PROCESS
12 AND WORK ON THIS AND I CERTAINLY SUPPORT THE CHANGE BECAUSE IT
13 PROVIDES US A WAY TO QUICKLY REFINE TASK FORCE ACTIONS AND
14 BEFORE FORM AMY VOTING. AND PROUD OPPORTUNITY FOR A MINORITY
15 VIEWS ON SPECIFIC ACTIONS TO BE DOCUMENTATION ALLOWING FOR
16 LARGER EFFORT TO PRODUCE AN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN. AND
17 HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY HAS THE COLORED CARD, YELLOW, RED, AND
18 GREEN AND HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY WILL BE PREPARED TO DO THAT. AND
19 AFTER WE APPROVE THE REVISED DECISION MAKING TOOLS AND
20 OBJECTIVE WE MAY THEN USE IT ON ITEM FIVE TO REACH CONSENSUS
21 ON GOALS OBJECTIVES PRIOR TO FORMAL ROLL CALL VOTE. AND AT
22 THAT TIME THE VIDEO LAY OUT, THEN WE CAN SEE HOW EVERYBODY
23 FEELS ABOUT THE ISSUE AND GET READY TO MOVE FORWARD TO TAKE A
24 VOTE. HOPEFULLY THE MEMBERS CAN SEE THE GALLERY VIEW. THAT'S
25 HOPEFULLY THE GOAL OF HOW WE'RE GOING TO NAVIGATE THROUGH THIS



November 16, 2020

1 AND HOPEFUL EVERYBODY HAS HAD OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW ALL OF THE
2 MATERIALS. NEXT ON THE AGENDA IS CONSENT CALENDAR. IT IS OUR
3 TWO MINUTES FROM OCTOBER 26TH. AND THE MEETING SUMMARY. SO
4 I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR CONSENT AND DISCUSSION. HEARING
5 NONE. IS THERE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

6

7 **DAVID CORTESE:** SO MOVED.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SECOND. HAGGERTY.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** HAGGERTY. SECOND. WEAL ANY PUBLIC
12 COMMENT ON CONSENT CALENDAR?

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES OR NO?

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. SUSAN ROTCHY.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ON CONSENT?

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SUSAN ROTCHY IS ON THE ATTENDEE LIST FOR
23 -- MAYBE -- MS. ROTCHY, CAN YOU HEAR US? YOU WOULD LIKE TO
24 SPEAK?

25



November 16, 2020

1 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** YES. SOMEHOW I DON'T HAVE THE LINK TO GET ON. I
2 JUST HAVE THE -- AS A PARTICIPANT.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** I WILL MAKE SURE SOMEBODY WILL SEND IT
5 TO YOU RIGHT AWAY.

6

7 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU FOR LETTING US KNOW. FOR THE
10 VOTE PART, MS. ROTCHY, CAN I ASK YOU, JUST NOW, IF YOU'RE
11 GOING TO BE A YES? ON THE VOTE FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

12

13 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** YES. THANK YOU.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** I'M GOING TO DO A ROLL CALL FOR THE
16 CONSENT CALENDAR. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM FOUR, STEVE, ARE YOU
19 READY?

20

21 **STEVE KINSEY:** YES. ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. AS THE
22 CHAIR MENTIONED THE PURPOSE OF THE REVISION THAT WE'RE LOOKING
23 AT TOOT IS TO GIVE AN EFFICIENT WAY TO MEASURE LEVEL AGREEMENT
24 ON A SPECIFIC MATTER OR REQUEST BEFORE ANY FORMAL ACTION IS
25 TAKEN SIMPLIFIES THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED CHOICE METHOD WHILE



November 16, 2020

1 MAINTAINING THE TASK FORCE'S ABILITY TO CONSTRUCTIVELY DEVELOP
2 ACTIONS BEFORE THAT FORMAL VOTE. WE WILL TALK ABOUT REVISED
3 GOALS OBJECTIVES. WHEN DOING SO THE CHAIR WILL BE HAVE THE
4 OPPORTUNITY TO SEEK YOUR INDIVIDUAL SUPPORT FOR A CHANGE.
5 HE'LL ASK YOU TO DISPLAY ONE OF THE THREE COLORS IN FRONT OF
6 YOURSELF SO THE SUPPORT STAFF CAN COUNT AND REPORT AN
7 ACCUMULATIVE TALLY. GREEN WILL EXPRESS YOUR SUPPORT, RED WILL
8 EXPRESS YOUR OPPOSITION, AND YELLOW WILL INDICATE THAT YOU CAN
9 LIVE WITH THE DECISION WHETHER YOU'RE IN COMPLETE AGREEMENT
10 WITH IT OR NOT. ONCE THE TALLY IS REPORTED, THE CHAIR'S
11 PREROGATIVE IS SUCH THAT IF WE THINKS MORE DISCUSSION IS
12 WARRANTED HE WILL PROCEED WITH THAT, IF NOT HE MAY DECIDE TO
13 MOVE TO A FORMAL VOTE. IN ADDITION WHEN A SUGGESTION IS MADE
14 IT'S POSSIBLE FOR THE CHAIR TO SAY IS THERE ANY OPPOSITION AND
15 IT'S POSSIBLE THAT IF THERE IS NO CONFLICT THAT CHANGES CAN BE
16 MADE WITHOUT HAVING TO GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS. I WANT TO BE
17 CLEAR ABOUT THAT. I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE IF SEVERAL
18 WORDS ARE PROPOSED FOR CHANGES TO THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES
19 FOLLOWING THE VOTE, THE CHAIR WOULD SAY WHETHER THE CHAIR
20 SHOULD BE INCORPORATED INTO THE TEXT THAT WILL BE VOTED ON. I
21 WILL BE AVAILABLE FOR QUESTIONS, AND WE'LL HAVE A ROLL CALL
22 VOTE RELATED TO DECISION MAKING PROCEDURES.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON WHAT WE'RE
25 PROPOSING? HOPEFUL EVERYONE HAS HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE UP



November 16, 2020

1 THEIR CARDS, AND HOPEFUL THEY'RE NOT BACKWARDS LIKE MINE IS
2 THERE. GET A PENCIL UP AND PRINT IT OUT. STEVE ARE YOU READY
3 TO MOVE ON TO 5A THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES?

4

5 **STEVE KINSEY:** I THOUGHT WE WERE GOING TO BE TAKING A ROLL CALL
6 VOTE ON THIS?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WE SHOULD MAKE SURE WE HAVE A ROLL
9 CALL VOTE ON THIS. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS.
10 IS EVERYONE IN AGREEMENT WITH THE PROCESS? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
11 SPEAKERS WALLY?

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** NO.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THAT'S WHAT I'M ASKING.

20

21 **AMY R. WORTH:** I'LL MOVE.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** AMY MOVES IT.

24



November 16, 2020

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** YOU KNOW WHAT I REALIZED, THOSE OF US WITH A
2 BACKGROUND, YOU CAN'T USE GREEN. MY GREEN DISAPPEARS. LOOK, IT
3 GOES AWAY.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** TAKE YOUR VIRTUAL BACKGROUND OFF,
6 BECAUSE YOU WON'T BE ABLE TO SEE THE SHEET.

7

8 **AMY R. WORTH:** YEAH. YEAH.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** TURN IT OFF WHEN WE GET TO VOTING.

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** I'M SORRY. WHO WAS THE SECOND?

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PEDROZA SECONDS

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSED
17 UNANIMOUSLY.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** 5A OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO FINALIZE
20 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES AND ONCE THEY'RE ADOPTED IT WILL REALLY
21 HELP US GUIDE THIS COMMITTEE THROUGH JUNE AND IT WILL KEEP US
22 MORE ORGANIZED AND FOCUSED. THE GOAL -- SO HOPEFULLY, AS STEVE
23 PRESENTS HIS TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IT REFLECTS MANY OF
24 THE COMMENTS WE HAVE HEARD AND HOPEFULLY WE GET A CONSENSUS
25 TODAY. AFTER STEVE EXPLAINS THE REVISIONS I'LL CALL ON THE



November 16, 2020

1 TASK FORCE MEMBERS WHO WANT TO COMMENT AND WE DON'T WANT TO
2 GET BOGGED DOWN ON WORDSMITHING THERE WILL BE PLENTY OF
3 OPPORTUNITY TO REFINE THIS AS WE GO ALONG BUT IF YOU THINK A
4 MEANINGFUL CHANGE OR ADDITION IS WARRANTED PLEASE SPEAK UP. WE
5 WILL USE OUR REVISED DECISION MAKING COLOR CARD PROCESS WE
6 HAVE BEEN SPEAKING ABOUT, BEFORE GOING INTO A FORMAL ROLL
7 CALLING VOTE AND WHEN WE VOTE IT WILL BE ON THE FULL PACKAGE
8 OF GOALS OBJECTIVES. WHAT WE WOULD REALLY LIKE TO DO TODAY IS
9 GET THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES APPROVED TODAY SO WE CAN STAKE
10 FOCUSED FOR THE NEXT SIX MONTHS ON WHAT THIS COMMITTEE IS
11 GOING TO WORK ON. SO WITH THAT, STEVE, IF YOU'RE READY, I'LL
12 HAND IT OVER TO YOU.

13

14 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. YES. AND YOU CAN BRING
15 UP THE SLIDE DECK THAT GOES WITH THIS. GREAT. THANK YOU. AS
16 THE CHAIR SAID THIS IS REALLY THE MOST SIGNIFICANT ACTION YOU
17 WILL TAKE AS A TASK FORCE AS YOU ADOPT THESE GOALS AND ACTIONS
18 TODAY THE PURPOSE OF THIS IS TO SHARPLY DEFINE THE GOALS AND
19 BOUNDARIES AND FOCUS OF YOUR TIME ON THE TASK FORCE FOR THE
20 REMAINING MONTHS BEFORE YOU PRESENT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
21 TO THE MTC COMMISSION NEXT YEAR. THIS WILL SERVE TO ORGANIZED
22 AGENDAS FOR THE REMAINING MEMBERS OF THE TASK FORCE. MAKING
23 SURE EACH OF YOU ARE CLEAR ABOUT THE LANGUAGE AND GIVE AN
24 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE ANY FINAL ADJUSTMENTS BEFORE THE VOTE
25 TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE STARTING IN A STRONG PLACE. LAST



November 16, 2020

1 MONTH YOU REVIEWED A DRAFT SET OF GOALS AND OBJECTIVES AND YOU
2 ACCEPTED EACH OF THEM WHILE AT THE SAME TIME REQUESTED A
3 NUMBER OF MODIFICATIONS THEY THINK ARE IMPORTANT. TODAY WILL
4 CONFIRM WHETHER THEY ADEQUATELY DO THAT. WE ARE GOING TO BE
5 WALKING YOU THROUGH THE REVISIONS VERY BRIEFLY. AND THEN, YOU
6 KNOW, IF THERE ARE REVISIONS SUGGESTED, WE WILL USE THE GREEN
7 LIGHT RED LINE APPROACH FOLLOWED BY AN ACTION PLAN VOTE ON THE
8 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE. IF YOU REMEMBER WE HAD USED
9 THE TERM TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION THROUGHOUT THE TASK FORCE
10 PROCESS AND WE PRESENTED A DEFINITION OF THAT LAST MONTH BACK
11 TO THE LAST SLIDE PLEASE. WE PRESENTED A DEFINITION OF THAT
12 LAST MONTH WE DISCUSSED IT. THERE WERE SEVERAL SUGGESTIONS FOR
13 CHANGES. WHAT YOU SEE IN FRONT OF YOU IS THE REVISED
14 DEFINITION OF WHAT TRANSFORMATION WOULD ENTITLE, OR INCLUDE.
15 AND THANK YOU FOR HELPING. IT ALSO REFLECTS SOME OF THE
16 COMMENTS THAT THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER MADE IN HIS RESPONSE LAST
17 MONTH. NEXT SLIDE. FOR GOAL ONE, IT WAS MODIFIED TO EMPHASIZE
18 THE URGENCY OF OBTAINING CRITICAL FUNDS. WE KNOW WE'RE ALREADY
19 BEGINNING TO SEE ACTIONS TAKEN AT DIFFERENT AGENCIES THAT ARE
20 THE RESULT OF CARES FUNDING, AND THE URGENCY WARRANTED IS TO
21 REFLECT THE SENSE OF THE TASK FORCE IT ALSO IS REFLECTION BY
22 ADDING OBJECTIVES APPRECIATED WITH MTC'S WILLINGNESS TO
23 SUPPORT RESEARCH AND MESSAGING AROUND RETURNING TO TRANSIT.
24 NEXT SLIDE. ADVANCING GOAL AND IMPORTANT CHANGE TO LANGUAGE IS
25 BEING PROPOSED IT CONDITIONS TO EXPRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF



November 16, 2020

1 THIS. ALL WORK IS DONE TO FOCUS ON OUTREACH AND CURRENT RIDERS
2 UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO POINT
3 OUT THAT IN ADDITION THE OUTREACH THE TASK FORCE ENCOURAGED US
4 TO REACH OUT TO THE AGENCY BOARDS AND INFORM THEM OF THE WORK
5 YOU'RE DOING AND INVITE THEM TO ALSO BE PART OF THE OUTREACH.
6 NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. GOAL THREE. GOAL THREE, THERE IS GOING TO BE
7 TWO SLIDES. BECAUSE THERE ARE SEVERAL OBJECTIVES ASSOCIATED
8 WITH IT FOR GOAL THREE. BUT IT REFLECTS THE MOST REVISIONS,
9 WHICH IS, I THINK, AN APPROPRIATE REFLECTION. BECAUSE IT
10 FOCUSES ON THE MOST IMPORTANT TOPIC THAT YOUR TASK FORCE HAS
11 CHOSEN TO ADDRESS IN THIS ACTION PLAN. I REALLY WANT TO
12 EMPHASIZE THIS. THAT YOU HAVE REALLY GIVEN A MAJOR
13 CLARIFICATION THAT THE PLAN IS NOT LIMITED TO A NEAR-TERM
14 CHANGE, BUT ALSO SHOULD FIT A NEAR-TERM ACTIONS THAT SERVE
15 TRANSIT FOR THE LONGER TERM. AND AS REQUESTED BY THE
16 OPERATORS, AND AGREED TO BY ALL OF YOU, I THINK TO DATE THE
17 IMPORTANCE OF DEFINING THE PROBLEM. WHAT IS THE PROBLEM THAT
18 WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE IS USUALLY A PRETTY GOOD PLACE TO START.
19 AND THEN MAKING A BUSINESS CASE BECAUSE THERE ARE ECONOMIC
20 ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH IT THAT NEEDS TO BE UNDERSTOOD. SO
21 THESE HAVE BEEN INCLUDED IN THE GOAL FOR GOAL THREE. NEXT
22 SLIDE. THIS IS A CONTINUATION OF GOAL THREE. AND WHAT YOU WILL
23 SEE HERE, THAT THE OBJECTIVES NARROW THE IMMEDIATE
24 CONSOLIDATION DISCUSSION WITHOUT LIMITING THE CONSIDERATION OF
25 GOVERNANCES AS PART OF THE OVERALL NETWORK MANAGEMENT



November 16, 2020

1 EVALUATION. YOUR REQUEST TO HIGHLIGHT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE
2 TRANSIT ADVANTAGES ON OUR STREETS AND HIGHWAYS IS ALSO
3 INCLUDED. IN THIS GOAL. AND AGAIN POINT OUT THAT THESE CHANGES
4 THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT HERE ARE OUR BEST EFFORT TO CAPTURE THE
5 COMMENTS THAT YOU MADE, BUT ALSO REFLECT THE LANGUAGE IN A
6 LETTER THAT WAS RECEIVED AND ENDORSED BY MANY OF YOU AT LAST
7 MONTH'S TASK FORCE MEETING. NEXT SLIDE. SO GOAL FOUR HAS BEEN
8 MODIFIED TO INCLUDE CONSIDERATION OF THE STATE AS WELL AS THE
9 REGIONAL TRANSIT INITIATIVES THAT ARE UNDERWAY. IT ALSO IS
10 DIRECTING OUR ATTENTION ON THE INITIATIVES. THESE ARE
11 INITIATIVES LIKE WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT FARE INTEGRATION
12 WAYFINDING SIGNAGE, BAY FORWARD AND OTHER KIND OF TRANSIT
13 ADVANTAGE INITIATIVES GOVERNANCE GRANTS AND THINGS OF THIS
14 NATURE BUT THESE INITIATIVES AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO YOUR
15 WORK SHOULD BE CONSIDERED IN THE CONTEXT OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT
16 OPTIONS THAT ARE BEING EVALUATED. AND THAT CONCLUDES IT. NEXT
17 SLIDE. I THINK IT TAKES US TO THE OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO
18 DISCUSS THESE PROPOSED REVISIONS. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE, LIKE
19 THE CHAIR DID, THAT WE NOT GET TOO BOGGED DOWN IN THE
20 LANGUAGE, BUT THESE ARE IMPORTANT SO IF THERE IS THINGS THAT
21 YOU THINK ARE MATERIAL, I ENCOURAGE TO YOU RECOMMEND CHANGES,
22 IF YOU CAN BE AS SPECIFIC AS POSSIBLE WITH THE LANGUAGE THAT
23 YOU PROPOSE, IF THERE IS A CHANGE, THAT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL.
24 AND THEN WE WILL TAKE ACTION ON THOSE AFTER, I BELIEVE, ALL OF



November 16, 2020

1 THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS AND PERHAPS THE PUBLIC HAVE COMMENTED.

2 CHAIR SPERING?

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOU'RE ON MUTE, JIM.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I WAS HAVING A LITTLE
7 PROBLEM THERE. THANK YOU, SCOTT. WHAT I WOULD LIKE -- WHO IS
8 CONTROLLING THE SLIDE DECK, YOU KNOW, WHEN SOMEONE REFERS TO
9 ONE OF THE GOALS, TELL US WHAT NUMBER IT IS, AND IF YOU COULD
10 PUT THAT SLIDE DECK UP, SO WE CAN USE THAT AS A DISCUSSION
11 POINT. AND SO WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND OPEN IT
12 UP FOR DISCUSSION, AND IF YOU THINK WE'RE ON THE RIGHT TRACK,
13 YOU'RE OKAY WITH THEM, WOULD BE GOOD TO HEAR FROM YOU. ELLEN
14 WU, ELLEN, YOU CAN KICK US OFF. GO AHEAD.

15

16 **ELLEN WU:** THANK YOU EVERYONE. GOOD MORNING. REALLY TRYING NOT
17 TO WORDSMITH BECAUSE I DON'T WANT 30 PEOPLE EDITING DOCUMENT.
18 SO JUST HAVE A COUPLE OF KEY POINTS AND CHANGES TO RECOMMEND
19 TO THE DOCUMENT. SO THE FIRST ONE IS THE -- I GUESS THE
20 PURPOSE STATEMENT. THERE IS REALLY NO TITLE. IT JUST HAS THE
21 GENERAL OVERALL STATEMENT OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. AND
22 I NOTICED THAT THE TERM EQUITABLE WAS DELETED FROM THE
23 ORIGINAL VERSION. -- AFFORDABLE WAS DELETE -- SORRY.
24 AFFORDABLE WAS DELETED FROM THE ORIGINAL VERSION, AND THAT
25 EQUITABLE IS NOT INCLUDED, WHICH IS ACTUALLY A GOAL. SO WOULD



November 16, 2020

1 WANT TO INCLUDE "AFFORDABLE" BACK IN, AND "EQUITABLE" AND IS
2 IT EASIER IF I COPY IT INTO CHAT? WHAT I WANT TO SAY TO COPY
3 IT INTO CHAT?

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. YOU CAN COPY IT INTO CHAT.

6

7 **ELLEN WU:** DESIGN ADEQUATELY INVEST IN AND EFFECTIVELY MANAGE
8 AN EQUITABLE PUBLIC TRANSIT NETWORK THAT IS INCLUSIVE,
9 FREQUENT, AFFORDABLE, ACCESSIBLE, ET CETERA. SO THOSE ARE JUST
10 THE TWO CHANGES TO THAT SLIDE. AND THEN JUST ONE OTHER ONE FOR
11 GOAL THREE. AND I'LL DO THIS. LET'S SEE WHAT OBJECTIVE --
12 OBJECTIVE E, SO I THINK IT MIGHT BE ON THE --

13

14 **SPEAKER:** NEXT SLIDE.

