



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again

Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.

(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*

To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

ABAG HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE

THURSDAY, JULY 9, 2020, 2:00 PM

JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR: WELCOME TO THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE ABAG HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. IN LIGHT OF GOVERNOR NEWSOM'S STATE OF EMERGENCY DECLARATION REGARDING THE COVID-19 OUTBREAK AND IN ACCORDANCE WITH EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM ON MARCH 17TH, 2020, AND THE GUIDANCE FOR GATHERINGS ISSUED BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH. THIS MEETING IS BEING CONDUCTED VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND ZOOM, VIDEO CONFERENCE FOR COMMITTEE, COMMISSION, AND BOARD MEMBERS WHO WILL BE PARTICIPATING IN THE MEETING FROM INDIVIDUAL REMOTE LOCATIONS. FRED, GIVE ME A ROLL CALL, THEN I'LL FINISH THE REST OF IT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. SUSAN ADAMS?

SPEAKER: SORRY WAS THAT JOSH ABRAMS? THERE WAS AN ECHO. JOSH ABRAMS IS HERE. SUSAN ADAMS IS ABSENT. ANITA ADDISON?

SPEAKER: HERE. JESSE ARREGUIN? I SEE YOU. RUPINDA? RICK BONILLA? MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WERE. ENCOURAGED TO PARTICIPATE HERE. MIKE B?

SPEAKER: HERE.



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MONICA BROWN.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AMANDA BROWN STEVENS? PAUL CAMPOS?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ELLEN CLARK?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HERE. DIANE DILLON? FORREST EBBS IS ABSENT. PAT
12 EKLUND? SHE IS MUTED, BUT I SEE HER.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SHE IS HERE. YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JONATHAN FEARN IS ABSENT. VICTORIA FIERCE?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEYSA FLIGOR?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GENTRY?

25

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE. RUSSELL HANCOCK IS ABSENT. WELTON JORDAN?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BRANDON KLINE? JEFFRY LEVIN?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCOTT LITTLEHALE IS ABSENT. TANYA M?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE YOU. FERNANDO MARTI?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RODNEY NICKENS?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JAMES P?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JULIE PIERCE? HERE. BOB PLANTHOLD? I DON'T
2 KNOW IF HE'S HERE. I DON'T SEE HIM. DARIN RANELLETTI?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. DARIN IS HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MATT REGAN IS ABSENT. JANE
7 RILEY?

8

9 **JANE RILEY:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLOS ROMERO?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE. SEMONIAN?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AARTI --

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BEN SMITH IS ABSENT. MATT WALSH?

22

23 **MATT WALSH:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **SPEAKER:** DIANE DILLON JOINED.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** I WOULD LIKE TO READ THE REST OF THE
7 ADVISORY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WERE ENCOURAGED TO PARTICIPATE
8 THROUGH ZOOM. AN ATTENDEE LINK WAS PROVIDED ON OUR PUBLISHED
9 AGENDA AS WELL AS A TELEPHONE NUMBER FOR ATTENDEES TO
10 PARTICIPATE BY PHONE. DETAILS AND INSTRUCTIONS FOR
11 PARTICIPATING THROUGH ZOOM ARE AVAILABLE ON THE ABAG WEB SITE.
12 FOR THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT YOUR
13 APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY
14 PARTICIPATE BY PHONE OR BY ZOOM, OR MAY SUBMIT COMMENTS BY E-
15 MAIL TO INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE
16 SCHEDULED MEETING DATE. DUE TO CURRENT CIRCUMSTANCES THERE MAY
17 BE A LIMITED OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS COMMENTS DURING THE
18 MEETING. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE POSTED
19 ONLINE AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ ALOUD.
20 AND AUTHORS OF WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK
21 MAY DO SO DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PORTION ON ITEMS ON THE
22 AGENDA. QUORUM IS PRESENT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST.
23 STAFF AND MEMBERS PLEASE SPEAK CLEARLY AND IDENTIFY YOURSELF.
24 COMMITTEE MEMBERS IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE IDENTIFY
25 YOURSELF, USE THE RAISED HAND ICON OR DIAL STAR NINE. CHAT

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FEATURE IS IN FULL PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THOSE WHO WISH TO SPEAK
2 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU. ROLL
3 CALL VOTE FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS ON THE AGENDA. PROCESS FOR
4 VOTING FOR TELEPHONIC PARTICIPATION, THE CLERK WILL CONDUCT A
5 ROLL CALL VOTE AND REPORT THE VOTE OR ABSTENTION OF EVERY
6 MEMBER PRESENT. GIVEN THE LIMITED AMOUNT OF TIME WE HAVE TODAY
7 AND THE ATTENDEES WHO WISH TO COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS,
8 I'M GOING TO USE THE CHAIR'S PREROGATIVE AND MOVE THE NON-
9 AGENDA MATTERS TO THE END OF THE MEETING. WE'RE GOING TO GO TO
10 THE CHAIR'S REPORTED. IN THE PACKET WERE THE MEETING NOTES
11 FROM THE LAST MEETING. CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FROM HMC
12 MEMBERS AND THE PRESENTATION FOR TODAY. A NEW MORE
13 ANNOUNCEMENTS I WANT TO MAKE. I WANT TO EXPRESS MY
14 APPRECIATION TO ALL OF YOU. WE'RE TOWARDS THE END OF OUR
15 PROCESS AND I RECOGNIZE PARTICULARLY GIVEN DISCUSSION LAST
16 TIME THIS IS A COMPLEX AND CHALLENGING PROCESS. AND I WANT TO
17 EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION ON BEHALF OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
18 FOR ALL THE WORK YOU'RE DOING BECAUSE IT BENEFITS OUR ENTIRE
19 AREA AND ITS RESIDENTS. AS USUAL WE HAVE A PACKED AGENDA.
20 WE'RE NOT PLANNING ON TAKING A FORMAL BREAK TODAY. WE HAVE
21 HEARD ALL OF THE SUGGESTIONS SUPPORTING HOW TO TAKE QUESTIONS
22 IN SUPPORT OF DISCUSSIONS BUT WE LIMITED TECHNOLOGY AND
23 SUPPORT TO ASSIST. PLEASE LIMIT COMMENTS WHEN OTHERS HAVE NOT
24 YET HAD A CHANCE TO SPEAK. WE HAVE MADE MODIFICATIONS TO OUR
25 CONSENSUS PROCESS SO IT'S TRANSPARENT TO THE AUDIENCE. I WOULD

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE VICTORIA FIERCE ON LEGISLATION UPDATE I
2 HAVE DISCUSSED WITH STAFF AND WILL BE PROVIDING ADVISEMENT
3 FROM HMC MEMBERS. NEXT ITEM IS ABAG HOUSING METHODOLOGY
4 MINUTES OF JUNE 19, 2020. IS THERE A MOTION?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MOVED BY BONILLA.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** A SECOND?

9

10 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** I'LL SECOND IT.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MINUTES OF JUNE
13 19TH, 2020? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE.
14 DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. MR. CASTRO ANY
15 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** SEEING NO RAISED HANDS FROM ATTENDIES.
20 CALL THE ROLL.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** OKAY MOTION CARRIES, COLLEAGUES. OKAY
25 SO NOW WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE PRESENTATION. AND MY

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 UNDERSTANDING IS THAT WE'LL TAKE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS AFTER
2 EACH PRESENTATION AND SAVE THE MORE SUBSTANTIVE DISCUSSION
3 UNTIL AFTER ALL THREE PRESENTATIONS. ITEM FIVE PLANNED BAY
4 AREA 2050 KEY DRAFT FINDINGS. A PRESENTATION ON THE FINAL
5 DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS HIGHLIGHTING SHORTCOMINGS AND
6 STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS UPCOMING FOR ABAG AND MTC. DAVE VAUTIN
7 WILL GIVE THE REPORT. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON. I WOULD
8 ASK STAFF TO PULL UP THE SLIDE TECH. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE
9 I'M DAVE VAUTIN. WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
10 AND RHNA PROCESS THIS AFTERNOON. I WISH YOU AND YOUR FAMILIES
11 GOOD HEALTH AT THIS TIME AND WE'RE READY TO DIVE INTO A VERY
12 SUBSTANTIVE MEETING TODAY. BEFORE I GET INTO THE SLIDES I WANT
13 TO GIVE SOME OVERARCHING THOUGHTS FOR YOU ALL TO CONSIDER AS
14 YOU GO THROUGH THE MATERIAL TODAY. YOU MIGHT BE NATURALLY
15 ASKING GIVEN HMC IS ALL ABOUT RHNA WHY ARE WE DOING A DEEP
16 DIVE PRESENTATION ON THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR ALL OF YOU. THIS
17 IS A REFRESHER, STATE REQUIREMENTS CONSISTENTLY WITH RHNA IN
18 THIS CASE WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WE SHARED A BIT ON THE
19 CONSISTENCY REQUIREMENTS TOWARDS THE END OF LAST YEAR WE CAME
20 BACK IN FEBRUARY AND MARCH TO SHARE THE APPROVED STRATEGIES
21 AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT THAT ACTION BY
22 MTC AND ABAG BOARDS MORE CLOSELY LINED WITH THE PLANNED BAY
23 AREA 2050 PROCESS WITH MANY KEY ISSUES BEING EXPLORED IN RHNA.
24 EXAMPLES INCLUDE INTEGRATION OF HIGH RESOURCE AREAS TRANSIT-
25 RICH AREAS HAZARDS AND JOBS HOUSING BALANCE STRATEGIES INTO

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THE PLANNER. BUT OF COURSE THOSE WERE THE INPUTS OF THE DRAFT
2 BLUEPRINT. MANY OF YOU WANTED TO KNOW WHAT IS THE OUTPUTS.
3 WHAT DOES THE GROWTH PATTERN LOOK LIKE. MANY OF US HAVE BEEN
4 BAKING A BIT MORE DURING THE SHELTER-IN-PLACE I I'M GOING TO
5 USE AN ANALOGY OF THAT TYPE TODAY. IN FEBRUARY WE PUT TOGETHER
6 THE INGREDIENTS MIXED THEM TOGETHER AND IN JULY THE RESULT IS
7 READY WE HAVE TAKEN IT OUT OF THE OVEN AND ALL OF YOU GET A
8 CHANCE TO TASTED. OF COURSE OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, WE GET ONE
9 MORE TRY TO FINESSE STRATEGIES MIX UP INGREDIENTS GO BACK TO
10 MTC AND ABAG BOARD AND BRING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IN THE FALL
11 WILL BE BETTER. TODAY'S PRESENTATION WE'LL GIVE YOU A CHANCE
12 TO GIVE YOU A FULL UNDERSTANDING OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT SO YOU
13 CONDITIONED WHETHER YOU WANT TO USE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS A
14 RESOURCE IN CREATING FACTORS OR BASELINE FOR THE RHNA
15 METHODOLOGY AND IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY FOR YOU TO GIVE US
16 FEEDBACK GIVEN YOUR EXPERTISE IN HOUSING. THERE ARE MANY OTHER
17 OPPORTUNITIES IN THE WEEKS AHEAD TO GET ENGAGED IF YOU ARE
18 INTERESTED IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I'LL FOCUS ON THE
19 HOUSING SIDE AND GIVE AN OVERARCHING LOOK. I HAVE NOTED THAT
20 THE RHNA METHODOLOGY MUST BE CONSISTENT WITH THE PLAN, IT'S
21 ULTIMATELY YOUR CALL ON HOW YOU WANT TO DO THAT. YOU CAN USE
22 THE PLAN AS A DATA SET OR RESOURCE AT YOUR DISPOSAL BUT
23 ULTIMATELY IT IS AN OPTION FOR YOU ALL TO CONSIDER. NEXT
24 SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE AT A CRITICAL JUNCTURE OF THE PLANNED
25 BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS A JUNCTURE THAT ALLOWS US TO SHARE

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 DETAILS THAT WE HAVEN'T IN THE PAST WE HAVE COMPLETED
2 SIMULATION MODELS. AFTER TWO YEARS OF THE HORIZON INITIATIVE
3 AND STRATEGIES FOR THE PLAN WE HAVE NOW COMPLETED MODELING
4 WORK. TODAY'S PRESENTATION REFLECTS A MAJOR MILESTONE I'M
5 GOING TO BREAK INTO FOUR CHUNKS REFRESH ON THE PROCESS TO DATE
6 AND STRATEGIES ANALYZED I'LL GO THROUGH THE FORECASTED
7 OUTCOMES FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT I'LL TALK ABOUT KEY
8 CHALLENGES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DOES NOT YET FULLY ADDRESS AND
9 I'LL TALK ABOUT THE NEXT STEPS FOR THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. AND
10 I'LL ASK FOR YOUR INDULGENCE BECAUSE I KNOW IT IS A LONG
11 PRESENTATION THERE IS A LOT OF CONTENT INCLUDED. NEXT SLIDE.
12 THANK YOU. HORIZON INITIATIVE REALLY FORMS THE FOUNDATION OF
13 ALL THE STRATEGIES THAT WE HAVE STUDIED. WE HAVE STRESS TESTED
14 ALL OF THE STRATEGIES INCLUDING THE HOUSING STRATEGIES
15 INTEGRATED AND THEY PERFORMED WELL ACROSS THREE VERY DIFFERENT
16 FUTURES FUTURES WHERE THE BAY AREA HAS SLOW OR FAST GROWTH
17 FUTURES WHERE THERE ARE MORE OR LESS RESOURCES AVAILABLE AND
18 SO WE KNOW THAT THESE STRATEGIES ARE MORE RESILIENT AND
19 EQUITABLE THAN STRATEGIES IN OUR PAST LONG RANGE PLAN WE HAVE
20 TESTED STRATEGIES IN FORCES LIKE WE SEE TODAY LIKE WHAT WOULD
21 HAPPEN IF THERE WAS EXTREME GROWTH IN TELECOMMUTES OR E-
22 COMMERCE. WE SUPPORTED TRAJECTORIES AND MODELING. WHEN WE
23 CREATE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE HAVE TO ADHERE TO FEDERAL AND
24 STATE REGULATIONS AND THAT MEANS IDENTIFYING ASSUMED EXTERNAL
25 FORCES FOR A VARIETY OF FACTORS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WON'T GO

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 INTO MUCH MORE DETAIL ON THIS TODAY. WE DO WORK CLOSELY WITH
2 THE STATE TO DEVELOP THESE ASSUMPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT
3 BLUEPRINT WAS APPROVED IN FEBRUARY 2020 FOR ANALYSIS BY MTC
4 AND ABAG COMPRISED OF STRATEGIES FOR EACH OF FOUR ELEMENTS OF
5 THE PLAN, TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ECONOMY, AND ENVIRONMENT,
6 AS WELL AS GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS.
7 ULTIMATELY THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS AN INTEGRATED PROPOSAL
8 WHEREAS RHNA FOCUSES SPECIFICALLY ON HOUSING, THROUGH AN EIGHT
9 YEAR TIME PERIOD, THE PLAN IS AT A HIGHER LEVEL AND LOOKS
10 LONGER TERM OVER A 30 YEAR PERIOD FOR A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT
11 TOPIC PERIODS. OFTENTIMES LONG-TERM PLANS FOR ABAG AND MTC
12 HAVE FOCUSED DISPROPORTIONATELY ON PROJECTS WE HAVE DRIFTED TO
13 A STRATEGY APPROACH RECOGNIZING INVESTMENTS ARE ONE PIECE OF A
14 BIGGER PUZZLE AND MORE IMPORTANT THAN ACHIEVING OUR CLIMATE
15 AND EQUITY GOAL ARE THINGS LIKE HOUSING STRATEGIES LIKE WE'LL
16 BE DISCUSSING TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. JUST TO UNDERSCORE A STRATEGY
17 IN THE CONTEXT OF PLANNED BAY AREA IS A DIFFERENT FACTOR THAN
18 YOU ALL HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT IN THE HMC PROCESS A STRATEGY
19 IS A SET OF POLICIES THAT CAN BE VETTED ON LOCAL FEDERAL AND
20 STATE LEVEL. ULTIMATELY THESE ARE NOT NEAR TERM PROPOSALS AND
21 THEY ARE IDEAS THAT COULD BE ADDRESSED AT MULTIPLE LEVELS OF
22 GOVERNMENT OVER THE NEXT THREE DECADES. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE
23 HEARD FROM THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS AS PART OF THE
24 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS. JUST IN FALL 2019 ALONE WE GOT
25 ALMOST 13,000 COMMENTS THAT GAVE CRITICAL INPUT ON STRATEGIES

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 TO INTEGRATE INTO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE GOT THOUSANDS MORE
2 COMMENTS ON THE PREDECESSOR HORIZON. STRIKING TO US IS THE
3 APPROVAL RATING ON THE COMMENTS RECEIVED. WE KNOW THE PUBLIC
4 IS INTERESTED IN FINDING SOLUTIONS TO OUR HOUSING,
5 TRANSPORTATION, AND OTHER CHALLENGE. NEXT SLIDE. IN YOUR
6 PACKET, YOU WILL FIND AN ATTACHMENT THAT LISTS OUT ALL 25 OF
7 THE STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR THE SAKE OF TIME I'M
8 NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH EVERY SINGLE ONE OF THEM BUT TOUCH ON
9 CATEGORIES OF THE STRATEGIES AND FOCUS ON HOUSING. FOR
10 TRANSPORTATION MAXIMIZING INFRASTRUCTURE CREATE SAFE STREETS
11 AND FOCUS ON REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE. FOR ENVIRONMENT
12 PROTECTIONS AGAINST HAZARDS, SEA LEVEL FLOODING WILDFIRE AND
13 EARTHQUAKES AND IMPACTS ON ENVIRONMENT THROUGH ELECTRIFICATION
14 PARKS OPEN SPACE AND AGRICULTURAL LAND PROTECTION. WE LOOK AT
15 WAYS TO BALANCE JOBS AND HOUSING AS WELL AS IMPROVE ECONOMIC
16 MOBILITY FOR LOWER INCOME RESIDENTS AND LASTLY, BUT CERTAINLY
17 NOT LEAST WE LOOKED AT A SET OF STRATEGIES FOR HOUSING. FIRST
18 PACKAGE WAS FOCUSED ON SPURRING HOUSING PRODUCTION LOOKING AT
19 INCREASING GROWTH IN NOT JUST PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS BUT
20 ALSO OTHER KEY TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS
21 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. WE ALSO LOOK AT WAYS TO STREAMLINE
22 DEVELOPMENT IN THE KEY GEOGRAPHIES AND TRY TO CREATE INCLUSIVE
23 COMMUNITIES BY ENABLING GROWTH IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THAT
24 HAVE BEEN DISCRETIONARY IN THE PAST. WHEN IT COMES TO
25 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THE PLANNER CREATES A SUITE OF STRATEGIES

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 DIRECT INVESTMENTS REVENUES ON THE REGIONAL LEVEL TO PAY FOR
2 DIRECT INVESTMENT IN DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOMES AND
3 INCLUSIONARY REQUIREMENTS ON THE LOCAL LEVEL. AND LASTLY, THE
4 HOUSING STRATEGIES INCLUDE INCREASED RENTER PROTECTION TO
5 ENSURE LOW INCOME RESIDENTS ARE NOT DISPLACED FROM THEIR
6 RESIDENCES. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE MANY OF THESE STRATEGIES
7 WERE DEVELOPED IN THE WINTER. A LOT HAS CHANGED IN THE LAST
8 FEW MONTHS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER A FEW THINGS FIRST OF
9 ALL WE'RE TRYING TO CREATE A PLAN FOR THE NEXT 30 YEARS IN THE
10 BAY AREA IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS THIS CRISIS WILL HAVE PASSED
11 BUT WE'LL STILL NEED HOUSING ADDRESSED BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY
12 HOUSING STRATEGIES HAVE BEEN STRESS TESTED AGAINST MANY OF THE
13 SAME FORCES THAT COMPRISE THIS PANDEMIC WHETHER TELL COMMUTING
14 E-COMMERCE SHIFTS AND EXPLORING HOUSING STRATEGIES THAT COULD
15 PLAY A CRITICAL ROLE IN ALL SORTS OF CONDITIONS. AND SOME
16 STRATEGIES BEING MORE RELEVANT TODAY LIKE BICYCLE IMPROVEMENTS
17 TENANT PROTECTION CHILD CARE SUBSIDIES AND INCREASED OPEN
18 SPACE WHICH WE ALL VALUE IN THIS DIFFICULT TIME. THAT BEING
19 SAID, THE SUMMER IS A GREAT TIME TO ADD STRATEGIES THAT KEEP
20 ON TRACK WITH THE MOMENT WE'RE IN. NEXT SLIDE. WE SHOWED THIS
21 GRAPHIC HERE WHICH REFLECTS THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES APPROVED
22 FOR STUDY BY MTC AND ABAG BOARD. NOTE HERE DIFFERENCE FROM
23 LAST ITERATION FOCUSING ON PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS LOCALLY
24 NOMINATED. WHILE THOSE TEND TO BE KEY GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WE
25 NEED TO LOOK BEYOND THEM IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE CLIMATE AND

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 EQUITY GOALS. PDAS ARE VOLUNTEERED BY LOCAL JURISDICTION WE
2 ADDED SELECT TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IN PLACES
3 THAT HADN'T STEPPED UP TO THE PLATE. AT THE SAME TIME IT'S
4 IMPORTANT TO PROTECT OUR NATURAL LANDS AFFECTING AREAS OUTSIDE
5 URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AS WELL AS UNMITIGATED ZONES. IN THE
6 RED GROWTH PDAS WHICH SHOWS WHERE MOST GROWTH WAS IN PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2040 NOW AUGMENTED IN THE ORANGE AND BLUE. GIVEN THE
8 GROUP IS LESS FOCUSED ON THE REVENUE PICTURE I'LL KEEP MY
9 PRESENTATIONS BRIEF HERE, THE PLAN DOES APPEAR TO BE FISCALLY
10 CONSTRAINED AND THIS CHART IDENTIFIES REVENUES NEEDED. YOU CAN
11 SEE THERE IS A FUNDING BROUGHT TO BAY AREA TO INCREASE THE
12 AMOUNT OF DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE DRAFT
13 BLUEPRINT AND YET THERE IS STILL NEARLY A \$400 BILLION NEED
14 FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. NOT EVERY LOW INCOME IS ACCESSIBLE IN
15 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BUT WE MAKE HEADWAY IN PRESERVES UNITS AS
16 WELL AS CREATING NEW UNITS. NEXT SLIDE. WHEREAS RHNA IS MORE
17 OF A MATHEMATICAL PROCESS THAT I TALKED ABOUT EARLIER
18 DEVELOPING THE PLANNED BAY AREA IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS A
19 BIT MORE LIKE BAKING. YOU PUT TOGETHER YOUR INGREDIENTS, YOU
20 PUT THEM IN THE OVEN AND YOU GET SOMETHING OF AN OUTCOME. FOR
21 THIS PROCESS OUR INGREDIENTS ARE THINGS LIKE THE BASELINE
22 DATA, ZONING, PIPELINE AND GROWTH BOUNDARIES WE GOT FROM LOCAL
23 JURISDICTION THROUGH AN INITIATIVE CALLED BAIFA. WE
24 INCORPORATED INPUT 25 STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND
25 DID OUR BEST TO SIMULATE WHAT THAT MIGHT MEAN TO FUTURE GROWTH

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 APPEARANCE OF THE REGION AND OUTCOMES OF THE REGION THOSE ARE
2 THE OUTCOMES OF THE PROCESS WE SHARED THE INPUTS PREVIOUSLY
3 BUT TODAY THE NEW ASPECT IS THOSE OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE. LET'S
4 JUMP INTO IT. WHAT ARE THE POTENTIAL INCOMES OF THE DRAFT
5 BLUEPRINT STRATEGY. WHAT DOES 2050 LOOK LIKE. IN AN UNCERTAIN
6 FUTURE IT'S DIFFICULT TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE FUTURE OUTCOME.
7 NEXT SLIDE. LET'S START WITH SOME OF THE HIGHLIGHTS. THERE IS
8 A LOT OF GOOD NEWS IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STARTING RIGHT OFF
9 THE BAT WITH HOUSING AFFORDABILITY FOR THOSE OF WHO YOU HAVE
10 FOLLOWED PLANNED BAY AREA PROCESSES IN THE PAST WE HAVE OFTEN
11 STRUGGLED TO BEND THE CURVE OF THE REGION'S INCREASING
12 UNAFFORDABILITY. THANKS TO THE HOUSING STRATEGIES WHICH
13 INCLUDE A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF NEW HOUSING UNITS AT ALL
14 INCOME LEVELS PLUS THE WITH DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABILITY
15 HOUSING WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO REDUCE THE COST BURDEN FOR THE
16 AVERAGE BAY AREA FROM 50 PERCENT FOR HOUSING AND
17 TRANSPORTATION IN 2015 TO 48 PERCENT IN 2050. STILL A SIZEABLE
18 AMOUNT BUT A SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION. A LOT IS BEING DRIVEN BY
19 THE ADDITIONAL DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHICH ALLOWS
20 US TO REDUCE THE BURDEN EVEN MORE FOR LOW INCOME RESIDENTS. AT
21 THE BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN YOU WILL SEE THAT THE PLAN HAS A
22 FOCUS ON ADDITIONAL GROWTH NEAR TRANSPORTATION AND WALKABLE
23 COMMUNITIES WHICH IS ESSENTIAL TO MEET OUR CLIMATE GOALS BY
24 2050 WITH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES WE CAN ANTICIPATE 40
25 PERCENT OF HOMES IN THE BAY AREA BEING WITHIN WALKABLE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL FRONT THE PLAN
2 MAKES A SIGNIFICANT DENT IN OUR ROAD SAFETY GOALS AND WE ALSO
3 MAKE SURE WE'RE PROTECTING HOMES FROM EARTHQUAKES AND SEA
4 LEVEL RISE WITH RETROFIT HOMES, AS WELL AS A SYSTEM OF LEVIES,
5 GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE OTHER AND IMPROVEMENTS THAT WOULD PROTECT
6 98 PERCENT OF ALL HOMES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE AND ALL HOMES IN
7 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN LASTLY REQUIREMENTS OF THE DRAFT
8 BLUEPRINT DO NOT IMPEDE ON THE REGION'S GROWTH THAT ACTUALLY
9 HELP THAT THE REGION IS PREPARED IN THE CHALLENGES AHEAD IN
10 INVESTING IN HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, AND OTHER SORTS OF
11 INFRASTRUCTURE. NEXT SLIDE. OVER THE 35 YEAR TIME PERIOD OF
12 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE ANTICIPATE THAT 1.5 MILLION NEW HOUSING
13 UNITS ARE REQUIRED. THIS IS RELATIVELY CONSISTENT WITH THE
14 EIGHT YEAR REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION OF ROUGHLY
15 440,000 THAT YOU SAW PREVIOUSLY. SO THAT'S IN THE 2020 TIME
16 PERIOD THIS IS THE LONGER TERM FORECAST FOR 2050 SO THEY'RE ON
17 THE SAME TRAJECTORY AS EACH OTHER. ALSO NOTABLE HERE IS HOW
18 THE PLAN DIFFERS ON JOB GROWTH IN THE RELATIVE JOB GROWTH AND
19 HOUSING GROWTH FROM PAST PLANS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAS
20 ROUGHLY ONE NEW HOME FOR EVERY ONE NEW JOB IN PART HOW WE'RE
21 ABLE TO BEND THE CURVE. STRATEGIES THAT ARE INCLUDED ADVANCE
22 IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE THOSE GAINS ARE REALIZED. NEXT SLIDE.
23 THIS IS WHERE I'M GOING TO SPEND EXTRA TIME IT'S ONE OF THE
24 SLIDES THAT'S MOST IMPORTANT FOR THE RHNA POTENTIAL AND A
25 POTENTIAL RESOURCE FOR YOUR PLANNING. NEXT SLIDE YOU WILL SEE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 GROWTH PATTERN SHOWS GROWTH SPREAD
2 ACROSS THE REGION WITH EACH BUBBLE REPRESENTING EACH NUMBER OF
3 HOUSEHOLDS IN EACH COUNTY YOU CAN FIND A DETAILED BREAKDOWN ON
4 THE PLANNED BAY AREA WEB SITE. ON THE RIGHT, THE DRAFT
5 BLUEPRINT ALL THE BUBBLES WITH THE AMOUNT OF NEW HOUSEHOLDS IN
6 THE REGION ARE QUITE A BIT LARGER. OTHER OBVIOUS THING IF YOU
7 LOOK AT THE MAP ON THE RIGHT SIDE IS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT HAS A
8 SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF GROWTH IN SILICON VALLEY. WITH THE ZONING
9 STRATEGIES AND THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRATEGIES AND THE LIKE
10 THERE IS A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY AREAS PARTICULARLY IN THE SOUTH
11 BAY THAT ARE RIPE FOR DEVELOPMENT BOTH MARKET RATE AND
12 AFFORDABLE DEVELOPMENT. WE'RE SEEING STRONG DEVELOPMENT LEVELS
13 IN THE SOUTH BAY AS A RESULT OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
14 STRATEGIES. A FEW OTHER THINGS TO NOTE HERE. YOU CAN SEE SOME
15 KEY GROWTH STATISTICS. DRAFT PLAN HAS GROWTH IN THE THREE BIG
16 CITIES AS A SHARE OF GROWTH BUT MORE GROWTH IN THE BAYSIDE
17 COMMUNITIES, THE COMMUNITIES BRINGING SAN FRANCISCO BAY. DRAFT
18 BLUEPRINT HAS LESS GROWTH IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. AND
19 MORE GROWTH IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS INTO -- AND IN THE HIGH
20 RESOURCE AREAS ALBEIT AT THE LOWER LEVEL THAN THE OTHER TWO
21 CATEGORIES. NEXT SLIDE. JOBS TOTALS ARE SIMILAR BETWEEN
22 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AND 2050 SKEWED TOWARDS SOUTH BAY WHEN
23 IT COMES TO JOBS THE STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN PROVE EFFECTIVE AT
24 SHIFTING HOUSING TO WHERE JOBS ARE TODAY THAN TO WHERE JOBS
25 AND HOUSING RICH COMMUNITIES ARE. YOU SEE THE GENERAL TREND

