



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript



September 14, 2020

**Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force**

**Monday, September 14, 2020, 1:05 PM**

**JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WELCOME EVERYONE. ARE YOU GOING TO RUN THE COVID GOVERNOR'S ANNOUNCEMENT? DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN



September 14, 2020

1 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE  
2 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS  
3 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE  
4 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL  
5 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE  
6 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO  
7 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO  
8 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE  
9 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WALLY, ARE YOU READY  
12 TO TAKE THE ROLL?

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. CHAIR SPERING?

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SECRETARY KIM?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

25



September 14, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SENATOR BEALL.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

4

5 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** I WILL CALL EVERYBODY NOW BY LAST NAME  
6 ONLY. PLEASE BE READY TO UNMUTE YOURSELF. BAKER?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CURRIER? CORTESE? FERNANDEZ?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** FORD?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT. GRIFFITH?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HAGGERTY? HALLS?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HARTNETT?

25



September 14, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** HURSH?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** JOSEFOWITZ?

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** PRESENT.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** KINMAN?

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** LINDSEY.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MCMILLAN?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

22

23 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MULLIGAN?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.



September 14, 2020

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MURPHY?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** PAPAN?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** PRESENT.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** PEDROZA?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** POWERS?

15

16 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** RABBIT? RAMACIER?

19

20 **RICK RAMACIER:** HERE.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ROTCHY?

23

24 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** HERE.

25



September 14, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** TREE? TUMLIN?

2

3 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

4

5 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WHELAN?

6

7 **NANCY WHELAN:** HERE.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WORTH? HERE.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WU. WUNDERMAN?

12

13 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HERE.

14

15 **ELLEN WU:** WU IS HERE. SORRY.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THANK ALL. SPECIAL WELCOME TO

20 SENATOR BEALL, SECRETARY KIM AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU, VERY

21 ACTIVE PARTICIPANTS IN OUR TRANSPORTATION STRATEGY. THANK YOU,

22 ALL THREE OF YOU, FOR BEING HERE. I WANT TO WELCOME EVERYONE

23 ELSE BACK. AN UNUSUAL SEPTEMBER FOR MOST OF US. IT'S A POINT

24 WHERE, IN AUGUST, MOST OF US ARE GOING ON VACATION VISITING

25 WITH FRIENDS AND RELATIVES. BUT BOY THIS YEAR HAS BEEN SO MUCH



September 14, 2020

1 DIFFERENT. BUT HOPEFULLY THIS YEAR YOU HAVE BEEN AT LEAST ABLE  
2 TO SALVAGE SOMETHING OUT OF THAT. THIS MEETING IS TWO AND A  
3 HALF HOURS. I HOPE BE FINISHED BY 330. THERE WAS SOME  
4 MISUNDERSTANDING ABOUT THE NOTICE SAYING THE MEETING WAS GOING  
5 UNTIL 5 O'CLOCK. I WON'T BE HERE. AND HOPE MANY OF YOU WON'T  
6 BE. WE HOPE TO WRAP UP BY 3:30 I WANT TO THANK CARL GUARDINO  
7 FOR HIS YEARS OF SERVICE IN THE LEADERSHIP GROUP AND HIS TIME  
8 HERE ON THE TASK FORCE AND WANT TO THANK HIM FOR THE HELP HE  
9 WAS GIVEN US IN THE TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES OVER THE YEARS  
10 AND I WANT TO THANK JASON BAKER WHO IS ON THE LINE. WE HAVE  
11 CARL HERE REPRESENTING. REFLECTION ON WHAT WE HAVE DONE SO  
12 FAR. WE HAVE CARES ACT MONEY ALLOCATION WE DID THAT IN JULY  
13 REGION'S OPERATION CENTER HIS DEVELOPED A HEALTH AND SAFETY  
14 PLAN THIS BODY HAS REVIEWED AND APPROVED I WANT TO THANK THE  
15 OPERATORS, LARGE AND SMALL, FOR ALL THE WORK. I WANT TO THANK  
16 YOU FOR DOING THAT. WE'RE STARTING TO SEE THE RESULTS OF THAT  
17 GOOD WORK. OUR OPERATORS ARE NOW IMPLEMENTING THAT PLAN, THAT  
18 THEY DEVELOPED, AND WE'LL BE GETTING REGULAR UPDATES AT THE  
19 COMMISSION, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING ABOUT THOSE  
20 COMMENTS. I REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE, IF SOMEONE DOES HAVE  
21 COMMENTS ON THAT HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN TO PLEASE DO IT AT THE  
22 MTC COMMISSION MEETINGS. THIS, WHAT WE WOULD LIKE TO DO IS  
23 REALLY START FOCUSING ON THE NEXT PHASES OF WORK THAT WE'RE  
24 GOING TO BE DOING HERE. SO THAT OPPORTUNITY IS GOING TO BE  
25 THERE EVERY MONTH AT MTC. LOOKING FORWARD TO TODAY'S TASK





September 14, 2020

1    FORCE MEETING. IT PROVIDES US WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO CONSIDER  
2    OUR PIVOT TO THE BALANCE OF OUR WORK THAT'S AHEAD OF US. WITH  
3    RESPECT TO WHAT WE MIGHT WISH TO CALL A RECOVERY PLAN, I  
4    SUSPECT ANY SORT OF RECOVERY IS GOING TO COME MUCH SLOWER WITH  
5    MORE PAIN THAN MOST OF US HAVE FEARED FROM THE BEGINNING AND  
6    HOPEFULLY WE'LL BE ABLE TO NAVIGATE THROUGH THIS AND FIND  
7    SOLUTIONS. TRANSIT OPERATORS OF COURSE WILL BE ON THE FRONT  
8    LINES OF THOSE DECISIONS AND CONSEQUENCES AND MTC AND THIS  
9    COMMITTEE WILL PLAY A SUPPORTING ROLE AND I HOPE MANY OF DOUBT  
10    SAME. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE REALLY PROMOTING PUBLIC  
11    TRANSIT, THE IMPORTANCE OF IT, AND THAT PLANS HAVE BEEN PUT IN  
12    PLACE TO MAKE IT SAFE AND HEALTHY TRIP. AND I'LL WRAP UP MY  
13    COMMENTS, NOW, BUT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SEVERAL MORE AS THIS  
14    AGENDA MOVES FORWARD, AS WE MOVE INTO THE OTHER AGENDA ITEMS  
15    AND I WANT TO REACH ITEM FOUR. NEXT ITEM BEFORE US REQUIRES  
16    LITTLE OR NO DISCUSSION IT'S A CONSENT CALENDAR APPROVAL. I  
17    WANT TO NOTICE IF ANYONE HAS ANYTHING ON CONSENT THAT THEY  
18    WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS OR REMOVE FROM CONSENT CALENDAR? OKAY.  
19    SEEING NO HANDS. WALLY DO YOU HAVE ANY PUBLIC SPEAKERS? AND IT  
20    INCLUDES THE MINUTES AND THE MEETING SUMMARIES FROM JULY

21

22    **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RAISED.

23

24    **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. COULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL?

25



September 14, 2020

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS A PANELIST ELLEN WU.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD ELLEN.

4

5 **ELLEN WU:** I THINK WHEN I READ THE NOTES THERE IS REFERENCE TO  
6 -- AND I THINK I REMEMBER THIS FROM MANY MEETINGS AGO ABOUT  
7 TRANSIT OPERATORS PASSENGER SURVEYS, THAT HAS INFORMED THEIR  
8 WORK AND IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE COULD SEE A SUMMARY OF THOSE  
9 SURVEY RESULTS. JIM, YOU AND I HAD A CONVERSATION ABOUT A  
10 MONTH AGO ABOUT GETTING A WHY PEOPLE MIGHT NOT BE USING  
11 TRANSIT AGAIN, AND YOU KNOW, THERE ARE A LOT OF SPECULATIONS  
12 BUT LET'S REALLY ASK PEOPLE, AND SO GIVEN THAT THEY'VE ALREADY  
13 DONE SOME SURVEYS IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL TO SEE THOSE  
14 RESULTS. AND I THINK I REMEMBER THEY DIDN'T SEE THEM. THEY  
15 HAVEN'T BEEN SHARED.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. I DON'T THINK I HAVE SEEN THEM  
18 EITHER. AND ELLEN, THIS IS SOMETHING THAT THERESE W. MCMILLAN  
19 AND I HAVE TALKED ABOUT TOO. SO WE NEED TO GET MORE OF THAT  
20 INFORMATION. BECAUSE IF WE'RE GOING TO DO A RECOVERY, WE WANT  
21 TO KNOW WHY PEOPLE AREN'T COMING BACK TO TRANSIT. WE'LL FOLLOW  
22 UP ON THAT ISSUE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WE ALSO HAVE ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER NOW.  
25 ROLAND.



September 14, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** ROLAND?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES. THANK YOU. CHAIR SPERING, JUST TO LETS YOU KNOW  
5 IT'S IMPOSSIBLE TO DIAL INTO THE MEETING BECAUSE ZOOM NO  
6 LONGER SUPPORTS TOLL-FREE NUMBERS. MARTHA AND KIMBERLY KNOW  
7 ABOUT THE PROBLEM BUT I DON'T KNOW ABOUT WHO ORGANIZES THIS  
8 MEETING.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I'LL LOOK INTO THAT. WALLY GO AHEAD  
11 AND TAKE THE ROLL.

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] UNANIMOUSLY, 27 VOTES.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. LET'S MOVE ON TO  
16 ITEM NUMBER FOUR. I WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND DO AN  
17 INTRODUCTORY ON THIS. I TOOK A MOMENT TO LOOK BACK ON SOME OF  
18 THE WORK ALREADY ACCOMPLISHED NOW I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A LOOK  
19 FORWARD TOWARDS OUR EFFORT THAT STARTS WITH TODAY'S UPCOMING  
20 PRESENTATIONS. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM TRANSIT  
21 OPERATORS ON BOTH THE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES EACH OF THEM ARE  
22 FACING, AND FIRST THOUGHTS ON HOW WE CAN TAKE POSITIVE ACTION  
23 TO BRING TRANSIT BACK TO SERVE THE BAY AREA TRAVELERS. AS  
24 WELL, I INVITED SPUR AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA TO PRESENT THEIR  
25 IDEAS TODAY. SEAMLESS HAS RIGHTLY IDENTIFIED SEVERAL



September 14, 2020

1 FRUSTRATIONS OUR CUSTOMERS CONFRONT GIVEN THE FRAGMENTED  
2 SYSTEM THAT IS THE BAY AREA'S PUBLIC TRANSIT. I DO, HOWEVER,  
3 WANT FOLKS TO KNOW THAT OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THE  
4 COMMISSION HAVE BEEN WRESTLING WITH THE SAME SUBJECT FOR MANY  
5 YEARS WITH SOME SUCCESS AND SOME EFFORTS THAT, YOU KNOW, IF WE  
6 GET THEM RIGHT, WE'LL GET THE RECOVERY WE NEED TO GET BACK ON  
7 OUR FEET. MTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE W. MCMILLAN WILL BE  
8 KICKING OFF TODAY'S SERIES OF PRESENTATIONS WITH SOME  
9 OVERREACHING PERSPECTIVE. MTC HAS PLAYED A ROLE IN THE  
10 REGION'S TRANSIT COORDINATION SINCE ITS INCEPTION IN 1970. AND  
11 WILL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THE  
12 COMMISSION REASON. STRONG INTEREST IN THE SUCCESS OF OUR WORK  
13 SERVING THE PUBLIC WITH THE BEST TRANSIT SERVICES WE CAN  
14 POSSIBLY DELIVER. ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR  
15 A LOT OF THE STUFF WE'RE LOOKING AT TODAY IS THROUGH YOUR  
16 EFFORTS AND CONTINUING TO PURSUE THESE VERY NEEDED CHANGES.  
17 THANK YOU FOR THAT. THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS, WE HAVE A BIG JOB  
18 AHEAD TO DEVELOP THE BAY AREA PUBLIC TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
19 ACTION PLAN THAT IDENTIFIES ACTIONS TO RESTATE THE TRANSIT  
20 SYSTEM INTO A CONNECTED MOBILITY NETWORK. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT  
21 EVERYBODY GETS ENGAGED IN THIS DISCUSSION. WE WON'T BE MAKING  
22 DECISIONS TODAY BUT WE WANT TO HEAR THE TASK FORCE'S THOUGHTS  
23 ABOUT THE INFORMATION YOU'RE ABOUT TO RECEIVE AND THEN WE'LL  
24 BE LISTENING CLOSELY TO YOU AS WELL INFORMATION FROM YOU AS  
25 WELL AND IT WILL SET THE FRAMEWORK FOR MEETINGS WE'RE GOING TO



September 14, 2020

1 HAVE IN THE FUTURE. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO EXECUTIVE  
2 DIRECTOR THERESE W. MCMILLAN AND THEN MARIN TRANSIT GENERAL  
3 MANAGER, NANCY WHELAN. THERESE ARE YOU READY TO KICK IT OFF?

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I AM. IF YOU COULD BRING UP THE  
6 PRESENTATION, THAT WOULD BE TERRIFIC. ALL RIGHT. AS CHAIR  
7 SPERING POINTED OUT, THIS IS THE LAUNCH, REALLY, OF STAGE  
8 THREE, AND BACK IN JULY, THIS TASK FORCE HAD CONCLUDED THE  
9 INCREDIBLY CRITICAL STAGE ONE WHICH WAS THE DISTRIBUTION OF  
10 THE CARES FUNDING AND OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS MADE THE NECESSARY  
11 ADJUSTMENTS TO THEIR SERVICE SOME OF WHICH WERE SUPPORTED BY  
12 THE FACT THAT WE GOT THAT ADDITIONAL INFUSION OF FUNDS FROM  
13 WASHINGTON. NOW, WE ALL THOUGHT, BY THIS JUNCTURE, THAT WE  
14 WOULD BE AT A MORE STABILIZED PLACE. BUT UNFORTUNATELY WE  
15 AREN'T THERE YET. THINGS REMAIN UNCERTAIN. OPERATORS ARE  
16 STRUGGLING WITH WHAT THE NEW BASELINE WILL BE FOR STAGE TWO.  
17 AND THAT IN LARGE PART IS BECAUSE THE FUNDING PICTURE IS STILL  
18 MOVING AROUND QUITE A BIT. AND GETTING THROUGHOUT PANDEMIC  
19 ENVIRONMENT WITH PARALLEL FISCAL RECOVERY HAS PROVEN MORE  
20 ELUSIVE THAN WE THOUGHT WE WOULD SEE IN THIS JUNCTURE. WE FIND  
21 OURSELVES IN CONTEXT AND TRANSITION FOR STAGE THREE, THE  
22 REBUILDING ELEMENT, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT THIS  
23 BODY HAS BEEN CHARGED WITH PUTTING TOGETHER IS STILL INFLUX  
24 BUT SAID THAT WE STILL MUST LOOK FORWARD AND BEGIN TO CRAFT  
25 WHAT THE NEXT STEPS TOWARD THAT REBUILT FUTURE LOOKS LIKE. SO



September 14, 2020

1 BASICALLY WHAT THAT MEANS, WE'RE GOING TO BE SHIFTING FROM A  
2 LINEAR PATH TO PARALLEL TRACKS. AND IF YOU CAN BRING UP THE  
3 NEXT SLIDE, WE'LL GIVE TO SEE WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE. THIS IS A  
4 QUICK REMINDER OF WHAT WE SAID WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO  
5 ACCOMPLISH IN STAGE THREE. AND AS A REMINDER, AS WELL, THE  
6 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE BY MID-2021 IS SUPPOSED TO SUBMIT THIS  
7 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SO THERE IS CLEAR BOUNDARIES ON THE  
8 SPAN OF TIME THAT THIS BODY WILL BE WORKING TOGETHER. ON THE  
9 RIGHT SIDE OF THE SLIDE, THIS IS A GRAPHIC WORD CLOUD. YOUR  
10 RESPONSES AS TASK FORCE MEMBERS BACK WHEN WE WANTED TO GET A  
11 SENSE OF WHAT YOU THOUGHT WAS GOING TO BE MOST IMPORTANT IN  
12 TERMS OF THE STAGE OF OUR WORK. AS YOU CAN SEE, THERE WERE  
13 COMMON TOPICS THAT ROSE TO THE TOP, EQUITY, FUNDING,  
14 GOVERNMENT, AND CONNECTIVITY. BUT I WANT TO POINT THERE IS A  
15 LOT OF THINGS ON THIS SLIDE AND I THINK THIS EMPHASIZES THIS  
16 GROUP HAS A LOT OF EXPECTATIONS RELATED TO OUR WORK AND WHAT  
17 THAT'S GOING TO MEAN TO US IS NOT ONLY FROM ENGAGING TOGETHER  
18 IN SOME TOUGH DISCUSSIONS, BUT THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BE  
19 PRIORITY IN CHOICES THAT COME OUT OF OUR WORK. OVER THE COMING  
20 YEAR, OUR CHARTER, THOUGH, WILL BE TO ULTIMATELY SHAPE THE  
21 TRANSIT SYSTEM SO WE HAVE A MORE CONNECTED AND CUSTOMER  
22 FOCUSED NETWORK. NEXT SLIDE. IT'S ALSO CRITICALLY IMPORTANT  
23 THAT WE REMIND OURSELVES OF SOMETHING THAT ALL OF US SHARED,  
24 WHICH IS THAT EQUITY IS ESSENTIAL TO THIS UPCOMING WORK, AS IT  
25 WAS WITH THE CARE ACT. AND WILL BE THROUGHOUT A LONE START WE



September 14, 2020

1 CONTINUE TO POINT TO, THE DECISIONS FACING YOUR ORGANIZATION  
2 CONTINUE TO BE MINDFUL THAT SERVING THOSE WHO MOST NEED OUR  
3 SERVICES ARE CRITICAL. MTC SUPPORTS THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN  
4 THAT EFFORT, WE OFFER OUR ASSISTANCE AS WE TAKE THIS  
5 OPPORTUNITY TO ENSURE THAT THE SYSTEM WILL WORK FOR THOSE WHO  
6 DEPEND ON IT MOST AND DON'T HAVE OTHER OPTIONS. THAT'S AT THE  
7 FOREFRONT. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT MEMBER WU POINTED OUT IS  
8 THERE HAVE BEEN SURVEYS THAT HAVE INDICATED BOTH ON TRANSIT  
9 AGENCY OBSERVATIONS AS WELL AS DATA THAT IN THE MONTHS OF THE  
10 PANDEMIC, THE CURRENT RIDERS ARE MOSTLY TAKING LOCAL AND SHORT  
11 ESSENTIAL TRIPS. AND THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN FOCUSING  
12 THEIR SERVICES TO MEET THAT -- THOSE NEEDS AND DEMANDS. SO AS  
13 WE THINK ABOUT REBUILDING, AS WE THINK ABOUT SENDING OUT THE  
14 MESSAGE TO BRING PEOPLE BACK TO TRANSIT, MAYBE ONE WAY OF  
15 THINKING ABOUT THIS IS THAT WE MUST BE INTERVENTIONAL THAT AS  
16 WE REBUILD OUR SYSTEM, WE DO NOT CREATE DISPARITIES IN TRANSIT  
17 QUALITY AND ITS AVAILABILITY FOR THOSE THAT WILL BE USING IT.  
18 NEXT SLIDE. CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED, REFERENCED AT THE  
19 BEGINNING, THAT THERE IS A NUMBER OF CONCURRENT EFFORTS WITH  
20 RESPECT TO WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE IN THE PAST AND THAT WE  
21 CONTINUE TO DO, THAT IS GOING TO BE VERY IMPORTANT IN ARE  
22 TERMS OF NOT ONLY PROVIDING BUILDING BLOCKS FOR OUR  
23 DISCUSSIONS NOW BUT VERY IMPORTANTLY, AS SERVING AS FOCUS  
24 AREAS WHERE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS COMING FROM  
25 THE BLUE RIBBON -- EXCUSE ME -- BLUE RIBBON WORKING GROUP WILL



September 14, 2020

1 BE TAKING FORWARD. TASK FORCE HAS NEVER BEEN A STANDALONE  
2 EFFORT. IT HAS BEEN A PLACE WHERE WE HAVE CERTAINLY FOCUSED,  
3 AND I THINK HONED OUR ATTENTION. AND THE WORK HERE WILL BUILD  
4 ON AND INFORMED BY THESE EFFORTS ILLUSTRATED ON THE SLIDE. I  
5 DON'T THINK WE NEED TO GO THROUGH THEM INDIVIDUALLY, BUT I  
6 THINK WHAT'S IMPORTANT IS TO SAY THAT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF  
7 FOLKS WHO MAY NOT BE SITTING AROUND THIS TABLE, THAT HAVE BEEN  
8 WORKING COLLABORATIVELY IN THESE EFFORTS, SOME OF WHICH ARE  
9 MTC LED, AND OTHERS WHICH HAVE BEEN INVOLVED, OTHER BOARDS,  
10 AND STAKEHOLDERS. AS THE REGION'S COORDINATING AGENCY, MTC  
11 HOPES TO WEAVE THE TASK FORCE'S WORK AND RECOMMENDATIONS INTO  
12 THESE EFFORTS, AND AS I MENTIONED, REALLY CRITICALLY, THAT'S  
13 GOING TO BE THE PLACE WHERE WE SEE RECOMMENDATIONS TURN INTO  
14 ACTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS ILLUSTRATES WHERE WE ARE AND  
15 IMPORTANTLY SETS THE TABLE FOR NEED TO WORK STAGE TWO AND  
16 STAGE THREE PARALLEL TRACKS. STAKE ONE, AS WE JUST MENTIONED  
17 WAS REALLY FOCUSED ON THE IMMEDIATE EMERGENCY RESPONSE, DRIVEN  
18 AND CATALYZED BY THE SHELTER IN PLACE ORDER AND ELEMENTS AND  
19 THE CARES ACT RECEIPTS AND DISTRIBUTIONS AND PARTICULARLY FOR  
20 THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THE RESPONSE OF WHAT THAT MEANT IN  
21 TERMS OF IMMEDIATE SERVICE LEVELS WAS REALLY THE FOCUS OF  
22 STAGE ONE. NOW WHAT WE'RE SEEING, THOUGH, IS A MUCH CLEARER  
23 VIEW OF A STAGE TWO, WHICH WAS REFINED HERE, NANCY WILL GO  
24 INTO THIS IN MORE DETAIL OF A SURVIVE STAGE, IF YOU WILL. OUR  
25 OPERATORS ACROSS THE BOARD AT DIFFERENT LEVELS ARE SEEING THE





September 14, 2020

1 CLIFF THEY'RE GOING TO NEED TO RESPOND TO THAT, THAT RESPONSE  
2 COLLECTIVELY WILL NEED TO ESTABLISH A BASELINE SERVICE FROM  
3 WHICH WE WILL REBUILD GOING FORWARD WHICH IS THE FOCUS OF  
4 STAGE THREE, BUT AS I MENTIONED IN MY OPENING REMARKS, WE'RE  
5 NOT THERE YET AND STILL VERY ACTIVELY, AS A PUBLIC TRANSIT  
6 COMMUNITY, WHICH INCLUDES ALL OF YOU AROUND THE TABLE, REALLY  
7 TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHERE THAT BOTTOM NEW BASELINE IS GOING  
8 TO START. FUNDING ADVOCACY IS GOING TO BE A CRITICAL PIECE OF  
9 THAT. UNFORTUNATELY IT DOES NOT LOOK LIKE THERE WILL BE AN  
10 ADDITIONAL COVID-19 RELATED ASSISTANCE PACKAGE COMING OUT OF  
11 WASHINGTON, D.C., OF ANY REALLY SIGNIFICANT SCOPE FROM  
12 TRANSPORTATION, BEFORE THE ELECTION, AND WE THEN HAVE TO SAY,  
13 THE RAMIFICATIONS OF THAT, NANCY WILL BE TALKING A BIT ABOUT  
14 THAT GOING FORWARD. BUT IMPORTANTLY, WE DO BELIEVE -- AND THIS  
15 IS THE FIRST BULLET UNDER THE GREEN BOX HERE ON THE SLIDE --  
16 WE HAVE TO BEGIN COMMUNICATING TO OUR PUBLIC, THAT PUBLIC  
17 TRANSIT IS HERE, PUBLIC TRANSIT NEEDS TO BE VIEWED AND USED AS  
18 A WAY OF GETTING AROUND THIS REGION AS WE COLLECTIVELY  
19 RECOVER, BROADLY FROM COVID-19, A LOT OF WHICH WE'RE STILL  
20 WORKING THROUGH, AND IF THERE IS ANY ADDITIONAL MESSAGE I  
21 WOULD PUT THERE, THE RAMIFICATION OF CLIMATE CHANGE THAT WE'RE  
22 ALL EXPERIENCING, AS FIRES LITERALLY SURROUND OUR REGION, AND  
23 THE IMPACTS ITS HAVING ON OUR COMMUNITIES NOW REALLY CONTINUE  
24 TO POINT OUT TO THE FACT THAT WE HAVE TO BE MOBILE IN  
25 DIFFERENT WAYS AND TRANSIT IS A CRITICAL PIECE OF THAT. WITH



September 14, 2020

1 RESPECT TO RECOVERY, AGAIN, THIS IS GOING TO BE THE FOCUS OF  
2 WHAT WE ARE LAUNCHING. THIS MONTH, AND IN THE ENSUING MONTHS,  
3 WE'LL BE SPEAKING ABOUT THOSE STEPS TO DEVELOP THE  
4 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, AND TO THEN MOVE FORWARD WITH  
5 ADOPTING AN IMPLEMENTING THAT GOING FORWARD AS PART OF OUR  
6 DISCUSSION TODAY. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO HAND IT OVER TO MY  
7 COLLEAGUE NANCY WHELAN WHO WILL COMPLETE THIS PRESENTATION.

