





## Adobe Acrobat Reader

### Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

#### To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:  
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

#### To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again  
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.  
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

### Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

**Note:** *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*



## Meeting Transcript

### **To select and copy it to the clipboard:**

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION

2 SUBCOMMITTEE

3 THURSDAY, JULY 30, 2020, 10:05 AM

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. CAN WE HAVE THE ANNOUNCEMENT PLEASE?

6 DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM

7 WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S

8 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS

9 OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB

10 SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND

11 OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND

12 RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS

13 PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED

14 ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.

15 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM,

16 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL

17 STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

18 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR

19 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC

20 SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING

21 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING

22 TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING

23 AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV). WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE

24 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT

25 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE  
2 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS  
3 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE  
4 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL  
5 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE  
6 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO  
7 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO  
8 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE  
9 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WOULD STAFF LIKE TO MAKE ANY OPENING  
12 REMARKS BEFORE I WELCOME PEOPLE IN?

13

14 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU. THIS IS BILL BACON, I AM THE CO  
15 PARTNER FOR THE FARE INTEGRATION STUDY. I WANT TO WELCOME  
16 EVERYONE TO THIS FIRST MEETING. WE'RE GOING TO BE HOPING TO  
17 GET QUITE A BIT OF FEEDBACK FROM ALL OF YOU TODAY AND WE  
18 APPRECIATE YOU TAKING THE TIME OUT OF YOUR SCHEDULES TO LEARN  
19 ABOUT THIS PROJECT AND TO HELP US MAKE THE PROJECT AS  
20 SUCCESSFUL AS IT CAN BE IN THE COMING YEAR. THAT'S ALL I WANT  
21 TO SAY BUT WE LOOK FORWARD TO A ROBUST CONVERSATION TODAY.  
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** MICHAEL?

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** NO. NOTHING TO ADD RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU BILL, AND TO  
2 EVERYONE FOR TAKING THE TIME OUT TODAY. TO INTRODUCE MYSELF MY  
3 NAME IS MIKE EISEMAN, FINANCING PLANNING MANAGER FOR BART AND  
4 CO-PROJECT MANAGER WITH BILL.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I AM RANDI KINMAN. AND AS CHAIR OF  
7 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK ALL OF YOU  
8 FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS. I'M GLAD WE FINALLY CAME TOGETHER  
9 TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE. OUR COMMITTEES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON FOR  
10 TEN YEARS AND OTHER GROUPS HAVE BEEN DOING THE SAME THING.  
11 THIS IS AN EXCITING TIME IN MANY RESPECTS BECAUSE WHEN THIS  
12 COMMITTEE WAS AUTHORIZED WE HAD NO IDEA A PANDEMIC WAS GOING  
13 TO BE UPON US AND THAT OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS WOULD BE IN A WORLD  
14 OF HURT AND NEAR COLLAPSE, AND THIS COMMITTEE'S WORK TIES INTO  
15 OUR RECOVERY EFFORTS SO IT'S MORE IMPORTANT NOW THAN EVER THAT  
16 WE GET THIS WORK DONE AND GET IT DONE QUICKLY AND CORRECTLY.  
17 WHILE THIS COMMITTEE IS A SUBCOMMITTEE OF A POLICY ADVISORY  
18 COUNCIL THEY CHAIR, YOU WILL BE ACTING AS A STANDALONE BODY  
19 GOING IN SEVERAL DIRECTIONS ALONG THE WAY. YOU ARE HEAR FROM  
20 OTHER RELATED COMMITTEES EITHER FROM BART OR MTC AND ABAG AND  
21 IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN FOLLOWING THOSE PLEASE LET BIRTH  
22 ACTUALLY LET MARTHA KNOW AND SHE WILL ADD YOU TO THE LIST OF  
23 PEOPLE WHO GET NOTIFICATIONS FOR THESE MEETINGS AND YOU WILL  
24 GET THE AGENDA SENT AND EVERYTHING ELSE. AS A SUBCOMMITTEE OF  
25 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, THIS IS A LITTLE TRICKY, BECAUSE



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WE'RE A HYBRID. I HAVE ZERO INTENTION OF RUNNING THESE  
2 MEETINGS AND ADDING TO MY PERSONAL WORKLOAD. SO I'M GOING TO  
3 BE APPOINTING ADINA LEVIN AS CHAIR AND WENDI KALLINS AS VICE  
4 CHAIR WHICH WILL ALLOW THE MEETINGS TO FLOW PROPERLY AND TO  
5 HAVE SOMETHING WHO CAN REPORT IN MULTIPLE DIRECTIONS. AGAIN, I  
6 WANT TO THANK ALL OF YOU FOR PARTICIPATING. I LOOK FORWARD TO  
7 WORKING WITH YOU AS A FELLOW COMMITTEE MEMBER OVER THE NEXT  
8 YEAR, AND WE'LL NOW TURN THE MEETING OVER TO ADINA FOR ITEM  
9 NUMBER TWO, WHICH IS THE ROLL CALL. THANK YOU. ADINA IT'S  
10 YOURS.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU TO EVERYONE FOR COMING TO THIS  
13 MEETING WHICH RANDI NOTED, IS LONG AWAITED AND THERE ARE A LOT  
14 OF PEOPLE IN THE LEAD UP WHO MADE THIS TEAM POSSIBLE AND  
15 BRINGING FORWARD THIS BOARD'S CONSIDERATION, AND WOULD VERY  
16 MUCH, AS THE FIRST MEETING, WHICH I AM CHAIRING, WOULD  
17 APPRECIATE ANY SUPPORT BY STAFF AND BY POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
18 CHAIR KINMAN TO HELP IN VERIFYING IF I'M DOING ANY OF THIS  
19 WRONG. SO AS WE GET STARTED, IS -- NOW THE POINT THAT WE ASK  
20 THE CLERK TO READ PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED, ASSOCIATED WITH  
21 THIS ITEM, INTO THE RECORD, AND ALSO IF ANYONE HAS -- ANY  
22 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HAVE QUESTIONS PLEASE USE THE RAISED  
23 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE TO COMMENT.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN:** WE NEED TO DO ROLL CALL FIRST.



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. FIRST THING WE NEED TO DO IS ROLL  
3 CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM BY THE CLERK.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. BOB ALLEN? JIM BLACKSTEN? CAT  
6 CARTER?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABIGAIL COCHRAN?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IAN GRIFFITHS?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TISHA DEE?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** TISHA DEE HARTMAN.

25





July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WENDI KALLINS IS EXCUSED.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JONATHON KASS?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RANDI KINMAN?

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN:** PRESENT. AND PLEASE NOTE JIM E. BLACKSTEN IS NO  
12 LONGER HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GWEN LITVAK? MONICA MALLON?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ADRIAN MENDOZA?

19

20 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. STEPHANIE MCNALLY? AND BRIAN  
23 STANKE?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO ITEM 3, MEMBERSHIP  
5 ROSTER AND APPOINTMENT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR FOR THE  
6 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
7 SUBCOMMITTEE, PRESENTED BY BILL BACON. I THINK WE WILL HAVE  
8 THE PRESENTATION FIRST, THEN DO THE PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **WILLIAM BACON:** THIS ITEM IS A MEMO AND A TEMPLATE OF THE  
11 ROSTER IN YOUR PACKET. RANDI NOTED A MOMENT AGO, THIS NEW  
12 SUBCOMMITTEE IS HOUSED UNDER MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BUT  
13 IT'S UNIQUE IN THAT IT INCLUDES BOTH MEMBERS OF THE POLICY  
14 ADVISORY COUNCIL AS WELL AS OTHER STAKEHOLDERS FOR A VARIETY  
15 OF DIFFERENT CONSTITUENCIES AROUND THE BAY AREA. THIS ITEM  
16 LISTS WHO IS INVITED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE MEETING TODAY BASED  
17 ON A FRAMEWORK THAT WAS APPROVED BY THE POLICY ADVISORY  
18 COUNCIL IN FEBRUARY OF THIS YEAR. YOU WILL SEE THE ROSTER AS  
19 WE -- AS IT STOOD, I SHOULD SAY, EARLIER THIS WEEK, AND THERE  
20 ARE SEVERAL OUTSTANDING INVITATIONS FOR DIFFERENT  
21 ORGANIZATIONS TO PARTICIPATE AND THOSE CHARACTERIZATIONS HAVE  
22 YET TO CONFIRM THAT THEY WILL BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE. OUR HOPE  
23 IS THEY WILL BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE IN FUTURE MEETINGS IF  
24 THEY'RE NOT ABLE TO BE HERE TODAY. THIS ITEM IS AN INFORMATION  
25 ITEM SO THAT ALL OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS CAN SEAT



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 MEMBERSHIP ROSTER FOR THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND JUST PROVIDE A  
2 LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND TO THOSE OF YOU WHO ARE NOT ON THE  
3 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ITSELF ABOUT HOW THIS BODY CAME TO BE.  
4 I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. I AM NOT SEEING ANY QUESTIONS  
7 OR RAISED HANDS FROM PANELISTS. IF THAT IS SELF ESTIMATED  
8 EVIDENT AND DOESN'T ENTAIL ANY QUESTIONS. WOULD THE COLLECT  
9 READ INTO THE RECORD ANY COMMENTS RECEIVED AND IF THE PUBLIC  
10 WISHES TO SPEAK PLEASE DIAL STAR NINE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS  
13 RAISED AT THIS MOMENT AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED ON  
14 THIS ITEM.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THEN WE CAN MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM  
17 NUMBER FOUR, WHICH IS UPDATE AND DISCUSSION ON THE FARE  
18 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY AND BUSINESS CASE, AND THIS  
19 WILL BE PRESENTED BY MICHAEL EISEMAN, WILLIAM BACON, AND LISA  
20 RAFFETTO. TURNING IT OVER TO STAFF FOR PRESENTATION PRIOR TO  
21 COMMENT AND DISCUSSION.

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** MIKE EISEMAN HERE. I WILL GET THIS STARTED  
24 FOR THE PRESENTATION. HOW DO WE DISPLAY THE POWERPOINT DECK?  
25 CAN SOMEONE HELP WITH THAT? AH, GREAT. OKAY. SO WE HAVE A



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 POWERPOINT DECK HERE. TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE, WE WANT TO KEEP  
2 OUR REMARKS BRIEF AND EMPHASIZE INPUT AND DISCUSSION FROM THE  
3 GROUP HERE. WE HAVE SORT OF THREE MAIN TOPIC AREAS THAT WE  
4 WANT TO INTRODUCE AND SEEK YOUR INPUT AND DISCUSSION ON. FIRST  
5 SET OF INFORMATION IS JUST TO CATCH US ALL UP ON THE PURPOSE,  
6 THE GOALS, AND THE GENERAL CONTRACTS FOR THIS STUDY. AND THE  
7 STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY IT'S SORT OF MORE COMPLEX THAN MANY  
8 PLANNING EFFORTS. AND MANY OF YOU SOME OF THAT AND PERHAPS NOT  
9 EVERYONE. SO LET'S GET CAUGHT UP ON THAT FIRST. THEN THERE IS  
10 TWO SUBSTANTIVE AREAS BEYOND THAT. ONE IS DISCUSSION OF A  
11 PROBLEM STATEMENT FOR THIS STUDY. WHAT ARE THE ISSUES WITH  
12 FARES THAT WE'RE ATTEMPTING TO ADDRESS, WHERE DO THEY SIT IN  
13 THE CONTEXT OF THE OTHER REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES  
14 AND GOALS. AND THAT'S BEEN DISCUSSED ALREADY BY THE SORT OF  
15 TASK FORCE THAT ULTIMATELY OWNS THIS STUDY BUT ON A  
16 PRELIMINARY BASIS, AND CERTAINLY IT NEEDS INPUT AND DISCUSSION  
17 FROM THIS GROUP. AND THEN THE THIRD ITEM IS A DISCUSSION OF  
18 WHAT WE'RE CALLING USER RESEARCH. SO AN ATTEMPT TO GET BROADER  
19 INPUT FROM A LARGER GROUPS OF FOLKS. AND THE INITIAL IDEA FOR  
20 THIS STUDY INCLUDED SOME INNOVATION THERE, TRYING TO USE SOME  
21 SORT OF MORE INNOVATIVE QUALITATIVE METHODS TO SEEK INPUT FROM  
22 FOLKS ACTUALLY OUT IN THE WORLD AND RIDING THE TRAINS, IN  
23 CONTEXT, AND BUSES, EXCUSE ME, SHOWING MY BIAS THERE AS A BART  
24 PERSON. AND WE -- THE PANDEMIC HAS CERTAINLY THROWN A WRENCH  
25 INTO THE WORKS AS TO THAT APPROACH AND WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 RETHINKING HOW TO GET THE INPUT WE NEED FROM A BROADER GROUP  
2 OF PEOPLE. AND WE WANT -- WE'RE HOPING TO ASK FOR YOUR INPUT  
3 AND DISCUSSION ON HOW TO APPROACH THAT PART OF THE PROJECT. SO  
4 MAYBE WITH THAT, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO BILL TO TALK ABOUT THE  
5 CONTEXT, AND BACKGROUND ON THE STUDY.

6

7 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANKS MIKE, IF WE CAN GO AHEAD TO THE NEXT  
8 SLIDE, PLEASE. AS MIKE MENTIONED, THE FIRST PORTION OF THIS  
9 PRESENTATION IS REALLY TO PROVIDE A BIT OF CONTEXT AND  
10 BACKGROUND ABOUT WHAT THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
11 STUDY IS INVESTIGATING, CONTEXT FOR FARE POLICY IN THE BAY  
12 AREA AND SORT OF HOW WE GOT TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY WITH THIS  
13 PROJECT. I DO WANT TO CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO TWO ATTACHMENTS  
14 THAT WERE INCLUDED WITH THIS ITEM. ONE WAS THE SCOPE OF WORK  
15 FOR THE PROJECT AND THAT IS WHAT OUR CONSULTANT TEAM WHICH IS  
16 A TEAM CALLED STEER, THAT IS THE WORK THE CONSULTANT GROUP  
17 RESPONDED TO, AND THAT'S A STARTING POINT FOR PEOPLE TO  
18 UNDERSTAND THE TYPES OF QUESTIONS WE ARE ASKING AND A SECOND  
19 ATTACHMENT WHICH IS A LARGE TABLE THAT SHOWS THE DIFFERENT  
20 FARES FOR A SINGLE RIDE TRIP IN THE BAY AREA. IT WAS UPDATED A  
21 FEW MONTHS AGO SO JUST NOTE THAT AS A CAVEAT, BUT THAT SHOWS  
22 JUST SOME OF THE WIDE RANGE OF COMPLEXITY OF THE FARES THAT  
23 EXIST FOR A SINGLE RIDE TRIP IN THE BAY AREA. THOSE ARE GOOD  
24 REFERENCE DOCUMENTS AND I'LL WALK US THROUGH THE FIRST FEW  
25 SLIDES AND IF FOLKS HAVE QUESTIONS PLEASE FEEL FREE TO RAISE



## Meeting Transcript

1 YOUR HAND OR TO COMMUNICATE, IF YOU HAVE A QUESTION WE DO WANT  
2 THIS TO BE A FAIRLY INTERACTIVE CONVERSATION TODAY, AND NOT  
3 JUST A LONG PRESENTATION WITH FEEDBACK AT THE END. I THINK A  
4 FAIR POINT TO START IS WHAT IS FARE POLICY AND WHAT DO WE MEAN  
5 BY THAT? FARE POLICY ARE THE RULES THAT DEFINE HOW MUCH PEOPLE  
6 PAY TO USE PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THAT CAN BE BROKEN DOWN TO  
7 SEVERAL DIFFERENT CATEGORIES NOTED HERE: THE STRUCTURE OF THE  
8 FARES; SO HOW IS THE PRICE SET IN DETERMINING WHAT IT COST TO  
9 TAKE A TRIP. WHAT IS THE PRICE ITSELF: WHAT DOES IT COST TO  
10 RIGHT TRANSIT, AND THIS SINGLE FARE RIDE COST EXCLUDING  
11 DISCOUNTS OR PASSES. WHAT ARE THE WEIGHS OR PAYMENT OPTIONS  
12 THAT PEOPLE CAN PAY THEIR FARE? DO THEY PAY THROUGH A SINGLE  
13 RIDE TICKET. IS THERE A CAP WHERE IF YOU PAY A CERTAIN AMOUNT  
14 PER DAY THAT GIVES YOU LOTS OF OPTIONS, SO THERE ARE LOTS OF  
15 METHODS FOR HOW PAYMENTS HAPPEN. AND DISCOUNTED FARES: DO  
16 RIDERS QUALIFY BASED ON DISCOUNTED FARE BASED ON AGE OR  
17 CHARACTERISTIC AND HOW IS THAT DETERMINED. GO TO THE NEXT  
18 SLIDE. THIS TABLE BREAKS DOWN THE COMPONENTS INTO MAYBE  
19 SLIGHTLY EASIER FORM FORMAT TO THINK ABOUT IN OUR REGION WITH  
20 TWO DOZEN OPERATORS THAT OPERATE DIFFERENT TYPES OF TRANSIT  
21 SERVICE WE CAN THINK ABOUT FARES AS A LOCAL TRANSIT FARE, A  
22 REGIONAL TRANSIT FARE FOR TRIPS CROSSING COUNTY LINES OR  
23 TRAVELING A GREATER DISTANCE. AS I MENTIONED ON THE PREVIOUS  
24 SLIDES, ARE THERE DISCOUNTS THAT ARE APPLIED TO THOSE FARES?  
25 IS THERE TIME BASED PRICING WHERE IF YOU TRAVEL ON A CERTAIN



## Meeting Transcript

1 DAY OR CERTAIN TIME, ARE THERE DISCOUNTS APPLIED. THIS ISN'T  
2 APPLIED IN THE BAY AREA BUT LOTS OF TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN THE BAY  
3 AREA AND AROUND THE WORLD OFFER TEMPORAL PRICING. HOW ARE  
4 TRANSFERS HANDLED IF YOU ARE HAVE TO TRANSFER BETWEEN BUSES  
5 WHAT IS THE WINDOW? IS THERE A SET AMOUNT OF TIME TO TRANSFER  
6 BETWEEN BUSES A LOT OF OUR SYSTEMS OFFER A 120 OR 90 MINUTE  
7 WINDOW WHERE YOU CAN TRANSFER OR FARE CREDITS IF YOU TRANSFER.  
8 AND LOYALTY INCENTIVES IF YOU REMAIN LOYAL TO A SYSTEM IN MANY  
9 CASES MONTHLY PASSES OR ANNUAL PASSES OFFERED ARE A LOYALTY  
10 SENSE PRODUCT IT ENCOURAGES A PASSENGER TO PAY AN UPFRONT COST  
11 AND THEN REMAIN A RIDER OF THAT SYSTEM. THERE ARE NO FURTHER  
12 BARRIERS TO USING THE SYSTEM. SO WHAT TYPE OF LOYALTY  
13 INCENTIVES EXIST IN THE FARE POLICY. WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT  
14 SLIDE PLEASE. SO FARE POLICY AFFECTS REALLY ALL ASPECTS OF THE  
15 TRANSIT SYSTEM. I THINK OBVIOUSLY IT IMPACTS THE REVENUE THAT  
16 OPERATORS HAVE TO OPERATE THE SYSTEMS AT ITS CORE FARES TO  
17 OPERATING THE SERVICE BUT BEYOND THAT IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT  
18 TO ALL OTHER FACTORS NOTED ON THIS SLIDE HOW DO EXPERIENCE THE  
19 SYSTEM TRAVEL AROUND THE SYSTEM IN THE COMMUNITY-BASED ON  
20 WHAT'S OFFERED THAT AFFECTS RIDERSHIP AND HOW MANY PEOPLE USE  
21 TRANSIT WHERE THE SERVICE IS DESIGNED AND HOW IT'S PLANNED IS  
22 IMPACTED BY TYPES OF FARE PRODUCTS OFFERED SO THINK ABOUT  
23 INSTANCES IF YOU'RE MAKING A CONNECTION BETWEEN TWO DIFFERENT  
24 TRANSIT SYSTEMS THE WAY PEOPLE USE THOSE SYSTEMS MIGHT CHANGE  
25 BASED ON THE TYPE OF FARE PRODUCTS YOU'RE OFFERING. MARKETING



