



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



APRIL 22, 2024

REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

MONDAY, APRIL 22ND, 2024, 11:30 AM

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST NOW YOU ARE DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. SO, MADAM CLERK, LET'S MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER ONE, WHICH IS ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM THE QUORUM.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. CHAIR POWERS?

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR CHAN? VICE CHAIR CHAN IS STILL ON HER WAY. MEMBER BOUCHARD?

MICHELLE BOUCHARD: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER CHURCHILL?



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript**

APRIL 22, 2024

1 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER FREMIER?

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER GONOT? MEMBER GONOT IS STILL ON THE
8 WAY. MEMBER HURSH?

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MULLIGAN?

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MURPHY?

17

18 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WHELAN?

21

22 **NANCY WHELAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TUMLIN?

25



APRIL 22, 2024

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** PERFECT. LET'S MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM
6 NUMBER TWO, WHICH IS WELCOME. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO WELCOME
7 EVERYBODY TO THE BART FACILITY HERE. AS YOU KNOW WE'RE KIND OF
8 ALTERNATING BETWEEN EAST BAY AND WEST BAY AND THIS MONTH WE'RE
9 HERE, AND IN THE FOLLOWING MONTH, APRIL AND MAY -- IN MAY,
10 WE'LL BE AT MTC HEADQUARTERS. THANK YOU ALL FOR ATTENDING. AND
11 I CAN'T STRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF PERSONAL IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE
12 AT THESE MEETINGS THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME OUT OF YOUR
13 DAY WHETHER THEY'RE HERE OR AT MTC HEADQUARTERS. THANK YOU FOR
14 THAT. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS
15 IS AN ACTION ITEM HERE. IS THERE A MOTION ON THIS PANEL, AND
16 THIS BOARD HERE FOR A MOTION AND SECOND.

17

18 **BILL CHURCHILL:** I'LL MOVE.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE HAVE CHURCHILL FOR THE MOTION AND
23 FREMIER FOR THE SECOND. HOW ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER IN THE
24 BUILDING OR VIRTUAL ON THIS ITEM?

25



APRIL 22, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS ONLINE BY ZOOM
2 AND NOTHING IN WRITING AND THERE IS NO ONE WITH A SPEAKER
3 CARD.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. REGIONAL -- I CAN'T REMEMBER IF
6 WE'RE COUNCIL OR CITY. SO COUNCIL MEMBERS ANY DISCUSSION ON
7 THE CONSENT? NOT SEEING ANY MADAM CLERK. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE
8 NOTE BY AYE. [AYES].

9

10 **CHAIR:** ABSTENTIONS? OPPOSED? OKAY. MADAM CLERK THAT, PASSES
11 UNANIMOUSLY. WE'RE OFF ON THE RIGHT PATH HERE. OKAY. SO, THE
12 FIRST OF OUR OPEN CONSENT OPEN AGENDA ITEM HERE IS 4A, THIS IS
13 AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. THIS IS AN UPDATE ON WHERE WE ARE WITH
14 TRANSIT PRIORITY EFFORTS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. AND, SO, I
15 AM GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO MELANIE. AM I TURNING THIS OVER
16 TO YOU OR JOEL? JOEL. OKAY. JOEL SCHAFFER, WHO IS WITH MTC,
17 KIND OF, TO LEAD US IN THIS DISCUSSION IN THE PRESENTATION
18 THERE, THEN WE'LL HEAR FROM THE PUBLIC AND OUR COMMITTEE
19 MEMBERS HERE. JOEL, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

20

21 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS AND THANK YOU COUNCIL
22 MEMBERS FOR HEARING OUR ITEM TODAY. MY NAME IS JOEL SCHAFFER,
23 TRANSIT NETWORK PROGRAM MANAGER AT MTC AND TODAY WE'LL BE
24 PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON TRANSIT PRIORITY PROGRESS IN THE
25 REGION. AS A PART OF THE PORTFOLIO ONE OF THE MTC EFFORTS IS



APRIL 22, 2024

1 TO ENHANCE TRANSIT CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE INVESTING IN TRANSIT
2 PRIORITY THINGS LIKE BUS LANES SIGNAL PRIORITY OPTIMIZATION
3 BUS BOARDING ISLANDS ET CETERA THE REASON WHY THIS IS
4 IMPORTANT IS BECAUSE IT INCREASES TRANSIT RELIABILITY AND
5 REDUCES TRAVEL TIMES FOR TRANSIT CUSTOMERS THIS RESULTS IN
6 EFFICIENT OPERATIONS AND RESULT IN COST SAVINGS TO THE
7 OPERATOR THAT CAN BE REINVESTED IN MORE FREQUENT SERVICE AND
8 THE OPPOSITE TRUE FOR LOWER RELIABILITY LONGER TRAVEL TIMES
9 AND INCREASE TRANSIT OPERATING COSTS. WE HAVE TWO OPERATORS
10 MICHAEL RHODES FROM SFMTA MUNI ROBERT DEL ROSARIO FROM AC
11 TRANSIT WILL PRESENT ON THE RECENT PROGRESS THEY HAVE MADE
12 WITH THIS AREA I'LL HAND IT OFF TO MICHAEL.

13

14 **MICHAEL RHODES:** MICHAEL RHODES I LEAD THE TRANSIT PRIORITY
15 TEAM AT SFMTA WE BUILT ABOUT 100 MILES OF TRANSIT RELIABILITY
16 CORRIDOR IMPROVEMENTS OVER THE LAST DECADE IN SAN FRANCISCO.
17 THE BLUE LINES ON THE MAP ARE WHERE WE HAVE MADE IMPROVEMENTS.
18 GRAY LINES WHERE WE PLAN TO GO NEXT. THAT'S 100 MILES THERE OF
19 ON THE MAP. THE WORK WE'RE DOING HERE DRAWS ON A TOOL KIT OF
20 MEASURED WHICH INCLUDE TRANSIT LANES, SIGNAL PRIORITY, BUS
21 FAULTS AND ISLANDS, STOP-SPACING CHANGES, TRAFFIC ENGINEERING
22 ADJUSTMENTS TO SPEED UP TRANSIT, AND, OF COURSE, INTEGRATING
23 PEDESTRIAN SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS TO HELP PEOPLE GET TO THE BUS
24 SAFELY. I'LL HIGHLIGHT A FEW OF THE PROGRAMS ACCOMPLISHMENTS
25 ON SPECIFIC CORRIDORS TO GIVE YOU A TASTE OF WHAT WE WORK ON



APRIL 22, 2024

1 STARTING WITH THE -- SORRY -- THE RESULTS -- FIRST AN OVERVIEW
2 OF RESULTS WHERE WE SEE IMPACTS ON RIDERSHIP. RESULTS SINCE
3 STARTING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MUNI FIRST PILOT PROJECT IN
4 2012 HAS EXCEEDED OUR EXPECTATIONS FOR WHAT WE CAN ACCOMPLISH
5 WITH TRANSIT PRIORITY. WE HAVE SEEN RIDERSHIP GROW PAIRED
6 SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS WITH TRANSIT PRIORITY CAPITAL PROJECTS
7 PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP GREW BY 20% ON FOCUS CORES DO
8 WE HAVE COMBINED IMPROVEMENTS LIKE INTRODUCING RAPID STOP
9 SERVICE EVEN NATION-WIDE RIDERSHIP ON MUNI WAS GOING DOWN BY
10 2% PER YEAR SINCE THE PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP HAS RECOVERED MOST
11 QUICKLY ON MANY OF THE CORRIDORS WHERE WE HAVE MADE
12 RELIABILITY SERVICE INVESTMENTS, MUNI CORRIDORS WHERE WE HAVE
13 DONE SERVICE CAPITAL UPGRADES AND THROUGH THE OUTPERFORMED OUR
14 SYSTEM WIDE RECOVERY WILL WE'RE SEEING HIGHER OVERALL
15 RIDERSHIP RECOVERY RATE BUT ALSO SEEING THESE ARE THE LINES
16 THAT KEEP PACE AND AHEAD OF THE SYSTEM LINE AVERAGE. SO TO
17 HIGHLIGHT A FEW SPECIFIC CORRIDORS, SINCE 2016 HERE ON MISSION
18 STREET CORRIDOR WE HAVE MADE A SERIES OF IMPROVEMENTS ACROSS
19 THE ENTIRE 14 MISSION ROUTE ON THE SYSTEM TRANSIT LANES,
20 SIGNAL PRIORITY BUS STOP CHANGES, INCREASED RAPID SERVICE,
21 LIMITED STOP SERVICE AND LOCAL SERVICE FREQUENCY ON THE 14
22 SERIES AND WE HAVE MADE PEDESTRIAN SAFETY UPGRADES BECAUSE
23 THERE IS HIGH INJURY CORRIDOR FOR PEDESTRIAN WE SAW RESULTS OF
24 19% RIDERSHIP INCREASE IN THE YEARS BEFORE PANDEMIC AND 92%
25 TOTAL RIDERSHIP RECOVERY RATE AND EVEN HIGHER I THINK FOR 14



APRIL 22, 2024

1 SERIES LINES. OVERALL END TO END TRAVEL TIME ON THE 14 ROUTE
2 HAS BEEN REDUCED BY 9%. SO THAT'S ACROSS THE ENTIRE 7, 8, 9
3 MILE ROUTE, ROUND TRIP INCLUDING LAYOVER REDUCED BY 9% SAVING
4 BY BUSES BUT OBVIOUSLY DELIVERING A BETTER CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE
5 IN THE SOMA SOUTH MARKET LINE WE HAVE SEEN 31% REDUCTION, CORE
6 AREAS WHERE WE HAVE SEEN HUGE IMPROVEMENT IN HOW THE BUS
7 OPERATES SAFETY BETTER TOO 33% REDUCTION IN PEDESTRIAN ON
8 INJURY COLLISIONS ON MISSION STREET AND REDUCTION IN
9 PEDESTRIAN INJURY. OF COURSE, ON GEARY WE HAVE FOCUSED ON
10 INTENSIVE COMPREHENSIVE IMPROVEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE ENTIRE
11 ROUTE, SIX YEARS WE HAVE IMPLEMENTED TRANSIT LANES, SIGNAL
12 PRIORITIES URBAN DESIGN IMPROVEMENTS, 18% DECREASE TRAVEL TIME
13 37 IMPROVEMENT IN TRAVEL TIME RELIABILITY, 70 TO 80% REDUCTION
14 VEHICLES GOING OVER 40 MILES PER HOUR NON-TRANSIT VEHICLES
15 SLOWED DOWN BY THIS PROJECT IT WAS A SAFETY PROJECT AS WELL
16 AND WE ALSO HAVE THE IMPORTANT COBENEFIT OF HELPING TO ADDRESS
17 SOME OF THE 1960'S ERA PLANNING MISTAKES OF CREATING GEARY
18 EXPRESSWAY AND WIDENING THE STREET, DISCONNECTING JAPAN TOWN
19 WESTERN ADDITION NEIGHBORHOOD FROM EACH OTHER. SO THAT PROJECT
20 RECONNECTED BY THE IMPROVING CONNECTION BETWEEN THOSE
21 NEIGHBORHOODS IN A NUMBER OF WAYS ADDRESSING BEYOND NARROW
22 TRANSIT FOCUS. LAST EXAMPLE IS A LITTLE DIFFERENT. THE PARK
23 PRESIDIO LOMBARD HOV LANES PROJECT A PILOT PROJECT, FIRST IN
24 THE STATE HOV HIGH OCCUPANCY VEHICLE CARPOOL LANES HERE IN
25 CALIFORNIA IT'S NOT A BIG SEPARATED FREEWAY IT'S CALTRANS



APRIL 22, 2024

1 RIGHT OF WAY BUT IT'S BASICALLY A CITY STREET WITH HOV LANE ON
2 IT WE IMPLEMENTED THESE ON LOMBARD STREAM PARK PRESIDIO
3 BOULEVARD, THIS SERVICE PART OF THE STATE HIGHWAY TRANSIT
4 SYSTEM PARTNERS WITH CALTRANS FOR A THREE YEAR PILOT, IT'S A
5 BIT COMPLICATED, WE HAVE A GREAT PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRANS TO
6 IMPLEMENT THIS QUICKLY AND EVALUATE THE PILOT AS WE GO. TRAVEL
7 TIME SAVINGS UP TO 10% WITH LITTLE IMPACT ON GENERAL TRAFFIC.
8 IT'S BEEN QUICK, IMPACTFUL AND NOT TOO MUCH NEGATIVE IMPACT
9 WHICH IS IMPORTANT FOR CALTRANS STANDPOINT. THE FOCUS ON THE
10 PILOT, INSTEAD OF WAITING DECADES TO GET THE PERFECT PROJECT
11 IN 2050 WE SAID LET'S GET SOMETHING ON THE GROUND AND WORK OUR
12 WAY INCREMENTALLY TO SOMETHING STRONGER. RESULTS HAVE BEEN
13 POSITIVE, WE HOPE TO MAKE IT PERMANENT FOLLOWING FULL
14 EVALUATION. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO ROBERT DEL ROSARIO FROM AC
15 TRANSIT. ROB

