



# **Association of Bay Area Governments**

**Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961**

## **Adobe Acrobat Reader**

### **Finding Words**

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

#### **To find a word using the Find command:**

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:  
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

#### **To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:**

Choose Edit > Find Again

Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.

(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

### **Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application**

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

**Note:** *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

### **To select and copy it to the clipboard:**

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1                               **ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS**

2                               **REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE**

3                               **THURSDAY, JULY 16, 2020, 1:00 PM**

4

5   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THIS IS THE JULY 2020  
6 ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING. WE DON'T YET HAVE A  
7 QUORUM. BUT I AM GOING TO BRING THE MEETING TO ORDER BY  
8 ANNOUNCING TODAY JULY 16TH, 2020. AGENDA SAYS JULY 1ST THAT  
9 WAS THE INTENT. IN LIGHT OF GOVERNOR NEWSOM'S STATE OF  
10 EMERGENCY DECLARATION REGARDING THE COVID-19 OUTBREAK AND IN  
11 ACCORDANCE WITH EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY GOVERNOR  
12 NEWSOM ON MARCH 17, 2020 AND THE GUIDANCE FOR GATHERINGS  
13 ISSUED BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH, THE  
14 MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND  
15 ZOOM FOR COMMITTEE, COMMISSION, OR BOARD MEMBERS WHO WILL  
16 PARTICIPATE IN THE MEETING FROM INDIVIDUAL REMOTE LOCATIONS.  
17 THE AGENDA IS POSTED. COMMITTEE MEMBERS, YOU ARE WELL VERSED  
18 ON ZOOM PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND. AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
19 IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK USE THE RAISED HAND OR IF YOU ARE DIALING  
20 IN DIAL STAR NINE, AND MR. CASTRO AND I WILL MANAGE YOUR  
21 PUBLIC COMMENTS. WITH THAT M CASTRO WOULD YOU CALL THE ROLL,  
22 PLEASE?

23

24   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, MA'AM. I'M CHECKING OUR COMMITTEE  
25 MEMBER LIST. NOW I'LL CONDUCT A ROLL CALL FOR THE REGIONAL

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PLANNING COMMITTEE. COUNCILMEMBER ADAMS? ABSENT. MAYOR

2 ARREGUIN?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR EZZY ASHCRAFT?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RICK B?

11

12 **RICK BONILLA:** PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CAMPOS? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CANEPA?

15

16 **DIR. DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MS. KATHLEEN CHA?

19

20 **KATHLEEN CHA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ?

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

25

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR DIANE DILLON? IS ABSENT. MAYOR  
2 PRO TEMPORE EKLUND? MAYOR EKLUND, YOU ARE MUTED, BUT I SEE YOU  
3 THERE. COUNCILMEMBER NEYSA FILGOR?

4

5 **NEYSA FILGOR:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR SCOTT HAGGERTY? ABSENT.

8 SUPERVISOR HANCOCK?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR NATHAN MILEY IS ABSENT.

13 SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

14

15 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR PIERCE?

18

19 **JULIE PIERCE:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBIT? SUPERVISOR RAMOS IS  
22 ABSENT. MR. MATT REGAN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR KATIE RICE IS  
23 ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CARLOS ROMERO?

24

25 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MARK ROSS?

3

4 **DIR. MARK ROSS:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. GREG SCHARFF IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER  
7 SCOTT SEDGLEY?

8

9 **SCOTT SEDGLEY:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR SPERING?

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MS. SONJA TRAUSS?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I AM PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR LORI WILSON?

20

21 **LORI WILSON:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

24

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** FRED, THIS IS SUPERVISOR BROWN. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU  
2 CALL MY NAME BUT I'M HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOT YOU. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF, THIS IS  
5 FRED, QUORUM IS PRESENT.

6

7 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GREAT WE DO HAVE A QUORUM. WE'LL GO IN  
8 THE ORDER OF AGENDA. FIRST ITEM TWO, CALLING FOR PUBLIC  
9 COMMENT. FOR ANY MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE WHO WOULD LIKE TO  
10 SPEAK UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY ITEM NOT ON THE AGENDA. I  
11 SEE A HIGHLIGHTED NUMBER 415883 CALLER, DID YOU --

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** KAREN, THAT'S ME PAT EKLUND.

14

15 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY GOOD. HI PAT.

16

17 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH. I HAVE TO DO BY PHONE AND BY VIDEO.

18

19 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY THAT'S FINE. THERE IS YOUR NAME.  
20 OKAY GREAT. FRED, I DON'T SEE ANYONE, DO I HAVE ANY PUBLIC  
21 COMMENTS OR DID ANYONE SEND ANYTHING IN PRIOR TO OUR MEETING.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO SUBMITTED COMMENTS BY E-MAIL AND I SEE  
24 NO ATTENDEES WITH RAISED HANDS FOR THIS ITEM.

25



July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** MOVING TO ITEM THREE WHICH IS THE  
2   CHAIR'S REPORT. THIS IS TO DISCUSS AND TAKEN ACTION ON  
3   CONCLUDING THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE SUBCOMMITTEE. AS  
4   MANY OF YOU MAY RECALL SEVERAL YEARS AGO, THERE WERE THREE  
5   SUBCOMMITTEES PUT TOGETHER ON A VARIETY OF ISSUES, ONE OF  
6   WHICH WAS A HOUSING SUBCOMMITTEE. AND NOW AS WE'RE MOVING  
7   FORWARD, AND THE CONCEPT OF CREATING A HOUSING COMMITTEE  
8   STANDING ON ITS OWN, WHICH IS ACTUALLY MEETING RIGHT AFTER  
9   THIS, IT SEEMED APPROPRIATE THAT WE NOT HAVE TWO COMMITTEES  
10   DOING THE SAME WORK. IT'S GOING TO TAKE STAFF TIME AND ALL OF  
11   YOUR TIME TO PARTICIPATE, WHO ARE ON THAT COMMITTEE, AND SO I  
12   AM RECOMMENDING, TO THIS BODY, THAT WE DISBAND THE HOUSING  
13   SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE. IS THERE A  
14   SECOND?

15

16   **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SECOND.

17

18   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. HAGGERTY. IS THERE ANY  
19   DISCUSSION?

20

21   **CARLOS ROMERO:** THIS IS CARLOS ROMERO, JESSE YOU GO FIRST. I  
22   SEE YOUR HAND.

23

24   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** JESSE, GO AHEAD.

25

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1   **JESSE ARREGUIN:** AS CHAIR MITCHOFF NOTED, THE HOUSING COMMITTEE  
2   WILL BE A STANDING COMMITTEE AND WE'RE WORKING WITH  
3   PARTNERSHIP WITH MTC ON ASSEMBLY BILL 1487 AND THE BAY AREA  
4   HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AS WELL AS HOUSING POLICY ISSUES  
5   AND, AROUND HOMELESSNESS. AND I HAD A CONVERSATION WITH VICE  
6   MAYOR ROMERO PRIOR TO THIS MEETING WHICH HE MAY ALSO ADDRESS  
7   AROUND CONTINUING THE PRACTICE OF HAVING NON-ELECTED  
8   PARTICIPATION ON THE NEW HOUSING COMMITTEE. AND SO I'LL BE  
9   DISCUSSING WITH MS. MCMILLAN AND BRINGING FORWARD A SUGGESTION  
10   THAT WE HAVE SOME EX-OFFICIO NEW MEMBERS ON THIS HOUSING  
11   COMMITTEE TO CONTINUE A STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION IN THIS  
12   PROCESS.

13

14   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MR. ROMERO?

15

16   **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES MAYOR ARREGUIN STOLE MY THUNDER. WE  
17   CERTAINLY DISCUSSED IT AND HAD A CONVERSATION WITH STAFF ABOUT  
18   EFFICIENCY AND CONVERSATIONS WITH THE CHAIR OF ABAG MAYOR  
19   ARREGUIN, AGAIN, I AM -- WE ARE IN CONCURRENCE TO THE EXTEND  
20   THAT WE CAN BROADEN EXESTENTIAL MEMBERS ON THE OTHER COMMITTEE  
21   THAT WOULD BE GREAT. I DID THINK IF POSSIBLE, OF THE NON-  
22   ELECTED MEMBERS WHO ARE ON THAT COMMITTEE, IF I MAY, PAUL  
23   CAMPOS, PAUL P, MATT REGAN, RODNEY NICKENS AND MELISSA WHO'S  
24   LAST TIME IN I'M FORGETTING, I WANT TO THANK THEM FOR THEIR

July 16, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ACTIVE PARTICIPATION AND I APPRECIATE THEIR INPUT IN THE  
2 HOUSING COMMISSION.

3

4 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** MAYOR ASHCRAFT?

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I AM IN SUPPORT. SUGGESTIONS RAISED BY  
7 MAYOR ARREGUIN AND VICE MAYOR ROMERO, SO CAN THE MOTION BE  
8 MODIFIED IF THAT IS ACCEPTABLE.

9

10 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** WHAT DID YOU WANT TO MODIFY IT TO?

11

12 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** WITH THE DIRECTION THAT CONTINUE TO  
13 HAVE SOME NON-ELECTED EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS OF THE MEMBERS OF THE  
14 ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** I BELIEVE THAT'S ALREADY BEEN MADE FROM  
17 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN WHEN WE DID IT AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE  
18 COMMITTEE IS THAT CORRECT JESSE?

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE WILL BE DOING THAT. I APPRECIATE THE  
21 SUPPORT MAYOR ASHCRAFT AND THAT IS SOMETHING WE'LL SUBMIT FOR.

22

23 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** PUTTING THE CART BEFORE THE HORSE HERE.

24

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1   **JESSE ARREGUIN:** ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD HAS TO ADD SEATS TO THE  
2   COMMITTEE SO YOU HAVE MY COMMITMENT THAT WE'LL DO THAT.

3

4   **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THAT'S IT FOR ME.

5

6   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** NO RAISED HANDS. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

7

8   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO HANDS FROM ATTENDEES AND NO WRITTEN  
9   COMMENTS RECEIVED.

10

11   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. WITH THAT MAY I HAVE A ROLL CALL  
12   VOTE ON THE ACTION, MR. CASTRO?

13

14   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. -- MARK L?

15

16   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** IS HE ON THE CALL? HE'S MY STAFF MEMBER  
17   WITH COUNTY PUBLIC WORKS.

18

19   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I THOUGHT I SAW HIM. MAYBE HE'LL COME UP.  
20   [ROLL CALL - CONTINUED]. MOTION PASSES.

21

22   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. CASTRO. MOVING TO ITEM  
23   FOUR. ONE ITEM ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR MINUTES FROM MAY 6TH,  
24   2020 MEETING. ANY COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, EDITS ON THAT FROM ANY  
25   COMMITTEE MEMBERS?

July 16, 2020



Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **JULIE PIERCE:** PIERCE MOVES.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HAGGERTY SECONDS.

5

6 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO TEND ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED

9 AND NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** CALL ROLL ON THE VOTE, PLEASE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES.

14

15 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** NEXT ITEM IS THE INFORMATIONAL ITEM. BE

16 PRESENTED BY DAVE VAUTIN. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD AFTERNOON DAVE

17 VAUTIN WITH MTC ABAG PLANNING TEAM AND PROJECT MANAGER. HAPPY

18 TO BE HERE TODAY TO SHARE THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT

19 BLUEPRINT FINDING. I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE WORK WE'RE SHARING

20 TODAY REFLECTS THE JOINT EFFORT ACROSS THE REGIONAL PLANNING

21 TEAM MTC ABAG PLANNING TEAM TO DO A LOT OF REALLY CHALLENGING

22 LONG RANGE PLANS WORK DURING THE DIFFICULT CIRCUMSTANCES OF

23 COVID-19 SHELTER-IN-PLACE PERIOD. PRESENTATION TODAY

24 REPRESENTS THE OUTCOME OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. YOU WILL

25 RELEVANCE IN FEBRUARY MTC BOARD DIRECTED STAFF TO STUDY

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 STRATEGIES FOR TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ECONOMY, AND  
2 ENVIRONMENT. ALONG WITH A SET OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR  
3 HOUSING AND JOBS TO UNDERSTAND HOW THEY ADVANCE REGIONAL  
4 HOUSING GOALS AND THESE ARE THE REGIONAL FOUNDATION OF THE  
5 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. THE DRAFT IS THE FIRST DRAFT OF PLANNED BAY  
6 AREA 2050 AND AN OPPORTUNITY TO REFLECT ON STRATEGY REVISIONS  
7 AND MAKE IMPROVEMENTS PRIOR TO THE FINAL DRAFT BLUEPRINT THIS  
8 FALL. I'M GOING TO ASK STAFF TO PULL UP THE PRESENTATION.  
9 THANK YOU. IT'S IMPORTANT TO MENTION THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF  
10 DISCUSSION OF MAJOR TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AS PART OF THE  
11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS WE KNOW THIS IS ONE PIECE OF THE  
12 PUZZLE WE COMPLAINT ACHIEVE REGIONAL GOALS FOR GHG, EQUITY AND  
13 THE LIKE WITHOUT A BROADER SET OF STRATEGIES THAT INTEGRATE  
14 TOGETHER HOUSING TRANSPORTATION ECONOMIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL  
15 ACTION. THESE ARE GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL IN THE MONTHS AHEAD AS  
16 WE LOOK TOWARDS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND WORK TOWARDS ACHIEVING  
17 SB 375 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION EFFORTS. WITH ALL OF THAT IN  
18 MIND LET'S JUMP INTO THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
19 SPEAKING OF THE TIMELINE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THIS GRAPH  
20 HIGHLIGHTS A HIGHLIGHT OF JUNCTURE EFFORT REGIONAL HOUSING  
21 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AFTER TWO YEARS OF HORIZON INITIATIVE  
22 FOLLOWED BY ROBUST STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT IN THE FALL AND  
23 WINTER WE HAVE COMPLETED UNNECESSARY FOR THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT.  
24 SINCE THIS IS A MAJOR MILESTONE TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS A BIT  
25 LONGER THAN USUAL AND I ASK FOR YOUR INDULGENCE. PRESENTATION



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 IS IN FOUR CHUNKS. FIRST I'LL TALK ABOUT THE PROCESS TO DATE  
2 AND THE STRATEGIES ANALYZED. SECOND I'LL HIGHLIGHT THE  
3 FORECASTED OUTCOMES FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. THIRD WE'LL  
4 EXPLORE HOW WELL THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MEETS THE GUIDING  
5 PRINCIPLES AND THE DRAFT AND FINALLY WE'LL TURN TO NEXT STEPS.  
6 NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. THE WORK OF THE HORIZON INITIATIVE IS  
7 MORE TIMELY THAN EVER WE STRESS TESTED STRATEGIES THAT HAVE  
8 BEEN INTEGRATED INTO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AGAINST THREE VERY  
9 DIFFERENT FUTURES THESE FUTURES WERE DEFINED LIKE FORCES LIKE  
10 RISING TELECOMMUTING AND E-COMMERCE AND THE STRATEGIES THAT  
11 MADE THE CUT FOR THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DECISIONS WERE MADE  
12 BASED UPON RESILIENCY AND EQUITY BENEFITS. THIS WAS REALLY A  
13 GREAT OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLORE HOW DIFFERENT FORCES DIFFERENT  
14 REGIONAL TRAJECTORIES COULD AFFECT THE REGION'S FUTURE AND HOW  
15 WE COULD RESPOND AND MORE IMPORTANTLY ESPECIALLY IN THE COVID-  
16 19 ENVIRONMENT HOW TO PIVOT WHEN THE SITUATION CHANGES. NEXT  
17 SLIDE. OF COURSE WHEN CREATING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE MUST  
18 ADHERE TO STATE AND FEDERAL REGULATIONS. STATE AND FEDERAL  
19 AGENCIES APPROVE THE FINAL PLAN THIS INCLUDES TAKING A BEST  
20 GUESS AT EXTERNAL FORCES RECOGNITION THE FUTURE IS HIGHLY  
21 UNCERTAIN. WE DON'T DO THIS ALONE. WE DO IT IN CONCERT WITH  
22 THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD AS KEY REGULATOR OF THE  
23 LONG RANGE PLAN. THIS FOLLOWS MANY ASSUMPTIONS BUT THE BOTTOM  
24 LINE I WANT TO UNDERSCORE IT OFTEN MAKES IT HARDER TO ACHIEVE  
25 THE REGIONAL VISION FROM GAS PRICES TO GROWS INCOME AND