## Meeting Transcript

1 OF THE SYSTEM, THE FARES THAT ARE AVAILABLE FOR THE PUBLIC TO  
2 PURCHASE, AND TO USE, MAKER A BIG DIFFERENCE IN TERMS OF HOW  
3 YOU SELL THE TRANSIT SERVICE THAT IS AVAILABLE, AND HOW YOU  
4 LET PEOPLE KNOW THAT THAT SERVICE IS THERE. IT'S RELIABILITY.  
5 THAT MIGHT NOT SEEM AS INTUITIVE, BUT A FARE SYSTEM THAT HAS  
6 SIGNIFICANT BARRIERS TO TRANSFER IN BETWEEN BUSES OR TRANSFER  
7 BETWEEN OPERATORS CAN SLOW DOWN THE SERVICE, IN SOME  
8 CIRCUMSTANCES, AND THAT CAN IMPACT RELIABILITY. AND I THINK,  
9 OVERLAYING ALL OF THIS, ARE QUESTIONS ABOUT EQUITY, AND HOW  
10 OUR FARE POLICIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA IMPACT THE BE ABILITY OF  
11 ALL PEOPLE TO MAKE USE OF TRANSIT AND HAVE ACCESS TO  
12 OPPORTUNITY THAT TRANSIT PROVIDES. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO  
13 JUST TRYING TO SUMMARIZE A LITTLE BIT HERE, AT A VERY HIGH  
14 LEVEL, SOME OF THE FARE POLICIES THAT EXIST TODAY IN THE BAY  
15 AREA. WE HAVE NINE DIFFERENT LOCAL BUS FARES THAT ARE  
16 AVAILABLE ON THE CLIPPER CARD DEPENDING ON WHICH TRANSIT  
17 SYSTEM YOU'RE USING AND THOSE RANGE IN PRICE BETWEEN \$1.50 AND  
18 \$2.50. SO THAT MEANS IF YOU GO DOWN AND TRY TO GET LOCAL BUS  
19 SERVICE IN YOUR COMMUNITY DEPENDING WHERE YOU ARE IN THE  
20 REGION THERE ARE NINE DIFFERENT LOCAL BUS FARES YOU MIGHT PAY  
21 DEPENDING ON WHICH OPERATOR YOU'RE USING AND THAT'S THE PRICE  
22 RANGE IN BETWEEN, \$1.50 AND \$2.50 THAT DEPENDING ON WHERE YOU  
23 ARE IN THE REGION AND WHAT TYPE OF TRIP YOU'RE TAKING. LOOKING  
24 AT DISCOUNTS THAT WE OFFER ACROSS OUR SYSTEMS. THERE ARE 16  
25 DIFFERENT DISCOUNT RATES THAT ARE OFFERED FOR YOUTH. SO THAT





## Meeting Transcript

1 COULD BE A 50 PERCENT DISCOUNT, 20 PERCENT DISCOUNT, THE RATE  
2 ITSELF IS DIFFERENT DEPENDING ON WHICH OPERATOR YOU'RE ON. AND  
3 FOR SENIORS, THERE ARE 14 DIFFERENT RATES OF DISCOUNT THAT ARE  
4 OFFERED, DEPENDING ON WHICH OPERATOR YOU'RE ON. SO THIS IS  
5 SOMEWHAT DIFFICULT TO COMMUNICATE TO THE PUBLIC IN TERMS OF  
6 WHAT TYPE OF DISCOUNT YOU WOULD BE ENTITLED TO, DEPENDING ON  
7 YOUR CATEGORY. THEN FINALLY, THIS, ALL OF THE EXISTING FARE  
8 POLICIES IN THE REGION SUM UP TO REQUIRE ABOUT 20,000, WHAT WE  
9 CALL "BUSINESS RULES" IN THE CLIPPER SYSTEM. SO ON THE BACK  
10 END OF THE CLIPPER CARD IS TECHNOLOGY INFRASTRUCTURE THAT HAS  
11 EVERY FARE PRODUCT COMBINATION PROGRAMMED INTO IT SO IF YOU  
12 TAP YOUR CLIPPER CARD ON AN AC TRANSIT BUS THEN GET ON BART  
13 TRAIN TO TAKE BART FROM BERKELEY TO FREMONT THEN GET OFF TO  
14 VTA SERVICE, WHAT TYPE OF FARE DOES YOUR CLIPPER CARD NEED TO  
15 CHARGE YOU. AND IT TAKES ABOUT 20,000 POLICIES WITHIN THE  
16 CLIPPER CARD SYSTEM TO IMPLEMENT OUR CURRENT FARE POLICY  
17 SYSTEM. AND THAT LEVEL OF COMPLEXITY MEANS THAT IT'S HARDER  
18 FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS TO IMPLEMENT NEW FARE PRODUCTS AND  
19 INNOVATIVE IDEAS IN TERMS OF HOW THEY OFFER PRODUCTS TO THEIR  
20 CUSTOMERS, BECAUSE IT REQUIRES A COMPLICATE THE TECHNOLOGY  
21 IMPLEMENTATION ON THE BACK END. NOW ALL THAT IS SET TO CHANGE  
22 WITH THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM THAT'S COMING IN ITS  
23 FIRST SET OF WAVES LATER THIS YEAR BUT IN OUR CURRENT SYSTEM  
24 TODAY THAT'S WHAT IT TAKES. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO  
25 THE JARGON HERE IS TECHNICAL AND I'LL TRY TO WALK US THROUGH



## Meeting Transcript

1 IT. BUT IF YOU WANT TO THINK ABOUT FARE POLICY AS SORT OF  
2 HAVING DIFFERENT METHODOLOGIES FOR HOW YOU COULD THINK ABOUT  
3 FARES, WE HAVE FOUR SORT OF MAIN DIFFERENT METHODOLOGIES THAT  
4 EXIST IN OUR REGION. WE HAVE SEVEN OPERATORS THAT USE A FLAT  
5 FARE FOR ALL TRIPS. AND THIS IS TYPICAL OF MANY SYSTEMS AROUND  
6 THE U.S., ESPECIALLY BUS OPERATORS. SO THIS MEANS ANY TRIP YOU  
7 TAKE, ANYWHERE IN THE SYSTEM OF THAT OPERATOR, YOU PAY A  
8 SINGLE FARE. SO A LOT OF OUR BUS OPERATORS USE THIS, SYSTEMS  
9 IN OTHER REGIONS LIKE NEW YORK CITY, NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY AND  
10 BUS SYSTEM ALWAYS USE A FLAT FARE. THERE IS A TWEAK ON THAT  
11 WHICH IS A FLAT FARE WITH WHAT WE'RE CALLING A "PREMIUM  
12 HYBRID" AND THAT IS CONSISTENT THAT NINE OPERATORS USE AND THE  
13 ONE ABOVE FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL TRIPS BUT IF THE OPERATOR OFFERS  
14 EXPRESS SERVICE OR REGIONAL SERVICE ON A BUS TYPICALLY, THERE  
15 IS A PREMIUM APPLIED TO THAT. AND A GOOD EXAMPLE OF THAT IS AC  
16 TRANSIT WHICH HAS A FLAT FARE FOR ALL OF THEIR SERVICE WITHIN  
17 THE EAST BAY CHARGES FOR PREMIUM FOR SERVICE FROM SAN  
18 FRANCISCO AND PENINSULA. FIVE OPERATORS ACTUALLY HAVE A ZONE  
19 BASED SYSTEM. THAT MEANS THEY HAVE A MAP OF THEIR SERVICE  
20 AREA, AND THEY ESSENTIALLY DIVIDE THAT SERVICE AREA INTO  
21 ZONES. AND THAT INFORMATION NEEDS TO BE COMMUNICATED TO  
22 PASSENGERS, USUALLY THROUGH MAPS THAT ARE AVAILABLE AT TRANSIT  
23 STOPS OR ON TRANSIT VEHICLES THEMSELVES, TO LET PASSENGERS  
24 KNOW WHICH STATIONS OR STOPS OR CITIES ARE LOCATED IN CERTAIN  
25 ZONES, AND A FARE THAT PASSENGERS ARE CHARGED IS BASED ON THE



## Meeting Transcript

1 NUMBER OF ZONES A CUSTOMER TRAVELS THROUGH. SO SOME OF OUR  
2 OPERATORS LIKE GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT, OR CALTRAIN ARE ZONE-BASED  
3 AND THE FARE THAT IS CHARGED, AGAIN, VARIES ON THE NUMBER OF  
4 ZONES YOU TRAVEL THROUGH. AND THEN FINALLY BART USES A  
5 DISTANCE BASED SYSTEM SO DEPENDING HOW FAR YOU TRAVEL ACROSS  
6 THE SYSTEM YOUR FARE IS ADJUSTED BASED ON THAT DISTANCE. I  
7 WANT TO BRIEFLY PAUSE HERE. DOES ANYONE HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT  
8 WHAT I JUST WALKED THROUGH? IS THERE ANYTHING I CAN CLARIFY  
9 BEFORE I GO ON? OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS. SO I'LL GO AHEAD  
10 ON. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AS I NOTED A MOMENT AGO, FARE  
11 REVENUE AT ITS CORE IS IMPORTANT FOR OPERATORS IN TERMS OF  
12 THEIR REVENUE AND WHAT THEY'RE ABLE TO HAVE -- SORRY -- THE  
13 AMOUNT OF FUNDING THEY'RE ABLE TO HAVE TO OPERATE THEIR  
14 SYSTEMS AND THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC HAS HIGHLIGHTED HOW CRITICAL  
15 FARE REVENUE IS TO SYSTEM OPERATION AND HAVING STABLE SOURCES  
16 OF FUNDING TO ENSURE THAT SERVICE IS ABLE TO BE OPERATED. WHAT  
17 WE'RE SHOWING HERE IS JUST HOW DIFFERENTLY FARE REVENUES --  
18 HOW DIFFERENT A ROLE FARE REVENUES PLAY FOR OPERATOR IN TERMS  
19 OF THE PERCENTAGE OF THEIR OVERALL BUDGET THAT COMES FROM  
20 FARES. GRAY SECTION LOWER PORTION OF EACH OF THESE BARS FOR  
21 LARGEST SEVEN TRANSIT OPERATORS SHOWS HOW MUCH OPERATING  
22 EXPENSES COME FROM FARES. AND THE SORT OF BLUE PORTION ABOVE  
23 IS THE PART THAT SUBSIDIZED BY SOME OTHER TYPE OF FUNDING;  
24 SALES TAX REVENUE, TOLL REVENUE, SOME OTHER TYPE OF FUNDING.  
25 YOU CAN SEE THE RELIANCE ON FARES. TWO THAT STAND OUT ARE BART



## Meeting Transcript

1 ASK CALTRAIN HEAVILY RELIANT ON FARES OTHER OPERATORS SHOWN,  
2 AGAIN THESE ARE LARGE OPERATORS RELY ON FARES FOR A RELATIVELY  
3 SMALL PORTION OF THEIR REVENUE STREAMS TO SUPPORT THEIR  
4 OPERATIONS. IF YOU GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, THIS SHOWS THE  
5 REMAINDER OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS, SO ALL OF OUR SMALLER  
6 SYSTEMS, SO THE SCALE HERE ON THE LEFT IS ADJUSTED GIVEN  
7 SMALLER AGENCIES AND SAN FRANCISCO FERRY SERVICE IS AN OUTLIER  
8 AMONGST THIS GROUP AND A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF THERE  
9 OPERATING BUDGET COMES FROM PASSENGER FARES. SO THIS JUST  
10 HIGHLIGHTS THAT CHANGES TO FARE POLICY CAN HAVE VERY DIFFERENT  
11 EFFECTS ON DIFFERENT OPERATORS, DEPENDING ON HOW THEIR BUDGET  
12 RELIES ON FARES, AND WHAT THAT MEANS FOR THE SERVICE THAT THEY  
13 CAN ACTUALLY OPERATE AND DEPLOY TO THE PUBLIC. GO ON TO THE  
14 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, HOW DID WE SORT OF GET TO WHERE WE ARE  
15 NOW? OVER THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS, MTC AND THE BAY AREA'S  
16 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE HAD DISCUSSIONS ABOUT HOW WE CAN HAVE A  
17 MORE CUSTOMER FOCUSED TRANSIT FARE SYSTEM, AND HOW OUR FARE  
18 POLICY CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE INVESTMENT THAT THE REGION  
19 AND THE OPERATORS ARE MAKING IN THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER  
20 SYSTEM. WHICH, AS I MENTIONED A MOMENT AGO WILL BEGIN ITS  
21 DEPLOYMENT THIS YEAR THROUGH A CLIPPER MOBILE APP AND CONTINUE  
22 TO BE DEPLOYED FULLY OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS. WITH THAT  
23 SORT OF CONTEXT IN MIND, THERE WAS AN AGREEMENT AMONGST THE  
24 OPERATORS AND MTC TO LAUNCH A FARE COORDINATION INTEGRATION  
25 STUDY THAT WE MANAGED JOINTLY BY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC



## Meeting Transcript

1 WITH BART AS THE LEAD FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO THE GOALS  
2 THAT WERE ESTABLISHED FOR THIS PROJECT WERE REALLY SETTING OUT  
3 OF A VISION AND GOALS FOR WHAT THE REGIONAL FARE SYSTEM CAN DO  
4 TO HAVE AN IMPROVED USER EXPERIENCE, HOW WE CAN TRY TO GROW  
5 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP THROUGH FARE POLICIES THAT REALLY ENCOURAGE  
6 PEOPLE TO USE TRANSIT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. AND TO REALLY DO  
7 THAT, BASED ON ROBUST PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT, USER RESEARCH, AND  
8 OUTREACH. AND AS MIKE MENTIONED IN HIS INTRODUCTORY REMARKS WE  
9 REALLY WANTED TO UNDERSTAND THE BARRIERS TO PEOPLE USING  
10 TRANSIT, WHICH THERE ARE MANY, BUT WE WANTED TO REALLY,  
11 ESPECIALLY FOCUS ON HOW FARES IMPACT PEOPLE'S ABILITY TO USE  
12 TRANSIT AND THEIR EXPERIENCE USING THE SYSTEM, AND HOW THAT  
13 MIGHT BE INHIBITING THEM FROM USING TRANSIT IF AT ALL OR TO  
14 THE EXTENT OTHERWISE. WE WANT TO IDENTIFY OPPORTUNITIES TO  
15 INCREASE RIDERSHIP THROUGH IMPROVING THE FARE SYSTEM AS I  
16 MENTIONED AND REALLY DEVELOP AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND A  
17 FUNDING PLAN FOR HOW WE CAN MOVE FORWARD SO THAT THE REGION  
18 AND OPERATORS CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF OPPORTUNITIES AS THEY  
19 ARISE, EITHER ON A FUNDING SIDE OR FROM TECHNICAL STANDPOINT  
20 TO IMPROVE FARE POLICY AND HELP THE CUSTOMER THROUGH A  
21 STRONGER MORE CUSTOMER FOCUSED SYSTEM. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE  
22 PLEASE. SO AS MIKE MENTIONED, THIS PROJECT DOES HAVE A LOT OF  
23 DIFFERENT SORT OF ENTITIES, OR STAKEHOLDER BODIES THAT WERE  
24 CREATED AS A PART OF IT. SO, WE DO HAVE A FARE INTEGRATION  
25 TASK FORCE THAT WAS ESTABLISHED JOINTLY BY THE TRANSIT



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 OPERATORS AND MTC THAT IS THE OWNER AND PROJECT SPONSOR FOR  
2 THIS WORK. AND YOU CAN SEE THE LOGOS OF THE PARTICIPATING  
3 AGENCIES REPRESENTED THERE. IT'S ALL OF OUR LARGE TRANSIT  
4 OPERATORS ALONG WITH A NUMBER OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS AND  
5 THAT GROUP MEETS EVERY OTHER MONTH. NEXT MEETING WILL BE IN  
6 AUGUST. AND THEY HEAR UPDATES ON THE PROJECT, REPORTS FROM THE  
7 CONSULTANT TEAM ABOUT THE PROGRESS ON THE SCOPE OF WORK, ET  
8 CETERA. THEY HAVE THEIR FIRST REAL MEETINGS AFTER THE PROJECT  
9 LAUNCHED JUST LAST MONTH. AS WE HAVE ALSO MENTIONED, THE  
10 PROJECT MANAGERS FOR THIS WORK ARE STAFF FROM BART AND MTC. WE  
11 ARE DOING THIS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH A STAFF WORKING GROUP WHICH  
12 IS MADE UP OF STAFF FROM ALL OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS SHOWN ON  
13 THIS SLIDE. SO THE MEMBERS OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE.  
14 THIS OPERATOR GROUP WAS INSTRUMENTAL IN SELECTING THE  
15 CONSULTING TEAM AND DEVELOPING SCOPE OF WORK AND PROVIDING  
16 SOUNDING BOARD FOR THE CONSULTING TEAM AND PROJECT MANAGERS ON  
17 THE WORK AND HELPING US STAY GROUNDED IN OUR SCOPE OF WORK AND  
18 UNDERSTANDING THE CHALLENGES THAT OPERATORS ARE FACING,  
19 ESPECIALLY IN THIS ENVIRONMENT RIGHT NOW, DURING COVID. SO WE  
20 DO HAVE A CONSULTANT TEAM THAT WAS PROCURED EARLIER THIS YEAR.  
21 THE CONTRACT WAS AWARDED IN MARCH OF 2020. THAT TEAM IS LED BY  
22 A CONSULTING FIRM A MENTIONED, NAMED STEER AND THAT TEAM  
23 CONSISTS OF SUBCONSULTANTS HERE IN THE BAY AREA AND AROUND THE  
24 WORLD: THIS CONSULTING TEAM IS REALLY BOTH INTERNATIONALLY  
25 BASED AND LOCALLY EXPERT SO WE WANTED TO HAVE A SORT OF A SET



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 OF OUTSIDE EYES WHO COULD HELP US ANALYZE THE DATA THAT WE  
2 HAVE IN THE BAY AREA, BUT ALSO THINK BIG ABOUT THE CHALLENGES  
3 AND OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE HAVE AND BRING LESSONS FROM OTHER  
4 PARTS OF THE WORLD THAT WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO LEARN FROM. SO  
5 THIS TEAM IS REALLY A GREAT GROUP THAT WE'RE EXCITED TO WORK W  
6 WE REALLY KICKED OFF THE PROJECT WITH THEM IN MAY, WHICH WAS  
7 AGAIN, SLIGHTLY DELAYED DUE TO THE PANDEMIC. THEN AS NOTED  
8 HERE, THIS GROUP TODAY, THANK YOU ALL FOR BEING PART OF THIS,  
9 THIS IS OUR REAL CORE STAKEHOLDER ADVISORY BODY, THE  
10 SUBCOMMITTEE ON FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION THIS GROUP  
11 IS INTENDED TO BRING TOGETHER ADVOCATES, STAKEHOLDERS WHO ARE  
12 NOT TRANSIT OPERATORS SORT OF A BROAD GROUP OF STAKEHOLDERS  
13 AGAIN TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK TO US AND OUR HOPE IS THAT THIS BODY  
14 WILL MEET EVERY OTHER MONTH THROUGHOUT THE COURSE OF THE  
15 PROJECT SO INTO THE MIDDLE OF NEXT YEAR TO PROVIDE GUIDANCE  
16 AND INPUT TO US. AND FINALLY, I HAVE NOTED ON HERE, THAT AS A  
17 PART OF THE SORT OF AGREEMENT TO ESTABLISH THIS PROJECT, AND  
18 THE FUNDING PLAN FOR THE PROJECT THAT MTC COMMISSION APPROVED  
19 IN OCTOBER OF LAST YEAR THERE IS ALSO TO BE A POLICY MAKER  
20 FORUM ON INTEGRATION WHICH WOULD BRING TOGETHER TO GOVERNING  
21 BOARD MEMBERS ON THE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AS WELL AS MTC ON  
22 THREE PROJECTS TO HEAR UPDATES ON THE STATUS OF THE WORK.  
23 WE'RE FIGURING OUT NOW HOW WE CAN ADJUST THAT PERHAPS TO  
24 RECOGNIZE THE BROADER CHALLENGES THAT THE OPERATORS ARE FACING  
25 BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC, SO WE HAVEN'T CONVENED THAT GROUP



