



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



APRIL 26, 2024

REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP

FRIDAY, APRIL 26TH, 2024, 1:00 PM

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: HI EVERYBODY. I'M GLAD TO SEE THE SUN HAS COME OUT SINCE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THIS MORNING. I WANT TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP. THE MEETING IS WEB CAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED FANNED FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS PARTICIPATING TODAY. I WANT TO WELCOME NEW MEMBER CHARLIE L, AND OLDER ADULT SAN PAT COUNTY. SO, I'M A LITTLE BIT CONFUSED BECAUSE I'M SEEING THAT THERE IS AN ANNOUNCEMENT FOR ZACK, BUT ALSO WELCOMING DAVIES OF TRANSFORM WHO WILLBE COMING AFTER. STAFF CAN EXPLAIN IT. THERE IS ONE VACANT POSITION AS A STUDENT ADVOCATE. IF THERE IS ANYONE WHO KNOWS ANYONE PLEASE RECRUIT THEM. WE'RE STARTING LATE AND WE HAVE SUBSTANTIVE ITEMS ON THE AGENDA, SO PLEASE BE AS CONCISE AS POSSIBLE. WE'LL START WITH THE FIRST ITEM WHICH IS WITH THE SUPPORT OF STAFF TO CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM.



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ZACK, ARE YOU ONLINE? I BELIEVE ZACK IS
2 NOT JOINING AND THE OTHER MEMBER IS IN ATTENDEE SHE CAN ONLY
3 SPEAK DURING PUBLIC COMMENT.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** FABULOUS. WE'LL GET TO, ABBY AS A SOMEBODY
6 WHEN SHE IS HERE. SO, ROLL CALL WILL BE WELCOME.

7

8

9

10 **>>CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM
11 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE CUSTOMER
12 ADVISORY GROUP HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER
13 MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF FIVE MEETINGS PER MONTH.
14 THIS AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING
15 FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. ROLL
16 CALL. CHAIR LEVIN.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CUSHMAN?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALAN? IS ABSENT. MEMBER BROWN?

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **HILLARY BROWN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** DEUTSCH-GROSS IS ABSENT. MEMBER ELDRED?

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FABRIS?

8

9 **DYLAN FABRIS:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GLASER?

12

13 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GRIFFITHS?

16

17 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HANKERSON?

20

21 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** KALLINS?

24

25 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LAVERY?

3

4 **CHARLIE LAVERY:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LIEU? IS ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER?

7

8 **EMILY LOPER:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PETTY?

11

12 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PIERCE? IS ABSENT. RAYMOND? IS ABSENT.

15 MEMBER SCOTT?

16

17 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** STANKE?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

24



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO DIVE INTO THE
2 FIRST SUBSTANTIVE ITEM. FIRST WE APPROVE THE MINUTES, WHICH IS
3 -- IF STAFF CAN HELP US WITH THE MINUTES APPROVAL?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YOU NEED A MOTION AND SECOND.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

8

9 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SECOND, ELDRED.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. DO WE HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THE
12 MINUTES?

13

14 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** CHAIR, DID YOU CHECK WHO WAS THE PERSON
15 WHO DID THE MOTION?

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION TAKEN BY GRIFFITH AND SECOND BY
18 ELDRED. CORRECT?

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY ANY DISCUSSION OR PUBLIC COMMENT? IF
21 NOT CAN STAFF HELP US VOTE?

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** SURE. LEVIN?

24

25 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CUSHMAN?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER BROWN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** DEUTSCH-GROSS IS ABSENT. ELDRED?

11

12 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GLASER?

15

16 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GRIFFITHS?

19

20 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HANKERSON?

23

24 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YES.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** COLLINS?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LAVERY?

6

7 **CHARLIE LAVERY:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** LIEU IS ABSENT. LOPER?

10

11 **MICHAEL LOPEZ:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PIERCE? IS ABSENT. RAYMOND DAVIS IS

14 ABSENT. MEMBER SCOTT?

15

16 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** STANKE?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

23 PRESENT.

24



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL NOW MOVE ON TO
2 THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES. THAT
3 WILL BE FOR OUR FEEDBACK TODAY. THIS ITEM WILL BE KICKED OFF
4 BY MELANIE CHOY WHO WILL HAND IT OVER TO ALLISON QUACH FOR THE
5 REMAINDER OF THE PRESENTATION.

6

7 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU. MELANIE CHOY WHAT I WANT TO DO IS
8 PROVIDE CONTEXT ON TODAY'S PRESENTATION FOR THE INITIAL RNM
9 PERFORMANCE METRICS WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCY
10 STAFF TO DEVELOP THESE MEASURES AND THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF
11 DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHAT'S BEING PRESENTED TO YOU TODAY THESE
12 METRICS REPRESENT A STARTING POINT A CENTRAL PLACE FOR US TO
13 HAVE THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES DATA PRESENTED ONE OF THE THINGS
14 WE RECOGNIZE IS THAT THERE IS A LOT OF DATA BEING COLLECTED
15 AROUND THE REGION BUT THIS GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE
16 A -- TO BRING THOSE PIECES OF DATA COLLECTION PIECES TOGETHER
17 AND TO LOOK AT THE OVERALL BIG PICTURE OF THE SYSTEM, HOW THE
18 SYSTEM IS PERFORMING AND ALSO IMPORTANTLY WITH THE ADDED LENS
19 OF THE INDIVIDUAL RIDER PRINCIPLE. SO, THE SECOND COMPONENT I
20 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT BEFORE WE GET INTO THE METRIC PRESENTATION
21 IS THESE ARE NOT INTENDED TO BE A REFLECTION OF ONE PARTICULAR
22 MODE OR AGENCY BUT HOW THE SYSTEM IS PERFORMING OVERALL
23 LOOKING AT PREFERENCES. THE INTENT IS LOOK AT THE SYSTEM, THE
24 TRANSIT SYSTEM AS A WHOLE, NOT NECESSARILY A PARTICULAR HONING
25 IN ON A PARTICULAR MODE OR AGENCY. AND THEN ALONG WITH THE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 REPORTING OF THE MEASURES WE HOPE TO PROVIDE CONTEXT ALONG
2 WITH THE DATA TO PROVIDE THAT BACKGROUND INFORMATION THAT
3 WOULD THEN ALSO RECOGNIZE THAT THERE ARE SOME OTHER THINGS
4 HAPPENING OUTSIDE OF THE TRANSIT SPACE BUT ALSO OUTSIDE OF
5 THINGS THAT MIGHT NOT BE DIRECTLY WITHIN OUR CONTROL THAT
6 MIGHT BE CHANGING WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN THE MEASURES OR THE
7 PERFORMANCE. LASTLY, THIS INITIAL SET OF METRIC WE'RE
8 PRESENTING TO YOU IS INITIAL AND WE ANTICIPATE IT WILL EVOLVE
9 AS WE START COLLECTING DATA DEVELOPING REPORTS PULLING IT ALL
10 TOGETHER WE ARE COMMITTED TO IMPLEMENTING THE INITIAL SET BUT
11 OPEN TO EVOLVING AND MODIFYING THIS AS NEEDED DEPENDING ON
12 WHAT WE NAVIGATE AS WE'RE PULLING TOGETHER THE PERFORMANCE
13 PRESENTATION WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO ALLISON TO
14 PROVIDE THE PRESENTATION.

15

16 **ALLISON QUACH:** THANK YOU. ALLISON QUACH MTC STAFF CAN WE GET
17 THE PRESENTATION SLIDES UP PLEASE? NEXT SLIDE. SO TO PROVIDE
18 SOME CONTEXT, THE APPROACH THAT WE'RE TAKING FOR DEVELOPING
19 RNM PERFORMANCE MEASURES IS ROOTED IN THE NET -- IN THE
20 MISSION FOR A REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WHICH IS TO DRIVE
21 TRANSFORMATION -- TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE CUSTOMER
22 EXPERIENCE FOR REGIONAL BAY AREA TRANSIT. AS MELANIE ALLUDED
23 TO IN HER INTRODUCTION, THE GOAL FOR THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES
24 IS TO LOOK AT REGIONAL TRANSIT OUTCOMES FOR RIDERS WITH REALLY
25 A FOCUS ON BENEFITS TO THE RIDER. PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 ALSO GOING TO BE USED TO MEASURE THE SUCCESS OF THE FRAMEWORK
2 AND DELIVERING OUTCOMES. WHAT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IS WE'RE NOT
3 JUST COLLECTING AND LOOKING AT METRICS FOR THE SAKE OF HAVING
4 THE DATA BUT USING THIS DATA TO CONTINUOUSLY IMPROVE BOTH UPON
5 TRANSIT AND UPON THE RNM FRAMEWORK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, OUR
6 GOAL IN THE NEAR-TERM IS TO ESTABLISH THIS INITIAL APPROACH
7 FOR RNM PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND THAT'S REALLY BASED ON DATA
8 THAT WE BELIEVE ARE READILY AVAILABLE AND THAT WE CAN
9 AGGREGATE RELATIVELY, YOU KNOW, EASILY WITHIN THAT CAPACITY.
10 AND AS WE WILL SHARE TOWARDS THE END OF THIS PRESENTATION,
11 WE'RE COMMITTED TO EVOLVING PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING OVER
12 TIME. AND, SO, WHAT THAT COULD INCLUDE IS, YOU KNOW, MAKING
13 THESE MEASURES MUCH MORE ROBUST, ESTABLISHING COMMON DATA
14 DEFINITIONS AND TARGET SETTINGS WHERE APPROPRIATE, DEVELOPING
15 MORE AUTOMATED PROCESSES FOR DATA COLLECTION, AGGREGATION,
16 DISAGGREGATION, AND ALSO DEVELOPING INTERACTIVE DASHBOARDS SO
17 THAT IT'S MUCH EASIER FOR YOU ALL, OR US, TO LOOK AT TRANSIT
18 DATA ACROSS THE REGION IN A CONSISTENT WAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
19 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE ORGANIZED
20 INTO TWO TYPES OF MEASURES THAT WE'RE PROPOSING. TYPE ONE
21 MEASURES, OR TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE
22 EXPERIENCE OF RIDERS ON THE TRANSIT IN THE REGION. AND THESE
23 MEASURES SHOULD ALSO HELP TO TELL THE STORY OF IMPACT AND
24 BENEFITS OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT ACTIVITIES FOR RIDERS FOCUSING
25 ON RNM AND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN INITIATIVES. THE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 SECOND CATEGORY, SECOND TYPE OF MEASURE, RNM AND TRANSIT
2 OPERATIONS PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO HOW WELL TRANSIT OPERATIONS IS
3 WORKING IN THE REGION, AND, ALSO, HOW WELL THE RNM FRAMEWORK
4 IS WORKING TO DELIVER ACTION PLAN AND ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK
5 MANAGEMENT COUNCIL'S WORKPLAN. NEXT SLIDE. THIS NEXT SLIDE
6 DRILLS DOWN INTO THE TWO TYPES OF PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND
7 INTRODUCES SOME SUBCATEGORIES OF THE METRICS. TYPE ONE TRANSIT
8 RIDER OUTCOMES CONSISTS OF RIDER EXPERIENCE METRICS THAT
9 CAPTURE OVERALL EXPERIENCE OF RIDERS ACROSS THE REGION IN
10 CATEGORIES SUCH AS RELIABILITY, CONNECTIVITY, EQUITY, AND
11 SAFETY AND COMFORT. AND AS I MENTIONED, THESE ALSO WILL
12 PROVIDE AS A CLOSER LOOK IN EVALUATING SPECIFIC RNM
13 INITIATIVES. TYPE II MEASURES RNM TRANSIT OPERATIONS CONSISTS
14 OF WORKPLAN ACHIEVEMENTS AND PROGRESS UPDATES ASSESSMENT OF
15 RNM CAPABILITIES AND NEEDS AND MEASURES OF REGIONAL TRANSIT
16 OPERATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE HAS A LOT OF
17 INFORMATION ON IT, BUT OUTLINES THE TYPE ONE TRANSIT RIDER
18 OUTCOME MEASURES. AS I MENTIONED, WITHIN THE RIDER EXPERIENCE
19 CATEGORY, OUR FOUR SUBCATEGORIES OF PRIORITIES FOR RIDERS,
20 RELIABLE, WHICH WE DEFINE AS ESTABLISHING A DEPENDABLE SYSTEM
21 THAT IS ON TIME AND PREDICTABLE, CONNECTIVITY, CREATING AN
22 INTEGRATED NETWORK THAT IS COORDINATED, CONVENIENT, AND EASY
23 TO USE FOR RIDERS, EQUITABLE ENSURING THAT THE TRANSIT SYSTEM
24 IS INCLUSIVE ACCESSIBLE AND SERVES DIVERSE RIDER NEEDS, AS
25 WELL AS SAFE AND COMFORTABLE, PROVIDING A SAFE, COMFORTABLE,



APRIL 26, 2024

1 SECURE ENVIRONMENT FOR RIDERS. AS A REMINDER, THE METRICS WE
2 HAVE IDENTIFIED ON THIS SLIDE CAN BE MEASURED USING EXISTING
3 DATA SOURCES OR FROM A REGIONAL RIDER SURVEY, WHICH WE'RE
4 DEVELOPING CURRENTLY, SO THAT WE CAN HEAR DIRECTLY FROM RIDERS
5 HOW WE'RE DOING ACROSS THESE CATEGORIES. AND AS MELANIE
6 MENTIONED, WE WILL BE REPORTING ON THESE METRICS WITHIN THE
7 BROADER CONTEXT IN WHICH TRANSIT OPERATES. SO, PROVIDING A
8 LITTLE BIT OF KIND OF COLOR AND CONTEXT AROUND WHAT WE'RE
9 SEEING IN THESE MEASURES. THE METRICS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED
10 THAT CAN BE REPORTED ON WITH EXISTING DATA SOURCES INCLUDE
11 RELIABILITY, TIME PERFORMANCE INCLUDING HEADWAY ADHERENCE
12 PERCENTAGE OF SCHEDULE TRIPS OPERATED TRANSIT SPEEDS
13 INFORMATION ON REALTIME DATA UNDER-CONNECTIVITY INTER-AGENCY
14 TRANSFERS AS WELL AS OPERATORS SCHEDULED COORDINATION EFFORTS.
15 UNDER EQUITY ENROLLMENT RIDERSHIP DISCOUNTED FARE PROGRAMS AS
16 WELL AS DISAGGREGATION OF THESE OTHER AND METRICS VARIOUS
17 DEMOGRAPHICS AND UNDER SAFETY AND COMFORT REPORTING ON EFFORTS
18 THAT OPERATORS ARE UNDERTAKING OPERATORS RECEIVING SB125
19 FUNDING. THE SECOND TABLE ON THIS SLIDE SHOWS EXAMPLES OF
20 MEASURES THAT ARE FOCUSED SPECIFICALLY ON THE BENEFITS OF
21 VARIOUS RNM INITIATIVES. WE HAVE PROVIDED HERE AS EXAMPLES,
22 THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT, MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, PROJECT,
23 TRANSIT PRIORITY IMPLEMENTATION, AS WELL AS EFFORTS TO IMPROVE
24 REGIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS. AND YOU KNOW, ONE EXAMPLE HERE IS
25 THAT FOR CLIPPER BAY PASS, EXAMPLES OF MEASURES THAT WE'LL BE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 LOOKING AT INCLUDE INCREASED RIDERSHIP AND INTER-AGENCY
2 TRANSFERS FOR CLIPPER BAY PASS HOLDERS. THE MEASURES AND
3 INITIATIVES LISTED IN THE SECOND TABLE WILL EVOLVE BECAUSE
4 EACH OF THESE MEASURES IS GOING TO BE TAILORED TO EACH
5 INITIATIVE AND WILL BE ESTABLISHED AS EACH INITIATIVE
6 ADVANCES. SECOND TYPE OF PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE RNM AND
7 TRANSIT OPERATION MEASURES. ONE CATEGORY IS WORKPLAN ACHIEVE.
8 AND WE'LL REPORT ON THIS QUARTERLY WHICH BEGAN LAST MONTH AT
9 THE RNM COUNCIL ANNUALLY ALONGSIDE THE REST OF THE PERFORMANCE
10 MEASURES PROPOSED HERE. THIS CONSISTS OF OTHER MEASURES THAT
11 PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE OPERATIONS OF THE RNM, IT'S
12 CAPABILITIES, RESOURCE NEEDS, ET CETERA, AS WELL AS TRANSIT
13 OPERATIONS THAT ARE CURRENTLY REPORTED TO THE NATIONAL TRANSIT
14 DATABASE, INCLUDING MEASURES OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP,
15 PRODUCTIVITY, AND COST EFFECTIVENESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS WE
16 OUTLINED IN THE BEGINNING THE MEASURES PRESENTED ON THE
17 PREVIOUS TWO SLIDES ARE REALLY INITIAL MEASURES THAT WE'RE
18 PROPOSING TO START WITH. ON THIS SLIDE WE SUMMARIZED SOME OF
19 THE WAYS THAT WE WILL EVOLVE THE MEASURES TO PROVIDE A MORE
20 HOLIST STORY AND MORE COMPLETE STORY ABOUT TRANSIT
21 PERFORMANCE. ACROSS EACH OF THE RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORIES,
22 FUTURE MEASURES COULD GO BEYOND OPERATOR AND MTC ACTIVITIES TO
23 REALLY INCLUDE MORE QUANTITATIVE METRICS OF AREAS SUCH AS
24 CONNECTIVITY AND SAFETY AND COMFORT. EVOLVED FROM SOME OF THE
25 METRICS THAT WE HAVE THAT ARE JUST ABOUT AVAILABILITY INTO



