



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



October 9, 2020

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 9, 2020, 9:35 AM

DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR: I'M DAVE CORTESE CHAIR OF THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, I AM WITH DAMON CONNOLLY, THE VICE CHAIR, WE ARE CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER AND WE REQUEST THAT THE BROADCAST TEAM LOAD THE ANNOUNCEMENT.

SPEAKER: DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING



October 9, 2020

1 TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING
2 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE
3 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
4 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
5 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE
6 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS
7 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
8 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
9 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
10 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
11 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
12 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
13 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

14

15 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. NOW THAT WE HAVE
16 THE RULES OF ENGAGEMENT OUT OF THE WAY, CAN I ASK THE CLERK TO
17 CALL THE ROLL?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

24

25 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORTESE?

3

4 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI NON-VOTING.

7

8 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO? ABSENT.

11 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.

12

13 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT? HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SLOCUM? ABSENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER STRACNER NON-VOTING.

24 COMMISSIONER STRACNER? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

25



October 9, 2020

1 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU MARTHA. WE'RE GOING TO
2 MOVE ON TO ITEM TWO ON THE AGENDA. WHICH IS THE PLEDGE OF
3 ALLEGIANCE. PLEASE STAND IF YOU'RE IN A POSITION TO DO SO AND
4 JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]
5 "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF
6 AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION
7 UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."
8 OKAY. THANK YOU. ITEM THREE IS THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.
9 WE'LL GO BACK TO THE CLERK FOR THAT.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
12 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
13 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A
14 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
15 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
16 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

17

18 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO ITEM FOUR,
19 WHICH IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. FIRST OF ALL, LET ME ASK IF
20 THERE IS ANY REQUESTS TO PULL ANYTHING OFF THE CONSENT
21 CALENDAR AS PER THIS COMMITTEE. SEEING NONE, WE CAN ENTERTAIN
22 A MOTION FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

23

24 **DAMON CONNOLLY, V. CHAIR:** SO MOVED.

25



October 9, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SECOND.

2

3 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** SECOND BY SPERING. LETS PAUSE TO ASK FOR
4 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC FOR THE ITEMS ON THE CONSENT
5 CALENDAR.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER THE CONSENT
8 CALENDAR.

9

10 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** LAST CALL FOR COMMENTS. WE SEE NO RAISED
11 HANDS. YOU CAN USE STAR NINE YOU IN ARE CALLING IN TO THE
12 MEETING. AGAIN, SEEING NO REQUESTS. WE'LL GO AHEAD AND TAKE A
13 ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

18

19 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, WE'LL MOVE ON TO
20 ITEM 5A, I BELIEVE IT IS. THIS WOULD BE THE, A CONTRACT HAVING
21 TO DO WITH -- OR CONTRACTS HAVING TO DO WITH FREEWAY SERVICE
22 PATROL TOWING SERVICE THERE IS A LIST OF VENDORS HERE. I
23 UNDERSTAND WE'LL HAVE A PRESENTATION FROM GIOVANNI DIFABIO, IS
24 THAT CORRECT?

25



October 9, 2020

1 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** YES. THAT'S CORRECT. MY NAME IS GIOVANNI
2 DIFABIO THE PROGRAM COORDINATOR FOR THE FREEWAY SERVICE
3 CONTROL. EVERY 2 YEARS APPROXIMATELY HALF OF THE BEAT FST
4 BEATS COME UP FOR PROCUREMENT. BEATS ARE SEGMENT OF FREEWAY
5 ASSOCIATED WITH EACH CONTRACT. AND IF THE AV STAFF COULD PUT
6 UP A MAP THAT WE HAVE AS PART OF THE ATTACHMENT. SO IN JUNE,
7 STAFF PROVIDED THIS COMMITTEE WITH INFORMATION ITEM OUTLINING
8 THE PROCUREMENT RESULTING IN THE CONTRACT RECOMMENDATIONS. THE
9 FSP CONTRACTS WILL PROVIDE TOWING SERVICES ON THE HIGHLIGHTED
10 SEGMENTS OF FREEWAY. THE CONTRACTS THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
11 TODAY ARE HIGHLIGHTED IN GREEN. IN TWO YEARS WE'LL COME BACK
12 FOR THOSE THAT ARE IN BLUE. THE 12 CONTRACTS AND RECOMMENDED
13 VENDORS AND AMOUNTS FOR EACH BEAT ARE OUTLINED IN ATTACHMENT
14 A, AND YOU CAN SEE WHICH OF THOSE VENDORS IS AN SBE CERTIFIED
15 VENDOR. AND I AM OPEN TO ANY QUESTIONS YOU HAVE.

16

17 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE?
18 SEEING NONE. MARTHA DO YOU AGREE THAT THERE ARE NO HANDS
19 RAISED?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, AND COMMISSIONER
22 GIOCAPINI BOTH HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED. THE FIRST ONE TO RAISE
23 THEIR HAND IS COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY.

24

25 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, PLEASE PROCEED.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. FOR ME THIS IS GOOD
3 WORK AND I AM HAPPY TO SEE OUR FACILITIES CONTINUE TO OPERATE
4 NOT ONLY IN A SAFE MANNER BUT IN AN EFFICIENT MANNER. WHAT I
5 DIDN'T SEE IN THE STAFF REPORT IS THE HOURS OF OPERATION WHICH
6 ON THE 580 CORRIDOR IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE THE COMMUTE STARTS
7 AROUND 2:30 IN THE MORNING. SO CAN I GET SOME UNDERSTANDING ON
8 THAT? GIOVANNI DIFABIO THE MAJORITY THE BEAT STARTS AT 6:00
9 A.M. BUT FOR BEAT TWO UP TO SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY LINE THAT'S AN
10 EXCEPTION THAT STARTS EARLIER AT 5:30 A.M.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SO FAR YOU'RE GIVING A PERFECT ANSWER.
13 HOW LATE DOES IT RUN IN THE EVENING?

14

15 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** THAT RUNS UNTIL 7:00 P.M. ALL OF OUR
16 SEGMENTS RUN THROUGH 7:00 P.M. IN THE EVENING WE FOUND
17 CONGESTION TYPICALLY DIES OFF SHORTLY THEREAFTER, OF COURSE ON
18 SOME OF THE OUTLINE BEATS THAT MAY RUN A LITTLE BIT LONGER,
19 BUT ALL OF OUR BEATS DO RUN UNTIL 7:00 P.M., WITH THE
20 EXCEPTION OF FRIDAY, WHEN UP IN VACAVILLE AND ALSO UP IN
21 ALAMEDA COUNTY WE RUN UNTIL 8:00 P.M. 1 DAY PER WEEK ON
22 FRIDAYS.

23

24 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO SAY THEY THINK THIS
25 IS GREAT STAFF WORK. I KNOW THAT MY QUESTION WAS SOMEWHAT



October 9, 2020

1 PAROCHIAL, BUT YOU ANSWERED IT IN THE REGIONAL, AND ANSWERING
2 AS TO BEATS AND HOW YOU'RE SERVING THE PUBLIC. I APPRECIATE
3 THE ANSWER AND I THINK YOU'RE DOING A GREAT JOB. THANK YOU.

4

5 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI?

8

9 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. I WAS WONDERING IF YOU COULD
10 EXPLAIN A BIT WHAT ON-CALL SERVICE MEANS FOR, IT LOOKS LIKE
11 HIGHWAY FOUR.

12

13 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** CAN YOU REPEAT THE BEGINNING OF YOUR
14 QUESTION, ABOUT HIGHWAY FOUR?

15

16 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I'M SORRY. I WAS WONDERING IF YOU COULD
17 EXPLAIN, IT LOOKS LIKE THERE ARE SOME BEATS THAT ARE LISTED AS
18 ON-CALL SERVICES. ONE, IN PARTICULAR, LOOKS LIKE IS HIGHWAY
19 FOUR. I'M WONDERING IF YOU COULD EXPLAIN WHAT THAT MEANS,
20 SPECIFICALLY?

21

22 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** THE DOTTED SEGMENTS ARE ON CALL. SO
23 TYPICALLY WITH THE FREEWAY SERVICE PATROL TRUCKS THEY'RE GOING
24 FROM ONE END OF THE FREEWAY TO THE OTHER AND GOING BACK AND
25 FORTH AND ONLY STOP IF CHP CALLS THEM FOR WORK ON THE SIDE OF



October 9, 2020

1 THE ROAD. THE TRUCKS WOULD ONLY ENTER THAT AREA IF THERE IS A
2 CALL TO 511 OR 911 AND THERE IS A DISABLED MOTORIST THERE SO
3 THEY WOULDN'T TYPICALLY PATROLLING THAT SEGMENT OF THE FREEWAY
4 BUT THEY DO RESPOND TO DISABLED MOTORISTS AND DEBRIS IN THOSE
5 AREAS.

6

7 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **GIOVANNI DIFABIO:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

10

11 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS ON
12 THE COMMITTEE OR THOSE VISITING? LET ME ASK THE CLERK IF WE
13 HAVE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS OR MEMBERS EFFORT PUBLIC WHO HAVE
14 RAISED HANDS ON THE ITEM.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM
17 AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

18

19 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WE CAN ENTERTAIN A MOTION ON
20 THE ITEM, 5A CONTRACTS FOR FREEWAY SERVICE PATROL TOWING
21 SERVICES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I MOVE TO APPROVE THIS CONTRACT.

24

25 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SECOND.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN AND COMMISSIONER
3 MACKENZIE.

4

5 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION? SEEING NO
6 REQUESTS, WE'LL TAKE A ROLL CALL VOTE. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

7

8 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** GRATE. THANK YOU MARTHA WE'LL MOVE TO
9 AGENDA ITEM 6A WHICH IS NEXT GENERATION SYSTEMS UPDATE AND I
10 THINK CAROLE IS GOING TO BE PRESENTING THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CAROL KEUSTER:** THAT'S RIGHT. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS CAN WE
13 GET THE MATERIALS SLIDE UP? THANK YOU. I WILL KEEP THIS BRIEF
14 BUT IT'S BEEN OVER A YEAR SINCE WE UPDATED YOU ON THE CLIPPER
15 PROGRAM AND DESPITE LOW TRANSIT LEVELS, FARE COLLECTION
16 CONTACTLESS FARE COLLECTION HAS BEEN MENTIONED QUITE A BIT
17 DURING THIS COVID TIME WE'RE HEARING CALLS FOR COORDINATED
18 TRANSIT AND OF COURSE CLIPPER IS DELIVERING A LOT OF WHAT
19 PEOPLE NEED IN TERMS OF SINGLE PAYMENT METHOD. I'M GOING TO
20 GIVE A QUICK REMINDER ABOUT WHAT CLIPPER DELIVERS TODAY AND
21 TOUCH A BIT ON THE COMING IMPROVEMENTS TO THE CLIPPER SYSTEM
22 THAT WE ARE BUSILY WORKING ON. NEXT SLIDE. JUST AS A REMINDER
23 BEFORE I TALK ABOUT IMPROVEMENTS JUST A REMINDER WHERE WE ARE
24 TODAY AND A REMINDER THAT CLIPPER HAS IN FACT BEEN CONTACTLESS
25 FOR 14 YEARS NOW, HAS BEEN OFFERING SEAMLESS TRAVEL SINCE



October 9, 2020

1 2006. OF COURSE YOU CAN USE CLIPPER TO TRAVEL SEAMLESSLY ON 22
2 TRANSIT AGENCIES CLIPPER AUTOMATICALLY CALCULATES THE CORRECT
3 AND BEST FARE AND APPLIES ALL DISCOUNTS AND TRANSFERS THERE IS
4 A LOT OF INTELLIGENCE PACKED INTO THIS CARD AS A RESULT WE
5 HAVE SATISFIED CUSTOMERS. CUSTOMER SURVEYS TENDS TO COME BACK
6 WITH 96 PERCENT OF TRANSIT RIDERS SAYING THEY BELIEVE IN
7 CLIPPER'S EXCELLENT SERVICE. IT'S A LOT TO BE PROUD OF. NEXT
8 SLIDE PLEASE. AND WHILE WE ARE BUSILY BUILDING THE NEXT
9 CLIPPER, WE'RE MAKING IMPROVEMENTS TO THE NEXT SYSTEM IN JULY
10 WE LAUNCHED A NEW AND IMPROVED MOBILE FRIENDLY ACCESSIBLE
11 WEBSITE. THIS IS THE FIRST SUBSTANTIAL WEB SITE CHANGE SINCE
12 WE REBRANDED AS CLIPPER IN 2010. I HOPE YOU GO AND CHECK OUT
13 THE WEB SITE. IT INCORPORATES FEEDBACK WE HAVE RECEIVED FROM
14 CUSTOMERS, FANS, AND OPERATORS OVER THE YEARS AND WE ALSO
15 ENGAGE THE CENTER FOR ACCEPTABLE TECHNOLOGY TO IMPROVE
16 ACCESSIBILITY OF THE WEB SITE. IT PROVIDES MORE INTUITIVE SITE
17 NAVIGATIONS STREAMLINED ACCOUNT MANAGEMENT ACCESS TO
18 INFORMATION ABOUT HOW TO ADD A CARD AND ADD VALUE. IT'S A NICE
19 BRIGHT DESIGN WE'RE PROUD OF IT. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU KNOW WE'RE
20 WORKING HARD TO DELIVER AN EVEN BETTER CLIPPER SYSTEM WE'RE
21 REFRESHING TECHNOLOGY TO DELIVER -- SO THAT WE CAN CONTINUE
22 DELIVERING THE EXISTING SERVICE THAT WE HAVE TODAY AND HAVE
23 MORE FLEXIBILITY FOR THE FUTURE. UNDER THE NEXT GENERATION
24 SYSTEM, PEOPLE WILL HAVE MORE CHOICES ABOUT HOW TO LOAD VALUE
25 AND PAY, THEY WILL BE ABLE TO USE THEIR VALUE SOONER. WE WILL