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP IN MIND AS YOU CONSIDER THE
2 RESOURCE FOR THE RHNA PROCESS IS THAT INCLUSION OF THE
3 BLUEPRINT WOULD TEND TO LEAD TO A SKEW IN THE SOUTH BAY. YOU
4 CAN ALSO NOTE HERE SOME OF THE KEY TOTALS THAT THERE IS A
5 LITTLE BIT MORE GROWTH IN THE THREE CITIES IN TERMS OF JOBS.
6 WE'RE SEEING IMPROVE THE JOBS HOUSING BALANCE IN THE DRAFT
7 BLUEPRINT IN SILICON VALLEY ALSO IN SAN FRANCISCO. WHAT ABOUT
8 TRANSPORTATION TRENDS. DRAFT BLUEPRINT LEADS TO SIGNIFICANT
9 IMPROVEMENT IN TERMS OF MODAL SHIFT. WE ANTICIPATE THERE WILL
10 BE A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN TELECOMMUTING ESPECIALLY AFTER
11 COVID-19 CRISIS. ALTHOUGH SHOWN AS 14 PERCENT HERE WE KNOW
12 MANY WORKERS LIKE RETAIL OR DOCTORS AND NURSES DON'T ALWAYS
13 HAVE A CHOICE TO WORK FROM HOME THIS REFLECTS ABOUT ONE IN
14 THREE OFFICE WORKERS BEING ABLE TO WORK FROM HOME ON A TYPICAL
15 DAY DURING 2050. WE EXPECT SIGNIFICANT GROWTH IN TRANSIT
16 RIDERSHIP AS WELL AS BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN ACTIVITY AS A
17 RESULT OF THE INVESTMENT THAT WE'RE MAKING IN EACH OF THOSE
18 MODES AND THE MORE FOCUSED GROWTH LAND USE PATTERN NEAR OUR
19 TRANSIT SYSTEMS. NEXT SLIDE. LASTLY, THE PLAN IS ONE OF THE --
20 THIS IS THE FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA THAT INCLUDES SEA LEVEL
21 RISE MITIGATION. DEVELOPING A SYSTEM OF LEVIES, MARSH
22 RESTORATION AND OTHER PLACE HOLDER STRATEGIES FOR EVERY SAN
23 FRANCISCO BAYSHORE LINE TO ENSURE COMMUNITY PROTECTION AGAINST
24 THE THREAT OF SEA LEVEL RISE. ULTIMATELY THE SYSTEM WOULD
25 PROTECT 98 PERCENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA HOMES IN 2050 AND THE

July 9, 2020



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 REGION'S JOBS AS WELL AND IT CREATES 100,000 ACRES OF NEW
2 MARSH LAND, A BONUS THERE AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS A LOT
3 GOING ON IN THIS SLIDE HERE I'M BREAK IT DOWN. PLANNED BAY
4 AREA 2050 HAS CLIMATE CHANGE AT THE CENTER. THAT'S TRUE BUT WE
5 LOOK AT OTHER ISSUES WITH SOCIAL EQUITY BEING CRITICAL
6 GUIDELINE THIS TIME. IN THE PREVIOUS PLANNED BAY AREA PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2040 WE HAD A 15 PERCENT TARGET TO TRY TO HIT AND
8 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 JUST BARELY HIT THAT TARGET BUT IN THE
9 YEARS SINCE THE BACKGROUND ASSUMPTIONS THINGS LIKE THE
10 DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE REGION, THE COST TO DRIVE, OTHER FACTORS
11 LIKE THAT ARE MAKING IT HARDER AND HARDER FOR US TO ADVANCE
12 TOWARDS OUR CLIMATE GOALS IF WE SIMPLY READOPTED PLANNED BAY
13 AREA 2040 TODAY INSTEAD OF HAVING A 15.POINT REDUCTION IT
14 WOULD BE BETWEEN 1 AND 4 PERCENTAGE POINTS LEAVING A HUGE GAP
15 BETWEEN THE NEWLY ADOPTED 19 PERCENT TOWARDS OUR TARGET. DRAFT
16 BLUEPRINT CAME IN CLOSING A GAP AT EIGHT POINT GAIN BUT THERE
17 IS STILL SIGNIFICANT GAP REMAINING AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
18 WILL HAVE TO STRUGGLE WITH THIS IN FIGURING OUT HOW TO ON
19 CLOSE THE GAP AND MAKING THE BAY AREA EQUITABLE. I'M GOING TO
20 SPEND LESS TIME ON THESE SLIDES. I WANT TO NOTE THERE ARE A
21 LOT OF HIGHLIGHTS OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE SEE FIVE KEY
22 CHALLENGES REMAINING THAT WILL REQUIRE FURTHER STRATEGY
23 MODIFICATIONS IN ORDER TO SOLVE THESE CHALLENGES WE'RE HOLDING
24 A SERIES OF WORKSHOPS BOTH FOR THE PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS AND
25 YOU'RE ALL INVITED TO THOSE. NEXT SLIDE. ONE OVERARCHING

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FINDING FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS IS THAT OUR
2 STRATEGIES EXCELLED IN ENSURING FUTURE GROWTH IS MORE
3 EQUITABLE MORE RESILIENT AND MORE SUSTAINABLE THAN PREVIOUS
4 GENERATIONS. HOWEVER, RIGHTING ALL OF THE WRONGS OF THE 20th
5 CENTURY, THINGS LIKE REDLINING WOULD REQUIRE EVEN MORE BOLDER
6 ACTION BOLDER STRATEGIES IN ORDER TO MAKE MORE HEADWAY IN THAT
7 CASE ENCOURAGE MORE GROWTH IN THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. NEXT
8 SLIDE. YOU WILL FIND ON THE PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG WEB SITE A HAND
9 OUT THERE IS A SNAPSHOT OF IT SHOWN ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE
10 THAT HAS A BREAKDOWN OF KEY METRICS EQUITY OUTCOMES PATTERN
11 GROWTH IN DETAIL ALL OF THAT IS ON THE WEB SITE AND IT
12 INCLUDES A BREAKDOWN OF THE TEN EVALUATION QUESTIONS TWO FOR
13 EACH OF OUR GUIDING PRINCIPLES BASICALLY TRYING TO HELP US
14 UNDERSTAND IF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKES THE BAY AREA MORE
15 AFFORDABLE MORE CONNECTED, MORE DIVERSE, HEALTHIER AND MORE
16 VIBRANT. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO FOCUS ON A COUPLE OF THESE
17 CHALLENGES MORE THAN OTHERS RECOGNIZING THE TOPIC TODAY IS
18 HOUSING. LET'S START WITH AFFORDABLE HOUSING. ALTHOUGH WE MAKE
19 MEANINGFUL HEADWAY TO REDUCE THE COST BURDEN OF HOUSING AND
20 TRANSPORTATION IN THE REGION AND THE REDUCTION ARE GREATER FOR
21 LOWER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS MANY LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ARE STILL
22 OVERBURDENS WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING COST IN THE REGION SO A
23 KEY QUESTION THAT WILL NEED TO BE ANSWERED IS HOW DO WE
24 CONTINUE TO FURTHER INCREASE THE PRODUCTION OF THOSE DEED
25 RESTRICTED HOMES THAT ARE AFFORDABLE FOR OUR LOWER INCOME

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 RESIDENTS? HOW DO WE ENCOURAGE PERHAPS MORE OF THAT GROWTH IN
2 THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS WHERE THERE ARE THE MOST WELL
3 RESOURCED SCHOOLS, THE BEST ACCESS TO JOBS, BEST ACCESS TO
4 PARKS, ET CETERA. YOU WILL NOTE THERE IN THE BULLET POINT AT
5 THE BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR THE FIRST
6 TIME IT INCLUDES SUFFICIENT FUNDING FOR PERMANENTLY PROTECT
7 AT-RISK AFFORDABLE UNIT IN THE REGION. AND TO PRODUCE NEW
8 UNITS FOR ALL LOW INCOME HOUSING GROWTH. AND THERE WILL BE
9 CONTINUED DEMAND IN THAT REGARD. THAT'S ONE KEY QUESTION THAT
10 REMAINS TO BE RESOLVED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. I'M
11 GOING TO SPEND LESS TIME HERE. OUR SECOND CHALLENGE AREA IS
12 RELATED TO TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND TRANSIT OVERCROWDING. SO
13 WE'LL BE ASKING STAKEHOLDERS TO HELP US TRY TO IDENTIFY NEW
14 AND EXPANDED STRATEGIES AND HELP US BETTER ADDRESS TRAFFIC
15 CONGESTION AND TRANSIT OVERCROWDING THAT CONTINUE TO INCREASE
16 IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT ABOUT THE
17 DIVERSE GUIDING PRINCIPLES? ARE WE SEEING PROGRESS ON OUR KEY
18 EQUITY GOALS? IT'S A MIXED BAG HERE. OUR FIRST EVALUATION
19 QUESTION LOOKED AT WHETHER BAY AREA COMMUNITIES ARE MORE
20 INCLUSIVE. WE DID SEE COMMUNITIES OF GROWTH IN HIGH RESOURCE
21 AREAS INCLUDING LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS BUT WE'RE SEEING AREAS
22 OF INCREASED DIVERSIFICATION AND PROFILES IN THOSE AREAS. WHEN
23 IT COMES TO DISPLACEMENT WE'RE SEEING CONTINUED RISE IN THE
24 RISK OF DISPLACEMENT IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. SHORT-TERM
25 MITIGATIONS LIKE RENT CONTROL CAN HELP OVER THE LONG-TERM IF

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 WE CONTINUE DISPLACEMENT OUT OF OUR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN
2 OFTEN TO AREAS OF THE PERIPHERY OF THE REGION. A FUNDAMENTAL
3 QUESTION IS AFTER INCLUDING THE ROBUST RENTER PROTECTIONS ALL
4 OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION WHAT DO WE HAVE LEFT IN
5 OUR TOOLBOX TO HELP ADDRESS THE RISING DISPLACEMENT RISK SO
6 MORE PEOPLE CAN REMAIN IN PLACE? NEXT SLIDE. I'LL GO THROUGH
7 THIS ONE RATHER QUICKLY TOO. ON OUR HEALTHY GUIDING PRINCIPLE
8 KEY CHALLENGE RELATED TO GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS ALTHOUGH THE
9 PLAN DOES GROW SMARTER THAN THE PREVIOUS ITERATION OF PLANNED
10 BAY AREA WITH EIGHT POINTS. WE STILL HAVE GREENHOUSE GAS
11 EMISSIONS TO SOLVE AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE'LL BE TACKLING IN
12 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. OUR FINAL SLIDE HERE
13 RELATES TO THE ECONOMIC VIBRANCY PRINCIPLE AND REALLY THE
14 CHANGE WE SEE IS RELATED TO JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE WE SEE
15 GAINS IN THE JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE BY SHIFTING HOUSING TO
16 WHERE JOBS ARE AT BUT HEADWAY WITH IMPACT FEES FOR NEW OFFICE
17 CONSTRUCTION IN THE JOB RICH COMMUNITIES IT DOESN'T MAKE
18 SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS IN ENCOURAGING MORE JOBS IN MOVING PLACE
19 TO ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA KEY CHALLENGE POSING TO
20 STAKEHOLDERS IN THE PROCESS IS COULD AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES PLAY
21 A ROLE IN SHIFTING JOBS TOWARDS OF THE WORKFORCE. NEXT SLIDE.
22 THOSE ARE THE BIG FIVE. THERE ARE FIVE BIG CHALLENGES THAT
23 WILL REALLY BE THE FOCUS OF THE NEXT 2, 3 MONTHS OF THE
24 BLUEPRINT PLANNING PROCESS WE'RE GOING TO BE ASKING HUNDREDS
25 OR THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE HOW THEY WOULD PROPOSE WE SOLVE THESE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FIVE CHALLENGES. THAT BEING SAID, I THINK WE'RE MAKING MORE
2 HEADWAY ON A LOT OF DIFFERENT METRICS THAN I SHOWED EARLIER
3 SIGNIFICANT PRESENTATION SO OBVIOUSLY THERE ARE GAINS BUT
4 STILL MORE WORK TO DO. THIS SLIDE SHOWS INITIAL STRATEGY IDEAS
5 THAT WE HAVE THROWN OUT THERE AS AN EXERCISE TO SOLVE SOME OF
6 THE KEY CHALLENGES BUT WE WANT TO HEAR FROM YOU AND MANY OTHER
7 FOLKS ABOUT CREATIVE SOLUTIONS. THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. TO
8 DO THAT WE HAVE BEEN LISTENING TO BAY AREA RESIDENTS BY
9 HOLDING FOCUS GROUPS IN COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN WORKING IN
10 CONCERT WITH NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS THIS HAS GIVEN GOOD
11 FEEDBACK AS WE REVISE THE 25 STRATEGIES AND AUGMENT WITH NEW
12 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. THIS BRINGS ME TO THE FOURTH AND FINAL
13 PART OF THE PRESENTATION LOOKING AHEAD TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
14 OBVIOUSLY WHAT WE'RE BRINGING FORWARD TO YOU TODAY IS A DRAFT
15 BLUEPRINT FOR THE REGION AND THERE IS MORE AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE.
16 THERE ARE WAYS TO BE INVOLVED IF YOU'RE INTERESTED. WE HAVE
17 WORKSHOPS WITH INFORMATION AVAILABLE ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA
18 WEB SITE THERE ARE FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS IN MULTIPLE
19 LANGUAGES THREE WORKSHOPS FOCUSED ON ECONOMY AND HOUSING AND
20 LOCAL JURISDICTION ARE OFFERING OFFICE HOURS, PROVIDING FLYERS
21 AND SURVEYS FOR THOSE WHO DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO ELECTRONIC
22 MEANS TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK. VOICEMAIL LISTENING LINE, A COMMENT
23 PERIOD THAT STRETCHES THROUGH AUGUST 10TH IF YOU WANT TO
24 SUBMIT A FORMAL LETTER. THERE ARE LOTS OF DIFFERENT WAYS TO
25 MAKE YOUR VOICE HEARD IF YOU'RE INTERESTED IN PLANNED BAY AREA

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 2050. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. ULTIMATELY WHAT WE'RE LOOKING
2 FOR IS NOT JUST FEEDBACK ON A GROWTH PATTERN WHICH IS OUR BEST
3 AVAILABLE FUTURE GROWTH OR OUTCOMES WE'RE LOOKING FOR FEEDBACK
4 ON HOW TO CHANGE THE STRATEGIES TO GET TO BETTER OUTCOMES
5 WHETHER THAT'S ADDING A STRATEGY REMOVING A STRATEGY OR
6 MODIFYING A STRATEGY. IT'S A PUBLIC POLICY IDEA, IN ORDER TO
7 MAKE US STRONGER, MORE RESILIENT AND EQUITABLE PLAN. NEXT
8 SLIDE. THIS BREAKS DOWN THE TIME TABLE AS NOTED WE JUST
9 RELEASED THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND ARE NOW IN ACTIVE COMMENT
10 PERIOD. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE FEEDBACK YOU ALL WILL PROVIDE WE
11 DO ANTICIPATE GOING BACK TO MTC COMMISSION AND ABAG BOARD WITH
12 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PROPOSAL IN SEPTEMBER WHICH WILL INTEGRATE
13 FEEDBACK WE GET HERE IN JULY AND AUGUST AND ULTIMATELY PLAN ON
14 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IN DECEMBER. SO THAT WRAPS IT UP FOR THIS
15 PRESENTATION OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. I
16 LOOK FORWARD TO ANY OF YOUR QUESTIONS. AND AGAIN WE STAND
17 READY TO SERVE AS A RESOURCE IF YOU CHOOSE TO USE THE PLAN AS
18 A WAY TO MAKE THE RHNA METHODOLOGY FULLY CONSISTENT WITH THE
19 PLAN GROWTH PATTERN. WITH THAT, I'LL TURN IT OVER, BACK TO OUR
20 FACILITATOR.

21
22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH DAVE. AMBER IS
23 GOING TO FACILITATE THE DISCUSSION.

24

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. AS YOU MENTIONED AT THE OUTSET OF THIS
2 MEETING, THERE WERE SOME GREAT IDEAS FOR HOW TO HELP US WITH
3 OUR CLARIFYING QUESTION PROCESS, AND UNFORTUNATELY WE'RE JUST
4 GOING TO DO THE ANALOG VERSION OF THIS, WHERE WE STILL HAVE TO
5 RAISE OUR HANDS AND ACTUALLY, LIKE, SPEAK THE QUESTION AND
6 THEN DAVE CAN HELP ANSWER. I SAW THAT THERE WERE SOME
7 QUESTIONS THAT WERE POSED IN THE -- AND I DON'T KNOW THAT --
8 BOB, YOU HAD A QUESTION ABOUT DEED RESTRICTED, WHAT DOES IT
9 MEAN? IS THAT A QUESTION YOU WANT TO START OFF WITH?

10

11 **BOB PLANTHOLD:** DEED RESTRICTED HAS A CONFRONTATION FROM LONG
12 AGO. DOES THAT MEAN LET'S SAY LOW OR MODERATE INCOME
13 RESIDENTS? DOES IT MEAN SOME OF THE OLD BIASES THAT ARE STILL
14 IN VARIOUS DEEDS? OR WHAT EXACTLY IS DEED RESTRICTED MEAN? THE
15 CONTEXT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050? >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD QUESTION.
16 WHEN WE SAY DEED RESTRICTED, IT'S DEED RESTRICTED TO SPECIFIC
17 LOWER INCOME LEVELS.

18

19 **BOB PLANTHOLD:** MAYBE TRY FOR A DIFFERENT TERM SO YOU DON'T
20 QUIET THAT SAME QUESTION FROM OTHERS, LIKE "INCOME
21 RESTRICTED."

22

23 **SPEAKER:** JAMES I THINK YOU HAD A QUESTION.

24

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** YEAH IT WAS BASICALLY WHY -- I MEAN IF YOU COULD GO
2 OVER IT AGAIN ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S MOST STRIKING IS THE
3 PROJECTIONS FOR THE SOUTH BAY, AND I THINK ESSENTIALLY YOU
4 WERE SAYING THAT WITHOUT RELAXATION TO ZONING, A LOT OF GROWTH
5 IN YOUR MODEL WOULD NATURALLY BE PULLED IN THAT DIRECTION BUT
6 IT OBVIOUSLY HAS BIG IMPLICATIONS FOR OTHER PARTS OF THE
7 REGION AS WELL AS THE SOUTH BAY ITSELF AND SO JUST WONDERING
8 IF YOU CAN UNPACK THAT A LITTLE BIT MORE. AND ALSO, HOW --
9 MAYBE SEPARATE OUT THE HOUSING FROM THE JOBS. >DAVE VAUTIN:
10 OKAY. LET ME TRY TO TAKE THAT IN A COUPLE OF CHUNKS HERE.
11 FIRST OF ALL IF YOU LOOK AT THE GROWTH PATTERNS THERE, WHEN
12 WE'RE LOOKING AT HOUSING THERE IS A LOT MORE HOUSING IN
13 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAN IN PREVIOUS ITERATIONS AND THAT'S
14 PART OF THE REASON WE'RE SEEING IMPROVEMENT ON AFFORDABLE.
15 THERE ARE MORE UNITS IN THE COUNTY THAN IN THE PRIOR ITERATION
16 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA BUT THE SHARE MIGHT SMALLER. FOR SANTA
17 CLARA COUNTY THE HEART OF SILICON VALLEY WE'RE SEEING HIGHER
18 SHARE AND TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS AND WE'LL ADDRESS THAT. WE
19 APPLIED DIFFERENT STRATEGIES, ADJUSTED ZONING IN DIFFERENT
20 PLACES LIKE TRANSIT-RICH AREAS HIGH RESOURCE AREAS PRIORITY
21 DEVELOPMENT AREAS TO DEVELOP A PATH. WE ALSO HAVE A STRATEGY
22 ABOUT STREAMLINING GROWTH THAT MAKES THIS EASIER TO REDEVELOP
23 CERTAIN PARCELS AND STRATEGIES TO REDEVELOP AGING MALLS AND
24 OFFICE PARKS. AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS A LOT OF THOSE BIG
25 20th CENTURY AGING MALLS AND OFFICE PARKS. WHEN WE RUN THE

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 STRATEGIES THROUGH OUR URBAN SIM LAND USE MODEL IT TAKES ON
2 THE MIND OF A DEVELOPER AND LOOKS ACROSS THE REGION WHERE IS
3 THE MOST ECONOMICALLY FEASIBLE FOR ME TO BE ABLE TO PENCIL OUT
4 THE PROJECTS AND MAKE A PROFIT IN TERMS OF DEVELOPMENT. AS THE
5 MODEL RAN THROUGH THE STRATEGIES THERE IS A LOT OF LARGE SIZE
6 PARCELS A LOT OF CAPACITY IN THE SOUTH BAY COSTLY TO JOBS
7 WHICH MAKES THE LAND DESIRABLE FOR WORKERS AND ESPECIALLY WHEN
8 THERE IS AFFORDABLE HOUSING MONEY IN PLAY THAT CAN GO IN AND
9 BUILD AFFORDABLE UNIT IN THOSE LOCATIONS THEY ARE ATTRACTIVE
10 ESPECIALLY WITH LOW-WAGE WORKERS WHO WORK IN MANY OF THE
11 OFFICE PARKS IN THE SOUTH BAY. THAT'S WHY WE'RE SEEING THAT
12 RESULT WHEN IT COMES TO THE GROWTH PATTERN IT REALLY JUST KIND
13 OF THE DESIRABILITY IF THOSE SOURCE OF MEASURES THAT RIGHT NOW
14 ARE LIMITING THE AMOUNT OF GROWTH IN THE SOUTH BAY WITH A
15 LITTLE BIT MORE FLEXIBILITY AND A LITTLE BIT MORE DEVELOPMENT
16 CAPACITY ENABLE GREATER SHARE OF THE GROWTH IN THAT REGION FOR
17 JOBS IN THE BAY AREA. WHEN IT COMES TO JOBS IT'S A DIFFERENT
18 STORY THOSE WHO HAVE ECONOMICS BACKGROUND YOU MIGHT SEE A
19 CONGLOMERATION EFFECT JOBS LIKE TO BE NEAR OTHER JOBS. WHEN
20 THEY DON'T REPORT TO THE WORKSITE ON ANY GIVEN DAY WE'RE
21 SEEING CONTINUED DESIRABILITY TO BE CLOSE TO OTHER JOB SITES
22 SO THOSE HIGH WAGE EMPLOYERS THEY WANT TO CONTINUE DEVELOPING
23 DOWN IN THE SOUTH BAY SO THAT WAY WHEN THE WORKFORCE COMES TO
24 WORK THEY'RE ABLE TO INTERACT MORE. THAT'S PLAYING A ROLE BUT
25 THE DIFFERENT FEE STRUCTURES WE PUT IN PLACE STRATEGIES

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 DESIGNED TO ENCOURAGE MORE JOBS TO MOVE TO OUR HOUSING RICH
2 AREAS THEY ULTIMATELY GREW TOO SMALL. EMPLOYERS DESIRED AND
3 FELT IN THE SOUTH BAY THEY PAID FEE CONTRIBUTED TO AFFORDABLE
4 HOUSING MONEYS AND WENT ALONG AND INCREASED THEIR WORKFORCE
5 DOWN THERE. THAT'S THE NARRATIVE WE'RE SEEING ROBUST GROWTH
6 DOWN THERE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. AARTI.

9

10 **ARTIE SHRIVASTAVA:** THANK YOU. PROJECT THE JOB GROWTH OF 41
11 PERCENT CAUGHT MY ATTENTION. I THINK IT'S SIGNIFICANTLY HIGH,
12 AND I DON'T THINK I HAVE ALL THE DATA YOU MAY BE LOOKING AT,
13 DAVE, BUT ANECDOTALLY OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS WE ARE SEEING
14 MORE JOB GROWTH FROM SAN MATEO TO SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN MATEO
15 WHERE A LOT OF BIG TECH COMPANIES ARE OPENING IN THOSE CITIES
16 VERSUS HERE IN SILICON VALLEY. WE HAVE RENEWED YOUNG TECH
17 EMPLOYEES WANTING TO LIVE IN THE BIG CITIES SO THAT DRIVES A
18 LOT OF WHERE THE TECH COMPANIES WANT TO LOCATE.

19

20 **NEYSA FILGOR:** I THINK THAT 44 PERCENT IS TOO HIGH AND I SEE
21 YOU WANT TO UNPACK IT BUT THAT PROJECTIONS SEEMS UNREALISTIC
22 BASED ON WHAT'S HAPPENING BUT PLUS YOU HAVE THE COVID FACTOR
23 WHICH TIES INTO MY NEXT QUESTION ABOUT THE 14 PERCENT WORK
24 FROM HOME, I THINK THAT YOU'RE PROJECTING OVER THE NEXT COUPLE
25 OF DECADES AND AGAIN EVEN BEFORE COVID, AND I WORK IN THE TECH

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SECTOR AS WELL. WE WERE SEEING MORE OF A DEMAND TO
2 TELECOMMUTE, AND I CAN ONLY IMAGINE WITH THE SUPPORT OF MANY
3 TECH COMPANIES NOW BASED ON WHAT WE'RE SEEING AND LEARNING
4 THROUGH COVID AND NOT KNOWING HOW LONG THIS WILL LAST WE
5 EXPECT TO SEE THIS NUMBER GO UP EVEN MORE. SO I DON'T KNOW IF
6 YOU ARE TAKING A MORE CONSERVATIVE APPROACH DAVE, I THINK THE
7 41 PERCENT IS TOO HIGH BUT I THINK THE 14 PERCENT ANTICIPATED
8 INCREASE IN TELECOMMUTING IS TOO LOW AND IF YOU TIE THIS BACK
9 TO RHNA WHICH IS THE PURPOSE OF THIS PRESENTATION, WHEN WE
10 LOOK AT FUTURE JOBS, TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY, ALL THESE THINGS,
11 REALLY, FOR ME, TIE INTO THESE PROJECTIONS AND WE REALLY WANT
12 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE GET THESE PROJECTIONS, AND I KNOW IT'S
13 NOT EASY. IT'S OF GUESSING AND DATA ANALYSIS. BUT THIS'S WHAT
14 CONCERNS ME ABOUT MAKING I DECISIONS BASED ON SOME OF THIS
15 DATA THAT WE'RE PROJECTING THAT TO ME JUST DOESN'T CORRESPOND
16 WITH WHAT I'M SEEING AND HEARING HERE IN SILICON VALLEY. AND
17 THE LAST THING, DAVE, I HAD THIS QUESTION ASKED A FEW TIMES
18 NOW AND I DIDN'T SEE IT CAPTURED IN YOUR PRESENTATION. IT'S
19 WHETHER OR NOT, EITHER THROUGH RHNA OR PLANNED BAY AREA, THERE
20 IS A COMPONENT OF GREEN SPACE PER CAPITA, YOU KNOW,
21 POPULATION, SIZE OF THE CITY WE TALK ABOUT PRESERVING
22 AGRICULTURAL LAND WHICH IS GREAT BUT WHAT ABOUT LAND SPACE
23 THAT TIES INTO THE BAY AREA CAN YOU TALK ABOUT PLANNED BAY
24 AREA 2050 IS PART OF THAT FIGURING OUT CITY SIZE CITY LOCATION
25 IS IT URBAN VERSUS SUBURBAN HOW DO WE LOOK AT GREEN SPACE AND

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ENSURING THAT AS WE INCREASE THE NUMBER OF HOUSING THAT WE'RE
2 ALSO PRESERVING GREEN SPACE? THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: A LOT OF
3 GOOD POINTS THERE. I'LL GIVE A 45 SECOND RESPONSE BECAUSE I
4 KNOW THERE IS PROBABLY A LOT OF QUESTIONS. SO, FIRST OF ALL IN
5 TERMS OF THE SHARES GROWTH IN SILICON VALLEY ALL POINTS WELL
6 TAKEN THAT'S WHY WE RECEIVE FEEDBACK SO WE CAN MODIFY OUR
7 STRATEGY TO ADJUST THE STRATEGIES ACROSS THE REGION TO
8 ENCOURAGE GROWTH IN OTHER PLACES. AS WE LOOK AT SAN FRANCISCO
9 NUMBERS WE SEE A LOT OF TECH JOB GROWTH IN SAN FRANCISCO IN
10 RECENT YEARS SAN FRANCISCO GROWTH IS DEFINED BY THE PIPELINE
11 PROJECT IN THE CITY AND THERE IS A LOT OF SMALL PARCEL SITES
12 THAT ARE LIKELY TO BE REDEVELOPED AND WHILE THERE IS GROWTH IN
13 SAN FRANCISCO IT'S BY PIPELINE VERSUS THERE IS OPPORTUNITY AND
14 ANALYSIS IN SOUTH BAY DEVELOPMENT, SAN FRANCISCO THERE IS A
15 BIT OF A CAP NOT A LOT MORE CAPACITY BEYOND THAT WHERE THE
16 INPUTS ARE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU MEAN JOBS OR HOUSING OR BOTH? JUST TO CLARIFY?
19 >DAVE VAUTIN: WELL FOR BOTH IN A SENSE. THERE IS UPZONING IN
20 PLACES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, BUT A LOT OF SAN FRANCISCO'S
21 REDEVELOPMENT PROJECTS ARE THINGS THAT ARE DEFINED BY BIG
22 SITES LIKE HUNTER'S POINT, TREASURE ISLAND, YOU KNOW. UPZONING
23 POLICIES TESTED IN THE WESTERN HALF OF SAN FRANCISCO REALLY
24 DIDN'T DO MUCH TO INCREASE -- GROWTH IN SAN FRANCISCO THOSE
25 PARCEL SIZES ARE SO SMALL. TO GO BACK TO THE ORIGINAL COMMENT.

