METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 1 WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 9, 2020, 1:30 PM 2 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. THIS 4 5 IS THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 9TH, 2020. I AM CYNTHIA MURRAY, THE VICE CHAIR OF THE PAC AND I AM 6 STEPPING UP FOR RANDI KINMAN WHO HAD A DEATH IN THE FAMILY AND 7 8 WILL BE JOINING US LATER IN THE MEETING. I WILL NOW CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. OKAY. BROADCAST TEAM IS ALREADY ROLLING. SO 9 10 THE FIRST ITEM IS --11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THE BROADCAST TEAM ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. 12 13 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: REQUEST THE BROADCAST TEAM TO ROLL THE 14 15 ANNOUNCEMENT. SORRY. I THOUGHT THEY ALREADY DID THAT. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. 16 PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER 17 N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REOUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. 18 THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL 19 UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY 20 21 NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA 22 ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR 23 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS 24 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD 25

USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL 1 UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES 2 3 WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE 4 5 THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS 6 BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING AT 7 8 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT 9 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN 10 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE 11 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS 12 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE 13 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL 14 15 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE 16 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO 17 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE 18 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. 19

20

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

21 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. ORDER OF THE ITEMS
22 BEING PRESENTED TODAY HAS CHANGED. CHAIR'S REPORT AND THE BLUE
23 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE COUNCIL INPUT ITEMS WILL BE
24 AFTER THE PRESENTATION OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL



BLUEPRINT AND FINAL ENGAGEMENT. CLERK CALL THE ROLL AND 1 2 CONFIRM QUORUM. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MICHAEL BALDINI? 4 5 MICHAEL BALDINI: HERE. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. RICHARD BARNETT? 9 SPEAKER: HERE. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CARLOS CASTELLANOS WILL BE JOINING US 12 LATER. RICK COATES? 13 14 15 RICK COATES: HERE. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABIGAIL COCHRAN. 17 18 19 ABIGAIL COCHRAN: HERE. 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED. >ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: 21 22 HERE. 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: BOB GLOVER IS ABSENT. CYNTHIA G IS 24 EXCUSED. RICH HEDGES? 25



```
1
2
    RICHARD HEDGES: HERE.
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: MICHELLE HERNANDEZ?
4
5
    MICHELLE HERNANDEZ: HERE.
6
7
8
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: WENDI KALLINS?
9
    WENDI KALLINS: HERE.
10
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: RANDI KINMAN IS ABSENT UNTIL SHE ARRIVES.
12
    ADINA IS ABSENT. MICHAEL LOPEZ? MICHAEL LOPEZ?
13
14
15
    MICHAEL LOPEZ: HERE.
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MARC MADDEN? MAD.
17
18
19
    MARC MADDEN: HERE.
20
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: ADRIENNE MENDOZA?
21
22
23
    SPEAKER: HERE. DAISY OZIM IS ABSENT. BEN SCHWENG?
24
    BENJAMIN SCHWENG: HERE.
25
```



1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. TERRI SCOTT? TERRI SCOTT IS 2 3 ABSENT. WALTER WILSON? 4 5 WALTER WILSON: PRESENT. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE A QUORUM. 8 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: NEXT IS APPROVAL OF THE JULY 9 10 8TH, 2020 MINUTES. MAY I HAVE MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES. 11 12 SPEAKER: MOTION. 13 14 15 SPEAKER: SECOND. 16 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: DID YOU GET THAT? 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RICH MOTIONED AND -- SECONDED. ARE THERE 19 ANY ABSTENTIONS? IF SO SAY YOUR NAME. OKAY I'M GOING TO GO TO 20 21 ROLL CALL VOTE. [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. 22 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: AND I SEE BOB GLOVER HAS JOINED 23 US, IF YOU WANT TO NOTE THAT FOR ATTENDANCE. NEXT ITEM IS ITEM 24 FOUR PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES OR 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED 1 AT INFO BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD. AND I WOULD ASK IF 2 3 THERE ARE ANY PARTICIPANTS PARTICIPATING TO USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO 4 5 SPEAK. DO I HAVE ANY COMMENTS? 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PUBLIC COMMENTS SUBMITTED HOWEVER KEN 8 BUKOWSKI HAS RAISED HIS HAND. GO AHEAD. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. 9 SPEAKER: I WANT TO SAY, I HAVE SOME DIFFICULTY WITH THE PUBLIC 10

11 OUTREACH FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. IT'S JUST VERY 12 DIFFICULT WHEN YOU CAN'T HEAR WHAT ALL OF THE PEOPLE ARE 13 SAYING, THE ONE-ON-ONE PUBLIC FORUMS DON'T ALLOW ANYBODY TO 14 HEAR WHAT OPPOSITION MAY BE SPOKEN. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE 15 THAT COMMENT. THANK YOU.

16

17 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU. IS THERE NO OTHER 18 ADDITIONAL?

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC21 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

22

23 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU MOVING TO ITEM FIVE
24 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS VEDA FLOREZ WILL PROVIDE THE REPORT FOR
25 THE ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. FARE



COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE. IS THERE SOMEONE 1 TAKING ADINA'S PLACE ON THAT? IF NOT LET'S GO TO VEDA? 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WENDI IS HERE FOR THAT. 4 5 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: VEDA FIRST. 6 7 8 VEDA FLOREZ: HI THIS IS VEDA FLOREZ AND I HAVE NO REPORT. LAST WE MET WAS BEFORE THE JULY MEETING SO WE'RE ALL CAUGHT UP AND 9 UP TO DATE. OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE IN OCTOBER. 10 11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WENDI, ARE 12 YOU MAKING THE REPORT FOR THE FARE COORDINATION AND 13 14 INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL ACTUALLY BE MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 21ST OF THIS MONTH. 17 18 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU MARTHA. 19 20 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: WENDI? 21 22 23 WENDI KALLINS: I DID NOT PREPARED TO PRESENT THE REPORT. I'M TRYING TO REMEMBER WHAT WE D WE HAD A PRESENTATION ON THE 24



PROCESS THAT WILL BE -- FROM THE CONSULTANTS -- AND I SAID I'M 1 2 TRYING TO DO THIS FROM MEMORY, SO FORGIVE ME. 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: SHOULD WE WAIT ASK CARRY THIS 4 5 OVER TO THE NEXT MEETING WHEN ADINA IS HERE AND YOU'RE NOT 6 CAUGHT UNPREPARED? 7 8 WENDI KALLINS: THAT MIGHT BE GOOD. AS I SAID, YOU KNOW, WE HAD A MEETING, AND WE DID GET CAUGHT UP TO DATE ON THE PROCESS 9 10 THAT'S GOING ON, AND -- [INDISCERNIBLE] 11 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: YOU'RE BREAKING UP ON US WENDI, 12 WE COULDN'T -- WE LOST YOU THERE. 13 14 WENDI KALLINS: 15 16 SORRY I NEED TO GET CLOSER TO MY COMPUTER. CAN YOU HEAR ME 17 NOW? 18 19 >>CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THAT'S BETTER. 20 21 22 WENDI KALLINS: WE HAD THE PRESENTATION FROM THE CONSULTANT. 23 PROCESS IS THEY'RE GOING TO BE RESEARCHING VARIOUS DIFFERENT FARE INTEGRATION TOOLS FROM AROUND THE WORLD AND THEY WILL BE 24 REPORTING BACK TO US, BUT THERE WAS MORE TO IT. AND I WOULD 25



HAVE TO GO BACK AND LOOK AT THE NOTES TO REMEMBER WHAT IT WAS 1 2 THAT WE WERE GIVEN. SORRY. 3 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THAT'S ALL RIGHT. WE'LL MAKE 4 5 SURE THAT THIS IS ON THE AGENDA FOR OUR NEXT MEETING, RIGHT 6 MARTHA? 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAT IS CORRECT, AND THEY WILL BE MEETING THE 25th OF THIS MONTH. 9 10 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: AGENDA ITEM SIX PLANNED BAY 11 AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT SUMMER 2020 ENGAGEMENT AND PROPOSED 12 REVISIONS. WELCOME LESLIE LARA ENRIQUEZ, AND DAVE VAUTIN WILL 13 DO THE PRESENTATION. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON, THIS IS 14 15 DAVE VAUTIN WITH THE MTC ABAG PLANNING TEAM, AND I'LL, AS YOU MENTIONED, I'LL BE COPRESENTING THIS ITEM WITH MY COLLEAGUE 16 LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ OF THE PUBLIC INFORMATION TEAM TODAY WE 17 WILL PRESENT THE RESULTS FOR THE ENGAGEMENT OF PLANNED BAY 18 AREA 2050 AND DESCRIBE HOW THAT INFORMED THE STAFF 19 RECOMMENDATION FOR ON STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE FINAL 20 21 BLUEPRINT. AS NOTED AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE ITEM, WE WILL BE SEEKING OUR -- THE BOARD'S ACTION, THE COMMISSION AND THE ABAG 22 BOARD ACTION ON THE STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AS WELL 23 AS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST LATER IN 24 THE MONTH. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. THANK YOU. 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS MILESTONE RELATED TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT 1 IS REALLY TWO AND A HALF YEARS IN THE MAKING. AND I WANT TO 2 3 GIVE CREDIT TO THE TEAM OF OVER 20 DIFFERENT PLANNERS OUTREACH PROFESSIONALS, MODELERS AND OTHERS HERE ON STAFF WHO HELPED 4 5 GET US TO THIS JUNCTURE, THE PRESENTATION WILL BE A LITTLE LONGER THAN NORMAL BUT GIVEN THE FACT THAT THE FINAL BLUEPRINT 6 IS A \$1.4 TRILLION PLAN FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE SPANNING FOUR 7 8 TOPIC AREAS WE HAVE A LOT TO COVER. AS SHOWN IN THE GRAPHIC WE SPENT 18 MONTHS WORKING TO PINPOINT STRATEGIES THROUGHOUT 9 HORIZON INITIATIVE WHICH EXPLORED UNCERTAIN FUTURES FOR THE 10 REGION AND WE FOCUSSED IN ON 25 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR 11 ELEMENTS TO CRAFT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BLUEPRINT SHOWN IN THIS 12 LARGE RECTANGLE BOX ON THE SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. AFTER THE 13 APPROVAL OF THE GEOGRAPHIES AND STRATEGIES FOR ANALYSIS IN 14 15 FEBRUARY, WE SPENT THE SPRING ANALYZING POTENTIAL OUTCOMES IN 16 ADDITION UPDATING THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST TO ACCOUNT FOR COVID-19 AND OTHER 2020 RECESSION IMPACTS. LEADING UP TO 17 SEPTEMBER WHERE WE ARE TODAY, WE HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE 18 THE FORECASTED OUTCOMES WITH THE PUBLIC SEEKING INPUT ON WAYS 19 TO ADD, REMOVE, OR MODIFY STRATEGIES TO ADVANCE THE FINAL 20 BLUEPRINT FURTHER TOWARDS THE REGION'S VISION OF A MORE 21 22 AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE HEALTHY AND VIBRANT REGION FOR 23 ALL. WE'RE READY TO DIVE INTO THE ANALYSIS DRIVEN BY THE VOICES WE HEARD IN VOICES ACROSS SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA WITH 24 NEW AND IMPROVED STRATEGIES. THIS IS NOT THE FINAL ACTION ON 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. THAT WILL OCCUR ONE YEAR 1 FROM NOW WHEN THE FINAL PLAN EIR AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ARE 2 PUBLISHED BUT SEPTEMBER 2020 IS A CRITICAL MILESTONE THAT WILL 3 INFORM THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES THAT WE'LL BRING FORWARD 4 5 BY THE END OF THE YEAR AND WE'LL ASK THE BOARDS TO CONSIDER TO ADVANCE INTO THE EIR AS THE PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE FOR PLANNED 6 BAY AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. AS ALL OF YOU ARE WELL AWARE, THE 7 8 BLUEPRINT INCLUDES FOUR ELEMENTS THAT WORK TOWARDS THE PLAN'S VISION OF A MORE AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERT REGION FOR ALL. 9 IN YOUR PACKET YOU WILL HAVE INFORMATION BENEFIT STRATEGIES 10 AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHY WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT REVISIONS MADE 11 WORK TO IDENTIFY THE FIVE CHALLENGES BROUGHT TO THE JULY 12 PRESENTATION THAT WE BROUGHT TO THE COUNCIL WHICH HIGHLIGHTED 13 INSUFFICIENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING, CONTINUED CONGESTION AND 14 TRANSIT CROWDING, DISPLACEMENT RISK, CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND 15 16 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCES THAT WERE NOT FULLY ADDRESSED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINT CARRIES FORWARD THE 17 AREAS OF SUCCESS FROM THE FINAL -- FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT 18 INTO THE FINAL RANGING FROM SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS THAT 19 PROTECT 98 PERCENT OF HOMES OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS TO REDUCED 20 21 TRANSIT COST FOR MEANS-BASED FARES AND MEANS BASED TOLLS THAT 22 PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT DISCOUNTS FOR LOW INCOME TRAVELERS. IT'S 23 IMPORTANT TO UNDERSCORE THE STRATEGIES IN THE BLUEPRINT ARE NOT LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY AND THEY'RE NOT NEAR TERM POLICY 24 PRESCRIPTIONS EITHER. THEY'RE IDEAS. THEY'RE IDEAS FOR CITIES, 25

FOR COUNTIES, FOR THE REGION, AND FOR THE STATE TO CONSIDER, AND TO COLLABORATIVELY ADVANCE OVER A 30 YEAR TIME HORIZON. THOSE NEAR TERM ACTIONS WILL BE FURTHER DEFINED THROUGHOUT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN EFFORT THAT IS UPCOMING THIS FALL AND THIS WINTER. WITH THAT, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO LESLIE WHO IS GOING TO HIGHLIGHT HOW WE CONDUCTED THE ENGAGEMENT THIS SUMMER WITH THE PUBLIC, STAKEHOLDERS, LOCAL JURISDICTION AND OTHERS. LESLIE.

8

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SPEAKER: THANK YOU DAVE, IF YOU COULD GET THE NEXT SLIDE 9 PLEASE. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. HAPPY TO BE HERE. SO STAFF 10 CONDUCTED THE SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT FOR THE 11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLAN UPDATE PROCESS, STARTING IN LATE 12 SPRING APPROXIMATE THROUGH AUGUST 10TH AND WE KICKED OFF 13 AROUND THE SAME TIME WHEN WE BEGAN TO SHELTER-IN-PLACE AND THE 14 15 PANDEMIC BEGAN WHICH MEANT WE HAD TO QUICKLY PIVOT AND 16 TRANSITION ALL OF OUR IN-PERSON ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS TO THE VIRTUAL WORLD. THIS VIRTUAL FIRST APPROACH TRULY ALLOWED US TO 17 THE OPPORTUNITY TO INNOVATE AND TRY NEW TECHNOLOGIES, WHILE AT 18 THE SAME TIME AIM TOCK REACH A BROADER AUDIENCE WITHIN A FEW 19 WEEKS WE PLANNED AND IMPLEMENTED A COMPREHENSIVE ENGAGEMENT 20 21 SUITE OF APPROACHES THAT ALLOWED THE PUBLIC REGARDLESS OF ACCESS TO INTERNET THE OPPORTUNITY TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS 22 SECOND ROUND OF OUTREACH. PURPOSE OF OUR ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES 23 WAS TO SOLICIT INPUT FROM THE PUBLIC, OUR PARTNERS AND 24 STAKEHOLDERS ON THE FIVE REMAINING CHALLENGES FOR THE REGION 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THAT PLANNING STAFF IDENTIFIED IN THEIR ANALYSIS OF THE DRAFT 1 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES NAMELY WE WANTED TO ENGAGE THE PUBLIC 2 3 SUPPORT FOR ADDING OR REMOVING STRATEGIES OR MODIFYING EXISTING STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. WE RELEASED THE DRAFT 4 5 BLUEPRINT IN EARLY JULY AND TOOK COMMENTS THROUGH AUGUST 10TH. WE HELD 25 ONLINE AND PHONE EVENTS WITH 18 OF EVENTS HAPPENING 6 IN A SPAN HELD IN JULY AND AUGUST. WE HELD TOWN HALLS THREE 7 8 CONDUCTED IN OTHER THAN ENGLISH, ONE IN MANDARIN CANTONESE AND 9 SPANISH. WE HELD THREE STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS FOR JURISDICTION PARTNERS AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS WE HAD A DIGITAL TRIBAL 10 SUPPLEMENT AND ALSO IN LATE SPRING WE HELD SEVEN FOCUS GROUPS 11 WITH OUR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION PARTNERS. IN ADDITION TO 12 THE ONLINE EVENTS WE OFFERED SEVERAL OTHER OPPORTUNITIES FOR 13 THE PUBLIC TO PARTICIPATE, INCLUDING A TELEPHONE LISTENING 14 LINE, AN ONLINE COMMENT FORM, OFFICE HOURS FOR OUR LOCAL 15 16 JURISDICTION PARTNERS AND WE HOSTED AN ONLINE SURVEY AND ALSO CONDUCTED TODAY STATISTICALLY VALID POLL. DURING OUR EVENT WE 17 INTRODUCED PLANNED BAY AREA AND PRESENTED OUTCOMES OF THE 18 DRAFT BLUEPRINT WITH AN ANIMATED VIDEO AND SECOND PART OF THE 19 MEETINGS WE CONDUCTED AN INTERACTIVE POLL TO ENGAGEMENT 20 PARTICIPANTS FOR NEW OR MODIFIED STRATEGIES AND WE ALSO ASKED 21 22 PARTICIPANTS TO PRIORITIZE THE CHALLENGES TO IDENTIFY WHICH 23 NEEDED TO BE ADDRESSED MOST URGENTLY IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. ALSO THE POLL THAT WE CONDUCTED DURING OUR EVENTS MIRRORED 24 WHAT WE DID WITH OUR ONLINE SURVEY. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE PROMOTED 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ALL OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORT IN VARIOUS WAYS INCLUDING OUR WEB 1 2 SITES, OUR SOCIAL MEDIA CHANNELS AND PRESS RELEASE THAT MADE 3 THE FRONT PAGE OF THE SAN FRANCISCO CHRONICLE. WE DID A PAID DIGITAL PROMOTION CAMPAIGN AND SENT E-MAIL BLASTS AND DIRECT 4 5 E-MAILS TO OUR PARTNERS TO GET THE WORD OUT ON THE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS AS WELL AS PROMOTE OUR ONLINE SURVEY WE PROMOTED OUR 6 ONLINE TOWN HALLS, DIRECT MAIL TO COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN 7 8 THROUGH NEXT DOOR AND ALSO POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL OLIVIA ASSISTED US WITH REACHING THE UNHOUSED COMMUNITY. RESULTING IN 9 19,000 PAGE VIEWS ON OUR WEB SITES AND OVER 83,000 ONLINE 10 ENGAGEMENTS INCLUDING EVERYTHING FROM REGISTRATION IN OUR 11 WORKSHOPS, LIKES, COMMENTS, SHARES, AND CLICKS ON OUR SOCIAL 12 MEDIA CHANNELS AND OUR E-MAIL COMMUNICATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. IN 13 TOTAL WE HAD OVER 7600 PEOPLE PARTICIPATE IN OUR ENGAGEMENT 14 ACTIVITIES, AND WE RECEIVED OVER 3400 COMMENTS. I DO WANT TO 15 16 NOTE THAT PARTICIPATION DURING THIS ROUND OF OUTREACH WAS MUCH MORE ROBUST THAN IN THE PAST, THE MAJORITY OF PARTICIPANTS 17 STAYED FOR THE ENTIRE EVENT WHEREAS IN PERSON THEY MAY ATTEND 18 FOR 20 MINUTES, SUBMIT THEIR COMMENTS THEN LEAVE. MOST FOLKS 19 STUCK AROUND FOR THE FULL TWO HOURS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. 20 WE'RE GOING TO SHIFT GEARS NOW, AND I'M GOING TO SHARE THE 21 RESULTS OF WHAT WE HEARD, AND THEN DAVE WILL PRESENT HOW THE 22 FEEDBACK INFORMED THE PROPOSED REVISIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE 23 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, WE ASKED PARTICIPANTS 24 DURING OUR MEETINGS TO PRIORITIZE THE CHALLENGES REMAINING TO 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

IDENTIFY WHICH NEEDED TO BE ADDRESSED MOST URGENTLY IN THE 1 FINAL BLUEPRINT. NOW, THE RESULT US THAT SEE HERE ON THE SLIDE 2 3 ARE ONLY FROM THE ONLINE SURVEY, THE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS AND THE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS THIS DOES NOT INCLUDE THE STATISTICALLY 4 5 VALID POLL. AND AS YOU CAN SEE HERE, THE CHANGE THAT CAME IN AT NUMBER ONE WAS HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY FOLLOWED BY 6 7 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS CHALLENGE AND CONGESTION AND 8 CROWDING, JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND THE NUMBER FIVE PRIORITY WAS DISPLACEMENT. ALL OF THE RESULTS FROM OUR SURVEY AND THE 9 COMMENTS THAT WE HEARD FROM OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS ARE POSTED 10 AT OUR WEB SITE AT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG UNDER THE "YOUR 11 COMMENTS" TAB. STAFF REACHED OUT TO COMMENTS AND THEMES TO 12 CHALLENGES AND ALL OF THOSE ARE SUMMARIZED IN ATTACHMENT B OF 13 YOUR PACKET. NOW FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE PRESENTATION, WE'LL 14 PRESENT THE CHALLENGES IN THE ORDER THAT THEY ARE RANKED HERE. 15 16 SO NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FIRST, AND DEFINITELY THE CHALLENGE THAT INDISPUTABLY ROSE TO THE TOP WAS HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY. 17 WHILE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES MADE SOME PROGRESS ON 18 THIS FRONT STAFF FOUND THAT HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF RESIDENTS 19 WOULD STILL LACK AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN 2050 SO WE ASKED STAFF 20 HOW WE COULD MAKE PROGRESS ON THIS EVENT AND PROPOSED FOLKS 21 WITH MU OR MODIFIED STRATEGIES THEY COULD VOTE ON AND ALSO 22 GAVE OPPORTUNITY TO PUT IN THEIR OWN SUGGESTED STRATEGIES. TO 23 THIS QUESTION WE HAD 4300 RESPONDENTS AND AS YOU CAN SEE HERE 24 TOP TWO VOTE-GETTERS ARE INVESTING IN STRENGTHENING IN 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS FOLLOWED BY CAPACITY FOR NEW HOUSING 1 IN COMMUNITIES WITH WELL-RESOURCED SCHOOLS AND GOOD ACCESS TO 2 3 JOBS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OUR STAFF AND INCOME PARTICULAR PLANNING STAFF TRULY VALUES THE PUBLIC'S INPUT SO WE WANTED TO 4 5 HIGHLIGHT SOME OF THE COMMENTS THAT HELPED SHAPE STAFF REVISIONS FROM THE HUNDREDS WE RECEIVED. FOR THIS SPECIFIC 6 7 CHALLENGE WE RECEIVED OVER 560 COMMENTS AND A LOT WHEN WE 8 HEARD ON THIS CHALLENGE WAS RELATED TO ADDRESSING WEALTH DISPARITIES SUCH AS PAYING PEOPLE A LIVABLE WAGE SO THEY CAN 9 AFFORD TO STAY IN THEIR HOMES AND IMPLEMENTING A UNIVERSAL 10 BASIC INCOME SO FOLKS CAN AFFORD TO STAY IN THEIR COMMUNITIES. 11 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. >DAVE VAUTIN: IN RESPONSE TO THE STRONG 12 PUBLIC FEEDBACK THAT HOUSING IS THE REGION'S NUMBER ONE 13 CHALLENGE, BY FAR, WE HAVE PROPOSED AN EXPANSIVE SET OF 14 STRATEGY REVISIONS. AT THE CENTER OF THIS, IT'S UNDERSCORING 15 16 THAT HOUSING IS A HUMAN RIGHT THAT WE NEED TO TREAT IT LIKE CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE LIKE ROADS AND BRIDGES. WHILE THE 17 DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID INCREASE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE REGION 18 BY A FACTOR OF FIVE THAT DIDN'T COME CLOSE TO MEETING THE 19 REGION'S CURRENT AND FUTURE NEEDS. IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE 20 PROPOSED TO EXPAND THE REVENUE ASSUMPTIONS TO A GREATER DEGREE 21 22 GENERATING 110 MILLION MORE FOR PRODUCTION AND 120 BILLION FOR 23 PRESERVATION THIS REFLECTS THE GOAL OF ADVANCING FAIR HOUSING THROUGH PRODUCTION IN HIGH RESOURCE PLACES BUT ALSO PRESERVING 24 EXISTING UNSUBSIDIZED NATURALLY AFFORDABLE UNITS SO 25