October 9, 2020

1 BE ISSUING SOFTWARE UPGRADES AND INSTALLING NEW EQUIPMENT ON
2 BUSES IN BART STATIONS AND RAIL AND FERRY PLATFORMS AND AT
3 THE SAME TIME, THE NEW SYSTEM WILL MAKE IT EASIER TO OFFER
4 INCENTIVES AND PROMOTIONS FOR USING CLIPPER AS WELL AS TO
5 MANAGE PROGRAMS LIKE UNIVERSITY AND INSTITUTIONAL PROGRAMS.
6 ONE OTHER REMINDER IS THAT WE ARE EXPANDED CLIPPER TO COVER
7 PARATRANSIT AND TO HAVE THE ABLE TO PAY FOR TRANSIT PARKING AT
8 TRANSIT STATIONS. SO THOSE ARE SIGNIFICANT NEW FEATURES THAT
9 WE DON'T HAVE TODAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. JUST AS A REMINDER,
10 THE CLIPPER PROGRAM IS DELIVERED THROUGH THIS CONSORTIUM OF
11 TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC, WE ACT AS THE CONTRACTING AGENCY
12 HOLDING THE VARIOUS CONTRACTS TO GET THE SYSTEM ON THE STREET.
13 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THAT CONSORTIUM, OUR CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
14 BOARD THAT MEETS MONTHLY, THERESE SITS ON THAT BOARD, THEY
15 HAVE BEEN VERY INTERESTED IN KEEPING US ON SCHEDULE FOR THIS
16 NEXT GENERATION DEPLOYMENT. I AM PLEASED TO SAY THAT WE'RE ON
17 SCHEDULE AND WITHIN BUDGET. AND RIGHT ON TRACK FOR WHERE WE
18 SHOULD BE, PER THE NEXT GENERATION DELIVERY SCHEDULE. NEXT
19 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE WE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET JUST SO
20 YOU COULD GET A LITTLE TASTE OF SOME OF THE EQUIPMENT THAT
21 WILL BE COMING NEXT YEAR ON BUSES AND RAIL AND FERRY STATIONS.
22 NEXT SLIDE. I'M GOING TO SPEND A SLIGHTLY LONGER MINUTE ON
23 THIS SLIDE BECAUSE WE'RE REALLY EXCITED ABOUT BEING ABLE TO
24 INTRODUCE THE CLIPPER MOBILE APP TO THE REGION. THE APP WILL
25 CHANGER HOW PEOPLE PAY THERE ARE FARES WITH CLIPPER. USING THE



October 9, 2020

1 APP CUSTOMERS WILL BE ABLE TO CREATE A MOBILE CARD THEN USE
2 THEIR PHONE TO PAY FARES RIGHT AT THE GATE. A MOBILE CARD WILL
3 WORK MUCH LIKE A PLASTIC CARD USING FIELD COMMUNICATION
4 TECHNOLOGY BUT HAVE THE ADDED FEATURE TO USE GOOGLE APPLE PAY
5 VALUE. ESSENTIALLY IF YOU ADD VALUE TO YOUR MOBILE CARD WITHIN
6 YOUR PHONE YOU'LL BE ABLE TO USE THAT VALUE IMMEDIATELY. BUT
7 IF YOU STIFF LOVE USING YOUR PLASTIC CARD THAT'S NO PROBLEM
8 TOO YOU CAN EITHER KEEP YOUR PLASTIC CARD OR MANAGE YOUR CARD
9 WITHIN THE APP. SO THE APP IS GOING INTO PILOT TESTING BY THE
10 END OF THIS CALENDAR YEAR WITH A REPRESENTATIVE GROUP OF
11 TRANSIT RIDERS AND WE'LL LOOK FORWARD TO LAUNCHING IT TO THE
12 GENERAL PUBLIC ONCE TESTING IS COMPLETED. WE FEEL IT'S GOING
13 TO BE A REAL GAME CHANGER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANTED TO
14 BRING YOU THIS INFORMATION ABOUT THE MOBILE APP BECAUSE WE'RE
15 HEARING A LOT OF CALLS FOR A WHOLE VARIETY OF APP TYPES, AND
16 ALSO QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW COME -- WHAT ABOUT THE CONCEPT OF
17 JUST USING A CONTACTLESS CREDIT OR DEBIT CARD TO PAY MY FARES.
18 SO OUR APPROACH ON CLIPPER IS THAT WE ARE LOOKING TO THE
19 EXISTING CLIPPER PROGRAM AND THE MOBILE APP TO SERVE THE WHOLE
20 LIST OF RIDERS THAT YOU SEE HERE IN THIS LEFT COLUMN. ALL OF
21 THE PRIMARY AUDIENCES, ALL OF THE DISCOUNTS AND PASSES THAT WE
22 OFFER VIA CLIPPER TODAY WILL BE OFFERED TOMORROW, AND ON THE
23 MOBILE APP, AND ONCE WE SEE THE UPTAKE OF THAT APP AND THE USE
24 OF IT, WE'LL THEN DECIDE ABOUT WHETHER TO MAKE THE ADDITIONAL
25 INVESTMENT INTO ACCEPTING CONTACTLESS CREDIT AND DEBIT CARDS



October 9, 2020

1 AT FARE GATES AND ON VEHICLES. I SHOULD SAY THAT THIS APPROACH
2 IS VERY MUCH INFORMED BY WHAT CLIPPER CARD HOLDERS TOLD US
3 THEY WANT TO DO. THEY DEFINITELY TOLD US THAT THEY PREFERRED
4 TO PAY WITH MOBILE THAN TO PAY WITH A CREDIT OR DEBIT CARD. SO
5 WE LISTENED TO THEM AND ARE LOOKING FORWARD TO HOW THEY REACT
6 AT THE LAUNCH OF THE APP. THE SWITCHING GEARS NOW. NEXT SLIDE
7 PLEASE. I THOUGHT I WOULD TOUCH ON A CAMPAIGN THAT IS OUT ON
8 THE STREET TODAY. IT'S A LITTLE -- I HAVE BEEN NOTICING IT'S
9 BEEN STICKING WITH THE SPLIT CLIMATE OF THE TIMES BECAUSE IT'S
10 CALLED MYTHS AND TRUTHS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE KNOW IS
11 THAT PEOPLE WHO USE CLIPPER LOVE IT FOR THE ONE WAY THAT THEY
12 USE IT, BUT THEY OFTEN DON'T KNOW THE SPECTRUM OF BENEFITS THE
13 CARD CAN OFFER. WHEN WE SURVEY TRANSIT RIDERS WE ASK THOSE WHO
14 DO USE CLIPPER -- I'M SORRY -- WE ASKED THOSE WHO DON'T USE
15 CLIPPER AND WHY THEY DO NOT. WE FOUND MISCONCEPTIONS. SOME
16 THINK YOU HAVE TO HAVE A CREDIT CARD TO USE CLIPPER OR
17 TRANSFER CARDS ARE NOT AVAILABLE, AND NONE OF THIS IS TRUE.
18 THIS CAMPAIGN IS TO DISPEL MISCONCEPTIONS AND PROVIDE PEOPLE
19 WITH FACTS ABOUT CLIPPER. AND THERE WILL BE A SEPARATE PUBLIC
20 OUTREACH EFFORT TO TARGET THE LAUNCH OF THE MOBILE APP ONCE WE
21 GET CLOSER TO THE LAUNCH. HERE YOU SEE EXAMPLES OF THIS CAME -
22 - CAMPAIGN. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. YOU CAN SEE THE
23 CAMPAIGN OUT ON THE STREET AS WELL. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
24 FINALLY, I THOUGHT I WOULD JUST TOUCH ON THE KIND OF SOME
25 FUTURE THINKING THAT WE'RE DOING IN-HOUSE HERE ON THE



October 9, 2020

1 OPERATIONS SIDE OF THE HOUSE, WHICH IS, DO CUSTOMERS REALLY
2 WANT TO HAVE THE ABILITY TO PAY FOR MORE GOODS AND SERVICES
3 WITH A CLIPPER CARD BEYOND TRANSIT? THERE IS A LOT OF TALK IN
4 THE TRANSPORTATION INDUSTRY ABOUT MOBILITY AS A SERVICE. THE
5 QUESTION WHETHER WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO EXPAND A PROGRAM LIKE
6 CLIPPER TO PAY FOR THINGS LIKE SCOOTERS AND BIKES AND TMCS. I
7 THINK IN CONCEPT IT'S A LOVELY IDEA AND IN REALITY, THERE IS
8 STILL A LOT OF QUESTIONS THAT WOULD HAVE TO BE ANSWERED. I
9 JUST WANT TO LET YOU THAN WE ARE GIVING THIS SOME THOUGHT. WE
10 DO TOUCH A LOT OF CUSTOMERS THROUGH THE CLIPPER AND THROUGH
11 THE FASTRAK PROGRAMS. AND THAT COULD BE A VERY POWERFUL TOOL,
12 BUT THERE, AGAIN, THE DEVIL IS IN THE DETAILS. A LOT OF
13 QUESTIONS TO BE WORKED OUT THERE. SO OUR GOAL RIGHT NOW IS TO
14 KEEP DOING THE GOOD WORK THAT WE'RE DOING, GET THIS MOBILE APP
15 OUT, SEE HOW THE CUSTOMERS REACT TO THAT AND GO FROM THERE.
16 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO SUM IT UP YOU SHOULD BE PROUD OF
17 CLIPPER. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT SERVICE WE CAN POINT TO THIS
18 PROGRAM AS A REAL ACCOMPLISHMENT. THIS TECHNOLOGY IS IN NEED
19 OF AN UPGRADE AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE GIVING IT TAKING A
20 SUCCESSFUL AGING SYSTEM AND BRINGING IT UP TO DATE SO IT WILL
21 BE FLEXIBLE FOR THE FUTURE. AS YOU CAN SEE IT'S NOT HAPPENING
22 OVERNIGHT BUT THE PROGRESS IS STEADY AND YOU WILL BE ABLE TO
23 SEE INCREMENTAL IMPROVEMENTS OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS BEFORE
24 FULL TRANSITION TO AN ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM THAT WILL OFFER THE
25 GREATEST CONVENIENCE TO OUR CUSTOMERS. WE'RE EXCITED TO BE



October 9, 2020

1 ENGAGED IN THE WORK. THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION. I WOULD BE
2 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

3

4 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

7

8 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** SPERING PLEASE PROCEED.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CAR ON IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION GOING ON WITH
11 AMTRAK OR THE CAPITAL CORRIDOR. WE HAVE A LOT OF COMMUTERS IN
12 SOLANO COUNTY THAT CONNECT TO BART AND GO INTO THE BAY AREA?
13 HAS THERE BEEN DISCUSSIONS WITH AMTRAK?