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 EQUALITY AND GREATER SHARE OF THE WEALTHY THOSE TRENDS NEED  
2 MORE DRIVING AND MORE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION. TELECOMMUTING  
3 TO WORK WITH CARB TO INCREASE THE SHARE OF OFFICE WORKERS  
4 WORKING FROM HOME IN THE FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. FOLLOWING ON THE  
5 EXTERNAL FORCES, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCORPORATES THESE 25  
6 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN,  
7 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT.  
8 ULTIMATELY THIS IS AN INTEGRATED PROPOSAL RECOGNIZING THAT THE  
9 PAST PLANS FOCUS ON TRANSPORTATION ISN'T ENOUGH TO GET US  
10 TOWARD THE BRIGHTER FUTURE. THOSE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS I  
11 MENTIONED ARE A SMALL BUT IMPORTANT PIECE OF THE PUZZLE  
12 BUNDLED TOGETHER WITH OTHER TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES, HOUSING  
13 STRATEGIES, ECONOMIC STRATEGIES, AND ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES.  
14 THINGS LIKE ROADWAY PRICING, DENSIFYING AROUND TRANSIT HUBS  
15 AND HIGH RESOURCE COMMUNITIES AND PROTECTING CRITICAL SEGMENTS  
16 OF SHORE LINES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE PLAY A CRITICAL ROLE IN THE  
17 REGION'S FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. YOU HAVE SEEN THIS MATERIAL  
18 BEFORE, BUT WE WANT TO REFRESH ON WHAT IT MEANS TO MEET A  
19 STRATEGY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. A STRATEGY IS A PUBLIC  
20 POLICY OR SET OF INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED NOT OVER  
21 THE NEAR TERM BUT OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS. THEY'RE NOT  
22 LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS EITHER. THEY ARE CONCEPTS THAT CAN BE  
23 INCORPORATED AT DIFFERENT LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT TO BRING ABOUT  
24 A BRIGHTER FUTURE FOR THE BAY AREA. IMPORTANTLY THE PLAN MUST  
25 BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED WHICH MEANS WE CAN'T INCLUDE EVERY



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 STRATEGY OR GET TO ALL OF OUR GOALS. WE DO NEED TO IDENTIFY  
2 THE POTENTIAL FUTURE REVENUE SOURCES TO PAY FOR SOME OF THESE  
3 BOLD IDEAS. NEXT SLIDE. EVEN BEFORE THIS POINT IN THE PROCESS  
4 WE HAVE ENGAGED WITH THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS IN FALL  
5 2019 WE GOT 13,000 COMMENTS THAT HELPED INFORM OUR VISION  
6 FORWARD STRATEGIES TO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. REMARKABLY 90  
7 PERCENT OF THE COMMENTS SUPPORTED STRATEGIES THAT WE WILL BE  
8 SHOWING TODAY. IN THE HORIZON INITIATIVE WE INTERACTED WITH  
9 TENS OF THOUSANDS MORE PEOPLE ON STRATEGIES THAT HAVE GONE  
10 INTO THREE YEARS OF HONING TO GET TO THIS POINT. NEXT SLIDE.  
11 YOU MAY RECALL THE 25 STRATEGIES FROM FOLLOW, WHEN WE  
12 PRESENTED THIS MATERIAL PREVIOUSLY. THERE IS AN ATTACHMENT IN  
13 YOUR PACKET THAT WALKS THROUGH ALL 25 OF THE STRATEGIES BUT I  
14 WANT TO QUICKLY RUN THROUGH THEM HERE CLUSTERED UNDER NINE  
15 CATEGORIES. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDES STRATEGIES TO  
16 MAINTAIN AND OPTIMIZE EXISTS INFRASTRUCTURE INCLUDING  
17 STRATEGIES RELATED TO PRICING OUR REGION'S HIGHWAYS. IT  
18 INCLUDES STRATEGIES TO CREATE HEALTHY AND SAFE STREETS BY  
19 REBUILDING LOCAL ARTERIALS MAKING THEM SAFER, CHANGING SPEED  
20 LIMITS AND ALSO BUILDING PROTECTED CYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN  
21 INFRASTRUCTURE. LASTLY IN TRANSPORTATION THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
22 CREATES A SHORT LIST OF TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS TO DESIGN OUR  
23 LOCAL AND REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THIS STRATEGY WILL BE  
24 EXPANDED IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING THE  
25 DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDES A SUITE OF STRATEGIES THAT TOUCH ON



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ALL THREE PS. PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION, AND PROTECTION. AND IT  
2 WORKS TO SPUR HOUSING PRODUCTION INCLUDES COMMUNITIES ACROSS  
3 THE BAY AREA AND PROTECT PRESERVE AND PRODUCE MORE DEED  
4 RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WHEN IT COMES TO THE ECONOMY,  
5 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ATTEMPTED TO IMPROVE ECONOMIC MOBILITY  
6 THROUGH STRATEGIES LIKE CHILD CARE SUBSIDIES AND INCUBATOR  
7 PROGRAMS FOR NEW BUSINESSES AS WELL AS STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE  
8 JOBS TO RELOCATE TO HOUSING RICH AREAS IN THE REGION -- OFFICE  
9 DEVELOPMENT. YOU WILL SEE IN A MINUTE THESE STRATEGIES PROVE  
10 UNSUCCESSFUL IN SHIFTING JOBS FROM THE MAJOR CLUSTER IN SOUTH  
11 BAY AND SILICON VALLEY. LASTLY, THE BLUEPRINT INCLUDES  
12 STRATEGIES ON THE ENVIRONMENT. THE FIRST REGIONAL PLANNED BAY  
13 AREA JUST UNDER \$20 BILLION PACKAGE OF SEA LEVEL RISE  
14 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVES FROM LEVIES AND RESTORATION TO PROTECT  
15 ALL OF OUR VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE TO  
16 RETROFIT AGAINST EARTHQUAKES AND INVESTING IN PARKS AND OPEN  
17 SPACE AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST ELECTRIFYING OUR TRANSPORTATION  
18 SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE THE STRATEGIES WERE APPROVED IN  
19 FEBRUARY AND YOU MAY ASK HOW OUR CURRENT REGIONAL NATIONAL AND  
20 GLOBAL CHALLENGES WITH COVID-19 AFFECT THEM. PLANNED BAY AREA  
21 2050 IS A 30 YEAR PLAN AND THE IMPACT FROM COVID-19 AND  
22 RECESSION WILL BE MOST SIGNIFICANT IN NEXT 5 TO 10 YEARS.  
23 SECOND WHILE WE DIDN'T STUDY A PANDEMIC IN HORIZON WE STUDIED  
24 MANY FORCES ARE COMING ALONG WITH IT, HIGH LEVELS OF  
25 TELECOMMUTING WITH TRANSIT PROJECTS TO MAKE SURE THEY MADE



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SENSE IN A WORLD WITH HIGH TELECOMMUTES AND A BOOMING GROWTH  
2 CYCLE WITH THE RISING TIDES FALLING FINANCES FUTURE WHICH  
3 SHOWED HOUSING STRATEGIES ARE ESSENTIAL REGARDLESS OF OUR  
4 REGION'S ECONOMIC BOOM AND BUST CONDITIONS. SOME OF THE  
5 STRATEGIES SEEM MORE TIMELY NOW IN THE PANDEMIC ERA THINGS  
6 LIKE BICYCLE IMPROVEMENTS THAT MAY BE NECESSARY IN A WORLD  
7 WHERE TRANSIT HAS REQUIREMENTS, AND PROTECTIONS FOR RENTERS  
8 WHO ARE WORRIED ABOUT BEING DISPLACED DURING THE CRISIS  
9 FUNDING FOR ESSENTIAL WORKERS CHILD CARE SUBSIDIES AND  
10 PROTECTIONS OF MUCH NEEDED OPEN SPACE WHICH I THINK WE ALL  
11 VALUE AS WE'RE SPENDING SO MUCH MORE TIME COOPED UP AT HOME.  
12 NEXT SLIDE. ANOTHER KEY ASPECT OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WERE THE  
13 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES EXPANDED TO ENCOURAGE MORE GROWTH IN HIGH  
14 RESOURCE AREAS. YOU WILL SEE THE MAP ON THE RIGHT SHOWS  
15 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS KEY BUILDING BLOCKS OF PRIOR  
16 PLANNED BAY AREAS AND EXPANDED GROWTH AREAS HIGHLIGHTED IN  
17 ORANGE AND BLUE THAT HELPS TO FURTHER MOVE US TOWARDS CLIMATE  
18 AND EQUITY GOALS COMPARED TO THE PRIOR PLAN. AGAIN, WE'RE  
19 CONTINUING TO PROTECT AREAS OUTSIDE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES AS  
20 WELL AS UNMITIGATED HIGH HAZARD AREAS IN ALL OF THIS LAND USE  
21 MODELING. NEXT SLIDE. WHILE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS LESS  
22 ORIENTED TOWARDS THE FINANCIAL AND INVESTMENT ASPECT OF PRIOR  
23 PLANS, AS IT IS MORE OF A STRATEGY ORIENTED PLAN TO ADVANCE  
24 THE REGION IT STILL MUST BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED AND THIS SEW  
25 PARTICULARLY ESSENTIAL IN THE WORLD OF TRANSPORTATION WHERE



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THERE ARE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS. YOU WILL SEE A BREAK DOWN  
2 FOR EACH ELEMENT OF THE PLAN INCLUDING ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT NEW  
3 REGIONAL REVENUES THAT ARE ESSENTIAL TO MAKE PROGRESS  
4 IDENTIFIED IN THE PRESENTATION. AND IN TOTAL IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
5 NOTE MORE THAN \$200 BILLION IN REVENUES FOR ALL AREAS WOULD BE  
6 NEEDED TO MAKE KEY HEADWAY HERE. THERE IS A FEW CAVEATS HERE  
7 BUT MOST IMPORTANT FOR THIS COMMITTEE IS TO HIGHLIGHT  
8 HIGHLIGHT THE CAVEAT TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WHILE THERE IS  
9 ROBUST MONEY IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT THERE IS STILL ENORMOUS  
10 GAP IN NEEDS AND ASSESSMENT OF 3 TO \$400 BILLION. WE'RE  
11 OCCURRING HOW TO ADDRESS THIS IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, THAT  
12 WILL BE KEY DISCUSSION. THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY ON HOW WE  
13 SLICE THE PIE FOR EACH OF THE AREAS BUT IT'S ESSENTIAL TO  
14 REMEMBER THAT IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO SLICE THE PIE DIFFERENTLY LOW  
15 COST AND NO COST STRATEGIES ESPECIALLY IN PLACES LIKE HOUSING  
16 CAN AUGMENT OUR FINANCIAL INVESTMENT SUPERVISOR OFTEN MAKE  
17 MUCH MORE HEADWAY. NEXT SLIDE. YOU MAY BE WONDERING HOW WE  
18 FORECAST THE OUTCOMES FOR THESE STRATEGIES. THAT'S NEVER BEEN  
19 MORE DIFFICULT THAN IN THE UNCERTAIN WORLD WE LIVE IN TODAY.  
20 WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND HOW WE CAN FURTHER  
21 REFINE STRATEGIES GOING FORWARD. WE DO IT BY TAKING BASELINE  
22 DATA AND INCORPORATE BEING THE STRATEGIES OF THE GROWTH  
23 GEOGRAPHIES APPROVED FOR ANALYSIS BY THE BOARD IN FEBRUARY. WE  
24 THEN RUN THIS THROUGH A SERIES OF ECONOMIC AND LAND USE MODELS  
25 FOR OUTCOMES AND POTENTIAL REGIONAL GROWTH PATTERNS AND THAT'S

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 WHAT WE HAVE RELEASED HERE IN JULY. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT ARE  
2 THE POTENTIAL OUTCOMES OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT? OF COURSE I  
3 WANT TO UNDERSCORE HERE THE FACT THAT WE LIVE IN SUCH  
4 UNCERTAIN TIMES. WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND  
5 THE POTENTIAL OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL START WITH THE GOOD  
6 NEWS. DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS THE FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA THAT MAKES  
7 HEADWAY ON OUR REGION'S UNAFFORDABILITY CRISIS. IN 2015 THE  
8 AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD SPENT 57 PERCENT OF THEIR TAKE HOME PAY ON  
9 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION, MUCH HIGHER THAN SOME OTHER  
10 PLAYERS IN THE UNITED STATES. WITH THE HOUSING STRATEGIES, AND  
11 THE 1.5 MILLION NEW HOMES, MANY OF THEM AFFORDABLE, IN THE  
12 DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE'RE ABLE TO DRIVE THAT DOWN TO 48 PERCENT OF  
13 HOUSEHOLD INCOME BY 2050 AND WHILE STILL HIGH IT'S A  
14 MEANINGFUL IMPROVEMENT COMPARED TO PAST PLANS AND CURRENT  
15 CONDITIONS. IN FACT THOSE GAINS ARE GREATER FOR LOW INCOME  
16 HOUSEHOLDS THANKS TO DIRECT INVESTMENT IN AFFORDABLE HOMES  
17 OVER 20,000 THROUGH 2050 AND HOMES LOCATED WITHIN WALKING  
18 DISTANCE OF TRANSIT WE'RE ABLE TO BRING A SHARE OF BAY AREA  
19 HOMES WITHIN A QUICK WALK OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FROM 30  
20 PERCENT IN 2015 TO 43 PERCENT IN 2050. NEXT SLIDE. LET'S TURN  
21 TO THE ENVIRONMENT NOW. WHAT DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DO ON  
22 THAT FRONT? OUR ACTIONS TO MAKE OUR LOCAL STREETS ARTERIALS  
23 AND HIGHWAYS SAFER WOULD ENABLE US TO SAVE 1500 LIVES THROUGH  
24 2050. WHILE NOT ENOUGH TO GET US TO ZERO FATALITIES A  
25 MEANINGFUL STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND MORE EFFORT COULD

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BE CONSIDERED THROUGH BOLDER ACTION IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.  
2 WHEN IT COMES TO THE RESILIENCE TO HAZARDS INCORPORATION OF  
3 SEA LEVEL RISE AND EARTHQUAKE PROTECTION FOR THE FIRST TIME IN  
4 PLANNED BAY AREA ENSURES THAT 98 PERCENT OF HOMES AT RISK OF  
5 SEA LEVEL RISE WOULD BE PROTECTED BY THE SYSTEM OF LEVIES AND  
6 OTHER SORTS OF INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WE DISCUSSED EARLIER AND  
7 THAT 100 PERCENT OF HOMES AT HIGH RISK OF DESTRUCTION AND  
8 EARTHQUAKE WOULD BE RETROFITTED. AND LASTLY SIGNIFICANT  
9 REVENUES NEEDED TO FUND THESE STRATEGIES, THE REVENUES  
10 GENERATED ENABLE US TO HELP LOW INCOME RESIDENTS INCLUDING  
11 WITH THE CHILD CARE SUBSIDIES AND OTHER PROGRAMS TO ADVANCE  
12 EQUITY GOALS AND ALLOW US TO REINVEST IN HOUSING  
13 INFRASTRUCTURE ALL CONTRIBUTING TO ECONOMIC GROWTH IN THE BAY  
14 AREA. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE HERE SHOWS THE REGIONAL GROWTH  
15 FORECAST WHICH NOW INTEGRATES ALL OF THE COVID-19 AND  
16 RECESSION IMPACT OF THE 2019 PERIODS. YOU WILL NOTE THE DRAFT  
17 BLUEPRINT INCLUDES HOMES OVER THE LIFESPAN AND 40 MILLION JOBS  
18 IN BASELINE CONDITIONS. ONE NEW HOME FOR EVERY NEW JOB WHICH  
19 IS ESSENTIAL FOR US TO ADDRESS THE JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE THAT  
20 HAS LONG EXISTED IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL SHOW BREAK  
21 DOWNS ON THE COUNTY LEVEL. PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 SHOWN ON THE  
22 LEFT AND THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ON THE  
23 RIGHT. NEW HOUSEHOLDS IN EACH COUNTY. A FEW OBSERVATIONS HERE.  
24 FIRST YOU WILL NOTICE THE BUBBLES ON THE RIGHT SIDE FOR  
25 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE GENERALLY LARGER THAN THOSE ON THE



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 LEFT SIDE, THAT'S A REFLECT OF THE GREATER AMOUNT OF TOTAL  
2 REGIONAL HOUSING GROWTH IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. ALSO NOTE  
3 THE SHARED GROWTH IN THE SOUTH BAY IS SIGNIFICANTLY LARGER  
4 THAN THE LAST PLAN. SOMEWHAT SMALLER GROWTH IN EACH BAY AND  
5 SAN FRANCISCO, SIMILAR LEVELS OF GROWTH IN MANY OF THE OTHER  
6 COUNTIES IN TERMS OF THE SHARE. IN MOST COUNTIES THE TOTAL  
7 NUMBER OF UNITS IS EITHER EQUIVALENT OR HIGHER THAN THE LAST  
8 PLAN. YOU WILL NOTE FROM KEY STATISTICS FROM THE LOWER LEFT OF  
9 EACH GRAPHIC IT SHOWS SLIGHTLY LESS GROWTH IN THE THREE CITIES  
10 SAN JOSE OAKLAND, AND BAYSIDE COMMUNITIES THAT TOUCH SAN  
11 FRANCISCO BAY, AND RELATIVELY COMPARABLE INLAND. SHARED GROWTH  
12 IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS IS ALSO REDUCED AS GROWTH IS  
13 MORE DISTRIBUTED TO OTHER TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS  
14 WHICH HELP US GET TO THOSE CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS. NEXT  
15 SLIDE.

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I CAN ASK A QUESTION ON THIS SLIDE? >DAVE  
18 VAUTIN: SURE.