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M HERE TO TALK ABOUT AC TRANSIT EFFORTS
18 WITH SIGNAL TIME PRIORITY. TO GET US OFF ON THE RIGHT FOOT
19 SIGNAL COORDINATION IS BASICALLY ABILITY FOR SIGNALS TO
20 COMMUNICATE WITH EACH OTHER SO THEY CAN OPERATE EFFICIENTLY
21 AND MOVE THE CORRIDOR TRAFFIC BETTER ALONG THOSE STREETS,
22 TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY, TSP, ALLOWING EXTRA GREEN TIME FOR
23 TIME TO GET BUSES THROUGH INTERSECTIONS WITH LESS DELAY. GOING
24 THROUGH THE BENEFITS OF SIGNAL COORDINATION AND TSP, AS I
25 MENTIONED THERE IS MORE EFFICIENT TRAFFIC FLOW WHEN YOU HAVE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 MORE EFFICIENT TRAFFIC FLOW CARS ARE STOPPED LESS IN TRAFFIC
2 BETTER FOR EMISSIONS AND POLLUTION. SAFETY, ABLE TO REGULATE
3 SPEED. WE'RE ALL FAMILIAR WITH THE CORRIDORS IN SAN FRANCISCO
4 IT'S A COMMONPLACE WHERE IT REGULATES THE SPEED THROUGH
5 TRAFFIC SIGNALS THEN FOR TRANSIT WHICH IS MOST IMPORTANT FOR
6 AC TRANSIT IS INCREASING OUR RELIABILITY BY SHORTER TRAVEL
7 TIMES TO INCREASE SIGNAL PERFORMANCE. THERE ARE CHALLENGES
8 WITH THIS WORK. THE SIGNALS SYSTEMS VARY FROM CITY TO CITY IN
9 THE URBAN CORE INFRASTRUCTURE IS OLDER AND URBAN CORE NEWER
10 SIGNALS AND EASIER TO COMMUNICATE WITH. APPROVAL PROCESS IS
11 COMPLICATED WEATHER WORKING WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS OR
12 CALTRANS. THERE ARE PROCESSES TO FOLLOW IN ORDER TO GET
13 PERMISSIONS TO MODIFY SIGNALS. THERE IS CONFLICTING VALUES IN
14 POLICIES AT THE INTERSECTIONS, THERE IS MULTI-MODES GOING
15 THROUGH INTERSECTIONS, SO WHICH ARE THE MODES YOU PRIORITIZE
16 MOST AND OFTENTIMES TRANSIT CAN CONFLICT WITH THAT BUT WE WORK
17 WITH LOCAL JURISDICTION TO FIGURE OUT WHERE TRANSIT FITS INTO
18 THE PUZZLE AND LASTLY RELATED TO SIGNALS SYSTEMS DATA IS
19 DIFFICULT TO COLLECT. SO, NEWER SYSTEMS ARE OKAY AND WE CAN
20 PULL DATA PRETTY WELL. BUT OLDER SYSTEMS YOU HAVE TO GO TO A
21 CABINET WITH USB DRIVE TRYING TO PULL THE DATA. SO, GETTING
22 DATA AND BEING ABLE TO ANALYZE THE DATA IN A TIMELY FASHION IS
23 DIFFICULT. THIS IS A SIMILAR PIECE COMPARED TO THE LARGER
24 PROGRAM MICHAEL MENTIONED WE HAVE ROBUST PROGRAM TRANSIT
25 PRIORITY BUT I WANTED TO FOCUS ON SIGNAL PRIORITY TODAY.



APRIL 22, 2024

1 IMPROVEMENTS CAN INCREASE SPEED AND RELIABILITY OF BUSES. THE
2 SIMPLE LINE GRAPH ON THE SCREEN SHOWS AC TRANSIT DECREASE IN
3 AVERAGE SCHEDULE SPEED MEANING WE NEED TO SCHEDULE OUR BUSES
4 TO BE SLOWER TO MATCH TRAFFIC CONDITIONS RESULTING IN LONGER
5 TRAVEL TIME FOR RIDERS COST TO PROVIDE SERVICE FOR THE SAME
6 LEVEL. AS A RESULT OF OUR CONCERTED EFFORTS AND IMPLEMENT
7 SIGNAL COORDINATION IN IT. SP WHEREVER POSSIBLE FLEETS ARE
8 EQUIPPED TO COMMUNICATE WITH SIGNALS WE HAVE 630 BUSES, AND
9 550 OF THEM ARE EQUIPPED. 450 TRAFFIC SIGNALS THROUGH THE OUR
10 SERVICE AREA EQUIPPED WITH IT. SP WITH ADDITIONAL 13 SIGNALS
11 AND QUEUE JUMP LANES. THESE HAVE LESSER SPACE REQUIREMENTS AND
12 DEDICATED LANES BUT CAN ARE EQUALLY EFFECTIVE. A NUMBER OF
13 MAJOR TRUNK LINES THAT CARRY OUR HIGHEST RIDERSHIP EQUIPPED
14 WITH IT. SP SIGNAL COORDINATION HAVE YIELDED US 10% SAVINGS.
15 BRT TEMPLE LINE WITH PASSENGER TRAVEL TIMES ALONG THE CORRIDOR
16 REFLECTED IN THE TREMENDOUS RIDERSHIP GROWTH. AND TO SEE
17 RIDERSHIP EXCEED PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS. NEXT SLIDE. GIVEN OUR
18 SUCCESSES WE HAVE SEEN MINIMAL ENACTS, AC TRANSIT, FRUITVALE
19 McDONALDS TELEGRAPH LOOKING AT THE GEOGRAPHY TO SPEED BUSES
20 ALONG. IN ADDITION OUR PARTNERS ARE INSTALLING IT. SP ON OUR
21 BEHALF TO IMPROVE TRANSIT PRIORITY FOR VEHICLES, INITIATIVES
22 INCLUDING PARTNERS WITH MTC DUMBARTON FORWARD, POWELL STREET
23 AND FREEWAY AT EMERYVILLE PART OF THE BAY BRIDGE PROGRAM LOCAL
24 JURISDICTIONS TSP AND COMPLETE STREETS PROJECTS AND TRANSIT
25 PRIORITY PROJECTS MAC ARTHUR CORRIDOR IN OAKLAND, AND SEA



APRIL 22, 2024

1 MOUNTS FOURTH STREET IN EMERYVILLE THAT'S A SUMMARY OF OUR
2 PROGRAM AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS AND WHAT WE HOPE TO GET IN THE
3 FUTURE ALSO FOR BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE SEEING IN
4 THE PROGRAM. I'LL TURN IT BACK TO JOEL.

5

6 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** THANK YOU ROBERT. SO IN ADDITION TO OPERATOR
7 LED EFFORTS, MTC INVESTING IN TRANSIT PRIORITY THROUGHOUT THE
8 REGION, INNOVATIVE DEPLOYMENTS TO ENHANCE ARTERIALS, TRANSIT
9 PERFORMANCE INITIATIVES GOING ON TEN YEARS NOW TRANSIT 2050+
10 AND THE FORWARD COMMUTE INITIATIVES SOME OF THE BRIDGE
11 CORRIDORS WE MEET REGULARLY TO DISCUSS MTC LED EFFORTS BUT
12 ALSO CALTRANS EFFORTS NAMELY IN THE WORKS DIRECTORS POLICY ON
13 TRANSIT PRIORITY AND FOCUS WHICH WILL BE A STATEWIDE POLICY
14 DEVELOPED BY HEADQUARTERS AS WELL AS THE BAY AREA TRANSIT PLAN
15 WHICH IS A DISTRICT FOUR EFFORT. SO, WITH THAT, THAT CONCLUDES
16 OUR PRESENTATION ON THIS ITEM AND WE CAN OPEN UP TO ANY
17 QUESTIONS.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. SO, BEFORE WE GET THERE, MR.
20 SCHAFFER, MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER IN THE ROOM OR
21 VIRTUALLY.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE. HOW
24 MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE?

25



APRIL 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MINUTES. ADINA LEVIN. IF YOU WILL
4 UNMUTE YOURSELF TO SPEAK?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ADINA LEVIN WITH
7 SEAMLESS BAY AREA SERVING ON THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR THE
8 TRANSIT PRIORITY INITIATIVE FOR MIRRORS. FIRST OF ALL, IT IS
9 REALLY EXCITING TO SEE THE FANTASTIC RESULTS FROM THE TRANSIT
10 PRIORITY INITIATIVES TO DATE, AND A PLAN HIGHLIGHTS FROM A
11 COUPLE OF THE AGENCIES COMING FORWARD. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS IS
12 THAT WHILE, YOU KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO HAS HAD FANTASTIC SUCCESS,
13 YOU KNOW, OVERCOMING CHALLENGES. SAN FRANCISCO IS ONE
14 JURISDICTION AND THE TRANSIT PRIORITY CORRIDORS IN MANY OTHER
15 PARTS OF THE REGION ARE MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL. AND, SO, I
16 WANTED TO SAY TO THIS GROUP WHAT I ALSO SAID IN THAT, IN THE
17 ADVISORY COMMITTEE, WHICH IS THAT IT IS VERY IMPORTANT TO
18 BRING TOGETHER STAFF AND ALSO ELECTED'S ON ALL OF THE KEY
19 CITIES ON TRANSIT PRIORITY ROUTES TO MAKE SURE THAT AS A
20 POLICY IS BEING WORKED ON, THAT EVERYONE -- EVERY JURISDICTION
21 ON THOSE KEY ROUTES IS AWARE OF WHAT'S GOING ON AND KNOWS
22 ABOUT IT BEFORE IT COMES FORWARD FOR POLICY DECISION SO THAT
23 NOBODY CAN SHOW UP AT THE LAST MINUTE AND SAY I DIDN'T KNOW
24 ABOUT THIS AND I HAVE CONCERNS. IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO GET
25 ALL THE CITIES ON THE KEY CORRIDORS ON TRANSIT PRIORITY



APRIL 22, 2024

1 ROUTES. LASTLY, AS A USER AND COMMUNITY MEMBER, YOU KNOW, MTC
2 IS ASSEMBLY INFORMATION THAT IS SUITABLE FOR THIS KIND OF
3 AUDIENCE, BUT IT IS REALLY DIFFICULT IF YOU ARE A COMMUNITY
4 MEMBER TO LOOK INTO SEE WHAT THESE ARE IN YOUR COMMUNITY,
5 ESPECIALLY IF IT TOUCHES BOTH AGENCIES AND MTC. AND, SO, I
6 ENCOURAGE MUCH MORE CUSTOMER FRIENDLY INFORMATION ABOUT THIS
7 NETWORK REGARDLESS OF WHICH ENTITY IS WORKING ON WHICH
8 PROJECT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
11 ONLINE AND THERE WAS NO SPEAKER CARDS AND NOTHING WAS RECEIVED
12 IN WRITING.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
15 MR. SCHAFFER, THANK YOU FOR FRAMING THIS UP AND MR. ROADS, AND
16 MR. DEL ROSARIO, VERY THOROUGH AND VERY DETAILED UPDATE ON
17 WHERE WE'RE GOING WITH TRANSIT PRIORITY. COUNCIL MEMBERS?
18 THOUGHTS, COMMENTS? ADVICE? I SEE SEVERAL HERE. LET'S GO DOWN
19 THE DAIS WITHOUT PUTTING ANYBODY ON THE SPOT HERE. MIKE?

20

21 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU TO THE PRESENTERS AND MTC. AS I HAVE
22 REVIEWED THIS BEFOREHAND, BUT IT'S GOOD TO GO THROUGH IT
23 TODAY, IT OCCURRED TO ME IT WAS GOOD TO DO THE JUXTAPOSITION
24 BETWEEN MUNI, SFMTA AND AC TRANSIT. MANY OF YOU KNOW, I
25 STARTED MY CAREER AT SFMTA AND I DIDN'T APPRECIATE HAVING DPT



APRIL 22, 2024

1 AND OWNERSHIP OF THE SIGNAL CONTROLLERS AND LESS OBSTACLES TO
2 MAKE THINGS HAPPEN IN SAN FRANCISCO. FAST FORWARD TO THIS SIDE
3 OF THE BAY, AND ONE OF MY COMMENT IS WITHOUT DIRECT LAND USE
4 ENGINEERING CONTROL, MONEY IS WHAT HAS GOT THIS DONE FOR US.
5 AND IT'S REALLY ACTC, ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
6 WHO HAS ALLOWED US TO GO INTO VARIOUS MUNICIPALITIES AND SAY
7 WE'LL BRING PARTIAL FUNDING FOR YOU TO UPGRADE YOUR TRAFFIC
8 CONTROLLER IF WE GET THE DATA REPORTING AND THE TSP WE NEED.
9 GOOD EXAMPLES OF COOPERATION. BOT GOOD PRESENTATIONS ON
10 ACCOMPLISHMENTS. THANK YOU ACTC IF YOU ARE LISTENING AND FOR
11 CONTINUING TO FUNDS AND TSP AND MTC. I DON'T WANT TO OVERLOOK
12 THAT FUNDING, AS WELL. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I'M GOING TO GO TO CAROLYN AND DENNIS.
15 CAROLYN.

16

17 **CAROLYN GONOT:** TWO QUESTIONS. THIS IS AN AREA I AM ALWAYS VERY
18 INTERESTED IN. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION, MIKE, I LIKED
19 HEARING FROM BOTH OF YOU. I HAVE QUESTIONS FOR ALL THREE OF
20 YOU. AC TRANSIT, AND SFMTA, I HAVE QUESTIONS SPECIFICALLY
21 REGARDING THE FUND SOURCES THAT YOU'RE USING. BECAUSE I KNOW
22 WITH SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE HAVE STRUGGLED ACTUALLY TRYING TO
23 FIND FUND SOURCES WE NEED WE HAVE PILOT PROJECTS AND WE'RE
24 WORKING MORE WITH THE FEDERAL. WE HAVE SOME FROM LOCAL
25 SOURCES, AND I MEAN, AND REGIONAL, BUT WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT



APRIL 22, 2024

1 FEDERAL. SO WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHERE DO WE GET THE
2 FUND SOURCES FROM AND TRYING TO PUSH MORE ON -- I THINK THE
3 ONE THING IS THE PARTNERSHIP WITH THE CITIES BECAUSE THE
4 ISSUES WITH THEM IS THEY'RE ALWAYS VERY OUTDATED TRAFFIC
5 SIGNAL CONTROLLERS BEING ABLE TO WORK WITH THEM AND THEN
6 SEEING I WOULD LOVE TO GET THAT NEWER EQUIPMENT, I WAS CURIOUS
7 ABOUT WHAT YOUR PROGRAMS ARE AND FUNDING, I KNOW THE CITY IS A
8 BIT DIFFERENT BUT I WAS CURIOUS WHAT SOURCES YOU HAVE USED AND
9 WHAT YOU HAVE BEEN ABLE TO GET.

