





Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*



Meeting Transcript

To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

WEDNESDAY, JULY 22, 2020, 9:45 AM

SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: WELCOME TO THE METROPOLITAN

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION MEETING OF JULY 22ND. I WOULD LIKE

TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER AND ASK FOR THE ANNOUNCEMENT TO

BE READ. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A

ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S

EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS

OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB

SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND

OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND

RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS

PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED

ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.

COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM,

WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL

STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR

DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC

SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING

SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING

TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING

AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE

POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT

WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE
2 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS
3 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
4 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
5 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
6 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
7 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
8 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
9 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THERE YOU HAVE IT, SO THOSE
12 OF YOU, THE FIRST TIME YOU HAVE HEARD IT, PRETTY EXCITING
13 STUFF, HUH? WITH THAT, KIMBERLY DO YOU WISH TO CONFIRM QUORUM
14 OR CALL THE ROLL.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I WILL CALL THE ROLL. HAGGERTY?

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

25



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BRUINS?

4

5 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** HERE.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IF YOU COULD KEEP MUTED UNTIL IT'S TIME
8 FOR YOU TO SPEAK THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. CONNOLLY?

11

12 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORTESE?

15

16 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

19

20 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIOCAPINI?

23

24 **DOREEN GIACOPINI:** HERE.

25



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

2

3 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO?

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MACKENZIE?

10

11 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

18

19 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SLOCUM?

22

23 **WARREN SLOCUM:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** STRACNER? IS ABSENT S TAVARES IS ABSENT.

5 AND WORTH?

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM TWO, CHAIR'S REPORT,
12 I'LL BE BRIEF TODAY. THANK YOU. THAT'S MY REPORT. ITEM THREE
13 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL COMMITTEE WHICH IS RANDI KINMAN.
14 RANDI, ARE YOU ON?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DO NOT SEE RANDI.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. IF WE DO NOT SEE RANDI, THEN WE
19 WILL MOVE ON. IF SHE COMES ON, WE'LL GO AHEAD AND DO THE
20 REPORT AT THAT TIME. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. ITEM FOUR.
21 THERESE?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. AND THANK
24 YOU, MR. CHAIR. WHAT I WOULD FIRST LIKE TO DO IS HAND THE
25 PROVERBIAL ZOOM MIC OVER TO OUR VICE CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU THERESE, AND I WANT TO CATCH THE

3 CHAIR BY SURPRISE, SO MANY OF YOU MIGHT KNOW THAT CHAIR

4 HAGGERTY EARLIER THIS MONTH WAS RECOGNIZED BY THE CALIFORNIA

5 TRANSPORTATION FOUNDATION AS THE YEAR SPONSORED BY MTC AND

6 ALAMEDA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION FOR WHICH OUR CHAIR HAS

7 SERVED AS OF THE COMMISSION FROM 2013 TO 2016. THE CURRENT

8 ALAMEDA CTC CHAIR NOTED 24 YEARS OF SERVICE SUPERVISOR

9 HAGGERTY HAS BEEN THE STRONGEST AND MOST SUCCESSFUL

10 TRANSPORTATION LEADERS IN THE BAY AREA. FOR ALL OF US WHO KNOW

11 HIM, WE SEE EFFECTIVE WORK IN ALMOST EVERY TRANSPORTATION

12 SYSTEM IN ALAMEDA COUNTY IN THE BAY AREA. THERE COULD NOT BE A

13 MORE DESERVING PERSON. IN ADDITION HONORING CHAIR HAGGERTY FOR

14 HIS WORK TO DELIVER ALAMEDA MEASURE B CAPITA PROGRAM AND TO

15 PASS THE MEASURE B -- EXTENSION CTF NOTED SCOTT'S LEADERSHIP

16 IN EXTENDING BART FOR THE FIRST TIME TO SANTA CLARA COUNTY,

17 AND HIS RULE IN THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA GOODS MOVEMENT

18 COLLABORATIVE, HIS WORK TO ADVANCE EXPRESS LANES PROJECT,

19 WHICH WE JUST TALKED ABOUT, AND SUPPORT FOR SAFE ROUTES TO

20 SCHOOL PROGRAM, AND AFFORDABLE STUDENT TRANSIT PASS. AND I

21 ALSO WANT TO NOTE HIS ADVOCACY FOR VALUING PARTNERSHIP IN THE

22 SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY COMMUNITIES. IT IS MY PLEASURE TO

23 CONGRATULATION OUR FEARLESS CHAIR FOR DECADES OF LEADERSHIP

24 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. SCOTT WE'RE VERY FORTUNATE TO HAVE

25 YOU, AND FOR ALL OF THE GOOD WORK YOU HAVE LED US AND CONTINUE



Meeting Transcript

1 TO LEAD US IN THE MONTHS AHEAD SCOTT CONGRATULATIONS ON BEHALF
2 OF THE ENTIRE COMMISSION. [APPLAUSE]

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. YOU DID CATCH ME OFF GUARD.
5 I WAS WONDERING WHAT WAS GOING ON BUT NONE OF US DO THIS WORK
6 ALONE AND I CERTAINLY DO NOT WHETHER IT'S BEING SUPPORTIVE AND
7 CAROLE AND ALL OTHERS AT MTC WE ALL WORK TOGETHER, AND I
8 GUESS, IT IS AN HONOR. I'M EXTREMELY EXCITED ABOUT IT.
9 TOMORROW WE HAVE A WEBINAR ON COVID AND TRANSIT, AND WHICH
10 WE'LL BE SPEAKING, BUT AGAIN, YOU DO NONE OF THIS ALONE.
11 PEOPLE COME TO YOU WITH IDEAS, YOU HAVE IDEAS, BUT THEN, YOU
12 KNOW, IT TAKES EVERYBODY TO PUT IT TOGETHER, INCLUDING THE
13 STAFFS. I MEAN, REALLY PROBABLY MORE IMPORTANTLY, IT IS THE
14 STAFFS AT MTC AND ACTC THAT HELP GET THIS WORK DONE. IT'S A
15 GROUP EFFORT, BUT I HUMBLY ACCEPT THE AWARD AND THANK YOU VERY
16 MUCH.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** TURN IT BACK TO YOU THERESE.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND MAYBE, GIVEN
21 WHAT CHAIR HAGGERTY JUST SAID, THERE IS A LOT THAT WE HAVE ALL
22 BEEN DOING COLLECTIVELY, SO I'M GOING TO NOTE IN ADVANCE THAT
23 MY REPORT BE A BIT LONGER THAN IT NORMALLY S BUT THERE IS A
24 NUMBER OF IMPORTANT THINGS TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION. LET ME
25 START WITH PLANNED BAY AREA. THERE WILL BE AN IMPORTANT ITEM



Meeting Transcript

1 ON PLANNED BAY AREA LATER ON IN THE AGENDA TODAY, BUT THE
2 DRAFT BLUEPRINT HAS BEEN RELEASED. AND IT'S OUT FOR A SERIES
3 OF VERY IMPORTANT TOWN HALLS AND MEETINGS TO GET INPUT ON THIS
4 VERY CRITICAL WORK OF BOTH MTC AND ABAG. I WOULD SAY THAT THE
5 MILESTONE OF GETTING THIS REPORT-OUT ON THE STREET IS A
6 CULMINATION, LIKE THREE YEARS' OF WORK, AND SO WANT TO GIVE,
7 YOU KNOW, A BIG HEADS UP TO THE STAFF, PARTICULARLY THOSE
8 HEADED BY ALIX BOCKELMAN AND MATT MALONEY FOR THE
9 EXTRAORDINARY AMOUNT OF WORK NEEDED TO PULL THIS FORWARD.
10 THERE ARE A NUMBER OF WORKSHOPS HAPPENING IN EVERY COUNTY
11 BETWEEN -- ACTUALLY THEY STARTED A BIT LAST WEEK, NAPA, MARIN,
12 AND CONTRA COSTA HAVE ALL HAD THEIR COUNTY WORKSHOPS. THESE
13 ARE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS, OF COURSE, IN THE EVENING TO FACILITATE
14 MAXIMUM PARTICIPATION BY OUR BAY AREA RESIDENTS. SAN MATEO
15 WILL BE THIS EVENING, AND THE REMAINDER OF THE COUNTY MEETINGS
16 WILL EXPEND THROUGH AUGUST THE FIFTH. SO, ENCOURAGE ALL OF YOU
17 AS COMMISSIONERS TO REACH OUT TO YOUR COLLEAGUES AND YOUR
18 CONSTITUENTS TO PARTICIPATE IN THESE VERY IMPORTANT SESSIONS.
19 I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE, NEXT, A SUMMARY OF THE WORK OF THE BLUE
20 RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE. TASK FORCE MET ON JULY 20TH, THIS
21 PAST MONDAY AND SPECIFICALLY REQUESTED THAT AN UPDATE BE
22 PRESENTED TO THE COMMISSION ON THE CRITICAL AND SHARED TASKS
23 OF DEVELOPING AND IMPLEMENTING A COMPREHENSIVE HEALTH AND
24 SAFETY STRATEGY TO KEEP THE BAY AREA'S PUBLIC TRANSIT RIDERS
25 AND EMPLOYEES. THERE WILL BE FRONT AND CENTER AT THE COVID-19



Meeting Transcript

1 PANDEMIC CONTINUES TO UNFOLD. LET ME START FIRST WITH AN
2 IMPORTANT OBSERVATION THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE BEEN
3 COMMITTED TO TACKLING THE SAFETY NEEDS OF THEIR EMPLOYEES AND
4 RIDERS SINCE THE BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC. SINCE DAY ONE,
5 THERE HAS BEEN CRITICAL ATTENTION TO THIS. AND THE OPERATORS
6 HAVE SHOWN AN EXTRAORDINARY COMMITMENT TO ADDRESS THE
7 CHALLENGES TO PUBLIC SAFETY ACROSS OUR REGION. AND TO THEIR
8 CREDIT, THEY ESTABLISHED A WORKING GROUP AND THAT GROUP HAS
9 BEEN WORKING WITH MTC STAFF AND THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
10 ONCE THAT -- WE HAD HIGHLIGHTED AND DAYLIGHTED THE IMPORTANCE
11 OF THIS SUBJECT IN THAT FORUM. SO THE TASK FORCE RECEIVED A
12 PRESENTATION, THIS LAST MONDAY, BY THE PUBLIC TRANSIT
13 OPERATORS. THOUGH RIDING TOGETHER BAY AREA HEALTHY TRANSIT
14 PLAN. AND THAT PLAN ESTABLISHING COMMON HEALTH AND SAFETY
15 COMMITMENTS FOR EMPLOYEES AND PASSENGERS INCLUDING THOSE THAT
16 RIDE MULTIPLE SYSTEMS. PLAN HIGHLIGHTS ESSENTIAL PARTNERSHIPS
17 WITH THE REGION'S TRANSIT CUSTOMERS TO WORK TOGETHER TO
18 MINIMIZE A TRANSITION OF COVID-19. AND IMPORTANTLY TRANSIT
19 OPERATORS HAVE COMMITTED TO IMPLEMENTING THE PLAN INDIVIDUALLY
20 AND COLLECTIVELY WITH AN EYE TO CONTINUALLY IMPROVING AND
21 ADJUSTING TO CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES AND OPPORTUNITIES DURING
22 THIS UNPRECEDENTED CRISIS, AND I THINK WE CAN ALL APPRECIATE
23 HOW WE DO NOT KNOW HOW THE PANDEMIC IS GOING TO UNFOLD GOING
24 FORWARD, AND WE'RE ALL WORKING TOGETHER TO RESPOND TO
25 CIRCUMSTANCES AS THEY PRESENT THEMSELVES. THE FOLLOWING STEPS



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 THAT EMERGED FROM -- OR ARE CLOSELY RELATED TO THE TASK FORCE
2 INPUT AND RECOMMENDATION ARE AS FOLLOWING. RIDING TOGETHER BAY
3 AREA HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN WHICH I'LL REFER TO NOW AS "THE
4 PLAN" WILL BE REFERRED PUBLICLY IN THE NEXT 30 DAYS AND
5 ACCOMPANIED BY A COMPANION COMMUNICATION CAMPAIGN LED BY MTC
6 AND THIS CAMPAIGN WILL SUPPORT THE COORDINATED INDIVIDUAL
7 AGENCY COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION EFFORTS THAT THEY ALSO
8 HAVE, FOR THEIR SYSTEM. MTC REQUESTS THAT THE TRANSIT
9 OPERATORS PRESENT TO THEIR GOVERNING BOARDS AND SUBMIT TO THE
10 COMMISSION A RESOLUTION THAT COMMITS EACH AGENCY TO
11 IMPLEMENTING THE RIDING TOGETHER BAY AREA HEALTHY TRANSIT
12 PLAN. AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PLAN'S HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMON
13 COMMITMENT, A SET OF PUBLIC TRANSIT BASELINE HEALTH CONDITIONS
14 WILL BE OUTLINED IN A DASHBOARD FOR PUBLIC ACCESS AND
15 INFORMATION. AND THIS WILL BE AVAILABLE TO THE COMMISSION AT
16 ITS AUGUST MEETING. AT THE AUGUST MEETING, WE WILL SEE THE
17 BASELINE METRICS THAT WILL BE TRACKED, AND AT THAT TIME IT
18 WILL BE ACCOMPANIED BY A FRAMEWORK FOR HOW THOSE METRICS WILL
19 BE MEASURED AND REGULARLY REPORTED TO BE TRACKED AND REPORTED
20 TO THE COMMISSION IN SUBSEQUENT MEETINGS AND THAT WILL BE DONE
21 ON A MONTHLY BASIS. SO, JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE FULL
22 COMMISSION WAS AWARE OF THE SIGNIFICANT WORK THAT HAS BEEN
23 ACCOMPLISHED TO DATE, A LOT MORE GOING FORWARD, BUT AS CHAIR
24 SPERING -- COMMISSIONER SPERING, WHO IS THE CHAIR OF THE BLUE
25 RIBBON TASK FORCE HAD SPECIFICALLY REQUESTED THAT I OUTLINE



Meeting Transcript

1 STATUS TO YOU TODAY. LET ME GO ON TO CLIPPER START, ANOTHER
2 REALLY SIGNIFICANT AND IMPORTANT PROGRAM. THE NEW CLIPPER
3 START IS A MEANS-BASED FARE PILOT. IT WAS REFERRED TO DURING
4 OUR BAIFA PRESENTATION EARLIER TODAY. AND IT ALLOWS LOWER
5 INCOME ADULTS AGED 19 TO 64 TO RECEIVE LARGE FARE DISCOUNTS ON
6 SELECT TRANSIT SERVICES AROUND THE REGION, AND IT WAS LAUNCHED
7 ON WEDNESDAY JULY 15TH. NOW, AGAIN, THIS IS A PILOT, AND THERE
8 IS FOUR AGENCIES THAT ARE CURRENTLY INVOLVED. MUNI, CALTRAIN,
9 SELECT SCHOOLS, TRANSIT AND FERRY GROUPS AND BART. THIS IS A
10 PILOT PROGRAM INITIATED BY THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AND
11 MTC THAT USES THE CLIPPER FARE PAYMENT SYSTEM AS A BASIS FOR
12 PUTTING FORWARD IN CONVEYANCE OF DISCOUNTS AND IT'S CRITICAL
13 BECAUSE IT'S COMING AT A TIME WHEN SOME OF OUR MOST VULNERABLE
14 RIDERS ON OUR SYSTEM ARE FACING IMPACTS FROM THE ECONOMIC
15 COVID CLIMATE WHICH WE ALL KNOW AND APPRECIATE. MTC HAS
16 RECENTLY ENGAGED 17 ADDITIONAL TRANSIT OPERATORS ON THE TOPIC
17 OF JOINING THE PROGRAM. AND WE WILL BE UPDATING THE COMMISSION
18 ON THAT PROGRESS OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS. SO, A MAJOR
19 STEP FORWARD IN OUR EQUITY PLATFORM. THE OTHER THING I WOULD
20 LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT BRIEFLY IS WHAT IS HAPPENING ON THE
21 LEGISLATIVE BRANCH. CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE WILL BE RETURNING
22 ON MONDAY JULY 27th, TWO WEEKS LATER THAN ORIGINALLY PLANNED,
23 DUE TO THE SURGE IN COVID CASES STATEWIDE. AND WE WOULD NOTE,
24 UNFORTUNATELY, AT LEAST SIX MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATURE AND
25 SEVERAL STAFFERS HAVE TESTED POSITIVE FOR COVID. SO MINDFUL OF



Meeting Transcript

1 WANTING TO ESTABLISH THE SAFE AS POSSIBLE CIRCUMSTANCES FOR
2 RECONVENING THE LEGISLATURE IS CONVENING TWO WEEKS LATER THAN
3 THEY ANTICIPATED. THIS DOES CREATE AN EVEN MORE COMPRESSED
4 HEARING SCHEDULE. SO WE EXPECT FAR FEWER BILLS TO MAKE IT TO
5 THE FINISH LINE THIS YEAR. CONGRESS MEANWHILE HAS RETURNED TO
6 WASHINGTON, D.C. WITH A CORONAVIRUS AID RELIEF PACKAGE AT THE
7 TOP OF THE AGENDA. IT'S BEEN WIDELY REPORTED THAT
8 CONGRESSIONAL LEADERSHIP HAS GIVEN THEMSELVES AN AUGUST 7TH
9 DEADLINE TO PASS THE BILL. STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT AID,
10 TRANSIT RELIEF, AND EMERGENCY AID FOR RENTERS ARE ALL
11 PRIORITIES THAT WE'RE HOPEFUL TO SEE IN A FINAL PACKAGE. WITH
12 THAT, MR. CHAIR, THERE IS OTHER THINGS OF NOTE IN MY REPORT,
13 BUT I WILL END IT THERE AND TURN IT BACK TO YOU.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ON THE PILOT PROGRAM
16 THAT WE'RE DOING, WHEN WILL WE GET SOME SMALL OPERATORS
17 INVOLVED IN THAT?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I KNOW THAT WE ARE EVALUATING, RIGHT NOW,
20 THE FULL COMPENDIUM AND SEVERAL SMALL OPERATORS HAVE ASKED TO
21 BE ADDED, AND I BELIEVE -- AND I DON'T KNOW IF ANDY OR CAROLE
22 HAPPEN TO BE ON THE CALL, BUT BETWEEN NOW AND THE END OF THE
23 CALENDAR YEAR, I BELIEVE WE WILL BE IN A POSITION TO START
24 INITIATING ENTRY. BUT, WE CAN REPORT BACK, MR. CHAIR, ON HOW
25 THE TIMING OF THAT PIPELINE SORTS ITSELF OUT.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** --

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD ANDY.

5

6 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR AND THERESE, THIS IS ANDY F
7 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF OPERATIONS. WE EXPECT THEM TO
8 ROLL IN IT'S GOING TO BE INCREDIBLE BUT WE WILL IDENTIFY THE
9 SCHEDULE ONCE WE GET IT IDENTIFIED THERE IS A HANDFUL OF
10 AGREEMENTS AND COMMITMENTS TO GET STARTED BUT WE HAVE STARTED
11 THE BACKGROUND IN THE WORK AND ANTICIPATE IT TO ROLL OUT OVER
12 THE COURSE OF THE FALL.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I THOUGHT I HAD A PANELIST
15 THAT WANTED TO SPEAK? ONE OF THE COMMISSIONER HAVE A QUESTION?
16 OKAY. SOMEBODY HAD ONE ON. IT'S BEEN REMOVED. WE TO HAVE AN
17 ATTENDEE THAT WISH --

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** WITH RESPECT TO COVID-19 I'VE DONE A LOT OF RESEARCH
22 I'M NOT A MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL IN ANY WAY SHAPE OR FORM, THE
23 ENTITIES THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO PUT THIS BEHIND THEM ARE THE
24 ONES THAT HAD A MASSIVE TEST, TRACE, AND ISOLATE ROUTINE. EVEN
25 VIETNAM WHERE I WAS 50 YEARS AGO AT THIS TIME, THEY HAVEN'T



Meeting Transcript

1 HAD ANY CASES. THAT SHOULD BE A BELL TO FEDERAL AND STATE AND
2 LOCAL THAT UNLESS YOU IMPLEMENT THAT ITEM THERE IS NO WAY
3 YOU'RE GOING TO STOP COVID-19 FROM GETTING IN. WITH RESPECT TO
4 THE MTC AND TRANSIT ORGANIZATIONS PERHAPS SHOULD YOU INVITE A
5 LOT OF THE TESTING TO KNOW DONE AT KEY TRANSIT STATIONS TO
6 PROTECT PEOPLE COMING IN AND ALSO TO VERIFY VALIDATE THAT
7 TRANSPORTATION OR MASS TRANSPORTATION WILL BE PROTECTED.
8 THAT'S MY SUGGESTION. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH VAUGHN. OKAY. SO
11 WITH THAT, I HAVE -- DO I HAVE ANOTHER ONE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DON'T SEE ANY ADDITIONAL HANDS. HOWEVER,
14 RANDI KINMAN IS NOW ON THE LINE.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO GET TO THAT. I'M JUST
17 TRYING TO GET TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT REAL QUICK. I
18 HAVE NO ATTENDEES NO PANELISTS WISHING TO SPEAK I AM ASSUMING
19 NO ONE SENT ANYTHING IN?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE RECEIVED.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** RANDI GLAD WE HAVE YOU BACK.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **RANDI KINMAN:** THAT'S FINE. EVERYTHING HAS BEEN RESOLVED. I
2 WANT TO THANK YOU CHAIR HAGGERTY AND THE COMMISSION. AND
3 RATHER THAN TELLING YOU WHAT WAS GOING ON THIS MONTH I WILL
4 TELL YOU ABOUT WHAT FORMER COMMISSIONER CALLS THE NEW
5 DIFFERENT. RELATED TO THE FACT LIKE YOU'RE ALL MOVING THROUGH
6 A MU ZOOM WORLD WHERE ZOOM IS NOT A DEFINITION OF SPEED.
7 UNLIKE THE COMMISSION WE ARE HAMPER BY THE BUILT IN COMPLEX
8 BECAUSE OUR COMMISSION MEETINGS OVERLAP THIS MEANS WE GET
9 BUMPED AND CANNOT COMMIT TO A REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING TIME
10 FROM MONTH TO MONTH. WE CONFINED TO A SPECIFIC TIME PERIOD.
11 LAST MONTH WE HAD SPECIFICALLY ASKED FOR PRESENTATION RELATED
12 TO DIGITAL OUTREACH PLANS AND HAD TO MOVE THAT TO THE
13 SEPTEMBER EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING. THIS MONTH
14 BOTH OF KEY FINDINGS AND KEY DECISIONS FOR TRANSPORTATION
15 ELEMENT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WERE ON OUR AGENDA, RATHER
16 THAN RECEIVING INFORMATION AND PROVIDING INPUT TO STAFF ON
17 EACH ITEM WE HEARD STAFF PRESENTATIONS AND MEMBERS ASKED
18 QUESTIONS BECAUSE OF OUR TIME CONSTRAINTS. THEY DIDN'T RECEIVE
19 ANSWERS THAT DAY, THERE WERE NO CLARIFYING OR FOLLOW-UP
20 QUESTIONS, AND WE CERTAINLY DIDN'T PROVIDE STAFF WITH
21 DIRECTION OR INPUT. THOSE QUESTIONS AND THE ANSWERS HAVE ALL
22 BEEN CAPTURED AND REPORTED BACK TO OUR MEMBERS AND WILL BE
23 REVIEWED NEXT TIME WE MEET WHICH WON'T BE UNTIL SEPTEMBER
24 BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN ADVISED THAT WE ARE OFF IN AUGUST. THIS
25 MEANS NONE OF OUR INPUT ON PLANNED BAY AREA IS INCLUDED IN ANY



Meeting Transcript

1 OF YOUR PRESENTATIONS. WHILE WE ARE IN A NEW DIFFERENT AND
2 HAVE TO ADAPT OUR COUNCIL AND OUR SUBCOMMITTEES NEED
3 CONSISTENT MEETING TIMES. CHAIR HAGGERTY, YOU JOKED LAST MONTH
4 HEY I KNOW YOU'RE ALL ON PER DIEM AND SIMPLY TRYING TO GET A
5 ROLL CALL AT A MEETING THAT A SIMPLY NEVER BEEN MOVED AROUND
6 WE RECEIVE \$50 PER MEETING WITH MAXIMUM OF \$150 A MONTH BUT
7 CAN NO LONGER TAKE TIME OFF ON -- INCLUDES BANDWIDTH ISSUES,
8 WHERE EVERYONE IS TRYING TO ATTEND WORK OR CLASSES AT THE SAME
9 TIME AND NONE OF US ARE STAFFED. ON MY PART I HAVE ASKED STAFF
10 TO PRESCHEDULE ALL OUR MEETINGS FOR THE NEXT SIX MONTHS AND
11 WILL CONTINUE THAT THROUGH SPRING OF 2021 BECAUSE WE CAN
12 ALWAYS GO BACK TO OUR OLD SCHEDULES IF WE MEET IN PERSON. WHAT
13 I'M ASKING FROM THE COMMISSION IS TO MAKE SURE STAFF HAS THE
14 ABILITY TO CONDUCT WHAT MAY AMOUNT TO OVERLAP IN PUBLIC
15 MEETINGS WE HAVE ADDED TO NOT SUBTRACTED PUBLIC MEETINGS AS WE
16 DEAL WITH SHORT AND LONG-TERM TRANSIT RECOVERY. BEHALF OF THE
17 ENTIRE COUNCIL I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE AT
18 ALL HOURS REALLY GOING ABOVE AND BEYOND AND ON BEHALF OF THE
19 ENTIRE COUNCIL I WANT TO SAY CONGRATULATIONS TO YOU CHAIR
20 HAGGERTY FROM OUR BODY FOR YOUR WELL DESERVED RECOGNITION FROM
21 THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION FOUNDATION AND THAT CONCLUDES MY
22 REPORT.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU RANDI, THIS IS VICE CHAIR ALFREDO
25 PEDROZA. I THINK WE LOST CHAIRPERSON HAGGERTY. ALL RIGHT. SO I



Meeting Transcript

1 BELIEVE RANDI, WE GOT YOUR REPORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
2 THERESE, YOU FINISHED YOUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORTS. DO WE
3 HAVE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** NO.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, ARE YOU RAISING
8 YOUR HAND FOR COMMISSIONER COMMENTS?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** SORRY. I'M WAITING FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR, SIR.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. WE SEE NO COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. LET'S
13 MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT ITEM AGENDA ITEM SIX CONSENT CALENDAR I
14 BELIEVE WE HAD A COUPLE OF REQUESTS TO REMOVE SOME ITEMS.
15 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. VICE CHAIR. I AM PULLING ITEM 6K. I
18 WAS NOT PART OF THE PRELIMINARY DISCUSSIONS ON THAT, AND I
19 RESPECTFULLY ASK STAFF IF THEY COULD LET US KNOW, DOES THIS
20 LEGISLATIVE ITEM APPLY TO HIGH SPEED RAIL?

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO REMOVE 6K FROM CONSENT
23 AND I BELIEVE COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY YOU ALSO HAD A REQUEST?