COMMUNITIES AREN'T DISPLACED. WITH THESE ROBUST FUNDING LEVELS 1 WE BELIEVE IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE TO HAVE A PLAN THAT SHOWS HOW 2 3 WE CAN HOUSE ALL LOW INCOME RESIDENTS BY 2050 INCLUDING OUR UNHOUSED POPULATION. THAT'S NOT ALL. OTHER REVISIONS INCLUDE 4 5 WORKING TO TACKLE THE INCOME SIDE OF THE AFFORDABILITY EOUATION BRINGING BACK THE UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME STRATEGY 6 FROM HORIZON AS A TENT POLE OF THE EXPANDED ECONOMY ELEMENT TO 7 8 THE PLAN WITH LOWER HOUSING COST AND INCREASED INCOMES, WE BELIEVE WE CAN MAKE HEADWAY ON HOUSING AFFORDABILITY FOR OUR 9 LOWER INCOME POPULATIONS. LASTLY WE UNDERSTAND THAT NON-10 TRADITIONAL TACTICS WILL BE REQUIRED, AND BEYOND STRATEGIES IN 11 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE HAVE INCORPORATED NEW STRATEGIES TO 12 ACCELERATED REDEVELOPMENT IN PUBLIC AND COMMUNITY OWNED LANDS. 13 WE NEED TO WEAVE IN MORE GREEN SPACE PARK TRAILS AND 14 15 RECREATION AREAS AS PART OF THE STRATEGIES AND THIS IS 16 FEATURED IN A NEW PARKS AND RECREATION STRATEGY IN THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. 17

18

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

19 SPEAKER: THE NEXT CHALLENGE THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WAS 20 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ONLY GETS US 21 HALFWAY TO OUR STATUTORY CLIMATE TARGET. SO WE ASKED HOW TO 22 MAKE FURTHER PROGRESS IN REDUCING EMISSIONS. FOR THIS 23 QUESTION, WE HAD OVER 4200 RESPONDENTS, AND THE TOP TWO VOTER 24 GETTERS WERE REQUIRING EMPLOYERS TO IMPLEMENT MANDATORY WORK 25 FROM HOME POLICIES AS WELL AS EXPANDING ELECTRIC VEHICLE AND

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE SUBSIDIES ESPECIALLY FOR LOW INCOME 1 HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE. FOR THIS CHALLENGE WE RECEIVED OVER 2 3 750 COMMENTS, DEFINITELY THE MOST OUT OF ALL OF THE CHALLENGES, AND THESE ARE SOME OF THE COMMENTS WE WANTED TO 4 5 HIGHLIGHT, FOR EXAMPLE, INCREASED DENSITY TO MAKE MASS TRANSIT MORE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT WHICH LOWERS THE VEHICLE MILES 6 7 THAT CAUSE GREENHOUSE GASSES. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: WITH 8 THE CLIMATE TARGET AT THE CORE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 MAKING FURTHER HEADWAY ON THIS CHALLENGE AREA IS ESPECIALLY CRITICAL. 9 FAILING TO ACHIEVE THE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET WILL RESULT IN 10 THE BAY AREA LOSING AT LEAST \$100 MILLION ANNUALLY IN STATE 11 FUNDING STARTING IN 2022. AND EVEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WITH NO 12 HIGHWAYS, ROBUST FOCUSED LAND USE PATTERN AND MANY MORE 13 STRATEGIES COULDN'T GET THERE. WE SEE THIS AS AN INCREDIBLY 14 DIFFICULTY TARGET THAT REOUIRES EVERYTHING INCLUDING THE 15 16 KITCHEN SINK APPROACH FORTUNATELY OUR FEEDBACK BACK HAS HELPED PUSH BACK BOLD IDEAS HERE STARTING WITH ELECTRIFICATION BY A 17 FACTOR OF EIGHT WITH SPECIFICITY ON LOW INCOME DISCOUNTS TO 18 ENSURE ALL HOUSEHOLDS BENEFIT FROM THE STRATEGY. THIS WAS DONE 19 BY CARVING OUT A STRATEGY EXPRESSLY FOR THE PURPOSE. WE HAVE 20 GONE BOLD ON TELECOMMUTING SEEN BROAD AGREEMENT FROM THE 21 PUBLIC. NEW REQUIREMENT, IN THE PLAN, AS A STRATEGY TO ENSURE 22 23 THAT MAJOR OFFICE BASED EMPLOYERS THOSE WITH AT LEAST 25 EMPLOYEES ACHIEVE A 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE SHARE ON A TYPICAL 24 WEEKDAY WOULD HELP MOVE US TOWARDS A GREENER FUTURE. WE KNOW 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THE STRATEGY WOULD NOT ON ITS OWN HELP US ACHIEVE EQUITABLE 1 2 OUTCOMES, BECAUSE THERE ARE GAPS IN INTERNET ACCESS ACROSS THE 3 REGION SO WE HAVE AUGMENTED IT WITH A SECOND STRATEGY FOR HIGH SPEED INTERNET SUBSIDIES AND INFRASTRUCTURE TARGETED TO 4 5 UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES TO ADDRESS THOSE DISPARITIES. THIRD, WE HAVE EXPANDED THE PRICING STRATEGY WHICH IN THE DRAFT 6 BLUEPRINT WAS ONE OF THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAYS TO MOVE TOWARDS 7 8 THE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGET BY INCENTIVIZING OFF PEAK AND CARPOOL TRIPS AS WELL AS MODES OTHER THAN THE AUTOMOBILE. 9 WITH LIMITED ROADWAY CAPACITY IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT WE MATCH 10 SUPPLY AND DEMAND. WITH NEW HIGHWAY EXPANSION STRATEGIES NOW 11 IN PLAY TO TACKLE SOME OF THE CONGESTED CORRIDORS IN THE FINAL 12 BLUEPRINT EXPANDING THE ROAD PRICING STRATEGY TO SOME 13 ADDITIONAL HIGHWAY CORRIDORS THAT FEATURE RAIL ALTERNATIVES IS 14 15 ESSENTIAL TO OFFSET THOSE GREENHOUSE GAS IMPACTS. FOURTH, WE 16 HAVE CONTINUED TO REFINE OF THE HOUSING AND ECONOMY STRATEGIES ON THE LAND USE FRONT BUT TRY TO EEK FURTHER REDUCTIONS WITH 17 18 GROWTH IN HIGH RICH PLACES. WE HAVE IMPLEMENTED NON-CLIMATE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES FOCUSED ON DECARBONIZING RESIDENTIAL 19 COMMERCIAL AND PUBLIC STRUCTURES OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD 20 21 WHICH ACCOUNTS FOR THE SECOND LARGEST SOURCE OF GREENHOUSE GAS 22 EMISSIONS. SB 375 DOESN'T ALLOW US TO TAKE CREDIT FOR THESE 23 BUT IT DOESN'T MEAN IT ISN'T A GOOD IDEA TO ADVANCE THESE STRATEGIES FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS A LOT 24 25 ON THIS GRAPHIC, AND WE HAVE NOT YET COMPLETED ANALYSIS ON THE

FINAL BLUEPRINT. BUT WE WANTED TO SHOW YOU OUR OVERALL GAME 1 PLAN TO MEET OR EXCEED THE 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA TARGET FOR 2 3 THE YEAR 2035. AS SHOWN ON THE TOP OF THE SCREEN, SIMPLY READOPTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 WOULD FALL WOEFULLY SHORT OF 4 5 THE 19 PERCENT TARGET WITH UPDATED EX-ORIGIN NEWS ASSUMPTIONS BASICALLY EXTERNAL FORCES BEYOND OUR CONTROL THAT PLAN WHICH 6 DID MEET THE 15 PERCENT TARGET IN THE PREVIOUS CYCLE WOULD 7 8 ONLY ACHIEVE THAT ONE POINT OF REDUCTION. THAT'S WHERE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT CAME IN MOVING US EIGHT POINTS CLOSER TO THE 9 TARGET DRIVEN PRIMARILY BY PRICING AND SPEED LIMIT STRATEGIES 10 AS WELL AS THE 23 ARE ORDER STRATEGIES THAT HELP MOVE US IN 11 THE RIGHT DIRECTION AS WELL. TO GET TO THE 19 PERCENT TARGET 12 WE STARTED ADDITIONAL DIALOGUE WITH THE CALIFORNIA AIR 13 RESOURCES BOARD TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE COST OF DRIVING 14 ACROSS MAJOR METRO AREAS IN CALIFORNIA TO ENSURE A LEVEL 15 16 PLAYING FIELD THIS LEAVES A SEVEN POINT GAP. STRATEGIES SHOWN TODAY WILL WORK TO MEET OR EXCEED THAT WITH TELEWORK AND 17 ELECTRIFICATION STRATEGIES BEING PERHAPS MOST SIGNIFICANT AND 18 OTHER STRATEGIES PLAYING A KEY ROLE AS WELL. IT'S ESSENTIAL WE 19 OVERSHOOT THE TARGET BECAUSE WE HAVE A SET EVER HIGHLY 20 EXPANSION STRATEGIES THAT MOVE US ROUGHLY TWO POINTS IN THE 21 22 WRONG DIRECTION SO WE NEED TO OFFSET THEM BY GOING BEYOND THE 23 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA GOAL. NEXT SLIDE.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SPEAKER: THE NEXT CHALLENGE THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WAS 1 CONGESTION AND CROWDING. FINDINGS FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT 2 3 ANALYSIS SHOWED THAT SOME KEY CORRIDORS MADE PROGRESS IN THESE TWO AREAS BUT OTHER DESERT NOT. WE ASKED THE PUBLIC HOW NOW OR 4 5 COMMANDED STRATEGIES WOULD HELP ADDRESS CONGESTION AND TRANSIT OAR CROWDING IN THE FUTURE. THIS QUESTION HAD OVER 4400 6 RESPONSES AND AS YOU CAN SEE HERE THE TOP TWO VOTE-GETTERS 7 8 WERE REDESIGNING TRANSIT TO OFFER A SEAMLESS EXPERIENCE AS WELL AS EXTENDING REGIONAL RAIL SERVICES TO THE COMMUNITIES 9 AND FREQUENCY OF THAT SERVICE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE HERE 10 THAT THERE IS EQUALLY LITTLE SUPPORT FOR WIDENING HIGHWAYS AND 11 EXPANDING INTERCHANGES AS THERE IS FOR IMPLEMENTING ALL LANE 12 TOLLING ON OUR FREEWAYS. NEXT SLIDE. WE RECEIVED OVER 450 13 COMMENTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE, WHICH RANGE FROM, YOU KNOW, WE 14 15 NEED TO IMPLEMENT THE SEAMLESS BAY AREA STRATEGY, TO PROVIDING 16 HIGH FREQUENCY CLEAN TRANSIT IN ALL DENSE AREAS SO PEOPLE DON'T SEE A NEED TO DRIVE. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: AGAIN, AS 17 WE SHARED IN JULY MANY OF THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES WERE 18 19 INFORMED BY COMMISSION ACTION ON REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING ASSUMPTIONS. WE HAVE WORKED TO WEAVE IN THOSE PROJECTS 20 21 INTO A SET OF NEW STRATEGIES FOR THE FIRST TIME IN THE FINAL 22 BLUEPRINT. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSCORE ON TRANSPORTATION, THE 23 ROLES FOR FISCAL CONSTRAINT ARE STRICTEST DUE TO FEDERAL AND STATE REGULATIONS WE HAVE BROUGHT FORWARD A BOLD SET OF 24 ASSESSMENTS FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE HIGHLIGHTS INCLUDE 25

DOUBLING DOWN WITH MORE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS 1 FREQUENCY BOOST IN ALL PDAS OTHER KEY SYSTEMS WITH 2 3 OVERCROWDING CHALLENGES AND MORE, AS WELL AS MORE FUNDING FOR KEY EXPANSION PROJECTS INCLUDING NEW RAIL LINES TO PLACES LIKE 4 5 THE TRI-VALLEY DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE, NORTH SAN JOSE, CUPERTINO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO ACROSS BAY BRIDGE AND DUMBARTON 6 7 CORRIDORS WE HAVE EXPANDED THE POPULAR SEAMLESS STRATEGY FOR 8 TRIP PLANNING AND FARE PAYMENT IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT TO INCLUDE SCHEDULED COORDINATION WITH 10 TO 15 TIMES TRANSFER 9 HUBS ACROSS THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE ADDED MORE FUNDING FOR 10 BICYCLING AND WALKING THANKS TO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES 11 THAT WILL ALLOW US TO HAVE A NETWORK OF MORE THAN 10,000 MILES 12 OF PROTECTED LANES BIKE PATHS AND TRAILS AND LASTLY STRATEGIC 13 AND LIMITED INVESTMENT IN HIGHWAYS HAVE BEEN INCORPORATING TO 14 PROVIDE EXPRESS WAYS AND IMPROVE BOTTLENECKS ACROSS THE REGION 15 16 WITH OFFSETS COMING FROM THE PREVIOUSLY DISCUSSED STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. THE FULL LIST OF FISCALLY CONSTRAINED 17 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND THE STRATEGIES THEY NEST WITHIN IS 18 INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT J AND THIS SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS SOME OF THE 19 BIG \$2 BILLION PLUS INVESTMENT IN EACH OF THE REGION, EACH OF 20 21 THE SUBREGIONS ACROSS THE BAY AREA. YOU WILL NOTE NINE 22 COUNTIES BENEFIT FROM THE EXPRESS LANE BUS NETWORK THAT HAS 23 BEEN INTEGRATED INTO THE BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SPEAKER: NEXT CHANGE THAT ROSE TO THE TOP IS THE JOBS/HOUSING 1 IMBALANCE ADDRESSED BY STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT 2 3 BLUEPRINT BUT THERE IS DEFINITELY NEED FOR ADDITIONAL PROGRESS ON THIS FRONT. SO WE ASKED FOLKS HOW MORE AMBITIOUS ECONOMIC 4 5 STRATEGIES COULD SHIFT JOBS CLOSER TO EXISTING HOUSING-RICH COMMUNITIES, AND FOR THIS CHALLENGE WE HAD OVER 4200 6 7 RESPONDENTS AND THE TOP TWO STRATEGIES WERE PROVIDING TAX 8 SUBSIDIES FOR EMPLOYERS TO RELOCATE MIDDLE WAGE JOBS CLOSER TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING AS WELL AS EXPANDING BUSINESS INCUBATOR 9 10 PROGRAMS TO INCLUDE SMALL BUSINESSES. AGAIN, JUST A REMINDER THAT THIS IS ONLY -- THIS ONLY INCLUDES THE ONLINE SURVEY, THE 11 DIGITAL WORKSHOPS AND THE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS IT DOESN'T 12 INCLUDE THE STATISTICALLY VALID POLL. FOR THIS QUESTION WE 13 RECEIVED MANY COMMENTS, FOR EXAMPLE, MORE EQUITABLE PAY ACCESS 14 TO BETTER PAYING JOBS AND JOB TRAINING FOR BETTER PAYING JOBS. 15 16 NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE AS STAFF RECOGNIZE HOW HARD THIS CHALLENGE WILL BE TO OVERCOME IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IN FACT 17 IN THE POST COVID ERA WHERE TELECOMMUTING MIGHT BE MORE COMMON 18 THAN EVER BEFORE THIS COULD LEAD TO SMALLER FOOTPRINT AND LESS 19 NEED FOR OFFICE COMPLEXES THUS BUILDING JOBS IN THE -- AND 20 21 CONTINUE WITH JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE DESPITE THAT WE'RE GIVING 22 IT ANOTHER TRY IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT RECOGNITION THE 23 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WERE TOO MUCH TO MAKE HEADWAY IN THIS REGARD FIRST RECOGNIZING BROADER SUPPORT FOR A 24 CARROT-BASED APPROACH INSTEAD OF STICK BASED APPROACH WE HAVE 25

 METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

ELIMINATED IMPACT STRATEGIES, INCREASED TAX ASSUMPTIONS AND 1 USED THOSE FOR INCENTIVES TO ENCOURAGE GROWTH IN TRANSIT-RICH 2 3 AREAS FOR EXAMPLE, BART. WE HAVE INCLUDED THE JOB TRAINING CENTERS, AND THIRD WHILE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDES 4 5 HUNDREDS OF BILLIONS OF DOLLARS FOR TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS IT HAD NOT YET INTEGRATED TRANSPORTATION FUNDING 6 FOR NON-PRIORITY AREAS FOR NON-TRANSPORTATION NEEDS WHICH ARE 7 8 SIZABLE AND SOME PPAS ARE ESSENTIAL FOR THE PPA TO SEE JOB 9 GROWTH WITHOUT INTERVENTION. NEXT SLIDE.

10

SPEAKER: THE CHALLENGE THAT ROSE TO NUMBER FIVE WAS 11 DISPLACEMENT AND DESPITE THE EXPANDED RENTER PROTECTIONS AND 12 EXPANDED AFFORDABLE HOUSING THE DRAFT ADDRESSED THE RISK FOR 13 DISPLACEMENT CONTINUES TO GROW OVER TIME. SO WE ASKED HOW CAN 14 NEW OR EXPANDED STRATEGIES HELP FURTHER ENSURE THAT LOW INCOME 15 16 RESIDENTS AND COMMUNITIES ARE COLOR ARE NOT ULTIMATELY DISPLACED TO AREAS WITH LIMITED ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY. FOR 17 THIS OUESTION WE HAD OVER 4400 RESPONDENTS AND THE TWO 18 19 STRATEGIES THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WERE EXPANDING INVESTMENT IN THE PRESERVATION OF PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND 20 ENSURING AMPLE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS BUILT IN COMMUNITIES MOST 21 22 AT RISK OF DISPLACEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. FOR THIS CHALLENGE WE 23 RECEIVED NEARLY 500 COMMENTS AND UNDER THIS CHALLENGE WE ALSO HEARD A LOT OF COMMENTS ABOUT ADDRESSING WEALTH DISPARITIES. 24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE HAVE WORKED TO PLACE 25

EQUITY AT THE CORE OF ALL STRATEGIES IN THE BLUEPRINT BUT WE 1 REALIZED WE WEREN'T GOING FAR ENOUGH TO ADDRESS THE DECADES OF 2 3 RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION AND WE WORKED TO ADDRESS THIS IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. IT ADDRESSES PROGRAMS IN PATHWAYS FOR 4 5 MORTGAGE SECURITY THROUGH RENTAL AND SMALL BUSINESS. SECOND WE ARE UNDERSCORING THE ESSENTIAL NATURE OF THE PRESERVATION 6 STRATEGY DISCUSSED PREVIOUSLY, WHICH WOULD ENABLE MANY MORE 7 8 LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS TO REMAIN IN PLACE ANDS HOPEFULLY BRING DOWN THIS ELEVATED METRIC, THIRD WE HAVE INCLUDED A NEW 9 STRATEGY TO INVEST IN COMMUNITIES BY FUNDING THEM DIRECTLY AND 10 ENABLING THEM TO PRIORITIZE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS THAT 11 THEY NEED THE MOST. AND LASTLY, WE HAVE ADDED FUNDING TO THE 12 RENTER PROTECTION STRATEGY PAIRING WITH LEGAL AID AND OTHER 13 SUPPORTIVE SERVICES FOR TENANTS. NEXT SLIDE. 14

15

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

16 SPEAKER: AS I MENTIONED EARLIER WE ALSO CONDUCTED A STATISTICALLY VALID POLL AND THE POLL RESULTS WILL BE 17 PRESENTED AT THE JOINT MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE 18 AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY BUT THIS IS A 19 OUICK PREVIEW OF WHAT WE SAW IN THE POLL COMPARED TO OUR 20 ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS I WANT TO MENTION THE SPECIFICALLY VALID 21 22 POLL INCLUDED ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY FOR THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT SO 23 THIS WAS NOT APPLES TO APPLES BUT WE WERE ABLE TO GLEAN SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES. HOUSING IS THE TOP CONCERN IN 24 BOTH EFFORTS ARE AND YOU CAN SEE THE OTHER SIMILARITIES HERE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

