

An aerial photograph of a city street grid, viewed from a high angle. The streets form a complex network of lines, with some major roads appearing as thicker, darker lines. The entire image is overlaid with a semi-transparent blue filter, giving it a monochromatic, official appearance.

ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

Meeting Transcript

October 15, 2020

ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 15, 2020, 6:05 PM

PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN: GOOD EVENING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING FOR OCTOBER 15TH, 2019. I WILL ASK THE TEAM TO ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE AND THE MTC EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING IS BEING CONDUCTED REMOTELY IN LIGHT OF GOVERNOR NEWSOM'S STATE OF EMERGENCY DECLARATION REGARDING THE COVID-19 OUTBREAK AND IN ACCORDANCE WITH EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM ON MARCH 17TH, 2020, AND THE GUIDANCE FOR GATHERINGS ISSUED BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH. THIS MEETING IS BEING CONDUCTED VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND ZOOM, VIDEO CONFERENCE FOR COMMITTEE, COMMISSION, AND BOARD MEMBERS WHO WILL BE PARTICIPATING IN THE MEETING FROM INDIVIDUAL REMOTE LOCATIONS. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WERE ENCOURAGED TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY THROUGH ZOOM. AN ATTENDEE LINK WAS PROVIDED ON OUR PUBLISHED AGENDA AS WELL AS A TELEPHONE NUMBER FOR ATTENDEES TO PARTICIPATE BY PHONE. DETAILS AND INSTRUCTIONS FOR PARTICIPATING THROUGH ZOOM ARE AVAILABLE ON THE ABAG WEB SITE. FOR THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE BY PHONE OR BY ZOOM, OR MAY SUBMIT COMMENTS BY E-MAIL TO INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE SCHEDULED MEETING DATE. DUE TO CURRENT

October 15, 2020

1 CIRCUMSTANCES THERE MAY BE A LIMITED OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS
2 COMMENTS DURING THE MEETING. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED
3 WILL BE POSTED ONLINE AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT
4 BE READ ALOUD. AND AUTHORS OF WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WHO WOULD
5 LIKE TO SPEAK MAY DO SO DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PORTION ON
6 ITEMS ON THE AGENDA. SO WITH THAT, WILL THE ABAG CLERK OF THE
7 BOARD PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL?

8

9 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, IF THE ABAG
10 CLERK OF THE BOARD WOULD PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM
11 IF A QUORUM IS PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR [INDISCERNIBLE].

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I AM PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PRESIDENT ARREGUIN?

18

19 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BASS?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JANIE?

Meeting Transcript

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I AM HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR CANEPA IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
5 CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER CLARK?

10

11 **CHRISTOPHER CLARK:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR CORTESE?

14

15 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR PRO TEMPORE EKLUND.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER ESPARZA?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR GARBARINO?

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE MAYOR GIBBONS?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER MCELHANEY?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY?

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR HALLIDAY? SUPERVISOR HANNIGAN? IS
17 ABSENT. DIRECTOR HILLIS?

18

19 **RICHARD HILLIS:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON?

22

23 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER LEE?

Meeting Transcript

October 15, 2020

1

2 **WAYNE LEE:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE MAYOR MACKENZIE?

5

6 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN? SUPERVISOR MAR?

9

10 **GORDON MAR:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MILEY? SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

13

14 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER PERALEZ? MAYOR PIERCE?

17

18 **JULIE PIERCE:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR PINE?

21

22 **DAVE PINE:** PRESENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

25

Meeting Transcript

October 15, 2020

1 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE .

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE .

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RODONI?

8

9 **JOHN RAHAIM:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER TAYLOR .

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE .

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR WILSON?

16

17 **LORI WILSON:** HERE .

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ?

20

21 **RAUL PERALEZ:** HERE .

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT .

24

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES
2 TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA. ONCE AGAIN
3 THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO
4 ADDRESS THE RHNA WE'LL TAKE COMMENT THIS IS EVENING. I SEE WE
5 HAVE ONE RAISED HAND. MR. CASTRO CALL THE FIRST SPEAKER. IS
6 MR. BEAKMAN.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I JUST ATTENDED MY FIRST MEETING. I GOT A LOT
9 OFF MY CHEST. I LIVE IN THE BAY AREA, SAN JOSE AREA. I WORK
10 FOR ACCOUNTABILITY FOR TECHNOLOGY DATA RESEARCH IN LOCAL
11 COMMUNITIES. IT WAS INTRODUCED BY THE ACLU IN 2014 WITH THE
12 HELP OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND THE UN. AND IT'S REALLY
13 INTERESTING WORK. IT TRIES TO CREATE THE IDEAS OF WHAT CAN BE
14 OPEN DEMOCRACY TO ADDRESS THE IDEAS OF PEACE AND HOW TO END
15 CONTINUAL WAR IN THIS CAREER. WE ARE IN A STATE OF WAR WITH
16 911 AND HOW DO WE GET OUT OF THAT AND HOW DO WE ADDRESS
17 CONTINUAL WAR IN ITS SHOCK DOCTRINE AND PRACTICES. THROUGH THE
18 IDEA OF OPEN DEMOCRACY. IT'S INTERESTING WORK. AND IT'S HOW
19 EVERYDAY COMMUNITY CAN RELATE TO THE PUBLIC ITSELF. THE CITY
20 GOVERNMENT ITSELF. IT'S CITY GOVERNMENT AND IT'S BUILDING
21 RELATIONSHIPS AGAIN IT'S BUILDING OPENNESS AND IT'S INCREDIBLE
22 WORK. AND IT DEFINES THE FUTURE OF RESPONSIBLE TECHNOLOGY OF
23 COMMUNITIES WORKING TOGETHER. IT'S THROUGH THAT WORK THAT I'M,
24 YOU KNOW, LEARNING TO SPEAK WITH MY GOVERNMENT, AND WORK WITH
25 MY GOVERNMENT MORE. AND IT BROUGHT ME TO, YOU KNOW, THESE

October 15, 2020

1 HOUSING ISSUES, AND I'LL BE SPEAKING TONIGHT ON THE IMPORTANCE
2 OF MIXED INCOMING AND HOW TO -- WE CAN ADDRESS OURSELVES IN
3 TERMS OF VERY LOW INCOME AND EXTREME HE LOW INCOME THAT DOES
4 NOT GET ENOUGH CREDIT IN THIS LIFE AND WE DON'T KNOW HOW TO
5 TALK ABOUT THAT. I HOPE WE CAN TALK ABOUT THESE ISSUES BETTER
6 AND IT WILL BE MY JOB AND ROLE IN LIFE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT
7 CAN BE. THANKS A LOT.

8

9 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANKS A LOT. DON'T SEE ANY OTHER
10 RAISED HANDS. MR. CASTRO ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA
11 ITEMS. ITEM SEVEN ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD.
12 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. SO I
13 WILL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM THREE, EXECUTIVE BOARD
14 ANNOUNCEMENTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? IF SO PLEASE RAISE
15 YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE IF YOU'RE PHONING IN. I DO NOT
16 SEE ANY RAISED HANDS M CASTRO ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
17 FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE.

20

21 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'LL GO TO THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT
22 FOR OCTOBER 15TH, 2020. I WANT TO THANK YOU COLLEAGUES FOR
23 YOUR PARTICIPATING IN TONIGHT'S MEETING. TONIGHT IS AN
24 IMPORTANT MILESTONE IN OUR WORK ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
25 ALLOCATION WHICH IS ONE OF THE CRITICAL RESPONSIBILITIES OF

October 15, 2020

1 ABAG GOVERNANCE. THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE COMPLETED
2 ITS WORK AND PRESENTED A METHODOLOGY AS OPTION 8A, AND
3 PROPOSED AT ITS MEETING ON THE 21st AND RECOMMENDED OPTION 8A
4 TONIGHT WE'LL HEAR A REPORT, AND AUTHORIZE OPENING OF PUBLIC
5 COMMENT PERIOD WHILE THIS IS AN IMPORTANT MILESTONE IT STARTS
6 MANY MONTHS PROCESS TO SOLICIT PUBLIC COMMENT AND TO FINALIZE
7 RHNA ALLOCATION WHICH WE WILL SUBMIT TO STATE HCD PROVIDE
8 COMMENT AND VOTE ON RHNA AND THERE IS AN APPEAL PERIOD SO
9 WE'RE AT THE BEGIN EVER WHAT WILL BE A MANY MONTHS PROCESS IN
10 THE RHNA APPROVAL. IN DECEMBER WE'LL CONSIDER APPROVAL OF THE
11 FINAL RHNA METHODOLOGY AFTER THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. I WANT
12 TO HIGHLIGHT SOMETHING WE DISCUSSED AT THE HOUSING COMMITTEE
13 WHICH IS THE REAP PROJECT REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PROGRAM. AS
14 YOU KNOW ABAG RECEIVED \$24 MILLION IN STATE FUNDS, THROUGH THE
15 GOVERNOR'S TRAILER BILL, AND THIS NOT ONLY IS PROVIDING DIRECT
16 FUNDING TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS FOR PLANNING WORK TO UPDATE
17 HOUSING ELEMENTS AND ZONING TO IMPLEMENT THE SIX CYCLE OF RHNA
18 BUT ALSO GRANTS WILL BE PROVIDED DIRECTLY OR ON A COMPETITIVE
19 BASIS TO SUPPORT THE WORK OF OUR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, AND
20 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WHICH IS ALREADY LAUNCHED TO SUPPORT
21 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO IMPLEMENT THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT. SO, YOU
22 KNOW, WHILE WE'RE TAKE THE STEP TONIGHT TO ADOPT THE RHNA
23 METHODOLOGY WE PLAY A ROLE AS REGIONAL COUNCIL AND GOVERNMENT
24 TO PROVIDE FUNDING SUPPORT AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO SUPPORT
25 COUNTIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION OF ALL SIZES TO IMPLEMENT.

October 15, 2020

1 THAT'S IMPORTANT AND PART OF OUR WORK AND AT A FUTURE MEETING
2 WE'LL BE VOTING ON THE PROCESS FOR ALLOCATING THOSE ADDITIONAL
3 REAP FUNDS. THAT'S MY REPORT. ARE THERE QUESTIONS IN IF SO
4 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. IS THERE ANY
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ON MY PRESIDENT'S REPORT? IF SO PLEASE RAISE
6 YOUR HAND AND PRESS STAR NINE. OKAY. SEEING NONE. MR. CASTRO
7 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ITEM FIVE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
12 REPORT. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO THERESE
13 MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU. GIVEN OUR SUBSTANTIAL AGENDA
16 ITEMS TODAY MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD RECEIVED MY REPORT,
17 AND I WOULD URGE YOU AT YOUR LEASE TOUR LOOK AT IT, AND I
18 WOULD TURN IT BACK OVER TO YOU. THANK YOU.

19

20 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS SUBMITTED BY E-
21 MAIL BY MR. CASTRO TO EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS. IT'S ALSO
22 POSTED ON THE LEGISTAR PAGE FOR THIS MEETING. ANY QUESTIONS
23 FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? COMMENTS? IS THERE ANY COMMENT ON
24 ITEM FIVE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR A REPORT IF SO RAISE YOUR HAND.
25 CALL THE SPEAKER.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS MR. BEAKMAN. GO AHEAD.
3 MR. BEAKMAN THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HI IT TOOK A WHILE TO UNMUTE. ON THE
6 SEPTEMBER ISSUES INCLUDED WILDLIFE REPORTS AND SUCH. FOR THIS
7 ITEM, I JUST WANTED TO OFFER AN EXAMPLE OF THE IDEAS OF A
8 SURVEILLANCE AND TECHNOLOGY ORDINANCE IDEAS OR JUST
9 ACCOUNTABILITY IDEAS THAT ARE NOW MORE POSSIBLE THAN THEY WERE
10 FOUR OR FIVE YEARS AGO. WE HAVE CHANGED QUITE A LOT WITH
11 ACCOUNTABILITY IN THE FAST FOUR OR FIVE YEARS. AND WORK AROUND
12 WILDLIFE ISSUES AROUND THE BAY, THAT INCLUDES WILDLIFE TRAIL
13 MAINTENANCE AND THOSE SORTS OF ISSUES. AIR MONITORING, THAT
14 TAKES TECHNOLOGY. AND I KNOW, LIKE THE CITY OF DAVIS, BY
15 SACRAMENTO HAS DEVELOPED A VERY GOOD SET OF, THEY CALL IT A
16 SURVEILLANCE AND TECHNOLOGY ORDINANCE WHICH IS A VERY GOOD SET
17 OF PRACTICES THAT DESCRIBES HOW DATA IS COLLECTED, WHO CAN SEE
18 THE DATA, HOW THE PUBLIC CAN SEE THE DATA. IT'S AN INVENTORY,
19 AND IT'S REALLY INTERESTING WORK. AND IT'S A QUESTION TO ASK
20 YOURSELVES, IF YOU HAVE AN AIR MONITOR UP, DOWN BY THE BAY,
21 AND IT OFFERS A BIT OF EXTRA SURVEILLANCE EQUIPMENT, SHOULD
22 THAT BE -- SHOULD THE PUBLIC BE AWARE OF THAT? SHOULD THEY BE
23 ALLOWED TO BE KNOWN TO THAT INFORMATION? AND WHAT EXACTLY IT'S
24 DOING. THAT IS A QUESTION THAT I FEEL THAT, YOU KNOW, OUR
25 FUTURE, WE CAN HAVE GUIDELINES AND EXAMPLES TO MAKE IT A

October 15, 2020

1 SIMPLE PROCESS SO THE PUBLIC CAN UNDERSTAND AND IT DOESN'T
2 HAVE TO BE SECRET, FEARFUL OR HIDDEN AND HOW TO WORK TOWARDS
3 THAT GOAL, THOSE GOALS, IS IMPORTANT. AND THAT'S WHY I'M HERE.
4 AND THAT'S THE FUTURE OF PEACE AND GOOD DEMOCRACY AND THAT
5 TECHNOLOGY DOES NOT TAKE OVER OUR LIVES. THANK YOU.

6

7 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY THANK YOU. ANY OTHER PUBLIC
8 COMMENTS ON ITEM FIVE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. POST THE ON
9 THE MTC WEB SITE. SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. MR. CASTRO ANY
10 WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE.

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ITEM SIX EXECUTIVE BOARD CONSENT
15 CALENDAR, TWO ITEMS ONE APPROVAL OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
16 MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 17TH, 2020 AND ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION
17 162020 REVISED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, FINAL BLUEPRINT
18 STRATEGIES AMENDMENT. DOES ANY EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER WISH TO
19 PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? DIRECTOR EKLUND?

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON 6B. I DON'T
22 NEED TO PULL T I JUST HAVE A REQUEST OF STAFF, IF THAT'S OKAY.
23 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN?

24

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THAT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE AT THIS
2 TIME.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I HAD, AT THE LAST MEETING, I
5 HAD TALKED ABOUT THE USE OF THE CAL FIRE MAPS FOR PLANNED BAY
6 AREA 2050, AND I WAS THINKING THEY WAS GOING TO GET SOME
7 FEEDBACK ON THAT, BUT I HADN'T. SO I DID MY OWN HOMEWORK. AND
8 AS ANTICIPATED CAL FIRE DOES NOT CONDUCT THEIR ASSESSMENTS ON
9 ALL PROPERTIES THAT ARE CONSIDERED A FIRE RISK. AND THEY ARE
10 NOT FINISHED, EVEN ASSESSING THE STATE RESOURCE AREAS, WHICH
11 ARE PRIMARILY STATE PROPERTIES, AND THEY DO NOT CONDUCT ANY
12 ASSESSMENTS IN LOCAL ASSESSMENT AREAS, AND ALSO IN THOSE STATE
13 AREAS WHERE THEY HAVE CONTRACTED WITH THE LOCAL AGENCY LIKE
14 MARIN COUNTY TO ASSESS THEM. AND THEY ONLY DO HIGH FIRE RISK.
15 SO I GOT A MAP FROM OUR FIRE DISTRICT, WHICH YOU CAN'T SEE,
16 BUT I DID PASS IT ON TO STAFF, MARIN IS ALMOST ALL RED,
17 WHEREAS IF YOU LOOK AT THE CAL FIRE MAP IT'S ALMOST ALL
18 YELLOW, WHICH IS MODERATE VERSUS HIGH OR VERY HIGH. SO I'M
19 ASKING THAT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT
20 THIS BEFORE THE DRAFT FINAL PLAN IS RELEASED, EITHER IN
21 NOVEMBER OR DECEMBER, SO THAT WE CAN TALK ABOUT WHAT'S THE
22 PROPER MAPS WE SHOULD BE USING AND WHAT AND HOW THE
23 DESIGNATION HAS. THAT ALSO GOES FOR CLIMATE CHANGE BECAUSE I
24 ALSO LEARNED PLANNED BAY AREA ONLY PLANNED BAY AREA DOES
25 INCLUDE SEA LEVEL RISE BUT DOESN'T INCLUDE FLOODING OF CREEKS,

October 15, 2020

1 STREAMS AND RIVERS AND IN OUR FLOODPLAINS. AND IN FACT THERE
2 IS A SITE IN MARIN THAT ABAG HAS DETERMINED TO BE TO BE
3 ELIGIBLE FOR HOUSING, BUT IT'S ALSO SUBJECT TO A FLOOD OF UP
4 TO EIGHT FEET ABOVE GRADE. SO I THINK THOSE ARE TWO ISSUES
5 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE SOME CONVERSATION BEFORE WE RELEASE
6 THE DRAFT. AND THIS IS THE ONLY OPPORTUNITY THEY COULD TALK
7 ABOUT IT, AT THIS TIME. SO I'M TRUSTING THAT SOMEBODY WILL GET
8 BACK TO ME? OR JESSE MAYBE YOU AND I CAN CHAT ABOUT TRYING TO
9 GET THIS ON THE AGENDA. I WOULD APPRECIATE THAT.

10

11 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** HAPPY TO DISCUSS THE ISSUE FURTHER.
12 I DID RECEIVE YOUR E-MAIL TODAY, AND I KNOW STAFF RECEIVED IT
13 AS WELL.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WOULD YOU MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE
18 THE CON SET CENT CALENDAR.

19

20 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WILL.

21

22 **WAYNE LEE:** SECOND.

23

24 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SECOND BY DIRECTOR LEE. DIRECTOR
25 HALLIDAY DO YOU WISH TO SPEAK?

October 15, 2020

1

2 **BARBARA HALLIDAY:** I THINK I MISSED ROLL CALL. I'M HAVING A LOT
3 OF DEVICE PROBLEMS TONIGHT. FOR SOME REASON SO I'M GOING TO
4 TRY TO HANG WITH YOU BUT I WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT I AM
5 HAVING PROBLEMS, AND I MAY HAVE TO -- I DON'T KNOW. I MAY GET
6 SHOVED OUT OF THE MEETING. SORRY. THAT'S ALL I WANTED TO SAY.

7

8 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. GLAD YOU'RE HERE
9 WITH US. THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND. MOVED BY EKLUND
10 SECONDED BY LEE TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR. QUESTIONS OR
11 COMMENTS FROM THE EXECUTIVE BOARD. IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR
12 HAND. SEEING NONE. LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CONSENT
13 CALENDAR. IF ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON
14 THE CONSENT CALENDAR PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR
15 NINE. OKAY. MR. BEAKMAN THIS IS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR ON THE
16 AMENDMENTS. MR. CASTRO CALL THE SPEAKER.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. BEAKMAN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES. I UNDERSTANDS WHAT THIS ITEM IS B ABOUT. I WANT
21 TO MAKE A COMMENT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE AND IT'S MY
22 FIRST TIME HERE TODAY SO I'M KIND OF INTRODUCING MYSELF AND
23 HOW I THINK AND WORK AND IT'S A BIT ANNOYING THAT IN
24 INTRODUCTIONS, AND HOPEFULLY I CAN MELLOW OUT. BUT SO YOU CAN
25 GET AN UNDERSTANDING OF MYSELF OF HOW I WANT TO THINK AND

October 15, 2020

1 WORK. WE HAVE HAD AN INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF FIRE THROUGHOUT THE
2 BAY AREA IN THE PAST FEW YEARS, AND IT'S BEEN VERY DIFFICULT
3 AND CHALLENGING AND, YOU KNOW, FOR ALL OF US, AND IT'S A
4 REMINDER TO ME THE IMPORTANCE OF BUREAUCRAT PRACTICES AND WHAT
5 IS CARING IN BUREAUCRAT PRACTICES AND HOW THAT CARING RELATES
6 TO THE COMMUNITY, HOW THE COMMUNITY CAN SHARE INFORMATION WITH
7 THE GOVERNMENT AND GOVERNMENT CAN SHARE INFORMATION WITH THEIR
8 COMMUNITY. AND I JUST -- IT'S DIFFICULT TO WORK THAT OUT, FOR
9 ALL OF US. WE HAVE HAD EPISODES IN THE SOUTH BAY, THAT HAVE
10 BEEN DIFFICULT TO HANDLE AND MANAGE. THERE WAS A MASS SHOOTING
11 IN GILROY A FEW YEARS AGO. SO, YOU KNOW, WE -- THERE IS ALWAYS
12 DIFFICULT SITUATIONS AND HOW WE WORK THAT OUT TOGETHER AS A
13 COMMUNITY, HOW WE LEARN FROM THAT AS A COMMUNITY, THAT MAY BE
14 THE MOST IMPORTANT LESSON THAT WE ALL LEARN IN LIFE, AND I
15 HOPE WE LEARN THOSE GOOD LESSONS TOGETHER AND THAT'S KIND OF
16 WHAT I WANT TO BE ABLE TO HELP WORK ON. SO THANK YOU.

17

18 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY OTHER
19 PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM SIX? EXECUTIVE BOARD CONSENT CALENDAR?
20 IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. DON'T SEE
21 ANY. MR. CASTRO ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE.

24

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? SEEING
2 NONE LET'S CALL THE ROLL ON THE VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES
5 UNANIMOUSLY.

6

7 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL NOW GO
8 TO ITEM SEVEN, THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION ITEM A
9 REPORT ON PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FOR THE 2023 TO 2031 REGIONAL
10 HOUSING NEEDS CYCLE AND REQUEST AUTHORIZATION TO OPEN PUBLIC
11 COMMENT ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS METHODOLOGY. I WANT TO
12 GO THROUGH THE PROCESS FIRST A PRESENTATION FROM MTC ABAG
13 STAFF AND I WANT TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO THANK GILLIAN
14 ADAMS IN PARTICULAR, AND THE ENTIRE TEAM THAT HAS WORKED OVER
15 THE PAST YEAR IN NOT ONLY PROVIDING ANALYSIS AND SUPPORT FOR
16 THE HMC BUT ALL THE INCREDIBLE WORK THEY HAVE DONE TO GET US
17 TO THIS POINT AND TO DEVELOP THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. I AM GOING
18 TO TURN IT OVER TO STAFF AND JULIE PIERCE FROM CONTRA COSTA
19 MAYOR'S ASSOCIATION AND GIVE A PRESENTATION ON THEIR
20 ALTERNATIVE TO 8A AND CARLOS ROMERO AND DIRECTOR BAS ARE GOING
21 TO PRESENT ON 6A THEN WE WILL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN
22 WE'LL DISCUSS AND TAKE ACTION. SO THAT'S THE PROCESS I'M
23 PROPOSING FOR TONIGHT. SO MATT, ARE YOU GOING TO INTRODUCE? OR
24 THERESE, THE ITEM, BEFORE GILLIAN PRESENTS?

25

October 15, 2020

1 **MATT MALONEY:** YES CHAIR I'LL SET THIS UP THEN PASS IT ON TO
2 GILLIAN. MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF PLANNING TONIGHT WE HAVE AN
3 ACTION PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FOR SIX CYCLE OF RHNA. WE'LL HAVE
4 A PERIOD OF PUBLIC COMMENT FOLLOWING YOUR ACTION WE WOULD HOLD
5 PUBLIC HEARING IN NOVEMBER AND TURN TO YOU WITH A DRAFT RHNA
6 METHODOLOGY FOR APPROVAL. BETWEEN MOVE ON TO SOME FURTHER
7 PHASES INCLUDING AN APPEALS PROCESS, AND ULTIMATELY YOU WOULD
8 YOU BE ASKED TO APPROVE THE FINAL ALLOCATION IN 2021. THIS IS
9 CERTAINLY NOT THE BEGINNING OF THE DISCUSSION ABOUT RHNA AND
10 IT'S DEFINITELY NOT THE END EITHER IT'S FAIR TO SAY WE'RE AT
11 THE BEGINNING OF THE HOMESTRETCH. IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE
12 THAT OUR FOCUS AT THIS MOMENT IS ON THE METHODOLOGY RATHER
13 THAN THE SPECIFIC ALLOCATION THE WE HAVE PROVIDED PRELIMINARY
14 ALLOCATIONS SO YOU CAN UNDERSTAND HOW THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY
15 BEFORE YOU WOULD BE LIKELY TO PLAY OUT. AND I'LL TALK MORE
16 ABOUT THAT IN A MINUTE. STAFF AND A GOOD NUMBER OF YOU HAVE
17 BEEN HARD AT WORK FOR ROUGHLY ONE YEAR WITH THE HOUSING
18 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE HMC DEVELOPING A CONSENSUS TO DEVELOP A
19 METHODOLOGY TO GUIDE THE SIXTH CYCLE OF RHNA COMPRISED OF A
20 BROAD SPECTRUM OF NUMBERS, 36 FROM ACROSS THE REGION NINE
21 ELECTED OFFICIALS ONE FROM EACH COUNTY 12 HOUSING PLANNING
22 STAFF ONE FROM EACH COUNTY AND 17 REGIONAL STAKEHOLDERS
23 DEVELOPERS FROM EQUITY PUBLIC SPACE PUBLIC HEALTH LABOR
24 TRANSIT, EQUITY AND ADVOCATES FOR THE THREE PS. THE CONSENSUS
25 OPTION 8A AFTER DELIBERATION THE GROUP MET ON MANY OPTIONS AND

October 15, 2020

1 REFERRED THE METHODOLOGY TO BAG PASSION STAFF. TWO WEEKS AGO
2 THE ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE ALSO HEARD THIS
3 RECOMMENDATION AND REFERRED IT TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AS STAFF
4 WE BELIEVE THE HMC PROCESS WAS THOROUGH. IT WENT DEEP AND
5 INVESTIGATED MANY OPTIONS ALL INTERESTS WERE REPRESENTED HMC
6 HAD ROBUST CONVERSATIONS HOW TO INCORPORATE PLANNED BAY AREA
7 2050 WHICH IS A PLAN THIS BOARD HAS ACTED ON AND KNOWS WELL.
8 IN THE END PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS INCORPORATED AND THE
9 COMMITTEE SUPPORTED THE USE OF THE SHARE OF 2050 HOUSEHOLDS TO
10 FORM THE BASELINE OF THE ALLOCATION. THE HMC THEN DISCUSSED
11 THE METHODOLOGY FACTORS USED TO SHIFT THAT BASELINE ALLOCATION
12 ALL THROUGHOUT THE COMMITTEE RELIED ON A SET OF EVALUATION
13 CRITERIA DEVELOPED TO UNDERSTAND HOW WELL THE METHODOLOGY
14 OPTIONS ADDRESS THE STATUTORY OBJECTIVES OF RHNA AND FURTHER
15 REGIONAL PLANNING GOALS. WHAT WAS DEMONSTRATED IS THE OPTIONS
16 BEFORE YOU TODAY PERFORMED EXTREMELY WELL IN ADVANCING THE
17 STATUTORY OBJECT IS OF RHNA IN THE END THAT'S IMPORTANT PART
18 OF THIS DECISION. I WANT TO TOUCH MORE ON THE USE OF USE OF
19 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT THE METHODOLOGY USES THE
20 BLUEPRINT HOUSEHOLDS SHARE IN 2050 AS A BASELINE. THE HMC
21 CONSIDERED BUT DECIDED AGAINST USING PLANNED BAY AREA
22 BLUEPRINT GROWTH, MEAN BEING THE SHARE OF THE GROWTH INCREMENT
23 OVER THE LIFE OF THE PLAN RATHER THAN THE HOUSEHOLD SHARE IN
24 2050. I AM SURE WE'LL GET INTO THIS DISTINCTION MORE TONIGHT
25 AS WE GET INTO DISCUSSING THE RECOMMENDATION AND THE ALTERNATE

October 15, 2020

1 OPTIONS. FURTHERMORE, I WANT TO CLARIFY THAT WE'RE IN THE
2 MIDST OF MOVING TOWARD THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR PLANNED BAY
3 AREA 2050. THE FINAL BLUEPRINT BUILDS UPON THE DRAFT, WITH
4 SOME IMPORTANT DISTINCTIONS. THIS IS IMPORTANT. BECAUSE THE
5 RHNA METHODOLOGIES AND THUS THE ULTIMATE ALLOCATIONS ARE TIED
6 TO THE PLAN. RIGHT NOW WE'RE SEEING ILLUSTRATIVE ALLOCATIONS
7 THAT ARE TIED TO THE DRAFT, BUT WE WILL ULTIMATELY SEE
8 ALLOCATIONS TIED TO THE FINAL. FOR INSTANCE, THE FINAL
9 BLUEPRINT INCORPORATES TEN ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES, INCLUDING
10 INCREASED FUNDING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION, AND
11 PRESERVATION WHICH HAVE BEEN APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION AND
12 EXECUTIVE BOARD. THESE STRATEGIES WILL LIKELY HAVE SOME IMPACT
13 ON THE ULTIMATE DEVELOPMENT PATTERN FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
14 THUS IT WILL IMPACT RHNA AS WELL. IN ADDITION WE CONTINUE TO
15 WORK WITH COUNTIES AND LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON UNDERLYING DATA
16 ISSUES, AND ASSUMPTIONS THAT FLOW INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.
17 THIS IS ALWAYS PART OF OUR PROCESS, MOVING FROM A DRAFT TO A
18 FINAL PLAN IN ORDER TO ENSURE THAT THE FINAL IS THE BEST
19 REPRESENTATION POSSIBLE OF THE ADOPTED STRATEGIES AGAINST THE
20 BASELINE LAND USE IN THE REGION. THIS PROCESS WILL ALSO HAVE
21 AN IMPACT ON WHAT EMERGES ULTIMATELY WITH THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
22 AND THUS RHNA. I WANT TO UNDERScore THE ACTION BEFORE YOU
23 TONIGHT IS APPROVAL OF A PROPOSED METHODOLOGY RATHER THAN THE
24 ALLOCATION NUMBERS THEMSELVES. RECOMMENDED OPTION BEFORE YOU
25 TONIGHT 8A IN STAFF'S STRIKES A BALANCE FOCUS OF PLANNED BAY

October 15, 2020

1 AREA OVER THE EIGHT YEAR RHNA CYCLE. FOR EXAMPLE, UNDER THIS
2 RECOMMENDED DISTRIBUTION, THE TOP 25 CITIES IN THE REGION
3 ACCOUNT FOR 72 PERCENT OF THE RHNA ALLOCATION. IN ADDITION,
4 THE OPTION PERFORMS VERY WELL ON THE EQUITY RELATED METRICS
5 DEVELOPED BY THE HMC AND WE SEE IT AS AN OPTION THAT
6 AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERS FAIR HOUSING WHICH IS I STATUTORY
7 OBJECTIVE OF THE RHNA PROCESS. RHNA IS A TOUGH PROCESS THE
8 NUMBER WE RECEIVED FROM THE STATE 441,000 IS MUCH BIGGER THAN
9 LAST TIME WHEN IT WAS 187,000 SO THIS IS STICKER SHOCK AND
10 ALSO A ZERO SUM GAME SO ANY CHANGES RESULTING IN A
11 JURISDICTION GETTING LESS MEANS SOMEBODY ELSE GETS MORE. WE
12 ALSO KNOW IT WILL BE CHALLENGING FOR JURISDICTIONS TO UPDATE
13 THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS COVID IS BIG AND THERE IS IMPACT ON
14 BUDGETS. WE SEE RHNA AS A CONTINUUM OF RELATED PACKAGE EFFORTS
15 TO ASSIST JURISDICTION IN MOVING FORWARD ON THEIR COMPLIANT
16 HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE JUST HEARD AN ITEM AT THE MEETING BEFORE
17 THIS ABAG HOUSE COMMITTEE ON THE REAP PROGRAM. THAT IS AN
18 EFFORT TO WORK WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON GETTING THOSE
19 COMPLIANT HOUSING ELEMENTS DONE. AND WE HAVE STAFF MADE THAT
20 EFFORT A TOP PRIORITY, AND WILL BE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH ALL
21 OF YOU IN THE FUTURE ON THAT. SO WITH THAT I'LL PASS IT ALONG
22 TO GILLIAN ADAMS AND SHE'LL WALK THROUGH THE PRESENTATION.
23
24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU MATT. PULL UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. GOOD
25 EVENING I'M GILLIAN ADAMS WITH REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS

October 15, 2020

1 ALLOCATION PROCESS UPDATING ON THE METHODOLOGY RECOMMENDED BY
2 HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE.
3 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO JUST AS A REMINDER RHNA IS A STATE-
4 MANDATED PROCESS TO IDENTIFY THE SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSING
5 NEEDS THAT EACH LOCAL JURISDICTION MUST PLAN FOR OVER AN EIGHT
6 YEAR PERIOD. BY LAW ABAG IS RESPONSIBLE FOR DEVELOPING A
7 METHODOLOGY FORMULA TO DEVISE THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS
8 DETERMINATION THAT THE BAY AREA RECEIVES FROM THE STATE AMONG
9 EACH CITY TOWN AND COUNTY IN THE REGION. EACH LOCAL GOVERNMENT
10 WILL RECEIVE A TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS BY INCOME CATEGORIES FOR
11 ABAG AND UPDATE THE GENERAL PLAN TO SHOW HOW IT CAN
12 ACCOMMODATE THIS ALLOCATION. IT'S IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT THAT
13 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS CHOOSE THE SPECIFIC LOCATIONS WITHIN THEIR
14 COMMUNITIES THAT WILL BE ZONED FOR HOUSING. ABAG CONVENED AN
15 AD-HOC HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE TO ADVISE STAFF ON THE
16 METHODOLOGY. HMC WAS MADE UP OF LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIALS AND
17 STAFF REPRESENTING JURISDICTION IN EVERY COUNTY AND FACILITATE
18 FACILITATORS MEETING FROM OCTOBER 2019 TO SEPTEMBER 2020 AND
19 OVER THE PAST YEAR IDENTIFIED FIVE OBJECTIVES IDENTIFIED IN
20 HOUSING ELEMENT LAW AND CONSISTENT WITH FORECASTING PATTERN OF
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. STAFF'S RECOMMENDATIONS AND HMC'S
22 DECISIONS WERE GUIDED BY PERFORMANCE EVALUATION METRICS THAT
23 ASSESS HOW SUCCESSFULLY DIFFERENT METHODOLOGY OPTIONS ACHIEVE
24 STATUTORY OBJECTIVES. THESE METRICS WERE BASED PRIMARILY ON
25 HOW HCD HAS EVALUATED OTHER REGION'S METHODOLOGIES. MORE

October 15, 2020

1 INFORMATION ON THESE METRICS WILL BE PROVIDED LATER IN THE
2 PRESENTATION. AT ITS FINAL MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 18TH THE HMC
3 VOTED 27 TO 4 TO RECOMMEND THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FOR
4 ALLOCATING THE BAY AREA'S HOUSING NEEDS THROUGHOUT THE REGION
5 IN AN EQUITABLE MANNER. ON OCTOBER 1ST THE REGIONAL PLANNING
6 COMMITTEE VOTED 15 TO 8 TO RECOMMEND THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY
7 FOR APPROVAL BY THE EXECUTIVE BOARD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AFTER
8 SEVERAL MONTHS OF CONSIDERING FACTORS TO INCLUDE IN THE
9 METHODOLOGY, IN JUNE, THE HMC CAME TO CONSENSUS AROUND
10 RECOMMENDATIONS TO GUIDE SELECTION OF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY.
11 THESE GUIDING PRINCIPLES INCLUDED MORE HOUSING SHOULD GO TO
12 JURISDICTIONS WITH MORE JOBS THAN HOUSING, AND TO COMMUNITIES
13 EXHIBITING RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION. METHODOLOGY SHOULD
14 FOCUS ON EQUITY AS REPRESENTED BY HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS AND
15 THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN HOUSING AND JOBS. EQUITY FACTORS NEED
16 TO BE PART OF THE TOTAL ALLOCATION, NOT JUST THE ALLOCATION OF
17 UNITS BY INCOME CATEGORIES, AND ALLOCATIONS SHOULD NOT BE
18 LIMITED BASED ON PAST RHNA. AND LASTLY, HOUSING IN HIGH HAZARD
19 AREAS IS A MAJOR CONCERN BUT RHNA MAY NOT BE THE BEST TOOL TO
20 ADDRESS THE ISSUE. THESE PRINCIPLES GUIDED HMC'S DELIBERATIONS
21 DURING IT'S REMAINING FIVE MEETINGS AND ARE REFLECTED IN THE
22 PROPOSED METHODOLOGY RECOMMENDED BY HMC AND RPC. NEXT SLIDE
23 PLEASE. THERE ARE THREE PRIMARY COMPONENTS OF THE RHNA
24 METHODOLOGY. THE BASELINE ALLOCATION, THE INCOME ALLOCATION
25 APPROACH, AND THE FACTORS AND WEIGHTS. THE FIRST STEP IN