14

15 **CAROL KEUSTER:** COMMISSIONER SPERING I CAN TELL YOU WE ARE ON
16 THAT QUESTION. AND YOU WILL BE THE FIRST TO GET AN ANSWER TO
17 IT. BUT WE'RE STILL WORKING ON IT. THIS QUESTION WAS RAISED IN
18 A CONVERSATION I HAD WITH DARYL HALLS I HAD YESTERDAY I THINK
19 WE HAVE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ABOUT THE APPROPRIATE EQUIPMENT WE
20 WOULD DEPLOY AND HOW THAT WOULD WORK BUT NOW IS THE TIME TO
21 INITIATE THOSE DISCUSSIONS AND WE'RE DOING THAT. JASON, DO YOU
22 HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD? OKAY.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AND THE LAST THING I WANT TO SAY, FOR ANY OF
25 OUR NEW COMMISSIONERS, WHEN WE LAUNCHED CLIPPER YEARS AGO,



October 9, 2020

1 THERE WAS A LOT OF PUSH BACK FROM THE TRANSIT OPERATORS -- I
2 MEAN, THIS WAS A DIFFICULT HAUL TO GET TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY.
3 TALK ABOUT SUCCESS, AS WE GET PUSH BACK ON MANY OF THE THINGS
4 WE PUT FORWARD TODAY, I WANT TO REMIND THAT THIS IS SOMETHING
5 THAT MTC WAS DEDICATED TO, AND FROM WHERE I SIT AND I'M SURE
6 AMY WILL TELL YOU, WE STAYED THE COURSE, SPENT THE MONEY,
7 EXTREMELY SUCCESSFUL. AND STAFF, JUST A GREAT ACCOMPLISHMENT.
8 SO EVERYBODY SHOULD BE PROUD.

9

10 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ANY REQUESTS? YES, AMY WORTH.

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT TO SECOND SPERING'S
13 COMMENTS ABOUT CLIPPER. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE SO MANY EXAMPLES
14 WHERE THIS HAS BEEN AN INCREDIBLE TOOL FOR OUR RIDERS, ALL
15 AGES, YOU KNOW, I WAS AT A COUNTY CONNECTION MEETING A FEW
16 YEARS AGO AND ONE OF OUR BOARD MEMBERS HELD UP HIS RETIREE
17 CLIPPER CARD AND HE SAID THIS IS THE BEST THING -- HE SAYS
18 THIS IS THE BEST GIFT I GOT FOR MY 61st BIRTHDAY. AND I SEE
19 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE TEARING. I THINK IT'S GREAT. BUT THERE
20 IS REAL OPPORTUNITY FOR YOUTH, GETTING THE YOUTH ON THE CARD.
21 AND YOU KNOW, I KNOW THAT MANY YOUNG PEOPLE AROUND THE BAY
22 AREA ARE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES, AND ONE OF
23 THE BIGGEST THING TO DATE YOU CAN DO IS TO GET ON TRANSIT. SO
24 I THINK THE INNOVATIONS THAT STAFF, THAT YOU HAVE BEEN
25 LEADING, CAROLE WITH REGARDS TO NOT ONLY THE BACK OFFICE



October 9, 2020

1 UPGRADES TO THE CLIPPER SYSTEM, BUT ALSO THE MOBILE APP, I
2 THINK WILL BE PARTICULARLY APPEALING TO THE YOUNG PEOPLE WHO
3 WANT TO USE TRANSIT, AND HAVING THIS MOBILE APP THAT THEY
4 NEVER LOSE THEIR PHONES. THEY NEVER LOSE THEIR PHONES. SO THIS
5 WILL BE -- I THINK THIS WILL BE A GREAT ADDITION TO THE
6 PORTFOLIO OF THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. YOU KNOW, THE OTHER THING TO
7 KEEP IN MIND IS THAT IT'S A SECURE SYSTEM. THAT'S THE
8 ADVANTAGE OF KIND OF HAVING THE CLIPPER CARD, THE CLIPPER
9 PROGRAM. IT'S A SECURE SYSTEM THAT IS IDENTIFIED. I THINK ALSO
10 THE MOBILE APP WILL ENABLE TOURISTS TO USE THE SYSTEM IN A
11 VERY EASY WAY TOO. SO THANK YOU AGAIN.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER VAC -- GIOCAPINI.

14

15 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR ALL THE HARD
16 WORK ON THIS AND FOCUS ON THE INTERACTION BETWEEN THE
17 REGIONAL, THE RTC AND CLIPPER. I KNOW THAT I HAVE EXPRESSED A
18 LOT OF CONCERNS ABOUT HOW THAT HAS BEEN WORKING, AND I
19 APPRECIATE THE WORK IN TRYING TO MAKE IT WORK BETTER, AND I
20 CERTAINLY HOPE THAT YOU WILL ALL, AS IT'S IMPLEMENTED, WORK
21 WITH THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY MAKE SURE THAT IT'S WORKING WITH
22 THEM. THANK YOU.

23

24 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA I SEE --

25



October 9, 2020

1 **CAROL KEUSTER:** COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI I WANT YOU TO KNOW THAT
2 OUR NEXT CHANGE TO THE CLIPPER MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING
3 WILL BE TO NEGOTIATE THE RTC DISCOUNT CARD PROGRAM UNDER THE
4 ADMINISTRATIVE AUSPICE OF THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. SO THESE
5 PROGRAMS ARE HOUSED IN DIFFERENT PLACES BUT THE CLIPPER
6 EXECUTIVE BOARD AGREES AND WELCOMES THE OPPORTUNITY AND THE
7 CHALLENGE OF BRINGING THAT RTC DISCOUNT CARD PROGRAM
8 ADMINISTRATION INTO THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. BECAUSE THEY'RE BOTH
9 REGIONAL PROGRAMS FOR TRANSIT AND TRANSIT RIDERS.

10

11 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** MARTHA, I SEE COMMISSIONER LICCARDO,
14 PEDROZA, MACKENZIE WITH HANDS UP I'M NOT SURE WHO ELSE. DO YOU
15 KNOW THE ORDER?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO IS FIRST.

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. THANKS TO EVERYONE FOR YOUR -- I JUST
20 WANT TO ECHO THE SENTIMENT, I KNOW IT WAS ACKNOWLEDGED IN THE
21 PRESENTATION THAT THERE WAS A DESIRE TO CREATE A SEAMLESS LINK
22 OF PAYMENT WITH ALL BIKESHARE AND SCOOTER AND OTHER PROGRAMS.
23 I KNOW THAT'S A CHALLENGE. I JUST THINK IT'S A CHALLENGE
24 ACTUALLY WORTH DEDICATING OUR RESOURCES TO, SO I HOPE WE WILL
25 GET THERE. THANK YOU.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FOLLOWED BY PEDROZA, THEN MACKENZIE.

3

4 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PEDROZA?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. JUST CONCUR WITH THE
7 COMMENTS THAT MAYOR LICCARDO MENTIONED. I THINK THE MOBILE APP
8 IS GREAT. IT'S ALSO GOING TO GET TIED INTO THE SCOOTER AND
9 BIKE HAVING THE ABILITY TO EXPAND IN THAT. FULLY UNDERSTAND
10 IT'S NOT AN EASY PATH BUT I DEFINITELY THINK IT'S ONE
11 WORTHWHILE ESPECIALLY IN TERMS OF THE COMMENTS MADE EARLIER
12 ABOUT THE YOUNGER RIDERSHIP, I THINK GIVING THEM THAT ABILITY
13 WILL REAP GREAT REWARDS. JUST SOME COMMENTS ALONG THOSE LINES.

14

15 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE?

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES AS A PAST CHAIR OF THE OPERATIONS
18 COMMITTEE, AND I BELIEVE THAT COMMISSIONER WORTH OCCUPIED THAT
19 ROLE, AS WELL, DID YOU NOT?

20

21 **AMY R. WORTH:** I DID. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** ANYWAY. I HAVE VERY FOND MEMORIES OF WORKING
24 WITH STAFF AS WE HAVE ADVANCED THIS PROGRAM, AND I THINK IT
25 WOULD BE VERY APPROPRIATE AT THIS TIME JUST TO THINK A MOMENT



October 9, 2020

1 ON MELANIE AND THE WORK SHE DID WITH THE STAFF. I HAVE VERY
2 FOND MEMORIES OF OUR 9:00 MEETINGS GETTING READY BACK IN THOSE
3 BY GONNA DAYS MEETING FACE-TO-FACE GETTING READY FOR THE
4 AGENDA OF THE FRIDAY MORNING COMMITTEES AND I STILL MISS HER
5 DEARLY. AND IN HER MEMORY, WE SHOULD THINK KINDS THOUGHTS
6 INDEED, AND THAT'S WHAT I HAVE TO SAY. IT'S KIND OF EMOTIONAL,
7 BUT THERE YOU GO.

8

9 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAKE. ANYONE ELSE? I CAN'T
10 TELL IF THERE IS ANY MORE HANDS UP MARTHA.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MORE COMMISSIONERS WITH THEIR
13 HANDS RAISED, HOWEVER THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HANDS RAISED.

15

16 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. CAN YOU PROCEED WITH CALLING
17 UPON THEM.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE THEM?

20

21 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST UP IS ROB THOMAS. GO AHEAD AND
24 UNMUTE YOURSELF. ROB, WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. OH, THEY LOWERED



October 9, 2020

1 THEIR HAND. NEXT UP IS ALETA. ALETA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
2 YOURSELF.
3
4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR DAVE CORTESE AND MEMBERS. ALETA
5 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. GREAT REPORT. I APPRECIATE IT. VERY,
6 VERY IMPORTANT WORK AND THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME TO
7 DISCUSS THIS. I HAVE THE NEW MOBILE APP FROM WASHINGTON, D.C.
8 AND LOS ANGELES, SO THIS WILL GIVE ME A PREVIEW OF WHAT'S
9 COMING. AND THIS WILL BE VERY HELPFUL. AND I DO SUPPORT ADDING
10 OTHER MODES INTO CLIPPER, BECAUSE I HAVE LOTS OF APPS ON MY
11 PHONE. AND IT'S GOOD TO SIMPLIFY THINGS, AND WE GET ECONOMIES
12 OF SCALE WITH OUR BANKING COSTS BY RUNNING MORE DOLLARS
13 THROUGH THE SYSTEM. AND SOME DAY, WE'RE GOING TO GET PAST
14 COVID, AND I APPRECIATE THESE CONTINUING INVESTMENTS BECAUSE
15 WHEN WE GET PAST COVID, WE'RE GOING TO BE READY. THERE IS, AS
16 I HAVE SAID BEFORE, EQUITY IN THIS, AND I HAVE BEEN DOING
17 CLIPPER SINCE 2010, AND I HAVE AN RTC DISCOUNT CARD. AND,
18 AGAIN, I REITERATE, THAT IT'S TIME TO GET AWAY FROM PAPER
19 TICKETS THEY'RE OLDER THAN ME AND I'M AN OLD SOLDIER SHOWING
20 MY AGE. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WORKS FOR YOUNG AND OLD. IT'S
21 SECURE. AND I JUST SAY THIS BECAUSE I WANT TO CONTINUE TO
22 REITERATE THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS PROGRAM, THAT TO ME IS AN
23 ORDINARY USER OF TRANSIT, HAS INDEED BEEN VERY HELPFUL TO ME
24 AND MADE THINGS A LOT EASIER. SO I LOOK FORWARD TO THE



October 9, 2020

1 CONTINUING UPDATES AND GETTING ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM GOING.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP, WE HAVE RICH HEDGES. RICH GO
5 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF AND AFTER RICH IT WILL BE CLIFFORD
6 AND THEN ROLAND.

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** TO SPERING'S COMMENTS, I REMEMBER THE DAYS OF
9 [INDISCERNIBLE] WE GOT BART TO USE IT. WE HAD A DIFFICULT TIME
10 GETTING IT OUT. MY CONCERN TODAY, AND I AM VERY HAPPY WITH
11 CLIPPER. SO I MEAN, NOT RUNNING CLIPPER DOWN, BUT I RECENTLY
12 READ A BOOK, ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE SUPER POWERS CHINA AND
13 SILICON VALLEY BY LEE WHO WAS THE RESEARCH DIRECTOR FOR
14 [INDISCERNIBLE] CHINA. RAISING AN ISSUE ABOUT HOW ARTIFICIAL
15 INTELLIGENCE COLLECTS INFORMATION. AND HE SAID THAT HE HAD
16 SEEN THAT CHINA DID NOT USE CREDIT CARDS, BUT THEY WENT
17 DIRECTLY TO USE OF PHONE FOR PURCHASES ALLOWED THEM TO COLLECT
18 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF PERSONAL INFORMATION FROM CONSUMERS SO
19 I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE TELEPHONE APP WE'RE GOING TO BE USING
20 AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO PROTECT THE PRIVACY OF USERS WHO ARE
21 USING THAT APPLICATION. SO, I WOULD LIKE FOR SOMEBODY TO MAKE
22 ME FEEL LIKE I'M SECURE IN USING IT. AFTER READING THIS BOOK,
23 I HAVE GOTTEN A LITTLE BIT LEERY ABOUT PURCHASES WITH A CELL
24 PHONE. THANK YOU.

