





Meeting Transcript

Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*



Meeting Transcript

To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.



Meeting Transcript

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 12, 2020, 9:40 AM**
4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING. WELCOME TO THE
6 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. CHAIR IS ABSENT TODAY.
7 SO I'M --
8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I'M HERE.
10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** OH NICK YOU'RE HERE. OH I WAS
12 TOLD YOU WERE GOING TO BE ABSENT. SO TAKE OVER, PLEASE.
13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. I THINK THERE WAS PROBABLY A
15 MIX-UP. SO SORRY ABOUT THAT. WHY DON'T YOU JUST CONTINUE
16 BECAUSE I DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE THE SCRIPT RIGHT IN FRONT OF ME.
17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. I CAN DO
19 THAT. IN THIS CASE I'M VICE CHAIR CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI. I WILL
20 CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND CAN YOU ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT,
21 PLEASE. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A
22 ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S
23 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS
24 OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
25 SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND



Meeting Transcript

1 OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
2 RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
3 PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED
4 ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.
5 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM,
6 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
7 STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
8 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
9 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC
10 SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING
11 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING
12 TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING
13 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE
14 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
15 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
16 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE
17 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS
18 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
19 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
20 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
21 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
22 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
23 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
24 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

25



August 12, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, COULD I HAVE YOU
2 CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM THE QUORUM PLEASE?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABSOLUTELY. COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

5

6 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** PRESENT.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ? NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

23

24 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TAVARES IS ABSENT. AND WORTH?

2

3 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM
8 TWO, OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON
9 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, KIMBERLY?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED,
12 AND I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** OKAY. THAT BEING THE CASE, DO
15 WE HAVE A MOTION FROM ANYBODY FOR OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I'LL MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR, BRUINS.

18

19 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** SECOND, GLOVER.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER BRUINS AND
22 SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
25 UNANIMOUSLY



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.
3 I HAVE NOW GOT THE SCRIPT NOW IN FRONT OF ME.

4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** OKAY. NICK YOU'RE IN CHARGE.
6 GO FOR IT.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
9 FOR STARTING. AGENDA ITEM 3A MTC RESOLUTION 4320 REVISED,
10 REVISES THE REGIONAL MEANS-BASED PROGRAM TO EXPAND THE CLIPPER
11 START PILOT BEYOND THE FOUR ORIGINALLY ENROLLED IN THE PILOT
12 INTERESTED BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES. JUDIS SANTOS AND LYSA
13 HALE.

14

15 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU. I'M JUDIS SANTOS PROGRAMMING MANAGER
16 FOR EQUITY AND ACCESS PROGRAM SECTION MTC AND ABAG. I'M HERE
17 WITH LYSA HALE WHO SERVES AS THE PROGRAM DELIVERY MANAGER FOR
18 CLIPPER START IN THE ELECTRONIC PAYMENT SECTION. I AM PLEASED
19 TO PRESENT THE REVISION OF THE REGIONAL MEANS-BASED TRANSIT
20 FARE PROGRAM FRAMEWORK IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19 IN RESPONSE TO
21 MTC'S AND ABAG'S BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE REQUEST BY TRANSIT
22 OPERATORS AND PUBLIC RESPONSIBILITY TO IMPROVE TRANSIT FOR
23 MARGINALIZED. TRANSIT FARE PILOT PROGRAM ALSO KNOWN AS CLIPPER
24 START WAS LAUNCHED. THIS PROGRAM INCLUDED FOUR TRANSIT
25 OPERATORS, BART IS OFFERING A 20 PERCENT DISCOUNT AND