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 TELECOMMUTE, OUR HANDS ARE TIED BECAUSE WE HAVE TO NEGOTIATE
2 WITH THE STATE ON WHAT THE TELECOMMUTE ASSUMPTION IS THEY
3 REGULATE OUR ASSUMPTIONS FOR THE PLAN. WE WORKED CLOSELY THIS
4 IS AN INCREASED NUMBER AFTER COVID TO TRY TO INCREASE THAT. SO
5 AS I SAY ONE IN THREE OFFICE WORKERS ON A TYPICAL WORK DAY.
6 THAT MIGHT BE CONSERVATIVE. IT REALLY IS UNCERTAIN RIGHT NOW
7 BUT WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST WITH THE STATE STANDARDS TO INCREASE
8 THE ASSUMPTION. AND THE DESIGN WE GO OUT IN THE ENVIRONMENT
9 AND PURCHASE MORE RECREATION AND PARK SPACE SO THERE IS MORE
10 GREEN SPACE PER PERSON BUT OPPORTUNITY TO THINK ABOUT URBAN
11 PARK SPACE IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS WELL.

12

13 **NEYSA FILGOR:** THANKS DAVE. AND AS STAKEHOLDERS ENGAGE IS THE
14 TECH SECTOR, BUT I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE SHOULD CONSIDER.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** ARTIE AND THEN I SAW A QUESTION FROM ELISE IN THE
17 CHAT. AARTI DO YOU WANT TO GO FIRST?

18

19 **ARTIE SHRIVASTAVA:** A COUPLE OF QUICK COMMENTS. I HAD A CHANCE
20 TO LOOK AT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE'S WORK, MANY
21 COMMUNITIES ESPECIALLY IN THE SOUTH BAY WILL BE LOOKING AT
22 EVEN AN EIGHT YEAR PERIOD OF THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT, CLOSE TO
23 50 PERCENT OF AN INCREASE IN UNITS. AND I REALIZE THAT A LOT
24 OF THIS HAS TO DO WITH, YOU KNOW, THE FACTORS YOU TALKED
25 ABOUT, DAVE. BUT TO SOME EXTENT, I THINK THIS IS KIND OF A

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PROPOSAL BASED ON A LOT OF FACTORS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO, YOU
2 KNOW, A LOT OF RESULTS WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO. BUT I THINK
3 SOME CONSIDERATION HAS TO BE GIVEN TO THE EXPECTATIONS OF
4 JURISDICTION, HOW QUICKLY, HOW FAST THEY'RE EXPECTED TO GROW.
5 BECAUSE THAT IS A REALITY THESE JURISDICTION ARE GOING TO HAVE
6 TO BE FACING. SECOND POINT I WANTED TO MAKE IS, I SUSPECT, AND
7 THIS ISN'T TO SAY ONE WAY OR THE OTHER, BUT A LOT OF THE
8 GROWTH IN THE SOUTH BAY WILL BE IN AREAS THAT ARE NOT AS WELL
9 SERVED BY TRANSIT AS SOME OF THE OTHER TRANSIT ORIENTED CITIES
10 SO I SUSPECT THAT'S WHY YOU'RE SEEING A LOWER, YOU KNOW,
11 PERFORMANCE ON THE PART OF THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS,
12 BECAUSE A LOT OF GROWTH IS EXPECTED. EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE
13 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, THEY STILL ARE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO
14 ACHIEVE THE KIND OF EFFICIENCIES YOU WOULD IN AREAS WHERE A
15 LOT OF INVESTMENT IS GOING IN, IN TRANSIT. SO JUST THOSE TWO
16 POINTS, I WANTED TO MAKE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS AARTI. DO YOU WANT TO ASK YOUR QUESTION
19 FROM CHAT ABOUT THE URBAN SIM?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I WAS WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY WAY NOW THAT WE HAVE
22 THE MODELING IS THERE ANY WAY TO RUN OUR HOUSING METHODOLOGY
23 COMMITTEE OR DRAFT METHODOLOGY THROUGH THE PROGRAM TO FIND OUT
24 HOW THEY FAIR IN TERMS OF REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS?

25 >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S NOT EXACTLY POSSIBLE. WORK YOU PRODUCE IS

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BASICALLY A GROWTH DISTRIBUTION WHICH IS AB OUTPUT IF YOU WANT
2 A MODEL YOU HAVE TO RUN IT THROUGH THE STRATEGIES. WE CAN'T
3 TELL YOU THE SPECIFIC GREENHOUSE GAS FORECAST FOR EACH OF THE
4 DIFFERENT RHNA METHODOLOGIES BUT WE CAN DO SO FOR THE PLANNED
5 BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS. SORRY ABOUT THE UNSATISFYING ANSWER.
6 BUT IF YOU LOOK AT THE PIE CHART YOU SEE THE PIE GOING BACK
7 INTO THE OVEN AND TRYING TO GET IT TO BAKE INTO SOMETHING
8 ELSE.

9

10 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** A QUICK REMINDER WE HAVE 15 MORE MINUTES FOR
11 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON PLANNED BAY AREA. AND THEN WE ANOTHER
12 AGENDA ITEM WHERE WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE CONNECTION AND
13 RHNA. WHERE WE WILL HAVE A LOT OF TIME FOR DISCUSSION. THIS IS
14 TIME FOR CLARIFYING QUESTIONS, DAVE CAN SHARE WAYS TO MAKE
15 COMMENTS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA. MICHAEL, LET'S GO TO YOU THEN
16 JEFF.

17

18 **MICHAEL BRILLIOT:** MICHAEL FROM SAN JOSE. I HAVE COMMENTS. BUT
19 THIS IS QUESTION TIME. QUESTION I HAVE DAVE, 41 PERCENT OF JOB
20 GROWTH WILL GO TO THE SOUTH BAY, CAN YOU TALK ABOUT WHERE IN
21 THE SOUTH BAY? SAN JOSE OF COURSE IS A VETERAN COMMUNITY, WE
22 HAVEN'T SEEN THAT JOB GROWTH COME TO FRUITION AND OUR JOBS
23 HOUSING BALANCE CONTINUES TO DETERIORATE EVEN WORSE AND IT
24 SOUNDS LIKE -- THIS FLY WENT BY REALLY FAST BUT IT SOUNDS LIKE
25 YOU GUYS AREN'T PROJECTING THAT MUCH GROWTH OF JOBS IN PLACES

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 LIKE REDWOOD CITY, SAN MATEO, UP THE PENINSULA WHERE A LOT OF
2 THE JOB GROWTH HAS OCCURRED ALSO. SO IF YOU COULD ANSWER THOSE
3 QUESTIONS THAT WOULD BE GREAT. >DAVE VAUTIN: CERTAINLY. THERE
4 IS A DIFFERENT ECONOMIC STRATEGY WE APPLY WE INCLUDED
5 ADDITIONAL DEVELOPMENT CAPACITY ALONG TRANSIT LINES FOR JOBS.
6 ULTIMATELY OUR FORECAST IS SHOWING STRONG GROWTH IN THE CLASS
7 OF GOLDEN TRIANGLE REGION IN SOUTH BAY NORTH FIRST STREET SAN
8 JOSE MOUNTAIN VIEW SANTA CLARA THAT MOUNTAIN ZONE HAS
9 PARTICULARLY DENSE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AS WELL
10 AS ADDITIONAL GROWTH NEAR THE DIRIDON STATION AREA NOT
11 SURPRISING GIVEN ALL THE PIPELINE PROJECTS IN THE QUEUE OVER
12 THERE AND DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE. THERE IS FAIRLY ROBUST JOB GROWTH
13 IN THOSE CENTERS, YOU CAN TAKE A LOOK AT THE BLUEPRINT
14 MATERIALS ONLINE AND YOU CAN SEE THE BREAKDOWN OF JOB GROWTH
15 BY CITIES AND COUNTIES.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE THREE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. YOU PRESENTED THE
22 OUTCOMES IN THE BLUEPRINT COMPARED TO PDA 2040. HOW DID THE
23 OUTCOMES IN THE BLUEPRINT COMPARE TO WHAT THE DEVELOPMENT
24 PATTERN HAS DONE OVER THE LAST 8 TO 10 YEARS. HOW MUCH OF A
25 SHIFT DOES THIS BLUEPRINT CALL FOR FROM WHAT'S ACTUALLY BEEN

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HAPPENING VERSUS WHAT'S CALLED FOR IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN? THE
2 SECOND QUESTION IS, IN THE BLUEPRINT, WHAT PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL
3 HOUSING PROJECTION IS PROTECTED TO BE IN THE VERY LOW AND LOW
4 INCOME CATEGORIES. AND THE 30 IS IN THE STRATEGIES, HOW DOES
5 THE NEW HOUSING ENTITY BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AGENCY FACTOR
6 INTO THOSE STRATEGIES? >DAVE VAUTIN: HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA
7 HAS BEEN POLARIZED IN THE LAST TEN YEARS. GROWTH HAS BEEN
8 HAPPENING IN SAN JOSE SAN FRANCISCO AND THE PERIPHERY OF THE
9 REGIONS, WHEREAS BAYSIDE CITIES HAVE CONTRIBUTED LESS
10 SPECIFICALLY CONSIDERING SHARE OF THE POPULATION. IN THE DRAFT
11 BLUEPRINT THERE IS A LITTLE BIT LOWER GROWTH IN THE THREE BIG
12 CITIES MORE GROWTH IN THE BAYSIDE SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES THAT
13 RING SAN FRANCISCO BAY AND THEN I THINK MORE COMPARABLE SHARE,
14 I WOULD HAVE TO CHECK IN THE COMMUNITIES INLAND BASICALLY.
15 WITH REGARDS TO THE SHARE OF LOW INCOME HOUSING, I THINK I
16 SHOW ABOUT 400,000 NEW DEED RESTRICTED UNITS THAT WOULD BE FOR
17 VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME DEMOGRAPHICS THAT'S OFF THE TOP OF MY
18 HEAD ABOUT 30 PERCENT OR SO OF ALL NEW HOUSING UNITS IN THE
19 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AND THEN REFERENCE TO BAHFA, WE DON'T SAY WHO
20 IS GENERATING THE ADDITIONAL HOUSING REVENUE TO PAY FOR THE
21 NEW DEED RESTRICTED HOUSING. IT COULD BE ON THE COUNTY LEVEL
22 IT COULD ON THE REGION LEVEL COMBINATION OF HOUSING BONDS OR
23 OTHER SORTS OF REVENUE MEASURES WOULD BE NECESSARY TO REALIZE
24 THAT VISION.

25

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** JULIE.

2

3 **JULIE PIERCE:** THANK YOU. DAVE, AND MATT, I'M GOING TO
4 APOLOGIZE IN ADVANCE FOR ASKING THE SAME QUESTION I ALWAYS
5 ASK, WHAT DOES IT TAKE TO DRIVE JOBS TO THE PLACE WHERE IS
6 PEOPLE ALREADY ARE? THE INLAND COMMUNITIES THAT HAD THE MORE
7 AFFORDABLE NATURALLY OCCURRING HOUSING? YOU KNOW THIS IS
8 SOMETHING WE HAVE WANTED FOR A LONG TIME IN THE EAST BAY, THE
9 NORTHERN WATERFRONT, IN SOLANO COUNTY EVEN, AND I KEEP HEARING
10 IT'S ALWAYS GOING TO GO BACK TO THE SAME PLACE BECAUSE THEY
11 LIKE TO CLUSTER TOGETHER. THE VMT, THE GREENHOUSE GASSES ARE
12 ASTRONOMICAL IF WE BUILD MORE HOUSING. SO FAR AWAY FROM WHERE
13 THE JOBS ARE GOING TO BE. SO WHAT'S IT TAKE TO MOVE JOBS TO
14 WHERE THE HOUSINGS ALREADY ARE? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE DID ANALYSIS
15 ON THIS AS PART OF THE HORIZON PROCESS AND WE SHARED A BIT OF
16 THE SPECTRUM WITH THE COMMISSIONERS AND THE BOARD AT THE
17 JANUARY RETREAT. SO ON ONE END YOU HAVE TAX INCENTIVES AND
18 OTHER INCENTIVES WE FOUND THAT TO BE NOT PARTICULARLY STRONG
19 IN TERMS OF DRIVING MORE JOBS TO HOUSING RICH PLACES. IN THE
20 MIDDLE IS A SET OF STRATEGIES THAT THE COMMISSION AND BOARD
21 APPROVED IN FEBRUARY WHICH WAS KIND OF A FEE STRUCTURE THAT
22 WAS DESIGNED TO CHARGE IMPACT FEES FOR THE ADDITIONAL CAMPUSES
23 IN JOB RICH AREAS ADDITIONAL OFFICE DEVELOPMENT. THAT HAS
24 MINIMAL IMPACT. WE SAW MORE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT AND JOBS MOVING
25 TO SOUTHERN CENTRAL ALAMEDA COUNTY IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THAT'S ABOUT ALL IT D WE THEN HAD KIND OF THE MOST AGGRESSIVE
2 STRATEGY WHICH WE SHOWED TO THE COMMISSION AND BOARD AND THE
3 COMMISSION AND BOARD DEPARTMENT WANT TO MOVE FOR WITH THAT
4 IDEA BUT THAT WAS THE ONLY ONE WE FOUND THAT HAS SHIFTED MORE
5 JOBS TO THE EAST BAY AND THAT'S HAVING OFFICE DEVELOPMENT
6 LIMITATION IN SPECIFIC COUNTIES IN THE REGION THAT ARE MORE
7 JOB RICH THAT LEAD TO GROWTH IN ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA. IT'S
8 A STRONG STRATEGY TO ACTUALLY YIELD THE RESULTS YOU'RE
9 REFERRING TO.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** JOSH AND THEN TOM, YOU SAW YOU HAD A QUESTION
12 IN THE CHAT.

13

14 **JOSH ABRAMS:** I GUESS IT'S FRUSTRATING TO ME NOT SO MUCH A
15 QUESTION BUT I WANT TO OFFER FEEDBACK AND I THINK A LOT OF
16 PEOPLE DO AND YOU WANT US TO USE PLANNED BAY AREA IN OUR WORK,
17 BUT WE DON'T HAVE ANY OPPORTUNITIES TO DISCUSS IT OR REALLY
18 GIVE YOU FEEDBACK ASIDE FROM SENDING IN A COMMENT IN ONE OF
19 EVERY 10,000 OF OTHER ONES THAT YOU RECEIVED. I GUESS IT
20 DOESN'T REALLY FEEL LIKE YOU VALUE OUR INPUT IF WE CAN'T GIVE
21 YOU -- IF YOU'RE NOT USING THIS FORUM TO GET INPUT. I HAVE
22 COMMENTS, BUT YOU DON'T WANT THEM. SO, I GUESS I'LL SEND YOU A
23 LETTER. I DON'T KNOW. SORRY, MY FRUSTRATION IS COMING THROUGH.
24 >DAVE VAUTIN: I'M SORRY THAT WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO
25 SPEND TALKING ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA FOR THREE OR FOUR HOURS

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 WHICH IS PROBABLY WHAT SOME MIGHT WANT TO DO BUT I DO WANT TO
2 ENCOURAGE YOU, WE HAVE, YOU KNOW, A WHOLE NUMBER OF DIFFERENT
3 FORUMS COMING UP THAT YOU CAN REGISTER FOR. THERE ARE PUBLIC
4 EVENTS ONES DESIGNED FOR STAKEHOLDERS LIKE YOURSELF GO TO OUR
5 WEB SITE PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG AND WE CAN SIGN YOU UP FOR THOSE
6 EVENTS AND WE FOCUS ON THE HOUSING AND STRATEGIES OF THE PLAN.

7

8 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** TOMMY AND THEN FERNANDO.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. A COUPLE OF CLARIFYING QUESTIONS.

11

12 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** CAN YOU SPEAK UP? I'M HAVING A HARD TIME
13 HEARING YOU.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** SORRY I'LL TRY. IS THAT BETTER?

16

17 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** BETTER. JUST TALK LOUD.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I'LL TALK LOUDER. A COUPLE OF CLARIFYING
20 QUESTIONS FOR THE HOUSING GROWTH ASSUMPTIONS THAT YOU SHARED,
21 I DON'T REMEMBER THE SLIDE NUMBER. BUT IS THE MODEL, WERE YOU
22 SAYING THAT THAT MODEL IS BASED ON OUR CAPPED -- BASED ON
23 EXISTING ZONING? AND JUST BECAUSE I WANT TO CAUTION THE RHNA
24 METHODOLOGY, WE MAY NOT LIMIT CONSIDERATION OF HOUSING SITES
25 BASED ON LAND USE RESTRICTIONS BUT THAT MIGHT BE A PART OF THE

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 CONVERSATION IN THE NEXT PRESENTATION. AND THEN ALSO THE 1.3
2 MILLION NEW HOUSEHOLDS THAT ARE IN THAT SAME HOUSING GROWTH
3 PATTERN, IS THAT WHAT PLANNED BAY AREA IS SEEING BEING
4 COMPLETED OVER THE 30 YEAR PERIOD? SO WOULD THAT BE THE 43,000
5 A YEAR OR LIKE, I GUESS OVER THE NEXT EIGHT YEARS THAT WOULD
6 BE 346? AND IF SO, HOW DID THAT TRACK FOR THE LAST PLANNED BAY
7 AREA IF .8 MILLION WERE PROJECTED? DID WE MEET THAT HOUSING
8 GOAL LAST PLANNED BAY AREA? >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME SEE THE
9 QUESTIONS. FIRST WE STARTED WITH ZONING, THE FLOW CHART,
10 THAT'S ONE BUT THEN WE APPLIED STRATEGIES TO ENABLE MORE
11 HOUSING GROWTH IN CRITICAL AREAS NEAR BART STATIONS ACROSS THE
12 REGION SO THOSE STRATEGIES REALLY HELPED DEFINE GROWTH AREAS
13 FOR THE PLAN AND GO ABOVE AND BEYOND THE EXISTING ZONING. NOT
14 TO SAY REGIONAL OR STATE ACTION THERE BUT IDENTIFYING LOCAL
15 JURISDICTION WILL LOOK TO KEY GROWTH AREAS IN THE FUTURE. WITH
16 REGARDS TO THE GROWTH LEVELS IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AND
17 2050, OUR REGION HAS HISTORICALLY UNDERPRODUCED HOUSING AND
18 CERTAINLY WE'RE NOT ON TRACK WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2040
19 PRODUCTION LEVELS HOWEVER PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAS A SET OF
20 EXPANDED HOUSING STRATEGIES THAT ARE DESIGNED TO ACCELERATE
21 THAT CURVE TO ENABLE MORE HOUSING GROWTH AND TO DO SO AT
22 ESPECIALLY AT THE LOWER INCOME LEVELS WHERE IT'S MUCH NEEDED.
23 IT'S SIGNIFICANTLY FASTER TRAJECTORY FOR HOUSING GROWTH THAN
24 PAST PLANS.

25

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU. FERNANDO.

2

3 **FERNANDO MARTI:** SURE. I HAD TWO QUESTIONS. SO ONE WAS, DAVE
4 YOU SPOKE ABOUT THE BAYSIDE CITIES HAVING RECEIVED A
5 PROPORTIONATELY SMALLER ALLOCATION -- OR NOT ALLOCATION, BUT
6 PRODUCTION, PRODUCING LESS HOUSING THAN THE BIG THREE CITIES
7 THAT PRODUCE ROUGHLY 50 PERCENT OF THE HOUSING GROWTH THAT WE
8 HAVE SEEN, SO MY FIRST QUESTION IS, SO DOES BY BAYSIDE CITIES,
9 IS THAT GENERALLY INCLUDE HIGH OPPORTUNITY, HIGH RESOURCE
10 CITIES? AND DID YOU ALL LOOK AT THAT, HOW WELL DID HIGH
11 RESOURCE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS DO IN PRODUCING HOUSING? AND
12 THEN MY SECOND QUESTION IS, IN YOUR LOOKING FORWARD IN YOUR
13 PROJECTIONS, THE MAPS SORT OF SHOW WHAT FOLKS HAVE SORT OF
14 SEEN ABOUT EMPHASIS OF ALLOCATION AROUND SILICON VALLEY, JOB
15 CENTERS, WERE YOU, IN THE BLUEPRINT, IS THAT ALSO LOOKING AT
16 DIFFERENTIAL ALLOCATIONS OF MARKET RATE AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING
17 THE WAY THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE DISCUSSING LATER TODAY IN THIS
18 MEETING? AND IF NOT, HOW DO YOU ALIGN THOSE KIND OF EMPHASIS
19 ON AFFORDABLE IN ONE PLACE OR MARKET RATE IN A DIFFERENT PLACE
20 THAT RHNA IS -- THAT THIS RHNA PROCESS IS FOLLOWING? >DAVE
21 VAUTIN: BOTH GOOD QUESTIONS. FIRST QUESTION WITH REGARDS TO
22 THE BAYSIDE COMMUNITIES, MANY OF THE BAYSIDE COMMUNITIES, NOT
23 ALL OF THEM, BUT MANY OF THEM THAT ARE HAVE LOWER HOUSING
24 PRODUCTION IN THE LAST DECADE, YOU KNOW, TEND TO BE HIGHER
25 RESOURCE PLACES THAT ARE MORE CONCERNED ABOUT NEW GROWTH. IN

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, NOT ONLY IS THERE A LITTLE MORE GROWTH IN
2 THE BAYSIDE CITIES THAN WE HAVE SEEN IN RECENT YEARS BUT MORE
3 GROWTH IN THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS BECAUSE WE HAVE INCORPORATED
4 SOME OF NOT ALL BUT SOME OF THE HIGH RESOURCES THAT HAVE BASIC
5 TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS INTO THE GROWTH PATTERN OF THE PLAN. I
6 THINK THERE IS MORE ROOM, IF THERE ARE FOLKS WHO ARE
7 INTERESTED IN INCREASING THAT SHARE EVEN FURTHER THERE IS
8 STILL MORE ROOM FOR GROWTH THERE BUT WE ARE MAKING HEADWAY
9 COMPARED TO THE LAST PLAN THAT DIDN'T HAVE AS MUCH GROWTH IN
10 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. AND WITH REGARDS TO THE BREAKDOWN BY
11 INCOME, YES WE DO DO OUR SIMULATION MODELING AT THE DIFFERENT
12 INCOME LEVELS. WE HAVE METRICS POSTED ONLINE THAT SHOWS
13 SPECIFICALLY WHERE LOW INCOME HOUSING ARE. AND WE'RE DOING
14 WORK IN JULY ON JOBS HOUSING FIT AND HOW WELL WE'RE DOING IN
15 THAT REGARD SO THERE IS NUMBER CRUNCHING GOING ON AT THIS
16 TIME.

17

18 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS. I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY, FOR BOB AND
19 JAMES, I HAVE BEEN HOLDING OFF ON YOU GUYS TO GET FOLKS WHO
20 HAVEN'T ASKED A QUESTION TO ALLOW THEM OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK
21 FOR THE AGENCY ENORMOUS YOU NORMS YOU ALL ADOPTED LAST YEAR.
22 WE'RE GOING TO GO INTO ROUND TWO, AND WRAPPING THIS UP IN THE
23 NEXT THREE OR FOUR MINUTES SO WE CAN MOVE ON TO THE NEXT
24 AGENDA ITEM. JAMES WHY DON'T WE GO TO YOU AND THEN BOB.

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** SURE. THANK YOU. SO, I WAS WONDERING IF THE
2 RELATIVELY LOW PROJECTIONS OF GROWTH, HOW IT PARTICULARLY
3 HOUSING GROWTH FOR ALAMEDA, SAN FRANCISCO, SOME OF
4 TRADITIONALLY TRANSIT SERVED AREAS IS ASSOCIATED WITH THE
5 OUTCOME THAT YOU'RE PROJECTING OF CONTINUED DISPLACEMENT IN
6 THOSE COMMUNITIES, OR IN OUR SORT OF LOWER INCOME TRANSIT
7 SERVED AREAS. IS THERE A SECTION THERE BETWEEN LESS HOUSING
8 BEING PROJECTED AND MORE DISPLACEMENT? >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME
9 CLARIFY, THERE IS NOT NECESSARILY LESS HOUSING, JUST A SMALLER
10 SHARE OF THE TOTAL HOUSING. THERE'S ACTUALLY MORE HOUSING THAN
11 IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN IN MANY OF THOSE COUNTIES. THAT'S A
12 REALLY INTERESTING QUESTION AND ONE THAT WE -- IT'S VERY
13 DIFFICULT FOR US TO GET TO THE CAUSALITY OF SOME OF THE
14 DISPLACEMENT METRICS AND WE KEEP TRYING TO EXPLORE IT FURTHER.
15 SO I DON'T HAVE A GREAT ANSWER FOR YOU RIGHT NOW WHERE WE
16 REPORT-OUT ON THE AREAS OF CONCERN, WHERE WE TRY TO IMPROVE
17 PERFORMANCE IN THAT REGARD THIS TIME AROUND SOMETHING WILL --
18

19 **SPEAKER:** THERE'S A DISCONNECT THERE BETWEEN IF YOUR PROJECTING
20 CONTINUED DEMAND FROM HIGH INCOME PEOPLE PUSHING OUT LOW
21 INCOME PEOPLE IN THOSE AREAS AND YET THERE ISN'T AS
22 SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF GROWTH IN HOUSING AFFORDABLE AND MARKET
23 RATE IN THOSE AREAS THEN THERE IS JUST KIND OF A DISCONNECT
24 THERE BETWEEN WHAT PEOPLE SEEM TO BE WANTING IN THE MODEL AND
25 WHAT'S PROJECTING IN HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HAVE BEEN TYPICALLY TRYING, GIVEN THE INTEREST IN CREATING A
2 PATHWAY TO OPPORTUNITY, TRYING TO FOCUS ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING
3 IN THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS BECAUSE THAT PROVIDES GREAT
4 OPPORTUNITY FOR UPWARD ECONOMIC MOBILITY. IF WE PUT ALL THE
5 UNITS OVER THERE THEN YOU'RE NOT PUTTING THEM IN THE LOWER
6 OPPORTUNITY AREAS WHERE DISPLACEMENT IS HIGH. SO WE'RE WORKING
7 ON THAT RIGHT NOW FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU. BOB, YOU HAVE BEEN SO PATIENT. THANK
12 YOU. YOU'RE UP.

13

14 **BOB PLANTHOLD:** YOU'RE PROJECTING CERTAIN AMOUNTS OF TRANSIT
15 USE. JUST THIS PAST WEEK MUNI AND AC TRANSIT BOTH SAID THEY'RE
16 CUTTING DRAMATICALLY A LARGE NUMBER OF THEIR LINES MUNI
17 ELIMINATING A NUMBER OF LINES PERMANENTLY 1/3 OR MORE. AC
18 TRANSIT IS GOING TO ELIMINATE. DO YOU HAVE TIME BEFORE
19 FINALIZATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO LOOK AT HOW THIS
20 DRAMATIC REDUCTION IN TRANSIT MIGHT EFFECT WHERE PEOPLE LIVE?
21 BECAUSE I WILL SAY, MUNI'S PLANS ARE LUDICROUS. THEY EXPECT
22 PEOPLE TO TAKE AN E-SCOOTER OR BIKE, OR E-BIKE, AND NOT TAKE A
23 CAR. BUT THAT DOESN'T ALLOW FOR THE LIMITS OF SENIORS AND
24 PRIMARY GRADES WHO AREN'T GOING TO BE ABLE TO TAKE OR USE
25 THOSE FACILITIES. DOES PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 HAVE A WAY TO

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 MAKE A QUICK FOOTNOTE, THINGS GOT REALLY PLUGGED UP BECAUSE OF
2 THIS THAT AND THE OTHER AND NOW WE CAN'T RELIABLY PROJECT,
3 PREDICT, THE PERCENTAGES THAT WE EARLIER THOUGHT MIGHT PREVAIL
4 IN A REAL NORMAL WORLD? >DAVE VAUTIN: YOU'RE POINTING OUT A
5 VERY NEAR AND MEDIUM TERM TURN. OUR SOLUTION TO THIS
6 CHALLENGE, WE DON'T HAVE -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS NOT AN
7 IMMEDIATE SOLUTION TO THE CHALLENGES OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS,
8 BUT I WANT TO NOTE WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING FOR THE FINAL
9 BLUEPRINT WILL ACTUALLY PRIORITIZE SOME OF THE REGIONAL
10 FUNDING IN THE PLAN TO ENSURE THAT WE CAN GET TRANSIT SERVICE
11 BACK TO THE 2019 SERVICE LEVELS AS SOON AS WE -- AS SOON AS
12 POSSIBLE. NOW I'M NOT SAYING THAT'S ANY TIME IN THE NEXT FIVE
13 YEARS BUT IN THE PLAN WE'RE TRYING TO FIND WAYS TO ACCELERATE
14 IT SO WE CAN COME BACK TO THOSE SERVICE LEVELS SOONER RATHER
15 THAN LATER AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE INTEGRATING INTO THE
16 PLAN.