APRIL 26, 2024

1 MEASURES OF QUALITY. SO, JUST FOR REALTIME INFORMATION. AS
2 WELL AS PROVIDING MORE CONTEXT ABOUT THE MEASURES, SO, AN
3 EXAMPLE OF THAT IS THINKING ABOUT TRANSIT SPEEDS IN THE
4 CONTEXT OF DRIVING SPEEDS ON THOSE SAME ROADWAYS OR THE SPEED
5 LIMITS OF THOSE ROADWAYS. AND AS PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING
6 EVOLVES RNM AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS MEASURES COULD INCORPORATE
7 OTHER READILY AVAILABLE DATA, CONSIDER ANALYSIS LOOKING AT
8 COST REVENUES AND SOCIETAL BENEFITS OF TRANSIT, CONSIDER
9 ASPECTS IS OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS SUCH AS MUTUAL AID, WORKFORCE
10 DEVELOPMENT, AND INCLUDE OTHER BENEFITS TO THE REGION SUCH AS
11 REDUCTIONS IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND MODE SHIFT TO MORE
12 SUSTAINABLE MODE. ATTACHMENT A IN YOUR PACKET LISTS SOME OF
13 THE SPECIFIC MEASURES THAT MAY BE CONSIDERED, BUT I'M NOT
14 GOING TO GO DOWN THROUGH ALL OF THEM IN THIS PRESENTATION.
15 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON THIS SLIDE, WE SHOW A TIMELINE OF
16 PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING AS IT RELATES TO THE REGIONAL
17 NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL'S WORKPLAN. WE ANTICIPATE THAT WE
18 WILL PEPPER THE FIRST PREPARE THE FIRST ANNUAL REPORT IN
19 SUMMER 2025, AHEAD OF DEVELOPING THE RNM COUNCIL NEXT
20 WORKPLAN, WHICH WILL EXTEND FROM 2025 TO 2026. HOWEVER, WE
21 RECOGNIZE THE NEED TO DELIVER ON PERFORMANCE MEASURES,
22 REPORTING QUICKLY SO WE HAVE DATA THAT'S OUT THERE TO LOOK AT
23 WITH RESPECT TO HOW TRANSIT IS PERFORMING. AND SO WHERE
24 FEASIBLE, WE WILL PLAN TO PROVIDE PRELIMINARY -- PRELIMINARY
25 REPORTING ON SELECT MEASURES AHEAD OF THAT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.



APRIL 26, 2024

1 SO, TODAY WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE
2 PROPOSED APPROACH AND INITIAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES. IN EARLY
3 MAY, WE WILL BE BRINGING THESE PERFORMANCE MEASURES TO THE
4 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE FOR DISCUSSION AND
5 FORMAL ADOPTION. AND THEN MOVING FORWARD, MTC AND OPERATOR
6 STAFF WILL WORK TO COLLECT ALL OF THIS DATA TO AGGREGATE AND
7 DISAGGREGATE IT. THIS INCLUDES SCOPING AND IMPLEMENTATION OF
8 THE REGIONAL TRANSIT CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE SURVEY, WHICH WILL
9 RETURN FOR YOUR FEEDBACK PRIOR TO IMPLEMENTATION. AND THEN,
10 FINALLY, WE ALSO ANTICIPATE ONGOING COORDINATION WITH STATE
11 EFFORTS AROUND TRANSIT. WITH THAT, I CONCLUDE MY PRESENTATION.
12 AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.

13
14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND FOR
15 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, WE'LL START TO MY LEFT. WARREN DO YOU HAVE
16 ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

17
18 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** ALLISON, WITH REGARD TO WAYFINDING, YOU CAN
19 TELL ME WHAT THE METRICS ARE ON WAYFINDING? YOU HAD MENTIONED
20 THERE WAS A WAYFINDING.

21
22 **ALLISON QUACH:** YES. SOME OF THE POTENTIAL MEASURES REGARDING
23 WAYFINDING INCLUDE THINGS LIKE TRAVEL TIME SAVINGS FOR RIDERS,
24 MOST SHIFT, IMPROVED ATTITUDES AND EASIER NAVIGATION FOR FOLKS
25 AT THE PROTOTYPE AND PILOT SITES. AS I MENTIONED DURING THE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 PRESENTATION, THESE ARE JUST EXAMPLE MEASURES AND THE MAPPING
2 AND WAYFINDING TEAM WILL ACTUALLY BE RETURNING, I BELIEVE,
3 BOTH TO THE COUNCIL, AND THIS BODY, AS WELL TO PRESENT THE
4 PROTOTYPE EVALUATION APPROACH. SO, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO HEAR
5 MORE SPECIFICS ABOUT THE EVALUATION AND MEASURES FOR THAT
6 PROJECT AT THAT PRESENTATION.

7

8 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** BECAUSE I DO HAVE SOME THOUGHTS AROUND
9 SIGNAGE. I HAVE SOME THOUGHTS AROUND PATH OF TRAVEL. THERE ARE
10 OTHER PIECES, I THINK, THAT I WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS AT SOME
11 POINT. SO THAT MAY BE A TIME TO ADDRESS THOSE. THE OTHER
12 QUESTION I HAD FOR YOU ARE ON THE PARATRANSIT PIECE. WHAT WERE
13 YOUR METRICS THERE?

14

15 **ALLISON QUACH:** YES. YOU WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE MORE
16 FEEDBACK AROUND THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT. FOR
17 PARATRANSIT, STAFF HAVE BEEN COORDINATING, MTC STAFF HAVE BEEN
18 COORDINATING WITH OPERATOR PARATRANSIT STAFF IN TERMS OF
19 PARATRANSIT METRICS. OUR PROPOSED APPROACH FOR PARATRANSIT IS
20 TO REPORT ON ANY AND ALL OF THE PROPOSED METRICS
21 DISAGGREGATING BY MODE, INCLUDING PARATRANSIT, SO NOT JUST BUS
22 VERSUS RAIL, BUT LOOKING AT PARATRANSIT WHERE FEASIBLE. SOME
23 OF THE MEASURES WE'RE LOOKING AT AROUND THAT INCLUDE ON TIME
24 TRIP PERFORMANCE, TRIP TIMES, QUALITY OF TRANSFER PRESIDENCY,
25 THAT, SORT OF, THING.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** THERE ARE SOME SPECIFICS, CERTAINLY TRANSFERS
3 DO MAKE SENSE ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES TO DIFFERENT
4 PARATRANSIT MODE -- YOU KNOW, IN A -- PARATRANSIT TRIPS
5 ENCOMPASS MORE THAN ONE PARATRANSIT AGENCY, BUT, ALSO, I THINK
6 YEAH, I THINK THAT MAKES SENSE FOR NOW. I MAY HAVE SOME
7 COMMENTS LATER ON, ON THE PARATRANSIT PIECE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GERRY?

10

11 **GERRY GLASER:** HAVING METRICS IS IMPORTANT WE CAN'T TELL IF
12 WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS IF OUR TOWN WE STARTED DOING THIS TRIED
13 TO EXPLAIN YOU WANT A BASELINE MEASURE WHERE YOU'RE GOING.
14 THERE ARE A FEW THINGS FROM HERE ONE IS, AS I WAS READING
15 THROUGH THE MATERIAL YOU SUPPLIED US I THOUGHT YEP, YEP, THEN
16 I READ FURTHER AND WENT, YOU GOT IT. SO, I THINK YOU'RE
17 EXTREMELY LOS AS FAR AS WHAT METRICS ARE LOOKING AT. THE BREAK
18 DOWN IN THE TWO TIERS OF WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH TRANSIT AND
19 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT I THINK THAT'S A GREAT IDEA HAVING
20 TWO METRICS ARE WE EFFECTIVE AS AN ORGANIZATION IS EVERYBODY
21 ELSE BEING AFFECTED AS A RESULT OF THINGS WE HAVE BEEN
22 INCITING THEM TO DO. I WENT IN AND GOT FAR ENOUGH IN YOUR
23 MATERIAL, YOU HAVE THE 505 SETS OF METRICS YOU'RE LOOKING AT
24 AND I ASKED A NUMBER OF PEOPLE BECAUSE TWO POPPED OUT AT ME
25 THAT YOU COVER TWO THAT ARE MOST IMPORTANT THAT KIND OF COVER



APRIL 26, 2024

1 IT ALL, CONVENIENCE AND COST. THOSE ARE THE TWO MOST IMPORTANT
2 SET OF METRICS THAT YOU SHOULD LOOK AT AND THEY SHOULD BE
3 EXPLICIT. HOW CONVENIENT HAS TRANSIT BECOME, HOW COST
4 EFFECTIVE HAS TRANSIT BECOME AND TO THAT END I HAVE ALWAYS
5 THOUGHT ABOUT MEASURES OF TRANSIT -- WELL, WHAT'S TRANSIT
6 BEING MEASURED AGAINST. OKAY. INDIVIDUAL VEHICLE TRAVEL. THE
7 COST FOR -- I CAME UP WITH AN ARBITRARY NUMBER ONE TIME, I
8 SAID, WHERE TRANSIT, IT COSTS AS MUCH -- SHOULD BE AS COST
9 EFFECTIVE SO THAT ONE AND A HALF PEOPLE COULD TRAVEL ON
10 TRANSIT FOR THE SAME COST AS THEY WOULD HAVE IN A VEHICLE.
11 THIS WOULD GET US -- GET PAST THE ONE PERSON PER DRIVER, PER
12 VEHICLE, AND PROBABLY GET US A LOT OF TWOS, AND HOPEFULLY
13 BEYOND THAT. BUT SOME NUMBER THAT ESTABLISHED TO SAY THIS IS
14 OUR GOAL HERE IS WHERE THE COST SHOULD BE, AND THAT BOTH FOR
15 THE COST AND THE TRAVEL TIME. THE TRAVEL TIME, AND PEOPLE HERE
16 KNOW, I LEFT THE HOUSE AT 645 SO I COULD BE HERE BY TEN.
17 BECAUSE I TOOK TRANSIT, IS QUITE A WAYS. AND THE CONNECTIONS
18 DON'T WORK AND ALL OF THAT. SO, IF I DROVE, IT WOULD HAVE BEEN
19 AN HOUR AND 15 MINUTES. IT'S EXTREMELY DIFFERENT FOR ME. NOT
20 TRUE FOR EVERYBODY ELSE. GOING HOME I'LL TAKE THE FERRY THEN
21 THE TRAIN. WHY IS THAT? IF I TAKE THE BUS, LAST TIME I LEFT
22 THE MEETING I TOOK THE BUS AND IT TOOK TWO AND A HALF HOURS
23 JUST TO GET WHERE MY CAR WAS BECAUSE THE BUS HAS THE SAME
24 IMPACT AS EVERYBODY IN A CAR AND I'M HOPING WE GET PAST THAT
25 BECAUSE AS PART OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WE'LL FIND



APRIL 26, 2024

1 A WAY TO ADDRESS THAT SO WHEN OUR METRICS ON BUS SHOW UP THEY
2 WILL SHOW UP GOOD AS THE OTHER DEDICATED CAUSEWAYS THAT WE
3 HAVE TO TRANSIT. RIDERSHIP FOR ME IS A MEASURE OF WHETHER
4 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS WORKING. IF WE INCREASE THE
5 NUMBER OF RIDERS WE MIGHT INCREASE CONVENIENCE, COST, BUT MADE
6 IT MORE ATTRACTIVE. I THINK MEASURING RIDERSHIP IS AN ATTRACT
7 MEASUREMENT OF WHETHER REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS BEING
8 SUCCESSFUL. I WOULD EVEN ARE SAY IT'S THE AGENCIES IT'S
9 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND OUR PRIMARY NUMBER IS
10 RIDERSHIP WENT UP BY 10% AND WE DID IT AGAIN THE NEXT YEAR.
11 ONE OF THE METRICS THAT I WAS LOOKING FOR, BECAUSE I ALSO SIT
12 ON THE SONOMA COUNTY ADVISORY BOARD, IS COST VERSUS REVENUE.
13 BECAUSE I THINK OUR COST FOR OUR TRANSIT IS TOO HIGH. THAT IS
14 TO SAY IF I WERE IN A BUSINESS TRYING TO WORK A BUSINESS AND
15 TRYING TO FIND A WAY TO GET MY COST DOWN. MOST OF US THINK
16 ABOUT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND GETTING ALL THE AGENCIES
17 TO WORK TOGETHER OR AS ONE WE GET THE COST DOWN WE'RE A LOT
18 MORE EFFECTIVE. SO, A MEASURE, A METRIC, A RATIO, OF THE COST
19 OF US PROVIDING TRANSIT AND OF THE REVENUE WE RECEIVE NOT
20 REVENUE OR GRANTS STATE FUNDS BUT THOSE WHO ARE VALUING IT AND
21 THAT'S THE RIDERS. AND THE LAST THING I HAD ON HERE WAS WE
22 TALKED ABOUT THE DASHBOARD. I TEND TO THINK THE DASHBOARD IS
23 NOT IMPORTANT. I WAS WORKING WITH SONOMA COUNTY AND THEY WERE
24 FOCUSING ON THE METRICS DASHBOARD, METRICS ARE GREAT BUT THE
25 NEXT ARE RIGHT SO THEY'RE FOCUSED ON PRESENTATION AS OPPOSED



APRIL 26, 2024

1 TO COLLECTION AND EVALUATION AND BEING ABLE TO RATIONALIZE
2 WHETHER YOU'RE MAKING PROGRESS YOU CAN DICE IT A NUMBER OF
3 DIFFERENT THINGS. DON'T FOCUS ON THE DASHBOARD FOCUS ON
4 COLLECTING NUMBERS AND MAKING SURE NUMBERS ARE RIGHT. I WOULD
5 USE TWO METHODS TO VALIDATE THE NUMBERS THE EXAMPLE WE DID ON
6 METRICS WAS SOLAR PANELS WE WANTED TO FIND OUT HOW MANY ENERGY
7 WE HAD WE MEASURED THE NUMBERS FROM PG AND E. AND THE NUMBERS
8 DIDN'T MEASURE UP AND I SAID EVERY 3.5 HOMES IN A ZIP CODE
9 WOULD HAVE A SOLAR PANEL ON IT SO THEN WE MEASURED ALL THE
10 HOUSES THAT HAD SOLAR PANELS AND IT WAS EVERY 3.5 HOMES HAS
11 SOLAR PANELS ON IT THAT KIND OF THING WHEN WE'RE GETTING OUR
12 METRICS, WE QUESTION THE METRICS AND SAY HERE IS THE ONE THAT
13 SUBSTANTIATES AND ONE IS ACTUALLY GOOD. THOSE ARE MY POINTS.

