



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

**Meeting Transcript**



MARCH 25, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD**

**MONDAY, MARCH 25<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 1:30 PM**

**CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. MADAM CLERK, LET US DO A ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

**CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES, CHAIR POWERS?

**CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

**CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

**V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** PRESENT.

**CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CUMINS?

**EDDY CUMINS:** HERE.



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR MEMBER PREMIER?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RICHARDSON FOR MEMBER GONOT?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

10

11 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

14

15 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WEGENER?

18

19 **CHRISTY WEGENER:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE QUORUM.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. NEXT ITEM ON OUR

24 AGENDA IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. LET ME

25 CHECK TO SEE IF A HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND ON THE CONSENT?



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** SO MOVED.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MADAM CLERK, WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND  
7 ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. LET'S CHECK IN WITH THE PUBLIC ON  
8 WHETHER VIRTUALLY, OR IN THE ROOM?

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, NO ONE  
11 WITH A CARD AND NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. ANY COMMISSIONERS WANT TO SPEAK ON  
14 THIS ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY. ALTHOUGH THOSE IN FAVOR, PLEASE  
15 ACKNOWLEDGE BY STATING AYE. (AYES)

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OPPOSED? OFF TO A GOOD START WE HAVE A  
18 UNANIMOUS VOTE ON OUR CONSENT ITEM. THE NEXT ITEM FOR THE  
19 BOARD UP HERE AT THE DAIS IS OUR INFORMATIONAL ITEMS BEING  
20 PRESENTED THROUGH OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S TEAM UP THERE. OUR  
21 FIRST ONE IS UPDATE ON WHERE WE ARE WITH OUR NEXT GENERATION  
22 CLIPPER DEPLOYMENT AND SCHEDULE UPDATES. JASON, I'M GOING TO  
23 TURN THIS OVER TO YOU TO FRAME UP AND INTRODUCE THE SPEAKERS.

24



MARCH 25, 2024

1   **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE. AS WE OFTEN BRING TO YOU EVERY MONTH WE  
2   HAVE OUR UPDATE, AS YOU MENTIONED, CHAIR POWERS ON THE  
3   SCHEDULE IMPLEMENTATION AND DEPLOYMENT. KELLY JON FROM OUR  
4   TEAM IS GOING TO PRESENT TODAY ON WHERE WE ARE, AND WE'RE ALL  
5   AVAILABLE TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS.

6

7   **KELLEY JACKSON:** THE PROJECT TEAM IS CONTINUING TO WORK TOWARDS  
8   STARTING THE CUSTOMER TRANSITION TO THE NEXT GENERATION  
9   CLIPPER SYSTEM IN LATE SUMMER 2024. OUR INITIAL PILOT TEST ON  
10   CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE FERRY, MUNI, SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY,  
11   AND SMART IS UNDERWAY. MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF HAVE ALREADY  
12   GENERATED ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM TRANSACTIONS BY TAPPING  
13   PREAUTHORIZED CLIPPER AND OPEN PAYMENTS CARDS ON ALL FIVE  
14   SERVICES. WE HAVE MAILED TEST CARDS TO PREVIOUSLY SELECTED  
15   MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO ALSO WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY THE  
16   NEXT FEW WEEKS TO TEST THE NEW SYSTEM AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK.  
17   ALL PILOT PARTICIPANTS HAVE ACCESS TO THE C TWO CUSTOMER WEB  
18   SITE AND CAN USE THE ACCOUNT BASED INTERFACE WHEN THEY TAP THE  
19   C TWO ENABLED FARE MEDIA ON INSTALLED CLIPPER READERS. MTC  
20   CONSULTANT STAFF ALSO HAVE ACCESS TO THE TOOL GIVING US  
21   VISIBILITY INTO THE REPORTING OF FARE PAYMENT AND SALES  
22   TRANSACTIONS. THIS TESTER WILL HAVE THE ABILITY TO TEST THE  
23   NEW MOBILE APPS AND FARE INSPECTION AND MOBILE PAYMENT DEVICE  
24   IN ADDITION THE CURRENT TESTING EFFORT STAFF ARE ENGAGED IN  
25   WORKING WITH CUBIC TO TRACK DELIVERABLES REQUIRED BY OUR



MARCH 25, 2024

1 PROJECT PARTNERS COMPLETE HARDWARE INSTALLATIONS AND SOFTWARE  
2 IMPLEMENTATION AND FRONTLINE STAFFING TRAINING NEEDED TO  
3 SUPPORT THE FULL INTEGRATION WITH C TWO SYSTEM AND TRANSITION  
4 TO OPERATIONS STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO CLOSELY MONITOR AND  
5 SCHEDULE AND PROVIDE MONTHLY UPDATES TO THE BOARD. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT UPDATE, KELLY.  
8 MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, EITHER VIRTUALLY OR  
9 IN-PERSON?

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER HERE IN THE ROOM.  
12 WILL THE SPEAKER PLEASE PUT UP THE BOX? TWO MINUTES IS GOOD?  
13 CHAIR POWERS?

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YES, MA'AM. I DIDN'T KNOW YOU WERE  
16 TALKING TO ME. I WAS THINKING ABOUT SOMETHING ELSE. SORRY.  
17 (LAUGHTER)

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THAT'S OKAY.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EVERYBODY IS BEING LOOKING AT ME, I'M,  
22 SO SORRY. I WAS THINKING ABOUT WHAT KELLY SAID. YES, MADAM  
23 CLERK, TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU.



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR  
3 THE RECORD. SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. THIS IS EXCITING. I'M  
4 GOING HAVE TO LOOK AT THE MATERIALS. I HAVE ONE. I'M EXCITED  
5 ABOUT DOING THIS. AND SHARING OF MY EXPERIENCES OF PRACTICING  
6 THIS. SO, I'M GOING TO BE TAPPING TWICE. BECAUSE I HAVE THIS  
7 AND THEN I HAVE MY REGULAR RTC CARD THAT WILL LEGALLY ALLOW ME  
8 TO RIDE ON THE TRAINS AND THE BUSES, ET CETERA. SO, I WOULD  
9 LIKE TO SEE MORE SYSTEMS WITH THIS. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE IT ON  
10 BART AND AC TRANSIT. BUT, I MEAN THIS, IS WHEN WE'RE DOING  
11 RIGHT NOW. BUT, YEAH, I'LL BE USING MUNI, THAT'S FOR SURE.  
12 I'LL GIVE YOU LOTS OF REASONS TO USE MUNI AND DO THE LONG  
13 ESCALATORS. BUT THIS WILL OFFER A CHANCE FOR ENGAGEMENT. AND I  
14 LOOK FORWARD TO THE DATA AND THE ANECDOTES COMING FROM OUR  
15 BETA TESTING GROUP. THIS IS NOT MY FIRST TIME DOING TESTING.  
16 ABOUT SEVEN YEARS AGO, I DID SOME BETA TESTING WITH THE RIDE  
17 RTC APP IN LAS VEGAS, THE FIRST TRANSIT APP USED ON A BUS  
18 SYSTEM, A FULL BUS SYSTEM IN LAS VEGAS. SO, I'M LOOKING  
19 FORWARD TO PRACTICING THIS YEAR. SO, I HOPE WE CAN HAVE  
20 ENGAGEMENT FROM OUR TEST GROUP. I DON'T KNOW ANY OF THE OTHER  
21 PEOPLE. MAYBE WE SHOULD ALL GET TOGETHER AND HAVE LUNCH IN THE  
22 YERBA BUENA ROOM AND SHARE STORIES ABOUT TESTING THIS AND  
23 GETTING IT READY TO GO LIVE TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

24



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ADINA LEVIN.

