



Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again
Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.
(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*

To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:
To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.

Meeting Transcript

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**

3 **WEDNESDAY, JULY 8, 2020, 9:45 AM**

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING WELCOME TO THE

6 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. AND DO WE HAVE A

7 COMMITTEE FOR YOU TODAY. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE

8 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE

9 GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN

10 REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON

11 THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,

12 STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK

13 CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR

14 REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR

15 CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO

16 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING

17 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE

18 OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE

19 TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST

20 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT

21 PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT

22 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

23 WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN

24 WRITING AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED

25 WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE

Meeting Transcript

1 RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE
2 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO
3 DO ON THE REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE.
4 SPEAKERS SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT
5 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
6 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
7 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
8 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
9 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
10 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE. ROLL CALL.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. BRUINS?

13

14 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER.

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ? NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

6

7 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. TAVARES IS ABSENT. AND
10 WORTH?

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. A QUORUM IS PRESENT.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. DO I HAVE A MOTION FOR THE
17 CONSENT CALENDAR.

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION. DUTRA-
20 VERNACI.

21

22 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** SECOND.

23

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. COMMISSIONERS WHO
2 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING NONE.
3 PUBLIC COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO RAISED HANDS AND NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
6 COMMENT RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
11 UNANIMOUSLY.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** AGENDA ITEM 3A MTC RESOLUTION 4402
14 REVISED 4430 REVISED AND 4434 REVISED FY '2021 ESTIMATE
15 ALLOCATES \$2.1 MILLION IN FY '2021TDA FUNDS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT
16 OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION AND APPROVES FY
17 '2021 CAPITAL PROJECT LIST. BILL B WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

18

19 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. MY NAME IS BILL BACON.
20 IF WE COULD HAVE THE PRESENTATION BROUGHT UP PLEASE. THIS
21 PRESENTATION COVERS ITEM 3A IN YOUR PACKET AND ITEM 3A REVISES
22 THE FISCAL YEAR 2021 FUND ESTIMATE AND INCORPORATES ACTUAL
23 SALES TAX REVENUE FOR THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT AND
24 SALES TAXES AS WELL AS ALLOCATES APPROXIMATELY \$30 MILLION TO
25 TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS I MENTIONED A MOMENT OKAY THIS

Meeting Transcript

1 ITEM UPDATES THE FUND ESTIMATE TO INCORPORATE ACTUAL REVENUES
2 FOR FISCAL YEAR '19/'20 FOR TDA 1107 SALES TAX. FUNDING FROM
3 SEVERAL DIFFERENT SOURCES BUT MOST OF THE FUND ESTIMATES
4 REVENUE DERIVE FROM THE SALES TAX OF SOME SORT REGIONALLY
5 AROUND 40 PERCENT OF TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUES ARE DERIVED
6 FROM SALES TAX. AS A RESULT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC TDA SALES
7 TAX REVENUE FOR FISCAL YEAR '19 '20 IS 6.4 PERCENT LOWER THAN
8 EXPECTED. LAG IN SALES TAX REVENUE REPORTED TO THE STATE MAY
9 NOT REPORT THE FULL EXTENT LOST THIS FISCAL YEAR DUE TO LOWER
10 SALES TAX REVENUES RECISIONS OF \$12.8 MILLION WERE REQUIRED
11 FROM 13 DIFFERENT TRANSIT OPERATOR IN FISCAL YEAR '19 '20.
12 INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT C WHICH IS A HAND OUT TO THIS ITEM.
13 PROJECT LIST FOR FISCAL YEAR 2020, 2021 SENATE BILL ONE STATE
14 OF GOOD REPAIR FUNDS THOSE FUNDS SUPPORT CAPITAL TRANSIT STATE
15 OF GOOD REPAIR. STAFF REVISED THE ESTIMATE LATER THIS FALL TO
16 REGULATE ACTUAL REVENUES FOR FISCAL YEAR 2019 AND 2020 FOR
17 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR. NEXT SLIDE. REPRESENTING REGION WIDE
18 RECEIPTS OF THE TDA SALES TAX DATA CONSISTENT WITH ALL OTHER
19 SALES TAX AS WELL. YOU CAN SEE THAT FOR FISCAL YEAR '19/'20
20 ADJUSTED TERMS WHILE THE SOLID REDLINE SHOWS NOMINAL TDA SALES
21 TAX REVENUE WHICH WAS \$402 MILLION. AS YOU CAN SEE FROM THE
22 SLIDE LESS SALES TAX GENERATION IN ADJUSTED DOLLARS NOW THAN
23 DUE TO THE DOT COM YEARS OR THE YEARS LEADING UP TO THE GREAT
24 RECESSION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS I NOTED A MOMENT AGO THERE
25 REMAINS SIGNIFICANT UNCERTAINTY ABOUT THE MAGNITUDE OF THE

Meeting Transcript

1 IMPACT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC ON SALES TAX REVENUE DUE TO
2 DELAYS IN REPORTING AND BECAUSE OF SEVERAL STATE SALES TAX
3 DEFERRAL PROGRAMS FOR BUSINESSES. WE KNOW FROM VARIOUS
4 INDICATORS THAT SALES TAX INDICATES ARE IMPACTED BECAUSE OF
5 THE PANDEMIC MTC HAS ADVISED OPERATORS TO REDUCE TDA SALES TAX
6 CLAIMS FOR FISCAL YEARS 2021 BY AT LEAST 25 PERCENT IN THE
7 AMOUNTS SHOWN IN THE FUND ESTIMATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. GIVEN
8 LAG TIME IN SALES TAX REVENUE REPORTING FROM BUSINESSES TO THE
9 STATE WE WANTED TO SHARE WITH THE COMMITTEE A LOOK AT ANOTHER
10 DATA SOURCE TO HELP INFORM US ABOUT THE MAGNITUDE OF THE
11 IMPACT OF THE PANDEMIC ON SALES TAX. THIS CHART ILLUSTRATES
12 DATA ON CREDIT CARD SALES WITH CHASE BANK ISSUED CREDIT AND
13 DEBIT CARDS COMPARING MARCH 2019 TO MARCH 2020 IN 16 LARGE
14 METRO AREAS ACROSS THE UNITED STATES. BLUE BARS SHOWS THE
15 PERCENTAGE DECLINE IN IN-PERSON TRANSACTIONS WHILE THE GREEN
16 BARS SHOW THE PERCENTAGE CHANGE IN ONLINE TRANSACTION IN THAT
17 METRO REGION. YOU WILL SEE THAT THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA ON
18 THE FAR RIGHT IS THE WORST IMPACTED METRO AREA IN MARCH BASED
19 ON IN-PERSON SALES WITH A DECLINE OF AROUND 30 PERCENT IN THE
20 VALUE OF TRANSACTIONS FOR MARCH 2019 TO 2020. THIS IS NOT
21 COMPLETELY SURPRISING GIVEN THAT OUR REGION WAS THE FIRST IN
22 THE NATION TO IMPLEMENT THE SHELTER-IN-PLACE ORDER IN MID-
23 MARCH. BUT WHAT THIS DOES HIGHLIGHT IS THAT THIS IS UNCHARTED
24 TERRITORY FOR A SALES TAX DECLINE. LOOKING BACK AT THE GREAT
25 RECESSION SALES TAX AROUND THE BAY AREA DECLINED AN AVERAGE OF

Meeting Transcript

1 20 PERCENT FROM THE PEAK IN 2008 TO A LOW POINT IN 2010. IN
2 OTHER WORDS A 20 PERCENT DECLINE TOOK TWO YEARS. IN MARCH WE
3 LIKELY SAW A LARGER DECLINE IN UNDER ONE MONTH. NEXT SLIDE
4 PLEASE. LASTLY, AS I MENTIONED EARLIER SENATE BILL ONE
5 ESTABLISHED TRANSIT STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAM REQUIRES MTC
6 TO ENDORSE A REGIONAL PROJECT LIST FOR ELIGIBLE TRANSIT
7 OPERATORS IN THE AREA. PROGRAM IS FUNDING BY VEHICLE
8 REGISTRATION FEE SO WILL NOT BE SIGNIFICANTLY IMPACTED BY THE
9 COVID-19 PANDEMIC. DETAILS ON THE PROJECT LIST ARE CONTAINED
10 IN THE RESOLUTION 4434 PORTION OF THIS AGENDA ITEM. AND
11 FINALLY, THIS ITEM DOES ALLOCATE ABOUT \$30 MILLION OF IT. DA
12 SALES TAX IN THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE FUNDS TO VARIOUS
13 OPERATOR IN FISCAL YEAR 2020, 2021 FOR BOTH OPERATIONS AND
14 CAPITAL NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WRAPPING UP, STAFF ARE
15 RECOMMENDING THE COMMITTEE FORWARD MTC RESOLUTION 4402 REVISED
16 4430 REVISED 4431 REVISED AND 4434 TO THE COMMISSION FOR
17 APPROVAL. THANK YOU. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET ME SEE IF I
20 CAN FIGURE THIS OUT. OKAY. COMMISSIONER -- CHAIR HAGGERTY.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. JUST IN THE
23 EFFORT TO CONTINUE TO PICK THE FLY OUT OF PEPPER HERE.
24 ATTACHMENT B FIRST PAGE TALKING ABOUT THE 10X AND 30X THOSE
25 ARE 10R AND 30R. I'M BRINGING IT UP BECAUSE I DON'T WANT

Meeting Transcript

1 SOMEBODY TO COME BACK AND SAY WELL THIS IS FOR THE 10X SO I
2 WANT TO CLARIFY THAT.

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE CAN ADJUST THAT THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
5 HAGGERTY.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. ANY
8 PUBLIC COMMENT?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS, AND I HAVE RECEIVED
11 NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR THIS ITEM.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** DO I HAVE A MOTION?

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** SO MOVED.

16

17 **WORTH:** I'LL GO AHEAD AND MAKE THAT MOTION.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVED BY COMMISSIONER
20 WORTH. SECOND BY DUTRA-VERNACI. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
23 UNANIMOUSLY.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** AGENDA ITEM 3B DIRIDON STATION
2 COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT. ENTERING INTO COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT
3 WITH THE CITY OF SAN JOSE CORRIDOR JOINT PERCENT CALTRAIN
4 SANTA CLARA VAL TRANSPORTATION VTA AND CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED
5 RAIL AUTHORITY TO SUPPORT THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SAN JOSE
6 DIRIDON DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM. MELANIE CHOY WILL PRESENT THIS
7 ITEM.

8
9 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. GOOD MORNING
10 COMMISSIONERS I'M MELANIE CHOY WITH THE POLICY AND PROGRAMMING
11 SECTION. TODAY WE AUTHORIZE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE
12 AND ENTER INTO COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH FOUR AGENCIES. CITY
13 OF SAN JOSE, CALTRAIN, VTA AND THE CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL
14 AUTHORITY. AND THIS IS JUST TO SUPPORT THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE
15 SAN JOSE DIRIDON STATION DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM. SAN JOSE DIRIDON
16 STATION IS ONE OF SEVERAL RAIL INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS
17 CURRENTLY IN DEVELOPMENT IN THE REGION PLAN ELECTRIFYING
18 CALTRAIN BART COMMUTER RAIL HIGH SPEED RAIL LIGHT RAIL AND BUS
19 SERVICES ALL ENVISIONED TO MEET AND SERVE THE STATION.
20 ADDITIONALLY THE CITY OF SAN JOSE HAS ADOPTED PLANS FOR
21 SUBSTANTIAL TRANSIT DEVELOPMENT ORIENTED NEAR THE STATION AND
22 THE CITY IS REVIEWING PROPOSED DOWNTOWN WEST PROJECT.
23 OPERATING UNDER AN EXISTING CO-OP AGREEMENT BEFORE
24 AFOREMENTIONED AGENCIES THAT HAVE BEEN MENTIONED APPROVES A
25 CONCEPTUAL LAY OUT DESIGN THIS PAST SPRING AN IMPORTANT

Meeting Transcript

1 MILESTONE FOR THE PROJECT. THE DESIGN LAY OUT FOCUSED ON THREE
2 MAIN DECISIONS FOR THE STATION AN ELEVATED STATION ORIENTATION
3 OF TWO STATION CONCOURSE ENTRANCES AND ALSO THE LAST DECISION
4 WAS TO STAY GENERALLY WITHIN THE EXISTING NORTHERN AND
5 SOUTHERN RAIL END ALIGNMENTS. MTC CONTRIBUTED 1.3 MILLION TO
6 THE EFFORT. THE EXISTING COOPERATIVE EXPIRES THIS MONTH AND
7 THE AGENCIES WOULD LIKE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH TWO CENTRAL AREAS
8 OF FOCUS FIRST TECHNICAL WORK TO A FORM THE NEAR TERM
9 DEVELOPMENT DECISIONS DOWNTOWN WEST PROJECT, AND THE SECOND
10 COMPONENT IS AN ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE AND GOVERNANCE
11 ASSESSMENT. AND SO TO CONTINUE ON WITH THIS WORK THE CLAUSE
12 NEEDS TO BE AMENDED AND TO EXTEND THE EXPIREE DATE. SO ALONG
13 WITH EXPIREE DATE EXTENSION THE PARTNERS ARE PROPOSING CHANGES
14 IN THE AMENDMENT THAT WOULD INCLUDE MINOR TECHNICAL REVISIONS
15 AND ALSO ADD MTC AS A FIVE PARTNER AGENCY TO THE CO-OP. WORK
16 PLAN UNDER THE CO-OP IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR MTC TO ACTIVELY
17 PARTICIPATE AS A PARTNER IN THESE MAJOR PROJECTS AND ALLOWS
18 FOR DIALOGUE AND ISSUES OF MAJOR CONCERN TO BE ADDRESSED
19 THROUGH THE PARTNERSHIP. WHILE RESTORING OPERATIONS TO STABLE
20 LEVEL IS TOP PRIORITY RIGHT NOW THERE IS VALUE IN CONTINUING
21 TO PLAN FOR A FUTURE TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS CONNECTED AND
22 INTEGRATED. DIRIDON CO-OP REQUEST IS CONSISTENT WITH THE
23 DTXMOU REQUEST OVER THE LAST FEW MONTH US YOU HAVE SEEN AND
24 ALTHOUGH THE PROJECTS ARE AT DIFFERENT -- EVEN THOUGH THE
25 PROJECTS ARE AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF DEVELOPMENT. AND



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 SEPARATELY FROM THIS CO-OP AGREEMENT ACTION, I WANT TO PROVIDE
2 YOU WITH SOME ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND THAT THE DIRIDON PROJECT
3 PARTNERS HAVE PRELIMINARY REQUESTED INFORMATION FOR MTC FUNDS
4 FOR THE PROJECT. SCOPE AND PROJECT FUNDING REQUEST WILL BE
5 FINALIZED AND THE DIRIDON WORK SCOPE FUNDING REQUEST TO THE
6 COMMISSION WILL BE PUT TO THE COMMISSION AS A SEPARATE AND
7 FUTURE ACTION. IN CONCLUSION STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRING THE
8 DIRIDON STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF SAN
9 JOSE CALTRAIN VTA AND CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL AUTHORITY IN
10 DEVELOPMENT OF THE SAN JOSE DIRIDON STATION TO THE COMMISSION
11 FOR APPROVAL AND TO AUTHORIZE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE
12 AND ENTER INTO A CO-OP AGREEMENT. AND THAT CONCLUDES MY
13 PRESENTATION. I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MELANIE. I THINK IT'S GREAT
16 THAT MTC IS GETTING INVOLVED IN THIS -- IN THESE SORT OF MEGA
17 PROJECTS WHERE WE'RE OBVIOUSLY GOING TO HAVE A HUGE AMOUNT OF
18 FUNDING ON THE LINE AND THEY'RE JUST A TREMENDOUS REGIONAL
19 SIGNIFICANT IN ADDITION BEING OF LOCAL SIGNIFICANCE, IF I --
20 IF THE COMMITTEE CAN JUST INDULGE ONE QUESTION FROM ME, FIRST,
21 WHY IS BART NOT PART OF THIS COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT? I MEAN,
22 THEY'RE JUST A KEY PLAYER. JUST AS IMPORTANT AS CALTRAIN IS,
23 AT DIRIDON, IN TERMS OF NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT ARE GOING TO BE
24 RIDING THAT SYSTEM.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. I THINK THAT THE PROJECT PARTNERS, I
3 THINK THAT SINCE VTA IS THE AGENCY THAT IS BUILDING THE BART
4 EXTENSION, I BELIEVE THEY FEEL THAT THEY ARE REPRESENTING
5 BART. SO, I MEAN, AGAIN, I WILL HAVE TO TALK TO THE PROJECT
6 PARTNERS BUT I THINK GENERALLY THAT IS THE REASON. BART IS
7 REPRESENTED ON ONE OF THE -- I'M GOING TO FORGET THE CORRECT
8 NAME OF IT -- BUT ONE OF THE DIRIDON JOINT POLICY ADVISORY
9 BOARD, PERHAPS IT'S CALLED, THEY ARE REPRESENTED ON THAT.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** UM THAT DOESN'T -- I KNOW IT'S NOT OUR
12 DECISION BUT THAT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE A, YOU KNOW, A
13 PARTICULARLY COOPERATIVE ARRANGEMENT TO EXCLUDE ONE OF THE
14 MAIN PARTNERS THROUGH A COOPERATIVE ARRANGEMENT. COMMISSIONER
15 PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAIR. I HAD AN ORIGINAL
18 OPINION ABOUT THIS, WHICH I AM CHANGING. I DO BELIEVE THAT
19 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT MTC BE REPRESENTED AS OUR EXECUTIVE
20 DIRECTOR IN THESE NEGOTIATIONS. MY CONCERN MOVING FORWARD
21 WOULD BE THE PARTNERS, CALTRAIN AND HIGH SPEED RAIL, AS THEY
22 CONNECT TO THE PENINSULA. SO I HOPE THAT THAT WOULD STAY OPEN
23 FOR DISCUSSION, AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE, AND I WOULD DISAGREE
24 WITH THE CHAIR, AS TO HAVING BART AS A PARTNER TO MOST
25 ANYTHING. BUT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MR. CHAIRMAN?

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY.

5

6 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. I APOLOGIZE, BUT SOMETHING'S
7 WRONG WITH MY SCREEN AND I CAN'T SEE ANYTHING RIGHT NOW BUT
8 I'M GOING TO ANSWER THIS QUESTION AND THEN TRY TO LOG IN
9 AGAIN. SIMILAR TO YOUR QUESTION MR. CHAIR AND I KNOW WE'RE
10 CAN'T HAVE EVERYBODY AT THE TABLE BUT TO WHAT LEVEL OF COMFORT
11 CAN YOU GIVE ME THAT'S AN END OF LINE STATION AND THERE IS
12 PLANNING AS FAR AS STORAGE OF TRAINS AND THINGS LIKE THAT WHAT
13 PART OF COMFORT WITH YOU GIVE ME ON THE COMMITTEE THAT THEIR
14 VIEWS WOULD BE HEARD AND UNDERSTOOD?

15

16 **MELANIE CHOY:** I WOULD LIKE TO AT LEAST -- I'LL JUMP IN HERE
17 FOR A SECOND. IN TERMS OF ORGANIZATIONAL DISCUSSIONS THIS HAS
18 COME UP IN TERMS OF LOOKING FORWARD FOR THE PROJECT. I THINK
19 IN THE FIRST CONCEPTUAL STAGE THEY WERE LOOKING AT THE
20 CONCEPTUAL LAY OUT AND SO MOVING FORWARD THERE'S A RECOGNITION
21 OF ALL THESE INTERSECTING PROJECTS AND THE INFLUENCE OF ALL
22 THESE PROJECTS, AND A NUMBER OF STAGES THESE PROJECTS ARE IN.
23 IN THE FUTURE WORK IN THIS WORK PLAN, THAT WILL BE ONE OF THE
24 ISSUES THAT WILL BE BROUGHT INTO THIS GOVERNANCE DISCUSSION,
25 AND ORGANIZATIONAL ASSESSMENT. THEY'RE ALSO -- THE PROJECT

Meeting Transcript

1 TEAM IS ALSO CONTEMPLATING A FOCUSED DISCUSSION ON FIGURING
2 OUT WHERE THE LINKAGES LIKE AND FIGURING OUT RESPONSIBILITIES
3 AND DECISION MAKING RESPONSIBILITIES ON DIFFERENT PROJECTS.
4 THERE ARE DISCUSSIONS REGARDING THIS TOPIC. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:
5 YEAH AND I --

6

7 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YEAH AND I -- GO AHEAD NICK.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I WAS GOING TO ASK YOU IF YOU COULD
10 MAYBE STAY ON THE LINE GIVEN THIS DISCUSSION WE MIGHT WANT TO
11 MAKE THIS PART OF THE MOTION.