19

20 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** DAVE, I HAVE NEVER NOTICED THIS BEFORE.  
21 [LAUGHTER] -- I MEAN, I HATE TO SAY THIS, I ALWAYS LOOKED AT  
22 THIS AND I THOUGHT IT WAS LIKE SANTA CLARA COUNTY. BUT THAT 44  
23 PERCENT, 2015 DRAFT BLUEPRINT, THAT'S SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY.  
24 >DAVE VAUTIN: IN TERMS OF THE TOTAL NUMBER OF JOBS COMPARABLE  
25 TO THE TOTAL OF SAN JOAQUIN?

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** NOPE I'M JUST TRYING TO ASK YOU. I'M  
3 FEELING A LITTLE BIT CHALLENGED RIGHT NOW MAYBE BECAUSE I HAVE  
4 HO ENDLESS DISCUSSIONS OF COVID TODAY. 44 FOR, WHAT IS THAT?  
5 WHAT COUNTY IS THAT?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SANTA CLAIR. >DAVE VAUTIN: YES. THAT'S SANTA  
8 CLARA.

9

10 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. WHEN I  
11 ASKED THE QUESTION I THOUGHT MAN, MAYBE I AM WRONG. GOOD TO  
12 KNOW. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: NO PROBLEM. SO JUST TO SET THE  
13 STAGE FOR THIS SLIDE, THIS IS A SIMILAR BREAK DOWN FOR JOBS  
14 BASED ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 VERSUS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. YOU  
15 WILL SEE A TREND WITH GREATER SHARE OF GROWTH AGAIN IN THE  
16 SOUTH BAY AREA COMPARED TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2040. WHILE THERE  
17 WERE SOME BENEFITS OF OUR JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE STRATEGY THAT  
18 TRIED TO SHIFT JOBS TO MORE HOUSING RICH COMMUNITIES NOTABLY  
19 ADDING GROWTH IN CENTRAL AND SOUTHERN COUNTIES AS THEY APPLIED  
20 TO JOB RICH COMMUNITIES ULTIMATELY THIS DOES NOT LEAD TO A  
21 SIGNIFICANT SHIFT OF JOBS OUT OF THE JOB RICH SANTA CLARA  
22 AREA. WE WERE MUCH MORE SUCCESSFUL IN OUR HOUSING STRATEGY OF  
23 BRINGING HOUSING CLOSER TO JOB CENTERS THAN WE WERE  
24 ENCOURAGING EMPLOYERS TO LOCATE JOBS ELSEWHERE. IN A WORLD OF  
25 GREATER TELECOMMUTING THIS REFLECTS WHERE THE CUBICLE OR



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 OFFICE IS FOR TYPICAL OFFICE WORKERS. MANY WORKERS DON'T HAVE  
2 TO GO TO THE OFFICE EVERY DAY OF THE WEEK BUT THE JOB SITES  
3 CONTINUE TO CLUSTER IN THE SOUTH BAY IN PARTICULAR. WHEN WE  
4 THINK ABOUT THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE THINK ABOUT FURTHER  
5 STRATEGIES ADVANCING IN ORDER TO SHIFT THE LOCATION OF JOBS.  
6 NEXT SLIDE. LET'S LOOK AT TRANSPORTATION FOR A MOMENT. ON THE  
7 LEFT YOU WILL SEE A BREAK DOWN OF MODAL CHOICES FOR COMMUTING  
8 IN 2015. ON THE RIGHT YOU WILL SEE THE 2050 BLUEPRINT  
9 CONDITIONS. WE'RE FORECASTING ROUGHLY A 17 PERCENT REDUCTION  
10 IN AUTO MODE SHARE THANKS TO GROWING USE OF TELECOMMUTING  
11 INCREASED BICYCLING AND INCREASED USE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
12 THANKS TO LAND USE AND TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES. THIS IS A  
13 MEANINGFUL SHIFT IN BOTH COMMUTER MODE CHOICES. NEXT SLIDE.  
14 WHEN IT COMES TO SEA LEVEL RISE, YOU SEE A BREAK DOWN HEREOF  
15 WHERE THE BENEFITS ARE ACCRUING FROM THE SEA LEVEL RISE  
16 PROTECTIONS INCLUDED IN THE PLAN THE NETWORK OF LEVIES AND  
17 OTHER INFRASTRUCTURE I TALKED ABOUT, THE 90 PERCENT, YOU CAN  
18 SEE WITH THE BUBBLE SIZE THERE WHERE THE NUMBER OF HOMES THAT  
19 ARE AT RISK FROM FLOODING. THESE ACTIONS, IN TOTAL, TOTAL  
20 ABOUT \$18 MILLION OF INVESTMENTS I WANT TO MAKE SURE  
21 COMMUNITIES WHICH ARE OFTENTIMES COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN OR KEY  
22 GROWTH AREAS ARE PROTECTED. 2,000 HOUSING UNITS WOULD REMAIN  
23 AT RISK AND THOSE ARE AREAS WHERE IT MAY BE APPROPRIATE TO  
24 CONSIDER STRATEGIC RETREAT. ON OTHER FRONTS THE SET OF  
25 IMPROVEMENTS IN TERMS OF SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECT 100,000 ACRES



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 OF MARSH LAND TO EXPAND MARSHES IN SAN FRANCISCO BAY AND  
2 PROTECT FROM FLOODING OR ACTIONS TO MITIGATE OR ELEVATE  
3 TRANSPORTATION NETWORKS TO ENSURE ALL MAJOR HIGHWAY AND RAIL  
4 CORRIDORS ARE PROTECTED AT TWO FEET OF SEE LEVEL RISE IN 2050.  
5 BEYOND 2050 IS TACKLING INCREASING SEA LEVEL RISE AFTER 2050.  
6 NEXT SLIDE. ONE KEY AREA FOR THE PLAN IS TO ADVANCE TOWARDS  
7 FEES FOR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS TARGETS FOR CARS AND LIGHT  
8 DUTY TRUCKS FOR STANDARDS ESTABLISHED BY THE STATE OF  
9 CALIFORNIA THIS TARGET HAS BEEN 15 PERCENT PER PERSON BY THE  
10 YEAR 2035 BUT IN 2019 THE STATE INCREASED THE TARGET TO 19  
11 PERCENT PER PERSON. LAST ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA BARELY  
12 HIT THE 15 PERCENT TARGET BUT CONDITIONS OUTSIDE OF THE  
13 PLANNING ENVIRONMENT THINGS LIKE DEMOGRAPHICS OR THE COST OF  
14 GASOLINE HAVE CONTINUED TO EVOLVE. SO IF WE SIMPLY READOPTED  
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 TODAY WE ANTICIPATED ITS BENEFITS WOULD  
16 DWINDLE TO A MERE ONE TO FOUR POINTS OF GHG REDUCTION, LEAVING  
17 A SIGNIFICANT A GAP. SEVEN POINTS WOULD BE REMAINING TO MEET  
18 THE NEW TARGET. THIS WILL BE A KEY DISCUSSION AREA AS WE MOVE  
19 INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GIVEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDED NO  
20 MAJOR HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS THOSE STRATEGIES WHICH ARE UNDER  
21 CONSIDERATION FOR INTEGRATION WITH THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IT MAKE  
22 THIS GAP BIGGER. WHAT STRATEGIES CAN WE BRING TO BEAR TO CLOSE  
23 THE GAP. TRANSPORTATION MONEYS WOULD FLOW TO OTHER REGIONS OF  
24 CALIFORNIA LIKE LOS ANGELES IF THE BAY AREA FAILS TO SOLVE  
25 THIS PROBLEM THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. THIS



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BRINGS ME TO THE THIRD PART OF THE PRESENTATION. HOW DOES THE  
2 DRAFT BLUEPRINT ALIGN WITH THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES ADOPTED BY  
3 ABAG AND MTC BOARD? NEXT SLIDE. FIRST OF ALL I SHOULD NOTE THE  
4 DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES EXCEL OUR ACTIONS IN THE FUTURE,  
5 FUTURE GROWTH, FUTURE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS, FUTURE  
6 CLIMATE PROTECTIONS, ARE MORE EQUITABLE AND MORE RESILIENT  
7 THAN PAST GENERATIONS HOWEVER MANY WRONGS OCCURRED IN THE 20th  
8 INDUSTRY AND RIGHTING THOSE WRONGS REQUIRES BOLD ACTION ON ALL  
9 FRONTS. NEXT SLIDE. YOU WILL FIND MANY MORE DATA POINTS THAN  
10 WE HAVE TIME TO COVER TODAY IN ATTACHMENT C, ALSO POSTED ON  
11 [PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/BLEUPRINT](http://PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/BLEUPRINT). I'LL HIGHLIGHT TEN EVALUATION  
12 QUESTIONS, TWO FOR EACH OF THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES TO GIVE YOU  
13 A FLAVOR OF WHERE THE BLUEPRINT IS ACHIEVING THE GOALS LAID  
14 OUT BY THE BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKES THE  
15 BAY AREA MORE AFFORDABLE. FIRST DO RESIDENTS SPEND LESS ON  
16 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. WE COVERED THIS PREVIOUSLY THE  
17 ANSWER IS YES AND THE REDUCTION IS GREATER FOR LOWER INCOME  
18 HOUSE HOLDS WHICH ARE DISPROPORTIONATELY HURTING. IT'S A  
19 MEANINGFUL STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. MEANS-BASED TOLLS  
20 INCLUDED INTO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ARE MITIGATED IN EQUITY  
21 IMPACTS ASSOCIATED WITH TOLLING. AND MEANS-BASED FARES CREATE  
22 REDUCTION OF COST BURDENS. SECOND WILL THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
23 SERVE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING? THE ANSWERS IS YES IT PRODUCES  
24 400,000 MORE UNITS SHORT OF THE REGIONAL NEED. WHILE  
25 PROTECTING DEED RESTRICTED UNITS AND PRODUCING UNITS TO

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ACCOMMODATE FUTURE LOW INCOME HOUSING GROWTH WHICH WILL OCCUR  
2 IN THE WORLD OF CONTINUED INCOME EQUALITY THERE IS STILL  
3 THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS THAT WOULD NEED LOW INCOME  
4 DEED RESTRICTED UNITS KEY CHALLENGE NUMBER ONE FOR THE FINAL  
5 BLUEPRINT WILL BE HOW DO WE PRODUCE MORE AFFORDABLE HOMES IN  
6 THE REGION WITH WELL RESOURCED SCHOOLS AND OTHER AMENITIES.  
7 NEXT SLIDE. SECOND, DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKE THE BAY AREA  
8 MORE CONNECTED? 96ED BAG HERE. ANSWER IS YES FOR TRANSIT,  
9 BETTER ACCESS TO JOBS, PARTICULARLY FOR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN  
10 WHICH IS A KEY EQUITY AREA. THANKS TO THE BUS AND BART  
11 INVESTMENT IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND YET RISING TRAFFIC  
12 CONGESTION COMBINED TO A SECONDARY DEGREE WITH SPEED LIMIT  
13 POLICIES PLAY A ROLE IN AUTO REDUCTION. THERE'S A TRADEOFF  
14 THERE THAT WILL BE CONSIDERED IN THE FINAL DRAFT BLUEPRINT.  
15 RELIABILITY FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE MATERIALS I WOULD  
16 NOTE THE MEANS-BASED TOLL, SOMETIMES NOT ENOUGH TO MITIGATE  
17 IMPACTS OF ALL POPULATIONS. WITH MUNI, AC TRANSIT, AND BART,  
18 AND OTHER SYSTEMS SUCH AS CALTRAIN, ARE FORECASTED TO HAVE  
19 TRANSIT CROWDING CHALLENGES BY THE TIME WE GET TO 2050. KEY  
20 QUESTIONS HERE IS WHAT ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES INCLUDING  
21 STRATEGIES THAT ARE GOING TO BE CONSIDERED BY THE COMMISSION  
22 NEXT WEEK CAN HELP US BETTER ADDRESS TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND  
23 TRANSIT OVERCROWDING. NEXT SLIDE. DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
24 PROTECT OUR REGION'S DIVERSITY AND MAKE IT MORE DIVERSE IN THE  
25 FUTURE? WHAT WE'RE SEEING HERE ARE SOME CHALLENGE AREAS FOR



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 EQUITY T WHILE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS BECOME MORE INCLUSIVE THESE  
2 ARE PLACES THAT ARE OFTEN RACIALLY EXCLUSIVE IN PAST DECADES.  
3 IT WOULD REQUIRE ACTION TO ENSURE FOLKS CAN LIVE IN THOSE  
4 AREAS. TRANSIT-RICH AREAS ARE AT RISK OF GENTRIFICATION.  
5 THAT'S A KEY AREA TO EXPLORE GOING FORWARD IN TERMS OF  
6 STRATEGIES. AND BAY AREA RESIDENTS MAY NOT BE ABLE TO STAY IN  
7 PLACE OVER THE LONG-TERM EVEN WITH RENT PROTECTION POLICIES  
8 THINGS THAT EXIST TODAY IN SAN FRANCISCO BUT ARE NOW BEING  
9 STUDIED ACROSS THE REGION LOW INCOME RESIDENTS WOULD CONTINUE  
10 TO BE AT HIGH RISK OF DISPLACEMENT ESPECIALLY IN COMMUNITIES  
11 OF CONCERN.

12

13 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** DID WE LOSE YOU DAVE? OR IS IT JUST ME?

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** I THINK WE DID.

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** DAVE, WE LOST YOU.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH.

20

21 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** BUT I DON'T SEE THAT YOU'RE MUTED. SO.  
22 OKAY. HE'S CONNECTING TO AUDIO AGAIN. WE'LL GIVE HIM A MINUTE.  
23 NOW YOU NEED TO UNMUTE. THERE YOU GO. >DAVE VAUTIN: CAN YOU  
24 HEAR ME NOW?

25



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU DAVE. >DAVE VAUTIN:  
2   SORRY ABOUT THAT. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT WE'RE  
3   EXPLORING WHETHER THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKES THE BAY AREA  
4   HEALTHIER WHEN IT COMES TO ROADWAY SAFETY I NOTED GAINS IN  
5   TERMS OF SAVING LIVES BUT EXPANDED STRATEGIES WOULD BE NEEDED  
6   TO MAKE THE BAY AREA SAFER AND HEALTHIER FOR ALL USERS OF OUR  
7   TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PROTECTS HOMES AT  
8   RISK OF SEA LEVEL RISE THANKS TO INVESTMENTS IT HIGHLIGHTS  
9   IMPORTANCE OF SPENDING MONEY SO YOU DON'T HAVE TO REBUILD  
10   COMMUNITIES ELSEWHERE. DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKES THE BAY AREA  
11   HEALTHIER AND SAFER IN TERMS OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BUT  
12   IT DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH AND A MORE CONCERTED EFFORT MAY BE  
13   NECESSARY TO CLOSE THE SIZABLE REMAINING GAP THAT DEFINES THE  
14   FOURTH CHALLENGING FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. LASTLY  
15   WE'LL FOCUS ON THE REGION'S ECONOMY OF ECONOMIC VIBRANCY. ONE  
16   KEY CHALLENGE THAT WE'RE ASKED TO EXPLORE WAS BALANCE OF JOBS  
17   AND HOUSING. ANSWER HERE IS A BIT OF A MIX. WE'RE ABLE TO  
18   SHIFT MORE HOUSING CLOSER TO EXISTING JOB CENTERS BUT WEREN'T  
19   ABLE TO DO THE OPPOSITE IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. SILICON VALLEY  
20   AND SAN FRANCISCO BECOME MORE BALANCE IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
21   BUT EAST BAY AND NORTH BAY SEE MORE LIMITED JOB GROWTH. LASTLY  
22   BAY AREA THE BAY AREA BUSINESSES WILL THRIVE WITH SELECT  
23   INDUSTRIES AND EXPECT TO SEE ROBUST GROWTH. WHILE EXPERIENCING  
24   A RECESSION TODAY WE BELIEVE THE REGION IS POISED FOR AN  
25   ECONOMIC REBOUND OVER THE NEXT DECADE AND TAX MEASURES COULD

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1    ENABLE GAINS TO BE SHARED BY ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS. KEY  
2    CHALLENGE IS THINKING ABOUT HOW AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES COULD BE  
3    EMPLOYED TO CREATE BETTER JOBS THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NEXT  
4    SLIDE. THIS IS THE TIP OF THE ICEBERG IN TERMS OF THE  
5    STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT TO GET FEEDBACK ON THE FIVE CHALLENGES.  
6    THAT WILL BE THE FOCUS OF MANY PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDER  
7    WORKSHOPS ARE IN THE COMING WEEKS. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE DEVELOP  
8    SOLUTIONS IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO REMAIN COMMITTED ESPECIALLY  
9    AT THIS POINT IN TIME WHERE EQUITY IS THE FOREFRONT OF ALL OUR  
10   MINDS TO 11 TO AFFECTED COMMUNITIES DIRECTLY. WE HAVE ALREADY  
11   CONDUCTED FOCUS GROUPS IN MANY DIFFERENT BAY AREA COMMUNITIES  
12   TO LISTEN TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR  
13   ABOUT THEIR NEEDS FOR HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, AND THE LIKE.  
14   YOU CAN SEE SOME OF THEIR COMMENTS HERE ON THIS SLIDE. WE'LL  
15   BE BRINGING BACK A MORE COMPREHENSIVE REPORT ON THE ENGAGEMENT  
16   WE HAVE DONE THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN SEPTEMBER. I  
17   THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE. THIS IS THE FINAL LAST FEW SLIDES  
18   ON THE BLUEPRINT. THIS WAS A MAJOR MILESTONE FOR OUR LONG-  
19   RANGE PLANNING WORK AND WE'RE BEGIN BEING THE TRANSITION TO  
20   THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE LAST STEP BEFORE WE GO INTO EIR THIS  
21   FALL. WE'RE SEEKING INPUT. WE'RE INCLUDING INPUT FROM AS MANY  
22   BAY AREA COMMUNITIES AS POSSIBLE. WE'RE HOLDING NINE COUNTY  
23   SPECIFIC VIRTUAL WORKSHOPS FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS IN FOUR  
24   LANGUAGES THREE VIRTUAL STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS ON DIFFERENT  
25   AREAS OF TOPICS OF THE PLAN AND FOCUSED COMMUNITY-BASED

