METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1 2	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
3	FRIDAY, OCTOBER 9, 2020, 9:40 AM
4	
5	JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: ON BEHALF OF MYSELF, THIS CHAIR,
6	AND DAVID RABBIT AS VICE CHAIR, I WOULD LIKE TO VEHICLE
7	EVERYONE TO THE JOINT COMMITTEE OF ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
8	COMMITTEE. FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS IS THE ANNOUNCEMENT OF
9	COVID-19.
10	
11	SPEAKER: DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A
12	ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
13	EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS
14	OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
15	SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
16	OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
17	RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
18	PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED
19	ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
20	COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM,
21	WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
22	STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
23	TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
24	DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
25	SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING
26	SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING



- 1 TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING
- 2 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE
- 3 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
- 4 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
- 5 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE
- 6 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS
- 7 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
- 8 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
- 9 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
- 10 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
- 11 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
- 12 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
- 13 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.
- 14
- 15 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. WITH THAT JESSE WILL
- 16 DO ROLL CALL. WE HAVE IT DOWN TO A SCIENCE. JESS DO YOU WANT
- 17 TO DO YOUR ABAG COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT AND YOUR CONSENT
- 18 CALENDAR.
- 19
- 20 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: MR. CHAIR SHOULD WE DO ROLL CALL
- 21 FIRST?
- 22
- 23 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: YEAH THAT'S WHAT I SAID WE'LL DO
- 24 ROLL CALL FIRST.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROLL CALL FOR ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
2	COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MAYOR ARREGUIN?
3	
4	JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ?
7	
8	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR CORTESE?
11	
12	DAVID CORTESE: HERE.
13	
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY?
15 16	SPEAKER: HERE.
17	SPEAKER. HEIGE.
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COUNCILMEMBER MACKENZIE?
19	
20	JAKE MACKENZIE: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: KAREN MITCHOFF?
23	
24	KAREN MITCHOFF: HERE.
25	



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ?
2	
3	RAUL PERALEZ: HERE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR PIERCE?
6	
7	JULIE PIERCE: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR RABBIT?
10	
11	DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR RAMOS?
14	
15	SPEAKER: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE MAYOR ROMERO? I THINK HE IS PRESENT.
18	
19	JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: HE IS ON THE CALL.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: QUORUM IS PRESENT.
22	
23	JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: HIS GO AHEAD AND DO THE MTC ROLL
24	CALL MARTHA.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER AHN?
2	
3	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CORTESE?
6	
7	DAVE CORTESE, CHAIR: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI NON-VOTING.
10	
11	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER LICCARDO.
14	
15	SAM LICCARDO: PRESENT.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER STRACNER NON-VOTING. MTC HAS
18	A QUORUM.
19	
20	JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: JESS I'M GOING TO HAND IT BACK TO
21	YOU FOR 2 AND 3.
22	
23	JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: FRED PLEASE GIVE THE ABAG
24	COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?
25	



MOTION.

11

12

14

16

18

October 9, 2020

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, SIR. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM 1 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG 2 3 BOARD IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$100 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING 4 5 FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK 6 YOU. 7 8 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: THANK YOU MOVING TO ITEM THREE ABAG COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR CONSISTS OF ONE ITEM APPROVAL 9 OF MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 11TH, 2020 MEETING. I'LL ENTERTAIN A 10

13 KAREN MITCHOFF: SO MOVED MR. PRESIDENT.

- 15 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: MOVED BY DIRECTOR MITCHOFF.
- 17 **JULIE PIERCE:** SECOND BY PIERCE.

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** SECOND BY PIERCE. ANY PUBLIC 20 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PLEASE 21 STAR NINE. NO COMMENTS. MR. CASTRO.

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO SUBMITTED COMMENTS. I SEE SUPERVISOR 24 HAGGERTY HAS A RAISED HAND.



1

October 9, 2020

JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: CHAIR HAGGERTY, DO YOU WISH TO

2 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. 3 SPEAKER: NO. I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT HAPPENED. 4 5 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: OKAY. WITH THAT WOULD THE COLLECT 6 7 PLEASE CALL THE ROLL. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES 10 UNANIMOUSLY. 11 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. THIS IS THE ITEM FOUR 12 CONSENT COMMITTEE CALENDAR. ANY DISCUSSION? IF NOT I'LL 13 14 ENTERTAIN A MOTION. 15 16 JAKE MACKENZIE: SO MOVED. 17 18 DAVE CORTESE, CHAIR: SECOND. 19 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: MACKENZIE AND CORTESE. MARTHA ANY 20 21 PUBLIC COMMENT? 22 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED FOR ANY ITEM 24 UNDER THE CONSENT CALENDAR.



JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: AND NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND UP. 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: WITH THAT TAKE THE ROLL. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] PASSES UNANIMOUSLY 9 10 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: ITEM FIVE REGION TRANSPORTATION PLAN SCOPE. WHO IS KICKING THIS OFF? 11 12 MATT MALONEY: COMMISSIONER SPERING MATT MALONEY REGIONAL 13 PLANNING I'LL CAN I HAVE I KICK IT OFF THEN PASS IT TO CAROLE. 14 15 GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I WILL INTRODUCE THE FIRST ITEM. 16 WE'RE GOING TO BE TAKING A BREAK FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. A DETOUR. OF COURSE THIS ALSO HAS A SYMBIOTIC RELATIONSHIP WITH 17 THE LONG RANGE PLAN TODAY WE'RE PRESENTING THE SCOPE FOR THE 18 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN REGION IN EARLY STAGES BUT 19 FELT WE NEED YOUR FEEDBACK EARLY ON. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 20 21 PLACES MAJOR EMPHASIS ON ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION TWO OF THE PLAN'S 35 STRATEGIES ADDRESS ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IN A 22 CENTRAL WAY. WE HAVE A STRATEGY FOR COMPLETE STREETS NETWORK A 23 \$13 BILLION INVESTMENT FOR BIKING AND WALKING AND MAKING 24

SAFER. INCLUDES BUILD-OUT OF 10,000 MILES OF BAKE LANES OR



- 1 MULTI-USE PATHS AND PROVIDING SUPPORT TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
- 2 TO EXPAND CAR FREE SO-CALLED SLOW STREETS IN ADDITION THE PLAN
- 3 EMPHASIZES A REGIONAL VISION ZERO POLICY THROUGH STREET DESIGN
- 4 AND REDUCED SPEED ALL ABOUT CREATING A SAFER ENVIRONMENT ON
- 5 OUR ROADWAYS INCLUDING REDUCED SPEED LIMITS AND DESIGN
- 6 ELEMENTS TO ENCOURAGE THE UPTAKE OF MORE ACTIVE MODES. ONSET
- 7 OF COVID-19 AND SHELTER-IN-PLACE HAS RESULTED IN SOME DRAMATIC
- 8 SHIFTS IN THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION SPACE. WE'RE SEEING
- 9 INCREASES IN BIKING AND WALKING TRIPS AS WELL AS RECORD BIKE
- 10 SALES MANY CITIES HAVE BEEN THINKING OUTSIDE THE BOX OF USING
- 11 STREETS DIFFERENTLY DURING THIS TIME IN A WAY THAT ENCOURAGES
- 12 RECREATION AND ACTIVE MODES THAT USES A WAY ON TO ENCOURAGE
- 13 VIBRANCE IN DOWNTOWN MANY OF WHICH HAVE BEEN ADVERSELY
- 14 AFFECTED BY THE PANDEMIC. STAFF IS RESEARCHING FEAR REACHED
- 15 PLANNING ON THIS TOPIC REACHING OUT TO PARTNERS AND
- 16 COMMUNITIES IN THE REGION WITH SPECIFIC ATTENTION ON
- 17 UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES INTENTION IS TO STRIKE A BALANCE
- 18 BETWEEN LONG-RANGE PLANNING ON THE TOPIC AND THE NEED TO FRONT
- 19 LOAD WHAT WILL BE A SHORTER TERM IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. KARA
- 20 OBERG IS HERE FROM THE REGIONAL PLANNING STAFF AND SHE WILL
- 21 PROVIDE A PRESENTATION TO YOU TODAY. I'LL PASS IT OVER TO HER.
- 23 KARA OBERG: THANK YOU MATT. THIS ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN
- 24 WILL DIRECTLY SUPPORT THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT
- 25 STRATEGIES. [INDISCERNIBLE] GUIDE INVESTMENT IN ACTIVE



- 1 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE AND REGIONAL POLICY DEVELOPMENT.
- 2 SO, IF WE COULD BRING UP THE SLIDES. THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE. SO
- 3 FOR BACKGROUND, IN 2001MTC ADOPTED OUR FIRST BICYCLE PLAN FOR
- 4 THE REGION AND THIS PLAN WAS MOST RECENTLY UPDATED IN 2009.
- 5 BETWEEN THIS PERIOD IN 2006 WE ADOPTED RESOLUTION 3765. AND
- 6 THIS IS THE POLICY FOR THE ACCOMMODATION OF BICYCLE AND
- 7 PEDESTRIAN FACILITIES WHICH IS ALSO KNOWN AS MTC'S COMPLETE
- 8 STREETS POLICY. NEXT SLIDE. A LOT HAS HAPPENED SINCE 2001. AS
- 9 I MENTIONED IN 2001 THAT WAS WHEN WE ADOPTED OUR FIRST BIKE
- 10 PLAN RESOLUTION 365 WAS PASSED IN 2006 AND A LOT OF MOVEMENT
- 11 IN OUR LONG RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLAN. IN 2008SB 375 WAS
- 12 PASSED AND WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF BEING CLOSE TO ADOPTING OUR
- 13 FOURTH PLANNED BAY AREA CYCLE. IN ADDITION TO THE MOVEMENT IN
- 14 OUR LONG-RANGE PLANNING, AS MENTIONED THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF
- 15 MOVEMENT IN BIKING AND WALKING. WILL IN 2013 A.B. 1193
- 16 ESTABLISHED A CLASS FOUR PROTECTED BIKEWAY. IN 2013 BAY AREA
- 17 BIKESHARE LAUNCH WHICH WAS THE FIRST REGIONAL BIKESHARE IN THE
- 18 COUNTRY AND LAUNCH 2017. WE HAVE SINCE HAD A LOT OF BIKES,
- 19 SCOOTER AND MICRO MOBILITY OPTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN OPERATING
- 20 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. NOT THAT A REMINDER IS
- 21 NEEDED BUT WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF A HISTORIC PERIOD OF CHANGE
- 22 BETWEEN THE PANDEMIC AND ECONOMIC RECESSION, A SPOTLIGHT ON
- 23 SYSTEMIC RACISM IN ADDITION FOREST FIRES AND POOR AIR OUALITY.
- 24 BUT WHAT THIS MEANS FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IS WE'RE SEEING
- 25 AN INCREASE BIKE USE. THEY'RE IMPLEMENTING QUICK BUILDS FOR



- 1 OUICK COMPLETE STREETS MICRO MOBILITY PROVIDING REDUNDANCIES
- 2 TO TRANSIT PEOPLE USING STREETS FOR MORE THAN JUST MOBILITY
- 3 NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO EXPAND UPON THE QUICK -- [INDISCERNIBLE]
- 4 AGAIN AS MAT MENTIONED INCREASE OF BIKE SALES IN ADDITION
- 5 TRIPS AND I WANT TO PROVIDE EXAMPLES OF WHAT WE'RE SEEING
- 6 AROUND THE REGION WITH THE QUICK STREETS IMPLEMENTATION. IN
- 7 FOSTER CITY THEY'RE UTILIZING AN OPEN CURB CONCEPT TO ADD
- 8 ADDITIONAL SPACE NEXT TO THE SIDEWALK TO ENCOURAGE PHYSICAL
- 9 DISTANCING FOR PEOPLE WALKING AND SLOWLY BIKING AND ROLLING.
- 10 IN PETALUMA THEY HAVE A SHARED STREET PROGRAM WHICH STREETS
- 11 ARE CLOSED TO THROUGH TRAFFIC TO PROVIDE SPACE FOR PEOPLE TO
- 12 REC RATE AND MOVE SAFELY USING PHYSICAL DISTANCING. OAKLAND
- 13 KICK STARTED THE SLOW STREETS STRATEGY, HAS RECENTLY
- 14 INSTITUTED SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS THAT PROVIDE PEDESTRIAN ACCESS
- 15 TO CENTRAL SERVICES SUCH AS GROCERY STORES APPROXIMATE MEDICAL
- 16 OFFICES. WE BRING UP THE HIGHLIGHTS HERE TO SAY WE'RE VERY
- 17 MUCH INCORPORATING THIS INTO THE PLAN IN ATU AND MAKING
- 18 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE
- 19 MICRO MOBILITY FRONTS SPECIFICALLY BIKESHARE WE HAVE SEEN THAT
- 20 BAY WHEELS RIDERSHIP HAS BEEN REDUCED SIMILAR TO TRANSIT.
- 21 RIDERSHIP HAS REMAINED STABLE FROM MAY TO SEPTEMBER AT 35
- 22 PERCENT PRE COVID LEVELS. BIKESHARE FOR ALL LOW INCOME PASS \$5
- 23 A YEAR FOR THE FIRST YEAR AND \$5 A MONTH THEREAFTER FOR
- 24 LIMITED 60 MINUTE RIDES HAS BEEN LARGE SUCCESS. WE HAVE
- 25 HIGHEST MEMBERSHIPS AROUND THE COUNTRY AND WE'RE SEEKING TO



- 1 EXPAND THIS PROGRAM. ELECTRIC BIKES ARE CONTINUING TO BE
- 2 POPULAR IN SAN FRANCISCO AND THE BAY AND SEEING TWICE AS MANY
- 3 CLASSIC BIKE RIDERSHIP THAN CLASSIC BIKES. IN ADDITION MTC HAS
- 4 A LARGE SHARE IN BIKESHARE CAPITAL PROGRAM. AS A REMINDER OF
- 5 THE GOAL HERE IS TO EXPAND BICYCLE ACCESS AND USE THROUGH BIKE
- 6 SHARING AND TO FACILITATE MULTI-MODAL TRANSPORTATION
- 7 CONNECTIONS TO TRANSIT AND OTHER BIKESHARE OPERATORS. SO MTC
- 8 HAS PROVIDED FUNDING TO THE CITY OF RICHMOND, FREMONT AS WELL
- 9 AS TAM AND SCTA TO GO ALONG WITH THE SMART CORRIDOR. THE
- 10 UPDATE HERE IS THAT RICHARD -- RICHMOND PLANS TO LAUNCH
- 11 BIKESHARE PLANS 100 BIKES OPERATING THIS YEAR THROUGH THE
- 12 PERMANENTS IS AND ARE IN THE PROCESS ARE REVIEWING CONTRACT
- 13 FOR A DIFFERENT SYSTEM AND IN THE NORTH BAY THEY ARE PLANNING
- 14 A LAUNCH OF THEIR SYSTEM, 300 E-BIKES IN THE SPRING OF 2021.
- 15 ONE NOTE IS THAT THE SAME OPERATOR HAS ONE IN RICHMOND AND TAM
- 16 AND SCTA SO THERE IS DEFINITELY OPPORTUNITY FOR SEAMLESS
- 17 MOBILITY AS MENTIONED EARLIER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO BACK TO
- 18 THE PLAN AT-LARGE AT MATT MENTIONED THIS IS GOING TO EXPAND
- 19 UPON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGIES. SO THE STRATEGIES THAT
- 20 WE HAVE HERE ARE BUILT, IDENTIFIED, BUILD AND CONNECT COMPLETE
- 21 STREETS NETWORK, ADVANCE REGIONAL VISION ZERO POLICY UTILIZES
- 22 CONNECTED COMMUNITIES DESIGNATION. CONNECTED COMMUNITIES ARE
- 23 AREAS OF BASIC TRANSIT SERVICE COMPLIMENTED BY ROBUST POLICIES
- 24 AND INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND MOBILITY SPECIFICALLY BIKING
- 25 WALKING VISION ZERO AND PARKING POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE. THE

- 1 ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN, AS A HIGHLIGHT, OUR POLICY AND PROGRAM
- 2 UNLESS WILL INCLUDE AN UPDATE OF MTC'S COMMITTEE STREETS
- 3 POLICY, THE REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK WHICH IS A
- 4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT STRATEGY AND THE ACTIVE
- 5 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK WILL BUILD OFF OUR REGIONAL BIKE
- 6 NETWORK PICTURED HERE TO THE RIGHT SO THE REGIONAL BIKE
- 7 NETWORK IS A PRODUCT OF OUR FIRST PLAN OF 2001 AND WE MOST
- 8 RECENTLY UPDATED THE MAP IN 2018. IN 2018 ABOUT TWO THIRDS WAS
- 9 COMPLETE JUST UNDER 1500 MILES OUT OF THE 200140 MILES OF THE
- 10 REGIONAL SIGNIFICANT CORRIDORS THAT WERE ESTABLISHED. TWO
- 11 OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN INCLUDE A FIVE YEAR IMPLEMENTATION
- 12 PLAN IN COORDINATION WITH PLANNED BAY AREA'S IMPLEMENTATION
- 13 AND WILL SUPPORT COVID-19 NEEDS AS MENTIONED AND LASTLY THE
- 14 FUNDING ANALYSIS TO UNDERSTAND FUNDING CONSTRAINTS AND
- 15 POTENTIAL FUNDING SCENARIOS. NEXT SLIDE. REGARDING ENGAGEMENT
- 16 WE LOOK FORWARD I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FEEDBACK AND
- 17 ANSWERING QUESTIONS FROM THIS GROUP TODAY. THERE WAS A
- 18 PRESENTATION TO THE CTA DIRECTOR BAUTERS LAST WEEK, AND WE'LL
- 19 BE PRESENTING TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL LATER THIS MONTH
- 20 IN ADDITION WE WILL BE ENGAGING THE REGIONAL ADVISORY REGIONAL
- 21 EQUITY AND EQUITY GROUPS. CTA AND LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TRANSIT
- 22 AGENCIES AND OTHER REGIONAL STATE PARTNERS CBOS ADVOCACY
- 23 ORGANIZATIONS AND NGOS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE ENGAGEMENT WE HOPE
- 24 WILL HELP TO LAY A BASIS FOR AN EQUITABLE PLAN BUT I WANT TO
- 25 HIGHLIGHT EXPECTS OF THE PLAN EQUITY. METRICS INCLUDE FACTORS



INCLUDING EQUITY AND I MENTIONED CBOS IN THE LAST SLIDE AND WE 1 PLAN TO HIRE AND PARTNER WITH CBOS THAT ARE ON MTC'S BENCH AND 2 3 OTHERS TO HELP WITH ENGAGEMENT AND BUILDING OFF PAST WORK. OUR OWN WORK AROUND CTPS THE AIR DISTRICT'S WORK ON 617 AS WELL AS 4 5 BUILDING OFF EQUITY ELEMENTS OF ADOPTED PLANS OR CLOSE TO ADOPTED PLANS SUCH AS OAKLAND'S BIKE PLAN AND SAN JOSE'S DRAFT 6 BETTER BIKE PLAN 2025. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS IS THE LAST SLIDE. 7 8 SO WE CURRENTLY HAVE THE RFP HAS BEEN RELEASED FOR CONSULTANT PURPOSES. THIS MONTH WE'LL BE REVIEWING PROPOSALS AND FORMING 9 A TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE. LATER THIS YEAR WE WILL BE 10 KICKING OFF THE MEETING WHICH THE FIRST MEETING WILL FOCUS ON 11 KEY ISSUES GOALS AND OBJECTIVES AS WE SIMULTANEOUSLY CHOOSE 12 CONSULTANT AND CONTRACT APPROVAL BULK OF WORK WITH STAKEHOLDER 13 ENGAGEMENT WILL BEGIN IN 2021 AS MATT MENTIONED WE WANT TO 14 15 LOOK AT THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN PARALLEL AND START WORKING 16 ON IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WITH THE REST OF THE WORK IN 2022 THAT IS THE GOAL FOR THE DRAFT AND FINAL PLAN. THAT'S WHAT I HAVE. 17 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND I LOOK FORWARD TO ANSWERING 18 19 QUESTIONS.