14

15 **TERRY SCOTT:** A QUESTION I HAVE IS RELATED TO THE CRITICALITY
16 OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT INTERFACING WITH THE TRANSIT
17 AGENCIES AND THE REQUIREMENT, AND THE ABSOLUTE NECESSITY OF A
18 COLLABORATIVE APPROACH. MY CONCERN IS THAT WITH THE NUMBER OF
19 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT WE HAVE, NETWORK MANAGEMENT NEEDS TO
20 BIND WITH THEM IN A WAY THAT DOES NOT -- DOES NOT CREATE ANY
21 KIND OF FRICTION THAT, WORKS IN, CONGRUENTLY TOGETHER. AND I
22 WANT TO KNOW ARE THE -- THE SYSTEMS IN PLACE THAT WILL ALLOW
23 THEM TO DO THAT? AND TO COMMUNICATE EFFECTIVELY ON A
24 CONTINUING BASIS GOING FORWARD? OR HAVE THOSE YET TO BE
25 DETERMINED? AND I THINK THAT'S A -- I'M ABSOLUTELY COMMITTED



APRIL 26, 2024

1 TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT APPROACH. BECAUSE I THINK THAT
2 THAT'S THE ONLY WAY THAT IT CAN DO THIS. AND IT CAN MEET THE
3 NEEDS OF THE COMMUNITY AND THE TRANSIT RIDERS, AS THEY -- AND
4 THEY'RE SO VERY DIFFERENT. IN PART, DEPENDING UPON THEIR
5 INDIVIDUAL HOUSEHOLDS, THEIR WORK, THEIR LOCATION, AND THAT
6 THE -- THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT THEY UTILIZE. AND IN CERTAIN
7 ISOLATE AREAS LIKE NAPA COUNTY WHERE I REPRESENT, THE -- WE'RE
8 SO FAR OUT OF THE VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCY NETWORKS, YOU KNOW,
9 WE DON'T REALLY HAVE TRAINS, WE DON'T HAVE BART. WE DON'T HAVE
10 A SOME OF THE NUMBER OF BUS SYSTEMS EXCEPT INTERNALLY IN THE
11 LARGEST CITIES IF YOU WILL, BUT WE CERTAINLY CAN USE THE --
12 LIKE, THE FERRY SYSTEMS, AND BUT A LOT OF FOLKS WHERE WE ARE,
13 IT'S A RURAL AREA, HO POPULATION, SO I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU CAN
14 ELIMINATE OR REDUCE THE NUMBER OF USAGE OF INDIVIDUAL
15 AUTOMOBILES. AND I KNOW ONE OF OUR MAJOR GOALS IS TO REDUCE
16 THE GREENHOUSE GASSES THAT THEY COST AND SO FORTH. BUT I THINK
17 THAT SOLUTIONS TO THAT HAVE TO COME THROUGH NETWORK
18 MANAGEMENT. THEY'RE NOT GOING TO COME UP WITH THEM ON THEIR
19 OWN. THEY'RE TRYING TO RUN THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEMS. AND I SEE
20 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT AS THE GLUE TO HOLD IT ALL TOGETHER AND
21 TO MAKE IT MUCH MORE FUNCTIONAL AND MUCH MORE ECONOMICAL. IT'S
22 A QUESTION OF TIME AND COST. HOW MUCH DOES IT COST AND THE
23 TIME REQUIRED TO UTILIZE IT, IS IT WORTH IT. IS IT GOING TO
24 GET PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR AUTOMOBILES ON TO PUBLIC TRANSIT IN AN
25 EFFECTIVE MANNER. SO, I CERTAINLY SEE A POTENTIAL, AND I



APRIL 26, 2024

1 RECOGNIZE AND EMBRACE THE REQUIREMENT OF IT. I'M JUST NOT
2 QUITE SURE YET IF WE'RE THERE, TO HOW TO MAKE IT HAPPEN. THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. I THINK THERE MAY HAVE BEEN, IN
6 ADDITION TO COMMENTARY, A QUESTION ABOUT THE INTERNAL
7 ASSESSMENT OF HOW NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS WORKING AND HOW MTC IS
8 WORKING WITH AGENCIES. IS THAT A FAIR SUMMARY?

9

10 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

11

12 **MELANIE CHOY:** FAIR QUESTION, IN RESPONSE IN TERMS OF THE
13 THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN HIGHLIGHTED THAT IS THE ESSENCE OF THIS
14 EVALUATION, MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE FUNCTIONING AND COLLABORATION
15 ALL COMPONENTS THAT GO INTO THIS THEN THE TYPE ONE, DISCUSSION
16 REGARDING OVERALL SYSTEM AND YOU HIGHLIGHTED THAT AS WELL IN
17 TERMS OF SERVICES AND HAVING AVAILABILITY OF SERVICES. THOSE
18 TWO DOVE TAIL METRICS WE'RE LOOKING AT BECAUSE LOOKING AT THE
19 SYSTEM INFORMS US IN TERMS OF MANAGEMENT OF THE SYSTEM ON WHAT
20 WE NEED TO PRIORITIZE, WHAT WE SHOULD FOCUS ON AND SO THE TWO
21 ARE ITERATIVE AND WE SEE IT THAT WAY IN SHORT TO YOUR ANSWER
22 THAT IS THE ESSENCE OF THE MEASURES THAT WE'RE DOING TO
23 ADDRESS A LOT OF THINGS YOU HAVE CALLED OUT AND RAISED.

24



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** THE QUESTION I BELIEVE IS NETWORK MANAGEMENT
2 SYSTEM WHERE THE BUCK STOPS THAT HAS TO BE AN EFFECTIVE
3 COMMUNICATOR IN VARIOUS TRANSIT SYSTEM, INDIVIDUAL PURPOSES
4 DOING THEIR JOBS IN THE WAY THAT BENEFITS THEIR PARTICULAR
5 AGENCIES NOT NECESSARILY BENEFITTING THE USERS AND THAT'S
6 WHERE THE NETWORK MANAGERS COME IN, THEY'RE THE GLUE THAT
7 HOLDS THE PROCESS TOGETHER IN MY OPINION.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. BRYAN?

10

11 **BRIAN STANKE:** THIS IS AN IMPORTANT ITEM WITH THE CHOOSING THE
12 OUTCOME METRICS THAT WE'RE THINKING AT THAT'S GONE INTO THIS,
13 I THINK KIND OF, THE BEGINNING, IT'S ASKING THE RIGHT
14 QUESTIONS IS THE MOST IMPORTANT STEP. RIGHT? IF WE'RE ASKING
15 THE WRONG QUESTIONS IN OUR METRICS, THOSE ISSUE NOT GOING TO
16 LEAD US TO THE RIGHT PLACE. WE NEED TO BE LOOKING AT, DO WE
17 HAVE METRICS THAT ARE ANSWERING THE RIGHT QUESTIONS TO TELL US
18 WHETHER OR NOT THIS EFFORT IS WORKING. AND I SEE AND I SEE
19 SOME OF THAT IN THE TYPE II TRANSIT OPERATIONS RIDERSHIP.
20 MENTION OF COST EFFECTIVENESS AND THERE ARE THOSE REGIONAL
21 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. WHAT I'M SEEING IN THE TRANSIT RIDER
22 OUTCOMES, YOU KNOW, THERE IS THE LONG-TERM AND THERE IS THE
23 IMMEDIATE, AND THE IMMEDIATE SEEMS VERY MUCH DRIVEN BY WHAT
24 ARE THE METRICS WE CAN GET TODAY AND THAT'S VERY PRACTICAL BUT
25 DOES THAT GET US TO THE RIGHT PLACE IN AND WHAT I'M NOT SEEING



APRIL 26, 2024

1 IN THE TIME -- IS A TIMELINE AND A COMMITMENT TO GET US THE
2 METRICS THAT ARE ASKING THE RIGHT QUESTIONS AND ANSWERING
3 THOSE QUESTIONS. SO, THERE ARE AND HERE, LIKE, CONNECTIVITY.
4 THE FIRST THING THAT POPS INTO MY MIND IS LOOKING AT WHAT ARE
5 THE PERCENTAGES OF JOBS, WHAT ARE THE PERCENTAGES OF REGIONAL
6 DESTINATIONS THAT ARE ACCESSIBLE BY PEOPLE WITH TRANSIT WITHIN
7 40 MINUTES, 30 MINUTES, AN HOUR. THESE ARE THINGS THAT CAN BE
8 CALCULATED, THESE ARE THINGS THAT REGIONAL NETWORK PLANNING
9 SHOULD AFFECT, BUT WE NEED TO HAVE A TIMELINE FOR WHEN WE
10 START ADDING THESE IN AS MEASURES THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT.
11 RATHER THAN -- IN THE FUTURE THEY COULD - IN THE FUTURE, THEY
12 SHOULD. BECAUSE IT'S GREAT WE CAN KNOW CURRENT PROVIDERS,
13 NUMBER OF BUS RUNS THEY MISS. BUT THAT WON'T TELL US WHETHER
14 OR NOT THEY'RE DOING A GOOD JOB. THAT TELLS US WHETHER THE
15 OPERATIONS OR OPERATORS ARE DOING A GOOD JOB. OR WHETHER THERE
16 IS A LABOR SHORTAGE IN THE BAY AREA AND NOT ENOUGH DRIVERS. WE
17 HAVE TO BE CAREFUL WE'RE NOT PICKING UP MEASURES THAT ARE EASY
18 BUT AREN'T REALLY TALKING TO WHAT THE REGIONAL NETWORK
19 MANAGEMENT NEEDS TO DO AND SHOWS ITS SUCCEEDING OR FAILING.
20 SO, I THINK THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT POINT. ONE OTHER IDEA IS,
21 TODAY WE HAVE A LOT OF BIG DATA AVAILABLE AS FAR AS WHERE
22 PEOPLE TRAVEL BY ANY MODE AND IF WE'RE GOING TO SPEND
23 RESOURCES, WHAT ABOUT WE LOOK AT WHERE PEOPLE ARE GOING, WHERE
24 THE MARKETS THAT ARE BETWEEN THE SERVICE AREAS, THAT INVOLVE
25 MULTIPLE SERVICE AREAS FOR TRANSIT, ARE SEVERELY



APRIL 26, 2024

1 UNDERPERFORMING AND WHETHER OR NOT WE CAN GET THAT PERFORMANCE
2 UP. THAT'S SOMETHING WHERE THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER CAN BE
3 EITHER SUCCEEDING IT OR NOT BUT IT'S NOT ABOUT AN INDIVIDUAL
4 OPERATOR'S PERFORMANCE IT'S ABOUT DOES THAT REGIONAL NETWORK
5 MANAGEMENT CLOSE GAPS, MAKE THINGS COMPETITIVE. AND MAYBE
6 THAT'S OVERLY FOCUSED. BUT, LIKE, HOW DO WE GET THOSE BIGGER
7 MEASURES -- HOW DOES THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER PUT TOGETHER
8 PERFORM BETTER THAN THE DIVIDED NETWORK WE HAVE TODAY AND WE
9 NEED NOT BE DISTRACTED BY METRICS THAT AREN'T TELLING US THAT
10 SUCCESS OR FAILURE. THANKS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. EMILY LOPER.

13

14 **EMILY LOPER:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. THIS IS
15 COMPREHENSIVE. THANK YOU. SO, THE FIRST TIME IN THE TRANSIT
16 RIDER OUTCOMES, I APPRECIATE THAT YOU INCLUDED SAFETY AND
17 COMFORT OF THE RIDE AND EXPERIENCE AS A METRIC. IT DOES SAY IN
18 THE MATERIALS THAT YOU'RE FOCUSED ON QUANTITATIVE SAFETY
19 METRICS AND YOU USE THE EXAMPLES OF FATALITIES, INJURIES,
20 OTHER EVENTS. I WOULD URGE YOU TO -- AND MAYBE THIS IS PART OF
21 THE PLAN, TO REQUESTED QUALITATIVE FEEDBACK FROM THE RIDERS IN
22 THE RIDER SURVEY BECAUSE THE PERCEPTION OF SAFETY, COMFORT OF
23 THE EXPERIENCE IS IMPORTANT BART HAS MADE TREMENDOUS
24 IMPROVEMENTS IN THEIR SYSTEM BUT IT'S TAKING A WHILE TO REACH
25 RIDERS. ADDRESSING THAT PERCEPTION IS IMPORTANT. AND OBVIOUSLY



APRIL 26, 2024

1 THE 27 OPERATORS HAVE DIFFERENT BASELINE LEVELS OF THE COMFORT
2 OF THE EXPERIENCE ON DIFFERENT MODES, SO I'M CURIOUS HOW YOU
3 ENVISION TAKING THAT INTO CONSIDERATION. ON SOME MODES IT'S
4 NOT REALLY NECESSARY TO MAKE IMPROVEMENTS BUT WOULD WANT THEM
5 TO BE -- OR IF YOU ARE JUST TRACKING IT BASED ON THESE EVENTS.
6 CRIME STATS OR THINGS HIKE THAT. SO, I GUESS THAT'S A
7 QUESTION, IF YOU THOUGHT THAT FAR AHEAD. [LAUGHTER]

8

9 **ALLISON QUACH:** SURE. YES. AS YOU MENTIONED WE DO PLAN TO
10 INCLUDE QUESTIONS AROUND SAFETY AND COMFORT ON TRANSIT AND
11 REGIONAL RIDER SURVEY SOME OPERATORS ARE ALREADY DOING THIS
12 BUT WE WANT TO STAY CONSISTENT ON THE SURVEY EFFORT REGIONAL
13 LEVEL THAT INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT RIDERS ACROSS
14 THE REGION NOT JUST FOR SOME SELECT OPERATORS. WE'RE GOING TO
15 BEGIN WITH THAT UNDERSTANDING BASELINE BEFORE WE MOVE INTO
16 TRYING TO ACT ON THE THING OR SETTING TARGETS AND ANYTHING
17 LIKE THAT. AND, TO THE QUESTION ABOUT QUANTITATIVE DATA, THAT
18 -- THE TABLE THAT YOU'RE REFERRING TO THAT SAYS NTD DATA ON
19 FATALITIES, INJURIES ET CETERA, IT'S ONE EXAMPLE AND WE
20 RECOGNIZE THIS IS ONE AREA WHERE WE REALLY WANT TO DEVELOP
21 MORE AND REALLY APPROPRIATE METRICS TO BE TRACKING ACROSS THE
22 SYSTEM.

23

24 **EMILY LOPER:** AND MY OTHER COMMENT JUST FOR THE TOTAL RNM
25 PERFORMANCE METRICS, I AGREE THAT RIDERSHIP SHOULD BE FRONT



APRIL 26, 2024

1 AND CENTER, BECAUSE IT'S, SORT OF -- THAT'S THE WHOLE POINT OF
2 DOING THESE IMPROVEMENTS IS TO ATTRACT RIDERS TO THE SYSTEM
3 AND KEEPING THAT AT THE FOREFRONT. AND ALSO WHEN YOU ARE DOING
4 THE SURVEY DATA OF THE TRANSIT RIDERS TO UNDERSTAND THE MODE
5 SHIFT OF WHERE THEY CAME FROM WHEN THEY START RIDING A NEW
6 SYSTEM WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR THE DATA TO UNDERSTAND WHERE THE
7 IMPROVEMENTS HAVE BEEN MADE AND WHETHER THOSE RIDERS CAME FROM
8 AND YOU KNOW PREVIOUSLY DRIVING OR SOMETHING. THANKS SO MUCH.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IAN?

11

12 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANKS. I'LL AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS, INCLUDING
13 SEVERAL PEOPLE, STANKE, IN PARTICULAR, AND THAT THE -- SO, I
14 THINK EAGER TO SEE A TIMELINE AROUND WHEN WE'RE GETTING TO
15 THOSE BEFORE THE PERFORMANCE METRICS AND I THINK IN PARTICULAR
16 ON THE CONNECTIVITY AND RELIABILITY, LIKE, IN THAT CATEGORY OF
17 THING, I THINK -- AND IT SPEAKS TO THE NEED TO HAVE A, SORT
18 OF, GREATER GOAL OF NETWORK CONNECTIVITY, BUT I WOULD LIKE TO
19 SEE A METRIC ASSOCIATED WITH, YOU KNOW, IDENTIFYING KEY HUBS
20 WITHIN A RENAL AND THEN THE TRAVEL TIME IT TAKES TO GET
21 BETWEEN THOSE HUBS. YOU KNOW? LIKE, AND ESPECIALLY WHERE THERE
22 IS MULTIPLE AGENCIES INVOLVED. SO, NOT HOOKING AT WHERE WE
23 HAVE ROOTS RIGHT NOW AND HOW ON TIME THEY ARE, AND HOW
24 RELIABLE, BUT JUST MORE TO SAY REFLECTING PEOPLE NEED TO GET
25 TO A TO B, BUT HOW LONG IT TAKES FOR PEOPLE TO GET TO A TO B,



APRIL 26, 2024

1 OR E TO F AND THOSE THOUGHTS AROUND JOURNEYS AND MAKING FASTER
2 MORE FREQUENT RELIABLE TRIPS BUT TO ME THAT NECESSITATES SOME
3 KIND OF SERVICE VISION, SOME KIND OF INTEGRATED NETWORK, PLAN
4 FOR NETWORK COORDINATION AND IDENTIFICATION OF WHAT THAT
5 COORDINATED NETWORK IS SO I THINK THAT RELATE TO THE PLANNED
6 BAY AREA 2050 -- OR TRANSIT 2050 EXERCISE AND THE CONNECT
7 NETWORK PLAN. I KNOW THAT'S A LOT OF THINGS BUT I WOULD LIKE
8 TO SEE THE CONNECTIVITY AND RELIABILITY METRICS GOING AND
9 EAGER TO SEE SOME -- YOU KNOW, TO HAVE MORE DETAIL ON THE
10 TIMING OF WHEN WE CAN GET THERE. LASTLY I'LL AGREE WITH
11 RIDERSHIP IS IMPORTANT AND IT WOULD BE GREAT TO HAVE A
12 DASHBOARD IN THE NEAR-TERM AROUND OR JUST SOME CENTRAL PLACE
13 WHERE WE CAN SEE RIDERSHIP ACROSS ALL THE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES
14 REPORTED. BART DOES A GREAT JOB THEY'RE PROBABLY EASIEST TO
15 FIND IN MY FREE TIME I LIKE TO GO CHECK OUT YESTERDAY'S BART'S
16 RIDERSHIP STATISTICS. I THINK PRIORITIZING, OBVIOUSLY AGENCIES
17 REPORT THAT GETTING EVERYONE ON THE SAME SCHEDULE AND GETTING
18 THAT INFORMATION OUT TO THE WORLD IS BOTH A TRANSPARENCY --
19 IT'S GOING TO BE GOOD FOR TRANSPARENCY BUT IT ALLOWS US TO
20 HAVE INFORMATION ABOUT WHAT'S WORKING, WHAT'S NOT WORKING AND
21 GIVE PEOPLE INFORMATION TO THINK ABOUT HOW TO IMPROVE THE
22 SYSTEM LOVE TO SEE A TIMELINE AROUND HOW WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO
23 ACHIEVE THAT SEEMS IMPORTANT REGARDLESS OF WHAT OTHER METRICS
24 WE CHOOSE TO GO FOR. THANK YOU.
25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SEBASTIAN?