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ORGANIZATIONS. WE'RE ALSO HOLDING OFFICE HOUR OPPORTUNITIES  
2 FOR LOCAL JURISDICTION. WE SENT OUT FLYERS AND HAVE AN ONLINE  
3 SURVEY. WE HAVE DEVELOPED A VOICEMAIL LISTENING LINE IN FOUR  
4 DIFFERENT LANGUAGES. WE HAVE AN OFFICIAL COMMENT PERIOD FOR  
5 LETTERS AND E-MAILS STRETCHING THROUGH AUGUST 10TH AND A POLL.  
6 YOU WILL BE RECEIVING MANY FORMS OF OUTREACH FEEDBACK. WHEN IT  
7 COMES DOWN TO THIS, WHEN YOU SEE OUTCOMES THAT ARE NOT  
8 DESIRABLE, EQUITABLE OR RESILIENCE IT COMES DOWN TO MODIFYING  
9 STRATEGIES WE STARTED WITH, ADDING, REMOVING OR MODIFYING FOR  
10 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE INPUT WE  
11 RECEIVE. WE HAVE STARTED THE PROCESS WHEN WE THINK ABOUT THE  
12 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT THROUGH JEWEL AND JULY AND MORE WORK  
13 WILL CONTINUE TO BE DONE IN AUGUST. NEXT SLIDE. HERE ARE SOME  
14 OF THE UPCOMING MILESTONES. WE HOPE YOU CAN HELP US GET THE  
15 WORD OUT ABOUT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT NEXT MONTH AS WE DO  
16 ENGAGEMENT ACROSS THE REGION IN A VIRTUAL MANNER AND WE'LL BE  
17 BACK IN SEPTEMBER WITH AN UPDATE AND PROPOSAL FOR STRATEGY  
18 REFINEMENTS AND REVISIONS FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT THIS FALL.  
19 NEXT SLIDE. THAT WRAPS UP THE PRESENTATION FOR TODAY. THERE IS  
20 LOTS IN INFORMATION ON [PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG/BLEUPRINT](https://plannedbayarea.org/blueprint) AND I AM  
21 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY THERE. LET'S SEE. LET'S GO TO  
24 PARTICIPANTS. COME ON. ALL RIGHTY. I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS





MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 RAISED. I CAN'T BELIEVE THERE IS NO HANDS RAISED. MAYOR  
2 ASHCRAFT. FIRST ONE UP. GO AHEAD PLEASE. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I'M TRYING. OKAY.

5

6 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** YOU THERE GO.

7

8 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. EXCELLENT  
9 PRESENTATION. THANK YOU. A LOT OF EXCITING MATERIAL IN THERE.  
10 THIS IS MY CONCERN AND PERHAPS OTHERS. SO YOU MENTIONED, MR.  
11 VAUTIN, THAT YOU DIDN'T LOOK SPECIFICALLY DIDN'T STUDY THE  
12 IMPACT OF COVID-19, BUT DECIDED THAT IT WOULD BE SIMILAR TO  
13 OTHER CYCLES OF BUST AND BOOM THAT THE BAY AREA HAS BEEN  
14 THROUGH, AS FAR AS IMPACT ON ECONOMIES. I WOULD URGE THAT  
15 THERE BE SPACE IN THIS STUDY, IN THESE FORECASTS FOR INPUT  
16 FROM PUBLIC HEALTH EXPERTS, IF THAT HASN'T BEEN DONE, AND LEER  
17 WE ARE IN THE SHADOW OF UCSF WHERE SOME OF THE TOP MEDICAL AND  
18 EPIDEMIOLOGICAL MINDS ARE STUDYING, AND CONSULTING ON COVID-  
19 19. BECAUSE MY SENSE IS THAT WHILE THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC MAY  
20 BARE SIMILARITIES TO OTHER CRISES WE HAVE BEEN THROUGH, I  
21 THINK IN SOME WAYS THAT WE DON'T EVEN KNOW, IT IS VERY  
22 DIFFERENT. AND I AM CONCERNED THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT THE COVID-  
23 19 RECESSION IMPACTS FROM 2030 AT THIS TIME WHEN WE ARE STILL  
24 IN THE FIRST WAVE OF THIS PANDEMIC, AND WE CERTAINLY DON'T  
25 HAVE IT UNDER CONTROL. I'M ALWAYS THE OPTIMIST, AND I BELIEVE



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THAT TIME AND SCIENCE ARE ON OUR SIDE AND THAT WE'RE WORKING  
2 TOWARD -- OR SCIENCE IS WORKING TOWARDS BETTER THERAPEUTICS  
3 AND VACCINATIONS. BUT WE DON'T HAVE THEM YET. AND I DO THINK  
4 THAT THIS IS GOING TO CUT ACROSS SO MANY DIFFERENT THINGS.  
5 HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, THE WAY WE WORK, SO I WOULD JUST URGE  
6 THAT WE GO TO EXPERTS WHO COULD ACTUALLY BRING SUBJECT MATTER  
7 EXPERTISE TO THESE FORECASTS. THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS  
8 FOR THAT COMMENT AND IF I COULD OFFER A BRIEF RESPONSE. WE'LL  
9 BE CONSULTING WITH LOTS OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING  
10 PUBLIC HEALTH STAKEHOLDERS OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS WE  
11 EXPLORED PAST PANDEMICS, THE 1919 PANDEMIC THAT HIT THE BAY  
12 AREA, THE SPANISH FLU. AND WE CAN GAIN INSIGHT TO IMPACTS AND  
13 HOW THE REGION CAN REBOUND FROM THE PANDEMIC. WE ARE  
14 DEVELOPING AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR THE NEXT FIVE YEAR AND  
15 THAT WILL HAVE FOCUS ON THE PANDEMIC BECAUSE THOSE IMPACTS  
16 WILL BE OBVIOUS IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS AND THAT WILL BE THIS  
17 FALL THERE IS A LOT OF WAYS WE CAN TRYING TO WEAVE COVID-19  
18 INTO THE PLAN.

19

20 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I'M GLAD YOU'RE LOOKING BACK AT THE  
21 SPANISH FLU EPIDEMIC. I HAVE FAMILY MEMBERS THAT WERE LOST IN  
22 THAT PANDEMIC, BUT I ALSO THINK THE BAY AREA WAS QUITE A  
23 DIFFERENT PLACE 103 YEARS AGO. SO YOU'RE PROBABLY PLANNING TO  
24 INCLUDE THIS, BUT I WOULD CERTAINLY LIKE A STUDY OR ANALYSIS  
25 OF HOW LONG IT WILL TAKE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEMS TO BE UP

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AND RUNNING AGAIN. THOSE OF US WHO HAVE BEEN AT -- LIKE  
2 ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION MEETINGS AND OTHER  
3 PLACES HAVE HEARD SOME PRETTY DIRE, AS WE'RE HEARING AROUND  
4 THE REGION SOME PRETTY DIRE STATISTICS ABOUT HOW THESE SYSTEMS  
5 ARE BARELY HANGING ON. BUT, THANK YOU, IT -- I JUST URGE THAT  
6 BROADER LOOK. THANKS.

7

8 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MARILYN. PAT EKLUND.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** CAN YOU HEAR ME KAREN?

11

12 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** YES. GO AHEAD.

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** I HAVE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. DO YOU WANT ME TO  
15 DO THEM ALL AT THE SAME TIME?

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** FIRST QUESTION IS, I THOUGHT WE WERE GOING TO DO  
20 A STRATEGY ON TELECOMMUTING AND I DIDN'T SEE IT IN THE  
21 LISTING. SHOULD I WAIT FOR THE SPONSOR GO AHEAD AND DO MY  
22 COMMENTS? >DAVE VAUTIN: I CAN --

23

24 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD AND RESPOND DAVE THEN SHE CAN  
25 MAKE HER COMMENTS.



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY THANK YOU. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE HAVE WORKED  
3 CLOSELY WITH THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD TO ACCELERATE THE  
4 ADOPTION OF TELECOMMUTING IT'S AN EXTERNAL FORCE AT THIS TIME,  
5 FOLKS TELECOMMUTING HOWEVER WE WANT TO THINK ABOUT ADDITIONAL  
6 STRATEGIES THAT CAN PUSH THAT FORCE EVEN HIGHER THAT'S ONE OF  
7 THE AREAS OF THE BLUEPRINT WILL FOCUS ON BUT THAT'S NOT A  
8 SILVER BULLET JUST BECAUSE FOLKS ARE WORKING FROM HOME DOESN'T  
9 MEAN THEY'RE NOT TAKING OTHER AUTOMOBILE TRIPS. THEY STILL  
10 CONTRIBUTE GHGS BUT IT'S ANOTHER PIECE OF THE PUZZLE.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** I THINK TELECOMMUTING IS GOING TO AFFECT MORE  
13 THAN JUST TRANSPORTATION. OR THE COMMUTING PATTERN. I THINK  
14 IT'S GOING TO AFFECT WHERE AND HOW MANY JOB SITES THERE ARE.  
15 AND I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE IMPACTING THINGS ALL OVER THE  
16 MAP. AND SO WE'RE, IN A WAY, GOING TO HAVE TO REDEFINE WHAT WE  
17 DEFINE AS A JOB. BECAUSE IT MAY NOT BE A PARTICULAR LOCATION.  
18 BUT I HAVE BEEN READING SOME OF THE COMMENT LETTERS, AND  
19 LISTENING TO A LOT OF THE PEOPLE COMMENTING, AND I HAVE TO  
20 AGREE WITH COMMENTS MADE ABOUT CONCERNS WHAT WE'RE INCLUDING  
21 IN HERE AS 1.5 MORE HOUSING UNITS AND 1.4 MILLION MORE JOBS.  
22 BECAUSE I THINK COVID HAS REALLY CHANGED OUR LIVES FOR THE  
23 FUTURE. AND I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING BACK TO  
24 WHERE WE WERE. AND IN FACT I WAS TALKING TO AN ECONOMIST  
25 YESTERDAY WHO IS PREDICTING THAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE A LOT



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 LONGER FOR US TO COME OUT OF THIS THAN WHAT WAS ORIGINALLY  
2 ANTICIPATED. MY CONCERN IS, IS THAT THE STRATEGIES REALLY  
3 FOCUS ON LOWER CLASS AND LOWEST AFFORDABILITY. I THINK THE  
4 MISSING MIDDLE HAS NEVER REALLY BEEN ADDRESSED. AND WHEN THE  
5 MISSING MIDDLE MOVED OUT, THEN I THINK THAT PROVIDES, YOU  
6 KNOW, MORE HOUSING FOR THE LOWER FOLKS WHEN THEY CAN MOVE UP,  
7 BUT WE NEED MORE MIDDLE -- MIDDLE HOUSING, YOU KNOW, FOR THE  
8 MISSING MIDDLE, IN MY OPINION. AND I HEARD THE COMMENT LAST  
9 TIME ABOUT TOLL LANES ON ALL THE FREEWAY LANES, AND I WAS  
10 SHOCKED TO SEE THAT IS ONE OF THE STRATEGIES. I CAN'T IMAGINE  
11 HAVING TO PAY A TOLL TO GO FIVE MILES ON THE FREEWAY TO GO  
12 HELP MY MOM. AND SO I -- IF THAT'S -- I DON'T THINK THAT'S  
13 GOING TO BE WELL ACCEPTED IF PEOPLE KNOW THAT IT'S IN THERE.  
14 AND I HAVE ASKED SEVERAL PEOPLE THAT HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING, THIS  
15 DID YOU SEE THAT STRATEGY AND THEIR ANSWER WAS NO. SO I AM  
16 CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. BECAUSE A LOT OF PEOPLE IN CALIFORNIA  
17 FEEL AS THOUGH THEY HAVE ALREADY PAID FOR THE FREEWAYS OR ARE  
18 PAYING IT THROUGH THEIR GAS TAXES OR THROUGH THEIR INCOME  
19 TAXES. I REALLY THINK THAT THERE IS AN ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM  
20 THAT WE HAVEN'T ADDRESSED AND I THINK I RAISED THIS ABOUT FIVE  
21 OR SIX YEARS AGO IS THAT THE BAY AREA HAS A SHARING CAPACITY  
22 FOR JOBS AND HOUSING AND PEOPLE BASICALLY. AND WHAT IS THAT  
23 CARING CAPACITY? I WOULDN'T HAVE A CLUE. I WOULDN'T KNOW HOW  
24 TO EVALUATE THAT. BUT THIS'S SOMETHING WE HAVE TO START  
25 LOOKING AT THAT BECAUSE YOU CAN'T KEEP GROWING AND GROWING AND



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 GROWING AT THAT LEVEL WITH THE REACHES OF WATER. FUNDING I  
2 THINK YOU'RE PROJECTING IS NOT ATTAIN BELIEVE. SO THE 400,000  
3 PERMANENT AFFORDABLE HOMES, THAT'S GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF  
4 MONEY. AND I REALLY DON'T KNOW WHERE THAT'S GOING TO COME  
5 FROM. AND I CONTINUE TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT THE HOUSING  
6 METHODOLOGIES SO FAR TO NOT USE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS THE  
7 MEANS OF DISTRIBUTING THE RHNA, AND INSTEAD TO USE THE CURRENT  
8 PATTERNS OF 2019. AND I RAISED THIS QUESTION LAST TIME ABOUT  
9 AN ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS AND WHAT THAT WOULD DO WITH OUR  
10 GREENHOUSE GAS PROJECTIONS AND WANTING TO MEET THE 19 PERCENT  
11 TARGET BUT THIS WOULD EXASPERATE THAT TARGET. I REALLY THINK  
12 WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT THAT MORE SO WE CAN HAVE THAT  
13 DISCUSSION AT THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE, AND THIS  
14 COMMITTEE AS WELL AS THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. AND LASTLY, I  
15 THINK THERE IS TOO MUCH EMPHASIS ON HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. AND  
16 THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. AND EVENTUALLY I'LL BE PUTTING SOME OF  
17 THESE IN WRITING.

18

19 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU PAT. SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY, I  
20 SAW YOUR HAND RAISED, AND NOW IT'S NOT. DID YOU WANT TO NOT  
21 SPEAK AFTER ALL?

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** WELL, I WAS AFRAID I HAD ANOTHER STUPID  
24 QUESTION.

25



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1   **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** NO. YOU NEVER HAD STUPID QUESTIONS  
2   SCOTT. GO AHEAD PLEASE.

3

4   **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THE LAST ONE I ACCUSED SANTA CLARA OF  
5   BEING SAN JOAQUIN. MY EAST AND WEST AND NORTH AND SOUTH. I AM  
6   CONCERNED, DAVE, THERE IS COUNTLESS ARTICLES COMING OUT THAT  
7   THERE IS A LARGE POPULATION MOVING OUT NOW OF THE URBAN CORES  
8   AND INTO THE SUBURBAN -- I CAN'T THINK OF IT -- THE BLACK  
9   BROWN COMMUNITY ARE MOVING OUT TO BRENTWOOD AND BRENTWOOD  
10  SEEMED LIKE A 5,000 PERCENT INCREASE IN THE POPULATION MOVE  
11  AND SO I'M JUST CURIOUS, ARE WE CONCERNED AT ALL THAT THINGS  
12  ARE KIND OF CHANGING RAPIDLY? AND THE PLAN IS PRETTY. MUCH  
13  GOING TO BE OBSOLETE ONCE WE GET GOING? >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK  
14  WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT THE IMPACTS OF THE SHORT-TERM TRENDS,  
15  THEY COULD BE REFLECTIVE OF ACCELERATED DISPLACEMENT FROM OUR  
16  COMMUNITIES IN THE CENTER OF THE REGIONS THOSE ARE THINGS WE  
17  SHOULD ARE CONCERNED ABOUT. AT THE SAME TIME IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
18  REMEMBER THIS IS A 30 YEAR PLAN. AT SOME POINT THIS PANDEMIC  
19  WILL BE OVER, AND THERE WILL BE A PERIOD OF RECOVERY AND THE  
20  IMPACTS, WE'LL HAVE SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS IN THE NEAR TERM. OVER  
21  THE LONG-TERM WE FEEL THAT OUR COMMUNITIES ALL ACROSS THE  
22  REGION ARE ATTRACTIVE PLACES TO LIVE. THERE ARE MANY GREAT  
23  ATTRIBUTES OF OUR URBAN CENTERS. IT'S NOT JUST THE ACCESS TO  
24  JOBS. IT'S ALL THE AMENITIES, ARE THE CULTURAL INSTITUTIONS,  
25  UNIVERSITIES AND THE LIKE. THERE ARE STILL A LOT OF COMPELLING



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 REASONS LONG-TERM THAT OUR BIG CITIES SAN HOSE OAKLAND AND SAN  
2 FRANCISCO WILL BE ATTRACTIVE PLACES TO SETTLE IN THE FUTURE.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOU AND I SHOULD GET TOGETHER IN ABOUT  
5 TEN YEARS NOW AND SEE WHO WAS RIGHT. I DON'T THINK THEY'RE  
6 COMING BACK. I SAW A HOUSE IN FREMONT THE OTHER DAY THAT SOLD  
7 FOR 1.2 MILLION. AND THAT HOUSE IS OVER 1200 SQUARES FEET, IF  
8 YOU MOVED IT OUT OF THE COUNTY IT WOULD BE IN THE \$200,000  
9 RANGE. COST OF HOW MUCH PEOPLE ARE SPENDING ON HOUSING AND  
10 TRANSPORTATION HAS GONE DOWN, I THINK YOU SAID 48 PERCENT,  
11 OVER THE PLAN, BUT I THINK IF SOMEBODY CAN LOOK AT A HOUSING  
12 THEY CAN BUY-IN SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY THEY'RE NOT GOING TO STAY.  
13 THEY'RE GOING TO GO. AND THERE'S NOTHING WRONG WITH LIVING IN  
14 SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY. A LOT TO DO RECREATIONAL STUFF. I DON'T  
15 THINK THEY'RE COMING BACK.

