





## Adobe Acrobat Reader

### Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

#### To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:  
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

#### To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again  
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.  
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

### Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

**Note:** *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*



## Meeting Transcript

### **To select and copy it to the clipboard:**

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:

To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1       **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION JOINT MTC PLANNING**

2       **COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE.**

3       **FRIDAY, JULY 10, 2020, 9:15 AM**

4       **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO  
5       CALL THE MTC JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG  
6       ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. I WILL NOW READ THE ADVISORY. DUE TO  
7       COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR.  
8       PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER  
9       N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT.  
10      THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL  
11      UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY  
12      NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES  
13      BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA  
14      ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR  
15      ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS  
16      OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD  
17      USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL  
18      UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES  
19      WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE  
20      NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE  
21      THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION  
22      IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS  
23      BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING AT  
24      INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE  
25      POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN  
2 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE  
3 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS  
4 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE  
5 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL  
6 ACTION ITEMS. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ROLL CALL, ITEM ONE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN? HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY? COMMISSIONER  
11 CORTESE?

12

13 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GIOCAPINI, NON-VOTING?  
16 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

17

18 **SAM LICCARDO:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.

21

22 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT.

25



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1    **DAVID RABBIT, ABAG V. CHAIR:** HERE.

2

3    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SLOCUM? COMMISSIONER SPERING?

4

5    **JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

6

7    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER STRACNER, NON-VOTING.

8

9    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

10

11    **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** JESS, ARE YOU GOING TO TAKE THE

12    ROLL FOR ABAG?

13

14    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR ARREGUIN?

15

16    **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** HERE.

17

18    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

19

20    **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

21

22    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORTESE?

23

24    **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

25



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR  
2 MACKENZIE?

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MITCHOFF

7

8 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PERALEZ IS ABSENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR PIERCE?

13

14 **JULIE PIERCE:** HERE

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS IS ABSENT VICE MAYOR

21 ROMERO? LET ME CHECK IF HE'S AN ATTENDEE. THERE HE IS. LET ME

22 MOVE HIM OVER. VICE MAYOR ROMERO, CAN YOU INDICATE THAT YOU'RE

23 PRESENT FOR QUORUM? COUNCILMEMBER -- VICE MAYOR ROMERO? WE CAN

24 CONFIRM THAT HE IS HERE. I SAW HIM THAT HE WAS ON. A QUORUM



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WOULD BE PRESENT. AND MAYOR ARREGUIN, MAY I MAKE THE COUNCIL  
2 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT FOR ABAG?

3

4 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OF AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING  
7 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE  
8 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP  
9 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
10 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
11 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** JESS, DO YOU WANT TO DO YOUR  
14 CONCEPT CONSENT CALENDAR FROM ABAG.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ FOR ABAG I'M ON AS  
17 WELL.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WE'LL GO TO CONSENT CALENDAR  
20 APPROVAL OF JUNE 12, 2020 AND ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 0202  
21 ANSWERS REVISED PDAS DESIGNATIONS IS THERE A MOTION TO APPROVE  
22 THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

23

24 **JULIE PIERCE:** PIERCE MOVES.

25





July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** MITCHOFF SECONDS.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** PIERCE MOVES MITCHOFF SECONDS.  
4 ANY DISCUSSION IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. ANY COMMENT ON  
5 THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR PLEASE RAISE  
6 YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE. NO COMMENTS. ANY RECEIVED, MR.  
7 CLERK?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE RECEIVED.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** CALL THE ROLL CALL ON THE CONSENT  
12 CALENDAR.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. MOTION PASSES.

15

16 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL TURN IT  
17 BACK OVER TO CHAIR SPERING.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. NEXT ITEM IS MTC  
20 CONSENT CALENDAR. MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANYBODY THAT WOULD LIKE TO  
21 SPEAK ON ANY CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
24 THEIR HANDS RAISED AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS  
25 ITEM.



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** BRINGING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE  
3 MEMBERS. IS THERE ANY QUESTIONS? COMMENTS? IF NOT I'LL  
4 ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR

5

6 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED MACKENZIE DAVID RABBIT, ABAG CHAIR:  
7 SECOND RABBIT.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. WOULD THE  
10 CLERK TAKE THE ROLL PLEASE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S MOVE ON TO. JUST  
15 FOR CLARITY ARE THESE NEXT TWO ITEMS MTC? THERESE? OR  
16 SOMEBODY, CAN THEY RESPOND?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THE FIRST ITEM IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM,  
19 COMMISSIONER. MTC AND ABAG WILL TAKE INTEREST IN AND WE EXPECT  
20 CONVERSATION AROUND THAT. THE SECOND ITEM, FIVE IS AN ITEM FOR  
21 ACTION BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GOOD. I THINK IT'S GOOD ABAG IS  
24 IN ON THESE MEETINGS. WITH THAT, THERESE, WOULD YOU WANT TO  
25 HAVE SOME COMMENTS HERE ON 4A BEFORE WE GET STARTED?



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES ABSOLUTELY THANK YOU COMMISSIONER

3 SPERING. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, AND EXECUTIVE BOARD

4 MEMBERS. COMMISSIONER SPERING HAD A QUESTION AT THE VERY

5 BEGINNING ABOUT HOW THESE TWO ITEMS RELATE IS REALLY THE

6 REASON FOR ME WANTING TO DO A LITTLE STAGE SETTING HERE FOR

7 EVERYONE. BECAUSE TODAY IS A HUGE MILESTONE FOR OUR TWO

8 AGENCIES. AND IT'S COALESCING IN MANY WAYS, THREE YEARS OF

9 WORK, BEGINNING WITH THE GROUNDBREAKING HORIZON SCENARIO

10 PLANNING EFFORT. AS WAS NOTED, WE'RE HAVING TWO MAJOR

11 PRESENTATIONS REGARDING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. FIRST ONE AS

12 MATT MENTIONED IS AN INFORMATION ITEM BUT IT PRESENTS THE

13 OUTCOMES OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, AND YOU WILL RECALL THAT IN

14 FEBRUARY, WHICH SEEMS MANY, MANY A LONG TIME AGO FOR ALL OF

15 US. [LAUGHTER] QUITE FRANKLY. MTC AND ABAG DIRECTED STAFF AT

16 THAT TIME TO STUDY A SET OF 25 STRATEGIES FOR TRANSPORTATION,

17 FOR HOUSING, ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. AND THOSE WERE

18 ACCOMPANIED WITH A SET OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR HOUSING AND

19 JOBS TO UNDERSTAND HOW WELL THAT PORTFOLIO WOULD ADVANCE

20 REGIONAL GOALS OF WHERE WE WANTED THE REGION TO BE IN THE NEXT

21 30 YEARS. AND SO THESE STRATEGIES ARE THE FOUNDATION, REALLY,

22 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. SO WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR IS THE

23 BLUEPRINT FINDINGS OF TESTING OUT THOSE STRATEGIES, AND THAT

24 REALLY IS THE FIRST DRAFT, IF YOU WILL, OF PLANNED BAY AREA

25 2050 AND IT PROVIDES AN OPPORTUNITY TO REFLECT ON HOW THOSE



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 STRATEGIES PERFORMED AGAINST THE OLD, AND WHETHER WE NEED SOME  
2 REVISIONS TO MAKE IMPROVEMENTS TO THOSE STRATEGIES PRIOR TO A  
3 FINAL BLUEPRINT ACTION THAT IS SLATED FOR THE FALL. NOW THE  
4 SECOND PRESENTATION WILL FOCUS ON A KEY ELEMENT MOVING FORWARD  
5 TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND THAT IS CENTERED ON THE  
6 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT. REMEMBER, THERE IS FOUR:  
7 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ENVIRONMENT, AND THE ECONOMY.  
8 BUT, UNIQUE TO THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT, THAT IS DISTINCT  
9 BECAUSE IT IS SUBJECT TO FEDERAL PLANNING REGULATIONS THAT  
10 REQUIRE THAT ALL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS FIT INTO  
11 A FINANCIAL ENVELOPE CALLED FINANCIAL CONSTRAINT. AND THOSE  
12 ASSUMPTIONS ON REVENUE NEED TO BE REASONABLE, AND WE NEED TO  
13 DEMONSTRATE HOW OUR PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS FIT WITHIN THAT  
14 ENVELOPE. NOW THIS ACTION THAT WILL BE TAKEN -- THAT WE'RE  
15 REQUESTING THE COMMISSION TO TAKE, BECAUSE IT IS A UNIQUE MPO  
16 SPECIFIC REQUIREMENT WILL ESTABLISH A BASELINE FOR FINAL  
17 NEGOTIATIONS WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION PROJECT SPONSORS AS WE  
18 MOVE INTO THIS STATUTORILY REQUIRED FISCAL CONSTRAINT  
19 ENVIRONMENT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. BUT OVERALL, IT'S  
20 IMPORTANT TO MENTION THAT WHILE THERE IS A LOT OF DISCUSSION  
21 ON THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS OVER THE PAST YEAR DESERVEDLY  
22 THERE'S REALLY AGAIN ONLY ONE PIECE OF THIS FOUR SUBJECT  
23 PUZZLE THAT UNDERWRITES THE PLAN. AND, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE  
24 WORKED TO MAKE THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS MORE EFFECTIVE  
25 GOING THROUGH A COMMIT LETTER PROCESS AND THE LIKE THAT STAFF



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WILL SPEAK TO, BUT ULTIMATELY, THE COMPLIMENTARY,  
2 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ECONOMIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES  
3 WILL BE ESSENTIAL TO MOVING THE NEEDLE OF WHERE WE WANT TO  
4 TAKE THE BAY AREA AS A WHOLE, AND WHILE THIS DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
5 MADE SIGNIFICANT HEADWAY IN ADDRESSING THESE REGIONAL  
6 CHALLENGES, WE'RE GOING TO BE DESIGNING OUR VIEW THAT EVEN  
7 BOLDER ACTION ON ALL FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN FOR PLANNED BAY  
8 AREA 2050 MAYBE REQUIRED IN SEPTEMBER AS PART OF THE FINAL  
9 BLUEPRINT IF WE WISH TO MEET OR EXCEED OUR GOALS PARTICULARLY  
10 FOR REQUIRED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. I WANT TO SET THAT  
11 CONTEXT BECAUSE WE HAVE GOT A LOT OF INFORMATION THAT WE'RE  
12 BRINGING FOR YOU TODAY, AND WANT TO APPRECIATE HOW FAR WE HAVE  
13 COME AND BE ABLE TO PUT IT IN THE CONTEXT OF WHERE WE NEED TO  
14 GO. SO THANK YOU MR. CHAIR FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SET THAT  
15 STAGE.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANKS THERESE THAT'S A GOOD  
18 FRAMEWORK AND GOOD SEGUE TO DAVE VAUTIN, THE BRAIN FOR THE  
19 BLUEPRINT. DAVE, ARE YOU GOING TO START THIS OFF? >DAVE  
20 VAUTIN: YES CHAIR SPERING. AND THANKS EVERYBODY, AND GOOD  
21 MORNING. I WOULD ASK THE STAFF TO BRING UP THOSE SLIDES FOR  
22 TODAY'S PRESENTATION. THANKS TO THERESE FOR SETTING THE STAGE  
23 AS THERESE MENTIONED THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS THE FIRST DRAFT OF  
24 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO TAKE A LOOK AT  
25 STRATEGIES THAT WERE PROVED IN FEBRUARY AND CONTINUED TO



## Meeting Transcript

1 REFINE THROUGH THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE.  
2 SO THIS LINE HERE SHOWS WHERE WE'RE AT IN THE PROCESS IT  
3 REALLY IS THE CRITICAL MILESTONE AT THE CENTER OF THE PLANNED  
4 BAY AREA 2050 PROCESS. AFTER TWO YEARS OF THE HORIZON  
5 INITIATIVE IN 2018 AND 2019, FOLLOWED BY A ROBUST PUBLIC AND  
6 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS IN THE FALL AND WINTER WE HAVE  
7 NOW COMPLETED THE MODELING AND ANALYSIS FOR THE DRAFT  
8 BLUEPRINT. SINCE THIS IS A MAJOR MILESTONE FOR THE LONG-RANGE  
9 PLANNING PROCESS TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS A BIT LONGER THAN  
10 NORMAL AND I APPRECIATE YOUR INDULGENCE IN HEARING A  
11 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF CONTENT. THERE IS A LOT TO GO THROUGH  
12 LOOKING AT 30 YEARS OF STRATEGIES AND OUTCOMES. TODAY'S  
13 PRESENTATION WILL BE BROKEN INTO FOUR CHUNKS FIRST [ SILENCE ]  
14 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT BUILDS ON THE HORIZON INITIATIVE WHICH  
15 SEEMS MORE TIMELY THAN EVER. IT UNDERSCORES HOW UNCERTAIN  
16 FUTURES CAN POSITION THE BAY AREA FOR SUCCESS. WE STUDIED  
17 THINGS LIKE EXPONENTIAL GROWTH IN TELECOMMUTING OR CHANGE IN  
18 E-COMMERCE APPEARANCE. INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FLEX  
19 STRATEGIES AND ANALYZED MOST RESILIENT AND EQUITABLE ACROSS A  
20 WIDE VARIETY OF DIFFERENT FUTURES THIS EFFORT GAVE KEY  
21 INSIGHTS ON HOW TO PIVOT WHEN THE TRAJECTORY OF THE REGION  
22 CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE WHEN WE CREATE PLANNED BAY AREA  
23 2050 WE MUST ADHERE TO FEDERAL AND STATE REGULATIONS THOUGH  
24 MANY OF THESE FORCES ARE QUITE UNCERTAIN ESPECIALLY AT THIS  
25 TIME WE HAVE TO TAKE A BEST GUESS AT EACH ONE OF THEM AND



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1    THERE ARE SEVERAL DOZEN IN TOTAL THIS HIGHLIGHTS A FEE KEY  
2    EXTERNAL FORCES IMPORTANT TO NOTE MTC AND ABAG DON'T DO THIS  
3    ALONE IN FACT WE GO THROUGH A PROCESS OF THE CALIFORNIA AIR  
4    RESOURCES BOARD THAT SERVES AS REGULATOR TO THE PLANNING  
5    PROCESS AND WE HAVE TO GET THEIR APPROVAL ON DIFFERENT FORCES.  
6    THERE ARE MANY FORCES IN PLAY BUT I WANT TO NOTE MANY OF  
7    MOVING IN WHAT WE MIGHT CONSIDERED TO BE THE WRONG DIRECTION.  
8    A DIRECTION THAT MAKES IT HARDER TO ACHIEVE OUR REGIONAL  
9    VISION. FOR EXAMPLE, FUTURE DEMOGRAPHIC PROJECTIONS FOR THE  
10   REGION, REALLY LOOKING AT OUR -- THE REGION LOOKS WEALTHIER  
11   AND OFTENTIMES THE COST OF DRIVING FOR THE PROJECTIONS HAVE  
12   NOT BEEN GOING UP AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. WHAT THIS MEANS IS  
13   IT PUTS US FURTHER AWAY FROM CRITICAL TARGETS RELATED TO  
14   GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. EXCEPTION IS TELECOMMUTING OR  
15   WORKING WITH CARB TO AKSEL THE TRAJECTORY OF TELECOMMUTING YOU  
16   WILL NOTE 30 PERCENT OF OFFICE WORKERS ON A TYPICAL DAY WILL  
17   BE WORKING FROM HOME. OF COURSE NOT ALL BAY AREA WORKERS ARE  
18   WORKING OUT OF OFFICE AND WE ARE ASSUMING A 14 PERCENT CHAIR  
19   IN THE FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS YOU MAY  
20   RECALL WAS APPROVED IN FEBRUARY 2020 BY MTC AND BAG FOR  
21   ANALYSIS. COMPRISED OF 25 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR ELEMENTS  
22   OF THE PLAN AND ULTIMATELY WE SEE IT AS AN INTEGRATED PROPOSAL  
23   GOING BEYOND PAST PLANS FOCUSING ON TRANSPORTATION AND IN  
24   RECENT YEARS HOUSING. TRANSPORTATION PROJECT ARE JUST ONE  
25   SMALL BUT IMPORTANT PIECE OF THE PUZZLE. WHEN WE BUNDLE THEM



## Meeting Transcript

1 WITH OTHER TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES, HOUSING STRATEGIES,  
2 ECONOMIC STRATEGIES, ALL THESE THINGS NEED TO WORK IN CONCERT  
3 TO GET TO CRITICAL CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS. AS WE HAVE  
4 EXPLORED THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE SEE HOW IT'S NOT PROJECTS BUT  
5 STRATEGIES LIKE ALL LANE TOLLING, SENSIFICATION AROUND TRANSIT  
6 HUBS AND HIGH RESOURCE COMMUNITIES AS WELL AS SHORE LINES THAT  
7 DRIVE THE OUTCOMES FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS  
8 SLIDE IS SIMPLY A REFRESHER OF WHAT A STRATEGY IS. I WANT TO  
9 UNDERSCORE THAT A STRATEGY IS NOT A NEAR TERM REACTION OR  
10 LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL IT'S A SET OF POLICY IDEAS OR SET OF  
11 INVESTMENTS IMPLEMENTED OVER A 30 YEAR PERIOD OVER LOCAL AND  
12 STATE LEVELS. FISCALLY CONSTRAINED SO WE CAN'T INCLUDE EVERY  
13 STRATEGY IN THE PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. 25 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT  
14 BLUEPRINT RECEIVED TENS THOUSANDS OF COMMENTS. WE RECEIVED  
15 13,000 COMMENTS IN 2019 BUT IN PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WE HAVE  
16 INTERACTED WITH THOUSANDS MORE BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND NOTABLY  
17 WHEN WE PUT BELIEVE IT SOME OF THE KEY STRATEGIES FROM HORIZON  
18 IN THE PART OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PROCESS WE RECEIVED  
19 RELATIVELY POSITIVE RESPONSES FROM BAY AREA MEMBERS 90 PERCENT  
20 SUPPORTED THE STRATEGIES EXPLORED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. NEXT  
21 SLIDE. IN YOUR PACKET YOU WILL FIND A REFRESHER WHICH HAS ALL  
22 25 STRATEGIES LISTED OUT FOR EACH OF THE CATEGORIES. I'LL GO  
23 THROUGH THEM RELATIVELY QUICKLY. DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDED  
24 STRATEGIES TO MAINTAIN AND OPTIMIZE INFRASTRUCTURE BY FIX IT  
25 FIRST APPROACH FOR TRANSPORTATION BUT ALSO THROUGH STRATEGIES





July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 LIKE ALL LANE TOLLING ON SELECT FREEWAY CORRIDORS TO BETTER  
2 MANAGE CONGESTION IT INCLUDED INVESTMENT IN BICYCLE AND  
3 PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE AS WELL AS REDUCED SPEED LIMITS TO  
4 MAKE OUR ROADS SAFER FOR ROADWAY USERS OF ALL TYPES AND  
5 INCLUDED A SHORT LIST OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL TRANSIT PROJECTS  
6 THAT APPROVED SPECIAL HIGH PERFORMING FOR BENEFIT-COST AND  
7 EQUITY. WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDED  
8 STRATEGIES TO SPUR HOUSING PRODUCTION AND CREATE INCLUSIVE  
9 COMMUNITIES WITH GROWTH NOT JUST IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS  
10 BUT IN SOME TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AS WELL AND  
11 PRODUCE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING THROUGH DIRECT INVESTMENT BY  
12 THE PUBLIC SECTOR BY INCLUSIONARY AND PROTECTION POLICIES.  
13 WHEN IT COMES TO THE ENVIRONMENT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT  
14 BLUEPRINT IS THE FIRST PLAN THAT INTEGRATES COMPREHENSIVE SETS  
15 OF SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS FOR THE BAY & AS WELL AS  
16 PROTECTIONS FROM WILDFIRES AND THE LIKE. AND IMPACTS OUR  
17 ENVIRONMENT BY ELECTRIFYING VEHICLES, PROTECTING PARKLAND  
18 AGRICULTURAL LAND AND PROTECTING OUR URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES  
19 AND LASTLY ON THE ECONOMIC SIDE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDES  
20 STRATEGIES FOR ECONOMIC MOBILITY CHAIR CARE SUBSIDIES  
21 INCUBATOR PROGRAMS AS WELL AS STRATEGIES TO TRY TO SHIFT  
22 LOCATION OF JOBS AND WE'LL COME BACK TO SOME OF THOSE  
23 STRATEGIES LATER IN THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE. OF COURSE  
24 ALL THESE STRATEGIES WERE DEVELOPED BEFORE THE COVID-19 ERA  
25 THAT WE LIVE IN NOW. WITH A FEW POINTS I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ON



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 THIS FRONT, NOTABLY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS A 30 YEAR PLAN.  
2 BUT, WE ALSO KNOW THAT WE HAVE STUDIED MANY. FORCES THAT THE  
3 PANDEMIC HAS BROUGHT TO OUR REGION. AS I MENTIONED WE LOOKED  
4 AT HIGH LEVELS OF TELECOMMUTING WE FOUND MANY OF OUR  
5 STRATEGIES INCLUDING TRANSIT INVESTMENTS STILL PROVED  
6 EFFECTIVE IN THAT ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMIC SLOW GROWTH  
7 RECESSION AND FOUND OUR STRATEGIES WERE JUST AS ESSENTIAL IN  
8 THAT REALM AS WELL AS A BOOMING ECONOMY. SOME OF THE  
9 STRATEGIES SHOWN HERE ARE THINGS THAT REALLY SEEM EVEN MORE  
10 RELEVANT TODAY THINGS LIKE QUICK BUILD BICYCLE INVESTMENTS  
11 PROTECTIONS TO PREVENT DISPLACEMENT CHILD CARE FOR ESSENTIAL  
12 WORKERS. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDED AN EXPANDED SET OF  
13 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES APPROVED BY BOTH BOARDS IN FEBRUARY. WE  
14 EXPLORED NOT JUST PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS BUT KEY AREAS FOR  
15 HOUSING GROWTH AND ALSO TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND HIGH RESOURCE  
16 AREAS AND YOU WILL SEE HOW THIS HELPED US GET CLOSER TO KEY  
17 CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS AND THE RESULT IN A MINUTE. WE'RE  
18 CONTINUING TO PROTECT AREAS OUTSIDE OF URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES  
19 AS WELL AS AREAS OF UNMITIGATED HIGH HAZARD RISK. YOU WILL  
20 NOTE THE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND THE AREAS IN ORANGE,  
21 RED, AND BLUE. NEXT SLIDE. WHILE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS LESS  
22 ORIENTED TOWARDS INVESTMENTS AND DOING A FINANCIAL EXERCISE AS  
23 PRIOR PLANS IT'S REALLY A STRATEGY ORIENTED PLAN IT STILL MUST  
24 BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED AND FOR TRANSPORTATION THAT'S A  
25 STATUTORY REQUIREMENT. YOU CAN SEE A BREAKDOWN OF TOTAL COST



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 OF EACH OF THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN INCLUDING ASSUMPTIONS  
2 ABOUT NEW REGIONAL REVENUES THAT WOULD BE ESSENTIAL TO MAKE  
3 THE PROGRESS THAT IS SHOWN IN THE PRESENTATION. IN TOTAL THE  
4 DRAFT BLUEPRINT ASSUMING MORE THAN 200 BILLION IN NEW REVENUES  
5 SPREAD ACROSS THE FOUR AREAS OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. KEY  
6 CAVEATS HERE ULTIMATELY THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID NOT SPEND ALL  
7 THE MONIES HERE. DURING THE BLUEPRINT BORDER LINE PROJECTS  
8 THAT WERE STRIVING TO BE INTEGRATED INTO STRATEGIES AND THAT'S  
9 WHAT THE NEXT ITEM IS ALL ABOUT. WITH REGARDS TO HOUSING WE  
10 ASSUMED ROBUST INCREASE IN REGIONAL HOUSING MONIES BUT THERE  
11 IS AN ENORMOUS GAP THE ORANGE STAR SHOWS A GAP OF \$400 BILLION  
12 REMAINING WHICH WILL BE SOMETHING WE WOULD NEED TO CONSIDER  
13 HOW AND IF AND HOW TO ADDRESS IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.  
14 ULTIMATELY THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO THINK  
15 ABOUT HOW WE SLICE THE PIE SO TO SPEAK FOR EACH OF THE FOUR  
16 AREAS BUT IT'S ESSENTIAL TO REMEMBER THAT HOW WE SLICE THE PIE  
17 IS NOT ENOUGH. IN FACT THOSE LOW COST AND NO COST STRATEGIES  
18 WHICH SOMETIMES CAN BE POLITICALLY CHALLENGING BUT ESSENTIAL  
19 FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE AUGMENT OUR FINANCIAL INVESTMENT AND  
20 HELP MOVE THE NEEDLE IN A MAJOR WAY. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE WE GET  
21 INTO THE OUTCOMES OF THE LAST SLIDE HERE YOU MAY BE WONDERING  
22 HOW WE ANALYZE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND I WANT TO GIVE CREDIT  
23 TO OUR MODELING TEAM WHO SPENT MONTHS DOING THIS WORK WHILE  
24 SHELTERED AT HOME. MODELING INVOLVED BASELINE DATA PROVIDED BY  
25 LOCAL JURISDICTION [ SILENCE ] -- I WILL NOTE THAT I REALLY



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WANT TO UNDERScore THE POTENTIAL OUTCOMES GIVEN THE UNCERTAIN  
2 FUTURE OUR REGION FACES, WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO UNDERSTAND  
3 WHAT THE POLICY IMPLICATIONS ARE OF EACH OF THESE STRATEGIES.  
4 THAT'S REALLY TO INFORM DISCUSSIONS AS WE GO FORWARD THIS  
5 SUMMER. SECOND PART OF THE PRESENTATION WHAT ARE THE POTENTIAL  
6 OUTCOMES OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. BLUEPRINT MAKES  
7 NOTABLE PROGRESS TO PRIOR ITERATIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA.  
8 FIRST OF ALL THE FIRST LINE HERE, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS THE  
9 FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA THAT ACTUALLY BENDS THE CURVE ON THE  
10 REGION'S AFFORDABILITY CRISIS AND WE DO THIS AS A NOTABLE WIN,  
11 REALLY, IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE CHALLENGES BE WE HAVE SEEN  
12 WITH PRIOR ITERATIONS OF THE PLAN. SO AS YOU WILL NOTE THE  
13 AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD SPENT ABOUT 57 PERCENT OF THEIR INCOME ON  
14 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION IN 2015, WITH A STRATEGIES IT'S NOT  
15 ONLY FOR TRANSPORTATION BUT ALSO THE HOUSING STRATEGIES TO  
16 CREATE MORE HOUSING TO PROVIDE MORE AFFORDABLE HOMES MORE DEED  
17 RESTRICTIONS PRODUCTION WE'RE ABLE TO BRING THAT DOWN TO 48  
18 PERCENT. STILL SIGNIFICANT BUT WE'RE MOVING IN THE RIGHT  
19 DIRECTION AND THAT'S FOR THE FIRST TIME. EVEN BETTER FROM BE  
20 EQUITY PERSPECTIVE. WE SEE EVEN GREATER GAINS FOR LOW INCOME  
21 HOUSEHOLDS THANKS TO STRATEGIES SOME OF THE MEANS-BASED  
22 STRATEGIES AS WELL AS THE CONSTRUCTION OF MORE THAN 400,000  
23 DEED RESTRICTED HOMES WITH HOUSING REVENUES IN THE DRAFT  
24 BLUEPRINT. FURTHERMORE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT CONTINUES TO FOCUS  
25 GROWTH IN WALKABLE COMMUNITIES WITH FREQUENT TRANSIT SERVICE



## Meeting Transcript

1 BRINGING THE SHARE OF ALL HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA THAT'S A  
2 SHORT WALK FROM FREQUENT TRANSIT FROM 32 PERCENT IN 2015 TO 43  
3 PERCENT BY 2050. THE ENVIRONMENTAL GAINS IN THE DRAFT  
4 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES TO MAKE OUR ROADS SAFER AND MAKE SURE  
5 THAT ACTIVE ROADS ARE SAFE AS WELL SAVE AT LEAST 1500 LIVES  
6 OVER THE COURSE OF THE PLANNING PERIOD AND THAT SHOWS THE  
7 EFFICACY OF THOSE STRATEGIES BUT AT THE SAME TIME WE RECOGNIZE  
8 MORE WORK WILL BE NECESSARY TO GET TO A GOAL OF ZERO DEATHS.  
9 SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS AND HOME RETROFIT STRATEGIES PROVE  
10 CRITICAL IN ENSURING THAT 100 PERCENT OF HOMES COULD BE  
11 RETROFITTED, HIGH RISK HOMES COULD BE RETROFITTED FOR  
12 EARTHQUAKES AND WE COULD PROTECT 98 PERCENT OF HOMES WITH A  
13 SYSTEM OF LEVIES, MARSH RESTORATION AND THE LIKE FROM SEA  
14 LEVEL RISE. LASTLY WHILE THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT TAX REVENUES  
15 THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED TO PAY FOR INFRASTRUCTURE AND HOUSING  
16 ET CETERA, WE CAN CONTINUE TO SEE ECONOMIC CONSTRAINTS COMING  
17 OUT OF THE RECESSION WE'RE IN AS A RESULT OF REINVESTMENTS OF  
18 PEOPLE AND PLACES IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT  
19 BLUEPRINT INCLUDES 1.5 MILLION NEW HOMES AND 1.4 MILLION NEW  
20 JOBS. THESE FIGURES REFLECT THE INTEGRATION OF COVID-19 AND  
21 RECESSION IMPACTS THAT WERE UNDER DEVELOPMENT THIS SPRING. AND  
22 YOU WILL NOTE, MOST NOTABLY, THAT FOR THE FIRST TIME THE PLAN  
23 INCLUDED ROUGHLY ONE NEW HOME FOR EVERY ONE NEW JOB AND THAT  
24 REALLY REFLECTS ALL OF THE DIRECT INVESTMENTS AND ACTIONS ON  
25 THE HOUSING FRONT IN THIS PLAN DESIGNED TO BRING DOWN THAT