24

25 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** I DID, FOR ITEM 6J. THANK YOU.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** 6J. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE UP 6K AND 6J DO
3 I HAVE A MOTION FOR THE BALANCE EXCLUDING 6K AND 6J.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** MOVED.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WHO WAS THE FIRST FOR THE MOTION?

10

11 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** BRUINS.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** BRUINS WAS FIRST. AND SECOND DUTRA-
14 VERNACI?

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** DID WE RECEIVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT FOR CONSENT
17 ITEMS?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ALTHOUGH THERE IS ONE
20 RAISED HAND.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALLOW THE COMMENT ON THE BALANCE OF THE
23 CONSENT.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JAMES LINDSAY.



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. I BELIEVE THAT 7B IS ON THE CONSENT
3 ITEM, AND THAT'S THE ITEM I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK TO.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I BELIEVE WE ARE NOT ON THOSE ITEMS YET.
6 THAT'S PART OF PROGRAMS AND ALLOCATION MR. LINDSAY. WE'LL TAKE
7 YOU UP ON THAT ITEM.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** BRINGING IT BACK. WAS THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS
12 OF THE PUBLIC THAT WANT TO COMMENT?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS AND I AM HAPPY
15 TO CALL THE ROLL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. DO ROLL CALL PLEASE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES
20 UNANIMOUSLY.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET'S MOVE ON TO
23 COMMITTEE REPORTS ITEM 7A AND B COMMUTER ALLOCATION REPORTS.
24 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

25



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CAN WE GO BACK TO THE CONSENT ITEMS THAT
2 WERE PULLED?

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APOLOGIZE FOR JUMPING
5 AHEAD. LET'S TAKE 6K FIRST.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. VICE CHAIR. SO, MY QUESTION TO
8 STAFF, WOULD THIS LEGISLATION APPLY TO ALLOW HIGH SPEED RAIL
9 AN EXEMPTION?

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR, THE SHORT ANSWER IS NO. BUT REBECCA IS ON THE LINE.
13 REBECCA, ARE YOU?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** I AM.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** REBECCA LONG CAN TAKE SPECIFICS ON THAT.

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** I AM GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONER PAPAN. THIS DOES
20 NOT APPLY TO HIGH SPEED RAIL. IT DOESN'T APPLY TO PROJECTS
21 THAT ARE NOT IN THE PUBLIC RIGHT OF WAY, FOR ONE THING, BUT
22 ALSO THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS WILL EXCLUDE ANY CHANGES RELATED
23 TO RAIL.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** GOD BLESS YOU. THANK YOU.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU REBECCA. COMMISSIONER PAPAN DOES
3 THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES IT DOES. THANK YOU VICE CHAIR.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOVING TO ITEM 6J COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

8

9 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** YEA AND MAYBE WHAT I CAN ASK, I'M ASKING FOR A
10 SEPARATE VOTE ON 6J, THE RECOMMENDATION IS TO SUPPORT. I'M NOT
11 THERE IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO VOTE IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AT
12 THIS TIME ON THAT, SO I SIMPLY WANTED THE OPPORTUNITY TO LOG A
13 NO VOTE.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. WE'LL TAKE THESE UP SEPARATELY
16 COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY. DID WE HAVE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS ON 6J IF
17 NOT I'M GOING TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR 6K.

18

19 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'LL MOVE. JOSEFOWITZ.

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING SECOND.

24



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT WE HAVE SECOND BY COMMISSIONER
2 SPERING. ROLL CALL PLEASE?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. THAT MOTION
5 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. CHAIR HAGGERTY, DO YOU
8 WANT TO TAKE OVER?

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD AND FINISH THE CONSENT
11 CALENDAR.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR:** ENTERTAIN A MOTION OF 6J. MOTION
14 BY SPERING, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. ROLL CALL?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
17 WITH ONE NO.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TURNING IT OVER TO
20 CHAIR HAGGERTY.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I'M AN AYE
23 VOTE ON THE REST OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR KIMBERLY. I GOT
24 KNOCKED OFF. BUT I FIGURED OUT THE COMPUTER. MOVING TO ITEM 7A
25 AND 7B WHICH IS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PROGRAMMING AND
3 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON, REMOTELY ON JULY 8TH, 2020 AND
4 REFERS THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL
5 AGENDA ITEM 7A COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH CITY OF SAN JOSE
6 CALTRAIN SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY VTA AND
7 CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL AUTHORITY TO SUPPORT DEVELOPMENT OF
8 SAN JOSE DIRIDON STATION PROGRAM. COMMISSION MATERIAL INCLUDES
9 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ABOUT HOW OTHER AGENCIES THAT SERVE THE
10 STATION ARE INCLUDED IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROJECT. I MOVE
11 APPROVAL OF THE DIRIDON STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT. BUT I
12 ALSO WANTED TO SPEAK ON THE ITEM.

13

14 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I WILL SECOND THE MOTION.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SECOND BY BRUINS, I THINK?

17

18 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YES.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND, UNDER DISCUSSION.
21 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

22

23 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS LIKE
24 CONTINUED CONCERN OF BART, AND ACE ARE NOT SORT OF FULL
25 MEMBERS OF THIS -- OF THIS PROJECT, ON THE FULL COMMITTEE. YOU



Meeting Transcript

1 KNOW, BART IS GOING TO, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE BOTH INCREDIBLY
2 IMPORTANT PARTNERS AND EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE NOT CONTRIBUTING
3 MONEY, I THINK IT'S A REAL PROBLEM TO HAVE THIS KIND OF PAY TO
4 PLAY ENVIRONMENT. AND I THINK WE ALL WORK BETTER WHEN WE'RE
5 ALL WORKING TOGETHER. AND I DON'T KNOW WHAT OPPORTUNITIES
6 THERE ARE FOR US TO KIND OF, YOU KNOW, TRY AND ALTER THE
7 COMPOSITION OF THIS BOARD, BUT NOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE PART
8 OF IT, I JUST WANTED IT RAISE THAT AS SOMETHING THEY FIND
9 QUITE PROBLEMATIC.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL, I AGREE WITH YOU, COMMISSIONER
12 JOSEFOWITZ. I THINK THAT EVERYBODY THAT'S UTILIZING THAT
13 STATION SHOULD BE AT THE TABLE. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, IT WOULD BE
14 A SHAME TO GET SOMEWHERE AND THEN FIND OUT IT DOESN'T WORK FOR
15 SOMEONE. SO I AGREE BUT I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHERE WE'RE AT WITH
16 THAT. WITH THAT, COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** AND I WILL RESPECTFULLY DISAGREE WITH MY
19 COLLEAGUES ON THIS ONE. ACCORDING TO THE REPORTS THEY ARE AT
20 THE TABLE, JUST NOT A VOTING MEMBER HERE AND THE DISCUSSIONS
21 THAT HAVE BEEN ONGOING SEEM TO BE VERY PRODUCTIVE AND
22 THANKFULLY, IF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC IS ON ABOARD, IT
23 WILL BE MORE COHESIVE IN UNDERSTANDING THROUGHOUT. SO I WOULD
24 PROVE THIS AS PROPOSED. THANK YOU.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SAY THAT, BEING AT
2 A TABLE AND NOT BEING ABLE TO VOTE IS LIKE KISSING YOUR
3 GRANDMOTHER.

4

5 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, IT'S COVID TIME, SIR.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YEAH WELL, OKAY.

10

11 **JEANNIE BRUINS, VICE CHAIR:** CHAIR HAGGERTY?

12

13 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** IT'S A WEIRD ANALOGY.

14

15 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** CHAIR HAGGERTY AND MEMBER JOSEFOWITZ, ARE YOU
16 HEARING COMPLAINTS ABOUT THIS? OR IS THIS YOUR OWN JUST
17 DESIRE?

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TOWER ME, I THINK IT'S MY OWN PERSONAL.
20 I MEAN, I NEVER LIKE BEING INVOLVED IN SOMEBODY -- SOMETHING,
21 AND NOT BEING INVOLVE, THAT'S JUST MY NATURE. AS AN ACE BOARD
22 MEMBER, I DEFINITELY WANT ACE AT THE TABLE I WANT THEM
23 TALKING. I WANT TO BE A PART OF IT BECAUSE THEY MAY DO
24 SOMETHING THAT DOESN'T ALLOW ACE TRAINS TO, YOU KNOW, BE
25 INVOLVED. I MEAN, SO, I JUST THINK IT'S NOT A GREAT IDEA. I'M



Meeting Transcript

1 NOT GOING TO DIE OVER IT, BUT I JUST DON'T LIKE, YOU KNOW, NOT
2 BEING AT THE TABLE BECAUSE IF YOU'RE NOT AT THE TABLE YOU'RE
3 ON THE MENU.

4

5 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** AND JOSEFOWITZ -- NICK, HOW ABOUT YOU? YOU
6 HAVE HEARD ANY COMPLAINTS ABOUT THIS? BECAUSE I HAVE NOT.

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I HAVE HEARD PEOPLE -- I WOULDN'T SAY
9 COMPLAINTS, AND I DON'T WANT TO -- AND AGAIN, I AGREE WITH
10 COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, IT'S NOT WORTH SOMETHING DYING ON THIS
11 HILL, I JUST THINK TO SET UP THIS PROJECT FOR GREATEST
12 SUCCESS, I THINK THERE ARE A NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO HAVE REACHED
13 OUT TO ME WHO HAVE INDICATE THIS IS THE BEST WAY FORWARD
14 CERTAINLY NOT SPEAKING FOR BART.

15

16 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I SUPPORT THE POSITION PRESENTED.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I SUPPORT THE MOTION BUT SOMETIMES YOU
19 HAVE TO HOLD YOUR NOSE. PAPAN DID YOU WANT TO SAY ANYTHING
20 ELSE? I'M GOING TO COMMISSIONER WORTH NOW.

21

22 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. YOU KNOW, I REALLY WANT TO
23 AGREE WITH CHAIR SPERING AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. YOU
24 KNOW, WE HAVE ALL BEEN INVOLVED IN THESE LARGE CAPITAL
25 PROJECTS AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO REALIZE FIRST OF ALL



Meeting Transcript

1 THE MONEY COMES FROM THE ENTIRE REGION TO FUND THESE PROJECTS.
2 AND SECOND OF ALL, IT IS VITALLY IMPORTANT THAT THE AGENCIES
3 THAT ARE GOING TO BE USING THESE FACILITIES HAVE A VOTING,
4 FULL PARTICIPATION IN THE PLANNING OF THESE PROJECTS. SO, I
5 THINK THAT THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT HAPPENS TO BE THE ONE WE'RE
6 TALKING ABOUT, BUT, YOU KNOW, IT'S REALLY -- IT'S REALLY
7 VITAL, BECAUSE WHAT HAPPENS IS, IF WE DON'T HAVE -- IF WE
8 DON'T HAVE THE RELEVANT AGENCIES AT THE TABLE, YOU END UP WITH
9 A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WASTED TIME WITH END-AROUNDS. AND I
10 JUST FEEL THAT WE HAVE INVESTED HUGE MONEY IN THE LINKAGES
11 WITH BART AND ACE AND THE DIRIDON STATION AND CALTRANS. AND
12 HIGH SPEED IS ALL GOING TO COME TOGETHER, AND I DON'T SEE THE
13 RESISTANCE AND IT'S REASON TO BE CONCERNED OF HAVING EVERYBODY
14 AT THE TABLE THAT'S GOING TO BE A TREMENDOUSLY IMPORTANT
15 PARTICIPANT AND PARTNER IN THIS. SAME, I'M GOING TO SUPPORT
16 THIS MOTION BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE AN ALTERNATIVE STRUCTURE
17 TO COME BACK TO US BECAUSE I THINK IT'S IN THE BEST INTEREST
18 IN THE LONG-TERM TO HAVE THESE OTHER TWO TRANSIT RAIL AGENCIES
19 ENGAGED, EQUALLY, IN THESE -- IN PLANNING AND THESE
20 DISCUSSIONS.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
23 WORTH. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO NOW.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **SAM LICCARDO:** APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS OF MY COLLEAGUES I'LL
2 TAKE THIS FEEDBACK BACK TO OUR PARTNERS OBVIOUSLY IT'S IN THE
3 HEART OF MY CITY AND IT'S VITALLY IMPORTANT FOR US TO GET IT
4 RIGHT AND WE WANT IT TO BE SOMETHING THAT'S EMBRACED BY ALL
5 OUR REGIONAL PARTNERS. I WILL NOTE, JUST SO FOLKS UNDERSTAND,
6 BART'S INPUT IS ALREADY DEEPLY ENMESHED IN EVERYTHING WE'RE
7 DOING WITH REGARD TO THE CONSTRUCTION OF THIS SITE, BECAUSE
8 VTA IS THE BUILDER, THAT IS VTA IS CONSTRUCTING THIS,
9 ESSENTIALLY, FOR BART. SO, THE -- YOU CAN BE CERTAIN THAT BART
10 WILL ABSOLUTELY BE INVOLVED IN EVERY SINGLE DETAIL BECAUSE VTA
11 CAN'T BUILD A BART LINE WITHOUT BART SIGN OFF AND WE KNOW THAT
12 VERY WELL FROM RECENT MONTHS THAT BART WILL BE CLEAR AND VOCAL
13 ABOUT EVERY ISSUE THEY'RE CONCERNED ABOUT. I DON'T WANT FOLKS
14 TO THINK THERE INPUT ISN'T CLEAR AND DIRECT. I HAVE A QUESTION
15 FOR CHAIR, ARE WE TAKING 7A AND 7B TOGETHER?

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NO.

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, DO YOU WANT TO GO AHEAD AND
22 CALL THE ATTENDEES?

23



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I WILL CALL THE ATTENDEES. AND WOULD
2 YOU LIKE ME TO ALSO NOTE THE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED
3 ON THIS ITEM?

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YES. SURE. YOU HAVE THE FLOOR.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ONE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FROM
8 ROLAND LEBRUN AND THE FIRST PUBLIC SPEAKER IS, THE LAST FOUR
9 DIGITS 6262, WHICH I BELIEVE IS MR. LABRUN.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS ROLAND, AND I TRIED TO SPEAK ON ITEM J
12 WHEN YOU PULLED IT FROM THE CONSENT FOR THE VERY REASON THAT
13 BILL IS GOING TO ALLOW US TO EXPEDITE ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCE
14 FOR DIRIDON. NOT JUST FOR DIRIDON, BUT FOR CAPITAL CORRIDOR
15 TRANSBAY TUBE. BUT SOMETHING THAT'S NOT ENVIRONMENTALLY CLEAR
16 WHICH IS THE ONLY SENSIBLE ALIGNMENT FOR THE CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN
17 EXTENSION. RESPONSIBILITIES SAYS ANY AGENCY MAY CONTRACT
18 MANAGE FULL CONTRACTORS TO FURTHER DEVELOP AND ADVANCE THE
19 PLAN, IT'S A PROBLEM. CURRENT PROJECT MANAGER IS A FULL
20 SAMTRANS PLANNER CURRENTLY EMPLOYED BY -- AND IF I KNOW WHAT
21 MAY BE WRONG WITH -- ONGOING I SUGGEST YOU TAKE BART AND
22 ATTEMPT TO TRANSFER FROM BART TO VTA GOOGLE IS ESTIMATING FOUR
23 MINUTE WALK THIS IS SIMILAR WITH DIRIDON. MOVING TO WHAT
24 DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ SAID, ABSOLUTELY. WHY CAPITAL CORRIDOR ON
25 THE TABLE. LETTER I WROTE TO YOU HAS THE BENEFIT OF BOTH



Meeting Transcript

1 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO AND BRUINS HAVING BEEN INVOLVED IN THIS,
2 WHAT HAPPENED TO THE CONTRACT? IS SO IT STARTED OFF WITH SPUR
3 AND MAYBE GIVE 48K CONTRACT THESE PEOPLE ESSENTIALLY RODE THE
4 -- GUESS WHAT A DAY LATER THEY GOT A CONTRACT FOR \$6.4
5 MILLION. THEN WENT BACK TO VTA, OH MY GOD, WE HAVE RUN OUT OF
6 MONEY WE WANT TO EXPAND THE CONTRACT TO \$8 MILLION. MAYOR
7 LICCARDO AT THAT POINT WAS CONTACTED BY THE PRESS AND SAID,
8 NO. WE HAVE TO REVISIT THIS. WHAT HAPPENED? THEY NOW CAME BACK
9 TO THE BOARD ON CONSENT, NOW INCREASED THE SCOPE OF THE
10 CONTRACT TO 11 MINUTE \$1 MILLION. SO, MY CONCLUSION HERE IS
11 THAT MTC ABSOLUTELY HAS TO TAKE OVER, AND START COORDINATING
12 ALL THESE AGENCIES HAVING EVERYBODY ON THE LEFT, RIGHT, AND
13 CENTER. RIGHT NOW CALTRAIN IS GOING TO GO AROUND AWARDING
14 CONTRACTS TO ALL. WHAT CAN POSSIBLY GO WRONG? THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID SHONBRUN.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, JUST SO I UNDERSTAND, THIS
19 MEANS --

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME. BECAUSE I THINK YOU CAN'T HEAR MY
22 TONE ON MY PHONE. SO THAT MEANS TIME. [LAUGHTER]

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS DAVID SHONBRUN, PRESIDENT OF TRANS- I
25 HAVE A QUESTION FOR COMMISSION CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. DIRIDON



Meeting Transcript

1 STATION IS ON AN EXISTING RIGHT OF WAY, BECAUSE YOU, AS POLICY
2 DIRECTOR OF SPUR WERE THE SPONSOR -- A SPONSOR OF SB288, I
3 WOULD LIKE YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHETHER THE DIRIDON STATION
4 IS SUBJECT TO ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUTORY EXEMPTION.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JUST SO WE'RE CLEAR, YOU DON'T DIRECTLY
7 CALL OUT COMMISSIONERS, YOU CAN ASK YOUR QUESTION, AND WE'LL
8 GET THE APPROPRIATE STAFF OR COMMISSIONER TO ANSWER YOUR
9 QUESTION. SO IF STAFF WANTS TO RESPOND TO THAT QUESTION, OR
10 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, IF YOU HAVE SOMETHING TO SAY THEN
11 FINE, IF NOT, I'M GOING TO MOVE ON.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. NEXT SPEAKER IS VAUGHN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I WOULD PUT EMPHASIS ON WHAT DIRECTORS HAVE
20 SAID ABOUT ADDING ACE AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR. THEY NEED TO
21 REALLY BE THERE. I MEAN CALTRAIN BUILDING ELECTRIFIED AND
22 MODERN RAILROAD IN THE BAY AREA, 180,000 RIDERS. THERE IS NO
23 REASON TO BELIEVE WITH MANHATTANIZATION OF BAY AREA GOING ON,
24 THAT AT SOME POINT CAPITAL CORRIDOR AND ACE WILL BE DELIVERING
25 200,000 RIDERS ON MODERN TRAINS COMING INTO THAT STATION NOT



Meeting Transcript

1 HAVING THEM AT THE TABLE DOESN'T MAKE A WHOLE LOT OF SENSE
2 IT'S ALMOST AS IF IT BEGS TO HAVE THE GOVERNANCE OF MODERN
3 RAIL NETWORK TAKEN AND PUT SOME PLACE ELSE OTHER THAN IN THE
4 VALLEY WICK OF THE LOCAL TOUCH OF OPINION TYPE OF STUFF. YOU
5 GOT TO HAVE THE MAJOR PLAYERS IN THERE. JUST THINK THE
6 NORTHEAST CORRIDOR THERE IS FIVE OR SIX DIFFERENT TRAINS
7 COMING IN THERE, OPERATORS ARE COMING IN FROM 80 OR 90 MILES
8 AWAY, AT MORE THAN 100 MILES AN HOUR TYPE OF THING AND
9 SCHEDULING. THERE IS 1.2 MILLION PEOPLE GOING ON THE LONG
10 ISLAND RAILROAD GRAND CENTRAL STATION HANDLES MORE PEOPLE IN
11 A DAY THAN ALL THE AIRPORT IN THE UNITED STATES. THIS IS
12 PLANNING TO FAIL. [LAUGHTER] YOU KNOW. YOU'RE GOING TO RUN
13 INTO FAILURE, IF YOU DON'T INCLUDE THOSE OTHER PARTIES. SOME
14 WAY OR ANOTHER YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO INCLUDE THEM. THEY'RE
15 PART OF THE MIX THAT MAKES IT A RAIL STATION. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT CALLER IS ALETA DUPREE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR HAGGERTY, AND MEMBERS. COMMITTEE
20 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. THE IDEA OF
21 REGIONAL COOPERATION IS IMPORTANT AND ESSENTIAL, AND I SUPPORT
22 THIS AGREEMENT, BUT IT MUST BE THE BEGINNING OF INCLUDING ALL
23 PARTIES AT THE TABLE. I DO NOT HAVE MUCH EXPERIENCE WITH
24 DIRIDON. HOWEVER, PENNSYLVANIA STATION IN NEW YORK HAS THREE
25 TENANT RAILROADS, THE LONG ISLAND, NJ TRANSIT AND AMTRAK AND



Meeting Transcript

1 THE STATION IS OWNED BY AMTRAK AND THEY ALL HAVE TO GET
2 TOGETHER, AND GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL THE WORLD'S LARGEST TRAIN
3 STAYING EVEN THOUGH IT'S OWNED BY THE IMPRESS TRANSPORTATION
4 AUTHORITY OF NEW YORK HAS MADE PROVISIONS FOR AMTRAK TO USE
5 ITS FACILITY AND MAKE COORDINATING WITH THE SUBWAY, IT IS
6 OPERATING BY MTA, AND SO EVEN WITH THE LACK OF PHYSICAL
7 CONNECTIONS THEY HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER. I EMPHASIZE THIS
8 AGREEMENT MUST BE THE BEGINNING OF COOPERATION SO THAT WAY WE
9 CAN BUILD OURSELVES INTO RAILROADING THAT IS NOT ONLY RELEVANT
10 TO THE FUTURE BUT GREAT AND LEGENDARY. THANK YOU.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO OTHER ATTENDEES
13 THAT WISHES TO SPEAK. AND I SEE NO PANELISTS. IS THAT CORRECT?

14

15 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** CHAIR HAGGERTY, I CAN JUST ASK SOMETHING
16 BEFORE WE VOTE ON THIS?

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YES YOU MAY, COMMISSIONER.

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** JOSEFOWITZ I WOULD REALLY LIKE STAFF TO
21 ENGAGE WITH THE DIRIDON AGENCIES TO SEE IF OTHER -- IF BART,
22 CAPITAL CORRIDOR AND ACE CAN BE INCLUDED IN THE DECISION
23 MAKING INFRASTRUCTURE AROUND DEVELOPMENT AND OPERATION AND
24 REPORT BACK TO US. YOU KNOW, IN THE COMING MONTHS, ON THAT.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IS THAT AN AMENDMENT TO YOUR MOTION?

2

3 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT IS AN AMENDMENT TO MY MOTION.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WHO IS THE SECOND ON THIS ITEM?

6 APPROXIMATE.

7

8 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** BRUINS. SO YOU ARE ASKING -- APPROVING THIS
9 COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT, AND YOU'RE ASKING MTC TO TAKE IT TO THE
10 BODY TO CONSIDER WHETHER OR NOT TO CHANGE THE MEMBERSHIP? IS
11 THAT WHAT I'M HEARING?

12

13 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

14

15 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** SO IT'S JUST FOR CONSIDERATION?

16

17 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES, SORT OF TO DISCUSS WITH THEM THAT
18 OPPORTUNITY AND THEN BRING IT BACK TO US WITH A -- ON THE
19 RESULTS OF THOSE DISCUSSIONS.

20

21 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** GIVEN THAT THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT MAYOR
22 LICCARDO WAS GOING TO DO I SECOND THAT FRIENDLY AMENDMENT.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND ON OUR AMENDMENT OF
25 7A. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES
3 UNANIMOUSLY.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU JOSEFOWITZ. ITEM
6 7B.

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** 7B MTC RESOLUTION REVISED CORONAVIRUS
9 AID RECEIVE AND ECONOMIC CARES ACT EMERGENCY TRANSIT
10 ASSISTANCE PROGRAMMING PROGRAMS APPROXIMATELY \$508 MILLION OF
11 FTA FUNDS OF CARES ACT FUNDING IN RESPONSE TO THE COVID-19
12 PANDEMIC ONE PERCENT REGIONAL TRANSIT PROGRAM WILL FUND
13 EXPANSION OF CLIPPER START MEANS-BASED PROGRAMS OF OPERATORS
14 IN THE REGION I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4420 REVISED.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DO I HAVE A SECOND TO THIS?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SECOND. SPERING SECOND.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING. I --

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR HAGGERTY, ARE YOU STILL ON?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** HE'S MUTED.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR HAGGERTY? I THINK HE'S WORKING THROUGH
2 IT. SO. ALL RIGHT. YOU KNOW, LET ME JUMP IN. WE HAD A FIRST
3 AND SECOND.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** QUESTION, MR. VICE CHAIR.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR:** GIVE ME ONE SECOND. COMMISSIONER
8 PAPAN.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** WITH RESPECT TO CLIPPER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
11 HAD REPORTED OUT ON COVID-19, IS THAT PART OF THIS OR WILL
12 THAT BE ADDRESSED LATER?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIR, THIS IS JIM SPERING WE ARE GOING
15 TO REQUEST THE TRANSIT OPERATORS REPORT TO THE COMMISSION
16 EVERY MEETING. IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THEY'RE RECEPTIVE TO
17 THAT, AND THAT'S OUR GOAL.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M BACK. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, DID
22 YOU WANT TO SAY SOMETHING? SAM?

