METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 14, 2020, 9:45 AM

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: HELLO EVERYBODY WELCOME TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. I'M CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER AND REQUESTING THAT THE INTRODUCTORY RECORDING BE PLAYED FOR THOSE WHO HAVEN'T SEEN IT. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WOULDN'T WANT TO MISS OUT ON THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE. CAN WE CONFIRM A QUORUM?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I'LL DO THE ROLL CALL. COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

JEANNIE BRUINS: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI? DUTRA-VERNACI?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER? GLOVER IS MOUTHING THAT HE IS HERE. BUT HE IS MUTED. JOSEFOWITZ?

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?

DIR. HILLARY RONEN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF?

LIBBY SCHAAF: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: TAVARES IS ABSENT. AND WORTH?

AMY R. WORTH: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: GREAT. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR ON AGENDA ITEM TWO?

FEDERAL GLOVER: MOVE APPROVAL.

JEANNIE BRUINS: SECOND.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND COMMISSIONER BRUINS. DO I -- WOULD ANYBODY LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE ITEM? DO WE HAVE --

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO RAISED HANDS. AND NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, MR. CHAIR.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: TERRIFIC. GREAT. SO LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: GREAT. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3A MTC RESOLUTION 4439 CLIPPER START PILOT EXPANSION PROJECTS. THIS ITEM PROGRAMS $5 MILLION DOLLARS PROVIDED BY THE CARES ACT FUNDS F OR CLIPPER START COPILOT AGENCIES FY 2021, AND FY 2022. JUDIS SANTOS WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

JUDIS SANTOS: THANK YOU, CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I AM JUDIS SANTOS. PROGRAMMING MANAGER OF EQUITY AND ACCESS AND POLICY AND PROGRAMS SECTION OF MTC. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT TO YOU TODAY ON THE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4439. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR SOMETIME NOW THE COMMISSION HAS ACKNOWLEDGED THAT AS A REGION CAUSE SHOULD NOT BE A BARRIER TO RIDING TRANSIT. DUE TO 2017 REGIONAL BASED STUDY AND POLICY DECISIONS THIS INCLUDED 2018 REGIONAL BASED FRAMEWORK TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE FOR RESIDENTS EARNING A LOW INCOME, MOVING TOWARD A CONSISTENT STANDARD FOR THE DISCOUNTS AND, THREE DEVELOP IMPLEMENTATION OPTIONS THAT ARE FINANCIALLY VIABLE, ADMINISTRATIVELY FEASIBLE. ON JULY 15TH, 2020 THE CLIPPER START PILOT LAUNCHED WITH FOUR PARTICIPATING OPERATORS, BART, CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, HIGHWAY AND TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT, AND THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY. AND ALSO IN JULY, THE COMMISSION DIRECTED 5 MILLION OF THE CORONAVIRUS AID RELIEF AND ECONOMIC SECURITY ACT FUNDS TO SUBSIDIZE AND HELP OFFSET A PORTION OF REVENUE LOSSES TO INCOMING INTERESTED CLIPPER START OPERATORS. TODAY'S ITEM IS TO FURTHER AS MTC EQUITY PLATFORM WOULD TERM FOCUS AND DELIVER UPON EXPANDING THE CLIPPER START PILOT PROGRAM. THE PROPOSED ACTION IS TO PROGRAM APPROXIMATELY 5 MILLION MADE AVAILABLE THROUGH CARES ACT TO COHORT TO TRANSIT OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS MENTIONED EARLIER, THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM AIMS TO INCREASE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE IN POVERTY ENABLING CONNECTIONS TO SERVICES, EMPLOYMENT, AND EDUCATION. THIS MAP ILLUSTRATES THE 17 COHORT TWO, INTERESTED PAY THING TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THEIR SERVICE AREAS ALONG WITH THEIR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. PLEASE NOTE THAT THE PARTICIPATION AND DISCOUNT OFFERINGS, EITHER 20 OR 50 PERCENT OF PENDING THEIR TRANSIT AGENCY FINAL BOARD APPROVALS. FOR THE SOUTH BAY THE SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OFFERS TWO MEANS-BASED DISCOUNT PROGRAMS THAT SERVE THE SAME DEMOGRAPHIC AS CLIPPER START RIDERS. MTC AND VTA STAFF ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TOGETHER TO ANALYZE IF THE PARTICIPATION OF VTA WOULD PROVIDE ADDITIONAL VALUE FOR LOW INCOME VTA RIDERS, AND MAY MODIFY THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM OF PROJECTS BASED ON THE ANALYSIS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TODAY'S ITEM PROPOSES PROGRAMMING 5 MILLION MADE AVAILABLE THROUGH CARES ACT. THE DISTRIBUTION IS DISPLAYED GRAPHICALLY ON THE BOARD CHART ON THE LEFT AND LISTED ON THE RIGHT AMOUNT LISTED UP TO WHICH AMENDMENT WITH REIMBURSEMENT BASED ON ACTUAL CLIPPER START TRIPS TAKEN. OPERATORS WILL BE REIMBURSED HALF OF THE 20 PERCENT DISCOUNT. STAFF PROPOSES TO PROGRAM FUNDS BASED ON PRE COVID ESTIMATED LOW INCOME RIDERSHIP AND FARE REVENUE WITH LOW INCOME RIDERSHIP WEIGHTED MORE HEAVILY AT A 60 PERCENT/40 PERCENT DISTRIBUTION. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS AN INTENTIONAL APPLICATION OF MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM IN THIS ITEM AS WELL AS THROUGHOUT THE PILOT. THROUGH THIS ITEM THE PILLAR LISTENING LEARNING WAS CONDUCT FROM