15

16 **ELLEN WU:** I THINK --

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO TO THE NEXT --

19

20 **ELLEN WU:** I WAS A LITTLE CONCERNED THAT -- TO SAY THAT WE
21 WOULD SUPPORT NEAR-TERM CONSOLIDATION WOULD MEAN THAT IT'S
22 KIND OF A GENERAL STATEMENT THAT WE ARE ALL IN AGREEMENT
23 WITHOUT REALLY KNOWING THE DETAILS AT THIS POINT. SO I JUST
24 MAKE IT A LITTLE MORE SPECIFIC SAYING "USING MTC STAFF AND



November 16, 2020

1 QUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS, IDENTIFY CRITERIA TO SUPPORT NEAR-
2 TERM CONSOLIDATION OPPORTUNITIES." AND I CAN COPY THAT TOO.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** AND THAT WAS ON D?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** C.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OH OKAY.

9

10 **ELLEN WU:** AND THOSE ARE JUST THE -- YEAH, THE TWO CHANGES,
11 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO RECOMMEND.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. GIVE ME C, AGAIN, ELLEN. WHAT
14 ARE YOUR CHANGES ON C AGAIN?

15

16 **ELLEN WU:** SORRY. MUTE. USING MTC STAFF AND QUALIFIED
17 PROFESSIONALS, IDENTIFY CRITERIA TO SUPPORT NEAR-TERM
18 CONSOLIDATION OPPORTUNITIES. INSTEAD OF KIND OF A CARTE BLANC
19 SUPPORT. THERE IS A TYPO IN MY CHAT. YOU GUYS WILL FIGURE IT
20 OUT.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT, OTHER COMMITTEE
23 MEMBERS ON GOALS OBJECTIVES? GINA PAPAN?

24



November 16, 2020

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES MR. CHAIR, AS FAR AS GOAL THREE, SECTION C,
2 "SUPPORT NEAR-TERM CONSOLIDATION OPPORTUNITIES TO FOCUS IN
3 SMALLER TRANSIT MARKETS." I WOULD PREFER THAT WE ARE TRYING TO
4 BE IMPACTFUL AS POSSIBLE THAT THAT COVERS ALL OF THE AGENCIES,
5 NOT JUST THE SMALLER. I GET WE'RE LOOKING FOR A STARTING POINT
6 BUT IF WE LIMIT OURSELVES TO THIS POINT IN TIME, I THINK THAT
7 WOULD BE REALLY DETRIMENTAL TO THE WHOLE PURPOSE.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO YOU'RE SUGGESTING TO REMOVE
10 THE SMALLER TRANSIT MARKETS?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** JUST, YEAH, EXPANDING ON THAT. IT SHOULD BE "ALL
13 TRANSIT MARKETS" THAT'S THE IMPACT WE HAVE HERE. ESPECIALLY
14 WITH 27 DIFFERENT AGENCIES. SO I'M NOT TRYING TO WORDSMITH
15 HERE. BUT I DO THINK THAT THAT NEEDS TO BE A BIGGER
16 OBJECTIVES, AND NOT LIMITED TO JUST SMALLER TRANSIT MARKETS.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH, I MEAN, THE PURPOSE OF THAT,
19 GINA, WAS THAT IT WAS SOMETHING THAT'S ACHIEVABLE. YOU KNOW,
20 IF WE MAKE THIS TOO BROAD, WE END UP WHERE WE ARE NOW, WHERE
21 IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO HAVE A, YOU KNOW, A FOCUSED APPROACH.
22 BUT THAT --

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** I GET --

25



November 16, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WE'LL SEE WHAT OTHER COMMITTEE
2 MEMBERS --

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. YEAH, MR. CHAIR, AND WITH THE LEGISLATIVE
5 ASPECT, I THINK WE HAVE A GRAND OPPORTUNITY HERE. SO I HOPE WE
6 CAN EXPAND ON IT.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** NO. I CONCUR. RANDI KINMAN? RANDI?

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I WOULD SUPPORT COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S
11 REMOVAL OF THE WORD "SMALLER" WHICH CREATES A MORE BLENDED
12 APPROACH EVEN THOUGH THE TARGET MIGHT BE SMALLER TRANSIT
13 MARKETS. MY QUESTION IS, WILL WE REFER IN GOAL THREE TO
14 EXPERIENCE PROFESSIONALS AND QUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS, AND I'M
15 JUST HOPING THAT WE CAN ALIGN THE LANGUAGE TO EITHER
16 EXPERIENCED OR QUALIFIED, AND I AM ASSUMING IT WOULD ALL BE
17 QUALIFIED. SINCE EXPERIENCED, BUT UNQUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS
18 WOULD NOT BE TO OUR BENEFIT. AND I'M HOPING THAT THAT INCLUDES
19 OUTSIDE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND OUTSIDE MTC. IT'S NOT DEFINED. SO
20 IF WE COULD JUST TAKE THE -- ANYWHERE -- WHERE IT SAYS
21 EXPERIENCE, TO CHANGE IT TO QUALIFIED. THROUGHOUT THE
22 DOCUMENTS.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. OKAY. SCOTT HAGGERTY. CHAIR
25 HAGGERTY?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. YOU KNOW I -- I REALLY
3 THINK -- I DON'T KNOW IF I REALLY AGREE WITH THE LANGUAGE
4 CHANGE, BUT WHAT I THINK WE SHOULD BE SAYING IS, YOU KNOW,
5 SUPPORT -- IDENTIFY -- LET ME SEE THIS -- SUPPORT WILLING
6 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN CONSOLIDATION EFFORTS. AGAIN I'M GOING
7 BACK TO THE FACT, THERE IS A FEW TRANSIT AGENCIES RIGHT NOW
8 THAT WANT TO MERGE, A FEW, THREE, AND THEY NEED HELP AND
9 ASSISTANCE. THERE SHOULD BE SOMETHING IN THERE THAT IDENTIFIES
10 THAT WE WILL STEP UP HELP FINANCIALLY AND SUPPORT WILLING
11 MERGERS.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. IAN?

14

15 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK STEVE
16 KINSEY AND CHAIR SPERING AND EVERYONE WHO WAS INVOLVED AND
17 STAFF AND MODIFYING THIS AND ADDRESSING A LOT OF THE COMMENTS
18 THAT WERE RECEIVED AT THE LAST MEETING. I GENERALLY LIKE THE
19 REVISED PURPOSE STATEMENT, AND THINK THIS IS MUCH, MUCH
20 STRONGER. I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS FROM SUPERVISOR PAPAN AND
21 TASK FORCE MEMBER KINMAN. I WOULD PROPOSE -- AND THE -- I
22 UNDERSTAND THAT WE HAVE LIMITED TIME, AND WE COULDN'T TAKE ON
23 EVERYTHING IN THIS TASK FORCE, AND I UNDERSTAND WHY THERE IS A
24 FOCUS ON SMALL AGENCY CONSOLIDATION AND OBJECTIVE C. WHAT I
25 WOULD PROPOSE PERHAPS INSTEAD THAT MAYBE ADDRESSES THE SAME



November 16, 2020

1 COMMENT THE OTHER TWO OTHER MENTIONING IS A SLIDE WORD CHANGE
2 TO OBJECTIVE 3B, WHICH I CAN POST IN THE CHAT, WHICH IS TO ADD
3 THE WORD -- AS PART OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT INVESTIGATION,
4 JUST TO ADD THE WORD GOVERNANCE INTO THAT LIST OF ITEMS. SO
5 USING PRIOR MTC ANALYSIS AND EXPERIENCED PROFESSIONALS. SO THE
6 FIRST CHANGE WOULD ACTUALLY BE TO INSERT AND IN CONNECTION
7 WITH THE ONGOING REGIONAL RAIL STUDY THAT WE UNDERSTAND IS
8 INVESTIGATING THIS SAME ISSUE, AND EVALUATE REGION WIDE
9 NETWORK MANAGEMENT ALTERNATIVES ADDRESSING ISSUES OF LEGAL
10 AUTHORITY AND ADDING THE WORD GOVERNANCE AND LABOR SCOPE
11 DUTIES ET CETERA. HOPEFULLY THAT WOULD ADDRESS AND ALLOW US TO
12 CONSIDER LONG-TERM CONSOLIDATIONS, BUT RECOGNIZING THAT THE
13 IMMEDIATE SHORT TERM FOCUS OF THIS TASK FORCE WILL CONSIDER
14 AND PROVIDE SUPPORT TO THOSE SMALLER AGENCY CONSOLIDATION MUCH
15 MORE FEASIBLE IN THE NEAR-TERM BUT TO ALLOW US TO THINK BEYOND
16 THAT SHOULD THOSE PERHAPS VALUABLE EFFORTS BE CONSIDERED AS
17 PART OF THE CONVERSATION ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT. I'LL TAKE
18 THE WHOLE BLOCK OF TEXT AND POST IT IN THE CHAT.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IN TERMS OF 3C, I AGREE WITH YOUR COMMENTS TO
23 FOCUS AND DISCIPLINED TO CREATE SOME MEANINGFUL ACTION BUT I
24 ALSO HEAR CONCERNS FROM COMMISSIONER PAPAN IN TERMS OF THIS
25 BEING A MOMENT IN TIME WHERE WE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO THINK OF



November 16, 2020

1 SOME OF THE THINGS. LEAVING SMALLER LEADERS, FOCUSING TO CHAIR
2 HAGGERTY'S POINT COULD ALSO INCLUDE MAYBE WILLING TO PROVIDE
3 SOME PEACE OF MIND THAT IS GOING TO BE WORKING WITH THE
4 SMALLER TRANSIT OPERATORS IF YOU HAPPEN TO BE A LARGER
5 OPERATOR, BUT I DO THINK IF YOU INCLUDE FOCUSING SMALLER
6 TRANSIT MARKETS AND WILLING OPERATORS I THINK MAYBE THAT WOULD
7 ADDRESS BOTH SIDES.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** JIM WUNDERMAN.

10

11 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I APPRECIATE PAPAN'S COMMENT. THE WAY 3B IS
12 PHRASED, I DON'T SEE WHY WE WOULD WANT TO BE EXCLUSIVE TO
13 SMALLER AND I'M NOT AS HYPED UP ABOUT WILLING VERSUS
14 UNWILLING, THE PURPOSE OF THIS IS TO IDENTIFY WHAT THE
15 OPPORTUNITIES ARE, AND THEN MAYBE ONCE THE OPPORTUNITIES ARE
16 IDENTIFIED AGENCIES WOULD BECOME WILLING. IT'S PRETTY TOUGH TO
17 ENGAGE IN A MERGER WHEN SOMEBODY IS UNWILLING BUT EXPOSING THE
18 FACTS AND OPPORTUNITIES IS REALLY THE WORK OF THE GROUP. SO
19 THAT'S MY VIEW ON THAT. AND ON THE LANGUAGE -- EXCUSE ME -- ON
20 3B, I DO NOT KNOW WHY WE ADDED THE WORD INCREASED BUDGET
21 REQUIREMENTS, SEEMS A LITTLE STRANGE TO ME THAT WE WOULD WANT
22 TO TAKE A LOOK AT ANALYSIS TO JUST LOOK AT INCREASES -- SORRY
23 ABOUT THE DOG -- AND NOT LOOK AT SAVINGS AS WELL BECAUSE BOTH
24 OF THOSE COULD BE PRESENT IN CIRCUMSTANCES. AND THE WORD IN



November 16, 2020

1 THERE SAVINGS, I THINK IT'S FAIR ENOUGH TO CONSIDER WHAT
2 INCREASES MAY BE AS WELL IN THE ANALYSIS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. JIM HARTNETT.

5

6 **JIM HARTNETT:** THANK YOU JIM. I HAVE SOME CONCERNS, THE
7 LANGUAGE THAT'S ALREADY IN THE REVISED DOCUMENT, I'M ALWAYS
8 WORRIED ABOUT CHANGES AT A MEETING LIKE THIS, WITH UNINTENDED
9 CONSEQUENCES. I'M NOT COMFORTABLE WITH ALL OF THE LANGUAGE IN
10 THE REVISED DOCUMENT, BUT I THINK IT STRIKES AN APPROPRIATE
11 BALANCE, AND WITH THAT, I DO THINK IT WOULD BE BETTER WITH THE
12 APPROPRIATE BALANCE THAT'S ALREADY IN THERE, RECOGNIZING,
13 THERE IS A TON OF WORK TO DO. AND THIS -- I THINK SETS THE
14 PROPER FRAMEWORK FOR THE WORK TO BE DONE. I JUST THINK IT
15 WOULD BE BETTER TO PROCEED WITH THE LANGUAGE AS IT IS. AND I
16 ACTUALLY INTERPRETED THE REVISED 3C AS SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY
17 EXPRESSED IT, WITHOUT THE NEED FOR IT TO BE CHANGED. THAT'S
18 HOW I INTERPRETED 3C WOULD WORK THE WAY THAT HE DESCRIBED IT.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. RICK RAMACIER?

21

22 **RICK RAMACIER:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I'M GOING TO SPEAK ON
23 BEHALF OF ALL OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS AS OPPOSED TO, SAY,
24 JUST MY AGENCY. SO I ASK THE TASK FORCE TO RECOGNIZE THAT'S
25 WHERE THE COMMENTS ARE COMING FROM. THE SMALLER OPERATORS WITH



November 16, 2020

1 THE EXCEPTION OF THE SOLANO OPERATORS, SENT A LETTER IN, I'M
2 NOT SURE IF IT WAS RECEIVED ON TIME. I'M JUST GOING TO TOUCH
3 ON IT REAL QUICKLY. PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANTLY, THE ISSUE OF
4 FUNDING, THE SMALLER OPERATORS WHILE WE CHOOSE NOT TO
5 WORDSMITH THIS AND LEAVE IT TO STEVE KINSEY TO FIND A WAY TO
6 MAKE IT CLEAR, WITH REGARDS TO FUNDING AND WHATEVER CONCEPT
7 COMES OUT OF THE RECOMMENDATION MOVING FORWARD TO IMPROVE THE
8 EXPERIENCE FOR THE CUSTOMER AND SEAMLESS AND CREATING THIS
9 REGIONAL NETWORK COME OUT OF CLEAR NEW FUNDING THAT'S
10 ESTABLISHED SOMEWHERE WHETHER THROUGH VOTER INITIATIVE OR
11 STATE LEGISLATURE THERE WAS CONSENSUS AMONGST SMALLER
12 OPERATORS THAT STILL NEEDS TO BE INCLUDED. AND THIS IDEA OF
13 LOCAL ENGAGEMENT, AND AT SOME POINT, THIS TASK FORCE GOING
14 THROUGH THE PROCESS IN ENGAGING LOCAL LEADERS ON WHAT WE'RE UP
15 TO. AND THIRD ON THE ISSUE OF C3, SUGGESTED ADDING THE WORD
16 CRITERIA. I THINK THAT'S HELP. THE SOLANO OPERATORS ARE STILL
17 TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT IS THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE
18 BY SIMPLY MERGING SMALLER OPERATORS. SO, AGAIN, A BUSINESS
19 CASE MAY BARE BEAR THAT OUT BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS MAY SHOW
20 THE BENEFITS AS OPPOSED TO DOWNSIDE OF DOING IT. IF THAT CAN
21 BE ACCOMPLISHED BEFORE DECISIONS ARE MADE, I THINK THE SMALLER
22 OPERATORS WOULD FEEL MUCH MORE COMFORTABLE WITH THAT LANGUAGE
23 MOVING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RICK. AMY WORTH. AMY?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK STAFF AND OUR
3 CONSULTING TEAM FOR TAKING AND INCORPORATING THE WORDS. AND
4 WHEN I HEARD STEVE KINSEY ARTICULATE THE WORDS, AS HE DID, IT
5 GAVE ME A LOT OF COMFORT. AS A REPRESENTATIVE OF A COUNTY THAT
6 HAS A NUMBER OF SMALLER OPERATORS I'M MINDFUL OF THE HISTORY
7 WHY THESE AGENCIES ARE CREATED AND THEY WERE CREATED TO
8 PROVIDE COMMUNITY SERVICE AND TO LINK COMMUNITIES TO THE
9 BROADER, THINGS LIKE IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, BART IS CENTRAL
10 TO OUR LONGER TERM COMMUTE TRANSIT SERVICES. BUT WE ALSO
11 PROVIDE ESSENTIAL TO SCHOOL TRANSPORTATION AND WE ALSO PROVIDE
12 LOCAL COMMUNITY TRANSIT FOR OUR TRANSPORTATION -- TRANSIT
13 DEPENDENT COMMUNITIES. SO I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT, IS I DO
14 SUPPORT THIS, THE LANGUAGE THAT'S BEEN IDENTIFIED HERE, BUT I
15 ALSO SUPPORT THIS CONCEPT THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE, BEFORE
16 WE PROCEED DOWN ANY PLAN OF MERGER, I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE
17 THIS ABILITY FOR THE LOCAL AGENCIES TO SIT DOWN AND ENGAGE IN
18 THIS DISCUSSION OF THE BUSINESS CASE, AND THE SERVICE CASE.
19 AND I ALSO WANT TO -- BECAUSE, AT THIS POINT, YOU KNOW, THIS
20 IS KIND OF NEW FOR OUR REGION, AND WE ALL, AS COMMISSIONERS AT
21 MTC NEED BE ABLE TO SIT DOWN WITH OUR LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES
22 AND DISCUSS THIS. AND SO I WOULD SUPPORT THIS LANGUAGE WITH
23 THAT AS PART OF THE FRAMEWORK. BUT I ALSO THINK IT'S VERY
24 IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THE ROLE THAT MTC WILL PLAY IN THIS.
25 YOU KNOW, MTC IS THE ONE -- YOU KNOW, AGENCY, IN THE REGION



November 16, 2020

1 THAT HAS REPRESENTATIVE FOR ALL THE COUNTIES, ALL THE
2 AGENCIES, AND I THINK THAT'S THE -- HAVING WORKED WITH MTC ON
3 THE TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY STUDY, A NUMBER OF THE STUDIES ALL
4 THE -- THEY'RE HIGH QUALITY THOUGHTFUL STUDIES WITH A LOT OF
5 ENGAGEMENT WITH PROFESSIONAL PERSPECTIVE. SO I WOULD -- I
6 WOULD SUPPORT THIS LANGUAGE, AGAIN, I THINK IT'S EXTREMELY
7 IMPORTANT TO KIND OF GET A SENSE OF THE ENDGAME, AND I WANT TO
8 EMPHASIZE, RICK RAMACIER'S POINT, AND THE SMALLER OPERATORS,
9 THAT ANY NEW INITIATIVES NEW TO COME WITH NEW FUNDING. YOU
10 KNOW, WE ARE VERY COMMITTED TO SOME OF THESE CONCEPTS OF
11 REGION WIDE TRANSIT, AND WE ENGAGE IN IT ACTIVELY, BUT AGAIN,
12 I DON'T THINK YOU CAN TAKE SERVICES FROM ONE COMMUNITY TO, YOU
13 KNOW, PUT THEM INTO REGIONAL RESOURCES, OR WHATEVER. SO I
14 THINK THAT THE REASSURANCE THAT RESOURCES ARE THERE FOR OUR
15 LOCAL SERVICES, IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO,
16 AGAIN, I TAKE THE LANGUAGE SERIOUSLY. I THINK THAT THEY ARE
17 REASSURANCES THAT HAVE BEEN PROVIDED IN THIS LANGUAGE ARE
18 IMPORTANT. AND I WOULD ALSO BE RELUCTANT TO START CHANGING
19 THIS LANGUAGE WITHOUT SIGNIFICANT THOUGHT, JUST BECAUSE
20 WORKING FROM THE BLACKBOARD, WITHOUT, YOU KNOW, A REAL
21 THOUGHTFUL -- I'M THINKING OF SCHOOL, I'M REMEMBERING THAT THE
22 CHALK, AND LOOKING AT, MAKING CHANGES WITHOUT REALLY A CHANCE
23 TO THINK ABOUT THEM. BECAUSE I THINK ALSO IN THE LONG-TERM,
24 EQUITY, I'M PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT OUR SMALLER TRANSIT
25 OPERATORS THAT OFFER TRANSIT SERVICES TO THE TRANSIT



November 16, 2020

1 DEPENDENT. THERE ARE NO OTHER OPTIONS. SO, WITH THAT, I, YOU
2 KNOW, AGAIN, I APPRECIATE THE WORK OF STAFF, AND OUR
3 CONSULTANTS TO KIND OF TRY TO FIND THE FINE BALANCE OF MOVING
4 FORWARD BUT ALSO RECOGNIZING THERE ARE CHALLENGES AND
5 CONSTRAINTS THAT EXIST.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU AMY. JASON BAKER. JASON?