## Meeting Transcript

1 YET, BUT THIS IS ANOTHER PART OF THIS PROJECT. WE CAN GO AHEAD  
2 AND ACTUALLY SKIP TO SLIDE 12, JUST IN THE INTEREST OF TIME  
3 AND WANTING TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE CAN TALK AS MUCH AS YOU HAVE  
4 QUESTIONS AND IDEAS HERE. SO AS I NOTED, THE PROJECT IS AIMING  
5 FOR CONCLUDING IN THE MIDDLE OF 2021, AND YOU CAN SEE ON THIS  
6 SLIDE, THE SORT OF PROPOSED TIMELINE AND WHAT WE'RE THINKING  
7 RIGHT NOW AS WELL AS SOME OF THE RISKS THAT WE FACE, AND THIS  
8 IS AGAIN SOMETHING WE REALLY WANT TO GET YOUR INPUT ON TODAY  
9 WHICH IS THE SUBJECT OF USER RESEARCH. ABOUT A THIRD OF OUR  
10 PROJECT BUDGET WAS INTENDED TO BE SPENT ON USER RESEARCH,  
11 REALLY GETTING ON THE GROUND, AND TALKING TO TRANSIT USERS,  
12 TALKING TO NON-USERS OF THE SYSTEM, AND UNDERSTANDING HOW FARE  
13 POLICY IMPACTS THEM, IS HOW FARE POLICY MAYBE INHIBITS THEM  
14 FROM USING TRANSIT AS MUCH AS THEY WOULD LIKE. SO WE ARE -- WE  
15 CERTAINLY ARE TO FACE RISK IN THIS CATEGORY SINCE WE CAN'T BE  
16 ON THE GROUND TALKING TO PEOPLE FACE-TO-FACE OR IN GROUPS LIKE  
17 WE DID BEFORE THE PANDEMIC THAT'S A LAYER THAT'S GOING TO BE  
18 DISPERSED THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT THIS IS AN AREA WE SEEK YOUR  
19 FEEDBACK ON TODAY. OTHER AREAS I WON'T WALK YOU THROUGH IT BUT  
20 YOU CAN SEE THE DIFFERENT ELEMENTS AS WE PROGRESS TO THE END  
21 OF THE PROJECT WHERE WE WOULD REALLY HAVE SPECIFIC STRATEGIES  
22 AND A VISION FOR WHAT FARE POLICY IN THE REGION COULD EVOLVE  
23 TO, AND WE WOULD BE DOING ANALYSIS, MODELING WORK, FINANCIAL  
24 PLANNING, LOOKING AT HOW IMPLEMENTATION OF THAT VISION WOULD  
25 IMPACT RIDERSHIP, THE FINANCIAL POSITION OF OPERATORS, ET





July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 CETERA. NOW, I THINK THIS IS PROBABLY OBVIOUS TO ALL OF YOU,  
2 BUT OUR SCOPE OF WORK WAS DEVELOPED BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, AND  
3 THE SITUATION HAS CHANGED DRAMATICALLY FROM A RIDERSHIP  
4 STANDPOINT, FROM A FINANCIAL STANDPOINT FOR OPERATORS, SO SOME  
5 OF THE SORT OF FRAMING THAT WE WOULD HAVE DONE HAD COVID NOT  
6 HAPPENED WOULD PROBABLY BE A BIT DIFFERENT NOW BECAUSE OF THE  
7 PANDEMIC AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO  
8 DISCUSSING WITH THIS GROUP OVER THE COMING YEAR TO FIGURE OUT  
9 HOW TO BEST PRESENT THE UNLESS AND GROUND IT IN THE REALITY  
10 WE'RE IN TODAY, NOT NECESSARILY EXCLUSIVELY IN A PRE COVID  
11 REALITY. SO I'LL GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND THIS WILL BE THE  
12 LAST SLIDE THEY WANT TO WALK US THROUGH AND I'LL TURN IT OVER  
13 TO MIKE. COVID-19 REALLY HAS PRESENTED AN UNPRECEDENTED SET OF  
14 CHALLENGES FOR THE PASSENGERS AND PUBLIC AT LARGE WHO ARE  
15 TRYING TO USE TRANSIT TO ACCESS THEIR JOBS TO ACCESS HEALTH  
16 CARE TO ACCESS BASIC NECESSITIES OF LIFE. IT'S CREATED  
17 INCREDIBLE CHALLENGES FOR TRANSIT STAFF WHO ARE REALLY ON THE  
18 FRONT LINES EVERY SINGLE DAY, AND IN SOME INSTANCES ARE REALLY  
19 RISKING THEIR LIVES TO DELIVER SERVICE AND ENSURE THE PUBLIC  
20 STILL HAS MOBILITY AND FOR THE AGENCIES THEMSELVES ESPECIALLY  
21 FOR OPERATORS THAT ARE VERY DEPENDENT ON FARES AS WE TALKED  
22 ABOUT A MOMENT AGO, IF HALF OF YOUR BUDGET HAS BASICALLY  
23 DISAPPEARED IT CREATES A SERIOUS FINANCIAL RISK FOR YOUR  
24 AGENCY AND YOUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE SERVICE IN THE LONG-TERM.  
25 CARES ACT AND THE FEDERAL FUNDING THAT WAS INCLUDED WITH IT,



## Meeting Transcript

1 FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS, WAS A TREMENDOUSLY IMPORTANT LIFELINE  
2 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE AGENCIES CAN CONTINUE TO OPERATE, BUT IT  
3 ONLY LASTS SO LONG AND SINCE WE HAVE NO IDEA WHERE THE  
4 PANDEMIC WILL TAKE US OVER THE COMING MONTHS, IT IS A  
5 SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE FOR OUR SYSTEMS. AND I WANT TO NOTE,  
6 SINCE THIS GROUP TODAY, WE'RE REALLY -- YOU ARE STAKEHOLDERS  
7 AND THE PUBLIC, WE RECOGNIZE THAT FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE, SO  
8 MUCH HAS CHANGED WITH TRANSIT SINCE MARCH. AND THE PUBLIC IS  
9 FACING DIFFERENT SCHEDULES. YOU COULD HAVE BEEN VERY USED TO A  
10 SPECIFIC SCHEDULE FOR YOUR SERVICE OR SERVICE US THAT USE  
11 REGULARLY THAT ARE COMPLETELY THROWN OUT THE WINDOW NOW, AND  
12 YOUR SERVICE MIGHT COME EVERY HOUR INSTEAD OF EVERY 20 MINUTES  
13 LIKE IT USED TO. THAT THERE ARE TREMENDOUS CONCERNS ABOUT  
14 SAFETY, AND HOW -- WHAT TYPE OF EXPERIENCE YOU WILL FACE USING  
15 TRANSIT. I THINK THE OPERATORS ARE DOING A LOT ON THIS TOPIC,  
16 BUT IT'S STILL SOMETHING THAT PASSENGER ARE VERY CONCERNED  
17 ABOUT. AND PEOPLE USE TRANSIT TO ACCESS JOBS. THAT'S AN  
18 IMPORTANT PART OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, AND SINCE SO MANY PEOPLE  
19 IN OUR REGION AND AROUND THE COUNTRY HAVE FACED JOB LOSSES OR  
20 FURLOUGHS OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS IT CHANGES THE FINANCIAL  
21 SITUATION OF INDIVIDUALS AND THEIR NEED AND ABILITY TO USE  
22 TRANSIT. YOU MIGHT HAVE USED TRANSIT REGULARLY AT A CERTAIN  
23 TIME OF DAY BEFORE THE PANDEMIC AND NOW PERHAPS YOU USE IT AT  
24 A DIFFERENT TIME OF DAY AND FIND THE SERVICES VERY DIFFERENT.  
25 AND THEN IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE AS WELL THAT TRANSIT PROVIDES



## Meeting Transcript

1 AN IMPORTANT ACCESS ROUTE FOR MEMBERS OF OUR COMMUNITY TO  
2 EDUCATION. AND WITH SCHOOLS, COMMUNITY COLLEGES, UNIVERSITIES,  
3 PRIMARILY, OPERATING ON A DISTANCE LEARNING BASIS RIGHT NOW,  
4 THE TYPE OF SERVICE THAT PEOPLE ARE USING TO ACCESS THOSE  
5 EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS MIGHT NOT BE NECESSARY ANYMORE, OR  
6 MIGHT HAVE CHANGED SIGNIFICANTLY, AND THAT HAS A MAJOR IMPACT  
7 AS WELL ON BOTH THE PUBLIC AND ON OUR OPERATORS. SO IF ANYONE  
8 HAS ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT WE HAVE JUST WALKED THROUGH, AS  
9 SORT OF BACKGROUND, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THAT NOW. AND OTHERWISE  
10 I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MIKE WHO WILL START TO GET INTO A LITTLE  
11 BIT MORE OF WHAT WE WANT TO DISCUSS WITH YOU WHICH IS PROBLEM  
12 STATEMENT, USER RESEARCH AND HOW WE APPROACH THAT.

13

14 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** BUT BILL. I'LL PUT THE QUESTION TO ADINA AS  
15 OUR CHAIR HERE. DO YOU WANT TO BREAK HERE AND HAVE SOME  
16 DISCUSSION ON THIS GENERAL ITEM? OR DO YOU WANT TO MOVE INTO  
17 THE PROBLEM STATEMENT SPECIFICALLY FIRST?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** LET'S SEE. OUT OF THE PANELISTS, DOES ANYBODY  
20 WANT TO RAISE A HAND IF THERE IS A QUESTION THAT YOU HAVE  
21 ABOUT THE MATERIAL THAT HAS BEEN PRESENTED TO DATE? IF SO  
22 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, IF NOT WE'LL MOVE ON.

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** ADINA I AM HERE NOW.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** WELCOME WENDI. FOR PERSONS WHO HAVE HEARD  
2 THE PRESENTATION, ANY HANDS WITH QUESTIONS? ALL RIGHT. I SEE  
3 THAT TISHA HAS A QUESTION.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MINE IS A QUESTION. IN ORDER TO ENTER HOW  
6 WE CAN BETTER ACCESS GROUP DEMOGRAPHICS AND UNDERSTANDING  
7 THEIR BARRIERS, A QUESTION TO ME IS, DO WE HAVE DEMOGRAPHICS  
8 OF RIDERSHIP? I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT SO WE CAN KEEP EQUITY  
9 VISIBLE, AND ALSO TO BETTER UNDERSTAND WHERE WE NEED TO FOCUS  
10 GROWTH STRATEGIES AND SO THAT WE CAN BOTH BE EFFECTIVE AND  
11 STRATEGIC IN REACHING OUT TO THEM TO UNDERSTAND THOSE BARRIERS  
12 FOR THEM?

13

14 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION IT'S AN IMPORTANT  
15 QUESTION ABOUT WHAT TYPE OF DATA WE HAVE AND WHO IS USING THE  
16 SYSTEM. WE HAVE AT A REGIONAL LEVEL A FAIRLY ROBUST DATA SET  
17 THIS COMES FROM MTC REGIONAL TRAVEL SURVEY THAT WE DO IN  
18 PARTNERSHIP WITH ALL OF THE OPERATORS. THAT COLLECTS  
19 INFORMATION, ESPECIALLY ABOUT DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTIC LIKE  
20 HOUSEHOLD INCOME, ACCESS TO VEHICLES WITHIN A HOUSEHOLD THINGS  
21 LIKE THAT. WE HAVE LESS SPECIFIC DETAIL ABOUT THE -- IN THE  
22 REGIONAL DATA SET -- ABOUT ETHNICITY OF PASSENGERS, BUT  
23 TRANSIT OPERATORS THEMSELVES HAVE MUCH MORE ROBUST DATA IN  
24 THEIR OWN DATA SETS ABOUT THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE USERS OF  
25 THEIR SYSTEM AND THEY HAVE TO COLLECT THAT INFORMATION AS A



## Meeting Transcript

1 PART OF THEIR FEDERAL TITLE SIX ANALYSIS WHEN THEY DO CHANGES  
2 TO FARE POLICY OR MANY OTHER ASPECTS OF THEIR SERVICE. SO ONE  
3 OF THE THINGS WE NEED TO DO IN THE SORT OF FIRST PHASE OF OUR  
4 PROJECT IS COLLECT ALL OF THE RELEVANT DATA THAT'S NECESSARY  
5 TO DO THE ANALYSIS AND SORT OF THIS DEMOGRAPHIC DATA IS  
6 IMPORTANT PART OF THAT. ONE OTHER THING I'LL ASK MAYBE A  
7 QUESTION TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE IS, WE HAVE A LOT OF DATA PRE  
8 COVID, BUT THE RIDERSHIP OF OUR SYSTEM AND THE MAKE UP OF WHO  
9 IS USING OUR SYSTEM HAS CHANGED A LOT. I THINK ANECDOTALLY WE  
10 KNOW MOST OF THE PEOPLE USING TRANSIT TODAY ARE DEPENDENT ON  
11 THE SERVICE AND DEPENDENT ON THE SYSTEMS BUT WE DON'T HAVE  
12 GOOD DATA ABOUT WHO THOSE INDIVIDUALS ARE AND MORE ROBUST  
13 INFORMATION ABOUT WHO IS USING THE SYSTEM TODAY. SO THAT'S AN  
14 AREA WHERE WE GOING TO CONTINUE AS STAFF INVESTIGATING TO SEE  
15 WHAT INFORMATION WE CAN COLLECT, BUT AGAIN AS SOME COMMUNITY  
16 MEMBERS, IF YOU HAVE THOUGHTS OR IDEAS ABOUT WAYS TO THINK  
17 ABOUT THAT QUESTION, OR TO ACCESS DATA, ARE WE'RE ALL EARS. SO  
18 THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. SO I SEE THAT RICH HEDGES HAS A  
21 QUESTION.

22

23 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH, THANK YOU, CAN EVERYONE HERE ME? I HAVE  
24 HAD A LITTLE PROBLEM WITH CAMERA AND SOUND. THIS IS AN OVERALL  
25 QUESTION WITHOUT WAITING TO FIND OUT IF WE CAN DO IT I AM



## Meeting Transcript

1 INTERESTED AND I BELIEVE MANY MEMBERS OF OUR GROUP ARE  
2 INTERESTED IN A REGIONAL FARE POLICY WHERE ONE FARE FITS ALL  
3 KNOWING PROBLEMS WE HAD IN THE GRANDFATHER OF CLIPPER, IS IT  
4 POSSIBLE, GIVEN ALL OF THE COMPLEXITIES WITH THE VARIOUS FARE  
5 SYSTEMS, TO HAVE A REGIONAL FARE? I WANT TO KNOW THAT BEFORE  
6 WE GET OFF ON DEALING WITH IT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **WILLIAM BACON:** CAN I CLARIFY, RICH, IS YOUR QUESTION SAYING,  
9 IS IT TECHNICALLY POSSIBLE THAT WE COULD HAVE A SINGLE FARE  
10 POLICY?

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** TECHNICALLY AND POLITICALLY, POSSIBLY.

13

14 **WILLIAM BACON:** I'LL SPEAK TO THE TECHNICAL SIDE AT LEAST.

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** GOOD IDEA.

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM WHICH FOR  
19 THOSE OF YOU WHO AREN'T FAMILIAR, THE REGION AND OPERATORS ARE  
20 INVESTING IN REPLACING THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM RIGHT NOW  
21 AND THE TECHNOLOGY IS BEING DEVELOPED AND, AGAIN WILL BEGIN TO  
22 BE DEPLOYED LATER THIS YEAR, THAT SYSTEM WILL TECHNOLOGICALLY  
23 MAKE IT EASIER TO CHANGE FARE POLICY AND MUCH CHEAPER TO  
24 IMPLEMENT CHANGES TO THE FARE POLICY WHICH RIGHT NOW IS ONE OF  
25 THE BIG BARRIERS BECAUSE OF THE 20,000 BUSINESS RULES I



## Meeting Transcript

1 MENTIONED. OUR CURRENT TECHNOLOGY USES INFRASTRUCTURE,  
2 BASICALLY, FROM MORE THAN 20 YEARS AGO. IT'S VERY OLD, SO THIS  
3 WILL REALLY BRING THE FARE PAYMENT TECHNOLOGY INTO THE 21st  
4 CENTURY AND ALLOW THE FLEXIBILITY PEOPLE WANT NOW. IN TERMS OF  
5 LOGISTICS OF FARE POLICY CHANGE RIGHT NOW THE TRANSIT  
6 OPERATORS CONTROL THEIR FARE POLICY SO THIS IS LOOKING AT  
7 SETTING OUT IDEAS AND A VISION FOR WHAT THE REGION COULD  
8 COLLECTIVELY ACHIEVE AND QUESTIONS ABOUT GOVERNANCE, OR  
9 CHANGES TO THAT ARE REALLY SORT OF BROADER TOPICS THAT ARE  
10 ADDRESSED A LITTLE BIT OUTSIDE THE STUDY, AND I DON'T KNOW  
11 MIKE IF YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD TO THAT?

12

13 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** ONLY TO SAY, I THINK WE HAVE -- THERE IS A  
14 BROAD RANGE OF POTENTIAL OF PROPOSALS WE COULD HAVE, AND I  
15 THINK WE HAVE SET OUT TO TRY TO COVER THAT RANGE. SO, YOU  
16 KNOW, THIS PROJECT COULD PROPOSE RELATIVELY SMALL FIXES, IT  
17 COULD PROPOSE QUITE A LARGE CHANGE IN THE STRUCTURE OF FARES  
18 IN THE REGION, AND THAT -- AND THOSE BIG CHANGES COULD INCLUDE  
19 CONSIDERATION OF ISSUES UP TO AND INCLUDING GOVERNANCE. BUT,  
20 THERE IS A LOT OF WORK TO DO TO UNDERSTAND IMPLICATIONS AND  
21 CHALLENGES IN THE PROCESS. I WOULD SAY WE'RE NOT RULING  
22 ANYTHING OUT AT THE START OF THE STUDY.

23

24 **RICHARD HEDGES:** IF I CAN JUST ONE STATEMENT, JUST DID A QUICK  
25 STUDY ON -- IT'S ABOUT \$13.25 1 WAY, SO YOU'RE LOOKING AT AN



## Meeting Transcript

1 ADULT WITHOUT THEIR DISCOUNTS ROUND TRIP FROM MTC ABOUT 26  
2 BUCKS. THAT'S PROHIBITIVE FOR MANY INDIVIDUALS TO USE TRANSIT.  
3 THAT'S WHY I'M SO INTERESTED IN A REGIONAL ONE-TIME PAYMENT  
4 FARE POLICY.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU RICH. RANDI KINMAN HAS HAD HER HAND  
7 RAISED.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. JUST A REQUEST TO STAFF, SINCE WE'RE  
10 DISCUSSING, SINCE EQUITY QUESTION CAME UP, CAN YOU PLEASE  
11 ROUTE OUT EITHER SEPARATELY OR IN OUR NEXT PACKET, THE MAPPING  
12 THAT WE HAVE FOR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN? I THINK THAT WILL  
13 HELP PEOPLE WHO ARE NEW TO THE REGIONAL DISCUSSION SEE WHERE  
14 OUR COMMUNITIES OF POVERTY AND COLOR ACTUALLY ARE, AND IT'S A  
15 BASELINE FOR US TO AT LEAST START THAT CONVERSATION AS WE WAIT  
16 FOR NEW DATA. THANK YOU.

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE'LL DEFINITELY BE ABLE TO DO THAT. THANKS  
19 RANDI.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. MOVING ON TO WENDI KALLINS WHO HAS  
22 HAD A HAND UP.