October 15, 2020

1 BUILDING A RHNA METHODOLOGY WAS SELECTING A BASELINE
2 ALLOCATION. BASELINE IS USED TO ASSIGN EACH JURISDICTION A
3 BEGINNING SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS. AT MEETING IN
4 JULY AND AUGUST, THE HMC CONSIDERED POTENTIAL OPTIONS FOR THE
5 BASELINE ALLOCATION. INCLUDING HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM PLANNED
6 BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT, AND EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. ALTHOUGH
7 THERE WAS SIGNIFICANT INTEREST IN INCORPORATING THE BLUEPRINT
8 INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY, THERE WAS CONCERN AMONG HMC MEMBERS
9 THAT THE BLUEPRINT'S EMPHASIS ON FOCUSED GROWTH, PARTICULARLY
10 IN THE SOUTH BAY, WAS INCONSISTENT WITH REQUIREMENTS FOR RHNA
11 TO DISTRIBUTE UNITS EQUALLY -- EQUITABLY THROUGHOUT THE
12 REGION. AT ITS AUGUST 13TH MEETING, THE HMC CONSIDERED FIVE
13 DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR THE BASELINE. COMMITTEE CHOSE NOT TO
14 MOVE FORWARD WITH GROWTH FROM THE BLUEPRINT, OR EXISTING
15 HOUSEHOLDS, AND INSTEAD CAME TO CONSENSUS AROUND USING 2050
16 HOUSEHOLDS FROM THE BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. WITH
17 THIS APPROACH, A JURISDICTION'S INITIAL SHARE OF THE REGIONAL
18 HOUSING NEED DETERMINATION IS BASED ON ITS SHARE OF THE
19 REGION'S TOTAL HOUSEHOLD IN THE YEAR 2050. USING HOUSEHOLD IN
20 2050 TAKES INTO CONSIDER THE NUMBER EVER HOUSEHOLDS THAT ARE
21 CURRENTLY LIVING IN A JURISDICTION, AS WELL AS THE NUMBER OF
22 HOUSEHOLDS EXPECTED TO BE ADDED OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL DECADES.
23 THE HMC PREFERRED USING HOUSEHOLD IN 2050 AS THE BASELINE
24 BECAUSE IT CAPTURES THE BENEFITS OF USING OF THE PLANNED BAY
25 AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT IN THE METHODOLOGY BUT ALSO PROVIDING

October 15, 2020

1 MIDDLE GROUNDS USING THE BASELINE BASED ON THE NUMBER OF
2 CURRENT HOUSEHOLDS AND BASELINE ON FORECASTED HOUSING GROWTH
3 FROM THE BLUEPRINT. THE SECOND STEP IN BUILDING THE RHNA
4 METHODOLOGY WAS SELECTED SELECTING AN APPROACH FOR ALLOCATING
5 UNITS BY INCOME. HMC CAME TO CONSENSUS AROUND USING THE
6 BOTTOM-UP APPROACH THE METHODOLOGY INCLUDES ONE SET OF FACTORS
7 AND WEIGHTS FOR VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME UNITS AND SECOND
8 FACTOR OF WEIGHTS FOR MODERATE AND ABOVE MODERATE UNITS.
9 ALLOCATION TO EACH JURISDICTION FROM TWO UNITS ARE ADDED
10 TOGETHER TO REACH THE TOTAL ALLOCATION BOTTOM-UP APPROACH
11 ALLOWS FOR FINE GRAINED CONTROL FOR ALLOCATIONS FOR A
12 PARTICULAR INCOME CATEGORY TARGETED APPROACH MEETS GOALS BY
13 ALLOWING LOW INCOME UNITS TO BE DIRECTED TOWARD AREAS OF
14 OPPORTUNITY. BOTTOM-UP APPROACH CAN ADDRESS CONCERNS ABOUT
15 DISPLACEMENT PRESSURES BY ALLOWING FOR LOWER ALLOCATIONS OF
16 MARKET RATE UNITS TO PERCENT OF HIGHER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS.
17 SELECTING FACTORS THAT ADDRESS A JURISDICTION'S BASELINE
18 ALLOCATION UP OR DOWN. THE TABLE AT THE BOTTOM OF THE SLIDE
19 SHOWS THE FACTORS AND WEIGHTS HMC SELECTED FOR THE PROPOSED
20 RHNA METHODOLOGY. EACH FACTOR REPRESENTS DATA RELATED TO THE
21 METHODOLOGY'S POLICY PRIORITY, ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY
22 AREAS, AND PROXIMITY TO JOBS. THE ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY
23 AREAS FACTOR IS BASED ON A JURISDICTION'S WITH THE HIGHER
24 PERCENTAGE OF HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN AREAS DESIGNATED HIGH
25 RESOURCE OR HIGHEST RESOURCE ON THE OPPORTUNITY MAP DEVELOPED

October 15, 2020

1 BY THE STATE. THE STATE EVALUATE THE CENSUS TRACKS USING
2 INDICATORS INCLUDING INCOME, EDUCATIONAL AND HEALTH OUTCOMES.
3 JOB PROXIMITY FACTORS IDENTIFY THE NUMBER OF JOBS THAT CAN BE
4 ACCESSED FROM A JURISDICTION BY A 30 MINUTE AUTO COMMUTE OR A
5 45 MINUTE TRANSIT COMMUTE. A FACTOR'S EFFECT ON A
6 JURISDICTION'S ALLOCATION DEPENDS ON HOW THE JURISDICTION
7 SCORES ON A FACTOR RELATIVE TO OTHER JURISDICTION IN THE
8 REGION. A JURISDICTION WITH AN ABOVE AVERAGE SCORE A FACTOR
9 WOULD GET AN UPWARDS ADJUSTMENT. WHEREAS THE CITY WITH A BELOW
10 AVERAGE SCORE A FACTOR WOULD GET A DOWNWARDS ADJUSTMENT
11 RELATIVE TO THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. THE PERCENTAGES IN THE
12 TABLE SHOW THE WEIGHTS ASSIGNED TO EACH FACTOR SELECTED FOR
13 THE DIFFERENT INCOME GROUPS. THE WEIGHT ASSIGNED TO EACH
14 FACTOR REPRESENTS THE FACTOR'S RELATIVE IMPORTANCE IN THE
15 OVERALL ALLOCATION. AS THE WEIGHT DETERMINES THE SHARE OF THE
16 REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS THAT WILL BE SIGNED BY THAT PARTICULAR
17 FACTOR. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS MENTIONED EARLIER, THE PROPOSED
18 RHNA METHODOLOGY USES YEAR 2050 HOUSEHOLD FROM THE PLANNED BAY
19 AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. THIS SLIDE
20 REVIEWS SOME OF THE BENEFITS THE AGENCY DISCUSSED ABOUT USING
21 PLANNED BAY AREA AS PART OF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. IMPORTANTLY,
22 INCORPORATING THE BLUEPRINT INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY WOULD
23 COMMUNICATE TO OUR LOCAL GOVERNMENT PARTNERS AND OTHER
24 STAKEHOLDERS THAT WE'RE MOVING TOWARD A UNIFIED VISION FOR THE
25 BAY AREA'S FUTURE. THE BLUEPRINT REFLECTS MULTIPLE HMC

October 15, 2020

1 PRIORITIES BY ADVANCING BOTH EQUITY AND SUSTAINABILITY
2 OUTCOMES FROM THE BAY AREA'S LONG-RANGE PLANNING EFFORTS THE
3 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IDENTIFIED IN THE BLUEPRINT HOUSEWIFE
4 OPPORTUNITIES IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS LOCATIONS CLOSE TO
5 EXISTING JOB CENTERS AND AREAS NEAR TRANSIT. THE GROWTH
6 GEOGRAPHIES IN THE BLUEPRINT ALSO EXCLUDE AREAS WITH HIGH
7 WILDFIRE RISK AND AREAS OUTSIDE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES. IN
8 ADDITION THE INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT PROPOSED IN THE
9 MUNICIPALITY WOULD PROTECT NEARLY ALL HOUSEHOLDS AT RISK OF
10 SEA LEVEL RISE. FOR THESE REASONS THE HMC CONCLUDED THAT THE
11 BLUEPRINT WAS MORE DIRECTLY SUITED TO ADDRESSING CONCERNS
12 ABOUT NATURAL HAZARDS THAN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY FACTOR WOULD
13 BE. USING THE 2050 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE PAIRED WITH EQUITY
14 FOCUSED FACTORS THAT HMC HAS PRIORITIZED WOULD ALLOW THE
15 REGION TO MOVE TOWARD EQUITABLE LAND USE PATTERN IN THE NEAR
16 TERM WHILE BUILDING POSITIVE RANGE OF OUTCOMES IN THE LONG-
17 TERM. THEREFORE THE YEAR 2050 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE RECOMMENDED
18 BY THE HMC RESULT IN AN ALLOCATION THAT REFLECTS THE
19 BLUEPRINT'S FOCUSED GROWTH PATTERN, WHILE THE ALLOCATION
20 FACTORS SELECTED BY THE HMC ADJUST THE BASELINE TO MEET THE
21 FAIR HOUSING AND EQUITY GOALS MANDATED BY STATE LAW. AS MATT
22 MENTIONED, IN SEPTEMBER, THIS BODY AND THE MTC COMMISSION
23 ADOPTED CHANGES TO KEY INPUTS INTO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
24 BLUEPRINT. SINCE THE BLUEPRINT IS PART OF THE RHNA
25 METHODOLOGY, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GROWTH PATTERN, WHICH IS

October 15, 2020

1 SLATED FOR RELEASE IN DECEMBER 2020, WILL EFFECT THE RHNA
2 ALLOCATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS GRAPHIC PROVIDES AN
3 OVERVIEW OF THE PROPOSED RHNA METHODOLOGY RECOMMENDED BY HMC
4 AND RPC, AT THE TOP YOU SEE 441 HOUSING UNITS THE STATE
5 IDENTIFIED FOR THE BAY AREA. IN STEP ONE YOU CAN SEE THAT THE
6 VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME UNITS HAVE BEEN GROUPED TOGETHER AND
7 THE MODERATE AND ABOVE MODERATE INCOME UNITS HAVE BEEN GROUPED
8 TOGETHER. STEP TWO SHOWS THE PROPOSED ALLOCATION FACTORS AND
9 WEIGHTS RECOMMENDED BY THE HMC. PROPOSED RHNA METHODOLOGY USES
10 ONE GROUP OF FACTORS AND WEIGHTS TO ALLOCATE VERY LOW AND LOW
11 INCOME UNITS WHILE ANOTHER SET OF FACTORS AND WEIGHTS
12 INDICATES ABOVE MODERATE AND MOT RAT INCOME UNITS. THE
13 RESULTING NUMBER OF UNITS ALLOCATED BY EACH FACTOR. THE THREE
14 FACTORS FOR ALLOCATING LOWER INCOME UNITS ARE 70 PERCENT
15 ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITIES AREAS. 15 PERCENT JOB PROXIMITY
16 AUTO WHICH ALLOCATES 27,000 UNITS AND 15 PERCENT JOBS
17 PROXIMITY TRANSIT WHICH ALLOCATES ANOTHER 27,000 UNITS. TWO
18 FACTORS USED TO ALLOCATE HIGHER INCOME UNITS ARE 40 PERCENT
19 ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, WHICH ALLOCATES ABOUT
20 104,000 UNITS, AND 60 PERCENT JOB PROXIMITY AUTO. WHICH
21 ALLOCATES AROUND 156,000 UNITS IN TOTAL THE ACCESS TO HIGH
22 OPPORTUNITY FACTORS ALLOCATES 52 PERCENT OF THE REGION'S RHNA.
23 WHILE FACTORS RELATED TO JOB PROXIMITY ALLOCATE 48 PERCENT OF
24 THE UNITS. IN STEP THREE OF THE METHODOLOGY EACH
25 JURISDICTION'S BASELINE ALLOCATION IS ADJUSTED BASED ON HOW IT

October 15, 2020

1 SCORES ON THE DIFFERENT ALLOCATION FACTORS. IF A JURISDICTION
2 HAS MORE ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY OR BETTER JOB PROXIMITY
3 RELATIVE TO THE REGION ITS ALLOCATION IS ADJUSTED UPWARD
4 OTHERWISE ITS ALLOCATION IS ADJUSTED DOWNWARD. THE UNITS THE
5 JURISDICTION RECEIVES FOR THE DIFFERENT INCOME GROUPS ARE
6 ADDED TOGETHER TO DETERMINE THE JURISDICTION'S TOTAL RHNA
7 ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS NOTED EARLIER, THE POTENTIAL
8 ALLOCATION SHOWN IN THE MATERIALS -- THERE ARE MANY MORE STEPS
9 IN THE PROCESS BEFORE REACHING FINAL ALLOCATION NEED TO BE
10 INCORPORATED INTO THE UPDATE. THE MAP ON THE LEFT REVIEWS GO
11 THE RATE THAT EACH REGION WOULD HAVE AS A RESULT OF THE
12 METHODOLOGY. THIS GROWTH IS BASED ON THE NUMBER OF
13 JURISDICTION'S HOUSEHOLD IN 2019. JURISDICTIONS WITH THE
14 DARKEST BROWN EXPERIENCE THE HIGHEST GROWTH RATES WHILE THOSE
15 IN THE LIGHT GRAY EXPERIENCE THE LOWEST GROWTH RATES. IN
16 GENERAL, THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE HIGHEST GROWTH RATES ARE
17 IN THE SOUTH BAY AND ALONG THE PENINSULA AND THOSE WITH THE
18 LOWEST GROWTH RATES ARE IN SONOMA A NAPA AND SOLANO COUNTY,
19 AND THE NORTHERN AND EASTERN PORTION OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY.
20 IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THE REGION AS A WHOLE WILL GROW BY 16
21 PERCENT AS A RESULTS OF THE ASSIGNED 2023 TO 2031 RHNA CYCLE
22 THEREFORE ANY JURISDICTION THAT RECEIVES LESS THAN 16 PERCENT
23 GROWTH RATE IS BEING ASKED TO TAKE ON LESS HOUSING THAN THE
24 REGIONAL AVERAGE. THE FACT THAT YOU SEE A LOT OF JURISDICTIONS
25 HIGHLIGHTED HERE SPEAKS TO THE OVERALL HIGHER HOUSING NEEDS

October 15, 2020

1 NUMBER OF 441,000 AND STATUTORY REQUIREMENT OF RHNA THAT ALL
2 COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION DO THEIR FAIR SHARE TOWARDS
3 MEETING THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS. THE MAP ON THE RIGHT SHOWS
4 THE POTENTIAL TOTAL ALLOCATION OF RHNA UNITS TO BAY AREA
5 JURISDICTIONS FOR THE RHNA CYCLE. JURISDICTIONS WITH A DARKEST
6 PURPLE RECEIVE THE LARGEST TOTAL ALLOCATIONS WHILE THOSE IN
7 THE LIGHT GRAY RECEIVE SMALLER ALLOCATIONS OF RHNA UNITS.
8 DISTRIBUTION OF RHNA IS FAIRLY CONCENTRATED WITH THE THREE
9 LARGEST CITIES RECEIVING BY FAR THE LARGEST ALLOCATIONS
10 ACCOUNTING FOR MORE THAN 1/3 OF ALL RHNA UNITS. THE 25
11 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE HIGHEST RHNA ALLOCATIONS FROM THE
12 PROPOSED METHODOLOGY WOULD ACCOUNT FOR 72 PERCENT OF ALL RHNA
13 UNITS. OUTSIDE OF THE THREE LARGEST CITIES, THE LARGEST RHNA
14 ALLOCATIONS ARE MOSTLY FOUND IN SILICON VALLEY, WHERE THERE IS
15 BOTH PROXIMITY TO MAJOR EMPLOYMENT CENTERS AND HIGH ACCESS TO
16 OPPORTUNITY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS TABLE SHOWS HOW THE RHNA
17 UNITS ARE DISTRIBUTED BY COUNTY. THE NUMBERS IN THE FIRST
18 COLUMN REPRESENT THE SUM OF THE AL CASING FOR ALL OF THE
19 JURISDICTION IN EACH COUNTY. AND THE SECOND COLUMN YOU CAN SEE
20 EACH COUNTY'S SHARE OF RHNA UNITS BASED ON THE PROPOSED
21 METHODOLOGY. YOU CAN COMPARE HOW THE SHARE OF RHNA UNITS FOR
22 EACH COUNTY COMPARES TO THE SHARE OF RHNA UNITS IN THE LAST
23 CYCLE IN THE MIDDLE COLUMN SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS AND
24 SHARE OF EXISTING JOBS. SAN FRANCISCO IN JURISDICTION IN
25 MARIN, SAT MAN AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY WOULD RECEIVE A LARGER

October 15, 2020

1 SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS THAN THEY DID IN THE 2015
2 TO 2023 RHNA CYCLE. JURISDICTION IN ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA
3 COUNTY RECEIVE A SMALLER SHARE OF THE RHNA FROM THE PROPOSED
4 METHODOLOGY THAN THEY DID FROM THE CYCLE FIVE METHODOLOGY.
5 WHILE THE SHARE OF ALLOCATIONS TO JURISDICTION IN SONOMA AND
6 NAPA COUNTY REMAINS UNCHANGED. WHEN COMPARING THE SHARE OF
7 RHNA UNITS FROM THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY TO THE COUNTY'S SHARE
8 OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS, ONLY SAN FRANCISCO AND JURISDICTIONS
9 IN SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA RECEIVE A LARGER SHARE OF THE
10 REGION'S RHNA COMPARED TO THEIR CURRENT SHARE OF THE REGION'S
11 HOUSEHOLDS. WHEN LOOKING AT JOBS, ONLY SANTA CLARA AND SAN
12 MATEO COUNTY ARE BEING ASKED TO TAKE ON A SHARE OF RHNA UNITS
13 THAT IS LARGER THAN THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING JOBS. THE
14 ALLOCATION FROM THE PROPOSED RHNA METHODOLOGY RECOMMENDED BY
15 THE HMC AND RPC WOULD RESULT IN JURISDICTIONS IN SANTA CLARA
16 COUNTY RECEIVING 33 PERCENT OF THEIR RHNA COMPARED TO ITS
17 SHARE OF EXISTING JOBS OF 27 PERCENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS
18 SLIDE SUMMARIZES SOME OF THE KEY TOPICS DISCUSSED BY THE HMC
19 AS ITS MEETING PRIOR TO THE PROPOSE THE METHODOLOGY. HMC
20 DECIDED NOT IT MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROPOSED EQUITY
21 ADJUSTMENT PROPOSED BY SEVERAL HMC MEMBERS THIS WOULD HAVE
22 PROPOSED A FLOOR TO THE VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME UNITS ASSIGNED
23 TO 49 JURISDICTIONS THAT WERE IDENTIFIED AS EXHIBITING ABOVE
24 AVERAGE RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION. HMC CONCLUDED THAT THE
25 PROPOSAL ADDED TO THE METHODOLOGY WITH ONLY MINIMAL IMPACTS ON

October 15, 2020

1 THE RESULTING ALLOCATIONS. HMC REVISITED THE QUESTION OF USING
2 A JURISDICTION'S EXISTING SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS IN 2019 AS THE
3 BASELINE ALLOCATION INSTEAD OF 2050 HOUSEHOLDS FROM THE
4 BLUEPRINT. HOWEVER THERE WAS BROAD AGREEMENT THAT
5 INCORPORATING A BLUEPRINT OF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY WAS
6 IMPORTANT TO ENSURE THE RHNA THIS ALLOCATION WHILE EQUITABLE
7 AND SUSTAINABILITY IDENTIFIED PARTICULARLY THOSE RELATED TO
8 GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS. WHILE A HANDFUL OF HMC
9 MEMBERS SUGGESTED USING GROWTH AS I BASELINE MOST COMMITTEE
10 MEMBERS REITERATED THAT USING 2050 HOUSEHOLDS REPRESENTS A
11 COMPROMISE BETWEEN USING 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AS THE BASELINE AND
12 USING THE FORECASTED GROWTH AS THE BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE.
13 AS NOTED PREVIOUSLY INCLUDING THE BLUEPRINT IN THE RHNA
14 METHODOLOGY ALSO ADDRESSES CONCERNS ABOUT NATURAL HAZARDS.
15 WHILE THERE IS UNDERSTANDABLY CONSIDERABLE CONCERN AMONG
16 COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABOUT ENSURING BAY AREA COMMUNITIES GROW IN
17 WAYS THAT WILL MIN MUSE NATURAL HAZARD, HMC MEMBERS DID NOT
18 SUPPORT ADDING A NATURAL HAZARD TO THE METHODOLOGY.
19 APPROPRIATE PLACES FOR PLANNING IN HOUSING FOR LESS RISK FROM
20 WILDFIRES AND OTHER HAZARDS WHILE UPDATING HOUSING ELEMENTS OF
21 THE PLANS. EXCESSING CONCERNS THAT THE REMAINING OPTIONS UNDER
22 DISCUSSION DID NOT GIVE WEIGHT TO FACTORS AND DID NOT ALIGN
23 WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THIS LEAD TO A REQUEST TO REVISIT
24 AN EARLIER OPTION THAT REDUCED THE INFLUENCE TO ACCESS TO HIGH
25 OPPORTUNITIES FACTOR AND INSTEAD FOCUSED ON JOBS RELATED

October 15, 2020

1 FACTORS PARTICULARLY JOB PROXIMITY. OTHER HMC MEMBERS POINTED
2 OUT THE FORECASTED PATTERN IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
3 BLUEPRINT ALREADY EMPHASIZED GROWTH NEAR JOB CENTERS AND
4 TRANSIT LOCATIONS THIS NEEDS TO BE BALANCE SAID ENSURING THAT
5 EVERY COMMUNITY IN THE BAY AREA RECEIVES ITS FAIR SHARE OF
6 HOUSING NEEDS AS REQUIRED BY RHNA. THESE COMMITTEE MEMBERS
7 NOTED THERE ARE HOUSING AND JOBS THROUGHOUT THE REGION BEING
8 HELP ENABLE SHORTER COMMUTES AND REDUCE GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS.
9 HMC MOVED FORWARD WITH PROPOSE THE METHODOLOGY AS A
10 COMPROMISED OPTION THAT RETAINS EMPHASIS ON ALLOCATING UNITS -
11 - [INDISCERNIBLE] WHILE ALSO FOCUSING ON ALLOCATING UNITS WITH
12 THE MOST ACCESS TO THE REGION'S JOBS. AS PROPOSED THE RHNA
13 METHODOLOGY ALLOCATES 40 PERCENT OF ALL UNITS BASED ON FACTORS
14 RELATED TO JOB PROXIMITY AND THE 25 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE
15 LARGEST ALLOCATIONS RECEIVE 72 PERCENT OF ALL RHNA UNITS
16 SUGGESTING THAT THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY DOES NOT RESULT IN
17 FIRST GROWTH PATTERN. AS I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE HMC MEMBERS
18 CONSISTENTLY RAISED CONCERNS ABOUT THE HIGH RATE OF GROWTH IN
19 SOME AREAS WOULD EXPERIENCE FROM PROPOSE SAID ALLOCATIONS
20 DRIVEN IN PART BY THE NUMBER OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLD IN
21 UNINCORPORATED COUNTY AREAS. SINCE THE NUMBER OF EXISTING
22 HOUSEHOLDS IS CAPTURED IN THE 2050 BASELINE. WHICH MAKES THE
23 MOST -- OCCURRING IN CITY. SMALL SHARE OF GROWTH IN
24 UNINCORPORATED AREAS IS FORECASTED IN AREAS THAT ARE CURRENTLY
25 UNINCORPORATED COUNTY LANDS, BUT HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO BE

October 15, 2020

1 ANNEXED IN THE FUTURE. ABAG MTC STAFF HAS ENGAGED IN DIALOGUE
2 WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT STAFF IN COUNTIES THAT HAVE EXPRESSED
3 CONCERN ABOUT THE POTENTIAL RHNA ALLOCATIONS TO UNINCORPORATED
4 COUNTIES TO PROPOSE THE GROWTH ASSIGNED TO THE SPHERE OF
5 INFLUENCE IN THE PLAN ASSIGNED THE RESPECTIVE CITY'S RHNA
6 ALLOCATIONS RATHER THAN THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTIES. ABAG MTC
7 STAFF IS WORKING WITH HCD TO ENSURE PROPOSED CHANGE IN HOW
8 RESPONSIBILITY IS SHARED AMONG CITIES AND UNINCORPORATED
9 COUNTIES WOULD STILL FURTHER THE RHNA OBJECTIVE. ABAG STAFF IS
10 CONTINUING THESE CONVERSATIONS ARE DESPITE THE LACK OF
11 CONSENSUS BETWEEN CITIES AND COUNTIES AT THIS TIME. IF
12 AFFECTED JURISDICTIONS COULD COME TO AN AGREEMENTS CHANGES
13 COULD BE IMPLEMENTED IN OF THE METHODOLOGY IN THE COMING YEAR.
14 HOUSING ELEMENT LAW INCLUDES A PROVISION THAT ALLOWS A COUNTY
15 TO TRANSFER A PORTION OF ITS RHNA ALLOCATION TO A CITY IF LAND
16 IS ANNEXED AFTER IT RECEIVES ITS RHNA THIS ALLOCATION FROM
17 ABAG. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS NOTED PREVIOUSLY HOUSE METHODOLOGY
18 IS CONSISTENT WITH THE FORECASTED DEVELOPMENT PATTERN FROM
19 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STAFF IDENTIFIED DETERMINING CONSISTENCY
20 BETWEEN RHNA AND THE PLAN IS BASED ON A COMPARISON OF THE
21 EIGHT YEAR RHNA HOUSING GROWTH AND THE 30 YEAR PLANNED BAY
22 AREA HOUSING GROWTH. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GROWTH PROJECTIONS
23 ARE IDENTIFIED AT COUNTY AND SUBCOUNTY LEVEL. SINCE THE RHNA
24 ALLOCATIONS ARE JURISDICTIONAL LEVEL THEY HAVE ENABLED
25 COMPARISON WITH THE PLAN PROJECTIONS. IF THE EIGHT YEAR GROWTH

October 15, 2020

1 FROM RHNA DOES NOT EXCEED THE 30 YEAR GROWTH AT THE COUNTY OR
2 SUBCOUNTY LEVEL THEN RHNA IN THE PLAN WILL BE FOUND TO BE
3 CONSISTENT. STAFF EVALUATED THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY USING
4 THIS APPROACH AND DETERMINED THERE ARE NO CONSISTENCY ISSUES.
5 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HOUSING ELEMENT LAW ALSO REQUIRES THAT THE
6 RHNA METHODOLOGY MEET FIVE STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND STAFF USED
7 THE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION METRICS MENTIONED EARLIER TO ASSESS
8 HOW WELL THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY ADDRESSES THESE REQUIRED
9 OBJECTIVES. THE METRICS ARE STRUCTURED AS A COMPARISON BETWEEN
10 THE ALLOCATIONS OF TOP JURISDICTIONS FOR A PARTICULAR
11 CHARACTERISTIC SUCH AS YOUR JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST
12 EXPENSIVE HOUSING COST AND ALLOCATIONS WITH JURISDICTIONS IN
13 THE REGION. PROVIDING A GRAPH SHOWING PERFORMANCE EVALUATION
14 RESULTS FOR ALL METRICS RELATED TO THE FIVE OBJECTIVES.
15 OBJECTIVE ONE IS ABOUT INCREASING THE HOUSING SUPPLY AND THE
16 MIX OF HOUSING TYPES IN AN EQUITABLE MANNER. THE METRICS FOCUS
17 ON THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST EXPENSIVE HOUSING COST. THE
18 CHART ON THE LEFT FOR METRIC 1A ONE SHOWS THE PERCENT OF RHNA
19 OF LOW INCOME UNITS THAT THESE JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE COMPARED
20 TO THE PERCENT THAT THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE
21 REGION RECEIVE. THE CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS WHETHER OR NOT
22 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF RHNA UNITS THAT AT
23 LEAST PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. A
24 PROPORTIONAL ALLOCATION MEANS THAT A CITY WITH FIVE PERCENT OF
25 THE REGION'S HOUSEHOLDS WOULD ALSO RECEIVE FIVE PERCENT OF THE

October 15, 2020

1 REGION'S RHNA. THE RESULT SUGGESTS THAT THE PROPOSED
2 METHODOLOGIES FURTHERS OBJECTIVE ONE. THE METHODOLOGY ASSIGNS
3 HIGHER PERCENTAGE OF LOW INCOME UNITS ARE. -- GREATER NEED OF
4 REGION'S JURISDICTION OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE
5 PLEASE. OBJECTIVE TWO FOCUSING ON PROMOTING INFILL DEVELOPMENT
6 OFFICIAL DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS AND GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS
7 REDUCTIONS. THERE ARE THREE METRICS FOR THIS OBJECTIVE, AND
8 THEY ALL MEASURE THE AVERAGE GROWTH RATE JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE
9 FROM THE DIFFERENCE METHODOLOGY OPTIONS. ON THE LEFT METRIC
10 TWO A LOOKS AT A JURISDICTION WITH THE LARGEST SHARE OF THE
11 REGION'S JOBS. IN THE MIDDLE, METRICS TWO B LOOKS AT THE
12 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST LAND IN PRIORITY AREAS. ON THE
13 RIGHT LOOKS AT JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LOWEST VEHICLE MILES
14 TRAVELED. THE RESULT OF THE METRICS SUGGEST THE PROPOSED
15 METHODOLOGY PREFERS OBJECTIVE TWO ACROSS ALL THREE METRICS THE
16 GROUP OF TOP 25 JURISDICTIONS CONSISTENTLY EXPERIENCE HIGHER
17 GROWTH RATES THAN THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION.
18 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OBJECTIVE THREE IS ABOUT PROMOTING A BETTER
19 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING. PARTICULARLY AN
20 IMPROVED JOBS/HOUSING FIT. THE CONCEPT OF JOBS/HOUSING FIT IS
21 BASED ON THE RATIO BETWEEN LOW WAGE JOBS AND HOUSING UNITS
22 AFFORDABLE TO LOW-WAGE WORKERS OBJECTIVE THREE FOCUS ON MOST
23 UNBALANCED JOBS/HOUSING FIT. PLACES WHERE THERE ARE THE MOST
24 LOW WAGE JOBS PER UNIT AFFORDABLE TO LOW WAGE WORKERS. THE
25 CHARGE ON THE LEFT FOR METRIC 3A ONE SHOWS THE PERCENTAGE OF

October 15, 2020

1 LOW INCOME UNITS THAT THESE JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE COMPARED TO
2 THE PERCENT THAT THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION
3 RECEIVE. THE CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS WHETHER OR NOT THESE
4 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF RHNA UNITS THAT IS
5 PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. THE
6 RESULTS INDICATE THAT THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FURTHERS
7 OBJECTIVE THREE AS THE 25 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST
8 IMBALANCED JOBS/HOUSING FIT RECEIVE A HIGHER SHARE OF THEIR
9 RHNA AS LOWER INCOME UNITS COMPARED TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS.
10 FURTHERMORE, THE ALLOCATION SIGNS THESE JURISDICTIONS A SHARE
11 OF THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS THAT IS MORE THAN 20 PERCENT
12 GREATER THAN THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE
13 PLEASE. OBJECTIVE FOUR IS ABOUT ALLOCATING A LOWER SHARE EVER
14 RHNA UNIT IN AN INCOME CATEGORY WHEN A JURISDICTION ALREADY
15 HAS A DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGH SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD IN THAT SAME
16 CATEGORY. METRIC FOR OBJECTIVE FOUR MEASURES WHETHER A
17 JURISDICTION WITH THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE EVER HIGH INCOME
18 HOUSEHOLDS RECEIVE A LARGER SHARE OF THE RHNA AS LOW INCOME
19 UNITS COMPARED TO THE JURISDICTIONS WITH HIGHER INCOME
20 HOUSEHOLDS. THE RESULTS INDICATE THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY
21 FURTHERS OBJECTIVE FOUR AS JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LARGEST
22 PERCENTAGE EVER HIGH INCOME RESIDENTS RECEIVE A LARGER SHARE
23 OF THEIR RHNA AS LOWER INCOME UNITS AND MOST
24 DISPROPORTIONATELY LOW INCOME JURISDICTION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
25 OBJECTIVE FIVE IS ABOUT AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING.

October 15, 2020

1 THERE ARE FOUR METRICS FOR THIS OBJECTIVE THAT FOCUS ON THE
2 ALLOCATIONS TO THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST ACCESS TO
3 RESOURCES. THOSE EXHIBITING THE MOST RACIAL AND ECONOMIC
4 EXCLUSION, AND THOSE WITH DISPROPORTIONATE SHARES OF HIGH
5 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. THE FIRST SET OF METRICS RELATED TO
6 OBJECTIVE FIVE FOCUSES ON JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LARGEST
7 PERCENTAGE OF HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, AS
8 DEFINED BY THE STATE. THE CHART ON THE LEFT SHOWS THE PERCENT
9 OF RHNA AS LOW INCOME UNITS COMPARED TO THE REST JURISDICTIONS
10 RECEIVE. THE CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS WHETHER OR NOT
11 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE ALLOCATION OF UNITS THAT IS PROPORTION
12 AT TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. PROPOSED RHNA
13 METHODOLOGY PERFORMS STRONGLY ON THESE METRICS AS
14 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY RECEIVE A
15 SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE RHNA AS LOW INCOME -- LOW INCOME
16 UNITS RECEIVING ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE NEARLY 15 PERCENT LARGER
17 THAN THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
18 METRIC 5B FOCUSES ON JURISDICTIONS THAT EXHIBIT RACIAL AND
19 ECONOMIC EXCLUSION WHICH DEFINES JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE BOTH
20 ABOVE AVERAGE DIVERGENCE INDEX SCORES AND ABOVE AVERAGE
21 PERCENTAGES EVER HOUSEHOLDS ABOVE 20 PERCENT OF THE AREA
22 MEDIAN INCOME. STAFF IS USING THE DIVERGENT INDEX THROUGHOUT
23 THE PROCESS TO FURTHER PREVENT RACIAL SEGREGATION. THE MORE A
24 JURISDICTION'S DEMOGRAPHICS DIVERGE FROM THE REGION'S
25 DISTRIBUTION THE HIGHER INDEX SCORE. A HIGH SCORE DOES NOT

October 15, 2020

1 NECESSARILY INDICATE THE REGION IS RACIALLY HOMOGENOUS ONLY
2 THE DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE DIFFERS FROM THE DEMOGRAPHICS. IN
3 TERMS OF DIVERGENCE INDEX SCORE AND SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS.
4 MEASURES WHETHER THESE 31 JURISDICTIONS -- HOUSEHOLDS. THE
5 METHODOLOGY PERFORMS WELL IN THIS METRIC WITH JURISDICTIONS
6 EXHIBITING RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION RECEIVING TOTAL
7 ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE 11 PERCENT GREATER THAN THEIR SHARE OF
8 THE REGION'S HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE METRICS FOR 5D
9 FOCUS ON THE JURISDICTIONS IDENTIFIED USING HMC COMPOSED
10 COMPOSITE SCORE FOR REGIONS ABOVE AVERAGE FOCUSING ON
11 JURISDICTIONS EXHIBITING RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXECUTION TAKING
12 ON THE SHARE OF TOTAL UNITS METRICS PROPOSED BY HMC MEMBERS
13 MEASURES WHETHER JURISDICTIONS DEMONSTRATING EXCLUSION RACIAL
14 -- TAKE ON LOW INCOME UNITS. THE CHART DEMONSTRATES THE
15 GEOGRAPHIES THAT EXPERIENCE -- THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY
16 PERFORMS WELL IN THIS METRIC AND ASSIGNS EACH JURISDICTION A
17 SHARE OF UNITS THAT ARE NEARLY 20 PERCENT GREATER THAN THE
18 SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSEHOLDS. THE CHART ON THE RIGHT FOR
19 METRIC 5D TWO SHOWS AMONG THE 49 RECEIVES AN ALLOCATION OF
20 RHNA UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO ITS SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS.
21 THE METHODOLOGY PERFORMANCE WELL ON THIS METRIC WITH 65
22 PERCENT OF THE 49 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVING LOWER INCOME
23 ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE AT LEAST PROPORTIONAL TO THE
24 JURISDICTION'S SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE
25 PLEASE. IN SUMMARY, THE PERFORMANCE METRICS DEMONSTRATES THAT

October 15, 2020

1 THE PROPOSED RHNA METHODOLOGY RESULT IN ALLOCATIONS THAT
2 ADVANCE THE STATUTORY RHNA OBJECTIVE. WITH THE PROPOSED
3 METHODOLOGY, MORE HOUSING AND ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE UNITS GOES
4 TO JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST EXPENSIVE HOUSING COST, THE
5 LARGER SHARES OF THE REGION'S JOBS, THE LARGER SHARES OF LAND
6 NEAR TRANSIT, THE LOWER VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, THE MOST
7 IMBALANCED JOBS/HOUSING FIT, THE LARGEST HIGH INCOME RESIDENTS
8 LARGEST ACCESS OPPORTUNITY AND HIGHEST LEVELS OF RACIAL
9 ECONOMIC EXCLUSION. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO
10 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN.

11

12 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH GILLIAN FOR THE
13 PRESENTATION. COLLEAGUES I'M GOING TO SUGGEST THAT WE DO
14 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS AT THIS TIME ON THE STAFF PRESENTATION
15 BEFORE WE GO TO THE OTHER PRESENTATIONS. SO, ARE THERE ANY
16 QUESTIONS FROM EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS ON THE PRESENTATION? OR
17 THE STAFF REPORT? AT THIS TIME? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND.
18 DIRECTOR GIBBONS THEN DIRECTOR MACKENZIE.

19

20 **LIZ GIBBONS:** I DID STUDY THIS MATERIAL. GILLIAN IT WAS A
21 LITTLE HARD TO HEAR YOU. I DON'T UNDERSTAND THE GRAPHICS OF
22 YOUR LAST SUPPORTING LAST FIVE. COULD YOU PULL UP ONE OF THE
23 GRAPHICS, AND I UNDERSTAND THE INTENT OF WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO
24 DESCRIBE, BUT THE GRAPHIC, ARE THE SOLID LINES, I'M --

25

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR GIBBONS ARE YOU TALKING
2 ABOUT THE ANALYSIS.

3

4 **LIZ GIBBONS:** THE LAST FIVE POINTS WITH THE DARK COLORED LINES,
5 THE BARS.

6

7 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** SURE. COULD WE PULL UP THE SLIDES AGAIN? GO
8 BACK ONE SLIDE. STOP HERE. ANYWHERE. BACK ONE. OKAY.