2 YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. IT'S EXCITING TO SEE THIS PROJECT MOVE FORWARD

5 AND I DID HAPPEN TO SEE IN THE STAFF REPORT OF ONE OF THE

6 PARTICIPATING AGENCIES WITH A SPECIFIC DATE. I BELIEVE IT WAS

7 AUGUST 24TH AS A GO-LIVE DATE FOR CLIPPER TWO, AND I DIDN'T

8 SEE THIS STAFF REPORT BUT I DO HOPE THAT'S TRUE. IT'S A FAIRLY

9 NEAR-TERM DATE, AND EXCITING TO SEE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS

12 ONLINE AND THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. COMMITTEE

15 MEMBERS COMMENT? MIKE? YOUR LIGHT IS ON. DENIS?

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** IF THE CHAIR WILL INDULGE ME I HAVE A COUPLE

18 OF QUESTIONS.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GO AHEAD.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THIS IS REALLY EXCITING. I WANT TO THANK STAFF

23 AND THE TEAM THAT'S ASSISTING YOU. IN THE PRIOR MEETING WE

24 TALKED ABOUT OPEN PAYMENT AND I'M EXCITED ABOUT THAT OPEN

25 PAYMENT IS ONE CREDIT CARD SYSTEM. OVER THE YEARS WE HAVE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TRAINED PEOPLE TO TAKE YOUR WALL WALLET OR TAP IT ON THE  
2 READER MY QUESTION IS IF I HAVE A CLIPPER CARD OR CREDIT CARD  
3 IN MY WALLET WHICH READS FIRST? BECAUSE CLIPPER CARD IS A  
4 LOYALTY PROGRAM, WE WILL HAVE PRODUCT LAUNCH AND A  
5 ACCUMULATORS. WHEN THEY TAG WILL IT BE CLIPPER FIRST?

6

7 **KELLEY JACKSON:** THERE IS CARD CLASH WHERE THE READER SEES TWO  
8 CARDS TRYING TO COMMUNICATE SO IT DOESN'T TALK TO EITHER. SO  
9 THERE IS GOING TO BE A HUGE CUSTOMER SERVICE PUSH AROUND THAT  
10 IN TERMS OF, AND WE HAVE BEEN SAYING IT FOR YEARS TAKE OUT  
11 YOUR CLIPPER CARD TAP IT'S THE MOST RELIABLE EXPERIENCE BUT WE  
12 KNOW PEOPLE HAVE COME UP WITH CREATIVE WAYS OVER THE YEARS AND  
13 THERE WILL BE EDUCATION AROUND SETTING IT UP ON YOUR PHONE,  
14 EXPRESS TRANSIT, SO YOUR CREDIT CARD THAT YOU JUST USED TO PAY  
15 FOR COFFEE IS THE ONE PAYING FOR YOUR TRIP TOO. IT'S TYPICALLY  
16 FOR PEOPLE WHO PREPAID AND HAVE TRANSIT BENEFITS THAT DON'T  
17 WANT TO USE THEIR PERSONAL CREDIT CARD.

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** SO, IT WON'T GRAB THE CLIPPER CARD FIRST. IT  
20 JUST SAYS READ NOTHING WHEN IT READS MULTIPLE CARDS.

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** IT DOESN'T KNOW WHICH ONE TO SELECT BECAUSE  
23 IT'S LOOKING AT A BUNCH OF DIFFERENT CARDS. IT'S NO DIFFERENT  
24 THAN YOU WOULD TRY AND PRESENT -- FORGET WHETHER YOU HAVE A  
25 CLIPPER CARD OR NOT, YOU HAVE HALF A DOZEN CONTACT DEBIT OR



MARCH 25, 2024

1 CREDIT CARDS IN YOUR WALLET, IT DOESN'T KNOW WHICH ONE TO  
2 SELECT. IT MIGHT SELECT ONE, BUT -- AND IF IT DOES, THE  
3 ASSUMPTION WOULD BE IT WOULD PICK THE CLIPPER CARD FIRST, BUT  
4 THERE IS NO GUARANTEE. IF THERE IS CLASH, IT WOULDN'T KNOW  
5 WHAT TO DO.

6

7 **DENNIS MULLIGAN:** THAT'S VERY HELPFUL, AND IS A SEQUA TO MY  
8 NEXT QUESTION. THIS MORNING I SAW A COUPLE OF PEOPLE TAP THEIR  
9 PURSES AND WALLETS ON THE CLIPPER READER. MY NEXT QUESTION IF  
10 IT'S ROLLING OUT IN THE SUMMER TIME, WHEN WILL THIS COMMITTEE  
11 SEE INFORMATION THAT WE'RE GOING TO SHARE WITH CUSTOMERS TO  
12 EDUCATE THEM BEFORE CARD CLASH? IF YOU COULD, IN THE FUTURE,  
13 SHOW US SOME OF THE INFORMATION WE'LL HAVE, SO WE CAN GET A  
14 SENSE OF WHAT TO TELL FOLKS. EACH OPERATOR MAY HAVE CUSTOMERS  
15 THAT ARE DIFFERENT THAN OTHERS BUT AT BART TAP OF YOUR WALLET  
16 OR PURSE IS COMMON. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE STAFF COMMUNICATE  
17 WITH CHANNELS AND CUSTOMERS WHATEVER REGIONAL CAMPAIGN YOU MAY  
18 HAVE. THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

19

20 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ABSOLUTELY. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT STAFF ABOUT  
21 THE MARKETING PLAN, BUT CERTAINLY WE'LL HAVE SOMETHING WE CAN  
22 BRING TO THIS BOARD IF, IN FACT, YOU WANT SOMETHING BROUGHT  
23 HERE OR, WE ARE WORKING WITH YOUR TEAMS. AND I CAN UNDERSTAND  
24 THE NUANCES.

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** CARD CLASH IS A BIG THING FOR CUSTOMER GROUPS  
2 AND TO EDUCATE ON.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE'LL BRING BACK FOR DISCUSSION. GOOD  
5 COMMENT.

6

7 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ONE THING TO ADD TO THAT. THERE ARE ALL KINDS  
8 OF THINGS THAT WHEN YOU HAVE CARDS, NOT JUST PHYSICAL, BUT  
9 ONES BUT DIGITAL ONES IN YOUR WALLET SAME KIND OF THING THERE  
10 TOO.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** A YEAR AFTER TODAY, THIS WILL ALL BE OLD STUFF  
13 AND PEOPLE WILL HAVE LEARNED NEW HABITS. THE FIRST COUPLE OF  
14 WEEKS CAN BE TRYING FOR OPERATORS OR STATION AGENTS. NEXT  
15 QUESTION. WE'RE GOING TO LAUNCH CLIPPER 2.0, THEN THERE IS  
16 LAUNCH THEN FULL IMPLEMENTATION? WHAT SORT OF TIME FRAME, AND  
17 IS IT GOING TO LOOK DIFFERENT FOR THE CUSTOMER DURING  
18 TRANSITORY PERIOD. WILL THE CUSTOMERS SEE THEIR ACCOUNT ONLINE  
19 AND THERE IS REALLY NO DIFFERENCE? IT'S MORE FOR US?