17

18 **BOB PLANTHOLD:** GOOD TO HEAR.

19

20 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANK YOU ALL. IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE WRAPPING UP
21 THIS AGENDA ITEM, AND I'M GOING TO MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT ONE. SO
22 --

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** BEFORE WE MOVE ON WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC
25 COMMENT. ON ITEM FIVE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 KEY FINDING. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK RAISE YOUR HAND OR
2 PRESS STAR NINE. MR. CASTRO WILL CALL ON THE ATTENDEES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WHAT IS THE TIME LIMIT?

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. THANK YOU. OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS
9 NOAH HOOSH. NOAH, GO AHEAD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO SAY I COMPLETELY CONCUR
12 WITH THE STATEMENTS OF JOSH ABRAMS REGARDING THE ABILITY FOR
13 US TO MAKE A DECISION ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA'S BENEFITS OR
14 IMPACTS TO THIS PROCESS, KIND OF GIVEN THE LIMITATIONS PUT ON
15 HOW IT'S PRESENTED AND OPPORTUNITIES TO AFFECT THE PLAN
16 THROUGH THIS PROCESS WHILE WE'RE ALSO BEING ASKED TO DECIDE TO
17 LEVERAGE OR UTILIZE IT.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ALFRED TWU. GO AHEAD.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI EVERYONE. MY NAME IS ALFRED, AND I JUST WANT TO
24 SAY THAT WE NEED TO PLAN TO SUCCEED, NOT TO PLAN TO JUST
25 CONTINUE THIS HOUSING CRISIS. SO DEFINITELY PUT MORE HOUSING



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

July 9, 2020

1 IN THE WEALTHIER NEIGHBORHOODS, AND FOR A HIGHER NUMBER. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER ATTENDEES
5 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AND NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
6 THIS ITEM.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL TURN IT BACK
9 OVER TO AMBER.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM SIX.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** YES WHICH IS --

14

15 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** PRESENTATION BY GILLIAN, AND --

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** -- PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE RHNA
18 METHODOLOGY. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. GILLIAN.

19

20 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** IF I CAN SAY AT THE OUTSET, OUR PLAN IS TO HAVE
21 GILLIAN PRESENT. WE NEED TO TAKE A BREAK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
22 BETWEEN HER PRESENTATION AND ELI'S PRESENTATION BUT THEN WE'LL
23 HAVE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON BOTH TOGETHER.

24

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** OKAY. THANK YOU AMBER. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE
2 OTHER SLIDE DECK PLEASE. NEXT SLIDE. SO AGAIN NOW THAT WE HAVE
3 LEARNED MORE ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA DRAFT BLUEPRINT FROM DAVE
4 WE'RE GOING TO DISCUSS WHAT ROLE THE PLAN MIGHT HAVE IN THE
5 RHNA METHODOLOGY. AS AMBER MENTIONED, WE FEEL LIKE THE NEXT
6 TWO AGENDA ITEMS ARE RELATED AND SO WE'RE HOPING THAT WE CAN
7 WAIT UNTIL AFTER ELI'S PRESENTATION ABOUT HOW THE PLAN MIGHT
8 RELATE TO THE INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGIES TO HAVE THE
9 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS AND A DISCUSSION AMONGST THE GROUP ABOUT
10 HOW WE MIGHT WANT TO INCORPORATE PLANNED BAY AREA INTO THE
11 METHODOLOGY. HOUSING ELEMENT REQUIRES RHNA METHODOLOGY TO BE
12 CONSISTENT WITH THE DEVELOPMENT PATTERN FROM PLANNED BAY AREA
13 2050 ALTHOUGH THE STATUTE DOESN'T PROVIDE DEFINITION OR
14 GUIDANCE FOR ACHIEVING CONSISTENCY INCORPORATING PLANNED BAY
15 AREA 2050 DIRECTLY INTO THE RHNA METHODOLOGY WITH SUPPORT
16 CONSISTENCY IN THE PLAN. HOWEVER CONSISTENCY CAN BE ACHIEVED
17 IF THE METHODOLOGY DOESN'T USE THE PLAN TO LINK FORWARD THE
18 ALLOCATIONS WITH THE RELEASE OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT HMC CAN
19 CONSIDER WHAT ROLE THE BLUEPRINT CAN PLAY IN MEETING THE RHNA
20 METHODOLOGY STATUTORY PLAN AND SUPPORTING CONSISTENCY WITH THE
21 PLANS DEVELOPMENT PATTERN. TODAY'S PRESENTATION DISCUSSES TWO
22 OPTIONS FOR USING THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT IN THE
23 METHODOLOGY. USING THE BLUEPRINT AS SOLE FACTOR FOR ALLOCATING
24 RHNA UNITS. EACH TOTAL UNIT ALLOCATION IS BASED ON SHARE OF
25 HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM 2010 TO 2050 FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT.

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SECOND OPTION IS TO USE EACH JURISDICTION OF SHARE OF FUTURE
2 HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE
3 ALLOCATION IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY INSTEAD OF USING TOTAL
4 HOUSEHOLDS IN 2019 AND I'M GOING TO PROVIDE MORE DETAILS ABOUT
5 BOTH OF THESE OPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE DRAFT
6 BLUEPRINT IS A COMPREHENSIVE REPRESENTATION OF MANY DIFFERENT
7 STRATEGIES AND POLICIES THAT ARE ALIGNED WITH THE RHNA
8 STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND THE HMC'S GOALS FOR THE RHNA
9 METHODOLOGY. AS DAVE MENTIONED IN HIS PRESENTATION THE DRAFT
10 BLUEPRINT RESULTS IN SEVERAL POSITIVE OUTCOMES FOR THE REGION
11 RELATED TO HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY. DRAFT BLUEPRINT
12 IS ALSO ALIGNED WITH SEVERAL OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS, THE HMC
13 CAME TO CONSENSUS ABOUT IN JUNE. HMC RECOMMENDED THAT THE
14 METHODOLOGY SHOULD DIRECT MORE HOUSING TO JURISDICTION WITH
15 MORE JOBS THAN HOUSING AND TO COMMUNITIES EXHIBITING RACIAL
16 AND ECONOMIC EXCLUSION. RELATEDLY THE HMC ALSO AGREED THE
17 METHODOLOGY SHOULD FOCUS ON EQUITY AND THE RELATIONSHIP
18 BETWEEN HOUSING AND JOBS. LASTLY, THE HMC CONFIRMED THAT
19 HOUSING IN HIGH HAZARD AREAS IS A CONCERN BUT RHNA MAY NOT BE
20 THE BEST TOOL TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE. DRAFT BLUEPRINT REFLECTS
21 THE HMC'S EQUITY FOCUSED GOALS FOR RHNA BY PRIORITIZING GROWTH
22 IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS PARTICULARLY IN SOUTH BAY ALTHOUGH THE
23 DRAFT BLUEPRINT DOES NOT ACHIEVE AN OVERALL HOUSING JOBS
24 BALANCE FOR THE REGION IT SHOWS GAINS BY FOCUSING GROWTH TO
25 JOB CENTERS IN THE PENINSULA AND SOUTH BAY. DRAFT BLUEPRINT

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 TAKES STEPS TO ADDRESS THE REGION'S HAZARD RISKS. GROWTH
2 GEOGRAPHIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PROTECT AREAS OUTSIDE URBAN
3 GROWTH BOUNDARIES AND WILDFIRE AREAS FEBRUARY HOUSING GROWTH.
4 INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE BLUEPRINT PROTECT ALL HOUSEHOLDS AT RISK
5 OF SEA LEVEL RISE ACCORDINGLY THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAY BE MORE
6 SUITED FOR ADDRESSING CONCERNS RELATED TO HAZARDS THAN FACTORS
7 THAT OMITTS ALLOCATIONS IN HIGH HAZARD AREAS. THE FIRST OPTION
8 FOR USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IN THE METHODOLOGY WOULD BE TO
9 HAVE EACH JURISDICTION'S TOTAL UNIT ALLOCATION FOR RHNA BE
10 BASED ON SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM 2010 TO 2050 FROM THE
11 DRAFT BLUEPRINT THE PLAN WOULD NOT BE USED TO ADJUST BASELINE
12 ALLOCATION BUT INSTEAD BE THE SOLE DETERMINANT OF A
13 JURISDICTION'S RHNA ALLOCATION. THIS APPROACH MIRRORS THE
14 METHODOLOGY FOR ALLOCATING TOTAL UNITS ADOPTED BY THE
15 SACRAMENTO REGION FOR THIS RHNA CYCLE. USING THE DRAFT
16 BLUEPRINT TO ALLOCATE UNITS WOULD BE BEST PAIRED WITH THE
17 INCOME SHIFT INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY. THE BOTTOM UP --
18 [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE] CATEGORY -- [AUDIO
19 DIFFICULTIES]

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** GILLIAN, YOUR INTERNET CONNECTION IS
22 CHOPPY. [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT --

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** GILLIAN, WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. DID GILLIAN
2 DROP OFF?

3
4 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I'M TRYING TO SEE --

5
6 **SPEAKER:** SHE'S PUTTING HERSELF BACK ON.

7
8 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** EXACTLY. IF WE CAN GIVE HER A MINUTE. THANKS
9 FOR YOUR PATIENCE, ALL. TECHNOLOGY.

10
11 **SPEAKER:** IT STILL BEATS COMMUTING DOWN THERE.

12
13 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THAT'S LOOKING ON THE BRIGHT SIDE.

14
15 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. CAN EVERYONE HEAR ME NOW?

16
17 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** YOU'RE BACK. MAYBE YOU NEED TO REPEAT WHAT YOU
18 WERE SAYING SO WE'RE ALL CAUGHT UP.

19
20 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THE PREVIOUS SLIDE TO THIS ONE. SO BASICALLY
21 THE FIRST OPTION FOR USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IN THE
22 METHODOLOGY WOULD BE TO HAVE EACH JURISDICTION'S TOTAL UNIT
23 ALLOCATION FOR RHNA BE BASED ON SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FOR
24 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. ADJUSTED TO BASELINE ALLOCATION --
25 INSTEAD TOTAL ADJUSTMENT OF RHNA ALLOCATION. THIS IS WHAT

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SACRAMENTO DID FOR THE RHNA CYCLE AND YOU SEE THE DRAFT
2 BLUEPRINT TO ALLOCATE UNITS BEST PAIRED WITH INCOME SHIFT ARE
3 INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY. BOTTOM UP INCOME ALLOCATION
4 APPROACH USES SEPARATE FACTORS TO ALLOCATE IN EACH INCOME
5 CATEGORY NOT COMPATIBLE WITH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS SOLE
6 FACTOR TO ALLOCATE UNITS. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE ALLOCATIONS
7 THAT WOULD RESULT FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS THE SOLE PATH IN
8 THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. EXPERIENCING THE LOWEST GROWTH RATE
9 WHILE RED HIGHEST GROWTH RATE THIS MAP DEMONSTRATES THE DRAFT
10 BLUEPRINT EMPHASIS ON HOUSING GROWTH IN SILICON VALLEY AS THE
11 DRAFT BLUEPRINT ADDRESSES SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE REGION'S
12 HOUSING GROWTH IN JURISDICTION IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND SAN
13 MATEO COUNTY WITH LOWER RATES OF GROWTH IN MANY OTHER
14 COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION. WITH REGARD TO ANOTHER
15 ISSUE HIGHLIGHTED BY THE HMC IN PAST MEETINGS USING THE DRAFT
16 BLUEPRINT TO ALLOCATE THE REGION'S HOUSING NEED RESULT IN
17 LOWER ALLOCATIONS TO THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS FOR MOST
18 COUNTIES -- [INDISCERNIBLE] BY HMC HOWEVER THIS IS NOT THE
19 CASE FOR SAN MATEO, SANTA CLARA, SOLANO AND SONOMA COUNTIES.
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. A BASELINE ALLOCATION CAN BE A STARTING
21 PLACE IN RHNA METHODOLOGY AND IS USED TO ASSIGN EACH
22 JURISDICTION A SHARE OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
23 DETERMINATION FROM HCD, THE METHODOLOGY OPTIONS HMC HAS BEEN
24 DISCUSSING TO DATE START BY -- SHARE OF REGION'S HOUSEHOLD IN
25 2019 THE METHODOLOGY ADJUSTS BASELINE ALLOCATION UP OR DOWN

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 DEPENDING ON FACTORS AND WEIGHTS SELECTED AND HOW JURISDICTION
2 SCORES ON FACTORS COMPARED TO JURISDICTION IN THE REGION.
3 SECOND OPTION FOR USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IN THE RHNA
4 METHODOLOGY HOUSEHOLD IN 2019 WOULD BE REPLACED BY EACH
5 JURISDICTION'S SHARE OF FUTURE HOUSEHOLD GROWTH FROM THE DRAFT
6 BLUEPRINT. THIS APPROACH IS CONSISTENT WITH HOW LONG RANGE
7 FORECASTS HAVE BEEN USED IN ABAG'S METHODOLOGIES FOR PREVIOUS
8 RHNA CYCLES. WHILE OPTION ONE WOULD USE THE PLANNED BAY AREA
9 2050 BLUEPRINT AS THE SOLE FACTOR FOR ALLOCATING UNITS TO
10 JURISDICTION. OPTION TWO USES THE BLUEPRINT AS A BASELINE
11 ALLOCATION THAT IS THEN ADJUSTED BY OTHER METHODOLOGY FACTORS.
12 SINCE THE BOTTOM UP INCOME ALLOCATION APPROACH USES SEPARATE
13 FACTORS TO ALLOCATE UNITS IN EACH INCOME CATEGORY THE MOST
14 EFFECTIVE WAY TO INCORPORATE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT TO BOTTOM UP
15 METHODOLOGY OPTIONS IS TO USE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS A
16 BASELINE ALLOCATION. THUS OPTION ONE WOULD PAIR WITH THE
17 INCOME SHIFT APPROACH FOR DIVIDING RHNA AMONG THE INCOME
18 CATEGORIES OPTION TWO INCOME SHIFT APPROACH OR THE BOTTOM UP
19 APPROACH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE COMPARES THE EFFECTS
20 OF THE TWO DIFFERENT -- HOUSING [INDISCERNIBLE] AND BOTTOM UP
21 THREE METHODOLOGY OPTIONS. FOR THESE COMPARISONS STAFF REMOVED
22 THE BALANCE EQUITY AND JOBS HOUSING NEEDS SCENARIOS CREATED IN
23 MARCH BASED ON THE FEEDBACK AT THE JUNE HMC MEETING THAT THE
24 RHNA METHODOLOGY SHOULD NOT INCLUDE A FACTOR RELATED TO
25 HAZARDS. IF HMC IS INTERESTED IN VISITING CONCEPTOLOGIES FROM

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 MARCH, STAFF CAN MAKE ADJUSTMENTS AND USE REVISED
2 METHODOLOGIES FOR FUTURE ANALYSIS. STAFF LIKELY TO SHOW ONLY
3 ONE OF THE BOTTOM UP CONSENT CONCEPTS -- FOR EACH METHODOLOGY
4 CONCEPT ON THE SLIDE THE MAP ON THE LEFT SHOWS THE RESULTS OF
5 THE METHODOLOGY USING TOTAL HOUSEHOLDS IN 2019 AS THE BASELINE
6 ALLOCATION. WHILE THE MAP ON THE RIGHT SHOWS RESULTS OF DRAFT
7 BLUEPRINT USED AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION. AGAIN, JURISDICTION
8 SHOWN IN THE DARKEST BLUE EXPERIENCED THE LOWEST GROWTH RATE
9 WHILE JURISDICTION IN DARKEST RED EXPERIENCE HIGHEST GROWTH
10 RATES THESE COMPARISONS DEMONSTRATE THE SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS
11 THAT THE UNDERLYING GROWTH PATTERN FROM THE BASELINE
12 ALLOCATION HAS ON THE METHODOLOGY OUTPUT. OVERALL, THE MAPS
13 INDICATE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS THE BASELINE
14 ALLOCATION RESULT IN CAPACITY NEAR MAJOR JOB CENTERS WHICH ARE
15 LARGELY FOCUSED IN THE SOUTH BAY THERE ARE GENERALLY LOWER
16 ALLOCATIONS ELSEWHERE IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS USED AS THE
17 BASELINE ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BOTH OPTIONS DISCUSSED
18 IN THE PRESENTATION REPRESENT WAYS TO INCORPORATE THE PLANNED
19 BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. HMC COULD
20 CHOOSE TO PURSUE ONE OF THESE TWO OPTIONS USING THE BLUEPRINT
21 METHODOLOGY AS A FACTOR OR AS ALLOCATION BASED ON OTHER
22 FACTORS ALTERNATIVELY HMC COULD CHOOSE NOT TO INCORPORATE THE
23 BLUEPRINT METHODOLOGY AND CONTINUE TO USE 2019 HOUSEHOLDS FOR
24 THE METHODOLOGY'S BASELINE ALLOCATION THIS SLIDE PROVIDES OVER
25 SUE OF BENEFITS AND DRAWBACKS OF INTENT TO INCORPORATE THE

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BLUEPRINT IN THE METHODOLOGY. USING THE BLUEPRINT WOULD
2 PROVIDE A PLAN AND ANALYSIS AND POLICIES RELATED TO KEY TOPICS
3 SUCH AS PROXIMATE TO TRANSIT REDUCING HAZARD RISKS AND MARKET
4 FEASIBILITY ALREADY BUILT INTO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. ANOTHER
5 BENEFIT OF USING BLUEPRINT -- THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DIRECTS
6 SIGNIFICANT HOUSING GROWTH INTO HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IN HIGH --
7 THE URBAN SIM MODEL USED TO EVALUATE THE IMPACT OF THE
8 POLICIES AND STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT TAKES A
9 FINANCIAL FEASIBILITY OF POTENTIAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS INTO
10 ACCOUNT AND SOME OF THE SMALLER RHNA ALLOCATIONS THAT RESULT
11 FROM USING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT COULD REFLECT THE FINANCIAL
12 FEASIBILITY ANALYSIS FROM URBAN SIM. ANOTHER POTENTIAL
13 DOWNSIDE TO USING THE BLUEPRINT IS THAT THERE COULD BE SOME
14 CHANGES TO THE BLUEPRINT -- THE ALTERNATIVE TO USING THE
15 BLUEPRINT IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY WOULD BE TO CONTINUE TO USE
16 THE 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AS BASELINE FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. AS
17 THE MAPS IN THIS PRESENTATION HAVE SHOWN THIS APPROACH WOULD
18 LIKELY RESULT IN AN EVEN DISTRIBUTION OF RHNA UNITS THROUGHOUT
19 THE REGION IT WOULD ALSO NOT BE DEPENDENT ON CHANGES THAT
20 OCCUR IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. HOWEVER THIS APPROACH WOULD MEAN
21 THERE IS LESS ALIGNMENT BETWEEN RHNA AND THE PLAN AND THE
22 METHODOLOGY WOULD NOT BUILD ON THE ANALYSIS AND POLICIES
23 ALREADY INCORPORATED INTO THE BLUEPRINT. SO STAFF RECOGNIZES
24 THAT THIS DECISION WILL LARGELY HINGE ON THE ALLOCATION
25 IMPACTS OF USING THE BLUEPRINT AS WELL AS INDIVIDUAL

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PREFERENCES FOR HOW CLOSELY SYNCED THE LONG RANGE PLAN IN RHNA
2 SHOULD BE. AS MAPS SHOW THE RESULTS OF THE DIFFERENT
3 METHODOLOGIES SHOWN THE CHOICE WHETHER TO INCLUDE THE DRAFT
4 BLUEPRINT HAS SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS ON THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS. IF
5 HMC CHOOSES NOT TO USE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS THE SOLE FACTORS
6 FOR RHNA AND DATA USED AS BASELINE WILL SET THE STAGE FOR HMC
7 TO DESIGN FACTORS AND WEIGHTS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE ALLOCATION
8 FORMULA WHETHER THAT FORMULA IS BASED ON THE INCOME SHIFT OR
9 BOTTOM UP INCOME ALLOCATION APPROACH. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER,
10 THE NEXT PRESENTATION WILL SHOW A MORE DETAILED COMPARISON OF
11 THE RESULTS WHEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS USED WITH A DIFFERENT
12 INCOME ALLOCATION APPROACHES. THIS INFORMATION IS AN IMPORTANT
13 CONSIDERATION IN DECIDING WHETHER TO USE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT
14 IN THE METHODOLOGY. WE ASK THAT HMC MEMBERS HOLD THEIR
15 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS UNTIL AFTER THE PRESENTATION AT THAT
16 TIME WE CAN DISCUSS OPTIONS FOR HOW TO REFER THE PLAN AND
17 INCLUDE METHODOLOGIES. WITH THAT I'M DONE WITH THAT
18 PRESENTATION. MADE IT THROUGH.

19
20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU GILLIAN. AMBER, SHOULD WE DO
21 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AT THIS TIME?

22
23 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THERE IS PUBLIC
24 COMMENT IN BETWEEN THESE TWO AGENDA ITEMS.

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** OKAY GREAT. WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT
2 ON THE PRESENTATION WE JUST HAD PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE
3 RHNA METHODOLOGY. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK TO THIS ITEM
4 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND USING THE RAISED HAND ICON OR PRESS
5 STAR NINE. MR. CASTRO IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE FOUR ATTENDEES WHO
6 HAVE RAISED THEIR HAND.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS ERIN ECKHOUSE. GO
9 AHEAD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ERIN E REGIONAL MEMBER FOR
12 CALIFORNIA YIMBY. YES IN MY BACKYARD. THANK YOU FOR THE
13 PRESENTATION. I DO HAVE SOME CONCERNS ABOUT THE WAY IN WHICH
14 USING THE PLANNED BAY AREA BASELINES MIGHT CONFLICT WITH SOME
15 OF THE DIRECTION THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAS ALREADY BEEN GOING,
16 IN PARTICULAR, ALONG THE PENINSULA AND IN SAN FRANCISCO AREAS
17 THAT OFFER BOTH VERY HIGH ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY AND EXCELLENT
18 JOBS PROXIMITY BUT WOULD SEE GREATLY REDUCED HOUSING GROWTH
19 UNDER THE PLANNED BAY AREA PLAN. PARTICULARLY I'M SURPRISED AT
20 THE LOW HOUSING GROWTH RATE FOR SAN FRANCISCO UNDER PLANNED
21 BAY AREA, IF YOU LOOK AT THE FACTORS THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAS
22 PRIORITIZED AROUND HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS OF WHICH THERE ARE A
23 GREAT NUMBER IN SAN FRANCISCO, ACCESS TO JOBS, SAN FRANCISCO
24 WAS OF THE LARGEST JOB CENTER IN THE REGION, ACCESS TO
25 TRANSIT, SAN FRANCISCO WAS THE MOST TRANSIT-RICH CITY IN THE



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 REGION, AND I THINK TO HAVE IT BE AS SOME OF THESE MODELS
2 WOULD SUGGEST, AT THE LOWER END OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING GROWTH
3 RATE WOULD BE A REAL MISS FOR THE METHODOLOGY. I'M
4 PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT HOW SAN FRANCISCO WOULD ALSO,
5 WITH SOME OF THE PENINSULA CITIES, AND -- SEEMS TO BE LEFT
6 BEHIND BY THE PLANNED BAY AREA MODEL. THAT'S ALL I HAVE TO
7 SAY.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS PAT ECKLUND. GO AHEAD.

10

11 **PAT ECKLUND:** HELLO FRED?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** I HAVE A QUESTION I WANTED TO ASK GILLIAN.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** IF YOU WOULD SAVE QUESTIONS UNTIL AFTER
18 THE NEXT PRESENTATION.

19

20 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THEN WE'LL HAVE QUESTIONS AND
23 DISCUSSION.

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY.