12

13 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'M STAYING ON UNTIL THE DISCUSSION IS
14 COMPLETE.

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN. OH SORRY --

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** NO. GO AHEAD EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** JUST TO MAYBE ROUND THIS OUT, I THINK ONE OF
21 THE MAIN REASONS WHY MTC'S ROLE AT THE TABLE IS SO IMPORTANT
22 FOR THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT IS IN FACT TO KEEP LIFTING UP AND
23 REQUIRING CONTINUED DISCUSSION ON THE VERY TYPES OF POINTS
24 THAT ARE BEING RAISED HERE. AGAIN, NOT BEING THE PROJECT
25 SPONSOR, THERE IS -- THERE IS -- YOU KNOW, SOME RESPECTFUL

Meeting Transcript

1 RELATIONSHIPS THAT NEED TO BE OBSERVED. WITH THAT SAID, I
2 THINK OUR VOICE IS HONING NOT ONLY TO THE COORDINATION OF
3 ONGOING SERVICES, OF ONGOING STUDIES, AND QUITE FRANKLY AS
4 MELANIE HAD POINTED OUT, THE FUTURE GOVERNANCE RELATED ISSUES
5 THAT WOULD NEED TO BE ATTACHED TO THIS PROJECT, I THINK, IS
6 ONE OF THE SPECIFIC PERSPECTIVES THAT WE CAN BRING AS THE
7 REGIONAL AGENCY THAT WOULD BE A VALUE AS THIS CONTINUES
8 FORWARD.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT, YOU
11 STANDING UP FOR THE REGION, WE STANDING UP FOR THE REGION ON
12 THIS. COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

13

14 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YEAH. I WANTED TO CHIME IN ON THIS AS WELL. I
15 THINK AS THIS PROJECT HAS GOTTEN TO THIS POINT, ALL THE
16 PLAYERS THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT HAVE HAD A SEAT AT "A
17 "TABLE, AND I THINK THE FOCUS IN TERMS OF CHANGING THE
18 COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT TO INCLUDE MTC AND ALL IS TO DEFINE A
19 NEW KIND OF TABLE THAT ALLOWS A LENS TO LOOK AT THIS BROADER,
20 AS WELL AS TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DEAL WITH ALL THE PARTS
21 THAT GO INTO IT SO THAT'S WHY THE GOVERNANCE PIECE IS ON
22 THERE. SO, YES, AND WHEN YOU LOOK AT SOMETHING LIKE BART, WITH
23 THE DEVELOPMENT, IT DOESN'T EXIST GOING INTO DIRIDON, AND
24 BECAUSE OF THE PARTNERSHIP WHICH HAVE -- HAS IMPROVED
25 TREMENDOUSLY OVER TIME, THEY ARE -- THEY ARE A CRITICAL PLAYER

Meeting Transcript

1 IN TERMS OF THE DESIGN, ULTIMATELY, WITH WHAT WE DO WITH BART
2 PHASE TWO. AND ACE, AND SUCH, THERE ARE OTHER SUCH AGENCIES
3 WHERE THERE IS NOT A LOT OF MOVEMENT IN TERMS OF DOING HARM
4 BUT AGAIN WHEN WE LOOK AT THIS BY APPROVING THIS CONFIGURATION
5 FOR THIS PARTICULAR TABLE OF PLAY ERRS, I THINK IT WILL
6 ADDRESS, AND BE ABLE TO A ADJUST HOW THINGS ARE GOING FORWARD
7 TO MAKE SURE WE END UP WITH A SOLUTION THAT IS SERVING
8 EVERYBODY. AND WHEN IT COMES TIME TO MAKE A MOTION, I WOULD
9 LIKE TO MAKE THE MOTION. [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO SECOND.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER BRUINS AND
14 COMMISSIONER --

15

16 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** JUST A MOMENT IN THE DRAFT BEFORE US, I KNOW
17 IT'S A DRAFT, BUT 8B NEEDS TO BE MODIFIED TO ADD MTC INTO THE
18 LANGUAGE THERE.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. STAFF CAN PICK THAT UP.
21 COMMISSIONER BRUINS, YOU KNOW, I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO
22 UNDERSTAND. I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO UNDERSTAND BETTER WHY BART
23 IS NOT AT THE -- SORT OF OFFICIALLY AT THE MAIN TABLE ON THIS.
24 WHILE, WE DON'T -- NOT -- WE HAVE APPROPRIATELY SPENT BILLIONS
25 OF DOLLARS AS A REGION GETTING BART TO DIRIDON. THERE IS A

Meeting Transcript

1 CLEAR PATH TO GET THERE. HIGH SPEED RAIL ON THE OTHER HAND IS
2 SOMETHING WHICH SOMETHING A LOT OF US WOULD LIKE TO SEE COME
3 BUT THE PLANS IN THE VERY DISTANT FUTURE IT FEELS LIKE, YOU
4 KNOW, IT JUST DOESN'T SIT WELL WITH ME THAT BART IS NOT AT
5 THAT TABLE, AND I DON'T THINK THIS IS A DECISION THAT WE HAVE
6 TO COME TO NOW, BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO INCLUDE IN THE
7 MOTION IF YOU ARE OPEN TO IT, IF STAFF COULD COME BACK TO US
8 AND KIND OF GIVE US A BETTER EXPLANATION OF THE PROJECTS
9 SPONSORS AT OUR NEXT COMMISSION MEETING ABOUT WHY -- WHAT'S
10 GOING ON HERE.

11

12 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** LET ME MAKE ONE MORE POINT OF CLARIFICATIONS,
13 WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE LIST OF PLAY ERRS, THEY ARE ALL
14 SIGNIFICANT FUNDING PARTNERS IN THIS OVERALL PROJECT. OKAY.
15 AND SO, THAT, I THINK IS REALLY THE LENS IN WHICH THIS
16 PARTICULAR TABLE HAS BEEN SET, IS THESE ARE THE KEY FUNDING
17 PARTNERS. AND SO THEREFORE, I -- AGAIN, I THINK THAT'S REALLY
18 WHAT IT IS ABOUT. PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT IN THIS ARE PROBABLY
19 PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT PUTTING UP THE BIG DOLLARS. AND YES AS A
20 REGION WE ALL ARE, BUT IT ACTUALLY GETS DOWN TO SPECIFIC
21 FUNDING PARTNERS AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT THIS REPRESENTATIVE
22 LIST REFLECTS. AND I COULD BE WRONG IN THAT, BUT THAT IS WHAT
23 I BELIEVE THAT THIS COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT IS ABOUT, IT'S
24 GETTING ALL THE FUNDING, THE BIG FUNDING PARTNERS A SEAT AT
25 THIS PARTICULAR TABLE.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I WANT TO SUPPORT IN WHAT YOU ASKED. AND
3 I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW LOOK, WHEN YOU'RE DOING
4 PLANNING AND GOOD PLANNING IT SHOULDN'T ALWAYS BE ABOUT WHO
5 PUTS IN MAJOR DOLLARS IT SHOULD BE WHO IS UTILIZING THE
6 FACILITY. I THINK BART UNDERSTANDS HOW TO RUN TRAINS.
7 SPECIFICALLY BART TRAINS, INTO THE FACILITY, AND THEY
8 UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY NEED. ACE COULD MAYBE ADD SOMETHING
9 BECAUSE THEY DO STORE TRAINS. AND I THINK MAYBE THEY DON'T
10 HAVE TO BE AT THE MAIN TABLE, THE MAJOR FUNDING TABLE BUT I
11 WOULD LIKE TO KNOW THAT THERE IS AT LEAST SOME SUBCOMMITTEE
12 BEING USED TO -- AND THIS IS MY, YOU KNOW, NICK MIGHT WANT
13 THEM AT THE TABLE -- I THINK HE DOES -- SOME SUBCOMMITTEE THAT
14 MIGHT ACTUALLY COMMUNICATE WITH THEM. I THINK IT'S A BIG
15 MISTAKE.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THEY ARE, I ASSURE YOU THEY ARE INVOLVED IN
18 THE CONVERSATIONS IN THEY ARE DIFFERENT -- THE SIZE OF THE
19 PROJECT HAS RESULTED IN MEETING MULTIPLE FOCUSED AREAS AND
20 EACH HAS A SEAT AT THAT TABLE, I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S ONE OR
21 TWO, BUT THEY ARE THERE.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I APPRECIATE THAT CONTEXT COMMISSIONER
24 BRUINS. IT JUST FEELS TO ME AS IF WE'RE GIVING PEOPLE NON-
25 VOTING SEATS AT THE TABLE WHEN MAYBE THEY SHOULD BE GETTING

Meeting Transcript

1 DIFFERENT TYPES OF SEATS. SO I KNOW THAT THERE ARE TWO OTHER
2 COMMISSIONERS -- COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI, AND I THINK
3 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, YOU WANT TO GO, YOUR HAND UP AGAIN?

4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** YES THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR
6 JOSEFOWITZ. YES. ON THIS ITEM, I DO SUPPORT THE CONCEPT THAT
7 WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT ALL THE PLAYERS ARE IN THE
8 CONVERSATION THAT WILL ULTIMATELY BE USING THAT STATION, AND
9 THANK YOU COMMISSIONER BRUINS AND COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY FOR
10 YOUR PERSPECTIVES AND BACKGROUND INFORMATION AS TO WHO THOSE
11 PLAYERS ARE, AND WHO IS DOING WHAT. SO, I DO AGREE IT'S
12 IMPORTANT TO END UP WITH A GOOD FINAL PROJECT, THAT EVERYBODY
13 IS TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION AS THIS DESIGN IS IMPLEMENTED.
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I DO BELIEVE, CORRECT ME IF
19 I AM WRONG, BUT BART DOES NOT RUN THAT STATION. IT IS RUN BY
20 VTA. IS THAT CORRECT?

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THAT'S CORRECT. THAT'S MY
23 UNDERSTANDING.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES SO I'M VERY COMFORTABLE. THEY HAVE BEEN PART
2 OF THE DISCUSSION. I DON'T KNOW THAT MUCH ABOUT ACE, FORGIVE
3 ME CHAIR HAGGERTY. BUT, HAVING A STATION AN INTERMODAL
4 STATION, BART IS NOT A GOOD PARTNER, AND TRYING TO GET
5 ANYTHING DONE WITH THEIR BOARD, I THINK JUST BEING ADVISERS
6 AND PART OF THE DISCUSSION IS SUFFICIENT HERE, AND ANY MORE
7 COMPLICATION AS IT DEALS WITH BART I DON'T THINK IS NECESSARY.
8 THEY DON'T RUN THE STATION. WE SAW THE BERRYESSA STATION
9 ALREADY HAS GRAFFITI. THEY'RE KNOWN FOR THAT AND I DON'T THINK
10 THEY SHOULD BE A PART OF THIS STATION. THEY DON'T OWN THE
11 STATION AS FAR AS TRAINS COMING IN AND OUT. THEY ARE PART OF
12 THE DISCUSSIONS. SO I WOULD NOT BE WILLING TO DO THE AMENDMENT
13 AT THIS POINT.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER BRUINS, I -- WHAT MY --
16 AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THE AMENDMENT I WAS HOPING TO MAKE, IS
17 TO ASK STAFF TO REPORT BACK ON HOW ACE AND BART ARE BEING
18 INCLUDED IN THE DECISION MAKING FOR THIS, FOR -- FOR -- IN
19 THIS COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT AT THE DIRIDON STATION PLANNING
20 IT'S NOT JUST SORT OF TO ASK THEM TO INCLUDE BART IN THE
21 COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT. THAT'S NOT WHAT I WAS SUGGESTING. WOULD
22 YOU -- WOULD -- WOULD -- WOULD THAT BE --

23

24 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YES. WITH THAT DIRECTION, I DEFINITELY AGREE.

25



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **GINA PAPAN:** FOR CLARIFICATION, ARE WE JUST ASKING FOR
2 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AS IT MOVES FORWARD THEN? I DON'T THINK
3 IT NEEDS TO BE A PART OF THE MOTION.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I WOULD LIKE IT TO BE PART OF A MOTION
6 -- OF THE MOTION IF THAT'S OKAY. BECAUSE I YOU THINK IT'S
7 BEING RAISED BY COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, AND I, AND I THINK WE
8 WANT TO MAKE A POINT OF IT. THAT SORT OF --

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** COULD YOU CLARIFY? COULD YOU CLARIFY FOR ME THE
11 INFORMATION YOU ARE REQUESTING?

12

13 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I THINK THE MOTION --

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SO WHAT -- COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** SO CHAIR, IF I MAY, I BELIEVE WHAT YOU'RE
18 SUGGESTING IS THE MOTION IS FOR US TO MOVE -- TO RECOMMEND TO
19 THE MTC -- TO MTC, THE APPROVAL OF THE COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT,
20 AND WE'RE ASKING, IN ADDITION, THAT STAFF BRING TO THE
21 COMMISSION, THE INFORMATION REGARDING HOW PARTNER -- OTHER
22 PARTNER AGENCIES, ARE ACE, BART, OTHER USERS, I THINK CAPITAL
23 CORRIDOR, ALL OF THE OTHER USERS OF DIRIDON STATION ARE BEING
24 INTEGRATED INTO AND HAVING A VOICE IN THIS, SO THAT IT WOULD
25 BRING THAT CLARIFICATION TO MTC AS WELL.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I AM -- TO THAT --

5

6 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** SOMEBODY CAPTURE THAT BECAUSE I'M NOT GOING TO
7 REPEAT IT.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. THIS'S BEEN CAPTURED. ANY OTHER
10 COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. I THINK WE HAVE A PUBLIC
11 COMMENT. KIMBERLY E DO WE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE HAVE TWO RAISED HANDS AND ONE
14 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FROM ROLAND LEBRUN AND I WILL CALL ON
15 THE FIRST CALLER IS LAST FOUR DIGITS 6262.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS ROLAND, SAN JOSE. GREAT CONVERSATION SO
18 FAR, BUT BEFORE I GET INTO RECOMMENDATIONS, LET ME TELL YOU
19 WHAT'S GOING ON HERE. PHASE ONE WAS A DISASTER. IT WAS ONE
20 YEAR LATE. IT WAS 100 PERCENT OVER BUDGET AND THE SOUTHERN
21 HALF OF THE STATION IS COMPLETELY MISSING. IT'S GONE. AND IF
22 YOU LOOK AT PAGE 52 OF THE PHASE ONE REPORT IN BLACK AND WHITE
23 ON PAGE 52, THAT GIVEN THAT BART AND DIRIDON WOULD BE
24 PHYSICALLY SEPARATED, IT IS ASSUMED THERE ARE NO PHASING
25 ISSUES, SO HOW COULD YOU POSSIBLY HAVE AN INTEGRATED STATION

Meeting Transcript

1 PROJECT PHYSICALLY SEPARATED? SO HERE ARE MY RECOMMENDATIONS.
2 MTC ABSOLUTELY THERE IS NO NEED TO WASTE MONEY ON GOVERNMENTS
3 WHEN YOU HAVE THE PERFECT GOVERNMENT MODEL FOR DIRIDON
4 STATION. IT'S GOOD TO GO. I WOULD LIKE THE TWO EXECUTIVE
5 STEERING COMMITTEES TO BE MERGED, THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION AND
6 DIRIDON, ONE COMMITTEE, END OF DISCUSSION. INCREASE FREQUENCY
7 OF THE MEETINGS TO MONTHLY, ESTABLISHMENT OF MTC AS THE LEAD
8 AGENCY FOR BOTH PROJECTS, INCLUDING RESPONSIBILITY FOR
9 AWARDED CONTRACTS AND TRAFFIC AND AWARDED WORK DIRECTLY.
10 THERE HAVE BEEN MAJOR ISSUES SOME OF WHICH QUITE FRANKLY HAVE
11 BEEN ILLEGAL. AND THE LAST POINT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE IS YES
12 BART MUST ACTUALLY BE AT THE TABLE. I MEAN BOTH AT TRANSBAY
13 AND AT DIRIDON, AND SOCIAL CAPITAL CORRIDOR BECAUSE THE WAY
14 THINGS ARE GOING WE'RE ACTUALLY GOING TO GET CAPITAL CORRIDOR
15 INTO THE TRANSBAY TERMINAL BEFORE CAL TRAINS OR HIGH SPEED
16 RAIL GETS ANYWHERE NEAR IT. THAT'S MY TWO CENTS, AND I LOOK
17 FORWARD TO YOUR FINAL RESOLUTION. THANK YOU.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. EUGENE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAN EVERYBODY HEAR ME?

24

25 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS EUGENE BRADLEY FOUNDER OF SILICON VALLEY
3 ADVOCACY WATCH DOG GROUP IN SILICON VALLEY IS SAN JOSE.
4 REGARDING MR. LEBRUN'S COMMENTS REGARDING THE CAPITAL CORRIDOR
5 BEING A UNIFIED TABLE IT SURPRISES ME WHEN PEOPLE CERTAIN
6 ORGANIZATIONS AND TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT ARE GOING TO BE USING
7 THAT STATION, POTENTIALLY, AREN'T EVEN AT THE TABLE. THIS IS,
8 OF COURSE THE METROPOLITAN -- LET ME REMIND EVERYBODY THIS IS
9 THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, PART OF YOUR JOB
10 IN YOUR OWN WHAT YOU'RE ABOUT ON YOUR WEB SITE, PLAN AND
11 COORDINATE AMONGST ALL BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES WHEN I HEAR
12 BART ISN'T PART OF THIS DISCUSSION OF PLANNING FOR THE UNIFIED
13 DIRIDON STATION THAT'S MTC NOT DOING ITS JOB, AND THAT, YOU
14 GOT THAT TO BE CORRECTED NOW. THERE IS SIMPLY NO EXCUSES. ALSO
15 ECHOING MR. LEBRUN'S COMMENT, BAD ENOUGH THAT PHASE ONE OF THE
16 BART EXTENSION DOWN INTO BERRYESSA IS INTO OVER MULTIPLE YEARS
17 LATE AND 100 PERCENT OVER BUDGET THAT SPEAKS TO MTC'S PART ON
18 PROPERLY COORDINATION BETWEEN THAT AND BART YOU HAVE TO
19 CORRECT THIS. THANK YOU.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU EUGENE FOR YOUR COMMENTS.
22 ALETA.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
25 FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. I'M GETTING UP TO

