

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY 1 WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 2020, 9:35 AM 2 3 [MEETING WILL BEGIN SHORTLY] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING 4 5 WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE 6 PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING 7 8 WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME 9 10 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND 11 WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR 12 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS 13 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD 14 15 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL 16 UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE 17 NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE 18 THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION 19 IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS 20 21 BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE 22 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT 23 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN 24 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE 25

September 23, 2020

REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS 1 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE 2 3 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE 4 5 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO 6 7 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE 8 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. I WOULD ASK KIMBERLY 10 11 TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL. 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. HAGGERTY? 13 14 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YES. HERE. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA? 17 18 ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR: HERE. 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN? 21 22 23 SPEAKER: HERE. 24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: BRUINS? 25



JEANNIE BRUINS: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI? SPEAKER: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ? COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? SAM LICCARDO: HERE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: MACKENZIE? JAKE MACKENZIE: I AM PRESENT. CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN? **GINA PAPAN: HERE.** CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT? RONEN? 



```
DIR. HILLARY RONEN: HERE.
1
2
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF? COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? ABSENT.
    SLOCUM?
4
5
6
    WARREN SLOCUM: HERE.
7
8
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING?
9
10
    JAMES P. SPERING: PRESENT.
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: STRACNER? COMMISSIONER STRACNER IS ABSENT.
12
    TAVARES? IS ABSENT. AND WORTH?
13
14
15
    AMY R. WORTH: HERE.
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.
17
18
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ON THE AGENDA TODAY, UNDER
19
    THE CHAIR'S REPORTS ITEM 2A AND 2B BATA RESOLUTION 138 IN
20
21
    APPRECIATION OF THE FORMER CALTRANS DISTRICT DIRECTOR AND
22
    FORMER DISTRICT OR DEPUTY DIRECTOR DAN MCELHANEY AND BATA
    RESOLUTION 139, A APPRECIATION FOR DR. BYRON MARONEY WHO JUST
23
    RETIRED AS CALTRANS CHIEF ENGINEER FOR THE TOLL BRIDGE SEISMIC
24
    SAFETY RETROFIT PROGRAM. AS CHAIR I WOULD LIKE BOTH ITEMS TO
25
```

September 23, 2020

BE CONTINUED TO OUR NEXT MEETING ON OCTOBER 28TH SO MR. 1 MCELHANEY AND MR. MARONEY CAN JOIN US IN ZOOM TO RECEIVE THE 2 3 VIRTUAL APPRECIATION OF THEIR CAREER ACCOMPLISHMENTS TO IMPROVE MOBILITY AND THE SAFETY OF THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF 4 5 CALIFORNIA. EVERYBODY OKAY WITH THAT? GOOD. THANK YOU. 6 7 JAKE MACKENZIE: AYE. 8 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I'M GOING TO ITEM THREE, CONSENT CALENDAR. I'M LOOKING FOR A MOTION. 10 11 JAKE MACKENZIE: SO MOVED, MR. CHAIR. 12 13 JEANNIE BRUINS: SECOND. BRUINS. 14 15 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: SECOND BY BRUINS. I WOULD ASK THE PUBLIC IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS TO RAISE YOUR 17 HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. I SEE NOBODY. 18 WE'LL MOVE TO 4A BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE REPORT. CHAIR WORTH? 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE NEED TO DO A ROLL CALL FOR THE CONSENT 21 22 CALENDAR. 23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I APOLOGIZE. I GOT CARRIED AWAY. 24 25



CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PROBLEM. [ROLL CALL VOTE] 1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. 3 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOVE TO BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIR WORTH. 6 7 8 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. THE BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MET ON SEPTEMBER 9TH, 2020 AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING 9 TO THE AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL. BATA RESOLUTION NUMBERS 52 10 REVISED AND 137, SUPPORT CONVERSION TO ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING 11 AT STATE OWNED BRIDGES AND ALLOW SUSPENSION OF PENALTIES FOR 12 VIOLATION NOTICES ISSUED DURING THE PERIOD WHILE CASH PAYMENT 13 IS NOT AVAILABLE ON THE STATE OWNED BRIDGES THAT STARTED IN 14 MARCH OF 2020. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 52 15 16 REVISED, AND 137. AND I THINK THAT'S -- SORRY. IT SHOULD BE, I MOVE APPROVAL OF BATA RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 52 REVISED AND NUMBER 17 18 137. 19 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. I HAVE A MOTION. 20 21 22 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I'LL GO AHEAD AND SECOND IT. DUTRA-23 VERNACI. 24

September 23, 2020

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. ANYBODY FROM THE 1 PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK. I SEE WE HAVE ONE. FOR THOSE WHO HAVE 2 3 NOT RAISED YOUR HAND USE YOUR RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS BECKELS. PLEASE UNMUTE 6 7 YOURSELF. 8 9 SPEAKER: I APOLOGIZE. ARE WE ON THE HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN ITEM. 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WE'RE ON THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY 11 12 AGENDA. 13 SPEAKER: MY BAD. I WISH TO SPEAK ON THAT. I DECLINE TO SPEAK 14 15 ON THIS. THANK YOU. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT ALETA DUPREE. 17 18 SPEAKER: CHAIR HAGGERTY AND MEMBERS. THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE 19 FOR THE RECORD, AND I DID SEND A LETTER YESTERDAY, AND THANK 20 YOU FOR INCLUDING MY COMMENTS FROM THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE 21 22 MEETING THAT OCCURRED TWO WEEKS AGO. THESE TWO POLICIES HERE 23 ARE ANOTHER STEP IN BEING ABLE TO BRING ABOUT A SAFER, MORE EFFICIENT AND MORE CUSTOMER FRIENDLY BAY AREA BRIDGE NETWORK. 24 AND IT IS THE POLICY CHANGES THAT SET THE STAGE FOR THE WORK 25



THAT IS TO BEGIN AND BUILD ON WHAT WE HAVE BEEN ALREADY DOING. 1 THIS WILL HELP US TO AVOID THE MISTAKES THAT HAVE BEEN MADE ON 2 3 OTHER AGENCIES AND WE HAVE DONE A VERY GOOD JOB AT AVOIDING THE MISTAKES THAT OTHER AGENCIES HAVE MADE. SO THIS WILL HELP 4 5 US TO GO FORWARD IN A MORE EQUITABLE AND USER FRIENDLY WAY. I ASK FOR YOUR YES VOTE ON THESE TWO ITEMS. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. WITH THAT, I WILL NOTE THAT THERE 9 ARE NO MORE PUBLIC SPEAKERS. COULD WE HAVE A ROLL CALL PLEASE? 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. HAGGERTY? 11 12 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YES. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA? 15 16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR: YES. 17 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN? 20 21 SPEAKER: YES. 22 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: BRUINS? 24 JEANNIE BRUINS: AYE. 25



```
2
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY?
3
    DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE.
4
5
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
6
7
8
    CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
9
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ?
10
11
    COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AYE.
12
13
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? MACKENZIE?
14
15
16
    JAKE MACKENZIE: AYE.
17
18
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
19
20
    GINA PAPAN: AYE.
21
22
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?
23
    DIR. HILLARY RONEN: AYE.
24
25
```



CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SLOCUM? 1 2 3 WARREN SLOCUM: AYE. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING? 6 7 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WORTH? 10 AMY R. WORTH: AYE. 11 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOTION PASSES. 14 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ITEM FIVE BATA RECOVERY AD HOC WORKING 15 16 GROUP. REPORT BY CHAIR WORTH. 17 18 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. BATA AD HOC WORKING GROUP 19 HELD OUR FIRST MEETING. MEETING DISCUSSED IMPACTS BRIDGE IMPACTS AS A RESULT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. WE REVIEWED 20 21 CURRENT CONDITION OF THE BATA PROGRAM AND IMPACTS OF COVID-19 22 ON OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROGRAMS. FUTURE MEETINGS WILL BE 23 UTILIZED TO REVIEW THESE PROGRAMS IN DEPTH OUR NEXT MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR MONDAY SEPTEMBER 28TH, 2020 AND THE WORKING 24



GROUP WILL EXPLORE IN DEPTH THE TRAFFIC OPERATIONAL AND 1 CHALLENGES AT AND TO THE BRIDGES. 2 3 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT REPORT. DO WE 4 5 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT. EXCUSE ME -- I 7 8 HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HAVE THEIR HANDS RAISED. 9 10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. SPERING? 11 12 JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN, MAYBE A QUESTION FOR ANDY. IS 13 THERE GOING TO BE ANY IMPACT WITH THIS COMMUTE FROM HOME, THIS 14 15 TELECOMMUTING? DO YOU SEE ANY IMPACT ON THE BRIDGE TOLLS? I 16 MEAN, THEY'RE REALLY TALKING ABOUT A FAIRLY LARGE NUMBER OF THE WORKFORCE DOING THAT. 17 18 ANDREW FREMIER: SPERING, WE DON'T HAVE ANYTHING DIRECT ON IT 19 BUT MY ASSUMPTION IS YES WE'RE GOING TO SEE SIGNIFICANT 20 21 CHANGES TO TRAVEL PATTERNS. WHAT WE NOTICED IS A LOT OF THE AREAS COMING INTO THE CITY, SILICON VALLEY THOSE BRIDGES 22 23 HAVEN'T RECOVERED IN THE NORTHERN AREAS WE SEE CHANGES AND WILL TRY TO MONITOR AS BEST WE CAN. WE DON'T HAVE INDICATION 24 25 ON WHAT IT IS, OBVIOUSLY YET THOUGH.

1

September 23, 2020

2 JAMES P. SPERING: I WAS CONCERNED ABOUT THE FINANCIAL IMPACT 3 ON THE FUNDING OF THE PROJECT, SERVICE, DO YOU SEE ANY NUMBERS THERE? 4 5 ANDREW FREMIER: WE'RE IN DECENT SHAPE. OBVIOUSLY IT LOOKS LIKE 6 RECESSION-TYPE NUMBERS, WHICH ARE NOT POSITIVE, IN TERMS OF 7 8 OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF IN THE PAST, BUT IF CONGESTION COMES BACK WE OBVIOUSLY ARE COLLECTING 9 REVENUE. SO YOU KNOW, RIGHT NOW, THERE IS NO PARTICULAR 10 CONCERN. IT SEEMS TO BE A GOOD ENOUGH PATTERN FOR US. 11 12 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. 13 14 15 THERESE MCMILLAN: COMMISSIONER SPERING, BRIAN MAYHEW IS ALSO 16 PRESENT IN CASE HE WOULD LIKE TO ADD ANY OBSERVATIONS ON THIS 17 TOPIC? 18 BRIAN MAYHEW: JUST TO SAY THAT YOUR LOOKING AT -- RIGHT NOW 19 WE'RE LOOKING AT 80 TO 85 PERCENT MODEL IF ANYTHING. AT SOME 20 21 POINT IN TIME CURRENT EXPENSES, CURRENT REHAB, ANYTHING ELSE. IT DRIVES TOWARD TOLL INCREASE AROUND 27, BEYOND THAT IT 22 ACCELERATED TOLLING INCREASE TO MAINTAIN OPERATIONS IMPROVE 23 THE TRAFFIC AND OF COURSE IT DELAYS IT. BUT EITHER WAY MUCH 24 BELOW THE 80 PERCENT THRESHOLD WHICH IS WHERE WE'RE SITTING AT 25



NOW IT CREATES A RELATIVELY NEAR TERM PROJECT WITHIN THE NEXT 1 FIVE TO -- I WOULD SAY 4 TO 7 YEARS. 2 3 JAMES P. SPERING: OKAY. THANK YOU. 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. ANYBODY ELSE? I SEE NOBODY 6 ELSE WISHING TO SPEAK. SO, WITH THAT, THAT WAS AN 7 8 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. KIMBERLY REAL QUICK, I JUST SCANNED MY E-MAILS, AND I'M NOT FINDING THE CLOSED SESSION. DID EVERYBODY 9 ELSE GET THAT? 10 11 AMY R. WORTH: YES. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I WILL FORWARD THAT TO YOU NOW. 14 15 16 JAKE MACKENZIE: YES. 17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I APOLOGIZE. I CAN'T FIND IT. RIGHT NOW 18 19 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO CLOSED SESSION CONFERENCE WITH OUR LEGAL COUNSEL TO MEET OVER EXISTING LITIGATION. THE AUTHORITY WILL 20 21 MEET IN CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 22 54956.9(A) AND PARAGRAPH (1) OF SUBDIVISION (D) OF GOVERNMENT 23 CODE SECTION 54956.9 TO CONFER WITH COUNSEL REGARDING HOWARD JARVIS TAXPAYERS ASSOCIATION, ET AL., CASE A157598. 24 COMMISSIONERS PLEASE USE THE ZOOM DETAILS PROVIDED BY 25



KIMBERLY. FOR THIS CLOSED SESSION. AT THE END OF CLOSED 1 SESSION PLEASE RETURN TO THIS ZOOM. WITH THAT, WE WILL LEAVE 2 3 THIS ZOOM TO THE CLOSED SESSION. [CLOSED SESSION] 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I ALWAYS TRY TO BE THE FIRST ONE BACK AND I NEVER GET THERE. WE ARE BACK FROM CLOSED SESSION. I 6 7 WOULD ASK COUNSEL TO GO OVER THE CLOSED SESSION. 8 ADRIENNE WEIL, COUNSEL: THANK YOU CHAIR HAGGERTY. BATA BOARD 9 MET IN CLOSED SESSION UNDER THE ITEM INDICATED IN THE AGENDA, 10 IS THERE WAS NO REPORTABLE ACTION. 11 12 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM SEVEN. 13 PUBLIC COMMENT I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED 14 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM AT INFO 15 16 BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 O'CLOCK, INTO THE RECORD, I WILL ASK IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT RELATED TO THE AGENDA IF 17 YOU TO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL 18 CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE WAS ONE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT 21 22 SUBMITTED BY ALETA DUPREE. THAT WILL BE POSTED ONLINE. THERE 23 ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT MEETING IS 1 SCHEDULED FOR OCTOBER 28TH, 2020 AT 375 BEALE STREET OR 2 3 REMOTELY AND BY WEBCAST AS SCHEDULED. ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED] 4 5 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION [MEETING WILL BEGIN SHORTLY] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A 6 ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S 7 8 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REOUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB 9 10 SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND 11 RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS 12 PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED 13 ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. 14 15 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, 16 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. 17 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR 18 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC 19 SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING 20 21 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING 22 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE 23 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT 24 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN 25

September 23, 2020

CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE 1 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS 2 3 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL 4 5 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO 6 7 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO 8 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE 9 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. 10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. KIMBERLY COULD WE PLEASE 11 MOVE TO THE ROLL CALL? 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. HAGGERTY. 14 15 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: HERE. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA? 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN? 23 24 SPEAKER: HERE. 25



```
1
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: BRUINS?
2
3
    JEANNIE BRUINS: PRESENT.
4
5
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY?
6
7
    DAMON CONNOLLY: HERE.
8
9
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CORTESE?
10
11
    DAVID CORTESE: HERE.
12
13
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
14
15
    CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIOCAPINI?
17
18
19
    DORENE M. GIACOPINI: PRESENT.
20
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
21
22
23
    FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
24
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ?
25
```



```
1
2
    COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE.
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO? IS
4
5
    ABSENT. MACKENZIE?
6
7
    JAKE MACKENZIE: PRESENT.
8
9
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN IS ABSENT.
10
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT?
12
13
    DAVID RABBIT: HERE.
14
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?
15
16
    GINA PAPAN: I'M HERE. SORRY. TRYING TO UNMUTE.
17
18
19
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. RONEN IS PRESENT. SCHAFF?
20
    LIBBY SCHAFF: HERE.
21
22
23
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: SLOCUM? COMMISSIONER SLOCUM IS ABSENT.
24
    SPERING?
25
```



```
1
    JAMES P. SPERING: PRESENT.
2
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: STRACNER? COMMISSIONER STRACNER
3
    SUPERINTENDENT. HE'S HAVING MICROPHONE DIFFICULTIES. TAVARES
4
5
    IS ABSENT.
6
7
   AMY R. WORTH: WORTH HERE.
8
9
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: QUORUM IS PRESENT.
10
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ITEM CHAIR'S REPORT AUTHORIZED AS CHAIR
11
    FOR SELECTION OF APPOINTMENT TO GENERAL COUNSEL WE HAVE
12
    REACHED TERMS ON EMPLOYMENT AND MOVED CONTRACT TO THE
13
    COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL I MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE
14
    CONTRACT WITH KATHLEEN CAIN FOR MTC GENERAL COUNSEL.
15
16
    AMY R. WORTH: MOVE APPROVAL.
17
18
19
    SPEAKER: SECOND.
20
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WAS THE SECOND SPERING?
21
22
23
    JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
24
```



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WORTH SECOND BY 1 SPERING ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NO RAISED HANDS AND NO 4 5 PUBLIC COMMENTER IF ITEM. 6 7 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? I 8 SEE NOBODY. STILL NOBODY. SO WITH THAT I'M GOING TO CALL FOR A 9 ROLL CALL VOTE. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HAGGERTY? 12 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YES. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA? COMMISSIONER PEDROZA? ABSENT. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN? 17 18 19 SPEAKER: AYE. 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: BRUINS? 21 22 23 JEANNIE BRUINS: AYE. 24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CONNOLY. 25



```
1
2
    DAMON CONNOLLY: AYE.
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CORTESE?
4
5
    DAVID CORTESE: AYE.
6
7
8
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
9
    CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
10
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
12
13
    FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
14
15
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ?
17
18
    COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AYE.
19
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.
20
21
    MACKENZIE?
22
23
    JAKE MACKENZIE: AYE.
24
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
25
```



GINA PAPAN: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT? DAVID RABBIT: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN? DIR. HILLARY RONEN: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF? **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SLOCUM? WARREN SLOCUM: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING? JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. CLERK OF THE BOARD: WORTH? 



1	AMY	R.	WORTH:	AYE.
---	-----	----	--------	------

3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

4

2

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: EXCITING TIMES. ITEM THREE POLICY
ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT RANDI KINMAN. ARE YOU ON? THERE YOU
ARE.

8

RANDI KINMAN: I'M GOING TO RUN THROUGH COMMENTS ON THE BLUE 9 RIBBON TASK FORCE AS WELL, BECAUSE I HAVE TO BUG OUT A LITTLE 10 EARLY TODAY. RELATED TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE COMMENTS 11 THAT WE HAVE COLLECTED ALONG THE LAST MONTH IS WE STILL WANT 12 TO SEE AN OUTWARD FACING PORTAL ON MTC WARDING ON WHAT 13 AGENCIES ARE DOING AND WHAT THEIR SPECIFIC PROTOCOLS ARE OR 14 15 HOW THEY'RE PERFORMING THEIR SPECIFIC GOALS. WHILE THE 16 DASHBOARD IS IN BETA PHASE RIGHT NOW CAN WE PLEASE PROVIDE A ONE STOP SHOP TO LINKS TO OTHER AGENCIES BECAUSE MANY OF US 17 USE MULTIPLE AGENCIES IN OUR TRAVELS WE ALSO HAVE CONTINUED 18 CONCERN FOR AGENCIES NOT HAVING EMERGENCY MASK SUPPLIES ON 19 BOARD IF YOU GO AND YOUR MASK IS BROKEN OR DAMAGED THEY 20 GENERALLY HAVE REPLACEMENT FOR YOU AND THAT WOULD BE 21 22 BENEFICIAL FOR BOTH DRIVERS AND RIDERS. WE ALSO HAVE VERY 23 STRONG FEELINGS ABOUT THE CONSOLIDATION OF AGENCIES GOING FORWARD, IN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE PROCESS. WE ALSO 24 SUPPORTED THAT, WE ADOPT TO KEEP IN MIND PARATRANSIT AS PART 25

OF THAT EOUATION, AND WE MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT THE 1 CONSOLIDATION OF PARATRANSIT DELIVERY SYSTEMS WITHIN SMALLER 2 3 REGIONS. BUT ANYTHING MTC CAN DO TO CONSOLIDATE SOME OF THESE AGENCIES WOULD BE SOMETHING WE WOULD CARRY PICKET SIGNS FOR. 4 5 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE WILL HOLD ITS SECOND 6 MEETING THIS WEEK. EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MET THIS 7 8 WEEK AND REVIEWED TITLE SIX REPORT AND ASKED STAFF TO RETURN NEXT MONTH TO ADDRESS THINGS WE DIDN'T GET TO THIS MONTH. WE 9 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT MTC AND CLIPPER KEEP IN MIND THE 10 DIFFICULTY THAT LOW INCOME HOMELESS AND UNBANKED RIDERS HAVE 11 IN RELOADING ANY CLIPPER CARD WITHOUT THE ABILITY TO DO IT 12 WITH CASH. THERE ARE MANY CASH ONLY RIDERS WHO CANNOT REACH 13 KIOSKS AND OUR CURRENT REACH OUT SYSTEM IS PRETTY SLIM. 14 15 COUNCIL MET THIS MONTH REVIEWING AND DISCUSSING PLANNED BAY 16 AREA 2050. WE HAVE ALSO SKETCHED OUT OUR WORK PLAN FOR THE NEXT YEAR PER THE RESOLUTION THAT ALLOWS US TO OPERATE. 17 RESOLUTION ALSO SAYS WE'RE SUPPOSED TO HOLD A YEARLY MEETING 18 WITH THE COMMISSION, WHICH WOULD BE THE ENTIRE COMMISSION AND 19 THE ENTIRE COUNCIL AND I DON'T SEE OBVIOUSLY ANY WAY OF DOING 20 21 THAT IN THE NEAR FUTURE. SO MY SUGGESTION IS THAT WE EITHER 22 SUBMIT IT IN WRITING OR THAT I HAVE A MEETING WITH VICE CHAIR 23 PEDROZA WHO WILL INHERIT THE YEAR LONG PLAN. AND THAT'S MY 24 REPORT.

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

September 23, 2020

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. YOU CAN GO AHEAD AND MEET 1 2 WITH VICE CHAIR PEDROZA. SO, ANYBODY HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THE 3 REPORT? I SEE NONE. THANK YOU RANDI. I'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE FORWARD THEN. MOVE TO ITEM 4A. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MR. CHAIR, THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE 6 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I DIDN'T RECEIVE ANY 7 8 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS. 9 10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: SORRY. YEAH. I MISSED THAT. I APOLOGIZE. GO AHEAD. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PROBLEM. THAT PERSON IS RICH HEDGES. 13 14 MR. HEDGES? 15 16 RICHARD HEDGES: YES. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SPEAK. I WANT TO ADD THAT I HAD REACHED OUT, BASED ON SOME OF THE REPORTS, TO 17 THE HEAD OF AT LEAST ONE OF THE AT UNITS AND HE'S TELLING ME 18 BASED ON DRIVER SENTIMENT THAT THEY REALLY PERFECT TO HAVE 19 REAR-DOOR BOARDING. AND THEY HAVE GENERALLY FRIGHTENED ABOUT 20 21 TELLING PEOPLE THEY HAVE TO HAVE MASKS CONCERN OF BEING 22 ASSAULTED AND OF COURSE REAR BOARDING LEAVES A PROBLEM WITH PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES OR WHEELCHAIRS BECAUSE THE FRONT OF 23 MOST BUSES ARE LOWERS TO ALLOW THEM EASIER ACCESS. THERE IS 24 GENERAL CONCERN ABOUT PEOPLE NOT WEARING MASKS. ABOUT THE 25

September 23, 2020

THREE-FOOT DISTANCING, AND ABOUT FRONT BOARDING AND ABOUT
 ASSAULTS. SO, THOSE ARE THEIR MAJOR CONCERNS, AND THEY DID NOT
 THINK, AT LEAST TO THIS ONE AGENCY THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
 FORCE HAD ADDRESSED THOSE. SO THANK YOU.

5

6 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. I SEE NO
7 OTHER ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HANDS UP. I'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO
8 4A THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

9

THERESE MCMILLAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING 10 COMMISSIONERS. THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. WE HAD 11 POSTED MY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. I KNOW WE HAVE A LOT 12 AHEAD OF US. SO I JUST WANT TO POINT TO THREE THINGS. AND THE 13 THIRD WILL BE AS RANDI KINMAN HAD REFERENCED, THE REPORT-OUT 14 15 ON THE BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN AND DASHBOARD. IN ADDITION THAT, THOUGH, I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE THE 16 RETIREMENT OF LAURA THOMPSON. LAURA STARTED WITH ABAG IN 17 SEPTEMBER OF 1999, AND WITH MTC AS ASSISTANT DIRECTOR IN THE 18 PLANNING SECTION ON JULY 1ST, 2017 AS PART OF THE STAFF 19 CONSOLIDATION. LAURA OVERSAW THE -- OVERSEES UNTIL SHE LEAVES 20 21 US TO GO TO SCOTLAND, THE BAY TRAIL, WHICH IS A SIGNATURE HIGH PROFILE INVESTMENT. AND IN FACT, AN AMAZING RESOURCE FOR THIS 22 REGION. AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, BECAUSE HER TENURE HAD 23 BEEN SO LONG, DIRECT WORKING WITH THAT AGENCY, GAVE HER A 24 LOVELY RESOLUTION LAST MONTH AT THE EXECUTIVE BOARDS. WE WANT 25

September 23, 2020

TO WISH HER WELL. AND, YOU KNOW, SHE IS SETUP HER TEAM TO 1 CONTINUE TO PROVIDE THE BAY TRAILS DEVELOPMENT AND WE LOOK 2 3 FORWARD TO THAT AS PART OF HER LEGACY. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION 4 5 CERTIFICATION REPORT HAD BEEN CONDUCTED THIS YEAR BY FHWA AND FTA, AND WE RECEIVED THE FINAL REPORT, AS PINT OF -- THIS IS 6 AN IMPORTANT CERTIFICATION FOR MTC'S PLANNING PROCESS THAT'S 7 8 DONE EVERY FOUR YEARS. WE RECEIVED A NUMBER COMMENDATIONS FOR OUR PROCESSES, HOWEVER THERE WAS ONE CORRECTED ACTION TO 9 IMPROVE ADMINISTRATION OF OUR SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK 10 GRANT PROGRAM AND MITIGATION AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM 11 THIS IS CLONE COLLECTIVELY IN OUR ADMINISTRATION AS OUR ONE 12 BAY AREA GRANT OR OBAG. CONCERN HAD TO DO WITH OUR PRACTICE ON 13 USING A FORMULA FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF STP FUNDS AS PART OF 14 THE OBAG'S PERSPECTIVE AND WFA WAS THAT FEDERAL ALLOCATION IN 15 16 PLANNING LAW WOULD NOT ALLOW THAT. SHORT OF IT MOVING FORWARD, WE WILL NEED TO KIM HOW THESE PROGRAM FUNDS ARE ADDRESSED AND 17 18 ENSURING WE'RE COMPLYING WITH THE CORRECTIVE ACTION AND OBVIOUSLY ANY REQUIREMENTS GOING FORWARD, AND WE WILL REPORT 19 TO THE COMMISSION ON THAT AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WITH THAT, 20 21 WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS TURN TO THE PRESENTATION THAT IS 22 HERE, ASK THE TEAM TO BRING THAT IT UP UNDER MY EXECUTIVE 23 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. OKAY.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THERESE MCMILLAN: THERESE, I AM SO SORRY. FOLLOWING THE 1 2 COMMISSION'S DIRECTION, AND INFORMED -- EXCUSE ME -- DID OUR -3 - DID THE PRESENTATION -- HOLD ON. I'M SORRY. I NEED TO JUST GET THE PRESENTATION BACK UP ON MY COMPUTER. JUST A SECOND. 4 5 OKAY. NOW WE'RE SETUP. AND I AM NOT MUTED SO HERE WE GO. FOLLOWING THE RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT 6 RECOVERY TASK FORCE, THE COMMISSION HAD DIRECTED MTC STAFF TO 7 8 PROVIDE A MONTHLY REPORT OF DATA THAT WOULD BE TRACKED ON THAT DASHBOARD. DASHBOARD DEVELOPED AND MAINTAINED BY THE BAY 9 AREA'S PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES. PUBLIC HEALTH METRICS ARE 10 DRAWN FROM THE LARGER WRITING BAY AREA TRANSIT HEALTH PLAN 11 THAT WAS PRESENTED TO THE OPERATOR IN AUGUST. THIS WILL BE THE 12 FIRST REPORT THAT WE'LL BE MAKING AND IT WILL BE A BIT LONGER 13 BECAUSE IT WILL CONTAIN A DESCRIPTION OF THE DASHBOARD 14 DEVELOPMENT AND STRUCTURE. FROM THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC, THE 15 16 BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES HAD UNITED AROUND A COMMON GOAL TO IMPLEMENT MEASURES FOR A SAFE RIDE FOR THE PUBLIC AS OUR 17 REGION RESPONDS TO THE CONTINUING COVID-19 PANDEMIC. TIMELINE 18 19 THAT'S ILLUSTRATED HERE OUTLINED KRON LOGICALLY THE TRANSIT AGENCY' OWNERSHIP AND COLLABORATION BEGINNING LATE JUNE AND 20 21 AUGUST TO DEVELOP PUBLISHING RIDING TOGETHER THE BAY AREA 22 HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN. AS A REMINDER, THAT WAS, AGAIN, RELEASED IN AUGUST, AND INCLUDES COMMITMENTS AND BEST PRACTICES TO 23 ALIGN WITH INDUSTRY, STATE, AND FEDERAL GUIDELINES FOR 24 FREQUENT CLEANING, PERSONAL PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT, FACE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COVERINGS, SOCIAL DISTANCING, VENTILATION, AND TOUCHLESS FARES 1 AROUND OTHER PUBLIC HEALTH METRICS. AT THE AUGUST BLUE RIBBON 2 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETING, THE AGENCIES DID COMMIT 3 TO REGULAR REPORTING ABOUT THIS PLAN VIA A PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE 4 5 DASHBOARD. TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ESTABLISHED AS OF TODAY, A MICRO-SITE, THEY HAVE BEEN COLLECTING DATA AND ARE PASSING 6 RESOLUTIONS IMPLEMENTING THE HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN, WHICH 7 8 INCLUDES PARTICIPATION IN THIS DASHBOARD. AND THE TIMELINE ALSO SHOWS THAT THERE IS A GOING FORWARD INTENT TO MONITOR 9 REPORT AND MODIFY THE PLAN AS CONDITIONS MAY CHANGE DURING THE 10 PANDEMIC. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS FOCUSES QUICKLY ON 11 DASHBOARD FEATURES. DASHBOARD IS DESIGNED TO BE A SIMPLE EASY 12 TO USE AND UNDERSTANDABLE PLATFORM. IT FEATURES INTUITIVE 13 NAVIGATION AND WILL BE USABLE ON ANY DEVICE. AGENCIES WILL BE 14 GIVEN A STAR RATING OF 1 TO 5 FOR EACH OF THE METRICS THAT ARE 15 16 TRACKED ACROSS THEM ALL AND THAT WILL BE ILLUSTRATED IN AN UPCOMING SLIDE. DASHBOARD WILL PROVIDE DEFINITIONS OF EACH OF 17 THE METRICS, A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE AGENCY'S METHODOLOGIES 18 19 OF UTILIZING DATA AND VISUAL OBSERVATIONS TO OBTAIN IT AND THE RATINGS EACH AGENCY RECEIVES FOR THE REPORTING PERIOD. VERY 20 21 IMPORTANTLY, AS INDICATED IN THE FOURTH BULLET, EACH AGENCY'S 22 DATA RESULTS DISPLAY WILL ALSO INCLUDE A LINK TO THE RESPECTIVE AGENCY'S COVID-19 PAGE. THAT INCLUDES INDIVIDUAL 23 WORK AND EFFORTS THAT THE AGENCY IS DOING TO KEEP PASSENGERS 24 AND THEIR EMPLOYEES SAFE. SUPPLEMENTING THE SHARED METRICS 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

BEING TRACKED ACROSS THE AGENCIES. MTC STAFF WILL ALSO PUT 1 THESE LINKS ON OUR WEB SITE. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS 2 3 SLIDE, AGAIN, BRIEFLY INTRODUCE WHERE WE ARE A BETA WEB PAGE THROUGH THE 17th FOR THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES 21 OF THE 25 4 5 THAT ARE PARTICIPATING. ALL AGENCIES ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TO OPERATIONALIZE DATA COLLECTION AND WILL REPORT THE DATA EACH 6 MONTH BASED ON A 30 DAY PERIOD. FOR EXAMPLE, SEPTEMBER 10TH 7 8 THROUGH OCTOBER 9TH. BETA DASHBOARD WILL BE LIVE. HOWEVER, TO THE PUBLIC ON SEPTEMBER 28TH, AN ACCEPTABLE, FROM 9 10 HEALTHYTRANSITPLAN, ALL ONE WORD.COM. NEXT SLIDE. REPORTS METRICS THAT WILL BE INCLUDED IN THE DASHBOARD INCLUDE FOUR 11 ESSENTIAL AND USEFUL MEASURES TO MONITOR HOW THE AGENCIES ARE 12 DOING AND INCLUDES TWO FOR PASSENGER FACING METRICS AND TWO 13 FOR EMPLOYEE FACING METRICS. PROPERLY WORN FACE COVERINGS ARE 14 15 MONITORED FOR BOTH CUSTOMERS AND EMPLOYEES. VEHICLE CAPACITY 16 TO ALLOW FOR A SIX FOOT SOCIAL DISTANCING IS MONITORS AND MASHED -- MEASURED AS ONE OF THE METRICS AND CONTACT TRACING 17 IS EMPLOYED FOR RELATED MEASURES. THERE HAS BEEN MASS 18 DISTRIBUTION AS WAS MENTIONED BY RANDI KINMAN AND OTHERS, 19 WHICH WERE NOT TRACKED AS METRICS ON THE DASHBOARD BUT THE 20 TRANSIT AGENCIES PROVIDED THIS UPDATED INFORMATION. PERSONAL 21 22 PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT, PPE, IS PROVIDED FOR ALL WORKPLACE 23 SETTINGS, MAINTAINED BY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. SOME JOB CATEGORIES MAY REQUIRE DIFFERENT PPE THAN OTHER JOB CATEGORIES 24 AND THE AGENCIES ARE RESPONDING TO THAT WITH JOB HAZARD 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ANALYSIS TO DETERMINE SPECIFIC HAZARDS OR EXPOSURE 1 POSSIBILITIES, AND BASE THEIR PPE ALLOCATION TO THEIR 2 3 EMPLOYEES ON THAT ASSESSMENT. CURRENTLY, MASKS ARE PROVIDED TO RIDERS BY MANY TRANSIT AGENCIES, INCLUDING -- THIS IS AN 4 5 INCLUSIVE LIST. AC TRANSIT, SFMTA, ACE, PETALUMA TRANSIT, BART. TRI DELTA. THIS INFORMATION CAN BE FOUND ON THEIR 6 RESPECTIVE WEB SITES. FOR THOSE AGENCIES NOT CONSISTENTLY 7 8 PROVIDING MASKS AT THIS TIME, THEY ARE MONITORING COMPLIANCE WITH PUBLIC HEALTH ORDERS TO WEAR MASKS AND WILL RECONSIDER 9 SUPPLYING MASKS IF COMPLIANCE BECOMES AN ISSUE ON THEIR 10 SYSTEM. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. THIS IS A HIGHLIGHT 11 OF WHAT THE REPORTING WILL LOOK LIKE. THE DASHBOARD FEATURES A 12 STAR RATING FOR EACH OF THE FOUR METRICS THAT WERE DESCRIBED. 13 IT WAS DONE IN THIS FASHION TO BE EASILY UNDERSTOOD BY THE 14 PUBLIC. THE AGENCIES ARE GIVEN 1 TO 5 STARS BASED ON THE 15 16 PERCENTAGE THEY INDIVIDUALLY REPORT FOR EACH OF THE METRICS. AND, AGAIN, IT RANGES FROM ONE STAR WHICH IS LESS THAN 60 17 PERCENT COMPLIANCE, TO FIVE STARS, WHICH IS GREATER THAN 95 18 PERCENT COMPLIANCE. NEXT SLIDE. DATA DASHBOARD IS SETUP AS ONE 19 MEANS OF ACCOUNTABILITY AND REPORTING. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT 20 21 TO RECOGNIZE THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS ARE HOLDING THEIR GM'S ACCOUNTABLE TO COVID RELATED RESPONSES AS THEY DO FOR ALL 22 SAFETY ISSUES. AGENCY DASHBOARD IS CURRENTLY IN BETA AS THE 23 AGENCIES ARE WORKING TO OPERATIONALIZE THEIR DATA COLLECTION. 24 AND THE DASHBOARD WILL INCLUDE THE AGENCY'S COMMITMENT AS WELL 25