2

3 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** ALLISON, THANK YOU. THERE'S A LOT IN THIS
4 THAT I LIKE. I LIKE THAT YOU'RE SETTING UP AS SOMETHING THAT
5 IS GOING TO EVOLVE OVER TIME. THAT'S HEALTHY AND IMPORTANT. I
6 LIKE THAT YOU DIFFERENTIATED REPORTING BETWEEN SOMETHING THAT
7 WOULD COME ON A QUARTERLY BASIS AND SOMETHING THAT ROLLS UP ON
8 AN ANNUAL BASIS, AND I LIKE THAT YOU'RE BROADLY BREAKING THE
9 DATA YOU'RE COLLECTING INTO DESCRIPTORS THAT TALK ABOUT
10 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AS WELL AS RIDER MARKETS AS WELL AS
11 SEPARATE CATEGORY THAT'S TALKING ABOUT OPERATIONS. A FEW
12 OBSERVATIONS, I WOULD MAKE, ECHO SOME OF THE THINGS THAT HAVE
13 BEEN SAID AND THEN DIVERGE A LITTLE BIT. THERE'S KIND OF A
14 TRUISM THAT YOU CAN'T MANAGE WHAT YOU CAN'T SEE AND I THINK
15 THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS OF WORK THAT'S BEEN GOING ON AROUND
16 REGIONAL TRANSIT THAT HAVE SUFFERED DUE TO LACK OF DATA
17 ANALYSIS THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF CONJECTURE ABOUT WHAT RIDERS
18 WANT, CONJECTURE AROUND WHAT DIFFERENT AGENCIES NEED THERE HAS
19 BEEN LITTLE DATA BROUGHT FORWARD INTO THE DISCUSSIONS AROUND
20 THAT. I'M GLAD TO SIGH THIS EFFORT MOVING FORWARD BECAUSE I
21 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT ASSESSING PROGRESS AND EFFECTIVENESS OF
22 NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORTS. AND YOU HAVE SOME OF THIS HERE
23 THAT TALKS ABOUT TRANSIT SYSTEM AS A WHOLE BOTH AN OPERATIONAL
24 BASIS IN TERMS OF RIDER MARKETS AND TWO FOR REASONS ONE IS
25 BECAUSE OF COURSE YOU WANT TO DETECT YOU'RE HAVING AN EVENT,



APRIL 26, 2024

1 AND ARE YOU TACKLING WHAT'S IMPORTANT ON THE SYSTEM. I THINK
2 IT'S GOING TO BE INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT FOR SEVERAL YEARS TO
3 ACTUALLY TELL IF NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORTS ARE HAVING
4 RIDERSHIP IMPACT. WE'RE SEEING SWINGS IN RIDERSHIP THAT ARE
5 NOT BEING DRIVEN BY THE PROGRAMS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE.
6 THAT'S GOING TO CONTINUE INTO THE FUTURE. THAT DOESN'T MEAN
7 THESE PROGRAMS AREN'T IMPORTANT OR ESSENTIAL. THAT'S JUST
8 REALITY. I THINK YOU WANT TO HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE
9 BIGGER SYSTEM SO THAT CAN ACTUALLY INFORM HOW YOU'RE CHOOSING
10 TO MOVE FORWARD WITH NETWORK MANAGEMENT ACTIVITIES IN THE
11 FUTURE AND WHAT USES THE JUSTIFICATION FOR THAT. A COUPLE OF
12 THINGS I'LL ZERO IN ON IN TERMS OF TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES, I
13 THINK IT'S GREAT YOU HAVE RIDER EXPERIENCE IN THERE. IT'S A
14 DETAIL. I WOULD PUT THAT INTO RIDER EXPERIENCES AND TRANSIT
15 MARKET MEASURES. I THINK MANY OF THE THINGS THAT ARE RIDER
16 EXPERIENCES ARE GOING TO BE THINGS YOU WOULD PICK UP IN THE
17 SURVEY, INDIVIDUAL EXPERIENCES ON THE SYSTEM, HOW THEY'RE
18 FEELING ABOUT THE SYSTEM. YOU KNOW? MY TRANSIT EXPERIENCE IN
19 SAN FRANCISCO IS GOING TO BE DIFFERENT FROM GERRY'S. HE COULD
20 HAVE UNCOMPETITIVE TRAVEL TIME; I COULD HAVE A COMPETITIVE
21 ONE. IT'S AN INDIVIDUAL EXPERIENCE. VERSUS SOMETHING TRANSIT
22 MARKET EXPERIENCE, LOOKING AT THE EXTENT MEASURED ON A
23 REGIONAL BASIS HOW MANY JOBS ARE ACCESSIBLE BY TRANSIT. THOSE
24 ARE EXAMPLES I WOULD GIVE AROUND EQUITY IS YOU COULD MEASURE
25 ON A MARKET BASIS HOW MANY LOW-INCOME PEOPLE ARE USING TRANSIT



APRIL 26, 2024

1 OR HOW MANY PEOPLE ON A COMMUNITY OF COLOR ARE ACCESSING
2 TRANSIT. BUT THAT'S VERY DIFFERENT THAN LOOKING AT DEMOGRAPHIC
3 DATA ON A SURVEY ASKING DID YOU FEEL SAFE ON TRANSIT, AND WAS
4 THERE A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN PEOPLE BASED ON HOW THEY IDENTIFY
5 THEIR GENDER. SO, I WOULD THINK ABOUT ADDING THAT AS A
6 SECONDARY CATEGORY IN THERE. THAT'S A LOT OUT OF ME. SO, I
7 THINK I'LL STOP. BUT I THINK THIS IS HEADED IN THE RIGHT
8 DIRECTION

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** DYLAN?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, JUST COMMENTS. FIRST OF
13 ALL, I WOULD SECOND THE INCLUSION OF RIDERSHIP FOR AGENCIES
14 THAT DO PRODUCE THAT, THAT'S GREAT TO SEE. I LIKE THE PERCENT
15 OF SCHEDULED TRIPS OPERATED IS ON HERE. I WOULD ASK OR NOTE
16 THAT IT WOULD BE GOOD MEASURE PERCENT OF SCHEDULE TRIPS
17 COMPLETED DEPENDING ON THE AGENCY. THOSE NUMBERS COULD BE
18 DIFFERENT, YOU KNOW, BUSES BREAKING DOWN, OR WHATEVER, TRIPS
19 BEING COMPLETED. THAT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO SEE. ON EQUITY, I
20 REALLY LIKE CALLING OUT EQUITY SAYING THAT -- I FORGET WHERE
21 IT WAS, THAT IT WOULD INCLUDE DISAGGREGATION OF THE OTHER
22 METRICS BY DEMOGRAPHICS. I THINK ALL OF THESE SHOULD INCLUDE
23 THAT DISAGGREGATION, AND I WOULD HIGHLIGHT EVEN SOME OF THE
24 THINGS IN THE RNM AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS CATEGORY, LIKE
25 WAYFINDING. I THINK SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO TRACK



APRIL 26, 2024

1 IS AS NEW WAYFINDING IS GOING UP. WHERE IS IT GOING UP? ONLY
2 IN WEALTHIER NEIGHBORHOODS OR IS IT SPREAD EQUALLY THROUGHOUT
3 THE REGION AND SAME GOES FOR THE BUS PROJECT, ASSUMED THAT
4 KIND OF ANALYSIS WOULD BE HAPPENING THERE. ALSO ON EQUITY,
5 GLAD TO SEE CLIPPER START, HIGH ENROLLMENT BEING TRACKED OF
6 COURSE AND I THINK ALSO IMPORTANT IS JUST TO TRACK COSTS
7 OVERALL. FOR FOLKS WHO AREN'T IN THOSE PROGRAMS, WHO IS
8 CARRYING THE BURDEN OF PAYING TRANSIT FARES, BREAKING THAT
9 DOWN ALONG MULTIPLE DEMOGRAPHICS AND SEEING IS THERE
10 DISCREPANCY BETWEEN WHAT DIFFERENT PEOPLE ARE PAYING. AND I
11 WOULD JUST SAY ON SAFETY AND COMFORT, IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO
12 BE TRACKING THAT SAFETY. OF COURSE, WE WANT PEOPLE TO FEEL
13 COMFORTABLE AND SAFE ON THE BUS. I WOULD HIGHLIGHT AND THIS
14 GOES TO THE EQUITY ISSUE AS WELL, IT WOULD BE GREAT TO SEE ON
15 HERE SOME REPORTING AROUND NEGATIVE INTERACTIONS WITH LAW-
16 ENFORCEMENT OR SECURITY STAFF. BECAUSE WE KNOW NOT EVERYBODY
17 FEELS MORE COMFORTABLE WITH AN ARMED, YOU KNOW, LAW-
18 ENFORCEMENT OFFICER ON THE BUS WITH THEM. SO, IT WOULD BE GOOD
19 TO SEE SOME OF THAT PERSPECTIVE, AS WELL, REPORTED IF THERE
20 ARE NEGATIVE INTERACTIONS BEING REPORTED. WE SHOULD BE UP
21 FRONT ABOUT THAT, AS WELL AND THEN I WOULD JUST SAY, I THINK
22 THE DASHBOARD IS A GREAT IDEA. WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE
23 DASHBOARD. THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. NOT ONLY JUST FOR GIVING
24 PEOPLE ACCESS TO DATA BUT ALSO FOR BUILDING TRANSPARENCY AND
25 TRUST AMONG FOLKS WHO MIGHT BE CRITICAL OF MTC AND TRANSIT



APRIL 26, 2024

1 AGENCIES, ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE HAVING A BALLOT MEASURE COME UP
2 IN 2026. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** EXCELLENT. DWAYNE HANKERSON.

5

6 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I HAVE A
7 COUPLE OF STATEMENTS AND IT'S REGARDING IMPROVING THE REGIONAL
8 PARATRANSIT TRIPS. I THINK ONE OF THE FIRST THINGS IS IF WE
9 COULD WORK ON GETTING A REGULATION OR A NEW RULE THAT YOU
10 DON'T -- IF SOMEONE COULD WORK AROUND THE IN-PERSON INTRODUCE
11 FOR DISABLED PEOPLE BECAUSE AUTO HARD AND YOU CAN'T GET THE
12 BENEFIT UNLESS YOU DO THE IN-PERSON INTERVIEW. AND THE SECOND
13 THING IS, AND I THINK YOU'RE ALREADY WORKING ON IT, IS THE
14 CONNECTION FROM ONE AGENCY TO THE NEXT AGENCY, BECAUSE IF YOU
15 LIVE IN SOLANO AND GOT AN APPOINTMENT IN OAKLAND, IT SHOULD BE
16 FREE TRANSFER, ONE RIDE YOU PAY FOR, ONE RIDE GOING,
17 ACKNOWLEDGE BACK I THINK THAT WOULD HELP PEOPLE WITH
18 DISABILITIES A LOT. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. CHARLIE LAVERY.

21

22 **CHARLIE LAVERY:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I DID GET SOME
23 OF THIS AT THE WORKSHOP. I APPRECIATE IT ALL. I REALLY LIKE
24 THAT WE'RE KIND OF COMING AT THIS, AND BECAUSE IT'S A NEW
25 ENTITY, WE HAVE GOT A CLEAN SHEET, AND WE'RE BAKING IN



APRIL 26, 2024

1 ACCOUNTABILITY AND SOME PERFORMANCE METRICS RIGHT OUT OF THE
2 GATE. AND I THINK THERE IS SOME VERY ACHIEVABLE GOALS. AND I
3 REALLY APPRECIATE THAT, BECAUSE YOU KNOW, SUCCESSES, YOU CAN
4 BUILD ON SUCCESSES, LITTLE WINS, LITTLE WINS, AND I THINK THAT
5 YOU'RE REALLY GETTING INTO YOUR STRIDE WITH THIS. AND AS YOU
6 KNOW, AS WE HIT EACH ACHIEVABLE GOAL, AND YOU CAN REACH FOR
7 THE NEXT AND I THINK WE'RE OFF TO A REALLY GOOD START. THANK
8 YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. WENDI KALLINS.

11

12 **WENDI KALLINS:** MY INITIAL QUESTION IS, HOW ARE YOU GOING TO
13 CONDUCT THE RIDER SURVEY, WHAT'S YOUR METHODOLOGY GOING TO BE?
14 IN.

15

16 **ALLISON QUACH:** THE RIDER SURVEY IS CURRENTLY UNDER DEVELOPMENT
17 WE HAVEN'T FIGURED OUT THE PARTICULAR METHODOLOGY YET WE'RE
18 CONTEMPLATING A COMBINATION OF IN-PERSON SURVEYS AS WELL AS
19 POTENTIALLY COMBINING THAT WITH A MAIL OR ONLINE, PHONE SURVEY
20 ALL OF THAT IS TBD AND IS REALLY DEPENDENT ON THE SURVEY
21 QUESTIONS AND TYPES OF QUESTIONS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
22 ASKING. SO AS WE PUT MORE THOUGHT INTO DEVELOPING THAT SURVEY
23 WE PLAN TO COME BACK TO BOTH THIS BODY AND TO THE RNM COUNCIL
24 TO REFINE IT BEFORE WE IMPLEMENT IT. SO MORE TO COME ON THAT.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** SO, IN RELATION TO THAT, I THINK SOME OF THE
2 METRICS -- FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO SAY THAT I AGREE THAT THE
3 BOTTOM LINE IS EITHER INCREASING RIDERSHIP OR NOT. BUT I THINK
4 SOME OF THE OTHER MEASURES YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IS TELLING YOU
5 THE WHY. YOU KNOW? THE EXPERIENCE OF THE RIDER IS GOING TO
6 GIVE YOU A CLUE OF WHAT'S WORKING AND WHAT'S NOT WORKING; DOES
7 IT FEEL SAFE, YOU KNOW? DO THEY ENJOY THE JOURNEY? WAS THERE
8 TOO MUCH WAIT TIME? SOME OF THE THINGS -- AND MAYBE THIS IS A
9 LITTLE OFF. THIS MIGHT COME WHEN IT COMES TO DOING THE RIDER
10 SURVEY, ITSELF, AND LOOKING AT THAT -- BUT WHAT IS THE PURPOSE
11 OF THE TRIP. AND ALSO DO THEY OWN A CAR. SO, ARE THEY TRANSIT
12 DEPENDENT, AND I THINK YOU MIGHT WANT TO BE DIRECT AND SAY,
13 DID YOU USE THIS TRIP BECAUSE OF A PASS THAT YOU GOT? AND
14 THAT'S NOW WHY YOU'RE USING TRANSIT; DID THAT CHANGE YOUR
15 BEHAVIOR. AGAIN, I THINK I JUMPING THE GUN. I THINK WHEN YOU
16 ACTUALLY COME BACK WITH THE RIDER SURVEY, I THINK I'LL
17 PROBABLY BE REPEATING THESE THINGS AGAIN. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HILARY BROWN.

20

21 **HILARY BROWN:** ONE THING I WOULD SAY, FROM MEMORY HERE, BART
22 WHEN I TALK TO PEOPLE IN THE TASK FORCE WHEN THEY COME TO THE
23 CITY OR OAKLAND, THEY HAVE TO GO TO -- THEY HAVE TO PAY
24 MULTIPLE FARES. SO, I THINK THAT COULD BE A CONCERN. AND ALSO
25 DATA FOR PEOPLE WHO USE WHEELCHAIRS, THE TIME TO GET TO AND



APRIL 26, 2024

1 FROM, AND A LOT COUNTIES IF ARE PEOPLE WHO USE WHEELCHAIRS
2 THEY HAVE DATA, AND FOR TRANSFERS IT MIGHT TAKE A FIVE MINUTES
3 OR A MINUTE LONGER, DATA FROM THESE COUNTIES. ACCESSIBILITY
4 FOR PEOPLE WHO APPLY FOR POSITIONS, THEY HAVE TO KNOW HOW TO
5 TRAVEL TO SANTA ROSA AND SAN BRUNO, HAVE TO KNOW HOW TO DO
6 THAT AND NAVIGATE EITHER ON THE APP OR WEB SITE. MY
7 UNDERSTANDING THERE WOULD BE NO STOPS, NOT SPECIFICALLY, BUT
8 IN THOSE LINES. I JUST WANT TO PUT THAT OUT THERE.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AND WE DON'T HAVE
11 ANY MEMBERS --

12

13 **GERRY GLASER:** ANNE OLIVIA.

