



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



MARCH 22, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
FRIDAY, MARCH 22ND, 2024, 10:00 AM

CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM PUNISHING TO SHEIK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. DUE TO REMOTE LOCATIONS ROLL CALL WILL BE TAKEN ON EACH ACTION ITEM. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CONFIRM QUORUM.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CAMPOS?

V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: PRESENT.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR BALDINI? AU?

CARLINE AU: PRESENT.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ELDRED? ESUF? IS EXCUSED. FITZGERALD? GLASER?

GERRY GLASER: HERE.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON IS EXCUSED. KALLINS?

3

4 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY?

11

12 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU? WE'LL LOOK BACK. PARKER?

19

20 **JOHNNY PARKER:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE IS EXCUSED. PIMPLE IS EXCUSED

23 UNTIL ARRIVAL. RHOADS? WE'LL LOOK BACK. MEMBER SCOTT?

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG?

3

4 **HOWARD WONG:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND WONG?

7

8 **RONALD WONG:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GIVE ME ONE SECOND. MEMBER BALDINI? ARE
11 YOU THERE? MEMBER BALDINI, WE CAN'T KEEP GOING UNLESS YOU
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SAYS WE CAN.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** WE HAVE REQUESTS FOR REMOTE
17 PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B. 2449 FOR CHRISTINE FITZGERALD,
18 JEFFREY RHODES, AND CARINA LIEU. FITZGERALD?

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** REQUESTING REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER
21 A.B. 2449 AS RELATED TO SECTION -- BECAUSE OF A PHYSICAL
22 DISABILITY UNDER 2926 AND 12 -- NINE 26 OF THE CODE, NO ONE
23 ELSE IS HERE AT MY HOME, JUST ME AND ME ALONE.

24

25 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND MEMBER LIEU?



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **CARINA LIEU:** GOOD MORNING. I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE
3 REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449 BECAUSE OF A NEED RELATED TO CHILD
4 CARE THAT REQUIRES ME TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY. THE CHILD IS MY
5 CHILD, AND SHE IS SIX WEEKS OLD. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AND MEMBER ROADS?

8

9 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** GOOD MORNING, MADAM CHAIR. I'M REQUESTING TO
10 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449, BECAUSE I AM SICK. LET'S
11 SEE. THERE ARE NO OTHER INDIVIDUALS IN THIS ROOM UNDER 18
12 YEARS OF AGE OR OLDER. AND, SO, I GUESS THAT'S ALL.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. YOUR REQUESTS ARE NOTED.
15 WE'RE ADDING MTC COUNCIL MEMBERS CHRISTINE FITZGERALD, JEFFREY
16 RHOADS, AND CARINA LIEU AS PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND MEMBER BALDINI IS BACK ON.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** GREAT. THANK YOU. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM
21 TWO, WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
24 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100



MARCH 22, 2024

1 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER
2 MEETING ELIGIBLE FOR REIMBURSEMENT, THIS AMOUNT
3 [INDISCERNIBLE] ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM THREE IS OUR
6 WELCOME AND CHAIR'S REPORT. I WANT TO SHARE WITH YOU ALL THAT
7 LAST MONTH IN FEBRUARY I ATTENDED AN AARP SAFE GROWTH
8 PRESENTATION ON A STUDY THAT WAS BEING CONDUCTED IN SAN JOSE
9 FOR THE MONTEREY HIGHWAY FOCUSING ON TWO INTERSECTIONS THAT
10 HAVE SEEN A LOT OF PEDESTRIAN FATALITIES OVER THE YEARS, AND
11 FOR FOLKS WHO MAY NOT KNOW, SAN JOSE'S HISTORY, BUT MONTEREY
12 HIGHWAY USED TO BE CALLED BLOODY ALLEY, BECAUSE IT HAS VERY
13 HIGH INSTANCES OF PEDESTRIAN FATALITIES IN ITS HISTORY AND
14 EVEN TO PRESENT DAY. SO IT WAS A REALLY INTERESTING SPACE
15 WHERE NEIGHBORS GOT TOGETHER AND PUT TOGETHER THEIR VISION FOR
16 HOW TO IMPROVE THOSE CORRIDORS, MAKE THEM SAFER, AND I THINK
17 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE CONTINUE TO INVEST IN COMMUNITY-
18 LED PROJECTS LIKE THESE, ESPECIALLY WHEN THEY ARE FOCUSING ON
19 SUCH DANGEROUS TRANSPORTATION CORRIDORS. I ALSO WANTED TO
20 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT MARCH 18th WAS TRANSIT DRIVER APPRECIATION
21 DAY. SO I HOPE THAT FOLKS HAD A CHANCE TO SHARE THEIR
22 APPRECIATION FOR OUR TRANSIT WORKERS. AND IT SHOULDN'T JUST BE
23 ON MARCH 18th. EVERY DAY THAT YOU CAN THANK OUR TRANSIT
24 SERVICE EMPLOYEES AND STAFF, PLEASE, YOU KNOW, EXPRESS THAT
25 GRATITUDE. AND I DEFINITELY WANT TO SHARE MY GRATITUDE FOR THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 VTA SERVICE PROVIDERS THAT HELP ME GET TO THIS LOCATION TODAY.
2 WITH THAT, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE ARE TWO ITEMS ON
3 OUR AGENDA, AND I'M HOPEFUL THAT WE'LL HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO
4 HEAR FROM STAFF, HEAR FROM OUR COUNCIL COLLEAGUES. BECAUSE
5 HAVING OPPORTUNITIES FOR EVERYONE TO SPEAK, TO ASK QUESTIONS
6 AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK IS WHY WE'RE HERE. SO IT'S IMPORTANT THAT
7 WE KEEP OUR COMMENTS RELATIVE TO THE TOPIC AND AS SUCCINCT AS
8 POSSIBLE. THAT IS MY CHAIR'S REPORT. CLERK, WERE THERE ANY
9 ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM
10 AND IF ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS
11 ITEM USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON
12 MEMBERS SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL
13 CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO
17 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE
20 NEXT ITEM. AGENDA ITEM 4A IS APPROVAL OF THE FEBRUARY 23, 2024
21 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE
22 THE FEBRUARY 23, 2024 MEETING MINUTES? THANK YOU. AND A
23 SECOND? OKAY. I HEARD A MOTION BY SCOTT AND A SECOND BY
24 GLASER. ARE THERE ANY MTC COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO
25 HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? YES, MEMBER WONG?



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **HOWARD WONG:** JUST A COMMENT SINCE THERE ARE TWO COUNCILMAN
3 WONGS ON THE COUNCIL IT SHOULD BE CLARIFIED WHEN IT'S AN H
4 WONG AND R WONG. IN THAT LAST MEETING I WAS ABSENT THERE
5 SHOULD BE AN H WONG THAT WAS EXCUSED AND R WONG THAT MADE A
6 MOTION TO ACCEPT THE MINUTES. AND THAT APPLIES THROUGHOUT THE
7 MINUTES. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. CLERK, WERE ANY ITEMS
10 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATE WITH THIS ITEM AND IF
11 ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM USE
12 THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS
13 OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK
14 WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
17 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO
18 SPEAK AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS
19 ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WILL YOU PLEASE NOW YOU
22 CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR CAMPOS?

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: YES.

2

3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR BALDINI?

4

5 V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI: YES.

6

7 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: OKAY. MEMBER AU?

8

9 CARLINE AU: YES.

10

11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BENITEZ?

12

13 DIANA BENITEZ: YES.

14

15 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DEUTSCH-GROSS?

16

17 ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS: YES.

18

19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ELDRED IS EXCUSED. ESUF IS EXCUSED.

20 MEMBER FITZGERALD?

21

22 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: YES.

23

24 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. MEMBER GLASER?

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

4

5 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** I MUST ABSTAIN.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN. ONE. MEMBER HANKERSON? IS

8 EXCUSED. MEMBER KALLINS?

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** APPROVED.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER KINMAN?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LAVERY? ABSENT. MEMBER

17 LEVIN?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER LIEU?

22

23 **CARINA LIEU:** YES.

24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER ORANTES? IS ABSENT.

2 MEMBER PARKER?

3

4 **JOHNNY PARKER:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER PIERCE IS EXCUSED. MEMBER PIMPLE?

7

8 **VINAY PIMPLE:** ABSTAIN.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN. MEMBER ROADS?

11

12 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER SCOTT?