9

10 **LIZ GIBBONS:** I THINK WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO EXPRESS IS THAT YOU
11 -- THAT YOU'RE -- I DON'T MEAN TO USE THE WORD, NOT MEANING TO
12 BE DISRESPECTFUL, MANIPULATING THE ALLOCATION BASED ON DATA
13 THAT, IF A CERTAIN LOCAL DOESN'T HAVE ENOUGH LOW INCOME
14 HOUSING, IT NEEDS TO INCREASE ITS LOW INCOME HOUSING SO IT'S
15 GETTING A DISPROPORTIONATELY INCREASED AMOUNT OF LOW INCOME
16 HOUSING. IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO EXPLAIN? YOUR NUMBER
17 ALONG THE BOTTOM DOESN'T MAKE SENSE TO ME AND WE DON'T HAVE
18 ANY VERTICAL GRAPH. SO I JUST DON'T GET WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO
19 EXPRESS AND WHAT IT'S ACTUALLY SAYING.

20

21 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** LET ME TAKE A STEP BACK. WHAT THIS IS LOOKING
22 AT IS NOT -- THESE ARE REPRESENTING -- OR MEASURING SORT OF
23 THE OUTCOMES OF THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. OKAY. SO THIS IS NOT
24 CHANGING ANYTHING ABOUT THE METHODOLOGY. BUT WHAT IT'S LOOKING
25 AT FOR THIS ONE, WE'RE LOOKING AT A SELECT GROUP OF

October 15, 2020

1 JURISDICTIONS, SO THAT'S THE TOP BAR. OKAY. SO THESE ARE THE I
2 THINK THIS IS THE 31 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN MEASURED TO
3 BE THE MOST DISPROPORTIONATELY INCOMES. COMPARED TO THE REST
4 OF THE REGION.

5

6 **LIZ GIBBONS:** IF I MAY, IT DOESN'T SAY THAT ON THE SLIDE, SO
7 THAT WOULD -- GOING FORWARD IT WOULD HELP TO BE MORE
8 DESCRIPTIVE.

9

10 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** OKAY. YEAH. SO WE TRIED TO DESCRIBE THE SORT OF
11 QUESTION THAT THESE METRICS IS ANSWERING IN THE TEXT ABOVE THE
12 GRAPH WHERE IT SAYS DO THE MOST DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGHER
13 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE PROPORTION AT.
14 THAT'S WHERE WE'RE TRYING TO INDICATE WHAT IS THE TYPE OF
15 JURISDICTION OR WHAT IS THE CHARACTERISTIC THAT WE'RE LOOKING
16 AT AND FOR EACH OF THESE IT'S SORT OF A COMPARISON OF SORT OF
17 TOP JURISDICTIONS ON THAT CHARACTERISTIC COMPARED TO THE REST
18 OF THE REGION. AND WHAT WE'RE HOPING TO SEE, WITH A
19 METHODOLOGY IS THAT THE ALLOCATIONS ARE GOING MORE TOWARD OF
20 THE SELECT JURISDICTIONS, WHATEVER THAT CHARACTERISTIC MIGHT
21 BE, COMPARED TO THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION.
22 AND SO IN THIS CASE, WE'RE LOOKING AT, DO THE RESULTS
23 ALLOCATIONS MEET A PROPORTIONALITY THRESHOLD. AND THIS DOTTED
24 LINE THAT YOU CAN SEE HERE AT ONE POINT, IF IT WAS
25 PROPORTIONAL THEN IT WOULD BE AT THAT ONE -- AT THAT DOTTED

October 15, 2020

1 LINE, THE FACT THAT THE BAR FOR THE SELECT JURISDICTIONS GOES
2 PAST THAT DOTTED LINE, OUT TO ABOUT, I THINK THAT LOOKS LIKE
3 125 PERCENT, MEANS THAT IT'S MORE THAN PROPORTIONAL FOR THOSE
4 JURISDICTIONS. AND THAT'S THE RESULT THAT WE WERE HOPING TO
5 SEE WITH THE METRICS IN TERMS OF EVALUATING WHETHER OR NOT THE
6 PROPOSED METHODOLOGY IS ACHIEVING THIS OBJECTIVE OF
7 AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING.

8

9 **LIZ GIBBONS:** SO THIS IS MEANT TO SHOW AN END RESULT?

10

11 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IT'S EVALUATING THE END RESULT YES.

12

13 **LIZ GIBBONS:** OKAY. YEAH. SO, I CAN CHAT WITH YOU LATER ABOUT
14 IT. YOUR EXPLANATION HELPS A LITTLE BIT. BUT I WOULD OFFER
15 THAT THE GRAPHICS DON'T DO YOU JUSTICE TO WHAT YOU'RE TRYING
16 TO EXPRESS.

17

18 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THE FEEDBACK.

19

20 **LIZ GIBBONS:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR MACKENZIE?

23

24 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES. EARLIER ON IN THE DISCUSSION ABOUT
25 PLANNED BAY AREA AND ITS RELATIONSHIP TO HCD AND THE RHNA

October 15, 2020

1 NUMBERS, YOU TALKED ABOUT URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND LET ME
2 BE VERY STRAIGHT FORWARD HERE. SONOMA COUNTY, THE NINE CITIES,
3 EIGHT HAVE JUST RENEWED THEIR URBAN VOTER APPROVED URBAN
4 GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND THE CITY OF SONOMA HAS THAT FINAL ONE ON
5 THE BALLOT IN LESS THAN I KNOW MONTH'S TIME, AND AT THE SAME
6 TIME, THE COUNTY OF SONOMA HAS VOTER APPROVED COMMUNITY
7 SEPARATORS AROUND MOST OF THESE JURISDICTIONS. UNDER A VOTER
8 APPROVED URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARY, THE CITY CANNOT PROVIDE
9 SERVICES OUTSIDE THAT URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARY TO THESE
10 UNINCORPORATED AREAS, AND WE HAVE A TEST CASE OF THAT IN
11 ROHNERT PARK. SO I'M REALLY MYSTIFIED I WOULD SAY ABOUT SOME
12 OF THE NUMBERS THAT HAVE EMERGED FROM THIS PROCESS. AND THE
13 OTHER THING IS, I'M CURIOUS -- AND MAYBE HCD DOESN'T RECOGNIZE
14 THE EXISTENCE OF VOTER APPROVED URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND
15 COMMUNITY SEPARATORS, AND THE SECOND POINT I WANT TO MAKE AND
16 THIS IS PAROCHIAL, WE'RE UPDATING OUR GENERAL PLAN IN ROHNERT
17 PARK, WE'RE ANTICIPATING ABOUT OVER THE PERIODS OF THE EIGHT
18 YEAR RHNA CYCLE, THAT WE WILL BE BUILDING ABOUT THREE TIMES
19 THE NUMBER OF HOUSING UNITS THAT ARE ALLOCATED TO US IN THE
20 PROPOSAL AND SO OUR GENERAL PLANS LOOKED AT, AT ALL IN TERMS
21 OF WHAT IS PROPOSED. WE ACTUALLY DO BUILD HOUSE IN ROHNERT
22 PARK. SO I'M JUST CURIOUS ABOUT THESE ANONYMOUS LOUSE
23 SITUATIONS THAT I OBSERVE. >DAVE VAUTIN: BOARD MEMBER
24 MACKENZIE THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE REGIONAL PLANNING TEAM.
25 I WANT TO ADDRESS A COUPLE OF POINTS RELATED TO WHAT YOU JUST

October 15, 2020

1 MENTIONED. FIRST OF ALL, WE DO INTEGRATE LOCAL LAND USE PLANS
2 INTO PLAN 2050, WHICH HAS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TONIGHT HAS A
3 NEXUS WITH THE RHNA PROCESS. WE ACTUALLY WENT THROUGH A NUMBER
4 OF MONTHS OF WORK IN 2019, SEEKING UPDATED DATA FROM
5 JURISDICTIONS ACROSS THE REGION, AND INTEGRATING THAT INTO OUR
6 MODELING. THE SECOND KEY POINT HERE IS THAT THE RHNA
7 METHODOLOGY BEFORE YOU TODAY REFLECTS THE BASELINE OF 2050
8 HOUSEHOLDS FOR EACH JURISDICTION. AND SO WHILE WE'RE WORKING
9 TO LIMIT THE AMOUNT OF GROWTH IN UNINCORPORATED AREAS,
10 INCLUDING IN SONOMA COUNTY, THOSE EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS REMAIN,
11 AND THOSE ARE PLAYING A ROLE IN THE ALLOCATION OF RHNA TO THE
12 UNINCORPORATED AREAS, RECOGNIZING THAT CONCERN WE HAVE BEEN
13 WORKING WITH SEVERAL COUNTIES ACROSS THE REGION WHO HAVE
14 CONCERNS ABOUT THE HIGHER COUNTY ALLOCATIONS OF RHNA THAN IN
15 PAST CYCLES, TO DO WHAT'S CALLED A SPHERE OF INFLUENCE
16 ADJUSTMENT TO SHIFT SOME OF THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS FROM THE
17 COUNTY TO THE CITIES. THE DIALOGUE HAS INCLUDED SONOMA COUNTY
18 AND THE CITIES WITHIN T WE HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO REACH A
19 CONSENSUS BETWEEN THE COUNTY AND THE CITIES ON THESE
20 ADJUSTMENTS, BUT AS GILLIAN MENTIONED IN HER PRESENTATION, WE
21 CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE COUNTY AND CITIES IN SONOMA SANTA
22 CLARA AND SOLANO, AND SHOULD THEY REACH CONSENSUS WE WOULD BE
23 MORE THAN HAPPY TO INTEGRATE THAT INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY
24 LATER THIS YEAR.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** OKAY. I HEAR YOU.

2

3 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. DIRECTOR LEE.

4

5 **WAYNE LEE:** THANK YOU MR. PRESIDENT. ON SLIDE 11 I HEARD YOU

6 SAY YOU'RE TRYING TO BALANCE THE HIGH VALUE MARKET RATE

7 HOUSING WITH MORE LOWER RATE HOUSING. FIRST OF ALL, DID I HEAR

8 THAT CORRECTLY? AND SECOND OF ALL, DOES THAT MEAN THAT THE LOW

9 INCOME HOUSING IS STILL A LOT MORE EXPENSIVE THAN REGIONS

10 WHERE THE HOUSING IS CHEAPER?

11

12 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** I'M SORRY, COULD YOU REPEAT THAT? I DO NOT

13 THINK I QUITE UNDERSTOOD THE QUESTION.

14

15 **WAYNE LEE:** FIRST OF ALL I WANT TO VERIFY, ON SLIDE 11.

16

17 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** COULD WE PULL UP SLIDE 11, PLEASE?

18

19 **WAYNE LEE:** OKAY. YOU SAID SOMEBODY ABOUT YOU'RE TRYING TO

20 REQUIRE PLACES THAT WHICH HOUSING IS MORE EXPENSIVE BY

21 REQUIRING MORE LOW INCOME HOUSING, IS THAT CORRECT? DID I HEAR

22 THAT CORRECTLY?

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** YEAH, SO THIS AGAIN IS A METRIC EVALUATING

25 WHETHER THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS ARE ACHIEVING THAT OUTCOME.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **WAYNE LEE:** SO RELATIVE TO HOUSING COST IN THE HIGHER AREAS
3 WHERE HOUSING IS MORE EXPENSIVE, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT LOWER
4 HOUSING CRISIS. IS THAT RELATIVE TO THE WHOLE BAY AREA OR
5 JUSTICE -- JUST RELATIVE TO THAT PARTICULAR CITY WHERE HOUSING
6 IS MORE EXPENSIVE.

7

8 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IN TERMS OF EVALUATING THE TOP 25 JURISDICTIONS
9 THESE ARE THE TOP REGION WIDE. THAT'S NOT SPECIFIC TO A
10 COUNTY.

11

12 **WAYNE LEE:** I'M NOT ASKING THE QUESTION CORRECTLY. SO WHAT I'M
13 TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IS IF YOU SAY YOU'RE GOING TO REQUIRE
14 THAT THERE ARE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN PLACES WHERE THE
15 HOUSING IS VERY EXPENSIVE, IF YOU REQUIRE -- IS THAT HOUSING
16 GOING TO BE WEIGHTED IN CONSIDERATION OF THE PRICES OF THE
17 HOUSES THAT ARE BEING BUILT THERE? FOR INSTANCE, IF YOU BUILT
18 A HOUSE IN HILLSBOROUGH, VERSUS EAST PALO ALTO -- OH NO --
19 ANTIOCH, OKAY, SO AN EXPENSIVE HOUSE WOULD BE RELEVANT. RIGHT?
20 SO IF YOU BUILT A HOUSING IN HILLSBOROUGH, YOU WANT TO BUILD
21 LOW INCOME HOUSING IS THAT GOING TO BE A \$5 MILLION, \$10
22 MILLION HOME OR IS THAT GOING TO BE A \$300,000 HOME?

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IF I'M UNDERSTANDING YOUR QUESTION CORRECTLY,
25 WHEN A JURISDICTION RECEIVES AN ALLOCATION OF RHNA UNITS IT'S

October 15, 2020

1 BROKEN UP INTO THE FOUR INCOME CATEGORIES AND THE FOUR INCOME
2 CATEGORIES ARE DEFINED AS A PERCENTAGE OF THE AREA MEDIAN
3 INCOME IN THAT CASE WHEN A JURISDICTION IS SORT OF FIGURING
4 OUT HOW TO ACCOUNT FOR THESE UNITS IN TERMS OF MEETING THEIR
5 RHNA OBLIGATIONS, THEY'RE LOOKING AT WHETHER SORT OF COST,
6 EITHER THE PRICE OF OWNERSHIP OR THE RENT IS AFFORDABLE TO A
7 HOUSEHOLD IN A PARTICULAR SHARE OF AREA MEDIAN INCOME. IN THAT
8 CASE THE AREA IS COUNTY SPECIFIC.

9

10 **WAYNE LEE:** IF YOU'RE MAKING \$10 MILLION A YEAR A LOW INCOME
11 HOUSE MIGHT BE \$3,000 WHEREAS IN ANOTHER AREA IT MIGHT BE
12 100,000. IT'S PARTICULAR TO THE AREA. THANK YOU.

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** IMMEDIATE PAST PRESENT RABBIT.

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST OFF, GILLIAN, THANK
17 YOU, AND MATT, THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK AND EVERYONE THAT
18 HAS BEEN INVOLVED. I KNOW THIS IS A REFRESHING LEAN TASK EACH
19 AND EVERY EIGHT YEAR AND THE TIME IT TAKES. JUST A FOLLOW UP
20 ON WHAT DIRECTOR MACKENZIE SAID ABOUT SONOMA COUNTY. YOU KNOW,
21 I KNOW THAT IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA, WE FEEL IF WE CAN DEAL
22 WITH THE SPHERE OF INFLUENCE AND ASSIGN SOME OF THOSE UNITS
23 WITH OUR BROTHER AND SISTER CITIES THAT WE CAN BE OKAY AS LONG
24 AS WE CAN ALSO WORK ON SOME OF THE AREA ISSUES THAT I KNOW WAS
25 MENTIONED WITH THE URBAN SIM PIECE. BUT WE HAVE THIS CITY

October 15, 2020

1 CENTERED GROWTH AND THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE FOR GROWTH FROM THE
2 LAST CYCLE, I MEAN, THE COUNTY IS LOOKING AT 919 PERCENT
3 INCREASE OVER THE LAST CYCLE, AND THE LARGEST CYCLE, THE
4 LARGEST INCREASE WITHIN A CITY IS MAYBE 250 PERCENT STILL
5 SIZABLE BUT NOT TO THE SAME DEGREE THAT THE UNINCORPORATED
6 COUNTIES ARE. IN OUR COUNTY LIKE DIRECTOR MACKENZIE SAID, THE
7 IMPORTANCE IS TRYING TO CONCENTRATE THAT GROWTH WITHIN THE
8 CITIES WHERE THE SERVICES ARE. WE HAVE VERY FEW AREAS WITHIN
9 THE UNINCORPORATED AREA WHERE WE CAN PUT GROWTH LIKE THAT. AND
10 IT'S NOT LIKE WE'RE NOT TRYING TO PUT HOUSING IN, BELIEVE ME.
11 I THINK WE'RE MAYBE A LITTLE UNUSUAL IN THAT REGARD DUE TO THE
12 LOSS OF HOUSES TO FIRE GOING ON. AND TO THAT END TOO, I KNOW
13 THAT YOU MENTIONED THAT THE METHODOLOGY DID NOT HAZARD
14 REDUCTION. I MEAN THERE IS -- OBVIOUSLY OUR COUNTY HAS A LOT
15 OF HAZARDS. WE FOUND THIS OUT AFTER THE LAST FOUR YEARS NOW
16 AND RUNNING GOING FORWARD. NATURE HAS GIVEN US THOSE HAZARDS
17 AND WE HAVE NOTHING TO DO BUT TO ADDRESS THOSE AND TRY TO
18 FIGURE THAT OUT WHETHER IT'S THE WILD LANDS FIRE PATHS,
19 FLOODING, CLIMATE CHANGE, ADAPTATION ISSUES TO SEA LEVEL RISE
20 AND WHAT NOT, COMING FORWARD. SO I HOPE THAT ALSO CAN BE
21 FACTORED INTO THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING TO MAKE SURE THAT
22 WE'RE REALLY, THE HOUSING PIECE IS IN LINE WITH OUR GREENHOUSE
23 GAS REDUCTION PIECE. BECAUSE, AGAIN, AN INCREASE OF THAT MANY
24 HOUSING UNITS IN UNINCORPORATED COUNTIES IS ONLY GOING TO
25 INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND NOT NECESSARILY BE PUTTING

October 15, 2020

1 THOSE HOMES WHERE THEY SHOULD BE WHERE ALL THE SERVICES ARE.
2 SO, I APPRECIATE THE WORK. I DO HAVE IN CONCERN IN THAT WAY. I
3 LOOK FORWARD TO MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN BE SUCCESSFUL WITH THE
4 SPHERE OF INFLUENCE DISCUSSIONS BECAUSE I THINK FOR OUR COUNTY
5 THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY KEY GOING FORWARD.

6

7 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER CLARIFYING
8 QUESTIONS FROM EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS? IF SO PLEASE RAISE
9 YOUR HAND. WE'LL HAVE A MEMBER SUBSTANTIVE DISCUSSION
10 OBVIOUSLY AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED
11 HANDS. NOW GOING TO TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO DIRECTOR PIERCE,
12 AND THE CONTRA COSTA CITIES ASSOCIATION. WE'LL HAVE TEN
13 MINUTES TO PRESENT THEIR ALTERNATIVE, AND MAYOR PIERCE, WHO
14 WILL BE PRESENTING? I BELIEVE IT'S BEEN PROVIDED TO THE TECH
15 AT THIS TIME.

16

17 **JULIE PIERCE:** THE SLIDE SHOW HAS BEEN PRESENTED TO TECHNICAL
18 STAFF. WE HAVE MATT RODRIGUEZ CITY MANAGER OF THE CITY OF SAN
19 PABLO, ACCOMPANIED BY TAI WILLIAMS, ASSISTANT MANAGER OF THE
20 TOWN OF DANVILLE WE HAVE BASELINE WHETHER WE USE 2050 GROWTH
21 AND 2050 HOUSEHOLD AND STAFF WILL GIVE THAT OVERVIEW NOW. I
22 SEE TAI WILLIAMS. BUT I TO NOT SEE --

23

24 **JULIE PIERCE:** MATT WAS THERE A MOMENT AGO.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** THERE HE IS.

2

3 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SHOULD WE QUEUE
4 UP THE SLIDE DECK?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES PLEASE.

7

8 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. AND THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS OF THE
11 EXECUTIVE BOARD. CAN EVERYONE HEAR ME?

12

13 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** SO MY NAME IS MATT RODRIGUEZ AS INTRODUCED BY MAYOR
16 PIERCE. WE ARE REPRESENTING THE CONTRA COSTA MAYOR'S
17 CONFERENCE INCORPORATING ALL 19 CITIES WHO SHARE A GOAL WITH
18 ALL OF YOU TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING NEED. FIRST AND FOREMOST THE
19 CONTRA COSTA SUBREGION UNDERSTANDS THE PROCESS AND WE
20 UNDERSTAND THE DIRE NEED FOR ADDITIONAL HOUSING PRODUCTION IN
21 THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS NO DISAGREEMENT ON THE
22 REASONS WHY HOWEVER WE DO RESPECTFULLY DISAGREE IN OUR
23 PERSPECTIVE ABOUT HOW TO BEST ALLOCATE THE 441,000 HOUSING
24 UNITS IN THE NEXT RHNA CYCLE SIX. THEREFORE WE WOULD LIKE TO
25 PRESENT AN ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVE WHICH WILL RESULT IN

October 15, 2020

1 HOUSING PRODUCTION FOR THE ENTIRE REGION AND TWO DOESN'T
2 SACRIFICE OUR GOAL OF MEETING SB 375. WE END THIS HASN'T BEEN
3 A TRADITIONAL PROCESS TO DEVELOP A METHODOLOGY THAT WORKS FOR
4 ALL JURISDICTIONS AND WHICH FITS ALL THE NEEDS IN THE REGION
5 AND WE CERTAINLY DON'T WANT TO DOUBT THE HARD WORK COMPLETED
6 TO DATE FROM RMC AND STAFF IN DEVELOPING RHNA METHODOLOGY
7 RECOMMENDATION THEREFORE WE APPRECIATE YOUR TIME DURING ALL
8 PERSPECTIVE DURING AN EXTRAORDINARY YEAR WHERE COVID-19 HAS
9 AFFECTED ALL OF US DRASTICALLY WITH STATE ECONOMIC VIABILITY
10 RECOVERY. INCLUDING NOTING THAT TWO THIRDS OF THE THOUGHTFUL
11 RHNA METHODOLOGY PROCESS LEFT HMC JUST THREE MEANS TO CONSIDER
12 MANY OPTION IN VERY LITTLE TIME TO VET THE VAST UNINTENDED
13 CONSEQUENCES OF OPTIONS. RECENTLY UNVEILED ON A RELATIVELY
14 SHORT TIME FRAME TO THE ENTIRE BAY AREA REGION SINCE AUGUST
15 2020. NEXT SLIDE. OPTION 8A. I WOULD LIKE TO START WITH
16 ANALYSIS WHICH CONCLUDED OPTION 8A IS NOT A MIDDLE ROAD NOR A
17 COMPROMISE OPTION 8A USES THE PLANNED BAY AREA FEATURE
18 HOUSEHOLDS BASED ON METHODOLOGY AND FOR WHATEVER THE REASON
19 THIS BASELINE METHODOLOGY ASSIGNS A STARTLING DRASTIC NUMBER
20 OF HOUSING UNITS TO SMALL AND RURAL COMMUNITIES IN THE FARTHER
21 REACHES OF THE BAY AREA SUBREGION. NEXT SLIDE. AT A MACRO
22 LEVEL WE CAN SEE THE CLEAR IMPACT OF USING THE PPA2050 FUTURE
23 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE IN ALLURE OF PLANNED BAY AREA BASELINE. IT
24 APPEARS THAT THE PBA2050 FUTURE HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE SWITCHES
25 BENEFITS FROM TWO COUNTIES AT THE EXPENSE OF ALL OTHERS IN THE

October 15, 2020

1 REGION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS PARTICULARLY CONCERNING TO US. AS
2 WE KNOW THAT THE CASA COMPACT DISCUSSIONS THAT THESE ARE THE
3 SAME COUNTIES THAT HAVE THE LARGEST HOUSING DEFICITS OVER THE
4 PAST DECADE AS ILLUSTRATED BY THIS GRAPH. NEXT SLIDE. AT A
5 SUBREGIONAL LEVEL, THE ANALYSIS SHOWS THAT IT'S THE BASELINE
6 METHODOLOGY THAT DRIVES THE INEXPLICABLE HOUSING IN THE
7 COMMUNITIES. ONE LOOKS SUFFICIENT LAND CAPACITY BECAUSE
8 THEY'RE LAND LOCKED OR BUILT OUT OR CONFINED BY VOTER APPROVED
9 URBAN GROWTH LINE LIMITS. OPTION TWO HIGH WAGE JOB CENTERS AND
10 THREE LACK OF ROBUST TRANSIT SYSTEM. THIS IS ILLUSTRATED HERE
11 ON SOME OF THOSE IMPACTS TO THOSE SMALLER COMMUNITIES. FOR
12 THESE COMMUNITIES OPTION 8A ISN'T A COMPROMISE AT ALL. MANY OF
13 THE SURROUNDING SUBREGIONS ARE CONCERNED THEY'RE SET UP TO
14 FAIL UNDER THIS OPTION 8A. SINCE MANY OF THE PROPOSED HOUSING
15 ALLOCATIONS WILL NOT RESULT IN NATURAL HOUSING PRODUCTION
16 BECAUSE OF THE [INDISCERNIBLE] FACTORS. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE
17 ONSET OUR INTENTION IS NOT TO ENGAGE IN A DENSELY SHIFTING
18 MAPPING OR METRICS EXERCISE, RATHER OUR CONCERNS IN CONTRA
19 COSTA SUBREGION AS WELL AS OTHER POTENTIAL SUBREGIONS CONCERNS
20 THAT MAY BE REPRESENTED HERE TODAY IS TO PROPOSE A MODIFIED
21 OPTION EIGHT ALTERNATIVE GROUNDED IN LAND USE AND
22 TRANSPORTATION PRINCIPLES THAT TAKE A DEEPER DIVE INTO A
23 NUMBER OF THESE ACCUMULATIVE FACTORS. NEXT SLIDE. OUR PROPOSAL
24 ALSO STRIVES TO ENSURE POLICY CONSISTENCY WE PLANNED BAY AREA
25 2050 BLUEPRINT. WHICH APPROPRIATELY FORECASTS A COMMENSURATE

October 15, 2020

1 AMOUNT OF HOUSING UNITS TO GO ALONG WITH THE JOBS PROJECTED IN
2 THE SOUTH BAY OVER THE NEXT PERIOD. OPTION 8A WOULD ALLOCATE
3 32 PERCENT WHERE MODIFIED OPTION WOULD ALLOCATE 44 PERCENT
4 MASK OF THE FUTURE JOB GROWTH IN THE REGION MAKING UP FOR THE
5 HOUSING DEFICIT WE SAW OVER THE PAST DECADE. NEXT SLIDE.
6 CONTRA COSTA'S OVERARCHING OBJECTIVES ARE TO SUSTAIN AND
7 UPHOLD OUR EFFORT TO REDUCE URBAN SPRAWL AND THE REGION'S MEGA
8 COMMUTES AVERAGING 3 TO 4 HOURS A DAY AND REPRESENTED HERE ON
9 THE MAP OF BAY AREA TRAFFIC COMMUTE FLOWS AS WELL AS TACKLE
10 AND MITIGATE THE ENVIRONMENTAL DAMAGE CAUSED BY THOSE
11 REPRESENTED IN THE ORANGE DESTINATION LINES ON THIS GRAPHIC.
12 NEXT SLIDE. SO WHILE WE BELIEVE THAT THE HMC RECOMMENDED
13 OPTION 8A IS A GOOD START, WE DON'T BELIEVE -- TO ADDRESS THE
14 FOLLOWING ISSUES WHICH HAVE BEEN EXPRESSED IN PREVIOUS AGENCY
15 DISCUSSIONS. AND MAY RESONATE WITH A NUMBER OF SUBREGIONs AS
16 FOLLOWS INCREASE HOUSING SUPPLY WHERE THE JOB CENTERS ARE
17 LOCATED PROMOTE INFILL DEVELOPMENT ON GENE FIELDS ON THE URBAN
18 EDGES. BRIDGE THE HOUSING DEFICIT WITH MUCH LESS THE HOUSING
19 NEED IN THE SOUTH AND WEST BAY OR ENSURE WE DON'T GENERATE OR
20 EXASPERATE THE RED TRAFFIC COMMUTES ON THIS MAP THAT WILL PUT
21 A FULL STOP TO MANDATE OUR GAG REDUCTION TARGETS. OPTION 8A
22 CAN GO EITHER FURTHER IN ACHIEVING IN JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE AND
23 IT DOES INITIATE A GOOD STARTING POINT WHEN MEANING POLICY
24 DIALOGUE AMONG ALL POLICY REPRESENTATIVES ON THE ABAG
25 EXECUTIVE BOARD TO CONSIDER THESE ACCUMULATIVE IMPACTS IN

October 15, 2020

1 ATTAINING ACTUAL HOUSING PRODUCTION IN A MORE EQUITABLE
2 MANNER. IN CLOSING I WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE THE SALIENT
3 COMMENTS IN THE LETTER DATED IT OCTOBER 2ND, 2020 TO ABAG
4 WHICH STRESSES THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF YOU 8A AS THE
5 ONLY SOLUTION AND PERHAPS CONSIDER ADJUSTING OR MODIFYING
6 THESE RECOMMENDATIONS TO ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES SHARED MANY
7 HERE ON THIS EXECUTIVE BOARD REGARDING FACTORS THAT MAKE MORE
8 INTUITIVE SENSE TO MAINTAIN REALISTIC HOUSING PRODUCTION FOR
9 COMMUNITIES AND IN THE ENTIRE REGION AS OUTLINED IN THE
10 SLIDES. INCREASING HOUSING SUPPLY BUT IN A MANNER THAT MEETS
11 HOUSING NEEDS NEAR JOB CENTERS, PROMOTES DEVELOPMENT THEREFORE
12 PROPOSING SOCIO-ECONOMIC, AND PROTECTS THE ENVIRONMENT AND
13 WILDLAND HAZARD AREAS BY MOVING AWAY FROM THE URBAN EDGES.
14 HELPS PROTECT SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA AND HELP ACHIEVE MANDATED
15 GOVERNMENT HG REDUCTION TARGETS THROUGH AN IMPROVED
16 JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE AND LASTLY IT ENSURES POLICY CONSISTENCY
17 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT BUT MORE CLOSELY ALIGN
18 THE HOUSING ASSIGNMENT AT THE JOB CENTERS. I KNOW OUR
19 COLLEAGUES AROUND THE REGION BELIEVE CONTRA COSTA MAY NOT GO
20 FAR ENOUGH TO ACHIEVE THE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND WE KNOW
21 THAT. WE WANT TO ADDRESS -- OCTOBER 2020 CORRESPONDENCE URGING
22 THE BODY TO TAKE THE APPROPRIATE TIME TO EVALUATE THE
23 UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF OPTION 8A RECOMMENDATION AND
24 PERHAPS CONSIDER ADJUSTING FACTORS TO ACHIEVE THAT
25 JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE. THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION. AND WE

October 15, 2020

1 THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE
2 BOARD GRANTING US OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK TO THE
3 PROCESS AND CONTRIBUTE TO THE DISCUSSION BEFORE YOU THIS
4 EVENING.

5

6 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. RODRIGUEZ.
7 THERE MAY BE QUESTIONS LATER ON THIS DISCUSSION. SO IF YOU
8 COULD STAY ON, AND I KNOW TAI WILLIAMS, AS WELL, AND WE DID
9 RECEIVE THE PRESENTATIONS COMMUNICATION IN OUR PACKET. SO
10 THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING TONIGHT. I'M NOW GOING TO CALL ON
11 CARLOS ROMERO. VICE MAYOR OF THE CITY OF EAST PALO ALTO, AND
12 NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS. WHO ARE GOING TO PRESENT FOR TEN MINUTES
13 ON OPTION SIX A EQUITY ADJUSTMENT FACTOR.

14

15 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN. I WILL PRESENT
16 INTRODUCTORY MARKS THEN PASS IT ON TO CHAIR ROMERO. WE DO
17 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF OPTION 6A
18 WITH THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. AS MANY OF YOU HAVE ALREADY
19 DISCUSSED, THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE ENGAGED IN THIS
20 COMPLEX TASK, CRAFTING AN EQUITABLE HOLISTIC AND DATA-DRIVEN
21 METHODOLOGY FOR OVER A YEAR. OPTION 6A WITH EQUITY ADJUSTMENT
22 WAS A CLOSE RUNNER UP IN HMC'S FINAL VOTE IS RECEIVED THE SAME
23 RIGOROUS ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION AS THE HMC'S FINAL
24 RECOMMENDATION. IT REFLECTS THE THOUGHTFUL WORK OF STAFF AND
25 STAKEHOLDERS WHICH SPANNED OVER 12 MONTHS. AT THE HOUSING

October 15, 2020

1 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE'S FINAL MEETING ABAG STAFF RECOMMENDED
2 OPTION SIX A BECAUSE IT PERFORMS BEST ON THE RHNA STATUTORY
3 REQUIREMENTS, INCLUDING THE LEGAL DUTY TO AFFIRMATIVELY
4 FURTHER FAIR HOUSING WHICH MEANS TO COMBAT RACIAL SEGREGATION
5 AS WELL AS TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS AND BRING HOMES
6 CLOSER TO JOBS. THIS PROPOSAL EXCELS ON ALL OF THOSE METRICS.
7 OPTION SIX A IS SIMILAR TO AND INCLUDES MANY OF THE SAME
8 ELEMENTS OF PROPOSAL 8A. HMC IDENTIFIED THESE ELEMENTS AS
9 ESSENTIAL TO AN EFFECTIVE AND EQUITABLE RHNA METHODOLOGY.
10 FIRST, IT USES PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLDS AS A BASELINE.
11 THIS BASELINE ENSURES CONSISTENCY WITH PLANNED BAY AREA ALONG
12 WITH MEETING THE OTHER LEGALLY REQUIRED OBJECTIVES OF THE RHNA
13 PROCESS. INCLUDING JOBS/HOUSING FIT, AND AFFIRMATIVELY
14 FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. THIS BASELINE ALSO AVOIDS AN
15 OVERRELIANCE ON EXISTING LAND USE PATTERNS WHICH REDUCE ACCESS
16 AND OPPORTUNITY TO EVERYONE ACROSS THE REGION. SECOND, ITS
17 FACTORS ARE BASED ON ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY AND JOBS. THESE
18 EXPAND HOUSING CHOICE ACROSS THE REGION AND ENSURE THAT ALL
19 KINDS EVER JOBS ARE CLOSE TO OUR HOMES. THIS SUPPORTS ECONOMIC
20 OPPORTUNITY, REDUCES GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND MITIGATES
21 CLIMATE CHANGE. BY USING JOBS PROXIMITY AUTO AND JOBS/HOUSING
22 FIT AS THE JOB RELATED FACTORS WE REDUCE EVERYONE'S COMMUTES
23 INCLUDING SERVICE JOBS THAT MAKE OUR RESTAURANTS AND TOURIST
24 DESTINATIONS THRIVE AND EVEN SMALL BUSINESS STRUGGLE BECAUSE
25 EMPLOYEES CAN NO LONGER LIVE CLOSE TO THEIR JOBS OR CLOSE TO

October 15, 2020

1 THE BAY AREA AT ALL. I'M PROUD TO SPEAK TO OPTION SIX A WITH
2 EQUITY ADJUSTMENT THIS EVENING BECAUSE IT GOES FURTHER THAN
3 OPTION 8A IN AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. EVALUATION
4 AND CRITERIA HERE, ONE IMPORTANT WAY THIS OPTION GOES FURTHER
5 IS THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. THIS ADJUSTMENT ENSURES THAT
6 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE HISTORICALLY EXCLUDED AFFORDABLE HOMES
7 RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF LOW AND VERY LOW INCOME HOUSING THAT
8 IS AT LEAST PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF THE REGIONS'
9 HOUSEHOLDS. A FAIR SHARE. WITHOUT THE ADJUSTMENT WE RUN THE
10 RISK OF PERPETUATING EXISTING SEGREGATION PATTERNS. THIS
11 METHODOLOGY WILL MOVE US FORWARD IN THE BAY AREA, WE ALL WISH
12 TO HAVE. AT OUR LAST EXECUTIVE BOARD WE AGREED TO ENDORSE PROP
13 16 TO INCREASE DIVERSITY IN WORKPLACES HIGHER EDUCATION AND
14 GOVERNMENT CONTRACTS TO ENSURE EVERYONE HAS TRUE ACCESS TO
15 OPPORTUNITY, WE NEED TO INCREASE DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION IN
16 OUR NEIGHBORHOODS TOO. THE WHOLE COUNTRY LOOKS TO OUR REGION
17 AS ONE OF THE MOST DIVERSE REGIONS IN THE U.S. YET WE'RE STILL
18 MORE RACIALLY SEGREGATED TODAY THAN WE WERE IN 1970. THIS
19 PROPOSAL WILL HELP US LIVE UP TO OUR REPUTATION AS BEING AN
20 INCLUSIVE PLACE WHERE EVERY FAMILY CAN THRIVE AND CHOOSE TO
21 LIVE ON CURRENT PREFERENCES NOT ON CURRENT RACIAL PATTERNS OF
22 SEGREGATION. I'M NOW GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO DIRECTOR ROMERO
23 WHAT PARTICIPATED IN THE HMC AND IS THE VICE CHAIR OF ABAG
24 REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE. THANK YOU.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY
2 MUCH. MEMBERS OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. I WANT TO FIRST
3 APOLOGIZE THAT WE DON'T HAVE A POWERPOINT FOR THIS
4 PRESENTATION. WE ONLY FOUND OUT TODAY THAT WE WERE ACTUALLY
5 GOING TO BE ALLOWED TO MAKE THE PRESENTATION, GRACIOUSLY BY A
6 CHAIR MAYOR ARREGUIN. I ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WE ARE
7 ONLY HERE TODAY COMPOUNDING AND AT THIS POINT ADVOCATE FOR
8 THIS MORE EQUITABLE AND REASONABLE SOLUTION. BECAUSE THERE WAS
9 ANOTHER OPTION THAT WAS PUT FORWARD, OUTSIDE OF THE RHNA
10 PROCESS. HAD IT NOT BEEN FOR THAT. WE WOULD NOT BE HERE. BUT
11 THE DOOR OPENED FOR US FOR WHAT I BELIEVE, AND WHAT I STAFF TO
12 BELIEVE ORIGINALLY TO BE THE OPTIMAL OPTION. SO HERE WE ARE
13 TODAY. LET ME MAKE IT CLEAR THAT WE NEED A RHNA THAT WILL MOVE
14 US TOWARD A FUTURE WHERE WE ALL HAVE A SAFE AND HEALTHY PLACE
15 TO LIVE, WHERE EVERYONE ACROSS THE REGION HAS ACCESS TO
16 OPPORTUNITY. I ASK THAT YOU AS THE BOARD TODAY ADOPT 6A WHICH
17 IS A MODIFIED OPPORTUNITY EMPHASIS AREA USING THE 2050
18 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE AND THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT THAT WE PROPOSE.
19 WE FEEL THAT OTHER OPTIONS DISCUSSED TODAY ARE NOT LIKELY TO
20 COMPLY WITH THE RHNA LEGAL REQUIREMENTS AND THAT IS CRUCIAL.
21 IN PARTICULAR AS IT PERTAINS TO THE APPROPRIATE BASELINE,
22 VITALLY IMPORTANT FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF UNITS. THE 2050
23 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE BALANCES CONSISTENCY WITH THE PLANNED BAY
24 AREA WHILE ENSURING THAT WE MEET RHNA'S LEGAL REQUIREMENTS. IT
25 IS THE MIDDLE GROUND COMPROMISE AMONG THE HMC. LET'S MAKE THAT

October 15, 2020

1 CLEAR. UNDER OUR PROPOSAL, TO SIX A, THE THREE BIG CITIES GET
2 OVER 1/336 PERCENT OF THE REJECT'S TOTAL RHNA, THE 25 LARGEST
3 JURISDICTIONS WILL GET TWO THIRDS, 66 PERCENT. WE INDEED ARE
4 SHARING THE PAIN. UNDER SIX A SPECIFICALLY, WE PUT STRONG
5 EMPHASIS ON HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, PLUS JOB PROXIMITY AS THE
6 BEST WAY TO MEET RHNA'S LEGAL REQUIREMENTS AND PLAN FOR THE
7 BAY AREA WHERE BAY AREA RESIDENTS CAN LIVE CLOSE TO THEIR
8 JOBS, AND PLACES WITH RESOURCES TO THRIVE. STAFF HAS FOUND, AS
9 PREVIOUSLY SAID, THAT 6A WAS THE BEST OPTION TO MEET THE
10 RHNA'S LEGAL REQUIREMENTS BY ADDING HOUSING CLOSE TO JOBS
11 MITIGATING CLIMATE CHANGE AND ALLOCATING FAIR SHARE OF HOMES
12 ESPECIALLY HOMES THAT ARE AFFORDABLE TO OUR VERY ESSENTIAL
13 WORKERS TO RACIALLY AND ECONOMICALLY JURISDICTIONS WHICH IS
14 REQUIRED IN THE RHNA LEGISLATION. RHNA AGAIN IS LEGALLY BOUND,
15 LEGALLY BOUND US TO SO. THERE IS A NEW REQUIREMENT TO COMBAT
16 RACIAL SEGREGATION AND IN LARGE PART WE'RE DOING THIS BECAUSE
17 PAST RHNA AS FAILED. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT EQUITY. EVERY CITY OR
18 COUNTY MEETS THEIR SHARE OF LOW INCOME RHNA THIS HELPS
19 SEGREGATE LIVING PATTERNS SO BAY AREA RESIDENTS CAN CHOOSE
20 WHERE TO LIVE BASED ON NEEDS AND PREFERENCES NOT THEIR RACIAL
21 AND ECONOMIC BACKGROUND. IT ENSURES THAT EVERY EXCLUSIVE CITY
22 OR COUNTY RECEIVES A SHARE OF VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME UNITS
23 THAT IS PROPORTIONAL TO THE SHARE OF REGION'S TOTAL. A 81/3 OF
24 THE JURISDICTION FALLS SHORT UNDER SIX A. HOUSEHOLD ONLY ONE
25 QUARTER OF THE JURISDICTIONS FALL SHORT. THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT

October 15, 2020

1 CLEARLY FILLS THE GAP. ABAG POINTED THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY
2 COMMITTEE TO INCUR A DIVERSE SET OF LOCAL OFFICIALS COUNTY AND
3 CITY APPOINTED MEMBERS COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS WHICH MET EVERY
4 MONTH FOR A WHOLE YEAR AND BOY DO I KNOW WE DID. WE DROVE DEEP
5 INTO THESE TECHNICAL DETAILS AND SPENT COUNTLESS HOURS GOING
6 BACK AND FORTH, FINDING A COMPROMISED POSITION. THAT IS WHAT
7 YOU HAVE. WE BELIEVE SIX A IS THAT POSITION. AND, AGAIN, WE
8 THINK THAT IT SHOULD BE APPROVED. BUT DERAILING THE PROCESS
9 ITSELF, WE THINK IS NOT EQUITABLE. I REMIND EVERYONE HMC
10 NARROWED ALL OPTIONS DOWN TO THREE AT THE LAST MEETING 6A WAS
11 THE PREFERRED OPTION 6A BECAME THE RUNNER UP 8A WAS
12 RECOMMENDED.