## Meeting Transcript

1 EXTREMELY HIGH COST OF LIVING IN THIS REGION. NEXT SLIDE. I  
2 WANT TO SHOW YOU A FEW BREAK DOWNS OF GROWTH APPEARANCE BY  
3 COUNTY. YOU WILL SEE BREAKDOWN OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AND  
4 RIGHT SIDE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT. A FEE KEY  
5 THINGS TO NOTE HERE. FIRST OF ALL THERE IS A LOT MORE NEW  
6 HOUSEHOLDS AND NEW HOUSING IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH IS  
7 WHY WE SEE PROGRESS IN THE KEY INDICATORS THAT'S WHY THE  
8 BUBBLES SCALED TO SIZE OF THE NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS ARE BIGGER  
9 ON THE RIGHT SIDE THAN THE LEFT. QUITE NOTABLE HERE IS THE  
10 DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES WHICH INCLUDE THINGS LIKE  
11 REDEVELOPING AGING MALLS AND OFFICE PARKS AS WELL AS  
12 INCREASING DEVELOPMENT CAPACITY NEAR TRANSIT AND IN HIGH  
13 RESOURCE AREAS, OUR ANALYSIS IS INDICATING THAT THAT WOULD BE  
14 TO SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER GROWTH PARTICULARLY IN THE SOUTH BAY  
15 PORTION OF THE REGION NEAR OUR REGION'S LARGEST JOB CENTER OF  
16 SILICON VALLEY. YOU SEE THAT SANTA CLARA REALLY ACCOUNTS FOR A  
17 SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE GROWTH SIGNIFICANT DRAFT BLUEPRINT.  
18 OTHER KEY THINGS TO NOTE HERE, THE DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS IS A  
19 LITTLE BIT SLIGHTLY A LITTLE BIT LESS FOCUSED IN THE BIG THREE  
20 CITIES AND A LITTLE BIT MORE FOCUSED IN WHAT WE CALL BAYSIDE  
21 COMMUNITIES THAT RING SAN FRANCISCO BAY, WHICH INCLUDE A MIX  
22 OF URBAN AND SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES. YOU WILL ALSO NOTE AT THE  
23 BOTTOM THERE IS SLIGHTLY LOWER SHARE OF GROWTH IN THE PRIORITY  
24 DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND THAT'S BECAUSE THERE IS MORE GROWTH  
25 HAPPENING IN OUR TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND IN THE HIGH RESOURCE



## Meeting Transcript

1 AREA THAN BEFORE. NEXT SLIDE. NUMBER OF JOBS PROJECTED IN  
2 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS SIMILAR TO THAT OF PLANNED BAY AREA  
3 2040 NOTABLE HERE AGAIN IS A CONCENTRATION OF JOB GROWTH IN  
4 THE SOUTH BAY WE'RE SEEING CONTINUED CLUSTERING WE'LL SEE SOME  
5 GAINS WITH REGARDS TO MORE GROWTH IN CENTRAL AND SOUTHERN  
6 ALAMEDA COUNTY THANKS TO THE JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE AND OTHER  
7 ACTIONS THAT HAVE TRIED TO MAKE THE JOBS HOUSING IMBALANCE  
8 BETTER ULTIMATELY THOSE DID NOT APPROVE SUCCESSFUL TO SHIFT A  
9 LARGE NUMBER OF JOBS FROM JOB RICH COMMUNITIES TO THE HOUSING  
10 AREAS OF THE REGION. LET'S TALK TRANSPORTATION FOR A MINUTE.  
11 PROGRESS ON MODE SHIFT AS A RESULT OF INVESTMENT IN BUS, BART,  
12 AND OTHER TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AS WELL AS A MORE COMPACT  
13 LAND USE PATTERN FOCUSED AROUND PUBLIC TRANSIT. OVER THE  
14 PLANNING PERIOD, WE SEE ROUGHLY 17 POINT REDUCTION IN AUTO  
15 MODE SHARE ASSOCIATED WITH PUBLIC TRANSIT, SIGNIFICANT GROWTH  
16 IN BICYCLING, AS A RESULT OF 7,000 MILES OF BICYCLE  
17 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND NOTABLE GAINS FOR TELECOMMUTING AS WELL.  
18 NEXT SLIDE. LASTLY SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTION WHICH I NOTED  
19 INCLUDES LEVIED, WETLAND RESTORATION AND OTHER SOURCE OF  
20 ACTIONS THAT COULD BE TAKEN TO PROTECT HOMES THAT ARE NEAR OUR  
21 BAYSHORE LINE NEED SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENTS ON THESE METRICS.  
22 WE WILL BE ABLE TO PROTECT ROUGHLY 89,000 HOMES THAT WOULD BE  
23 AT-RISK LEAVING 2,000 HOMES AT RISK WITH THE INVESTMENT IN THE  
24 DRAFT BLUEPRINT ALMOST ALL THE REGION'S JOBS WOULD ALSO BE  
25 PROTECTED BY THIS SET OF IMPROVEMENTS AND WE WOULD BE ABLE TO



## Meeting Transcript

1 RESTORE 100,000 ACRES OF MARSH LAND. LASTLY INCLUDE ACTIONS ON  
2 OUR REGION'S TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM EITHER ON THE SYSTEM TO  
3 ELEVATE KEY ASSETS OR A FEW MILES AWAY MAKE SURE THOSE ASSETS  
4 AREN'T INUNDATED. NEXT SLIDE. A LOT GOING ON IN THIS GRAPHIC  
5 BUT I WANT TO BREAK IT DOWN BECAUSE THIS IS A STATUTORY  
6 REQUIREMENT, AND IT'S FAILING TO CLOSE THE GREENHOUSE GAS  
7 TARGET GAP FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL PUT CRITICAL BILL  
8 SENATE ONE TRANSPORTATION MONIES AT RISK. LET'S START AT THE  
9 TOP BAR THERE. PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 HAD A 15 PERCENT PER  
10 CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGET FOR CARS AND LIGHT DUTY  
11 TRUCKS IT BARELY MET THAT TARGET. A LOT HAS CHANGED IN THE  
12 LAST FOUR YEARS WE HAVE HAD TO UPDATE -- ASSUMPTIONS WITH THE  
13 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. BAR BELOW THAT WE LOOKED AT IF  
14 WE READOPTED PLAN 2040 HOW WOULD IT PERFORM AND WE SEE THE  
15 UPDATED EXTERNAL FORCES THINGS LIKE GAS PRICES NOT GOING UP AT  
16 THE RATE AS ANTICIPATED EFFECTS STRATEGIES IN THE LAST PLAN IT  
17 DWINDLES BY 1 AND 4 PERCENTAGE POINTS LEAVING A LARGE GAP TO  
18 THE HIGHER 19 PERCENT TARGET THAT CARB IMPOSED IN 2018.  
19 LUCKILY THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT TOOK BOLD ACTION TO CLOSE THE GAP  
20 BUT THEY PROVED UNSUCCESSFUL THIS FULLY CLOSING IT. WE BELIEVE  
21 WITH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE COULD GET UP TO 12 PERCENT POINTS  
22 TO THE 19 PERCENT TARGET BUT IT LEAVES A SEVEN PERCENT GAP THE  
23 DRAFT BLUEPRINT INCLUDED NO MAJOR HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS SO IT  
24 REALLY JUST INCLUDED A SHORT LIST OF TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES  
25 FOCUSED ON PUBLIC TRANSIT AS WELL AS OUR KEY HOUSING ECONOMIC





## Meeting Transcript

1 AND ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES SO IF WE INTEGRATE SOME HIGHWAY  
2 PROJECTS INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT THAT MAY CAUSE THE GAP TO  
3 GET SLIGHTLY LARGER EXACERBATING THE CHALLENGES. NEXT SLIDE.  
4 THIS BRINGS ME TO THE 30 PARDON OF THE OVERVIEW OF THE DRAFT  
5 BLUEPRINT HOW DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ALIGN WITH THE FIVE  
6 GUIDING PRINCIPLES ADOPTED BY THE BOARD IN 2019? NEXT SLIDE.  
7 THE KEY OVERARCHING FINDINGS HERE. DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES  
8 REALLY EXCEL IN ENSURING THAT FUTURE GROWTH IS MORE EQUITABLE,  
9 MORE RESILIENT, AND MORE SUSTAINABLE, I WOULD SAY, THAN PAST  
10 GENERATIONS. HOWEVER, WE HAVE DECADES WORTH OF CHALLENGES THAT  
11 THE REGION HAS ACCUMULATED OVER THE 20th CENTURY AND RIGHTING  
12 SOME OF THE WRONGS OF THOSE DECISIONS WOULD REQUIRE BOLDER  
13 ACTION IF YOU CHOOSE TO DO SO IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE.  
14 NEXT SLIDE. YOU WILL SEE A DOCUMENT FULL OF METRICS AND EQUITY  
15 -- [ SILENCE ] ---ED GOOD NEWS YES THE STRATEGIES MAKE THE  
16 FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA THAT ACTUALLY REDUCED THE COST PERSON  
17 ESPECIALLY FOR OUR LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. WHILE THE DRAFT  
18 BLUEPRINT INCLUDES NEW TOLLING STRATEGIES THE INTEGRATION OF  
19 MEANS-BASED FARES HELPS ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES. SECOND WILL  
20 THE BAY AREA PRESERVE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING. YES INCLUDING  
21 MONEY TO PROTECT, AND PRODUCE ENOUGH UNITS TO ACCOMMODATE ALL  
22 THE FUTURE LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS THIS REMAINS WELL SHORT OF  
23 EXISTING REGIONAL NEEDS. WE HAVE HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF  
24 EXISTING LOW INCOME -- THAT BRINGS US TO CHALLENGE NUMBER ONE  
25 -- ESPECIALLY IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS WITH ACCESS TO SCHOOLS



## Meeting Transcript

1 AND PARKS ET CETERA. NEXT SLIDE. WHAT ABOUT CONNECTIVITY DOES  
2 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKE THE BAY AREA MORE CONNECTED? WILL BAY  
3 AREA RESIDENTS BE ABLE TO ACCESS TRANSIT MORE EASILY GOOD AND  
4 BAD NEWS YES FOR TRANSIT BUT NOT FOR MOTORISTS. SO ACCESS TO  
5 JOBS RESULTS IMPROVE FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT, OBVIOUSLY WITH  
6 INVESTMENTS LIKE IMPROVED BUS FREQUENCIES BUT THE TRANSIT  
7 LINES THOSE HELP IMPROVE ACCESS TO COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN BUT  
8 WE SEE RISING TRAFFIC CONGESTION INTO A SECONDARY EXTENT  
9 REDUCED SPEED LIMIT PLAYING A ROLE FOR USER TO GET TO JOBS.  
10 BAY AREA RESIDENTS HAVE TRANSIT THEY CAN RELY ON IT REALLY  
11 WOULD CONTINUE TO DEPENDED ON THE CORRIDOR AND THE OPERATOR.  
12 WE'LL ABLE TO MITIGATE MUCH OF THE RISE OF TRAFFIC CONGESTION  
13 ON CORRIDORS THAT HAVE THE ALL LANE STRATEGIES BUT SOMETIMES  
14 THEY'RE INSUFFICIENT TO MITIGATE THE EFFECTS OF GROWING  
15 POPULATION. WHILE TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING HELPS CONSTRAINTS IT  
16 WILL CONTINUE TO GROW ELSEWHERE ESPECIALLY ON EXPRESS BUSES  
17 AND OTHER RAIL SYSTEMS SO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT MAY NEED TO  
18 THINK ABOUT THOSE SYSTEMS AS WELL KEY CHALLENGE HERE IS HOW  
19 CAN NEW INCENTIVE STRATEGIES BETTER ADDRESS TRAFFIC CONGESTION  
20 AND OVERCROWDING THAT WERE LEFT UNADDRESSED IN THE DRAFT  
21 BLUEPRINT? NEXT SLIDE. DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT HELP PRESERVE  
22 DIVERSITY AND MAKE IT DIFFERENT IN THE FUTURE AND BE MORE  
23 INCLUSIVE? THE SHORT ANSWER HERE IS WE'RE FINDING HIGH  
24 RESOURCE AREAS IN PLACES WITH SOME OF THE BEST SCHOOLS IN THE  
25 REGION AND BEST ACCESS TO JOBS THAT THOSE BECOME MORE



## Meeting Transcript

1 INCLUSIVE OVER TIME AND BY REDUCING VARIOUS PRODUCTION WE HELP  
2 DEAL WITH LEGACY OF EXCLUSION REDLINING IN MANY OF THOSE  
3 COMMUNITIES BUT AT THE SAME TIME THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT LEAVES  
4 MANY TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AT RISK OF GENTRIFICATION. AND MANY  
5 BAY AREA RESIDENTS MAY NOT NECESSARILY BE ABLE TO STAY IN  
6 PLACE OVER THE LONG-TERM. RENTER PROTECTION STRATEGIES  
7 PROVIDES MEANINGFUL SHORT-TERM BENEFITS BUT OVER THE LONG-TERM  
8 WE SEE CONTINUED HIGH RISK DISPLACEMENT ESPECIALLY IN  
9 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. KEY CHALLENGE GOING FORWARD HOW CAN WE  
10 REDUCE RISK OF DISPLACEMENT SO MORE RESIDENTS CAN STAY IN  
11 PLACE. NEXT SLIDE. DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKE THE BAY AREA  
12 HEALTHIER WILL RESIDENTS BE SAFER AND HEALTHIER? SHORT ANSWER  
13 YES BUT MORE GAINS ARE NEEDED TO ACHIEVE THE GOAL OF ZERO  
14 DEATHS ON OUR REGION'S ROADWAY SYSTEMS WHILE PLAYING KEY ROLE  
15 EXTENDED STRATEGIES WILL BE NEEDED FOR THE ZERO VISION GOAL  
16 GOING FORWARD. NEARLY ALL HOMES AT RISK FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ARE  
17 PROTECTED BY THE INVESTMENT AND THAT'S KEY PROXIMITY. WILL THE  
18 BAY AREA ENVIRONMENT BE HEALTHIER AND SAFER. SEEING KEY GAINS  
19 FOR AIR QUALITY AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION IN THE  
20 DRAFT BLUEPRINT THERE WOULD BE NEEDED TO BE A CONCERT THE  
21 EFFORT IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR CLOSING THE GAP. NEXT SLIDE.  
22 SHOULD BE BAY AREA BECOME MORE VIBRANT GOING FORWARD? HOW DO  
23 WE BETTER BALANCE JOBS AND HOUSING? IT DEPENDS. ARE STRATEGIES  
24 EFFECTIVE IN SHIFTING HOUSING TO WHERE JOBS ARE. OR LESS  
25 EFFECTIVE TO SHIFTING JOBS TO WHERE HOUSING IS TODAY. EAST BAY



## Meeting Transcript

1 SEEING MORE LIMITED JOB GROWTH THAT MAY BE SOMETHING WE WANT  
2 TO SEE ADDRESSED IN THE FINAL STRATEGIES OF THE BLUEPRINT. AS  
3 WE HAVE COME OUT OF THE RECESSION TODAY WE EXPECT THAT THE  
4 THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO REBOUND ROBUSTLY AND WITH ADDITIONAL  
5 MEASURES EFFECTS ON BUSINESSES AND HIRING INDIVIDUALS THAT  
6 COULD SEE GAINS SHARED MORE EQUITABLY FOR ALL BAY AREA ARE  
7 THESE FINAL DRAFT BLUEPRINT IS THINKING ABOUT HOW AMBITIOUS  
8 STRATEGIES TO BE EMPLOYED TO SHIFT JOBS CLOSER TO THE REGION'S  
9 HOUSING. THE BIG FIVE CHALLENGES REALLY ARE WHAT WE ARE INTENT  
10 ON TRYING TO FOCUS ON TO TRY TO COLLABORATIVELY TRY TO PROBLEM  
11 SOLVE WITH STAKEHOLDERS OVER THE MONTHS AHEAD. THIS IS A  
12 BRAINSTORM OF INTRODUCING IDEAS FOR CHALLENGES BUT WE'RE  
13 INTERESTED IN LISTENING TO STAKEHOLDERS AND ALL OF YOU TO  
14 ADDRESS CHALLENGES OF AFFORDABILITY OVERCROWDING TRANSIT  
15 DISPLACEMENT GREENHOUSE GAS MISSES -- EMISSIONS AND THE JOBS  
16 HOUSING IMBALANCE. NEXT SLIDE. WE REMAIN COMMITTED ESPECIALLY  
17 IN THIS POINT IN TIME WHERE EQUITY IS AT THE FOREFRONT OF ALL  
18 OF OUR THINKING. SO LISTENING AND LEARNING FROM COMMUNITIES  
19 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE ALREADY BEEN OUT TALKING TO  
20 DIFFERENT COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS THROUGH FOCUS GROUPS  
21 IN THE BAY AREA. LISTENING TO THESE COMMUNITIES WE HAVE  
22 HIGHLIGHTED SOME OF THE QUOTES WE HAVE HEARD WHICH GIVE US  
23 SOME GOOD THINGS TO THINK ABOUT AND CHEW AS WE MODIFY  
24 STRATEGIES OVER THE SUMMER AND COME BACK TO YOU WITH THE  
25 STRATEGIES FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT IN THE FALL. WE'LL COME BACK



## Meeting Transcript

1 WITH SUMMARY OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT IN JULY AND AUGUST AT THE  
2 NEXT SEPTEMBER MEETING. NEXT SLIDE. FINAL PART OF THE  
3 PRESENTATION IS HIGHLIGHTING NEXT STEPS AS WE GO FORWARD FROM  
4 THIS MILESTONE. THIS DRAFT IN THE BLUEPRINT WAS MONTHS AND  
5 YEARS IN THE MAKING BUT NOW WE HAVE TO TURN AROUND A SECOND  
6 DRAFT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND IT STARTS WITH LISTENING  
7 AND MAKING STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. WE DEVELOPED A  
8 COMPREHENSIVE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER  
9 ENGAGEMENT CAMPAIGN FOR JULY AND AUGUST. WE'LL BE HOLDING A  
10 COUNTY SPECIFIC VIRTUAL PUBLIC WORKSHOP FOR EVERY ONE OF THE  
11 BAY AREA COUNTIES FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS IN MULTIPLE  
12 LANGUAGES, HOLDING THREE VIRTUAL STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS AND WE  
13 HAVE ALREADY HELD SEVEN FOCUS GROUPS WITH COMMUNITY-BASED  
14 ORGANIZATIONS WE'RE ALSO OFFERING OFFICE HOURS FOR FEEDBACK TO  
15 SHARE ON THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND MAIL IN AND A LISTENING LINE  
16 FOR RECEIVING FEEDBACK. A COMMENT PERIOD SET UP THROUGH AUGUST  
17 10TH AND VALID POLLS THAT WILL BE LAID OUT IN LATE JULY.  
18 ULTIMATELY IT COMES BACK TO THE STRATEGIES. WE WANT TO IMPROVE  
19 THE OUTCOMES WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT HOW TO ADD, REMOVE, OR  
20 MODIFY THE 25 STRATEGIES THE COMMISSION AND BOARD APPROVED FOR  
21 STUDY IN FEBRUARY. WE HAVE ALREADY STARTED THE WORK FOR THE  
22 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT AND YOU WILL HEAR MORE ABOUT THAT IN  
23 THE NEXT PRESENTATION. SO THAT'S JUST ONE PIECE OF THE PUZZLE.  
24 WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT ALL OF THESE ELEMENTS AND THE  
25 STRATEGIES INCLUDED WITH THEM. NEXT SLIDE. THIS GRAPHIC SIMPLY



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 SHOWS THE NEXT STEPS GOING FORWARD. WE WILL BE OUT IN  
2 COMMUNITY IN A VIRTUAL MANNER THROUGHOUT JULY AND INTO EARLY  
3 AUGUST. WE'LL THEN BE WORKING ON SOME STRATEGY REFINEMENTS IN  
4 AUGUST AND COME BACK TO YOU WITH A COMPREHENSIVE REPORT IN  
5 SEPTEMBER. WE ANTICIPATED MODELING AND ANALYSIS IN THE FALL  
6 AND BRINGING A SIMILAR SET OF RESULTS FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT  
7 TO THE COMMITTEES IN DECEMBER AT WHICH TIME WE'LL REQUEST YOUR  
8 APPROVAL FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR THE PROCESS OF PLANNED  
9 BAY AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. [ SILENCE ] DISTINGUISH ACHIEVING  
10 THAT THROUGH STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WHEN YOU SHOWED THE CHARITY OF  
13 THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES, THE PERCENTAGE OF ARE HOUSING THAT YOU  
14 HAD WAS VERY LOW FOR HOUSING. WHY ISN'T THAT NUMBER HIGHER?  
15 >DAVE VAUTIN: IF YOU LOOK AT THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, I'LL ONLY  
16 MENTION TWO THINGS. ONE IS THE GRAPH SHOWS THE SHARES SO FOR  
17 ALMOST EVERY COUNTIES THE NUMBER OF NEW HOUSING UNITS IS  
18 HIGHER FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT MORE  
19 HOUSING IN THIS PLAN. SHARES AS YOU SAY IN SOME OF THE  
20 COUNTIES ARE LOWER. GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FOR THE PLAN EXPANDED  
21 THE GROWTH PATTERN IN TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS  
22 THAT WERE NOT PLANNED PDAS LOCATED IN THE SOUTH BAY PENINSULA  
23 MARIN COUNTY AND EAST BAY. THAT DEFINITELY CONTRIBUTED TO THE  
24 ADDITIONAL GROWTH IN THOSE PARTS OF THE REGION.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** AUTO AFFORDABILITY HOUSING PIECE  
2 ARE YOU CALCULATING THE SUPPLY AND DEMAND? NONE OF THE  
3 JURISDICTION, NONE OF US BUILD HOUSING, WE ALL WANT IT, THE  
4 SUBSIDIES ARE SO HIGH AND RESOURCES ARE BECOMING LIMITED FOR  
5 BASIC SERVICES, STRUCTURE AND ALL THAT, HOW ARE YOU  
6 CALCULATING THAT PIECE TO FIND AN END SIDE OF IT. >DAVE  
7 VAUTIN: ESTIMATING HOUSING NEED IS VERY CHALLENGING, AND THERE  
8 ARE OTHER FOLKS IN THE STATE THAT ARE TRYING TO CALCULATE THE  
9 NUMBERS AS WELL. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A STATUTORY REQUIREMENT IN  
10 OUR PLAN TO PLAN FOR ALL THE REGION'S GROWTH AT ALL INCOME  
11 LEVELS. MANY -- WHEN WE DO FORECAST THERE WILL BE CONTINUED  
12 DEMAND FOR HOUSING ESPECIALLY WITH LOW INCOME AND INEQUALITY  
13 ON THE RISE. WE'RE TAKING FUTURE GROWTH PROJECTIONS FOR  
14 HOUSEHOLDS IN THE REGION LOOKING AT DEMOGRAPHICS AND WE  
15 BASICALLY QUANTIFY WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO ENSURE THAT FOLKS WHO  
16 ARE IN THE LOWEST INCOME BRACKET WHO, YOU KNOW, IS GOING TO BE  
17 THE HARDEST FOR THE MARKET TO SERVE THEM AS IT MIGHT BE MORE  
18 POSSIBLE ON THE MODERATE AND HIGHER INCOME LEVELS HOW MUCH  
19 WOULD IT TAKE FOR DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR EACH.  
20 THAT'S HOW WE QUANTIFIED AND IT'S A VERSION 1.0 TO GET US TO  
21 WHAT THAT MAGNITUDE IS.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. I DON'T SEE -- BOARD  
24 MEMBERS, OKAY. SO I GOT SOME HANDS. WE'LL START OFF WITH  
25 CARLOS AND THEN MR. HAGGERTY AND THEN MR. MACKENZIE.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** CHAIR SPERING, I CAN'T RAISE MY  
3 HAND BECAUSE I'M A COHOST BUT I WANT TO GET IN AFTER  
4 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. I GOT YOU DOWN JESS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CAN YOU REPEAT WHO IS FIRST UP?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** FOR SOME REASON SOME OF THE HANDS  
11 HAVE BEEN LOST. MARTHA WHO IS UP NEXT?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THINK YOU CALLED CARLOS.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I DID BUT HE IS NOT ANSWERING.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST UP IS COMMISSIONER CORTESE.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVE, DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT?

20

21 **DAVID CORTESE:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS.

22 ONE IS, I'M JUST WONDERING, IN TERMS OF THE REFERENCED OF

23 LOWER SPEED LIMITS AS A POTENTIAL GHG REDUCTION, IF THERE HAS

24 BEEN ANY THOUGHT OR DISCUSSION ABOUT HAVING A HIGHER SPEED

25 LIMIT OR PRESERVING THE EXISTING SPEED LIMIT FOR CLEAN AIR





## Meeting Transcript

1 VEHICLES IN A SORT SEPARATING OUT, SO THAT IT'S, YOU KNOW, WE  
2 HAVE OBVIOUSLY HAD SORT OF CONFLICTING MESSAGES OR TENSION  
3 AROUND TRYING TO INCENTIVIZE CLEAN AIR VEHICLES, YOU KNOW,  
4 WITH FREE EXPRESS LANE FARES AND THINGS LIKE THAT. BUT, WHICH  
5 IS SORT OF COUNTERPRODUCTIVE IN TERMS OF INVESTMENT, I'M  
6 WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY THOUGHT GIVEN TO SOME SORT OF A  
7 RECOMMEND OR A PILOT IN THE BAY AREA THAT WOULD SORT OF  
8 BIFURCATE SPEED LIMITS OBVIOUSLY WITHOUT CREATING ANY  
9 EXCESSIVE SPEED LIMITS BUT PENALIZING AT SOME POINT THE USE OF  
10 FOSSIL FUEL VEHICLES. >DAVE VAUTIN: IT'S SOMETHING WE CAN  
11 THINK ABOUT TO REFINE THE STRATEGY FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.

12

13 **DAVID CORTESE:** ANOTHER QUESTION, AND I DON'T MEAN THIS TO BE -  
14 - AND THIS I THINK IS PROBABLY FOR THERESE BECAUSE IT'S AN MPO  
15 KIND OF A QUESTION. IT WOULD CERTAINLY BE UNFAIR TO, YOU KNOW,  
16 SORT OF PUT ANY OTHER STAFF ON THE SPOT ALTHOUGH I'M REALLY  
17 JUST CURIOUS ESPECIALLY WITH YOUR SORT OF -- I'M ASSUMING YOUR  
18 NATIONAL EXPERIENCE IN LOOKING AT THE EVOLUTION OF MPOS, YOU  
19 KNOW, WITH, I CAN'T HELP BUT THINK WITH ALL OF THE GROWTH IN  
20 THE SOUTH BAY THAT WE'RE SEEING HERE BOTH ON THE JOB SIDE AND  
21 THE HOUSING PRODUCTION SIDE, AND THEN WITH SOME OF THE PAST,  
22 YOU KNOW, BEING FROM SANTA CLARA COUNTY, WITH SOME OF THE PAST  
23 GROWING PAINS WE HAVE EXPERIENCED, YOU KNOW, SORT OF A LITTLE  
24 BIT OF RIVALRY AND COMPETITION AROUND EXPRESS LANES, CERTAINLY  
25 WE SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH FEDERAL STIMULUS MONEY, AND



## Meeting Transcript

1 UNFORTUNATELY THAT ALWAYS SEEMS TO HAPPEN WHEN THERE IS  
2 LIMITED RESOURCES AND EVERYONE IS TRYING TO FIGHT FOR GOOD  
3 THINGS, BUT IS IT CONCEIVABLE AT SOME POINT THAT, YOU KNOW,  
4 PART OF THE BAY AREA REGION, FOR EXAMPLE, THE SOUTH BAY,  
5 GIVEN, AGAIN GIVEN THE PRODUCTION NUMBERS, YOU KNOW, PASS US  
6 TO SORT OF QUALIFY AS AN MPO ITSELF, IN ORDER TO PRESERVE ITS  
7 ABILITY OR THE OVERALL BAY AREA ABILITY TO MEET THESE SB 375  
8 REQUIREMENTS? AND AGAIN, I'M NOT ASKING YOU -- I'M NOT  
9 ENDORSING THEM I'M NOT ASKING TO ENDORSE ONE WAY OR THE OTHER,  
10 I'M JUST WONDERING IF THAT'S HAPPENING IN THE COUNTRY OVER  
11 LONG PERIODS OF GROWTH WHERE, YOU KNOW, ONE AREA OF AN MPO HAS  
12 SORT OF TAKEN OFF ON ITS OWN, PARTICULARLY ON THE GROWTH SIDE.  
13 OBVIOUSLY WE HAVEN'T HAD THESE KIND OF GHG REQUIREMENTS BEFORE  
14 IN THE HISTORY OF THE COUNTRY, ANY THOUGHTS ON THAT?

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. IT'S INTERESTING BECAUSE ONE OF THE  
17 THINGS THAT WAS A MAJOR DISCUSSION AT USDOT WHILE I WAS THERE  
18 PARTICULARLY FOR SECRETARY FOX WAS OF THE NOTION OF WHAT AN  
19 MPO SHOULD BE. QUITE FRANKLY ACROSS THE COUNTRY, YOU HAVE VERY  
20 LARGE MNOS LIKE OURS IN EXTREMELY SMALL FRAGMENTS MPOS THAT  
21 ARE, FOR EXAMPLE, IN NORTH CAROLINA, WHERE HE WAS FROM, AND HE  
22 SAW, FRANKLY, THE FRAGMENTATION BEING A SIGNIFICANT BARRIER TO  
23 ACCOMPLISHING THE TYPES OF INVESTMENTS AND PROGRAMS NEEDED TO  
24 MOVE THE NEEDLE ON THE PROBLEM. SO I THINK MAYBE THE SHORT  
25 ANSWER TO A VERY COMPLICATED CONSIDERATION QUESTION IS, WHAT



## Meeting Transcript

1 DOES AN MPO BOUNDARY MEAN. WHAT DO YOU WANT TO EXPLORE? THE  
2 BOUNDARY THAT YOU MIGHT POLITICALLY PUT AROUND AN ARENA FOR  
3 FINANCIAL PURPOSES, OR FUNDING RELATING PURPOSES, MIGHT BE  
4 VERY DIFFERENT FROM THE BOUNDARY YOU WOULD DRAW FOR THE  
5 PURPOSES OF PLANNING TO FALL REGIONAL PROGRESS. AND I THINK  
6 THAT'S THE DILEMMA THAT THIS QUESTION OF WHAT AN MPO SHOULD  
7 LOOK LIKE WOULD NEED TO CONSIDER. AND SO, I THINK, YOU KNOW,  
8 AGAIN, THE WAY MPOS HAVE BEEN DEVELOPED ACROSS THE COUNTRY  
9 OVER A PERIOD OF TIME, ARE A REFLECTION OF POLITICAL, YOU  
10 KNOW, POLITICAL CONSIDERATIONS, OR POLITICAL RELATIONSHIPS  
11 WITHIN ANY PARTICULAR AREA OF THE COUNTRY, CHICAGO, NEW YORK,  
12 BOSTON, YOU KNOW, WITH EXTREME DIFFERENCES IN, FOR EXAMPLE,  
13 CALIFORNIA. BUT I THINK IF YOU ASK THE BROADER QUESTION, WHAT  
14 SHOULD THE BOUNDARIES BE FOR REGIONAL PLANNING AND THE  
15 INVESTMENTS NEEDED TO CARRY OUT THOSE OBJECTIVES? IF YOU  
16 STARTED WITH THAT, I THINK THAT WOULD BE THE APPROPRIATE  
17 LARGER QUESTION TO BEGIN WITH, IN TERMS OF ANY, YOU KNOW,  
18 RETHINKING OF WHAT THINGS SHOULD LOOK LIKE.