20

21 **KELLEY JACKSON:** CUSTOMER TRANSITION, WE'RE FLIPPING A SWITCH  
22 AND STARTING IT. WHAT IT MEANS THOUGH IS AT THE SAME TIME,  
23 CUBIC IS MOVING DATA FROM THE CURRENT LEGACY BACK OFFICE TO  
24 THE NEXT GENERATION BACK OFFICE AND THAT HAS TO BE DONE IN  
25 BATCHES THAT'S WHERE THERE IS A TRANSITION PERIOD. 100,000



MARCH 25, 2024

1 CARDS A NIGHT OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. SO THAT'S WHAT KIND OF  
2 DRIVES THAT TRANSITION PERIOD TIMELINE. IT'S NOT REALLY, YOU  
3 KNOW, OH, NOW WE HAVE TO DO THIS, NOW WE HAVE TO DO THAT. IT'S  
4 READY TO GO. WE GO, IF YOU GET THE CARDS OVER, AND THEN WE DO  
5 SOME CLEAN UP AROUND THE CUSTOMER SERVICE TERMINAL WHICH ARE  
6 BACKWARDS COMPATIBLE. BUT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT TRANSITION, IT'S  
7 A NUMBER OF WEEKS, SO IT'S NOT, LIKE, OH, IF YOU DON'T HAVE  
8 THIS IN PLACE BY TRANSITION YOU'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE IT FOR  
9 ANOTHER YEAR, WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THINGS IN EARLY  
10 2025.

11

12 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** EXCELLENT THANK YOU. ONE FINAL QUESTION SINCE  
13 YOU MENTIONED THE TRANSIT TORE PERIOD, 100,000 CARDS, WHAT  
14 WILL THAT AFFECT DATA TRANSIT OPERATORS GET. WILL WE GET  
15 CLIPPER ONE, THEN CLIPPER TWO REPORT? A LOT OF FOLKS USE THE  
16 DATA REALTIME FOR LOTS OF PURPOSES. I WAS CURIOUS, IS THERE  
17 ANY CARD CLASH THERE? IS IT GOING TO BE SEAMLESS?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** BOTH SETS OF REPORTS OF DATA WILL HAVE TO BE USED TO  
20 RECONCILE FINANCIALLY.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** CAN WE COMBINE THOSE?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY.

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** OKAY. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ALL AWARE  
2 OF THAT BEFORE IT HAPPENS. I'M EXCITED TO SEE THIS ROLL OUT  
3 LATER THIS YEAR.

4

5 **KELLEY JACKSON:** WE HAVE A TEAM WORKING TOGETHER THAT'S GOING  
6 TO BE PROVIDING SETTLEMENT TRAINING TO GET ALL OPERATORS  
7 THROUGH THIS. IT'S VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT WE DID FOR THE PHASE  
8 THREE, PHASE TWO, PHASE ONE ROLL [INDISCERNIBLE]. YOUR TEAMS  
9 REPORTS THAT ARE AVAILABLE AND REPORTING TO SUPPORT THROUGH  
10 THIS TRANSITION PERIOD.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD QUESTIONS DENIS. ANY OTHER  
13 QUESTIONS ON MY RIGHT? ANY COMMENTS? OKAY. VICE CHAIR, WE'LL  
14 HOLD OFF HERE. EDDY, ALIX, ANYTHING ON THIS SIDE? NO. OKAY.  
15 ALIX? JESS? OKAY. MADAM -- OKAY. KELLY, MAYBE IT'S YOU OR  
16 EDWARD AND I DON'T KNOW IF IT COMES ON THIS ONE OR THE OTHER,  
17 THE FOLLOW UP ITEM, BUT WHEN I'M OUT IN THE SYSTEM TALKING TO  
18 THE RIDERS, YOU KNOW, I TRACK AND I PAY ATTENTION, THERE IS  
19 STILL SOME CHALLENGES WITH, WHEN I -- I MEAN, I HAVE A CLIPPER  
20 CARD, BUT IF I'M USING MY VIRTUAL ONE, ON THE HUNTING, YOU  
21 KNOW, WITH THE READERS, AND YOU KNOW, THE iPhone AND THE  
22 SAMSUNG, ARE THERE -- HAVE WE -- WHAT ADVICE WOULD YOU GIVE TO  
23 ME -- I WAS AT LAKE MERRITT LAST TUESDAY NIGHT AND IT'S LIKE  
24 7:00, AND 1 OF THE RIDERS IS HUNTING AROUND ON THE READER,  
25 TRYING TO GET OUT WITH THEIR CARD AND THEY'RE STRUGGLING TO



MARCH 25, 2024

1 GET IT TO READ AND THE STATION AGENT CAME OUT AND SAID IT'S  
2 NOT NECESSARY, YOU DON'T PUT IT FLAT LIKE THAT, YOU HAVE GOT  
3 TO TURN IT DOWN 30 DEGREES AND AS SOON AS THE RIDER DID THAT,  
4 BOOM, THE GATES OPENED UP AND OFF THEY WENT. SO, ONE, HAVE  
5 THERE BEEN IMPROVEMENTS TO THAT HUNTING ELEMENT? TWO, MAYBE WE  
6 COULD INCORPORATE SOME OF THAT INTO SOME OF THE MARKETING  
7 STUFF, YOU KNOW, WHAT DENIS'S COMMENT WAS, WHAT ADVICE WOULD  
8 YOU HAVE FOR ME THERE, KELLY?

9

10 **KELLEY JACKSON:** WELL, WE HAVE RELEASED A SERIES OF VIDEOS  
11 ABOUT USING THE MOBILE CARDS SO THAT'S PART OF THE EXPERIENCE.  
12 AND TO YOUR POINT, THERE ARE VARIATIONS BETWEEN BOTH. LIKE THE  
13 IPHONE VERSUS THE ANDROID PHONES, WITH WHERE THEIR ANTENNA IS  
14 AND A LOT OF IT HAS TO DO WITH EXPERIENCE MAKING OTHER  
15 PURCHASES WITH YOUR MOBILE CARDS IN TERMS KNOWING WHAT GETS  
16 YOU BEST RESULTS AT THE GROCERY STORE AS WELL. THERE IS A  
17 LEARNING CURVE, AND I'LL BE HONEST, I STARTED TAGGING MY  
18 MOBILE CARD ON AC TRANSIT BUSES COULDN'T DO IT ON BART AND  
19 JASON HAD TO TEACH ME HOW TO DO THE BART GATE IT WAS JUST THAT  
20 EXTRA PAUSE AND HOLD. I WAS ACTUALLY AT [INDISCERNIBLE]  
21 STATION BUS FRIDAY BECAUSE OF BART, AFC, FCE COMS WERE THERE  
22 INSTALLING CARD READERS AND WE'RE INSTALLING, WE'RE SEEING  
23 PEOPLE COME THROUGH. AND PEOPLE WERE GOING THROUGH USING TR3  
24 CAME BACK USING TR4. THERE IS THAT PAUSE BUT PEOPLE GOT IT AND  
25 IT KEPT THE FLOW GOING. SO THE LEARNING CURVE, FRIENDS BEING



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TOGETHER SHOWING EACH OTHER HOW TO TAG WITH THEIR PHONES.  
2 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE -- SO, WE'LL SEE THAT. WE'LL SEE THAT. BUT  
3 I THINK WE'LL BE ABLE TO SUPPORT IT WITH OUR TOOLS IN THE  
4 STATIONS. AND THE TO YOUR POINT, THE STATION AGENTS ARE  
5 INCREDIBLE ABOUT HELPING PEOPLE, AS WELL.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD. OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER  
8 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM. JASON AND KELLY, THANK YOU FOR THE  
9 UPDATE THERE ON THE 3A. 3B, JASON I'M GOING TO TURN THIS OVER  
10 TO EDWARD AND HE'S GOING TO WALK US THROUGH THE CURRENT  
11 OPERATIONS OF CLIPPER AND THE PERFORMANCE UPDATE. EDWARD, ARE  
12 YOU GOING TO NAVIGATE THIS DISCUSSION FOR US?