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

VARIOUS GROUPS FOCUSING ON METRICS AROUND RIDERS EARNING LOW INCOMES FOCUS AND DELIVER WITH ACCELERATE THE IMPLEMENTATION STARTING WITH THE FOUR OPERATORS LAUNCHED IN JULY EXPANDING THE PILOT IN AUGUST AND PROGRAMMING 17 OPERATORS TODAY AND LASTLY TRAINING GROW EVALUATING THE PILOT PERIOD TO HELP ASSESS THE ATTAINMENT OF THE PROGRAMS GOALS EVALUATION AND PUBLIC INFORM PROVIDERS ABOUT THE PUBLIC'S REACH TO INCREASE BENEFIT MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE IN POVERTY, EMPLOYMENT, AND EDUCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN CONCLUSION STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS THE COMMITTEE FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL MTC RESOLUTION 4439 PROGRAMMING 5 MILLION PROVIDED BY CARES ACT FUNDS FOR CLIPPER START PILOT COHORT TWO AGENCIES FOR FISCAL YEARS 2021, AND 2021, AND 2022.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO I HAVE COMMENTS FROM FELLOW COMMISSIONERS? I DON'T SEE ANY.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I DON'T EITHER.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: TERRIFIC. I WANT TO CONGRATULATE MTC AND JUDD AS, YOU ARE, ON THIS PROGRAM. I THINK IT'S TERRIFIC. I THINK IN PARTICULAR, WETA, MARIN TRANSIT AND SMART ARE OFFERING 60 PERCENT DISCOUNTS FOR LOW INCOME RIDERS IS HOPEFULLY GOING TO SET STANDARD AND HOPEFULLY VTA IS FINDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

ITS WAY TO JOIN THE PROGRAM SO WE CAN HAVE LOW INCOME DISCOUNT THROUGHOUT THE REGION. LET'S MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. IT'S GOOD TO BE BACK WITH YOU. I COMMEND TO YOU MAINTAIN THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS PROGRAM. IT IS HELPFUL TO MANY AND HOPEFULLY THE NUMBERS WILL INCREASE. AND THERE ARE MANY, SUCH AS MYSELF, WHO RIDE MORE THAN ONE SYSTEM IN A DAY. SO, THIS WILL HELP US REACH OUT WITH THIS MEANS-BASED DISCOUNTS TO PEOPLE RIDING ADDITIONAL SYSTEMS BESIDES WHAT'S OFTEN KNOWN AS THE BIG FOUR. MANY PEOPLE OF LOWER INCOME OFTEN LIVE LONG DISTANCES FROM THEIR EMPLOYMENT, OR THEIR EDUCATION, AND THE AVERAGE COST OF OWNING AND OPERATING A CAR IN THE UNITED STATES IS ABOUT $700 A MONTH. THAT IS MORE THAN THE $500 A MONTH IT COSTS TO RIDE THE NEW HAVEN LINE FROM NEW HAVEN CONNECTICUT TO GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL IN NEW YORK FOR A MONTH. BECAUSE THERE ARE MANY ESSENTIAL WORKERS THAT ARE LOWER INCOME, THEY NEED TO HAVE ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE TRANSPORTATION THIS WILL ALSO ALLOW PEOPLE TO GET THE CLIPPER CARDS, WHICH WILL HELP WITH OUR TITLE SIX MITIGATION EFFORTS. SO, THIS IS A PROGRAM ROOTED IN EQUITY, BECAUSE REDUCED FARE MUST NEVER MEAN REDUCED SERVICE. I WANT PEOPLE TO GET BACK ON THE BUSES AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

TRAINS, BECAUSE THIS'S THE FINANCIALLY BEST DEAL OUT THERE. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE IS --

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS. RICH HEDGES FOLLOWED BY ROLAND LEBRUN.

RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I LOVE THIS PROGRAM. I WISH IN SOME WAYS IT COULD BE MORE. I UNDERSTAND AND KNOW THAT KANSAS CITY WENT TO ZERO FARES. IT'S A MUCH SMALLER SYSTEM WITH A LOT LESS REACH. I KNOW LA IS CONSIDERING IT. I DON'T THINK IT'S POSSIBLE IN THE BAY AREA, DUE TO THE COST OF RENTING THESE TRANSIT SYSTEMS, BUT CERTAINLY WIDE DISCOUNTS POWER THOSE PEOPLE THAT NEED THE DISCOUNTS, IS AN EXCELLENT PROGRAM, AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY INVOLVED IN THIS, AND ESPECIALLY ALL THE TRANSIT DISTRICTS THAT STOOD UP AND AGREED TO THIS. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. IT'S A SMALL ASK FROM ME. I WOULD REALLY LIKE MTC TO BE INVOLVED WITH, YOU KNOW,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

GOVERNANCE, AT THE VTA, ESPECIALLY IN THEIR PRIORITIZATION OF PROJECTS. I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. RIGHT NOW, THE PLAN IS TO SPEND $200 MILLION A MILE ON BART CONSULTANTS, FOR THE BART EXTENSION. PRETTY MUCH 100 PERCENT OF THAT FUNDING IS COMING STRAIGHT OUT OF OUR STAFF MEASURES. AT THIS POINT, BASICALLY --

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: ROLAND, CAN I ASK YOU TO SPEAK TO THE ITEM, IF POSSIBLE?

SPEAKER: WELL, I'M GETTING THERE. I'M GETTING THERE. LET ME EXPLAIN TO YOU WHAT IS GOING ON. WE HAVE GOT PEOPLE IN NEED, WHERE I LIVE, WHICH IS SOUTH OF SAN JOSE, BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND GILROY, WHO HAVE GOT NO OTHER MEANS OF GETTING TO WORK. THERE IS 600 TO 800 OF THEM LEFT BY THE ROADSIDE EVERY DAY WHICH LEAVES THEM PICKING UP BRICKS AND SMASHING WINDOWS. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO OTHER RAISED HANDS FROM THE PUBLIC.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: OKAY. I THINK COMMISSIONER BRUINS RAISED HER HAND.

JEANNIE BRUINS: FIRST OF ALL I WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT. I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT MTC AND VTA ARE WORKING TOGETHER AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

TAKING A CLOSE LOOK. VTA HAS TWO PROGRAMS AND SUCH, AND THAT IN AND OF ITSELF SHOULD NOT BE THE END OF THE DISCUSSION IT IS REALLY DOING THE ANALYSIS. SO I REALLY DO APPRECIATE THAT TO SEE IF THERE IS SOMETHING THAT MAKES SENSE FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND I WOULD BE PREPARED TO MAKE A MOTION IF THE CHAIR IS READY FOR THAT.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: GREAT. LET'S DO IT.

JEANNIE BRUINS: SO I WILL MOVE REFERRAL OF RESOLUTION 4439 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU SO MUCH. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR: I'LL GO AHEAD AND SECOND IT.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SECONDED BY DUTRA-VERNACI. SEEING NO OTHER HANDS, LET'S HAVE A VOTE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, PUBLIC COMMENT OR OTHER BUSINESS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND I HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: GREAT. SO WE ADJOURN TO THE NEXT MEETING WHICH WILL TAKE PLACE ON THE AFTERNOON OF THE FIRST WEDNESDAY OF NOVEMBER AND NOT THE SECOND NOVEMBER DUE TO THE HOLIDAY AND WILL TAKE PLACE NOVEMBER 4TH AT 1:35 P.M. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.
Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred.This document is provided as a convenience only.

NTT
Broadcasting Government