20

- JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: CAN YOU EXPAND ON THE FUNDING PLAN AS 21
- 22 THE STRATEGY, THE LAST TASK YOU HAD ON THE CHART WHAT ARE YOU
- 23 GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THERE?



- 1 KARA OBERG: THIS TASK IS GOING TO BE STAFF LEAD WITH
- 2 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS SECTION AS WELL AS STAFF PLANNING.
- 3 WE HAVE A HOST OF FUNDING SOURCES THAT ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
- 4 CAN BE FUNDED BY. SO WE WANT TO EVALUATE, YOU KNOW, THE
- 5 EFFICACY OF THAT, AS WELL AS MAYBE ADDING SOME MORE
- 6 FLEXIBILITY. SO A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES, OUR ACTIVE
- 7 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IS LARGELY OVERSUBSCRIBED SO HOW CAN WE
- 8 GET MORE FUNDING FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AS ONE PIECE AND
- 9 THEN MORE NEAR TERM PRESENT DAY CHALLENGE IS THESE QUICK
- 10 COMPLETE STREETS FOR EXAMPLE, PEOPLE WANT TO IMPLEMENT THEM
- 11 BUT THE FUNDING MAYBE DOESN'T MATCH EXACTLY WHAT JURISDICTIONS
- 12 ARE LOOKING TO DO. SO LOOKING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT ALL OF OUR
- 13 FUNDING OPTIONS ARE AND HOW WE MEET THE CURRENT DEMAND FOR
- 14 BIKING AND WALKING IMPROVEMENTS.
- 16 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: WILL STAFF BE CONSIDERING SOME
- 17 SEED MONEY THAT WOULD GO INTO DELIVERING SOME OF THE PROJECTS
- 18 IN THESE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES SO WE CAN ACTUALLY START
- 19 SEEING HOW EFFECTIVE SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS ARE?
- 21 KARA OBERG: I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEA. WE CAN DEFINITELY
- 22 NOTE THAT.
- 24 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. IF YOU CAN HAVE PILOT
- 25 PROGRAMS IN A LOT OF THESE COMMUNITIES, I THINK IT WOULD SPEAK

15

20



VOLUMES AND I THINK IT'S A WORTHWHILE INVESTMENT HOPEFULLY 1 2 STAFF CAN LOOK AT THAT. 3 KARA OBERG: OKAY. 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: MARTHA, I DON'T SEE ANYBODY ELSE 6 7 WITH THEIR HAND UP. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER AHN. 10 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: COMMISSIONER I WOULD LIKE TO GET 11 IN ON AFTER COMMISSIONER. 12 13 EDDIE AHN: AHN QUICK QUESTION ON AB 617, OUR NON-PROFIT IS 14 15 DOING AN AIR QUALITY MONITORING PROGRAM AND I LOVE THE WORK 16 WEST OAKLAND IS DOING, COULD YOU EXPOUND ON THE CONNECTION AND ALSO OTHER PROJECTS THAT EXIST IN THE CITY OF RICHMOND. 17 18 MATT MALONEY: COMMISSIONER THIS IS MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF 19 REGIONAL PLANNING. I WILL STEP IN ON THIS AND KARA FEEL FREE 20 21 TO AUGMENT ON MY ANSWER IF YOU WANT TO. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING 22 TOGETHER WITH THE PROJECT ON AB 617 THAT'S EXPANDING INTO 23 RICHMOND AND EAST OAKLAND. ONE OF THE THINGS WE FOUND VERY HELPFUL ABOUT THAT EFFORT IS JUST THE VERY DEEP LEVEL OF 24 ENGAGEMENT THAT WENT INTO THAT EFFORT AND ALSO THE COMMITMENT 25



REALLY THIS'S BEEN MADE TO THOSE COMMUNITIES NOT ONLY TO WRITE 1 2 A PLAN, BUT TO WORK TOWARD IMPLEMENTING THE STRATEGIES IN THE 3 PLAN. YOU KNOW, I -- MANY TIMES ALSO YOU KIND OF GO INTO SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS LIKE AB 617 AND OBVIOUSLY THE FOCUS THERE IS 4 5 AIR OUALITY IN CERTAIN PARTS OF THE REGION BUT WHAT YOU FIND WHEN YOU TALK TO THE COMMUNITY MEMBERS, YOU KNOW, YOU MIGHT 6 COME OUT WITH SOMEBODY DIFFERENT, AND MORE ILLUMINATING IN 7 8 TERMS OF WHAT THESE COMMUNITIES ARE REALLY DESIRING IN TERMS OF IMPROVEMENTS. ONE THING THAT WE HAVE NOTED IS THAT, YOU 9 10 KNOW, IMPROVEMENTS AMENITIES TO ASSIST WITH WALKING AND BIKING IS SOMETHING THAT RISES TO THE FOREFRONT IN A LOT OF THESE 11 PLANNING EFFORTS. AND I THINK JUST BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE 12 ABILITY OBVIOUSLY TO REACH EVERYBODY AND TO HIT EVERY 13 COMMUNITY, WE WANT TO WORK AS CLOSELY AS WE CAN WITH OUR 14 PARTNERS WHO ARE IN SIMILAR SPACES, AND ENGAGING BROADLY WITH 15 16 COMMUNITIES TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT DUPLICATING EFFORTS AND BUILDING OFF THINGS THAT HAVE ALREADY HAPPENED THAT HAVE 17 BEEN SUCCESSFUL. 18 19 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: EDDIE, DID THAT ANSWER YOUR 20

22

21

23 EDDIE AHN: YES IT DID.

QUESTION?

24

25 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. WHO IS NEXT MARTHA?



1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR ARREGUIN? 3 JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR: THANK YOU. JUST A FEW COMMENTS. 4 5 EXCITED WE'RE STARTING THIS PROCESS. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE MTC TO BUILD ON LOCAL AND COUNTY ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLANS SO WE 6 CAN COORDINATE POLICIES AND PROGRAMS IN THOSE PLANS. AND I 7 8 THINK MTC COULD PROVIDE VALUE BY CONTINUING TO ADVANCE AND EVOLVE THE REGIONAL BIKESHARE PROGRAM. I WAS ENCOURAGED TO 9 10 HEAR THAT RICHMOND WILL BE LAUNCHING E-BIKES, AND WOULD LIKE TO KNOW MORE ABOUT THE STATUS OF THE E-BIKE PROGRAM IN THE 11 EAST BAY. IN ADDITION, I THINK THIS PLAN COULD HELP FACILITATE 12 INFORMATION EXCHANGE REGARDING COVID, QUICK BUILD ACTIONS 13 ACROSS THE REGION. WE HAVE SEEN THESE QUICK BUILD PROJECTS 14 15 HAPPEN, AND I THINK WE COULD SEE MORE OF THAT AND HOW WE CAN 16 LOOK AT SORT OF TRANSFORMING OUR STREETS TO IMPROVE WALKING AND BIKING. AND, I THINK THIS PLANNING PROCESS CAN HELP LOCAL 17 GOVERNMENTS IMPROVE THEIR PROJECT COMPETITIVENESS FOR STATE 18 AND FEDERAL GRANTS. SO I JUST WANT TO ENCOURAGE ENGAGEMENT 19 WITH CITIES AND TRANSIT AGENCY IN THIS PROCESS. AND, YOU KNOW, 20 21 I THINK THIS COULD REALLY BE A REALLY EXCITING WAY TO NOT ONLY IMPLEMENT OUR PLANNED BAY AREA GOALS, BUT ALSO TO OUR VISION 22 ZERO POLICY THAT MANY JURISDICTIONS MTC ADOPTED AND MAKE SOME 23 OF THE INVESTMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN IMPLEMENTED IN THIS COVID 24



- 1 EMERGENCY PERMANENT TO IMPROVE THE SAFETY OF PEOPLE BIKING AND
- 2 WALKING.

3

- 4 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: VERY GOOD COMMENTS. MARTHA, I
- 5 SHOW NICK JOSEFOWITZ NEXT, AND CARLOS AND THEN DAVID RABBIT,
- 6 CONNOLY AND AMY WORTH. DO YOU HAVE THE SAME ORDER?

7

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE THAT SAME ORDER.

9

10 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY NICK YOU'RE UP.

11

- 12 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU CHAIR. I'M REALLY EXCITED BY
- 13 THIS TOO. I THINK THERE IS A REALLY CENTRAL PIECE OF PLANNED
- 14 BAY AREA GETTING PEOPLE ON BIKES AND WALKING AND IN BIKESHARE,
- 15 AND IT'S TERRIFIC TO SEE THIS LEADERSHIP, AND I HOPE THAT WHEN
- 16 YOU PUT TOGETHER THE PLAN, YOU CAN REALLY SORT OF HAVE THE
- 17 PLAN BE CLEAR ON HOW IT -- LIKE, THAT IT IS AT THE APPROPRIATE
- 18 SCALE TO MEET THE GOALS THAT WE HAVE IN PLANNED BAY AREA. SO
- 19 HOW DO WE -- NOT JUST A PLAN OF OH, THESE ARE SOME NICE THING
- 20 TO HAVE, BUT THIS IS ACTUALLY WHAT WE NEED TO DO TO GET TO THE
- 21 MODE SHIFT WE NEED IN PLANNED BAY AREA. I THINK THAT WOULD
- 22 REALLY CENTERS US AND DELIVER THE TYPE OF PLAN THAT WE NEED.
- 23 THIS IS EXCITING.

24

25 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: CARLOS ROMERO?



1	
2	CARLOS ROMERO: SO FOR MANY DISADVANTAGED AND COMMUNITIES OF
3	CONCERN, THE ISSUE OF JUST OVERALL STREET INFRASTRUCTURE,
4	EXISTING GEOMETRY, LACK OF SIDEWALKS IS A CRITICAL HURDLE TO
5	GET TO ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS. CERTAINLY MEASURE W
6	HERE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY TRIES TO ADDRESS SOME OF THAT THROUGH
7	ITS ADDED FUNDING. BUT I THINK THERE WAS A SPEAKER PREVIOUSLY
8	WHO KIND OF MENTIONED LOOKING AT AND COORDINATING WITH SOME OF
9	THE LOCAL ACTUALLY, I THINK IT WAS MAYOR ARREGUIN WHO SAID
10	COORDINATING WITH SOME OF THE CITIES AND LOCAL COUNTIES WITH
11	THEIR PROGRAMS AROUND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AND PARTICULARLY
12	IN COMMUNITIES OF COLOR WHERE THE AMOUNT OF INFRASTRUCTURE
13	NEEDED TO ACTUALLY MAKE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS,
14	ACTUALLY VIABLE, IS A SIGNIFICANT HURDLE. SECONDLY, I THINK
15	THERE IS A REAL OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE ACTIVE
16	TRANSPORTATION ISSUES WITH EXISTING SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL
17	PROGRAMS THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA. CLEARLY WHAT
18	THEY ARE TRYING TO DO IS GET CHILDREN AND THEIR PARENTS TO
19	FEEL COMFORTABLE WALKING AND BIKING TO SCHOOL, AND THEY HAVE
20	SOME RESOURCES, BUT BEYOND THE RESOURCES, THEY ACTUALLY HAVE A
21	HUGE CAPTIVE AUDIENCE IN TERMS OF PARENT WHO IS ARE CONCERNED
22	ABOUT THEIR CHILDREN WALKING TO SCHOOL OR BIKING, AND I AM
23	SURE WOULD LOVE NOT TO HAVE TO DRIVE THEIR KIDS TO SCHOOL
24	EVERY MORNING CERTAINLY IN EAST PALO ALTO OUR BIGGEST TRAFFIC
25	JAMS ARE IN THE MORNING WHEN WE HAD SCHOOL IN SESSION BECAUSE



- 1 WE HAD TRAFFIC BUT A LOT OF PARENTS DRIVING THEIR CHILDREN TO
- 2 SCHOOL IF YOUR SCHOOL IS WITHIN HALF A MILE OR THREE QUARTER
- 3 OF A MILE YOU COULD SEND THEM WALKING PROGRAM COORDINATION IS
- 4 HELPFUL. I'LL END MY COMMENTS THERE. THANK YOU.

5

6 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: DAVID RABBIT.

7

- 8 DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL THE
- 9 WORK. I WASN'T GOING TO SAY ANYTHING UNTIL I SAW PETALUMA
- 10 FEATURED THERE WITH THE CAR FREE SLOPED STREETS. I HAVE TO ASK
- 11 THIS, THERE IS ONE NOT FAR FROM MY HOUSE, WAS THAT WAY BEFORE
- 12 COVID PURPOSES ALLOWING PEOPLE TO WALK AND HAVE SAFELY
- 13 DISTANCED FROM ONE ANOTHER. IS THERE ANY OTHER CRITERIA
- 14 INVOLVED? DID WE PASS ANYTHING ON IN THAT VAIN? QUITE FRANKLY,
- 15 THIS STREET IS A RESIDENTIAL STREET THAT IS CLOSED FOR TWO
- 16 BLOCKS. AND I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHAT IT'S DOING IN TERMS OF THE
- 17 BIG PICTURE.

- 19 KARA OBERG: YES I CAN ADDRESS THAT ALL OF THESE HAVE STARTED
- 20 SINCE COVID-19 TO ALLOW ADDITIONAL SPACE BETWEEN PEOPLE BIKING
- 21 WALKING ROLLING WITH PHYSICAL DISTANCING MEASURES. HOWEVER, IN
- 22 A LOT OF COMMUNITIES, AND I'M ACTUALLY NOT 100 PERCENT SURE IN
- 23 PETALUMA IN OAKLAND FOR EXAMPLE, THEY'RE ALSO IMPLEMENT BEING
- 24 THE BIKE PLAN. SO THE SLOW STREETS IN OAKLAND WERE ALSO
- 25 IDENTIFIED IN THE BIKE PLAN TO BE SLOW STREETS PRE COVID. AND



REGARDLESS OF COVID. BUT COVID IS KIND OF, YOU KNOW, KICK 1 2 STARTED THESE THINGS TO BE MORE INDEED MORE PRESENT. SO, DID I 3 ANSWER YOUR QUESTION? I THINK THERE WAS TWO PARTS TO IT. 4 5 DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR: YEAH. I THINK THAT'S IT I WAS ASKING IF THERE IS ANY OTHER CRITERIA. AND I'LL BE HONEST THE 6 STREETS I SEE HERE IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD I JUST SCRATCH MY HEAD 7 8 AND DON'T KNOW WHY THOSE ARE CLOSED. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE STREETS. THEY HAVE SIDEWALKS. I WAS JUST WONDERING IF THERE IS 9 CRITERIA. CARLOS MENTIONED IF THERE IS NOT A SIDEWALK, IT 10 MAKES SENSE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S SAFE AND CAN PHYSICALLY 11 DISTANCE. I LIVE ACROSS THE STREET FROM A PARK WHERE THERE ARE 12 MANY PLACES TO WALK AND THE STREETS ARE OPEN. I WAS WONDERING 13 HOW YOU DO IT AND IT'S IMPLEMENTED. I WAS JUST WONDERING IT'S 14 15 AN ITERATIVE PROCESS FOR A LOT OF CITIES. 16 17 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU DAVID. COMMISSIONER CONNOLY, AND THEN AMY WORTH. 18 19 DAMON CONNOLLY: THANK YOU CHAIR. I THOUGHT MAYOR ARREGUIN 20 21 NAILED THE COMMENTS. AND I SHARE ALL OF MY COLLEAGUE'S

25 PARTICULARLY GRATIFIED TO SEE THAT VISION ZERO IS A KEY PART

COULD NOT BE BETTER TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS, AND ALSO,

EXCITEMENT IN HAVING THIS PLAN MOVE FORWARD. AS WE CONTINUE TO

REIMAGINE OUR STREETSCAPES AND MOBILITY, I THINK THE TIMING

22

23



- 1 OF IT. AND THAT UNDERSCORES IT AS WE CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD
- 2 REGIONALLY, MAKING SURE THAT OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, LOCAL
- 3 STAKEHOLDERS, HAVE A KEY PART IN THE PROCESS, AND SEAT AT THE
- 4 TABLE. SO, VERY EXCITED TO SEE THIS MOVE FORWARD.

5

6 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. AMY?

- 8 AMY R. WORTH: OKAY. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I APPRECIATE THE
- 9 OPPORTUNITY TO JUMP IN ON THIS DISCUSSION AND FIRST OF ALL
- 10 CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS OF THE COMMISSIONERS, PARTICULARLY
- 11 CARLOS AND JESSE'S COMMENTS, I KIND OF WANTED TO PICK UP ON
- 12 THOSE. FIRST OF ALL THANK YOU TO OUR STAFF FOR BRINGING THIS
- 13 TOGETHER AT THIS TIME. THIS IS REALLY EXCITING. MY DAUGHTER
- 14 AND I HAD A CHANCE THE OTHER DAY TO GOAL INTO SAN FRANCISCO
- 15 WITH OUR BIKES AND WE SPENT THE DAY BIKING, AND I LOVE THE
- 16 WIGGLE IN SAN FRANCISCO, WHERE YOU CAN GET FROM POINT A TO
- 17 POINT B WITH THE LEAST AMOUNT OF HILLS. NOW WITH MY ELECTRIC
- 18 BIKE, I CAN FINALLY DO THOSE HILLS. BUT I THINK, AS I READ THE
- 19 REPORT AND ANTICIPATING IN TODAY'S MEETING AND HEARING THE
- 20 REPORT TODAY, I COUPLE OF THINGS COME TO MIND, FIRST OF ALL,
- 21 ALL OF OUR CITIES HAVE BIKES AND PEDESTRIAN PLANS IN PLACE ON
- 22 THE SHELF AND READY TO IMPLEMENT. I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT
- 23 THING WE CAN DO IS COORDINATE THE PLANS WITH THE REGIONAL
- 24 PLANS THE REGIONAL BIKE ROUTES AND GET THESE BUILT. HOW CAN WE
- 25 FIND THE FUNDING, THE EARLY FUNDING NOW. I THINK THERE IS A



- 1 HUGE OPPORTUNITY RELATIVE TO OUR OTHER TRANSPORTATION
- 2 INVESTMENTS. MANY OF THESE REALLY REQUIRE, YOU KNOW, DON'T
- 3 REQUIRE A HUGE AMOUNT OF MONEY AND THEY'RE JUST AS STAFF
- 4 INDICATED, THIS PROGRAM IS OVERSUBSCRIBED BUT I WOULD LOVE TO
- 5 LOOK AT EVERY DRAWER IN THE BAY AREA WHETHER IT'S THE
- 6 DISTRICT, OR WHATEVER TO TRY TO FIND MORE MONEY TO PUT INTO
- 7 THIS PROGRAM. AND PARTICULARLY, ARE THE SCHOOLS, I THINK IT
- 8 WOULD BE, REACHING OUT TO THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WOULD ENABLE
- 9 US TO DIRECTLY CONNECT HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORTATION. I THINK
- 10 CARLOS IS RIGHT ON POINT. HUGE AMOUNT OF VMT, AIR QUALITY
- 11 ISSUES AND TRAFFIC CONGESTION COMES FROM THE SINGLE OCCUPANCY
- 12 TRIPS TO SCHOOLS, AND IF WE HAD THE ABILITY TO REALLY MAKE A
- 13 ROBUST BIKE NETWORK THAT ALMOST RADIATES FROM SCHOOL SITES, I
- 14 THINK THAT COULD GO A LONG WAY IN GETTING, YOU KNOW,
- 15 INCREASING BICYCLE USE AND ACCESS SO THAT WE PROVIDE SAFE
- 16 CORRIDORS FOR PEOPLE THAT WANT TO BE USING BICYCLES. THANK
- 17 YOU.

18

- 19 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. JAKE MACKENZIE?
- 20 JAKE.