10

11 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** SURE. FOR AC TRANSIT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF
12 FUNDING SOURCES LISTED ON THE SCREEN HERE THAT MTC HAVE
13 PROVIDED. WE HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL IN RECEIVING THE TRANSIT
14 PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE DOLLARS. ONE THING WITH TSP IS THESE
15 GRANTS, IF THEY'RE \$2 MILLION, \$5 MILLION, WE WITH CAN GO A
16 LONG WAY, UPGRADING SIGNALS DEPENDS ON WHAT TECHNOLOGY IS OUT
17 THERE, IF IT'S OUTDATED. BUT THEN WE HAVE BEEN HAVING SUCCESS
18 WITH APPLYING FOR SINGLE CORRIDOR THROUGH, TPI AND RECEIVING
19 FUNDS AND DELIVERING. A NUMBER OF OUR PROJECTS ARE TPI FUNDED.
20 MORE ROBUST PROJECTS IDENTIFYING CORRIDORS IN TRANSIT AND
21 THEIR TRANSIT PLANS MACARTHUR INTERNATIONAL WORKING WITH RT,
22 WORKING WITH MEASURE B FUNDS AND FEDERAL FUNDS PUT THOSE
23 CORRIDORS TOGETHER AND TSP PART OF THOSE BUT FOR THE MOST PART
24 AC TRANSIT IS APPLYING FOR INDIVIDUAL CORRIDORS WE HAVE RELIED
25 ON A LOT OF THESE PROGRAMS THAT ARE MENTIONED IN THE SCREEN.



APRIL 22, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SFMTA, SIMILARLY ESPECIALLY IN THE EARLY YEARS AND
3 ONGOING TPI FUNDING FOR MTC HELPED US GET STARTED WITH SOME OF
4 OUR EARLIEST TSP IMPROVEMENTS AND TRANSIT PRIORITY
5 IMPROVEMENTS. WE WERE FORTUNATE GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND
6 ADOPTED IN 2014 BY VOTERS, TO KEEP US GOING. AND THEY CONTINUE
7 TO SUPPORT US OR HAVE BEEN A KEY PART TO KEEP THAT GOING
8 THROUGH STATE FUNDS THROUGH GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION PROGRAMS,
9 TIRCP, ASEC PROGRAMS THAT HAVE SUPPORTED TRANSIT, AS WELL.

10

11 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THE REASON I'M ASKING IS IT'S NOT JUST THE LONG
12 CORRIDORS IT'S OVERALL JUMPING IN GENERAL EVEN FREQUENT
13 NETWORK OUR LOCAL BUS NETWORK MAYBE RUNS OF 20 MINUTE
14 HEADWAYS, NOT TEN MINUTE OR MORE FREQUENT HEADWAYS. WE WERE
15 TALKING, WE'RE DOING ADJUSTMENT IN MAY AND APRIL THERE IS
16 GOING TO BE ADJUSTMENT OF 9,000 HOURS LAST YEAR HEADWAYS OF
17 15,000 HOURS, JUST FOR SPEED IMPROVEMENTS AND LOOKING AT
18 15,000 THIS COMING YEAR JUST TO DEAL WITH SPEED ISSUES, OUR
19 HEADWAYS, QUEUE JUMPING LANES ABLE TO MAKE IMPROVEMENTS
20 CONGRESSIONAL HAS COME BACK AND OUR RIDERSHIP HAS COME BACK ON
21 OUR FREEWAY NETWORK WE'RE BACK UP AT OUR PRE-PANDEMIC
22 RIDERSHIP ON THOSE ROUTES WE NEED TO KEEP IT GOING BUT WE HATE
23 TO CONTINUE TO PUT OUR OURS THERE WHEN WE WANT TO PUT MORE
24 FREQUENT SERVICE OUT THERE ON THE ROUTE. THAT'S A BIG PART OF
25 IT AND SOMETHING THE REGION NEEDS TO THINK ABOUT WHEN WE'RE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 TALKING ABOUT PUTTING MONEY INTO SERVICE IS PUTTING MONEY INTO
2 SPEEDING UP SERVICE SO WE'RE NOT PUTTING MONEY OUT THERE TO
3 TRY TO KEEP UP WITH CONGESTION ON THE BUS NETWORK. THE OTHER
4 THING WANT TO ASK ABOUT MTC, I DON'T KNOW -- AND MAYBE I'M
5 GOING ASK FOR A MEETING BETWEEN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND
6 SPECIFICALLY MTC ON -- ON -- BECAUSE OF THESE ISSUES THAT
7 WE'RE HAVING IN OUR COUNTY ON CONGESTION, WHAT IS THE EFFORTS
8 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY REGARDING SOME OF THE CALTRANS LED
9 EFFORTS AND MTC AND -- BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW WHAT THEY ARE ON
10 THE DIRECTORS POLICY, WHAT CORRIDORS ARE WE LOOKING AT IN OUR
11 COUNT SPECIFICALLY IN THE TRANSIT 2050 NETWORK AND I DON'T
12 KNOW WHAT AREAS WE'RE LOOKING AT IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. WE
13 HAVE A LOT OF OUR ROADWAYS AND ARTERIALS THAT ARE KEY, A LOT
14 OF NETWORK -- A LOT OF RIDERSHIP. 86% OF A LOT OF OUR HOURS ON
15 ARE FREQUENT NETWORK. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT HAVING A MEETING.
16 MAYBE YOU KNOW HOW MUCH FOCUS IS IN THAT AREA BUT WE HAVE A
17 LOT OF RIDERSHIP IN THAT AREA.

18

19 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** GREAT COMMENT. YEAH, WE ACTUALLY HOST A TRANSIT
20 PRIORITY WORKING GROUP, WHICH HAS STAFF FROM ALL OF THE
21 OPERATORS ATTEND THAT. SO WE'RE WORKING WITH IT. TAMIKO
22 PERCELL AT VTA, SHE'S THE POINT PERSON THERE WHO IS INVOLVED
23 WHEN CAL TRAMS COMES TO PRESENT AT THAT MEETING AND PROVIDE
24 INPUT ON ANY REQUESTS THEY HAVE BUT IN TERMS OF THE NETWORK
25 QUESTION, I THINK SHORTLY WE'LL BE GETTING THERE WITH THE TWIT



APRIL 22, 2024

1 2050+ NETWORK I CAN PASS IT TO MELANIE TO TALK ABOUT THAT BUT
2 THAT'S ONE OF THE STEPS COMING UP SOON.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GO AHEAD.

5

6 **MELANIE CHOY:** THREE ASPECTS IN TERMS OF YOUR QUESTION, QUARTER
7 LEVEL FUNDING BUT ONE THING IS LOOKING AT CHALLENGED AREAS
8 SPECIFIC HOTSPOTS AND THAT'S ACTUALLY A GOOD PREVIEW FOR THE
9 NEXT ITEM I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IN TERMS OF THINKING ABOUT
10 TRANSIT PRIORITY OVERALL IN THE LAST 20 TO 30 YEARS THERE IS
11 WORK TOWARDS CORRIDOR BASED, A NUMBER OF THINGS HAPPENING WITH
12 THE STATE SYSTEM, SOME ARE ARTERIALS, PARTNERSHIP WITH CMAS,
13 SO THERE IS A LOT OF WORK DONE IN THIS SPACE, AND WE FEEL
14 THERE ARE OTHER -- WE'RE STARTING TO GET INTO THIS PLACE WHERE
15 WE NEED TO LOOK BEYOND CORRIDOR LEVEL, BUT ALSO TARGETED
16 AREAS. AND, SO, AS WE PROCEED WITH ROLLING OUT BusAID, ONE OF
17 THE THINGS WE ALSO WANT TO DO IN THE FUTURE IS THINK THROUGH
18 COMPREHENSIVELY ALL THESE OTHER CHALLENGES THAT WE FACE IN
19 TERMS OF LOOKING AT SPECIFIC ISSUE AREAS, BUT ALSO ON A NEED
20 BASED, NOT JUST CORRIDOR LEVEL. AND SOME ASSESSMENTS WE HOPE
21 WE CAN EMBARK ON NEEDS BASED ASSESSMENT IN THE FUTURE IN THIS
22 AREA TO ADDRESS KIND OF MORE OF THESE CHALLENGE AREAS,
23 CHALLENGE SPOTS. SO THAT'S ONE THING. SECOND THING IS IN TERMS
24 OF CALTRANS FOCUS AREAS THEY ARE DOING A TRANSIT -- A PRIORITY
25 POLICY STATEWIDE AND THAT EFFORT, I DON'T KNOW EXACTLY WHERE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 THEY'RE AT IN TREMENDOUS OF ROLLING THAT OUT BUT I BELIEVE
2 IT'S NEXT FALL WHEN THEY ANTICIPATE PUTTING A STATEWIDE POLICY
3 OUT THERE, WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING ON A REGIONAL POLICY AND
4 WE'RE HOPING THE TWO DOVE TAIL WITH EACH OTHER SO THAT IT'S
5 CONSISTENT BUT ALSO PLAYS TO THE RESPECTIVE ROLES OF THE STATE
6 AND THE REGION SO WE'RE ALSO CURRENTLY IN PARALLEL WITH ALL
7 THIS WORK COORDINATING WITH CALTRANS ON THAT, STATEWIDE AND
8 ALSO DEVELOPING A POLICY FOR OURSELVES AND THE REGION. AND THE
9 THIRD ASPECT IS IN TERMS OF SOME OF THESE CORRIDORS AND
10 PARTNERSHIPS WITH VTA, WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO SIT DOWN AND TALK
11 THROUGH SOME OF THE AREAS. SO, WE WOULD BE -- WE WOULD SET UP
12 A MEETING, BUT ALSO IN TERMS OF TRANSIT 2050 PLUS THERE IS
13 ANALYSIS LOOKING AT THE CORRIDOR DOWN THE ROAD. SO ONE OF THE
14 THINGS WE COULD DO IS A COMPARISON OF CURRENT CONDITIONS TODAY
15 BUT ALSO BRING IN TRANSIT 2050+ TEAM AND LOOK AT WHAT THEY'RE
16 PROJECTING FOR THE FUTURE AND LOOK FOR OPPORTUNITIES IN THAT
17 SPACE. SO, WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP WITH A MEETING WITH
18 SANTA CLARA ON THAT.

19

20 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YEAH, AND I KNOW THE CITY IS OF COURSE VERY
21 GEARED BUT WE HAVE CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS THEY WANT TO DO A
22 TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY POLICY THAT THE CITIES ADOPT THEY NEED
23 HELP WITH THAT AND THEN INCENTIVES TO GO ALONG WITH THAT SOME
24 OF THE LOCAL ROADS AND STREETS PAVEMENT HITTING HIGH INDICES
25 IN THE CITIES CAN THEY MOVE SOME OF THAT MONEY OVER TO DO THE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 TRAFFIC SIGNAL IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT GETS
2 INCENTIVIZED I THINK IT'S A GOOD ROLE THAT MAYBE MTC CAN
3 SUPPORT IN SOME OF THE PROGRAMS THEY HAVE.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD COMMENTS CAROLYN. DENNIS?

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I'LL ECHO WHAT CAROLYN SAID, I WANT TO THANK
8 THE PRESENTERS GREAT PRESENTATION, WITH THE BENEFICIARY OF
9 SFMTA WORK. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT HOW TRANSIT WAS IN DECLINE
10 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, AND ANY SUCH CONGRESSIONAL THAT HAPPENS
11 ABSENT THIS INFORMATION IS AN INCOMPLETE CONVERSATION. BECAUSE
12 THIS IS A REGION-WIDE ISSUE. AND, SO IF THE AVERAGE BUS SPEED
13 IS DECLINED BY 14.2% IT MEANS BUS TRIPS TAKE LONGER ALSO MEANS
14 THEY'RE LESS RELIABLE PEOPLE WITH ACCESS TO AUTOMOBILES MOVE
15 AWAY FROM THE BUS. WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT THAT WE CAN TALK
16 ABOUT INCREASING FREQUENCY BUT IF WE DON'T INCREASE SPEED
17 PEOPLE WITH CHOICES WILL CHOOSE TO DRIVE WE NEED TO INVEST
18 MONEY IN THE REGION WHETHER WE PUT ADEQUATE FUNDS INTO SPEED
19 UP TRANSIT OR NOT THERE IS A LOT WE COULD DO TO SPEND MONEY.
20 ANY TIME YOU'RE AT A MEETING SOMEONE IS TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT
21 DECLINING OVER THE YEARS MY ANSWER IS SO IS AVERAGE BUS SPEED.
22 WHILE FOLKS WHO HAVE ACCESS TO AN AUTOMOBILE CAN CHOOSE TO
23 DRIVE IT COULD HURT OUR GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS, BUT FOLKS WHO
24 DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO AN AUTOMOBILE THIS IS UNFAIR, THIS TAKES
25 TIME AWAY FROM THE REST OF YOUR LIFE. IT IS AN EQUITY ISSUE,



APRIL 22, 2024

1 HAVING BUSES GET SLOWER OVER TIME -- THIS SHOWS THE ROOT CAUSE
2 MUCH A LOT OF OUR PROBLEMS. SO, THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU DENNIS. LET'S TURN OUR
5 ATTENTION TO BILL AND THEN WE'LL GO TO APRIL.