8

9 **JASON BAKER:** I WANT TO SEE CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE PROBLEM
10 STATEMENT. AND I WOULDN'T ALLOW MYSELF TO MISS THE OPPORTUNITY
11 TO LOOK AT PREVIOUS WORK, AND MAYBE IT'S JUST A SMALL LANGUAGE
12 CHANGE OR MAYBE THE WAY WE TALK ABOUT LANGUAGE ALREADY, BUT
13 FOCUS BUT NOT LIMITED TO SMALLER AGENCIES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT
14 THE FACT THAT MAYBE THERE IS LOWER HANGING FRUIT WITH AGENCIES
15 THAT ARE ALREADY WILLING AND SMALLER BUT AS LONG AS WE'RE
16 GOING TO DO THIS DIVE AND HAVE STAFF PROFESSIONALS COME TALK
17 TO US WE SHOULDN'T MISS THE CHANCE THAT MAY BE APPLICABLE TO
18 MEDIUM OR LONG-TERM WORK WITH THE LARGER AGENCIES.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JASON. DARYL HALLS. DARYL?

21

22 **DARYL HALLS:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. I WANT TO ECHO A COUPLE
23 OF RICK COMMENTS. HE MENTIONED SOLANO OPERATORS DIDN'T SIGN
24 THE LETTER WE UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF FUNDING AND LOCAL
25 INVOLVEMENT. ITEM C IS REALLY IMPORTANT THERE IS A LOT OF



November 16, 2020

1 UNDERSTANDING THAT WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO ACTIVELY WORK WITH
2 MTC AND OTHERS IT'S BEEN YEARS SINCE WE DID A COMPREHENSIVE
3 CONSOLIDATION STUDY, WITH SOLTRANS, IMPROVEMENT, AND I THINK
4 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO ROUND TWO. AND IF WE WANT TO CONVEY AND
5 SEE THE LANGUAGE AS WRITTEN WORKS WITH US AND WE'RE WORKING
6 WITH JIM SPERING AND TRANSIT OPERATORS TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE
7 ISSUES IN THE TASK FORCE, AND THOSE DISCUSSIONS HAVE BEGUN I
8 WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT WE ARE DEFINITELY IN SUPPORT OF THE
9 DIRECTIVE MESSAGE SETTING.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** JEFF?

12

13 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION THIS MORNING BUT
14 WE HAVE A LOT ON OUR AGENDA AND I DON'T THINK IT'S THE MOST
15 EFFECTIVE USE OF OUR TIME TO TRY TO DO WORDSMITHING WITH 35 OF
16 US HERE. AND WITH MANY OF THE PREVIOUS SPEAKERS, I DON'T LOVE
17 ALL OF THIS LANGUAGE. I THINK THIS LANGUAGE IS CLOSE ENOUGH,
18 AND I WANT TO MOVE ON TO THE REAL WORK OF THIS COMMITTEE, AND
19 SO IF THE CHAIR IS WILLING, I WOULD LIKE TO ACTUALLY MOVE THIS
20 ITEM WITH THE ORIGINAL LANGUAGE AS PRESENTED BY STAFF.

21

22 **JIM HARTNETT:** SECOND. THIS IS JIM HARTNETT, AND I SECOND THAT
23 MOTION.

24



November 16, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. LET'S JUST GO THROUGHOUT
2 COMMENTS. AND JEFF, I CERTAINLY AGREE, AND I JUST -- I'M GOING
3 TO DO A QUICK POLL AND SEE IF WE CAN GET TO THAT FAIRLY
4 QUICKLY. IS THERE ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS? DAVID?
5 ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU. GOOD TO HAVE YOU TODAY, DAVID, THANK YOU.

6

7 **DAVID CHIU:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. FIRST LET ME SAY I REALLY
8 APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THESE REVISIONS. I
9 THINK THINGS HAVE MOVED IN A GOOD DIRECTION. I THINK IT'S A
10 GOOD KICKING OFF POINT FOR THE CONTENT OF THE TRANSFORMATION
11 PLAN ACTION PLAN AND LEGISLATION TO PREPARE WITH LOCAL AND
12 REGIONAL POLICY CHANGES. ON C3, I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS MADE
13 BY PAPAN, WUNDERMAN, KINMAN AND OTHERS, WE OBVIOUSLY HAVE TO
14 PRIORITIZE BUT I THINK THE CURRENT LANGUAGE SUGGESTS THAT WE
15 SHOULDN'T LOOK AT ALL AT OTHER POTENTIAL CONSOLIDATION
16 OPTIONS. AND I MIGHT SUGGEST THAT WE THINK ABOUT HOW TO STATE
17 IT IN A WAY OF PRIORITIES, PRIORITIZING THE CONVERSATION THAT
18 WE KNOW NEED TO HAPPEN, BUT NOT FOR CLOSING OTHER
19 POSSIBILITIES. AND YOU KNOW, IF ITS DECISION TODAY THAT FOLKS
20 WANT TO MOVE FORWARD AS S I PROBABLY WOULD THROW UP A YELLOW
21 CARD, IF THERE IS SOME OPENNESS TO KIND OF THINK ABOUT
22 REVISING THAT LANGUAGE I'M MUCH MORE COMFORTABLE WITH THE
23 GREEN CARD. BUT I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. I THINK THAT PEOPLE
24 UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO HAVE CONVERSATION WITH
25 LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND START WITH CRITERIA. I THINK THAT'S



November 16, 2020

1 SOMETHING WE CAN ALL AGREE WITH BUT UNDERSTANDING THERE MAY BE
2 OPTIONS BEYOND THAT IS SOMETHING WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT. THE
3 LAST THING I WANT TO SAY ELLEN WU HAD PROPOSED LANGUAGE
4 CHANGES WHICH I REALLY LOOK ADDITION OF WORDS EQUITABLE AND
5 AFFORDABLE THE NIT-PICKY THING, THROWING EQUITABLE IN FRONT OF
6 AFFORDABLE, QUALIFYING FRAMEWORK, JUST WANTED TO THROW OUT
7 THOSE COMMENTS. APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S WORK ON THIS.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MR. CHAIR, REAL QUICK.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** GINA PAPAN. WE JUST HEARD FROM OUR LEGISLATIVE
14 REPRESENTATIVE WHO IS TRYING TO HELP US THROUGH THIS PROCESS.
15 AND I THINK MR. BAKER'S COMMENTS ABOUT FOCUS BUT NOT LIMITED
16 TO WOULD OPEN THE DOOR. I WOULD HAVE TO VOTE RED UNLESS THAT
17 LANGUAGE WAS INCLUDED IN THERE. TRANSIT AGENCIES ESPECIALLY
18 THE BIG ONES HAVE A HABIT OF GOING AND POINTING TO JUST THIS
19 TYPE OF LANGUAGE. SO I BELIEVE WE SHOULD MAKE MR. BAKER'S
20 MODIFICATION OF FOCUS BUT NOT LIMITED TO SMALLER TRANSIT
21 MARKETS AND THAT'S THE ONLY WAY I WOULD VOTE, GREEN IF IT HAD
22 THAT AMENDMENT.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IS THAT A SUBSTITUTE MOTION?

25



November 16, 2020

1 **GINA PAPAN:** IF ACCEPTED, YES.

2

3 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IF IT'S A SUBSTITUTE MOTION, IT NEEDS A
4 SECOND.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WELL NOW, GINA JUST HOLD OFF ON
7 MAKING THAT MOTION, PLEASE. I'LL GIVE YOU AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO
8 THAT. I DO WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS. YOU KNOW, THE WAY WE
9 CRAFTED THIS LANGUAGE WHERE WE HAVE "WHERE FEASIBLE" THIS GOAL
10 DOESN'T PRECLUDE THE COMMITTEE FROM MAKING A RECOMMENDATION ON
11 HOW WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THE LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS. YOU
12 KNOW, DO WE PUT A PROCESS IN PLACE THAT STARTS LOOKING AT
13 THAT. YOU KNOW, RIGHT NOW, THE LARGE OPERATORS ARE WORKING
14 CLOSELY TOGETHER, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE COORDINATES, COOPERATING,
15 THEY'RE DOING SOME THINGS THAT THEY HAVEN'T DONE IN A LONG
16 TIME. AND I THINK WE OUGHT TO LET THAT PROCESS DEVELOP MORE
17 OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS. BUT THERE IS NOTHING TO
18 PREVENT THIS COMMITTEE TO TRY TO PUT IN FORMAL REVIEW INTO
19 WORKING WITH THE LARGER OPERATORS. I JUST REALLY WANT TO
20 CAUTION THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS, THAT IF WE MAKE THIS SO LARGE,
21 THAT THIS COMMITTEE REALLY ISN'T GOING TO ACCOMPLISH ANYTHING.
22 AND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO IS FOCUS ON THE SMALLER OPERATORS,
23 WHERE WE SAY "WHERE FEASIBLE" AND WHAT IS THE DEFINITION OF
24 SMALL OPERATORS, AND I AM SURE IF I ASKED EVERYBODY WE WOULD
25 HAVE 20 DIFFERENT ANSWERS. AND BART IS MUNI, AC, THOSE ARE THE



November 16, 2020

1 LARGE OPERATORS AND EVERYBODY ELSE KIND OF FALLS INTO THE
2 SMALLER CATEGORY AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE FORCING ANYTHING ON
3 TO ANYBODY, WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING IT WHERE FEASIBLE AND IF
4 THERE IS ANYBODY ON THIS COMMITTEE THAT WANT'S TO SEE AN
5 EXAMPLE OF WHAT SHOULD BE LOOKED AT CLOSELY AND MAYBE
6 CONSOLIDATED OR REALLY REFORMED IS SOLANO COUNTY. AND IF YOU
7 WANT TO COME UP, I'LL SHOW IT TO YOU, WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT,
8 AND IT'S NOT A FUNDING ISSUE. IT'S HOW WE'RE PROVIDING SERVICE
9 TO PEOPLE THAT REALLY NEED IT. AND YOU KNOW, BECAUSE OF THE
10 WAY WE'RE SETUP, IT'S NOT FUNCTIONAL, AND IT'S NOT WORKING.
11 AND SO, YOU KNOW, THOSE ARE THE TYPE OF THINGS THAT NEED TO BE
12 REVIEWED, I DON'T KNOW THAT THOSE ARE ALL OF THE ANSWERS. BUT
13 I JUST CAUTION THAT WE START ADDING SO MUCH LANGUAGE INTO
14 THIS, THAT WE JUST START TO REALLY BURDEN THE ABILITY OF THIS
15 COMMITTEE TO DELIVER SOME MEANINGFUL RECOMMENDATIONS. AND SO,
16 I WOULD JUST CAUTION THAT. BUT THERE IS STILL GOING TO BE
17 DISCUSSION ON THE LARGER OPERATORS, CONSOLIDATION,
18 COOPERATION, COORDINATION, ALL OF THAT DISCUSSION HAS TO TAKE
19 PLACE AT SOME POINT. AND I JUST REALLY, FOR ME, I REALLY WANT
20 LIKE TO SEE SOME SOLID RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF THIS
21 COMMITTEE, THAT WE DON'T MAKE IT SO BROAD THAT WE REALLY CAN'T
22 FOCUS ON THOSE. SO THAT'S JUST KIND OF MY COMMENTS. STEVE WERE
23 YOU KEEPING TRACK OF THE RECOMMENDED CHANGES?
24



November 16, 2020

1 **STEVE KINSEY:** YES, I WAS, CHAIR SPERING. FIRST IF WE TAKE UP
2 THE DEFINITION, SLIDE SHOWS THAT THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
3 DEFINITION COULD BE BROUGHT UP, KEEP GOING BACK, ONE MORE.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THERE YOU GO.

6

7 **STEVE KINSEY:** ELLEN WU HAD SUGGESTED TWO WORDS BE ADDED HERE.
8 ONE, BEHIND EFFECTIVELY MANAGE, AND EQUITABLE, PUBLIC TRANSIT
9 NETWORK, THAT IS INCLUSIVE, AND THEN AFTER RELIABLE, ADDING
10 AFFORDABLE. SO I THINK YOU COULD JUST DECIDE, MR. CHAIR,
11 WHETHER OR NOT THERE'S CONSENSUS THAT THOSE WORDS ARE
12 ACCEPTABLE TO BE A PART OF THE DEFINITION, AND IF NOT, THEN
13 YOU CAN GO INTO A MORE DETAILED KIND OF GREEN LIGHT RED LIGHT.
14 BUT MY SENSE IS THAT THOSE WORDS HAVE BEEN ACCUSED
15 CONSISTENTLY THROUGHOUT THE TASK FORCE WORK AND IT'S SOMETHING
16 YOU MIGHT JUST ACCEPT BY BROAD SUPPORT.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. I AGREE. IT REALLY ENHANCES
19 THAT DEFINITION. SO, IS THERE ANYBODY THAT'S ABSOLUTELY
20 OPPOSED TO THAT LANGUAGE CHANGE IN THE DEFINITION? IF SO RAISE
21 YOUR HAND. OKAY. ALL RIGHT.

22

23 **DAVID CHIU:** COULD I JUST ASK ONE CLARIFYING QUESTION. SO IF
24 YOU PUT EQUITABLE IN FRONT OF PUBLIC TRANSIT NETWORK AND THAT



November 16, 2020

1 QUALIFIERS, I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE INTERPLAY -- SORRY
2 THE LAWYER IN ME, AND IT I WANT TO UNDERSTAND.

3

4 **ELLEN WU:** WE DEFINITELY WANTED TO HAVE EQUITABLE BECAUSE IT'S
5 A GOAL AND FEELS LIKE IT SHOULD BE INCLUDED. AND HAPPY TO
6 ENTERTAIN OTHER THINGS, BUT I ALSO DON'T THINK IT'S A BAD IDEA
7 TO HAVE EQUITY FRONT AND CENTER OVER EVERYTHING THAT WE THEN
8 MOVE FORWARD AND DO. IT'S A GOOD THING, TO HAVE THAT LENS, AS
9 PART OF -- YOU KNOW.

10

11 **AMY R. WORTH:** JIM, I CAN JUST ASK? ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU, I
12 THINK YOUR POINT IS, IT'S NOT NECESSARILY THE WORD, BUT PUT
13 THE WORD IN THE APPROPRIATE PLACE IN THE SENTENCE.

14

15 **DAVID CHIU:** CORRECT.

16

17 **AMY R. WORTH:** YOU WOULD SAY INCLUSIVE, EQUITABLE QUESTION
18 RATHER THAN WHAT --

19

20 **DAVID CHIU:** I WOULD SAY -- I DON'T KNOW IF THE IMPLICATION IS
21 SAYING EQUITABLE AND THEN EVERYTHING ELSE.

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** SO I THINK THE SUGGESTION IS PUTTING EQUITABLE
24 IN FRONT OF INCLUSIVE IN THE SERIES MUCH QUALIFYING
25 CHARACTERIZATION THAT WE HAVE EMBRACE SAID.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT'S A GOOD CLARIFICATION.
3 ANYBODY THAT OBJECTS TO THAT? MOVE ON.

4

5 **STEVE KINSEY:** GOAL THREE, WHERE THE OTHER CHANGES ARE BEING
6 PROPOSED. PRIMARILY ON ITEM C. I THINK THAT THE QUESTION, FOR
7 YOU, CHAIR SPERING, AND SOME OTHERS IS WHETHER OR NOT THE
8 LANGUAGE THAT THIS TASK FORCE BAKER PROPOSED WHERE IT WOULD
9 SAY CONSOLIDATION OPPORTUNITIES, FOCUSED IN, BUT -- IN --
10 LET'S SEE. IT SAID FOCUSED IN -- BUT -- FOCUSED IN, BUT NOT
11 LIMITED TO SMALL TRANSIT MARKETS. IF YOU WOULD ACCEPT THAT, I
12 THINK A NUMBER OF THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS WHO SPOKE, WOULD BE
13 SUPPORTIVE. IT MAINTAINS THE PRIORITY OF FOCUS ON THE SMALLER
14 MARKETS, BUT ALLOWS FOR THE CONSIDERATION OF HOW CONSOLIDATION
15 RELATES TO ALL OF THE AGENCIES, AS YOU DO YOUR EVALUATION. SO
16 THAT WOULD BE -- I THINK I WOULD CHECK THAT FIRST. BEFORE GET
17 INTO SOME OF THE OTHER IDEAS AROUND WILLINGNESS AND SO FORTH.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH THAT KIND OF INCLUDES MANY OF
20 THE COMMENTS THAT WE HEARD. SO, LET'S -- STEVE, JUST READ THAT
21 LANGUAGE BACK AGAIN. AND I'M GOING ASK FOR COMMENTS.

22

23 **STEVE KINSEY:** SURE IT WOULD SAY USING MTC STAFF AND QUALIFIED
24 PROFESSIONALS, IDENTIFY AND SUPPORT NEAR-TERM CONSOLIDATION
25 OPPORTUNITIES FOCUSED IN BUT NOT LIMITED TO SMALLER TRANSIT



November 16, 2020

1 MARKETS WITH MULTIPLE TRANSIT OPERATORS TO PROVIDE A MORE
2 CONNECTED SERVICE TO THE CUSTOMER WHERE FEASIBLE. AND, I THINK
3 THAT ADDRESSES THOSE WHO WANT TO HAVE A BROADER REACH. IT
4 DOESN'T NECESSARILY TAKE UP THE IDEA OF THE WILLING OPERATOR
5 AND I THINK WE COULD HAVE MORE CONVERSATION ABOUT WHETHER OR
6 NOT YOU NEED LANGUAGE OR WANT LANGUAGE AROUND THAT.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. LET'S -- COMMENTS ON THAT
9 LANGUAGE CHANGE?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** MR. CHAIR, I WOULD ACCEPT THAT LANGUAGE CHANGE.
12 BECAUSE I HAVE TO DEAL WITH THE BIG OPERATORS, AND I
13 UNDERSTAND YOU'RE DEALING WITH THE SMALLER ONES. BUT THAT
14 WOULD LEAVE THE DOOR OPEN, I THINK, FOR LEGISLATION, IF WE
15 NEED.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. OKAY. I MEAN, IT -- I'M JUST
18 CONCERNED THAT -- I DON'T WANT THIS COMMITTEE TO GET BOGGED
19 DOWN DEALING WITH LARGE TRANSIT OPERATIONS CONSOLIDATION
20 BECAUSE IT REALLY ISN'T SOMETHING THAT'S ACHIEVABLE FOR THIS
21 COMMITTEE. SO I WANT TO CAUTION THAT WE DON'T GET BOGGED DOWN
22 ON THAT ISSUE. OTHER PEOPLE? COMMITTEE MEMBERS, COMMENTS ON
23 THIS LANGUAGE CHANGE? YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S ACCEPTABLE, TO
24 ME.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **STEVE KINSEY:** THERE ARE A COUPLE OTHER THINGS I WOULD POINT
2 TO. THERESE?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. MY ONLY OTHER OBSERVATION IS, I THINK,
5 "WHERE FEASIBLE" REALLY, IS A QUALIFYING STATEMENT THAT COULD
6 TAKE IN -- I MEAN SOMEONE'S COMPLETELY UNWILLING, THAT'S NOT
7 NECESSARILY GOING TO BE FEASIBLE, I THINK THAT ALLOWS FOR THE
8 CONSIDERATION OF ADVANCING THINGS THAT ARE GOING TO HAPPEN,
9 THAT ARE ACTIONABLE, ET CETERA. SO, I THINK THAT THE CURRENT
10 MODIFICATION WORKS.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ARE THERE ANY OBJECTIONS TO
13 THAT CHANGE OF LANGUAGE? OKAY.