23

24 **SAM LICCARDO:** FORGIVE ME. I WAS ON MUTE. THANK YOU. I
25 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY HERE. I HAVE HAD SOME CONVERSATIONS



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 WITH SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS TRYING TO ABIDE BY THE BROWN ACT.
2 WAS NOT ABLE TO SPEAK TO ALL. BUT I WANTED TO PROPOSE AN
3 AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION. AND, FORGIVE ME I'M GOING TO TAKE
4 MYSELF OFF VIDEO FOR A MOMENT SO I CAN READ THE MEMO. --SORRY
5 WE -- AMENDMENT, RATHER. THAT IS -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] SO
6 EVERYONE IS AWARE, BEFORE I ACTUALLY READ THE MOTION FOR THE
7 COMMITTEE DEBATE, THERE WAS SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF DISCUSSION
8 ABOUT THE -- THERE HAD BEEN VERY CLEAR STATEMENTS FROM STAFF,
9 DURING PHASE ONE, THAT ESSENTIALLY THE DISCREPANCY BETWEEN
10 PROJECTIONS FOR LOSSES, FOR EXAMPLE, OF SALES TAX DOLLARS OR
11 RIDERSHIP DOLLARS, WOULD BE ANY PROJECTIONS THAT DID NOT MEET
12 THE ACTUAL DATA WOULD BE TRUED UP, IN A SUBSEQUENT PHASE. NOW,
13 THROUGH NO ONE'S FAULT WE'RE NOW AT PHASE TWO, AND THERE
14 REALLY IS NO TRUEING UP, BECAUSE THE DATA IS NOT YET
15 AVAILABLE. AND IT WON'T BE FOR A MONTH OR TWO. AND SO, I WOULD
16 ASK, IF THE MAKER OF THE MOTION WOULD ACCEPT A FRIENDLY
17 AMENDMENT TO INCLUDE A CONDITION THAT THERE WOULD BE A TRUE UP
18 OF ANY NEGATIVE DIFFERENTIAL BETWEEN PROJECTED AND ACTUAL
19 SALES TAX AND/OR FARE REVENUES WITH ANY FUTURE ALLOCATION OF
20 FEDERAL DOLLARS FOR PAN -- PANDEMIC ECONOMIC RELIEF FOR
21 PERIODS OF MARCH TO SEPTEMBER 2020 OR WHATEVER APPROPRIATE
22 TIME PERIOD FOR TURTLE AVAILABLE DATA, NOW IN THE EVENT ANY
23 TRANSIT OPERATOR RECEIVED LESS THAN THEIR ADJUSTED SHARE CARES
24 ACT FUNDING DUE TO INACCURATE FORECAST SUCH DIFFERENTIALS
25 WOULD BE COMPENSATED WITH A FUTURE ALLOCATION OF EMERGENCY



Meeting Transcript

1 FUNDING AND IF CONGRESS FAILS TO APPROPRIATE ADDITIONAL
2 DOLLARS MTC STAFF SHALL FIND IDENTIFIABLE SOURCES OF FLEXIBLE
3 FUNDING THAT CAN ACCOMMODATE OPERATORS FOR SHORT FALLS. THAT
4 WOULD BE MY REQUESTED AMENDMENT FOR COMMISSIONER.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, ARE YOU IN
7 AGREEMENT WITH THAT?

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, YOU
10 PUTTING THIS FORWARD, AND I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE,
11 EXCEPT, WE -- I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY RUN THIS PAST SFMTA
12 BEFOREHAND, AND I THINK THERE IS CONCERNS ABOUT THE TRUE
13 UPCOMING OUT OF EXISTING FEDERAL FUNDS, RATHER THAN NEW
14 FEDERAL FUND. BECAUSE THOSE ARE FUND THAT OPERATORS ARE
15 CURRENTLY COUNTING ON FOR THEIR OPERATIONS. AND SO I DON'T --
16 I DON'T WANT TO BE DIFFICULT ABOUT T BUT IF -- WOULD YOU BE
17 POTENTIALLY OPEN TO JUST HAVING THIS COME OUT OF FUTURE
18 FEDERAL FUNDS? IS THAT LAST SENTENCE?

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** COMMISSIONER THE SENTENCE SPECIFICALLY STATES
21 OTHER SOURCES FUNDING -- IT WOULDN'T BE RELYING UPON IT AS
22 EXAMPLE OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I'M NOT SURE THAT WAS A DETAIL
23 THAT YOU MAY HAVE NOTICED.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COULD YOU GIVE ME AN EXAMPLE OF THE
2 FLEXIBLE FEDERAL -- SO THIS WOULD BE SORT OF, JUST MAYBE I
3 COULD GET AN EXAMPLE OF THAT?

4

5 **SAM LICCARDO:** I COULD CERTAINLY CONJECTURE AND IMAGINE, I RAN
6 THIS LANGUAGE AROUND MTC STAFF, LET'S IMAGINE WE HAVE, IN
7 JANUARY OF NEXT YEAR WHO RECOGNIZE THE SEVERE SHORTFALLS THAT
8 MANY AGENCIES ARE SUFFERING AND DECIDED INDEPENDENT OF COVID
9 THAT THERE SHOULD BE SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDING THAT WOULD BE
10 MADE AVAILABLE, THAT MIGHT BE SUCH IN ALLOCATION. BUT
11 CERTAINLY, I KNOW MTC STAFF HAD A CHANCE TO REVIEW THIS AND
12 THEY MAY HAVE SPECIFIC IDEAS AS WELL.

13

14 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WELL, I HAVE NO PROBLEM WITH ANY NEW
15 FEDERAL FUNDING THAT COMES DOWN THE -- THAT COULD COME DOWN,
16 THAT WE COULD RECEIVE, I THINK THERE WAS JUST CONCERN BY SFMTA
17 AROUND USING EXISTING FEDERAL FUNDING WHETHER IT'S FORMULA OR
18 DOLLARS BEING USED TO SUPPORT CAPITAL PROGRAMS.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NICK, ARE YOU, AS MAKER OF THE MOTION,
21 ARE YOU OKAY WITH ACCEPTING THE FRIENDLY AMENDMENT WITH THE
22 CAVEAT THAT IT BE NEW FEDERAL FUNDING?

23

24 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I AM, YES.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TO THE SECONDER OF THE MOTION, I
2 BELIEVE IT WAS SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES, I AM VERY SUPPORTIVE. I THINK THIS IS
5 GOING TO ADDRESS AN ISSUE WE HAVE BEEN STRUGGLING WITH, WITH
6 FAIRNESS AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS. YES MR. CHAIR, I
7 SUPPORT IT.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SAM ARE YOU OKAY WITH THE WORDING THE
10 WAY IT WAS JUST SAID?

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES. I WOULD PREFER THAT IT WAS SOMETHING THAT
13 WAS A BIT BROADER, BUT IN THE SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION, AS YOU
14 ALL CAN TELL, I'M TRYING TO BRIDGE WHAT HAS BEEN A PAINFUL
15 DIVIDE FOR THOSE OF US DOWN IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, WE HAVE
16 CALLS FROM DIFFERENT MPOS AND SO FORTH AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
17 AN END PUT TO THAT SOMEHOW. SO I HOPE THIS WILL BE READ
18 BROADLY BY ALL OF OUR COLLEAGUES TO ENSURE THAT WE GET THE
19 JUST RESULT THEY THINK WE INTEND.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

22

23 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I HAD A QUESTION ON THE SAME AREA NOW THAT YOU
24 HAVE DONE A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION, I HAD CONCERN
25 WITH HOW IT WAS WORDED AND WOULD FEEL COMFORTABLE REPLACING



Meeting Transcript

1 FLEXIBLE WITH DISCRETIONARY FUNDING I THINK THAT IT WOULD MAKE
2 IT CLEARER, IF WE HAVE DISCRETIONARY FUNDING AND IT WOULD BE
3 CLEARER AND I DON'T LIKE MTC "SHALL IDENTIFY" THEY'RE GOING TO
4 ATTEMPT TO IDENTIFY SOURCES OF DISCRETIONARY FUNDING, I CAN
5 SUPPORT THAT. I AM NOT SURE I CAN SUPPORT THE AMENDED MOTION.
6 BUT I LIKE WHERE SAM WAS TRYING TO GO WITH DISCRETIONARY FUNDS
7 WOULD BE CONSIDERED AND ADDITIONALLY ANY BRAND-NEW FUNDS.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU. COMMISSIONER CORTESE?

10

11 **DAVID CORTESE:** I JUST WANTED TO INDICATE I AM PREPARED TO
12 SUPPORT THE MOTION. AND I APPRECIATE THE EFFORT BY
13 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO TO GET SOMETHING ON THE TABLE HERE THAT
14 BRINGS WHAT APPEARS TO BE MORE EQUITY AND FAIRNESS TO SOME OF
15 THE OPERATORS, OBVIOUSLY SALES TAX DEPENDENT OPERATORS LIKE
16 VTA. I WANT TO SAY MY VOTE ON THIS ISSUE IS CONSISTENT WITH MY
17 COMMENTS ON THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE WHERE I
18 EXPRESSED SOME SERIOUS CONCERNS ABOUT THE WAY THINGS WERE,
19 UNDERSTANDING THAT THIS IS A VERY LIMITED BUCKET OF MONEY THAT
20 WE'RE DEALING WITH IN THE FIRST PLACE. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.
21 I JUST WANTED TO EXPLAIN MY VOTE ON THE MOTION. NOW THERE IS A
22 SECOND TO THE AMENDED MOTION. THANK YOU.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CORTESE. I
25 HAVE NO OTHER COMMISSIONERS THAT WISH TO SPEAK. WE HAVE A



Meeting Transcript

1 PLETHORA OF ATTENDEES THAT WISH TO SPEAK. AND WHAT I WOULD
2 LIKE TO DO, KIMBERLY, IS WE'RE GOING TO GO WITH A TWO MINUTE
3 TIME LIMIT ON THESE SPEAKERS. AND WE'RE UP TO 22, NOW, SO IF
4 YOU WANT TO JUST AGREE WITH SOMEBODY, YOU CAN JUST AGREE,
5 WHICH WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. IF NOT, WE HAVE 44 MINUTES OF
6 PUBLIC COMMENT RIGHT NOW. SO GO AHEAD.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR, THERE WERE 41 WRITTEN PUBLIC
9 COMMENTS RECEIVED. DO YOU WANT ME TO READ THOSE IN NOW? OR
10 WOULD YOU LIKE TO HEAR FROM THE ATTENDEES FIRST?

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WHEN YOU HAVE THE FLOOR KIMBERLY, YOU
13 MAY DO WHAT YOU LIKE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. 41 LETTERS RECEIVED
16 FROM THE FIRST IS FROM AMELIA CHIU, THEN RICHARD CONDA OF
17 ASIAN LAW ALLIANCE. DEREK AMAYA OF APPROPRIATED STUDENTS
18 UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BART TRANSIT OPERATORS, SHARON
19 BUSKA, BOB BROWNSTEIN, SUSAN GRAHAM, DON L OF CANCER CARE
20 POINT. DON, CANCER FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING OF THE DON, CITY OF
21 FREMONT. DIANE HOWARD MAYOR OF CITY OF REDWOOD CITY MAYA
22 ESPARZA CITY OF SAN JOSE, LISA GILLMOR MAYOR OF -- CITY OF
23 SANTA CLARA, PHILOP VU, OF COMMUNITY HEALTH PARTNERSHIP, DREAM
24 CORE GREEN FOR ALL ARE F. JOLENE SMITH OF FIRST FIVE OF SANTA
25 CLARA COUNTY. TARA HAMILTON, JENNIFER, KEVIN MA. LEELA LAMB,



Meeting Transcript

1 ALLISON BREUNER OF LAW FOUNDATION OF SILICON VALLEY. SYLVIA
2 LEON. ERIN MORRO. LINDA HUTCHENS KNOLLS FROM MOTHERS -- SOUTH
3 BAY. OLIVIA TU, CHRISTINA F. JULIAN PRIMO, RYAN GALLAGER OF
4 PUBLIC AUTHORITY SERVICES, JENNIFER RAMOS, JAMES LEE OF
5 RICHMOND CHAMBER OF COMMERCE. ROSE LINDA RODRIGUEZ, CONNIE
6 ROGERS, DR. MARY MONTALVO OF SANTA CLARA VALLEY MEDICAL
7 CENTER, DAVID GRADY OF STATE COUNCIL ON DEVELOPMENTAL
8 DISABILITIES, DARYL IBARRA OF UPLIFT FAMILY SERVICES,
9 VIETNAMESE AMERICAN PROFESSIONAL WOMEN'S ASSOCIATION OF
10 SILICON VALLEY, AND LORRAINE BILLER. AND THE FIRST CALLER OR
11 MEMBER EFFORT PUBLIC, MIKE HURSH, IF YOU ARE THERE, PLEASE
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH GOOD MORNING CHAIR HAGGERTY
15 AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION MY NAME IS MICHAEL HURSCH. THIS
16 MORNING I HAVE BEEN MEETING WITH SEVERAL COLLABORATORS WHO
17 HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH MTC STAFF, YOU SHOULD HAVE A LETTER IN
18 YOUR PACKET WHICH IS SIGNED BY 20 PUBLIC TRANSIT GENERAL
19 MANAGERS URGING APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THIS IS A
20 TIME OF UNPRECEDENT THE CHALLENGES FOR EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY AS
21 WE ALL STRUGGLE TO SUPPORT OUR RIDERS PRESERVE AND PROTECT OUR
22 EMPLOYMENT BASE. RECOMMENDED RECOMMENDATION BEFORE YOU MAKES
23 IMPORTANT AND THOUGHTFUL RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON EQUITY THAT
24 REFLECT THE FOCUS THAT WE MUST HAVE ON SERVING THE MOST
25 VULNERABLE MEMBERS OF OUR RIDER COMMUNITIES. MTC STAFF DID A



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 REMARKABLE JOB BALANCING SETS OF DATA TO FASHION THE ADOPTED
2 RECOMMENDATION. IT STRIKES A GOOD BALANCE AND IT IS CRITICAL
3 FOR OF AGENCY THAT ALL THE FUNDS BE DISTRIBUTED AS QUICKLY AS
4 POSSIBLE. I WANT TO UNDERScore THAT UNLESS ADDITIONAL REVENUES
5 CAN BE SECURED SOME OF OUR SYSTEMS WILL ONCE AGAIN FACE
6 CRITICAL SHORTFALLS SOME MORE QUICKLY THAN OTHERS. TRANSIT
7 OPERATORS ARE ALL COMMITTED TO MESH THE SAFETY OF RIDERS, OF
8 OUR FRONTLINE HEROIC EMPLOYEES AND ARE WORKING TO ADAPT BAY
9 AREA TRANSIT HEALTH AND SAFETY PLAN. WE LOOK FORWARD TO
10 CONTINUING OUR WORK TOGETHER INCLUDING JOINTLY PURR SUING
11 FINANCIAL RELIEF FROM BOTH STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IT IS
12 ESTIMATED THAT CALIFORNIA ALONE WILL NEED ADDITIONAL 3.1
13 BILLION WITH A B TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT SYSTEMS STATEWIDE YOUR
14 ACTION TODAY IS A CRITICAL STEP FORWARD I RESPECTFULLY REQUEST
15 YOUR YES VOTE ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME, JAMES LINDSAY, PLEASE UNMUTE
18 YOURSELF.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES. THANK YOU. CHAIR HAGGERTY, AS A BLUE RIBBON
21 COMMISSION MEMBER THAT VOTED NO ON ITEM 5A I WAS TOLD I WOULD
22 HAVE MORE TIME THAN THE ALLOTTED TIME, IS THAT TRUE OR NOT
23 TRUE?

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, NO. EVERYBODY
2 GETS TWO MINUTES. I APOLOGIZE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SIR. AS MOST OF YOU MAY NO, I VOTED NO ON
5 THIS ITEM AND I WANT TO GIVE RELEVANT BACKGROUND ON WHY. I
6 REPRESENT 13,000 HARDWORKING FRONTLINE MEMBERS THROUGHOUT THE
7 STATE OF CALIFORNIA BETWEEN EARLY MARCH WHEN THE QUARANTINE
8 BEGAN UP TO MID-JUNE WE HAD SEVEN MEMBERS CONFIRM POSITIVE
9 WITH COVID-19. WE BELIEVE FROM DRIVING THEIR BUSES BUT SINCE
10 THEN OUR MEMBERS HAVE BEEN HIT WITH OVER 80 POSITIVE TESTS IN
11 CALIFORNIA. WHAT DO THESE NUMBERS TELL US? NOT ENOUGH HAS BEEN
12 DONE TO PROTECT OUR OPERATORS. IT COMES DOWN TO SAFETY
13 MEASURES. WHEN MEMBER TRANSIT DISTRICTS WITHIN MTC HAVE THEIR
14 OWN SAFETY STANDARDS, OFTEN VARYING FROM DISTRICT TO DISTRICT,
15 THIS IS UNACCEPTABLE AND FRANKLY A RECIPE FOR LOOKS UNHEALTHY
16 WORKING CONDITIONS. WE BELIEVE THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA SAFETY
17 REGULATION SHOULD BE THE STARTING POINT FOR SAFETY WHICH ARE
18 THE CDC LEVELS OF EFFECTIVENESS AND CERTAINLY BETTER THAN
19 THOSE OF INDIVIDUAL DISTRICTS OR APTA. IF OUR MEMBERS LEAD
20 SAFETY STANDARDS TO INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND ONE FAILS
21 THEY ALL FAIL EVEN WORSE TRANSIT DISTRICTS THINK THEY CAN
22 PROVIDE SAFETY STANDARDS BY THEMSELVES HOWEVER BACK IN MARCH
23 AT THE BEGINNING OF THIS HEALTH CRISIS NO AGENCY NOT ONE OF
24 THEM CAME TO THE ATU AND CALLED FOR FACE MASKS, GLOVES, HAND
25 SANITIZER OR ANY OTHER SAFETY MEASURES FOR OUR OPERATORS. IT



Meeting Transcript

1 WAS OUR UNION THAT IT DEMANDED THESE BASIC ESSENTIAL SAFETY
2 GEAR BE PROVIDED. I WOULD JUST TELL YOU THAT RIGHT NOW, WE
3 CURRENTLY HAVE TRANSIT DISTRICTS THAT ARE LOOK TO ALREADY
4 SHRINK IN THE SAFETY STANDARDS THAT HAVE BEEN MET GOING FROM
5 THREE-FOOT DISTANCING TO SIX FOOT DISTANCING AND THIS IS GOING
6 TO BE DISASTER ROUSE FOR EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA I WOULD ASK
7 FOR CARES FUNDING SET ASIDE TO FUND AND MTC TO HAVE OVERSIGHT
8 --

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WRAP UP PLEASE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES, SIR IN THIS MOTION THERE IS ONE PERCENT FOR
13 CLIPPER THAT COULD BE USE FOR CARES SET OF FUNDS. THANK YOU
14 FOR LISTENING. CONGRATULATIONS CHAIR HAGGERTY ON YOUR AWARD.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. LINDSAY.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS YVONNE WILLIAMS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER I'M YVONNE WILLIAMS PRESIDENTS
21 OF THE AMALGAMATED TRANSIT. APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY SPEAK
22 BEFORE YOU TODAY WHAT I CONSIDER TO BE IMPORTANT FOR BOTH
23 LOCAL 192 AND MASS TRANSIT DEPENDENT PUBLIC BUT I WANT TO
24 FOCUS ON PARATRANSIT. THIS STILL UNCHECKED CORONAVIRUS
25 PANDEMIC IS WREAKING HAVOC ON THE GENERAL PUBLIC. BEYOND THE



Meeting Transcript

1 OBVIOUS HEALTH CONCERN TO WEAR A FACE MASK IS PUBLIC IT IS
2 ALSO SIMPLY COMMON SENSE THAT SUPPORTS THIS REQUIREMENT. IT IS
3 UNDERSTANDABLE THAT MTC MEMBER AGENCIES AND THEIR OPERATORS
4 WANT OUR OPERATORS TO WEAR THE FACIAL COVERINGS, WE UNDERSTAND
5 THAT. IT IS IMPOSSIBLE TO ARGUE WITH THE SENSIBILITY OF THAT
6 POLICY OF OUR EMPLOYERS. FURTHER, IF AGENCIES SEEK TO ENFORCE
7 THIS MANDATE THROUGH PROGRESSIVE DISCIPLINE IT WILL BE HARD
8 FOR US TO OBJECT TO THAT ALSO. WHAT WE DO OBJECT TO, HOWEVER,
9 AND MOST STRENUOUSLY IS AN UNFAIR DISCIPLINARY POLICY, ATU
10 LOCAL 192 FIRMLY BELIEVES THAT RIDERS WHO REFUSE TO WEAR FACE
11 MASKS RECEIVE SOME SORT OF PUNISHMENT AND NOT JUST A SLAP ON
12 THE WRIST, AFTER ALL THEY ENDANGER THEMSELVES, OTHER RIDERS
13 AND OUR OPERATORS. OUR OPERATORS HAVE ENOUGH TO CONTEND WITH
14 WITHOUT BEING ASKED TO ENFORCE THIS SENSIBLE POLICY. THEY ARE
15 TRANSIT DRIVERS AND NOT POLICE MEN. I WANT TO REITERATE
16 SOMETHING ABOUT PARATRANSIT BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT SOME
17 PARATRANSIT RIDERS CANNOT WEAR FACE COVERINGS, THEREFORE
18 PARATRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS ARE AT MOST RISK FOR EXPOSURE
19 TO COVID-19 AND BLOOD BORN PATHOGENS YET IF YOU ASK OUR
20 DRIVERS, THEY WILL TELL YOU THAT PPE ARE NOT CONSISTENTLY
21 AVAILABLE TO THEM. IN ADDITION GLOVES, MASKS, SANITIZER AND
22 WIPES, PARATRANSIT WORKERS MUST BE PROVIDED WITH TYVEX -- VEK
23 TYPE OF COVERINGS, COVER-UPS TO WEAR WHEN COMING INTO CLOSE
24 CONTACT WITH PASSENGERS FOR THE HEALTH AND SAFETY OF THE
25 RIDERS.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CAN YOU WRAP UP PLEASE?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S IT.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WE GOT TO GET BETTER AT THIS
7 TWO MINUTE TIME LIMIT. OKAY NEXT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHONITA.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. IT'S CHONITA CHEW, REPRESENTING ALAMEDA COUNTY,
12 REPRESENTING SENIOR RIDERS OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. PROPOSED 33.8
13 MILLION BEING PROPOSED FOR MTC TO ALLOCATE TO AC TRANSIT WILL
14 PROVIDE A LIFELINE TO THE SERVICE THAT WILL HELP SUSTAIN THE
15 SERVICE FOR THE FORESEEABLE FUTURE. THIS WILL HELP PRESERVE A
16 LEVEL OF SERVICE THAT SO MANY SENIORS RELY ON TO KEEP GOING --
17 TO KEEP OUR LOCAL ECONOMY GOING. THESE FUNDS ARE CRITICAL TO
18 KEEP SERVICES RUNNING. 75 PERCENT OF OUR PEOPLE OF COLOR AND
19 43 PERCENT OF THEM DO NOT DRIVE. SO IT WOULD BE KIND OF CRUEL
20 TO CUT BACK ON SERVICES FOR THE SENIOR'S COMMUNITY HERE.
21 SENIORS REPRESENT A LARGE PORTION OF THE AC TRANSIT RIDERSHIP.
22 SO I'M JUST HOPING THAT WE CAN GET THESE FUNDS, AND GET IT
23 GOING. FUND WILL ALLOW THEM TO CONTINUE TO SERVING FOR AC
24 TRANSIT TO SERVE THE SENIORS. THANK YOU.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SHANE
2 WEINSTEIN.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY NAME IS SHANE WEINSTEIN
5 PRESIDENT OF ATU LOCAL 5875 REPRESENTING THE BRAVE MEN AND
6 WOMEN THAT OPERATOR GOLDEN GATE BUSES THANK YOU FOR THE
7 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK TODAY WE HAVE HEARD DISCUSSION AND
8 COMMENTS CONCERNING ABSOLUTE NECESSITY OF BUS OPERATOR SAFETY
9 AND PUBLIC SAFETY ESPECIALLY WHILE RIDING BUSSES AND TRAINS ON
10 BEHALF OF THE MEMBERS OF ATU 1575 I WANT LIKE TO BRING A
11 MATTER OF HEALTH AND SAFETY TO YOUR ATTENTION WE BELIEVE HAND
12 SANITIZES FOR EVERYONE WHO GETS ON A BUS OR TRAIN RIDERS WHEN
13 BOARDING SHOULD BE PROVIDED USE OF SUCH SANITIZER. IT WOULD
14 ALLOW DISTRICTS TO MANDATE SANITIZER USE ON ALL VEHICLES THIS
15 MAY SEEM LIKE A SMALL ITEM AND SURELY IT WILL NOT COST THE
16 AGENCIES A LOT OF MONEY BUT IT'S AN IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION
17 ALONG WITH FACE MASKS HAND SANITIZER PROVIDE FIRST LINE OF
18 DEFENSE AGAINST THE DEADLY AND INVISIBLE CORONAVIRUS AND LIVES
19 ARE AT STAKE HERE AND THE RELATIVE INEXPENSIVE EXPENSE WILL
20 HELP CONTROL THIS MENACE. IT WOULD BE A MORAL BOOSTER BOTH FOR
21 OPERATORS AND RIDING PUBLIC TO SERVE, SANITIZER AVAILABILITY
22 WOULD SHOW THE PUBLIC, TRANSIT AGENCIES CARE ABOUT THEIR
23 HEALTH AND SAFETY AND WOULD DEMONSTRATE TO THE MEMBERS YOU
24 CARE ABOUT US YOUR HARDWORKING EMPLOYEES. IN ADDITION HAND
25 SANITIZER, DEPARTMENT SANITIZE AFTER EVERY OPERATOR SHIP AS



Meeting Transcript

1 REQUIRED. JUST RECENTLY I WAS TOLD SOMEONE'S FATHER, MOTHER
2 AND BROTHER CONTRACTED COVID-19 FATHER AND MOTHER WERE ON THE
3 BRINK EVER DEATH IT'S PARENT WE SEND ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS
4 HOME SAFELY TO THEIR FAMILIES. THANK YOU FOR LISTENING AND FOR
5 CONSIDERING HOW SUCH A SMALL OFFER COULD HELP THE BAY AREA
6 TRANSIT OPERATORS AND RIDERS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MARY LYNN LAMPY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** IS MY AUDIO OKAY?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HI MARY LANDY, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF GENESIS. I AM A
15 PARENT OF A TEEN WHO TAKES AC TRANSIT AND BART TO SCHOOL WHEN
16 THERE IS SCHOOL GENESIS REPRESENTS MANY WHO RELY ON TRANSIT AS
17 THEY ARE CORE ESSENTIAL WORKERS. FIRST OF ALL WE WANT TO SAY
18 THAT WE SUPPORT JAMES LINDSAY AND ALL OF ATU AND WORKERS RIGHT
19 NOW. THIS IS AN EMERGENCY. TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS AND
20 THOSE WHO CARE ABOUT THEM ASK YOU TO COMMITMENT TO STRONG
21 STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS. TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS NEED
22 THE OPPORTUNITY TO EXAMINE AND COMMENT ON STRONG SPECIFIC
23 STANDARDS IN ADVANCE OF THE AUGUST MTC MEETING. WE INVITE YOU
24 TO CONSIDER THIS BECAUSE IT WILL GIVE THE FIRST COMPLIANCE
25 REPORT FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO BE RELEASED SOONER RATHER



Meeting Transcript

1 THAN AT THE END OF AUGUST. THIS MATTERS TO ME BECAUSE I WANT
2 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE PROTECT THE HEALTH OF WORKERS, RIDERS AND
3 ALL PEOPLE WHO COME INTO CONTACT WITH THESE ESSENTIAL WORKERS
4 THANK YOU, AND THANK YOU TO THE TRANSIT SYSTEMS WHO PROVE THAT
5 WE ARE TRULY INTERCONNECTED.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ERIN MORRO.
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME 12347.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I CAN HEAR YOU.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. I
15 BELIEVE PARATRANSIT IS THE MOST UNDERSERVED POPULATION IN THE
16 NINE BAY AREA REGION. I BELIEVE THAT LOOK AT THE CHART THAT
17 VTA GETTING \$66 MILLION FOR THEIR NEEDS TO PROVIDE SERVICE,
18 SOME OF THAT HAS GOT TO BE PARATRANSIT FUNDING. THEY STILL
19 HAVE TO PAY FOR PARATRANSIT. I NEVER LIKED THE FEDERAL FUNDING
20 GUIDELINES, OR THE METHODOLOGY. I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE
21 CHANGED. THIS IS A VERY SMALL POT OF MONEY. AT THE END OF THE
22 DAY WHEN THIS MONEY DRIES UP, YOU KNOW, THE NEXT THING ON THE
23 TABLE, AND I LOVE ATU, THEY'RE A FANTASTIC PEOPLE THAT DRIVE
24 OUR BUSES, BUT BIG-TIME LAYOFFS ARE COMING. SO I DON'T KNOW.