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS SHAJUTI HOSSAIN.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M SHAJUTI HOSSAIN FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND
7 FRIENDS FOR SOCIAL EQUITY NETWORK. I WANT TO APPRECIATE HMC
8 AND ABAG WORK IN THE EQUITY PROCESS. WE'RE AT A TIME IN OUR
9 HISTORY WHERE WE COULDN'T CONTINUE THE ROLE RACE HAS PLAYED IN
10 OUR SYSTEMS INCLUDING HOUSING. TODAY WE CAN SHAPE OUR REGION'S
11 RESPONSE TO THIS MOMENT IN THE NEXT DECADE AND WE CANNOT FAIL
12 AT THIS TIME THERE IS TOO MUCH AT STAKE. TAKING YOUR TIME TO
13 MAKE THESE DECISIONS WILL AFFECT BLACK AND BROWN NEIGHBORS,
14 COWORKERS FRIENDS AND FAMILY. AGENDA PACKET USES THE
15 EVALUATIVE CRITERIA THAT STAFF PROPOSED A FEW HMC MEETINGS AGO
16 BUT I DON'T RECALL HMC AGREEING THOSE WERE THE RIGHT CRITERIA
17 I THINK THERE SHOULD BE MORE DISCUSSION ABOUT THE CRITERIA AND
18 A MORE OFFICIAL DECISION ON WHETHER THOSE ARE THE RIGHT
19 CRITERIA OR WHETHER THEY NEED TO BE ADJUSTED. AND THEN AS GO
20 INTO YOUR DISCUSSION ON THE NEXT ITEM I WANT TO SHARE FROM SIX
21 WINDS WE BELIEVE THAT THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT SHOULD
22 NOT BE A FACTOR OR THE BASELINE BECAUSE RIGHT NOW THE DRAFT
23 BLUEPRINT FAILS TO SPREAD OUT THE RHNA ACROSS THE REGION GIVEN
24 THIS AND THE FACT THAT THE STRATEGIES WON'T BE FINAL UNTIL
25 SEPTEMBER WE SHOULDN'T BE RELYING ON THIS AS A FACTOR IN THE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 METHODOLOGY. WE CAN SHARE THAT CONSISTENCY IN OTHER WAYS. IN
2 TERMS OF THE INCOME SHIFT APPROACH VERSUS THE BOTTOM UP
3 APPROACH, WE PREFER THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH BECAUSE OF THE
4 INCOME SHIFT WOULD SEVERELY INCREASE DISPLACEMENT RISK IN
5 VULNERABLE CITIES. ONE SUGGESTION WE HAVE IS WHEN SPLITTING UP
6 THE INCOME CATEGORIES IN THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH IS TO HAVE THE
7 BOTTOM UP ALLOCATIONS IN ITS OWN GROUP WITH REMAINING THREE
8 CATEGORIES IN ITS OWN THAT'S HOW SB5 IS DONE AND LOWER INCOME
9 AND MOT RAT INCOME HOUSING RELY ON SUBSIDIES. AND WE WANT TO
10 USE TOTAL SHARE OF HOUSEHOLD IN 2019 AS THE BASELINE GIVEN
11 PLANNED BAY AREA BASELINE WOULD LEAVE OUT TOO MANY HIGH
12 OPPORTUNITY JURISDICTION.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ALROS HARMAN.
15 GO AHEAD.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. I AM -- I HAVE SPENT MY ENTIRE ADULT LIFE LIVING
18 ALL AROUND THE BAY AREA, BERKELEY DOWN TO MOUNTAIN VIEW AND
19 PALO ALTO, EAST PALO ALTO, I AM NOW A HOMEOWNER IN SAN BRUNO
20 AND SERVE ON THE PLANNING COMMISSION IN MY TOWN. I WANT TO
21 ECHO THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER'S COMMENTS ABOUT BEING AMBITIOUS
22 ABOUT BUILDING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS. CALLING BACK TO THE
23 PRESENTATION ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THERE WAS A SLIDE THAT
24 WENT BY QUICKLY SAYING OH WE WOULD HAVE TO BE MUCH MORE -- I
25 FORGET WHAT THE TERMINOLOGY WAS -- WE WOULD HAVE TO BE MUCH

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BOARD IN ORDER TO ADDRESS SYSTEMIC -- WE CREATED THROUGH THE
2 20th INDUSTRY CENTURY THAT SHOULD SHOCK THE CONSCIOUS THAT
3 WE'RE NOT CONTEMPLATING ACTUALLY FIXING THE THINGS PREVIOUS
4 GENERATIONS DID. I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO EMPHASIZE BUILDING
5 ENOUGH HOUSING THAT'S ACCESSIBLE ALL UP-AND-DOWN THE INCOME
6 SCALE THAT WE CAN BRING MARKET RATE DOWN SO THAT THE MEDIAN
7 INCOME PERSON CAN AFFORD THE MEDIAN HOUSE IN OUR COMMUNITIES
8 AND NOT DRIVING PEOPLE OUT. I AS A HOMEOWNER KNOW I'M
9 RESPONSIBLE FOR GENTRIFYING MY COMMUNITY. I'M A TESLA ENGINEER
10 DURING MY DAY JOB FOR WHICH I'M TAKING TIME OFF TO JOIN THIS
11 AND I BOUGHT A HOUSEHOLD FROM A HISPANIC FAMILY BUT ARE YOU
12 GOING TO SAY THEY CAN'T SELL TO THE HIGHEST BIDDER. I THINK WE
13 NEED TO AIM VERY HIGH IN PUTTING OUR OVERALL HOUSING NUMBERS
14 WE NEED TO BE AIMING FOR 800,000 TO A MILLION IN THE NEXT
15 HOUSING CYCLE AND WE NEED TO ALLOCATE THE HOUSEHOLDS TO WHERE
16 PEOPLE WORK. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT
19 FRUCKMAN. GO AHEAD.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. SO I'M CALLING FROM SAN FRANCISCO.
22 I'M ASKING THAT YOU ALLOCATE MORE HOUSING TO SAN FRANCISCO
23 RATHER THAN THE APPROACH TAKEN IN THE BOTTOM UP CONCEPT. IN
24 THE LAST DECADE SAN FRANCISCO HORIZON ADDED AROUND 200,000
25 JOBS AND 2500 UNITS OF HOUSING. IT'S PRETTY HARD TO BELIEVE

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THAT WE WOULD NOT ASK SAN FRANCISCO TO CREATE HOUSING FOR ALL
2 THE NEW JOBS THAT WE HAVE CREATED. YOU KNOW, IN THE LAST 50,
3 60 YEARS, SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING TOOK THE APPROACH THAT SAN
4 FRANCISCO IS A JOB CENTER IN A REGION WHERE PEOPLE CAN LIVE.
5 BUT THAT'S CLEARLY PROVEN TO BE THE WRONG APPROACH SINCE WE
6 HAVE SEEN MASSIVE DISPLACEMENT OF PEOPLE FROM SAN FRANCISCO.
7 AND THE NATIONAL COUNCIL ON -- THE NATIONAL COMMUNITY
8 REINVESTMENT COALITION HAS IDENTIFIED EASTERN NEIGHBORHOODS IN
9 SAN FRANCISCO AS SOME OF THE FASTEST GROWING -- FASTEST
10 GENTRIFYING IN THE COUNTRY BUT IN OUR SAME AREA OAKLAND IS
11 GENTRIFYING MUCH MORE EXTENSIVELY BECAUSE OF SAN FRANCISCO JOB
12 GROWTH. SO I ASK THAT YOU ADJUST THE PLAN TO TAKE THAT INTO
13 ACCOUNT SO THAT SAN FRANCISCO STOPS GENTRIFYING OAKLAND. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS STEVEN BUSS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI STEVEN BUSS CALLING FROM SAN FRANCISCO AS WELL
19 ALSO AN A MEMBER OF YIMBY ACTION. I AGREE WITH THE
20 COMMISSIONERS AND SPEAKERS WE NEED TO SEEK OUTCOMES THAT
21 SIGNIFICANTLY GROW THE HOUSING STOCK IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY, HIGH
22 DENSITY AREAS THAT HAS THE END RESULT OF MINIMIZING CAR
23 TRAVEL. SO, YOU KNOW, PUT HOUSING ALONG EXISTING TRANSIT LINES
24 AND IN EXISTING CITIES. WE SHOULD BE SEEKING AN OUTCOME WHERE
25 THE POPULATION OF SAN FRANCISCO QUINN TIPPLES BY 2050. SO, I'M

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AIMING FOR 5 MILLION PEOPLE IN THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO BY
2 2050, AND YOU KNOW, I KNOW OUR CURRENT PLANS DON'T CALL FOR
3 THAT, IN THAT REGARD, I THINK THEY'RE INSUFFICIENT. BUT AT
4 LEAST WHEN WE ARE PLANNING FOR THE GROWTH YOU'RE PROJECTING,
5 WE SHOULD NOT PUSH THEM OUT TO OUTLYING AREAS. THOSE MAPS
6 EARLIER, I WAS PRETTY CONCERNED TO SEE THE HIGHEST GROWTH IN
7 THE FARTHEST OUTLYING COMMUNITIES. IT'S GOING TO PUSH PEOPLE
8 INTO 2, 3 HOUR ALONG COMMUTES INTO SILICON VALLEY WE NEED TO
9 BUILD AND FOCUS ON GROWTH WHERE PEOPLE WANT TO LIVE AND WHERE
10 EXCELLENT JOBS ARE SO THAT PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO WASTE THEIR
11 LIVES SITTING IN THEIR CARS. SO I ENCOURAGE YOU TO TAKE
12 WHATEVER APPROACH LEADS TO THE HIGHEST GROWTH IN THESE HIGH
13 OPPORTUNITY, HIGH DENSITY AREAS ESPECIALLY IN SAN FRANCISCO.
14 THANKS.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS IRA KAPLAN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS IRA KAPLAN. I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO.
19 AS I LOOK AT THIS, THIS IS REALLY NOT THAT COMPLICATED. OUR
20 HOUSING SHORTAGE IS MOST SEVERE IN THE AREAS WITH THE HIGHEST
21 HOUSING CRISIS. THAT'S WHY THOSE HOUSING PRICES ARE HIGH.
22 THOSE AREAS LIKE SAN FRANCISCO WHERE I LIVE, IT'S MUCH OF THE
23 PENINSULA, PARTS OF THE SOUTH BAY, PARTICULARLY NEAR STANFORD
24 UNIVERSITY, AND THAT'S WHERE THE HOUSING SHOULD GO. IT'S WHERE
25 THE HOUSING SHORTAGE IS MOST SEVERE. THESE ARE ALSO HIGH

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 RESOURCE AREAS. SO I WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO EMPHASIZE PUTTING
2 HOUSING IN SAN FRANCISCO WHERE I LIVE, IN THE AREAS WITH THE
3 JOBS, AND THE AREAS WITH THE HIGH RESOURCES. THESE ARE ALSO --
4 MANY OF THESE ARE AREAS WHERE THE SCHOOLS ARE SUFFERING FROM
5 UNDERPOPULATION WHERE THEY HAVE EXCELLENT SCHOOLS AND THEY
6 DON'T HAVE ENOUGH STUDENTS TO FILL THEM UP BECAUSE THEY HAVE
7 PRICED EVERYBODY OUT. ADDING HOUSING WOULD ADD TO
8 SCHOOLS IT WOULD BE A SHAME TO LOSE THOSE GREAT SCHOOLS AND
9 FORCE THE SCHOOL DISTRICTS TO CLOSE BY NOT PROVIDING UP
10 HOUSING TO PROVIDE STUDENTS FOR THE SCHOOLS FOR ALL OF THOSE
11 REASONS I WOULD ENCOURAGE MORE HOUSING IN SAN FRANCISCO AND
12 THE PENINSULA AND THE NORTHWESTERN PART OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SONJA
16 TRAUSS.

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** AND BEFORE SONJA SPEAKS, AS THERE ARE
19 MORE SPEAKERS THAN APPEARED ORIGINALLY, WE'RE GOING TO GO DOWN
20 TO ONE MINUTE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. SO THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD IS
23 ONE MINUTE. GO AHEAD SONJA.

24

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO EARLIER SPEAKER SUPPORT FOR
2 PUTTING HOUSING IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS. MAYBE I MISSED IT
3 BUT I FEEL LIKE THE PRESENTATION MADE IT HARD TO SEE WHICH
4 EITHER FOLLOWING THE BLUEPRINT OR NOT PUT MORE HOUSING IN HIGH
5 OPPORTUNITY AREAS. I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE REALLY NEED TO SEE.
6 IT'S TEMPTING, OF COURSE, BEING TO LOAD UP THE PENINSULA,
7 BECAUSE CUPERTINO AND PALO ALTO ARE FAMOUS FOR HAVING SUCH
8 LARGE LOT SIZES LOW DENSITY ZONING BUT MAYBE THERE ARE PLACES
9 IN THE EAST BAY THAT ARE SORT OF UNDER RHNA'D IF WE GO WITH
10 THE BLUEPRINT. BUT YEAH, THAT'S WHAT WE SHOULD BE LOOKING FOR
11 WHERE ARE THE PLACES THAT HAVE ACRES AND ACRES OF LARGE LOT
12 SIZE. WILL EXTREMELY EXPENSIVE IS A WAY TO BE ABLE TO TELL IF
13 IT'S A DESIRABLE PLACE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS THE CALLER WITH
16 THE NUMBER ENDING IN 6187. GO AHEAD.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SARAH OGILVIE. MEMBER OF YIMBY ACTION
19 LIVING IN SAN FRANCISCO. TO GET MORE ASSIGNED TO SF IS BECAUSE
20 ABILITY TO PRODUCE HOUSING WAS DEFINED BY THE PIPELINE AND
21 SAID THAT SMALL PARCELS WERE UNLIKELY TO GET REDEVELOPED.
22 CALIFORNIA STATE HAS BEEN BREATHING DOWN SAN FRANCISCO'S NECK
23 CASTING LAWS TO BREAK DOWN DU JOUR SEGREGATION AND FAILS TO
24 TAKE DECISIVE ACTION IN THE NAMES OF BLACK LIVES MATTER AND
25 ALL OF THE CALLS FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE HAPPENING ON ITS STREETS

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PLEASE STOP PREPPING SAN FRANCISCO'S WEALTHY NEIGHBORHOODS CAN
2 GET OFF THE HOOK ANOTHER DECADE PLEASE ALLOCATE HEAVY PORTION
3 THERE IS BEGINNING WITH FOREST HILL AND PLEASE DON'T MAKE MY
4 REMOTE WORKING HUSBAND AND OTHERS LIKE HIM FEEL THEY HAVE TO
5 SACRIFICE THE HIGH OPPORTUNITY WALKABLE REGION FOR CAREER
6 SUCCESS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS DARYL
9 OWENS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M FROM EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE. THIS TALKING
12 POINT THAT YOU CAN'T ALLOCATE MORE HOUSING AND SF, THIS'S
13 BULL. WHO CARES IF THE LOT SIZE IS SMALL. INFILL HOUSING IS
14 DONE ON SMALL LOTS ALL THE TIME. REASON IT'S NOT DONE IN SF IS
15 BECAUSE THEY PUT ALL THE ZONING CAPACITY IN TOXIC WASTE LANDS.
16 IF ANYTHING THAT'S A REASON TO DO IT WE DON'T NEED MORE SUPER
17 MEGA DEVELOPMENT HOUSING PROJECTS OUT IN LIKE THE SUBURBS OF
18 SANTA CLARA COUNTY IN THE VERY SOUTHERN PORTION OF THE COUNTY.
19 WE NEED DENSE INFILL PROJECTS IN THE URBAN CORE WHERE THE VAST
20 MAJORITY OF THE PEOPLE ARE, AND YOU NEED THEM WHERE THE VAST
21 MAJORITY OF THE JOBS ARE. IT'S RIDICULOUS TO PROJECT A GROWTH
22 RATE HIGHER FOR SAN FRANCISCO THAN OAKLAND WHEN OAKLAND HAS
23 NOTHING GOING ON AND SF HAS MAJOR OFFICE PROJECTS COMING DOWN.
24 THIS'S INSANE.

25

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST SPEAKER IS MARK US
2 HELMER.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS MARCUS I AM A RESIDENT OF NAPA COUNTY.
5 I HAVE HAD THE PRIVILEGE EVER LIVING IN NAPA COUNTY WHERE
6 OPPORTUNITY IS ABOUND BUT IT'S NO SECRET WHY OUR MARKET RATE
7 IS SO HIGH. IT'S HOUSING. A LOT OF COMMENTERS HAVE TALKED
8 ABOUT SAN FRANCISCO, AND NAPA IS PEANUTS COMPARATIVELY BUT IT
9 SEEMS IN NAPA WE'RE PLANNING FOR ADDING MORE JOBS THAN
10 HOUSING. WE'RE NOT BUILDING ENOUGH HOUSING WHERE THERE ARE
11 JOBS AND RESOURCES. HENCE HAVING FAR REACHING AND DISASTROUS
12 CONSEQUENCES. ADDRESS THAT. PLEASE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND ONE MORE SPEAKER -- TWO
15 MORE SPEAKERS. LU IS IA SANCHEZ.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS LU SEA SANCHEZ. I AM
18 HERE TO REQUEST ABAG COMMISSIONERS TO ALLOCATE HOUSING TO HIGH
19 OPPORTUNITY AREAS. MY FAMILY LIVES IN FAIRFIELD BECAUSE IT'S
20 THE ONLY AREA THEY CAN AFFORD BUT MOST WORK OUTSIDE SALON
21 OPEN. RIGHT NOW YEAR IN A POSITION TO HELP FAMILIES LIKE MINE
22 IN THE IMPACT OF BUILDING SO LITTLE HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS
23 WORRIES ME BECAUSE YOUR LETTING THE COMMITTEE KNOW YOU'RE OKAY
24 WITH THE STATUS QUO AND THAT SHOWS HOW DISCONNECTED YOU ARE
25 WITH THE COMMUNITIES YOU REPRESENT. PLEASE ALLOCATE MORE

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HOUSING NEEDS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS SO WE CAN WORK TOWARDS
2 A BRIGHTER PROSPEROUS FUTURE FOR CALIFORNIA. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST SPEAKER IS JORDAN
5 GRIMES. GO AHEAD.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS JORDAN GRIMES. I'M A LIFE-
8 LONG RESIDENT OF SAN MATEO COUNTY AND A LEAD MEMBER OF
9 PENINSULA FOR EVERYONE. JUST WANT TO ECHO PREVIOUS SPEAKERS
10 AND SAY IT'S ABSOLUTELY PIT FULL THE AMOUNT OF HOUSING THAT
11 WE'RE GOING TO ADD IN BOTH SAN MATEO COUNTY, PENINSULA, SAN
12 FRANCISCO TO HAVE ALL OF THESE WEALTHY AREAS PENINSULA
13 ESPECIALLY THAT I HAVE SPENT YEARS AND YEARS AND YEARS NOT
14 BUILDING HOUSING, TO THE POINT OF [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]
15 [INDISCERNIBLE] THE LAUGHING STOCK OF, YOU KNOW -- SHARE ON
16 HOUSING AND IT'S REALLY DISAPPOINTING SEEING THE NUMBERS
17 COMING OUT ON THIS, AND GOD, YEAH, ALL I REALLY WANT TO SAY IS
18 I HOPE THAT THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS LIKE THE PENINSULA, LIKE
19 SAN FRANCISCO CAN SEE MORE HOUSING GOING FORWARD, BECAUSE
20 RIGHT NOW IT'S JUST NOT ACCEPTABLE. SO THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THIS'S THE LAST OF THE
23 ATTENDEES WHO WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. THERE WAS ONE
24 PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED BY E-MAIL THAT WAS INCLUDED IN THE

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PACKET ON THE HAND OUT I SENT OUT BY E-MAIL TO FOLKS AND ALSO
2 ONLINE AT MTCLEGISTAR.COM.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. CASTRO. WE'RE
5 GOING TO GO TO 6B NOW, FURTHER DISCUSSION OF REGIONAL HOUSING
6 NEEDS ALLOCATION INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY. ELI KAPLAN
7 WILL BE GIVING THE PRESENTATION.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. COULD WE HAVE THE SLIDE
10 DECK BROUGHT BACK UP PLEASE. THANK YOU. AS MENTIONED EARLIER
11 THE PURPOSE OF THIS ITEM IS TO FURTHER EXPLORE THE INCOME
12 ALLOCATION APPROACHES DISCUSSIONS AT THE PREVIOUS TWO MEETINGS
13 VISITING CONCEPTS FROM THE PREVIOUS AGENDA ITEMS AND DISCUSS
14 RESULTS FROM DATA PRODUCE. THIS CAN HELP HMC RECOMMEND AN
15 APPROACH FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY AND ALSO INFORM WHETHER TO
16 INCORPORATE PLANNED BAY AREA IN THE METHODOLOGY. AT THE END OF
17 THE PRESENTATION COMMITTEE MEMBERS WILL HAVE THE CHANCE TO ASK
18 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS RELATED TO MY AND GILLIAN'S PRESENTATION
19 AND THEY CAN DISCUSS WHICH INCOME ALLOCATION APPROACH THEY
20 PREFER FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE JUNE
21 MEETING STAFF PRESENTED POSSIBLE RHNA METHODOLOGIES RELATED TO
22 TWO DIFFERENT APPROACHES FOR ALLOCATING UNITS BY INCOME INCOME
23 SHIFT APPROACH AND THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH. FOR THE INCOME
24 SHIFT APPROACH FACTOR BASED METHODOLOGY FIRSTS ALLOCATES THE
25 TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS TO A JURISDICTION IN THE INCOME

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY IS THEN USED TO DISTRIBUTE THAT TOTAL
2 AMONG THE FOUR INCOME CATEGORIES INCOME SHIFT ALLOCATES UNITS
3 TO THE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES BY COMPARING A JURISDICTION'S
4 INCOME DISTRIBUTION TO THE REGION'S DISTRIBUTION AND MOVING
5 THE LOCAL INCOME DISTRIBUTION CLOSER TO THE REGIONAL AVERAGE.
6 IN CONTRAST TO THE INCOME DISTRIBUTION APPROACH, THE BOTTOM UP
7 APPROACH USES FACTORS TO DETERMINE ALLOCATIONS FOR THE FOUR
8 INCOME CATEGORIES IN THE SUM OF THE INCOME ALLOCATIONS
9 REPRESENTS A JURISDICTION'S TOTAL ALLOCATION A JURISDICTION'S
10 ALLOCATION WITHIN EACH INCOME CATEGORY IS DETERMINED BY HOW
11 THE JURISDICTION SCORES WITH THE REST OF THE REGION. ANALYSIS
12 COMPARING OUTCOMES PRODUCED BY DIFFERENT INCOME SHIFT
13 MULTIPLIERS IN THE TWO BOTTOM UP. POLLING SUGGESTS THAT THE
14 HMC MEMBERS ARE NARROWING IN ON A PREFERRED INCOME SHIFT
15 APPLIER IF ABAG USES THE INCOME SHIFT APPROACH. PREFERENCE
16 USING 25 PERCENT MULTIPLIER OR 150 PERCENT MULTIPLIER WITH
17 COMMITTEE MEMBERS FLIPPED BETWEEN OPTIONS RESPONSE ANALYSIS OF
18 METHODOLOGIES FOR TODAY'S MEETING FOCUS ON THESE TWO
19 MULTIPLIERS. 90 PERCENT APPROVING FACTORS CHOSEN FOR
20 ALLOCATING THE VERY LOW AND LOW INCOME UNITS AND 82 PERCENT
21 APPROVING FACTORS CHOSEN FOR ALLOCATING MODERATE AND ABOVE
22 MODERATE UNITS ACCORDINGLY TWO FACTOR CONCEPTS AND BOTTOM UP
23 CONCEPTS PREPARED FOR TODAY POLLING ALSO SHOWED HMC PREFERRED
24 THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH TO THE INCOME SHIFT APPROACH WITH 50
25 PERCENT OF HMC MEMBERS INDICATING PREFERENCE FOR THE BOTTOM UP

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 APPROACH AND 17 PERCENT PREFERRING INCOME SHIFT APPROACH
2 HOWEVER 1/3 OF THE HMC WAS UNDECIDED ABOUT WHICH INCOME
3 ALLOCATION APPROACH THEY PREFER IN RESPONSE TO THE LARGE
4 NUMBER OF UNDECIDED COMMITTEE MEMBERS STAFF DESIGNED AN
5 ACTIVITY FOR HMC MEMBERS TO COMPLETE PRIOR TO TODAY'S MEETING.
6 THIS GUIDED HMC MEMBERS THROUGH USING THE ONLINE TOOL TO
7 CREATE METHODOLOGIES TO THE TWO INCOME APPROACHES. INSTRUCTED
8 TO SEND HMC STAFF ONE METHODOLOGY FOR EACH APPROACH AND NOTE
9 WHICH METHODOLOGY THEY CREATED TO PRODUCE BECOME OUTCOMES FOR
10 THE REGION. 19 AGENCY MEMBERS SUBMITTED RESPONSES TO THE
11 ACTIVITY OVER HALF OF THE COMMITTEE IN CONTRAST TO THE POLLING
12 RESULTS FROM JUNE MORE HMC MEMBERS THAT COMPLETED THE
13 METHODOLOGY -- WITH NINE MEMBERS PREFERRING INCOME SHIFT SEVEN
14 PREFERRING BOTTOM UP APPROACH TWO UNSIDED AND ONE WHO DID NOT
15 NOTIFY PREFERENCE. ANOTHER POLLING FROM JUNE MOST COMMON
16 INCOME SHIFT POLLING WAS 100 ADMINISTRATION WITH 6H MC MEMBERS
17 CHOOSING 100 INCOME SHIFT MULTIPLIER. THREE CHOSE 125 PERCENT
18 SHIFT. HMC MEMBERS RECEIVED A HAND OUT IN THEIR AGENDA PACKET
19 SUMMARIZING RESULTS AND IT ALSO INCLUDES INFORMATION ON
20 FACTORS AND WEIGHTS THAT HMC MEMBERS CHOSE FOR THEIR
21 METHODOLOGY. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY RELATED QUESTIONS
22 AFTER THE PRESENTATION OR OVER E-MAIL. NEXT SLIDE. AS NOTED IN
23 THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION FROM GILLIAN BASELINE ALLOCATION
24 USED IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY HAS A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON THE
25 METHODOLOGY'S OUTPUT ADDITIONALLY THE INCOME ALLOCATION

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 APPROACH USED FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY NOT ONLY EFFECTS HOW A
2 JURISDICTION'S RHNA DIVIDED AMONG THE FOUR INCOME CATEGORIES
3 BUT ALSO INFLUENCES THE TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS ASSIGNED TO EACH
4 JURISDICTION. THEREFORE CHOOSING INCOME ALLOCATION APPROACH
5 AND BASELINE ALLOCATION ARE INTERLINKED DECISIONS THAT BOTH
6 AFFECT NUMBER OF UNITS TO EACH JURISDICTION HMC MEMBERS SHOULD
7 CONSIDER COMBINED EFFECTS OF THE ASPECTS OF THE METHODOLOGIES
8 IN MAKING THE RECOMMENDATION. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE JUNE MEETING,
9 HMC MEMBERS REQUESTED MORE SPECIFIC INFORMATION IN HOW TOTAL
10 UNIT ALLOCATIONS TO JURISDICTION VARY UNDER THE DIFFERENT
11 METHODOLOGY SCENARIOS. TO ASSIST HMC WITH CHOOSING INCOME
12 ALLOCATION APPROACH STAFF PAIRED THE DIFFERENT INCOME SHIFT
13 AND BOTTOM UP METHODOLOGIES DISCUSSED IN PREVIOUS MEETINGS
14 WITH THE TWO BASELINE OPTIONS, 2019 HOUSEHOLDS WE HAVE LOOKED
15 AT THUS FAR AND THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. STAFF ALSO PAIRED THE
16 INCOME SHIFT APPROACH WITH THE BLUEPRINT ALLOCATION
17 METHODOLOGY WHERE THE GROWTH PATTERN AND DRAFT BLUEPRINT
18 ALLOCATE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS WITHOUT ADDITIONAL METHODOLOGY
19 FACTORS. THE MAPS ON THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATE THE DIFFERENCES IN
20 THE GROWTH RATES THAT JURISDICTION EXPERIENCE WITHIN THE
21 DIFFERENT INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGIES. IN THESE MAPS
22 JURISDICTION SHADED DARKEST BLUE EXPERIENCED LOWEST GROWTH
23 RATES DARKEST RED HIGHEST GROWTH RATES MAPS ON THE LEFT PART
24 OF THE SLIDE REPRESENT RHNA METHODOLOGIES THAT COMPARE WITH
25 THE RHNA METHODOLOGY APPROACH. MAP ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SLIDE REPRESENT BOTTOM UP RHNA METHODOLOGIES. FOR THE HOUSING
2 JOBS CRESCENT MAPS IN BOTTOM UP METHODOLOGY MAPS THE MAPS ON
3 THE UPPER ROW USED 2019 HOUSEHOLDS FOR THE BASELINE ALLOCATION
4 MAPS ON LOWER ROUTE USE -- THESE MAPS ILLUSTRATE EMPHASIS ON
5 HOUSING GROWTH IN SILICON VALLEY AS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT
6 SUGGESTS SHARE ON REGIONAL HOUSING GROWTH TO JURISDICTION IN
7 SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO JURISDICTION IN THIS PART OF THE
8 REGION EXPERIENCED MOST GROWTH THAN ALL OF THE METHODOLOGIES
9 THAT USED THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BASELINE ALLOCATION AS WELL AS
10 METHODOLOGY THAT USES TO ALLOCATE RHNA. AT THE HIGHER LEVEL
11 THERE DO NOT APPEAR TO BE DIFFERENT DIFFERENCE IN HOUSING
12 GROWTH BETWEEN THE METHODOLOGIES WHEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS
13 INCORPORATED THIS CAN BE SEEN BY LOOKING AT THE MAPS ON THE
14 BOTTOM ROW OF THE SLIDE. WHEN METHODOLOGIES USE 2019
15 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE ALLOCATION THERE IS GROWTH THROUGHOUT THE
16 REGION WHICH IS PARTICULARLY EVIDENT IN THE HOUSING JOBS
17 CRESCENT BOTTOM UP TWO FACT HOR IN THE TOP ROW OF THE SLIDE
18 FOR MORE DETAILED LOOK AT HOW TOTAL ALLOCATIONS AND SHARED
19 RHNA IN EACH INCOME CATEGORY BAY AREA FOR ALL NINE COUNTY
20 JURISDICTION YOU CAN REFER TO APPENDIX ONE FOR THIS ITEM IN
21 THE AGENDA PACKET. NEXT ITEM. FOR THE MAY MEETING STAFF
22 PREPARED A POTENTIAL METRICS FOR EVALUATING RHNA METHODOLOGY
23 OPTIONS THESE METRICS TEND TO ASSIST THE AGENCY FOR PROPOSING
24 WHETHER THE METHODOLOGY WILL MEET STAT FORE OBJECTIVES AND
25 REGIONAL PLANNING GOALS STAFF AND ANALYSIS CONDUCTED BY HCD

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AND METHODOLOGIES COMPLETED BY OTHER REGIONS OTHER METRICS
2 PRESENTED BY STAYING HOLDERS AND INTERPRETATIONS OF
3 PREPARATORY LANGUAGE STAFF REVISED INITIAL SET OF METRICS
4 BASED ON WHAT IS MOST USEFUL TO HMC MEMBERS REVISED SET
5 INCLUDES SEVEN METRICS CORRESPONDING TO FIVE OBJECTIVES SEVEN
6 METRICS HAVE BEEN INCORPORATED IN THE ONLINE TOOL AND I WILL
7 NOW GIVE AN OVERVIEW OF HOW THE DIFFERENT MONTHLY OPTIONS
8 DISCUSSED TODAY PERFORMED ON THESE METRICS FOR MORE DETAIL
9 APPENDIX TWO FOR THIS ITEM IN THE AGENDA PACKET CONTAINS
10 CHARTS ILLUSTRATING HOW METHODOLOGY OPTIONS PERFORMED ON THE
11 DIFFERENT METRICS. FIRST STATUTORY OBJECTIVE FOCUSES ON
12 WHETHER RHNA INCREASES HOUSING SUPPLY AND AFFORDABILITY ACROSS
13 THE REGION IN AN EQUITABLE MANNER. METRIC CORRESPONDING TO
14 THIS OBJECTIVE LOOKS AT JURISDICTION WITH THE MOST EXPENSIVE
15 HOUSING COST WITH THE SIGNIFICANT PERCENTAGE OF THE RHNA AS
16 LOWER INCOME UNITS STEMMING DIRECTLY IN EACH ANALYSIS AS WAS
17 MENTIONED IN ALL OF THE LETTERS SUBMITTED LIKE HCD AND THREE
18 OTHER REGIONS WHEN SUBMITTING RHNA METHODOLOGY. ALL OF THE
19 BOTTOM UP METHODOLOGIES DID WELL ON THIS METRIC SPECIFICALLY
20 THE BOTTOM UP TWO FACTOR CONCEPT PERFORM BEST SIGNIFICANT
21 METRIC REGARDLESS OF 2019 HOUSEHOLDS OR WHETHER THE DRAFT
22 BLUEPRINT IS USED FOR THE ALLOCATION. SECOND STATUTORY
23 OBJECTIVE FOCUSES ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION EFFICIENT
24 DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS AND GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION IN LETTERS
25 TO OTHER REGIONS HCD DISCUSSED HOW RHNA METHODOLOGIES REACHED