13
14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** VICE MAYOR ROMERO TIME IS UP.

15
16 **CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE V. CHAIR:** LET ME JUST
17 SAY, FOR ALL OF THE REASONS, I URGE THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
18 ADOPT OPTION 6A WITH THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. THANK YOU VERY
19 MUCH MAYOR ARREGUIN FOR LETTING ME GO OVER A FEW SECONDS.

20
21 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. LAST PRESENTATION. STAFF'S
22 DONE ANALYSIS OF ALL THREE OPTIONS AND THEY'RE GOING TO
23 PRESENT THAT AND I'LL ASK IF GILLIAN CAN DO THAT AS QUICKLY AS
24 POSSIBLE.

October 15, 2020

1 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** I'LL DO MY BEST. PULL UP THE SLIDES PLEASE AND
2 NO TO SLIDE NUMBER 22. OKAY. AS PRESIDENT ARREGUIN MENTIONED,
3 STAFF -- TO EVALUATE THE OUTCOMES. THESE MAPS SHOW SIMILAR TO
4 THE ONES THEY SHOWED BEFORE. THEY SHOW THE TOTAL ALLOCATION A
5 JURISDICTION WOULD RECEIVE FROM A DIFFERENT METHODOLOGY
6 OPTION. PROPOSED METHODOLOGY IS SHOWN ON THE LEFT. THE 2015 TO
7 2050 GROWTH BLUEPRINT BASELINE WAS OPTION 8A FACTORS AND
8 WEIGHTS CONTRA COSTA IDEA IS THE ONE IN THE MIDDLE. AND OPTION
9 6A WITH THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT IS THE ONE ON THE RIGHT.
10 JURISDICTIONS AGAIN WITH THE DARKEST PURPLE RECEIVE THE
11 LARGEST ALLOCATION IN ALL THREE OPTIONS YOU CAN SEE THE
12 DISTRIBUTION OF RHNA IS FAIRLY CONCENTRATED WITH THE THREE
13 LARGEST CITIES RECEIVING THE LARGEST ALLOCATIONS. THE MAP IN
14 THE MIDDLE SHOWS THAT USING HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM THE
15 BLUEPRINT SHOWS CONCENTRATION OF UNIT IN SILICON VALLEY. MORE
16 DETAILED MAP SHOWING THE JURISDICTION ALLOCATIONS FOR THE
17 PROPOSED METHODOLOGY ARE IN YOUR PACKET IN APPENDIX ONE AND
18 THOSE FOR ALTERNATE PROPOSALS ARE IN PACKET FIVE IF YOU WANT
19 TO LOOK MORE CLOSELY. NEXT SLIDE. THESE MAPS AGAIN ILLUSTRATE
20 THE POTENTIAL GROWTH RATE THAT EACH JURISDICTION WOULD RECEIVE
21 AS A RESULT OF THE ALLOCATIONS FROM THE DIFFERENT METHODOLOGY
22 OPTIONS. AGAIN, THIS IS COMPARED TO EXISTING HOUSEHOLD IN
23 2019. THE JURISDICTIONS WILL THE DARKEST COLORS WOULD RECEIVE
24 THE HIGHEST GROWTH RATES. AS YOU CAN SEE ALL THE OPTIONS
25 DEMONSTRATE EMPHASIS ON SILICON VALLEY OURSELF THE

October 15, 2020

1 JURISDICTIONS THAT APPEAR LIGHT GRAY WHITE COLOR IN THE MIDDLE
2 MAP INDICATE HOUSEHOLD GROWTH IS ASKING JURISDICTIONS TO DO A
3 LOT TO MEET HOUSING NEEDS WHILE MANY OTHER JURISDICTIONS ARE
4 BEING ASKED TO DO RELATIVELY LITTLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AGAIN
5 I'M GOING TO TRY TO WALK THROUGH THESE METRICS EVALUATION
6 RESULTS. SEE IF I CAN MAKE IT MORE CLEAR. THIS OBJECTIVE IS
7 THE FIRST ONE RELATED TO INCREASING THE HOUSING SUPPLY AND THE
8 MIX OF HOUSING TYPES. IN THE CHARTS THE METHODOLOGY
9 RECOMMENDED BY THE HMC AND THE RPC IS SHOWN IN BLUE. THE
10 METHODOLOGY WITH THE BLUEPRINT GROWTH IN OPTION 8A FACTORS AND
11 WEIGHTS IS SHOWN IN BROWN AND OPTION 6A WITH THE EQUITY
12 ADJUSTMENT IS SHOWN IN GRAY. THE CHART ON THE LEFT SHOWS THE
13 PERCENT OF THE RHNA AS LOCATION UNITS THAT JURISDICTIONS WITH
14 THE MOST EXPENSIVE HOUSING COST WOULD RECEIVE AS COMPARED TO
15 THE REVVED OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN OF THE REGION. ALL ASSIGNED
16 A HIGHER INCOME OF UNITS COMPARED TO LOW INCOME COST. YOU CAN
17 SEE THE TOP BAR SELECT JURISDICTIONS TOP 25 THAT ARE MOST
18 EXPENSIVE IS A LITTLE BIT LONGER THAN THE BAR FOR THE REV THE
19 JURISDICTION IN THE REGION. LOOKING AT THE CHART ON THE RIGHT
20 SHOWS WHETHER THOSE JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF
21 TOTAL UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTS HOUSEHOLDS.
22 YOU CAN SEE THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY AND OPTION 6A CHIEF THIS
23 RESULT WITH OPTION 6A PERFORMING THE BEST PROPOSAL OF
24 BLUEPRINT GROWTH FALLS SHORT. IN THAT PROPOSAL THE TOP 25
25 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST EXPENSIVE HOUSING COST RECEIVE

October 15, 2020

1 ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE NOT PROPORTIONAL TO THE EXISTING
2 HOUSEHOLDS WHILE THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION
3 DO RECEIVE. THE DOTTED LINE INDICATE WHERE IS THE
4 JURISDICTIONS ARE PROPORTIONAL TALK BY THE TIME FACT THAT THE
5 BROWN BARS FOR THE SELECT JURISDICTION, THE BAR ON THE TOP IS
6 SHORTER FOR THE BAR ON THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS AND IT
7 DOESN'T COME CLOSE TO THE 1.0 MEASURE FOR PROPORTIONALITY.
8 NEXT SLIDE. OBJECTIVE TWO, ALL OF THE METHODOLOGIES PERFORM
9 RELATIVELY WELL DIRECTING RHNA UNITS TO JURISDICTIONS WITH THE
10 MOST JOBS. JURISDICTIONS WITH THE MOST PROXIMITY TO TRANSIT
11 AND THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LOWEST VMT. HOWEVER, THE
12 ALTERNATE METHODOLOGY USING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT
13 GROWTH AS A BASELINE PERFORMS THE BEST AGAIN, THE ONE IN
14 BROWN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE CHART ON THE LEFT FOR THIS
15 OBJECTIVE SHOWS THE PERCENT OF RHNA UNITS AGAIN AS LOW INCOME
16 UNITS JURISDICTIONS WITH THE WORST JOBS/HOUSING FIT RECEIVES
17 COMPARED TO THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION. THE
18 CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS WHETHER OR NOT THESE JURISDICTIONS
19 ARE RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO EXISTING
20 HOUSEHOLDS. RESULTS INDICATE ALL METHODOLOGIES PERFORM WELL
21 FOR 3, WITH OPTION 6A PERFORMING BEST WHEN LOOKING AT BOTH
22 METRICS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE METRIC FOR OBJECTIVE FOUR
23 MEASURES WHETHER JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE OF
24 HIGH INCOME HOUSEHOLDS RECEIVE A LARGER SHARE OF THEIR RHNA AS
25 LOWER INCOME UNITS COMPARED TO THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE

October 15, 2020

1 LARGEST PERCENTAGE OF LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLD THIS IS ABOUT
2 TRYING TO DIRECT LOW INCOME UNITS TO PLACES THAT HAVE AN
3 EXISTING HIGH SHARES OF HIGH INCOME HOUSEHOLDS RESULTS
4 INDICATE THAT ALL METHODOLOGIES ADVANCE OBJECTIVE FOUR WITH
5 OPTION 6A PERFORMING THE BEST. AGAIN YOU CAN SEE THAT THE BARS
6 ON THE GRAY OPTION OF A LITTLE BIT LONGER THAN THE BROWN AND
7 THE BLUE WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WHEN WE SAY PERFORM BEST.
8 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THERE ARE FOUR METRICS RELATED TO
9 OBJECTIVE FIVE, AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. THE
10 CHART ON THE LEFT SHOWS THE PERCENTAGE OF RHNA LOW INCOME
11 UNITS THE JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE OF
12 HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS RECEIVE COMPARED
13 TO THE PERCENT THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS ARE IN THE REGION
14 RECEIVE. ALL METHODOLOGIES RECEIVE WITH THE HIGHEST PERCENTAGE
15 EVER HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS WITH OPTION
16 6A PERFORMS BEST. THE CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS ALLOCATION EVER
17 RHNA UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO THE SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS.
18 THE RECOMMENDED PROPOSED METHODOLOGY AND OPTION 6A ACHIEVE
19 THIS RESULT WITH OPTION 6A PERFORMING BEST BUT THE PROPOSAL
20 USING BLUEPRINT GROWTH FALLS SHORT. IN THAT PROPOSAL, THE
21 JURISDICTIONS WITH THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE EVER HOUSEHOLDS
22 LIVING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, RECEIVE ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE
23 NOT PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. WHILE
24 THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION DO RECEIVE
25 PROPORTIONAL ALLOCATIONS. AGAIN, THIS IS WHERE THE BROWN BAR

October 15, 2020

1 ON THE TOP IS FALLING SHORT OF THE DOTTED LINE. NEXT SLIDE
2 PLEASE. METRIC FIVE B MEASURES WHETHER JURISDICTIONS THAT
3 EXHIBIT RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION RECEIVE A SHARE OF TOTAL
4 RHNA UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO THE SHARE OF THE REGION'S
5 HOUSEHOLD. RECOMMENDED PROPOSED METHODOLOGY AND OPTION 6A
6 ACHIEVE THIS RESULT WITH OPTION 6A PERFORMING BEST THE
7 PROPOSAL USING BLUEPRINT GROWTH FALLS SHORT. IN THAT PROPOSAL
8 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVING RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION RECEIVE
9 ALLOCATIONS NOT PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR SHARE OF EXISTING
10 HOUSEHOLDS WHILE THE REST OF THE JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION
11 RECEIVE ALLOCATIONS THAT ARE SLIGHTLY MORE THAN PROPORTIONAL.
12 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. METRICS 5C MEASURES JURISDICTIONS WITH THE
13 HIGHEST PERCENTAGE OF HIGH INCOME RESIDENTS RECEIVE
14 PROPORTIONAL TO EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS OPTION 6A PERFORMING BEST
15 AND PROPOSAL WITH BLUEPRINT GROWTH AS A BASELINE NOTICEABLY
16 HIGHER THAN THE OTHER TWO. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE CHART ON
17 THE LEFT SHOWS WHETHER THE 49 JURISDICTIONS WITH ABOVE AVERAGE
18 RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION RECEIVE A TOTAL SHARE OF LOW
19 INCOME UNITS THAT IS AT LEAST PROPORTIONAL TO THEIR TOTAL
20 SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS. ALL THREE METHODOLOGIES PERFORM WELL ON
21 THIS METRIC WITH OPTION 6A PERFORMING THE BEST. THE CHART ON
22 THE RIGHT SHOWS WHETHER OR NOT EACH JURISDICTION AMONG THE 49
23 RECEIVES AN ALLOCATION OF RHNA UNITS THAT'S PROPORTIONAL TO
24 ITS SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT
25 INCLUDED IN OPTION 6A ENSURES THAT EACH OF THE 49

October 15, 2020

1 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVE AN ALLOCATION OF LOWER INCOME UNITS AS
2 PROPORTIONAL TO ITS SHARE OF EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS. THAT WHAT
3 YOU SEE ON THE GRAY BAR THAT REACHES THE 1.0. THE RECOMMENDED
4 METHODOLOGY PERFORMS RELATIVELY WELL WITH 65 PERCENT OF THE 49
5 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVING PROPORTIONAL ALLOCATIONS. THE
6 ALTERNATE OPTION, WITH HOUSEHOLD GROWTH AS A BASELINE DOES NOT
7 PERFORM WELL AS ONLY 20 PERCENT OF THE JURISDICTIONS
8 EXHIBITING ABOVE AVERAGE RACIAL ECONOMIC EXCLUSION RECEIVE A
9 SHARE OF LOW INCOME UNITS PROPORTIONAL TO SHARE OF EXISTING
10 HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE. THAT'S THE END OF THE EVALUATION OF
11 THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS AND I WANT TO REMIND FOLKS WHERE WE ARE
12 IN THE PROCESS. APPROVAL BY THE EXECUTIVE BOARD THE PROPOSED
13 RHNA METHODOLOGY WILL BE RELEASED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT INCLUDING
14 A PUBLIC HEARING TO BE HELD IN NOVEMBER. IN EARLY DECEMBER,
15 THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT DATA FOR THE 2050
16 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE IS ANTICIPATED BECOME AVAILABLE. RPC AND
17 THE EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL THEN RAE IF ON THE PUBLIC FEEDBACK AS
18 WELL AS UPDATES MADE TO INTEGRATE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT DATA.
19 APPROVAL AND SUBMITTAL OF THE DRAFT RHNA METHODOLOGY TO HCD IS
20 EXPECTED BY THE END OF 2020. SO WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO TAKE
21 ANY QUESTIONS.

22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. DIRECTOR LEE HAS
24 RAISED THEIR HAND. I AGAINST I'LL -- WE'LL DO CLARIFYING
25 QUESTIONS ON THE ALTERNATIVE PRESENTATIONS AT THIS TIME. THEN

October 15, 2020

1 I WOULD LIKE TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT THEN WE CAN GET INTO THE
2 MOTIONS OR DISCUSSION, OR SUBSTANTIVE DISCUSSION. DIRECTOR
3 LEE.

4

5 **WAYNE LEE:** I WANT TO REITERATE TO STAFF THAT THIS IS AMAZING
6 WORK YOU HAVE DONE, EVERYBODY, THERESE, I CONGRATULATE YOU AND
7 YOUR STAFF. THIS IS AN AMAZING AMOUNT OF WORK. IT'S VERY
8 DENSE, IT TOOK ME A LONG TIME TO FIGURE THIS ONE OUT. BUT, I
9 JUST HAVE ONE CLARIFYING QUESTION. SO AREAS OF OPPORTUNITY,
10 DOES THAT MEAN HIGH INCOME, LOTS OF RESOURCES, DAY CARES,
11 FOOD, AND STUFF LIKE THAT -- I MEAN, PLACES TO SHOP. IS THAT
12 WHAT IT MOONS IN.

13

14 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IT'S A MEASURE DEVELOPED BY THE STATE HOUSING
15 DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT AND IT'S A MEASURE OF HIGH QUALITY
16 NEIGHBORHOODS. THEY LOOK AT, YOU KNOW, PERFORMANCE INDICATED
17 RELATED TO ECONOMIC ACCESS TO JOBS EDUCATIONAL OUTCOMES
18 READING AND MATH SCORES FOR FOURTH GRADERS AND HIGH SCHOOL
19 GRADUATION RATES AND INDICATORS FOR ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY. SO
20 IT'S A PRETTY BROAD MEASURE OF THAT IDEA OF SORT OF ACCESS TO
21 OPPORTUNITY.

22

23 **WAYNE LEE:** SO PLACES LIKE ATHERTON, WHICH DOESN'T HAVE MUCH
24 BUSINESS OR MUCH APARTMENTS, BUT HAS A LOT OF HIGH EARNERS, IS

October 15, 2020

1 THAT CONSIDERED A HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREA OR WOULD YOU SAY MORE
2 LIKE SAN FRANCISCO WOULD BE A HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREA?

3

4 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** I THINK BOTH OF THEM MEASURE IN THAT WAY. I
5 THINK PARTLY BECAUSE IT IS A BROAD BASED METHOD RICK OR
6 EVALUATION THAT THE STATE HAS USED. I THINK IT CAPTURED A LOT
7 OF DIFFERENT SORT OF QUALITY THAT GO INTO BEING A HIGH
8 RESOURCE AREA.

9

10 **WAYNE LEE:** YEAH BECAUSE I DON'T -- IF YOU ARE A HIGH INCOME
11 PERSON BUT YOU DON'T HAVE A LOT OF SHOPPING, OR, YOU KNOW,
12 INFRASTRUCTURE NEARBY, THEN, TO ME, I MEAN, YEAH, YOU CAN BUY
13 A LOT OF THINGS WHEN YOU HAVE A LOT MORE MONEY. YOU CAN IMPORT
14 THAT STUFF. SO THAT'S REALLY KIND OF MISLEADING. SO THAT'S MY
15 PERSPECTIVE. IT'S NOT APPLES TO APPLES. IT'S APPLES TO
16 ORANGES. THANK YOU.

17

18 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR GIBBONS.

19

20 **LIZ GIBBONS:** THANK YOU. I'M FOLLOWING UP ON DIRECTOR LEE'S
21 QUESTIONS. IN MANY CONVERSATIONS AT ABAG, AND WITH THE NON-
22 PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS, THERE WAS A DEBATE BETWEEN SIMPLY
23 PROVIDING HOUSING UNITS VERSUS PROVIDING THE OPPORTUNITY TO
24 GAIN WEALTH, BASICALLY TO BUY A HOME WHICH GIVES YOU THE
25 OPPORTUNITY TO GAIN WEALTH. AND INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH, MY

October 15, 2020

1 CONVERSATIONS HERE IN THE SOUTH BAY WITH VARIOUS ORGANIZATIONS
2 LIKE SILICON VALLEY AT HOME, WAS THAT THERE WAS A STRONG PUSH
3 TO HAVE PEOPLE BE ABLE TO BUY AS A WAY TO HAVE, BUILD WEALTH.
4 AND THAT KIND OF CAUGHT ME BY SURPRISE. SO WHEN I LOOK AT
5 THESE NUMBERS, AND THESE DISTRIBUTIONS, RELATIVE AREAS, I'M
6 SURPRISED -- IF I'M WRONG -- BUT I'M SURPRISED THAT --
7 EMPHASIZE THE ABILITY TO HAVE MORE HOUSING IN LESS EXPENSIVE
8 AREAS. AND I UNDERSTAND THE CRITERIA'S ABOUT DRIVING AND ALL
9 THAT. BUT THERE IS SUCH A DISPARITY BETWEEN THE COST OF
10 HOUSING IN THE DIFFERENT AREAS THAT IF OUR GOAL IS ONE TO
11 PROVIDE MORE HOUSING, COST EFFECTIVELY, AND TWO, TO PROVIDE AN
12 OPPORTUNITY TO OWN HOUSING, MORE REALISTICALLY. THAT DOESN'T
13 SEEM TO BE CONSIDERED HERE AT ALL.

14

15 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** WHAT I WOULD SAY ABOUT THAT IS THE PURPOSE OF
16 THE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS, HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IS THEY'RE
17 BASED ON RESOURCES, FAMILIES THAT LIVE THERE, IT LEADS TO
18 BETTER LIFE OUTCOMES. AND IF OWNING A HOME IS ONE ELEMENT OF
19 THAT, YOU POINTED IT OUT AS WEALTH BUILDING BUT I DON'T THINK
20 IT'S THE ONLY AVENUE FOR A HOUSEHOLD TO IMPROVE ITS QUALITY OF
21 LIFE.

22

23 **LIZ GIBBONS:** I WOULD JUST OFFER THIS AS FOOD FOR THOUGHT. IF
24 YOU HAVE AN AREA WHERE A MILLION DOLLARS WILL BUY YOU ONE
25 HOUSE AND A MILLION DOLLARS IN ANOTHER AREA, IT COULD BUY YOU

October 15, 2020

1 TWO AND EVEN THREE HOUSES, IT SEEMS LIKE THAT'S WORTH
2 CONSIDERING WHEN YOU DO THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE RHNA NUMBERS.
3 ACTUALLY, I THINK IT WAS DIRECTOR MACKENZIE WHO SAID THAT HIS
4 AREA IS LOOKING TO BUILD WAY MORE HOUSING THAN IS ALLOCATED.
5 AND I AM SURE THAT'S ONE OF THE FACTORS. SO IT'S NOT QUITE
6 BALANCES OUT FOR ME. I UNDERSTANDS WHY YOU GOT WHAT YOU GOT
7 BUT I'M LOSING WITH THE REALITY OF GETTING MORE HOUSES BUILT
8 FOR THE MOST COST EFFECTIVE MANNER.

9

10 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. VICE PRESIDENT RAMOS?

11

12 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS THE SAME LINE OF QUESTIONING
13 THAT I HAD, IN PARTICULAR, WHEN I LOOK AT THE HIGH RESOURCE
14 AREAS, IF I TAKE WHAT WAS WHAT THE MANNING SHOWS IS A HIGH
15 RESOURCE AREA IN NAPA COUNTY, BASED UPON THE PRESENTATION THAT
16 YOU GAVE US GILLIAN, IT SAID THAT THERE WAS GOING TO BE THE
17 FIRE ZONES, THE FIRE PRONE AREAS WERE GOING TO BE LEFT OUT,
18 AND WE'RE LOOKING AT OPPORTUNITY, YET, WHEN I LOOK AT THREE
19 AREAS -- SORRY. I GOT TWO LITTLE ONES RIGHT HERE AT MY FEET
20 THAT YOU MIGHT HEAR IN THE BACKGROUND. WHEN I LOOK AT TWO
21 AREAS IN PARTICULAR IN NAPA COUNTY, ONE OF THEM BEING CIRCLE
22 OAKS WHICH WAS THREATENED BY FIRE THREE TIMES IN THE LAST
23 THREE YEARS, THERE ARE NO SIDEWALKS. IT'S A VERY REMOTE AREA.
24 SO AND IT'S ALSO A VERY STEEP AREA. SO IT'S ALSO IN AN AG
25 WATER SHED AREA THAT IS PROTECTED. SO WHEN I LOOK AT ANOTHER

October 15, 2020

1 AREA OUT IN THE [INDISCERNIBLE] AREA AND IN MY DISTRICT IN
2 PARTICULAR, SAME THING LARGER PARCELS, GOING TO DIRECTOR
3 GIBBON'S POINT WHEN YOU LOOK AT WHAT YOU'RE ABLE TO BUY, YES
4 YOU HAVE AN AREA OF HIGH OWNERSHIP AND HIGH SUCCESS RATES AND
5 HIGH OUTCOMES OVERALL, BUT IT TENDS TO BE MORE OF A FARMING
6 AREA, AND A LEGACY AREA. SO THERE IS A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS I
7 HAVE IN TERMS OF IDENTIFICATION AND USE AND THE ALLOCATION,
8 WHICH IS VERY EMPHASIZED ON THESE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. THE
9 IMPACT OF FARMING AND AGRICULTURAL IMPACT THE IN THAT AREA, OF
10 URBAN LIMIT LINES, OF AGRICULTURAL CITIZEN PROTECTED AREAS,
11 BUT ALSO TOPOGRAPHY. I CAN'T -- YOU CANNOT PUT A SIDEWALK IN
12 ANY OF THESE AREAS THAT ARE MAPPED OUT AS HIGH RESOURCE AREAS
13 BY THE BACKGROUND THAT I HAVE DONE. SO MY QUESTION IS, HOW FAR
14 ARE WE LOOKING INTO THIS? ARE WE JUST LOOKING AT DATA POINTS
15 AND NOT NECESSARILY, YOU KNOW, A DRIVE BY ALONE WILL TELL YOU,
16 THE AREAS YOU HAVE IDENTIFIED IN NAPA COUNTY ARE NOT YOUR HIGH
17 RESOURCE AREAS, SO HOW FAR ARE WE GOING INTO THIS TO USE THIS
18 AS A BASIS FOR A LARGE AMOUNT OF THE METHODOLOGY AND THE
19 ALLOCATION? >DAVE VAUTIN: THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN WITH STAFF
20 AGAIN. I'M GOING TO TACKLE THIS QUESTION. THANK YOU SUPERVISOR
21 RAMOS. WITH REGARD TO THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THIS IS
22 SOMETHING THE STATE HAS DEVELOPED OVER A SERIES OF YEARS AND
23 HCD HAS EM GRACED AS A KEY WAY TO EVALUATE RHNA AND LOOKING AT
24 DIFFERENT HOUSING ELEMENTS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMIND THAT AS
25 WE LOOK AT ALLOCATION THROUGH THIS PROCESS WE'RE NOT SITING

October 15, 2020

1 CITING PARTS OF JURISDICTIONS, IT'S A SHARE EVER HIGH RESOURCE
2 AREA WITHIN THAT JURISDICTION NOW AS EACH JURISDICTION UPDATES
3 ITS HOUSING ELEMENT OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS THE
4 TRADEOFFS ARE IMPORTANT FIRE RISK ZONES ACCESS OPPORTUNITY
5 EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE, THAT WILL BE SOMETHING JURISDICTIONS
6 HAVE TO CONSIDER AS THEY GO FORWARD UPDATING THE HOUSING
7 ELEMENT.

8

9 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I WOULD SAY YES,
10 THIS IDENTIFICATION COMES FROM THE STATE. IT'S PART OF THE
11 INFORMATION THAT IS BEFORE US. IT COMES DOWN TO THE REGION,
12 AND AS YOU SAY IT GOES DOWN TO THE LOCAL, BUT AT SOME POINT,
13 WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO USE THE KNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE AS TO
14 WHAT IS GOING TO BE VIABLE AND WHAT IS NOT GOING TO BE VIABLE.
15 IF THESE NUMBERS ARE COMING DOWN, THEY HAVE GOT TO COME DOWN
16 IN A WAY WHERE THEY ARE ACTIONABLE. WHERE THEY ACTUALLY ARE
17 GOING TO MEAN SOMETHING. AND SO WHEN I HAVE A COUNTY THAT HAS
18 AN AGRICULTURAL PRESERVE, AN AL CULTURAL WATER SHED ALL
19 PROTECTED BY REFERENDUMS. I HAVE COUNTY LINES AND HALF OF MY
20 COUNTY HAS BURNED AND YOU'RE TELLING ME THAT THE HIGH RESOURCE
21 AREA THAT IS IDENTIFIED FOR THIS METHODOLOGY, TO THE TOTAL
22 NUMBER, I'LL ACCEPT THAT, TO THE TOTAL NUMBER OF THE COUNTY, I
23 AM -- I PAUSE. I PAUSE, BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THAT THAT IS
24 NECESSARILY THE END-ALL, BE ALL, THAT IS WORTHY OF WHAT IS IT,
25 70 PERCENT OF THE IMPACT, THAT YOU ARE USING FOR THE LOW TO

October 15, 2020

1 VERY LOW ALLOCATION OF HOUSING. THAT'S MY CONCERN THAT I HAVE
2 HERE. AT SOME POINT, WE -- THE LARGE NUMBER, AND THE
3 INFORMATION OF THE NUMBER COMING DOWN FROM HCD, DOWN TO THE
4 LOCALS, AND IMPOSING A NUMBER ON THE LOCALS THAT DOESN'T
5 ACCOUNT FOR THE, ALL THE CONSTRAINTS THAT ARE UPON US, I THINK
6 THAT'S WHERE REGIONALISM COMES IN. REGIONALISM, I SEE AS WE
7 HAVE TO BE ABLE TO PLAN FOR OUR COLLECTIVE SUCCESS. AND WE
8 HAVE GOT OUR NINE COUNTIES AND WE ALL HAVE TO BE ABLE TO HAVE
9 DEFENDABLE HOUSING ELEMENTS. AND WE ARE ONLY GOING TO BE
10 SUCCESSFUL AS A REGION IF EVERY SINGLE COUNTY CAN MEET THAT
11 MOMENT, AND CAN MEET THAT NUMBER. SO I'LL STOP WITH THAT.

12

13 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR CHAVEZ OF ONCE AGAIN
14 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. WE'RE NOT GETTING INTO SPEECHES YET, OR
15 DISCUSSION. SO SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ AND ANY OTHER CLARIFYING
16 QUESTIONS, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND.

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'LL TRY NOT TO TAKE THAT PERSONALLY
19 CHAIR ARREGUIN. I'M KIDDING. I'M TOTALLY MESSING WITH YOU. NO
20 PROBLEM. SO I DO HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. ONE IS DIRECTOR ROMERO
21 MADE A COMMENT THAT, ABOUT THE PROCESS RELATIVE TO HOW THE
22 OPTIONS WERE CHOSEN, AND SUGGESTED THAT 6A WAS SOMEHOW MOVED
23 FROM PRIORITY ONE TO PRIORITY TWO. AND I JUST WONDERED IF
24 STAFF COULD RESPOND TO THAT COMMENT. AND THEN, LET ME JUST
25 TELL YOU THE SECOND QUESTION BECAUSE THEY MIGHT BE CONNECTED.

October 15, 2020

1 IT APPEARS TO ME THAT 8A HMC AND OPTION 6A WITH THE EQUITY
2 ADJUSTMENT ARE VERY SIMILAR IN THAT FOR MOST AREAS THAT 6A AND
3 8A PERFORM -- 6A IS EITHER A LITTLE BETTER THAN THE TWO, OR 8A
4 IS BETTER IN ONE. AM I RIGHT THAT THE ONLY PLACE -- THE ONLY
5 SINGLE PLACE THAT THERE IS ONLY ONE OBJECTIVE AND OF THAT ONLY
6 ONE SUBOBJECTIVE THAT THE BLUEPRINT GROWTH WITH 8A FACTORS IS
7 ACTUALLY BETTER THAN THE OTHER TWO? IS THAT ACCURATE? THE
8 REASON I'M ASKING THE QUESTION IS I WAS HAVING A HARD TIME
9 UNDERSTANDING THE BARS TOO.

10

11 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** ANSWER THE QUESTION ABOUT 6A. SO, STAFF'S
12 RECOMMENDATION FOR THE HMC AT THE LAST MEETING WAS TO APPROVE
13 OR RECOMMEND 6A. WE DID RECOMMEND AGAINST THE EQUITY
14 ADJUSTMENT AS MENTIONED IT ADDS COMPLEXITY AND DIDN'T ADD
15 ENOUGH OF IMPACT. WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY IS A LITTLE
16 BIT DIFFERENT BUT THE CONVERSATION THAT HMC HAD WAS, I THINK,
17 SIMILAR TO THE CONVERSATION THAT WE'RE HAVING NOW, I THINK
18 SOME FOLKS FELT LIKE 6A WENT TOO FAR, AND THERE WAS A DESIRE
19 TO MOVE IN A DIRECTION THAT WOULD FOCUS MORE ON JOBS SO THAT
20 WAS OF THE CONVERSATION THE AGENCY HAD IN TERMS OF CHOOSES 8A
21 AS THE COMPROMISE OR MIDDLE PATH BETWEEN SORT OF THE EMPHASIS
22 ON EQUITY THAT 6A HAD VERSUS THE DESIRE TO MOVE MORE IN THE
23 DIRECTION OF FOCUSED GROWTH. AND TO YOUR QUESTION ABOUT THE
24 METRICS, YES. SO, THE BLUEPRINT GROWTH OPTION DOES BETTER ON -
25 - A LITTLE BIT BETTER ON THE OBJECTIVE TWO WHICH IS ABOUT THE

Meeting Transcript

October 15, 2020

1 PRIORITY INFILL REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. BUT DOESN'T
2 DO AS WELL ON THE OTHER METRICS.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND TO MY EYE, IT'S NOT -- IT DOESN'T APPEAR TO
5 BE MUCH DIFFERENT. IS THAT ACCURATE? AGAIN I'M HAVING A HARD
6 TIME WITH THE BARS ON OBJECTIVE TWO. YEAH.

7

8 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IT DOES BETTER BUT IT IS -- THEY ALL DO WELL, I
9 GUESS I WOULD SAY, BUT IT DEFINITELY DOES BETTER. LOOKING AT
10 THE LENGTH OF THE LINES, YOU SEE THAT THE BROWN ONE IS LONGER
11 THAN THE BLUE.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL RIGHT. I'LL GO BACK TO GRAPH SCHOOL. GILLIAN
14 LAST THING AND AS BRIEF AS YOU CAN BE ABOUT THIS. WHEN YOU SAY
15 COMPLEXITY. WHAT DO YOU MEAN? ONE IS MORE COMPLEX THAN THE
16 OTHER, BECAUSE?

17

18 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** SPECIFIC TO THE IDEA OF ADDING THE EQUITY
19 ADJUSTMENTS. AND SO COMPLEXITY WAS HONESTLY JUST NOT TRYING TO
20 ADD ANYTHING ELS THAT WE HAD TO EXPLAIN.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NO MORE BARS AND LINES.

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** YEAH.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** IT WAS -- I WAS THE CHAIR OF HMC,
2 IT WAS HOW ARE WE GOING TO EXPLAIN THIS TO PLANNERS AND LOCAL
3 GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS BECAUSE IT ADDS ANOTHER LAYER OF KIND OF
4 COMPLEXITY IN THE EXPLANATION OF THE METHODOLOGY AND HOW THE
5 METHODOLOGY IS CALCULATED.