14

15 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANNE OLIVIA. YEAH. ANNE OLIVIA HAS A HAND
16 RAISED, WHICH I CANNOT SEE.

17

18 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I FEEL LIKE A LOT OF MY COMMENTS WERE
19 BROUGHT FORWARD BY FOLKS AND YOU ASKED IF WE COULD KEEP THEM
20 AS BRIEF AS POSSIBLE IF NOT SHORTER THAN THAT, SO THERE IS A
21 LOT OF CONCERNS REGARDING TIME AND PEOPLE NOT FEELING SAFE
22 WITH MORE ARMED PEOPLE ON OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THINGS LIKE
23 THAT, THAT I WOULD ECHO, BUT I FEEL LIKE A LOT OF THOSE
24 COMMENTS WERE MADE, SO I'M TRYING TO BE RESPECTFUL OF TIME.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT THANK YOU. AND THAT WAS AS BRIEF
2 AS POSSIBLE IF NOT BRIEFER, SO THANKS. AND, REALLY GLAD TO
3 HEAR SO MANY DIFFERENT COMMENTS AND I HAVE GOT ASTONISHINGLY A
4 FEW MORE THAT HAVEN'T BEEN COVERED. ONE OF THEM IS IN TERMS OF
5 STATION ACCESS. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, I KNOW THAT CALTRAIN IS
6 UPDATING ITS STATION ACCESS POLICY. BART, LIKE, DIFFERENT
7 AGENCIES HAVE DIFFERENT STATION ACCESS, POLICIES AND THEY
8 TRACK THINGS SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT FROM ONE TO THE OTHER. IT
9 WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE STATION ACCESS MODE SHARE THAT IS
10 COMPARABLE. LET'S SEE. I'M GLAD THAT THIS IS BEING APPROACHED
11 AS A WORK IN PROGRESS, STARTING OUT WITH THE DATA THAT'S
12 AVAILABLE THEN ADDING MORE. I THINK THAT'S AN EXCELLENT
13 APPROACH. IN TERMS OF THERE WAS SOME DISCUSSION IN TERMS OF
14 ACCESSIBILITY. THERE SHOULD BE MORE ACCESSIBILITY METRICS NOT
15 ONLY ABOUT PARATRANSIT, ALSO FOR ACCESSIBILITY OF GENERAL
16 PURPOSE SYSTEM. THAT IS A LARGE TOPIC AND FROM WHAT I HEAR
17 FROM MEMBERS OF THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY IS THAT IT'S A LARGE
18 AND NOT REALLY WELL -- LIKE, THERE IS NOT A REAL CLEAR
19 DEFINITION ALONG THOSE LINES SO THAT WOULD BE A REALLY GOOD
20 THINGS TO FLESH OUT. IN TERMS OF -- LET'S SEE. I WANTED TO
21 ECHO THE COMMENT ABOUT ACCESS AND, LIKE, THE SHARE OF
22 POPULATION TO ACCESS NOT ONLY TO JOBS, BUT TRANSIT CENTER HAS
23 AN INTERESTING EQUITY DASHBOARD THAT LOOKS AT ACCESS NOT ONLY
24 JOBS, BUT FOR EXAMPLE, I THINK THEY HAVE GROCERY STORES AND
25 HEALTH CENTERS, OTHER DESTINATIONS. NON-JOB COMMUTE TRIPS AND



APRIL 26, 2024

1 ALSO IMPORTANT TO TRACK WHEN WE GET TO THAT ACCESS METRICS. IN
2 TERMS OF MODE SHARE, LAYERING ON TO WHAT IAN WAS TALKING ABOUT
3 IN TERMS OF DEFINING A REGIONAL CONNECTED NETWORK. LIKE, MODE
4 SHARE ALL AROUND THE REGION IS AN INTERESTING STATISTIC, BUT
5 IT'S NOT THAT MEANINGFUL, BECAUSE IT'S NOT THAT TRACTABLE,
6 LIKE WHAT YOU DO TO CHANGE MODE SHARE ALL AROUND THE REGION IS
7 A BROAD BRUSH. WHEREAS IF YOU CAN SAY, YOU KNOW, THE MODE
8 AROUND THIS BRT LINE OR THESE BART STATIONS AND THEIR
9 CONNECTIONS, LIKE THAT'S PRETTY MEANINGFUL BECAUSE THERE HAVE
10 BECOME QUITE A LOT OF TRACTABLE THINGS THAT YOU CAN DO AND
11 THEN COMPARE. SO, OVER TIME THAT WOULD BE A REALLY USEFUL
12 THING TO BE TRACKING. THEN, LASTLY, I WANT TO ECHO WHAT
13 SEVERAL PEOPLE SAID ABOUT DEVELOPING A TIMELINE, AND, ALSO, IN
14 TERMS OF TRACKING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF HOW NETWORK MANAGEMENT
15 IS WORKING, I AM WONDERING AND THINKING OUT LOUD ABOUT WHETHER
16 IT WOULD BE HELPFUL, AND NOT TOO EMBARRASSING, TO SAY WE WANT
17 TO BE TRACKING OUR PERFORMANCE AGAINST OUR TIMELINE. YOU KNOW,
18 NOT TO, LIKE, WITH THE GOAL OF NOT TO BE EMBARRASSING, BUT THE
19 GOAL OF TO BE IDENTIFYING ANY BARRIERS TO ACHIEVING A GOAL
20 THAT WAS SET FORTH, IS IT A BARRIER IN TERMS OF DATA QUALITY,
21 IS IT A GOAL IN TERMS OF A DECISION-MAKING PROCESS THAT IT
22 TOOK 18 AGENCIES ALL TO AGREE AND THAT TOOK A YEAR AND A HALF.
23 I THINK THAT WOULD BE A USEFUL THING IN GENERAL TO TRACK THE
24 TIME PROGRESS ON VARIOUS DIFFERENT INITIATIVE GOALS IN ORDER,
25 WITH THE GOAL OF BEING ABLE TO IMPROVE THE PROCESS. AND I



APRIL 26, 2024

1 THINK THAT'S ALMOST THE LOST. AT THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
2 COUNCIL, GENERAL MANAGER GONOT OF VTA HAD IDENTIFIED SOMETHING
3 THAT WAS IN THE METRICS THAT RELATED TO PEAK PERIOD COMMUTING.
4 AND I DIDN'T ACTUALLY FIND IT IN THE LIST, SO MAYBE I MISSED
5 IT, BUT TO THE EXTENT THAT IT USES A WHITE COLLAR PEAK TRAVEL
6 TIME AS A METRIC, SHE ENCOURAGED USING DIFFERENT TIME PERIODS
7 BECAUSE THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, MANY DIFFERENT TRAVEL PATTERNS
8 FOR PEOPLE WITH DIFFERENT KINDS OF TRIPS. I CAN'T ACTUALLY
9 TELL WHAT SHE WAS REFERRING TO, BUT THEY AN IMPORTANT POINT TO
10 MENTION WHATEVER IT DID REFER TO. I THINK THAT'S IT BUT IF
11 STAFF WANTS TO RESPOND TO ANYTHING PEOPLE SAID BEFORE WE GO TO
12 PUBLIC COMMENT?

13

14 **ALLISON QUACH:** THANKS ADINA TO YOUR LAST QUESTION ABOUT TIME
15 OF DAY THAT'S LISTED UNDER POTENTIAL FUTURE MEASURES BUT
16 THINKING IN TERMS OF DISAGGREGATION EVEN IN EXISTING MEASURES
17 WE CONCUR WITH COUNCIL MEMBERS COMMENTS AND WE'LL BE LOOKING
18 INTO THAT.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IAN?

21

22 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANK YOU ADINA, MODE SHARE, THE STANDARD
23 METRIC IS MODE SHARE DURING COMMUTE HOURS THAT'S HISTORICALLY
24 HAS BEEN MTC VITAL SIGNS AND THAT'S AN OUT OF DATE STATISTIC.
25 WE WERE TRYING TO FIND MODE SHARE OVERALL FOR TRIPS AND IT'S



APRIL 26, 2024

1 INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT IT'S DIFFICULT STATISTIC TO FIND I THINK
2 THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO GET THAT MODE SHARE STATISTIC
3 NOT BIAS IN FAVOR OF ONE TIME OF DAY BUT REFLECTIVE OF OVERALL
4 TRANSIT TRIPS AND POPULATIONS AND TO ENCOURAGE ALL OUR TRANSIT
5 AGENCIES TO BE COLLECTING AND PUTTING THAT DATA OUT THERE IN
6 THE SAME WAY I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT SPECIFIC THING WE
7 SHOULD TRY TO ACCOMPLISH.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY COMMENTS FROM STAFF BEFORE WE GO TO
10 PUBLIC COMMENT.

11

12 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU. MELANIE CHOY, MTC. WHAT I WANT TO DO
13 IS ACCEPT APPRECIATION FOR THE DIVERSITY OF COMMENTS FROM ALL
14 OF YOU AND OUR INTENT IS TO TAKE THE FEEDBACK AND AS WE WORK
15 ON THE METRICS WE'RE BRINGING IT TO THE RNM COMMITTEE NEXT
16 MONTH AND AS THOSE MEASURES ARE APPROVED AND ADVANCED, THE
17 FEEDBACK WILL BE HELPFUL FOR US IN TERMS OF EVOLVING ALL OF
18 THE METRICS AND OUR DIRECTION AND ALSO A FOCUS IN ON SENDING
19 OUT THE TIMELINE AS WELL AS GETTING BACK TO ALL OF YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I SEE ONE MEMBER OF
22 THE PUBLIC IN THE ROOM.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY. YOU KNOW, IN JUST OVER TWO YEARS,
2 WE'RE GOING TO PUT A BOND ON THE BALLOT. AND, SO, I THINK IT'S
3 REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THAT FOLKS SEQUENCE THE WORK YOU'RE
4 DOING SO BY THE TIME THE BOND IS ON THE BALLOT WE HAVE
5 SOMETHING TO SHOW WE'RE ACTUALLY GETTING THIS WORK DONE NOT
6 JUST THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON IT OR STUDYING FOR THE LAST
7 EIGHT YEARS OR HOWEVER MUCH IT WILL BE BY THAT POINT. THINK
8 ABOUT THE LOW-HANGING FRUIT AND NON-CONTROVERSIAL STUFF. NO
9 AGENCY IS GOING TO WANT TO SERIOUSLY DISCUSS FREE TRANSFERS
10 BEFORE THEY KNOW THE FISCAL CLIFF HAS BEEN AVOIDED. DON'T EVEN
11 GO THERE JUST YET. SOMETHING LIKE, FOR EXAMPLE, YOU KNOW,
12 REDOING -- OR DOING THE SCHEDULING BETTER SO THAT, ONE, YOU
13 KNOW, TRAIN COMES AT ONE POINT, AND THE BUSES LEAVE, OR THE
14 BUSES COME AND THE TRAIN LEAVES. SOMETHING LIKE THAT CAN BE
15 EASILY DONE. ALL YOU HAVE TO DO IS GRAB THE DATABASES OF 511
16 OR GOOGLE, OR WHAT HAVE YOU AND YOU SHOULD BE ABLE TO IDENTIFY
17 THAT KEY SCHEDULING ISSUES ARE A GOOD DATA ANALYST SHOULD BE
18 ABLE TO DO IN A FEW MONTHS, MAX. GO FOR THE LOW-HANGING FRUIT.
19 AGAIN, WAYFINDING, ET CETERA, YOU KNOW, WHY NOT SET UP THE
20 COMMITTEE NOW? IT'S PRETTY NON-CONTROVERSIAL WE'RE GOING TO
21 HAVE TO DO IT WHY WAIT UNTIL THE ENTIRE STUDY IS DONE ALL OF
22 THE CONTROVERSIAL STUFF IS DONE SO PLEASE SEQUENCE IT IN A WAY
23 THAT YOU HAVE SOMETHING YOU CAN SHOW THE VOTERS THAT WE HAVE
24 ACCOMPLISHED ALREADY. THANK YOU.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO ONE ON ZOOM AND NO ONE WITH HANDS
4 RAISED.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR THE
7 ROBUST WORK ON THIS END. LOOKING FORWARD FOR THIS TO CONTINUE
8 MOVING FORWARD GATHER DATA IMPROVE. WE ARE NOW MOVING ON TO
9 THE NEXT ITEM WHICH AGENDA ITEM 4B WHICH IS REGARDING
10 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, ITEM NUMBER 25, WHICH IS
11 PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY AND A PROJECT TO ADOPT STANDARDIZED
12 ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PROGRAMS BENEFITTING PEOPLE WITH
13 DISABILITIES AND DRENNEN SHELTON AND JOHN SANDERSON WILL
14 PRESENT THIS INFORMATIONAL ITEM.

15

16 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** HI. THIS IS DRENNAN. I'M ON ZOOM. IT LOOKS
17 LIKE THEY'RE BRINGING UP THE SLIDES. PERFECT. SO, THANKS FOR
18 HAVING US TODAY. I'M DRENNEN SHELTON IN THE REGIONAL NETWORK
19 MANAGEMENT SECTION AT MTC. AND AS THE CHAIR SAID, JOINING ME
20 TODAY IS JOHN SANDERSON. HE IS THE DIRECTOR OF ADA SERVICES AT
21 COUNTY CONNECTION. SO WE'RE HERE TO PRESENT THE DRAFT REPORT
22 ON THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, ACTION 25. WHICH IS TO
23 ADOPT STANDARDIZED ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PROGRAMS THAT
24 BENEFIT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. SO, MTC AND THE TRANSIT
25 AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS ACTION FOR WELL OVER A YEAR



APRIL 26, 2024

1 NOW. OUR WORK HAS FOCUSED ON TWO DIFFERENT PROGRAMS FOR
2 PARATRANSIT RIDERS. ONE IS THE TRANSIT CONNECTIONS CLIPPER
3 CARD RTC PROGRAM WIDELY KNOWN SECOND PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY
4 WHICH IS GOING TO BE THE MAIN FOCUS OF THE REPORT BUT FOR
5 THOSE OF YOU WHO AREN'T FAMILIAR WITH THE RTC PROGRAM IT
6 PROVIDES DISCOUNTS ON FIXED ROUTE FOR DISABLED RIDERS. THE
7 ELIGIBILITY CHANGES MADE TO THE RTC PROGRAM ARE RELATIVELY
8 SIMPLE AND WILL SIGNIFICANTLY STREAMLINE THE APPLICATION
9 PROCESS FOR PARATRANSIT RIDERS. PARATRANSIT RIDERS WHO WANT TO
10 JOIN THE RTC PROGRAM NOW NEED ONLY TO OPT INTO THE PROGRAM TO
11 RECEIVE THOSE DISCOUNTS ON FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT. THAT POLICY
12 CHANGE ALREADY MADE ITS WAY THROUGH THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
13 BOARD AND ALL OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES INDIVIDUAL THIS ROLLED
14 OUT BY MAY 1ST. BUT AS I SAID, THE VAST MAJORITY OF WORK DONE
15 UNDER THIS ACTION FOCUSES ON THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS FOR
16 PARATRANSIT. OUR WORK FOR THIS INITIATIVE FELL INTO THREE MAIN
17 PARTS. ONE WAS DOCUMENTING AND UNDERSTANDING ALL OF THE
18 PROCESSES BY WHICH OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY.
19 THE SECOND WAS RESEARCHING INDUSTRY WIDE BEST PRACTICES AND
20 LESSONS LEARNED FROM AROUND THE COUNTRY, AND THE THIRD WAS
21 STUDYING THOSE FRICTION POINTS FROM BOTH THE RIDER PRINCIPLE
22 AND THE AGENCY PERSPECTIVE IN ORDER TO DEVELOP OUR
23 RECOMMENDATIONS. WE DID THIS WORK WITH A FULL UNDERSTANDING
24 THAT STANDARDIZING ACROSS THE REGION WOULD REQUIRE A VERY
25 LARGE INVESTMENT OF FUNDING, WHICH WE KNOW WE DON'T HAVE. SO,