- 22 JAKE MACKENZIE: THANK YOU. NOW JUST RIGHT ALONG WITH
- 23 COMMISSIONER WORTH'S COMMENTS, AND AS SOMEONE WHO CUT HAS
- 24 POLITICAL TEETH A LONG TIME AGO DEVELOPING ROHNERT PARK'S
- 25 MASTER BICYCLE PLAN AND THEN THE SONOMA COUNTY BICYCLE PLAN



- 1 WHICH ENDED UP MAKING SMART'S MASTER MULTIPLE USE PASS
- 2 PARALLELING THE RAILROAD TRACKS SOMETHING THAT WAS A VISION
- 3 AND NOW HAS BEEN REALIZED; TO ME, THE IMPORTANT THING AGAIN IS
- 4 TO HAVE RESOURCES DIRECTED, AND THAT'S WHAT HAS HELD US HELP
- 5 FROM HAVING THAT VISION OF A 70 MILE PATH FROM, THROUGH SONOMA
- 6 COUNTY AND MARIN, PARALLELING THE RAILROAD TRACKS. A HUGE
- 7 ASSET IN THE FUTURE. SO I'M VERY ENCOURAGED BY THIS PART OF
- 8 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND A
- 9 THOROUGH EXAMINATION OF FUNDING POSSIBILITIES. THANK YOU.

10

- 11 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER
- 12 HANDS. ALL THE OTHER COMMUNITY MEMBERS GREAT COMMENTS AND I
- 13 WANT TO THANK NICK JOSEFOWITZ FOR FOCUSING ON THE IMPORTANCE
- 14 OF THIS IN THE OVERALL LENS IS CRITICAL. I WANT TO MAKE SURE
- 15 IT ISN'T JUST A PLANNING DOCUMENT, THAT WE START DELIVERING
- 16 SOME OF THESE PROJECTS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT AND HOPEFULLY
- 17 STAFF WILL FOCUS ON IT. YOU HAVE HEARD A LOT OF GOOD COMMENTS
- 18 AND WHERE I THINK WE SHOULD PUT SOME OF OUR RESOURCES. SO WITH
- 19 THAT, MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY OTHER SPEAKERS?

20

- 21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS OR
- 22 COMMISSIONERS BUT WE DO HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

23

24 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: LET'S HEAR FROM THEM GO AHEAD.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE ORDER WILL BE ROLAND, ALETA, KEN, 1 2 DARYL, SARAH, DAVE. 3 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IS FOR TRIP MAXIMUM 4 5 ONE OR TWO MILE WALKING 1 TO 2 MILES BIKING. I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THE -- CAN YOU HEAR ME? 6 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: YES. GO AHEAD. 9 SPEAKER: SO I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THE UNINTENDED IMPACTS 10 OF PLANNED BAY AREA POLICIES AS AN EXAMPLE, THE 60 PERCENT 11 TELECOMMUTING MANDATE ON ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. AS AN EXAMPLE, 12 WE ARE ALREADY BEGINNING TO SEE THE ONSET OF THE COLLAPSE OF 13 THE RENTAL MARKET IN SAN FRANCISCO, MOUNTAIN VIEW AND 14 SUNNYVALE. AND FROM THAT, YOU CAN DEDUCT THAT THESE RENTERS 15 16 HAVE BASICALLY LEFT TOWN AND THEY'RE NO LONGER USING ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION TO GO TO WORK. THE NEXT QUESTION NOW IS, AND I 17 KNOW NOBODY HAS THE ANSWER TO THIS, IS WHERE DID THESE PEOPLE 18 MOVE TO. BECAUSE IF THEY MOVED AWAY A LONG DISTANCE FROM WORK, 19 AND AT SOME POINT IN TIME WHEN COVID IS OVER OR WHATEVER, 20 21 THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO COME INTO WORK FOR A COUPLE OF TIMES A DAY, THERE IS THE POTENTIAL THAT THE VMT AND GHG FOOTPRINT 22 WILL INCREASE BECAUSE THEY WILL HAVE TO TRAVEL MUCH LONGER

DISTANCES THAN BACK IF THE DAYS WHEN THEY WERE BASICALLY

RENTING A COUPLE OF BLOCKS AWAY FROM THEIR WORK. THANK YOU.

23

24



1 2 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ALETA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR JIM SPERING AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE 6 FOR THE RECORD. GOOD PRESENTATION. I PERSONALLY USE THOSE 7 8 ELECTRIC BICYCLES ARE AND SCOOTERS. I JUST THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE OF THEM. ESPECIALLY AS WE GET OUT OF COVID. AND 9 THAT LAST MILE CONNECTIVITY IS REALLY ONE OF THE MOST 10 IMPORTANT THINGS I REMEMBER THE DAYS OF GROWING UP MY FATHER 11 BEING A REGULAR LONG ISLAND RAILROAD COMMUTER, AND YOU JUST 12 COULDN'T PUT ENOUGH CARS IN THAT PARKING LOT. HE HAD TO GET 13 MONTHLY PARKING PERMITS WHICH WERE VERY HARD TO GET. MY FATHER 14 15 DID HAVE ONE. AND JUST, I REMEMBER TIMES WITH -- WITHOUT LAST 16 MILE SOLUTIONS OF HAVING TO RIDE FOLDING BIKES AND CARRY THEM ON NEW JERSEY TRANSIT BECAUSE OF RESTRICTED BIKES RULES. SO 17 THE KEY IS JUST TO HAVE THESE SMALL MICRO MOBILITY VEHICLES 18 THAT ARE SHARED, BECAUSE BIKE THEFT IS A RAMPANT PROBLEM IN 19 AMERICA. THE AVERAGE COST OF OWNING A CAR IN AMERICA IS ABOUT 20 21 \$700 A MONTH. FROM A PRACTICAL STANDPOINT OF EQUITY, IS THAT BUILDING MICRO MOBILITY WILL ALLOW MORE PEOPLE TO ACCESS THE 22 COMMUNITY, ESPECIALLY POWERED VEHICLES SUCH AS THE BIKES AND 23 SCOOTERS THAT ARE VERY HELPFUL TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, OF 24 25 WHICH I AM ONE. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO BUILD-OUT



- 1 A COMPLETE SAFE STREETS, SO WE CAN HAVE FEWER CARS ON THE
- 2 ROAD, WHICH MEANS FEWER CARS LESS CHANCE YOU'RE GOING TO GET
- 3 HIT BY ONE. THANK YOU FOR THIS, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO
- 4 CONTINUING THIS WORK. APPRECIATE IT.

5

6 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. MARTHA?

7

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: KEN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 SPEAKER: YEAH. HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

11

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES.

- 14 SPEAKER: I'M GETTING BACK TO EQUITY. WHY ARE WE NOT LOOKING AT
- 15 VALUE RECAPTURE AS A SOURCE OF MONEY? THESE TRANSPORTATION
- 16 INVESTMENTS MAKE PROPERTY OWNERS A LOT OF MONEY AND THEY NEED
- 17 TO GIVE SOME OF IT BACK. I MEAN, IT'S OUTRAGEOUS. LET'S TAKE A
- 18 LOOK AT EMERYVILLE. WE CREATED THE EMERY GROUND, THE PROPERTY
- 19 OWNERS SAW THE VALUE IN THE GROUND WE HAVE HAD FEE LAST MILE
- 20 TRANSIT FOR THE LAST 25 YEARS. WHY CAN'T EVERY OTHER COMMUNITY
- 21 DO THAT? LET'S LOOK AT THE VALUE OF INCREASED LAND THAT GOES
- 22 NEXT TO ALL THESE PROJECTS. NOW YOU HAVE VALLEY LINK AND WE'RE
- 23 GOING TO DO THAT LIKE BART AND NOW DO ANY RECAPTURE? WE NEED
- 24 TO MAKE TRANSIT FREE AND RECAPTURE SOME OF THE TRANSIT MONEY
- 25 WE'RE MAKING. THANK YOU.



1 2 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: DARYL HALLS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. DARYL HALLS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SOLANO 6 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. I WANT TO ECHO COMMISSIONER 7 8 COMMENTS. SOLANO COUNTY IS ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THE PLAN AND I WANT TO REITERATE SOME OF THE COMMENTS WHERE REALLY WHERE 9 WE'RE AT IS WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF PLANNING LOOKING TO ACTIVE 10 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THIS YEAR WE COMBINED BIKE AND 11 TRANSPORTATION PLAN TO ONE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION THAT LINKS 12 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS MAJOR 13 TRANSIT CENTERS AND PROGRAMS. TIME IS RIGHT AND WE'RE LOOKING 14 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MTC STAFF. THANK YOU. 15 16 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU DARYL. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SARAH JONES GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 19 20 SPEAKER: HI. THANKS A LOT. SARAH JONES FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO 21 22 MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY. I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I 23 REALLY APPRECIATED ALL OF COMMISSIONER COMMENTS, PARTICULARLY COMMISSIONER ROMERO. AND I THINK THAT WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO 24 HEAR FROM THE CBOS WILL ECHO THAT AND OUR OWN EXPERIENCE IN 25



9

11

13

October 9, 2020

- 1 SAN FRANCISCO HAS ECHOED IT TOO. THAT WHEN THINKING ABOUT
- 2 COMPLETE STREETS IN DISADVANTAGED AND DISEMPOWERED
- 3 COMMUNITIES, WE REALLY NEED TO THINK ABOUT THE BROADER
- 4 INFRASTRUCTURE DEFICIENCIES THERE AS WELL AS ALL OF THE NON-
- 5 INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMS THAT TRULY HAVE TO COME TOGETHER TO
- 6 CREATE SAFETY. SO I REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO THIS. AND I THINK
- 7 YOU'RE GOING TO COME OUT WITH GREAT WORK AND LOOK FORWARD TO
- 8 WHAT WE CAN FUND THROUGH IT.

10 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU SARAH.

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AND OUR LAST SPEAKER IS DAVE CAMPBELL.

- 14 SPEAKER: DAVE CAMPBELL. ADVOCACY DIRECTOR WITH BIKE EAST BAY.
- 15 THANK YOU MTC FOR THE SCOPING OF THIS PLAN. IT LOOKS LIKE A
- 16 GOOD SCOPING DOCUMENT. I REALLY LIKE IT. SUPER APPRECIATE THE
- 17 QUICK BUILD STRATEGIES INCLUDED. AND ON THAT NOTE I WANT TO
- 18 THANK MTC STAFF FOR THEIR COMMITMENT TO HELP ADVANCE OUICK
- 19 BUILD PROJECT DURING THE PANDEMIC AND GOING FORWARD. GREAT
- 20 WORK MTC FOR CONTINUING THAT AS WELL. AND A COUPLE OF
- 21 QUESTIONS. ONE IS, WHAT IS OUR BUDGET FOR THIS PLAN? I DO HAVE
- 22 CONCERNS THAT THE BUDGET IS LOW. IS IF IT'S NOT, STOP ME. BUT,
- 23 THERE IS A LOT OF WORK IN THIS PLAN, AND I HEAR THERE MAY NOT
- 24 BE ENOUGH MONEY. SO, PLEASE, BEFORE YOU SIGN OFF TODAY, MAKE
- 25 SURE THERE IS ENOUGH MONEY. THEN I WANT TO JUST UNDERSCORE



1	SOME OF THE OBSTACLE TO MAKING STREETS SAFER FOR BIKING AND
2	WALKING. ONE OF THE NUMBER ONE OBSTACLES IS THE CALIFORNIA
3	NUTCD. IT GETS IN THE WAY OF OUR WORK ALL THE TIME. AND IT'S A
4	DOCUMENT LARGELY DESIGNED TO MOVE CARS. WE NEED A CALIFORNIA
5	EXEMPTION. WE NEED A BAY AREA EXEMPTION TO THE CALIFORNIA
6	NUTCD WHEN IT COMES IT WALKING AND BIKING AND WALKING AND
7	TRANSIT MATTERS. THAT COULD COME POTENTIALLY IN THE POLICY
8	PART OF THIS ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN. IT'S PROBABLY NOT
9	SOMETHING THAT GARRETT AND MARTHA AND HER TEAM ARE THINKING
10	ABOUT, BUT MTC NEEDS TO THINK ABOUT THIS. IT'S IN THE WAY. AND
11	THEN THE OTHER THING THAT'S IN THE WAY IS THE BILLIONS OF
12	DOLLARS THAT WE CONTINUE TO SPEND ON FREEWAY PROJECTS. AMY
13	WORTH ASKED THE CORRECT QUESTION. HOW ARE WE GOING TO BUILD
14	THIS NETWORK. WELL, WE CONTINUE TO SPEND HALF A MILLION
15	DOLLARS ON FREEWAY INTERCHANGES AND AMY KNOWS WHICH ONE I'M
16	TALKING ABOUT. THAT MONEY IS COMPETING WITH MONEY TO BUILD THE
17	BIKEWAY. AS A MATTER OF POLICY, AND I CAN NAME PROJECTS LIKE
18	THAT ALL THROUGHOUT THE EAST BAY. SO WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
19	BUILDING 60 MILES OF EXPRESS LANES AND WE WANT TO BUILD A
20	BIKEWAY NETWORK OR SAFE STREETS, THOSE ARE CONTRADICTORY GOALS
21	OFTEN BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH MONEY. SO IT'S NOT ENOUGH
22	TO SUPPORT BOTH

23

24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME --



SPEAKER: WE NEED SOME HARD DECISIONS MADE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 1 2 SUPPORT. 3 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. HEY MATT, DID YOU WANT 4 5 TO TOUCH BRIEFLY ON FUNDING. KARA JUST TOUCHED ON IT. BUT DO 6 YOU WANT TO COMMENT ON IT? 7 8 MATT MALONEY: LOOK A LOT OF AGENCIES WE HAD TO TAKE SOME HAIR CUTS THIS YEAR ESPECIALLY WHEN LOOKING AT BUDGETING FOR 9 CONSULTANT WORK. WE ARE PLANNING TO HIRE A CONSULTANT TO HELP 10 OUT WITH SOME OF THIS, BUT I THINK THE WAY WE TREAT AS STAFF 11 OUR RELATIONSHIP CONSULTANTS, WE HAVE CONSULTANTS COME IN AND 12 HELP OUT TO DO SOME OF OUR WORK BUT THIS IS GOING TO BE 13 PRIMARILY STAFF LED AND WE DO THE BEST WORK IN THE PLANNING 14 SPHERE WHEN IT'S DONE IS BY STAFF AND THAT'S NOT TO DIM --15 16 DIMINISH WHAT CONSULTANTS DO, BUT WE HAVE ROBUST STAFF IN PLACE TO MEET WITH THE PLAN. 17 18 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU MATT, WITH THAT THIS IS 19 AN INFORMATION ITEM. LET'S MOVE ON TO 5B SOMETHING LESS 20 CONTROVERSIAL. THE -- YOU KNOW, I ASKED THERESE TO PUT 21 TOGETHER A PRESENTATION, AND SHE HAS DONE THAT. STAFF HAS ALSO 22 PUT TOGETHER THIS ONE PAGE FLYER, HOPEFULLY ALL OF YOU GOT IT, 23 AND IT REALLY GIVES AN EXPLANATION AS TO, YOU KNOW, WHAT THIS 24

STRATEGY IS ALL ABOUT AND WHAT IS ISN'T ABOUT. SO WITH THAT,



- 1 THERESE, ARE YOU READY? DO YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS? YOU HAVE A
- 2 SHORT PRESENTATION ALSO.

- 4 THERESE MCMILLAN: YES LET'S BRING THE PRESENTATION UP. THERESE
- 5 MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. THIS PRESENTATION FOLLOWS
- 6 EXTENSIVE FEEDBACK LEADING UP TO THE CONSIDERATION OF STAFF'S
- 7 RECOMMENDED STRATEGIES FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. SINCE THE
- 8 SEPTEMBER 23RD MEETING AND SEVERAL VALUABLE CONVERSATIONS
- 9 SINCE THEN WE REALIZE THAT THE TELECOMMUTING STRATEGIES INTEND
- 10 IN ITS INHERENT COMPLEXITIES WERE NOT EXPLAINED AS WELL AS
- 11 THEY COULD HAVE BEEN THUS NOT WELL UNDERSTOOD. THIS
- 12 PRESENTATION IS INTENDED TO LEVEL SET THE TELECOMMUTING
- 13 STRATEGY, ITS CONTEXT, WHAT IT IS, AND IMPORTANTLY, WHAT IT IS
- 14 NOT. AND THE NEXT STEPS TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION'S DIRECTION
- 15 VIA MOTION TO EXPLORE POSSIBLE ALTERNATIVES TO THE STRATEGY AS
- 16 LONG AS CRITICIZE CAL GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS CAN
- 17 BE MET. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO REVIEW
- 18 HOW WE GOT HERE. AND STARTING WITH THE BOX TO THE LEFT, 25
- 19 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES WERE APPROVED FOR ANALYSIS IN FEBRUARY.
- 20 IT SEEMS LONG TIME AGO AND THEY WERE TESTED TO DETERMINE
- 21 IMPACTS ACROSS A BROAD SET OF METRICS AMONG THEM THE STATUTORY
- 22 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGET THAT WE HAD RECEIVED FROM THE
- 23 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. IN EARLY JULY, THE NEXT BOX,
- 24 WE HAD PRESENTED OUR KEY FINDINGS FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT
- 25 STRATEGIES TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE AT THEIR JULY MEETING.