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** SONJA TRAUSS.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** IT SOUNDS LIKE THERE IS A LOT OF PEOPLE BEING LIKE,  
20 OH WELL, I DON'T KNOW, MAYBE THE POPULATION IS GOING TO GO  
21 DOWN. I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR WHAT ARE THE -- HOW DO I SAY THIS?  
22 THERE IS A PHRASE, BETTER SAFE THAN SORRY. RIGHT? SO GIVEN  
23 THAT WE DON'T KNOW, WHAT IS THE BEST ERROR TO MAKE? LIKE, TO  
24 MY MIND, ANTICIPATING A LOT OF HOUSING NEED IS BETTER THAN  
25 ANTICIPATING NOT ENOUGH. BECAUSE IF WE ZONE FOR A LOT OF



July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HOUSING, SAY WE BUILD AN APARTMENT BUILDING HERE, HERE, AND  
2 HERE AND WHEN IT TURNS OUT WE DON'T NEED ALL THAT ZONING.  
3 OKAY. NO HARM DONE. IT JUST DOESN'T GET BUILT OUT. BUT WHEN WE  
4 ANTICIPATE THAT WE DON'T NEED VERY MUCH HOUSING AND SAY OH  
5 KEEP THAT AS A PARKING LOT OR SINGLE FAMILY HOUSE BUT THERE  
6 ARE PEOPLE WHO WANT TO BUILD A LOT OF HOUSING AND THEY CAN'T  
7 BECAUSE THE LAW IS IN THE WAY. THAT'S A PROBLEM. HEAR ALL  
8 THESE COMMENTS GOING OH WE MIGHT NOT HAVE THAT MUCH POPULATION  
9 GROWTH. WHAT'S HARM IN OVERESTIMATING POPULATION GROWTH? I  
10 ALSO WANT TO REALLY MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE REALIZE, IT MIGHT BE  
11 THE CASE PEOPLE LEAVE BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN THERE WON'T BE  
12 SOMEBODY TO REPLACE THEM. I CAME HERE IN 2011 THE ECONOMY WAS  
13 SORT OF BAD HERE BUT WAY WORSE THAN EVERYWHERE ELSE. WE'RE  
14 STILL GOING TO HAVE PEOPLE TO WANT TO COME. EVEN IF PEOPLE  
15 LEAVE AND DON'T COME BACK THEY WILL BE REPLACED. I WANT TO  
16 TALK ABOUT HOUSEHOLD PROJECTIONS BETWEEN EARLY APRIL AND THIS  
17 DRAFT. AND I FORGET, IT WAS APRIL 5TH OR 8TH, THE PRESENTATION  
18 THAT WAS GIVEN, AND THE PRESENTATION WAS GIVEN A FEW TIMES,  
19 THE 2030 HOUSEHOLD PROJECTIONS WAS 3.377 MILLION, IS THEN NOW  
20 OUR NEW PROJECTIONS FOR HOUSEHOLDS IN 2030 IS 3.21 MILLION,  
21 WHICH IS 167,000 FEWER HOUSEHOLDS. AND THE EARLIER HOUSEHOLD  
22 PROJECTIONS IMPLIED THAT WE NEEDED ABOUT 600,000 NEW  
23 HOUSEHOLDS, AND THE NEW HOUSEHOLD PROJECTIONS IMPLIES WE NEED  
24 ABOUT 430,000 NEW HOUSEHOLDS, WHICH IS A PRETTY BIG DROP. AND  
25 I DON'T -- I DON'T SEE WHY A RECESSION OR EVEN COVID WOULD



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 CAUSE SUCH A DRAMATIC DECREASE. AND I CAN'T HELP BUT NOTICE  
2 THAT THE EARLIER HOUSEHOLD PROJECTIONS MATCHED THE REGIONAL  
3 HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION THAT STAFF WAS TELLING PEOPLE THEY  
4 THOUGHT WE WERE GOING TO GET, AND THEN COINCIDENTLY, THE NEW  
5 HOUSEHOLD PROJECTIONS MEETS OUR NEW REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS  
6 DETERMINATION. IT SEEMS ALL TO CONVENIENT AND NOT PARTICULARLY  
7 BELIEVABLE DROP BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE SO MANY.

8

9 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, SONJA. ANYTHING ELSE? SONJA?  
10 OKAY. SHE MUTED HERSELF. I'M GOING TO LOWER HER HAND. OKAY.  
11 NEYSA FILGOR. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

12

13 **NEYSA FILGOR:** YES I CAN, THANKS CHAIR. DAVE, I WILL NOT REPEAT  
14 ALL THE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS I MADE AT THE HMC MEETING LAST  
15 WEEK. BUT I DO HAVE A FOLLOW UP GOING BACK TO THE PROJECTIONS  
16 FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY, SAN MATEO COUNTY, SAN FRANCISCO AND  
17 OAKLAND. I WAS ASKED THIS BY A COUPLE OF RESIDENTS, WHETHER OR  
18 NOT WE CAN GET THE DATA SUPPORTING THAT 41 PERCENT PROJECTIONS  
19 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY? I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S AVAILABLE FOR  
20 US. I KNOW WE'LL BE HAVING WORKSHOP SUPERVISOR OPPORTUNITIES  
21 FOR THE PUBLIC TO ATTEND AND COMMENT AND ASK THOSE QUESTIONS.  
22 BUT I THINK WE WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE IT. I REPRESENT THE  
23 CITY IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY SO AT A MINIMUM, WE WOULD LOVE TO  
24 SEE THE DATA THAT SUPPORTS THAT 41 PERCENT PROJECTIONS, WHAT  
25 YOU'RE RELYING ON, WHAT THE ASSUMPTIONS ARE BASED ON. BECAUSE

July 16, 2020

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 OF COURSE, WE DISAGREE. WE THINK IT'S TOO HIGH AND THERE ARE  
2 OTHER AREAS IN THE BAY AREA THAT SHOULD ARE HIGHER BASED ON  
3 WHAT WE HAVE SEEN OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS AND WHAT WE  
4 ANTICIPATE HAPPENING WITH COVID AND OTHER FACTORS. THANKS

5 DAVE. >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR THAT QUESTION. I WANT TO  
6 PROVIDE A QUICK RESPONSE. THE ON OUR WEB SITE WE HAVE A BREAK  
7 DOWN OF GROWTH WITHIN EACH COUNTY WE ALSO HAVE A MAP THAT  
8 SHOWS KEY GROWTH AREAS WHICH ARE THE MAIN AREAS THAT  
9 ADDITIONAL HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH IS OCCURRING SO YOU CAN SEE  
10 WHERE THOSE LOCATIONS ARE IN THE COUNTY. WE HAVE ALSO WORKED  
11 WITH LOCAL JURISDICTION TO REVIEW ALL THE INPUT DATA THAT  
12 EFFORT TOOK PLACE IN 2019 AND EARLY 2020 AND THERE IS  
13 OPPORTUNITY IN OFFICE HOURS FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO COME IN  
14 LOOK AT THE DATA LOOK UNDER THE HOOD AND GET AN UNDERSTANDING  
15 OF THE SORTS OF STRATEGIES THAT WERE APPLIED IN THEIR  
16 JURISDICTION THAT LEAD TO THE GROWTH PREDICTIONS. THOSE ARE  
17 DIFFERENT RESOURCES AND OPPORTUNITIES TO LEARN MORE. >DAVE  
18 VAUTIN: IS THAT WHAT YOU MENTIONED IS THAT ALSO ONLINE? >DAVE  
19 VAUTIN: YES THERE IS AN ONLINE TOOL FOR BASIS. BUT THE OFFICE  
20 HOURS OPPORTUNITIES ARE REALLY GREAT FOR OUR LOCAL  
21 JURISDICTION BECAUSE IT CAN BE HELPFUL TO COLLABORATE AND TAKE  
22 A LOOK AT THAT STUFF TOGETHER.

23

24 **NEYSA FILGOR:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

25



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. IS THAT ALL YOU HAD NEYSA?

2

3 **NEYSA FILGOR:** YES. THANK YOU.

4

5 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. THEN WE'LL GO ON TO AMBER C.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK STAFF. THIS HAS BEEN A  
8 LONG PROCESS AND A LOT OF WORK ON YOUR END. TWO QUESTIONS.  
9 FIRST, I KEEP COMING BACK TO THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS  
10 GOALS AND HOW FAR AWAY WE ARE FROM MEETING THEM, AND I KNOW A  
11 BIG PORTION OF THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT BEING DEALT WITH THE  
12 HOUSING JOBS LOCATIONS, BUT I CAN'T HELP BUT THINK THAT THERE  
13 MUST BE SOME WAY TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THE TRANSPORTATION  
14 IMPROVEMENTS EARLIER. AND I THINK NEXT WEEK WE'LL BE TALKING -  
15 - OR MTC COMMISSION WILL BE TALKING ABOUT HOW TO POTENTIALLY  
16 MOVE SOME OF THE PROJECTS FROM LATER IN THE PLAN TO EARLIER.  
17 SO WE WOULD JUST URGE THAT YOU STRONGLY CONSIDER THAT, AND  
18 MOVING THE REGIONAL MEGA MEASURE FUNDING INTO THE EARLIER  
19 PORTION OF THE PLAN IN ORDER TO START DELIVERING SOME OF THESE  
20 CRITICAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS EARLIER, AND HOPEFULLY  
21 INCREASE EVEN MORE THE ABILITY OF PEOPLE TO USE, ESPECIALLY  
22 THE NEW TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. ALSO, I WANTED TO COMMENT THAT WE  
23 REALLY APPRECIATE, IN THE STRATEGIES, THE KIND OF BROAD  
24 THINKING ABOUT SEAMLESSNESS, NOT JUST WITH RESPECT TO FARES,  
25 BUT ALSO LOOKING AT ACROSS MODES, SO TOLL LANES, TDM, RIDE-



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 SHARE, AND THE EFFORTS THAT ARE GOING ON RIGHT NOW WITH  
2 SEAMLESS, THE PARTNERSHIP SEAMLESS SUBCOMMITTEE BLUE RIBBON  
3 TASK FORCE EXPRESS LANE STEERING COMMITTEE. WE URGE TO NOT  
4 JUST LOOK FOR OPPORTUNITIES WITHIN THE MODES BUT THEN ALSO  
5 KIND OF AN UMBRELLA OPPORTUNITY FOR SEAMLESSNESS THAT LOOKS AT  
6 THINGS LIKE TRANSIT SUBSIDIES FOR EXPRESS LANE USE. SO ACROSS  
7 SUBSIDIES WITH TRANSIT AND EXPRESS LANE USED COMBINED WITH  
8 MEANS BASE TOLLING IT CAN ADVANCE EQUITY GOALS THAT ARE A  
9 CRITICAL PART OF THIS PLAN AS WELL. SO THANK YOU.

10

11 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LAST HAND  
12 RAISED I HAVE FROM OUR MEMBERS IS RICK BONILLA. IF THERE IS  
13 ANYONE ELSE WHO WISHES TO SHARE COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS PLEASE  
14 RAISE YOUR HAND. SONJA I'M GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT  
15 FIRST. BECAUSE YOU HAVE ALREADY HAD YOUR TIME. RICK BONE ILLA,  
16 PLEASE.

17

18 **RICK BONILLA:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR. I HAVE A COUPLE ON OF  
19 COMMENTS. ONE IS, I NOTICED WE'RE LOOKING AT JOBS AND HOUSING  
20 FIT, BUT YOU KNOW WE'RE PROJECTING, AND I FEEL GOOD ABOUT THE  
21 PROJECTIONS BUT WE'RE PROJECTING TO BUILD A LOT OF HOUSING IN  
22 THE NEXT CYCLE AND OVER THE SPAN OF 2050, THERE IS A SERIOUS -  
23 - I COME FROM THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY, I AM A RETIRED  
24 CARPENTER. I KNOW A LOT ABOUT THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY, AND I  
25 CAN SPEAK TO THE FACT AND I BELIEVE A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 ALSO HONED IN ON THIS, THERE IS CLEARLY A SHORTAGE THAT'S  
2 HISTORICAL BUT IT'S MORE THAN JUST A SHORTAGE EVER SKILLED AND  
3 TRAINED WORKERS WHICH LEADS TO HIGHER COST LOWER PRODUCTIVITY  
4 AND SLOWER ACTUAL PRODUCTION OF HOUSING, BUT IT HAS TO DO WITH  
5 THE FACT THAT THE CURRENT TRAINED AND SKILLED WORKFORCE IS  
6 AGING. AND WE'RE NOT TAKING IN YOUNG PEOPLE BECAUSE THEY  
7 CLEARLY, AND THIS HAS BEEN STUDIED IN NEW SURVEYS VIEW THESE  
8 JOBS AS BEING TOO HARD. YOU WORK OUTSIDE. YOU DON'T ALWAYS  
9 HAVE GUARANTEED WORK BECAUSE THERE IS A SEASONAL NATURE. A  
10 WHOLE LIST OF IMPEDIMENTS TO ATTRACT YOUNG PEOPLE. I WANT TO  
11 PUT THIS BUG IN THE EAR, WE NEED TO FORM A COALITION WITH  
12 PEOPLE TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ABLE TO INDUCE PEOPLE TO SEEK  
13 TRAINING AND OPPORTUNITIES IN WHAT CAN BE A WELL PAYING JOB IN  
14 THE WORK OF CONSTRUCTION WORKERS TO VALUE PROPERLY AND IF  
15 THEY'RE PROVIDED WITH BENEFITS BECAUSE IT IS A DANGEROUS AND  
16 DIFFICULT JOB. THEY NEED HEALTH CARE, INDEED PENSION. ALL OF  
17 THESE THINGS NEED TO BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION. I WANT TO  
18 ADD, REGARDING TRANSPORTATION, I WANT TO ADD TO WHAT WAS SAID  
19 ABOUT TRYING TO MOVE UP THE SCHEDULE AND SEEK TO PUT  
20 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS IN PLACE AS SOON AS POSSIBLE  
21 BECAUSE OF THE SEVERE ISSUE WE HAVE WITH GREENHOUSE GAS  
22 EMISSIONS, CLIMATE CHANGE, SEA LEVEL RISE, ALL OF THE OTHER  
23 ASSOCIATED FACTORS. I SERVE ON TWO COMMITTEES HERE IN SAN  
24 MATEO COUNTY WHERE WE'RE WORKING ON ALL OF THE ISSUES THAT  
25 WERE SPOKE ABOUT SUCH AS RIDE-SHARE AND SO FORTH, SHUTTLES,



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 GETTING PEOPLE ON TO THE TRAINS, SO YOU NAME T FINALLY, I WANT  
2 TO MENTION ONE LAST THING, WHICH IS THE INACTION, THE LACK OF  
3 SUPPORT THAT CAME FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
4 FOR CALTRAIN, THE OTHER DAY, IS JUST INEXPLICABLE TO ME. I  
5 HAVE AN ISSUE WITH IT. CALTRAIN IS THE ONLY MASS TRANSIT THAT  
6 SERVES ARE BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE, EVERYBODY ON  
7 THE PENINSULA ALL OF THE CITIES THAT BOARD THE TRACKS ARE  
8 BUILDING TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT ALL ALONG THOSE  
9 CORRIDORS. ALL OF OUR CLIENTS IN THE CITY OF SAN MATEO THAT I  
10 HAILED FROM ARE BUILT AROUND THE TRANSIT CORRIDOR, THE TRACKS.  
11 WE HAVE TO USE CALTRAIN. SO ANYBODY WHO CAN, PLEASE THINK  
12 ABOUT THIS, AND WORK TO URGE DECISION MAKERS TO VALUE AND  
13 SUPPORT MASS TRANSIT, ESPECIALLY RAIL TRANSIT LIKE CALTRAIN.  
14 OKAY. THANK YOU.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S SEE. DO WE HAVE ANY  
17 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS, FRED? UPON

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
20 THEIR HAND RAISED. FIVE NOW.