APRIL 26, 2024

1 INSTEAD, WE CONSIDERED ALL OF THIS SIGNIFICANT VARIATIONS
2 BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES AND WE WORKED TO EMPHASIZE UNIVERSAL
3 PRACTICES, REDUCE BURDENS TO APPLICANTS AND TO RIDERS AND TO
4 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. WE LOOKED AT REGIONALIZING SOME
5 FUNCTIONS OF ELIGIBILITY, AND MINIMIZING THE LEVEL OF NEW
6 INVESTMENT NEEDED WHILE WE ALSO CONTINUE TO ENSURE FEDERAL
7 COMPLIANCE OF THIS CIVIL RIGHT. OUR DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS WERE
8 DEVELOPED THROUGH A NUMBER OF STAKEHOLDER GROUPS. WE HAVE A
9 WORKING GROUP OF PARATRANSIT AND ACCESSIBILITY TRANSIT STAFF.
10 WE HAVE MEMBERS FROM THE NINE COUNTY PARATRANSIT COORDINATING
11 COUNCILS. THESE ARE MEMBER GROUPS WHO ADVISE AND MAKE
12 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES ON PARATRANSIT AND
13 ACCESSIBILITY MATTERS. WE HAD ADVICE FROM THE MTC POLICY
14 ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, AND THERE WAS
15 SPECIFIC OUTREACH AND ENGAGE TO PARATRANSIT RIDERS THROUGH THE
16 COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT HUMAN SERVICES TRANSPORTATION PLAN
17 UPDATE. SO, WITH ALL OF THAT PREAMBLE OUT OF THE WAY, LET'S GO
18 TO THE NEXT SLIDE. I DO WANT TO GIVE YOU A LITTLE BIT OF
19 BACKGROUND ON WHAT PARATRANSIT IS, AND A LITTLE BIT ABOUT IT.
20 SO, PARATRANSIT IS A PUBLIC TRANSIT SERVICE FOR PEOPLE WHO
21 HAVE A DISABILITY OR A DISABLING HEALTH CONDITION THAT
22 PREVENTS THEM FROM USING THE FIXED ROUTE SYSTEM. PUBLIC
23 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE REQUIRED UNDER THE AMERICANS WITH
24 DISABILITIES ACT, THE ADA, TO PROVIDE PARATRANSIT SERVICES.
25 SO, IT IS A CIVIL RIGHT. PARATRANSIT IS CALLED A COMPLEMENTARY



APRIL 26, 2024

1 SERVICE, MEANING THAT IT OPERATES WITH THE SAME HOURS AND DAYS
2 AS FIXED ROUTE, AND IT ONLY OPERATES WITHIN A THREE QUARTER
3 MILE BUFFER AROUND FIXED ROUTE STOPS AND STATIONS. PARATRANSIT
4 FARES CAN BE UP TO DOUBLE THE AMOUNT OF THE FIXED ROUTE FARE.
5 AND AGENCIES CAN REQUIRE THAT RIDERS SCHEDULE THEIR TRIPS UP
6 TO 24 HOURS IN ADVANCE. AND, LASTLY, TRANSIT AGENCIES CANNOT
7 DENY PARATRANSIT TRIP REQUESTS DUE TO CAPACITY ISSUES OR THE
8 TRIP TYPE. SO, THAT MEANS THAT TRIPS FOR LIFE SAVING MEDICAL
9 APPOINTMENTS ARE TREATED JUST AS IMPORTANTLY AS TRIPS TO A
10 MOVIE THEATRE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOT ALL PUBLIC TRANSIT
11 AGENCIES ARE REQUIRED TO PROVIDE PARATRANSIT. SPECIFICALLY
12 COMMUTER BUS, COMMUTER RAIL, AND INNER CITY RAIL SERVICES ARE
13 EXEMPT. THERE ARE ALSO SEVERAL CITIES IN THE BAY AREA THAT
14 PROVIDE PARATRANSIT-LIKE SERVICES. BUT FOR THE PURPOSES OF
15 THIS WORK, WE'RE ONLY DEALING WITH BAY AREA PUBLIC TRANSIT
16 SERVICES THAT ARE MANDATED BY THE ADA TO PROVIDE THAT
17 PARATRANSIT SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, RIDERS BECOME
18 ELIGIBLE FOR PARATRANSIT SERVICE IF THEY'RE UNABLE TO USE THE
19 PARATRANSIT, BECAUSE OF A DISABILITY, OR DISABLING CONDITION.
20 SOME PEOPLE BELIEVE THAT PARATRANSIT IS PROVIDED TO YOU AT A
21 CERTAIN AGE. IT'S NOT. IT'S BASED ON DISABILITY OR DISABLING
22 CONDITION. TO DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY TRANSIT AGENCIES CONSIDER
23 A NUMBER OF FACTORS INCLUDING THE ABILITY TO WALK OR WHEEL TO
24 OR FROM TRANSIT STOPS. THE ABILITY TO ENTER AND EXIT TRANSIT
25 STATIONS, THE ABILITY TO SIGNAL FOR STOPS WHILE RIDING THE BUS



APRIL 26, 2024

1 AND THE ABILITY TO HANDLE A NUMBER OF UNEXPECTED SITUATIONS.
2 AND WHILE THE ADA PROVIDES CRITERIA FOR DETERMINING
3 ELIGIBILITY, IT DOES NOT PROVIDE THE PROCESS FOR DETERMINING
4 ELIGIBILITY. AND, SO, AS YOU MIGHT IMAGINE, EACH TRANSIT
5 AGENCY HAS THEIR OWN WAY TO APPROACH DETERMINING ELIGIBILITY.
6 AND IN THE BAY AREA YOU CAN FIND SIMPLE PAPER BASED
7 APPLICATION PROCESSES. YOU CAN FIND PAPER BASED APPLICATION
8 PROCESSES THAT ALSO INCLUDE A TELECONFERENCE INTERVIEW, AND
9 THEN YOU CAN FIND PAPER BASED APPLICATIONS, AN IN-PERSON
10 INTERVIEW THAT ALSO INCLUDE A TRANSIT SKILLS ASSESSMENT, SORT
11 OF, LIKE A TEST. THERE AT THE PLACE WHERE THEY DO ELIGIBILITY
12 ASSESSMENTS. ONE OF THE GREAT THINGS WE HAVE IN OUR AREA IS
13 THAT IF YOU ARE DETERMINED TO BE ELIGIBLE UNDER ONE BAY AREA
14 TRANSIT AGENCY, YOU ARE ELIGIBLE UNDER ALL OF THE BAY AREA
15 TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO, YOU DON'T HAVE TO GET ELIGIBILITY FROM
16 EACH SYSTEM. AND THEN ONCE YOU'RE DETERMINED TO BE ELIGIBLE
17 FOR PARATRANSIT, EVEN IF YOU HAVE A PERMANENT DISABILITY,
18 RIDERS MUST RECERTIFY THEIR ELIGIBILITY EVERY THREE YEARS AND
19 GO THROUGH SOME TYPE OF PROCESS AGAIN. IMPORTANTLY, ONLY SOME
20 OF OUR AGENCIES INTEGRATE MOBILITY MANAGEMENT SERVICES INTO
21 THEIR ELIGIBILITY PROCESS. MEANING THAT SOME AGENCIES WILL
22 EDUCATE THEIR APPLICANTS AND RIDERS, AND ACTUALLY GIVE
23 REFERRALS TO OTHER SERVICES OR TO TRAVEL TRAINING IN THEIR
24 AREA. AND NOW I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO JOHN TO GO THROUGH
25 THOSE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS WE HAVE FOR YOU IN THE REPORT.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **JOHN SANDERSON:** THANK YOU. THE ELIGIBILITY WERE SET OUT BY
3 FEDERAL LAW AND POLICY A LONG TIME AGO BUT THE INDIVIDUAL
4 NITTY-GRITTY DETAILS WERE LEFT UP TO THE OPERATORS IN TERMS OF
5 EXACTLY HOW TO FIGURE OUT WHO IS ELIGIBLE AND WHO IS NOT THAT
6 LED TO 27 SEPARATE PROCESSES ACROSS THE BAY AREA WHICH OF
7 COURSE IS CUMBERSOME AND CONFUSING. THE NOTIONS WERE TO
8 STANDARDIZE AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE THOSE PROCESSES. THIS FIRST
9 SIX, THE FOCUS IS REALLY ON THE ELIGIBILITY EVALUATION
10 PROCESS, ITSELF. AND THE IDEA WAS TO STANDARDIZE ACROSS THE
11 REGION AND ALSO TO SET A BASELINE FOR EVERYONE. AS DRENNAN
12 MENTIONED, SOME PROCESSES WERE VERY EXTENSIVE, OTHERS WERE
13 PRETTY MINIMAL, AND WE WANTED TO GET EVERYBODY UP TO A, SORT
14 OF, BASELINE OF QUALITY, IF YOU WILL, NOT TO SAY THAT ANYBODY
15 WAS NON-COMPLIANT BEFORE, BUT SOME COULD BE A LITTLE MORE
16 ROBUST. SO, THE IDEA WAS STANDARDIZE THE APPLICATION FORM. SO,
17 WE'RE ALL FILLING OUT THE SAME QUESTIONS. STANDARDIZE THE
18 INTERVIEW PROTOCOL SO THAT WE'RE ASKING THE SAME QUESTIONS
19 WHEN WE TALK TO PEOPLE. APPEALS PROCESS. AGAIN, SOMETHING
20 THAT'S LEFT UP TO THE INDIVIDUAL OPERATOR IN THE LAW, BUT WE
21 WANTED TO HAVE SOME PROCESS THAT EACH OPERATOR WILL BE
22 APPLYING HERE IN THE BAY AREA. DEFINITION, YOU WOULD THINK
23 THIS WOULD BE KIND OF EASY AND OBVIOUS, BUT IT WASN'T. SO, WE
24 HAD EXTENSIVE DISCUSSIONS ON EXACTLY TO CALL EVERYTHING. AND
25 HAVE NOW MANAGED TO STANDARDIZE THE DEFINITIONS OF ELIGIBILITY



APRIL 26, 2024

1 CATEGORIES, TIMELINES FOR RENEWABLE. DRENNAN MENTIONED WE HAVE
2 ALL STANDARDIZED ON FIVE YEARS NOW. THAT'S A BIG WIN. WE ALSO
3 NEED TO EXPLORE ALTERNATIVES TO BRINGING PEOPLE IN FOR IN-
4 PERSON ASSESSMENT FOR CERTAIN DISABILITY CATEGORIES THAT'S NOT
5 WARRANTED. FOR EXAMPLE, FOLKS WHO ARE ELDERLY, AND ARE
6 ATTENDING A DAY PROGRAM AT AN ALZHEIMER'S DAY CENTER, THEY
7 DON'T NECESSARILY NEED TO COME DOWN TO THE PARATRANSIT OFFICE
8 TO SEE IF THEY'RE ABLE TO TAKE THE BUS ON THEIR OWN. WE CAN
9 SAY PRETTY CONFIDENTLY JUST BASED ON A BRIEF INTERVIEW WITH A
10 SOCIAL WORKER, THAT THEY'RE NOT. AND THEN LASTLY ON THIS LIST
11 IDENTIFY AND ENHANCE ALTERNATIVES, INCORPORATING TRAVEL
12 TRAINING AND ALSO NON-ADA, NON-PARATRANSIT OPTIONS TO GET
13 PEOPLE AROUND. PARATRANSIT IS THE KIND OF OPTION OF LAST
14 RESORT. IT IS THE MOST ACCESSIBLE OPTION WE HAVE, BUT IT ALSO
15 IS CLUNKY IT'S INCONVENIENT AND EXPENSIVE TO PROVIDE AND NOT
16 TERRIBLY COMFORTABLE FOR THE RIDERS A LOT OF THE TIME. SO IF
17 WE CAN GET PEOPLE SHIFTED ON TO OTHER MORE, SORT OF, NIMBLE
18 SERVICES THAT COULD MEET THEIR NEEDS, MAYBE WE CAN DO THAT
19 MORE EFFICIENTLY, AND IN A GREATER DEGREE OF COMFORT,
20 HOPEFULLY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS
21 ARE A LITTLE BIT LONGER TERM BUT STILL KIND OF IMMEDIATE IN
22 FRONT OF US AND THESE ARE REALLY ABOUT MAINTAINING THE QUALITY
23 THAT WE'RE GETTING TO, THAT WE HAVE GOTTEN TO, AND, ALSO,
24 MAINTAINING SUSTAINABILITY. A LOT OF THIS STUFF, YOU KNOW, YOU
25 CAN'T JUST SET IT UP AND THEN LET IT GO P YOU HAVE GOT TO KEEP



APRIL 26, 2024

1 TRAINING AND KEEP WORKING ON IT. THESE PROGRAMS TEND TO BE
2 PRETTY PERISHABLE. SO IF WE FALL UP IT TAKES TIME TO GET BACK
3 ON TRACK. SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE REALLY PRIORITIZE ANNUAL
4 TRAININGS. A LOT OF THE PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY TRAININGS HAVE
5 BEEN KIND OF BY THE SEAT OF THE PANTS OR ON THE JOB TRAINING,
6 THAT KIND OF THING. THERE ARE SOME PROGRAMS OUT THERE THAT ARE
7 AVAILABLE. IN YEARS PAST, LONG BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, WE DID
8 HAVE FOLKS COME THROUGH EVERY COUPLE OF YEARS AND DO BIG
9 INTENSIVE TRAINING. WE WOULD LIKE TO GET BACK ON THAT TRACK
10 AND ACTUALLY EXPAND IT. WE HAVE, HOPEFULLY, AT LEAST ONE
11 FORMAL TRAINING SESSION HERE IN THE BAY AREA EVERY YEAR. WE
12 ALSO NEED TO KEEP AN EYE ON NEW VENDORS THIS IS A COMPLEX
13 FAIRLY NICHE FUNCTION THERE ARE COMPANIES THAT ARE ENGAGED IN
14 THIS WORK, BUT THE LANDSCAPE CHANGES PRETTY CONSTANTLY. SO, WE
15 NEED TO KEEP TRACK AND WE NEED MTC'S HELP DOING THAT. WE WANT
16 TO EXPLORE TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS TO ENHANCE ELIGIBILITY
17 IMPLEMENTATION. KICK THAT ONE BACK TO DRENNAN. TO THE PRIOR
18 DISCUSSION, WE WANT TO DEVELOP MONITORING STRATEGIES. THIS IS
19 PART OF THE PROCESS. SO, PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY IS PART OF
20 THE OVERALL PARATRANSIT PROGRAM. I THINK THE SUCCESS AND
21 EFFICIENCY OF THE ELIGIBILITY EVALUATION PROCESS NEEDS TO BE
22 MEASURED RIGHT ALONG WITH OUR KPIS THAT WE'RE USING TO
23 EVALUATE THE REGIONAL NETWORK AS A WHOLE. AND SOMEWHERE ALONG
24 THE WAY WE WANT TO INCREASE THE TRIP BY TRIP CONDITIONAL
25 ELIGIBILITY. THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE ELIGIBLE FOR



APRIL 26, 2024

1 PARATRANSIT TRIPS FOR SOME TRIPS BUT NOT NECESSARY HE FOR
2 OTHER TRIPS. IN PRACTICAL TERMS IT'S VERY, VERY DIFFICULT FOR
3 THE PROVIDERS TO TELL EXACTLY WHEN A PERSON IS AND IS NOT
4 ELIGIBLE, GIVEN THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE DAY, A LOT OF TIMES
5 IT'S VARIABLE HEALTH CONDITION, OR IT REQUIRES A GREAT DEGREE
6 OF ADDITIONAL DATA ABOUT WHAT ARE THE HILLS LIKE, WHAT'S THE
7 DISTANCE TO THE NEAREST BUS STOP. THOSE KIND OF THINGS. THAT'S
8 NOT NECESSARY HE DATA THAT PARATRANSIT RESERVATIONISTS ARE
9 EQUIPPED WITH, AND SO WE WANT TO GET THEM THERE. DRENNAN, BACK
10 TO YOU.

11

12 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THANK YOU. COULD WE ADVANCE THE SLIDE,
13 PLEASE? GREAT. SO, AT THIS STAGE WE'RE STILL CONTINUING TO
14 RECEIVE FEEDBACK FROM THE RIDERS AND THE PARATRANSIT
15 COORDINATING COUNCIL MEMBERS FROM AROUND THE REGION. WE'LL
16 CONTINUE TO TAKE INPUT ON THIS REPORT AND THESE
17 RECOMMENDATIONS. AND THEN IN THE -- I THINK IN JUNE WE'RE
18 GOING TO THE RNM COUNCIL IT SAYS JUNE, JULY, BUT I'M PRETTY
19 SURE WE'RE GOING IN JUNE, THEN ON TO THE RNM COMMITTEE IN THE
20 FALL. AND OUR WORKING GROUP OF PARATRANSIT ACCESSIBILITY --
21 PARATRANSIT AND ACCESSIBILITY STAFF AT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
22 HAVE AND WILL CONTINUE TO COORDINATE ON THESE POLICY CHANGES
23 AND IMPLEMENTATION. AS JOHN MENTIONED, A FEW THINGS HAVE
24 ALREADY STARTED TO BE IMPLEMENTED SUCH AS THE THREE YEAR
25 ELIGIBILITY PERIOD, BEING EXTENDED TO FIVE YEARS. SO THAT'S



APRIL 26, 2024

1 WHAT THEY'RE WORKING ON DOING NOW. ADVANCE THE SLIDE. I WANT
2 MAKE SURE YOU ALL HAVE OUR CONTACT INFORMATION IF SOMETHING
3 OCCURS AFTER THE MEETING WE WANT ALWAYS WANT YOU TO BE ABLE TO
4 GET IN TOUCH WITH US BUT WITH THAT WE'RE HAPPY TO ANSWER YOUR
5 QUESTIONS AND HEAR WHAT YOU HAVE TO SAY.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I SEE WARREN HAD A
8 HAND?