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER CLARIFIES QUESTIONS?
10 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT I'M GOING TO EXERCISE
11 CHAIR'S PREROGATIVE PER SPEAKERS IF YOU ARE REPRESENTING AN
12 ORGANIZATION I WOULD ENCOURAGE THE ORGANIZATION TO HAVE ONE
13 SPOKESPERSON AND YOU CAN INDICATE HOW MANY PEOPLE ON THE CALL
14 ARE IN SUPPORT FROM YOUR ORGANIZATION JUST IN ORDER TO
15 FACILITATE PUBLIC COMMENT. SO IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK
16 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. AND ONCE AGAIN, IF
17 YOU ARE REPRESENTING AN ORGANIZATION, I AM ENCOURAGING TO HAVE
18 ONE SPOKESPERSON FOR THAT ORGANIZATION. WE RECEIVED HUNDREDS
19 OF COMMUNICATIONS SENT BY STAFF FROM CITIES FROM INDIVIDUALS
20 OF THE BAY AREA AND WE VERY MUCH APPRECIATE COMMENTS RECEIVED
21 ON THIS ISSUE. MR. CASTRO I'M GOING TURN IT OVER TO YOU TO
22 CALL THE SPEAKERS.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS MR.
25 BEAKMAN, GO AHEAD SIR.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU. I HAVE A LOT TO SAY. I HOPE I CAN FIT
3 IT IN A MINUTE. THE PERSON WHO SPOKE BEFORE SUPERVISORS
4 CHAVEZ, SHE DID EXCELLENT. SHE DESCRIBED EXACTLY WHAT I HAVE
5 BEEN TRYING TO DESCRIBE ALL DAY. HOW CAN THE MTC LEARN TO BE A
6 BETTER FACILITATOR AND FACILITATE WHAT'S HAPPENING FROM
7 SACRAMENTO HO THE LOCAL LEVEL. GOOD LUCK ON THOSE EFFORTS
8 FREMONT AND REDWOOD ARE WORKING ON EQUITY AND HOW THAT CAN
9 ADDRESS A COMMUNITY OF EQUITY AND ADDRESS POLICING ISSUES WITH
10 BETTER HOUSING. ALL THAT MEANS IS YOU HAVE TO CONSIDER PEOPLE
11 WHO LIVE WITH \$20,000 INCOME LEVELS AND 25,000, \$28,000 INCOME
12 LEVELS. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU ARE QUITE DOING THAT. FORGIVE MY
13 INEXPERIENCE. I HOPE WE WORK ON THAT ISSUE. AND LIKE I SAID
14 BEFORE IN 2018, 2019MTC WAS WORKING ON MIXED INCOME IDEAS.
15 THEY REALLY NEEDED HELP FROM SAN JOSE WITH THAT AND SAN JOSE
16 SHOWED THEM AND ADVOCACY SHOWED THEM THE EXAMPLE AND CONCLUDE
17 WITH THE EXAMPLES --

18

19 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I'M GOING SHUT OFF YOUR MIC. WE'RE
20 GOING IT GO IN THE NEXT SPEAKER.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS NEWELL ARNERICH.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** NEWELL ARNERICH DANVILLE, SIX TIME MAYOR, ARCHITECT
25 PLANNER. WE'RE HERE TO SUPPORT THE PROCESS. SUPPORT THE

October 15, 2020

1 NUMBERS NOBODY'S ARGUING ABOUT THE NUMBERS WHAT WE'RE ASKING
2 FOR AND I'LL TELL YOU THE REASONS WE'RE ASKING YOU TO CONTINUE
3 THIS DECISION ON 8A FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS. ONE, THERE ARE
4 FLAWS BUT THINGS THAT CAN BE FIXED WITH A LITTLE MORE TIME. WE
5 HAVE ONLY HAD THREE MEETINGS TO LOOK AT THIS. THAT THERE ARE
6 SOLUTIONS HERE THAT WILL MAKE THIS BETTER. WHAT WE'RE AFTER IS
7 A LITTLE BIT OF TIME AND BECAUSE WHEN YOU LOOK AT THIS FROM A
8 HIGH LEVEL VIEW IT IS THE SAME PROBLEM WE HAVE DONE IN THE
9 PAST 20 YEARS JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE CONTRA COSTA COUNTY HAS
10 PROVIDED THE LION'S SHARE OF THAT HOUSING. THAT WILL HAPPEN
11 AGAIN WE WILL WORSEN GREENHOUSE, IT'S SETUP FOR FAILURE. IT
12 DOESN'T TAKE A LOT. WE WOULD ASK YOU TO JUST DELAY THIS GIVE
13 OUR STAFF THE TIME TO COME BACK WITH THOUGHTFUL MEANINGFUL
14 SOLUTIONS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

15

16 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT FRUCHTMAN GO AHEAD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING MY NAME IS ROBERT FRUCHTMAN I LIVE IN
21 SAN FRANCISCO PLEASE ADOPT THE METHODOLOGY OF THE HOUSING
22 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE
23 OPTION 8A USING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE. IN
24 1970 SAN FRANCISCO WAS ABLE TO HOUSE ITS ENTIRE WORKFORCE. BY
25 2020 WE CAN BARELY HOUSE HALF OUR WORKERS EVEN THOUGH WE HAVE

October 15, 2020

1 DOUBLED OUR WORKFORCE AND MANY NEIGHBORHOODS CLARIFIED AS
2 RACIALLY ECONOMIC'S EXCLUSIVE. ALLOCATE HOMES CLOSE TO JOBS
3 AND FURTHER FAIR HOUSING IN JURISDICTION'S EXPERIENCING RACIAL
4 INEQUITIES HMC PROPOSAL WILL RESULT IN A POSITIVE OUTCOME FOR
5 THE ENTIRE BAY AREA IS PERFORM BETTER THAN THE CONSIDERED
6 ALTERNATIVES FOR THESE REASONS PLEASE ADOPT THE PROPOSAL OF
7 THE PLAN 2050 HOUSEHOLDS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GENE FOOTHILLS AHEAD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE AN ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATION WORKING TO
12 PROTECT OPEN SPACE AND NATURAL RESOURCES IN SAN MATEO AND
13 SANTA CLARA COUNTIES WE SUBMITTED A LETTER YESTERDAY WITH
14 LOCAL CHAPTERS ASKING TO TAKE ACTION ON WHATEVER METHODOLOGIES
15 ARE APPROVED DOESN'T AFFECT WILDLIFE HABITAT. WE ARE ASKING
16 THOSE ARE REALLOCATED TO THE URBAN AREAS. 99 PERCENT OF THE
17 UNINCORPORATED AREA OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY IS RURAL GREAT PART
18 IS WILDLIFE HABITAT ONE OF THE MAIN CONCERNS IS THE POTENTIAL
19 IMPACT TO COYOTE VALLEY WHICH IS A CRITERIA CAL WILDLIFE
20 CORRIDOR BUT BECAUSE OF ITS LOCATION WOULD BE PUT UNDER
21 INTENSE DEVELOPMENT PRESSURE IF THOUSANDS OF UNITS ARE
22 ALLOCATED TO THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTY. -- SANTA CLARA COUNTY
23 GETTING HOUSING GETTING ALLOCATIONS, IT'S THE UNINCORPORATED
24 IN THE COUNTY SHOULD NOT BE GETTING HOUSING.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LUKE GO AHEAD.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** PROJECT COORDINATOR WITH GENERATION HOUSING. I'M HERE
4 TO SUPPORT 8A. BAY AREA NEEDS METHODOLOGY TO BALANCE
5 PRIORITIES IN THE OBJECTIVES OF RHNA GENERATION HOUSING
6 BELIEVES OPTION 8A WOULD BALANCE THESE GOALS. CONCERN WITH THE
7 UNINCORPORATED NUMBERS FOR OUR COUNTY ARE TOO HIGH CONSIDERING
8 UNINCORPORATED AREAS. COUNTY AND CITY COMMUNITY LEADERS ARE
9 EQUIPPED TO DETERMINE HOW TO SHIFT RESPONSIBILITY AND ENSURE
10 WE CAN BUILD FAIR HOUSING UNDER OPTION 8A. WE MUST RISE TO THE
11 OCCASION TO MEET THE REGION'S HOUSING NEEDS BY MOVING FORWARD
12 WITH 8A WE CAN HELP OUR REGION PROSPER AND ALLOWING RESIDENTS
13 TO CHOOSE BASED ON NEEDS PREFERENCES AND PROXIMITY TO
14 RESOURCES NOT RACIAL ECONOMIC BACKGROUND. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER ENDING IN 6262. GO
17 AHEAD.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI THIS. IS ROLAND LEBRUN SAN JOSE. THE REASON I
20 RAISE MY HAND IS BECAUSE OF THE PRESENTATION ON THE MEGA
21 COMMUTE. AND THE URBAN SPRAWL. IS BY THE WAY, I CAN'T FIND
22 THAT PRESENTATION ANYWHERE ON THE MTC'S LEGISTAR. THE SPRAWL
23 IS OCCURRING. THE PROBLEM IS IT'S NOT OCCURRING WITHIN THE
24 NINE BAY AREA COUNTY PLANNING AREA. IT'S HAPPENING OUTSIDE. IF
25 YOU GO TO LOOK AT MERCED, YOU LOOK AT LOS BANS ON, YOU CAN GET

October 15, 2020

1 A SINGLE FAMILY HOUSE. IF YOU GO CLOSER YOU STILL GET ONE FOR
2 HALF A MILLION DOLLARS. SO WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO? IT'S WHY
3 HIGH SPEED RAIL WAS HIJACKED IT WAS SUPPOSED TO GO TO LA NOT
4 MERCED. WE'RE ARE GOING TO PUT HIGH SPEED RAIL OVER THERE
5 GUESS WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN TO MERCED. RIGHT? AND THEN WE
6 SPEND \$12 BILLION ON AN ALIGNMENT THAT WAS NEVER SUPPOSED TO
7 BE THERE IN THE FIRST PLACE. I'LL LEAVE THAT THERE FOR YOU.
8 GOOD NIGHT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER. GO AHEAD.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THERE ARE ALREADY TREMENDOUS ECONOMIC PRESSURES. IF
13 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT EQUITY WHAT THE JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE A
14 HIGH PERCENTAGE EVER MINORITIES AND WHO IS NEWER RESIDENTS
15 PLAY HIGH PROPERTY TAXES BUT WHICH ARE SEVERELY UNDERFUNDED
16 WHEN IT COMES TO SCHOOLS HOW ARE HOUSING SUPPOSED TO PAY FOR
17 ALLOCATIONS WHEN THEY'RE ALREADY BEING LEANED UPON
18 ECONOMICALLY AND UNDER FUNDED. WHAT IS THE PLAN TO INCREASE
19 THE SHARE OF BELOW MARKET RATE HOUSING. PLEASE PROVIDE IDEAS
20 HOW TO PAY FOR THESE ALLOCATIONS THERE IS FOCUS ON WHERE TO
21 PUT THE HOUSING BUT THERE SEEMS TO BE NO ATTENTION PAID ON HOW
22 TO PAY FOR THIS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER KATIE MOORE CUPERTINO.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M KITTY MOORE CUPERTINO PLANNING ENGINEER. I AM
2 REPRESENTING MYSELF. CUPERTINO HAS GOOD HOUSING TO JOBS RATIO
3 WHAT'S BEING SPOKEN BY PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND OUR NEW RHNA
4 NUMBERS WILL RESULT IN 25 AFFORDABLE HOMES AT THAT LEVEL
5 CUPERTINO 350 SCARE FOOT UNIT COMFORTS \$800,000 TO BUILD SO
6 YOU THINK THAT WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE \$2 BILLION WORTH OF
7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WHERE IS THE FUNDING FOR THAT GOING TO
8 COME FROM? FROM THE STATE? HOW ARE YOU HELPING US OUT OR ARE
9 YOU TELLING US WE HAVE TO PROVIDE A TON EVER AFFORDABLE UNITS
10 WITHOUT GIVING US SUPPORT WHATSOEVER? THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MARK LAND GRAPH.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE IN SUPPORT OF OPTION 8A BUT WHICH TO EXPRESS
15 OUR CONCERNS ABOUT ALLOCATIONS TO UNINCORPORATED AREAS AND DO
16 NOT FEEL TRANSFERS TO SPHERES ARE ACCEPTABLE. THE NEXT CYCLE
17 REPRESENTS 13 PERCENT INCREASE OVER LAST ROUND. SANTA CLAIR
18 HAS PROVIDED SMART GROWTH IN UNINCORPORATED AREAS BUT THE
19 INCREASE IN ALLOCATION WOULD INDUCE SIGNIFICANT SMALL
20 INCLUDING THAT WHICH ANNEXATION BY LAND CURRENTLY WITHIN THEIR
21 SPHERE WHICH IS FARMLAND AND SHOULD BE PROTECTED. THIS IS
22 COUNTER TO RESOURCE PROTECTION GOALS BUT COUNTER TO
23 FOUNDATIONAL GOAL OF REDUCING GREENHOUSE BY FOCUSING HOUSING
24 NEAR JOBS AND TRANSIT.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME. THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CARLOS
2 HARMON.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU TO THE BOARD FOR PROVIDING THE OPPORTUNITY
5 TO SPEAK MY NAME IS HARMON. I AM NOT SPEAK OCEAN -- I SPEND A
6 LOT OF TIME THINKING ABOUT LAND USE. I AM A MEMBER OF URBAN
7 ENVIRONMENTALISTS ORGANIZATIONS THAT EXIST TO ADDRESS THE
8 INEQUALITY AND CLIMATE CRISIS. I COMMEND STAFF AND THE MEMBERS
9 OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE FOR THEIR WORK OVER THE
10 PAST YEAR WHILE I WOULD HAVE LIKED TO SEE RHND NUMBERS SET
11 HIGHER WITH THE GOAL OF ADDRESSING LONG-TERM HOUSING DEFICIT
12 RATHER THAN KEEPING PACE I AM SATISFIED THAT GIVEN AT THE
13 NUMBER THE VARIANT OF 8A OR 6A WITH EQUITY VARIANT WOULD BRING
14 THE TWO HOUSING AREAS CLOSE TO JOBS AND TRANSIT. THE IMPORTANT
15 THING IS THAT WE MOVE THE PROCESS FORWARD AND THAT YOU MAKE A
16 CLEAR DECISION WITHOUT DELAY I HOPE THE BOARD WILL COMMIT TO
17 ONE OF THE TWO METHODOLOGIES EXPEDITIOUSLY. THE BAY AREA IS
18 GREAT LET'S MAKE MORE OF IT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS BILL CLARKSON.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING BILL CLARKSON CITY OF SAN RAHMON FOR THE
23 LAST NINE YEARS OUR COMMITMENT TO JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE BY
24 PLANNING AND BUILDING HOMES NEAR OUR JOB CENTER SUCH AS OUR
25 \$2.5 BILLION PROJECT CALLED CITY WALK IT WILL BE IN OUR

October 15, 2020

1 BUSINESS RANCH CITY PARK SURROUNDED BY JOBS, TRANSIT CENTERS,
2 AND DOWNTOWN CITY CENTER. OUR COUNCIL DID SO BECAUSE WE
3 BELIEVE IN THE HOUSING BALANCE REDUCING TRAFFIC, REDUCING
4 GREENHOUSE GASSES BUT WE URGE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD TO REJECT
5 THE HMC6A TO & TO TAKE THE ALTERNATIVE EIGHT. WE DO SO BECAUSE
6 WE REALLY WANT TO HOLD WHERE THEY SHOULD HOLD HIGH WAGE IN JOB
7 RICH AREAS IN REGIONS TO PROVIDE HOUSING FOR ALL THE JOBS THEY
8 HAVE CREATED OVER THE LAST TWO DECADES IN ADDITION FAIR
9 ALLOCATION OF THEIR SHARE OF HOUSING IN THE NEXT ROUND. THANK
10 YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER DELILAH CLAY.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING DELILAH CLAY OF THE CITY OF BRISBANE WE
15 HAVE CONCERN OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 METHODOLOGY. THE
16 GROWTH PROJECTIONS FOR BRISBANE ARE BASED ON A
17 MISUNDERSTANDING ABOUT THE AVAILABLE UNREGULATED LANDFILL IN
18 THE BAY LANDS. THERE IS EXISTING CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE FOR
19 THE BAY AREA REGION THERE, AND IN TOTAL IT'S ABOUT 400 ACRES
20 OF LAND THAT CLEARLY CAN'T SUPPORT HOUSING DEVELOPMENT.
21 BRISBANE RECOGNIZES THE NEED TO DO ITS PART INTRODUCING
22 HOUSING ON THE BAY LANDS THAT DOUBLES THE CITY POPULATION AND
23 HOUSING STOCK. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MTC AND ABAG TO
24 ADDRESS OUR CONCERNS. THANKS.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID YING.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS DAVID YING I AM A PLANNER WITH THE CITY
4 OF SAN JOSE BUT I'M SPEAKING AS A RESIDENT. I SUPPORT OPTION
5 6A UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES SHOULD ABAG ADOPT BLUEPRINT GROWTH
6 WITH 8A FACTOR WEIGHTS. THAT OPTION PERFORMS FAR WORSE ON
7 PARTICULAR EQUITY MEASURES THAT EITHER HMC OR OPTION 6A WE
8 SHOULD GO WITH EITHER ONE OF THOSE. I DON'T HAVE A STRONG
9 PREFERENCE EITHER WAY HOWEVER 8A IS BETTER IN TERMS EVER
10 FOCUSING GROWTH NEAR JOBS.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS THOM BUTT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I'M AN ALTERNATE ON THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND
15 MAYOR OF THE CITY OF RICHARD. I HAVE REPRESENTED RICHMOND AS
16 AN ELECTED OFFICIAL FOR THE PAST 25 YEARS. I CAN ENSURE THAT
17 OUR COMMUNITY IS RICH IN CULTURAL DIVERSITY BUT IT'S BLESSED
18 WITH A WIDE VARIETY OF TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS MULTIPLE BUS
19 LINES BART AMTRAK AND TWO INTERSTATE FREEWAYS. FOR THESE
20 REASONS OUR CITY WANTS TO GROW AND IS POISED FOR
21 REVITALIZATION AND REDEVELOPMENT INCLUDING BROWNFIELDS WHILE
22 WE APPRECIATE THE BEST INTENTIONS OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY
23 COMMITTEE MEMBERS I'M HERE TO URGE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD TO DO
24 THE FOLLOWING. NUMBER ONE, REJECT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY
25 COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION THAT USES THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050

October 15, 2020

1 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE METHODOLOGY. BECAUSE IT WOULD
2 INAPPROPRIATELY ASSIGN HOUSING TO THE OUTER EDGE OF THE REGION
3 AWAY FROM THE REGION'S HIGHEST WAGE JOB EARNERS. SECOND, THIS
4 WOULD MEAN DISINCENTIVIZING BROWNFIELDS. THE CHANGE WILL LEAD
5 TO OPPORTUNITIES ON GREENFIELDS TO OUTER EDGES OF THE REGION.
6 INSTEAD ON BEHALF OF THE CONTRA COSTA MAYOR'S CONFERENCE I
7 URGE THE BOARD TO ADOPT CONTRA COSTA'S ALTERNATIVE METHODOLOGY
8 BECAUSE IT PRODUCES A HOUSING ASSIGNMENT PATTERN CONSISTENT
9 WITH THE BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AND THE REGION'S LONG-TERM
10 VISION FOR A GREATER JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADAM
13 BUCKBINDER. GO AHEAD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. GO AHEAD.

14

15 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ADAM, WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. BUT YOU
16 SHOULD BE ABLE TO SPEAK. WE'LL COME BACK TO YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS TIM FRANK.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU SEE ME? [LAUGHTER] JUST THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
25 I REALLY APPRECIATE THIS DISCUSSION, AND I APPRECIATE THE VERY

October 15, 2020

1 HARD WORK THAT STAFF DID. I HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THE WORK OF
2 THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE FROM THE BEGINNING, AND I
3 CAN TELL YOU THAT WHEN I WAS FIRST LOOKING AT THE OPTIONS,
4 BEFORE I SAW THE EXTENSIVE ANALYSIS THAT STAFF D I DIDN'T KNOW
5 WHICH WAY I WOULD BE POINTING. BUT THE EVALUATION THAT THE
6 STAFF DID ACROSS A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT METRICS WAS ACTUALLY
7 COMPELLING. AND I AGREE WITH THE STAFF THAT THE
8 RECOMMENDATIONS THEY MADE FAVORING OPTION 6A. IT ACTUALLY BEST
9 IN TERMS OF A BROAD RANGE OF CRITERIA. AND IT CLEARLY IS THE
10 BEST FROM FAIR HOUSING. AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT A
11 FAIR HOUSING EMPHASIS WILL NOT ONLY PLACE MORE HOMES IN AREAS
12 WHERE PEOPLE WILL DO BETTER. IT CAN EVEN SERVE ESSENTIALLY A
13 VERY EFFECTIVE REGIONAL WORKFORCE STRATEGY IF YOU TAKE A
14 GROCERY STORE WORKER, SAY THE WHOLE FOODS IN SAN RAFAEL, BUT
15 WHO LIVES IN SOME PLACE LIKE SAN PABLO --

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOUR TIME IS UP.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** -- THEIR KIDS GET TO GO TO THE MARIN COUNTY SCHOOLS
20 AND ACTUALLY WILL DO MUCH BETTER.

21

22 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** TIME IS UP.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS FERNANDO MARTI.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **FERNANDO MARTI:** GOOD AFTERNOON -- [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO
2 DIFFICULTIES]

3

4 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** FERNANDO, WE'RE HAVING DIFFICULTY
5 HEARING YOU. FRANK, COULD YOU RESTART HIS TIME?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR.

8

9 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** FERNANDO ARE YOU THERE?

10

11 **FERNANDO MARTI:** I WANT TO REITERATE THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT
12 WENT INTO OPTION 8A THAT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE AS VICE
13 MAYOR ROMERO MENTIONED EARLIER THAT STAFF HAD INITIALLY
14 RECOMMENDED OPTION 6A, WHICHEVER WAY WE END UP HERE, TONIGHT,
15 I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO MAINTAIN WHAT WE WERE TRYING TO DO
16 THROUGH THAT WHOLE PERIOD, WHICH WAS IN LARGE PART TO
17 UNDERSTAND HOW WE PLACE HOUSING IN A WAY -- IN A WAY THAT
18 MEETS FURTHERING AFFIRMATIVE FAIR HOUSING GOALS. WHEREVER YOU
19 END UP, THERE WAS A LOT OF GOOD WORK THAT WENT INTO 8A AND 6A
20 BUT THOSE ARE THE DIRECTIONS WE NEED TO BE GOING IN AND ONE OF
21 THE MAPS PRESENTED SHOW IN VERY STARK VISUAL FORM HOW THE
22 PLANNED BAY AREA GROWTH SCENARIO IS DIFFERENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER ELIZABETH GO
25 AHEAD.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M ELIZABETH SAN FRANCISCO FOUNDATION MY WORK IS
3 HELPING TO ADVANCE EQUITABLE OUTCOMES FOR THE REGION BASED ON
4 CHANGES IN THE BUILT IN ENVIRONMENT. AND I WANT TO START BY
5 GIVING A HUGE THANKS TO STAFF AND FOR THE HMC FOR THE THOROUGH
6 AND COMPLEX WORK THEY HAVE ACCOMPLISHED AND TO THE BOARD I
7 WANT TO ASK YOU TO ADOPT THE HMC RECOMMENDED METHODOLOGY OR
8 THE 6A EQUITY ADJUSTMENT WITH THIS DECISION AND THE UPCOMING
9 DECISIONS THAT WILL FOLLOW ON THIS ONE. WE, AS A REGION, WE
10 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHIFT OUR EXISTING SEGREGATED LAND USE
11 PATTERNS TO BE MORE EQUITABLE, TO MEET THE STATUTORY
12 OBJECTIVES SET OUT IN RHNA TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR
13 HOUSING AND TO ENSURE BY DOING THAT RACIALLY AND ECONOMICALLY
14 EXCLUSIVE JURISDICTIONS ARE ALLOWED THEIR FAIR SHARE OF
15 HOUSING ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS TIM McGALLIAN.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU EVERYONE MY NAME IS MAYOR TIM M FROM THE
20 CITY OF CONCORD. THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING US TO HAVE THIS
21 CONVERSATION DON'T LOOK AT THIS AGAIN 8A HAS BEEN CALLED NOT
22 PERFECT BY THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND FORCES ARE ALLOCATION OF
23 IMBALANCE EVER UNITS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS WHICH INCLUDES
24 AREAS OF SIGNIFICANT INFRASTRUCTURE, TRANSPORTATION
25 CONSTRAINTS AND POOR TRANSIT PROXIMITY. THIS METHOD WILL

October 15, 2020

1 CONTINUE TO HAVE THE SUPER COMMUTER TREND FROM OUTLYING AREAS
2 AND JOB CENTERS, WHICH WILL EXACERBATE GHG EMISSIONS AND
3 FURTHER DEGRADE OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AND IN THIS VIEW
4 THIS COMPROMISE IS NOT NECESSARILY MIDDLE OF THE ROAD THERE IS
5 A LOT MORE THAT BE DONE. CITY OF CONCORD IS LARGEST IN CONTRA
6 COSTA COUNTY BUT A CORRIDOR FOR HUGE IMPACT ON OUR STREETS AND
7 GRIDLOCK AND QUALITY OF LIFE FOR OUR RESIDENTS BUT ALSO GHG
8 EMISSIONS IS SOMETHING THAT IS SIGNIFICANT WE NEED TO BE
9 BETTER ABLE TO MATCH JOBS WITH HOUSING IN ORDER TO DEVELOP A
10 BETTER OUTCOME AND A GREENER OUTCOME, WE URGE THE COMMITTEE TO
11 DO A BETTER JOB IN TAKING THIS BACK. TAKE A LITTLE EXTRA TIME
12 AND HOPEFULLY FIGURE OUT A WAY TO COME UP WITH FINALIZING THE
13 METHODOLOGY THAT WORKS FOR EVERYONE.

14

15 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MARCUS HELMER.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I RECOMMEND THE BEST FOR EQUITY AND CLIMATE CHANGE
20 I'M ASKING THAT ABAG DO ITS BEST TO UPHOLD ITS GOAL TO REDUCE
21 GREENHOUSE GAS. AS SOMEONE WHO LIVES IN A HIGH FIRE RISK AREA
22 AND HAD FAMILY EVACUATED TWICE IN THE LAST FIRE I WOULD ASK
23 THAT WE MOVE QUICKLY AND PLACE HOUSING TO JOBS. AS FAR NAPA IT
24 WILL BE OUR RESPONSIBILITY TO PUT OUR TINY ALLOCATION IN LOW

October 15, 2020

1 FIRE RISK URBANIZED AREAS. PLEASE ADOPT THE HMC RECOMMENDATION
2 OPTION 8A. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER SHAJUTI HOSSAIN.
5 GO AHEAD.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SHAJUTI HOSSAIN AN ATTORNEY AS PUBLIC
8 ADVOCATES. SO THE CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE
9 ON ITS WEB SITE EXPLAINS THAT THE OPPORTUNITY MAPS ARE BASED
10 OFF OF TEN DIFFERENT FACTORS ACROSS ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT AND
11 EDUCATIONAL DO MAINTENANCE THEY LOOK AT POVERTY, EMPLOYMENT
12 JOB PROXIMITY MEDIAN HOME VALUE AND THEY USE CALENVIROSCREEN
13 LOOKING AT INDICATES INCLUDING GROUNDWATER AND HAZARD WASTE.
14 THEY LOOK AT EDUCATION RATES. ALL EVER THESE THINGS GO INTO
15 THE OPPORTUNITY PLANS. JOBS/HOUSING FIT IS THE RATIO OF LOW
16 WAGE JOBS TO LOW-WAGE WORKERS WE HAVE CITIES THAT ARE 10 TO 20
17 JOBS THAT IS AFFORDABLE TO LOW-WAGE WORKERS. I URGE TO YOU
18 ADOPT 6A.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER RICK BONILLA. UNMUTE YOURSELF
21 PLEASE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** RICK BONILLA CITY OF SAN MATEO. I WAS FORTUNATE TO BE
24 A MEMBER OF HMC AND RPC. I TOTAL SUPPORT 6A WITH THE EQUITY
25 ADJUSTMENT. HOWEVER, AS A FALL BACK, I ALSO SUPPORT 8A BECAUSE

October 15, 2020

1 IT GETS CLOSE ENOUGH, CLOSER TO WHAT REALLY IS THE IMPORTANT
2 THING, WHICH IS AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. WE SAT
3 THROUGH 12 MONTHS I WAS ONE WHO VOTED AFFIRMATIVELY ON 8A WHEN
4 THAT CAME DOWN AS A CHOICE AND IT'S BEEN A LONG AND DIFFICULT
5 PROCESS. IN A LOT OF OUR CITIES WE HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE
6 PUBLIC USUALLY THEY'RE THE ONES WHO FEEL VERY CONFIDENT THEY
7 ARE PRIVILEGED THEY HAVE ACCESS AND A VOICE. LET ME REMIND YOU
8 THAT THERE ARE THOUSANDS OF OTHER PEOPLE OUT THERE WHO DON'T
9 HAVE THE SAME CONDITIONS. AND I HEAR THEM THEY NEED A PLACE TO
10 LIVE CLOSE TO THEIR JOB. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU SIR. SCOTT LITTLEHALE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD MY NAME
15 IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE RESEARCHER FOR THE CARPENTERS UNION. WE
16 REPRESENT TENS OF THOUSANDS OF MEN AND WOMEN WHO LIVE AND/OR
17 WORK IN THE BAY AREA COUNTIES. WE DON'T HAVE A PARTICULAR AX
18 TO GRIND IN THE ALLOCATION PROCESS BESIDES INCREASING
19 OPPORTUNITIES FOR WORKING CLASS AND MIDDLE CLASS HOUSEHOLDS
20 WHERE CONSTRUCTION JOBS ARE REASONABLY PROXIMITY. HMC MEMBERS
21 DID A DILIGENT JOB TRYING TO BALANCE STATUTORY REQUIREMENT IN
22 SEEKING METHODOLOGY THAT IS NEITHER AD-HOC NOR INEXPLICABLE.
23 IT BALANCES MORE HOUSING IN JURISDICTIONS WITH JOBS. IN TERMS
24 ACROSS THE CITIES AND COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA THAN WAS A THE

October 15, 2020

1 CASE IN THE PREVIOUS PLANNING CYCLE, THE NUMBERS ARE JUST
2 LARGER. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER AARON ECKHOUSE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS AARON ECKHOUSE REGIONAL
7 POLICY MANAGER FOR YIMBY YES IN MY BACKYARD. I URGE YOU TO
8 UPHOLD 8A TO TAKE A DEEP DIVE AND BALANCE ACROSS THE REGION
9 WITH 2050 HOUSEHOLDS AS A BASELINE. WE THINK THIS METHODOLOGY
10 DOES A GREAT JOB OF ADVANCING BOTH EQUITY AND SUSTAINABILITY
11 GOALS. TO THE CONCERN OF UNINCORPORATED COUNTY AREAS. I AGREE
12 THAT'S SOMETHING ABAG CAN RESOLVE IN THE NEXT TWO MONTHS IN
13 THE PUBLIC COMMENT PROCESS. IT DOESN'T NECESSITATE THROWING
14 OUT THE ENTIRE METHODOLOGY. AND I WOULD SAY WE'RE COMMITTED TO
15 WORKING WITH YOU AND HELPING YOU PLAN FOR YOUR RHNA ALLOCATION
16 IN A WAY THAT FURTHERS SUSTAINABLE EQUITABLE GROWTH.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS BOBBY LOPEZ.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD EVENING BOARD MEMBERS. WE AGREE WITH THE
21 ROAMS TO MOVE MORE HOUSING TO JOBS. WE BELIEVE THIS IS BEST
22 ACCOMPLISHED WITH OPTION 6A WITH AN EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. IT
23 KNOCKS IT OUT OF THE PARK WITH METRICS. WITH CENTRAL CITY
24 NEIGHBORHOODS COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN DRIVING UP -- FORCING
25 FAMILIES OUT. LOOKING FOR A JOBS/HOUSING FIT IS HOW ADDRESS

October 15, 2020

1 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND TRANSIT AND EQUITY. SEE IF WE CAN
2 POTENTIALLY LOOK AT OUR COMMERCIAL ZONING ONLY ALLOWED FOR
3 RESIDENTIAL. IN A STUDY OF SHOPPING MALLS TWO YEARS AGO IN THE
4 BAY AREA WE IDENTIFIED 200 POTENTIAL SITES LARGER THAN ONE
5 ACRE IN SIZE FOR POTENTIAL HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. HOUSING WAS
6 NOT PERMITTED ON 75 PERCENT OF THESE PROPERTIES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ALLISON.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. WE SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO
11 ADOPT THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED ALLOCATION OPTION 8A
12 METHODOLOGY WITH THE 2050 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE. IT MEANS IN THIS
13 REASON CYCLE THIS PROCESS MUST PROVIDE MORE ACCESS TO
14 OPPORTUNITY RICH AREAS FOR THE PEOPLE PREVIOUSLY EXCLUDED FROM
15 THEM. THE METHODOLOGY FOR ALLOCATION RECOMMENDED TONIGHT WOULD
16 RESULT IN HIGHER ALLOCATION OF LOWER INCOME HOMES TO
17 JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE RICH IN HIGH WAGE JOBS AND GOOD SCHOOLS
18 AND WE UNDERSTAND THIS HAS HAD AN IMPACT ON THE GEOGRAPHY
19 DISTRIBUTION. WE KNOW THIS IS GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE TO
20 EVERYONE AND THIS IS EARLY IN THE PROCESS AND WILL BECOME MORE
21 CHALLENGING BECAUSE OF NEW STATE LAWS GUIDING THE PROCESS. WE
22 HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO RESPOND TO OUR REGION'S HOUSING
23 CRISIS. THIS IS A CHANCE FOR EVERY LOCAL COMMUNITY TO ACCEPT
24 RESPONSIBILITY, WEIGH IN, TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE REAP FUNDING
25 FOR PLANNING ASSISTANCE AND SHAPE THE WAY DEVELOPMENT HAPPENS

October 15, 2020

1 IN THEIR COMMUNITIES. WE NEED EVERY COMMUNITY TO EMBRACE THESE
2 CHALLENGES AND RESPONSIBILITIES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN M.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS JOHN M MEMBER OF EAST BAY FOR
7 EVERYONE. I HAVE BEEN OBSERVING THE HMC MEETING THIS IS YEAR
8 AND I WANT TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT TONIGHT FOR USING THE 2050
9 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE AND FOR TRYING TO FOLLOW THE IDENTIFIED
10 EVALUATION METRICS. I SAW THE COMMITTEE BEING GIVEN A HUGE
11 NUMBER OF CRITERIA AND VIEWPOINTS TO BALANCE AND IN THE ENDS
12 THEY DID WELL IN THE BALANCING ACT. THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
13 SHOULD REVIEW THE METRICS I RESPECT 8A IS A COMPROMISE. NEAR
14 JOBS AND WILL SHARE A HOUSING BURDEN IT IS NOT A NEW IDEA BUT
15 ONE WHO IS TIME HAS COME AFTER LONG RUNNING CONVERSATION. IT'S
16 NOT SUFFICIENT BUT IS NECESSARY. 2050 HOUSEHOLDS ARE THE ONES
17 THAT MAKE PROGRESS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JEFF LEVIN.
20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WHY DON'T WE GO JUSTINE AND COME
23 BACK TO JOE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER JUSTINE MARCUS.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THERE I'M JUSTINE MARCUS. WHEN THIS PROCESS
3 BEGAN OVER A YEAR AGO WE KNEW IT WOULD BE DIFFERENT WITH MORE
4 HOUSING NEEDS AND MORE METHODOLOGY WOULD ARE REQUIRED WE KNEW
5 THAT IT WOULDN'T BE BUSINESS AS USUAL IF WE'RE GOING TO
6 MEANINGFULLY GOING TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING CRISIS. WATCHING OF
7 THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE I WAS HEARTENED TO SEE IT
8 WAS NOT BUSINESS AS USUAL AND THAT THIS DIVERSE SET OF MEMBERS
9 FROM ACROSS THE REGION ENGAGED WITH DETAILS AND MADE A
10 RECOMMENDATION THAT BALANCES ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY, JOBS AND
11 MITIGATING CLIMATE CHANGE. I URGE TO YOU ADOPT OPTION 8A WITH
12 THE 2050 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE ALONG WITH A RESOLUTION TO
13 UNINCORPORATED AREAS. I WANT TO CALL OUT THE 2050 GROWTH
14 BASELINE PERFORMS POORLY WITH STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS
15 ESPECIALLY AROUND AFFIRM THISTLE FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU NEXT SPEAKER.