Meeting Transcript

1 BUT I THINK PARATRANSIT AND THEM BEING SAFE AND IT BEING CLEAN
2 IS VERY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS EUGENE BRADLEY.
5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. NEXT SPEAKER IS BONNIE LOCKHART.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, I CAN HEAR YOU.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. I KNOW YOU ALL HAVE A LOT ON YOUR PLATE BUT I
12 WANT YOU TO HEAR WHAT MARY SAID AND REITERATE WHAT JAMES L
13 SAID, BUT THIS IS AN EMERGENCY THERE ARE A THOUSAND CASES IN
14 THE NINE COUNTY AREA TODAY. MULTIPLE THAT BY 30 AND YOU CAN
15 SEE HOW MANY CASES WE'RE DEALING WITH. WE NEED A COMMITMENT
16 TODAY TO RELEASE THOSE STRONG SPECIFIC STANDARDS IN TWO WEEKS
17 A MONTH IS WAY TOO LONG INTO AUGUST. WE NEED THOSE RELEASED SO
18 WE CAN COMMENT ON THEM AND THE PUBLIC CAN COMMENT ON THEM
19 BEFORE YOUR AUGUST MEETING AND WE NEED TO HAVE REPORTS ON
20 COMPLIANCE BY THE END OF AUGUST. THIS IS AN EMERGENCY AND WE
21 ALL SEE THE LOVELY SIGNS THANKING OUR ESSENTIAL WORKERS THIS
22 IS THE WAY TO THANK OUR ESSENTIAL WORKERS TO PUT STRONG
23 STANDARDS INTO PLACE SO WE KNOW THEY HAVE THE STANDARDS THEY
24 NEED AND WE CAN CHECK UP AND MAKE SURE THEY'RE HAPPENING AND
25 DEAL WITH THE FAILURES TO MAKE THEM HAPPEN. SO PLEASE GET



Meeting Transcript

1 THOSE STANDARDS, MAKE A COMMITMENT TODAY TO HAVE THOSE
2 STANDARDS WRITTEN OUT SO WE CAN COMMENT THEM IN TWO WEEKS.
3 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MARCIA LOVE
6 LAS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MARCIA LOVELACE GENESIS COALITION IN EAST
9 BAY AND TRI-VALLEY AND ALSO WANTING TO SUPPORT JAMES LINDSAY,
10 AND REITERATE THE EMERGENCY THAT WE'RE FACING AND IS YOU TO
11 HAVE THOSE SPECIFIC STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS SO THAT WE CAN
12 COMMENT IN ADVANCE OF YOUR AUGUST MEETING, AND THAT THE
13 COMPLIANCE REPORT WILL BE RELEASED SOONER THAN THE END OF
14 AUGUST. I -- THIS IS IMPORTANT TO ME, BECAUSE THE PEOPLE WHO
15 DRIVE AND WORK FOR THE MASS TRANSIT AND THE RIDERS ARE
16 IMPORTANT TO ME. AND THE FUTURE OF MASS TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT
17 TO ME, BECAUSE RIDERS ARE NOT GOING TO TRUST THEIR OWN HEALTH
18 AND USE MASS TRANSIT IF THEY DON'T THINK IT'S SAFE SO THESE
19 STANDARDS ARE CRITICAL FOR THOSE ON THE FRONT LINES FOR THOSE
20 THAT ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT, AND FOR THE FUTURE OF MASS
21 TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS HALEY C.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** GOOD MORNING THIS IS HALEY C POLICY ADVOCACY
2 MANAGER AT REFORM AND VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
3 COMMISSION AND BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE. LAST MEETING
4 WAS SHORT OF SPECIFICS AND ASK WE ENSURE PUBLIC TRANSIT MEETS
5 STANDARDS DEVELOPED. I HEARD COMMISSIONER SPERING SAY THE
6 REVIEW WILL BE MADE PUBLIC IN THE NEXT 30 DAYS HOWEVER THAT IS
7 NOT ENOUGH TIME WHEN THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO APPROVE IT WE
8 NEED THE STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS SO WORKERS AND RIDERS HAVE
9 OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE MEANINGFUL FEEDBACK. CHART THAT WAS
10 CREATED TO SHOW WHAT EACH OPERATOR WAS DOING IN TERMS OF
11 HEALTH AND SAFETY WAS A GOOD START. AM AS HAS BEEN MENTIONED
12 THIS IS AN EMERGENCY INFECTION AND DEATH RATES ACROSS THE
13 STATE AND AMONGST DRIVERS ARE SKYROCKETING WE NEED TO MAINTAIN
14 STANDARDS CLEARLY AND IDENTIFY WHY THEY'RE NOT BEING MET. MOST
15 OPERATORS ARE NOT PROVIDING MASKS AND SANITIZERS INCLUDING
16 COALITIONS AT ATU PARTNERS HAVE BEEN ASKING FOR MONTHS WE HAVE
17 RECEIVED THOUSANDS OF PETITIONS AND LETTERS ASKING FOR THIS
18 AND WE SEE THIS IS NOT HAPPENING. I BELIEVE THE OPERATORS CARE
19 ABOUT WORKER RIDER SAVE THE. YOU CAN PLEASE EXPLAIN WHY MASKS
20 AND HAND SANITIZER ARE NOT BEING PROVIDED AND WHAT MTC IS
21 DOING TO OVERCOME BARRIERS TO THAT. FINALLY I HEARD FROM
22 COMMISSIONERS THAT PROGRESS ON THE REPORTS CAN YOU ENSURE THE
23 REPORT IS MONTHLY STARTING AUGUST AND GOING MONTH HE UNTIL THE
24 PANDEMIC IS OVER. CONSENT IS NOT SUFFICIENT. COMMISSIONERS



Meeting Transcript

1 MUST HEAR WHERE THE OPERATORS ARE ON THESE STANDARDS. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT CALLER IS RADICA GOEL.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS RADICA SUPERVISOR GOEL, I GO TO HIGH
7 SCHOOL IN CUPERTINO LIVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND AM 15 YEARS
8 OLD I AM WITH SILICON VALLEY YOUTH CLIMATE ACTION VTA IS
9 DEPENDENT ON LOCAL SALES TAX WHICH HAS TAKEN A HIT SINCE THE
10 START OF THE COVID PANDEMIC. I URGE STAFF TO CALCULATE CARES
11 FUNDING TO REFLECT OPTIMISTIC SALES TAX ASSUMPTIONS AS A
12 STUDENT I KNOW THAT MANY STUDENTS WHO GO TO MY HIGH SCHOOL ARE
13 DEPENDENT ON VTA BUS ROUTES WITHOUT VTA BUSES STUDENTS WOULD
14 HAVE TO BIKE WITH TERRIBLE WEATHER TO GET TO SCHOOL BECAUSE
15 THEY HAVE NO OTHER WAY TO GET TO SCHOOL. VTA IS IMPORTANT TO
16 ALL OF US STUDENTS AND WE'RE VERY DEPENDENT ON IT FOR
17 EDUCATION. FOR THESE REASONS I URGE THAT YOU RECONFIGURE THE
18 CALCULATIONS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME AND
19 CONSIDERATION.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOVANKA
22 BECKLES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI. I AM FORMER VICE MAYOR OF CITY COUNCIL RUNNING
25 FOR AC TRANSIT BOARD I STAND IN SOLIDARITY WITH TRANSIT



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 WORKERS AND THE RIDERS AND ASK THAT YOU HONOR THE REQUEST OF
2 THOSE ON THE FRONTLINE FOR THREE MONTHS NOW THE PEOPLE WHO
3 OPERATE AND RIDE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA HAVE BEEN COMING TO
4 YOU WITH A SINGLE -- SIMPLE REQUEST SET STRONG UNIFORM
5 STANDARDS TO PROTECT THE TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS ON ALL 27
6 TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN ALL NINE COUNTIES THOSE MOST VULNERABLE
7 SUCH AS ELDERLY WHO RELY ON PARATRANSIT NEED YOUR HELP IN
8 STAYING SAFE YET FOR THREE MONTHS LATER YOUR BLUE RIBBON TASK
9 FORCE HAS STILL NOT YET SET STRONG REGIONAL STANDARDS FOR MOST
10 THINGS OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES NEED TO DO TO MAKE TRANSIT SAFE
11 AND EVEN WHERE THERE ARE STANDARDS LIKE PROVIDING MASKS AND
12 HAND SANITIZER FOR RIDERS, MOST TRANSIT AGENCIES STILL AREN'T
13 MEETING THEM. MEANWHILE THERE HAS BEEN A SURGE EVER COVID
14 INFECTIONS IN THE BAY AREA. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ESSENTIAL
15 WORKERS HERE, AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE, AND THAT MEANS
16 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE LIVES OF BLACK AND BROWN WORKERS AND
17 RIDERS. OUR LIVES ARE AT GRAVE RISK FROM THIS PANDEMIC. WE
18 DON'T GET TO STAY -- MOST FOLKS DON'T GET A CHANCE TO STAY
19 HOME SAFELY IN THE COMFORT AND SAFETY OF A ZOOM SCREEN. SO, AS
20 ELECTED LEADERS, SITTING ON A REGIONAL BOARD, IT IS YOUR
21 RESPONSIBILITY TO TAKE IMMEDIATE ACTION TO PROTECT OUR LIVES
22 AND WE ASK, ONCE AGAIN, THAT YOU HONOR THOSE ON THE FRONT
23 LINES WHO KNOW WHAT THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT, AND ASKING FOR HELP
24 FROM YOU.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD MARK
2 ANTONIO.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONERS I'M RICHARD MARK ANTONIO WITH PUBLIC
5 ADVOCATES AND THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION.
6 FOR THREE MONTHS, AND COUNTING, THE PEOPLE WHO OPERATE AND
7 RIDE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA HAVE BEEN COMING TO YOU WITH A
8 SIMPLE REQUEST, SET STRONG UNIFORM STANDARDS TO PROTECT THE
9 TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS ACROSS THE REGION, REPORT ON
10 COMPLIANCE AND THEN TAKE ACTION TO FILL ANY GAPS. IN APRIL,
11 YOU IGNORED THE REQUEST, BUT IN MAY, MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS
12 AGREED THAT THE SAFETY OF TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS SHOULD BE
13 MTC'S FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS IN CONNECTION WITH THE
14 ALLOCATION OF THE REMAINING HALF BILLION DOLLARS IN CARES ACT
15 FUNDING. YOU ACKNOWLEDGED THAT AS THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
16 COORDINATING AGENCY. YOU ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS IS YOUR
17 RESPONSIBILITY. NOW THREE MONTHS HAVE GONE BY AND MTC HAS TILL
18 NOT SET THOSE STRONG REGIONAL STANDARDS, AND AS WAS JUST SAID
19 EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE AREN'T STANDARDS BEING MET MEANWHILE AS
20 COVID CASES SURGE IN THE BAY AREA WE NOW LEARN WE WON'T SEE A
21 COMPLETE PLAN FOR ANOTHER MONTH? THIS IS AN EMERGENCY AND MTC
22 MUST TREAT IT AS AN EMERGENCY. TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS NEED
23 TO YOU COMMIT TODAY TO RELEASE STRONG SPECIFIC REGIONAL
24 STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS, SO THAT WE CAN ALL COMMENT ON IT
25 IN ADVANCE OF OUR AUGUST MEETING AND MAKE SURE THAT ANY GAPS



Meeting Transcript

1 ARE ADDRESSED IMMEDIATELY, AND THAT WILL ALSO ALLOW THE FIRST
2 COMPLIANCE REPORT TO BE RELEASED SOONER THAN THE END OF
3 AUGUST. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RIA BIARRI.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY. I'M
8 RIYA AND I AM A RISING SOPHOMORE AT SPRINGS. I KNOW WITH
9 SILICON VALLEY CLIMATE YOUTH ACTION. DEFICIT OF \$200 MILLION
10 BY THE UPCOMING END OF FISCAL YEAR WHICH WOULD NEGATIVELY
11 IMPACT VULNERABLE POPULATIONS. I URGE STAFF TO RECON HAVING
12 CARES ACT FUNDING TO REFLECT CONSERVATIVE SALES TAX
13 ASSUMPTIONS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME AND
14 CONSIDERATION.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOE K. SIR, ARE
17 YOU THERE? NEXT SPEAKER IS EMILY WHEELER.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I CAN HEAR YOU.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER I'M WITH PUBLIC
24 ADVOCATES ASKING MTC FOR A STRONG PLAN FOR MTC PANDEMIC I'M
25 ASKING MTC TREAT THIS AS KNOW EMERGENCY IT IS TRANSIT WORKERS



Meeting Transcript

1 AND RIDERS NEED YOU TO MEET TODAY TO COMMIT TO STANDARDS SO WE
2 CAN COMMENT AT THE AUGUST MEETING AND MAKE SURE ANY GAPS ARE
3 ADDRESSED THAT WILL ALSO ALLOW FIRST COMPLIANCE REPORT TO BE
4 RELEASED SOONER THAN THE END OF AUGUST WHICH IS TRULY CRITICAL
5 AS CASES SHOOT UP AND DEATHS ARE ON THE RISE. THANK YOU SO
6 MUCH.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS HOAI TRUNG.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I LIVE IN SAN JOSE. I URGE MTC TO DIRECT STAFF TO USE
11 CONSERVATIVE SALES TAX ASSUMPTIONS TO CALCULATE THE SECOND
12 PAYMENT OF CARES ACT FUNDING. OVER 30 PERCENT OF BAY AREA
13 TRANSIT RIDERS ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS. ALMOST 80 PERCENT OF VTA
14 RIDERS ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR. 50 PERCENT ARE LOW INCOME, AND 80
15 PERCENT ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT. SOMEWHAT OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS
16 SACRIFICE THOSE WHO CAN LEAST AFFORD CUSTOM SERVICE. VTA WAS
17 OF THE ONLY TRANSIT AGENCY THAT DID NOT RECEIVE ENOUGH MONEY
18 IN THE FIRST CARES DISTRIBUTION WHERE EVERY OTHER AGENCY GOT
19 MORE THAN THEY NEEDED. SERVING HIGH LOW INCOME RIDERS THAN
20 BART AND CALTRAIN. AS WELL AS VITAL CLIMATE ACTION WE MUST
21 DISTRIBUTE FUNDING FAIRLY THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA IN
22 PARTICULAR TO MAINTAIN CRITICAL SAFETY STANDARDS. PLEASE USE A
23 CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTION TO CALCULATE CARES FUNDING. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ARTURO AGUILAR.



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ARTURO AGUILAR CHAIRMAN WITH THE
3 CALIFORNIA CONFERENCE BOARD WITH THE AMALGAMATED TRANSIT UNION
4 REPRESENTING 13,000 MEN AND WOMEN WHO SO PROUDLY HAVE SERVED
5 AND CONTINUE TO SERVE THE PUBLIC ALL OVER CALIFORNIA DURING
6 THIS PANDEMIC. TODAY WE ARE DISCUSSING THE WORKERS IN THE BAY
7 AREA, AND WHO ARE IN NEED OF YOUR SUPPORT FOR PPES. WE NEED
8 YOU, NOT ONLY TO PROTECT THE EMPLOYEES BUS, BUT ALSO IS MY
9 PASSENGERS WITH PPE SO WE CAN FIGHT THIS PANDEMIC YOU ARE
10 TAKING PRECAUTIONS BY HOLDING ZOOM MEETINGS AND SOCIAL
11 DISTANCING BUT OPERATORS OFTEN -- OPERATORS OFFICE IS ON THE
12 ROAD AND IN A TRAIN OR THE MAINTENANCE WORKERS IN THE SHOP. AS
13 OF TODAY UNFORTUNATELY ATU INTERNATIONALLY HAS LOST 80 MEMBERS
14 TO COVID-19. TOO MANY LIVES LOST. WHEN WILL YOU STAND UP FOR
15 YOUR MEMBERS AND EMPLOYEES. WE NEED MORE OVERSIGHT AND YOUR
16 MOTION DOES NOT DO THAT. WHAT WILL IT TAKE FOR YOU TO TAKE
17 ACTION. IF WE ARE TRULY HEROES THEN DON'T TREAT US LIKE ZEROS,
18 PLEASE PROTECT US AND CARVE OUT FIVE PERCENT OF THE BUDGET FOR
19 PPES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER WITH THE LAST FOUR
22 DIGITS OF 8575. HELLO CALLER.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME 12347 WE CAN.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING TO ALL I HOPE ALL IS WELL WITH YOU AND
4 YOUR FAMILIES. MY NAME IS MICHELLE GRAY PRESIDENT FOR LOCAL
5 1605. IN REFERRING TO MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER, AFTER TALKING
6 TO SEVERAL HEALTH OFFICERS ACROSS THE STATE NOT EVERY DISTRICT
7 IS VOLUNTARILY PROVIDING PPE EVEN BALKING IN THE FACE OF THE
8 DANGEROUS HEALTH CRISIS ON BEHALF OF ATU LOCAL 1605 I'M
9 CALLING ON MTC TO USE CARES ACT FUNDS FOR OPERATORS AND
10 PASSENGERS. MTC MUST PURCHASE IN BULK AND DISTRIBUTE TO
11 OPERATES TO PROVIDE MAYBE A REMEDY OF THESE SITUATIONS WHEN
12 PEOPLE SHOW UP ON THE BUS, OR TRANSPORTATION, WHATEVER, AND TO
13 BE ABLE TO PROVIDE THEM WITH A FACE MASK. NOT TO BE ENFORCERS
14 BUT TO ACT AS A FRONTLINE HEALTH CARE SUPPORTER, AS
15 DISTRIBUTORS. YOU KNOW, WE SERVE BRAVELY AND DILIGENTLY THE
16 TRANSIT DEPENDENT PUBLIC. WE DESERVE THE FULL SUPPORT OF OUR
17 EMPLOYERS WHEN IT COMES TO PERSONNEL SAFETY AND HEALTH. PUBLIC
18 AND OPERATORS SHOULD NOT FALL VICTIM TO UNCOVERED RIDERS WHO
19 KNOW BETTER. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT ALAN.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MEMBERS THIS IS BOB ALAN
24 URBAN HABITAT AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I'M GOING
25 TO ECHO COMMENTS HALEY CURRIER MADE THIS IS NOT A TYPICAL



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 PROCESS WHERE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT A TRANSPORTATION PROJECT OR
2 LONG RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLAN. THIS IS A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS
3 MANY OF YOU KNOW THAT YOU SIT ON COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
4 AND THAT MEANS ACTING IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF WEEKS TO GIVE THE
5 OPPORTUNITY TO EVALUATE THE ANALYSIS WHAT'S IN THE DRAFT PLAN
6 NOT JUST THE CHART WHICH IS MIN FULL FIRST STEP FOR RESTORING
7 PUBLIC CONFIDENCE BUT TO MEET THE PUBLIC CRISIS AS A REGION.
8 THERE IS BEEN THE ISSUE OF PUSHING FORWARD WITH THE CARES ACT
9 FUNDING TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT IS STILL RUNNING AND THAT WE
10 PROTECT ESSENTIAL WORKERS IN THE STRAIGHT SECTOR, BUT WE NEED
11 TO SHOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO CLEARLY IDENTIFY THAT THIS SYSTEM
12 IS SAFE FOR RIDERS AND WORKERS. PLAN YOU PUT FORWARD MAKES
13 SOME IMPORTANT GESTURES IN THAT DIRECTION AND WE TALKED ABOUT
14 THAT MONDAY AT THE TASK FORCE MEETING. IT DOES NOT SHOW THAT -
15 - ENSURE THERE IS NOT GAPS IT DOES NOT RIGHT NOW FOR EXAMPLE,
16 ANSWER THE QUESTION WHEN YOU GET ON TRANSIT IS THERE GOING TO
17 BE MASKS OR HAND SANITIZER AND IF THE AGENCY IS NOT PROVIDING
18 THAT WILL WE FILL IN THOSE GAPS? WE CERTAINLY IN CALIFORNIA
19 HAVE PRIDED OURSELVES ON BEING AHEAD OF THE CURVE AND
20 UNFORTUNATELY THAT CURVE HAS COME BACK AND WE ARE BACK IN THIS
21 CRISIS WITH CASES RISING. WE DON'T HAVE MONTHS TO ENSURE THAT
22 WE'RE DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN, AS A REGION TO GUARANTEE THE
23 SAFETY OF ESSENTIAL WORKERS, RIDERS AND TRANSIT WORKERS WHILE
24 THEY'RE OUT MAKING SURE THAT THE SYSTEM IS STILL FUNCTIONING
25 FOR THOSE WHO NEED IT MOST. SO WE NEED THIS TO BE A REGULAR



Meeting Transcript

1 ITEM ON THE MTC AGENDA WE KNOW SOME OF THE WORK IS CLEARLY
2 GOING FORWARD AT THE TASK FORCE AND WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATOR
3 WORKING GROUP THE DATA NEEDS TO BE HELD AND ANALYZED BY MTC
4 NOT BY THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION WHICH IS THE LOB
5 LOBBYING ADVOCACY ORGANIZATION FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND
6 WE NEED TO ENSURE THAT EVERYONE HAS A CLEAR SENSE OF WHAT THE
7 HEALTH PROCEDURES ARE, WHAT THE PROTECTIONS ARE THAT ARE IN
8 PLACE AND A GUARANTEE THAT PPE AND THOSE SAFETY PROTECTIONS
9 ARE IN PLACE ON ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND IT'S SOMETHING CAN'T
10 WAIT FOR. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JESSE HUNT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING ON MY NAME IS JESSE HUNT PRESIDENT OF
15 LOCAL 1855 REPRESENTING BART ESSENTIAL WORKERS THANK YOU FOR
16 THE TIME TO ADDRESS THREE ISSUES FIRST IS DISINFECTING OF
17 TRAINS. GENERAL CLEAN SUGGEST NOT ENOUGH AGENCIES MUST DO DEEP
18 CLEANING AT THE END OF THE LINES REGULARLY AND SANITIZING
19 AFTER EACH RUN ALL FORMS OF CLEANSING MUST BE USED IN ORDER TO
20 BOOST OPERATOR CONFIDENCE AND SAFETY. THIS WAY WE CAN PASS
21 THAT GOOD FEELING ON TO OUR RIDERS AND THE SIMPLE FACT IS IF
22 RIDERS DO NOT FEEL SAFE THEY WILL NOT RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND
23 PUSHING WORKERS WHO FAIL TO COME TO WORK. I DO NOT WANT ILL
24 WORKERS ON THE JOB, BUT WE CANNOT HAVE BOTH WAYS. SHOWING UP
25 FOR WORK ILL IN ORDER NOT TO BE DISCIPLINED. YOU MUST NOT MAKE



Meeting Transcript

1 THEM NOT COME TO WORK WHEN ILL. FINALLY JUST LAST WEEK WE HAD
2 THE LATEST IN A SERIES OF INCIDENTS THAT CONTINUE TO HAPPEN.
3 ONE OF OUR STATION OPERATORS WAS SPIT ON AND ASSAULTED BY A
4 PASSENGER AFTER THEY WERE TOLD TO WEAR A MASK ON THE TRANSIT
5 SYSTEM. WE MUST INSIST ON CONSISTENT POLICIES IN SUPPORT
6 THROUGHOUT MTC AGENCIES REGARDING ENFORCEMENT OF MASK
7 REQUIREMENTS. THERE ARE MEMBERS WHO ARE ESSENTIAL RISKING
8 THEIR LIVES EVERY DAY IS NOT A HEADLINE IT'S A STARK REALITY
9 AND WE NEED MTC SUPPORT TO PROTECT THEIR SAFETY. THANK YOU
10 VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER WITH THE
13 LAST 46262.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. THIS IS ROLAND AND I ABSOLUTELY AGREE WITH
16 EVERYTHING ELSE THAT PEOPLE HAVE SAID BEFORE ME BUT I WANT TO
17 GO BACK TO THE LETTER I WROTE ABOUT THE COMMITTEE. RIGHT AT
18 THE END OF THE LETTER THERE'S A PIE CHART THAT BASICALLY SHOWS
19 YOU THE PROBLEM. YES, VTA ARE TAKING A BIG HIT ON SALES TAXES.
20 THEY'RE ONLY TALKING ABOUT ONE SALES TAX. THERE ARE THREE OF
21 THEM. AND I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE OF THE KIND OF
22 ABUSES THAT GOES WITH THE PROBLEM SECOND ONE MEASURE A. SECOND
23 ONE I HAVE A REPORT IN FRONT OF ME APPROVED 2020 SILICON
24 PROGRAM MONTHLY REPORT INCREASE IN SEVEN AND A HALF MILLION
25 DOLLARS AND LISTEN TO THIS. AND PLEASE SIT DOWN. 5.6 MILLION



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 IS EXECUTION OF TASK ORDER WITH MWJB FOR WORK PERFORMED DURING
2 THE STOP WORK PERIOD. I'LL READ IT AGAIN EXECUTION OF A TASK
3 HOLDER FOR WORK PERFORMED DURING THE STOP PERIOD. THAT IS THE
4 CRUX OF THE PROBLEM. WHAT'S SOLUTION. SALES TAX, NOBODY CAN
5 TOUCH THE FIRST ONE VTA AND BUS OPERATIONS. SECOND ONE I
6 TALKED ABOUT, IS TAKES A SIMPLE MAJORITY OF THE VTA BOARD TO
7 DO SOMETHING ABOUT IT AND REROUTE FUNDING FROM BART
8 CONSULTANTS TO VTA BUS AND -- OPERATIONS. 2016 MEASURE B SAME
9 CAN APPLY THERE BUT THAT IS 75 PERCENT OF THE VTA VOTE. SO IN
10 CLOSING --

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CAN IDENTIFY THE ITEM ROLAND, PLEASE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I'M DONE.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA MALL ON.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS MONICA PUBLIC VOICES FOR TRANSPORTATION
21 I WANT THIS TREATED AS AN EMERGENCY AND PROTECT TRANSIT
22 WORKERS AND RIDERS BY COMMITTING TODAY TO RELEASE STRONG CIVIC
23 STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS. SO THAT WE CAN HAVE THE
24 OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON THEM BEFORE THE MEETING TO MAKE SURE
25 THAT ANY GAPS ARE ADDRESSED. THIS WILL ALSO ALLOW THE FIRST