Meeting Transcript

1 SPEED ON IT AND I HAVE USED THE DIRIDON STATION SEVERAL TIMES
2 WITH RAILROAD, LIGHT RAIL AND BUSSES AND THOSE LITTLE
3 SCOOTERS. SO THE COOPERATION IS ESSENTIAL, AS BOTH WITH THE
4 OPERATIONAL RAIL ASPECTS, AND ALSO WITH PLANNING. IT'S
5 IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT THIS IN A GLOBAL PERSPECTIVE. IDEA OF
6 COOPERATION IS NOT NEW. CONSIDER A STATION IN NEW YORK CITY IS
7 THE WORLD'S LARGEST TRAIN STATION KNOWN AS GRAND CENTRAL
8 TERMINAL. I AM SURE MANY IF NOT ALL OF YOU HAVE SEEN IT, HAS
9 INVOLVED PLANNING, WHICH IF YOU STAND ON PARK AVENUE NORTH OF
10 46th STREET MANY OF THE BUILDINGS ARE ACTUALLY BUILT OVER 48
11 ACRES OF TRAIN YARDS. AND SO IT IS AN INTEGRATED STATION
12 BECAUSE NOT ONLY ARE THERE 44 PLATFORMS FOR ARE COMMUTER RAIL
13 BUT THERE ARE THREE MAJOR SUBWAY LINES THAT ARE CONNECTED WITH
14 THE STATION AS WELL, EVEN THOUGH THEY ARE NOT PHYSICALLY
15 CONNECTED TO THE COMMUTER RAIL NETWORK. SO YOU HAVE A LOT OF
16 VOICES AT THE TABLE. NOW, IN NEW YORK CITY, THE TERMINAL, AND
17 THE SUBWAY ARE ALL OWNED FULLY. THEY'RE ALL OPERATED BY THE
18 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. BUT THEY'RE STILL A
19 COOPERATION BECAUSE THE SUBWAY IS OWNED BY THE CITY EVEN
20 THOUGH THE TERMINAL IS OWNED BY THE MTA. SO IT'S IMPORTANT
21 THAT WE GET TOGETHER AND BRING THE VOICES TO THE TABLE SO WE
22 CAN BUILD OURSELVES A STATION THAT CAN BE PART OF GREAT
23 LEGENDARY RAILROAD. THANK YOU.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALETA. LEGENDARY
2 RAILROADING. SOMETIMES I WOULD THINK THAT REFERS TO SOMETHING
3 ELSE IN A POLITICAL CONTEXT.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** -- A QUESTION.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** CALL FOR THE QUESTION.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OH CALL FOR THE QUESTION. I THOUGHT
12 YOU SAID I HAVE A QUESTION. LET'S TAKE A VOTE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES
15 UNANIMOUSLY.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM 4AMTC
18 RESOLUTION 4202 REVISED REVISIONS TO THE OBAG TWO, TO PROGRAM
19 \$5 MILLION TO TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS IN MARIN, NAPA, SOLANO,
20 AND SONOMA COUNTIES AS PART OF THE INCENTIVE FOR HIP, SUB-HIP
21 PILOT PROGRAM AND \$1 MILLION TO NAPA VALLEY TRAFFIC AND MULTI-
22 MODAL IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT WITHIN THE MULTI-FREEWAY PROJECT.
23 MALLORY.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** GOOD MORNING. I WILL BE PRESENTING ON THE
2 TWO SEPARATE PROGRAMS. FIRST \$1 MILLION WITH THE FREEWAY
3 PERFORMANCE PROGRAM FOR NAPA VALLEY MULTI-MODAL IMPROVEMENTS
4 PROJECTS FOR MULTI-MODAL STREET IMPROVEMENTS THROUGHOUT NAPA
5 VALLEY INCLUDING STATE ROUTE 29 SILVERADO TRAIL VINE TRAIN
6 NETWORK ALL TO INCLUDE WALKING AND BIKING TO LOCAL COMMUTERS
7 RESIDENTS AND VISITORS. 5 MILLION POOL SET ASIDE FOR PROJECTS
8 IN THE NORTH BAY. SO A QUICK CONTEXT. A REMINDER ON THE
9 OVERALL HOUSING INCENTIVE POOL OR HIP PROGRAM COMMISSION
10 ESTABLISHED HIP IN 2018 AS A WAY TO PROVIDE FINANCIAL DIRECT
11 FINANCIAL INCENTIVE FOR CITIES TO BUILD AND PRESERVE
12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. HIP PROGRAM WILL DISTRIBUTE APPROXIMATELY
13 70 MILLION IN TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO 15 CITIES THAT BUILD OR
14 PRESERVE THE MOST AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS IN PRIORITY
15 DEVELOPMENT AREAS THAT ARE TRANSIT PRIORITY AREAS BETWEEN 2018
16 AND 2022 AND STAFF WILL PRESENT AN UPDATE TO THE COMMISSION ON
17 THE CURRENT STANDINGS FOR THE HIP PROGRAM INCLUDING 2018 AND
18 2019 HOUSING UNIT AS PART OF A LARGER HOUSING PROJECT REPORT
19 LATER THIS YEAR AND WINTER. ON TOP OF THE OVERALL HIP PROGRAM
20 SETTING ASIDE 5 MILLION FOR PILOT SUB-HIP WHILE BOTH SUB-HIP
21 PILOT AND LARGER THERE -- THERE ARE KEY DIFFERENCES TO THE
22 PROGRAMS. AWARDING CITIES FOR HOUSING ACHIEVEMENTS OVER A FIVE
23 YEAR PERIOD TO PUT FUNDS ON TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS TO SUPPORT
24 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IN THE REGION OF HOUSING AFFORDABILITY
25 GIVEN THE RELATIVELY SMALL PILOT SIZE OF 5 MILLION AND THE

Meeting Transcript

1 INTENT TO TARGET AREAS OF EXISTING AFFORDABILITY SUB-HIP FUNDS
2 ARE LIMITED TO FOUR COUNTIES IN THE NORTH BAY WITH PARTICULAR
3 FUNDING EMPHASIS ON SOLANO COUNTY PROJECTS THAT THE COUNTY
4 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY IN SOLANO MARIN NAPA SONOMA COUNTY HAVE
5 SUBMITTED FIVE PROJECTS FOR THE 5 MILLION SUB-HIP PILOT
6 DETAILS ON FIVE PROJECTS ARE INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT ONE TO
7 THIS ITEM AND ATTACHMENT TWO INCLUDES MAP LOCATION IN RELATION
8 TO THE PDAS AND TPAS IN THE NORTH BAY ONE ITEM I WOULD LIKE TO
9 HIGHLIGHT WITH THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS THE PROJECTS IN
10 FAIRFIELD AND VALLEJO INVOLVE FUND SWAPS IN BOTH JURISDICTION
11 FOR THOSE CITIES MTC SUBFUNDS WILL BE USED ON ELIGIBLE LOCAL
12 STREETS AND ROADS PROJECTS FREEING UP EQUAL AMOUNTS OF LOCAL
13 FUNDS FOR CITIES TO DIRECTLY COMMITMENT TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING
14 PROJECTS AND INFRASTRUCTURE. PRIOR TO PROGRAMMING SUB-HIP
15 FUNDS IN THE TIP FOR THOSE TWO PROJECTS EACH OF THOSE TWO
16 CITIES WOULD BE REQUIRED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION COMMITTING TO
17 BOTH SUB-HIP TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND THE ASSOCIATED
18 HOUSING PROJECT WITH THAT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THIS
19 ITEM IS TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4202 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION
20 FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I GUESS NOW THAT
23 WE CAN'T WATCH BASEBALL, WE HAVE TO WATCH THE HIP PROGRAM
24 STANDINGS. SO, DO -- ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS ON
25 THIS ITEM? I JUST WANT TO SAY, I THINK IT'S REALLY EXCITING

Meeting Transcript

1 THAT WE ARE PUTTING OUR MONEY TO WORK IN A WAY THAT IS SORT OF
2 SO JOINED UP BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING,
3 AND THAT WE'RE RELATIONSHIP HELPING THESE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
4 PROJECTS BE DELIVERED IN HELPING MAKE SURE THERE IS REAL KIND
5 OF CONTINUABLE AND EQUITABLE MOBILITY FOR THE RESIDENTS OF
6 THOSE PROJECTS IN THE PROCESS. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT
7 PROGRAM. DO I HAVE ANY -- I DIDN'T SEE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY
8 WRITTEN COMMENT?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NO RAISED HANDS AND HAVE RECEIVED
11 NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** LET'S SEE IF WE CAN KEEP THAT GOING
14 FOR THE NEXT ITEM. FIRST LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE'LL NEED A MOTION AND SECOND.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE DO NEED A MOTION AND SECOND. WHO
19 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THE MOTION.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE.

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** PAPAN MOVES. WORTH SECONDS. WE GO TO
2 VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL] MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. OKAY. HERE IS THE BIG ONE.
7 ITEM FOUR MTC RESOLUTION 4420 REVISED, CORONAVIRUS AID RELIEF
8 AND ECONOMIC SECURITY CARES ACT HR 748 EMERGENCY TRANSIT
9 ASSISTANCE PROGRAMMING FOR \$504 MILLION OF FTA SECTION 5307
10 FUNDS FOR CARES ACT TO SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN RESPONSE
11 TO THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. TERESA ROMELL IS GOING TO PRESENT
12 THIS ITEM. I WOULD LIKE TO REMIND PUBLIC COMMENTERS THEY CAN
13 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OF ZOOM OR IF THEY'RE DIALLING IN
14 BY PHONE THEY CAN DIAL STAR NINE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, AND
15 WE WILL CALL ON YOU AFTER THE PRESENTATION IS AFTER COMMISSION
16 DISCUSSION. THERESA

17

18 **THERESA ROMELL:** YES. GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I BELIEVE
19 THERE'S A SLIDE PRESENTATION ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM. THERE
20 YOU GO. SO TODAY I'M GOING TO PRESENT THE STAFF PROPOSED AND
21 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE RECOMMENDED
22 DISTRIBUTION FOR PHASE TWO OF THE CORONAVIRUS AID RELIEF AND
23 ECONOMIC RECOVERY ACT OR CARES FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
24 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. YOU'RE ALL AWARE IN RESPONSE TO THE
25 PANDEMIC, THE COMMISSION APPOINTED THE 32 MEMBER BLUE RIBBON

Meeting Transcript

1 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE TO HELP GUIDE THE PHASE TWO
2 DISTRIBUTION OF CARES ACT FUNDING IN LINE WITH CARES ACT
3 DISTRIBUTION PRINCIPLES IS TO CONSIDER SAFETY NETWORK
4 CONNECTIVITY FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY AND SYSTEM EQUITY IN ITS
5 DEVELOPMENT. IN ADDITION THE TASK FORCE PURPOSE IS TO IDENTIFY
6 ACTIONS BY MID-2021 TO RESHAPE THE REGION'S PUBLIC TRANSIT
7 SYSTEM TO BE MORE CONNECTED, EFFICIENT, AND USER FRIENDLY.
8 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THANK YOU. THIS SLIDE
9 SHOWS A GRAPHIC TIMELINE OF THE TASK FORCE WORK. YOU CAN SEE
10 WITH THE PHASE TWO CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION PROPOSAL, THE TASK
11 FORCE IS CURRENTLY IN STAGE TWO OF ITS WORK ENCOMPASSES SHORT-
12 TERM RECOVERY STRATEGIES AND WILL BEGIN MOVING INTO STAGE
13 THREE WHICH WILL INCLUDE THE DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF
14 A TRANSIT -- TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN THAT WILL LIKELY
15 AFFECT COMMISSION POLICIES, LEGISLATION, NEW FUNDING, AND
16 POTENTIALLY GOVERNANCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THERE HAVE BEEN
17 THREE MEETINGS SO FAR WITH DISCUSSION TOPICS FOCUSED AROUND
18 SAFETY AND NETWORK PLANNING, AND DISTRIBUTION NEXT MEETING
19 SCHEDULED FOR JULY 20TH TASK FORCE WILL CONTINUE TO DISCUSS
20 SHORT-TERM RECOVERY STRATEGIES BUT ALSO LAUNCH TRANSFORMATIVE
21 ACTION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE GETTING INTO THE
22 CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION, I WANT TO GIVE A BIT OF BACKGROUND ON
23 THE NEAR TERM RECOVERY PLANNING THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC
24 HAVE BEEN ENGAGED IN OVER RECENT WEEKS. IT WILL PROVIDE
25 CONTEXT FOR THE CARES DISTRIBUTION. NEXT SLIDE. SAFETY HAS

Meeting Transcript

1 BEEN A BIG TOPIC OF NEAR TERM SERVICE PLANNING GIVEN
2 IMPORTANCE OF GETTING THE PUBLIC TO FEEL SAFE ABOUT COMING
3 BACK TO TRANSIT. TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE TAKEN A LEAD HERE AND
4 HAVE BEEN WORKING TOGETHER AT AN NOURISHING ENCOURAGING LEVEL
5 OF COORDINATION TO DEVELOP A CONSISTENT SAFETY PLAN FOR
6 STANDARDS LEVERAGE OF DATA LEARNING FROM BEST PRACTICES
7 NATIONALLY AND INTERNATIONALLY COMMUNICATING WITH THE PUBLIC
8 AND LOOKING AT WEARS TO WAYS TO MEASURE PROGRESS. FUTURE
9 UPDATES WILL BE PROVIDED AT UPCOMING MEETINGS AS WELL. NEXT
10 SLIDE. TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC HAVE MADE SEVERAL NEAR TERM
11 COMMITS RELATED TO RECOVERY PLANNING INCLUDING UNDERTAKING
12 ACTIONS NEEDED TO UNDERSTAND RIDER NEEDS SPECIAL THOSE OF THE
13 TRANSIT DEPENDENT INCLUDING CONDUCTING SURVEY SUPERVISOR POLLS
14 AT THE AGENCY AND REGIONAL LEVELS INCLUDING SERVICE PLANNING.
15 MTC HAS COMMITTED TO ASSISTING WITH CAMPAIGNS TO PROTECT THE
16 HEALTH AND SAFETY OF RIDERS AND TRANSIT EMPLOYEES AS WELL AS
17 TO WELCOME RIDERS BACK WITH COOPERATED MESSAGING. TRANSIT
18 OPERATORS HAVE COMMITTED TO PROVIDE QUARTERLY REPORTING AS
19 SERVICE LEVELS CHANGE ALLOWING FOR EVALUATION OF CONNECTIVITY
20 AND GAPS AND IDENTIFIED SEVERAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR REGIONAL
21 COLLABORATION IN AREAS RELATED DIRECTLY TO THE TRANSIT
22 RECOVERY EFFORT. NEXT SLIDE. SO WITH THAT BACKGROUND I'M GOING
23 TO MOVE INTO PHASE TWO CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION WHICH HAS BEEN
24 ONE OF THE FOCUSES OF THE TASK FORCE WORK OVER THE LAST THREE
25 MEETINGS. I DO WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THE CARES ACT PROVIDES

Meeting Transcript

1 EMERGENCY RELIEF FOR THE REG'S TRANSIT OPERATORS. FUNDING IS
2 INTENDED TO STABILIZE SYSTEMS BUT WE KNOW IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO
3 GET US THROUGH THIS PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LET'S SEE. AS
4 YOU MAY RECALL WITH PHASE ONE WE DEVELOPED IN CONSULTATION
5 WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE IN THE DISTRIBUTION
6 OF CARES ACT FUNDING COMPELLING TO ACT QUICKLY USING FUNDING
7 TO ADDRESS OPERATOR NEEDS ARISING OUT OF THE COVID-19 CRISIS
8 AND ALLOWING FLEXIBILITY TO BOTH ADDRESS ONGOING UNCERTAINTY
9 AS WELL AS DISTRIBUTION CONSTRAINTS PROPOSED BY THE PRESCRIBED
10 FEDERAL FUNDING FRAMEWORK. FIFTH PRINCIPLE ADDED IN MAY
11 SUGGESTS A PHASE TWO DISTRIBUTION TO OPERATOR RECOVERY
12 STRATEGIES THAT TAKE INTO ACCOUNT NETWORK CONNECTIVITY
13 LIFELINE SERVICE NEEDS AND FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY. NEXT
14 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE PROVIDES A GRAPHIC REPRESENTED ON THE RIGHT
15 OF PHASE ONE AND PHASE TWO DISTRIBUTIONS AND THE RESULTING
16 DISTRIBUTION OF THE FULL 1.3 BILLION IN CARES ACT FUNDING BY
17 OPERATOR. PHASE ONE DISTRIBUTION WAS FOR APPROXIMATELY 60
18 PERCENT OF THE FUNDS OR 781 MILLION THIS DISTRIBUTION WAS
19 BASED ON HYBRID FORMULA COMPRISED OF 33 PERCENT OF OPERATOR
20 SHARES OF STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE REVENUE FORMULA 33 PERCENT
21 OF SHARES BOX AND 33 PERCENT ON RELATIVE SHARES OF OPERATING
22 EXPENSE. THIS REPRESENTED FARES REVENUE TO A SIGNIFICANT
23 DEGREE OF COLLAPSE AT THE START OF THE PANDEMIC AND IMPACTING
24 OPERATORS THAT ARE HIGHLY RELYING ON IT. THERE WAS A
25 COMMITMENT TO TRUE-UP THE DISTRIBUTION TO ACCOUNT FOR REVENUE

Meeting Transcript

1 LOSSES THAT WE DIDN'T YET HAVE RELIABLE INFORMATION THAT ON AS
2 TO IMPACT FOR EXAMPLE, SALES TAX REVENUE. REPRESENTING 40
3 APPROXIMATELY OF THE TOTAL CARES ACT FUNDING OR 508 MILLION.
4 THIS DISTRIBUTION WHICH WE CALL THE SERVICE HORIZON APPROACH
5 SEEKS TO FULLY FUND OPERATORS ESTIMATED REVENUE LOSSES DUE TO
6 COVID-19 THROUGH DECEMBER OF 2020 ACROSS BOTH PHASE ONE AND
7 PHASE TWO OF THE CARES ACT DISTRIBUTION. HOWEVER, DUE TO THE
8 MAGNITUDE OF ANTICIPATED LOSSES WE CAN ONLY BACKFILL
9 APPROXIMATELY 90 PERCENT OF ANTICIPATED LOSSES OVER THAT TIME
10 PERIOD. THIS APPROACH DOES INCLUDE THE PROMISE TRUE UP THAT
11 YOU WILL SEE IN LATER SLIDES AS IT LOOKS AT ANTICIPATED LOSSES
12 THROUGH MARCH AND DECEMBER OF 2020 ASK CALCULATE THE TOTAL
13 AMOUNT OF CARES ACT FUNDING AN OPERATOR NEEDS OVER THAT TIME
14 PERIOD. THE PROPOSED PHASE TWO APPROACH USES A CONSISTENT SET
15 OF ASSUMPTIONS ACROSS ALL OPERATOR NECESSARY TWO TIME PERIODS
16 MARCH THROUGH AUGUST AND SEPTEMBER THROUGH DECEMBER TO
17 DETERMINE ANTICIPATED REVENUE LOSSES LASTLY APPROACH INCLUDES
18 EQUITY ADJUSTMENT APPLIED BY WAIVING 25 PERCENT OF PROJECTED
19 REVENUE LOSS OF RIDER SHARE TO PASSENGERS OR INCOME LEVELS
20 BELOW \$50,000 PER HOUSEHOLD. NEXT SLIDE. AS IN PHASE ONE STAFF
21 IS PROPOSING THAT MTC RECEIVES A ONE PERCENT SHARE OF THE
22 CARES ACT FUNDING IN PHASE TWO TO SUPPORT REGIONAL TRANSIT
23 OPERATIONS AND TRANSIT RECOVERY. FOR PHASE TWO THE TOTAL ONE
24 PERCENT IS PROPOSED TO AUGMENT THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM.
25 CLIPPER START IS AN 18 MONTH MEANS-BASED FARE PILOT PROGRAM

Meeting Transcript

1 FUNDED BY TRANSIT OPERATOR AND MTC FUNDING SET ASIDES THERE
2 ARE CURRENTLY FOUR OPERATORS PARTICIPATING IN THE PILOT BUT
3 CARES ACT PHASE TWO WOULD ALLOW EXPANSION TO INCLUDE
4 ADDITIONAL OPERATORS. CONFIRMING OPERATOR INTEREST IN
5 CONFIRMING PILOT AND WE BELIEVE THERE WILL BE SIGNIFICANT
6 INTEREST. THERE ARE THINGS TO WORK OUT STILL INCLUDING TIMING
7 AND CLIPPER SYSTEM CHANGES AS WELL AS IDENTIFICATION OF ANY
8 OTHER REGIONAL FUND SOURCES THAT COULD BE BROUGHT TO BARE. WE
9 BELIEVE THE AUGMENTATION OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM IS
10 PRIORITY TO HELP TRANSIT RIDERS DURING THIS DIFFICULT TIME.
11 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE MENTIONED EARLIER THAT THE PROPOSED
12 PHASE TWO DISTRIBUTION USES A CONSISTENT SET OF ASSUMPTIONS
13 ABOUT REVENUE LOSS ACROSS TWO DIFFERENT TIME PERIODS IN ORDER
14 TO KEEP OPERATORS ON A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD. ORIGINALLY
15 INTRODUCTION OF THE FRAMEWORK TO THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK
16 FORCE WE HAD SUGGESTED SLIGHTLY IN CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS
17 THAN THOSE SHOWN HERE OVER MULTIPLE DISCUSSIONS WITH TRANSIT
18 OPERATORS OVER THE LAST SEVERAL WEEKS AND IN REVIEWING MORE
19 RECENT DATA AVAILABLE OPERATOR BUDGETS AND MTC'S OWN BUDGET
20 ASSUMPTIONS WE MODIFIED OUR ASSUMPTIONS TO REFLECT SLIGHTLY
21 MORE OPTIMISTIC OUTLOOKS ON PROJECTED REVENUE LEVELS FOR
22 CERTAIN FUND SOURCES. CHANGES IN OUR ORIGINAL ASSUMPTIONS ARE
23 REPRESENTED IN A TELL -- IN THE BOXES. WE ASSUME FARES ARE
24 DOWN 90 PERCENT AS OPPOSED TO FISCAL YEARS 2019, TAXES FOR
25 FISCAL YEAR ON DOWN IN OUR ASSUMPTION THAT HAD SALES TAXES