INCLUDING SUPPORT FOR SEAMLESS TRANSIT, AND COMPLETE STREETS, 1 AND THE DIFFERENCES WERE MINOR BUT THERE WAS GREATER SUPPORT 2 3 FOR REBUILDING INTERCHANGES -- EXCUSE ME, REBUILDING INTERCHANGES AND EXPANDING JOB TRAINING IN THE STATISTICALLY 4 5 VALID POLL COMPARED TO OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: SO THANKS LESLIE FOR WALKING US THROUGH THE 6 ENGAGEMENT RESULTS I'LL SHARE A FEW SLIDES THEN WE WILL BE 7 8 HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. JUST TO RECAP WHAT YOU HEARD, WE HAVE BUILT UPON THE FOUNDATION OF THE DRAFT 9 BLUEPRINT 25 STRATEGIES, EXPANDING IT TO A TOTAL OF 35 10 STRATEGIES THAT ARE FOCUSED ON ADVANCING EQUITABLE OUTCOMES 11 AND A FOCUS ON BEING RESILIENT TO AN UNCERTAIN FUTURE. 12 HIGHLIGHTS IN TERMS OF THE REVISIONS INCLUDE THOSE COMMUNITY 13 LED TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS UPGRADES TO A TIMES TRANSFER HUBS 14 15 ACROSS THE REGION TO ADVANCE THAT SEAMLESS VISION. 100 PLUS 16 BILLION IN NEW TRANSIT INVESTMENTS TO BUILD THAT NEXT GENERATION NETWORK WITH NEW VRT, NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING 17 VALLEY LINK TO CORRECT THE REGION TO THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY 18 AND 10,000 MILES OF NEW BICYCLE INFRASTRUCTURE. SIGNIFICANT 19 HOUSING ELEMENT WE TOUCHED ON THE VASTLY EXPANDING AFFORDABLE 20 21 HOUSING PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION TARGETED RENTAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS COMMUNITY LAND TRUST AND OTHER INNOVATIVE APPROACHES 22 TO PRESERVE AND PRODUCE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND THE FIRE 23 ELEMENT INCLUDED \$500 PER MONTH FOR BASIC INCOME, TAX 24 INCENTIVES TO ENCOURAGE MORE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT IN HOUSING-25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RICH COMMUNITIES AND NEW INFRASTRUCTURE FOR INDUSTRIAL LANDS. 1 AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL SIDE REFINEMENTS 2 3 TO THE SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS EXPANSIONS TO BUILDING RETROFITS EXPANDING FOR NEW AND MODERNIZED PARKS AND BOLD 4 5 INITIATIVES RANGING FROM EL COMMUTING REOUIREMENTS TO ADVANCING EV SUBSIDIES. IT IS THROUGH THESE REVISIONS THAT 6 7 WE'RE WORKING TO MAKE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050'S FINAL BLUEPRINT 8 FINALLY LIVE UP TO ITS VISION AS ADVANCING A MORE CONNECTED DIVERSE HEALTHY AND VIBRANT COMMUNITY FOR ALL. NEXT SLIDE. 9 I'LL OUICKLY PIVOT AWAY FROM STRATEGIES WHERE CHANGES HAVE 10 BEEN MOST SIGNIFICANT. WE'LL ALSO BE ASKING THE BOARD TO 11 APPROVE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WHICH IS 12 PRIORITY FOR JOB GROWTH. WE HAVE INTEGRATED PRIORITY 13 DEVELOPMENT AREAS ADOPTED BY THE BOARD IN JULY AS WELL AS DATA 14 ON TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. THIS ACTION WOULD 15 16 REAFFIRM THE DEFINITION APPROVED IN JANUARY WITH THE LATEST DATA AND PROTECTS AREAS OUTSIDE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND 17 HAZARD AREAS. APPROVAL OF THE FINAL REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST 18 WHICH INCLUDES ADJUSTMENTS IN THE 2020 TO ACCOUNT FOR COVID-19 19 AND THE 2020 RECESSION WE SHARED THIS IN JULY FOR PUBLIC 20 21 COMMENT AND RECEIVED NO FEEDBACK. WE ASK THE BOARD TO APPROVE 22 THIS JUNCTURE IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ASSOCIATION SETTLEMENT. 23 NEXT SLIDE. AT THE END OF THE DAY THIS SET OF GRAPHS SHOWS HOW THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINANCIAL SIDE OF THE EQUATION 24 STACKS UP. WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE NEED FOR AUGMENTING 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SIGNIFICANT EXISTING RESOURCES FOR SEVERAL ELEMENTS OF THE 1 2 PLAN TO ADDRESS GAPS, ESPECIALLY ON THE HOUSING, ECONOMIC, AND 3 ENVIRONMENTAL ASPECTS OF THE PLAN. IN TOTAL, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WOULD SUM UP TO ROUGHLY \$1.4 TRILLION FOR 30 YEAR 4 5 PLANNING HORIZON WITH 600 BILLION FOR TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES OVER 400 BILLION FOR HOUSING AND 300 BILLION FOR 6 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND THE ENVIRONMENT COMBINED. NEXT SLIDE. 7 8 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAS MORE MILESTONES AHEAD FINAL BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS SHOULD INPUTS BE APPROVED THIS MONTH WILL 9 STRETCH THROUGH MOST OF THE REST OF THIS YEAR WITH THE EIR 10 SCOPING PROCESS AND ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT THIS FALL AND 11 KICKING OFF IMPLEMENTATION LIKELY COMING BACK TO THIS 12 COMMITTEE IN NOVEMBER WORKING TOWARDS THE DECEMBER ACTION ON 13 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES, WE ANTICIPATE ADVANCING THAT 14 15 FORWARD INTO THE EIR AFTER BOARD APPROVAL AND THEN RELEASING 16 THE DRAFT PLAN, EIR AND IMPLEMENTATION MAN IN THE SPRING. NEXT SLIDE. THERE ARE TWO KEY IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS WE WANTED TO 17 18 HIGHLIGHT TODAY. ONE WAY THE PLAN CAN BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE REAL-WORLD IS THROUGH THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED ALLOCATION 19 PROCESS OR RHNA, THE ABAG HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE HAS 20 21 CONSIDERED WHAT ROLE IF ANY THE BLUEPRINT SHOULD PLAY IN RHNA 22 AND IN AUGUST THEY RECOMMENDED 2050 HOUSEHOLDS IN THE 23 BLUEPRINT BE USED AS A STARTING POINT FOR RHNA. UNLIKE THE FOCUS ON COUNTY AND SUBCOUNTY PROJECTIONS RHNA FOCUSES ON THAT 24 CITY AND TOWN LEVEL AND ULTIMATELY THOSE WILL INFORM HOUSING 25

ELEMENT UPDATES WHEN AVAILABLE IN DECEMBER THE FINAL BLUEPRINT 1 2 DATA CAN BE INCORPORATED INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY PENDING 3 BOARD DIRECTION. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED, ANOTHER FOCUS FOR IMPLEMENTATION IS THAT FINAL PART OF THE PLAN, THE 4 5 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND FOR EACH OF THESE 30 YEAR STRATEGIES THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL IDENTIFY ONE OR MORE ACTIONS THAT 6 MTC AND ABAG CAN ADVANCE IN PARTNERSHIP WITH PUBLIC, PRIVATE, 7 8 AND NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS THESE RANGE FROM STUDIES TO CONVENING LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY AND PROGRESS. AND WE LOOK 9 FORWARD TO PROGRESS ON THE FINAL PIECE OF THE PUZZLE FOR 10 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. THAT WRAPS UP OUR 11 PRESENTATION. WE APPRECIATE YOU LETTING US WALK YOU THROUGH 12 THIS COMPLEX AND DETAILED ITEM THAT COVERS A WIDE RANGE OF 13 STRATEGIES AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO TAKING ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY 14 15 HAVE ON THE STRATEGIES, GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES OR REGIONAL GROWTH 16 FORECAST AT THIS TIME.

17

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST UP, WE HAVE ADINA LEVIN FOR
19 COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENT. ADINA, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
20

21 SPEAKER: ADINA LEVIN. THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR THE PRESENTATION 22 IT'S GREAT TO HEAR THE FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMUNITY AND HOW 23 MUCH SOME COMBINATION OF GOOD THINGS THAT THE STAFF HAS BEEN 24 DOING, AND POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND OTHER COMMUNITY 25 CONNECTIONS HAVE BEEN DOING AND MAYBE THINGS THAT WE HAVE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

LEARNED FROM COVID IN ORDER TO GET THAT FEEDBACK. SO REALLY 1 GLAD TO SEE THAT. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS, LOOKING AT THAT VERY 2 LARGE AMOUNT OF MONEY IS THAT, PARTICULARLY WITH PUBLIC 3 TRANSPORTATION MEGA PROJECTS, THIS IS SOMETHING -- AND STAFF, 4 5 PLEASE LET ME KNOW IF THERE IS SOMETHING IN HERE THAT I HAVE MISSED WHICH IS QUITE POSSIBLE, THE -- A BAY AREA IN SPECIFIC 6 AND THE UNITED STATES -- GLOBALLY NOT GOOD AT THIS AND WE 7 8 OVERPAY BY GLOBAL STANDARDS INCLUDING IN OTHER DEVELOPED WORLD ECONOMIES WITH HIGH PAID WORKERS, WE STILL PAY WAY TOO MUCH. 9 10 AND SO, ONE OF THE THINGS THEY WOULD LIKE TO RECOMMEND, IF THAT IS NOT IN HERE IS THAT WE LOOK VERY CLOSELY AT STRATEGIES 11 THAT WILL BRING COSTS IN LINE OF THE NEEDED AND VALUED 12 INVESTMENTS IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO AFFORD MORE OF THE THING 13 THAT WE NEED AND WANT TO DO. SO THAT IS ONE COMMENT. ON 14 15 HOUSING, REALLY GLAD TO SEE THE FEEDBACK INCLUDING THE NEED TO 16 HAVE HOUSING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY COMMUNITIES, THAT IT IS, YOU 17 KNOW, A HIGH TIME TO DO SO. AND I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. AND THEN, LASTLY, IN THE -- IN TERMS OF THE TELECOMMUTING AND 18 THOSE REALLY, YOU KNOW, VERY AGGRESSIVE TARGETS, AND THE 19 REPORT THAT THIS WAS VERY POPULAR IN TERMS OF THE COMMUNITY 20 21 FEEDBACK, I WOULD BE REALLY CURIOUS TO CUT THE COMMUNITY FEEDBACK BY AGE, GENDER, AND PARENTAL STATUS. SO I DO NOT HAVE 22 SMALL CHILDREN AT HOME, BUT I HAVE, YOU KNOW, FRIENDS AND 23 COLLEAGUES WHO HAVE SMALL CHILDREN AT HOME, AND THE EXPERIENCE 24 OF PEOPLE WITH SMALL CHILDREN AT HOME IS EXTRAORDINARILY 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

DIFFERENT FROM PEOPLE WHO DON'T. THERE WAS A REALLY 1 2 INTERESTING NEWS STORY THAT SHOWED THAT SCIENTISTS, AND 3 ACADEMICS, WHO HAD SMALL CHILDREN AT HOME WERE PUBLISHING LESS AND PEOPLE WHO DID NOT HAVE SMALL CHILDREN AT HOME WERE 4 5 PUBLISHING MORE, AND I THINK THERE IS -- THERE MAY BE SOME SIGNIFICANT UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES IN TERMS OF THAT HIGH 6 LEVEL OF TELECOMMUTING. WE THINK THAT MORE TELECOMMUTING IS 7 8 INEVITABLE AND GOOD BUT GOING TO THAT DRASTICALLY WOULD BE A DISADVANTAGE TO THINGS WE HAVEN'T THOUGHT THROUGH, THE OTHER 9 10 IDEA IS RELATED TO INCREASING OPPORTUNITIES FOR CAREER DEVELOPMENT AND GOOD PAYING JOBS WHERE ONCE AGAIN IF WE'RE 11 SAYING THAT HALF OF THE PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE WORKING FROM 12 HOME, IS THERE GOING TO BE ENOUGH OPPORTUNITY FOR THAT 13 EDUCATION AND TRAINING? I THINK MAYBE THAT PENDULUM IS 14 15 SWINGING TOO FAR IN ONE DIRECTION AND THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS RICK COATES. 17 18 RICK COATES: YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME OKAY? 19 20 21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, WE CAN. 22 RICK COATES: I NOTED THAT YOU MENTIONED SOMETHING ABOUT THAT 23 THIS IS NOT A PLAN FOR LOBBYING. AND THEN A LATER ON YOU SAID 24 YOU WANTED TO EXPAND NEW REVENUES, AND THE LAST TIME I CHECKED 25

MOST OF THE REVENUES COME FROM EITHER THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT 1 OR THE STATE GOVERNMENT. HOW DO WE PROPOSE EXPANDING REVENUES 2 3 IF WE DON'T LOBBY SOME? >DAVE VAUTIN: JUST TO CLARIFY, I DIDN'T SAY WE WOULDN'T LOBBY FOR POLICIES, WHAT I SAID THAT IS 4 5 THAT THE POLICY IDEAS IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AREN'T NEAR TERM LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS. NOW THAT BEING SAID THE 6 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL LOOK AT EACH 30 YEAR STRATEGY AND 7 8 FIGURE OUT WHAT SHOULD WE DO IN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS TO ADVANCE IT. AND SO THAT MAY BE IN SOME LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACIES TO BE 9 DEVELOPED THAT IS APPROPRIATE FOR EACH OF THOSE STRATEGIES AND 10 IT MAY BE LOOKING AT EACH OF THESE STRATEGIES IN AN 11 INCREMENTAL WAY THAT WE DON'T JUMP TO THE STRATEGIES IN THE 12 NEXT 30 YEARS BUT OVER A PERIOD OF DECADES AND YEARS PURSUE 13 NEW REVENUES AND REGULATORY AUTHORITIES THAT ENABLE ADVANCED 14 STRATEGIES. THAT'S THE THINKING IS ADVOCACY AND TYPE OF WORK 15 16 WE WOULD DO TO IMPLEMENT THE PLAN.

17

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RICK COATES: THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. I WOULD SAY THAT 18 MOST OF THE CHANGES ARE VERY POSITIVE. I AM PLEASED TO SEE 19 MOST OF THEM. I DO STILL HAVE SOME PROBLEM WITH THAT EXPANDING 20 21 HIGHWAY 37, ESPECIALLY WHEN IT'S NOT COUPLED WITH AN EXPANDED SMART TRAIN ROUTE, WHICH I THINK SHOULD COME FIRST BEFORE ANY 22 WORK ON THE HIGHWAY IS DONE. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT THE ORDER IS 23 WRONG. AND IF WE'RE WORRIED ABOUT FUNDING, WHICH I THINK WE 24 SHOULD BE. I THINK HIGHWAY 37 WOULD BE ONE OF THE MOST 25

EXPENSIVE WASTES OF MONEY I COULD THINK OF. THEY'RE TALKING 1 ABOUT \$5 BILLION FOR THE ONE PROJECT OVERALL. IT'S POURING A 2 3 LOT OF MONEY DOWN A GOPHER HOLE THAT'S ATTACHED TO THE BAY. ANYWAY, THAT'S JUST MY OPINION ON THAT. AND I'M WONDERING, YOU 4 5 MENTIONED ABOUT OFFICE SPACE, THE USE OF OFFICE SPACE GOING DOWN. IS IT POSSIBLE THAT SOME OF THAT COULD BE CONVERTED TO 6 HOUSING? MAYBE MIXED USE. >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT IS A POTENTIAL 7 8 OUTCOME. I THINK AS WE LOOK AHEAD, YOU KNOW, WE DO FORECAST, YOU KNOW, IN THE DECADES AHEAD, ADDITIONAL JOB GROWTH, I THINK 9 WHAT WE'RE SAYING IS THAT MUCH OF THAT JOB GROWTH COULD BE 10 POTENTIALLY ACCOMMODATED BY ADDITIONAL -- OR BY THE -- SORRY. 11 I DIDN'T MEAN ADDITIONAL, BUT BY EXISTING OFFICE BUILDINGS. 12 IT'S PORTABLE THERE IS STILL SURPLUS ON THAT BUT PROBABLY 13 WHAT'S MOST LIKELY IS SOME OF THOSE BIG COMPANIES THAT HAVE 14 15 BEEN BUILDING MANY NEW OFFICE BUILDING IN RECENT YEARS ARE 16 ABLE TO SLOW DOWN THEIR EXPANSION IN SEARCH OF NEW BUILDINGS WHILE CONTINUING TO GROW THE NUMBER OF JOBS THAT ARE EITHER 17 WORKING IN THAT BUILDING OR REWORKING REMOTELY FOR THAT 18 BUILDING OR EMPLOYER. THAT'S CERTAINLY SOMETHING TO CONSIDER 19 IN THE YEARS AHEAD WOULD BE WHAT IS A BETTER WAY WE COULD USE 20 21 THE EXISTING BUILDINGS IN THE REGION.

22

23 RICK COATES: THANK YOU.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24

25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP, WENDI.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

1

WENDI KALLINS: THANKS. I ALSO WANT TO COMMENT ABOUT 2 3 TELECOMMUTING. TO BEGIN WITH, I RECOGNIZE THERE IS ISSUES WITH TELECOMMUTING, AS A MATTER OF FACT WE'RE SEEING THE FALL OUT 4 5 RIGHT NOW IN THAT PEOPLE ARE MOVING OUT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND THEY'RE BIDDING UP HOMES IN THE SUBURBS UP HERE IN MARIN 6 COUNTY. SO WE KNOW THAT THAT IS HAPPENING, AND YET, THAT BEING 7 8 SAID, I THINK THAT IT IS AN ABSOLUTELY IMPORTANT TO HAVE THIS PART OF THE MIX. I THINK THAT THE SHARE OF TELECOMMUTING 9 SHOULD DEFINITELY GO UP, AND TO THAT VEIN, 350 BAY AREA IS 10 ACTUALLY SPONSORING A -- ON SEPTEMBER 17TH -- A PANEL 11 DISCUSSION AND I HAVE PUT IT IN THE CHAT AND I'LL ANNOUNCE IT 12 AGAIN AT THE END. BUT I WANT PEOPLE TO KNOW THAT WE DO HAVE 13 SOME SPEAKERS WHO WILL BE SPEAKING TO THE BENEFITS OF THE 14 15 ENVIRONMENT OF TELECOMMUTING. ALSO I NOTICED THAT, YOU KNOW, 16 WHEN YOU WERE TAKING THE PUBLIC COMMENT, THAT YOU WERE JUST TAKING THE TOP TWO EVEN THOUGH THERE MIGHT BE ONE OR TWO 17 PERCENTAGE POINTS BETWEEN THE TOP TWO AND THE TOP THREE, AND I 18 GUESS YOU HAD TO HAVE A CUTOFF POINT BUT SOME OF THE PLACES IN 19 THE THIRD POSITION, FOR INSTANCE, THERE WAS ONE FOR 20 21 DISCOURAGING MORE OFFICE PARKS? THAT ONE CAUGHT MY EYE, SO I WANTED TO GET SOME FEEDBACK ON THAT ONE, OF WHY YOU DIDN'T 22 LOOK AT SOME OF THOSE THIRD TIER COMMENTS. 23

24

SPEAKER: JUST TO CLARIFY, I ONLY READ THE TOP TWO FOR THE SAKE
 OF TIME BECAUSE IT IS A LONG PRESENTATION, BUT OUR PLANNERS
 DID TAKE ALL OF THE FEEDBACK, THEY READ ALL OF THE COMMENTS
 AND TOOK ALL OF THE RESULTS AND REVIEWED EVERYTHING.

5

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

6 WENDI KALLINS: I DIDN'T SEE THAT TURNING UP IN WHAT WAS
7 CHANGED TO PLANNED BAY AREA. I DIDN'T SEE THOSE CHANGES THERE,
8 AND THAT'S WHY I BROUGHT IT UP. >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK FOR SOME
9 OF THE CHALLENGES WE DID INCORPORATE SOME OF THE ONES THAT HAD
10 A SLIGHTLY LOWER --

11

WENDI KALLINS: ACTUALLY, I DID SEE BIKE AND WALK WAS ONE OF 12 THOSE THAT WAS PUT IN THERE. >DAVE VAUTIN: TO ANSWER YOUR 13 SPECIFIC CAPACITY YOU'RE CORRECT IN THE JOBS/HOUSING BALANCE 14 15 WE DIDN'T SELECT THE THIRD OPTION IN PLAY. WE HAD A CHANCE TO 16 REASSESS THE ECONOMY ELEMENT, GIVEN THE ECONOMY IS DIFFERENT NOW THAN WHERE IT WAS SIX OR SEVEN MONTHS AGO. AND WE HEARD A 17 LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM LOCAL JURISDICTION AS WELL AS THE PUBLIC 18 SHOWN THERE, THAT WE SHOULD, IN THIS MORE CHALLENGING ECONOMIC 19 ENVIRONMENT, THAT THE CARROT-BASED APPROACH WAS A LOT MORE 20 21 ATTRACTIVE THAN CAPS ON DEVELOPMENT TO DISCOURAGE BUILDING THAT WAS INCENTIVE BASED WAS MORE PALATABLE AND THAT'S WHY WE 22 MADE THE SHIFT THERE AND DIDN'T INCLUDE THE STRICT CAPS 23 APPROACH. 24

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

> WENDI KALLINS: THE OTHER ONE WAS RELAXING ZONING TO ALLOW FOR 1 MIXED USE. I KNOW THAT'S SOMETHING THE STATE LEGISLATURE WAS 2 3 LOOKING AT. AND THINGS DID GO BY A LITTLE FAST SO I'M NOT SURE IF ANY OF THAT WAS PUT N I KNOW THAT THERE IS DEFINITELY PUSH 4 5 BACK FROM THE "WE LOVE SUBURBS" PEOPLE. I WANTED TO SEE IF THAT WAS A STRATEGY THAT WAS BEING CONSIDERED? >DAVE VAUTIN: 6 YEAH THAT WAS IN THE MIX. WE DIDN'T HAVE TIME TO HIGHLIGHT ALL 7 8 OF THE SMALLER SCALE REVISIONS THEY'RE IN ATTACHMENT I OF THE 9 PACKET. SO SOME OF THAT'S IN THERE. 10 WENDI KALLINS: OKAY GREAT THANKS. 11 12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RANDI, I SAW YOU'RE HERE. DID YOU WANT TO 13 TAKE OVER? MAYBE SHE GOT DISCONNECTED. NEXT UP IS RICH. RICH, 14 15 GO AHEAD. YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF, RICH. 16 RICHARD HEDGES: I THOUGHT I HAD. 17 18 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: ACTUALLY, NO. I'LL LET CYNTHIA FINISH OUT 19 THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. 23 RICHARD HEDGES: SHALL I GO? 24 25

September 9, 2020



2

September 9, 2020

1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES.