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES. THIS IS A FOLLOW UP TO RICH'S QUESTION AND  
25 COMMENTS. -- IN LOOKING AT THE CHART, IT'S REALLY OBVIOUS THAT





## Meeting Transcript

1 THE RAIL LINES, YOU KNOW, BART, AND CALTRAIN, IN PARTICULAR,  
2 THEY CHARGE MORE FOR THE SERVICE, AND THEY ALSO HAVE A MUCH  
3 HIGHER PERCENTAGE OF THEIR INCOME COMING FROM FARES, HOW ARE  
4 WE GOING TO BE WEIGHING THAT AS WE LOOK AT THE LARGER SYSTEM  
5 AND FINDING SOME KIND OF FARE INTEGRATION WHEN YOU HAVE THOSE  
6 KIND OF DISPARITIES GOING ON?

7

8 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** MAYBE JUST ON THAT I SHOULD SAY, SPEAKING AS  
9 BOTH A PARTICIPANT AND BART STAFF PERSON, YES THAT IS A BIG  
10 CHALLENGE AND SOMETHING THIS STUDY IS GOING TO HAVE TO --  
11 ESPECIALLY WHEN WE START THINKING ABOUT BIG MOVES ON FARES  
12 IT'S GOING TO BE A COMPLEX CHALLENGE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO  
13 THINK CAREFULLY ABOUT.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I SEE IAN GRIFFITHS HAS A HAND RAISED AS  
16 WELL.

17

18 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** ON THE QUESTION THAT RICHARD POSED, I MEAN, I  
19 CERTAINLY BELIEVE THAT THE ROLE OF THIS STAKEHOLDER GROUP  
20 SHOULD NOT BE CONSTRAINED BY WHAT THE EXISTING STRUCTURES OR  
21 FUNDING SOURCES THAT WE HAVE. I THINK OUR ROLE, AND THE ROLE  
22 OF THIS STUDY AS A WHOLE IS TO LEAD WITH WHAT IS RIGHT FOR  
23 USERS, WHAT IS RIGHT FOR THE PUBLIC, WHAT WILL -- LIKE,  
24 FOCUSING ON, I AGREE WITH THE GOALS THAT ARE STATED AT THE  
25 OUTSET FOR THE STUDY, AND IF WE KEEP OURSELVES FOCUSED ON



## Meeting Transcript

1 DEVELOPING FARE SYSTEMS THAT ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS, WE MAY FIND  
2 THAT WE DON'T HAVE THE RIGHT GOVERNANCE IN PLACE. WE NEED TO  
3 LOOK AT OTHER FARE REVENUE SOURCES. BUT IF WE'RE NOT EVER  
4 GOING TO EXPLORE THOSE THINGS OR BUILD A CASE FOR THOSE THINGS  
5 IF WE DON'T HAVE A STUDY THAT DOCUMENT WHERE IS THEY'RE  
6 NEEDED. AND THERE IS A NUMBER OF THINGS GOING ON RIGHT NOW,  
7 THROUGH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND OTHER STATE AND  
8 REGIONAL LEADERS THAT SUGGEST THAT THERE IS THAT POSSIBILITY.  
9 SO THIS STUDY, I SEE THIS STUDY AS PLAYING AN IMPORTANT ROLE  
10 IN, AGAIN, LEADING WITH WHAT'S RIGHT FOR USERS. SO I'M HAPPY  
11 TO HEAR THAT WE'RE NOT CONSTRAINING OURSELVES BY WHAT'S  
12 CURRENTLY POSSIBLE, AND I WOULD JUST ENCOURAGE EVERYONE IN  
13 THIS GROUP TO NOT SORT OF ARTIFICIALLY TAKE THINGS OFF THE  
14 TABLE BECAUSE IT DOESN'T SEEM POSSIBLE RIGHT NOW. I THINK IT'S  
15 OUR ROLE TO LEAD WITH WHAT WE THINK SHOULD BE THE SYSTEM.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. SO THAT SEEMS LIKE THE END OF  
18 THE HANDS. I HAVE ONE SHORT QUESTION TO ASK -- MIGHT NOT BE  
19 SHORT TO ANSWER, AND THEN WE CAN MOVE ON TO THE NEXT PIECE OF  
20 THE PRESENTATION. MY QUESTION WAS, WITH THOSE 20,000 BUSINESS  
21 RULES WHERE PRESUMABLY THAT MAKES IT FLOW AND COSTLY BE ABLE  
22 TO CHANGE TO BE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT ANY CHANGES TO THAT PRETTY  
23 COMPLICATED SYSTEM, HAS THE CLIPPER TEAM ASSESSED THAT IF  
24 THOSE NUMBER OF RULES WERE SIMPLIFIED, HOW MUCH COST SAVINGS  
25 THERE MIGHT BE AND HOW MUCH TIME SAVINGS THERE MIGHT BE TO THE



## Meeting Transcript

1 FARE SYSTEM? BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT  
2 SOME CHANGES THAT MIGHT COST MONEY, MIGHT THERE BE ANY SAVINGS  
3 IN THINGS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT? IS THAT A QUESTION WITH A KNOWN  
4 ANSWER?

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** THIS IS BILL AGAIN, COPROJECT MANAGER. I CAN'T  
7 SPEAK SPECIFICALLY ADINA TO THE DOLLAR COST CHANGES FROM A  
8 REDUCTION IN BUSINESS RULES. I CAN SPEAK GENERALLY THAT SORT  
9 OF WHAT YOU WERE SORT OF ASKING THERE, DOES THE COST GO DOWN  
10 AS THE BUSINESS RULES DECREASE. AND THERE'S A CORRELATION  
11 THERE IF WE HAVE NEW BUSINESS RULES THE COST OF IMPLEMENTING  
12 INDIVIDUAL FARE POLICY CHANGES CAN BE LOWER BECAUSE IT NEEDS  
13 TO BE TESTED AGAINST FEWER COMBINATIONS OF OTHER BUSINESS  
14 RULES. COMPLEXITY IN AND OF ITSELF IS NOT ALWAYS A BAD THING  
15 IN TERMS OF HOW A FARE POLICY MIGHT WORK ON THE BACK END, BUT  
16 IT DOES HAVE IMPLEMENTATION COSTS FROM A TECHNICAL STANDPOINT,  
17 BUT IT MIGHT NOT ACTUALLY BE BAD FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE.  
18 THERE CAN BE COMPLICATED TECHNOLOGY SOLUTIONS THAT IMPLEMENT  
19 SOMETHING VERY GOOD FOR THE PUBLIC. SO I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD  
20 BE CON STRAND BY THINKING BUSINESS RULES ARE JUST THAT. BUT IN  
21 OUR CURRENT TECHNOLOGY IT IS COSTLY TO MAKE CHANGES AS A  
22 RESULT OF THOSE BUSINESS RULES IN OUR NEW NEXT GENERATION  
23 CLIPPER SYSTEM BECAUSE IT'S NOT TECHNOLOGY FROM 1998 IT WILL  
24 BE EASIER TO USE AND EASIER TO MAKE CHANGES FROM A TECHNOLOGY  
25 STANDPOINT. AT OUR NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING WE CAN HAVE ONE OF



## Meeting Transcript

1 OUR STAFF CLIPPER MEMBERS TO BE PRESENT TO ANSWER QUESTIONS  
2 ABOUT THE BALANCE OF COST REDUCTION THAT WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO  
3 ACHIEVE.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO I HAVE A BUNCH OF QUESTIONS ABOUT  
6 EQUITY THAT PROBABLY RELATE TO USER RESEARCH THEY WILL ASK ALL  
7 THE WAY AT THE END. I SEE THAT BRIAN STANKE HAS HIS HAND  
8 RAISED. SO GO AHEAD BRIAN, BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT PART  
9 OF THE PRESENTATION.

10

11 **BRIAN STANKE:** QUICKLY ON FEASIBILITY, COST, TECHNOLOGY, I  
12 THINK SOMETHING THAT WAS POINTED OUT IN THE PRESENTATION SO  
13 FAR, AND THAT HASN'T CHANGED WITH COVID, IS WHEN WE HAVE 30  
14 SOMETHING AGENCIES WITH MULTIPLE DIFFERENT DEFINITIONS OF HOW  
15 OLD A YOUTH IS, HOW MUCH A DISCOUNT IS, THERE IS NO TECHNOLOGY  
16 NEEDED TO ALIGN THOSE POLICIES. IT CAN BE DONE BY ALL 30  
17 AGENCIES AGREEING THIS IS WHAT A YOUTH IS, THIS IS WHAT THE  
18 DISCOUNT IS, AND WHAT CAN BE DONE WITHIN STATE LAW. THERE IS A  
19 DECISION TO DO IT, BUT, AND THERE IS NO TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIER  
20 FOR ALIGNING A LOT OF THESE POLICIES AND RULES. SO WE HAVE TO  
21 KEEP THAT IN MIND, AND THERE COULD BE SIGNIFICANT SAVINGS AND  
22 PEOPLE, YOU KNOW, THAT THE PUBLIC UNDERSTANDING WHAT THE RULES  
23 ARE. WE HAVE 15 DIFFERENT YOUTH FARES AND NO ONE CAN REMEMBER  
24 THAT. AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT'S NOT AFFECTED BY WHATEVER  
25 COVID OR WHATEVER THE FUTURE BRINGS.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **WILLIAM BACON:** THOSE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT POINTS. ONE THING I  
3 WOULD NOTE IS THERE HAS BEEN SOME PROGRESS OVER THE LAST FEW  
4 YEARS IN THE REGION, AND THE OPERATORS ACTUALLY DO, NOW, AGREE  
5 ON THE AGES OF YOUTH AND SENIORS, WHICH WAS NOT THE CASE IN  
6 THE PAST. SO THERE IS AGREEMENT THAT, YOU KNOW, A SENIOR  
7 STARTS AT AGE 65, WHICH HAD NOT ALWAYS BEEN THE CASE. BUT OF  
8 THE ACTUAL DISCOUNTS THAT ARE OFFERED ARE WHAT I WAS  
9 HIGHLIGHTING EARLIER IN THE PRESENTATION. SO THERE IS VERY  
10 DIFFERENT DISCOUNT RATES THAT ARE OFFERED DEPENDING ON WHICH  
11 SYSTEM YOU'RE USING IF YOU ARE A YOUTH OR A SENIOR.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE ARE SEEING -- I'M  
16 NOT SEEING HANDS FROM ANYBODY THAT HASN'T SPOKEN.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TISHA HAS HER HAND UP.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** TISHA DO YOU WANT TO SPEAK AGAIN OR DO YOU  
21 HAVE SOMETHING FOR THE END?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I CAN SAVE IT FOR THE END THAT'S FINE.

24



## Meeting Transcript

1   **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** IN THE INTEREST OF HEARING FROM STAFF,  
2   LET'S HEAR THE NEXT PIECE OF THE PRESENTATION AND THEN ASK  
3   MORE QUESTIONS AND MAKE MORE COMMENTS THEN. SO HANDING THIS  
4   BACK OVER TO STAFF.

5

6   **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY. LET'S SEE. CAN WE DISPLAY THE  
7   POWERPOINT DECK HERE STARTING ON SLIDE 15? DO FOLKS SEE THE  
8   POWERPOINT DECK OR NO? NEXT TOPIC IS THE PROBLEM STATEMENT.  
9   IT'S A STEP IN THE STUDY, IT'S TO CREATE A PROBLEM STATEMENT,  
10   AND YOU KNOW, IF YOU THINK OF THE BACKGROUND MATERIAL THAT  
11   BILL JUST RAN THROUGH, THIS IS A COMPLEX ISSUE THAT HAS A LOT  
12   OF DIFFERENT FACETS SO THE PROBLEM STATEMENTS TRIES TO PUT ON  
13   PAPER EXACTLY WHAT ARE WE DOING HERE, WHAT ARE THE ISSUES  
14   WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS IN A CONCISE WAY. AND WE'RE FRAMING  
15   THIS AS A HYPOTHESIS TO TEST AND A STATEMENT THAT WILL BE  
16   REFINED AS WE MUTUAL THROUGH THE STUDY AND LEARN THINGS --  
17   THAT'S THE BASIC IDEA HERE AND THIS HAS FOUR PARTS HERE THE  
18   MATERIAL THAT WE GOT FOR YOU, IN THE PROBLEM STATEMENT, THE  
19   FIRST PART IS A KIND OF STATEMENT OF WHERE WE THINK FARES FITS  
20   IN THE CONTEXT OF THE BROADER SET OF ISSUES AND CHALLENGES FOR  
21   REGIONAL TRANSIT, TRANSPORTATION MOBILITY. SO THAT'S AN  
22   IMPORTANT CONTEXT STATEMENT, AND THEN THERE IS A CONCISE SORT  
23   OF THE CORE OF THE PROBLEM STATEMENT ITSELF, IS SHOWN IN PART  
24   TWO, AND THEN SOME MORE DETAIL ABOUT HOW WE MIGHT SORT OF  
25   PROCEED IN STUDYING EACH ELEMENT OF THE PROJECT STATEMENT --



## Meeting Transcript

1 OF THE PROBLEM STATEMENT. SO MAYBE IF WE COULD MOVE TO SLIDE -  
2 - THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE PROBLEM STATEMENT PART ONE  
3 THIS IS THE CONTEXT THEY JUST MENTIONED. SO, IN THE FIRST TWO  
4 PARAGRAPHS HERE KIND OF SPEAK TO THE BACKGROUND THAT BILL JUST  
5 COVERED SO MAYBE I'LL FOCUS ON THE SECOND TWO PARAGRAPHS. SO  
6 ONE IS, WE TRY TO CAPTURE -- YOU KNOW, IF WE'RE THINKING ABOUT  
7 HOW FARES AFFECT MOBILITY FARES SIT IN CONTEXT OF IMPORTANT  
8 FACTORS SO WE TRY TO LAY OUT THOSE. TRANSIT SERVICE  
9 RELIABILITY, FREQUENCY, COVERAGE, CONNECTIVITY, LAND USE AND  
10 DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS, THE PRICE OF TRANSIT RELATIVE TO OTHER  
11 OPTIONS AND IS A FARE ISSUE. THOSE ARE IMPORTANT FACTORS IN  
12 PEOPLE'S DECISION MAKING AROUND MOBILITY AND THE CONVENIENCE  
13 OF THE SYSTEM MAY BE IMPORTANT FOR TRAVELLERS. THIS IS WHY  
14 THIS IS IMPORTANT. AND BUT WE DO WANT TO IDENTIFY THAT BAY  
15 AREA TRANSIT RIDERS FACE CHALLENGES ACROSS ALL OF THOSE AREAS  
16 AND THIS STUDY SITS IN THAT CONTEXT AND LASTLY, THE AUDIENCE  
17 THAT COVID-19 HAS IMPACTED ALL AREAS OF THE REGION, TRANSIT,  
18 MORE THAN MOST, AND THE STUDY WILL HAVE TO PROCEED IN THAT  
19 CONTEXT. SO NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS IS SORT OF THE CORE OF  
20 THE PROBLEM STATEMENT. AND, AGAIN, WE ARE FRAMING THIS AS A  
21 HYPOTHESIS TO TEST, AND IT WILL BE UPDATED AS WE MOVE THROUGH  
22 THE STUDY. SO SORT OF LOOKING HERE AT THE SECOND HALF OF THIS  
23 SLIDE, HOW DOES THE CURRENT STATE OF FARE COORDINATION AND  
24 INTEGRATION AFFECT TRAVELERS AND LIMIT RIDERSHIP? SO WE WERE  
25 GOING TO EVALUATE THOSE IMPACTS IN THE FOLLOWING AREAS. AND



## Meeting Transcript

1 THIS IS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE TRYING TO BREAK DOWN A COMPLEX ISSUE  
2 INTO SEVERAL SIMPLE PIECES, AND THIS IS AN AREA WHERE YOU'RE  
3 INPUT IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT. WAY WE HAVE CHOSEN TO BREAK IT  
4 DOWN IS, ONE, CUSTOMER VALUE CURRENT FARE POLICIES CAN LEAD TO  
5 DISCONNECT BETWEEN FARE CHARGE AND VALUE A CUSTOMER PLACES ON  
6 THEIR TRIP. SPOKEN TO THIS MORNING. PAYMENT EXPERIENCE. SO  
7 CURRENT FARE PRODUCTS PASSES PAYMENT TECHNOLOGIES AND PAYMENT  
8 EXPERIENCES MAY NOT BE LEGIBLE OR EASILY UNDERSTOOD. THREE.  
9 EQUITY, WE HAVE ALSO BEGUN TO ADDRESS THIS MORNING CURRENT  
10 FARES MAY NOT CONSISTENTLY MEET THE NEEDS OF VULNERABLE  
11 POPULATIONS AND FOUR FUTURE TRANSIT CURRENT FARES MAY NOT  
12 OPTIMIZE RIDERSHIP AND BENEFITS OF TRANSPORTATION IMPOSED  
13 INVESTMENTS. THAT'S THE CORE OF THE PROBLEM STATEMENT. IF YOU  
14 CAN MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS ONE IS A LITTLE MORE  
15 DETAILED. SO THE -- IN ORDER TO STAY SIMPLE, WE HAVE KEPT  
16 THOSE CORE STATEMENTS HIGH LEVEL, BUT THIS STABLE HERE KIND OF  
17 LAYS OUT SORT OF SOME EXAMPLES -- AND SOME KEY CHALLENGES TO  
18 INVESTIGATE RELATED TO EACH OF THE CORE STATEMENTS AND I DON'T  
19 WANT TO READ THOSE, BUT THE COLUMN ON THE LEFT HERE CAN SORT  
20 OF HELP CLARIFY WHAT IT IS EXACTLY THAT WE MEAN IN EACH OF  
21 THOSE AREAS. AND THEN WE CAN CERTAINLY -- THAT SLIDE THERE IS  
22 PROBABLY WHERE WE WANT TO FOCUS OUR ATTENTION, WHILE WE  
23 DISCUSS IT, BUT I DID WANT TO POINT OUT, IF YOU LOOK ON THE  
24 NEXT SLIDE, AND IT'S REALLY THE NEXT THREE HERE, OUR  
25 CONSULTANT TEAM, AND BILL MENTIONED IT'S A TEAM LED BY STEER





## Meeting Transcript

1 THAT GOT A LOT OF EXPERIENCE DOING CITIES LIKE THIS, BOTH  
2 DOMESTICALLY IN THIS COUNTRY AND INTERNATIONALLY THEY LAID OUT  
3 A DRAFT RESEARCH PLAN FOR DATA THEY WOULD LIKE TO HELP US  
4 COLLECT AND SOME ANALYSIS THAT WE CAN BEGIN DOING FOCUSED  
5 AROUND THE PLANKS IN THIS PROBLEM STATEMENT. SO, LET'S SEE.  
6 MAYBE I'LL JUST WRAP UP ON SLIDE 22, SO IF YOU COULD SKIP  
7 FORWARD A COUPLE OF SLIDES. SO -- AND THESE ARE SOME QUESTIONS  
8 THAT WE HAVE PUT OUT TO SORT OF QUEUE UP YOUR THINKING. DOES  
9 THE PROBABLE STATEMENT EFFECTIVELY CAPTURE THE DECISION MAKING  
10 FACTORS FOR RIDING TRANSIT? DOES THE PROBLEM STATEMENT IMPACT  
11 THE COVID STATEMENT ADEQUATELY DOES THE PROBLEM STATEMENT  
12 CAPTURE ISSUES AROUND EQUITY APPROPRIATELY, AND THEN OF COURSE  
13 ANY FEEDBACK ISSUES SUGGESTIONS. WE ARE OPEN TO YOUR INPUT  
14 NOW. SO MAYBE ADINA I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU FOR DISCUSSION.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** IN TERMS TO -- REMIND ME, IF THERE IS AN  
17 ADDITIONAL SECTION FOLLOWING THIS ONE IN TERMS OF MANAGING THE  
18 TIME?

19

20 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. WE HAVE ONE MORE SECTION, WHICH IS USER  
21 RESEARCH.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY GREAT. OKAY. SO ON THOSE PROBLEM  
24 STATEMENTS, ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS ABOUT THIS AT THIS TIME?