8

9 **NANCY WHELAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU THERESE. THIS IS LASTING LONGER  
10 THAN WE ANTICIPATED TRANSIT RIDERS ARE NOT RETURNING, AND  
11 WE'RE IN SURVIVAL MODE. I WILL SHARE THE DETAIL OF THE CURRENT  
12 SITUATION AND THEN MOVE TO THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN.  
13 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PANDEMIC HAS HIT TRANSIT VERY HARD IN THE  
14 BAY AREA. RIDERSHIP HAS EVAPORATED DUE TO THE SHELTER IN PLACE  
15 ORDERS AND WORKING FROM HOME. WE'RE CURRENTLY ESTIMATING ABOUT  
16 A 77 PERCENT DECLINE IN RIDERSHIP ACROSS THE REGION. DURING  
17 THE PANDEMIC TRANSIT RIDERS WERE ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND TRANSIT  
18 BASIC MOBILITY RIDERS. TRIPS ARE MAINLY LOCAL WITH AVERAGE  
19 BEING LESS THAN SIX MILES. TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUES LEFT  
20 SIDE OF THE SLIDE ARE DROPPING 63 PERCENT FROM PREPANDEMIC  
21 LEVELS. CARES ACT HAS PROVIDED A WELCOME BACK FILL FOR THOSE  
22 LOST REVENUES HOWEVER, THERE IS A FINANCIAL CLIFF LOOMING AS  
23 CARES ACT FUNDS ARE DEPLETED THIS FALL WITHOUT A CONTINUATION  
24 OF FUNDING TRANSIT SERVICE CUTS MAY BE AN OPTION. SOME OF OUR  
25 TRANSIT AGENCIES MAY FACE LAYOFFS AS EARLY AS THIS FALL. AS



September 14, 2020

1 THERESE NOTED, TRANSIT IS IN SURVIVAL MODE RIGHT NOW RATHER  
2 THAN RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHILE WE'RE IN SURVIVAL MODE,  
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE ALWAYS PUT THE SAFETY OF EMPLOYEES AND  
4 RIDERS FIRST, AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO DO SO. WE'RE STARTING TO  
5 RETAIN A HIGHLY QUALIFIED WORKFORCE TO THE GREATEST EXTENT  
6 POSSIBLE. IF WE DON'T RETAIN A CORE WORKFORCE WE WILL NOT BE  
7 READY TO RESPOND WHEN NEEDED. WE'RE BEING ADAPTIVE IN SERVICE  
8 SO WHEN PEOPLE ARE READY TO RETURN TO WORK WE'LL BE QUICKLY  
9 ABLE TO RESPOND. PROVIDING SERVICE TO RIDERS WHO HAVE NO OTHER  
10 OPTIONS OUR AGENCIES HAVE FOCUSED LASER LIKE ON SERVING  
11 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN AND PROVIDING ESSENTIAL SERVICE ON A  
12 NETWORK OF CORE ROUTES WHILE MAINTAINING KEY TRANSFER  
13 CONNECTIONS ON THE MOST HEAVILY USED ROUTES. IN TERMS OF  
14 DECISION MAKING OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ENHANCED OUR  
15 PREVIOUS COORDINATION ACTIVITIES AND ARE NOW IN A PERIOD OF  
16 UNPRECEDENTED COLLABORATION AND INFORMATION SHARING AT THE  
17 GENERAL MANAGER AND STAFF LEVELS. HAVING SERIOUS CONVERSATIONS  
18 ABOUT TRADEOFFS AND SCARCITY OF DOLLARS AND OPERATING HOURS  
19 FOR SERVICE DEPLOYMENT VERSUS SERVICE INVESTMENT IN TERMS OF  
20 MAINTENANCE AND CAPITAL INVESTMENTS AND ANTICIPATING OPERATING  
21 FUND AND ADJUSTING SERVICE LEVELS TO MEET FORECASTED FUNDING  
22 ALL OF THESE DECISIONS ABOUT FUNDING, HOW QUICKLY RESERVES ARE  
23 DEPLETED AND WHEN SERVICE LEVELS ARE ADJUSTED ARE TAKING PLACE  
24 AT EACH TRANSIT SERVICE'S BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE WORKING IN  
25 PARALLEL AS THERESE MENTIONED. SO WHILE WE HAVE BEEN IN THE



September 14, 2020

1 PANDEMIC WE HAVE BEEN COLLABORATING JOINTLY WITH MTC ABOUT HOW  
2 WE OFFER AND SERVICES. THIS COLLABORATION IS UNPRECEDENTED IN  
3 ADDITION TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD AND FARE INTEGRATION  
4 TASK FORCE, CORE IS HAPPENING BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES LOCAL  
5 AND REGIONAL TO ADDRESS TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AND WORKING TO  
6 EXPLORE INNOVATIVE CONCEPTS AS LISTED AT THE BOTTOM OF THE  
7 SLIDES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE NETWORK IN THE NEAR-TERM  
8 EXAMPLES INCLUDE QUICK BUILD TOOLKIT THAT EXPEDITED LOW  
9 INVESTMENT HIGH RETURN CAPITAL INVESTMENTS THAT GIVE TRANSIT A  
10 PRIORITY. OTHERS LOOKING AT TECHNOLOGY TO HELP ADDRESS THE  
11 AGE-OLD PROBLEM OF MISSING A TRANSIT CONNECTION. VERY RIDER  
12 FOCUSED THERE. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSIT AGENCIES DO ACKNOWLEDGE  
13 THAT THERE IS ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT AND COORDINATION IN THE  
14 SERVICE WE PROVIDE. WE ALSO BELIEVE THAT TRANCE FORGING THE  
15 REGION'S NETWORK INTO A WORLD CLASS SYSTEM FOR OUR RESIDENTS  
16 IS POSSIBLE AND IT DOES HAVE ITS CHALLENGES. NEXT SLIDE.  
17 BEFORE REVIEWING THE CHALLENGES, IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE  
18 THAT THERE ARE KEY FACTORS BEYOND THE TRANSIT AGENCY'S CONTROL  
19 THAT CONTRIBUTE TO THOSE CHALLENGES. FIRST, IS THE CONTINUING  
20 UNCERTAINTY OVER WHEN THE PANDEMIC WILL EASE, AND WHEN TRANSIT  
21 RIDERS WILL RETURN TO WORKPLACES, AND WE JUST DON'T KNOW WHEN  
22 THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN. SECOND ECONOMIC FORECAST IS UNCLEAR AS  
23 TO HOW QUICKLY AND IN WHAT FORM JOBS AND TRANSIT RIDERS AND  
24 FARES AND SALES TAX BASE REVENUES WILL RETURN. OUR THIRD  
25 CHALLENGE IS THE LAMP USE CONTEXT AND ROADWAY NETWORK THAT



September 14, 2020

1 TRANSIT OPERATES IN. PARTICULARLY IN SUBURBAN ENVIRONMENTS  
2 THAT MAKES TRANSIT LESS COMPETITIVE WITH DRIVING. DIVERSE LAND  
3 USE TYPES, PLACE TYPES AND DENSITIES ACROSS OUR REGION MAKES  
4 SERVICE DIFFICULT AND THERE IS THE ONGOING HOUSING JOBS  
5 BALANCE CHANGE THIS'S BEEN WITH US FOR A WHILE. ANY CHANGES IN  
6 THESE VARIABLES WILL IMPACT TRANSIT'S PERFORMANCE AND  
7 EFFECTIVENESS. NEXT SLIDE. NEVERTHELESS THERE ARE SOME AREAS  
8 THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE LOOKING AT RIGHT NOW, THINGS  
9 THAT WE CONTROL AS WE NAVIGATE THE PERIOD THROUGH SURVIVAL AND  
10 INTO RECOVERY AND I'LL GO THROUGH EACH OF THE ISSUES THAT WE  
11 ARE FACING. FIRST IS SYSTEM DESIGN. AND THAT CONCERNS HOW WE  
12 PROVIDE SERVICE TO THOSE RIDERS AND COMMUNITIES THAT NEED IT  
13 AND TO FACILITATE TRANSFER CONNECTIONS AT A SUBREGIONAL LEVEL.  
14 AS A TRANSIT NETWORK AS A WHOLE IS DESIGNED WITH PRIORITIES  
15 AND LIMITED RESOURCES. NEXT WE'RE ASKING HOW EFFECTIVE IS THE  
16 SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE DEPLOYED. UNDER SYSTEM PERFORMANCE, PARTLY  
17 DUE TO THE BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT THE NETWORK HAS BECOME SLOWER  
18 AND LESS RELIABLE FOR OUR RIDERS. THE THIRD ISSUE IS SYSTEM  
19 EXPANSION, AND THE EXPANDING THE NETWORK AND ASSOCIATING  
20 INFRASTRUCTURE IS SLOW AND EXPENSIVE WHILE THE CURRENT  
21 PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS FOR PROJECTS IS  
22 FRAGMENTED. SMALL SCALE ADDITIONS TO THE NETWORK SUCH AS RULE  
23 AND SCHEDULE ARE POSSIBLE. AND THE NEXT ISSUES, FARES AND  
24 PAYMENTS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT BUT FARES ASSOCIATED WITH  
25 TRANSIT SUCH AS PARKING ARE COMPLEX AND ARE NOT ALWAYS



September 14, 2020

1 COORDINATED. THERE ARE ISSUES UNDERWAY SUCH AS EXPANSION OF  
2 CLIPPER START PROGRAM AND FARE INTEGRATION STUDY LOOKING AT  
3 HOW TO MAKE TRANSIT FARES MORE AFFORDABLE AND EASIER TO  
4 NAVIGATE FOR RIDERS. AND THERESE EXPANDED ON THIS ONE EARLIER  
5 ABOUT PUBLIC INFORMATION, IS SOMETHING UNCOORDINATED AND  
6 INCONSISTENT AND AS WE MOVE INTO THE PHASE, TRAVEL INFORMATION  
7 INSTEAD OF PUBLIC SYSTEMS WHICH ARE OUTDATED GOAL IS TO MAKE  
8 ACCESSIBLE TO RIDERS. MTC'S REGIONAL TRANSIT MAPPING AND  
9 WAYFINDING PROJECT WILL ESTABLISH A FOUNDATION FOR A MORE  
10 CONSISTENT AND USER FRIENDLY SIGNAGE. AND CURRENTLY WILL  
11 FINANCIAL OUTLOOK YOU SAW AND ALL OF THESE ISSUES WILL BE  
12 SUBJECT TO CHALLENGES IN THEIR IMPLEMENTATION PRIMARILY AROUND  
13 SURROUNDING COST AND AVAILABLE FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
14 WE'RE LOOKING AT TRANSFORMATION IN STAGES. THESE ISSUES THAT  
15 WE HAVE JUST OUTLINED CONTINUE TO BE TRANSFORMATIVE AND SOME  
16 WILL REQUIRE NEW FUNDING BUT OTHERS CAN BE IMPLEMENTED SOONER.  
17 SOME OF THE NEAR-TERM SOLUTIONS ON THE LEFT SIDE THAT WE'RE  
18 CALLING BASELINE INCLUDE COORDINATED PLANNING OF SERVICE AND  
19 SCHEDULES, AMONG THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THROUGH THE USE OF  
20 COMMON PLANNING TOOLS. THIS WOULD INCLUDE THE TIMING OF MAJOR  
21 SERVICE ADJUSTMENTS THAT IS WHEN WE PUT SCHEDULED CHANGES IN  
22 PLACE OR ROUTE INVESTMENT IN PLACE AND IMPROVE KEY TRANSIT  
23 CONNECTIONS. NEXT WE HAVE A COMPLETE EXISTING FARE STUDIES AND  
24 FARE INITIATIVES THAT ARE CURRENTLY UNDERWAY AND CAN ALSO  
25 IMPROVE 511 AS TRIP PLANNING AND PUBLIC INFORMATION TOOL. AND



September 14, 2020

1 LASTLY WE CAN IMPLEMENT THE INNOVATIVE CONCEPTS WE MENTIONED  
2 PREVIOUSLY ON THE EARLIER SLIDE AND TO THE RIGHT WE'RE SHOWING  
3 LONGER TRIP SOLUTIONS THAT ARE A BIT MORE INVOLVED BUT THEY  
4 BUILD ON THE MERE TERM SOLUTIONS AND CONTINUE THE  
5 TRANSFORMATION. SOME SOLUTIONS INCLUDE INFRASTRUCTURE  
6 MODERNIZATION AND EXPANSION TO IMPROVE TRANSIT PERFORMANCE BY  
7 GIVING OPERATE PRIORITY FARE SUBSIDIES COMPREHENSIVE ANALYSIS  
8 FOR THE REGION'S NETWORK AND FURTHER DEVELOPMENT AND  
9 IMPLEMENTATION OF A REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS NETWORK. A NEW SET OF  
10 METRICS AND STANDARDS TO DEFINE AND MEASURE SUCCESS. AND  
11 CONSISTENT REGIONAL SIGNAGE AND EVENTUALLY MOVING TOWARD A  
12 CONSISTENT BRANDING. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSFORMATION ALSO INCLUDES  
13 SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO TRANSIT FINANCE, AS MENTIONED BEFORE.  
14 OPERATING AND CAPITAL COSTS ARE CONSTANTLY RISING, AND  
15 INEFFICIENCY EXIST. THAT END RESULT IS TO TYPICALLY TRANSFER  
16 THE BURDEN ON TO RIDERS IN THE WAY OF HIGHER FARES, OR IN THE  
17 WAY OF LOST SERVICE AND THE ACTIONS WE'RE PROPOSING ARE ON THE  
18 RIGHT HAND SIDE INCLUDE TRANSIT AGENCIES CONTINUING  
19 COORDINATION ON COST AND WORKING TOGETHER. PERHAPS ECONOMIES  
20 OF SCALE FOR CERTAIN ASPECTS OF OUR BUSINESS SUCH AS  
21 PURCHASING AND MARKETING. ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THE EQUATION  
22 FUNDING COMES FROM A WIDE VARIETY OF SOURCES. FEES SUPPORT OUR  
23 TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN OUR COMMUNITIES AND EACH OF THESE HAS AN  
24 EXISTING EXPENDITURE CLAIM THAT LACE OUT HOW THE FUND ARE TO  
25 BE USED MANY CANNOT BE USED OUTSIDE OF THE COUNTY OR DISTRICT



September 14, 2020

1 IN WHICH THEY WERE PASSED. ONE OF THE ACTIONS THAT WE NEED TO  
2 TAKE IS TO COLLECTIVELY ESTIMATE THE COST OF THE REGIONAL  
3 INITIATIVES BEING DISCUSSED NOW AND UNDER THIS TASK FORCE'S  
4 PURVIEW AND FIND THE MONEY TOGETHER SOME MUST COME FROM  
5 FEDERAL AND STATE GOVERNMENTS THAT RELY ON ADVOCACY AT THE  
6 REGIONAL AND LOCAL LEVEL. NEXT SLIDE. AND FINALLY ONCE WE HAVE  
7 AGREED UPON A SET OF SOLUTIONS TO TRANSFORM THE TRANSIT  
8 NETWORK WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT THE BEST WAY TO IMPLEMENT THESE  
9 PROPOSALS AND MANAGE THE SYSTEM GOING FORWARD. WE HAVE  
10 IDENTIFIED THREE OPTIONS FOR SYSTEM MANAGEMENT THAT HAVE THEIR  
11 OWN SET OF BENEFITS AND TRADEOFFS. IN THE TOP BOX, THE FIRST  
12 ONE WE'RE CALLING NON-BINDING COORDINATION THE TRANSIT  
13 AGENCIES ARE FREQUENTLY MEETING AS I SAID BEFORE AND  
14 COORDINATING ON A REGULAR BASIS TO PLAN AND MANAGE THE  
15 NETWORK. A LOT OF THIS, FRANKLY, WAS AN OUTGROWTH OF THE WORK  
16 THAT FASTER NEGOTIATED AND BROUGHT HOME WITH THIS PANDEMIC.  
17 UNDER THIS OPTION THESE EFFORTS WOULD CONTINUE AND BE EXPANDED  
18 AT MULTIPLE LEVELS. AND THE SECOND BOX THERE BINDING  
19 COORDINATION, UNDER THIS OPTION THE TRANSIT AGENCIES WOULD  
20 WORK TOGETHER TO COORDINATE A FORMAL COORDINATING ENTITY  
21 SOMEWHAT SIMILAR TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD BUT WITH THE  
22 OVERSIGHT RESPONSIBILITIES OF MORE FUNCTIONS AND THIS NEW  
23 ENTITY COULD SERVE AS THE REGION'S NETWORK MANAGER. THE LAST  
24 OPTION THAT'S IDENTIFIED THERE IS AGENCY CONSOLIDATION IT  
25 WOULD BE THE DEEPEST FORM OF INTEGRATION WHICH HAS BENEFITS





September 14, 2020

1 BUT CAN ALSO HAVE SIGNIFICANT CHARGES AND COMPLEX TRADEOFFS IN  
2 FUNDING STRUCTURE, COST, LABOR, GOVERNMENTS AND LOCAL CONTROL  
3 AS EXAMPLES. AND THIS MAY BE BETTER TAKEN UP AT A SUBREGIONAL  
4 LEVEL. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSFORMATION OF THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT  
5 SYSTEM REQUIRES THAT WE ACKNOWLEDGE THE ISSUES WE'RE CURRENTLY  
6 FACING WHILE DEVELOPING A SHARED VISION OF OUR FUTURE WE HAVE  
7 BEGUN EFFORTS OF TRANSPORT SYSTEM AND CONTINUE TO BUILD ON  
8 THOSE. THIS IS A MONUMENTAL TASK BUT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE  
9 READY, WILLING, AND EXCITED TO TAKE IT ON AND WE LOOK FORWARD  
10 TO WORKING WITH THE TASK FORCE, MTC AND REGIONAL AND LOCAL  
11 PARTNERS TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN. WITH THAT I'LL THANK YOU, AND  
12 TURN IT BACK TO CHAIR SPERING.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU NANCY AND THERESE. THAT'S A  
15 LOT TO TRY TO ABSORB HERE AND WHAT'S GOING ON FORWARD. I THINK  
16 THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE CERTAINLY HEADED IN THE RIGHT  
17 DIRECTION. MANY THINGS A LOT OF US HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT FOR  
18 YEARS, IT LOOKS LIKE YOU'RE STARTING TO, AT LEAST CONSIDER  
19 SOME OF IT, THE COMMUNICATIONS, 511 BETTER PUBLIC INFORMATION  
20 COORDINATED SERVICE PLANNING, I THINK VERY IMPORTANT THERE,  
21 FARE STUDIES, AND THE VARIOUS THINGS YOU HAVE BROUGHT FORTH.  
22 WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO NOW IS OPEN THIS UP FOR DISCUSSION FOR  
23 THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS FOR THERESE OR  
24 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN IT UP TO



September 14, 2020

1 COMMITTEE MEMBERS COMMENTS. DON'T SEE ANY HANDS YET. OKAY.

2 GINA, GO AHEAD.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** WHILE EVERYBODY'S HOLDING BACK ON THEIR HAND

5 RAISING. COME ON. YEAH, LOOK AT. [LAUGHTER] YES. I HAVE SOME

6 CONCERNS, NON-BINDING COORDINATION. I -- WHY -- I MEAN WE

7 AGREE ON THE ISSUES HERE, AND THE GOALS, BUT WHEN WE APPROACH

8 THINGS IN SUCH A WAY THAT THEY ARE NON-BINDING, THAT'S DEEPLY

9 CONCERNING THAT WE'RE JUST GOING TO BE RUNNING CIRCLES, AGAIN,

10 BECAUSE AS THE CHAIRMAN ACKNOWLEDGED, WE HAVE KNOWN ABOUT

11 THESE THINGS FOR A VERY LONG TIME. SO I HAVE A PROBLEM WITH

12 THAT. I WONDER IF -- CAN SOMEBODY EXPLAIN WHY IT'S SUPPOSED TO

13 BE NON-BINDING?

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL I'LL -- THIS IS THERESE. I'LL JUMP IN.