3 RICH HEDGES: JUST A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS ESPECIALLY ON HOUSING AND THE ENVIRONMENT. AND CLEAN ENERGY. I'M CONCERNED 4 5 WITH THE CHANGES IN THE ECONOMY. URBAN VILLAGE PLANS THAT ARE AROUND ESPECIALLY SAN JOSE AND THE PENINSULA WERE CONSTRUCTED 6 WITH A MIXED USE TO LIMIT THE AMOUNT OF CAR TRIPS YOU HAVE TO 7 8 HAVE FOR SERVICES, AND THOSE ARE BEING VERY DIFFICULT TO FULFILL, BECAUSE OF THE CHANGES IN THE ECONOMY. AND I'M 9 10 CONCERNED, AND I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE STAFF'S COMMENT ON THIS ONE AS WELL AS ONE OTHER THING. I'M CONCERNED THAT, A, WE'RE 11 NOT GOING TO -- HOUSING PRODUCTION BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO MAKE 12 IT LESS AFFORDABLE FOR DEVELOPERS AND, TWO, IF WE DO GET T 13 WON'T GET THE MIXTURE THAT WILL HELP WITH THE AMOUNT OF CAR 14 15 TRIPS THAT ARE NECESSARY. WHOLE RETAIL SECTION HAS KNOT YET 16 BEEN BUILT ON ABOUT 15 YEARS INTO THE 20 YEAR PLAN OF BAY 17 MEADOWS, AND MY OTHER CONCERN IS OBVIOUSLY WITH THE ENVIRONMENT. IF YOU'RE NOT LIMITING CAR TRIPS, YOU'RE GOING TO 18 AFFECT OUR ABILITY TO COMPLETE THE PLAN FOR REDUCTION IN 19 GREENHOUSE GASSES, AND ALONG WITH THAT, WHEN WE'RE TALKING 20 21 ABOUT IN THE PLAN, MORE ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND CHARGING STATIONS, MANY OF THE CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS CANNOT PUT IN THE 22 220 THAT'S NECESSARY FOR THE CHARGING STATIONS, INTO GARAGES. 23 MY DEVELOPMENT IS ONE OF THOSE. IT'S 41 YEARS OLD. YOU CAN PUT 24 25 THEM IN THE STANDALONE TOWNHOUSES LIKE I LIVE N BUT IN THE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

CONDOS IT'S IMPOSSIBLE. IN FACT IT WOULD BE A FIRE HAZARD 1 RIGHT NOW FOR JUST TWO PEOPLE TO PLUG IN A CAR IN A SIX GARAGE 2 3 SET. SO, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE, IN THE PLAN, THAT WE HAVE THE MONEY TO HELP SOME OF THESE OLDER DEVELOPMENTS IMPLEMENT 4 5 CHARGING STATIONS. I KNOW THAT PENINSULA CLEAN ENERGY HAS A PLAN TO DO SO, BUT THEY'RE GOING TO NEED HELP WITH IT 6 FINANCIALLY TOO. SO IF YOU CAN MAKE SENSE OF MY COMMENTS AND 7 8 RESPOND TO HOW YOU THINK IT'S GOING TO EFFECT WITH THE CHANGES IN THE ECONOMY, AND ESPECIALLY THE PLANS THAT HAVE ALREADY 9 BEEN DRAWN WHETHER WE'LL BE ABLE TO GET HOUSING IN IT BECAUSE 10 DEVELOPERS WON'T BUILD ON THOSE PLANS. IF YOU WOULD COMMENT ON 11 WHAT I JUST SAID, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS 12 RICH. A FEW THINGS ON YOUR COMMENTS, FIRST OF ALL, WE ALL 13 RECOGNIZE THAT THE RETAIL SECTOR IS CHANGING A LOT, AND THAT 14 IN A LOT OF -- PLACES WE'RE ZONED FOR RETAIL. WE HAVE VACANT 15 16 SPACES IN THE CITIES AND STOREFRONT RETAIL AND NEW DEVELOPMENTS ACROSS THE REGION WHICH IS GOING TO BE A 17 CONTINUED CHALLENGE WE HAVE SEEN IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT THAT 18 JOB GROWTH ON THE PENINSULA WAS FAIRLY ROBUST COMPARED TO 19 OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION. SO, SO FAR SOME OF OUR ECONOMIC 20 21 STRATEGIES SEEMS TO BE DOING A GOOD JOB GETTING A MIX OF 22 HOUSING AND JOBS AND IN PLACES LIKE THE PENINSULA BUT THERE IS RECOGNITION FOR CERTAIN JOB TYPES THAT OUR INDUSTRY SECTOR 23 CONTINUES TO CHANGE AROUND COMMENTS REGARDING LIMITING CAR 24 TRIPS WE HAVE A LOT OF STRATEGIES DESIGNED IN THERE THAT ARE 25

TO REDUCE CAR TRIPS WITHIN THE REGION WHETHER THAT'S PRICING 1 STRATEGIES OR NEW INVESTMENT IN PUBLIC TRANSIT TO REVISE THOSE 2 3 ALTERNATIVES HUGE INVESTMENT IN PEDESTRIAN AND BIKING INFRASTRUCTURE, WHETHER SHORT-TERM OR LONG-TERM, REDUCE 4 5 DEPENDENCE ON AUTOMOBILES ACROSS THE REGION AND ENCOURAGE SHORT TRIPS TO BE DONE BY WALKING OR BICYCLING AND LASTLY WITH 6 REGARDS TO CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S PART OF THE ELECTRIC 7 8 VEHICLE STRATEGY IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT SUBSIDIZING THE VEHICLES IT'S ABOUT HELPING TO PAY FOR THE CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE AND 9 10 BY INCREASING THAT FUNDING LEVEL BY A SIGNIFICANT DEGREE, BY EIGHT TIMES THAT WOULD ENABLE USES TO REALLY DO A LOT MORE, 11 ESPECIALLY IN MULTI-FAMILY STRUCTURES OTHER STRUCTURES THAT 12 COULD BENEFIT FROM CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE. 13

14

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RICHARD HEDGES: DAVE I RECOGNIZE THAT. TWO OF THE PROJECTS IN 15 16 OUR OFFICE ALLOW PEOPLE TO CHARGE IN THE EVENING. I STILL THINK ELIMINATION OF RETAIL IS REALLY GOING TO PUT PEOPLE ON 17 THE ROAD FOR SERVICES ESPECIALLY GROCERIES AND THINGS LIKE 18 THAT. I RECOGNIZE ALL THESE OTHER STRATEGIES WE HAVE TO 19 IMPLEMENT AND THAT'S GOING TO TAKE TIME AS WELL. SO, I 20 21 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS, AND I AGREE WITH MOST OF THEM, BUT I 22 REALLY THINK IT'S GOING TO SET US BACK NOT BEING ABLE TO GET 23 RETAIL TO SOME OF THE LARGER DEVELOPMENTS. I WILL SAY THIS, THE LATEST DEVELOPMENT 973 UNITS A BLOCK FROM CALTRAIN STATION 24 SAN MATEO DOESN'T HAVE RETAIL BUT IT HAS A DROP OFF PLACE FOR 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

September 9, 2020

PACKAGES SO IT'S RECOGNIZING THESE CHANGES. AND THE OTHER 1 THING I WANTED TO COMMENT ON, HANK DITTMIER'S BOOK WHICH WE 2 3 TALKED ABOUT AND ACTUALLY BOUGHT A COPY OF IT, I HAVE RECOGNIZED WE'RE GETTING PUSH BACK ON SMALLER HOUSE UNIT IN 4 5 SAN MATEO AND THERE IS A LOT OF INFILL SPACE IN SAN MATEO FOR SMALL DEVELOPMENTS AND I THINK OTHER PARTS TOO. IN THE LONG-6 TERM WE'RE GOING TO GET MORE BANG FOR THE BUCK BASED ON 7 8 STRATEGIES FOR BUILDING. I THINK THE TIME IN SAN MATEO, THE BIGGER DEVELOPMENTS, BECAUSE MUCH LAND, IT'S JUST GONE. THANKS 9 10 DAVE.

11

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP, MICHAEL BALDINI.

13

MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU. THERE IS A COUPLE OF ISSUES I HAVE 14 WITH THE PRESENTATION AS FOR AS, YOU MENTIONED NEW TRANSBAY 15 16 RAIL, THAT'S NOT BART, IT'S THE DUMBARTON BRIDGE OR ANOTHER 17 HEAVY RAIL? AND WITH THAT PRESENTATION, YOU ALSO SHOW A PICTURE OF THE BENICIA MARTINEZ RAIL BRIDGE UNION PACIFIC USED 18 BY THE AMTRAK CORRIDOR AND SO ON AND SO FORTH AND BAND OF 680, 19 BENICIA MARTINEZ BRIDGE AND I THOUGHT THAT WAS DESIGNED FOR 20 21 HEAVY RAIL, AS FAR AS WHEN IT WAS CONSTRUCTED AND ENGINEERED, THE JUMPING OVER TO THE TERM, AND THIS IS TERMINOLOGY ONLY IS 22 THE PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING IT SOUND LIKE OKAY LET'S 23 JUST LEAVE THEM THERE, OR DUMP THESE PREDOMINANTLY COMMUNITIES 24 OF COLOR AND JUST KEEP THEM WHERE THEY'RE AT, WHETHER IT'S --25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

I THINK WE ALL KNOW THE COMMUNITIES AROUND THE BAY WHY NOT 1 GIVE THEM A PATHWAY TO THAT HOME WITH A BACKYARD OR, YOU IT 2 3 JUST SEEMS THAT, OKAY, LET'S JUST BUILD A WALL AROUND IT AND JUST, IT WILL ALWAYS BE PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE THAT'S HOW IT 4 5 COMES ACROSS. BICYCLES, I THINK IT'S DIFFICULT TO SEE A WORKING FAMILY ADOPT BICYCLES AND ALL OF THEIR GOINGS ON, FOR 6 ALL THEIR NEEDS. WHEN SCHOOL IS BACK IN SESSION AND A COUPLE 7 8 OF SCHOOLS ARE UP HERE, IT'S MOM OR DAD DROPPING OFF THEIR KID AND IT SOUND LIKE WE NEED TO TEACH HOW TO RIDE A BIKE AGAIN. 9 AND THEN THE SOLAR POWER, IS THERE ENOUGH POWER GIVEN THIS ERA 10 OF ROLLING BROWN OUTS TO ENCOURAGE MORE ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND 11 CHARGING STATIONS WHEN ROLLING BROWN OUTS ARE JUST A WAY OF 12 LIFE NOW. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: I'LL ADDRESS YOUR 13 QUESTIONS. WE HAVE A NUMBER OF HANDS UP. TO QUICKLY ADDRESS 14 THE RAIL PROJECTS THERE ARE TWO RAPID TRANSIT ON THE DUMBARTON 15 16 BRIDGE THAT'S ONE LINE AND ACROSS TRANSBAY BAY BRIDGE CORRIDOR EITHER A NEW BART LINE OR COMMUTER RAIL CONNECTION IF THAT 17 CORRIDOR. THAT'S -- SO WE'RE NOT SPECIFYING THE EXACT MODE 18 THERE, BUT THEY WOULD SERVE, YOU KNOW, TWO DIFFERENT MARKETS 19 DEPENDING ON THE MODE. AND THEN JUST TO CLARIFY ON THE HOUSING 20 21 FRONT, WE HAVE EXPANDED THE REVENUE FOR BOTH NEW AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AND ALSO FOR PRESERVATION, 22 ABOUT THE SAME AMOUNT OF NEW FUNDING FOR ALL OF THOSE THINGS. 23 I THINK WHAT WE HEARD FROM SOME OF THE COMMUNITIES THAT, THAT 24 25 ARE CURRENTLY LOWER INCOME AND MINORITY COMMUNITIES IS THEY

 METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

HAVE BUILT A COMMUNITY IN SOME OF THESE PLACES THEY HAVE
 NEIGHBORHOOD CONNECTIONS AND SUPPORTIVE SERVICES SO NOT
 EVERYONE WANTS TO RELATE. AFFORDABLE DEED RESTRICTED AND
 PROTECTING AREAS FROM DISPLACEMENT RISK IT'S REALLY ABOUT
 HAVING CHOICES.

6

7 MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU.

8

9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAHMON, YOU'RE UP NEXT. GO AHEAD.

10

RAHMON MOMOH: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. I HAVE 11 A FEW OUESTIONS. FIRST ONE IS THE UNDER 500 UNIVERSAL BASIC 12 INCOME, I'M SURE THAT'S NOT FOR HOUSING. WHAT IS THAT FOR? AND 13 HOW DO YOU COME UP WITH THAT AMOUNT? YOU KNOW, THE PROPOSED 14 15 \$500? >DAVE VAUTIN: YEAH, THAT'S A GOOD OUESTION. OBVIOUSLY 16 UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME IS SOMETHING THAT'S BEEN TALKED ABOUT A LOT IN POLICY CIRCLES THERE ARE SOME PILOT PROGRAMS INCLUDING 17 IN STOCKTON THAT ARE ONGOING ON THAT FRONT AND I BELIEVE 18 THAT'S WHERE WE GOT THE FUNDING LEVEL FOR THE UNIVERSAL BASIC 19 INCOME BY MIMICKING THE STOCKTON PILOT THAT'S CURRENTLY 20 21 ONGOING WHICH THEY'RE LOOKING TO SEE HOW THAT SORT OF PAYMENT 22 MONTHLY COULD HELP MOVE PEOPLE INTO THE MIDDLE CLASS PROVIDING 23 THEM THAT FINANCIAL STABILITY SO THEY CAN GO TO COMMUNITY COLLEGE AND GET THE TRAINING THEY NEED TO MOVE UP THE INCOME 24 LADDER OVER TIME. SO THAT'S POLICY IS NOT ONE THAT IT WOULD BE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

IMPLEMENTED ON THE REGIONAL LEVEL IT'S MORE OF A STATE LEVEL
 POLICY BUT IT'S ONE WAY WHERE WE TRYING TO INDUCE EQUALITY IN
 THE INCOME MAMA THAT WOULD BE SUBSTITUTING INCOME, THE \$500?
 >DAVE VAUTIN: YES.

5

RAHMON MOMOH: MY OTHER COMMENT ON TELECOMMUTING, THERE WAS AN 6 ARTICLE IN THE SUNDAY TIMES ABOUT TELECOMMUTING FOR THE 7 8 MINORITY COMMUNITY, AND I WANT TO SHARE THAT WITH YOU. BECAUSE APPARENTLY ALL OF THE OPPORTUNITY WE HAVE TO INTERACT AND GET 9 MENTORED, THIS IS ADVERSELY IMPACTED, BLACKS, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE 10 OF COLOR. AND YOU MIGHT WANT TO LOOK INTO THAT IMPACT IN TERMS 11 OF EQUITY. BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE THAT OPPORTUNITY IS 12 DISAPPEARING FOR SOME PEOPLE. AND PEOPLE ARE REVERSING BACK TO 13 THE TRADITIONAL WAY OF, PEOPLE DIDN'T KNOW, AND PEOPLE THEY 14 15 ARE COMFORTABLE WITH, WHEREAS WHEN YOU WALK IN AT THE OFFICE YOU'RE ABLE TO INTERACT WITH PEOPLE AND PEOPLE CAN SEE YOU, 16 DON'T JUDGE YOU WITHOUT KNOWING YOU, SO THE ARTICLE IS A VERY 17 GOOD ONE. I WOULD STRONGLY RECOMMEND THAT YOU LOOK AT IT, IT 18 WAS IN THE NEW YORK TIMES, AND IT WENT INTO DETAILS ABOUT THE 19 IMPACT OF TELECOMMUTING ON MINORITIES, ESPECIALLY AFRICAN 20 21 AMERICANS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANK YOU. 22

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: TERRI, GO AHEAD.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

TERRY SCOTT: I HAVE A OUESTION AND A FEW COMMENTS. DO WE HAVE 1 CURRENT ACCESS TO DATA ON TELECOMMUNICATIONS? OR EXCUSE ME, 2 3 TELECOMMUTING PEOPLE WHO BASICALLY, TO ALLOW A POTENTIAL REDIRECTION OF SOME OF THE ALLOCATED FINANCIAL RESOURCES THAT 4 5 WE HAVE DISCUSSED TO OTHER FORMS OF TRANSPORTATION AND TO POTENTIALLY OTHER COMMUNITIES? IF WE HAVE PEOPLE, AS IT SEEMS, 6 AND I HAVEN'T SEEN THE LATEST DATA BUT A LOT OF PEOPLE IN SAN 7 8 FRANCISCO ARE TELECOMMUTING NOW, AND THEREFORE THEY'RE NOT UTILIZING TRANSPORTATION TO AND FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO THE 9 DEGREE THAT THEY DID PREVIOUSLY. AND HOW IS THAT GOING TO 10 CHANGE GOING FORWARD? IS THAT JUST A CURRENT TREND? IS THAT 11 GOING TO BECOME A PERMANENT ASPECT THAT WE SHOULD BE DEALING 12 WITH, AND WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT IN OUR FUTURE PLANNINGS? WE, 13 TOO, WE IN NAPA, ARE ALSO SEEING A LOT OF TECH AND OTHER 14 15 EMPLOYEES WHO ARE RELOCATING TO OUR RELATIVELY RURAL 16 COMMUNITY. AND AS SUCH, WE'RE EXPERIENCING BOTH NEWER FORMER 17 URBAN RESIDENTS THAT ARE ARRIVING AND PURCHASING HOMES, AND IN SOME CASES, YOU KNOW, INCREASING, RAISING THE PRICES OF THOSE 18 PROPERTIES. AND AS A RURAL COMMUNITY, WE HAVE A LIMITED NUMBER 19 OF AVAILABLE HOMES IN A 15 YEAR PLAN THAT REQUIRES US TO 20 REMAIN IN AGRICULTURE, WHICH LIMITS THAT HOME. I MEAN, AS I 21 HAVE STATED BEFORE, I THINK WE'RE AN UNUSUAL COMMUNITY WHERE 22 WE HAVE THREE AND A HALF MILLION VISIT TOURISTS A YEAR BUT 23 LESS THAN 30,000 RESIDENT IN THE ENTIRE COUNTY. AT ANY RATE, 24 WE'RE SEEING MORE AND OLDER RETIRED RESIDENTS THAT MAY BE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RELOCATING TO LESS EXPENSIVE COMMUNITIES, AND TO COMMUNITIES 1 2 WHERE THERE IS A LESSER TRANSPORTATION REQUIREMENT, AND THAT A 3 NETWORK, WE DON'T -- WE DON'T HAVE REALLY A SUPER HIGHWAY INTO THIS PARTICULAR COUNTY. SO, IT'S KIND OF A TRANSITION OF OLDER 4 5 AND RETIRED EMPLOYEES LEAVING WHILE SOME OF THESE NEW FORMERLY SAN FRANCISCO EMPLOYEES THAT MANY OF WHOM LIVE OUTSIDE SAN 6 FRANCISCO BECAUSE THE COST OF HOUSING IS SO HIGH THERE, WELL 7 8 NOW THEY'RE MOVING TO THE SURROUNDING COMMUNITIES AND COUNTIES, AND THERE WILL BE, HOPEFULLY, THAT WILL REMAIN AS 9 10 TELECOMMUTING OPTIONS, BUT IF IT CHANGES, AND IF IN FACT THEY ARE REQUIRED TO RELOCATE, TO ACTUALLY WORK OUT OF OFFICES ET 11 CETERA, IN SAN FRANCISCO, EITHER THROUGH THEIR CURRENT 12 EMPLOYEES OR FOR NEW COMPANIES THAT ARE COMING IN, THEN 13 ADDITIONAL TRANSPORTATION RESOURCES WILL BE NECESSARY. ARE WE 14 15 UP TO SPEED IN THE PRESENTATION, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT WE HAVE 16 HEARD PREVIOUSLY, IN CONSIDERING THESE TRANSPORTATION TRANSITIONS THAT ARE TAKING PLACE? >DAVE VAUTIN: THE SHORT 17 ANSWER TO YOUR OUESTION S WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO INTEGRATE 18 BASED ON ALL THE DATA WE HAVE AT THIS JUNCTURE, THE FUTURE 19 PROJECTIONS FOR HIGHER TELECOMMUTING THE STRATEGIES INVOLVING 20 21 TELECOMMUTING TO IMPLEMENT THEM INTO THE BLUEPRINT I WANT TO UNDERSCORE, I THINK WE FEEL IT IN OUR BONES RIGHT NOW HOW 22 UNCERTAIN THE FUTURE IS RIGHT NOW AND THE IDEA OF GATHERING A 23 PERFECT PREDICTION IS VERY FOGGY IN TERMS OF WHAT THE FUTURE 24 MIGHT HOLD. THAT'S WHY WE UPDATE THESE PLANS EVERY FOUR YEARS. 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

WE THINK WE HAVE DEVELOPED A REALISTIC VISION FOR POST COVID 1 COMMUTING PATTERNS WHERE THERE WILL BE MORE TELECOMMUTING BUT 2 3 PEOPLE MAY STILL COME INTO THE OFFICE A FEW DAYS A WEEK IN ORDER TO HAVE THAT INTERACTION WITH THEIR COWORKERS AND THE 4 5 CREATIVE COLLABORATION. IT WILL BE A NEW NORMAL. WE HAVE TRIED TO PROJECT WHAT THAT MIGHT LOOK LIKE AND ACCOMMODATE IT WITH 6 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS BUT THERE IS ALWAYS AN OPPORTUNITY 7 8 TO CONTINUE TO REFINE THAT WHEN WE DO OUR UPDATE FOUR YEARS FROM NOW. 9

10

11 SPEAKER: THANK YOU.

12

13 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: MARTHA WHEN YOU CALL ON THE
14 PEOPLE CAN YOU CALL THE NEXT PERSON AFTER THAT SO THEY'RE
15 READY.