13

14 **EDWARD MENG:** I WILL.

15

16 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GREAT. WE'LL CUT JASON RIGHT OUT OF  
17 THIS.

18

19 **EDWARD MENG:** THANK YOU MR. POWERS I'M HAPPY TO REPORT THIS  
20 MONTH ON CLIPPER OPERATIONS PERFORMANCE WHICH IS INTENDED TO  
21 KEEP THIS BOARD UP-TO-DATE ON THE OVERALL CLIPPER SYSTEM  
22 PERFORMANCES OPERATIONAL STANDARDS REGIONALLY AS WELL AS  
23 INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES. WE HAVE BEEN MANAGING CUBIC DEVELOPMENT  
24 TESTING AND DEPLOYMENT OF C TWO SYSTEMS IN ORDER TO HELP  
25 MANAGE THE WORK EXPECT RESOURCE LEVELS CONSISTENT WE ARE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 HONORING REQUEST TO CONSIDER FARE CHANGES ON A QUARTERLY BASIS  
2 SO PLEASE CONSIDER THIS REMINDER THAT FARE CHANGES ARE PLANNED  
3 TO TAKE PLACE JULY 1ST, 2024 REQUESTED TO BE SUBMITTED BY  
4 APRIL 1ST, 2024. NEXT WEEK. LAST MONTH CLIPPER PROCESSED 12  
5 MILLION TRANSACTIONS AND SETTLED OVER \$28 MILLION IN REVENUE  
6 BOTH TRANSACTIONS AND REVENUE HAVE INCREASED 20%, 23%  
7 RESPECTIVELY YEAR OR YEAR IN COMPARISON TO FEBRUARY 2023 WE  
8 COULD GET THE SLIDES UP? YOU WILL RECALL LAST MONTH WE SHARED  
9 INSIGHTS ON AVERAGE WEEKDAY RIDERSHIP ACROSS AGENCY  
10 GEOGRAPHIES AND MODES IN THE BAY AREA AND SOME BOARD MEMBERS  
11 ASKED US TO TAKE A LOOK AT AVERAGE WEEKEND RIDERSHIP WE WANTED  
12 TO SHARE INSIGHTS THAT WE WERE ABLE TO DRAW FROM THAT DATA.  
13 NEXT SLIDE. CLIPPER AVERAGE WEEKEND RIDERSHIP DROPPED FEBRUARY  
14 2020 WHICH WAS THE LAST FULL MONTH PRIOR TO 2020 CLEARLY THEY  
15 DROPPED FROM 2020 TO 2021 BUT SINCE 2021 THE DATA SHOWS STRONG  
16 ANNUAL YEAR OVER YEAR INCREASES. CLIPPER DATA SHOWS NEARLY 2  
17 MILLION REGIONAL RIDES TAKEN ON WEEKENDS IN FEBRUARY. NEXT  
18 SLIDE. IN FACT FOR SOME AGENCIES INCLUDING CALTRAIN, GOLDEN  
19 GATE TRANSIT, AND SAMTRANS WEEKEND RIDERSHIP HAS NEARLY FULLY  
20 RECOVERED TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS AT 96%, 90%, AND 93%  
21 RESPECTIVELY WHEN LOOKING AT THE CLIPPER DATA. NEXT SLIDE  
22 PLEASE. AND, IN FACT, ONE AGENCY HAS FULLY RECOVERED AND EVEN  
23 EXCEEDED ITS FEBRUARY 2020 WEEKEND RIDERSHIP LEVELS. SAN  
24 FRANCISCO BAY FERRY, OR WETA, IS CURRENTLY CARRYING MORE  
25 PASSENGERS ON WEEKENDS THAN IN FEBRUARY 2020. THIS REINFORCES



MARCH 25, 2024

1 A LOT OF ANECDOTAL EVIDENCE THAT WE'RE HEARING THAT RIDERSHIP  
2 PATTERNS ARE SHIFTING ACROSS THE REGION. FINAL SLIDE PLEASE.  
3 THAT BRINGS US TO CLIPPER FACTS OF THE MONTH, WHILE OVERALL  
4 REGIONAL RIDERSHIP IS STILL 60% OF PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS FROM  
5 FEBRUARY 2020, WE HAVE SEEN, AS I MENTIONED, NOTABLE GROWTH,  
6 THREE FOLD COMPARED TO DATA IN FEBRUARY 2021, AND CURRENT  
7 TRENDS CONTINUE TO POINT TOWARDS WEEKEND RIDERSHIP INCREASES  
8 ACROSS THE REGION. THAT CONCLUDES MY SHORT REPORT AND I'M  
9 HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU, ED. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC  
12 COMMENT EITHER IN THE ROOM OR VIRTUAL?

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** [INDISCERNIBLE] [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR BOB POWERS. A LITE D SHE AND HER  
17 FOR THE LOWERED TEAM FOLD. GOOD REPORT. I LIKE THE WAY THIS  
18 REPORT IS LAID OUT. I GUESS I'M ONE OF THE PEOPLE WHOSE  
19 HELPING WETA GET THAT WEEKEND RIDERSHIP UP. AND, YEAH, I'M  
20 SEEING PEOPLE ON THAT FOR. SO, WE'RE GETTING THERE. CERTAINLY  
21 LIKE TO SEE A CHART AMONG ALL THE OPERATORS AND CALTRAIN, AND  
22 SAMTRANS. WE'RE SEEING IT. I GUESS THE WEEKEND, THE WEEKDAY IS  
23 VERY MUCH OUR ACHILLES HEEL HERE. AND HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE  
24 BACK OUT ON THE WEEK -- I DON'T KNOW HOW MUCH OF THIS IS DUE  
25 TO REMOTE WORK. I THINK IN NEW YORK, THEY'RE NORTH OF 75% NOW.