## Meeting Transcript

1 AND I'M LOOKING FOR HANDS. SO I DO HAVE A COMMENT OR A  
2 QUESTION, BUT WANT TO WAIT FOR OTHER PEOPLE TO JUMP IN HERE.

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** ACTUALLY ADINA CAN I HOMELAND MAYBE IF WE  
5 DISPLAY SLIDE 18, THAT MAYBE WILL HELP PEOPLE REMEMBER WHAT  
6 THE PROPOSED PROBLEM STATEMENT IS.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO WHILE PEOPLE ARE PONDERING, I'M SEEING  
9 THE LANGUAGE IN HERE ABOUT VALUE, BUT NOT LANGUAGE ABOUT  
10 RIGHT, FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM, AND, YOU KNOW, DO WE WANT TO  
11 HAVE A CONCEPT OF HOW MUCH MOBILITY, AS A POLICY MATTER, DO WE  
12 WANT TO BE EXPECTING TO PROVIDE FOR PEOPLE AND I HAVE SOME  
13 ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS ABOUT EQUITY BUT WILL HOLD THEM BECAUSE  
14 OTHER PEOPLE HAVE HANDS. RANDI KINMAN?

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I REALIZE THIS IS A GROUP  
17 SPECIFICALLY DISCUSSING FARE COORDINATION, AND INTEGRATION,  
18 BUT I THINK THAT PART OF THE ISSUE THAT WE HAVE IS ACTUALLY  
19 ACCESS, AND I'M WONDERING HOW THAT PLAYS INTO THE SCENARIO  
20 DOWN THE LINE. BECAUSE IT DISAPPOINT -- DOESN'T MATTER IF YOU  
21 MAKE IT. IF I DON'T HAVE ACCESS, I'M NOT RIDING. SO, DOES --  
22 IS THAT SOMETHING THAT WE CAN TIE INTO? AND I KNOW THAT'S  
23 GOING TO BE PART OF THE ONGOING BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, BUT I  
24 THINK THAT WE JUST NEED TO STICK A PIN IN THAT PROBLEM RIGHT  
25 NOW, AND ACKNOWLEDGE THAT IT -- IT'S A COMBINED PROBLEM.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** UH, HUH.

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** RANDI CAN I ASK YOU, WHEN YOU SAY ACCESS, IN  
5 THE ADA SENSE? OR ACCESS FOR PEOPLE WITH MOBILITY CHALLENGES?  
6 OR JUST GETTING TO THE STATION IN GENERAL?

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN:** JUST GETTING TO PLACES, AND I WILL USE MY  
9 EXPERIENCES AS A COMMUNITY COLLEGE TRUSTEE. OUR COMMUNITY  
10 COLLEGES ARE ALL BUILT OUTSIDE THE CITY CORE FOR THE MOST PART  
11 SO THEY'RE NOT ON GENERALLY STANDARD BUS LINES AND THAT MAKES  
12 IT HARD FOR OUR STUDENTS TO HAVE -- AND THESE ARE THE PEOPLE  
13 WE NEED TO SERVE -- IT MAKES IT REALLY DIFFICULT FOR THEM TO  
14 USE TRANSIT BECAUSE I DON'T CARE IF YOU'RE ONLY PAYING A  
15 DOLLAR A DAY, YOU'RE NOT GETTING TRANSIT SERVICE THAT ALLOWS  
16 YOU TO GET BACK AND FORTH TO CAMPUS. SO THOSE ARE THE  
17 SITUATIONS THEY WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ACKNOWLEDGE GOING  
18 FORWARD ON THIS.

19

20 **WILLIAM BACON:** I WAS GOING TO ADD, I THINK WE'RE VERY  
21 COGNIZANT OF THE FACT THAT FARE POLICY IS ONE PLANK IN A LARGE  
22 SORT OF PUZZLE OF IMPROVING ACCESS TO TRANSIT, IMPROVING  
23 TRANSIT AS A WHOLE. SO I THINK THAT'S WHY WE'RE TRYING TO BE  
24 VERY DELIBERATE IN THE PROBLEM STATEMENT IN SAYING THAT FARE  
25 POLICY IS ONE OF THE BARRIERS TO TRANSIT, AND YOU KNOW IF WE



## Meeting Transcript

1 WANT TO HAVE A BEST TRANSIT SYSTEM, THAT WE -- THAT WE'RE  
2 TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN THIS REGION, YOU KNOW, HOW CAN FARE  
3 POLICY PLAY ITS PART IN BRINGING THAT VISION TO FRUITION AND  
4 HAVING A ROBUST SYSTEM THAT DOES PROVIDE ACCESS TO THE BEST  
5 EXTENT IT POSSIBLY CAN? SO WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT, AGAIN, IN  
6 THE PROJECT ITSELF, HOW WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT AND MAKE THAT  
7 CLEAR, THAT THERE ARE THESE OTHER BARRIERS, AND I THINK THAT'S  
8 SOMETHING THAT OUR FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IS INTERESTED  
9 IN SO THOSE ARE THE GENERAL MANAGERS RELYING THAT RELIABILITY,  
10 FREQUENCY, ACCESS TO THE SERVICE AT ALL ARE REALLY FUNDAMENTAL  
11 QUESTIONS AND CHALLENGES AS WELL.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. JUST SO WE CARRY IT ALONG.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY NEXT IS IAN GRIFFITHS.

16

17 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SOMETHING THAT'S MISSING FROM THIS PROBLEM  
18 STATEMENT IS WHAT IS IN FACT OUR CURRENT FARE POLICY ON  
19 SERVICE DESIGN? SO, HOW TRANSIT AGENCIES MAKE DECISIONS ON  
20 WHAT SERVICE TO PROVIDE, AND WHERE. I THINK THAT IS A BIG FARE  
21 POLICY, AND REALLY HOW THE DIFFERENT DEPENDENCIES THAT THE  
22 TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ON REVENUES BECAUSE ESSENTIALLY EVERYONE  
23 IS COLLECTING ONLY THEIR REVENUE FROM THEIR OWN CUSTOMERS IT'S  
24 NOT BEING SHARED IT'S NOT BEING SPLIT UP OPERATORS ARE NOT  
25 BEING COMPENSATED ON A BASIS -- IT'S JUST BEING LIKE, YOU KNOW



## Meeting Transcript

1 IF YOU PICK UP A PASSENGER YOU GET THE FULL FARE FROM THAT AND  
2 THAT SYSTEM TO ME WHICH IS PART OF OUR FARE POLICY GREATLY  
3 INFLUENCES A TRANSIT AGENCY'S DECISION TO PROVIDE SERVICE IN  
4 SOME AREAS VERSUS OTHERS AND IT IS CONNECTED TO THE OVERALL  
5 CONVENIENCE AND LEVEL OF INTEGRATION TO OUR NETWORK. I WOULD  
6 LOVE FOR THIS STUDY TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT FARES AND FARE POLICY  
7 IS CONNECTED TO OUR ABILITY TO DESIGN AND PROVIDE INTEGRATED  
8 CONVENIENT SERVICE FOR USERS. BECAUSE THERE IS AN INEQUAL --  
9 THERE ISN'T CONSISTENT INCENTIVES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO  
10 PROVIDE MORE SERVICE WHEN, YOU KNOW, WHEN THEY'RE NOT  
11 ESSENTIALLY BEING -- THEY'RE ONLY COLLECTING -- THEY'RE GOING  
12 TO BASICALLY NOT PROVIDE SERVICE IN AREAS WHERE THERE IS LOWER  
13 RIDERSHIP OR BART IS GOING TO HAVE CERTAIN FINANCIAL MOTIVES  
14 TO PROVIDE CERTAIN TYPES OF TRANSIT SERVICE CALTRAIN IS GOING  
15 TO HAVE DIFFERENT MOTIVES. IS THAT HARD -- DO YOU SEE THAT AS  
16 PART OF THE STUDY OR SOMETHING THAT THE STUDY COULD HELP FLESH  
17 OUT IN TERMS OF IDENTIFYING THAT PARTICULAR BARRIER TO KIND OF  
18 THE SUPPLY SIDE OF LIKE WHAT SERVICE ENDS UP GETTING PUT OUT  
19 AS A RESULT OF THE CURRENT FARE POLICY?

20

21 **WILLIAM BACON:** MIKE I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT TO ANSWER -- I  
22 THINK WE AGREE WITH WHAT YOU'RE SAYING IAN AND I THINK WE WERE  
23 TRYING TO CAPTURE THOSE CONCEPTS IN NUMBER FOUR, WHICH IS THE  
24 FUTURE TRANSIT SORT OF ISSUE, AND IF, AGAIN, IF YOU OR OTHERS  
25 HAVE FEEDBACK ABOUT HOW WE CAN BETTER FRAME THAT, I THINK WE



## Meeting Transcript

1 CAN TRY TO REWORK IT A LITTLE BIT TO CAPTURE WHAT YOU SAID BUT  
2 I THINK THIS'S THE SPIRIT OF WHAT YOU'RE GETTING AT IS WHAT  
3 WE'RE TRYING TO CAPTURE IN THAT ITEM NUMBER FOUR.

4

5 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I THINK IT COULD USE A SLIGHTLY MORE FINER  
6 POINT ON THAT. BUT YEAH, I FIGURED THAT'S PROBABLY WHERE IT  
7 BELONGS BUT MAYBE WE CAN -- I CAN OFFER SOME COMMENTS OFFLINE  
8 TO THAT.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MOVING ON TO JONATHON KASS.

11

12 **JONATHON KASS:** THANKS. TWO QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS, ONE RELATED  
13 TO THE COVID CONTEXT, I THINK WHAT YOU HAVE REALLY CAPTURES  
14 THE SERIOUS IMPACTS OF COVID, AND NOT JUST ON THE AGENCIES  
15 TODAY BUT ON THE WAY THE STUDY CAN BE CONDUCTED VERSUS HOW IT  
16 WAS ENVISIONED. TO ME, I FEEL LIKE THERE IS ANOTHER PIECE THAT  
17 MAYBE SHOULD BE PUT OUT MORE EXPLICITLY, I THINK THE LONG-TERM  
18 FINANCIAL CHALLENGES THAT ARE BEING CREATED SUGGEST THAT WE'LL  
19 BE HAVING TO PARE BACK OUR SYSTEM IN A WAY THAT MIGHT CREATE  
20 REDUNDANCIES HOW WE CAN MAKE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM STREAMLINED  
21 WE'LL BE HAVING TO DEPLOY BUT THIS GOES WITHOUT SAYING I THINK  
22 THAT SIMPLY ELEVATES THE IMPORTANCE OF FARE COORDINATION AND  
23 INTEGRATED FARE SYSTEM BECAUSE YOU ARE GOING TO -- YOU'RE  
24 GOING TO HAVE, LIKELY, MORE PEOPLE USING MORE SYSTEMS. SOME  
25 WAY OF GETTING THAT POSSIBILITY IN THERE, TO ME, WOULD BE



## Meeting Transcript

1   USEFUL. AND THEN SECONDLY, YOU KNOW, I LIKE -- IF I UNDERSTAND  
2   -- I JUST WANT TO CONFIRM, IT SOUNDED LIKE -- I THINK IT MAKES  
3   A LOT OF SENSE THAT WE SPEND THIS TIME UP FRONT THINKING  
4   CAREFULLY ABOUT THE PROBLEM STATEMENT BUT IT SOUNDED LIKE YOU  
5   SAID, THESE ARE A LITTLE BIT LIVING STATEMENTS THAT WE MAY  
6   LEARN THINGS IN THE RESEARCH THAT CAUSE US TO HAVE TO GO BACK  
7   AND REVISIT OUR PROBABLE STATEMENT, AND THAT -- THERE IS SOME  
8   FLEXIBILITY TO DO THAT FOR ANY OF THESE TOPICS. DID I  
9   UNDERSTAND THAT RIGHT?

10

11   **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES. THAT IS THE INTENDED APPROACH, AND IT IS  
12   CONSISTENT WITH THE APPROACH THAT OUR CONSULTANT TEAM HAS  
13   TAKEN ON SIMILAR STUDIES IN OTHER REGIONS, AND THEY HAVE FOUND  
14   IT TO BE SUCCESSFUL. SO, YES.

15

16   **JONOTHON KASS:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

17

18   **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** COOL. RICH HEDGES.

19

20   **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I JUST HAD TO SAY THAT I AGREE SO  
21   MUCH WITH ANDY AND ALSO WITH IAN AND THERE HAS TO BE SOME WAY  
22   IN OUR POLICY STATEMENT TO IDENTIFY THESE ISSUES HERE, BUT THE  
23   FARE INTEGRATION HAS TO BE -- OR SHOULD BE WORKED ON FIRST, AS  
24   OUR PRIMARY DUTY. BUT I WILL SAY THAT WITHOUT AN INTEGRATION  
25   OF SCHEDULES, IT'S REALLY AN EQUITY ISSUE. I HAVE WORKED WITH



## Meeting Transcript

1 SERVICE WORKERS ALL MY LIFE, AND SCHEDULES ARE VERY  
2 UNFORGIVING. PEOPLE GET WRITTEN UP REGULARLY WHEN THEY'RE LATE  
3 AND BY THE THIRD WARNING THEY'RE LOOKING FOR A JOB. AND TO A  
4 VERY LARGE EXTENT, WITH THE HUGE DELAYS SOMETIMES BETWEEN A  
5 BUS LEAVING BECAUSE I HAVE EXPERIENCE SAID THIS THREE OR FOUR  
6 MINUTES BEFORE CALTRAIN OR BART GETS IN THERE IS AN HOUR AND  
7 SOMETIMES MIDDAY, 90 MINUTES, YOU HAVE DESTROYED SOMEBODY'S  
8 WORK SCHEDULE. SO ALL OF THESE THINGS PUT TOGETHER ARE VERY  
9 MUCH EQUITY ISSUES. AND SO I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THEM  
10 ACKNOWLEDGED, BUT OUR PRIMARY FOCUS, I BELIEVE, IS ON THE FARE  
11 INTEGRATION POLICY. THANK YOU.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** COOL. SO MOVING ON, THANK YOU RICH. MOVING ON TO  
14 WENDI KALLINS.

15

16 **WENDI KALLINS:** I GOT IT. IT TAKES A MINUTE TO UNMUTE. DRILLING  
17 DOWN FROM THE POLICY STATEMENTS FROM THE QUESTIONS TO ASK, AND  
18 THEN THE RESEARCH, I THINK IT'S VERY THOROUGH AND FOLLOWING  
19 THROUGH ON THAT, BUT THEN I DON'T SEE IN THE RESEARCH, WHERE  
20 YOU'RE LOOKING INTO GOOD EXAMPLES OF ALTERNATIVES TO BE ABLE  
21 TO PRESENT TO US. AND, SO, CAN YOU TELL ME WHERE I CAN FIND  
22 THAT? I SEE YOU NODDING, BILL. [LAUGHTER]

23

24 **WILLIAM BACON:** YEAH SO, I THINK THE PROBLEM STATEMENT IS SORT  
25 OF TRYING TO FRAME HOW WE APPROACH THE RESEARCH AND THE





## Meeting Transcript

1 ANALYSIS WORK THAT THE PROJECT WILL UNDERTAKE. WE ALSO SORT OF  
2 SIMULTANEOUSLY RIGHT NOW HAVE ONGOING -- OUR CONSULTANT TEAM  
3 IS WORKING ON PREPARING SOME SORT OF BEST PRACTICES FROM  
4 AROUND THE WORLD IN TERMS OF FARE POLICY, PLANKS, OR GOOD --  
5 BEST PRACTICES, I GUESS, I'LL JUST LEAVE IT AT THAT, FROM  
6 OTHER REGIONS AROUND THE WORLD, AND I THINK WHERE THE PROJECT  
7 WILL EVENTUALLY LEAD, IS THAT BASED ON THIS RESEARCH AND  
8 ANALYSIS, WE WILL END UP PROPOSING SEVERAL DIFFERENT  
9 ALTERNATIVES THAT WILL BE ANALYZED IN THE PROJECT, AND OVER  
10 THE COMING YEAR, WE WILL BE COMING TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND TO  
11 OTHER STAKEHOLDER BODIES, AS WE FORMULATE THOSE ALTERNATIVES  
12 WE WILL BE ANALYZING SO THOSE WILL BE SPECIFIC IDEAS THAT WE  
13 WILL BE TESTING IN THIS PROJECT TO SAY, IF WE HAD A, YOU KNOW,  
14 AS AN EXAMPLE, A SINGLE LOCAL BUS FARE ACROSS THE BAY AREA,  
15 WHAT WOULD THAT MEAN? IF WE HAD A CERTAIN DISCOUNT POLICY,  
16 WHAT WOULD THAT MEAN? AND IN THESE DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVE BE  
17 TESTING THAT. THIS GROUP WILL BE PART IN DETERMINING AND  
18 FORMULATING THOSE IN PART OF WHAT WE WILL BE TESTING. THIS IS  
19 SORT OF LIKE THE RESEARCH PLAN AND THEN WE'LL BE COMING BACK  
20 WITH SORT OF A UNIVERSE OF BEST PRACTICE IDEAS THAT OUR  
21 CONSULTANT TEAM IS WORKING ON AND REFORMULATING THAT INTO  
22 SOMETHING THAT WE'LL TEST FOR OUR REGION. DOES THAT MAKE  
23 SENSE?

24



## Meeting Transcript

1   **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO SEE -- IT  
2   WOULD BE NICE IF IT WAS IN THE DOCUMENT SOMEWHERE JUST SO WE  
3   KNOW THAT'S GOING ON. I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO ADD THAT.  
4   AND I WANT TO ADD MY VOICE TO THE DILEMMA WE HAVE BEEN SILOED  
5   INTO TALKING ABOUT FARES, AND YET FARES AND SYSTEM INTEGRATION  
6   -- YOU KNOW, ROUTE INTEGRATION, ARE DIRECTLY LINKED. SO THAT  
7   IS A PROBLEM, I THINK, THAT DOES NEED TO BE SOLVED, SO THAT WE  
8   CAN BE LOOKING AT HOW THAT -- HOW THOSE THINGS INTERCONNECT,  
9   AND HOW THEY RELATE AND AFFECT EACH OTHER.

10

11   **ADINA LEVIN:** GREAT. COOL. OKAY. SO MOVING ON TO TISHA HARTMAN.

12

13   **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU. ONE OF THE THINGS WHEN YOU WERE ASKING  
14   THE QUESTION IS, ARE THE QUESTIONS WE'RE ASKING INCLUSIVE  
15   ENOUGH. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S OBVIOUS TO ME CAN WHICH IS A  
16   BARRIER TO RIDERSHIP SOMETHING OUT OF THE SCOPE OF THIS  
17   COMMITTEE, BUT SOMETHING THAT SHOULD BE ON THE BOARD IS THE  
18   PERCEPTION OF PUBLIC SAFETY AS A WOMAN AND COMMUTER THAT WOULD  
19   BE GOING TO LONG DISTANCES, ARE YOU KNOW, AFTER HOURS OR  
20   POTENTIALLY LATE AT NIGHT THAT'S ALWAYS BEEN A CONSIDERATION  
21   FOR ME WHEN I'M CONSIDERING PUBLIC TRANSIT I DON'T THINK YOU  
22   CAN HAVE A DISCUSSION AND NOT HAVE THAT ON THE TABLE AS WELL.  
23   SECOND THING, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE FARES THAT ARE PRESENTED IN  
24   THE PACKET, I SEE, REALLY, JUST A FEW DEMOGRAPHICS. I SEE  
25   CHILD, YOUTH, AND SENIOR, AND IN ABSENCE OF MORE DEMOGRAPHIC



## Meeting Transcript

1 DATA, AND INTEREST OF EQUITY, AND IN REACHING THE UNDERSERVED  
2 COMMUNITIES AND IN GROWING RIDERSHIP, I THINK THERE IS REAL  
3 OPPORTUNITY TO ADD A FINANCIAL NEEDS SEGMENT, WHICH WOULD BE  
4 LIKE YOUR SECTION-EIGHT VOUCHER, RECIPIENTS EBT RECIPIENTS,  
5 STUDENTS AND ALSO PUBLIC SERVANT OPPORTUNITY, HEALTH CARE  
6 WORKERS POLICE OFFICERS, FIREMEN, AND THEN OBVIOUSLY A  
7 COMMUTER SEGMENT. MAYBE THE COMMUTER SEGMENT SUBSIDIZES THE  
8 FULL PRICE GROUPS, AND I THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY IN  
9 DEMOGRAPHIC IN FARE BREAK DOWNS. AND THAT'S IT.