- 1 AND CRITICALLY, WE ANNOUNCED AT THAT TIME THAT THE STRATEGIES
- 2 FELL SHORT OF THE 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA TARGET. AND AT THAT
- 3 TIME, WE HAD IDENTIFIED TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY AS ONE OPTION
- 4 AMONG SEVERAL OTHERS THAT WANTED TO TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT TO
- 5 TRY TO HELP CLOSE THAT GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GAP. THE SO
- 6 DURING THE SUMMER AN EXTRAORDINARILY LEVEL OF ENGAGEMENT, WE
- 7 ONLY HAD TWO MONTHS, WAS LAUNCHED TO TRIAL RUN MANY OF THESE
- 8 POTENTIAL CONCEPTS INCLUDING TELECOMMUTING TO CLOSE THE GHG
- 9 GAP, AND IMPORTANTLY TO ADDRESS OTHER PERFORMANCE CHALLENGES
- 10 THAT WERE -- THAT HAD EMANATED FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. SO IN
- 11 THE LAST BLOCK HERE, ON SEPTEMBER 11TH, THE PLANNING COMMITTEE
- 12 RECEIVED A REPORT FROM STAFF THAT BROUGHT FORWARD TEN MORE
- 13 STRATEGIES OF THAT INCLUDED A TAILORED ALBEIT BOLD STRATEGY,
- 14 EN SEVEN THAT WAS DESCRIBED AND APPROVED WITH SOME ADDITIONAL
- 15 DIRECTION, AS WE WILL SEE. SO LET'S TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT THE
- 16 NEXT SLIDE, WHY THE TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY WAS SO IMPORTANT AS
- 17 PART OF THOSE TEN ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES. YOU HAVE SEEN THIS
- 18 CHART BEFORE. BUT I ALWAYS RETURN TO IT, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S
- 19 A REALLY IMPORTANT CONTEXTUAL EXPLANATION ABOUT THE CHALLENGE
- 20 THAT WE HAVE IN TERMS OF MEETING THE REQUIRED GREENHOUSE GAS
- 21 REDUCTION GAP. GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION EMISSIONS IS A
- 22 CRITICAL CONCERN FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 NOT ONLY IS IT
- 23 RANKED HIGHLY AMONG CONCERNS BY OUR PUBLIC, BUT IT'S ALSO A
- 24 STATUTORY GOAL. THERE IS A 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA GHG REDUCTION
- 25 TARGET THAT IS SET BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD OR

- 1 CARB FOR THE YEAR 2035. NOW, ON THIS CHART, THE BLACK ARROW AT
- 2 THE TOP, AS A REMINDER, WAS A SOBERING START THAT IF WE HAD
- 3 SIMPLY ADOPTED THE LAST PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 THOSE STRATEGIES
- 4 WOULD ONLY HAVE ACHIEVED A ONE PERCENT REDUCTION AGAINST THE
- 5 TARGET SET. IT WAS SHY OF THE EXPANDED STATE TARGET THAT WAS
- 6 EXPLORED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. LOOKING AT THE BLUE
- 7 ARROWS, THIS WAS OF THE COMPENDIUM OF STRATEGIES, THE
- 8 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDING ALL LANE TOLLING
- 9 ON SELECT FREEWAYS. 55 MILE PER HOUR REGIONAL SPEED LIMIT AS
- 10 WELL AS 20 OTHER STRATEGIES RANGING FROM HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT
- 11 AT A MUCH HIGHER LEVEL THAN PREVIOUS PLANS, THE ADDITIONAL
- 12 BIKE PED INVESTMENT WE JUST HEARD REFERENCE SAID 13 BILLION,
- 13 THERE, \$400 BILLION FOR TRANSIT, BOTH SUSTAIN THE SYSTEM AS
- 14 WELL AS EXPAND IT, AND WE MADE PROGRESS, EIGHT PERCENT CLOSER
- 15 TO THE TARGET, BUT WE WERE STILL TEN POINTS SHY. SO THAT'S
- 16 WHERE WE WERE IN JULY. THE GRAY ARROW SHOWS A TECHNICAL AREA
- 17 WE'RE HAVING CONVERSATIONS WITH CARB ABOUT WHICH IS SOME OF
- 18 THE UNDERLYING DRIVING ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HOW THE COST OF
- 19 DRIVING IS TREATED IN OUR PLANNING PROCESS. WE BELIEVE THAT IT
- 20 SHOULD BE SIMILAR TO HOW OTHER MAJOR METROS ARE BEING TREATED.
- 21 THIS IS A CONVERSATION THAT'S ONGOING. IF IT CAN BE RESOLVED,
- 22 IT MAY GET US ANOTHER THREE POINTS TOWARD THE GOAL. BUT WHAT
- 23 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY ARE THE GREEN ARROWS. THESE ARE THE
- 24 STRATEGIES WE BROUGHT FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION, BEGINNING OF
- 25 SEPTEMBER, AS PART OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. AND ESPECIALLY

- 1 TELECOMMUTING AND ELECTRIFICATION, YOU MAY RECALL THAT IT WAS
- 2 ANOTHER MAJOR ELEMENT OF THE TEN, COULD PLAY A VERY KEY ROLE
- 3 IN CLOSING THE REMAINING GAP. THERE WAS A NUMBER OF OTHER
- 4 STRATEGIES, THE OTHER BETWEEN ARROW YOU SEE THERE. BUT ONE OF
- 5 THE IMPORTANT THINGS YOU WILL NOTICE, IS THAT WE CAN'T SIMPLY
- 6 CLOSE THIS GAP. WE ACTUALLY MUST EXCEED IT. BECAUSE SOME OF
- 7 THE HIGHWAY EXPANSION STRATEGIES, WE ACTUALLY HEARD ABOUT SOME
- 8 OF THEM EARLIER DURING THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE, WITH OUR
- 9 EXPRESS LANES, THOSE ARE INCLUDED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, AND
- 10 THEY MOVE US IN THE WRONG DIRECTION BY ABOUT TWO POINTS,
- 11 BECAUSE WITH HIGHWAY CAPACITY, YOU DO GET INCREASED VMT, THAT
- 12 THEN HAS TO BE MITIGATED. SO THIS IS THE CONTEXT OF WHAT WE'RE
- 13 TRYING TO TACKLE. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT IS THE
- 14 TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY AND ITS ROLE AGAINST THAT BACKDROP? AS
- 15 A REMINDER, THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT
- 16 TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY, EN7 FOCUSES ON REQUIRING LARGE OFFICE
- 17 BASED EMPLOYERS TO ACHIEVE A TELECOMMUTING TARGET OF 60
- 18 PERCENT ON A TYPICAL WEEKDAY BY 2035. EMPLOYERS COULD MEET
- 19 THIS TARGET USING ANY VARIETY OF ALTERNATIVE WORK OPTIONS SUCH
- 20 AS COMPRESSED WORK WEEKS, FLEXIBLE WORK SCHEDULES, REMOTE WORK
- 21 POLICIES, ET CETERA THE ADOPTED -- AS ADOPTED BY THE ABAG
- 22 BOARD AND COMMISSION ON THE 23rd, THE STRATEGY ONLY ASSUMES
- 23 THAT MAJOR OFFICE BASED EMPLOYERS WOULD NEED TO REACH THE 60
- 24 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE SHARE. MANUFACTURING, RETAIL, HOSPITALS,
- 25 ET CETERA, ARE ALL ASSUMED TO BE EXEMPT. SMALL BUSINESSES WITH

- 1 LESS THAN 25 EMPLOYEES ARE ASSUMED TO BE EXEMPT. THIS HAS THE
- 2 EFFECT OF INCREASING THE COMMUTE MODE SHARE ACROSS ALL
- 3 ANTICIPATED COMMUTE TRIPS IN THE REGION TO NO MORE THAN 25
- 4 PERCENT. SECOND BULLET OF IMPORTANCE, THE STRATEGIES IN
- 5 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE MERELY POLICY RECOMMENDATION IN A
- 6 LONG RANGE PLAN CONTEXT. MTC WOULD HAVE TO PURSUE NEW
- 7 REGULATORY AUTHORITY, OR OUR PARTNERS AND MOVING FROM PLANNING
- 8 TO ACTION WOULD REQUIRE NEGOTIATION, REFINEMENTS AND CONSENSUS
- 9 ACROSS MANY INTERESTS. ON THE THIRD BULLET, I WANT TO, AGAIN,
- 10 REMIND, THE DRIVING INTENT HERE, THIS TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY IS
- 11 IN ADDITION TO, NOT INSTEAD OF, ALL OF THE OTHER 35 STRATEGIES
- 12 IN THE PLAN, IT IS ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE AS STAFF HAD
- 13 INTENTIONALLY PAIRED THIS STRATEGY WITH A COMPANION ONE TO
- 14 SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASE INVESTMENT IN BROADBAND INFRASTRUCTURE,
- 15 ESPECIALLY FOR UNDER RESOURCED LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES THAT
- 16 MIGHT NOT OTHERWISE BE ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF TELECOMMUTING
- 17 OPTIONS. EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS WERE FRONT AND CENTER IN OUR
- 18 CONCERNS IN THIS IDEA OF A PACKAGE OF STRATEGIES GOING
- 19 FORWARD, NOT ONE WORKING BY ITSELF. A LOT OF CONCERN HAS BEEN
- 20 EXPRESSED THAT THIS TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IS DESIGNED TO TAKE
- 21 AWAY TRIPS FROM TRANSIT AND BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN TRIPS TO WORK.
- 22 THERE'S A FEAR THAT THIS IS I STRATEGY THAT YOU SERVE ALL
- 23 OTHERS THAT IT IGNORES ESSENTIAL HOUSING AND LAND USE POLICY.
- 24 BUT AS WE'LL ILLUSTRATE ON THE NEXT SLIDE OUR INTENTION WITH
- 25 THE STRATEGY IS EXACTLY THE OPPOSITE. LET'S GO TO THAT SLIDE.

- 1 THIS IS A NEW GRAPHIC, THEY THINK WILL GET AT SOME OF THE
- 2 CONCERNS THAT WE HAVE CERTAINLY HEARD SINCE THE PRESENTATION
- 3 TO THE COMMISSION ON THE 23rd. THIS -- AND IT'S INTENDED TO
- 4 CAPTURE GRAPHICALLY THE "IN ADDITION TO" VERSUS TO THE
- 5 "INSTEAD OF" NATURE OF THE TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY. ON THE PIE
- 6 CHARTS, YOU SEE THE TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY ONLY WORKS AS A
- 7 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION CLIMATE CHANGE STRATEGY IF IT REDUCES
- 8 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED CREATED BY AUTOMOBILES. THAT EFFECT CAN
- 9 BE APPROXIMATED BY LOOKING AT THE MODE SHARE OF TRIPS DURING
- 10 COMMUTE. AND THAT'S WHAT THESE PIE CHARTS ILLUSTRATE. SO LET'S
- 11 START WITH THE ONE ON THE LEFT. I CALL IT BASE CAMP 2015. THE
- 12 KEY TAKE AWAY HERE IS THAT 75 PERCENT OF COMMUTE TRIPS,
- 13 ESSENTIALLY TODAY, PRE COVID, SO WE ALWAYS NEED TO PUT THAT UP
- 14 THERE, 75 PERCENT WERE DONE BY AUTO. TRANSIT WAS AT 14
- 15 PERCENT, WALKING AND BIKING AT FIVE, AND TELECOMMUTING
- 16 ACTUALLY, I MEAN IT'S BEEN AROUND FOR A WHILE, WAS AT SIX.
- 17 LET'S MOVE TO WHAT WE ANTICIPATED WITH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AS
- 18 MENTIONED BEFORE THIS WAS A COMPENDIUM OF TESTING 25
- 19 STRATEGIES INCLUDING THE SIGNIFICANT, HUNDREDS OF BILLIONS OF
- 20 INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT AND BIKE AND PED, AND THE LIKE. AND WE
- 21 SAW SOME MAJOR SHIFTS TRANSIT WENT FROM 14 PERCENT TO 20. BIKE
- 22 AND PED, INCREASED TO EIGHT PERCENT. TELECOMMUTING, WITHOUT A
- 23 SPECIFIC STRATEGY, NATURALLY BASED ON THE FACTORS THAT ARE IN
- 24 PLAY, THAT OUR MODEL LOOKS AT, WILL BE EXPECTED TO GROW TO 14
- 25 PERCENT, ARE AND AUTO DID REDUCE SOME. HOWEVER, IT WAS NOT

- 1 ENOUGH TO MEET THE TARGET. SO THEN WE HAD TO MOVE TO LOOKING
- 2 AT THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, WHICH IS ILLUSTRATED IN THE PIE CHART
- 3 TO THE RIGHT. REFLECTING THE ADDITIONAL NATURE OF THE STRATEGY
- 4 IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT TRANSIT AND BIKE AND PED ARE
- 5 EXPECTED TO MAINTAIN OR INCREASE THEIR RESPECTIVE MODE SHARES
- 6 WITH THE TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IN PLACE. IT IS NOT INTENDED
- 7 FOR THOSE TO LOSE GROUND, AND IN FACT, THE AUTOS SHARE IS TO
- 8 TAKE THE BRUNT IN TERMS OF THE IMPACT IN REDUCTION. SO
- 9 IMPORTANTLY, IN THIS AS WELL, ALL OF THE PROJECTED TRAVEL
- 10 CHOICES IN BOTH OF DRAFT AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINTS ARE BUILT
- 11 UPON TRANSIT SUPPORTIVE LAND USE PATTERNS AND AFFORDABLE
- 12 HOUSING PROVISIONS THROUGH EXPLICIT POLICIES THAT ARE
- 13 DRAMATICALLY GREATER THAN IN PAST PLANS. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT
- 14 SLIDE. THROUGHOUT THE BLUEPRINT PROCESS, THE COMMISSION HAS
- 15 BEEN COMMITTED TO A DEEP AND MEANINGFUL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
- 16 PROCESS, WHICH MEANS THAT THE VOICES THAT WE HEAR FROM THE
- 17 PUBLIC NEED TO BE ON THE TABLE AS PART OF THE DECISION MAKING
- 18 PROCESS ON EVERY LEVEL, ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO HAVE NOT
- 19 TRADITIONALLY INCLUDED IN THAT PROCESS. WHILE THERE ARE MANY
- 20 CONSIDERATIONS THAT MUST COME TO BEAR AROUND THIS
- 21 TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IN THE PLAN IT IS WORTH NOTING THAT
- 22 WHEN WE CONDUCTED DURING THE SUMMER A STATISTICALLY VALID
- 23 TELEPHONE POLL, 76 PERCENT OF THOSE THAT RESPONDED WERE IN
- 24 FAVOR OF WHAT WAS, YOU KNOW, ASKED HERE, OF REQUIRING
- 25 EMPLOYERS TO LIMIT IN-PERSON OFFICE WORK WHEN TELECOMMUTING OR



- 1 WORKING -- WHEN TELECOMMUTING OR WORKING FROM HOME IS
- 2 POSSIBLE. WE ALSO RECEIVED A HIGH LEVEL OF SUPPORT FOR THIS
- 3 CONCEPT AS PART OF THE WORKSHOPS, THE ONLINE SURVEY SUPERVISOR
- 4 MANY LETTERS THAT WE RECEIVED. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO
- 5 AS PART OF THE MOTION ADOPTING THE BODY OF STAFF'S FINAL
- 6 BLUEPRINT RECOMMENDATIONS ON SEPTEMBER 23RD, THE COMMISSION
- 7 DIRECTED THAT WE LOOK AT ALTERNATIVES FOR THE TELECOMMUTING
- 8 STRATEGY THAT MUST GENERATE THE SAME GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS
- 9 REDUCTIONS THAT WOULD NEEDED, AGAIN PAIRED WITH OTHER
- 10 STRATEGIES, TO ACHIEVE A REQUIRED STATE TARGET. THAT SLIDE
- 11 OUTLINES THE IMPORTANT PARAMETERS THAT WOULD GUIDE THAT
- 12 EVALUATION GOING FORWARD. THERE ARE THREE TYPES OF ALTERNATIVE
- 13 BUCKETS THAT WE MIGHT WANT -- THAT WE MAY BE ABLE TO LOOK AT.
- 14 THE FIRST IS REFINING THE EXISTING STRATEGY AS IT ALREADY HAS
- 15 BEEN CONTEMPLATED. THE SECOND WOULD BE TO SCALE BACK THAT
- 16 EXISTING STRATEGY TO SOME DEGREE AND MITIGATE ELSEWHERE TO
- 17 MAKE UP THE DELTA OF EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS THAT WE NEED TO
- 18 ACCOMPLISH. THE THIRD BUCKET WOULD BE TO ELIMINATE THE
- 19 STRATEGY IN ITS ENTIRETY AND THEN COMPLETELY MITIGATE IT WITH
- 20 OTHER STRATEGIES. BUT IMPORTANTLY, TO BE EFFECTIVE, THESE
- 21 ALTERNATIVES, HOWEVER THEY MAY BE, MUST MEET THE FOLLOWING
- 22 THREE TESTS. THEY NEED TO BE AT-SCALE, THAT MEANS A MODIFIED
- 23 OR ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY CANNOT JUST HAVE MODIFIED IMPACTS ON
- 24 GHG REDUCTION. DO YOU REMEMBER FROM THE ARROW SLIDE,
- 25 TELECOMMUTING WORKS QUITE WELL WITH OTHER STRATEGIES IN TERMS

- 1 OF IMPACTING GHG REDUCTION. THEY ALSO CANNOT, ANY ALTERNATIVE,
- 2 CANNOT DOUBLE COUNT ESTIMATED GHG REDUCTIONS. AGAIN. THERE WAS
- 3 A NATURAL CALL, FOR, "WHY DON'T WE DO TRANSIT? WHY DON'T WE DO
- 4 BIKE AND PED?" THE MODELS ASSUME THAT BEFORE AND CARB IN
- 5 REVIEWING OUR PLAN IS GOING TO BE PARTICULARLY ATTENTIVE TO
- 6 WHETHER THIS DOUBLE COUNTING CONSIST IN OUR MODEL OUTPUTS.
- 7 FINALLY, THERE IS FISCAL CONSTRAINT, WHICH IS ANOTHER
- 8 REQUIREMENT. THIS IS A LONG-STANDING FEDERAL REQUIREMENT, THAT
- 9 IS IMPOSED ON TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AND STRATEGIES. SO
- 10 ANY TRANSPORTATION ORIENTED STRATEGY THAT MAY BE OFFERED AS AN
- 11 ALTERNATIVE MUST FIT WITHIN THE FEDERALLY REQUIRED FISCAL
- 12 CONSTRAINT AND WE WOULD NOTE WORKING WITH THE COMMISSION AND
- 13 WE HAD PRESENTED THIS BOTH IN JULY AND SEPTEMBER, ALL MONEYS
- 14 THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED, ARE CURRENTLY ALLOCATED TO SPECIFIC
- 15 INVESTMENTS IN THE PLAN. SO, NEXT SLIDE. IN WRAPPING UP THIS
- 16 PRESENTATION, WHICH I HOPE HAS CLARIFIED THE CONTEXT FOR THE
- 17 FINAL BLUEPRINT RECOMMENDATIONS AT-LARGE CLARIFIED WHAT THE
- 18 TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IS AND IS NOT, AND BETTER DESCRIBED
- 19 WHAT IT IS INTENDED TO ACHIEVE, THERE IS A FINAL AND VERY
- 20 IMPORTANT DISTINCTION THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE TODAY BEFORE
- 21 GOING FORWARD. MOVING TO A PLAN TO AN ACTIONABLE SET OF
- 22 CHANGES IS A VERY IMPORTANT DISTINCTION. MTC DOES NOT HAVE THE
- 23 AUTHORITY TO IMPLEMENT THE STRATEGY TODAY, AND THE BODY OF
- 24 ACTIONS REQUIRED TO ENSURE THAT THE INTENDED SYNERGISTIC
- 25 RELATIONSHIPS AND THE OUTCOMES THAT WE DISCUSS TODAY, FOR

- 1 EXAMPLE, THE ASSUMPTIONS OF MUCH GREATER AFFORDABLE HOUSING,
- 2 THAT BROADBAND, FOR LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES WOULD AFFECT ALL OF
- 3 THOSE THINGS TOGETHER, THAT WOULD TAKE A COLLECTIVE EFFORT
- 4 AMONG MANY PUBLIC AND PRIVATE INTERESTS AND STAKEHOLDERS. MTC
- 5 WILL BE LAUNCHING IN NOVEMBER, THE IMPLEMENTATION ELEMENT OF
- 6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT IS DESIGNED TO TACKLE THE MANY
- 7 LAYERS AND CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN FLAGGED TO DATE, AND WOULD
- 8 BE THE FORUM TO FURTHER EXPLORE THEM. THIS NECESSARILY
- 9 INCLUDES SOMETHING THAT'S BEEN REFERENCED OVER AGAIN BUT WORK
- 10 REPEATING WE NEED TO LOOK AT THE TIMELY STRATEGY INCLUDING
- 11 TELECOMMUTING AGAINST THE BACKDROP OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC
- 12 AND ITS CONTINUING IMPACT ON THE ECONOMY AND THE HEALTH OF OUR
- 13 PEOPLE. SO IT'S IMPORTANT TO REALIZE THAT THIS NEXT STEP OF
- 14 MOVING FROM A POLICY, AT A PLANNING LEVEL, TO ACTUAL
- 15 IMPLEMENTATION, IS A REALLY IMPORTANT, AND ONE THAT REQUIRES A
- 16 LOT OF THOUGHT. FINALLY, WE ALSO NEED TO REALIZE THAT THE LONG
- 17 RANGE PLAN IS ITERATIVE PROCESS. THERE WILL BE SUBSEQUENT
- 18 PLANS THAT CAN ADJUST AND MODIFY ELEMENTS BASED ON CHANGED
- 19 CONDITIONS, CHANGED PRIORITIES AND CHANGED REQUIREMENTS
- 20 INCLUDING ANY STATUTORY CHANGES. SO NEXT SLIDE. NEXT AND LAST.
- 21 SO, AGAIN, REFLECTING THE DIRECTION FROM THE COMMISSION, OVER
- 22 THE NEXT MONTH, STAFF AND INTERESTED FART PARTNERS WILL
- 23 DISCUSS REFINEMENTS TO THE STRATEGY KNOWING THAT WE HAVE TO
- 24 CHIEF THE SAME GHG REDUCTIONS PRIOR TO RELEASE OF OUR FINAL
- 25 BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS AT THE END OF 2020. I ALSO WANT TO REMIND



- 1 EVERYONE THAT'S WE HAVE ONE MORE YEAR BEFORE THE FINAL PLAN
- 2 ITSELF IS DONE. THE BLUEPRINT IS A VERY IMPORTANT MILESTONE,
- 3 BUT WE HAVE GOT ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT PROCESS AHEAD AND A
- 4 NUMBER OF OTHER THINGS. AS CHAIR SPERING NOTED, I ALSO WANT
- 5 TO, AGAIN, REMIND THAT AT HIS DIRECTION WE SYNTHESIZED THE
- 6 POINTS WE MADE IN THIS PRESENTATION, INTO A HAND OUT THAT
- 7 WOULD BE A READY REFERENCE FOR THE COMMISSIONERS AND
- 8 DISTRIBUTION TO INTERESTED PARTIES. I ALSO WANT TO THANK
- 9 PROFUSELY THE PLANNING TEAMS. WITH THAT, MR. CHAIR I'LL TURN
- 10 IT BACK OVER TO YOU.
- 12 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU THERESE. THERESE, AT
- 13 THE COMMISSION MEETING, I BELIEVE IT WAS COMMISSIONER
- 14 JOSEFOWITZ THAT RAISED VARIOUS STRATEGIES YOU WANTED TO
- 15 EXPLORE FURTHER. AND I AM ASSUMING STAFF IS LOOKING AT THOSE
- 16 AND MANY OTHERS THAT WE'RE HEARING FROM OTHER PARTNERS?
- 18 THERESE MCMILLAN: YES. WE WILL BE LOOKING AT A RANGE.
- 20 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THERESE, IN YOUR PRESENTATION,
- 21 CAN YOU JUST VERBALLY TELL US WHY YOU CAN'T JUST TAKE THIS
- 22 OUT? WE'RE GETTING A LOT OF LETTERS TO JUST SAY, TAKE IT OUT.
- 23 AND CAN YOU JUST VERBALLY SAY WHY THAT'S NOT POSSIBLE AND WHAT
- 24 THE END RESULT WOULD BE?