6

7 **BILL CHURCHILL:** I WANTED TO THEY THINK STAFF FOR A GREAT
8 PRESENTATION. I REALLY JUST WANTED TO MAKE A COMMENT. SO, AC
9 TRANSIT AND SFMTA HAS LED THE WAY FOR THE BAY AREA, AS A
10 WHOLE, IN SOME OF THIS TECHNOLOGY, HOW TO MAKE INROADS TO
11 SPEEDING TRANSIT BACK UP. AND I WANT TO THANK BOTH AGENCIES
12 FOR THEIR PARTNERSHIP IN HELPING THE EAST BAY, OR THE FAR EAST
13 BAY. WE HAVE CURRENTLY THREE DIFFERENT TSP PROJECTS UNDERWAY.
14 WE WOULD NOT BE WHAT WE ARE IF IT WAS NOT FOR THE SUPPORT AND
15 INFORMATION PROVIDED BY AC TRANSIT, IN PARTICULAR. SO, IT GOES
16 A LONG WAYS IN MY VIEW TO SHOWING AND DEMONSTRATING WHAT WE
17 CAN DO IN THE BAY AREA WORKING TOGETHER HOW THIS IS A PERFECT
18 VENUE FOR TRANSMITTING AND SHARING THE INFORMATION ACROSS ALL
19 OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA. SO FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, IT'S A
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY OF THE LET'S GO TO APRIL AND THEN
23 SEAMUS AND JEFF.

24



APRIL 22, 2024

1 V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: YES. SO, I WANT TO SAY MY THANKS TOO.
2 AND I THINK -- I JUST WANT TO ECHO, I THINK, WHAT BILL JUST
3 SAID. IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT WHEN WE'RE DOING THINGS LIKE THIS,
4 THAT WE CAN SHARE SOME OF THAT STORY AND SOME OF THE BEST
5 PRACTICES WITH OUR PARTNER AGENCY IT'S REALLY PERSONALITY.
6 ALSO SAMTRANS WE HAVE ACTUALLY DONE A BUS PRIORITY. WE LOOKED
7 AT ONE OF OUR MAJOR CORRIDORS EL CAMINO REAL, AND THAT'S ONE
8 OF THE PROJECTS RECOMMENDED, VTA, BECAUSE WE LOOKED AT VTA FOR
9 EL CAMINO REAL, WE DID THE SAME THING IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT
10 HOTSPOTS, WE WANTED TO APPLY AND POTENTIALLY USE THAT IN OUR
11 OWN SITUATION. SO, I WANT TO THANK, ACTUALLY, THE REMINDER
12 THAT JOEL SAID, THAT THERE IS A BUS PRIORITY GROUP THAT'S
13 REALLY IMPORTANT THAT FORUM. THAT'S THE FORUM TO REALLY WORK
14 TOGETHER IT'S NOT JUST TRANSIT AGENCY IT'S CALTRANS. IT'S THE
15 CITY, WE ALL WORK TOGETHER. UNLIKE JEFF IN SAN FRANCISCO, A
16 NUMBER OF US DON'T HAVE THE OVERSIGHT OF THE STREET. WE REALLY
17 NEED TO WORK TOGETHER WITH THE CITIES, BUT WE, YOU KNOW, A
18 NUMBER OF THE MAJOR CORRIDORS WE ALSO NEED TO WORK WITH
19 CALTRANS I THINK THAT PARTNERSHIP IS REALLY IMPORTANT AND
20 REALLY WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK CAROLYN
21 ASKED A QUESTION, AND I WAS JUST MORE IN, YOU KNOW, MAYBE MORE
22 INTERESTED IN -- WE DON'T HAVE TO GO INTO IT. BUT IN TERMS OF
23 THE CALTRANS STUDY, BOTH -- OR THE EFFORTS, BOTH AT THE STATE
24 LEVEL AND THE REGIONAL LEVEL, MAKING SURE THE RIGHT FOLKS ARE
25 ACTUALLY AT THE TABLE AND PROVIDING INPUT. THANK YOU.



APRIL 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, APRIL. SEAMUS AND
3 JEFF.

4

5 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** THANKS. CONGRATULATIONS ON THE OUTCOMES HERE.
6 JUST REALLY IMPRESSIVE STORY. ECHO DENIS'S POINT ABOUT HOW
7 SPEED AND TRAVEL TIME IMPROVEMENTS CAN LEAD TO INCREASED
8 RIDERSHIP AND RESTORED RIDERSHIP IN THIS CASE. ABSOLUTELY TRUE
9 I'M WONDERING THE DATA SOURCES FOR TRAVEL TIME IMPROVEMENTS
10 WHAT DO YOU LOOK AT WHEN YOU USE THOSE METRICS?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. WE TYPICALLY USE OUR GTS BASED TRIP TRAVEL
13 TIME WE LOOK AT TRIP TRAVEL TIME BEFORE AND WE FORTUNATELY
14 HAVE A ROBUST DASHBOARD THAT CAN ALLOW US TO MEASURE TIME OF
15 DAY, DAY OF THE WEEK, HOW THINGS CHANGE WHEN WE MADE THE
16 CHANGES. SO IT'S ULTIMATELY USING AVL SYSTEM, GPS TO MEASURE
17 WHAT'S GOING ON.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** JEFF?

20

21 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SO, WE HAVE MADE INCREDIBLY RAPID PROGRESS ON
22 TRANSIT PRIORITY TREATMENT DESPITE SUFFERING THE WORST
23 FINANCIAL CRISIS IN OUR AGENCY HISTORY BECAUSE SAVING TRANSIT
24 TIME IS LIKE PRINTING MONEY. GETTING 15% IMPROVEMENT IN
25 TRANSIT SPEED MEANS 15% MORE CAPACITY AND MORE FREQUENCY AT



APRIL 22, 2024

1 NO-COST. THESE ARE LOW-COST INVESTMENTS THAT RAPIDLY PAY FOR
2 THEMSELVES. I HOPE THAT ALL OF THE BAY COUNTY CONGESTION
3 MANAGEMENT AGENCIES AS WELL AS MTC ARE REALLY PAYING
4 ATTENTION. THE SECOND THING THAT I WOULD SAY IS THAT THE WORST
5 DELAY MUNI IS STILL EXPERIENCING HAVE TO DO WITH FREEWAY ON
6 AND OFF-RAMPS PARTICULARLY AROUND THE BAY BRIDGE. FREEWAY AND
7 BRIDGE DELAY ARE POLICY CHOICE WE'RE ACTIVELY DECIDING THAT
8 TRANSIT DOESN'T MATTER AND I WOULD URGE THIS GROUP TO TAKE A
9 STRONG POLICY STANCE THAT METRIC FOR MANAGING BRIDGES AND
10 FREEWAYS IS THE MOVEMENT OF PEOPLE AND GOODS. KEY METRIC
11 SHOULD BE PERSON THROUGHPUT BECAUSE WHEN WE ALLOW CONGESTION
12 TO JAM UP THE BAY BRIDGE IT DRAMATICALLY REDUCES THE NUMBER OF
13 PEOPLE THAT THE BRIDGE CAN MOVE IN ALL MODES OF TRANSPORTATION
14 AND THAT'S ESPECIALLY TRUE WHEN WE ALLOW BUSES TO BE STUCK IN
15 CONGESTION ON OUR REGIONAL NETWORK.

16
17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS, JEFF. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? I'M
18 NOT SEEING ANY. I HAD JUST A COUPLE. FIRST, LET ME JUST
19 CONGRATULATE YOU, JOEL, AND MICHAEL, YOU AND I DON'T KNOW EACH
20 OTHER, BUT I AM CERTAINLY EXPOSED TO DEL ROSARIO QUITE OFTEN
21 BUT VERY WELL DONE TO SHED LIGHT ON IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE ARE
22 MAKING ON TRANSIT PRIORITIES IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND I WOULD
23 ENCOURAGE EVERYBODY AT THIS DAIS UP HERE TO -- IF YOU WERE
24 PAYING ATTENTION, I KNOW WE ALL WERE TO MR. ROADS'S STATEMENT,
25 HE SAID LET'S NOT WAIT FOR THE PERFECT. AND IT'S EVIDENT WE'RE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 NOT WAITING FOR THE MOON AND STARS TO ALIGN TO START DOING
2 SOMETHING TO MAKE IT BETTER AND IT ISN'T GOING TO BE PERFECT
3 BUT IT'S MOVEMENT IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND I KNOW I HAVE
4 TALKED WITH JEFF ABOUT THAT AND MANY OTHERS ON THIS DAIS AND
5 ANDY FROM MTC, YOU KNOW, PERFECT IS THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD, SO
6 LET'S GET GOING ON THIS. SO, I APPRECIATED THAT COMMENT, MR.
7 ROADS. TO YOU, MR. SCHAFFER, I WANTED TO CIRCLE BACK TO WHAT
8 MR. TUMLIN JUST SAID ABOUT PERSON THROUGHPUT AND THEN
9 CROSSWALK IT BACK. YOU KNOW, I'M ON -- I HAPPEN TO BE IN THIS
10 MEETING ON A STATEWIDE INITIATIVE ON TRANSIT, AND NEVER ONCE
11 DID THE CONCEPT COME UP THAT THEY WERE WORKING ON A TRANSIT
12 PRIORITY POLICY. NOT ONCE. AND, SO, I WOULD LIKE TO GET THAT
13 FRAMEWORK, AT LEAST -- YOU KNOW, AND I CAN CERTAINLY GET IT
14 FROM TOKES, AND SEE IF THEY COULD SHARE THAT IT WOULD BE
15 INTERESTING TO SEE IF IT REFERENCED WHAT JEFF JUST SAID,
16 PERSON THROUGHPUT. THAT SHOULD BE PART OF THAT STATEWIDE
17 TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY, SHOULD BE UNDERPINNING IN THAT
18 POLICY. AND I DON'T KNOW IF IT IS. FIRST I HEARD THAT I WERE
19 MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION, BUT IT'S CERTAINLY TIMELY
20 INFORMATION. I'M NOT THE ONLY PERSON ON THIS COMMITTEE OR
21 SERIES OF MEETINGS HERE, BUT IT WOULD BE GOOD FOR US TO
22 UNDERSTAND THAT A LITTLE BIT AS THESE MEETINGS UNFOLD THERE.
23 SO, WHATEVER YOU CAN SHARE, WITHOUT PUTTING YOURSELF IN A BAD
24 POSITION, AND FROM A CONFIDENCE, IF IT'S A DRAFT OR ANYTHING.
25 ANYWAY, THANKS FOR THE WORK DO YOU ON THIS JOEL AND THANK YOU



APRIL 22, 2024

1 MR. RHODES AND DEL ROSARIO. WELL DONE. OKAY WHY DON'T WE MOVE
2 ON TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM. A VERY NICE LEAD HERE INTO THIS
3 AGENDA ITEM, MR. SCHAFFER. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER B THIS IS AN
4 ACTION ITEM FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL THIS IS APPROVAL OF
5 APPROXIMATELY \$18 MILLION IN FUNDING FOR NEAR-TERM QUICK-BUILD
6 TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, TAKE INTO
7 CONTEXT OF WHAT SCHAFFER AND ROADS AND DEL ROSARIO JUST WALKED
8 US THROUGH, JOEL YOU'RE GOING TO WALK US THROUGH THIS ITEM.
9 AND AGAIN THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM FOR THE COUNCIL TO TAKE A
10 VOTE ON. JOEL?

11

12 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. IF WE COULD GET THE
13 SLIDES? THANK YOU. SO, NOW WE'LL DIVE INTO A BIT MORE DETAIL
14 ON THE BUS ACCELERATED INFRASTRUCTURE DELIVERY PROGRAM WHICH
15 WE MENTIONED IN THE PREVIOUS DECK. SO, AS A REFRESHER, THIS IS
16 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN INITIATIVE TO REDUCE
17 TRANSIT TRAVEL TIMES AND IMPROVE TRANSIT RELIABLE EMPHASIZES
18 NEAR-TERM OR QUICK-BUILD SOLUTIONS AT PROBLEM HOTSPOT
19 LOCATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED BY TRANSIT OPERATORS. AT
20 THE PRESENT TIME IT'S COMPRISED OF \$30 MILLION IN TOTAL
21 FUNDING HALF OF THAT IS LOCAL FUNDS EXCHANGE FUNDS AND OTHER
22 HALF IS FEDERAL FUNDS, STA, OBAG THREE AND STP CMAQ. THIS
23 EFFORT STARTED OFF LAST SUMMER WE INTERVIEWED ALL OF THE LIGHT
24 RAIL OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND INTRODUCED THEM TO
25 THE BUS PROGRAM WHICH WAS BRAND-NEW AT THE TIME, DISCUSSED