Meeting Transcript

1 CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HIGHWAY AND TRANSPORTATION
2 DISTRICT AND THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
3 OFFERING A 50 PERCENT DISCOUNT ON A SINGLE RIDE FOR ELIGIBLE
4 ADULT INDIVIDUALS EARNING A LOW INCOME. THE VISION OF THE
5 REGIONAL MEANS-BASED TRANSIT FARE PILOT PROGRAM WILL EXPAND
6 THE PARTICIPATION IN THE CLIPPER SMART PILOT TO AN ADDITIONAL
7 17 INTERESTED BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES LISTED IN ATTACHMENT
8 B. EACH TRANSIT AGENCY'S PARTICIPATION AND DISCOUNT OFFERING
9 IS SUBJECT TO THE GOVERNING BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. EXPANSION IS
10 BEING FUNDED THROUGH MTC ONE PERCENT SHARE AND SECOND
11 DISTRIBUTION OF CARES FUNDING TRANCHE TWO APPROVED IN JULY.
12 100 PERCENT OF THE MTC SHARE IN TRANCHE TWO UNDERSCORES PILOT
13 FOR ADDITIONAL. PILOT THROUGH JANUARY 2022 AND PROGRAM
14 ELEMENTS -- INCLUDING INCLUSION IN THE PILOT'S EQUITY AND
15 ACCESS PROGRAM EVALUATION WILL BE CONDUCTED AT THE BASELINE
16 MIDPOINT AND AT THE END OF THE PILOT. [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS
17 CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION, AND LYSA AND I ARE HERE TO ADDRESS
18 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY COMMENTS FROM
21 COMMISSIONERS? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
22 COMMENT?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT.
25 BUT I DO HAVE ONE RAISED HAND FROM ALETA DUPREE.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YOU'RE UP ALETA.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
5 FOR THE RECORD. I REITERATE TO YOU, THIS IS VERY, VERY
6 IMPORTANT. AND IN MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE OF TRANSIT, NOT JUST
7 IN THE BAY AREA, BUT IN A NUMBER OF OTHER PLACES, TRAVEL HAS
8 BECOME REGIONAL FOR ME. I WENT TO NEW YORK, BUT I STAYED THE
9 NIGHT IN NEW JERSEY, TOOK A BUS, RODE A SUBWAY, AND THEN TOOK
10 A TRAIN TO CONNECTICUT, PLEA STATES IN ONE TRIP. WHEN YOU ADD
11 MORE IT COSTS MORE MONEY. AVERAGE COST OF OWNING A CAR IN
12 AMERICA IS ABOUT \$700 A MONTH. SO I URGE YOU TO APPROVE THIS
13 IN RESPONSE TO THE COMMISSION THIS RULE WILL MAKE A DIFFERENCE
14 FOR OUR LONGER DISTANCE COMMUTERS, OFTEN FALL UNDER LOWER
15 INCOMES, AND HELP PEOPLE TO GET CLIPPER CARDS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALETA. OKAY. IF THERE IS NO
18 OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT. DO I HAVE A MOTION? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

19

20 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL SECOND THAT. DUTRA-
21 VERNACI, SECOND.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOVED BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. SECOND BY
24 DUTRA-VERNACI. LET'S GET A VOTE.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
2 UNANIMOUSLY.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. AGENDA ITEM 4A TRANSPORTATION
5 FUNDING AND HOUSING LINKAGES CONSENSUS PROPOSES MEMORIALIZING,
6 JANUARY 2020 WORKSHOP LINKING TRANSPORTATION FUNDING TO -- I'M
7 GOING TO SLIGHTLY MODIFY THIS, TO COMPLIANCE WITH STATE LAW
8 AROUND HOUSING REQUIREMENTS. TERESA ROMELL WILL PRESENT THIS
9 ITEM.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND DIRECTORS TERESA
12 ROMELL. WHILE IT SEEMS LIKE IT'S BEEN A LONG TIME IN JANUARY
13 2020 THE COMMISSION HELD A WORKSHOP LINKING TRANSPORTATION TO
14 FUNDING HOUSING OUTCOMES. STAFF PRESENTATION BEGAN WITH A
15 RECAP OF MANY PAST DISCUSSIONS ON THIS TOPIC, INCLUDING THE
16 LIMITATIONS TO CONDITIONING DUE TO FUNDING CONSTRAINTS AND
17 TARGETING USES. STAFF ALSO PRESENTED PROPOSED APPROACHES TO
18 CONDITIONING SUBSET OF APPROACH TO RESOURCES ON HOUSING.
19 WORKSHOP CONCLUDED WITH COMMISSIONER CONSENSUS THAT THIS
20 AGENDA ITEM SEEKS TO FORMALIZE FOR THE PURPOSE OF GUIDING
21 FUTURE PROGRAM FUNDING DEVELOPMENT AND GUIDELINES AND
22 POLICIES. CONSENSUS WOULD SIGNIFICANTLY NARROW THE FOCUS OF
23 CONDITIONING EFFORTS TO THE NEXT CYCLE OF ONE BAY AREA PROGRAM
24 OBAG THREE AS WE CALL IT. OBAG THREE IS A PROGRAM FUNDED WITH
25 FLEXIBLE FUND SOURCES AND INCLUDES INCENTIVES AND CONDITIONS