25

11

17



- 1 THERESE MCMILLAN: YES. THERE ARE RAMIFICATIONS FOR THE REGION
- 2 IF WE DON'T MEET THIS 19 PERCENT REDUCTION PER CAPITA TARGET
- 3 FROM CARB. THIS ALL COMES FROM SB 375. WHICH, AS YOU ALL KNOW,
- 4 ABOUT TEN YEARS AGO, FOUNDATIONALLY CHANGED PLANNING
- 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR METROPOLITAN REGIONS. IF WE DO NOT MEET THAT
- 6 TARGET, WE BECOME INELIGIBLE FOR SEVERAL STATE FUNDING POTS.
- 7 WE ESTIMATE, AN AGGREGATE, AN AVERAGE OVER TIME, BECAUSE
- 8 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING COMES ON CYCLING BUT ON AVERAGE WE'RE
- 9 ESTIMATING WE WOULD PROBABLY BE INELIGIBLE AND POTENTIALLY
- 10 LOSE UPWARDS OF A HUNDRED MILLION A YEAR FROM THOSE
- 11 COMPETITIVE SOURCES. AND IT'S PROBABLY WORTH NOTING WE WOULD
- 12 BE THE FIRST MAJOR REGION TO NOT MEET THE REQUIREMENTS OF SB
- 13 375 AT THIS POINT. THAT BEING THE FIRST OUT OF THE GATE TO NOT
- 14 MEET THAT IMPORTANT LEGISLATIVE REQUIREMENT HAS SOME UNKNOWN
- 15 ELEMENTS I WOULD HAZARD AS WELL. SO, I HOPE THAT ANSWERS YOUR
- 16 QUESTION.
- 17
- 18 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: YES AND FEDERAL PROGRAMS THAT
- 19 WOULD BE AFFECTED AS WELL.
- 20
- 21 THERESE MCMILLAN: FEDERAL PROGRAMS, I THINK THE MAIN THING
- 22 THERE, THE SB 375 DOESN'T CARRY OVER TO THE FEDERAL PROGRAMS
- 23 DIRECTLY, HOWEVER, WE USE A LOT OF THOSE STATE MONEYS TO MATCH
- 24 FEDERAL DISCRETIONARY PROGRAMS. SO VERY DEFINITELY, THERE
- 25 WOULD BE SOME IMPACT.



1 2 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: YEAH. OKAY. WITH THAT, NICK, DID 3 YOU WANT TO -- I SEE YOUR HAND IS UP. 4 5 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES. THANK YOU CHAIR. AND THANK YOU CHAIR FOR BRINGING THIS ITEM BACK, AND THANK YOU THERESE FOR 6 THE PRESENTATION AND FOR ENGAGING WITH ME AND WITH THE CITY 7 8 AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO FOR THE LAST FEW WEEKS SINCE THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION. AND YOU KNOW, I -- AND I WANT TO 9 10 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT, YOU KNOW, THE PLANNED BAY AREA, AS A WHOLE, IS, YOU KNOW, YOU AND YOUR STAFF HAVE DONE AN INCREDIBLE PIECE 11 OF WORK TO KIND OF NOT ONLY CHART SORT OF THE -- A SET OF 12 STRATEGIES TO MEET OUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS BUT SO 13 MANY OTHER GOALS WE'RE STRIVING TO ACHIEVE AS A REGION, AND I 14 15 THINK WE HAVE NO DOUBT THAT THE WORK-FROM-HOME STRATEGY'S 16 INTENTION WAS POSITIVE. I DON'T THINK ANYONE WAS SORT OF THINKING THERE WAS ANYTHING NEVER GOING ON THERE. BUT I THINK 17 THE CITY AND TOWN OF SAN FRANCISCO IS THINKING ABOUT THE 18 UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF THE WORK-FROM-HOME STRATEGY 19 ESPECIALLY IN THIS CLIMATE WHERE EVERYTHING IS SO FRAGILE 20 21 WHERE THE BAY AREA HAS SOME OF THE HIGHEST UNEMPLOYMENT RATES IN THE COUNTRY SAN FRANCISCO SALES TAX HAS DECLINED MORE THAN 22 ANY OTHER COUNTY IN THE STATE THAT WE ARE SENDING A MESSAGE 23 THAT WE ARE NOT WELCOMING BUSINESSES BACK INTO DOWNTOWN STAN 24

FRISK. AND THIS IS NOT JUST A -- AND THE POWER OF THE PLAN IS

- 1 PARTLY THAT IT SETS US UP AS A BODY, AS MTC TO DELIVER ON
- 2 CERTAIN STRATEGIES. BUT THE POWER OF THE PLAN ALSO LIES IN
- 3 SORT OF THE MESSAGE THAT IT SENDS TO OUR REGION AND TO OUR
- 4 COMMUNITY, AND IN THIS CASE, TO THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY. AND
- 5 EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT BINDING, AND WE KNOW IT'S NOT BINDING,
- 6 AND IN SOME CASES, I WISH IT WAS BINDING AND NOW I'M GLAD THAT
- 7 IT'S NOT, BUT YOU KNOW, EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT BINDING, IT DOES
- 8 SEND A VERY CLEAR MESSAGE. AND I THINK A LOT OF US -- I AND I
- 9 HAVE SPOKEN TO MAYOR LICCARDO ON THIS WHO UNFORTUNATELY
- 10 COULDN'T MAKE IT TO THIS MEETING. I HAVE HAD A LOT OF
- 11 BUSINESSES REACH OUT TO ME AND SAY LOOK THIS IS GOING TO
- 12 AFFECT OUR DECISION MAKING ABOUT WHERE WE'RE GOING TO BE
- 13 LOCATING OUR HEADQUARTERS WHEN WE'RE GOING TO BE MAKING
- 14 INVESTMENTS IN DOWNTOWN CITIES, AND I DON'T THINK WE CAN
- 15 IGNORE THAT KIND OF POWER THAT WE HAVE, AND I THINK THAT'S WHY
- 16 THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO IS ONE OF THE REASONS
- 17 THAT WE ARE, WE FEEL SO STRONGLY ABOUT THIS ELEMENT IN THE
- 18 PLAN, AND NOT JUST LIKE WHETHER IT GETS INTO THE PLAN NEXT
- 19 SUMMER, BUT IT'S WHY WE FEEL SO STRONGLY ABOUT THE FACT THAT
- 20 IT'S SORT OF INCLUDED NOW IN THE LATEST DRAFT. AND WE UNDER --
- 21 WE CERTAINLY DON'T WANT TO DO ANYTHING THAT WOULD JEOPARDIZE
- 22 OUR -- THIS PLAN'S ABILITY TO MEET ITS GREENHOUSE GAS
- 23 EMISSIONS TARGETS, BUT WE ALSO, AS THE MOTION ACKNOWLEDGED
- 24 THAT WAS PASSED LAST TIME, WE ALSO HAVE DEEP FAITH THAT THERE
- 25 IS NOT JUST ONE WAY THAT WE CAN MEET OUR GREENHOUSE GAS



EMISSIONS TARGETS. WE ARE A BIG REGION, AND MTC STAFF HAVE 1 2 REALLY BIG BRAINS, AND LIKE SOME OF THE BEST PLANNERS WORKING 3 AT MPOS IN THE COUNTRY, AND WE REFUSE TO BELIEVE THAT THERE IS JUST ONE MIXTURE OF STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT CAN MAKE 4 5 THIS PLAN COMPLIANT. AND SO WE WANT TO SORT OF FIND A WAY TO MODIFY THIS WORK-FROM-HOME STRATEGY. AND THEN SORT OF INCLUDE 6 OTHER STRATEGIES, AND DO IT AS OUICKLY AS POSSIBLE SO WE CAN 7 8 SEND A CLEAR MESSAGE THAT WE ARE NOT SORT OF FORCING PEOPLE OUT OF OUR DOWNTOWNS. WE'RE NOT SENDING A MESSAGE TO THE 9 10 BUSINESS COMMUNITY THAT WE DON'T WANT PEOPLE COMING BACK, AND REBUILDING THEIR WORKFORCES IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO AND 11 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE AND ELSEWHERE. AND SO I APPRECIATE THIS 12 OPPORTUNITY. YOU KNOW, I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING THIS BACK 13 CHAIR SPERING SO I HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS, 14 15 AND I REALLY HOPE WE CAN FIND A WAY FORWARD. AND YOU KNOW, IN 16 A WAY THAT SORT OF RETAINS THE INTEGRITY AND POWER OF THE PLAN. AND I JUST KIND OF WANT TO LEAVE WITH ONE STATISTIC. 17 THERE ARE TEN PERCENT OF COMMUTERS THAT COMMUTE INTO DOWNTOWN 18 SAN FRANCISCO, ALONE IN THEIR CAR. TEN PERCENT. A 60 PERCENT 19 WORK-FROM-HOME MANDATE MAKES ABSOLUTELY NO SENSE IN SAN 20 21 FRANCISCO. THANK YOU.

- 23 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: NICK YOUR COMMENTS ARE WELL TAKEN
- THAT'S WHY WE'RE GOING TO EXPLORE OPTIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES IN 24
- ANY WAY WE CAN ADDRESS THAT. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE, 25



- 1 PROBABLY TWO YEARS AGO WHEN WE EMBARKED ON THIS, THAT WE SAID,
- 2 AND WE MADE IT CLEAR, AND MANY COMMISSIONERS SAID IT AND OUR
- 3 STAFF SAID 18 PERCENT IS GOING TO BE EXTREMELY DIFFICULT TO
- 4 MEET. THERE IS GOING TO BE -- I THINK SOMEBODY USED THE TERM
- 5 DRACONIAN MEASURES ARE GOING TO BE PUT INTO THE PLAN AND STAFF
- 6 IS GOING TO HAVE TO STRETCH EVERY OPPORTUNITY TO MEET THAT 18
- 7 PERCENT. SO YOU KNOW, MAYBE THE QUESTION OUGHT TO BE, IS THAT
- 8 A REALISTIC NUMBER? BECAUSE YOU CAN SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING, AND
- 9 THE CHOICES THAT ARE GOING TO COME BEFORE US TO REDUCE THAT
- 10 COMMUTE ARE GOING TO BE, I THINK, AS PAINFUL. BUT YOUR
- 11 COMMENTS ARE WELL TAKEN. WE UNDERSTAND IT, AND STAFF IS
- 12 ACTIVELY WORKING TO FIND ALTERNATIVES TO THIS. SO WITH THAT,
- 13 I'LL GO TO KAREN THEN JEWEL THEN -- JULIE THEN ALFREDO.
- 15 DAVID E. HUDSON: YOU'RE MUTED KAREN.
- 17 KAREN MITCHOFF: I HAVE A QUESTION BUT NEED TO MAKE A COMMENT
- 18 FIRST. BOTH SPERING AND I AND OTHERS SERVE ON THE BAY AREA AIR
- 19 OUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT BUT JIM AND I REPRESENT COUNTY
- 20 WHERE IS THERE ARE REFINERIES AND IT'S AMAZING TO US HOW WE
- 21 HEAR THAT WE HAVE TO SHUT DOWN REFINERIES, BAY AREA HEALTH, NO
- 22 MATTER WHAT THE ECONOMIC CONSEQUENCES ARE, HOWEVER WEDNESDAY'S
- 23 AIR BOARD MEETING WE WERE HEARING FROM OTHER COMMUNITIES WHO
- 24 DEPEND ON THE ECONOMIC VITALITY AND ALL OF A SUDDEN IF THEY
- 25 DON'T MEET THIS REQUIREMENT, "OH MY GOSH IT'S GOING TO IMPACT

14



OUR ECONOMY." I FIND THE IRONY WORTH NOTING. AND I DON'T 1 DISAGREE WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT WE NEED TO FIND 2 3 OTHER WAYS, BUT WE'RE GOING TO HIT THE RUBBER IN THE ROAD AS THE ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT AND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO 4 5 FIGURE IT OUT. MY OUESTION RELATES TO THE ISSUE. I HAVE BEEN HEARING ABOUT THIS 60 PERCENT AND MAYBE THERESE THIS IS 6 DIRECTED TO YOU ON YOUR SLIDE YOU TALKED ABOUT THE 25 PIE 7 8 SHARE, AND I KNOW SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ IS OF LEADING THE EFFORT AT THE AIR BOARD ON THE CUT THE COMMUTE AND CONTRA COSTA IS 9 LOOKING AT THAT. IS THAT 25 PERCENT 60 PERCENT OF SOMETHING? 10 OR? WHAT AM I MISSING? OR HOW HAVE I INTERPRETED THAT? 11 12 THERESE MCMILLAN: I CAN ADDRESS THAT AND I HAVE STAFF WHO IS 13 JUMP IN IF I'M WRONG IN ITS BROADEST SENSE. AS I MENTIONED ONE 14 THING THAT WAS RECEIVED AS SORT OF TOP LINE INCEPTION IS THAT 15 16 THE TELECOMMUTING WAS GOING TO BE IMPOSED ON 60 PERCENT OF ALL OF THE JOBS IN THE REGION AND THAT WAS NOT THE CASE. SO THE 17 FIRST THING WAS THAT IT WAS FOR EMPLOYERS THAT HAD 25 18 EMPLOYEES OR MORE. ABOUT HALF OF ALL THE JOBS ARE LESS THAN 19 THAT, WHICH IS, ACTUALLY I THINK THAT FOLKS DON'T REALLY KNOW 20 21 HOW BIG -- HOW EXTENSIVE SMALL BUSINESS IS, SO THAT WAS SORT 22 OF FIRST CUT. THEN WE WENT THROUGH AND TOOK OUT BUSINESSES, BUSINESS TYPES, THERE IS I WAY TO SORT THROUGH IT, WHERE WE 23 FELT TELECOMMUTING DOESN'T WORK, THE SUPER MARKETS, RETAIL, 24

HOSPITALS, WAREHOUSES WHERE FOLKS NEED TO BE THERE. STRIP THAT



- 1 OUT. SO THE 60 PERCENT WAS ON TOP OF A MUCH SMALLER SHARE OF
- 2 THE JOBS. SO FAR WHEN THAT'S DONE IT RESULTS IN THAT 25
- 3 PERCENT IMPACT ACROSS ALL THE COMMUTE SHARE. DOES THAT MAKE
- 4 SENSE? BETTER SENSE? OOH, I THINK KAREN FROZE. BUT, JUST TO
- 5 THE POINT REFERENCING WHAT SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ HAS BEEN DOING. I
- 6 KNOW 20, THE SAME NUMBER CAN BE CONFUSING BECAUSE THE EFFORT
- 7 SHE HAS BEEN LEADING HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON A VOLUNTARY PROGRAM
- 8 RIGHT NOW TARGETING A 25 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE SHARE. SO THE 25S
- 9 ARE DIFFERENT. BUT I JUST EXPLAINED HOW OURS WAS DERIVED.

11 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. GO AHEAD KAREN.

13 KAREN MITCHOFF: SOMETHING HAPPENED TO MY VIDEO. AND I WANT TO

- 14 THANK THERESE FOR THAT EXPLANATION. THAT MAKES PERFECT SENSE
- 15 IS PERHAPS I'M REITERATING BECAUSE MY SOUND DID GO OUT FOR A
- 16 MINUTE. WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT AT THE AIR BOARD IS LOOKING
- 17 AT THAT FLEXIBLE, SO THAT EMPLOYERS WOULD HAVE, YOU KNOW, ONE
- 18 CONCEPT, I SIMPLE ONE IS YOUR 25 PERCENT OF THE EMPLOYEES HAVE
- 19 TO DO A TELECOMMUTE, OR CAN IT BE SO MANY EMPLOYEES THAT
- 20 TELECOMMUTE ALL THE TIME. SO WE RECOGNIZE THAT ONE SIZE FITS
- 21 ALL DOESN'T WORK. AND I KNOW THAT WORK WILL CONTINUE. THANK
- 22 YOU VERY MUCH.
- 24 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. JULIE AND THEN
- 25 ALFREDO.