25



October 9, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CLIFFORD WALDECK. PLEASE
2 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** OH I WAS GOING TO SPEAK ON SOMETHING ELSE I HEARD
9 HERE BUT I WANT TO SAY AS A TRANSIT USER AROUND THE BAY AREA,
10 I WOULD LIKE TO APPLAUD THE WORK OF THE STAFF, AND THEIR
11 APPROACH TO ROLLING OUT NEW PROGRAMS AND TECHNOLOGIES. AND
12 I'LL TELL YOU WHAT I LOVE ABOUT MY CLIPPER CARD, I JUST LOVE
13 PULLING OUT MY WALLET, NOT EVEN HAVING TO OPEN IT UP, AND JUST
14 GOING ACROSS GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT OR ON BART. I WANT TO THANK
15 ALL OF YOU FOR MAKING LIFE THAT AM EASIER ALONG THE WAY. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT AND LAST SPEAKER I
19 HAVE LOOKS LIKE IT'S ROLAND LEBRUN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. YES. THIS IS ROLAND. A COUPLE OF VERY
22 QUICK COMMENTS, WITH REGARDS TO THE NEW TECHNOLOGY ON THE
23 BUSES, I HOPE THAT THIS TIME IT WILL BE TESTED PROPERLY,
24 WHEREBY PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO TAKE THEIR CLIPPER CARDS OUT OF
25 THEIR WALLETS TO TAG IN, THIS IS WHAT HAPPENED LAST TIME ALL



October 9, 2020

1 THE VTA BUSES WERE WORKING PERFECTLY AND THEN THIS NEW
2 TECHNOLOGY CAME ALONG AND IT DIDN'T WORK ANYMORE. TO HAVE TO
3 TAKE YOUR PAPER CARD OUT OF YOUR WALLET WHILE YOUR SURROUNDED
4 BY HOMELESS PEOPLE IS NOT SAFE. PERIOD. I LOOKED THROUGH THE
5 ENTIRE CONTENTS OF MY WALLET AND MUNI INTRODUCED A NEW CARD
6 WITH NEW CARD READERS AND IF I USED THE OLD CARD IT WORK IT
7 DIDN'T. -- THE OTHER COMMENT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE IS ABOUT A
8 BUS DESIGN WHICH I NOTICED ON ONE OF THE SLIDES, THERE ARE
9 MANY PEOPLE WHO GET KILLED SITTING UNDER A BUS SHELTER WAITING
10 FOR A BUS, WHICH A TRUCK OR A CAR OR WHATEVER FOR WHATEVER
11 REASON WIPES THEM OUT. WHAT I WOULD LIKE THE COMMISSION TO DO
12 IS START WITH ANALYSIS OF THE NUMBER OF FATALITIES THAT HAVE
13 OCCURRED, AND LOOK AT THE DESIGN, POTENTIALLY COME UP WITH A
14 BETTER DESIGN FOR BUS SHELTERS AND THEN COME UP WITH FUNDING.
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
18 HANDS, MR. CHAIR.

19

20 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MARTHA. LET ME JUST
21 ADD A QUICK COMMENT, MYSELF, BEFORE WE DISPENSE WITH THE
22 REPORT. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. AND I JUST WANTED TO
23 DIRECT THIS TO CAROLE AND THERESE AND EVERYONE, AND SOME OF US
24 HAVE BEEN ON THE COMMISSION LONG ENOUGH TO REMEMBER THAT THERE
25 WAS A TIME WHEN THERE WERE PROCUREMENT ISSUES, TECHNOLOGICAL



October 9, 2020

1 ISSUES AND SUCH THAT WERE ALL WORKED OUT WITH THIS, WHICH IS
2 REALLY ONE OF THOSE POSITIVE STORIES YOU DON'T OFTEN HEAR B WE
3 HEAR ABOUT, YOU KNOW, SO MUCH DIFFICULTY AND CHALLENGES, IF
4 NOT BOONDOGGLES AT TIMES AT THE STATE LEVEL OR OTHER LEVELS OF
5 GOVERNMENT IN TERMS OF TECHNOLOGICAL PROCUREMENT, ENDING UP
6 JUST ESSENTIALLY CRASHING AND NOT REALLY CREATING A RETURN ON
7 THE INVESTMENT THAT WAS ORIGINALLY INTENDED. SO, I JUST WANTED
8 TO SAY TO THE TEAM, CONGRATULATIONS ON WORKING OUT ALL THOSE
9 EARLY PROBLEMS, SIMILAR TO, I THINK, SPERING AND OTHERS
10 HARKENING BACK TO THOSE EARLY DAYS. AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU
11 PARTICIPATE IN SYMPOSIUMS OR OTHER KINDS OF SHARING WITH YOUR
12 PEERS IN OTHER AGENCIES, INCLUDING THE STATE, BUT I WOULD HOPE
13 THAT THAT WOULD HAPPEN. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, THERE IS -- THERE
14 HAD TO HAVE BEEN SOME LESSONS LEARNED HERE ON HOW TO VOID A
15 COMPLETE MESS. I MEAN, THIS COULD HAVE REALLY WENT OFF IN A
16 REALLY BAD DIRECTION AT ONE POINT, AND I KNOW THERE ARE
17 SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS HEREOF THIS COMMITTEE THAT WOULD
18 REMEMBER CLEARLY THAT POINT OF DEPARTURE WHERE THINGS QUICKLY
19 GOT BACK ON THE RIGHT TRACK, AND IF THAT COULD HAPPEN MORE
20 OFTEN WITH OTHER GOVERNMENT AGENCIES, YOU KNOW, IT WOULD SAVE
21 THE TAXPAYERS A LOT OF MONEY AND EVERYBODY A LOT OF
22 EMBARRASSMENT. CONGRATULATIONS ON THAT. I KIND OF MAKE THOSE
23 COMMENTS BECAUSE THIS WILL PROBABLY BE ONE OF THE LAST TIME I
24 HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE A COMMENT ON THE CLIPPER CARD AS
25 A COMMISSIONER TERMING OUT SOON. SO I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT



October 9, 2020

1 AND ENCOURAGE, REALLY, SINCERELY, ENCOURAGE WHATEVER MTC CAN
2 DO AS AN ORGANIZATION, TO SHARE THOSE LESSONS LEARNED WITH
3 OTHERS. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, AGAIN IT'S AN INFORMATION ITEM.
4 MY UNDERSTANDING IS WE DON'T NEED A MOTION. WOULD THAT BE
5 CORRECT, MARTHA?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS CORRECT.

8

9 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHTY.

10

11 **AMY R. WORTH:** DAVE?

12

13 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** YES?

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** FORGIVE ME FOR JUMPING IN, BUT I CAN JUST
16 RESPOND TO THE COMMENT THAT YOU MADE? BECAUSE I KNOW CAROLE
17 WOULDN'T DO IT. I JUST WANT YOU TO KNOW THAT CAROLE HAS BEEN A
18 FEATURED SPEAKER IN THE ITS INTERNATIONAL SO SHE HAS BEEN
19 RECOGNIZED AROUND THE WORLD FOR THE WORK THAT SHE AND OUR MTC
20 STAFF HAVE DONE AROUND THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. I THINK YOUR POINT
21 IS VERY WELL TAKEN AND IT SHOWS THE RECOGNITION AND EXCELLENCE
22 THAT HAS BEEN FOUNDATIONAL IN THIS CLIPPER PROGRAM. SO, THANK
23 YOU FOR RAISING THAT POINT SO I COULD REPLY. BECAUSE I THINK
24 WE HAVE GREAT REASON TO BE INCREDIBLY PROUD OF OUR STAFF, AND
25 THE WORK THAT THEY HAVE DONE IN THIS PARTICULAR AREA OF



October 9, 2020

1 INNOVATION AND IMPROVING THE LIVES AND ACCESS TO TRANSIT FOR
2 ALL OF OUR RIDERS AROUND THE BAY.

3

4 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** YES. DEFINITELY A TRUE SUCCESS STORY.
5 THANK YOU AMY. AND AGAIN, ESPECIALLY IF YOU KNEW WHERE IT ALL.
6 [LAUGHTER] IF YOU KNEW ALL THE HISTORY OF IT, EVEN MORE SO.
7 THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON FROM SIX A TO SIX B WHICH IS THE
8 CLIPPER START-UP DATE. AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO TRANSITION
9 OVER TO LYSA HALE PERHAPS.

10

11 **LYSA HALE:** YES COMMISSIONER, LYSA HALE GOOD MORNING TO ALL OF
12 YOU I AM HAPPY TO BE HERE TODAY TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT CLIPPER
13 START. I WANT TO ADD A COMMENT TO THAT LAST ITEM WHICH IS
14 JASON WEINSTEIN AND A NUMBER OF OTHER STAFF MEMBERS ON THE
15 CLIPPER PROGRAM ALL WORK WITH PEER AGENCIES AND INDUSTRY
16 ASSOCIATIONS TO SHARE INFORMATION ABOUT CLIPPER AND ALSO TO
17 LEARN FROM THEM. SO THAT'S A BIG PART OF WHAT WE DO IN TERMS
18 OF INTERACTING WITH OTHER ORGANIZATIONS ABOUT THE CLIPPER
19 PROGRAM. SO I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT BEFORE I GOT STARTED.

20

21 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR DOING THAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **LYSA HALE:** I AM HERE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE CLIPPER START
24 PROGRAM. WE HAVE PRESENTED TO THIS COMMITTEE, IN THE PAST, BUT
25 IT'S BEEN QUITE A WHILE, AND THE BIG NEWS IS SINCE WE WERE



October 9, 2020

1 HERE TO TALK TO YOU, THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM LAUNCHED ON
2 JULY 15TH. IT'S, IF YOU CAN RECALL, IT'S 12 TO 18 MONTH PILOT
3 PROGRAM, AND OUR GOAL IS TO TEST WHETHER A MEANS-BASED PROGRAM
4 CAN IMPROVE TRANSPORTATION AFFORDABILITY AND INCREASE ACCESS
5 TO OPPORTUNITY FOR ADULT TRANSIT RIDERS. SO TO QUALIFY, YOU
6 HAVE TO BE 19 TO 64 AND EARN LESS THAN 200 PERCENT OF THE
7 FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL AND THAT COMES OUT TO ABOUT 52,000 A
8 YEAR FOR A FAMILY OF FOUR. CURRENTLY, FOUR AGENCIES ARE
9 PARTICIPATING, SFMTA, CALTRAIN AND GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT ARE
10 OFFERING A 50 PERCENT DISCOUNT, AND BART IS OFFERING A 20
11 PERCENT DISCOUNT. THE MEMO THAT WE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET
12 CONTAINS NUMBERS AS OF THE END OF AUGUST. BUT I RECENTLY GOT
13 UPDATED NUMBERS THROUGH THE END OF SEPTEMBER AND CAN SHARE
14 THOSE WITH YOU, BECAUSE I'M PRETTY EXCITED ABOUT IT. WE HAVE,
15 TO DATE, RECEIVED 1,679 APPLICATIONS, AND WE HAVE APPROVED
16 1,521 OF THEM. STILL, SAN FRANCISCO ACCOUNTS FOR THE MAJORITY
17 OF APPLICATIONS WITH 69 PERCENT. AND 373 UNIQUE RIDERS HAVE
18 USED THEIR CLIPPER START CARDS THROUGH THE END OF SEPTEMBER.
19 THE BULK OF THOSE TRIPS, 4,007 OUT OF 6,021 WERE TAKEN ON BART
20 REPRESENTING 67 PERCENT OF ALL THE TRIPS TAKEN. WHILE THE
21 ORIGINAL COMMISSION RESOLUTION ESTABLISHED THE FRAMEWORK FOR
22 THE PROGRAM, INCLUDING THE FOUR OPERATORS THAT WOULD
23 PARTICIPATE, WE HAVE NEW INTEREST IN THE PROGRAM. TO DATE, 17
24 ADDITIONAL OPERATORS HAVE INDICATED THAT THEY WANT TO JOIN
25 CLIPPER START, AND \$5 MILLION IN CARES ACT FUNDS HAVE BEEN SET



October 9, 2020

1 ASIDE FOR THAT EXPANSION OF THE PROGRAM. SO WE'RE NOW ACTIVELY
2 WORKING ON EXPANDING THE PROGRAM TO ADD THESE NEW OPERATORS.
3 STAFF WILL BE TAKING A REVISED PROGRAM FRAMEWORK TO THE
4 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE ON OCTOBER 14TH, AND
5 THEN TO THE COMMISSION ON OCTOBER 28TH. OUR PLAN IS TO ADD A
6 SUBSET OF THE OPERATORS TO THE PROGRAM BEFORE THE END OF
7 NOVEMBER WITH THE REMAINDER TO BE ADDED IN EARLY 2021. SO
8 THAT'S MY UPDATE FOR YOU. AND I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
9 QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE ABOUT THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM.