Meeting Transcript

1 RELATED TO HOUSING PERFORMANCE. SPECIFICALLY IT WAS AGREED AT
2 THE WORKSHOP THAT ELIGIBILITY FOR OBAG THREE FUNDS WOULD
3 REQUIRE COMPLIANCE WITH REGIONAL HOUSING STANDARDS. STAFF
4 AGREED AT THE TIME IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE TO CONSIDER FUNDING
5 SPLIT BETWEEN THE COUNTY AND REGIONAL PROGRAMS. AT THE TIME
6 THERE WAS DISCUSSION ABOUT POTENTIALLY INCREASING THE COUNTY
7 SHARE OF THE PROGRAM ALTHOUGH COMMISSIONERS WANTED TO BETTER
8 UNDERSTAND THE TRADEOFFS WITH THE REGIONAL PROGRAM THAT WOULD
9 ENTAIL. THIRD, THE COMMISSION AGREED IT WOULD CONSIDER USING
10 INCREMENTAL FUNDING INCREASES TO OBAG THREE PROGRAM TO AWARD
11 OR INCENTIVIZE HOUSING PERFORMANCE. PERHAPS SOMETHING SIMILAR
12 TO THE HOUSING INCENTIVE POOL PROGRAM THAT WAS DEVELOPED TO
13 AWARD TOP PERFORMERS AND -- SUCH PROGRAM IF INTRODUCED WOULD
14 BE THE SUBJECT OF COMMISSION DIRECTION AND APPROVAL. ON THE
15 SECOND AND THIRD POINTS, I WANT TO STRESS THAT THE CONSENSUS
16 BEFORE YOU TODAY DOES NOT PROPOSE ANY SPECIFIC DISTRIBUTION
17 FOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM BUT SIMPLY ENSURES THE COMMISSION WILL
18 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THE POTENTIAL AT THE
19 APPROPRIATE TIME. I WANT TO MAKE SURE TO NOTE THAT NOTHING IN
20 THIS CONSENSUS CHANGES THE FACT THAT THE FUNDING IN QUESTION,
21 OBAG FUNDS MAY BE SPENT ON ELIGIBLE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS
22 AND PROGRAMS. I ALSO WANT TO NOTE THAT ALTHOUGH HOUSING
23 ELEMENT LAW HAS CHANGED SIGNIFICANTLY IN REPRESENTATIVE YEARS
24 THE STATE HAS DEDICATED FUNDING TO SUPPORT LOCAL JURISDICTION
25 IN DEVELOPING COMPLIANT HOUSING POLICIES IN SACRIFICE OTHER



Meeting Transcript

1 STATE LAW REQUIREMENTS INCLUDING 24 MILLION IN REGIONAL EARLY
2 ACTION PLANNING OR WHEAT FUNDS INCLUDING LOCAL COMPONENT LEAP.
3 THERE IS ASSISTANCE AVAILABLE TO HELP JURISDICTIONS WITH
4 COMPLIANCE AND MEETING DESIRED HOUSING OUTCOMES. ATTACHMENT A
5 TO YOUR AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY INCLUDES FIVE SPECIFIC POINTS TO
6 THE CONSENSUS. FIRST, ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING UNDER THE NEXT
7 CYCLE OF THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM JURISDICTION MUST
8 COMPLY WITH STATE HOUSING ALLOWS CERTIFIED BY HCD SUBMIT
9 ANNUAL HOUSING PROGRESS REPORTS THROUGHOUT THE FUNDING CYCLE,
10 ADOPT RESOLUTION AFFIRMING COMPLIANCE WITH SURPLUS LANDS ACT
11 AND SUBMIT TO HCD LOCAL INVENTORY OF SURPLUS LAND.
12 JURISDICTION WILL ALSO BE REQUIRED TO DENIAL STRAIGHT
13 COMPLIANCE WITH STATE LAWS GOVERNING DENSITY BONUSES,
14 ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS AND HOUSING ACCOUNTABILITY ACT. IN
15 TERMS OF COMPLIANCE STAFF WILL DEVELOP A PROCESS TO DETERMINE
16 COMPLIANCE WITH THE RELEVANT HOUSING LAWS IN THE MOST
17 STREAMLINED AND COORDINATED MANNER POSSIBLE AND WILL CONTINUE
18 TO VERIFY THE STATUS OF HOUSING ELEMENTS AND ANNUAL HOUSING
19 PROGRESS REPORTS TO HCD PERFORMANCE PROCEDURES. ALL OTHER
20 HOUSING LAWS REQUIRED TO OBAG THREE MTC STAFF PROPOSES SELF
21 CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE BY WAY OF BOARD RESOLUTION AND
22 OPINION OF COUNSEL UNLESS THE BOARD DEVELOPS A WAY TO TRACK T
23 ADDITIONALLY EVIDENCE OF A HOUSING ACCOUNTABILITY ACT
24 VIOLATION MAY TRIGGER A CASE SPECIFIC EVALUATION OF REQUIRED
25 COMPLIANCE AND FUNDING ELIGIBILITY BY MTC STAFF AND IN