23

10

1 JULIE PIERCE: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. AND I WANT TO ECHO MY 2 3 THANKS TO STAFF. PLANNED BAY AREA IS AN INCREDIBLY HEAVY LIFT. AND I WILL SAY, TO KIND OF ECHO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S 4 5 COMMENTS, PERHAPS THAT 19 PERCENT REDUCTION IS OVERALL AMBITIOUS AND IT MAY BE THAT WE CAN'T ACTUALLY MEET IT, AND AT 6 SOME POINT, ONE OF THE REGIONS IN CALIFORNIA IS GOING TO SAY, 7 8 IT CAN'T BE DONE. AT SOME POINT, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO CHALLENGE THIS WHOLE PROJECT. BUT, HOPING WE DON'T HAVE TO BE 9 THE ONE IN THE BARREL FOR THAT. BUT, MY COMMENTS ABOUT 10 TELECOMMUTING. THESE IDEAS ARE REALLY GOOD, AS FAR AS THEY GO. 11 AS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NOTED, THEY ARE NOT ENFORCEABLE. WE 12 CANNOT DICTATE TO PRIVATE BUSINESS. WE CAN BEG, WE CAN PLEAD. 13 WE CAN ASK THEM TO LED BY EXAMPLE, BUT WE COULDN'T ENFORCE IT 14 15 UNLESS SOMETHING CHANGES ON A STATEWIDE LEVEL. SO I GUESS MY 16 PITCH WOULD BE THAT WE DEPEND LESS ON TELECOMMUTING IS MORE ON FULLY INTEGRATING RHNA ANY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WHAT DO I 17 MEAN BY THAT? WHAT I MEAN BY THAT IS, BY REQUIRING A 18 COMMENSURATE AMOUNT OF HOUSING BE LOCATED IN VERY CLOSE 19 PROXIMITY TO WHERE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THAT THE JOBS ARE GOING 20 21 TO GROW, AND THAT HOUSE SO HAPPENS TO BE WHERE THE JOBS ALREADY ARE, WE ACCOMPLISH A WHOLE LOT OF THINGS. WE REDUCE 22 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, WHICH REDUCES GREENHOUSES. WE ALSO 23 IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR THE WORKERS IN THOSE JOB 24

CENTERS BY SHORTENING THEIR COMMUTES. THAT APPLIES NOT TO JUST

- 1 THOSE HIGH SALARY TECH TITANS THAT EVERYBODY THINKS ABOUT THAT
- 2 WORK IN SILICON VALLEY AND SAN FRANCISCO AND OTHER JOB CENTERS
- 3 BUT ALSO TO THE SERVICE WORKERS WHO SUPPORT THOSE JOBS. WE HAD
- 4 A PRESENTATION AT AN ABAG ASSEMBLY THAT SAID EVERY ONE OF
- 5 THOSE HIGH PRICE JOBS SUPPORTS AT LEAST 12 OTHER JOBS IN THAT
- 6 VICINITY OF LOWER WAGE SALARIES. MANY OF THOSE FOLKS HAVE TO
- 7 COMMUTE 50, 60 MILES, EACH WAY TO FIND A PLACE THEY CAN AFFORD
- 8 TO LIVE. SO MY SUGGESTION IS, BY INCORPORATING RHNA INTO
- 9 PLANNED BAY AREA, I KNOW IT'S NOT REQUIRED BY LAW, BUT IT
- 10 OUGHT TO BE, BUT BY DOING THAT, IT WOULD ALLOW US TO CREATE
- 11 NEW HIGH-RESOURCE HOUSING NEAR THOSE JOBS, IMPROVING THE
- 12 QUALITY OF LIFE FOR ALL OF THOSE WORKER AND AT SOME POINT THE
- 13 INCREASE IN POPULATION ALONE IS GOING TO OUTSTRIP OUR CAPACITY
- 14 TO ADD THAT GROWTH IN THE EXISTING HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. I'M
- 15 SUGGESTING THAT, PERHAPS WE SHOULD TAKE SOME OF THAT ESTIMATED
- 16 \$1.4 TRILLION FOR PLANNED BAY AREA IMPLEMENTATION AND CREATE
- 17 HIGH RESOURCE COMMUNITIES IN THOSE AREAS NEAR THE PLANNED JOB
- 18 CENTERS. NOT JUST PUT THE HOUSES THERE, BUT CREATE REAL HIGH-
- 19 RESOURCE AREAS, OUT OF THAT GROWTH. THAT REDUCES SPRAWL, IT
- 20 INCREASES THE QUALITY OF LIFE, IT ENHANCES THE SERVICES NEAR
- 21 THE JOBS, IT MAINTAINS THE VIABILITY OF OUR EXISTING JOB
- 22 CENTERS, LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN JOSE, AND SUPPORTS THOSE
- 23 ANCILLARY BUSINESSES AND SERVICES THAT WE WERE JUST TALKING
- 24 ABOUT. IT ALSO HELPS KEEP THESE CITIES FROM BECOMING GHOST
- 25 TOWNS. WHICH IS WHAT'S HAPPENED DURING COVID, TO A LARGE

- 1 EXTENT. AND THOSE BUSINESSES SURROUNDING WHAT USED TO BE THOSE
- 2 HUGE JOB CENTERS ARE REALLY SUFFERING. BUSINESSES ARE GOING
- 3 OUT OF BUSINESS SO IF WE GET SMART ABOUT WHERE WE PUT THE
- 4 HOUSING, I THINK WE CAN ACTUALLY REVITALIZE THOSE MAJOR JOB
- 5 CENTERS. AND IMPROVE THE OUALITY OF LIFE FOR THESE FOLKS.
- 6 PLANNING FOR MORE HOUSING PROXIMATE TO THE NEW AND EXISTING
- 7 JOB CENTERS THAT WE'RE ANTICIPATING IN PLANNED BAY AREA, AND
- 8 WE'RE LOOKING AT A 41 PERCENT GROWTH IN JOBS IN SANTA CLARA
- 9 AREA. WE ALREADY KNOW WE HAVE WAY MORE JOBS THERE THAN WE HAVE
- 10 AVAILABLE HOUSING. SO MAYBE WE NEED TO TAKE A REAL SERIOUS
- 11 LOOK AT HOW THIS WORKS. DOING THAT WOULD ALSO LESSEN THE
- 12 DEMAND FOR THOSE ADDITIONAL TRANSIT AND ROADS, LOWERING THE
- 13 INFRASTRUCTURE COST WE JUSTICE HEARD THAT'S 400 BILLED OUT OF
- 14 THAT 1.4 TRILLION. MAYBE THAT WOULD HELP US MAKE THIS WORK,
- 15 AND REALLY BE IMPLEMENTABLE. SO, I THINK WE NEED TO KEEP THE
- 16 TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY. I THINK THERE IS A WHOLE LOT OF SENSE IN
- 17 DOING THAT. BUT BE A LITTLE LESS DEPENDENT ON THAT. I THINK
- 18 ASSUMING IT WILL MAKE UP A WHOLE OUARTER OF OUR GREENHOUSE GAS
- 19 REDUCTION TARGET, IS OVERLY AMBITIOUS. I THINK WE NEED TO STOP
- 20 THE SPRAWL OF PUTTING NEW GROWTH IN THE FRINGES OF THE BAY
- 21 AREA, IS PUT IT WHERE THE JOBS ARE NOW, AND WHERE THEY'RE
- 22 GOING TO BE IN THE FUTURE, IT'S TIME TO STOP THE OLD GROWTH
- 23 PATTERNS OF GROWTH AND GET REAL ABOUT PLANNING FOR A BETTER
- 24 FUTURE FOR EVERYONE. AND, AS A SHORT-TIMER, I KNOW THAT
- 25 IRRITATES A LOT OF PEOPLE, BUT I THINK IT'S TIME THAT WE GET



- 1 REAL. WE CANNOT CONTINUE TO GROW THE WAY WE ALWAYS HAVE. IT
- 2 DOESN'T WORK. AND IT WON'T WORK. INTO THE FUTURE. AND IF WE
- 3 DON'T GET SMART, WE'RE GOING TO LOSE THE BUSINESSES WE HAVE.
- 4 AND TALKING TO FOLKS FROM THE BAY AREA COUNCIL, I KNOW THAT
- 5 THE TOP 12 EMPLOYERS, RIGHT NOW, IN THE BAY AREA, ALL HAVE
- 6 EXIT PLANS. IF WE DON'T MAKE THINGS BETTER, THEY WILL BE GONE.
- 7 IS WE WILL BE PARTLY RESPONSIBLE. SO, LET'S TRY TO FIND A WAY
- 8 TO MAKE IT WORK AND KEEP THOSE BUSINESSES HERE. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO REMIND
- 11 EVERYONE THAT STAFF IS GOING TO LOOK AT ALL OF THESE
- 12 STRATEGIES, AND IF YOU HAVE A STRATEGY YOU WANT IN MORE
- 13 DETAIL, DAVE VAUTIN IS ON THE LINE HERE, HE'S LISTENING TO
- 14 WHAT'S GOING ON. WE'RE NOT GOING TO SOLVE IT HERE AT THIS
- 15 MEETING. BUT JULIE, I APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS. AND I JUST
- 16 WANT TO LET EVERYONE KNOW THAT, YOU KNOW, THE POINTS THAT ARE
- 17 BEING MADE, WE'RE ALL VERY SENSITIVE TO THOSE AND WE
- 18 UNDERSTAND WHAT THOSE IMPACTS ARE, AND I THINK EVERYTHING
- 19 THAT'S GOING TO BE DONE TO MITIGATE THAT AND HOW WE BRING THIS
- 20 PLAN FORWARD. FRED OWE DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

- 22 ALFREDO PEDROZA: I THINK THE WAY WE'RE MOVING FORWARD DOESN'T
- 23 PRECLUDE US FROM HAVING THOSE CONVERSATIONS FROM REACHING OUT
- 24 AND LISTENING TO THINGS LIKE THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND OTHERS.
- 25 WE WANT TO GET THIS RIGHT. BUT I THINK THAT'S WHY YOU MADE THE



- 1 MOTION IN A WAY THAT'S GOING TO GIVE THOSE OPPORTUNITIES.
- 2 AGAIN, ALL THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN SHARED TODAY FROM
- 3 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, A LITTLE BIT MORE CENTRIC ARE VALID,
- 4 AND WE NEED TO HAVE THIS CONVERSATION. AGAIN, I SUPPORT THE
- 5 DIRECTION WE'RE READING IN, BECAUSE IT GIVES US THE
- 6 OPPORTUNITY TO DO JUST THAT. SO AGAIN, THANK YOU MR. CHAIR FOR
- 7 BRINGING THIS BACK. EDDIE?

8

- 9 EDDIE AHN: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I HAD A OUICK CLARIFYING
- 10 QUESTION AND QUICK COMMENT TO FOLLOW. PROBABLY FOR THERESE.
- 11 THERESE, YOU ORIGINALLY MENTIONED ANALYSIS THAT CERTAIN TYPES
- 12 OF SECTOR HAVE BASICALLY BEEN EXCLUDED SUPER MARKETS RETAILERS
- 13 HAS OFFICE SPACE BEEN CONSIDERED BY MTC PUBLIC SECTOR AGENCIES
- 14 NON-PROFITS AS WELL?

- 16 THERESE MCMILLAN: LET ME TURN TO DAVE TO, I THINK CAN
- 17 ELUCIDATE THE DATA SET AND WHAT WE TOOK FORWARD. DAVE, DO YOU
- 18 WANT TO PICK THAT UP? >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS
- 19 DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE PLANNING TEAM. IN OUR SIMULATION
- 20 MODELING, WE CATEGORIZED JOBS INTO ABOUT A HALF DOZEN
- 21 CATEGORIES. ONE OF THOSE IS PROFESSIONAL BUSINESS SERVICES,
- 22 WHICH A LARGE CHUNK OF THAT PARTICULAR CATEGORY OF THOSE WHITE
- 23 COLLAR, 9 TO 5 OFFICE JOBS, BUT WE ALSO INCLUDE COMPONENTS OF
- 24 SEVERAL OTHER CATEGORIES BASED ON THE SHARE OF TRADITIONAL



- 1 OFFICE SPACE EMPLOYMENT SO IT DOES INCLUDE PUBLIC SECTOR JOBS
- 2 THAT ARE OFFICE BASED AS WELL.

- 4 EDDIE AHN: THAT BRINGS UP A CONCERN OF MINE TOO, BECAUSE
- 5 CERTAIN GOVERNMENT AGENCIES, I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A
- 6 LOT OF NUANCE IF AND WHEN WE GO DOWN THIS ROAD GOVERNMENTS
- 7 HAVE TO DO SOCIAL WORK AND INTERACT WITH COMMUNITIES I WORRY
- 8 ABOUT THE LONG-TERM DECREASING COMMUNICATION BETWEEN THE
- 9 PUBLIC SECTOR, I ECHO SOME OF THE COMMENTS EARLIER BY
- 10 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IT'S MORE ABOUT SIGNALS TOO, THAT WE
- 11 SENDING TO THE OVERALL MARKET, LIKE, JUST IN THE PRIVATE
- 12 SECTOR ALONE, THE IDEA OF A WORK CULTURE, WHAT DOES IT EVEN
- 13 MEAN? I THINK PEOPLE ARE VERY PSYCHOLOGICALLY SCARRED FROM THE
- 14 PANDEMIC NOW. AND IN MY FINAL COMMENT I ASK SAN FRANCISCO TO
- 15 WORK WITH THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AGAIN I THINK THEY
- 16 ANSWERED A REALLY INTERESTING LETTER THAT GOES INTO DETAIL
- 17 ABOUT EQUITY COMMENTS WHICH I'M INTERESTED IN AS A
- 18 COMMISSIONER AND THE SLIDING SCALE OF TRIP REDUCTION FACTORS
- 19 AND THESE ARE THINGS THEY WOULD BE MORE THAN HAPPY TO FOLLOW
- 20 UP ON WITH STAFF OFFLINE. OVERALL I'M WORRIED ABOUT THE POLICY
- 21 IT'S NOT JUST UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES IT'S JUST RESHAPING OF
- 22 AMERICAN CITIES WHICH WE'RE NOT READY FOR. IT'S GENERALLY GOOD
- 23 PRACTICE TO TRY TO ENCOURAGE SUSTAINABLE TRIPS AND I
- 24 APPRECIATE THE WORK BY STAFF, ALL THE WORK THAT GOES INTO THIS



BUT OVERALL I'M WORRIED ABOUT THE UNINTENDED DEVASTATION TO 1 2 OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES. 3 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU EDDIE. CINDY CHAVEZ. 4 5 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YOU KNOW, I WANT TO START -6 7 - AND THIS IS GOING TO SOUND A LITTLE MORE PROVOCATIVE THAN I 8 MEAN IT TO, BUT I WANT TO START WITH ONE PART OF THE PLAN THAT WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT TODAY AND THAT IS THAT A PART OF THIS 9 PLAN REFLECTED ON THE IMPACTS OF WHAT WOULD HAPPEN IF WE HAD A 10 SIGNIFICANT NATURAL DISASTER. AND PART OF THAT PLAN SAID HOW 11 LONG WOULD IT TAKE US TO BUILD BACK SO THAT BUSINESSES COULD 12 GET BACK ONLINE AND FLOURISH HERE. AND WHAT I WAS CONCERNED 13 ABOUT, WHEN I LOOKED AT THAT PART OF THE PLAN IS IT SAID IT 14 15 COULD TAKE BETWEEN 5 AND 10 YEARS FOR US TO BE ABLE TO PUT THE 16 BUILDINGS BACK TOGETHER TO BE ABLE TO GET WORKPLACES BACK TOGETHER SO PEOPLE COULD GET BACK TO WORK. AND I RAISE THAT 17 BECAUSE COVID-19 IS ACTUALLY THAT DISASTER. NOW, IT'S HITTING 18 US IN A DIFFERENT WAY, BUT THE IMPLICATIONS OF IT ARE 19 SIGNIFICANT AND SO THAT BRING ME TO THE ISSUE OF REMOTE WORK. 20 21 WHEN WE REACH OUT TO THE PUBLIC, AND WE DO POLLS PRE COVID ABOUT WHAT THEY LIKE AND DON'T LIKE ABOUT LIVING IN THE BAY 22 AREA, ONE OF THE COMPLAINTS WE ALWAYS HEAR IS ABOUT TRAFFIC. 23 AND NOT JUST TRAFFIC, BUT ABOUT CONGESTION, AND GOT JUST 24 CONGESTION, BUT HOW LONG IT TAKES TO GET FROM POINT A TO POINT

- 1 B AT ANY GIVEN TIME OF DAY OR NIGHT. AND PART OF OUR
- 2 RESPONSIBILITY HAS BEEN TO LOOK AT, AND I THINK, BROADLY, HOW
- 3 DO WE CREATE A HIGH QUALITY OF LIFE FOR PEOPLE WHO WANT TO
- 4 LIVE, WORK, AND PLAY HERE. AND WHEN YOU LOOK AT A STRATEGY
- 5 LIKE REMOTE WORK, WHICH BY THE WAY IS HAPPENING WHETHER WE
- 6 LIKE IT OR NOT, THE REAL QUESTION IS, HOW ARE WE SHAPING IT?
- 7 ARE WE GOING TO BE IN FRONT OF HELPING PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THE
- 8 VERY BEST WAY TO CREATE THE QUALITY OF LIFE WE WANT HERE IN
- 9 THE COMMUNITY? AS AN EXAMPLE, IN MY OPINION, IN FACT SOME OF
- 10 THE WAYS REMOTE WORK NAME AND CUT THE COMMUTE PLEDGE NAME ARE
- 11 KIND OF MISNOMERS AND WE HAVE TO WORK ON IT, BECAUSE WHAT WE
- 12 REALLY WANT TO CREATE ARE OPTIONS FOR PEOPLE TO MOVE AROUND
- 13 OUR COMMUNITY THAT DOES NOT REQUIRE THEM TO GET IN A SINGLE
- 14 OCCUPANCY FOSSIL FUELED VEHICLE. THAT'S WHAT THE GOAL IS. AND
- 15 WITH THAT, THERE ARE SO MANY CHANGES THAT ARE GOING TO BE
- 16 HAPPENING, INCLUDING NEW KINDS OF VEHICLES THAT USE -- AND
- 17 MORE ACCESS TO ELECTRIC VEHICLES. I ONLY SAY THAT BECAUSE I
- 18 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE DON'T LOOK AT ANY SINGLE TOOL
- 19 THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT IN THIS BLUEPRINT AS A BLUNT INSTRUMENT.
- 20 I THINK IF WE ALL KNOW THAT WHEN POLICIES GET DEVELOPED, THEY
- 21 HAVE TO BE STRUCTURED, CUSTOMIZED AND FRAMED. AND I'M
- 22 CONFIDENT THAT THE STAFF UNDERSTANDS THAT. I'M CONFIDENT THAT
- 23 OUR CITIES UNDERSTAND THAT, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT, AS
- 24 WE PROCEED, THAT WE CONTINUE TO SAY THAT. BECAUSE OTHERWISE, I
- 25 THINK THE POINT, EDDIE, THAT YOU JUST RAISED, AND THE POINT

- 1 THAT NICK RAISES, THEY'RE NOT LOST ON ME, BUT I THINK FOR US
- 2 TO PRESUME THAT THERE IS ONLY ONE WAY TO GET TO THAT NUMBER IS
- 3 REALLY NOT RIGHT. AND I KNOW THAT STAFF IS GOING TO BE WORKING
- 4 ON THAT. AND LET ME JUST ADD ONE OTHER THING TO WHAT JULIE
- 5 JUST TALKED ABOUT RELATIVE TO RHNA. YOU KNOW, I THINK ONE OF
- 6 THE MOST IMPORTANT OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE HAVE, SITTING ON
- 7 THESE REGIONAL BOARDS, IS BETTER UNDERSTANDING THE PLACE WE
- 8 ALL SIT. AND KAREN HAD A GOOD POINT WHICH IS, WE ALL LOOK AT
- 9 EACH OTHER'S REGIONS DIFFERENTLY THAN WE LOOK AT THEM
- 10 OURSELVES. SO WHENEVER I HEAR SOMEONE SAY LET'S PUT MORE
- 11 HOUSING NEAR JOBS THEN THEY SAY LOOK AT SAN JOSE I SAY WHOA,
- 12 WHOA, WHOA, IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY MOST OF THE JOBS FRANKLY PER
- 13 RATIO POPULATION AREN'T IN SAN JOSE. SO I LOOK AT MORE HOUSING
- 14 COMING TO SAN JOSE WHICH SAN JOSE FROM MY PERSPECTIVE HAS BEEN
- 15 A CHAMPION IN TERMS OF BUILDING HOUSING LONGER THAN OTHERS
- 16 WERE. AND I SAY NO LET'S NOT THROW IT IN ONE BUCKET WE NEED TO
- 17 BE MORE STRATEGIC AND CUSTOMIZED. I SAY THAT BECAUSE I THINK
- 18 THE INTENT OF STAFF WILL BE TO CUSTOMIZE ALL OF THESE
- 19 STRATEGIES AND NOT ALL OF US ARE GOING TO LIKE WHAT THE
- 20 IMPACTS TO THE COMMUNITIES ARE THAT WE REPRESENT, BUT
- 21 HOPEFULLY IF WE'RE LAYER OTHER THESE ON TOP OF EACH OTHER
- 22 WE'RE COMING UP WITH SOLUTIONS THAT BOTH IMPROVE AIR QUALITY
- 23 BUT OVERALL IMPROVE OUALITY OF LIFE AND MAKE EMPLOYERS WANT TO
- 24 BE HERE AND FRANKLY WANT TO STAY HERE. AND I'M NOT SURE WE
- 25 WERE DOING A GOOD JOB OF THAT BEFORE COVID-19. SO THE QUESTION



- 1 IS, WHAT ARE WE LEARNING FROM COVID-19 RIGHT NOW THAT'S GOING
- 2 TO HELP US BE MORE COMPETITIVE AND HOW DO WE WORK WITH OUR
- 3 EMPLOYERS TO MAKE SURE THAT'S THE CASE. TO ME THAT'S SORT OF
- 4 THE CALL TO ACTION HERE. AND FRANKLY TO ME COVID-19 HAS GIVEN
- 5 AN INDICATION OF MUCH BIGGER ISSUES IN THE PLAN OF WHAT TO DO
- 6 IN A BIG EVENT LIKE AN EARTHQUAKE BECAUSE MANY OF OUR LARGE
- 7 EMPLOYERS COULD MOVE ANYWHERE THEY WANT TODAY. AND IF A BIG
- 8 EARTHQUAKE HAPPENS THEY'RE GOING TO DO IT. OUR ABLE TO BOUNCE
- 9 BACK IS A GREAT OPPORTUNITY HERE. SORRY THAT WAS A LITTLE BIT
- 10 OFF BUT I HAVE BEEN LISTENING TO THESE DISCUSSIONS FOR A WHILE
- 11 AND WANTED TO SHARE SOME OF MY REFLECTIONS. THANK YOU.