18

19 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** THANK YOU. NEYSA FLIGOR, LOS ALTOS MAYOR, MEMBER
20 OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND THE REGIONAL PLANNING
21 COMMITTEE. IN SELECTING OPTION A, THE HMC MEMBERS EVALUATED
22 AND CONSIDERED MANY OPTIONS. FACTORS WEIGHTING THESE FACTORS
23 AND BASELINES. THE HMC PROCESS THOUGH COMPLICATED WAS
24 EXTREMELY THOROUGH. HMC MEMBERS RECOMMENDED OPTION A BECAUSE
25 IT ADVANCES THE RHNA STATUTORY OBJECTIVES ALLOWS EQUITABLE

October 15, 2020

1 DISTRIBUTION THROUGHOUT THE REGION. CONSIDERS OPEN SPACE AND
2 IT IS A STRONG METHODOLOGY TO SUBMIT TO THE HCD FOR APPROVAL
3 THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY WILL HAVE THE LARGEST SHARE UNDER
4 OPTION A THE COUNTY IS 1 OF 3 JURISDICTIONS UNDER WHICH ITS
5 SHARE OF RHNA ALLOCATION WOULD EXCEED SHARE OF BAY AREA
6 HOUSEHOLDS SIMILAR TO OTHER COUNTIES OUR MEMBER JURISDICTION
7 AND ELECTED OFFICIALS ARE QUESTIONING WHERE THEY WILL BUILD A
8 SHARE OF SHARE ALLOCATED UNITS THEREFORE WE STRONGLY OPPOSE
9 OPTIONS THAT WOULD INCREASE THE ALLOCATION TO SANTA CLARA
10 COUNTY BUT WE BELIEVE 8A WAS A COLLABORATIVE PROCESS RESULT
11 AND A REGIONAL SOLUTION. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS RUBY S.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. HI. I'M CALL IN TO SUPPORT OPTION 8A OR 6A,
16 THE HMC RECOMMENDED METHODOLOGY. I FIND IT, YOU KNOW, A LITTLE
17 BIT DISRESPECTFUL THAT WE SPENT -- AND TO ALL OF THE MEMBERS
18 ON THE HMC COMMITTEE THAT WE SPENT OVER A YEAR WORKING ON THIS
19 TOGETHER COLLABORATIVELY IN A REALLY IMPORTANT WAY TO
20 DEMONSTRATE HOW WE WOULD GROW OUR REGION OVER THE NEXT TEN
21 YEARS. SO, I THINK IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FROM A FURTHER
22 FROM AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING PERSPECTIVE.
23 ESPECIALLY IN THIS MOMENT WHEN WE WANT TO LOOK BACK AND SAY
24 OUR METHODOLOGY INCREASED MORE INTEGRATED COMMUNITIES, LEAD TO
25 BETTER OUTCOMES AND DECREASED WEALTH GAPS ON HOME OWNERSHIP. I

October 15, 2020

1 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THE PROCESS IS HONORED AS OPPOSED TO
2 FOLKS COMING IN AT THE LAST MINUTE. I THINK THAT'S A THREAT TO
3 AN EQUITABLE PROCESS. I STRONGLY ENCOURAGE FOLKS TO SUPPORT 8A
4 OR 6A THAT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE DID.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER JILANI KELLINGS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** MAYOR OF THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH I'M HERE TO URGE THE
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD TO HOLD OFF ON APPROVING THE HOUSING
10 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION. JUST TO CONSIDER THE
11 CONTRA COSTA ALTERNATIVE METHODOLOGY. IN PITTSBURGH OUR CITY
12 ENVISIONS A FUTURE OF ENGAGED RESIDENTS EXPANDED LOCAL ECONOMY
13 WITH QUALITY JOBS AND IMPROVED TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT
14 CONNECTIONS ALL OF US TOGETHER BUT WE CANNOT REALIZE THIS
15 VISION IF REGIONAL AGENCIES UNDER WELL INTENDED AND MISGUIDED
16 RECOMMENDATIONS CONTINUE TO CONSIDER CONTRA COSTA UNFAIR
17 BURDEN EVER HOUSING UNITS THIS MEANS OUR CITY MUST DEDICATE
18 HAVE A VACANT LAND FOR MORE HOUSING WHEN WHAT WE NEED ARE
19 JOBS. FURTHER DEGRADING OUR AIR QUALITY. LEAVING OUR RESIDENTS
20 TIRED FROM THEIR LONG COMMUTES AND RENDER LESS ABLE TO ENGAGE
21 IN THE MANNER IN WHICH WE HAVE ENVISIONED FOR THOSE PURPOSE WE
22 ASK YOU TO RECONSIDER AND LOOK AT THE CONTRA COSTA
23 METHODOLOGY.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CINDY SILVA.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CINDY SILVA MAYOR THE CONTRA
3 COSTA THANK YOU IF THE BOARD MEMBERS ON OUR BEHALF CONTRA
4 COSTA AGREES WITH THE PREMISE THAT WE NEED TO BUILD MORE
5 HOUSING AND WITH THE 441,000 UNITS THE CHANGE IS NOT THE
6 NUMBER IT'S ALLOCATION ACROSS THE REGION GIVEN A SERIES OF
7 COMPLEX AND COMPETING PRIORITIES. YOU ALL MENTIONED THEM
8 EARLIER. VMT, GHG CONGESTION, LACK OF ADEQUATE TRANSIT. I WANT
9 TO FOCUS ON THE METRIC OF HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS IT IS
10 LAUDABLE BUT FLAWED BECAUSE IT ASSUMES HIGH WAGE CENTERS WILL
11 CONTINUE WELL INTO THE FUTURE IN FACT TO SECURE A CERTIFIED
12 HOUSING ELEMENT THESE CITIES IN THESE OUTLYING AREAS WILL BE
13 FORCED TO RESUME COMMERCIAL AREAS JOB RICH AREAS WE WILL HAVE
14 FEWER JOBS NOT MORE JOBS AS THE EXECUTIVE BOARD OF ELECTED
15 OFFICIALS YOU HAVE LOTS OF REASON TO STEP BACK AND THINK
16 THROUGH TO FIND THE BEST ALTERNATIVE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER SERENA. PLEASE
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS SERENA. I AM A HOUSING COMMISSIONER.
22 CAN YOU HEAR ME OKAY?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, MA'AM.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. HOUSING COMMISSIONER CANDIDATE RUNNING FOR CITY
2 COUNCIL. I'M HERE SPEAKING BY MYSELF. SO HIGH HOUSING -- SO I
3 SUPPORT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
4 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE WITH 6A, EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. THAT'S WHAT I
5 SUPPORT. SO GIVE ME AN IDEA, BECAUSE WE HAVE HIGH OPPORTUNITY,
6 A SUPPOSE HIGH OPPORTUNITY, HIGH JOB, THAT SUPPORTS RHNA, A
7 LEGAL REQUIREMENT AND PLAN FOR BAY AREA WHERE ALL RESIDENTS
8 CAN LIVE AND WORK CLOSE TOGETHER. SORRY. I JUST GOT A CALL AND
9 I GOT RATTLED BY THAT. THE PANDEMIC AND PROTEST FOR RACIAL
10 JUSTICE OR HIGHLIGHTING DEFICIENCIES AND LACK OF CARE FOR
11 MINORITY BLACK AND BROWN INDIVIDUALS ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND THE
12 FAMILIES WHO COMMUTE LONG DISTANCES. SO, BASICALLY WHAT I'M
13 TRYING TO SAY IS THAT I REALLY -- THEY WORKED HARD. THE AGENCY
14 WORKED HARD AND I SUPPORT 6A WITH EQUITY ADJUSTMENT. THANK
15 YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER STEVEN SCHARFF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI MAYOR OF CUPERTINO WITH THE RECOMMENDATION 60
20 PERCENT REMOTE WORKING AND BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM'S GOAL OF THE
21 END OF INTERNAL COMBUSTION POWERED VEHICLES WE NEED A MORE
22 INTUITIVE RHNA METHODOLOGY THAT TAKES INTO ACCOUNT COVID-19 AND
23 DRASTIC CHANGES IN HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION THAT ARE ALREADY
24 OCCURRING AND THAT TAKES INTO ACCOUNT LAND USE AND
25 TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES. THE BIGGEST ISSUE WITH RHNA IS THAT

October 15, 2020

1 CITIES DON'T BUILD HOUSING DEVELOPERS BUILD HOUSING WE HAVE
2 ENTITLED AND PROVED MORE THAN 300 PERCENT OF OUR CURRENT RHNA
3 IRONICALLY THE ONLY PROJECT BUILT IS 19 UNIT 350 SQUARE FOOT
4 STUDIOS THAT COST \$800,000 TO BUILD. NONE OF THE OTHER
5 PROJECTS ARE BEING BUILT DUE TO ECONOMIC REASONS. WE'RE NOT
6 GETTING OUR REQUIRED INCLUSIONARY VMR BECAUSE MARKET RATE
7 HOUSING IS BEING BUILT. WHAT WE NEED IS STATE FUNDING TO BUILD
8 THE HOUSING IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT. WE CAN AND WILL MEET OUR
9 RHNA BUT JUST LIKE THIS CYCLE, ACTUALLY HAVING IT BUILT IS A
10 WHOLE 'NOTHER STORY. THANK YOU.

11

12 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER KELSEY BANES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING MY NAME IS KELSEY RESIDENT OF PALO ALTO
17 AND REGIONAL EXECUTIVE BOARD IN YIMBY ACTION AND WOULD
18 ENCOURAGE YOU TO ADOPT HMC RECOMMENDATION OF 8A. WE ENVISION A
19 BAY AREA THAT IS BOTH MORE EQUITABLE AND MORE SUSTAINABLE AND
20 WE CAN DO THIS WITH DENSITY. WE ARE IN A TIME CRISIS AND WE
21 REALLY NEED BOLD ACTION TO BOTH ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGER AND
22 REDUCE RACIAL SEGREGATION. ALTERNATIVE PRESENTED BY CONTRA
23 COSTA COUNTY WOULD FURTHER PERPETUATE SEGREGATION AND WOULD
24 EXEMPT PLACES LIKE ATHERTON FROM BUILDING MORE HOUSING. AND
25 WOULD NOT AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING AS REQUIRED. FROM

October 15, 2020

1 A PALO ALTO PERSPECTIVE, A LOT OF PEOPLE IN OUR CITY ARE
2 COMPLAINING THAT WE CAN'T DO IT. I BELIEVE THAT WE CAN, AND I
3 WOULD SAY STEVEN SCHARFF IS BEHIND ME AT A SAN MATEO CITY
4 COUNCIL MEETING AND SAID OF THE MILLENNIALS BEGGING FOR
5 HOUSING SHOULD JUST LEAVE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER MICHAEL BRILLOT.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI I WAS A MEMBER OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY
10 COMMITTEE AND DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR THE CITY OF SAN JOSE. THE
11 CITY OF SAN JOSE SUBMITTED A LETTER TODAY IN RECOMMENDATION
12 FOR HMC USING OPTION 8A REFLECTING THE COLLABORATIVE PROCESS
13 OF HMC AND INCORPORATES THE NINE COUNTY GOAL FOR A SUSTAINABLE
14 REGION AND ACHIEVES STATUTORY OBJECTIVES OF RHNA. ALTERNATIVE
15 METHODOLOGIES ARE BEING PUT FORWARD USING BLUEPRINT GROWTH AS
16 BASELINE WHICH SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCES ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY AND
17 UNDERMINES RHNA'S STATUTORY OBJECTIVES TO AFFIRMATIVELY
18 FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. IT WAS ALSO INCREASE SANTA CLARA
19 COUNTY'S SHARE OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION
20 FROM 33 PERCENT UNDER OPTION 8A TO 45 PERCENT. DESPITE THE
21 FACT IT ONLY HAS 24 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA POPULATION. PLEASE
22 SUPPORT OPTION -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GABRIEL QUINTO.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** GABE CITY OF EL CERRITO. I AM CHAIR OF THE CONTRA
2 COSTA CONFERENCE AND I STAND WITH MY COLLEAGUES AND RECOMMEND
3 THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REJECT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY'S
4 COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION THAT USES PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
5 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE METHODOLOGY BECAUSE IT WOULD
6 INAPPROPRIATELY ASSIGN HOUSING TO THE OUTER EDGES OF THE
7 REGION AWAY FROM THE REGION'S HIGHEST WAGE JOB CENTERS. THIS
8 WOULD AGGRAVATE EXCESSIVE COMMUTES GENERATING MORE GREENHOUSE
9 GAS EMISSIONS ESSENTIALLY REVERSING HARD WORK AND PROGRESS ON
10 CLIMATE CHANGE. INSTEAD I URGE THE BOARD TO ADOPT CONTRA COSTA
11 ALTERNATIVE METHODOLOGY BECAUSE IT PRODUCES A HOUSE ASSIGNMENT
12 PATTERN CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AND
13 THE REGION'S LONG-TERM VISION FOR A GREATER JOBS/HOUSING
14 BALANCE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER JOSHUA HUB. UNMUTE
17 PLEASE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** APOLOGIES. GOOD EVENING MY NAME IS JOSH SPEAKING ON
20 BEHALF OF THE REGIONAL OPEN SPACE DISTRICT. WE ARE DEEPLY
21 CONCERNED WITH THE STEEP INCREASE IN HOUSING ALLOCATIONS FOR
22 UNINCORPORATED COUNTIES AND OPTION 8A. THIS WILL FORCE
23 COUNTIES TO LOOK BEYOND TRADITIONAL URBANIZED IN AREAS TO
24 GREENFIELD LOCATIONS. PREFERENCE IS OPTION 8A WILL BE REVISED
25 TO BE CONSISTENT WITH THE STATE CLIMATE ACTION GOALS AND

October 15, 2020

1 CONSERVATION STRATEGIES AS A STEWARD OF SEVERAL PCAS WE KNOW
2 THAT LANDS PROVIDE CRITICAL ECOSYSTEMS TO SUPPORT URBAN AREAS
3 WITH CLEAN AIR WATER FOOD AND URBAN RESPITE FOR THE PUBLIC.
4 OUR CONCERNS IS THE HOUSING IN WILDLIFE INTERFACE INCREASE
5 WILDFIRES AND INCREASE RISK TO SENSITIVE HABITATS AND ENHANCES
6 RISK OF EXPOSURE OF OUR PREDATOR POPULATIONS TO ROW DENT
7 SIDES. HABITAT TO REFRESH ENABLED MOVEMENT ACROSS THE LAND
8 SCAPE. WE URGE THE BOARD TO MAINTAIN A BALANCE BETWEEN THE
9 BUILT IN ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL LANDS THAT PLANNED BAY AREA
10 HAS SUCCESSFULLY PROTECTED UP UNTIL NOW.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN CHAN.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MEMBERS OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE. THANK YOU
15 FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP IN THESE TIMES. MY NAME IS KEN. WE WORK
16 CAN COMMUNITY LEADERS TO PRESERVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING. I AM
17 ASKING THAT YOU ADOPT OPTION 8A. RECENTLY A MET A COMMUNITY
18 MEMBER SHE IS A MEMBER OF FOUR SHE HAS DEDICATED HER LIFE TO
19 EDUCATING THE CHILDREN OF OUR COMMUNITY HOWEVER IN SPITE OF
20 HER BEST EFFORTS SHE FOUND HERSELF BEING A PAYCHECK AWAY FROM
21 HAVING A PLACE TO CALL HOME. IF THE BOARD CHOOSES NOT TO ADOPT
22 TONIGHT'S RECOMMENDED METHODOLOGY. TO LOSE HER WOULD BE A
23 GREAT LOSS. WE ASK YOU ADOPT HMC8A RECOMMENDED METHODOLOGY
24 USING THE PLANNED BAY AREA BASELINE. THANK YOU.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROD SINKS.

2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **DIR. ROD SINKS:** THANK YOU. SO I'M AN ALTERNATE ABAG EXECUTIVE
5 BOARD MEMBER AND RESIDENT OF CUPERTINO. I WOULD ENCOURAGE THE
6 OPTION 8A. IT'S APPROPRIATE TO HAVE A HIGHER DISTRIBUTION TO
7 JURISDICTIONS WITH GREATER RESOURCES. IT'S A VERY IMPORTANT
8 WAY WE CORRECT LONG-STANDING INEQUITY AND HOUSING. I HAVE
9 HEARD OFFICIALS FIGHTING TO BLOCK, HOW IN THE WORLD ARE WE
10 GOING TO PAY FOR ALL THIS VMR WE HAVE 15 PERCENT HOUSING
11 INCLUSION'S REQUIREMENT AS WELL AS SUBSTANTIAL DEVELOPMENT
12 IMPACT FEES. SO WE WILL PAY FOR IT WHEN WE ENTITLE MARKET RATE
13 DEVELOPMENT INCLUDING HOUSING AT ALL INCOME LEVELS THAT PAYS
14 FOR THAT VMR. WE CAN DO THIS. AND I HOPE THE REGION IS WILLING
15 TO MOVE FORWARD. WE ARE SITTING IN A MASSIVE HOUSING CRISIS.
16 WE NEED TO MAKE THIS WORK.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS TOMIQUIA
19 BENNETT. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. HIGH NAME IS TOMIQUIA B. I AM WITH URBAN
22 HABITAT. I WANT TO TUTU TO BOARD MEMBERS AND STAFF FOR ALL OF
23 YOUR HARD WORK. I AM HERE THIS EVENING TO ASK THAT YOU ADOPT
24 OPTION 6A WHICH USES 2050 BASELINE AND THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT.
25 THE OTHER OPTIONS DISCUSSED THIS EVENING ARE NOT LIKELY TO

October 15, 2020

1 COMPLY WITH RHNA'S REQUIREMENTS. WE NEED A RHNA THAT'S GOING
2 MOVE US TOWARDS A FUTURE WHERE EVERYONE HAS A HEALTHY AND SAFE
3 PLACE TO LIVE AND CREATES A REGION THAT OFFERS OPPORTUNITY TO
4 EVERYONE WHO LIVES HERE. WE HAVE BEEN DEALING WITH A LOT OF
5 UNEXPECTED THINGS LEGALLY WITH THE COVID PANDEMIC AND THE
6 WILDFIRES, AND THAT JUST REMINDS US THAT WE NEED TO PLAN FOR
7 ON YOU FUTURE WHERE WE ALL CAN THRIVE REGARDLESS OF WHAT'S
8 COMING OUR WAY. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** BEFORE WE GO GOT NEXT SPEAKER, THE
13 NUMBER OF RAISED HANDS KEEPS GROWING SO I'M GOING TO ASK IF
14 YOU WANT TO SPEAK, RAISE YOUR HAND NOW. IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK
15 RAISE YOUR HAND NOW OR PRESS STAR NINE. I SEE WE HAVE NINE
16 RAISED HANDS.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MR. PRESIDENT MY NAME IS RODNEY NICKENS
21 RESIDENT OF OAKLAND. I PROPOSE ADOPTION OF 8A WHICH USES
22 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLDS AS ITS BASELINE. IN THE
23 HOUSING PAPER THE ROAD AHEAD NOW IS THE TIME TO TURN THE PAGE
24 AND WRITE A NEW CHAPTER IN OUR REGION'S HISTORY. A CHAPTER
25 WHERE ALL FAMILIES IN THE BAY AREA REGARDLESS OF RACE AND

October 15, 2020

1 INCOME CAN HAVE ACCESS TO SAFE AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WHILE
2 OPTION 6A WITH THE EQUITY ADJUSTMENT WAS THE SUPERIOR RACIAL
3 EQUITY PROPOSAL OPTION 8A STILL MOVES THE REGION FORWARD BY
4 UTILIZING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLDS AS ITS BASELINE
5 WHICH IS CRITICAL TO BALANCING CONSISTENCY WITH RHNA FAIR
6 HOUSING LAWS IN OUR REGION'S DIRE AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDS. WE
7 ARE AT A MOMENT OF RACIAL RECKONING UNLIKE ANY OTHER IN OUR
8 NATION WE MUST APPROVE RHNA A EIGHT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING BOARD MEMBERS MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES
13 LIFE-LONG SAN MATEO COUNTY RESIDENT. I AM HERE IN STRONG
14 SUPPORT OF OPTION 8A. AS WAS NOTED BY STAFF AND PREVIOUS
15 SPEAKERS THIS METHODOLOGY IS THE PRODUCT OF A YEAR OF HARD
16 WORK BY STAKEHOLDER GROUPS AND COMMUNITY ADVOCATES. THE BAY
17 AREA AND INDEED MOST OF CALIFORNIA HAS SPENT THE LAST SEVERAL
18 DECADES FOCUSING GROWTH LOCATION COMMUNITIES LIKE ALLOWING JOB
19 RICH AREAS TO WALL THEMSELVES OFF. WHILE I WOULD PREFER 8A,
20 THE RECOMMENDATION OF OPTION AT EIGHT -- EXCUSE ME WHILE I
21 WOULD HAVE PREFER THE 6A, 8A BEGINNING TO CORRECT HISTORIC
22 WRONGS. I ASK YOU TO REJECT CONTRA COSTA PLAN WHICH FAILS
23 POLICIES. IT IS UNACCEPTABLE AND ABAG SHOULD REJECT IT. WHILE
24 IT'S A REASONABLE COMPROMISE THAT SETS US ON AN EQUITABLE PATH

October 15, 2020

1 ADDRESSING OUR EVERY WORSENING HOUSING CRISIS. PLEASE MOVE
2 FORWARD WITH IT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN E.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CAN YOU HEAR ME? I AM JOHN E. WE ARE
7 THE SPONSORS OF THE SUCCESSFUL PROPOSITION MEASURE IN MARCH OF
8 THIS YEAR WHICH SAYS THERE WILL BE NO MORE OFFICE BUILDING IN
9 SAN FRANCISCO UNTIL THE ABAG RHNA GOALS FOR LOW INCOME HOUSING
10 ARE BUILT. THAT IS ESSENTIALLY WHAT MUST BE DONE FOR THE
11 ENTIRE BAY AREA. THIS ENTIRE PROCESS YOU ARE THIS IS A
12 FANTASY. THERE IS NOT TEN PERCENT OF THE FUNDING NEEDED TO
13 BUILD ALL OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNDER YOUR NUMBERS UNDER
14 ANY ALTERNATIVE. THE ONLY WAY TO ENSURE JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE
15 IS TO STOP COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT UNLESS AND UNTIL ALL NINE
16 COUNTIES THAT AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS ACTUALLY PRODUCED.
17 OTHERWISE, YOUR PLAN IS AN EXTENSION OF THAT, FOR THE LOW
18 INCOME COMMUNITIES OF SAN FRANCISCO AND ALL OUR ESSENTIAL
19 CITIES. THIS IS MADNESS WHAT YOU ARE DOING.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SYD KAPUR.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SYD K RESIDENT OF OAKLAND AND VOLUNTEER
24 WITH YIMBY ACTION FOR EVERYONE. I WANT TO SPEAK IN FAVOR OF
25 OPTION 8A. I DON'T KNOW HOW CLOSELY YOU ALL HAVE BEEN LOOKING

October 15, 2020

1 AT THE THESE CHARTS, BUT IF YOU LOOK AT OBJECTIVE ONE, THAT IS
2 LIKE, I'M GUESSING IT'S NUMBER ONE BECAUSE IT'S THE MOST
3 IMPORTANT METRIC HERE, THIS PROPOSED CONTRA COSTA PLAN,
4 PERFORMS MORE THAN 20 PERCENT WORSE ON THE METRIC. THIS IS NOT
5 JUST SAYING THAT THE AMOUNT OF HOUSING IN THE 25 JURISDICTIONS
6 IS 20 PERCENT WORSE THAN THE OTHER PLANS IT'S SAYING THE
7 JURISDICTIONS GET MORE THAN 20 PERCENT LESS OF THE ALLOCATION
8 THAN THE AVERAGE JURISDICTION WHICH IS JUST BIZARRE. ISN'T THE
9 POINT OF THIS PROCESS TO BUILD HOUSING IN -- [INDISCERNIBLE]
10 COMMUNITIES. IF YOU LOOK AT THE MAP. IT'S SIMILARLY BIZARRE.
11 WHY IS IT THAT JUST SOUTH OF THE COUNTY LINE BETWEEN SANTA
12 CLARA AND SAN MATEO, MOST OF THE CITIES GET OVER 30 OR 40
13 PERCENT IN INCREASE WHILE THE ONES IN SAN MATEO GET SINGLE
14 DIGITS IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JEFF LEVIN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** JEFF LEVIN WITH EAST BAY HOUSING ASSOCIATION AND A
19 MEMBER OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. WHILE I SUPPORTED
20 6A OPTION 8AS OF THE METHODOLOGY THAT THE COMMITTEE WAS THE
21 COMMITTEE WAS ABLE TO COMPROMISE ON AND FRANKLY GETTING THAT
22 MANY PEOPLE FROM DIVERSE BACKGROUNDS ON SOMETHING THIS
23 IMPORTANT SHOULD NOT BE BRUSHED ASIDE. WITH RESPECT TO THE
24 BASELINE ISSUE IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT RHNA DOESN'T
25 HAVE THE SAME BELIEFS AND REQUIREMENTS OF PLANNED BAY AREA. IN

October 15, 2020

1 ADDITION HOUSING BALANCE CLOSE TO TRANSIT RHNA MUST ADDRESS
2 RACIAL INEQUITY BY FURTHERING AFFIRMING AFFAIR HOUSING AND TO
3 LOW INCOME HOUSING BY A FAIL TOUR -- TO DO SO IN THE PAST.
4 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS HAS A SIGNIFICANT GROWTH FACTOR. AND I
5 JUST WANT TO NOTE THAT ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES
6 RECEIVE 34 PERCENT IN THE CURRENT CYCLE. THEY 29 PERCENT SHARE
7 UNDER 8A AND PROPOSAL CUTS TO 24 PERCENT THAT'S NOT
8 ACCEPTABLE. I URGE TO YOU ADOPT 8A.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROB EASTWOOD.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING ROB E DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF DEPARTMENT OF
13 PLANNING COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA SPEAKING ON THE METHODOLOGY
14 TONIGHT NOT TO THE WORK DONE BUT WITH THE METHODOLOGY, THE
15 UNINCORPORATED AREAS OF SANTA CLARA WOULD GET 4200 IN RHNA. WE
16 DESIGNATE THOSE LANDS FOR RESOURCE CONSERVATION AG
17 PRESERVATION. WE BELIEVE THAT A RHNA THIS HIGH WOULD FORCE US
18 TO REZONE THOSE LANDS FOR URBAN HOUSING IN CONFLICT WITH OUR
19 GENERAL PLAN AND IN CONFLICT OF PLANNED BAY AREA'S GOALS OF
20 LOWER GHG, LOWER VMT WE ASK STAFF TO DEVELOP THIS PROBLEM NOT
21 WITH SOMETHING IN CONFLICT WITH THE STATE LONG-TERM GOALS.
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ADAM BUCKBINDER.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HELLO. THANK YOU. HI. MY NAME IS ADAM B.
2 PLANNING COMMISSIONER IN THE CITY OF CAMPBELL HOWEVER I'M
3 SPEAKING HERE ONLY FOR MYSELF. PLEASE ADOPT THE HOUSING
4 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION 8A USING PLANNED BAY
5 AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLD RECOMMENDATION AS BASELINE. HMC HAS MET
6 FAIR SOLID YEAR WORKING ON THIS. MY CITY FOUR YEARS OF
7 UPDATING THE GENERAL PLAN FIVE YEARS IN NOW. I KNOW HOW HARD
8 IT IS TO CAST VALUE ON MAJOR DECISION LIKE THIS. WE DON'T WANT
9 TO MAKE A MISTAKE BUT AT SOME POINT WE NEED TO TRUST THE
10 PROCESS WE SETUP. THIS COMPLEMENTS FURTHERING AFFIRMING FAIR
11 HOUSING. AND PUTS JOBS CLOSE TO HOMES PLEASE ADOPT HMC'S
12 RECOMMENDATION. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MOONY M.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING MY NAME IS MOONY. I AM A CUPERTINO
21 RESIDENT. I AM SPEAKING AS A RESIDENT REPRESENTING MYSELF. SO,
22 I'M HEARING MORE WHAT IS GOING ON IN CUPERTINO. THINGS ARE NOT
23 GOING WELL AND WE NEED TO FIX. ON THESE OPTIONS, THEY STINK.
24 BECAUSE THEY DON'T WANT WORK. THE DELIVERY TRYING TO EXTRACT
25 HUGE BENEFIT TO DRIVER WHAT WE'RE ASKING THEM TO DELIVER AND

October 15, 2020

1 THAT DOESN'T WORK. I'LL GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. THE PLAN IS A
2 MESS. IT CREATES 10,000 JOBS AND IT ONLY BUILDS 200400 HOMES.
3 WHERE ARE THE OTHER 7,000 GOING TO FIND HOMES. WE NEED TO COME
4 UP WITH A PLAN THAT WORKS. IT'S MAKING THE HOUSING SITUATION
5 WORSE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME PLEASE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SO PLEASE CONSIDER FUNDING LOW INCOME HOMES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER MISH A.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO GOOD EVENING. MY NAME IS MISHA. AND I GREW UP
14 IN THE BAY AREA. I WANT TO SPEAK IN FAVOR OF 8A FROM THE
15 HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. I THINK HOUSING IS@ROOT OF A
16 LOT INEQUITY THAT WE SEE IN THE BAY AREA THE BAY AREA HAS
17 PROGRESSIVE PHILOSOPHIES AND VIEWS. I THINK WE SHOULD GO IN
18 THAT DIRECTION I DON'T WANT TO SEE DISPLACEMENT GROW AND
19 CONTINUE TO BECOME A BIGGER PROBLEM. I AM IN FAVOR OF HAVING
20 MORE DENSE AREAS. SO I URGE YOU TO VOTE IN FAVOR OF 8A. THANK
21 YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS R WANG.

24

October 15, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** HI R WONG VICE CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMISSION IN
2 CUPERTINO. AND I WANTED TO POINT OUT THE ISSUE OF
3 UNAFFORDABILITY THAT'S OUT THERE. WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT
4 AFFORDABILITY, A SINGLE UNIT TODAY IN CUPERTINO COSTS OVER
5 \$800,000, AND TODAY'S PLAN WOULD REQUIRE \$4 BILLION IN UNITS
6 ASSOCIATED WITH NO FUNDING. WHERE WOULD THE FUNDING COME FROM
7 AND THE RHNA ASSESSMENT WERE CALCULATED PRE COVID LOOKING AT
8 SOME OTHER ASSESSMENT IN TERMS OF EMBARCADERO INSTITUTE. THEIR
9 NUMBERS SHOW WE DOUBLE COUNTED WHAT WE HAVE. I OPPOSE --
10 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF MYSELF.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PUBLIC SPEAKERS. MR. MAYOR PUBLIC COMMENTS
13 RECEIVED BY FIVE INCLUDE IDEAS WERE POSTED ONLINE AND E-MAILED
14 TO EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS.

15

16 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU TO
17 THE OVER 120 ATTENDEES WHO PARTICIPATED IN OUR MEETING TODAY.
18 AND ALL THE PUBLIC COMMENTS, AND THE HUNDREDS OF
19 COMMUNICATIONS THAT WE RECEIVED. REPRESENTING INDIVIDUALS AND
20 ORGANIZATIONS FROM ACROSS THE BAY AREA. WE APPRECIATE YOUR
21 INPUT ON THIS IMPORTANT DECISION. SO, COLLEAGUES. IT'S TIME
22 FOR DISCUSSION AND ACTION. SO I'M GOING TO CALL ON RAISED
23 HANDS, IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, PLEASE RAISE YOUR
24 HAND. AND THE FIRST SPEAKER IS DIRECTOR HUDSON.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I GUESS IT WORKS BETTER IF IT'S NOT MUTED.
2 LISTENED INTENTLY TONIGHT. DON'T WANT TO GO DOWN THE
3 RESPONDING TO EVERYTHING I HAVE HEARD. I JUST WANT TO POINT
4 SOMETHING OUT. WE ARE PAST A FIX. A MAJOR PROBLEM, AND IN MY
5 OPINION SOMEWHERE ALONG THE ROAD WE LOST SIGHT OF SOMETHING
6 THAT WILL BE THE BIG PICTURE AT THE END OF THE DAY. WE'RE
7 ASKED TO PRODUCE 442,000 HOMES FOR ROUGHLY A MILLION PEOPLE
8 OVER THE NEXT DECADE. AND THE PROBLEM IS WHERE WE PUT THOSE
9 PEOPLE, OR THOSE HOMES, NOT HOW MANY. TONIGHT WE WERE SHOWN,
10 AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN SEE, THIS IT HAS A BLUEPRINT, 2015
11 TO 2050, 1.4 MILLION NEW JOBS. TWO THIRDS OF WHICH ARE IN
12 THREE COUNTIES. SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO, AND SANTA CLARA. WE
13 HAD ANOTHER GRAPH HERE THAT SHOWS YOU THAT BETWEEN 2010 AND
14 2016, THE VAST NUMBER OF JOBS THAT WE SHOW SURPASSED NEW
15 HOUSING IN THREE COUNTIES. SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO, AND SANTA
16 CLARA. NOW, IF YOU'RE GOING TO PUT, OR SHOW, THAT TWO THIRDS
17 OF ALL THE JOBS ARE IN THREE COUNTIES, YOU NEED TO SHOW TWO
18 THIRDS OF ALL THE HOUSING ARE GOING IN THESE THREE COUNTIES.
19 THE NUMBER SHOULD BE ABOUT 295,000 PER RESIDENCE. EARLIER
20 TONIGHT WE HEARD FROM ONE PERSON THAT SAID THIS HAS BEEN GOING
21 ON FOR 20 YEARS. I CAN DOCUMENT THAT IT'S BEEN GOING ON FOR
22 25. IN 1998 I WROTE A POSTCARD TO CLIENTS OF MINE THAT TALKS
23 ABOUT CHANGES IN THE BAY AREA JOBS AND HOUSING FROM '95 TO
24 '97. SANTA CLARA, 126,005 JOBS. 7,154 HOMES IN THREE YEARS.
25 SAN FRANCISCO, 36,170 JOBS 1,430 HOMES. SAN MATEO 125,000 JOBS

October 15, 2020

1 200,363 HOMES. THAT'S 11,000 HOMES FOR 187,000 JOBS OUT OF
2 287,000 THAT WERE PRODUCED IN THE BAY AREA. AND I LEFT THIS
3 ONE SENTENCE FOR PEOPLE, CONCURRENTLY, WHICH IS 1998, OR
4 CURRENTLY, THE BAY AREA HAS APPROXIMATELY 1 MILLION MORE JOBS
5 THAN HOMES. THAT'S A PROBLEM FOLKS THAT WE'RE NOT ADDRESSING
6 WITH 8A, SIX B, OR 1426S. YOU HAVE TO MATCH JOBS, HOUSING
7 BALANCE. THAT'S WHAT THIS WHOLE THING STARTED OUT WITH. NOW
8 JIM SPERING EARLIER TONIGHT MADE A VERY IMPORTANT STATEMENT.
9 IT'S NOT EQUITABLE. PEOPLE IN THESE THREE COUNTIES CAN SELL
10 THEIR HOME, IF THEY HAVE LIVED THEIR FOR AT LEAST TWO YEARS.
11 POCKET 500,000 TAX EXCLUDED AND MOVE TO HIS COUNTY. THAT'S
12 WHAT HE WAS SAYING, WITHOUT SAYING IT. NOW, THE REALITY IS,
13 YOU CAN'T BEAT ECONOMICS. JOBS ARE DEMAND. HOUSES ARE SUPPLY.
14 IF DEMAND IS GOING UP FASTER THAN SUPPLY, WHAT HAPPENS TO
15 PRICE? WE'RE GOING TO PRICE OURSELVES OUT. AND YOU CANNOT
16 CONTINUE TO DO THIS BUSINESS AS USUAL AND KICK THE CAN DOWN
17 THE ROAD AND EXPECT THIS TO BE SOLVED. THIS IS A BAD
18 DIRECTION. AND I WILL ONLY VOTE FOR THE 8A MODIFIED TONIGHT,
19 OR TAKE IT BACK AND RELOOK AT IT AGAIN. THERE IS NO WAY WE CAN
20 DO LESS THAN 295,000 HOMES IN THOSE THREE COUNTIES. IT DOESN'T
21 MAKE SENSE.

22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR CLARK?

24

October 15, 2020

1 **CHRISTOPHER CLARK:** THANK YOU MR. PRESIDENT. I'M GOING TO POINT
2 OUT TO YOU SANTA CLARA CITIES ASSOCIATION A FEW OF OUR
3 REPRESENTATIVES SPOKE AND ALSO SUBMITTED A LETTER. SO I WON'T
4 BELABOR THOSE POINTS. I JUST WANT TO SAY THIS EVENING THANK
5 YOU TO ALL OF THOSE WHO WORKED ON THIS AND PROVIDED PUBLIC
6 INPUT OVER THE LAST YEAR OR MORE. I BELIEVE THAT, YOU KNOW,
7 WITH OPTION 8A, WE HAVE ARRIVED AT WHAT IS A HALLMARK OF A
8 COMPROMISE WHERE NO ONE IS 100 PERCENT SATISFIED WITH
9 SOMETHING, BUT NO ONE IS 100 PERCENT DISSATISFIED WITH THE
10 OUTCOME. AND AS I LISTENED TONIGHT AND I APPRECIATE STAFF
11 WALKING THROUGH THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN 8A AND 6A, THE TWO
12 OPTIONS, I THINK FOR ME TO DEVIATE FROM A RECOMMENDATION OF
13 HMC AND OTHERS THAT HAS BEEN WORKED ON SUCH A LONG PERIOD OF
14 TIME AND HAS TRIED TO STRIKE A LICENSE ON ALL OF THE CRITERIA
15 AND GOALS THAT WE SET FORTH, IT WOULD TAKE SOMETHING, IT WOULD
16 TAKE SOMETHING THAT IS FAILURE OBVIOUSLY SIGNIFICANTLY BETTER
17 THAN OPTION 8A, AND THE RECOMMENDATION IN ORDER FOR ME TO
18 DEVIATE FROM THAT. AND WHILE, YOU KNOW, 6A CERTAINLY HAS ITS
19 POSITIVE ASPECTS, I THINK THAT IT DOESN'T QUITE ACHIEVE THE
20 BALANCE AND THE COMPROMISE THAT WAS STRUCK BY THE HMC AND
21 THROUGH THIS ENTIRE PROCESS. AND I THINK FOR ME TO VOTE TO
22 OVERALL STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION OR THE HMC'S RECOMMENDATION AT
23 THE END OF THE DAY, I WOULD HAVE TO SEE SOMETHING
24 SIGNIFICANTLY BETTER BASIC ON ALL FRONTS. SO MR. PRESIDENT,
25 WHEN YOU'RE READY I'M READY TO MOVE WE PROVE OPTION 8A. BUT I

October 15, 2020

1 WANT EVERYONE TO GET A CHANCE TO SPEAK. BUT I AM PREPARED TO
2 DO SO IF YOU THINK IT'S PROPOSED.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I SECOND THAT.

5

6 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE HAVE A MOTION ON THE FLOOR WHICH
7 IS TO APPROVE OPTION 8A AND APPROVE THE RELEASE OF THE RHNA
8 METHODOLOGY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND OPENING THE PUBLIC COMMENT
9 ON THE RHNA METHODOLOGY.

10

11 **CHRISTOPHER CLARK:** YES THANK YOU FOR CLARIFYING THAT.