19

20 **DAVID CORTESE:** THANK YOU. AND THROUGH THE CHAIR, I JUST WANT  
21 TO SAY, AGAIN, I AM OBVIOUSLY -- I HAVE OBVIOUSLY SPENT A  
22 GREAT DEAL OF MY CAREER IN REGIONAL GOVERNMENT WORKING TOWARD  
23 CONSOLIDATION AND SORT OF THE OPPOSITE OF FRAGMENTATION, AND  
24 YOU KNOW, THE STAFF MERGER FOR EXAMPLE, IS, YOU KNOW, I THINK  
25 SOMETHING ALONG THOSE LINES, BUT EVEN THAT AT SOME LEVEL WAS A



## Meeting Transcript

1 LITTLE BIT FISCALLY MOTIVATED IN THE BEGINNING, MEANING SHOULD  
2 WE SUBSIDIZE AGENCIES THE WAY WE HAVE IN THE PAST? OR SHOULD  
3 WE DO IT DIFFERENTLY? MAYBE IF WE CONSOLIDATE STAFF, WE CAN --  
4 OVER THE LONG-TERM, HAVE A MORE EFFICIENT APPROACH, AND I JUST  
5 -- I JUST WORRY. IT'S NOT WORRY, I GUESS. NOT THAT AT ALL. I  
6 GUESS I SURMISE THAT AT SOME POINT, YOU KNOW, FISCAL ISSUES  
7 MAY OVERTAKE GOOD PLANNING PRINCIPLES -- [ SILENCE ] STARTING  
8 TO CREATE A SORT OF A DIFFERENT MOTIVATION AROUND THINGS. SO I  
9 THINK IT'S SOMETHING TO PAY ATTENTION TO AS A FOOTNOTE TO ALL  
10 THE LONG-TERM PLANNING AND AROUND PLANNED BAY AREA. BECAUSE  
11 CERTAINLY SOMETHING LIKE THAT WOULD ALL OF A SUDDEN CREATE NOT  
12 ONLY A BIFURCATED PLANNED BAY AREA, BUT A PRETTY RADICAL SET  
13 OF ASSUMPTIONS AND OUTCOMES IN TERMS OF QUALIFYING UNDER SB  
14 375. SO THANK YOU FOR ANSWERING. AND I THANK MY COLLEAGUES FOR  
15 PUTTING UP WITH THAT LITTLE -- WE ARE LOOKING AT THINGS LONG-  
16 TERM, THAT'S WHY I BROUGHT IT UP BUT I REALIZE THAT WAS A  
17 LITTLE BIT PHILOSOPHICAL. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ON THE PLANNING SIDE DAVE, I  
20 DON'T THINK IT WOULD BE A GOOD IDEA BUT IF SOLANO COUNTY  
21 DIDN'T HAVE TO COMPETE WITH SANTA CLARA, I THINK IT WOULD BE A  
22 REALLY GOOD IDEA. WE HAVE GOT JAKE. A LITTLE LEVITY THERE.  
23 [LAUGHTER] JAKE THEN SCOTT THEN JESS.

24

25 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AM I UP? I THOUGHT HAGGERTY --



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD JAKE.

3

4 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I CERTAINLY APPRECIATE PAST CHAIR CORTESE'S

5 PHILOSOPHIZING. I THINK IT WAS WELL STATED AND WELL PUT.

6 ANYWAY. MY QUESTION IS A WE BIT MORE DIRECT. AND THE TIMELINE,

7 WE SAW THAT THE RHNA PROCESS WAS PARALLELING THE BLUEPRINT

8 PROCESS, AND I HAVE NOT BEEN ACTIVELY INVOLVED ON THAT ABAG

9 SIDE OF THINGS, AND THE RHNA PROCESS, BUT ARE WE -- AND THIS

10 GOES TO CHAIR SPERING'S POINT ABOUT NUMBERS AND THE DIFFERENT

11 PARTS OF THE BAY AREA, IS THIS SYNCHRONIZED AT THE MOMENT? ARE

12 WE ALL IN TUNE AS TO WHERE THE RHNA PROCESS IS GOING AND THE

13 NUMBERS COMING DOWN FROM SACRAMENTO? AND THE NUMBERS THAT

14 WE'RE PROPOSING GOING FORWARD, ADVANCING FROM 2040 TO 2050?

15 I'M JUST CURIOUS. >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. LET

16 ME BREAK IT INTO TWO PARTS FIRST IS TOTAL AMOUNT OF HOUSING

17 GROWTH. SO THE RHNA PROCESS UNDERWAY HAS A NEED NUMBER THAT

18 CAME FROM SACRAMENTO OF ROUGHLY 430,000 UNITS BETWEEN --

19 THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH OUR GROWTH TRAJECTORY. WITH THAT IT'S

20 SIMILAR TO THE TOTAL NUMBER. SECOND PART OF YOUR QUESTION IS

21 DISTRIBUTION OF THE GROWTH JUST YESTERDAY PRESIDENT ARREGUIN

22 LEAD THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND WE PRESENTED FOR

23 PRODUCTION FOR HMC TO CONSIDER AS PART OF THEIR PROCESS

24 ULTIMATELY IT'S GOING TO BE THEIR CALL IF THEY WANT TO

25 INTEGRATE THE NUMBERS THERE ARE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS THAT



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 THE RHNA METHODOLOGY BE CONSISTENT WITH THE PLAN DISTRIBUTION  
2 BUT THERE IS SOME FLEXIBILITY. IT'S A PRETTY FLEXIBLE  
3 REQUIREMENT. SO STILL THE SECOND HALF OF THE ANSWER IS IT'S  
4 STILL A WORK IN PROGRESS AND WE'LL KNOW MORE IN THE NEXT MONTH  
5 OR TWO.

6

7 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** OKAY IT WOULD SEEM TO ME THAT COMING TOGETHER  
8 WOULD BE GREATLY DESIRABLE. SO WE DON'T GO FORWARD INTO NEXT  
9 CALENDAR YEAR WAS BATTLING NUMBERS. THAT'S MY PHILOSOPHIZING  
10 FOR TODAY, SO FAR.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU JAKE. I HAVE  
13 SCOTT, JESS, THEN I'M GOING TO TRY CARLOS AGAIN, THEN CINDY.  
14 GO AHEAD SCOTT.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. FIRST OF ALL  
17 DAVE, I WANT TO SAY IT WAS A GREAT REPORT. CAN YOU -- IS IT  
18 POSSIBLE TO GO BACK TO SLIDE 11 SOME. >DAVE VAUTIN: TECHNICAL  
19 STAFF, CAN YOU PULL THAT UP?

20

21 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOU THERE GO. ON THE TRANSPORTATION  
22 ELEMENT YOU SAY THERE IS 463 BILLION IN EXISTING FUNDING AND  
23 63 BILLION IN NEW REVENUES. WHAT ARE THE REVENUE ASSUMPTIONS?  
24 >DAVE VAUTIN: FIRST THE 63 BILLION INCLUDES DOZENS OF EXISTING  
25 SOURCES INCLUDING SALES TAX MEASURES. SO THERE IS A LOT OF



## Meeting Transcript

1 DIFFERENT THINGS IN THERE. BUT WHEN IT COMES TO THE NEW  
2 REVENUES, I THINK THIS'S WHAT YOU'RE ASKING ABOUT WE ARE  
3 ASSUMING THAT A MAJOR REGIONAL MEASURE FOR TRANSPORTATION  
4 PASSES, AT SOME POINT DURING THE PLANNING PERIOD, THAT  
5 ACCOUNTS FOR A GOOD CHUNK OF NEW REVENUES, BUT ALSO THE ALL  
6 LANE TOLLING STRATEGY ON SELECT CORRIDORS THAT IS ANOTHER  
7 CRITICAL PIECE OF THE PIE THERE, AND A THIRD KEY SOURCE I  
8 WOULD NOTE IN THE NEW REVENUE IS SOME OF THE TRANSIT PROJECTS  
9 WE INCLUDE AS WELL AS EXPRESS LANE PROJECTS THEY GENERATE  
10 PROJECT SPECIFIC REVENUE, SO THERE IS KIND OF THREE NEW  
11 SOURCES THAT ARE IN THE LIGHT RED PART OF THE PIE.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SO WHEN YOU'RE ASSUMING REVENUE MEASURES,  
14 SUCH AS THE REAUTHORIZATION OF THE HALF AND FULL CENT SALES  
15 TAX, AND I GUESS IF YOU'RE LOOKING AT MAYBE A MEGA REGION TYPE  
16 MEASURE, HAVE YOU ASSUMED THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT THAT WILL  
17 GENERATE ON THE MEGA REGION ONE? I'M TALKING ABOUT THE MEGA  
18 REGION. I UNDERSTAND THAT YOU HAVE DONE IT FOR THE SMALL HALF  
19 CENT SALES TAX AUTHORITIES, BUT ARE YOU ASSUMING THE REVENUE  
20 FROM A LARGE TAX MEASURE? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES. WE ARE.

21

22 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HOW MUCH DID YOU ASSUME? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO  
23 WE -- WE ARE -- WE'RE NOT ENDORSING A PARTICULAR TYPE OF LEVEL  
24 BUT IN ORDER TO ESTIMATE THE MAGNITUDE, WE ASSUMED A \$0.01  
25 SALES TAX OR THE EQUIVALENT OF THAT.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** AND ARE YOU ASSUMING THAT THE -- IF WE  
3 LOOK AT THE MEGA REGIONAL SALES TAX MEASURE WHEN DO YOU ASSUME  
4 THAT IN THE PLAN? >DAVE VAUTIN: I SHOULD CLARIFY THAT WE --  
5 WHEN WE ASSUME A NINE COUNTY MEASURE IT'S -- SO WE'RE NOT  
6 TAKING MONEY FROM OTHER PARTS OF THE MEGA REGION TO PAY FOR  
7 THE PROJECTS WITH THE NINE COUNTY REVENUES FOR THE NINE COUNTY  
8 PROJECTS.

9

10 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** RIGHT I'M REFERRING TO THE NINE COUNTY.  
11 AT WHAT POINT DO YOU ASSUME THE REVENUE? FIRST 15 YEARS?  
12 APPROXIMATE SECOND? WHAT? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO BEFORE COVID, WE  
13 WERE GOING TO ASSUME IT EARLIER IN THE PLANNING PROCESS  
14 BECAUSE IT LOOKS LIKE THE POLLING WAS FAVORABLE EVEN IF IT  
15 DIDN'T HAPPEN IN 2020 MAYBE IT WOULD HAPPEN IN 20 22 OR 2024.  
16 WE HAVE TO CONVINCE FEDERAL AND STATE AUTHORITIES THAT WE'RE  
17 BEING FISCALLY CONSTRAINED -- [ SILENCE ] -- TO 2035 PART OF  
18 THAT IS DUE TO THE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET IS IN 2035 SO THE AIR  
19 RESOURCES BOARD WHICH IS ONE OF OUR REGULATORS GIVEN THE MEGA  
20 MEASURE WAS NOT MOVING FORWARD RIGHT AWAY, WE MOVED IT TO A  
21 DAY FURTHER BACK IN THE PLAN WHERE THEY WOULD HAVE FEWER  
22 CONCERNS ABOUT US ASSUMING A BUNCH OF NEW REVENUE THAT IS FOR  
23 PROJECTS THAT ARE REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS SO WE'RE MORE  
24 CONSERVATIVE ABOUT THAT.

25





## Meeting Transcript

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** -- GO AHEAD SCOTT HAGGERTY  
2 HAGGERTY FOR ME THAT'S A PROBLEM THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO  
3 ASSUME A NINE COUNTY REVENUE IN THE NEXT 15 YEARS WHEN MOST OF  
4 THE WORK IS DONE. YOU KNOW, COVID IS SLOWING US DOWN. YOU  
5 KNOW, THE NEWS REPORTS TODAY SAID THEY'RE PRETTY CLOSE TO A  
6 VACCINE, AND YOU KNOW, IT LOOKS LIKE IT'S GOING TO BE ABLE TO  
7 BE MASS PRODUCED. NOW I DON'T ALWAYS BELIEVE THE NEWS BUT  
8 THAT'S WHAT IT SAYS. STOCK MARKET HAS BEEN HOLDING RELATIVELY  
9 WELL. IT SEEMS LIKE INVESTORS ARE GOING ALONG WITH, YOU KNOW,  
10 THE THOUGHT THAT WE'RE GOING TO RECOVER, AND I THINK IT'S NOT  
11 REALLY FEASIBLE TO THINK WITH ALL THE WORK THAT'S DONE, ALL  
12 THE MOMENTUM THAT WAS BEHIND IT, AND REALLY, THE -- YOU KNOW,  
13 THE -- WHAT I HAVE HEARD IS FOUR YEARS IS PROBABLY WHAT IT'S  
14 GOING TO TAKE TO RECOVER, BUT TO SAY WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO A  
15 REVENUE MEASURE FOR 15 YEARS, I THINK THAT'S JUST TOO  
16 CONSERVATIVE FOR ME, AND I THINK THAT WE NEED TO RETHINK THAT,  
17 AND BRING THAT FORWARD IN THE FIRST 15 YEARS.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, THIS IS MATT MALONEY. I WANT  
20 TO AUGMENT WHAT DAVE SAID ABOUT THE REVENUES. IT'S DEFINITELY  
21 A BALANCING ACT ON OUR PART WE'RE INTENDING THE PLAN AS A 30  
22 YEAR PLAN TO BE ASPIRATIONAL FOR SURE IN BOTH PERIODS 1 AND 2.  
23 ONE PIECE THAT DAVE MAYBE DIDN'T MENTION IS THAT HISTORICALLY,  
24 IN PLANS OF THE PAST AND ALSO IN THIS PLAN, WE HAVE ALSO  
25 INCLUDED AN EXPECTATION FOR REVENUES FROM WHAT WE CALL



## Meeting Transcript

1 ANTICIPATED OR UNSPECIFIED SOURCES AND THAT'S JUST SIMPLY TO  
2 REFLECT THAT WE HAVE A HISTORY IN THIS REGION AND THE STATE OF  
3 DELIVERING ON NEW REVENUES THAT ARE UNEXPECTED. SO, YOU KNOW  
4 EXAMPLES LIKE SB1 LEGISLATION, CAP-AND-TRADE LEGISLATION,  
5 THINGS LIKE THAT. WE ALSO INCLUDE A LINE ITEM FOR THOSE TYPES  
6 OF REVENUE IN THE PLAN TO THE TUNE OF ROUGHLY STAFF CAN  
7 CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG IT'S ROUGHLY \$23 BILLION OVER THE  
8 COURSE OF THE PLAN WITH FLEXIBILITY IN PERIOD ONE AND PERIOD  
9 TWO. AS DAVE MENTIONED WE ALSO HAVE SOME REVENUES FROM THE ALL  
10 LANE TOLLING STRATEGY OCCURRING IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN.  
11 I THINK AT THE END OF THE DAY, WE ARE STRIVING TO BE  
12 ASPIRATIONAL, AND TO GET INVESTMENTS MADE IN THE PLAN, BUT WE  
13 ALSO NEED TO ENSURE THAT WE'RE COMPLYING WITH GOOD FINANCIAL  
14 PLANNING PRACTICES, AND ENSURING THAT THE FEDS AND THE STATE  
15 ARE ACCEPTING WHAT WE'RE DOING ON THAT SIDE. SO IT'S A NUANCED  
16 ANSWER. IT'S A BIT OF A DELICATE DANCE THAT WE TRY TO DO. IT'S  
17 A BIT OF A BALANCE ON COMPLIANCE WITH FINANCIAL PLANNING AND  
18 FEDERAL REGULATIONS AND BEING ASPIRATIONAL FOR INVESTMENTS  
19 THAT THE REGION NEEDS.

20

21 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MATT, I HEAR WHAT YOU'RE SAYING BUT AS A  
22 POLICY MAKER AND ONE THAT WOULD MAKE A DECISION ON PUTTING THE  
23 BALLOT MEASURE ON, IF I WAS AROUND AND TO MY FELLOW  
24 COLLEAGUES, ARE I WILL BE AROUND, I WILL NOT WAIT 15 YEARS TO



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 ADDRESS SOMETHING AS LARGE AS THAT, AND I REALLY BELIEVE THAT  
2 WE'RE BEING OVERLY CONSERVATIVE ON THE REVENUE ASSUMPTIONS.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. WE HAVE -- HERE IS THE  
5 ORDER THAT WE'RE GOING TO GO HERE. I HAVE GOT JESS, CARLOS,  
6 CINDY, JULIE, AND PAT ECKLUND. SO, JESS, JUROR UP.

7

8 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** JESS THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT  
9 TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR IMPORTANT WORK. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT  
10 MILESTONE. I HAVE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. THE 14 PERCENT  
11 TELECOMMUTING NUMBER, THAT MAY BE TOO CONSERVATIVE. WE ARE  
12 SEEING AN INCREASE IN TELECOMMUTING BECAUSE MANY BUSINESSES  
13 ARE NOT IN FULL OPERATION, AND THAT MAY BE A TREND THAT  
14 CONTINUES AND IT'S ACTUALLY SOMETHING THAT WE SHOULD CONTINUE.  
15 SO I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE FACT THAT WE'RE LIKELY TO SEE  
16 INCREASE MAYBE BEYOND 14 PERCENT, IN TELECOMMUTING REGIONALLY,  
17 AND THAT HAS AN IMPACT ON HOW WE ACHIEVE CERTAIN OUTCOMES SO I  
18 WANTED NOT ONLY OUR GHG DIRECTION OUTCOMES, ECONOMIC GOALS, SO  
19 I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT. I'M GOING TO ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES  
20 THAT YOU HAD NOTED REGARDING CHALLENGE ON TRANSPORTATION.  
21 GIVEN WHERE WE'RE AT, I THINK THERE IS GOING TO HAVE TO BE  
22 GREATER EMPHASIS ON TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUES. YOU KNOW, IN  
23 MY COUNTY, IN ALAMEDA COUNTY AC TRANSIT ANNOUNCED THEY'RE  
24 GOING TO CUT A NUMBER OF LINES THROUGHOUT THE SYSTEM  
25 PERMANENTLY UNTIL WHICH TIME THERE IS FUNDING TO RESTORE THE



## Meeting Transcript

1 LINES AND THAT UNDERMINES THE BROADER GOALS UNDER GHG  
2 REDUCTION AND INCURRING TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT ALONG  
3 TRANSIT LINES AND STOPS. SO I THINK WHAT IS GOING TO BE REALLY  
4 CRITICAL, AND I KNOW CHAIR SPERING IS LEADING THE TASK FORCE  
5 THAT'S LOOKING AT THESE ISSUES, I THINK WHAT'S GOING TO BE  
6 REALLY CRITICAL IS KEEPING THE EXISTING TRANSIT AGENCIES IN  
7 OPERATION, AND NOT HAVING THEM CUT SO MUCH, BECAUSE WE NEED TO  
8 RESTORE AND MAINTAIN THE EXISTING SERVICE WHILE WE'RE ALSO  
9 LOOKING AT EXPANSION OF TRANSIT INFRASTRUCTURE, EXPANDING THE  
10 NETWORK. SO I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT, AS THAT'S AN  
11 IMMEDIATE ISSUE THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH RIGHT NOW. AND  
12 OBVIOUSLY WE START THIS WORK BEFORE COVID BUT WE WANT TO LOOK  
13 AT THAT LENS. SO I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT. ON CHALLENGE FOUR  
14 REDUCTIONS, I THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE GREATER EMPHASIS ON  
15 DECARBONIZING TRANSPORTATION AND BUILDING SECTOR. AND THERE IS  
16 A LOT OF DISCUSSION ON MICRO MOBILITY AND IMPROVING THE BIKE  
17 INVESTMENT INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH IS GREAT BUT WE NEED TO LOOK  
18 AT HOW WE'RE DECARBONIZING NEW AND EXISTING BUILDINGS SIMILAR  
19 TO LEGISLATION THAT WAS PASSED IN MY CITY AND CITIES  
20 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, AND HOW WE'RE ENCOURAGING GREATER  
21 INVESTMENT IN LOCAL RENEWABLE ENERGY INFRASTRUCTURE, AND  
22 LOOKING AT THINGS LIKE MICROGRIDS AS A WAY TO PRESENT  
23 RESILIENCY WITHIN OUR COMMUNITY. SO I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT  
24 THOSE SORT OF RENEWABLE ENERGY AND GREEN BUILDING STRATEGIES  
25 AS WAYS THAT MIGHT BE HELPFUL FOR US TO ACHIEVE THAT



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 ADDITIONAL REDUCTION WE NEED TO IN OUR GHG GOALS IN ADDITION  
2 TO THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES THAT WE HAVE DISCUSSED. BIG  
3 THING AROUND CHALLENGE FIVE IS HOW TO MOVE HOUSING TO WHERE  
4 THE JOBS ARE. AND I KNOW THAT THERE WERE STRATEGIES THAT HAVE  
5 WORK BEFORE AND WERE UNDER CONSIDERATION. THAT'S THE CRITICAL  
6 THING, IN ALAMEDA COUNTY WE HAVE SEEN JOB GROWTH OR JOB  
7 CENTERS, HOW DO WE CONCENTRATE THE HOUSING THERE RATHER THAN  
8 CONTINUE BEING THE EXISTING PATTERN OF HOW THE REGION HAS BEEN  
9 BUILDING. THERE WAS A STATISTIC THAT WE'RE ASSUMING A 43  
10 PERCENT INCREASE IN MORE GROWTH NEAR TRANSIT UP FROM 32  
11 PERCENT. AND I JUST HAVE TO COMMENT THAT I DON'T THINK THAT'S  
12 ENOUGH. AND NOT ONLY TO REACH OUR GOALS, BUT REGIONALLY AND  
13 MAYBE THAT'S GOING TO REQUIRE BOLDER STRATEGIES BUT I WANT TO  
14 EMPHASIZE THAT WE SHOULD LOOK AT INCREASING BEYOND THE 43  
15 PERCENT. AND THEN JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS: HOW DOES COVID  
16 IMPACT OUR ECONOMIC GROWTH MODEL? JOBS? LOCATION? >DAVE  
17 VAUTIN: SO OVER THE COURSE OF THE SPRING, WE WENT AND  
18 INTEGRATED THE IMPACT OF THE RECESSION FROM COVID INTO THE  
19 FIRST TEN YEARS OF THE FORECAST SO WE TOOK AN IMMEDIATE AND  
20 SIGNIFICANT HIT ON OUR TOTAL JOBS FOR 2020 WITH AN ONGOING  
21 RECOVERY TREND THAT STRETCHES THROUGHOUT THE 2020S VERY KIND  
22 OF SEVERE IMPACT IN 2020, 2021, AND 2022. THAT EFFECTS THE JOB  
23 TREND LINE TO A LESSER EXTENT THAT IT AFFECTS POPULATION  
24 GROWTH TREND LINE AS WELL. THERE IS PREFERENCE CHANGES WITH  
25 COVID-19. THAT'S CHANGING. HOW DEMOGRAPHICS MIGHT CHANGE WE



## Meeting Transcript

1 DON'T HAVE ALL THAT INFORMATION AVAILABLE IN THE NEXT FEW  
2 MONTHS IT'S PROBABLY GOING TO TAKE YEARS TO REALLY BE ABLE TO  
3 DIGEST HOW PREFERENCES WILL CHANGE. WE HAVE DONE FORECAST  
4 OTHER ON BEST AVAILABLE INFORMATION WE HAVE AT THIS TIME.  
5 INCLUDING ECONOMIC FORECASTING TREND LINES. WE HAVEN'T CHANGED  
6 LAND PREFERENCES IN A MAJOR WAY AS A RESULT OF COVID JUST YET.  
7

8 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** OKAY. MY LAST QUESTION IS GOING TO  
9 SLIDE 21. SO IT LOOKS AT HOW PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 AND HOW  
10 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ARE MEETING THE VARIOUS TARGETS. SO EVEN  
11 AFTER THESE VARIOUS STRATEGIES, WE HAVE A SEVEN PERCENT GAP  
12 THAT WE NEED TO FILL TO MEET THE STATE REQUIREMENT OF 19  
13 PERCENT. HOW ARE WE GOING TO GET THAT SEVEN PERCENT? I THINK  
14 ON SLIDE 30 THERE WERE SOLUTIONS PUT FORWARD OF OTHER  
15 STRATEGIES THAT COULD BE IMPLEMENTED. IS THAT -- [ SILENCE ] -  
16 - THAT THAT GAP, CAN WE HAVE MORE TELECOMMUTING INCENTIVES  
17 MANDATES, OTHER THINGS TO GROW THAT SHARE AND GET CARB TO BE  
18 ON BOARD WITH A HIGHER TELECOMMUTING LEVEL? REALLY WE'RE OPEN  
19 TO IDEAS THAT'S WHY WE'RE DOING THE WORKSHOPS IN THE NEXT  
20 MONTH OR TWO.

21

22 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** THIS IS MY LAST COMMENT. THANK YOU  
23 FOR INDULGING ME. WHEN WOULD YOU LIKE SPECIFIC INPUT ON  
24 ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES? IS NOW THE TIME? OR WILL THAT BE IN



## Meeting Transcript

1 SEPTEMBER? >DAVE VAUTIN: NOW IS GREAT OR ANY TIME BETWEEN NOW  
2 AND SEPTEMBER.

3

4 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** ONE THING I WANT TO BRING UP, WE BELIEVE THE  
7 MICRO GRID IS AN IMPORTANT STRATEGY THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO  
8 WEAVE INTO THE PLAN POSSIBLY ONE UNFORTUNATE PIECE ABOUT THAT  
9 IS OUR GHG TARGET IN TERMS OF COMPLIANCE IS MORE NARROW THAN  
10 IT'S ABOUT REDUCING GHG IN LIGHT DUTY TRUCKS. THAT'S THE  
11 NARROW SLICE THAT WE HAVE. WE HAVE TO DEAL PRIMARILY WITH THE  
12 TRANSPORTATION SECTOR BUT MORE CRITICALLY IT'S THE LOCATION OF  
13 HOUSING AND JOBS THAT REALLY IS WHAT HELPS US GET AT THAT, BUT  
14 I WANTED TO MAKE THAT POINT FOR EVERYONE.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CARLOS, LET'S  
17 SEE AND THEN CINDY. CARLOS, BEFORE YOU GO, DAVID, DO YOU  
18 ASSUME THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS ARE GOING TO GO BACK TO  
19 NORMAL, PRECOVID-19?

20

21 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE. I JUST WANT TO JUMP IN HERE  
22 ALSO FOR THESE REALLY INSIGHTFUL QUESTIONS ON THE  
23 TRANSPORTATION. I THINK A NUMBER OF THEM WILL ALSO BE COVERED  
24 IN OUR NEXT PRESENTATION.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY.

2

3 THERESE MCMILLAN: JOE I -- SO I JUST WANTED --

4

5 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: OKAY.

6

7 THERESE MCMILLAN: FOR MORE HELPFUL CONTEXT.

8

9 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: JESS RAISED SOME ISSUES THAT NEED  
10 TO BE ADDRESSED. CARLOS, CINDY, PAT ECKLUND. CINDY YOU GOT YOU  
11 DOWN AFTER PAT.

12

13 SPEAKER: THIRD TIME IS A CHARM HERE.

14

15 JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. CARLOS. GOT YOU.

16

17 SPEAKER: I VOTE TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS THIRD  
18 PLANNED BAY AREA THAT I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED WITH, THIS  
19 INCORPORATES EQUITY ISSUES THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN THE  
20 PAST BUT ONE CAN SOMEONE ANSWER A QUESTION. EITHER NOW OR WHEN  
21 I FINISH MY QUESTIONS. WE BE DOING EXTENSIVE EQUITY ANALYSIS  
22 OF THE PLAN ONCE COMPLETED. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE ARE ALREADY A  
23 BREAKDOWN OF EQUITY PERFORMANCE SIGNIFICANT MATERIALS. WE HAVE  
24 TRIED TO BREAKDOWN THAT SILO AND SUBMIT INTO BROADER SET OF  
25 METRICS BUT WE WILL BE DOING A BREAKDOWN OF EQUITY ANALYSIS.





## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I NOTICED WE'RE PROPOSING OR STUDYING OVER  
3 1 MILLION NEW JOBS AND IT'S 5 MILLION NEW HOMES DO I HAVE THAT  
4 CORRECT?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S CORRECT.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** SO BASICALLY WE'RE TREADING WATER IN NEGATIVE PLACE,  
9 IN THE SENSE THAT RIGHT NOW, WE HAVE A HOUSING DEFICIT, WITH  
10 THIS PLAN, WE CONTINUE TO HAVE A HOUSING DEFICIT ASSUMING WE  
11 HAVE 1.4 MILLION JOBS AND ONLY GENERATING 1.5 MILLION HOMES.  
12 OBVIOUSLY THAT'S PROBLEMATIC. AND IF I LOOK AT THE HOUSING  
13 ELEMENT, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S PAGE 11, I HAD IT SOMEWHERE.  
14 IF I LOOK AT THE HOUSING ELEMENT IT PROPOSES \$100 MILLION IS  
15 THAT CORRECT? IN INVESTMENTS. AND IS THAT INCLUSIVE OR  
16 EXCLUSIVE OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE THAT AT THIS POINT  
17 IS NOT MOVING FORWARD? THE MONEY THAT'S ASSUMED THAT MIGHT BE  
18 THERE TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING ISSUE? >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT  
19 INCLUDES FUTURE OR REGIONAL COUNTY MEASURES TO FUND HOUSING.  
20 SO WE AREN'T ASSUMING THAT MEASURE IS HAPPENING IN 2020 WE ARE  
21 ASSUMING THAT SOMETIME IN THE -- DURING THE 2020S THAT THERE  
22 WILL BEGIN TO BE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURES TO FUND DEED  
23 RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING.