12

- 13 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU CINDY. JAKE THEN
- 14 CARLOS.

- 16 JAKE MACKENZIE: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WAS LISTENING WITH
- 17 GREAT INTEREST TO THE SELF DESCRIBED SHORT-TIMER, JULIE
- 18 PIERCE, AND I WAS REFLECTING UPON ONE ASPECT OF SB 375. THE
- 19 PROBLEM WITH 375 IS THAT IT'S LEGISLATIVE HISTORY AND THE
- 20 EVENTS LEADING UP TO IT ARE NOW BACK IN THE MIDSTS OF TIME,
- 21 AND AS SOMEONE WHO PARTICIPATED SOMEWHAT UNWILLINGLY WITH THE
- 22 LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA CITIES, THAT PARTICULAR SUMMER, I GOT OUT
- 23 OF IT, FRANKLY, BECAUSE ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS WERE NOT
- 24 INCLUDED. THAT BEING SAID, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S VERY CLEAR
- 25 IN IMPLEMENTING 375, COORDINATING THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS



ALLOCATION PROCESS WITH REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PROCESS WHILE 1 2 MAINTAINING LOCAL AUTHORITY OVER LAND USE DECISIONS. AND I 3 BELIEVE, ARE WE NOT COMING VERY CLOSE TO WHERE THESE TWO FORCES ARE GOING TO COME TOGETHER PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THE 4 5 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENT? THERE IS CERTAINLY A LOT OF STIRRING UP IN SONOMA COUNTY OVER SOME OF THE NUMBERS THAT ARE 6 -- HAVE BEEN PUT FORWARD. SO I WAS VERY INTERESTED IN JULIE 7 8 PIERCE'S COMMENTS, AND IT SEEMS TO ME, WE HAVE A MAJOR TASK ON OUR HANDS TO, WHICH HAS TO INVOLVE THIS RELATIONSHIP OF THE 9 JOBS AND THE HOUSING AND WHERE THEY ARE. AS SOMEONE WHO IS A 10 PIONEER AND WORKING FROM HOME BACK IN THE EARLY 1990S, I 11 UNDERSTAND I HAVE A SON WHO IS I GOOGLE EMPLOYEE. HE'S NOT 12 GOING TO BE GOING BACK TO WORK IN SAN FRANCISCO. NOT THIS 13 YEAR. PROBABLY NOT NEXT YEAR. I THINK SOME OF THESE MAJOR 14 15 CHANGES, YOU KNOW, HAVE TAKEN PLACE ALREADY. THESE MAY NOT BE 16 THE MOST COGENT COMMENTS I HAVE EVER MADE, BUT THIS COLLISION COURSE BETWEEN THE RHNA NUMBERS AND THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, 17 WE HAVE GOT TO RESOLVE THIS, AND WE HAVE GOT TO RESOLVE IT IN 18 A WAY THAT'S GOING TO HELP US MEET THE TARGETS. THANKS. 19 20 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU JAKE. CARLOS? COMMENTS?

22 23

21

- CLERK OF THE BOARD: I CAN'T HEAR HIM. HE'S NOT MUTED ON OUR 24
- END. HE MIGHT BE MUTED ON HIS PHONE. 25

MARTHA IS CARLOS STILL WITH US?



1

October 9, 2020

2 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THERE. CARLOS? 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HE MUTED HIMSELF. 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. AMY, AND THEN I'LL COME 6 BACK TO CARLOS. AMY, GO AHEAD. 7 8 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO PICK UP ON THE 9 COMMENTS OF THE COMMISSIONERS. THERE IS A MARVELOUS EXHIBIT AT 10 COYOTE POINT MUSEUM I TOOK MY KIDS THERE YEARS AGO IT SHOWS 11 THE ECOSYSTEM OF THE RED HAWK AND YOU SEE THIS HUGE CEDAR TREE 12 AND THE WHOLE ECOSYSTEM AND I THINK THE JOBS ENVIRONMENT IS 13 LIKE THAT TODAY WE HEARD AT OUR LAST MEETING THE SERVICES 14 15 JULIE'S POINT OF THE RATIO ONE TECH JOB TO THE SERVICE JOBS. 16 WE TALK ABOUT THE TECH FOLKS WORKING AT HOME BUT WHAT ABOUT ALL THE HUGE NUMBERS OF PEOPLE THAT ARE WORKING SUPPORTING 17 THAT ECOSYSTEM AND THE CONCERNS ABOUT THIS EMPLOYMENT. BUT THE 18 OTHER THING THAT CONCERNS ME, AND AGAIN, I WAS THERE WITH JAKE 19 DURING MOSES WHEN WE WERE DOING 375, AND 1 OF THE CHALLENGES 20 21 TO DATE, I THINK I HAVE SEEN, IS THANKS TO THE FINE WORK IN 22 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY FOR OUR ABAG REPRESENTATIVE COMMISSIONER PIERCE, WE HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO DRILL DOWN INTO THE HOUSING 23 NUMBERS AS THEY'RE EVOLVING. AND THE REALITY OF SB 375 WAS 24 25 THAT WE HAD TO LINK HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT, AND



- WHERE WE ARE MOVING IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS, IS WE'RE MOVING 1 FARTHER AND FARTHER AWAY FROM THE PRIORITY OF JOBS/HOUSING 2 3 BALANCE. SO WE'RE PUTTING MORE AND MORE HOUSES AWAY FROM JOB CENTERS AS OPPOSED TO PUTTING THEM CLOSE TO THE JOB CENTERS. 4 5 SO I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE LOOK TO LINKING THE HOUSING WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA INVESTMENT TRANSPORTATION 6 INVESTMENT, AND I THINK CINDY IS PROPOSING REALLY A MODERATE 7 8 APPROACH TO PROACTIVELY PLANNING THE KINDS OF COMMUTE OPTIONS, NOT ONE SIZE FITS ALL. BUT I REALLY AM CONCERNED THE WAY THIS 9 PLAN IS MOVING IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS RELATIVE TO OUR ABILITY 10 TO ACHIEVE THESE GREENHOUSE TARGET GOALS. BECAUSE IT'S 11 ESSENTIALLY BECOMING BUSINESS AS USUAL. AND I RECOGNIZE THE 12 IMPORTANCE OF EXPLORING THE COMMUTE, YOU KNOW, THESE WORK-13 FROM-HOME OPTIONS, BUT I JUST THINK THAT WE CAN'T MOVE AWAY 14 15 FROM THIS LINKAGE IN THE OTHER AREAS. SO I THINK THAT IT'S, AS 16 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE INDICATED IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE IDENTIFY THE WAYS OF MATCHING THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS WITH OUR 17 ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS WITH REGARDS TO PLANNED BAY AREA, AND THE 18 VMT REDUCTION. THANK YOU. THANK YOU AMY. BEFORE I GO BACK TO 19 CARLOS. MARTHA, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE IN PUBLIC 20 21 SPEAKERS?
- 22
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NINE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 24 THEIR HANDS RAISED AT THIS MOMENT.



- 1 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. CARLOS, ARE YOU THERE NOW?
- 2 THIS TIME? OKAY I'M NOT HEARING CARLOS. MARTHA LET'S GO TO THE
- 3 PUBLIC SPEAKERS. GIVE EVERYONE ONE MINUTE SO WE CAN BRING THIS
- 4 BACK TO THE COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM ONLY.
- 5 SO GO AHEAD.

6

- 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST UP IS HENRY FOLLOWED BY KEVIN. GO
- 8 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

- 10 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR SPERING AND COMMISSIONERS HENRY
- 11 HILKIN PLANNING DIRECTOR AT THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY
- 12 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT COUPLE POINTS. I WANT TO ELEVATE HOW
- 13 IMPORTANT THE BLUEPRINT IS WE WILL NOT MEET OUR GREENHOUSE
- 14 TARGETS WITHOUT DEEP REDUCTIONS IN THE TRANSPORTATION SECTOR.
- 15 AND THAT MEANS ZERO EMISSIONS VEHICLES THAT MEANS REDUCED VMT
- 16 AND ALL THE SUPPORTING POLICIES THERESE DESCRIBED IN HER
- 17 PRESENTATION. AND I GUESS MY SECOND POINT REALLY IS THAT THE
- 18 AIR DISTRICT IS, I JUST WANTED YOU TO UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE
- 19 COMMITTED TO WORKING WITH AND YOU YOUR STAFF ON WORKING
- 20 THROUGH ALL THE IMPLEMENTATION DETAILS OF THESE STRATEGIES. WE
- 21 HAVE A LONG HISTORY OF WORKING WITH MTC STAFF. WE JOINTLY
- 22 DEVELOPED A COMMUTER BENEFIT PROGRAM THAT WE TOOK TO OUR
- 23 RULEMAKING PROCESS THROUGH THE 511 WEB SITE THAT'S A GREAT
- 24 FOUNDATION TO BUILD ON AND WE'RE POISED AND COMMITTED TO WORK
- 25 WITH STAFF, AS I SAID, TO WORK OUT ALL THE IMPLEMENTATION



DETAILS THAT ARE YET TO COME FOR THIS STRATEGY AND MANY 1 2 OTHERS. THANK YOU. 3 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: NEXT SPEAKER. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: KEVIN, FOLLOWED BY ALETA. KEVIN, GO AHEAD. 6 7 8 SPEAKER: HIGH MY NAME IS KEVIN RESIDENT OF SEEING NONE COUNTY. I RECOGNIZE THIS STRATEGY IS WE'RE TOO MUCH ON IT WORKING FROM 9 HOME IS KIND OF HARD TO ENFORCE IN TERMS OF HOW BUSINESSES 10 WORK AND THERE IS A LOT OF SIDE EFFECTS PEOPLE WHO ARE AT THE 11 RESTAURANTS NEXT TO LARGE BUSINESSES OR JANITORS WHO WORK AT 12 THE COMPANIES THERE IS A LOT OF SIDE BUSINESSES THAT WOULD BE 13 EFFECTED BY THE MANDATE. THE GOAL OF THE MANDATE IS TO REDUCE 14 15 SINGLE OCCUPANCY CAR DRIVING AND THE STRATEGY SHOULD BE JUST 16 LIKE WE SHOULD JUST REDUCE THAT INSTEAD TALKED EARLIER ABOUT TRIP CAPS. THOSE ARE THE REAL THINGS THAT REDUCE GHG. I WORK-17 FROM-HOME BUT PREVIOUSLY WHEN I WORKED AT MY COMPANY I WALKED 18 TO WORK. WORK-FROM-HOME DOESN'T ACTUALLY SOLVE ANYTHING. THERE 19 IS ENOUGH PEOPLE THAT SPECIFIED EARLIER THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE 20 DON'T DRIVE TO WORK THEY ALL TAKE TRANSIT. WORK-FROM-HOME 21 22 STRATEGY PUSHES ALL THE BURDEN TO THE WORKER TO CREATE THEIR 23 OWN WORK ENVIRONMENT AT THEIR OWN HOME CREATE THEIR OWN EMISSIONS BY GOING TO THEIR LOCAL COMMUNITIES BECAUSE PEOPLE 24

WOULD MOVE TO LESS DENSE COMMUNITIES.



1 2 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ALETA FOLLOWED BY SEAMLESS BAY AREA. GO 4 5 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 6 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE 7 8 RECORD. I HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THIS I BELIEVE WE SHOULD HAVE A WORK AT HOME STRATEGY BUT I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD BE A 9 MANDATE. I HOPE COMPANIES WOULD BE ENLIGHTENED TO DEVELOP A 10 WORK AT HOME STRATEGY AND THAT WOULD GIVE THE EMPLOYEES THE 11 FREEDOM TO BE ABLE TO LIVE, REALLY WHERE THEY CAN AFFORD. I AM 12 WONDERING IF SOME PEOPLE ARE AFRAID OF EXPANDING WORK AT HOME, 13 BECAUSE ONCE YOU CAN WORK AT HOME, YOU CAN MOVE TO OTHER 14 15 STATES WHICH DON'T HAVE STATE INCOME TAXES AND HAVE MUCH LOWER 16 COST OF LIVING SUCH AS NEVADA OUR NEIGHBOR TO THE EAST WHERE 17 I'M SITTING RIGHT NOW, CHEAP ELECTRICITY, AND LOW RENT, AND THE ONLY DRAWBACK TO NEVADA IS IT GETS HOT IN THE SUMMER. 18 WORK-FROM-HOME WOULD HELP A LOT OF PEOPLE ESPECIALLY THE 19 20 DISABLED. 21 22 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU ALETA. 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SEAMLESS BAY AREA FOLLOWED BY ROLAND. GO 24

25

AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

1 2 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, THIS IS ADINA LEVIN. I 3 DON'T KNOW HOW TO CHANGER THAT NAME IN WHAT ZOOM IS DOING. APOLOGIES FOR THAT. COMMENTS ON THIS. APPRECIATE HEARING 4 5 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN TALK ABOUT HOW THE INTENT OF THIS STRATEGY IS NOT TO REDUCE THE USE OF TRANSIT AND WALKING AND 6 BICYCLING TO COMMUTE, AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT SOME OF OUR 7 8 ADVOCACY PARTNERS HAVE HEARD FROM STAFF AS WELL, AND SINCE THAT IS THE CASE, WE ARE VERY MUCH EAGERLY LOOKING FORWARD TO 9 HAVING THE TEXT OF THE STRATEGY EN7 TO BE EDITED AND CHANGED 10 IN ORDER TO REFLECT THAT INTENT BY STAFF. WHAT COMMISSIONER 11 JOSEFOWITZ SAID, IF YOU HAVE AN OFFICE WITH 100 PEOPLE IN 12 DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, AND ONLY 10 OF THEM DRIVE, OR DOWNTOWN 13 SAN JOSE, AND 25 OF THEM DRIVE, IF YOU SAY 60 PERCENT NEED 14 15 WORK-FROM-HOME THAT IS SUPPRESSING BICYCLING, WALKING AND 16 TRANSIT, BUT IF -- SO I AGREE WITH THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER, WE SAY A FOCUS ON REDUCING DRIVE ALONE IS THE RIGHT WAY TO GO AND 17 LASTLY 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: -- REDUCING THE HIGHWAY EXPANSION CAN HELP CREATE MORE ROOM ON THE GREENHOUSE SIDE. THANK YOU. 23

25 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. NEXT MARTHA.



1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROLAND GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 3 SPEAKER: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I THINK YOU HAVE HEARD ENOUGH 4 5 FROM DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS ABOUT THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF THE WORK-FROM-HOME POLICY. I WOULD LIKE TO 6 TOUCH ON TWO ALTERNATIVES THAT DO NOT REQUIRE [INDISCERNIBLE] 7 8 GROWTH. SB 375 -- ALL RAIL AND GOODS MOVEMENTS INCLUDING TO AND FROM DESTINATIONS OUTSIDE OF NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES 9 STARTING WITH THE CITY OF OAKLAND. LAST BUT NOT LEAST A BAN ON 10 FOSSIL FUELS IN NEW CONSTRUCTION INCLUDING THE CONSTRUCTION 11 PHASE STARTING WITH SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, AND SAN JOSE, IF 12 GOOGLE CAN GET THERE IN TEN YEARS WHY CAN'T OTHERS FOLLOW 13 THEIR LEAD? THANK YOU. 14 15 16 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: NEXT MARTHA. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP AMELIA FOLLOWED BY SARAH. GO AHEAD 18 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 19 20 AS WE HEARD TODAY THE STRATEGY INCLUDES FEASIBILITY AND 21 IMPACT MAKING THE PLAN TOO RELIANT ON A SINGLE RECOMMENDATION 22 WHICH LOOKS ANALYSIS OF COUNTLESS IMPLICATIONS WE WOULD SEE 23 FOR RESIDENTS ACROSS THE SPECTRUM CONCERNS OF EQUITY AND 24

INCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS ON HOUSING AND PUBLIC SERVICES AND



- 1 FURTHER WE DON'T SEE ADEOUATE UNDERSTANDING AND CONSIDERATION
- 2 OF NUANCES FOR PEOPLE WHO ALREADY COMMUTE VIA GREEN METHODS.
- 3 WHILE THE SAN FRANCISCO CHAMBER OF COMMERCE REPRESENT THE
- 4 GOALS, THERE ARE STRATEGIES THAT SHOULD BE ALIGNED FURTHER FOR
- 5 A CONNECT BAY AREA IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO MEET THE PLAN GOALS
- 6 THEY'RE NOT ENFORCEABLE AND SET THE BAY AREA UP FOR FAILURE IF
- 7 CHANGES ARE MADE IT'S CRUCIAL THEY ARE DOCUMENTED IN THE PLAN
- 8 WE STRONG LE URGE RECONSIDERATION AND REMOVAL OF EN7. THANK
- 9 YOU.

10

11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SARAH JONES.

- 13 SPEAKER: THANK YOU SAY JONES PLANNING DIRECTOR OF SFMTA. WE
- 14 ARE AT THIS POINT CONCERNED ABOUT THE STRATEGY AS ITS WRITTEN
- 15 AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING TOGETHER ON REFINEMENTS, AND SOME
- 16 ADDITIONAL WORK TOWARDS A BETTER SOLUTION. WE VERY MUCH
- 17 SUPPORT THE NEED FOR CAR TRIP RUCK AND ARE -- REDUCTION AND
- 18 ARE SENSITIVE TO THE STRATEGIES INCLUDED NEED TO BE FEASIBLE
- 19 IN MEETING THE GOALS. SFMTA AND SAN FRANCISCO HAS ONE OF THE
- 20 MOST BUSINESS FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION DEMAND IN THE STATE.
- 21 IT'S RESPONSIVE TO EFFICACY MEASURES AND MEETS DEVELOPMENT AND
- 22 ANALYZATION OF PROJECTS. PROVIDING OPTIONS TO TRAVEL BY CAR
- 23 FOR ALL TYPES OF TRIPS AND PUTTING PEOPLE CLOSE TO WHERE THEY
- 24 WANT TO GO TO ACHIEVE OUR CARBON REDUCTION GOALS. WE ARE



OFFERING OURSELVES AS A RESOURCE TO MTC TO HELP DEVELOP 1 EFFECTIVE WAYS TO REFINE THE STRATEGY. 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: JEFFREY FOLLOWED BY JASON. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 9 10 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. THREE QUICK POINTS IN THE INTEREST OF 11 TIME. ONE IS, I THINK WE NEED TO STEP BACK BECAUSE WE'RE IN 12 THE MIDDLE OF THIS COVID CRISIS AND IT'S DRIVING, RIGHT NOW, 13 THE ISSUE OF WORK-FROM-HOME. OUR MID-SIZE OFFICE OF ARCHITECTS 14 15 AND URBAN DESIGNERS, FOR EXAMPLE, HAVE TO BE ABLE TO MEET 16 FACE-TO-FACE, AND THE DEPRIVATION OF THAT RIGHT NOW IS VERY DIFFICULT ON OUR WORK PROCESS. SECOND POINT, AND I WILL SEND A 17 MEMO ON THIS, THIS IS A FUNDAMENTAL DISRUPTION OF THE WHOLE 18 URBAN CONCEPT. IT HAS HUGE WORK, SOCIAL, CULTURAL, ECONOMIC 19 IMPLICATIONS. THIRD IS, THERE IS GOING TO BE SMALL BECAUSE AS 20 SOMEONE ELSE MENTIONED, THERE IS GOING TO BE PEOPLE MOVING OUT 21 TO CHEAPER PLACES, AND THAT MEANS THAT THE GHG FROM 22

AUTOMOBILES MAY NOT NECESSARILY REDUCE. LET ME PLEASE SAY ONE

FINAL THING, WHICH IS, AS CHAIR OF BAY AREA COUNCIL'S

23



TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE, I WORKED ON A PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION 1 REGIONAL PLAN WHICH WAS GOING VERY WELL BUT THEN GOT --2 3 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: YOU HAVE TO WRAP UP. 4 5 SPEAKER: I AM WRAPPING UP. THANK YOU. AND I THINK WE NEED TO 6 GET BACK TO THAT AND FOCUS ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, JOBS AND 7 8 HOUSING, AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 9 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU JEFF. 10 11 SPEAKER: NEXT UP IS JASON. FOLLOWED BY DAVID. 12 13 THANK YOU MARTHA A JASON BAKER FROM THE SILICON VALLEY 14 15 LEADERSHIP WHERE I'M VICE PRESIDENT OF HOUSING. THANK YOU FOR 16 THE WORK WE UNDERSTAND THE SPOT YOU'RE IN TRYING TO MEET THE NUMBERS. WE SENT IN TWO LETTERS I WON'T GO OVER THOSE BUT I 17 WANT TO ADDRESS TWO OTHER POINTS. FIRST OF WHICH IS I DON'T 18 THINK THE SUPPORT THAT THE SLIDES REPRESENT REALLY REPRESENT 19 SUPPORT FOR THIS PROGRAM, POLLING FOLKS ON WHETHER OR NOT THEY 20 21 BELIEVE IN A WORK-FROM-HOME POLICY GENERALLY IS DIFFERENT FROM ASKING IF THEY WANT TO BE REQUIRED BY THE GOVERNMENT STAY HOME 22 60 PERCENT OF THE TIME EVEN IF THEY COULD WALK TO WORK. AS MTC 23 IS COUNTING UP VOICES JUST BECAUSE THE 300 FIRST MEMBERS OF 24

THE LEADERSHIP GROUP AREN'T TAKING THEIR TURN AT THE MIC ONE



- 1 AFTER ANOTHER DOESN'T MEAN THEY'RE NOT CONCERNED ABOUT THE
- 2 EFFECTS OF THE PLAN INCLUDING THE POSSIBILITY OF NOT
- 3 RECOGNIZING THE GOOD WORK A LOT OF THE FOLKS HAVE DONE ON
- 4 BIKING AND PED POLICIES THIS WOULD SUPPRESS THE BIKING AND
- 5 WALKING FOLKS HAVE WORKED SO HARD ON. THANK YOU FOR THE WORK
- 6 AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO REACH OUT OVER THE NEXT MONTH.
- 8 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU.
- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: DAVID FOLLOWED BY GLEN. GO AHEAD AND
- 11 UNMUTE.