COMMISSION September 23, 2020 Meeting Transcript AS TIPS FOR PASSENGERS, THAT'S ILLUSTRATED ON THIS SLIDE. AND 1 THE CUSTOMER TIPS, IN PARTICULAR, ARE IMPORTANT SINCE THE 2 3 SUCCESS OF THE PLAN IS BOUND WITH PASSENGER PARTICIPATION INCLUDING PROPERLY WEARING THE MASK AND KEEPING A SAFE SIX 4 5 FOOT DISTANCE FROM OTHERS NOT IN THEIR HOUSEHOLD. WE WANT TO NOTE THAT SIX FEET IS THE WORKING DIRECTIVE FOR BAY AREA 6 AGENCIES, AND IS THE METRIC CURRENTLY EVALUATED UNTIL ANY 7 8 FURTHER DIRECTION IS PROVIDED BY PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICIALS. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS PROVIDES YOU A STATIC 9 10 SNAPSHOT PREVIEW OF THE DATA COLLECTED THROUGH SEPTEMBER 17TH, WHICH IS CURRENTLY BEING TESTED ON THE BATA WEB SITE AND BEING 11 SETUP FOR ALL OF THE AGENCIES. SITE WILL BE LIVE AND 12 INTERACTIVE ON SEPTEMBER 28TH. DATA WILL CONTINUE TO BE 13 COLLECTED THROUGHOUT MONTH OF SEPTEMBER TO PROVIDE A COMPLETE 14 REPORTING PERIOD IN OCTOBER. A SUBSEQUENT REPORTING PERIOD 15 16 WILL BE BASED ON, AGAIN, A 30 DAY PERIOD. AGENCIES HAVE PUT IN SIGNIFICANT EFFORTS TO THE DASHBOARD'S DESIGN AND THE 17 COLLECTION OF THE DATA WHAT YOU CAN SEE HERE AS AN EXAMPLE IS 18 BOTH LARGE AND SMALL AGENCIES ARE COMMITTING RESOURCES TO DO 19 SO. THEY HAVE WORKED TO MEASURE ACROSS MODES, THEIR VARIOUS 20 21 FLEET SIZES AND ACQUIRING STATISTICALLY DIFFERENT SAMPLES ON ACCOUNTS AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. THIS FEATURES A SNAPSHOT OF 22 LARGE AGENCY SUCH AS ALAMEDA -- OR AC TRANSIT, SAMTRANS, BART, 23 MUNI, AND SMALLER AGENCIES, SUCH AS ACE AND TRI DELTA. AGAIN, 24 THE AGENCY RATINGS, THIS IS A SNAPSHOT FOR INFORMATION THROUGH 25

32

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

SEPTEMBER 17TH. AGAIN, IS BASED ON THE 1 TO 5 STAR RATING. AND 1 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THE AGENCY'S CONTINUED MONITORING OF 2 3 THEIR PLAN AND UPDATES AND MODIFICATIONS AS, AGAIN, THE PANDEMIC EVOLVES. NEXT SLIDE. ONE OF THE IMPORTANT REQUESTS BY 4 5 CHAIR HAGGERTY AND THE COMMISSION WAS THE ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS BY THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO COMMIT TO IMPLEMENTING 6 THE PLAN THAT THEY HAD DEVELOPED, THE WRITING TOGETHER THE BAY 7 8 AREA HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN. THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THE STATUS OF THOSE RESOLUTIONS. 25 AGENCIES, AGAIN, WE'RE WORKING TO 9 PASS THEM. 16 AGENCIES HAVE ALREADY ADOPTED THEM. NINE 10 AGENCIES ARE SCHEDULED FOR ADOPTION, EITHER LATER THIS MONTH 11 OR IN OCTOBER. NEXT SLIDE. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. I 12 WOULD NOTE THAT IF THERE IS QUESTIONS, TECHNICAL QUESTIONS 13 REGARDING THE DASHBOARD, HANNAH LINDALOKT OF BART IS HERE TO 14 ANSWER THOSE OUESTIONS AS THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE THE ONES 15 16 DEVELOPING MAINTAINING AND POPULATING THE DASHBOARD. THAT MR. CHAIR CONCLUSION MY PRESENTATION. 17

18

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

19 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU THERESE. I THINK ONE OF 20 THE THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO SEE POSTED ON THE INDIVIDUAL PAGES 21 SAY COPY OF THE RESOLUTION THAT THEY HAVE APPROVED IN THE 22 VOTE. TO MAKE SURE WE'RE UNANIMOUS. IF YOU COULD WORK ON THAT 23 THAT WOULD BE GREAT. I DON'T SEE HANDS FROM COMMISSIONERS. 24 WE'LL GO TO THE ATTENDEES. KIMBERLY CALL ON THEM.

25



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: I WOULD BE HAPPY TO. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD
2	YOU ALLOW?
3	
4	SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: TWO MINUTES.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS KEVIN. I.
7	
8	SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS KEVIN MCDONNELL. AS WEEN THE
9	PANDEMIC IS STILL GOING ON AND TRANSIT AGENCIES STILL REMAIN
10	IN DEEP FINANCIAL CRISIS THAT REQUIRES AN EMERGENCY THAT MTC
11	HAS SO FAR LACKED. AT THE RECOVERY TASK FOREHEAD DIRECTORS
12	SAID THEY WOULD ANALYZE THE BUDGET TO DISCOVER DEBT SPIRALS.
13	MTC IS A STAFF WITH A LARGE BUDGET AND LOTS OF STAFF AND IT'S
14	TIME TO PUT THAT STAFF BOO USE AND YOU FAILED SO FAR TO SHIFT
15	MUCH FUNDING TO PREVENT MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS.
16	WHILE THE DASHBOARD LOOKS FINE IT STILL PLACES THE BURDEN ON
17	INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MAKE A VALID HEALTH PLAN THAT
18	SOMETIMES DOES REQUIRE A PUSH FROM ABOVE TO ACTUALLY GET
19	THINGS GOING OTHER WISE WE BECOME A PATCHWORK THAT NO ONE
20	WANTS. THIS IS A CRISIS AND WE DEMAND SAFE AND HEALTHY
21	TRANSPORTATION FOR WHAT WE NEED FOR TRANSIT RIDERS TODAY.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS NATHANIEL
24	ARNOLD.
25	

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SPEAKER: YES. HELLO. MY NAME IS NATHANIEL ARNOLD. AND I AM A 1 MEMBER OF AC TRANSIT. I AM IN CHARGE OF THEIR SAFETY AND 2 3 HEALTH FOR THE UNION AND OF THE REASON I'M HERE IS ME AND MY WORKERS ARE ON THE FRONT LINES OF THIS CRISS. LAST WEEK A BLUE 4 5 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE, DIRECTOR MCMILLAN STATED MTC WOULD ALLOW ANALYSIS FOR MTC'S BUDGET TO DETERMINE WHICH 6 MONEYS WOULD BE SHIFTED TO ADDRESS THE URGENCY OF SERVICE CUTS 7 8 AND MAJOR DROPS IN RIDERSHIP. TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING SEVERE SERVICE CUTS AND JOB LOSSES IN THE COMING MONTHS. YOUR 9 BUDGET CANNOT REFLECT BUSINESS AS USUAL. WE ARE IN THE MIDDLE 10 OF A CATASTROPHE FOR ALL OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND FOR THOSE 11 OF US WHO DEPEND ON IT YOU CONTROL BILLIONS OF DOLLARS AND 12 NUMEROUS FUNDING SOURCES. THIS IS A TIME TO PRIORITIZE AND 13 KEEP MONEY ON THE GROUND TO PROVIDE SERVICE. MTC IS A REGIONAL 14 AGENCY WITH A MISSION AND ABILITY TO ADDRESS THIS CRISIS. YOU 15 16 HAVE AN OPERATING BUDGET OF OVER \$70 MILLION A YEAR. YOU TOOK ONE PERCENT OF THE CARES ACT FUNDING TO SUPPORT YOUR TRANSIT 17 RECOVERY. YOU FAILED TO PRESENT ANY OPTIONS TO SHIFT FUNDING 18 THAT YOU CONTROL TO AVOID MASSIVE LAYOFFS ASK SERVICE CUTS IN 19 FACT THIS MONTH THE ONLY AGENDA ITEM RELATED TO EMERGENCY 20 21 TRANSIT FUNDING PURPOSES IS TO SPEND THAT \$500,000 OF THE 22 CARES ACT MONEY YOU TOOK TO SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY EFFORTS. REEVALUATION OF THE FUNDS OF THE MTC ALLOCATES MUST BE A TOP 23 PRIORITY. YOU MUST LEAVE HEALTH AND SAFETY UP TO THE OPERATORS 24 WHO PROVIDE BAY AREA MINIMUM TO THE TRANSIT PLAN. WE ARE 25



WAITING FOR THE DASHBOARD TO BE MADE PUBLICLY AVAILABLE ON THE 1 WEB SITE AND TO ENSURE IT INCLUDES BASIC INFORMATION SUCH AS 2 3 WHETHER AGENCIES WHO ARE PASSING OUT THE MASKS --4 5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** [INDISCERNIBLE] 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE NEXT SPEAKER --8 SPEAKER: THE LIMITED RESPONSE OF THE FACE OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH 9 10 RISK ON PUBLIC TRANSIT --11 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: CAN YOU WRAP IT UP PLEASE? 12 13 SPEAKER: YES. THIS IS A CRISIS WE DEMAND ACTION TO PUBLIC 14 15 TRANSPORTATION TO PROVIDE FUNDING FOR IMMEDIATE NEEDS. 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVE CAMPBELL. UNMUTE 19 YOURSELF. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: THIS IS DAVE CAMPBELL ADVOCACY DIRECTOR FOR BIKE EAST 23 BAY ALSO VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. I WANT TO FIRST THANK AC TRANSIT FOR PROVIDING FREE MASKS AND SANITIZER. THIS'S GREAT. 24 I'M PLEASED THEY'RE LISTENING TO CALLS FROM THE PUBLIC TO DO 25

SO. STILL PUSHING OTHER EAST BAY OPERATORS TO DO THE SAME. SO 1 THE TWO POINTS I WANT TO MAKE IS, ONE, WE HAVE TO GET ALL OF 2 3 OUR OPERATORS TO DO THAT AND WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THE UPCOMING TRANSIT SHORT FALL. PROPOSITION 15 IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR THAT. 4 5 SO YES ON PROP 15 TO HELP FILL THE FUNDING GAP GOING FORWARD. BUT HERE TO ASK MTC TO STEP UP, QUICKLY, TO SHOW MORE 6 LEADERSHIP. ESTABLISH MORE LEADERSHIP TO MOVE FUNDING FROM 7 8 FREEWAY PROJECTS, HOWEVER THAT CAN HAPPEN, TO STABILIZE TRANSIT FUNDING OVER THE NEXT COMING YEARS, AND ON THE PPE, 9 10 POINT, I HAD A GOOD CONVERSATION WITH COMMISSIONER WORTH AFTER LAST MONTH'S MEETING AND SHE PROMISED SHE WAS GOING TO HOP ON 11 HER EAST BAY BUSSES AND SEE WHAT THE PPE USAGE WAS ON LIKE 12 THEM AND SHARE THAT EXPERIENCE WITH YOU HERE TODAY. SO THANK 13 YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH FOR DOING THAT. AND ALSO, THANK YOU FOR 14 15 ASKING THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS HERE TODAY TO DO THE SAME, AND 16 TO CONTINUE TO DO THE SAME AS WE HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT PPE, PUBLIC HEALTH, AND NEEDED TRANSIT FUNDING. WE NEED OUR 17 COMMISSIONERS ON THESE BUSES REGULARLY. WE NEED YOU STANDING 18 AT BUS STOPS, MISSING BUSES BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT COMING AND 19 EXPERIENCE EVERYTHING EVERYONE OUT THERE IS EXPERIENCING. 20 21 THANK YOU.

22

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JAVANKA
24 BECKELS.

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING YOU ALL, COMMISSIONERS, MY NAME IS 1 JAVANKA, I AM WITH VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. 2 3 AC TRANSIT WORKERS ARE WORRIED ABOUT CUTS TO BUS LINES WAGES AND JOBS AND DEMANDING SERIOUS SAFETY MEASURES TO PROTECT THE 4 5 WORKERS AND THE RIDERS. MTC, YOUR AN AGENCY IS AN AGENCY WITH A MISSION AND ABILITY TO ADDRESS THIS CRISIS. YOU HAVE THE 6 7 MONEY AND THE STAFF TO HELP FUND AND COORDINATE A REAL 8 RESPONSE. WE KNOW THAT YOU HAVE ACCEPTED \$13 MILLION IN THE CARES ACT FUNDING. THAT SHOULD BE SPENDING -- THAT YOU SHOULD 9 BE SPENDING TO MAKE OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COVID SAFER AND 10 TO STAVE OFF MASSIVE SERVICE CUTS AND LAYOFFS. BUT AFTER SIX 11 MONTHS IT'S IMPORTANT MTC HAS ACCOMPLISHED NOTHING. YOUR 12 HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN IGNORED ATUS DEMANDS TO ENSURE RIDER AND 13 WORKER SAFETY. YOU EMPLOYED MINIMAL SAFETY STANDARDS. MONTHS 14 LATER THEY'RE STEPPING UP TO MEET DEMANDS NO THANKS TO MTC. 15 16 BECAUSE YOU HAVE DONE NOTHING TO SHIFT FUNDING TO AVOID MASSIVE LAYOFFS AND SERVICE CUTS. THIS MONTH THE COMMISSION IS 17 RECOMMENDING SPENDING A MILLION DOLLARS OF CARES ACT FUNDS TO 18 SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY WITHOUT SAYING WHAT THAT MEANS OR 19 WHERE THIS MONEY IS ACTUALLY GOING. THIS IS ABSOLUTELY ABSURD. 20 AC TRANSIT IS NOW CONSIDERING SERVICE CUTS OF UP TO 30 PERCENT 21 22 AND CUTTING AWAY JOBS OF OUR MAJORITY BLACK WORKFORCE. MTC HAS MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN CARES ACT FUNDING AND BILLIONS FROM 23 OTHER SOURCES THAT MIGHT BE USED TO SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY. 24 BUT UNFORTUNATELY, MTC HASN'T EVEN TOLD US HOW MUCH OF THAT 25



MIGHT BE USED TO HELP OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. MTC HAS A 1 RESPONSIBILITY TO SAVE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM, WORKING 2 3 PEOPLE DEMAND ACTION. 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM OAKLAND TENANT 8 UNION. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE. TWO 10 11 MINUTES TO SPEAK. 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OAKLAND TENANT UNION. PLEASE UNMUTE 13 YOURSELF. OKAY. MOVING TO NEXT SPEAKER. GREEN FOR ALL. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: HELLO COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS NICHOLE WONG A CAMPAIGN MANAGER AT BETWEEN FOR ALL AND RESIDENT AND ACTIVE 17 PARTICIPANT IN THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. 18 PUBLIC TRANSIT HAS BEEN UNDERWATER FOR SIX MONTHS. DELAYING 19 SAFETY MEASURES THAT CAN PROTECT LIVES NOW TRANSIT FACING 20 21 DRASTIC CUTS YOU CANNOT AFFORD TO PASS BY OBJECTIVE THAT 22 MAINTAINS STATUS QUO. MTC IS THE AGENCY'S BEST VIEW TO OFFER 23 LEADERSHIP DURING THIS CRISIS ABOUT AN OPERATING BUDGET OF OVER \$170 MILLION EACH YEAR TAKE ACTION. TRANSIT RIDERS ARE 24 DEPENDENT ON YOU. SHIFT FUNDING FROM CARES ACT FUNDING TO 25

September 23, 2020

AVOID MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS. IT'S IMPERATIVE MTC 1 DETERMINES ALLOCATIONS. YOU HAVE LEFT HEALTH AND SAFETY AT THE 2 3 TRANSIT SYSTEMS THIS HAS LIST THE BURDEN ON RIDERS AND WORKERS THEMSELVES. DASHBOARD YOU PRESENTED TODAY REFLECTS THIS 4 5 LACKING IN SPECIFICITY AND ARE RIDER EMPLOYEE FOCUSED. FOR INSTANCE THE DASHBOARD FAILS TO MONITOR WHETHER TRANSIT 6 AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING HAND SANITIZERS AND MASKS TO RIDERS 7 8 MEASURES TO KEEP RIDERS AND WORKERS SAFE. PLEASE ENSURE THE 9 NEEDS OF OUR RIDERS AND OPERATORS. THANK YOU.

10

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT IS MARK RICHARD ANTONIO. PLEASE
 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS RICHARD MARK 14 ANTONIO WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC 15 16 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. OVER THE DECADES YOU HAVE DIRECTED UNTOLD BILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO BUILD, MAINTAIN AND OPERATOR 17 TRANSIT SYSTEM. PANDEMIC AND ECONOMIC DOWNTURN NOW POSE AN 18 EXISTENTIAL CRISIS TO THAT TRANSIT SYSTEM. BUT SIX MONTHS IN, 19 THERE IS NO SIGN THAT MTC IS TREATING THIS AS A CRISIS. LAST 20 21 MONTH, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SAID MTC WOULD BE EXPECTING EACH 22 TRANSIT AGENCY TO TRANSLATE THE HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN INTO A 23 SPECIFIC AGENCY PLAN. WHERE IS THE AGENDA ITEM ABOUT THOSE PLANS? I WROTE TO SIX OF THE LARGEST TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND 24 MOST HAD NOT CREATED AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND DIDN'T 25

September 23, 2020

DISCLOSE ANY PLANS TO DO SO. AND WHERE IS THE AGENDA ITEM 1 ABOUT HOW MTC WILL SHIFT FUNDING TO EMERGENCY TRANSIT 2 3 OPERATING SUPPORT? IT'S AS IF MTC IS STILL EXPECTING ANOTHER FEDERAL STIMULUS BEFORE THE CURRENT ONE RUNS OUT AND MEANWHILE 4 5 AGENCIES ARE PREPARING FOR MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS. YOU ARE THE STEWARDS OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, THAT SYSTEM IS IN 6 7 CRISIS. AND YOU MUST NOT ALLOW IT TO BE DESTROYED WITHOUT 8 DOING EVERYTHING IN YOUR POWER TO PRESERVE T THANK YOU. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: KIMBERLY, CAN YOU DO ME A FAVOR AND TRY 10 THE OAKLAND -- I NOTICED THEY CAME BACK ON AGAIN. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OAKLAND TENANT UNION PLEASE UNMUTE 13 14 YOURSELF. SOMEONE FROM THE OAKLAND TENANT UNION, YOU HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE UNMUTE 15 16 YOURSELF. 17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THERE YOU GO. 18 19 SPEAKER: HI. OCCUR HEAR ME? 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. 23 SPEAKER: HI. SORRY FOR THE MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER MEMBER OF 24 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT COALITION PUBLIC TRANSIT HAS BEEN 25

AFFECTED FOR SIX MONTHS WE'RE ASKING YOU TO RESPOND TO THE 1 EMERGENCY. I AM A TRANSIT RIDER ON THE FRONTLINE OF THIS 2 3 CRISIS. AND I RIDE TRANSIT REGULARLY. LAST WEEK AT THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN STATED 4 5 THAT MTC STAFF WOULD ANALYZE MTC'S BUDGET TO DETERMINE WHICH MONEY SHOULD BE SHIFTED TO ADDRESS EMERGENCY OF THIS CRISIS TO 6 ADDRESS MAJOR DROPS IN RIDERSHIP. YOUR BUDGET CANNOT REFLECT 7 8 BUSINESS AS USUAL. WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF A CATASTROPHE FOR THOSE THAT DEPEND ON IT. YOU CONTROL BILLIONS OF DOLLARS FROM 9 NUMEROUS FUNDING SOURCES THIS IS THE TIME TO PRIORITIZE MONEY 10 TO KEEP SERVICE ON THE GROUND. MTC HAS THE ABILITY TO ADDRESS 11 THIS CRISIS. YOU HAVE AN OPERATING BUDGET OF OVER \$70 MILLION 12 A YEAR AND STAFF, AND YOU TOOK FUNDS FROM CARES ACT, BUT YOU 13 FAILED TO PRESENT OPTIONS TO PREVENT MASSIVE LAYOFFS. TRANSIT 14 FUNDING PROPOSES TO SPEND \$500,000 OF CARES ACT MONEY YOU 15 16 TOOK. REEVALUATION OF THE FUNDS MTC ALLOCATES MUST BE A TOP PRIORITY. OPERATORS CONTRIBUTE TO THE BAY AREA MINIMUM OF THE 17 TRANSIT PLAN WHICH AS YOU MENTIONED EARLIER WAS SUPPOSED TO BE 18 GUIDELINES NOT OF THE TOP OF WHAT PEOPLE WERE AIMING FOR. THIS 19 IS A CRISIS. WE DEMAND ACTION SAY PUBLIC TRANSIT BY FUNDING 20 21 IMMEDIATE OPERATING NEEDS OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. THANK YOU 22 VERY MUCH.

23

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS HALEY
25 CURRIER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS THIS IS HALEY CURRIER 2 3 POLICY ADVOCACY MANAGER AT TRANSFORM MEMBERS OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND MEMBER OF BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK 4 5 FORCE. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT DURING THE HEALTH AND PUBLIC CRISIS -- PUBLIC SAFETY AND SERVICE AND JOB CUTS. 6 7 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS IS ACTUALLY AN IMPORTANT STEP TO ENSURING 8 EVERY AGENCY HAS WHAT THEY NEED TO KEEP RIDERS AND OPERATORS SAFE. THIS IS THE GOAL OF THE PROJECT. METRICS ARE 9 UNDERDEVELOPED. SHOULD BE AGENCY IS HANDING OUT MASKS YES OR 10 NO. AGENCY IS HANDING OUT HAND SANITIZER YES OR NO. DIRECTOR 11 WORTH HAS THAT INFORMATION. WHY ISN'T IT HANDED OUT AS 12 REQUESTED. MTC SHOULD WORK WITH OPERATORS AND RIDERS NOT JUST 13 MEASURE COMPLIANCE. THIS ISN'T ABOUT SHAMING OR PUNISHING 14 15 AGENCIES. PRESENTS OPPORTUNITY FOR EACH AGENCY IDENTIFYING 16 BEST PRACTICE AND FILLING THE GAP. SECOND OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING SERVICE AND JOB CUTS THAT WILL LEAD TO FURTHER 17 18 DROPS IN RIDERSHIP AND STRANDED. TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE STATED MTC STAFF WOULD ANALYZE FUNDS CONTROLLED BY MTC TO 19 DETERMINE WHICH FUNDS COULD BE SHIFTED TO FILL THE URGENT 20 NEED. THIS IS A CRISIS. THIS IS A TIME FOR LEADERSHIP AND 21 22 CREATIVITY THIS IS NOT THE TIME TO ACCEPT THE WAY THING HAVE 23 BEEN. WHEN YOU SEE HUNDREDS OF JOBS BEING CUT DOZENS OF BUS LINES BEING CUT RIDERS WAITING FOR BUSES THAT NEVER COME TO 24 GET TO THE STORE OR HELPFUL WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO. DON'T 25



TELL THE TRANSIT RIDERS WHAT YOU CAN'T DO. TELL US WHAT YOU
 CAN DO TO ENSURE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM MAKES IT THROUGH THE
 CRISIS.

4

5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT ALAN.
6 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I THINK THE 9 COMMENTING THIS MORNING IS SOMETHING YOU'RE ALL AWARE OF WE'RE 10 IN A CRISIS IN TERMS OF THE SYSTEM YOU ALL HAVE BEEN A PART OF 11 BUILDING OVER YOUR TIME WITH THE STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS. I 12 THINK WHAT WE'RE ALL SAYING TODAY IS WE CLEARLY NEED TO SEE A 13 RESPONSE ON HEALTH AND SAFETY THERE HAS BEEN PROGRESS IN TERMS 14 15 OF WHAT WAS PRESENTED TODAY I'LL QUICKLY ECHO ULTIMATELY NOT 16 HAVING THE METRIC THEY THINK MOST LAY PEOPLE AND RIDERS WOULD FOCUS ON WHICH THE AVAILABILITY OF MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER 17 SEEMS INCREDIBLY PROBLEMATIC AND UNDERMINES FROM A TYPICAL 18 RIDERS PERSPECTIVE THE INFORMATION YOU HAVE AND SHOULD BE 19 INCLUDED IN THE DASHBOARD. BUT THE AREA IN WHICH THE HEALTH 20 21 AND SAFETY, WHERE IT'S IRREFUTABLE THAT MTC HAS NOT JUST THE 22 POLITICAL RESPONSIBILITY TO ADDRESS BUT A STATUTORY ONE, I THINK IS CLEARLY ON THE FISCAL CRISIS WE'RE FACING. OPERATORS 23 AT THE LOCAL LEVEL ARE PRESENTING INCLUDING VTA, SFMTA, OTHER 24 AGENCIES, A REALLY ROBUST SET OF DIFFICULT TRADEOFFS THAT WE 25

September 23, 2020

HAVE TO MAKE TO KEEP THE SYSTEM GOING. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE 1 HEARING TODAY WE NEED TO HEAR WHAT YOU CAN DO AS A REGIONAL 2 3 TRANSIT PLANNING AGENCY. THERE IS TRADEOFFS TO THOSE DECISIONS. WE'RE IN SEPTEMBER AND WE STILL HAVEN'T HAD A 4 5 CONVERSATION ABOUT WHAT THE METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION COULD DO. THAT'S YOUR RESPONSIBILITY, IT'S YOUR RESPONSIBILITY 6 TO VOTE ON WHAT THOSE OPTIONS ARE AND IT'S OUR RESPONSIBILITY 7 8 AT THE PUBLIC AND ADVOCATES OF THE COMMUNITY TO HAVE A ROBUST DISCUSSION. WE DON'T HAVE THAT INFORMATION. IT NEEDS TO HAPPEN 9 AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS COME UP TO THE 10 TASK FORCE. IT'S UNCONSCIONABLE TO TALK ABOUT IMPORTANT 11 CONVERSATION IN STAGE THREE WHEN WE HAVEN'T DONE ANYTHING 12 AROUND STAGE TWO IMMEDIATE RECOVERY MUCH PLEASE LISTEN TO WHAT 13 FOLKS HAVE SAID TODAY AND TAKE ACTION ON THAT. THANK YOU. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 17 18 SPEAKER: HI CAN YOU HEAR ME? 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. 21 22 23 SPEAKER: YEAH. WELL, I JUST WANT TO GET BACK TO THE IDEA OF EQUITY. WE REALLY NEED TO START THINKING ABOUT HOW WE CAN MAKE 24 PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE. WE HAVE ALL THESE PEOPLE LOSING THEIR 25

September 23, 2020

JOBS AND THAT MAKES IT MORE DIFFICULT. THEY CAN'T GET AROUND 1 2 THEY CANNOT BE PRODUCTIVE. HOMELESS PEOPLE CANNOT BE 3 PRODUCTIVE UNLESS THEY GET TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO. IF WE COULD FOCUS ON MAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE, LET'S TAKE A LOOK 4 5 AT THE COST OF COLLECTING A FARE. AND CLIPPER IS OVER \$400 MILLION. SO NOW WHEN I WANT TO USE BART, I HAVE TO USE AN 6 EXTRA \$3 TO GET A CLIPPER CARD. I DON'T THINK THAT'S FAIR. WE 7 8 ARE GOING TO LET TRANSIT SUFFER AND WONDER WHY SO MANY PEOPLE WANT TO DRIVE. LET'S LOOK AT HOW TO MAKE TRANSIT FREE AND 9 RECOVERY MONEY FROM PROPERTY OWNERS WHO BENEFIT FROM THE 10 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT. THANK YOU. 11

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS NICK FRENCH. PLEASE UNMUTE
14 YOURSELF.

15

16 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS NICK FRENCH I AM A LONG TIME BART AND AC TRANSIT RIDER. I WANT TO ECHO COMMENTS MADE ALREADY BY 17 THE VOICE FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I THINK MTC HAS 18 FAILED TO SHOW THE LEADERSHIP OF THE CRISIS FACING OUR TRANSIT 19 SYSTEM I WAS STRUCK SEEING THE DASHBOARD THAT MTC IS TAKING A 20 21 PASSIVE ROLE REPORTING WHAT AGENCIES ARE DOING, BUT NOT EVEN REPORTING SOME OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS, LIKE, YOU KNOW, 22 THE ISSUES AROUND MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER THAT HAVE BEEN 23 RAISED, AND MORE FUNDAMENTALLY THAT IT STRUCK ME THAT MTC IS 24 NOT USING ITS CONSIDERABLE RESOURCES AND AUTHORITY TO ACTUALLY 25

September 23, 2020

DIRECT OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT
 IS SAFE FOR RIDERS DURING THE PANDEMIC. SO AGAIN JUST WANT TO
 ECHO COMMENTS OTHERS HAVE MADE. THIS IS A CRISIS THAT THE MTC
 HAS NOT HANDLED.

5

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN COURTNEY.
7 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. MY NAME IS JOHN COURTNEY, ATU 9 LOCAL 265 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. I DO AGREE WITH WHAT NICK 10 JUST SAID ABOUT LEADERSHIP. IT COMES DOWN TO LEADERSHIP. AND 11 YOU HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING AND NOT LEADING AT ALL. IN FACT, ONE 12 OF THE COMMISSIONERS MADE A COMMENT, IN THE PAST MONTH ABOUT 13 STAYING IN YOUR LANE. AND IF THERE WAS EVER A TIME FOR MTC TO 14 SHOW LEADERSHIP IT'S NOW. I HAVE A FEW EXAMPLES AT VTA. VTA 15 16 HAS NOT BEEN A BAD ACTOR. DON'T GET ME WRONG. THEY HAVE DONE MOST PROGRESSIVE THINGS IN TERMS OF KEEPER RIDERS AND 17 OPERATORS SAFE HOWEVER THERE'S A SHORT FALL. I HAVE AN 18 OPERATOR CURRENTLY WHO JUST CAME OUT A COMA SHE ONLY WENT TO 19 WORK, FROM HOME TO WORK AND ENDED UP IF A COMA SHE WAS DENIED 20 21 WORKER'S COMPENSATION. YOU CAN IMAGINE HOW DISGUSTING THAT IS. AND TIME AND TIME AGAIN WE'RE NOT FOLLOWING THROUGH ON ALL 22 YOU'RE DOING HERE PUTTING OUT THIS DASHBOARD AND YOU'RE JUST 23 WALKING AWAY FROM T THERE IS NO ACCOUNTABILITY, THERE IS NO 24 GOING TO POLICE THE AGENCIES, THERE IS NO FOLLOW UP, NO 25

September 23, 2020

LEADERSHIP. AND THIS'S WHAT IS REALLY FRUSTRATING FOR US. LIKE 1 I SAID IF THERE EVER WAS A TIME FOR MTC TO SHINE AND ACTUALLY 2 3 DO YOUR JOB, THE TIME IS NOW. WE NEED TO SAVE LIVES AND KEEP TRANSPORTATION GOING. SERVICE CUTS ARE NEVER -- COME BACK --4 5 [INDISCERNIBLE] SERVICE CUTS -- PLEASE MOVE SOME FUNDING 6 AROUND. 7 8 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: MUTE PLEASE. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES. 10 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. MR. HEDGES? 11

12

RICHARD HEDGES: THANK YOU. YEAH. I REALLY MISS RIDING TRANSIT 13 DURING THIS PANDEMIC. I ACTUALLY LOVE GETTING ON IT, TALKING 14 15 TO PEOPLE, FINDING OUT THEIR VIEWS ON THING WITHIN THE BAY 16 AREA AND NATIONALLY. BUT, I WOULD SAY THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT TIME. I UNDERSTAND THE LACK OF POWER THAT MTC HAS TO DRIVE THE 17 TRANSIT AGENCIES INTO ANY PARTICULAR PROGRAM. IF WE CUT TO 18 THAT, I THINK THE FIVE STAR PROGRAM IS A GOOD START, IN GIVING 19 PEOPLE INFORMATION BUT I WILL TELL YOU THAT THE PEOPLE THAT 20 21 ARE MOST IN TOUCH WITH THIS, AND THAT ARE IN TRANSIT VEHICLES EVERY DAY, ARE THE DRIVERS. MTC SHOULD LISTEN TO THEM VERY 22 CAREFULLY. THEY UNDERSTAND THE PROBLEMS. AND I WOULD SAY THE 23 SAFETY OF THE PASSENGERS ARE DIRECTLY RELATED TO THE DRIVERS. 24 25 ISSUES THEY BRING UP ARE REAR BOARDING, EVERYBODY WEARING A

September 23, 2020

MASK, THEY'RE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT NOT FINDING OUT WHO AMONG 1 THEM HAS CONTACTED COVID. SOME OF THE AGENCIES TELL ME THAT 2 3 THEY'RE ONLY TOLD WHEN IT HAPPENS, NOT -- I UNDERSTAND THE GOVERNOR HAS MADE THAT ABILITY OPEN TO THE AGENCIES TO LET THE 4 5 DRIVERS REPRESENTATIVES KNOW WHO HAS BEEN INFECTED SO THE DRIVERS CAN KNOW WHETHER THEY HAVE BEEN IN PROXIMITY OF THE 6 WORKERS. I THINK THAT WILL MAKE DRIVERS FEEL A LOT SAFER. 7 8 SAFETY OF THE DRIVERS IS DIRECTLY RELATED TO SAFETY OF THE PASSENGERS LISTEN TO THE DRIVERS AND SINCE IT'S SELF REPORTING 9 CONTACT THE DRIVERS OR SETUP A VEHICLE WHERE THEY CAN TELL YOU 10 THEIR FEELINGS ABOUT WHEN'S BEING REPORTED. THANK YOU. 11

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS BONNIE
14 LOCKHART. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 SPEAKER: YES. HI. MY NAME IS BONNIE LOCKHART AND I AM A VOLUNTEER FOR VOICES WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND I AM HERE 17 BECAUSE I'M PASSIONATE ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IT'S RACIAL 18 ISSUE AND SOCIAL JUSTICE ISSUE AND CLIMATE ISSUE. I WANT TO 19 REITERATE ALL THAT'S BEEN SAID ABOUT HEALTH AND SAFETY. PUBLIC 20 TRANSIT IS IN DEEP CRISIS. TREATING THIS LIKE THE EMERGENCY IT 21 22 IS WHAT IS YOUR PLAN. PUBLIC TRANSIT IS ABOUT TO GO OFF A 23 CLIFF TALKING ABOUT CUTS TO CRUCIAL SERVICES MAY NEVER RECOVER. YOU CONTROL THE BUDGET. BUCK STOPS HERE. YOU TOOK 24 MILLION DOLLARS IN CARES ACT FUNDS FOR TRANSIT RECOVERY. WE 25

September 23, 2020

HAVE NOT SEEN HOW YOU'RE GOING TO USE THOSE BILLIONS OF 1 DOLLARS TO SAVE PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE NEED A RESPONSE THAT THIS 2 3 EMERGENCY DEMANDS. WE HAVE GOT TO SEE YOUR ANALYSIS OF HOW YOU'RE GOING TO SHIFT FUNDS TO HALT THIS DEATH SPIRAL OF 4 5 SERVICE CUTS AND FARE INCREASES AND THEN REDUCED RIDERSHIP. WE NEED TO YOU PRIORITIZE PLANNING ABOVE ALL ELSE THIS SHOULD BE 6 TOP AGENDA HEALTH AND SAFETY IS CRUCIAL TO THAT PLAN AND WE 7 8 NEED A RECOVERY BUDGET, THAT IS WAY OVERDUE. THIS COVID CRISIS HAS SHOWN US WHAT DENIAL BY LEADERSHIP OF THE DEPTH OF A 9 10 CRISIS LEADS TO. BEFORE THE NEXT MTC MEETING, WE NEED TO SEE A PLAN OF HOW YOU'RE GOING TO FIND THE FUNDS, HOW YOU'RE GOING 11 TO SHIFT THE FUNDS, AND HOW YOU'RE GOING TO SAVE PUBLIC 12 TRANSIT. WE NEED TO FACE REALITY WITH COURAGE AND VISION. 13 14 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SARAH BETWEEN17 WALD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS SARAH BETWEEN -- GENE WALD WITH 350 BAY
AREA. THAT WAS A NICE PRESENTATION ON THE PROGRESS OF THE
SOFTWARE AND YOUR TRACKING PROGRAM, BUT, THIS IS HAPPENING
VERY LATE, AND IT STILL ISN'T DOING ENOUGH ON DRIVER AND RIDER
SAFETY. SO I'M ALARMED THAT OVER A THIRD OF THE AGENCIES, IF I
READ IT CORRECTLY, HAVE NOT ADOPTED THE COVID HEALTH PROGRAM.
MTC'S JOB IS TO -- SO I HEARD, UNDER THE AGENCIES, TO LEAD

September 23, 2020

THEM TO WORK TOGETHER. AND IT'S NOT HAPPENING. SOFTWARE STILL 1 NEEDS TWEAKING TO PROPERLY SHOW THE SAFETY SITUATION AS PEOPLE 2 3 HAVE DISCUSSED. COVID CRISIS IS IN ITS SIX MONTH AS I'M SURE YOU KNOW. CLIMATE CRISIS HAS BEEN DECLARED EMERGENCY IN THE 4 5 BAY AREA. WHY? SIMPLY AS EVERYBODY WOULD SAY, YOU SIMPLY HAVE NOT INVESTED ENOUGH IN DOING THIS. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT CALLER IS 6262 LE BRUN. MR. LE BRUN, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 9 10 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW? 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. 13 14 SPEAKER: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. THIS IS ROLAND IN SAN JOSE. SO 15 16 RIGHT NOW THERE IS A CONFERENCE GOING ON IN LONDON IT'S CALLED BROADCAST WEEK AND MONDAY STARTED OFF WITH ARTICLE 19 AND KEYS 17 TO SUCCESS IN COVID-19. BEFORE I TALK ABOUT RAIL I WANT TO 18 TALK ABOUT BUSES BECAUSE I THINK BUSSES AND RAIL HAS TO BE 19 HANDLED DIFFERENTLY. BUSES ARE BASICALLY AN ESSENTIAL 20 LIFELINE. THERE IS NO TWO DAYS ABOUT IT AND LEAVING PEOPLE ON 21 22 THE SIDE OF THE ROAD BECAUSE THERE IS NOT ROOM FOR SOCIAL DISTANCING ON THE BUSES. WILL WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THAT. I ASKED 23 THE QUESTION, HOW IS SOCIAL DISTANCING GOING, AND THEY TOLD 24 ME, IF WE HAVE TO OPERATE TRAINS AT 50 PERCENT, WE WILL NOT 25

September 23, 2020

SURVIVE. WE REALLY NEED TO BE IN 80 TO 90 PERCENT. RESULTS, 1 BASICALLY IS CATASTROPHIC. IN LONDON IT WAS 10,000 NEW CASES, 2 3 WHAT IS THE SOLUTION. LATER PLANNING TO ADDRESS THIS WHEN WE TALK ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. ALL THE INFRASTRUCTURE, RAIL 4 5 INFRASTRUCTURE, A PORTION IS NOT DOING A LOT. WE START STUDYING HOW WE CAN USE IT FOR GOODS MOVEMENT AND GENERATING 6 REVENUE THAT AWAY. I AM INCLUDING BART. BART IS SHIPPING SOME 7 8 KINDS OF GOODS WITH BART WHICH BY THE WAY IS BEING ELECTRIFIED IS THE WAY THE GOODS ARE MOVING THROUGH THE SYSTEM NOW. THAT'S 9 10 MY TWO CENTS. THANK YOU.