Meeting Transcript

1 COOPERATION WITH HCD. .3 OF THE FRAMEWORK STATES CYCLES STAFF
2 WILL UPDATE HOUSING LAWS THAT JURISDICTION MUST COMPLY TO BE
3 AVAILABLE FOR FUNDING FOR EACH CYCLE OF FUNDING AND SHOULD
4 ADDITIONAL HOUSING LAWS BE ENACTED IN ADOPTION OF OBAG THREE
5 GUIDELINES STAFF WILL REQUIRE MODIFICATIONS IF NECESSARY FOR
6 REQUIREMENTS. OBAG FUNDING FOR COUNTY AND STATE SHARES STAFF
7 WILL RAISE CONSIDERATION FOR SPLIT. AS PERTAINING TO GUIDELINE
8 DEVELOPMENT STAFF WILL PROVIDE TYPES OF EXPENDITURE PROGRAMS
9 FUNDED THROUGH OBAG TWO REGIONAL PROGRAMS FOR INDIVIDUAL
10 DISCUSSION PURPOSES. LASTLY .5 ADDRESSES POTENTIAL FUNDING AND
11 STATES IF THE REGION RECEIVES A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN
12 FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUES ABOVE THOSE FORECASTED FOR THE
13 OBAG THREE PROGRAM HORIZON, AND THE SHARE IS INCREASED THAT
14 THE COMMISSION WILL CONSIDER USING THAT INCREMENT TO AWARD OR
15 INCENTIVIZE HOUSING PERFORMANCE. IN CLOSING STAFF
16 RECOMMENDATIONS MEMORIALIZING THE CONSENSUS JUST DISCUSSED
17 PARTICULARLY TO GUIDE DISCUSSIONS RELATED TO THE OBAG THREE
18 PROGRAM WHICH ARE ANTICIPATED TO BEGIN NEXT SPRING. WE ASK
19 THAT YOU -- TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND FUNDING LINKAGES TO THE
20 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THAT'S MY PRESENTATION. I WANT TO
21 NOTE THAT DANIEL SAVER WITH OUR INTEGRATED PLANNING SECTION IS
22 HERE HE WORKS ON OUR HOUSING PROGRAMS, IS AVAILABLE TO ANSWER
23 ANY QUESTIONS THAT MIGHT BE SPECIFIC TO THE CERTIFICATION
24 REQUIREMENTS.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
2 PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. CONSENSUS, AS TO POINTS 1
5 THROUGH 3, NO PROBLEM WHATSOEVER. I DO HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT THE
6 CONSENSUS OF 4 AND 5. I KNOW THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
7 POTENTIAL REVISIONS. AND SO THAT KIND OF MAKES IT DIFFICULT
8 WHEN YOU'RE SAYING CONSENSUS HERE. COUNTIES ONLY RECEIVE 42
9 PERCENT OF THE FUNDING. AND SO I FIND THAT THERE IS LITTLE
10 INFORMATION SUPPORTING CHANGES AT THIS POINT IN TIME. CONCERNS
11 THAT WE HAVE ARE THAT INCREASING THE WEIGHT OF HOUSING
12 PRODUCTION AND DISTRIBUTION OF FURTHER OBAG FUNDS COULD
13 SIGNIFICANTLY DISADVANTAGE SMALLER COUNTIES AND SMALL CITIES.
14 REWARDING INCENTIVES FOR PRODUCTION COULD BENEFIT, ACTUALLY,
15 THE LARGER CITIES, AND LARGER PROJECTS THAT THEY MIGHT HAVE.
16 SO JUST AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE, TO SAY CONSENSUS WHEN WE
17 DON'T REALLY SEE ALL THE EVIDENCE ON THIS ASPECT, AND HOW IT
18 WILL PROCEED, I FIND PROBLEMATIC, AND WE ARE IN DIRE NEED OF
19 THE FUNDS WE GET TO REDUCE THE VEHICLE TRIPS AND GREENHOUSE
20 GAS EMISSIONS. SO, WITH THAT SAID, IF SOMEBODY COULD CLARIFY
21 THAT MORE SO, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD REITERATE TO HAVE THOSE POINTS US MENTIONED
24 TO BE CONSIDERED BY THE FULL COMMISSION. CONSENSUS IS THAT WE
25 WILL NOT CHANGE THE SPLITS BETWEEN THE COUNTY AND REGIONAL