16 I THINK THE INTENTION OF THAT SLIDE WAS TO SHOW, COMMISSIONER

17 PAPAN, THAT THERE ARE THREE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF COORDINATION

18 THAT COULD HAPPEN. WE'RE NOT SAYING THAT, WITH RESPECT TO THE

19 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE'S WORK, THAT WE HAVE -- THAT IT WILL BE

20 ONLY BE SLOTTED INTO ONE OF THOSE LEVELS. WHEN WE SAY NON-

21 BINDING IT'S A BROAD STATEMENT, BECAUSE OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS

22 ARE AT SUCH DIFFERENT SIZES, LARGE OPERATORS, MEDIUM

23 OPERATORS, SMALL OPERATORS, IN THE PAST THERE HAS BEEN

24 COORDINATION WHERE, WHAT MIGHT APPLY TO A LARGE OPERATOR WOULD

25 NOT NECESSARILY BE APPROPRIATE OR APPLIED TO A SMALL OPERATOR.



September 14, 2020

1 SO, IN THOSE CASES, THERE MAY BE A COORDINATED EFFORT, BUT  
2 WE'RE NOT MANDATING BINDING CONSTRAINTS THAT WOULD NOT EQUALLY  
3 APPLY TO THE DIFFERENT OPERATORS. NOW THAT DOESN'T MEAN IT'S  
4 THE APPROPRIATE APPROACH TO EVERY SINGLE ISSUE, BUT IN SOME  
5 CASES, IT MAY BE THE LEVEL OF COORDINATION THAT MAKES SENSE.  
6 AND AS NANCY HAD POINTED OUT, THERE IS A WHOLE HIERARCHY OF  
7 HOW THAT BECOMES MORE RIGOROUS. I THINK WHAT WE WERE TRYING TO  
8 SAY IS, ONE OF THE STEPS WE'LL NEED TO TAKE IS LOOK TO THE  
9 SOLUTION, AND THEN MATCH IT WITH THE APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF  
10 COMMITMENT TO MAKE SURE IT HAPPENS, AND IT'S NOT JUST WORDS.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** AND THE OTHER, GINA, IS THAT THIS IS  
13 JUST ONE OF THE OPTIONS THAT THIS COMMITTEE IS GOING TO BE  
14 LOOKING AT. YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR A PRESENTATION FROM SEAMLESS  
15 AND SPUR IN JUST A MINUTE. IT'S JUST A DIRECTION THAT THE  
16 TRANSIT OPERATOR IS GOING. BUT I THINK THIS IS GOING TO  
17 REQUIRE A LOT MORE DISCUSSION AS TO HOW THIS IS GOING TO  
18 DEVELOP, WHAT OUR RECOMMENDATIONS ARE GOING TO BE.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** CAN I PULL UP ONE MORE HERE. WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT  
21 ISSUE THREE HERE, SYSTEM EXPANSION, I MEAN, WE'RE TRYING TO  
22 STREAMLINE EVERYTHING, GET EVERYTHING IN THE FUNDING WE HAVE  
23 AVAILABLE, ALL THAT STUFF, IF YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT EXPANSION  
24 ISSUES, YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT RAISES THE COST LEVEL. SO IF  
25 THESE ARE IN ANY TYPE OF PRIORITY ORDER, PLEASE LET ME KNOW,



September 14, 2020

1 BUT THAT ONE SHOULD BE WAY DOWN. I THINK WE COULD ACTUALLY  
2 ATTAIN EARLIER ISSUES ON SOME OF THESE. SO, I DON'T KNOW HOW  
3 THEY LISTED THESE, BUT PLEASE CONSIDER, WE WANT TO GET THINGS  
4 DONE AND WE WANT TO BE EFFICIENT. SO, IF ANYBODY CAN ENLIGHTEN  
5 ME ON THAT, THANK YOU.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU, DAVID, DID  
8 YOU WANT TO SPEAK?

9

10 **DAVID CHIU:** SURE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IF YOU'RE NOT READY, I HAVE OTHER  
13 PEOPLE WHO HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED.

14

15 **DAVID CHIU:** I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM SUPERVISOR PEDROZA. I  
16 HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS BUT AM LOOKING AT SLIDES RIGHT NOW.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ALFREDO THEN WU.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I AGREE WITH YOUR  
21 COMMENTS THAT THESE ARE STARTING POINTS TO OUR DISCUSSION THAT  
22 WE NEED TO HAVE BUT WE NEED TO FOCUS ON HOW WE DO THIS. TO ME  
23 THAT'S CRITICAL NATURE. THIS IS A MOMENT IN TIME THAT WE NEED  
24 TO SLOW DOWN TO ENSURE WE GET IT RIGHT. ALONG THE SAME LINES  
25 AROUND EQUITY. EQUITY IS THE WORD OF THE DAY, WORD OF THE



September 14, 2020

1 MONTH, WORD OF THE YEAR. BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE GETTING  
2 IT RIGHT. EQUITY CAN MEAN DIFFERENT THINGS TO DIFFERENT  
3 PEOPLE. AND AT THIS TIME WHEN WE'RE MAKING TRANSFORMATIVE  
4 CHANGES, THAT WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO  
5 ACCOMPLISH WITH EQUITY. BECAUSE, AGAIN, WE'RE ALL SAYING IT,  
6 AND IT'S COMING UP IN ALL LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT, BUT I DON'T  
7 THINK WE HAVE REALLY TRIED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO  
8 ACCOMPLISH WITH THAT. IN TERMS OF WHAT IT MEANS TO THE USERS,  
9 AND TO ME, AGAIN, I LOOK AT TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS AS A VERY  
10 SERIOUS PRIORITY FOR OUR SYSTEMS RIGHT NOW. AND THE OTHER  
11 COMMENT ABOUT TELEWORK, WHETHER THAT BECOMES SUSTAINABLE OR  
12 NOT. I THINK WHAT YOU'RE SEEING CERTAIN BIG CORPORATIONS DOING  
13 IN CERTAIN MUNICIPALITIES I CAN GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE WE HAVE  
14 ADOPTED TELL WORK POLICY AND THAT'S GOING TO BE OF CONCERN IN  
15 THE BAY AREA BUT GOING BACK TO THE SPECTRUM OF MANAGEMENT  
16 OPTIONS, I THINK THIS IS A STARTING POINT AND WE HAVE TO BE  
17 WILLING TO GET UNCOMFORTABLE IN WHAT IT MEANS BUT WE NEED TO  
18 BE SURE WE'RE SETTING AND GROUNDING THESE DISCUSSIONS AS WE  
19 GO.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ELLEN, BEFORE I GET TO YOU. I  
22 RECEIVED A TEXT. MTC IS WORKING TO SURVEY AND RESEARCH A  
23 COMMUNICATION PROCESS FOR THE PUBLIC SO WE'RE GOING TO BE  
24 GETTING INTO THOSE ISSUES, AND I'LL HAVE STAFF CONTACT YOU  
25 ELLEN SO THEY CAN WALK YOU THROUGH WHAT OUR NEXT STEPS ARE,



September 14, 2020

1 BUT THAT WAS PART OF THE CARES MONEY THAT WE HAD ASKED FOR AND  
2 WE ARE IN THE PROCESS OF DOING THAT. SO WITH THAT ELLEN, GO  
3 AHEAD WITH YOUR COMMENTS.

4

5 **ELLEN WU:** GREAT THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT EQUITY WAS FRONT  
6 AND CENTER AND IS BEING PRIORITIZED. I GUESS MY QUESTION  
7 AROUND THAT IS HOW IT'S BEING CONCRETE IMPLEMENTED IN THE  
8 CURRENT WORK AND GIVEN THE CURRENT SITUATION IN RESPONSE TO  
9 THE PANDEMIC. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, OUR FUNDING DECISIONS WITH THE  
10 PLANNED BAY AREA CHANGING, BASED ON INVESTMENT PRIORITIES, AND  
11 THE COVID IMPACT, AND IN GENERAL, HOW YOU MIGHT BE DOING AN  
12 ANALYSIS, OR WHEN, IF, MAYBE YOU SHOULD DO AN ANALYSIS OF THE  
13 MONEYS THAT CAN BE MOVED AROUND TO REALLY ADDRESS THE EQUITY  
14 IMPACT THAT THE PANDEMIC IS HAVING ON THE OPERATORS. SO THAT'S  
15 ONE QUESTION. AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION IS ON SLIDE EIGHT.  
16 THERE IS REFERENCE TO FASTER, AND I GUESS I JUST WANT  
17 CLARIFICATION IF THAT REFERENCE IS RELATED TO THE SPECIFIC  
18 CAMPAIGN FOR THE \$0.01 SALES TAX FOR THE REGIONAL MEASURE OR  
19 ARE YOU USING THAT TERM JUST TO TALK ABOUT THE REGIONAL  
20 MEASURE IN GENERAL?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** NANCY, DID YOU WANT TO RESPOND?

23

24 **NANCY WHELAN:** YES. I THINK THE REFERENCE TO FASTER WAS REALLY  
25 ONE OF THE THINGS MOST RECENTLY THAT BROUGHT THE OPERATORS



September 14, 2020

1 TOGETHER ON A PLANNING BASIS, ON A REGIONAL PLANNING BASIS SO  
2 IT'S JUST AN EXAMPLE OF THE WAY THAT WE'RE COLLABORATING.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. IAN GRIFFITH? IAN.

5

6 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU FOR THIS PRESENTATION. GOING BACK TO  
7 DIRECTOR MCMILLAN'S COMMENTS, ON THE OPENING SLIDE, I  
8 APPRECIATE THE RESTATEMENT OF THE TASK FORCE PHASE THREE  
9 PURPOSE. I WOULD ARGUE WHILE I HAVE NO PROBLEM WITH THE  
10 STATEMENT THAT THE PLAN SHOULD IDENTIFY ACTIONS NEEDED TO  
11 RESHAPE THE REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM INTO A MORE CONNECTED,  
12 FOCUSED AND USER MOBILITY NETWORK I WOULD ARGUE THE TASK FORCE  
13 IN STAGE THREE NEEDS TO BE MORE AMBITIOUS THAN THAT. WE NEED  
14 TO DO BETTER. WE NEED TO ASPIRE TO BETTER THAN WE WERE BEFORE.  
15 WE NEED TO REALLY OPTIMIZE THE NETWORK, DO THE MOST -- CREATE  
16 THE BEST POSSIBLE MOST CONNECTED NETWORK THAT WE POSSIBLY CAN,  
17 FOR THE PUBLIC, WITH EVERY DOLLAR THAT WE HAVE. THAT SHOULD BE  
18 THE PRIMARY TASK OF THE TASK FORCE, AND I DON'T KNOW IF WE --  
19 YOU KNOW, IF OTHERS SUPPORT RAISING THIS TASK FORCE'S PURPOSE  
20 TO THAT LEVEL OF AMBITION, I CERTAINLY THINK THAT COULD HELP  
21 US MOVE TOWARD MORE TRANSFORMATIONAL IDEAS OVER THE COURSE OF  
22 THE NEXT NINE MONTHS. AND I ALSO APPRECIATE THE  
23 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FROM DIRECTOR MCMILLAN THAT THERE WERE A LOT  
24 OF ISSUES RAISED AT THE LAST MEETING AND WE REALLY DO NEED TO  
25 PRIORITIZE. WE CAN ONLY TAKE ON SO MANY TOPIC AREAS WITH OUR



September 14, 2020

1 LIMITED TIME HERE. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO  
2 CONSIDER WHAT ISSUES UNIQUELY CAN BE ADDRESSED BY THIS GROUP  
3 OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE BEEN BROUGHT TOGETHER FOR THIS VERY  
4 SPECIAL PURPOSE TASK FORCE. LASTLY, OBVIOUSLY WE WILL BE  
5 PRESENTING AFTER, THIS AND WE'LL HAVE SOME MORE THOUGHTS ON  
6 THAT. FINALLY, I JUST WISH TO SAY THEY THINK IT'S VERY  
7 IMPORTANT TO STRONGLY SUPPORT IDENTIFYING REGIONAL FUNDING  
8 NEEDS AS A REGION, AND AS ONE OF THE ACTIVITIES THAT DIRECTOR  
9 WHELAN HAD DISCUSSED, THAT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL THAT WE  
10 DON'T JUST ON AN AGENCY BY AGENCY BASIS TRY TO, YOU KNOW, GET  
11 LOCAL FUNDING MEASURES PASSED ALTHOUGH THAT WILL BE PART OF  
12 THE SOLUTION BUT WE HAVE A CONSERVATIVE PROACTIVE VISION TO  
13 TRY TO RAISE THE REGIONAL FUNDING SCALE FOR THE RECOVERY THAT  
14 WILL BE NEEDED IN THE VERY NEAR-TERM. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU. DAVID DID  
17 YOU WANT TO SPEAK NOW? I SEE YOUR HAND UP.

18

19 **DAVID CHIU:** FIRST I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR ALL YOUR WORK  
20 ON THIS TASK FORCE AND I AM EXCITED TO SEE WE'RE TURNING TO  
21 PHASE THREE NOW. I HAVE TWO COMMENTS ON THE PRESENTATION I  
22 JUST HEARD. FIRST AROUND THE SLIDE ON SURVIVAL AND AT THE  
23 HEART OF THAT DURING THIS TIME PERIOD IS SAFETY AND SAFETY  
24 PLANNING. AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK THE OPERATORS FOR ALL THE  
25 WORK YOU'RE DOING TO CREATE VERY WORKABLE HEALTHY AND SAFETY





September 14, 2020

1 PLANS FOR ALL. I APPRECIATE VERY MUCH HOW MUCH EFFORT HAS GONE  
2 INTO T I APPRECIATE FROM THE PUBLIC, AND STAKEHOLDERS WHO ARE  
3 STILL CONCERNED ABOUT SAFETY AND WHAT THEY PERCEIVE TO BE LACK  
4 OF OVERSIGHT IN THIS AREA. AND OUT OF FULL DISCLOSURE IT'S  
5 BEEN SUGGESTED TO ME THAT WE MAY NEED LEGISLATION IN THIS  
6 AREA. I'M NOT CURRENTLY THE OPINION THAT THAT'S NECESSARY  
7 BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS WE OUGHT TO  
8 BE ABLE TO PUT SOMETHING IN PLACE TO BUILD PUBLIC CONFIDENCE  
9 IN SAFETY BUT IF THERE IS A SERIES INCIDENT THAT HAPPENS  
10 AROUND SAFETY, I THINK THIS CHATTER OR MOMENTUM WILL BUILD I  
11 WOULDN'T BE SURPRISED IN OTHERS IN THE LEGISLATION WANT TO DO  
12 SOMETHING IN THIS SPACE WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS WORK  
13 TOGETHER TO FIGURE OUT IF THERE IS SOMETHING WE CAN PUT INTO  
14 PLACE TO ENSURE THESE SAFETY PLANS HAVE SUSTAINABILITY, THAT  
15 THERE IS OVERSIGHT, ACCOUNTABILITY, I'M WONDERING IN CAL OSHA  
16 OR CTC OR CAL STIP COULD BE ENGAGED IN SOME WAY TO OVERSIGHT  
17 SO WE DON'T HAVE TO GET LEGISLATIVE INVOLVEMENT SO I WONDER IF  
18 ANYONE WOULD BE INTERESTED IN THAT CONVERSATION. SECONDLY ON  
19 THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN I'M GOING TO SAY SOMETHING  
20 THEY HOPE IS OBVIOUS. I THINK WE ALL WANT OUT OF THIS TASK  
21 FORCE FOR THERE TO BE A ROBUST OF PLANABLE ACTIONABLE STEPS  
22 FOR REFORM. WE DON'T WANT TO JUST TALK WE WANT ACTION. IDEA  
23 THAT SOMEHOW WE MAY ENGAGE IN JUST NON-BINDING COORDINATION  
24 THAT WOULD FEEL REMARKABLY UNSATISFYING. I THINK WE NEED TO DO  
25 SOMETHING UNBINDING IN A COORDINATED WAY. AT LEAST MOVE TO



September 14, 2020

1 SOME AGENCY CONSOLIDATION TO REALLY MOVE FORWARD SOMETHING  
2 THIS'S GOING TO BE MEANINGFUL. AND MY HOPE IS IN THE NEXT  
3 COUPLE OF MONTHS THERE ARE THINGS WE CAN IMPLEMENT RIGHT OUT  
4 OF THE GATE AND AS YOU ALL KNOW I'M LOOK FOR SOME REAL GOOD  
5 NEXT STEPS THAT IF IT NEEDS LEGISLATIVE ACTION, I WOULD BE  
6 PREPARED TO DO THAT. I WANT TO SAY I AM SOMEWHAT AGNOSTIC ON  
7 WHAT THE EXACT DETAILS OF THE SOLUTION ARE BUT WE ALL KNOW  
8 THAT WE DON'T JUST HAVE YEARS MORE TO GO AROUND IN CIRCLES ON  
9 THIS AND TO ECHO WHAT WE HEARD FROM IAN FROM SEAMLESS, WE HAVE  
10 TO CLEARLY IDENTIFY AND FIX WORLD PROBLEMS IMMEDIATELY, AND  
11 ENSURE THAT THE FACT THAT WE HAD FOUR PERCENT OF ALL BAY AREA  
12 TRIPS BE MADE ON TRANSIT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC IS NOT SOMETHING  
13 THAT IS WHAT WE'RE SHOOTING FOR HERE. WE HAVE GOT TO THINK  
14 BIGGER, AND WHILE OUR STATE IS LITERALLY ON FIRE BECAUSE WE  
15 DIDN'T FIGURE OUT GOOD LAND USE AND GOOD TRANSPORTATION  
16 PLANNING, I THINK WE HAVE JUST GOT TO THINK MUCH MORE  
17 SUSTAINABLY AND WITH A REAL ROBUST SET OF ACTIONS. LOOKING FOR  
18 THE PRESENTATION AND HAPPY TO ENGAGE WU DURING AND AFTER THIS  
19 MEETING TO MOVE FORWARD IN THIS WAY.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU THANK YOU FOR  
22 THOSE COMMENTS. I CAN'T AGREE WU -- WITH YOU MORE. WE HAVE TO  
23 LOOK AT THIS DIFFERENTLY THAN WE DID IN THE PAST. PRESENTATION  
24 YOU SAW IS ONE OPTION THIS COMMITTEE IS GOING TO BE LOOKING  
25 AT. WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT A SERIES OF RECOLLECTIONS



September 14, 2020

1 SOME REQUIRING LEGISLATION, SOME MTC IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO  
2 DO. SO DON'T FEEL CONSTRAINED BY THE PRESENTATION YOU JUST  
3 SAW. WE'RE GOING TO SEE AND HEAR OPTIONS THAT YOU WILL NEED TO  
4 CONSIDER AND SOME ARE GOING TO BE FAR REACHING. RANDI KINMAN.  
5 MICHAEL HURSH, AC TRANSIT, AND THEN JIM WUNDERMAN. RANDI?

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO SECOND AND THIRD THE IDEA  
8 ABOUT NON-BINDING COORDINATION BEING ABLE TO THE TABLE. IN  
9 GENERAL, I THINK THE PUBLIC FEELS THAT THE REASON WE'RE IN AS  
10 BAD OF SHAPE AS WE ARE, OR THE PERCEIVED BAD SHAPE THAT WE'RE  
11 THIS IS BECAUSE WE HAVE SO MANY PEOPLE WORKING IN DIFFERENT  
12 SILOS, SO I THINK EVEN THE LANGUAGE OF NON-BINDING  
13 COORDINATION IS NOT PART OF THE TRANSFORMATIVE LOOK THAT WE  
14 ARE HOPING TO ACHIEVE HERE. IF NOTHING ELSE, I WANT ALL OF THE  
15 AGENCY'S, AND I WANT ALL OF THEM HAVING THE SAME DEFINITIONS  
16 FOR EQUITY FOR WHAT IT TAKES FOR STANDARDIZED THROUGHPUT AND  
17 STANDARDIZED SAFETY MEASURES WHEN WE HAVE NON-BINDING  
18 COORDINATION WHERE PEOPLE CAN OR CANNOT OPT IN, I WOULD LOVE  
19 TO SEE US KIND OF REMOVE THAT FROM THE MENU HERE. IT DOESN'T  
20 MEAN IF IT'S BINDING AMONG A GROUP OF PEOPLE, IT DOESN'T MEAN  
21 THAT YOU'RE CAUSING PAIN FOR A SMALLER PROVIDER AS OPPOSED TO  
22 A LARGE PROVIDER, THAT'S NOT HOW GROUPS SHOULD BE WORKING, AND  
23 I THINK THIS IS OUR OPPORTUNITY, NOW THAT EVERYBODY IS WORKING  
24 TOGETHER, TO REALLY BUILD ON THAT, AND THAT'S THE MESSAGE THEY



September 14, 2020

1 GET CONSISTENTLY FROM THE GROUPS THAT I REPRESENT AND JUST  
2 WANTED TO SECOND AND THIRD THAT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. MICHAEL H, AND THEN  
5 JIM WUNDERMAN.

6

7 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO COMMENT ON THE TWO  
8 PATHS. I WANT TO KEY ON THE FOREFRONT AND ASK EVERYONE NOT  
9 JUST PANELISTS BUT ATTENDEES, WE HAVE GOT TO BE LOBBYING FOR  
10 FEDERAL, STATE OR LOCAL FUNDING FOR AC TRANSIT WE'RE FORTUNATE  
11 THE CLIFF IS MIDDLE OF NEXT YEAR BUT FOR OTHERS IT'S END OF  
12 THIS YEAR. I TOTAL AGREE WITH THE OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE, BUT  
13 PLEASE HELP US FIGHT THE FIRE, AND FIND FUNDING SO THAT WE CAN  
14 SURVIVE SO WE CAN GET THROUGH COVID AND GET THE RIDERSHIP  
15 BACK. I DON'T WANT TO RAIN ON THE PRACTICE -- PARADE, WE NEED  
16 TO BE CAUTIONARY.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IF THERE IS AN AREA WHERE WE CAN HOLD  
19 HANDS THIS IS IT. WE HAVE TO GET ORGANIZED AS A REGION AND PUT  
20 ON AS MUCH PRESSURE AS WE CAN. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS  
21 AND YOU'RE NOT RAINING ON THE PARADE, YOU'RE BRINGING  
22 SOMETHING FORWARD THAT WE HAVE TO ADDRESS AND WORK FOR IT. JIM  
23 WUNDERMAN.

24



September 14, 2020

1 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANK CHAIRMAN SPERING. I WANT TO JUST SECOND  
2 WHAT A NUMBER OF FOLKS SAID, AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU, REALLY  
3 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS ON IT. IT'S THE SAME THING I THINK I  
4 SAID IN THE LAST MEETING. SO I WON'T TAKE TOO LONG SAYING IT.  
5 THIS IS OUR TIME IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO REALLY DO  
6 SOMETHING MATERIAL TO IMPROVE OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, YOU  
7 KNOW, IF NOT NOW, WHEN ARE WE GOING TO DO? SO I THINK WE HAVE  
8 TO REMAIN VERY FOCUSED ON IT AND I THINK THAT WILL SLIDE ON  
9 NON-BINDING REALLY GOT FOLKS ATTENTION BECAUSE I THINK IT'S  
10 SORT OF -- EVEN THOUGH IT'S AN OPTION, THERE IS NOTHING WRONG  
11 WITH LAYING OUT OPTIONS IT'S A SIGNAL FOR SOMETHING THAT  
12 SOUNDS BUSINESS AS USUAL, AND THIS'S CERTAINLY NOT WHERE I  
13 THINK WE SHOULD END UP. WE INVEST IN INFRASTRUCTURE AND  
14 TRANSPORTATION OPERATIONS AND ESPECIALLY FROM THE WORK WE DID  
15 ON FASTER, WHAT WE FOUND IS THE PUBLIC IS WILLING TO INVEST,  
16 BUT THEY'RE NOT WILLING TO INVEST IN THE SYSTEM AS IT APPEARED  
17 AT THAT TIME, THAT WAS PRE PANDEMIC. AND I THINK THIS IS -- IT  
18 WAS A REAL SIGNAL TO ME THAT WE NEEDED TO GO BACK AND RETHINK  
19 WHAT WE'RE DOING, AND WHAT I WOULD SAY IS, LIST START THINKING  
20 ABOUT GETTING THE SYSTEM IN PLACE FIRST THAT WE WOULD WANT TO  
21 INVEST IN AND CONVINCE AND CAJOLE EVERYBODY TO INVEST IN THAT.  
22 LET'S HOPE THAT THERE ARE FOLLOWING ROUND OF FUNDING FROM  
23 WASHINGTON. THERE REALLY NEED TO BE. BUT I DO THINK THERE IS  
24 GOING TO BE MORE FOCUS IN THE FUTURE. I SUSPECT. I DON'T KNOW  
25 IT, BUT I SUSPECT. THERE IS GOING TO BE MORE FOCUS ON THE WAY



September 14, 2020

1 FUNDS ARE SPENT AND THE RETURNS ON THOSE FUNDS AND THOSE SORTS  
2 OF THINGS. CHANGE ISN'T EASY. IT NEVER REALLY IS. BUT THIS IS  
3 ONE OF THOSE CASES WHERE IT BROUGHT A GOOD GROUP OF FOLKS  
4 TOGETHER AND DIFFERENT WALKS OF LIFE WHO ALL CARE ABOUT THE  
5 SAME THING AND I HOPE AS WE GO DOWN THE PATH WE CAN KIND OF  
6 THINK HIGH, REALLY REACH FOR IT, AND DO THE KIND OF THINGS  
7 THAT, SOMEWHERE WE ALL SORT OF KNOW WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE GET  
8 DONE AND BE PROUD OF THE RESULTS. I THANK YOU FOR THE  
9 OPPORTUNITY.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JIM. GOOD COMMENTS. RICK  
12 RAMACIER, AMY WORTH AFTER RICK.