15

16 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HOWARD WONG? MEMBER ROLAND WONG?

19

20 **RONALD WONG:** APPROVED.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. IT PASSES WITH 15 AYES AND

23 FOUR ABSTENTIONS.

24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO
2 LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS
3 ITEM AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE
4 RECORD. I'LL ALSO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
5 PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT
6 RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND
7 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
8 SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO
9 SPEAK. THIS IS AGENDA ITEM FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENTS AND OTHER
10 BUSINESS.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALETA DUPREE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR CAMPOS AND MEMBERS.
15 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. GOOD
16 TO SEE YOU. I LOVE A GOOD PUBLIC MEETING. I'M A BIG FAN OF
17 MTC. YOU SHOULD KNOW THAT. IT'S GOOD TO HAVE OUR EXECUTIVE
18 DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER HERE. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. BECAUSE I
19 REALLY ENJOY BEING HERE. IT'S A GOOD WAY TO START MY DAY. WHAT
20 DO I SEE IN YOU? I LIKE TO THINK OF YOU AS MY PEER GROUP
21 BRIDGE TO ELECTED OFFICIALS. THAT IT IS YOUR ENGAGEMENT THAT
22 HELPS TO TRANSLATE THE THINGS THAT I SAY AND OTHERS SAY. TO
23 THOSE WHO MAKE VERY BIG AND WEIGHTY DECISIONS THAT OFTEN
24 INVOLVE SPENDING LOTS OF MONEY, LIKE DOING BRIDGE WORK AND
25 FUNDING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND I SPEAK FROM THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 PERSPECTIVE OF BEING AN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY MEMBER,
2 BEING A SERVICE DISABLED VETERAN AND USING TRANSIT AND HAVING
3 REDUCED FARE CLIPPER AND RIDING THE BUS OVER THE BRIDGE. THESE
4 ARE ALL VERY IMPORTANT TO ME. AND IT'S NOT JUST HERE, BUT IT'S
5 AROUND THE COUNTRY. DO I THIS WHEN I'M IN NEW YORK AND USING
6 THEIR FAMOUS TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM CALLED THE SUBWAY, WHICH
7 I'M SURE MANY HAVE GOTTEN TO SEE. SO, HOW DO WE TAKE THIS
8 FORWARD? I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING WHAT YOU HAVE TO SAY. I'M
9 SURE I WILL BE SAYING MORE THINGS. BUT, REALLY, IN MY SEVEN
10 YEARS OR SO, I THINK I HAVE COME TO SPEAK. THIS IS REALITY
11 HERE IN THIS ROOM. MTC DOES REAL THINGS. THEY TRANSLATE INTO
12 THE THINGS THAT I DO ON A DAILY BASIS. SO, I ASK OF YOU,
13 TODAY, AS YOU DELIBERATE TO ALWAYS KEEP IN MIND THE BRIDGE
14 THAT YOU FORM. IN REACHING OUT TO THOSE THAT MAKE DECISIONS.
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I -- SORRY. I'M NOT SEEING
18 AGENDA ITEM SIX. OH HERE IT IS SORRY. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE
19 THE PUBLIC COMMENT. ALWAYS SO GREAT TO HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF
20 THE PUBLIC AT THESE MEETINGS. SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH. THE NEXT
21 AGENDA ITEM, 6A, IS OUR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE
22 UPDATE. REBECCA LONG AND GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN WILL PRESENT
23 THIS ITEM FOR INFORMATION. FOLLOWING THE PRESENTATION -- OH
24 I'M SORRY. THANK YOU.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **REBECCA LONG:** OKAY. THANK YOU CHAIR CAMPOS. GOOD MORNING
2 REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. JUST
3 ME TODAY. AS YOU KNOW GEORGIA AND I DO TAG TEAM ON THIS. SHE'S
4 REALLY WORKING ON A LOT OF THE SACRAMENTO FACING WORK, AND I
5 AM NAVIGATING ALL OF THE REGIONAL WORK, AS WELL AS WORKING ON
6 THE BILL, TOO. SO. APOLOGIES FOR THE VERBAL UPDATE RATHER THAN
7 SOMETHING IN WRITING BUT IT'S A VERY FLUID PROCESS HERE SO
8 THIS WAY YOU GET THE MOST CURRENT INFORMATION. SO, JUST KIND
9 OF STARTING WITH THE MOST RECENT DEVELOPMENT, THIS BILL WAS SB
10 925, AUTHORED BY SENATOR WE KNOWER AND THERE WAS A PLACE
11 HOLDER BILL THAT WAS INTRODUCED, KIND OF IN JANUARY. THE BILL,
12 IT'S NOW THIS TOPIC OF A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE IS
13 NOW BEING FOLDED INTO SB1031, WHICH WAS ANOTHER WIENER BILL.
14 OBVIOUSLY BILLS CAN BE AMENDED AND THE TOPICS CHANGE. AND NOW
15 THERE IS A JOINT AUTHORSHIP WITH SENATOR WAHAB, IT WAS AN
16 INTRODUCTION OF A BILL THAT WAS ALSO A PLACE HOLDER RELATED TO
17 TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION AND THAT TOPIC HAS NOW BEEN BROUGHT INTO
18 SB1031 WHAT'S INCLUDED IS A STUDY RELATED TO THE TRANSIT
19 CONSOLIDATION FOLLOWED BY A PLAN AND THE CALIFORNIA STATE
20 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY IS THE ENTITY CHARGED WITH CONDUCTING
21 THE STUDY AND THE PLAN AND THE LANGUAGE IN THE BILL IS
22 DETAILED ON THIS TOPIC AND MTC STAFF ALONG WITH TRANSIT
23 OPERATORS ARE REVIEWING IT AND IT WILL LIKELY HAVE SOME
24 RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO THE LANGUAGE. IT'S VERY PRESCRIPTIVE
25 RIGHT NOW AND FROM MY PERSPECTIVE NONE OF THIS HAS GONE TO THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 COMMISSION FOR FINAL CONSIDERATION YET. IT DOES FEEL LIKE
2 MAYBE IT'S A BIT OF OVERKILL IN TERMS OF THE LEVEL OF DETAIL,
3 AND TO SOME EXTENT, PUTTING THE CART BEFORE THE HORSE IN TERMS
4 OF THE PLAN, RIGHT? THERE IS AN ASSESSMENT FOLLOWED BY A PLAN,
5 BUT THE LANGUAGE, RIGHT NOW, ESSENTIALLY IS SAYING, PREJUDGING
6 WHAT IS IN THE ASSESSMENT. SO, WORK TO BE DONE THERE. AND
7 LET'S SEE. OTHER KEY PROVISIONS THAT ARE NOW IN THE BILL. THIS
8 BILL IS PUBLIC. YOU KNOW, YOU CAN FIND IT ON LEGINFO.CA.GOV IS
9 REALLY THE FRAMEWORK THAT THE COMMISSION ADOPTED THAT YOU ALL
10 REALLY HELPED CREATE THROUGH THE FALL. AS YOU WILL RECALL WE
11 BROUGHT LOTS OF DIFFERENT ITERATIONS, THE PRESENTATION HERE IT
12 INCLUDES THE DIFFERENT FUNDING CATEGORIES OF TRANSIT
13 TRANSFORMATION, SAFE STREETS, CONNECTIVITY, AND THE MENU OF
14 DIFFERENT REVENUE OPTIONS. ONE THING I'LL HIGHLIGHT IS THE
15 REVENUE OPTIONS THAT ARE IN THE BILL, PRINT ARE NOT THE SAME
16 AS WHAT THE COMMISSION RECOMMENDED. SO, ONE IMPORTANT OPTION
17 HAS NOT BEEN MOVED FORWARD AND THAT IS AN INCOME TAX, A
18 REGIONAL INCOME TAX. SO, YOU KNOW, THIS IS STILL A WORK IN
19 PROGRESS. IT'S NOT TO SAY THAT ISN'T NECESSARILY NOT GOING TO
20 MAKE IT INTO THE FINAL BILL, BUT IT WAS NOT INCLUDED IN THIS
21 DRAFT. WHAT ARE OTHER SIGNIFICANT DEVELOPMENTS? ANOTHER
22 IMPORTANT PROVISION THAT IS IN THERE IS A MINIMUM AMOUNT FOR
23 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, SPECIFICALLY TRANSIT OPERATIONS
24 FUNDING RELATED TO TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND THAT IS A \$750
25 MILLION FLOOR. AND, SO, THAT DOES, YOU KNOW, CREATE A