Meeting Transcript

1 DOWN 50 PERCENT DURING THAT PERIOD. FROM SEPTEMBER THROUGH
2 DECEMBER WE ASSUME FARES ARE DOWN 70 PERCENT COMPARED TO
3 FISCAL YEAR 2019 AND THAT'S A CHANGE FROM OUR ORIGINAL
4 ASSUMPTION OF DOWN 75 PERCENT. WE REVISED OUR SALES TAX
5 ASSUMPTIONS TO BEING DOWN 30 PERCENT INSTEAD OF ORIGINALLY
6 ASSUMED 35 PERCENT. AND WE ALSO MODIFIED OUR ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT
7 BRIDGE TOLLS AND SAN FRANCISCO PARKING REVENUE TO BE SLIGHTLY
8 MORE OPTIMISTIC DURING THIS TIME PERIOD. AS I MENTIONED WE
9 THINK THESE MODIFICATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH MORE RECENT DATA
10 THAT WE HAVE SEEN ESPECIALLY FOR SALES TAX SUPERVISOR BRIDGE
11 TOLLS AND MORE CONSISTENT WITH MTC BUDGET ASSUMPTIONS. IT IS
12 IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT WE DID NOT ACHIEVE TOTAL CONSENSUS
13 AMONG OPERATORS ON THE CHANGES TO OUR ASSUMPTIONS ALTHOUGH THE
14 MAJORITY WERE SUPPORTIVE AT THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK
15 FORCE MEETING THERE ARE TWO OUT OF 32 VOTES TO BLOCK, IN YOUR
16 PACKET YOU SHOULD HAVE A LETTER FROM VTA STATING THEIR
17 PERSPECTIVES ON THE PROPOSAL IN ADDITION LETTERS FROM MULTIPLE
18 TRANSIT AGENCIES STATING SUPPORT FOR THE PROPOSAL. DESPITE THE
19 FACT THERE IS STILL DISSENT ON OUR RECOMMENDATION STAFF
20 BELIEVES THE ASSUMPTIONS USED REMAIN CONSERVATIVE AND
21 REPRESENT A LIKELY OUTCOME FOR MORE REVENUE GENERATION. ONE
22 THING WE CAN ALL AGREE ON IS THAT NONE OF THE ASSUMPTIONS ARE
23 LIKELY TO BE COMPLETELY ACCURATE GIVEN THE UNPRECEDENTED
24 UNCERTAINTY THAT REMAINS ABOUT HOW THE ECONOMY AND TRANSIT
25 RIDERSHIP WILL RECOVER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS SLIDE

Meeting Transcript

1 PROVIDES A NAP SHOT OF WHAT THE SEVEN LARGE OPERATORS
2 INDIVIDUALLY AND THE SMALL OPERATORS COLLECTIVELY WILL RECEIVE
3 OVER BOTH PHASES OF CARES ACT FUNDING PENDING APPROVAL OF THE
4 PHASE TWO DISTRIBUTION. CARES CARRIES INCENTIVE PERCENT OF
5 RIDERSHIP PHASE TWO -- OPERATING COST FOR SMALL AND LARGE
6 OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS GRAPHICALLY THE
7 PHASE ONE FUNDING SHARES RECEIVED BY LARGE OPERATORS IN ORANGE
8 VERSUS PHASE TWO PROPOSED SHARES IN LIGHT BLUE. AND THE
9 RESULTING SHARES IN DARK BLUE OR PURPLE. BEYOND SHOWING THE
10 PERCENT SHARES BY PHASE THE SLIDE SHOWS THE TRUE UP THAT THE
11 PHASE TWO PROPOSAL PERFORMS ARE OPERATORS RECEIVING MORE IN
12 PHASE ONE BART CALTRAIN AND AC TRANSIT RECEIVE A SMALLER SHARE
13 IN PHASE TWO AND VICE-VERSA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HERE IS THE
14 SAME GRAPHIC REPRESENTATION FOR THE SMALL OPERATORS. A NOTE ON
15 ACE, THEY ARE NOT PROPOSED TO RECEIVE ALLOCATION IN PHASE TWO
16 AS PHASE ONE ALLOCATION BETWEEN WHAT THEY RECEIVED FROM THE
17 BAY AREA, PLUS WHAT THEY RECEIVED FROM THE URBANIZED AREA
18 SUFFICIENTLY COVERS THEIR NEED THROUGHOUT END OF THE CALENDAR
19 YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY I WANT TO LEAVE YOU WITH THIS SLIDE.
20 WE CALL THIS THE FINANCIAL CLIFF SLIDE, BECAUSE AS MUCH OF A
21 HELP THAT THE CARES ACT FUNDING HAS BEEN IN DEALING WITH THE
22 CRISIS AT HAND IN THE VERY SHORT-TERM, WE KNOW THAT IT WILL
23 NOT BE ENOUGH TO STAVE OFF THE INEVITABLE IN THE LONG-TERM.
24 WHILE PHASE TWO PROPOSAL IS MEANT TO COVER OPERATORS THROUGH
25 DECEMBER THE APPLICATION OF EQUITY ADJUSTMENT MEANS SOME WILL

Meeting Transcript

1 BE ABLE TO GO FURTHER AND OTHERS COME UP SHORT OF THAT END OF
2 THE CALENDAR YEAR MARK. OF COURSE THESE ESTIMATES ARE ALL
3 BASED ON VERY UNCERTAIN ASSUMPTIONS. THE OTHER MITIGATING
4 FACTOR IS THAT SOME OPERATORS HAVE REDUCED COST SO THAT CLIFF
5 CAN BE POSTPONED TO A DEGREE. AND OPERATORS WILL LIKELY
6 RESTORE SERVICES AS DEMAND RETURNS. THERE IS ALSO THE
7 POSSIBILITY, ALTHOUGH NOT NEARLY CERTAIN, THAT THERE WILL BE
8 OTHER INVESTMENTS MADE TO BACKFILL LOST REVENUE INCLUDING
9 HEROES ACT FUNDS, THE INVEST IN AMERICA TRANSPORTATION BILL
10 OTHER FTA FORMULA FUNDS AND POTENTIALLY EVEN STATE FUNDING.
11 NEXT SLIDE. SO WITH THAT, I REQUEST THAT YOU MOVE RESOLUTION
12 4420 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND OF COURSE I'M
13 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THERESA. AND I
16 WANT TO THANK THERESE AND ALIX, AND THERESA, AND EVERYBODY ON
17 STAFF, WHO HAS PARTICIPATED IN THIS. IT WAS A REALLY QUICK
18 TURN AROUND. AND THERE WAS A REMARKABLE DEGREE OF CONSENSUS
19 AROUND WHAT COULD BE A REALLY CONTENTIOUS ITEM THAN THIS IS.
20 SO I JUST WANTED TO THANK ALL OF -- EVERYBODY ON STAFF WHO
21 WORKED ON THIS. I ALSO WANTED TO -- INCLUDING STEVE KINSEY AND
22 I WANT TO THANK CHAIR SPERING SERVING ON THE TASK FORCE THAT'S
23 A REAL TESTAMENT THAT GOT US TO THIS PLACE, AND IT'S A REALLY
24 CHALLENGE THAT HAS ARISED IN BRINGING THIS REGION TOGETHER AND

Meeting Transcript

1 ADDRESS WHAT WE CAN IN THESE EXISTENTIAL CHALLENGES.

2 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND COMMISSIONER RONEN.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN I'M NOT ON THE
5 COMMITTEE SO I'LL FOLLOW YOUR LEAD AND TAKE UP SOME TIME ON
6 ANOTHER COMMITTEE.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO THANK THERESE AND ALIX AND ALL THE
11 STAFF. BUT I WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT YOUR PROPOSAL THAT
12 YOU SEE BEFORE YOU IS -- WAS REQUESTED BY THE COMMITTEE.
13 COMMITTEE ASKED THE STAFF TO GO BACK, DO THE TRUE UP, AND ADD
14 AN EQUITY COMPONENT, WHICH THEY HAVE DONE. SO I THINK THIS
15 BEST ADDRESSES THE TRANSIT OPERATOR'S NEEDS AS BEST WE COULD.
16 AND TO GET, OUT OF 32 MEMBERS, 30 SAID THAT YES, GO FORWARD, I
17 THINK IS A REAL CONSENSUS, IF YOU NEED, OF GETTING THIS MONEY
18 ALLOCATED RIGHT AWAY. SOME OF THE ISSUES RAISED, I THINK NEED
19 TO BE ADDRESSED, IF MORE MONEY DOES COME TO THE REGION, WHICH
20 STAFF AND THE COMMITTEE HAS AGREED TO DO, NOTHING'S PERFECT.
21 BUT WHAT WE HAVE BROUGHT FORWARD IS VERY EQUITABLE, IT'S VERY
22 FAIR. IT MEETS SOME OF THE NEEDS THAT THE COMMITTEE REQUESTED,
23 AND SO I CERTAINLY URGE THE COMMITTEE TO GO FORWARD WITH THIS
24 RECOMMENDATION. AND MR. CHAIRMAN, JUST, YOU KNOW, I WANT TO
25 THANK ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS ON THE TASK FORCE. IT'S A REAL

Meeting Transcript

1 COMMITMENT. BUT I THINK A VERY ROBUST DISCUSSION, AND VERY
2 MEANINGFUL. AND I THINK JUST BRINGING EVERYBODY TOGETHER
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS TOGETHER A LOT OF VALUE IS COMING FROM WHAT
4 WE'RE DOING. I URGE GOING FORWARD AND GETTING THIS DESPERATELY
5 NEEDED MONEY OUT TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. THANK YOU MR.
6 CHAIRMAN.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING.
9 COMMISSIONER RONEN AND THEN COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

10

11 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. NORMALLY I DON'T REPEAT
12 COMMENTS OF MY COLLEAGUES WHEN I AGREE BECAUSE I DON'T WANT TO
13 TAKE UP THE TIME AND USUALLY MY COLLEAGUES EXPRESSED WHAT I
14 WOULD HAVE EXPRESSED BUT IN THIS SITUATION, I JUST WANTED TO
15 ECHO EVERYTHING COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND SPERING HAD TO
16 SAY. JUST REALLY WANT TO, YOU KNOW TIP MY HAT TO ALL OF YOU
17 WHO PARTICIPATED IN THE BLUE RIBBON PANEL, THIS HAS BEEN A
18 TREMENDOUSLY CHALLENGING TIME. AND JUST THE WAY THAT MTC HAS
19 HANDLED THIS HUGE CRISIS DESERVES A LOT OF COMMENDATIONS. I
20 JUST WANTED TO PERSONALLY EXPRESS MY THANK YOU TO EVERYONE.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN.
23 COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

24



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THANK YOU. LET ME START BY SAYING HOW MUCH I
2 APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK THAT WENT INTO THIS, TO ALIX'S
3 EARLIER COMMENT, I THINK THIS WAS A HEAVY LIFT IN A DIFFICULT
4 SITUATION TO GO THROUGH, AND THANK YOU TO ALL THE BLUE RIBBON
5 COMMITTEE MEMBERS ET CETERA I DO THINK, AT THIS POINT, YOU'RE
6 JUST ASKING FOR CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. SO I HAD A FEW
7 QUESTIONS, HAVING NOT BEEN ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE.
8 COULD YOU HELP ME UNDERSTAND, IN TERMS OF THE PROPOSAL THAT'S
9 BEFORE US, HOW -- WHAT ASSUMPTIONS WERE MADE WITH RELATIVE TO
10 WHAT WE SEE AS FAR AS RETURNING TO TRANSIT VERSUS PEOPLE
11 RETURNING TO THEIR AUTOMOBILES? I'LL JUST LAY OUT ALL MY
12 QUESTIONS ALIX AND THERESE. YOU MADE ADJUSTMENTS TO WHAT WAS A
13 CONSERVATIVE MODEL. YOU DID A LITTLE TWEAKING AND JUST TO HELP
14 ME OUT, WHAT DATA, WHAT WERE THOSE TWEAKS BASED ON? FOR
15 EXAMPLE, SALES TAX WHAT WAS THE SOURCE FOR DETERMINING THE
16 MOVEMENT AND PROJECTIONS ON THE SALES TAX AND HOW THE ACTUALS
17 WERE THEY ACTUALS AVAILABLE AND BRIDGE TOLLS. TO ALL THE
18 ITALICS, WHAT'S DATA KIND OF BEHIND THAT. AND THEN CHAIR, I
19 THINK THERE IS A RECOMMENDATION, ALSO, IF I UNDERSTAND
20 CORRECTLY, ALSO IN TERMS OF THE MEANS-BASED FARE PILOT DO WE
21 HAVE TO TAKE THAT SEPARATELY FROM ALL THE OTHER QUESTIONS? OR
22 HOW DO YOU WANT TO DO THAT?
23

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** CAN I ASK STAFF TO ANSWER -- TO GIVE
2 THEIR PERSPECTIVE ON WHETHER WE SHOULD TAKE THAT SEPARATELY,
3 THE MEANS-BASED FARE PILOT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS NOW IF YOU WOULD
6 LIKE DEPARTMENT WE --

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** DIDN'T WE TAKE QUESTIONS ON THAT IN
9 THE LAST MEETING.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** WE TOOK QUESTIONS ON PHASE ONE.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER.

14

15 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THE EXPANSION ARE THEY ASKING OPERATORS TO NOW
16 BE INCLUDED THIS'S ONE QUESTION AND THE OTHER THING IS THE
17 PILOT HAS TWO ELEMENT IN TERMS OF SET ASIDES THERE'S THE MTC
18 SET ASIDE WHICH IS ANSWERED CLEARLY BY DOING THE ONE PERCENT
19 FROM TRANCHE TWO THAT DEALS WITH THE SET ASIDE FOR MTC BUT
20 WHERE IS THE SET ASIDE BEING DONE FOR THE TRANSIT AGENCY POINT
21 OF VIEW GIVEN THAT WE'RE ALL KIND OF IN DIRE STRAITS IN TERMS
22 OF WHAT WE HAVE AVAILABLE TO US. SO I WOULD LIKE TO
23 UNDERSTAND, AGAIN, HOW ARE WE OPENING IT UP, YOU KNOW WHO HAS
24 ASKED FOR IT AND THEN WHERE DOES THIS SET ASIDE COME FROM AT
25 THE AGENCY LEVEL?

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I CAN START RESPONDING TO YOUR FIRST QUESTIONS,
3 PEOPLE RETURNING TO TRANSIT VERSUS AUTOMOBILES, I HAVE TO
4 ADMIT WE DON'T HAVE CLEAR INFORMATION ON THAT YET. WE DID USE
5 AS A BASIS FOR OUR DISTRIBUTION THE FISCAL YEAR 2019
6 INFORMATION. BUT OUR ASSUMPTIONS DO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THIS
7 IDEA AND THERE ARE VERY CONSERVATIVE ESPECIALLY FOR RIDERSHIP
8 ASSUMING THAT WE'LL STILL BE HAVING A 70 PERCENT DEGREE IN
9 FARE REVENUE GOING THROUGH THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR. SO AS
10 WE GET MORE FUNDING INFORMATION AND MORE ACTUAL DATA, WE CAN
11 ADJUST ANY FUTURE FUNDING AVAILABILITY BASED ON MORE ACTUAL
12 DATA. YOUR SECOND QUESTION ABOUT WHAT WERE THE TWEAKS TO
13 ASSUMPTIONS BASED ON. I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT BASIS THAT WE
14 LOOKED AT IN TERMS OF SALES TAX FUNDING, WE LOOKED AT WHAT
15 OPERATORS WERE ASSUMING THEMSELVES IN THEIR RECOVERY
16 STRATEGIES. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WOULD RECALL THIS IF YOU'RE
17 NOT ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE BUT WE DID ASK ALL OPERATORS
18 TO SUBMIT A TRANSIT RECOVERY STRATEGY TO US TO HELP INFORM
19 THIS DISTRIBUTION AND IN THAT INCLUDED A LOT OF ASSUMPTIONS
20 ABOUT WHAT THEY WERE ASSUMING ABOUT SALES TAX REVENUES AND
21 FARE REVENUES ET CETERA. SO WE FELT THAT OUR ORIGINAL
22 ASSUMPTIONS WERE REALLY AT THE KIND OF LOW END OF THOSE, AND
23 COULD BE ADJUSTED A LITTLE BIT TO BE JUST SLIGHTLY MORE
24 OPTIMISTIC. AND ALSO WE LOOKED AT WHAT MTC ITSELF, YOU KNOW,
25 ASSUMED IN THE BUDGET THAT WERE PRESENTED LAST MONTH AND WE

Meeting Transcript

1 JUST FELT THAT THE SMALL TWEAK IN THE ASSUMPTIONS WOULD BE A
2 LITTLE BIT MORE CONSISTENT WITH THOSE. MOVING ON TO THE MEANS-
3 BASED FARE, MAYBE I'LL ALLOW ALIX TO KIND OF WEIGH IN ON THIS,
4 BUT WE ARE CHECKING WITH OPERATORS TO ENGAGE INTEREST IN
5 JOINING INTO THAT PILOT PROGRAM. AS I MENTIONED THERE IS STILL
6 QUITE A FEW THINGS THAT NEED TO BE ADDRESSED BEFORE WE CAN
7 OPEN IT UP TO ANYONE. ENGAGING CURRENTLY AND THE STATE TRANSIT
8 ASSISTANCE AND TOP FUNDING FOR MTC'S SHARE OF THE SUBSIDY
9 TRANSIT OPERATOR SUBSIDY WOULD BE UP TO THEM TO SET ASIDE A
10 PIECE OF THEIR OWN BUDGETS FOR THAT AS WELL.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN. I WANT TO ADD ONE
13 THING IN PARTICULAR ON THE MEANS-BASED. YOU HAD ASKED WHETHER
14 THIS WAS REQUESTED OF US, AND WE DID RECEIVE A LETTER FROM THE
15 TRANSIT AGENCIES, ASKING FOR CERTAIN AREAS WHERE THEY REALLY
16 WANT LIKE TO SEE MTC'S ASSISTANCE AND ONE OF THEM WAS IN
17 SEEING AN EXPANSION OF THE CLIPPER START, THE MAINTENANCE
18 BASED PROGRAM. SO WE WERE DIRECTLY RESPONDING. WE HAD SOME
19 REQUESTS IN THE PAST ON THIS, AND WE REALLY DIDN'T TECHNICALLY
20 FEEL IT WAS FEASIBLE TO OTHERS AND TRYING TO GET PAST THAT
21 ROADBLOCK SO WE'RE TRYING TO RESPOND TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
22 WE HAVE ASKED FOR RESPONSE AND HAVE GOTTEN SIGNIFICANT
23 INTEREST FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THEY STILL NEED TO GO TO
24 THEIR BOARD BUT WE HAVE RECEIVED I WOULD SAY AT LEAST TEN
25 TRANSIT AGENCIES BUT I THINK IT'S MORE THAN THAT THAT HAVE

Meeting Transcript

1 EXPRESSED INTEREST IN EXPANSION AND ALSO IF YOU WILL INDULGE
2 ME, I WANT TO GO BACK TO A FEW THING THAT THERESE MENTIONED
3 AND HIGHLIGHT, IN THE QUESTION OF RETURN TO TRANSIT VERSUS THE
4 AUTOMOBILE I THINK ANOTHER THING WE HAD TO LOOK AT WHEN WE
5 WERE LOOKING AT FARE LOSSES IN OUR ASSUMPTIONS IN THE NEAR
6 TERM WE LOOK AT 90 PERCENT LOSS AND IN THE SUBSEQUENT PERIOD
7 WE HAVE A 70 PERCENT LOSS WE REALLY HAD TO CONSIDER THE SOCIAL
8 DISTANCING REQUIREMENTS AND THE LIKELIHOOD THAT WE AREN'T
9 GOING TO SEE A VACCINE DURING THIS PERIOD SO THE SOCIAL
10 DISTANCING REDUCES THE ABILITY FOR TRANSIT TO CARRY AS MANY
11 PASSENGERS AND THEREFORE AS MUCH FARE REVENUE. SO THAT WAS ONE
12 THING WE LOOKED AT AND I THINK ON THE SALES TAX, AGAIN, YOU
13 KNOW, THE CHALLENGES WE REALLY DON'T HAVE MUCH ACTUAL DATA,
14 BUT WE DID FEEL THAT BY BEING LOOKING AT A 45 PERCENT
15 REDUCTION FROM MARCH ALL THE WAY TO AUGUST, WELL PAST WHEN THE
16 SHELTER-IN-PLACE HAS PARTIALLY BEEN LIFTED, THAT THAT WAS
17 QUITE CONSERVATIVE AND THEN GOING INTO THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR --
18 SORRY, SEPTEMBER TO DECEMBER, THE 30 PERCENT REDUCTION WAS
19 QUITE A BIT MORE CONSERVATIVE THAN AGAIN WHAT MTC WAS LOOKING
20 AT IN ITS BUDGET AND BASED ON BRIAN HAVING REVIEWED A LOT OF
21 DIFFERENT DATA AS WELL, SO I JUST WANTED TO ADD THOSE
22 ADDITIONAL POINTS.