13

14 **RICK RAMACIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR. GOOD DISCUSSION. JUST A COUPLE  
15 OF THINGS. OPERATORS AND MTC STAFF WORK A LOT OF HOURS ON  
16 PRODUCING THE SLIDE DECK AND THE INTENT IS FOR YOU ALL TO SEE  
17 THE DESIRE DECK, AND ABSORB THE ENTIRE DECK AND NOT JUST GET  
18 FOCUSED ON ONE BULLET POINT. I'LL TALK ABOUT THAT THEN GET  
19 BACK TO THE DECK. THERE ARE THREE OPTIONS ON THE SLIDE AND  
20 FOLKS ARE TALKING ABOUT ONE OPTION. OPERATORS ARE WORKING  
21 CLOSER TOGETHER THAN WE HAVE IN MANY YEARS AND THAT'S BEEN  
22 NOTED AND WE APPRECIATE THAT THAT'S BEEN NOTED. THERE ARE  
23 STILL 27 OPERATOR IN THE BAY AREA, THEY'RE ALL DIFFERENTLY  
24 GOVERNED ALL INDEPENDENT OF EACH OTHER AND MANY OF THOSE  
25 AGENCIES, THOSE STAFFERS HAVE TO GET BUY-IN FROM THEIR BOARD



September 14, 2020

1 MEMBERS, LOCALLY ELECTED OFFICIALS TO COMMIT TO THE OFFERS IN  
2 THE SLIDE DECK AND IF YOU SEE OPTIONS THAT LOOKS TOO MUCH LIKE  
3 BUSINESS AS USUAL IT'S PERHAPS SOME OF THE OPERATORS IN ORDER  
4 TO BUY INTO THE ENTIRE DECK NEED THAT OPTION UP THERE FROM A  
5 LOPE PERSPECTIVE, AT LEAST FOR THE TIME BEING. AND OUR DECK  
6 WAS REALLY ABOUT ALL THE THINGS WE COULD DO TOGETHER, SHORT OF  
7 GOVERNANCE TO REALLY MOVE THE NEEDLE IN A MEANINGFUL WAY TO  
8 BUILD A MORE CONNECTED SEAMLESS SYSTEM FOR THE BAY AREA.  
9 GOVERNANCE PIECE WHICH YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR A LITTLE BIT ABOUT  
10 FROM OUR NEXT PRESENTERS AND THE HARDEST THING TO DO AND WHEN  
11 YOU LOOK AT WHAT GOVERNANCE MEANS WHEN YOU'RE STARTING WITH 27  
12 INDEPENDENT AGENCIES, SOME OF WHICH ARE ENABLED UNDERSTATE  
13 LEGISLATION, SUCH AS AC TRANSIT OR BART, AND THEIR INDEPENDENT  
14 BOARD OF DIRECTORS, AND THEN YOU THROW IN ALL THE LABOR UNIONS  
15 AND THERE ARE MANY. THERE ARE MANY UNIONS. THERE IS ALMOST A  
16 DOZEN JUST AT THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT ALL OF THAT IS  
17 GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF WORK TO UNTANGLE AND REPUT TOGETHER.  
18 IT'S NOT EASY. MEANWHILE WE'RE WORKING HARD AS OPERATORS TO  
19 GIVE YOU, THIS TASK FORCE, A LOT OF GOOD OPTIONS ON HOW WE CAN  
20 MOVE THAT NEEDLE WITHOUT DOING THE GOVERNANCE FIRST WHILE WE  
21 PERHAPS PURSUE THE GOVERNANCE ON A PARALLEL TRACK WE CAN GET  
22 SOME OF THESE THINGS DONE FOR THE PUBLIC AT THE SAME TIME, AND  
23 THAT'S THE INTENT OF OUR DAY.  
24



September 14, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RICK. I WANTED TO KEEP US  
2 ON SCHEDULE. SO WE HAVE GOT ANOTHER ITEM BEFORE US. AND SO IF  
3 WE CAN, IF COMMITTEE MEMBERS, IF YOU CAN KEEP YOUR COMMENTS  
4 BRIEF, SO WE CAN MOVE ON TO THAT NEXT ITEM. AMY WORTH, ELLEN  
5 WU. AND JAMES LINDSAY.

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** FIRST I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON RICK'S COMMENTS.  
8 FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION. I THINK IT WAS  
9 VERY HELPFUL TO SEE THIS IN ITS ENTIRETY. I WANTED TO GO BACK  
10 TO ONE OF THE COMMENTS THERESE MADE WHICH IS REALLY IMPORTANT  
11 AND HAVING GONE THROUGH THE ABAG MTC DISCUSSIONS FOR THE LAST  
12 HOW MANY, 15 YEARS AND MORE, I CAN UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGES  
13 OF APPROACHING GOVERNANCE FIRST AND THE PROBLEM SECOND. SO I  
14 REALLY THINK THAT WHAT WE NEED TO DO IS WE NEED TO FIND OUT  
15 WHERE WE WANT TO GO AND WHAT WE WANT TO DO AND THEN WE LOOK AT  
16 THE STRUCTURAL ISSUES AROUND THAT. AND THIRDLY, THE FINANCING.  
17 YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY WE CURRENTLY HAVE PEOPLE THAT ARE RELYING  
18 ON TRANSIT SERVICES, AND IF WE START TO SAY WE'RE GOING TO  
19 REALIGN, WE'RE GOING TO CHANGE TRANSIT SERVICES, IT BECOMES A  
20 ZERO SUM GAME WITHOUT HAVING ADDITIONAL REVENUE. BUT I DO, AND  
21 FOR EXAMPLE, LET ME JUST GIVE YOU A QUICK EXAMPLE OF NON-  
22 BINDING COORDINATION, THAT'S THE 680 CORRIDOR WHERE ALL OF THE  
23 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO LOOK AT EXPRESS  
24 TRANSIT FROM THE NORTH TO THE SOUTH. SO I THINK THERE MAY BE  
25 DIFFERENT ELEMENTS OF WHERE WE ULTIMATELY WANT TO BE THAT





September 14, 2020

1 WOULD HAVE A UNIQUE REFLECTION ON HOW WE WOULD IMPLEMENT  
2 THOSE. OBVIOUSLY WE WANT TO MOVE THIS FORWARD, WE WANT TO  
3 PROVIDE A SAFE ROBUST ENHANCED TRANSIT RESOURCES FOR OUR  
4 REGION, BUT, AGAIN, I THINK IF WE CAN FOCUS ON OUR GOAL THEN  
5 WE CAN FOCUS ON HOW TO STRUCTURE IT AND MAKE SURE THAT WE DO.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ELLEN, GO AHEAD.

8

9 **ELLEN WU:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE MY OTHER QUESTION DIDN'T GET  
10 LOST ON HANDLING EXISTING FUNDING HOW THAT MAY BE FREED UP TO  
11 ADDRESS THE SHORTFALLS THE OPERATORS ARE EXPERIENCING? IF  
12 THERE IS SOME KIND OF ANALYSIS THAT'S HAPPENING?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY MAYBE -- THERESE HANG ON. NOT  
15 YET. LET ME GET THROUGH THINGS THEN YOU CAN ANSWER AND WE CAN  
16 MOVE ON. JAMES LINDSAY?

17

18 **JAMES LINDSAY:** THANK YOU CHAIRMAN. I'LL MAKE THIS QUICK. I  
19 AGREE WITH MIKE HURSH AND RICK, LESS HERE, THE GOVERNOR'S  
20 ISSUE IS A LITTLE MORE UNTANGLING, THERE IS FEDERAL  
21 IMPLICATIONS, 13C PROTECTIONS, ALL THAT GOES ALONG WITH THESE  
22 KIND OF CONSOLIDATION ISSUES, AND THEN JUST REAL QUICK AS FAR  
23 AS FUNDING, MY ORGANIZATION WILL CONTINUE TO FIGHT FOR FUNDING  
24 FOR THE BAY AREA IN THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, THE STATE  
25 GOVERNMENT, WHEREVER WE CAN FIND A PENNY WE'RE GOING TO SEARCH



September 14, 2020

1 FOR IT. BUT JUST, OPERATORS, IF YOU'RE GOING TO UNDERSTAND  
2 LAYING OFF ATU MEMBERS IT'S GOING TO BE TOUGH TO GET FIGHTING  
3 MEMBERS INTO THE FIGHT IF MANAGEMENT ISN'T TAKING CUT OR SKIN  
4 IN THE GAME TO THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE THE ONES TO GET  
5 PUNISHED AND YOU WANT US TO HELP GET MONEY AS WELL THAT'S KIND  
6 OF A DIFFICULT TASK TO BRING FORWARD. JUST KEEP THAT IN MIND.  
7 THANK YOU.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANKS JAMES. THERESE WHY DON'T YOU  
10 GO AHEAD AND ANSWER THAT QUESTION AND THEN WE'LL MOVE TO THE  
11 NEXT ITEM.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'LL BE BRIEF. JUST TO SAY THAT MEMBER WU'S  
14 POINT IS AN IMPORTANT ONE. AND MTC STOPPED BROADLY GIVING THE  
15 FINANCIAL DIFFICULTIES THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO SEE WHAT  
16 FLEXIBILITIES WE DO HAVE. MANY FUNDING SOURCES HAVE LOTS OF  
17 LIMITATIONS THAT CAN ONLY BE SPENT FOR CAPITAL, CAN ONLY BE  
18 SPENT FOR X, SO WE'RE LOOKING TO FIND WHAT FLEXIBILITIES ARE  
19 AVAILABLE, AND AS WE'RE ALL TALKING ABOUT HERE, WHAT TRADE-  
20 OFFS WOULD HAVE TO BE CONSIDERED IF THOSE SHIFTS WERE TO  
21 HAPPEN TO MAKE SURE THERE WEREN'T UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES AS A  
22 RESULT. BUT YES IT'S A KEY STEP FORWARD, AND I AM CERTAIN THAT  
23 SOME OF THAT WILL BE BROUGHT FORWARD FOR THIS TASK FORCE'S  
24 INFORMATION AS WE FORWARD THROUGH THAT.

25



September 14, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE. AND I WANT TO  
2 REMIND EVERYONE, THIS IS THE BEGINNING OF THIS DISCUSSION. AND  
3 IT'S GOING TO GET A LOT MORE DIFFICULT THAN WHAT YOU'RE  
4 HEARING TODAY. SO I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE ON TO ITEM 4B SO WE CAN  
5 KEEP MOVING.

6

7 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** THIS IS SUSAN, I CAN SAY ONE THING?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

10

11 **SUSAN ROTCHY:** I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR THEIR TIME HERE. I  
12 UNDERSTAND THE CUTS AND FINANCIAL BURDEN YOU'RE ALL HAVING,  
13 BUT PLEASE DON'T FORGET PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, BECAUSE WE  
14 REALLY DO RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU SUSAN.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CHAIR SPERING, THERE ARE TWO PUBLIC  
19 COMMENTS. DO WE PUSH THEM ALL TO THE END AND DO PUBLIC COMMENT  
20 --

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THAT'S WHAT I WAS GOING TO DO. SO IF  
23 YOU CAN, TELL THEM TO HOLD IT. LET US GET THROUGH ITEMS FOUR.  
24 AND THIS NEXT IS A PRESENTATION FROM SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND  
25 SPUR. IAN GRIFFITHS AND JONATHON CASS. FIRST I WANT TO SAY



September 14, 2020

1 THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE GOING TO -- THEY HAVE BEEN ASKED TO  
2 BRING SOMETHING FORWARD, KIND OF SET THE STAGE FOR FUTURE  
3 DISCUSSIONS, PRESENT SOME CONCEPTS THAT WE MIGHT CONSIDER IN  
4 THE COMING MONTHS. I HAVE ASKED THEM TO TEST OUR COMFORT LEVEL  
5 AND ADD TO THE MENU OF CHANGES THAT WE MIGHT CONSIDER AT OUR  
6 FUTURE MEETINGS AND WITH THAT IAN HOPEFULLY YOU WILL MEET THAT  
7 CHALLENGE. YOU HAVE ALWAYS TESTED OUR COMFORT LEVEL SO  
8 HOPEFULLY YOU'RE GOING TO DO THAT TODAY. I WANT EVERYONE TO  
9 KNOW THEY HAVE ASKED BOTH SEAMLESS, TO BRING STUFF FORWARD  
10 THAT WOULD BE GOOD THOUGHT FOR FUTURE CONSIDERATION. SO WITH  
11 THAT, IAN.

12

13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU. AND ACTUALLY, JONATHON CASEY -- C  
14 CAN SPUR. THANK YOU FOR THE INTRODUCTION. AND ALL OF THE  
15 COORDINATION OF WORK GOING ON JONATHON IS GOING TO START OUR  
16 PRESENTATION OUT.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I THINK A LOT OF SOME OF THE INTRODUCTORY  
19 MATERIAL HAS NOW BEEN DISCUSSED SO I'LL TRY TO SPEED THROUGH  
20 IT. BUT THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING AND MEMBERS OF THE TASK FORCE  
21 FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS EXAMPLES OF TRANSIT  
22 INSTITUTIONAL REFORM THAT ARE RELEVANT AS THE TASK FORCE  
23 CONSIDERS THE PATH TO RECOVERY. WE KNOW THAT AGENCIES ARE  
24 WORKING TIRELESSLY ON A PATH FOR IMMEDIATE SURVIVAL AND WE  
25 HEARD MORE EVIDENCE OF THAT TODAY. OUR PRESENTATION IS COMING



September 14, 2020

1 FROM THE PERSPECTIVE THAT ULTIMATELY OUR RECOVERY REQUIRES  
2 THAT TRANSIT BOTH SURVIVE AND THRIVE. THIS IS THE CHARGE OF  
3 THE TASK FORCE IN STAGE THREE. NEXT SLIDE. WE CAN GO TO THE  
4 NEXT ONE. SPUR AND SEAMLESS ARE PARTNERING ON THIS ONE. YOU  
5 KNOW OUR ORGANIZATIONS BUT JUST A FEW WORDS IN THIS AREA SPUR  
6 IS A NON-PROFIT MEMBER SUPPORTED ORGANIZATION THAT SUPPORTS  
7 GOOD PLANNING AND GOOD GOVERNMENT THROUGH RESEARCH INFORMATION  
8 AND ADVOCACY. SPUR HAS RESEARCHED THE BENEFITS OF COORDINATING  
9 REGIONAL TRANSIT TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, EQUITY,  
10 EFFICIENCY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. SPUR'S REPORT TITLED SEAMLESS  
11 TRANSIT PUBLISHED IN APRIL 2015 COVERED MANY OF THESE ISSUES  
12 AND HAS SINCE SPAWNED DEEPER RESEARCH ON TRANSIT COORDINATION  
13 TOPICS SUCH AS THE RECENTLY PUBLISHED PAPER ON HOW STREAMLINED  
14 INTEGRATED FARES CAN HELP THE REGION REALIZE TRANSIT'S  
15 PROMISE. SPUR IS CURRENTLY WORKING TO COMPLETE A PAPER FOCUSED  
16 ON THE MATTER OF NETWORK, REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER. DO YOU  
17 WANT TO GO AHEAD IAN?

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SEAMLESS BAY AREA IS A MUCH NEWER ORGANIZATION.  
20 WE FORMED IN 2017 AROUND THIS VISION OF WORLD CLASS EQUITABLE  
21 AND TRANSIT INTEGRATION. IT'S CONNECTED TO THE REPORT  
22 PUBLISHED BY SPUR AND MANY OF OUR FOUNDING MEMBERS FINDING THE  
23 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE POPULARLY SUPPORTED BY OUR RIDERS AND  
24 AGENCIES WERE NOT HAPPENING WERE NOT BEING IMPLEMENTED AND IT  
25 SEEMED LIKE GOVERNANCE WAS A MAJOR OBSTACLE TO THOSE MOVING



September 14, 2020

1 FORWARD WE HAD PUBLIC THE SEAMLESS TRANSIT PRINCIPLES SEVEN  
2 WHICH SHOULD GUIDE OUR REGION SUPPORTED BY MEMBERS OF OUR  
3 ORGANIZATION AND SIX PUBLIC ENTITY. NEXT SLIDE.

4

5 **JONOTHON KASS:** SO YOU'RE ALL SICK OF THIS SLIDE BY NOW I WANT  
6 TO BRING IT UP TO EMPHASIZE NEAR-TERM RECOVERY WORK WILL  
7 INCLUDE IN THE COMING MONTHS BEYOND UNPRECEDENTED COORDINATION  
8 AMONG AGENCY THIS IS ESSENTIAL AND REQUIRES ADVOCACY FROM ALL  
9 OF US. TASK FORCE IS ENTERING STAGE THREE, DEVELOPMENT AND  
10 IMPLEMENTATION OF PUBLIC TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.  
11 AND THIS ACTION PLAN NEEDS TO DEFINE HOW TRANSIT SYSTEMS CAN  
12 BETTER DELIVER SERVICE WITH INCREASINGLY CONSTRAINED RESOURCES  
13 AND EVENTUALLY EMERGE FROM THIS CRISIS WITH A NETWORK THAT CAN  
14 MEET OUR EQUITY SUSTAINABILITY AND MOBILITY GOALS. AND IN  
15 JULY, MEMBERS NOTED THAT THE TASK FORCE IS UNIQUELY POSITIONED  
16 FOR FUNDING CHALLENGES AND READY FOR THE NEXT ACTION PLAN.  
17 NEXT SLIDE. OUR PRESENTATION WILL COVER, I'LL NOTE SOME OF THE  
18 REGION'S TRANSIT CHALLENGES WHICH HAVE BEEN DISCUSSED, A  
19 VISION FOR AN INTEGRATED TRANSIT NETWORK, A SUMMARY OF BEST  
20 PRACTICES FROM SOME OF THE MOST SUCCESSFUL REGIONS, AND  
21 PRIORITY CONSIDERATIONS AS YOU SETS THE COURSE FOR A  
22 SUCCESSFUL TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. AS  
23 DISCUSSED TRANSIT FACED CHALLENGES BEFORE THE PANDEMIC,  
24 ALTHOUGH TWO-THIRDS OF OUR TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT GOES TO  
25 TRANSIT, AND THE ECONOMY HAS BEEN QUITE STRONG, PER CAPITA



September 14, 2020

1 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP WAS DROPPING ON MOST SYSTEMS AND TRANSIT  
2 COMMUTE TIMES WERE INCREASING. SINCE THE PANDEMIC, SOME  
3 SYSTEMS THAT HAD STRONGEST RIDERSHIP GROWTH AND FASTEST TRAVEL  
4 TIMES ARE IN THE GREATEST CRISIS. SO, WE NEED TO RECOVER BACK  
5 TO NORMAL, BUT THAT'S NOT ENOUGH FOR TRANSIT TO SURVIVE AND  
6 DELIVER WHAT WE REQUIRE. NEXT SLIDE. YOU ALL KNOW TRANSIT  
7 CHALLENGES CREATE REAL AND UNACCEPTABLE IMPACTS ON THE LIVES  
8 OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS. THESE AREN'T THE CHALLENGES OF  
9 INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS, THESE ARE OFTEN THE CHALLENGES OF  
10 NETWORK CONNECTIONS THAT NO ONE IS ACTUALLY RESPONSIBLE FOR  
11 DELIVERING. PEOPLE RUN INTO THESE PROBLEMS WHEN INDIVIDUAL  
12 AGENCIES DO MOST THINGS RIGHT. PEOPLE TRAVEL BOTH LOCALLY AND  
13 REGIONALLY, AND BETTER COORDINATION HELPS BOTH OF THOSE  
14 SCALES. NEXT SLIDE. AND SUPPORTING TRANSIT AGENCIES TO RECOVER  
15 IS THE MOST URGENT THINGS, BUT UNLESS WE EMERGE FROM THE  
16 CRISIS WITH A STRONG REGIONAL NETWORK WE CAN'T MEET OUR EQUITY  
17 AND MOBILITY GOALS. WE'RE SEEING A SYSTEM WITHOUT  
18 INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES FOR COORDINATION, AND IT IS FAR LESS  
19 ABLE TO ADAPT TO AN UNCERTAIN FUTURE. AND AN UNCERTAIN FUTURE  
20 IS WHAT WE HAVE GOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

21

22 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** BOTH OF OUR ORGANIZATIONS HAVE CONDUCTED  
23 EXTENSIVE RESEARCH ON TRANSIT CHALLENGES INCLUDING BAY AREA  
24 LEADERS AND MANY OF YOU OVER THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS AND WE  
25 KEEP ARRIVING CONSISTENT SET OF POOR TRANSPORTATION OUTCOMES



September 14, 2020

1 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO RESOLVE, AND I CONSISTENT SET OF ROOT  
2 CAUSES THAT LEAD TO THOSE AND SOME OF THESE RECOGNIZE THE  
3 BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT FACTORS THAT NANCY WAS REFERRING TO.  
4 THERE IS, TO BE CLEAR ABOUT THE PROBLEMS THAT WE WANT TO FIX,  
5 THERE IS BOTH NOT ENOUGH SERVICE OR SLOW AND INFREQUENT AND  
6 UNRELIABLE SERVICE THAT WE WANT TO IMPROVE UPON, CORE  
7 INCONSISTENT CUSTOMER SERVICE ACROSS THE REGION INEQUITABLE  
8 COST AND INEQUITABLE ACCESS TO TRANSIT FOR CONNECTIONS, AND  
9 INEFFICIENCY AND SLOW PACE OF CHANGE IN HOW MUCH TRANSIT WE  
10 GET FOR EACH DOLLAR WE SPEND ON OPERATIONS BUT ALSO ON  
11 CAPITAL, NEW PROJECT, AND TRYING TO INITIATE ANY KIND OF  
12 REGIONAL INITIATIVE. WE WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT THESE ARE NOT  
13 CONNECTED. THERE IS NO ONE ROOT CAUSE THAT CAUSES THESE POOR  
14 OUTCOMES, THERE IS A NUMBER OF THINGS RANGING FROM BOTH NOT  
15 ENOUGH FUNDING WHICH IS PARTICULARLY AN ISSUE RIGHT NOW BUT  
16 EVEN IN NORMAL TIMES THERE IS INADEQUATE CONSTRAINT AND  
17 FUNDING UNSUPPORTED LAND USES, POLICIES THAT DRIVE,  
18 INEFFECTIVE BUSINESS PRACTICES, AND LACK OF COORDINATION AND  
19 ALIGNMENT AMONG OUR TRANSPORTATION INSTITUTION. BY TAKING A  
20 LOOK AT GOVERNMENT FUNDING THROUGH THIS TASK FORCE WE'RE ABLE  
21 TO MAKE REAL PROGRESS ON ADDRESSING THE ROOT CAUSES ON THE TWO  
22 ISSUES ON THE RIGHT, COORDINATION AND LACK OF INEFFECTIVE  
23 BUSINESS PRACTICES IN PARTICULAR BUT IT GIVES US AN  
24 OPPORTUNITY TO STRUCTURE GOVERNANCE TO SUPPORT ALL OF THESE