MARCH 22, 2024

1 FOUNDATION ON WHICH TO BUILD THE REST OF THE MEASURE, AND IT
2 DOES CREATE A LOT OF UPPER PRESSURE ON THE TOTAL SIZE OF THE
3 MEASURE. WE, IN THE COMMISSION'S ACTION, TAKEN IN JANUARY, DID
4 NOT HAVE, YOU KNOW, SPECIFIC PERCENTAGES FOR THE DIFFERENT
5 PROGRAMS. WE WERE VERY EXPLICIT THAT THAT WORK WAS GONNA NED
6 TO EVOLVE THROUGH CONVERSATIONS WITH THE LEGISLATURE,
7 CONTINUED CONVERSATIONS WITH PARTNERS. BUT NOW THAT THAT \$750
8 MILLION IS IN THE BILL IT REALLY ACCELERATES THE NEED TO
9 FIGURE THIS OUT. AND, SO, STAFF IS WORKING DILIGENTLY ON THAT,
10 INCLUDING, AS WELL, THE QUESTION OF GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE, RIGHT,
11 AND HOW IS THE LEGISLATION GOING TO BE STRUCTURED TO GIVE
12 ASSURANCE THAT VOTERS, YOU KNOW, IN ALL COUNTIES, WHERE THE
13 MEASURE IS ON THE BALLOT IN ALL NINE COUNTIES, ARE GOING TO
14 RECEIVE A REASONABLE RETURN ON THEIR INVESTMENT, AS IT WERE.
15 SO, THE NEXT STEP, IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW MTC AND THE WORK THAT
16 WE'RE DOING AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL IS TO BRING FORWARD SOME
17 RECOMMENDATIONS ON THOSE ITEMS TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE IN
18 APRIL. AND THAT'S REALLY JUST BECAUSE WE'RE FEELING A LOT OF
19 PRESSURE TO PUT OUR STAMP ON THIS BEFORE THE LEGISLATURE IS,
20 YOU KNOW, JUST MOVES FORWARD WITH THEIR OWN IDEAS. AND, SO,
21 THAT IS THE NEXT, SORT OF, KEY MILESTONE IS BRINGING FORWARD
22 SOME RECOMMENDATIONS ON APRIL 12TH TO THE LEG COMMITTEE,
23 FOLLOWED BY ACTION BY THE COMMISSION. YOU KNOW, LATER THAT
24 MONTH, AND THEN THE BILL, ITSELF, IS EXPECTED TO BE HEARD IN
25 TWO POLICY COMMITTEES, AS WELL AS THE APPROPRIATIONS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 COMMITTEE, AND IT'S GONNA BE COMING QUITE CLOSE TO THE
2 DEADLINE TO GET THROUGH THOSE COMMITTEES. SO, THERE'S AN
3 ANTICIPATED HEARING ON APRIL 23RD AT THE SENATE TRANSPORTATION
4 COMMITTEE, FOLLOWED BY APRIL 25TH AT THE SENATE REVENUE AND
5 TAXATION COMMITTEE. BOTH COMMITTEES ARE CHAIRED BY BAY AREA
6 MEMBERS, SENATE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE IS CHAIRED BY SENATOR
7 CORTESE AND SENATE REV AND TAX COMMITTEE IS CHAIRED BY SENATOR
8 GLAZER, AND THEN IT WILL GO TO APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE THEN
9 NEEDS TO MOVE OFF THE SENATE FLOOR BY THE END OF MAY SO THAT
10 CITIZEN TIMELINE. IT MOVES OUT OF SENATE BUT THERE WILL ALSO
11 LIKELY BE SOME CHANGES MADE IN ASSEMBLY. THAT'S HOW THE
12 PROCESS WORKS. IN ADDITION, ANOTHER IMPORTANT POLICY HANGING
13 OUT THERE IS THE ELIGIBILITY RELATED TO HIGHWAY FUNDING. SO,
14 WHETHER WE CAN TACKLE THAT IN APRIL, I THINK REMAINS TO BE
15 SEEN, BUT WE KNOW THAT IT'S AN IMPORTANT ISSUE, AND YOU KNOW,
16 SOME OF YOU ON THIS BODY HAVE, IN YOUR OTHER ROLES, EXPRESSED
17 CONCERNS ABOUT THAT, AND OBVIOUSLY IT CAME UP AT THE
18 COMMISSION'S JANUARY MEETING. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK -- I AM
19 SURE YOU MAY HAVE A LOT OF LOGISTICS QUESTIONS AND OTHER
20 QUESTIONS, BUT IF YOU WANT TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT
21 TODAY, AS FAR AS YOUR PERSPECTIVE, I THINK THAT WOULD BE
22 PRODUCTIVE, AS WELL AS ANY ITEMS I MENTIONED. WITH THAT I'LL
23 TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR
24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND WE'LL BEGIN OUR COMMENTS
2 ON MY RIGHT HAND SIDE. SO, CARINA AND THEN DIANA.

3

4 **CARINA LIEU:** NO COMMENTS AT THIS TIME.

5

6 **DIANE NGUYEN:** THANK YOU. NO COMMENTS AT THIS TIME.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** WILLIAM?

9

10 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** ARE THOSE HANDOUTS ALREADY IN PRINT?

11

12 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. THOSE HANDOUTS WERE USED IN
13 OUR LOBBY DAY WHICH WAS ABOUT A WEEK AGO. YEAH. WE HAVE SHARED
14 THOSE PUBLICLY. THEY WILL PROBABLY EVOLVE OVER TIME BECAUSE
15 THEY WERE ACTUALLY FINALIZED BEFORE THE BILL LANGUAGE WENT
16 INTO PRINT IT WAS OUR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT WAS GOING IN BUT
17 YES THOSE HAVE BEEN SHARED PUBLICLY.

18

19 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** THANKS REBECCA. I'M CONCERNED THAT WE'RE
22 GETTING A MEASURE THAT'S NOT GOING TO PASS AT THE BALLOT. ALSO
23 CONCERNED, YOU THINK THERE WAS A LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM
24 INTERESTED PARTIES THAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR A MORE BALANCED
25 MEASURE THAT HAD SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS, CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS, AS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 PART OF THE PROGRAM. I THINK THE PUBLIC PERCEPTION MAY BE THAT
2 THIS IS JUST A BAIL-OUT, AT THE VOTER'S EXPENSE TO, YOU KNOW,
3 TO SUSTAIN A SYSTEM THAT ISN'T MEETING THE COMMUNITY'S NEEDS
4 RIGHT NOW. AND I THINK THAT SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS BRING ADDED
5 EQUITY. THEY BRING JOBS, NOT JUST CONSTRUCTION JOBS, BUT THEY
6 GENERATE ENERGY FOR SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC VIBRANCY IN THE
7 REGION. AND I THINK THE CHANCES, WHAT'S PERCEIVED AS A BAILOUT
8 PASSING IS VERY SLIM. I'M WAITING TO SEE SOME RESPONSE TO THE
9 FEEDBACK THAT'S BEEN GIVEN AROUND THIS. BUT RIGHT NOW IT SEEMS
10 AS IF IT'S GOING FULL BORE WITH A VERY OPERATIONS-FOCUSED
11 MEASURE. AND THAT'S A CONCERN FOR ME.

12
13 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WENDI AND THEN ZACK.

14
15 **WENDI KALLINS:** LET'S SEE. WELL, WITH RESPECT TO MY COLLEAGUE,
16 I DISAGREE ABOUT THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS. I THINK WE HAVE A
17 MYRIAD OF DIFFERENT OPPORTUNITIES FOR CAPITAL FUNDING THAT ARE
18 AVAILABLE, AND VERY, VERY, VERY FEW OPPORTUNITIES FOR
19 OPERATIONS. AND MY FEELING IS THAT PEOPLE WANT TO SEE A SYSTEM
20 THAT WORKS, AND THAT'S REALLY WHAT'S GOING TO INSPIRE THEM.
21 WITH CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS FROM MY EXPERIENCE ON THE GROUND
22 WHAT PEOPLE CARE ABOUT IS LOCAL ROADS AND STREETS AND
23 IMPROVEMENTS FOR ALL USERS. AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE MORE
24 POPULAR FOR ANY KIND OF FREEWAY EXPANSION OF ANY KINDS. AND
25 JUST TO REMIND PEOPLE AGAIN THIS HIGHWAYS ARE NOT JUST



MARCH 22, 2024

1 FREEWAYS, THERE ARE LOCAL ROADS THAT ARE CONSIDERED, HIGHWAYS.
2 AND THEY CAN BE INCLUDED. I HAVE A QUESTION. WHO IS CARRYING
3 IT IN ASSEMBLY?