23

24 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** SO IN LIGHT OF WHERE WE ARE TODAY, AS FAR AS
25 SURGES, THAT ARE OCCUR OCCURRING AND SUCH, DO I STILL BELIEVE

Meeting Transcript

1 IN THE SALES TAX, THAT THAT IS STILL A FAIR ASSUMPTION TO BE
2 MADE GIVEN THE UNCERTAINTY THAT WE'RE IN?

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WE STILL BELIEVE THAT WE'RE APPROPRIATELY
5 BALANCING SORT OF THE UNCERTAINTY THAT'S OUT THERE, AND TRYING
6 TO BE CONSERVATIVE IN OUR APPROACH. BUT, AGAIN, I THINK WE
7 HIGHLIGHTED MANY TIMES THAT THERE IS STILL A LOT, YOU KNOW,
8 WE'RE ALL FACING A LOT OF UNCERTAINTY, AND I THINK THERE IS
9 ALSO AN OPPORTUNITY, AS WE HAVE NOTED, THAT THE OPERATORS DO
10 NEED ADDITIONAL FUNDING IF THERE ARE FUTURE FUNDING
11 OPPORTUNITIES, AND OBVIOUSLY WE WILL AGAIN BE LOOKING AT NEW
12 INFORMATION AS IT EVOLVES, BUT WE DO THINK THAT BASED ON WHERE
13 WE ARE TODAY THAT WE'RE BEING APPROPRIATELY --

14

15 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** CHAIR, IF I MAY ASK ONE MORE QUESTION. WHEN WE
16 LOOK AT ALL OF THESE, DO WE DO SENSITIVITY TESTING? SO IF I'M
17 HEAVILY RELIANT ON FARES IN TERMS OF UNDERSTANDING WHAT THAT
18 20 PERCENT ADJUSTMENT THAT YOU HAVE MADE YOU KNOW, FROM THE
19 MARCH, AUGUST, VERSUS SEPTEMBER TO DECEMBER, IN TRYING TO
20 UNDERSTAND, AGAIN, THE SENSITIVITY BASED ON HOW MUCH OF MY
21 REVENUE IS BASED ON ANY ONE OF THESE ELEMENTS WHERE WE HAVE
22 ADJUSTED FROM, AND AGAIN, FROM THE ORIGINAL TO BE TO BE
23 MODIFIED, HAVE WE DONE THAT SENSITIVITY TESTING?

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SAY IN A WAY WE HAVE. WE, IN THE DISCUSSIONS
2 WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE WE HAVE DEFINITELY LOOKED AT
3 OPERATORS MIX OF REVENUE, AND AS MENTIONED WE TRIED OUR
4 HARDEST TO MAKE SURE WE HAD AN APPROPRIATE BALANCE AND ENSURE
5 THAT ANY CHANGES THAT WE MADE DID NOT SWING ANYONE IN A REALLY
6 SIGNIFICANT WAY, BUT REPRESENTATIVE OF -- BALANCE.

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WANT TO ADD FARE REVENUE AND SALES TAX ARE
9 MAJOR DRIVERS HERE SO TO SENSITIVITY OF SWINGS AND UNKNOWNNS,
10 SALES TAX IS 35 PERCENT OF THE OVERALL TRANSIT OPERATOR
11 BUDGETS AND FARES AT ABOUT 30 PERCENT OR SO. SO THOSE ARE
12 REALLY THE MAJOR DRIVERS, AND I THINK AS YOU'RE POINTING OUT,
13 SOME SYSTEMS LIKE VTA ARE VERY HEAVILY RELIANT ON SALES TAX.
14 SO ANY ADJUSTMENTS OBVIOUSLY EFFECT THEM MORE ON THAT FRONT
15 AND CONVERSELY SOME OPERATORS ARE RELIANT ON FARE REVENUE, AND
16 SO THEN ANY SLIGHT ADJUSTMENTS THERE DO EFFECT THEM MORE. SO
17 IT REALLY IS A CHALLENGE AND WE TRY TO POINT THAT OUT TO THE
18 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE GOING IN THAT THERE IS SUCH DIFFERENT
19 MIXES OF REVENUES THAT THE OPERATORS RELY ON SO AGAIN WE TRY
20 TO UNDERSTAND THAT BUT IT IS A CHALLENGE GIVEN THE UNCERTAINTY
21 WE FACE AND THAT SOME OPERATORS ARE MORE RELIANT ON ONE
22 FUNDING STREAM.

23

24 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THANK YOU.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IS THAT DOES THAT
2 ANSWER ALL YOUR QUESTIONS COMMISSIONER BRUINS?

3

4 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** YEAH. I THINK I'M FINE.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO I HAVE
7 ANY OTHER COMMISSIONS WHO WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS? OKAY.
8 SEEING -- COMMISSIONER SPERING DID YOU PUT YOUR HAND UP AGAIN?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, I'M NOT SOMEBODY WHO WANTS TO
11 VOTE AGAINST THE ONE PERCENT. I RECOMMEND YOU TAKE IT IN ONE
12 MOTION THAT'S WHAT WE DID PREVIOUSLY. AND IT REALLY IS A
13 PACKAGE AND TO FOLLOW-THROUGH ON THE WORK THAT MTC IS GOING TO
14 DO. THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEA
17 COMMISSIONER SPERING. WOULD ANYBODY LIKE TO MAKE THAT MOTION?
18 COMMISSIONER WORTH? MAYBE -- COULD YOU TAKE YOURSELF OFF MUTE?

19

20 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO MAKE
21 THAT MOTION.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. DO I
24 HAVE A SECOND?

25



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** I'LL SECOND IT.

2

3 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. OKAY
4 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. AND A REMINDER THAT YOU
5 CAN USE THE RAISED HAND FUNCTION ON ZOOM OR YOU CAN PRESS STAR
6 NINE IF YOU'RE CALLING IN. I'M GOING TO -- WE -- I THINK WE'RE
7 GOING TO HAVE OVER 20 PUBLIC COMMENTERS. SO, IF THERE IS NO
8 OBJECTION FROM MY COLLEAGUES ON THE COMMITTEE, I'M GOING TO
9 ASK PUBLIC COMMENTERS TO LIMIT THEIR COMMENTS TO ONE MINUTE IF
10 THAT'S OKAY. DOES THAT -- KIMBERLY WHOM YOU CAN SEE ON YOUR
11 SCREEN WILL BE TIMING IT AND THERE WILL BE A PHONE TIMER THAT
12 WILL DING WHEN YOUR ONE MINUTE IS UP. KIMBERLY WOULD YOU LIKE
13 TO GO THROUGH THE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WE RECEIVED
14 FIRST?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. THERE IS QUITE A LIST. SO BAY AREA
17 WITH ME A MOMENT. FIRST IS AAI FROM CERRITOS -- ALAMEDA
18 CHAMBER OF COMMERCE THERE WERE TWO LETTERS SUBMITTED BY
19 MADELINE -- AND KATHY ADAMS ALLIANCE FROM THE GIRLS WRITTEN BY
20 -- ARUCHA. TWO LETTERS FROM AMERICAN FEDERATION OF STATE
21 COUNTY MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES FROM SOUTH CRUISE AND CITY OF D.
22 TWO LETTERS FROM BROTHERS OF LOCOMOTIVE ENGINEERS. MARK KENNY
23 AND DENNIS PIERCE. LETTER FROM CITY OF PALO ALTO WRITTEN BY
24 ADRIENNE FEIN CITY OF SAN CARLOS BY JEFF M, CITY OF SAN JOSE
25 BY MAYA ESPARZA. CITY OF SAN MATEO, JOE G, CITY OF -- RICHARD

Meeting Transcript

1 GARBARINO. CITY OF EAST OAKLAND DEVELOPMENT CENTER REGENA
2 JACKSON. FRIENDS OF FIVE TRAILS TERRY CHRISTIAN. INTERNATIONAL
3 FEDERATION OF TECHNICAL ENGINEERS STANLEY YOUNG. OAKLAND
4 CHAMBER OF COMMERCE ALLIE BOND. 15 LETTERS FROM NORTHEAST
5 MEDICAL SERVICES. SAN JOSE DOWNTOWN ASSOCIATION, SCOTT KENESE,
6 THREE LETTERS FROM SANTA CLARA VTA, NURIA FERNANDEZ. JANICE B,
7 NAFTEK. THREE LETTERS FROM SERVICE EMPLOYEES NATIONAL LOCAL
8 UNION 521 TAMMY, KAMI B, AND ROBIN GARCIA. LETTER FROM
9 INDIVIDUAL TEVERE KAUER, A LETTER SIGNED BY MULTIPLE TRANSIT
10 GENERAL MANAGERS. UNITED SENIORS OF OAKLAND AND ALAMEDA
11 COUNTY, CHINITA CHIU. UNITY COUNCIL CHRIS I. UC BERKLEY DAVID
12 S. PROFESSIONAL WOMEN'S ASSOCIATION OF SILICON VALLEY, WORKING
13 PARTNERSHIPS USA, AND THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS SUBMITTED
14 LETTERS. AARON M. BRENDON S, ROLAND L, AND YADWINDER B, ALL OF
15 THOSE LETTERS WERE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND WERE
16 RECEIVED BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU KIMBERLY. AND I WANT TO
19 THANK EVERYONE WHO WROTE IN TO INFORM THIS DECISION THOSE WHO
20 PARTICIPATED IN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE DISCUSSIONS. WE'RE
21 GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT STARTING WITH CALLER ENDING
22 6262.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS ROLAND. SO MY LETTER TOOK ME FIVE DAYS TO
25 WRITE. I WOULD APPRECIATED IF SOMEBODY COULD TAKE TIME TO READ

Meeting Transcript

1 T I WAS HOPING TO BE BEHIND THE PRESENTATION. AND THE REASON
2 IS WE JUST OPENED HALF OF OUR PROJECT TEN YEARS LATE FOR THREE
3 AND A HALF BILLION DOLLARS, AND WE ARE SERVING 350 -- SO THE
4 PER PASSENGER IS \$10 MILLION. EACH ISSUE IS WHAT'S CLEARLY
5 ESTABLISHED IN 2008, 2009, THE GRAND JURY REPORT AND I DON'T
6 HAVE TIME TO READ IT BUT IT'S ON BOTTOM OF FIRST PAGE OF MY
7 LETTER. SO IT WAS A SOLUTION. NURIA'S PRESENTATION, ONE OF THE
8 THREE HALF CENT TAX MEASURES IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY ANOTHER
9 12,000 MEASURE NOTHING STOPPING THE BOARD FROM APPROPRIATING
10 THE BOARD FROM THE TAX MEASURE TO TRANSIT CORPORATIONS THERE
11 IS ALSO 2016 MEASURE B CURRENTLY \$50 MILLION A YEAR, WHAT --
12 AND LET ME FINISH MY SENTENCE ONCE AGAIN THE BOARD HAS THE
13 AUTHORITY WITH 75 PERCENT OF THE BOARD'S OPERATING 100 PERCENT
14 OF TAX TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** CHAIR, IF I MAY INTERRUPT, THIS IS JEANNE.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OF COURSE.

21

22 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I BELIEVE FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE THAT
23 CHAIR SPERING HAD SAID ANYBODY WHO VOTED ON A BLOCK WOULD BE
24 ABLE TO HAVE TIME TO PRESENT. I WOULD ASK, CAN WE HAVE THEIR
25 PRESENTATIONS IF THEY ARE PLANNING TO SPEAK, COULD WE PULL

Meeting Transcript

1 THEM UP TO THE FRONT OF PUBLIC COMMENT SO THAT EVERYBODY HAS
2 THE BENEFIT OF WHAT THEY HAVE TO SAY? I BELIEVE THERE WAS TWO.
3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** ABSOLUTELY IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT
5 NO ONE HAD OPTED TO PRESENT, BUT STAFF MAYBE YOU WOULD BE MORE
6 UP TO DATE ON IT IF I MISUNDERSTOOD.

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN, I WAS TOLD BY VTA
9 STAFF THAT THEY WOULD -- THAT NURIA WOULD NOT BE PRESENTING.
10 I'M LOOKING TO SEE IF SHE HAS HER HAND RAISED AND IF ANYTHING
11 WAS CHANGED BUT THAT'S WHAT I WAS ALERTED TO YESTERDAY. SO
12 THAT'S WHAT WE WERE FOLLOWING.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** AND THE UNION REPRESENTATIVE ALSO WAS
15 NOT GOING TO PRESENT? ALIX? WHO VOTED TO BLOCK FROM THE TASK
16 FORCE.

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I DIDN'T HAVE FORMAL COMMUNICATION WITH HIM.
19 SO I'M NOT SURE ON THAT.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SO MAYBE I COULD JUST ASK, IF THERE IS
22 -- IF THERE IS ANYBODY FROM -- IF VTA WOULD LIKE TO PRESENT?
23 I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHAT -- HOW IT WOULD WORK OVER ZOOM. BUT --
24 KIMBERLY, HOW WOULD WE -- HOW CAN WE SORT OF SEE THEIR
25 PREFERENCES?

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WELL, I DO SEE THAT NURIA IS LISTED AS AN
3 ATTENDEE, HOWEVER HER HAND IS NOT RAISED. SO I WOULD ASK THAT
4 IF SHE WOULD LIKE TO PRESENT, SHE RAISE HER HAND NOW, AND THEN
5 WE'LL -- WE CAN CALL UPON HER THAT WAY. ON ALTERNATIVE SHE IS
6 E-MAIL ME IF SHE'S NOT ABLE TO RAISE HER HAND, BUT THAT WOULD
7 BE THE ONLY OPTION I CAN THINK OF.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SHE STILL HAS NOT RAISED HER HAND. SO MY
12 ASSUMPTION IS --

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO COMMISSIONER BRUINS, IF
15 SOMETHING CHANGES, MAYBE YOU CAN LET US KNOW AS WELL.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** NO. THANK YOU. I WAS NOT AWARE. I JUST HEARD
18 THE TAPE THIS MORNING SO I WAS NOT AWARE WHETHER THESE PEOPLE
19 WANTED TO SPEAK OR NOT SPEAK. BUT I WOULD NEUROLOGY --
20 ENCOURAGE THEM TO DO SO.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NURIA HAS RAISED HER HAND IF YOU WOULD
25 LIKE TO CALL ON HER, I'LL UNMUTE HER.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. YES NURIA.

3

4 **NURIA FERNANDEZ:** HI GOOD AFTERNOON TO ALL. AND THANK YOU VERY
5 MUCH. IT WAS NOT MY INTENT TO PRESENT. I THOUGHT THAT THE
6 LETTER I SUBMITTED WAS QUITE EXHAUSTIVE IN THE ISSUES THEY
7 HAVE BEEN RAISING, NOT ONLY ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, BUT
8 IN SUBSEQUENT CONVERSATIONS WITH MTC STAFFS. SO I JUST WANTED
9 TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO THANK THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE
10 AND THE GREAT WORK THAT ALL MEMBERS HAVE PUT INTO THIS EFFORT.
11 IT'S A VERY DIFFICULT SUBJECT WHEN IT COMES TO CARES ACT
12 FUNDING AND THE DECISION WE ALL MADE AS GENERAL MANAGERS WHEN
13 WE AGREED TO PROCEED WITH AN APPORTIONMENT THAT WAS DIFFERENT
14 THAN WHAT TRADITIONALLY WOULD HAVE BEEN APPLIED FOR FEDERAL
15 FUNDS COMING TO OUR REGION. IT WOULD ALSO -- IT WAS ALSO
16 IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT WHEN WE, AS GENERAL MANAGERS TOGETHER
17 WITH MTC MET BACK IN MARCH TOWARDS THE END OF MARCH, AND
18 AGREED -- STARTED DISCUSSING PRINCIPLES THAT THERE WAS AN
19 EFFORT TO JUST GET THE FUNDING ALLOCATED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE,
20 BUT A DECISION WAS MADE BY THE MAJORITY THAT IT SHOULD BE
21 BROKEN DOWN INTO TWO TRANCHES TO GIVE EVERYONE THE OPPORTUNITY
22 TO BE IN A PLACE WHERE WE HAD MORE ACCURATE INFORMATION THAT
23 IT WILL BE APPLIED TO THE SECOND TRANCHE GIVEN THAT THE SECOND
24 TRANCHE IS ALSO BASED ON FORECASTING, I THINK, IN HINDSIGHT,
25 IT WOULD HAVE BEEN EASIER JUST TO GET THIS DONE AND OVER WITH

Meeting Transcript

1 EARLY ON, BUT NONETHELESS, THE POSITION OF THE VALLEY
2 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY CONTINUES TO BE THE SAME REGARDLESS
3 OF WHAT THE FINAL DETERMINATION IS, AND THAT IS THAT WE SERVE
4 ESSENTIAL RIDERS, THE MAJORITY OF OUR RIDERSHIP IS INDIVIDUALS
5 WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT, AND THAT THEY ARE FULFILLING
6 ESSENTIAL OBLIGATIONS IN THIS COVID ENVIRONMENT. THEY DON'T
7 HAVE A CHOICE. THEY CAN'T WORK FROM HOME. AND WE ARE ALSO SO
8 DEPENDENT ON SALES TAX, THAT THE UNCERTAINTY OF OUR CURRENT
9 ENVIRONMENT DOES NOT GIVE US THE COMFORT THAT THE APPROACH
10 THAT HAS BEEN USED IS ONE THAT IS GOING TO BE HELPFUL TO OUR
11 RIDERSHIP, AND OUR ABILITY TO CONTINUE PROVIDING RIDERSHIP TO
12 THE STATEMENTS MADE PREVIOUSLY BY PUBLIC SPEAKER REGARDING THE
13 ABILITY OF OUR BOARD TO BE ABLE TO MAGICALLY TAKE FUND THAT
14 WERE VOTED BY SANTA CLARA COUNTY RESIDENTS TO BE APPLIED IN A
15 CERTAIN WAY AND TO DO SOMETHING DIFFERENT WITH THEM, I THINK
16 IT'S HIGHLY OPTIMISTIC. AND THAT CERTAINLY IS NOT A
17 RECOMMENDATION THAT STAFF WILL BE MAKING TO OUR BOARD. WE ARE
18 BASING OUR POSITION TODAY, AND WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT THE
19 FORECAST FOR THE FUTURE, GIVEN THE INFORMATION THAT WE HAVE,
20 JUST AS MTC HAS BEEN APPLYING SO FAR. ONCE AGAIN, I THINK THAT
21 -- I THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SAY A FEW WORDS. I WAS
22 PREPARED TO JUST MAKE CLARIFICATIONS AT THE END BUT I THINK
23 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT EVERYONE UNDERSTANDING THAT EVEN THOUGH
24 SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY MAY BE
25 JUST ONE OF THE PARTICIPANTS IN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AS A WHOLE HAS WORKED VERY
2 COLLABORATIVELY IT'S ALWAYS DIFFICULT WHEN IT COMES TIME TO
3 FUNDING TO MAKE DECISIONS WITHOUT BEING PAROCHIAL EVEN THOUGH
4 THESE DECISIONS THAT WE'RE MAKING HERE AFFECT NOT ONLY OUR
5 ABILITY TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO SOME OF THE OTHER TRANSIT
6 OPERATORS THAT COME INTO OUR COUNTY, BUT THEN OUR DECISION AS
7 TO HOW WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE PROVIDING FUNDING TO OUR OWN
8 SERVICES THROUGH OUR LIGHT RAIL AND OUR BUS SYSTEMS. SO I
9 THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF DISCUSSION WITHIN OUR
10 ORGANIZATION, AS WELL AS WITH OTHER OPERATORS THAT SERVE OUR
11 COUNTY ABOUT WHAT THIS FUTURE, WHAT COVID HAS DONE TO US, AS A
12 REGION, AND WHAT OUR -- WHAT OUR SIGHTS SHOULD BE PLACED ON AS
13 WE THINKING ABOUT THE FUTURE AND THE TYPE OF OPERATION AND THE
14 REACH OF OUR OPERATION AND SERVICES. IF THINGS DON'T START TO
15 TURN AROUND QUICKLY. I KNOW THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF
16 DISCUSSION ABOUT CLIFFS, AND IT'S PRETTY FRIGHTENING. BECAUSE
17 THAT CLIFF IS NOT JUST HAPPENING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, AT THE
18 REGIONAL LEVEL, IT'S HAPPENING NATION-WIDE. WITH COVID
19 FUNDING, CARES ACT FUNDING AND ALSO WITH OUR TRADITIONAL
20 FUNDING SOURCES THAT COME FROM THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT THROUGH
21 THE HIGHWAY TRUST FUND WHICH IS ALSO ON A CLIFF, SO THERE IS
22 GOING TO BE A LOT OF ISSUES THAT ARE GOING TO BE WEIGHING VERY
23 HEAVILY ON DECISIONS THAT ARE MADE BY MTC GOING FORWARD. I
24 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO JUST SAY A FEW WORDS. THANK YOU
25 VERY MUCH FOR INDULGING ME, AND I WILL -- THANK YOU FOR