Meeting Transcript

1 COMPLIANCE REPORT TO BE RELEASED SOONER THAN THE END OF
2 AUGUST. WE HAVE BEEN COMING TO THESE MEETINGS FOR, I THINK, AT
3 LEAST THREE MONTHS NOW, ASKING TO YOU TAKE THIS SERIOUSLY, AND
4 ASKING YOU TO HELP US TO PROTECT THE LIVES OF TRANSIT WORKERS
5 AND RIDERS, AND NOW WE REALLY NEED YOU TO TAKE ACTION. SO
6 PLEASE CONSIDER THIS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SONJA PATEL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I AM SONJA PATIL PART OF THE TRANSIT TEAM WITH
11 SILICON VALLEY YOUTH CLIMATE ACTION AS WELL, AND VTA RECEIVES
12 \$73 MILLION DISTRIBUTION IN THE FIRST PHASE OF THE CARE ACT
13 FUNDING AND THIS IS THE ONLY AGENCY IN THE FUNDING PHASE TO
14 RECEIVE LESS THAN IT NEEDED ALL THE OTHER AGENCIES RECEIVED
15 MORE THAN ENOUGH TO FULFILL NEEDS AT THE TIME. I HOPE WE
16 DIRECT STAFF TO RECONSIDERING CALCULATION OF SECOND YOU ROUND
17 OF CARES ACT REFLECTIVE OF TASK ASSUMPTIONS. THANK YOU FOR
18 YOUR TIME.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN COURTNEY.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY AFTER THIS SPEAKER I'M GOING
23 TO HAVE TO MUST SPEAKERS TO ONE MINUTE. THE LIST KEEPS
24 GROWING. AND WE HAVE OTHER ITEMS WE NEED TO MOVE ON TO. SO I
25 APOLOGIZE TO ALL THE SPEAKERS, BUT BEING THE CHAIR OF THE MEET



Meeting Transcript

1 MEANS SOMETIMES YOU HAVE TO MAKE UNPOPULAR DECISIONS. SO AFTER
2 THIS SPEAKER WE'LL BE MOVING TO ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING THIS IS JOHN CORNY ATU LOCAL 65 I
7 REPRESENT THE WORKERS FOR VTA AND I WANTED TO POINT OUT
8 SOMETHING THEY HEARD SAID I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WHAT WE'RE
9 TALKING ABOUT HERE IS THE LIVES OF BLACK AND BROWN WORKERS AND
10 RIDERS THOSE LIVES ARE AT GREAT RISK AND I THINK IT'S
11 IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT THAT MTC DOES NOT REFLECT THE COMMUNITY
12 THAT WE SERVE. IT DOESN'T LOOK ANYTHING LIKE THE COMMUNITY
13 THAT WE SERVE. SO I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT, FOR ONE
14 THING. AND THE SECOND THING IS, I JUST AM WONDERING HOW MANY
15 OF YOU FOLKS COME HOME FROM WORK AND HAVE TO COMPLETELY TAKE
16 YOUR CLOTHES OFF AT THE DOOR, WASH YOUR CLOTHES, TAKE A SHOWER
17 OUTSIDE AND THEN COME IN AND SEE YOUR FAMILY BECAUSE YOU ARE
18 WORRIED ABOUT CONTACTING COVID OR GIVING IT YOUR FAMILY
19 MEMBERS. I WOULD PROBABLY SAY ZERO. AS A MATTER OF FACT WE
20 COULDN'T HIDE BEHIND ZOOM OR BEHIND DISTANCING ON THE BUSES WE
21 HAVE TO PERFORM OUR JOBS AND DUTIES AS WORKERS AND WE'RE OUT
22 THERE ON THE FRONT LINES FROM THE VERY BEGINNING THAT BEING
23 SAID I SEE THIS PUSH TO DO THREE-FOOT DISTANCING I GOT TO SAY
24 SOMETHING, THE AUDACITY OF FOLKS TO DO SOMETHING LIKE THAT.
25 WHEN YOU ARE IN THE SUPER MARKET ARE YOU THREE FEET OR MAKING



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 SURE IT'S SIX FEET? I'LL GUARANTEE YOU ARE MAKING SURE IT'S
2 SIX FEET SO TO THINK IT'S OKAY IN AN INCUBATOR LIKE A BUS TO
3 THINK IT'S OKAY TO BE WITHIN THREE FEET BECAUSE YOU'RE WEARING
4 A MASK IT'S UNBELIEVABLE THAT ANYBODY WOULD HAVE THAT TYPE OF
5 MENTALITY. WE NEED TO PUT ASIDE SOME MONEY FOR PPES AND FOLLOW
6 THE STATE GUIDELINES, NOT THE CTA OVERSEEING THE MTC. WHAT IS
7 THE OUTCOME IF SOMEONE DOESN'T COMPLY? A SLAP ON THE WRIST? I
8 BEG YOU AND IMPORE YOU TO CONSIDER THE FOLKS WHO WORK ON THE
9 FRONT LINES AND THE RIDERS WHO TAKE THE BUSES AND TONIGHT SIT
10 IN -- DON'T SIT IN OFFICES. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.
11 THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS TERRY TAPPEN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M TERRY VICE MAYOR OF THE BERKELEY TRANSIT
16 ASSOCIATION. IN ADDITION WHAT THE SPEAKERS FROM THE BUS
17 DRIVERS AND TRAIN OPERATORS HAVE SAID I WISH TO ADD THAT AC
18 TRANSIT AND BART ARE DEEPLY IMPORTANT TO BERKELEY'S COMMUNITY
19 THEY ARE NECESSARY FOR OUR CITY TO REACH OUR CLIMATE GOALS AND
20 I ASK YOU ALLOCATE NECESSARY RESOURCES SO WE CAN MAINTAIN
21 NECESSARY OPERATIONS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT CALLER WITH THE LAST 4,
24 7188.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** YES. HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. MY
6 NAME IS MIGUEL NAVARRO PRESIDENT AND BUSINESS AGENT OF ATU
7 LOCAL 1574. WITH CORONAVIRUS CASES RISING TASK FORCE PROPOSE
8 THREE-FOOT DISTANCING POLICY ON BUS OR TRAIN SEEMS TO BE
9 UNFORESEEABLE NON-STARTER WITH THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE AND CDC
10 GUIDANCE MY MEMBERS ATU LOCAL 1574 WANTING TO KNOW WHO IS
11 GOING TO BE OVERSEEING EACH AGENCY IF LEFT UP TO THEMSELVES.
12 I'M AFRAID SOME WILL NOT KEEP THE OPERATORS AND PUBLIC SAFE
13 AND JUST WHEN SUCH A POLICY GOES INTO EFFECT I DON'T SEE ANY
14 DECISION MAKING ON THIS TOPIC COMING OUT OF THE GOVERNOR'S
15 OFFICE. OR FOR THAT MATTER, ELECTED OFFICIALS OFFICE THERE
16 DOESN'T SEEM TO BE MUCH GROUNDS FOR SUCH A DISTANCING
17 BUILDINGS ON BUSES AND TRAINS. SOCIAL DISTANCING OF SIX FEET
18 SEEMS TO BE WORKING WELL ON THE STREET AND IN PARKS AND IN
19 OTHER PUBLIC PLACES. THAT'S ALL WELL AND GOOD AND NECESSARY
20 BUT THE THREE-FOOT DISTANCING ON BUSES AND TRAINS RIDERSHIP IS
21 ALREADY DOWN AND SPACINGS THEM OUT EVEN MORE WITH THE CONFINES
22 EVER PUBLIC TRANSIT VEHICLES IS AN UNFORESEEABLE BURDEN. THANK
23 YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SAL CRUZ.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS THIS IS SAL CRUZ FROM THE
3 AMERICAN FEDERATION OF COUNCIL EMPLOYEES FROM BAY AREA RAPID
4 TRANSIT SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF LOCAL BART CHAPTER WE URGE TO
5 YOU SUPPORT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE RECOMMENDED TRANCHE TWO
6 CARES ACT ALLOCATIONS ON BEHALF OF 25 ESSENTIAL BART WORKERS
7 WHO ARE BRAVING THE DANGERS EVERY DAY OF THE PASSENGERS DURING
8 THIS PANDEMIC WE APPRECIATE YOUR HARD WORK ON THIS ISSUE.
9 THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MIGUEL NAVARRO
12 JR. I THINK YOU JUST SPOKE BUT YOU'RE HERE AGAIN. SO NEXT
13 SPEAKER IS NICHOLE WONG. NICHOLE WONG.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS NICHOLE WONG
16 AND I AM THE TRANSPORTATION CAMPAIGN MANAGER WITH CLEAN AIR
17 FOR ALL NON-PROFIT CORP OUR OFFICE BASED IN OAKLAND. ON YOU
18 INTERVIEWS MADE IT CLEAR THAT HEALTH AND SAFETY IS MOST
19 PRESSING FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS ACROSS THE COUNTRY. I URGE YOU
20 TO TAKE BOLD ACTION NOW TO PROTECT THE LIVES OF TRANSIT
21 WORKERS AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS FOR IT DISPROPORTIONATELY
22 PEOPLE OF LOW INCOME AND COLOR. WE RECOMMEND YOU FOLLOW HEALTH
23 AND SAFETY STANDARDS WITHIN TWO WEEKS AND ENSURE THAT TRANSIT
24 AGENCIES COMPLY ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES MUST ARE REQUIRED TO
25 PROVIDE MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER TO PASSENGERS ON TRANSIT AND



Meeting Transcript

1 PPE SHOULD BE AVAILABLE TO PASSENGERS ON TRANSIT. EMPLOYEES
2 ARE PUTTING THEIR LIVES ON THE LINE YOU MUST VALUE THEIR LABOR
3 BY OFFERING ONSITE COVID TESTING HAZARD PAY IS SICK LEAVE.
4 THINKING DID SERVICE ALLOCATION IN TERMS OF CARES FUNDING
5 EQUITY MUST BE PART OF THAT PROCESS.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TIME IS UP NICHOLE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. DECISIONS YOU MAKE TODAY HAVE THE POWER TO
10 SAVE LIVES PLEASE TAKE ACTION NOW.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU NICHOLE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SEAMUS MURPHY.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS SEAMUS MURPHY FROM SAN MATEO
17 COUNTY DISTRICT WE SUPPORT THIS ITEM AND SUPPORT THE TRUE UP
18 LANGUAGE THAT'S BEEN SUGGESTED. WE WOULD SUGGEST THAT YOU
19 REVISE THE WORD FLEXIBLE IN THE FINAL SENTENCE LINE IN THE
20 SENSE WHERE COMMISSIONER BRUINS IS HEADED WE DON'T WANT
21 FORMULA FUNDS THAT THE PROGRAM DEPENDS ON, WE HAVE SEEN HOW
22 EFFECTIVE FORMULA FUND CAN BE WITH THE CARES ALLOCATION ITSELF
23 WE ENCOURAGE TO YOU EXPLORE THAT FURTHER WITH MTC STAFF. THANK
24 YOU.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR HAGGERTY. MEMBERS, ALETA DUPREE FOR
4 THE RECORD. PERFECT MUST NEVER BE THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD. IT'S
5 VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE DO THIS SO WE CAN GET THE MONEY TO THE
6 AGENCIES. CLIPPER IS ESSENTIAL. IT'S GOOD LEVERAGE, BOTH ON
7 THE CAPITAL AND THE OPERATING SIDE. IT PROTECTS PEOPLE,
8 REDUCES INTERACTION BETWEEN EMPLOYEES AND CUSTOMERS AND KEEPS
9 THE MONEY -- YOU DON'T HAVE TO CARRY ALL THAT MONEY AROUND. SO
10 BRIEFLY, LET'S GET THIS DONE TODAY. IT WILL NEVER BE ENOUGH,
11 BUT IT'S AN IMPORTANT START. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS EUGENE BRADLEY.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI EVERYBODY THIS EUGENE BRADLEY FOUNDER AND CEO OF
16 SILICON VALLEY TRANSIT UNION. I SUPPORT THE SPEAKERS IN
17 REGARDS TO THE ACTION IT'S IMPORTANT TO PLAN AND COORDINATE
18 EVERYTHING I HAVE READ SO FAR SUGGESTS THIS IS NOT HAPPENING
19 PEOPLE'S LIVES ARE AT STAKE RIGHT NOW TRANSIT RIDERS AS WELL
20 AS THOSE WHO DRIVE THE BUS SUPERVISOR MAINTAIN. IT'S IMPORTANT
21 FOR THE TASK FORCE TO MOVE FAST TO GET STANDARD UNIFORM
22 MEASURES SO THAT EVERYBODY STAYS SAFE BUT THE CONTINUED FOOT
23 DRAG AS HAS BEEN THE CASE FOR THE LAST FEW MONTHS YOU TELL
24 EVERYONE WHO TAKES A BUS OR TRAIN TO KEEP THEM SAFE YOU TELL
25 RIDERS AND TRANSIT WORKS THEIR LIVES DO NOT MATTER LET'S GET



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 GOING ON GETTING UNIFORM STANDARDS FOR EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY TO
2 USE AND MAKE SURE THAT THE AGENCIES ARE HELD ACCOUNTABLE AND
3 ENFORCING AND ENACTING THOSE STANDARDS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS VICTORIA
6 FIERCE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HI CAN YOU HEAR ME? GREAT. HI I'M VICTORIA FIERCE A
9 MEMBER OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE ON ABAG
10 AND ALSO A CANDIDATE FOR AC TRANSIT. I LIVE OUT HERE IN
11 DOWNTOWN OAKLAND. AND I FULLY DISAGREE WITH ANY NOTION THAT WE
12 NEED TO DO CONSERVATIVE FUNDING HERE. WE ARE, YOU KNOW, ON THE
13 EDGE OF A GREAT DEPRESSION AND POSTERITY IS NOT WHAT WE NEED
14 NOW. MORE SPENDING ON TRANSIT HELPS PEOPLE IN POVERTY. WE SAW
15 REPORT ON CLOSING GAPS IN EXPRESS LANE NETWORK THE QUESTION I
16 HAVE IS WHY AREN'T WE CLOSING THE GAP ON OTHER THINGS LIKE
17 ADDING BUS LANES. WE NEED THESE KIND OF STANDARD STANDARDS WE
18 NEED SUPPORT FOR OUR PEOPLE BECAUSE THIS IS AN ACTUAL HEALTH
19 CRISIS AND HEALTH ISSUE AND PEOPLE ARE DYING EVERY DAY BECAUSE
20 OF THIS DISEASE AND IT'S JUST A SIMPLE PIECE OF PAPER THAT
21 COULD SAVE MILLIONS OF LIVES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS PAM HERHOLD.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS PAM H HERE REPRESENTING
2 BART. WE APPRECIATE THE WORK OF THE COMMISSION. WE ALSO COULD
3 SUPPORT THE PROPOSED TRUE UP AMENDMENT HOWEVER SUCH FUNDING
4 MUST COME FROM FUTURE EMERGENCY FUND SO LONG A TRUE UP WOULD
5 NOT IMPACT EXISTING OR PLANNED CRITICAL CAPITAL PROJECTS.
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JEREMY TAYLOR.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS JEREMY TAYLOR I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA
11 COUNTY. I URGE MORE TC TO DIRECT STAFF TO RECONFIGURE
12 CALCULATIONS OF SECOND TRANCHE OF FUNDING TO -- I THINK YOU
13 ARE HEARING WE WOULD LIKE TO GET MORE FUNDING. MOST AGENCIES
14 ONLY HAVE 50 PERCENT. FOR THOSE THAT ARE LOOKED OFFICIALS
15 THERE IS A TREMENDOUS SWELL. IF YOU LIKE YOUR POSITION I WOULD
16 RECOMMEND TO WORK WITH US BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE SHY
17 ABOUT THINGS IF THEY GO WRONG FOR US. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I REALLY WONDER HOW MANY OF THE PEOPLE OUT THERE
22 SUPPORT DEFUNDING POLICE AND EXPECT ENFORCEMENT ON HIT IT
23 AGENCIES WHEN PEOPLE ARE NOT IN COMPLIANCE WE WANT TO PROVIDE
24 SOME FUNDING FOR POLICE IF WE WANT SOME ENFORCEMENT TO HAPPEN.
25 THANK YOU.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES

5 FORMER PENINSULA FOR EVERYONE. WE DO ADVOCACY IN SANTA CLARA.

6 I AM A TRANSIT RIDERS AND WOULD LIKE TO CALL FOR STRONG

7 UNIFORM STANDARDS AS WELL AS MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER. OUR

8 TRANSIT WORKERS ARE PUTTING THEIR LIVES ON THE LINE FOR US.

9 AND MASKS AND SANITIZER IS THE LEAST WE CAN DO. THIS

10 DISPROPORTIONATELY AFFECTS PEOPLE OF COLOR THIS MUST HAPPEN

11 NOW NOT AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. WE CANNOT CONTINUE KICKING THE

12 CAN DOWN THE ROAD OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND RIDERS ALL DESERVE

13 BETTER. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU NEXT SPEAKER IS ALEXIS.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ALEXIS T14-YEAR-OLD OF SAN CLAIR. I AM

18 PART OF TRANSIT TEAM SILICON VALLEY AS WELL. IT'S ESSENTIAL

19 THAT VTA RECEIVE ITS FAIR SHARE EVER FUNDING TO CONTINUE

20 PROVIDING SERVICE SUCH AS EQUITY. I URGE MTC TO RECALCULATE

21 CARES ACT FUNDING. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME AND

22 CONSIDERATION.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE LAST SPEAKER IS KATE

25 BREEN.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. KATE BREEN DIRECTOR OF
3 GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS FOR SAN FRANCISCO MTA. I WANT TO THANK THE
4 WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE IN ADVANCING
5 TODAY'S RECOMMENDATION ON CARES ACT FUNDS. THESE FUNDS ARE
6 CRITICAL TO ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE REGION TO CONTINUE TO
7 PROVIDE ESSENTIAL SERVICE TO CUSTOMERS IN ALL NINE COUNTIES
8 PER DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM SFMTA WOULD REQUEST IN SUPPORTING
9 ANY TRUE UP THAT WE ENSURE THAT SUCH TRUE UP COMES FROM FUTURE
10 EMERGENCY RELIEF FUNDING RATHER THAN SHIFTING FLEXIBLE FUNDING
11 THAT SUPPORTS THE REGION'S CRITICAL CAPITAL PROGRAM AND WE
12 URGE YOU WORK WITH STAFF TO CLARIFY THIS. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE NO ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS
15 MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER BRUINS? UNMUTE.

18

19 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. FIRST IS FOR STAFF. IF
20 STAFF CAN COMMENT OR CLARIFY, WHAT IS COMING TO US WITH
21 RESPECT TO HEALTH AND SAFETY STANDARDS AND OR COMPLIANCE?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
24 WHAT I HAD REITERATED OR OUTLINED IN MY EXECUTIVE REPORT IS
25 THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN



Meeting Transcript

1 ALIGNMENT WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE REVIEW, AND A HEALTH
2 AND SAFETY TRANSIT PLAN THAT HAS BEEN DEVELOPED AMONG ALL OF
3 THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, LARGE AND SMALL, I THINK THAT'S
4 IMPORTANT TO REITERATE, HAS BEEN PUT TOGETHER, AND A NUMBER OF
5 THE RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF THAT REVIEW WITH THE BLUE
6 RIBBON TASK FORCE. THAT PLAN HOWEVER HAS NOT YET BEEN
7 RELEASED, AND I WAS ASSURED THAT THE PLAN WOULD BE ABLE TO BE
8 RELEASED WITHIN THE NEXT 30 DAYS. I DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC
9 TIME, BUT THAT PLAN WOULD THEN BE THE BASIS FOR IDENTIFYING
10 THE SPECIFIC BASELINE CONSISTENT HEALTH CONDITIONS, METRICS,
11 THAT WOULD BE HELD ACROSS THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND THEN
12 SUBSEQUENT TO THAT, THERE WOULD BE A FRAMEWORK ON HOW THAT
13 WOULD THEN BE TRACKED AND MEASURED. SO THAT IS WHAT IS THE
14 NEXT STEPS THAT WE EXPECT TO COME FORWARD IN THIS PUBLIC
15 TRANSIT HEALTH AND SAFETY PHASE.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THAT WOULD BE COMING POTENTIALLY ON OUR
18 AGENDA.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WHAT WE EXPECT IS THE PLAN WOULD BE RELEASED
21 IN ADVANCE OF THE NEXT MEETING AND AT YOUR NEXT MEETING IN
22 AUGUST WE WOULD HAVE A SPECIFIC DASHBOARD CONSISTENT WITH THE
23 PLAN THAT OUTLINES THE COMMON HEALTH METRICS ACROSS ALL OF THE
24 HEALTH AGENCIES AND THEN THE NEXT STEPS BEYOND, AFTER THAT
25 WOULD BE A FRAMEWORK OF HOW THAT WOULD BE -- HOW THOSE METRICS



Meeting Transcript

1 WOULD BE MEASURED, DATA COLLECTED, AND REPORTED ON AN ONGOING
2 BASIS, TO THE COMMISSION.

3

4 **JEANNIE BRUINS, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SO -- GO AHEAD JEANNE.

7

8 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I WAS GOING TO MOVE ON TO THE MOTION THAT'S ON
9 THE TABLE. DID YOU WANT TO SAY SOMETHING ABOUT THE HEALTH AND
10 SAFETY ISSUE? OR --

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YEAH, I DO, BUT YOU CAN CONTINUE. I
13 HAVE OTHER COMMISSIONERS THAT WISH TO SPEAK TOO.

14

15 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** SO I WAS GOING TO ASK, CAN SOMEBODY RESTATE
16 THE MOTION THAT'S ON THE TABLE, SPECIFICALLY, WHAT IS BEING
17 STRICKEN FROM THE PROPOSED LANGUAGE OF MAYOR LICCARDO AND WHAT
18 IS BEING INSERTED.

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, MY
21 UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THE LAST SENTENCE IS BEING STRUCK FROM
22 THE MOTION.

23



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE -- THAT'S -- YOU'RE THE
2 MAKER OF THE MOTION. SO IS THAT THE ANSWER -- SO IS THAT TRUE
3 WITH THE SECONDARY --

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NO. ME MADE A MOTION AND IT WAS
6 AMENDED.

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. MY UNDERSTANDING WAS THAT THE -- I
9 DON'T KNOW IF WE ALL HAVE THIS IN FRONT OF US. MAYBE IT'S
10 POSSIBLE TO PUT IT IN THE CHAT. IF THAT WOULD BE AN
11 APPROPRIATE USE OF THE CHAT?

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON? BECAUSE WE'LL GET
14 THERE, AND I MEAN WE'RE GOING TO -- THE MOTION WILL BE READ
15 BACK BEFORE WE VOTE ON IT, I ASSURE YOU. BUT I HAVE A COUPLE.
16 FIRST OF ALL, BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO ADD THIS TO THE MOTION
17 THAT THERE IS A MONTHLY REPORTING BACK TO MTC ON PPE, AND IF
18 WE COULD, GET UPDATES AS TO HOW COVID IS PROGRESSING WITHIN
19 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. SOMETIMES THAT DATA IS NOT EASY TO GET,
20 AND I UNDERSTAND THAT, BUT I THINK THERE SHOULD BE A REPORTING
21 BACK. IS THEN A QUESTION TO STAFF, I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHY
22 COULDN'T WE REQUIRE ONE OR TWO PERCENT TO GO TO PPE AND
23 KEEPING THE DRIVER'S SAFE AND OUR RIDERS SAFE?

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** COMMISSIONER -- CHAIR HAGGERTY, THIS IS
2 THERESE MCMILLAN. DISCUSSION AT THE TIME AGAIN, WAS THAT
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS WERE USING THE CARES ACT MONEY AND SPENDING
4 WHATEVER WAS NECESSARY IN ORDER TO ENSURE, PARTICULARLY, THAT
5 PPE WAS PROVIDED TO THEIR EMPLOYEES AND THAT THERE WAS
6 SUFFICIENT FUNDING FOR THE ENHANCED MAINTENANCE, CLEANING
7 PROTOCOLS AND WHAT NOT THAT MAY BE AFFECTING MAINTENANCE
8 BUDGETS ET CETERA. SO FROM AN OPERATIONAL POINT OF VIEW RATHER
9 THAN CONSTRICTING OR LIMITING SOME ARBITRARY PERCENTAGE, THE
10 AMOUNTS THAT, IT WAS OUR UNDERSTANDING -- AND I CAN HAVE ALIX
11 JUMP IN AND RESPOND, BUT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS NEED MONEY IN
12 ORDER TO AUGMENT AND SUPPLEMENT THEIR BUDGET AT WHATEVER
13 LEVELS NECESSARY TO ADDRESS SAFETY RELATED COSTS GIVEN THE
14 COVID ENVIRONMENT. SO IT WAS -- THAT WAS PART OF THE THINKING
15 AS TO WHY A SPECIFIC SHAKE DOWN, BUT AT SOME LIMITED AMOUNT,
16 WOULD NOT BE NECESSARY.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL, I THINK THE PUBLIC IS ASKING US
19 TO DO SOMETHING ELSE. I THINK THEY'RE ASKING THAT WE GUARANTEE
20 THAT A CERTAIN AMOUNT BE USED TOWARDS SAFETY. AND IF THEY'RE
21 ALREADY SPENDING THAT THEN I DON'T SEE THE BIG DEAL IN
22 REQUIRING IT. BUT I'LL LISTEN TO MY COLLEAGUES AND HOW THEY
23 WANT TO GO WITH THIS. I AM ALSO CONCERNED, BECAUSE AS YOU
24 HEARD, LAST TIME, WE HAD THIS REPORT TO US, THEY WANT A REPORT
25 TO CTA, CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION AND THAT JUST DOESN'T



Meeting Transcript

1 WORK. THIS IS A LOCAL ISSUE, AND I THINK WE SHOULD BE
2 OVERSEEING IT LOCALLY. AND MAKING SURE OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES
3 ARE DOING THE RIGHT THING. I WANT TO BE CLEAR I'M NOT SAYING
4 THEY'RE NOT DOING THE RIGHT THING. I WANT TO BE CLEAR, I KNOW
5 OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE VERY INTERESTED IN MAKING SURE THEIR
6 BUSES AND TRAINS AND FERRIES ARE SAFE SO THEY CAN GET THEIR
7 PASSENGERS BACK. I UNDERSTAND THAT'S THEIR GOAL AND I SHARE
8 THAT GOAL WITH THEM BUT I CERTAINLY WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE
9 MOTION INCLUDE THE REPORTING BACK MONTHLY TO MTC AND I THINK
10 WE HAVE SOME REALLY, REALLY BRIGHT STAFF PEOPLE AT MTC AND
11 THEY CAN PUT TOGETHER SOMETHING THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN FILL
12 OUT AND THEN ALSO I -- IF THEY'RE SPENDING ALREADY TWO PERCENT
13 ON PPE THEN WHY CAN'T WE REQUIRE THAT BUT I'LL LISTEN TO MY
14 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS ON THAT. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO GO TO
15 GINA PAPAN NOW.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS OF
18 THE CHAIR. TESTIMONY TODAY SHOWS OTHERWISE. AND THAT'S DEEPLY
19 CONCERNING TO MYSELF A COMMISSIONER AND ALSO A MEMBER OF THE
20 BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE. WE'RE BEING TOLD ONE THING BY
21 THE PROVIDERS AND THEIR UNIFORM STANDARDS AND YET WE'RE NOT
22 GETTING THE ASSURANCES AND OBVIOUSLY THE OPERATORS, THE
23 EMPLOYEES, AND THE PUBLIC STILL ARE FACING GRAVE RISKS,
24 IMMEDIATELY. SO, I HAVE ASKED, DURING THE COMMISSION, THE TASK
25 FORCE, THAT WE GET MORE THAN A COMMITMENT, WHAT IS HAPPENING



Meeting Transcript

1 RIGHT NOW. SO I AGREE WITH THE CHAIR THAT WE NEED TO KNOW
2 THAT, AND WE NEED TO KNOW HOW THEY ARE PROGRESSING AND WE
3 SHOULD BE IMPLEMENTING MONTHLY REQUIREMENTS ARE IS ALMOST TOO
4 LATE AT THIS POINT. WE NEED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE REQUIREMENTS
5 ALONG THESE LINES AND FOR ONE CLARIFICATION, I DON'T THINK WE
6 WERE STRIKING ONE SENTENCE OF THIS, I THINK IT ONLY RELATED AS
7 THE MOTION GOES TO FUTURE FUNDING AND I WOULD LIKE
8 CLARIFICATION LATER. THANK YOU SIR.