APRIL 22, 2024

1 CHALLENGES THEY FACE WHEN IMPLEMENTING TRANSIT PRIORITY
2 HISTORICALLY AND CURRENTLY THEN START INVENTORY OF HOTSPOT
3 LOCATIONS THAT COULD BE POINTS OR SEGMENTS THAT HAVE TRANSIT
4 RELIABILITY ISSUES OR SLOW TRANSIT TRAVEL TIMES THAT COULD
5 BENEFIT FROM THESE QUICK-BUILD PROJECTS. THAT EFFORT DID
6 RESULT IN INVENTORY OF 87 HOTSPOT LOCATIONS THAT WERE
7 IDENTIFIED FOR POTENTIAL IMPROVEMENT. THAT'S WHAT'S SHOWN IN
8 THE MAP HERE. WE DID DIVIDE IT UP INTO HIGHER RIDER -- WHEN
9 WE'RE CALLING HIGHER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS AND LOWER RIDERSHIP
10 OPERATORS SPLIT THERE OUR THRESHOLD FOR THOSE TWO IS 500,000
11 RIDERS PER MONTH. SO, THE HIGHER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS ARE
12 SAMTRANS, VTA, AC TRANSIT, AND SFMTA AND LOWER RIDERSHIP
13 OPERATORS ARE THE OTHER 16 OR 17 IN THE BAY AREA. THESE
14 HOTSPOT PROJECTS WENT THROUGH TWO STAGE SCREENING PROCESS.
15 FIRST STAGE OF THIS WAS DEVELOPMENT OF SCORING CRITERIA TO
16 ACTUALLY SCORE THOSE 87 LOCATIONS. YOU MAY RECALL OUR LAST
17 PRESENTATION ON THIS BODY ON THE BusAID PROGRAM WAS RELATED TO
18 THESE SCORING CRITERIA AS THEY WERE IN DEVELOPMENT. SO, JUST
19 QUICKLY GOING THROUGH THEM AGAIN. THE FIRST CATEGORY WHICH HAS
20 THE HIGHEST RATING IS ACTUALLY VERY RELATED TO THAT PERSON
21 THROUGHPUT CONVERSATION THAT WE WERE JUST TALKING ABOUT, IT
22 LOOKS IT'S TOTAL RIDERSHIP PASSING THROUGH THE HOTSPOT
23 LOCATION BASED ON VEHICLE LOADS AND THE NUMBER OF TRIPS THAT
24 PASS THROUGH THAT LOCATION. WE ALSO LOOKED AT THE POTENTIAL
25 FOR DELAY REDUCTION BY APPLYING A TREATMENT AT THAT LOCATION



APRIL 22, 2024

1 BASED ON WHAT THE TREATMENT ITSELF IS. SO, IT'S -- MULTIPLE
2 THE TWO THROUGHPUT BY POTENTIAL DELAY REDUCTION YOU HAVE
3 CALCULATION FOR TOTAL PERSON DELAY THAT YOU COULD REDUCE AT
4 THAT LOCATION FIRST CATEGORY HAS THE HIGHEST WAITING. NEXT
5 VERY IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION FOR THE PROGRAM LOOKS AT
6 RIDERSHIP DEMOGRAPHICS WHO IS ACTUALLY AFFECTED BY A PROJECT
7 IF IT WERE TO BE BUILT AND THE RELATIONSHIP OF THE PROJECT
8 SITE TO EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. AND THEN, FINALLY, ALSO
9 TYING THIS INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE PRIORITY
10 DEVELOPMENT AREAS. SO, AGAIN, THIS WAS WHAT WE WENT OVER IN
11 DECEMBER. BUT WE APPLIED THESE TO THOSE 87 HOTSPOT LOCATIONS
12 THAT YOU SAW ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE. AND THAT RESULTED IN 24,
13 WE'LL CALL IT HIGH-SCORING PROJECTS. SO, AS I MENTIONED ON THE
14 PREVIOUS SLIDE, WE SPLIT OUT PROJECTS INTO THOSE IDENTIFIED BY
15 HIGH RIDERSHIP OPERATORS AND THOSE IDENTIFIED BY LOWER
16 RIDERSHIP OPERATORS AND THAT WAS SO WE COULD SET DIFFERENT
17 THRESHOLDS BETWEEN THE TWO, ON THE SLIDE THE THRESHOLD FOR
18 HIGHER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS NEEDED SCORE OF 40 POINTS OR MORE
19 IN ORDER TO ADVANCE OR BE CONSIDERED FOR HIGH-PERFORMANCE
20 PROJECT WHEREAS LOWER RIDERSHIP PROJECTS THRESHOLD AT 30
21 POINTS INTENT IS ENSURE INVESTMENTS AND PROJECTS BENEFITTING
22 OPERATORS OF ALL SIZES. SO, THIS'S A LOT ON THAT. SO, I DON'T
23 NEED TO GO INTO TOO MUCH MORE DETAIL BUT 14 OF THE PROJECTS
24 IDENTIFIED BY HIGH RIDERSHIP OPERATORS HIT THAT THRESHOLD AND
25 TEN IDENTIFIED BY THE LOWER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS HIT THAT



APRIL 22, 2024

1 THRESHOLD AND YOU CAN SEE THAT IN THE MAP THERE. SO, AFTER
2 STAGE ONE, WE SHIFTED INTO SECOND STAGE OF THE SCREENING
3 PROCESS, WHICH WE CALLED THE FEASIBILITY READINESS ASSESSMENT.
4 SO THOSE 24 PROJECTS MENTIONED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE THEY WERE
5 INVITED TO SUBMIT A FEASIBILITY READINESS ASSESSMENT WHICH
6 INCLUDED QUESTIONS RELATED TO PROJECT COST, DELIVERY PHASE,
7 AND HOW MUCH POTENTIAL FOR QUICK-BUILD IMPLEMENTATION,
8 SCHEDULE RISK, PROJECT SCALEABILITY, SUPPORT AND COORDINATION
9 OUT THERE, HAS SPONSOR BEEN IDENTIFIED OR DELIVERY AGENCY WHAT
10 KIND OF ASSISTANCE LOTS OF IN THE WEEDS QUESTIONS ABOUT THESE
11 PROJECTS. A COUPLE OF IMPORTANT THINGS TO NOTE IS OF THOSE 24
12 PROJECTS ALL COUNTIES HAD AT LEAST ONE QUALIFYING PROJECT THAT
13 ADVANCED TO THIS STEP, HOWEVER, THE NORTH BAY AGENCIES
14 DEFERRED SUBMISSION AT THIS POINT, SO THAT THEY COULD FURTHER
15 DEVELOP PROJECTS THAT JUST WEREN'T QUITE READY TO ADVANCE
16 PROJECTS AT THIS TIME. AND, SO, WHAT WE DID END UP WITH IS 13
17 PROJECT SUBMISSIONS, AND YOU CAN SEE KIND OF THE SPLIT BETWEEN
18 THE SIX DIFFERENT OPERATORS THAT PROVIDED SUBMISSIONS. AND
19 THESE SUBMISSIONS WERE ASSESSED BY A FEASIBILITY READINESS
20 PANEL WHICH CONSISTED OF MTC STAFF, BART STAFF, AND CALTRANS
21 STAFF. AND, SO, THIS KIND OF LEADS INTO THE PRINCIPLES THAT
22 INFORMED THE FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS. SO, WE WANTED TO ENSURE
23 OPERATOR DIVERSITY. SO WE SET A MAXIMUM OF TWO PROJECTS,
24 AND/OR \$5 MILLION AWARDED TO ANY INDIVIDUAL OPERATOR. WE'RE
25 ALSO PROPOSING NOT SPENDING ALL OF THE 30 MILLION RIGHT NOW.



APRIL 22, 2024

1 AND THAT'S TO RESERVE FUNDING FOR THE FUTURE FOR PROJECTS THAT
2 DEFERRED, LIKE THE NORTH BAY PROJECTS THAT I MENTIONED AND
3 SOME SPECIFICALLY CALLED OUT HERE IN THIS TABLE. SO, WE WANTED
4 TO SAVE MONEY FOR PROJECTS THAT DEFERRED AND/OR PROJECTS STILL
5 IN DEVELOPMENT. FINALLY, WE WANTED TO EMPHASIZE QUICK-BUILD,
6 MENTIONED IN THE FIRST SLIDE, WHILE ALSO SUPPORTING SOME
7 PROJECTS AT THE PLANNING OR DESIGN PHASE. SO, ALL OF THESE
8 PRINCIPLES WENT INTO THE DRAFT FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH
9 ARE HERE. SO, WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING ARE FUNDING EIGHT PROJECTS,
10 SUBMITTED BY SIX DIFFERENT OPERATORS LISTED HERE. I WON'T GO
11 THROUGH EVERY LINE ITEM HERE. BUT, I THINK THE IMPORTANT
12 THINGS TO POINT OUT ARE THE VARIETY OF THE TYPES OF PROJECTS,
13 SO YOU WILL SEE SOME ARE TRADITIONAL TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY,
14 SOME ARE CLOUD-BASED OR NEXT GENERATION TRANSIT SIGNAL
15 PRIORITY, OTHERS ARE BOARDING ISLANDS, OR STOP RECONFIGURATION
16 PROJECTS AND OTHERS INCLUDE THINGS LIKE COLORIZED TRANSIT
17 LANES. SO THESE PROJECTS TRULY PULL A LOT OF THE DIFFERENT
18 TRANSIT PRIORITY TOOLS OUT OF THE TOOLKIT. AND OTHER THING TO
19 HIGHLIGHT IS THAT TWO OF THE OPERATORS HERE ARE LOWER
20 RIDERSHIP OPERATORS, AND SO, THAT'S -- OR, I SHOULD SAY TWO OF
21 THE PROJECTING PRIMARILY BENEFIT LOWER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS,
22 AND THAT'S THE MONUMENT CORRIDOR PROJECT IN THE CITY OF
23 CONCORD SERVED BY CAN'T CONNECTION, AND THEN THE ALVARADO
24 PROJECT UNION CITY TRANSIT. SO TOTAL ABOUT 18 MILLION BEING
25 PROPOSED FOR FUNDING. SO, IN TERMS OF APPROVAL AND NEXT STEPS,



APRIL 22, 2024

1 THE REQUESTED ACTION TODAY WOULD BE RNM COUNCIL APPROVAL OF
2 THESE DRAFT FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS. IF THAT WERE TO HAPPEN,
3 THE NEXT STEPS AFTER THAT WOULD BE WE WOULD GO TO THE
4 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IN MAY, FOLLOWED BY THE
5 RNM COMMITTEE, ALSO IN MAY, AND THEN FINALLY THE MTC
6 COMMISSION IN MAY. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS FOR THE PROJECTS
7 THEMSELVES, PROJECTS THAT ARE FUNDED ARE ANTICIPATED TO BE
8 COMPLETED IN THE NEXT 1 TO 3 YEARS. EMPHASIS ON THIS IS QUICK-
9 BUILD IT WILL INCLUDE PRE AND POST IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION
10 SO WE CAN QUANTIFY AND EVALUATE PROJECT BENEFITS AT EACH OF
11 THESE LOCATIONS. WE ARE RESERVING 12 MILLION FOR FUTURE
12 FUNDING ROUNDS. THIS IS NOT THE END-ALL, BE-ALL ONLY FUNDING
13 ROUND. WE DID RESERVE FUNDING FOR FUTURE ROUNDS AS ADDITIONAL
14 PROJECTS BECOME READY. THEN THERE WILL BE CONTINUED
15 COORDINATION WITH VARIOUS MTC TRANSIT PRIORITY EFFORTS. SO
16 WITH THAT THAT'S ALL I HAVE GOT FOR YOU AND CAN TURN IT OVER
17 FOR ANY QUESTIONS

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION MR.
20 SCHAFFER. WE HAVE AN ACTION ITEM IN FRONT OF US FOR
21 APPROXIMATELY \$18.3 MILLION FOR AUTHORIZATION FOR THE PRIORITY
22 PROJECTS HERE. SO, THAT'S FIRST. SECOND, JUST TO MAKE SURE
23 WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE, MR. SCHAFFER, THE RESERVING 12
24 MILLION, THE \$12 MILLION ALLOCATION WILL COME BACK TO THIS
25 COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL PRIOR TO AUTHORIZATIONS PER PROJECT? OR



APRIL 22, 2024

1 SHOULD I ASK -- JOEL, YOU'RE OFF THE HOOK ON THAT ONE.

2 MELANIE?

3

4 **MELANIE CHOY:** CORRECT. WHAT WE'LL BE ESTABLISH SUGGEST A
5 FUTURE PROCESS IN SIX MONTHS TO ONE YEAR IN TERMS OF
6 SOLICITING PROJECTS THAT ARE READY ONCE WE DO THAT AT STAFF
7 LEVEL WE'LL GO BACK THROUGH THE SAME PROCESS.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** FOR THE REMAINING 12 MILLION. I WANT TO
10 MAKE SURE THAT OUR COUNCIL MEMBERS KNEW THAT YOU'RE NOT
11 GETTING AUTHORIZATION TO ALLOCATE THE 12 MILLION OUT AS OF
12 YET. IT'S GOT TO COME BACK TO THIS BOARD. WE HAVE AN ACTION
13 ITEM IN FRONT OF US, MADAM CLERK. LET'S SEE IF THERE IS A
14 MOTION AND SECOND FIRST.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** MOVE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE HAVE A MOTION FROM MULLIGAN. AND A
19 SECOND FROM WHELAN. OKAY. LET'S JUST PAUSE THERE A SECOND.
20 MADAM CLERK, HOW ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, EITHER IN
21 THE ROOM OR VIRTUALLY?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED ON
24 ZOOM, NO SPEAKER CARDS ON THIS ITEM AND NOTHING RECEIVED IN
25 HIGH. THE.



APRIL 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. VERY GOOD. HOW ABOUT DISCUSSION,
3 CONCERNS, EPIPHANIES FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MR. HURSH, AC
4 TRANSIT.

5

6 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I APPRECIATE EPC WAS A CRITERIA, AND I
7 APPRECIATE THE WHOLE 50 MILLION IS NOT SPENT BECAUSE I WOULD
8 LIKE US TO USE THE FIRST STEP TO VALIDATE OUR CRITERIA WORKED.
9 I ACTUALLY WOULD HAVE ARGUED FOR HIGHER RANKING FOR APC, AND
10 MAYBE THIS IS TOO GRANULAR, ARE THERE ANY PROJECTS THAT WERE
11 YES EPC, YES PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT BUT DIDN'T MAKE THE CUT FOR
12 OTHER REASONS? PROJECT READY, ENVIRONMENT, ANYTHING LIKE THAT?
13 DID WE SKIP OVER ANY EPC. I JUST WANT TO SUPPORT EPC RANKING
14 WORKED.