10

11 **WILLIAM BACON:** THIS IS BILL, AND I'LL ADD, THE CHART IN  
12 ATTACHMENT B TO THIS ITEM I THINK ADDRESSES YOUR COMMENT.  
13 BREAK DOWN IN CATEGORIES. THERE ARE TWO CATEGORIES THAT MAY  
14 NOT BE EXPLICIT ONE IS LABELED RTC STANDS FOR REGIONAL TRANSIT  
15 CONNECTION THAT'S PRIMARILY PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES WHO HAVE  
16 ACCESS TO A DISCOUNT CATEGORY THAT, IN THE BAY AREA FOR RTC SO  
17 THAT HAVE BEEN CLARIFIED ON THAT HAND OUT AND THE COLUMN FAR  
18 RIGHT ON ATTACHMENT B REFERS TO A MEANS-BASED DISCOUNT BRANDED  
19 AT CLIPPER START WHICH LAUNCHED THIS MONTH AND PROVIDES A  
20 DISCOUNT TO PASSENGERS BASED ON QUALIFYING INCOME OF THEIR  
21 HOUSEHOLD. AND THE ORIGINAL PILOT PROGRAM FOR THE CLIPPER  
22 START PROGRAM WAS JUST FOR FOUR OPERATORS SFMTA CALTRAIN BART  
23 AND GOLDEN GATE BUT ACTUALLY PARTIALLY BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC  
24 BEING EXPANDED TO A LONGER INCLUSIVE LIST OF OPERATORS ACROSS  
25 THE REGION LATER THIS YEAR AND THE DISCOUNT RATES THAT ARE



## Meeting Transcript

1 BEING OFFERED ARE BEING ADJUSTED AS WELL MOSTLY TO A 50  
2 PERCENT DISCOUNT SO THAT INFORMATION IS STILL INFLUX AND  
3 CHANGING SINCE OPERATORS HAVE DECIDED TO EXPAND THE MEANS-  
4 BASED PROGRAM THROUGH THE CLIPPER START PILOT BUT THIS PROJECT  
5 ITSELF WILL ABSOLUTELY BE LOOKING AT HOW AN INCOME BASED FARE  
6 PRODUCT COULD WORK, INFORMED BY THE PILOT THAT IS NOW ON THE  
7 STREET TODAY.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** COOL. SO SEEING NO ADDITIONAL HANDS, I WANT TO  
10 CHIME IN BEFORE WE MOVE INTO THE LAST PIECE OF THE  
11 PRESENTATION, AND I HAVE ONE KIND OF BIG POINT, AND ONE  
12 SMALLER POINT BUILDING ON WHAT SOME PEOPLE HAVE SAID. THERE  
13 HAS BEEN A NUMBER OF PEOPLE BRINGING UP THE THEME OF EQUITY,  
14 AND I WOULD LOVE TO SEE, YOU KNOW, THE PROBLEM STATEMENT AS A  
15 HIGH LEVEL, BUT I THINK IN ORDER TO ADDRESS IT, I THINK THAT  
16 IT WILL BE IMPORTANT TO DRILL DOWN INTO A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT  
17 NUANCES THAT GET AT THAT ISSUE. BECAUSE THERE ARE A NUMBER OF  
18 DIFFERENT FINANCIAL BARRIERS, AND IT'S NOT ALL ONE THING. SO  
19 FOR EXAMPLE, THE MEANS-BASED FARE DISCOUNT ADDRESSES  
20 HOUSEHOLDS WITH LESS THAN TWO X OF THE POVERTY LEVEL WHICH IS  
21 50,000 FOR A FAMILY OF FOURS BUT WE KNOW THAT FOR HOUSING  
22 AFFORDABILITY, IT'S IN THE 70 THOUSANDS OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME  
23 WHERE YOU'RE CLASSIFIED AS VERY LOW INCOME. SO THERE ARE  
24 HOUSEHOLDS THAT MAKE 50 PERCENT MORE THAN WOULD QUALIFY FOR  
25 THIS MEANS-BASED FARE BUT THAT ARE STILL SEVERELY ECONOMICALLY



## Meeting Transcript

1 CHALLENGED TO LIVE WITH A ROOF IN THE BAY AREA. SO I THINK  
2 THAT IS ONE ELEMENT. ANOTHER ELEMENT IS IN TERMS OF COST  
3 CONTENDING TO DRIVING WE KNOW ABOUT TWO THIRD'S OF BAY AREA  
4 WORKING POOR PEOPLE ARE COMMUTING BY CAR. SO, THE QUESTION  
5 ABOUT WHAT IS AFFORDABLE, PEOPLE ARE CLEARLY VOTING WITH THEIR  
6 WHEELS THAT, MAYBE THERE IS OTHER REASONS THAT PEOPLE ARE  
7 DRIVING, BUT IF SOME OF IT IS AFFORDABILITY, IS IT BECAUSE  
8 DRIVING IS PERCEIVED AS MORE AFFORDABLE THAN TAKING TRANSIT.  
9 SO THAT IS ANOTHER DEFINITION OF AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY.  
10 ANOTHER ISSUE IS NOT SO MUCH ABOUT INCOME AS CASH FLOW. SO  
11 HOUSEHOLDS THAT ARE LOWER IN RESOURCES, MAY HAVE A CERTAIN  
12 LEVEL OF INCOME, BUT IT IS, YOU KNOW, ONE WAY THAT OUR REGION  
13 PROVIDES LOWER TRANSIT FARES IS BY HAVING A MONTHLY PASS. BUT  
14 IN ORDER TO HAVE A MONTHLY PASS, YOU NEED TO BE ABLE TO PUT  
15 \$75 UP AT THE BEGINNING OF THE MONTH WHICH IS NOT SOMETHING  
16 THAT EVERYONE CAN DO. SO THERE IS, YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT THE  
17 ISSUE OF CASH FLOW IN TERMS OF WHAT IT MEANS TO BE AFFORDABLE.  
18 AND THEN ANOTHER -- AND I'M NOT GOING TO EXHAUST THIS LIST,  
19 BUT THIS THINKING SHOULD GET FLESHED OUT. ANOTHER IS ABOUT THE  
20 DISTANCE OF TRAVEL BY INCOME LEVELS. WE KNOW THAT THERE HAS  
21 BEEN A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF DISPLACEMENT AND SUBURBANIZATION  
22 OF POVERTY AND PEOPLE OF COLOR AND LOW INCOME PEOPLE WHO HAVE  
23 MOVED OUT TO FURTHER REGIONS AND TAKE LONGER TRIPS SUCH THAT  
24 IF WE HISTORICALLY THOUGHT OF LONG TRIPS AS LUXURY AND IT'S  
25 GOOD TO CHARGE MONEY BUT WE'RE SEEING LOW INCOME PEOPLE FACING



## Meeting Transcript

1 LONG TRIPS WHAT DOES THIS MEAN IN TERMS OF EQUITY IN TERMS OF  
2 PRICING STRUCTURE SO MORE NUANCED AND RICHNESS ABOUT EQUITY  
3 AND WHAT THE DIFFERENT CHALLENGES ARE FOR AFFORDABLE AND WHAT  
4 KINDS OF SOLUTIONS MIGHT ADDRESS THOSE. AND THAT'S THE END OF  
5 THAT. LAST ELEMENT IS SEVERAL PEOPLE HAVE MENTIONED THERE IS  
6 OTHER ISSUES THAT ARE RELATED TO FARES AND FARE POLICY AND  
7 FARE INTEGRATION. AND THIS HAS BEEN SUCH A CHALLENGING ISSUE  
8 FOR OUR REGION TO FINALLY DECIDE TO TAKE ON, THEY WOULD IN NO  
9 WAY WANTED TO SEE US TAKING OUR EYE OFF THE BALL. I THINK WE  
10 HAVE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO TAKE THIS ON, BUT AT THE SAME TIME  
11 PEOPLE WILL BE COMING FORWARD WITH MANY ADDITIONAL GOOD IDEAS  
12 ABOUT IMPROVING THE SYSTEM AND WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM STAFF  
13 AND HAVE STAFF THINK ABOUT HOW CAN WE CAPTURE THOSE IDEAS AND  
14 FEED THEM TO AN APPROPRIATE PLACE SO WE CAN THINK ABOUT HOW  
15 GOOD IDEAS DON'T GET LOST BUT ALSO THAT WE DON'T LOSE THE  
16 OPPORTUNITY TO -- THIS VALUABLE THING. AND THOSE ARE MY  
17 COMMENTS. IF STAFF HAS COMMENTS, WE CAN MOVE ON TO THE  
18 REMAINDER OF THE PRESENTATION. AND I WOULD LIKE US TO BE DONE  
19 BY NOON

20

21 **WILLIAM BACON:** THE POINTS YOU'RE BRINGING UP ABOUT DISTANCE  
22 TRAVELED AND DISPLACEMENT THROUGHOUT THE REGION HAS BEEN  
23 EXPERIENCING FOR A NUMBER OF YEARS ARE IMPORTANT AND SOMETHING  
24 WE NEED TO DO ANALYSIS ON THE STUDY AND PRESENT DATA SHOWING  
25 HOW THE AVERAGE FARE PAID BY A HOUSEHOLD BASED ON THEIR INCOME



## Meeting Transcript

1 MIGHT NOT REALLY REFLECT THE VALUE OF THAT TRIP, NECESSARILY  
2 IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE CHARGING. SO I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING  
3 THAT REALLY HAS CHANGED A LOT SINCE OUR SYSTEMS WERE  
4 CONSTRUCTED OR ADMINISTRATIVELY CREATED, TYPICALLY 50 TO 70  
5 YEARS AGO AT THIS POINT. WHERE MANY PEOPLE ARE ABLE TO LIVE  
6 CLOSE TO WHERE THEY WORKED, AND THAT MIGHT NOT BE THE CASE FOR  
7 MANY PEOPLE TODAY YOU MIGHT HAVE TO TAKE TWO OR THREE SYSTEMS  
8 TO GET FROM YOUR PLACE OF RESIDENT OR EDUCATION OR JOB OR  
9 FACILITIES ET CETERA. I WOULD JUST SAY WE'RE COGNIZANT OF THAT  
10 AS WELL AND INTEND TO LOOK AT THAT IN OUR WORK.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SO WITH THAT, SINCE I  
13 DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS ON THIS TOPIC, LET'S GET AN UPDATE  
14 ON USER RESEARCH AND HOW ON EARTH CAN WE DO RESEARCH IN THE  
15 ERA OF COVID. HANDING IT BACK TO STAFF.

16

17 **WILLIAM BACON:** I CAN START OFF AND IF MIKE E HAS THOUGHTS, HE  
18 CAN JUMP IN. IF WE CAN PULL UP THE SLIDES, SLIDE 24 PLEASE. GO  
19 ON TO NUMBER 24, THE NEXT ONE. SO AS WE TALKED ABOUT A MOMENT  
20 AGO, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT PARTS OF THIS  
21 PROJECT, WHEN THE SCOPE WAS DEVELOPED, AND WHEN THE MTC  
22 COMMISSION APPROVED AN ALLOCATION OF REGIONAL MEASURE TWO  
23 BRIDGE TOLL FUNDS ABOUT \$900,000 TO SUPPORT THIS WORK AND THE  
24 CONSULTANT TEAM, WAS USER RESEARCH. AND ABOUT A THIRD OF OUR  
25 ENTIRE PROJECT BUDGET WAS INTENDED TO BE SPENT DOING USER



## Meeting Transcript

1 RESEARCH, TALKING TO PEOPLE, OUT ON THE STREET, YOU KNOW, IN  
2 STATIONS, ON BUSES, EXPERIENCING THE SYSTEM, AND LEARNING FROM  
3 THEM, AND HELPING GUIDE OUR WORK BY THE EXPERIENCE OF THE  
4 PEOPLE WHO USE TRANSIT EVERY DAY. AS WELL AS BY TALKING TO  
5 PEOPLE WHO DON'T USE TRANSIT VERY MUCH, TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE  
6 BARRIERS TO THE SYSTEM IMPACT THAT CHOICE IN TERMS OF NOT  
7 USING TRANSIT. AND AS I THINK ALL OF US HAVE EXPERIENCED OVER  
8 THE LAST FOUR MONTHS, COVID HAS UPENDED EVERYTHING THAT WE  
9 HAVE PLANNED. AND YOU KNOW, BEFORE THE PANDEMIC WE HAD HOPED  
10 TO LEARN FROM THIS USER RESEARCH, REALLY THE EXPERIENCE, AND  
11 OUR CONSULTANTS PHRASED IT AS THE MEANING OF TAKING TRANSIT IN  
12 TERMS OF WHAT OPPORTUNITIES TRANSIT PROVIDES THEM, AND THE  
13 VALUE OF WHAT TRANSIT MEANS TO THEIR LIVES IN TERMS OF HOW  
14 OPPORTUNITIES THAT THEY WOULDN'T HAVE OTHERWISE HAVE ACCESS  
15 TO, ARE ACCESSIBLE BY TRANSIT, OR HOW THEY'RE NOT, OR HOW  
16 TRANSIT FORMS BARRIERS TO THEM REALLY ACHIEVING OPPORTUNITIES  
17 THEY WOULD LIKE TO ACHIEVE BECAUSE THE SCHEDULE ISN'T  
18 COORDINATED OR BECAUSE THE SCHEDULE ISN'T FREQUENT OR RELIABLE  
19 ENOUGH. WE WANT TO HEAR FROM THE PEOPLE IN OUR REGION. WE PLAN  
20 TO DO THIS THROUGH A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT MECHANISMS, AND  
21 OUR CONSULTANT TEAM IS A FIRM NAMED OXD WHICH IS A USER  
22 RESEARCH AND DESIGN FIRM THAT SPECIALIZES IN CREATIVE ON THE  
23 GROUND ALMOST ANNE THROW APOLOGY RESEARCH USING SYSTEMS LIKE  
24 TECHNOLOGY SYSTEMS TRANSIT SYSTEMS PARK SYSTEMS THINGS LIKE  
25 THAT. THEY ARE BASED IN VANCOUVER COLUMBIA AND VANCOUVER, THEY





## Meeting Transcript

1 HAVE DONE POLICY BADE WORK IN THE REGION AND DONE CUTTING EDGE  
2 USER RESEARCH ABOUT FARE POLICY FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATOR IN  
3 VANCOUVER WHICH IS TRANCE LINK THAT WAS ATTRACTIVE TO THE  
4 PROCUREMENT SELECTION PANEL WHICH CONSISTED OF MTC AND BART  
5 AND OTHER TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF, AND WE WERE VERY INTERESTED  
6 IN BRINGING THEIR APPROACH TO OUR REGION, AND SORT OF LEARNING  
7 FROM WHAT THEY HAVE LEARNED IN VANCOUVER, AND BEING ABLE TO  
8 TRANSLATE THAT INTO INSIGHTS FROM OUR CUSTOMERS. NOW, MOST OF  
9 THAT INVOLVED IN-PERSON INTERACTION FROM STAFF FROM THE  
10 CONSULTANT, RIDING BUSES, RIDING TRAINS, BEING IN STATIONS,  
11 DEVELOPING MOCK FARE, YOU KNOW, CHARTS AND MAPS, AND YOU KNOW,  
12 ASKING USERS TO INTERACT WITH THEM AND EXPERIENCE THOSE  
13 PROPOSED SYSTEMS SO GETTING AT A QUESTION WENDY ASKED A MOMENT  
14 AGO, LATER IN THE STUDY WHEN WE HAVE ALTERNATIVE FARE CONCEPTS  
15 OR POLICIES TO LOOK AT, PROTOTYPING THEM AND ACTUALLY  
16 DEVELOPING COLLATERAL THAT YOU WOULD SHOW PEOPLE AND SAY DOES  
17 THIS MAKE SENSE TO YOU HOW WOULD YOU INTERACT WITH THIS DOES  
18 THIS CHANGE HOW WOULD YOU TAKE YOUR TRIP AND TRYING TO  
19 UNDERSTAND FROM USERS HOW FARE POLICY AFFECTS THEM AND HOW  
20 CHANGES TO POLICY COULD IMPACT THEIR BEHAVIOR IN THE SYSTEM.  
21 WE ARE TRYING TO FIGURE THIS OUT AS WE GO IN TERMS OF HOW TO  
22 ADAPT THIS BECAUSE NOT ONLY ARE WE NOT ABLE TO REALLY HAVE  
23 FACE-TO-FACE INTERACTIONS, BUT OUR TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS DOWN  
24 70 TO 90 PERCENT DEPENDING ON THE OPERATOR YOU'RE TALKING  
25 ABOUT, AND THE INDIVIDUALS USING TRANSIT MIGHT NOT, IN ANY WAY



## Meeting Transcript

1 FEEL COMFORTABLE SPEAKING TO PEOPLE WHILE MAKING THEIR TRIP,  
2 IS THEN BEYOND THAT WE'RE MISSING A HUGE SEGMENT OF  
3 INDIVIDUALS WHO WOULD HAVE BEEN TYPICALLY RIDING TRANSIT, AND  
4 THEIR EXPERIENCES AND PERSPECTIVES WOULD BE LOST IF WE DID  
5 USER RESEARCH EXCLUSIVELY BASED ON WHO IS USING THE SYSTEM  
6 TODAY. SO WE'RE TRYING TO REGROUP AND THIS IS REALLY WHERE  
7 WE'RE LOOKING FOR EXPERTISE FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEES SINCE MANY  
8 OF YOU CLOSER TO STAKEHOLDER GROUPS AND COMMUNITY-BASED  
9 ORGANIZATIONS THAN WE ARE NECESSARILY AS STAFF, AND WE HAVE  
10 DISCUSSED WITH OUR CONSULTANT, ONE IDEA WHICH INVOLVES HOSTING  
11 A SERIES OF -- WHAT THE CONSULTANT DESCRIBES AS NARRATIVE  
12 WORKSHOPS WHICH WOULD BRING TOGETHER IDEALLY, A VERY DIVERSE  
13 RANGE OF STAKEHOLDERS IN A VERY FOCUSED CONVERSATION, TRYING  
14 TO GET AT THOSE SAME KINDS OF QUESTIONS WE WOULD BE ASKING IN  
15 PERSON ABOUT HOW TAKING TRANSIT OFFERS VALUE, OR BARRIERS TO  
16 YOUR LIFE, AND ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY, HOW LEGIBLE AND  
17 COMPREHENSIBLE OUR FARE SYSTEM IN AND WHAT THAT MEANS IN TERMS  
18 OF A DECISION MAKING PROCESS IN USING THE SYSTEM AND TRYING TO  
19 COLLECT INSIGHTS IN THE FRONT STAGE OF THE PROJECT IN TERMS OF  
20 HOW PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THE SYSTEM TODAY. NOW, I THINK WE'RE  
21 VERY CONCERNED THAT ANY TYPE OF REMOTE OR ZOOM-BASED WORKSHOP  
22 FORMAT WOULD NOT BE INCLUSIVE OF THE PEOPLE WHO USE OUR  
23 SYSTEM. AND ARE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT HOW WE WOULD BE ABLE TO  
24 BROADLY REACH OUT TO EVERYONE WHO NEEDS TO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY  
25 TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS CONVERSATION. SO WE HAVE THROWN AROUND



## Meeting Transcript

1 SOME DISCUSSION ABOUT CAN WE COMMUNICATE WITH COMMUNITY-BASED  
2 ORGANIZATIONS AND ASK THEM TO HELP IDENTIFY INDIVIDUALS WHO  
3 WOULD BE WILLING TO PARTICIPATE, DO WE NEED TO PROVIDE  
4 INCENTIVES AND OFFER PEOPLE SOMETHING IN EXCHANGE FOR THERE  
5 TIME TO PARTICIPATE IN HOUR AND A HALF WORKSHOPS WITH  
6 CONSULTANTS. RIGHT NOW GIVEN THE STATE OF THE PANDEMIC IN THE  
7 BAY AREA I DON'T THINK WE FEEL COMFORTABLE WITH ANY TYPE OF  
8 PERSONAL INTERACTION BUT HOPEFULLY DOWN THE LINE OVER THE  
9 COURSE OF THE PROJECT WE WILL BE ABLE TO ENGAGE IN MORE IN-  
10 PERSON INTERACTION AND WHAT ARE THE APPROPRIATE WAYS TO DO  
11 THAT. SO IF YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE HERE. WE HAVE SOME  
12 QUESTIONS, SIMILAR TO WHAT WE DID FOR THE PROBLEM STATEMENT  
13 QUEUED UP HERE JUST TO SORT OF GET THE CONVERSATION GOING BUT  
14 WE DO WANT TO HEAR FROM YOU, SO WHAT ARE THE BEST WAYS TO DO  
15 USER RESEARCH RIGHT NOW DURING THE PANDEMIC. DO YOU HAVE  
16 EXPERIENCE OR LESSONS FROM YOUR ORGANIZATION OR FROM YOUR  
17 CONSTITUENCIES THAT YOU SEE THAT WORK WELL OR DON'T WORK WELL  
18 BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT TO REPEAT MISTAKES AND WE WANT TO LEARN  
19 FROM INTERNAL PROCESSES IN TERMS OF OTHER ENGAGEMENT  
20 ACTIVITIES GOING ON WITH THE BAY AREA AND TRANSIT OPERATOR  
21 LEVEL. HOW DO WE ENGAGE WITH SO MANY PEOPLE SHELTERING IN  
22 PLACE. HOW CAN COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS HELP US? IS THERE  
23 A ROLE FOR THEM OR NOT IS REALLY A QUESTION. AND ARE THERE  
24 GOOD WAYS REALLY TO GAIN THESE INSIGHTS FROM THE PUBLIC RIGHT



## Meeting Transcript

1 NOW. SO I'LL STOP TALKING, BUT WE LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR  
2 THOUGHTS AND DISCUSSION.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. SO MUCH OF THIS WORLD IS DIFFERENT IN THE  
5 ERA OF THE PANDEMIC. THANK YOU FOR GRAPPLING WITH THIS, AND  
6 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE IDEAS THAT PEOPLE WILL HAVE, WHO HAVE  
7 HANDS RAISED INCLUDING AND STARTING WITH RICH HEDGES.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. JUST A QUESTION. I HAD TO LEAVE THE  
10 ROOM FOR A MOMENT AND I CAME BACK AND HEARD YOU TALKING,  
11 DISCUSSING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IN TORONTO, DID I HEAR THAT  
12 CORRECTLY?