9

10 **SAM LICCARDO:** THAT WAS ALSO MY UNDERSTANDING COMMISSIONER WELL
11 I LICCARDO.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL GET A REVOTE
14 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I'M NOW GOING TO
15 GO TO COMMISSIONER SPERING.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I JUST WANT TO
18 REMIND EVERYONE, THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE, THE MAIN FOCUS WAS
19 FORUM SO THERE WAS AN ESSENTIAL CLEARING HOUSE THAT COULD DEAL
20 WITH AND ADDRESS SOME OF THESE ISSUES. ONE THING THAT IS
21 ABSENT IN ALL OF THIS DISCUSSION AND EVEN AT THE BLUE RIBBON
22 COMMITTEE IS WE'RE DEALING WITH THE GENERAL MANAGERS OR
23 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AT WHAT POINT ARE THE ELECTED BOARDS OF
24 THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES BEING HELD RESPONSIBLE? ALL THE
25 COMMENTS AT OUR BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE WE'RE HEARING AND ALL



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 COMMENTS WE'RE HERE RIGHT NOW AT MTC THEY NEED TO BE PRESENTED
2 TO EACH ONE OF THOSE ELECTED BOARDS AND THEY NEED TO ANSWER
3 THOSE QUESTIONS. ARE THEY DOING THIS? WHY AREN'T THEY DOING IT
4 AND THEN HAVE THAT RESPONSE. I THINK IT'S FOOLISH TO THINK
5 THAT, YOU KNOW, THOSE ARE COMPLETELY AUTONOMOUS ISSUES, THE
6 CARES MONEY WAS NOT SENT TO MTC TO CONDITION IT, OR TO HOLD IT
7 HOSTAGE, IT WAS TO GET IT OUT TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS SO THAT
8 THEY COULD CONTINUE TO OPERATE, AND YOU KNOW, THE MORE MONEY,
9 AND THE MORE DELAY THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT WE KEEP FIDDLING
10 AROUND WITH, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE MORE PEOPLE LAID OFF, PEOPLE
11 LOSING THEIR JOBS TRANSIT OPERATORS AREN'T GOING TO BE ABLE TO
12 MOVE FORWARD. YOU KNOW, THE IMPRESSION THAT THE TRANSIT
13 OPERATORS ARE NOT DOING ANYTHING UNTIL THEY REPORT BACK TO US,
14 IT'S JUST NOT CORRECT. I MEAN, THEY ARE DOING, YOU KNOW,
15 THEY'RE DOING A LOT OF THE BASELINE WORK WE HAVE ASKED FOR. WE
16 HAVE ASKED FOR THEM TO COORDINATE AND COMMUNICATE WITH EACH
17 OTHER IN THE SMALL, LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THEY'RE ALL DOING
18 THAT. YOU KNOW, AT SOME POINT, THOSE DIRECTLY ELECTED BOARDS
19 AND IF THERE EVER IS AN ARGUMENT FOR CONSOLIDATION THIS IS IT.
20 BUT THEY HAVE TO BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE AND AT SOME POINT THEY
21 HAVE TO WEIGH IN ON THIS WE'RE HEARING FROM THE UNION LEADERS
22 WHAT IS THE BART BOARD SAYING ABOUT PROTECTING. WHAT IS AC
23 TRANSIT AND SOLTRANS SAYING? WE NEED TO HEAR FROM THOSE
24 BOARDS. AND IT'S REALLY UNFAIR TO PLACE THIS WHOLE BURDEN ON
25 MTC AND THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE WHICH HAS NO AUTHORITY. NONE



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 AT ALL. AND SO, I WOULD CERTAINLY HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW, WE GET
2 A MUCH HIGHER LEVEL OF COOPERATION WORKING TOGETHER,
3 TREMENDOUS STRIDES HAVE BEEN MADE. WE'RE SEEING COOPERATION
4 AND COORDINATION THAT WE HAVEN'T SEEN, SOME OF THIS HISTORIC.
5 BUT HEALTH AND SAFETY SAY HIGH PRIORITY FOR EVERYBODY. IF
6 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO PUT HAND SANITIZER ON THESE VEHICLES,
7 THEN TELL US WHY. BUT FOR US TO REQUIRE IT, NOT KNOWING WHY
8 IT'S NOT POSSIBLE OR NOT FEASIBLE, IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE.
9 AND SO, MR. CHAIRMAN, YOU KNOW, ON MONEY WE'RE ALLOCATING A
10 PERCENTAGE IS GOING TO HELP WITH SAFETY OPERATIONS WHAT
11 PERCENTAGE IS I DON'T KNOW, TO HAVE THEM REPORT BACK WOULD BE
12 GOOD TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE AGREED TO REPORT TO MTC ON A
13 MONTHLY BASIS SO WE'RE REALLY PUSHING THE ENVELOPE. IT'S
14 PROBABLY NOT GOING AS FAST AS EVERYONE WOULD LIKE, BUT IT
15 REALLY IS A LOT HAS BEEN ACCOMPLISHED. AND YOU KNOW, A LOT OF
16 THE ISSUES THAT ARE BEING RAISED WITH THE TRANSIT EMPLOYEES, I
17 THINK ARE VERY VALID, AND THEY NEED TO BE ADDRESSED BUT THE
18 TRANSIT BOARDS HAVE TO BE ACCOUNTABLE FOR SOME OF THE
19 QUESTIONS BEING ASKED. MTC CAN'T TELL ANY TRANSIT OPERATOR
20 WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO DO. WE DON'T HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. MR.
21 CHAIR I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY THAT BOTH BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE
22 AND MTC ARE DOING AS MUCH AS WE CAN. WE'RE BRINGING AS MUCH OF
23 THIS TO THE FOREFRONT AND YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE THESE
24 DISCUSSIONS ARE DONE IN THE SUNSHINE, AND YOU KNOW, I THINK
25 THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, I HOPE THE TRANSIT BOARDS ARE HEARING



Meeting Transcript

1 WHAT IS BEING SAID. BUT THERE HAS TO BE SOME ACCOUNTABILITY ON
2 THE PART OF THOSE BOARDS. THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN OF THE BLUE
5 RIBBON COMMITTEE. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SAY THAT, YOU KNOW,
6 AT THE LAST BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE MEETING I DID TALK ABOUT
7 THESE TRANSIT BOARDS PASSING RESOLUTIONS OF, YOU KNOW, HOW
8 THEY INTEND TO OPERATE SAFELY, SO, AND I THINK THAT SHOULD
9 STILL HAPPEN. I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. AND I AGREE
10 WITH YOU. I MEAN, WE HAD A CALLER CALL UP AND SAY IF WE DON'T
11 VOTE HIS WAY HE'S GOING TO MAKE SURE WE DON'T GET VOTED FOR,
12 WELL YOU KNOW WHAT, THERE IS ELECTED TRANSIT MEMBERS WHO ARE
13 RUN BEING THESE THINGS YET IT'S EASY TO CALL UP AND THREATEN
14 UP. HE DOESN'T HAVE TO VOTE. I DON'T CARE.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE MCMILLAN SAID SHE SUPPORTS. THAT'S A
17 GOOD SUGGESTION AND WE'RE NOT WAITING UNTIL THE SEPTEMBER
18 MEETING ON THOSE THEE ISSUES.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY KEEP IN MIND WE'RE WORKING IN
21 AUGUST TOO. DUTRA-VERNACI?

22

23 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU. FIRST OF ALL SINCE I WAS NOT A
24 MEMBER OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE I WANT TO THANK EACH AND
25 EVERY ONE OF YOU FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK DONE ALONG THESE LINES



Meeting Transcript

1 AND SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF SPERING, HE HIT THE NAIL ON THE
2 HEAD IT'S THE AGENCIES THAT NEED TO BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE AND
3 WITH THE NUMBER OF SPEAKERS WE HEARD FROM TODAY I AM SURE ALL
4 OF US COMMISSIONERS, AS I RECEIVED INNUMEROUS E-MAILS NOT JUST
5 FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCY WORKERS BUT RIDERS, PLEADING FOR THE
6 MASKS AND SANITIZER. SO, I'M CERTAINLY IN SUPPORT OF DOING
7 EVERYTHING WE CAN AS QUICKLY AS WE CAN TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT
8 MONEY IS BEING USED APPROPRIATELY FOR THOSE MEASURES AND NOT
9 JUST FOR THE PROVIDERS OR THE TRAIN OPERATORS, BUT I THINK
10 ALSO THE RIDING PUBLIC AS WELL, BECAUSE WITH THIS PANDEMIC
11 CONTINUING TO SPIRAL UPWARDS IT'S THE RIDERS WHO ARE GETTING
12 ON WITHOUT EQUIPMENT AND WHAT HAVE YOU THEN IF WE, IF THERE IS
13 THE CAPABILITY THEY SHOULD BE HANDED MASKS AS WELL TO PROTECT
14 EVERYONE FROM EACH OTHER. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
15 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA COULD YOU DO ME A
18 FAVOR AND CLEAN PAPAN, SPERING, AND DUTRA-VERNACI. I'M GOING
19 TO CALL ON COMMISSIONER LICCARDO.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M SORRY CHAIR YOU ASKED ME TO DO
22 SOMETHING.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SOMEHOW IT JUST GOT DONE. THANK YOU
25 KIMBERLY. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU CHAIR. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, I

3 THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IF WE CLARIFY THE MOTION STRIKING

4 THAT SENTENCE ALTOGETHER MEANS THERE WOULD BE NO EFFORT FOR

5 STAFF TO LOOK AT ANY EXISTING FEDERAL PROGRAM EVEN IF THERE

6 WERE A SEPARATE ALLOCATION FOR THAT PROGRAM THE BOARD COULD

7 CONSIDER AND MY FRIENDLY AMENDMENT WOULD BE SEVERAL MONTHS AGO

8 WE ALL VOTED ON PHASE ONE WITH THE PROMISE THERE WOULD BE A

9 TRUEING UP, THAT IF ASSUMPTION SUPERVISOR PROJECTIONS DID NOT

10 MEET REALITY THERE WOULD BE A TRUE UP. NOW THROUGH NO ONE'S

11 FAULT THERE IS NO TRUE UP BECAUSE THERE IS NO ACTUAL DATA TO

12 BE ABLE TO MATCH THOSE PROJECTIONS WITH REALITY. AND IF

13 REALITY IS DIFFERENT THAN THE PROJECTIONS THEN WE'RE

14 ALLOCATING MONEY BASED ON SOMEONE'S INACCURATE PROJECTIONS AND

15 ONE THING WE KNOW ABOUT PROJECTIONS IS THEY'RE ALWAYS WRONG,

16 THE QUESTION IS JUST A QUESTION OF HOW MUCH. SO IT WOULD BE

17 HELPFUL AT LEAST TO ALLOW STAFF TO IDENTIFY THOSE DOLLARS AND

18 THE BOARD WILL STILL BE FREE TO VOTE ON THOSE DOLLARS HOWEVER

19 IT CHOOSES, BUT IN THE SENTENCE THAT IS CONTEMPLATED IS TO

20 ALLOW IDENTIFICATION OF THE FUNDING THAT IS DISCRETIONARY AND

21 FLEXIBLE MIGHT BE PROGRAMS SUCH AS STP OR CMAQ AND IF THEY ARE

22 CAPITAL RESTRICTED PERHAPS THERE COULD BE CONSIDERATION FOR

23 CAPITAL REPLACEMENT THAT COULD BE THAT AGENCIES COULD USE. BUT

24 IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WE NEED TO HAVE AN APPROACH THAT SAYS



Meeting Transcript

1 WE'RE GOING TO ACTUALLY ALLOCATE MONEY BASED ON THE REAL
2 NUMBERS NOT JUST BASED ON PROJECTIONS.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** STAN, I THINK THE WAY I REMEMBER YOUR
5 MOTION I THINK WE PRETTY MUCH ACCEPTED IT WITH THE CHANGE IN
6 YOUR AMENDMENT WAS THAT IT WOULD APPLY TO NEW MONEY ONLY.
7 THAT'S HOW I REMEMBER.

8

9 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES. INCLUDING SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING TO EXISTING
10 FEDERAL PROGRAMS IT'S NOT JUST MONEY WITH A NEW ACRONYM ON THE
11 BILL. THAT IS IF THERE IS SUPPLEMENTAL CMAQ MONEY, THAT THAT
12 WOULD BE FUNDING THAT COULD BE CONSIDERED. IS AGAIN IT WOULD
13 ALL BE SUBJECT TO.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PEDROZA?

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I'LL COMMENT
18 ON THE PPE AND EMPLOYEE SAFETY IS RIDERSHIP SAFETY. WAY I LOOK
19 AT RIDERSHIP IS YOU'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE INCREASED RIDERSHIP
20 UNLESS YOU HAVE SAFE SYSTEMS AND I CONCUR WITH SOME OF THE
21 COMMENTS, I THINK YOU HAVE OPERATORS WHO ARE MOTIVATED THEY
22 HAVE SAFE SYSTEMS TO RESTORE RIDERSHIP I SEE OUR ROLE AT MTC
23 TO LOOK AT IT FROM A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE. I SUPPORT THE
24 ACCOUNTABILITY REPORTING AND OVERSIGHT I FEEL THAT'S THE SPACE
25 MTC SHOULD BE PARTICIPATING IN BUT WE SHOULD BE EMPOWERING



Meeting Transcript

1 LOCAL OPERATORS TO ENSURE THEY'RE DOING AS MUCH AS THEY CAN.
2 WHAT THEY DO IN NAPA MAY BE DIFFERENT BUT IT'S ABOUT RESTORING
3 RIDERSHIP CONFIDENCE. I THINK OPERATORS ARE GOING TO TAKE IT
4 UPON THEMSELVES TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE INVESTING IN HAVING SAFE
5 SYSTEMS SO AGAIN I SUPPORT THE DIRECTION OF HAVING
6 ACCOUNTABILITY, HAVING REPORTING OUT TO MTC IN A VERY
7 TRANSPARENT WAY, AND THEN WE ACT BASED OFF THAT INFORMATION IF
8 WE'RE SEEING ANY GAPS BUT I DO THINK WE NEED TO DEPLOY THE
9 MONEY AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE ALL THE OPERATORS HAVE BEEN
10 COMING TOGETHER TO CROSS YOUR IDEAS OF WHAT THEY NEED TO DO TO
11 HAVE SAFE SYSTEMS SO I'LL SUPPORT THAT DIRECTION AND REGARDING
12 COMMENTS I THINK FUTURE FUND SUGGEST APPROPRIATE. I THINK
13 MAYOR LICCARDO IS RIGHT WE SHOULD LOOK AT TRUE UP BUT BEING
14 LOOKING AT EXISTING FUNDING AUGMENTS THAT WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT
15 WOULD BE THE NORMAL PROCESS TO LOOK AT EXISTING REVENUES.
16 THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.

19

20 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I WANTED TO ADD MY VOICE TO THAT OF
21 COMMISSIONER SPERING IS THE REMARKS HE MADE IN THE INTEREST OF
22 TIMELINESS. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE BREVITY.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** UNEXPECTED.

2

3 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YES IT WAS, QUITE SERIOUSLY.

4 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

5

6 **AMY R. WORTH:** I'LL BE BRIEF FIRST I WANT TO CONCUR WITH
7 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND COMMISSIONER PEDROZA'S COMMENTS. I
8 ALSO BELIEVE THAT PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY FOR OUR OPERATORS
9 AND RIDERS, OUR DRIVERS, OUR WORKERS ARE EXTREMELY IMPORTANT
10 IT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT THING WE'RE DOING. AND SO SERVING ON A
11 TRANSIT BOARD, I CAN AFFIRM THAT THESE ISSUES ARE EXTREMELY
12 IMPORTANT TO OUR BOARD AND IN FACT WE NORMALLY ARE TAKING A
13 BREAK IN AUGUST, AND WE HAVE -- WE HAVE SCHEDULED A MEETING SO
14 THAT WE CAN DO THE KIND OF ADOPTION THAT THIS COMMISSION AND
15 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ARE TALKING ABOUT IN TERMS OF A
16 RESOLUTION, IN TERMS OF AFFIRMATION OF THE HEALTH AND SAFETY
17 PROTOCOLS THAT WILL BE PUT IN PLACE. I ALSO CONCUR WITH THE
18 MOTION WITH REGARDS TO THE TRUE UP. BUT I DO THINK IT'S
19 IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THIS IS THE INTENTION OF THIS IS NEW,
20 NEW MONEY THIS IT'S NOT ANYTHING OTHER THAN THAT. SO, AND I
21 THINK THAT'S THE SPIRIT IN WHICH THIS HAS BEEN CONVEYED TO ME.
22 SO, AGAIN, I KNOW WE'RE IN A HUGE CHALLENGE BECAUSE NOBODY HAS
23 THE DATA UNTIL AFTER SEPTEMBER WHEN WE ACTUALLY SEE THE TRUE
24 UP NUMBERS. SO THANK YOU.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH.

2 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, BRING US HOME.

3

4 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I HAVE TO UNMUTE MYSELF BEFORE I DO
5 THAT. SO I THINK I PROBABLY RASHLY STRUCK THAT LAST SENTENCE.

6 SPIRIT OF THE AMENDMENT THAT MAYOR LICCARDO HAS CLARIFIED

7 WORKS FINE. IT'S WHAT WORKS WELL FOR ME, AND FOR -- BECAUSE

8 IT'S A FOCUS ON NEW MONEY, REGARDLESS OF WHETHER IT'S AN

9 EXISTING ACRONYM OR NEW ACRONYM AND I THINK THAT MAKES SENSE.

10 I ALSO HEARD THERE WAS AN AMENDMENT THAT YOU WERE ASKING FOR

11 CHAIR HAGGERTY, WHICH IS A MONTHLY REPORTING BACK TO MTC ON

12 THE STATUS OF THE OPERATORS PPE, ON THE STATUS OF HOW THE

13 OPERATORS ARE HANDLING PPE AND PUBLIC HEALTH MEASURES AS WELL

14 AS ON THE CASES OF COVID IN OUR TRANSIT AGENCY WORKFORCE AND

15 ON TRANSIT. IS THAT CORRECT, COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY?

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M SORRY. NICK, SOMEBODY -- I -- I

18 THINK YOU WRAPPED IT UP, RIGHT?

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY WHAT YOUR

21 REQUESTED AMENDMENT WAS AND THEN ASK COMMISSIONER SPERING

22 FIGURE HE WAS OKAY MAKING THAT. I THINK YOUR WAS MONTHLY

23 REPORTING BACK TO MTC ON THE PUBLIC HEALTH ACTIONS OPERATORS

24 HAVE TAKEN AND ON THE NUMBER OF NEW CASES OF COVID IN OUR



Meeting Transcript

1 TRANSIT AGENCY WORKFORCE AND THAT HAVE BEEN CONTRACTED ON
2 TRANSIT. IS THAT AN ACCURATE --

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THAT CORRECT. I'M ALSO -- AND I THINK
5 COMMISSIONER SPERING ALLUDED TO DOING THIS. BUT I DID WANT TO
6 MAKE SURE THAT THE TRANSIT BOARD PASSED RESOLUTIONS THAT SPEAK
7 TO SAFETY.

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES. OKAY.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR. SPECIFICALLY, WITH THE RECOMMENDATION OR SUGGESTION
13 ABOUT REPORTING ON SPECIFIC COVID CASES BY INDUSTRY, I JUST
14 WANT TO NOTE THAT WE WOULD WANT TO CHECK ON HIPPA AND OTHER
15 PROTECTIONS THAT ARE OFTEN PUT ON SUCH DATA. I UNDERSTAND
16 WHERE THE CONCERN IS COMING FROM, BUT CERTAINLY WOULD WANT TO
17 ENSURE THAT WE ARE NOT TRYING TO PURSUE INFORMATION THAT WOULD
18 BE OTHERWISE PROTECTED UNDER PUBLIC HOUSING, OTHER PRIVACY
19 LAWS. JUST WANTED TO SAY MAYBE WE NEED TO CHECK THAT OUT.
20 THERESE AS MAYORS AND COUNTY SUPERVISORS, WE'RE FULLY AWARE OF
21 HIPPA AND WHAT WE NEED TO REPORT BUT THAT DOESN'T STOP US
22 FROM GATHERING OTHER INFORMATION THAT WOULD BE RELEVANT.

23

24 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO TO THE BEST OF OUR ABILITY, I THINK,
25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -- SO COMMISSIONER SPERING, DOES THAT SOUND



Meeting Transcript

1 LIKE A -- DOES THAT SOUND LIKE A MOTION THAT MAKES -- THAT
2 SORT OF REFLECTS ISSUE YOU ARE AS WELL THAT YOU WANT TO UPDATE
3 YOUR SECOND.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I SUPPORT THE AMENDED CHANGES AND FORWARD MY
6 SECOND.

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TERRIFIC.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

11

12 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANTED TO CHECK WITH COMMISSIONER
13 LICCARDO TO SEE IF HE'S COMFORTABLE WITH THIS?

14

15 **SAM LICCARDO:** I AM. AND I APPRECIATE YOUR EFFORTS
16 COMMISSIONER.

17

18 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK WE GOT A MOTION AND SECOND, AND
19 IF ANYBODY IS CLEAR ON THAT, I THINK COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY,
20 EVERYBODY IS READY TO TAKE ROLL CALL.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR TAKING OVER COMMISSIONER
23 JOSEFOWITZ. YES. LET'S GO WITH THE ROLL CALL.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:**



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SORRY I HAVE TO UNMUTE MYSELF. [ROLL CALL VOTE].**

3

4 **>>JEANNIE BRUINS:** I BELIEVE THE LANGUAGE THERE ALREADY
5 ADDRESSED SAM LICCARDO'S CONCERN AND THERE WAS OPPORTUNITY TO
6 BE CLEAR ON THE DIRECTION BUT I WILL VOTE FOR IT JUST TO KEEP
7 US GOING.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL - CONTINUED].

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HOLD ON A SECOND KIMBERLY. SOMEBODY
12 NEEDS TO MUTE THEIR MICROPHONE. THEY'RE HAVING A CONVERSATION
13 WITH SOMEBODY OUTSIDE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. [ROLL CALL - CONTINUED]. THANK
16 YOU. MOTION PASSES.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CONGRATULATIONS. GOOD JOB BY THE
19 MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. SAM THANK YOU FOR CONTINUING TO
20 WORK IT. NEXT ITEM, COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I THINK WE'RE NOW ON TO 8A WHICH WILL BE
23 THE PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU'RE CORRECT. THAT'S WHAT HAPPENS
2 WHEN SOMEBODY PUTS A SANDWICH IN FRONT OF YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WORRIES.

5

6 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** LUCKY YOU.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DOOR DASH. GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER
9 SPERING.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. JOINT MTC PLANNING
12 COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET ON JULY
13 10TH AND THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE
14 COMMISSION FOR ITS APPROVAL. AND ITEM 8A WHICH IS PLANNED BAY
15 AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT KEY DECISIONS FOR THE TRANSPORTATION
16 ELEMENT. RECOMMENDS SPECIFIC REGION FALL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING
17 LEVELS TO THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA
18 2050. FINAL BLUEPRINT IN ADVANCE OF A BROADER STRATEGY
19 REFINEMENTS. MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE VOTED TO REFER THE
20 RECOMMENDATION TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND REQUESTED
21 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FROM STAFF ON WAYS TO ADVANCE TWO
22 PRIORITY MEGA PROJECTS. VALLEY LINK AND THE CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN
23 EXTENSION FROM PERIOD TWO TO PERIOD ONE OF THE PLAN. STAFF HAS
24 PREPARED OPTIONS FOR THE COMMISSION'S CONSIDERATION AND OUR
25 STAFF MATT MALONEY WILL GIVE A BRIEF PRESENTATION. AND MR.



Meeting Transcript

1 CHAIRMAN, AFTER THE PRESENTATION, I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
2 MOTION AND THEN OPEN IT UP FOR DISCUSSION.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY, MR. CHAIR, WE'LL DO THAT.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. MAT M OF PLANNING. I
7 WILL HAPPY TO BRIEF AND TRUNCATE THIS AND GET TO THE POINT IF
8 THAT'S OKAY WITH THE CHAIR AND COMMISSIONER SPERING.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THE CHAIR ALWAYS APPRECIATES THOSE
11 BEING BRIEF.