September 14, 2020

1 ROOT CAUSES AND TRY TO IMPROVE UPON THE OUTCOMES OF OUR SYSTEM  
2 AS A WHOLE. NEXT SLIDE.  
3  
4 **JONOTHON KASS:** SO MAYBE TOO MUCH HAS BEEN SAID ABOUT NON-  
5 BINDING, BUT SO YOU CAN TAKE THIS OUTSIDE OF THAT  
6 CONVERSATION. BUT THIS SLIDE SHOWS, BASED ON POLLING FOR LAST  
7 YEARS'S REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE, THAT ONE OF  
8 THE PUBLIC'S FAVORITE ADMITS WAS THE COMMITMENT TO  
9 INSTITUTIONALIZING PUBLIC COORDINATION REGIONAL TRANSIT AND  
10 THIS WAS SPOKEN ON BUT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A POLL THAT WAS  
11 PRESENTED JUST LAST WEEK WHICH WE COULDN'T GET IN OUR SLIDES  
12 MTC PRESENTED ITS PLANNED BAY AREA POLL WHICH PRESENTED PUBLIC  
13 REACTIONS TO A BUNCH OF STRATEGIES INCLUDING TRANSIT  
14 STRATEGIES, AND THE TRANSIT STRATEGY WITH THE MOST TOTAL  
15 SUPPORT, AT 88 PERCENT OF RESPONDENTS IN A STATISTICALLY VALID  
16 POLL WAS REQUIREMENTS FOR BAY AREA PUBLIC BUS AND TRAIN  
17 AGENCIES TO COORDINATE, SCHEDULES, FARE STRUCTURES, AND  
18 PAYMENTS -- PAYMENT SYSTEMS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. THAT WAS  
19 THE STRATEGY. AND THIS STRATEGY DIDN'T JUST HAVE THE MOST  
20 SUPPORT OF THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES, ONLY ONE OF THE TOTAL 27  
21 PLANNED BAY AREA STRATEGIES THAT WERE POLLED HAD MORE TOTAL  
22 SUPPORT THAN THIS TRANSIT COORDINATION REQUIREMENT. NEXT  
23 SLIDE. SO WE CAN SEE THAT COVID HAS EXPOSED THE FRAGILITY OF  
24 OUR SYSTEM AS YOU'RE HEARING TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE WORKING IN  
25 OVERDRIVE TO COORDINATE IN THIS CRISIS BUT WE DON'T HAVE THE



September 14, 2020

1    INFRASTRUCTURE TO MAKE THAT DOABLE. THERE SEW NOT A GUIDING  
2    PLAN FOR A REGIONAL CONNECTED TRANSIT NETWORK, AND WITHOUT A  
3    REGIONAL PLAN FOR CONNECTIVITY OR PROCESSES FOR ENSURING  
4    ALIGNMENT SERVICE CHANGES AND TRANSIT INVESTMENTS ARE OFTEN  
5    MADE IN ISOLATION. LOCAL AND REGIONAL SYSTEMS DON'T WORK  
6    TOGETHER SO WE SEE BOTH DUPLICATION AND GAPS. AS HAS BEEN  
7    SAID, RECENT COORDINATION AND RESPONSE TO THE PANDEMIC IS  
8    UNPRECEDENTED AND A GREAT STEP FORWARD BUT IT SHOULD BE  
9    INSTITUTIONALIZED AND STREAMLINED TO HAVE THE NECESSARY  
10    SUSTAINED IMPACT. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT WE NEED TO EMERGE FROM THE  
11    CRISIS WITH A TRANSIT NETWORK THAT CAN THRIVE AND THAT WE CAN  
12    AFFORD IS THE FOLLOWING WE NEED NETWORK CONNECTION  
13    STRATEGICALLY PLANNED AT A LEVEL DECENTRALIZED AT THE BAY  
14    AREA. WE NEED TRANSIT SYSTEMS COORDINATING AS THEY OPERATE  
15    DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE INTEGRATED NETWORK. AND AS THE PUBLIC  
16    CONTINUES TO NOTE, WE NEED SERVICE QUALITY, FARES, SCHEDULES,  
17    AND WAY FIND NAG IS STANDARDIZED TO BE RELIABLE AND EASY FOR  
18    USERS. HOWEVER HARD AGENCIES AND MTC MAY TRY TO DELIVER THESE  
19    THINGS WE HAVE NOT PUT AUTHORITIES AND STRUCTURES IN PLACE TO  
20    MAKE IT DOABLE. NEXT SLIDE. A REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER  
21    COORDINATOR UNITY CAN MAKE IT POSSIBLE TO OPERATE TO FUNCTION  
22    AS A NETWORK FOR CUSTOMERS. THERE ARE A LOT OF WAYS  
23    RESPONSIBILITIES CAN BE SHARED AND SPLIT BUT IN OUR VIEW A  
24    NETWORK MANAGER ENTITY WOULD SET GOALS AND MINIMUM STANDARDS  
25    FOR THE NETWORK WITH FOCUS INTEGRATION ON URBAN AND SUBURBAN



September 14, 2020

1 ROUTES. FOCUS ON CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND INTERFACES,  
2 FACILITATE COORDINATION BETWEEN OPERATORS, AND IT COULD  
3 FULFILL A VARIETY OF OTHER ROLES THAT YOU SEE LISTED HERE, AND  
4 MORE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, YOU WILL SEE THAT RELATIVE TO THE CASE  
5 STUDIES THAT IAN IS GOING TO PRESENT NOW, THE BAY AREA IS NOT  
6 THAT UNIQUE IN NEEDING TO COORDINATE MANY AGENCIES AND  
7 OPERATORS, BUT WE STAND APART IN NOT HAVING A SIGNIFICANT  
8 NETWORK MANAGER FUNCTION TO OVERCOME THESE INHERIT REGIONAL  
9 NETWORK CHALLENGES. AND ENVIRONMENT FOR ADDITIONAL RESOURCES  
10 AND GREATER ADAPTABILITY THIS COORDINATION FUNCTION IS MORE  
11 IMPORTANT THAN EVER. NEXT SLIDE.

12

13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** NOW I WOULD LIKE TO TURN TOWARDS SHARING  
14 FINDINGS ON RESEARCH IN OTHER REGIONS THAT HAVE ACHIEVED HIGH  
15 RIDERSHIP INTEGRATED AND EQUITABLE SYSTEMS AND THAT HAVE  
16 ADAPTED QUICKLY IN THE CASE OF COVID IN ORDER TO SHOW THAT  
17 THERE IS A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT WAYS OF SETTING UP AN EFFECTIVE  
18 NETWORK MANAGER THAT CAN BRING TOGETHER OUR SYSTEM. AND IT'S  
19 IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT CASE STUDIES THAT WORK FROM AROUND THE  
20 WORLD IF WE'RE GOING TO SETUP A NETWORK MANAGER FOR THE BAY  
21 AREA. THIS RESEARCH WILL BE CIRCULATING AFTER THE TASK FORCE  
22 MEETING, IT'S ENTITLED -- IDENTIFIED AS A MANAGER ENTITY THAT  
23 PERFORMED VERY WELL AND THAT EXISTS IN DIFFERENT WORLD CLASS  
24 TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT HAVE HIGH SUSTAINED AND GROWING TRANSIT  
25 RIDERSHIP. ONE IS THE MODEL OF THE NETWORK MANAGER AS A



September 14, 2020

1 COORDINATING ENTITY ONLY THAT DOESN'T ACTUALLY DIRECTLY  
2 OPERATE ANY TRANSIT. SECOND MODEL IS A NETWORK MANAGER THAT'S  
3 BOTH A COORDINATOR, AND THE OPERATOR OF THE REGIONAL SYSTEMS,  
4 THE REGIONAL RAIL AND SOMETIMES BUS SYSTEMS AND THEN THE THIRD  
5 OVERALL MODEL THAT EXISTS IS THE NETWORK MANAGER AS THE SOUL  
6 SYSTEM OWNER IN THE REGION, OR A COMPLETE CONSOLIDATION MODEL.  
7 ALL OF THESE MODELS FOR COORDINATION WORK, AND -- OR CAN WORK  
8 IN DIFFERENT PLACES, AND WE BELIEVE IT'S THE PRIMARY TASK FOR  
9 THE PRIMARY APPROACH GIVEN THE UNIQUE CONDITIONS HERE. I'LL  
10 DISCUSS EACH ONE OF THESE IN A BIT MORE DETAIL. SO THE NEXT  
11 SLIDE, IF YOU CAN GO TO THAT. GREATER FRANKFURT IN GERMANY  
12 EXEMPLIFIES COORDINATOR ONLY MODEL. ADVANCE THE SLIDE PLEASE.  
13 PRIOR TO 1993, THERE WERE NO REQUIREMENTS, AND NO COMMON  
14 GOVERNANCE FRAMEWORK FOR FRANKFURT, DOZENS OF TRANSIT  
15 OPERATORS THAT SPAN 408 MUNICIPALITIES, FRANKFURT IS A LARGE  
16 REGION OF MANY URBAN CENTERS, HIGHWAYS AND MANY TRANSIT  
17 OWNERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA, AND REQUIRED CONNECTIVITY  
18 INTEGRATION AS WELL AS CHANGES TO HOW TRANSIT WAS TENDERED,  
19 THE RMV WAS CREATED IN 1995 WHICH INTRODUCED COMMON FARE  
20 POLICIES COORDINATED SCHEDULES, COMMON BRANDING AND  
21 COORDINATED NETWORK DESIGN BETWEEN 1996 AND 2017 THE FRANKFORT  
22 REGION'S TRANSIT RIDERSHIP GREW BY 55 PERCENT FOUR TIMES THE  
23 RATE OF OUR TRANSIT DURING THE SAME TIME PERIOD WHICH IS JUST  
24 16 PERCENT. NEXT EXAMPLE FROM THE RESEARCH IS THE SECOND  
25 MODEL, IN TORONTO, WHICH I'LL GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE OF A REGION



September 14, 2020

1 THAT HAS COME A LONG WAY IN A SHORT PERIOD OF TIME TO  
2 INTEGRATE A SYSTEM AND IT SHOWS HOW INSTITUTIONS CAN EVOLVE  
3 OVERTIME THEY'RE NOT JUST CREATED WITH ALL FUNCTIONALITY ON  
4 THE FIRST DAY. IF SOMEONE COULD ADVANCE THE SLIDE PLEASE.  
5 GREATER TORONTO THIS IS A REGION WITH SIMILAR LEVELS OF WEALTH  
6 AND POPULATION TO THE BAY AREA. VAST SUBURBAN AREAS MIXED  
7 DENSITY AREAS SEVERAL TRANSIT AGENCIES SETUP BETWEEN THE 1920S  
8 AND 1970S EACH UNIQUE AND DIFFERING COMMUNITIES. IT WAS ONLY  
9 IN 2006 14 YEARS AGO THAT THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO DETERMINED AN  
10 ENTITY TO OVERSEE THE ENTIRE NETWORK AND PLAN FOR INTEGRATION  
11 METRO WAS CREATED AS A PLANNING ONLY ENTITY BUT IT WAS A  
12 COUPLE OF YEARS LATER THAT THE REGIONAL RAIL AND BUS RIDER WAS  
13 IMPLEMENTED AND ADDED. THEY HAVE TAKEN ON ADDITIONAL  
14 INITIATIVES WITH SUBSEQUENT LAWS AND CHANGES TO THEIR  
15 GOVERNANCE THIS HAS PUT THE AGENCY IN CONTROL OF ALL MAJOR  
16 PROJECT DELIVERY WITHIN THE REGION AND ADVANCING REGIONAL  
17 WAYFINDING BRANDING FARE AND SERVICE INTEGRATION. LASTLY NEXT  
18 SLIDE TRANSLINKS IN VANCOUVER, THE SOLE SYSTEM OWNER ONE  
19 AGENCY THAT RUNS ALL ASPECTS OF THE TRANSIT AND SYSTEMS THIS  
20 WAS CREATED IN 1999 BUT HAS SEEMED TO SUSTAIN RIDERSHIP GROWTH  
21 IN THAT PERIOD. ENTITY NOT ONLY OVERSEES TRANSIT BUT ALSO  
22 MAJOR REGIONAL GROWTH, AND REGIONAL PEDESTRIAN AND BIKE  
23 INFRASTRUCTURE. IT HAS A UNIQUE TWO TIERED BOARD STRUCTURE AND  
24 WITH ADJUSTED AS RECENTLY AS 2007, IT HAS ONE OF THE TWO TIERS  
25 OF THE BOARD IS A 17 REGIONAL MAYORS THAT SIT ON THE MAYOR



September 14, 2020

1 COUNCIL EVER TRANSPORTATION THAT ENSURES THE DEGREE GRAPHIC  
2 REPRESENTATION FROM ALL PARTS OF THE REGION BUT THEN A  
3 SEPARATE BOARD OF DIRECTORS THAT'S MORE INVOLVED IN DAY TO  
4 PLANNED BAY AREA DECISIONS THAT THE AGENCIES ARE APPOINTED,  
5 EVERY ASPECT OF THE REGION HAS A VOICE IN THIS STRUCTURE BUT  
6 ALL PARTS OF THE REGION, URBAN AND SUBURBAN HAVE SEEN  
7 SIGNIFICANT INCREASES OF USE OF TRANSIT OVER TIME. THERE HAS  
8 NOT BEEN A LOSER, IT'S BEEN A WIN-WIN SITUATION FOR ALL PARTS  
9 OF THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE IS A SUMMARY TABLE OF ALL OF THE  
10 CASE STUDIES IN THIS WORK THAT I WON'T BE ABLE TO GO THROUGH  
11 THIS IN DETAIL, BUT WE HAVE GOT ALL TEN CASE STUDIES LISTED  
12 HERE IN THE ROWS, AND THE VARIOUS FUNCTIONS PERFORMED BY EACH  
13 ENTITY'S NETWORK MANAGER IN THE COLUMNS, WITH THE GREEN  
14 INDICATING WHERE THAT FUNCTION IS DONE IN THAT PARTICULAR  
15 NETWORK MANAGER, AND WHAT YOU SEE HERE IS A REMARKABLE DEGREE  
16 OF ALIGNMENT ACROSS THE INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES THEY TEND TO  
17 PERFORM THE SAME SET OF FUNCTIONS AT THE REGIONAL SCALE  
18 NETWORK DESIGN INTEGRATED FARE, SCHEDULED COORDINATION,  
19 PROCUREMENT VERY OFTEN MONITORING OF SERVICE STANDARDS, THEY  
20 DON'T ALL OPERATE THE TRANSIT ITSELF, WHEN WE COMPARED IT TO  
21 THE BAY AREA WHERE FUNCTIONS ARE DONE AT THE REGIONAL SCALE  
22 THESE ARE NOT DONE AT THE REGIONAL SCALE AND THE TRANSIT USE  
23 IN THE BAY AREA MAKING UP FOUR PERCENT OF ALL TRIPS COMPARED  
24 TO MUCH HIGHER RATES ACROSS MANY PARTS OF THE WORLD MANY OF  
25 WHICH ARE VERY SIMILAR TO THE BAY AREA IN TERMS OF DENSITY.



September 14, 2020

1 SO, WRAPPING UP HERE, WE'RE NOT PRESCRIBE A SPECIFIC MODEL FOR  
2 THE BAY AREA SO WE FEEL REFORM IS A CRITICAL PART OF HOW WE  
3 RECOVER OVER THE LONG-TERM. ADVANCE THE SLIDE PLEASE. WE KNOW  
4 A NETWORK MANAGER ENTITY IS A NORM IN HIGH PERFORMING REGIONS,  
5 I WANT TO EMPHASIZE WITH RESPECT TO COUNTER REGION AND THE  
6 THOUGHT OF WHEN WE COULD CONVERT SOMETHING LIKE THE CLIPPER  
7 EXECUTIVE BOARD INTO A MANAGER. I THINK WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT  
8 CLEARLY IF WE'RE SETTING AN ENTITY UP TO BE A NETWORK MANAGER  
9 WHAT THE RIGHT STRUCTURE MEASURE IS ABLE TO LEVEL THAT KIND OF  
10 ACCOUNTABILITY AND CONDITION TO SUPPORT THE COORDINATION AND  
11 COORDINATION SORTED WITH HIGH RIDERSHIP BENEFITS EVEN WITH NO  
12 NEW SPENDING AND HIGHER LEVELS OF RIDERSHIP IN BOTH URBAN AND  
13 SUBURBAN AREAS. NEXT SLIDE. THE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE IS  
14 GOING TO BE LIMITED BY TIME CONSTRAINTS. WE HAVE TO  
15 PRIORITIZE. WE ONLY HAVE ABOUT NINE MONTHS LEFT. WE DO WANT TO  
16 COVER A LOT OF TOPICS, BUT WE THINK IT'S IMPORTANT IF WE DO  
17 AGREE THAT GOVERNANCE AND FUNDING ARE TWO PRIORITIES THAT WE  
18 WANT TO DELVE INTO THAT WE IDENTIFY A CLEAR SET OF QUESTIONS  
19 THAT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WOULD ENTER. WE WOULD  
20 PROPOSE THE FOLLOWING BE ANSWERED IN THIS ACTION PLAN: FIRST  
21 WHERE DO WE WANT TO GO. WHAT TRANSPORTATION OUTCOMES DO WE  
22 WANT. LET'S BE CLEAR ABOUT WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO. THEN  
23 WHAT INSTITUTIONS AND FUNDING DO WE NEED IN ORDER TO REALIZE  
24 THOSE OUTCOMES WHAT AUTHORITIES ARE APPROPRIATE FOR TRANSIT  
25 NETWORK MANAGER AND WHAT AUTHORITIES ARE APPROPRIATE FOR LOCAL



September 14, 2020

1 INSTITUTIONS WHAT TYPES OF ARE FUNDING AND TOOLS SUPPORT THOSE  
2 ENTITIES, WHAT TOOLS FIT THE MANDATE. WHAT'S RIGHT GEOGRAPHY  
3 FOR ANY KIND OF NETWORK MANAGER AND CRITICALLY HOW SHOULD ANY  
4 OF THESE INSTITUTIONS BE GOVERNED, WHAT'S RIGHT REPRESENTATIVE  
5 AND GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE. AND FINALLY ONLY THEN ONCE WE HAVE  
6 IDENTIFIED THESE QUESTIONS, SHOULD WE BEGIN TO ANSWER HOW DO  
7 WE BEGIN TO TRANSITION FROM WHAT'S NOW TO THE FUTURE STATE.  
8 ARE WE GOING TO MODIFIED CHANGES TO MANDATES, ARE  
9 CONSOLIDATIONS AND MERGERS PROVIDE VAIL. WE HAVE TO IDENTIFY  
10 FEASIBLE TRANSITION PATH ONLY ONCE WE FIGURE OUT WHERE WE WANT  
11 TO GO AND WHAT ARE THE SET OF INSTITUTIONS THAT WE NEED IN  
12 ORDER TO GET THERE. AND THEN, IN ORDER TO ANSWER THESE  
13 QUESTIONS, WE BELIEVE THAT WE WILL NEED THOUGHTFUL ANALYSIS  
14 PROVIDED BY AN IMPARTIAL THIRD PARTY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT  
15 WITH PARTICULAR EXPERIENCE IN GOVERNANCE MODELS DRAWING FROM  
16 RICH EXAMPLES SUCH AS THESE BUT ALSO PROVIDING ANALYSIS  
17 CONTEXT. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY NEED FOR THOUGHTFUL  
18 IMPLEMENTATION PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT, PRIORITIZE DECISION MAKING.  
19 SO WE WILL END HERE. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THESE NEXT PROPOSED  
20 STEPS TO BE CONSIDERED BY THE TASK FORCE, WE WOULD ASK THAT  
21 THE TASK FORCE CONSIDER THAT WHILE WE SUPPORT THE SAFETY  
22 RECOVERY AND ALIGNMENT EFFORTS INITIATED BY TRANSIT AGENCIES  
23 AND THAT WERE DISCUSSED IN THE PRIOR PRESENTATION, THAT WE  
24 TAKE THE NEXT STEPS OF CONFIRMING A CLEAR SET OF QUESTIONS  
25 THAT SHOULD BE ANSWERED AS PART OF THE PUBLIC TRANSFORMATION





September 14, 2020

1 ACTION PLAN SUCH AS THOSE PROPOSED ON SLIDE 20, AND DEVELOPING  
2 A WORK PLAN FOR ANSWERING THESE KEY QUESTIONS BRINGING ON THE  
3 APPROPRIATE EXPERTISE THAT WILL BE NEEDED TO DO THAT. THANK  
4 YOU FOR THE INVITATION TO PRESENT TO THE TASK FORCE, AND WE  
5 WELCOME THE DISCUSSION AROUND HOW WE WANT TO FOCUS OUR ENERGY  
6 OVER THE NEXT NINE MONTHS.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU IAN. BEFORE I GO TO  
9 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. IAN, ON THE EXAMPLES YOU GAVE, ESPECIALLY  
10 THE FRANKFURT ONE, HOW DID THEY DEAL WITH THE LABOR ISSUES?  
11 WHEN THEY WERE CONSOLIDATING?

12

13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THAT FRANKFURT ONE, THERE ARE OVER 100  
14 DIFFERENT OPERATORS AND MANY DIFFERENT UNION CONTRACTS AND  
15 AGREEMENTS, SO THAT -- THOSE LABOR FORCES ARE HEAVILY  
16 UNIONIZED IN FRANKFURT LARGELY, AND IT HAD FEW IMPLICATIONS ON  
17 LABOR AGREEMENTS. BUT RATHER THE NETWORK COORDINATOR, YOU  
18 KNOW, ESTABLISHED THE OUTCOMES, AND THE LABOR AGREEMENTS  
19 PROBABLY EVOLVED OVER TIME AS AGREEMENTS WERE NEGOTIATED.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO MOST OF THOSE CONTRACTS  
22 STAYED IN PLACE IN THOSE UNIONS AND REPRESENTATIONS. OKAY. I'M  
23 GOING TO GO AHEAD AND OPEN IT UP FOR DISCUSSION NOW. AND JEFF?  
24 JEFF IS GOING TO KICK IT OFF.

25



September 14, 2020

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** JEFF, MTA THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. IN  
2 MY PAST LIFE I HAVE WORKED FOR MANY OF THE ORGANIZATIONS YOU  
3 HAVE MENTIONED INCLUDING DOING SUBSTANTIAL ORGANIZATION  
4 DEVELOPMENT NETWORK FOR ENTITIES LIKE TRANSLINK AND ONE.  
5 THINGS YOU NEGLECTED TO POINT OUT AMONG ALL OF THE  
6 ORGANIZATIONS THAT YOU DISCUSSED AS KEY TO THEIR SUCCESS WAS  
7 SUBSTANTIAL FEDERAL AND/OR PROVINCIAL FUNDING THAT WENT ALONG  
8 WITH THESE FUNDING. IT WASN'T MAGIC THAT MADE MANAGEMENT  
9 EFFECTIVE IT WAS GIVING RESOURCE TO THESE ENTITY IT WASN'T A  
10 ZERO SUM GAME. IN ORDER TO ENCOURAGE A ZERO GAP, IN ORDER TO  
11 MAKE TRANSIT FARES AFFORDABLE FOR LONGER TRIPS, THEY DIDN'T  
12 CUT REVENUE FOR ENTITIES FORCING THEM TO REDUCE SERVICE IN  
13 ORDER TO REDUCE THEIR PRICES. IN ORDER TO MAKE THIS WORK, AND  
14 MAKE IT EQUITABLE, IT NEEDS TO COME WITH SUBSTANTIAL  
15 ADDITIONAL FUNDING. OTHERWISE, IT IS MERELY A ZERO SUM GAME  
16 THAT BENEFITS NONE OF US.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. DENNIS MULLIGAN?