Meeting Transcript

1 PUTTING ME BACK ON THE SCREEN. I WILL SIT BACK AND ACCEPT THE
2 DECISION OF THIS COMMITTEE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH GENERAL MANAGER
5 FERNANDEZ FOR THOSE COMMENTS AND FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT IN THIS
6 WHOLE PROCESS. OKAY WE'RE GOING TO BACK TO PUBLIC COMMENT. SO
7 DAVID WESSEL.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I'M DAVID WESSEL FROM SUNNYVALE. I OPPOSE THE
10 PROPOSAL BECAUSE I DON'T THINK IT GIVES VTA ENOUGH. VTA
11 PROJECTS A DEFICIT OF \$210 MILLION BY THE END OF THIS UPCOMING
12 FISCAL YEAR, AS WAS STATED DURING THE COMMENTS, VTA IS PERHAPS
13 THE MOST DEPENDENT ON SALES TAX REVENUE OF ALL THE AGENCIES.
14 IT RECEIVED ONLY A \$73 MILLION DISTRIBUTION IN THE FIRST PHASE
15 OF THE CARES ACT FUNDING, AND WAS THE ONLY AGENCY THAT DIDN'T
16 GET ENOUGH -- DIDN'T GET WHAT IT NEEDED. SO, FOR THOSE
17 REASONS, I OPPOSED PROPOSAL.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVID FOR THAT COMMENT.
20 LOUISA HAHN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE CAN.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** ALL RIGHT COOL. SO I'M 17 FROM LOS ALTOS AND SANTA
2 CLARA COUNTY AND I URGE THE PLANNING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
3 TO RECOMMEND THE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS NOT THE SOMEWHAT
4 OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS USED TO CALCULATE THE SECOND PAYMENT OF
5 THE CARES ACT FUNDING. THIS IS IMPORTANT TO ME BECAUSE MANY
6 PEOPLE IN OUR AREA RELY ON VTA OPERATIONS SPECIFICALLY LOW
7 INCOME AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT COMMUNITY MEMBERS SUCH AS
8 CAREGIVERS WORKING FOR SENIORS VTA REPRESENTS THE GREATEST
9 NUMBER OF THE VULNERABLE POPULATION COMPARED TO OTHER
10 AGENCIES.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU LOUISA FOR THAT COMMENT.
13 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR COMING TODAY. KATIE YOUNG I THINK IS
14 MAYBE -- IF I MISPRONOUNCED THAT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS KATY L. I AM 16 YEARS OLD AND PART OF THE
17 SILICON VALLEY YOUTH CLIMATE ACTION TEAM. I URGE MTC
18 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE -- SECOND PAYMENT OF THE
19 CARES ACT FUNDING LIKE LOSA SAID MANY ON VTA OPERATIONS MANY
20 ON LOW INCOME AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT COMMUNITY MEMBERS SUCH AS
21 LOW INCOME MEMBERS. MANY RIDERS ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND
22 POPULATIONS COMPARED TO OTHER LARGE AGENCIES SO IT IS
23 ESSENTIAL FOR VTA TO RECEIVE ITS FAIR SHARE OF FUNDING TO
24 CONTINUE PROVIDING SERVICES FOR THE SAKE OF EQUITY. THANK YOU
25 FOR YOUR TIME.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH KATIE. RACHEL WOO.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS RACHEL WU, AND I GO TO MILPITAS
5 HIGH SCHOOL IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. AND I AM 16. I AM ALSO PART
6 OF SILICON VALLEY YOUTH CLIMATE STRIKE AND I URGE THE
7 COMMITTEE TO CONSIDER THE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS NOT THE
8 SOMEWHAT OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS FOR THE SALES TAX PROJECTIONS.
9 SO THAT VTA WILL RECEIVE MORE FUNDING. AND THIS IS INCREDIBLY
10 IMPORTANT TO ME AS A LOWER INCOME STUDENT THAT FREQUENTLY
11 TAKES THE BUS TO AND FROM SCHOOL, THANKFULLY I DON'T HAVE TO
12 WORK DURING THIS TIME BUT I UNDERSTAND THAT MANY ESSENTIAL
13 WORKERS WHO ARE THE BACKBONE OF OUR ECONOMY AND THE BACKBONE
14 OF OUR LIVES RIGHT NOW THEY'RE THE ONES WHO WILL HAVE TO TAKE
15 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND DON'T HAVE THE OPTION TO WORK FROM
16 HOME, AND THIS TRANSIT DEPENDENT COMMUNITY MAKES UP 80 PERCENT
17 OF VTA RIDERS. I THINK THIS IS ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE
18 VTA SPECIFICALLY EXTREMELY DEPENDENT ON LOCAL SALES TAX WHICH
19 HAS TAKEN A HIT OF HISTORIC PROPORTIONS SINCE THE START OF THE
20 PANDEMIC SO THE AGENCY FORECAST DEFICIT OF 210 MILLION BY THE
21 END OF UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR THIS WILL AFFECT VULNERABLE
22 POPULATIONS AND SPECIFICALLY FOR THE VTA REGION. I AM
23 INCREDIBLY MOTIVATED BY THE PRIORITIZATION OF EQUITY BUT I
24 THINK THAT WE CAN DO BETTER IN THIS REGARD AND ALLOCATE MORE
25 FUNDING TO THE VTA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RACHEL FOR THOSE COMMENTS
3 AND THAT PERSPECTIVE. NEXT UP IS SOMEONE WHO IS SCREAM NAME IS
4 GAMALEO OF CALIFORNIA.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. SORRY ABOUT THAT. I SHARE MY ZOOM. THIS IS
7 ACTUALLY MARY LYNNE LAMPY. I'M EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF GENESIS.
8 IS MY AUDIO OKAY?

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE CAN HEAR YOU, YES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GREAT GENESIS IS A FAITH AND COMMUNITY-BASED
13 ORGANIZING GROUP LOCATED IN ALAMEDA COUNTY INCLUDING TRI-
14 VALLEY AND ALAMEDA WE'RE ORGANIZED AROUND PUSHING EQUITY IN
15 PUBLIC TRANSIT WE SEE THIS ISSUE AS A WAY TO DEMONSTRATE HOW
16 WE'RE TRULY INTERCONNECTED THIS IS IMPORTANT TO ME BECAUSE
17 DURING TIMES WE'RE NOT SHELTER-IN-PLACE I HAVE HIGH SCHOOL
18 STUDENTS WHO TAKE TRANSIT TO ACTIVITIES. COMMISSIONERS SHOWER
19 CONSISTENT IN THE WAY YOU CALL ON TRANSIT AGENCIES TO PROTECT
20 WORKERS AND RIDERS ARE AT THIS TIME ESPECIALLY THE MOST
21 VULNERABLE YOUTH SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES I KNOW
22 THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE DOING THEIR BEST TRANSIT IS
23 INTERCONNECTED AND I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE CONSISTENCY OF THE
24 STANDARDS I WANT BUILT IN ACCOUNTABILITY AND THE ABILITY OF
25 THE CARES ACT FUND THAT ALLOW THE AGENCIES TO DO WHAT THEY CAN

Meeting Transcript

1 TO ENSURE THE SAFETY AND HEALTH OF THE RIDERS AND WORKERS I
2 URGE YOU TO ALLOCATE TO AC TRANSIT THE PROPOSED \$33.8 MILLION
3 SO THAT THE DISTRICT CAN CONTINUE SERVING THOSE WHO MOST RELY
4 HEAVILY ON AC TRANSIT TO GET THEM THROUGH THIS PANDEMIC WE
5 ALSO URGE TO YOU PUSH FOR STANDARDS NOT JUST GUIDELINES FOR
6 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO THE RIDERS AND PARENTS LIKE ME WHO PUT
7 THEIR CHILDREN ON TRANSIT CAN BE CONFIDENT THAT THERE ARE SAFE
8 AND HEALTHY AND CLEAN VEHICLES SO WORKERS AND RIDERS CAN DO
9 WHAT THEY CAN I'M ALSO SPEAKING UP FOR LEADERS NO OTHER MEANS
10 OF TRANSPORTATION BEYOND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IT IS
11 DISAPPOINTING TO ME THAT YOU NEVER LIMIT THE COMMISSIONERS
12 COMMENTS BUT YOU ALWAYS LIMIT THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS AND THAT
15 PERSPECTIVE. MEGAN ROBELOWSKI.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** CRYSTAL.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MEGAN R, I AM A RESIDENT OF LOS GATOS AND
22 I WANT TO ECHO THE CONCERNS ABOUT THE SALES TAX PROJECTIONS
23 USED TO CALCULATE THE FUNDING ALLOCATION AND THE NEGATIVE
24 IMPACT THIS WOULD HAVE ON VTA. I THINK GIVEN WHAT WE HAVE
25 LEARNED FROM THIS PANDEMIC HOW IT WITH BE DANGEROUS TO BE TOO

Meeting Transcript

1 OPTIMISTIC IN PREPARATIONS WE HOPE THE SITUATION WILL IMPROVE
2 BUT WE HAVE TO BE PREPARED FOR THE NEGATIVE IMPACTS ON OUR
3 COMMUNITIES. A LOT OF RIDERS ON VTA THAT'S THEIR ONLY CHOICE
4 THEY DON'T HAVE THE OPTION TO GO BACK TO TAKING A CAR. SO CUTS
5 TO VTA BUDGET THAT MIGHT COME FROM NOT HAVING ENOUGH CARES ACT
6 FUNDING WOULD AFFECT RIDERS WHO HAVE NO OTHER OPTION AND THESE
7 ARE THE MOST VULNERABLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES ESSENTIAL WORKERS,
8 SENIORS, STUDENTS, AND YEAH THESE RIDERS ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT
9 AND NEED TO BE MOST PROTECTED DURING THESE TURBULENT TIMES WE
10 MUST NOT STIFLE THE MOVEMENT OF THOSE WHO RELY ON VTA. WE ASK
11 VTA RECEIVE THEIR FAIR SHARE SO THEY CAN CONTINUE PROVIDING
12 SERVICE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MEGAN FOR YOUR
15 COMMENTS AND YOUR PERSPECTIVE. NEXT UP IS SOMEONE WITH THE
16 HANDLE TEAMSTERS LOCAL 17.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES. GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS RICH V FROM LOCAL 70. I
19 REPRESENT THE BUS OPERATOR IN LAFTA AND LIVERMORE DUMBARTON
20 CONSORTIUM I AM URGING STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND TO APPROVE ALL
21 OF THE AGENCIES HAVE BEEN GREAT AS FAR AS PROVIDING PPE,
22 KEEPING OUR BUSES CLEAN AND DOING THE BEST THEY CAN TO KEEP
23 ALL OF OUR OPERATORS WORKING. SO, I WOULD PARTICULARLY LIKE TO
24 POINT OUT LAFTA WHICH HAS BEEN DOING HOSPITAL LEVEL CLEANING

Meeting Transcript

1 AND TAKING CARE OF OUR DRIVERS. I URGE COMMITTEES TO APPROVE
2 STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT COMMENT AND FOR
5 YOUR PERSPECTIVE. AND FROM YOUR MEMBERS. NEXT UP IS -- I MIGHT
6 MISPRONOUNCE THIS NAME. HOIAN TRUNG.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I AM WITH MOTHERS UP FRONT I LIVE IN SAN JOSE I URGE
9 THE COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND THE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS OF
10 CARES ACT FUNDING OVER 30 PERCENT OF BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERS
11 OF ESSENTIAL WORKERS ALMOST FIRST RIDERS COLOR 80 PERCENT ARE
12 TRANSIT DEPENDENT OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS SACRIFICING THOSE WHO
13 CAN LEAST AFFORD IT CUSTOMER SERVICE. EQUITY CONSIDERATION
14 WILL HAVE ZERO IMPACT IF MTC DOES NOT CHANGE ITS FORMULA TO
15 PROJECT SALES TAX REVENUE. ASSUMPTIONS ARE FAR TOO OPTIMISTIC
16 DURING THIS ECONOMIC DOWNTURN. VTA WAS OF THE ONLY AGENCY THAT
17 DID NOT GET MUST HAVE NUN IN THE FIRST CARES DISTRIBUTION YET
18 SUPPORTS HIGHER PERCENTAGE OF LOW INCOME USERS. RECOMMEND
19 CARES DISTRIBUTION FUNDING. THANK YOU.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR COMMENTS
22 ON AND THAT PERSPECTIVE. NEXT UP IS EUGENE BRADLEY.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. CAN EVERYBODY HEAR ME?

25



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS EUGENE BRADLEY FOUNDER OF SILICON VALLEY
4 TRANSIT USERS. I SUPPORT MS. FERNANDEZ LETTER TO VTA FOR THE
5 TASK FORCE. VTA IS DEPENDENT ON SALES TAX REVENUE FOR MOST
6 OPERATIONS FUNDING THIS IS FUNDING VOTER APPROVED NEXT PHASE
7 OF CARES FUNDING BASED ON OLD TIRED FORMULA DOES NOT DO VTA OR
8 ANY OTHER DECENT TRANSIT AGENCY THAT NEEDS SALES TAX REVENUE
9 ANY GOOD. I'M ONE OF THE PEOPLE THAT TAKES VTA MOST EVERY DAY
10 BUT NOT OFTEN NOW BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC I'M STAYING AT HOME
11 UNFORTUNATELY PEOPLE WHO RIDE VTA DON'T HAVE THAT OPTION. BY
12 NOT GIVING VTA PROPER FUNDING LIKE YOU DID IN THE FIRST
13 PAYMENT YOU BASICALLY TOLD THE VULNERABLE POPULATIONS AND
14 THOSE WHO CAN'T DRIVE A CAR THAT THEY DON'T WANT MATTER. SO
15 I'M STRONGLY URGING YOU TO USE THE CONSERVATIVE OPTION TO USE
16 THE SALES TAX CALCULATION AND BY NEED NOT BY FORMULA THAT
17 DOESN'T DO WELL IN A GLOBAL PANDEMIC LET'S MAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT
18 RIDERS MATTER APPROVE THE OPTION TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE GETS
19 WHAT THEY NEED NOT BY FORMULAS.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS TREMITA CHU, IF
22 I PRONOUNCED THAT CORRECTLY. HELLO? I THINK MAY BE STILL
23 MUTED. KIMBERLY? DO WE --

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I THINK SHE'S MUTED ON HER END. WE HAVE
2 UNMUTED MULTIPLE TIMES.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE NEXT CALLER
5 WHO HAS A SCREEN NAME ALEXIS.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS A LEXIC TAN A 14 YEAR RESIDENT OF SANTA
12 CLARA AND STUDENT AT SANTA CLARA HIGH SCHOOL. I AM A MEMBER OF
13 THE CLIMATE ACTION TEAM AND RECOMMEND THE CONSERVATIVE
14 ASSUMPTION ARES INSTEAD OF OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS FOR THE
15 SECOND PAYMENT OF THE CARES ACT FUNDING. THIS IS IMPORTANT
16 BECAUSE MANY PEOPLE IN THE AREA RELY ON VTA OPERATION
17 ESPECIALLY LOW INCOME COMMUNITY MEMBERS. VTA SERVES THE
18 GREATEST NUMBER OF THE VULNERABLE POPULATIONS COMPARED TO
19 OTHER LARGE AGENCIES SO IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT VTA RECEIVE ITS
20 FAIR SHARE OF FUNDING AND CONTINUE TO PROVIDING SERVICE. THANK
21 YOU FOR LISTENING AND I URGE TO YOU CONSIDER THE CONSERVATIVE
22 ASSUMPTION.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JASON BAKER.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK TODAY. MY NAME
2 IS JASON BAKER VICE PRESIDENT OF TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING
3 FOR THE SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP AND I THINK WHAT IS
4 MOST CLEAR FROM THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION ANALYSIS AND STAFF
5 PRESENTATION TODAY IS THERE IS SIMPLY ISN'T ENOUGH MONEY TO DO
6 WHAT WE NEED DO HERE WE KNOW HOW CRITICAL TRANSIT IS WE WILL
7 CONTINUE TO WORK HARD AT THE FEDERAL AND STATE LEVEL FOR MONEY
8 FOR BACKFILL BUT WE'RE WORKING ON MODEST ONE 8TH CENT SALES
9 TAX INCREASE COUNTY-WIDE TO FIND DEDICATED SOURCES OF
10 OPERATING FUNDS WE CAN'T PASS THAT MEASURE UNLESS IT'S PUT ON
11 THE BALLOT BY A NUMBER OF SUPERVISOR AND TRANSIT BOARDS BUT IF
12 WE CAN'T GET IT ON THE BALLOT WE BELIEVE THE PUBLIC WOULD VOTE
13 TO SUPPORT THE MEASURE IT WOULD BRING FUNDS TO CALTRAIN AND
14 HELP OTHER AGENCIES WHO NEED TO CONTRIBUTE SUBSTANTIAL FUNDS
15 TO CALTRAIN OPERATIONS. I HOPE ANY TRANSIT MEMBER OR BOARD OF
16 SUPERVISORS WHO HAS CONCERNS OF THE ALLOCATION WOULD HELP WITH
17 THIS IN TRYING TO GROW THE PIE TO FUND OUR REGION'S RAIL
18 SYSTEM THANK YOU STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR SERVICE
19 TODAY.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JASON AND ALSO THANK YOU FOR
22 THE SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP'S SERVICE ON THE BLUE
23 RIBBON TASK FORCE. AMY SERGEANT.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. UNMUTE. OKAY. I HAVE A SPEECH THAT SEVERAL
2 PEOPLE HAVE GIVEN ALREADY. SO I WILL SAY I URGE YOU TO GO FOR
3 THE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS RATHER THAN THE SOMEWHAT
4 OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS 80 PERCENT OF THE VTA RIDERS ARE
5 TRANSIT DEPENDENT INCLUDING ME, AND I HAVE BEEN BEHIND THE
6 WHEEL OF A MOTOR VEHICLE, BUT YOU REALLY DON'T WANT ME BEHIND
7 YOU BECAUSE I HAVE NO DEPTH OF FIELD VISION. THEN THERE ARE
8 THE LOWER INCOME MINORITY AND STUDENTS WHO ARE ALSO AFFECTED.
9 PLEASE IN YOUR OWN SELF INTEREST PLEASE CONTINUE TO FUND VTA
10 TO KEEP ME OFF THE ROADS. THANK YOU.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH AMY, FOR COMING
13 IN, AND FOR WAITING FOR THAT PERSONAL PERSPECTIVE. CATHY ADAMS
14 IS NEXT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I'M CATHY ADAMS
21 PRESIDENT AND CEO OF LOCAL AFRICAN AMERICAN CHAMBER OF
22 COMMERCE HERE TO SPEAK ON THE ITEM ON THE AGENDA REPRESENTING
23 MEMBERS OF OAKLAND FROM MOM AND POP WORKERS, AND EMPLOYERS
24 LIKE CO-OPS RELYING HEAVILY ON TRANSIT SERVICES TO ENSURE
25 EMPLOYEES ARE ABLE TO GET TO WORK EVERY DAY AND TO DELIVER

Meeting Transcript

1 CUSTOMERS WHO WANT ACCESS TO THEIR SERVICES. WE KNOW THAT THE
2 CURRENT PANDEMIC HAS DRASTICALLY IMPACTED BUSINESSES ACROSS
3 THE ECONOMY INCLUDING TRANSIT AGENCY. AC HIT HAS TAKEN A
4 TREMENDOUS FINANCIAL HIT DUE TO THE FOREGOING FARE COLLECTION
5 AND APPROXIMATELY LIKELY TO CONTINUE TO SUFFER FINANCIALLY DUE
6 TO THE REDUCED SALES TAX REVENUE. PROPOSED 33.8 MILLION BEING
7 PROPOSED FOR MTC TO ALLOCATE TO AC TRANSIT WILL PROVIDE A
8 LIFELINE TO THE SERVICE THAT WILL HELP SUSTAIN THE SERVICE FOR
9 THE FORESEEABLE FUTURE. THIS WILL HELP TO PRESERVE THE LEVEL
10 OF SERVICE THAT SO MANY OF OUR MEMBERS AND OUR MEMBERS'S
11 PATIENTS RELY ON TO KEEP OUR LOCAL COMMUNITY GOING. IF AC
12 TRANSIT DOES NOT RECEIVE THIS FUNDING, WE HEAR THAT IT WILL
13 REDUCE SERVICE LEVELS AND OUR LOCAL BUSINESS COMMUNITY THAT IS
14 ALREADY STRUGGLING AND IN DIRE STRAITS. IT'S CRITICAL TO KEEP
15 SERVICE RUNNING AC TRANSIT PROVIDES SERVICE IT OUR COMMUNITY
16 WHO RELY AND DEPEND ON THE SERVICE 74 PERCENT HAVE INCOMES OF
17 LESS THAN 54,000, 75 PERCENT OF PEOPLE WITH OCCUR 43 DON'T
18 HAVE ACCESS TO A CAR. THESE FUNDS WILL ALLOW US TO CONTINUE
19 SERVING THEM. I TRUST YOU WILL DO THE RIGHT THING IN
20 SUPPORTING THIS.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE COMMENT.
23 NEXT UP IS SAL CRUZ. GOOD TO SEE YOU SAL.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. HOW ARE YOU?