Meeting Transcript

1 PROGRAM BUT MERELY THAT THE COMMISSION WOULD COME BACK AND
2 CONSIDER THAT AND THAT DECISION WOULD BE INFORMED BY CURRENT
3 INFORMATIONS ON THE CURRENT PROGRAM AND HOW THOSE OBAG FUNDS
4 ARE USED.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** AS LONG AS WE ARE CLEAR ON THAT ASPECT. IT'S WHEN
7 WE USE WORDS WE START OUT WITH CONSENSUS OF THE COMMISSION. I
8 KNOW AND HOPE THAT WE GET ADDITIONAL INFORMATION. I JUST DON'T
9 WANT REPRESENTATIONS MADE THAT THE COMMISSION HAS AGREED TO
10 SOMETHING THAT WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH INFORMATION FOR AT THIS
11 POINT IN TIME.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YEAH.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I THINK THAT'S AN INFORMED
18 CLARIFICATION COMMISSIONER PAPAN. COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY?

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. SOMETHING THEY
21 THINK WOULD HAVE BEEN HELPFUL TO HAVE PART OF THE PACKET, AND
22 I KNOW WE HAVE IN THE PAST, AND MY RECOLLECTION IS WE'RE IN
23 PRETTY GOOD SHAPE BUT WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT JURISDICTION
24 BEING COMPLIANT WITH STATE HOUSING LAWS, WHICH I AGREE WITH,
25 BUT I WOULD HAVE LIKED TO HAVE SEEN A CHART THAT SHOWS, YOU



Meeting Transcript

1 KNOW, WHO IS COMPLIANT AND WHO IS NOT. CAN YOU MAYBE TELL ME,
2 BRIEFLY, WHO IS NOT? BECAUSE I KNOW THERE MAY BE NONE. THERE
3 MAY BE ONE OR TWO. BUT I KNOW THE MAJORITY IS THAT PEOPLE ARE
4 COMPLIANT, OR JURISDICTION.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** I GUESS I CAN TRY AND ANSWER THAT. WE DON'T HAVE A
7 CURRENT CHART. WHEN WE WENT THROUGH THE DISCUSSIONS ON THE
8 HOUSING CONSENSUS POOL WE HAD DATA AT THAT POINT BUT THAT'S
9 BEEN SOME TIME. I THINK WE NEED TO REDO SUCH A CHART, GIVEN
10 THE CURRENT LAWS. AND I WOULD ASK DANIEL IF HE HAS ANY --

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** LET ME JUST ASK THIS AND THEN MAYBE --
13 AND DANIEL, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU KNOW WHO IS NON-COMPLIANT BUT
14 IF YOU DON'T KNOW, DON'T WORRY ABOUT IT. COULD WE MAKE THAT
15 CHART A PART OF THE PACKET WHEN IT COMES TO THE COMMISSION?

16

17 **DANIEL SAVER:** JUST TO -- I DON'T KNOW OFFHAND IF THERE ARE ANY
18 JURISDICTION THAT ARE NON-COMPLIANT. FROM A HOUSING
19 PERSPECTIVE, I BELIEVE IT'S NEARLY ALL IF NOT ALL JURISDICTION
20 ARE INDEED COMPLIANT. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE'RE WORKING
21 THROUGH IN DEVELOPING THIS IS FOR SOME OF THE LAWS THERE IS
22 NOT GOOD TRACKING MECHANISMS TO EASILY DETERMINE COMPLIANCE
23 WHICH IS PART OF WHY STAFF WAS SUGGESTING A SELF-CERTIFICATION
24 PROCESS FOR A NUMBER OF LAWS. HCD TRACKS HOUSING COMPLIANCE
25 AND OTHER LAWS BUT NOT THE OTHER PACKAGE. SO WE CAN WORK