4

5 **REBECCA LONG:** THERE IS ONE COAUTHOR, AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING
6 I'M SURE THE BILL WILL GENERATE ADDITIONAL COAUTHORS, SO IT'S
7 SENATOR WIENER, WAHAB AND TING LISTED AS COAUTHOR.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS:** WOULD IT BE TO OUR ADVANTAGE TO CONTACT OUR OWN
10 ASSEMBLY MEMBERS AND ASK THEM TO SUPPORT IT?

11

12 **REBECCA LONG:** YES ABSOLUTELY.

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** COULD YOU ALSO REMIND US WHAT INCOME OPTIONS
15 STILL REMAIN IN THE BILL?

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** PAYROLL TAX EMPLOYER'S PARCEL TAX, SALES TAX,
18 THEN AFTER JANUARY 1ST, 2030 VEHICLE REGISTRATION SURCHARGE.

19

20 **WENDI KALLINS:** NOT A LOT OF REVENUE OPTIONS THERE, EXCEPT FOR
21 THE SALES TAX WHICH HAVE COURSE PEOPLE ARE TIRED OF. AND YOU
22 SAID THAT THERE IS A LOT OF DETAILS IN THE ASSESSMENT. I DON'T
23 WANT YOU TO GO INTO TOO MUCH DETAIL, BUT COULD YOU GIVE US A
24 LITTLE MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THAT, ABOUT THE CONSOLIDATION
25 AND WHY IT'S OF A CONCERN?



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** YES LET ME PULL IT UP SO I CAN CITE SOME OF
3 THOSE DETAILS. SO, YOU KNOW, AN EXAMPLE, I MEAN, FOR ONE
4 THING, JUST FOR CONTEXT, THERE IS ABOUT THREE PAGES THAT
5 DESCRIBE THE STUDY, RIGHT? SO, IT'S JUST A LOT OF LANGUAGE.
6 THERE IS A NUMBER THANK YOU TECH TEAM, BUT THIS IS NOT THE
7 DOCUMENT. I'M TALKING ABOUT REFERRING TO THE BILL ITSELF. IT
8 REQUIRES SPECIFIC DATA GATHERING FOR EXAMPLE, LISTING OUT OF
9 EXACT NATURE OF BOARD STRUCTURE, NUMBER OF VEHICLES, EVERY
10 TRANSIT AGENCY, HAS A LOT OF THINGS THAT ARE FACTUAL PROBABLY
11 COULD BE COLLECTED DON'T NECESSARILY NEED TO BE IN THE STUDY.
12 ONE OF THE CHALLENGES OR CONCERNS IS OPERATIONS IS ASSESSMENT
13 TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS AND HOW TO CONSOLIDATE TRANSIT
14 AGENCIES TO ACHIEVE THE FOLLOWING OBJECTIVES, SOMEWHAT
15 CONTRADICTORY, FOR EXAMPLE, IMPROVING ACCESS, IMPROVING ACCESS
16 TO VARIOUS DESTINATIONS, SAVING MONEY OF LIKE COST
17 EFFICIENCIES, SUPPORTING ADOPTION OF ADVANCED TECHNOLOGIES.
18 THERE IS SOME INHERENT TENSION AND CHALLENGES WITH THE
19 LANGUAGE RIGHT NOW. THE OTHER CONCERN THAT A NUMBER OF
20 OPERATORS HAVE EXPRESSED IS THAT THE LANGUAGE, IF YOU JUST
21 READ IT ON ITS FACE, IT IMPLIES THAT THE STUDY IS STRICTLY
22 LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATING ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES INTO ONE.
23 HOWEVER SENATOR WAHAB HAS SAID PUBLICLY THAT'S NOT THE INTENT.
24 SOME OF THIS IS ABOUT, AGAIN, ALIGNING THE LANGUAGE WITH WHAT
25 WE UNDERSTAND THE SENATOR HAS IN MIND.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** THE LAST ONE I WOULD AGREE WITH, THAT YOU NEED
3 TO LOOK AT ALL DIFFERENT CONFIGURATIONS, ALL SOUTH BAY, YOU
4 KNOW, ALL NORTH BAY, YOU KNOW, TAKING IT IN STRIDES, THINGS
5 LIKE IMPROVING SERVICE AND SUCH. I WOULD SAY THAT THAT SHOULD
6 BE A GOAL. WHEN LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATION HOW IT WOULD IMPROVE
7 SERVICE AND IT WOULD BE A FOREMOST STUDY. I DON'T UNDERSTAND
8 WHY THEY WOULD HAVE A PROBLEM WITH THAT ONE.

9

10 **REBECCA LONG:** AGAIN, I THINK THE CONCERN IS MORE THAT IT'S
11 ASKING FOR THE STUDY IN THE PLAN TO ACHIEVE MULTIPLE OUTCOMES
12 AT ONCE. AND SOME OF THOSE OUTCOMES MIGHT BE IN TENSION WITH
13 ONE ANOTHER.

14

15 **WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY. I GUESS I'LL HAVE TO GO READ THE BILL.
16 SEE IF I CAN ACTUALLY READ THE BILL. (LAUGHTER) HOW MANY PAGES
17 IS IT?

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** IT'S ABOUT 25 PAGES.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I --

24

25 **WENDI KALLINS:** I WERE GOING AROUND. SECOND CHANCE.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** CLARIFICATION.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I THINK WE'LL GO BACK THEN WE CAN GO TO
5 CHARLIE.

6

7 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF AROUND UPDATES
8 TO THIS BODY ON WHAT'S CHANGED IN MEASURE. I WOULD ALIGN
9 MYSELF WITH COUNCIL MEMBER KALLINS COMMENTS THIS IS NOT A
10 BAILOUT BUT SOMETHING SUBSTANTIVE FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.
11 WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE NEED FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MTC HAS
12 LAID OUT AMBITIOUS PLANS AROUND THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
13 THAT'S IN THE MEASURE I THINK WE CAN GO TO VOTERS SAYING THIS
14 WILL TRANSFORM THE RIDING EXPERIENCE WHEN IT COMES TO
15 COORDINATING SCHEDULES, MAPPING AND WAY FINDING AND FARES IN
16 ADDITION TO THE VERY NEEDED LOCAL INVESTMENTS AND STREETS
17 INVESTMENTS THAT NEED TO BE FUNDAMENTAL TO THIS MEASURES AND
18 THE GEOGRAPHIC RETURN TO SOURCE ISSUES. SO, I HOPE THOSE
19 PIECES ARE MAINTAINED IN THE MEASURE. IT'S A POWERFUL MESSAGE
20 THAT FOLKS IN THE BAY AREA CAN GET BEHIND. I LOOK FORWARD TO
21 SUPPORTING A MEASURE THAT DOES THAT. I'LL NOTE ON THE HANDOUT
22 IN THE PACKET, IT SAYS 1031 IS WIENER'S BILL AND DOESN'T
23 MENTION WAHAB. SO MIGHT WANT TO LOOK INTO THAT.

24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. WE'RE AWARE OF THAT. IF YOU
2 LOOK AT THE BILL, CERTAINLY SENATOR WAHAB IS A JOINT AUTHOR,
3 AT THE TIME WE FINALIZED THIS, THAT WAS THE DIRECTION THAT WE
4 WERE GIVEN.

5

6 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** CHARLIE, DID YOU WANT TO MAKE A QUICK
7 CLARIFICATION?

8

9 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** SURE. I WANTED TO CLARIFY WHEN TALKING ABOUT
10 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS, I WASN'T THINKING OF HIGHWAY EXPANSION
11 I'M THINKING CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS IN GENERAL. I THINK
12 RESTRICTION ON HIGHWAY EXPANSION IS A SEPARATE QUESTION, AND
13 IS A SMALL PART OF WHAT MIGHT MAKE UP CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS,
14 RAIL, LIGHT RAIL, AND THE LIKE. JUST WANT TO BE CLEAR ON THAT.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ROLAND AND THEN HOWARD.

17

18 **RONALD WONG:** I HAVE NO COMMENTS AT THIS TIME. THANK YOU.