MARCH 25, 2024

1 NOW THINKING NEW JERSEY TRANSIT IS AROUND 85 TO 90% BACK.  
2 THAT'S A HUGE AGENCY, MUCH, MUCH BIGGER THAN WHAT WE HAVE  
3 HERE. I THINK, CERTAINLY, SOME OF THIS IS GOING TO BE ABOUT  
4 PEOPLE WHO DON'T USE CLIPPER ON OUR SYSTEMS TO START USING  
5 CLIPPER ON OUR SYSTEMS. AND AS I SAID BEFORE, PROBLEM IS NOT -  
6 - IT'S NOT A LACK OF PARKING SPACES. IT'S TOO MANY VEHICLES.  
7 AND I KNOW, I GOT MY FRIENDS OVER AT BATA, AND THE BRIDGE  
8 NEEDS THE MONEY TOO. SO, I -- HOW DID THIS ALL COMPLEMENT EACH  
9 OTHER? THIS REPORT IS SHOWING WE'RE GETTING THERE. WE USED TO  
10 HAVE A BENCHMARK OF 20 MILLION TRANSACTIONS A MONTHS. HOW DO  
11 WE GET THERE? WE'RE AMORTIZING A \$465 MILLION INVESTMENT THAT  
12 WAS PASSED IN THIS BOARDROOM IN 2018. WE HAVE MORE WORK TO DO  
13 WE HAVE GOT TO GET AN INCENTIVE FOR PEOPLE TO GET BACK ON THE  
14 SYSTEM. THANK YOU

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN YOU'RE NEXT.  
17 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WANTED TO DROP A QUICK CONNECTION BETWEEN THIS  
20 ITEM AND THE STRONG RIDERSHIP RECOVERY ON THE WEEKEND AND THE  
21 PREVIOUS ITEM ABOUT CLIPPER TWO AND THE UPCOMING FUTURE OF  
22 OPEN PAYMENT TAP CREDIT CARD TO PAY. THIS CREATES EVEN MORE  
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO DO MARKETING FOR ENTERTAINMENT AND SPECIAL  
24 EVENTS AND A POTENTIAL FOR A, JUST BRING A FRIEND ALONG  
25 PROMOTION. SO WITH SEAMLESS AND OUR PARTNERS AT SAN FRANCISCO



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TRANSIT RIDERS, WE DO -- WE HAVE BEEN COORGANIZING TRANSIT  
2 MONTH WHICH IS CELEBRATING THE USE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN  
3 THE MONTH OF SEPTEMBER AND WITH THESE TWO ITEMS, I'M THINKING  
4 ABOUT, YOU KNOW, MAYBE DOING PROMOTIONS TO BRING A FRIEND, NOW  
5 THAT THAT FRIEND DOESN'T HAVE TO FUSS WITH A TICKET MACHINE OR  
6 GET A CLIPPER CARD OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. AND I'M REALLY GLAD  
7 THAT THE PROMOTIONAL PLAN IS COMING TO YOUR BOARD, NOT ONLY  
8 FOR THE TECH SUPPORT ISSUES, BUT, ALSO, FOR THE SIGNIFICANT  
9 PROMOTIONAL OPPORTUNITIES THERE ARE TO GROW RIDERSHIP WHERE WE  
10 SEE THAT DEMAND REALLY INCREASING. THANK YOU

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO SPEAKER ONLINE  
13 AND THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. COUNCIL MEMBERS.  
16 COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTS? TO MY RIGHT NOT SEE ANYTHING. TO MY  
17 LEFT. ALIX BOCKELMAN.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU. I WAS LOOKING AT THESE NUMBERS AND  
20 THINKING ABOUT THE EARLIER MEETING TODAY THE RNM COUNCIL AND  
21 METRICS AND I THINK ONE THING THAT COULD BE INTERESTING TO ADD  
22 NEXT TIME YOU BRING THIS REPORT IS HOW THE SERVICE HOURS  
23 FREQUENCY MAY HAVE CHANGED DURING THE SAME PERIOD OF TIME  
24 BECAUSE I'M SUSPECTING WETA ADDED QUITE A BIT OF WEEKEND  
25 SERVICE OR AT LEAST HAVE ADDED SOME WEEKEND SERVICE SO IT



MARCH 25, 2024

1 MIGHT INTERNETTING TO KNOW JUST IN TERMS OF LESSONS LEARNED  
2 AND WHY THE NUMBERS MAY ELECTRIC LIKE THIS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY NOT SEEING ANY FURTHER COMMENTARY.  
5 EDWARD, THANK YOU. YOU'RE GOING TO WALK OUR BOARD MEMBERS  
6 THROUGH OUR DRAFT TWO YEAR BUDGET AND WORKPLAN AS AN  
7 INFORMATIONAL ITEM TO REVIEW, AND FOR YOU AND JASON TO PROVIDE  
8 SOME FEEDBACK. SO, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS, EDWARD.

9

10 **EDWARD MENG:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, CHAIR POWERS. AGENDA ITEM  
11 THREE. C3. THIS IS A DRAFT TWO YEAR CLIPPER BUDGET FOR YOUR  
12 REVIEW AND COMMENT. WE DID MEET WITH YOUR STAFF TWO WEEKS AGO  
13 TO GO THROUGH THIS BUDGET IN MORE DETAIL AND HAVE TAKEN THEIR  
14 COMMENTS INTO CONSIDERATION. WE PLAN TO RETURN TO THIS BOARD  
15 NEXT MONTH WITH REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF THE BIANNUAL BUDGET.  
16 FOR CLARIFICATION, FISCAL YEARS '24/'25 AND '25, '26 ARE YEARS  
17 CURRENTLY UNDER REVIEW AND WILL BE REQUESTED FOR APPROVAL IN  
18 THE ATTACHMENTS THOSE ARE TWO YEARS THAT ARE BORDERED IN RED.  
19 SO IN GENERAL PREPARING THE CLIPPER BUDGET WE TEND TO PLAN  
20 CONSERVATIVELY HISTORICALLY THE PROGRAM HAS NEEDED TO BE  
21 FLEXIBLE TO ENABLE TO RESPOND QUICKLY TO CHANGES AND REQUESTS.  
22 SO THIS REFLECTED SOME KEY ACCUMULATIONS THAT WE MADE IN THIS  
23 BUDGET BEGINNING WITH THE ATTACHMENT A TO THIS MEMO WHICH IS  
24 THE DRAFT OPERATING BUDGET CURRENTLY OUR BUDGET PLANS FOR THE  
25 START OF CUSTOMER BEGINNING JULY 1ST WITH THE FULL CUSTOMER



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TRANSITION OCCURRING IN LATE SUMMER AS WE STATED BEFORE. WE'RE  
2 ASSUMING CONSERVATIVELY C1 CONTRACT IS CORRESPONDING OPERATING  
3 COSTS WILL LIKELY BE NEEDED THE ENTIRE FISCAL YEAR CURRENTLY  
4 C1 CONTRACT EXPIRES NOVEMBER 2024 BUT OUR BUDGET ASSUMES THE  
5 SUPPORT OF ONGOING OPERATIONS OF THE SYSTEM ARE NEEDED LONGER  
6 THAN THAT AT LEAST UNTIL THE EXPECTED C TWO SYSTEM COMPLETION  
7 DATE 2025. WE ALSO APPLIED WE WERE ABLE TO SECURE 6.5 MILLION  
8 IN LC TOP FUNDING FROM THE STATE'S CAP-AND-TRADE PROGRAM ORDER  
9 TO SUPPORT THE ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM AS THE PRIMARY PLATFORM  
10 WE'RE DELIVERING CUSTOMER-FACING BENEFITS TO THE REGION  
11 INCLUDING CLIPPER START MEANS BASED PROGRAM CLIPPER ACCESS RTC  
12 REDUCED AND NO-COST REGIONAL INTEROPERATOR CAPPING AND  
13 ACCUMULATORS AND OTHER CUSTOMER-FACING AND RIDER BENEFITS WE  
14 HAVE ALSO INCLUDED 2.4 MILLION IN SENATE BILL ONE STATE TO  
15 START UP COST THAT IS LINE 24 OF THE DRAFT OPERATING BUDGET  
16 THAT WE ARE NOT ASSUMING WILL BE AVAILABLE BEYOND THE NEXT  
17 FISCAL YEAR AND IDENTIFIED THE NEED FOR 2.7 MILLION INACTIVE  
18 CARD FUNDS LINE 26 IN THE BUDGET AS UNRESTRICTED FUND SOURCE  
19 TO ENSURE THAT EXPECTING OPERATING COST CAN BE COVERED. QUICK  
20 REMINDER WE ASKED THE BOARD LAST YEAR FOR APPROVAL TO USE  
21 INACTIVE UNREGISTERED CARD FUNDS IN LAST YEAR'S BUDGET AS WELL  
22 AS LAST BUT BECAUSE OF VARIOUS CHANGES IN THE PROJECT SCOPE  
23 AND MILESTONE PAYMENTS OVER THE LAST YEAR WE ACTUALLY DIDN'T  
24 NEED TO ACCESS THOSE FUNDS THIS CURRENT FISCAL YEAR HOWEVER  
25 ALONG WITH THIS OVERALL BUDGET WE PLAN TO COME TO THE BOARD