21

22 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. WOULD YOU CALL ON OUR FIRST  
23 CALLER, PLEASE.

24



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TO CONFIRM, CHAIR, THE TWO MINUTE TIME  
2 LIMIT?

3

4 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** YES PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENS. GO  
7 AHEAD RODNEY. RODNEY, UNMUTE YOURSELF, PLEASE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** AM I GOOD TO GO?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU FRED. SORRY ABOUT THAT. [LAUGHTER]  
14 GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS RODNEY NICKENS,  
15 THE POLICY MANAGER AT THE NON-PROFIT HOUSING OCEAN OF NORTHERN  
16 CALIFORNIA. WE'RE BASED IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND FIRST I WANT TO  
17 THANK STAFF FOR ALL OF THEIR WORK ON PLANNED BAY AREA THUS  
18 FAR. WE KNOW THIS HAS BEEN A TREMENDOUS UNDERTAKING ESPECIALLY  
19 DURING THIS EMERGENCY. WE APPRECIATE ALL OF THE WORK THUS FAR  
20 AND ALL THE DISCUSSIONS THIS AFTERNOON. I AM PERSONALLY  
21 PLEASED TO SEE SUGGESTIONS PERTAINING TO PARTNERS HOUSING AND  
22 LANE STRATEGIES HAVE BEEN IMPLEMENTED IN THE PLAN AS MENG SAID  
23 BEFORE THESE STRATEGIES ARE IMPORTANT TO OUR HOUSING  
24 AFFORDABILITY RISE. THERE ARE GOING TO BE CRITICAL  
25 CONVERSATIONS HAPPENING IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS ESPECIALLY



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 AROUND PLANNED BAY AREA AND RHNA AND ALL THE VARIOUS POLICY  
2 UPDATES AND PROGRAMS THAT MTC AND ABAG ARE ENGAGED IN AT THIS  
3 POINT. BUT I THINK IT'S CRITICAL THAT WE REFLECT ON THE  
4 FAILURES OF THE PREVIOUS PLAN TO ADDRESS AFFORDABILITY  
5 CHALLENGES AND THAT WE CONTINUE TO ENCOURAGE LOCAL  
6 JURISDICTION IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS TO THINK ABOUT HOW THEY  
7 ADDRESS THEIR FAIR SHARE OF HOUSING GROWTH AND THE HISTORIC  
8 AND LEGACY OF RACIAL INJUSTICE AND ECONOMIC INEQUITY THAT ARE  
9 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTING THE AFRICAN AMERICAN COMMUNITY  
10 AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR MORE BROADLY. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT  
11 TO ADDRESS BUILDING PRACTICES IN THOSE COMMUNITIES AND PUT  
12 FORWARD BOLD STRATEGIES AND IDEAS AND POLICIES THAT WILL  
13 EXPAND THE WORK THAT HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE TO ADDRESS THE  
14 THREE PS, PROTECTIONS PRESERVATION, WE MUST DO MORE TO PROTECT  
15 OUR COMMUNITIES AND COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. WE MUST DO MORE TO  
16 ADDRESS THOSE WHO ARE UNHOUSED. WE HAVE A SEVERE HOMELESSNESS  
17 CRISIS THAT'S EXACERBATED BY THE PANDEMIC IT'S INCUMBENT UPON  
18 ALL OF US, STAKEHOLDER SUPERVISOR OFFICIALS AS MEMBERS OF THE  
19 BODY TO TAKE THIS CHALLENGE SERIOUSLY AND RISE TO THE  
20 OCCASION. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE HARD WORK YOU'RE DOING.  
21 WE RECOGNIZE THIS IS AN UNPRECEDENTED TIME. THANK YOU VERY  
22 MUCH.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SAM DEUTSCHE,  
25 GO AHEAD.



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. TO THE COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS SAM D. THANKS FOR  
3 TAKING THE TIME TODAY. JUST TO GIVE SOME CONTEXT, I THINK IT'S  
4 VERY IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT THE BROADER SCOPE OF WHAT'S GOING ON  
5 IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW, WHICH IS THAT WE ARE ONE OF THE  
6 MOST UNAFFORDABLE METROPOLITAN AREAS IN THE ENTIRE COUNTRY.  
7 AND THAT'S GOING TO HAVE EFFECTS FOR EVERYBODY THAT LIVES  
8 HERE. JUST SPEAKING PERSONALLY, I AM A RENTER, I HAVE THREE  
9 ROOMMATES, AND TO BE FRANK, I'M PROBABLY NEVER GOING TO BE  
10 ABLE TO AFFORD TO BUY A HOUSE IN THE BAY AREA WHICH IS  
11 FUNCTION OF THE POLICIES INCLUDING DISCRETIONARY ZONING THAT  
12 HAVE GOTTEN INTO THIS SITUATION WHERE WE HAVE SUCH A SEVERE  
13 HOUSING SHORTAGE. AND I WANT TO TELL ABAG THAT THERE IS NO  
14 REASON TO LOWER THE PROPOSED HOUSING PROJECTIONS BASED ON  
15 COVID, GIVEN HOW STRONG THE ECONOMY IS, IN GENERAL, IN THE BAY  
16 AREA, EVEN THOUGH DESPITE THE RECESSION THE BAY AREA IS ALWAYS  
17 GOING TO BE INCREDIBLY DESIRABLE DUE TO CONCENTRATION OF  
18 COMPANIES AND THE WEATHER AND THE NATURAL BEAUTY AS WELL AND I  
19 THINK WE NEED TO STOP LOOKING AT THE STATUS QUO AS SOMEWHAT  
20 ACCEPTABLE AND START THINKING MORE RADICALLY ABOUT MASSIVELY  
21 INCREASING THE NUMBER OF HOUSINGS THAT WE BUILD TO INCREASE  
22 ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY BUT ALSO TO CREATE A MORE SUSTAINABLE  
23 ENVIRONMENT, BOTH IN TERMS OF THE FACT THAT THE BAY AREA'S  
24 AMAZING WEATHER AND THE PEOPLE DON'T NEED TO SPEND AS MUCH  
25 ENERGY HEATING THEIR HOMES BUT ALSO THINKING ABOUT TRANSIT



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 CONCENTRATION AND HOUSING NEAR MASS TRANSIT WHERE PEOPLE WILL  
2 HAVE EASY ACCESS TO JOBS, THEY WON'T HAVE TO SPEND THOUSANDS  
3 OF DOLLARS ON CARS, BALLS -- BUT ALSO WILL NOT CONTRIBUTE TO  
4 GLOBAL WARMING AND CONGESTION. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE. UNMUTE  
7 YOURSELF PLEASE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING PARTICIPATION.  
10 MY NAME IS SCOTT. I APPRECIATED HEARING THE PRESENTATION. I  
11 ALSO APPRECIATED COUNCILMEMBER BONILLA, I WANT TO ELABORATE ON  
12 THIS. IN MY INITIAL INVOLVEMENT IN THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY  
13 COMMITTEE, I NOTICED THERE WAS GOING TO BE A SURVEY OF LOCAL  
14 JURISDICTION ABOUT BARRIERS TO ATTAINING OUR HOUSING NEEDS,  
15 AND NOTICED THAT WHILE THERE ARE QUESTIONS RELATING TO  
16 AVAILABILITY OF CAPITAL, AVAILABILITY OF LAND, THERE WAS NO  
17 QUESTION ABOUT AVAILABILITY OF LABOR TO BUILD HOUSING. WE --  
18 FORTUNATELY STAFF LISTENED, INCLUDED THE QUESTION ON THE  
19 SURVEY AND IT CAME BACK AS THE FOURTH MOST COMMON RESPONSE OF  
20 BEING A SERIOUS BARRIER TO ATTAINING AND ACHIEVING OUR HOUSING  
21 NEEDS BUILD-OUT. NOW, WHY DO WE HAVE PROBLEMS WITH LABOR?  
22 WELL, I HAVE DONE SOME WORK WITH THE AMERICAN COMMUNITY  
23 SURVEY, AND IT TURNS OUT THAT FOUR OUT OF TEN CONSTRUCTION  
24 WORKER FAMILIES LIVING IN WEST BAY, EAST BAY, AND SOUTH BAY  
25 QUALIFY AS VERY LOW INCOME FAMILIES. SO YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 DIFFICULTY DOUBLING THE SIZE OF YOUR CONSTRUCTION WORKFORCE  
2 FOR BUILDING HOUSING, HOUSING TYPICALLY PAYS LESS THAN IF YOU  
3 ARE BUILDING COMMERCIAL STRUCTURES OR PUBLIC WORKS, TO DOUBLE  
4 IT'S GOING TO BE VERY DIFFICULT IF YOU HAVE A BUNCH OF VERY  
5 LOW INCOME FAMILIES BECAUSE WHO WANTS TO TAKE ON A CAREER AND  
6 BE VERY LOW INCOME IN THE BAY AREA? PRESENTLY 1/3 OF HIRES  
7 EMPLOYING TO EMPLOYMENT AND CONSTRUCTION ARE ACKNOWLEDGE FROM  
8 OUTSIDE -- COMING FROM OUTSIDE THE BAY AREA. I ASK THAT WE  
9 MEASURE THESE ISSUES BECAUSE IF WE DON'T MEASURE THEM WE'RE  
10 GOT GOING TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER WITH  
13 NUMBER ENDING IN 6187.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON ABAG MY NAME IS SARAH OGILVIE. I AM A  
16 RESIDENT IN SAN FRANCISCO. I CURRENTLY LIVE IN THE MISSION, IN  
17 MY ZIP CODE WE'RE EXPERIENCING THE WORST EFFECTS OF THE COVID-  
18 19 PANDEMIC BUT A MAJOR SYMPTOM OF THESE EFFECTS IS THE  
19 OVERCROWDING. IT'S THE OVERCROWDING THAT I HAVE PERSONALLY  
20 WITNESSED AND I AM DEEPLY CONCERNED ABOUT ADDRESSING. I AM  
21 CONCERNED THAT LOWERING EXPECTATIONS FOR SENSITIVE COMMUNITIES  
22 IS REALLY GOING TO EXACERBATE THE PROBLEM. AND I'M JUST REALLY  
23 CONCERNED THAT THIS OVERALL REDUCTION IN THE NUMBERS IS BEING  
24 EXPRESSED AS A PROBLEM OF COVID-19. THERE WAS A JOHN HOPS  
25 CONSISTENCY STUDY PUBLISHED ON JUNE 19TH SAYING NOT LINKED TO

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HIGHER CORONAVIRUS RAISED AND IS LINKED TO COVID-19 DEATH  
2 RATES. I'M ASKING ABAG TO REALLY CONSIDER THE NEED FOR HEALTHY  
3 DENSITY, ESPECIALLY IN AREAS LIKE MY DISTRICT TO BE PLANNED  
4 AND DEVELOPED IF POSSIBLE. AND THAT, YOU KNOW, AS FAR AS  
5 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND'S COMMENTED, I BELIEVE THERE IS SOME  
6 MISSING MIDDLE HOUSING GOING ON HERE AND LET'S KEEP IN MIND  
7 THAT THE MARKET RATE HOUSING IS GOING TO BE THE KEY TO  
8 BUILDING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO WE'RE GOING TO NEED AN  
9 ABUNDANCE OF BOTH TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING PROBLEMS IN THE  
10 REGION. AND I AGREE THERE NEEDS TO BE A CONSIDERATION OF  
11 LOOKING FOR MORE, EXPECTING MORE FROM THE BAY AREA, BECAUSE  
12 THE BAY AREA IS GOING TO BE A KEY LOCATION WHERE WE'RE GOING  
13 TO ACTUALLY SOLVE THE ECONOMIC CRISIS THAT HAS BEEN CAUSED BY  
14 THIS PANDEMIC. THERE ARE PROBLEMS. EVERYBODY CAN WORK TO MAKE  
15 THE BAY AREA BETTER. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ALFRED TWU. GO AHEAD.  
18 UNMUTE YOURSELF PLEASE.

19

20 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** FRED, HOW MANY MORE SPEAKERS DO WE  
21 HAVE?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THREE AFTER THIS ONE.

24



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO WE HAVE FOUR SPEAKERS. MY  
2 CONCERN IS, WE HAVE TWO MORE CRITICAL ISSUES WE NEED TO GET  
3 TO, AND I KNOW WE NEED TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. I WANT TO GIVE  
4 HEADS UP TO MR. SHORETT, MS. FASINGER. AND ADAMS. WE ONLY HAVE  
5 A HALF AN HOUR AND THE HOUSING COMMITTEE IS SUPPOSED TO MEET  
6 AFTER THIS. AM I CORRECT?

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** THE HOUSING COMMITTEE MEETING IS AT 4:15.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THE TWO ITEMS FOLLOWING THIS ARE NOT LONG  
11 PRESENTATIONS. HOPE IS THEY WON'T TAKE A LOT OF TIME.

12

13 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THAT'S WONDERFUL. FRED GO AHEAD WITH  
14 OUR NEXT PUBLIC SPEAKER.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I'M ALFRED I LIVE IN EAST BERKELEY AND ONE OF THE  
17 THINGS I HAVE NOTICED IN THE LAST FEW MONTHS IS EVEN THOUGH  
18 PEOPLE ARE MOVING FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO FIND CHEAPER RENTED,  
19 THEY'RE NOT LEAVING THE BAY AREA, THEY'RE COMING TO THE EAST  
20 BAY AND WE'RE STILL SEEING OVERCROWDING AND HIGH HOUSING  
21 PRICES HERE. SO FOR THAT REASON, I URGE YOU TO AIM FOR A  
22 HIGHER NUMBER. THE WAY I THINK ABOUT IT IS IF YOU PUT IN THE  
23 HIGHER NUMBER AS THE GOAL AND IT ENDS UP BEING TOO HIGH, THERE  
24 IS NOT REALLY ANY CONSEQUENCE BECAUSE IT'S NOT LIKE HOMES ARE  
25 GOING TO BE BUILT WHERE THERE IS NO DEMAND BUT YOU IF YOU PUT



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 IN TOO LOW A NUMBER AND IT'S NOT ENOUGH THEN WE'RE BACK TO THE  
2 CONTINUOUS PROBLEM WE'RE HAVING WITH OVERCROWDING AND PEOPLE  
3 BEING DISPLACED IN THE AREA. AND THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE I  
4 KNOW WHO USED TO LIVE IN THE BAY AREA WHO HAD TO MOVE AWAY BUT  
5 WANT TO MOVE BACK. SHOULD BE INCLUDED TO CALCULATE HOW MANY  
6 HOMES WE NEED IN THE REGION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KENNETH RUSSELL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON ABAG MY NAME IS KENNETH R.  
11 I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. WHERE IS OUR VISION? IS OUR LEADERS  
12 OF THE BAY AREA SHOULD NOT BE SATISFIED WITH MINE ARE TWEAKS  
13 TO THE STATUS QUO. DO WE ALL THINK THINGS ARE WORKING FOR THE  
14 PEOPLE HERE? WE NEED TO PLAN FOR WHAT WE WANT TO HAPPEN. THIS  
15 PLAN SHOULDN'T BE A BARE MINIMUM JUST SCRAPING BY NOT MEETING  
16 OUR CLIMATE GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS. IT'S JUST TOO HARD, SO WE  
17 GIVE UP PLAN. LEADERSHIP ISN'T ABOUT EVERYTHING BEING EASY.  
18 THIS MOMENT ASKS A LOT OF OUR LEADERS. THAT'S WHY YOU ARE  
19 HERE. I ALSO THINK IT'S CRAZY THAT WE HAVE GROUPS HERE DURING  
20 THIS RECESSION TALKING ABOUT HOW THEY DON'T WANT PEOPLE AND  
21 TAXPAYERS. HOW MANY CITIES IN THE REGION ACROSS OUR COUNTRY  
22 WOULD BE HAPPY TO HAVE THE CHALLENGES WE HAVE HERE IN THE BAY  
23 AREA WITH MORE PEOPLE WANTING TO LIVE HERE? I ALSO THINK IT'S  
24 VERY CONCERNING THAT IN EARLY APRIL BEFORE THE REGIONAL  
25 HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION CAME OUT THE PLANNED BAY AREA