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 OBJECTIVES IN LINE WITH TRANSIT AND BASED ON LODGE RANGE
2 REGIONAL PLAN. HMC WANTED TO PROVIDE THE AGENCY FOR SUBJECTIVE
3 MEASURES ACCORDINGLY STAFF DEVELOPED TWO METRICS FOR THIS
4 OBJECTIVE TO MEASURE JURISDICTION WITH THE MOST JOBS AND
5 ACCESS TO TRANSIT HAVE HIGHEST GROWTH RATES FROM RESULTS OF
6 RHNA USING THE METHODOLOGY IN PERFORMANCE METRICS BOTH HOUSING
7 AND JOBS METHODOLOGY IN THE BOTTOM UP CONCEPT ACHIEVING
8 OBJECTIVE TWO COMBINED WITH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BASELINE THESE
9 TWO METHODOLOGIES WITH THE 25 JURISDICTION WITH MOST GROWTH.
10 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OBJECTIVE THREE FOCUSES ON THE RELATIONSHIP
11 BETWEEN JOBS AND HOUSING. IN PARTICULARLY EMPHASIZES JOBS
12 HOUSING FIT ACCORDINGLY STAFF CREATED A METRICS THAT EXAMINES
13 WHETHER JURISDICTION WITH THE MOST LOW WAGE JOBS FOR HOUSING
14 UNITS AFFORDABLE LOW-WAGE WORKERS RECEIVE A SPECIFIC
15 PERCENTAGE OF RHNA AS LOWER INCOME UNITS USING 2019 BASELINE
16 RESULTS IN BEFORE THE PERFORMANCE ON THE METRICS FOR OBJECTIVE
17 THREE BOTTOM UP CONCEPTS ARE BOTH OBJECTIVE METHODOLOGIES WHEN
18 COMPARED WITH THE 2019 HOUSEHOLD ALLOCATION IN BOTH SCENARIOS
19 THE JURISDICTION WITH THE MOST UNBALANCED JOBS HOUSING FIT
20 RECEIVE 49 PERCENT OF RHNA AS LOWER INCOME UNITS. OBJECTIVE
21 FOUR FOCUSES ON WHETHER METHODOLOGY DIRECTS A LOWER PORTION OF
22 HOUSING NEED TO INCOME CATEGORY WHEN A JURISDICTION ALREADY
23 HAS A DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGH SHARE IN THAT CATEGORY. THIS
24 OBJECTIVE METRIC EXAMINES WHETHER THE JURISDICTION WITH THE
25 LARGEST PERCENTAGE OF LOW INCOME RESIDENTS RECEIVES A SMALLER

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SHARE OF RHNA AS LOWER INCOME UNITS THAN A JURISDICTION WITH
2 THE LOWEST PERCENTAGE OF HIGH INCOME RESIDENTS. BOTTOM UP
3 METHODOLOGIES PERFORMED BEST IN OBJECTIVE FOUR METRIC
4 REGARDLESS OF METHODOLOGY ALLOCATION. DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGH
5 INCOME JURISDICTION RECEIVING 51 PERCENT. ADDITIONALLY BOTTOM
6 UP METHODOLOGY RESULT MOST DISPROPORTIONATE LOWER INCOME
7 JURISDICTIONS RECEIVING 39 PERCENT OF THE RHNA AS LOWER INCOME
8 UNITS. THESE ALLOCATIONS ACHIEVE OBJECTIVE FOUR JURISDICTION
9 WITH LARGEST SHARE OF LOW INCOME RESIDENTS RECEIVE SMALLER
10 PERCENTAGES OF LOWER INCOME RHNA WITH DISPROPORTIONATELY
11 WEALTHY JURISDICTIONS. AT THE SAME TIME BOTTOM UP
12 METHODOLOGIES ALLOCATE LOWER INCOME RHNA TO JURISDICTIONS WITH
13 SIGNIFICANT LOW INCOME POPULATIONS THAN OTHER METHODOLOGY
14 OPTIONS, WHICH ADDRESSES CONCERNS THAT HMC MEMBERS HAVE RAISED
15 ABOUT DISPLACEMENT IN THESE JURISDICTION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
16 OBJECTIVE FIVE FOCUSES ON THE AFFIRMATIVELY FAIR HOUSING HMC -
17 - FOCUSED ON WHETHER METHODOLOGY HIGH PERCENTAGE OF HOUSEHOLDS
18 LIVING IN HIGH OR HIGHEST RESOURCE AREAS BASED ON THE STATE'S
19 OPPORTUNITY MAP IT SEEMS LIKE THAT HCD WILL OUT OPPORTUNITY
20 DATA ON METHODOLOGY PREFERRED HOUSING. STAFF INCLUDED A
21 METRICS FOR THE OBJECTIVE FOR HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN HIGH
22 RESOURCE TRACKS RECEIVING PERCENTAGE EVER RHNA. ALLOCATING
23 LOWER INCOME RHNA TO JURISDICTION WITH THE MOST OPPORTUNITY
24 PARTICULARLY WHEN PAIRED WITH 2019 HOUSEHOLDS WITH THE
25 BASELINE ALLOCATION IN BOTH BOTTOM UP SCENARIOS USING 2019

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BASELINE JURISDICTION WITH THE LARGEST PERCENTAGE OF
2 HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN HIGHEST RESOURCE TRACT RECEIVES 51
3 PERCENT OF RHNA. SOME COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND STAKEHOLDERS HAVE
4 EXPRESSED INTEREST IN THE VALUE METRICS THAT CONSIDER RACIAL -
5 - COMPARED TO SOCIO-ECONOMIC AND RACIAL INCLUSION NOTED IN
6 PAST RHNA CYCLES COMMUNITIES EXHIBITING RACIAL AND ECONOMIC
7 EXCLUSION HAVE REACHED SHARES -- IN RESPONSE METRICS FOR THE
8 AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING OBJECTIVES IT EXAMINES
9 WHETHER RACIALLY ECONOMICALLY JURISDICTION RECEIVE
10 PROPORTIONAL TO THE SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS METRICS FOCUSES
11 SPECIFICALLY ON THE JURISDICTION THAT HAVE ABOVE AVERAGE
12 DIVERGENCE INDEX SCORES AND ABOVE AVERAGE HOUSEHOLDS ABOVE 21
13 PERCENT OF AREA MEDIAN INCOME HOUSE JOBS CRESCENT METHODOLOGY
14 COMPARED WITH BASELINE ALLOCATION PERFORMANCE BEST IN THE
15 METRIC FURTHERING AFFAIR HOUSING USING THIS METHODOLOGY 87
16 PERCENT OF THE HIGH DIVERGENCE RECEIVE NUMBERS PRO RATIONAL TO
17 THE REGION'S SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE. OVERALL THE
18 METHODOLOGIES USING THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH TEND TO PERFORM
19 WELL ON THE METRICS ACROSS THE OBJECTIVE WHICH REMAINS TO BE
20 TRUE WHETHER THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT IS USED FOR THE
21 METHODOLOGY. HMC IS NOT REQUIRED TO MAKE ANY FINAL DECISIONS
22 TODAY THEY WOULD LIKE TO GET A SENSE OF OTHER HMC MEMBERS AND
23 METHODOLOGY ALLOCATION APPROACH AND WHETHER TO USE PLANNED BAY
24 AREA IN THE METHODOLOGY WHEN MAKING THE RECOMMENDATION HMC MAY
25 WANT TO CONSIDERING OF THE -- OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER ARE

July 9, 2020



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 REGIONAL GROWTH APPEARANCE AND METHODOLOGIES VARIANCE IN THE
2 JURISDICTION BOTH IN TOTAL AND INCOME COST CATEGORIES STAFF
3 WILL NOW TAKE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PRESENTATIONS
4 GIVEN BY GILLIAN AND MYSELF BASED ON THE TOPICS SHOWN ON THIS
5 SLIDE. I CAN NOW OPEN UP FOR QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS ELI. WE HAVE ABOUT A HALF HOUR LEFT. WE
8 HAVE A BUNCH OF PUBLIC COMMENT. OUR GOAL FOR THE LAST SLIDE IS
9 TO THINK TOGETHER ABOUT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HMC ON HOW
10 TO USE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT AND THE METHODOLOGY FOR
11 INCOME ALLOCATION THAT YOU WANT TO RECOMMEND. IT SEEMS LIKE
12 THERE ARE A LOT OF CLARIFYING QUESTIONS FOLKS HAVE PUT IN THE
13 CHAT. I SAW ONE FROM JEFF THAT YOU ASKED IN THE CHAT DURING
14 DAVE'S PRESENTATION THAT IT KIND OF CONNECTED TO RHNA,
15 FERNANDO, VICTORIA, PAT. JAMES YOU HAD A QUESTION. IF WE CAN
16 RUN DOWN THESE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS AND SEE HOW MUCH
17 DISCUSSION WE CAN GET INTO THE IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS ENOUGH
18 THAT WE NEED TO DO SOME CLARITY FIRST. JEFF DO YOU WANT TO ASK
19 YOUR QUESTION? IS IT STILL RELEVANT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** SURE. I GUESS AT THIS POINT I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS THAT
22 DEAL WITH THE ISSUE OF CONSISTENCY AND THEN MAYBE COME BACK
23 LATER WHEN WE GIVE COMMENTS BECAUSE I HAVE COMMENTS AS WELL.
24 FIRST GENERAL QUESTION IS WHAT GUIDANCE AT ALL DO WE HAVE FROM
25 HCD ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO BE CONSISTENT, AND YOU KNOW, WHAT'S

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THE THRESHOLD WE HAVE TO PASS TO DEMONSTRATE ON REALLY GIVEN
2 WHAT WE HAVE SEEN HERE I'M NOT AT ALL COMFORTABLE WITH
3 INCORPORATING THE BLUEPRINT IN ANY WAY AND I THINK THERE ARE
4 OTHER WAYS FOR US TO BE ABLE TO DEMONSTRATE CONSISTENCY. BUT,
5 I'M ALSO CONCERNED THAT THE BLUEPRINT CALLS FOR 30 PERCENT,
6 VERY LOW, AND LOW INCOME HOUSING. RHNA REQUIRES US TO PLAN FOR
7 40 PERCENT VERY LOW AND LOW. SO WE ALREADY HAVE SOMETHING OF A
8 JUNCTURE BETWEEN WHAT THE BLUEPRINT IS AIMING FOR AND WHAT THE
9 RHNA ACTUALLY REQUIRES US TO DO. SO MAYBE STAFF CAN COMMENT ON
10 WHAT THE IMPLICATIONS OF THAT ARE, EVEN FOR, YOU KNOW,
11 DEFINING WHAT CONSISTENCY IS. BASED ON INCOME LEVEL DATA. SO
12 THAT ISSUE MAY BE A BIT OF A MOOT POINT. BUT I WANT TO CLARIFY
13 IF THE STATISTICS ARE OF A DIFFERENT TYPE. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
14 LOW INCOME IN THE PLAN WE HAVE BROKEN THE REGION INTO
15 QUANTILES FOR INCOME CATEGORIES. THOSE INCOME BRACKETS ARE
16 SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT THAN THE ONES HCD USES FOR THE RHNA PROCESS
17 THOSE TWO STATISTICS OF 30 AND 40 PERCENT AREN'T COMPARABLE.
18 DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDES UNDERCOVER DEED RESTRICTED TO
19 QUANTIFY GROWTH FOR THE LOW INCOME BRACKET IN THE CONTEXT OF
20 THE PLAN SO THE SPECIFICS JUST HAVE DIFFERENT INCOME
21 THRESHOLDS IT'S KIND OF LIKE COMPARING APPLES AND ORANGES.

22

23 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** FERNANDO, YOU HAD A QUESTION IN THE CHAT ABOUT
24 SOLANO COUNTY? THERE WAS ANOTHER QUESTION. THERE WERE JUST A

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments
Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FEW QUESTIONS ABOUT SOLANO IN THE CHAT, BUT MAYBE WE CAN
2 ANSWER OR ASK ALL TOGETHER.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. I THINK EVERYONE WAS WONDERING WHY PLANNED BAY
5 AREA, THAT GENERALLY EMPHASIZES THE KIND OF AREA AROUND THE
6 BAY AND SILICON VALLEY, SOLANO POPS UP IN BRIGHT RED. >DAVE
7 VAUTIN: I CAN TAKE THIS ONE AS WELL. SO, SOLANO COUNTY IS
8 UNINCORPORATED POPULATION IS THE SMALLEST, I BELIEVE, OF ALL
9 OF THE BAY AREA COUNTIES. IT'S A CLASSIC SMALL DENOMINATOR
10 PROBLEM THERE IS NOT THAT MUCH BROTH IN SOLANO COUNTY COMPARED
11 TO ITS DENOMINATOR BUT BECAUSE IT'S SMALL IT POPS UP AS HAVING
12 A HIGHER GROWTH RATE SO IT MAKES IT LOOK LIKE A TON OF GROWTH
13 THERE WHEN THERE REALLY IS NOT. THERE IS GROWTH AROUND THE AIR
14 FORCE BASE AND THAT'S LIKELY WHAT'S DRIVING IT WE'LL CHECK THE
15 NUMBERS BUT THERE IS NOT A TON IN TERMS OF THE NUMBER OF UNIT
16 IN UNINCORPORATED SOLANO.

17

18 **MONICA BROWN:** THIS IS SUPERVISOR MONICA BROWN AND I REALIZE I
19 HAVE NOT BEEN RECOGNIZED. THERE IS NO ASTERISK TO INDICATE
20 THAT. THAT'S WHY I WROTE MY QUESTION. WE WOULD HAVE NO IDEA
21 AND JUST GO MERRILY ON THE WAY. WHICH IS WHY I WROTE I'M NOT
22 READY TO MAKE A DECISION TODAY UNTIL I HAVE A CHANCE TO GO
23 OVER ALL OF THIS. SO THAT'S IT. I'M DONE. THANK YOU.

24

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** HELPFUL MONICA, THANK YOU. VICTORIA, YOU HAD A
2 QUESTION IN THE CHAT I'M NOT SURE I CAN ASK IT MYSELF SO I'M
3 GOING TO ASK YOU TO ASK.

4

5 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** YES THIS IS LIKE FROM A WHILE BACK WHEN WE
6 WERE LOOKING AT THESE TWO OPTIONS. ONE SLIDE THAT HAD OPTION
7 ONE, USE THE BLUEPRINT FACTOR, OPTION TWO, USE THE BLUEPRINT
8 AS THE BASELINE ALLOCATION SO I'M WONDERING IF THIS IS MAYBE
9 RELATED TO THE SOLANO QUESTION, DOES THE BLUEPRINT OPTION
10 THERE USE EARTH BY JURISDICTION BASELINE VALUE OR IS IT
11 POPULATION SHARE BY 2030 AS THE BASELINE VALUES THERE?

12

13 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** IT'S BASED ON HOUSEHOLD GROWTH.

14

15 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** PAT, YOU HAD RAISED YOUR HAND AT SOME POINT?

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

20

21 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** YEP. GO AHEAD.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** I HAVE THREE QUESTIONS FOR GILLIAN AND/OR ELI. I
24 AM CONFUSED ABOUT OPTION 1 AND 2, IF YOU LOOK ON PAGE 1 OF 6
25 OF THE PDF THAT YOU SENT OUT, WHICH IS THE CHART THAT SHOWS

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THE JURISDICTION'S POTENTIAL ALLOCATIONS GROUP OF CITIES, AND
2 I'M JUST LOOKING AT THE MIDDLE CITIES, SO ARE YOU SAYING THAT
3 OPTION ONE ARE THE LAST THREE ON EACH OF THESE INDIVIDUAL
4 CHARTS, AND THEN OPTION TWO IS THE FIRST THREE WHERE IT SAYS
5 2019 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE? IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE SAYING?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I THINK I CAN ANSWER THAT QUESTION. THAT BRINGS UP A
8 GOOD POINT FOR FOLKS WANTING TO SEE SOME OF THE NUMBERS BEHIND
9 THOSE MAPS. I KNOW THE MAPS ON SMALL ON THE SLIDE. IN THE
10 AGENDA PACKET THERE IS A SERIES OF CHARTS THAT SHOWS THE
11 ACTUAL AMOUNT, THE NUMBER ALLOCATIONS OF EACH JURISDICTION
12 UNDER THE DIFFERENT SCENARIOS. IT DOESN'T SHOW PERCENTAGE
13 GROWTH. SO THAT'S SOMETHING WE COULD INCLUDE IN ADDITION. BUT
14 IN THE CHART PAT IS REFERRING TO, THE FIRST BAR ISN'T REALLY A
15 METHODOLOGY WE'RE CONSIDERING, BUT ESSENTIALLY WHAT IT LOOKS
16 LIKE, WITH THE BASELINE ALLOCATION SCENARIO, THE BROWN BAR,
17 WHERE THE RHNA -- THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS IS ALLOCATED JUST
18 SOLELY BASED ON EACH JURISDICTION'S CURRENT SHARE OF THE
19 REGION'S HOUSEHOLD. SO THAT'S THE HOUSEHOLD BASELINE
20 ALLOCATION. AND THEN THE NEXT TWO BARS SHOW THE HOUSING JOBS
21 CRESCENT METHODOLOGY USING THAT 2019 HOUSEHOLDS BASELINE AND
22 THEN THE BOTTOM UP THREE FACTORS METHODOLOGY USING THE 2019
23 BASELINE. AND THEN THE FOURTH BAR, THE LIGHT BLUE BAR IS THE
24 OPTION ONE SCENARIO. THE BLUEPRINT ALLOCATION WHERE THE
25 REGIONAL NEED WOULD BE ALLOCATED ENTIRELY USING THE BLUEPRINT

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AND NOT HAVE ADDITIONAL FACTORS AND THEN THE LAST TWO BARS,
2 THE DARKER BLUE BARS ARE WHAT THE SECOND AND THIRD BAR ARE,
3 THOSE TWO METHODOLOGIES CONSIDERATION THE BLUE BASELINE.
4 OPTION TWO USING THE BLUEPRINT AS A BASELINE APPLIED TO THE
5 METHODOLOGIES WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT. AND I KNOW THAT WAS
6 A LOT. SO FEEL FREE TO --

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** NO-NO, THAT'S FINE. SO THEN ELI, WHEN IT SAYS
9 BLUEPRINT ALLOCATION SCALE TO RHND, THAT'S OPTION ONE?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. AND THEN THE TWO BARS TO THE RIGHT OF THAT
14 ARE -- IS OPTION TWO?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. OTHER THING I DO NOT UNDERSTAND IS WHAT IS
19 THIS HOUSING JOBS CRESCENT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THAT IS ONE OF THE METHODOLOGIES --

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** I HAVE NO IDEA WHAT THE CRESCENT IS.

24

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S ONE OF THE METHODOLOGIES THAT WAS CREATED BY
2 THE HMC IN MARCH. THERE WERE THREE THAT GOT THE MOST VOTES AND
3 THE GROUP HAD THE MOST AND THE GROUP NAMED THEM.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** SINCE WE'RE SPENDING THOUSANDS -- I DON'T KNOW IF
6 MILLION DOLLARS -- MAYBE WE ARE -- DOING THIS WHOLE 2050
7 PLANNED BAY AREA AND DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND EVENTUALLY FINAL
8 BLUEPRINT, WHICH WILL BE INCORPORATED INTO PLANNED 2050, IF
9 WE'RE SPENDING ALL THIS TIME AND EFFORT TO LOOK AT THIS AND
10 STUDY IT, WHY WOULDN'T WE USE IT INSTEAD OF JUST USING THE
11 2019? IT SEEMS LIKE IT WOULD BE A LOT MORE UPDATED AND IT
12 WOULD BE ACHIEVING MORE OF THE GOALS THAT WE WOULD BE DOING,
13 AND IF WE DON'T USE THE BLUEPRINT THEN MAYBE WE NEED TO NOT
14 PRODUCE THE BLUEPRINT BUT CHANGE IT INTO SOMETHING ELSE. I
15 JUST -- IT DOESN'T SEEM REASONABLE TO ME THAT WE WOULDN'T USE
16 IT. BUT HELP ME TO UNDERSTAND WHY WE WOULD OR WOULDN'T.

17

18 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I WOULD SAY THAT MAYBE THAT'S A QUESTION FOR
19 YOUR COLLEAGUES ON THE HMC TO HASH OUT TOGETHER. I THINK THE
20 STAFF HAS PRESENTED LIKE THE PROS AND CONS ARE VARIOUS WAYS OF
21 CONSIDERING THE BLUEPRINT.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. SO I'LL POSE THAT QUESTION WHEN WE GET TO
24 THE -- [LAUGHTER]

25

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** YEAH. IT'S A DECISION POINT THAT YOU ALL SORT
2 OF HAVE TO ARRIVE AT AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION ULTIMATELY TO
3 ABAG STAFF ABOUT WHAT TO DO AND THEN PROBABLY, YOU KNOW,
4 HEARING FROM EACH OTHER ABOUT WHAT YOU THINK ABOUT THAT WOULD
5 BE REALLY HELPFUL. SO I KNOW WE HAVE SO MANY PEOPLE WITH
6 QUESTIONS. SO I JUST WANT TO MOVE ON. JAMES YOU HAD A COUPLE
7 OF QUESTIONS IN THE CHAT, THEN MONICA AND MATT.

8
9 **SPEAKER:** YEAH I'LL SPEAK TO PAT'S POINT AND IT'S GOING TO
10 RELATE TO MY QUESTION. I THINK THE REASON WHY WE WOULD
11 CONSIDER NOT JUST FOLLOWING THE PLAN IS THAT WE WANT TO
12 RESPOND TO THE CURRENT CONDITIONS THAT PEOPLE ARE LIVING IN,
13 AND NOT JUST AN ABSTRACTED FORECAST 30 YEARS INTO THE FUTURE.
14 SO THAT IS THE POINT OF WHY WE'RE CONSIDERING ADDITIONAL WAYS
15 AND NOT JUST TAKING PLANNED BAY AREA. BUT TO THAT POINT, YOU
16 KNOW, THE EXERCISES WE WERE ASKED TO DO, WE USED THE 2019
17 HOUSEHOLD DISTRIBUTION, AND OBVIOUSLY THE PLANNED BAY AREA
18 2050 IS QUITE A DIFFERENT DISTRIBUTION OF HOUSEHOLDS AND SO I
19 IMAGINE THAT IT -- AND BASED ON THE MAPS, IT INTERACTS
20 DIFFERENTLY WITH THE DIFFERENT FACTORS THAT ARE CONSIDERED, SO
21 I'M WONDERING IF WE CAN ACTUALLY SEE YOUR RESULTS. BECAUSE I
22 FOUND WHEN I WAS PLAYING WITH THE MAP TOOL THAT THE COLORS
23 RECALL A GENERAL INDICATION OF CHANGE BUT BECAUSE IT'S ALL
24 RELATIVE THE COLORS DON'T TELL YOU ANYTHING SO IT WOULD BE
25 GREAT TO SEE THE COLORS UNDERLYING ON THE MAPS SO I WONDER IF

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 YOU COULD SHARE THAT OR SHARE A DIFFERENT VERSION OF THE TOOL
2 SO WE CAN PLAY WITH THAT OURSELVES SO WE CAN UNDERSTAND WHAT
3 IT MEANS TO USE PLANNED BAY AREA AS A POTENTIAL BASELINE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YEAH THAT'S A GOOD POINT IT SHOULD BE FAIRLY EASY FOR
6 US TO BUILD THE OTHER BASELINE OPTION INTO THE TOOL AND GIVE
7 THE HMC A CHANCE TO USE THE TOOL BETWEEN NOW AND AUGUST
8 MEETING TO EXPERIMENT WITH THAT BASELINE SCENARIO AS WELL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** GREAT. THANKS. MONICA, DID YOU HAVE A QUESTION?
13 NO. OKAY. MATT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO GO BACK TO SOLANO COUNTY. I THINK DAVE
16 COVERED A LITTLE BIT OF THE EXPLANATION. EVEN THOUGH WE DON'T
17 HAVE THE POPULATION, THE GROWTH RATE IS STILL AT 23 PERCENT
18 PLUS BASED ON THE BLUEPRINT, WHICH TELLS ME THERE IS A
19 MISTAKE, A MISTAKE AND ASSUMPTION. UNINCORPORATED SOLANO HAS
20 NO CITY SERVICES, VIRTUALLY, NO PDAS, NO TRANSIT CENTERS, NO
21 JOB CENTERS SO SOMETHING'S GOING ON WITH THOSE NUMBERS WHICH
22 KIND OF MAKES THE BLUEPRINT A NON-STARTER FOR ME. THERE MAY BE
23 A MISTAKE THERE BUT THERE MAY BE MISTAKES IN OTHER
24 JURISDICTION THAT WE DON'T KNOW ABOUT. I'M NOT INCLINED TO
25 EVEN CONSIDERING USING THE BLUEPRINT AT THIS POINT UNTIL MORE

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 INFORMATION COMES OUT TO ASSURE ME THAT IT'S ACCURATE. >DAVE
2 VAUTIN: I WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE A BRIEF COMMENT ALL
3 JURISDICTION WERE PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW THE BASELINE
4 AGENDA AS APART OF THE AGENDA IN 2017 SO THERE WEREN'T -- TO
5 WITH THAT SAID WE APPLY STRATEGIES ON TOP OF THE BASELINE
6 DATA. WE WILL TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT'S GOING ON THERE BUT AGAIN
7 IT'S A VERY SMALL NUMBER OF HOUSING UNITS IT'S REALLY SHOWING
8 UP THERE IS SO FEW UNITS IN THE UNINCORPORATED AREA IN THE
9 FIRST PLACE.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** AARTI AND THEN MINDY.

12

13 **ARTIE SHRIVASTAVA:** YES. I HAD A QUESTION. ON THE CHART WHERE
14 YOU SHOW THE BASELINE, THE BLUEPRINT ALLOCATION THAT'S SCALED
15 TO THE RHND, DID YOU TAKE THE NUMBER FOR THE 35 YEARS PERIOD
16 AND THEN SCALE IT DOWN TO THE RHNA PERIOD?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES RHND IS 441,000 AND THE BLUEPRINT GROWTH IS 1.2
19 MILLION WE TAKE THE PATTERN AND MAKE IT FIT SO IT HAS THE SAME
20 SIZE AS WHAT WE NEED TO ALLOCATE FOR THE REGIONAL HOUSING
21 NEEDS WE JUST TAKE THE PATTERN AND MAKE IT FIT SO IT'S SCALED.

22

23 **ARTIE SHRIVASTAVA:** OKAY THANK YOU.

24

25 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS MINDY.

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **SPEAKER:** MY QUESTIONS WERE ANSWERED BY ELI EARLIER.

3

4 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** DARIN.

5

6 **DARIN RANELETTI:** ARE YOU LOOKING AT FEEDBACK FOR BASELINE IN
7 GENERAL OR WHETHER THE BLUEPRINT SHOULD BE USED AS A BASELINE
8 I UNDERSTAND WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHETHER OR NOT THE
9 BLUEPRINT SHOULD BE INCORPORATED AND WE HAVE TWO OPTIONS OF
10 2019 HOUSEHOLDS VERSUS THE BLUEPRINT I'M INTERESTED IN THE
11 DISCUSSION OF THE BASELINE IN GENERAL BECAUSE I HAVE FEEDBACK
12 I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE FOR OTHER OPTIONS IS THAT SOMETHING YOU
13 WOULD LIKE TODAY OR IS THAT GOING TO BE ON A FUTURE MEETING?

14

15 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** IDEALLY WE WOULD GET TO THAT DISCUSSION TODAY,
16 AND UNFORTUNATELY I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE TIME CRUNCHED.
17 BECAUSE WE ONLY REALLY HAVE 15 MORE MINUTES FOR QUESTIONS AND
18 DISCUSSION. BUT THAT IS THE CONVERSATION THAT YOU ALL NEED TO
19 HAVE, AND A DECISION THAT YOU NEED TO MAKE ABOUT WHAT YOU'RE
20 RECOMMENDING AS THE BASELINE. AND THEN SORT OF OUTSIDE OF
21 THAT, IF YOU'RE RECOMMENDING USING THE BLUEPRINT IN ANY
22 CAPACITY, THEY OFFER A FEW DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR HOW TO USE IT
23 ONE OF THEM IS THE BASELINE. DOES THAT HELP?

24

25 **DARIN RANELETTI:** YES THANKS.