12

13 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THAT WAS MOVED BY CLARK AND
14 SECONDED BY LEE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD MAKE A SUBSTITUTE MOTION THAT WE CONTINUE
17 THIS AND WORK ON SOME THINGS TO MAKE IT BETTER. OUR GOAL IN
18 EACH OF OUR COMMUNITIES IS TO BUILD MORE HOUSING IN THE RIGHT
19 PLACES AND WE USE THESE RHNA NUMBERS TO MAKE DECISIONS AND AS
20 I HAVE LOOKED AT SOME OF THESE HIGH RESOURCE AREA NUMBERS THEY
21 MAY MAKE SENSE ON PAPER, BUT AS YOU DRILL DOWN, I THINK
22 SUPERVISORS RAMOS MADE IT VERY CLEAR THEY JUST REALLY DON'T
23 WANT MAKE SENSE FOR OUR COMMUNITIES AND GO COUNTER TO SOME OF
24 THE VERY IMPORTANT PRINCIPLES THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH
25 IN OUR COMMUNITIES. THEY NEED TO BE VIABLE OPTIONS. AND SO

October 15, 2020

1 TONIGHT, WHY WOULD WE ADOPT A PLAN THAT MANY OF US DO NOT
2 BELIEVE CAN BE SUCCESSFUL. IT CANNOT BE IMPLEMENTED
3 SUCCESSFULLY. WE NEED THAT ONLY DEPENDABLE HOUSING ELEMENTS
4 BUT WE REALLY NEED ONES THAT ARE REALISTIC WHERE HOUSING CAN
5 BE BUILT AND I'M SORRY THAT SOME PEOPLE WHO SERVED ON THE
6 COMMITTEE FEEL OFFENDED BY COMMENTS OF ABAG MEMBERS. THEY FEEL
7 DISRESPECTED BY US BUT WE WHO SIT ON ABAG ARE CHARGED TO
8 REPORTS OUR ENTIRE CITIES WITHIN OUR COUNTY, WE'RE THE ONES
9 THAT NEED TO IMPLEMENT THIS IN OUR COMMUNITIES AND WHEN WE SEE
10 IT WORSENING, JOB HOUSING IMBALANCE INCREASING OUR VEHICLE
11 MILES TRAVELED, IT IS A SERIOUS PROBLEM, AND ESPECIALLY WHEN
12 WE START BEING PUSHED INTO OPEN SPACE OUTSIDE OUR URBAN LIMIT
13 LINES SO FOR THIS REASON I MOVE THAT WE INSTEAD CONTINUE THIS
14 DECISION AND CONTINUE TO LOOK AT A COOPERATIVE SOLUTION THAT
15 WILL WORK MUCH BETTER FOR ALL OF US.

16

17 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I'LL SECOND THAT MOTION.

18

19 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SECONDED BY DIRECTOR HUDSON.
20 SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN WAS THERE A DATE YOU PROPOSE TO CONTINUE
21 THIS?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I AM OPEN TO A DATE. I WOULD SAY SOMETIME NEXT YEAR
24 GIVEN THE FACT THAT WE'RE IN OCTOBER AND I'M NOT SURE OF
25 NOVEMBER AND DECEMBER, SO PERHAPS WE COULD SAY FEBRUARY.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WELL, I WANT TO, BEFORE I GO TO
3 DIRECTOR PIERCE, MS. MCMILLAN OR MR. MALONEY, WHAT'S THE
4 TIMELINE WE HAVE TO WORK WITH.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S IMPORTANT TOO.

7

8 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, I WOULD
9 TURN IT OVER TO MATT TO CLARIFY THE SPECIFIC TIMELINES THAT WE
10 ARE REQUIRED TO MEET.

11

12 **MATT MALONEY:** I GUESS TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION, FIRST I WANT TO
13 REMIND THE BOARD THAT, YOU KNOW, THE ACTION TONIGHT WOULD OPEN
14 THIS UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. YOU WOULD BE APPROVING A PROPOSED
15 METHODOLOGY, AND THEN WE WOULD BE COMING BACK WITH ANOTHER
16 ITEM FOR AN ACTION LATER THIS YEAR IN DECEMBER, LIKELY, TO
17 APPROVE A DRAFT METHODOLOGY. YOU KNOW, THE CLOCK IS TICKING
18 FOR THIS PROCESS FOR US TO ACHIEVE WHAT WE NEED TO DO IN
19 STATUTE. WE HAVE A SUBREGIONAL PROCESS THAT IS ALSO GOING ON.
20 IT'S ACTUALLY THE NEXT ITEM TONIGHT WHICH HINGES ON THIS
21 DECISION. IF WE SORT OF DELAY THIS DECISION THEN WE'RE ALSO
22 PUTTING THE SUBREGIONS, WHICH ARE SOLANO AND NAPA, IN A BIT OF
23 A DIFFICULT BIND. IF GILLIAN HAS ANYTHING TO ADD THERE THAT
24 MAYBE I MISSED, FEEL FREE.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** NO. I THINK THAT COVERS IT. [INDISCERNIBLE]
2 SUBREGIONAL SHARE -- DEADLINE STARTING NEXT YEAR --
3 [INDISCERNIBLE].
4

5 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SUPERVISOR ANDERSON I'M GOING TO
6 INTERPRET YOUR MOTION TO BE THAT THIS WOULD BE CONTINUING THIS
7 UNTIL NEXT MONTH.
8

9 **SPEAKER:** WE CAN CERTAINLY -- THAT WOULD GIVE US SOME
10 ADDITIONAL TIME, AND I RECOGNIZE THIS ARE SOME SIGNIFICANT
11 CONSTRAINTS, AND THAT IT WOULD AT LEAST GIVE US ADDITIONAL
12 TIME TO EXPLORE T I AM HOPING THAT WOULD BE SUFFICIENT, BUT I
13 WAS JUST GIVING AN OUTER EDGE BUT CERTAINLY LET'S HAVE MY
14 MOTION BE UNTIL OUR NEXT MEETING.
15

16 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR HUDSON, IS THAT OKAY? I
17 CAN'T SEE YOU OR HEAR YOU.
18

19 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.
20

21 **SPEAKER:** HE GAVE A THUMB'S UP.
22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR PIERCE?
24

October 15, 2020

1 **JULIE PIERCE:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. I APPRECIATE THAT.
2 AND I WILL BE VOTING IN FAVOR OF THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION AND
3 CERTAINLY AGAINST OPTION 8A. FIRST I WANT TO GIVE A REALLY
4 BIG, VERY SINCERE THANK YOU TO STAFF AND TO ALL OF MY FELLOW
5 COMMISSIONERS WHO SPENT THE PAST YEAR GETTING US TO THIS
6 STAGE. IT TRULY HAS BEEN A MONUMENTAL LIFT AND I RECOGNIZE
7 THAT. AND AS OBNOXIOUS I HAVE BEEN IN MY CONCERNS, I REALLY DO
8 APPRECIATE ALL OF YOUR EFFORT, AND WHAT AN INCREDIBLE EFFORT
9 THIS HAS BEEN. BUT, I FELT THAT THE REAL POLICY DISCUSSION, AS
10 IT RELATES TO HOW THE BAY AREA CONTINUES TO GROW, WERE
11 LACKING. WE TALKED A LOT OF PLANNING IDEAS OVER THE YEAR, BUT
12 ONLY REALLY GOT DOWN TO THE SERIOUS POLICY DISCUSSIONS,
13 EXTREMELY LATE, IN AUGUST, AFTER PLANNED BAY AREA WAS PUT OUT
14 THERE FOR -- TO LOOK AT. THREE MEETINGS OF STATEMENTS AND
15 SEVERAL LAST MINUTE ALTERNATIVES, MANY OF THEM, AND THEN AN UP
16 OR DOWN VOTE IS NOT A REAL DISCUSSION MAKE. SO FRANKLY IN MY
17 OPINION NONE OF THE OPTIONS THAT REMAINED ON THE TABLE AT THE
18 END OF THE PROCESS ADHERED TO THE STATED GOAL TO ALIGN WITH
19 PBA2050 GREENHOUSE GAS GASSES AND TARGETS ARE GOING TO BE
20 MERELY IMPOSSIBLE TO REACH NO MATTER HOW MANY PEOPLE WE WANT
21 TO HAVE TELECOMMUTING. AND I RECOGNIZE THAT RHNA AS DIFFERENT
22 REQUIREMENTS THAN PLANNED BAY AREA. BUT PLANNED BAY AREA IS
23 MANDATED AS WELL, AND IF WE COULDN'T GET THAT APPROVED, WE'RE
24 IN, OUT OF COMPLIANCE. WE RISK A LOT OF MONEY IF WE GO OUT OF
25 COMPLIANCE. SO, PROXIMITY TO JOBS, BY BOTH AUTO AND TRANSIT

October 15, 2020

1 SHOULD BE THE HEAVIEST TRITE FOR WHERE NEW HOUSING SHOULD GO.
2 THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR OUR WORKERS IS SEVERELY IMPACTED BY
3 SPENDING MANY, MANY HOURS A DAY COMMUTING. FAMILIES AND
4 COMMUNITIES SUFFER WHEN RESIDENTS CANNOT PARTICIPATE. WHEN MOM
5 AND DAD CAN'T BE HOME TO DO HOMEWORK WITH THE KIDS, OR THEY
6 CAN'T BE THERE TO PARTICIPATE IN COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES, WE ALL
7 SUFFER. THAT'S NOT EQUITY. SO UNDER THE RECOMMENDED PLANNED
8 BAY AREA 2050 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE, THE OPTIONS WERE CREATING
9 SMALL. THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY BEFORE THE BOARD TODAY THAT
10 WAS RECOMMENDED TODAY HAS DRAMATICALLY INCREASED THE
11 ALLOCATIONS TO THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS OF THE REGION OUTSIDE
12 APPROVED URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES. MANY OF THOSE AREAS ARE ALSO
13 HIGH HAS HARD AREAS. IT'S ALSO DRAMATICALLY INCREASED THE
14 ALLOCATIONS TO SMALL COMMUNITIES THAT ARE FURTHER FROM HIGH
15 QUALITY TRANSIT AND JOB CENTERS. RATHER THAN THE PREVIOUS
16 ITERATIONS BASED ON GROWTH THAT ALIGN CLOSELY WITH PLANNED BAY
17 AREA 2050. SO, DURING THIS PROCESS, I HAVE FREQUENTLY HEARD
18 THE CHARGE THAT SOME JURISDICTIONS HAVE NOT DONE THEIR FAIR
19 SHARE. I WOULD REMIND EVERY ONE OF US THAT IN THIS CURRENT
20 HOUSING CYCLE, EVERY ONE OF OUR 101 CITIES AND NINE COUNTIES
21 HAVE APPROVED CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE DON'T QUALIFY FOR
22 MTC MONEY IF WE DON'T. SO WE GOT THEM APPROVED. SO, WE HAVE
23 IDENTIFIED LOCATIONS FOR THE HOUSING UNITS THAT HAVE BEEN
24 ALLOCATED. HOW MANY OF THEM HAVE BEEN BUILT? WE JUST SAW THOSE
25 CHARTS. WE ALSO KNOW AS ELECTED OFFICIALS WHAT THE MANY

October 15, 2020

1 FACTORS ARE THAT GO INTO WHY THEY HAVE NOT BEEN BUILT AND
2 LIKELY WON'T BE BUILT. ASSIGNING UNITS WHERE THEY'RE NOT
3 LIKELY TO EVER BE BUILT DOESN'T SOLVE OUR PROBLEM. WE HAVE A
4 PROBLEM OF NEEDING HOMES FOR PEOPLE CLOSE TO THEIR JOBS.
5 PUTTING THEM IN THE FAR REACHES OF THE REGION DOESN'T
6 ACCOMPLISH THAT GOAL. SO, MANY JURISDICTIONS MAY NOT ACHIEVE
7 COMPLIANCE, THIS NEXT ROUND. THEY MAY NOT BE ABLE TO MEET
8 THOSE TARGETS. THEY MAY NOT BE ABLE TO LOCATE ALL OF THOSE
9 UNITS. SO, I HAVE FURTHER HEARD THAT FOR EQUITY REASONS, THE
10 NEW HOUSING NEEDS NEED TO BE PLACED HEAVILY IN HIGH
11 OPPORTUNITY AREAS. I DON'T DISAGREE WITH THAT AT ALL. I
12 HONESTLY BELIEVE THAT ALL OF THE OPTIONS BEFORE US, INCLUDING
13 ALL THREE TONIGHT, TECHNICALLY MEET THE STATUTORY
14 REQUIREMENTS. SOME MAY BE BETTER THAN OTHERS. BUT I ASK YOU
15 THIS, IF WE'RE GOING TO BE BUILDING THOUSANDS OF NEW JOBS,
16 WOULDN'T IT MAKE SENSE TO MAKE -- TO PUT THE HOUSES IN AND TO
17 MAKE THOSE AREAS INTO NEW HIGH QUALITY AREAS? WHY WOULDN'T YOU
18 MAKE THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THERE? WE'RE GOING TO SPEND \$1.4
19 TRILLION, WE'RE TOLD, TO IMPLEMENT THIS PLAN. WHY SHOULDN'T
20 SOME OF THOSE DOLLARS GO INTO MAKING HIGH RESOURCE AREAS
21 CLOSER TO WHERE THE JOB CENTERS ALREADY ARE? WE HAVE ALREADY
22 HEARD THAT THREE COUNTIES HAVE WAY MORE JOBS THAN THEY HAVE
23 HOUSES. WHY WOULDN'T YOU PUT THE HOUSES THERE AND MAKE THOSE
24 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS TOO? WHY WOULDN'T YOU DO THAT? DOESN'T
25 THAT SEEM LIKE EQUITY TO YOU? IT SURE DOES TO ME. THE HIGH

October 15, 2020

1 OPPORTUNITY AREA THAT IS TWO HOURS COMMUTE FROM JOBS DOES NOT
2 PRODUCE A HIGH QUALITY LIFE FOR OUR FAMILIES. SO, IF WE
3 GENUINELY WANT TO ALIGN THE RHNA AND FUTURE GROWTH WITH
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, SO WE CAN ACCOMPLISH THE GOALS THAT IT
5 SETS OUT, THEN WE ARE PROPOSING GOING BACK TO THE PLANNED BAY
6 AREA 2050 GROWTH BASELINE INSTEAD OF THE HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE
7 USING THE SAME FACTORS AS OPTION 8A AND THE 2050 GROWTH
8 BASELINE PROTECTS THE AREAS OUTSIDE OF URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES
9 AND FOCUSES NEW HOUSING IN THE AREAS THAT ARE CURRENTLY BIG
10 JOB CENTERS, SORELY LACKING AND COMMENSURATE WITH GROWTH TODAY
11 AND PROJECTED TO GROW BY OVER 40 PERCENT, THEY'RE ALREADY
12 LACKING AND GROWING BY 40 PERCENT AND HOUSING IS PROJECTED AT
13 30 PERCENT. IT DOESN'T COMPUTE PEOPLE. I BELIEVE THAT THE 2050
14 GROWTH BASELINE IS THE RIGHT POLICY DECISION, AND I WOULD
15 PROPOSE THAT WE GIVE THIS ALTERNATIVE FULL ABAG BOARD
16 CONSIDERATION. WE HAVE GOT THE OPPORTUNITY NOW TO PIVOT ON HOW
17 AND WHERE WE GROW. WE CAN CORRECT THE CURRENT IMBALANCE IN
18 JOBS AND HOUSING CLOSE TO THOSE JOBS OR WE CAN ADD MORE CARS
19 TO OUR ALREADY OVERLY CONGESTED ROADS EXACERBATING SPRAWL
20 SHOULD NOT BE OUR GOAL. I APPRECIATE STAFF AND THE EFFORT OF
21 EVERYONE ON THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE WHO CONTRIBUTED
22 TO THIS. BUT I REALLY THINK WE SERIOUSLY HAVE GONE OFF TRACK,
23 AND I WOULD ASK YOUR SUPPORT TO CONSIDER THE NEW ALTERNATIVE,
24 BE SERIOUSLY CONSIDERED BY THE BOARD FOR THIS INCREDIBLY
25 IMPORTANT POLICY DECISION FOR OUR FUTURE. THANK YOU.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. SO I'M GOING JOIN THE
3 STACK AFTER VICE PRESIDENT RAMOS BECAUSE I WANT TO OFFER MY
4 PERSPECTIVE ON THIS ISSUE. SO, DIRECTOR MAR?

5

6 **GORDON MAR:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. I WANT TO START BY
7 THANKING THE RHNA METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND STAFF FOR YOUR
8 WORK ON THE EXTREMELY COMPLEX PLANNING EXERCISE ESPECIALLY FOR
9 THOSE ON HMC FERNANDO. I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. IT'S BEEN A
10 CHANGING DECISION TO COME TO THIS PRETTY DIVERSE PERSPECTIVE,
11 AND REPRESENTING DIVERSE GEOGRAPHIES. AND I THINK THIS IS A
12 VERY HEALTHY PROCESS TRYING TO FIND, COME TO AGREEMENT ON THIS
13 REALLY IMPORTANT REGIONAL POLICY. SO I JUST WANT WANTED TO
14 SHARE A FEW POINTS FROM WHERE I SIT IN THIS AND WHERE I
15 REPRESENT FROM SAN FRANCISCO. AND I'LL SAY LONG WITH MY SAN
16 FRANCISCO COLLEAGUES ON THE ABAG BOARD AND IN OUR CITY WE HAVE
17 HAD A ROBUST DISCUSSION ABOUT RHNA, AND THE TOP GOALS THAT
18 EMERGE FROM OUR DISCUSSIONS TO FOCUS ON SIGNIFICANT UNMET
19 NEEDS FOR HOUSING AFFORDABLE TO LOW INCOME AND MODERATE INCOME
20 UNITS TO COUNTERACT THE DISPLACEMENT OF COMMUNITIES OF COLOR
21 IN CORE URBAN CITIES AND ESPECIALLY NOW DURING COVID-19 WE'RE
22 SEEING AN EXODUS OF HIGH WAGE WORKERS FROM THE LUXURY CONDOS
23 THAT DEVELOPERS CLAMORED TO BUILD HERE AND WITH RENTS STARTING
24 TO FALL HOUSING PRICES HAVE NOT TRICKLED DOWN TO AFFORDABLE
25 LEVELS FOR MOST WORKING PEOPLE IN OUR CITY, WITH THE 8A OPTION

October 15, 2020

1 I AM PLEASED THAT SAN FRANCISCO'S PORTION OF THE AFFORDABLE
2 INCOME CATEGORIES HAS INCREASED TO REFLECT OF THE NEEDS,
3 HOWEVER INCREASING TO ABOVE MODERATE MARKET RATE HOUSING HOW
4 THAT COULD ACCELERATE DISPLACEMENT OF WORKING CLASS RESIDENTS
5 AS WELL AS OTHER MARKET IN THE REGION WE HAVE REVIEWED THE
6 IMPACTS OF BUILDING MARKET RATE HOUSING IN DENSITY AND FOR
7 IMPLEMENTATION EVER MARKET RATE HOUSING BEYOND THE SHARE OF
8 THE REGION THAT SAN FRANCISCO ALREADY CARRIES WILL HAVE A
9 NEGATIVE EFFECT ON THE GROUND IN OUR VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES.
10 ADDITIONALLY, I WANT TO SAY SB28 WAS FOR MEETING NEEDS FOR
11 HOUSEHOLDS LOW AND MODERATE INCOME HOUSEHOLDS NEED HOUSING WE
12 HAVE FAILED TO BUILD. IT'S SUPPOSED TO BE THE INTENT OF STATE
13 LAW NOT TO INCREASE DISPLACEMENT. I ALSO DON'T WANT TO LOSE
14 SIGHT OF WHO WE PLAN TO BE BUILDING FOR IN THE REGION. WHILE
15 THE PLANNED BAY AREA ASSUMES JOB GROWTH WILL BE IN SILICON
16 VALLEY, AND MUCH OF IT, I THINK IS TILL UP IN THE AIR WITH
17 CHANGING TELECOMMUTE PATTERNS, AND WE MUST CONTINUE TO FOCUS
18 ON OUR SERVICE WORKERS, OUR ESSENTIAL WORKERS, WHO MUST WORK
19 IN PHYSICAL LOCATIONS AND THEIR HOUSING NEEDS. AND WE MUST
20 INCORPORATE JOBS/HOUSING FIT IN PLANNED BAY AREA AND CENTER
21 THEIR CONCERNS BECAUSE THEY HAVE THE LEAST FLEXIBILITY AND ARE
22 THE MOST ESSENTIAL IN OUR COMMUNITY'S STABILITY. SO I JUST
23 WANTED TO END BY SAYING BY ACKNOWLEDGING THE TWO ALTERNATIVE
24 METHODOLOGY OPTIONS PRESENTED AND THE SOLID RATIONALE FOR
25 BOTH. I ESPECIALLY APPRECIATE OPTION 6A WITH STRONGER

October 15, 2020

1 PROVISIONS. I WILL SUPPORT 8A IT DOES A BETTER JOB OF
2 JOBS/HOUSING FIT BUT WITH RESPECT TO THE YEAR LONG PROCESS HMC
3 WENT THROUGH TO MANAGE THE NEEDS OF INTEREST IN THE REGION
4 TOWARDS COMPROMISING AND CONSENSUS. THANKS TO EVERYONE WHO
5 WORKED ON THIS INCREDIBLY UPON COMPLEX YES CONTENTIOUS BUT
6 IMPORTANT POLICY THAT WILL BE IMPORTANT FOR THE FRAMEWORK FOR
7 SOLVING OUR REGION'S HOUSING AFFORDABLE CRISIS.

8

9 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DIRECTOR
10 EKLUND.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. WHILE I
13 WILL BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION TO POSTPONE THIS DECISION UNTIL
14 NEXT MONTH, SO THAT WE CAN HAVE A LITTLE BIT MORE OPPORTUNITY
15 TO EVALUATE THE MODIFIED OPTION 8A. WHICH TEN CITIES IN MARIN
16 COUNTY DID SUPPORT. AND WE WERE NOT SUPPORTING OPTION 8A
17 PRIMARILY BECAUSE OPTION 8A REALLY PUTS A LOT OF THE HOUSING
18 DEMAND WHERE THERE IS NOT HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT AND WHERE THERE
19 ARE NO JOBS. SO IT'S ONLY GOING TO EXASPERATE THE GREENHOUSE
20 GAS. AND IN FACT, I THINK WE MIGHT HAVE TO END UP DOING
21 TELECOMMUTING FOR 80 PERCENT INSTEAD OF 60 PERCENT TO OFFER
22 SET THAT. I SERVED ON THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE, AND
23 FRANKLY, I WAS VERY FRUSTRATED. BECAUSE WHEN STAFF RECOMMENDED
24 -- OR HAD VARIOUS OPTIONS AT THE BASELINE, HOUSEHOLD GROWTH
25 WAS ONE OF THE OPTIONS, BUT WE NEVER HAD A CHANCE TO DISCUSS T

October 15, 2020

1 I KEPT ASKING, WAIT A MINUTE, WE NEED TO DISCUSS THIS OPTION
2 OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FOR AN OPTION AS THE BASELINE AND THE
3 PROCESS WAS, WELL, IF YOU GET NINE CARDS THEN THAT WOULD BLOCK
4 THAT DECISION SO WE NEVER HIS DISCUSSION. WHICH, TO ME, SORT
5 OF VIOLATES THE BASIC PRINCIPLE OF A DEMOCRACY. YOU NEED TO
6 DISCUSS THE OPTIONS THAT ARE BEFORE US. BUT I REALLY THINK
7 THAT THE MODIFIED OPTION IS BETTER. LET ME GIVE YOU AN
8 SPECIFIC EXAMPLE WHY OPTION 8A IS GOING TO SETUP COMMUNITIES
9 TO FAIL. AND I'M GOING TO PROBABLY USE THE SMALLEST CITY IN
10 THE WHOLE BAY AREA. I HAVEN'T DOUBLE CHECKED MY FACTS BUT I
11 THINK IT IS AND THAT IS THE ISLAND OF BELVEDERE IN MARIN
12 COUNTY. THAT ALLOCATION LAST TIME WAS 16. THEY ARE BUILT OUT
13 HAVE NO COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT THE ONLY NON-RESIDENTIAL
14 DEVELOPMENT IS CITY HALL. AND IT'S AN ISLAND IN THE BAY. UNDER
15 8A, THEY GET 160. SO WHERE WOULD THEY PUT THAT 160? THAT
16 OPTION JUST -- IT WOULD PUT SO MANY CITIES IN A POSITION WHERE
17 -- WHAT ARE YOU GOING TO DO? MAKE MORE LAND OUT OF BAY? I
18 DON'T THINK BCDC WOULD LIKE THAT. SO, I REALLY THINK THAT WE
19 NEED TO REALLY TAKE A HARD LOOK AT THE MODIFIED 8A OPTION.
20 AND, I THINK THAT PUTTING HOUSING IN THE HIGH OPPORTUNITY
21 AREAS THAT HAS HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT MAKES SENSE. BUT PUTTING
22 HOUSING WHERE THE HEADWAY IS 30 MINUTES, WHICH IS ONE OF THE
23 OPTIONS IN THAT FORMULA, NO ONE'S GOING TO WAIT 30 MINUTES FOR
24 A BUS TO GO TO THE OFFICE. THAT'S GOING TO EXACERBATE

October 15, 2020

1 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. I SUPPORT CANDACE'S MOTION TO
2 CONTINUE IT. AND I SUPPORT OPTION 8A SUBSTITUTE PROPOSAL.

3

4 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR BAS?

5

6 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF WHO PUT AN
7 INCREDIBLE INVESTMENT OF ENERGY, TIME, EXPERTISE INTO THIS
8 PROCESS ALONG WITH ALL OF THE MEMBERS OF THE HMC, THIS IS VERY
9 TECHNICAL AND DETAILED WORK ASK COMPLEX WORK. SO I DON'T THINK
10 ANY OF US CAN THANK YOU ENOUGH FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE TO
11 GET US TO -- GET US TO THIS POINT. YOU SPOKE AND INTRODUCED 6A
12 WHICH WAS OF THE RECOMMENDED STAFF PROPOSAL, AND I DO WANT TO
13 SAY THAT THE METRICS AND THE OUTCOMES OF WHERE WE COULD HAVE
14 GONE WITH THAT PROPOSAL WERE VERY, VERY CLEAR IN TERMS OF
15 ALLOWING WORKERS TO BE CLOSE TO THEIR JOBS MAKING SURE THAT WE
16 MAKE THE MAXIMUM PROGRESS IN TERMS OF ADDRESSING ECONOMIC AND
17 RACIAL SEGREGATION. I STILL VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THAT WORK. I
18 WOULD LIKE TO BE IN A PLACE OF BEING ABLE TO SUPPORT THAT.
19 IT'S NOT EITHER OF THE MOTIONS THAT WE ARE LOOKING AT RIGHT
20 NOW. BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US IN THIS POLITICAL
21 MOMENT TO LOOK HARD AT OUTCOMES AS WE DO OUR WORK. AND I
22 APPRECIATED STAFF BEING STRAIGHT FORWARD IN TERMS OF ANSWERING
23 DIRECTOR CHAVEZ'S QUESTIONS ABOUT THE COMPLEXITIES THAT LEAD
24 TO HMC PROPOSING OPTION 8A, AND I DO THINK THE COMPLEXITY OF
25 THE IMPLEMENTATION, THE PROCESS OF ADDING THE EQUITY

October 15, 2020

1 ADJUSTMENT THAT IS MEANINGFUL BUT WE HAVE TO PUSH OURSELVES TO
2 DO THE MOST AROUND RACIAL INEQUITY. I THINK THAT'S CRITICAL
3 COMPONENT. I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE'RE BEING CALLED TO DO. THAT
4 SAID WITH THE MOTION AND SUBSTITUTE ON THE FLOOR, I THINK
5 OPTION 8A GETS US CLOSER TO WHERE WE NEED TO GO IN TERMS OF
6 OUR OVERALL GOALS. I WANT TO MENTION 6A AND 8A, PUT 57 AND 58
7 PERCENT RESPECTIVELY OF RHNA INTO SAN MATEO SANTA CLAIR AND
8 SAN FRANCISCO COUNTIES, AND THAT'S NEARLY TWO THIRD THAT IS'S
9 VERY SIGNIFICANT. I AM CONCERNED THAT CHANGING THE BASELINE
10 DRAMATICALLY SHIFTS THAT ALLOCATION, AND SHIFTS WHAT WE ARE
11 LOOKING AT IN TERMS OF THE OVERALL OUTCOMES SO. SO WITH THE
12 MOTION AND MOTION AND SUBSTITUTE ON THE FLOOR DISPUTE HAVING
13 INTRODUCED 6A, I WILL BE SUPPORTING 8A. THANK YOU.

14

15 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR ESPARZA?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'LL BE BRIEF. I KNOW IT'S GETTING LATE.
18 FIRST OFF, I WANTED TO THANK EVERYONE FOR THEIR HARD WORK AND
19 I WANTED TO ADDRESS THE PROCESS A LITTLE BIT. I WILL NOT BE
20 SUPPORTING THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION AND WILL BE SUPPORTING THE
21 UNDERLYING MOTION. AND THIS GROUP HAS PUT IN A YEARS' WORTH OF
22 EFFORT INTO THIS RESULT AND I THINK ALTERNATE METHODOLOGIES AT
23 THIS POINT UNDERMINE THE OBJECTIVES OF BRINGING IN FAIR
24 HOUSING, ADDRESSING EQUITY, AND I ALSO JUST WANTED TO REMIND
25 FOLKS THAT WE'RE IN A HOUSING CRISIS. AND WE HEAR ALL THE TIME

October 15, 2020

1 FROM FOLKS WHO GROUP HERE, AND WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO STAY HERE
2 AND RAISE THEIR FAMILIES HERE, AND I THINK THAT WE'RE ALL
3 GOING TO BE STRETCHED AND WE'RE ALL ASKED TO DO A LITTLE BIT
4 MORE. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT WAS DONE ON 6A. I JUST
5 WANT TO CALL THEM OUT. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THEIR EFFORTS ON
6 THE DEALING WITH OUR HISTORY ON RACIAL INEQUITIES AND RACIAL
7 SEGREGATION IN THE BAY AREA. SO I THINK THAT'S REALLY
8 IMPORTANT. AND I JUST WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU FOR BRINGING
9 THAT UP. I WILL BE SUPPORTING 8A. I -- IT ADDRESSES
10 GENTRIFICATION. IT ADDRESSES DISPLACEMENT BY ALLOWING THE
11 INCOME ALLOCATIONS WHICH I THINK IS HUGE IN SAN JOSE AND SANTA
12 CLARA COUNTY THE VAST MAJORITY OF THOSE BEING DISPLACED ARE
13 PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND IT'S A CRISIS IN OUR CITY. AND LASTLY, I
14 WANTED TO POINT OUT, IN THE 8A SCENARIO SANTA CLAIR WOULD
15 STILL RECEIVE THE LARGEST SHARE OF THE ALLOCATION ALMOST 33
16 PERCENT OF THE RHNA ALLOCATION FOR THE ENTIRE BAY AREA WAS
17 NEARLY TWICE THE PROPORTIONAL SHARE OF ANY OTHER COUNTY. AND
18 VERY QUICK, I JUST -- SOME FOLKS, THE COMMENTERS, I WANT TO
19 THANK ALL 120 THAT SPOKE, IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, WE HAVE TAXED
20 OURS FOR TRANSIT. IT IS AN IMPORTANT ISSUE, AND IT'S ALSO AN
21 EQUITY ISSUE BECAUSE SO MANY LOW-WAGE WORKERS RELY ON PUBLIC
22 TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO BRING THAT UP. I RECOGNIZE THAT
23 TRANSIT, PUBLIC TRANSIT IS AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE EQUATION.
24 BUT THIS ISN'T MTC, SO I WILL STOP AT THIS POINT. THANK YOU.
25

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. OKAY DIRECTOR PERALEZ.
2 I'M GOING ASK WE CAN KEEP OUR COMMENTS BRIEF. THIS IS AN
3 IMPORTANT DISCUSSION. I WANTING TO RESPECTFUL OF PEOPLE
4 EXPRESSING THEIR VIEWS.

5
6 **RAUL PERALEZ:** I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT AND I APPRECIATE THAT I'M
7 SPEAKING AFTER MY COLLEAGUE IN THE CITY OF SAN JOSE. ONE THING
8 THEY WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT I DON'T KNOW, IT'S EXTREMELY CLEAR
9 TO EVERYBODY, AS YOU LOOK AT SOME OF THE NUMBERS IN THE 8A
10 GROWTH BASELINE, GOING AROUND 65,000 TO 96,000 UNITS OF
11 HOUSING JUST FOR THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, AND CURRENTLY IN THE
12 CITY OF SAN JOSE, WE ONLY HAVE ABOUT 80 PERCENT OF THE JOBS
13 THAT WE ACTUALLY, MEANING WE GOT ABOUT .8 JOBS FOR EVERY ONE
14 PERSON THAT IS ACTUALLY EMPLOYED. SO 20 PERCENT OF OUR
15 EMPLOYABLE WORKFORCE ARE LEAVING THE CITY OF SAN JOSE. WE ARE
16 ALREADY A BEDROOM COMMUNITY. THE ONLY BIG CITY IN THE ENTIRE
17 COUNTRY THAT HAS THIS DYNAMIC WHERE OUR POPULATION ACTUALLY
18 DECREASES DURING THE WORK DAY. THAT'S ACTUALLY BEEN SHIFTED
19 NOW WITH COVID, AND YOU HAVE MORE PEOPLE OBVIOUSLY WORKING
20 FROM HOME. IT'S THE FIRST TIME IN OUR HISTORY THAT WE HAVE HAD
21 THAT BE THE CASE. BUT I THINK IT'S A MAYBE NOT COMMONLY KNOWN,
22 AND MAYBE THERE IS THIS ASSUMPTION THAT SOMEHOW, BECAUSE WE'RE
23 A LARGE CITY, ALL THE JOBS RESIDE IN THESE AREAS THAT IS NOT
24 THE CASE. AND IN FACT, WHEN YOU COMPARE, IF YOU'RE BEING
25 LOOKING AT THINGS LIKE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, I THINK ONE

October 15, 2020

1 OF THE REASONS YU SEE SOME OF THESE OTHER OPTIONS LIKE 6A, OR
2 THE 8A HMC RECOMMENDED OPTION, THE REASON WHY YOU DON'T SEE A
3 SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE SIGNIFICANT GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IS
4 BECAUSE IF YOU ACTUALLY THINK ABOUT IT IN SIMPLE MATH, IF YOU
5 HAVE AN EXTRA 30,000 INDIVIDUALS INTO AN AREA WHERE MAYOR
6 STILL COMMUTING, THEY'RE NOT NECESSARILY -- THERE IS NOT
7 NECESSARILY SOMEHOW NO COMMUTE AND IN FACT AGAIN WE HAVE 20
8 PERCENT OF OUR WORKFORCE TODAY COMMUTING OUT OF THE CITY AND
9 THEY'RE ON THE ROAD ANYWHERE FROM 30 MINUTES TO AN HOUR GOING
10 ONE WAY AND HAVING TO COME BACK. NOW THAT MAY BE A TWO HOUR
11 COMMUTE FOR SOMEBODY WHO IS COMING FROM FURTHER OUT, BUT WHEN
12 YOU COMPARE IT SOMEBODY COMING FROM A FEW HOURS OUT AND MAYBE
13 A HUNDRED THOUSAND INDIVIDUALS VERSUS 30,000 INCREASE OF NEW
14 UNITS IN THAT INCREASE OPTION, FROM THE GROWTH BASELINE, THE
15 DIFFERENCE IS STARK. AND IN THAT IT'S GOING TO ATTRIBUTE TO
16 SOME GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS THERE IS A LOT OF OTHER FACTORS THAT
17 GO INTO PLAY BUT THAT'S SORT OF THE ONE ARGUMENT THAT WE SEE
18 THAT MAY BE POSITIVE FROM THIS 8A OPTION WITH THE GROWTH
19 BASELINE. AND I THINK THAT'S WHY WE SEE THAT IT'S NOT EVEN
20 THAT SIGNIFICANT, AS SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ POINTED OUT. SO I'LL
21 LEAVE THAT CONVERSATION THERE. BUT I DO WANT TO SAY THAT I
22 ORIGINALLY WOULD HAVE WANTED TO SUPPORT OPTION 6A. I THINK THE
23 EQUITY ARGUMENT IS SOMETHING THAT HAS NOT BEEN ADDRESSED BY
24 OUR REGION, AND IN FACT, I THINK IT WAS MAYBE A GREAT EXAMPLE
25 TO BRING UP BELVEDERE. AS YOU LOOK TODAY, AS I TOOK THE

October 15, 2020

1 OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO WHILE WE'RE ON THIS CALL, THERE ARE
2 CURRENTLY A FEW HOMES LISTED FOR SALE BETWEEN
3 \$5,000,030,000,000 ON THIS ISLAND OF BELVEDERE. AND THE
4 AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD INCOME IS ALMOST \$300,000 A YEAR. YET THEY
5 STILL HAVE 341 PEOPLE BLOT POVERTY LEVEL. AND SO, ALTHOUGH
6 THIS ISLAND, IN ITSELF, SOMEHOW THEY WANT TO STAY AN ISLAND
7 FOR 5 TO \$30 MILLION MANSIONS FOR POP MAKING \$3,000 A YEAR
8 THERE ARE INDIVIDUALS TO THE MAKING THAT MONEY AND ARE LIKELY
9 INDIVIDUALS SERVING THAT COMMUNITY WHO HAVE NO OPTION BUT TO
10 COMMUTE FROM ELSEWHERE AND THIS IS WHY THAT EQUITY ARGUMENT IS
11 SO STRONG BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT BEEN BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING
12 IN THESE COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT OUR BUYER REGION AND WE HAVE
13 THESE EXCLUSIVE ISLANDS AS BELVEDERE IS FOR ONLY WEALTHY
14 INDIVIDUALS. SO I THINK THAT MIGHT HAVE BEEN A DECENT EXAMPLE
15 FOR ONE ARGUMENT BUT IT ENDED UP BEING A TERRIFIC EXAMPLE FOR
16 MY ARGUMENT. SO I THINK, AS A SIGNIFICANT COMPROMISE, I THINK
17 THE OPTION RECOMMENDED BY HMC, 8A WITH THE HOUSEHOLD BASELINE
18 ESPECIALLY WITH THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT WENT IN OVER THE LAST
19 YEAR, I APPRECIATE ALL OF THE WORK THAT THE COMMITTEE PUT IN
20 AND ESPECIALLY THE STAFF IN TRYING TO REALLY FIGURE OUT SOME
21 OF THE FACTS FOR US BE ABLE TO LAY IT OUT CLEARLY WHAT THE
22 IMPACTS, AND NONE OF THESE OPTIONS ARE PERFECT BY ANY MEANS,
23 AND SO WE HAVE TO WEIGH OUT OPTIONS, I THINK THIS ONE GIVES US
24 THE BEST BALANCE MOVING FORWARD. SO I WON'T BE SUPPORTING THIS

October 15, 2020

1 SUBSTITUTE MOTION BUT I WILL SUPPORT THE UNDERLYING MOTION.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. VICE PRESIDENT RAMOS.