10

11 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU LYSA. QUESTIONS? I DON'T SEE
12 HANDS RAISED FROM MY VIEW S MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY TO BE
13 ACKNOWLEDGED ON THE COMMITTEE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERESE MCMILLAN.

16

17 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THERESE.

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THE CLIPPER START
20 IS ONE REALLY IMPORTANT MANIFESTATION OF THE EQUITY PLATFORM
21 THAT WE HAD BROUGHT FORWARD TO YOU BACK IN, ALMOST A YEAR AGO,
22 WITH THE INTENT OF EVALUATING HOW EQUITY CAN BE INFUSED ACROSS
23 ALL LINES OF MTC BUSINESS. AND, AGAIN, I'M PARTICULARLY
24 EXCITED AND PROUD ABOUT THE WORK THAT'S BEING DONE IN THIS
25 SPACE, AND THE TOUCH THAT IT'S HAVING FOR THOSE IN OUR



October 9, 2020

1 COMMUNITY THAT REALLY NEED, YOU KNOW, ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY TO
2 BE ENHANCED. SO JUST WANTED TO PUT THIS GREAT PROJECT IN THAT
3 CONTEXT AS WELL. THANK YOU.

4

5 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE. ANY OTHER REQUESTS TO
6 BE ACKNOWLEDGED FROM MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? OR OTHER
7 COMMISSIONERS? SEEING NONE. ARE THERE ANY REQUESTS? I DIDN'T
8 SEE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS COME IN ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL. ARE
9 THERE ANY CURRENT REQUESTS TO SPEAK MARTHA?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
12 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. ALETA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
13 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CORTESE AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR
16 THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY GOOD WORK. AND CLIPPER START NOT ONLY
17 MAKES TRANSIT AFFORDABLE, I HAVE AN RTC CARD, AND BELIEVE ME
18 IT MAKES A DIFFERENCE. BUT IT IS A WAY TO HELP PEOPLE IN
19 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN TO GET THESE CLIPPER CARDS. IT
20 SATISFIES A LOT OF MITIGATIONS WHEN IT COMES TO TITLE SIX. SO
21 THIS LEVELS THE PLAYING FIELD BECAUSE NOW PEOPLE WHO ARE OF
22 LOWER INCOME ARE ABLE TO GET THESE CARDS, AND TO BE ABLE TO
23 PUT MONEY ON THEM, AND HAVE THEIR BALANCES -- THEY CAN
24 REGISTER THESE CARDS, WHICH WILL KEEP THEM SAFE BECAUSE WHEN
25 SOMEBODY LOSES PAPER TICKETS OR LOSES MONEY, IT CAN BE -- RUIN



October 9, 2020

1 US, LOSING A PAPER PASS CAN BE LIKE LOSING A 50 OR \$100 BILL.
2 SO I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO MORE AGENCIES BEING INVOLVED WITH
3 THIS, BECAUSE CLIPPER IS REGIONAL, AND THERE ARE MANY PEOPLE,
4 ESPECIALLY OF MODEST MEANS WHO USE MORE THAN ONE SYSTEM OVER
5 THE COURSE OF A DAY. I HAVE OFTEN USED AS MANY AS THREE OR
6 FOUR. SO I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THIS ROLLING OUT ON A REGION
7 WIDE BASIS SO THAT EVERYBODY CAN HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR
8 AFFORDABLE TRANSIT IN THIS NINE COUNTY DISTRICT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.
11 ANYBODY ELSE MARTHA?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
14 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

15

16 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT THEN THAT WAS ALSO AN
17 INFORMATION ITEM. SO WE WILL MOVE ON TO ITEM 6C, WHICH IS A
18 BAY AREA EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC PLAN, AND FOR THAT, JIM
19 MACRAE, I BELIEVE, IS COMING UP?

20

21 **JIM MACCRAE:** YES GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS JIM MACRAE WITH
22 THE EXPRESS LANE TEAM. TODAY I'M GOING TO BE PRESENTING THE
23 FIRST IN A SERIES OF WHITE PAPERS THAT WILL ALL BE ASSEMBLED
24 INTO AN EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC PLAN THAT WE'LL BE COMING BACK
25 IN EARLY 2021 TO PRESENT TO THIS COMMITTEE FOR ADOPTION. MAY I



October 9, 2020

1 ASK THE AV TEAM TO PUT UP THE SLIDE SHOW. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
2 SO THIS PARTICULAR PAPER IS ON MITIGATION STRATEGIES FOR
3 EXPRESS LANES, AND HOW TO ADDRESS POTENTIAL INCREASES IN
4 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AS WE
5 BUILD-OUT THE EXPRESS LANE NETWORK. SO THE PAPER IS REALLY
6 TRYING TO ANSWER THE QUESTION, HOW DO WE FILL IN EXPRESS LANE
7 AND NETWORK GAPS WHILE STILL TRYING TO MEET THE REGION'S
8 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND VMT REDUCTION GOALS? FOR THE
9 FIRST COUPLE OF SLIDES, REALLY TO PROVIDE YOU MORE WITH SOME
10 CONTEXT OF WHERE WE HAVE BEEN WITH OUR STRATEGIC PLAN, AND
11 WHERE WE'RE GOING. SO NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS SLIDE IS
12 DIVIDED INTO THREE TRACKS. THE FIRST TRACK BEGAN IN THE SUMMER
13 OF 2019. AND THAT'S WHERE WE STARTED WORKING WITH OUR EXPRESS
14 LANE PARTNERS IN DEFINING REGIONAL EXPRESS LANE GOALS THAT WE
15 CAN USE TO HELP US IDENTIFY FUNDING FOR PROJECTS COMING UP. SO
16 WHAT WE DID, WE USED THE GOALS TO IDENTIFY PROJECT
17 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SB1 COMPETITIVE GRANTS AND WE ALSO CREATED
18 AN EXPRESS LANE FUNDING PLAN FOR REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDS,
19 AND THESE WERE APPROVED BY THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
20 COMMITTEE IN MAY OF 2020. THAT WAS TRACK ONE. WITH TRACK TWO,
21 WHAT WE STARTED TO DO, LAST YEAR, WAS BEGAN WORKING ON A TEN
22 YEAR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, SORT OF GIVING US A ROADMAP OF THE
23 UPCOMING PROJECTS. BUT AS PLANNED BAY AREA WAS GOING ON, WE
24 STARTED TO SEE THAT OUR WORK WAS OVERLAPPING WITH PLANNED BAY
25 AREA, AND IT BECAME NECESSARY FOR US TO CHANGE OUR FOCUS AND



October 9, 2020

1 START TRYING TO ADDRESS POLICY ISSUES THAT WERE COMING OUT OF
2 THE PLAN, INCLUDING SOME OF THE EXPRESS LANE DEFICIENCIES THAT
3 CAME OUT OF THE PLAN'S ANALYSIS, MOST SPECIFICALLY EQUITY,
4 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, COST EFFECTIVENESS. WE BASICALLY
5 TRANSITIONED OUR TEN YEAR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN TO COME UP WITH
6 A TEN -- I'M SORRY -- A 15 AND 30 YEAR PROJECT LIST THAT THEN
7 WENT INTO THE PLAN. WE HAVE FINISHED TRACK TWO, AND NOW WE'RE
8 ON TO TRACK THREE. AND THAT'S SORT OF WHY I'M HERE TODAY.
9 TRACK THREE IS GETTING BACK TO OUR ORIGINAL STRATEGIC PLAN, WE
10 HAVE IDENTIFIED SIX WHITE PAPERS THAT WE ARE WANTING TO DO FOR
11 THE PLAN. ORIGINALLY, WE HAD A 7TH PAPER ON EQUITY, BUT
12 BECAUSE THE NEEDS WERE RAPIDLY CHANGING ON TRYING TO GET SOME
13 EQUITY RELIEF, WE CONVERTED THE EQUITY PAPER INTO A MEANS-
14 BASED ROLLING PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON THE FIRST SLIDE
15 OUTLINES THE SIX WHITE PAPERS, WE HAVE ONE GHG, EXPRESS BUS,
16 FINANCING STRATEGIES, STRATEGIC FUNDING PRINCIPLES, CONSISTENT
17 OPERATING POLICIES AND 1 ON ALL LANE TOLLING. WE HAVE
18 IDENTIFIED THREE OF THE PAPERS TO PRESENT TO THIS GROUP BASED
19 ON MTC'S EXPRESSED AREAS OF POLICY INTERESTS. SO THE THREE ARE
20 THE VMT PAPER, THE STRATEGIC FUNDING PRINCIPLES PAPER, AND
21 THEN CONSISTENT OPERATIONS POLICIES. ON THE MEANS-BASED
22 TOLLING PILOT, WE HAVE STARTED WORK ON THAT. WE'RE HOPING TO
23 LAUNCH THAT IN ABOUT A YEAR, AND IT WAS GOOD PAIRING. WE'RE
24 USING THE CLIPPER START AS THE MODEL FOR OUR PILOT. I DO HAVE
25 A DISCLAIMER A LOT OF THIS WORK IS BEING DONE BASED ON PRE



October 9, 2020

1 COVID CONDITIONS. WE FEEL IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO PREDICT HOW
2 AND WHEN THE TRAFFIC MAY PICK UP AGAIN AND HOW TRAVEL PATTERNS
3 MAY CHANGE. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT THE LONG-TERM EFFECTS ON TRAVEL
4 BEHAVIOR, AND BECAUSE OF THIS WE'RE STILL GOING TO MOVE
5 FORWARD WITH OUR STRATEGIC PLAN WORK, BUT WE ARE ACKNOWLEDGING
6 COVID AND ITS IMPACTS IN OUR PAPERS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO
7 NOW, WE'RE GETTING INTO THE GHG AND VMT WHITE PAPER. AGAIN, WE
8 HAD THE QUESTION, HOW DO WE FILL IN THE GAPS IN THE EXPRESS
9 LANE NETWORK WHILE STILL MEETING THE REGION'S GREENHOUSE GAS
10 AND VMT REDUCTION GOALS. THE GOALS OF THE PAPER, WE'RE TRYING
11 TO IDENTIFY POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS THAT COULD HELP PROJECTS
12 MITIGATE THEIR IMPACTS FOR GHG AND VMT AND THEN WE FINISH THE
13 PAPER WITH SOME RECOMMENDATIONS THAT MTC AND PARTNER AGENCIES
14 CAN TAKE IN HELPING TO REDUCE GHG REDUCTIONS. THE BASIC
15 ORGANIZATION OF THE PAPER, WE STARTED OUT WITH A BACKGROUND OF
16 THE CHALLENGES OF BUILDING NEW CAPACITY UNDER CLIMATE CHANGE
17 LEGISLATION. WE INCLUDE THE GOALS AND CHALLENGES OF PLANNED
18 BAY AREA 2050, WHERE THE REGION MUST MEET BY 2035, AND MEET 19
19 PERCENT PER CAPITA GHG EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS THEN DISCUSS IDEAS
20 AS THEY RELATE TO 2 SPECIFIC EXPRESS LANE PROJECT TYPES. THE
21 11 IS LANE CONVERSION FROM A GENERAL PURPOSE LANE TO AN
22 EXPRESS LANE AND THEN THE SECOND ONE IS ADDING FREEWAY
23 CAPACITY BY BUILDING NEW LANE CONSTRUCTION. AND THEN WE FINISH
24 IT UP WITH OUR RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS MAP
25 ILLUSTRATES THE CHALLENGE THE REGIONAL NETWORK HAS IN