24



## Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** AND CLEARLY AS YOU'RE NOTING THERE IS STILL \$97  
2 BILLION UNMET FUND TO CORRECT THE REGIONAL MEASURE. THAT'S  
3 YOUR START THERE. 397 BILLION IS REMAINING EVEN IF WE WERE  
4 ABLE TO PASS THE REGIONAL MEASURE. SO IT'S A DAUNTING, CLEARLY  
5 -- I WANTED TO DISCUSS THE SEA LEVEL RISE PIECE. SO THE  
6 ASSUMPTION IN THE PLAN IS TWO FEET SEA LEVEL RISE, PLUS, I  
7 ASSUME, NORMAL 100 YEAR EVENTS. IS THAT THE RIGHT NUMBER? OR  
8 IS THAT THE RIGHT SEA LEVEL RISE? SO DOES THAT MEAN IN 2055 OR  
9 SOMETHING WE HAVE TO GO TO ANOTHER TWO LEVELS -- TWO FEET OF  
10 SEA LEVEL RISE, AND SHOULD WE BE PLANNING FOR SOMETHING HIGHER  
11 THAN THAT? BECAUSE THE INVESTMENTS INVOLVED TO GET US TO  
12 PROTECT THE COASTLINE OR THE BAY LINE ARE GOING TO BE REALLY  
13 EXPENSIVE, SO WHY NOT PLAN FOR A HIGHER SEA LEVEL RISE GIVEN  
14 THAT THE TRENDS ON GLOBAL WARMING ONGOING IN THE WRONG  
15 DIRECTION? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE WORKED WITH THE BAY CONSERVATION  
16 AND DEVELOPMENT FOR THE SEA LEVEL RISE ASSUMPTIONS, IT'S THE  
17 FIRST TIME WE HAVE INCLUDED A SET OF INVESTMENTS TO PROTECT  
18 OUR SHORELINE THERE ARE INVESTMENTS THAT WOULD BE NEEDED  
19 BETWEEN 2050 AND 20100, WE WANTED TO IDENTIFY AN INITIAL SET  
20 OF IMPROVEMENTS THAT WOULD BE NEEDED OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS AS  
21 A STARTING POINT.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YEAH I THINK MY POINT IS IF WE PLAN FOR TWO WE KNOW  
24 IT WILL BE MORE BY THE END OF THE INDUSTRY -- CENTURY ARE WE  
25 NOT SPENDING MONEY IN A WAY -- IN ANOTHER 30 YEARS. I'LL LEAVE



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 THAT. >DAVE VAUTIN: I SHOULD CLARIFY THE INVESTMENTS WE'RE  
2 MAKING ON THE SHORELINE TWO FEET PLUS FLOODING THEY'RE HIGHER  
3 THAN TWO FEET THEY'RE DESIGNED TO LAST MANY DECADES OR THE  
4 SECTIONS NOT IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WOULD BE FLOODED AT 3,  
5 4, 5, FEET SO PROTECTIONS COULD BE BUILT LATER ON.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** OKAY THANK YOU. ON ROAD PRICING, AND I THINK FOLKS  
8 HAVE BROUGHT UP THIS. ROAD PRICING STRATEGIES INCLUDE, SAID  
9 THE ALL TOLLING FOR ALL LANES, CORRECT? YEAH. I MEAN I DON'T -  
10 - THAT -- I APPROVE GOING IN THAT DIRECTION. I DON'T KNOW,  
11 HAVE WE -- WHAT HAVE OUR RESPONSES BEEN FROM THE VARIOUS  
12 GROUPS AND FOLKS WHO HAVE RESPONDED AS WE'RE AWARE THAT ALL  
13 TOLLING IS BEING ANALYZED AND ASSUMED TO BE ONE OF THE WAYS  
14 THAT WE REDUCE BOTH VMT AND GHGS? IT SEEMS LIKE THAT COULD BE  
15 AN EXTREMELY DIFFICULT POLICY TO MOVE FORWARD IF WE DON'T  
16 START ROLLING IT OUT NOW. IT'S COMING IN THE NEXT 5 TO 10  
17 YEARS. >DAVE VAUTIN: I FOR ONE WAS SURPRISED THAT WE DIDN'T  
18 GET AS STRONG OF A NEGATIVE REACTION TO THAT STRATEGY WHEN WE  
19 DID OUR FALL AND WINTER PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AS YOU MIGHT THINK.  
20 WE WERE OUT, YOU KNOW, AT FARMER'S MARKETS AND THE LIKE, AND  
21 THAT STRATEGY -- DISCOUNT PROGRAMS TO ENCOURAGE FOLKS TO, YOU  
22 KNOW, TRAVEL AT NON PEAK TIMES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. SO I THINK THE TELECOMMUTING PIECE, MAYOR  
25 ARREGUIN, DID A GOOD JOB OF, I THINK, ALSO IT'S PUTTING



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 FORWARD MY CONCERNS WHEN FACEBOOK SAYS THEY'RE GOING TO MOVE  
2 TO PERMANENT 50 PERCENT OFFSITE TELECOMMUTING, I THINK WE  
3 SHOULD BE LOOKING AT THAT NUMBER VERY SERIOUSLY, AND IF  
4 POSSIBLE EVEN POLLING THE LINKEDIN'S, AND POLLING THE  
5 EMPLOYERS WHO ARE RUNNING THOUSANDS OF BUSES TO SEE IF THEY  
6 ARE ALL GOING TO BE MOVING TO THOSE MUCH HIGHER TELECOMMUTING  
7 LEVELS. SO I CONCUR WITH MAYOR ARREGUIN ON THAT. AND THEN  
8 FINALLY, IN TERMS OF THE BAY AREA DIVERSITY ISSUE, SOCIO-  
9 ECONOMIC DIVERSITY ISSUE, IT REALLY DOES GO DOWN, I THINK, IN  
10 THIS APPROACH. AGAIN IT WILL TAKE BILLIONS AND BILLIONS OF  
11 DOLLARS TO BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND I UNDERSTAND SHORT-  
12 TERM BENEFITS OF RENT CONTROL AND HOW BECAUSE OF CONTROL WE  
13 FIND THOSE UNITS THAT ARE UNDER RENT CONTROL IN MANY CITIES DO  
14 NOT REMAIN PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE, BUT I THINK SOME FORM OF  
15 RENT CONTROL IS ON BOARD TO CONSIDER SOME OF THE AFFORDABLE.  
16 IT IS A BIT SHOCKING BASED ON THIS PLAN WE WILL HAVE REDUCED  
17 SOCIO-ECONOMIC DIVERSITY SOMEWHAT. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE  
18 THAT POINT. AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK. THIS IS  
19 THE SECOND TIME I HAVE HEARD THIS PROPOSAL, AND THE SECOND  
20 TIME A REVIEWED A HARD COPY, AND I FINALLY BEGIN TO GET IT. SO  
21 THANKS A LOT DAVE FOR POUNDING IT INTO OUR HEAD. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CINDY CHAVEZ.

24



## Meeting Transcript

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HI GUYS. THANK YOU FOR THE TIME. FIRST OF ALL, A  
2 LOT OF FOLKS HAVE SAID WHAT I WAS GOING TO SAY. SO I'LL JUST  
3 SAY THEY WANT TO ASSOCIATE MY COMMENTS WITH CARLOS AND MAYOR  
4 ARREGUIN AND ALSO DAVE, AND SAY TO THE STAFF, I THINK THIS WAS  
5 EXCELLENT. AN EXCELLENT BODY OF WORK. AND ONE CONCERN THAT I  
6 HAVE IS I THINK THE POINT YOU RAISED DAVE ABOUT US NOT  
7 UNDERSTANDING THE IMPLICATIONS OF COVID-19 FOR AN EXTENDED  
8 PERIOD OF TIME MAY REQUIRE US TO DO SOMETHING MORE  
9 SUPPLEMENTAL IN TERMS OF REALLY DIGGING INTO THE IMPACTS OF  
10 THIS, PARTICULARLY BECAUSE OF THE JOB IMPLICATIONS, AND THE  
11 DIVIDE THAT IS JUST GOING TO BECOME GREATER AND GREATER AND  
12 GREATER AND IT MAY REQUIRE US TO RETHINK A NUMBER OF  
13 STRATEGIES. SO I WANT TO ADVOCATE FOR A SUPPLEMENTAL DOCUMENT.  
14 SECOND, I JUST WANTED TO RAISE A CONCERN I HAVE THAT REALLY,  
15 AS IT RELATES TO HOW WE LOOK AT EQUITY, THEY THINK THE URGENCY  
16 AT WHICH WE LOOKED AT EQUITY MONTHS AGO, CAN'T -- IT CAN'T BE  
17 REFLECTED IN THIS -- IN THE DOCUMENT, I THINK JUST -- I'M NOT  
18 SURE IT CAN BE. BECAUSE I THINK THAT THE SOLUTIONS WE'RE GOING  
19 TO NEED TO BE PROTECTIVE, AND TO BE PROACTIVE ARE NOT THINGS  
20 WE HAVE YET EVEN THOUGHT OF. AND I THINK THIS'S PARTLY WHY THE  
21 JOB LOSS, THE AREA THAT JOB LOSSES WILL HAPPEN, THE FACT THAT  
22 WE HAVE SO MANY PEOPLE MOVING OUT OF THE AREA PRETTY  
23 DRAMATICALLY, AND I JUST WANT TO GIVE YOU ALL AN EXAMPLE. MY  
24 OFFICE IS JUST IN THE OUTSIDE OF DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE, AND WE  
25 HAVE A MIDDLE SCHOOL THAT'S RIGHT OUTSIDE MY WINDOW, THEY HAVE



## Meeting Transcript

1 LOST 120 STUDENTS FOR THIS FALL, COMING BACK, AT A MIDDLE  
2 SCHOOL, AND MOST OF THOSE FOLKS ARE MOVING TO, IT APPEARS, WE  
3 DON'T KNOW WHERE ALL OF THEM ARE GOING, SOME OF THEM ARE  
4 MOVING TO DIFFERENT PARTS OF SAN JOSE, BUT MANY OF THEM ARE  
5 MOVING TO SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY, MADERA, FRESNO. WHICH BRINGS ME  
6 TO MY LAST POINT, WHICH IS THAT, I WANT TO REALLY JUST  
7 HIGHLIGHT AND UNDERSCORE THE ISSUE THAT DAVE RAISED ABOUT  
8 WHETHER OR NOT IT MAKES SENSE FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO STAY  
9 PART OF THIS MPO WHEN SO MUCH OF THE IMPACT AND GROWTH WE'RE  
10 HAVING IS REALLY COMING SOUTH OF US. I MENTION THAT BECAUSE I  
11 THINK LONG-TERM, WE NEED TO BETTER UNDERSTAND SANTA CLARA,  
12 VTA, OTHER CITIES -- TO THE SOUTH AS MUCH AS WE'RE ALL  
13 RELATING TO THE NORTH. SO I FEEL LIKE WE'RE A LINCHPIN COUNTY.  
14 AND SECOND IS, I'M CONCERNED ABOUT HOW WE LEVERAGE RESOURCES  
15 GIVEN THE STRUGGLE OF THE COUNTIES THAT WE ALL REPRESENT AND  
16 WHAT THE IMPLICATIONS ARE FOR US STOPPING THAT WHAT I'M  
17 PRESUMING IS GOING TO HAVE BIG IMPLICATIONS FOR THE  
18 ENVIRONMENT OVERALL, BOTH FROM A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION  
19 PERSPECTIVE BUT ALSO BECAUSE WE KNOW AIR QUALITY IN THAT  
20 REGION JUST NEXT DOOR IS EVEN WORSE THAN OUR AIR QUALITY. SO I  
21 PUT THAT OUT FOR MY COLLEAGUES. BECAUSE I JUST WANTED YOU ALL  
22 TO BE AWARE THAT'S SOMETHING I REALLY HAVE BEEN GIVING A LOT  
23 OF THOUGHT TO BECAUSE I THINK -- AND HONESTLY, COVID-19 HAS  
24 ADVANCED MY THINKING AROUND THAT EVEN MORE AND I'LL BE  
25 INTERESTED, AS YOU CONTINUE YOUR RESEARCH, TO BETTER



## Meeting Transcript

1 UNDERSTAND THE IMPLICATIONS OF THAT BORDER FOR US AS IT  
2 RELATES TO HOW WE DO PLANNING REGIONALLY, BUT ALSO IN SANTA  
3 CLARA COUNTY. SO THANKS. GOOD WORK YOU GUYS, REALLY AMAZING.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU CINDY. JULIE, AND THEN  
6 PAT ECKLUND.

7

8 **JULIE PIERCE:** I WILL AGREE WITH CARLOS, SEEING THIS FOR THE  
9 SECOND TIME IS REALLY HELPFUL. WE SAW THIS YESTERDAY AT THE  
10 HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE AND WENT WAY BEYOND THAT AND I  
11 WOULD RECOMMEND THOSE OF YOU WHO WANT TO UNDERSTAND HOW THIS  
12 ALL WORKS TOGETHER, TAKE A LOOK AT THAT MEETING. WE NEED THAT.  
13 THANK YOU TO STAFF. THIS IS A VERY COMPREHENSIVE PRESENTATION.  
14 I WILL AGREE WITH THE PREVIOUS SPEAKERS THAT I THINK WE'RE  
15 BEING TOO CONSERVATIVE IN SOME OF OUR ASSUMPTIONS, IF WE'RE  
16 GOING TO STAND ANY CHANCE OF MAKING ANY OF THESE TARGETS,  
17 HOUSING INCLUDED, WE HAVE GOT TO FIND MONEY SOONER THAN LATER.  
18 AND FIGURE OUT HOW TO DO THAT, AND THAT'S WHERE SOME OF OUR  
19 PARTNERS MAY BECOME INVOLVED IN THAT. I THINK ONE OF THOSE  
20 THINGS THAT IS PROBABLY TOO CONSERVATIVE IS THE AMOUNT OF  
21 PERMANENT TELECOMMUTING, I THINK THAT'S BEEN REFERRED TO  
22 BEFORE. I REALLY DO THINK THERE ARE GOING TO BE MANY COMPANIES  
23 WHO ARE GOING TO LOOK TO EXPAND ON THAT AFTER THIS EXPERIENCE  
24 AND MAKE IT MORE OF A FORMAL PART OF THEIR WAY OF BUSINESS, AT  
25 LEAST I WOULD HOPE SO. I HOPE THEY DON'T JUST THINK WE CAN GO



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 BACK TO THE OLD NORMAL AND EXACERBATE THE PROBLEMS THAT WE  
2 HAVE. I DO THINK THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT THIS BOARD IS  
3 GOING TO HAVE TO GRAPPLE WITH, AND THIS COMES OUT OF THE  
4 HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE MEETING YESTERDAY, IS WHAT WE  
5 USE AS A BASE FOR OUR RHNA. BECAUSE THE DIFFERENT -- [ SILENCE  
6 ] THOROUGHLY RESEARCHED PLAN AS THE BASIS FOR OUR RHNA, AND  
7 TIE THEM TIGHTLY TOGETHER, WE WILL REGRET THE OUTCOME. I JUST  
8 -- I JUST DON'T THINK THAT WE CAN ASSUME, YES WE WOULD LIKE TO  
9 MOVE THE JOBS TO WHERE THE HOUSES ALREADY ARE. WE HAVE SEEN  
10 THAT SO FAR THAT'S NOT WORKING. AND IT'S BEEN SUGGESTED THAT  
11 WE ADD CORPORATE HEAD TAXES, THAT WE ADD GROWTH CAPS ON JOBS  
12 IN THE AREAS THAT ARE ALREADY JOB RICH. WHILE THAT SOUND LIKE  
13 IT MIGHT WORK, MY CONCERN IS, THEY'RE GOING TO FLEET -- FLEE  
14 THE STATE BECAUSE THEY CAN TELECOMMUTE. I HAVE GOT A GREAT  
15 NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN CLAYTON WHO WORK DIRECTLY FOR MICROSOFT IN  
16 SEATTLE FROM THEIR HOME ALL THE TIME. THEY GO UP MAYBE ONCE A  
17 QUARTER FOR A MEETING. OUR COMPANIES IN SILICON VALLEY CAN DO  
18 THE SAME THING. THEY CAN SPREAD THEIR WORKERS ALL OVER THE  
19 COUNTRY. SO IF WE GET TOO PUSHY ON THEM, THEY MAY FLEE THE  
20 STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND ALL OF OUR EXPENSES IN LIEU OF MOVING  
21 THE EAST BAY AND NORTH BAY WHERE WE WOULD REALLY LIKE THEM. I  
22 THINK WE NEED TO CONSIDER WHETHER THAT'S A POSSIBILITY OR NOT  
23 AND I'M NOT SURE WE'RE BEING REALISTIC ABOUT THAT. AS MUCH AS  
24 I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE ALL OF THE JOB CENTERS COME BACK TO THE  
25 EAST BAY I'M NOT SURE WE CAN GET THEM. SO MY TWO CENTS.





July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1    THANKS. THANK YOU JULIE. PAT ECKLUND, THEN MAYOR LICCARDO, AND  
2    SCOTT I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP AGAIN YOU'LL  
3    FOLLOW MAYOR LICCARDO. PAT.

4

5    **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** PAT ALREADY TALKED. SHE ALREADY TALKED  
6    JIM.

7

8    **PAT ECKLUND:** CAN YOU HEAR ME? THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING FOR  
9    ALLOWING ME TO MAKE A COMMENT, AND THEN ALSO TO ASK A  
10   QUESTION. FIRST OF ALL, I AGREE WITH SEVERAL OF THE SPEAKERS  
11   AHEAD THAT MENTION THAT WE'RE UNDERESTIMATING THE CONVERSION  
12   TO TELECOMMUTING. I THINK 14 PERCENT IS WAY TOO CONSERVATIVE.  
13   I THINK ONE THING THAT COVID HAS TAUGHT US IS THAT WE CAN DO  
14   OUR JOB BY NOT HAVING TO NECESSARILY GO TO WORK. AND I THINK  
15   THAT HAVING A MORE REALISTIC TELECOMMUTING ASSUMPTION WILL  
16   HAVE TREMENDOUS IMPACTS ON TRANSIT NEEDS AND ALSO LOCATION OF  
17   JOB CENTERS, AND I THINK THAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE ANALYZED. SO  
18   THAT I WANTED TO REITERATE THAT. QUESTION I HAVE IS ALREADY  
19   BEEN MENTIONED TO SOME DEGREE, THE DISCUSSIONS YESTERDAY AT  
20   THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE WAS PRETTY SURPRISING IN  
21   THAT MANY OF THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS ARE NOT INCLINED TO WANT TO  
22   USE THE BLUEPRINT AS A MEANS OF DISTRIBUTING THE HOUSING, EVEN  
23   THOUGH I THINK EVERYBODY THEORETICALLY AGREES WITH THE FACT  
24   THAT HOUSING SHOULD GO WHERE THE JOBS ARE, BUT THAT'S NOT  
25   WHERE THEY'RE HEADED. SO IF THE METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE



## Meeting Transcript

1 RECOMMENDS TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE  
2 BOARD AGREES NOT TO USE THE BLUEPRINT FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF  
3 THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION THAT GOES THROUGH 2030,  
4 WHICH IS ACTUALLY WHAT? TWO MORE PLANNED BAY AREAS? MY  
5 QUESTION TO YOU, DAVE, IS THAT IS THERE A WAY FOR YOU TO DO AN  
6 ANALYSIS OF WHAT IMPACT THAT MAY HAVE TO OUR ASSUMPTIONS IN  
7 ACHIEVING THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IN BECAUSE AS YOU AND  
8 MATT ARTICULATED, IS THAT OUR SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGY  
9 IS REALLY LOOKING AT THE LAND USE IMPLICATIONS THUS COMMUTING  
10 TO JOBS, CARS AND STUFF LIKE THAT, WHAT IMPACT THAT'S GOING TO  
11 HAVE ON REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IF WE DON'T USE THE  
12 BLUEPRINT CAN YOU DO ANALYSIS TO SEE WHAT THE IMPACT IS TO  
13 ACHIEVING OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS? >DAVE VAUTIN: THAT'S A  
14 GREAT QUESTION. IT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT WE CAN JUST DO RIGHT  
15 OFF THE BAT OR THAT'S VERY EASY I THINK WE NEED TO MULL THAT  
16 OVER MORE BEFORE WE CAN PROVIDE A THOUGHTFUL RESPONSE ON THAT.  
17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** I GUESS, JUST FOLLOWING UP, I THINK THAT THAT'S  
19 VERY IMPORTANT TO HAVE THAT, BECAUSE THE METHODOLOGY  
20 COMMITTEE, AND ESPECIALLY THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD NEEDS TO  
21 HAVE A BETTER UNDERSTANDING. BECAUSE IF ALL THE ASSUMPTIONS IN  
22 PLANNED BAY AREA ARE THAT YOU'RE FOCUSING THE HOUSING WHERE  
23 THE JOBS ARE, AND THAT'S NOT GOING TO HAPPEN UNTIL THIS NEXT  
24 RHNA CYCLE, WHICH IS BEYOND 2030, YOU'RE ESSENTIALLY  
25 COMMITTING US FOR THE NEXT TWO PLANNED BAY AREAS OR MORE, TO A



## Meeting Transcript

1 PATTERN OF DEVELOPMENT THAT DOES NOT SUPPORT -- I DON'T KNOW  
2 HOW MUCH WE'RE SPENDING ON PLANNED BAY AREA -- BUT IT'S NOT  
3 SUPPORTING WHAT YOU'RE SHOWING US IN THIS PLAN. SO I THINK  
4 THAT'S REALLY CRITICAL. AND I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO KNOW AT  
5 WHAT POINT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE THAT ANALYSIS. BECAUSE I THINK  
6 THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE DECISION MAKERS.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY IS THAT IT, PAT?

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR SPERING.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I THINK DAVE IS GOING TO HAVE TO  
13 AT LEAST CONSIDER THE POTENTIAL OF HAVING THIS CONFLICT SO AT  
14 SOME POINT THERE HAS TO BE CONSIDERATION FOR THAT. MAYOR  
15 LICCARDO, SAM ARE YOU ON THE LINE?

16

17 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES THANKS JIM. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT TOPIC ALL  
18 THE GOOD QUESTIONS THAT HAVE COME UP. DAVE THANKS FOR THE  
19 GREAT WORK. IT'S HARD TO MISS THIS IS A HUGE AMOUNT OF JOBS  
20 AND HOUSING GROWTH IS FOCUSED IN SANTA CLARA AND SOUTH BAY. SO  
21 I WANTED TO GET TO THE MICRO FOR A MOMENT. IF YOU LOOK AT  
22 ATTACHMENT C OF THE REPORT, IN THE SECOND QUESTION THAT'S  
23 POSED IN THOSE SLIDES IS HOW DOES THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
24 INFLUENCE REGIONAL GROWTH PATTERNS. WHAT YOU SEE IS ROUGHLY  
25 TWO DOZEN GEOGRAPHIC AREAS BROKEN OFF, AND I'M NOT SURE HOW



## Meeting Transcript

1 THOSE LINES WERE CREATED BECAUSE IT APPEARS OBVIOUSLY TO  
2 SPREAD ACROSS MULTIPLE JURISDICTION, BUT YOU WILL PRETTY  
3 QUICKLY NOTE AS YOU SCROLL DOWN THE SLIDE PAGE 45 OUT OF 49 IN  
4 THIS REPORT, THAT 30 PERCENT OF THE JOBS ARE GOING TO ONE OF  
5 THOSE LITTLE GEOGRAPHIC AREAS. [LAUGHTER] AND THAT SCENARIO  
6 APPEARS TO COMPRISE MOSTLY WESTERN NORMAL PART OF SANTA CLARA  
7 COUNTY SUNNYVALE MOUNTAIN VIEW, IT LOOKS LIKE IT COULD BE PALO  
8 ALTO IT'S HARD TO TELL FROM WHERE THE LINES ARE DRAWN AND  
9 PROBABLY PART OF SAN JOSE AS WELL. DAVE, DO I HAVE THAT RIGHT?  
10 >DAVE VAUTIN: YEAH. YOU MAY HAVE MISSED ONE OR TWO  
11 JURISDICTION. IT'S THAT KIND OF, I THINK THE NICKNAME IS THE  
12 GOLDEN TRIANGLE AREA OF SILICON VALLEY.  
13

14 **SAM LICCARDO:** SANTA CLARA, SUNNYVALE, MOUNTAIN VIEW. HERE'S  
15 THE CHALLENGE I'M LOOKING AT THE NUMBERS BOTH ON THE SET OF  
16 FRAMES, YOU CAN SIX SET OF FRAMES THERE ON THE SLIDE AGAIN 45  
17 OUT OF 49 SORRY I CAN'T BETTER DESIGNATE IT YOU WILL SEE THAT  
18 30 PERCENT OF THE ENTIRE BAY AREA JOBS ARE PROJECTED IT GROW  
19 THERE AND ONLY 12 PERCENT OF THE HOUSING. AND YET IF YOU GO  
20 DOWN A COUPLE OF SLIDES YOU SEE THE JOBS HOUSING RATIO DROP  
21 WHICH SEEMS VERY COUNTER INTUITIVE BECAUSE ONE WOULD THINK IT  
22 WOULD INCREASE DRAMATICALLY AND YOU WOULD HAVE AN EVEN MORE  
23 JOB INTENSIVE AREA, THAT CLEARLY CONTRA SERENES OUR GOALS AND  
24 JUST TO COMBINE WITH OTHER OBSERVATIONS DAVE SO YOU CAN LOOK  
25 AT ALL THIS AT ONCE, THAT'S NOT AN AREA WE'RE MAKING HUGE



## Meeting Transcript

1 INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT OF COURSE IF THAT'S NOT THE AREA IT'S  
2 HARD TO SEE THE LINES, INCLUDES THE BART STATION, WE HAVE  
3 SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT INVESTMENT THERE AND LIGHT RAIL THROUGH  
4 SAN JOSE AND MOUNTAIN VIEW BUT THE MOST AREAS WE'RE MAKING THE  
5 MOST TRANSIT INVESTMENT WOULD BE IN THE GEOGRAPHIC AREA I  
6 BELIEVE TO THE SOUTH, SAN JOSE, AND THERE YOU SEE JOBS  
7 EMPLOYEE RESIDENT RATIO DROPPING. [LAUGHTER] AND ONE WOULD  
8 EXPECT THAT'S AN AREA GIVEN EXISTING PLANS WHERE YOU WOULD SEE  
9 MUCH GREATER UPTICKS IN DENSITY BOTH IN JOBS AND HOUSING. SO  
10 OUR CONCERN IS, THIS IS WHERE ENORMOUS SHARE OF THE GROWTH IS  
11 GOING, AND WE'RE LOOKING -- [ SILENCE ] RATIOS THAT BECOME  
12 MORE IMBALANCED TOWARD HOUSING, AND I THINK IF YOU WERE TO  
13 CORRECT THE JOB EMPLOYMENT RATIO FOR THAT GOLDEN TRIANGLE  
14 AREA, YOU WOULD SEE THAT NUMBER IS SPIKING TOWARDS JOBS WHAT  
15 WE'RE GETTING IS A GREATER DIVISION OF HOUSING AND JOBS NOT A  
16 GREATER INTEGRATION, WHICH HAS LOTS OF, OF COURSE,  
17 ENVIRONMENTAL SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC IMPACTS. SO DO YOU WANT TO  
18 MAYBE OFFER -- [LAUGHTER] I'M SORRY AGAIN TO GET EVERYBODY IN  
19 THE WEEDS ON THIS BUT I'M VERY CONCERNED ABOUT WHERE THIS  
20 LEADS. >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME TRY TO OFFER A FEW REMARKS ON THIS  
21 I WANT TO CAVEAT THAT THIS IS OUR DRAFT BLUEPRINT AS WE ARE  
22 CONTINUING TO ANALYZE AND DIG INTO THE DATA AND THINK ABOUT  
23 HOW WE MAKE MORE MICRO LEVEL TWEAKS TO THE STRATEGIES AND  
24 SUBPARTS OF EACH COUNTY. SO I JUST WANT TO KIND OF CAVEAT  
25 THAT. YOU KNOW, JUST BIG PICTURE, WHAT WE SAW IN THE SOUTH BAY



## Meeting Transcript

1 AND MAYBE ESPECIALLY IN THAT ZONE THAT'S ACCOUNTING FOR A VERY  
2 LARGE SHARE OF JOB GROWTH IS AS WE RUN ALL OF OUR SIMULATION  
3 MODELS WE'RE SEEING THAT THESE, YOU KNOW, LARGE PARCEL SIZES  
4 DOWN IN THE SOUTH BAY, A LOT OF MID-20th CENTURY OFFICE  
5 COMPLEXES LOW-LEVEL COMPLEXES AND MALLS OR STRIP MALLS, THINGS  
6 LIKE THAT, THERE IS JUST AN INCREDIBLE DEVELOPMENT POTENTIAL  
7 FOR THAT. SO AS WE RUN A LOT OF OUR SIMULATION MODELS AND  
8 INCORPORATE THESE STRATEGIES THAT ENABLE MORE DEVELOPMENT BOTH  
9 HOUSING AND JOBS IN THESE DIFFERENT PLACES, THE REGION'S  
10 DEVELOPERS THAT WE SIMULATE ARE REALLY INTERESTED IN LOCATING  
11 DOWN CLOSE TO THE KIND OF THE HEART OF THE REGION'S BIGGEST  
12 JOB CENTERS. SO THAT, IN PART IS WHAT'S DRIVING A LOT OF THAT  
13 ACTION IN THAT PARTICULAR ZONE. I WOULD NOTE THERE IS MORE JOB  
14 GROWTH IN THIS PLAN IN THE DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE AND THE DIRIDON  
15 STATION AREA THAN THE PREVIOUS ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA.  
16 RECOGNIZING THAT THERE IS THE BART INVESTMENT IN THAT  
17 CORRIDOR. I THINK YOU MAKE A GOOD POINT WHICH IS THE LEVEL OF  
18 GROWTH IN THAT NORTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY AREA, IN PARTICULAR.  
19 YOU KNOW, THERE IS NOT A LOT OF NEW BIG TRANSPORTATION  
20 INVESTMENTS TAKING ADVANTAGE OF THE LIGHT RAIL THAT WERE BUILT  
21 DECADES AGO BUT THERE ARE NOT A LOT OF NEW INVESTMENTS PLANNED  
22 IN THAT AREA BUT THAT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO TAKE A CLOSER  
23 LOOK AT AS WE GO INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.  
24



## Meeting Transcript

1 **SAM LICCARDO:** OKAY. I GUESS I THINK OUR AMBITIONS AROUND  
2 EVERYTHING, AROUND EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENT AND SO FORTH IS TO  
3 TRY TO SEE IF WE CAN GET TO MORE BALANCED COMMUNITIES AND IF  
4 FEELS AS THOUGH IF YOU LOOK AT SANTA CLARA COUNTY WHAT YEAR  
5 SEEING IS A COUNTY BECOMING MORE DIVIDED NOT MORE INTEGRATED.  
6 SO I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT AND I KNOW WE CAN TALK MORE  
7 OFFLINE. >DAVE VAUTIN: MR. MAYOR I WOULD NOTE ONE MORE THING  
8 IN SANTA CLARA JOBS HOUSING BALANCE IS BECOMING BETTER IN  
9 CUPERTINO MOUNTAIN VIEW YOU CAN SEE THE COMPARISON GOING DOWN  
10 FROM 2.2 JOBS PER HOUSING UNIT DOWN TO 1.2 THERE IS A LOT MORE  
11 HOUSING IN THOSE AREAS THAT HISTORICALLY HAVE PRODUCED LESS  
12 HOUSING. SO I CERTAINLY DO TAKE YOUR POINT.

13

14 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAM. DAMON CONNOLLY.  
17 DAMON.

18

19 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU CHAIR THANK YOU DAVE FOR THE WORK ON  
20 THE DRAFT. ON THE JOBS GROWTH PROJECTIONS SLIDE WHICH PREDICTS  
21 MARIN COUNTY AT ZERO PERCENT. THAT SEEMS LIKE AN  
22 UNDERESTIMATE. SO I WANTED TO UNPACK THAT A LITTLE BIT AND  
23 WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THAT. I HAVE A NOTE, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT  
24 THE COUNTY MET OF THE PREVIOUS 30 YEAR JOB GROWTH TOTALS IN  
25 EIGHT YEARS. SO WHAT'S DRIVING THAT ZERO PERCENT? >DAVE



## Meeting Transcript

1 VAUTIN: WE ARE EXAMINING THAT IN MORE DETAIL AS WE GO INTO THE  
2 FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE. MARIN COUNTY HISTORICALLY, THE MEDIAN  
3 AGE HAS CONTINUED TO INCREASE MORE AND MORE FOLKS ARE, AS A  
4 SHARE OF THE POPULATION ARE RETIRED. THOSE ARE SORTS OF TRENDS  
5 THAT CAN REDUCE THE SORT OF, YOU KNOW, THE JOB TOTALS FOR THE  
6 REGION OR THE JOB GROWTH POTENTIAL GOING FORWARD. SO WE'LL  
7 TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT THAT AS WE GO FORWARD.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** IS THAT IT, DAN? OKAY THANK YOU.  
10 NICK JOSEFOWITZ AND THEN KAREN MITCHOFF.