13

14 **WILLIAM BACON:** NO, I THINK I MENTIONED TORONTO, BUT VANCOUVER  
15 AND FARE POLICY THERE.

16

17 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YOU REALIZE THAT IN MOST OF THE CANADIAN  
18 CITIES THE UNDERGROUND SUBWAYS HAVE MILES OF RETAIL THAT LOOK  
19 LIKE SOME OF THE MOST EXPENSIVE SHOPPING CENTERS IN OUR  
20 COUNTRY. IT'S A WHOLE DIFFERENT INTERFACE WITH THE RIDER. I  
21 HAVE USED THE SYSTEMS IN BOTH TORONTO AND IN MONTREAL. IT'S  
22 VERY INTERESTING. I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY THAT, IN MY MIND TO  
23 SEE WHAT KIND OF INFORMATION WE ARE GETTING. SO ANYWAY THAT'S  
24 PRETTY MUCH IT. THANK YOU.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. IF STAFF DOESN'T HAVE ANY COMMENT ON  
2 THAT FROM RICH, WE'LL MOVE ON TO WENDI KALLINS.

3

4 **WENDI KALLINS:** SO JUST OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD, A COUPLE OF  
5 IDEAS. I'M WONDERING IF YOU CAN PROVIDE FORMS ON THE TRANSIT  
6 SYSTEMS THAT PEOPLE COULD FILL OUT IF THEY WOULD BE WILLING TO  
7 PARTICIPATE IN A PHONE INTERVIEW, OR FACETIME, ZOOM INTERVIEW,  
8 YOU KNOW, OR A ZOOM MEETING, THAT MIGHT BE ONE WAY TO GATHER  
9 SOME PEOPLE. I THINK IT'S A GOOD IDEA TO REACH OUT TO  
10 ORGANIZATIONS THAT WORK WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE PROBABLY TRANSIT  
11 DEPENDENT, AND MAYBE ALSO LOOKING AT THE END OF THE LINE, IF  
12 THEY'RE ESSENTIAL WORKERS, SOME OF THEM ARE PROBABLY GOING TO  
13 SPECIFIC LOCATIONS, IS YOU MIGHT SEE IF YOU CAN RECRUIT PEOPLE  
14 FROM THOSE LOCATIONS TO TALK TO YOU. ANOTHER THING TO KEEP IN  
15 MIND IS THAT A LOT OF FORM OF TRANSIT USERS WHO WERE  
16 COMMUTERS, NON-ESSENTIAL WORKERS, BUT OFFICE WORKERS MAY NO  
17 LONGER BE COMING BACK TO TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY'RE NOW  
18 CONVERTING TO TELECOMMUTING. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD -- IT MAY  
19 BE GOOD TO REACH OUT TO SOME OF THE RESEARCH ORGANIZATIONS AND  
20 ASSESS WHAT KIND OF LOSS OF TRANSIT IS GOING TO RESULT FROM  
21 THAT. AND HOW MANY PEOPLE -- AND AGAIN, THOSE ARE SOME OF THE  
22 PLACES WHERE YOU MIGHT BE ABLE TO REACH OUT TO PEOPLE WHO USED  
23 TO COMMUTE ON A REGULAR BASIS AND MAY GO BACK TO IT. SO THAT'S  
24 MY BRAINSTORM IDEAS.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. EXCELLENT. SO AS WE KEEP THE IDEAS  
2 COMING, ABIGAIL COCHRAN.

3

4 **ABIGAIL COCHRAN:** HI. THANKS ADINA I AM GOING TO BUILD OFF OF  
5 SOME OF WENDI'S COMMENTS. I THINK THERE IS ABSOLUTELY  
6 OPPORTUNITIES TO GO THROUGH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO  
7 REACH OUT FOR POPULATIONS THAT MAY BE PARTICULARLY VULNERABLE  
8 RIGHT NOW. WITH TRANSIT DEPENDENT POPULATIONS, TO FACILITIES  
9 SENIOR ET CETERA, AND PEOPLE WHO MAY BE UNHOUSED AND PEOPLE  
10 WHO MAY BE USING THOSE ORGANIZATIONS MORE THAN USUAL TO FIGURE  
11 OUT TO GET MESSAGES FROM PUBLIC HEALTH, TRANSIT COMMUNICATES  
12 AND OTHER TYPES OF REALLY IMPORTANT INFORMATION. AND I THINK  
13 THERE IS A LOT OF SCHOLARSHIP ABOUT HOW EMERGENCY RESPONSE IS  
14 -- IN AN EMERGENCY RESPONSE SITUATION RISK COMMUNICATIONS,  
15 REALLY LEVERAGING THE CAPACITY OF THOSE COMMUNITY-BASED  
16 ORGANIZATIONS IS REALLY IMPORTANT AND NOT JUST TRANSPORTATION  
17 AGENCIES AND PROVIDERS. HOWEVER, YOU CAN LEVERAGE  
18 COMMUNICATION CAPACITY OF TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES IN  
19 PARTICULAR WAYS, AND I THINK THAT LEVERAGING COMMUNICATIONS  
20 FROM OPERATORS WHO TALK TO THEIR RIDERS A LOT, FOR INSTANCE  
21 PARATRANSIT OPERATORS. BECAUSE YOU NEED TO CALL TO SCHEDULE  
22 THINGS LIKE THAT, IS A GOOD WAY TO MAKE SURE YOU'RE  
23 DISSEMINATING ACCURATE INFORMATION. ACCURATE INFORMATION AND A  
24 GOOD WAY TO COLLECT INFORMATION FROM RIDERS ABOUT THEIR NEEDS  
25 AND BEHAVIORS RIGHT NOW. THANKS VERY MUCH.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** GREAT. SO, LET'S SEE. MOVING ON, BRIAN STANKE.  
3 BRIAN.

4

5 **BRIAN STANKE:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YES.

8

9 **BRIAN STANKE:** GREAT. JUST BUILDING ON SOME OF THE COMMENTS BY  
10 WENDI AND ABIGAIL, THE CITY OF SAN JOSE HAS HAD A LOT OF  
11 SUCCESS BOTH WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO DO TARGETED  
12 OUTREACH. AN IMPORTANT LESSON WE LEARNED DOING THAT IS WHEN  
13 YOU INTEGRATE THOSE COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS INTO YOUR  
14 OUTREACH IT'S IMPORTANT TO FAIRLY COMPENSATE THOSE  
15 ORGANIZATIONS FOR THE TIME THAT THEY SPEND HELPING THE  
16 OUTREACH. I ALSO WANT TO SECOND THE IDEA THEY THINK IT --  
17 THERE ARE CHALLENGES, BUT I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO REACH OUT  
18 TO THAT TEN OR 20 PERCENT OF THE RIDERSHIP THAT IS STILL USING  
19 TRANSIT RIGHT NOW, THAT ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS, THAT ARE  
20 TRANSIT DEPENDENT, THAT IS MOST LIKELY THE DEMOGRAPHIC THAT  
21 YOU WOULD NOT CATCH IF YOU DID A ZOOM MEETING OR ANOTHER  
22 MEETING WHERE YOU WOULD CATCH ON TRANSIT. AND JUST KIND OF  
23 THROWING IN A LAST IDEA, I THINK IT'S MORE OF A CHALLENGE  
24 MAYBE DOING SURVEYING, WHERE YOU ASK IF PEOPLE RODE TRANSIT  
25 BEFORE, AND USE IT TO REPRESENT A CURRENT GROUP OF PEOPLE WHO



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 ARE NOT RIDING TRANSIT. COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND  
2 REACHING OUT TO THOSE STILL RIDING TRANSIT ARE IMPORTANT TO  
3 GET THAT REPRESENTATIVE EXAMPLE.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. COOL. THE LET'S SEE. THANK YOU. AND  
6 MOVING ON TO RANDI KINMAN.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF THINGS BE TO ADD  
9 TO THE POT. WE CAN ACTUALLY REACH OUT DIRECTLY TO HOMELESS  
10 SHELTERS. THEY HAVE THE CAPACITY TO DO SMALL ZOOM MEETINGS.  
11 THEIR CLIENTELE ARE SHELTER-IN-PLACE AND FAIRLY STABLE. WE  
12 HAVE ONE GROUP IN SUNNYVALE THAT'S ACTUALLY FORMED ITS OWN  
13 HOMELESS UNION, SO TO SPEAK. SO I REALLY WANT US TO BE  
14 REACHING OUT, NOT AS MUCH TO THE CBOS IN THAT CASE, BUT TO THE  
15 ACTUAL PEOPLE WHO ARE USING THE SYSTEM. AND THIS IS,  
16 UNFORTUNATELY, A PRIME OPPORTUNITY FOR US, BECAUSE THEY ARE  
17 SHELTER-IN-PLACE ACROSS OUR ENTIRE REGION. I KNOW URSULA HAS  
18 STARTED WORKING ON THAT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. ALSO OUR  
19 COMMUNITY COLLEGES -- I'M BACK TO THAT AGAIN -- AND OUR HIGH  
20 SCHOOLS WHERE STUDENTS ARE DEPENDENT AND STAFF ARE DEPENDENT  
21 ON TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION, ARE ALL RUNNING A USER LIST  
22 WHERE THERE IS A LARGE AMOUNT OF CONVERSATION GOING ON IT  
23 WOULD BE EASY TO TAP INTO THOSE NETWORKS AND HOLD SMALL FOCUS  
24 GROUP MEETINGS. BEING ABLE TO THROW OUT A SURVEY THAT PEOPLE  
25 CAN USE, WHETHER WE ADVERTISE IT AT TERMINALS, WHETHER WE





## Meeting Transcript

1 ADVERTISE IT ON THE TRANSIT ITSELF, IF WE CAN TARGET THE HIGH  
2 VOLUME AREAS AROUND HEALTH CARE CENTERS WHERE PEOPLE ARE  
3 GOING, ARE USING TRANSIT, WOULD AT LEAST ALLOW US TO CAPTURE  
4 THOSE RIDERS, AND I KNOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A REALLY  
5 HARD TIME CATCHING THE PEOPLE WHO WERE FORMER RIDERS, BUT AT  
6 LEAST WE CAN WORK WITH WHAT WE HAVE GOT. SO THOSE ARE MY  
7 THOUGHTS RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY GREAT. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO SOMEONE WHO  
10 HASN'T SPOKEN YET ON THE PANEL, STARTING WITH CAT CARTER.

11

12 **CAT CARTER:** HI. THANKS. SECOND ALL OF THESE SUGGESTIONS, A LOT  
13 OF THEM ARE ONES I PUT NOTES DOWN TO SAY SOMETHING ABOUT. THEY  
14 ARE GREAT IDEAS. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT OTHER AGENCIES BUT I KNOW  
15 MUNI HAS DONE WELL WITH USING SORT OF DOOR HANGERS ON THE  
16 POLES OF BUSES WHICH IS AN INEXPENSIVE WAY TO REACH RIDERS ON  
17 BUSES SO I WOULD RECOMMEND CHECKING THAT OUT. THERE IS A  
18 SHIFT, OF COURSE, TO TELECOMMUTING AND THERE MAY BE A LOT OF  
19 PEOPLE THAT DON'T GO BACK TO OPPORTUNITY OFFICES BUT I HAVE,  
20 IN OUR CONVERSATIONS WITH SORT OF MAJOR EMPLOYER IN SAN  
21 FRANCISCO AND IN THE AREA WE ARE HEARING THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE  
22 DON'T HAVE GREAT HOME WORKING SITUATIONS AND DON'T WANT TO GO  
23 BACK TO THEIR OFFICES. SOME COMMUTERS WANT TO RETURN. AND  
24 WORKING WITH EMPLOYERS WOULD BE A GOOD WAY AND ALL THOSE  
25 COMPANIES LIKE SALESFORCE ARE DOING THEIR OWN INTERNAL



## Meeting Transcript

1 SURVEYS. I DON'T KNOW IF THEY WANT TO SHARE BUT THEY'RE  
2 TALKING TO THEIR EMPLOYEES ABOUT THESE ISSUES. AND ANOTHER WAY  
3 TO REACH PEOPLE WHO MAY NORMALLY RIDE BUT AREN'T ARRIVING NOW  
4 BECAUSE THEY'RE SHELTER-IN-PLACE IS GROCERY STORES. TALKING  
5 ABOUT FINDING PEOPLE THAT ARE STILL RIDING BY GOING TO HEALTH  
6 CARE CENTERS MEDICAL CENTERS, BUT ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND A LOT  
7 OF US WHO ARE TELECOMMUTING ARE STILL GOING TO GROCERY STORES  
8 SO IF THERE IS A SURVEY SOMEONE CAN SNAP ON TO THEIR PHONE  
9 WOULD BE GOOD.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GOOD IDEAS WE'RE HEARING FROM EVERYBODY.  
12 MOVING ON TO ADRIAN MENDOZA.

13

14 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** THANKS. AS A FORMER STUDENT AT SANTA ROSA JR.  
15 COLLEGE THE PAST TWO YEARS, ONE OF THE THING WE HAD WAS  
16 SUBSIDIZED BUS RIDING. IT WAS FREE IF YOU WERE A STUDENT, TO  
17 RIDE. WITH THE STUDENTS SHELTERING IN PLACE AND DISTANCE  
18 LEARNING RIGHT NOW, I THOUGHT PERHAPS SOCIAL MEDIA, IN  
19 ADDITION WITH -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IS ONE WAY OF REACHING THAT  
20 POPULATION. ANOTHER POPULATION THEY WOULD LIKE TO SUBMIT SOME  
21 INFORMATION ABOUT WOULD BE THE LATINOS, SPANISH SPEAKING  
22 POPULATION, AS WELL, TO ENGAGE AND MAKE USE OF THE LOCAL  
23 MEDIA, THE SPANISH LANGUAGE MEDIA, THE BILINGUAL MEDIA, ANY  
24 OTHER POPULATIONS THAT DEAL WITH MULTI-LINGUAL CHALLENGES. AND  
25 SO WITH THE SAME THING, AS I SAID WITH THE STUDENTS, IT'S A



## Meeting Transcript

1 WAY OF GETTING PEOPLE ENGAGED WHO MIGHT NOT WANT TO  
2 NECESSARILY OTHERWISE LISTEN TO THE MESSAGE THAT IS BEING SENT  
3 OUT. SO THAT'S MY TWO CENTS ON THAT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE THAT IT IS 11:55 AND THIS  
6 MEETING IS SCHEDULED TO ADJOURN AT 12. IS IT POSSIBLE TO RUN  
7 THIS UNTIL 12:15 I AM SEEING A COUPLE OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
8 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AS WELL AS THREE PANELISTS ON THIS  
9 LAST ITEM I REQUEST HELP FROM STAFF ON THE LOGISTICS TO  
10 GETTING TO THE END OF THIS MEETING.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MARTHA SPEAKING. THERE IS NO ACTION ITEMS  
13 ON THIS IF WE LOSE QUORUM IF PEOPLE NEED TO DROP OFF WE'RE  
14 OKAY. AND THERE ISN'T A MEETING SCHEDULED TO START AT 12:00 SO  
15 I THINK WOULD BE OKAY. IF PEOPLE NEED TO LEAVE JUST GO AHEAD  
16 AND LEAVE.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** WE'LL TAKE THE REMAINING HANDS FROM THE  
19 PANELISTS THEN MOVE ON TO THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. SO TISHA?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I DEFINITELY AGREE THAT REACHING OUT TO  
22 THE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS IS GOING TO BE CRITICAL, BUT THERE  
23 ARE ADDITIONAL WAYS THAT YOU CAN REACH POPULATIONS THAT YOU  
24 WOULDN'T NORMALLY REACH. AND THIS WOULD BE REALLY, I THINK  
25 BENEFICIAL IN UNDERSTANDING HOW YOU CAN INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 TO REACH BEYOND WHAT YOU'RE CURRENTLY REACHING IN THIS  
2 ENVIRONMENT I AGREE SOCIAL MEDIA IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT AND  
3 IN LEVERAGING PRIOR EXPERIENCE IN CORPORATE AMERICA WHEN WE  
4 NEEDED TO REACH BEYOND OUR CURRENT THING, I WOULD RECOMMEND  
5 FACEBOOK SURVEYS. YOU MIGHT NEED TO DO AN INCENTIVE MAYBE A  
6 CUP OF COFFEE MAYBE A FREE RIDE ON THE NEXT TRANSIT. BUT  
7 THAT'S GOING TO GET YOU ALL OF THE RIDERS -- EVEN MY  
8 GRANDMOTHER, SHE'S 83, SHE CAN USE FACEBOOK. THIS IS GOING TO  
9 OPEN UP A BROAD AUDIENCE FOR YOU. SECOND THING, YOU CAN --  
10 THERE ARE COMPANIES OUT THERE THAT ALLOW YOU TO DO PUSH  
11 NOTIFICATIONS ON PEOPLE'S PHONES WHEN THEY HIT CERTAIN  
12 GEOGRAPHIC SPOTS. SO IF YOU WERE TO ENGAGE THOSE TYPES OF  
13 COMPANIES AND SAY ANY TIME SOMEONE IS WITHIN THE PROXIMITY OF  
14 ONE OF OUR MAJOR TRANSPORTATION, A FERRY, DIFFERENT TYPES OF  
15 ORGANIZATIONS THAT WOULD HOUSE SOME OF THE PARTICIPATING  
16 TRANSPORTATION, YOU COULD HAVE A PUSH NOTIFICATION THAT COULD  
17 POP-UP ASKING WOULD YOU PARTICIPATE IN A SHORT SURVEY. AND  
18 FINALLY GETTING ONE OF THE NINE TRANSIT ORGANIZATIONS TO AGREE  
19 TO PUT A WEB POP-UP SO WHEN YOU GO TO RESEARCH A FARE ON THE  
20 WEB SITE, IF YOU GO TO CLOSE THE WEB SITE OUT A THING POPS UP  
21 AND ASKS DID YOU BUY TODAY AND CERTAIN QUESTIONS. BASICALLY  
22 YOU WOULD HAVE A WAY TO REACH PEOPLE WHO MIGHT BE WALKING AWAY  
23 OTHERWISE. THAT WOULD BE A GOOD WAY TO REACH IN THIS REMOTE  
24 ENVIRONMENT. THANK YOU.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** LAST HAND FROM THE PANEL, FROM RICH  
2 HEDGES.