12

13 **MATT MALONEY:** FANTASTIC. I'LL SET THIS UP AND SPEED INTO THE
14 PRESENTATION AND GET TO THE OPTIONS. AT THE PLANNING COMMITTEE
15 IN JULY STAFF PRESENTED INFORMATION ON THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND PROVIDED AN ACTION ITEM ON KEY
17 DECISIONS FOR THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE PLAN. SO THE
18 CENTRAL FOCUS OF THIS ITEM IS MOVING FOREHEAD -- TOWARD A
19 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED SET OF INVESTMENTS OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS
20 TO BE ENCAPSULATED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 RECOMMENDATIONS ON
21 SPECIFIC REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING LEVELS FOR THE
22 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL
23 BLUEPRINT IN ADVANCE OF BROADER STRATEGY REFINEMENTS IN
24 SEPTEMBER OF 2020. SO EARLIER THIS MONTH THE ACTIONS OF THE
25 REFERRED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WITH REQUEST FOR



Meeting Transcript

1 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON HOW TO ADVANCE TWO PROJECTS AND
2 CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED IN THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION OF CALTRAIN
3 AND VALLEY LINK FOR THE FIRST TIME PERIOD OF THE PLAN. THIS IS
4 KNOWN AS PERIOD ONE PERIOD BETWEEN 2021 AND 2035 AND WE HAVE
5 BEFORE THE BOARD'S CONSIDERATION IS THREE OPTIONS TO
6 ACCOMPLISH THIS. I WOULD ASK THE SLIDES BE ADVANCED TO THE
7 NINTH SLIDE IS I'LL GO RIGHT TO THE OPTIONS. WE HAVE THREE
8 OPTIONS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION TODAY. AND SO I WILL START WITH
9 OPTION A. OPTION A ESSENTIALLY IS TO RETAIN THE INITIAL STAFF
10 RECOMMENDATION THAT WAS PROVIDED TO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE
11 EARLIER THIS MONTH. SO IT DOES TO THE ASSUME IN ADDITIONAL
12 FISCAL CAPACITY IN PERIOD ONE. IN THIS OPTION, THERE WOULD BE
13 FEWER PROJECT IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN TO MATCH THAT
14 FISCAL CAPACITY. WE ENVISION THAT ADVANCING PROJECTS TO PERIOD
15 ONE THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE CAN DO ADMINISTRATIVELY IT WOULD
16 REQUIRE NEW CONFORMITY ANALYSIS WHICH IS SOME EXTRA WORK. SOME
17 OF THE PROS HERE, THE PROJECTS WOULD BE EQUALLY ELIGIBLE TO
18 COMPETE FOR FUNDING AND MOVE FORWARD SO WHETHER OR NOT THE
19 PROJECT IS IN PERIOD ONE OR PERIOD TWO, IT IS A FISCALLY
20 CONSTRAINED PROJECT IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND I GUESS I
21 WOULD ALSO JUST LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT THE THIRD BULLET UNDER THE
22 PROS WHICH IS SIMPLY THAT THIS REFLECTS A MORE CONSERVATIVE
23 APPROACH TO FINANCIAL PLANNING IN A LONG RANGE EXPERIMENT.
24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN THE SECOND OPTION WE WOULD ADD FISCAL
25 CAPACITY IN PERIOD ONE. SO WE WOULD ESSENTIALLY TAKE ONE OF



Meeting Transcript

1 OUR EXPECTED REV FEW SOURCES, WHICH IS A \$0.01 WIDE COUNTY
2 SALES TAX MEGA MEASURE OPTION AND WE WOULD ADVANCE THAT INTO
3 THE FIRST PERIOD OF THE PLAN REFLECTING A BIT MORE OPTIMISTIC
4 APPROACH TO FINANCIAL PLANNING AND THE PROS ARE IT SHIFTS
5 CAPACITY TO THE EARLIER YEARS AND WOULD ALLOW US TO FISCALLY
6 CONSTRAIN THESE TWO PROJECTS THAT I MENTIONED FOR
7 CONSTRUCTION. IT POTENTIALLY ALLOWS FOR A LITTLE MORE FISCAL
8 CAPACITY WHERE WE COULD INCLUDE STRATEGIES TO ENABLE US TO GET
9 TO OUR GHG GOALS AND EQUITY OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE
10 THIRD OPTION WOULD BE TO NOT ADD ADDITIONAL FISCAL CAPACITY IN
11 PERIOD ONE BUT IT WOULD ESSENTIALLY BE TO SWITCH OUT PROJECTS
12 FROM PERIOD ONE TO PERIOD TWO IN ORDER TO CREATE MORE
13 CAPACITY. SO THIS WOULD DELAY SOME PROJECTS TO PERIOD TWO.
14 SOME OF THE PROS OF THIS OPTION IS IT WOULD REMAIN
15 CONSERVATIVE, DEPENDING ON THE PROJECTS ULTIMATELY THAT WOULD
16 BE SWAPPED OUT, IT COULD BE BENEFICIAL FOR THE PLAN IN TERMS
17 OF GHG EMISSIONS BUT ONE OF THE CONS OF THIS OPTION IS THAT
18 SOME OF THOSE PROJECTS MAY BE PRIORITY SUCH AS EXPRESS LANE OR
19 EXPRESS BUS NETWORK BILLED OUT PROJECTS THAT MIGHT HAVE GHG
20 CONCERNS AND THOSE WOULD HAVE TO BE ASSUME TO BE DELIVERED
21 LATER IN THE PLAN CYCLE. NEXT SLIDE. JUST TO SUM UP AND THEN I
22 CAN OPEN IT UP FE COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. WE'RE
23 SEEKING APPROVAL FOR ONE OF THE THREE OPTIONS TO GO ALONG WITH
24 A REFERRAL ON REGIONAL FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS TOWARD PROJECTS



Meeting Transcript

1 IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THAT
2 CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
5 PRESENTATION. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH, MR. CHAIRMAN, JUST FOR THE SAKE OF
8 TIME, I WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO APPROVE PLANNED BAY
9 AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT KEY DECISIONS FOR THE TRANSPORTATION
10 ELEMENT AS REVISED WITH OPTION D AS PRESENTED TODAY. THERE HAS
11 BEEN A LOT OF DISCUSSION, THOSE TWO PROJECTS HAVE A LOT OF
12 MERIT BUT I DON'T WANT TO GO INTO ALL OF THAT JUST DUE TO TIME
13 THAT'S THE MOTION MR. CHAIRMAN.

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** I'LL SECOND.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** UNDER DISCUSSION, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I WAS JUST WONDERING HERE,
20 CAN WE -- DOES THIS INCLUDE, MTC, THE DTX PHASE ONE OF THE
21 PLAN? BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO SUPPORT A RECOMMENDATION THAT IT
22 INCLUDE CALTRANS ENHANCED GROWTH SO I GOT A LITTLE LOST IN
23 THERE. WE WANTED TO TRY TO INCLUDE THAT, WHERE ARE WE -- WHICH
24 ONE DOES THAT FALL UNDER. SORRY.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **MATT MALONEY:** THE PROJECT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ESSENTIALLY IS
2 THE EXTENSION OF CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN EXTENSION INTO THE
3 SALESFORCE TRANSIT CENTER THAT PROJECT IS FISCALLY CONSTRAINED
4 IN THE PLAN THIS IS RECOMMENDATION, THIS IS ABOUT SEQUENCING
5 THE PROJECT AND MOVING IT EARLIER IN THE PLAN CYCLE. PLAN DOES
6 ALSO INCLUDE FREQUENCY BOOSTS FOR CALTRAIN, ALONG THAT
7 CORRIDOR. IT ASSUMES THE ELECTRIFICATION OF THAT. BUT ALSO
8 MOVING CALTRAIN UP TO ROUGHLY EIGHT TRAINS PER HOUR DURING THE
9 COURSE OF THE PLAN.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THAT'S WHAT I NEEDED TO HEAR. THANK YOU VERY
12 MUCH.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, OKAY, WE HAVE TEN ATTENDEES
15 THAT WISH TO SPEAK I'M GOING TO GIVE THEM ONE MINUTE EACH.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY AND ONCE THEY SPEAK I'LL READ THE
18 LETTERS RECEIVED. FIRST SPEAKER IS MARK ZEBATA.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU. THIS IS MARK ZEBATA, EXECUTIVE
21 DIRECTOR WITH THE TRANSBAY -- AUTHORITY THANK YOU CHAIR
22 HAGGERTY AND CONGRATULATIONS ON THE AWARD AND THANK YOU FOR
23 YOUR CONTINUED SUPPORT FOR TRANSPORTATION IN THE BAY AREA.
24 ALSO WANT TO THANK SUPERVISOR SPERING AND THE PLANNING
25 COMMITTEE FOR TAKING OUR CONSIDERATION. WE SUPPORT OPTION B.



Meeting Transcript

1 OPTION B ALLOWS DOWNTOWN EXTENSION AS WELL AS VALLEY LINK,
2 BOTH SIGNIFICANT PROJECT TO BE IN PERIOD ONE. AND THE
3 EXTENSION RECEIVED FULL ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCE IN MID-2019
4 WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH OUR DESIGN SO WE CAN BE CONSTRUCTION
5 READY IN THE NEXT THREE YEARS AND WITH ENOUGH FUNDING WE COULD
6 BE OPEN FOR OPERATIONS IN 2030 OR 2031. SO WE'RE VERY EXCITED
7 ABOUT THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR SUPPORT. I WANT TO BE
8 SPORT AND SWEET BECAUSE I KNOW IT'S BEEN A LONG MEETING FOR
9 YOU. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS PAUL AKINJO.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES, MA'AM. THANK YOU. CHAIRMAN HAGGERTY, AND THE
14 REST OF THE BOARD MEMBERS. I AM BASICALLY HERE REPRESENTING
15 VALLEY LINK TO BE MOVED TO OPTION ONE. THAT WAY WE CAN
16 CONTINUE TO INVEST, AS WE ALREADY DID, FOR INSTANCE, CITY OF
17 LATHROP, WE HAVE TO ADVANCE ALL OF OUR -- LINE AS WE SUPPORT
18 THE ECONOMY OF THE BAY AREA, WE, TOO, NEED THE SUPPORT FROM
19 THE BAY AREA GROUPS AND THE SAN FRANCISCO GROUP TOO. SO WE
20 NEED TO REALLY MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE THAT ARE LIVING, THE
21 VALLEY AS A WHOLE, THEY ARE NOT SHORT HANDED AS WE ARE
22 DEVELOPING, THINGS WOULD CHANGE, THE ECONOMY OF THIS AREA, THE
23 BAY AREA AS A WHOLE, BELIEVE IT OR NOT, DEPENDS -- THE FUTURE
24 DEPENDING ON THE VALLEY. SO IF THE VALLEY IS BEING SHORT
25 HANDED NOW, AND WE ARE PUSHED AWAY ALL THE WAY TO THE END OF



Meeting Transcript

1 BAY AREA 2050, YOU SEE VAL -- VALLEY LINK TO BE MOVED TO PHASE
2 ONE OF THE PROJECT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND LEBRUN.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS ROLAND QUICKLY ONE SET OF BAD NEWS AND THREE
7 SETS OF GOOD NEWS. BART -- ANOTHER \$2 BILLION IN THE LAST YEAR
8 SO IT NO LONGER BELONGS IN PERIOD ONE THIS'S THE BAD NEWS. AND
9 VTA OFFICIALS HAVE RECEIVED TO GET BACK DOWN TO 11 -- WE HAVE
10 A VERBAL FOR DTX AND PBX FOR LESS THAN \$1 BILLION INSTEAD OF
11 \$6 BILLION. AND THE LAST ONE IS WE HOPE TO HAVE ANOTHER
12 PROPOSAL BY THE END OF THE YEAR TO ADVANCE CAPITAL TRANSBAY
13 TUNNEL TO PERIOD ONE FOR LESS THAN \$3 BILLION. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ANTHONY
16 SIMMONS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS
19 ANTHONY SIMMONS DIRECTOR OF SMART AND CALTRAIN FIRST
20 APPRECIATE THE WORK OF STAFF AND COMMISSION TO ADVANCE PLANNED
21 BAY AREA 2050 TO THIS POINT IN ITS DEVELOPMENT WE APPRECIATE
22 INCLUSION OF CALTRAIN ENHANCED GROWTH PROJECT IN THE PLAN AND
23 WE APPRECIATE THE COMMISSION'S CONSIDERATION TO ADVANCE DTX
24 PROJECT AND CALTRAIN GROWTH PROJECT INTO PERIOD ONE OF THE
25 PLAN. IT WOULD BE SYMBIOTIC AND INTERTWINED FOR CREATING A



Meeting Transcript

1 REGION WITH ACCESS TO THE CORE OF SAN FRANCISCO. ELECTRIFIED
2 CALTRAIN SERVICE ENHANCED BY THE PROJECT FORTIFIES THE PROJECT
3 FOR FUNDING AND WOULD BE CRITICAL FOR THE PROJECT'S SUCCESS.
4 LEAD PROJECTS ARE INTERRELATED AND SHOULD BE ADVANCED TOGETHER
5 AS EXPEDIENTLY AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS ADINA LEVIN. AND PLEASE PUT THIS COMMENT
10 AS ADINA LEVIN AND NOT AS SEAMLESS -- A COUPLE OF COMMENTS
11 SUPPORTING OPTION B AND KEEPING THE ORDER WITH THE COST
12 EFFECTIVE BRS, BRT AND EXPRESS BUSES HAPPENING SOON BUT ALSO
13 HAVING A REGIONAL MEASURE WHICH HOPEFULLY OUR REGION WILL BAN
14 TOGETHER TO PASS IN ORDER TO ENABLE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION AND
15 CALTRAIN CAPACITY IMPROVEMENT TO BE MOVED FORWARD IN TIME
16 STRONGLY SUPPORTING MTC'S POLICIES TO MAKE SURE THAT EQUITY
17 MEASURES ENABLE THESE EXPENSIVE CAPITAL PROJECTS TO BE MADE
18 AVAILABLE TO MANY MORE PEOPLE ACROSS THE INCOME SPECTRUM, AND
19 ALSO TO BE WORKING ON A CAPITAL PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SO THAT
20 THESE THINGS CAN BE DONE COST EFFECTIVELY. LASTLY, IN TERMS OF
21 THE OPERATING FUNDING, I WILL BE COMING FORWARD WITH SEAMLESS
22 BAY AREA SCHEDULING MEETINGS WITH STAFF AND OUR VOICES WITH
23 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION PARTNERS ON SOME DISCUSSION ABOUT
24 INCREASING THE AMOUNT OF OPERATING FUNDING WHICH WE HAVE DONE
25 RESEARCH THAT WOULD INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND DEVELOP THE



Meeting Transcript

1 RULES OF THE PLAN. THAT'S SCHEDULES STAFF AND PARTNERS AND
2 FOLLOWING UP WITH TIME TO HAVE THAT BE CONSIDERED BEFORE YOUR
3 FINAL DECISIONS BUT OPERATING FUNDING MAKING SURE THAT THERE
4 IS GOOD FREQUENT SERVICE WILL BE IMPORTANT FOR THE RIDERSHIP
5 IN THE FUTURE LASTLY FOR A BALLOT MEASURE WE WILL BE WORKING
6 FOR IN SUPPORT OF A BALLOT MEASURE WITH PROGRESSIVE REVENUE
7 SOURCES WHICH WE HAVE TIME TO FLUSH OUT AND DEVELOP. THANK
8 YOU.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WE'RE ON ONE MINUTE, RIGHT?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE ARE.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ERIC CORDOVA.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR HAGGERTY
19 COMMISSIONERS ERIC CORDOVA DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR THE SAN
20 FRANCISCO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY HERE TO SUPPORT OPTION B I
21 WANT TO THANK CHAIR SPERING FOR MAKING THE MOTION. I WANT TO
22 THANK THE COMMISSION FOR PARTICIPATING IN THE EXECUTIVE
23 STEERING COMMITTEE THAT WE HAD OUR INAUGURAL MEETING LAST
24 FRIDAY REST ASSURED WE'RE EXPLORING WAYS TO EXPEDITE PROJECT
25 DEVELOPMENT WORK WORKING WITH PARTNER EXERCISE MAKING SURE WE



Meeting Transcript

1 ENSURE THE FULL NETWORK BENEFITS OF THE SYSTEM AND WE SEE THIS
2 AS SERVING AS THE POTENTIAL FIRST LEG OF THE TRANSBAY RAIL
3 CROSSING WHICH WILL INCREASE REGIONAL RATE TRANSIT FOR A DOZEN
4 OPERATORS AND PASSENGERS. HIGHLIGHTING BENEFITS THE PROJECT
5 WILL SERVE 90,000 RIDER TRIPS A DAY REDUCING CONGESTION ON
6 1011 OF THE MOST CONGESTED CORRIDORS IN THE REGION AND
7 REDUCING TONS OF MET ROC MITT METRIC TONS OF CO2.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS MAYOR JOHN MARCHON I WOULD LIKE TO URGE THE
12 COMMISSION TO ADOPT OPTION B TO BRING TO PHASE ONE THIS WILL
13 REDUCE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED BY 100 MILLION MILES PER YEAR
14 AND REDUCE 33,000 METRIC TONS OF GREENHOUSE GAS. YOU HAVE MY
15 LETTER IN YOUR PACKET AND I WOULD APPRECIATE IT AGAIN ADOPTION
16 OF OPTION B. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID SHONBRUN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M DAVID SHONBRUN PRESIDENT OF THE ASSOCIATION OF
21 TRAIN RIDERS OF CALIFORNIA. WE ARE RAIL ADVOCATES SO YOU WOULD
22 PROBABLY EXPECT US TO SUPPORT THE REG'S LATEST RAIL PROJECT
23 THE VALLEY LINK RAIL PROJECT HOWEVER WE DO NOT. WE HAVE A
24 LETTER IN THE PACKET EXPLAINING THE FACTORS THAT LEAD TO THAT
25 POSITION. LET'S START BY ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THERE IS ONLY ONE



Meeting Transcript

1 REASON THIS ITEM IS EVEN ON THE AGENDA TODAY. COMMISSIONER
2 CHAIR IS ATTEMPTING TO MUSCLE HIS PET PROJECT INTO THE FUNDING
3 QUEUE. OUR BIGGEST OBJECTION TO THIS PROJECT IS THAT 37
4 PERCENT OF ITS CAPITAL COST IS ESSENTIALLY A UTILITY
5 RELOCATION. THAT IS RIDICULOUS. MOVING OF THE FREEWAY TO MAKE
6 ROOM FOR THIS PROJECT DOES NOTHING FOR TRANSPORTATION. THAT
7 MAKES THE PROJECT DESIGN INHERENTLY WASTEFUL.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL IT TAKES 32,000 CARS OFF THE ROAD
10 TOO, AND IF ANY OF MY COMMISSIONERS FEEL MUFFLED, I APOLOGIZE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO SAY I'M SURPRISED WE DON'T WORK WITH DTX AS
15 AN EXAMPLE ARE THERE ANY PROPERTY OWNERS THAT ARE GOING TO
16 BENEFIT FROM VALLEY LINK PARTICIPATING AND PAY FOR IT DO WE
17 EXPECT VISITORS TO SUPPORT A ONE PERCENT INCREASE IN TAX AFTER
18 BEING DEVASTATED BY THE PANDEMIC AND THE NEW REQUIREMENTS OF
19 SOCIAL DISTANCING TO OPERATE BUSINESSES. I THINK THIS WHOLE
20 THING IS UNREALISTIC. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DOUG MANN.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS DOUG MANN. I AM A RESIDENT OF LIVERMORE AND I
25 AGREE WITH WHAT THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER SAID YOU MAY NOT HEAR



Meeting Transcript

1 DIRECTLY FROM RESIDENTS OF LIVERMORE EXPECT THROUGH FILTERS
2 BUT THERE IS GOING TO BE EXTREME OPPOSITION FROM VALLEY LINK.
3 MEASURE B HAS BEEN SHIFTED FROM ONE PLACE TO ANOTHER IT WAS
4 SUPPOSED TO GO FOR LIVERMORE'S BENEFIT WE WOULD LIKE THAT FOR
5 BUS SERVICE OR SOMETHING TO BENEFIT US INSTEAD VALLEY LINK IS
6 TRYING TO SOLVE THE COMMUTER TRAFFIC PROBLEM BY CREATING MORE
7 COMMUTERS. THAT DOESN'T HELP LIVERMORE WE DID NOT SIGN UP FOR
8 THIS. A LOT, IF EVEN A SMALL FRACTION OF THE EFFORT THAT IT'S
9 TAKEN TO GET VALLEY LINK THUS FAR WE'RE ENCOURAGING TO PUT IN
10 COMPANIES LIKE MINE TO KEEP WORKERS AT HOME A LITTLE MORE
11 OFTEN AND HAVE THEM TELECOMMUTE THE PROBLEM WOULD BE SOLVED AS
12 YOU KNOW IN TERMS OF THE FREEWAYS THE PROBLEM IS SOLVED AT THE
13 MOMENT DUE TO THE PANDEMIC LET'S KEEP IT THAT WAY LET'S MOVE
14 TOWARD TELECOMMUTING AND GET OFF THIS PROJECT. I DO SUPPORT
15 DTX MOVING TO PERIOD ONE. I DO NOT SUPPORT VALLEY LINK --

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS TIM SEBRANTI

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS TIM S. ON BEHALF OF THE BUSINESS
20 ORGANIZATIONS FOR THE INNOVATION OF TRI-VALLEY LEADERSHIP
21 GROUP SUPPORTING VALLEY LINK AND OPTION B I WANT TO START BY
22 THANKING MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND STAFF FOR LOOK AT THIS
23 ITEM IN THE LAST TWO WEEKS AND RECOMMENDING THIS OPTION WHICH
24 IS INTENDED TO SERVE 10,000 MORE LIVERMORE RIDERS ON A DAILY
25 BASIS. FOR PERIOD ONE TO ADDRESS JOBS HOUSING BALANCE AND



Meeting Transcript

1 OPTIONS FOR WHERE PEOPLE LIVE AND WORK FACILITATES GOODS
2 MOVEMENT AND SERVES TRANSIT ORIENTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING.
3 BOTTOM LINE CANNOT WAIT UNTIL 2035 TO RELIEVE CONGESTION IN
4 THE CORRIDOR. MAKING VALLEY LINK SHOVEL READY IDENTIFIED AS A
5 MAJOR CONNECTION BETWEEN BAY AREA AND SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY AND
6 RECENTLY ADOPTED STATE RAIL PLAN AND SHOULD BE PRIORITIZED
7 ACCORDINGLY IN MTC'S PLANNED BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS TESS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS THIS IS TESS L EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND I
13 ASK YOU TO LEND SUPPORT TO OPTION B. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS BOB.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SPEAK. VAUGHN. I WOULD GO
18 FOR OPTION C WHICH WOULD ALLOW YOU TO PICK AND CHOOSE
19 DIFFERENT PROJECTS AND GOING ALONG WITH WHAT THE CALTRANS
20 DIRECTOR WROTE UP, MOST OF THE THINGS THAT CONNECT TO THE
21 STATE RAIL PLAN AND THAT WOULD PROVIDE MAJOR RAIL SERVICES
22 THROUGHOUT NOT ONLY BAY AREA BUT THE MEGA REGION ARE EVEN
23 INCLUDED IN THE PERIOD ONE. I WOULD POINT OUT THE DOWNTOWN
24 EXTENSION, DUMBARTON, IMPROVEMENTS TO A SERVICE. BY THE WAY A
25 SERVICE COULD CONNECT WITH BART AND FREMONT AND REPLACE VALLEY



Meeting Transcript

1 LINK AT MUCH SMALLER COST AND PROVIDE MUCH BETTER
2 TRANSPORTATION FOR THE TRI-VALLEY. PREVIOUS SPEAKER MENTIONED
3 IT. THIS IS NOT HELPING TRANSPORTATION IN THE TRI-VALLEY THERE
4 IS A BUNCH OF NUMBERS THROWN AROUND BUT THE NEW RIDERS ON
5 VALLEY LINK IS LESS THAN 14,000 AND THE I-880 IS SUPPOSED TO
6 GROW BY 50,000. TRAFFIC IS EXPECTED TO BE AS BAD IN 2040 AS IS
7 THE CASE EVEN WITH VALLEY LINK IN THERE SOME OF THE OTHER
8 PROJECTS ARE JUST AS BAD. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS PETER STRAUSS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. PETER STRAUSS. ON THE BOARD OF SAN
13 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND ONE OF THE -- PART OF THE FRIENDS
14 OF DTX, I STRONGLY REASONABLE TO YOU SUPPORT THE
15 RECOMMENDATION TO MOVE DTX PROJECT INTO PERIOD ONE PROJECT
16 WITHOUT THE TRADEOFF WITH EXPRESS BUS LANES WHICH ARE ALSO
17 UNNEEDED. AS YOU PROBABLY KNOW, THE DTX IS SAN FRANCISCO
18 HIGHEST PRIORITY FOR MAJOR CAPITAL INVESTMENT AFTER THE
19 CENTRAL SUBWAY. WE HAVE ALREADY BUILT ESSENTIALLY A PIECE OF
20 THE PROJECT IN THE SALESFORCE TRANSIT CENTERS. IT'S ESSENTIAL
21 THAT WE COMPLETE THAT AND CALTRAIN AS THE BIGGEST POTENTIAL
22 FOR GROWTH AMONG ALL OF THE BAY AREA RAIL SYSTEMS AS IT
23 EVOLVES INTO A TRUE RAPID TRANSIT SERVICE. AS YOU KNOW, WE
24 HAVE BEEN INVOLVED, I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED WITH VOICES FOR
25 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN SUPPORT OF A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION



Meeting Transcript

1 MEASURE, WHICH WE HAD HOPED TO BE ON THE BALLOT THIS YEAR BUT
2 WE STILL HOPE TO BE ON THE BALLOT IN 2022, 2024. ONE POINT FOR
3 STAFF PLEASE DO NOT ASSUME THIS WILL BE A SALES TAX. WE
4 BELIEVE A PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCE WOULD BE FAR MORE
5 APPROPRIATE SALES TAX AS YOU NOTE WILL NOT FAREWELL IN
6 NOVEMBER OR IN THE FUTURE PROGRESSIVE SOURCES ARE MOVING
7 FORWARD IN THE FUTURE PATH. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DEREK HOLT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONERS, I'M SURE THAT. JPA CITIZEN ADVISORY
12 COMMITTEE AND WE STRONGLY ENCOURAGE COMMISSIONERS TO PLACE DTX
13 IN THE FIRST PERIOD OF PLANNED BAY AREA. YOU HAVE HEARD OUR
14 REQUEST FOR SUPPORT. WE HEARD FROM PRESENTERS OF VISION ZERO
15 WHO CONNECT REDUCTION IN TRAFFIC INJURIES AND FATALITIES WITH
16 THE SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS THAT DTX WILL BRING TO SAN FRANCISCO
17 SOLUTION TO THE PROBLEM IN THE GAP BETWEEN COMMUNITIES FOR
18 THOSE WHO CAN'T ACCESS DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. WE ARE AWARE OF
19 THE CURRENT FUNDING SUPPORT THAT SEEMS TO BE AVAILABLE RIGHT
20 NOW BUT MIGHT NOT BE AVAILABLE SHOULD CONSTRUCTION BE DELAYED.
21 IN CLOSING, BASED ON EVIDENCE I RESPECT AND ENCOURAGE TO PLACE
22 DTX IN THE FIRST PERIOD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

23



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GERALD K.
2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. NEXT SPEAKER IS MR. CAUTHIN, ARE YOU
3 THERE?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I'M THE PRESIDENT OF THE BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION
6 WORKING GROUP, AND WE HAVE BEEN STRONG SUPPORTERS OF DTX. YOU
7 KNOW FOR ALL THE OBVIOUS REASONS IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG
8 BENEFIT TO GET TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO HOWEVER THERE IS
9 ANOTHER THAT ISN'T TALKED ABOUT MUCH AND THAT IS IT WILL JOIN
10 IMMEDIATELY WITH TEN PASSENGER LINES AND 40 BUS LINES ALONG
11 WITH DIRIDON STATION IT WILL BECOME FIRST OR SECOND MOST
12 IMPORTANT SEAMLESS TRANSIT CONNECTION IN THE REGION. NOW WITH
13 RESPECT TO THE VALLEY LINK PROJECT, AS THE SPEAKER SAID
14 EARLIER ARE ACCORDING TO CALTRAIN THE AMOUNT OF TRAFFIC ON 580
15 WILL GO UP ABOUT 100,000 CARS A DAY, BY 2,040, AND THIS LITTLE
16 ONE -- MOST HE ONE TRACK SYSTEM WILL CARRY SOMEWHERE BETWEEN
17 14,000 RIDERS A DAY AND SOME SAY 28,000, BUT EVEN SO, THIS
18 WILL HAVE ABSOLUTELY NO EFFECT ON THE TRAFFIC IN -- THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JIM SCHMIDT.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M CALLING TO ENDORSE THE DTX
23 PROJECT MOVING TO PERIOD ONE, AND TO RETAIN THE VALLEY LINK
24 PROJECT IN PERIOD TWO. DTX IS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT
25 REGIONAL PROJECTS CONNECTING THE MOST IMPORTANT TRANSIT HUB IN