MARCH 25, 2024

1 NEXT MONTH WITH THE REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF 2.7 MILLION  
2 INACTIVE CARD FUNDS FOR MAINTAINING SUPER OPERATION. PER PRIOR  
3 YEARS WE ARE EXPECTING AN OPERATING DEFICIT IN THE OUTER  
4 FISCAL YEARS. MTC'S OPERATING BUDGETS ARE APPROVED ANNUALLY,  
5 SO WE DO NOT WANT TO MAKE ANY ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT FUNDING BEYOND  
6 THE TWO YEARS BEING APPROVED BY THIS BOARD AND BEYOND KNOWING  
7 AND EXPECTING THIS DEFICIT WILL BE THERE IN THE FUTURE AND  
8 THAT WE WILL NEED TO IDENTIFY FUNDS IN ORDER TO AVOID THIS  
9 DEFICIT. I'M HAPPY TO PAUSE FOR QUESTIONS.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WHY DON'T WE MOVE--THEN TAKE QUESTIONS AT  
12 THE END, EDWARD, ON BOTH OPERATING AND CAPITAL.

13

14 **EDWARD MENG:** OKAY. SO, ATTACHMENT B TO THIS ITEM IS THE DRAFT  
15 CLIPPER CAPITAL BUDGET. MAIN HIGHLIGHTS TO NOTE ON THIS BUDGET  
16 IS THAT IT REMAINS STABLE AS WE HAVE IDENTIFIED FUNDING FOR  
17 THE CAPITAL WORK UP TO SYSTEM COMPLETION IN 2025 AND WE WILL  
18 CONTINUE IT KEEP THE BOARD UPDATED CAPITAL STATUS OF THE WORK  
19 THAT ALL OF OUR C TWO. CONTRACTORS ARE DELIVERING. WE HAVE  
20 ASSUMED, UNDERLINE ITEM -- LINE 11 OF THE CAPITAL BUDGET  
21 INITIALLY AROUND 3 MILLION AND UP TO POTENTIALLY 5 MILLION  
22 ANNUALLY, IN FUNDING FOR CAPITAL WORK. THIS WORK HAS YET TO BE  
23 FUNDED AS WE DON'T KNOW YET WHAT THE SCOPE OF THE WORK WILL  
24 BE. BASED ON HISTORICAL INVESTMENTS IN C1 AND C TWO CLIPPER  
25 NEEDS TO PREPARE FOR FUNDING THINGS LIKE SYSTEM MODIFICATIONS



MARCH 25, 2024

1 EQUIPMENT PROCUREMENTS AND OTHER INVESTMENTS INTO THE SYSTEM.  
2 IN THE MEDIUM TERM PROGRAM IDENTIFYING HOW TO FIND POTENTIAL  
3 FUTURE SYSTEM INVESTMENTS. LINE 19 OUT YEAR RUNNING INTO THE  
4 RED. THE CLIPPER PROGRAM IS NOT ASSUMING AVAILABILITY OF  
5 CONTINUATION OF THE SENATE BILL ONE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR  
6 CAPITAL FUNDS BEYOND FISCAL YEAR '25, '26 IN PERPETUITY  
7 CONTINUING TO WORK WITH PROGRAMS AND POLICY STAFF AT MTC TO  
8 IDENTIFY OTHER POTENTIAL ALTERNATIVE FUND SOURCES. OVERALL WE  
9 BELIEVE THE CLIPPER PROGRAM IS STABLE IN NEAR-TERM AND WITH  
10 ASSISTANCE OF MTC'S FUNDING STAFF WE FEEL CONFIDENT OPERATIONS  
11 ARE FULLY FUNDED IN THE NEXT TWO YEARS AND WE ALSO KNOW WE  
12 NEED TO FURTHER SEEK FUNDING THAT ADDITIONAL CAPITAL PROJECTS  
13 AND WORK CAN CONTINUE TO BE SUPPORTED. SO, I AM HAPPY TO TAKE  
14 YOUR COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS BEFORE WE RETURN NEXT MONTH TO  
15 THIS BOARD FOR A REQUEST FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. LET US START WITH HEARING FROM THE  
18 PUBLIC. MADAM CLERK, EITHER VIRTUALLY OR IN-PERSON?

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON ONLINE, AND WE HAVE  
21 ONE PERSON HERE IN THE ROOM. A LITE ALETA DUPREE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** ALETA DUPREE SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. BUDGET LOOKS  
24 GOOD. IT'S HARD TO PREDICT OUT. I'M THINKING WE'LL RESOLVE ANY  
25 DEFICITS AS WE GET CLOSER. WE'LL HAVE TO SEE HOW MUCH INACTIVE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 CARD FUNDS WE MIGHT HAVE TO DRAW. AGAIN, A GOOD REASON THAT  
2 EVERYBODY SHOULD REGISTER THEIR CAR. SO THAT WAY THAT MONEY IS  
3 CUSTOMER KNOW WHERE IS IT IS. I MEAN, WE KNOW WHERE IT IS. BUT  
4 IF IT'S UNREGISTERED, THEN A LOT OF CUSTOMERS COME AND USE THE  
5 SYSTEM, THEN YOU HAVE TO CLAW THAT BACK. SO FAR WE'RE DOING  
6 OKAY WITH THAT. NOT SEEING ANYTHING HERE ABOUT OUR BANKING  
7 COST. AND THAT'S A BIG CONVERSATION TO HAVE AT VERY HIGH  
8 GOVERNMENT LEVELS. BECAUSE I WANT TO SEE ELECTRONIC PAYMENT BE  
9 SUSTAINABLE GOING FORWARD. BECAUSE THAT'S HOW PEOPLE ARE  
10 PAYING FOR THINGS, AND ESPECIALLY WITH THE OPEN PAYMENTS OF  
11 C2. THERE IS GOING TO BE A CARD FEE FROM THE BANK AND THE  
12 PROCESS WITH EACH ONE OF THOSE TRANSACTIONS, AND THEY'RE MICRO  
13 TRANSACTIONS, SO THAT COULD BE A LITTLE HIGHER. SO IT'S NOT  
14 MENTIONED HERE, BUT WE CERTAINLY WANT TO BE MINDFUL OF THAT.  
15 SO, I THINK THE KEY FOR US TO BE ABLE TO MAKE BUDGET IN FUTURE  
16 YEARS IS FOR MORE PEOPLE TO GET ON TO THE SYSTEM SO WE CAN  
17 AMORTIZE THESE COSTS OVER MORE USERS. I BELIEVE THAT THE  
18 FUTURE IS GOOD. AND I TRY NOT TO GET SCARED BY THE RED  
19 NUMBERS. BUT IT IS AN ADMONISHMENT THAT WE HAVE TO KEEP  
20 THINKING FORWARD AND HAVE MONEY AT THE READY IN THE CASE  
21 THINGS TURN SOUTH. THANK YOU

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN, YOU MAY UNMUTE  
24 YOURSELF.