9

10 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YEAH, UNFORTUNATELY DUE TO PARATRANSIT I'M
11 GOING TO HAVE TO LEAVE SHORTLY I WANT TO MAKE SURE I HAVE A
12 CHANCE TO COMMENT ON THIS TOPIC PARATRANSIT IS NEAR AND DEAR
13 TO MY HEART I USE IT ON A SEMI DAILY BASIS, PRETTY CLOSE TO A
14 DAILY BASIS, DRENNAN AND HER TEAM HAVE DONE A GOOD JOB OF
15 TRYING TO GRAPPLE WITH THIS ISSUE. THIS PRESENTATION ABOUT
16 ELIGIBILITY AND ALL THE DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF IT HAS BEEN A
17 LONG TIME IN COMING. IT'S IMPORTANT WE GRAB WELL THIS. FOR A
18 LONG TIME PARATRANSIT RIDERS HAVE HAD ARE THIS STRUGGLE OF
19 TRYING TO MOVE FROM ONE AGENCY TO ANOTHER, TO TRY TO BE
20 ELIGIBLE IN ONE PLACE IN ONE WAY, AND THEN HAVE A COMPLETELY
21 DIFFERENT STRUGGLE IN ANOTHER AREA. I WANT TO JUST REMIND
22 EVERYONE THAT WHAT WE'RE HEARING TODAY AROUND ELIGIBILITY IS
23 JUST THE TIP OF THE ICEBERG. THIS ARE A NUMBER OF OTHER
24 PARATRANSIT CHANGES THAT WE'LL BE HEARING ABOUT IN THE FUTURE.
25 I WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT THIS WHOLE PARATRANSIT REALM,



APRIL 26, 2024

1 IT MAY NOT BE SOMETHING THAT MOST PEOPLE THINK ABOUT WHEN WE
2 TALK -- WHEN WE THINK ABOUT SEXY PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, THE
3 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF PROJECTS THAT PEOPLE WANT
4 TO CONSIDER BUT WHEN IT COMES TO THIS MEASURE THIS IS
5 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT AND SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO BE FUNDED,
6 WHEN WE THINK LONG-TERM AND ALL OF THE DIFFERENT CHANGES THAT
7 NEED TO HAPPEN IN THIS REALM AND THE PARATRANSIT WE DO NEED IT
8 FUNDED AND IT'S IMPORTANT AS BART SAN JOSE OR IT'S MAJOR. I
9 WANT TO THANK DRENNAN, STAY TUNED WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING
10 ABOUT THIS FOR QUITE A WHILE. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO PRIORITIZE PEOPLE
13 WITH PERSONAL EXPERIENCE OR DIRECT PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE OR
14 NEEDS AND THEN TO ANYBODY ELSE WHO HAS ANY QUESTIONS. SO, IS
15 THERE ANYBODY THAT HAS PERSONAL OR PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE,
16 RAZZ A HAND. HILARY.

17

18 **HILARY BROWN:** PERSONALLY I HAVE BEEN A DISABLED RIDER SINCE
19 JIMMY CARTER WAS PRESIDENT. I'M GLAD THIS PROGRAM EXISTS
20 BECAUSE I KNOW PEOPLE WHO USE WHEELCHAIRS, THIS WAS BEFORE --
21 THIS HAPPENED WHICH IS THIS PROGRAM EXISTED, AND I LIVED IN
22 THE CITY AND USED BUSES, I COULDN'T STAND IT, BUT SINCE THEN
23 THEY HAVE PEOPLE WHO USE WHEELCHAIRS CAN SIT DOWN WITH THAT
24 DISABILITY. SO, I APPRECIATE THIS EXISTS IN ALL OF THE NINE
25 BAY AREA COUNTIES. I WANT TO SHARE THAT.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. DWAYNE HANKERSON.

3

4 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT THAT WHEN WE'RE
5 DEALING WITH THIS ISSUE, I KNOW THAT RESOURCES ARE ULTIMATELY,
6 LIKE, THE BOTTOM LINE. BUT ANOTHER ONE OF OUR PRIORITIES SORRY
7 TO MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY IS EQUITABLE AND TO MAKE SURE THAT
8 PEOPLE, LIKE, THEY'RE NOT -- LIKE, DISCRIMINATED AGAINST IN A
9 WAY. LIKE, THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO ACCESS TRANSIT JUST LIKE A
10 PERSON THAT DOESN'T HAVE A DISABILITY CAN ACCESS TRANSIT. AND
11 IF THAT TAKES A LITTLE MORE EFFORT, IT'S GOING TO TAKE MORE
12 RESOURCES. BUT WE NEED TO FACE THAT UP FRONT AND IT'S NOT A
13 THING THAT WE CAN LEGISLATE, I DON'T THINK, AND I THINK WE
14 NEED TO LOOK AT IT LIKE THAT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** JUST A REAL QUICK COMMENT. IT'S REALLY A
17 POSITIVE THING THAT IT SEEMS TO BE PRIORITIZING ENGAGEMENT
18 WITH ENGAGEMENT WITH PARATRANSIT RIDERS IN THAT COMMUNITY. AND
19 I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO REACH OUT TO MEMBERS OF THAT
20 COMMUNITY WHO ARE NOT RIDING TRANSIT TO FIND OUT WHY AND WHAT
21 THE CHALLENGES ARE. BUT I THINK, AGAIN, VERY POSITIVE SIGNS.
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** DYLAN?

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **DYLAN FABRIS:** I HAD A QUICK QUESTION, PERMANENT ELIGIBILITY IS
2 FOR UP TO THREE YEARS AND YOUR CONSIDERING EXTENDING THAT TO
3 FIVE. IS THAT RIGHT?

4

5 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** SO THAT CHANGE HAS ALREADY BEEN MADE. IT'S
6 STARTED TO BE IMPLEMENTED NOW.

7

8 **DYLAN FABRIS:** AND IS THERE A REASON WHY FOR FOLKS WITH
9 PERMANENT DISABILITIES THAT CAN'T JUST BE INDEFINITE?

10

11 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** SO, WE'RE STREAMLINING THE RECERTIFICATION
12 PROCESS, AS WELL, SO IT'S NOT THE FULL ELIGIBILITY PROCESS
13 THAT IF YOU ALREADY HAVE PARATRANSIT AND YOU'RE IN A CERTAIN
14 CATEGORY THAT YOU WILL HAVE TO GO THROUGH. IT WILL BE A
15 STREAMLINE PROCESS THAT ISN'T NECESSARILY ABOUT EVALUATING
16 YOUR ABILITY TO USE FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT, IT'S MORE ABOUT ARE
17 YOU STILL USING THE SERVICE, YOU KNOW, ARE THERE UPDATES TO
18 YOUR MOBILITY, THERE ARE UPDATES TO THE DEVICES YOU USE, ARE
19 THERE UPDATES IN YOUR CONTACT INFORMATION THAT, SORT OF,
20 THING.

21

22 **DYLAN FABRIS:** SO, THE PURPOSE OF HAVING THE RECERTIFICATION IS
23 TO GET MORE DATA? IS IT LIKE A FEDERAL REQUIREMENT? OR I'M
24 JUST -- I'M NOT SUPER INTO THESE ISSUES I'M JUST TRYING TO
25 UNDERSTAND WHY THE -- YOU KNOW, PROCESS TO REDO IT AGAIN.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** IT'S CERTAINLY A BEST PRACTICE TO CONTINUE TO
3 ENGAGE WITH YOUR PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS. JOHN, IS THERE ANYTHING
4 ELSE YOU WANT TO ADD TO THAT?

5

6 **JOHN SANDERSON:** I WILL STATE FEDERAL REGULATION DON'T REQUIRE
7 A RECERTIFICATION PROCESS. THEY DO SPECIFICALLY CALL IT OUT AS
8 AN OPTION THAT OPERATORS CAN DO. AND, YOU KNOW, AS DRENNAN
9 SAYS, IT'S A BEST PRACTICE. BASICALLY, WE NEED TO CHECK IN AND
10 JUST DO AN ADMINISTRATIVE UPDATE EVERY FEW YEARS. OTHERWISE,
11 YOU KNOW, PEOPLE'S LIVING SITUATION DOES CHANGE. SOMETIMES
12 SOMEBODY WILL COME IN, THEY WILL ENROLL IN THE PROGRAM,
13 THEY'RE LIVING AT HOME, THEN THINGS HAVE MOVED ON A LITTLE BIT
14 THEY'RE USING A DIFFERENT MOBILITY DEVICE, MAYBE LIVING IN
15 ASSISTED LIVING, THOSE KIND OF CHANGES AFFECT IN MATERIAL WAYS
16 HOW WE SERVE THOSE RIDERS. AND SO WE JUST NEED TO RE-
17 ESTABLISHED THE, SORT OF, GROUNDWORK FOR EACH PERSON THAT,
18 JUST AS OUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THEIR SITUATION IS, EVERY
19 NOW YEARS. WE TRY TO MAKE IT AS PAINLESS AS POSSIBLE,
20 SOMETIMES MORE SUCCESSFULLY THAN OTHERS.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. I SEE THAT ANNE OLIVIA HAS A HAND.
23 LET'S GO TO ANNE OLIVIA ON ZOOM.

24



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M REALLY
2 EXCITED SEEING THE WORK AROUND ELIGIBILITY MAKING ALL THOSE
3 PROCESSES GO TOGETHER IT'S JUST CLEAR YOU HAVE BEEN LISTENING
4 TO FEEDBACK AND THAT'S BEEN GIVEN IT'S QUITE EXCITED TO SEE
5 THAT FEEDBACK INTEGRATED THAT'S THE PART I DID HEAR. THE PART
6 I DIDN'T HEAR DOESN'T MEAN IT'S NOT THERE IS REGARDING THAT
7 SAME QUALITY OF SERVICE LIKE I DIDN'T HEAR ANYTHING REFLECTED
8 AROUND, LIKE MY FRIEND I CONNECTED YOU WITH, IF SHE HAS TO GO
9 TO A DOCTOR'S APPOINTMENT SHE HAS TO BLOCK OUT HER ENTIRE DAY
10 IT'S A 30 MINUTE DRIVE IN EACH DIRECTION BUT IT TAKES HER,
11 SOMETIMES, 12 HOURS TO GO TO AND FROM THE APPOINTMENT. I'M
12 CURIOUS IN THIS QUALITY OF SERVICE THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT
13 RESPECTING FOLKS WHO USE PARATRANSIT'S TIME AS MUCH AS RESPECT
14 EVERYONE ELSE'S TIME AND LOOKING AT COMFORT ABILITY OF THOSE
15 RIDES LIKE SHE HAS TO TAKE EXTRA PAIN KILLERS ON THOSE DAYS
16 BECAUSE THE RIDES ARE SO JARRING AND THEY SHAKE SO MUCH THAT
17 IT HURTS HER BODY. SO I'M JUST WONDERING WHERE THOSE PIECES
18 ARE IN OUR QUALITY OF SERVICE METRICS.

19

20 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** YOU KNOW, AS WARREN SAID, WITH WE FIRST
21 OPENED UP, THERE IS MORE TO COME. THIS WAS REALLY FOCUSED ON
22 THE ELIGIBILITY PART OF PARATRANSIT AND IN THE COMING DISH --
23 IN THE COMING MONTHS, WE'LL BE WORKING ON PARATRANSIT REFORM
24 ANOTHER IMPORTANT ACTION IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
25 WE'RE CONSIDERING A WHOLE NUMBER OF THINGS, THE FOCUS THAT



APRIL 26, 2024

1 WILL BE ON HOW SERVICE IS DELIVERED. WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING
2 PARATRANSIT SPECIFIC METRICS IN WHICH TO MEASURE PROGRESS. SO,
3 ALL OF THAT IS TO COME.

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** DIFFERENT PIECE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SEBASTIAN?

8

9 **SEBASTIAN:** THANK YOU. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIVE PRESENTATION.
10 I'M HAPPY TO SEE ALL THE WORK YOU'RE DOING MY FATHER IS A
11 PARATRANSIT USER HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I GUESS ONE QUESTION I
12 HAD JUST AS YOU HAVE DIFFERENT ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES AND
13 DIFFERENT PLACES, DID YOU -- WERE YOU ABLE TO LOOK AT ANY,
14 SORT OF, CUSTOMER USER DATA THAT SUGGESTED THOSE PROCESSES
15 LEAD TO KIND OF DIFFERENT OUTCOMES IN TERMS OF HOW PEOPLE ARE
16 USING PARATRANSIT OR WHO IS USING PARATRANSIT?

17

18 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** NOT ON A WHO AND HOW THEY USE PARATRANSIT.
19 BUT CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, WE CERTAINLY WE INTEND TO LOOK AT HOW
20 ONE PROCESS MAY YIELD DIFFERENT RESULTS THAN A DIFFERENT
21 PROCESS. THAT WILL COME, I THINK, UNDER THE PREVIEW, THE
22 ACTION '24, THE PARATRANSIT REFORM. BUT WITH ELIGIBILITY, ONCE
23 YOU'RE ELIGIBLE, YOU KNOW, WE, SORT OF, STOP THERE WITH THIS
24 WORK. FOLKS ARE ABLE TO USE THE SERVICE, NOT USE THE SERVICE.
25 THEY'RE NOT TRACKED IN ANY WAY. CERTAINLY WITH THE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 RECERTIFICATION PROCESS WE JUST TALKED ABOUT, RIDERS ARE, YOU
2 KNOW, ASKED, IF YOU ARE NOT USING THE SERVICE WHY AREN'T YOU
3 USING THE SERVICE, THAT, SORT OF, THING. BUT, YEAH, CERTAINLY,
4 WE'RE NOT USING THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS TO DETERMINE HOW THE
5 SERVICE IS BEING USED.

6

7 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** FOLLOW UP. I GUESS WHAT I'M GETTING AT AND
8 THERE IS NO POINT TO THIS BUT I THINK I RECALL I HEARD YOU
9 SAYING THAT ONCE SOMEONE IS CERTIFIED WITHIN THE ONE SYSTEM IN
10 THE BAY AREA, THEY'RE ELIGIBLE ALL OVER. AS YOU PRESENT THIS
11 WORK AND THE IMPORTANCE OF PARATRANSIT WORK THAT'S STILL TO
12 COME, ONE OF THE THINGS I'M LOOKING FOR IS TRYING TO
13 UNDERSTAND IF STANDARDIZING CERTIFICATION IS AN IMPORTANT
14 FOUNDATIONAL ELEMENT TO THEN DOING FURTHER PARATRANSIT REFORM?
15 OR, YOU KNOW, I WANT TO BE CAREFUL ABOUT HOW I SAY THIS, BUT
16 IT'S KIND OF WHAT IS THE OVERARCHING GOAL THAT WE'RE TRYING TO
17 SOLVE? IS IT ENSURING THAT WE AS A REGION WANT TO JUST ENSURE
18 THAT A CIVIL RIGHT IS APPLIED IN A UNIFORM WAY ACROSS ALL NINE
19 COUNTIES. NOT SUGGESTING THERE ISN'T A GREAT REASON FOR IT.
20 BUT AS YOU COMMUNICATE THAT IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT FOR THAT TO
21 COME OUT IF WE HAVE STANDARDIZED ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES IF WE
22 WANT TO LOOK AT SUBSEQUENT WAVES OF PARATRANSIT IMPROVEMENT IN
23 REFORM. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT MAKES SENSE. BUT THAT'S ONE PART
24 I WASN'T QUITE CLEAR ON THIS.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** YES, THAT MAKES SENSE. I THINK THE PRIMARY
2 REASON WE WANT TO DO THIS WORK IS BECAUSE NEIGHBORS COULD HAVE
3 DIFFERENT PROCESS, WE WANT RIDERS TO HAVE RELATIVELY THE SAME
4 EXPERIENCE WHEN APPLYING FOR PARATRANSIT THAT'S THE PRIMARY
5 INTEREST IN THIS AND ALSO LOOK AT HOW THERE COULD BE MONEY
6 SAVING IN AN AREA AND IMPROVE ELIGIBLE IN ANOTHER AREA.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT BRINGING THAT OUT IN
9 THE THEME THAT IT'S IMPORTANT CIVIL RIGHTS BE APPLIED EQUALLY
10 ACROSS THE BAY AREA BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT STATEMENT
11 OF VALUES THAT CARRIES FORWARD THE WORK YOU'LL BE DOING IN THE
12 FUTURE.