October 9, 2020

1 DETERMINING WHICH PROJECT TYPE, GP LANE CONVERSION OR NEW
2 CONSTRUCTION, SHOULD BE BUILT WHILE TRYING NOT TO ADVERSELY
3 IMPACT GHG EMISSIONS. SO JUST TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE MAP, THE
4 BLUE LINES ARE EXPECTING OR UNDER CONSTRUCTION EXPRESS LANES,
5 SO NOT REALLY PART OF THE MITIGATION QUESTION. THE PURPLE
6 LINES ARE HOV CONVERSION PROJECTS. SO, AGAIN, THAT'S NOT
7 REALLY WHERE OUR CHOICES ARE, SO IT'S REALLY THE GREEN LINES
8 WHERE WE HAVE THIS CHOICE. WE TRY AND BUILD A PROJECT WHERE
9 WE'RE TAKING A GP LANE OR DO WE BUILD A NEW CONSTRUCTION
10 PROJECT. AND THE TRADEOFFS BETWEEN THE TWO ARE, AS YOU CAN
11 IMAGINE, VERY COMPLEX. BECAUSE SOME PLACES, YOU KNOW, TRYING
12 TO TAKE A GENERAL PURPOSE LANE, COULD RESULT IN PRETTY
13 SIGNIFICANT TRAFFIC CONGESTION UNLESS WE HAVE ROBUST
14 INVESTMENTS AND STRONG ALTERNATIVES TO SO LOW DRIVING IF THOSE
15 ARE IN PLACE. NEW CONSTRUCTION HAS THE ENVIRONMENTAL
16 CHALLENGES AND WITH THE NEW LEGISLATION OF SENATE BILL 743,
17 ALL NEW CONSTRUCTION WILL HAVE TO GO THROUGH VMT IMPACT
18 ANALYSIS AND MITIGATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE IS
19 TRYING TO SHOW THE TRADEOFFS BETWEEN THE TWO PROJECT TYPES.
20 AGAIN, THE LANE CONVERSION HERE IS JUST FOR THE GENERAL
21 PURPOSE LANE CONVERSION PROJECTS. SO THE BENEFITS OF THESE
22 GENERAL PURPOSE LANE CONVERSION PROJECTS, THEY ARE LEAST
23 IMPACTFUL FROM A VMT PERSPECTIVE, USE LEFT DEMAND, THEY
24 CONTINUE TO INCENTIVE HOV AND TRANSIT USE, AND THEY ARE LESS
25 EXPENSIVE, AND HAVE SHORTER CONSTRUCTION DURATIONS. THE BIG



October 9, 2020

1 CHALLENGES FOR THESE, THERE IS A BIG CHALLENGE ON THE
2 LEGISLATIVE FRONT, IT'S, YOU KNOW, IT'S PRETTY AMBIGUOUS ON
3 WHAT IS ALLOWED THERE ARE PROVISIONS IN FEDERAL AND STATE LAW
4 THAT EXPLICITLY PROHIBIT THE CONVERSION OF GENERAL PURPOSE
5 LANE TO A TOLL LANE AND THE EXCEPTION AT FEDERAL LEVEL IS THE
6 VALUE PRICING PROGRAM AS LONG AS THEY HAVE APPROVAL OF
7 SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION AND CALTRANS. FEDERAL AND STATE
8 LAW SEEM TO ALLOW CONVERSION FROM A GENERAL PURPOSE LANE TO AN
9 HOV LANE, AND THEN A PHASE TWO COULD HAPPEN WHERE YOU WOULD
10 THEN CONVERT THE HOV TO AN EXPRESS LANE. THERE IS SOME
11 INDICATION THAT FUTURE FEDERAL REAUTHORIZATION MAY BE MORE
12 PERMISSIVE, AND WE ARE DEFINITELY MONITORING THAT. THE OTHER
13 PART OF A CHALLENGE FOR THE GENERAL PURPOSE LANE CONVERSIONS,
14 IT'S NOT FEASIBLE IN ALL LOCATIONS, CONVERTING A GP LANE TO A
15 MANAGED LANE DOES REDUCE CORRIDORS CARRYING CAPACITY. SOME
16 CORRIDORS CANNOT AFFORD LOSS OF CAPACITY SO MAKING GP
17 CONVERSION SUCCESSFUL IN THOSE CORRIDORS COULD BE VERY
18 CHALLENGING AND YOU WOULD HAVE TO HAVE SOME STRONG INVESTMENT
19 IN SERVICES SUCH AS TRANSIT AND SUPPORTING CARPOOLING. ON THE
20 NEW CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS, THE BENEFITS, IT DOES RESULT IN
21 SHORT-TERM CONGESTION RELIEF. IT MAY BE THE ONLY OPTION TO
22 CLOSE NETWORK GAPS, AND THE DUAL LANE CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS
23 CAN IMPROVE THE OPERATIONS OF EXPRESS LANES AND TRANSIT. AND
24 JUST AS A REMINDER, THE DUAL LANES, THAT'S WHERE THE PROJECT
25 WOULD CONVERT AN HOV LANE INTO AN EXPRESS LANE AS WELL AS ADD



October 9, 2020

1 A LANE WITH NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE MAIN CHALLENGE REALLY IS IT
2 DOES INDUCE DEMAND. SO IT INCREASES VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED,
3 CONGESTION OVER THE LONG HAUL, AND ALSO THEN GREENHOUSE GAS
4 EMISSIONS. ALSO, YOU KNOW, SB 743 WILL REQUIRE VMT IMPACT
5 ANALYSIS AND MITIGATION TO PREVENT THE PROJECT'S ADVERSE
6 EFFECTS. NOW, SOME OF OUR PARTNERS ARE EXPLORING A RANGE OF
7 MITIGATION STRATEGIES, INCLUDING VMT EXCHANGES AND BANKS WHICH
8 ARE BRAND-NEW, AND WE'RE FOLLOWING THOSE AS WELL. AND THIS
9 SORT OF FLOWS RIGHT INTO MY FIRST RECOMMENDATION, SO NEXT
10 SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS LIED REALLY SHOWS HOW MUCH IS GOING ON
11 WITH POTENTIAL REGIONAL MITIGATION SOLUTIONS. SO OUR
12 RECOMMENDATION IS TO PARTICIPATE WITH PARTNERS IN THEIR
13 DEVELOPMENT OF THESE SOLUTIONS, AND ALSO PARTICIPATE IN THE
14 ANALYSIS OF THE SOLUTIONS. I'LL SORT OF TRY TO WALK YOU
15 THROUGH THIS. I'LL START WITH THE LOWER LINE, THE CALTRANS
16 BOX. SO THIS IS WHERE WE NEED TO STAY ENGAGED WITH HOW SB 743
17 WILL BE ROLLED OUT. SB 743 IS A CHANGE TO CEQA THAT REPLACES
18 THE PREVIOUSLY METRICS LIKE SERVICE AND DELAYS WITH HAVING TO
19 SHOT IMPACTS OF VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. SO WHAT WE ARE
20 RECOMMENDING IS THAT WE TRACK THE RESULTS OF THE FIRST VMT
21 IMPACT ANALYSIS, WE PARTICIPATE IN MITIGATION STRATEGIES, AND
22 MAYBE WE CAN EVEN CREATE LIKE A VMT TOOLBOX FOR FUTURE
23 PROJECTS. AS I MENTIONED THERE ARE ALSO NEW MITIGATION
24 STRATEGIES CALLED VMT EXCHANGES AND VMT BANKS, SO WE'RE NOT
25 EXPERTS IN THESE YET, BUT WE'RE TRYING TO LEARN VERY QUICKLY.



October 9, 2020

1 THERE IS A LOT OF NUANCES AND HISTORY RELATED TO CEQA AND A
2 LOT OF ACTIVITY TO ABSORB. CONCEPTS HAVE PREDOMINANTLY BEEN
3 DISCUSSED IN THE HOUSING AND COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT SPHERE.
4 THUS FAR SOME EXAMPLES COULD BE USED AS MODELS FOR
5 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS BUT THESE MAY REQUIRE FURTHER CEQA
6 REVIEW. THESE THINK THESE COULD BE VERY POWERFUL TOOLS,
7 BECAUSE FOR PROJECTS WHERE IT'S NOT FEASIBLE TO ACTUALLY
8 MITIGATE IN OR NEAR THE PROJECT SITE, THESE SOLUTIONS ACTUALLY
9 ALLOW MITIGATION SOLUTIONS TO BE DONE IN ANOTHER PART OF THE
10 REGION. LET ME START WITH THE VMT MITIGATION EXCHANGE THIS IS
11 AGREEMENT TO RETURN A VMT REDUCING PROJECT WHERE THEY CAN
12 PROPOSE A NEW ONE IT'S ESSENTIALLY EXCHANGING VMT INCREASE
13 PROJECT FOR AN EQUAL VMT DECREASE PROJECT THIS COULD ALLOW FOR
14 MITIGATIONS OUTSIDE OF PROJECT AREA, PERHAPS EXPRESS BUS COULD
15 HELP IN THIS EXCHANGE. EXPRESS BUS IS NOT A FULL MITIGATION
16 SOLUTION, BUT IT CAN CERTAINLY HELP. AN EXAMPLE OF THIS IS IN
17 THE FIRST BOX UNDER CONTRA COSTA, AND THEIR INNOVATE 680
18 PROJECT. SO WHAT THEY'RE DOING ON THIS PROJECT RESEMBLES A VMT
19 EXCHANGE. IT'S STILL IN DEVELOPMENT BUT THE CONCEPT PROPOSES
20 TO OFFSET THE VMT EFFECTS OF THE EXPRESS LANE PROJECT VMT
21 REDUCING BENEFITS BY OTHER PROJECTS THAT WOULD BE REALIZED IN
22 THE CORRIDOR. WITH VMT BANKS, IT'S RELATED TO THE EXCHANGE
23 CONCEPT, BUT INSTEAD OF EXCHANGING PROJECTS IT ALLOWS PROJECT
24 TO BUY CREDITS. AND THEN THAT MONEY IS USED BY THE BANK TO
25 HELP SUPPORT OFFSITE MITIGATION PROJECTS. BANKS ARE MORE



October 9, 2020

1 FLEXIBLE IN FACILITATING REGIONAL TRANSFERS BUT THEY DO
2 REQUIRE MORE PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION TO COLLECT FEES AND FUND
3 MITIGATION PROJECTS. SO TO OUR KNOWLEDGE, THERE ARE NO VMT
4 BANK MODELS IN TRANSPORTATION YET. SOME MODELS MAY COME OUT OF
5 THE WORK BEING DONE BY CONTRA COSTA AND ALSO THE SOUTHERN
6 CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS. THAT'S THIS BOTTOM LINE
7 UNDER CONTRA COSTA AND SCAG. BOTH ORGANIZATIONS RECEIVED THE
8 CALTRANS SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES GRANTS, AND THESE GRANTS ARE
9 TO BE USED TO COME UP WITH A MITIGATION, A VMT MITIGATION
10 PROGRAM. SO I DON'T THINK EITHER ORGANIZATION KNOWS YET
11 WHETHER THEY'RE GOING TO DO AN EXCHANGE OR A BANK. AN ALSO
12 POTENTIAL MODEL IS IN THE FAR RIGHT BOX WHICH IS THE REGIONAL
13 ADVANCE MITIGATION PLANNING, OR RAMP WORKING WITH THE COASTAL
14 AGENCY FOR FRAMEWORK AND PROJECTS MITIGATING HABITATS. CHANGE
15 TO BOTH IDEAS ARE UNKNOWN ADMINISTRATION COST AND NEEDS FOR
16 OVERSIGHT, AND ALSO THE COST OF MITIGATION MAY EXCEED THE COST
17 OF THE ACTUAL IMPACT. AND FINALLY WE HAVE THE TWO TOP CENTER
18 BOXES, ALAMEDA VTA AND CCAG, THEY'RE STARTING TO USE VMT
19 MITIGATION TOOLS FOR LAND USE AND WE CAN MONITOR AND LEARN
20 FROM THOSE EFFORTS. NOT ON THE SLIDE, BUT MAYBE A POTENTIAL
21 SOLUTION COULD BE, CAN REGIONAL EXPRESS LANE PARTNERS
22 COLLABORATE ON MITIGATION SOLUTIONS FOR MULTIPLE PROJECTS, SO
23 THAT THEY DON'T HAVE TO MITIGATE THEIR INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS.
24 AND THIS SORT OF REINFORCES THE IDEA OF WORKING AS A REGIONAL
25 EXPRESS LANE NETWORK AS OPPOSED TO INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS. NEXT



October 9, 2020

1 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE IS OUR SECOND RECOMMENDATION, WHICH
2 IS REALLY TO ADVOCATE FOR LEGISLATION. SO IT BASICALLY
3 SUMMARIZES WHAT I STATED EARLIER ABOUT THE LEGAL HURDLES BOTH
4 ON THE FEDERAL AND STATE LEVEL. YOU KNOW, THE FINAL GOAL, OF
5 COURSE, WOULD BE APPROVAL TO BE ABLE TO DO GENERAL PURPOSE
6 LANE CONVERSION PROJECTS. SO WE'RE RECOMMENDING WE LOOK FOR
7 OPPORTUNITIES TO ADVOCATE FOR THIS LEGISLATION. WE KNOW
8 CONVERSIONS ARE GOING TO BE -- THIS TYPE OF CONVERSION IS
9 GOING TO BE CONTROVERSIAL. IT'S FAIR TO ASSUME THERE WILL BE A
10 LOT OF LOCAL PUSH BACK TO ANY PROPOSAL TO TAKE AWAY FREE
11 ACCESS TO AN EXISTING HIGHWAY LANE. REALLY FOR US TO SUCCEED I
12 THINK WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO COMMUNICATE VERY EFFECTIVELY TWO
13 THINGS. FIRST WE'LL HAVE TO COMMUNICATE THE ENVIRONMENTAL
14 BENEFITS OF LANE CONVERSION PROJECTS AND OVERALL EQUITY
15 BENEFITS RESULTING FROM A FULLY CONNECTED NETWORK. AND
16 SECONDLY, I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO UNDERSCORE THE NEGATIVE
17 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS AND SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER COST THAT
18 RESULT FROM COMPLETING THE NETWORK THROUGH HIGHWAY WIDENING.
19 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS OUR THIRD RECOMMENDATION IT
20 BASICALLY IS TO CONSIDER USING EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC FUNDING
21 PRINCIPLES TO ENCOURAGE THE LANE, THE GENERAL PURPOSE LANE
22 CONVERSION PROJECTS. IF THE PROJECTS MAKE SENSE IN THE CONTEXT
23 OF WHERE THEY ARE PROPOSED. SO HAVING FUNDING TIED TO SOME
24 TYPE OF IMPACT ANALYSIS THAT TRIES TO MAKE LANE CONVERSION
25 PROJECTS WORK COULDN'T HELP MAKE SOME OF THE LANE CONVERSION