19

20 **HOWARD WONG:** I ASSUME THAT THE PREVIOUS DISCUSSION ABOUT
21 PUTTING THIS MEASURE ON THE BALLOT BY PETITION IS NO LONGER
22 BEING CONSIDERED. IS THAT CORRECT?

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** NO. THAT'S NOT CORRECT. SO, THE LANGUAGE IS
25 BEING DRAFTED. OR IS IN PRINT TO AUTHORIZE SIGNATURE GATHERING



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CITIZEN INITIATIVE AS ONE OF THE POSITION OPTIONS FOR IT TO GO
2 ON THE BALLOT.

3

4 **HOWARD WONG:** IS IT COORDINATED FORMALLY BY MTC? OR PRIVATE
5 CITIZEN?

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** IT WOULD NEED TO BE PRIVATE INITIATIVE HOWEVER
8 THIS IS SOMETHING WE'RE INCREASINGLY EDUCATING OURSELVES ON.
9 THE LATEST INFORMATION I GOTTEN FROM SENATOR WIENER'S OFFICE
10 SAYS THAT THE LANGUAGE IN THE BILL CAN REALLY DETERMINE WHAT
11 THE VOTERS PETITION ON TO THE BALLOT. SO, EVEN IF IT IS
12 PRIVATELY LED, THE STRUCTURE AND THE EXPENDITURE PLAN CAN BE
13 LARGELY SHAPED BY THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION.

14

15 **HOWARD WONG:** AND, OF COURSE, THERE ARE PROBABLY POLITICAL
16 CONSULTANTS WHO WOULD ADVISE WHETHER THAT'S A GOOD WAY OF
17 APPROACHING IT OR NOT. THAT COULD HAVE SOME NEGATIVE, YOU
18 KNOW, INFLUENCE ON THE ELECTORATE. WHETHER IT'S AN ATTEMPT TO
19 CIRCUMVENT -- NOT CIRCUMVENT, BUT AS AN ALTERNATE TO 2/3
20 REQUIREMENT TO GO TO PETITION THAT REQUIRES ONLY 50% PLUS ONE.
21 ANYWAY, I'M SURE WE'LL HEAR MORE ABOUT THAT. ANYWAY, THE -- I
22 THOUGHT THE PRESS CONFERENCE THAT INTRODUCED THE MEASURE WAS
23 ACTUALLY VERY WELL DONE. THE UNIFIED VOICE, BY MANY
24 LEGISLATORS FROM THROUGHOUT THE REGION, SENATORS WIENER AND
25 WAHAB, AND OTHERS, I THINK REFLECTED, VERY WELL THE SURVEYS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 AND THE VOTER SENTIMENT ABOUT THE NEED FOR MORE REGIONAL
2 COORDINATION, TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. I THOUGHT, ALSO, THE
3 EMPHASIS IS NOT JUST ON THE FUTURE, BUT THAT AGENCIES, TODAY,
4 ARE ACTUALLY WORKING VERY HARD TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER SERVICE,
5 FUNDAMENTALS OF TRANSIT. I THOUGHT THAT WAS VERY GOOD. I THINK
6 THE -- IT IS IMPORTANT TO BRING IN ALL THE ELECTORATE. I THINK
7 THAT'S WHY ROADS, WHICH WERE VERY HIGH ON THE SURVEYS, PEOPLE
8 DO WANT BETTER HIGHWAYS, ROADS, POTHOLE REPAIRS, SO THAT
9 WHATEVER THE MEASURE IS, IT'S TRULY BENEFICIAL FOR ALL, ALL
10 PEOPLE. AND I THINK THAT'S PROBABLY ONE OF THE FEW WAYS OF
11 PASSAGE, IF THEY WERE TO DO THE 2/3 REQUIREMENT. THE -- STILL,
12 THE INTERESTINGLY, THE NEWS STORIES THAT CAME FROM THAT
13 INTRODUCTION -- INTRODUCING PRESS CONFERENCE, WAS A LITTLE
14 MIXED. AND I THINK THE MESSAGING PROBABLY GOT A LITTLE BIT
15 CLOUDY. THERE ARE SOME NEWSPAPERS THAT FOCUSED, A LOT, ON THE,
16 NOT JUST STUDY OF COORDINATING AND INTEGRATING TRANSIT
17 AGENCIES, BUT SEVERAL ARTICLES SAID THIS MEASURE WILL MERGE
18 AND INTEGRATE TRANSIT AGENCIES, WHICH IS A LITTLE BIT NOT
19 ACCURATE. AND THEN THAT TRIGGERED SEVERAL TRANSIT AGENCIES TO
20 RESPOND IN THOSE ARTICLES SAYING WE'RE STUDYING THIS, AND
21 WE'RE NOT NECESSARILY FOR IT. SO THERE SEEMED TO BE A SENSE OF
22 DIVISION CREATED BY THAT MESSAGING. SO, I THINK THAT NEEDS TO
23 BE CLARIFIED. ALSO, I THINK THE FUNDING MEASURES INSTEAD OF
24 POSING ALL OF THESE FUNDING MEASURES, SEVERAL OF WHICH WOULD
25 PROBABLY BE POLITICALLY NON-STARTERS, SUCH AS THE SALES TAX, I



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THINK THE EMPHASIS SHOULDN'T BE ON THE TYPES OF FUNDING, BUT
2 THE PACKAGE OF FARE FUNDING. AND IT MAY NOT BE ONE SINGLE
3 SOURCE OF FUNDING. IT MAY BE A PACKAGE OF FUNDING THAT IS FAIR
4 THAT HAS LESS REGRESSIVE IMPACTS ON LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, FOR
5 INSTANCE. THE OTHER THING THAT I KIND OF NOTED WAS THAT
6 COINCIDING WITH THIS INTRODUCTION OF THIS MEASURE WAS -- ARE
7 PERCEPTION OF CALIFORNIA PROPOSITION ONE, WHICH WAS A -- HAD A
8 VERY, SEEMINGLY, AT THE BEGINNING, A VERY STRONG MESSAGE ABOUT
9 HOUSING AND MENTAL HEALTH FACILITIES, AND, YET, IT ONLY PASSED
10 BY 50.2% OF THE VOTE. WHEN THE SUPPORTERS HAD RAISED \$13
11 MILLION TO SUPPORT AND OPPONENTS HAD RAISED ONLY \$1,000 TO
12 OPPOSE. THAT WAS VERY INTERESTING, BECAUSE WHAT IT SHOWED WAS
13 THAT PROP ONE, BECAUSE IT DIDN'T HAVE A UNIFIED VOICE, WHERE
14 LOCAL AGENCIES AND LOCAL CITIES, SOME OF WHOM OPPOSE THE
15 MEASURE, COMBINED WITH PROFESSIONAL PEOPLE IN THE MENTAL
16 HEALTH FACILITIES, OR THE SOCIAL SERVICES FIELDS, OPPOSED IT.
17 THAT WITH VERY LITTLE CAMPAIGN COULD ALMOST DEFEAT A SEEMINGLY
18 POPULAR MEASURE. SO, IF WE WERE TO REQUIRE A 2/3 VOTE AND NOT
19 HAVE A UNIFIED VOICE, AND A MEASURE THAT TRULY, YOU KNOW,
20 ADDRESSES EVERYONE'S NEEDS AND HAVE EVERYONE ON BOARD, FROM
21 THE BEGINNING, THAT WOULD RISK THE MEASURE. SO, I THINK
22 THERE'S -- IT WAS A GOOD START, BUT IT NEEDS A LITTLE BIT MORE
23 COORDINATION, A FEW MORE MEETINGS. I'M SURE WILL COME. SO,
24 THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ADINA AND THEN RANDI.