14

15 **STEVE KINSEY:** OKAY. THE ONE OTHER ONE THERE, CHAIR SPERING,
16 WAS TASK FORCE MEMBER WU ALSO WANTED TO MODIFY THE FRONT END
17 OF, THIS OF THIS ITEM, WHICH WAS WHERE IT SAYS IDENTIFY AND
18 SUPPORT, SHE WANTED IT TO CHANGE TO "IDENTIFY CRITERIA TO
19 SUPPORT" WHICH WAS TO BE A BIT MORE OPEN ENDED IN WHETHER OR
20 NOT TO GO FORWARD WITH LOOKING AT THIS. BUT, SO THAT -- THAT
21 IS THE OTHER ONE, THEN, THAT I THINK YOU COULD DISCUSS.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ELLEN EXPLAIN THAT CRITERIA? IT SEEMS
24 LIKE THAT'S JUST A LITTLE INVOLVED TO GET TO THAT TYPE OF
25 DEFINITION. EXPLAIN THE PURPOSE OF THAT.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **ELLEN WU:** WELL, IT'S MORE THE ASSUMPTION OF THAT WE'RE ALREADY
3 IN SUPPORT OF THE IDEA AND ANYTHING THAT WOULD BE PROPOSED. SO
4 IT WAS QUALIFYING THE SUPPORT. BUT GIVEN THE AMOUNT OF
5 CONVERSATION AND THE FACT THAT WE REALLY NEED TO MOVE O I AM
6 TOTAL WILLING TO LET GO OF THAT.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY YEAH. I WOULD APPRECIATE THAT.
9 BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW THAT I WOULD SUPPORT THAT. SO I
10 APPRECIATE THAT. THAT CERTAINLY WILL HELP.

11

12 **STEVE KINSEY:** EXCELLENT.

13

14 **ELLEN WU:** I JUST WANT THIS CLEAR, YOU KNOW, IF THERE IS A LOT
15 OF DETAILS, AS WE HAVE EXPERIENCED IN THE LAST TEN MINUTE, 15
16 MINUTE CONVERSATION, THAT GOES INTO THE CONSOLIDATION
17 CONVERSATION, ET CETERA, AND THAT WE SHOULDN'T AUTOMATICALLY
18 ASSUME SUPPORT.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** NO. WE UNDERSTAND THAT.

21

22 **ELLEN WU:** YEAH.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. NICK, I DON'T SEE YOUR HAND UP.
25 BUT I WAS TOLD THAT YOU WANT TO SPEAK?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** NO. I WAS JUST GOING TO AGREE.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT'S A MILESTONE IN ITSELF,
5 THAT NICK JOSEFOWITZ AGREES.

6

7 **STEVE KINSEY:** IF YOU GO BACK ONE SLIDE BACK TO OBJECTIVE B.
8 YOU CAN SEE WHERE WE TALK ABOUT EXPERIENCED PROFESSIONALS,
9 TASK FORCE MEMBER KINMAN WANTED QUALIFIED TO USE, BE USED IN
10 ALL CASES. I THINK THAT'S PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. THERE WAS
11 ALSO A REQUEST FROM TASK FORCE MEMBERS GRIFFITHS ABOUT INJECT
12 -- INSERTING THE WORD GOVERNANCE AFTER ISSUES OF LEGAL
13 AUTHORITY AND BEFORE LABOR. SO IT'S JUST TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
14 GOVERNANCE WOULD ALSO BE PART OF THE EVALUATION OF THE NETWORK
15 MANAGEMENT CONCEPTS THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT. MY OWN SENSE, FROM
16 WHAT YOU HAVE TALKED ABOUT IS IT'S INHERENT, BUT I THINK IF
17 YOU WANT TO HAVE MORE DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT, THAT MAY BE
18 APPROPRIATE. I THINK IT COULD BE ADDED EASILY.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. IS THERE ANYONE THAT'S -- THAT
21 OBJECTS TO JUST ADDING THAT LANGUAGE IN? I AGREE IT IS
22 INHERENT.

23

24 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** CAN I PROPOSE -- THAT WAS MADE -- THAT
25 SUGGESTION WAS MADE PRIOR TO TASK FORCE MEMBER BAKER'S



November 16, 2020

1 SUGGESTION, AND I THINK THE ONE THAT WE ALREADY APPROVED, IT
2 COVERS IT, SO I WOULD BE FINE ELIMINATING THAT FROM THE -- YOU
3 KNOW, WE DON'T NEED TO DISCUSS THAT CHANGE, FOR MY SAKE, AT
4 LEAST, AT THIS POINT.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU IAN. WE'LL JUST
7 LEAVE IT AS IT IS. IS THERE ANY OTHER CHANGES?

8

9 **STEVE KINSEY:** ONE FINAL ONE I THOUGHT YOU MIGHT WANT TO AT
10 LEAST CONSIDER, IS YOU HAD RECEIVED A LETTER FROM THE SMALLER
11 OPERATORS AND TWO TASK FORCE MEMBERS, RAMACIER ON BEHALF OF
12 THEM, AS WELL AS DARYL HALLS, ON BEHALF OF SOLANO OPERATORS,
13 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF NEW FUNDING, AND TASK
14 FORCE MEMBER WUNDERMAN WONDERED ABOUT THE IDEA OF INCREASED
15 BUDGET -- THE USE OF THE TERM "INCREASED FUNDING REQUIREMENTS"
16 THE INCREASE WAS TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT
17 NEEDING NEW FUNDING FOR NEW INITIATIVES, THAT YOU CAN'T DO
18 MORE WITH THE SAME. AND SO, I THINK THAT'S WHY INCREASED HAD
19 GOTTEN IN THERE. HE ASKED ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT WE COULD GET
20 BUDGET SAVINGS AS WELL. SO THAT'S ONE QUESTION. ONE THOUGHT
21 WOULD BE TO -- I THINK THAT -- THAT THE IDEA OF A BUSINESS
22 CASE WILL EVALUATE SAVINGS. SO I DON'T THINK THAT IT'S
23 NECESSARY TO INCLUDE THAT. I DO THINK THAT YOU COULD LOOK AT
24 OBJECTIVE D, IF WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, OBJECTIVE D COULD --
25 EXCUSE ME -- UNDER -- ACTUALLY IT'S ON GOAL FOUR -- NO. EXCUSE



November 16, 2020

1 ME. GOAL 3D WHERE YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT STATE AND REGIONAL
2 POLICY LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS, YOU COULD INCLUDE "AND IDENTIFY
3 ADDITIONAL -- OR NEW FUNDING FOR NEW SERVICES" SO THAT IT
4 RECOGNIZES WHAT YOUR OPERATORS ARE TELLING YOUR SMALLER
5 OPERATORS IN PARTICULAR, ARE SAYING THAT THEY WANT IT
6 RECOGNIZED THAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE NEW MONEY IF YOU'RE GOING
7 TO DO MORE THINGS. SO I THINK THAT'S THE POINT OF THE
8 CONVERSATION. YOU HAVE BOTH, COMMISSIONER WUNDERMAN, WONDERING
9 ABOUT WHETHER TO SPECIFY CITED OUT SAVINGS AND YOU HAVE THE
10 SMALLER OPERATORS ASKING FOR RECOGNITION THAT FUNDING WOULD BE
11 NEEDED. ON THE LATTER, I THINK YOU COULD HAVE THAT BY JUST
12 ADDING AND IDENTIFY FUNDING SERVICES UNDER OBJECTIVE D.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THINK IT GOES WITHOUT SAYING, NEW
15 YOU FUNDING, IF YOU ARE CHANGING OPERATIONS. BUT I WANT TO SAY
16 THAT IN THE SMALLER OPERATORS, THERE COULD BE SAVINGS, YOU
17 DON'T NEED ADDITIONAL MONEY TO REALLY PROVIDE A BETTER
18 SERVICE. AND SO I DON'T WANT TO RESTRICT THE CONSIDERATION OF
19 SOME SMALL OPERATIONS, CONSOLIDATION. BECAUSE THERE COULD BE A
20 SAVINGS. IT WOULDN'T TAKE ADDITIONAL RESOURCES OR FUNDING. AND
21 SO I DON'T WANT TO CONSTRAIN IT BY THAT. I THINK IT'S IMPLIED
22 THAT YOU START MAKING THESE TYPES OF CHANGES, I THINK THE
23 QUESTION ANYBODY'S GOING TO ASK IS WHERE IS THE FUNDING.

24



November 16, 2020

1 **STEVE KINSEY:** OKAY. I THINK THAT WAS THE FINAL ITEM TO BE
2 CONSIDERED.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO JIM WUNDERMAN, ARE YOU OKAY
5 WITH THAT?

6

7 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** WELL, AS I SAID BEFORE, I WOULD LIKE THE WORD
8 SAVINGS TO BE INTRODUCED IF YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE THE WORD
9 INCREASED. IF YOU JUST LEAVE IT AS BUDGET IMPLICATIONS. I'M
10 NOT LOOKING AT THE LANGUAGE RIGHT NOW, BUT I'M OKAY -- IF YOU
11 HAVE THE WORD INCREASED IT IMPLIES THAT YOU'RE NOT LOOKING AT
12 SAVINGS, TO ME, AS I READ T YOU'RE ONLY LOOKING AT ONE SIDE OF
13 THE EQUATION, I THINK SAVINGS AND INCREASED BUDGET IS FINE
14 BECAUSE IT TAKES IN TOTALITY OF IT, BUT I THINK THE NOTION
15 THAT YOU CAN'T DO MORE WITH LESS CAN'T TO BETTER WITH LESS
16 BEING EXCLUDED HAS REALLY, UNFORTUNATE IF THAT'S WHAT WAS
17 THINKING OBVIOUSLY. WE'RE GOING TO ADD NEW SERVICES THERE'S
18 GOING TO BE IMPLICATIONS. THE REALITY IS WE'RE ENTER INTO A
19 STATE OF WHAT COULD BE A LONG-TERM BUDGET PARALYSIS OF
20 CIRCUMSTANCES. I RUN A TRANSIT AGENCY AT LEAST AS CHAIR AND
21 WE'RE ALL FACING THIS AND WE MAY NEED TO LOOK AT OPERATIONAL
22 IMPROVEMENTS AND CHANGES AND CONSOLIDATIONS AND NETWORK
23 CHANGES IN A WAY THAT IS REALLY FOCUSED ON HOW TO BE ABLE TO
24 MAINTAIN SERVICE FOR THE PUBLIC AND IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF
25 SERVICE TO THE PUBLIC AS MARGINAL YET YOU KNOW WITHOUT



November 16, 2020

1 IMPACTING COST THAT WOULD YOU KNOW BECAUSE WE SIMPLY DON'T
2 HAVE THE MONEY TO DO IT AND MAYBE WITH THE NEW ADMINISTRATION,
3 YOU KNOW HOPEFULLY THEY WILL PROVIDE NEW MONEY I'M ALL FOR IT,
4 BUT IN TERMS OF ANALYSIS IT MAKES SENSE THAT WE WOULD BE
5 LOOKING AT BROADLY THIS QUESTION OF WHAT THE IMPLICATIONS OR
6 COSTS ARE SO I'LL STOP THERE.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** STEVE, WHERE WOULD YOU INSERT
9 SAVINGS?

10

11 **STEVE KINSEY:** ON GOAL 3B YOU COULD HAVE INCREASED BUDGET
12 REQUIREMENTS AND SAVINGS OR YOU COULD SIMPLY NOT CHANGE THE
13 TERM -- THE REVISION THAT WAS PROPOSED OF INCREASED AND JUST
14 LEAVE IT AS IT WAS ORIGINALLY PRESENTED LAST MONTH OVERSIGHT
15 AND BUDGET REQUIREMENTS WHICH CAPTURE BOTH SIDES OF SAVINGS
16 AND INCREASED COST. NOW THE FACT THAT THE SMALLER OPERATORS
17 HAVE REALLY WANTED TO EMPHASIZE THERE ARE SENSE THAT NEW MONEY
18 WILL BE NEEDED, I THINK MAYBE THE EASIEST THING TO DO IS TO
19 INCLUDE INCREASED BUDGET REQUIREMENTS AND SAVINGS.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH THAT'S WHAT I WOULD RECOMMEND.
22 SO AND STEVE THAT'S THE LAST ISSUE?

23

24 **STEVE KINSEY:** IT IS.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, STEVE, COULD YOU QUICKLY GO
2 THROUGH THE CHANGES, GIVE A QUICK SUMMARY, THEN? WHO MADE THE
3 MOTION ORIGINAL?

4

5 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I MADE THE MOTION WITH JIM SECOND.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY SO WITH YOUR PERMISSION HAVE
8 STEVE GO THROUGH THE REVISIONS AND IF YOU'RE OKAY, IF YOU
9 COULD JUST MAKE THE MOTION REFLECT THAT IF YOU ARE COMFORTABLE
10 DOING IT.

11

12 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES I'LL WAIT FOR STEVE'S SUMMARY.

13

14 **AMY R. WORTH:** JIM?

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I DON'T SEE A HAND RAISED.

17

18 **AMY R. WORTH:** I DO. AND IT'S AMY.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

21

22 **AMY R. WORTH:** I SUPPORT THE LANGUAGE PRESENTED LET ME CLARIFY
23 THE AGENCY AROUND THE SMALL OPERATORS AND BUDGET SAVINGS. I
24 THINK WHERE WE ARE GOING TO BE HEADED AS WE SIT DOWN WITH OUR
25 TRANSIT COLLEAGUES IN OUR SMALLER COMMUNITIES AND LOOK AT THIS



November 16, 2020

1 THE GOAL IS TO CONTINUE TO PROVIDE THOSE SERVICES TO OUR
2 RESIDENTS, AND IF WE CAN DO IT IN A MORE COST EFFECTIVE WAY WE
3 WANT TO DO THAT. WHAT THE CONCERN IS, IS TAKING SMALLER
4 OPERATOR SAVINGS AND PUTTING THEM INTO A NEW INITIATIVE. AND
5 THAT'S WHERE I THINK THE POINT THAT KEEPS BEING MADE IF WE'RE
6 GOING TO DO SOMETHING LIKE INCREASED EXPRESS BUS NETWORK AND
7 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE WORKING FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE 680
8 CORRIDOR WE'RE NOT GOING TO TAKE FROM LOCAL COMMUNITY SERVICES
9 AND PUT THEM INTO A DIFFERENT THING. I THINK THAT IS ONE OF
10 THE BIGGEST ANXIETIES. SO I AM VERY COMFORTABLE WITH THE
11 LANGUAGE THAT'S IDENTIFIED, BUT WITH, AGAIN, WITH THE CLARITY
12 TO UNDERSTAND THAT THE INTENT OF LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATION,
13 LOOKING AT COST EFFECTIVE INITIATIVES, IS TO BE ABLE TO
14 CONTINUE TO PROVIDE QUALITY SERVICES TO THESE AGENCIES
15 PROVIDE. I KNOW THAT MAYBE WHAT YOU'RE ALL THINKING BUT WHY I
16 REALLY SUPPORT THE LANGUAGE, AND I THINK THE INTENT OF THE
17 CLARIFICATION FROM THE SMALLER OPERATORS.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** AMY, THE POINT YOU'RE RISING IS ONE
20 OF THE REASONS WHY WE CONTINUE TO USE MTC STAFF AND QUALIFIED
21 PROFESSIONALS, BECAUSE IT -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THROUGH MTC THAT
22 HAS THE REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE SMALLER OPERATORS --
23 [INDISCERNIBLE] I APPRECIATE YOU RAISING THAT POINT. BUT I
24 THINK THAT WILL BE ADDRESSED. I DON'T THINK ANY WORK MOVING



November 16, 2020

1 FUNDS FROM -- I THINK I MIGHT BUT I DON'T THINK ANYBODY ELSE -

2 -

3

4 **AMY R. WORTH:** I WANTED TO HAVE TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** STEVE.

7

8 **STEVE KINSEY:** WE WOULD BE ADDING THE WORDS EQUITABLE AND
9 AFFORDABLE SO IT'S EFFECTIVELY MANAGING A PUBLIC TRANSIT
10 NETWORK THAT'S EQUITABLE INCLUSIVE FREQUENT AFFORDABLE
11 ACCESSIBLE RELIABLE INTEGRATED AND CARRIES ON BELOW THAT.
12 THAT'S ONE CHANGE. THEN NUMBER THREE, WE WOULD CHANGE TO
13 QUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS AND SUPPORT NEAR-TERM CONSOLIDATIONS
14 FOCUSED IN BUT NOT LIMITED TO SMALLER TRANSIT MARKETS WITH
15 MULTIPLE TRANSIT OPERATORS PROVIDED MORE CONNECTED SERVICE TO
16 THE CUSTOMER WHERE FEASIBLE. WE WOULD, IN B, CHANGE IT TO
17 USING MTC ANALYSIS AND QUALIFIED PROFESSIONALS -- THE WORD
18 QUALIFIED CHANGED -- EVALUATE REGION-WIDE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
19 TO ADDRESS ISSUES OF LEGAL AUTHORITY, LABOR SCOPE OF DUTY'S
20 OVERSIGHT INCREASED BUDGET REQUIREMENTS AND SAVINGS AND
21 RECOMMEND NEAR-TERM ACTIONS. SO THOSE ARE THE CHANGES THAT
22 HAVE BEEN PROPOSED.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** AYE.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** SO THE ORIGINAL MAKER OF THE MOTION
4 IS OKAY WITH THAT?

5

6 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

7

8 **JIM HARTNETT:** AND THE SECOND. SECOND IS AS WELL.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO VERY GOOD. WE HAVE A --
11 GOING TO NOT ASK ANYBODY TO SHOW THEIR CARDS HERE. YOU KNOW,
12 THE GREEN, RED, OR YELLOW, BECAUSE I THINK WE HAVE A
13 CONSENSUS. IS THERE ANYBODY -- DOES ANYBODY OBJECT TO US GOING
14 TO THE VOTE? OKAY. HEARING NONE. WALLY IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
15 COMMENTS BEFORE WE GO TO THE VOTE?

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES THERE IS.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO YOU HAVE
20 WALLY?