19

20 **DENNIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU MEMBERS EFFORT TASK FORCE AND  
21 PRESENTERS. LAWFUL LEVELS OF PRESENTATION. I ALWAYS THOUGHT OF  
22 MTC AS OUR NETWORK MANAGER, THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE, WE  
23 DID THAT ONE DAY BECAUSE MTC SAID HEY WE HAVE A GAP. SO THEY  
24 FOUND THE ONES WHO RUN IT AND CONNECTED PART OF THE EAST BAY  
25 TO THE MARIN LOCAL SERVICE THAT NANCY OPERATORS AND IT'S ALL



September 14, 2020

1 TIMED WHEN YOU GET OFF THE BUS IN SAN RAFAEL ASSUMING THE BUS  
2 DOESN'T GET STUCK IN TRAVEL. ASSUMING MTC HAS THE ROLE OF THE  
3 NETWORK MANAGER, ALL OF US COULD DO OUR JOBS BETTER THAT'S WHY  
4 WE'RE ALL HERE WE SHARE A COMMON FOCUS BUT WITH RESPECT TO THE  
5 GOVERNANCE FOCUS I LIKE WHAT YOU HAD ON SLIDE TENT, WHAT  
6 OBJECTIVES DO WE WANT. I THINK IT WOULD BE A HELPFUL STEP FOR  
7 THIS GROUP AS A TASK FORCE TO REACH CONSENSUS ON WHAT  
8 OBJECTIVES WE WANT, AND FORM A FOUNDATION IF WE COULD DO THAT  
9 AT THE NEXT MEETING FOR WHATEVER GOVERNANCE MODEL FLOWS OUT OF  
10 THAT BUT IF WE DON'T AGREE ON THE OBJECTIVES I THINK WE'LL  
11 HAVE A LOT OF PROBLEMS IN THE FUTURE WHEN WE TALK ABOUT WHAT'S  
12 THE BEST PATH TO GO ON. I THINK OBJECTIVES WOULD BE HELPFUL  
13 AND CONSTRUCTIVE SO I WOULD ENCOURAGE MY COLLEAGUES TO BUILD  
14 UPON THAT AS THE PRESENTATION WE JUST HEARD SAYING LET'S HAVE  
15 A CONVERSATION ON OBJECTIVES REACH COMMON GROUND AND MOVE ON  
16 FROM THERE BECAUSE THIS IS IMPORTANT WORK.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** DENNIS, I AGREE. I THINK THAT'S THE  
19 POINT AMY WORTH WAS TRYING TO MAKE EARLIER AND I DEFINITELY  
20 AGREE. IT'S TIME TO MOVE THIS COMMITTEE TO GETTING INTO WHAT  
21 OUR GOAL AND OBJECTIVE. JIM WUNDERMAN AND THEN JASON BAKER.

22

23 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANKS MR. CHAIR. I THOUGHT IT WAS A VERY GOOD  
24 AND THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION. VERY INTERESTING FINDINGS. I HAVE  
25 A QUESTION. NONE OF THE EXAMPLES THAT WERE HELD UP WERE FROM



September 14, 2020

1 THE UNITED STATES, AND I WAS WONDERING, YOU KNOW, IF THERE ARE  
2 GOOD EXAMPLES WHERE, YOU KNOW, AGENCIES OR REGIONS THROUGHOUT  
3 THE UNITED STATES HAVE GONE THROUGH THIS, AND THINGS SIMILAR  
4 TO WHAT YOU SHOWED PLACES LIKE TORONTO VANCOUVER AND  
5 FRANKFURT?

6

7 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH --

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IAN, IF YOU COULD HOLD -- WRITE DOWN  
10 THAT QUESTION. I WOULD LIKE TO GET TO THE COMMITTEE AND THEN  
11 YOU COULD ADDRESS ISSUES AS WE GO ALONG. JASON BAKER?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE COORDINATION IN THE  
14 FASTER PROCESS. I THINK FOR US TO LOOK AT THE HARD QUESTIONS  
15 TO TEE UP WHEN WE CAN TAKE THEM ON HEAD ON, BUT AS JEFF SAID  
16 NOT JUST TALK ABOUT THE QUESTIONS BUT THE FUNDING IMPLICATIONS  
17 AND HOW MUCH THESE THINGS COST BECAUSE SO MANY OF THE  
18 IMPORTANT OBJECTIVES WE HAVE INCLUDING TERMS OF SEAMLESSNESS,  
19 IF YOU WANT SEAMLESS FARES THAT'S GOING TO TAKE MORE MONEY  
20 FASTER AND FREQUENT SERVICE CAN GO A LONG WAY TOWARDS  
21 COORDINATION OF SCHEDULES BECAUSE SOMETIMES YOU GET TO THE  
22 POINT WHERE YOU DON'T CARE ABOUT THE SCHEDULE BECAUSE I TRAIN  
23 COMES FAST ENOUGH AND THOSE WERE ADVANCES TO LOOK AT AS A  
24 REGIONAL MEASURE TEES UP QUESTIONS AND TALKING ABOUT NETWORK



September 14, 2020

1 SOLUTIONS BUT ALSO TALKING ABOUT FUNDING IMPLICATIONS TO GO  
2 ALONG WITH THAT IS KEY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU THE ELLEN WU, AND  
5 THEN GINA PAPAN.

6

7 **ELLEN WU:** THANK YOU. WE'RE REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO DELVING  
8 INTO THIS. I THINK WE'RE ALL IN AGREEMENT THAT MORE  
9 COORDINATION IS GOOD BUT WE ALSO WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT  
10 RESULTS IN MORE TRANSIT AND MORE JOBS AT THE SAME TIME. AND  
11 SO, YOU KNOW, THE WHOLE THING ABOUT THE DETAILS, DEVIL'S IN  
12 THE DETAILS, HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE, AND HOW WE'RE GOING  
13 TO GET THE MONEY TO DO THAT.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GINA?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I THINK WE'RE MISSING THE  
18 POINT HERE. WE'RE IN A POSITION TO RECREATE TRANSIT HERE. WE  
19 ALL KNOW MORE MONEY IS NEEDED, BUT ARE WE GOING TO TAKE THAT  
20 MONEY AND JUST PUT IT INTO THE WAY THINGS USED TO BE DONE OR  
21 ARE WE GOING TO MAKE IT BETTER THAN EVER BEFORE. AND THAT'S, I  
22 THINK, WHAT OUR BIGGEST OBLIGATION HERE IS AT THIS POINT IN  
23 TIME IS NOT TO GO BACK TO THE WAY IT WAS, BUT TO MAKE IT  
24 BETTER THAN EVER BEFORE. YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT COORDINATION. WE  
25 HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT IT FOR DECADES! NOW IS THE TIME IF WE



September 14, 2020

1 HAVE A MANAGER, THAT THAT CAN HAPPEN FOR GOOD. AND THIS IS THE  
2 WAY I VIEW THE PRESENTATIONS TODAY HERE. YOU SAY THEY'RE GOING  
3 TO TAKE MONEY, WELL, WE'RE GOING TO BE GETTING MONEY, AND IT'S  
4 KIND OF HOW WE'RE GOING TO INVEST THAT MOVING FORWARD, IS FOR  
5 A SUSTAINABILITY AND THE RECREATION. YOU CAN'T JUST, I'M  
6 HOPING, SPEND THAT MONEY, AND WHAT USED TO BE DONE BUT USE IT  
7 IN A WAY THAT'S MORE PRODUCTIVE AND AS NOTED INCREASE  
8 RIDERSHIP. THANK YOU.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU GINA. ALFREDO?

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO ECHO SUPPORT  
13 OF WHAT OUTCOMES DO WE WANT BUT I HOPE IT'S MATCHED WITH WHAT  
14 DOES IT TAKE TO ACHIEVE THOSE OUTCOMES. I THINK THAT'S THE  
15 CRITICAL PART. GREAT PRESENTATION, AND THOUGHT PROVOKING, AND  
16 ASKS US ABOUT FUNDING BUT BUILDING A SYSTEM THAT'S  
17 SUSTAINABLE. JUST SOME COMMENTS MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION,  
20 SCOTT HAGGERTY. GOOD TO SEE YOU SCOTT.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANKS. IT'S BEEN A HECK OF A MORNING AT  
23 ACTC, I CAN TELL YOU. YOU KNOW, I'M TRYING TO CATCH UP ON THE  
24 CONVERSATION, BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE'RE IN REALLY DIFFICULT  
25 TIMES. EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT, AND I THINK NOW, WE HAVE TO MAKE



September 14, 2020

1 REALLY DIFFICULT DECISIONS, AND I THINK THAT WHEN YOU LOOK AT  
2 THE BAY AREA, WITH ITS, I BELIEVE 26 TRANSIT AGENCIES, THAT IS  
3 WAY TOO MANY. AND WE TALK ABOUT MONEY, BUT IF WE CAN'T  
4 CONSOLIDATE, AND GET RID OF SOME OF THESE SMALLER OPERATORS  
5 AND MAKE THEM A LITTLE BIGGER OPERATOR, FOR EXAMPLE, I'LL PICK  
6 RICK RAMACIER, AND MICHAEL TREE, WHO IS NOT ON THE CALL, MAYBE  
7 WE COULD MERGE THOSE TWO AGENCIES. [LAUGHTER] RICK GOT  
8 INVOLVED. YOU KNOW, I MEAN, THESE ONES THAT WHERE LITTLE  
9 CITIES ARE RUNNING THEIR OWN TRANSIT AGENCY, UNION CITY, FOR  
10 EXAMPLE, WITH AC TRANSIT RUNNING ALL AROUND THEM. I MEAN, I  
11 UNDERSTAND THEIR REASONING, WHY THEY DIDN'T WANT TO BE A PART  
12 OF THE AC TRANSIT SYSTEM, BUT, THEY SHOULD NOT BE OPERATING  
13 THEIR OWN LOCAL BUS SYSTEM. AND SO, I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, WE  
14 CAN KEEP DANCING AROUND THE ISSUE, AND WE CAN HIRE A SYSTEM  
15 MANAGER, AND WE CAN GET CUTE AND PUT IT AT MTC, BUT UNTIL WE  
16 REALLY GET INTO THE MEAT OF THE ISSUE, WHICH IS TOO MANY  
17 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA THEN WE'RE NOT GOING TO SOLVE  
18 THE PROBLEM. AND I -- WE HAVE TO START MAKING THOSE  
19 COMMITMENTS. AND I REALIZE THAT AC TRANSIT DOESN'T WANT TO  
20 MERGE WITH, YOU KNOW, SOME OTHER CARRIER, I GET ALL THAT. BUT  
21 ULTIMATELY WE'RE HERE FOR THE TAXPAYER AND I THINK WE GOT TO  
22 QUIT DANCING AND WE NEED TO GET SERIOUS.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SCOTT. I DON'T SEE ANY  
25 OTHER HANDS UP RIGHT NOW. YOU KNOW, I JUST WANTED TO ADD THAT,



September 14, 2020

1 YOU KNOW, IN OUR NEXT MEETING WHEN WE START TALKING ABOUT  
2 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A LOT OF REASONS NOT  
3 TO DO A LOT OF THE STUFF THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW,  
4 IT'S FUNDING, AND LABOR, AND THE LIST GOES ON AND ON, AND I  
5 HOPE THAT THIS COMMITTEE IS NOT CONSTRAINED BY SOME OF THESE  
6 YOU KNOW, CHALLENGES THAT ARE BEFORE US, I THINK THAT WE CAN  
7 REALLY COME UP WITH THE PLAN THAT WE WANT TO TRY AND  
8 IMPLEMENT, AND THEN FIGURE OUT WHAT DOES IT TAKE TO DO IT, AND  
9 THERE IS NO DISAGREEMENT, ADDITIONAL FUNDING IS A REQUIREMENT.  
10 YOU LOOK AT THE WORK THAT THE FASTER GROUP DID, THAT WAS  
11 REALLY TO ADDRESS MANY OF THESE THINGS THAT WE'RE ALL TALKING  
12 ABOUT, BUT I DON'T THINK FASTER WAS WILLING TO MONEY INTO THE  
13 EXISTING SYSTEM THE WAY IT'S SETUP RIGHT NOW AND I DON'T KNOW  
14 IF JIM WOULD BE WILLING TO COMMENT ON THAT. I SURE HOPE  
15 EVERYONE WILL GIVE OUR NEXT MEETING CONSIDERATION AND FOCUS ON  
16 WHAT IS OUR OBJECTIVE AND WHAT IS IT THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO  
17 ACCOMPLISH. SO THE -- YOU KNOW, I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS.  
18 LET'S GO TO THE PUBLIC, WALLY, IF YOU COULD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** LET THEM ANSWER THE QUESTIONS.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JIM. I'M GLAD YOU CORRECTED  
23 ME. WHO WAS THAT DIRECTED TO? IAN?

24

25 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I THINK IT WAS FOR ME, ON WHETHER --





September 14, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IT'S ABOUT ANY EXAMPLES IN THE UNITED  
3 STATES.

4

5 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** U.S. EXAMPLES. YEAH. THERE ARE A COUPLE. I  
6 MEAN, REALLY, THE REASON WHY WE FOCUS SO MUCH ON INTERNATIONAL  
7 EXAMPLES IS BECAUSE THE BAY AREA IS KIND OF AT THE TOP OF THE  
8 U.S. REGION IN TERMS OF TRANSIT PERFORMANCE, EXCEPT FOR NEW  
9 YORK. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE GOT THE HIGHEST RATES OF TRANSIT USE  
10 ANYWHERE IN THE COUNTRY. WE'RE ROUGHLY ON PAR WITH DC IN  
11 CHICAGO BUT NEW YORK IS THE ONLY OTHER REGION THAT AS A REGION  
12 IS DOING BETTER THAN WE ARE, AND NEW YORK IS NOT A HELPFUL  
13 COMPARISON FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS ALMOST ALL REGIONS HAVE  
14 SEEN DECLINING TRANSIT USE IN RECENT YEARS, THE ONE NOTABLE  
15 EXCEPTION IS SEATTLE. THERE ARE LESSONS TO BE LEARNED FROM  
16 SEATTLE, THEY DON'T HAVE A PERFECT NETWORK MANAGER, BUT THEY  
17 HAVE AN ENTITY THAT COORDINATES, THEY DEFINE THE FARE  
18 STRUCTURE, THE COORDINATED SCHEDULE, THEY DO PROJECT DELIVERY  
19 BUT THEY ALSO OPERATE THE RAIL AND BUS SYSTEM THAT'S A U.S.  
20 EXAMPLE BUT WE'RE SETTING OUR SITES ON EXAMPLES THAT ARE  
21 MOSTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNTRY.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WHAT OTHER METROPOLITAN AREA IN THE  
24 COUNTRY HAS THIS MANY TRANSIT OPERATORS MOST OF THEM ARE ONLY  
25 ONE OR TWO. ISN'T THAT CORRECT?



September 14, 2020

1

2 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I THINK WE HAVE THE MOST OF ANY MPO THAT I'M  
3 CERTAINLY AWARE OF.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THERE WAS ANY OTHER QUESTIONS  
6 THAT WERE UNANSWERED? THAT WAS THE ONLY QUESTION THAT WE HAD.  
7 JIM, ANYTHING ELSE ON THAT?

8

9 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I THINK THAT ONE OF THE OBJECTIONS THEY HEARD,  
10 BEFORE ANYONE HAS REALLY OBJECTED, IS, WELL, IT'S TOO  
11 COMPLICATED TO DO THIS. AND I LIKE THE PATH THAT WE'RE  
12 STARTING TO LOOK AT HERE. I THINK IT'S MATERIAL AND TIMELY,  
13 AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IF THERE ARE OTHER REGIONS OF THE  
14 UNITED STATES, WHERE THERE IS SORT OF APPLES AND APPLES THAT  
15 COULD HELP US THINK THROUGH THIS, THAT THEY WOULD APPLY. AND I  
16 KNOW THAT LOS ANGELES HAS A, YOU KNOW, HAS A METRO SYSTEM,  
17 MAYBE IT'S DIFFERENT BECAUSE IT'S SINGLE COUNTY, THEY  
18 CERTAINLY HAVE A NUMBER EVER OPERATOR IN LA BESIDES THEM, AND  
19 NEW YORK CITY HAS AN OVERSEER, AND THAT CERTAINLY OVERSEES THE  
20 NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY SYSTEMS AND A LOT OF THE BUSES AND SO  
21 FORTH, SO I DO THINK THAT -- I DON'T KNOW WHEN THOSE THINGS  
22 HAPPENED, NEW YORK SUBWAY SYSTEM WAS THREE PRIVATE SYSTEMS  
23 THAT WERE KIND OF FORCED TOGETHER, I THINK, AROUND WORLD WAR  
24 I, AND I THINK IN THE END WORKED PRETTY WELL FOR A LONG TIME.  
25 AND EVENTUALLY FUNDING TO MAINTAIN THE INFRASTRUCTURE, THAT'S



September 14, 2020

1 SOMETHING WE ALL HAVE TO FOCUS ON BUT TO GET BACK TO YOUR  
2 COMMENTED ABOUT FASTER AND WHAT THE INTENTIONS WERE, YOU KNOW,  
3 AS WE WENT FORWARD, WE HEARD MORE AND MORE THE RELUCTANCE OF  
4 FOLKS WHO WANTED TO INVEST IN THE SYSTEM AS WE PRESENT IT, AND  
5 MORE AND MORE FOLKS SAW FASTER AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO INVEST IN  
6 NEW APPROACHES, LIKE, YOU KNOW, AN ELECTRIFIED REGIONAL  
7 EXPRESS BUS SYSTEM, AND YOU KNOW, THAT -- I THINK THERE IS A  
8 LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES HERE TO THINK DIFFERENTLY ABOUT OUR  
9 SYSTEM, THAT WOULD -- BUST THROUGH THIS PROBLEM THAT WE HAVE  
10 HAD OVER TIME AND NOT IN ANY WAY INCREASING THE MODE SHARE.  
11 AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT THIS IS ABOUT. THAT SHARE FOR OUR  
12 COMMITMENT TO TRANSIT IS JUST TOO LOW. SO I WANTED TO MAKE  
13 SURE THAT IF THERE ARE PLACES IN THE COUNTRY WE COULD BE  
14 LOOKING TO FOR BEST PRACTICES IN THIS, I REALIZED WE'RE  
15 ACTUALLY ONE OF THE BETTER AREAS OF THE COUNTRIES FOR TRANSIT  
16 IN A COUNTRY THAT DOESN'T REALLY HAVE A VERY STRONG PROTRANSIT  
17 SET OF POLICIES. BUT MAYBE, IN A NEW ADMINISTRATION, THAT  
18 MIGHT CHANGE, AND WE COULD KIND OF CATCH A WAVE WITH THIS, AND  
19 WE SHOULD MAKE SURE WE CATCH THE RIGHT ONE. SO THAT WAS MY  
20 PURPOSE IN ASKING THE QUESTION. AND YOU KNOW, I THINK IT WAS  
21 REALLY CLEAR AS WE WENT THROUGH FASTER, AND I THINK SEAMLESS,  
22 YOU KNOW, COMING ALONG AT THE SAME TIME, AND OTHER FOLKS, YOU  
23 KNOW, THERE WAS PRETTY CONSISTENT VIEW THAT WE CAN'T JUST SELL  
24 FUNDING FOR WHAT WE HAVE GOT. FUNDING OBVIOUSLY HAS TO BE A  
25 REALLY BIG PART OF THIS. REGARDLESS OF THE SYSTEM. BUT IF YOU



September 14, 2020

1 WANT TO GET THE FUNDING, YOU THE WAY FUNDING WORKS IS YOU HAVE  
2 GOT TO CONVINCE SOMEBODY TO FUNDS. AND IN THE AREA WE WERE  
3 GOING ABOUT FASTER MAYBE THERE IS ANOTHER WAY, IT WAS GOING TO  
4 REQUIRE TWO THIRDS OF VOTE OF THE PUBLIC OVER NINE COUNTIES,  
5 WHICH IS A REACH. AND SO YOU HAVE REALLY GOT TO GET SOMETHING  
6 OUT THERE THAT THE PUBLIC CAN REALLY LOVE, AND THAT, YOU KNOW,  
7 SORT OF THE BODY OF POLITICS CAN REALLY GET BEHIND AND ALL OF  
8 THAT. SO I THINK SOME OF THE THINGS -- I DON'T WANT TO PRE  
9 DISPOSE ANY CONCLUSION ABOUT EXACTLY WHAT THIS SHOULD LOOK  
10 LIKE IN THE END, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE TO EXPLORE  
11 BUT WE CERTAINLY SHOULD EXPLORE IT ALL.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **JONOTHON KASS:** CHAIR SPERING MAY A MAKE A COMMENT.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** BRIEFLY THEN I WANT TO GET TO STACY  
18 AND MICHAEL HURSH, AC TRANSIT, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE  
19 CONCLUDE AT THREE THIRD. GO AHEAD JONATHON.

20

21 **JONOTHON KASS:** IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT JIM WUNDERMAN WAS JUST  
22 SAYING THERE WAS AN EARLY COMMENT ABOUT ZERO SUM GAME, AND I  
23 THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT -- I KNOW THAT WE'RE VERY USED TO  
24 TRANSIT DECISIONS BEING THAT, AND I THINK PART OF THE  
25 FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE HERE, IS THAT IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE



September 14, 2020

1 THAT. THERE ARE COORDINATION STEPS THAT WE CAN TAKE THAT WILL  
2 NOT TAKE FROM ONE PARTY TO GIVE TO ANOTHER, BUT SIMPLY DELIVER  
3 MORE TO THE VARIETY OF TRANSIT CUSTOMERS THAT ARE OUT THERE.  
4 AND THE POLLING IS INDISPUTABLE, THAT OVER THE YEARS, THAT  
5 THAT'S WHAT THE VOTERS WHO COULD FUND MORE, WHO COULD SUPPORT  
6 THESE SALES TAX MEASURES OR OTHER MEASURES, WANT. AND GOING  
7 BACK TO 2001, WHERE MTC DID ANOTHER POLL, SIMILAR TO THE ONE  
8 THEY PRESENTED THAT WAS PRESENTED YESTERDAY. BACK IN 2001 THE  
9 VOTERS WERE SAYING SIMILAR THINGS. WHAT THEY WANT IS A MORE  
10 COORDINATED SYSTEM. SO THAT'S THE PATH, PERHAPS, TO DEFUND IT.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. STACY, THEN MICHAEL  
13 HURSH, AC TRANSIT.

14

15 **STACY MURPHY:** YEAH. I JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT WE  
16 HAVE TWO PIECES OF TRANSPORTATION THAT OBVIOUSLY ISN'T MAKING  
17 THE GRADE HERE BUT I UNDERSTAND. PUBLIC -- PRIVATE YOU  
18 TRANSPORTATION FOR SHUTTLES THAT WE REPRESENT WE REPRESENT  
19 OVER A THOUSAND BUS DRIVERS AND A LARGE MAJORITY OF SITTING AT  
20 HOME RIGHT NOW SOME GETTING PAID SOME NOT. WITHOUT  
21 TRANSPORTATION COMING BACK EVEN TECH COMPANIES SUCH AS  
22 FACEBOOK, APPLE AND GOOGLE HAS PUSHED SERVICE OUT TO 2021,  
23 THAT IS GOING TO BE EFFECT OUR TRANSPORTATION IN THE BAY AREA  
24 HUGELY AS CROWDED AS IT IS, AND ONCE AGAIN THE UNNAMED SCHOOL  
25 BUS, THE DRIVERS ARE STRUGGLING AND IT'S IMPORTANT TRANSIT,



September 14, 2020

1 AND IT'S ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE GET THEM BACK ON THE  
2 ROAD AND KEEP THEM SAFE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MICHAEL, I'M GLAD  
5 THAT BUS BEHIND YOU DIDN'T HIT YOU. SO YOU'RE UP NOW.