11

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAJ, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR HAND IS
13 RAISED. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. THIS IS -- I HOPE EVERYONE IS 15 16 SAFE AND DOING WELL. I WANT TO PROVIDE A BIT OF AN UPDATE NOW THAT THE CARES ACT FUNDING HAS BEEN DISTURBED. OUR DISTRICT 17 HAS ADOPTED THE MTC RESOLUTION FOR OUR DISTRICT. IT'S STILL 18 FALLING SHORT IN MEETING ALL THE STATE AND COUNTY GUIDELINES. 19 WHAT'S EVEN MORE TROUBLING IS THAT THEY ARE NOW CONSIDERING 20 SERVICE CUTS INTO THE FUTURE AND THIS'S JUST NOT AT VTA BUT 21 ALL OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES AS WELL. ONE OF THE SOLE PURPOSES 22 23 OF THOSE MONEYS WAS TO MAINTAIN SERVICE ON THE STREETS. I'M ASKING THE MTC TO PROVIDE OVERSIGHT AND HOLD THE TRANSIT 24 AGENCY'S ACCOUNTABLE TO PROVIDING A SAFE BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY 25

September 23, 2020

A RELIABLE SERVICE. AGENCIES THEMSELVES ARE SHRUGGING THEIR
 RESPONSIBILITY. I WOULD ASK TO WITHHOLD FUNDING IF THE
 AGENCIES THEMSELVES DON'T DO THE RIGHT THING. SO ONCE AGAIN,
 I'M ASKING THE MTC TO PROVIDE THE MUCH NEEDED OVERSIGHT. THANK
 YOU.

6

7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA MALLEN,
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALLEN I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA 10 COUNTY AND AM SPEAKING FOR VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I 11 WANT TO TREAT THIS LIKE THE CRISIS IT IS I AM A TRANSIT RIDER 12 MYSELF AND AM WORRIED THERE WON'T BE ENOUGH MONEY, IS I'M 13 WORRIED IT'S ALMOST GOING TO BE IMPOSSIBLE TO GET AROUND AFTER 14 CUTS ARE MADE. MAIN TWO AGENCIES I USE ARE VTA AND CALTRAIN 15 16 RIGHT NOW VTA IS CONSIDERING CUTTING SERVICE BY 30 PERCENT AND IF THEY DON'T PASS THE MEASURE RR. YOU HAVE THE POWER, PLEASE 17 MAKE SURE TRANSIT IS SAFE AND CUTS ARE PREVENTED. THANK YOU. 18

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS EUGENE BRADLEY. PLEASE
21 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS EUGENE BRADLEY FOUNDER AND CEO OF SILICON
24 VALLEY TRANSIT USERS. I DO A LOT OF BUSINESS IN SANTA CLARA
25 COUNTY EVEN THOUGH CURRENTLY NOW I LIVE IN MONTEREY COUNTY. IT

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION September 23, 2020 Meeting Transcript DISTURBS ME TO SEE MTC HAS NOT DONE VERY MUCH REGARDING HEALTH 1 TO KEEP THESE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES SAFE DURING THE COVID-2 3 19 PANDEMIC. IT TROUBLES ME MORE THEY'RE CONSIDERING ASKING EMPLOYERS TO ONLY ALLOW 60 PERCENT OF THEIR EMPLOYEES TO WORK 4 5 FROM HOME. WHAT HAPPENS TO THE OTHER 40 PERCENT OF EMPLOYEES, SAY, LIKE, A WAITER OR GAS STATION ATTENDANT, OR EVEN SOMEBODY 6 -- OR A DOCTOR WHO CAN'T WORK FROM HOME, THEY HAVE TO GO IN 7 8 PHYSICALLY. THEIR TRANSIT FUNDING IS GOING TO BE CUT EVEN MORE. IT'S TROUBLING TO HEAR THAT VTA AND OTHER TRANSIT 9 AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE NATION HAVE PROPOSED CUTTING THEIR 10 TRANSIT SERVICE WHILE MEANWHILE MTC CONTINUES TO DO THE SAME 11 OLD SAME OLD. I SAW A CARTOON YEARS AGO THAT DESCRIBES WHAT 12 MTC HAS TO DO WHICH FRANKLY, DON'T JUST STAND THERE, DO 13 SOMETHING. IT'S PAST THE TIME YOU DO SOMETHING TO MAKE SURE 14 15 RIDERS AND OPERATORS ARE SAFE AND MAKE SURE THERE IS FUNDING

17

16

**METROPOLITAN** 

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS ISABELLA CHIU19 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

FOR TRANSIT THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA.

20

21 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS ISABELLA CHU FOUNDER OF REDWOOD CITY BOARD 22 AND FREQUENT TRANSIT RIDER I BIKE AND TAKE THE TRAIL ALMOST 23 EVERYWHERE. FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM WITH TRANSPORTATION IN THE 24 U.S. GENERALLY AND INCLUDING PROGRESSIVE AREAS LIKE THE BAY 25 AREA IS THAT WE HAVE GOT AN ALL YOU CAN EAT BUFFET AND

September 23, 2020

UNLIMITED SUBSIDIES FOR DRIVING AND TRANSIT IS FORCED TO FIGHT 1 FOR EVERY SCRAP AND NOT JUST TRANSIT, BEING BUT YOU KNOW, 2 3 WALKING, BIKING AND TRANSIT ARE LEFT FIGHTING FOR SCRAPS AND THERE ARE SO MANY STRATEGIES AVAILABLE TO US INCLUDING PRICING 4 5 PARKING AT WHAT ITS WORTH ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS, YOU KNOW, STARTING TO PRICE DRIVING, IT'S SOMETHING LIKE ITS TRUE 6 COST, BUT THERE IS A TREMENDOUS RESISTANCE TO EVEN CONSIDERING 7 8 ANY OF THESE SORT OF STRATEGIES WHICH WOULD AT LEAST PUT TRANSIT ON A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD WITH TRYING. -- DRIVING. 9 THAT'S THE FIRST THING. I HAVE A FLEXIBLE JOB, I LOVE WORKING 10 FROM HOME, I THINK THE IDEA OF MANDATING THAT 60 PERCENT OF 11 PEOPLE DO THAT IS ABSURD. CERTAINLY WE SHOULD MAKE IT 12 APPEALING, WE SHOULD, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY MAKE IT EASY TO DO, 13 AND AN OPTION. BUT TO MANDATE IT MAKES NO SENSE. AND THERE ARE 14 15 MANY OPPORTUNITIES AND OPTIONS AVAILABLE TO US THAT DON'T 16 INVOLVE DRACONIAN MEASURES WHICH PUNISH PEOPLE WHO CHOOSE NOT TO DRIVE. THANK YOU. 17

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. TWO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC SPEAKERS
20 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
21 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM MR. CHAIR.

22

23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WITH THAT I WILL CLOSE THE PUBLIC
24 COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION. I WOULD CERTAINLY
25 ASK IF THERE IS ANY COMMISSIONERS WITH COMMENTS? OKAY. I THINK

September 23, 2020

IT'S KIND OF A STRETCH TO MAKE COMMENTS SUCH AS MTC HAS DONE 1 2 NOTHING. I THINK MTC HAS DONE A LOT. I THINK, IF I'M THE 3 COMMISSIONER, I WAS THE ONE THAT SAID STAY IN YOUR LANE. I WILL STAY IN MY LANE. I AM A FIRM BELIEVER. I KNOW IT'S FINE 4 5 TO COME TO MTC AND POUND AS OPPOSED TO GOING TO THE DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES AND SPEAK WITH THEM. THAT'S WHERE THESE 6 COMMENTS NEED TO BE. WE HAVE PUT OUT CARES ACT FUNDING IN 7 8 RECORD TIME THROUGH THE GOOD WORK OF OUR STAFF, THERESE, ALIX, AND OTHERS. WE HAVE FORMED A BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. I REALLY 9 10 BELIEVE MTC IS SHOWING LEADERSHIP IN THIS REGARD, AND I THINK THAT'S ENOUGH SAID FROM ME. NICK THEN JIM. 11

12

13 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU CHAIR. SO I MAY HAVE MISSED 14 IT. IS THERE -- THE GUIDELINES DON'T REQUIRE TRANSIT AGENCIES 15 TO PROVIDE PPE TO RIDERS WHO NEED IT, EVEN THOUGH I KNOW A LOT 16 OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE DONE THAT, AC TRANSIT, VTA, SFMTA 17 AND OTHERS, IS THERE ANYWHERE ON THE DASHBOARD WHERE WE CAN GO 18 TO SEE WHICH TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING PPE, PROVIDE PPE 19 TO ALL THE RIDERS WHO NEED IT?

20

THERESE MCMILLAN: AS I MENTIONED, THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. -- THERE WILL BE LINKS TO EVERY SINGLE AGENCY'S COVID-19 WEB PAGE. AND FOR THE AGENCIES THAT DO PROVIDE MASKS, THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE ON THOSE LINKS. I DON'T KNOW IF HANNAH IS -- WOULD COUNTER WHAT I JUST SAID, BUT THAT IS THE



PLACE WHERE THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE AVAILABLE ON A -- FOR 1 2 EACH AGENCY. AND IF PROVIDED IT WOULD BE POSTED THERE. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HANNAH'S BEEN UNMUTED SHE CAN RESPOND. 4 5 SPEAKER: CURRENTLY THAT'S NOT ON THE DASHBOARD ITSELF BUT 6 7 THERE WILL BE A LINK TO THE AGENCY AND ITS COVID RESPONSE. 8 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THE DASHBOARD IS TRYING TO BE A CENTRAL 9 REPOSITORY OF INFORMATION THAT SEEMS CRITICAL ELEMENT MAKING 10 SURE PEOPLE ARE WEARING MASKS AND HAVE ACCESS TO PPE IS THE 11 MOST EFFECTIVE THING THAT WE CAN DO AS A SOCIETY TO PREVENT 12 THE SPREAD OF COVID. SO I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS A NEXT 13 ITERATION OF THIS DASHBOARD. BUT I WOULD REALLY ADDRESS TO 14 INCLUDE THAT INFORMATION IN THE DASHBOARD IF IT'S NOT GOING ON 15 16 THE DASHBOARD GET A REPORT BACK TO THE COMMISSION ON IT. BECAUSE I'M CERTAINLY INTERESTED IN IT AND I THINK WE NEED TO 17 KNOW IF TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE NOT DOING THAT. BECAUSE I DON'T 18 WANT TO ASSUME THAT THEY'RE NOT. BECAUSE THEY MAY ALL BE, BUT 19 I DON'T KNOW THAT. NO ONE HAS TOLD ME THAT. I HAVE BROUGHT 20 THIS UP IN PREVIOUS MEETINGS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND 21 22 THE COMMISSION. IT'S IMPORTANT TO KNOW IF TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE 23 PROVIDING PPE TO RIDERS WHO NEED IT.

24

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YEAH. I THINK THAT CERTAINLY -- I DON'T 1 THINK IT'S A BAD THING TO HAVE, ON THE DASHBOARD SAYING IF 2 3 THEY'RE GIVING OUT MASKS, BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT MASKS ARE AN ORDER, I HEALTH ORDER, AND WE'RE 4 5 ALL SUPPOSED TO BE WEARING MASKS. SO IT'S -- YOU KNOW, I MEAN, BY THE TIME YOU GET TO THE TRANSIT AGENCY, WHETHER IT BE BART 6 OR A BUS, YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO HAVE YOUR MASK ON 30 MINUTES 7 8 BEFORE YOU GOT THERE. BUT I WOULD AGREE THAT, IN A CASE SOMEONE BREAKS OR SOMETHING, THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE SPARE 9 THE AIRS -- SPARES IN MY CAR. IF SOMEONE NEEDS ONE THEY CAN 10 GIVE THEM ONE. MAYBE WE SHOULD TAKE A LOOK AT THAT. SPERING, 11 WORTH, PAPAN. 12

13

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

JAMES P. SPERING: I WANT TO ECHO YOUR COMMENTS MR. CHAIR. I 14 THINK IT'S MISGUIDED TO SAY MTC HAS DONE NOTHING. EVERYBODY 15 16 HAS A TENDENCY TO FORGET THAT THESE ARE THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE DIRECTLY ELECTED BOARDS, THEY'RE APPOINTED BOARDS, MTC 17 HAS ABSOLUTELY NO AUTHORITY OVER THEM. WE CAN CERTAINLY GIVE 18 THEM GUIDANCE AND, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE REOUIRED THEM TO PUT THIS 19 CONSORTIUM TOGETHER, TO WHERE THEY DEVELOPED THIS HEALTH AND 20 21 SAFETY PLAN. I THINK THEY HAVE DONE AN OUTSTANDING JOB. AND IT AMUSES ME THAT THE VERY PEOPLE COMPLAINING ABOUT THIS ARE THE 22 ONES DOING MORE DAMAGE TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS THAN ANYBODY 23 ELSE. THEY KEEP PORTRAYING IT AS UNHEALTHY AND NOT SAFE AND IT 24 JUST ISN'T THE CASE. ALL OF MY TRANSIT AGENCIES REQUIRING 25

Meeting Transcript

**METROPOLITAN** TRANSPORTATION

COMMISSION

September 23, 2020

MASKS FOLLOWING IT STARTING TO GET RIDERSHIP BACK AND MOST 1 COUNTIES ARE DOING THAT. AND YOU KNOW, WE HAVE GOT CARES MONEY 2 3 OUT QUICKLY. WE'RE LOOKING AT THE ORGANIZATION, OPERATIONAL STRUCTURE OF THESE OPERATIONS, AND SO MTC HAS REALLY INVESTED. 4 5 WE'RE ALSO WITH THE CARES MONEY, YOU KNOW, WE'RE PUTTING TOGETHER A MARKETING CAMPAIGN, AND WE'RE LOOKING AT MANY 6 ISSUES. WE'RE GOING TO BE PUTTING TOGETHER SURVEYS TO WHERE 7 8 WE'RE SURVEYING EMPLOYEES, THE RIDERS, WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT A REALTIME CAMPAIGN FOR THE ACTUAL OPERATIONS OF 9 10 THE TRANSIT AND THE HELP PROVIDE THE WAYFINDING FOR THE OPERATORS. DEVELOPING COMMUNICATIONS FOR BOTH RIDERS AND 11 EMPLOYEES. I MEAN, THERE IS A WHOLE PLETHORA OF THINGS THAT 12 MTC IS PUTTING TOGETHER. AND ONE OF THE REASONS WE CAN'T BE 13 THE CONDUIT BETWEEN THE PEOPLE THAT YOU HEAR COMPLAINING AND 14 15 THE OPERATORS, IS THAT WE DON'T HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. AND WE'RE DEVELOPING THIS RELATIONSHIP WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND I 16 THINK IT'S REALLY DEVELOPING, AND MATURING TO WHERE IT'S 17 BECOMING A VERY FUNCTIONAL AND RESPONSIVE RELATIONSHIP TO MAKE 18 THESE CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE FACING, AND I ALSO WANT TO END, 19 MR. CHAIRMAN, MTC DOES NOT HAVE ENOUGH MONEY TO BAIL OUT ONE 20 21 OF THESE AGENCIES MUCH LESS ALL OF THEM. WE DON'T HAVE THE RESOURCES. WE'RE THE PLANNING ORGANIZATION. WE'RE NOT A 22 FUNDING OH THE MONEY TRAVELS THROUGH MTC, AND AS THERESE WILL 23 TELL YOU, WE CAN'T BAIL OUT ANYBODY OR MTC WILL NEED A BAIL 24 OUT. SO WE HAVE TO BE VERY CAUTIOUS AND WE HAVE TO WORK 25

CLOSELY TOGETHER. I DON'T THINK THERE IS A SINGLE PERSON ON 1 THIS COMMISSION THAT DOESN'T WANT TO SAVE EVERY SINGLE JOB WE 2 3 CAN, AND WE'RE PUTTING TOGETHER A STRONG ADVOCACY IN SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON, D.C. AND IT WOULD BE GOOD IF WE 4 5 COULD ALL PULL TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THEE ISSUES BUT THERE IS NO EASY SOLUTION TO THIS. AND MTC IS, YOU KNOW, OUR STAFF IS, 6 WHOING NIGHT AND DAY AND DOING AS MUCH AS THEY CAN TO HELP 7 8 FACILITATE, YOU KNOW, KEEPING THESE TRANSIT OPERATIONS GOING. BUT IT IS A UNIQUE CHALLENGE THAT WE FACE. BUT THE CRITICISM 9 10 TO SAY MTC IS DOING NOTHING JUST IS NOT VALID, AND I THINK IT'S VERY COUNTERPRODUCTIVE IF THEY KEEP HAMMERING ON THESE 11 OPERATIONS WHEN THEY'RE DOING A PRETTY DOG ON GOOD JOB AND 12 WE'RE NOT GETTING SPIKES FROM TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE VIRUS. 13 SO I WOULD JUST HOPE THAT MTC STAYS THE COURSE AND THAT WE 14 15 CONTINUE TO DO EVERYTHING THAT WE CAN IN THE CAPACITY THAT 16 WHAT WE HAVE. THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

17

18 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU MR. SPERING. SPERING.
19 THERESE, I NOTICED YOU'RE IN THE QUEUE DID YOU WANT TO SAY
20 SOMETHING NOW OR DID YOU WANT TO WAIT.

21

22 THERESE MCMILLAN: I COULD SAY SOMETHING AFTER THE

23 COMMISSIONERS HAVE.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24

25 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YOU CHOOSE TO WAIT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO CONCUR WITH THE 2 3 PREVIOUS COMMENTS. I THINK THE COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION WITH ALL OF THE AGENCIES AND MTC HAS BEEN HISTORIC. I LOOK 4 5 BACK AT THE RECORD AND I KNOW MANY OF US SERVED ON TRANSIT BOARDS AND WE CARE DEEPLY ABOUT WORKER OPERATOR SAFETY AND 6 RIDER SAFETY. THIS IS ESSENTIAL IF GETTING OUR SYSTEMS BACK. 7 8 SECOND PIECE IS THE FEDERAL FUNDING. WE ABSOLUTELY NEED ADDITIONAL STATE OR FEDERAL FUNDING TO SUSTAIN THESE 9 OPERATIONS. FINANCIAL CHALLENGES ARE STAGGERING, AND I KNOW 10 THEY'RE KEEPING OUR AGENCIES AWAKE, AND ESPECIALLY THE FINANCE 11 OFFICERS, LATE AT NIGHT, LOOKING AT NUMBERS AND SEEING HOW WE 12 CAN, YOU KNOW, MAINTAIN SERVICES. I DID ACCEPT DAVE'S 13 CHALLENGE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO REPORT, AS I COMMITTED HIM 14 15 TODAY, I AM WORKING ON THAT TASK. AND IT'S STILL IN PROGRESS. 16 I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO TOMORROW. IT'S BIKE TO ANYWHERE DAY. RIDING MY BIKE FROM HOME TO THE BUS, GETTING ON THE BUS AND 17 RIDING BACK HOME AGAIN. I DO THINK OUR BOARD CARES DEEPLY, ALL 18 OF OUR COMMISSIONERS ABOUT RESTORING TRANSIT AND SUPPORTING 19 ALL OF THE TRANSIT INITIATIVE THAT CHAIR SPERING OF THE TASK 20 21 FORCE AND CHAIR HAGGERTY HAVE OUTLINED. ALSO, JUST WANT TO POINT OUT, THAT I THINK THE OTHER THING I WANT TO POINT OUT 22 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE DOING 23 ARE LOOKING AT THE FINANCIAL AND OPERATIONAL ISSUES, WITH THE 24 LENS THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF EQUITY. AND I JUST 25

September 23, 2020

WANTED TO ADD TO OUR COMMENTS FROM OUR CITIZENS ADVISORY 1 COMMITTEE. ONE OF THE AREAS THAT'S PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT IS 2 3 PARATRANSIT. AND I KNOW THAT JUST RECENTLY SEVERAL AGENCIES HAVE ADOPTED A PROGRAM WHERE IN THE PAST, YOU HAD TRANSFERS 4 5 FROM ONE COUNTY TO THE NEXT TO TAKE SOMEBODY FROM HOME TO AN APPOINTMENT. WE'RE NOT PROVIDING A SEAMLESS TRANSPORTATION 6 BETWEEN, FROM ONE JURISDICTION TO ANOTHER. SO, I THINK THOSE 7 8 KINDS OF INNOVATIONS IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF SERVICE AND OPERATIONS AND PROVIDING A SAFE TRAVELING ENVIRONMENT. I AGREE 9 WITH THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE AND WANT TO ASSURE 10 EVERYONE I THINK WE ALL WANT TO AND ARE CONTINUING TO WORK 11 HARD TO SUPPORT TRANSIT AND TO ENSURE ITS SURVIVAL DURING THIS 12 CRISIS TIME. SO THANK YOU. 13 14 15 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH, AND I 16 ASSUME YOU'LL BE ROCKING THE NEW E-BIKE TOMORROW. 17 AMY R. WORTH: I WILL. I WILL. SO I CAN GET BACK UP THE HILL 18 WHEN I GET HOME. 19 20 21 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I UNDERSTAND THAT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN. 22 23 GINA PAPAN: YES. VERY WELL SAID BY PRIOR COMMISSIONERS THERE. I WISH WE HAD MORE ABILITY TO MAKE THESE AGENCIES ACCOUNTABLE 24 BUT AS POINTED OUT, THE AGENCIES AND THE BOARDS ARE THE ONES 25

September 23, 2020

MAKING DECISIONS AT THIS POINT IN TIME. AND AS SPERING POINTED
 OUT WE HAVE LEGISLATORS ON THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION ASK WE
 ARE TALKING ABOUT LEGISLATION IF THAT NEEDS TO BE THE WAY TO
 MAKE THEM MORE ACCOUNTABLE BUT WE'RE DOING THE BEST WE CAN DO
 ASSURE SUSTAINABILITY THERE ISN'T ENOUGH MONEY IN THE RECOVERY
 SO PLEASE WORK WITH US AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN MAKE SHOULD
 DIFFERENCE HERE. THANK YOU.

8

9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN? 10

11 THERESE MCMILLAN: MAYBE JUST TO WRAP UP. APPRECIATE HEARING 12 ALL THE COMMENTS. I WOULD SAY THAT, AGAIN, AS A REMINDER, THE 13 DASH -- CAN YOU HEAR ME -- I'M SORRY -- GOSH -- I -- OKAY --14 I'M UNMUTED -- I THINK I'M UNMUTING MYSELF AT THE SAME TIME 15 KIMBERLY --

16

17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: NO YOU'RE WORKING FINE. SOMEBODY CAME 18 OVER YOU.

19

THERESE MCMILLAN: SO, AGAIN, APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS FROM
EVERYONE. A COUPLE OF THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO CLARIFY. FIRST,
THAT, AS A REMINDER, THE DASHBOARD IS DEVELOPED BY THE TRANSIT
OPERATORS THEY DEVELOP IT CONTROL IT ARE COLLECTING THE DATA
ET CETERA I CAN BRING FORWARD TO THEM THE COMMENTS THAT
COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS HAVE MENTIONED ABOUT MASKS

AND AVAILABILITY OF THAT INFORMATION SOMEHOW IN THE DASHBOARD. 1 SO I WILL COMMUNICATE THAT BACK TO THEM. IN ADDITION, BEING 2 3 WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION ABOUT OPERATING REVENUE, AT THE LAST BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE MEETING THAT SEVERAL OF THE 4 5 SPEAKERS IN FACT ARE A MEMBER OF, IT HAD BEEN ONE OF THE MAJOR THINGS THAT WAS DISCUSSED AT THAT TIME, WAS THE FISCAL CLIFF. 6 AND THE IMPLICATIONS THAT IT HAD FOR SERVICES, AND THE TRANSIT 7 8 OPERATORS THEMSELVES, SPECIFICALLY POINTED TO THE NEED TO HAVE A SURVIVAL STAGE, IF YOU WILL, A CONTINUING RECOVERY STAGE 9 10 THAT WILL HAVE TO MOVE ALONGSIDE ANY DISCUSSIONS WE HAVE ABOUT REBUILDING, AS PART OF THE TASK FORCE'S AGENDA. AND AT THAT 11 TIME, THERE WAS A REQUEST FOR MTC STAFF TO BE ABLE TO BRING 12 FORWARD, BACK TO THE TASK FORCE, A CLARIFICATION OF WHAT 13 OPERATING REVENUE EXISTS, AND WHAT FLEXIBILITIES MIGHT THERE 14 15 BE TO BRING OTHER SOURCES TO BEAR TO SUPPLEMENT THOSE GIVEN 16 THE FACT THAT THERE ARE THESE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES FACING NOT ONLY THE OPERATORS HERE, BUT EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE 17 STATE AND MANY ACROSS THE COUNTRY. SO, WE DID COMMIT TO 18 BRINGING THAT INFORMATION BACK TO THE NEXT BLUE RIBBON TASK 19 FORCE, AND ABSENT OTHER DIRECTION FROM COMMISSIONERS TODAY, 20 21 THAT WOULD BE WHERE WE WOULD BRING THAT INFORMATION. SO, THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. 22

23

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR
25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?



1 THERESE MCMILLAN: YES IT DOES. THANK YOU. 2 3 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I'M GOING TO DO SOMETHING I NEVER DO. 4 5 SAM, YOU MAY WANT TO CHANGE YOUR NAME. YOU DON'T LOOK LIKE 6 ESTELLA. 7 8 SAM LICCARDO: THANK YOU. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I AM ALLOWING TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. 10 11 THEN WE'RE DONE WITH PUBLIC HEARING ON THIS ISSUE. JUDITH, UNMUTE YOURSELF AND SPEAK. YOUR HAND IS DOWN NOW. SO I'M 12 ASSUMING YOU'RE DONE. 13 14 SPEAKER: HELLO. I AM JUDITH. I HAVE BEEN ASKED TO JOIN THE 15 16 MEETING REGARDING CONCERNS OF ONE OF OUR OPERATORS WHO TESTED POSITIVE FOR COVID-19. I WISH TO SHARE WITH YOU, THAT THE 17 CONTRACT IS WITH TRISTAR RISK MANAGEMENT WHO HANDLES ALL WORK 18 COMP MATTERS FOR VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY INCLUDING 19 FULL INVESTIGATIONS TO DETERMINE COMPENSABILITY. ON THE 20 21 INSTANCE AT HAND THE DATE OF INJURY WAS AUGUST 14TH INCIDENT 22 INVOLVED AN UNRULY PASSENGER THAT RESULTED IN THE ARREST OF 23 THE PASSENGER. WE WERE ABLE TO COMPILE THE COACH DATA, FILES AND VIDEO AND WERE ABLE TO DETERMINE THE OPERATOR AND THE 24 PASSENGER WERE WEARING FACE MASKS WHEN THE ENCOUNTER OCCURRED 25

September 23, 2020

THAT THE OPERATOR WAS PROTECTED BY A COACH SHIELD. THERE WAS 1 NO CLOSE CONTACT BETWEEN THE PASSENGER AND THIS -- AND THE 2 3 OPERATOR. PASSENGER WAS ARRESTED BY THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, AND TWO TESTS WERE PERFORMED ON THE 4 5 PASSENGER THAT DETERMINED THAT HE WAS FREE FROM COVID-19. BASED ON THE CIRCUMSTANCES INVOLVED, OUR THIRD PARTY CLAIMS 6 ADMINISTRATOR STARS RISK DENIED THE CLAIM AS COMPENENSIBLE. 7 8 THANK YOU.

9

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. OKAY WITH THEY WILL NOW 10 LEAVE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT AND THANK HER FOR THAT 11 COMPREHENSIVE REPORT AND NOTE YOU WILL BE TAKING THINGS BACK 12 TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AS WAS STATED BY NICK. IT'S A START. 13 IT'S A WORK IN PROGRESS. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO COMMISSIONER 14 15 COMMENTS AND HOPE THAT MANY OF YOU ARE PRETTY MUCH COMMENTED 16 OUT AT THIS POINT. ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE ARE. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO ITEM SIX. CONSENT CALENDAR. DO I 17 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE CONSENT? IS 18

19

20 JAKE MACKENZIE: SO MOVED MR. CHAIR.

21

22 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: SECOND, DUTRA-VERNACI.

23

24 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I HAVE A MOTION BY MACKENZIE AND SECOND 25 BY DUTRA-VERNACI. I WILL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE IS ANYBODY WHO

September 23, 2020

1 HAS -- IF SHE'S RECEIVED ANY ITEMS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT 2 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM. I'LL ALSO ASK THE PUBLIC TO USE THE 3 RAISE HAND FEATURE OR STAR NINE. YOU'RE GOING TO GET TWO 4 MINUTES TO SPEAK AND THEN WE'LL DO A ROLL CALL. SO WITH THAT, 5 I NOTICED WE HAVE ONE ATTENDEE. DO YOU HAVE ANY WRITTEN --6

7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE -- SORRY -- I HAVE NO WRITTEN
8 PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM. AND I DO SEE THE ONE MEMBER OF
9 THE PUBLIC WITH THE RAISED HAND. JOHN COURTNEY. PLEASE UNMUTE
10 YOURSELF.

11

SPEAKER: YEAH THIS IS JOHN COURTNEY FROM ATU. I WANT TO THANK 12 VTA. I WISH I HAD THAT POWER TO DISAPPEAR EIGHT BOARD MEETING. 13 THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. I WAS NOT ABLE TO GET ANY 14 INFORMATION PRIOR. IT WAS MY IMPRESSION THAT AN ASSAULT TOOK 15 16 PLACE. WERE SAFETY REGULATIONS VIOLATED. I IMPLORE VTA TO SIT DOWN WITH US SO WE CAN WORK ON SOME OF THESE CASES WHERE THE 17 FRUSTRATION LEVEL AND THE FAMILIES AND RELATIVES ARE CALLING 18 THE UNION AND CALLING THE COMPANY. SIT DOWN WITH US LET'S TALK 19 ABOUT THESE CASES ON AN INDIVIDUAL BASIS WE HAVE A MEETING 20 WITH THE GENERAL MANAGER NEXT WEEK AND WE DID AGENDAIZE THOSE 21 22 ITEMS. I WANT TO THANK VTA FOR BRINGING RISK MANAGEMENT INTO 23 THIS CONVERSATION. I APPRECIATE THAT.