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ONLY ONE. AMY LINHAHN. YOU MAY SPEAK.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. THAT WAS A MISTAKE. I DIDN'T MEAN TO RAISE MY
25 HAND.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WITH THAT WE HAVE NO MORE PUBLIC
3 COMMENTS.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **STEVE KINSEY:** STEVE HERE. I WANT TO THANK ALL OF THE TASK
11 FORCE MEMBERS. OBVIOUSLY THIS GIVES ME THE OPPORTUNITY TO WORK
12 WITH ALL OF YOU IN THE COMING MONTHS AHEAD AROUND A FAIRLY
13 DEFINED PROGRAM, TO GET YOU TO THE GOAL, AND A QUALITY PLAN
14 THAT YOU INTEND TO PRESENT NEXT JUNE SO THANKS AGAIN TO EACH
15 OF YOU FOR YOUR ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. I WANT TO THANK ALL OF THE
18 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, THIS IS A MILESTONE AND WE'RE GOING TO BE
19 ABLE TO FOCUS OUR EFFORTS IN THE NEXT COMING MEETINGS. AND I
20 THINK THIS IS REALLY BUILDS A STRONG CONSENSUS GOING FORWARD.
21 STEVE AND I WERE TALKING EARLIER AND THOUGHT THIS PROCESS WAS
22 GOING TO TAKE UP ALL THE TIME IN THE MEETING BUT I HAVE FAITH
23 IN THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS TO COME CONSENSUS. APPRECIATE IT.
24 WITH THAT I WANT TO MOVE ON TO THE EQUITY PRESENTATION.
25 THERESE, YOU AND STEVE ARE GOING TO BE PRESENTING THAT.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **STEVE KINSEY:** I'LL BE KICKING IT OFF THEN THERESE WILL BE
3 MAKING SUBSTANTIAL COMMENTS SHORTLY.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

6

7 **STEVE KINSEY:** BRING UP THE SLIDE PRESENTATION, PLEASE, AND
8 MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE. REALLY, THE POINT THAT WE'RE MAKING
9 HERE, THE PURPOSE OF HAVING THIS TODAY IS THAT FROM THE VERY
10 BEGINNING OF THIS TASK FORCE, MANY OF YOU HAVE SPOKEN ABOUT
11 THE IMPORTANCE OF DOING YOUR BUSINESS WITH EQUITY, ALWAYS AT
12 THE FRONT, AND THAT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT HAS HISTORICALLY
13 HAPPENED. THE DISPARITIES ARE WELL DOCUMENTED. WE'LL TALK A
14 LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT TODAY. BUT IN TERMS OF HOW THIS WORK
15 WILL INFLUENCE YOUR TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. WHAT WE WANT
16 TO DO TODAY IS BEGINNING GIVING YOU THE OPPORTUNITY THE KIND
17 OF PRINCIPLES REFLECTING THAT EQUITY IS A PART OF
18 TRANSFORMATION OF TRANSIT GOING FORWARD. WHAT ARE THE
19 CHARACTERISTICS OF IT, AND ALSO HOW DO WE ACHIEVE AND ACTIVELY
20 LISTEN TO THOSE MOST AFFECTED BY THESE DECISIONS AS A PART OF
21 THE DEVELOPMENT OF THIS ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO I
22 WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO THERESE, AND SHE WILL WALK US THROUGH
23 SEVERAL OF THE CONTEXTUAL IDEAS BEFORE WE GET INTO THE
24 SPECIFIC DISCUSSION THAT ALLOWS YOU AS TASK FORCE MEMBERS TO
25 WEIGH IN. THERESE?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU STEVE, AND AGAIN, GOOD
3 MORNING TO ALL OF YOU. AND I THINK THE DISCUSSION THAT WE JUST
4 HAD REALLY UNDERSCORES THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS DISCUSSION AND
5 DELIBERATION. YOU KNOW, EQUITY, AS WE ALL AGREED, IS CRITICAL
6 TO WHAT WE HAVE AHEAD OF US, AND REALLY NEED TO BE INTEGRATED
7 INTO ALL LINES OF BUSINESS ATTACHED TO WORK. THERE ARE MANY
8 DEFINITIONS OF EQUITY. THIS SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS FOUR EXAMPLES.
9 AND I THINK WHEN'S IMPORTANT HERE IS TO RECOGNIZE THE
10 CONTEXTUALIZATION OF EQUITY ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE TRYING TO
11 ACHIEVE SPECIFIC OUTCOMES SPECIFIC TO CHANGE BUT WITHIN A
12 PARTICULAR AGENDA. AS AN EXAMPLE, SFMTA'S COMMITMENT IS MUCH
13 MORE SPECIFIC, IDENTIFIES IMPORTANT FORUMS, SUCH AS THE BY
14 ANNUAL BUDGET ET CETERA WHEREAS THE POLICY LINK, YOU KNOW,
15 THEIR WORK IN SETTING THE STAGE FOR THE IMPACT OF HOW THEY
16 APPROACH IT, HAS A MUCH BROADER DEFINITION FOR EQUITY. AND I
17 THINK AS WE COLLECTIVELY BEGIN TO THINK ABOUT EQUITY
18 PRINCIPLES, I WOULD ENCOURAGE US TO FRAME THE PRINCIPLES AND
19 THE DEFINITION OF EQUITY, TO THE CONTEXT THAT WE ARE TRYING TO
20 ACCOMPLISH FOR THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. ALL OF US, AT SOME
21 LEVEL, ARE ENGAGED WITH EQUITY ON A BROAD SCALE, BUT FOR THE
22 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE OUR CHARGE TODAY IS TO HONE IN ON WHAT
23 THAT DEFINITION SHOULD LOOK LIKE. AS A STARTER, WE HAVE
24 CONSISTENTLY ACKNOWLEDGED THAT OUR EFFORTS MUST PROVIDE
25 TRANSIT SERVICE TO THOSE WHO MOST NEED IT. LET'S GO TO THE



November 16, 2020

1 NEXT SLIDE. YOU KNOW, I WANT TO START BY SAYING THIS IS GOT AN
2 EASY TASK. AND I THINK THE CHALLENGE OF THIS WORK REFLECTS
3 EQUITY COMPLEXITY, AND ITS IMPORT. AND IN PERHAPS ONE WAY, TO
4 GUIDE AND OPERATIONALIZE EQUITY WHERE THE TASK FORCE CAN BE
5 DRAW FROM MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM THAT WAS ADOPTED OVER A YEAR
6 AGO. WHERE WE OUTLINED FOUR PILLARS, AS A TOOL FOR WEAVING AND
7 CONTINUALLY INTEGRATING EQUITY INTO THE WORK WE DO, LISTEN AND
8 LEARN, DEFINE AND MEASURE, FOCUS AND DELIVER, AND TRAIN AND
9 GROW. AND I'LL HIT ON HOW SOME OF THESE PILLARS ARE ALREADY, I
10 THINK, SHAPING THE WORK AHEAD OF US. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT
11 SLIDE. A CRITICAL, CRITICAL PART OF WHAT WE NEED TO DO IS
12 LISTEN. FROM THE PAST MEETINGS OF THIS TASK FORCE, WE HAVE
13 CAPTURED A SET OF THOUGHTS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED BY YOU, IN
14 THE REALM OF THE EQUITY LENS THAT WE NEED TO BRING TO THE WORK
15 AHEAD OF US. THIS, AGAIN, QUICKLY, THERE, ON THE SLIDE HERE,
16 YOU KNOW, PRIORITIZING TRANSIT SERVICE FOR THOSE MOST IN NEED
17 HAS BEEN A CONTINUING THEME. DON'T FORGET PARATRANSIT AND
18 SCHOOL RELATED PUBLIC TRANSIT NEEDS. I THINK THIS REFLECTS
19 THAT EQUITY CAN AND NEEDS TO BE SHAPED BY THOSE WHO ARE
20 IMPACTED. SEEK INPUT DIRECTLY FROM RIDER SUPERVISOR THOSE --
21 RIDERS AND THOSE WHO ARE MOST RELIANT ON PUBLIC
22 TRANSPORTATION, NOT JUST FOR THOSE AT THE TABLE BUT THOSE WHO
23 ARE USING THE SERVICE AND WHO VERY OFTEN HAVE NOT BEEN AT THE
24 DECISION MAKING TABLE. EQUITY SHOULD BE WOVEN THROUGHOUT, AND
25 THE IMPORTANCE OF EQUITY METRIC, AND THAT'S A GOOD WAY TO GET



November 16, 2020

1 TO THE NEXT SLIDE. A HUGE COMPONENT OF CONTEXTUALIZING ON THE
2 DEFINITION EQUITY AND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN TERMS OF
3 PROBLEM SOLVING AND FORWARD LOOKING CHANGE IS DATA. WE NEED
4 DATA TO DEFINE AND MEASURE AS AN INTEGRAL COMPONENT OF WHAT
5 WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ON ALL
6 OF OUR WORK BUT ALSO VERY SPECIFICALLY WITH EQUITY. AND HERE
7 IS AN EXAMPLE OF HOW CURRENT AND APPLICABLE DATA IS GOING TO
8 HELP WITH OUR WORK. WHAT WE SEE ON THIS SLIDE IS A BAR CHART
9 THAT SHOWS A BREAK DOWN OF WHO WAS RIDING TRANSIT BEFORE THE
10 PANDEMIC. FROM A UCLA RIDERSHIP STUDY THAT WAS PRESENTED TO
11 THE COMMISSION IN FEBRUARY OF 2020. AND YOU CAN SEE, AT THAT
12 TIME, AGAIN, PRE PANDEMIC, THAT WE WERE ALREADY BEGINNING TO
13 SEE A SHIFT IN THE COMPOSITE OF OCCASIONAL RIDERS, TRANSIT
14 DEPENDENT RIDERS, AND CHOICE RIDERS, AND THIS WAS FROM 2009 TO
15 2017, QUITE A TEN YEAR OUTLINE, AND WHAT WE SAW WAS, YOU KNOW,
16 A SIZABLE JUMP IN CHOICE RIDERS. HOWEVER, RIGHT NOW, WE KNOW
17 THAT POST -- WELL, EXISTING, AS WELL AS POTENTIALLY POST-COVID
18 CONDITIONS ARE EXTREMELY DIFFERENT. WE NEED TO ASK THOSE
19 QUESTIONS, WHO IS RIDING TRANSIT NOW? HOW DO WE MEET THE NEEDS
20 OF CURRENT RIDERS, WHAT DATA DO WE NEED NOW AND IN THE FUTURE
21 AS WE'RE GOING FORWARD WITH THE BLUE RIBBON'S WORK. LET'S GO
22 TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO HERE IS, AGAIN, AN EXAMPLE OF, WE MIGHT
23 NOT HAVE COMPLETE DATA, BUT WE DO HAVE SOME DATA THAT'S
24 BEGINNING TO TELL US AN INTERESTING STORY. AS YOU CAN SEE,
25 WITH THESE PIE CHARTS, PRE-COVID OBSERVATIONS, WE'RE



November 16, 2020

1 COMPARING, IF WE LOOK AT THAT COMPARED TO INFORMATION WE HAVE,
2 AS OF TODAY, AND AGAIN, THINGS ARE CHANGING ALMOST DAILY, AS
3 WE WORK THROUGH THESE UNPRECEDENTED TIMES, IN COMPARING THE
4 PERCENTAGE HERE, OF TRANSIT FOR AGENCIES FROM THIS YEAR TO
5 LAST YEAR WE SEE A NOTABLE INCREASE IN THE PERCENTAGE SHARE
6 FOR AC TRANSIT AND A DECREASE FOR THE SHARE OF BART. BASED ON
7 INFORMATION COMPARED AGAINST PRE COVID, IT DOES APPEAR THERE
8 HAS BEEN A SHIFT IN THE COMPOSITE TO REFLECTING WHO MAY BE
9 RIDING TRANSIT AND ON WHAT SYSTEMS. AND THE NEXT STEP WOULD BE
10 TO DRILL DOWN AND ASK THE QUESTION, WHY? WHAT MAY BE DRIVING
11 THE SHIFT THAT WE HAVE SEEN, AND WHAT MIGHT BE FACTORED THAT
12 WOULD MOVE FORWARD TO PERHAPS EVEN DIFFERENT INFORMATION THAN
13 WHAT WE'RE SEEING TODAY. SO ALL OF THIS WOULD BE REALLY
14 IMPORTANT IN HELPING TO SHAPE OUR RECOVERY, AND HOW WE WOULD
15 IMPORTANTLY APPLY OUR TRANSIT RESOURCES. THE DATA WILL HELP US
16 EVALUATE AND PARTICULARLY FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, HOW THEY
17 MAY NEED TO RETHINK THEIR SERVICE STRUCTURES, AND THROUGHOUT
18 ALL OF THIS, AN IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION, ALWAYS, IS THAT ONE
19 SIZE DOESN'T FIT ALL, AND THE RESPONSES AND DATA MAY BE VERY
20 DIFFERENT AMONG OUR LARGE OPERATORS, VERSUS OUR SMALL
21 OPERATORS, BUT WITH EQUITY, MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE GETTING
22 THE INFORMATION AND THE FACTS ON THE GROUND THAT WILL HELP US
23 IN THIS SPACE. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO JUST LOOKING AT
24 THOSE TWO PARTICULAR PILLARS. THE LISTEN AND LEARN ELEMENT,
25 COMBINED WITH DATA THAT WE'RE STILL TRYING TO, AGGREGATE, AND



November 16, 2020

1 ANALYZE, AND USE TO HELP US MAKE OUR DECISIONS, WE -- YOU
2 KNOW, I WOULD SUGGEST, HERE, THAT WE'RE ALREADY BEING ABLE TO
3 PUT THOSE TWO THINGS TOGETHER, AND PERHAPS COME UP WITH SOME
4 OBSERVATIONS THAT MIGHT HELP IN SHAPING PRINCIPLES GOING
5 FORWARD. TWO IMPORTANT KEY POINTS. AGAIN COMBINING WHAT WE
6 HAVE HEARD ON THE GROUND WHICH, AND LET'S NOT FORGET THAT IT'S
7 A DATA POINT IN AND OF ITSELF, NUMBERS THAT WE'VE BEEN LOOKING
8 AT, IS THAT WE COMBINE TRANSIT FOR THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST AND
9 TO OUR UNDERSERVED POPULATIONS WHOSE PRESENCE HAS BEEN
10 CONSISTENT IN TERMS OF WHO CONTINUING TO RIDE THE SYSTEM
11 MOVING FORWARD. AND SECONDLY, AS WE REBUILD, WE SHOULD DO SO
12 IN A WAY THAT DOES NOT RECREATE THE DISPARITIES THAT EXISTED
13 PRIOR TO THE SYSTEM -- EXCUSE ME -- PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC AND
14 MAY STILL EXIST AS WE'RE IN THE CURRENT THROWS OF DEALING WITH
15 THE IMPACT OF THE PANDEMIC ON OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND
16 RIDERS. I WILL TURN IT BACK OVER TO STEVE KINSEY BUT PERHAPS
17 THIS WILL BEGIN TO SET A FRAMEWORK AS WE DISCUSS EQUITY
18 PRINCIPLES, AND IMPORTANTLY, THE INFORMATION AND WORK AND
19 ANALYSIS THAT NEEDS TO BE BROUGHT TO BEAR AS WE DO THAT.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE. STEVE, COMMENTS
22 BEFORE WE OPEN IT UP TO THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS?

23

24 **STEVE KINSEY:** WELL JUST, I'M GOING TO SPEAK. IF YOU WOULD GO
25 TO THE NEXT SLIDE, I WOULD SAY WE'RE GOING TO START THE



November 16, 2020

1 DISCUSSION AND I'LL TAKE YOU TO THE NEXT SLIDE AS WELL, JUST
2 TO KIND OF IDENTIFY. TODAY THERESE HAS CONTEXTLIZED THE
3 BROADER CONCERN OF EQUITY APPLICATION TO MOBILITY ISSUES THAT
4 YOU ADDRESS. WE'RE GOING TO DRAW OUT FROM YOU IN THE PUBLIC
5 IDEAS FOR PRINCIPLES WE'RE ALSO VERY INTERESTED IN YOUR
6 THOUGHTS ON HOW TO INCLUDE UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES AND WHAT
7 KIND OF OUTREACH SHOULD BE USED, REMEMBERING THAT THE
8 COMMISSION, A MONTH AGO, HAS ALREADY AUTHORIZED DOING THAT AS
9 PART OF THE SURVEY AND MESSAGING WORK THAT YOU'RE DOING. AND
10 THEN NEXT MONTH, WE'LL BRING YOU SOME PRINCIPLE IN DRAFT FORM
11 FOR YOU TO REVIEW AND COMMENT ON JUST AS YOU DID THE GOALS AND
12 OBJECTIVES AND THEN FINALLY WE'LL APPROVE THOSE PRINCIPLES IN
13 JANUARY, AND THEY'LL BE REFLECTED IN YOUR ACTION PLAN. NEXT
14 SLIDE PLEASE I THINK WE COULD JUST LEAVE THIS UP RIGHT NOW AS
15 SORT OF KIND OF THE CATEGORICAL AREAS WHERE YOU COULD BE
16 IDENTIFYING PRINCIPLES AS YOU GO. ACTUALLY, LET'S MOVE TO THE
17 NEXT ONE. EXCUSE ME. AND THIS JUST LEAVES YOU WITH SOME THINGS
18 TO THINK ABOUT, AND I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU, TO OPEN UP THE
19 CONVERSATION AMONGST THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY STEVE, HOW DO YOU SEE THIS BEING
22 AGENDAIZED AT OUR FOLLOWING MEETINGS?

23

24 **STEVE KINSEY:** WHAT I THINK OF THE FOLLOWING MEETING, IN
25 DECEMBER, WHAT WE WILL BRING YOU -- WHAT I WILL BRING YOU, IS



November 16, 2020

1 SOME DRAFT STATEMENT OF PRINCIPLES, BASED ON WHAT I HAVE HEARD
2 FROM YOU, AND YOU KNOW, IF WE USE THE FINAL SLIDE THAT THERESE
3 PRESENTED, I THINK THOSE ARE TWO BENCHMARK PRINCIPLES AS AN
4 EXAMPLE OF THE KINDS OF THINGS THAT COULD BE DISCUSSED:
5 PRIORITIZATION FOR TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND EQUITABLE REBUILDING
6 WHICH REFLECTS HISTORIC DISPARITIES BEING DISMANTLED. WHAT
7 I'LL DO IS BRING YOU SOME DRAFT PRINCIPLES AT THE NEXT
8 MEETING, YOU WILL RESPOND TO THOSE, ARE THEY SUFFICIENT, DO
9 THEY ACCURATELY CONVEY WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY, HOW
10 WILL THEY BE APPLIED, AND THEN TAKING YOUR COMMENTS INTO
11 CONSIDERATION, YOU WILL HAVE ONE FINAL OPPORTUNITY IN JANUARY
12 TO, BEFORE ADOPTING THEM.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY SO AT OUR NEXT MEETING WE'LL
15 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DRILL DOWN DEEPER ON SOME OF THESE
16 OPTIONS?

17

18 **STEVE KINSEY:** ABSOLUTELY THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR TO GET
19 FROM YOU TASK FORCE MEMBERS, WHERE DO YOU PLACE IMPORTANCE,
20 WHAT DO YOU THINK ARE WAYS THAT IT COULD BE REFLECTED IN THE
21 ACTION PLAN AND MORE IMPORTANTLY IN THE RECOVERY SERVICE AREAS
22 AND OPERATIONS.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO AHEAD AND
25 OPEN IT UP. JEFFREY TUMLIN, JEFF, BEFORE YOU GO, WALLY, IF I



November 16, 2020

1 MISS ANYBODY WITH THEIR HANDS UP LET MEAN. EVIDENTLY I'M
2 MISSING SOME. THE TWO I SEE UP NOW ARE HAYLEY AND JEFF.

3

4 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE WITH YOU, THE WORK
5 WE DO AT SFMTA, QUALITY AND ANALYTICS FOR THE GRAPHICAL
6 OUTPUTS WE'VE BEEN DEVELOPING SINCE WE HAVE DONE MORE THAN
7 ANYONE IN SHIFTING RESOURCES IN ORDER TO BEST ACCOMMODATE THE
8 ACCESS EMPLOYMENT ACCESS NEEDS FOR MOST VULNERABLE
9 POPULATIONS.

10

11 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU JEFF. THAT'S RIGHT UNDER THE CATEGORY
12 OF MEASURING THE METHODOLOGY.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** HALEY?

15

16 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** I COUPLE OF COMMENTS TO KICK OFF THE
17 CONVERSATION THIS IS OBVIOUSLY AN PART OF ENSURING WE'RE
18 MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION ONE IN TERMS OF EQUITY METRICS
19 WE CAN THINK ABOUT HOW WE NOT JUST BENEFIT DISADVANTAGED
20 COMMUNITIES BUT WE'RE OVERLY BENEFITTING DISADVANTAGED
21 COMMUNITIES HOW DO WE COMPENSATE THE FACT THAT WE HAVE BEEN
22 UNDERSERVING THESE COMMUNITIES FOR SO LOW THINKING ABOUT THAT
23 IN THE NEXT METRICS OF OVEREMPHASIZING NEED FOR THOSE
24 COMMUNITIES AND THINKING ABOUT FOR EXAMPLE, AN EQUITY METRIC,
25 YOU CAN FIGURE OUT HOW TO TURN THESE INTO PRINCIPLES, BUT IT'S



November 16, 2020

1 NOT ONLY HOW DO WE REDUCE THE COST PERSON ON LOW INCOME
2 GROUPS, HOW DO WE KNOW WHAT THE COST BURDEN FOR PARTICULAR
3 GROUPS NOW HOW DO WE REDUCE THE BURDEN AND INCREASE THE BURDEN
4 ON HIGHER INCOME GROUPS IN ORDER TO CREATE MORE EQUITY AND HOW
5 THE COST OF THE SYSTEM ARE BEING BEARD. AND EXAMPLES OF
6 DEFINITIONS ARE CALLING OUT RACIAL EQUITY, TALKING ABOUT
7 BUILDING THE SYSTEM AROUND PEOPLE WITH TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND
8 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES FOR EXAMPLE, WE KNOW DISADVANTAGED
9 COMMUNITIES USE LOCAL BUSINESS SERVICE MORE PRIORITIZING
10 FUNDING TO INVESTMENTS TO THINGS THAT LOW INCOME AND
11 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE USING MORE IN TERMS OF OUTREACH,
12 ENSURING THAT THOSE WHO ARE HELPING SUPPORT THAT OUTREACH ARE
13 BEING COMPENSATED COMPENSATING CBOS FOR ORGANIZING THE INPUT
14 OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES IS PART OF A JUST AND EQUITABLE
15 PROCESS AS WELL AS AN EQUITABLE OUTCOME.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU HALEY. ELLEN WU.