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. SO, A FEW THINGS. I WANTED TO PUT IN MY
4 THOUGHTS, ALONG WITH COLLEAGUES ON THIS BODY WHO ARE
5 SUPPORTING THE FOCUS ON TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING TO SUSTAIN
6 AND IMPROVE TRANSIT. I KNOW THAT DIFFERENT PEOPLE HAVE -- ARE
7 READING THE POLLING DATA DIFFERENTLY AND BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN
8 SOMETHING GOES ON THE BALLOT, THERE WOULD NEED TO BE A LOT
9 MORE POLLING AND ANALYSIS. BUT ONE THING, THAT, AT LEAST THE
10 WAY I'M READING THE RESULTS FROM MTC AND OTHER SURVEYS IS THAT
11 PEOPLE, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE DON'T JUST WANT A RESCUE FOR TRANSIT,
12 THEY WANT IT TO GET BETTER. AND BETTER INCLUDES FREQUENT
13 SERVICE, BETTER INCLUDES COOPERATED SERVICE, BETTER INCLUDES
14 INTEGRATED AFFORDABLE FARES AND ASPECTS OF THE TRANSFORMATION
15 ACTION PLAN. AND, SO, AND, SO, I THINK THAT'S A PRETTY CLEAR
16 READING FROM SOME OF WHAT'S COMING OUT OF THE PEOPLE. PEOPLE
17 DO ALSO VALUE THEIR LOCAL STREETS AND FIXING POTHOLES, THOSE
18 ARE GOOD FOR ALL, BUT PEOPLE WANT TRANSIT TO IMPROVE. SO, IN
19 TERMS OF THE RELATIONSHIP OF THAT TO CAPITAL FUNDING, IF IT
20 IS, YOU KNOW, SOME -- SOME CAPITAL FUNDING IS, LIKE, VERY
21 SYNERGISTIC TO IMPROVING. LIKE, IF YOU DO TRANSIT PRIORITY
22 TREATMENTS, YOU WIND UP GETTING MORE SERVICE OUT OF THE SAME
23 OPERATING DOLLAR, AND THE BUS IS FASTER AND MORE RELIABLE AND
24 SOMEONE CAN GET TO A JOB ON TIME, AND SO ON. IF, IN A MIX OF
25 TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS, WE PUT IN A LOT OF MONEY INTO, YOU



MARCH 22, 2024

1 KNOW BART TO SILICON VALLEY, AND VALLEY LINK AND LINK 21, AND
2 SO ON, AND THEN ARE LEFT WITHOUT ENOUGH OPERATING MONEY SO
3 THAT WE HAVE VIABLE BART SERVICE, THEN WE HAVE BART TO SILICON
4 VALLEY AS A TRAIN MUSEUM, RIGHT? WE HAVE THIS STATION
5 UNDERGROUND THAT LOOKS BEAUTIFUL AND WE'RE REMEMBERING THE
6 TRANSIT SERVICE SYSTEM THAT WE USED TO V SO, MAKING SURE THAT
7 WE HAVE THAT, NOT ONLY CONTINUED VIABLE AND IMPROVED SERVICE
8 IS FUNDAMENTAL AND THE CAPITAL WOULD NEED TO SUPPORT THE
9 SERVICE. IT CAN'T BE INSTEAD OF THE SERVICE THAT'S NOT -- IT
10 DOESN'T EVEN MAKE SENSE IN THAT DIRECTION. THE -- ANOTHER
11 QUESTION I HAVE IN TERMS OF TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING IS,
12 THERE IS A PROVISION WITH TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT AND
13 BUILDING ON THE PREVIOUS COMMUTE BENEFIT PROGRAM TO INCLUDE
14 OPTIONS TO PURCHASE THE ALL-AGENCY TRANSIT PASS, WHICH IS
15 AMAZINGLY SUCCESSFUL IN PILOT AND SEEMS LIKE A POTENTIAL
16 VALUABLE THING TO INCLUDE AND THE QUESTION I HAVE THERE IS
17 THAT WOULD LOGICALLY BRING IN MORE RIDERS AND MORE OPERATING
18 REVENUE INTO THE SYSTEM, AND HAS THERE BEEN ANY ANALYSIS ABOUT
19 WHAT THE REVENUE EFFECT THAT WOULD BE AS PART OF THE PACKAGE
20 IN THE LEGISLATION.

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** I APOLOGIZE, ADINA I LOST TRACK OF THAT
23 QUESTION. CAN YOU REPEAT IT?

24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT, AS TO HOW MUCH
2 REVENUE THAT MIGHT BRING IN?

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** GOT IT. (LAUGHTER) IN OUR ANALYSIS WE AS A
5 STRUCTURE FORWARD WE'RE USING A PLACE HOLDER WHICH IS
6 DEFENSIBLE BUT CERTAINLY NOT FINAL OR BASED ON VERY ROBUST
7 DATA BUT AGAIN WE THINK IT'S DEFENSIBLE. WHAT'S INCLUDED IN
8 THE LANGUAGE NOW IS A MANDATE, BUILDING ON THE EXISTING
9 COMMUTER BENEFIT PROGRAM THAT MTC AND THE AIR DISTRICT
10 ADMINISTER. THAT'S APPLICABLE TO ALL EMPLOYERS IN THE BAY AREA
11 WITH 50 OR MORE EMPLOYEES. AND WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING IS A
12 MANDATE FOR ALL OF THOSE EMPLOYERS THAT THEY SUBSIDIZE SOME
13 FORM OF NON-SINGLE-OCCUPANT VEHICLE TRAVEL, WITH TRANSIT-RICH
14 LOCATIONS THAT WOULD NOT BE NECESSARILY BE A TRANSIT SUBSIDY
15 AND THE AMOUNT THAT WE'RE ESTIMATING IS ABOUT \$100 MILLION A
16 YEAR SO WE THINK THAT'S DOABLE WITHIN THE RANGE THAT WOULD BE
17 POLITICALLY ACCEPTABLE.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. ALSO FOLLOWING THE MENTIONED PROP ONE
20 IT WASN'T AS MIGHT OR MIGHT NOT PERTAIN AS AN ANALOGY. THAT
21 WASN'T NEW MONEY. THAT WAS TAKING EXISTING MONEY FROM SOME
22 MENTAL HEALTH PROGRAMS AND THEN MOVING IT INTO HOUSING AND
23 DIFFERENT MENTAL HEALTH PROGRAMS. SO, I THINK AS AN ANALOGY,
24 IT MAY OR MAY NOT HOLD, BECAUSE OF THAT FUNDAMENTAL ISSUE
25 ABOUT WHAT THAT MEASURE ACTUALLY DID.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ASKING
3 PEOPLE TO VOTE ON A MEASURE THAT SAYS IT'S A TRANSPORTATION
4 MEASURE, WE NEED TO BE CLEARER TO THE VAST MAJORITY OF PEOPLE
5 WHO DON'T USE TRANSIT WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO GET OUT OF IT, AND
6 IN JUST THIS HAND OUT, IT'S NOT VERY CLEAR FOR THE WHAT'S IN
7 IT FOR ME PEOPLE, EVEN THIS SECTION WHERE IT SAYS VOTERS
8 STRONGLY VALUE TRANSIT BUT ALSO SUPPORT LOCAL IMPROVEMENTS AND
9 ROAD CONDITIONS AND SAFETY. IT SEGUES INTO TRANSIT. SO, YOU'RE
10 NOT GIVING PEOPLE WHO AREN'T TAKING TRANSIT A REALLY GOOD IDEA
11 OF WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO GET OUT OF THIS, AND THAT MAKES UP
12 THE BIGGEST POPULATION WHO ARE GOING TO BE VOTING YEA OR NAY
13 ON THIS. I THINK REWARDING SOME OF THIS IS GOING TO BE
14 ABSOLUTELY NECESSARY. BECAUSE THE CRANKY PEOPLE THAT I LIVE
15 NEAR ARE NOT GOING TO VOTE FOR THIS. BECAUSE THEY DON'T TAKE
16 TRANSIT. THEY JUST WANT EVERYBODY TO GET OFF THE ROAD AND OUT
17 FROM IN FRONT OF THEM. IF WE CAN EXPLAIN TO THEM THAT TRANSIT
18 AGENCIES ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR GETTING PEOPLE OUT FROM IN FRONT
19 OF THEM. WE NEED TO DO A BETTER JOB OF THAT. THAT'S REALLY
20 CLEAR FROM THIS, THAT WE'RE NOT SPEAKING TO THEM, AT ALL.
21 WE'RE ONLY TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT. AND I GET THAT. AND I GET --
22 WE GET THAT, BUT THE LOCAL PERSON ON THE STREET DOES NOT GET
23 THAT. THEY'RE COMPLAINING ABOUT ALL THE HIGH DENSITY HOUSING
24 THAT'S BEING BUILT NEAR THEM THAT'S NOT REALLY AFFECTING THEM.
25 THEY'RE COMPLAINING ABOUT THE TRAFFIC BACKUPS, DUE TO THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BUILDING OF THE HIGH DENSITY HOUSING. THEY'RE COMPLAINING THAT
2 ONCE THEY GET ON THE ROAD THEY CAN'T GET ANYWHERE BECAUSE
3 SIGNALIZED LIGHTS, THERE IS NO TIMING ON THAT. THEY'RE
4 COMPLAINING ABOUT POTHOLES. SO, WE NEED TO GET THEM SOMETHING
5 TO VOTE FOR, SINCE THEY'RE OBVIOUSLY CONVINCED THEY'RE NOT
6 GOING TO TAKE A LIGHT RAIL OR BUS THEIR ENTIRE LIVES, MUCH
7 LESS A TRAIN OR ANYTHING ELSE. THAT'S MY TWO CENTS.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TERRY THEN GERRY.