7

9

12

- 13 SPEAKER: I THINK THE STRATEGY IS CURRENTLY WRITTEN, THERE IS A
- 14 LOT OF MAJOR PROBLEMS SPECIFICALLY AROUND WALKING, BIKING
- 15 TRANSIT. IT'S GOOD TO HEAR THAT STAFF SAYS THAT THE MANDATE
- 16 WOULDN'T NECESSARILY APPLY TO PEOPLE WHO DO THAT, BUT I THINK
- 17 THE TEXT EFFORT STRATEGY NEEDS TO REFLECT THAT ACCORDINGLY. I
- 18 ALSO THINK THAT IT WOULD BE FAR BETTER TO JUST TRY TO FIGURE
- 19 OUT WAYS TO STOP TO LIMIT THE WAY PEOPLE ACTUALLY DRIVE
- 20 OPPOSED TO PUTTING EVERYTHING REMOTE WHICH COMES WITH
- 21 PROBLEMS. AND THE QUESTION EARLIER MOVING TO SAN FRANCISCO
- 22 HAVING A PDM [INDISCERNIBLE] SEEMS MORE EFFECTIVE THAN
- 23 REDUCING EMISSIONS THAN A BLUNT MANDATE LIKE WHAT'S BEEN
- 24 PROPOSED SO FAR.



JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. MARTHA HOW MANY MORE 1 2 DO WE HAVE? MARTHA? 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIVE. I THOUGHT I WAS UNMUTED. 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: GWEN THEN KEN. 9 SPEAKER: HI GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS GWEN SENIOR VICE 10 PRESIDENT AT BAY AREA POLICY COUNCIL. I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR 11 ALL THIS GREAT WORK AND THANK YOU TO SPERING FOR BRINGING THIS 12 ITEM BACK THE BAY AREA SUPPORTS A STAY AT HOME STRATEGY BUT 13 FEEL THIS MANDATE IS AN OVERSTEP. AS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ 14 15 MENTIONED WHILE THIS IS JUST A PLAN THE STRATEGY IS HAVING 16 REAL IMPACTS ON OUR REGION AS BUSINESSES ARE CHOOSING WHERE TO GROW AND LOCATE TODAY. WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE UNINTENDED 17 CONSEQUENCES OF THE POLICY. THE CENTERS DOWNTOWN AND REGIONAL 18 TRANSIT SYSTEM INCREASE IN SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLE TRIPS AND 19 OF COURSE SPRAWL INSTEAD WE PREFER ALTERNATIVES SUCH AS RHNA 20 21 THAT ACHIEVE OUR GOALS INSTEAD OF BECOMING GHOST TOWNS. WE 22 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU OVER THE NEXT MONTH TO TACKLE 23 THE CHALLENGES SIGNIFICANT BAY AREA AND MEET OUR GREENHOUSE

EMISSIONS GOALS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25



JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: KEN BUKOWSKI, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE FOLLOWED BY DON. 4 5 SPEAKER: WHEN WE TAKE THESE SURVEYS DO THESE PEOPLE 6 7 SURRENDERING ON THE IMPACTS. IT'S TRUE THEY WANT TO 8 TELECOMMUTE BUT WHAT THE BUSINESSES. IF YOU HAVE FREE PUBLIC TRANSIT IT CHANGES ALL OF THESE ASSUMPTIONS TOTALLY. A LOT OF 9 PEOPLE WON'T DRIVE AND IN ANOTHER TEN YEARS YOU'RE GOING TO 10 HAVE ALL ELECTRIC VEHICLES SO THAT WILL REDUCE THE GREENHOUSE 11 GAS SO I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE A STEP BACK AND REEVALUATE WHAT 12 WE'RE DOING. THANK YOU. 13 14 15 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU KEN. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: DON GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 17 18 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR HARD WORK 19 ON THIS INCREDIBLE PLAN. I WILL SAY THAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT 20 21 THE DISCONNECT BETWEEN THE MANDATE AND SOMETHING AS IMPORTANT 22 AS CALTRAIN. THERE ARE COMMISSIONERS ON THIS CALL WHO HAVE 23 SHOWN TREMENDOUS LEADERSHIP IN GETTING MEASURE RR ON THE BALLOT. AND IF WE'RE ABLE TO SAVE CALTRAIN WITH A DEDICATED 24 25 FUNDING SOURCE AN ENTIRE SMART GROWTH STRATEGY FROM SAN



- 1 FRANCISCO TO SAN JOSE IS AT RISK IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. I
- 2 THINK IF YOU WENT OUT AND RETESTED A QUESTION THAT SAID DO YOU
- 3 SUPPORT A 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE MANDATE, THAT WILL REDUCE THE
- 4 NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO SUPPORT THE SMALL BUSINESSES AROUND
- 5 CALTRAIN STATIONS, OR OTHER TRANSIT STATIONS, IF THEY SURVIVE
- 6 COVID-19 THIS MAY END UP KILLING THEM, YOU WOULD GET A MUCH
- 7 DIFFERENT RESPONSE AND YOU WOULDN'T USE IT AS A CREDIBILITY
- 8 MARKER FOR THIS PROGRAM. SO TELECOMMUTE YES. MANDATE NO. THANK
- 9 YOU.

10

11 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU DON.

12

- 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CLIFFORD GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
- 14 CLIFFORD FOLLOWED BY ROBERT.

- 16 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS CLIFFORD WALDEK A LONG TIME
- 17 ACTIVE MEMBER OF THE SAN FRANCISCO CHAMBER OF PUBLIC POLICY
- 18 COMMITTEE AS WELL AS THE BAY AREA COUNCIL, AND I THINK AMELIA
- 19 OF THE CHAMBER AND GWEN AND [INDISCERNIBLE] OF THE BAY AREA
- 20 COUNCIL FOR THEIR COMMENTS AS WELL. AND I AGREE WITH, YOU KNOW
- 21 AS SOMEONE WHO HAS BEEN WORKING IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO FOR
- 22 OVER 50 YEARS, I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. THIS
- 23 DOESN'T WORK FOR SAN FRANCISCO, AND A OUESTION I WOULD LIKE TO
- 24 POSE IS, IF GOVERNOR NEWSOM'S MANDATE OF ELECTRIC VEHICLES BY
- 25 A CERTAIN TIME, DOES THAT CHANGE -- OR BY A CERTAIN DATE --



- 1 DOES THAT CHANGE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ALL OF THIS? AND I
- 2 THINK IT'S GOOD TO HAVE -- TO CUT DOWN ON ALL OF WHO PLAN TO
- 3 SPEAK FOR TWO MINUTES DOWN TO ONE MINUTE ESPECIALLY FOR
- 4 SOMEONE WHO STUTTERS.

5

6 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU CLIFFORD.

7

- 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROBERT GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. IT
- 9 WILL BE FOLLOWED BY PHONE NUMBER 8616.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS ROBERT F. I
- 12 AGREE. THIS POLICY IS INHERENTLY JUST NONSENSE, IF YOU JUST
- 13 LOOK AT WHAT THE EXPECTED MODE SHARES ARE EXPECTED TO BE BY
- 14 2050. WE'RE SAYING THAT IN 2015 WALK AND BIKE WAS FIVE PERCENT
- 15 OF MODE SHARE. WE'RE ONLY EXPECTING IT TO BE EIGHT PERCENT BY
- 16 2050 LIKE IN 30 YEARS WE'RE ONLY EXPECTING A TINY MINORITY OF
- 17 PEOPLE TO ACTUALLY WALK AND BIKE MORE AND WE'RE ONLY EXPECTING
- 18 TRANSIT TO GO FROM 14 PERCENT OF MODE SHARE TO 20 PERCENT MODE
- 19 SHARE. CLEARLY THE PROBLEM IS NOT TELECOMMUTING. THE PROBLEM
- 20 IS THE CAR TRAFFIC WHICH WE ARE -- WHICH WE HAVE NO SOLUTION
- 21 FOR CONVERTING CAR TRAFFIC INTO OTHER MODES OF TRANSPORTATION.
- 22 THAT'S THE REAL ISSUE. THE ISSUE ISN'T THERE ARE TOO MANY
- 23 OFFICE WORKERS. THE ISSUE IS THE BAY AREA HAS NO IDEA HOW TO
- 24 GET AROUND THAT DOESN'T INVOLVE A CAR.



JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU. 1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: LAST FOUR DIGITS 8616, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE 3 YOURSELF. AGAIN. LAST FOUR DIGITS OF YOUR PHONE NUMBER IS 4 5 8616. YOU WILL NEED TO UNMUTE YOURSELF. PRESS STAR NINE. OKAY. 6 SPEAKER: YES. HI. THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY 7 8 AREA. THANK YOU TO STAFF. I AGREE THAT WE NEED TO INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF TELECOMMUTING AND WE ABSOLUTELY, YOU KNOW, 9 UNDERSTAND THAT THE INTENT OF THIS POLICY IS TO REDUCE 10 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, HOWEVER THE ACTUAL TEXT OF THIS 11 POLICY IS -- HAS ALL SORTS OF UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES. I 12 REALLY DON'T THINK, WHILE THE INTENT IS TO REDUCE CAR TRAVEL 13 THAT YOU CAN DEFINITIVELY SAY THAT THIS POLICY WILL REDUCE CAR 14 15 TRAVEL, AND INCREASE TRANSIT AND NOT REDUCE TRANSIT AND 16 WALKING AND OTHER MODES. 28 PERCENT OF IT, IT'S A NATIONAL REPORT I'M LOOKING AT 20 PERCENT OF ALL VMT IS COMING FROM 17 COMMUTING TO WORK. THAT'S 70 PERCENT OF VMT THAT ARE OTHER 18 TYPES OF TRIPS THAT THIS POLICY ISN'T -- ISN'T ADDRESSING. SO 19 WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOMETHING MORE HOLISTIC THAT ISN'T 20 21 FOCUSED ON LARGE EMPLOYERS BUT ACTUALLY GETS AT THE HEART OF

23

22

THE PROBLEM.

24 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC 1 2 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. WE HAVE RECEIVED PUBLIC COMMENT FROM 3 SAN FRANCISCO --4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. I'M GOING TO BRING IT BACK TO THE --6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OH I WAS GOING TO READ THE PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED INTO THE RECORD. 9 10 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION 13 AUTHORITY, SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP, SILICON VALLEY 14 15 ORGANIZATION, SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP, SAN MATEO 16 COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION, SAN CARLOS CHAMBER OF COMMERCE. NATIONAL ASSOCATION OF INDUSTRIAL AND OFFICE PARKS, 17 SILICON CHAMBER, SUNNYVALE CHAMBER OF COMMERCE, DOWNTOWN 18 ASSOCIATION AND CHAMBER OF REDWOOD CITY, WAS A JOINT LETTER, 19 AND WE RECEIVED COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONER LICCARDO WHICH WILL 20 21 BE POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS AFTER 22 THIS MEETING. 23 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: REAL QUICK DAVE VAUTIN QUESTION 24

FOR YOU. DAVE, WHAT'S THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN 25 PERCENT



- 1 TELECOMMUTING OR BUSINESSES HAVE TO HAVE 25 PERCENT OF THEIR
- 2 WORKERS USE PUBLIC TRANSIT OR OTHER MODES? >DAVE VAUTIN:
- 3 SORRY. MAYBE IF I COULD ASK TO CLARIFY THE QUESTION,
- 4 COMMISSIONER. ARE YOU SAYING WHAT'S THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A
- 5 REQUIREMENT HAVING --

6

- 7 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: MANDATE, IF BUSINESS IS 25
- 8 PERCENT HAVE TO USE PUBLIC TRANSIT, THERE IS SOMETHING OTHER
- 9 THAN THE AUTOMOBILE. >DAVE VAUTIN: SO IF WE WANTED TO GET
- 10 EQUIVALENT GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS BY COUNTING OTHER MODES
- 11 TOWARDS THIS GOAL, WE WOULD HAVE TO SET A HIGHER TARGET.
- 12 BECAUSE THERE ARE CURRENTLY COMMUTERS HEADED TO THESE
- 13 BUSINESSES THAT ARE TAKING TRANSIT, WALKING, BIKING, DOING ALL
- 14 THESE GOOD THING TODAY. SO IF WE WANTED TO GET EQUIVALENT
- 15 EMISSIONS WITH THE SAME STRATEGY THAT TARGETS LARGER SCALE
- 16 EMPLOYERS WE WOULD HAVE TO DO THE ANALYSIS ON THAT OVER THE
- 17 COURSE OF THE FALL BUT IT WOULD PROBABLY BE IN THE 70 TO 80
- 18 PERCENT RANGE RECOGNIZING THERE SAY CHUNK OF THOSE PEOPLE
- 19 TAKING ALTERNATIVE MODES.

- 21 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: I THINK COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ
- 22 AND AHN, MAYBE -- WHAT NUMBER OF TELECOMMUTING IS COMFORTABLE
- 23 FOR BUSINESSES? SO WE KNOW WHAT THAT GAP THAT WE'RE TRYING TO
- 24 FILL IS. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW, I THINK TELECOMMUTE -- BEFORE
- 25 COVID-19, WE WERE BETWEEN 6 AND 10 PERCENT ALREADY. AND SO,



- 1 THAT NUMBER, OVER TIME, IS GOING TO INCREASE. AND SO, MAYBE WE
- 2 JUST FIND OUT WHAT THAT IS, AND START FOCUSING ON WHAT IS THE
- 3 GAP WE HAVE TO CLOSE. WE'RE NOT GOING ELIMINATE TELECOMMUTING
- 4 ENTIRELY. I THINK STAFF HAS HEARD A LOT. WE KNOW WE HAVE A LOT
- 5 OF WORK AHEAD OF US, IS DAVID, YOU PROBABLY HAVE SOME
- 6 SLEEPLESS NIGHTS AHEAD OF YOU. AND I WANT TO GO BACK TO
- 7 CARLOS. I DON'T KNOW IF HE'S STILL ON.

- 9 CARLOS ROMERO: I'M HERE. THIS STRATEGY CLEARLY HAS SOME ISSUES
- 10 AND CONCERNS WITH MANY CBD CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICTS IT'S NOT
- 11 A PAN SEA HOWEVER IF WE CAN FIGURE OUT IMPACTS ON TRANSIT AND
- 12 BIKE PED, IF WE CAN CREATE SOME PILOT PROGRAMS THAT ARE
- 13 SUGGESTED ACTUALLY IN THE PRESENTATION MOVING FORWARD THAT
- 14 COULD IMPLEMENT THIS STRATEGY, IT CERTAINLY COULD BE A VALID
- 15 CHOICE FOR CERTAIN CITIES, CERTAIN COUNTIES, WHERE THERE IS A
- 16 LOT OF IN-MIGRATION, TRAFFIC, THAT SPREAD OUT OVER LARGER
- 17 GEOGRAPHIC AREAS. AND I CAN UNDERSTAND -- I DON'T HAVE A
- 18 BETTER TERM BUT I WOULD SAY THE PAROCHIALITY OF SAYING THIS
- 19 DOESN'T WORK FOR US. WE NEED TO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AN
- 20 OPTION, ORGANIC CHANGE THAT IS OCCURRING IN COMMUTING
- 21 PATTERNS, I THINK IT'S WORTH LOOKING AT TRYING TO MITIGATE
- 22 THOSE IMPACTS MENTIONED, THE TAXATION POLICY THAT CAPTURES
- 23 SOME OF THE BENEFITS OF COMMUNITIES THAT COMPANIES GET FROM
- 24 ACTUALLY MORE FOLKS TELECOMMUTING IN, BUT REALLY UNDERSTANDING
- 25 THOSE IMPACTS INCLUDING THE EQUITY IMPACTS ARE IMPORTANT. BUT



I WOULD NOT DISCARD THIS OPTION OUTRIGHT. I THINK WE NEED TO 1 2 TEST IT. AND WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND HOW IT COULD WORK AND THE 3 IMPACT THAT IT WOULD HAVE ON THE VARIOUS TYPES OF COMMUNITIES. 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: THANK YOU CARLOS. OKAY. WELL, I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. I THINK WE HAVE HAD A VERY GOOD 6 DISCUSSION. JUST REAL OUICKLY, I WANT TO THANK ALL OF THE 7 8 PEOPLE THAT CALLED IN TO SPEAK THOSE ARE CLEAR SUCCINCT COMMENTS FOR ONE MINUTE. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE SPEAKERS 9 FOR DOING THAT. ANY COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY FINAL BRIEF 10 COMMENTS THAT YOU FEEL LIKE YOU HAVE TO MAKE? OKAY. SEEING 11 NONE. THERESE AND DAVID V, DO YOU GUYS NEED TO HEAR ANYTHING 12 ELSE? YOU HAVE CLEAR DIRECTION? YOU KNOW WHAT CONCERNS ARE? 13 OKAY. ALL RIGHT. WITH THAT, THE -- WHAT I'M GOING DO IS SEE IF 14 15 THERE IS ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS. MARTHA IS THERE ANY OTHER 16 PUBLIC COMMENTS 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING 18 TO SPEAK UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT 19 WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: ALL RIGHT EVERYONE. GOOD DISCUSSION. WE'RE GOING TO BE WORKING ON THIS AND TAKING MANY 23

OF THE COMMENTS INTO CONSIDERATION. AND WITH THAT, IF THERE IS



1	NO OT	HER	BUSIN	ESS,	THIS	MEETING	IS	ADJOURNED.	TO	NOVEMBER	6TH.
2	THANK	YOU	ALL.	[AD	JOURNI	ED]					
3											
4											
5											
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											
19 20											
21											
22											
23											
24											
25											



Broadcasting Government