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 PROTECTION OF HOMES IS DOWN TO 3.21 MILLION. WHAT HAPPENED TO  
2 THE 167,000 HOUSEHOLDS. WE NEED TO AIM FOR THE FUTURE WE NEED  
3 AND THAT MEANS FIXING OUR UNAFFORDABILITY AND FIXING  
4 EXCLUSIONARY ZONING. PLEASE PLAN FOR THIS FUTURE WE NEED. LIKE  
5 ALFRED SAID, THE RISK ISN'T IN PLANNING FOR TOO FEW HOMES.  
6 RISK IS IN PLANNING FOR TOO MUCH. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS THEO GORDON.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS THEO GORDON. I AM A RENTER IN SAN  
11 FRANCISCO AND CHAIR OF SAN FRANCISCO YIMBY CALLING TO  
12 REPRESENT OUR 9,000 MEMBERS AND ASK THAT WE RAISE THE RHNA  
13 NUMBERS. WE'RE IN A HOUSING CRISIS. WE ALL KNOW THIS. WE HAVE  
14 ALL SEEN, AND THAT CRISIS HAS BEEN CAUSED BY LOCAL LEADERS WHO  
15 HAVE FAILED US. AND YOU KNOW THAT OUR GLOBAL LEADERS ARE  
16 FAILING US BECAUSE WE SAW TWO STORIES TO SPEAK OF IT IN SAN  
17 FRANCISCO THAT WAS DISCUSSED EARLIER IN THIS CALL BECAUSE OF A  
18 PETTY SQUABBLE AMONGST BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND CALTRAIN A  
19 VITAL LINK IN THE BAY AREA THEY'RE ALSO ABOUT TO KILL SEVERAL  
20 THOUSAND HOMES IN THE PLAN ON MARKET STREET INCLUDING 25  
21 PERCENT BELOW MARKET RATE. THESE ARE OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS.  
22 THEY RESPOND TO PAROCHIAL CONCERNS AND THEY CAUSE THIS CRISIS.  
23 THEY SAY THEY WANT MORE HOUSING BUT THEN THEY BLOCK THAT  
24 HOUSING AND THEY PROFIT OFF OF THEIR OWN HOME VALUES. PLEASE  
25 TAKE AWAY OUR LOCAL CONTROL HOLD US ACCOUNTABLE TELL SAN





MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 FRANCISCO YOU HAVE TO BUILD MORE HOUSING. THAT'S THE POWER YOU  
2 V MAKE GOVERNMENTS LIKE OURS GOVERNMENTS THAT ARE FAILING DO  
3 THEIR PART FOR FAIR HOUSING. RAISE THE NUMBER AND PUSH THE  
4 ALLOCATION INTO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS LIKE SAN FRANCISCO.  
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN --  
8 SORRY. ROBERT FRUCKMAN.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ROBERT F. I LIVE IN SAN  
11 FRANCISCO. I ALSO WANT TO CALL FOR MORE HOUSING IN SAN  
12 FRANCISCO. I WANT -- SO I HAVE BEEN DOING IN RESEARCH ON THE  
13 HOUSING DEFICIT FOR SAN FRANCISCO, IN PARTICULAR, I FOUND THAT  
14 SINCE 1970, WE HAVE ADDED 383,000 JOBS, BUT ONLY 57,000 HOMES.  
15 THAT'S A RATIO OF 6.6 JOBS PER HOME FOR THE LAST 50 YEARS. SO  
16 IT'S NOT SURPRISING THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS SO UNAFFORDABLE.  
17 ESPECIALLY TO INDUSTRIES WHERE YOU USED TO BE ABLE TO BE A  
18 BLUE-COLLAR WORKER AND LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. NOW IT'S JUST  
19 UNAFFORDABLE. IN 1968, THE HCD DIRECTOR CHARLES LEMENGER SAID  
20 THAT WE WOULD NEED 7.5 MILLION HOMES BY 2,000 TO ACCOMMODATE A  
21 POPULATION OF 40 MILLION PEOPLE. WE NEED TO BUILD AROUND  
22 250,000 HOMES PER YEAR. BUT WE HAVEN'T -- IN FACT, WE HAVE  
23 ONLY BUILT HALF OF THAT ACCORDING TO CALIFORNIA STATE REPORTS.  
24 SO AS A RESULT, WE DO NOT GET 40 MILLION PEOPLE IN THE YEAR  
25 2,000, WE HIT 33 MILLION. SO WHEN YOU DO NOT BUILD HOUSING IT



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 IS A SELF FULFILLING PROPHECY YOU LOWER YOUR POTENTIAL  
2 POPULATION AND YOU MAY GET UNAFFORDABLE FOR THE PEOPLE WHO ARE  
3 TRYING TO LIVE IN URBAN REGIONS. I URGE YOU TO MAKE SAN  
4 FRANCISCO MORE EQUITABLE AND AFFORDABLE BY ADDING TO OUR RHNA  
5 PROJECTIONS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES. GO AHEAD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.  
12 MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES. I AM A LIFE-LONG SAN MATEO RESIDENT  
13 AND LEAD MEMBER OF HOUSING ADVOCACY GROUP PENINSULA FOR  
14 EVERYONE. I WANT TO ECHO DIRECTOR ASHCRAFT'S COMMENTS AND  
15 DIRECTOR BONILLA'S COMMENTS -- EXCUSE ME, AND COUNCILMEMBER  
16 ASHCRAFT AND BONILLA'S COMMENTS. THIS ISN'T A NORMAL  
17 RECESSION. NEED FOR HOUSING IS NOT GOING AWAY AND IN FACT IT'S  
18 GREATER THAN EVER DUE TO WHAT WILL ALMOST ASSUREDLY BE AN  
19 INTENDED WAVE OF EVICTIONS COMING OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL  
20 MONTHS. I THINK IT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE A  
21 PUBLIC HEALTH ANALYSIS, A ROBUST PUBLIC HEALTH ANALYSIS  
22 INVOLVED BEFORE WE -- INVOLVED IN ASSESSING WHAT THE COVID  
23 IMPACTS ARE GOING TO BE ON HOUSING BEFORE WE MAKE ANY  
24 DECISIONS. WE'RE ALSO DECADES BEHIND ON OUR HOUSING GOALS AND  
25 WHO'S GOALS HAVE BEEN ABSURDLY INADEQUATE. IN NEW AREA BETWEEN



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 2010 AND 2017 MOUNTAIN VIEW ADDED A GRAND TOTAL OF 30,000 JOBS  
2 AGAINST A RHNA GOAL OF 2900 HOMES. MENLO PARK SIMILARLY ADDED  
3 19,000 JOBS AGAINST A RHNA GOAL OF 655 HOMES. SO YOU HAVE ALL  
4 OF THESE WEALTHY LOCALS THAT HAVE BEEN GOBBLING UP JOBS FOR  
5 THE LAST 20, 30 YEARS, AND THE RHNA GOALS HAVEN'T BEEN  
6 ANYWHERE NEAR WHAT THEY HAVE NEEDED TO BE. I DO WANT TO  
7 ADDRESS A COUPLE OF THE COMMENTS AROUND SPECIFICALLY  
8 TELECOMMUTING. I'M A LITTLE TIRED QUITE FRANKLY HEARING  
9 RETIREES PONTIFICATING ABOUT HOW TELECOMMUTING IS GOING TO  
10 SAVE US, WHEN MOST OF THEM, IF NOT THE GREAT MAJORITY OF THEM  
11 ARE NOT DEALING WITH TELECOMMUTING EVERY DAY. I THINK THERE IS  
12 A CONCERNING OVEREMPHASIS ON THAT. IT'S NOT GOING TO SAVE US.  
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR MITCHOFF TWO ADDITIONAL MEMBERS OF  
16 THE PUBLIC RAISED THEIR HANDS TO SPEAK.

17

18 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD PLEASE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS REILLY E, GO AHEAD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE AT THE BOTTOM OF A HOLE. WE HAVE BEEN DIGGING  
23 THE HOLE WITH EXCLUSIONARY ZONING, DISCRETIONARY REFUSE RHNA  
24 IS A TOOL THAT CAN HELP US TAKE LARGE STEPS OUT OF THIS CRISIS  
25 AND WE SHOULD BE USING IT TO BE AS BIG AND BOLD AS WE K I WANT



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 TO STAY IN THE BAY AREA BUT REGIONAL LOCAL AND STATE  
2 GOVERNMENTS TELLS ME YOU DON'T WANT ME HERE. PLEASE RAISE THE  
3 NUMBERS DRAMATICALLY. HELP US BUILD MORE HOUSING THROUGHOUT  
4 THE BAY AREA HELP US STOP DIG SUPPORTING FIX THE PROBLEMS WE  
5 HAVE CREATED FOR OURSELVES. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THAT'S OUR LAST SPEAKER. CHAIR  
8 MITCHOFF THERE WAS AN E-MAIL SENT LATE ON A NON-SPECIFIC  
9 AGENDA ITEM AND THAT WAS SENT TO ALL COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

10

11 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** I DID SEE THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I  
12 SEE THAT CINDY CHAVEZ WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENTED. GO  
13 AHEAD.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO LIFT UP ONE OF THE ISSUES  
16 THAT WAS RAISED BY SCOTT LITTLEHALE. AND I DO THINK THAT ONE  
17 OF THE CONSIDERATIONS, AS WE KEEP DOING THESE PLANS IS REALLY  
18 LOOKING AT OPPORTUNITIES TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE -- AS WE'RE  
19 SOLVING ONE PROBLEM WE'RE NOT CREATING ANOTHER. AND WHAT I  
20 MEAN BY THAT IS HAVING PEOPLE PAID SO LITTLE THAT THEIR  
21 COMMUTES ARE LONGER, AND THAT THEY'RE NEEDING PUBLIC  
22 ASSISTANCE. IT JUST SEEMS LIKE THAT DOESN'T TEAM IN TO BE A  
23 ZERO SUM GAME AND WE CAN THINK MORE CRITICALLY ABOUT THAT IN  
24 OUR PLANNING. THANK YOU.

25



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND MATT, I'M GOING TO COME  
2 BACK TO YOU, BECAUSE SONJA HAS TEXTED THAT. SEE WOULD LIKE HER  
3 QUESTIONS ANSWERED. I'M NOT SURE -- THE FIRST ONE CAN BE  
4 ANSWERED. CAN YOU TALK ABOUT WHY THERE WAS A 11 LESSENING OF  
5 HOUSEHOLDS BY 167,000?

6

7 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK DAVE HAS GOT IT.

8

9 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** AND THE SECOND IS PHILOSOPHICAL, WHAT  
10 ARE THE MEANS FOR UNDER OR OVERESTIMATING. I THINK YOU AND I  
11 HAD A CONVERSATION ABOUT THESE NUMBERS. CAN YOU ADDRESS THAT?  
12 >DAVE VAUTIN: I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER THE QUESTIONS. FIRST  
13 OF ALL I WANT TO NOTE WE BROUGHT FORWARD REGION GROWTH  
14 FORECAST IN APRIL RECOGNIZING IMPACTS OF JOB TRENDS AND  
15 SECONDARY IMPACTS ON POPULATION AND HOUSING DURING THE 2020S.  
16 TOTAL NUMBER OF NEW HOMES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS  
17 CONSISTENT BETWEEN THE APRIL FORECAST AND THE JULY FORECAST  
18 THAT INCORPORATES ALSO OF THE COVID IMPACTS 1.5 MILLION NEW  
19 HOMES THROUGH 2050 WHICH IS A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE FROM OUR  
20 PREVIOUS PLAN AND THAT'S HELPING TO IMPROVE SOME OF THE  
21 HOUSING OUTCOMES. WITH REGARDS TO THE NEAR TERM IMPACT FOR THE  
22 YEAR 2030 THE REGION HAD 2.7 MILLION HOUSEHOLDS AND HOUSING  
23 UNIT IN 2015, AND THE 2030 NUMBERS WENT DOWN A LITTLE BIT LESS  
24 THAN THE COMMENTER BROUGHT UP. JUST TO GIVE THE NUMBERS FOR  
25 CONTEXT. WE HAD HOUSING HOLDS THAT WENT DOWN TO 3.2 AND



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HOUSING WENT DOWN TO 3.3. THAT'S A REFLECTION OF THE WEAKER  
2 JOB GROWTH AND SLOWER POPULATION GROWTH IN THE 2020S BUT AS  
3 THE ECONOMY RECOVERS IN THE LATTER HALF OF 2020 AND BEYOND  
4 WE'RE SEE SUGGEST HOUSING DEVELOPMENT IN THE COMING YEARS SO  
5 WE'RE SEEING SLOW DOWN IN THAT PART OF THE PLAN. IN RELATION  
6 TO COVID JOBS HOUSING BALANCE IS RESPONSIVE TO WHAT WE HEARD  
7 FROM THE ABAG BOARD IN PROBLEM.

8

9 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >DAVE VAUTIN: ON  
10 THE SECOND QUESTION, BRIEFLY. WE EXPLORED THIS VERY QUESTION  
11 IN THE HORIZON INITIATIVE. AND IT IS TRUE THAT OUR HOUSING  
12 STRATEGIES PROVE EFFECTIVE IN BOTH THE WEAK AND STRONG MARKET  
13 ECONOMIES SO BY PROVIDING ADDITIONAL ZONING CAPACITY THE  
14 POSITIVES ARE MUCH GREATER THAN THE NEGATIVES BECAUSE IT WON'T  
15 NECESSARILY END UP BEING USED -- HOUSING MARKET INCOME LEVELS  
16 IF THE MARKET IS STRONG. THERE IS MORE INFORMATION ON THAT IN  
17 OUR FUTURES FINAL REPORT.

18

19 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I DON'T SEE ANY  
20 MORE HANDS RAISED. AND NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENT. SO WE'RE GOING  
21 TO MOVE ON.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLOS ROMERO WITH HIS HAND RAISED. AND  
24 THERE WAS ANOTHER PUBLIC SPEAKER THEY FAILED TO CALL ON. ALSO  
25 MARK.

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** I SEE MARK THERE. WHY DON'T WE TAKE THE  
3 PUBLIC SPEAKER FIRST.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KYLE KELLY, GO AHEAD.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE. I'M ACTUALLY CALLING FROM SANTA CRUZ. YOU  
8 HAVE PROBABLY HEARD ME SPEAK IN THE PAST. I WANT TO SPEAK TO  
9 SOME OF THE COMMUNITIES DOWN HERE THAT ARE CURRENTLY  
10 OVERCROWDED THAT COME TO WORK IN YOUR CITIES ALL OF WHICH  
11 CAN'T DO REMOTE WORK, WORKING IN YOUR GROCERY STORES, IN YOUR  
12 KITCHENS, AND THE REALITY IS, THEY HAVE TO KEEP ON COMMUTING  
13 INTO THE BAY AREA BECAUSE OF A FAILURE TO BUILD WITHIN THERE.  
14 AND THIS IS EVEN PREPANDEMIC HAS BEEN A PROBLEM. LIKE, THAT  
15 CROWDING IS GOING TO CAUSE FURTHER CORONAVIRUS SPREAD. NOT  
16 DENSITY. THIS IS ABOUT CROWDING. PEOPLE CURRENTLY TAKING OVER  
17 -- THEY HAVE ONE SINGLE FAMILY HOME. THERE WILL BE EIGHT  
18 PEOPLE LIVING IN IT OR MORE WHEN WE COULD BE BUILDING ENOUGH  
19 APARTMENTS OR CONDOS OR TOWNHOUSES OR WHATEVER, CLOSE TO WHERE  
20 YOU ARE NOW AND NOT CREATING ADDITIONAL TRAFFIC ON THE ROAD  
21 AND BUILDING INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES THAT COULD INCLUDE THEM.  
22 YOU HAVE TO START THINKING ABOUT THEM OUTSIDE OF THIS LENS  
23 WITHOUT LOOKING AT HOW WE, YOU KNOW, THE PEOPLE THAT ARE  
24 PRIVILEGED ENOUGH TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THESE CALLS, YOU NEED TO  
25 THINK ABOUT THE REST OF OUR COMMUNITIES THAT SUPPORT US AND



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 THINK ABOUT HOW CAN WE BRING THEM IN HOW CAN WE BUILD ENOUGH  
2 HOUSING FOR THEM.

3

4 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CARLOS, GO  
5 AHEAD.

6

7 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU FOR BEING SO GENEROUS WITH ALLOWS US  
8 TO SPEAK. I'LL MAKE THIS A QUICK COMMENT BECAUSE I HAVE  
9 COMMENTED IN THE PAST. SPECIFICALLY IN TERMS OF THE NUMBER OF  
10 UNITS WE SHOULD BE PLANNING FOR, CLEARLY WE'RE LOOKING AT THAT  
11 WITH RHNA BUT ALSO WITHIN THIS PLAN, WE HAVE A GOAL. WE SHOULD  
12 ALL KEEP IN MIND THAT THIS IS ESSENTIALLY A FIVE YEAR PLAN  
13 THAT WE WORK ON EVERY FOUR YEARS. IT MOVES US IN THE RIGHT  
14 DIRECTION. AS MUCH AS I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE HOUSING,  
15 CERTAINLY, PRIORITIZED, AND PUT IN THE PLAN, THERE IS THE  
16 PROBLEM OF SB35, IN WHICH IF WE DON'T GET THE APPROPRIATE  
17 NUMBER OF MARKET RATE UNITS PRODUCED, THE CITIES WILL THEN  
18 HAVE TO ISSUE BY RIGHT PERMITS FOR THOSE CITIES WHERE INDEED  
19 THE MARKET RATE HOUSING IS NOT BEING PRODUCED AT THE  
20 APPROPRIATE LEVEL. MARKET INDEED MAY NOT BE ABLE TO  
21 ACCOMMODATE SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER NUMBERS. THIS IS A FIVE YEAR  
22 PLAN. SO I THINK THERE IS ALLOWANCE IN THE GOAL THAT WE'RE  
23 SETTING TO BE REALISTIC ENOUGH THAT IF WE CALIBRATE, WE CAN  
24 CALIBRATE IN THE FUTURE. A LOT OF BY RIGHT HOUSING IN WHICH  
25 THE LOCAL COMMUNITIES DON'T HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO MEET STANDARDS





MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 APPLIED THERE COULD BE REPERCUSSIONS TO TRY TO OVERTURN SOME  
2 OF THE LAWS THAT WE PRESENTLY HAVE. IS LASTLY I WANT TO SAY  
3 THE PLAN ITSELF IS CALLING FOR STRATEGIES AROUND 10 TO 20  
4 PERCENT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN TALK  
5 ABOUT MIDDLE INCOME HOUSING. I THINK WE SHOULD CONSIDER  
6 INCREASING THAT NUMBER TO 15 TO 25 PERCENT, AND INDEED THE  
7 HIGHER PORTION, LET'S SAY BETWEEN THE 20 TO 25, A FIVE PERCENT  
8 PORTION COULD INDEED BE DEDICATED TO THE "MISSING MIDDLE" OR  
9 MIDDLE INCOME HOUSING THAT HOUSING IS EASIER TO BUILD AND  
10 REQUIRED FAR LESS SUBSIDIES THAN THE LOWER INCOME HOUSING THAT  
11 CLEARLY IS NEEDED TO MAKE SURE THAT COMMUNITIES OF COLOR AND  
12 WORKING CLASS FOLKS ARE NOT DISPLACED FROM THE COMMUNITIES.  
13 THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR.