10

11 **TERRY SCOTT:** AS BRIEFLY AS POSSIBLE, THIS MEASURE, AND ANY
12 PUBLIC VOTE THAT MAY BE APPROACHED TO TAKE, I THINK IT CRIES
13 OUT SIGNIFICANTLY FOR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT THAT WE HAVE BEEN
14 TALKING ABOUT FOR THE LAST THREE OR FOUR YEARS. AND NOTHING
15 HAS BEEN -- I DON'T KNOW IF NOTHING HAS BEEN DONE, BUT
16 NOTHING HAS APPEARED. NOTHING HAS HAPPENED THAT WE CAN
17 MEASURE. AND, SO, I THINK THAT I AGREE THAT THERE MAY BE
18 DIFFICULTY IN GETTING PUBLIC SUPPORT, UNLESS THEY KNOW WHAT
19 THEY'RE GETTING. AND THE POINT IS, I THINK THE POINT WAS WELL
20 MADE THAT THERE ARE MANY OF THE -- MANY OF THE IMPROVEMENTS
21 THAT PEOPLE ARE LOOKING FOR, THEY FEEL THEY HAVE ALREADY PAID
22 FOR, THAT THEY HAVE PAID FOR THROUGH THEIR TAXES, ET CETERA,
23 AND SO TO INCREASE THAT WITHOUT SHOWING MEASURABLE
24 IMPROVEMENTS AND IMPACTS TO THE INDIVIDUALS THAT MAY OR MAY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 NOT BE IMPACTED, ARE PRETTY CRITICAL. AND, SO, I -- YOU KNOW,
2 THERE IS A LOT MORE WORK NEEDS TO BE DONE ON THIS. THANK YOU.
3
4 **GERRY GLASER:** WHEN I APPLIED FOR THIS SEAT ON THIS BODY, I
5 HAVE TO ADMIT THAT I WAS PRETTY IGNORANT ABOUT TRANSIT. THE
6 LAST TIME I WAS TAKING TRANSIT WAS BACK IN THE '70S ON BART.
7 AND SO I STUDIED A LOT BEFORE I CAME HERE FOR THE FIRST
8 MEETING. THAT WAS WHEN I DISCOVERED WE HAD 27 TRANSIT
9 DISTRICTS IN OUR NINE COUNTIES, AND I MENTIONED THAT IN OUR
10 VERY FIRST MEETING. BECAUSE I'M A QUIET GUY AND I DON'T LIKE
11 TO SAY MUCH. AND RANDI SAID YEAH ALL OF US WERE ASKING THAT
12 QUESTION TOO. AND WE'RE STILL ASKING THAT QUESTION. I ALSO SIT
13 ON THE SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE FOR CITIZEN'S
14 ADVISORY COMMITTEE. AND THE STUDY, WHICH MTC PARTICIPATED WITH
15 IN CONSOLIDATION AND INTEGRATION OF THE THREE BUS TRANSIT
16 DISTRICTS IN THE COUNTY IS AN EXCELLENT STUDY. I DON'T KNOW
17 WHAT YOU GUYS PAID FOR OUT OF IT BUT YOU GOT ONE HECK OF A
18 DEAL OF THE IT'S A REALLY GOOD IN-DEPTH STUDY, AND A GREAT
19 MODEL FOR THE KIND OF STUDY THAT WE SHOULD BE DOING FOR THE
20 ENTIRE AREA. AND LOOKING AT IT BECAUSE IT LOOKS AT CHALLENGES
21 BENEFITS AND TIMELINES. THE DISAPPOINTING PART IS WE HAVE MADE
22 A LOT OF PROGRESS BECAUSE WE JUST HAD A REPORT-OUT IN JANUARY
23 ON HOW FAR WE GOT WITH THAT. A FEW THINGS OCCURRED BUT THERE
24 IS A LOT MORE TO THAT. BUT THE POINT I MADE DURING THAT
25 MEETING IS THAT MOST PEOPLE KEEP TALKING ABOUT INTEGRATION OF



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THE TRANSIT DISTRICTS. I DON'T CARE ABOUT INTEGRATION OF THE
2 TRANSIT DISTRICTS, I CARE ABOUT CONSOLIDATION OF THE TRANSIT
3 DISTRICTS. SO THAT'S THE FOCUS. CONSOLIDATION VERSUS
4 INTEGRATION. AND, AS FAR AS THE MEASURE, ONE OF THE THINGS
5 THAT I'M DISTURBED ABOUT AS WE'RE GOING AROUND HERE IS THE
6 MEASURES ADDRESSING BOTH FUNDING AND DIRECTION. IF THERE WERE
7 TWO SEPARATE MEASURES, ONE MEASURE WHICH SAYS, HERE IS OUR
8 DIRECTION. WE WANT YOU TO STUDY THIS. AND THIS IS THE
9 DIRECTION THAT WE SHOULD BE TAKING. GIVE US A STUDY ON THAT,
10 WE CAN HAVE LEGISLATION ON THAT, WE CAN HAVE A VOTE ON THAT.
11 PROBABLY JUST AT THE LEGISLATIVE LEVEL. THAT WOULD BE VALUABLE
12 FOR US TO DO. AND IF THE STATE GAVE US FUNDING IN ORDER TO DO
13 THAT STUDY AT THE SAME TIME THAT WOULD BE A REASONABLE AMOUNT
14 OF MONEY AND PROBABLY DOESN'T NEED TO GO TO THE VOTERS. AFTER
15 THAT ONCE YOU SAY HERE IS THE PLAN AND YOU SAY WE NEED FUNDING
16 TO IN ORDER TO PUT THIS PLAN IN PLACE MAKES SENSE BECAUSE
17 YOU'RE SELLING SOMETHING NOT SELLING THE CONCEPT WHAT WE THINK
18 WE'RE GOING TO DO AND THIS IS HOW MUCH MONEY THAT YOU ARE
19 GOING TO NEED TO GIVE US IN ORDER TO DO SOMETHING THAT WE
20 HAVEN'T TOUCHED. THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE HEARING HERE AS WELL. AND
21 ANYWAY THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. I DIDN'T HAVE QUESTIONS BUT I
22 LIKE TO MAKE COMMENTS

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR THERE, IS AN ASSESSMENT AND
25 THEN THERE IS A PLAN. THE ASSESSMENT IS DUE -- IT'S ACTUALLY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 VERY QUICK, IT'S DUE BY JANUARY 1ST, 2026, SOMEONE CAN CORRECT
2 ME. THEN THE PLAN TO IMPLEMENT IS DUE BY JANUARY 1ST, 2027, SO
3 A COUPLE OF MONTHS BEFORE THE ELECTION. THE QUESTION OF HOW
4 WOULD THE STUDY BE PAID FOR IS STILL AN OPEN QUESTION BUT ALL
5 PROVISIONS RELATED TO ASSESSMENT AND PLAN ARE NOT SUBJECT TO
6 VOTER APPROVAL SO THE INTENT IS VERY MUCH TO DO THIS WORK SO
7 THAT IN A MEASURE YOU CAN BE TALKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE ON
8 THE CUSP OF EXECUTING THIS GOVERNANCE CHANGES, ET CETERA.