18

19 **ELLEN WU:** I JUST WANT TO SUPPORT HALEY'S COMMENTS. AND THANKS
20 FOR THERESE IN HIGHLIGHTING THE SFMTA'S EQUITY STRATEGY WHICH
21 ACTUALLY URBAN HABITAT WORKED ON WITH THEM, AND AS YOU
22 MENTIONED IN THE PRESENTATION, A PART OF THAT STRATEGY IS THAT
23 IT'S TIED TO THE TWO-YEAR BUDGET, AS JEFF MENTIONED, AND
24 THAT'S REALLY CRITICAL. AND I THINK NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE
25 PRINCIPLES THAT THE INVESTMENTS ARE TIED TO EQUITY. RIGHT? SO



November 16, 2020

1 IT'S NOT JUST A STANDALONE, AND SEPARATE PROJECTS -- OR
2 PROJECT -- IT'S INCORPORATED AND FUNDING IS ALIGNED WITH THOSE
3 EQUITY PRINCIPLES. AND THAT WE DO PARTNER WITH STAKEHOLDER AND
4 HAVE A ROBUST COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PROCESS AND COMPENSATE THE
5 COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS THAT DO STEP FORWARD TO HELP,
6 APPROPRIATELY.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. JIM HARTNETT. JIM?

9

10 **JIM HARTNETT:** YES. THANK YOU. I'M NOT SURE HOW WE FIT THIS IN
11 BUT IT JUST SEEMS WHEN WE TALK ABOUT EQUITY, WE GENERALLY
12 DON'T SEEM TO TALK ABOUT PUBLIC HEALTH AND HOW THAT FITS IN.
13 AND PUBLIC HEALTH, IT, BOTH AS IT RELATES TO MINORITY
14 COMMUNITIES AND IN GENERAL, SO I JUST THINK, SOMEHOW WE GOT TO
15 FACTOR IN PUBLIC HEALTH AS WE ADDRESS THE EQUITY ISSUE.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. GOOD SUGGESTION. ROBERT POWERS?
18 BOB?

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS:** JUST A COMMENT TO THERESE AND STEVE. AS WE'RE
21 COMING IN THE DECEMBER MEETING WITH OUR DRAFT PRINCIPLES FOR
22 EQUITY, IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE ALSO HAD SOME DRAFT
23 PERFORMANCE MEASURES OR METRICS THERE, OR EXAMPLES OF DRAFT
24 PERFORMANCE METRICS. I KNOW TUMLIN SAID THAT HE WOULD SHARE
25 SOME OF THE METRICS THAT THE TA AND THE MUNI USE, BUT IT MIGHT



November 16, 2020

1 BE NICE FOR THIS GROUP TO HAVE SOME SAMPLE OR DRAFT
2 PERFORMANCE MEASURES ASSOCIATED WITH THESE PRINCIPLES IN
3 DECEMBER. JUST A COMMENT.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I AGREE. A LOT OF US DON'T HAVE THAT
6 DETAIL. THAT'S A GOOD SUGGESTION, AND THERESE, IF WE COULD
7 FOLLOW UP ON THAT, AND STEVE?

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** DEFINITELY. AND I WOULD JUST SAY THAT ONE OF
10 THE REASONS WHY DATA IS SO IMPORTANT IN THIS, IS THAT YOU
11 CAN'T HAVE A METRICS THAT YOU CAN'T MEASURE, AND TO MEASURE
12 IT, YOU HAVE TO HAVE THE DATA. SO I THINK BRINGING THAT
13 FORWARD IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE IF WE NEED TO GET
14 DIFFERENTLY INFORMATION IN ORDER TO USE THE METRICS THAT ARE
15 MOST VALUABLE FOR THE WORK THAT'S SOMETHING TO HIGHLIGHT
16 QUICKLY.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** RANDI KINMAN.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE COMMENTS THAT COME OUT OF OUR
21 SUBCOMMITTEES, WHICH INCLUDE THE IDEA THAT WE'RE PRESUMING
22 THAT PEOPLE HAVE APPROPRIATE ACCESS TO THE EXISTING TRANSIT,
23 AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WHAT'S MEASURED IS THE ACTUAL
24 ACCESSIBILITY INCLUDING WORKING ESCALATORS, AND ELEVATORS, AND
25 ABILITY TO GET ON TO TRANSIT IN STATION WHERE IS THOSE ARE



November 16, 2020

1 BARRIERS FOR NOT JUST DISABLED BUT SENIORS AND FAMILIES WITH
2 CHILDREN, THE COMBINATION OF PUBLIC HEALTH AND ACCESS THAT
3 WE'RE ACTUALLY PROVIDING SANITATION FOR HOMELESS POPULATION
4 AND LOW INCOME POPULATIONS WHO MAY NOT BE ABLE TO CARRY
5 SANITIZER, AND PROVIDING MASKS BECAUSE I ASSUME WE'RE GOING TO
6 BE USING MASKS FOR ANOTHER YEAR, THOSE ARE SOME OF MY PRIMARY
7 CONCERNS THAT WE INCLUDE ACCESSIBILITY ALONG WITH THE OTHER
8 METRICS.

9

10 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. DARYL HALLS. DARYL.

13

14 **DARYL HALLS:** YES. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE -- THANK YOU FOR THE
15 PRESENTATIONS, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE MTC'S PROCESSES, WE JUST
16 WRAPPED UP A PROCESS FUNDED BY MTC IN VALLEJO, PIONEERED FOR
17 ALL OF THE UNITED STATES IT WAS REALLY AN INTEGRATED PROCESS
18 AND MTC RESOURCES WERE REALLY VALUABLE AND THEY HAVE BEEN
19 PARTNERING STAFF WITH US THROUGH CONSOLIDATED TRANSIT SERVICE
20 AGENCY, LOOKING AT ELDERLY ISSUES, THOSE ARE GOOD PARTNERSHIPS
21 IN SUBURBAN AREAS THAT CAN BE MODELED. THANK YOU FOR THAT.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** JOHN?

24



November 16, 2020

1 **JOHN FORD:** OUR AGENCY IS GOING THROUGH THIS AND AS MANY
2 AGENCIES ARE, ONE THING POINTED OUT TO US IS INCLUDING AN
3 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT IN THE CURRENT STATE OF AFFAIR IN HISTORIC
4 DISPARITIES THAT HAVE EXISTED IN THE STATEMENT OF DEVELOPING
5 AS LONG AS THERE IS ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THAT TODAY WOULD BE
6 IMPORTANT.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** MICHAEL HURSH.

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I WANT TO MAKE IT DOESN'T GET LOST LOOKING AT
11 EQUITY AROUND SCHOOL TRANSPORTATION, IT CAN BE FROWNED UPON IN
12 TERMS OF STA, BUT IT'S HUGE INTERNALLY WITH HOW EDUCATION IS
13 TEMPORARILY CHANGED. PLEASE DON'T LOOK PAST THAT. IN LOOKING
14 AT STUDENT TRANSPORTATION AND SAME WITH PARATRANSIT IT'S
15 CHANGED BUT WE COULDN'T LET IT SLIP BY THE WAY SIDE AS WE
16 STUDY EQUITY, EQUALITY AND ACCESS FOR ALL.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I'M GLAD YOU RAISED THAT ISSUE ON THE
19 SCHOOL. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. OKAY. STEVE?

20

21 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS TWO PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES. OKAY. HANG ON WALLY. STEVE, YOU
24 HAVE HEARD THE COMMENTS. HOW WILL THESE COMMENTS COME FORWARD
25 IN OUR NEXT MEETING?



November 16, 2020

1

STEVE KINSEY: WELL WHAT I WILL PRESENT IN THE NEXT MEETING IS
A SET OF DRAFT PRINCIPLES THAT TOUCH ON THESE POINTS THAT HAVE
BEEN MADE. I'M ALSO GOING TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF SAN FRANCISCO
SFMTA'S OFFER AND TAKE A GOOD LOOK AT THAT AND WORK WITH THE
MTC STAFF, WHO HAVE ALSO BEEN KIND OF TAKING A HARD LOOK AT
PERFORMANCE METRICS. I'LL ALSO DRAW FROM OTHER RESOURCES THAT
ARE OUT THERE, AND BE PRESENTING YOU WITH A SERIES OF DRAFT
PRINCIPLES THAT TRY AND CAPTURE THE EQUITY ISSUE AS IT RELATES
TO THE PLAN. SO YOU WILL HAVE A SPECIFIC DRAFT IN YOUR PACKET
IN ADVANCE OF THE MEETING. AND JUST AS WE DID WITH THE GOALS,
I'LL LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR OWN THOUGHTS ABOUT HOW TO REVISE
THEM OR EXPAND THEM OR DELETE THEM.

14

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: OKAY. AND ROBERT POWER'S COMMENTS
ABOUT BRINGING EXAMPLES FORWARD, YOU AND THERESE WILL DO THAT?

17

STEVE KINSEY: YES. ABSOLUTELY. THE METRICS, HE WAS INTERESTED
IN HAVING SOME SAMPLES OF THAT, SO WE WILL WORK ON GETTING
THOSE TOGETHER AS WELL.

21

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: OKAY. VERY GOOD. WALLY, LET'S GO
AHEAD AND GO TO THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

24



November 16, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** OKAY. ADINA AND THEN ROLAND. PLEASE
2 SPEAK. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES WE CAN.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** TERRIFIC. ADINA LEVIN, IN SPEAKING WITH A FRIEND
11 OF CALTRAIN, WHERE -- FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN FOCUSING ON
12 SUPPORTING THE USE OF SUSTAINABLE AND EQUITABLE TRANSPORTATION
13 ON THE PENINSULA CORRIDOR FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO SAN JOSE,
14 SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO BUILD ON
15 THAT WAS MENTIONED BY A TASK FORCE MEMBER IS LOOKING AT
16 HISTORICAL DISPARITIES AND IN PARTICULAR LOOKING AT
17 OPPORTUNITIES TO OVERCOME HISTORICAL DISPARITIES AS PART OF
18 OUR RESPONSE TO THIS PANDEMIC. A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES IS
19 CALTRAIN JUST APPROVED AN EQUITY STRATEGY THAT IN ORDER TO
20 OVERCOME THINGS THAT ITS OWN RESEARCH SHOWED RESULTED IN A
21 RIDERSHIP BEING WEALTHIER IN THE SURROUNDING COMMUNITIES WITH
22 EXAMPLES TO REPAIR THAT. TO DO THAT, I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD
23 ONLY LOOK AT WHAT IS HISTORICAL DRIVEN BY PREVIOUS POLICIES,
24 BUT LOOK FORWARD, AND SIMILAR DATA HAS COME UP RECENTLY IN
25 SAMTRANS'S RIDER RESEARCH, REIMAGINE SAMTRANS WHERE THEY FOUND



November 16, 2020

1 A TOP PRIORITY OF SAMTRANS RIDERS WERE PREDOMINANTLY LOW
2 INCOME HAS BETTER ACCESS TO RAIL THAN CALTRAIN WHICH IS ACCESS
3 THEY DIDN'T HAVE BUT WANTED. SO WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT EQUITY
4 NOT ONLY AT WHAT PEOPLE HAVE BEEN DOING IN THE PAST BUT
5 LOOKING AT OPPORTUNITIES THAT LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND
6 PEOPLE OF COLOR IN COMMUNITIES, TO LOOK AT THE CRISIS AND
7 OPPORTUNITIES BEYOND.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ROLAND.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS GREAT. YOU HAVE A NEW SYSTEM. I AM SUPPOSED
12 TO CLICK -- EVEN THOUGH I AM ON MY PHONE. I DIDN'T HAVE ANY
13 COMMENT ABOUT THIS PRESENTATION OTHER THAN AIMING TO THERESE'S
14 PRESENTATION, UNTIL ADINA SPOKE. AND I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT
15 TO YOU IF YOU WANT TO LOOK AT EQUITY CALTRAIN DOESN'T GO
16 BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO IT GOES TO GILROY. THAT
17 WOULD BE A GOOD PLACE TO START EQUITY. I HAVE A COMMENT ON THE
18 PREVIOUS ITEM BECAUSE I COULDN'T GET N YOU WERE VOTING BY THE
19 TIME I FIGURED IT OUT. FIRST OF ALL IN TERMS OF AFFORDABLE, I
20 THOUGHT THERE WAS NO NEED TO REINTRODUCE THE TERM BECAUSE WE
21 HAVE ALREADY INVESTED AFFORDABILITY INTO MEANS-BASED FARES.
22 THE ONLY OTHER COMMENT I HAVE HAD -- THERE IS NO NEED TO
23 REWORD THREE C IF YOU REMOVE EVERYTHING STARTING WITH FOCUS
24 ALL THE WAY UP TO THE WORD, TO AT THAT POINT IN TIME, THE



November 16, 2020

1 FEASIBLE THAT THERESE ADDED AT THE END TAKES CARE OF ANYTHING
2 YOU MIGHT WANT TO TAKE CARE OF IN C3. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE IS NO OTHER PUBLIC
5 COMMENT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WE HAVE EVERYONE'S INPUT. EVERYONE IS
8 IN AGREEMENT. I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM SO WE
9 DON'T RUN OUT OF TIME AND SO WE CAN HEAR THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
10 TRANSPORTATION. IS THERE ANYTHING ANYONE WANTED TO ADD FOR
11 THERESE OR STEVE FOR ADDITIONAL INSTRUCTIONS? STEVE?

12

13 **STEVE KINSEY:** I AM LOADED UP AND READY TO GO. I LOOK FORWARD
14 TO GET BEING BACK WITH YOU SOMETHING MORE CONCRETE NEXT TIME
15 BUT THIS IS EXACTLY WHAT I HOPED TO GET OUT OF TODAY. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THIS NEXT ITEM IS VOICES FOR PUBLIC
19 TRANSPORTATION. I HAVE ASKED ELLEN WU, AND HAYLEY CURRIER, AND
20 IAN GRIFFITHS TO BRING FORWARD THIS PRESENTATION. AS YOU WILL
21 REMEMBERED IN OUR FIRST MEETING, WE WANT ORGANIZATIONS AND
22 GROUPS TO BRING FORWARD, WE WANT TO AFFORD THE OPPORTUNITY,
23 WITH THAT ELLEN OR HALEY, WHO IS KICKING THIS OFF?

24

25 **ELLEN WU:** I AM.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. ELLEN IT'S YOU. GOOD
3 INFORMATION THAT YOU WERE ABLE TO DISTRIBUTE TO US. REALLY
4 APPRECIATE THE FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES IS A REALLY GOOD PAPER.

5

6 **ELLEN WU:** GREAT. THANKS. I'M GOING TO START. AND IT'S
7 ACTUALLY, THE PRESENTATION WILL BE BY HALEY WITH TRANSFORM AND
8 MYSELF, BECAUSE IT WAS SUCH A SHORT TIME I IAN GRACIOUSLY SAID
9 THE TWO OF US COULD GO AHEAD AND DO THE PRESENTATION. OH, AND
10 THERE ARE SLIDES TO BRING UP. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE SO WE'RE HERE
11 REPRESENTING THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION
12 FOUR REPRESENTATIVES MYSELF, HALEY, IAN, AND JAMES WITH ATU.
13 WE WANTED TO INTRODUCE THE COALITION TO THE TASK FORCE AND
14 SHARE OUR WORK WITH YOU BECAUSE IT INTERSECTS WITH THE WORK OF
15 THE TASK FORCE IS DOING AROUND RECOVERY LONG-TERM
16 TRANSFORMATION. AND ALSO, WE HOPE TO BE IMPORTANT PARTNERS. I
17 THINK WE COULD BE IMPORTANT PARTNERS AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN
18 TALKING ABOUT FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. THE VOICES FOR
19 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WAS CREATED TO ADVOCATE FOR EQUITY
20 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT WILL FUND A
21 TRANSFORMATIONAL SYSTEM THAT THE BAY AREA NEEDS WHILE CREATING
22 GOOD PAYING GREEN JOBS AND REDUCING CAR TRIPS AND CARBON
23 EMISSIONS. HOWEVER, LIKE EVERYONE, WE HAVE PIVOTED SINCE THE
24 PANDEMIC AND ARE ALSO WORKING ON JUST RECOVERY OF OUR TRANSIT
25 SYSTEM. FOR US A JUST RECOVERY REQUIRES FUNDING NEEDED TO



November 16, 2020

1 PREVENT MAJOR SERVICE CUTS AND LAYOFFS. WE'RE TALKING TO YOU
2 HERE TODAY BECAUSE THERE IS ALIGNMENT WITH THE RECOVERY
3 PROCESS TRANSFORMATION AND A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE. WE
4 HOPE, AS WE ALL DO, THAT A REGIONAL MEASURE SHOULD BE ABOUT
5 CREATING A TRANSIT SYSTEM WE WANT AND NOT MERELY ABOUT
6 RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS IS A LITTLE HISTORY ABOUT THE
7 CAMPAIGN, OUR TIMELINE. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TOGETHER SINCE
8 JANUARY 2018 BECAUSE WE SAW THE NEED FOR TRANSFORMATIONAL
9 INVESTMENT INTO OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. WE HAVE
10 CONTINUED TO ORGANIZE AROUND OUR VISION AND PRINCIPLES WHICH
11 YOU CAN LOOK AT BY GOING TO MOBILIZE THE BAY, THE WEB SITE. WE
12 HAVE WORKED HARD TO SHAPE THE PLATFORM AROUND DISADVANTAGED
13 COMMUNITIES AND HAVE CONDUCTED RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS TO
14 SUPPORT THESE PRIORITIES WE HAVE CREATED INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK
15 AND WORKED WITH LEGISLATURE TO SHAPE STATE ENABLING
16 LEGISLATURE PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE AS SOON
17 AS COVID HIT WE HEARD THAT COMMUNITIES SAFETY FOR FRONTLINE
18 WORKER WAS A MOST PRESSING NEED. AND WE BEGAN ADVOCATING FOR
19 SAFETY OF FRONTLINE WORKERS AND WORKING FOR THE PHYSICAL
20 RECOVERY OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE SHOWS THE
21 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE INVOLVED IN THE COALITION. WE HAVE
22 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS, LABOR, ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS,
23 AND EQUITY ADVOCATES. THE COALITION CONTINUES TO GROW AND
24 MEETS MONTHLY WITH A STEERING COMMITTEE THAT MEETS WEEKLY. AND
25 AGAIN, WE HOPE TO BE GOOD PARTNERS, AND A RESOURCE FOR THE



November 16, 2020

1 TASK FORCE, AND PARTICULARLY IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF EQUITY
2 PRINCIPLES. AND I'M HANDING IT OVER TO HALEY.