16

17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I'M SORRY. NOT EVERYONE CAN SEE THE LIST.
18 NEXT UP IS CARLOS THEN ANNE OLIVIA THEN VEDA. CARLOS GO AHEAD.
19

20 MICHAEL LOPEZ: STARTING ON THE TELECOMMUTE, I AM INTERESTED, I 21 HAVE NOT READ THE ARTICLE THAT RAHMON MENTIONED BUT HOPEFULLY 22 THAT'S SOMETHING MTC CAN LOOK AT IN TERMS OF HOW TELECOMMUTING 23 AFFECTS COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, AND IN OUR CASE, ALSO, YOU KNOW, 24 THE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. AND ALONG 25 THOSE LINES, TELECOMMUTING, I WOULD ALSO ENCOURAGE, I THINK AN

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

EARLIER COMMENT EARLIER FROM ADINA ABOUT PARENTS, AND HAVING 1 2 SMALL CHILDREN AND TELECOMMUTING, I WOULD ENCOURAGE THE 3 COLOCATING -- I DON'T KNOW HOW WE COULD DO THIS IN THE PLAN --BUT ENCOURAGING THE USE OF CHILD CARE FACILITIES THAT ARE NEAR 4 5 HOMES SO THAT THEY CAN HAVE THAT OPPORTUNITY, EVEN IF THEY DON'T HAVE TO COMMUTE TO WORK, THAT THEY STILL HAVE THE 6 OPPORTUNITY TO WORK FROM HOME WITHOUT ALSO DOING CHILD CARE AT 7 8 THE SAME TIME. RIGHT NOW DURING COVID WE ARE IN THAT SITUATION AND A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE STRUGGLING WITH THAT. I'M THINKING 9 POST COVID. AND I WOULD ENCOURAGE, I KNOW MAYBE OUTSIDE THE 10 PLAN, BUT I ALWAYS WANTED TO BRING IN THE CONNECTION WITH 11 SCHOOLS AND EDUCATION. SO THAT'S REALLY HOW -- HOW DO WE 12 IMPROVE NEIGHBORHOOD SCHOOLS SO THAT, AS WAS BEING MENTIONED 13 EARLIER PARENTS DRIVING THEIR KIDS, THAT IS A CAUSE OF 14 15 CONGESTION IN THE MORNINGS AND IN THE AFTERNOONS, THAT HAVING 16 CHILDREN -- HAVING PARENTS AND COMMUNITIES FEEL COMFORTABLE AND CERTAIN ABOUT THEIR SCHOOL AND THAT IT PERFORM IN A WAY 17 THAT WOULD MEET THERE NEEDS AND ALSO WITH A STATE OF FACTOR 18 THAT IS IN LINE WITH WHAT MTC HAS DONE IN THE PAST, SAFE TO 19 SCHOOLS, REALLY LOOKING AT THE SAFETY ASPECT OF IT SO WE CAN 20 21 HAVE MORE KIDS GOING BACK ON THEIR BIKES, BACK TO THE FUTURE AGAIN. AND I WOULD ALSO ADD, ON THE ISSUE ABOUT DISPLACEMENT. 22 IN FACT, THIS IS ONE WHERE MAYBE, NOT HAVING READ THAT 23 ARTICLE, THAT THE LEGACY OF REDLINING HAS BEEN THIS KIND OF 24 25 ISOLATION OF COMMUNITIES. AND SO AT THE SAME TIME, LIKE DAVE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SAID A LOT OF COMMUNITIES HAVE BUILT A SUPPORT SYSTEM AROUND 1 THEM SO I DO BELIEVE THAT WE NEED TO GIVE THAT OPPORTUNITY TO 2 3 ALSO IMPROVE THOSE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE LACKING AND PROVIDE --HAVE A MORE PLANED IN TERMS OF OPPORTUNITIES FOR GROCERY 4 5 STORES, FOR FOOD DESERTS TO HAVE THOSE FRESH FOODS AND PUSHING FOR THOSE THINGS AS WELL, AND I WOULD SAY IF WE HAVE 6 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE MEASURE, AND LEARN FROM 7 8 PAST EXPERIENCES FROM INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS ON WHAT HAPPENED WHEN DISPLACEMENT DID HAPPEN, AND WHAT CAN WE DO 9 LOOKING FORWARD SO THAT YES WE'RE PUTTING IN NEW 10 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS IN UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES, BUT AS 11 WE HAVE SEEN IN THE PAST IT TENDS TO LEAD TO DISPLACEMENT. AND 12 LASTLY, I WOULD ENCOURAGE, ALSO, MAYBE ALONG THE LINES OF 13 EDUCATION AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR FOLKS WHO RISE, IS JOB 14 15 TRAINING, AND LOOKING IN THE PLAN, IF WE -- I KNOW IT'S HARD 16 TO PREDICT THE FUTURE, BUT IF WE CAN REALLY PUT AN EMPHASIS ON WHAT KIND OF JOBS WOULD THESE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE UNDERSERVED 17 BE ABLE TO FOCUS ON TRAINING SO THAT WE CAN HAVE A WELL PAID, 18 YOU KNOW, WELL -- AND HAVE FOLK WHO CAN ACTUALLY BE ABLE TO, 19 YOU KNOW, LIVE, AND HOPEFULLY BUY HOMES IN AREAS THAT THEY 20 21 LIVE IN, AND DON'T HAVE A LOT OF SUPER COMMUTES WHICH IS 22 WHAT'S HAPPENING NOW. BECAUSE THEIR PAYCHECK DOESN'T ALLOW THEM TO BE ABLE TO -- SO THAT ALSO HAS TO DO WITH THE ABILITY 23 THAT TO BUILD MORE OF THAT AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCLUDE THE VMR 24 HOME OWNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES IN THOSE HIGH EXPENSE AREAS THAT 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

WE DO HAVE THAT PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN MANY
 COMMUNITIES AND IT'S NOT JUST IN CERTAIN COMMUNITIES. I'LL
 LEAVE IT AT THAT. THANK YOU.

4

5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. ANNE OLIVIA, GO AHEAD AND THEN VEDA THEN BEN. >ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I 6 WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF FOR THAT FANTASTIC PRESENTATION. 7 8 THERE IS CLEARLY BEEN A HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT HAS BEEN PUT INTO IT. I AM A BIG FAN OF OUITE A FEW OF THE CHANGES THAT I 9 10 HAVE SEEN INTEGRATED INTO THIS MASSIVE PROJECT, INCLUDING SOME REAL STEPS TO ADDRESS DISPLACEMENT WITH THE INTRODUCTION OF 11 THE UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME AND SOME REALITY POSITIVE 12 INTEGRATION OF PUBLIC PROCESSES IT'S BEEN COOL TO PARTICIPATE 13 IN THIS AND I WANT TO RECOGNIZE HOW HARD THEY HAVE BEEN 14 WORKING IN THE COMMUNITY IN WAYS THAT WE TRADITIONALLY HAVE 15 16 NOT BEEN ABLE TO CONNECT. I HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT THE NEW STRATEGIES WHEN THEY ARE TAKEN TOGETHER AND WITHIN CONCERN 17 SPECIFICALLY ABOUT RAISING CLASS EOUITY THAT I EXPRESS AT 18 EVERY MEETING. LOOKING SPECIFICALLY AT THE THIRD POINT IN 19 CHALLENGE NUMBER TWO, THE FEE PER MILE TOLLING. STAFF AND I 20 21 HAVE HAD LONG AND EX-- EXTENSIVE IMPACTS. LAST CONVERSATION I HAD, WE -- I WAS ASSURED REPEATEDLY THAT WE WERE ONLY TALKING 22 ABOUT TOLLING FOR EXPRESS LANES. I SEE NOW THAT THESE ARE TWO 23 SEPARATE STRATEGIES AND SO I WILL REITERATE MY CONCERNS ABOUT 24 THE ALL LANE TOLLING STRATEGIES. WHEN YOU LOOK AT THIS AND 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COMBINE IT WITH THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE THERE ARE CERTAIN 1 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE LIKELY TO BE IN JOBS THAT ARE NOT ABLE TO 2 3 WORK FROM HOME. AND TO BE CLEAR, I LOVE THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. I BENEFIT FROM IT. I HATE COMMUTING. I AM NOT A 4 5 PARENT SO I DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT KIDS BEING AT HOME. I LOVE THE REALLY SMART STRATEGY OF EXPANDING BELIEF INTERNET. 6 MINE IS EXPENSIVE AND IT'S TERRIBLE. SO AGAIN I BENEFIT FROM 7 8 THIS ALONG WITH A LOT OF OTHER FOLKS WHO ARE ALSO STUDENTS LIKE ME. BUT WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING TO BE 9 ABLE TO WORK FROM HOME AND THE KINDS OF JOBS THEY HAVE AND 10 THEN THE PEOPLE WHO CAN'T WORK FROM HOME AND THE JOBS THEY 11 HAVE, AND THEN YOU LAY THAT OVER WITH AN ALL LANE TOLLING, 12 ESPECIALLY WITH THE DISPLACEMENT, I AM BETTING THAT IF YOU 13 LAID A RACIAL EQUITY IMPACT ANALYSIS ON TOP OF THESE 14 STRATEGIES WITH INDUCTION IF WE LOOK AT THE SLIDE AFTER THAT 15 16 GHG REDUCTION SLIDE THAT YOU WOULD SEE A DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT ON RACE AND CLASS GROUPS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ASK STAFF 17 BECAUSE AGAIN YOU WEREN'T ABLE TO GO DEEPLY INTO THIS, THE 18 PRESENTATION WAS OUICK ABOUT THE STRATEGIES USED TO MITIGATE 19 THIS AND VERY CLEARLY JUST SAYING THAT COMMUNITIES WITH LESS 20 21 ECONOMIC RESOURCES CAN APPLY TO GET A DISCOUNT IS NOT SAY 22 SATISFACTORILY ANSWER ANYWAY. RIGHT NOW WE SEE THE PRESIDENTIAL ADMINISTRATION MAKING THREATS ABOUT HOUSEHOLD 23 INFORMATION BEING USED TO BE TURNED OVER TO ICE SO WE KNOW 24 THAT COMMUNITIES ARE NOT RECORDING -- FOLKS IN MY COMMUNITY 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

ARE NOT UTILIZING SERVICES OR ASKING FOR SERVICES OUT OF FEAR 1 2 THAT IT WILL IMPACT THEIR IMMIGRATION STATUS OR APPLICATION, 3 WE KNOW THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS THAT QUALIFY FOR THESE PROGRAMS AND WHO MOST NEED THEM DO NOT APPLY FOR THEM JUST SAYING FOLKS 4 5 THAT WITH NEED CAN APPLY ERASES THE LIVED EXPERIENCE ESPECIALLY TODAY'S LIVED EXPERIENCE OF THEM NOT ACTUALLY BEING 6 ABLE TO DO SO BECAUSE OF THE POLITICAL CLIMATE UP HERE. AND A 7 8 VARIETY OF OTHER REASONS AROUND SHAME, AROUND ACCESS, AROUND LANGUAGE AND EVEN KNOWING THAT THE PROGRAMS EXIST. I AM HOPING 9 10 THAT WE ARE INTEGRATING AUTOMATIC QUALIFICATION INTO THE APPLICATIONS LIKE WAS TOLD TO ME ABOUT THE TOLLING ON EXPRESS 11 LANES. THIS IS A BIG CONCERN AND I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING 12 WHAT STRATEGIES ARE BEING REDUCED TO ADDRESS THESE CONCERNS 13 AND HOPING THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE DO GET 14 15 CONSIDERATION ABOUT EOUITY IN PARTICULAR HOW THESE STRATEGIES 16 FALL IN LINE WHEN VIEWED THROUGH AN EQUITY LENS. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS ANNE OLIVIA I WANT TO ADDRESS MOST OF 17 YOUR COMMENTS ARE FOCUSED ON THE ALL LANE TOLLING I'LL ADDRESS 18 THERE WE FOCUSSED ON THE EOUITY IMPACTS ON THE ALL LANE 19 TOLLING IN THE DRAFT ALL LANE TOLLING ADDRESSES INEOUITIES 20 21 THAT CAN APPEAR TO HAVE MITIGATIONS ON THE PRICING FRONT WE INCLUDE THE ON THE TRANSIT SIDE AS WELL WITH MEANS-BASED 22 DISCOUNTS FOR TRANSIT AS WELL, AND WHAT WE FOUND FROM THAT 23 ANALYSIS IS THAT THOSE DISCOUNTS ACTUALLY ENSURED THAT THE 24 IMPACTS WERE NOT DISPARATE. THEY MINIMIZED THE COST INCREASES 25

FOR LOW AND MINIMUM INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND THEY WERE MUCH LOWER 1 THAN COST INCREASES EXPERIENCED BY HIGHER INCOME TRAVELERS AND 2 3 BY INCOME WE SHAW THE SHARE OF INCOME SPENT ON TRANSPORTATION COSTS AND WE SAW SIGNIFICANT REDUCTIONS FOR LOWER INCOME 4 5 TRAVELERS. WHEN IT COMES TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE SIDE OF IT, WHERE WE LEARNED A LOT FROM THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM THAT'S 6 7 CURRENTLY BEING PILOTED AS WELL AS A PILOT FOR MEANS-BASED 8 DISCOUNTS ON THE EXPRESS LANE NETWORK, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DOESN'T NECESSARILY GET INTO THE EXACT ADMINISTRATION OF ANY 9 OF THE STRATEGIES BUT AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH IMPLEMENTATION 10 11 AS WE STUDY TOLLING IN GREATER DETAIL AS PART OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PHASE WE CAN LOOK AT THE SORT OF ADMINISTRATIVE 12 SIDE OF THINGS HOW A PROGRAM WOULD ACTUALLY BE ADMINISTERED IN 13 REAL LIFE. I KNOW WE HAVE TALKED TO SOME DIFFERENT FOLKS ABOUT 14 WAYS TO ENSURE THAT THE VARIOUS SOCIAL PROGRAMS THAT IT'S MORE 15 16 STREAMLINED SO WHEN YOU OUALIFY FOR ONE PROGRAM MAYBE YOU OUALIFY FOR A NUMBER OF OTHER PROGRAMS AS WELL TO REDUCE THE 17 PAPERWORK REQUIRED FOR A NUMBER OF LOWER INCOME COMMUNITIES. I 18 APPRECIATE YOUR POINTS AND WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO OFFSET AND 19 MINIMIZE THOSE IMPACTS AS PART OF OUR GOAL OF ADVANCING EOUITY 20 21 IN THE PLAN.

22

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY VEDA THEN BEN, BOB, THEN WALTER WILL
24 WRAP US ALL UP. VEDA. VEDA, YOU'RE MUTED.

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU FOR MAKING THE ADJUSTMENTS TO THE 1 PROGRAM IT'S EXCITING TO SEE YOU HAVE PIVOTED AND REDIRECTED 2 3 AND I HOPE WE SEE THAT EVERY FIVE YEAR THAT WE HAVE THE REDIRECT AS WE MOVE TOWARDS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I WANT TO 4 5 TOUCH BASE WITH YOU ABOUT YOUR PAGE VIEWS AND ENGAGEMENTS YOU HAD 19,000 PAGE VIEWS SO I'M WONDERING, I WENT TO THE PAGE 6 ABOUT FIVE TIMES AND I WONDER IF YOU HAVE AGGREGATED COUNTS IN 7 8 THE NUMBER OF VIEWERS, AND ENGAGEMENT. I WONDER IF THE NUMBERS WOULD BE AFFECTED. AND I WANT TO ADDRESS THE ISSUES YOU 9 TOUCHED BASE AROUND THE GREENHOUSE GAS AREAS TOO. AND YOU SAID 10 YOU WOULD LIKE TO ENCOURAGE TELECOMMUTING AND WE HAD A LOT OF 11 CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT TODAY AND I THINK THAT COULD BE A 12 GREAT TOPIC FOR A FUTURE PAPER, FOR MTC TO CONSIDER. I'M ALSO 13 INTERESTED IN THE JOB TRAINING. AND YOU MENTIONED YOU WOULD 14 PARTNER FOR NEW JOB TRAINING AND THAT I HOPE THAT YOU LOOK TO 15 16 EXISTING ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE ALREADY DOING TRAINING AND PARTNER WITH THEM FIRST, RATHER THAN RECREATING THE WHEEL IN A 17 NEW ORGANIZATION. LET'S EXPAND WHAT WE HAVE THERE TO --18 BECAUSE THEY HAVE THE CONNECTIONS WITH THE COMMUNITY AS WELL. 19 SO I THINK YOU COULD HIT THE GROUND RUNNING IF YOU CONSIDERED 20 THAT. AND UNDER YOUR JOB TRAINING I WOULD ALSO LIKE YOU TO 21 22 CONSIDER, MTC TO CONSIDER THE IDEA OF CHILD CARE. WE NEED TO 23 EXPAND OUR CHILD CARE. AND RIGHT NOW, IT'S USUALLY WOMEN OF COLOR EARNING ABOUT \$15 AN HOUR, IF THAT. AND WE HAVE REALLY 24 UNDERVALUED OUR CHILD CARE PROVIDERS AS WE FOUND OUT DURING 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COVID-19. BUT MANY OF OUR JR. COLLEGES ARE DROPPING THEIR 1 CHILD CARE PROGRAMS AS WELL SO WE'RE LOSING ALL OF OUR TRAINED 2 3 CHILD CARE TECHNICIANS SO THAT'S SOMETHING WE REALLY NEED TO THINK ABOUT IF WE WANT TO KEEP OUR COMMUNITY WORKING AND 4 5 ESPECIALLY IF THEY'RE TELECOMMUTING THEY NEED TO HAVE THAT SEPARATION TIME TO FOCUS ON THEIR JOB. AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE 6 TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE AID IN ELECTRIFICATION. SO I THINK 7 8 IT'S A GREAT IDEA. IT'S VERY EXPENSIVE TO BUY AN ELECTRIFIED CAR AND IT WOULD REALLY HELP WITH COMMUTING, SAVE OUR ROADS 9 AND ENVIRONMENT IT WOULD MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE HOWEVER IF YOU 10 ARE GIVING ELECTRIFICATION AID TO PURCHASE AN ELECTRIFIED CAR 11 IN A COMMUNITY SUCH AS THE CANAL NEIGHBORHOOD IN SAN RAFAEL, 12 THERE IS SUCH LIMITED PARKING NOW TO EVEN PUT A CHARGING 13 STATION THERE, WOULD ELIMINATE, TAKE AWAY A PARKING SPACE. SO 14 WOE REALLY HAVE TO LOOK AT OUR NEIGHBORHOODS OF CONCERN AND 15 16 WORK WITH OUR CITY PLANNERS TO FIND OUT WHERE WE CAN TAKE AWAY A PARKING SPACE TO PUT A CHARGING STATION IN. IN NOVATO WHERE 17 I LIVE THEY HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB IN EXPANDING COMMUNITY 18 SHOPPING CENTERS WITH ELECTRIFIED CHARGING STATIONS BUT IN THE 19 CANAL NEIGHBORHOOD THERE IS JUST NO PLACE TO PUT THAT. I WANT 20 21 TO REVISIT OR MENTION AN INVESTMENT INTO SMALL GRID PRODUCTIONS. THE LARGE GRIDS, IF THEY GO DOWN, IF ONE END OF 22 23 THE GRID GOES DOWN IT CAN ELIMINATE THE ENTIRE BAY AREA, IF WE HAD SMALLER MICRO GRIDS THAT WOULD HELP TAKE THE PRESSURE OFF 24 THE GENERAL GRID AND I ALSO WANT TO VISIT HIGHWAY 37 AND BACK 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

THAT UP. THAT'S A 50 YEAR PLAN. AND WITHOUT REALLY VISIONING A 1 2 SPACE FOR BIKE AND PEDESTRIANS AND, YOU KNOW, A SEPARATE RAIL 3 SYSTEM, OR SOME SORT OF COMMUTING APPARATUS, I THINK WE'RE IN REAL TROUBLE. I THINK THE NAPA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY 4 5 HAS BEEN DOING RESEARCH IN COMMUTING, BUT WE DO NEED THAT SEPARATE SYSTEM WHERE PEOPLE CAN COMMUTE BACK AND FORTH IN 6 YEARS TO COME. AND I'M JUST GOING TO REVIEW MY NOTES ONE MORE 7 8 TIME. AND I THINK I HAVE GOT EVERYTHING. I'LL FOLLOW-THROUGH AFTERWARDS ON ANYTHING ELSE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 9

10

11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AWESOME. BEN. BEN ARE YOU STILL WITH US? 12

BENJAMIN SCHWENG: YES, I AM. SORRY. OKAY. SO I HAVE THREE 13 COMMENTS. ONE ABOUT THE ALL TOLLING. I THINK THAT -- I AGREE 14 WITH WHAT EVERYONE ELSE SAID. I THINK THAT THE GREATEST -- THE 15 16 TOP TEN PERCENT INCOME EARNERS IN THE BAY AREA ARE THE ONES THAT ARE GOING TO BENEFIT THE MOST FROM ALL TOLLING BECAUSE 17 THEY HAVE LARGE DISPOSABLE INCOMES AND THEY CAN GO WHEREVER 18 THEY WANT AT ANY TIME OF DAY WITH LESS TRAFFIC. SO I'M 19 WONDERING IF WE COULD ADD -- I KNOW WE'RE DOING SOME REACH 20 21 OUTS TO PEOPLE ON THE LOWER INCOME SPECTRUM BUT IF THE TOLLING COULD SOMEHOW BE MORE PROGRESSIVE SO THE TOP TEN PERCENT COULD 22 PAY MORE BECAUSE I THINK THEY ARE GETTING THE BIGGEST BENEFIT. 23 MY SECOND COMMENT WAS ABOUT HOUSING AND ZONING. WHERE I'M AT 24 IN HAYWARD AND CASTRO VALLEY WE WOULD HAVE SIGNIFICANTLY MORE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

HOUSING IN THE PAST TEN YEARS IF IT WASN'T FOR THE LOCAL 1 GOVERNMENT OR JURISDICTION WHO KEEPS TRYING TO ADD SIGNIFICANT 2 3 AMOUNTS OF RETAIL TO HOUSING PROJECTS, WHICH DEVELOPERS DON'T WANT TO DO BECAUSE THEY'RE CHASING A DWINDLING SALES TAX 4 5 DOLLAR. AND I THINK THE SALES TAX ISSUE IS REALLY HURTING THE GROWTH IN HOUSING IN A LOT OF THESE COMMUNITIES THAT DON'T 6 HAVE SIGNIFICANT INDUSTRIAL BASES. UNLESS WE SOLVE THAT WE'RE 7 8 NOT GOING TO GET THE HOUSING WE WANT OR THAT WE'RE EVEN ZONING FOR. AND FINAL A COMMENT ABOUT BIKES. I THINK HISTORICALLY WE 9 HAVE DONE A POOR JOB OF MODELING RECREATIONAL BIKING AND I 10 THINK THERE IS SIGNIFICANT GROWTH NO CYCLING NOW, AND WE TALK 11 ABOUT LOW STRESS ROUTES. I THINK THAT AS WE'RE ADDING THESE 12 BIKE LANES I THINK WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT WAYS WHERE WE NEED 13 ANOTHER CATEGORY WHICH IS CHILD FRIENDLY ROUTES WHICH I THINK 14 IS A LOT DIFFERENT THAN LOW STRESS ADULT ROUTES BUT AS WE'RE 15 16 SEEING MUCH MORE KIDS GETTING ON BIKES, I THINK WE NEED TO BE MINDFUL IN OUR MODELING AND WHAT WE'RE DESIGNING THAT SOME OF 17 THESE ROUTES NEED TO BE EXTRA FRIENDLY AND WORK FOR YOUR 18 THREE-YEAR-OLD TO NINE-YEAR-OLD RIDER, WHICH IS A DIFFERENT 19 NEED THAN JUST A LOW STRESS BIKE ROUTE. THANK YOU. >DAVE 20 VAUTIN: THANKS FOR YOUR COMMENTS. I'LL JUST SAY THAT A LOT OF 21 22 THAT REALLY IMPORTANT WORK WILL HAPPEN AS PART OF THE REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN, THAT ACTUALLY WILL BE KICKING OFF 23 THIS YEAR. WHAT WE HAVE SKETCHED OUT HERE IS KIND OF A 10,000 24 MILE NETWORK BUT IT WILL BE UP TO THAT PLANNING EFFORT TO 25



REALLY THINK ABOUT HOW AND WHERE, AND WHAT TYPES OF
 IMPROVEMENTS ARE MOST APPROPRIATE ACROSS THE REGION. I JUST
 WANT TO GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO THAT IMPORTANT PLANNING EFFORT.
 CLERK OF THE BOARD: LAST BUT NOT LEAST, BOB.