Meeting Transcript

1 TOWARDS GATHERING AS MUCH INFORMATION AS IS AVAILABLE TO HAVE
2 THAT INFORMED FUTURE DISCUSSION.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I WOULD APPRECIATE THAT AND MAYBE HAVE IT
5 AVAILABLE AT THE COMMISSION MEETING. OTHER THING IS, I
6 APOLOGIZE, I'M NOT REALLY GRASPS THIS BULLET, BUT WHAT ARE WE
7 REALLY TALKING ABOUT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE APPROPRIATENESS OF
8 ADJUSTING THE FUNDING BETWEEN COUNTY AND REGIONAL PROGRAMS.
9 CAN SOMEBODY EXPAND ON THAT?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SURE. THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. THERE WAS A REINTEREST IN LOOKING AT WHAT
13 PERCENTAGE GOES TO THE COUNTIES FOR THEIR ABAG PROGRAM, WHICH
14 I THINK RIGHT NOW IS ABOUT 40 TO 45 PERCENT, AND THE 55 TO 60
15 PERCENT THAT SUPPORTS REGIONAL PROGRAMS. AND SOME OF THOSE
16 REGIONAL PROGRAMS, YOU KNOW, INCLUDE THE CLIPPER PROGRAM, A
17 LOT OF PROGRAMS THAT SUPPORT IMPROVEMENTS TO OUR HIGHWAY
18 NETWORK, ET CETERA. SO WHAT WE HEARD IS THAT THERE WAS AN
19 INTEREST IN GETTING MORE INFORMATION FROM STAFF ON THE
20 REGIONAL SIDE TO SEE IF YOU MIGHT WANT TO, AGAIN, ADJUST THIS
21 PERCENTAGE. WHAT WE HEARD AT THE WORKSHOP WAS THERE WAS A
22 LITTLE MORE INTEREST IN INCREASING THE COUNTY SHARE. IT
23 DOESN'T MEAN YOU COULDN'T REVISIT THAT LATER, BUT THAT WAS
24 MORE, I THINK, WHAT WE HEARD. BUT YOU WANTED TO UNDERSTAND THE
25 TRADEOFFS. I THINK WHAT WE UNDERSTOOD WAS THE CONSENSUS WAS,



Meeting Transcript

1 THIS WAS AN AREA THAT YOU WANTED TO LOOK AT WHEN WE DEVELOPED
2 THE OBAG THREE, AND YOU WANTED STAFF TO BRING YOU RELEVANT
3 INFORMATION SO YOU COULD MAKE A BETTER DECISION ABOUT WHAT THE
4 APPROPRIATE SPLIT IS BETWEEN THESE TWO CATEGORIES.

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SO I GUESS IF I'M BEING ASKED TO BE A
7 CONSENSUS PERSON, I WOULD SAY THAT I AGREE WITH YOUR
8 INTERPRETATION THAT WE WERE INTERESTED IN THAT FUNDING GOING
9 UP, AND NOT DOWN, FOR THE COUNTIES.

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT IS MOSTLY HOW I REMEMBER THE
12 CONVERSATION.

13

14 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY. I'M FINE. I JUST WANT THE REALLY TO
15 CLARIFY THAT AND ALSO GET THAT ON THE RECORD THAT THIS IS NOT
16 SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO TAKE AWAY. SO I'M FINE. THANK YOU
17 MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER PEDROZA?

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS
22 FROM COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND CHAIR HAGGERTY. ESPECIALLY ON
23 NUMBER FOUR. YOU KNOW, I THINK JUST THE COMMENT I'LL MAKE IS,
24 ESPECIALLY ON NUMBER FIVE, WE WERE HAVING THESE DISCUSSIONS
25 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, REALLY UNDERSTANDING THAT WE MIGHT HAVE