6

7 **MICHAEL HURSH:** WE'RE PROUD OF THOSE DOUBLE DECKERS, COMPARED  
8 TO OTHER REGION AND OTHER MANAGER IMPLEMENTATIONS THAT WE LIST  
9 THE POPULATION OF THOSE REGIONS, ANY DOLLARS THAT CAME ALONG  
10 AND LABOR IMPLICATIONS MY RELATION WITH TRANSIT AROUND THE  
11 WORLD, WE ARE MUCH LARGER THAN THE AGENCY'S LISTED. WE DON'T  
12 HAVE THE DOLLARS FLOWING. AND IF RECOLLECTION SERVES RIGHT,  
13 HUGE LABOR UNREST IN VANCOUVER, I BELIEVE, SO I WOULD ASK THAT  
14 WE PUT THE ENTIRE EQUATION ON THE TABLE WHEN WE GO FORWARD. IF  
15 WE'RE GOING TO SAY COMPARE TO SEATTLE OR FRANKFURT OR  
16 MINNEAPOLIS LET'S PUT THE POPULATION NUMBERS DOWN SO WE TRULY  
17 KNOW WHAT WE'RE COMPARING OURSELVES TO. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GOOD POINT. LET ME GET TO PUBLIC  
20 COMMENTS. WALLY HOW MANY DO YOU HAVE?

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WE HAVE FOUR RIGHT NOW. MEMBERS EFFORT  
23 PUBLIC PARTICIPATE BEING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH COMMENTS  
24 PLEASE USE THE RAISE YOUR HAND FEATURE, DIAL STAR NINE NOW,  
25 AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE



September 14, 2020

1 MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS TO SPEAK. PLEASE RAISE YOUR VIRTUAL HAND  
2 IN THE NEXT 60 SECONDS SO I CAN RECOGNIZE YOU AS A SPEAKER. SO  
3 WE HAVE SIX NOW. AND WE'RE STARTING OUT WITH MONICA MALLON.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY WALLY LET'S GIVE EVERYBODY TWO  
6 MINUTES.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** OKAY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALL ON WITH SILICON VALLEY  
11 CLIMATE ACTION AND I REALLY THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE FOCUS  
12 ON SECURING FUNDING FOR AGENCIES IN THE NEAR-TERM. TRANSIT  
13 AGENCIES ARE ALREADY TALKING ABOUT MAKING REALLY DRAMATIC  
14 CUTS. WE'RE GOING TO BE FALLING OFF A CLIFF IN A FEW MONTHS. I  
15 PERSONALLY LIVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY I RELY ON TRANSIT AND I  
16 PRIMARILY USE VTA WHICH IS PRIMARILY CONSIDERING CUTTING  
17 SERVICE BY 30 PERCENT WHICH WOULD BRING SERVICE LEVELS DOWN TO  
18 WHERE THEY WERE IN 1979. SERVICE WILL BE THE SAME OR WORSE  
19 WHEN EVERYONE THAT REPRESENTS ME IN THIS COUNTY ON THIS TASK  
20 FORCE WAS MY AGE. I'M 23 RIGHT NOW. SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT  
21 YOU SHOULDN'T WHETHER THE HAPPEN OUR AGENCIES ARE STRUGGLING  
22 AND NEED HELP TO STAY LIFE PLEASE CONSIDER HELPING THE  
23 AGENCIES OUT PROVIDING THEM WITH DISCRETIONARY FUNDING, EVEN  
24 ARE LOANING THEM MONEY OR HAVING A STATE STRATEGY WHEN THERE A  
25 VACCINE AND PEOPLE ARE READY TO GET BACK TO WORK, A LOT OF



September 14, 2020

1 THEM ARE GOING TO NEED TO USE TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY PROBABLY  
2 SOLD THEIR CARS BECAUSE THEY CAN'T AFFORD CARS ANYMORE. WE  
3 REALLY NEED TO MAKE TRANSIT IS READY TO PERFORM ON PRE COVID  
4 SERVICE LEVELS. PLEASE DO EVERYTHING YOU CAN DO TO HELP WITH  
5 THAT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON TASK FORCE MEMBERS. ADINA LEVIN WITH  
12 FRIEND OF CALTRAIN, WE HAVE BEEN WORKING SPEAKING ON THE  
13 IMPORTANT SUBJECT OF FUNDING FOR THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM TO  
14 RECOVERY FROM COVID. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON MEASURE RR FOR  
15 CALTRAIN AND IN PARTNERS WITH TRANSIT RIDER GROUPS, TRANSIT  
16 ADVOCACY GROUPS AROUND THE REGION TO BRING IN THAT MONEY,  
17 HOSTING A TOWN HALL FOR, WITH TRANSIT ADVOCATES AROUND THE  
18 STATE, WITH KAMALA HARRIS'S STAFF TALKING ABOUT THE  
19 COMMENCEMENT WITH EAST BAY TRANSIT RIDERS TO MAKE SURE WE'RE  
20 BRING NEGLIGENT FUNDING AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO DO SO, BUT ALSO  
21 WANTED TO REALLY SUPPORT THE IDEAS THAT IN ORDER TO BE -- TO  
22 BRING IN THAT FUNDING INCLUDING THE REGIONAL FUNDING BUILDING  
23 ON WHAT JIM WUNDERMAN SAID, THE PUBLIC WANTS TO SEE AN  
24 INTEGRATED SYSTEM IN ORDER TO INVEST IN T I ALSO WANTED TO  
25 SPEAK IN MY ROLE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND MTC





September 14, 2020

1 WORKING ON FARE INTEGRATION WHERE THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD  
2 MODEL WHERE DECISIONS GO BACK TO 27 DIFFERENT TRANSIT  
3 AGENCIES, I THINK THAT MODEL WHERE YOU NEED TO GO BACK TO 27  
4 BOARDS WILL NOT GET US THAT UNIFIED SYSTEM THAT THE PUBLIC  
5 WANT THAT WILL BUILD THE PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THE SYSTEM THAT  
6 WE NEED. SERVICE INTEGRATION ALONG WITH PUBLIC SUPPORT GOES  
7 ALONG WITH FUNDING.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** NEXT, PETER STRAUSS.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU PETER STRAUSS I'M ON THE BOARD OF SAN  
14 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS I WANT TO THANK ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU  
15 AND BEALE FOR BEING HERE TODAY. I AM VERY MUCH WITH MICHAEL  
16 HURSH IN LIMELIGHT WITH STAGE TWO AND THAT WE NEED STRATEGIES  
17 TO SURVIVE A FINANCIAL CLIFF OR WE DON'T NEED TO WORRY ABOUT  
18 TRANSFORMATIVE RECOVERY. YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT ZERO SUM GAME WE  
19 ARE SO FAR BELOW ZERO SUM GAME THIS'S WHAT WE NEED TO FOCUS  
20 AND I THINK DON'T THINK WE HAVE FOCUSED SUFFICIENTLY ON HOW WE  
21 CAN SECURE THE SUFFICIENT REVENUE TO GET US THROUGH THE  
22 CURRENT GAP. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY THAT EVEN WITH THE CHANGE OF  
23 ADMINISTRATION, I DON'T THINK WE CAN RELY ON THE FEDERAL  
24 GOVERNMENT TO SOLVE ALL OF OUR PROBLEMS. AND WHEREAS IN SOME  
25 LOCAL DISCUSSION, YOU KNOW, AND THE NUMBER OF YOU HAVE



September 14, 2020

1 MENTIONED THE FISCAL ISSUES, WE'RE NOT DOING ENOUGH ABOUT  
2 THIS. THIS IS A REGIONAL PROBLEM. AND IT'S PERHAPS A STATE  
3 PROBLEM, AND I THINK IT WARRANTS A REGIONAL AND PERHAPS A  
4 STATE SOLUTION. I HAVE HAD SOME INITIAL DISCUSSIONS ON THE  
5 STATE LEVEL BUT AS NEAR AS I CAN TELL, THERE IS NOTHING REALLY  
6 HAPPENING TO PULL TOGETHER ANYTHING, OR CONSIDER ANYTHING ON  
7 THE STATE LEVEL RIGHT NOW. I WOULD CERTAINLY, IF I'M WRONG, I  
8 WOULD CERTAINLY WELCOME ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU AND SENATOR BEALL  
9 CHIMING IN RIGHT NOW BUT I THINK WE NEED TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE  
10 FAR MORE AGGRESSIVELY THAN WE HAVE BEEN DOING SO FAR, AND  
11 COLLECTIVELY THAN WE HAVE BEEN DOING SO FAR. THANK YOU.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES AND THEN SYD  
16 KAPUR.

17

18 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. TODAY I AM SPEAKING AS AN  
19 INDIVIDUAL. THERE IS A BLUEPRINT IN FRONT OF YOU FOR  
20 CONSOLIDATING TRANSIT AGENCIES, THERE WAS A BILL THAT MERGED  
21 ALL OF THE VARIOUS WATER AGENCIES INTO ONE CALLED WETA, AND  
22 THIS IS GOING TAKE STATE LEGISLATION TO MAKE ANY MAJOR  
23 PROGRESS. I THINK YOUR SMALLEST WORRY IS LABOR. LABOR  
24 NEGOTIATES OVER CONDITIONS, AND WHAT I HAVE FOUND IN MY UNION  
25 IS THAT AS THINGS HAVE INCREASINGLY GOTTEN MORE DIFFICULT WITH



September 14, 2020

1 INDIVIDUAL BARGAINING, THAT THEY HAVE MERGED LOCALS. YOU WILL  
2 PROBABLY FIND THAT IF YOU MERGE ORGANIZATIONS, LOCALS WILL  
3 MERGE FOR MORE AUTHORITY AT THE BARGAINING TABLE. AND I THINK  
4 I COULD DISCUSS OFFLINE SOME THING THAT MAYBE COULD BE DONE TO  
5 MAKE THIS AN EASIER TRANSITION WITH LABOR. IT'S GOING TO BE  
6 AGENCIES AND VARIOUS COUNTIES WHO WILL PUT UP THE BIGGEST  
7 OPPOSITION. IT WON'T BE LABOR UNIONS. THEY WILL NEGOTIATE. AND  
8 SAYING THAT, I THINK THE BLUEPRINT IS THERE. AGAIN. IT'S STATE  
9 LEGISLATION. WITHOUT IT YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET MUCH DONE.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SYD KAPUR AND THEN ROLAND.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SYD AND I LIVE IN OAKLAND AND AM A  
16 TRANSIT RIDER. I WANT TO COMMENT I STRONGLY SUPPORT THE THREE  
17 OPTIONS YOU HAVE PRESENTED AND I LIKE THE IDEA OF TRYING TO  
18 MOVE AWAY FROM ZERO SUM GAME IF WE CAN DO FARE INTEGRATION AS  
19 ADINA MENTIONED AND THAT IN ITSELF WILL ENCOURAGE MORE PEOPLE  
20 TO USE TRANSIT GETTING THEM TO MORE TRANSIT WITH THE SAME FARE  
21 AND THAT WITH ALLOWING PEOPLE TO COMBINE RAIL AND BUS TRIPS  
22 TOGETHER SHOULD HELP TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND GET US OUT OF  
23 THIS HOLE OF COVID RIDERSHIP DECLINES.

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.



September 14, 2020

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ROLAND?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. SO, I AM GOING TO TOUCH ON  
5 THREE THINGS AND CLOSE ON WITH A COMMENT MONICA MALLON SAID.  
6 EXAMPLES AND SEAMLESS. ON INTEGRATION, I AM GLAD PEOPLE  
7 MENTIONED NEW YORK BUT WHAT ABOUT LONDON, PARIS, TOKYO, AND  
8 HONG KONG? WITH REGARDS TO SEAMLESS CONNECTIONS, I THINK  
9 THAT'S THE REALLY THE CRUX OF THE METHOD HERE. I'M GOING TO  
10 GIVE YOU EXAMPLES. MILLBRAE CONNECTION BETWEEN CALTRAIN AND  
11 BART WHY DO WE HAVE 800 FOOT CONNECTION BETWEEN BART AND  
12 TRANSIT -- HOW DID WE END UP WITH A FOUR MINUTE CONNECTION IN  
13 MILPITAS? WHEN THE LIGHT RAIL IS LITERAL OWE TOP OF THE BART  
14 STATION? WHAT HAPPENED THERE? AND LAST, BUT NOT LEAST, GET  
15 YOURSELF READY FOR THE IMPENDING CATASTROPHE AT DIRIDON AND  
16 WHAT'S GOING DOWN THERE AND HOW THEY'RE GOING TO BEGIN  
17 CONNECTING BUSES, BART, CALTRAIN, HIGH SPEED RAIL AND LIGHT  
18 RAIL. IT'S A CATASTROPHE. PLEASE KEEP AN EYE ON IT. A NUMBER  
19 OF AGENCIES, HAVING STARTED WITH SOME LOW HANGING FRUITS. I'M  
20 GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE. WHY DO WE NEED A SEPARATE AGENCY  
21 IN EACH COUNTY. WHY DO WE NEED SAMTRANS? WHY CAN'T WE HAVE VTA  
22 AND MUNI PROVIDING BUSINESS SERVICE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY? AND  
23 BY THE WAY PROVIDING BETTER SERVICE THAN SAN MATEO IS  
24 CURRENTLY PROVIDING? MY LAST POINT, IT'S A COMMENT ON THE  
25 POINT THAT MONICA MALLON MADE, THERE ARE MANY ISSUES AT VTA,



September 14, 2020

1 BUT I CAN ASSURE THAT FUNDING IS ONE OF THEM. I ASSURE YOU IN  
2 THE NEXT FEW WEEKS AND MONTHS YOU'RE GOING TO START SEEING  
3 SOME KIND OF MOVEMENT THAT'S GOING TO BE INTENDED TO PUT VTA  
4 BACK ON TRACK. AND BY BACK ON TRACK, I MEAN BACK ON TRACK WITH  
5 ITS MISSION STATEMENT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ROLAND. WALLY IS THERE ANY  
8 OTHER SPEAKERS?

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. THERE IS DEREK SAGE HORN THEN BOB  
11 ALLEN AND ALETA DUPREE. DEREK E YOU'RE NEXT.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. DEREK SAGE HORN FROM EAST BAY TRANSIT  
14 RIDERS UNION. I WANT TO COMMENT IN SUPPORT OF THE SEAMLESS  
15 VISION AS PRESENTED. EXAMPLES ARE SIMILARLY GOOD. I WANT TO  
16 URGE COMMISSIONERS ON THE TASK FORCE TO REALLY, DON'T SHY AWAY  
17 FROM THE INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLES. I KNOW THERE ARE  
18 INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLES THAT HAVE DIFFERENT CONDITIONS, AND  
19 BACKGROUNDS, BUT THE REASON THAT SEAMLESS IS DOING THIS WORK  
20 IS THAT WE, AS A COUNTRY, HAVE FAILED TO PRIORITIZE MAKING  
21 THESE CONNECTIONS FOR RIDERS, AND THE BAY AREA, WE CAN TRY  
22 TAKE HINTS FROM SEATTLE AND OTHER PLACES, BUT WE REALLY SHOULD  
23 BE FOLLOWING BEST PRACTICES FROM AROUND THE WORLD AND BEING  
24 LEADERS, AT LEAST DOMESTICALLY ON THIS ISSUE. IT'S IMPORTANT  
25 WE DON'T GET CAUGHT UP IN THE FIGHT OF DIFFERENT TRANSIT



September 14, 2020

1 AGENCIES HERE. RIDERS DON'T CARE ABOUT WHAT COLOR BUS THEY'RE  
2 CONNECTING TO. THEY DON'T CARE ABOUT THE INTERNAL STRUGGLES  
3 AND STRIVE THEY WANT TO MAKE SURE THEIR CONNECTIONS ARE MADE,  
4 AND THEY'RE BEING INCENTIVIZED TO TAKE TRANSIT BETWEEN BART  
5 AND AC TRANSIT, SO THEY CAN GET WHERE THEY'RE GOING AND  
6 QUICKLY TOO. SO I JUST WANT TO REALLY URGE THE COMMISSIONERS  
7 TO BE BOLD. WE WANT TO HELP GET THAT ADDITIONAL REVENUE, BUT  
8 WE REALLY NEED TO AGREE THAT PRIORITIZING THE RIDERS IS THE  
9 MOST IMPORTANT THING, AND THEIR TRIPS, AND THAT WE CAN FILL IN  
10 THE DETAILS OF WHERE OUR INSPIRATION IS, FROM THERE. THANK  
11 YOU.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** BOB ALLEN, AND THEN A ALETA DUPREE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANKS.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE HAVING THE CONVERSATION LOOKING AT EVERYBODY  
20 FROM PUBLIC SAFETY, GOVERNANCE, CERTAINLY THE FUNDING AND NOW  
21 SOME OF THE STRUCTURAL REFORMS, AND I THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO  
22 HAVE A SYSTEM WITH OUTCOMES WE WANT WITH MORE TRANSIT SERVICE,  
23 THEN WE UNFORTUNATELY WE NEED TO TACKLE ALL THESE THINGS. I  
24 WANT TO ECHO WHAT MONICA SAID IN TERMS OF, WE DON'T WANT TO  
25 GET TO A LONG-TERM DISCUSSION OF WHAT THE SYSTEM LOOK LIKES,



September 14, 2020

1 WHEN WE'RE STARTING WITH A THIRD LESS SERVICE. WHETHER IT'S  
2 THE FIRES WE'RE DEALING WITH, AS SPERING SAID, THE FACT THAT  
3 WE'RE STILL WAY OFF ON OUR PLANNED BAY AREA CLIMATE CHANGE  
4 GOALS, TRYING TO MAKE A CONVINCING CASE, TO RAISE MORE MONEY,  
5 I THINK IS GOING TO BE MORE CHALLENGING AFTER PEOPLE LOCALLY  
6 SEE SERVICE CUTS. I DON'T WANT TO PICK APART THE POLLING.  
7 RECENT POLL SHOWED 85 PERCENT OF PEOPLE WANT LOCAL SERVICE.  
8 FOLKS WANT MORE THAN ONE THING AND THESE THINGS WORK IN TANDEM  
9 BUT IF WE DON'T DO SOMETHING TO ROLL BACK AND PREVENT WHAT'S  
10 COMING DOWN THE PIKE I DON'T KNOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO PASS  
11 ANYTHING OR THAT WE'RE GOING HAVE A MUCH SMALLER SHELL OF A  
12 SYSTEM. THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT THAT MTC PUTS THINGS ON THE  
13 TABLE. WE'RE IN SEPTEMBER, WE'RE NOT SEEING ANALYSIS OF WHAT  
14 WE ARE GOING TO DO WHETHER WE AGREE ON THE CONSEQUENCES AS  
15 DIRECTOR MCMILLAN SAID, WE NEED HAVE DISCUSSION, THE FACT THAT  
16 WE HAVEN'T SEEN EVERYTHING WE CAN DO AND HAVE FULL DEBATE ON  
17 IN SEPTEMBER I THINK IS A PROBLEM. WHEN YOU GET TO DEBATES  
18 OVER REGIONAL MEASURE OR TRANSFORM GOVERNANCE, WHEN THERE ARE  
19 CUTS OF 68 BUS LINES THAT CAN'T BE THE STARTING PLACE WHERE  
20 ANY OF US WANT TO HAVE THIS CONVERSATION OR DREAM BIG ABOUT  
21 WHAT THE SYSTEM COULD LOOK LIKE. SO PHASE TWO SHOULDN'T BE  
22 SOMETHING THAT LOOKS LIKE PHASE ONE WHERE THE OPERATORS ARE  
23 OFF ON THEIR OWN FIGURING THIS OUT AND WE NEED TO HAVE REAL  
24 DISCUSSIONS AS CHAIR HAGGERTY SAID, ABOUT WHAT IS LOOKS LIKE  
25 TO MAKE TOUGH DECISIONS. RIGHT NOW, WE HAVEN'T SEEN WHAT THOSE



September 14, 2020

1    OPTIONS ARE, AS FAR AS WHAT MTC ACTUALLY CONTROLS AND WHAT YOU  
2    ALL CONTROL AS COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU.

3

4    **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WALLY ANY MORE SPEAKERS?

5

6    **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ALETA DUPREE.

7

8    **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** HOW MANY MORE AFTER A LIT A.

9

10   **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ONE MORE. ADAM P.

11

12   **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ADAM, YOU WILL BE OUR LAST  
13   SPEAKER. GO AHEAD ALETA.

14

15   **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR  
16   THE RECORD. A LOT OF THINGS IN THIS PRESENTATION, AND I'M  
17   DIGESTING IT ALL. I THINK CERTAINLY FOR ME, THE FARE  
18   INTEGRATION AND THE EXPANSION OF CLIPPER IS ESSENTIAL. AND  
19   ESPECIALLY IN THIS COVID WORLD, PEOPLE ARE REALLY TIRED OF  
20   PAPER TICKETS. AND SO FARE INTEGRATION IS COMPLICATED BECAUSE  
21   OF THE ISSUES OF APPORTIONMENT. AND CAN WE GET THIS 27 AGENCY  
22   SYSTEMS TO CONSOLIDATE? I DON'T KNOW. EVEN IN NEW YORK, YOU  
23   STILL HAVE MULTIPLE AGENCIES, BECAUSE YOU HAVE THE MTA IN NEW  
24   YORK, AND YOU HAVE NEW JERSEY TRANSIT IN NEW JERSEY AND YOU  
25   HAVE RAIL THAT CROSS INTO BOTH STATES CALLED PATH, TRANCE





September 14, 2020

1 HUDSON AND IN WASHINGTON, D.C., YOU HAVE THE MATCH PRO, WHICH  
2 IS IN THREE STATE LEVEL JURISDICTION, DC, MARYLAND, VIRGINIA.  
3 SO IT'S GOING TO BE A HEAVY LIFT TO BRING EVERYBODY TO THE  
4 TABLE. I THINK THE MOST DIFFICULT PART OF DEALING WITH THE  
5 MONEY IS GOING TO BE APPORTIONMENT. DIVIDING UP THE PIE, SO  
6 EVERYBODY GETS PAID. THANK YOU.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** ADAM PALVAKA.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** PERFECT. I JUST WANT TO SAY, GOING ON WITH WHAT THE  
17 LAST SPEAKER SAID APPORTIONMENT IS OBVIOUSLY A CHALLENGE BUT  
18 FROM AN ACCESSIBILITY STANDPOINT AND FROM AN END USER  
19 STANDPOINT INTEGRATING FARES IS GOING TO MAKE TRANSIT FOR THE  
20 BAY AREA EASY. HAVING TO GO FROM ONE TRANSIT SYSTEM TO ANOTHER  
21 IS A CHALLENGE IN AND OF ITSELF BUT WHETHER SOMEONE IS A  
22 LOCAL, WHETHER SOMEONE IS -- ESPECIALLY IF THEY'RE A TOURIST,  
23 HAVING TO CONSTANTLY REFARE, REPAY, RESWIPE, DO I HAVE ENOUGH  
24 ON MY CLIPPER CARD, AM I GOING TO GO OVER, NOT KNOWING HOW  
25 MUCH A TRIP IS GOING TO COST IS FRUSTRATING. THAT'S GOING TO



September 14, 2020

1 PUSH A LOT OF PEOPLE AWAY. THAT'S WHY I SAY CALTRAIN FARES ARE  
2 POPULAR BECAUSE IT'S A SET AND FORGET. I UNDERSTAND THE BACK  
3 END, YOU KNOW, THE BACK END IS OBVIOUSLY GOING TO BE A  
4 CHALLENGE, INTEGRATING ANYTHING IS GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE BUT  
5 I WOULD URGE EVERYONE TO PUT FARE INTEGRATION FOR CONSUMERS AT  
6 THE FRONT END OF THE -- AT THE HIGH END OF THE PRIORITY LIST.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THAT WAS OF THE LAST SPEAKER.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU WALLY. WAITING IN THE  
11 WINGS HERE IS STEVE KINSEY WITH CIVICKNIT AND HE HAS HEARD  
12 COMMENTS AND IS GOING TO OUTLINE ACTION PLAN, SCOPE AND NEXT  
13 STEPS. STEVE IF YOU'RE READY TO DO THAT. I'M TRYING TO KEEP US  
14 ON TIME.