October 9, 2020

1 PROJECTS A REALITY. WE PRESENTED OUR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE
2 EXECUTIVE STEERING COMMITTEE YESTERDAY, MADE UP OF ALL THE
3 CTAS, AND WE DID HEAR SOME CONCERNS ON THIS PARTICULAR IDEA.
4 THE TWO MAJOR POINTS WERE, NUMBER ONE, NEW CONSTRUCTION
5 PROJECTS THAT CAN MITIGATE THEIR OWN VMT INCREASES SHOULD NOT
6 BE PENALIZED WHEN COMPETING FOR FUNDS. AND THE SECOND THING WE
7 HEARD WAS, IF THE REGION IS BUILDING AN EXPRESS LANE NETWORK,
8 WE NEED TO LOOK AT IT AS A WHOLE AND NOT INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS.
9 THEREFORE, WE SHOULD NOT PUT SO MUCH EMPHASIS ON ENCOURAGING
10 LANE CONVERSION PROJECTS BUT RATHER CONSIDER PRIORITIZING
11 PROJECT TYPES THAT IMPROVE THE EFFICACY OF THE ENTIRE NETWORK,
12 SO ALLOWING FOR BOTH TYPES OF PROJECTS. THERE IS MORE TO
13 DISCUSS, I THINK, ON THIS TOPIC. OUR STRATEGIC FUNDING
14 PRINCIPLES, ON OUR SCHEDULE, IS LINING UP TO BE PRESENTED TO
15 THIS COMMITTEE IN DECEMBER SO WE HAVE MORE OPPORTUNITY TO TALK
16 ABOUT THAT THERE. SO THAT'S THE PRESENTATION. I CAN TAKE ANY
17 QUESTIONS. FROM THE COMMITTEE.

18

19 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERE WAS A THOROUGH
20 PRESENTATION. ANY DISCUSSION OR QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMUNITY.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING.

23

24 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** JIM.

25



October 9, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I HAVE THE SAME QUESTION ON THE CONVERSION.
2 THE ONE THING THEY FIND FOR ME PARTICULARLY IN SOLANO COUNTY,
3 DISTURBING, A LOT OF THIS IS SORT OF ECONOMIC EXERCISE WE
4 DON'T LOOK AT WHAT'S HAPPENING ON THE GROUND WHEN WE LOOK AT
5 SOLANO COUNTY RIGHT NOW WE'RE TRYING TO PUT THE MANAGED LANE
6 IN FROM FAIRFIELD ALL THE WAY UP TO 505. RIGHT NOW, THE BACK
7 UP IS SO BAD ON WEEKENDS, HOLIDAY WEEKENDS, AND WEEKENDS, AND
8 IT'S TRAFFIC THAT WE HAVE NO CONTROL OVER IT BACKS UP TO THE
9 CARQUINEZ BRIDGE SOMETIMES FARTHER THAN THAT AND IT DUMPS ALL
10 THIS TRAFFIC ON OUR ROADS SO ON THE HOLIDAY WEEKENDS TO DRIVE-
11 THRU FAIRFIELD VACAVILLE ALL PACKED JUST TRYING TO GET AROUND.
12 IT DOESN'T -- OUR EXPRESS BUS IS TOTALLY INEFFECTIVE GOING TO
13 SACRAMENTO WE HAVE A LOT OF WORKERS GOING THAT WAY. TALK ABOUT
14 EQUITY, IF YOU WERE TO CONVERT ONE LANE THERE, THE TRAFFIC
15 WOULD BE BACKED UP TO THE BAY BRIDGE. I THINK THAT WE HAVE GOT
16 TO DRILL DOWN ON SOME OF THESE THINGS A LITTLE BIT MORE AND
17 LOOK AT WHAT SOME OF THESE IMPACTS ARE. AND I GUESS, THE OTHER
18 THING, JIM, MAYBE YOU CAN EXPLAIN, WHEN YOU SAY YOU ADD A
19 LANE, ADD TO VMT, IF WE MANAGE THAT LANE, AND SAY IT WAS \$20
20 TO GO TWO MILES VERY FEW PEOPLE ARE GOING TO USE IT WE CAN GET
21 EXPRESS BUS CARPOOLS VAN POOLS ALL THROUGH THAT I'M NOT SURE
22 IF YOU MANAGE THE LANE HOW DOES THIS INCREASE THE VMT. SO I
23 JUST CAUTION THAT, YOU KNOW, WE REALLY HAVE TO SEPARATE WHERE
24 THESE, YOU KNOW, CONVERTED LANES, THERE IS TIMES THAT THAT'S
25 VERY APPROPRIATE. OTHER PLACES, IT'S NOT. AND YOU KNOW, THE



October 9, 2020

1 IMPACT IT'S HAVING ON SOLANO COUNTY, IF YOU CONVERTED ONE OF
2 THOSE LANES IT WOULD BE AN ABSOLUTE TOTAL DISASTER FOR MOVING
3 GOODS AND PEOPLE AND YOU KNOW, THAT WHOLE CORRIDOR WOULD BE
4 ABSOLUTELY CHOKED. SO I JUST HOPE THAT OUR STAFF CAN DRILL
5 DOWN A LITTLE BIT MORE AS WE LOOK AT THESE VARIOUS PROJECTS
6 AND THE IMPACT IT'S HAVING ON THE LOCAL COMMUNITIES. THIS ONE
7 IS JUST KILLING US IN SOLANO COUNTY, AND IT IS CONTRIBUTING TO
8 BAD AIR. I MEAN ALL OF THOSE THINGS THAT COME ALONG WITH
9 TRAFFIC JUST ASSISTING THERE IDLING AND OUR EXPRESS BUS
10 SOMETIMES SITS THERE FOR ANYWHERE FROM 20-45 MINUTES JUST
11 TRYING TO GO SEVERAL MILES. AND THAT'S NOT EFFECTIVE. AND SO,
12 I REALLY HOPE WE CAN SEPARATE, YOU KNOW, THE LANGUAGE WE OUGHT
13 TO BE USING IS CONVERTING LANES WERE FEASIBLE, THERE NEEDS TO
14 BE SOME DEFINITION TO THAT, AND THE PUBLIC IS VERY CONCERNED
15 ABOUT THIS CONVERTING LANES. SO, THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I
16 DIDN'T MEAN TO RAMBLE ON.

17

18 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU JIM. THANK YOU JIM
19 SPERING. I THINK MOST OF THAT WAS COMMENTS. I DON'T KNOW IF
20 MR. MACRAE IF YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO ANY OF IT I'M NOT SURE
21 IT'S NECESSARY.

22

23 **JIM MACCRAE:** I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY I THINK WE'RE ON THE SAME
24 PAGE IN THAT WE'RE ASKING FOR THOROUGH ANALYSIS TO ENSURE THAT
25 THE RIGHT PROJECT TYPE GETS DONE IN THE RIGHT PLACE. BUT ALSO



October 9, 2020

1 REALIZING WE WILL HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER IF WE DO NEED THE
2 CONSTRUCTION WE'LL HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER TO FIND MITIGATION
3 SOLUTIONS. SO, THANK YOU.

4

5 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** I WOULD -- I'M GOING PIPE IN AND SAY I
6 AGREE WITH SPERING THAT IT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLEX THAN WHAT
7 IT LOOKS LIKE, THE LEGISLATION DID IN TERMS OF KIND OF A
8 SIMPLISTIC ONE OFF APPROACH IN TERMS OF VMT. BUT I'M SURE IT
9 WILL BE KEEP EVOLVING, AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT SPERING'S
10 REQUEST IS, IS THAT WE MAKE SURE TO ASSERT THE FACT THAT WHAT
11 HAPPENS WITH THOSE TRAFFIC PATTERNS AS WE MANAGE THE -- AS WE
12 MANAGE THE SYSTEM IS A LITTLE MORE COMPLEX AND IT LOOKS LIKE
13 THEY CONTEMPLATED IN THE BILL. AND I HOPE I DIDN'T
14 MISCHARACTERIZE YOUR COMMENTS SPERING.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** NO MR. CHAIRMAN YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY CORRECT
17 AND IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE TO BE DEVELOPING THIS WHOLE SYSTEM
18 AND DUMPING IT DOWN INTO A CHOKE POINT. IT'S GOING TO BE A
19 DISASTER. WE HAVE TO CONSIDER THAT AS IT GOES. THANK YOU MR.
20 CHAIRMAN FOR CLARIFYING THAT.

21

22 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS IT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ
23 THAT'S NEXT MARTHA?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS CORRECT.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK COMMISSIONER WORTH WAS NEXT.
3 SHE'S BEEN TRYING TO --

4

5 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** I DIDN'T SEE HER HAND UP.

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** SORRY. I HAD TECHNICAL PROBLEMS AT THIS END.
8 IT'S KIND OF FUNNY PEOPLE ASK ME ABOUT THE MAP THAT'S BEHIND
9 ME IT'S PROBABLY A 19th TURN OF THE INDUSTRY MAP OF CONTRA
10 COSTA AND IT'S INTERESTING TO SEE HOW WE'RE STILL USING THESE
11 OLD RAIL LINES. SPERING, I WANT TO CONFER WITH SPERING'S
12 COMMENTS, AND THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY'S COMMENTS BECAUSE
13 THEY'RE REALLY DEALING WITH EACH COUNTY IS DEALING WITH THESE
14 LANES ON THE GROUND, AND I REALLY BELIEVE THAT THE EXPRESS
15 LANES REPRESENTS THE MOST IMPORTANT INVESTMENT THAT WE CAN
16 MAKE MOVING FORWARD EXPANDING OUR TRANSIT NETWORK USING OUR
17 EXPRESS BUSES TO UTILIZE THOSE LANES. WE HAVE GOT TO HAVE THE
18 LANES TO DO THEM, AND SO I AM VERY CONCERNED, AND WE HAD THIS
19 LONG CONVERSATION IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, WHEN WE WERE PUTTING
20 OUR TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, TOGETHER, BECAUSE WE CANNOT HAVE A
21 VIABLE NETWORK WHEN WE HAVE THESE CHOKES POINTS AND WE KNOW
22 THERE ARE THREE KEY CHOKES POINTS THROUGHOUT THE SYSTEM THAT WE
23 HAVE TO CLOSE. WE HAVE TO OPEN UP THESE CHOKES POINTS. AND I --
24 THE OTHER THING FROM AN EQUITY STANDPOINT, I THINK IT'S VERY
25 IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THESE EXPRESS



October 9, 2020

1 LANES A LOT OF THEM EXIST IN AREAS WHERE THERE IS NOT
2 COMPARABLE TRANSIT THAT GOES FROM HOME TO WORK. SO TO FORCE
3 SOMEBODY THAT'S, IN OUR COUNTY, GOING FROM EAST COUNTY DOWN
4 TO, SAY, THE SAN RAHMON VALLEY OR THE TRI-VALLEY FOR A JOB,
5 THERE IS NOT VIABLE TRANSIT TO PROVIDE THOSE SERVICES. SO I
6 REALLY THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO NOT GO IN WITH THE
7 PHILOSOPHY THAT WE'RE JUST GOING TO CHOKE DOWN THESE FREEWAYS
8 AND PEOPLE WILL AUTOMATICALLY GO ON TO TRANSIT. I THINK WE
9 HAVE TO MAKE THE EXPRESS TRANSIT VIABLE, EFFECTIVE, FAST, BUT
10 WE ALSO HAVE TO RECOGNIZE THAT THERE ARE SO MANY PEOPLE THAT
11 HAVE NO CHOICE BUT NEED TO USE THE FREEWAYS IN THEIR
12 AUTOMOBILES. SO, AGAIN, I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO PUT
13 THAT EQUITY LENS ON INVESTMENT. AND I JUST THINK THAT EACH
14 COUNTY IS APPROACHING THIS FROM A VERY CAREFUL, THOUGHTFUL
15 APPROACH, IN TERMS OF THOSE NETWORK THAT, AGAIN, HAS THE
16 POTENTIAL TO REALLY EXPAND OUR TRANSIT IN THE REGION.