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. ADINA LEVIN, AND REPORTING FROM THE CUSTOMER  
2 ADVISORY GROUP FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT. GLAD TO SEE THAT THERE  
3 IS A POT OF FUNDING FOR POTENTIAL ENHANCEMENTS TO THE CLIPPER  
4 TWO SYSTEM AND REFRAINING FROM SUGGESTING ADDITIONAL FEATURES  
5 UNTIL THE DATE FOR C2 RELEASE NOW THERE SEEMS TO BE A DATE.  
6 AND WHEN C2 WAS PRESENTED TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THERE WAS IS  
7 I SENIOR SOMEONE WITH DISABILITIES SAYING WITH THE OPEN  
8 PARTICIPATE FEATURE WILL I BE GETTING ACCESS TO MY DISCOUNT AS  
9 A SENIOR OR AS A PERSON WITH DISABILITIES THIS WAS A QUESTION  
10 THAT WILL ARISE AS A CUSTOMER SERVICES ISSUE AS SOON AS THAT  
11 FEATURE ROLLS OUT. SO THE POTENTIAL AT THE STATE LEVEL CAL ITP  
12 PROJECT IS WORKING ON TECHNOLOGY THAT CAN SUPPORT. THEY HAVE A  
13 SENIOR ACCESS WORKING SINCE '22 THEY'RE EXPECTING A MEDICARE  
14 THIS FALL AND OTHER DISABILITY BY THE END OF THE YEAR. IT  
15 WOULD SURELY BE A TECHNOLOGY PROJECT TO SEE IF IT WOULD BE  
16 FEASIBLE TO USE THEIR SYSTEM, BOTH FOR STREAMLINING,  
17 ELIGIBILITY, AND TO ENABLE PEOPLE TO GET ACCESS TO THEIR  
18 DISCOUNTS IF THEY'RE PAYING WITH A CREDIT OR DEBIT CARD AND  
19 THAT'S SOMETHING THEY MAKES SENSE TO LOOK INTO AND CERTAINLY  
20 SENIOR POPULATION WOULD BENEFIT FROM USING TRANSIT IT'S A  
21 LARGE AND GROWING RAPIDLY OPPORTUNITY INCREASING RIDERSHIP  
22 EVEN AT A LOWER DISCOUNT FEE. THANK YOU  
23  
24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NO SPEAKERS ONLINE AND  
25 NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM.



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.  
3 COMMENTS, ADVICE FROM THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS IN I MAY HAVE ONE  
4 ITEM. ANYBODY? YEAH. WHY DON'T WE GO TO GREG, VTA.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** QUICK CLARIFICATION AND PROBABLY GOOD NEWS IF I'M  
7 UNDERSTANDING IT CORRECTLY. FROM OPERATING COST PERSPECTIVE,  
8 IF I LOOK AT THIS RIGHT, IN '23, '24 LOOKING AT CURRENT  
9 CLIPPER OPERATING COST, 14.7 NOT WORRYING ABOUT ADDITIONAL  
10 COST FOR NEW, THEN '25, '26 FOR THE NEW ACTUALLY 13.18 WE'RE  
11 GOING TO SEE REDUCTION IN COSTS BETWEEN WHAT WE CURRENTLY DO  
12 VERSUS NEW. AND THAT'S HAPPENING FOR BOTH. THAT'S GOOD. I JUST  
13 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WAS THE EXPECTATION?

14

15 **EDWARD MENG:** YEAH. WE HAVE DONE SEVERAL ESTIMATES INTO FUTURE  
16 ON COST OF C1 AND C2 AND THEY'RE EQUIVALENT NOT A HUGE  
17 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN WITH WE'RE SEEING BETWEEN OPERATING COST.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I'LL TAKE THAT FOR NOW. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. OVER HERE, ANYTHING? VICE CHAIR?  
22 OH, EDDY, I'M SO SORRY. THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS, SIR.

23

24 **EDDY CUMINS:** THANK YOU. I MENTIONED ON THE CAPITAL BUDGET BUT  
25 WHEN I LOOK AT THE OPERATING BUDGET, I SEE WE GO RED STARTING



MARCH 25, 2024

1 IN '26, '27. WHAT WOULD BE THE PLAN TO FILL THAT GAP IN THE  
2 FUTURE?

3

4 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** AS ED MENTIONED IN HIS PRESENTATION, WE'LL BE  
5 LOOKING FOR REVENUE TO FILL THAT VOID IT'S NOT SIGNIFICANT AT  
6 LEAST NOT IN THE EARLY YEARS BUT IT IS THERE SO WE'LL HAVE TO  
7 THINK OF WAYS TO BRIDGE THIS GAP SO WE CAN PROVIDE FUNDING  
8 THAT WE NEED TO MANAGE THIS ENTIRE PROGRAMMING. WE'LL BE  
9 WORKING WITH THE FUNDING, THE FPP, FUNDING PROGRAMS, AND GROUP  
10 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN DO THAT

11

12 **EDWARD MENG:** WE DIDN'T WANT TO COMMIT TO A SPECIFIC FUNDING  
13 SOURCE BECAUSE WE KNOW A LOT CAN CHANGE OVER THE NEXT TWO  
14 YEARS. BUT WE ARE IN CONSTANT REGULAR DIALOGUE WITH OUR  
15 FUNDING PROGRAM.

16

17 **EDDY CUMINS:** GREAT. THANKS.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. OTHER COMMENTS? NOT SEEING ANY. I  
20 JUST WANTED TO MAKE A NOTE, EDWARD, WHEN YOU BRING THIS BACK  
21 FOR AN ACTION ITEM, ARE YOU COMING BACK -- ARE WE ACKNOWLEDGE  
22 BACK AS AN ACTION ITEM ON 22 APRIL FOR THIS ITEM?

23

24 **EDWARD MENG:** YES.

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** IT WOULD BE GOOD, IF I DO THE BART BOARD  
2 WHICH I'M IN THE MIDDLE OF DOING NOW FOR THE BART BUDGET FIRST  
3 THING DO I IS FOR '23, AND '24, I WALK THIS BOARD THROUGH  
4 WHERE WE ARE WHERE WE ENDED WITH '23 AND '24 AND THE OPERATING  
5 BUDGET AND CAPITAL BUDGET WHERE WE ARE, HOW DID WE PERFORM AND  
6 THOSE FUNDS ARE THEY ROLLING IN SO THAT FRONT END IS MISSING  
7 HERE. I GET WHERE YOU'RE TRYING TOO LEAD US ON '24, '25, AND  
8 '26, BUT HARD FOR ME TO GET POINTED IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION  
9 WHEN I DON'T KNOW HOW WE ARE HOW WE HAVE DONE IN '23 AND '24.  
10 SO NAVIGATE THAT AND BRING IT BACK IN APRIL.