5

6 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I THANK YOU FOR THE WORK OF
7 STAFF AND OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. I DON'T WANT
8 TO LOSE SIGHT OF THE FACT THAT THE PASSAGE OF TIME BRINGS THE
9 VALIDATION TO THE PROCESS AND JUST BECAUSE A YEAR HAS GONE BY
10 DOESN'T MEAN THAT A STAMP OF APPROVAL IS WARRANTED AND THAT WE
11 SHOULD CLOSE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR RECOGNITION OF INNOVATION.
12 AND IN FACT, WHAT I SAY TO YOU ALL, MY COLLEAGUES S THAT THE
13 INNOVATION HERE ABSOLUTELY HINGES ON WHAT EVERYONE IS TALKING
14 ABOUT, WHICH IS EQUITY, BUT WE'RE LOOKING AT EQUITY IN THIS
15 MOMENT IN TIME AND MOVING FORWARD AS OPPOSED TO LOOKING AT THE
16 INREC EQUITIES OF THE PAST AND THE DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT OF
17 THE JOBS AND HOUSING IMBALANCE OVER THE LAST 20 YEARS AND
18 TRYING TO RECTIFY THAT FOR AN ENTIRE REGION AS OPPOSED TO
19 LOOKING AT WHAT THE DEFICIENCIES WERE OF THE PAST AND TO MOVE
20 FORWARD THAT WE HAVE GOT TO DO BOTH DO BETTER IN THE FUTURE
21 BUT ALSO LOOK TOWARDS THE PAST. ONE OF THE THINGS THEY THINK
22 IS IMPORTANT HERE, AND SOMEHOW IT'S NOT LOST UPON ME THAT WE
23 SEEM TO DO OUR FINEST WORK AT ABAG IN THE WE HOURS OF THE
24 NIGHT AND INTO THE MORNING. I AM GOING TO SAY TO ALL OF YOU
25 RHNA IS A FLOOR. ANYONE THAT WANTS TO DO MORE YOU ARE BY ALL

October 15, 2020

1 MEANS AS YOUR JURISDICTIONS EMPOWERED TO DO MORE BUT WHAT RHNA
2 LOOKS AT AND WHAT IT'S FORCING UPON EACH OF US, AND I SAY EACH
3 OF US REGIONALLY, IN THE LARGE NUMBER, AND EACH OF US IN OUR
4 RESPECTIVE CAPACITIES IN THE JURISDICTIONS THAT WE REPRESENT,
5 IS THAT THAT NUMBER THAT'S COMING FROM THE STATE IS WHAT IS
6 FORCED UPON US AND THAT IS GOING TO BE THAT METRIC THAT WE
7 EITHER MEET IT UNDER THESE VERY STRICT CIRCUMSTANCES THAT ARE
8 IMPOSED UPON US THROUGH THIS PROCESS, WHICH WE CAN -- I CAN --
9 I'LL ACKNOWLEDGE, WE CAN DISAGREE AS TO WHETHER A SUFFICIENT
10 POLICY DISCUSSION WAS HAD AT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE
11 OR NOT. I THINK DEPENDING ON YOUR JURISDICTION, YOU HAVE A
12 DIFFERENT POINT OF VIEW. BUT, IF WE LOOK AT TAKING THIS RHNA
13 NUMBER, AND LOOKING AT IT AS A FLOOR, AND ACKNOWLEDGING THAT
14 WE HAVE TO ADDRESS INEQUITIES FOR THE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE
15 IN ORDER TO ATTAIN JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE INTO THE FUTURE WE ARE
16 EMPOWERED TO DO MORE BUT IN ORDER TO DO THAT WE HAVE GOT TO
17 HAVE AN ACKNOWLEDGEMENT THAT WHERE THE JOBS ARE, WHERE THEY
18 WILL BE. HOW LONG THESE COMMUTES ARE, I HAVE SHARED THIS
19 BEFORE. I TRAVEL 14 MILES TO WORK AND IT TAKES ME 42 MINUTES.
20 SO THE 30 MINUTE LEAD TIME -- I DON'T KNOW WHERE THAT GETS ME.
21 ANY -- WHERE THAT GETS ME A BETTER QUALITY OF LIFE. BECAUSE AS
22 IT IS RIGHT NOW TRAVELING 14 MILES ONE WAY, I AM IN THE CAR
23 WITH MY THREE CHILDREN, AT LEAST AN HOUR AND A HALF A DAY.
24 THAT'S NOT A QUALITY OF LIFE, SO IF WE ARE HOOKING AT
25 DISPERSING HOUSING TO THE ENTIRE REGION AS OPPOSED TO

October 15, 2020

1 CONCENTRATING AROUND THESE JOB CENTERS THAT HAVE THE
2 INFRASTRUCTURE IN PLACE, THAT HAVE THE ABILITY TO ACCEPT THAT
3 INFRASTRUCTURE, THAT HAVE THAT I WOULD SAY REAL OPPORTUNITY
4 BECAUSE I'LL TELL YOU, SOME OF THESE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS DON'T
5 HAVE THAT OPPORTUNITY. AND WE CANNOT BE ON A PATH FORWARD
6 SIMPLY BECAUSE OF THE PASSAGE EVER TIME, AND THE TIME THAT HAS
7 BEEN INVESTED BY STAFF AND THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE
8 TO SUBSCRIBE TO A METHODOLOGY THAT IDENTIFIES THESE HIGH
9 RESOURCE AREAS THAT WILL SETUP CERTAIN JURISDICTIONS TO FAIL
10 ON THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS. PART OF THE RHNA PROCESS PROCESS IS
11 WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO ELEVATE EVERYONE AT THE SAME TIME WITH A
12 RECOGNITION THAT WE ARE ALL DIFFERENT. I'M THE FIRST TO
13 RECOGNIZE THAT WE ARE ALL AT FAULT FOR NOT HAVING PRODUCED
14 ENOUGH HOUSING. WITH THE EXCEPTION -- CREDIT TO MAYOR GARCIA
15 WHO IS HERE, HAS MET ITS HOUSING ALLOCATION TIME AND TIME
16 AGAIN. SO I WILL SAY THAT. BUT WE HAVE GOT TO BE ABLE TO
17 RECOGNIZE WHERE OUR -- WHERE WE HAVE BEEN IN ORDER TO BE ABLE
18 TO MOVE FORWARD OTHER IS FOR THAT REASON, I WILL BE SUPPORTING
19 THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION, BECAUSE IT ESTABLISHES THE FLOOR FOR US
20 TO BE ABLE TO ADDRESS THE INEQUITIES OF THE PAST, TO BE ABLE
21 TO SUPPORT A MORE EQUITABLE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VICE PRESIDENT RAMOS. I'M
24 GOING TO JUMP INTO THE DISCUSSION. I RESPECTFULLY DISAGREE. I
25 CONTINUING PROMOTES THE INEQUITIES OF THE PAST THAT'S WHY I

October 15, 2020

1 SUPPORT OPTION 8A. I SUPPORT PRAISE GIVEN TO STAFF. I CHAIRED
2 THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND EVERY MEETING THERE WAS
3 A REQUEST FOR VOLUMES AND INFORMATION AND THEY JUST DID A
4 REALLY INCREDIBLE JOB OF GIVING US ANALYSIS UPON WHICH WE CAN
5 MAKE, HAVE A DISCUSSION AND MAKE INFORMEDED DISCUSSIONS. WE H
6 I THINK AT THE END OF THE DAY EIGHT DIFFERENT OPTIONS THAT WE
7 CHOSE FROM SO THERE WAS ANALYSIS OF HOW THOSE DIFFERENT
8 OPTIONS, METRICS IN TERMS OF NUMBERS PER JURISDICTION AND BY
9 COUNTY. SO I JUST WANT TO JOIN THE PRAISE TO OUR STAFF. AND
10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE SUPPORT YOU PROVIDED THE HMC AND
11 TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD'S PROCESS. I WANT TO SHARE A COUPLE OF
12 POINTS. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION IN THAT WE
13 DO HAVE A VERY LIMITED TIME FRAME TO MAKE DECISIONS TO MEET
14 HCD'S TIME LIMITS. THE NEXT DECISION -- WE HAVE ONE MORE
15 DECISION TO MAKE BEFORE WE ADJOURN TONIGHT WHICH IS THE
16 SUBREGIONAL SHARES NAPA COUNTY, SOLANO COUNTY, SOME HAVE
17 FORMS, SUBREGIONS AND WE DO NEED TO MOVE THE SUBREGIONAL
18 PROCESS FORWARD TO MEET HCD'S TIMELINE AND WE HAVE TO HAVE A
19 METHODOLOGY TO MOVE THE SUBREGION PROCESS FORWARD. SO I AM
20 CONCERNED ABOUT A DELAY AND HOW IT WOULD IMPACT OUR ABILITY TO
21 MEET STATUTORY TIMELINES. WITH RESPECT TO THE VARIOUS OPTIONS,
22 I WANT TO SAY AN APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT WENT INTO THE
23 DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVES THAT WENT BORROW -- BEFORE IT, AND I
24 HAVE THE UTMOST RESPECT OF THOSE ON THE BOARD, WITH RESPECT TO
25 OPTIONS OF THE REGION. WE HAVE AT THE END OF THE DAY WHAT'S

October 15, 2020

1 BEST FOR THE REGION. WITH RESPECT TO THE ALTERNATIVE 8A. YOU
2 KNOW, STATED THAT, YOU KNOW, MOST OF THE JOB GROWTH HAS BEEN
3 THREE COUNTIES SANTA CLARA SAN FRANCISCO SAN MATEO COUNTY.
4 OPTION 8A DISTRIBUTES 60 PERCENT OF THE GROWTH TO THOSE
5 DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS AND THE ALTERNATIVE REDUCES
6 ALLOCATIONS TO SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY, AND SAN MATEO COUNTY. SO
7 I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. WHAT THE ALTERNATIVE WILL DO, AND
8 THIS IS AN AREA OF CONCERN FOR ME, AND I RECOGNIZE I'M COMING
9 FROM AN URBAN PERSPECTIVE, AND I'M THINK THINK ABOUT HOW I
10 LOOK AT IT FROM THE COMMUNITIES THEY REPRESENT IN ALAMEDA
11 COUNTY. BY PUTTING MORE MARKET RATE HOUSING IN SAN FRANCISCO,
12 THAT WILL FURTHER EXACERBATE THE GENTRIFICATION DISPLACEMENT
13 THAT WE ARE SEEING IN NEIGHBORHOODS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND
14 SUBURBANIZED COMMUNITIES I DO THINK THOSE COMMUNITIES NEED TO
15 MEET THEIR FAIR SHARE BUT THERE ARE FACTORS WE NEED TO
16 RECOGNIZE. WE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSION AT THE HOUSING
17 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. AND I KNOW THIS BECAUSE I CHAIRED THE
18 PROCESS. AND WE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSION AROUND THE BASELINE
19 ISSUE, AND WE DIDN'T ARRIVE AT A CONSENSUS AROUND THE
20 BASELINE, SO STAFF CAME FORWARD WITH THIS ALTERNATIVE USING
21 THE 2050 HOUSEHOLDS AND WE HAD A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT AND
22 THEN THROUGH A CONSENSUS BASED PROCESS HMC ARRIVED AT USING
23 THIS AS A BASELINE. WE HAD EXTENSIVE DISCUSSION OF ALL OF THE
24 FACTORS AND THE METHODOLOGY AND ULTIMATELY 27 MEMBERS OF THE
25 HMC VOTED TO SUPPORT OPTION 8A. AND 16 MEMBERS OF THE RPC

October 15, 2020

1 VOTED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH 8A AS WELL. SO I RESPECTFULLY
2 DISAGREE WITH ASSERTIONS THAT THERE WAS NOT SUFFICIENT
3 DISCUSSION OR SUFFICIENT INFORMATION AT THE HMC, AND I HAVE TO
4 SAY THAT AS CHAIR OF THAT COMMITTEE. BECAUSE THE LAST THING I
5 WANT TO DO IS ENSURE THAT WE DID NOT HAVE ADEQUATE TIME FOR
6 DISCUSSION, AND WE HAD EXTENSIVE DISCUSSION. IT KIND OF WENT
7 AROUND IN CIRCLES TO BE QUITE HONEST WITH YOU. BUT ULTIMATELY
8 THE MAJORITY OF THE COMMITTEE ARRIVED AT THE MAJORITY OF THE
9 OUTCOME. A COUPLE MORE POINTS. I THINK OPTION 8A ALTHOUGH NOT
10 PERFECT ENSURES A MORE EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF HOUSING
11 THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND WE HAVE TO RECOGNIZE. ONE, I AGREE
12 WE HAVE A JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND JOBS RICH COMMUNITIES
13 HAVE NOT MET THEIR FAIR SHARE SECONDLY WE WANT TO ADDRESS THE
14 ISSUE OF LACK OF ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY IN NEIGHBORHOODS AND
15 COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO THAT WAS ANOTHER FACTOR
16 WE HAVE THIS MANDATE TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING AS
17 PART OF SB 828. SO WHEN YOU LOOK AT HOW THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS
18 COMPARE OPTION 6A AND A EIGHT DO BEST TO MEETING REQUIREMENTS
19 OF AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. I THINK A LOT OF
20 THESE ISSUES WILL KNOW ADDRESSED WHEN WE GET TO HOUSING
21 ELEMENT IMPLEMENTATION. SPHERES OF INFLUENCE WILL BE CREATED
22 WHERE UNITS CAN BE MOVED OUT OF UNINCORPORATED AREAS, AND
23 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROVIDED SUSPECTING THE PLANNING NEEDED
24 FOR IMPLEMENTATION. I TO FEEL THAT AS THE CHAIR OF THE HMC
25 WEARING THAT OTHER HAT, I HAVE TO RESPECT THE WORK THAT THE

October 15, 2020

1 COMMITTEE DID, WHICH WAS A VERY DIVERSE GROUP OF STAKEHOLDERS
2 INCLUDING CLOSELY GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS, AND I DO HAVE TO
3 SUPPORT THE WORK THAT THEY DID. AND ALSO, IN ORDER TO ENSURE
4 THAT WE REACH AN OUTCOME THAT NOT ONLY MEETS STATUTORY
5 REQUIREMENTS BUT MOVES US FURTHER ALONG AS A REGION TO
6 INCREASE OPPORTUNITY THROUGHOUT EVERY CORNER OF OUR REGION. SO
7 I RESPECT EVERYONE'S OPINION. I'M GOING TO VOTE FOR 8A, BUT I
8 RESPECT THOSE WHO DISAGREE, AND WE'LL SEE WHAT THE OUTCOME IS
9 TONIGHT. PAST PRESIDENT RABBIT?

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARBEGIN, AND I GOT I HAVE
12 GOT TO SAY I HAVE LISTENED INTENTLY TO THE DISCUSSION TONIGHT
13 AND EVERYONE IS HAS VALID POINTS. THERE IS ELEMENTS OF THE
14 DIFFERENT OPTIONS THAT ADDRESS DIFFERENT THINGS THAT ARE
15 COMING FORWARD AND YOU HEAR THAT AND TO EVERYONE COMMENT, I,
16 AGAIN, I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE LISTENING TO YOUR POINT OF VIEW,
17 AND I THINK IT'S EVENTUAL GOING FORWARD. AND I WILL SAY, ONCE
18 AGAIN, TO STAFF, THANK YOU, THANK YOU, THANK YOU FOR ALL THE
19 WORK. JANE REILLY SAYS HELLO. GILLIAN, AND THANK YOU FOR ALL
20 THE WORK, AND SPEAKS VERY HIGHLY OF YOU IN SPITE OF HER
21 PENDING RETIREMENT AND THAT'S OUR PLANNER HERE IN SONOMA
22 COUNTY. OUR COUNTY ACTUALLY IS NOT SHYING AWAY AT ALL FROM THE
23 HOUSING. AND I HAVE SAID THIS BEFORE TO YOU, AND I DON'T MEAN
24 TO TAKE TIME NOW, BUT YOU KNOW, LOSE ABOUT 7,000 HOMES IN
25 THREE YEARS' TIME INCLUDING ABOUT 700 THIS YEAR AND YOU HAVE A

October 15, 2020

1 DIFFERENT ATTITUDE ABOUT HOW YOUR HOUSING SHOULD BE BUILT AND
2 WHERE IT'S BUILT. WE HAVE EVERY REGULATION THERE IS WE HAVE
3 OFF THE SHELF ADUS DESIGN AND ENGINEER, WITH NO DEVELOPMENT
4 IMPACTS BECAUSE WE NEED PEOPLE TO BE ABLE TO STAY HERE IN OUR
5 COUNTY AND DESPITE OF THAT WE LOST 3,000 POPULATION WITH THE
6 FIRES AND WHO KNOWS WITH THE LAST THREE FIRES NAPA COUNTY IS
7 SUFFERING IN MUCH THE SAME WAY IN THIS LAST FIRE WITH THE
8 NUMBER OF COMMERCIAL STRUCTURES THOSE ARE JOBS AS WELL AS
9 HOMES THAT ARE TRAGICALLY LOST. SO, HOUSING SAY BIG DEAL. MY
10 WIFE COMMUTES TO SONOMA COUNTY BECAUSE IT WAS THE ONLY HOME WE
11 COULD AT THE TIME. OUR QUALITY OF LIFE IS COMPROMISED BECAUSE
12 WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE MOVING ANY TIME SOON. WITH ALL OF THAT,
13 I LOOK AT THESE THINGS AND THERE IS NO WRONG OR RIGHT ANSWER.
14 OUR COUNTY IS -- IT'S 200 UNITS HERE, 200 UNIT THERE IS, AT
15 THE END OF THE DAY WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO PUSH OURSELVES THE
16 BRINK. AND TO REALLY PUSH OURSELVES. I WILL SAY THIS THOUGH, I
17 HOPE IN THE FUTURE METHODOLOGIES THAT WE DO TREAT
18 UNINCORPORATED AREAS, HAVE SOME SORT OF FACTOR. BECAUSE YOU
19 KNOW, WE, REALLY, IN THIS COUNTY HAVE EMPHASIZED CITY CENTERED
20 GROWTH AND IT'S NOT THAT WE DON'T WANT THE GROWTH I'M NOT
21 TALKING ABOUT ELIMINATING OUR NUMBER BUT MAYBE IF WE COULD
22 HAVE SOME SORT OF FACTOR, WE DON'T NEED 6,000 OPPORTUNITY INS
23 OUT IN THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTY. THAT'S NOT WHERE THE JOBS
24 ARE. IT'S FARMLAND. WE'RE TRYING TO PROTECT T AND WE HAVE THIS
25 -- SO THAT'S A WHOLE 'NOTHER ISSUE AND WE CAN DEAL WITH THAT

October 15, 2020

1 LATER. I'M NOT OPPOSED -- I WANT TO FIX SOME OF THE ISSUES WE
2 HAVE RUN INTO WITH URBAN SIM AND I ALSO WANT TO FIX THE SPHERE
3 OF INFLUENCE ISSUES, AND IF YOU THINK THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN
4 LIKE AT SOME FUTURE POINT IN TIME AFTER THINGS GET ANNEXED, IF
5 YOU HAVE BEEN THROUGH THE LAFCO PROCESS YOU KNOW THAT'S NOT
6 GOING TO BE QUICK. AND IT HAS TO HAPPEN WITH THIS CYCLE RIGHT
7 NOW. SO I JUST PUT THAT OUT THERE FOR OUR STAFF TO RECOGNIZE
8 THAT. YOU KNOW, SO NO MATTER WHAT OPTION WE PICK. I DO THINK -
9 - I WILL SAY THIS, AND I DON'T MEAN TO BE CURMETHODOLOGY ON
10 BUT WHATEVER OPTION WE PICK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO LEGISLATE
11 AT SOME TIME BECAUSE WE HAVE TO DECOUPLE THE GRANTS. WHEN A
12 JURISDICTION TRYING TO MEET ONE STATE MANDATE RUNS INTO THE
13 OTHER STATE MANDATE AND THAT'S PLANNED BAY AREA. AND ALL OF US
14 THIS IS PLANNED BAY AREA, WE'RE IMPLEMENTING DRACONIAN METHODS
15 TO MEET OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS THAT ARE NOT QUITE
16 PALATABLE FOR FOLKS, THE CONTROVERSY OVER THE 60 PERCENT
17 TELECOMMUTE OR MY WAY THE FACT THEY WOULD IMPOSE ALL LANE
18 TOLLING ON THE FREEWAY. THESE ARE ISSUES THAT NEED TO GO BACK
19 TO THE STATE AND TO HAVE A BIG BROADER DISCUSSION. THE WE
20 DON'T -- I UNDERSTAND THAT, YOU KNOW, PERHAPS WE DON'T WANT TO
21 BE THE FIRST REGION TO NOT MEET A STANDARD BUT AT WHAT PRICE
22 ARE WE PAYING TO NOT STAND UP TO THE STATE AND SAY YOU KNOW WE
23 NEED TO FIGURE THIS OUT IN A BIGGER BROADER WAY AND THE PEOPLE
24 WHO MOVE OUT OF THE BAY AREA DO SO FOR INCOME, AND WHY ARE YOU
25 THEN PENALIZED THEM FOR HAVING TO COMMUTE TO THEIR JOBS

October 15, 2020

1 WHEREVER THEY MAY BE. I THINK WE HAVE SOME ISSUES TO DEAL W
2 I'M IN FAVOR OF MOVING WITH 8A. I RESPECT THE WORK THAT'S BEEN
3 DONE. QUITE FRANKLY, I RESPECT WHETHER IT'S 6A IN OUR COUNTY
4 IT'S NOT GOING TO MAKE A HUGE HILL OF DIFFERENCE WITH THE
5 NUMBERS. WE'LL PUSH OURSELVES NO MATTER WHAT BUT WITH THE WORK
6 ALREADY DONE I'M GOING TO STICK WITH THE RECOMMENDATION I'M
7 NOT OPPOSED TO ANY SORT OF DELAY AND MAKING SURE WE HAVE ALL
8 THE INFORMATION THAT WE NEED BUT I'LL LEAVE THAT UP TO THE
9 REST OF BOARD MEMBERS ASK STAFF. THANK YOU MR. PRESIDENT AND
10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR RUNNING A GREAT MEETING.

11

12 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'RE NOT DONE YET. DIRECTOR LEE?

13

14 **WAYNE LEE:** THANK YOU MR. PERSPECTIVE. YEAH. IT'S A VERY
15 DIFFICULT DISCUSSION, AND I APPRECIATE ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES
16 HERE, I KNOW ALL OF US FEEL THE STRESS AND WE ALL WANT TO MAKE
17 OUR STANDARD OF LIVING, WE WANT TO MAKE OUR COMMUNITY A
18 LIVABLE PLACE FOR EVERYBODY. SO I LISTENED TO THE DISCUSSION
19 ABOUT THE BELVEDERE ISLAND, THERE'S A FLAW IN THAT DISCUSSION
20 BECAUSE AS STAFF HAS FIGURED OUT, IT DEPENDS -- IT'S THE COST
21 OF HOUSING THERE, LOW INCOME HOUSING MAY COST \$3 MILLION AND
22 THAT'S NOT AFFORDABLE FOR SOMEBODY WHO IS CLEANING THE HOUSE
23 OR TENDING THE GARDEN. SO, THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO COMMUTE.
24 THERE IS LOW INCOME HOUSING THAT'S GOING TO BE AVAILABLE WHERE
25 YOU HAVE MUNICIPALITY THAT HAS A \$10 MILLION AVERAGE HOME.

October 15, 2020

1 OTHER FACTOR IS THE COMMUTE EVEN THOUGH IT'S KIND OF FACTORED
2 IN. BUT THERE ARE UNIQUE GEOGRAPHICAL AREAS THAT JUST LENDS
3 ITSELF TO GRIDLOCK AND COMMUTES. AND I THINK PART OF OUR
4 DISCUSSION IS THAT WE ONLY TALK ABOUT HOUSING. WE DON'T TALK
5 ABOUT -- OF COURSE WE DON'T TALK ABOUT TRANSPORTATION, BUT
6 THAT IS THE OTHER ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM. IF YOU GO AROUND THE
7 OTHER CITIES, NEW YORK AND EAST COAST, THEY BUILD A LOT OF
8 GOOD TRANSPORTATION, THEY BUILD A LOT OF GOOD HOUSING BECAUSE
9 THEY DO A LOT OF GOOD PLANNING IN CONJUNCTION SO WE ARE HERE
10 TRYING TO SOLVE EVERYTHING WITH HOUSING AND THERE IS NO DOUBT
11 THAT WE NEED TO BUILD THE HOUSING AND THIS PROCESS IS NOT
12 PERFECT. THERE'S A REQUIREMENT TO BUILD 600 LOW INCOME HOUSING
13 IN MILLBRAE. AND IF YOU HAVE EVER BEEN TO MILLBRAE THERE IS
14 NOT MUCH LAND AND IF THERE IS LAND IT'S VERY EXPENSIVE AND
15 THERE IS NO WAY YOU CAN BUILD LOW INCOME UNLESS THE ONLY PLACE
16 WE CAN DO THAT IS AT THE SAN FRANCISCO PUC AND THEY'RE NOT
17 INTERESTED IN DEVELOPING THEIR LAND. THEY HAVE A SIX ACRE
18 PIECE OF PROPERTY THE SIZE OF BART BUT THEY'RE NOT INTERESTED
19 IN DEVELOPING IT FOR LOW INCOME. SO WE'RE KIND OF STUCK. I'M -
20 - I'M THINKING THAT THIS IS A LIVING PROCESS. WE HAVE GOT TO
21 TAKE STEPS AND THERE'S NOT GOING TO BE A PERFECT. WE'RE NOT
22 GOING TO REACH THE EQUALITY EVERYWHERE. BUT WE HAVE GOT TO
23 TAKE A STAB AT IT TODAY BECAUSE TOMORROW IS GOT GOING TO
24 CHANGE MUCH. YOU GUARANTEE YOU, YOU CAN DO A LOT OF DISCUSSION
25 IT'S NOT GOING TO CHANGE MUCH. THIS IS THE BEST HYBRID WE HAVE

October 15, 2020

1 GOT. IT'S NOT PERFECT. BUT IT'S A LIVING DOCUMENT, WE CAN
2 STILL MAKE CHANGES BECAUSE I THINK THE ECONOMICS WILL REQUIRE
3 THAT. THE IMPACT OF TRAFFIC WILL REQUIRE IT, THE LACK OF
4 TRANSPORTATION WILL REQUIRE IT. CHANGES, WE'LL HAVE TO TWEAK
5 OUR NUMBERS AND EXPECTATION AND STAFF WILL GET NEW STATISTICS
6 THAT SHOW THAT WE NEED TO MAKE CHANGES. SO YES EQUITY IS
7 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT BECAUSE IF WE DON'T, THE SERVICE INDUSTRY,
8 OUR PRICE OF LIVING WILL GO UP. THE PEOPLE WILL HAVE TO MOVE
9 OUT, AND PEOPLE LIKE MYSELF CAN'T AFFORD TO LIVE HERE MUCH
10 MORE -- LUCKY I'M TABLE, I BOUGHT A HOUSE A WHILE AGO, AND MY
11 PARENTS ARE HERE. I'M LUCKY AND THERE AREN'T MANY LUCKY PEOPLE
12 LIKE ME I'M GOING TO SUPPORT 8A.

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR HUDSON.

15

16 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** REGARDLESS OF WHAT HAPPENS TONIGHT, YOU HAVE
17 MY --

18

19 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WHAT?

20

21 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I WANT TO CORRECT SOMETHING 8A REACHES THE
22 NUMBER, TWO THIRDS OF THE JOBS GO TO THREE THIRDS OF THE
23 COUNTY AND TWO THIRDS OF THE 8A MODIFIED BEFORE WE GET INTO TO
24 ACTUALLY ACCEPT THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION, IT'S THERE. BUT 8A
25 DOESN'T DO THAT. AND YOU DON'T GET THE TWO THIRDS JOBS AND TO

October 15, 2020

1 THIRDS HOUSING BALANCE, WHAT YOU DO IS CONTINUE THE PATTERN WE
2 HAVE WITH THE LAST QUARTER OF THE INDUSTRY AND THERE IS NO WAY
3 WE CAN JUSTIFY TWO THIRDS OF THE JOBS GOING MOSTLY TO SANTA
4 CLARA AND REDUCE 53,000 HOMES. IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. BUT
5 IT DOES SEEM TO BE THE WAY WE'RE GOING AND I'M TELLING YOU
6 YOU'RE GOING HAVE ANOTHER RHNA CYCLE AFTER THAT AND IT'S NOT
7 GOING TO GO AWAY WHERE YOU HAVE THIS IMBALANCE. SO WE EITHER
8 PUT OUR FOOT DOWN STARTING TONIGHT AND TRYING TO WORK THIS OUT
9 OR WE JUST ACCEPT WHAT YOU HAVE BEEN DOING AND COME UP WITH
10 WHATEVER IS CONVENIENT, 28A AND LEAVE IT AT AN IMBALANCE. BUT
11 IT IS NOT EQUITABLE.

12

13 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOROR MACKENZIE.

14

15 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES. I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
16 THANK DAVID RABBIT FOR NOT APPOINTING ME TO THE HMC. I SERVED
17 ON IT FOR TWO CYCLES BEFORE THIS ONE, AND SO I KNOW IT'S CRUEL
18 AND UNUSUAL PUNISHMENT, AND THANK YOU MR. PRESIDENT FOR
19 CHAIRING IT AND BRINGING IT TO WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER A
20 SUCCESSFUL CONCLUSION. I WOULD JUST AGREE NOT 100 PERCENT WITH
21 MY FELLOW SONOMA COUNTYIAN SUPERVISOR RABBIT. BUT I DO BELIEVE
22 THAT WE NEED TO DEAL, STAFF TO STAFF, AND POLITICALLY AS
23 NECESSARY WITH THE -- WHAT IS IT? THE SONOMA COUNTY THEM A I
24 GUESS, WHERE YOU HAVE NINE CITIES WITH WERE APPROVED URBAN
25 GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND VOTER APPROVED COMMUNITY SEPARATORS

October 15, 2020

1 AROUND THEM. THERE HAS GOT TO BE SOME RESOLUTION OF THAT
2 PROBLEM. THAT BEING SAID, NO DELAY. 8A. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. WITH THAT NO OTHER RAISED
5 HANDS. I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT WHILE THIS IS IMPORTANT
6 FOR THE SUBREGIONAL SHARES, AND FOR THE PUBLIC COMMENT
7 PROCESS, WHAT WE ARE DOING, ESSENTIALLY IS STARTING A PUBLIC
8 COMMENT PERIOD. WE'LL VOTE IN DECEMBER, ACTUALLY, ON THE FINAL
9 METHODOLOGY. AND THEN THAT WILL GO TO HCD, SO WE FIRST VOTE ON
10 THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION FROM SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN.

11

12 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** THERE IS AN ATTENDEE.

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE ALREADY CLOSED PUBLIC COMMENT.
15 SORRY WHOEVER RAISED THEIR HAND. I CALLED PUBLIC COMMENT AND
16 WE CLOSED SUBSTITUTE MOTION FROM SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN, AND MR.
17 CASTRO DID YOU WRITE IT DOWN? I THINK IT'S TO CONTINUE
18 DISCUSSION OF THE METHODOLOGY UNTIL OUR NEXT ABAG MEETING,
19 RIGHT?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT'S CORRECT.

22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** MOVED BY ANDERSEN SECONDED BY
24 HUDSON WE'LL NOW VOTE ON THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION TO CONTINUE OUR
25 METHODOLOGY TO THE NEXT ABAG MEETING.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VOTE ON THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION. [ROLL CALL
3 VOTE].

4

5 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** FRED LORI WILSON TYPED A COMMENT IN
6 CHAT SAYS I'M HERE. I DON'T KNOW.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THANK YOU. I COUNTED 24 NOS. NINE
9 YESES, MOTION FAILS.

10

11 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. LET'S CALL THE ROLL ON THE
12 MAIN MOTION TO ADOPT 8A.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. I COUNT 23 YES. TEN NOS.
15 MOTION PASSES.

16

17 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM. WE
18 HAVE ONE MORE ITEM. WHICH THE PRIOR ITEM IMPLEMENTED THE NEXT
19 ITEM GILLIAN IN THE INTEREST OF TIME IF WE CAN BE BRIEF
20 EXPLAINING THIS REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DRAFT SUBREGION SHARES.
21 IF YOU CAN TELL US WHAT IT IS, AND THEN WE CAN MOVE FORWARD
22 WITH A MOTION, POTENTIALLY.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RIGHT. SO HOUSING ELEMENT LAW ALLOWS
25 JURISDICTIONS TO DECIDE SUBREGION. AND THE SUBREGION WILL

October 15, 2020

1 CONDUCT ITS OWN RHNA'S PROCESS SEPARATE FROM A REGION'S
2 PROCESS AS PART OF THE PROCESS ABAG IS PUBLIC FOR TAKING A
3 SHARE OF THE HOUSING NEED WE GET IF THE STATE AND SIGNING IT
4 TO SUBREGIONS HOW THEY DISTRIBUTE IT AMONG ITS NUMBERS. THE
5 METHODOLOGY THAT THE BOARD APPROVED LAST MAY WAS THAT WE WOULD
6 ESSENTIALLY SUM THE ALLOCATIONS TO THE JURISDICTIONS WHO ARE
7 MEMBERS OF THE SUBREGION SUM THOSE ALLOCATIONS TOGETHER TO
8 DETERMINE THE SUBREGION'S TOTAL SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSING
9 NEED. BASED ON OPTION 8A. YOU SEE IN YOUR PACKET, THE SHARE
10 THAT WOULD GO TO THE NAPA COUNTY SUBREGION IS..78 PERCENT OF
11 THE REGION'S, AND THE DRAFT'S REGION EVER SOLANO COUNTY
12 SUBREGION IS 2.3 PERCENT.

13

14 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION TO
15 APPROVE THE DRAFT SHARES BASED ON 8A?

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** SECOND.

18

19 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SECONDED BY MULTIPLE PEOPLE. FRED,
20 WHOEVER GOT THE SECOND FIRST.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IF I CAN GET A NAME, PLEASE.

23

24 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MACKENZIE.

25

October 15, 2020

1 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. GIVE IT TO SUPERVISOR CANEPA,
2 I'LL GIVE TO DO SUPERVISOR MACKENZIE.

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** WHATEVER. I DON'T CARE.

5

6 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** COLLEAGUES DISCUSSION ON THE
7 MOTION. I SEE NO RAISED HAPPENED. WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON
8 ITEM SEVEN B, THE RHNA DRAFT SUBREGION SHARES. IF YOU WILL
9 LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I SEE WE
10 HAVE ONE RAISED -- OH I DON'T THINK THIS INDIVIDUAL RAISED
11 THEIR HAND. I THINK B IS THE ONLY RAISED HAND.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES. BEAKMAN HERE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK TONIGHT. I
14 WANTED TO QUICKLY OFFER UNDER EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE ITEM TEN
15 THERE ARE THREE SETS OF ITEMS THAT YOU'RE WORKING ON THAT ARE
16 ADDRESSING HOUSING ISSUES, AND THAT RHNA IS ONLY ONE PART OF
17 THREE SECTIONS. AND TWO OTHER SECTIONS THAT CAN ADDRESS MORE
18 EXPERIMENTAL IDEAS IN HOUSING. I DON'T KNOW HOW THIS QUITE
19 RELATES TO YOUR SUBHOUSING IDEAS OF THIS ISSUE. THANK YOU FOR
20 YOUR PATIENCE TO LET ME SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS
23 MR. CASTRO. ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WERE NONE.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** LET'S CALL THE ROLL ON THE MOTION.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES

5 UNANIMOUSLY.

6

7 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO THAT COMPLETES

8 OUR AGENDA. IN CLOSING, I WANT TO -- WE'RE SO FORTUNATE TO

9 HAVE SUCH DEDICATED LEADERS FOR OUR REGION. I WANT TO THANK

10 YOU ALL FOR YOUR TIME TODAY. THIS WAS A VERY IMPORTANT

11 DISCUSSION, AND A GOOD DISCUSSION. AND DIRECTOR GIBBONS BEFORE

12 WE ADJOURN, DO YOU WISH TO COMMENT.

13

14 **LIZ GIBBONS:** I WANT TO COMPLIMENT STAFF FOR THE INFORMATION

15 AND PRESENTATIONS ON THE PRECEDING MEETING ON THE HOUSING

16 COMMITTEE. AND I STRONGLY, STRONGLY ENCOURAGE ALL MEMBERS TO

17 REVIEW THE MEETING VIDEO OR PRESENTATION -- OR WRITTEN

18 MATERIAL. VERY, VERY IMPORTANT, IT RELATES DIRECTLY TO THE

19 FUTURE OF HOW WE CAN WORK TOGETHER AND GET SUPPORT FROM ABAG

20 AND MTC ON MEETING OUR RHNA NUMBERS. SO, THANK YOU TO STAFF,

21 AND PLEASE, EVERYONE, TAKE A LOOK AT THE MATERIAL.

22

23 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YEAH. I THINK WE'LL HAVE A

24 PRESENTATION IN A FUTURE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING ABOUT THE

25 EXPANDED PORTFOLIO.

October 15, 2020

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MR. PRESIDENT, I WILL ECHO THESE REMARKS AND I
3 HAVE ALREADY SENT OUT TO THE SONOMA COUNTY MAYORS AND COUNCIL
4 MEMBERS, THE LINKS TO THAT HOUSING COMMITTEE, MTC EXEC
5 COMMITTEE MEETING, AND I WAS JUST THINKING AS WE WERE
6 CONCLUDING THIS EPIC MEETING, THAT THE COMPANION PIECE TO WHAT
7 WE WERE DISCUSSING AT LENGTH, IT IS TO BE FOUND IN THAT
8 POWERPOINT PRESENTATION, AND THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
9 AUTHORITY, AND THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE, AND THE WORK THAT
10 IS TO COME NOW IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. I COULDN'T AGREE MORE
11 WITH THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT THE NEXT
14 MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD IS ON NOVEMBER 19TH AND WITH
15 THAT WE'RE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU ALL. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government