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WELL, GO AHEAD.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I AM SAL CRUZ PRESIDENT OF THE AMERICAN FEDERATION OF
5 COUNTY EMPLOYEES AT BART AND ALL LOCAL 2110 BART CHAPTER WE
6 SUPPORT MTC STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THE ALLOCATION OF THE
7 SECOND TRANCHE OF THE CARES ACT FUNDS CARES FUND SUGGEST A
8 LIFELINE AND WITH BART AND ITS SISTER AGENCIES AT THE BACKBONE
9 OF THE BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND ITS SIGNIFICANT
10 IMPACT ON THE ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT WE MUST MOVE FORWARD
11 EVEN IN THE FACE OF SO MANY UNCERTAINTIES ONE THING IS CLEAR
12 TO US WHEN THE RIDERS RETURN TO BART AND ITS SISTER AGENCIES
13 OUR LOCAL ECONOMY WORKERS PASSENGERS AND COMMUNITIES WILL
14 THRIVE TOGETHER FROM BART COLLECTIVELY REPRESENTING CLOSE TO
15 2500 BART WORKERS THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR HARD WORK ON
16 THIS VERY IMPORTANT ISSUE.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU SAL. HALEY CURRIER.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS HALEY C, POLICY ADVOCACY
21 MANAGER AT TRANSFORM AND A MEMBER OF THE BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY
22 TASK FORCE THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR ALL THE WORK DONE
23 THUS FAR. I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE COMMENTS MADE, AND
24 COMMENTS MISSING FROM THE CARES ACT PRESENTATION TODAY WORKER
25 AND RIDER HEALTH AND SAFETY IT NEEDS TO BE PRIORITY AS



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 COMMISSIONERS HAVE STATED AS MUCH IN THE PAST. I AM CONCERNED
2 ABOUT THE PROPOSALS SHARED AT THE LAST TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK
3 FORCE MEETING REGARDING HEALTH AND SAFETY FOR EXAMPLE, I HEARD
4 THAT OPERATORS COULD PROVIDE MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER IF
5 FEASIBLE AND I WANT TO KNOW WHAT DOES THAT MEAN. WHICH
6 OPERATORS ARE DOING IT? DO YOU AS COMMISSIONERS KNOW? HOW WILL
7 THE PUBLIC KNOW? YOU COMMISSIONERS HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO
8 PUSH A REGIONALLY CONSISTENT APPROACH TO THIS. RESULTS OF
9 PUBLISHED ON THE MTC WEB SITE I'M NOT ASKING -- CARES ACT
10 MONEY ONLY ON WHAT'S NEEDED AND TO ENSURE WHAT'S HAPPENING IF
11 HAND SANITIZER IS NOT BEING DISTRIBUTED BECAUSE OF BUDGET WE
12 NEED TO ADDRESS THAT. ARE YOU WILLING TO ASK ON HEALTH
13 REPORTING ON SAFETY MASKS AND BUSES AND -- MTC WEB SITE.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH HALEY FOR THE
16 COMMENTS AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE ON THE BLUE RIBBON
17 TASK FORCE. NEXT IS KARLA G.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS KARLA G, POLICY
20 ADVISE OR AT THE UNITY COUNCIL HERE ON BEHALF OF KRYSTA
21 IGLESIAC, PEOPLE RELY ON AC TRANSIT AND BART TO GET TO WORK
22 EVERY DAY. IT'S AN ESSENTIAL SERVICE AND CLIENTS COMMUTING TO
23 MOVE AROUND THE TRANSIT DISTRICT ARE ABLE TO DO SO WITHOUT THE
24 ADDITION OF FARES IN AC TRANSIT BUSES RIDERS, 75 PERCENT ARE
25 PEOPLE ARE COLOR 73 PERCENT LOW NUMBER AND MANY DON'T HAVE

Meeting Transcript

1 ACCESS TO A CAR. WE HAVE A PROGRAM CALLED DEVELOPMENT ACADEMY
2 TO TRAIN TRANSIT DEPENDENT COMMUNITY MEMBERS. WE SUPPORT STAFF
3 RECOMMENDATION TO HELP KEEP EMPLOYEES SAFE, HEALTHY, AND
4 EMPLOYED. WE HAVE SENT A MORE DETAILED LETTER OF SUPPORT.
5 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH KARL FOR THE
8 COMMENT. NEXT UP MACY LEE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS MACY LI, I'M 14 YEARS OLD AND A
11 STUDENT AT HOMESTEAD WHILE SCHOOL IN CUPERTINO. I URGE THE
12 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS
13 AND NOT THE OPTIMISTIC ASSUMPTIONS TO CALCULATE THE SECOND
14 PAYMENT OF CARES ACT FUNDING THIS IS IMPORTANT TO ME BECAUSE
15 SO MANY PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITY DEPEND ON OPERATION ESPECIALLY
16 THOSE WITH LOW INCOME THOSE WHO ARE ESSENTIAL WORKERS AND
17 SENIORS. IN COMPARISON TO OTHER LARGE AGENCIES VT SERVES THE
18 GREATEST AMOUNT OF THE VULNERABLE POPULATIONS VT MUST RECEIVE
19 ITS FAIR SHARE OF FUNDING FOR THEM TO CONTINUE PROVIDING THEIR
20 SERVICE THIS IS ESSENTIAL. THANK YOU.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MACY FOR YOUR PERSPECTIVE.
23 NEXT UP IS DON C.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON BEHALF OF SAN
2 MATEO COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION WE SUPPORT THE
3 STAFF DISTRIBUTION WE SUPPORT THE WORK OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
4 FORCE AND STAFF. I THINK IF ALL BUT ONE OR TWO AGENCIES AGREE,
5 YOU HAVE CONSENSUS. WHEN I LOOKED AT THE FINANCIAL CLIFF SIDE
6 IT SEEMS LIKE CALTRAIN COULD RUN OUT OF MONEY FIRST. THEY
7 DIDN'T ASK ME TO CALL TODAY AND COMPLAIN THEY ASKED ME TO CALL
8 TODAY AND SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND TO APPLAUD THE
9 WORK OF EVERYONE AT MTC I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO THE WORDS OF
10 JASON BAKER, THE BEST WAY TO FOR VTA TO FIND MORE MONEY IS TO
11 PLACE ONE PERCENT SALES TAX ON THE BALLOT THIS NOVEMBER TO
12 PROVIDE DEDICATED FUNDING FOR CALTRAIN. THANK YOU.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH DON. ED MULLINS.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** WONDERFUL. I REPRESENT HAYWARD CHAMBER OF COMMERCE
21 AND WE'RE EXTREMELY INTERESTED IN THE DISCUSSION THAT'S GOING
22 ON. AC TRANSIT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT FOR THE RESIDENTS OF
23 HAYWARD AND THOSE WHO ARE EMPLOYED IN HAYWARD TO GET TO AND
24 FROM WORK. SO VERY BRIEFLY WE SUPPORT THE AC TRANSIT

Meeting Transcript

1 ALLOCATION AS PROPOSED, MTC AND THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH BOB ALAN.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HIGH EVERYONE THIS IS BOB ALAN WITH VOICES FOR PUBLIC
7 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON TERMS OF
8 THE NOT HAVING ENOUGH RESOURCES I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO WHAT
9 PEOPLE SAID ABOUT THAT ALTHOUGH I WOULD ALSO SUPPORT WHAT
10 HALEY CURRIER MENTIONED IN TERMS EVER THE SCARCE DOLLARS FIRST
11 GO TO GUARANTEE THE HEALTH AND SAFETY OF RIDERS AND TRANSIT
12 WORKERS BECAUSE WON'T HAVE A RECOVERY IF PEOPLE AREN'T ON THE
13 SYSTEM SAFELY NOW OR DON'T FEEL THEY CAN GET ON A SYSTEM
14 THAT'S SAFE AS FAR AS THE DIFFICULT CIRCUMSTANCES WE FACE, AND
15 THE FINANCIAL CLIFFS WE HAVE ALL BEEN ON TRANSIT OPERATOR
16 BOARD MEETINGS LATELY, THAT REQUIRES LOOKING AT EVERYTHING,
17 PLANNED BAY AREA AS WELL AS PET PROJECTS EVERY TIME WE BRING
18 UP LARGE PROJECTS HOW WE'RE GOING TO PAY FOR THEM AT THE
19 REGIONAL LEVEL WE OFTEN GET PUSH BACK AS ADVOCATES WHETHER
20 IT'S THE OPEN AIRPORT CONNECTOR OR THE PROJECTS HALF A MILLION
21 PROJECT WE DON'T HAVE FUNDING FOR TO GO TO SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY
22 TO BE CONSIDERED WE NEED TO PUT EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE IN
23 TERMS OF PRIORITIES THAT MEANS GETTING MORE MONEY ON THE TABLE
24 WHICH A LOT OF ADVOCATES ARE TRYING TO GET FOR THE STATE
25 FUNDING ROUTE TO SHIFT FUNDS TO LOCAL OPERATIONS. AND FINALLY

Meeting Transcript

1 ON THE TASK FORCE ITSELF THERE IS A LOT OF GOOD WORK HAPPENING
2 I THINK ON THE TASK FORCE BUT THERE IS ONE GIANT PROBLEM ON IT
3 WE'RE NOT GETTING INFORMATION AS TASK FORCE MEMBERS IN A
4 TIMELY WAY WE GET THE PACKETS ON FRIDAY AT 5:00 P.M. TO WEIGH
5 IN ON A HALF BILLION DOLLARS ALLOCATION TO WEIGH IN ON AT 2:00
6 P.M. IT'S A STRUCTURAL PROGRAM THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. I
7 DON'T THINK YOU CAN TAKE WHAT'S COMING OUT OF THE TASK FORCE
8 AS SERIOUSLY AS IT OUGHT TO BE. I THINK IT'S A LOT OF GOOD
9 WORK BUT WE NEED A STRUCTURE. AND I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
10 YOUNG FOLKS WHO HAVE BEEN ON THE CALL TODAY. DURING A
11 DIFFICULT TIME IT GIVES ME HOPE AND OPTIMISM THAT THE YOUNG
12 FOLKS ARE ENGAGED. SO THANK YOU FOR THE WORK.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU BOB AND THANK YOU FOR THE
15 SERVICE ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND I WOULD CONSIDER YOU
16 ONE OF THE YOUNG FOLKS WHO CAME AND SPOKE. SO AT LEAST FOR THE
17 NEXT LITTLE BIT. NEXT UP WE HAVE THREE MORE CALLERS JUST TO
18 KIND OF LET EVERYBODY KNOW SO FAR. NEXT CALLER ENDING UP IN 35
19 -- I CAN'T SEE IT ANYMORE. 3512.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HELLO.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

24



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 HI MY NAME IS JAMES, CEO AND PRESIDENT OF RICHMOND CHAMBER OF
2 COMMERCE WE REPRESENT OVER 270 BUSINESS COMMUNITIES HERE IN
3 RICHMOND RANGING FROM SMALL MOM AND POP TO RESTAURANTS, LARGE,
4 AND SUPPLIERS AS LARGE AS COSTCO TO BLUE APRON. OUR MEMBERS
5 TRULY DEPEND ON AC TRANSIT SERVICE PARTICULARLY ESSENTIAL
6 WORKERS WE BELIEVE THIS IS CLOSELY TIED TO TRANSPORTATION AND
7 LIKE MANY BUSINESSES AROUND HERE AC TRANSIT ALSO HAS TAKEN A
8 TREMENDOUSLY HIT FINANCIALLY, AND BY -- IF THE FUNDING DOESN'T
9 HAPPEN IN AND DIMINISH SOME OF THE TRANSIT LINE IT WOULD
10 TREMENDOUSLY AFFECT OUR CITY SO I'M HOPING THE BOARD WOULD
11 REVIEW IT AND APPROVE IT AND WE WANT TO SUPPORT IT. THANK YOU.

12

13 >>NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
14 COMMENTS. ALETA DUPREE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
17 RECORD. THIS IS VERY, VERY IMPORTANT AND WE'RE NOT QUITE DONE
18 YET. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE APPROVE THIS ITEM AND MOVE IT
19 TO THE COMMISSION AS IT IS REGIONAL IN NATURE. AND I AM A USER
20 OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE, AS YOU ALL
21 KNOW. I DID SEE THE MENTIONS ABOUT FUNDING FOR CLIPPER, AND
22 THE RTC DISCOUNT PROGRAM OF WHICH I AM A USER OF BOTH OF THOSE
23 PROGRAMS AND IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT WE KEEP THOSE OPERATING. IT
24 IS MUCH BETTER TO KEEP YOUR MONEY IN A CREDIT UNION THAN IN A
25 COFFEE CAN. CLIPPER MUST BE PRESERVED. SOME MAY NOT WALK AWAY

Meeting Transcript

1 HAPPY BUT THERE ISN'T ENOUGH MONEY TO GO AROUND. I THINK WE
2 HAVE DONE OUR BEST TO TRY TO SPREAD IT AS EVENLY AS WE CAN,
3 AND I ASK THAT WE MOVE FORWARD AND GET THIS TO THE COMMISSION.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH A LIT A ALLIE
7 BOND.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI I AM ALLIE BONDY PUBLIC POLICY DIRECTOR FOR THE
10 OAKLAND CHAMBER OF COMMERCE WE REPRESENT A THOUSAND BUSINESSES
11 IN OAKLAND I WANT TO REITERATE KEY POINTS KATHY ADAMS SPOKE
12 ABOUT AC TRANSIT TO OAKLAND. BUSINESSES OF ALL SIZE SAYS
13 RELIES ON THE SAFE AND RELIABLE SERVICE THAT TRANSIT PROVIDES
14 TO HELP CUSTOMERS GET TO AND FROM. AC TRANSIT HAS TAKEN A HIT
15 BY FOREGOING FARE COLLECTION AND WE'LL LIKELY TO CONTINUE TO
16 SUFFER FINANCIALLY DUE TO SALES TAX REVENUE. WE WILL HAVE TO
17 REDUCE SERVICE LEVELS IN OUR LOCAL ECONOMY IT'S ALREADY
18 STRUGGLING. I TAKE AC TRANSIT TO AND FROM WORK EVERY DAY AND
19 MY UNCLE WHO IS A LEGALLY BLIND SENIOR CITIZEN RELIES ON
20 TRANSIT FOR EVERY ASPECT OF HIS DAILY LIFE AND I WANT TO
21 REITERATE WHO THESE FUNDS WILL BE SERVING AC TRANSIT SERVES
22 THOSE WHO ARE 75 PERCENT WHO HAVE INCOMES UNDER \$50,000 A YEAR
23 75 PERCENT ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR AND 43 PERCENT DON'T HAVE
24 ACCESS TO A CAR. THESE FUNDS WILL HELP AC TRANSIT TO CONTINUE
25 TO PROVIDE THESE SERVICES TO MOST IN NEED. THANK YOU.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALLIE. THAT IS END OF OUR
3 PUBLIC COMMENT. SO, I THINK IF I REMEMBER RIGHTLY FROM A LONG
4 TIME AGO, WE DO HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. IS THAT CORRECT
5 KIMBERLY?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS CORRECT. MOTION WAS MADE BY WORTH,
8 SECOND BY GLOVER.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER BRUINS, IS THAT YOUR HAND
11 UP?

12

13 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THAT IS MY HAND UP AND IF I MAY I WOULD LIKE
14 TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS BEFORE WE CALL FOR THE VOTE.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OF COURSE.