15

16 **JOEL SCHAFFER:** YEAH. PROBABLY, OUT OF THE 87 -- THAT WHOLE
17 BATCH OF PROJECTS, INITIALLY, THERE ARE SOME PROJECTS THAT
18 SCORED QUITE WELL IN EQUITY CATEGORY, BUT MAYBE ARE LOW
19 RIDERSHIP OR THERE WASN'T A LOT OF POTENTIAL FOR DELAY
20 REDUCTION AND BECAUSE THAT WAS THE LARGEST CATEGORY WEIGHTED
21 AT 60%, THEY MAY HAVE GOTTEN ALL EQUITY POINTS BUT NOT MANY OF
22 THE OTHER, SO, MAYBE THEY DIDN'T HIT THAT THRESHOLD TO ADVANCE
23 FURTHER. THAT'S A POSSIBILITY. BUT THAT DIDN'T GENERALLY
24 HAPPEN TOO MUCH.

25



APRIL 22, 2024

1 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I'M GOING TO SUPPORT FOR THE REASONS THAT YOU
2 GAVE, UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES, I WANT TO ENSURE WE'RE TRANCE
3 PART AND DELIBERATE ABOUT THAT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GREAT COMMENT MICHAEL. OTHER COMMENTS?
6 WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECONDS. NANCY WHELAN, MARIN TRANSIT.

7

8 **NANCY WHELAN:** I WANT TO MAKE COMPLAINT. THANK YOU. IT'S GREAT
9 TO SEE THIS CRITERIA LAID OUT THE WAY IT HAS BEEN IT'S PRETTY
10 TRANSPARENT. I AGREE WITH MIKE'S COMMENTS ABOUT LOOKING AT
11 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES IN THE FUTURE, BUT ALSO BECAUSE
12 YOU -- YOU KNOW, 87 APPLICATIONS, I THINK YOU DID A GREAT JOB
13 OF SORTING THROUGH ALL OF THOSE IN A FAIRLY RAPID TIME FRAME,
14 BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT THOSE THAT CAME THROUGH BEFORE,
15 LIKE YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT, WOULD HAVE -- YEAH, HAVE SOME
16 CONSIDERATION, AS MOVE FORWARD INTO THE NEXT ROUND, AS YOU
17 HAVE SAID, THERE ARE A LOT OF THEM THAT ARE UNDER DEVELOPMENT
18 AND I THINK WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY STILL HAVE ANOTHER
19 SHOT AT IT EVEN IF WE REDO THE CRITERIA. SO THAT'S MY COMMENT.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS, NANCY.
23 OKAY I'M NOT SEEING FURTHER DISCUSSION FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS.
24 WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE.
25 [AYES]



APRIL 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR:** ANY IN OPPOSITION? OKAY. MADAM CLERK, IT PASSES
3 UNANIMOUSLY. WHICH CONCLUDES AGENDA ITEM NUMBER -- I BELIEVE,
4 MADAM CLERK, THAT WAS 4B. AND WE ARE MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM
5 NUMBER 4C. AND THIS IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
6 PERFORMANCE MEASURES. AND SO THIS IS GOING TO BE A STAFF LED
7 DISCUSSION ON OUR PERFORMANCE MEASURES. AND I WOULD REMIND THE
8 COUNCIL MEMBERS HERE AT THE DAIS THAT DIRECTOR CHOY BROUGHT
9 THIS ITEM IN FRONT OF THIS COUNCIL, I THINK, JUST AS THE PRIOR
10 COUNCIL MEETING A MONTH AGO, JUST TO TAKE OUR TEMPERATURES AND
11 SEE IF WE'RE HEADED IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND I THINK THERE
12 WAS PRETTY REQUESTED SUPPORT THAT THIS ITEM WAS HEADED IN THE
13 RIGHT DIRECTION AT THAT PARTICULAR MOMENT IN TIME. SO THIS IS
14 AN ACTION ITEM THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE ASKED TO APPROVE I'LL
15 TURN IT OVER TO ALLISON? OR MELANIE YOU WANT TO FRAME IT UP?

16

17 **MELANIE CHOY:** I WOULD LIKE TO FRAME IT UP. THANK YOU EVERYONE
18 FOR YOUR COMMENTS LAST MONTH AND STAKEHOLDERS WHO HAVE SPENT
19 TIME EVALUATING AND ENGAGING IN THIS PROVIDING COMMENTS THE
20 FEEDBACK THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED HAS BEEN ESSENTIAL IN TERMS OF
21 ESTABLISHING THE METRICS. AND CAPTURES VARIOUS VIEW POINTS
22 ABOUT THE SYSTEM AND LOOK AT THE SYSTEM AND INCORPORATES INTO
23 THE WORK. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE VALUED ENGAGEMENT.
24 STARTING POINT WILL ITERATIVELY EVOLVE AS WE HAVE TODAY. WE
25 ANTICIPATE TO COME BACK WITH CHANGES AS NEEDED AS WE START



APRIL 22, 2024

1 COLLECTING AND REPORTING ON THE DATA AND ELEMENTS WE ARE
2 COMMITTED TO MAKING STEP WISE CHANGES TO METRICS AS THEY
3 EVOLVE THIS IS A KEY PIECE FOLDING INTO WHAT WE ARE PRESENTING
4 TODAY. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT AND APPRECIATE THE TRANSIT
5 AGENCY STAFF. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF HEAVY LIFTING AND A LOT
6 OF DISCUSSIONS THAT WENT INTO THIS AND BRINGING IT TO YOU IN A
7 SIMPLE MANNER. WE WORKED CLOSELY WITH TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF,
8 REPRESENTING TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF INVOLVED THROUGHOUT THE
9 STAGES, TAKING FEEDBACK LAST MONTH AND HELPING US TRANSLATE IT
10 TO PRESENT WITH UPDATED METRICS BASED ON COMMENTS. I'M GOING
11 TO HAND IT OVER TO ALLISON TO HIGHLIGHT CHANGES THAT WERE MADE
12 BETWEEN LAST MONTH'S PRESENTATION AND TODAY FOR YOUR APPROVAL.
13

14 **ALLISON QUACH:** THANK YOU MELANIE. ALLISON QUACH MTC TRANSIT
15 TRANSFORMATION COORDINATOR. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT ATTACHMENT A
16 IN YOUR PACKET THAT SUMMARIZES MANY OF THE COMMENTS WE
17 RECEIVED LAST MONTH AS WELL AS STAFF RESPONSES AND
18 RECOMMENDATIONS THEN ATTACHMENTS IN DETAIL ON THE PERFORMANCE
19 MEASURES WE'RE GOING TO SUMMARIZE IN THIS PRESENTATION TODAY.
20 JUST AS A REMINDER ALL OF THIS IS ROOTED IN THE RNM MISSION
21 WHICH IS TO DRIVE TRANSFORMATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS IN THE
22 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR THE REGION BAY AREA TRANSIT.
23 PERFORMANCE MEASURES WILL BE USED TO MEASURE THE SUCCESS OF
24 THE FRAMEWORK IN DELIVERING OUTCOMES AND YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT
25 JUST DOING THIS TO LOOK AT METRICS, BUT WE'RE REALLY USING



APRIL 22, 2024

1 THIS DATA TO CONTINUOUSLY IMPROVE UPON THE REGIONAL NETWORK
2 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. WHAT WE'RE DOING, AS MELANIE KIND OF
3 MENTIONED IN THE INTRODUCTION IS TO ESTABLISH KIND OF A NEAR-
4 TERM APPROACH AND WE'RE COMMITTING TO EVOLVING THESE
5 PERFORMANCE MEASURES IN OUR REPORTING, OVER TIME, AS WE'LL
6 SHARE LATER IN THE PRESENTATION. SO, PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE
7 ORGANIZED INTO TWO TYPES OF MEASURES. TYPE ONE, TRANSIT RIDER
8 OUTCOMES PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE EXPERIENCE OF RIDERS ON
9 TRANSIT IN THE REGION, AND THESE MEASURES ARE ALSO GOING TO
10 HELP TO TELL THE STORY OF THE IMPACT AND BENEFITS OF THE
11 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT ACTIVITIES FOR RIDERS. TYPE II
12 MEASURES PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO HOW WELL TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN
13 THE RNM FRAMEWORK ARE WORKING OVERALL TO DELIVER ON THE
14 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND ON THE RNM COUNCIL'S
15 WORKPLAN. THIS CATEGORY CONSISTS OF MEASURES OF WORKPLAN
16 ACHIEVEMENTS AND ASSESSMENTS OF THE RNM CAPABILITIES AND NEEDS
17 AS WELL AS OVERVIEW OF REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SO, THIS
18 SLIDE OUTLINES TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOME MEASURES. AND WHAT'S
19 PRESENTED HERE IN THE ORANGE TEXT ARE CHANGES THAT WE HAVE
20 INCORPORATED BASED ON FEEDBACK RECEIVED LAST MONTH. WITHIN THE
21 RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORY ARE FOUR SUBCATEGORIES OF PRIORITIES
22 FOR RIDERS, RELIABILITY, CONNECTIVITY, EQUITY, AND SAFETY AND
23 COMFORT. AS A REMINDER, THE METRICS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED ON
24 THIS SLIDE ARE THOSE THAT CAN BE MEASURES USING EXISTING DATA
25 SOURCES OR FROM A REGIONAL RIDER SURVEY, SO WE CAN HEAR



APRIL 22, 2024

1 DIRECTLY FROM RIDERS HOW WE'RE DOING IN THOSE AREAS. WE WILL
2 BE REPORTING ON THESE METRICS WITHIN THE BROADER CONTEXT OF
3 HOW TRANSIT OPERATORS TRANSIT OPERATES, ACKNOWLEDGING FACTORS
4 OUTSIDE OF THE CONTROL OF OPERATORS AND MTC THAT MAY AFFECT
5 PERFORMANCE. THE SECOND TABLE BE ON THIS SLIDE OUTLINES
6 MEASURES FOCUSED SPECIFICALLY ON BENEFITS TO RIDERS FROM RNM
7 ACTIVITIES. EXAMPLES HERE WE HAVE LISTED INITIATIVES SUCH AS
8 CLIPPER BAY PASS, REGIONAL MAPPING AND FINDING PROJECT,
9 BusAID, WHICH YOU JUST HEARD A PRESENTATION ON, AND EFFORTS TO
10 IMPROVE REGIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS. AS A REMINDER, THESE
11 MEASURES PRESENTED ON THE SECOND TABLE ARE JUST KIND OF
12 EXAMPLES, AND THEY WILL BE TAILORED TO EACH PROGRAM OR
13 INITIATIVE. SO, THESE WILL BE ESTABLISHED AS EACH INITIATIVE
14 ADVANCES. SO, THE MEASURES THAT YOU WILL SEE ON THIS TABLE
15 WILL LIKELY EVOLVE AS THE VARIOUS INITIATIVES MOVE FORWARD.
16 AGAIN, TYPE II RNM AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS MEASURES CONSIST OF
17 THESE KIND OF SUBCATEGORIES, SO, WORKPLAN ACHIEVEMENT WHICH
18 WILL BE REPORTED BOTH QUARTERLY, WHICH WE PRESENTED FOR THE
19 FIRST TIME LAST MONTH, AS WELL AS ANNUALLY ALONGSIDE THE REST
20 OF THE PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING. A SET OF OTHER MEASURES
21 THAT PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO OPERATIONS OF RNM ARE CAPABILITIES,
22 RESOURCE NEEDS, ET CETERA, AND THEN MEASURES THAT REGIONAL
23 TRANSIT OPERATIONS, SUCH AS RIDERSHIP, PRODUCTIVITY, COST
24 EFFECTIVENESS, ET CETERA. THIS SLIDE DOES NOT HAVE SUBSTANTIVE
25 CHANGES, SINCE WE PRESENTED IT TO YOU LAST MONTH. AND THEN, AS