17

18 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. NOW,
19 I GUESS WE GO TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, PLEASE.

20

21 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU CHAIR. YOU KNOW, I HAVE SAID
22 THIS MANY TIMES OF THIS COMMISSION BEFORE, BUT I REALLY DO
23 THINK WE NEED TO FOCUS ON ENFORCEMENT AS WELL, THAT WE CAN
24 BUILD-OUT THE MOST BEAUTIFUL EXPRESS LANE NETWORK, AND IF WE
25 CAN'T DO OCCUPANCY ENFORCEMENT, IF WE CAN'T MAKE SURE THAT



October 9, 2020

1 PEOPLE WHO ARE CLAIMING THAT THEY HAVE THREE PEOPLE IN THEIR
2 CAR, ACTUALLY HAVE THREE PEOPLE IN THEIR CAR, IT'S GOING TO BE
3 A COMPLETE WASTE OF MONEY. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET ANY
4 OF THE BENEFITS FOR DRIVERS, FOR, YOU KNOW, FOR TRANSIT, OR
5 FOR ANYTHING. THEY'RE JUST GOING TO GET CHOKED UP LIKE OUR HOV
6 LANES ARE CHOKED UP WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE STEALING THOSE LANES.
7 AND SO I REALLY HOPE THAT WHEN WE THINK ABOUT, YOU KNOW,
8 LEGISLATION AND THE STRATEGIC PLAN, THAT WE HAVE A REALLY
9 ROBUST PLAN FOR AUTOMATED ENFORCEMENT. BECAUSE YOU CAN'T --
10 YOU JUST CANNOT DO -- YOU CANNOT ENFORCE AN EXPRESS LANE
11 NETWORK AROUND THIS REGION THAT IS HUNDREDS OF MILES WITH LIKE
12 A FEW DOZEN CHP OFFICERS ON THE SIDE OF THE ROAD. AND THEY
13 CAN'T -- AND I DID A RIDE ALONG WITH THEM AS I THINK A LOT OF
14 OTHER COMMISSIONERS DID, THEY CAN'T ENFORCE THEM AT NIGHT,
15 BECAUSE THE CHP OFFICER LIKE ALL THE REST OF US CAN'T SEE INTO
16 THE DARK AND CAN'T SEE INTO A CAR'S WINDOW WHEN THE SUN IS NOT
17 OUT. SO HOW CAN WE -- WE CAN'T JUST -- WE CAN'T LIKE HAVE THIS
18 CENTERPIECE OF OUR PLAN TO MANAGE OUR FREEWAYS NOT EVEN BE
19 ENFORCEABLE AT NIGHT. SO I'M -- I DON'T WANT TO BAG ON -- I'M
20 GOING TO KEEP ON BANGING ON ABOUT THIS, AND I REALLY HOPE THAT
21 STAFF TAKES THIS SERIOUSLY, AND INCLUDES THIS. AND THEN THE
22 OTHER THING I WANT TO SAY IS I DON'T DISAGREE WITH SPERING AND
23 COMMISSIONER WORTH AND COMMISSIONER CORTESE ABOUT NEEDING TO
24 TAKE INTO ACCOUNT LOCAL CONTEXT, I THINK THAT'S REALLY
25 IMPORTANT. BUT I'M ALSO ENCOURAGE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO FIND A



October 9, 2020

1 WAY FORWARD WHERE WE CAN DELIVER THIS EXPRESS LANE NETWORK IN
2 A REASONABLE AMOUNT OF TIME. AND IN A WAY THAT'S KIND OF
3 CONSISTENT WITH TRYING TO KIND OF KEEP GREENHOUSE GAS TRYING
4 TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND REDUCE CONGESTION AND
5 YOU KNOW IN SAN FRANCISCO, WE'RE REALLY -- WE WOULD REALLY --
6 WE WANT THE AUTHORITY TO CONVERT, TO DO CONVERSIONS FOR
7 EXPRESS LANES COMING UP INTO THE CITY. AND SO I THINK THAT
8 THERE IS, YOU KNOW, AND I THINK THAT IF WE CAN -- WE REALLY
9 ACKNOWLEDGE THE VALUE OF HAVING A KIND OF INTERSECTED REGIONAL
10 NETWORK AND THE COST OF CONVERSION IS JUST SO MUCH LOWER AND
11 THE SPEED THAT IT TAKES, THE SPEED AT WHICH WE CAN DELIVER
12 THOSE CONVERSIONS, SO WHERE IT MAKES SENSE, WE REALLY SHOULD
13 BE LEANING INTO CONVERSIONS, I THINK, BECAUSE THAT'S HOW WE
14 CAN GET WITHIN ALL OF OUR COLLECTIVE LIFETIMES, THE REGIONAL
15 EXPRESS LANE NETWORK CONNECTED UP TO WHAT WE NEED TAKING INTO
16 ACCOUNT OF COURSE THE LOCAL SITUATION.

17

18 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS.
19 ANYTHING ELSE FROM MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? OR OTHER
20 COMMISSIONERS? SEEING NONE. MARTHA ADO WE HAVE REQUESTS FROM
21 THE PUBLIC TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE DO. FIRST UP IS ALETA DID YOU
24 PRODUCE FOLLOWED BY KEN AND THEN ROLAND. ALETA GO AHEAD AND
25 UNMUTE YOURSELF.



October 9, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR DAVE CORTESE AND MEMBERS. ALETA
3 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND I WOULD
4 LIKE TO SEE WHERE EXPRESS LANES ARE GOING. I'M A USER OF HIGH
5 CAPACITY TRANSPORTATION. AND I KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE TO SIT IN
6 BUSES, IN TRAFFIC. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE WHAT ALL LANE
7 TOLLING LOOKS LIKE, AND IF FEDERAL LAW WILL ALLOW IT, BECAUSE
8 WE HAVE TO PAY FOR ROADS. AND I AM -- I DO HAVE PERSONAL
9 EXPERIENCE WITH CHOKE POINTS. IT IS VERY COMMON ON SUNDAY
10 AFTERNOONS ON INTERSTATE 15 IN NEVADA, WHICH IS THREE LANES IN
11 EACH DIRECTION THAT UPON APPROACHING THE CALIFORNIA LINE,
12 OFTEN HAS BACKUPS AS LONG AS 20 MILES, BECAUSE WHEN WE GET TO
13 CALIFORNIA, THE HIGHWAY NARROWS TO TWO LANES IN EACH
14 DIRECTION. SO, WE MAY HAVE TO ADD SOME LANES, AND HOPEFULLY
15 THAT CAN BE DONE WITHOUT EXCESSIVE TAKING OF PROPERTY. I DON'T
16 WANT US TO HAVE TO SEE A REPLAY OF THE FREEWAY REVOLTS THAT
17 WENT BACK TO THE '60s AND '70s, SO AS A USER OF HIGH CAPACITY
18 TRANSPORTATION, CERTAINLY WE HAVE TO LOOK AT TOLLING AND
19 CASHLESS TOLLING IS COMING INTO ITS OWN I REMEMBER BACKUPS ON
20 THE NEW YORK STATE THOROUGH WAY AT BARRIERS WHERE YOU WOULD
21 HAVE THE TRAFFIC JAMS, CASHLESS TOLLING SHOULD HOPEFULLY MAKE
22 THAT A THING OF THE PAST. SO LET'S CONTINUE THIS WORK, BECAUSE
23 WE JUST WANT TO GET MORE PEOPLE ON TRANSIT, FEWER CARS ON THE
24 ROAD, AND EVERYTHING FLOWING SAFELY AND FREELY. THANK YOU.

25



October 9, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS KEN BUKOWSKI. KEN, GO AHEAD.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME 12347 --

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** FIRST I WANT TO TALK ABOUT EQUITY. TRANSIT WAS
8 SUPPOSED TO BE AFFORDABLE TRANSIT NEEDS TO BE FREE SO
9 EVERYBODY HAS THE RIGHT TO GO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO TO BE
10 PRODUCTIVE. IT'S NOT FAIR TRANSPORTATION IS MAKING PROPERTY
11 OWNERS WEALTHY AT THE EXPENSE OF THE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE THERE
12 IS BILLIONS OF DOLLARS BEING USED TO MAKE PROPERTY MORE
13 VALUABLE AND WE HAVE THIS MEANS-BASED FARE WHICH IS
14 OUTRAGEOUS, UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS ARE NOT GOING TO USE IT,
15 AND I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT EQUITY.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY ROLAND AND AFTER ROLAND, DAVID.
18 ROLAND, GO AHEAD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MR. CHAIR, BEFORE I GET TO THIS, I WANT TO
21 BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION THAT I'M LOOKING AT A BLACK SCREEN
22 WITH A GREEN PHONE IN IT, AND IF PANELISTS ARE ABLE TO SEE
23 EACH OTHER, I THINK IT WOULD BE NICE IF THE SAME FACILITY WAS
24 AVAILABLE TO ATTENDEES. IT WOULD BE NICE TO BE ABLE TO SEE YOU
25 WHILE I ADDRESS YOU. NOW, I REALLY WANT TO SPEAK TO NUMBER



October 9, 2020

1 THREE WHICH THERE WAS DISCUSSION ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
2 AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS ON TUESDAY I WAS INFORMED BY
3 STAFF, THE MTC BOARD HAD APPROVED REDUCING SPEED LIMITS TO 55
4 MILES AN HOUR. AND I WOULD LIKE TO POLITELY PUT IT TO YOU,
5 THAT A 55 MILE AN HOUR EXPRESS LANE SOUNDS LIKE A PERFECT
6 EXAMPLE OF AN OXYMORON. NOW MOVING ON TO DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ'S
7 COMMENT ABOUT MAKING THIS FREEWAY SMARTER, NOT JUST DETECTING,
8 YOU KNOW VEHICULAR OCCUPANCY. A SMART FREEWAY IS ACTUALLY
9 CAPABLE OF DETECTING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS ON THE FLY. AND
10 THE SMART FREEWAY IS ALSO ABLE TO DYNAMICALLY CHANGE SPEED
11 LIMITS ON LANES BASED ON CURRENT TRAFFIC CONDITIONS. AND I'M
12 NOT SEEING THIS ANYWHERE AS PART OF THE PLAN, AND I THINK IT
13 SHOULD BE THERE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LAST SPEAKER IS DAVID. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** COOL. SO MY NAME IS DAVID YING I WANT TO VOICE MY
23 OPPOSITION TO ANYTHING THAT INCREASES OR EXPANDS HIGHWAYS. I
24 THINK THERE IS A PRETTY SOLID BODY OF EVIDENCE THAT SHOWS THAT
25 BUILDING MORE LANES DOES NOT REDUCE TRAFFIC IN THE LONG RUN



October 9, 2020

1 AND I THINK IT'S A REALLY BAD IDEA TO PUT EVEN MORE PULL MONEY
2 INTO SOMETHING THAT DOESN'T EVEN WORK. SO ANYTHING REGARDING
3 LIKE MANAGEMENT OR BETTER USE OF EXISTING LANES WOULD BE
4 GREATLY PREFERRED. THANK YOU.

5

6 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** OKAY. DOES THAT CONCLUDE THE SPEAKERS
7 THEN, MARTHA?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES THAT CONCLUDES THE SPEAKERS.

10

11 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. ANY FINAL COMMENTS FROM
12 MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? IF NONE, AGAIN, THIS WAS AN
13 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. IT'S COMING, THE TOPIC IS COMING BACK
14 AGAIN IN DECEMBER, WE'RE TOLD, AND I THINK THE -- WE WOULD
15 JUST ASK THAT THE COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE, BE TAKEN INTO
16 CONSIDERATION AND PERHAPS RESPONDED TO FURTHER IN DECEMBER.
17 THAT SAID, WE WILL MOVE ON TO GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT, WHICH IS
18 ITEM SEVEN, AND MARTHA BE DO WE HAVE REQUESTS TO SPEAK UNDER
19 ITEM SEVEN?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED AND
22 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

23

24 **DAVID CORTESE, CHAIR:** MOVING TO ITEM EIGHT, ADJOURNMENT TO
25 NEXT MEETING CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR FRIDAY NOVEMBER 6TH,



October 9, 2020

1 2020. THAT'S THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE I'M REFERRING TO. THANK

2 YOU ALL AND WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29



Broadcasting Government