3

4 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** THANKS ELLEN. NEXT SLIDE. AND THE NEXT SLIDE
5 AFTER THAT. SO NOW THAT ELLEN HAS TALKED US THROUGH THE VOICES
6 FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS -- AND IF YOU COULD GO TO THE
7 NEXT SLIDE -- WE HAVE BEEN WORKING -- WHAT WE HAVE BEEN
8 WORKING ON FOR THE PAST THREE YEARS. I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT
9 PRIORITIES IN ADDRESSING THE CURRENT TRANSIT CRISIS AND LONG-
10 TERM NEEDS OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. IN ORDER TO PLAN FOR THE
11 RECOVERY WE KNOW WE MUST RESPOND TO THE CURRENT CRISIS WITH
12 THE URGENCY IT DESERVES WHICH MEANS TAKING UNPRECEDENTED
13 ACTION TO KEEP TRANSIT GOING AND PROTECT SERVICE FOR THOSE WHO
14 NEED IT THE MOST. WE BELIEVE THIS MUST HAPPEN AT THE REGIONAL
15 LEVEL AS WELL AS THE FEDERAL AND STATE LEVEL. DIRECTOR
16 MCMILLAN SHOWED AT LAST BLUE RIBBON MEETING WHAT FUNDS COULD
17 BE MADE AVAILABLE FOR OPERATIONS AND ADDRESSING RESOURCES
18 OPERATION FUNDING SHORTFALLS. MTC CAN'T ADDRESS THE PROBLEM
19 ALONE AND SHOULD ADDRESS AN AGGRESSIVE CAMPAIGN AT THE STATE
20 LEVEL FOR MORE FUNDING TO PREVENT FURTHER SERVICE CUTS AND
21 WORKER LAYOFFS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE IN THE NEAR-TERM WE MUST
22 RETURN SERVICE TO PRE COVID LEVELS AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. THE
23 PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT INDICATES WE WILL RETURN TO SERVICE
24 LEVELS BY 2035 OUR COMMUNITIES CANNOT WAIT THAT LONG. PRE
25 COVID LEVELS WERE ALREADY INSIGNIFICANT TO MEET THE REGION'S



November 16, 2020

1 NEEDS WE KNOW CUTS FROM THE 2008 FINANCIAL CRISIS HAVE NOT
2 BEEN RESTORED SO WE HAVE TO LEARN FROM THAT AND ACT
3 ACCORDINGLY. RETURN TO PRE COVID SERVICE LEVELS IS REQUIRED
4 BUT NOT ACTUALLY SUFFICIENT. WHICH IS WHY WE NEED A
5 TRANSFORMATIVE INVESTMENT IF OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
6 SOMETHING WE KNEW BEFORE COVID AND WHICH IS MORE GLARING NOW.
7 TO BUILD THE JUST FUTURE WE ALL WANT TO SEE WE NEED DEDICATED
8 AND ROBUST FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS FOR BOTH LOCAL AND REGIONAL
9 SERVICE. WE NEED SUFFICIENT STATE OF GOOD REPAIR FUNDING TO
10 MAINTAIN THE SYSTEM WE HAVE. WE NEED FUNDS FOR INTEGRATED
11 AFFORDABLE FARES THAT INCREASE THE ACCESSIBILITY AND USABILITY
12 OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WE NEED AN INVESTMENT STRATEGY BUILT
13 AROUND EQUITABLE OUTCOMES THAT CENTERS THE NEEDS AND
14 PRIORITIES OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. AND OF COURSE ALL
15 OF THIS MUST BE FUNDED PROGRESSIVELY TO ENSURE THAT ALL
16 STAKEHOLDERS PAY THEIR FAIR SHARE AND THAT THOSE ALREADY
17 LIVING ON THE MARGINS ARE NOT OVERLY BURDENED. BUT A JUST AND
18 INCLUSIVE PROCESS IS ALSO NECESSARY. A SUCCESSFUL REGIONAL
19 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE WILL BE CREATED BY A MULTI-
20 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS LED BY A PUBLIC CONVENER. WHEN WE LOOK
21 AROUND THE COUNTRY, THIS IS WHAT HAS LED TO SUCCESS FOR
22 SIMILAR MEASURES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE AND ONE MORE SLIDE. SO,
23 ROBUST FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS IS OF COURSE ESSENTIAL FOR
24 BUILDING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WE WANT. BUT WHAT DOES ROBUST
25 ACTUALLY MEAN? SO VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND



November 16, 2020

1 SEAMLESS BAY AREA RELEASED A REPORT IN SEPTEMBER OUTLINING
2 WHAT COULD THIS MEAN. WHAT WE KNOW IS THE SINGLE GREATEST
3 DETERMINATE OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS SERVICE HOURS AND THE BAY
4 AREA DOES NOT STACK UP IN THAT DEPARTMENT. WE PROVIDE BASED ON
5 RESOURCES WE HAVE NOT BASED ON DEMAND. WHAT OF THE CITIES
6 SITED IN THIS REPORT GREATER TORONTO AREA COMPARATIVE TO
7 POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA DELIVERS 55 PERCENT MORE SERVICE
8 HOURS PER CAPITA THAN THE BAY AREA DOES AND THAT SERVICE
9 ATTRACTS 163 PERCENT MORE RIDERS PER CAPITA SO THE SERVICE
10 HOURS ARE GIVEN GREATER BUMP IN ACTUAL RIDERSHIP. ROBUST
11 OPERATING FUNDS WOULD INCREASE SERVICE LEVELS WHICH WOULD
12 INCREASE RIDERSHIP WE SHOULD PURSUE RESOURCES TO PERFORM
13 SERVICE WE NEED NOT JUST ACCEPT SERVICE LEVELS WE HAVE. THIS
14 NEEDS TO BE A PRIMARY FOCUS OF ANY MAJOR TRANSPORTATION
15 INVESTMENT. NEXT SLIDE. THE MEMBERS OF OUR COALITION THAT LONG
16 PUSHED FOR PROGRESSIVE TAXATION. PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES
17 ARE MORE EQUITABLE AND ALSO MORE LIKELY TO WIN AT THE BALLOT
18 WHICH I'LL GET TO IN A SECOND. WE WORKED WITH, AS YOU SAW IN
19 YOUR PACKET WE WORKED WITH THE SILICON VALLEY COMMUNITY
20 FOUNDATION TO PRODUCE A REPORT ANALYZING DIFFERENT REVENUE
21 SOURCES THAT COULD BE USED FOR TRANSPORTATION AND FOUND FOUR
22 PROMISING OPTIONS PERSONAL INCOME TAX HEAD CHARGE PARSER TELL
23 HEAD TAX AND BUSINESS PARKING LEVY PROPERTY TAX SPECIFIC FOR
24 PARKING LOTS WHICH HAS A NICE CLIMATE NEXUS. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT
25 WE LEARNED FROM THIS RESEARCH IS THAT IT IS POSSIBLE TO FUND A



November 16, 2020

1 ROBUST PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM WHILE ENSURING THAT THOSE WITH
2 THE LEAST ABILITY TO PAY ARE NOT OVERBURDENED. NEXT SLIDE
3 PLEASE IN ADDITION WE ATTAINED RESEARCH TO CONDUCT POLLING ON
4 THE VIABILITY OF DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES AND WE FOUND BOTH
5 THAT FUNDING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION POLLS VERY WELL WHICH
6 SHOULD BE ENCOURAGING TO ALL OF US AND THAT AN INCOME TAX
7 SURCHARGE ON HIGH TECH POLLED HIGHEST AND WAS LEAST IMPACTED
8 BY NEGATIVE MESSAGING. MANY OF THE PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES
9 THAT WE TESTED IN THE POLL DID WELL AND IN FACT DID BETTER THE
10 SALES TAX AND I'LL NOTE YOU CAN FIND ALL THESE REPORT IN THE
11 AGENDA PACKET IF YOU WANT TO DIVE INTO THE DETAILS. NEXT
12 SLIDE. SO IN SUMMARY, IN CONCLUSION, OUR TOP PRIORITY IS
13 ENSURING ADEQUATE OPERATING FUNDING TO GET US THROUGH THE
14 PRESENT CRISIS, TO ALLOW FOR A JUST RECOVERY, AND TO MAINTAIN
15 THE SYSTEM UNTIL WE PASS A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE, AND HAVE
16 A LARGE INFUSION OF NEW INVESTMENTS. WE NEED TO WORK TOGETHER
17 TO ENSURE OUR PARTNERS AT THE STATE ARE TAKING EVERY ACTION
18 POSSIBLE TO FILL THE IMMEDIATE FUNDING GAP EVEN AS MTC DOES
19 WHAT IT CAN TO ADDRESS THE CRISIS AND AS WE MOVE FORWARD
20 TOGETHER TOWARD THE TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING
21 MEASURE WE KNOW WE NEED, A MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PROCESS LED BY A
22 PUBLIC ENTITY WILL RESULT IN A JUST AND SUCCESSFUL OUTCOME.
23 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I THINK WE HAVE SOME TIME FOR
24 QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION.

25



November 16, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** JIM? JIM, YOU'RE ON MUTE.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SCOTT. IAN, DID YOU WANT TO
4 COMMENT REAL QUICK? YOU KNOW, WE GOT A COUPLE OF MINUTES HERE.

5

6 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** WELL, I'LL JUST REITERATE THAT I THINK THE KEY
7 REASON WHY THIS IS AN IMPORTANT, TODAY, TO DISCUSS, EVEN
8 THOUGH WE MAY BE YEARS AWAY FROM A POTENTIAL REGIONAL FUNDING
9 MEASURE THAT COULD UNLOCK THE AMOUNT OF REVENUE THAT WE NEED
10 FOR THAT LONG-TERM TRANSFORMATION, IS THAT EVEN IN THAT 2 TO 4
11 YEAR TIME FRAME THESE OTHER REGIONS THAT HAVE SUCCEEDED SUCH
12 AS SEATTLE AND LA, HAVE HAD A ROBUST MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PROCESS
13 CONVENED BY A PUBLIC ENTITY AND IN THIS PROCESS THAT MEANS
14 MTC, AND I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE IMMEDIATE STEPS TO PUT
15 TOGETHER A PROCESS BY WHICH OVER THE COMING YEAR OR NUMBER OF
16 YEARS WE DEVELOP A VISION WE CAN ALL BUY INTO REGARDING A
17 REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE THAT PROVIDES POSITIONS FOR US IN THE
18 FUTURE YEARS. I THINK IF THIS TASK FORCE COULD MAKE A CLEAR
19 STATEMENT OF THE VALUE OF THAT FOR LONG-TERM RECOVERY, THAT
20 COULD POSITION US FOR SUCCESS IN A NUMBER OF YEARS. SO WE
21 WOULD LIKE TO SEE MTC TAKE SOME ADDITIONAL STEPS FOLLOWING
22 THIS MEETING WHERE PERHAPS TO DISCUSS MTC FUTURE COMMISSION
23 MEETINGS REGARDING HOW WE'RE GOING TO SETUP THE MULTI-
24 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS WHERE ALL OF THE DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS
25 CAN HAVE THEIR VOICE HEARD MOVING FORWARD.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. BECAUSE
3 I'M HOPING THOSE ARE THE TYPES OF RECOMMENDATIONS THIS
4 COMMITTEE WILL BE MAKING. AND I AGREE. AND I HOPE IT'S SOONER
5 THAN LATER AS YOU EXPRESSED. I THINK THE URGENCY OF THIS
6 FUNDING, AFTER THIS PANDEMIC, IF, YOU KNOW, THIS RECOVERY IS
7 GOING TO BE SLOW AND THE NEEDS FOR THESE RESOURCES ARE GOING
8 TO BE EXTREMELY DEMANDING ON US. SO I THINK WE NEED TO SOONER
9 RATHER THAN LATER. JASON DID YOU WANT TO COMMENT?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THE LEADERSHIP GROUP, WE HAVE LEAD TRANSIT MEASURES
12 OVER THE LAST DECADES WE SPOKE ON MEASURE RR FOR EXPANDING
13 CALTRAIN. I COCHAIRLED MAMEASURE ALONG MATT FROM MY TEAM, WE
14 RAISED \$2.7 MILLION FOR A LOT OF FOLKS NOT JUST LEADERSHIP
15 GROUP WE MAKE THAT HAPPEN BUT WE ALSO SPOKE OUT FOR PUBLIC
16 TRANSIT IN TERMS OF MAKING THOUSANDS OF CALLS MY TEAM MADE
17 OVER 5,000 CALLS SENT OVER 70,000 TEXT MESSAGE IN SUPPORT OF
18 MEASURE RR AND WE'RE HAPPY TO WORK IN FAVOR OF WHAT'S NEXT. I
19 WANT TO MAKE CLEAR THE PRESENT PRESENTED TODAY TWO THIRDS VOTE
20 IS A TALL BARRIER I CAN TELL YOU THAT FROM SUSPICIOUS MEASURE
21 RR HAD OPPOSITION GROUPS OF LABOR, EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTALLY
22 ON BUSINESSES BEHIND IT AND IT WAS STILL HARD TO PASS THAT
23 MEASURE IT'S IMPORTANT TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE FACT THAT TWO
24 THIRDS BARRIER IS DIFFICULT TO ACHIEVE AND WE SAW SAY PAYROLL
25 TAX FAIL IN PORTLAND BECAUSE IT HAD ORGANIZED OPPOSITION



November 16, 2020

1 FUNDING WITH LEADERSHIP. WE'RE COMMITTED TO WORKING FOR
2 EQUITABLE WAYS TO FUND PUBLIC TRANSIT. I PERSONALLY DON'T WANT
3 THINK THE NEXT LARGE REGIONAL MEASURE SHOULD BE A SALES TAX I
4 THINK WE SHOULD DO SOMETHING MORE EQUITABLE THAN THAT, AND I
5 AM LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING ON A MEASURE THAT FIND FUNDING
6 THAT BRINGS TOGETHER A BROAD COALITION LIKE THE ONE THAT STOOD
7 BEHIND RR THAT INCLUDES LABOR AND BUSINESS AND EQUITY GROUPS I
8 THINK THAT'S THE ONLY WAY WE ARE GOING TO HAVE SUCCESS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. JIM WUNDERMAN.

11

12 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK ALL OF US
13 STAND FOR HAVING EQUITY BE AT THE FRONT AND CENTER OF OUR
14 REGIONS TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, AND YOU KNOW, LIKE SBLG THE
15 COUNTY HAS BEEN AT THE FRONT OF THESE MEASURES FOR A LONG TIME
16 AS JASON SAID THEY'RE NOT EASY BUT THEY'RE REALLY IMPORTANT.
17 YOU KNOW, AT THIS POINT IN TIME, THE CONCERN I HAVE, A PRETTY
18 SERIOUS CONCERN ABOUT THE PROPOSED MECHANISMS FOR RAISING THE
19 MONEY THAT WERE PUT FORWARD. WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN THE BAY AREA
20 IS AN UNPRECEDENTED INTEREST ON THE PART OF BUSINESS, TAX
21 PAYING BUSINESS TO EXIT THE REGION ON THE BASIS THAT THE
22 BURDEN OF TAXATION ON BUSINESSES UNEQUITABLE COMPARED TO OTHER
23 STATES, AT A TIME WHEN THERE IS TREMENDOUS PRESSURE ON THE
24 BOTTOM LINE OF COMPANIES TO STAY AFLOAT. OUR GROUP HAS BEEN
25 CRITICIZED AT TIMES FOR BEING A PROTAX GROUP. I THINK IT'S A



November 16, 2020

1 FAIR CRITICISM AND WE HAVE SUPPORTED THE PERSONAL INCOME TAX
2 INCREASE BACK WHEN JERRY BROWN WAS FIRST GOVERNOR AND THE
3 STATE WAS IN A BIG HOLE AND SO FORTH. BUT YOU KNOW, TODAY, I
4 WOULD SAY, WE WOULDN'T BE, PROBABLY INVOLVED IN AN EFFORT THAT
5 WAS AS DESCRIBED. ALTHOUGH I DO THINK THAT BUSINESS CAN AND
6 SHOULD PLAY A ROLE. WE NEED TO WORK OUT WHAT THE RIGHT BALANCE
7 OF THIS IS, I THINK BUSINESS HAS TO BE A PART OF IT, AND I
8 WOULD CERTAINLY ENCOURAGE OUR MEMBERS AND THE GREATER BUSINESS
9 COMMUNITY TO PARTICIPATE IN IT. BUT IT'S A -- YOU KNOW, I JUST
10 WANT TO -- YOU KNOW I WANT YOU ALL TO UNDERSTAND AT THIS POINT
11 IN TIME WHAT WE'RE KIND OF HEARING AND FACING, WHICH IS,
12 AGAIN, REALLY UNPRECEDENTED AND VERY, VERY DIFFICULT, AND IF
13 YOU TAKE A LOOK AT TODAY'S WALL STREET JOURNAL THERE IS AN
14 OPED PIECE OF A GUY WHO RUNS A VENTURE CAPITAL FIRM WHO TALKS
15 ABOUT WHY WE MOVED HIS COMPANY TO TEXAS AND WE'RE HEARING MORE
16 AND MORE ABOUT THIS AND I DON'T HAVE TOO MANY MEMBERS THAT I'M
17 AWARE OF THAT DON'T PLAN TO LEAVE THE BAY AREA OR TO NOT TO
18 GROW IN THE BAY AREA TO SOME DEGREE AND I DON'T UNDERSTAND THE
19 FULL IMPLICATIONS OF THIS BECAUSE OUR AREA IS INCREDIBLY
20 ATTRACTIVE FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS THAT, YOU KNOW, WHERE WE --
21 WHERE OTHER REGIONS DON'T COMPARE TO OURS, BUT THE REALITY IS,
22 WHAT I THINK WE'RE FACING, AND YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT SEEING TOO
23 MANY ARTICLES RUN IN NATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS OR EVEN IN THE BAY
24 AREA TO SPEAK TO PEOPLE WANTING TO COME HERE. PEOPLE ARE
25 TALKING ABOUT WANTING TO LEAVE. AND IT'S VERY DISCOURAGING AND



November 16, 2020

1 CHALLENGING. SO, YOU KNOW, PLEASE UNDERSTAND, AS WE GO
2 FORWARD, IF THAT BECOMES KIND OF THE WAR CRY THAT YOU KNOW
3 WHAT WE GOT TO DO IS WE GOT TO INCREASE, YOU KNOW, WE GOT TO -
4 - SURCHARGE THE INCOME TAX AND WE HAVE GOT TO CREATE A NEW TAX
5 ON JOBS AND THOSE KINDS EVER THINGS, I DON'T THINK IT'S VERY
6 LIKELY YOU WILL SEE SUPPORT FROM THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND THE
7 FUND-RAISING OR ANY ASPECT OF, THIS AND WE COULD EVEN BE
8 OPPOSITIONAL. I DON'T KNOW. I HAVEN'T HAD THAT DISCUSSION WITH
9 THE MEMBERS. CONVERSELY, IF IT'S A PROCESS AS IAN DESCRIBED
10 OVER TIME WHERE WE ALL KIND OF WORK TOGETHER AND SIT DOWN AND
11 FIGURE OUT WHAT IS FAIR, WHAT CAN WORK, KIND OF REALLY GET
12 EXCITED ABOUT IT, I THINK BUSINESS LEADERS ARE EXCITED AS
13 ANYBODY ELSE BECAUSE THE STAKEHOLDERS ADDRESS THIS ISSUES. I
14 WANT TO BE HONEST ABOUT HOW WE'RE SEEING THINGS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THAT'S A GOOD COMMENT. AND I THINK
17 IAN WAS IMPLYING THAT MTC BUSINESS TRANSPORTATION LEADERS, THE
18 PUBLIC, AND THE ADVOCACY GROUPS, WE'RE GOING HAVE TO BRING
19 EVERYBODY TOGETHER BECAUSE JIM YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT, THE
20 ECONOMIC HEALTH OF THE REGION REALLY WILL DETERMINE THAT LEVEL
21 OF TRANSIT SERVICE THAT WE PROVIDE AND SO WE HAVE TO BE
22 SENSITIVE TO THAT. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. ELLEN AND
23 THEN -- ELLEN, DO YOU NEED TO COMMENT? OR CAN I GO TO OTHER
24 COMMITTEE MEMBERS FIRST AND COME BACK TO YOU?

25



November 16, 2020

1 **ELLEN WU:** YOU CAN COME BACK ALTHOUGH IT WAS DIRECTLY RELATED
2 TO --

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD THEN.

5

6 **ELLEN WU:** THIS IS WHY WE NEED A BROADER TABLE MULTI-
7 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS WITH A PUBLIC AGENCY MAYBE HEADING IT TO
8 HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS. BUT JUST DEFINITELY APPRECIATE THE
9 HARDSHIP ON BUSINESSES RIGHT NOW IN THIS MOMENT, BUT ALSO WANT
10 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT CALIFORNIA ACTUALLY RANKS IN THE BOTTOM
11 THIRD OF STATES WITH BUSINESSES -- BUSINESS TAXES OF THE SHARE
12 OF THE ECONOMY BECAUSE OF THE TAX BREAKS THAT THEY GET
13 THROUGHOUT THE STATE. SO I WANTED TO ADD THAT CONTEXT ALSO.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. I GUESS YOU HAD TO THROW THAT
16 ONE OUT. NICK JOSEFOWITZ.