24

September 23, 2020

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WE'RE ON CONSENT NOW. WE HAVE KIND OF 1 MOVED O THANK YOU JOHN. OKAY. SO WITH THAT I HAD A MOTION. I 2 3 BELIEVE IT WAS MACKENZIE DUTRA-VERNACI. FINE SCOTTISH DUO. WITH THAT I'LL CALL FOR A ROLL CAUGHT VOTE, PLEASE. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES. 6 7 8 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WE'LL MOVE TO 7A AND B PROGRAMMING AND 9 ALLOCATIONS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. 10 11 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: JUST PULLING UP MY SCRIPT BECAUSE I NEVER KNOW WHAT TO SAY UNLESS SOMEONE TELLS ME EXACTLY WHAT TO 12 SAY. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY 13 SEPTEMBER 9TH 2020, AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO THE 14 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. MTC RESOLUTION 4402 REVISED UPDATES 15 16 FUND ESTIMATE TO INCORPORATE FY 19/20 REVENUE FOR THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMS AND 17 18 REVISED FY 20/21 REVENUE ESTIMATES. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC 19 RESOLUTION 4402 REVISED. I CAN ALSO MOVE THE SECOND ONE AT THE SAME TIME IF YOU WANT TO CHAIR HAGGERTY. 20 21 22 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: NICK, WE CAN TRY THAT. BUT WE ALWAYS 23 GET IN TROUBLE WHEN WE DO IT. GO AHEAD.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: MTC RESOLUTIONS 4429 REVISED 4430 1 REVISED, 4431 REVISED, AND 4432 REVISED TO ALLOCATE \$139 2 MILLION IN FY 2021 TDA, STA, RM2 AND AB 1107 FUNDS TO FIVE 3 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY TO 4 5 SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION IN ADDITION A RECISSION ACTION OF \$5.6 MILLION IN STA FUNDS 6 FROM MTC'S CLIPPER PROGRAM TO ALLOW FOR THE REDIRECTION OF 7 8 THESE FUNDS TO THE CLIPPER START MEANS BASED FARE PILOT. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION, 4429 REVISED, 4430 REVISED, 9 4431 REVISED, AND 4432 REVISED. 10 11 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I'LL SECOND THOSE. 12 13 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I DON'T SEE ANYBODY WISHING TO SPEAK. 14 15 ANYTHING SUBMITTED IN WRITING KIMBERLY? 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT. 17 18 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ROLL CALL VOTE. 19 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES. 21 22 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVE TO ITEM 8A 23 JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING WITH THE ABAG 24 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER SPERING. 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN, THE JOINT MTC 2 3 PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET ON SEPTEMBER 11TH AND THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE REFERRED ONE 4 5 ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THIS IS AN AGENDA ITEM 8A, MTC RESOLUTION 4437, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL 6 7 BLUEPRINT. REVISIONS DISCUSSED IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 8 FINAL BLUEPRINT. SUMMER 2020 ENGAGEMENT AND PROPOSED REVISION. RESOLUTION ADOPTS THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST. STAFF WILL 9 THEN ANALYZE THIS PACKAGE EVER FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AND 10 REPORT BACK ON FORECASTED OUTCOMES BY THE END OF 2020. AT 11 WHICH TIME, STAFF WILL SEEK APPROVAL OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS 12 PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 13 2050 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT. THE COMMITTEE'S UNANIMOUS 14 RECOMMENDATION APPROVAL OF THE ITEM TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE 15 16 BOARD AND COMMISSION WITH AN AMENDMENT FROM COMMISSIONER LICCARDO REQUESTING PRIORITIZATION OF FUNDING FOR CALTRAIN 17 18 GRADE SEPARATIONS FOR PROJECTS THAT SERVE THE DUAL PURPOSE OF CONNECTING HIGH SPEED RAIL TO THE BAY AREA IN IMPROVING THE 19 CALTRAIN SYSTEM. THIS AMENDMENT WAS REFERRED TO IN THE 20 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. I BELIEVE YOU ALL RECEIVED A COPY OF 21 THE BACKGROUND MATERIAL, 8A, IT WAS A PRETTY GOOD DESCRIPTION 22 23 AND I BELIEVE MATT MALONEY IS GOING TO GIVE US A BRIEF PRESENTATION. AND I THINK IT'S A PRETTY GOOD COMPROMISE THAT 24 WAS WORKED OUT WITH COMMISSIONER LICCARDO AND STAFF. 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

MATT MALONEY: GOOD MORNING MATT MALONEY JOINED BY DAVE VAUTIN. 2 3 MTC AND ABAG MET JOINTLY IN REFERRING AN ACTION TO YOU TODAY THIS REFERS A MAJOR MILESTONE IN WORK YOU HAVE BEEN ENGAGED 4 5 WITH EVERY STEP OF THE WAY. ACTION BEFORE TO YOU TODAY IS TO APPROVE A SET OF STRATEGY FOR THE FORECASTED PLANNED BAY AREA 6 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT ONCE APPROVED WE WILL MOVE FORWARD TO 7 8 ANNOUNCE THE FINAL RESULTS IN DECEMBER AND ANNOUNCE THE PLAN AS WE MOVE INTO THE FINAL PROCESS. WE ALSO MADE SIMILAR 9 DETAILED PRESENTATIONS TO THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND 10 THE ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE. LASTLY, I WILL MENTION 11 THAT THIS ITEM, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WAS ALSO APPROVED BY YOUR 12 COLLEAGUES OVER AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD LAST WEEK. PLANNED 13 BAY AREA 2050 IS A LONG RANGE 30 YEAR PLAN ENSURING THAT THE 14 BAY AREA IS CONNECT, DIVERSE, HEALTHY CONNECT AND VIBRANT FOR 15 16 ALL. REPORT INCLUDED FEEDBACK FROM THE PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS RECEIVED OVER THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER. COVID-19 PANDEMIC 17 MEANT THAT WE HAD TO RECALIBRATE OUR OUTREACH STRATEGY TO 18 VIRTUAL ENVIRONMENT. WE HELD NINE COUNTY SPECIFIC WORKSHOPS 19 THREE DIGITAL STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS 20 AND SEVEN FOCUS GROUPS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY-BASED 21 22 ORGANIZATIONS RAN A STATISTICALLY VALID POLL IN ALL NINE COUNTIES BASED ON STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. 23 POLL RESULTS WERE SHARED AND DISCUSSED WITH MTC PLANNING 24 COMMITTEE AS PART OF THE ITEM EARLIER THIS MONTH. RESULTING IN 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

7600 PARTICIPANT IN ALL ACTIVITIES IN 3600 COMMENTS RECEIVED. 1 OUR BIGGEST CHALLENGES IN THE BLUEPRINT CONCERNS THAT ROSE TO 2 3 THE TOP AFFORDABILITY ON THE HOUSING FRONT AND CONCERNS ABOUT GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION IN CLIMATE CHANGE. WE BELIEVE THE 4 5 FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES BEFORE YOU TODAY HELPS TACKLE THOSE INVESTMENT IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION 6 7 AND JUMP-STARTING DEVELOPMENT ON PUBLICLY OWNED AND COMMUNITY 8 LAND ON HOMES. GAP WE FACE IN THE REGION IS A SERIOUS HILL TO CLIMB. OUR ROLE AS A REGION IS FOR THIS PLAN TO ACHIEVE A 9 FORECASTED 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA GHG REDUCTION BY THE YEAR 10 2035. THIS MUST BE ACCOMPLISHED THROUGH GHG REDUCTIONS FROM 11 CARS AND LIGHT DUTY TRUCKS THE STRATEGIES MUST BE ONES THAT 12 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE POISED TO DELIVER WE CAN'T TAKE CREDIT 13 FOR MANY OF THE CHANGES MADE ON THE STATEWIDE NATIONAL OR 14 15 INTERNATIONAL LEVEL WE MUST INCLUDE POLICIES AND INVESTMENT 16 THAT SHOW WHAT THE REGION CAN DO TO MEET THE GOAL. OUR STRATEGY FOR ACHIEVING THE GHG GOAL THIS TIME IS EVERYTHING 17 18 INCLUDING THE KITCHEN SINK. STRATEGIES ARE INDEED BOLD AND UNFLINCHING TO USE THE COMMISSIONARY TERMINOLOGY. STARTING 19 POINT FOR ACHIEVING THIS IS AN EXTREMELY FOCUSED PATTERN OF 20 HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH BASED AROUND PROXIMITY TO HIGH OUALITY 21 22 TRANSIT SERVICE HOWEVER THIS ALONE WILL NOT BE SUFFICIENT TO 23 REACH THE TARGET THEREFORE WE HAVE INCLUDED NEW STRATEGIES SUCH AS ROBUST TELEWORK STRATEGY AND INCREASED EMPHASIS ON THE 24 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM TO COMPLIMENT THE LAND USE PATTERN AND 25

September 23, 2020

THE PLAN'S MAJOR INVESTMENT IN PUBLIC TRANSIT. THESE 1 STRATEGIES TAKEN AS A WHOLE ARE GAME CHANGING AND AS STAFF OUR 2 3 VIEW IS THAT THESE STRATEGIES ARE ABSOLUTELY NECESSARY COMPONENTS TO ACHIEVING OUR GHG GOAL. COMMITTEES UNANIMOUSLY 4 5 RECOMMENDED APPROVAL OF THIS ITEM TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND COMMISSION WITH AN AMENDMENT FROM COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. 6 7 AT THIS POINT I WANT TO TOUCH ON THAT AMENDMENT. AT COMMITTEE 8 OUR TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES INCLUDED A ROBUST SET OF 9 INVESTMENTS SERVING THE SOUTH BAY WHICH IS POISED TO RECEIVE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF GROWTH IN THIS PLAN. THOSE INVESTMENTS 10 11 INCLUDED A MIX OF COUNTY AND REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING FOR CALTRAIN, HIGH SPEED RAIL INVESTMENTS THROUGHOUT THE 12 CORRIDOR AS WELL AS RAMPED UP INVESTMENTS IN THE VTA LIGHT 13 RAIL SYSTEM IN RESPONSE TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO'S AMENDMENT 14 ACTIVITY STAFF HAS CLARIFIED SPECIFICS OF SOME OF THE FUNDING 15 16 WHICH IS ASSIGNED IN THE PLAN FIRST WE ARE CLARIFYING THAT 4.1 BILLION IN REGIONAL FUNDING FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS CAN ALSO BE 17 USED FOR OTHER MODERNIZATION EFFORTS THAT BENEFIT CALTRAIN AND 18 THE HIGH SPEED RAIL ON THE EXTENT OF THE CORRIDOR. WE ALSO 19 EXPANDED THE TOTAL AMOUNT OF FUNDING ASSIGNED FOR CALTRAIN AND 20 HIGH SPEED RAIL CAPITAL PROJECTS BY 3 BILLION. THIS WAS DONE 21 22 BY REDUCING THE SCOPE OF NORTH SAN JOSE VTA LIGHT RAIL TO A 23 COMMENSURATE AMOUNT. THAT WOULD BE ASSIGNED SPECIFICALLY TO THE SEGMENT SOUTH OF TAMIEN STATION AND COULD BE USED FOR A 24 POTENTIAL ARRAY OF INVESTMENTS. 7.1 BILLION IN REGIONAL 25

September 23, 2020

DISCRETIONARY FUNDING INCLUDES HIGH SPEED RAIL DUAL PURPOSE 1 INVESTMENTS FROM SOUTH TO NORTH TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS 2 3 IDENTIFIED BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO RELATED TO THIS MOTION. FURTHERMORE THIS 7.1 BILLION IN FUNDING COULD SEPARATE GRADE 4 5 INTEGRATIONS SOUTH OF DIRIDON IN SAN JOSE. LASTLY WE WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE REGION'S EXISTING COMMITMENT TO A BLENDED 6 7 SYSTEM ON THE PENINSULA CORRIDOR THIS AGREEMENT MEMORIALIZED 8 IN A NINE PARTY MOU IDENTIFIES INVESTMENTS IN THE TRANSIT IN 9 SAN JOSE GIVEN THIS PROPOSED AMENDMENT WOULD ASSIGN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY INVESTMENT TO THE 10 11 CORRIDOR SOUTH OF TAMIEN STATION MTC STAFF WOULD ENCOURAGE NINE PARTIES TO COOPERATE ON POTENTIAL UPDATES TO THE MOU TO 12 INCORPORATE THE EXPANDED GEOGRAPHIC. OUR RECOMMENDATION TODAY 13 IS TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4437 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL 14 15 FURTHERMORE WE ALSO RECOMMEND MTC WORK WITH THE OTHER MEMBERS 16 OF THE NINE PARTY MOU UPDATE THE AGREEMENT WITH THE BAY AREA INTEGRATE CALTRAIN CORRIDOR SOUTH OF SAN JOSE AND ANY OTHER 17 ADJUSTMENTS DEEMED NECESSARY. 18

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE CHAIR IS MUTED. MR. CHAIR.

21

ALFREDO PEDROZA: KIMBERLY, I THINK HE STEPPED OUT FOR A
SECOND. I WILL JUMP RIGHT IN. AND I'LL ASK CHAIR SPERING DO
YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO REPORT UNDER YOUR CHAIR COMMITTEE
REPORT.



1 2 JAMES P. SPERING: I'LL MAKE A MOTION. 3 ALFREDO PEDROZA: I'LL OPEN IT UP FOR COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. WE 4 5 HAVE A FEW. I'M GOING TO START WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN. 6 7 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. JUST FOR CLARIFICATION, ON 8 THAT LAST AMENDMENT PROPOSED BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, SO, THE 9 EXISTING FUNDING FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS THROUGHOUT SAN MATEO 10 COUNTY IS -- WHERE IS THAT? 11 MATT MALONEY: THOSE EXISTING GRADE SEPARATIONS ARE INCLUDED IN 12 THE PROJECT LIST OF THE PLAN. THERE ARE \$5.7 BILLION IN THE 13 PLAN FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS AND MODERNIZATION ALONG THE 14 ENTIRETY OF THE CORRIDOR. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO DOES 15 16 STIPULATE THAT AN ADDITIONAL 3 BILLION ON TOP OF THAT AMOUNT WOULD BE DEDICATED TO INVESTMENTS SOUTH OF TAMIEN. 17 18 19 GINA PAPAN: SO NO DEFERMENT OF FUNDS FOR THE REST OF THE GRADE CROSSINGS? 20 21 22 MATT MALONEY: NO. 23



GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. MR. CHAIR, BEFORE 1 2 THIS GETS AHEAD, I HAVE ISSUES RELATED TO THE PLAN SHOULD I 3 ADDRESS THEM NOW? 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA: I THINK CHAIR HAGGERTY IS BACK. GO AHEAD. 6 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: MY VICE CHAIR IS GOING TO SAY IF 7 8 THEY'RE RELEVANT TO THIS ITEM GO AHEAD AND GO. 9 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD ASK THAT WE ADD AN 10 AMENDMENT, CAN YOU PLEASE INCLUDE AIRPORT IN THE MAPPING OF 11 THE PLAN? FOR SOME REASON THAT KEEPS GETTING LEFT OUT. I WAS 12 TOLD THAT IMPROVING ACCESS TO AIRPORTS IS PART OF THE PLAN. 13 SO, BUT IT JUST SEEMS RIDICULOUS THAT WE DO NOT INCLUDE MAJOR 14 15 ASPECTS, AND THOSE ARE THE THREE AIRPORTS ON THE DIAGRAM. 16 THAT'S ONE PRIMARY ISSUE THERE. SECONDARILY THERE WAS A 17 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE CITY OF BRISBANE, AND I, FOR ONE, AM VERY, VERY HESITANT TO GO AHEAD WITH A PLAN THAT SAYS WE'RE 18 GOING TO BE WORKING IT OUT WITH CITIES. WE SHOULD HAVE DONE 19 THAT AT A PRIOR TIME HERE. TO BE SPECIFIC THE LAND THAT 20 21 BRISBANE HAS DOUBLES THE POPULATION SIZE AND WHAT IS BEING PROPOSED IN THE PLAN FAR EXCEEDS THAT AND INCLUDES LAND WHICH 22 IS NOT DEVELOPABLE. IT IS TOXIC, AND HAZARDOUS. SO, YOU KNOW, 23 I'M FRUSTRATED BY THE FACT THAT THEY'RE BEING ASSESSED A HUGE 24 NUMBER OF HOUSING UNITS WHERE YOU CANNOT BUILD ON THERE AND IN 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ADDITION THAT, THERE IS A REPRESENTATION THAT STAFF SEEMS TO 1 BE ACCEPTING THAT, OH, EVERYBODY'S GOING TO WORK IT OUT WITH 2 3 HIGH SPEED RAIL. WELL, WE HAVE ALL TRIED THAT AND I DON'T THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE. RIGHT NOW HIGH SPEED RAIL HAS SAID 4 5 THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE THAT LAND FROM BRISBANE AND ALSO SAID THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE LAND FROM MILLBRAE, SO TO SAY IN THE 6 PLAN WHICH GOES TEN YEARS FORWARD HERE, THAT WE STILL HAVE 7 8 CERTAIN HOUSING REQUIREMENTS ON LAND WHICH IS BASICALLY TRYING TO BE TAKEN BY HIGH SPEED RAIL, CAN SOMEONE PLEASE ADDRESS 9 10 THAT FOR ME? >DAVE VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THIS IS DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE PLANNING TEAM AT MTC. I WANT TO ADDRESS BOTH 11 OF YOUR POINTS. I THINK WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO INDICATE THE 12 AIRPORTS ON FUTURE MAPS THAT WE INCLUDE IN THE PLANNED BAY 13 AREA 2050 DOCUMENT SO WE'LL RECOGNIZE THAT AND WE'LL MAKE THAT 14 CORRECTION GOING FORWARD. WITH REGARDS TO THE CITY OF 15 16 BRISBANE, ALL CITIES IN THE REGION HAD AN EXTENSIVE PERIOD OF TIME TO REVIEW INPUT DATA TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO AN 17 INITIATIVE CALLED BASAS THIS OCCURRED OVER A FOUR TO 6 MONTH 18 PERIOD IN 2019 WHERE JURISDICTIONS COULD DIG INTO THE DATA AND 19 GIVE FEEDBACK. WE DIDN'T GET ANY FEEDBACK ON SOME OF THESE 20 PARCELS IN OUESTION FROM BRISBANE DURING THAT JUNCTURE AND 21 22 BRISBANE DID RAISE THIS OVER THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER AND WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO CLARIFY THE SPECIFIC PARCEL AND USES. 23 WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THEM ON THAT. WE DIDN'T GET THE 24 FEEDBACK DURING THE COMMENT PERIOD DURING THAT PERIOD IN 2019 25



WE'RE LOOKING TO FIND A RESOLUTION TO THAT IN THE FINAL
 BLUEPRINT PHASE NOW.

3

GINA PAPAN: THE WORD YOU USED WAS FINAL. AND THAT CONCERNS ME. 4 5 WE'RE BEING ASKED TO APPROVE A FINAL HERE. THIS CONCERNS ME YOU'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO CHANGE THE FACT THAT THE LAND 6 IS CURRENTLY UNUSABLE FOR HOUSING. IT'S TOXIC. I'M LOOKING FOR 7 8 AN AMENDMENT THAT ADDRESSES THAT NOW. IS THAT POSSIBLE? >DAVE VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER, I THINK THE ISSUE IS WE HAVE NOT 9 RECEIVED ENOUGH INFORMATION ABOUT THE SPECIFIC PARCELS FROM 10 BRISBANE AND WE'RE CONTINUING TO TALK TO THEM ABOUT THAT. 11 WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO REMOVE PERMANENTLY INDUSTRIAL PARCELS 12 LIKE THE PG&E SUBSTATION AND THE POTENTIAL HIGH SPEED RAIL 13 YARD ON THE LANDS YOU'RE REFERRING TO HOWEVER THERE ARE A 14 NUMBER OF LANDS THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED IN THE CITY AS THE 15 16 BAY LANDS SITE FOR FUTURE HOUSING THAT REMAIN CRITICAL PIECES OF THE PUZZLE HERE. SO WE CAN COMMIT TO CONTINUING THAT 17 DIALOGUE WITH THEM AS WE CONDUCT THE ANALYSIS OF THIS FINAL 18 BLUEPRINT, OR WE WOULD WANT TO WORK TOWARDS A RESOLUTION THIS 19 FALL BEFORE WE COME BACK TO YOU IN DECEMBER ON THE FINAL 20 21 BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES.

22

23 GINA PAPAN: OKAY. PLEASE. I NEED THAT RESOLUTION BECAUSE
24 EVIDENTLY THEY WORKED IT OUT WITH THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE. FINAL
25 NOTE HERE IS THE REQUIREMENT THAT 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS

TELECOMMUTE. AND, THERE IS NO -- I MEAN -- IT WAS MENTIONED 1 2 EARLIER, THE IMPACT THAT MIGHT HAVE, WELL, THE BRIDGES, ALSO, 3 THE IMPACT THAT IT HAS ON VARIOUS COMPANIES, AS WELL AS THE FACT THAT WE'RE NOT EVEN SAYING AS AN ALTERNATIVE OR ENCOURAGE 4 5 THEM TO GET ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SO, IT'S JUST KIND OF --IT'S A TOO GENERAL STATEMENT WITHOUT ANY MODIFICATION TO 6 ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AS AN 7 8 ALTERNATIVE, OR JUST, I CAN'T SUPPORT THIS IN THE WAY IT'S CURRENTLY WRITTEN. I GUESS, I GET THE POINT, GREENHOUSE 9 GASSES, WE WANT THAT -- WE DON'T WANT THAT. WE WANT TO REDUCE 10 11 THEM. BUT JUST TO SAY OUTRIGHT WE'RE GOING TO REQUIRE 60 PERCENT TO TELECOMMUTE. THAT'S PROBLEMATIC. SO I HAVE 12 DIFFICULTY SUPPORTING THAT AND AS A LAST NOTE -- SORRY MR. 13 CHAIRMAN -- I CAN'T FIND IT I'LL HAVE TO COME BACK TO IT. I 14 15 DON'T WANT TO HOLD EVERYBODY UP.

16

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WELL, WE'LL SEE HOW THAT GOES. GOING TO 18 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

19

20 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I JUST WANTED TO LET EVERYBODY KNOW THAT
21 RATHER THAN GETTING A HAIRCUT, I HAVE PUT ON A HAT. SAME
22 PURPOSE.

23

24 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THAT WAS A COUPLE MEETINGS AGO.



COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO WE GET A --1 2 3 SAM LICCARDO: I STILL SUPPORT THE HAIRCUT. 4 5 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I HAVE LOCAL CONTROL OVER MY OWN HAIR. SO, I'M -- YOU KNOW, WE GET TO THE END OF THESE PROCESSES, AND 6 I THINK WE FOCUS ON THE THINGS THAT AREN'T RIGHT WITH THE PLAN 7 8 BUT I WANT TO START OFF BY COMMENDING STAFF FOR DOING AN INCREDIBLE JOB IN A DIFFICULT MOMENT IN A THORNY SET OF ISSUES 9 TO SET BROADLY ASPIRATIONAL VISIONS OF HOW WE GET TO THE 10 PROBLEMS IN OUR REGION. I THINK IT'S A REALLY POWERFUL 11 DOCUMENT. I ALSO WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER LICCARDO FOR 12 RAISING THE ISSUES AROUND HIGH SPEED RAIL BECAUSE I THINK THIS 13 REGION REALLY NEEDS A PLAN FOR HOW WE GET HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO 14 15 OUR REGION. AND IF WE JUST SIT ON OUR HANDS AND WAIT FOR THE TRAIN TO COME, WE'LL BE WAITING A LONG TIME, AND IT'S 16 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE COME TOGETHER AS A REGION TO MAKE 17 -- TO DO WHAT WE CAN TO MAKE SURE IT COMES HERE AND COMES HERE 18 FIRST. SO, HAVING SAID THAT, AND YOU MAY HAVE ALREADY SAID 19 THIS MATT, BUT I HAVE BEEN A BIT CONFUSED BY THESE LAST MINUTE 20 21 CHANGES, AND I GET INTO THE SORT OF EDITS OF THIS ELEMENT LAST NIGHT, THE \$4 BILLION, JUST, RUN MU THROUGH WHERE THAT'S --22 HOW -- WHERE THAT'S GOING, AND WHAT ITS PRIORITIZED FOR, AND 23 WHAT DOES PRIORITIZATION MEAN? DOES THAT MEAN WE'RE GOING TO 24 MARCH OUR WAY UP FROM THE SOUTH AND NOT FUND ANY PROJECTS FROM 25



THE NORTH UNTIL WE FUND PROJECTS FROM THE SOUTH. HOW DOES THAT 1 2 WORK? 3 MATT MALONEY: WE HAVE A SLIDE, I'LL ASK KIMBERLY WARD, IF YOU 4 5 HAVE THAT SLIDE, TO POP IT UP ON THE SCREEN OR TECH SUPPORT IF 6 THAT'S APPROPRIATE. 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. 9 MATT MALONEY: I'M HOPING EVERYONE CAN SEE THIS SLIDE. I'LL 10 KEEP THIS UP AND DAVE VAUTIN FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN AND AUGMENT 11 ANYTHING I MISSED. WHAT WE'RE SHOWING HERE IS ESSENTIALLY THE 12 CHANGES WE HAVE MADE THIS MONTH BETWEEN THE COMMITTEE ITEM AND 13 THE COMMISSION ITEM. SO YOU WILL NOTICE, IN THE TOP BAR, THERE 14 15 IS A SET OF INVESTMENTS FOR CALTRAIN HIGH SPEED RAIL SYSTEM 16 WIDE GRADE SEPARATIONS. THERE IS SOME COUNTY BUDGET DOLLARS ASSIGNED TO THAT IN THE PLAN, BOTH FROM SAN MATEO AND SANTA 17 CLARA. AS WELL AS 4.1 MILLION REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY. OVER ON 18 THE RIGHT SIDE IN BETWEEN AND YELLOW, YOU WILL SEE THERE IS A 19 SET OF INVESTMENTS INCLUDED FOR VTA LIGHT RAIL NORTH SAN JOSE 20 21 MOD AND DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE MODERNIZATION. BOTTOM INDICATES WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING TODAY INCLUDING THE AMENDMENT OF COMMISSIONER 22 LICCARDO. ESSENTIALLY, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT IS 23 THE BLACK PARENTHESIS ON THE BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN THAT SHOWS 24 OF THE 7.1 BILLION IN THE EXPANSION TO 7.1 IS DONE IN PART BY 25

September 23, 2020

A DOWN SCOPING OF THE VTA LIGHT RAIL NORTH SAN JOSE MOD 1 PROJECT. THAT PROJECT IS STILL IN THE PLAN IT JUST DOES NOT 2 3 ASSUME SOME OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE IN SERVICE THAT WOULD GO INTO IT. THAT 3 BILLION COMES OVER FROM VTA THAT BECOMES 7 4 5 BILLION AND WE HAVE A BIGGER AMOUNT OF INVESTMENTS BUT KEY POINT MINIMUM AMOUNT 3 BILLION WOULD BE USED FOR CALTRAIN AND 6 HIGH SPEED RAIL SOUTH OF TAMIEN. DAVE, IF THERE IS ANYTHING I 7 8 MISSED THERE THAT I SHOULD HAVE POINTED OUT THAT I DIDN'T 9 PLEASE POINT IT OUT. 10 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COULD YOU POINT OUT HOW YOU SEEING IT 11 APPLIED. 12 13 MATT MALONEY: WHEN YOU SAY PRIORITIZATION IN THE STRATEGIES. 14 15 16 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I DON'T HAVE IT IN FRONT OF ME. IT SAID 17 PRIORITIZATION --18 19 SAM LICCARDO: ATTACHMENT "I" MAY BE HELPFUL. IT'S PAGE 12 OF ATTACHMENT "I." 20 21 22 MATT MALONEY: I'M PULLING IT UP AND IF DAVE PULLS IT UP 23 QUICKER FEEL FREE TO RUN THROUGH THAT. 24



JAMES P. SPERING: SAM DO YOU HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT
 THAT IS.

3

SAM LICCARDO: NICK AND I TALK ABOUT THIS. THIS IS VARIOUS
STRATEGIES ON ATTACHMENT I, STRATEGY 11 IS THE EXPAND AND
MODERNIZE REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK DESCRIBED ON PAGE 12 AND I
THINK THIS'S THE LANGUAGE THAT NICK IS REFERRING TO.

8

MATT MALONEY: ONE OF THE IMPORTANT PIECES HERE IS THIS AS THE 9 STRATEGY SAYS IT FUNDS CAPITAL, MODERNIZATION PROJECTS ALONG 10 THE CORRIDOR PRIORITIZING DUAL PURPOSE INVESTMENTS SOUTH TO 11 NORTH THAT CONNECT HIGH SPEED RAIL TO THE BAY AREA. I THINK 12 THE INCUMBENT IN THIS CONVERSATION IS VERY IMPORTANT TO POINT 13 OUT IS THE FACT THAT WE AS A REGION HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF 14 15 HOW WE INVEST IN THE CORRIDOR THAT NINE PARTIES HAVE AGREED 16 TO. THERE IS NO DOUBT THIS AMENDMENT ALTERS THE CENTER OF GRAVITY OF THIS CONVERSATION. AND THIS IS A LONG RANGE OF PLAN 17 OF 30 YEARS WHAT'S HAPPENING TODAY IS A POLICY MARKER THAT 18 ILLUSTRATES THE IMPORTANCE OF BRINGING HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO 19 THE BAY AREA, AND INVESTMENTS TO THE SOUTH OF TAMIEN. BUT, YOU 20 21 KNOW, I WOULD SUBMIT THAT WHAT IS REALLY REQUIRED, 22 PRACTICALLY, IS FOR THE PARTIES TO COME TOGETHER TO HASH THIS OUT. PLAN IS OBVIOUSLY -- THIS IS PLANNING, INVESTMENT, POLICY 23 MARKER DOLLARS. THIS IS NOT AN ALLOCATION OF DOLLARS AT THIS 24



STAGE. SO THAT TYPE OF COORDINATION IS GOING TO BE VERY
 IMPORTANT TO FLESH THIS OUT.

3

COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. I THINK FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I 4 5 WOULD HAVE A PROBLEM IF IT WAS LIKE, YOU KNOW, THIS REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY PART, WE WOULD JUST, LIKE, STARTING WITH THE 6 SOUTH MOST GRADE SEPARATION, AND THEN JUST KIND OF MOVING 7 8 NORTH ONE BY ONE IF THAT'S WHAT IT MEANT, IF YOU WERE TELLING ME THAT'S NOT WHAT IT MEANT IT'S JUST KIND OF A GENERAL 9 INDICATION OF LIKE A PRIORITY WE NEED TO CONSIDER AMONGST 10 OTHER PRIORITIES, I'M FINE WITH THAT, AND I THINK IT'S -- THAT 11 MAKES SENSE. IS THAT WHAT YOU ARE TELLING ME MATT? 12

13

MATT MALONEY: GENERALLY YES AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO DISTINGUISH THAT THERE IS A SET OF INVESTMENT IN THE PROJECT LIST THAT ARE ESSENTIALLY CORRIDOR WIDE. AND THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, THEY SHOULD BE UNDER DISCUSSION BY THE GROUP. WE ARE ESSENTIALLY HIGHLIGHTING, ILLUSTRATING, EARMARKING, IF YOU WILL, A SET OF INVESTMENTS, ALSO IN THE PLAN, THAT IS SOUTH OF TAMIEN STATION. READING THAT AS A MATTER OF POLICY IN THE PLAN.

22 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. I DON'T KNOW, COMMISSIONER
23 LICCARDO IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK TO THIS. I HAVE SOMETHING ELSE I
24 WANT TO TALK ABOUT WITH REGARDS TO --

25



1 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: JUST KEEP GOING.

2

3 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. I HAVE REAL CONCERNS, AND SO DOES -- AND THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO DOES GENERALLY ABOUT THE WORK 4 5 FROM HOME MANDATE. COMMISSIONER RONEN UNFORTUNATELY HAD TO LEAVE, BUT SHE ASKED ME TO READ -- SHE POSTED SOMETHING IN THE 6 CHAT WHICH SHE ASKED ME TO READ OUT. I'LL DO THAT THEN ADD MY 7 8 OWN COMMENTS SHE SAYS I'M CONCERNED THAT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT 60 PERCENT OF EMPLOYEES TELECOMMUTING IF THIS BECOMES REALITY 9 IT WILL HAVE A TREMENDOUS IMPACT ON SAN FRANCISCO AN IMPACT I 10 DON'T BELIEVE WE HAVE SUFFICIENTLY DISCUSSED OR EVALUATED TO 11 INCLUDE IN THE BLUEPRINT I ASK THAT YOU STRIKE OUT THIS 12 REQUIREMENT I AM CERTAINLY WILLING TO REVISIT THE IMPACTS ON 13 THE ENVIRONMENT GIVEN THE MAJOR IMPACTS THAT SUCH A POLICY OR 14 REQUIREMENT WOULD HAVE ON OUR CITY I ASK THAT WE HAVE AN 15 16 EXTENSIVE PROCESS BEFORE DELIBERATING ON A MANDATE IN THIS REGARD. I WANT TO ADD, THAT THE PROBLEMS THEY HAVE WITH THIS 17 MANDATE ARE SORT OF THREE FOLD. I THINK WE HAVE A REAL PROBLEM 18 WITH THE EOUITABLE -- WITH EOUITY AROUND THIS MANDATE. IT'S 19 FINE TO ASK PEOPLE TO WORK FROM HOME IF THEY LIVE IN A LARGER 20 21 HOME WITHOUT ROOMMATES OR FAMILY MEMBERS OR IF THEY LIVE IN A SMALLER APARTMENT OR LIVE WITH FAMILY MEMBERS OR ROOMMATES I 22 DON'T THINK IT'S FAIR TO ASK THEM TO WORK FROM HOME. I HAVE 23 SOMEONE ON MY TEAM, SHE IS INDUSTRY, LIVES IN AN APARTMENT 24 WITH FIVE OTHER ROOMMATES. WE COULDN'T EXPECT TO SAY IF SHE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

HAS THE OPTION TO WALK TO WORK THAT WE REOUIRE SHE WORK FROM 1 HOME. THERE IS NO CLIMATE CONGESTION BENEFIT IF PEOPLE WHO 2 3 STAY HOME RATHER THAN TAKE TRANSIT OR VANPOOL TO WORK. AND I THINK THERE ARE OTHER MORE FLEXIBLE OPTIONS LIKE TRIP CAPS, 4 5 VERY AGGRESSIVE TDM OPTION WHERE IS WE CAN GET EXACTLY THE SAME GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BENEFIT BUT WITHOUT A LOT OF THE 6 PROBLEMS. WORK FROM HOME MANDATES ALSO PENALIZE THE SORT OF 7 8 DOWNTOWNS. BECAUSE DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, ESPECIALLY, AS MANY OTHER DOWNTOWNS, RELY ON -- AND OUR WHOLE CITY BUDGET RELIES 9 10 ON WORKERS COMING TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, AND IF WE'RE PREVENTING THEM FROM COMING EVEN IF THEY'RE TAKING BART OR AC 11 TRANSIT OR CALTRAIN OR BIKING OR WALKING THAT'S GOING TO HAVE 12 A TREMENDOUS EFFECT. I WOULD LIKE TO -- I DON'T WANT TO MAKE -13 - I WILL -- I'M NOT MAKING THIS MOTION, BUT IF -- I WOULD 14 15 REALLY APPRECIATE IF THERE WAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AN 16 AMENDMENT TO ADD AN AMENDMENT WHICH WOULD STRIKE THIS WORK FROM HOME MANDATE FROM THIS PLAN. AND REPLACE IT WITH AN 17 EQUIVALENT MANDATE THAT WOULD BE -- THAT WOULD HAVE TRIP CAPS, 18 WHICH GENERATE A SIMILAR AMOUNT OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS 19 REDUCTIONS. BUT WHICH DON'T HAVE THE NEGATIVE IMPACT ON 20 21 DOWNTOWNS, AND PROVIDE MORE FLEXIBILITY TO WORKERS. I KNOW 22 SPERING WANTS TO MAKE THE MOTION AND I DON'T KNOW IF HE WOULD CONSIDER INCORPORATING THAT IF NOT I'LL MAKE MY OWN AMENDMENT. 23 24



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: HE'S WAY DOWN THERE. I WOULD LIKE TO
 HEAR MATT'S RESPONSE TO THAT.