6

BOB GLOVER: THANK YOU. I APOLOGIES IF MY INTERNET CUTS OUT, 7 8 BETWEEN MY WIFE AND DAUGHTERS THERE'S NOT A LOT OF INTERNET TO GO AROUND. THE POLL BE CENT OUT I KNOW IT'S GOING OUT TO THE 9 COMMISSIONERS BUT THERE WERE A COUPLE OF THINGS OF NOTE THAT 10 WERE INTERESTING THERE BIGGEST ONE IS 89 PERCENT OF THE PEOPLE 11 POLLED KNEW NOTHING ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA AND EIGHT PERCENT 12 KNEW LITTLE ABOUT IT BASICALLY STATING THAT 98 PERCENT OF THE 13 PUBLIC OUT THERE KNOWS LITTLE OR NOTHING ABOUT ALL OF THE 14 15 STUFF WE'RE DISCUSSING HERE WHICH IS AN AREA TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT. SECOND THING, HAS TO DO DAVE WITH ATTACHMENT I, OF THE 16 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THE INTEGRATED AFFORDABLE HOUSING IE 17 INCLUSIONARY ZONING COMPONENT. I KNOW WE HAVE WRITTEN A LETTER 18 ARTICULATING OUR CONCERNS THAT POSSIBLY OVERSTATES THE BENEFIT 19 AND TAKES SOME OPPORTUNITIES OFF OF SOME OTHER ELEMENTS BUT 20 BASICALLY SAYING THAT 66, THE 330,000 UNITS ARE GOING TO BE 21 PRODUCED BY REQUIRING JURISDICTION WITH PDAS TO HAVE 10 TO 20 22 23 PERCENT INCLUSIONARY ZONING, THE CONCERN IS THAT MOST OF THOSE JURISDICTION ALREADY HAVE INCLUSIONARY ZONING AT 10 TO 20 24 PERCENT IT WOULD BE CURIOUS TO SEE WHAT THAT NUMBER IS AND IF 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THEY ALREADY HAVE THAT, HOW MUCH OF THE 66 OF THE 330 IS 1 2 ALREADY BEEN PRODUCED. QUESTION I HAVE TOO, IS THAT IT SAYS 3 THAT 20 PERCENT WOULD BE REQUIRED IN STRONG MARKETS ALTHOUGH IT DOESN'T REALLY DEFINE WHAT SAY STRONG MARKET ALTHOUGH IT 4 5 DOES OUTLINE 29 JURISDICTION THAT I BELIEVE AREN'T IN STRONG MARKETS BUT SAN FRANCISCO BEING ONE OF THOSE THAT THE TURNER 6 7 CENTER JUST DID A REPORT TALKING ABOUT THEIR 20 PERCENT 8 REQUIREMENT AND THE IMPACT THAT HAD ON A LOWERING OF PRODUCTION. JUST TO ARTICULATE THOSE CONCERNS AND WHAT THE 9 FEASIBILITY IS FOR SOME, A JURISDICTION THAT IS AT TEN OR 15 10 TO GOING AT 15 OR 20 AND THE IMPACT THAT HAS ON TOTAL NUMBERS 11 PRODUCED AND IMPACT ON OUR MEETING REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS AND 12 REACHING TO SAN BENITO AND SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY. I APPRECIATE 13 THE OPPORTUNITY. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS BOB I'LL TRY TO RESPOND 14 BRIEFLY A COUPLE OF THINGS TO KEEP IN MIND ONE WE'RE TRYING TO 15 16 UNDERSTAND A SUITE OF STRATEGIES TO TACKLE THESE BIG HOUSING CHALLENGES. THESE STRATEGIES ARE CONCEPTS IN A LONG RANGE 17 PLAN, THEY AREN'T SOMETHING OUT THERE WE'RE TRYING TO 18 19 IMPLEMENT TOMORROW. THEY'RE THINGS WE SEE AS PIECES OF THE PUZZLE ON THE FIRST POINT WE WORKED TO UPDATE ALL OF THE 20 BASELINE INCLUSIONARY ZONING IN THE REGION. THIS WAS AN AREA 21 22 THAT THE ORGANIZATION BROUGHT UP DURING THE HORIZON PROCESS 23 AND WE GOT BETTER DATA AND IMPLEMENTED THAT INTO THE BLUEPRINT PLANNING SO YES THAT MEANS THE INCLUSIONARY POLICY HERE WOULD 24 PRODUCE A SMALLER NUMBER OF UNITS BECAUSE THERE IS A HIGHER 25

BASELINE IN PLAY ALREADY BUT THE TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS 1 PRODUCED STILL KIND OF REFLECTS THE ADDITIVE EFFECTS OF EXIST 2 3 OTHER PLUS FUTURE POLICY ASSUMPTIONS. I THINK, YOU KNOW, MORE BROADLY, WE ARE TRYING TO BRING MONEY TO THE TABLE IN THE 4 5 PLANNING PROCESS TO HELP PRODUCE THIS AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO, YOU KNOW, THE INCLUSIONARY ZONING IS NOT DOING IT ALL ON ITS 6 OWN, THE EXPANDED STRATEGIES INCLUDE ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT A WIDE 7 8 VARIETY REGIONAL AND LOCAL FUNDING SOURCES THAT CAN HELP ENSURE UNITS ARE BROUGHT FORWARD IN COMMUNITIES ACROSS THE 9 REGION. SO I THINK THAT -- THAT'S JUST KIND OF THE OVERALL 10 RESPONSE WE SEE IN INCLUSIONARY. WE'RE SPECIFYING WHICH 11 JURISDICTION SHOULD HAVE A CERTAIN LEVEL JUST ENDORSING THE 12 IDEA THAT STRONGER MARKETS MIGHT BE APPROPRIATE FOR HIGHER 13 LEVELS OF INCLUSIONARY. 14

15

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

16 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH DAVE AND LESLIE. TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK. AND THERE IS A TERM I HAVE 17 LEARNED THAT THE MILITARY IS USING CALLED VUCA, LIKE SNAFU 18 STANDS FOR SOMETHING IT'S VOLATILITY UNDERSTANDING COMPLEXITY 19 AND AMBIGUITY THAT'S THE TIME WE'RE IN THE WE JUST HAVE TO DO 20 21 THE BEST WE CAN, AND AGAIN, KEEP LOOKING AT THE WHAT CHANGES AS WE GO FORWARD OR AS WE GET MORE CLARITY ON. I THINK THE 22 BIGGEST THING WE HAVE TO REMEMBER IS WHATEVER EXISTED BEFORE 23 IN THE PANDEMIC IN THIS RECISSION IS NOT THERE ANYMORE AND WE 24 HAVE A WHOLE NEW WORLD NOW THE NEW NORMAL THAT WE HAVE TO 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

UNDERSTAND AND TRY TO PLAN FOR. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. I 1 WAS IMPRESSED AT THE RESULTS OF THE ONLINE ENGAGEMENT LESLIE, 2 3 AND I HOPE WE CAN INCORPORATE THEM IF WE CAN EVER GET BACK TO MEETING IN PERSON THESE ONLINE THINGS SEEM TO BE SUCCESSFUL 4 5 AND WE SHOULD CONTINUE TO USE THEM AS TOOLS. TERRIFIC WORK BY STAFF TO FIGURE OUT NEW WAYS TO WORK WITH PEOPLE AND GET THEM 6 ENGAGED. I AM A LITTLE CONCERNED ABOUT THE FUNDING SOURCES IT 7 8 SEEMS TO ME THAT IF I WAS GOING TO PINPOINT ONE THING THAT WE SHOULD BE CONCERNED ABOUT IS THE EFFORT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO 9 DO TO MAKE THE FUNDING HAPPEN. I HOPE WE CAN CONTINUE TO LOOK 10 AT WAYS TO HELP WITH THE FUNDING AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO 11 HAVE TO GET CREATIVE IN FIGURING OUT NEW WAYS THAT REVENUE CAN 12 BE RAISED FOR THAT. ON THE TELECOMMUTING, IT SEEMS TO BE QUITE 13 APPARENT FROM WORKING WITH THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY THAT THEY 14 ARE VERY HAPPY WITH A LOT OF THEIR WORKERS WORKING FROM HOME. 15 16 THEIR WORKERS ARE HAPPY TO BE WORKING FROM HOME IT'S HELPED INCREASE THE AVAILABILITY FOR DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION BECAUSE 17 THEY CAN HIRE PEOPLE THAT DON'T LIVE NEARBY AND THEREFORE NOT 18 SHUTOUT BECAUSE OF COMMUTES AND COST OF HOUSING SO IT CAN HELP 19 US ACHIEVE OUR GOALS AND I AM EXCITED ABOUT THAT. I'M ALSO 20 SEEING A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE NO LONGER TAKING TRANSIT AND HAVE 21 GONE OUT AND BOUGHT CARS THERE'S A HUGE MARKET RIGHT NOW FOR 22 USED CARS WE MAY SEE A BIG CHANGER FROM TRANSIT USE TO CAR USE 23 AND THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO FIGURE INTO OUR PREDICTIONS. I AM 24 25 CONCERNED ABOUT SENIOR HOUSING. WE HAVE SUCH A HUGE AMOUNT OF

SENIORS NEEDING SENIOR HOUSING AND WE HAVE JUST SEEN THE 1 HORRORS FROM THIS PANDEMIC OF PEOPLE LIVING IN SENIOR HOUSING 2 3 AND SENIOR ASSISTED LIVING FACILITIES NURSING HOMES I HOPE WE CAN DO BETTER FOR OUR SENIORS AND I THINK IT SHOULD BE PART OF 4 5 THE PLAN AND I HAVE RAISED THIS ISSUE BEFORE AND I'M NOT SEEING IT BEING PICKED UP. SO I HOPE OTHERS SUPPORT THAT. AND 6 I ALSO WANT TO REALLY STRESS THAT HIGHWAY 37 SHOULD DEFINITELY 7 8 STILL BE KEPT. AND I KNOW THERE IS CONCERNS ABOUT IT BUT IT'S ALSO A LIFELINE FOR THE NORTH BAY IN CONNECTING US IF THERE 9 WAS A DISASTER SO WE NEED TO HAVE ALTERNATIVE MODES OF ABILITY 10 TO GET AROUND. NOW IT'S TIME TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENTS IF THERE 11 IS ANYONE OUT THERE WHO HAS SUBMITTED PUBLIC COMMENT OR NEEDS 12 TO SPEAK THEY NEED TO RAISE THEIR HAND USING THE RAISED HAND 13 FEATURE AND PARTICIPANTS YOU CAN USE THE STAR NINE IF YOU'RE 14 15 ON THE PHONE. MARCY DO WE HAVE ANYONE WISHING TO DO PUBLIC 16 COMMENT?

17

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES KEN BUKOWSKI. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE19 YOURSELF.

20

21 SPEAKER: I THINK A LOT OF THE ASPECTS OF THIS PLAN IS
22 UNREALISTIC THE FUTURE IS GOING TO BE DIFFERENT. I HAVE
23 CONCERNS. EVERY TIME YOU MOVE TRANSPORTATION IT HURTS THE
24 ECONOMY AND WE SHOULD MAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE. I AM CONCERNED
25 THE MONEY FROM EXPRESS LANES IS NOT DEDICATED TO MAKE PUBLIC

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

TRANSIT FREE AND I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE LACK OF EOUITY PEOPLE 1 HAVING TO APPLY FOR MEANS-BASED FARE I THINK IS UNREALISTIC. 2 3 AS ONE OF THE COMMISSIONERS SAID LOW INCOME PEOPLE JUST DON'T APPLY FOR THESE PROGRAMS THEN IT DOESN'T ADDRESS THE 4 5 UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS, THE BEST THING WE CAN DO FOR OURSELVES IS FOCUSING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE, THEN REDUCING 6 7 TRAFFIC CONGESTION. THANK YOU. 8 9 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: MARTHA ANYONE ELSE? 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO KEN WAS THE ONLY SPEAKER AND NO PUBLIC 11 COMMENT SUBMITTED. 12 13 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: RANDI KINMAN NOW? 14 15 16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I DON'T HAVE A RAISED HAND FEATURE ON MINE RIGHT NOW. I WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR A LOT 17 OF GOOD COMMENTS, THEY WALKED IN LATE TO, AND I WANT TO SAY 18 THAT I WILL TRADE YOU OFFICE PARKS FOR WORK FROM HOME HUBS. 19 HUBS WHERE THERE IS IT INFRASTRUCTURE, THE ABILITY FOR 20 21 DAYCARE, THE ABILITY FOR PEOPLE TO ACTUALLY DO THEIR JOBS. WE 22 SAW THIS A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO DURING THE FIRES WHEN WE HAD COMMUNITY COLLEGES CLOSED DOWN, AND HAD TO GO -- THEY DIDN'T 23 EVEN GO ONLINE, THEY JUST WENT OFFLINE COMPLETELY FOR WEEKS 24 WHICH WAS REALLY DISRUPTIVE. SO THE ABILITY TO HAVE THE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

BANDWIDTH THAT A LOT OF US DON'T HAVE WHEN WE HAVE MULTIPLE 1 2 PEOPLING WORKING FROM HOME AND KIDS OR EVEN THE QUIET ZONE AND 3 I THINK THOSE CAN BE COMBINED IN THE EXISTING PDAS WE HAVE NOW BECAUSE WE HAVE RETAIL SPACE THAT IS GOING EMPTY AND I THINK 4 5 THAT IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO KIND OF TWIST THAT SCENARIO AROUND AND IN THE CASE OF EMERGENCIES LIKE WE'RE UNDOUBTEDLY 6 GOING TO SEE SOMETHING THAT'S SETUP TO HANDLE A LOT OF 7 8 TRAFFIC. I DO WANT US TO KEEP AN EYE ON THE PDAS PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING BECAUSE I DON'T HAVE A GOOD HANDLE ON WHAT 9 THEY'RE PRODUCING. PDAS I'M FAMILIAR WITH, SIMPLY PLAY IN LIEU 10 FEES SO AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS NOT GOING ADJACENT OR NEAR 11 TRANSIT IT'S NOT GOING ANYWHERE NEAR WHERE SOMEBODY WHO NEEDS 12 TRANSIT IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET TO IT EASILY. IN OUR CASE, 13 WE JUST REMOVED TRANSIT FROM SOME AREAS, SO THERE IS THAT TOO. 14 15 BUT I THINK THAT THAT CAN ALSO PIGGY BAG ON TO SENIOR HOUSING. 16 WE HAVE A COMPLETE LACK OF AFFORDABLE SENIOR HOUSING IN ANY AREA. SO, I JUST WANT -- I WANT US TO SOMEHOW MONITOR THAT AND 17 GET, LIKE, YEARLY REPORTS, THIS MANY UNITS OR PROMISES THIS 18 MANY UNITS ARE SUPPOSED TO BE PIPE LINED, THIS MUCH MONEY WENT 19 INTO IT. WE'RE SPENDING TENS OF MILLION DOLLARS ON THE BIG 20 21 PROJECTS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING I'M NOT SEEING IT COME UP. 22 THAT'S A BIG PROBLEM FOR US. I WANT TO CIRCLE BACK TO THE IDEA OF PRODUCING CERTIFIED CHILD CARE PEOPLE AND THE COMMUNITY 23 COLLEGES WHO HAVE BEEN THE LEADERS IN THIS. WE NEED TO HAVE 24 FINANCING ARRANGED DIFFERENTLY BECAUSE OUR COMMUNITY COLLEGES 25

DEPEND ON THIS BEING A STUDENT CENTERED ACTIVITY IN THAT AS 1 2 PEOPLE ARE EARNING THEIR DEGREES AND THEIR CERTIFICATES, WE 3 HAVE TO HAVE ACTUAL SEATS IN -- WE HAVE TO ACTUALLY HAVE POSITIONS THAT ARE THERE AS STUDENTS, WHICH CUTS DOWN ON THE 4 5 AMOUNT OF PEOPLE THAT WE CAN USE, AND THE AMOUNT OF -- WE COULDN'T JUST SPEND MONEY ON IT. IT HAS TO BE -- THOSE 6 STUDENTS HAVE TO COME FROM SOMEWHERE. AND RIGHT NOW WE'RE ALL 7 8 KIND OF SCRAMBLING TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE WOULD PROVIDE THE BASICS ON ABOUT A THIRD OF THE FOOTPRINT THAT WE'RE CURRENTLY 9 USING. SO THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES THERE. WE HAVE PEOPLE WHO 10 ARE MORE THAN READY, WILLING, AND ABLE TO CONDUCT THE CLASSES 11 NEEDED TO PRODUCE THE CHILD CARE, OR THE SENIOR IN-HOME CARE, 12 OR ANY OF THOSE THINGS, BUT BECAUSE OF OUR CONSTRICTIONS ON 13 HOW MANY PEOPLE WE CAN PUT PER SQUARE FOOT IN A BUILDING WE 14 CAN'T OPEN UP THOSE COMPONENTS OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGES. IT'S 15 16 NOT COST EFFECTIVE. SO THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS ON THIS ISSUE. AND I THANK YOU. SO THAT WILL BE LAST CALL FOR COMMENTS. AND I 17 THINK I WILL TAKE OVER FROM HERE. 18

19

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

20 CYNTHIA L. MURRAY, VICE CHAIR: YES.

21

22 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THAT'S JUST HOW I AM. THANK YOU ALL, AND 23 THANK YOU TO STAFF. IF I'M READING MY NOTES CORRECTLY, WE HAVE 24 ONLY SKIPPED THE CHAIR'S REPORT AND I CAN POP BACK UP TO THAT. 25 IS THAT CORRECT MARTHA?



1

3

September 9, 2020

2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAT IS CORRECT.

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. GOING INTO MY CHAIR'S REPORT. ONE 4 5 OF THE INTERESTING THINGS ABOUT ATTENDING A LOT OF MEETINGS IS HEARING THINGS THAT ARE GOING ON THAT WE WOULDN'T NORMALLY 6 HEAR ABOUT. BATA, THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY HAD A REALLY 7 8 INTERESTING DISCUSSION LAST MONTH ABOUT HOW THEY ARE HANDLING THE REDUCTION OF THE TOLL BOOTHS AND THE TOLL TAKERS SINCE 9 10 THEY REMOVED THE PEOPLE FROM THE BOOTHS, BUT THIS'S LEADING US TO A SYSTEM WHERE YOU HAVE TO HAVE CALL CENTERS, AND YOU HAVE 11 TO HAVE PEOPLE MAILING NOTICES AND THINGS LIKE THAT. AND IT 12 WAS DURING THIS DISCUSSION THAT I FOUND OUT -- I'M SURE THAT 13 OTHERS KNEW -- THAT ONE OF OUR CALL CENTERS WAS ACTUALLY 14 15 LOCATED OUT OF STATE. SO I WAS REALLY PLEASED TO HEAR THE 16 COMMISSION SAY, YOU KNOW, WE GOT PEOPLE THAT DON'T WANT HAVE -- DON'T HAVE JOBS HERE IN OUR OWN AREA LET'S MOVER THEM BACK. 17 THAT MAY BE A CONVERSATION YOU MAY FOLLOW IN THE FUTURE. YOU 18 ARE GOING TO SEE IN YOUR STAFF LIAISON REPORT THE WORK PLAN WE 19 DEVELOPED IN THE PAST AND IT'S LAID OUT IN THE MANNER OF 20 21 WHAT'S COMING UP IN THE AGENDA OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS ALSO THE ISSUE WE HAD BROUGHT UP BEFORE OF THE INTERNSHIP PROGRAM 22 THAT USED TO OCCUR HERE. SO, STAFF IS GOING TO START WORKING 23 ON THAT AND THEY WOULD LIKE ONE OR TWO PEOPLE WHO HAVE AN 24 INTEREST IN THE PROJECT, WHO HAVE EXPERIENCE IN INTERNSHIP 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PROGRAMS PRIMARILY. BECAUSE THAT MAKES THE INPUT A LOT MORE 1 2 EFFECTIVE AND VALUABLE. AND WHO UNDERSTAND HOW THIS PROGRAM 3 WAS RUN. I KNOW THAT WE HAVE ONE PERSON WHO IS A FORMER INTERN IN OUR PROGRAM, SO I'M KIND OF HOPING SHE VOLUNTEERS. ANYBODY 4 5 WHO IS INTERESTED IN THAT PLEASE GET AHOLD OF MARTI. THE LAST THING -- WELL NO, THE NEXT TO THE LAST THING. I KNOW THAT 6 THERE IS AN EOUITY PROGRAM FOR MTC BEING DEVELOPED AND I 7 8 REALLY WANT TO EXPRESS MY HOPE THAT WE SEE THAT AS IT COMES FORWARD BEFORE IT GOES TO THE COMMISSION, BECAUSE IT SOUNDS 9 VERY EXCITING. I ASKED THAT STAFF SEND YOU THE PIECES OF PAPER 10 THAT ARE THE DRAFT METRICS IN DASHBOARD FOR WHAT'S COMING OUT 11 OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND WHAT'S COMING OUT OF THE 12 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS A SERIES OF -- IT'S A DASHBOARD THAT 13 SAYS THIS AGENCY IS DOING THIS, THIS AGENCY IS DOING THAT. 14 15 THERE ARE 23 AGENCIES, SO ALL THE AGENCIES ARE TALKING 16 TOGETHER, AND THEY'RE ALL PARTICIPATING, AND THE ISSUES THEY HAVE UP ARE PROVIDE AND WEAR MASKS, MASKS FOR DRIVERS AND IT 17 GOES ALL THE WAY UP TO PROVIDING HAND SANITIZER. I WOULD POINT 18 OUT THAT THE ONLY AGENCY THAT'S PROVIDING EVERYTHING ON THE 19 CHECKLIST IS ACE WHICH KIND OF CONCERNS ME AND IT'S RAISED 20 21 ISSUES ACROSS THE BOARD WITH PEOPLE BOTH ON AND OFF THE TASK FORCE IN THAT IT'S GREAT THAT -- AND I KNOW THAT THE BLUE 22 RIBBON TASK FORCE IS COMING UP NEXT ON THE AGENDA IT'S REALLY 23 GREAT THAT THE AGENCIES AND THE PROVIDERS ARE ALL TALKING TO 24 25 EACH OTHER IN A MANNER THEY HAVEN'T DONE IN THE PAST, THE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PROBLEM WE V HOWEVER, IS THEY'RE TALKING TO THEMSELVES. THEY 1 2 ARE SAYING THIS IS WHAT WE WILL DO, FOR INSTANCE, SAMTRANS 3 WILL PROVIDE MASKS AND WEAR MASKS, ALL EMPLOYEES ARE REQUIRED TO WEAR MASKS, THEY WILL REPOST THE REOUIREMENTS THEY WILL 4 5 ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO CARRY INDIVIDUAL SANITIZER THEY WILL PROVIDE SANITIZER AT STATIONS OR STOPS THERE IS INCONSISTENCY 6 BETWEEN ONE CARRIER AND ANOTHER AS TO WHAT THE BASELINE IS AND 7 8 THAT CREATES A PROBLEM BECAUSE WE ALL CROSS COMMUTE ON OUR TRANSIT LINES SO I DON'T EVER USE JUST -- THANK YOU. OH THERE 9 IT IS SO I DON'T EVER USE JUST ONE TRANSIT LINE. SO I DON'T 10 KNOW -- I WOULD HAVE TO LOOK LIKE AT MY MATRIX AND RUN THE 11 RISK -- AND THIS IS WHAT THE ADVOCATES AND THIS IS WHAT THE 12 UNION PEOPLE ARE COMPLAINING ABOUT, IS THAT THERE IS NO 13 CONSISTENCY HERE. AND THERE IS NO BASELINE HERE. IN LOOKING AT 14 15 THIS, I DON'T KNOW WHAT -- AND I TRULY APPRECIATE THE FACT 16 THAT WE ARE NOT MEDICAL PERSONNEL, THAT WE TO NOT HAVE THE EXPERTISE AND EPIDEMIOLOGY, BUT SOMEBODY OUT THERE HAS BOTTOM 17 LINE BASELINES THAT THEY HAVE BEEN USING AND BEING ABLE TO SEE 18 THAT PERHAPS ON THE DASHBOARD WOULD HELP US GET AROUND THE 19 ISSUE THAT -- AND THE CONCERN THAT PEOPLE HAVE RIGHT NOW. 20 21 BECAUSE THEY WANT -- I THINK IT WAS ADINA THAT SAID TO ME IN A CONVERSATION, SOMEBODY WANTS SOMEBODY TO BE IN CHARGE SOMEBODY 22 WANTS SOMEBODY TO HAVE THE BASELINE OF PROTOCOL HAVING A MAP 23 MATRIX LIKE THIS THAT SHOWS WHAT EACH PROVIDER IS PROVIDING OR 24 25 DOING IS GREAT, EXCEPT THAT IT DOESN'T TELL ME THAT WHEN