17

18 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** FIRST OF ALL, I APPRECIATE THE TIME AND ENERGY
19 AND DISCUSSIONS THAT HAVE GOTTEN US THIS FAR THIS HAS NOT BEEN
20 EASY FOR THOSE INVOLVED. FUNDS ARE NOT SUFFICIENT AND WE ALSO
21 KNOW WE NEED TO GET FUNDS INTO THE HANDS OF TRANSIT AGENCIES
22 AS SOON AS POSSIBLE WITH THAT SAID I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE
23 COMMENTS AND A FEW ASKS. TRANSIT AGENCIES RELIANT ON VERY --
24 THEIR RELIANCE ON REVENUE LIKES ON RESPECT TO REVENUE FARES,
25 PARKING SALES TAX TOLLS ET CETERA. IN NORMAL TIMES, I THINK WE

Meeting Transcript

1 COULD AGREE THAT IT IS CRITICAL TO ACCURATELY ASSESS THE
2 IMPACTS OF CHANGES IN FUNDING FORMULAS WERE THEY TO BE MADE
3 BUT THESE ARE NOT NORMAL TIMES WE CAN'T ACCURATELY PROJECT
4 WHAT LIES AHEAD AND WE KNOW THERE IS NOT ENOUGH FUNDS.
5 THEREFORE WE NEED TO RELY ON SOME LEVEL OF CONFIDENCE THAT WE
6 NEED TO BE ATTENTIVE THAT WE'RE DOING NO HARM TO TRANSIT
7 DEPENDENT PEOPLE. WE NEED TO ASSESS HOW PROPOSED RESULTS DEAL
8 WITH EQUITY FOR TRANSIT DEPENDENT PERSONS HOW DOES THE
9 PROPOSAL IMPACT THE WORKING POOR ELDERLY STUDENTS AND
10 PARATRANSIT AS WE KNOW WHEN WE MOVE INTO THE FALL THERE IS
11 CALL FOR OPENING UP OUR SCHOOLS THAT'S GOING TO CHANGE THE
12 DYNAMIC FOR MANY OF OUR AGENCIES AS MENTIONED EARLIER AS WE
13 CARRY STUDENTS TO THEIR SCHOOLS WHETHER IT BE AT THE JUNIOR
14 HIGH, HIGH SCHOOL, OR COLLEGE LEVEL. WHILE VTA HAS VOICED
15 THEIR CONCERN AND PROVIDED SALES TAX PROJECTIONS BASED ON UCLA
16 STUDIES THEY MAY NOT BE THE ONLY AGENCY FOR WHICH A SENSITIVE
17 STUDY IS WARRANTED. LOOKING AT THE LARGE TRANSIT AGENCIES SOME
18 SEE THE PROPOSAL BEFORE US SOME SEE FOUR PERCENT DECREASE
19 BETWEEN WHAT WAS THE CONSERVATIVE ESTIMATE AND WHAT WAS BEFORE
20 US. WHILE AT LEAST ONE SEES A FOUR PERCENT INCREASE. I SAY IT
21 IN THOSE TERMS BECAUSE WHEN THE PRESENTATION GOT UPDATED ON
22 THE WEB SITE THROUGH OUR LEGISLATE, ALL MY NOTES DISAPPEAR
23 WHEN A PRESENTATION IS REPLACED. SO ONE QUESTION I WOULD ASK,
24 IN ADDITION TO THE SENSITIVITY TRAINING, COULD WE AT LEAST
25 ALSO LOOK AT THESE EXTREMES TO CONSIDER WHETHER OR NOT THERE

Meeting Transcript

1 IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR SMOOTHING THEM OUT A LITTLE BIT. BOTTOM
2 LINE, I BELIEVE WE ARE CLOSE, BUT I DON'T THINK WE'RE QUITE
3 THERE YET, AND I THINK MY UNCERTAINTY IF THAT WOULD GO AWAY IF
4 WE DID SOME OF THE SENSITIVITY. IT IS MY HOPE THAT ADDITIONAL
5 TUNING MAY TAKE PLACE BETWEEN NOW AND THE MTC MEETING. I
6 BELIEVE THIS IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT MY COLLEAGUE DAVE CORTESE
7 ASKED FOR AT THE LAST TASK FORCE MEETING. AND I HOPE THAT
8 WOULD BE INFORMED TUNING THAT BEING TAKE PLACE. ADDITIONAL E
9 AS WE MOVE THIS THING FORWARD, I WOULD ASK THAT IN THE MTC
10 MEETING, THAT THE PROPOSAL, WHETHER IT'S THIS ONE IN ITS
11 CURRENT FORM OR SLIGHTLY REFINED HELPS US AS COMMISSIONERS TO
12 UNDERSTAND HOW THEY ARE ACHIEVING THE STABILIZATION WHICH IS
13 ONE OF OUR GOALS, RESPONSE TO TRANSIT AGENCIES NOT JUST IN
14 AGGREGATE AND THE IMPACT ON THE AGENCY'S ABILITY TO SERVE OUR
15 MOST VULNERABLE USERS. I WOULD ALSO ASK THAT IF WE CAN, MAYBE
16 MTC CAN CHECK IN WITH THEIR FIRM, WHERE THEY GOT THEIR SALES
17 TAX PROJECTIONS AS WELL AS THE OTHER AGENCIES WHO ARE HEAVILY
18 DEPENDENT ON SALES TAX CAN DO A CHECK IN AND COMPARE NOTES. SO
19 WITH THAT, I THINK THIS DOES NEED TO MOVE FORWARD TO THE MTC,
20 I WOULD ASK THAT THE MOTION REFLECT SOME OF THIS REQUEST FOR
21 INFORMATION AND ALSO I LOOK AT THE SENSITIVITY AND MAYBE
22 SMOOTHING OUT IF THERE IS ADDITIONAL TUNING THAT IS WARRANTED.
23 THANK YOU.

24

25 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I THINK I'M A COHOST SO I
3 DON'T HAVE A HAND. I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR THEIR
4 COMMENTS. I SUPPORT THE MOTION, OBVIOUSLY MAKING IT. I WANT TO
5 ADD A COUPLE OF COMMENTS AS THIS MOVES FORWARD TO THE
6 COMMISSION, IN ANTICIPATION, AND AS WE FURTHER OUR WORK. FIRST
7 OF ALL, I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY WHO COMMENTED ON
8 THIS MATTER. I WANT TO ESPECIALLY THANK THE YOUNG PEOPLE WHO
9 WEIGHED IN. THIS IS ONE OF THE ADVANTAGES OF HAVING A ZOOM
10 FORMAT, THEY CAN PARTICIPATE. NORMALLY THEY WOULD BE IN SCHOOL
11 OR DOING OTHER THINGS AND WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO WEIGH IN. I ALSO
12 WANT TO THANK THE OPERATORS. I THINK THIS IS A HUGE
13 CHALLENGING PROBLEM SERVING ON THE BOARD OF A TRANSIT AGENCY.
14 I SEE FIRSTHAND THE CHALLENGES THAT ALL THE AGENCIES ARE
15 FACING. EVERYBODY IS LOOKING INTENSELY AT SALES TAX REVENUE,
16 AND REALIZING THAT TRANSIT IS HEAVILY DEPENDENT UPON FARES AND
17 SALES TAX -- TAX FOUNDATIONALLY NOT JUST LOCALLY BUT STATE
18 FUNDS TOO. I WANT TO THANK THE OPERATORS FOR WORKING TOGETHER
19 ON THIS AND COMING TOGETHER FOR A RECOMMENDATION. CLEARLY
20 THERE IS NOT ENOUGH MONEY TO DEAL WITH THE ISSUES THAT WE'RE
21 FACING. I THINK OUR ADVOCACY EFFORTS ARE GOING TO BE
22 ESPECIALLY CRITICAL. I AM GRATEFUL FOR SPEAKER PELOSI FROM THE
23 UNITED STATES CONGRESS FOR MAKING SURE THAT THIS FIRST
24 ALLOCATION OF FUNDING TO KEEP TRANSIT AFLOAT HAS COME INTO
25 COMMUNITIES AND WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO ALLOCATE THESE

Meeting Transcript

1 SIGNIFICANT FUNDS. BUT I DO BELIEVE THAT WE HAVE TO BE DILL --
2 WE HAVE GOT TO GO TO THE STATED, WE HAVE GOT TO GO BACK TO THE
3 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT FOR ANOTHER INFUSION OF FUNDS BECAUSE THOSE
4 GRAPHS THAT SHOT FINANCIAL CLIFF FOR ALL OF OUR TRANSIT
5 AGENCIES ARE PARTICULARLY COMPELLING AND I FEEL ALL OF OUR
6 TRANSIT AGENCIES SERVE POPULATIONS THAT DEPEND EVERY DAY ON
7 THESE BUSES RUNNING. I WANT TO COMMENT AND ADD I KNOW THE
8 CENTER FOR SIGNIFICANT LIVING COMMENTS CAME FOR THE BATA
9 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE BUT WANT TO NOTE THEY WERE SPEAKING TO THE
10 COMMITTEES BEFORE THIS ISSUE IN TERMS OF THE ALLOCATION AND
11 HOW IMPORTANT IT IS PARTICULARLY TO COMMUNITIES LIKE THE
12 DISABLED COMMUNITY. AND PROVIDING ON TRANSIT ACCESS TO
13 INDIVIDUALS WHO PREVIOUSLY DIDN'T HAVE THAT MOBILITY AND THE
14 OTHER ISSUE COMMENTING ON THE COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON THE
15 RIDER PERCENT AND OPERATOR SAFETY AND THE WORKER'S SAFETY
16 PROTOCOLS I KNOW WE DISCUSSED THIS AT LENGTH OF THE TASK
17 FORCE, AND I AGAIN APPRECIATE THE OPERATORS COMING TOGETHER
18 AND BRINGING BACK TO US FOR SORT OF FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS THAT
19 WE CAN INCORPORATE AND THAT THE OPERATORS CAN EMBRACE AND WE
20 CAN HAVE A REASSURANCE REGION WIDE TO OUR RIDERS AND THE
21 WORKERS THAT THESE SAFETY PROTOCOLS WILL BE ADOPTED AND ARE IN
22 PLACE. AND I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO CONTINUE THAT
23 CONVERSATION. AND I KNOW WE'RE MEETING ON THE 20th, AND LOOK
24 FORWARD TO GETTING THOSE, YOU KNOW, RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE
25 OPERATORS AND THE COMMUNITIES. SO THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORK.
3 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR I WANT TO AGREE WITH MY FELLOW
6 COMMISSIONERS ON HOW DIFFICULT THIS HAS BEEN BUT ASSURE THE
7 PUBLIC THAT WE ARE COMMITTED TO TRYING TO GET MORE FUNDING
8 THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS, AND ALSO TO AID THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
9 MOVING FORWARD HERE, WHETHER IT'S PARTNERSHIPS OR PUBLIC,
10 PRIVATE, OR WHATEVER WE CAN DO TO HELP THESE AGENCIES SURVIVE.
11 IT IS DRAMATIC TO SEE THE CLIFFS AHEAD. THERE IS NO DOUBT
12 ABOUT THAT. I DO WANT TO THANK ALL THE PUBLIC THAT
13 PARTICIPATED IN THIS PROCESS. WE HAVE LOOKED AT EVERY COMMENT
14 THAT HAS COME IN, AT LEAST I HAVE, AND WE'RE TAKING THIS VERY
15 SERIOUSLY. BEING A PART OF THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION WE'RE
16 LOOKING TO MAKE SIGNIFICANT CHANGES MOVING FORWARD TO MAKE
17 TRANSPORTATION NOT ONLY SAFE FOR EVERYONE BUT ALSO MORE
18 EFFICIENT AND CONNECTED AND COORDINATED. SO, I KNOW THIS IS
19 DIFFICULT. WE'RE DOING THE BEST WE CAN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
20 MR. CHAIR.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
23 COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY.

24

Meeting Transcript

1 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO CONGRATULATE
2 THE COMMITTEE ON HOW GOOD A JOB I THINK THEY HAVE DONE BUT I
3 ALSO WANT TO PROP UP WHAT HALEY COURIER TALKED ABOUT AND
4 THIS'S SAFETY. IT DOES NO GOOD TO HAVE BART SPRAYING THEIR
5 TRAINS EVERY NIGHT AND THEN HAVING A BUS THAT'S COMING IN TO
6 BRING THE PEOPLE IN FROM THEIR LAST MILE AND THAT BUS HASN'T
7 BEEN CLEANED IN THREE OR FOUR DAYS. I BELIEVE WE NEED SOME
8 SORT OF STANDARDIZED PROCESS GOING FORWARD. I CERTAINLY HAVE
9 NO PROBLEM WITH MTC HEARING IT ONCE A MONTH AS SHE WAS ASKING
10 ABOUT, BUT AS THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE TENDS TO MOVE FORWARD
11 THIS'S GOING TO BE PARAMOUNT TO ME, RIDER SAFETY, DRIVER
12 SAFETY, I HAVE SEEN PLEXIGLASS AROUND THE DRIVERS THESE ARE
13 ALL THINGS WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT BUT WE NEED TO KEEP TRANSIT
14 SAFE OR PEOPLE WILL ABANDON IT.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR HAGGERTY. AND I ALSO,
17 ON THE HEALTH AND SAFETY ISSUE I THINK WE NEED TO AT LEAST
18 ESTABLISH MINIMUM STANDARDS NOT EVERYBODY HAS TO DO THE SAME
19 CLEANING WITH THE EXACTLY THE SAME PRODUCTS IN THE EXACT SAME
20 WAY BUT WE GOT TO HAVE STANDARDS. CHAIR HAGGERTY IS RIGHT. WE
21 ARE A SYSTEM AND THE PANDEMIC HAS REMINDED US OF THAT SO
22 POWERFULLY THAT WE'RE ONLY AS STRONG TOGETHER AS OUR WEAKEST
23 AND MOST VULNERABLE POPULATIONS ARE. OKAY. SO I HAVE A MOTION
24 AND A SECOND ON THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. AND SO IF THERE ARE
25 NO OTHER COMMENTS, I'LL GO TO ROLL CALL VOTE.

Meeting Transcript

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. [ROLL CALL]

3

4 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I'M GOING TO VOTE AYE BUT WANT TO SEE MORE
5 DISCUSSION GOING ON BETWEEN THE PARTIES TO SEE IF WE CAN
6 SMOOTH THIS OUT A LITTLE BIT MORE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, FIRST I
13 WANT TO THANK THE PUBLIC FOR THEIR COMMENTS. IT REALLY
14 HIGHLIGHTS THE CHALLENGE THAT WE'RE ALL PHASE WITH AND THE
15 DIFFICULTY OF THIS DECISION THAT'S MADE. VERY MUCH
16 APPRECIATED. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE THAT THIS PROPOSAL DOES
17 SERVE RIDERS ALL OVER THE REGION. WHEN YOU START MOVING MONEY
18 AROUND SOMEBODY'S GOING TO BE IMPACTED. SO THERE IS A LOT OF
19 GOOD THAT'S HAPPENING HERE. CHALLENGE THAT VTA HAS, THE
20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN AND ALIX BOCKELMAN ARE
21 VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THIS AND WE'RE LOOKING AT WHAT ARE SOME
22 OPPORTUNITIES WE MIGHT HAVE TO HELP OPERATORS THAT ARE IN THAT
23 SITUATION SO IT'S NOT JUST BEING IGNORED. IT'S A CONCERN, AND
24 WE'RE ALL ACTIVELY LOOKING AT ADDITIONAL REVENUES. BUT THAT
25 ISSUE HAS TO BE ADDRESSED. I JUST WANT TO SAY SOMETHING ABOUT



July 8,

2020

Meeting Transcript

1 THE COMMENTS ABOUT THE REPORTS GETTING TO EVERYBODY LATE. YOU
2 KNOW, WE'RE RECEIVING A LOT OF INFORMATION LATE, AND WE'RE
3 PUTTING THIS STUFF OUT AS FAST AS WE CAN. WE'RE HOPING THAT
4 MAYBE WE'RE GOING TO GET A LITTLE BIT MORE LAG TIME BETWEEN
5 WHEN THE INFORMATION GOES OUT AND WHEN WE HAVE THE NEXT
6 MEETING. LAST POINT I WANTED TO MAKE IS THAT THE BLUE RIBBON
7 COMMITTEE HAS ASKED THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TO GIVE US A REPORT
8 AT EVERY ONE OF OUR MEETINGS AS TO WHAT THEY'RE DOING WITH THE
9 HEALTH AND SAFETY PROTOCOLS AND HOW THEY'RE PROVIDING THAT
10 SERVICE FOR BOTH THE EMPLOYEES OF THE SYSTEM AND THE RIDERS. I
11 AGREE WITH CHAIR HAGGERTY, WE HAVE GOT TO HAVE SOME MINIMUM
12 STANDARDS THAT EVERYBODY CAN COUNT ON AND THE BLUE RIBBON
13 COMMITTEE WILL ADDRESS THOSE ISSUES. BUT YOU KNOW, WHAT'S
14 BEFORE US IS SERVING A LOT OF TRANSIT DEPENDENT OPERATORS, AND
15 WE ARE VERY SENSITIVE TO WHAT VTA, THE CONCERNS THEY'RE
16 RAISING SO IT'S NOT GOING UNNOTICED. THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. OKAY.
19 MOVING ON TO ITEM 4C. TRANS-- TRANSPORTATION FUNDING AND
20 HOUSING LINKED CONSENSUS COMMISSIONER TO LINK FUNDING TO
21 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS TO IMPROVEMENTS IN HOUSING
22 OUTCOMES. I'M CONSCIOUS THAT IT'S 1:05, AND I WOULD -- I CAN -
23 - I CAN CONTINUE FOR A FEW -- YOU KNOW, FOR AS LONG AS THIS
24 ITEM IS NEEDED, BECAUSE THIS IS THE LAST ITEM BUT I JUST
25 WANTED -- A SUBSTANTIVE ITEM, BUT I WANT TO ASK MAY FELLOW

Meeting Transcript

1 COMMISSIONERS WHETHER THEY WANT TO CONTINUE THIS ITEM OR TAKE
2 IT NOW BASED ON HOW LATE THIS MEETING HAS GONE ON.

3

4 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** MY PREFERENCE WOULD BE TO CONTINUE THIS ITEM
5 BECAUSE I TOO NEED TO STEP OUT. I THINK YOU'RE GOING TO LOSE
6 YOUR QUORUM.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** I WILL AGREE WITH THAT.

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** IF WE'RE GOING TO LOSE THE
11 QUORUM WE MIGHT AS WELL SAVE THE CONVERSATION.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE HAVE WAITED A WHILE FOR THIS ONE
14 BUT I GUESS WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO WAIT ONE MONTH MORE.

15

16 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** HOW LONG WILL IT TAKE?

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** HOW LONG IT WILL TAKE ALIX?

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK WE CAN MAKE A QUICK PRESENTATION. I
21 THINK IT'S JUST A MATTER OF WHETHER YOU -- THE COMMISSIONER
22 FEEL WHETHER WE HAVE PROPERLY CAPTURED AND TO MEMORIAL LIES
23 WHAT YOU TALKED ABOUT AT YOUR WORKSHOP. SO IT'S SORT OF UP TO
24 YOU.

25

Meeting Transcript

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** CHAIR HAGGERTY?

2

3 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'M FINE WAITING, MR. CHAIR, I CAN BE
4 DEPUTIZED IF IT'S A QUORUM ISSUE, AND I DON'T KNOW IF ALFREDO
5 IS STILL O BUT IT'S FINE IF YOU WANT TO CONTINUE IT.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD RECOMMEND KICKING IT IF WE HAVE COMMENTS.

8

9 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** I PREFER KICKING IT.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE HAVE TWO FOR KICKING IT. ANY OTHER
12 COMMISSIONERS? COMMISSIONER WORTH?

13

14 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I AM HAPPY TO STAY BUT I'M
15 ALSO MINDFUL, WE WANT TO GIVE ALL THE ITEMS THEIR APPROPRIATE
16 TIME. SO MY ONLY QUESTION S IS THERE ANY TIME -- ARE THERE ANY
17 TIME CONSTRAINTS AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND
18 MOVING THE PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION INTEGRATION FORWARD?

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN. JUST AS A REMINDER
21 THAT MIGHT BE HELPFUL. CHAIR HAGGERTY HAD DIRECTED THAT WE
22 HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE AUGUST COMMITTEE MEETINGS, AND AT
23 THIS JUNCTURE, WE ARE ANTICIPATING THAT WE HAVE KEY ITEMS THAT
24 DO NEED TO GO FORWARD FOR THE WEDNESDAY MEETINGS WHICH WOULD
25 INCLUDE THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. SO WE

Meeting Transcript

1 WOULD'N'T NECESSARILY HAVE TO WAIT ALL THE WAY TO SEPTEMBER. WE
2 COULD BRING THIS UP NEXT MONTH IN AUGUST, AND THERE WOULD BE
3 MORE TIME TO CONSIDER IT.

4

5 **AMY R. WORTH:** THAT'S GOOD. THANK YOU.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO LET'S CONTINUE THE ITEM. AND
8 THEN FOR ITEM FIVE, WHERE THE CTC UPDATE WE'RE ALSO GOING TO
9 CONTINUE THAT ITEM AND WE'RE GOING TO GO TO ITEMS -- DO I NEED
10 A VOTE TO CONTINUE IT OR CAN I JUST DO IT? OKAY WE'LL JUST DO
11 IT. AND ITEM SIX, OTHER BUSINESS, PUBLIC COMMENT. I DON'T SEE
12 ANY. KIMBERLY, DO YOU SEE ANY?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I DO NOW SEE A RAISED HAND BUT I HAVE NOT
15 RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC WRITTEN COMMENT PER THIS ITEM. IT'S MR.
16 LEBRUN HAS RAISED HIS HAND.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** QUICKLY, AND YOU NEARLY BEAT ME TO IT. BUT I REALLY
21 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO CHIME IN ON SOME OF THE OFF
22 TOPIC COMMENT THE THAT WERE MADE ABOUT THE ONE 8TH CENT SALES
23 TAX AND THIS IS GOING TO BE RELIEF OF THE CAL TRAINS
24 OBLIGATIONS WE VOTED FOR THIS TWICE IN 20,002,016 AND AT THE
25 END OF THE DAY TO GET AWAY WITH THIS CAL TRAINS WOULD NOT BE

Meeting Transcript

1 ANY BETTER THAN IT IS NOW SO AT SOME POINT I WOULD APPRECIATE
2 HELP FROM MTC LOOKING INTO THE LANGUAGE ON THE VARIOUS TAX
3 MARRIES AND SOME ARE COMING UP WITH SOME WAY TO ENFORCE THEM
4 BY FUNDING FOR THE PROJECT. THAT'S WHAT IT TAKES. THANK YOU.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ROLAND. SEEING NO OTHER
7 PUBLIC COMMENT. THAT ENDS THIS COMMITTEE MEETING. AND SEE YOU
8 ALL IN AUGUST. [ADJOURNED]

9