3

MATT MALONEY: COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ I'LL START OFF. I THINK 4 5 THE FIRST THING TO UNDER SCORE IS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD ALWAYS SAY THIS IS REMEMBER IT. THIS IS A 30 YEAR LONG RANGE 6 PLAN, AND YOU KNOW, THESE STRATEGIES ARE MEANT TO BE PLANNING 7 8 IDEAS TO HELP THIS REGION GET TO OUR GOALS. DETAILS OF ALL THESE THINGS MATTER VERY GREATLY, AND THESE STRATEGIES ARE NOT 9 INTENDED TO BE PRESCRIPTIVE. SO THERE IS A LOT OF WIGGLE ROOM 10 INVOLVED. THAT BEING SAID, AS WE LOOK AT THIS PLAN, GOING 11 AHEAD TO 2035, THIS TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IS ONE OF THE 12 BIGGEST, MOST NECESSARY PIECES, WE BELIEVE, TO GET INTO THAT 13 GHG GOAL. WE BROUGHT THIS STRATEGY IN THE SUMMER, THE REQUEST 14 15 THAT WE RECEIVED FROM THE COMMISSION WAS TO AIM HIGHER AND 16 THAT WE WERE BEING TOO MODEST SO WHAT WE HAVE DONE IS AUGMENT THE PREVIOUS ASSUMPTION WHICH WAS AT A 14 PERCENT REGION WIDE 17 LEVEL UP TO PROVE PERCENT. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT 18 WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN THIS PLAN IS A 25 PERCENT LEVEL OF 19 TELEWORK, NOT 60. IT IS ACCOMPLISHED IN PART BY DOING MORE 20 21 WITH OFFICERS EMPLOYEES, BUT THE TOTAL AMOUNT IS 25. I'LL ALSO SAY WE RAN, IN THE STATISTICALLY VALID POLL WE RAN A QUESTION 22 ON THE SUBJECT. AND THE OUESTION HAD TO DO WITH WHETHER PEOPLE 23 SUPPORTED EMPLOYERS LIMITING IN-PERSON OFFICE WORK WHEN 24 TELECOMMUTING OR WORKING FROM HOME WAS POSSIBLE. AND THE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RESULT OF THAT POLL SHOWED 76 PERCENT SUPPORT, REGION WIDE, 1 FOR A STRATEGY LIKE THIS. I'LL ALSO MENTION THIS STRATEGY IS 2 3 COMPLIMENTED BY ANOTHER STRATEGY, EC3, IF YOU'RE FOLLOWING ALONG THE STRATEGY ATTACHMENT WHICH IS INVESTED IN HIGH SPEED 4 5 INTERNET IN UNDERSERVED LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT THE EQUITY IMPACTS. AND THUS IT'S IMPORTANT TO 6 UNDERSTAND THE FACT THAT WE HAVE COMPLIMENTED THE TELEWORK 7 8 STRATEGY WITH THIS OTHER STRATEGY AND DAVE IF YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD THAT I HAVE MISSED FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN. >DAVE 9 VAUTIN: THE ONE THING I WOULD ADD TO WHAT MATT JUST COVERED 10 IS, THESE ARE, AGAIN, LONG RANGE STRATEGIES THAT CAN BE 11 REFINED FURTHER AS WE MOVE INTO IMPLEMENTATION. IT IS NOT 12 SAYING THAT THIS SORT OF STRATEGY WE PUT INTO PLACE IN 2021 OR 13 2022, WHAT WE'RE TELLING OUR REGULATORS AT THE CALIFORNIA AIR 14 RESOURCES BOARD IS THAT THIS STRATEGY IS SOMETHING THAT THE 15 16 REGION WOULD ENVISION BY 2035, AND THAT GIVES US A NUMBER OF YEARS TO NOT ONLY REFINE THE CURRENT STRATEGY OR FIND 17 EQUIVALENT STRATEGIES THAT WOULD GET US TO THAT SAME GOAL. WE 18 HAVE ALSO SPOKEN TO, AGAIN, OUR REGULATORS WHO NEED TO PROVE 19 THIS PLAN AND IN ORDER FOR TRANSPORTATION FUNDING TO KEEP 20 21 FLOWING TO THE BAY AREA. AND THEY HAVE A GREATER LEVEL OF OPENNESS FOR THIS STRATEGY THAN FOR THE TRIP CAP APPROACH, 22 WHICH IS PART OF THE REASON WHY IT IS SOMETHING THAT WE'RE 23 CONSIDERING IN THE PLAN CONTEXT, AND I WOULD UNDERSCORE WHAT 24 MATT SAID THAT THE PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR IT IS QUITE STRONG. AS I 25

September 23, 2020

MENTIONED, THE THREE QUARTERS BAY AREA RESIDENTS IN THE POLL
 INCLUDING 70 TO 80 PERCENT OF RESIDENT IN EVERY BAY AREA
 COUNTY SUPPORTED THE CONCEPT. SO THIS WAS SOMETHING WHERE WE
 WERE REALLY BEING RESPONSIVE TO THE PUBLIC FEEDBACK.

5

6 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I APPRECIATE THAT. BUT WHY ARE YOU GOING
7 TO REQUIRE SOMETHING WHO WALKS TO WORK, TO STAY HOME. WHAT'S
8 THE CLIMATE BENEFIT? WHAT'S THE CONGESTION BENEFIT? WHAT'S THE
9 ECONOMIC BENEFIT?

10

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: HOLD ON. YOUR BOSS WANTED TO GET IN.

THERESE MCMILLAN: TO ANSWER COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT'S 13 EXACTLY THE KIND OF IMPLEMENTATION NUANCE THAT WOULD COME INTO 14 15 DISCUSSIONS ON HOW YOU WOULD ACTUALLY MOVE SOMETHING LIKE THIS 16 GOAL FROM CONCEPT TO ACTION. IT WOULD BE A MORE REFINED POLICY THAT SAYS THE FOCUS OF THE TELEWORK WOULD BE FOR THOSE 17 EMPLOYEES THAT ARE DIVING TO THE OFFICE. THOSE ARE THE KINDS 18 OF LAYERED REFINEMENTS THAT WOULD HAPPEN AT THE POINT THAT 19 THIS STRATEGY WOULD BE TAKEN FORWARD FOR ANY KIND OF 20 IMPLEMENTATION AT A REGIONAL, LOCAL LEVEL, IF IT WAS STATE, 21 YOU KNOW, REGULATIONS, THAT NEEDED TO BE DONE, THERE'S A WHOLE 22 HOST OF IMPLEMENTATION LEVERS THAT ARE TO BE DETERMINED. SO 23 WE'RE TAKING NOTE, AND WHAT I THINK STAFF IS HIGHLIGHTING IS 24 THAT IS A DIFFERENT LEVEL, BUT THE BROADER CHALLENGE FOR THE 25

September 23, 2020

REGION, IS WE HAVE TO HAVE A STRATEGY ON TOP OF EVERYTHING 1 ELSE WE HAVE DONE. I WAS JUST CHECKING THE SLIDE FROM BEFORE. 2 3 THAT WE HAD PRESENTED BACK IN, TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE, WHEN WE HIGHLIGHTED THE FAMOUS ARROW SLIDE, PRIOR TO THE FINAL 4 5 BLUEPRINT WHEN WE DID ALL OF THIS PUBLIC OUTREACH, WE HAD ONLY MANAGED TO IDENTIFY NINE PERCENT OUT OF 19. IN THE SUMMER. 6 THAT WAS HOW MUCH GROUND THAT WE NEEDED TO MAKE UP. AND SO 7 8 THIS, YOU KNOW, TELEWORK BUNDLES, AS WE HAVE SAID, WITH REALLY IMPORTANT PARALLEL STRATEGIES, IS, YOU KNOW, A SIGNIFICANT 9 PART OF WHAT WE ARE GOING TO HAVE TO TAKE TO CARB IN ORDER FOR 10 THEM TO APPROVE THIS PLAN AND THE GHGS. SO JUST TO HIGHLIGHT, 11 THAT'S THE PLACE WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW. 12

13

COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I MEAN, I UNDERSTAND THAT I'M BEING TOLD 14 15 THAT LIKE, YOU KNOW, LIKE -- I HAVE TO WAIT, BECAUSE, LIKE --16 BUT, ON SPECIFICS OF THIS POLICY, BUT IT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE A SPECIFIC TO SAY, THE 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS -- WHAT I'M 17 PROPOSING IS THAT WE SAY 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS HAVE TO EITHER 18 TELECOMMUTE OR TAKE A SUSTAINABLE -- OR TAKE A SUSTAINABLE 19 MODE TO THE OFFICE. THAT DOES NOT SEEM LIKE A DETAILED 20 21 IMPLEMENTATION THAT SEEMS LIKE A FUNDAMENTALLY DIFFERENT POLICY WHICH ACHIEVES ALL OF THE GOALS THAT YOUR POLICY 22 ACHIEVES BUT PROVIDES MORE FLEXIBILITY AND ISN'T A THREAT TO 23 CITIES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, AND WHAT WE HAVE IN OUR -- AND IS 24 25 IN EFFECT FOR CITIES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, TO THE SAME DEGREE.

September 23, 2020

1 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: NICK, WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON? I THINK THE 2 3 CASE HAS BEEN MADE. I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE EITHER MORE PEOPLE IN OR OUT ON THIS IDEA. AND LET'S JUST SEE WHERE IT 4 5 GOES BUT LET ME LET OTHER PEOPLE SPEAK. IS THAT OKAY? 6 7 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THAT'S GREAT. 8 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER CONNOLY, AND LICCARDO, AND 9 10 AHN. 11 DAMON CONNOLY: GREAT I'LL JUMP IN AND START WITH THANKS FOR 12 THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT WENT INTO THE BLUEPRINT TODAY, TO 13 STAFF AND COLLEAGUES AS WELL AS PUBLIC COMMENT WE RECEIVED WAS 14 15 GREAT. SO SPEAKING FOR MARIN COUNTY. I WANT TO FAVORABLY 16 COMMENT ON THE TRANSPORTATION COMPONENT OF THE BLUEPRINT. ALL OF THE PAGER PROJECTS THAT MARIN PROPOSED HAVE BEEN INCLUDED 17 IN THE PLAN. THOSE INCLUDE A RESILIENT STATE ROUTE 37 IN 18 THERE, I PARTICULARLY WANT TO THANK MY NORTH BAY COLLEAGUES 19 FOR JOINING FORCES TO BRING THAT ACROSS THE FINISH LINE. MARIN 20 SONOMA NARROWS. U.S. 101 TO 580 DIRECT CONNECTOR AND RICHMOND 21 22 SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE WESTBOUND JOINT USE LANE WHICH IS STILL UNDER CONSIDERATION BUT INCLUDED AS MOVING FORWARD IN THE 23 PLAN. ON THE REGIONAL GROWTH PROJECTIONS AND STRATEGIES, A 24 COUPLE OF ISSUES I WANTED TO RAISE AND PERHAPS GET SOME FOLLOW 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

UP FROM STAFF. THE FIRST IS -- AND THIS HAS COME UP THROUGHOUT 1 THE CONVERSATION, HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, WHICH CONTINUE TO BE A 2 3 LITTLE BIT NEBULOUS. BUT MY MAIN CONCERN IS TO WHAT EXTENT ARE THEY ACTUALLY TETHERED TO HIGH OUALITY TRANSIT? THE GOAL 4 5 STATED HERE IS TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND PROMOTE EQUITY. TO THE EXTENT THAT WE'RE PROPOSING A LOT OF NEW 6 HOUSING, AND WE ALL RECOGNIZE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A REGIONAL 7 8 GOAL THAT WE ALL NEED TO PURSUE, MARIN COUNTY IS CONTINUING IN THAT DIRECTION, INCLUDING TWO NEW PDAS, PROPOSED THIS YEAR, 9 10 ONE IN INCORPORATED MARIN, ONE IN UNINCORPORATED. BUT THE FACT IS -- AND I'LL GET TO NUMBERS WE'RE SEEING RECENTLY FROM RHNA 11 THAT A LOT OF HOUSING IS BEING PROPOSED IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS 12 WITH NO INDICATION THERE IS ANY RELATIONSHIP TO HIGH QUALITY 13 TRANSIT. LAST THING WE WANT TO DO IS HAVE PEOPLE DRIVING IN 14 15 SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES, AND THEREBY INCREASING GREENHOUSE 16 GAS EMISSIONS, LET ALONE FORCING WORKING CLASS FOLKS WHO RELY ON TRANSIT TO HAVE TO GO OUT AND BUY A VEHICLE. SO THAT'S ONE 17 ISSUE. WE HAVE BEEN PUSHING FOR A HYBRID APPROACH. IT'S NOT 18 CLEAR TO ME THAT THAT WAS RESPONDED TO IN THIS PLAN. SO THAT'S 19 A CONCERN. PRACTICALLY SPEAKING, WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN MARIN 20 21 FROM THE DRAFT RHNA NUMBERS IS THAT THE UNINCORPORATED ALLOCATION FOR MARIN HAS GONE UP 22 TIMES FROM THE LAST RHNA 22 CYCLE. IT'S EYE POPPING. SO THE OUESTION I HAVE THAT'S MORE 23 FUNDAMENTAL, EVEN, IS TO WHAT EXTENT DOES ADOPTING THIS 24 25 BLUEPRINT DRIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF RHNA? BECAUSE YOU CAN WELL

September 23, 2020

IMAGINE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A PROBLEM WITH THAT IF THE ANSWER 1 2 IS THIS IS A PRINCIPLE OR MAIN DRIVER OF THAT PROCESS. SO I 3 WOULD LIKE STAFF TO -- AND I RECOGNIZE THE RHNA NUMBERS ARE GRAPHED, BUT FRANKLY, THAT'S WHERE THE RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD. 4 5 THERE ARE PROBABLY A FEW ISSUES. YOU KNOW, IS IT SOMETHING RELATED TO UNINCORPORATED STATUS, FOR EXAMPLE, BUT AGAIN, THAT 6 OVERALL ISSUE, AND IN FACT, I WOULD EVEN, WHETHER A MOTION OR 7 8 A MORE DIRECT STATEMENT, THAT BY APPROVING THIS, THAT IS NOT DRIVING THOSE OUTCOMES AS PART OF THE RHNA PROCESS. 9

10

11 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

12

SAM LICCARDO: THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO JOIN IN THE THANKS 13 AND PARTICULARLY TO THANK MATT AND ALIX FOR WORKING WITH US TO 14 15 CARVE OUT A PATH TO ENSURE THE REGION CAN GET CONNECTED TO 16 HIGH SPEED RAIL IN OUR LIFETIME. COMMISSIONER PUT IT WELL, ABOUT THE PRIORITIES HERE, AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK, 17 CERTAINLY, SEVERAL OF MY COLLEAGUES, COMMISSIONER PEDROZA AND 18 SPERING AND THOSE WHO HAVE JUMPED IN TO HELP, I LOOK FORWARD 19 TO THE MASTER AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE NINE PARTIES. I THINK THAT 20 21 CONVERSATION IS IMPORTANT AND OVERDUE AND WE ALL AGREE IT NEEDED TO BE REVISED EVEN BEFORE THIS POINT. I WANT TO CLARIFY 22 IF THERE ARE TWO SEPARATE THINGS GOING ON HERE SO FOLKS AREN'T 23 MIXING THE TWO. ONE IS WHAT WE HAVE ESSENTIALLY DONE AS MATT 24 DESCRIBED IS REMOVE \$3 BILLION FROM A LOCAL SANTA CLARA 25

September 23, 2020

PROJECT TO GET THIS HIGH SPEED RAIL PROJECT INTO THE BAY AREA. 1 2 AND SECONDLY, THE \$4.1 BILLION REGIONAL FUNDS ALONG THAT 3 CORRIDOR, WHICH WOULD BE FOR THE DUAL USE PROJECTS, ACTUALLY BOTH COULD BE FOR DUAL USE, AND THAT'S WHERE THE 4 5 PRIORITIZATION FROM SOUTH AND NORTH EXIST, AND I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT THIS IS NOT A STRICT AND 6 EXCLUSIVE KIND OF PRIORITIZATION. OBVIOUSLY THERE ARE OTHER 7 8 FACTORS THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED. FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE IS THAT WE HAVE DEPOSIT TO BUILD THE FIRST STORY OF THE BUILDING 9 BEFORE WE START BUILDING THE 13th STORY. AND I THINK WE HAVE 10 SEEN WHAT HAS EMERGED FROM THIS BOOK END STRATEGY OF HIGH 11 SPEED RAIL STATEWIDE AND IT'S BEEN A POISONOUS RESULT THAT WE 12 HAVE CREATED THIS GOLDEN GOOSE MENTALITY THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL 13 AND ITS PURPOSE IS TO CREATE FUNDING THAT LOCAL COMMUNITIES 14 CAN USE TO REALLY CREATE TRANSIT THAT'S SEPARATE FROM HIGH 15 16 SPEED RAIL THAT MIGHT GET CONNECTED IN A DECADE OR TWO. AND 17 WHAT I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO DO, AS A REGION, IS TO UNDERSTAND HOW BEST WE CAN GET HIGH SPEED RAIL HERE AND 18 STARTING AT GROUND FLOOR GOING UP TO THE 13 TO 15th STORY. 19 WHEREVER WE END UP. I THINK WE ALL UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE NEED 20 21 TO GET TO SALESFORCE TOWER, BUT IT'S GET TO GET TO THE FIRST 22 FLOOR FIRST. AND SO THAT IS WHAT'S BEHIND THIS WHOLE PRIORITIZATION. I THINK, I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S 23 CONCERNS, IT'S KNOWN FUNDING THAT HAS TRADITIONALLY CREATED 24 GREAT SEPARATIONS SAN MATEO COUNTY OR NORTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

IS BEING TOUCHED THROUGH THIS, BUT RATHER WHAT WE WANT TO DO 1 IS ENSURE THAT WE GET FIRST THINGS FIRST WHICH IS GETTING THE 2 3 TRAIN HERE. AND I HOPE WE CAN COME BACK IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS AND TALK MORE IN DEPTH ABOUT WHAT THAT STRATEGIES NEEDS TO BE. 4 5 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH HIGH SPEED RAIL STAFF TO TALK ABOUT WHAT THE STAGING MIGHT LOOK LIKE TO GET THE FUNDING IN PLACE 6 TO GET TO THE BAY AREA AND TO BE PAROCHIAL FOR A MOTION, I 7 8 THINK IN THIS CASE BEING PAROCHIAL ALIGNS WITH THE REGIONAL OBJECTIVE, IF WE CAN'T GET IT TO DIRIDON STATION THEN NONE OF 9 10 THIS IS WORTH THE EFFORT, BUT WHATEVER WE'RE SPENDING ANYWHERE ELSE ALONG THE LINE TO BENEFIT HIGH SPEED RAIL BECAUSE IT'S 11 ONLY IN DIRIDON STATION THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL CAN GET TO THE 12 ONE PLACE IN THE BAY AREA WHERE WE WILL HAVE BART, CALTRAIN, 13 ACE, CAPITAL CORRIDOR, AND A HOST OF OTHER LOCAL COMMUTER 14 15 SYSTEMS LIKE LIGHT RATE AND BUS RAPID TRANSIT. THAT'S THE ONLY 16 PLACE IN THE BAY AREA WHERE YOU CAN ACTUALLY GET ALL THE SYSTEMS. THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO BRING HIGH SPEED 17 RAIL INTO CONNECTIVITY WITH ALL THE OTHER SYSTEMS WHICH MEANS 18 WE GOT TO GET IT THROUGH PACHECO PASS AND GILROY AND MORGAN 19 HILL THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT TO ME THAT WE HAVE DOLLARS 20 COMMITTED TO COMMUNITIES TO GILROY AND MORGAN HILL AND THAT'S 21 BASIS FOR PRIORITIZATION. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR WHAT THEY 22 HAVE DONE. I THINK WE'RE ALL GOING TO GET THERE AND IT'S 23 IMPORTANT FOR US TO CONVENE AGAIN ON THIS ISSUE. WE NEED TO 24 TALK ABOUT WHAT STRATEGIES MAKE SENSE FOR THE ENTIRE REGION 25



AND I APPRECIATE MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS SUPPORT AND 1 2 PARTICULARLY COMMISSIONERS WORKING WITH ME. 3 EDDIE AHN: I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION ON FUNDING I HAVE 4 5 BEEN FOLLOWING IT IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE A GENERAL PRIORITIZATION THAT GETS AT HOPEFULLY ET NEEDS OF THE SOUTH 6 BAY AS WELL. I THINK THE THING I WANT TO FOCUS ON IS 60 7 8 PERCENT GOAL FOR TELEWORKING IT STRIKES ME AS UNREALISTIC AND A HIGH NUMBER AS WE WERE WORKING OFF THE ORIGINAL ASSUMPTION 9 OF 35 PERCENT AND JUMPING TO THAT GOAL I'M CONCERNED ABOUT. 10 NOW I WOULD SUPPORT ELIMINATING THE LANGUAGE ENTIRELY OR AT 11 LEAST DOING WHAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS SUGGESTING IS 12 BUILDING FLEXIBILITY WHICH IS THE IDEA OF TELEWORKING AND 13 BUILDING SUSTAINABLE TRIPS, TRIP CAPS. 14 15 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? SCHAFF HALF HERE I'LL PUT ON MY CAMERA. THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. I WILL SAVE MY 17 COMMENTS ON TELECOMMUTING FOR LAST. BUT BASICALLY I WANT TO 18 THANK STAFF FOR RESPONDING TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. I DO HOPE THAT 19 OAKLAND CAN BE A PARTNER ON THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND I 20 21 WOULD LOVE FOR YOU TO INCLUDE MY STAFF AS YOU DEVELOP IT. I KNOW IN OAKLAND, OUR EQUITY -- EQUITABLE CLIMATE ACTION PLAN 22 23 THAT WE RECENTLY ADOPTED REALLY FOCUSES ON SHORT-TERM IMPLEMENTATION ON OUR FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES IMPROVED 24

25 AFFORDABILITY AND REBUILDING A SEAMLESS TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO,

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

EXCITED ABOUT THE FOCUS ON THAT AND THE IMPLEMENTATION STAGE. 1 I'M EXCEPTIONALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE STRATEGY TO PROVIDE 2 3 TARGETED MORTGAGE RENTAL AND SMALL BUSINESS ASSISTANCE THAT WAS A FANTASTIC ADDITION. AND HOW THIS CAN BE A CODED RESPONSE 4 5 MODEL AS WELL IN THE SHORTER TERM. I DO HAVE SOME CONCERN. YOU USED THE TERM BASIC INCOME AS A FOUNDING MEMBER OF MAYORS FOR 6 GUARANTEED INCOME, WE ARE REALLY TRYING TO EDUCATE THE PUBLIC 7 8 ABOUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN GUARANTEED INCOME AND BASIC INCOME. AND I REALLY ADVISE THAT WE CHANGE THAT LANGUAGE TO 9 GUARANTEED INCOME, WHICH IS TARGETED -- IT IS NOT UNIVERSAL OR 10 FOR EVERYONE. IT IS FOR THOSE WHO NEED IT. AND SO, IF THERE IS 11 FURTHER DISCUSSION, I NEED TO HAVE OFFLINE WITH STAFF, I WOULD 12 LIKE TO -- SORRY. IT SUDDENLY STARTED -- I THINK URSULA. 13 URSULA, IF YOU COULD MUTE YOURSELF? BUT ANYWAY, I WOULD LIKE 14 TO -- I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT GUARANTEED INCOME. AND THEN 15 16 FINALLY ON THE TELECOMMUTING MANDATE. I HAVE SOME PRETTY STRONG FEELINGS ABOUT THIS. AND WHILE I GENERALLY TRY AND BE 17 VERY COLLEGIAL THAT WE'RE UNDER A CLEAR MORAL IMPERATIVE 18 PARTICULARLY IN THIS MOMENT IN THIS YEAR TO BE UNEOUIVOCAL 19 ABOUT PUTTING PEOPLE BEFORE PROFIT AND THE CLIMATE DEVASTATION 20 21 THAT HAS CAUSED THAT POLLUTED AIR HAS CAUSED IS SO MUCH MORE IMPORTANT THAN THE VIABILITY OF PROFITS. SO, I BELIEVE THIS IS 22 A VERY IMPORTANT POLICY. IF IT MAKES PEOPLE FEEL MORE COMPANY 23 TO SAY THAT IT IS A 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING, OR EQUIVALENT, 24 MANDATE, TO REALLY SIGNAL THAT THE GOAL IS THE "BENEFITS" OF 25

THIS POLICY AND THERE IS FLEXIBILITY IN HOW IT'S ACHIEVED SO 1 THAT COMPANIES COULD CERTAINLY GET CREDIT FOR NON-CAR OWNING 2 3 EMPLOYEES ET CETERA. I THINK CERTAINLY THAT IS WISE AND I THINK WE HAVE HEARD STAFF SAY CLEARLY THAT THESE ARE THE TYPES 4 5 OF FLEXIBILITIES AND ACCOMMODATIONS THAT WE WOULD SEE IN THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. BUT I AM NOT WILLING TO NOT HAVE A 6 TELECOMMUTING MANDATE IN THIS POLICY. OR IN THIS BLUEPRINT. WE 7 8 HAVE GOT TO CONTINUE IDEALLY LOOK FOR SILVER LININGS AMIDst THIS HORRIFIC TRAGEDY THAT WE'RE SUFFERING RIGHT NOW AND ONE 9 OF THEM IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THING THAT WE -- THAT COULD 10 NOT HAVE BEEN DONE IN THE PAST, AND CERTAINLY, ACCELERATING 11 TELECOMMUTING POLICIES AND REALLY DRIVING WHAT BENEFITS WE CAN 12 DERIVE FROM TELECOMMUTING. NOW IS A TIME, MORE THAN EVER, THAT 13 WE CAN DO THAT IN A WAY THAT WOULD BE LEAST IMPACTFUL AND 14 15 HARMFUL. I WOULD FEEL COMFORTABLE WITH ADDING THE TERM OF 16 EQUIVALENT IF THAT WOULD WORK WITH VALID CONCERNS. I AM SUPPORTIVE OF THE WORK AND APPRECIATE THE INCREDIBLE THOUGHT 17 STAFF HAS PUT INTO THIS AS WELL AS THE GOOD COMMENTS FROM MY 18 COLLEAGUES. THANK YOU. 19

20

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU MAYOR. PEDROZA, BRUINS,
 SPERING, LICCARDO, AGAIN.

23

ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU CHAIR. AND I AGREE WITH MAYOR
SCHAFF ON THE TELEWORK POLICY. GREAT COMMENTS ON THAT. I WANT



TO START BY THANKING STAFF. A LOT OF WORK WENT INTO THIS, IN 1 2 PARTICULAR OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN, MAKING 3 SURE WE STAY WITHIN THE FINANCIAL ENVELOPE AND REMAIN STRATEGIC. WE CAN'T KEEP DOING BUSINESS AS USUAL SO WE HAVE TO 4 5 GET UNCOMFORTABLE WHETHER IT'S POLICIES OR TELEWORK AROUND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. GOVERNOR ANNOUNCED BY 2035 HE'S GOING TO 6 BE BANNING GAS POWERED VEHICLE. THIS IS GOING TO HAPPEN. IS 7 8 THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHAPE THE FUTURE. THIS IS WHAT I SEE TO SHAPE THE PLAN. ON THE TELEWORK POLICY IT'S BENEFITS WE 9 WANT TO ACHIEVE. WE KNOW THERE IS BENEFIT TO -- LET'S PROVIDE 10 AMENDMENTS TO THAT AND TO THE HOUSING WE NEED TO LOOK AT THE 11 NEED AND IT'S GOING TO HAPPEN SO WE NEED TO MAKE SURE LOCALLY 12 THAT WE TRY TO BE PART OF THE SOLUTION VERSUS PART OF THE 13 PROBLEM. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT PLAN THAT'S HIGH LEVEL. THERE 14 15 IS A LOT TO BE SAID ABOUT HOW WE IMPLEMENT IT BUT THIS IS 16 FIRST STEPS. I'M IN SUPPORT OF WHAT'S OUTLINED HERE AND THANK YOU TO MAYOR LICCARDO FOR WANTING TO LOOK AT HIGH SPEED RAIL 17 IF A VERY GOOD WAY BUT ALSO UNDERSTANDING WE HAVE A BALANCE 18 THAT WE NEED TO FIND HERE FOR THE REGION. SO JUST SUPPORTIVE 19 OF THIS PLAN. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. 20

21

22 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

23

JEANNIE BRUINS: THANK YOU TO STAFF. THERE IS A LOT OF HARDWORK THAT GOES INTO THIS AND SO MANY COMPETING PERSPECTIVES

AND PRIORITIES. I THINK YOU HAVE DONE A NICE JOB AND THE 1 WORDING, I THINK YOU HAVE THREADED THE NEEDLE PRETTY WELL. SAM 2 3 LICCARDO I WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU IN TERMS OF THE CHANGES THAT YOU BROUGHT INTO REGARDING HIGH SPEED RAIL ET CETERA I 4 5 DEFINITELY SUPPORT THAT, AND YOU KNOW, NICK, I TRIED TO FIGURE OUT WHAT THE ANALOGY WAS, AND I'M GLAD SAM WAS OF THE ONE WHO 6 MENTIONED YOU HAVE TO BUILD THE GROUND FLOOR BEFORE YOU BUILD 7 8 THE 13th STORY. THIS IS IMPORTANT. DIRIDON IS A CRITICAL PLACE TO GET IT AT LEAST THAT FAR AND THEN WE GO FROM THERE, AND YOU 9 CAN'T GET TO DIRIDON IF WE DON'T PUT THIS AS PRIORITY HERE. IN 10 TERMS OF THE LAST ITEM, AS FOR AS THE MANDATE, I ACTUALLY -- I 11 MEAN, I CAN SEE BOTH SIDES OF THIS. BUT I THINK MY PERSONAL 12 PREFERENCE IS IF WE COULD TRY AND FIGURE OUT SOME HYBRID 13 LANGUAGE SO WE DON'T LOSE SIGHT OF IT'S NOT JUST A MANDATE AT 14 15 HOME IT'S MORE THE HYBRID LANGUAGE THAT NICK TRIED TO GET TO 16 SOMETHING STAFF COULD WORK WITH GIVING US MORE OF HYBRID 17 THING. 18

19 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: SPERING, DID YOU WANT TO HOLD OFF?
20

21 JAMES P. SPERING: WHEN YOU'RE READY FOR A MOTION.

22

23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER LICCARDO I'M GOING HOLD

24 YOU OFF TOO. SO I CAN GET TO EVERYBODY ELSE FIRST.

25 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE?

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

2 JAKE MACKENZIE: MY APOLOGIES, YOU CAUGHT ME UNAWARES I WAS 3 EXPECTING TO BE THIRD IN LINE. NEVER MIND. LICCARDO, HIGH SPEED RAIL, IF WE WANT TO BE A 21st CENTURY NATION STAKED, OR 4 5 WHATEVER WE ARE IN CALIFORNIA, THE HIGH SPEED RAIL PROJECT HAS GOT TO MOVE FORWARD. OTHERWISE, WE'RE A THIRD WORLD NATION AS 6 FAR AS I'M CONCERNED. COMMISSIONER CONNOLY AND HIS REMARKS 7 8 ABOUT THE NORTH BAY AND THE RESILIENT STATE ROUTE 37 PROJECT, THAT BRINGS TO MIND ONE OF THE SERIOUS PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE 9 GOING TO BE DEALING WITH, AND I'M NOT GOING TO BE DEALING WITH 10 IT INTO THE INDUSTRY, BUT SEA LEVEL RISE. AND JUST TO MAKE 11 SURE THAT AS WE'RE MAKING OUR PROJECTIONS ON HOUSING, THAT 12 WE'RE TAKING INTO EFFECT WHAT WE KNOW IS HAPPENING, AND WHAT 13 WE KNOW IS GOING TO BE HAPPENING. IN THE NORTH BAY, I THINK WE 14 15 HAVE FOUGHT OUR CORNER VERY WELL, AND I WOULD STILL REMIND 16 PEOPLE THAT IN THE STATE RAIL PLAN THE EXPANSION OF RAIL 17 SERVICE FROM THE SMART CORRIDOR OVER TO THE MAIN LINE AT CORDELIA JUNCTION IS SOMETHING, AGAIN, THAT IS IMPORTANT, I 18 BELIEVE, TO OUR BAY AREA. AND, FINALLY, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, 19 AND THE RHNA NUMBERS, THAT THE PROJECTIONS FOR THE COUNTY OF 20 21 SONOMA -- AND I HOPE THAT COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS STILL ON THE LINE AND WILL JUMP IN, BUT THE NUMBERS THAT I HAVE HEARD KIND 22 OF PARALLEL WHAT COMMISSIONER CONNOLY WAS TALKING ABOUT, AND 23 THAT IS MASSIVE INCREASE IN UNINCORPORATED SONOMA COUNTY. 24 25 SONOMA COUNTY -- ALL NINE CITIES HAVE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES

APPROVED BY THE VOTERS. WE HAVE COMMUNITY SEPARATORS APPROVED 1 2 BY THE VOTERS TO CONSTRAIN GROWTH AROUND THESE URBAN GROWTH 3 BOUNDARIES. CITY CENTERED GROWTH IS THE COUNTY'S GENERAL PLAN, AND I BELIEVE THAT THE CITIES IN SONOMA COUNTY ARE POISED AND 4 5 WE IN ROHNERT PARK HAVE DEMONSTRATE THAT WE ARE WILLING TO GIVE DEVELOPMENT APPROVAL FOR MORE HOUSING, AND WE CONTINUE TO 6 HAVE THAT ATTITUDE. SO, I'M VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THE COMING 7 8 TOGETHER OF RHNA NUMBERS AND AS FAR AS I'M CONCERNED, THESE NUMBERS THAT ARE PROPOSED FOR UNINCORPORATED SONOMA COUNTY, 9 10 THERE IS GOING TO BE A BIG -- THERE IS GOING TO BE A BATTLE. ANYWAY. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I HAVE TO LEAVE THIS MEETING AT 11 2:00 FOR A MEDICAL APPOINTMENT. SO, I KNOW THAT THE JOINT 12 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL EVENTUALLY COME IN FRONT OF THIS 13 BODY, BUT IF IT'S AFTER 2:00, I'M GOING TO HAVE TO ASK YOU TO 14 15 TAKE OVER THE REINS FOR ME.

16

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER RABBIT.