Meeting Transcript

1 HAD A DIFFERENT FINANCIAL OUTLOOK THEN TO WHAT IT IS NOW. SO,
2 I THINK WE JUST HAVE TO FRAME, KIND OF INCENTIVE FUNDING, IF
3 THERE ARE INCREASES IN TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, WE'RE GOING TO
4 HAVE TO LOOK AT THOSE THROUGH A DIFFERENT LENS AS WE ARE IN A
5 PANDEMIC NOW, AND WE WEREN'T THEN. SO I THINK, JUST INSTEAD OF
6 USING WORDS LIKE CONSIDER, I THINK WE HAVE TO FRAME IT MORE
7 APPROPRIATELY, THAT WE WILL HAVE DISCUSSIONS. AND TO ME, IT'S
8 ABOUT MANAGING EXPECTATIONS, THERESE, OR ALIX, SO THAT WHEN WE
9 HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS, WE'RE GOING TO REFERENCE WHAT WE'RE
10 DOING NOW. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE FRAMING IT
11 APPROPRIATELY NOT TO GO BACK TO WE CONSIDERED IT THEN AS A
12 DISCUSSION. SO AS LONG AS WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THAT STATE
13 OF MIND, I CAN SUPPORT THOSE DIRECTIONS.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DOES STAFF WANT TO -- ALIX,
16 DO YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO THAT?

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I APPRECIATE THE COMMENT. I THINK WE CAN DO
19 THAT.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER SPERINGING? HAD.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. PART OF THE
24 DISCUSSION, FIRST I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER PAPAN FOR
25 GETTING CLARIFICATION ON 4 AND 5, AND THERESE, THANKS FOR



Meeting Transcript

1 CLARIFYING THAT. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. IMPORTANT PART OF
2 THE DISCUSSION ON THE 45 TO 55 PERCENT, IF IT STAYS AT THOSE
3 LEVELS, THE LOCAL SHARE, WE WANT TO HAVE A LOT MORE
4 FLEXIBILITY ON HOW WE CAN SPEND THAT MONEY. SO PART OF THE
5 DISCUSSION WAS, YOU KNOW, GIVING US THE LATITUDE TO REALLY BE
6 ABLE TO USE THAT MONEY IN A VERY EFFICIENT WAY LOCALLY. SO I
7 DON'T WANT TO LOSE SIGHT OF THAT FLEXIBILITY PIECE. AND AS
8 ALIX SAID, WE SAID WE WOULD REVISIT THE SHARE. BECAUSE SOME OF
9 THE 55, THE REGIONAL SHARE DOES BENEFIT ALL OF US AND THEY'RE
10 VERY IMPORTANT PROGRAMS. AND I THINK THE CONSENSUS WAS THAT WE
11 REALLY SHOULD LOOK AT THAT BEFORE WE START ADJUSTING THOSE
12 PERCENTAGES. SO I JUST WANTED TO EMPHASIZE THE FLEXIBILITY OF
13 THE LOCAL SHARE. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
16 PAPAN IS YOUR HAND UP AGAIN? OR WAS IT UP FROM BEFORE?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** YES IT IS TO BE CLEAR FOR THE RECORD. IT'S A 42 --
19 58 SPLIT, THE TRADEOFF IS POSSIBLE INCREASE TO THE COUNTIES
20 FOR NUMBER FOUR, AND THEN NUMBER FIVE TO INCLUDE ISSUES
21 RELATED TO THE CURRENT PANDEMIC. I THINK THAT WOULD BE CLEARER
22 IF WE ARE TALKING ABOUT A COMMISSION CONSENSUS, AND MANY OF US
23 WOULD FEEL BETTER ABOUT THAT, IF THAT'S POSSIBLE, I WOULD LIKE
24 TO MAKE THAT AMENDMENT.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT'S FINE. I MEAN, WE
2 HAVEN'T MADE A MOTION. SO I THINK, YOU KNOW, I WOULD CERTAINLY
3 BE OPEN TO ENTERTAINING THAT AS A MOTION, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THE MOTION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL GO AHEAD AND SECOND IT.
10 DUTRA-VERNACI.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.
13 OKAY. COMMISSIONER SPERINGING, DO YOU -- IS YOUR HAND BACK UP?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH I DID. GINA, CAN YOU CLARIFY THAT
16 MOTION? YOU KNOW, ARE YOU SAYING TO RAISE THE AMOUNT? OR TO
17 CONSIDER RAISING IT?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD GLADLY CLARIFY. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER
20 SPERINGING. TO CONSIDER RAISING IT, I BELIEVE THIS IS A
21 CONSIDERATION SECTION ANYWAY. BUT, THANK YOU, SIR.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** NO. THANK YOU. AND THE REASON I SAY THAT,
24 IS, SOME OF THESE REGIONAL PROGRAMS REALLY BENEFIT ALL OF US,
25 AND I WANT TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION. BUT I'M CERTAINLY