11

12 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE. WE CAN DO THAT OF COURSE.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YOU HAVE 22 MONTHS OUT OF 24 MONTHS AND  
15 WHAT YOU WOULD DO IS PROJECT THOSE FINAL TWO MONTHS. RIGHT? SO  
16 YOU WILL HAVE THAT.

17

18 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. SO, WITH THAT, EDWARD, I THINK  
25 THAT WRAPS UP THIS ITEM HERE. THEN IT CROSS WALKS INTO OUR



MARCH 25, 2024

1 ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. SO, JASON, THE FLOOR IS  
2 ALL YOURS ON AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR.

3

4 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANKS CHAIR POWERS. -IT'S BEEN A LONG  
5 AFTERNOON. I'LL BE BRIEF. AS KELLY NOTED IN 3A, WE'RE  
6 CONTINUING TO MAKE PROGRESS WITH OUR PILOT AND ALETA STOLE  
7 SOME OF MY THUNDER HERE, BUT AS OF FRIDAY THE PUBLIC AND  
8 OPERATOR STAFF ARE NOW ABLE TO TEST THE NEXT GENERATION IN THE  
9 LIMITED PILOT SO WE'RE ALL EXCITED ABOUT THAT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MADAM CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR ACTING  
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED  
15 IN WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO ONE  
16 IN THE ROOM.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. A QUICK SCAN HERE. I'M NOT -- OH.

19

20 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I JUST WANT TO POINT OUT, JASON, THAT'S A HUGE  
21 MILESTONE, A REALLY, REALLY BIG DEAL. CONGRATULATIONS.

22

23 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I APPRECIATE THAT.

24

25 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD CALL, JEFF.



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I DON'T WANT TO BURY THE LEAD BUT WE HAVE A  
3 LOT TO WORK TO DO AND I'M VERY COGNIZANT OF THAT TOO.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU JASON. THAT CONCLUDES ITEM  
6 FOUR. WE'LL GO TO ITEM NUMBER FIVE WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT AND  
7 ANY OTHER BUSINESS? MADAM CLERK?

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA  
10 ADMIT FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. GOOD MEETING  
11 TODAY. YOU KNOW, I LOVE A GOOD PUBLIC MEETING. ESPECIALLY IN  
12 HERE. I REALLY ENJOY BEING HERE. IT'S A VERY WELCOMING SPACE.  
13 AND I THINK IT'S BEEN ABOUT SEVEN YEARS THAT I HAVE BEEN  
14 SPEAKING ABOUT CLIPPER, PROBABLY MORE THAN JUST ABOUT ANYONE.  
15 AND CLIPPER REALLY WORKS. EVERY DAY I'M OUT IN SYSTEM, AND  
16 JASON AND THE TEAM ARE REALLY KEEPING UP WITH THINGS AND  
17 MAKING THIS PROGRAM WORK. AND SETTING AN EXAMPLE THAT WE CAN  
18 SHOW TO OTHER AGENCIES. I THINK THE BIGGEST CHALLENGE, RIGHT  
19 NOW, ESPECIALLY AS I SEE WITH OPEN PAYMENT, BUT REALLY WITH  
20 ANY FORM OF ELECTRONIC PAYMENT, IS GROUPS. I DON'T REALLY HAVE  
21 ANY EXPERIENCE WITH GROUPS, BECAUSE, I, BASICALLY, GO PLACES  
22 BY MYSELF. I HAVE A CARD. MY ROOM MEAT HAS A CARD. MY MOTHER  
23 HAS A CARD. MY SISTER AND ALL HER FAMILY, THEY ALL HAVE CARDS.  
24 AND, SO, WHEN I'M IN NEW YORK, AND I PAY FOR TRANSIT ON THE  
25 BUSES, AND THAT LEGENDARY AND HISTORIC SUBWAY, I HAVE A CARD.



MARCH 25, 2024

1 AND I HAVE REDUCED FARE FOR OMNI IN NEW YORK CITY. SO, YOU  
2 TAKE OUT A DOLLAR 45 FOR EACH ONE OF THOSE USES UNTIL I HIT 12  
3 IN A SEVEN-DAY PERIOD. SO, WE CAN DO THAT HERE. BUT GROUPS IS  
4 A BIG CHALLENGE, ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU HAVE A LIMITED NUMBER OF  
5 TAPS BECAUSE YOU DON'T WANT TO TAP A RUN A CARD LIMIT OUT.  
6 ESPECIALLY MORE SO WITH SYSTEMS WHERE YOU HAVE TO TAP OUT SUCH  
7 AS BART AND CALTRAIN. I THINK OUR FOCUS SHOULD BE ON HOW TO BE  
8 MORE USER FRIENDLY FOR GROUPS SO THEY CAN PARTICIPATE FULLY IN  
9 THIS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** YOU MAY NOT HAVE BEEN ONLINE WHEN YOU DID THAT?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER FITZGERALD, ARE YOU READY TO  
16 SPEAK? YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. SORRY ABOUT THAT.

17

18 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** NO WORRIES. THANK YOU, WALLY. CHRISTINE  
19 FITZGERALD, COMMUNITY ADVOCATES, SILICON VALLEY INDEPENDENT  
20 LIVING CENTER, ALSO SERVING ON SEVERAL MTC COMMITTEES. I HAVE  
21 A QUICK QUESTION FOR FOLKS. WONDERING IF WE HAVE -- WHICH I  
22 DON'T RECALL IF WE DO OR NOT -- IF WE'RE TRACKING THE  
23 RETURNING TO WORK IN-PERSON, VERSUS NOT? I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN  
24 A LOT OF DISCUSSION IN INCREASE IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP ON THE  
25 WEEKENDS, NOT SO MUCH WEEKDAYS. I'M JUST WONDERING IF WE'RE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TRACKING THAT TREND TO SEE WHETHER OR NOT THE ANSWER REALLY IS  
2 A CASE OF SOMEBODY NOT CHOOSING TO GO INTO WORK ON A  
3 PARTICULAR DAY, OR WHETHER THERE IS ANOTHER CONCERN OR AVENUE  
4 THAT WE'RE MISSING, ANOTHER ITEM THAT WE SHOULD BE PAYING  
5 ATTENTION TO. THE OTHER THING WOULD LIKE TO ADD IS, I LOOK  
6 FORWARD TO A TIME WHERE WE WILL BE ABLE TO USE THE CLIPPER  
7 CARD FOR NOT ONLY TRANSIT ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, BUT ALSO WITH THE  
8 POSSIBILITY OF ADDING THE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM INTO THIS.  
9 BECAUSE THAT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED A DEDICATED SYSTEM UNTO  
10 ITSELF. THAT'S ONE OF THE BEST WAYS TO RECOGNIZE THAT IT IS A  
11 LEGITIMATE SYSTEM AND NOT A STEPDAUGHTER AT THE HEART. THANK  
12 YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
15 ONLINE AND NOBODY IN THE ROOM, AND WE HAVE NOT RECEIVED  
16 ANYTHING IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. WE WILL CLOSE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER  
19 FIVE. AGENDA ITEM SIX IS ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING. SO  
20 WE'RE ALL SET ON OUR NEXT MEETING OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE  
21 BOARD, 22 APRIL. IT WILL BE AT BART HEADQUARTERS ON THE FIRST  
22 FLOOR. IT WILL BE AT 1:30. WE'LL SEE YOU ALL THEN. WITH THAT,  
23 WE ARE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

24



*Broadcasting Government*