18

19 DAVID RABBIT: KUDOS TO STAFF FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK.

20 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE MENTIONED MY NAME, I FEEL I WOULD TALK
21 BRIEFLY ABOUT THE SITUATION HERE IN SONOMA AND WHY IT'S
22 IMPORTANT THAT WE CAN'T BE SO IN FAVOR OF HOUSING THAT IT
23 CONTRADICTS OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS GOALS AND
24 SUSTAINABILITY GOALS AND THAT'S WHAT'S HAPPENING. PERCENTAGE

September 23, 2020

550 PERCENT FROM THE LAST CYCLE, AND WE DON'T HAVE A LOT OF 1 AREAS THAT HAVE SERVICES THAT CAN ACCOMMODATE THAT TYPE OF 2 3 HOUSING. WE DO HAVE, IN THIS COUNTY, AND I THINK WE'RE THE ONLY ONE, AND I CAN SAY THAT ONLY ONE IN THE STATE, I'LL THROW 4 5 THAT OUT THERE UNTIL I'M PROVEN OTHERWISE, THAT HAS VOTER APPROVED ALL CITIES URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES COMMUNITY 6 SEPARATORS THROW ON TOP OF THAT OPEN SPACE ACQUIRED LAND AND 7 8 MAKING SURE WE'RE PROTECTING THOSE AND WHAT IT'S LEAD TO WHEN YOU COME TO SONOMA YOU CAN ACTUALLY DRIVE FROM ONE CITY YOU 9 ENTER A GREENBELT UNTIL YOU ENTER THE NEXT CITY AND SO ON AND 10 SO FORTH SO IT'S REALLY ABOUT CITY CENTER GROWTH AND WE'RE NOT 11 TRYING TO SHORT CHANGE OUR GROWTH AND WE WELCOME IT AND WANT 12 MORE. WE HAVE SEEN POPULATION DECLINE AND NEED FOR HOUSING. 13 BUT WE NEED TO FIX THAT AS WE GO FORWARD. I UNDERSTAND LAST 14 FRIDAY'S METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE, THE NUMBER HAS DROPPED 15 16 SLIGHTLY MARIN HAS THE SAME ISSUE OF 2,000 PERCENT INCREASE IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA. THAT'S REALLY NOT WHERE ALL THAT 17 HOUSING NEEDS TO BE BUILT. AND I WOULD SAY THE SAME THING HERE 18 IN SONOMA COUNTY. AND THE OTHER THING WE'RE STRUGGLING WITH 19 HERE IN SONOMA IS TO COMPLETE OUR SMART RAIL SYSTEM NORTH, AND 20 21 WE DO -- WE ARE ACTIVELY CONSTRUCTING INTO WITHSTAND --WINDSOR. THAT'S GREAT. IT'S A BENEFIT AND CHALLENGE WHEN 22 YOU'RE NOT INCLUDED ON PLANS GOING FORWARD ESPECIALLY WHEN 23 GIVEN A VOTER APPROVED MEASURE WHICH JUST MAKES IT POLITICALLY 24



A TOUGH HAUL. I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU MR.
 CHAIR.

3

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. SO I HAVE NOW OUR EXECUTIVE 4 5 DIRECTOR. SHE IS OFFICIALLY RAISING HER HAND. I JUST, FOR ME, MAYBE I WAS WAY OFF BASE, YOU KNOW, BUT WHEN I GOT UP THIS 6 MORNING, I KIND OF FIGURED THAT ALL THIS TALK ABOUT HOUSING 7 8 AND EVERYTHING WAS DONE AT ABAG AND WE WERE GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS HERE. SO I'M A LITTLE 9 10 CONFUSED. I MEAN, YOU KNOW YOU NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT ANYTHING WE DO, IF WE UNRAVEL WHAT WAS DONE BY ABAG OR TRY TO, 11 OR ATTEMPT TO CHANGE, THEN WE GOT TO GO BACK TO ABAG AND WHERE 12 IS THIS GOING TO STOP? WE HAVE ELECTED OFFICIALS THAT SIT ON 13 ABAG TOTALLY VETTED, HOUSING PRODUCTION, AND RHNA NUMBERS, NOW 14 WE'RE SITTING HERE AT MTC, THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY TALKING 15 ABOUT HOUSING. IT'S A LITTLE FRUSTRATING TO ME. GO AHEAD 16 17 THERESE.

18

19 THERESE MCMILLAN: AND ANTICIPATING THAT I WANTED TO JUMP IN 20 HERE, AND I'LL CALL ON MATT AND DAVE TO HELP ME IF I DON'T GET 21 EVERYTHING COMPLETELY CORRECT. BUT I THINK THE ISSUE THAT 22 COMMISSIONER CONNOLY HAD FIRST RAISED AND THEN WAS SORT OF 23 ECHOED BY COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE AND COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS 24 THE BASIC RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE FORECAST THAT WE ARE IN 25 FACT ASKING YOU TO ADOPT, AS PART OF THIS SUITE OF ACTIONS

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RELATIVE TO THE PLAN, BECAUSE AS WE HAVE JUST BEEN TALKING, 1 2 OUR ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHERE WE PUT AND DISTRIBUTE HOUSING, IS A MAJOR PART OF THE PLAN BUT THE QUESTION IS HOW THAT RELATES 3 OR DRIVES RHNA. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO HIT ON A COUPLE 4 5 OF POINTS. A, THE HOUSING NUMBERS THAT WE PUT IN PLANNED BAY AREA ARE 30 YEAR NUMBERS. RHNA IS AN EIGHT YEAR PROCESS. SO 6 THERE IS A VERY BIG DISTINCTION THERE. HOWEVER, STATE LAW DOES 7 8 REQUIRE THAT THERE IS A CONSISTENCY BETWEEN PLANNED BAY AREA AND RHNA, AND IN TERMS OF THE BROAD SORT OF GUIDE POST OF WHAT 9 10 THE PLANNED BAY AREA PROVIDES, WHICH, BASED ON ABAG ACTIONS WAS TO ASSUME THE BASIC DISTRIBUTION PATTERN AS PART OF THE 11 FACTORS THAT GO INTO THE BASELINE FOR RHNA, THAT'S BEING 12 BROUGHT INTO PLAY, HOWEVER THERE ARE SPECIFIC SET OF ACTIONS 13 THAT SITS WITH THE RHNA PROCESS THAT ARE INDEPENDENT AND NOT 14 15 TIED TO PLANNED BAY AREA. AND THAT'S JUST THE WAY THAT, YOU KNOW, THOSE TWO PROCESSES ARE SETUP BY STATE LAW. I THINK AT 16 17 THAT POINT, I WOULD OFFER THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND OUR HOUSING ASSUMPTION HERE DO NOT, IN THEIR ENTIRE -- IN THEIR 18 ENTIRETY, DRIVE WHAT THE RHNA PROCESS REQUIRES. THERE IS A LOT 19 OF DIFFERENT FACTORS OVER AND ABOVE PLANNED BAY AREA THAT NEED 20 TO BE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT, AND AS CHAIR HAGGERTY SAID, ABAG IS 21 LEADING THAT PROCESS, AND NOT DISCUSSION. BUT I'LL TURN IT 22 OVER TO MY STAFF IN CASE THERE IS ANY OTHER CLARIFICATIONS WE 23 SHOULD MAKE IN TERMS OF THAT RELATIONSHIP. >DAVE VAUTIN: 24 25 THANKS THERESE. I WANT TO ADD TWO QUICK CLARIFICATIONS

RECOGNIZING THAT RHNA IS IN THE ABAG DOMAIN, BUT PERHAPS 1 ANSWERING THE QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS TODAY. ONE IS 2 3 THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, 1 OF THE STRATEGIES YOU ALL ARE CONSIDERING FOR APPROVAL AND YOU HAVE IN FEBRUARY OF THIS YEAR 4 5 WAS TO FOCUS ALMOST ALL GROWTH IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES SO WHEN IT COMES TO GROWTH IN PLANNED 6 BAY AREA 2050 THAT WHERE GROWTH IS BEING CONCENTRATED WITHIN 7 8 URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES RHNA CONSIDERS FACTORS SUCH AS WHERE EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS LIVE AND THAT'S POWERING PORTIONS AS WELL 9 NOT JUST THE GROWTH IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I WANT TO 10 PROVIDE A BIT OF ARRAY OF HOPE WE HAVE DEVELOPED A POTENTIAL 11 TO CONCERN OF SELECT UNINCORPORATED AREAS IN THE REGION 12 WORKING WITH THEM TO POTENTIALLY SHIFT A SHARE OF THE RHNA IN 13 THE SPHERE OF INFLUENCE AREAS OVER TO THE CITIES TO ADDRESS 14 15 THIS ISSUE. AND WE HAVE OFFERED IT UP TO SPECIFIC 16 JURISDICTIONS IF THEY CAN PROVIDE DOCUMENTATION OF ALL THE SMART GROWTH, URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES ANNEXATION POLICIES TO 17 HCD, WE HAVE MAKE THAT ADJUSTMENT IN OCTOBER BEFORE GOING BACK 18 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. AND WE ACTUALLY HAVE HAD SPECIFIC 19 DIALOGUE WITH SOLANO, SONOMA AND SANTA CLARA COUNTIES THAT 20 HAVE EXPRESS THE DIRECT INTEREST IN THE ADJUSTMENT. WE HAVEN'T 21 22 HEARD BACK CONFIRMATION IN THE EIGHT JURISDICTIONS BUT WE ARE WORKING ACTIVELY WITH A NUMBER OF COUNTIES. 23

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. I'M GOING TO GO TO SAM, GINA, AND
 THEN JIM.

3

SAM LICCARDO: THANKS FOR INDULGING ME A SECOND TIME. I WANT TO 4 5 WEIGH IN AND SUPPORT THE MOTION OF AMENDING THE MANDATE OF WORKING FROM HOME. IT'S GOING TO IMPACT THOSE COMMUNITIES 6 DIFFERENTLY IN THOSE COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE A HIGH PERCENTAGE 7 8 OF WORKERS THAT DO NOT HAVE THE LUXURY OF WORKING FROM HOME, RESTAURANT COOKS, LABORERS, CONSTRUCTION WORKERS, NURSES, I 9 THINK WE'RE SEEING HOW THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE 10 DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACTS LOW INCOME AND MODERATE INCOME 11 RESIDENTS. THERE IS A REAL SYNERGY AND I'M HEARING FROM MY 12 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS AROUND A COMPROMISE SPERING IS GOING TO 13 COME UP WITH BRILLIANT LANGUAGE TO CAPTURE ALL THE BENEFITS OF 14 15 WORKING FROM HOME BUT CERTAINLY NOT MANDATING IT AND FINDING 16 OTHER ALTERNATIVES THAT WE ALL KNOW SO MUCH ABOUT WHETHER WALKING OR TRANSIT. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO FIND IMPACTS 17 SOCIALLY AND PSYCHOLOGICALLY, THIS ISOLATION WILL BE WITH US 18 FOR A GENERATION AND WORKING FROM HOME IS CERTAINLY NOT THE 19 IDEAL SOLUTION. SO WE HAVE GOT TO FIND LOGICAL ALTERNATIVES. 20 21 22 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

23

24 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. YES. I AM ALSO IN SUPPORT OF THE25 AMENDMENT AS FAR AS MAKING IT WORK FOR THE COMMON GOOD THERE.

September 23, 2020

I NEED TO KNOW, ON THE ACCELERATED USE OF PUBLIC AND COMMUNITY 1 2 LAND MIXED LAND HOUSING AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES. I GET THAT. I 3 SUPPORT THAT, BUILDING ON COLLEGES AND HIGH SCHOOL CAMPUSES AND STUFF THAT DIRECT IMPACTS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS 4 5 INFRASTRUCTURE COST BECAUSE I THINK THEY'RE ALL EXEMPTED FROM PAYING OUR LOCAL FEES TO HELP US BE SUSTAINABLE. SO JUST WANT 6 TO BE AWARE. WAS THERE A OUESTION? OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW 7 8 ON THE PERMANENT RESTRICTION ON LOW INCOME, EITHER RENTALS OR HOUSING AND STUFF, IS THAT MOVING FORWARD? OR IS THAT INCLUDE 9 PROPERTY THAT'S ALREADY BEEN DESIGNATED FOR A LIMITED PERIOD 10 OF TIME? >DAVE VAUTIN: TO CLARIFY ON THE RENTER PROTECTION 11 STRATEGY, THE ONLY CHANGE THAT'S BEEN MADE TO THAT STRATEGY TO 12 WHAT YOU ALL HAVE APPROVED IN FEBRUARY ARE ADDITIONS OF SOME 13 LEGAL SERVICES FOR TENANTS INCORPORATING THAT INTO THE MIX. SO 14 15 IT REMAINS THE SAME AS WHAT WAS PREVIOUSLY APPROVED.

16

GINA PAPAN: OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU. LAST THING HERE, I BELIEVE, 17 IS THE ALL LANE TOLLING THAT WAS PRESENTED TO OUR JURISDICTION 18 AS BEING STUDIED THEN STAFF RESPONDED THAT IT'S ALREADY BEEN 19 STUDIED, AND IT'S JUST THAT IT SEEMS TO BE THAT'S THE ONLY 20 THING THAT YOU'RE STUDYING HERE. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO 21 WORK FOR OUR JURISDICTION BECAUSE OTHER STUDIES WOULD BE MORE 22 HELPFUL. FOR INSTANCE, FREE TRANSIT IN AND OUT OF SFO. 43,000 23 EMPLOYEES. PUBLIC TRANSIT, I MEAN, THOSE ARE THE TYPE OF 24 ALTERNATIVES I'M NOT SEEING HERE THAT WOULD ACHIEVE MAJOR 25

September 23, 2020

GOALS IN REDUCING GREENHOUSE GASSES, IT JUST SEEMS LIKE 1 EVERYTHING WAS PUT ALL ON THE ALL LANE TOLLING. AND I KNOW FOR 2 3 A FACT OUR JURISDICTION IS NOT IN SUPPORT OF THAT. AND WHERE ALSO HOW DOES THAT AFFECT IF YOU'RE DOING ALL LANE TOLLING AND 4 5 WHAT THE GOVERNOR JUST ANNOUNCED IF WE'RE GOING TOWARD ALL ELECTRIC VEHICLES THEN ARE WE -- I'M NOT SURE THE IMPACT THERE 6 IS WHAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE. SO AS FAR AS THE PROPOSAL, I 7 8 REALLY WISHED WE WOULD HAVE SEEN OTHER ALTERNATIVES BESIDES THIS ALL LANE TOLLING, AND I THINK WE WERE REALLY CLEAR ON 9 THAT WHEN WE PRESENTED OUR LETTER. SO I WAS WONDERING WHAT 10 STAFF -- HAS THE STUDY BEEN COMPLETED OR WERE WE 11 MISREPRESENTED? >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK A COUPLE OF POINTS ON 12 YOUR QUESTION, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, FIRST OF ALL, WE DID STUDY 13 ALL LANE TOLLING IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE FOUND THAT IT WAS A 14 MAJOR CONTRIBUTOR TO REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND 15 16 THAT THE MEANS-BASED TOLL POLICY ADDRESSED MANY OF THE EOUITY CONCERNS THAT DOESN'T MEAN THE STUDY, THAT FURTHER STUDIES 17 AREN'T NEEDED. IN FACT WE WANT TO STUDY IT FURTHER IN THE 18 FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE HERE WITH FURTHER REFINEMENTS IDENTIFIED 19 IN THE PACKET AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PHASE, SHOULD THE 20 21 STRATEGY MOVE FORWARD, A MUCH MORE COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL 22 STUDY WOULD BE NECESSARY AS A FIRST STEP. MORE WORK WOULD BE REQUIRED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH ORGANIZATIONS ACROSS THE REGION. 23 24



GINA PAPAN: AS COMMISSIONER CONNOLY NOTED DEFINITION OF STRONG 1 MARKET AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, THOSE ARE REALLY VAGUE AND I 2 3 WOULD APPRECIATE FURTHER DEFINITION MY CITY HAS BEEN LISTED AS A STRONG MARKET WE HAVE VERY MINIMAL MARKET OR BUSINESS IN OUR 4 5 CITY. SO CLARIFICATION ON THAT MOVING FORWARD WOULD BE EXCEPTIONALLY HELPFUL. IS THAT POSSIBLE? >DAVE VAUTIN: HAPPY 6 TO ANSWER THAT RIGHT NOW. HIGH RESOURCE IS DEFINED BY THE 7 8 STATE. IT'S AN OFFICIAL DEFINITION APPROVED BY THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA THEY DEVELOPED MAPS FOR HIGH RESOURCE AREAS WE HAVE 9 10 INCORPORATED THOSE MAPS YOU CAN FIND THOSE ON THE TREASURER'S WEB SITE FOR THE STATE. 11

12

13 GINA PAPAN: STRONG MARKET? >DAVE VAUTIN: WHERE IT'S STRONG 14 MARKET WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THERE IN OUR ANALYSIS ARE THE 15 TRANSIT-RICH HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THAT OFTEN HAVE HIGHER HOME 16 VALUES. THEY HAVE HISTORICALLY HAD A STRONGER MARKET FOR 17 DEVELOPMENT.

18

19 GINA PAPAN: BUT THAT'S -- STRONGER MARKET FOR DEVELOPMENT IN 20 WHICH WAY? IS COULD YOU CLARIFY FOR ME? BECAUSE WE HAD HIGH 21 TRANSIT AND WE GOT YES HIGH HOME PRICES BUT THERE IS NO OTHER 22 LAND. WHERE IS THAT SUPPOSED TO HAPPEN. >DAVE VAUTIN: WHAT 23 WE'RE SAYING THERE IN STRONG REAL ESTATE MARKET WE'RE SAYING 24 UNDERLYING CHARACTERISTIC GREAT SCHOOLS FOR RESIDENTS, A WIDE 25 ARRAY OF PARKS, A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT SOCIAL SERVICES, THOSE



ARE THINGS THAT OFTEN LEAD TO HIGHER HOME VALUES AND MAKE THE 1 2 COMMUNITIES MORE ATTRACTIVE TO LIVE IN. 3 GINA PAPAN: I UNDERSTAND. THANK YOU. AGAIN, I AM SUPPORTIVE OF 4 5 THE AMENDMENT. 6 DAMON CONNOLLY: DAVE, IF I CAN JUMP IN, WHAT ABOUT HIGH 7 8 RESOURCE AND CONSTRAINED TRANSIT. >DAVE VAUTIN: WITH REGARD TO HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, THE COMPROMISE THAT WAS REACHED IN 9 FEBRUARY ON HIGH RESOURCE AREAS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 10 REMAINS IN THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. SO IT'S NOT ALL HIGH 11 AREAS THAT ARE IN INCORPORATED PLAN 2050 IT'S THOSE THAT MEET 12 THE MINIMUM TRANSIT THRESHOLDS THAT'S COMPROMISING MANY OF THE 13 RESOURCES ARE NEAR JOB CENTERS, AND A COMMUTER COULD USE 14 15 TRANSIT OR AUTO WHICH WOULD ATTRACTIVE AS WELL AND THEY WOULD 16 HAVE ACCESS TO HIGH PERFORMING SCHOOLS THIS'S DIFFERENT FROM THE RHNA PROCESS WHICH IS ONE OF THE REASONS WE'RE SEEING 17 HIGHER ALLOCATIONS IN RHNA IS THAT IT BUILDS AND ACCELERATES 18 REGARDLESS OF HIGH LEVEL OF TRANSIT RESOURCE. 19 20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: REAL QUICK BEFORE I GO TO SPERING. HOW 21

23

22

JAMES P. SPERING: MULTIPLE TIMES, MR. CHAIR. OVER THE PAST
COUPLE OF YEARS.

MANY TIMES HAVE WE HEARD THIS ITEM?

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1 2 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YEAH. I'M SURPRISED. DAVE, AND/OR MAYBE 3 MATT, I'M NOT SURE WHO, THE ADDITIONAL MONEYS THAT ARE BEING ALLOCATED TO, AND FIRST OF ALL I'M VERY SUPPORTIVE OF HIGH 4 5 SPEED RAIL AND SAM'S AMENDMENT. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT BECAUSE IT'S STILL PRETTY FAR OUT, A LOT OF ENVIRONMENTAL WORK 6 7 -- THIS IS CONSIDERED PROGRAM TWO MONEY, RIGHT. 8 MATT MALONEY: THAT'S CORRECT. THIS WOULD BE PERIOD TWO OF THE 9 10 PLAN, THE BACK HALF. 11 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THEN I'M FINE. SPERING? 12 13 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. YOU KNOW, YOU'RE 14 15 HEARING ALL THE COMMENTS, AND I THINK A LOT OF THEM ARE VALID, 16 BUT WE ARE AT THE 11th HOUR, AND THERE IS A LOT OF MONEY AT RISK HERE. AND I THINK AS MOST OF YOU KNOW, WHEN THIS PLAN IS 17 ADOPTED WE NOW START ON THE NEXT PLAN AND A LOT OF THE 18 STRATEGIES AND SUGGESTIONS THAT ARE BEING MADE RIGHT NOW 19 CERTAINLY WILL BE BROUGHT INTO THE NEXT PLAN. YOU KNOW, BUT 20 21 FOR US TO, AT THIS POINT, SAY WE WANT TO ELIMINATE THIS MANDATE ON THE TELECOMMUTING IS A HUGE IMPACT ON US APPROVING 22 THIS PLAN IN A TIMELY FASHION. IT'S JUST NOT GOING TO HAPPEN. 23 STAFF -- I DON'T BELIEVE IS GOING TO FIND THE EQUIVALENT 24 BENEFITS BETWEEN NOW AND THE END OF THIS YEAR. DAVID YOU MIGHT 25

September 23, 2020

WANT TO HELP ME ON THIS WE EMBARKED ON THIS SEVERAL YEARS AGO, 1 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS SAID THIS IS 2 3 GOING TO BE VERY DIFFICULT AND VERY UNCOMFORTABLE FOR US TO MOVE FORWARD AND I THINK THE OPTIONS THAT STAFF HAS PUT IN I 4 5 THINK ARE MANAGEABLE AT THIS POINT. I UNDERSTAND THE IMPLICATION. ISSUES THAT NICK IS RAISING, I THINK NEED TO BE 6 EXPLORED A LOT MORE. BUT I JUST REALLY WOULD CAUTION STAFF ON 7 8 JUST MAKING AMENDMENTS TO THE PLAN THAT REALLY WE CAN'T JUSTIFY OR WE CAN'T MEET THOSE TARGETS, AND YOU KNOW, I WOULD, 9 10 YOU KNOW, MAYBE MATT OR DAVE CAN JUST COMMENT REAL BRIEFLY BUT IF WE START AMENDING THIS PLAN AT THIS LATE HOUR, I MEAN, DO 11 YOU HAVE ANY RABBITS IN YOUR HAT THAT'S GOING TO GET US 12 THROUGH THE THRESHOLD, TO THE FINISH LINE? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO AT 13 THIS POINT SPERING, WE'RE FEEL LIKE WE HAVE PULLED OUT EVERY 14 15 RABBIT IN THE HAT IS MAYBE SEARCHED FOR SOME MORE RABBITS.

16

JAMES P. SPERING: YEAH. AND THAT'S THE POINT I'M MAKING AND 17 THE OTHER OUESTION I WANT TO ASK, YOU'RE COMING BACK TO US AT 18 THE END OF THE YEAR WITH ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES THIS IS ON 19 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES OR SOMETHING. WHEN THAT COMES BACK TO US 20 21 SOME OF THE SUGGESTIONS THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHER COMMISSIONERS HAVE MADE, YOU CAN GUYS AT LEAST BE LOOKING AT 22 THOSE TO SEE IF THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, ANY BENEFITS OR ANY 23 EQUIVALENTS THAT WOULD CLOSE THAT GAP TO WHERE MAYBE IT'S NOT 24



THE SIX PERCENT THRESHOLD. IS THAT NOT SOMETHING THAT COULD BE
 AT LEAST LOOKED AT? >DAVE VAUTIN: ABSOLUTELY.

3

JAMES P. SPERING: THAT'S ALL I NEED. DAVE ALL I WANTED WAS A 4 5 YES. MY MOTION, AND HOPE -- SAM, FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU. I FELT WE WOULD HAVE BEEN REMISS IF WE DIDN'T HIGHLIGHT HIGH 6 SPEED RAIL AND I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING THAT FORWARD AND I'M 7 8 GLAD THAT WORKED OUT SO I'M HOPING YOU'RE PROBABLY GOING TO BE DISAPPOINTED IN THE MOTION I'M GOING TO MAKE BUT THE MOTION IS 9 GOING TO BE THAT WE ADOPT THIS PLAN THAT'S BEING PRESENTED TO 10 US TODAY AND THAT WE DIRECT STAFF TO LOOK AT POTENTIAL 11 STRATEGIES THAT WILL GIVE US THE EOUIVALENT OF THAT 60 PERCENT 12 MANDATED TELECOMMUTE. SO THAT WOULD BE THE MOTION. SO WHAT IT 13 DOES, IS IT OPENS THE DOOR FOR STAFF, IF HE'S LOOKING AT 14 15 STRATEGY BETWEEN NOW AND THE END OF THE YEAR. SO THAT WOULD BE 16 THE MOTION, MR. CHAIRMAN, BUT I JUST WANT TO TELL THE COMMISSION THAT, YOU KNOW, THIS IS THE 11th HOUR. WE HAVE BEEN 17 WORKING ON THIS. A LOT OF THESE ISSUES HAVE BEEN ADDRESSED I 18 DON'T KNOW OF ANOTHER WAY WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THE FINISH 19 LINE. I WOULD ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH WHAT 20 21 STAFF HAS PRESENTED AND THAT WE START WORKING ON THESE STRATEGIES WHERE WE REALLY NEED TO CHANGE IT IN THE NEXT PLAN 22 THAT WE ADOPT THAT WE REALLY CAN ADOPT LIKE THE ISSUES SAN 23 FRANCISCO IS RAISING. THAT WOULD BE MY MOTION MR. CHAIR. 24

114



JAKE MACKENZIE: I'LL SECOND THE MOTION MR. CHAIR. 1 2 3 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND I'M GOING TO STOP ON THE COMMISSIONER FOR A MINUTE I WANT TO GIVE THE 4 5 PUBLIC AN IDEA OF THE DIRECTION WE'RE GOING BUT NOW WE HAVE A LOT OF PUBLIC SPEAKERS JAKE IF YOU CAN HOLD IN THERE OR NOT. 6 7 8 JAKE MACKENZIE: I UNDERSTAND MR. CHAIR. I DO HAVE THE MEDICAL APPOINTMENT AT TWO. I JUST DIDN'T THINK WE WERE GOING TO BE 9 GOING THIS LONG. 10 11 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: NO WE -- WELL, I NEVER THINK WE'RE 12 GOING TO GO THIS LONG. SO, AGAIN, MY --13 14 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: MR. HAGGERTY, I'LL GIVE YOU AN 15 16 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AMENDMENT AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT. 17 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YES. I'M GOING TO GO TO THE PUBLIC NOW, 18 JAKE, DO YOU WANT TO PULL YOUR SECONDS? BECAUSE YOUR NOT GOING 19 TO BE HERE. VAL, JOHN --20 21 22 JAKE MACKENZIE: I'LL MAKE MY MOTION MR. CHAIR. 23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: DO I HAVE A SECOND. 24 25



ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND. 1 2 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WHO? 3 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALFREDO. 6 7 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. KIMBERLY CALL THE SPEAKERS. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MR. CHAIR HOW MANY MINUTES WOULD YOU LIKE? 10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: MINUTE AND A HALF. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS VAL MINOTTI, PLEASE 13 14 UNMUTE YOURSELF. 15 16 SPEAKER: THIS IS VAN WITH BART. CHIEF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT OFFICER. FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU AND STAFF FOR YOUR WORK. I 17 WANT TO THANK STAFF AND THE COMMISSION ON THE TRANSIT 18 INVESTMENTS STATE OF GOOD REPAIR IT'S IMPORTANT TO MAINTAIN 19 OUR EXISTING SYSTEM. SECOND ONE IS THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL 20 21 CROSSING IT'S A BIG MEGA REGIONAL PROJECT THAT WILL INCLUDE 22 BOTH COMMUTER RAIL AND BART TECHNOLOGIES IT'S KEY TO MAKE LINKAGES IN THE REGION. SECOND I WOULD SAY I DO HAVE CONCERNS 23 ABOUT THE MANDATE FOR THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING. WE -- OUR 24



SUPPORT OF GETTING TO THE GREENHOUSE REDUCTIONS EMISSIONS AND 1 2 APPRECIATE SPERING'S COMPROMISED PROPOSAL. THANK YOU. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN BATE. 4 5 SPEAKER: HELLO. MY NAME IS JOHN BATE. I'M WITH THE ADVOCACY 6 7 GROUP ENVIRONMENTALISTS SPEAK FOR THE PEOPLE. I WANT TO SPEAK 8 ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE, EMPLOYEES WORKING FROM HOME 9 THREE OUT OF FIVE DAYS A WEEK WILL OPT TO WORK AT HOME FIVE OUT OF FIVE DAYS A WEEK MAKING EXODUS FROM THE BAY AREA. 10 ACCOMMODATED POPULATION GROWTH IN A SUSTAINABLE MANNER TO 11 OTHER REGIONS THIS DOESN'T REDUCE OVERALL EMISSIONS. OTHER 12 REGIONS HAVE HIGHER PER CAPITA USAGE. THIS IS AN ABJECT 13 FAILURE OF PLANNING. WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO REVIEW THE COMMENTS 14 SUBMITTED BY GROUPS SUCH AS URBAN ENVIRONMENTALISTS WHICH 15 16 PROPOSE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION POLICIES PARTICULARLY REMOVAL OF FREEWAY INFRASTRUCTURE WE CAN REMOVE 17 18 GREENHOUSE GAS IF WE REDUCE CARBON EMISSIONS BY IMPROVES 19 ENVIRONMENTALLY AND BELT OF LIFE RATHER THAN EXCLUDING FROM OUALITY OF THE REGION OR WORK FROM HOME. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS LAST FOUR DIGITS 6262, MR. 23 LEBRUN.

24

**METROPOLITAN** TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION September 23, 2020 Meeting Transcript SPEAKER: THANK YOU. IN A MINUTE AND A HALF, I WANT TO THANK 1 MAYOR LICCARDO FOR THE APPROACH HE'S TAKING BUT I BELIEVE THAT 2 3 WE'RE GOING TO SEE HIGH SPEED RAIL WHERE IT'S ALREADY MADE IN THE BAY AREA AND EVENTUALLY CONNECT TO THE CENTRAL VALLEY AND 4 5 THE REST OF THE STATE, NOT THE OTHER WAY AROUND. THING I WANT TO TALK ABOUT IS ADDING ONE RABBIT TO TODAY'S TASK. IS YOU 6 CANNOT POSSIBLY MAKE A SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION IN GHGS IF YOU DO 7 8 NOT LOOK AT GOODS MOVEMENTS. STARTING WITH STRATEGIC PLANNING OF THE LOCATION OF DISTRIBUTION CENTERS AND I WOULD CALL THEM. 9 HDH HIGH DISTRIBUTION AREAS LOOK WHAT HAPPENED IN SAN JOSE, 10 DISTRIBUTION CENTER WAS NIXED NOW WE'RE GETTING FOUR 11 DISTRIBUTION CENTERS, INCLUDING AMAZON. THIS WAS NOT PLANNED 12 PROPERLY ALL DISTRIBUTION CENTERS ARE EAST OF HIGHWAY 101. 13 PRIOR TO THAT THOSE DISTRIBUTION CENTERS WERE AGAINST THE 14 CALTRAIN TRACKS THAT WE GOT TO ELECTRIFY BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND 15 16 GILROY AND I WANT YOU TO THINK ABOUT AMAZON WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO, THEY'RE GOING TO BE DISTRIBUTORS WITH EVERYTHING 17 WITHDRAWN. HOW IS THAT GOING TO WORK. 15 MILES AWAY FROM THE 18 PLACE WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO BE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN SAN 19 JOSE FOR EXAMPLE, IF AMAZON COULD BE LOCATED IN THE CAPITAL 20 21 EXPRESS WAY AREA. THANK YOU. 22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI.

24

September 23, 2020

SPEAKER: HELLO. A COUPLE THINGS ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA. I'M 1 NOT SURE HOW REALISTIC IT IS. REVENUE IS OPTIMISTIC TO SAY THE 2 3 LEAST. HOW ARE THEY GOING TO PROVIDE THE HOUSING REQUIRED IS HOW ARE THEY GOING TO EXIST UNDER THE CURRENT CIRCUMSTANCES. 4 5 THERE IS NOTHING ABOUT FUTURE RIGHTS HERE. MAYBE WE DON'T WANT TO PUSH EVERYBODY INTO BUSES OR ACCELERATE RIDE-SHARE. 6 7 CARPOOLING DIDN'T WORK BUT WE COULD PROVIDE A FINANCIAL 8 INCENTIVE THROUGH REGISTRATION FEES WHICH WOULD GET PEOPLE ENCOURAGED TO USE RIDE-SHARE WITH THEIR CARS. OTHER THING IS 9 ALL LANE TOLLING. I DON'T KNOW WHO YOU'RE SERVING WHO THINK 10 THIS IS A GOOD IDEA BUT EVERYBODY I SPEAK TO THINKS IT'S A 11 DISASTER. IT HURTS THE ECONOMY. JUST LIKE THE EXPRESS LANE 12 IMPACTS LOW INCOME PEOPLE. DRIVING DOWN HIGH RENTS AND THEY 13 CAN'T AFFORD TO TRAVEL WE NEED IT AS A MAIN OBJECTIVE IN THIS 14 15 PLAN. THANK YOU.

16

17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SABIK TRADAN.
18 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

19

20 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS SABEEK AND I ENCOURAGE YOU NOT TO
21 IMPLEMENT THIS MANDATE. THIS INDUSTRY CONTINUES TO BE
22 CONCENTRATED HERE DESPITE OUR ASTRONOMICAL COST OF LIVING OF
23 THE PROPOSING THIS MANDATE WILL IMPACT PRODUCTIVITY AND WORK
24 SATISFACTION AND WILL HAVE A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON PEOPLE WITH
25 ROOMMATES WHO CAN'T BE AS EFFECTIVE WHEN WORKING FROM HOME.



REDUCING CARBON EMISSIONS IS OF IMPORTANCE BUT WORK FROM HOME 1 2 MANDATE IS THE WRONG APPROACH. BIKING AND WALKING OVER DRIVING 3 IS SO PEOPLE CAN GET TO WORK WITHOUT CARBON INTO THE AIR. INSTEAD OF DOING WHAT WE'RE CURRENTLY DOING CUTTING TRANSIT 4 5 AND MAKING PARKING FREE. WE NEED TO PUT MORE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT INTO CITY CENTERS RATHER THAN SPRAWLING CITY PARKS 6 THAT FORCE EMPLOYEES TO DRIVE. I URGE YOU ALL NOT TO APPROVE 7 8 IT AND I URGE YOU ALL TO REALLY EMPHASIZE POSITIVE SOLUTIONS 9 RATHER THAN POINTLESS MANDATES. THANK YOU.

10

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ALIX SUITE
 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

SPEAKER: THANK YOU GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS ALIX SWEET 14 15 TRANSPORTATION SUPERVISOR TO MAYOR LONDON BREED IN SAN 16 FRANCISCO FOR THE MANDATE FOR WORKERS TO WORK FROM HOME, I SINCERELY APPRECIATE MTC SHOWING WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO MEET 17 THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS GOALS WITH THE TELECOMMUTE 18 STRATEGY HOWEVER I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THE STRATEGY AND 19 IMPLEMENTATION CANNOT BE ONE SIZE FITS ALL THE WAY THE 20 STRATEGY IS WORDED IGNORES THE BENEFITS OF THE APPROXIMATELY 21 22 70 PERCENT OF PEOPLE WHO WORK BIKE WALK AND TAKE TRANSIT IN 23 SAN FRANCISCO MANDATING 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE MAY AFFECT RECOVERY AND WILL HAVE IMPLICATIONS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND ON 24 SERVICES THAT DEPEND ON DOWNTOWN TAX INCOME. WE BELIEVE THE 25



1 STRATEGY NEEDS REVISIONS PREFERABLY NOW OR IN THE

2 IMPLEMENTATION PHASE TO REDUCING COMMUTES RATHER THAN BLANKET3 TELECOMMUTE. THANK YOU FOR ALL OF YOUR WORK AND TIME.

4

5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS BEVEN D.