15

16 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU CHAIR. YOU HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB  
17 KEEPING EVERYBODY MOVING TODAY. I WANT TO THANK THE  
18 ORGANIZATIONS, BE AGENCIES SHOULD HAVE PUT THE TIME IN TO PUT  
19 THESE PRESENTATIONS TOGETHER. I CONGRATULATE YOU ON KEEPING  
20 THEM SUCCINCT AND GETTING A LOT OF INFORMATION IN FRONT OF THE  
21 TASK FORCE WHO HAVE ENDURED THIS TWO AND A HALF HOURS OF WORK  
22 JUST BY LISTENING AND THINKING THAT'S GOING CONTINUE FOR THE  
23 NEXT 8, 9 MONTHS SO I WANT TO MAKE PINT THAT AS YOU DIGEST  
24 THIS FEEL FREE TO CHECK IN WITH MYSELF OR THE CHAIR AT ANY  
25 POINT ALONG THE WAY IF YOU WANT TO HAVE A CONVERSATION OR MAKE



September 14, 2020

1 A SUGGESTION, WE WANT TO LISTEN AND TAKE THOSE CONSIDERATIONS  
2 INTO ACCOUNT. I'M GOING TO ASK FOR THE GRAPHIC TO BE PUT UP SO  
3 WE CAN WORK OFF OF THAT. THIS IS A GRAPHIC INTENDED TO SORT OF  
4 SHOW THE ROADMAP OR THE NEXT STEPS, WHERE WE'RE HEADED AND HOW  
5 WE INTEND TO GET BETWEEN HERE AND A FINAL PLAN NEXT JUNE. AS  
6 WAS POINTED OUT BY THERESE W. MCMILLAN, WE DON'T CONSIDER  
7 EQUITY TO BE A SIDE BAR, OR A SECONDARY MATTER. IT'S A  
8 FUNCTION OF THE ENTIRE SYSTEM, THAT NEEDS TO BE DEVELOPED, AND  
9 I THINK THERE IS ALREADY BEEN, REALLY UNANIMOUS CONSENT THAT  
10 THAT NEEDS TO BE AT THE FOREFRONT. OTHER THING IMPORTANT HERE,  
11 IS STAGE TWO, THE OPERATORS ARE GOING TO LEAD AND MUST LEAD  
12 THE RECOVERY, THEY ARE THE ONES WHO NEED TO UNDERSTAND AS THE  
13 CARES ACT DIMINISHES TO ZERO AND WHEN THE FUNDING FROM FEDERAL  
14 AGENCIES IS GOING TO COME THROUGH. SO THEY WILL LEAD THAT, BUT  
15 AS WAS POINTED OUT IN THE PRESENTATION, THAT THE OPERATORS  
16 MADE THERE ARE SOME INNOVATIONS THAT THEY'RE LOOKING AT AS  
17 THEY'RE TRYING TO RESPOND TO A TOUGH SITUATION THAT MAY BE  
18 USEFUL AND INFORMATIVE TO THE IDEA OF TRANSFORMATIVE WAYS TO  
19 DELIVER TRANSIT. SO WE NEED TO SUPPORT THE OPERATORS IN THIS  
20 CRITICAL TIME. WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE THAT THEY HAVE ALL HANDS  
21 ON DECK JUST TO DEAL WITH THE SITUATION IN FRONT OF THEM. AND  
22 WE DEFINITELY THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THEM TO STAY INVOLVED  
23 WITH US BECAUSE THEY KNOW A LOT ABOUT WHAT IT WILL TAKE TO  
24 MAKE A TRANSFORMATION WORK, EVEN AS THEY GO THROUGH THE ISSUES  
25 THAT ARE RIGHT IN FRONT OF THEIR FACE EVERY SINGLE DAY. THE



September 14, 2020

1 PRESENTATIONS WE HEARD TODAY WERE DIVERSE. THEY SHOWED  
2 PRIORITIES FROM DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES AND THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT  
3 WE WANTED. AND THEY IDENTIFIED A RANGE OF DIFFERENT PRIORITIES  
4 THAT THE TASK FORCE COULD POSSIBLY TAKE. I WANTED TO MENTION  
5 THAT SPUR HAS LET ME KNOW THAT WITHIN THE NEXT MONTH, PROBABLY  
6 BEFORE THE NEXT TASK FORCE MEETING, THEY ARE GOING TO BE  
7 RELEASING THEIR OWN VERSION OF THE TRANSIT COORDINATOR FOR THE  
8 BAY AREA, ACHIEVING SEAMLESS TRANSIT, WHICH IS THEIR MORE  
9 DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF WHAT THEY THINK A SYSTEM LIKE THAT  
10 COULD LOOK LIKE UNDER A NETWORK MANAGER APPROACH, AND I WANT  
11 TO INVITE ALL THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, THEY HAVE BEEN DEVELOPING  
12 THEIR OWN WHITE PAPERS, I THINK DURING THIS STAGE, THE NEXT 60  
13 DAYS WE'RE REALLY STILL WELCOMING NEW IDEAS AND DIFFERENT  
14 THOUGHTS THAT WILL HELP TO SHAPE AND IN FACT FOCUS THE WORK  
15 THAT THE TASKING FORCES GOING TO TAKE ON. IN TERMS OF THE  
16 PROCESS, A COUPLE OF THINGS I WANT TO SHOW HERE ABOUT PROCESS,  
17 THE BAR THERE ACROSS THE TOP. YOU KNOW, NEXT MONTH IS REALLY  
18 YOUR MONTH AS A TASK FORCE. WE'RE GOING TO SPEND THE TIME  
19 HELPING YOU DEFINE WHAT ARE THOSE KEY OBJECTIVES, THAT YOU  
20 WANT TO ACHIEVE. HOW CAN WE REALIZE THOSE OBJECTIVES, WHAT  
21 DIFFERENT TECHNIQUES AND WHAT DIFFERENT WAYS NEED TO BE  
22 EVALUATED AND THAT'S FOLLOWED, OCTOBER WILL BE FOCUSED ON  
23 THAT, NOVEMBER WILL ALLOW US TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS BASED ON WHAT  
24 WE HAVE HEARD IN THE OCTOBER MEETING, AS WELL AS TODAY AND  
25 EVEN IN JULY, SOME EARLY THOUGHTS THEN WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON



September 14, 2020

1 A RANGE OF ISSUES CUSTOMER BASED EXPERIENCE, AND ULTIMATE  
2 MECHANISMS THAT WE NEED MAKE THESE THINGS HAPPEN. THOSE  
3 RECOMMENDATIONS WE'RE ALLOWING YOU A COUPLE OF MONTHS TO REACH  
4 FOR AND STRIVE FOR A CONSENSUS IF YOU CAN, AND IF NOT TO  
5 REALLY ALLOW FOR THE DIVERSE OPINIONS TO BE ADEQUATELY AND  
6 FAIRLY REPRESENTED TO THE COMMISSION. WE HAVE A HARD STOP IN  
7 JUNE. THIS TASK FORCE IS GOING TO COMPLETE ITS WORK BY JUNE,  
8 AND AFTER THAT, THE COMMISSION WILL CONSIDER YOUR  
9 RECOMMENDATIONS, AND TAKE ACTION ON THE ONES THAT THEY CONCUR  
10 WITH. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. SO, IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS  
11 ON THIS, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER THEM NOW. AS I SAID, YOU'RE ALSO  
12 WELCOME TO CHECK IN WITH ME, STEVE AT CIVICKNIT.COM WITH ANY  
13 COMMENTS YOU MIGHT HAVE. I ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT IN  
14 ADDITION TO THE AGENCIES, IT'S REALLY ADMIRABLE THE PUBLIC WHO  
15 HAVE PARTICIPATED HAVE KEPT YOUR COMMENTS CONCISE AND CLEAR  
16 AND WE WELCOME THAT AS WELL. OF THE WITH THAT, THAT WILL  
17 COMPLETE THIS. THERE WILL BE SOME SORT OF SUMMARY COMMENTS  
18 I'LL MAKE AFTER THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM. IS

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. CHAIR HAGGERTY? SCOTT? DO YOU  
21 WANT TO COMMENT?

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YEAH. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. SO GOING BACK  
24 TO THAT SLIDE, WHEN I TALKED EARLIER ABOUT CONSOLIDATION, I  
25 DON'T REALLY SEE ANY OF THAT.



September 14, 2020

1

2 **STEVE KINSEY:** I THINK THIS'S IN THE IMPLEMENTATION STAGE,  
3 SCOTT, IF WE PUT THE SLIDE BACK UP, YOU WILL SEE THAT ISSUE,  
4 THE SPECTRUM OF SYSTEM MANAGEMENT OPTIONS, THAT'S REALLY  
5 WITHIN THAT SPECTRUM, AND I USE THAT TERM, BECAUSE THAT WAS  
6 THE WAY THE SLIDE WAS PRESENTED. BUT, CERTAINLY, CONSOLIDATION  
7 FITS WITHIN THAT, AND TODAY I HEARD VERY STRONG INTEREST  
8 ACROSS THE BOARD IN REALLY LOOKING AT MAKING REAL CHANGE  
9 HAPPEN. SO THAT'S WHEN WE'LL BE ABLE TO TACKLE THAT. WE'RE NOT  
10 GOING TO AVOID IT BY ANY MEANS.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I THINK I WOULD HAVE FELT BETTER IF IT  
13 WAS SPELLED OUT BETTER. I THINK THIS COMMITTEE SHOULD  
14 RECOMMEND TO MTC THAT WE MAKE AVAILABLE AT LEAST FUNDING FOR  
15 TWO CONSOLIDATIONS. AND LET THE CARRIERS, THE TRANSIT  
16 AGENCIES, VOLUNTEER. YOU KNOW, I HAVE SAT ON ONE -- I THINK  
17 JIM, OUR CHAIRMAN HAS SAT ON THOSE CONSOLIDATIONS, THEY'RE NOT  
18 FUN. I HAVE SAT ON THEM. THEY'RE NOT FUN ULTIMATELY THE ONE I  
19 LOOKED AT GOT DOWN TO 13 RULES. I THINK MTC SHOULD MAKE A  
20 BOARD TO RECOMMENDATION CONSOLIDATIONS AND TRY TO FIND A  
21 MEDIUM CARRIERS THAT ARE CONTIGUOUS THAT MAYBE THEY'LL TALK  
22 ABOUT IT IF THEY KNOW THE FUNDING IS THERE CERTAINLY TWO  
23 GENERAL MANAGERS CAN GET TOGETHER WITH THEIR BOARD AND MAYBE  
24 SOME MERGING I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO FUND THE ISSUE. AND  
25 MAKE IT AVAILABLE FOR SOMEBODY TO DO THE WORK. WE'RE GETTING



September 14, 2020

1 AHEAD RIGHT NOW WE'RE JUST SAYING LET'S LOOK AT IT AND WE'RE  
2 GETTING NOWHERE. YOU'RE SAYING HARD STOP IN JUNE AND I CAN  
3 TELL YOU THERE'S A HARD STOP IN JANUARY FOR ME. BUT WE GOT TO  
4 PUT CARROTS OUT THERE TO GET PEOPLE TO BITE ON SOME OF THIS.

5

6 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH STEVE, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT OUR  
9 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES, I HOPE WE GET TO PUTTING SOME OF THOSE  
10 ISSUES BEFORE THIS COMMITTEE SOONER RATHER THAN LATER TO START  
11 TALKING ABOUT THE VERY THING CHAIR HAGGERTY JUST DISCUSSED.  
12 BUT I MEAN WE HAVE HAD A COUPLE PRESENTATIONS HERE TODAY WITH  
13 MANY OPTIONS, AND I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO SPEAK TO THE  
14 VARIOUS OPTIONS AND SEE IF WE HAVE CONSENSUS AMONG THE  
15 COMMITTEE TO MOVE FORWARD ON SOME OF THEM.

16

17 **STEVE KINSEY:** VERY GOOD MR. CHAIR, YOU HAVE MADE IT PINT  
18 THROUGHOUT THIS, THAT YOU DON'T WANT THE MTC AND THE OPERATORS  
19 TO JUST TRY AND FIND COMMON GROUND AND TRY TO PRESENT A  
20 UNIFIED POSITION. YOU WANT EACH OF THEM TO FEEL INDEPENDENT  
21 AND CAPABLE PUTTING FORWARD WHAT THEY THINK MAKES THE MOST  
22 SENSE. YOU ARE ALSO LOOKING TO THE WISDOM OF YOUR TASK FORCE,  
23 THAT INCLUDES REPRESENTATIONS FROM LABOR SOCIAL JUSTICE AND  
24 ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS AND OTHERS. IT'S MY EXPECTATION THAT WHAT  
25 WE SHOULD BE BRINGING BACK TO YOU IN OCTOBER, IS AN ATTEMPT ON



September 14, 2020

1 MY PART, TO HAVE LISTENED TO ALL THOSE DIFFERENT FORCES AND  
2 TRY TO PRESENT TO YOU AND YOUR TASK FORCE SOME VERY SPECIFIC  
3 OBJECTIVES. GOALS TOO, OBJECTIVES EVEN MORE SPECIFICALLY TO  
4 GET DOWN TO THE OBJECTIVE YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT AND LET PUSH  
5 BACK ON THE ONES THAT YOU THINK ARE OFF BASE AND ADD TO ONES  
6 YOU DIDN'T HEAR. WE WILL CONTINUE TO LOOK TO THE TASK FORCE  
7 REPRESENTATIVE IT IS ACROSS THE SPECTRUM OVER THE NEXT MONTHS  
8 TO HAVE SOMETHING DEFINITIVE FOR YOU TO REACT TO.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IAN DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT BRIEFLY?

11

12 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** JUST BRIEFLY. I THINK I AGREE WITH THE SPIRIT  
13 OF WHAT CHAIR HAGGERTY JUST STATED WHICH IS THE IMPLEMENTATION  
14 -- GETTING, THE TOPIC OF GOVERNANCE IS SUCH A LARGE TOPIC THAT  
15 I THINK WE HAVE TO KIND OF STRETCH THAT OUT EARLIER, AND TEND  
16 TO IDENTIFY THE SCOPE FOR THAT WORK AND UNDERTAKING THAT WORK  
17 IMMEDIATELY, EVEN THOUGH THE BULK OF THE DISCUSSION MAY NOT  
18 HAPPEN UNTIL JANUARY, I THINK THERE ARE QUESTIONS, AND I SEE  
19 THESE AS MORE CONCURRENT ELEMENTS BUT I AGREE THAT WE SHOULD  
20 FORCE -- YOU KNOW, MAKE SURE WE DON'T PUT OFF DISCUSSIONS  
21 UNTIL JANUARY BUT WE BEGIN TO STRATEGIZE AROUND THEM  
22 IMMEDIATELY.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ELLEN, CAN WE RESPOND TO YOUR  
25 QUESTION OFFLINE?





September 14, 2020

1

2 **ELLEN WU:** I HAVE A QUESTION?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** DID THE QUESTION GET ANSWERED, THE  
5 ONE ABOUT DIRECTING THE FUNDING FOR THE --

6

7 **ELLEN WU:** YES THERESE MENTIONED THEY WERE IN THE PROCESS OF  
8 DOING IT SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING MORE ABOUT THAT.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GINA?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO ITERATE THEY AGREE WITH CHAIR  
13 HAGGERTY. WE NEED SPECIFICS TO PRESENT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **STEVE KINSEY:** CHAIR ONE LAST THING THAT I NEGLECTED TO SAY.  
18 NEXT MONTH WE'LL COME BACK TO YOU WITH CLARITY TO THE EXTENT  
19 THAT WE CAN PROVIDE TO THE EXISTING SURVEYS THAT HAVE BEEN  
20 DONE. I THINK WE OWE YOU THAT AND WILL HAVE SOMETHING IN THE  
21 WAY OF A SUMMARY.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. LET'S MOVE ON TO  
24 PUBLIC COMMENTS. -- DO YOU HAVE ANYONE FROM PUBLIC COMMENTS  
25 WALLY?



September 14, 2020

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. YES. THERE IS ONE. HOLD ON. SORRY.  
3 IT'S MY SYSTEM IS KIND OF FROZEN. ROLAND.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YES. OKAY. GREAT. VERY BRIEFLY, I WANT TO COMMENT. I  
6 HOPE YOU HAVE READ THE TWO LETTERS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
7 YOUR AGENDA. AND I WANT YOU TO ADDRESS THE SAME THING, MAKE A  
8 RECOMMENDATION, I MAY BE WRONG ABOUT THIS ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED  
9 AT THE LAST MTC COMMISSION, BUT FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, WHAT  
10 BASICALLY HAPPENED WAS THIS PLAN THAT CAME FROM ALL THE  
11 AGENCIES. IS THAT THIS PROCESS WASN'T ESSENTIALLY CONSULTANT  
12 DRIVEN AND THERE WAS A LACK OF OUTREACH ON THE FRONT LINES ON  
13 BOTH THE TRANSIT OPERATOR SIDE, AND THE RIDERS. SO MOVING  
14 FORWARD, WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IS A RECOMMENDATION FROM  
15 THIS COMMITTEE DIRECTING STEVE KINSEY TO REVIEW THE TESTIMONY  
16 THAT TOOK PLACE AT THE COMMISSION. ARE YOU OKAY SCOTT?  
17 CHARACTERIZE THE COMMENTS MADE AT THE LAST MEETING, AND  
18 ALIGNMENT ABOUT THE OPERATORS, DRIVERS, AND THE RIDERS. THANK  
19 YOU.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'RE REAL CLOSE TO  
22 ADJOURNMENT TRYING TO KEEP ON SCHEDULE. SO COMMITTEE MEMBERS,  
23 IF YOU HAVE SOMETHING SPECIFIC THAT YOU WANT TO HAVE STEVE  
24 KINSEY FOCUS ON, BETWEEN NOW AND OUR NEXT MEETING, PLEASE  
25 CONTACT HIM. AND I'M CERTAINLY GOING TO DO SO. SO AS THE



September 14, 2020

1 CHAIRMAN. I WOULD LIKE TO GET TO SOME OF THESE ISSUES BEFORE  
2 SO WE CAN START TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS. I WOULD LIKE TO  
3 SEPARATE WHERE MTC HAS AUTHORITY AND WHERE WE'RE GOING TO NEED  
4 LEGISLATION. THAT'S GOING TO BE AN IMPORTANT PIERCE. MTC, I  
5 HOPE, THERESE WE'RE GOING TO START LOOKING AT WHERE MTC HAS  
6 DISCRETION. I AGREE WITH SCOTT HAGGERTY, I WAS HOPING  
7 ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHIU WOULD INTRODUCE LEGISLATION TO SAY SOLANO  
8 COUNTY CAN ONLY HAVE ONE OPERATOR BUT I'M NOT SURE HE'S READY  
9 TO DO THAT. BUT THINGS TO LOOK AT.

10

11 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** [INDISCERNIBLE] TOO.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THINK NAPA ALREADY --

14

15 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MR. CHAIRMAN, CAN I ASK SOMETHING? I  
16 GUESS I'M CURIOUS AS TO A RESPONSE FROM THERESE, IN  
17 RELATIONSHIP TO WHAT I BROUGHT UP. MAYBE TAKING IT TO A  
18 COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS THIS, IT'S SIMPLY JUST PAYING FOR THE  
19 STUDY TO LOOK AT THE MERGER OF WILLING TRANSIT LINES. AND  
20 THERE MAY BE A COUPLE OUT THERE. SO, I'M TRYING TO KICK START  
21 -- I'M TRYING TO KICK START SOME ACTION. IS

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THERESE?

24



September 14, 2020

1   **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WHAT I WOULD SUGGEST IS, FIRST, I THINK  
2   THERE HAS BEEN A NUMBER OF, AND I CAN CONSULT WITH STEVE  
3   KINSEY, I THINK THERE HAS BEEN PROPOSALS TO CONSULT WITH  
4   ASSISTANCE. FRANKLY I WOULD NEED TO CHECK ON BUDGET TO SEE  
5   WHAT FUNDING IS POSSIBLE TO SUPPORT ADDITIONAL WORK OF THE  
6   BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. AND THERE WOULD NEED TO BE SOME CLEAR  
7   DECISIONS ABOUT PRIORITIES ON WHERE TO DIRECT THAT. IT IS  
8   LIMITED, IF AT ALL, AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT REVIEW,  
9   THEY WOULD NEED TO BRING FORWARD IN TERMS OF ANY CONTINUED  
10   DISCUSSIONS IN WHAT CONSULTANT ASSISTANCE, OVER THE LIFESPAN  
11   OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, YOU WOULD WANT TO DIRECT.

12

13   **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WELL I -- LOOK, I FEEL LIKE IF WE  
14   COULDN'T FUNDING A STUDY TO HAVE TWO WILLING PARTICIPANTS LOOK  
15   AT MERGER THEN WE'RE JUST WASTING OUR TIME HERE. IF WE CAN'T  
16   AFFORD THAT, HOW ARE WE GOING TO AFFORD ALL THE OTHER STUFF WE  
17   WANT TO LOOK AT. I GUESS I'LL WAIT UNTIL MORE THOUGHT IS PUT  
18   INTO T I JUST THINK -- I'M JUST TRYING TO KICK START  
19   SOMETHING. WE CAN JUST SIT HERE AND HAVE THESE MEETINGS, BUT I  
20   WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE SOMETHING COME OUT OF IT.

21

22   **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THAT COULD BE AN ISSUE, SCOTT, THAT  
23   MTC CAN TAKE UP, THE COMMITTEE CAN RESPOND TO WHATEVER --

24



September 14, 2020

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THAT'S WHAT I ASKED, IS IF WE COULD TAKE  
2 IT TO COMMITTEE, MR. CHAIRMAN, AND MAYBE SHOULD YOU BRING IT  
3 TO YOURS.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. YEAH. WE CAN DEFINITELY DO  
6 THAT. SO WITH THAT, I JUST WANT TO GO AHEAD AND WRAP THIS UP.  
7 I KNOW EVERYBODY'S TIME IS VALUABLE. SO STEVE, DO YOU HAVE  
8 ENOUGH DIRECTION, AND I THINK THE COMMITTEE IS ASKING TO YOU  
9 BE AGGRESSIONS TESTIFY ASK YOU TO COME BACK WITH ITEMS TO  
10 DISCUSS AND START MOVING STRATEGIES FORWARD. STEVE YOU'RE  
11 MUTED. STEVE KINSEY, YOU'RE MUTED.

12

13 **STEVE KINSEY:** THANK YOU FOR MUTING ME. LISTEN, I WILL JUST  
14 SAY, I WAS GOING TO RUN OVER A SUMMARY OF COMMENTS THAT WERE  
15 MADE BUT I WON'T. I'LL PUT THE ONE THAT'S AT THE TOP OF MY  
16 LIST. BUSINESS AS USUAL WON'T CUT T YOU CAN BE SURE I'LL COME  
17 BACK WITH TANGIBLE THINGS AND CHAIR HAGGERTY I'M ASKING YOU  
18 FOR ONE MONTH TO TRY TO LET US BRING THIS BACK SO YOU CAN SEE  
19 THINGS THAT ARE TANGIBLE AND JANUARY 4TH IS A MEANINGFUL  
20 MEETING IN YOUR LIFE.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'M RUNNING OUT OF MONTHS.

23

24 **STEVE KINSEY:** I KNOW. I HEAR YOU, BROTHER. THANK YOU CHAIR.

25



September 14, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU EVERYONE. I LOOK FORWARD TO  
2 DISCUSSIONS NEXT MONTH. WITH THAT OUR MEETING IS ADJOURNED.  
3 [ADJOURNED]

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26



*Broadcasting Government*