11

12 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I -- SO I'M ALSO REALLY  
13 CONCERNED ABOUT THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS SIDE OF THINGS.  
14 AND YOU KNOW, IN THE LAST PLAN, IT FELT LIKE AT THE VERY END  
15 OF THE SORT OF, BEFORE THE ADOPTION, AND I WASN'T HERE, ON THE  
16 COMMISSION AT THE TIME, THERE WERE A BUNCH OF STRATEGIES THAT  
17 WERE PUT IN PLACE THAT DIDN'T REALLY HAVE A REALISTIC CHANCE  
18 OF GETTING ADOPTED AND I'M CONCERNED THAT WE'RE DOING THE SAME  
19 THING THIS TIME AROUND WITH ALL LANE TOLLING, WHICH MAY BE A  
20 VERY POWERFUL STRATEGY BUT I'M NOT SURE WE HAVE A REALISTIC  
21 PLAN OF IMPLEMENTING IT IN THIS SORT OF THE TIME THAT WE WOULD  
22 NEED TO IMPLEMENT IT ACCORDING TO THE PLAN. HOW ARE YOU KIND  
23 OF -- HOW DOES THE -- HOW DO THESE STRATEGIES THEN ACTUALLY  
24 SORT OF FIND THEIR -- WHAT'S THE -- PLAN TO TAKE THESE  
25 STRATEGIES AND MAKE THEM REAL?





## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'M GLAD COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, YOU RAISED

3 THIS, BECAUSE THIS WAS SOMETHING I WAS GOING TO MAKE NOTE OF

4 AT THE END BUT I'LL BRING IT FORWARD NOW SINCE YOU RAISED THE

5 THEME. VERY BROADLY, AND MAYBE DAVE AND OTHERS HAVE SOME

6 SPECIFIC COMMENTARY, BUT I THINK IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FOR

7 ALL OF ARE US TO UNDERSTAND THIS PLAN ASSUMES A NUMBER OF

8 ACTIONS. IT ASSUMES A CHANGE FROM WHERE WE ARE TODAY ON A

9 NUMBER OF LEVELS. PLAN USED IN WHATEVER FORM DOES NOT

10 GUARANTEE THAT THOSE ACTIONS WILL OCCUR. IT SIMPLY SAYS THAT

11 THAT'S THE LONE STAR, THAT'S WHY WE WANT TO HEAD. AND IF, YOU

12 KNOW, FOR THESE THINGS TO COME ABOUT, AS YOU POINT OUT

13 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, IT'S GOING TO BE HARD FOR A LOT OF

14 THESE THINGS TO GO FORWARD. IT'S GOING TO BE CHANGES IN

15 POLICIES, IT'S GOING TO BE CHANGES IN POTENTIALLY REGULATION,

16 CHANGES IN LAWS ON THE BOOKS. AND IT'S GOING TO TAKE A LEVEL

17 OF POLITICAL COURAGE TO MOVE BEYOND WHERE WE ARE TODAY THAT IS

18 SIGNIFICANT. AND IT'S ALWAYS GOING TO ASSUME INDIVIDUAL

19 RESPONSIBILITIES TO KIND OF LIVE UP TO THESE ASSUMPTIONS. YOU

20 KNOW, FOR A NEW GENERATION OF FOLKS TO BE ABLE TO SAY, "I CAN

21 LIVE IN A SMALLER FOOTPRINT THAN MY PARENTS DID." OR THINGS

22 LIKE THE SPEED, THE DRIVERS WILL ACTUALLY ADHERE TO THE SPEED

23 LIMITS. [LAUGHTER] UNLIKE WHAT WE OFTEN SEE. SO I THINK IT'S

24 JUST -- IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO ALWAYS KEEP THAT IN MIND,

25 THAT THE PLAN IS A CHALLENGE UNTO ITSELF TO ACTUALLY DELIVER



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 IT. AND THE BEST THAT WE CAN DO IS TRY TO MAKE THE CASE THAT  
2 MAKING THOSE CHANGES MATTER. AND THAT THEY MATTER TO FUTURE  
3 GENERATIONS AND WE HAVE TO STEP TO THE PLATE IN ORDER TO DO T  
4 SO JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT THERE AS A LARGER PICTURE.

5

6 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THOSE COMMENTS. AND I WAS  
7 GOING TO SAY, YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, IF  
8 WE'RE GOING TO BE -- WE SHOULD START THINKING ABOUT THAT AS WE  
9 DECIDE WHAT STRATEGIES WE WANT TO PUT IN THIS PLAN. I MEAN,  
10 THIS IS THE FOUNDATIONAL DOCUMENT OF THIS AGENCY AND OF OUR  
11 REGION -- AND OF REGIONAL PLANNING, AND I THINK, TO ME, IT'S  
12 JUST INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT, THAT IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ADOPTING  
13 SOMETHING WHICH INCLUDES SOMETHING AS DIFFERENT AS ALL LANE  
14 TOLLING FOR OUR FREEWAYS WE NEED TO DO IT WITH AN  
15 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO GET THERE AND DO THAT.  
16 AND THERE ARE LOTS OF STRATEGIES IN HERE AND WE DON'T NEED TO  
17 GO SUPER IN DEPTH TO ALL OF THEM BUT ALL OF THE MAJOR ONES I  
18 WOULD LIKE TO SEE WHAT WE NEED TO DO, AS YOU SAID -- >DAVE  
19 VAUTIN: AND IDENTIFYING WHAT ACTIONS THESE ORGANIZATIONS NEEDS  
20 TO TAKE TO GET US TO THE STEPS OF THINKING ABOUT HOW WE GET TO  
21 SOME OF THESE STRATEGIES. THAT MIGHT BE BY DOING STUDIES,  
22 LOOKING AT DIFFERENT LEGISLATIVE OPTIONS THERE ARE THINGS WE  
23 CAN DO TO THINK ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION THAT IS PART OF THE  
24 PROJECT AND WE'LL BE DOING THAT WORK IN THE FALL.

25



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AFTER WE HAVE DECIDED WHAT WE WANT TO DO  
2 -- AFTER THE PLAN HAS BEEN SORT OF BASICALLY SIGNED OFF ON.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVE? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES ONCE WE  
5 HAVE DIRECTION FROM YOU ON WHICH STRATEGIES ARE APPROPRIATE  
6 FOR THE LONG-TERM, WE WANT TO START IDENTIFYING THE NEAR TERM  
7 STEPS TO THINK ABOUT HOW THEY ARE GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTED.

8

9 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT. THANK  
10 YOU.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU NICK. KAREN MITCHOFF.  
13 SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF.

14

15 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** THANK YOU JIM. I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT, I TOO  
16 WAS VERY IMPRESSED WITH THIS PRESENTATION. LIKE JULIE, OR I'M  
17 GOING TO GO BACK AND DIVE INTO IT, BECAUSE IT WAS A LOT. I  
18 JUST WANTED TO TALK TO ALL OF YOU, IF YOU HAVE BEEN WATCHING  
19 ME, I HAVE HAD TO TAKE SOME PHONE CALLS IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT  
20 I'M NOT INTERESTED IN THIS BUT THERE IS A PLANNED PROTEST IN  
21 FRONT OF MY HOME ON MONDAY AND I HAVE BEEN ON THE PHONE WITH  
22 THE POLICE. SO THAT'S AN INDICATION OF WHY I HAVE HAD TO TAKE  
23 PHONE CALLS IT'S NOT TO SAY I AM NOT INVOLVED IN WHAT'S BEEN  
24 GOING ON HERE. BECAUSE I HAVE BEEN DISTRACTED I AM GOING TO GO



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 BACK AND REVIEW THE QUESTIONS OF STAFF. IT'S AMAZING WORK, HOW  
2 YOU HAVE ALL PULLED IT TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** KAREN, I WOULD BE ON THE PHONE  
5 WITH THE FIRE DEPARTMENT AS WELL, NOT ONLY THE POLICE. SCOTT,  
6 IS YOUR HAND UP TO SPEAK AGAIN?

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I APOLOGIZE, MR. CHAIR, SECOND BITE OF  
9 THE APPLE.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I HAD ACTUALLY PUT MY HAND UP EARLIER,  
14 BUT I WAS REALLY HAPPY TO HEAR THE ISSUES THAT AS I UNDERSTAND  
15 -- CINDY WAS TALKING ABOUT. YESTERDAY THERE WAS A DEVELOPER  
16 SPEAKING -- LET ME ASK THIS QUESTION OF DAVE FIRST -- DAVE, DO  
17 YOU, WHEN YOU COME UP WITH YOUR ASSUMPTIONS ON HOUSING, DO YOU  
18 WORK, LIKE, OF THE BUILDERS? >DAVE VAUTIN: THE MODEL, THE  
19 URBAN SIM MODEL THAT'S BEEN DEVELOPED, ACTUALLY, DURING ITS  
20 DEVELOPMENT PROCESS, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THE -- IS THAT  
21 BASICALLY THE DEVELOPER MODEL THAT WE USE WAS DEVELOPED IN  
22 CONCERT WITH ACADEMICS AND OTHER IN THE DEVELOPMENT INDUSTRY  
23 THAT'S HOW WE CREATED THE -- I'M BLANKING ON THE TERM HERE,  
24 BASICALLY THE TOOL THAT ESTIMATES WHERE FUTURE GROWTH MIGHT



## Meeting Transcript

1 PENCIL OUT AND SO THERE HAS BEEN A SETTING ON THAT FOR THE  
2 PAST DECADES.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THERE WAS A MAJOR DEVELOPER THERE  
5 YESTERDAY, AND MOST OF US KNOW HIM, HE WAS TALKING ABOUT  
6 HOUSING, AND HE SAID THAT HOUSING IN FREMONT IS DOWN 25  
7 PERCENT, AND HOUSING IN MOUNTAIN HOUSE, IN THE LAST FEW MONTHS  
8 HAS TRIPLED. SPECULATION MAY BE THAT THERE IS MORE PEOPLE WILL  
9 BE MOVING AS TELECOMMUTING BECOMES MORE PERMANENT NEEDING ONLY  
10 TO GO INTO THE OFFICE OCCASIONALLY, THE SUBURBAN AREAS ARE  
11 MORE COMPACT THAN THE URBAN. AND THE BAY AREA SERVICE WORKERS  
12 MAY BE FORCED OUT OF THE TRI-VALLEY AS MORE URBANITES MOVE  
13 INTO THE SUBURBAN AREAS AND I WOULD REMIND US ALL THAT OUR  
14 SERVICE WORKERS ARE NOT ABLE TO COMMUTE TELECOMMUTE. SO TRENDS  
15 ARE CHANGING RAPIDLY. AND I SUGGEST WE MAYBE TAKE A MONTH OR  
16 SO AND FIGURE THAT OUT, AND TALK TO SOME OF THESE HOME  
17 BUILDERS AND FIND OUT WHAT THEY'RE SEEING ON THE STREET. NOT  
18 TO SAY, DAVE, YOU'RE NOT DOING A GREAT JOB. THAT'S NOT WHAT  
19 I'M SAYING IT'S JUST INFORMATION I HAVE SEEN AND DOVETAILS  
20 INTO WHAT SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ WAS TALKING ABOUT ALSO.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU SCOTT. DAVE, A  
23 QUESTION. IF WE WERE TO MOVE THE MEGA MEASURE UP INTO THE NEXT  
24 5 TO 10 YEARS, WHAT DOES THAT DO TO THE PLANE? >DAVE VAUTIN:  
25 LET ME GIVE CONTEXT ON THE MEGA MEASURE. WE DON'T HAVE IT ON



## Meeting Transcript

1 THE NUMBERS. OTHER REGIONS HAVE DONE MEGA MEASURES HAVE NOT  
2 INCLUDED MEGA MEASURES IN THE PLAN AT ALL. LOS ANGELES WAITED  
3 UNTIL AFTER THE VOTERS APPROVED IT TO INTEGRATE IT INTO A LONG  
4 RANGE PLAN SO HAVE FOLKS IN THE PACIFIC NORTHWEST BECAUSE THE  
5 MEGA MEASURE CREATES ALL SORTS OF FLAGS FOR STATE AND FEDERAL  
6 FOLKS WHO REGULATE IT. WHAT WE HAVE TRIED TO STRIKE A BALANCE  
7 BETWEEN THE PLAN INCLUSIONARY AND THE MEGA MEASURE BY PLACING  
8 IT IN A CONSERVATIVE POINT IN 2025 IN ORDER TO GET THE MUCH  
9 NEEDED STATE AND FEDERAL APPROVALS. IT'S TRUE WE RAN THE  
10 NUMBERS EARLIER IN THE PROCESS WHERE THE MEGA MEASURE WAS IN  
11 2035 AND WE CAN SHARE THOSE WITH YOU, BUT THE CHALLENGE IS  
12 MAKING SURE THE PLAN GETS APPROVED BY OUR REGULATORS AND  
13 THAT'S THE DRIVING FORCE IN THE 2035 ASSUMPTION.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** IT SEEMS LIKE WITH ALL OF THE  
16 ACTIVITIES AND PROJECTS THAT WERE DEVELOPED THERE WAS  
17 TREMENDOUS OUTREACH AND IT JUST SEEMS LIKE THAT ISSUE IS NOT  
18 GOING TO SIT IDLE FOR 15 YEARS. IT'S TOO CRITICAL THERE IS TOO  
19 PROJECTS IN THE INDUSTRY THAT RESIDENTS ARE REALLY CONCERNED  
20 ABOUT. I HOPE THAT WE LOOK AT THAT ISSUE MORE. IT'S NOT LIKE  
21 IT'S SOMETHING NEW. IT'S ON THE HORIZON FOR US. I DON'T SEE  
22 ANY OTHER HANDS. MARTHA ADO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. AND FOR THE RECORD, THERE WAS NO  
25 WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED BEFORE THE 5:00 P.M. DEADLINE. WE



## Meeting Transcript

1 HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. FIRST  
2 IS ROBERT FERCHMAN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO  
3 MINUTES.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD ROBERT. YOU HAVE TWO  
6 MINUTES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HI GOOD MORNING -- AFTERNOON OUT THERE. I'M ROBERT  
9 FRUCKMAN, I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I WANT TO ECHO THE PREVIOUS  
10 COMMENT ABOUT HOW WE'RE TREADING WATER WITH OUR JOBS HOUSING  
11 BALANCE. IN SAN FRANCISCO OVER THE LAST FOUR DECADES OR SO HAS  
12 ADDED AROUND 300,000 JOBS AND SOMEWHERE AROUND LIKE 40,000  
13 HOMES. SO WE ARE IN DESPERATE NEED OF ALL THE HOUSING TO BE  
14 MAID UP TO FILL THAT GAP. I HAVE SEEN THE RECENT HOUSING  
15 DISTRIBUTION AND IT'S 440,000 UNITS OR SO AND THAT'S ACTUALLY  
16 GOOD FOR SAN FRANCISCO. IF WE HAD ALL THAT IN SAN FRANCISCO IT  
17 WOULD BE AMAZING BECAUSE WE V I THINK SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 60 TO  
18 75 PERCENT OF OUR RESIDENTIAL LOTS ARE ZONED FOR SINGLE FAMILY  
19 HOMES, AND SO THERE IS A LOT OF ROOM FOR EXPANSION OF HOUSING  
20 IN HIGH OPPORTUNITY AND HIGHEST OPPORTUNITY CENSUS TRACKS  
21 HERE. BUT 440,000 HOMES FOR THE ENTIRE BAY AREA IS REALLY  
22 INSIGNIFICANT WHEN YOU COMPARE THAT TO OUR GAP OF, YOU KNOW,  
23 EASILY NORTH OF 250,000 HOMES THAT WE NEED. SO, IF WE ARE TO  
24 REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, WE NEED TO STOP TREATING SAN  
25 FRANCISCO AS AN EMPLOYMENT REGION IN A -- OR EMPLOYMENT AREA



## Meeting Transcript

1 IN A REGIONAL SETTING, AND START TREATING IT AS A RESIDENTIAL  
2 AREA AS WELL AS A COMMERCIAL CENTER. SO, IF -- I THINK THE  
3 NATIONAL COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT COALITION HAS RECENTLY  
4 RELEASED A REPORT LAST MONTH WHICH SHOWS SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND  
5 HAS THE HIGHEST RATE OF GENTRIFICATION. I'LL WRAP UP SOON. AND  
6 THAT IS MOSTLY OAKLAND.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU ROBERT.  
9 MARTHA WHO DO YOU HAVE NEXT?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ROLAND. ROLAND.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. -- AGAIN -- THANK YOU.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD ROLAND.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SO FOUR TOPICS. MPO WOUND BOUNDARIES, GHG  
18 MEASURES NEAR HOUSING IF YOU LOOK AT SLIDE 17 AND 18 SHIFT IS  
19 CLEAN BETWEEN THE TWO TOWNS SAN FRANCISCO AND SANTA CLARA  
20 COUNTY AND YOU LOOK AT THE BUBBLE AND THE BUBBLE ON THE  
21 HOUSING IS COVERING HALF OF SANTA CRUZ COUNTY SO I WOULD  
22 SUGGEST RATHER THAN SPLITTING INTO TWO SEPARATE MPOS IS TO  
23 BASICALLY REORGANIZE THE CENTER AND INCORPORATE THE FOUR  
24 COUNTIES SOUTH OF SANTA CLARA INTO THE PLAN OTHERWISE IT'S NOT  
25 GOING TO WORK. ON THE GHGS -- [ SILENCE ] -- IT'S GOING TO BE





July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 A BIG PROBLEM IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY BECAUSE IT'S SO FAR -- WE  
2 ALREADY HAVE ONE IN THREE QUARTER OF TRANSPORTATION ALONE AND  
3 WE HAVE ALSO GOT HOUSING MEGA MEASURES. WE NEED TO ALIGN THAT  
4 SO THAT WE HAVE ROUGHLY THE SAME AMOUNT IN EVERY COUNTY. AND  
5 THE LAST POINT IS TO COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY'S POINT, IS ABOUT  
6 MOVING, YOU KNOW, HOUSING WHERE JOBS ARE. WELL, WHAT HAPPENED  
7 IS OTHER JOBS MOVE WHERE THE HOUSING IS. SO WHAT I WOULD  
8 SUGGEST, ON THE LAST POINT, IF YOU WANT TO DO PLANNING, GO FOR  
9 PLANNING THAT IS DRIVEN, GO AND LOOK AT PLANNING APPLICATIONS  
10 AND SEE THAT INTO THE MODEL BECAUSE I WILL TELL YOU WHAT'S  
11 GOING ON WITH WHAT DEVELOPERS ARE DOING. THANK YOU.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THAT OUR LAST  
14 SPEAKER MARTHA?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
17 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TO OUR  
20 NEXT ITEM. DAVE GREAT STAFF WORK. DAVE, ARE YOU GOING TO KICK  
21 THIS NEXT ITEM OFF 5A PLANNED BAY AREA FINAL BLUEPRINT KEY  
22 DISCUSSIONS? >DAVE VAUTIN: I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO MY  
23 COLLEAGUE RALEIGH McCOY WHO WILL BE WALKING THROUGH TODAY'S  
24 PRESENTATION.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1   **RALEIGH MCCOY:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. AS EXECUTIVE  
2   DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN PULLED UP IN HER STAFF REPORT. WE  
3   HAVE THE PRESENTATION FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AS  
4   STARTING POINT FOR OUR CONTINUED WORK IN COUNTY TRANSPORTATION  
5   AGENCIES AS CTA'S FINALIZE COUNTY PROJECT LIST WITHIN THE  
6   FISCALLY CONSTRAINED ENVELOPE THAT WE HAVE TO KEEP OURSELVES  
7   WITHIN. FULL SET OF STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDED IN YOUR  
8   PACKETS ATTACHMENT B SPEAK TO MAGNITUDE OF FUNDING  
9   RECOMMENDATION AS WELL AS SEQUENCING WHEN PROJECTS WOULD OPEN  
10   BETWEEN 215 YEARS PERIODS BETWEEN THE 30 YEAR PLANNING HORIZON  
11   AND I'LL SPEAK MORE AS TO WHAT EXACTLY THAT MEANS IN THE  
12   COMING SLIDES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO TO BRIEFLY RECAP WHERE WE  
13   HAVE BEEN THE PROCESS OF IDENTIFYING WHICH PROJECTS WERE MOST  
14   COMPETITIVE FOR REGIONAL FUNDING IN 2019 100 LARGE PROJECTS  
15   WERE SUBMITTED FOR ANALYSIS THROUGH THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE  
16   ASSESSMENT PROCESS THESE PROJECTS VAULTED FOR COST  
17   EFFECTIVENESS IMPACTS ON EQUITY AND ALIGNMENT WITH THE ADOPTED  
18   PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GUIDING PRINCIPLES IDENTIFYING A SHORT  
19   LIST OF TEN OF THE HIGHEST PERFORMING AND MOST RESILIENT  
20   PROJECTS FOR THE REMAINING 90 PROJECTS ANALYSIS IDENTIFYING  
21   WHERE PROJECTS COULD BE IMPROVED THROUGH PROJECT LEVEL  
22   MODIFICATIONS OR SUPPORT FOR COMPLIMENTARY STRATEGIES SPONSORS  
23   WERE ABLE TO LEVERAGE FINDINGS AND SUBMIT IDEAS FOR PROJECTS  
24   THROUGH COMMIT LETTERS SUBMITTED IN APRIL OF THIS YEAR.  
25   DELIVERABLES FEEDING INTO THE RECOMMENDATIONS IS THE DRAFT



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 COUNTY PROJECT LIST SUBMITTED IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR. IN THOSE  
2 LISTS COUNTIES IDENTIFIED PROJECTS BASED ON PROJECTED REVENUES  
3 AVAILABLE AT THE COUNTY LEVEL INCLUDING BOTH PROJECTS THAT  
4 WERE EVALUATED IN THE PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT ALONG WITH A  
5 NUMBER OF SMALLER PROJECTS OR PROGRAMMATIC OR GENERAL  
6 INVESTMENT IN CASES WHERE THE COUNTY BUDGET ASSIGNMENT WAS NOT  
7 SUFFICIENT TO MEET THE TOTAL COST OF A PROJECT OR PROGRAM GAPS  
8 IN FUNDING MAY BE FILLED USING A LIMIT OF POOL OF REVENUE  
9 SOURCES OUTSIDE THE COUNTY'S CONTROL AND IN PLANNING CONTEXT  
10 REFERRED TO AS REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY REVENUES IN JUNE STAFF  
11 SHARED INITIAL PREVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR REGIONAL FUNDING  
12 THAT WOULD BE ASSIGNED TO MAJOR PROJECTS RECOMMENDATIONS BASED  
13 ON PROJECT PERFORMANCE COMMIT LETTERS AND GENERAL PICTURE OF  
14 REVENUE NEEDED TO CLOSE FUNDING GAPS RECOMMENDATIONS YOU HAVE  
15 BEFORE YOU TODAY BUILD ON THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS AS WELL AS  
16 FEEDBACK RECEIVED AND CONVERSATIONS RECEIVED WITHIN THE  
17 COUNTIES IDENTIFYING PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR REGIONAL FUNDING  
18 AS WELL AS IDENTIFYING SEQUENCING OF PROJECT OPENING DATES  
19 LOOKING FORWARD TO SOME KEY NEXT STEPS IN THE PROCESS WE'LL BE  
20 ASKING THE COUNTIES TO FIND THEIR COUNTY LISTS BASED ON  
21 REGIONAL FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE END OF THIS MONTH AS  
22 WELL AS ASKING THEM TO SEEK BOARD ACTION ON THEIR COMMITMENT  
23 LETTERS BY THE END OF AUGUST. NEXT SLIDE. I FIRST OF ALL WANT  
24 TO COMING UP FRONT THAT STAFF HAVE MADE SOME REVISIONS FOR  
25 CLARITY ON THIS SLIDE SO IT WILL APPEAR SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT



## Meeting Transcript

1 THAN WHAT YOU HAVE IN YOUR PACKETS BUT I'LL WALK YOU THROUGH.  
2 AS REFERENCED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE FOR GUIDANCE FROM THE  
3 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD FINAL BLUEPRINT SPLIT INTO TWO  
4 PERIODS BY PROJECTS OPENING YEAR. THIS IS AN EFFORT TO CLOSELY  
5 ALIGN INVESTMENTS WITH WHEN PROJECTED REVENUES WOULD BE  
6 AVAILABLE. AS SHARED IN JUNE WE UPDATED ON PROJECTED NEEDS AND  
7 REVENUES REVENUES IN FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN ARE LIMITED  
8 COMPARED TO WHAT'S AVAILABLE IN THE SECOND HALF THIS ACCOUNTS  
9 FOR REDUCED REVENUES IN THE NEAR TERM DUE TO ECONOMIC  
10 RECESSION AS WELL AS INCLUSION OF NEW REVENUES IN THE LATTER  
11 HALF OF THE PLAN RELATING TO DISCUSSION ON THE PREVIOUS ITEM  
12 ABOUT THE MEGA MEASURE GIVEN THE LIMITED ENSURE THAT OF FUNDS  
13 IN AVAILABLE IN PERIOD ONE THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN YOUR PACKET  
14 PRIORITIZE PROJECTS THAT ADVANCE EQUITY AND WILL HELP TO  
15 CONTRIBUTE TO OUR GHG REDUCTION GOALS IN PERIOD TWO THERE ARE  
16 A NUMBER OF OTHER HIGHER COST TRANSIT ROAD PROJECTS THAT WHILE  
17 DEFINITELY BEING REGIONAL PRIORITIES WERE UNABLE TO BE  
18 INCLUDED IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN DUE TO FISCAL REALITIES  
19 OF WHAT WAS AVAILABLE AND WE HAVE GOTTEN A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS  
20 ON WHAT IT MEANS FOR A PROJECT TO BE LISTED WITH AN OPENING  
21 YEAR IN PERIOD TWO. PROJECTS LISTED IN PERIOD TWO OF THE PLAN  
22 ARE INCLUDED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 MEANING THEY CAN  
23 COMPLETE THEIR PROJECT DEVELOPMENT WORK AND SEEK FUNDING AND  
24 UNDERSTANDING THAT CONSTRUCTION FOR MANY PROJECTS THAT ARE  
25 PROPOSED IS A MULTI- YEAR IF NOT DECADES LONG PROCESS PROJECTS



## Meeting Transcript

1 IN PERIOD TWO COULD INITIATE CONSTRUCTION WORK AS THEY PREPARE  
2 FOR OPENING AFTER 2035. HOWEVER UNDERSTANDING THAT CONDITIONS  
3 MAY CHANGE IN A PROJECT LISTED WITH AN OPENING YEAR IN PERIOD  
4 TWO MAY FIND ITSELF IN A POSITION TO BEGIN OPERATIONS EARLIER  
5 THAN ANTICIPATED MTC WILL BE DEVELOPING A MEGA PROJECT  
6 ADVANCEMENT POLICY THAT WOULD SYSTEMICALLY GUIDE THE PROCESS  
7 FROM PERIOD TWO TO PERIOD ONE WITHIN THE PLANNING CONTEXT  
8 GIVEN THAT CERTAIN CRITERIA ARE MET AND DEVELOPING THIS POLICY  
9 WOULD OCCUR WITH THE COMING YEAR WITH THE POLICY BEING  
10 DEVELOPED FOR 2021. NEXT SLIDE. MOVING INTO THE PROPOSAL NOW  
11 KEY SUMMARY STATISTICS THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE  
12 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT TOTAL 553 BILLION ACROSS THE PLAN  
13 PERIOD WITH AROUND 141 BILLION WITH THE INVESTMENT CONSIDERED  
14 REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY. TO PROVIDE HIGH LEVEL SUMMARIES OF THE  
15 INVESTMENT OPERATING AND MAINTAINING EXISTING ROAD AND TRANSIT  
16 SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE TODAY ACCOUNTS FOR TWO THIRDS OF THE TOTAL  
17 INVESTMENT IN THE PLAN WITH REMAINING REVENUES DIRECTED  
18 TOWARDS STRATEGIES INCLUDING INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND OR  
19 OPTIMIZE TRANSIT AND ROAD NETWORKS AS WELL AS STRATEGIES  
20 POLICY BASED REDUCING TRANSIT FARE COST INTEGRATING MEANS-  
21 BASED FARES OR ALL LANE TOLLING STRATEGIES LOOKING AT  
22 DISCRETIONARY INVESTMENTS HALF OF ALL DISCRETIONARY REVENUES  
23 ARE ASSIGNED TO TRANSIT ALIGNED WITH OUR REGIONAL CLIMATE AND  
24 EQUITY GOALS NEXT LARGEST CATEGORY IS OPERATIONS AND  
25 MAINTENANCE COST WHERE REGIONAL REVENUES ARE USED TO



## Meeting Transcript

1 SUPPLEMENT FUNDS THAT MAINTAIN AND OPERATE THE EXISTING SYSTEM  
2 THAT WE HAVE TODAY. INVESTMENTS IN ROAD PROJECTS ACCOUNT FOR  
3 ROUGHLY 15 PERCENT OF ALL REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY INVESTMENTS  
4 WITH INVESTMENTS IN BIKE AND PED INFRASTRUCTURE ROUNDING OUT  
5 THE TOTAL INVESTMENT. NEXT SLIDE. IN THE NEXT TWO SLIDES I'LL  
6 HIGHLIGHT FINDINGS FROM EARLY ANALYSIS CONDUCTED IN ACCORDANCE  
7 WITH TITLE SIX REGULATIONS AS MENTIONED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE  
8 OVER TWO THIRDS OF ALL INVESTMENTS IN OUR TRANSPORTATION  
9 PROGRAM ARE DIRECTED TOWARD MAINTAINING THE EXISTING SYSTEM  
10 THE CHART TOP LEFT SUGGESTS THAT MAINTAINING EXISTING TRANSIT  
11 SYSTEM, BOTTOM TWO ROWS IN THE TOP LEFT CHART, MEANS THAT A  
12 LARGER -- [ SILENCE ] -- MORE SO THAN MINORITY USERS WHILE  
13 INVESTING IN TRANSIT RESULT IN A ROUGHLY EVEN SPLIT. NEXT  
14 SLIDE. FOCUSING IN ON THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES NOW APPROACH TO  
15 CRAFTING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WAS TO INCLUDE TRANSIT PROJECTS  
16 WITH THE MOST POSITIVE EQUITY IMPACTS IN THE FIRST 15 YEARS OF  
17 THE PLAN INCLUDING A NUMBER OF INVESTMENT IN BUS AND BART  
18 SERVICES. THAT SAID CHARTS ON THE LEFT SHOW INVESTMENT BY TIME  
19 PERIOD BROKEN OUT FOR LOW INCOME OR MIDDLE AND HIGH INCOME  
20 USERS OR MINORITY AND WHITE USERS SHOWS INVESTMENTS ARE SPLIT  
21 EQUALLY. SO INCLUDING THE FIRST 15 YEARS DESPITE STRATEGY  
22 INVESTMENT. INCLUDING ADVANCING STRATEGIES LIKE MEANS-BASED  
23 AND INTEGRATED TRANSIT FARES TO REDUCE THE COST BURDEN OF  
24 TAKING TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. FOR THE SECOND HALF OF THE  
25 PRESENTATION I'LL BE PROVIDING MORE DETAIL ON THE REVISED



## Meeting Transcript

1 REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE  
2 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT AND AGAIN I'LL DIRECT TO YOU ATTACHMENT  
3 B OF YOUR PACKET FOR THE FULL LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT  
4 SLIDE. AS DAVE HIGHLIGHTED IN HIS PREVIOUS PRESENTATION  
5 BLUEPRINT IS BASED ON STRATEGIES WHICH SEEKS TO CREATE A  
6 COHESIVE PROPOSAL FOR POLICY INVESTMENTS FOR TRANSPORTATION  
7 HOUSING THE ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMY. HERE ON THE SLIDE YOU CAN  
8 SEE THE TOTAL ALL OF THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES THAT ARE  
9 PROPOSED FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF  
10 SLIDES I'LL BE DIVING INTO MORE DETAIL FOR THE FOUR STRATEGIES  
11 HIGHLIGHTED WITH THE COLORFUL BACKGROUND. THESE STRATEGIES ARE  
12 COMPRISED OF A NUMBER OF PROJECTS THAT WERE SUBMITTED BY THE  
13 COUNTIES NOT THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR REGIONAL FUNDING HELPED  
14 SHAPE HOW THESE STRATEGIES WOULD BE INCLUDED IN THE FINAL  
15 BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE WE DIVE IN AS HIGHLIGHTED IN THE  
16 PREVIOUS PRESENTATION ANALYSIS OF A MORE LIMITED SET OF  
17 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT REDUCED PER  
18 CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BUT FELL SHORT OF MEETING SB  
19 375 MANDATED TARGET BY FIVE PERCENTAGE POINTS AND I KNOW  
20 YOU'RE ALL AWARE THIS IS A SUBSTANTIAL GAP THAT WE NEED TO  
21 CLOSE. A NUMBER OF INVESTMENTS THAT MAY HELP CLOSE THE GAP  
22 ALSO INCLUDES INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND ROADWAY CAPACITY WHICH  
23 COULD MOVE THE NEEDLE IN THE OPPOSITE DIRECTION BY  
24 INCENTIVIZING MORE DRIVING. AS SUCH RECOMMENDATIONS SHARED  
25 TODAY MAY NEED TO BE REVISITED BASED ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT



## Meeting Transcript

1 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS PRODUCTION PERFORMANCE. STAFF HAVE  
2 INITIATED CONVERSATIONS WITH SPONSORS OF ROAD CAPACITY  
3 INCREASING PROJECTS IN REGARD TO APPROPRIATE MITIGATION  
4 MEASURES TO EXPLORE OVER THE COURSE OF THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE.  
5 FOR THE NEXT COUPLE OF SLIDES I'LL HIGHLIGHT RECOMMENDATION IN  
6 YOUR ATTACHMENT AND FEW EXAMPLE PROJECTS I WANT TO UNDERScore  
7 THE PROJECTS SHOWN ON THE SLIDE AREN'T THE COMPLETE PROPOSAL  
8 TURNING FIRST TO STRATEGIES TO IMPROVE INTERCHANGES AND  
9 ADDRESS HIGHWAY BOTTLENECK WHILE A NUMBER OF FULLY FUNDED  
10 THROUGH THE COUNTY BUDGETS SEVERAL LARGER SCALE PROJECTS WITH  
11 REGIONAL MACS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR REGIONAL FUNDS IN THE FIRST  
12 15 YEARS OF THE PLAN THIS INCLUDES INTERIM IMPROVEMENTS ON  
13 SR37 CORRIDOR AND OPTIMIZATION IMPROVEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE BAY  
14 AREA THROUGH BAY AREA FORWARD. ALSO INCLUDED IN THE FIRST  
15 PERIOD ARE PROJECTS FUNDED BY COUNTIES THAT BUILD ROAD  
16 CAPACITY ON SR 4 AND 239. IN THE LASTER HALF OF THE PLAN  
17 REGIONAL FUNDS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR THE PROJECT INTERCHANGE  
18 PROCESS AND SR 262. A NUMBER OF SMALLER INVESTMENTS ARE  
19 RECOMMENDED FOR REGIONAL FUNDING INCLUDING I80 WESTBOUND TRUCK  
20 SCALES AND SOSCOL IMPROVEMENTS. PROJECTS THAT INCREASE ROAD --  
21 ASTERISK -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] [INDISCERNIBLE] PROJECTS OVER  
22 THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
23  
24 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RALEIGH, YOUR AUDIO IS A LITTLE  
25 MESSED UP.





## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RALEIGH, YOUR AUDIO IS MESS UP.

5 DID YOU CHANGE ANYTHING?

6

7 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** APOLOGIES. OH WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO REVIEW ANY

8 OF THE CONTENT ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE OR SHOULD I JUST MOVE

9 FORWARD?

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** NO JUST CONTINUE FROM HERE.

12

13 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** I APOLOGIZE POWER THAT EVERYONE. MOVING FORWARD

14 EXPANSION OF LOCAL TRANSIT FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY ADVANCES

15 PROGRESS TOWARDS GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND EQUITY GOALS

16 INCLUDED IN THE STRATEGIES ARE NUMBER OF IMPROVEMENTS TO THE

17 BUS REGION INCLUDING IMPROVEMENTS FOR AC TRANSIT MUNI AND

18 SONOMA COUNTY TRANSIT AND BUS RAPID TRANSIT ON HIGH RIDERSHIP

19 CORRIDORS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND EAST BAY, AND SIGNAL PRIORITY

20 GENERAL ENHANCEMENTS AND SMALL SCALE BUS SERVICE. INVESTMENT

21 IN THIS STRATEGY SEEK TO MODERNIZE AND SELECTIVELY EXTEND THE

22 REGION'S RAIL NETWORK THE STRATEGY INCLUDES SEVERAL INVESTMENT

23 IN THE BART SYSTEM INCLUDING CORE CAPACITY AND BART TO SILICON

24 VALLEY AND EAST BAY. INCLUDING SEVERAL HIGHER COST INVESTMENTS

25 IN THE SECOND HALF OF THE PLAN INCLUDING LINKING WITH SAN



## Meeting Transcript

1 FRANCISCO AND PROJECTS THAT FEED INTO AND SUPPORT THAT  
2 INVESTMENT DOWNTOWN CALTRAIN EXTENSION FREQUENCY INTERCHANGES  
3 TO CALTRAIN AND PROVIDING CONNECTIONS BETWEEN CENTRAL VALLEY  
4 AND THE EAST BAY. ADDITIONALLY SEVERAL LIGHT RAIL PROJECTS  
5 IDENTIFY THE STRATEGIES WITH INVESTMENTS AND GRADE SEPARATIONS  
6 AND STATION ENHANCEMENTS FOR RAIL SERVICE. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY  
7 TURNING TO THE FREEWAY NETWORK THIS STRATEGY ENVISIONS NEXT  
8 GENERATION FREEWAY NETWORK THAT SUPPORTS CARPOOLERS AND  
9 TRANSIT RIDERS FOUNDATION REGIONAL CONTINUOUS PRESS LANES  
10 NETWORK BUILT IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN EXPRESS BUS ROUTES  
11 OPERATING WITHIN THE SIX EXPRESS BUS NETWORK INCLUDING EXPRESS  
12 BUS SERVICE FROM DIRIDON TO SALESFORCE TRANSIT CENTER FALL  
13 SHOW TO SF AIRPORT AND SAN FRANCISCO TO RED WE CITY THROUGH  
14 THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR. OTHER INVESTMENTS ON I80 AND TRANSIT  
15 BAY LINES WOULD SUPPORT EXPRESS BUS INVESTMENTS. NEXT SLIDE.  
16 RECOMMENDATIONS PRESENTED HERE HELP INFORM THE DEFINITION OF  
17 SEVERAL TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINT,  
18 HOWEVER AS THERESE MCMILLAN WAS MENTIONING STRATEGIES IN  
19 QUESTION ARE ONE ELEMENT OF ONE COMPONENT THAT INCLUDE  
20 STRATEGIES AND ENVIRONMENT. NEXT ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT ON THE  
21 FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES IN ORDER TO FINALIZE THE PROPOSAL  
22 BY SEPTEMBER OF THIS YEAR SO ANOTHER ROUND OF ANALYSIS CAN  
23 BEGIN -- DIGITAL TRIBAL SUMMIT WILL BE HELD IN PLACE OF THE  
24 PREVIOUS RTPS. STAFF AND PARTNER AGENCIES, WE'LL BE HOSTING  
25 TWO EXTENDED RAWG WORKSHOPS REGIONAL ADVISORY WORKING GROUP AS



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WELL AS THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP IN JULY AND AUGUST. NEXT  
2 SLIDE.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RALEIGH ARE YOU SPEAKING?

5

6 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THANK YOU. AND I APOLOGIZE IF MY CONNECTION IS  
7 CAUSING DELAY.

8

9 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** RALEIGH YOU MIGHT TRY TURNING OFF YOUR  
10 VIDEO SOMETIMES THAT HELPS.

11

12 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** OKAY AND I APOLOGIES EVERYONE. THIS IS THE LAST  
13 SLIDE. TO CLOSE OUT THE PRESENTATION, IN MAY STAFF WILL HOLD  
14 COMMUNITY-BASED WORKSHOPS AND WE WANT TO CLOSE OUT THE  
15 PRESENTATION WITH SOME OF THE QUOTES WE HAVE RECEIVED. TO  
16 SUMMARIZE COMMON THEMES THERE WAS BROAD INVESTMENTS FOR LOW  
17 INCOME TRIPS LOW INCOME PEOPLE LIKELY TAKE INCLUDING WEEKEND  
18 AND OFF PEAK. HIGHLIGHTING SHORTCOMINGS OF THE EXISTING SYSTEM  
19 INCLUDING BARRIERS TO ACCESSING DISCOUNT PROGRAMS AND  
20 DIFFICULTY NAVIGATING TRANSFERS BETWEEN OPERATORS ONE QUOTE  
21 SUMS IT UP BEST "I JUST WANT THE BUS TO BE NEW, CLEAN, AND NOT  
22 BREAKDOWN." AS WE CONTINUE TO THINK THROUGH THE FINAL  
23 BLUEPRINT IN THE COMING MONTHS INPUT LIKE THIS IS IMPORTANT TO  
24 MEET THE NEEDS OF THE REGION'S MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES. NEXT  
25 SLIDE.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RALEIGH, ARE YOU FINISHED?

3

4 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** RALEIGH, WE HAVE A QUESTION --

7

8 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** JUST TO CLOSE OUT, TO WRAP UP NOW -- WE'RE --

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH.

11

12 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** YES. JUST TO WRAP UP WITH THE REQUESTS ACTION

13 THIS IS AN ACTION FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WHERE WE'RE

14 REQUESTING APPROVAL OF THE REGIONAL FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS

15 INCLUDED IN YOUR ATTACHMENT WHICH AGAIN REPRESENTS A STARTING

16 POINT FOR CONVERSATIONS WITH CTAS AS FINALIZE THEIR FISCALLY

17 CONSTRAINED COUNTY LIST. WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS

18 NOW.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU RALEIGH, CAN YOU BRING

21 SLIDE TELL UP? I HAVE GOT A QUESTION BEFORE WE GET THERE.

22 TRANSIT BENEFITTING LOW INCOME, STUDIES AND REALITY SHOW US

23 THAT THEY -- THEIR INCOME INCREASES, THE TWO THINGS THEY

24 PURCHASE ARE CARS AND HOMES. THEY -- STUDIES SHOW THAT THEY

25 FEEL LIKE THEY HAVE BEEN DENIED THE MOBILITY THIS A LOT OF US



## Meeting Transcript

1 TAKE FOR GRANTED DRIVING TO A PARK OR GOING SOME PLACE. HOW DO  
2 YOU JUSTIFY THAT TRANSIT JUST ALWAYS BENEFITS THE LOW INCOME?  
3 THE WAY IT'S IN THESE CORRIDORS THAT WERE BEING DESIGNED?

4

5 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** SO I CAN START OFF. A LOT OF THESE  
6 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE INFORMED BY OUR QUANTITATIVE EQUITY  
7 ASSESSMENTS THROUGH THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT  
8 APPROACH WHICH MODELS THE TRAVEL BAY AREA OF PEOPLE BY THEIR  
9 INCOME GROUPS AND HELPS US UNDERSTAND WHO IS BENEFITTING FROM  
10 DIFFERENT PROJECTS. REALLY HAVING THAT QUANTITATIVE OBJECTIVE  
11 FINDING HELPS US TO UNDERSTAND WHICH PROJECTS ARE MOST LIKELY  
12 TO ADVANCE EQUITY.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DO YOU MAKE THE ASSUMPTION THAT  
15 LOW INCOME PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO BE BUYING CARS? IS THAT THE  
16 ASSUMPTION THAT YOU HAVE MADE? >DAVE VAUTIN: IF I MAY, CHAIR  
17 SPERING, I CAN JUMP IN ON THIS ONE. FIRST, IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
18 NOTE THE MAJORITY OF LOW INCOME FOLKS, AS WELL AS THE CLEAR  
19 MAJORITY OF HIGH INCOME FOLKS OWN CARS IN THE BAY AREA AND OUR  
20 FORECAST SHOWS THAT WILL LIKELY CONTINUE IN THE FUTURE BUT  
21 OBVIOUSLY A GREATER SHARE OF LOWER INCOME FOLKS DO NOT OWN  
22 CARS WHEN WE DO OUR MODELING WE LOOK AT THE CHARACTERISTIC OF  
23 EACH HOUSEHOLD DEPENDING ON THEIR LOCATION WHETHER THEY CHOOSE  
24 TO OWN ZERO, 1, 2, 3, CARS AND THAT'S DEPENDENT ON THEIR  
25 INCOME, WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO WORK AND THINGS. DEPENDING ON



## Meeting Transcript

1 INVESTMENTS AND THIS IS REFLECTED IN EXISTING DATA AS WELL IN  
2 TERMS OF WHAT THE BAY AREA LOOKS LIKE TODAY. OUR BUS SYSTEMS  
3 TENDS TO HAVE MUCH HIGHER SHARES OF LOWER INCOME AND MINORITY  
4 RIDERS AND OUR RAIL SYSTEMS TENDS TO HAVE HIGHER INCOME  
5 DEMOGRAPHIC VIEW WITH SYSTEMS LIKE CALTRAIN OR ACE WHERE THE  
6 MEDIAN INCOME FOR THE TYPICAL RIDER IS QUITE HIGH. WHEN WE  
7 LOOK AT TRANSIT INVESTMENTS SOME OF THE INVESTMENTS ON THE  
8 PREVIOUS STRATEGY WITH BUS AND BUS RAPID TRANSIT LINES THOSE  
9 VARIES STRONGLY TO ADVANCE EQUITY WHICH PERFORMANCE STRONGLY  
10 WITH OUR PROJECT THIS IS WHY IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE THE  
11 STRATEGY MEANS BASED FARES TO FORM THE DEMOGRAPHIC FOR THE  
12 RAIL SYSTEMS.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVE ON THE POVERTY LEVELS DO  
15 THEY STAY CONSTANT OR DO YOU SEE THAT GOING DOWN DO YOU SEE  
16 MORE PEOPLE MOVING INTO PROSPERITY? HOW DUPLICATE THOSE  
17 NUMBERS? >DAVE VAUTIN: WHEN WE DID ECONOMIC FORECASTING FOR  
18 THE PLAN WE HAVE STRATEGIES TRYING TO MOVE PEOPLE INTO THE  
19 MIDDLE CLASS ULTIMATELY THE GLOBAL AND NATIONAL TRENDS ARE SO  
20 POWERFUL INCOME AND EQUALITY GETTING WORSE AND WORSE SO WE SEE  
21 CONTINUED BREAKDOWN OF PEOPLE AT THE LOWER END AND MORE PEOPLE  
22 AT THE HIGHER END AS WE MOVE TO 2050.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH UNFORTUNATELY THAT DIVISION  
25 IS GROWING. ON THIS SLIDE HERE AT OUR WORKSHOP, WE TALKED



## Meeting Transcript

1 ABOUT THE VALLEY LINK AND HOPEFULLY SCOTT OR SOMETHING CAN  
2 ADDRESS THE ISSUE, IS THAT PERIOD TWO, I UNDERSTAND THE  
3 DOWNTOWN CALTRAIN EXPANSION AND SO FORTH BUT I THOUGHT VALLEY  
4 LINK HAD CONSIDERABLE MONEY THAT'S ALREADY DEDICATED TO THAT.  
5 WHY IS THAT IN THAT CATEGORY? CAN SOMEBODY RESPOND TO THE  
6 VALLEY LINK?

7

8 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** SO, MR. CHAIRMAN I --

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD, SCOTT.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YOU KNOW, MICHAEL TREE IS ALSO ON THE  
13 LINE SO I WOULD LIKE MAYBE HIM TO GET ON AND MAYBE RAISE HIS  
14 HAND, BUT YOU KNOW THERE IS -- I WOULD SUBMIT TO YOU THAT IT'S  
15 PROBABLY ONE OF THE MORE EARLY FUNDED PROJECTS THAT WE SEE ON  
16 THE LIST. IT HAS A LITTLE OVER \$600 MILLION IN IT RIGHT NOW  
17 SOME COMING FROM THE PLANNING AREA HERE OUT IN THE TRI-VALLEY  
18 THROUGH MEASURE B HAS PUT UP 400 MTC HAS MONEY INVOLVED. I'LL  
19 LET MICHAEL TREE TALK MORE TO THE SPECIFICS I'M GOING TO TALK  
20 ABOUT VALLEY LINK IN A BIT WHEN I RAISE MY HAND BUT AS FAR AS  
21 YOUR QUESTIONS ON THE DOLLARS I'LL LET MICHAEL DO IT.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ONE OF THE QUESTIONS I RAISED,  
24 DAVE VAUTIN, I THOUGHT AT OUR WORKSHOP WE TALKED ABOUT VALLEY  
25 LINK AND THE BENEFIT IT HAD WITH THE INTER-REGIONAL TRAFFIC



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 CONGESTION IN A MAJOR CORRIDOR, OR SOMETHING. AND I'M JUST  
2 SURPRISED TO SEE THAT IN THAT SECOND PHASE, AND SO I'M HOPING,  
3 YOU KNOW, STAFF IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO RESPOND A LITTLE BIT.  
4 SCOTT, WHO DID YOU SAY WOULD SPEAK?

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MICHAEL TREE. BUT IF I COULD JUST SAY ONE  
7 MORE THING, EVER YEAR THIS PROJECT DELAYS IT GOES UP \$60  
8 MILLION SO IF WE GO UP INTO 2035 AND HAVE TO COMPETE THEN WE  
9 HAVE PROBABLY PUT IT TO A POINT WHERE THE PROJECT CAN'T BE  
10 BUILT BECAUSE YOU HAVE BEEN ADDING \$60 MILLION FOR 15 YEARS.  
11 MICHAEL ARE YOU ON THE LINE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **MICHAEL TREE:** OKAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

18

19 **MICHAEL TREE:** GREAT. THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING I WOULD BE HAPPY  
20 TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON FUNDING FOR VALLEY LINK IN THE NEAR  
21 FUTURE MTC WILL CONSIDER REALLOCATING \$400 MILLION IN THE  
22 PROJECT FOR BB FUNDS AND WE ANTICIPATE THAT TO TAKE PLACE IT  
23 HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED 188 MILLION FOR BRIDGE TOLL FOR THE  
24 PROJECT. [ SILENCE ] -- TOWARDS FINANCIALLY PARTICIPATING IN  
25 THE TRAIN \$40 MILLION FROM SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY AND AGENCIES





## Meeting Transcript

1 THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING TOWARDS FUNDING WITH THEIR AQMD, THE  
2 TRAIN IS BEING PLANNED FOR ZERO EMISSIONS AND ALSO LOOKING AT  
3 ADDITIONAL IMPACT FEES AND TAX INCREMENT FINANCING, AND  
4 FINALLY I'LL SAY SINCE THERE WAS DISCUSSION ON THE IMPORTANCE  
5 OF FUTURE SALES TRANSPORTATION FUNDING FOR EITHER A SALES TAX  
6 OR OTHER WITH THE BALLOTS, SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY, LIKE THE BAY  
7 AREA HAS BEEN PLANNING FOR A TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX EITHER  
8 IN 2022 OR THERE, SHORTLY THEREFORE, WHEN THE ECONOMY  
9 REINFORCE, WHICH WOULD PROVIDE FUNDING FOR THE PROJECT AND  
10 CERTAINLY YOU HAVE A LOT OF INTEREST FROM THE STATE WITH THEIR  
11 PROGRAM. THIS PROJECT IS IN THE STATE RAIL PLAN SO EXPECT SOME  
12 FUNDING FROM THE TERSE UP AND SUGGESTED CORRIDORS AND YOU HAVE  
13 THREE CONGRESSMEN WHO ARE REPRESENTED IN THE PROJECT AREA WHO  
14 HAVE A VERY KEEN INTEREST ON PROVIDING FEDERAL FUNDING. SO IN  
15 SHORT, WE SEE A PATH FOR ACTUALLY CONSTRUCTING AND BEING AN  
16 OPERATIONS BEFORE 2028 OR SHORTLY INTO 2028, WHICH IS, YOU  
17 KNOW, THIS'S SIX YEARS PRIOR TO THAT 2035 YEAR THAT  
18 DIFFERENTIATES BETWEEN PERIOD ONE AND PERIOD TWO. OKAY. I  
19 THINK DAVE VAUTIN, I DIDN'T MEAN TO FOCUS ON THE MONEY SIDE OF  
20 THIS THING. I THOUGHT THERE WAS SOME DISCUSSION THAT THERE  
21 WERE, YOU KNOW, MORE BENEFIT TO THIS PROJECT BETWEEN THE TWO  
22 REGIONS, AND SO THAT'S WHY, I JUST FIND IT STAGE THAT THAT  
23 PROJECT IS, IN THAT SECOND PERIOD.

24

25 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MR. CHAIR --



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **MICHAEL TREE:** MR. CHAIR IF I COULD --

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID, WHO WANTS TO GO? MATT OR  
5 DAVID?

6

7 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** IT'S ME, SCOTT.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD, SCOTT.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THERE IS CURRENTLY 90,000 PEOPLE COMMUTING  
12 OVER THE ALTAMONT EVERY DAY AND AS I REPORTED EARLIER MOUNTAIN  
13 HOUSE SALES HAVE TRIPLED IN THE LAST FEW MONTHS WHICH YOU CAN  
14 BUYOUT THERE FOR \$500,000 IS A BEAUTIFUL HOME, AND PEOPLE ARE  
15 MOVING OUT THERE. THE VALLEY LINK WILL HAVE 15 MINUTE  
16 HEADWAYS, AND WILL RUN ALL DAY, WHEREAS WE APPRECIATE, AND I  
17 WANT TO SAY THIS, TOO, TO THE STAFF, I APPRECIATE THE WORK  
18 THEY HAVE DONE WITH ACE, BUT LIKE I SAID, WE'RE GETTING BART  
19 LIKE SERVICE ALL THE WAY INTO RIVERBANK CALIFORNIA, AND IT IS  
20 AS THE STATE RAIL PLAN, IT IS IN THE STATE RAIL PLAN I THINK  
21 THE RIDERSHIP PROJECTIONS ARE AROUND SOMEWHERE AROUND 30,000 A  
22 DAY. THE THING S IF THAT GETS CARS OFF THE ROADS AND THAT  
23 HELPS WITH TRUCK TRAFFIC SUPPOSED TO TRIPLE BY 2035 OVER THE  
24 ALTAMONT, THIS IS ALSO HELPING THE PORT CONTINUE TO DO ITS



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 ECONOMIC ENGINE TOO, AND YOU CAN'T FORGET THE AIR QUALITY AND  
2 GETTING THOSE 30,000 CARS OFF THE ROAD.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DAVID, CAN YOU KIND OF  
5 RESPOND. I SORT OF APOLOGIES. I DIDN'T WANT TO JUST FOCUS ON  
6 THIS ONE PROJECT, BUT THIS KIND OF STOOD OUT TO ME IN OUR  
7 PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS ON THIS. GO AHEAD. >DAVE VAUTIN:

8 CERTAINLY CHAIR SPERING AND CHAIR HAGGERTY. THERE IS A NUMBER  
9 OF PROJECTS IN THE SECOND HALF OF THE PLAN. DUE TO COVID-19 WE  
10 TOOK AN \$11 BILLION HIT ON THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN. SO WE  
11 WOULD HAVE HAD 11 BILLION MORE IN REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY MONEY  
12 IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN IF IT WASN'T FOR THE RECESSION  
13 WE'RE BEING HIT WITH RIGHT NOW THAT WOULD HAVE GIVEN US A LOT  
14 MORE MONEY IN THE EARLY YEAR OF THE PLAN. SO WE AGREE WITH THE  
15 VALLEY LINK FOLKS THIS IS A CRITICAL PROJECT IT PERFORMED  
16 SECOND BEST IN TERMS OF RAIL EXTENSION IN TERMS EVER CROSSING  
17 AND PROJECT EVALUATIONS IT WAS A GOOD PERFORMING PROJECT. AT  
18 THE SAME TIME, IT HAS -- IT, LIKE A LOT OF OTHER PROJECTS IN  
19 THE RIGHT COLUMN HAS A VERY LARGE DISCRETIONARY AREA WITH THE  
20 2028 OPENING IT'S A \$2.5 BILLION DISCRETIONARY FUNDING. WE ARE  
21 STRUGGLING TO TRY TO FIND WAYS TO FIT MORE PROJECTS IN THE  
22 FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN WITHOUT KICKING OUT SOME OF THE MUCH  
23 NEEDED TRANSIT INVESTMENTS THAT ARE IN THERE EXPRESS LANES  
24 OTHER SORTS OF PROJECTS. YOU KNOW, WE ARE WORKING TO CONTINUE  
25 TO LOOK AT WAYS TO ENSURE WE CAN GROW THE PIE THERE AND



## Meeting Transcript

1 IDENTIFY ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCES, BUT THAT SORT OF FISCAL  
2 CONSTRAINT IF THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN IS WHY, YOU KNOW, A  
3 NUMBER OF THESE RAIL PROJECTS ARE PLACED AT THE TAIL END. IN  
4 THESE OTHER REGIONS WHERE THEY ADVANCE THE MEGA MEASURE THEY  
5 WENT BACK AND AMENDED THEIR PLAN AND ACCELERATED PROJECTS TO  
6 BRING THEM FORWARD AND THAT'S EXACTLY THE SAME SORT OF THING  
7 WE COULD DO BOTH THROUGH THE TRANSIT PROJECT ACCELERATION  
8 POLICY THAT WE'RE EXPLORING FOR 2021 BUT ALSO FOR FUTURE  
9 PLANS. THAT'S ALSO ANOTHER OPTION IN ADDITION TRYING TO FIND  
10 WAYS TO FIT MORE PROJECTS INTO THE FIRST HALF OF THE PLAN.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU DAVID. JULIE, DID  
13 YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP?

14

15 **JULIE PIERCE:** I JUST WANT TO ADD TO THE CHORUS FOR THE VALLEY  
16 LINK IT MAKES A WHOLE LOT OF SENSE AND IS FURTHER ALONG IN  
17 MANY WAYS AND MAKES A HUGE DIFFERENCE. I'M NOT ON MTC BUT I'M  
18 IN FAVOR OF GOING THAT FIRST.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBER  
21 COMMENTS?

22

23 **JESSE ARREQUIN, VICE CHAIR:** MR. CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS  
24 VALLEY LINK AS WELL AS ONE OF THE REPRESENTATIVES OF ALAMEDA  
25 COUNTY CITIES I WANT TO TALK ABOUT HOW THIS PROJECT IS SO



## Meeting Transcript

1    IMPORTANT NOT JUST TO THE TRI-VALLEY BUT TO THE ENTIRE COUNTY.  
2    IT'S ABOUT RELIEVING THE CONGESTION SO THAT TRUCK TRAFFIC THAT  
3    IS GOING TO AND FROM OUR PORT CAN MOVE MORE EFFICIENTLY. SO  
4    IT'S IMPORTANT TO OUR BROADER ECONOMIC GOALS AND ALSO IS  
5    IMPORTANT TO GET CARS OFF THE ROAD AND TO ADVANCE OUR  
6    GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS AND TO PROMOTE MORE SUSTAINABLE  
7    WAYS OF PEOPLE TO COMMUTE. SO AS WAS NOTED, THE ALAMEDA COUNTY  
8    TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WHICH I SERVE ON IS CONSIDERING  
9    REPROGRAM BEING OVER \$400 MILLION WHICH WAS PREVIOUSLY  
10    ALLOCATED FOR THE BART TO LIVERMORE EXTENSION FOR THIS PROJECT  
11    AND WHEN WE APPROVED OUR TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX, IN 2014, IN  
12    OUR TRANSPORTATION EXPENDITURE PLAN WE SAID WE WANT TO LOOK AT  
13    A RAIL EXTENSION IN THE TRI-VALLEY BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT MORE  
14    HOUSING IS BEING BUILT THERE. THERE WAS A LOT OF COMMUTE IN  
15    THE MEGA REGION, AND WE NEED TO RELIEVE THE CONGESTION. SO I'M  
16    HOPEFUL THAT MY COLLEAGUES ON THE ALAMEDA COUNTY  
17    TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WILL SUPPORT THAT EXPENDITURE BUT I  
18    REALLY THINK THIS IS CRITICAL TO MOVE TO THE FIRST PHASE SO IF  
19    THIS CAN ACTUALLY BE BUILT NOW SO WE CAN RELIEVE CONGESTION  
20    ADVANCE OUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS AND IMPROVE THE  
21    TRUCK TRANSPORT TO AND FROM THE PORT OF OAKLAND SO I WOULD  
22    URGE MTC MEMBERS TO APPROVE IT IN PHASE ONE.

23

24    **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU --

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** -- AROUND DTX, THE EXTENSION THAT'S BEEN MENTIONED IN  
2 THIS PRESENTATION BUT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THIS SHOULD BE A  
3 PRIORITY PROJECT AND HAS BEEN MENTIONED IN THE PAST AS  
4 POTENTIALLY PART OF ONE SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S INCLUDED  
5 IN STAFF'S ASSUMPTIONS AND JUST WANTED STAFF'S RESPONSE.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NICK JOSEFOWITZ, AND  
8 THEN JAKE MACKENZIE.