6

SPEAKER: I AM BEVEN D MEMBER OF THE BARC BOARD OF DIRECTORS 7 8 AND I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR UPLIFTING THE RAIL TRANSBAY CORRIDOR AND I WANT TO POINT OUT THE SURVEY RESEARCH WE HAVE 9 DONE SHOWS THAT IN THE MEGA REGION 80 PERCENT OF THE 10 RESPONDENTS FELT WE SHOULD BE MOVING FORWARD TO FIX OUR 11 TRANSIT SYSTEM AND TO MAKE IT MORE EFFECTIVE AND SPECIFICALLY 12 WHEN PRESENTED WITH NTRC, 80 PERCENT OF THE MEGA REGION AND 84 13 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA SAID THAT THIS IS REALLY AN ESSENTIAL 14 15 PROJECT. I'M HONORED TO BE DAD OF A 14-YEAR-OLD I DON'T THINK 16 HE'S GOING TO THANK ME FOR BARC INVOLVEMENT IT'S GOING TO BE DOWN THE ROAD WHERE GENERATIONS ARE GOING TO ENJOY A SEAMLESS 17 TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THAT WE HAVE TIED OUR RAIL SYSTEMS TOGETHER 18 SO THEY CAN BE MOST EFFECTIVE AS POSSIBLE. I WOULD ALSO LIKE 19 TO SAY I THINK THIS PROJECT AND YOU CITE IT AS ADDRESSING 20 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND I THINK THAT IS ABSOLUTELY 21 22 ESSENTIAL. AND THAT WE ARE ATTACHING AN EQUITY VISION TO THE NEW RAIL CROSSING AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE SIGNIFICANT I 23 APPRECIATE SO MUCH THE OPPORTUNITY TO TESTIFY AND IF I COULD I 24 WOULD LIKE TO CONGRATULATE CHAIR HAGGERTY FOR 20 YEARS OF 25



SERVICE TO THE MTC AND TO THE BAY AREA THROUGH THE MTC. THANK 1 2 YOU VERY MUCH. 3 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU BEVEN. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM SEAMLESS 6 7 BAY AREA. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 8 SPEAKER: HELLO. COMMISSIONERS THIS IS ADINA LEVIN. CAN YOU 9 HEAR ME? AND I DO NOT KNOW WHY ZOOM DOES THAT. I WOULD LIKE TO 10 SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF THE PROPOSAL FROM COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ 11 TO SUPPORT A REQUIREMENT FOR NON-DRIVE ALONE, BUT NOT 12 REQUIRING ONE SPECIFIC MODE BEING TELEWORK TO NOT DRIVE ALONE. 13 YOU KNOW, REQUIRING PEOPLE WHO WALK TO WORK TO STAY HOME 14 15 INSTEAD, MAKES NO SENSE AS MANY PEOPLE HAVE ALREADY MENTIONED 16 WAYS TO ACHIEVE THAT, SEAMLESS BAY AREA DID FORWARD YOU A REPORT WHICH WE HAVE RECENTLY COMPLETED. WE HAD SHARED AN 17 EARLIER DRAFT OF THAT REPORT TO YOU, SHOWING THAT THERE IS A 18 STRONG CORRELATION BETWEEN THE AMOUNT OF TRANSIT SERVICE AND 19 THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. SO WE WOULD ENCOURAGE THE 20 21 VERSION THAT COMES TO YOU FOR EXPERIMENTAL REVIEW, TO HAVE A 22 VERSION THAT GETS US TO THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE THAT THEY 23 HAVE -- WHAT WE HAVE HERE CORRELATED WITH AN INCREASE IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP INCREASING TRANSIT SERVICE IS NOT THE ONLY 24 THING WE NEED TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IN THE LONG RANGE 25



PLAN WE NEED CHANGES AS AN ESSENTIAL COMPONENT AND WE
 RECOMMEND THAT APPROVAL STRATEGY IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
 AS A WAY TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS GAP. THANK YOU.

4

5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CLIFF LENTZ,
6 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. I'M CLIFF LENTZ BRISBANE CITY COUNCILMEMBER. I WANT TO SAY MYSELF AND THE CITY OF 9 BRISBANE SUPPORTS REGIONAL PLANNING THAT MAKES SENSE AND 10 CREATES COLLABORATIVE FEEDBACK FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENT. CITY OF 11 BRISBANE PASSED MEASURE JJ IN 2018 SO HOUSING COULD OCCUR IN 12 THE BAY LANDS THIS ACTION BY CITIZENS WILL DOUBLE THE 13 POPULATION OF OUR CITY THIS WAS NOT AN EASY ENDEAVOR BUT WE 14 WORKED WITH OUR COMMUNITY AND STATE REPRESENTATIVES TO COME UP 15 16 WITH A BALANCE THE PLAN. SUPPORTED BY THE DEVELOPER AND HOUSING ADVOCATES, AND SENATOR SCOTT WIENER SHOWING PEOPLE OF 17 18 CALIFORNIA HOW TO DO IT RIGHT FOR ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS. MOVING FORWARD TO INCREASE HOUSING PRODUCTION BY 100 19 PERCENT FOR WHATEVER REASON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROPOSES 20 21 THAT BRISBANE INCREASE ITS HOUSING STOCK QUITE POSSIBLY UP TO ABOUT 450 PERCENT. ALSO, THE AREAS WHERE HOUSING IS BEING 22 23 PROPOSED IS LOCATED ON LAND THAT HOUSING SHOULD NOT BE DEVELOPED ON. SUCH AS FORMER UNREGULATED GARBAGE DUMP NEXT TO 24 A PROCESSING FACILITY ON A CURRENT PG&E SUBSTATION, AREAS THAT 25

September 23, 2020

ARE VULNERABLE TO SEA LEVEL RISE. NOW, I'M NOT SAYING POSTPONE 1 YOUR VOTE TODAY. IN FACT I'M NOURISHING YOU TO MOVE FORWARD IN 2 3 THE PROCESS, HOWEVER, WHAT I AM ASKING IS THAT WE CONVENE A MEETING WITH THE CITY OF BRISBANE, SAN MATEO COUNTY 4 5 REPRESENTATIVES, PBA2050 STAFF AND EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN. THERE SEEMS TO BE A DISCONNECT WITH OUR CITY THAT 6 NEEDS GET IRONS OUT. THERESE, I'M ASKING YOU IF YOU COULD HAVE 7 8 YOUR STAFF REACH OUT TO OUR CITY MANAGER CLAY HOLSTEIN TO ADDRESS THEE ISSUES AND MOVE FORWARD TO DEVELOP A REALISTIC 9 MISSION FOR BRISBANE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE WANT TO MAKE 10 SOMETHING HAPPEN BUT WHAT'S BEING ADDRESSED RIGHT NOW IS JUST 11 UNREALISTIC. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. 12 13 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: DAVE, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT YOU 14

14 SCOIL HAGGERIL, CHAIR: DAVE, IT'S MI UNDERSTANDING THAT FOU 15 WORK WITH ALL THE PLANNING DIRECTORS FROM ALL THE CITIES? 16

17 DAVE CORTESE: THAT'S CORRECT. WE HAD SEVERAL MEETINGS WITH THE
18 BRISBANE TEAM ALREADY THROUGHOUT PROCESS.

19

20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. NEXT
21 PERSON.

22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS KEVIN MA, PLEASE UNMUTE24 YOURSELF.

September 23, 2020

SPEAKER: HELLO MTC COMMISSIONERS, KEVIN MA, I SUPPORT THE 1 2 REQUIREMENT WE ALL RECOGNIZE GHGS ARE ONE COMPONENT OF TRANSIT 3 OF GOING TO WORK BUT TELEWORK IS INCREDIBLY INEQUITABLE IN THE CURRENT SYSTEM BASED ON HOW PEOPLE LIVE IN THEIR HOMES HOW 4 5 PEOPLE ACTUALLY GET TO WORK AS OF RIGHT NOW AND THE KINDS OF WORK AN EMPLOYEE HAS TO DO TO GET THEIR HOME SETUP FOR 6 EMPLOYER WORK. TECH IS FINE BUT RETAIL IS MUCH HARDER TO DO, 7 8 THERE IS GOING TO BE INEQUITY, THE CARS TRIPS FOCUS IS THE MAJORITY OF WHERE EMISSIONS COME FROM IN THE PROCESS WE SHOULD 9 SUPPORT MECHANISMS TO GET THEM ON TRANSIT THEN THEY GET TO USE 10 TRANSIT OUTSIDE OF WORK TOO T INSTEAD, WHICH IS SHOWN IN THE 11 OTHER SLIDE FOR THE TOLLING STRUCTURE THAT ACTUALLY CAN FUND 12 THESE THINGS. 60 PERCENT MANDATE IS KIND OF HARD TO MEET WE 13 SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON THING THAT ARE LIKELY TO HAPPEN. IT'S 14 15 HARD IN THIS CURRENT FINANCIAL SITUATION.

16

17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS STEVEN BUS, PLEASE UNMUTE18 YOURSELF.

19

20 SPEAKER: HI. THIS IS STEVEN BUS FROM SAN FRANCISCO. I'M PART 21 OF YIMBY ACTION HERE IN THE CITY. I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS MY 22 STRONG DISAPPROVAL OF THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. WE ARE ALL 23 SACRIFICING, NOW, TO REDUCE THE SPREAD OF THE VIRUS BUT NO ONE 24 IS WORKING FROM HOME. IT'S PROBABLY FINE IF YOU OWN A BIG 25 HOUSE OUT IN THE SUBURBS AND YOU'RE ENGINEER RETIREMENT BUT

September 23, 2020

FOR YOUNG WORKERS LIKE ME WHO LIVE IN CROWDED CONDITIONS 1 2 WORKING FROM HOME IS TERRIBLE. MYSELF AND FRIENDS OF MINE HAVE 3 ALL FALLEN INTO DEPRESSION. WE DO NOT WANT TO CONTINUE THIS AS A LIFESTYLE. AND BY FORCING WORKERS TO WORK FROM HOME, YOU ARE 4 5 GUARANTEEING THAT WE JUST LEAVE. AND I DON'T HAVE TO REMIND YOU, BUT OUR OBLIGATIONS REQUIRE GROWTH. AND IF THE REGION 6 STARTS TO SHRINK BECAUSE OF MANDATES YOUR PENSIONS WILL DRY 7 8 UP. NO ONE WANTS THIS TO HAPPEN. SO GOING FORWARD, PLEASE STRIKE THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. THIS IS A TERRIBLE WAY TO 9 10 LIVE. AND AS SAID IT'S INEQUITABLE FOR PEOPLE WHO LIVE --11 [INDISCERNIBLE] 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADAM PABLAKA. 13 14 SPEAKER: HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME? 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. 17 18 SPEAKER: I WANT TO BRIEFLY, CHAIR HAGGERTY HAD MENTIONED THAT 19 HE WAS SURPRISED BY ALL OF THIS TALK ON HOUSING. BUT HOUSING 20 21 AND TRANSIT ARE INTRINSICALLY RELATED. YOU CAN'T SEPARATE THEM. I THINK IT COMES BACK TO WHAT LIBBY SCHAAF SAID EARLIER 22 SHE WANTED THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME BUT LIKE MANY FOLKS 23 HERE THAT'S SIMPLY NOT EQUITABLE. YOU LOOK AT WHO IS CALLING 24 IN RIGHT NOW NOBODY IN THE RETAIL SECTOR NOBODY LOW INCOME IS 25

September 23, 2020

ABLE TO CALL IN. ALL OF THOSE OF US CALLING IN WORK FROM HOME 1 WHO HAVE THE JOBS TO COVER THIS. I THINK THE PROBLEM HERE, IT 2 3 GOES BACK TO THE OLD HENRY FORD QUOTE YOU ASK PEOPLE WHAT THEY WANT THEY WILL SAY THEY WANT A FASTER HORSE. A 60 PERCENT WORK 4 5 FROM HOME MANDATE IS THE FASTER FORCE. WHAT YOU NEED IS REDUCTION IN GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS. SIMPLY, MANDATING WORK FROM 6 HOME ISN'T GOING TO BENEFIT THE FOLKS WHO HAVE MONEY IT'S 7 8 GOING TO BENEFIT THE FOLKS WHO CAN BUYER BIGGER HOMES OR EVEN BUY UNITS EVICTING LOW INCOME FOLKS AND MERGE 1, 2 BEDROOMS TO 9 MAKE A BEDROOM FOR ZOOM. I ENCOURAGE COMMISSIONERS TO FOCUS ON 10 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION AS A GOAL BUT DO NOT REQUIRE 60 11 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME THAT'S INEOUITABLE AND WILL HURT THOSE 12 OF US WHO CAN'T AFFORD IT AND ARE ABLE TO AT LEAST WORK FROM 13 14 HOME .

15

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I'M SORRY. BUT WE KEEP
ADDING SPEAKERS SO I'M GOING TO HAVE TO MOVE IT IF WHAT'S BEEN
ADDED IN THE BEGINNING I WOULD HAVE STARTED WITH A MINUTE PER
SPEAKER BECAUSE WE'RE STILL AT 29 SPEAKERS. SO, ONE MINUTE.
CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SELINE.
SPEAKER: HI. I'M SALIM, A BAY AREA NATIVE. I WAS REALLY HAPPY

24 TO HEAR THE COMMENTS I HEARD FROM JOSEFOWITZ, AND I HOPE25 THAT'S THE DIRECTION COUNCIL GOES IN. I THINK THE 60 PERCENT

September 23, 2020

WORK FROM HOME MANDATE IS OUTRAGE FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE. IT'S 1 TAKEN AS LITERAL POLICY THAT YOU WOULD IMPLEMENT. MTC DOES NOT 2 3 HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. EVEN AS A STRATEGY IT'S SOMEWHAT OUTRAGE. YOU KNOW, I THINK A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO WORK FROM HOME DON'T 4 5 LIKE WORKING FROM HOME. I'M ONE OF THEM, AND ADDITIONALLY IT WOULD HURT THE LOCAL ECONOMY, WHICH IN LARGE PART DEPENDS ON 6 PEOPLE MOVING AROUND OUTSIDE OF THEIR OWN TOWN AND GOING TO 7 8 PLACES WHERE THEY WORK. AND, ADDITIONALLY, I, YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT THERE REALLY ISN'T AN ENVIRONMENTAL POINT TO JUST 9 TAPPING WORK FROM HOME WHEN YOU COULD HAVE OTHER SUSTAINABLE 10 WAYS OF GETTING TO WORK. I DO SUPPORT THE AMENDMENT. 11 12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS STACY14 RANDECKER.

15

16 SPEAKER: HI. SORRY. I WASN'T READY FOR THAT. I'M A 20 YEAR RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND AN ADVOCATE FOR ALL THE OUTCOMES 17 THAT YOU'RE SEEKING. I FOCUSED ON MAKING THIS REGION BETTER, 18 AND THE PLANET, VIA TRANSPORTATION. AND I'M SIMPLY IN SHOCK AT 19 THE THINKING AROUND THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE YES 20 WE WANT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES BUT WHY AREN'T YOU 21 CONSIDERING TRANSIT, WALKING, BIKING? YOU HAVE EVER RIDDEN 22 23 TRANSIT. YOU HAVE RIDDEN TRANSIT LATELY? I DID THE OTHER NIGHT CALTRAIN WAS EMPTY FROM FRONT TO BACK AND I DON'T KNOW HOW 24 THEY'RE GOING TO SURVIVE COVID. WORK FROM HOME MANDATE MAY 25

September 23, 2020

WORK FOR HIGH INCOME WORKERS BUT IT'S GOING TO DECIMATE 1 TRANSIT DOWNTOWN COMMUTERS AND LEAD TO DESTROYING THE BAY 2 3 AREA. BECAUSE IF THAT WORKER CAN WORK FROM HOME, WHY DO THEY NEED TO LIVE HERE? WHY COULDN'T THEY BE IN PEORIA ILLINOIS OR 4 5 INDIA. WORK FROM HOME WILL HAVE TREMENDOUS UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES BUT THERE IS A RABBIT IN THE HAT, A WAY TO HAVE 6 BETTER OUTCOMES THAN THIS 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE WE 7 8 NEED TO FOCUS ON EVERY INDIVIDUAL NOT JUST COMMUTE TRIPS FOR LARGE EMPLOYERS. YOU CAN DO THIS. YOU CAN PUT DEVICES IN THE 9 CARS. IF YOU SIMPLY REQUIRE IT THROUGH PUBLIC POLICY, YOU 10 COULD APPLY POLICY TO VEHICLE UTILIZATION AND NOT JUST FOR 11 SOME COMPUTERS. YOU COULD THEN SHIFT TO TRACKING HOW THAT 12 VEHICLE WAS USED, WHERE IT IS USED AND WHEN AND PRICE IT 13 ACCORDINGLY. AND IT WOULD BE NOTHING TO YOU. IT IS A LOW COST 14 THING YOU CAN PUT INSIDE THE CARS. AND IT WOULD ELIMINATE THE 15 16 TOLLING AND CONGESTION PRICING SOLUTIONS. YOU CAN IMPLEMENT IT QUICKLY AND YOU CAN GET EFFECTIVE EFFICIENT EQUITABLE AND 17 EXPERIMENTALLY SOUND TRANSIT. PLEASE CONSIDER --18

19

20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. YOUR TIME IS UP. THANK YOU.

21 KIMBERLY.

22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ARE YOU THERE? I CAN'T HEAR YOU MR. CHAIR.
24 YOU'RE FROZEN.



SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT ONE -- SO HELP ME 1 2 OUT IF I DON'T HEAR --3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: CAN YOU HEAR ME KIMBERLY? 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I CAN HEAR YOU NOW. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I NEED TO HEAR THE TIMER GO OFF ON 10 THAT. IF I HAPPEN TO MISS IT PLEASE CATCH IT. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I WILL. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID 13 14 PAGE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 15 16 SPEAKER: HI THANKS EVERYONE THANKS TO THE STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK. I'M WITH 350 SOL CON 17 VALLEY TELEWORK TEAM AND WE'RE REALLY OVERJOYED WITH THIS 18 PROPOSAL ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT RULE. THERE IS BEEN A LOT OF 19 TALK ABOUT HOW MUCH THERE IS PROBLEMS WITH TELEWORK. AND I 20 21 THINK ALL OF US KNOW THE GOOD AND BAD OF IT WE HAVE BEEN 22 THROUGH IT FOR THE LAST SEVERAL MONTHS BUT THERE IS NOT SO 23 MUCH TALK ABOUT THE PROBLEMS WITH WILDFIRES AND HURRICANES AND THE INEVITABLE GRADUAL WORSENING OF CLIMATE THROUGHOUT THE 24 WORLD THE PEOPLE WHO DIE FROM GREENHOUSE GAS PHENOMENAL IS 25



GOING TO BE WORSE IN THE THIRD WORLD. TERMS OF EOUITY AND 1 BENEFIT IS OUT OF BALANCE IN TERMS OF WHAT WE SHOULD BE DOING 2 3 TO GET THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS DOWN. 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. YOUR TIME IS UP. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU MR. PAGE. NEXT SPEAKER IS CLIFF 8 BARGER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 9 SPEAKER: HI THANK YOU. MY NAME IS CLIFF. I LIVE IN SAN 10 FRANCISCO. ESPECIALLY AFTER WHAT WE WENT THROUGH THE LAST FEW 11 WEEKS I COULDN'T AGREE MORE STRONGLY WITH THE GOALS TO LIMIT 12 OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. I THINK THAT'S SUPER IMPORTANT 13 BUT I WANT TO REALLY EMPHASIZE MY AGREEMENT WITH COMMISSIONER 14 JOSEFOWITZ. 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE JUST REALLY 15 16 DOESN'T MAKE ANY SENSE FOR OUR REGION. I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY WE WOULD BE MANDATING SO MANY PEOPLE WORK FROM HOME WHEN THEY 17 COULD TAKE MORE SUSTAINABLE MODES OF TRANSPORTATION AND HAVE 18 ESSENTIALLY THE SAME IMPACT, ESPECIALLY WHEN WE KNOW THAT 19 THERE ARE SO MANY POTENTIAL REGRESSIVE CONCERNS WITH FORCING 20 21 PEOPLE TO WORK FROM HOME WHO DO NOT HAVE THE LARGE LIVING ROOMS OR ROOM, HOME OFFICES, IF THEY LIVE WITH MULTIPLE 22 23 ROOMMATES. PERSONALLY I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO WHEN I CAN GET BACK INTO MY OFFICE ON A MORE REGULAR BASIS AND COLLABORATION 24 WITH MY EMPLOYEES BUILDING MEDICAL DEVICES. I CAN'T -- I'M NOT 25



AS EFFECTIVE WORKING FROM HOME. AND I DON'T THINK I'M ALONE
 HERE. THANK YOU.
 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM THE BAY AREA AIR
 QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. I CAN'T SEE YOUR NAME. PLEASE
 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8 SPEAKER: YES GOOD AFTERNOON MR. CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS I'M HILKIN PLANNING DIRECTOR AT THE BAY AREA AIR OUALITY 9 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. I WANT TO EXPRESS THE AIR DISTRICT'S 10 SUPPORT FOR THE STAFF PROPOSAL BEFORE YOU TODAY. 11 TRANSPORTATION IS THE LARGEST SOURCE OF GREENHOUSE GASSES AND 12 AIR POLLUTION IN THE BAY AREA. AND WE SIMPLY WILL NOT MAKE OUR 13 14 GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS AND AIR POLLUTION GOALS, ESPECIALLY IN OUR MOST IMPACTED COMMUNITIES IF WE DO NOT REDUCE VEHICLE 15 16 MILES TRAVELED. SO STAFF HAS ASSEMBLED A BOLD AND COMPREHENSIVE SET OF STRATEGIES FOR YOU, AND WE SUPPORT THE 17 PROPOSED BLUEPRINT BEFORE AND YOU WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING 18 WITH YOU IN THE YEARS AHEAD WHEN YOU HAVE COMPLETED THIS 19 20 PROCESS NEXT YEAR, THANKS. 21

22 23

24 SPEAKER: THANKS COMMISSIONERS. I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENTS25 THAT ADINA LEVIN ENCOURAGED TO YOU HOPEFULLY LOOK AT WHAT WE

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS BOB ALAN.

September 23, 2020

THINK AS A HIGH OUALITY CONSULTANT PROPOSAL ABOUT HOW WE CAN 1 INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AS A KEY STRATEGY AND HOPE YOU'LL 2 3 INCORPORATE THAT. MOST OF US AGREE ON THE NEED TO HAVE A SERIOUS TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY. I THINK PUTTING ONE OUT THERE 4 5 THAT SEEMS TO HAVE IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES, IS UNREALISTIC AND UNINTENDED EQUITY IMPACTS WARRANTS SERIOUS REEVALUATION OF THE 6 POLICY YOU ADOPT LOOK AT A TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY ONE THAT'S 7 8 GOING TO REDUCE YOU GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS. STAFF HAS AN IMPOSSIBLE JOB I THINK WE ALL ACKNOWLEDGE THAT I HOPE WE 9 RELY ON STRATEGY THAT WE THINK ACTUALLY HAVE A REALISTIC 10 OPPORTUNITY FOR IMPLEMENTATION AND TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT 11 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ PUT IN THE MIX IN THE ROUND TRIP 12 CAPPING AND OTHER IDEAS THAT WILL GET US TO THE SAME OUTCOME. 13 14 THANK YOU.

15

16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JONATHON C.
17 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 SPEAKER: HI. MY NAME IS JONATHON CASS SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF 20 SPUR. WE APPRECIATE ALL OF THESE AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES. LIKE 21 MANY WHO ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE OR 22 AGGRESSIVE TDM MANDATE TRIP CAPS WHERE PEOPLE HAVE THE OPTION 23 TO WALK, BIKE, VANPOOL CARPOOL OR WORK FROM HOME. IN ADDITION 24 WHAT'S BEEN SIDE MANDATE WORK FROM HOME IS GOING TO DAMAGE 25 SOME OF OUR SUSTAINABLE AND WALKABLE COMMUNITIES GREENHOUSE

September 23, 2020

GAS IMPACTS OF REMOTE WORK IS NOT STRAIGHT FORWARD. WORK FROM
 HOME CAN CAUSE MORE AUTO TRIPS FOR PEOPLE WHO WORK ALL DAY.
 POLICY NEEDS TO BE REVISED TO ADDRESS BENEFITS NOT JUST PEOPLE
 WORKING FROM HOME. REDUCED AUTO TRIPS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS ROB. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7 ROB NIELSEN.

8

SPEAKER: MY NAME IS ROB NIELSEN FROM PALO ALTO. I WANT TO 9 SPEAK ON THE 60 PERCENT WORK AT HOME MANDATE. I WOULD LIKE TO 10 ECHO THOUGHTS OF COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND SUPPORT FOR MORE 11 FLEXIBLE TARGETS BIKING, WALKING, LIMITING SINGLE DRIVING 12 COMMUTES. WORK AT HOME IS GOOD FOR SOMEBODY LIKE ME. I HAVE 13 BEEN DOING IT FOUR AND A HALF YEARS IN PALO ALTO. I HAVE A 14 15 NICE SIZE COUCH AND PEOPLE AROUND IT'S NOT GOOD FOR PEOPLE WHO 16 -- THEIR NEEDS INTO ACCOUNT. ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT HAVING GREATER DEVELOPMENT OUTSIDE OF THE BAY AREA RESULT IN POLICIES 17 LIKE THIS AND OTHER AREAS OF THE COUNTRY. NETTING MUCH MORE 18 GREENHOUSE GASS REDUCING GHGS IN THE BAY AREA. THAT CONCLUSION 19 20 MY COMMENTS.

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS DARIO.

23

24 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS DARIO IGLESIAS CALLING FROM SAN
25 FRANCISCO. I'M CALLING TO OPPOSE STRONGLY THE 60 PERCENT

September 23, 2020

MANDATE FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS. FIRST, IT IS UNREALISTIC IN 1 2 A SENSE THAT IT IS NOT POSSIBLE TO IMPLEMENT. SECOND, IT IS 3 UNREALISTIC IN ET SENSE THAT EVEN IF IT WAS IMPLEMENTED, THE COMPANIES WOULD RATHER MOVE THEIR OFFICES ELSEWHERE THAN 4 5 SATISFY SUCH MANAGEMENT. IT WAS MEANT TO BE A CHECK OFF IN A PLANNING TARGET INSTEAD LET'S TALK TAKE THE ACTUAL OBJECTIVE 6 SERIOUSLY IN HELPING REDUCE CONGESTION HAVING HIGHER DENSITY 7 8 SO THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT BECOMES FEASIBLE. IMPLEMENTING BIKING INFRASTRUCTURE TO GET PEOPLE OUT OF THERE ARE CARS WE NEED TO 9 STOP SUBSIDIZING CARS WITH FREE PARKING ET CETERA FEMALE WE 10 NEED TO IMPLEMENT PROJECTIONS PRICING SO THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY 11 DISINCENTIVIZE TRAVELING BY CAR. 12

13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER.

15

16 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS VADIM AND I AM STRONG HE OPPOSED TO THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE BACK BEFORE COVID WHEN I 17 WORKED IN AN OFFICE I NEVER EMITTED GREENHOUSE GAS DURING MY 18 COMMUTE BECAUSE I BIKED TO WORK. WORKING FROM HOME IN MY 19 APARTMENT FORCED ME TO WORK TO A HOME WHICH REOUIRES MORE 20 21 ENERGY TO HEAT AND COOL. AND I NOW DRIVEWAY AN OLD BEATER CAR 22 THAT GETS TEN MILES PER GALLON. I THINK WE CAN ALL AGREE THAT 23 BEING FORCED TO WORK FROM HOME VASTLY INCREASED MY GREENHOUSE GAS MISSIONS AND I AM NOT ALONE. PLEASE DON'T FORCE PEOPLE TO 24 INCREASE GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS BY MANDATING WORK FROM HOME. 25



1

September 23, 2020

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM GREENBELT ALLIANCE. 2 3 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS ZOEY DIRECTOR AT GREENBELT ALLIANCE. 4 5 I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF ON THE WORK. I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT FOR THIS EFFORT. BUT IF WE DON'T PLAN FOR FLOODING 6 ALL HOMES ROADS AND STRATEGIES WILL BE FLOODED CLIMATE A 7 8 ADAPTION CANNOT STOP AT THE SHORELINE MANY AREAS SUSCEPTIBLE TO FLOODING IMPACTING COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. DEVELOPMENT 9 LARGELY PROTECTED FROM FLOODING BASED ON PROJECTS BEING 10 IMPLEMENTED THESE ASSUMPTIONS WILL NOT BE REALITY WITHOUT 11 LEADERSHIP OF THIS COMMISSION WE URGE YOU TO LEADERSHIP THE 12 CONVERSATION ABOUT POTENTIAL MEASURES AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. 13 ADDITIONALLY WE RECOMMEND A REVAMP --14 15 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS NILO. 18 19 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS NILO, AND I LIVE IN SUNNYVALE AND 20 WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE WHAT MANY PEOPLE HAVE SAID ABOUT BEING 21 22 FLEXIBLE WITH THE 60 PERCENT MANDATE AND NOT MAKING IT ABOUT 23 TELECOMMUTING SO MUCH OF WHAT MAKES CITIES GREAT IS PEOPLE GETTING TOGETHER AND I WOULD POINT OUT THE CITIES THAT HAVE 24 THE BEST JOB OF LOW GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS RELY ON PEOPLE 25

September 23, 2020

GETTING TO JOB BY FREQUENT ELECTRIC TRAINS LIKE TOKYO AND 1 HAVING LOTS EVER HOUSING AND JOBS NEAR THOSE TRAIN STATIONS SO 2 3 THINGS THAT ENCOURAGE THAT INSTEAD OF TRYING TO DO THIS FIRST IN THE WORLD TELECOMMUTE THING PROBABLY ARE MORE REALISTIC AND 4 5 BETTER FITS, OUR FRIENDS IN THE NORTH BAY HAVE A TRAIN LINE THEY'RE BUILDING THEY SHOULD ELECTRIFY THAT RUN IT MORE 6 AFFECTIONATE HE AND RUN WELL HOUSING NEXT TO THAT WHICH SHOULD 7 8 SOLVE ALL THE PROBLEMS ABOUT GREENBELTS. APARTMENT BUILDINGS AIR GREAT FORM OF HOUSE. THANK YOU. 9

10

11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS COREY SMITH.

12

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY COREY SMITH ON BEHALF OF BAY 13 AREA HOUSING COALITION. I SHARE MANY OF THE CONCERNS MENTIONED 14 EARLIER AND APPRECIATE NICK JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS. ONE PIECE 15 16 OF THIS THAT I WOULD LIKE TO ADD IS THAT THERE IS SO MUCH ABOUT THE ECONOMY THAT WE DON'T KNOW WHAT IT'S GOING TO LOOK 17 LIKE A YEAR FROM NOW, FIVE YEARS FROM NOW, TEN YEARS FROM NOW, 18 AND ONE INDUSTRY THAT I CAN SPECIFICALLY POINT OUT IS THE 19 MEDICAL INDUSTRY AND THE PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE THAT ARE DOING 20 21 IN-PERSON MEDICAL VISITS VERSUS DIGITAL MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS 22 SO THERE IS SO MANY DIFFERENT PIECES HERE THAT ARE MOVING AND SHAKING OUT, SO MAXIMUM FLEXIBILITY IS REALLY APPRECIATED. 23 24 THANK YOU.



CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS JEREMY ROSE. 1 2 3 SPEAKER: HI THERE MY NAME IS JEREMY ROSE I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO I WANT TO CALL IN ECHO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S 4 5 CONCERNS AROUND TELECOMMUTING MANDATE NOT ALL JOBS CAN BE PERFORMED REMOTELY I ACTUALLY HAVE IN FRONT OF ME A REPORT ON 6 THE BAY AREA ECONOMY FROM 2011 BUT AT LEAST 50 PERCENT OF 7 8 EMPLOYMENT IN THE BAY AREA ACCORDING TO THESE SURVEYS IN INDUSTRIES LIKE RETAIL, LIKE FOOD SERVICES, LIKE 9 10 MANUFACTURING, THINGS CANNOT BE DONE IN PERSON. SO I DON'T SEE JUST HOW SIMPLY PROCLAIMING THOSE JOBS SHOULD HAPPEN REMOTELY 11 IS GOING TO MAKE THAT OCCUR. SECOND FOR WORKER WHO IS DO HAVE 12 THE OPTION TO WORK REMOTE HE I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THOSE WHO TO 13 NOT LIVE CLOSE ENOUGH TO WALK OR BIKE TO WORK, WILL BE LESS 14 15 LIKELY TO RECEIVE RAISES AND PROMOTIONS. AND FOCUS ON PUBLIC 16 TRANSIT AS A CLIMATE SOLUTION.

17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS JARROD NIELSEN. PLEASE19 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 SPEAKER: HI. MY NAME IS JARROD NIELSEN AND I WORK IN PALO
22 ALTO. I STRONGLY OPPOSE THE TELECOMPUTING MANDATE. IN-PERSON
23 WORK IS INCREDIBLY USEFUL FOR PROBLEM SOLVING COHESION
24 BUILDING COMMUNITIES I AGREE CLIMATE CHANGE IS A PROBLEM AND I
25 WORRY ABOUT IT BUT THIS TELECOMMUTING MANDATE IS INCREDIBLY



SHORT SITING AND FOR THAT THINKING. MANDATE WILL CRASH THE 1 REMOTE ECONOMY WITH TECH WORKERS LEAVING WHICH WILL DEVASTATE 2 3 THE LOW INCOME RETAIL PORTION AS WELL. IF THIS MANDATE IS PASSED THERE WILL NOT BE REVENUE TO EFFECT OTHER POTENTIAL 4 5 CHANGES SUCH AS HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT. THANK YOU. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND KATEL. 8 SPEAKER: HELLO COMMISSIONERS ROLAND CALLING FROM SAN 9 FRANCISCO. I LIKE MANY OTHER CALLERS AGREE CAN COMMISSIONER 10 JOSEFOWITZ'S RECOMMENDATION. I USED TO WALK A MILE TO WORK AND 11 BACK IT MAKES NO SENSE TO MAKE PEOPLE WHO WALK STAY HOME JUST 12 TO IMPROVE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WHAT YOU SHOULD BE DOING 13 INSTEAD IS GETTING MORE PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT. AND NOT THROW 14 UP YOUR HANDS AND SAY YOU CAN'T SOLVE THE BAY AREA'S 15 16 TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES. THOSE CHALLENGES ARE YOUR JOB AND YOU CAN'T SAW YOU'RE NOT GOING TO DO IT. WE'RE GOING TO MAKE 17 PEOPLE TODAY HOME. THAT'S NOT ACCEPTABLE. 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS THEO. PLEASE 20 21 UNMUTE YOURSELF. 22 23 SPEAKER: HELLO. I AM THEODORE RANDOLPH RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO I AM CALLING TO SUPPORT JOSEFOWITZ'S AMENDMENT. 24

25 MANDATE IS BAD FOR OFFICES, WE SHOULD PROMOTE INTERNET ACCESS

September 23, 2020

FOR OTHER REASONS. OVERSTATED GREENHOUSE GAS FOR COVID 1 [INDISCERNIBLE] PEOPLE ARE NOT DRIVING CHILDREN TO SCHOOLS NOT 2 3 EATING AT RESTAURANTS ALL OF THAT IS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THE SOLUTION IS AVAILABLE BUT UNAVOIDABLE MORE DENSITY HIGH 4 5 OUALITY PUBLIC TRANSIT TURNING NEIGHBORHOODS INTO MIXED USE WALKABLE COMMUNITIES. ALSO I THINK T ONE IS THE MOST EXPENSIVE 6 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN, [INDISCERNIBLE] INCLUDING ELECTRIC 7 8 CARS FROM -- TN EIGHT -- INFRASTRUCTURE IS MORE EXPENSIVE MORE HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT AND WALKABLE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK 9 YOU. 10

11

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: LAST FOUR DIGITS, 6187 PLEASE UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF. 6187 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS SARAH O. I HAVE RELIED ON PUBLIC 16 TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK. I OPPOSE OF THE WORK FROM HOME MAP 17 MANDATE AND ACCEPT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S COMP MIGRATION. 18 SOUNDS TO ME LIKE A STEEP DROP IN BUSINESS. I THINK IT'S 19 ATTEMPTING TO BUILD A VOID NEAR WORK CENTERS. DO NOT APPROVE 20 THIS MANDATE PLAN ON BUILDING MORE HOUSING IN HIGH RESOURCE 21 AREAS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT
24 FRUCKMAN.