PROVIDER -- ONE PROVIDER DECREASES WHAT THEY DO, HOW THAT'S 1 GOING TO IMPACT THE PEOPLE WHO INTERACT WITH THE RIDERSHIP OF 2 3 ANOTHER PROVIDER. SO, THERE IS NO CONSISTENCY IN AGREEING TO A BOTTOM LINE. AND I FIND THAT THE WORDING AND SOME OF THE 4 5 DOCUMENTS IS A LITTLE SWISHY, TO SAY THE LEAST. BECAUSE IT SAYS THINGS LIKE "RIDERS MUST DO THINGS" AND THEN IT SAYS THE 6 PROVIDERS WILL DO THINGS WHEN THEY CAN. SO I JUST WANT TO 7 8 ADVISE YOU THAT THAT NEEDS TO BE TIGHTENED UP, AND THAT WILL BE AN ONGOING COORDINATION. BUT WHAT I'M REALLY PLEASED TO SEE 9 IS THIS MATRIX IS GOING TO BE UP, AVAILABLE FOR THE PUBLIC. SO 10 YOU KNOW WHAT PROVIDER IS DOING WHAT, AS FAR AS SOME BASIC 11 PROTOCOLS. IT DOES NOT TELL YOU, HOWEVER, WHAT KIND OF 12 CLEANING MATERIALS THEY'RE USING, HOW OFTEN THEY'RE CLEANING, 13 I -- AS SOMEBODY WHO LIVES NEXT TO A COUNTY HOSPITAL WHERE A 14 15 LOT OF SICK PEOPLE ARE IN AND OUT IT MAKES ME CONCERNED THAT A 16 BUS CAN GO ALL DAY WITHOUT BEING RECLEANED OR BEING SWITCHED OVER. SO THOSE ARE PEOPLE WHO ARE TRANSFERRING VIA DIRIDON 17 STATION TO ALL THE PROVIDERS IN THE REGION OR GOING ON APART 18 AND GOING SOME PLACE. SO WE ARE MAKING PROGRESS. I AM GLAD TO 19 SEE THAT THEY'RE TALKING TO EACH OTHER, HOWEVER I FEEL THERE 20 21 IS A LONG WAY TO GO AND THAT WILL BE COMING UP ON OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM. SO IS THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON MY 22 23 CHAIR'S REPORT? I CAN'T SEE THE BOARD. SO --

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS WITH THIS HANDS 1 RAISED AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. 2 3 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL GO INTO 4 5 AGENDA ITEM EIGHT BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE FOR COUNCIL INPUT AND I HAVE THERESA ROMELL. 6 7 8 THERESA ROMELL: THANK YOU. I AM DIRECTOR POLICY. I AM GOING TO BE PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY 9 TASK FORCES AND PROVIDE INPUT GOING FORWARD. TASK FORCE HAS 10 MET SEVERAL TIMES OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS AND IN JULY THEY 11 RECOMMENDED DISTRIBUTION FOR A SECOND PORTION OF CARES ACT 12 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND THAT WAS ONE EFFORT TASK 13 FORCE PRIMARY PURPOSES WAS FOR THE DISTRIBUTION EFFORT CARES 14 ACT FUNDING. THAT FUNDING WAS INTENDED TO SUPPORT OPERATIONS 15 16 THROUGH THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR HOWEVER THE ASSUMPTIONS USED TO FORM THE DISTRIBUTION FORMULA HAD THE ECONOMY 17 RECOVERING TO SOME DEGREE IN SEPTEMBER AND REVENUE STARTING TO 18 COME BACK TO A LEVEL STARTING IN SEPTEMBER WE WERE HOPING THE 19 SHELTER-IN-PLACE WOULD BE AT LEAST BEHIND US AT THIS POINT. 20 21 WHICH OBVIOUSLY HASN'T HAPPENED YET. SO IT REALLY REMAINS TO BE SEEN HOW FAR THE CARES FUNDING WILL LAST AND WHAT THE LEVEL 22 23 OF SERVICE ADJUSTMENTS THAT WILL BE NECESSARY IF AN ADDITIONAL FUNDING PACKAGE DOES NOT MATERIALIZE. TASK FORCE WAS ALSO VERY 24 INVOLVED IN PROVIDING INPUT INTO THE RIDING TOGETHER BAY AREA 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN THAT'S THE PLAN THAT RANDI WAS JUST 1 SPEAKING TO. IT'S A TRANSIT OPERATOR LED COLLABORATIVE PLAN 2 3 THAT WAS PUBLICLY RELEASED ON AUGUST 18th THE PLAN ESTABLISHES OPERATORS HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMITMENTS FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS 4 5 AND RIDERS AND IT'S SUPPOSED TO BE ADAPTABLE TO CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES CAUSED BY THE PANDEMIC MTC SUPPORTED A BAY AREA 6 WIDE PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS EFFORT THAT WAS LAUNCHED ALONGSIDE 7 8 THE PLAN'S RELEASE STARTING WITH A PRESS EVENT ON AUGUST 19TH. SO MOVING ON FROM THE HEALTH PLAN, AT THE MOST RECENT MEETING 9 10 IN JULY, THE TASK FORCE BEGAN WHAT'S REFERRED TO AS STAGE 11 THREE OF ITS WORK. AND STAGE THREE WILL ENTAIL A DEVELOPMENT OF A TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. THIS IS 12 THE SECOND PRIMARY FOCUS OF THE TASK FORCE. MEMBERS WEIGHED IN 13 AT THAT MEETING ON THEIR TOP THREE PRIORITY TOPICS THAT THEY 14 15 WOULD LIKE TO SEE ADDRESSED IN PLAN AND THERE WAS DISCUSSION 16 ON FOCUS OF THE TASK FORCE OVER THE COMING MONTHS NEXT WEEK ON SEPTEMBER 17TH THE TASK FORCE WILL CONTINUE TO MEET ON 17 DISCUSSION STAGE THREE WORK THERE WILL BE A PRESENTATION FROM 18 MTC STAFF AND TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT HIGHLIGHT CHALLENGES 19 FACING TRANSIT INCLUDING IMPORTANTLY THE CONTINUING AND 20 21 LOOMING FINANCIAL CRISIS RELATED TO THE PANDEMIC AS WELL AS 22 WHAT ACTIONS ARE CURRENTLY UNDERWAY AND POTENTIAL ACTIONS AND INITIATIVES THAT COULD BE EMPLOYED TO IMPROVE THE NETWORK AND 23 ITS PERFORMANCE. THIS PRESENTATION WILL BE FOLLOWED UP WITH A 24 25 PRESENTATION FROM SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND SPUR, TWO STAKEHOLDER

 METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

September 9, 2020

GROUPS WITH REPRESENTATION ON THE TASK FORCE AND LASTLY, THERE 1 WILL BE A PROPOSED ROADMAP PRESENTED TO GUIDE FUTURE MEETINGS 2 3 AND DISCUSSION ITEMS IN ORDER TO INFORM THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN AND OF COURSE, THE TASK FORCE WILL BE ASKED TO 4 5 WEIGH IN ON THAT ROADMAP. THE STAFF IS TAKING YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE PRIORITY TOPIC. A LIST OF THESE WAS INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT 6 A TO THIS ITEM PRIOR TO THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT TASK FORCE 7 8 MEETING SO WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK TO THE GROUP TO BEGIN 9 DISCUSSION. 10 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I HAVE ADINA LEVIN. WAIT. ADINA BEFORE 11 YOU START --12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RANDI, YOU MUTED YOURSELF. 14 15 16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: IS THERE ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC BEFORE WE START WITH COUNCIL. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND 19 RAISED AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. 20 21 22 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADINA YOU'RE UP. 23 SPEAKER: I WANTED TO THANK THE CHAIR FOR HER COMMENTS ABOUT 24 HER HEALTH AND SAFETY CONCERNS FOR THE TASK FORCE REGARDING 25

THE COLLABORATION, IT'S WELCOME BUT THERE IS I GAP BETWEEN 1 2 WHAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ACHIEVE BY WORKING 3 TOGETHER AND REALLY WHAT WAS BEING ASKED FOR BY TRANSIT RIDERS AND WORKERS AND ADVOCATES WHICH WAS TO HAVE A SINGLE POINT OF 4 5 ACCOUNTABILITY AND AS MUCH CONSISTENCY AS IS POSSIBLE AND THAT MAKES SENSE GIVEN THE PRIVACY OF THE HEALTH CONCERNS. AND THAT 6 WILL ALSO [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] -- TERM GOALS FOR THE REST OF 7 8 THE TIME THAT IT WORKS TOGETHER, AND BUT FIRST BEFORE GETTING SOME COMMENTS ABOUT THAT I WANT TO EXPRESS A LITTLE BIT OF A 9 10 CONCERN. BECAUSE THE EARLIER PART OF THIS MEETING, WHERE WE GOT A PRESENTATION IN ADVANCE FROM STAFF ABOUT WHAT IS COMING 11 FORWARD WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT AND WE WERE ABLE 12 TO SEE A [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE] AND THEN THOSE 13 COMMENTS ARE BEING DELIVERED TO THE BODY. IT'S GOT THE 14 PRESENTATION IN ADVANCE. LET'S SEE. I SEE THAT THAT -- IT 15 16 STOPPED THE VIDEO IS THAT BECAUSE MY NETWORK IS SO SHAKY THAT YOU CAN'T SEE THE VIDEO IS THAT THE PROBLEM? 17

18

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU'RE CORRECT.

20

21 SPEAKER: YES. SO, AND GIVEN THE FACT THAT FOR THE TASK FORCE, 22 THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME IMPORTANT PRESENTATIONS BY THE 23 IDEAS BEING PUT FORWARD BY BAY AREA AND SPUR AND WE'RE 24 SUPPOSED TO COMMENT ON WHAT THE TASK FORCE IS TALKING ABOUT 25 BUT WE'RE FOCUSSING ON THE PREVIOUS MEETING. SO I THINK THAT

IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE ARE EXPECTED TO BE PROVIDING -- TO GET 1 THE PRESENTATIONS THAT THEY ARE ABOUT TO GET AS OPPOSED TO THE 2 3 ONES THEY GOT LAST TIME. I WANT TO MAKE THAT A COMMENT. AND IN TERMS OF THE POTENTIAL GOING FORWARD ONE EFFORT THINGS THAT 4 5 HAD BEEN PROPOSED BY THE MTC COMMISSIONERS WHO CONVENED THE TASK FORCE IN TERMS OF TRANSIT RECOVERY WAS -- INSTITUTIONAL 6 AND A GOVERNANCE ISSUES AND OPPORTUNITIES IN TERMS OF WHAT IS 7 8 IT THAT'S REALLY GOING TO BE NEEDED TO WORK TOGETHER TO RECOVER PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN THE SEVERE IMPACTS OF COVID, 9 AND TO BE ABLE TO REACH SOME OF THE GOALS THAT WERE PRESENTED 10 -- PRESENTATION FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA. THERE IS A LOT OF 11 REALLY IMPORTANT GOALS IN TERMS OF HAVING A MORE COORDINATED 12 SYSTEM THAT WILL ALLOW FOR THE INCREASE IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP 13 THAT WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR CLIMATE AND EQUITY 14 15 GOALS. AND THE TYPE OF ARRANGEMENT THAT WE SAW WITH THE HEALTH 16 AND SAFETY WHERE TRANSIT AGENCIES WERE WORKING TOGETHER BUT COULDN'T QUITE GET TO ONE SINGLE APPROACH IS GOING TO GET IN 17 THE WAY OF TRANSIT RECOVERY AND IS GOING TO GET IN THE WAY OF 18 BEING ABLE TO ACHIEVE THOSE -- THIS -- POTENTIALLY SOMETHING 19 THAT WHILE THERE IS THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, MTC TRANSIT ADVOCACY 20 21 GROUPS, LOOKING FORWARD TO MAKE PROGRESS ON AND THAT IS MY COMMENT ALTHOUGH I FEEL A LITTLE BIT STYMIED BECAUSE WE DON'T 22 HAVE THE ABILITY TO COMMENT ON WHAT WOULD BE BEFORE THE TASK 23 FORCE. THANK YOU. 24

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THERESA ROMELL: I FEEL YOUR FRUSTRATION ABOUT NOT HAVING THE 1 MATERIALS IN ADVANCE OF THIS GROUP PRIOR TO THE TASK FORCE 2 3 MEETING. I THINK THAT HAS BEEN A CHANGE FOR US BECAUSE THERE ARE A LOT OF DIFFERENT PEOPLE PROVIDING INFORMATION. WE'RE 4 5 DOING A JOINT POWERPOINT WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS. TRANSIT OPERATORS RIGHT NOW ARE WORRIED ABOUT SURVIVAL. YOU KNOW, THEY 6 ARE WORKING AS HARD AS THEY CAN TO MAKE SURE THAT THEIR 7 8 SYSTEMS DO NOT GO UNDER SO THIS WORK REALLY IS A COLLABORATIVE EFFORT AND REALLY TO GET THE TYPE OF MATERIAL, THE OUALITY OF 9 10 MATERIALS THAT WE WANT TO PRESENT TO THE TASK FORCE, IT TAKES A LONG TIME. WE PUTTING AS MUCH EFFORT AND RESOURCES INTO IT 11 AS POSSIBLE. IN FACT THERE ARE TRANSIT OPERATORS, I'M LATE 12 FAIR MEETING AT 3:30 TO HELP FINALIZE THAT PRESENTATION SO WE 13 CAN GET IT POSTED AND OUT TO THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS, IN AS 14 15 MUCH TIME AS POSSIBLE, FOR THEM TO REVIEW T SO I UNDERSTAND 16 YOUR FRUSTRATION. I WISH WE COULD GET THE MATERIALS OUT A BIT EARLIER BUT EVERY SINGLE ONE OF THESE MEETINGS IS A HUGE LIFT 17 AND WE'RE WORKING HARD TO GET ALL OF THAT INFORMATION TO YOU. 18 THE LUCKY PART IS THAT YOU DO HAVE, AS A COUNCIL GROUP, 19 REPRESENTATION ON THE TASK FORCE. SO, YOU ARE GOING TO BE 20 21 GETTING A FIRSTHAND OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT AT THE TASK FORCE 22 MEETINGS AS WELL.

23

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THERESA, BEFORE I BRING WENDI BACK IN,
25 NUMBER ONE, I AM THE REPRESENTATION, SO IF I'M NOT TALKING TO

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

MY COUNCIL ABOUT THESE ISSUES, BEFORE THE MEETING, THEY'RE 1 ENTRUSTING ME WITH A LOT, AND I THINK THAT THEY KNOW THAT I'M 2 GOING TO STAND UP FOR A LOT. BUT, I DON'T THINK THAT THAT'S --3 I DON'T THINK IT'S ADEQUATE, SO I -- I JUST NEED TO VENT THAT 4 5 FRUSTRATION THAT I FEEL I HAVE THE TECHNICAL, MORAL, AND EXPERIENCE BEHIND ME, ALL OF THAT COMBINED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT 6 WE WOULD SAY GOING FORWARD, HOWEVER, I -- THAT'S NOT MY JOB. 7 8 SO I WANT TO BE REALLY CLEAR ON THAT, THAT THAT'S NOT MY JOB. YES IT'S MY JOB TO SPEAK FOR THEM AND IF I HAVE TO SPEAK FOR 9 10 THEM WITHOUT TALKING TO THEM I WILL, BUT IT'S IMPORTANT FOR EVERYONE TO GET THE INFORMATION AND IF THE TRANSIT PROVIDERS 11 ARE SO CONCERNED ABOUT SURVIVAL, THAT THE CURRENT DYNAMICS 12 THAT WE HAVE WHERE DISCUSSION TAKES PLACE AT THE TASK FORCE 13 BUT THE TRANSIT PROVIDERS GO OFF IN A DIRECTION AND THEY DO 14 15 THEIR THING, AND THEN THEY BRING BACK WHAT THEY DO TO US, AND 16 THE ADVOCATES, AND THE DRIVERS, AND THE UNIONS, THEY'RE NOT 17 PART OF THAT CONVERSATION, IT CREATES AN AURA OF DISTRUST. BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT PART OF THE OF ONGOING SHARING OF IDEAS. 18 SO, I UNDERSTAND THAT. BUT THIS IS GOING TO BE -- THIS IS 19 GOING TO NEGATE THE POSITIVE STUFF THAT HAPPENS WHEN YOU HAVE 20 21 THE TRANSIT PROVIDERS, YOU HAVE THE WORKER BEES, AND YOU HAVE THE RIDERSHIP AND ONLY ONE OF THOSE GROUPS IS ACTUALLY MEETING 22 AND HAVING A CONVERSATION. REST OF US, THE OTHER TWO THIRDS OF 23 THE GROUP THAT ARE SUPPOSED TO BE WORKING TOGETHER ARE NOT 24 PART OF THAT DISCUSSION. SO, JUST SO YOU KNOW, AND YOU CAN 25



TAKE THAT BACK WITH YOU TO -- THIS'S WHERE THE FRUSTRATION IS
 COMING FROM.

3

THERESA ROMELL: IN MY EXPERIENCE IN SEETHE HOW THE MEETINGS 4 5 HAVE PROGRESSED IN THE TASK FORCE I BELIEVE THERE IS CONTINUITY BETWEEN ONE MEETING AND THE NEXT WHERE THINGS ARE 6 NOT DECIDED IN ONE MEETING AND THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO GO BACK 7 8 TO THE VARIOUS GROUPS AND DISCUSS AND PROVIDE INPUT AND I THINK WE'LL SEE THAT GOING FURTHER AS I MENTIONED THERE WILL 9 BE A PROPOSAL OF KIND OF LIKE A ROADMAP OF DISCUSSION TOPICS 10 FOR THE COMING MEETINGS, AND I THINK THAT THAT ROADMAP ALSO 11 PRESENTS SOME SORT OF UPON CONTINUITY AND IT'S NOT WHERE 12 THINGS ARE DECIDED IN A PARTICULAR MONTH THERE MORE OR LESS 13 TWO MONTHS WHERE PEOPLE ARE TALKING ABOUT CERTAIN TOPICS AND 14 GIVING PEOPLE A CHANCE TO WEIGH IN AND PROVIDE INPUT INTO THAT 15 16 PROCESS. WE WANT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ITSELF TO BE ABLE TO WEIGH INTO THAT ROADMAP AND TAYLOR THE WAY THEY WANT TO SEE 17 IT SHAPE UP. JUST FROM MY EXPERIENCE, THE HEALTH PLAN WASN'T A 18 ONE MEETING ISSUE. IT WAS A MULTIPLE MEETING ISSUE AND THAT'S 19 EVEN CONTINUED ON TO OUR COMMISSION MEETING WHERE IS THERE IS 20 A REPORT ABOUT THE HEALTH PLAN ON A STANDING BASIS. SO I WANT 21 TO ADD THAT AS A BIT A HOPEFUL COMFORT FACTOR THAT THESE 22 23 AREN'T ONE -- THESE AREN'T ONE DECISION POINTS THAT ARE HAPPENING AT THE TASK FORCE MEETINGS. 24



2

September 9, 2020

1 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. WENDI?