Meeting Transcript

1 SUPPORTIVE OF RAISING IT TOO BUT I DON'T WANT TO MINIMIZE THE
2 IMPORTANCE OF SOME OF THESE REGIONAL PROJECTS. THANK YOU FOR
3 THAT CLARIFICATION.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

6

7 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YEAH. I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS MADE BY MY
8 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS AND SUCH. NOT WORDSMITHING THIS NOW, BUT
9 I THINK IF WE CAN CAPTURE SOME OF THESE ELEMENTS NOW THAT HAVE
10 BEEN DISCUSSED, SO I THINK GINA YOUR MOTION DOES CAPTURE THE
11 CONSIDERATION OR HAVING A DISCUSSION REGARDING THE LOCAL
12 VERSUS REGIONAL SHARE, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE
13 ALWAYS CAPTURING THAT FLEXIBILITY ELEMENT THAT WAS BROUGHT UP.
14 I THINK THE HARD THING IS CARRYING FORWARD SOME OF THE KEY
15 ELEMENTS THAT WERE IN OUR MINDS AT THE TIME SOME OF THOSE ARE
16 INTERPRETED INTO THE TEXT, I THINK IT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL
17 GOING FORWARD.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YOU KNOW, I THINK MY -- I THINK THAT
20 MAKES A LOT OF SENSE, COMMISSIONER BRUINS. I ALSO THINK THAT
21 HAVING HAD DISCUSSIONS WITH STAFF, ON THIS, FOR A LONG TIME,
22 MY SENSE IS THAT ALIX AND THERESA ARE PRETTY COLLUDE INTO AND
23 ARE PAYING CLOSE ATTENTION TO THESE DISCUSSIONS AND ARE QUITE
24 AWARE OF WHERE WE'RE ALL LANDING ON ALL OF THIS. SO, ALIX
25 WOULD YOU LIKE TO COMMENT ON THAT?



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SURE, CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. I THINK BASED ON THE
3 DISCUSSION, WE CAN MAKE SOME WORD CHANGES BETWEEN THE
4 COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION TO REFLECT A FEW MORE
5 SPECIFICITIES THAT WERE NOTED TODAY, IF THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE
8 JEANNE? COMMISSIONER BRUINS. SORRY.

9

10 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** NO THAT WOULD. AND NICK, I TOTALLY AGREE WITH
11 YOU STAFF USUALLY HAS A LOT OF ATTENTION TO THE DETAILS, BUT
12 WHEN IT COMES BACK TO US AS BODIES, OUR MEMORIES ARE NOT AS SO
13 -- AGAIN, IT'S EXAMPLES THAT ARE PLACED IN THERE, THAT WOULD
14 BE HELPFUL TO JOG OUR MEMORIES, NOT NECESSARILY STAFF'S.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES. I AGREE. AS ONE OF THE PEOPLE
17 WHO'S MEMORY NEEDS JOGGING. ALSO MY LEGS NEED JOGGING. ANYWAY.
18 IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? I DON'T SEE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.
19 DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT KIMBERLY?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT BUT A
22 HAND JUST WENT UP FROM BELUE N.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I AM FROM THE NON-PROFIT HOUSING ASSOCIATION OF
25 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. AND WE JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT WE SUPPORT



Meeting Transcript

1 STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AS ITS ESSENTIAL FOR ENSURING THE
2 IMPLEMENTATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA. AND WE'RE REALLY GRATEFUL
3 TO STAFF FOR ALL THEIR GREAT WORK ON THIS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. OKAY. SO LET'S VOTE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES
12 UNANIMOUSLY.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. SO, MOVING ON TO THE MERGER
15 CONSENSUS, ULTIMATELY. MOVING ON TO ITEM FIVE. WHICH IS PUBLIC
16 COMMENT. AND OTHER BUSINESS. DO WE HAVE ANY OTHER PUBLIC
17 COMMENT OR OTHER BUSINESS?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT,
20 AND I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WELL THEN IT'S QUICKLY ADJOURNED.

23 [ADJOURNED] THE NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND

24 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY



August 12, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 SEPTEMBER 9TH, 2020 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER. THANK YOU
2 VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]
3