14

15 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARK ROSS PLEASE.

16

17 **DIR. MARK ROSS:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR. I'LL BE QUICK. I HAVE  
18 SPOKEN BEFORE ABOUT TAX POLICY. I THINK IT'S A SHORT CUT TO  
19 PROVIDING SOME HOUSING, NUMBER ONE CUT OR ALTER CAPITAL GAINS.  
20 A LOT OF PEOPLE WILL SELL. RETIRED PEOPLE WILL SELL THEIR  
21 RENTALS AND MANY PEOPLE HAVE CREATED -- BUT THEY DO NOT SELL  
22 DUE TO CAPITAL GAINS STATE AND FEDERAL YOU COULD COMPARE THAT  
23 WITH AN ALTERED 1031 EXCHANGE WHICH SOME PEOPLE USE TO GET TAX  
24 CREDIT OR JUST TO RELINQUISH HOUSING THEY HAVE. YOU COULD GET  
25 TAX CREDITS FOR HUGE INCENTIVES THROUGH TAX CREDITS TO BUILD



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 HOUSING AND ONCE IT'S BUILT YOU COULD CONSIDER A REVERSE  
2 WILLIAM SON ACT. SO IT WOULD HAVE A TAX SHELTER FOR 5, 10  
3 YEARS. THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR  
4 HARD WORK.

5

6 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO CHECK. I HAVE GOT  
7 A CHAT HERE. I WANT TO SURE WE HAVE ANSWERED EVERYBODY -- IF  
8 DEMAND IT LOW IT DOESN'T MATTER IF HOUSING IS BY RIGHT. OKAY.  
9 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY OTHER COMMENTS RECEIVED FRED?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DO NOT SEE ANY FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS.  
12 OF THE SONJA TRAUSS HAS HER HAND RAISED.

13

14 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS GOING TO BE HELPFUL. SITUATION IS LIKE ANY  
17 TOWN IN BAY AREA THEY HAVE TO BUILT HOUSING UNITS BUT NOBODY  
18 WANTS TO BUILD HOUSING UNITS BUT THERE IS NO DEMAND BUT CARLOS  
19 SAYS IF WE DON'T BUILD UNITS ZONING HAS TO BE BY RIGHT. IF  
20 NUMBER'S MAKING APPLICATIONS THE REASON THINGS ARE BY RIGHT IS  
21 ALSO THE REASON THAT IT DOESN'T MATTER IF YOU HAVE TO GO -- IF  
22 YOU HAVE TO LET PEOPLE USE THE SB35 -- DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?  
23 THE ONLY WAY YOU'RE GOING TO GET INTO A SITUATION WHERE A LOW  
24 ECONOMY, A SLOW ECONOMY MEANS THAT YOU HAVE -- THAT SB35 KICKS



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 IN THERE IS ALSO A TIME WHEN SB35 KICKS IN IT DOESN'T MATTER  
2 BECAUSE NO ONE IS TRYING TO BUILD ANYTHING ANYWAY.

3

4 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SONJA. THAT'S A COMMENT. AND  
5 WE DO NOT HAVE TIME FOR ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION. I'M GOING MOVE  
6 ON. THEY CAN HAVE THAT CONVERSATION IN THE CHAT. ITEM 5B  
7 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ADDITIONAL PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS  
8 SUBMITTED FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT THIS IS ALSO AN INFORMATION  
9 ITEM. MR. SHORETT AHEAD PLEASE.

10

11 **MARK SHORETT:** THANK YOU. I WILL KEEP THIS BRIEF. THIS ITEM  
12 DOES NOT INCLUDE A POWERPOINT.

13

14 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** OH NO.

15

16 **MARK SHORETT:** THIS EVENING THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL  
17 CONSIDER THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION THAT IT  
18 ADOPT FOUR NEW PDAS COMPLIMENTED BY BOUNDARY CHANGES OF  
19 ADDITIONAL PDAS THIS IS LOCALLY NOMINATED PDA IN FEBRUARY. IN  
20 ADDITION EXISTING PDAS AND SELECT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES OUTSIDE  
21 PDAS THIS SET WAS INTEGRATED INTO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
22 DRAFT BLUEPRINT WHICH DAVE TALKED TO YOU ABOUT EARLIER TODAY  
23 IN CONCERT WITH ADOPTION OF THESE PDAS EXECUTIVE BOARD  
24 RECOMMENDED STAFF PROVIDE ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITY FOR  
25 JURISDICTION TO NOMINATE OR MODIFY PDAS PRIOR TO THE PLANNED

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT. WINDOW TO DO THIS CLOSED IN LATE MAY.  
2 SO DURING EXTENSIVE ENGAGEMENT WITH LOCAL STAFF WE HEARD FROM  
3 MOST OF THEM THEY CAREFULLY CONSIDERED OPPORTUNITIES TO CREATE  
4 NEW PDAS DURING THE SUBMISSION PROCESS REFLECTED IN THE  
5 FEBRUARY ADOPTIONS CITIES SUBMITTED FOUR NEW PDAS EACH  
6 SUPPORTED BY CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTIONS AND CONSISTENT WITH  
7 CRITERIA SET BY ABAG BOARD IN 2019 WHEN IT DID AN ADOPTION  
8 THAT UPDATED THE REGIONAL GROWTH FRAMEWORK. SO THIS INCLUDES  
9 TWO PDAS IN THE CITY OF SAN RAFAEL AND ONE EACH IN BENICIA AND  
10 FAIRFIELD IN ADDITION WE RECEIVED FIVE PROPOSED BOUNDARY PDAS  
11 TWO IN SAN JOSE FAIR FEEL AND ONE FROM LIVERMORE. SO PENDING  
12 EXECUTIVE BOARD ACTION THIS EVENING, THESE NEW AND MODIFIED  
13 PDAS WILL BE INTEGRATED INTO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL  
14 BLUEPRINT AND I'LL CLOSE THERE IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S TAKE A LOOK AND SEE. I  
17 DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PROBLEM  
18 THAT WISHES TO COMMENT, FRED?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND  
21 RAISED NOW. EXCEPT NOW, THERE IS ONE.

22

23 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** LET'S GO TO THAT PERSON.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RODNEY NICKENS, GO AHEAD. RODNEY?

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1

2 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** LET'S GO ON TO THE NEXT SPEAKER. OR  
3 THERE ISN'T A NEXT SPEAKER. CORRECT.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I AM HERE. SORRY ABOUT THAT.

6

7 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** NO PROBLEM.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. RODNEY NICKENS WITH THE NON-PROFIT  
10 HOUSING ASSOCIATION AGAIN. I'LL BE BRIEF. JUST WANTED TO THANK  
11 STAFF FOR THEIR WORK ON INTEGRATING PLANNED GEOGRAPHIES INTO  
12 THE BLUEPRINT AND AS WELL AS EXPANDING THOSE INTO PRIORITY  
13 DEVELOPMENT AREAS I ALSO WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR REACHING OUT  
14 AND INCLUDING ME ON THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE. I AM  
15 EAGER TO EXPLORE WAYS TO IMPROVE THESE PROGRAMS AND TO  
16 ESTABLISH HIGHER STANDARDS AS WELL AS AFFORDABILITY THRESHOLDS  
17 AND LOOK FORWARD TO DISCUSSING AND COLLABORATING WITH STAFF ON  
18 REQUIREMENTS AND LOCAL JURISDICTION COMPLIANCE WITH HOUSING  
19 ALLOWS AND INCENTIVES FOR OUTCOMES -- PLANNING. THANK YOU.

20

21 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPEAKER ROBERT FRUCKMAN.

24

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO SAY I'M APPRECIATIVE OF THE SAN FRANCISCO  
2 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS WHICH HAVE BEEN ADDED ON THE WEST  
3 SIDE OF THE CITY. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE ONES ON THE EAST  
4 SIDE OF THE CITY REMOVED. IN THE LAST TEN YEARS, 90 PERCENT OF  
5 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT HAS ONLY TAKEN PLACE ON THE  
6 EAST SIDE AND FORMALLY IN INDUSTRIAL AREAS WHILE THE MUCH  
7 RICHER WESTERN SIDE OF THE CITY HAS SEEN VERY LITTLE  
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. IN FACT I THINK WITHIN THE  
9 LAST TEN YEARS THE RICHMOND DISTRICT WHICH IS RANKED BY THE  
10 CTC AS HAVING HIGH AND HIGHEST RESOURCE CENSUS TRACKS HAS ONLY  
11 BUILT 400 AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS IN THE LAST DECADE WHICH IS  
12 A THENCE AND PITTANCE AND FRANKLY EMBARRASSING. I URGE YOU TO  
13 RESTRICT PDA ACTIVITY ON THE EASTERN SIDE OF TOWN, WHICH WAS  
14 FORMERLY INDUSTRIAL SITES UNTIL 50 YEARS AGO. THANK YOU.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY MORE PUBLIC  
17 SPEAKERS FRED?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC SPEAKERS AND NO PUBLIC COMMENTS  
20 RECEIVED BY E-MAIL.

21

22 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU MR.  
23 SHORETT. LET'S GO TO ITEM SIX. OUR FAVORITE SUBJECT REGIONAL  
24 HOUSING NEEDS, MR. PAUL FASINGER.

25



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T HAVE A POWERPOINT PRESENTATION EITHER.

2

3 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** WE'RE ALL GOING TO BE DISAPPOINTED THAT  
4 THERE ARE NO POWERPOINT PRESENTATIONS. I'M JOKING.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOING TO GIVE A QUICK DESCRIPTION OF THE ACTIONS  
7 THE EXECUTIVE BOARD TOOK JUNE 18TH WHERE IT CONSIDERED THE  
8 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION PROVIDED BY HCD. THAT  
9 DETERMINED TOTALLED 441,176 HOUSING UNITS TO BE USED IN THE  
10 RHNA CYCLE. THOSE NUMBERS ARE NOT JUST THE TOTAL BUT DIVIDED  
11 INTO FOUR DIFFERENT INCOME CATEGORIES, VERY LOW, LOW TO  
12 MODERATE, AND ABOVE MODERATE. SO THE REQUIREMENT IS FOR  
13 HOUSING IN ALL OF THE DIFFERENT INCOME CATEGORIES. AND THOSE  
14 NUMBERS WOULD BE USED IN THE FUTURE AS THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY  
15 COMMITTEE IDENTIFIES AN ALLOCATION METHOD TO ASSIGN THOSE  
16 NUMBERS TO INDIVIDUAL JURISDICTION IN THE BAY AREA. BUT RIGHT  
17 NOW, THE HOUSING NEED IS ONLY OF THE TOTALS FOR THE REGION.  
18 LET ME SAY THAT THAT TOTAL OF 441,000 IS 135 PERCENT HIGHER  
19 THAN IN THE PREVIOUS CYCLE OF THE RHNA PROCESS. AND BY THAT, I  
20 MEAN THAT IN THE LAST RHNA CYCLE, THE TOTAL NUMBER WAS 187,990  
21 UNITS, AND NOW THIS NUMBER IS MORE THAN DOUBLE THE TOTAL  
22 NUMBER THAT WE SAW IN THE LAST RHNA CYCLE. IN PRODUCING THIS -  
23 - THESE NUMBERS, HCD HAS A VERY SPECIFIC METHODOLOGY THAT IS  
24 IDENTIFIED IN STATE STATUTE IN PRODUCING THESE PARTICULAR  
25 NUMBERS HCD USED A FORECAST FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE AND



MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 NOT THE ABAG FORECAST USED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT METHODOLOGY.  
2 THERE IS A VARIETY OF REASONS FOR THAT, BUT ESSENTIALLY, THAT  
3 IT PREFERS TO USE THAT NUMBER UNLESS WE PRODUCE A NUMBER THAT  
4 IS VERY CLOSE TO THE DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE NUMBER. CURRENTLY,  
5 THE METHODOLOGY FOR THE RHNA PROCESS ADJUSTS THAT FORECAST TO  
6 ADD FACTORS TO ADDRESS OVERPAYMENT AND OVERCROWDING IN THE  
7 REGION. AND THAT IS WHY, EVEN THOUGH THEY STARTED WITH THE  
8 DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE FORECAST, THE RHNA NUMBER, 441,000, ENDS  
9 UP BEING A NUMBER COMPARABLE TO THE ABAG BLUEPRINT -- DRAFT  
10 BLUEPRINT FORECAST. AND SO, AS A RESULT, THESE NUMBERS ARE  
11 SUPPORTIVE OF THE NUMBERS WE SEE IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AND  
12 THE ALLOCATION OF THOSE NUMBERS WILL BE TAKING PLACE OVER THE  
13 COMING MONTHS. THAT'S THE SUMMARY OF MY PRESENTATION. AND I  
14 WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS IF YOU HAVE ANY.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? I  
17 DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. ANYBODY HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR  
18 PAUL? OKAY. FRED, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
21 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

22

23 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** GREAT. GO AHEAD PLEASE.

24





MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENSES. GO  
2 AHEAD.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON RODNEY NICKENS NON-PROFIT HOUSING  
5 ASSOCIATION. ALSO A NUMBER OF YIMBY. I WANT TO MAKE PINT TO  
6 RECOGNIZE THE RHNA NUMBER IS LOWER THAN IT HAS BEEN IN THE  
7 PAST. THIS IS A MOMENT TO RISE TO THE OCCASION AND ADDRESS THE  
8 LACK OF PLANNING THAT HAS LEAD US TO THE SITUATION WE'RE  
9 CURRENTLY IN. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK STAFF AND THIS BODY TO  
10 PARTNER WITH US, AND THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING ADVOCACY COMMUNITY  
11 TO CONTINUE TO ADDRESS THESE CHALLENGES AND RISE TO THE  
12 OCCASION. THANK YOU.

13

14 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RODNEY. ANYBODY ELSE FRED?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KYLE KELLY.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I AM CURIOUS IF THERE HAS BEEN A RETROSPECTIVE DONE  
19 TO DETERMINE WHAT THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION HAS  
20 BEEN IN THE PAST. TO SEE IF IT HAS BEEN ENOUGH HOUSING FOR  
21 EVERYBODY WHO HAD HOMELESS OR CURRENTLY IN OVERCROWDING  
22 SITUATIONS. TO DETERMINE IF THE 400 K IS AN APPROPRIATE  
23 AMOUNT.

24

July 16, 2020



Association of Bay Area Governments

Serving the counties, cities and towns of the Bay Area since 1961

## MEETING TRANSCRIPT

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS ADAM

2 BUCKBINDER. GO AHEAD.

3

4 **KAREN MITCHOFF, CHAIR:** ARE YOU TRYING TO UNMUTE YOURSELF, MR.

5 BUCKBINDER? HELLO? IF YOU CAN'T HEAR US, UNFORTUNATELY WE

6 CAN'T HEAR YOU. I ENCOURAGE YOU TO SUBMIT YOUR PUBLIC COMMENT

7 TO MR. CASTRO IN WRITING AND HE'LL MAKE SURE WE ALL GET A COPY

8 OF IT. OKAY. WITH THAT I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER BUSINESS.

9 LET'S SEE. WE'RE ADJOURNING UNTIL OUR NEXT MEETING ON

10 WEDNESDAY SEPTEMBER 2ND, 2020. SO WITH THAT I'M GOING TO

11 ADJOURN THE MEETING. THANK YOU STAFF FOR ALL OF YOUR HARD

12 WORK, AS ALWAYS, AND THANK ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES ON THIS

13 COMMITTEE FOR TAKING TIME. I KNOW HOW BUSY WE ALL ARE. HAVE A

14 GOOD REST OF THE DAY. WE WILL SEE YOU AT ONE OF THE MANY

15 MEETINGS THAT'S GOING TO CONTINUE ON LATER ON THIS AFTERNOON

16 AND THIS EVENING. GO GET SOMETHING TO EAT. [LAUGHTER] BYE-BYE.

17 [ADJOURNED]

18