3

4 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I LOST MY TRAIN OF THOUGHT LAST  
5 TIME. I WANTED TO COME BACK. I AGREE WITH TISHA THAT FACEBOOK  
6 WOULD BE A GOOD VEHICLE. I WANT TO ADD SOME OTHERS. RANDI  
7 MENTIONED THE HOMELESS I KNOW THAT FROM PRE SET WALKING, THAT  
8 A NUMBER OF AGENCIES THAT COORDINATE HAVE HOMELESS POPULATION,  
9 VOTE, AND THEIR ADDRESS IS THEIR VOTING ADDRESS. SO THAT'S ONE  
10 WAY WE CAN FIND PEOPLE, I THINK. I WANT TO GIVE A SHOUT OUT  
11 FOR ZOOM. MY UNION REPRESENTS PEOPLE THAT MAKE ENTRY LEVEL  
12 FROM 32 TO 35,000 TO 65,000 A YEAR WITH COVERAGE OF PENSIONS  
13 AND HEALTH CARE AND OTHER STUFF BUT THEY'RE NOT HIGH INCOME  
14 PEOPLE. WE HAVE BEEN HOLDING WEEKLY ZOOM MEETINGS WITH THE  
15 PANDEMIC, AND WE HAVE BEEN GETTING HIGH TURN OUT AND THESE ARE  
16 LOW INCOME PEOPLE. ZOOM MIGHT BE THE WAY TO DO IT IF YOU SPACE  
17 IT IN THE RIGHT TIME. BUT ONE THING WE HAVEN'T RAISED IS JUST  
18 ABOUT EVERY CURRENT TRANSIT USER HAS A CLIPPER CARD AND THEY  
19 ALL REGISTER WITH THEIR E-MAIL ADDRESS, AND YOU COULD HAVE  
20 CLIPPER RATHER THAN MTC GATHERING FOR SECURITY REASONS ASK  
21 THEM IF THEY WOULD SEND OUT QUESTIONNAIRES WITH THE ANSWERS  
22 COME BACK TO OUR COMMITTEE AND MTC. CLIPPER IS A GOOD WAY AND  
23 WE COULD DIVIDE IT UP WITH PEOPLE WITH REDUCED FARES AND SO  
24 THERE IS A WAY TO SORT OF SORT OUT THE POPULATIONS WE WANT TO  
25 TALK TO. SO, AND I JUST GIVE TISHA A SHOUT OUT, IT'S NOT OUR



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 RESPONSIBILITY RIGHT NOW BUT SAFETY IS AN ISSUE IS IT BEGAN TO  
2 REALLY DRIVE RIDERSHIP DOWN. I HAVE BEEN IN SOME SITUATIONS  
3 THAT WERE VERY UNSAFE ON MAJOR CARRIER BART. SO THAT'S  
4 SOMETHING THAT OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES REALLY HAVE TO FACE IN THE  
5 FUTURE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANKS. SO THE ONE THING THEY  
8 WOULD ADD BEFORE MOVING ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT IS THAT THE BAY  
9 AREA IS AN INTERNATIONAL HOT BED OF PROFESSIONAL DISCIPLINE OF  
10 USER RESEARCH, AND I WONDER WHETHER STAFF ALREADY HAS OR COULD  
11 REACH OUT TO SOME OF THE PROFESSIONALS WHO DO THIS WORK WHO  
12 ARE PRESUMABLY HAVING CHALLENGES IN A WIDE RANGE OF DOMAINS,  
13 AND I HAVE A FEW CONTACT IN THAT FIELD, AND CAN HAIL SOME  
14 PEOPLE, BUT THAT MAY BE -- THERE MAY BE SOME OTHER PEOPLE IN  
15 THE FIELD THAT HAVE SOME IDEAS HAVING, YOU KNOW, RUNNING INTO  
16 THIS ALL OVER THE PLACE, BECAUSE OF OUR BROAD CHALLENGES RIGHT  
17 NOW. SO MOVING ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. FIRST OF ALL, AND I SEE  
18 THREE HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, IF YOU ARE IN, AMONG  
19 THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, AND YOU WANT TO GIVE A PUBLIC  
20 COMMENT, USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE, OR DIAL STAR NINE TO BE  
21 IN THE QUEUE TO MAKE AN AUDIO COMMENT. HAS THE CLERK RECEIVED  
22 ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ASSOCIATED AND IF SO CAN THOSE BE  
23 ASSOCIATED WITH THE RECORD PLEASE

24



## Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM BY  
2 THE FIVE INCLUDE DEADLINE AND THE FIRST MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC  
3 TO TALK IS PHONE NUMBER ENDING IN 6262. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
4 YOURSELF.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI, THIS IS ROLAND, IN SAN JOSE. SO, I THINK THIS  
7 STARTED VERY WELL, AND WE WERE FOCUSING ON FARE COORDINATION,  
8 BUT SOMEHOW I GOT THE IMPRESSION THAT WE LOST OUR FOCUS AS  
9 THINGS WENT ON HERE TODAY. BASICALLY THERE ARE THREE THREADS  
10 HERE AND THIS SHOULD BE HANDLED SEPARATELY, EQUITY, AND THEN  
11 OBVIOUSLY INTEGRATING THE SYSTEMS, AND INTERFACE. AND  
12 INTERFACE AND FARES IS WHAT WE SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON NOW.  
13 SLIDES 6 AND 7 TALKING ABOUT FARES IN THE BAY AREA, AND THERE  
14 ARE SOME LOW HANGING FRUITS IN THERE, LIKE WHY DO WE HAVE NINE  
15 DIFFERENT LOCAL BUS FARES AND CLIPPER. LET'S TAKE CARE OF THIS  
16 RIGHT AWAY. I DON'T THINK THAT WOULD BE DIFFICULT. 16 DISCOUNT  
17 RATES FOR YOUTH, 14 FOR SENIORS LET'S TAKE THAT AWAY. TRIPS  
18 SAME DISTANCE AND MODE CAN VARY DRAMATICALLY IN PRICE, AND  
19 YES, THAT IS NOT AN ISSUE, THAT IS THE WAY IT IS. SO NOW YOU  
20 MOVE ON TO THE PREVIOUS SLIDE, TALKING ABOUT FLAT FARES FOR  
21 SEVEN OPERATORS. AND THEN TALKING ABOUT ZONE BASED. IN LONDON  
22 EVERYTHING IS ZONE BASED. BUT THE THINGS THAT YOU GOT TO  
23 UNDERSTAND, IS THAT IF AN OPERATOR -- CAN YOU HEAR ME? -- EVEN  
24 OPERATOR, OPERATOR WAS IN ONE ZONE, THAT OPERATOR BY DEFAULT  
25 IS FLAT FARE WITHIN THE ZONE. YOU KNOW IT'S NOT DIFFICULT TO



## Meeting Transcript

1 UNDERSTAND. NOW, WHEN IT GETS TO THE POINT OF PEOPLE --  
2 BASICALLY TIME IS MONEY, AND THEY PAY FOR WHAT THEY GET --  
3 THIS IS WHY EXPRESS BUSES COST TWICE AS MUCH AS ORDINARY BUSES  
4 BECAUSE THEY TAKE YOU WHERE YOU WANT TO GET IN HALF OF TIME.  
5 AND THAT'S THE SAME THING WITH CALTRAIN AND BART THAT'S WHY  
6 YOU PAY A PREMIUM. THESE SYSTEMS ARE DEDICATED, ARE MUCH MORE  
7 EXPENSIVE TO OPERATE THAN BUSSES AND ROADS. AND LAST THING I  
8 WANT TO POINT OUT TO YOU WHAT'S MISSING FROM THE PRESENTATION  
9 IS THE FUNDING SOURCES. YES, YOU TALK ABOUT THE FARES, BUT YOU  
10 DID NOT TALK ABOUT HOW ALL THE SYSTEMS USE DIFFERENT FUNDING  
11 SOURCES. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. NEXT UP IS CHRISTINA GOTUACO. GO  
14 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **CHRISTINA GOTUACO:** HI CHRISTINA IN SAN FRANCISCO AND A MEMBER  
17 OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I JUST WANT TO -- SORRY -- OH  
18 I JUST WANT TO SAY, AT MINIMUM, I HOPE THAT EXISTING AVENUES  
19 ARE AUTOMATIC, SUCH AS TRANSIT AGENCY WEB SITES AS TISHA SAID,  
20 AND THE CLIPPER E-MAIL LIST SERVE AS RICH WAS MENTIONING TO  
21 ALSO ADD LIST OF SERVE TRANSIT OPERATORS WHO OPERATE ANY PASS  
22 HOLDER PROGRAMS, AC TRANSIT EASY TRANSIT PASSES AS WELL AS  
23 TRANSIT HUBS, SIGNAGE CASES FOR SCHEDULES HAVE SPACE FOR OTHER  
24 ADVERTISING AND ANNOUNCEMENTS OR ON THE SCREENS THAT ARE IN  
25 STATIONS. I THINK -- I ONLY HEARD REALLY FROM BRIAN AND RANDI





## Meeting Transcript

1 AND CAT ABOUT OUTREACH TO CURRENT RIDERS. THERE ARE STILL  
2 PEOPLE RIDING THE BUSES AND TRAINS TODAY, AND I THINK THE  
3 RICHEST DATA WILL COME FROM LIVE RIDERS THEMSELVES. ESPECIALLY  
4 IF YOU ARE ABLE TO JUST HAND THEM A PIECE OF PAPER OR OFFER  
5 THEM AN ONLINE INTERFACE, WHERE THEY CAN JUST LOG THEIR SYSTEM  
6 RIDES, LIKE MAYBE JUST DO A WEEK LONG DIARY OF WHAT THEY'RE  
7 RIDING, WHERE THEY'RE GETTING ON, WHERE THEY'RE GETTING OFF,  
8 AND HOW THEY'RE PAYING FOR EACH MODE THAT THEY'RE TAKING. IF  
9 WE WERE EVEN TO DO THAT ACROSS MAYBE OUTREACH TO LIKE FOUR OR  
10 500 CURRENT RIDERS AND TARGET SO THERE IS A PROPORTIONAL  
11 REPRESENTATION FROM EACH TRANSIT AGENCY I THINK THAT WOULD  
12 PROVIDE RICH DATA ABOUT CURRENT FARES BEING, AND HOW THEY'RE  
13 AFFECTING CURRENT RIDERS AND THEN THOSE PEOPLE COULD BE  
14 INVITED TO PARTICIPATE IN AN HOUR LONG WORKSHOP AND THEN THEY  
15 WOULD HAVE VESTED INTEREST SINCE THEY HAVE BEEN DOING THEIR  
16 ETHNIC GRAPHIC RESEARCH. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ALETA DUPREE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIRPERSON ADINA LEVIN AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
21 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY COMPREHENSIVE. VERY WELL  
22 THOUGHT OUT. IT'S HEAVY. I REALLY APPRECIATED THE CHART WITH  
23 ALL OF THE DIFFERENT FARE POSSIBILITIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA.  
24 AND I THINK THAT A WORK-UP OF WHAT A PROPOSED FARE INTEGRATION  
25 SCHEDULE SHOULD LOOK LIKE, APPORTIONMENT IS A MAJOR PART OF A



## Meeting Transcript

1 FARE INTEGRATION IN THAT EACH SYSTEM GETS THEIR DUE, CONSIDER  
2 THE INTERNATIONAL FUEL TAX AGREEMENT, WHICH IS A MECHANISM  
3 USED TO APPORTION FUEL TAXES PAID BY TRUCKING COMPANIES BASED  
4 ON MILEAGE AND FUEL PURCHASES IN EACH STATE. I THINK WE SHOULD  
5 ALSO LOOK AT SYSTEMS IN OTHER AREAS. CLOSEST I HAVE COME TO  
6 FARE INTEGRATION IS USING TRANSIT IN PORTLAND, USING THE HOPP  
7 FAST PASS APPLICATION. AND CHICAGO HAS A SMALL INTEGRATIVE  
8 APPEARING SYSTEM BETWEEN THE CTA, WHICH OPERATES THE L, AND  
9 THE SUBURBAN BUS LINE KNOWN AS PACE. IN NEW YORK, YOU CAN  
10 SPEND \$2.75 SENDS TO RIDE SUBWAY TO PARTS OF THE CITY, BUT  
11 YOU'RE GOING TO PAY 2 TO 3 TIMES AS MUCH TAKING THE RAILROAD,  
12 AND SO THERE IS A DIFFERENCE IN GOING FROM NEW YORK, PEN  
13 STATION TO NEWARK ON NJ TRANSIT OR IF YOU WALK ONE BLOCK TO  
14 HAROLD SQUARE AND GO TO NEWARK USING PATH OR YOU CAN GO FROM  
15 THE BRONX TO MANHATTAN ON THE SUBWAY FOR \$2.75 BUT YOU'RE  
16 GOING TO PAY MORE IF YOU GO FROM THE BRONX ON METRO NORTH TO  
17 GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL. I THINK WE SHOULD LOOK AT SYSTEMS AND  
18 HOW THEY'RE DOING IT OR NOT DOING IT. THANKS.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT WAS OUR LAST SPEAKER THERE ARE NO  
21 OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANKS  
24 VERY MUCH TO STAFF, THAT THIS GROUP HAS PROVIDED YOU WITH FOOD  
25 FOR IMPROVING THE USER RESEARCH AND REFINING THE STUDY. MOVING



## Meeting Transcript

1 ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE, NEW BUSINESS, NOW IS THE POINT  
2 IN THE AGENDA WHERE MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MAY BRING UP  
3 NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION FOR A FUTURE AGENDA.  
4 SO PLEASE RAISED YOUR HAND IF YOU HAVE ANY ITEMS OF NEW  
5 BUSINESS THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO PUT INTO THE HOPPER HERE. AND  
6 I SEE THAT RANDI KINMAN HAS A HAND.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE  
9 A KNOWN FORMAT FOR MAKING SURE THAT THIS GROUP SEES THE  
10 MATERIAL BEFORE IT GOES TO THE BIG TASK FORCE, AND THAT WE  
11 HAVE ALL THOSE SCHEDULES COMING UP. THAT'S MY ASK. THANK YOU.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND OTHER ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS  
14 THAT ANYBODY HAS HERE? I AM NOT SEEING ANY HANDS. SO WE WILL  
15 MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM HERE, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY  
16 OTHER BUSINESS. I'LL ASK TO READ NAMES OR ORGANIZATIONS OF  
17 GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT  
18 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD AND ANYONE PARTICIPATING  
19 IN GENERAL COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT ON TODAY AGENDA PLEASE USE THE  
20 RAISED HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I'LL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK.  
21 WERE THERE ANY OTHER WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM  
24 HOWEVER ROLAND LEBRUN HAS HIS HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.  
25 ROLAND.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. THANK YOU. VERY BRIEFLY. IT'S TO DO -- AND I  
3 APOLOGIZE FOR THE NOISE, THE GARBAGE IS RIGHT OUTSIDE MY HOUSE  
4 RIGHT NOW -- THE WAY THE PACKET IS ORGANIZED, EVERYTHING IS  
5 BUNGLED TOGETHER, AND THEN THERE IS MASSIVE SPREADSHEET IN THE  
6 MIDDLE, THAT BASICALLY TALKS ABOUT THE VARIOUS AGENCIES, THAT  
7 ARE BASICALLY TRYING TO PACK IT COMPLETELY OUT OF WHACK SO I  
8 WAS WONDERING IF MOVING FORWARD IF IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE TO  
9 HAVE THE NARRATIVES, YOU KNOW, IN A SEPARATE PDF, OF THE  
10 PRESENTATION, A SEPARATE PDF THEN WHEN YOU HAVE THE AUTOMATIC  
11 SPREADSHEET LIKE THAT IF ONCE AGAIN IT COULD BE ON ITS OWN  
12 WHEN IT'S POSTED ON THE LEDGE STAR. THANK YOU.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. IF THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
15 PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, WE WOULD LIKE TO  
16 MOVE ON TO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN --

17

18 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS ONE MORE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC  
21 THAT JUST RAISED THEIR HAND.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALETA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN AND MEMBERS. ALETA

3 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. THANK YOU. I LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING

4 TOGETHER AGAIN. IN THE BROADER SCOPE, I FEEL THIS WORK OF FARE

5 INTEGRATION, I WOULD HOPE, TO HELP ADVANCE LARGER

6 CONVERSATIONS ABOUT HOW PEOPLE INTERACT BOTH FINANCIALLY AND

7 IN COMMUNICATES IN RELATIONSHIPS WITH TRANSIT SYSTEMS. THERE'S

8 A COIN SHORTAGE GOING ON RIGHT NOW. AND SO WITH VEHICLES SUCH

9 AS CLIPPER AND APPS, HOPEFULLY WE CAN ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO TAKE

10 THEIR COINS DOWN TO THE BANK OR TO A SUPER MARKET COIN HOPPER

11 AND DROP THEM IN AND TRANSFER THAT MONEY OVER SO THEY CAN RIDE

12 TRANSIT AND GET THOSE COINS IN THE SYSTEM AND MOVE PAST THAT.

13 SO, EQUITY, OBVIOUSLY, IS IMPORTANT. BECAUSE IN ORDER TO HAVE

14 MORE OPTIONS, IT SHOULDN'T JUST BE ABOUT OPTIONS THAT ARE

15 THERE, SUCH AS WHEN I MENTIONED BEFORE ABOUT MJ TRANSIT VERSUS

16 PATH OR AMTRAK OR METRO NORTH VERSUS SUBWAY. BUT OPTIONS TRULY

17 BECOME AVAILABLE WHEN THE PRICING OF THOSE OPTIONS IS SIMILAR,

18 RATHER THAN STARKLY DIFFERENT. AND SO WE CAN OPEN UP MORE

19 CAPACITY, ESPECIALLY IF YOU HAVE AN EMPTY RAILROAD TRAIN GOING

20 TO THE SAME PLACE AS A CROWDED SUBWAY. WE CAN MOVE SOME OF

21 THOSE PEOPLE OFF THE CROWDED SUBWAY ON TO THE EMPTY RAILWAY.

22 SO IT IS IMPORTANT TO HAVE EQUITY ON THE TABLE, JUST AS I HOPE

23 WE CAN BE A VOICE FOR HELPING, ESPECIALLY THE UNBANKED TO BE

24 ABLE TO ENGAGE WITH TRANSIT WITHOUT HAVING TO CARRY MONEY

25 AROUND OR PAY HIGH FEES FOR FINANCIAL SERVICES. THANK YOU.



July 30, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. ARE THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
3 PUBLIC WHO WISH TO SPEAK AT THIS TIME?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
6 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANKS TO EVERYBODY WHO HAS  
9 COME IN TO SHARE YOUR THOUGHTS WITH STAFF. AGENDA ITEM SEVEN  
10 IS ADJOURNMENT TO THE NEXT MEETING. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE  
11 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
12 SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE AT A TIME TO BE DULY NOTICED. THANK YOU  
13 VERY MUCH. AND SEE YOU AT THAT DULY NOTICED TIME. [ADJOURNED]

14