9

10 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. I WAS GOING TO SAY THE SAME THING  
11 AS EDDIE. YOU KNOW, DTX BEING A REGIONAL PRIORITY FOR MANY  
12 RTPS, IT'S A -- IT'S BEEN AT SORT OF THE -- AT THE FRONT OF  
13 THE QUEUE AS A FEDERAL NEW STARTS PRIORITY AS WELL, AND IT  
14 SERVES PART OF THE REGION THAT HAS BUILT THE MOST -- THAT HAS  
15 REALLY KIND OF DONE SO MUCH TO BUILD SO MUCH HOUSING AND TO  
16 CREATE SO MANY JOBS IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. AND YOU KNOW, I  
17 THINK IT'S -- I WOULD REALLY ADVOCATE FOR IT GOING IN PHASE  
18 ONE. HOWEVER, I UNDERSTAND THAT THE KIND OF THE FISCAL  
19 CONSTRAINTS, BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE -- YOU KNOW, AND I KIND  
20 OF UNDERSTAND STAFF'S PERSPECTIVE OF WANTING TO DO A MEGA  
21 PROJECT DELIVERY PROCESS, BECAUSE I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY  
22 PROBLEMATIC IF, FROM A -- FROM A SAN FRANCISCO PERSPECTIVE IF  
23 PLANNED BAY AREA ALL OF A SUDDEN PUT OTHER LARGE RAIL PROJECTS  
24 IN FRONT OF THE QUEUE IN FRONT OF DTX BECAUSE DTX IS  
25 ENVIRONMENTALLY CLEARED, AND IT IS JUST A CRITICALLY IMPORTANT



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 LINK IN ADDITION AS A FIRST STEP TOWARDS A SECOND RAIL  
2 CROSSING ACROSS THE BAY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. JAKE?

5

6 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'M HERE. I'M LIVE. I'M WELL. ONE PART OF THE  
7 REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK THAT IS STILL IN ITS INFANCY THAT IS AS  
8 WELL RECOGNIZED AS SMART, BUT SMART HAS BEEN INCLUDED IN THE  
9 SAME CALIFORNIA RAIL PLAN THAT HAS BEEN REFERENCED EARLIER ON,  
10 AND I BELIEVE IT WOULD HAVE BEEN A REAL DISSERVICE TO THE  
11 REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK AND TO TRANSIT PLANS LOOKING FORWARD TO  
12 2050, IF THE SMART PROJECT WAS NOT INCLUDED IN ONE PLANNED BAY  
13 AREA. I'M NO LONGER ON THE SMART BOARD AS YOU KNOW BUT I WAS  
14 ON IT FOR MEMBERSHIP A YEAR. BUT CERTAINLY THE LONG-TERM GOAL  
15 OF GOING TO CLOVERDALE DOESN'T RESONATE VERY WELL IN TERMS OF  
16 LOOKING AT POPULATIONS, BUT CERTAINLY THE WORK THAT'S GOING ON  
17 TO GET SMART TO WINDSOR AND HEALDSBURG IS SOMETHING TO BE  
18 CONSIDERED AS WELL AS THE CONNECTION TO THE MAIN LINES THROUGH  
19 STATE ROUTE 37, AND THAT'S ANOTHER PROJECT THAT WAS CALLED OUT  
20 EARLIER ON IN THE PRESENTATION TODAY, AND TO ME, I THINK SMART  
21 NEEDS TO BE INCLUDED IN THAT SO THAT IT IS IN A POSITION TO  
22 ACCEPT FUNDING NOT ONLY IN TERMS EVER EXTENDING THE REGIONAL  
23 RAIL NETWORK, BUT ALSO TO BE PART OF A STATE ROUTE 37  
24 RESILIENCY PROGRAM. SO THERE YOU HAVE IT. THANKS. BYE.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I HAVE GOT CARLOS AND AMY AND  
2 THEN DAVID RABBIT. HEY, BEFORE ANY OF YOU GO, THERESE, CAN YOU  
3 WAIT TO SPEAK? OR DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING YOU WANTED TO --  
4 THERESE?

5

6 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I CAN WAIT TO SPEAK. WHY DON'T -- YEAH. I'LL  
7 WAIT UNTIL -- AND THEN WHY DON'T YOU CALL ON ME CHAIR SPERING  
8 AFTER THE COMMISSIONERS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. CARLOS, GO AHEAD.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO CALL OUT, WHEN YOU COMBINE HOUSING AND BUS  
13 TRANSPORTATION COSTS FOR MANY PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND WORKING  
14 CLASS FOLKS IN THE BAY AREA, CLEARLY THAT NUMBER IS IN EXCESS  
15 OF 65 TO 75 PERCENT OF FOLKS'S INCOME, AND HAVING A LOCAL BUS  
16 SERVICE CONNECTED W AND I THINK IT IS POINT OUT HERE IN THE  
17 PLAN, A MORE REGIONAL INTEGRATE THE EXPRESS LANE, EXPRESS BUS  
18 NETWORK, WHICH I HOPE WOULD ALSO INCLUDE DRT UPGRADES. I THINK  
19 IT MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE TO GETTING EQUITABLE OUTCOMES FOR  
20 LOWER INCOME FOLKS, PEOPLE OF COLOR. I PROBABLY AM GOING TO  
21 TAKE A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT STANCE FOR MOST FOLKS REPRESENTING  
22 THEIR AREA. DUMBARTON RAIL IS PUT IN THE SECOND CATEGORY OR  
23 SECOND TRANCHE OF PROJECTS FURTHER DOWN THE LINE. IT'S GOING  
24 TO SERVE MAYBE 18,000 PEOPLE. AT THE RISK OF PILLARING  
25 LOCALLY, I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE TO LOOK AT DUMBARTON





## Meeting Transcript

1 CROSSING AS A CRITICAL EXPRESS LANE/DRT LINE. THEY COULD  
2 ACTUALLY RUN ON THE EXISTING ROADWAY AND IT WOULD BE A REAL  
3 TRAGEDY TO NOT TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO STUDY THAT APPROACH,  
4 GIVEN THAT FACEBOOK HAS PULLED OUT OF THE OVERALL LARGER RAIL  
5 PROJECT. THEY WERE FUNDING A FAIR AMOUNT OF THE UPFRONT COST.  
6 WHO KNOWS HOW MUCH THEY WERE GOING TO FUND ON THE ACTUAL  
7 INFRASTRUCTURE, I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE FOR US TO TRY  
8 TO FIGURE OUT AND INTEGRATE INTO THIS PLAN, A ROBUST ANALYSIS  
9 OF HOW VTK COULD WORK OVER THE DUMBARTON BRIDGE, AND  
10 ESSENTIALLY HOPE NO LONGER REQUIRE THE USE OF PRIOR BRIDGE  
11 WHICH WAS AT THE TIME WAS A BILLION AND A HALF DOLLAR PROJECT  
12 SAM I THINK YOU REMEMBER ABOUT WHEN THE \$90 MILLION WENT OUT  
13 TO BART AND NOW THIS IS CLOSER TO TWO AND A HALF TO THREE  
14 BILLION DOLLARS PROJECT AND TO THE EXTEND THAT WE ACCOUNT LOOK  
15 AT VRT WHICH WOULD BE COST EFFECTIVE AND USE THE UNION PACIFIC  
16 RIGHT OF WAY THAT WE OWN IN SAN MATEO COUNTY I THINK THAT  
17 MIGHT GO FARTHER IN MOVING PEOPLE FROM THE EAST BAY TO THE JOB  
18 CENTERS HERE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AS WELL AS SAN MATEO  
19 COUNTY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO REMIND  
22 EVERYONE, PERIOD TWO DOESN'T -- PRECLUDE THOSE PROJECTS FROM  
23 LOOKING AT ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN AND SO FORTH. IT'S JUST WE'RE  
24 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED AND THE ONLY REASON I BROUGHT UP VALLEY  
25 LINK IS BECAUSE I KNOW THERE IS A SIZABLE COMMITMENT TO IT.



## Meeting Transcript

1 SOME OF THESE OTHER PROJECTS DON'T HAVE THAT. I WANT TO SUBMIT  
2 THAT FOR CLARIFY, AND FOR 1 AND 2, THESE ARE VERY IMPORTANT  
3 PROJECTS THAT PEOPLE ARE TALKING ABOUT THAT ARE ON THE RADAR  
4 SCREEN SHOWING THEY ARE IMPORTANT AND THAT WE'RE NOT  
5 MENTIONING THEM, THAT WE ARE TRYING TO BRING THOSE FORWARD. SO  
6 WITH THAT, AMY, AND THEN I GOT DAVID RABBIT AND THEN MAYOR  
7 LICCARDO.

8

9 **AMY R. WORTH:** GREAT. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR AND FOR YOUR  
10 LEADERSHIP ON THIS. AND THANK YOU TO STAFF. YOU HAVE DONE  
11 INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF WORK TO BRING THIS TOGETHER AND AS WE  
12 DISCUSS IT WE UNDERSTAND MORE AND MORE. I WANT TO OFFER  
13 COMMENTS. FIRST I CONCUR IN LOOKING AT OUR REGION, WE LOOK  
14 WIDELY AND WE LOOK LOCALLY, AND THAT'S THE CHANGE WITH THIS  
15 PLAN. WE NEED TO DO BOTH IN THAT PLAN. SO, I -- AND I REALLY  
16 WANTED TO CONCUR WITH THE THOUGHTS AROUND THE VALLEY LINK  
17 PROGRAM. YOU KNOW, WE TALKED ABOUT HOUSING, IN THE LAST ITEM,  
18 AND WHILE I RECOGNIZE WE HAVE AMBITIOUS GOALS, THE TREMENDOUS  
19 COST OF PRODUCING HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA, I'M NOT SURE WE  
20 HAVE REALLY HONESTLY CONSIDERED WHAT WOULD THAT TRULY MEANS,  
21 AND CONSEQUENTLY PEOPLE ARE MOVING, YOU KNOW, OUT INTO THE --  
22 INTO SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY, AND DOWN TO MONTEREY, AND A VARIETY  
23 OF PLACES AND WE NEED TO LINK THOSE WITH RAIL. WE COULDN'T  
24 REPEAT THE SINS OF THE PAST AND JUST RELY ON CARS. RAIL LINKS  
25 ARE VERY IMPORTANT. AND THAT'S ANOTHER THING I WANT TO ADDRESS



## Meeting Transcript

1 WE HAVE TALKED RESPECTIVELY ABOUT THE REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK,  
2 AND I THINK THE NEW REGIONAL TRANSIT RAIL CORRIDOR ACROSS THE  
3 BAY THAT WOULD PROVIDE FACILITIES FOR BOTH BART AS WELL AS  
4 HEAVY RAIL, LIKE CAPITAL CORRIDOR, MAKES A HUGE -- WILL MAKE A  
5 HUGE DIFFERENCE ULTIMATELY IN TERMS OF OUR, YOU KNOW, EC -- --  
6 TO GET CLOSE TO ACHIEVING THOSE GREENHOUSE GAS AND VMT  
7 REDUCTION GOALS THAT ARE A REQUIREMENT. SO, YOU KNOW, A  
8 RECOGNIZE THE CHALLENGE WITH THE LONG-TERM PLANNING. I KNOW  
9 LOS ANGELES HAD TO DEAL WITH IT EXTENSIVELY WITH THEIR SALES  
10 TAX MEASURE BECAUSE IT WAS A PERPETUITY AND THE PROJECTS WERE  
11 ANTICIPATED SIMILAR TO THE LINKS THAT WE'RE CONSIDERING. SO, I  
12 ALSO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT THIS PLAN OFFERS AN  
13 ADVOCACY PLATFORM FOR US TO GO AND GET THOSE NEW STARTS,  
14 FEDERAL DOLLARS THAT ARE ABSOLUTELY REQUIRED TO ACHIEVE THESE  
15 PROJECT GOALS. SO THANK YOU. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU AMY. DAVID RABBIT.  
18 DAVID. DAVID RABBIT, ABAG CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR.  
19 CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO FOLLOW UP ON WHAT COMMISSIONER  
20 MACKENZIE LAID OUT THERE AND TALK ABOUT SMART FOR A SECOND.  
21 YOU ARE ALL FAMILIAR WITH SMART AND WE VERY MUCH APPRECIATE  
22 ALL THE SUPPORT OVER THE YEARS AS WE CONTINUE TO GO FORWARD  
23 AND BUILD THE SYSTEM OUT RIGHT NOW WE'RE UNDER CONSTRUCTION  
24 FROM NORTH SANTA ROSA TO WINDSOR WE HAVE MONEY TIED UP INTO  
25 RM3 TIMING WISE THAT'S GOING TO BE INTERESTING. WE JUST



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 COMPLETED A SALE AND BE PROVIDING A SECOND SMART STATION HERE  
2 IN PETALUMA. WE HAVE LARKSPUR NORTH SANTA ROSA NOW ON TO  
3 WINDSOR AND TO CLOVERDALE. IT IS ENVIRONMENTALLY CLEAR THAT AS  
4 THE RAIL NETWORK CONNECTION, THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS  
5 REDUCTIONS, HERE IN THE NORTH BAY WE HAVE ONE CORRIDOR IN  
6 NORTH SALES DIRECTION IT'S 101 AND SMART WAS ALWAYS SEEN AS A  
7 WAY TO STOP THE EXPANSION OF 101 AND GET PEOPLE ON TO RAIL AND  
8 IT'S BEEN SUCCESSFUL HERE PRIOR TO COVID I THINK WHAT'S  
9 IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF HOW THIS GETS INCORPORATED INTO PLANNED  
10 BAY AREA IS THE OPPORTUNITY FOR HOUSING. HERE IN PETALUMA  
11 ALONE AT THE TWO STATIONS WE HAVE PLANS APPROVED, JUST IN THE  
12 LAST SEVEN MONTHS FOR WELL OVER 500 UNITS AND THAT'S  
13 CONSERVATIVE FOR THIS TOWN IF YOU GO TO SANTA ROSA YOU'RE  
14 GOING TO HAVE SIMILAR TYPE NUMBERS AND IF YOU GO ALL LONG THE  
15 CORRIDOR YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE SIMILAR HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES.  
16 LOCAL COMMITMENT ON THE TWO COUNTIES IS TO COMPLETE THE FULL  
17 SYSTEM THAT WAS ENVISIONED. WE NEED TO PULL, I THINK, AT LEAST  
18 SOME PIECE OF SMART NEEDS TO REMAIN IN THE PLAN. AND I LOOK  
19 FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO WORK WITH STAFF AND SATISFY THE  
20 CHALLENGES THAT THE FISCAL CONSTRAINT BRING MAYBE IT'S NOT  
21 ALWAYS AS NORTH AS WAS INTENDED BUT THERE ARE STILL PIECES  
22 WITHIN IT THAT NEED TO BE FINANCED TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S  
23 GOING TO BE AS SUCCESSFUL AS IT WAS ENVISIONS AND THEN YOU  
24 THROW IN HERE WE HAD AN ELECTION CYCLE WHERE A BILLIONAIRE  
25 THROUGH IN MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OPPOSING IT BECAUSE WE CAN'T



## Meeting Transcript

1 COMPLETE WHAT WE PROMISED BECAUSE WE CAN'T STAY ON THE LIST TO  
2 GET THE MONEY IS KIND OF FULFILLING OUR OWN PROPHECY. JUST  
3 WANT TO LET EVERYONE KNOW THE BRIEF HISTORY HERE AT SMART.  
4 THANKS.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVID. SAM LICCARDO.

7

8 **SAM LICCARDO:** I WANT TO BUILD ON A COMMENT THAT COMMISSIONER  
9 ROW MERRY MADE THAT WAS IMPORTANT. EXPAND A REGIONAL LOOK  
10 HERE. I THINK WHAT WE ALL AGREE IS CONSTRAINED BUDGETS ARE A  
11 DAMPER ON OUR AMBITIONS OF EVERYTHING WE WANT TO ACCOMPLISH IN  
12 THIS REGION AND THESE PROJECTS ARE INCREDIBLY EXPENSIVE. AND I  
13 SUSPECT THAT WE'RE NOT THE ONLY AGENCY, VTA OR CITY OF SAN  
14 JOSE WHO THAT IS STARTING TO SPEND A LOT OF MONEY ON TECHNICAL  
15 ALTERNATIVES. WE'RE LOOKING AT RETROFITTING OUR LIGHT RAIL  
16 LINE TO BECOME AUTONOMOUS VRT LINE. INCREDIBLY COST  
17 INFRASTRUCTURE. SIMILARLY WE'RE TALKING TO THE COMPANIES WHO  
18 ARE TESTING IN LAS VEGAS WHERE YOU CAN RUN A CAR THROUGH A  
19 TUNNEL AND AVOID A LOT OF INFRASTRUCTURE COST. FAR BE IT FOR  
20 ME TO SUGGEST HYPERLOOP IS COMING SOMETIME SOON. THERE ARE A  
21 LOT OF PROBLEMS OUT THERE AND I THINK MANY OF US ARE LOOKING  
22 AT THOSE INDIVIDUALLY BUT IT SEEMS TO ME THIS WILL BE A ROLE  
23 THAT MTC WOULD PLAY AS A LEADER GIVEN HOW REGIONAL DOLLARS  
24 COULD BE USED FOR REGIONS TO TAKE LOCAL INCENTIVES TO DEAL  
25 WITH THE RISK. AS WE LOOK AT THE LONG HAUL ON THE OPTIMISTIC



## Meeting Transcript

1 DOLLARS WE WANT TO PASS AND MONIES WE'RE GETTING FROM THE  
2 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET WHAT WE NEED OR WANT  
3 AND WE'RE GOING TO LOOK AT BETTER ALTERNATIVES I WANT TO THROW  
4 OUT A SUGGEST THAT MTC WOULD PLAY A READ ROLE IN HELPING TO  
5 IDENTIFY THOSE SYSTEMS AND THOSE PROJECTS THAT MIGHT BE BETTER  
6 CANDIDATES FOR MORE COST EFFECTIVE TECHNOLOGICAL APPROACHES.  
7 AND I THINK -- I WOULD CERTAINLY BE HAPPY TO HAVE VTA BE A  
8 GUINEA PIG IN THAT EFFORT. BUT ANYWAY, I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT.  
9 THANK YOU.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAM FOR THOSE COMMENTS.  
12 I THINK THAT'S A TREND WE'RE HEADED TOWARDS. DAMON CONNOLLY.

13

14 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO FOCUS ON HIGHWAY 37  
15 FIRST. AS THINGS STAND THE INTERIM PROJECT IS INCLUDED IN  
16 PERIOD ONE, THE LONG-TERM PROJECT IS INCLUDED IN PERIOD TWO.  
17 THERE IS AN ASTERISK IN THE PRESENTATION RELATING TO THE  
18 INTERIM PROJECT, MAINLY THE ASTERISK IS ONLY INCLUDED IF GHG  
19 MITIGATIONS ARE IDENTIFIED BY SEPTEMBER. I WANT TO IMPACT  
20 THAT, BUT FIRST NOTE THAT ON ATTACHMENT B WHICH IS THE  
21 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS THEMSELVES, THE ASTERISK  
22 IS NOT INCLUDED FOR THE INTERIM PROJECT, BUT IS INCLUDED FOR  
23 THE LONG-TERM PROJECT. SO IT'S A DISCREPANCY, TO START OUT  
24 WITH. SO IF YOU COULD ANSWER WHAT IS THE ASTERISK ASSOCIATED  
25 WITH, AND THEN PROBABLY JUST AS IMPORTANTLY, WHAT DOES IT



## Meeting Transcript

1 MEAN? THIS IS KIND OF NEWS TO ME AND OTHERS EVEN THOUGH I HAVE  
2 BEEN ON THE POLICY STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HIGHWAY 37. BUT WHAT  
3 ARE THE QUALIFICATIONS IF THAT IS NOT MET BY SEPTEMBER AND  
4 THEN I HAVE ONE OTHER TOPIC. >DAVE VAUTIN: I CAN JUMP IN ON  
5 THIS ONE. THANK YOU FOR POINTING OUT THAT ERROR, THE ASTERISK  
6 IS SUPPOSED TO BE ON THE INTERIM PROJECT AS IT WAS IN THE  
7 POWERPOINT. PROJECT IS SPECIFIC TO THE WIDENING MUCH OF THE  
8 WIDENING WOULD BE IN THE FIRST PHASE IN PERIOD ONE. SO WHAT  
9 THAT INDICATES IS WE HAVE A SET OF PROJECTS FOR HIGHWAY  
10 CAPACITY EXPRESS LANES 37SR FOUR SR 239 CONTRA COSTA THOSE ARE  
11 A HANDFUL OF HIGHWAY PROJECTS PROPOSED AS PART OF THE  
12 STRATEGY. WE HAVE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS AS WELL. AND THOSE,  
13 INCLUDING THOSE PROJECTS WILL MAKE THAT SITUATION WORSE. IF WE  
14 DON'T HIT THE TARGET, MANY OF THESE ROAD PROJECTS WON'T BE  
15 ABLE TO GO AFTER STATE'S MONEYS FOR SB1 SO REALLY EAR ALL  
16 EITHER SUCCEED OR FAIL TOGETHER. WE PUT PROJECTS INTO THE PLAN  
17 AND DON'T MEET OUR TARGET WELL THOSE PROJECTS WON'T BE ABLE TO  
18 GET AS MUCH MONEY AND IT'S GOING TO MAKE IT HARDER TO DELIVER  
19 THEM. SO IT'S A LOSING PROPOSITION THERE. WE HAVE ASKED FOR  
20 THE BIG HIGHWAY PROJECTS TO WORK WITH CTAS OR PROJECT SPONSORS  
21 TO BRING FORTH THE IDEA MITIGATION THAT WOULD ASSOCIATE WITH  
22 THAT PROJECT. THERE ARE A WIDE VARIETY OF THINGS THAT CAN BE  
23 DONE BUT THING THAT NEED TO GO WITH THE EXISTING COUNTY POLICY  
24 PROJECT LIST. WE ARE HOLDING MEETINGS WITH EACH COUNTY THAT



## Meeting Transcript

1 HAS PROJECTS IN JULY, AND WE'RE COLLABORATING WITH THEM TO  
2 FIND MITIGATIONS.

3

4 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THAT SOUND LIKE AN ONGOING DISCUSSION. NEXT,  
5 BASICALLY WOULD JUST SIMPLY LIKE TO ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH THE  
6 VIEW THAT SMART SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN THE PROPOSAL. I THINK  
7 IT'S FAIR SAY THAT THE SCALE OF ANY EXPANSION OF THE SYSTEM IS  
8 UNDER CONSIDERATION RIGHT NOW AND SUBJECT TO DISCUSSION. THAT  
9 HAVING BEEN SAID, I FOUND IT SIGNIFICANT THAT CALTRANS  
10 SUBMITTED A LETTER JUNE 29TH, OF WHICH WE HAVE A COPY OF WHICH  
11 HIGHLIGHTED THE REGIONAL BENEFITS OF SMART AS PART OF THE  
12 BACKBONE OF OUR REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK AND SPECIFICALLY LINKED  
13 TO ISSUES LIKE THE POTENTIAL EXPANSION EAST ALONG HIGHWAY 37  
14 TO SOLANO COUNTY AND IT WOULD ACTUALLY CONNECT WITH THE RAIL  
15 SYSTEM GOING UP TO SACRAMENTO. SO, ANYWAY, I THINK IT IS  
16 WORTHY OF RECONSIDERATION. SO IT WOULD JOIN IN THAT REMARK AS  
17 WELL.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SCOTT, DID YOU HAVE YOUR HAND UP  
20 AGAIN? [ SILENCE ] --

21

22 **SAM LICCARDO:** AFTER 15 MILLION TRAVELERS THAT'S SIGNIFICANT.  
23 AND OBVIOUSLY OF REGIONAL IMPORTANCE OAKLAND AND SAN FRANCISCO  
24 HAD CONNECTORS BUILD WITH REGIONAL MONEY WHY WOULDN'T THAT BE  
25 ON ANY REGIONAL LIST FOR FUNDING?





## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** I CAN TAKE THAT ONE. VTA SUBMITTED IN THEIR  
3 PROJECT LISTS TO FUND A STUDY, THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL  
4 WORK FOR THAT AIRPORT CONNECTOR. SO THAT -- THE COST OF THAT  
5 EXPENDITURE IS FULLY COVERED BY THE COUNTY BUDGET.

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** WE HAVE DONE SOME STUDIED ALREADY. I GUESS -- IN  
8 TERMS OF THE ACTUAL PROJECT, IN OTHER WORDS, YOU'RE SAYING  
9 THERE WOULD BE NO CONSTRUCTION OF ANY PROJECT WITH ANY  
10 REGIONAL MONEY THROUGH 2050? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE WORK CLOSELY  
11 WITH CTA THE WITH THE PROJECT LIST ULTIMATELY NOT INCLUDED IN  
12 THE PROJECT SUBMISSION IN TERMS OF WHAT THEY SUBMITTED TO US  
13 JUST A REQUEST TO STUDY THE PROJECT OVER THE LIFESPAN OF THE  
14 PLAN THAT'S WHY THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION COMES FROM.

15

16 **SAM LICCARDO:** IS THERE ANY OPPORTUNITY AT THIS POINT THIS LATE  
17 IN THE STAGE IF VTA WERE TO BE CHANGING ITS POSITION FOR THERE  
18 TO BE ANY POTENTIAL INCLUSION. I FIND IT REMARKABLE THE  
19 RESIDENTS IN THE BAY AREA WOULD NOT HAVE CONSIDERED ANY  
20 REGIONAL DOLLARS FOR ANY KIND OF TRANSIT CONNECTION? >DAVE  
21 VAUTIN: I THINK WE WOULD CERTAINLY BE OPEN TO TALKING ABOUT IT  
22 MORE IF THERE WAS COUNTY PRIORITIZATION IS BUDGET ASSIGNED TO  
23 IT SO FAR THAT'S NOT WHAT WE HAVE RECEIVED IN DIRECTION FROM  
24 VTA.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1   **SAM LICCARDO:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL MUCH.

2

3   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAM. SCOTT, GO AHEAD.  
4   YOU'RE THE LAST COMMITTEE MEMBER.

5

6   **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY  
7   THAT WHAT I THINK COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS SAYING ABOUT  
8   LOOKING AT THE TECHNOLOGY IS PROBABLY A PRETTY GOOD ONE AND  
9   SOMETHING I COULD SUPPORT. I REMEMBER WHEN WE WERE LOOKING AT  
10   \$3 MILLION TO BUILD BART TO LIVERMORE FIVE MILES, BUT NOW FOR  
11   BASICALLY THE SAME PRICE WE'RE NOW GOING TO RIVER BANK  
12   CALIFORNIA, 42 MILES. SO, I THINK THIS IS ONE PROJECT YOU  
13   COULD HOLD UP AS THE POST CHILD TO BE HONEST WITH YOU AS DOING  
14   THE RIGHT THING AND FINDING THE MOST ECONOMICAL AND  
15   ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE PROJECT. THIS THING WILL BE HYBRID  
16   TECHNOLOGY AND WE'RE VERY EXCITED ABOUT IT. I WANT TO REMIND  
17   YOU ALL THAT THESE ARE YOUR WORKERS. THESE WORK NEITHER HAVE -  
18   - ALMOST 70 PERCENT OF THESE PEOPLE EITHER DO NOT HAVE A  
19   DESTINATION OR ORIGIN IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, THEY ARE COMMUTING TO  
20   YOUR EMPLOYERS. WE TALK ABOUT EMPLOYERS MOVING OUT AND GOING  
21   TO SAN JOAQUIN IF IT KEEPS GETTING HARDER TO GET UP TO SAN  
22   FRANCISCO, EXACTLY WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO DO. THEY WILL LEAVE  
23   YOUR COMMUNITIES AND YOU WILL LOSE THE JOBS. IF THAT'S WHAT WE  
24   WANT THAT'S OKAY. I WOULD REALLY PUSH HARD TO ASK WE PUT THIS  
25   IN AGAIN A \$60 MILLION A YEAR ESCALATION. WE CANNOT WAIT ANY



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 LONGER. ANY CONTINUED BENEFITS THAT LET THE PORT OF OAKLAND  
2 THRIVE IT'S VERY IMPORTANT IF THESE TRUCKS CAN'T GET OUT ON  
3 THE HIGHWAY THEY'RE GOING TO GO TO OTHER PORTS, DOWN TO LA,  
4 AND WE WILL LOSING MORE AGAIN AND OAKLAND WILL NOT ONLY HAVE  
5 NO SPORTS TEAMS, BUT THEY WILL ALSO HAVE NO PORT. SO, I WOULD  
6 REALLY APPRECIATE IT. EARLIER WHEN WE SAW THE MAP OF THE  
7 HOUSING, WE SAW 44 PERCENT IN, I THINK IN SAM'S AREA, THE NEXT  
8 HIGHEST WAS 19 PERCENT IN THE TRI-VALLEY AREA. TRI-VALLEY AREA  
9 IS THE AREA THAT'S BEEN MAKING US LOOK GOOD AS FAR AS BUILDING  
10 HOUSING OVER THE LAST DECADE AND THEY'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO  
11 TAKE HOUSING. BUT WE COULDN'T -- WE HAVE CONSTANTLY IGNORED  
12 THIS COMMUNITY, AND WE CANNOT KEEP DOING THAT. THEY -- IF YOU  
13 LOOK AT CHANNEL TWO, WHEN YOU WATCH THE MORNING NEWS, YOU WILL  
14 SEE THE FIRST AREA THAT LIT UP WHEN PEOPLE STARTED GOING BACK  
15 TO WORK WAS INTERSTATE 580 COMING OUT OF TRACY OR IN THE  
16 EVENING GOING HOME TO SAN JOAQUIN AND STAN SLAV, I APPRECIATE  
17 WE ALL HAVE OUR WANTS AND NEEDS BUT WE TALK ABOUT RIDERSHIP OF  
18 30,000 THAT HAVE 15 MINUTE HEADWAYS, AND IT IS DESPERATELY  
19 NEEDED AND I APPRECIATE THE RECOMMENDATION THAT WE MOVE IT TO  
20 PHASE ONE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. DON'T HAVE ANY OTHER  
23 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. THERESE, MAYBE YOU CAN FIND OUT WHERE WE  
24 CAN GO NEXT. WE HAVE HEARD A LOT OF COMMENTS.

25



## Meeting Transcript

1   **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME OKAY?

2

3   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES. GO AHEAD.