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** JEFF AND THEN ALAN. JEFF, DO YOU STILL HAVE A
3 QUESTION?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** QUESTION YES. PARTICULARLY THE CHARTS THAT ARE IN THE
6 APPENDIX CB BEING ABLE TO LOOK AT THOSE NUMBERS SIDE BY SIDE
7 WOULD BE HELPFUL. THERE WAS A LOT OF USEFUL DATA THERE BUT
8 IT'S DIFFICULT TO ABSORB AT FIRST FRANCE AND I THINK WE NEED
9 TIME TO THINK THROUGH THE IMPLICATIONS ON IT.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** VERY HELPFUL. THANK YOU. ELLEN AND THEN
12 MICHAEL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY QUESTION MAY BE EMBARRASSINGLY RUDIMENTARY. COULD
15 STAFF REITERATE WHAT WE MEAN BY BASELINE IN THE SCENARIOS. I
16 GET IT'S ABOUT DISTRIBUTION, 2019 HOUSEHOLDS IS SORT OF ABOUT
17 WHAT IS REALLY EXISTING IN CITIES TODAY, BUT, AND THE
18 BLUEPRINT IS MORE THE POLICY BASED ALMOST A PROJECTIONS
19 DIFFERENT STARTING POINT BUT THAT'S MY INTERPRETATION OF IT
20 BUT IF STAFF COULD IN SIMPLE TERMS EXPLAIN TO THE GROUP WHAT
21 WE MEAN BY BASELINES SO WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE. I'M NOT
22 SURE MY UNDERSTANDING IS COMPLETELY CORRECT.

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** BASELINE IS DETERMINING EACH STARTING POINT OR
25 THE ADDITIONAL FACTORS AND WAYS THAT MIGHT BE IMPLIED TO THAT

July 9, 2020



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 INITIAL ASSIGNMENT OF UNITS. AND SO WE HAVE SORT OF -- WHAT
2 WE'RE PRESENTING HERE IS TWO DIFFERENT WAYS OF ASSIGNING THAT
3 SHARE ONE IS BASED ON JURISDICTION OF SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS,
4 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AND THE OTHER IS ASSIGNING -- BASED ON ITS
5 SHARE OF FUTURE GROWTH FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AND THEN
6 THAT'S THE STARTING PLACE, AND THEN IF WE USE THE OTHER
7 FACTORS THEY ADJUST THE BASELINE ON -- [INDISCERNIBLE] UNDER
8 SCORES FACTORS BASED ON JURISDICTION.

9

10 **ELLEN CLARK:** OKAY THANK YOU GILLIAN.

11

12 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** MICHAEL THEN VICTORIA.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION. ELI I HAVE A QUESTION. IT'S THE
15 DAY BEFORE I GO ON VACATION MAYBE MY BRAIN IS SOMEWHERE ELSE.
16 ONE OBJECTIVE, DIVERGENCE WHERE THE HOUSING CRESCENT IS THE
17 BEST ON THAT ONE IT WAS THE LAST OF THE ENACTORS, CAN YOU JUST
18 EXPLAIN THAT ENACTOR MORE? I HAD A HARD TIME UNDERSTANDING
19 WHAT THAT WAS -- HOW THAT MEASUREMENT WAS WORKING.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO. SO THAT INDICATOR WAS THAT
22 METRIC WAS TO PROVIDE CONVERSATION AROUND THE NOTION THAT IN
23 THE PAST A JURISDICTION THAT LET'S SAY IS ONE PERCENT OF THE
24 BAY AREA'S HOUSEHOLDS BUT MAYBE IT RECEIVES HALF OF ONE
25 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA'S RHNA, THAT IT WAS RECEIVING RHNA

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 NUMBERS FAR BELOW SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS AND CONCERNS AROUND THE
2 FACT THAT JURISDICTION THAT HAVE HISTORICALLY EXHIBITED MORE
3 RACIAL ECONOMIC EXCLUSION THAT IT WAS A CONSISTENT PATTERN AND
4 SO THIS WAS TRYING TO MEASURE THAT BY LOOKING AT JURISDICTION
5 THAT HAD THE HIGHEST -- THAT WERE ABOVE AVERAGE IN TERMS OF
6 DIVERGENT SCORE MEANING THEY HAVE THE MOST -- THEIR RACIAL
7 DEMOGRAPHICS ARE MOST DIFFERENT FROM THE REGION AND ABOVE
8 AVERAGE IN TERMS OF SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS THAT ARE ABOVE 120
9 PERCENT OF AMI. SO IT'S TAKING THAT GROUP OF JURISDICTION
10 WHICH I BELIEVE IS ABOUT 31, WHO CHECK BOTH OF THOSE BOXES
11 BEING ABOVE AVERAGE IN TERMS OF DIVERGENCE AND HIGH INCOME
12 HOUSEHOLDS AND SEEING WHETHER THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS TO THOSE
13 JURISDICTION UNDER THESE DIFFERENT SCENARIOS, WHETHER THOSE
14 ALLOCATIONS WERE AT LEAST PROPORTIONAL TO THOSE JURISDICTION'S
15 SHARE OF POPULATION. SO IF THOSE JURISDICTION WERE EACH ONE
16 PERCENT OF THE REGION SEEING WHETHER THEY RECEIVED AT LEAST
17 ONE PERCENT OF THE REGION'S RHNA, SO YOU KNOW A POTENTIAL FLAW
18 WITH THAT METRIC COULD BE MAYBE IT WAS LIKE ALMOST
19 PROPORTIONAL, LIKE IT RECEIVED .9 PERCENT OF RHNA AND IS ONE
20 PERCENT OF THE POPULATION SO IT DOESN'T CHECK THAT BOX AND IT
21 DOESN'T TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE RELATIVE SIZES OF JURISDICTION
22 SO IT'S NOT A PERFECT METRICS BUT TRYING TO GET AT THAT SORT
23 OF MEASURE OF LIKE FAIR SHARE AND DISTRIBUTION.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU THAT HELPS.

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** VICTORIA, I SAW HAD YOU A QUESTION IN CHAT.

3

4 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** IT'S NOT FOR THIS ITEM. ONE OF THE
5 PRESENTATIONS EARLIER ALSO SAID THE EVALUATION METRICS AND
6 THERE IS THIS ONE OBJECTIVE BY JURISDICTION LARGE PERCENTAGE
7 OF HOUSEHOLDS LIVING IN RESOURCE TRACKS AND I'M REMEMBERING
8 FROM EARLIER DISCUSSIONS.

9

10 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I THINK MAYBE WE LOST VICTORIA? I SEE THE REST
11 OF YOU MOVING. SO IT'S NOT ME. I THINK WE'LL MOVE ON --

12

13 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** AM I BACK?

14

15 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** YES YOU'RE BACK.

16

17 **VICTORIA FIERCE:** INSTEAD OF FOCUSING ON WHAT PERCENTAGE EVER
18 PEOPLE LIVE IN A HIGH RESOURCE AREA, WHAT PERCENTAGE OF LAND
19 IS IN A HIGH RESOURCE AREA. IT'S TOTALLY POSSIBLE TO HAVE ONE
20 PERCENT OF THE POPULATION HOLD 99 PERCENT OF THE WEALTH IN THE
21 NEIGHBORHOOD AND GET LESS ALLOCATION.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** ONE THOUGHT I HAVE ON THAT IS HCD HAS CONSISTENTLY
24 LOOKED AT THE PERCENT OF RESIDENTS IN A JURISDICTION IN THE
25 HIGHER RESOURCE TRACKS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO MIRROR WHAT THEY

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 WERE DOING IF AN AGENCY WAS INTERESTED IN LOOKING AT THE
2 METRICS VICTORIA WAS LOOKING AT, MAYBE SHARE THAT WITH US AND
3 WE'LL INCORPORATE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO REFLECT HOW RHNA
4 METHODOLOGY WOULD LIKELY BE EVALUATED BY THE STATE.

5

6 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS. NEYSA.

7

8 **NEYSA FILGOR:** THANKS. I THINK THIS QUESTION IS FOR GILLIAN.
9 I'M NOT SURE I HEARD AN ANSWER TO JEFF'S QUESTION EARLIER IN
10 HOW WE INTERPRET THE WORD CONSISTENT. UNDER THE LAW IT
11 REQUIRES RHNA BE CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE
12 REASON I'M ASKING IS THE TWO OPTIONS PRESENTED TODAY, I AM NOT
13 IN FAVOR OF EITHER WITH REGARDS TO INCORPORATING PLANNED BAY
14 AREA 2050, BUT OBVIOUSLY I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE CONSISTENT
15 WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, SO YOU CAN TALK TO THAT TO MAKE
16 SURE THAT IF THE VOTER OF THE DECISION IS NEITHER OF THE
17 OPTIONS PRESENTED TODAY, AND HOW TO USE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
18 THERE ARE OTHER WAYS FOR US TO BE CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY
19 AREA 2050.

20

21 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** ALL OF THE STATUS SAYS IS RHNA NEEDS TO BE
22 CONSISTENT WITH THE DEVELOPMENT PATTERN FROM THE PLANNED BAY
23 AREA. AND I GUESS I'LL ASK TAWNY MAYBE TO SEE FROM HCD TO SEE
24 IF SHE HAS ANY MORE INSIGHTS IN HOW THEY INTERPRET THAT.

25

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** HI GILLIAN. YEAH. IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT CONSISTENCY
2 BETWEEN THE TWO PLANS, YOU'RE RIGHT THAT ISN'T -- IT'S FAIRLY
3 WIDE OPEN. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THAT BACK AND SEE IF IT CAN BRING
4 MORE CONTEXT FOR HOW WE INTERPRET IT FROM THE OTHER PLANS THAT
5 WE HAVE REVIEWED.

6

7 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** WERE THERE ANY HMC MEMBERS WHO PUT A QUESTION
10 IN CHAT I'M MISSING. OR OTHER CLARIFYING QUESTIONS? IT SEEMS
11 LIKE WE HAVE AT LEAST A LITTLE BIT OF TIME TO ACTUALLY TALK
12 ABOUT WHAT YOU MIGHT NEED TO MAKE THESE DECISIONS. OKAY. SO
13 PROBABLY NOT TODAY BECAUSE WE'RE GETTING --

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I'M HAVING A HARD TIME HITTING MY HAND. I DO HAVE A
16 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. ARE WE ONLY VOTING ON OPTION ONE VERSUS
17 OPTION TWO EVEN THOUGH WE'RE LOOKING AT A WHOLE SET OF
18 SCENARIOS IN THE PACKAGE THAT COMPARE TWO APPROACHES TO USING
19 THE BLUEPRINT TO USING 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AS THE BASELINE? IS
20 2019 HOUSEHOLDS STILL AN OPTION FOR RHNA? OR ARE YOU TELLING
21 US THAT WE JUST HAVE TO CHOOSE BETWEEN BLUEPRINT AS
22 DISTRIBUTION AND BLUEPRINT AS BASELINE?

23

24 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THERE IS THREE OPTIONS ESSENTIALLY. WE
25 PRESENTED TWO DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR HOW YOU COULD USE THE PLAN

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ONE IS DIRECT ALLOCATION ONE IS CHANGING THE BASELINE WHERE
2 YOU DON'T HAVE TO CHOOSE USING THE PLAN. SO OPTION THREE IS
3 CONTINUING WITH USING 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AS THE BASELINE OR I
4 GUESS IF FOLKS WANT TO DISCUSS OTHER BASELINES THAT'S
5 SOMETHING THAT IF THERE IS ENOUGH INTEREST AMONG THE GROUP IN
6 DOING THAT, WE CAN -- I GUESS, ADD THAT TO THE CONVERSATION
7 FOR AUGUST.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THAT GREATLY CLARIFIES WHAT'S ON THE
10 TABLE. >DAVE VAUTIN: YEAH AND I WOULD ADD ONE THING TO WHAT
11 GILLIAN SAID, AS I MENTIONED IN MY PRESENTATION, THE BLUEPRINT
12 IS SIMPLY A RESOURCE FOR YOU TO CONSIDER. IT MAY BE THE
13 EASIEST WAY TO SAY THAT THE PLAN -- TO SAY THAT RHNA IS
14 CONSISTENT BECAUSE YOU HAVE WOVEN IT RIGHT INTO THE
15 METHODOLOGY, BUT IT'S NOT REQUIRED. SO YOU -- IF YOU GO WITH
16 THE APPROACH OF NOT USE YOU THE BLUEPRINT, YOU JUST NEED TO
17 MAKE SURE THE FACTORS AND WEIGHTS THAT YOU CHOOSE LEAD TO A
18 RHNA THIS ALLOCATION THAT'S ASSISTANT WITH THE BLUEPRINT WHICH
19 MIGHT BE TRICKIER BUT MIGHT GET YOU TO THE OUTCOMES YOU
20 DESIRE.

21

22 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** HANDS?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** ARE YOU CALLING ON ME AGAIN?

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** DO YOU HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES. THANK YOU. AND I THINK THIS FOLLOWS WITH JEFF'S
4 QUESTION. BECAUSE I THINK MANY OF US ARE GRAPPLING WITH JUST A
5 DECISION BETWEEN PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT AND THE POPULATION
6 BASELINE. IS ONE OF THE OPTIONS -- OR IS THIS TOO DIFFICULT --
7 AND IT SOUNDED LIKE IT MIGHT BE POSSIBLE -- TO ADD IN SOME OF
8 THOSE FACTORS THAT WENT INTO PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT TO OUR
9 MTC ANALYTICS PAGE. SO THERE ARE CERTAIN THINGS WITHIN THE
10 BLUEPRINT THAT LOOK GOOD, RIGHT? I THINK MAYBE PEOPLE ARE
11 UNCOMFORTABLE AND JUST THROWING DOWN ASK SAYING THIS IS THE
12 WAY TO GO. BUT GIVEN THAT THERE MIGHT BE SOME THINGS THAT ARE
13 GOOD ABOUT THAT, IS THAT A POSSIBILITY OR IS THAT JUST WAY TOO
14 COMPLICATED? WE HAVE ALREADY GOTTEN FAR WITH THE ANALYTICS
15 TOOL WITH THE WAY WE HAVE GOT IT ADDING ANOTHER LAYER OF
16 FACTORS BUT I IMAGINE THE WAY YOU GOT TO THE BLUEPRINT MIGHT
17 HAVE BEEN AN ENTIRELY DIFFERENT WAY THAN ADDING OTHER FACTORS
18 ABOUT EXPECTED JOB GROWTH OR, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER IT MIGHT HAVE
19 BEEN, THAT GETS TO YOU SOMETHING THAT LOOKS VERY DIFFERENT
20 FROM WHAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH SO FAR. BUT IF IT WAS
21 POSSIBLE TO ADD SOME OF THOSE FACTOR IN, THAT MIGHT BE GOOD
22 AND THEN WE CAN KIND OF PLAY WITH -- YEAH MAYBE WE WANT MORE
23 OF THAT EXPECTED JOB GROWTH OR WHATEVER IT IS THAT GOT YOU
24 THERE. >DAVE VAUTIN: THIS COMES DOWN TO HOW DIFFERENT THE RHNA
25 PROCESS IS AN EXERCISE AND THE MAP EXERCISE IS ABOUT THE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 STRATEGIES AS INGREDIENTS THAT YOU PUT TOGETHER. NOW IS IT
2 POSSIBLE TO IDENTIFY A DATA SECT AND FACTOR THAT ALIGNS WITH
3 EACH OF THE PUBLIC POLICY IDEAS EXPLAINED IN THE PLAN? MAYBE
4 BUT IT WOULD BE COMPLICATED. THERE ARE 25 DIFFERENT STRATEGIES
5 IN PLAY THAT WERE APPROVED BY MTC AND ABAG BOARDS SOME MAY NOT
6 HAVE GOOD MATHEMATICAL FACTORS SITTING ON THE SHELF READY TO
7 BE USED ON IT'S NOT A CLEAR CUT YES OR NO ANSWER TO WHAT
8 YOU'RE ASKING BUT IT WOULD BE COMPLEX AT THIS LATE STAGE OF
9 THE PROCESS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AS A STATUTORY QUESTION ARE WE CONSTRAINED WITHIN THE
12 HMC RHNA PROCESS TO MATHEMATICAL QUESTIONS? SO IF WE WERE AS
13 AN HMC, LET'S SAY, TO SAY WE WANT TO CONSIDER DEVELOPMENT
14 ALONG THE BAYSIDE, OR DEVELOPMENT ALONG 680 CORRIDOR, TO SAY
15 AS AN EXAMPLE, AND ALLOCATE HOUSING BASED ON THAT RATHER THAN
16 A MATHEMATICAL FORMULA. IS THAT KIND OF OFF THE TABLE AS A
17 STATUTORY THING? OR CAN WE ADD IN THOSE KIND OF STRATEGY
18 PLANNING QUESTIONS? >DAVE VAUTIN: I WOULD HAVE TO DEFER TO
19 GILLIAN ON THIS ONE. I WOULD NOTE THAT I DON'T BELIEVE THERE
20 IS ANY REGION IN CALIFORNIA THAT HAS KIND OF GONE WITH THAT
21 SORT OF DIFFERENT APPROACH. USUALLY THESE APPROACHES -- IT'S
22 VERY MUCH MATHEMATICAL ABOUT FACTORS AND WEIGHTS AND
23 CHARACTERISTICS OF EACH JURISDICTION. GILLIAN DO YOU WANT TO
24 ADD ANYTHING TO THAT?

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** YEAH. I GUESS I WOULD SAY I HAVEN'T SEEN
2 ANYTHING LIKE THAT. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO KIND OF KEEP
3 IN MIND THE NARRATIVE THAT GOES WITH THIS, AND SO I THINK
4 QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW THOSE PLACES MIGHT BE CHOSEN, I THINK
5 THERE IS VALUE IN, FOR THE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THAT HAVE TO
6 IMPLEMENT THIS, AND HAVING A SENSE THAT THERE IS A FORMULA IN
7 WHICH THEY WERE TREATED THE SAME. RIGHT? AND SO I THINK THERE
8 IS ALSO THE QUESTION OF WE CAN'T -- OBVIOUSLY WE CAN USE
9 PLANNED BAY AREA WHICH RELIES ON LOCAL JURISDICTION KIND OF
10 LAND USE INFORMATION AND PLANNING INFORMATION BUT WE COULDN'T
11 LIMIT OUR RHNA ALLOCATION BASED ON THAT. SO I JUST -- I THINK
12 THAT ADDS A LEVEL OF COMPLEXITY TO THE PROCESS THAT I DON'T
13 THINK IS NECESSARILY GOING TO BE HELPFUL AT THIS TIME. BUT I
14 THINK THE QUESTION OF WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT THE PLACES WHERE
15 YOU WANT THAT GROWTH TO GO, WHAT ARE THOSE PLACES. RIGHT? SO
16 IF YOU CAN TAKE, IF YOU HAVE A PARTICULAR PLACE IN MIND, I
17 THINK WHAT WE HAVE BEEN GETTING AT WITH THESE DIFFERENT
18 FACTORS AND THE DIFFERENT IDEAS OF WHERE GROWTH SHOULD GO,
19 WHAT IS IT THAT LEADS YOU TO THINK OF THAT PLACE AND CAN WE
20 USE THAT AS A FACTOR THAT GETS APPLIED TO ALL SIMILAR PLACES.
21

22 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** OKAY. SO WE'RE RUNNING UP AGAINST OUR TIME
23 LIMIT HERE, AND CLEARLY THERE IS NO CONSENSUS AMONG US ABOUT
24 WHAT TO DO, RIGHT? WE'RE NOT -- WE HAVEN'T DONE ENOUGH
25 DISCUSSION, WE HAVEN'T -- YEAH. EXACTLY, WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THERE YET. SO I WOULD URGE YOU TO LOOK AT THE LAST SLIDE AND
2 ELI'S PRESENTATION, AND THE DISCUSSION QUESTION. AND REALLY,
3 WHAT WE NEED TO HEAR FROM YOU, EITHER VIA CHAT, OR VIA E-MAIL
4 OR SAY IT RIGHT NOW, AND VERY QUICKLY, IS WHAT INFORMATION DO
5 YOU NEED TO MAKE A DECISION IN AUGUST ON THESE QUESTIONS OF
6 ARE WE RECOMMENDING THE BLUEPRINT AS USED IN THE RHNA
7 METHODOLOGY, AND IF SO HOW. WHAT INCOME APPROACH YOU WANT TO
8 RECOMMEND THAT STAFF USED, AND THEN WHAT BASELINE DO YOU WANT
9 TO RECOMMEND. WE COULDN'T GET THERE RIGHT NOW, BUT IF YOU
10 DON'T HAVE A CLEAR IDEA IN YOUR MIND ABOUT WHERE YOU STAND AND
11 WHAT YOU WOULD ADVOCATE FOR, I THINK UNDERSTANDING FROM YOU
12 WHAT INFORMATION YOU NEED TO GET THERE WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL
13 FOR STAFF SO THEY CAN PREPARE THAT AND WE CAN HAVE THAT
14 DISCUSSION IN AUGUST AND THEN MOVE TOWARD, IDEALLY, SOME
15 DECISION POINTS, AND KIND OF FIND CONSENSUS AS A COMMITTEE. IS
16 THAT -- HOW DOES THAT RESONATE? ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO ASSUME
17 IT DOES RESONATE. I'M A LITTLE NERVOUS ABOUT CONTINUING THE
18 CONVERSATION JUST BECAUSE I KNOW THERE IS SO MUCH PUBLIC
19 COMMENT COMING UP. I URGE YOU, IN THE NEXT TEN MINUTES, I MEAN
20 LISTEN TO PUBLIC COMMENT OF COURSE, BUT PUT IN CHAT WHAT YOU
21 NEED TO HEAR. E-MAIL RHNA AT PACIFIC EDGE AND WE CAN PASS IT
22 ALONG TO STAFF.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** CAN I INTERJECT? WOULD THE COMMITTEE BE
25 AGREEABLE TO EXTEND 15 MINUTES. WE ARE SUPPOSED TO END AT

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FIVE, BUT IF PEOPLE WOULD LIKE IN DISCUSSION THAT MIGHT BE
2 APPROPRIATE. IS THAT OKAY?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** WE MIGHT EXTEND 15 OR SO MINUTES THAT
7 MIGHT GIVE TIME TO HAVE DISCUSSION. I'M NOT HEARING PEOPLE ARE
8 READY TO MAKE THE DECISION. AND I DON'T THINK THIS WAS NOTICED
9 AS AN ACTION ITEM.

10

11 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I WOULDN'T SAY THERE IS ANY VOTING, BUT MAYBE
12 TRYING TO COME TO CONSENSUS AS A COMMITTEE. IF WE DO HAVE SOME
13 EXTRA TIME THAT'S FABULOUS. I THINK MAYBE WE CAN HAVE A VERBAL
14 CONVERSATION ABOUT WHAT INFORMATION YOU WOULD NEED. WHAT ARE
15 YOU LOOKING FOR FROM STAFF. I KNOW THERE IS SOME SUGGESTIONS
16 ABOUT HOW WHAT, YOU KNOW, MAPS AND TABLES, BUT WHAT'S STILL A
17 QUESTION IN YOUR MIND ASSURE TRYING TO MAKE THIS DECISION
18 ABOUT THE BLUEPRINT, THE BASELINE, AND THEN THE INCOME
19 APPROACH. AND BOB, I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED AND THEN JANE AND
20 JEFF. BOB DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

21

22 **BOB PLANTHOLD:** SOME PEOPLE WANT TO TALK AND WORK EVERYTHING
23 OUT ALL AT ONCE AND SOME DON'T. SOME OF US -- SEEING IN
24 ATTENDANCE SOME OF US HAVE LEFT. I THINK IT'S UNFAIR TO SAY
25 WE'RE GOING TO EXTEND THE DISCUSSION, WHEN SOME HAVE LEFT

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BECAUSE WHEN WE CONVENE AGAIN PEOPLE WILL BE CAUGHT WITH, OH,
2 YOU DECIDED THIS, AS AN IMPLICATION AS ANY SORT OF EXTENDED
3 DISCUSSION. I JUST THINK SINCE SOME OF US HAVE TO LEAVE AT
4 5:00 IT'S NOT FAIR TO EXTEND. WE OUGHT TO SAY CONTINUED TO
5 NEXT TIME.

6

7 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS FOR THAT BOB. I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY
8 THERE ARE NO DECISIONS BEING MADE AS WE EXTEND, AND IT'S ONLY
9 HEARING FROM YOU ALL ABOUT WHAT INFORMATION YOU NEED IN ORDER
10 TO MAKE A DECISION IN AUGUST, AND IF YOU NEED TO JUMP OFF,
11 IT'S TOTALLY FINE, BUT IF YOU COULD EITHER COMMUNICATE THROUGH
12 CHAT OR E-MAIL THEN WE CAN ATTEMPT TO ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS.
13 OR, I WON'T, OF COURSE, STAFF WILL. JAMES THEN JEFF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I THINK WE NEED TO NARROW DOWN THE QUESTIONS OR BREAK
16 THEM UP. I MEAN THERE IS JUST A HUGE AMOUNT OF CONTENT, AND I
17 APPRECIATE THAT STAFF HAS PREPARED ALL OF THIS MATERIAL BUT
18 MOST OF TODAY WAS ABSORBING A LOT OF MATERIAL WE TRIED TO
19 STUDY AND WORK WITH IT BEFORE. SO I THINK IF YOU CAN CLARIFY
20 WHAT THE QUESTIONS ARE GOING TO BE, MAYBE YOU NEED TO DO SOME
21 SURVEYS IN BETWEEN, SO THAT YOU, YOU KNOW WHERE THE QUESTIONS
22 FOR US STILL ARE, WHERE WE GOING TO NEED MORE INFORMATION AND
23 WHICH THINGS WE'RE READY TO MOVE FORWARD ON, AND REALLY MAKE
24 IT CLEAR, LIKE WHAT ARE THE ACTION ITEMS THAT WE NEED TO TAKE
25 STEPS ON. I -- YOU KNOW, IT SEEMS LIKE PLANNED BAY AREA HAS

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BEEN SUGGESTED AS A BASELINE WE HAVE THE 2019 HOUSEHOLD SO
2 THAT SEEMS LIKE A CLEAR QUESTIONS TO TAKE ACTION ON I THINK
3 PEOPLE ARE RAISING VALID POINTS ON OVERALL LAND AREA THERE
4 COULD BE ADDITIONAL FACTORS AND THEN THERE IS WHERE WE WOULD
5 APPLY FACTORS THROUGH INCOME SHIFT OR BOTTOM UP ON TOP OF THE
6 BASELINE. SO THERE IS SOME THINGS I FEEL LIKE YOU COULD BE
7 SERVING AND HELPING US NARROW THE FIELD AND HELPING US MOVE
8 TOWARDS ACTION ITEMS THAT WE CAN VOTE ON, AND MOVE FORWARD.

9

10 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS FOR THAT, JIM. JEFF? I THINK YOU HAD A
11 QUESTION.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** WELL, A COUPLE OF COMMENTS TO RESPOND TO WHAT YOU'RE
14 ASKING TO REITERATE THE NEED TO HAVE THE DATA TABLES SO THAT
15 WE CAN GET INTO THIS A LITTLE BIT DEEPER. ALSO, THIS WAS
16 RAISED AS A COMMENT. I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE WHAT HAPPENS
17 IN THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH IF WE MOVE MODERATE INCOME IN WITH
18 VERY LOW AND LOW. I THINK THE COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE ABOUT
19 THE IMPLICATIONS FOR SB35 AND HOW STREAMLINING PLAYS OUT BASED
20 ON PEOPLE'S PERFORMANCE ON RHNA, NEEDS TO BE THOUGHT ABOUT AS
21 WE'RE FIGURING OUT HOW TO ACTUALLY DO THE RHNA ALLOCATIONS
22 BECAUSE IT WILL HAVE TREMENDOUS IMPLICATIONS FOR THINGS LIKE
23 DISPLACEMENT IN CHOOSING DEVELOPMENT. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT, YOU
24 KNOW, ALL OF THIS, WHAT IT MEANS FOR EQUITY AND AFFIRMATIVELY
25 FAIR HOUSING I THINK THE RHNA ELEMENT IN THE FIRST PLACE WHERE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 WE HAVE HOUSING ELEMENT LAW WAS TO PROMOTE RACIAL AND ECONOMIC
2 EQUITY THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND THAT REALLY SHOULD BE A
3 PRIMARY CONSIDERATION GOING INTO THIS EXERCISE. WHERE I'M AT
4 IS LEANING VERY MUCH TOWARDS USING A BOTTOM UP APPROACH ON A
5 2019 HOUSEHOLD DISTRIBUTION IT PRODUCES EQUITY ACROSS THE
6 REGION RHNA ONLY DICTATES ZONING IT DOESN'T DETERMINE WHERE
7 HOUSING GETS BUILT IT DETERMINES WHERE HOUSING CAN GET BUILT
8 BASED ON REGULATION AND IF WE REQUIRE SOME AREAS TO ZONE FOR
9 AN EXTREMELY HIGH NUMBER OF UNITS AND THEREFORE TELL ALL THE
10 REST OF THE AREAS THEY DON'T NEED TO ZONE THAT HIGH, THEN WHAT
11 HAPPENS IS IF THE MARKET DOESN'T WANT TO BUILD IN THE AREAS
12 THAT HAVE HAD TO DO A TON OF ZONING, THEY CAN'T BUILD IN THE
13 OTHER AREAS BECAUSE THOSE JURISDICTION DIDN'T ESTABLISH ENOUGH
14 ZONING TO ACCOMMODATE THE DEMAND THAT DOESN'T GET ACCOMMODATED
15 IN THE HIGH ZONING AREAS. WE HAD THIS DISCUSSION EIGHT YEARS
16 AGO IN THE LAST RHNA, AND WE WERE VERY WORRIED ABOUT THE
17 POSSIBILITY THAT WE THOUGHT WE WERE PROMOTING SMART GROWTH BUT
18 MIGHT END UP WITH A GROWTH PATTERN THAT WASN'T WHAT ANY OF US
19 WANTED BECAUSE THE MARKET WOULDN'T WOULD WHERE WE SAID IT
20 SHOULD AND COULDN'T BUILD WHERE IT WANTED TO O WE'RE HAVING
21 POLARIZED DISTRIBUTION AND I THINK THAT'S THE BASELINE IN THE
22 BLUEPRINT IS POLARIZATION AND I THINK WE OUGHT TO EVEN IT OUT
23 SO THAT ALL JURISDICTION ARE DOING SOMETHING CLOSE TO FAIR
24 SHARE THAT WOULD ALLOW THE REGION TO ACTUALLY ACCOMMODATE ITS
25 NEEDS.