13

14 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THANKS.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. IAN.

17

18 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THIS IS EXCITING TO SEE AND I LIKE THE APPROACH
19 AND LOOK FORWARD TO ACTION '24 AND I'M CURIOUS, AND I'LL
20 ADMIT, I HAVEN'T READ THIS ENTIRE REPORT, I LOOK FORWARD TO
21 READING IT IN GREATER DETAIL, BUT HAVING LOOKED THROUGH IT, IN
22 THE SURVEY OF DIFFERENT ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES AND DESIRE TO
23 CREATE SOME STANDARDS THAT EVERYONE, INDIVIDUALLY, HOWEVER
24 MANY, COMPARE TRANSIT ELIGIBILITY ENTITIES THAT WE HAVE RIGHT
25 NOW TO DO THINGS IN A UNIFORM WAY I'M CURIOUS IS THERE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 SOMETHING FOR SMALLER ENTITIES TO SAY WE'LL HAPPILY GIVE
2 ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION AWAY TO SOMEONE ELSE, TO ADJACENT
3 ENTITY SAYING I'LL HAPPILY HAVE THE COUNTY DO IT FOR ME. IT
4 SEEMS ESPECIALLY LOOKING AT SOME OF THESE COSTS, YOU KNOW,
5 THERE ARE ECONOMIES OF SCALE HERE AND -- OR THERE IS -- I'M
6 JUST CURIOUS WHETHER THERE HAS BEEN SOME KIND OF LEGAL -- ARE
7 THERE LEGAL BARRIERS THAT PRESENT THEM FROM ACTUALLY GIVING
8 THAT AUTHORITY AWAY TO SPECIAL-NEEDS ELSE? YOU CAN JUST SPEAK
9 TO THE BARRIERS OF ACTUALLY CENTRALIZING SOME OF THESE THINGS
10 IF ARE THERE ANY.

11

12 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THAT'S A REALLY INTERESTING QUESTION THAT
13 YOU'RE ASKING. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE PUT IN THE REPORT --
14 SO, A BEST PRACTICE WOULD TELL US, YES, WE WOULD LIKE TO --
15 YOU SHOULD CONSOLIDATE YOUR ELIGIBILITY PROCESS. YOU WOULD SAY
16 THAT AGENCIES ARE HESITANT TO DO SO BECAUSE IT IS AN IMPORTANT
17 CIVIL RIGHT AND THEY DON'T WANT TO HAVE TO DEPEND ON ANOTHER
18 ENTITY TO DETERMINE THEIR COMPLIANCE WITH PROVIDING THE CIVIL
19 RIGHTS. THAT'S IMPORTANT. THE SECOND THING IS CONSOLIDATING,
20 LIKE A REGIONAL CONSOLIDATION OF ELIGIBILITY WOULD REQUIRE
21 APPLICANTS TO TRAVEL MORE. IT WOULD REQUIRE EVERY AGENCY TO DO
22 ELIGIBILITY IN THE EXACT SAME WAY. AND THAT WOULD COST A LOT
23 OF MONEY. SO IT WOULD BE INTRODUCING NEW FRICTION, IT WOULD BE
24 INTRODUCING MORE COST. BUT AS YOU POINT OUT, THERE COULD BE
25 SOME AGENCIES THAT WOULD SAY, YOU KNOW, I'M HAPPY IF SOMEONE



APRIL 26, 2024

1 ELSE DOES IT FOR ME, WE CAN CONSOLIDATE, WE HAVE MOLDS WHERE
2 THAT HAS OCCURRED. SOLANO CAN'T HAS DONE THAT. THE AGENCIES UP
3 IN THAT COUNTY ALL HAVE ONE SYSTEM. IT'S RUN BY THE SOLANO
4 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. IT'S OAR SEEN BY THEM WITH A
5 CONTRACT. AND THEN WE HAVE ALSO SEEN ON A MORE INFORMAL BASIS,
6 A COUPLE OF AGENCIES HAD SHARED CONTRACT, SHARED A VENDOR ON
7 THE SAME CONTRACT. AND THEY'RE NOT DOING THAT CURRENTLY, BUT
8 THEY CERTAINLY HAVE DONE IT BEFORE. SO, YOU KNOW, THERE IS
9 ROOM OUT THERE STILL TO MOVE TO CONSOLIDATE SOME OF THE
10 FUNCTIONS. I THINK GIVEN OUR CURRENT STATE OF TRANSPORTATION
11 FUNDING, WE DON'T WANT TO INTRODUCE ANYTHING THAT'S GOING TO
12 COST MORE TO DO SOMETHING THAT WE'RE ALREADY DOING, AND THAT'S
13 PRETTY GREAT, ANYWAY. WE JUST WANT TO GET MORE ON THE SAME
14 PAGE.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. AND JUST A NOTE THAT WE'RE
17 GOING TO LOSE QUORUM BY FOUR. AND LIKE HAVE ANOTHER UPDATE
18 THERE MIGHT BE PUBLIC COMMENTS SO IF ANYBODY HAS OTHER
19 COMMENTS PLEASE KEEP IT SHORT SO WE CAN HEAR FROM THE PUBLIC.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON ONLINE WITH A HANDS
22 RAISED. I'M SORRY. I THOUGHT --

23

24 **GERRY GLASER:** MY ONLY COMMENT WAS I REALLY ENJOYED -- NOT
25 ENJOYED -- IT'S A HECK OF A GOOD REPORT.



APRIL 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. OKAY. REALLY QUICKLY, I
3 WANT TO ECHO THAT DYLAN HAD SAID DID THE NEEDING TO REAPPLY, I
4 CERTAINLY UNDERSTAND THE BEST PRACTICE OF DATA GATHERING IF
5 SOMEONE HAS CHANGED THEIR MOBILITY DEVICE NEEDS FOR EXAMPLE,
6 THAT'S A GOOD SURVEY, BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN SOMEBODY SHOULD
7 FALL OFF ELIGIBILITY LIKE IF SOMEONE HAS ALZHEIMER'S THEY
8 SHOULD NOT FALL OFF OF ELIGIBILITY AFTER AN X PERIOD OF TIME
9 THAT'S SOMETHING I HAVE HEARD FROM OTHER COMMUNITY MEMBERS IN
10 THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY. GLAD TO HEAR METRICS FOR PARATRANSIT
11 WILL BE CONSIDERED AS PART OF A BROADER PARATRANSIT REFORM IN
12 ACTION 24. SO, THANKS VERY MUCH, DRENNAN. THERE IS A MEMBER OF
13 THE PUBLIC WITH A HANDS RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. THERE
16 IS DEBBIE, AND WE HAVE ROLAND WONG. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES
17 EACH.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. HI THERE, THIS IS DEBBIE, AND I AM THE
24 PRESIDENT AND CEO AND PRESIDENT AT CHOICE IN AGING. AND I WANT
25 TO EXPRESS MY GRATITUDE FOR DRENNAN'S LEADERSHIP. I THINK THIS



APRIL 26, 2024

1 IS A VERY COMPREHENSIVE AND A GREAT, GREAT START. I THINK THAT
2 THE USER EXPERIENCE OF ELIGIBILITY CAN DETERMINE WHETHER OR
3 NOT SOMEBODY USES THIS SERVICE AND IT CAN MEAN IF THEY CANT
4 AND THEY DON'T, THEY HAVE TO GET ELIGIBLE IN MULTIPLE MACES
5 THEY MAY NOT CHOOSE TO GET AROUND WHICH IS HARMFUL FOR
6 INDIVIDUALS. I WANT TO LIFT IAN'S COMMENT AND ADINA COMMENT.
7 AND I DON'T KNOW, ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED. I WANT TO KNOW HER. SHE
8 SEEMS AMAZING. THING IS A LOT OF TO BE DONE. I LOOK FORWARD TO
9 THE CONTINUED REFORMS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT AND PROCESSES THAT
10 FOCUS AROUND RIDER EXPERIENCE. THERE WAS SOME OTHER COMMENTS
11 BY MEMBERS ABOUT ANYBODY WITH A DISABILITY SHOULD BE ABLE TO
12 GET AROUND AND WE SHOULD RESPECT THEIR TIME AND HONOR THEM AS
13 WELL, AND I JUST WANT TO LIFT AND ELEVATE ALL OF THOSE
14 COMMENTS. AND, AGAIN, THANK YOU, DRENNAN, FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP
15 ON THIS EFFORT. THAT'S IT.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ROLAND WONG.
18 ROLAND?

19

20 **ROLAND WONG:** THERE I GO. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M
21 ALSO A PARATRANSIT USER. AND, LET'S SEE, FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO
22 THE EAST BAY, IN PARTICULAR, AND LET'S SEE, AS FAR AS THE
23 STANDARDIZED RENEWAL PROCESS, NOW, IT'S LIKE, IT'S A PITY, IT
24 TAKES A WHILE FOR EACH BROKER OFFICE TO COME UP WITH A
25 STANDARD. I LIVE IN THE EAST BAY NOW, AND I RECENTLY LAST YEAR



APRIL 26, 2024

1 I WAS RELEASED ON DISABILITY AND I WAS ABLE TO USE THE SHORT
2 FORM, IT'S LITERALLY MAYBE LESS THAN TWO PAGES, AND, LIKE, SAN
3 FRANCISCO ALSO IMPLEMENTED A SHORT FORM, TOO, TO RENEW THE
4 ELIGIBILITY STATUS, WHICH IS KIND OF GOOD. AND, LET'S SEE, OH
5 GOSH. I'M ALREADY RUNNING OUT OF TIME? LET'S SEE. ANYWAY, SO,
6 BUT I'M GLAD TO HEAR ABOUT THE ELIGIBILITY FROM 3 TO 5-YEAR.
7 SO THAT WAY, YOU KNOW, THE CLIENTS DON'T NEED TO RENEW MORE
8 QUICKLY. SO, AND LASTLY, I JUST RECENTLY APPLIED FOR THE
9 HAYWARD HUB PROGRAM, PARATRANSIT IN THE HAYWARD AREA, BUT I
10 KNOW THAT'S A SMALLER COMPANY. OKAY.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TIME.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO THE STAFF FOR
19 PRESENTING THIS. AND LOOK FORWARD TO THE NEXT THINGS AS THERE
20 IS CONTINUED IMPROVEMENT IN THE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM AND
21 ACCESSIBLE TRANSPORTATION. AND, SO, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO
22 THE NEXT AND FINAL ITEM HERE, WHICH IS A REGIONAL NETWORK
23 MANAGEMENT PROGRAM UPDATE FROM ALLISON BEARING IN MIND THAT
24 WE'RE GOING TO LOSE A QUORUM BY FOUR.

25



APRIL 26, 2024

1 **ALLISON QUACH:** THANK YOU CHAIR LEVIN. SO, IN YOUR PACKET, WITH
2 THIS ITEM, IS OUR TWO PAYMENTS THAT WERE PRESENTED TO THE
3 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL ON THEIR WORKPLAN UPDATES.
4 THIS WAS PRESENTED TO THE RNM COUNCIL IN MARCH, AND WHAT WE
5 REALLY WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT IS THAT AT MONDAY'S REGIONAL
6 NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL MEETING STAFF PRESENTED AN UPDATE
7 ON THE BUS ACCELERATED INFRASTRUCTURE YOU DELIVERY OR BusAID
8 PROJECT. BusAID IS AN ACTION PLAN INITIATIVE TO REDUCE TRANSIT
9 TRAVEL TIMES AND IMPROVE RELIABILITY BY FUNDING NEAR TERM
10 QUICK BUILD SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS HOTSPOT LOCATIONS IDENTIFIED
11 BY TRANSIT OPERATORS. FOR EXAMPLE, PROJECTS INCLUDE TRANSIT
12 LANES, QUEUE JUMP LANES, ALLOW BUSES TO BYPASS CONGESTION,
13 TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY, BOARDING ISLANDS OR BUS BULBS, ET
14 CETERA, IN OCTOBER STAFF PRESENTED THE BusAIDS SCORING
15 CRITERIA TO THIS GROUP, AND BASED ON THAT FEEDBACK AND AFTER
16 ANALYZING 80 PROJECTS THAT WE RECOMMEND FOR FULL OR PARTIAL
17 FUNDING VIA BusAID. SOME OF THE PROJECT SPONSORS INCLUDE AC
18 TRANSIT, COUNTY CONNECTION, SAMTRANS, SFMTA, UNION CITY
19 TRANSIT, AND VTA, FUNDED PROJECT PHASES ARE ANTICIPATED TO BE
20 COMPLETED WITHIN THE NEXT 1 TO 3 YEARS. AND RELATED TO THE
21 FIRST ITEM, ALL PROJECTS WILL INCLUDE PRE AND POST
22 IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION SO WE UNDERSTAND THE BENEFITS OF
23 THOSE PROJECTS. LET'S SEE THIS ITEM WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE
24 RNM COMMITTEE NEXT MONTH FOR APPROVAL. SO, THERE IS MORE --
25 THERE WILL BE MORE INFORMATION IN THE RNM COMMITTEE PACKET ON



APRIL 26, 2024

1 THESE PROJECTS, AS WELL. THAT CONCLUDES MY UPDATE, AND HAPPY
2 TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THESE ITEMS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM
5 MEMBERS OF THE BODY, RAISE YOUR HAND. YOU HAVE -- DYLAN?

6

7 **DYLAN FABRIS:** I DON'T SEE IT IF THE PACKET BUT ARE THE ACTUAL
8 PROJECTS IDENTIFIED OR ANNOUNCED YET?

9

10 **ALLISON QUACH:** TO BE CLEAR THE PACKET INCLUDES A WORKPLAN
11 UPDATE FOR THE RNM COUNCIL. THE BusAID PROJECTS HAVE BEEN
12 IDENTIFIED. THEY WERE PRESENTED, AND THEY'RE IN THE RNM
13 COUNCIL'S PACKET FROM EARLIER THIS WEEK. POLLS FOR NOT
14 INCLUDING IT IN YOUR PACKET. WE ALSO HAVE A BLOG POST ON MTC'S
15 BLOG THAT PROVIDES A BRIEF SUMMARY OF WHAT THOSE PROJECTS ARE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GREAT THINGS.

18

19 **MELANIE CHOY:** AND WE CAN SEND THE LISTENING TO THIS GROUP AS
20 WELL.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM
23 MEMBER THIS BODY, INCLUDING THOSE ONLINE? MY ONE COMMENT HERE,
24 I THINK I MADE IT AT THE NET ON WORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL IS,
25 OVER TIME, AS THERE IS WORK ON A TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY IT



APRIL 26, 2024

1 WOULD BE GREAT TO HAVE A COMPREHENSIVE INVENTORY OF THE SMALL
2 AND LARGER TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS, SAYING THERE'S LIKE
3 BASICALLY NOBODY'S ABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS ABOUT LIKE ABOUT
4 THE ENTIRE CORRIDOR AND THE RIGHT HAND AND THE ANSWERS TO A
5 PROJECT THAT THE LEFT HAND IS DOING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO
6 DO OVER TIME. IAN?

7

8 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** ADDITIONAL COMMENT OR QUESTION ON THE WORKPLAN.
9 I GUESS I WAS UNDER THE IMPRESSION AND MAYBE IT'S AT A FUTURE
10 MEETING THAT WE WOULD BE GETTING AN UPDATE ON THE FREE AND
11 REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS SCHEDULE OF WHEN THE -- WHEN THOSE ARE
12 GOING TO BE GOING TOWARDS LOCAL AGENCY BOARDS FOR APPROVAL? I
13 KNOW THE TIMELINE FOR ROLLING OUT IS THIS FALL, BUT THEY STILL
14 NEED TO BE APPROVED BY 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO, IS THAT COMING
15 FORTH AT A FUTURE RNM COUNCIL? MAYBE I'M WRONG; IT WASN'T A
16 COMMITTEE. MAYBE NOT THIS GROUP. BUT DO YOU HAVE A SENSE OF
17 WHEN THOSE WILL BE COMING BE AVAILABLE, COMING TO OUR LOCAL
18 AGENCY MEETINGS?

19

20 **MELANIE CHOY:** I'LL HAVE TO LOOK INTO THAT AND GET BACK TO YOU.
21 I DO NOT HAVE SPECIFIC TIMELINE AND DATES OFF THE TOP.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT.
24 MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX. THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE.
25 ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO HAVE COMMENTS ON ITEMS



APRIL 26, 2024

1 THAT ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA EITHER IN WRITING, IN-PERSON, OR ON
2 ZOOM?

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED IN
5 WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED IN ZOOM. AND
6 THERE IS NO SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** FANTASTIC. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN,
9 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING WILL BE FRIDAY JUNE 28TH AT 1:00
10 P.M. AT THIS LOCATION. THANK YOU, TO ALL. HAVE A GOOD
11 AFTERNOON. [ADJOURNED]

12



Broadcasting Government