3 WENDI KALLINS: YEAH. THANKS. SO, I THINK THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S BEEN BROUGHT UP THAT SEEMS TO BE THE CORE -- ONE 4 5 OF THE CORE ISSUES, IS THAT MTC IS CONVENING THIS TASK FORCE AND, YOU KNOW, HELPING TO FACILITATE THE TASK FORCE BUT REALLY 6 HAS NO POWER TO IMPLEMENT THE DECISIONS THAT ARE MADE BY THE 7 8 TASK FORCE. AND I THINK THAT IT WAS EVEN REINFORCED BY THE TASK FORCE CHAIR'S RESPONSE TO THE LETTER THAT WAS SENT IN BY 9 THE UNIONS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS IS THAT MTC DOES NOT HAVE 10 THE POWER AND THIS GOES TO, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE'RE LOOKING 11 TOWARDS THE FUTURE IF WE REALLY WANT AN INTEGRATED SYSTEM THIS 12 REALLY DOES NEED TO BE AN AGENCY THAT DOES COORDINATING AND 13 WHEN DECISIONS ARE MADE THAT THEY'RE IMPLEMENTED ACROSS THE 14 15 BOARD. SO I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE BIG PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE 16 DEALING WITH HERE. I DON'T NECESSARILY AGREE WITH ALL OF THE 17 CRITICISM THAT CAME IN THAT LETTER, FOR INSTANCE, YOU KNOW, THE THREE-FOOT VERSUS THE SIX FOOT. I UNDERSTAND -- YOU KNOW, 18 THE STUDIES ARE LOOKING AT WHAT'S GOING ON IN OTHER COUNTRIES 19 AND IT'S -- HAS BEEN SEEN THAT THREE-FOOT SEEMS TO BE ADEOUATE 20 21 AND WHEN YOU'RE LOOKING AT TRYING TO CREATE A SYSTEM THAT ACTUALLY FUNCTIONS, NINE PEOPLE ON A HUGE 40 PASSENGER BUS 22 DOESN'T CUT IT. OPERATORS CANNOT OPERATE AND CANNOT CONTINUE 23 TO SURVIVE IF THAT CONTINUES. AND I'M SOMEONE WHO IS, YOU 24 25 KNOW, BEEN QUITE CAREFUL ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WEARING MY MASK AND

DOING SOCIAL DISTANCING, AND RAILING AT PEOPLE WHO DON'T. SO, 1 BUT I DO BELIEVE THAT IT'S BEEN SHOWN AGAIN AND AGAIN THAT 2 3 PUBLIC TRANSIT IS NOT REALLY A SPREADER OF COVID. AND SO WHATEVER CAN BE DONE TO HELP BING BACK PUBLIC TRANSIT SO THAT 4 5 IT'S ACTUALLY FUNCTIONAL, I WANT TO SUPPORT, PERSONALLY. THERE IS ALSO THE ISSUE WITH CLEANING. AND THAT'S ANOTHER 6 CONTROVERSIAL ISSUE WHERE IT'S AGAIN SHOWN THAT CLEAN SUGGEST 7 8 ACTUALLY -- THE CONSTANT CLEANING IS NOT NECESSARILY THE WAY THAT THE DISEASES -- THE DISEASE IS NOT NECESSARILY SPREAD ON 9 10 SURFACES, IT CAN BE, BUT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE DEALING WITH A SITUATION WHERE THERE IS A LOT WE DON'T KNOW, AND WE'RE TRYING 11 TO GET A PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT FUNCTIONS, AND ONE WAY TO 12 SERVE THE RIDER IS NOT TO HAVE BUS AFTER BUS GO BY AND PEOPLE 13 CAN'T GET ON BECAUSE THEY HAVE THEIR NINE PASSENGERS. OR 14 MAKING THEM -- YOU KNOW, HAVING A CONSTANT CLEANING OPERATION 15 16 ALL DAY LONG. SO, I THINK THAT THERE ARE WAYS IN WHICH, I 17 THINK THE BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS ARE FAIR, BUT THE PROBLEM IS, I GET BACK TO MY ORIGINAL POINT, IS IT'S NOT BEING 18 IMPLEMENTED UNIVERSALLY, AND THEREIN LIES THE TROUBLE. AND I 19 ALSO WANT TO AGREE WITH RANDI DO YOU DO HAVE BASICALLY A TASK 20 21 FORCE THAT'S ESSENTIALLY THE OPERATORS WITHOUT THE RIDERS AND THE OPERATORS -- I MEAN THE EMPLOYEES REALLY BEING PROPERLY 22 REPRESENTED ON THE COMMISSION. SO, I AGREE THAT THAT'S A 23 PROBLEM. 24

25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ARE THERE OTHER COMMENTS? 1 COULD WE PUT UP THE PAGE ONE OF THE DISCUSSION PRIORITY 2 3 TOPICS, PLEASE? THANK YOU. THIS IS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE NEED TO PROVIDE INPUT ON. IN THERE IS ANYTHING MISSING FROM 4 5 HERE OR ANYTHING YOU FEEL STRONGLY SHOULD BE HIGHLIGHTED OR TAKEN OFTEN, I WOULD APPRECIATE PEOPLE RAISING THEIR HAND OR 6 LETTING ME KNOW. AND SINCE I CAN'T SEE THE BOARD AGAIN. 7 8 NOTHING. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO MEMBERS ARE RAISING THEIR HAND. USING 10 THE VIRTUAL FEATURE OR WAVING THEIR HANDS IN FRONT OF THEIR 11 12 CAMERA. 13 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THESE ARE THE TOPICS THAT ARE MOVING 14 15 FORWARD. COULD WE LOOK AT THE SECOND PAGE TO LOOK AT TO 16 CONTEMPLATE. THIS IS ANOTHER ISSUE I HAVE. I CAN SEE THAT TWO PEOPLE HAVE RAISED THEIR HANDS. THERE WE GO. VEDA. 17 18 VEDA FLOREZ: HI. I'M INTERESTED IN COMMENTING ON THE LAST 19 SLIDE. YOU HAD EOUITY ISSUES, OR EOUITY POLICIES. EOUITY 20 21 POLICIES. COULD YOU EXPAND ON WHAT THAT MEANS? IS THAT EQUITY 22 OVERLAY OWE JUST REVIEWING THE POLICIES THAT ARE IN PLACE? 23 SPEAKER: I THINK ALL OF THE ABOVE AS WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING, 24 AND THE FEEDBACK FROM THE LAST TASK FORCE MEETING EQUITY 25

REALLY APPLIES TO ALL OF THESE ACTIONS IN ONE WAY OR ANOTHER 1 IT'S NOT JUST IN ITSELF A SEPARATE PRIORITY BUT IS KIND OF AN 2 3 OVERLAY ON TO ALL OF THE ACTIONS THAT WE WOULD CONTEMPLATE WITH THE TASK FORCE. SO I THINK WITH THE -- WHILE WE'RE 4 5 INTERESTED IN SPECIFIC EOUITY POLICIES THAT CAN BE BROUGHT TO BAY AREA TO IMPROVE EQUITY, I THINK WE UNDERSTAND THAT EQUITY 6 IS SOMETHING THAT IS INTERLACED THROUGHOUT ALL OF THE 7 8 PRIORITIES. 9 VEDA FLOREZ: I THINK THAT'S GREAT THERESA, AS A PRIORITY BUT 10 WHEN YOU HAVE IT LISTED AS EQUITY POLICIES RATHER THAN EQUITY 11 OVERLAY OR DEI POLICY OVERVIEW, EACH OF THESE SHOULD BE VIEWED 12 FROM THE EQUITY LENS AND I THINK WE SHOULD REFLECT THAT. 13 14 EQUITY POLICIES DOESN'T RELAY THAT. 15 16 SPEAKER: I AGREE AND WE DID GET FEEDBACK ON THIS SLIDE IN PARTICULAR THAT IT WAS A BRAINSTORM OF DIFFERENT THINGS KIND 17 OF THROWN UP THERE, AND I THINK WE HAVE WORKED A LITTLE BIT TO 18 KIND OF, YOU KNOW, BETTER ORGANIZE THIS LIST AND HOPEFULLY BE 19 ABLE TO PROVIDE SOMETHING AT NEXT WEEKS'S MEETING THAT IS A 20 21 LITTLE BIT EASIER TO SPEAK TO.

22

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

23 VEDA FLOREZ: GREAT AND I THINK YOU COULD ADD EQUITY POLICY
24 OVERLAY OR EQUITY POLICY REVIEW TO KEEP IT PRECISE AND STILL
25 MOVE FORWARD THE MESSAGE. THANK YOU.



1 2 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ADINA. 3 SPEAKER: YEAH. SO THAT PREVIOUS SLIDE, WITH ALL OF THOSE 4 5 THINGS, THAT IS REALLY QUITE A LAUNDRY LIST, AND I THINK THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY WITH THIS UNPRECEDENTED SET OF PEOPLE AROUND 6 THE SAME VIRTUAL ABLE TO WORK TOGETHER ON DEALING WITH, LIKE, 7 8 ONE, MAYBE THE DEPTH OF THE CHALLENGE WITH COVID AND WHAT THE DIFFERENT SCENARIOS MIGHT BE COMING FROM THE REGION AND 9 10 THEREFORE WHAT THE RECOVERY STRATEGIES MIGHT BE. AND, LIKE THAT'S A HIGH LEVEL THING THAN LOOKING AT MAPPING. I THINK 11 TAKING THIS WHOLE BIG MULTI-STAKEHOLDER GROUP AND WORKING ON 12 WAYFINDING SEEMS LIKE FAR TOO NARROW A THING AND LOOKING AT 13 THE BROADER QUESTION OF HOW CAN THE SYSTEM BE SERVING RIDERS 14 15 DURING THIS DIFFICULT TIME INCLUDING EQUITY, SERVING PEOPLE 16 WHO ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND NEED TO BE TRAVELING, INCLUDING MAKING IT AFFORDABLE IN THE DEPTH OF A RECESSION AND THEN 17 DEALING WITH THE GOVERNANCE AND FUNDING ISSUES THIS TOGETHER 18 CAN EITHER HELP OR HINDER THE RESPONSE TO COVID. SO, ONE, LIKE 19 IT'S GREAT THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN WORK TOGETHER ON A --20 [INDISCERNIBLE] BUT THEN IF WE SAY, WELL, THIS IS A PIECE OF 21 THE SYSTEM THAT, YOU KNOW, IS NEEDED BYE LOW INCOME AND 22 TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE BUT BECAUSE AGENCY A DOESN'T HAPPEN 23 TO HAVE FUNDING BECAUSE THEY'RE WEAKER THAN AGENCY B, THERE IS 24 NOTHING WE CAN DO ABOUT IT BECAUSE EACH TRANSIT AGENCY IS 25

September 9, 2020

SEPARATE AND THERE IS NO WAY OF PRIORITIZING THE NEEDS OF 1 RIDERS IN OUR FRAGMENTED SYSTEM. SO I THINK THAT'S AN 2 3 OPPORTUNITY TO TAKE ON THOSE ISSUES TO FACE THE CRISIS TOGETHER AND TO LOOK AT UNPRECEDENTED WAYS -- SHARED 4 5 OPPORTUNITIES AND SHARED ACCOUNTABILITY TO SOLVE THESE PROBLEMS TOGETHER. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES. 9 RICHARD HEDGES: YES I WANT TO BRING UP MOBILITY TECHNOLOGY AND 10 BRING UP THE CLIPPER CARD. TASK CARD IS NOW AVAILABLE FOR USE 11 ON CERTAIN ANDROIDS AND ON THE APPLE iPhone. I KNOW WE'RE 12 MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION AND I HOPE WE HEAR THAT UP. MY OTHER 13 QUESTION IS IF WE'RE CHARGING FOR CLIPPER CARDS AND RIGHT NOW 14 15 WE SHOULD STOP IT, THERE SHOULDN'T BE A JUST TO GET THE CARD 16 WE WANT TO USE THAT SO THEY'RE NOT HANDLING THE MONEY AND FORCING THE HANDLING OF MONEY AND SOME TRANSIT AGENCIES AREN'T 17 TAKING MONEY NOW WE NEED TO MAKE IT AS EASY AS POSSIBLE FOR 18 PEOPLE TO GET CLIPPER CARDS. THANK YOU. 19 20 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MICHAEL LOPEZ. 21 22 23 SPEAKER: YES. I WAS LOOKING AT THE LIST. I LOOKED AT IT THE OTHER NIGHT AND I THREE THAT I PICKED WERE THE EQUITY POLICIES 24



AND THE TRANSIT AND FUNDING AND THE PARATRANSIT TO ME SEEMS 1 2 THAT, IS THAT ADDRESSING THE ELDERLY? 3 SPEAKER: YES. 4 5 MICHAEL LOPEZ: THOSE ARE THE THREE FROM THE LIST THEY CHOSE AS 6 7 THE PRIORITY. 8 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I'M WONDERING IF WE ATTENDANT PUT SOME OF 9 10 THE CONVERSATION INTO EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. LOOKING AT THIS GOING ON FOR THE NEXT TWO YEARS, WE HAVE THE IMMEDIATE 11 HOW DO WE DEAL WITH THINGS BUT I WAS KIND OF CONCERNED WITH 12 THE LACK OF COORDINATION BETWEEN THE EQUITY AND THE 13 PARATRANSIT, AND THE NUMBER OF OTHER UMBRELLAS AS IT CAME UP 14 15 THROUGH THE CONVERSATIONS. SO COULD WE ACTUALLY PUSH SOME OF 16 THAT THROUGH OUR EXISTING EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, SAY 17 THIS SPRING, AND THERE IS ONLY ONE REPRESENTATIVE, I BELIEVE, IN THE DISABLED COMMUNITY ON THE TASK FORCE. SO THAT WOULD BE 18 AN OPPORTUNITY TO BRING TOGETHER. 19 20

21 SPEAKER: ARE YOU SPEAKING ABOUT SPECIFIC YOU ISSUES TO BE 22 DISCUSSED AT THAT MEETING. I THINK THAT'S DEFINITELY A 23 POSSIBILITY AND I WANT TO MENTION THAT MAYBE WE ARE GETTING 24 THE UPDATE OF THE COORDINATED PLAN AS WELL. SHORTLY, SO THAT 25 MIGHT -- AND I -- WE HOPE THAT THERE ARE SOME OPPORTUNITIES

September 9, 2020

FOR LINKAGES BETWEEN THAT WORK AND THE TASK FORCE AS WELL. SO

2 I THINK THOSE ARE BOTH -- OR TWO ISSUES THAT MIGHT BE GOOD
3 CANDIDATES FOR THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE.
4
5 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OKAY. THANK YOU. I SEE VEDA HAS HER HANDS

- 6 UP AGAIN. VEDA.
- 7

1

8 VEDA FLOREZ: THANK YOU FOR INDULGING ME SECOND TIME AROUND. JUST FOR EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE TO FOCUS ON IS A 9 LITTLE MISGUIDED. IN MY OPINION I WOULD LIKE TO SEE EOUITY 10 ISSUES TAKEN OFF OF THIS AND AROUND AN ASTERISK AND INDICATED 11 TO THE COMMUNITY THAT WE WILL LOOK AT EACH OF THESE WITH AN 12 OVERLAY OF OUR EQUITY GOALS AND THAT BEING SAID, I WOULD ALSO 13 LIKE THE PARATRANSIT BULLET POINT TO BE PARATRANSIT FOR SENIOR 14 15 MOBILITY AND THOSE WITH DISABILITIES JUST SO PEOPLE 16 UNDERSTAND, SO I THINK LANGUAGE DOES MATTER.

17

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I'M NOT PROPOSING THAT WE TAKE AWAY THE 18 EQUITY OVERLAY ON ANYTHING. WHAT I'M PROPOSING IS THAT WE DO A 19 DEEPER MORE THOROUGH DIVE INTO THE VERY ITEMS THAT COME UNDER 20 21 THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE SO THAT WE HAVE A RICHEN 22 INPUT OF INFORMATION FROM PEOPLE WHO ARE DIRECTLY IMPACTED BY PARATRANSIT OR BY OTHER EOUITY ISSUES IN ACCESSING -- IT'S A 23 WAY TO START THAT CONVERSATION WHILE THE -- WHILE ANOTHER 24 CONVERSATION IS TAKING PLACE. AND IT'S A WAY TO INFORM THE 25

September 9, 2020

LARGER CONVERSATION. SO, WE CAN TALK ABOUT THAT AT OUR AGENDA
 PLANNING. WITH THAT, I HAVE RICH HEDGES WITH YOUR HAND UP
 AGAIN. GO AHEAD RICH.

4

5 RICHARD HEDGES: I JUST WANT TO RESPOND ON THE PARATRANSIT. I REALLY LOOKED AT WHAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS WERE ON PARA 6 TRANSIT, AND I THOUGHT THEY EXCEEDED, BY SOMEWHAT THE REST OF 7 8 THE PUBLIC TRANSIT'S SPHERE, AND I THOUGHT IT WAS PRETTY GOOD. I ATTEND THE PCC MEETINGS IF OUR COUNTY FOR THE FARE TRANSIT 9 COORDINATING COMMITTEE AND I THINK THAT PRETTY WELL FITS THEIR 10 BILL TOO. NOW THEY HAVEN'T HAD MEETINGS IN THE LAST COUPLE OF 11 MONTHS, BUT I THINK THEY'RE -- I THINK THEY HAVE HIT A GOOD 12 NOTE ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PARATRANSIT. SOME MAY DISAGREE 13 WITH ME, BUT I THINK IT'S FINE. 14

15

16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COUNCIL17 MEMBERS? I SEE ATTENDING HANDS RAISED. MARTHA?

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER, KEN BUKOWSKI,
20 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

SPEAKER: YEAH, HI. I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE FUNDING. I THINK FUNDING SOURCES YOU REALLY GOT TO TAKE A LOOK AT IT LOCAL JURISDICTION ARE GOING TO BE STRAPPED FOR MONEY AND ARE GOING TO LOOK TO RAISE TAXES FOR LOCAL SERVICES AND THERE IS

September 9, 2020

REQUIREMENTS TO GET A MEANS-BASED FARE THOSE ALMOST HAVE TO BE
 ELIMINATED EVERYBODY HAS TO HAVE THE ABILITY TO GET TO WHERE
 THEY NEED TO GO. AND THE MONEY SHOULD BE USED TO MAKE TRANSIT
 AFFORDABLE AND THAT WAS SUPPOSED TO BE A PROMISE THAT WAS MADE
 IN THE VERY BEGINNING AND THEY'RE NOT CARRYING THROUGH WITH
 IT. THANK YOU.

7

8 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MARTHA DO YOU HAVE ANY MORE
9 RAISED HANDS, OR PEOPLE IF THERE IS ANYBODY ELSE IN THE PUBLIC
10 THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK.

11

12 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS EFFORT PUBLIC13 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

14

15 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU THERESA WE'RE GOING TO LET YOU 16 GET TO YOUR MEETING ONLY A HALF AN HOUR LATE. THANK YOU VERY 17 MUCH. WE'LL BE MOVING NOW INTO ITEM NUMBER NINE, STAFF LIAISON 18 REPORT.

19

20 MARTI PASCHAL: I DO NOT HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD TO MY REPORT. BUT
21 I HAVE E-MAILED THE COUNCIL AND STAFF THE NEW YORK TIMES
22 ARTICLE THAT RAHMON SHARED AND AFTER TODAY'S MEETING I WILL
23 SHARE INFORMATION ABOUT THE EVENT WITH COMMENTS REFERENCED
24 LATER.

September 9, 2020

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS ITEM TEN
 MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL REPORT ON LOCAL OR RELATIVE ISSUES OR
 EVENTS. I SEE WENDI'S HAND UP. GO AHEAD WENDI.

4

5 WENDI KALLINS: I WANT TO GIVE DETAILS ON THE EVENT IT'S GOING TO BE SEPTEMBER 17TH COSPONSORED AT 4:00 P.M. COSPONSORED BY 6 350 BAY AREA 350 SILICON VALLEY, YOU WILL GET THE EVITE 7 8 INFORMATION THE SPEAKERS ARE GOING TO BE KATE LISTER, GLOBAL WORKS ANALYTICS, AND CINDY CHAVEZ, VICE CHAIR OF THE BAY AREA 9 10 AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT AND CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND KARL GARDINO WHO IS 11 FORMER PRESIDENT AND CEO OF SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP. 12 IT SHOULD BE A ROBUST CONVERSATION WE'RE GOING TO BE FOCUSING 13 14 ON TELEWORKING AS IT RELATES TO THE ENVIRONMENT. THANK YOU.

15

16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES THEN ADINA.

17

18 RICHARD HEDGES: JUST A COMMENT. I TRIED READING THE NEW YORK 19 TIMES ARTICLE THAT LET ME COMMENT THAT WHEN I DO A NEWSPAPER 20 ARTICLE I CUT AND PASTE IT IN THE BODY OF THE E-MAIL BECAUSE 21 IF YOU DON'T SUBSCRIBE TO THE PAPER YOU GET 15 SECONDS TO READ 22 IT THEN YOU GET A SUBSCRIBE. IN THE FUTURE IF EVERYBODY WANTS 23 TO READ THE ARTICLE YOU NEED TO FIND OUT IF THEY SUBSCRIBE OR 24 CUT AND PASTE IT IN THE E-MAIL. THANK YOU.



RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU RICH. ADINA? 1 2 3 SPEAKER: OKAY. SO, I WANTED TO SHARE THAT THERE IS A REALLY INTERESTING PRESENTATION COMING UP AT LUNCHTIME AT SPUR 4 5 TOMORROW, THEY'RE PUTTING ON IN ZOOM, THERE IS A RESEARCH GROUP CALLED TRANSPORTATION CHOICES THAT DID SOME RESEARCH ON 6 BEST PRACTICES FROM METROPOLITAN AREAS AROUND THE WORLD THAT 7 8 HAVE HIGH RIDERSHIP PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AND WHAT IS IT THAT THEY DO AND WHAT MIGHT WE BE ABLE TO LEARN FROM. AND 9 THAT HAS SOME REALLY INTERESTING MATERIAL THAT I THINK PEOPLE 10 HERE WOULD FIND RELEVANT, AND SO I RECOMMEND CHECKING OUT 11 TOMORROW'S LUNCHTIME FORUM AT SPUR, AND I CAN SEND THE LINK TO 12 13 STAFF. 14 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. VEDA? GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE 15 16 VEDA. 17 VEDA FLOREZ: I GOT THE WHEEL. SORRY ABOUT THAT. [AUDIO 18 DIFFICULTIES] 19 20 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OOPS. 21 22 23 VEDA FLOREZ: -- LOCAL MEASURES ALTHOUGH THERE ARE NO REGIONAL MEASURES LOCAL MEASURES THAT AFFECT OUR LIVES AND HERE AT MTC 24 25 SO PLEASE TAKE A LOOK AND REMEMBER TO VOTE AND MAIL YOUR



BALLOT OR PUT IT IN ANY DROP BOX THAT YOU MAY SEE IN YOUR 1 2 COMMUNITY. 3 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY MORE -- I DON'T SEE ANY 4 5 MORE RAISED HANDS. WITH THAT, WE WILL GO INTO NEW BUSINESS. IS 6 THERE ANY NEW BUSINESS TO RAISE? MICHAEL BALDINI? MICHAEL? 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HE'S LOGGED IN ON TWO LINES AND I DON'T KNOW IF HE'S REALLY RAISING HIS HAND OR NOT. 9 10 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: MICHAEL, ARE YOU -- OKAY. WITH THAT, ARE 11 THERE ANY OTHER -- GO AHEAD MARTHA. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PLEASE FILL OUT THE SURVEYS THAT WAS E-14 MAILED TO YOU YESTERDAY, THE DEADLINE IS TUESDAY. 15 16 RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: OH YES, PLEASE DO THAT. AND WITH THAT, 17 18 PLEASE PUSH THE CENSUS. PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT YOU'RE REGISTERED TO VOTE. DON'T BE SURPRISED WHEN IT'S TIME TO VOTE 19 BECAUSE WE KNOW THESE LITTLE SURPRISES HAPPEN. BUT ALSO THE 20 21 CENSUS IS HOW WE GET OUR MONEY AND WE JUST REALLY, REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE WE ASK ALL YOUR FRIENDS AND FAMILY IF THEY HAVE 22 ALREADY DONE THAT. WITH THAT, I BELIEVE WE ARE DONE FOR THE 23 DAY. AND I WILL ADJOURN THIS MEETING. NEXT MEETING OF THE 24 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY OCTOBER 14TH, 25