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS JEFF JUST A GENTLE REMINDER THIS IS A
3 TIME THAT YOU TELL US WHAT YOU NEED IN ORDER MAKE A DECISION
4 AND I THINK IN AUGUST THIS IS GOING TO BE A WHERE I STAND AND
5 ADVOCATING WHERE YOUR THINKING. JOSH AND THEN DARIN. NO
6 THOUGHTS JOSH? MAYBE YOU'RE ON MUTE. I CAN'T SEE YOU. ALL
7 RIGHT. MOVING ON. DARIN?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. TWO COMMENTS. ONE IS, I DON'T SUPPORT USING
10 THE BLUEPRINT AS EITHER A BASELINE OR ALLOCATION AND I HAVE A
11 SENSE THAT THE COMMITTEE, FOR THE MOST PART AGREES WITH THAT.
12 I THINK WE COULD PROBABLY HAVE SOME KIND OF TEMPERATURE CHECK
13 ON THAT WHETHER IT'S THROUGH THE RED, YELLOW, GREEN, THUMB'S
14 UP, THUMB'S DOWN EXERCISE AND MAYBE JUST GET THAT OFF THE
15 TABLE. IN AUGUST WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
16 COMPARED BASELINE 2019 HOUSEHOLDS TO JURISDICTION LAND AREA. I
17 THINK LAND AREA IS THE ONLY LIKE FAIR COMMON GROUND STARTING
18 PLACE. IF WE'RE BASING IT ON HOUSEHOLDS THAT'S LIKE
19 INCORPORATING OUR PAST INEQUITIES. AND YOU KNOW I DON'T KNOW
20 IF IT'S GOING TO MAKE THAT MUCH OF A DIFFERENCE BUT I WOULD
21 LIKE TO SEE THAT. THANKS.

22

23 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** FERNANDO.

24

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **FERNANDO MARTI:** I MOSTLY WANT TO ECHO WHAT JEFF SAID EARLIER,
2 THE IMPORTANCE OF BEING ABLE TO LOOK AT THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH
3 BY SEPARATING OUT THE ABOVE MARKET, WHICH IS BASICALLY MARKET
4 RATE AND ALL THE OTHER LOW AND MODERATE INCOME ASPECTS OF IT.
5 I THINK IT WOULD BE INTERESTING, I KNOW YOU ALL GOT A LOT OF
6 FEEDBACK AS FOLKS KIND OF PLAYED WITH THE DIFFERENT TOGGLES,
7 IF, YOU KNOW, I THINK YOU'RE GETTING A LOT OF CONSENSUS AROUND
8 EXPLORING MORE THE NOT PLANNED BAY AREA, AND SO MAYBE HELPING
9 US THINK THROUGH SOME OF THE BENEFITS OF DIFFERENT, OF THE
10 TOGGLES. MY VERSION, I SIMPLIFIED IT TO JUST ONE FACTOR FOR
11 THE ABOVE MARKET, ABOVE MODERATE AND ONE FACTOR FOR THE BELOW
12 MODERATE. BUT THAT MIGHT BE HELPFUL. I THINK -- I DON'T KNOW
13 WHO THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER WAS TALKING ABOUT LAND AREA, I
14 UNDERSTAND SOME FOLKS ARE -- THERE IS A LOT OF LOGIC TO THAT.
15 I THINK THERE IS ALSO A PARTICULAR LOGIC, ESPECIALLY AS WE
16 TALK ABOUT SOME REALLY BIG NUMBERS, ABOUT UNDERSTANDING THE
17 AMOUNT OF UNDERUTILIZED SITES, PARKING LOTS, ONE STORY
18 BUILDINGS, THAT ARE AVAILABLE IN DIFFERENT JURISDICTION. I
19 DON'T KNOW IF THAT IS SOMETHING YOU ALL CAN INTEGRATE AS A
20 FACTOR, BUT THAT MIGHT BE A WAY TO SORT OF SUSS OUT SOME OF
21 THOSE QUESTIONS. IT SORT OF GETS AT MY EARLIER COMMENT ABOUT
22 YOU KNOW JUST SORT OF THINKING ABOUT IN A VERY VISCERAL WAY
23 GOING DOWN EL CAMINO REAL AND 680 CORRIDOR AND SEEING A LOT OF
24 OPPORTUNITIES. HOW DO YOU INTEGRATE THAT QUESTION OF

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 OPPORTUNITIES WITH THE OTHER FACTORS THAT WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING
2 AT SO FAR.

3

4 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** GREAT. THANK YOU. JOSH.

5

6 **JOSH ABRAMS:** I GUESS I FEEL LIKE THERE IS OPTIONS OUT THERE
7 THAT WE AREN'T EXPLORING AND JUST LOOKING AT THE TOOL IS
8 REALLY ENCOURAGING US TO FIT OUR THINKING INTO A BOX THAT IT
9 COULD BE MUCH BROADER. SO I REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE FOR THE
10 NEXT MEETING IF WE CAN DO THAT. AND I'LL THROW OUT WHAT I
11 WOULD LIKE TO SEE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE CITIES BEING EXPECTED
12 TO DRAMATICALLY REDUCE JOBS HOUSING GAP IF THEY HAVE A JOBS
13 HOUSING GAP. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES
14 PROTECTED FROM A BIG INCREASE IN RHNA, IF THEY WANT TO ON GROW
15 THAT'S GREAT BUT I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD BE FORCING THEM TO
16 GROW BECAUSE I THINK THAT WILL CAUSE DISPLACEMENT AND THREE I
17 THINK WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT FACTORING IN CONSIDERATIONS
18 POPULATION LOW ZONING HOW THOSE CITIES ARE EXPECTED TO GROW A
19 FAIR AMOUNT. AND NONE OF THAT IS REALLY A POSSIBLE
20 CONVERSATION IN THE TOOL. SO I DON'T KNOW HOW TO -- I WOULD
21 LOVE IF THERE WAS A WAY TO USE THE TOOL YES BUT MAYBE MOVE
22 BEYOND THE TOOL ALSO.

23

24 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THANKS JOSH. ALL RIGHT. I'M NOT SEEING ANY
25 OTHER HAND RAISED. AND WE'RE DEFINITELY --

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **SPEAKER:** EXCUSE ME --

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I HAVE HAD MY HAND RAISED FOR THE PAST TEN
5 MINUTES.

6

7 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** OH NO.

8

9 **PAT ECKLUND:** SO I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN SEE IT OR NOT. I'M NOT
10 EXACTLY SURE WHY. FIRST OF ALL, WHEN SOME PEOPLE HAVE
11 MENTIONED LAND AREA. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT
12 BUILDABLE LAND AREA. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I WAS A MINORITY
13 VOTE ON, IS NOT FACTORING IN AREAS THAT ARE HIGH FIRE RISK,
14 BECAUSE YOU CANNOT BUILD IN THOSE AREAS NOW, BASED ON SOME OF
15 THE STUFF THAT'S BEEN HAPPENING WITH PG&E, AND IN HIGH
16 HILLSIDES AND STUFF LIKE THAT. BUT WHAT I'M GOING TO NEED, I'M
17 LEANING MORE TOWARDS THE BOTTOMS UP TOWARDS THE BLUEPRINT. BUT
18 FOR ANY OF THESE OPTIONS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT, I
19 THINK IT'S PERSONALITY -- IMPORTANT FOR US TO HAVE AN
20 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IT MEANS TO EACH OF THE JURISDICTION, SO
21 THE CHART THAT'S IN THE APPENDIX WERE VERY HELPFUL FOR ME TO
22 UNDERSTAND WHAT THOSE ELEMENTS DID TO THAT PARTICULAR
23 COMMUNITY, AND I STUDIED IN CITIES ALL OVER THE BAY AREA
24 WHETHER THEY WERE BIG CITIES OR MIDDLE SIZED CITIES OR SMALL
25 CITIES, AND SO SOME OF THE IMPLICATIONS FOR THOSE CITIES WOULD

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SET THEM UP TO FAIL, ABSOLUTELY. AND I DON'T THINK THAT ABAG
2 SHOULD BE ANY PART OF THAT, IN MY OWN OPINION. BUT I'M GOING
3 TO NEED MORE DETAILED INFORMATION. EXACTLY WHAT ARE THE
4 OPTIONS, AND MAKE IT SO CLEAR THAT IT SHOULD -- THERE SHOULD
5 NOT BE ANY QUESTIONS IN OUR MINDS WHAT THAT OPTION MEANS. LIKE
6 I NEVER REALLY UNDERSTOOD WHAT OPTION ONE WAS AND OPTION TWO
7 AND HOW IT RELATED TO THE DISCUSSION POINT. MAYBE I'M SLOWER
8 THAN MOST. BUT ALSO THE PRESENT THING I DON'T THINK WE ALL
9 VOTED FOR THAT, AND I'M -- I DON'T -- AND THERE IS NO
10 EXPLANATION WITH THAT, WHAT THE FACTORS ARE, IN ANY OF THIS
11 MATERIAL. SO I THINK YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REMIND SOME OF US
12 IF THAT OPTION IS STILL IN THERE, WHAT THAT INCLUDES, AND,
13 AGAIN, WHAT IT MEANS TO EACH OF THE JURISDICTIONS AND THAT'S
14 WHY I FOUND THE CHART TO BE VERY HELPFUL. AND IF I THINK OF
15 ANYTHING ELSE, I GUESS I E-MAIL IT TO GILLIAN AND ELI. IS THAT
16 WHAT I DO?

17

18 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** THAT WORKS. OR YOU CAN E-MAIL RHNA AT THE
19 PACIFIC EDGE AND WE'LL COMBINE ALL YOUR E-MAIL.

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** DOES GILLIAN AND ELI HAVE A PREFERRED --

22

23 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** I THINK THEY MIGHT HAVE A SLIGHT PREFERENCE FOR
24 YOU E-MAILING RHNA AT THE PACIFIC EDGE SO WE CAN PULL ALL OF
25 THE E-MAILS TOGETHER.

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** YOU CAN HAVE FRED SEND THAT E-MAIL OUT BECAUSE I
3 WANT TO MAKE SURE IT GETS TO THE RIGHT E-MAIL. SHIP YES. WE'LL
4 PUT IT IN THE CHAT AS WELL.

5

6 **PAT ECKLUND:** NOT EVERYBODY IS ON CHAT.

7

8 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** OKAY. ANYTHING ELSE PAT?

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** THAT'S IT I'M GOING TO NEED SOME MORE TIME TO
11 TALK TO MY COLLEAGUES AND STAFF.

12

13 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** OKAY.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** AND SOME OTHER IDEAS.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS ELISE, I CAN'T FIGURE OUT HOW TO RAISE MY
18 HAND WITH THE TECHNOLOGY I'M USING.

19

20 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** SURE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I ASKED ELI IF WE HAD ANY WAY TO USE, IF THAT PLANNED
23 BAY AREA WAS SOMEHOW IN ONE OF OUR TOOLS AND I THINK IT WOULD
24 BE HELPFUL IF THERE IS A WAY THAT WE COULD HAVE THAT IN A TOOL
25 SO WE CAN KIND OF SEE HOW IT COULD PLAY OUT AS IS THERE A

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 METHODOLOGY, OR THE BASELINE I THINK THAT MIGHT BE INTERESTING
2 TO SEE IF THAT'S NOT IMPOSSIBLE TO DO. THANKS.

3

4 **AMBER SHIPLEY:** GREAT. SO I'M -- I JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
5 SOMETHING THAT PAT SAID ABOUT HOW THIS WAS VERY CONFUSING. AND
6 THIS IS VERY CONFUSING. THIS IS A REALLY COMPLICATED PROCESS.
7 IT'S A REALLY COMPLICATED ISSUE, AND IT MAKES SENSE THAT WE'RE
8 ALL DIGESTING INFORMATION AND WE NEED MORE TIME. AND THIS BODY
9 HAS COME TOGETHER TO HELP MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS ON A VERY
10 COMPLICATED THING AND WE'RE REACHING A POINT NEXT MONTH WHERE
11 YOU HAVE TO MAKE THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS I WOULD URGE YOU AGAIN
12 TO LOOK AT SLIDE 19, ON GILLIAN'S PRESENTATION. DISCUSSION
13 QUESTIONS THAT'S WHERE WE'RE GOING TO COME TO YOU NEXT MONTH,
14 LIKE, HOW SHOULD YOU USE THE BLUEPRINT, WHAT'S THE INCOME
15 APPROACH THAT YOU RECOMMEND, AND WHAT'S THE BASELINE THAT YOU
16 RECOMMEND. WE HAVE TO MOVE TOWARDS THAT DECISION POINT. NOT
17 TODAY. NOW WE HAVE GOTTEN ALL THE NOTES FROM CHAT AND THIS
18 CONVERSATION AND WE CAN CREATE SPACE AND DIALOGUE FOR
19 DISCUSSION THAT YOU'RE ASKING FOR WHEN WE COME TOGETHER IN
20 AUGUST AND I FEEL LIKE WITH THAT, BECAUSE WE'RE OVER OUR TIME
21 AND WE HAVE A BUNCH OF PEOPLE WANTING TO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT,
22 ENDING THIS AGENDA ITEM, AND MOVE ON TO THE NEXT.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU AMBER. WE DO NEED TO TAKE
25 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AND THEN HAVE NON-AGENDA PUBLIC

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 COMMENT AFTER THAT. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM SIX B FURTHER
2 DISCUSSION OF THE RHNA INCOME ALLOCATION METHODOLOGY. IF YOU
3 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE.
4 EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS ERIN ECKHOUSE GO AHEAD.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** ERIC E FROM CALIFORNIA YIMBY P I HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT
9 THE EVALUATION METRICS AND PARTICULARLY THE NUMBER, THE
10 PERCENTAGE OF ALLOCATION WITHIN A JURISDICTION, RATHER THAN
11 TOTAL QUANTITY. I KNOW THAT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS BEEN RAISED
12 AS A CONCERN BY MEMBERS OF HMC IN THE PAST AS WELL AS IN
13 PUBLIC COMMENT. IF SOMETHING COULD HAPPEN LIKELY WITH THE
14 SOLANO COUNTY QUESTION WHERE YOU HAVE A LARGE SHARE OF SMALLER
15 OVERALL NUMBER WHICH WOULD MISLEADINGLY SUGGEST THERE HAS BEEN
16 EFFECTIVE ALLOCATION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO A JURISDICTION
17 WHEN IN FACT IT'S JUST A SMALL DENOMINATOR FACTOR. SO I THINK
18 IT'S MORE IMPORTANT THAT WE BE ALLOCATING LARGE QUANTITIES OF
19 AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO EXCLUSIONARY AREAS THAN LARGE
20 PERCENTAGES, AND I KNOW THERE'S A FACTOR THAT REFLECTS THAT
21 WITH THE COMPARISON TO THEIR REGIONAL HOUSEHOLD SHARE OF THE
22 ALLOCATION, I REALLY ENCOURAGE MORE FACTORS THAT FOCUS ON
23 TOTAL QUANTITY RATHER THAN A PERCENTAGE OF THE ALLOCATION AND
24 JURISDICTION IT RECEIVES.

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU NEXT SPEAKER IS STEVEN BUSS GO
2 AHEAD.

3

4 **HI STEVEN BUSS CALLING FROM SAN FRANCISCO AGAIN ALSO A NUMBER**
5 **OF YIMBY ACTION HERE IN THE CITY. THERE -- I WAS CONFUSED**
6 **AROUND THE METRICS. IT SOUNDED LIKE YOU WERE -- THE STAFF**
7 **PRESENTER WAS PRESENTING THEM AS A TRADEOFF, YOU EITHER GET A**
8 **LOT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING OR YOU GET A LOT OF MARKET RATE**
9 **HOUSING, AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE, WHEN YOU ARE**
10 **CONSIDERING THIS, YOUR DECISION, THAT HIGH COST AREAS NEED**
11 **BOTH A TON OF MARKET RATE HOUSING, AND SUBSIDIZED HOUSING.**
12 **BECAUSE AS YOU KNOW, THE ONLY WAY TO LOWER THE MARKET PRICE IS**
13 **TO DELIVER A LOT OF MARKET RATE HOUSING. AND WE ALSO NEED TO**
14 **PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE WHO CAN'T AFFORD THE MARKET**
15 **RATE PRICE SUBSIDIZED HOUSING. SO PLEASE FOCUS -- PLAN FOR A**
16 **LOT OF BOTH MARKET RATE HOUSING AND SUBSIDIZED HOUSING IN HIGH**
17 **COST AREAS. ALSO AS A SECOND POINT, I DISAGREE WITH THE COLORS**
18 **YOU USE ON THE MAP YOU SHOULDN'T USE RED FOR HIGH GROWTH. YOU**
19 **SHOULD USE GREEN.**

20

21 **>>CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS NOAH HAUS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** NOAH HMM SPEAKING ALTERNATE HMC FROM COTATI. I HAVE
24 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU TO HMC AND STAFF YOU GUYS ARE DOING A LOT
25 OF WORK THAT WE NEED. THIS IS A DIFFICULT MEETING FOR ME.

July 9, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 GOING BACK TO THE FIRST MEETING I ATTENDED WAS IN 2019, THERE
2 HAS BEEN A CONSISTENT PUSH BACK AGAINST USING THE BLUEPRINT,
3 AND I THINK A LOT OF OUR TIME KEEPS GETTING TAKEN UP WITH
4 DISCUSSIONS OF SHOULD WE USE THE BLUEPRINT OR NOT. AND SO I
5 THINK WE NEED TO GET THAT OFF THE TABLE VERY QUICKLY AT THE
6 NEXT MEETING PLEASE WITH MORE TIME TO THE COMPLETE AND LESS
7 TIME TO STAFF'S KIND OF -- AND I'M GOING TO USE THE TERM SALES
8 PITCH AND I'M NOT TRYING TO DISPARAGE ANYONE BUT PLEASE GIVE
9 US TIME TO DISCUSS IT AND DECIDE QUICKLY ON THAT AND MOVE ON
10 FROM IT BECAUSE IT'S BEEN A RECURRING THEME AND EATING UP A
11 LOT OF TIME. PART OF THE THEME YOU'RE SEEING WITH THE PUSH
12 BACK ON THE BLUEPRINT IS NONE OF OUR EXTERIORS HAVE USED THAT
13 DATA IT'S KIND OF APPLES AND ORANGES AND WE'RE SPENDING TIME
14 USING HOUSEHOLD BASELINE DATA AND THEN WE GET THIS PITCH AS TO
15 WHY WE NEED TO USE THE BLUEPRINT IT CONFUSES THE DISCUSSION
16 AND WE NEED ON GET IT DECIDED. I WOULD ECHO JAMES PAP AS'S
17 LAST TWO COMMENTS FROM NEYSA AND JEFF. JUST CONCUR WITH THOSE.
18 AND EXISTING HOUSEHOLD DATA USED AS A BASELINE IS CRITICAL
19 BECAUSE IT HIGHLIGHTS THE EXISTING PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE TRYING
20 TO SOLVE FOR WITH THESE ALLOCATIONS. THE BLUEPRINT IS A 30
21 YEAR GROWTH MODEL WHEREAS RHNA IS AN EIGHT YEAR BASELINE
22 APPLICATION APPLES AND ORANGES AND GETTING BACK TO MY POINTS I
23 ALREADY MADE. -- I WOULD IDENTIFY THAT THE HOUSING CRESCENT
24 WAS ONE OF THE TOP THREE CHOICES OF HMC DURING THE LAST IN-
25 PERSON MEETING THAT WE HELD, AND THEN FINALLY I WOULD SUPPORT

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THE BOTTOM UP APPROACH OR THE JOBS HOUSING APPROACH USING 2019
2 HOUSEHOLD AS THE BASELINE. THANK YOU.

3
4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU SIR. ROBERT FRUCKMAN, GO AHEAD.

5
6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD EVENING. JUST COMMENTING AGAIN. SO, I'M CALLING
7 FROM SAN FRANCISCO I THINK I WAS PREVIOUSLY CONFUSED ABOUT
8 WHICH CONCEPT A PREFER AND I THINK NOW I PREFER THE 2019
9 BASELINE NOT PLANNED BAY AREA BASELINE BOTTOM UP SHIFT
10 APPROACH IN THE APPENDIX IT'S CLEAR WE GET A LOT MORE HOUSING
11 USING THE 2019 HOUSEHOLD BASELINE. LIKE, IF I -- IF WE USE THE
12 BOTTOM UP THREE X APPROACH WITH THE 2019 HOUSEHOLDS SAN
13 FRANCISCO WOULD RECEIVE AROUND 85,000 HOMES IN THIS NEXT CYCLE
14 NOW IF YOU COMPARE THAT TO LAST DECADE'S JOBS HOUSING BALANCE
15 WE HAD 200 JOBS AND 25,000 HOMES BUILT 85,000 IS NOT EVEN HALF
16 OF OUR GAP IN THE JOBS THAT WE ADDED AND HOMES THAT WE ADDED.
17 IT'S REALLY NOT GREAT BUT IT'S THE BEST OF THE BAD OPTIONS
18 THAT I BELIEVE WE HAVE. SO THANK YOU.

19
20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU SIR. NEXT SPEAKER IS ANNA
21 DRISCOLL. GO AHEAD.

22
23 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M ANNA D SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF COMMUNITY
24 ENTERPRISE PARTNERS I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK SUPPORT FOR RHNA
25 METHODOLOGY FOR FAIR HOUSING BY USING 2019 HOUSEHOLDS AS THE

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BASELINE RATHER THAN THE BLUEPRINT AND BY IMPLEMENTING THE
2 BOTTOM UP APPROACH WE MUST ACKNOWLEDGE RACISM AND POLICIES
3 THAT CONTINUE TO IMPACT THE BAY AREA HOUSING SYSTEM WE NEED TO
4 DELIVER ON STATUTORY OBJECTIVES AND DELIVER HOUSING.
5 ENTERPRISE SUPPORTS CONTINUING TO USE THE 2019 DISTRIBUTION OF
6 HOUSEHOLDS SINCE PBA AND RHNA FUNCTION ON TWO DIFFERENT
7 TIMELINES AND SCALES WE BELIEVE IT ALLOWS A STARTING POINT TO
8 CONTRIBUTE HOUSING WHILE MAINTAINING CONSISTENCY. AND WE
9 SUPPORT A BOTTOM UP METHODOLOGY RATHER THAN INCOME SHIFT
10 APPROACH WE FIND THIS APPROACH BEST ENABLES US TO FINE TUNE
11 THE METHODOLOGY AND ADVANCE GOALS OF PROVIDING ACCESS TO
12 AFFORDABILITY AND PREVENTING DISPLACEMENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SIDAK KAPUR.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO ECHO POINTS ANNA JUST MADE. AS YOU KNOW,
17 ONE, THE REQUIREMENTS FROM SB28 IS IN THE ALLOCATION PROCESS
18 WE HAVE TO FOLLOW FURTHERING AFFIRMATIVE FAIR HOUSING AND
19 USING THE BLUEPRINT METHODOLOGY WHICH ITSELF BAKES IN LOTS OF
20 ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHAT CITIES WILL WANT TO UPZONE WHERE PDAS
21 ALREADY EXIST, THAT BASELINE IS NOT NEUTRAL IT WOULD HURT FAIR
22 HOUSING. AND THAT'S BASED ON THE STATUS QUO OF WHAT CITIES --
23 [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] GO AGAINST THE -- YEAH.
24 IT MIGHT BE A VIOLATION OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK YOU.

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SAM DEUTCH.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SAM D. I WORK IN SAN FRANCISCO I AM
4 CALLING IN SUPPORT FOR THE 2019 BASELINE AND ALSO MENTION
5 SOMETHING THAT HASN'T BEEN TALKED ABOUT MUCH WHICH IS CLIMATE.
6 AND IF WE FOCUS AND CONCENTRATE DEVELOPMENT ALONG WITH THOSE
7 SPECIFICALLY RATHER THAN FURTHER INLAND AND THE SOUTH BAY IT
8 WILL ALLOW PEOPLE TO LIVE IN A MORE TEMPERATE CLIMB AND
9 THEREFORE NEED TO USE LESS ENERGY FOR HEATING AND GAS WHICH
10 WOULD HELP FURTHER OUR CARBON RUCK REDUCTION GOALS AND SUSTAIN
11 THE RHNA NUMBERS SHOULD BE BIGGER GIVEN EVERYTHING THIS'S
12 GOING ON AND HOW AFFLUENT THE BAY AREA IS AND HOW MANY PEOPLE
13 WANT TO LIVE HERE THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KYLE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I'LL CALLING IN SANTA CRUISE BUT I WORK IN LOS GATOS.
18 I THINK, FOR ME ONE OF THE BIG ASPECTS FOR ABAG IS THAT IF LOS
19 GATOS DOES NOT BUILD WHERE LOS GATOS HAS A BIG ISSUE FOR JOBS
20 HOUSING IMBALANCE WITH BEING ONE OF THE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS
21 WHERE THERE SHOULD BE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THE SUBSIDIZED
22 HOUSING AS WELL AS MARKET RATE NEEDS TO HAPPEN IN LOS GATOS
23 ESPECIALLY AS NETFLIX OTHER AND COMPANIES THERE CONTINUE TO
24 BUILD MANY PEOPLE TO COME TO WORK MR. IT'S BARISTAS OR GROCERY
25 STORE WORKERS THEY ALL COME DOWN THE COAST TO SALINAS THERE IS

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 NOT ENOUGH HOUSING THERE. AND LOBBYING FOR AMBAG MAKING SURE
2 THEY'RE DOING THEIR PART.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES ATTENDEES WITH
5 PUBLIC COMMENT. NO PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE SUBMITTED FOR THIS
6 ITEM.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES THIS ITEM.
9 LAST ITEM IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA.
10 AND IF ATTENDEES WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON A NON-AGENDA MATTER
11 THIS'S WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF HMC PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND
12 OR PRESS STAR NINE AND EACH SPEAKER WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS STEVEN BUSS, GO AHEAD.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANKS, STEVEN BUSS AGAIN FROM YIMBY ACTION IN
17 SAN FRANCISCO. JUST TO FINISH THE THOUGHT I HAD FROM MY LAST
18 COMMENT. IT'S NOT RELATED TO THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION. IT
19 SAYS GENERAL ONES. ABOUT THE COLORS THAT YOU CHOOSE FOR THE
20 MAPS THAT Y'ALL GENERATE, I REALLY THINK YOU SHOULDN'T USE RED
21 TO INDICATE HIGH GROWTH BECAUSE IT'S -- IT IMPLIES TO THE
22 VIEWER THAT IT'S A BAD THING THAT ANY HOUSING GROWTH IS
23 NECESSARILY BAD. OBVIOUSLY THAT'S NOT THE CASE. AND I THINK
24 THE COLOR CHOICES YOU MAKE REALLY INFORM HOW PEOPLE LOOK AT
25 AND UNDERSTAND THE GRAPHICS PRODUCED. SO I REALLY THINK YOU

July 9, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SHOULD EITHER CHOOSE TOTALLY NEUTRAL COLORS OR FRAME GROWTH AS
2 A GOOD THING RATHER THAN A BAD THING, LIKE I SAID USE GREEN
3 FOR GROWTH OR USE SHADES OF GRAY FOR DARK BEING -- LIGHT GRAY
4 BEING LOW GROWTH. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KYLE KELLY. GO AHEAD.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I'LL ADD ON FOR THE COLORS THE PALATE YOU SHOULD USE
9 IS VIRIDIS. IT'S USEFUL FOR THOSE WHO ARE COLOR-BLIND AND WILL
10 ALLOW YOU TO HAVE A PALATE THAT'S NOT -- IT DOESN'T HAVE THE
11 SAME KINDS OF ASSOCIATIONS. IT GOES FROM YELLOW TO PURPLE.
12 ANYWAY LOOK IT UP. IT'S CALLED VIRIDUS. THANKS.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.
15 THERE WERE TEN E-MAILS AND IT'S POSTED ONLINE AND LEDGE STAR.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES NON-AGENDA
18 PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH FOR YOUR ATTENDANCE
19 AND PARTICIPATION TODAY, AND I AGREE THAT WE SHOULD MAKE A
20 DECISION AT THE BEGINNING OF OUR NEXT MEETING ON ARE WE USING
21 THE BLUEPRINT OR NOT SO WE CAN GO FROM THERE. AND THANK YOU TO
22 OUR FACILITATOR. THERE WAS A LOT OF USEFUL INFORMATION ABOUT
23 THE INFORMATION YOU NEED OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS. NEXT MEETING
24 OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE IS ON AUGUST 13TH AND
25 WITH THAT THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

July 9, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1