17

18 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I ALSO WANT TO LIFT UP THE PART OF THE
19 PRESENTATION WHICH TALKS ABOUT GOING TO THE STATE TO TRY AND
20 FIND -- TO -- IN THE IMMEDIATE TERM, TO FIND MORE REVENUES FOR
21 TRANSIT. AND I HOPE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN BE REALLY
22 SUPPORTIVE OF EITHER FROM A TASK FORCE OR COMMISSION LEVEL.
23 AND I KNOW WE ARE OBVIOUSLY DOING A LOT OF ADVOCACY AT THE
24 FEDERAL LEVEL WHERE THE BIGGEST OPPORTUNITIES ARE. BUT I HOPE
25 THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN DO, WE CAN BE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF, AND



November 16, 2020

1 I THINK GOING FORWARD ON A LARGER MEASURE LOCALLY I THINK
2 THAT'S SOMETHING WE SHOULD BE CONSTANTLY AT THE FOREFRONT OF
3 OUR MIND AS SORT OF ABOUT HOW WE CAN FACILITATE THAT PROCESS
4 THAT ALIGNS SUCCESSFULLY IN TIME FAIR MAJOR ELECTION,
5 SOMETHING LIKE 2024 BECAUSE IT CAN'T BE DONE OVERNIGHT AND I
6 THINK HAVING A ROBUST STAKEHOLDER PROCESS LED BY A PUBLIC
7 AGENCY WOULD BE INCREDIBLY BENEFICIAL.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THINK LEGISLATORS AND FEDERAL
10 UNDERSTAND THAT SERVICE CUTS AND WORK LAYOFFS IMPACT OUR
11 ECONOMY AND REALLY NOT GOOD. THAT'S THE MESSAGE AND WE NEED TO
12 GET SOME RELIEF THERE. ALFREDO?

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU JIM. I WANT TO CONCUR WITH MEMBER
15 WUNDERMAN AND HIS COMMENTS. I THINK THEY'RE APPROPRIATE AT
16 THIS POINT IN TIME. AND JIM TO YOUR POINT HOW WE DO THIS IS
17 CRITICAL I ENVISION A SCENARIO WHERE WE BRING STAKEHOLDERS
18 TOGETHER TO HAVE CONVERSATION BUT WE NEED TO DO THIS WITH OUR
19 BUSINESS PARTNERS THAT IS WHAT HAS MADE OTHER MEASURES
20 SUCCESSFUL AND I THINK THIS IS A TIME WHEN BUSINESSES ARE
21 CIRCLING QUITE A BIT. JIM IS RIGHT WE OFTEN HEAR OF BUSINESSES
22 LEAVING CALIFORNIA AND WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A THRIVING
23 BAY AREA.

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU. DAVID.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **DAVID CHIU:** FIRST IS I WISH JIM BEALL WAS ON THIS CALL HE AND
3 I HAD THIS GRAND 2020 PLAN FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT HE WAS GOING
4 TO OFFER FASTER AND I WAS LOOKING FORWARD TO BEING HIS LEAD
5 ASSEMBLY ON IT I WAS GOING TO DO SEEMLESS AND WE WERE GOING TO
6 GET REVENUES AND PANDEMIC STRUCK. I THINK THIS IS CRITICAL IF
7 WE CAN FIGURE OUT REFORM AND REGIONAL GOVERNANCE THAT WILL
8 BODY THE PUBLIC CONFIDENCE FOR FUTURE SUPPORT ON THE MEASURE.
9 I WANT TO ECHO WHAT IAN GRIFFITHS SAID ABOUT SETTING THE TABLE
10 FOR THIS. I WOULD SUPPORT REVENUE ALL IDEAS I HAVE HEARD I
11 WOULD SUPPORT IF WE CAN GET THERE. BUT I ALSO WILL SAY AND WE
12 KNOW THIS I HAVE HEARD A LOT FROM BOTH SIDES OF THIS
13 DISCUSSION FROM THE FASTER COALITION FROM THE FOLKS THAT
14 PRESENTED TODAY WE ARE REALLY NOT ON THE SAME PAGE AS A REGION
15 TO BE SUCCESSFUL POLITICALLY. SO THE EXTENT TO WHICH WE CAN
16 ALL WORK AT IT DURING THIS TIME PERIOD I PERSONALLY SEE MIDWAY
17 POSITIONS BETWEEN THE TWO SIDES. I AM VERY RESPECTFUL OF THE
18 PLATE OF THE PRIVATE SECTOR AT THIS MOMENT DURING COVID BUT WE
19 NEED TO AGREE ON THE NEED FOR EQUITABLE AND PROGRESSIVE
20 SOLUTIONS TO DO THIS. I WANT TO SAY HAPPY TO PARTICIPATE AND
21 REALLY PROD BOTH SIDES TO TRY TO FIND A SPOT THAT WILL WORK.
22 AND TO THINK ABOUT THAT FOR '22 OR '24. THIRD I WANT TO SAY
23 BECAUSE NICK JOSEFOWITZ BROUGHT IT UP. I WILL SUPPORT STATE
24 FUNDING CONSENSUS WE CAN PROVIDE WITH THE ONE CAVEAT, THERE
25 AREN'T A LOT OF STATE LEGISLATORS WILLING TO PRIORITIZE



November 16, 2020

1 TRANSIT OVER OTHER NEEDS. WE JUST BALANCE SAID A SCORE BILLION
2 DOLLARS BUDGET DEFICIT AND I EXPECT NEXT TRANCHES OF MONEY
3 WILL GO TO SCHOOL, UNEMPLOYMENT BENEFITS SOCIAL SAFETY NET, TO
4 STABILIZE BUSINESS THAT IS FALLING APART STRUGGLING RIGHT NOW
5 TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO MAKE THE CASE TO LEGISLATURE AND
6 COLLEAGUES TRANSIT OUGHT TO RECEIVE MONEY AT THE SAME TIME
7 THAT'S WHERE THE RUBBER HITS THE ROAD WITH CHALLENGES IN
8 POLITICS. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ENGAGE IN OFFLINE CONVERSATIONS
9 ON THIS MOVING FORWARD.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVID FOR THOSE COMMENTS.
12 HALEY?

13

14 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** YES THANK YOU. I'M SO GLAD THAT WE HAVE THE
15 OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS ALL OF THE ISSUES RELATED TOW THIS
16 BECAUSE IT'S IMPORTANT TO THE REGION. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE
17 CHALLENGES BUSINESSES ARE FACING DURING THE CRISIS WE NEED TO
18 TALK ABOUT THE CHALLENGES THAT LOW INCOME COMMUNITY MEMBERS
19 ARE FACING IN THE CURRENT CRISIS AS ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS THE
20 -- WE DON'T NEED TO ENUMERATE THE CASCADING EFFECTS THAT COVID
21 HAS HAD ON PEOPLE EVEN AS BUSINESSES ARE SUFFERING LOW INCOME
22 AND DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE ALSO SUFFERING THAT'S WHY
23 WE'RE BRINGING UP ALTERNATIVES TO A SALES TAX AND WANT TO
24 DISCUSS THE POSSIBILITIES TO ENSURE THAT THE BURDEN OF PAYING
25 FOR THE SYSTEM THAT WE KNOW WE WANT IS EQUITABLY DISTRIBUTED



November 16, 2020

1 AS WE HAVE DISCUSSED SO MUCH EQUITY IS CENTER TO MTC AND
2 PLANNING PUTTING ALL OPTIONS ON THE TABLE IS IMPORTANT TO
3 HAVING EQUITABLE OUTCOMES.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. YOU KNOW I JUST WANT TO FOLLOW
6 UP ON JIM WUNDERMAN COMMENTS. YOU KNOW, WHATEVER WE DO BRING
7 FORWARD IT HAS TO BE AN ENHANCEMENT TO BUSINESS AND IT HAS TO
8 REALLY DEMONSTRATE THAT THERE IS SOME ADVANTAGES TO A WORLD
9 CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT BENEFITS BUSINESSES HERE IN THE BAY
10 AREA. SO WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REALLY HAVE THAT DISCUSSION,
11 AND AS ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU SAID, WE NEED TO BRING ALL THE
12 PARTIES TOGETHER AND BUILD A CONSENSUS SOMETHING WE CAN ALL
13 GET BEHIND. WITH ANY OPPOSITION ANY MEASURE IS GOING TO BE
14 EXTREMELY DISTANCE. HOPEFULLY THIS COMMITTEE CAN MAKE
15 RECOMMENDATIONS ON NEXT STEPS. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE
16 ANY OTHER HANDS. HALEY GOOD PRESENTATION ELLEN, I ENCOURAGE TO
17 REVIEW THE HANDOUTS. THE COMMISSION IS GOING TO BE BRINGING
18 FORWARD THESE ISSUES IN THE FUTURE. IAN, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
19 COMMENTS AND RELINQUISHING SOME OF YOUR TIME TO YOUR
20 COLLEAGUES THERE. I APPRECIATE THAT THERE SO WE COULD MOVE
21 THIS FORWARD. ARE THERE ANY CLOSING COMMENTS ON THIS ISSUE?
22 OKAY. ALL RIGHT. WELL THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD PRESENTATION.
23 WALLY, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

24



November 16, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES THERE S LET ME INVITE THEM. MEMBERS
2 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH COMMENTS
3 PLEASE USE YOUR RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE NOW, AND
4 I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE
5 MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS TO SPEAK. PLEASE RAISE YOUR VIRTUAL HAND
6 IN THE NEXT 60 SECONDS TO BE RECOGNIZED AS A SPEAKER. FIRST
7 SPEAKER ADINA.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. ADINA LEVIN, FRIENDS EVER
10 CALTRAIN. WANT TO SUPPORT OF COMMENTS ABOUT HAVING A MULTI-
11 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS CONVENED BY A PUBLIC AGENCY THIS. IS
12 SOMETHING THAT HAS BEEN DONE AT THE COUNTY LEVEL WITH SANTA
13 CLARA COUNTY MEASURE B, AND SAN MATEO COUNTY MEASURE W PUBLIC
14 AGENCY MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PROCESS HELPED BUILD A DIVERSE SET OF
15 SUPPORT THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IN GETTING TWO THIRDS AS JASON
16 MENTIONED, AND CALTRAIN WORK ON ORGANIZATIONS THE 2018 MEASURE
17 ON RR BRINGING TOGETHER NON-PROFITS TRANSIT ADVOCATES, ACTIVE
18 TRANSPORTATION, THE ENVIRONMENT TURNING OUT OVER 500
19 VOLUNTEERS AND MANY TENS OF THOUSANDS OF CALLS AND TEXT
20 MESSAGES, AND HAVING STAKEHOLDERS GET OVER THAT TWO THIRDS,
21 AND PUBLIC OUTREACH GOOD PRECEDENT IN MEASURE RR WITH
22 BUSINESSES PLAN THAT CALTRAIN DID IN WORK GETTING LOCAL
23 ELECTED SUPPORT FOR THE GOAL IN THE MEASURE THAT HELPED
24 COMMUNITY SUPPORT, THAT HAD BEEN DISCUSSED IN THE COMMUNITY
25 FOR A YEAR OR TWO. PUBLIC OUTREACH, AND PUBLIC CONVENOR,



November 16, 2020

1 STAKEHOLDER SUPPORT IS ESSENTIAL IN GETTING THAT BROAD SUPPORT
2 TO GETTING OVER THE TWO THIRDS PERCENT.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ROLAND.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** ESSENTIAL FOR MTC TO KEEP AN EYE ON WHAT'S HAPPENING
7 WITH THE FUNDING I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE ON THURSDAY
8 AT NOON THE VTA ADMINISTRATION AND FINANCE COMMITTEE IS GOING
9 TO BE REPORTING ESSENTIALLY A DEFICIT OF \$5 MILLION UP TO JUNE
10 AND \$25 MILLION IN THE PERIOD FROM JUNE TO THIS SEPTEMBER. BUT
11 THE PRESENTATION DOESN'T TALK ABOUT THE CARES ACT. AND IF YOU
12 LOOK AT THE REPORT, SO THIS IS ITEM 12 OF THIS ADMINISTRATION
13 FINANCE COMMITTEE, THERE IS A VERY SMALL NOTE THAT SAYS THIS
14 REFLECTS THE EXCLUSION -- I WILL REPEAT, THE EXCLUSION OF
15 CARES ACT FUNDING RECEIVED IN AUGUST 20TH AND INITIAL ADA
16 FUNDING. WHICH IS \$141 MILLION. YOU KNOW, WHY AREN'T THEY
17 MENTIONING IT? THEY ACTUALLY HAVE A SURPLUS AND A DEFICIT. THE
18 OTHER THING WITH REGARD TO RR PASSING YEAH IT PASSED OURSELF
19 IT FAILED IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND THAT IS AN ISSUE, BECAUSE
20 HALF OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY DOESN'T GET CALTRAIN SERVICE THAT'S
21 BOTTOM LINE GOVERNANCE ISSUE THAT HAS GOT TO BE ADDRESSED.
22 LAST POINT ON GOVERNANCE I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION
23 WHAT'S GOING ON ABOUT SAN JOSE IT'S 100 PERCENT -- I SPOKE ON
24 MEASURE EIGHT RIGHT BEHIND ME FOREMOST CENTER TRANSPORTATION
25 COMMITTEE CHAIRMAN TO PROVIDE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK YOU.



November 16, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MONICA MALLON.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MONICA. I AM A TRANSIT RIDER FROM SANTA
7 CLARA COUNTY. I SUPPORT THE IDEA OF HAVING STRONG PUBLIC
8 PROCESS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT EVERYONE HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO
9 BE HEARD. I FEEL THAT THE SB278 PROCESS THAT HAPPENED LAST
10 YEAR AND EARLIER THIS YEAR THERE ARE NO PUBLIC MEETINGS AT ALL
11 IN MY COUNTY OF 2 MILLION PEOPLE. THIS MEASURE IS SOMETHING
12 THAT'S GOING TO BE IMPACTING US FOR DECADES AND I REALLY WANT
13 TO URGE YOU TO MAKE SURE THIS IS A THOUGHT OUT PROCESS. THESE
14 ARE ROUGE DECISIONS AND SHOULD NOT BE TREATED LIKE SOME
15 MEASURES IN THE PAST OR LIKE THE PROCESS THAT HAPPENED THIS
16 YEAR.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ANY LAST COMMENTS BY COMMITTEE
21 MEMBERS? AGAIN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. VOICES FOR PUBLIC
22 TRANSPORTATION, GOOD PRESENTATION. AND WE WILL CERTAINLY BE
23 ENGAGING WITH YOU MORE IN THE FUTURE OF THE COMMITTEE. SO
24 THANKS AGAIN. BEFORE WE DO OUR MEETING SUMMARY, DO WE HAVE ANY
25 PUBLIC COMMENTS?



November 16, 2020

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** NO. NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, STEVE, IF YOU'RE READY TO
5 GIVE US A WRAP UP.

6

7 **STEVE KINSEY:** YES. GREAT MEETING TODAY. THANK YOU ALL FOR
8 GOING FORWARD. ACTUALLY I'LL ASK FOR ONE SLIDE TO BE BROUGHT
9 UP, WHICH IS JUST A GRAPHIC ILLUSTRATING WHERE WE ARE AND
10 WHERE WE'RE HEADED. YOUR ACTIONS TODAY ARE RIGHT ON TARGET BY
11 ADOPTING THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES. BASED ON YOUR COMMENTS LAST
12 MONTH, CHAIR SPERING, SUPPORTED BY A NUMBER OF OTHER TASK
13 FORCE MEMBERS, WE HAVE EXTENDED THE AMOUNT OF TIME THAT WE'RE
14 GOING TO SPEND ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND REALLY FOCUS ON
15 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE ISSUES, BEGINNING IN
16 DECEMBER, YOU WILL SEE THAT THERE IS A FAIR AMOUNT OF ACTION
17 GOING ON IN DECEMBER, WE'RE GOING TO RECEIVE AN UPDATE FROM
18 THE OPERATORS ON THEIR STAGE TWO RECOVERY. WE'RE ALSO GOING TO
19 HAVE, AS WE TALKED ABOUT, THE DRAFT OF THE EQUITY PRINCIPLES,
20 AND WE'RE GOING TO BEGIN A TWO MONTH PROCESS OF LOOKING AT THE
21 EXISTING INITIATIVES THAT MTC ALREADY HAS UNDERWAY FOLLOWED BY
22 IN FEBRUARY SOME FORM OF ACTION THAT WOULD LINK THOSE
23 INITIATIVES TO THE NETWORK MANAGER DISCUSSION. SO YOU'RE
24 REALLY IN THE HEART OF THE HEAVY LIFTING HERE OVER THE NEXT



November 16, 2020

1 SEVERAL MONTHS. AND WE'LL DO THE BEST WE CAN TO ORGANIZE IT TO
2 BE EFFICIENT ON YOUR BEHALF. THAT'S IT FOR NOW, I WOULD SAY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THERESE, COULD YOU GET YOU TO
5 COMMENT REAL BRIEFLY ON THE MTC PROCESS, LOOKING AT SOME OF
6 THEIR REGIONAL FUNDS OR OPPORTUNITIES OR HOW WE'RE ADVOCATING
7 FOR THOSE STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING?

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SURE. YOU KNOW, AS A QUICK REMINDER, WE HAD
10 MADE A PRESENTATION ON THE RANGE OF POTENTIAL SOURCES THAT
11 MIGHT BE BROUGHT TO BEAR TO THIS BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE, AND WE
12 FOLLOWED THAT UP WITH A PRESENTATION TO OUR PROGRAMMING AND
13 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THOSE FIVE THINGS THAT WE BROUGHT UP
14 THAT WE WOULD NEED TO EVALUATE WERE, YOU KNOW, WHAT LEVELS OF
15 SERVICE CAN BE SUSTAINED AND FOR HOW LONG, WITH A FOCUS ON
16 SERVICING THE RIDERS THAT NEED IT MOST. I THINK THAT'S A
17 REALLY CRITICAL BASELINE QUESTION. THE SCALE OF THE REVENUE
18 OPTIONS IS REALLY IMPORTANT GIVEN THE SCALE OF THE ISSUE, AND
19 WHEN THEY'RE AVAILABLE. THAT IS GOING, YOU KNOW, PLAY INTO
20 FEASIBILITY OF ALTERNATIVES, INCLUDING STEPS AND APPROVALS,
21 TRADEOFFS AND SHIFTING FUNDS ET CETERA. SO WE LAID THAT OUT
22 BOTH FOR BLUE RIBBON AND FOR PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
23 COMMITTEE. WHEN WE WANT TO DO IS BRING FORWARD SOME POTENTIAL
24 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATES COMMITTEE IN
25 DECEMBER. THAT'S WHAT WE HAD, YOU KNOW, SUGGESTED AT THE



November 16, 2020

1 COMMITTEE LAST TIME. AT LEAST SOME PRINCIPLES ABOUT HOW WE
2 WOULD GO FORWARD, AND A LOT OF THIS IS SHAPED BY LOOKING,
3 AGAIN, AT WHAT INFORMATION, AS YOU KNOW NOVEMBER RESULTED IN,
4 YOU KNOW, SOME IMPORTANT DECISIONS ABOUT WHAT LEADERSHIP LOOKS
5 LIKE THERE. SO THAT WILL PLAY INTO THINGS. BUT HOPEFULLY WE
6 CAN AT LEAST FRAME UP SOME POTENTIAL CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE
7 COMMISSION AT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS MEETING IN
8 DECEMBER.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. WELL THANK YOU THERESE. WELL
11 WITH THAT WE'RE AT THE END OF THE MEETING. DOES ANYBODY HAVE
12 ANY CLOSING COMMENTS BEFORE WE ADJOURN? ALL RIGHT. LOOK
13 FORWARD TO SEEING EVERYONE IN DECEMBER. AND WITH THAT, THIS
14 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU ALL FOR ATTENDING. GOOD
15 MEETING. [ADJOURNED]

16



Broadcasting Government