4

5   **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GOOD. OKAY. SO APPRECIATE ALL OF THE REMARKS  
6 FROM EVERYONE, VERY THOUGHTFUL. AND I'M MINDFUL OF HOW WE MOVE  
7 FORWARD WITH THE FACT THAT THIS IS A RECOMMENDATION FOR  
8 ACTION. AS YOU REMEMBER, WHAT WE SAID WAS, WHAT WE WERE  
9 BRINGING FORWARD WAS A RECOMMENDATION OF ESSENTIALLY A MATH  
10 PROBLEM, OF HOW TO FIT PROJECTS INTO FINANCIAL ASSUMPTIONS  
11 THAT ALLOWED FOR FINANCIAL CONSTRAINTS? AND THAT'S AN  
12 IMPORTANT DISTINCTION. THIS ISN'T ABOUT MERIT, THE FACT THAT  
13 THE PROJECTS ARE IN THE LONG RANGE PLAN MEANS WE HAVE  
14 DEMONSTRATED THEIR MERIT THIS IS MASS SEQUENCE ABOUT PROJECTS  
15 IN THE PIPELINE. HERE IS WHAT I THINK WE SHOULD DO. YOU COULD  
16 RECOMMEND THAT THE STAFF MOVE FORWARD WITH THE FOLLOWING  
17 DIRECTIONS TO COME BACK WITH OPTIONS. HERE IS THE MAIN OPTIONS  
18 I HAVE HEARD. FIRST ONE IS TO CONSIDER WHETHER YOU MOVE UP,  
19 OUR ASSUMPTIONS ARE TRIGGER A MEGA REVENUE MEASURE. BECAUSE  
20 THAT WOULD, IF YOU MOVED IT UP, THAT WOULD INCREASE MORE  
21 FINANCIAL CAPACITY. IN OTHER WORDS, IT WOULD CREATE A BIGGER  
22 FINANCIAL ENVELOPE. THERE ARE PROS AND CONS WITH THAT. WE NEED  
23 TO BRING THOSE BACK TO YOU. THE BIGGEST ONE AS STAFF HAS SAID  
24 BEFORE AND I'LL REITERATE BECAUSE I HAVE SEEN IT HAPPEN IS OUR  
25 AVERAGES MAY CALL THE QUESTION AND SAY THAT'S TOO AMBITIOUS



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 AND NOT APPROVE THE FINANCIAL CONSTRAINTS. THAT'S THE RISK.  
2 AND I EXPECT CARB TO BE TOUGH ON OUR REASONABLE ASSUMPTIONS  
3 BECAUSE OF GHG TARGETS. THAT'S WHERE I THINK WE WOULD BE. ONCE  
4 WE MAKE AN OPTION OF EITHER MOVING IT UP AND INCREASE OR KEEP  
5 THE FINANCIAL CAPACITY THE SAME THEN THERE IS THE QUESTION OF  
6 -- [ SILENCE ] -- MEASURE, WE WOULD NEED TO COME BACK AND  
7 RECOMMEND TO YOU, WHAT GETS TAKEN OUT OF BIN ONE TO MAKE SPACE  
8 FOR THESE PROJECTS. WE CAN DO THAT AND I THINK THAT CAN BE AN  
9 OPTION BUT THAT BASICALLY IS WHAT WE WOULD COME BACK TO YOU TO  
10 SHOW. AND, YOU KNOW, THAT'S PRETTY MUCH WHERE WE WOULD BE  
11 THERE. I THINK WHAT I WOULD END WITH THOUGH, AND IT GETS BACK  
12 TO WHAT COMMISSIONER LICCARDO WAS SPEAKING TO, IS AT THE END  
13 OF THE DAY, ONE OF THE CHALLENGES FOR THIS PLAN, AND THE MATH  
14 PROBLEM IS THAT MANAGING MEGA PROJECTS IS JUST REALLY HARD,  
15 BUT BECOMING MORE THE NORM THAN THE EXCEPTION. MULTI-BILLION  
16 DOLLARS PROJECTS ARE BECOMING JUST A REALITY IN LONG RANGE  
17 PLANS ACROSS THE COUNTRY, AND MANAGING THEM MEANS MANAGING  
18 DIFFERENTLY. AND I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE DO WANT TO  
19 SPEAK TO IS HOW CAN WE BRING DOWN THE COST. YOU KNOW, I THINK  
20 REGARDLESS OF WHERE THEY ULTIMATELY END UP IN OUR SEQUENCE  
21 PIPELINES, THE COST OF THESE PROJECTS IS GOING TO BE A HEAVY  
22 BURDEN FOR THIS PLAN GOING FORWARD. BECAUSE YOU JUST START,  
23 YOU KNOW COST INCREASES ARE INEVITABLE IN MANY CASES, AND WE  
24 FEED TO START THINKING CREATIVELY ABOUT HOW TO CONTAIN THAT OR  
25 CHANGE THE SCOPES. SO, THAT'S WHAT I SEE -- AND THEN ONE LAST



## Meeting Transcript

1    THING. I THINK THE OTHER THING, JUST TO BE MINDFUL OF, IS NO  
2    MATTER WHAT WE FINALLY ADOPT IN THIS PLAN, THE ABILITY OF ANY  
3    SINGLE PROJECT TO COMPETE ON THE DISCRETIONARY COMPETITIVE  
4    STATE OR FEDERAL LEVEL WILL DEPEND NOT ON WHAT MONEY IS  
5    ASSUMED, BUT WHAT MONEY YOU HAVE. IN HAND. SO IF THE ULTIMATE  
6    FUNDING PLANNED PARTICULARLY FOR PROJECT OF A BILLION OR MORE  
7    HAVE FUNDING GAPS AND WE'RE ASSUMING IN OUR PLAN THOSE WILL BE  
8    FILLED WITH MONEYS WE STILL HAVEN'T GOTTEN BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT  
9    GONE TO THE VOTERS ON OR NOT JUST REMEMBER IN THAT COMPETITIVE  
10   ENVIRONMENT THE TYPING FOR ACTUALLY REALIZING THESE REVENUES  
11   AND MAKING THEM A REALITY WILL BE CRITICALLY IMPORTANT IN  
12   TERMS OF MAKING THE PROJECT ACTUALLY COMPETE IN THE  
13   DISCRETIONARY COMPETITIVE ARENA SO I JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERY  
14   ONE OF THAT REALLY IMPORTANT THING TO REMEMBER AS WELL. SO  
15   THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. THAT'S HOW I THINK WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO GO  
16   FORWARD.

17

18   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I THINK THOSE OPTIONS OUGHT TO BE  
19   CONSIDERED. THERESE, IF YOU PUT THE MEGA REGION WITHIN THE  
20   NEXT FIVE YEARS THAT WOULD BE IRRESPONSIBLE AND I DON'T THINK  
21   WE COULD JUSTIFY IT. BUT WITHIN FIVE OR TEN YEARS I BELIEVE  
22   THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF MOMENTUM TO DEAL WITH THE ISSUE,  
23   IF YOU LOOK AT THE PROJECTS, DOWNTOWN EXTENSION AND THE BAY  
24   CROSSING, THESE ARE NOT -- THESE ARE PROJECT THAT ARE NOT  
25   GOING TO GO AWAY. THEY'RE FUNDAMENTAL FOR HOW TO PROVIDE



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 FUTURE TRANSIT. AND I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO LOOK AT, WHAT ARE WE  
2 COMFORTABLE WITH, MOVING THAT MEGA MEASURE, HOW MANY YEARS,  
3 WITH THE 15 YEAR CYCLE. I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO AT LEAST LOOK AT  
4 THAT AND BRING BACK THAT AND THEN SHOW US HOW THAT AFFECTS THE  
5 PLAN. IS THAT SOMETHING THAT -- THERESE?

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT WAS A PIECE OF THE RECOMMENDATION THAT  
8 I HAD, AGAIN BRING BACK TO YOU WHAT THAT WOULD LOOK LIKE,  
9 BECAUSE AGAIN, IT'S A MATH PROBLEM TO SOME DEGREE. IT WOULD  
10 CHANGE THE CALCULATION, AND WE ALSO WANT TO BE CLEAR WHERE THE  
11 RISK AND TRADEOFF OF THAT WOULD BE. POSITIVE TRADEOFF YOU  
12 CREATE MORE FINANCIAL CAPACITY. RISK IS THAT WE HAVE  
13 EVALUATING AGENCIES WHO MAY OR MAY NOT DO THAT AS TOO  
14 AMBITIOUS, AND IN THAT CASE, WE WOULD NEED TO HAVE TO ANSWER  
15 TO THAT, AND SO THAT'S REALLY, I THINK, WHAT WE HAVE BEEN  
16 STRUGGLING WITH, IS TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW THAT TRADEOFF IS  
17 GOING FORWARD. YEAH. I THINK WHATEVER TIME WE CAN GET OFF OF  
18 THAT, WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO JUSTIFY IT BUT I REALLY BELIEVE 15  
19 YEARS IS NOT REALISTIC. I DON'T THINK THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY  
20 AND MANY OF OUR COUNTIES ARE GOING TO SIT IDLE FOR THAT PERIOD  
21 OF TIME. I THINK A MEGA REGION IS GOING HAVE TO BE CONSIDERED.  
22 THERESE, WHERE DO WE GO NEXT? YOU'RE LOOKING FOR US TO APPROVE  
23 SOMETHING TODAY. IS THAT GOING TO COME BEFORE THE COMMISSION  
24 AT OUR NEXT MEETING. IS THAT WHAT STAFF IS HOPING TO DO?

25



## Meeting Transcript

1   **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I'M GOING TO ASK STAFF WHETHER THIS WAS JUST  
2   A COMMITTEE APPROVAL. OR -- I NEED TO --

3

4   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID, WHEN WERE YOU LOOKING FOR  
5   IT? DAVE VAUTIN? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE WERE ASKING FOR COMMITTEE  
6   APPROVAL, BUT I WANT TO REFER TO ALIX IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS  
7   HERE.

8

9   **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK GIVEN THE DISCUSSION TODAY, I THINK  
10   THAT WE WOULD BE FULLY COMFORTABLE WITH YOU REFERRING IT TO  
11   THE COMMISSION WITH STAFF DIRECTION THAT THERESE OUTLINED  
12   RATHER THAN TAKING COMMITTEE ACTION.

13

14   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH THAT MAKES SENSE. THAT GIVES  
15   STAFF TIME TO LOOK AT THE ISSUES AND ANALYZE MORE. BEFORE I GO  
16   TO PUBLIC COMMENT, IS THERE A MOTION TO MOVE IT WITH THE STAFF  
17   RECOMMENDATION THERE?

18

19   **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED MR. CHAIR, THIS IS MACKENZIE.

20

21   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. GOOD. SECOND TO THAT? SCOTT  
22   ARE YOU --

23





## Meeting Transcript

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I WAS WAITING FOR THE SECOND, MR. CHAIR.  
2 I CAN'T SECOND T BUT I WAS GOING TO ASK STAFF TO JUST, REAL  
3 QUICK, CLARIFY THE MOTION.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** COMMITTEE MEMBERS, IS THERE A  
6 SECOND?

7

8 **DAVID CORTESE:** I'LL SECOND IT. CORTESE.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVE. MARTHA DO WE HAVE  
11 PUBLIC COMMENT?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OH YES. WE HAVE LOTS OF PUBLIC COMMENTS.  
14 [LAUGHTER] SO FOLLOWING -- THERE IS A LIST. SO THERE ARE SIX  
15 INDIVIDUALS WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. AND ATTENDEES ARE  
16 REMINDED TO USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR PRESS STAR NINE IF  
17 YOU ARE CALLING IN SO WE CAN CALL UPON YOU WHEN IT'S THE  
18 APPROPRIATE TIME. BEFORE THAT, THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS, AND  
19 ENTITIES SUBMITTED PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE THE 5 O'CLOCK P.M.  
20 DEADLINE, DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT FOUR, SENATOR  
21 SCOTT WIENER AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER DAVID CHIU TRANSBAY JOINT  
22 POWERS AUTHORITY CALTRAIN VICTOR DOUGLAS ESENT COLLIN  
23 SUBMITTED TWO, TESLA, INC. FRIENDS OF DOWNTOWN RAIL EXTENSION,  
24 CITY OF DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO CITY OF WINDSOR CITY AND COUNTY  
25 OF SAN FRANCISCO AND COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY



## Meeting Transcript

1 INNOVATION TRI-VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP EAST BAY LEADERSHIP  
2 COUNCIL CAROLE LAND AND DEVELOPMENT CITY OF PLEASANTON DUBLIN  
3 ANOTHER ONE FROM CITY OF PLEASANTON TRI-VALLEY SAN JOAQUIN  
4 VALLEY REGIONAL RAIL OUGHT TRI-VALLEY CHAMBER OF COMMERCE SHAY  
5 HOMES NORTHERN CALIFORNIA DUBLIN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE CITY OF  
6 PLEASANTON, CHALIB S. CITY OF LIVERMORE, CITY OF MENLO PARK.  
7 BILL NAYLOR, LYNN WALLACE NAYLOR, HACIENDA, CITY OF LIVERMORE,  
8 SPUR, LIVERMOR, AMADOR VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY, LABOR 304,  
9 HONORABLE KATHLEEN BAKER RETIRED, VISIT TRI-VALLEY CITY LINDA  
10 LAMOR AND CITY OF BELVEDERE. ALL CORRESPONDENCE HAVE BEEN  
11 POSTED ONLINE AND WAS DISTRIBUTED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND  
12 COMMISSIONERS. >DAVE VAUTIN: OKAY.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WE'LL GO TO THE SPEAKERS. I  
15 REALLY WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF YOU COULD TRY TO KEEP YOUR  
16 COMMENTS DOWN TO ABOUT ONE MINUTE. IF YOU RUN OVER THAT WOULD  
17 BE OKAY. BUT WE'RE GOING TO ALLOW TWO MAXIMUM BUT PLEASE BE AS  
18 BRIEF AND SUCCINCT AS POSSIBLE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS -- IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT MTC IS  
21 BOTH FOR BART A SECOND CROSSING AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR A SECOND  
22 CROSSING. A SECOND CROSSING WOULD INCREASE BART'S CAPACITY AND  
23 RESILIENCE NET EVENT OF EARTHQUAKE OR DISRUPTION ON ONE OF OUR  
24 BRIDGES. YOUR OWN STAFF SAYS THAT IF WE'RE GOING TO FUND ONE  
25 MEGA PROJECT THIS IS THE ONE TO FUND. WE HAVE A LOT OF



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1   COMPETING PRIORITIES AND PROJECTS BUT THIS ONE BRINGS SO MANY  
2   OF THEM TOGETHER THAT WITHOUT IT OUR EFFORTS TO REDUCE  
3   GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS TO PROVIDE SEAMLESS TRANSIT AND AN  
4   ALTERNATE TO DRIVING WILL FALL APART. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

5

6   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT MARTHA.

7

8   **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN. GO AHEAD AND  
9   UNMUTE YOURSELF.

10

11   **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. CAN YOU HEAR  
12   ME?

13

14   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES. GO AHEAD.

15

16   **ADINA LEVIN:** I'M GOING TO MAKE COMMENTS WITH A COUPLE OF  
17   DIFFERENT HATS. FIRST OF ALL, AS A MEMBER OF THE POLICY  
18   ADVISORY COUNCIL, I THINK SPEAKING FOR SOME THINGS THAT THE  
19   COUNCIL HAS AGREED TO IN TERMS OF BEING PLEASED TO SEE THE  
20   COMPLIMENTARY STRATEGIES THAT ARE -- FOR SOME OF THE MORE  
21   EXPENSIVE RAIL PROJECTS THAT HAVE PREVIOUSLY BEEN ACCESSIBLE  
22   TO HIGHER INCOME PEOPLE BUT NOT LOWER INCOME PEOPLE. AND SO  
23   THE MEANS-BASED FARE EQUITY AND EQUITY AND INCLUSION POLICIES  
24   BEING PUT FORWARD AS WAYS TO ENABLE INVESTMENTS INTO THOSE  
25   TYPES OF PROJECTS TO SUCCESS AS A BROADER SPECTRUM OF OUR



## Meeting Transcript

1 RESIDENTS IS VERY WELCOME TO SEE. MOVING ON WITH THE FRIENDS  
2 OF CALTRAIN AND FRIEND OF DTX, WANTED TO SEE, THERE IS, SOME  
3 OF THE PROJECTS THAT ARE SLATED FOR THE BACK HALF OF THE TIME  
4 PERIOD WITH A PROCESS BEING DEFINED FOR HOW DO YOU MOVE A  
5 PROJECT FORWARD IN TIME, PARTICULAR, THERE IS A REGIONAL  
6 MEASURE THAT GOES FORWARD THAT WOULD HELP WITH THE FUNDING,  
7 BUT ALSO, IF THERE MAY BE FEDERAL STIMULUS FUNDS, I THINK IT  
8 WOULD BE APPROPRIATE TO HAVE THAT PROCESS DEFINED EARLY, SO  
9 THAT IN CASE THERE IS FEDERAL STIMULUS FUNDING TO DEAL WITH  
10 THE RECESSION, THAT OUR REGION IS VERY WELL PREPARED TO JUMP  
11 ON THOSE OPPORTUNITIES AND DO PROJECTS THAT ARE REALLY MEETING  
12 THE REGION'S GOALS AND NOT WIND UP FUNDING THINGS THAT DON'T  
13 ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN THAT FAR DOWN.  
14 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT MARTHA.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT WE HAVE TESS L. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
19 YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. HI MR. CHAIRMAN. THANK YOU EVERYBODY. AND  
22 I WANT TO, FIRST OFF START BY SAYING HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE ALL  
23 THE WORK THAT STAFF HAS DONE. THIS IS A YEOMAN'S AMOUNT OF  
24 WORK AS TO CRITICAL TIME WHERE WE ARE TO MOVING THIS FORWARD.  
25 I WANT TO FOCUS ON THE DISCUSSION AROUND VALLEY LINK AND IN



## Meeting Transcript

1 PARTICULAR THE PROCESS FOR PROJECTS BEING ABLE TO MOVE FROM  
2 PERIOD ONE -- EXCUSE ME PERIOD TWO TO PERIOD ONE, AND TO SEEK  
3 CLARIFICATION IN EARLY CLARIFICATION ON WHAT THAT PROCESS IS  
4 THAT HAS NOT BEEN CLEAR AS OF THIS POINT, AND SECONDLY, THAT  
5 THERE COULD BE SOME ASSURANCE THAT IF A PROJECT IS IN PERIOD  
6 TWO, IT IS NOT IN ANY WAY DISADVANTAGED OR IMPEDED GOING AFTER  
7 FUNDING, INCLUDING ANY SORT OF MTC RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING  
8 SB1 FUNDS. AS YOU KNOW, WITH SALES TAX MEASURES, WE USE THOSE  
9 FUNDS TO TRY TO LEVERAGE FUNDS, AND AS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
10 OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION HAS MENTIONED  
11 WE HAVE BEEN VALLEY LINK AND TO BE ABLE TO USE OUR SALES TAX  
12 DOLLARS TO LEVERAGE FUNDS IS CRITICAL SO IF IT WOULD BE  
13 POSSIBLE TO REQUEST THAT IT ALSO BE DOCUMENTED THAT NO  
14 PROJECTS IN PERIOD TWO WOULD NEGATIVELY BE AFFECTED BY ANY  
15 FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS OR PURSUING ANY FUNDS THAT WOULD BE  
16 HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

17  
18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU TESS. NEXT SPEAKERS  
19 MARTHA.

20  
21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP WE HAVE PAUL AKINJO, GO AHEAD AND  
22 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23  
24 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS PAUL A. CAN YOU HEAR ME?  
25



## Meeting Transcript

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD PAUL.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I HAVE BEEN HERE 20 YEARS,  
4 AND I KNOW HOW THIS TRANSPORTATION -- FROM OUR AREA ALL THE  
5 WAY DOWN TO THE BAY AREA AND SAN JOSE, YOU HAVE TO BE UP AT  
6 3:00 A.M. TO BE ABLE TO NAVIGATE THE ALTAMONT PASS, SO WE ARE  
7 HERE AND COMMITTED TO PROCESS -- COMMITTED TO SAN JOSE TO PROP  
8 UP YOUR ECONOMY IN THAT AREA AND NOW WE HAVE A PROJECT THAT  
9 NEEDS FUNDING AND REASONABLE YOU PUT US IN THE SECOND ROUND IS  
10 VERY DISSATISFYING. WE ARE COMMITTED, REALLY, REALLY COMMITTED  
11 TO THE VALLEY LINK PROJECT, TO THE EXTENT THAT WE USE OUR  
12 LAND, EVERYTHING THAT YOU NEED, WE NEED TO FIND A SOLUTION TO  
13 TRANSPORTATION. AND ALSO AUTHORITY -- SO ECONOMICALLY  
14 EXTENSIVE STUDY TO LOOK AT LAND IS NOT JUST BASED ON SIMPLE  
15 TRAVEL, WE HAVE TO LEAD TOO. SO PLEASE HELP US MOVE THE VALLEY  
16 LINK PROJECT TO THIS ONE. WE HAVE PROJECT THAT WE'RE DOING  
17 HERE TO HELP SUPPORT THE PROJECT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S  
18 ALL I HAVE.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. UP NEXT MARTHA?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP WE HAVE ROLAND.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SO THE ISSUE ABOUT THE EQUITY AND OTHER RAIL SYSTEMS  
25 IS EASILY ADDRESSED TO MEANS-BASED, SO THIS -- WITH HOW TO



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 MOVE PROJECTS FROM PHASE TWO TO PHASE ONE LET'S START WITH SAN  
2 JOSE. BART THREE AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS CARRIES THOUSANDS  
3 OF PASSENGERS PER DAY AND INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP WOULD COST \$1  
4 MILLION PER PASSENGER. SO WE NEED TO ADDRESS ISSUE WITH BART  
5 PHASE TWO WHEN WE DO WE SHOULD EXPRESS \$1 MILLION IN SAVINGS  
6 THAT CAN BE USED IN PHASE ONE INCLUDING DIRIDON AND CONNECTION  
7 TO SAN JOSE AIRPORT I RECEIVED A DRAFT PROPOSAL FOR BART PHASE  
8 TWO EARLIER THIS WEEK AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SHARING IT WITH  
9 MAYOR LICCARDO AND THE COMMISSION OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS WE  
10 HAVE THE SAME ISSUE WITH DTX. VTX CAN -- BUT THE PROJECT IS A  
11 BOONDOGGLE, AND I WANT TO TOUCH ON LEGISLATION THAT WOULD --  
12 CLEARANCE FOR \$1 BILLION ALTERNATIVE DURING THE -- COMMITTEE -  
13 - VALLEY LINK, I SUPPORT BUT WE NEED DATA TO GUIDE OUR  
14 INVESTMENTS MOVING FORWARD AND FIGURE OUT WHERE THE MAJORITY  
15 OF THE TRAFFIC ULTIMATELY HAS FOR SAN FRANCISCO ALSO SILICON  
16 VALLEY IS TAKE IT FROM THERE INCLUDING THE LAST VEGAS SOLUTION  
17 MENTIONED BY MAYOR LICCARDO AS A TACTICAL AND INEXPENSIVE  
18 SOLUTION TO CONNECT ACE TO BART IN PLEASANTON.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. UP NEXT.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UP NEXT IS DAVID HERBERT. --

23

24 **SPEAKER:** COMMENTS MENTIONED BY MANY OF MY COLLEAGUES AND  
25 MANYLERS SENT IN ALREADY AND COMMENTS BY SCOTT HAGGERTY I



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1 WOULD REITERATE THAT INDEED THE PEOPLE HAVE SPOKEN THIS IS A  
2 PROJECT 15 YEARS IN THE MAKING THAT GOES BACK TO WHEN BART WAS  
3 FIRST PLANNED, THE CURRENT VALLEY LINK PROJECT EXTENDS TO  
4 RIVERBANK AND INCLUDES THOUSANDS AND THOUSANDS OF POTENTIAL  
5 HOMES AND JOBS, FREES UP A GOODS CORRIDOR WHICH OUR ENTIRE  
6 MEGA REGION RELIES UPON BRINGS PEOPLE TO WORK THAT ARE THE  
7 WORKERS THAT SERVE THE POOR URBAN AREAS, AND WE HAVE COME SO  
8 FAR WITH A LOT OF POLITICAL MOMENTUM, POLITICAL WILL, A LOT OF  
9 FUNDING ALREADY. THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MICHAEL TREE MENTIONED  
10 THIS CAN BE DONE BEFORE PHASE TWO EVEN STARTS SO CUTTING US AT  
11 THE KNEES AND TAKING US TO PHASE TWO BEFORE TRANSFERRING FUNDS  
12 WOULD NOT BE THE RIGHT THING TO DO. I WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO  
13 AMEND THE MOTION TO REQUIRE AIR SUBSTANTIVE GUARANTEE AS  
14 MENTIONED THAT WE WON'T BE HAMPERED IF WE'RE NOT MOVED INTO  
15 PHASE ONE FOR VALLEY LINK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR LISTENING,  
16 I KNOW YOU HAVE A LOT ON YOUR PLATE. YOU'RE DOING A GREAT JOB.  
17 BUT THIS IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BOB WARNER.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M VICE MAYOR OF LIVERMORE, HAVE BEEN IN TOWN  
24 FOR 44 YEARS, SAW WHAT HAPPENED TO THE ALTAMONT OVER THAT  
25 PERIOD OF TIME. I THINK WE KNOW THAT THE DYNAMICS IS JUST





## Meeting Transcript

1 GOING TO GET WORSE EVEN WITH COVID. SO I WANT TO ADD MY VOICE  
2 TO SCOTT HAGGERTY AND DAVE HAL BETTER AND ALL THE OTHERS WHO  
3 HAVE SAID WE NEED TO GET THIS PROJECT FUNDED AND MOVING. IT'S  
4 MADE A LOT OF PROGRESS. IT'S IN A GOOD POSITION. SO I URGE YOU  
5 TO DO THAT MOTION -- AMENDMENT, WHERE YOU MAKE SURE THAT IF IT  
6 IS STAYING IN TWO -- I THINK IT SHOULD BE IN ONE BUT IF IT  
7 STAYS IN TWO, YOU HAVE TO MAKE ABSOLUTE SURE THAT IT'S NOT  
8 HINDERED. THANK YOU.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MARTHA HOW MANY MORE SPEAKERS DO  
11 WE HAVE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
14 HAND RAISED. NEXT UP IS JOHN MCPARTLAND.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** DISTRICT FIVE FOR THE TRI-VALLEY AREA. I WOULD LIKE  
17 TO BACK UP WHAT EVERYONE ELSE HAS SAID I CAN'T ARTICULATE THE  
18 ISSUES BETTER THAN SCOTT HAGGERTY HAS DONE BUT IT'S IMPERATIVE  
19 THAT WE PUT THE VALLEY LINK ON TO PHASE ONE. SO THAT WE CAN  
20 END UP HAVING THAT DONE BEFORE WE EVEN GET TO 2035.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER MARTHA.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR LAST SPEAKER IS S GRAHAM, GO AHEAD AND  
25 UNMUTE YOURSELF.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M SADIE GRAHAM AND I AM THE ACTING DIRECTOR FOR  
3 THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING PROGRAM BEING ADVANCED BY BART  
4 AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR ALL THE HARD  
5 WORK AND NOTE THAT THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING IS POWER  
6 THAN JUST A CONNECTION FROM OAKLAND TO SAN FRANCISCO BUT WILL  
7 CONNECT OUR RAIL NETWORK AND GREATLY IMPROVE RAIL SERVICE ALL  
8 ACROSS THE MEGA REGION. WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO WORK  
9 WITH ALL THE COMMISSIONERS AND MTC ON ADOPTING A REGIONAL  
10 FUNDING MEASURE THAT HELPS ADVANTAGE OUR REGIONAL  
11 TRANSPORTATION GOALS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. OKAY. BRING IT BACK TO  
14 THE COMMITTEE. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. IS THERE ANY  
15 LAST COMMENT? ANY COMMITTEE MEMBER WOULD LIKE TO MAKE?

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** CAN THE MOTION BE RESTATED, THERE CHAIR?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH. THERESE, YOU'RE GOING TO  
20 COME BACK WITH A MENU OR VARIOUS OPTIONS THAT WE CAN LOOK AT  
21 CORRECT?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES. THE SPECIFIC OPTIONS WOULD BE ADVANCING  
24 -- AND AGAIN, "OPTIONS "WOULD BE ADVANCING THE MEGA MEASURE  
25 EARLIER INTO THE PLANNING PERIOD, WHICH WOULD CREATE SOME MORE



## Meeting Transcript

1 FINANCIAL CAPACITY, AND ALLOW, IN AMONG OTHER THINGS ALLOW  
2 CONSIDERATION OF MOVING SOME PROJECTS, NOT ALL OF THEM, INTO  
3 BIN ONE. SECOND WAS WHETHER SPECIFICALLY TO, YOU KNOW  
4 IDENTIFY, IN THE BIN ONE, BIN TWO PROJECTS OF THE VALLEY LINK,  
5 DTX, IN PARTICULAR HAVE BEEN FLAGGED AS TO WHAT IT WOULD TAKE  
6 AS TO THE ASSUMPTION IF A MEGA MEASURE, IF THERE IS MORE  
7 CAPACITY CREATED, OR IS NOT, SHOULD THE COMMISSION NOT CHOOSE  
8 TO DO THAT, AND IN THE LATTER CASE, WHAT TRADEOFFS, WHAT WOULD  
9 HAVE TO BE TAKEN OUT OF BIN ONE TO MAKE SPACE FOR THOSE  
10 PROJECTS TO MOVE FORWARD TO BIN TWO. SO THOSE ARE THE OPTIONS  
11 WE WOULD PUT TOGETHER FOR COMMISSION CONSIDERATION.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY AND THERESE, COULD YOU PUT  
14 TOGETHER A SPREADSHEET THAT WILL SHOW THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN  
15 THOSE PROJECTS. LIKE THE VALLEY LINK HAS X NUMBERS OF DOLLARS  
16 AND MAYBE A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF A BENEFIT AND LOOK AT  
17 TRANSBAY AND WHAT THE COST WOULD BE. GIVE US A REAL BRIEF  
18 DESCRIPTION OF THOSE PROJECTS.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. SO THAT'S THE MOTION. IS  
23 THERE ANY OTHER -- SCOTT, DID THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?

24

25 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YES, SIR.



## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. COULD MARTHA COULD YOU TAKE  
3 THE ROLL, PLEASE. AND IF ANYBODY COULD PUT YOUR SANDWICH DOWN  
4 AND GET READY TO VOTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THERESE THANK YOU FOR HELPING  
9 FIND THE SOLUTION ON MOVING FORWARD HERE. THERE IS A LOT OF  
10 INTEREST HERE. I FEEL THAT IS A GOOD PATH FORWARD. DAVE VAUTIN  
11 AND STAFF, GREAT PRESENTATION. A LOT OF WORK AND VERY MUCH  
12 APPRECIATE IT. SO WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM SIX, PUBLIC  
13 COMMENT, MARTHA DO YOU HAVE ANYBODY FOR PUBLIC COMMENTS?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ROLAND HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GO AHEAD ROLAND.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS IS ROLAND. VERY QUICKLY, I WOULD  
20 APPRECIATE IF THE PRESENTATIONS COULD HAVE THE SLIDE NUMBER IN  
21 THE SAME LOCATION. TODAY IT WAS AT THE TOP OF THE SLIDE AND  
22 THE NEXT PRESENTATION WAS AT THE BOTTOM. AND THE OTHER ONE, I  
23 WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE IF YOU COULD JUST PLACE SOME KIND OF  
24 TIME SO THAT MEMBERS KNOW WHEN THEY ARE WITHIN THEIR LOCATION.  
25 THANK YOU.



July 10, 2020

## Meeting Transcript

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU ROLAND. OTHER BUSINESS?  
3 STAFF? ANYTHING ELSE? ALIX ARE WE DONE?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** DONE. GOOD JOB. [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY THANKS. IF THERE ARE NO  
8 OTHER COMMENTS I'M GOING TO GO AHEAD AND ADJOURN THE MEETING.  
9 I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR HANGING IN THERE. THIS IS VERY  
10 IMPORTANT WORK THAT WE'RE DOING HERE. I APOLOGIZE FOR THE  
11 LENGTH OF THE MEETING. WITH THAT WE'RE OFFICIALLY ADJOURNED  
12 AND STAFF CAN GET TO WORK. THANK YOU EVERYONE. [ADJOURNED]

13