Meeting Transcript

1 THE REGION. IT CARRIES AN ESTABLISHED RIDERSHIP THAT IS NOT
2 EXPECTED FORECAST AND THERE ARE NO OTHER CONNECTIONS THAT WILL
3 ENABLE AS MANY DESTINATION CHOICES AS WOULD HAPPEN AT THE HUB
4 AT THE SALESFORCE CENTER. CONTRARY, THE TRI-VALLEY PROJECT IS
5 BASED ON A FLAWED ALTERNATIVE ANALYSIS THAT DID NOT CONSIDER
6 REAL ALTERNATIVES. DID NOT CONSIDER EVOLVING AUTONOMOUS
7 VEHICLE TECHNOLOGY, AND DID NOT CONSIDER THE LEVERAGE OF THE
8 PLANNED LANE MANAGED LANE PROJECTS IN THAT CORRIDOR. RIDERSHIP
9 IS ENTIRELY SPECULATIVE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE LAST SPEAKER IS
12 CATHERINE BAKER.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I AM AN AUTHOR OF THE LEGISLATION THAT
15 FOUNDED VALLEY LINK, AND THE ENTITY, AND I AM VISITING WITH
16 YOU TODAY TO URGE THAT IT BE MOVED TO PERIOD ONE, NOT ONLY
17 BECAUSE OF A SIGNIFICANT SUPPORT THAT THE LEGISLATION AND
18 VALLEY LINK HAVE BIPARTISAN SUPPORT AT LOCAL REGIONAL STATE
19 AND FEDERAL LEVEL OUR REGION AND CENTRAL VALLEY REGION THE
20 PROJECT ALSO HAS SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON OUR COMMUNITY. I THINK
21 DIFFERENT FOLKS IN PUBLIC COMMENT MAY HAVE DIFFERENT OPINIONS
22 ABOUT THAT BUT I STRONGLY BELIEVE IT WILL HAVE 30,000
23 RIDERSHIP A DAY AND 22,000 JOBS CREATED AND THE PROJECT IS FAR
24 ALONG AND WE RARELY SEE A PROJECT EVER THIS MAGNITUDE THIS FAR
25 ALONG SO QUICKLY. PRECISELY ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING WORK IS



Meeting Transcript

1 DONE AND IT'S READY FOR FINAL CONSTRUCTION AND DESIGN BY 2022
2 BUT PERHAPS THE STRONGEST REASON I WANT TO IMPART UPON MY
3 COLLEAGUES RESPECTFULLY TODAY IS BY NOT PUTTING IN PERIOD ONE
4 WE WOULD EFFECTIVELY BE TELLING THE NECK GENERATION THIS IS A
5 DECISION FOR YOU TO MAKE -- AND I BELIEVE IT NEEDS TO BE MADE
6 IN THIS GENERATION AND STRONGLY URGE THIS PROJECT TO BE
7 ALLOWED TO GO FORWARD.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MR. CHAIR, THAT WAS THE LAST
10 SPEAKER BUT I DO HAVE 16 LETTERS RECEIVED. I SHOULD READ INTO
11 THE RECORD.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ANDREAS KLOOFER FROM ALAMEDA
16 COUNTY BUILDING AND TRADE CONSTRUCTION COUNCIL. JIM WUNDERMAN,
17 BAY AREA COUNCIL. RON JERARD FROM -- COMMUNITY COLLEGE
18 DISTRICT, RICH CONSTANTINE, MAYOR CITY OF MORGAN HILL AND
19 ROLAND VELAZCO CITY OF GILROY JOINT LETTER CONGRESSWOMAN NANCY
20 PELOSI, JACKSON F. JAMES HUNG YE TSING. HOWARD WONG. STEVEN
21 LENTZA OF INNOVATION TRI-VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP. ROBERT OF
22 MUNI, DAVID SHONBRUN TRANSIT RIDERS OF ASSOCIATION OF
23 CALIFORNIA, TRI-VALLEY CHAMBER COMMERCE ALLIANCE,
24 ASSEMBLYMEMBER REBECCA, DARYL AND TONY TAVARES OF CALTRAIN.
25 THANK YOU KIMBERLY. THINGS ARE GOING TO BE BAD SO NO SENSE IN



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 TRYING TO FIX THEM THAT'S THE ARGUMENT WE'RE HEARING THESE
2 DAYS AND I'M AMAZED THAT PEOPLE GET ON AND REALLY DON'T KNOW
3 WHAT THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT. RIDERSHIP IS 32,000 PEOPLE, THAT
4 THEIR IS 90 SOMETHING THOUSAND PEOPLE COMMUTING OVER ALTAMONT.
5 YOU GO ON TODAY AND THE FIRST AREA LIT UP ALL RED BECAUSE OF
6 COMMUTE PATTERNS OVER THE ALTAMONT AND I AM AMAZED I WOULD
7 GIVE SOMEBODY CALLING FROM LIVERMORE SAYING THEY DON'T WANT IT
8 I CAN TELL YOU THEY MUST LIVE ON THE EDGE AND WHAT I MEAN BY
9 THAT, THEY LIVE CLOSE TO THE FREEWAY BECAUSE THE AMOUNT OF CUT
10 THROUGH TRAFFIC THIS WILL TAKE OFF LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS IN
11 LIVERMORE BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE CUTTING THROUGH THE ALTAMONT AND
12 PERHAPS I SHOULD SHOW YOU THE VIDEO OF THE GUY WHO HAS GIVEN
13 UP AND IS NOW RIDING HIS BIKE BECAUSE IT'S EASIER. THIS IS A
14 MUCH NEEDED PROJECT. I WOULD REMIND ALL OF YOU, ESPECIALLY
15 THOSE ON THE PENINSULA -- WELL, NOT THE PENINSULA -- ACTUALLY
16 NOT THE PENINSULA, BUT THE OAKLAND AREA THAT THIS IS A GOOD'S
17 MOVEMENT CORRIDOR, AND THE CONTAINER TRAFFIC IS SUPPOSED TO
18 TRIPLE BY 2030 OVER THE ALTAMONT SO THIS IS A WAY TO GET CARS
19 OFF THE ROAD, CLEAN THE ENVIRONMENT, IS ALSO BE ABLE TO MOVE
20 THE GOODS MOVEMENT OUT. SO HAVING SAID THAT, I THINK WHAT'S
21 REALLY INCREDIBLE HERE IS FOR THE FIRST TIME, I BELIEVE, EVER,
22 SAN JOAQUIN HAS ADOPTED A TOD POLICY AND THEY ARE GOING ALONG
23 THE SAME LINES AS MTC IS AS FOR AS HIGH DENSITY HOUSING NEAR
24 MASS TRANSIT STATION. SO THIS IS A GREAT PROJECT. IT'S WORTHY.
25 IT'S ACKNOWLEDGING THAT WE ARE A MEGA REGION. WE ARE NOT



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 SPENDING OUR MONEY IN SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY. WE WILL NOT. WE
2 CANNOT. AND BUT, WE ARE PROVIDING THE MONEY TO WOULD OUR
3 STATIONS AND OUR TRACK IN ALAMEDA COUNTY. I WOULD SAY THIS,
4 THAT THE CITY OF TRACY JUST PUT UP, I BELIEVE IT'S ABOUT \$20
5 MILLION IN LAND FOR A MAINTENANCE FACILITY. THEY'RE COMMITTING
6 TO HIGHER DENSITY HOUSING AROUND THEIR TRANSIT AGENCY, AROUND
7 THE TRANSIT. I MEAN, THERE IS A LOT GOING ON, AND THE SAN
8 JOAQUIN AREAS TRYING TO MIMIC A LOT OF THE THING MTC IS DOING
9 AND THE MENTION SALES TAX. WHEN WE STARTED 24 YEARS AGO WHEN I
10 FIRST GOT ON BOARD, ACE IN SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY THEY DID A LOT
11 OF THE LAY WORK SIMILAR TO WHAT WE'RE DOING NOW AND THIS TIME
12 IT'S OUR TURN THIS BALANCES OUT. IT'S A TRANSPORTATION PROJECT
13 IT COMPETES WELL IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I DIDN'T MUSCLE
14 STAFF TO MAKE THE NUMBERS LOOK GOOD FOR T I DIDN'T MUSCLE MY
15 COMMISSIONERS. I JUST AM SIMPLY ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THIS IS A
16 GOOD MEGA REGION PROJECT AND I WOULD SUPPORT YOUR AYE VOTE ON
17 THIS ITEM. SO THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CALL FOR THE VOTE, MR. CHAIRMAN. WE'RE
20 READY. JIM, I WOULD LIKE TO BUT I GOT A COUPLE OF
21 COMMISSIONERS WHO WANT TO SPEAK. I HAVE GOT DUTRA-VERNACI,
22 MACKENZIE AND PAPAN.

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES THIS IS THE REPRESENTATIVE FOR THE
25 CITIES OF ALAMEDA COUNTY, I JUST WANT TO LEND MY SUPPORT FOR



Meeting Transcript

1 OPTION B. SCOTT, YOU SPOKE SO PASSIONATELY JUST A MINUTE AGO.
2 SO I WON'T SAY ALL THE REASONS WHY, BECAUSE I THINK YOU
3 INCLUDED EVERYTHING IN YOURS. BUT I DID WANT TO SPEAK UP
4 BECAUSE I DID HEAR SOME OPPOSITION FROM FOLKS IN ALAMEDA
5 COUNTY, AND AS CITIES OF ALAMEDA COUNTY ARE IMPORTANT. SO
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE?

9

10 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** HI. I'LL BE BRIEF, MR. CHAIR. I JUST WOULD
11 LIKE TO REFLECT, AS ONE OF THE FOUNDING MEMBERS OF THE SMART
12 OPERATION IN SONOMA AND MARIN COUNTIES, THE FACT THAT
13 CALIFORNIA, CALTRANS HAS CALLED OUT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE
14 CALIFORNIA RAIL PLAN, AND I KNOW YOU ALL HAVE BEEN TALKING
15 ABOUT RAIL ITEMS IN THE SOUTHERN PART OF OUR REGION HERE, AND
16 I WOULD JUST REMIND YOU OF THE IMPORTANCE OF THE SMART
17 OPERATION AS PART OF AN OVERALL RAIL PLAN, AND I TO NOT
18 BELIEVE THAT IT SHOULD BE NEGLECTED, AND I BELIEVE YOU HAVE
19 LETTERS THAT REFLECT THAT. SO THANK YOU.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.
22 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE
25 THAT THIS IS AN EXTREMELY POSITIVE MOVE AND THAT IT DOES



Meeting Transcript

1 BENEFIT THE PENINSULA AS WELL, OPENING UP THE CORRIDOR INTO
2 THE MEGA REGION IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO ALL OF US, AS WELL,
3 ALONG WITH ALL THE PRINCIPLES THAT MTC IS SUPPORTING. WE NEED
4 TO STOP THE SOLE CRUSHING COMMUTES, AND WE NEED TO PROVIDE
5 ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR HOUSING AND GETTING PEOPLE BACK
6 AND FORTH, AND I THINK THIS IS A GOOD PLAN. THANK YOU SIR.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, I HAVE NO OTHER
9 SPEAKERS, ATTENDEES OR PANELISTS SO I'M GOING ASK FOR A ROLL
10 CALL VOTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABSOLUTELY. HAGGERTY.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HOLD ON ONE SECOND. I'M GOING TO ASK,
15 IS EVERYBODY CLEAR ON THE MOTION?

16

17 **AMY R. WORTH:** YEP.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. GO AHEAD.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THE MOTION PASSES.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YOU DIDN'T CALL SPERING, MADAM CLERK. AYE
24 FOR SPERING.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU TO THE COMMISSIONERS. I ALSO
2 WANT TO THANK STAFF. GREAT WORK. CERTAINLY APPRECIATE
3 EVERYTHING YOU GUYS DID AND LISTENING TO THE COMMISSION AT OUR
4 LAST MEETING AND REALLY, I THINK PUTTING TOGETHER A GREAT
5 PLAN. SO I CERTAINLY APPRECIATE IT. I'M SURE MY FELLOW
6 COMMISSIONERS APPRECIATE STAFF AND ALL THE HARD WORK YOU HAVE
7 DEFINITELY PUT INTO THIS. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO MOVE TO THE
8 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE CHAIRED BY CHAIRMAN MACKENZIE.

9

10 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MR. CHAIR, THANK YOU, THIS IS THE UNENVIABLE
11 POSITION OF BEING LAST OF A VERY LONG MEETING WE HAVE HAD
12 TODAY SO I WILL DO MY BEST TO GET US THROUGH THIS. THIS IS A
13 REPORT OF A JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG
14 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. JULIE PIERCE CHAIRS THE ABAG
15 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. WE'RE STILL TWO SEPARATE BODIES. AGENDA
16 ITEM NUMBER NINE, WE DID MEET ON JULY 10TH AND WE REFERRED
17 FOUR ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. YOU HAVE ALREADY
18 APPROVED TWO OF THESE IN THE CONSENT CALENDAR BRINGS US TO
19 AGENDA ITEM 9A SENATE BILL 902 WIENER STREAMLINING TOOL
20 CREATES AN OPTIONAL TOOL FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS UNDERLYING THE
21 OPTION FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO STREAMLINE UPZONING IN TRANSIT
22 LOCATIONS JOB RICH URBAN INFILL SITES AND I MOVE A SUPPORT
23 POSITION ON SENATE BILL 902.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** QUESTION.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HOLD ON.

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SECOND.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SECOND.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** PAPAN DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANT TO BE CLEAR, ON JURISDICTION THAT HAVE
11 ALREADY DONE THIS, I DON'T KNOW WHY WE WOULD NEED LEGISLATION
12 TO ALLOW JURISDICTION TO DO EXACTLY WHAT WE HAVE ALREADY DONE.
13 IS THERE A REASON FOR THIS? I'M NOT CLEAR ON WHY THIS EVEN
14 EXISTS.

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** THIS IS REBECCA LONG IF I WOULD LIKE ME TO
17 RESPOND TO STAFF.

18

19 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SORRY REBECCA, I SHOULD HAVE IMMEDIATELY
20 CALLED UPON YOU.

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** NO PROBLEM COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE WHAT THIS BILL
23 DOES IS IN ESSENCE ALLOWS FOR UPZONING ITSELF FOR UP TO TEN
24 UNITS PER PARCEL TO BE CEQA EXEMPT. SO IT'S SPECIFICALLY, AS
25 YOU ARE AWARE SOME REZONING DO REQUIRE CEQA AND THIS IS SAYING



Meeting Transcript

1 THE REZONING IS NOT SUBJECT TO CEQA AT THE DISCRETION OF LOCAL
2 JURISDICTION IN ACCELERATING REZONING TO MEET NEEDS.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** FOR CLARIFICATION IF WE HAVE ALREADY REZONED AND
5 WE HAVE DEVELOPMENT THAT'S ALREADY IN THE PROCESS RIGHT NOW
6 DOES THE DEVELOPER GET TO SAY THEY DON'T HAVE TO COMPLY WITH
7 CEQA?

8

9 **REBECCA LONG:** NO. THIS DOES NOT RELATE TO -- AS YOU MENTIONED
10 IF YOU HAVE ALREADY REZONED AND YOUR REZONING MEETS YOUR NEEDS
11 THERE'S NOTHING YOU NEED TO DO, THIS IS JUST A TOOL FOR
12 JURISDICTION THAT MIGHT IDENTIFY SOME SITES THAT THEY WOULD
13 LIKE TO REZONE UP TO TEN UNITS PER PARCEL. IT'S ABOUT
14 STREAMLINING THE ZONING PROCESS ITSELF.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER.

19

20 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** BRUINS TO KEEP IT SHORT RATHER THAN ASKING MY
21 QUESTIONS I'M GOING TO BE VOTING NO ON THIS BUT MY PRIMARY
22 CONCERNS BEING THAT THE ORDINANCE IS THE SB 902 IS SILENT ON
23 WHETHER OR NOT THERE HAS TO BE CONSISTENCY BETWEEN -- AND A
24 GENERAL PLAN. AND SO BY BEING SILENT IT LEAVES THE ORDINANCE
25 AND ITS RELATIONSHIP TO THE GENERAL PLAN UP TO INTERPRETATION



Meeting Transcript

1 AT THE LOCAL LEVEL AND THEREFORE, WHEN YOU DO THAT, IT
2 SUBJECTS THE LOCAL TO LEGAL CHALLENGES IN TERMS OF THEIR
3 ACTIONS SO IF A CITY IS DOING THIS CORRECTLY, THEY WOULD HAVE
4 TO BE UPDATING THEIR GENERAL PLAN AS WELL. SO I GUESS I WOULD
5 LIKE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE INTENT OF THAT IS BUT WITHOUT THAT
6 I WILL VOTE NO. ADDITIONALLY, IT'S NOT CLEAR AS TO WHETHER OR
7 NOT WHAT THE INTENT IS RELATIVE TO CEQA. CEQA IS JUST THE
8 RELIEF THEY'RE GETTING IS JUST FOR DOING THE ORDINANCE IS DOES
9 IT ALSO GIVE RELIEF IF YOU ARE DOING A GENERAL PLAN THE LAW
10 SPEAKS DIFFERENTLY TO THAT, AND IS IT -- CAN A CITY CHOOSE TO
11 DO CEQA ANYWAY? OR IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO BE
12 FROWNED UPON? AND THEN THE LAST THING IS, IN TERMS OF -- IT
13 SAYS THE BILL AUTHORIZES THE LOCAL GOVERNANCE TO PASS A BILL
14 NOTWITHSTANDING LOCAL RESTRICTIONS ON ADOPTING ORDINANCE I
15 ASSUME THIS INCLUDES RESTRICTIONS ENACTED BY LOCAL VOTER
16 INITIATIVE AND MY QUESTION IS WHETHER THAT'S LEGAL AND BY NOT
17 CALLING OUT SPECIFICALLY DOES IT LEAVE LOCAL JURISDICTION OPEN
18 TO LEGAL ACTION?

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** REBECCA?

21

22 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS, IF THERE IS
23 ENLIGHTENMENT BY STAFF THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I CAN TRY TO SHED LIGHT ON
2 THAT. WITH RESPECT TO THE GENERAL PLAN, I THINK THIS IS
3 CONCEIVED AS AN OVERLAY TO YOUR EXISTING ZONING. AND SO THE
4 ORDINANCE THAT WOULD BE CEQA EXEMPT WOULD BE LIMITED TO AN
5 ORDINANCE THAT UPZONED UP TO TEN UNITS PER PARCEL. SO IF YOU
6 WERE DOING ALL KINDS OF OTHER CHANGES TO YOUR GENERAL PLAN
7 THAT WOULD NOT -- LET'S SEE WITH REGARD TO WHETHER IT'S AN
8 OPTION, IF A JURISDICTION IS DOING AN UPZONING ANYWAY, YOU DO
9 NOT HAVE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE STREAMLINING TOOL. SO AGAIN,
10 IT'S AT THE LOCAL JURISDICTION'S DISCRETION. AND THEN YOU ARE
11 CORRECT THAT THE INTENT OF THE LEGISLATION IS TO OVERRIDE
12 POTENTIAL VOTER APPROVED RESTRICTIONS RELATED TO UPZONING. SO
13 THIS IS TO ALLOW THE LOCAL JURISDICTION, IF THEY DETERMINE
14 THAT IT WAS APPROPRIATE TO UPZONE, TO DO THAT EVEN IF THERE
15 HAVE BEEN SOME RESCUE -- HISTORIC RESTRICTIONS.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** DOESN'T THE ORDINANCE HAVE TO BE CONSISTENT
18 WITH A GENERAL PLAN OR DOES THIS MEAN -- DOES THIS BILL SAY IT
19 DOES NOT HAVE TO BE?

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING SINCE ZONING IS
22 ESSENTIALLY PART OF YOUR GENERAL PLAN FRAMEWORK THAT THIS IS
23 ESSENTIALLY AN OVERLAY SO IT COULD MODIFY THE ZONING IN YOUR
24 EXISTING GENERAL PLAN.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY JEANNE?

2

3 JEANNIE BRUINS: YEAH.

4

5 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: SO I HAVE NO OTHER SPEAKERS ON THE
6 PANELIST SIDE. I SEE NO ATTENDEES. KIMBERLY ANY LETTERS?

7

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: OKAY WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO A ROLL CALL
11 VOTE.

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THAT MOTION DOES NOT
14 PASS. THERE ARE NINE AYES AND FOUR NAYS.

15

16 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: THAT MOTION DOES PASS.

17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OH.

19

20 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: NINE PEOPLE VOTE --

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OH I'M SORRY. IT DOES PASS.

23

24 SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR: [LAUGHTER] YOU WERE JUST CHECKING ME TO
25 SEE IF I WAS PAYING ATTENTION. COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THANK YOU FOR PAYING ATTENTION. GENERAL
3 ASSEMBLY BILL, LOCAL INCENTIVE TO AUTHORIZE FOURPLEXES BY
4 RIGHT AND SINGLE FAMILY ZONES WITH ACCOMPANYING CREDIT AROUND
5 THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION. THERE WAS A REQUEST AT
6 MEET TO CONCUR WITH THE EMERGENCY PROCEDURE TO COMMUNICATE A
7 POSITION ON THIS BILL PRIOR TO TODAY'S COMMISSION MEETING. I
8 INDICATED MY CONCURRENCE. THIS IS IN CONFORMANCE WITH OUR
9 RESOLUTION NUMBER 1058 AS REVISED AND THE PROCEDURES MANUAL.
10 SO THAT HAPPENED. I NOW MOVE A SUPPORT AND SEEK AMENDMENT
11 POSITIVE ON A.B. 3040 TO LIMIT THE INCENTIVE TO HOMES AT LEAST
12 25 YEARS OR OLDER, I SO MOVE.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. SECOND ANYWHERE?

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH. SPERING.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I GOT A SPERING --
19 [LAUGHTER] I GOT A SPERING. I GOT A SECOND BY SPERING. I SEE
20 NO ATTENDEES WISHING TO SPEAK. DO YOU HAVE ANY LETTERS?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO SIR, NO PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL PLEASE.

25



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. THANK YOU. MOTION
2 PASSES.

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I BELIEVE MR. CHAIR, THAT THAT BRINGS ME TO
5 THE END OF MY COMMITTEE REPORT. AND I JUST WANT Y'ALL TON THAT
6 I'M DOING THIS IN MY 31st WEDDING ANNIVERSARY AND I'M ABOUT TO
7 GET MY HEAD HANDED TO ME ON A PLATTER.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CONGRATULATIONS.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SOME OF US, JAKE, COULD SUPPORT THAT.

12

13 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** [LAUGHTER] BUT IT AIN'T GONNA HAPPEN BUDDY.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SO GO DO IT. OKAY.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SOMEBODY DESERVES A MEDAL AND IT ISN'T JAKE.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ITEM TEN PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK

20 KIMBERLY TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT

21 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM THAT CAME INTO BAY AREA IN, I ASK IF

22 YOU WISH TO SPEAK USE YOUR RAISED HAND ICON OR DIAL STAR NINE.

23 KIMBERLY ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS?

24



Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR THIS
2 ITEM BUT THERE ARE THREE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
3 HANDS RAISED. I WILL CALL UPON THEM. ROLAND L.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS ROLAND. I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THE
6 MEETING REFERRED TO. LAST FRIDAY I WAS NOT NOTIFIED ABOUT IT
7 WAS FROM SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING ON MONDAY THE AFTERNOON.
8 CONTACTED ACCESS WEBEX VIDEO ARCHIVE SERVICE AND TOLD THEE
9 MEETINGS ARE NOT ARCHIVED AND I WAS TOLD THERE IS NO RECORDING
10 I SHOULD READ THE MINUTES WHEN THEY'RE AVAILABLE.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THAT'S NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** NO IT ISN'T. REASON I'M ADDRESSING THE COMMISSION IS
15 TO ASK THAT MTC ASSUME RESPONSIBILITY FOR RECORDING THIS
16 MEETINGS, STARTING BY MOVING THE TELECONFERENCES FROM THE
17 WEBEX TO THE ZOOM PLATFORM. I'M ALSO REQUESTING THAT THE
18 COMMISSION COUNCIL AGENDIZING THESE MEETINGS ON MTC REGISTER
19 PLATFORM.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU I'LL ASK OUR EXECUTIVE
22 DIRECTOR TO LOOK AT THAT AND SEE IF THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN
23 ACCOMMODATE. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS DUANE.



Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M ADDRESSING THE FACT, I ATTEMPTED
3 TO GET ON FOR THE 9:00 A.M. MEETING, AND THE -- I GUESS MY
4 TELEPHONE WOULDN'T WORK BUT JUST AS A GENERAL OBSERVATION
5 ABOUT ALL OF THIS LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE WORK, IS THAT WE HAVE
6 SACRAMENTO WANTING TO DEAL WITH THE PROBLEM, WHICH IS REALLY
7 JOBS, HOUSING IMBALANCE. AND INSTEAD OF DEALING WITH THAT
8 PROBLEM, THEY WANT TO SHOVE THE ABILITY FOR DEVELOPERS TO
9 BUILD BASICALLY SLUMS IN THE NORTH BAY BECAUSE IT'S BUILDING
10 TOO MUCH BUSINESS IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND WHEN I SAY SLUMS, I
11 MEAN HOUSING THAT DOES NOT HAVE FOOD. THAT DOES NOT HAVE SUPER
12 MARKETS WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE FOR THE CHILDREN DOES NOT HAVE
13 PARKS, DOES NOT HAVE PLAY GROUNDS DOES NOT HAVE SAFE ACCESS TO
14 SCHOOLS WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE WHY WOULD WE BE SUBSIDIZING
15 TRANSPORTATION OR BUILDING EVER HOUSING OR CHANGING OF RULES
16 THAT ALLOW THAT? THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE LAST SPEAKER IS KEN
19 BUKOWSKI.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. HI. I WANT TO REINFORCE THE POINT THEY MADE
22 EARLIER, PROPERTY OWNERS GET SUBSTANTIAL FINANCIAL BENEFIT FOR
23 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AND WHY AREN'T WE LOOK TO THEM FOR
24 NEW TRANSPORTATION MONEY INSTEAD OF TAXING THE PUBLIC? I MEAN,
25 WE HAVE PEOPLE THAT CAN'T AFFORD PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THEN WE'RE



July 22, 2020

Meeting Transcript

1 SUBSIDIZING PROPERTY OWNERS WITH TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS.
2 I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE A LOOK AT HOW TRANSPORTATION IS
3 FUNDED. THANK YOU.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I AGREE SOMEWHAT WITH MR. BUKOWSKI IN
6 THAT HOUSING THAT IS BEING BUILT RIGHT NOW PAY A FEE INTO
7 FUNDING FOR TRANSPORTATION FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY. WHAT DO YOU
8 THINK OF THAT? END OF PUBLIC COMMENT. NEXT MEETING SCHEDULED
9 TO BE HELD ON AUGUST 26th 2020375 BEALE STREET OR REMOTELY BY
10 WEBCAST DEPENDING ON WHAT'S HAPPENING. ANY CHANGES TO THE
11 SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED TO THE PUBLIC. I WANT TO THANK MY
12 COLLEAGUES FOR JOINING. [ADJOURNED

13