APRIL 22, 2024

1 I MENTIONED AT THE BEGINNING, WE ARE AIMING TO EVOLVE
2 PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING, AS THIS MOVES FORWARD, AND THIS
3 SLIDE SUMMARIZES SOME OF THE WAYS THAT WE WILL BE EVOLVING THE
4 MEASURES TO PROVIDE A HOLISTIC STORY ABOUT TRANSIT
5 PERFORMANCE. I'M NOT GOING TO READ ALL OF THE TEXT ON THIS
6 SLIDE BUT ACROSS EACH OF THE RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORIES,
7 FUTURE MEASURES SHOULD GO BEYOND OPERATOR AND MTC ACTIVITIES
8 TO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE METRICS OF CONNECTIVITY AND SAFETY AND
9 COMFORT, IN PARTICULAR. WE'LL ALSO EVOLVE FROM CURRENT METRICS
10 THAT ARE MORE AROUND AVAILABILITY, FOR EXAMPLE, REALTIME
11 INFORMATION TO MEASURE OF THE QUALITY OF THAT INFORMATION. AND
12 THEN, WE WILL ALSO BE WORKING TO IDENTIFY WAYS TO PROVIDE MORE
13 CONTEXT AROUND THE PERFORMANCE MEASURE THAT WE'RE REPORTING
14 ON. AND THE TABLE BELOW, AS PERFORMANCE MEASURES REPORTING
15 EVOLVES RNM TRANSIT OPERATION MEASURES COULD INCORPORATE OTHER
16 READILY AVAILABLE DATA FROM ND THAT WE'RE NOT PROPOSING FOR
17 THE FIRST ROUND OF REPORTING CONSIDER ELEMENTS OF COST,
18 REVENUES, SOCIETAL BENEFITS OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS SUCH AS
19 MUTUAL AID OR WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT AND THEN ALSO BROUGHT IN
20 TO INCLUDE OTHER BENEFITS TO THE REGION SUCH AS VMT REDUCTIONS
21 AND MODE SHIFT AND IN YOUR ATTACHMENT B IN YOUR PACKET HAS AN
22 I BELIEVE THAT THAT LISTS SOME OF THE SPECIFIC MEASURES THAT
23 MAY BE CONSIDERED AS WE MOVE THIS FORWARD. FOLLOWING ADOPTION
24 LATER THIS SPRING WE'LL CONTINUE TO WORK TO REFINE THE
25 MEASURES AS WELL AS TO COLLECT AND AGGREGATE AND ANALYZE THE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 DATA. WHILE WE STILL ANTICIPATE THAT WE WILL PREPARE THE FIRST
2 ANNUAL REPORT NEXT SUMMER IN 2025, THIS IS KIND OF TO KEY UP
3 THE DEVELOPMENT OF YOUR NEXT WORK, WE RECOGNIZE THE NEED TO
4 DELIVER ON PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING QUICKLY AND WHERE
5 FEASIBLE WE WILL PLAN TO BRING PRELIMINARY REPORTING ON SELECT
6 MEASURES TO YOU. TO ADDRESS THE QUESTIONS THAT WERE RAISED
7 AROUND SB125 REPORTING THAT WERE RAISED LAST MONTH, I WANT TO
8 SHARE THAT REPORTING TO THE STATE WAS COMPLETED IN DECEMBER
9 2023. REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES HAVE BEEN INCORPORATED
10 INTO OUR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AND WILL BE REPORTED
11 AS YOUR AGENCIES SUBMIT CLAIMS FOR THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR OF TDA
12 AND STA FUNDING. FOR THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
13 PERFORMANCE MEASURES THAT RELY ON REPORTING THAT OVERLAPS WITH
14 SB125 MEASURES WE'LL BE WORKING WITH OTHER MTC STAFF TO USE
15 THAT INFORMATION THAT'S SUBMITTED IN THOSE WORKBOOKS. SO,
16 TODAY WE'RE SEEKING YOUR APPROVAL OF THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES
17 AS PRESENTED IN ATTACHMENT B IN YOUR PACKET. NEXT UP, WE HAVE
18 A MEETING WITH THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER
19 ADVISORY GROUP ON FRIDAY TO SOLICIT ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK, AND
20 THEN WE'LL BE BRINGING THESE MEASURES TO THE RNM COMMITTEE IN
21 EARLY MAY FOR A DISCUSSION AND FORMAL ADOPTION. MOVING
22 FORWARD, MTC WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH YOUR STAFF TO COLLECT
23 AND AGGREGATE THE DATA, AND THIS INCLUDES, AS I ALLUDED TO
24 EARLIER, SCOPING OUT OF A REGIONAL TRANSIT CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE
25 SURVEY. AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE PLAN TO RETURN FOR YOUR



APRIL 22, 2024

1 FEEDBACK ON PRIOR IMPLEMENTATION. FINALLY, WE ALSO ANTICIPATE
2 ONGOING COORDINATION WITH STATE EFFORTS AROUND PERFORMANCE
3 MEASURE REPORTING AS APPROPRIATE. WITH THAT, THAT CONCLUDES MY
4 PRESENTATION.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION,
7 ALLISON. AGAIN, COUNCIL MEMBERS, WE HAVE AN ACTION ITEM IN
8 FRONT OF US. LET ME JUST PAUSE HERE. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A
9 SECOND ON THIS ITEM HERE? ANYBODY?

10

11 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I'LL MOVE, TUMLIN.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I GOT A MOTION FROM JEFFREY TUMLIN,
14 SFMTA, AND SECOND FROM MICHAEL HURSCH, AC TRANSIT. MADAM CLERK
15 LET'S CHECK IN WITH OUR PUBLIC VIRTUALLY OR IN THE BUILDING ON
16 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO HANDS RAISED ON ZOOM NOTHING
19 RECEIVED IN WRITING AND WE DON'T HAVE ANY SPEAKER CARDS ON
20 THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OH WE HAVE ONE PERSON ONLINE. ADINA LEVIN.
25 YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. ADINA?



APRIL 22, 2024

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** THERE WE GO. BRIEFLY, GOOD TO SEE THESE MOVING
3 FORWARD. AND, ALSO GLAD TO SEE THE INTEREST IN DELIVERING
4 WHATEVER METRICS AND RESULTS ARE AVAILABLE AS SOON AS POSSIBLE
5 AND BEFORE A YEAR FROM NOW. AS THERE IS A LOT OF INTEREST IN A
6 REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE AND GENERATING PUBLIC MOTIVATION TO
7 FUND TRANSIT. ANYTHING THAT WE ARE SEEING IN TERMS OF THE
8 PROGRESS OF THESE REGIONAL COORDINATION INITIATIVES WILL BE OF
9 HIGH INTEREST TO THE PUBLIC AND THE PUBLIC KEEPS SAYING IN
10 POLLING THAT THEY WANT TO SEE TRANSIT IMPROVING. SO, ANY DATA
11 THAT CAN BE COMMUNICATED THAT CAN HELP PEOPLE SEE THE PROGRESS
12 BEING MADE IS REALLY GOOD FOR THE ABILITY TO GET PUBLIC
13 CONFIDENCE AND PUBLIC FUNDING. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE IS NO OTHER PERSON WITH
16 THEIR HAND RAISED.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
19 AGAIN, WE HAVE AN ACTION ITEM. THE ITEM IN FRONT OF US IS THE
20 SECOND TIME WE HEARD IT. FIRST TIME IT WAS AN INFORMATIONAL
21 ITEM. ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS CONCERNS FOR MELANIE CHOY OR
22 ALLISON AND HANNAH? LET'S GO TO CAROLYN GONOT, VTA.

23

24 **CAROLYN GONOT:** ALLISON, THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE UPDATE ON
25 THIS. I KNOW I MISSED THE LAST MEETING. I ACTUALLY AM REALLY



APRIL 22, 2024

1 HAPPY TO SEE SOME OF THE STUFF ON THE EQUITY AND PRETTY MUCH
2 ADDRESSING, I THINK IT WAS ON THE TIME OF DAY, I THINK IT'S
3 CRITICAL, AND I THINK WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE THIS ON ALL THE
4 WORK WE'RE DOING ON OUR FUNDING GOING FORWARD, IS THIS, AM
5 PEAK, PM PEAK IS NOT WHAT'S HAPPENING. I WAS LOOKING AT THIS
6 THE OTHER DAY, OUR 2:00 P.M. PEAK FOR TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IT'S
7 NOT AP PEAK ANY LONGER. SO WHEN YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT MARKET
8 FOR EQUITY, WHO IS RIDING, IS THE MIDDAY SERVICE SO WHEN
9 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT RELIABLE AND CONNECTIVITY IT'S REALLY
10 GOING TO BE ARE WE PROVIDING THOSE SERVICES WHEN THOSE WORKERS
11 NEED IT, AND ARE WE ADDRESSING THE WORKERS WHO ARE GOING TO BE
12 TAKING TRANSIT? AND ARE WE ADJUSTING OUR SERVICES TO MEET THE
13 WORKERS WHO NEED TO TAKE TRANSIT AND WHO ARE TAKING TRANSIT.
14 AND THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING AND THE REASON WHY WE'RE
15 HAVING THESE PEAKS NOW AND WE'RE RECOVERING WELL. AND I THINK
16 THAT'S THE QUESTION THAT I THINK THE WHOLE REGION NEEDS TO
17 START THINKING ABOUT, IN HOW WE'RE ADJUSTING AND OUR FUNDING
18 AND HOW THINKING ABOUT HOW OUR FUNDING MOVES THROUGHOUT THE
19 REGION BECAUSE SO WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT MEASUREMENTS AND TIME OF
20 DAY, ISN'T JUST ON EQUITY IT'S ABOUT CONNECTIVITY AND IT'S
21 ABOUT RELIABILITY AND I'M AFRAID THAT WE'RE STILL REALLY
22 FOCUSED ON -- NOT STILL ON THOSE CONNECTIONS IN A COMMUTER
23 PATTERN THAT'S AM AND PM FOCUSED AND I THINK WE REALLY HAVE TO
24 DEAL WITH THAT ALL DAY PATTERN THAT'S HAPPENING NOW, I REALLY
25 APPRECIATE THAT TIME OF DAY AND I THINK IT NEEDS A BIGGER



APRIL 22, 2024

1 FOCUS NOT JUST IN EQUITY BECAUSE I THINK THAT IS A LOT OF THE
2 RIDERS RIGHT NOW AND IF WE DON'T FOCUS ON THAT, WE'RE GOING
3 HAVE A PROBLEM GOING FORWARD AND GROWING OUR RIDERSHIP.
4 THANKS.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS, CHAIR
7 LYNN. -- CAROLYN. OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS? OKAY. I'M NOT SEEING
8 ANY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. WILL ALL THOSE IN FAVOR
9 PLEASE ACKNOWLEDGE BY SAYING AYE? ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY
10 AYE. [AYES].

11

12 **CHAIR:** ABSTENTIONS? OPPOSED? NOT SEEING. MADAM CLERK, THE ITEM
13 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. AND I BELIEVE THAT COMPLETES AGENDA ITEM
14 NUMBER 4C. MY NOTES ARE RIGHT HERE. AND WHICH MOVES US TO
15 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE, AND THIS IS OUR DIRECTORS REPORT FROM
16 DIRECTOR CHOY. MELANIE, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

17

18 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. I'M GOING TO START OUT
19 WITH A PREVIEW OF WHAT'S COMING FORWARD IN THE NEXT MONTH OR
20 TWO. NEXT MAY WE'LL BE PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON THE MAPPING AND
21 WAYFINDING PILOT WE HAVE BEEN HAVING A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS AND
22 THE PROJECT TEAM IS APPRECIATIVE OF THE CONSISTENT AND REGULAR
23 ENGAGEMENT FROM YOUR STAFF ON THIS TOPIC. OF ITS BEEN
24 EXTREMELY VALUABLE IN TERMS OF OUR TECHNICAL ADVISORY, PROJECT
25 MEETINGS, I KNOW WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF MEETINGS ON THIS TOPIC



APRIL 22, 2024

1 AND IT REQUIRES A LOT OF YOUR STAFF TIME BUT IT'S BEEN HELPFUL
2 FOR US IN TERMS OF RECEIVING THIS FEEDBACK AND REFINING OUR
3 APPROACH. SO, NEXT MONTHS WE'LL PLANNING TO COME BACK TO YOU
4 AT YOUR COUNCIL MEETING WITH AN UPDATED APPROACH FOR THE PILOT
5 PROGRAM FOR MAPPING AND FINDING. THE PROJECT IS ACCEPTING
6 NOMINATIONS RIGHT NOW FOR ACCESSIBILITY WORKING GROUP AND
7 APPLICATIONS ARE DUE -- NOMINATIONS ARE DUE MARSH -- SORRY --
8 MAY 3RD, AND WE PLAN TO CONVENE THIS GROUP IN JUNE AND THAT'S
9 AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT OF THIS WORK, IN THE PERSPECTIVE AS
10 PILOTS ROLL OUT AND JUST SUBSEQUENT VERSIONS OF THE STANDARD
11 PERCENT AND DESIGN DEVELOPMENT OF THAT PROJECT. AND THEN
12 LASTLY, THERE ALSO HAS BEEN AN EVALUATION PLAN FOR THE
13 PROTOTYPE. SO, PREVIOUSLY BACK IN JANUARY WE SHARED
14 INFORMATION REGARDING THE PROTOTYPE, SO CONCURRENTLY IN
15 PARALLEL WE HAVE ALSO BEEN DEVELOPING THE EVALUATION PLAN FOR
16 THOSE PROTOTYPES SO THE PROTOTYPES ARE TWO LOCATIONS THAT
17 WE'RE ROLLING OUT AND FIRST EVALUATION PLAN IS INFORMATION
18 FROM THAT EVALUATION WILL FEED INTO THE PILOT NEXT MONTH
19 YOU'RE ALSO GOING TO GET AN UPDATE IN TERMS OF OUR ENTIRE
20 PILOT APPROACH SO LOOK FORWARD TO PRESENTING YOU WITH UPDATED
21 INFORMATION ON THAT PROJECT. THEN THE SECOND PROGRAM AREA I
22 WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT IS TWIT 2050+ THERE WAS A WORKSHOP HELD
23 ABOUT TWO WEEKS AGO ALSO WITH YOUR AGENCY AND STAFF
24 INVOLVEMENT IN OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM ON TRANSIT 2050+
25 AND THEY ARE CONTINUING TO REFINE AN EARLY DRAFT OF THE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 NETWORK 2050+ THE TRANSIT 2050+ TEAM IS ALSO WORKING TO BRING
2 FORWARD A DRAFT NETWORK INFORMED BY PROJECT PERFORMANCE
3 FINDINGS IN JUNE 2024 MEETING SO WE ANTICIPATE BRINGING THE
4 TRANSIT 2050+ BACK TO THIS GROUP AND LASTLY I WANTED TO
5 HIGHLIGHT THAT OUR COMMISSION COMMITTEE RNM COMMITTEE MAY
6 APPROVE THE APPROVAL ACTION TO EXPAND THE RV PASS PROGRAM IT'S
7 FOR INNOVATION TASK FORCE MEETING, UCSF IS EXPANDING THEIR
8 PROGRAM AND IT'S EMPLOYER BASED PROGRAM IN TERMS OF BAY PASS,
9 THAT WAS BEING OFFERED AND THERE WE TOOK ACTION LAST WEEK TO
10 EXPAND IT TO CAMPUS BASED STUDENTS AS WELL. WE'RE WORKING
11 CONTINUALLY ON EXPANDING THAT PROGRAM. THE SECOND CATEGORY OF
12 UPDATES I WOULD LIKE TO SHARE WITH ALL OF YOU IS THE TEAM
13 STAFFING UPDATES REGARDING REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT TEAM.
14 I'M EXCITED TO ANNOUNCE JASON LEE WILL BE JOINING THE RNM TEAM
15 AT THE END OF THE MONTH AS OUR NEWEST ASSISTANT DIRECTOR AND
16 BRINGS A WEALTH OF PROJECT DELIVERY OPERATIONS EXPERIENCE TO
17 THE TEAM. HE'S HERE TODAY WITH THE RNM STAFF MEMBERS. AND THE
18 MAPPING WAYFINDING PROJECT TEAM WILL BE ONE OF THE INITIATIVES
19 UNDER HIS PORTFOLIO AS PART OF A BROADER PORTFOLIO. AND JASON
20 COMES TO US FROM SFMTA MOST RECENTLY. AND WE'RE APPRECIATIVE
21 OF THE SUPPORT OF ALL YOUR AGENCIES. AND HE WAS RESPONSIBLE
22 FOR SFMTA NEXT GENERATION INFORMATION SYSTEM. HE WAS FOCUSED
23 ON IMPROVED REALTIME PREDICTIONS AND ACCURACY AND INTRODUCTION
24 OF STATE-OF-THE-ART DIGITAL SIGNS, ALSO IMPLEMENTED AMERICA'S
25 FIRST MULTI-MODAL DOOR UP MUNI TRAVEL TIMES EXCITED TO HAVE A