25



2

September 23, 2020

1 JAKE MACKENZIE: I'M OUT OF HERE MR. CHAIR. BYE-BYE.

3 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS I'M ROBERT FRUCKMAN LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO CALLING ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME 4 5 MANDATE I SUPPORT THE AMENDMENT OF COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. IF THE ANSWER IS WE HAVE TOO MANY CARS ON THE ROAD, THE LANGUAGE 6 ABOUT INCREASING USAGE ABOUT OTHER TRANSPORTATION MODES BUT 7 8 THE STRATEGIES DO NOT INCLUDE LANGUAGE ABOUT LONG-TERM SOLUTIONS ABOUT REDUCING PARKING. WHITE COLLARS WORKER --9 10 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS FORCES CAR OWNERSHIP AND POLLUTION ON POOR POPULATIONS AND 60 PERCENT MANDATE WOULD NOT ADDRESS THIS 11 IF WE KNOW THAT CAR TRAVEL IS HARMFUL WE SHOULD REDUCE CAR 12 DEMAND BY EVERYONE NOT JUST OFFICE WORKERS REQUIRING WORKERS 13 TO WORK FROM HOME DOESN'T REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS IT MAKES THEIR 14 15 JOBS WORSE. THANK YOU.

16

17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA MALL ON 18 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

19

20 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALLEN, I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA
21 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MENTIONED EARLIER THE REPORT
22 THE BAY AREA IS UNDERSERVED WHEN IT COMES TO TRANSIT
23 PRECISIONS SO I WANT TO ENCOURAGE YOU TO LOOK AT INCLUDING
24 MORE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN PLANNED BAY AREA SO
25 THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY HAVE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS GOING TO

September 23, 2020

1 WORK FOR PEOPLE. YOU KNOW, I HAVE EXPERIENCED GOOD TRANSIT
2 BEFORE. I HAVE BEEN TO VANCOUVER I HAVE BEEN ON TRAINS THAT
3 RUN EVERY THREE MINUTES AND BUSES THAT RUN EVERY FIVE OR SIX
4 MINUTES IT'S POSSIBLE AND WE CAN DO IT HERE TOO. PLEASE DON'T
5 GIVE UP ON TRANSIT AND THINK ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AS A
6 SOLUTION BECAUSE IT IS COOL AND IT IS GREAT AND IT'S GOING
7 HELP US SAVE THE PLANET. THANK YOU.

8

9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DON C PLEASE10 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

SPEAKER: HELLO THERE SAN FRANCISCO RESIDENT GREAT WORK ON THE 12 PLAN TOTALLY SUPPORT GHG REDUCTION CAN'T SUPPORT A 60 PERCENT 13 MANDATE TELECOMMUTING MUST BE A STRATEGY BUT THIS IS SO OFF 14 BASE. YOU REFERENCED THE POLL. POLL ASKED A QUESTION 15 16 INCENTIVES TO ADDRESS COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT AT STOPS THAT GOT 20 PERCENT SUPPORT SO I'M CONFUSED ABOUT HOW THAT DRIVES 17 EVERYTHING I'M HERE TO SPEAK FOR THE SMALL BUSINESS OWNERS 18 BEING DECIMATED AROUND DOWNTOWN. COVID IS KILLING PEOPLE. THIS 19 IS LIKE A MASSACRE THESE PEOPLE EMPLOY LOW INCOME AND LOW-WAGE 20 WORKERS AND IF PEOPLE DON'T GET BACK TO WORK THESE BUSINESSES 21 22 WILL NEVER SURVIVE. I LIVE AT THE FOURTH AND KING STATION IN 23 SAN FRANCISCO, MY NEIGHBORHOOD, I DON'T RECOGNIZE IT ANYMORE. SO THIS IS A STRATEGY, BUT THIS CAN'T END POLLUTION. THANK 24 25 YOU.

1

September 23, 2020

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLES WHITFIELD PLEASE 2 3 UNMUTE YOURSELF. 4 5 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS CHARLES WHITFIELD CALLING TO OPPOSE THE BLANKET 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE AS 6 7 WRITTEN. FORCING WORKERS TO USE ALREADY CRAMPED OFFICE SPACE 8 DOES NOT TO HAVING OUR CLIMATE GOALS OR REDUCE CONGESTION. IF WE WANT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS VMT AND TRAFFIC 9 VIOLENCE WE MUST FOCUS ON THE SOURCE OF EMISSIONS CARS. WE 10 MUST FOCUS ON DENSER HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT AS PRIMARY TOOLS TO 11 REDUCE OUR CARBON FOOTPRINT. THANK YOU. 12 13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JASON BAKER.
15 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

SPEAKER: I GOT MUTED AND UNMUTED. THANK YOU JASON BAKER VICE 17 18 PRESIDENT OF TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FOR THE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA LEADERSHIP GROUP WE REPRESENT 350 19 BUSINESSES IN THE BAY AREA AND I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE 20 21 MANDATE SOLUTION TO POLLUTION AND TRAFFIC AND CARS. 22 TELECOMMUTING IS ONE TOOL IN THE TOOLBOX OTHERS INCLUDE 23 BELIEVE IT TRANSIT WALKING BIKING AND MOBILITY. A REMOTE WORKING MANDATE LIKE THIS RISKS ENCOURAGING SPRAWL AND NOT 24 WORK COMMUTE TRIPS AND DOING MORE HARM TO OUR ENVIRONMENTAL 25

September 23, 2020

EFFORTS ASKING COMMUTERS TO SWITCH TO SUSTAINABLE MODES OF 1 GETTING TO WORK. [INDISCERNIBLE] WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO WORK WITH 2 3 THE BUSINESSES THAT THIS WILL IMPACT. WE WANT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE. WE KNOW IT'S IMPORTANT. BUT THIS POLICY ISN'T THE 4 5 WAY TO DO IT. I ALSO WANT TO THANK MTC COMMISSIONERS FOR THINKING AS A REGION ON THE HIGH SPEED RAIL ISSUE AND THE 6 7 BUILDING BLOCKS FOR OUR HIGH SPEED RAIL. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SHEHAN. 10 SPEAKER: HI. MY NAME IS SHAHIN CALLING FROM SAN FRANCISCO, 11 REGARDING THE TELECOMMUTING MANDATE I'M CALLING IN SUPPORT OF 12 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S SUGGESTIONS. THIS IS A WELL 13 INTENTIONED MANDATE THAT THE LANGUAGE IN THE PLAN PUTS THE 14 15 CART BEFORE THE HORSE I'M NEARLY HALF MY COWORKERS COMMUTING 16 TO OUR PALO ALTO OFFICE VIA BICYCLE AND TALL TRAIN 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING POLICY WOULD LEAVE MANY OF US BEHIND AT HOME FOR 17 NO REASON. THIS IS THE ROLLING BLACKOUT OF TRANSPORTATION 18 PLANNING AND IT WOULD BE PAY PLANNING FAILURE NOT A SUCCESS. 19 INSTEAD I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MTC WORK TO REDUCE CAR TRIPS TO 20 REDUCE CONGESTION WHILE ALLOWING TRANSIT AND OTHER MODE SHARES 21 22 TO GROW. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION TO MY COMMENT AND 23 THANK YOU FOR YOUR IMPORTANT WORK ON THIS PLAN. 24

25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES.

1

September 23, 2020

GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES. I'M PRIMARILY HERE 2 3 TO STRONGLY OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE HAVING PEOPLE SHELTER-IN-PLACE IS NOT THE ANSWER TO THE CRISIS 4 5 WE NEED TO IMPLEMENT INFRASTRUCTURE, RAPID TRANSIT BUS ONLY LANES INCREASING FREQUENCY AND TRANSIT PRIORITY BUILDING OUT 6 LANES ET CETERA IT'S VERY FRUSTRATING TO HEAR STAFF PROPOSE 7 8 THIS AS THE ONLY OPTION WHEN WE CURRENTLY SPEND MILLIONS ON ROADS. I SPENT THE LAST SIX MONTHS WORKING FROM HOME MYSELF 9 AND DOING THIS 100 PERCENT OF THE TIME IS NOT VIABLE IT TAKES 10 A SERIOUS TOLL ON MENTAL. ONLY PEOPLE I KNOW WHO THINK THIS IS 11 A GOOD ARE RETIRED BOOMERS WHO HAVE TIME TO SPEND ALL DAY ON 12 BACK TO BACK MEETINGS. PLEASE CONSIDER COMMISSIONER 13 JOSEFOWITZ'S MOTION. THANK YOU. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEGGY. 17 18 SPEAKER: HI. I STRONGLY OPPOSE MANDATE THAT PRESCRIBES THAT 19 INDIVIDUALS AND COMPANIES HAVE TO STAY HOME, WHETHER IT'S FOR WORK, FOR SCHOOL I MEAN FOR CORONAVIRUS, YES. THIS IS NOT A 20

21 SOLUTION. SOLUTION IS PUTTING SOMETHING IN PLACE THAT ENABLES
22 ALTERNATIVES TO CARS. RIGHT? SO MORE TRANSPORTATION, LIMITS ON
23 CARBON EMISSIONS, AND MORE ELECTRIC OPTIONS THAT DON'T EMIT -24 I STRONGLY OPPOSE THIS. THIS. THIS IS NOT THE RIGHT THING FOR



SAN FRANCISCO FOR INDUSTRY FOR INDIVIDUALS. I HOPE YOU WILL
 RECONSIDER. THANK YOU.

3

4 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN WAYNE.
5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS JORDAN WAYNE 8 RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND I OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT 9 TELECOMMUTE REQUIREMENT. I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO COMMENTERS IN PARTICULAR COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. THIS IS A TOOL FOR 10 11 REDUCING GHG EMISSIONS SHIFTING ROAD SHARE. [INDISCERNIBLE] I SUPPORT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S ALTERNATIVE PROPOSAL. I 12 THINK WE SHOULD REPLACE THIS MANDATE WITH POLICIES THAT TARGET 13 SHIFTING MODE SHARE TO WALKING OR BIKING AND MODE SHARE 14 INSTEAD. I THINK IT WOULD BE IN LINE WITH THIS BODY TO SUPPORT 15 16 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION NOT FORBID TRIPS PEOPLE WANT TO TAKE WHICH WOULD IMPROVE THEIR LIVES. A RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE 17 BETTER FOR EXAMPLE, TAXING EMPLOYERS BASED MODE SHARE AND THE 18 19 EMPLOYEES THAT DRIVE TO WORK OR THE NUMBER OF PARKING SPOTS THEY OFFER OR BOTH. I WOULD SUPPORT CONGESTION PRICING AS AN 20 ALTERNATIVE. BUT I THINK THE 60 PERCENT IS NEEDLESS. 21

22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. ZACK.

September 23, 2020

SPEAKER: HI GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ZACK AND I LIVE IN SAN 1 FRANCISCO. I OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING MANDATE THIS 2 3 IS THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, THE STRATEGY IS A FUNDAMENTAL ABDICATION OF YOUR JOB TO PROVIDE SUPPORT FOR 4 5 TRANSPORTATION. IF IMPLEMENTED, THE STRATEGY WOULD PROPOSE SIGNIFICANT EQUITY CONCERNS TO VIRTUALLY EVERY SMALL BUSINESS 6 AND WIDESPREAD ECONOMIC EFFECTS THAT AVOID WIDESPREAD ECONOMIC 7 8 EFFECTS IF NOT IMPLEMENTED THE BLUEPRINT WON'T ACHIEVE ITS CLIMATE GOALS IT'S INSULTING THEY PROPOSAL HAS GOTTEN THIS FAR 9 WITH SO LITTLE THOUGHT. IT'S YOUR JOB TO MEET THE NEEDS. THIS 10 STRATEGY IS JUST GIVING UP. THANK YOU. 11

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENS.
14 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE MY NAME IS RODNEY NICKENS I AM A MEMBER OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY 17 COMMITTEE AND POLICY MEMBER. I AM CALLING IN FAVOR OF THE LAND 18 USE HOUSING AND ANTI- STRATEGIES ESPECIALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE 19 PROSPECT OF EXPANDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION AND 20 PRESERVATION AND BEING LOOKING FORWARDING TO FURTHER 21 22 CONVERSATION. I AM A MEMBER OF THE GREATER COMMUNITIES 23 COLLABORATIVE AND AM EXCITED ABOUT THE POSSIBILITIES OF DEVELOPMENT ON COMMUNITY LAND AS ALLUDED MANY STRATEGIES WILL 24 FALL SHORT TO ADDRESS OUR AFFORDABILITY CHALLENGES SO WE NEED 25

September 23, 2020

1 TO CONTINUE TO WORK TO BUILD AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THAT WILL 2 ADDRESS RACIAL EQUITY AND ENCOURAGE MORE HOUSING GROWTH IN THE 3 COMMUNITY. I WILL CLOSE PIE SAYING IT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO 4 WORKING WITH STAFF IN THE NEXT PHASES OF THE PLAN. THANK YOU. 5

6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ANDY CHAU.
7 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

SPEAKER: HI. GOOD AFTERNOON. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE 60 9 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. I THINK IT SHOULD BE AMENDED 10 TO ALLOW OTHER FORMS OF COMMUTE REDUCTION WITH THE OUTCOME OF 11 REDUCING SINGLE, A SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES. I AM CONCERNED, 12 INSTEAD, RIGHT NOW, A LOT JOBS HAVE THE REQUIREMENT OF HAVING 13 RELIABLE TRANSPORTATION, WHICH MEANS THAT YOU ESSENTIALLY HAVE 14 A CAR. BUT RIGHT NOW WITH THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE, WHAT IT 15 16 COULD BE IS, INSTEAD, IS MAKE CHANGING TO HAVING A DEDICATED HOME OFFICE WHICH MEANS A LOT OF PEOPLE IS, THEY CANNOT HAVE A 17 -- THEY NEED TO HAVE A DEDICATED SPACE, THAT MEANS THEY MOVE 18 TO -- LARGER HOUSING PRESUMABLY IN THE SUBURBS THAT HAS EQUITY 19 ISSUE AND ULTIMATELY HINDER PEOPLE. THANK YOU. 20

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS KELSEY. PLEASE23 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS KELSEY BANES CALLING 1 2 APPROXIMATE PENINSULA FOR EVERYONE. AND I DO SUPPORT 3 STRATEGIES TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BUT I AGREE WITH THE OTHER SPEAKERS THAT THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE IS ILL 4 5 ADVISED. I LIVE IN PALO ALTO IT'S ONE OF THE WORST CITY IN TERMS OF JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND I THINK A LOT OF SPEAKERS 6 TODAY HAVE MENTIONED THEY WORK IN PALO ALTO. BUT I THINK IT'S 7 8 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE WHAT THE TOP EMPLOYER IN PALO ALTO ARE. IT'S LUCILLE PACKARD CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL, STANFORD HEALTH 9 10 CARE, STANFORD UNIVERSITY, VA PALO ALTO HEALTH CARE SYSTEM. TOP EMPLOYERS ARE EDUCATION AND HEALTH CARE AND OUR TEACHERS 11 WHO ARE TEACHING AT STANFORD AND SERVING VETERANS AT THE VA 12 ARE NOT INTERESTED IN CONTINUING TO WORK FROM HOME FOR 13 FOREVER. MANDATE IS A HEAVY-HANDED WAY OF HANDLING THIS ISSUE. 14 AND WOULD PREFER TO SEE MTC FOCUS ON INCREASING TRANSIT 15 16 OPERATIONS. I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. THANK YOU. 17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU.

19

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: DANIEL WOODS MULLIGAN. YOU ARE THE LAST
21 SPEAKER. AFTER THIS SPEAKER PUBLIC HEARING WILL CLOSE.

22

23 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS DANIEL WOODS MILLIGAN I LIVE AND WORK IN
24 SAN FRANCISCO. I UNDERSTAND THE REASONS FOR THIS, AND THAT
25 BUDGETS ARE HARD AND THAT TRANSPORTATION IS CROWDED. I JUST

September 23, 2020

LIKE TO ECHO SOME OF THE OTHER COMMENTS. I LIVE WITH FIVE 1 ROOMMATES THAT'S NORMAL FOR A LOT OF US. I WORK IN DOWNTOWN. 2 3 THIS WOULD MAKE MY LIFE UNLIVABLE. THERE IS NO WAY THEY COULD AFFORD TO LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND WORK IN SAN FRANCISCO WITH 4 5 FIVE OF US IN ONE HOUSE WORKING FROM HOME. I HOPE THAT THOUGHT CAN BE GIVEN TO WHAT THIS WOULD MEAN FOR THOSE OF US WITH 6 7 THESE ROOMMATE SITUATIONS WHICH ARE REALLY COMMON IN SAN 8 FRANCISCO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALL OF YOU FOR YOUR WORK. 9 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT'S THE END OF THE 10 11 PUBLIC HEARING. 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MR. CHAIR, SORRY TO INTERRUPT YOU, THERE 13 WERE OVER 100 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS. OKAY. JUST WANT TO MAKE 14 15 SURE. 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: DO YOU WANT TO POST THEM? 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THEY ARE POSTED AS A SINGLE DOCUMENT 19 LISTED AS A EIGHT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT, AND IF YOU'RE READY 20 I'LL READ THEM INTO THE RECORD. 21 22 23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: DO YOU HAVE TO READ THEM ALL? 24



CLERK OF THE BOARD: I BELIEVE SO. LET'S ASK LEGAL COUNSEL TO 1 2 CONFIRM THAT. 3 ADRIENNE WEIL, COUNSEL: THAT'S THE PREFERABLE WAY TO GO. 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: IS IT PREFERABLE? OR IS IT THE LEGAL 6 7 WAY? JUST READ THEM. 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, SIR. SCOTT SINI, SCOTT CONNER, MIKE 9 G. ERIN E ANDREW F. BARIC. ZACK L. AUNT S. JASON BAKER SILICON 10 VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP. JONATHON Z, ELIZABETH GROSSMAN. 11 ALLISON A. JIM W OF BAY AREA COUNCIL. PARTHIC, STACY BARTLETT, 12 STEPHANIE BEECHAM. MAC B OF SAN FRANCISCO, JASON BAKER. AKSHAE 13 B. BRAD, CLAYTON BRISBANE, MILA, HARE COOK, KAY COOK ADRIAN 14 CULVERT JOSHUA DAVIS. KYLE. KRISTEN CONNOLY EAST BAY 15 16 LEADERSHIP GROUP. DAVID ELLIS JESSE FARMER KEVIN FERGUSON JOHN G. OF CONSTRUCTION FIELD INCORPORATED, HANCOCK OF FLYNN 17 PROPERTIES INCORPORATED. SAMUAL FRITZ, JOSH G, RYAN G., 18 GALETE, JONATHON GORDON, MICK HARRIS, MIHMY HART, JIM HARTNETT 19 OF SAN MATEO DISTRICT. DARLENE G OF HMTV CORPORATION, ANNE 20 21 HILL, DARLENE G. OF ATT CORPORATION. BRENDON IRVINE BROOK. CATHY JORDAN. C MICHAEL CAM. IRA KAPLAN. CATTLE, MATT LINK. 22 DANIEL C. BUDRY, ANDREW KRAUSS. JOSEPH. DAVID L. DEBBIE L. 23 KEVIN MCDONNELL JUSTIN. PROSPER N. ED P. CHRISTOPHER PETERSON, 24 25 KEVIN PETERSON, CHRIS REVEAL OF PLANT CONSTRUCTION COMPANY.

September 23, 2020

ZABIK, JUSTIN P. HANSEN O, ALEXANDER O. DR. STEVE R. JESSE 1 RICHMOND, SHAHIM, MARK CROSS, ERIC S. WILLIS B JR. ADINA LEVIN 2 3 SEAMLESS BAY AREA. MATT, KELLY S, CAITLIN, RICHARD OF SWIFT REAL ESTATE PARTNERS, ZACK TAYLOR NATHAN T. KAREN T. MICHAEL 4 5 COVARRUBIAS OF TMG PARTNERS. ALIX T, PATRICK T. BENJAMIN O, COLLIN OF VAN BARTEN GROUP; CHELSEA, DAVID WHITTAKER, JORDAN 6 WAYNE. WOODROW, WOODS, CLAIR WRIGHT, RICHARD Y, ZAVAKER, 7 8 MICHAEL Z, OF WEST COAST INDUSTRIES BEN SOTO, ROSEANNE FAUST. AND TESLIN YOW OF ALAMEDA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. 9 10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I CAN GO TO COMMISSIONERS? 11 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. 12 13 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY. SO I 14

15 WAS GOING TO MAKE A -- OFFER AN AMENDED MOTION. IF THAT WAS 16 APPROPRIATE AT THIS STAGE.

17

18 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: YOU CAN TRY IT AND SEE IF THE SECOND IS
19 MAKER WILL ACCEPT IT.

20

21 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. SO I WILL ALSO PUT THIS IN THE
22 CHAT AND I WILL READ IT OUT. SO, IT'S THE AMENDED MOTION IS A
23 MODIFICATION TO STRATEGY EN SEVEN WHICH THE STRATEGY EVERYBODY
24 HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT TO RE-- [INDISCERNIBLE] COMMUTING
25 MANDATES FOR OFFICE EMPLOYERS AND MANDATE TELECOMMUTING

September 23, 2020

SUSTAINABLE MODES OR EQUIVALENT THAT WOULD GENERATE THE SAME 1 2 GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS AT THE EXISTING STRATEGY BY 3 MODIFYING OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE STRATEGY BECAUSE BY INCORPORATING THE ABILITY FOR PEOPLE BASED ON THE FEEDBACK 4 5 THAT WE GOT FROM STAFF, YOU CAN'T JUST ADD IN TRANSIT, INTO THIS STRATEGY AND EXPECT THE SAME LEVEL OF GREENHOUSE GAS 6 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS SO YOU NEED TO MODIFY IT A LITTLE BIT, 7 8 FOR INSTANCE BY, I DON'T WANT TO DO THE MODIFICATION HERE BECAUSE I DON'T HAVE THE MODEL, BUT GIVING STAFF A LITTLE BIT 9 10 OF LEEWAY TO MAKE SLIGHT MODIFICATIONS TO THE STRATEGY TO STILL BE ABLE TO MEET OUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS. 11 12

13 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT TO THE MAKER OF THE MOTION
14 AND THE SECONDER WHICH WAS PEDROZA SPERING, OR PEDROZA SPERING
15 EITHER WAY, ARE YOU GOING TO ACCEPT THAT AMENDMENT?

16

17 JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN, I JUST WANT, DAVE, V, YOU JUST 18 HEARD THAT MOTION, WHAT DOES THAT DO TO THIS PLAN AND THE TIME 19 FRAME?

20

21 THERESE MCMILLAN: SPERING, LET ME START FIRST AND THEN I'LL
22 HAND IT OVER TO DAVE. I THINK THERE IS A COUPLE OF THINGS
23 THAT, FRANKLY, AS STAFF WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BALANCE IN
24 TERMS OF THIS. ONE OF THE, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE SITUATIONS IS
25 THE FACT THAT THIS IS -- THIS BROADER INTERPRETATION IS



OVERLAYING OVER A SET OF STRATEGIES THAT WE ARE ALREADY
 ASSUMING IN THE PLAN. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT.

3

JAMES P. SPERING: THERESE, I THINK WE HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING 4 5 THERE. IF DAVE COULD JUST ANSWER THAT OUESTION BECAUSE I WANT TO SEE IF WE CAN MOVE THIS THING ALONG. DOES THIS IMPACT THE 6 GREENHOUSE GAS NUMBERS THAT ACHIEVE WITH THE MOTION THAT'S 7 8 BEING MADE? >DAVE VAUTIN: WHAT I WOULD SAY COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, PHRASING HERE WOULD ENABLE US TO INCREASE THE 9 LEVEL OF THE MANDATE TO ACHIEVE INCREASED -- OR THE SAME I 10 SHOULD SAY, GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS, WE WOULD NEED TO SPEND 11 TIME CALCULATING THAT AND IT MIGHT LEAD TO A MUCH HIGHER 12 MANDATE MODEL SUCH AS 80 PERCENT OR MORE FOR OFFICE SPACE 13 EMPLOYERS FOR THESE VARIETY OF TRIP TYPES. SO THIS MAY CAUSE 14 15 THIS NEXT PHASE OF ANALYSIS TO TAKE A BIT LONGER THAN 16 PREVIOUSLY ENVISIONED. MAYBE NOT MUCH LONGER BUT WOULD 17 PROBABLY REQUIRE A BIT MORE WORK.

18

JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN I'M CERTAINLY GOING TO OPPOSE
THE MOTION, IF IT DOES GET A SECOND. A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT
NEED TO BE STATED. ONE IS THAT THIS APPRISES TO SMALL
BUSINESSES, TO THE LARGE EMPLOYERS 25 PEOPLE OR MORE SMALL
BUSINESSES AREN'T GOING TO BE IMPACTED. IF WE GO TO THE MIDDLE
OF NOVEMBER, 6 TO 8 MONTHS ALL OF THESE ISSUES BEING TALKED
ABOUT CAN BE ADDRESSED IN THAT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND

September 23, 2020

COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS PROPOSING IMPACTS ALL OF US WE 1 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE IMPACTS ARE GOING TO BE IT ISN'T FAIR TO 2 3 THROW THAT OUT AT THIS MINUTE AND NOT UNDERSTAND WHAT THE IMPACT IS. LET'S HAVE STAFF GO THROUGHOUT ANALYSIS IN THE 4 5 IMPLEMENTATION PHASE OF WHAT'S BEING PROPOSED. AND THE OTHER THING I WANT TO POINT OUT, WE HAVE 6 TO 10 PERCENT THAT ARE 6 7 COMMUTING NOW? THIS PLAN TAKES IT UP TO ABOUT 25 PERCENT. 75 8 PERCENT OF THE WORKERS ARE STILL GOING TO BE COMMUTING. THEY'RE STILL GOING TO BE PLUGGING UP OUR BRIDGES AND 9 EVERYTHING AND STILL DRIVING INTO SAN FRANCISCO. SO AGAIN I 10 WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO ADOPT THIS PLAN, LET 11 US ADDRESS THESE ISSUES THAT ARE BEING RAISED WHEN WE GO 12 THROUGH THE IMPLEMENTATION IT'S GOING GIVE US TIME TO LOOK AT 13 IT, STUDY IT AND REVIEW IMPACTS. 14

15

16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: IT'S NOT A MOTION. WE ASKED WHETHER YOU
17 WANT TO ACCEPT THE FRIENDLY AMENDMENT.

18

19 COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I DON'T LIKE TO PUT A WRENCH IN THINGS 20 AT THE LAST MOMENT BUT THIS WAS A STRATEGY WE SAW TWO WEEKS 21 AGO AT THE COMPETE MEETING. I RAISED THE CONCERNS AT THE TIME 22 BUT THERE WAS NO ALTERNATIVE AT THIS COMMISSION MEETING TO 23 GRAPPLE WITH. SO THAT'S WHY I'M GOING TO MAKE A SUBSTITUTE 24 MOTION. FIRST MOTION WOULD SAY INCLUDE MY AMENDMENT.



```
SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. SO YOU'RE MOVING THE STAFF
1
    RECOMMENDATION PLUS YOUR AMENDMENT?
2
3
    COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
4
5
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: IS THERE A SECOND.
6
7
8
   EDDIE AHN: I'LL SECOND.
9
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER AHN?
10
11
   EDDIE AHN: YES.
12
13
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. ROLL CALL VOTE.
14
15
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]
17
18
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. MOTION FAILS. WHAT WAS THE VOTE?
19
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE COUNT, FOUR AYES NINE NOS.
20
21
22
    SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY NOW MOVE BACK TO THE ORIGINAL
23
   MOTION. SPERING DO YOU WANT TO RESTATE YOUR ORIGINAL MOTION.
```

September 23, 2020

JAMES P. SPERING: MOTION IS THAT I MOVE THE APPROVAL OF THE 1 REVISED MTC RESOLUTION 4337 PLANNED BAY AREA FINEST BLUEPRINT 2 3 AS PRESENTED TODAY AND THAT STAFF LOOK AT THE -- I CAN'T REMEMBER THE WORD WE USED SOME OF THE ALTERNATIVES MENTIONED 4 5 BY JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS AND BY THE END OF THE YEAR WHEN THE PLAN COMES BACK TO US FOR THE GROSS -- GROWTH STRATEGY, THEY 6 WOULD HAVE TO BE EQUIVALENT, GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS BENEFITS. SO 7 8 THAT WAS THE MOTION, MR. CHAIRMAN. 9 ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND CHAIR. 10 11 GINA PAPAN: I CAN HEAR THAT AGAIN PLEASE SORRY. 12 13 JAMES P. SPERING: I'M MOVING THE PLAN AS PRESENTED THEN WE'RE 14 ASKING STAFF TO LOOK AT ANY OF THESE ALTERNATIVES AND BETWEEN 15 NOW AND NOVEMBER, WHEN THE PLAN COMES BACK TO US, THAT IF THE 16 ALTERNATIVES THAT ARE BEING MENTIONED BY COMMISSIONER 17 JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS, IF IT GIVES US THE EQUIVALENT OF THE 18 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS THAT WE'RE GETTING FROM THE PROPOSED 19 PLAN, THEY WILL BE CONSIDERED AT THAT TIME. WE'RE ADOPTING A 20 21 PLAN THAT MEETS OUR GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS. 22 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. MOTION PEDROZA SAID HIS SECOND 23 STANDS. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE. 24



CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] OKAY. THAT WILL BE 12
 YES. ONE NO. ONE ABSTENTION.

3

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON. I THINK 4 5 IT'S THE CHAIR OF THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE, WHICH JAKE HAS LEFT. JULIE IS THE CHAIR. MAYBE THAT'S THE FIRST THING WE 6 SHOULD TALK ABOUT ABAG IS THE CHAIR FOR THE LEGISLATIVE 7 8 COMMITTEE, JULIE PIERCE JAKE WAS MADE VICE CHAIR. MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET SEPTEMBER, REFERRED THREE ITEMS TO 9 THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. ITEM NINE A MEASURE RR CALTRAIN 10 \$0.18 SALES TAX DEDICATED SOURCE OF TAX REVENUE FOR A 18 OR 11 1.205 SALES TAX FOR 30 YEARS FOR OPERATING MAINTENANCE CAPITAL 12 CONSISTENT WITH CALTRANS REVENUE STREAMS NEW TAX ESTIMATE TO 13 BE SUFFICIENT TO MEET OPERATING COST AT THIS TIME THEREBY 14 15 REDUCING FINANCIAL PRESSURE ON MEMBER AGENCIES MOVE FOR 16 SUPPORT ON POSITION RR.

17

18 JEANNIE BRUINS, VICE CHAIR: SECOND.

19

20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: SECOND BY BRUINS. ROLL CALL VOTE,
21 PLEASE? WAIT. ANYBODY WISHING TO SPEAK? ANY COMMENTS ANYBODY
22 WISHING TO SPEAK?

23

24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT AND I
25 HAVE RECEIVED NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.



1 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ROLL CALL VOTE. 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] 4 5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: STOP. I'M GOING TO DO THE WHOLE REPORT 6 7 AND IN ONE MOTION IF THAT'S OKAY. EVERYBODY OKAY WITH THAT? 8 MEASURE DD SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY --[INDISCERNIBLE] EXTENSION 20 YEAR EXTENSION WOULD PROVIDE 9 CERTAINTY NEEDED TO KEEP PROJECT PIPELINE MOVING AND MATCHING 10 FUNDS FOR STATE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS AND OTHER PROGRAMS. 11 RENEWABLE SUNSET MARCH 30, 2045. I MOVE APPROVAL OF THAT ONE. 12 PROPOSITION 16 STATEWIDE BALLOT INITIATIVE TO REPEAL 13 CALIFORNIA AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLAN ACROSS CALIFORNIA EVENTUAL 14 15 TOOL TO HELP CREATE MORE DIVERSE WORKFORCE CONTRACTING POOL 16 AND STUDENT BODY WITHIN THE CONFINES OF THE FEDERAL LAW. I IMPROVE A SUPPORT POSITION OF 16. LET'S SEE HERE. IN ADDITION 17 TO THE ITEMS REFERRED BY ABAG MTC LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE THERE 18 IS STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO SECOND A SUPPORT POSITION ON SB146 19 AUTHORED BY SENATOR BEALL ASSURING ROBUST DIGITAL ENGAGEMENT 20 EFFORTS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WITHOUT REACH REQUIREMENTS 21 22 AFTER SHELTER-IN-PLACE IS LISTED CHAIR HAGGERTY AND FORMER MTC 23 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE CHAIR AUTHORIZED STAFF TO COMMUNICATE A POSITION OF SUPPORT ON THE BILL IN JULY PURSUANT TO THE 24 MISSION URGENCY PROCEDURES THIS ACTION SO THIS ACTION TODAY IS 25



SIMPLY TO RATIFY THE POSITION, THE BILL IS CURRENTLY AWAITING 1 SIGNATURE BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM I MOVE A SUPPORT POSITION OF 2 3 SENATE BILL 146. SO WITH THAT, YOU HAVE ALL OF THEM TOGETHER. IS THERE A SECOND? 4 5 ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND, PEDROZA. 6 7 8 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. IS EVERYBODY OKAY VOTING ON THEM ALL TOGETHER? 9 10 SPEAKER: YES. 11 12 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES. 15 16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THERE WAS -- YOU HAD NO LETTERS. I 17 FORGOT TO ASK IF YOU HAD ANYTHING RECEIVED. 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC 20 COMMENT AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. 21 22 23 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: I'M ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS UNDER 24 PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM TEN AT INFO BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD ALSO 25



ASK IF ANY MEMBERS FROM THE GENERAL PUBLIC WITH QUESTIONS OR ANY COMMENT UNRELATED TO ANYTHING ON THE AGENDA. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT? CLERK OF THE BOARD: NONE. SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THIS CONCLUDES THIS MEETING. NEXT MEETING OF METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WILL BE HELD REMOTELY BY WEBCAST OR 375 BEALE STREET ANY CHANGES TO THE PUBLIC WILL BE DULY NOTED. [ADJOURNED] 



Broadcasting Government