APRIL 22, 2024

1 BROAD TEAM OF STAFF ON THE RNM TEAM. ADDITIONALLY, I WOULD
2 ALSO LIKE TO SHARE AND WELCOME STEPHANIE HAMM AND BRIT TANNER
3 WHO ARE CURRENTLY IN THE PROCESS OF TRANSITIONING FROM MTC
4 DESIGN PROJECT DELIVERY SECTION TO THE RNM TEAM BOTH STEPHANIE
5 AND BRIT HAVE ALSO BEEN WORKING ON TRANSIT SPEED AND
6 RELIABILITY PROJECTS SUCH AS BAY BRIDGE FORWARD ALSO ARTERIAL
7 OPERATIONS AND SO WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT BRINGING THEIR
8 ACKNOWLEDGE TO THE TRANSIT PRIORITY WORK STEPHANIE BRINGS
9 REGIONAL PLANNING PROJECT DELIVERY EXPERIENCE AND BRIT WAS
10 ALSO SFMTA SHE BRINGS 23 YEARS OF EXPERIENCE FROM MUNI FORWARD
11 PROGRAM. WE'RE QUITE EXCITED. AS THEY TRANSITION TO RNM, THEIR
12 PORTFOLIO WILL CENTER ON TRANSIT PRIORITY AND PROGRAM
13 MANAGEMENT. WE'RE EVOLVING THE TEAM AND OUR PORTFOLIO OF WORK
14 SO WE'LL BE COMING BACK AND HIGHLIGHTING THE BROADER PORTFOLIO
15 THAT EACH OF THESE FOLKS WILL HAVE. AND THEN ALSO I WOULD LIKE
16 TO REITERATE THAT BILL BACON JOINED US LAST MONTH AS OUR
17 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOCUSED ON FARE INTEGRATION INITIATIVES AND
18 AS WELL BROADER INITIATIVES BEYOND FARE INTEGRATION AND THIS
19 WILL BE EVOLVING AS WE DEVELOP THE WORK PORTFOLIO. SO OUR TEAM
20 IS FULLY MOBILIZED. WE'RE EXCITED TO HIT THE GROUND AS WE COME
21 BACK TO YOU NEXT MONTH. ONE LAST THING IN CLOSING, SATURDAY I
22 ATTENDED BART'S RIDE HISTORY CELEBRATION IT'S REMARKABLE THAT
23 THE MAJORITY OF TRAIN CARS IN THE BART SUITE HAVE BEEN IN
24 SERVICE SINCE BART BEGAN IT'S AN INCREDIBLE USEFUL LIFE, 1962,
25 AND WHAT'S INSPIRING NOT ONLY OUTPOURING OF PEOPLE WHO CAME TO



APRIL 22, 2024

1 TAKE THIS LAST RIDE, THERE WERE LINES OF PEOPLE WAITING TO
2 BOARD THE LEGACY TRAINS AND IT WAS A GREAT CELEBRATORY EVENT
3 BURSTING THIS ENTHUSIASM. THERE WAS ENTHUSIASM PRESENT THROUGH
4 THE BAY AREA NOT ONLY FOR THE BART SYSTEM BUT FOR ALL SYSTEMS,
5 WHETHER FERRY, RAIL, OR BUS, BUT IT WAS A REMINDER TO ME THAT
6 THIS IS THE REASON WHY ALL OF US ARE HERE TODAY DOING WHAT
7 WE'RE DOING. I JUST WANTED TO CLOSE OUT WITH THAT COMMENT.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT REPORT, DIRECTOR
11 CHOY. MADAM CLERK, LET US GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS REPORT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON ONLINE, THAT'S CHARLIE
15 LAVERY, YOU CHARLIE, YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS AND STAFF. I
18 WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR WORK ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK
19 MANAGEMENT AND I HAVE TO CONDITION FESS I DIDN'T READ MY NOTE
20 ON THE CALENDAR AND I SHOWED UP AT MTC AT 11:00 A.M. THIS
21 MORNING BUT DULY NOTED THAT I WILL CHECK CAREFULLY NEXT TIME
22 AND I'M EXCITED TO SEE THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT TEAM
23 GETTING INTO STRIDE WITH TRANSIT PRIORITY AND ALSO TO SEE THE
24 ACCOUNTABILITY BAKED IN AT THIS MOMENT WITH THE PERFORMANCE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 METRICS, KUDOS FOR THAT, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE CUSTOMER
2 ADVISORY GROUP ON FRIDAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
5 ONLINE, THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING AND THERE IS NO
6 SPEAKER CARDS ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. ANY DISCUSSION FROM COUNCIL
9 MEMBERS ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT? YES, APRIL?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** IF I COULD JUST ADD A QUICK QUESTION.
12 FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO CONGRATULATE MELANIE AND MTC FOR
13 REALLY STAFFING UP THE TEAM, BUT JUST A CLARIFICATION. YOU
14 SAID THERE IS GOING TO BE NOMINATIONS OR APPLICATIONS GOING
15 OUT ABOUT THE ACCESSIBILITY COMMITTEE. THAT RELATED TO THE
16 WAYFINDING? NOT THE PARATRANSIT?

17

18 **MELANIE CHOY:** CORRECT THAT. IS -- WE ALSO HAVE A PARATRANSIT
19 ONE, BUT THAT IS SEPARATE. PARTICULARLY THE MAY 3RD DATE THAT
20 E-MAIL HAS BEEN OUT AND WE'RE LOOKING FOR NOMINATIONS FROM
21 TRANSIT AGENCIES.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** FOR STAFFERS OR PUBLIC MEMBERS.

24



APRIL 22, 2024

1 **MELANIE CHOY:** I THOUGHT STAFF BUT THERE ARE ALSO SOME PUBLIC
2 AT-LARGE MEMBERS AS WELL.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** OKAY THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OTHER COMMENTS FOR THE EXECUTIVE
7 DIRECTOR? DENNIS?

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MAY MAYBE THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS MORE
10 APPROPRIATE BUT YOU BROUGHT UP EMPLOYER PASS MAY THEY SHOULD
11 BE COMBINED ANYWAY. EMPLOYER PASS IT'S GREAT WE HAVE BEEN
12 SEEING EXPANDING INTEREST BUT SOMETIMES EMPLOYERS ARE REQUIRED
13 BY ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCES FACILITIES TO PROVIDE MEASURES TO
14 MAKE SURE THEIR EMPLOYEES GET TO WORK WITHOUT SINGLE OCCUPANT
15 VEHICLES, BUT SOME EMPLOYERS HAD EXTENSIVE NETWORKS FIVE YEARS
16 AGO THEY HAD EXTENSIVE ENDS PULL NETWORK AND THEY CANCELED
17 THAT TODAY THEIR PROGRAM IT SOUNDS GREAT. IT MAY BE FROM A
18 BUSINESS PERSPECTIVE ADVANTAGEOUS TO SIGN UP FOR A REGIONAL
19 PASS IT MAY BE CHEAPER THAN HAVING A VANPOOL PROGRAM IF THIS
20 IS USED TO SUPPORT VANPOOL PROGRAMS THAT WE MEASURE AFTER I
21 YEAR OR SO TO SEE WHETHER IT WAS APPROPRIATE AND DO WE
22 ACTUALLY HAVE MORE PEOPLE DRIVING ALONE EVEN AFTER WE BROUGHT
23 THIS EMPLOYER ON BOARD. JUST TO THINK ABOUT IN THE FUTURE AS
24 WE BRING ON EMPLOYERS. BECAUSE SOME HAVE OBLIGATIONS AND WE



APRIL 22, 2024

1 DON'T WANT THEM TO SAVE A LITTLE MONEY UNLESS IT HELPS GET
2 MORE PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS. JUST A THOUGHT TO KEEP IN MIND.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU DENNIS. GOOD COMMENTS. SEEING
5 NO OTHER COMMENTS THAT'S GOING TO CLOSE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
6 FIVE. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX, MADAM CLERK, THIS IS PUBLIC
7 COMMENT ON ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT WASN'T ON THE AGENDA. SO,
8 DO WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WEATHER VIRTUALLY OR IN-
9 PERSON THAT WOULD LIKE TO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER CARD. BARNEY SMITH, IF
12 YOU WOULD COME TO THE PODIUM?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS BARNEY SMITH AND I AM A TRANSIT USER AND
15 LICENSED PROFESSIONAL ENGINEER WITH 25 YEARS OF EXPERIENCE IN
16 THE TRANSIT INDUSTRY. I AM HERE TODAY TO REQUEST THAT THIS
17 COMMISSION CONSIDER SUSPENDING WITHHOLDING OR REVOKING FUNDING
18 FOR THE VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY'S VS V-2 PROJECT. VTA HAS
19 DELIBERATELY MISMANAGED THIS PROJECT LED TO CURRENT TEN YEAR
20 DELAY AND EXPLOSION OF COST OVER THE LAST THREE YEARS GROWING
21 FROM \$4 BILLION TO \$6 BILLION TO 12.7 BILLION. VTA CHIEF
22 FINANCIAL OFFICER, A YEAR AGO, POINTED TO THE LACK OF
23 TRANSPARENCY AND EFFORTS TO MISLEAD THE PUBLIC AND VTA BOARD
24 WHEN HE REPORTED THAT THE VTA HAD WAITED OVER A YEAR TO INFORM
25 THE BOARD OF COST INCREASE FROM 6 TO \$9 BILLION. AT LAST



APRIL 22, 2024

1 WEDNESDAY'S VS V-2 COMMITTEE WE SAW THE PROJECT CONTINUE TO
2 HIDE INFORMATION AND FACTS ABOUT THE NECESSARY VEHICLE
3 PROCUREMENT AND AVOID TRANSPARENCY. THE FEDERAL STATE
4 ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTS ARE COMPLETELY OUT OF DATE THE PROJECT
5 LOOKS NOTHING LIKE WHAT WAS APPROVED IN 2018. THE AMOUNT OF
6 DIRT BEING MOVED IS INCREASED BY 300%. THE NUMBER OF TRUCKING
7 TRIPS HAS GROWN BY OVER 100,000 AND COST HAS EXPLODED TO 12.7
8 BILLION. THE PROJECT IS NOW TEN YEARS LATE AND LESS SAFE THAN
9 ANY MAJOR PROJECT BUILT IN CALIFORNIA. FOR OVER THREE YEARS
10 NUMEROUS BOARD MEMBERS AND TRANSIT EXPERTS HAVE BEEN ASKING
11 FOR A TWIN BOARD TO A SINGLE BOARD COMPARISON. THE PROJECT
12 PROPOSED IS PROVIDING AN APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON LAST
13 MONTH ONLY TO PROVIDE NO UPDATE ON THEIR COMPARISON. THIS
14 APPEARS TO BE A WHITE-WASH AND SMOKE SCREEN SO THEY CAN PUSH
15 AND PROVIDE NO ACCOUNTABILITY. PLEASE CONSIDER WITHHOLDING ALL
16 FUNDING TO VTA UNTIL ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW DOCUMENTS ARE
17 UPDATED AND BOTH BOARDS AND PUBLIC ARE ABLE TO REVIEW AND
18 COMMENT ON APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON.

19
20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ONE ON ZOOM WITH
21 HAND RAISED, NO OTHER SPEAKER CARDS AND NOTHING RECEIVED IN
22 WRITING.

23
24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THAT WILL CLOSE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
25 SIX. OUR FINAL AGENDA ITEM IS NUMBER SEVEN AND NEXT MEETING SO



APRIL 22, 2024

1 WE ARE SCHEDULED TO BE MEETING ON MONDAY THE 20th OF MAY. AND
2 IT WILL BE AT 11:30 AND IT WILL BE AT MTC'S HEADQUARTERS
3 LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING EVERYBODY IN-PERSON MONDAY 20 MAY.
4 AND WITH THAT, THE MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.
5 [ADJOURNED]
6



Broadcasting Government