9

10 **GERRY GLASER:** I KNOW YOU'RE FAMILIAR WITH THE 2019 STUDY DONE
11 IN SONOMA COUNTY AND YOU CAN SEE HOW IT WAS BROKEN DOWN INTO
12 STEPS AND EACH ISSUES ARE DISCUSSED AND EACH ONE HAS A
13 DIFFERENT SET OF DYNAMICS THAT GOES ALONG WITH IT AND
14 OPPORTUNITIES AND COST TO GO ALONG WITH IT.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY,

17

18 **JOHNNY PARKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. I HAVE NO
19 FURTHER COMMENTS ON IT.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** SO, I WAS A BIT CONCERNED ABOUT YOUR MENTIONING
22 THAT, YOU KNOW, THE BILL GOES INTO A LOT OF DETAIL. BECAUSE WE
23 ARE MORE THAN TWO AND A HALF YEARS OUT FROM THE ELECTION,
24 TYPICALLY FROM WHAT I UNDERSTAND, THE WAY WE DO MEASURES IS WE
25 DO POLLING AND WE FIGURE OUT WHAT WE NEED TO PUT INTO IT TO



MARCH 22, 2024

1 GET IT OVER THE LINE. WHICH YOU SIMPLE CLIENT DO AT THIS
2 STAGE, AND SO, YOU ARE TYPICALLY DOING POLLING, YOU KNOW,
3 PRETTY CLOSE TO THE TIME WHEN YOU NEED TO PUT IT ON THE
4 BALLOT, YOU DO THE TWEAKS THAT YOU THINK ARE GONNA GET YOU
5 OVER THE LINE. SO, I'M JUST A BIT CONCERNED THAT, THAT, YOU
6 KNOW, THAT KIND OF STANDARD APPROACH THAT WE HAVE IS -- IS --
7 THAT PEOPLE SOMEHOW SEEM TO THINK THAT PASSING THIS IS SUCH A
8 DONE DEAL THAT WE CAN DO ANYTHING WE WANT. IT'S NOT A DONE
9 DEAL. THE OTHER THING IS, ALSO, AGAIN, YOU KNOW, IS TALKING
10 ABOUT CONSOLIDATION ON THE MTC ITSELF. THE IDEA OF
11 CONSOLIDATION WAS ABSOLUTELY RADIO ACTIVE. I MEAN PEOPLE --
12 PEOPLE ON THE MTC DO NOT LIKE CONSOLIDATION, THEY WANT
13 COORDINATION. YOU KNOW, ON THAT MEETING, I, MYSELF, HEARD
14 COORDINATION NOT CONSOLIDATION, PROBABLY 20 TIMES. SO THIS
15 ASSUMPTION THAT THIS IS WHAT WE THINK IS THE BEST AND IT'S A
16 DONE DEAL, WE CAN DO ANYTHING WE WANT, I THINK THIS'S
17 MISGUIDED. AND THE THIRD THING I WANTED TO SAY IS THIS WHOLE
18 BAILOUT THING, PERSONALLY, I, MYSELF, AM NOT NECESSARILY
19 AGAINST BAILOUTS, THE THING IS BAILOUTS ARE TEMPORARY. IF YOU
20 ARE TALKING ABOUT A 30-YEAR BAILOUT, THE OPTICS JUST LOOK BAD.
21 IT SEEMS LIKE YOU'RE NOT EVEN INTERESTED IN BEING EFFICIENT.
22 SO, I FEEL LIKE IF WE HAVE A FLOW LIKE THIS PEOPLE START
23 TALKING ABOUT 30-YEAR BAILOUTS, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A PROBLEM
24 AGAIN. SO, I JUST HOPE FOLKS ARE CAREFUL ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WHAT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 YOU -- HOW YOU RESTRICT WHAT KIND OF MEASURE YOU'RE GOING TO
2 PUT ON, BECAUSE WE NEED IT TO PASS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. GABRIEL, AND THEN WE'LL GO TO
5 OUR FOLKS ONLINE.

6

7 **GABRIEL GORDO:** I WANT TO ECHO THE SENTIMENT ABOUT WHAT STAFF
8 AND OTHER MEMBERS HAVE ALLUDED TO ABOUT HAVING THE CART BEFORE
9 THE HORSE AND I HOPE THAT CAUTIONING THAT AT THE CENTER AREN'T
10 PLACING TOO MUCH INTO THE BILL AS TO HOW THE BILL SHOULD BE
11 RISKING THEIR ASSESSMENT OF WHAT SHOULD BE IN THE MEASURE MAY
12 NOT MATCH WHAT VOTERS WOULD ACTUALLY SUPPORT. AND, LIKE FOLKS
13 MENTIONED, THERE IS A LOT THAT COULD CHANGE BETWEEN NOW AND
14 2026. SO, IT SEEMS LIKE MAYBE LEAVING IT TO WHATEVER,
15 HOPEFULLY GRASSROOTS ORGANIZATION, OR COALITION, BRINGS THE
16 MEASURE FORWARD INTO THE FUTURE, AND THEIR EXPERTISE MAY BE
17 MORE PRUDENT. SO, THAT'S MY ONLY COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I BELIEVE JEFF HAD HIS HAND
20 UP EARLIER.

21

22 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** YES. I CAN SPEAK, I GUESS. I HAVE GOT A LOT OF
23 THOUGHTS HERE AND I DON'T WANT TO WASTE ANYONE'S TIME. I WANT
24 TO SHARE AN OBSERVATION THAT BY AND LARGE THOSE WHO ARE
25 MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL ARE URBANISTS BY NATURE, AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 WE'RE VERY TRANSIT AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FOCUSED.
2 UNFORTUNATELY, I DON'T THINK WE REALLY REPRESENT THE VAST
3 MAJORITY OF THE VOTERS. AND WITH A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING OF
4 VOTER FATIGUE THAT WE FACE AND A GENERAL DISTRUST OF
5 GOVERNMENT BY MANY VOTERS, AT THIS POINT, WE GOT A REAL MAJOR
6 MOUNTAIN TO CLIMB HERE, GETTING THIS INITIATIVE TO PASS. AND I
7 THINK THAT ONE OF THE THINGS WE HAVE TO BEAR IN MIND IS,
8 INDEED, BASED UPON COUNCIL MEMBER KINMAN'S OBSERVATIONS, IS
9 THAT THIS THING, THIS INITIATIVE REALLY HAS TO ADDRESS THE
10 INTEREST AND NEEDS OF THOSE SUBURBAN VOTER SUPERVISOR THOSE
11 FOLKS WHO DRIVE. AT THE END OF THE DAY, I MAY BE TRANSIT
12 FOCUSED, BUT MY DAILY LIFE IS GENERAL IN AN AUTOMOBILE. THE
13 ONLY TIME I USE TRANSIT IS TO GO INTO SAN FRANCISCO BECAUSE IT
14 DOESN'T SERVE MY NEEDS, QUITE FRANKLY. I THINK WE HAVE A
15 NUMBER OF ISSUES THAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS, ONE OF WHICH IS HOW
16 DO WE REALLY MAKE A COMPELLING CASE ON THIS INITIATIVE AT THE
17 END OF THE DAY. WHAT ARE WE DOING TO DELIVER VALUE? WHAT ARE
18 WE DOING TO ADDRESS OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCIES? WHAT ARE WE
19 DOING TO ADDRESS DELIVERING CAPITAL PROJECTS EFFICIENTLY AND
20 COST EFFECTIVELY? WHY IS IT THAT IT COSTS FOUR TIMES AS MUCH
21 TO BUILD A UNIT OF INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE UNITED STATES AS IT
22 DOES IN THE EU? WE NEED TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES. THE VOTERS
23 ARE TIRED OF BEING TAXED FOR THINGS AND BELIEVING THEY'RE NOT
24 SEEING RESULTS. WE HAVE GOT TO GET OURSELVES TO WHERE WE GOT
25 SOMETHING THAT APPEALS TO A LOT OF PEOPLE AND DEMONSTRATES



MARCH 22, 2024

1 REAL PROGRESS. AND, ALSO, WE NEED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT WE CAN
2 BE TRUSTED. BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN THE INITIATIVE GOES TO THE
3 VOTERS, WHAT ARE WE DOING THAT'S GOING TO DELIVER THEIR TRUST?
4 AND OTHER -- AND A COUPLE OF OTHER THOUGHTS. I THINK WE NEED
5 TO FOCUS MORE STRONGLY ON AN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK.
6 BIKE PHONE CALLS VOTE. AND THE BIKE PHONE CALLS WERE THE ONES
7 THAT MADE THE SMART INITIATIVE PASS, ULTIMATELY. THEY ARE VERY
8 MUCH CONCERNED ABOUT, SAFE ALTERNATIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORKS
9 THAT ARE REALLY DELIVERED ON A REGIONAL BASIS. THE OTHER THING
10 IS REGARDING REVENUE STREAM, WE NEED TO ALSO FOCUS ON GETTING
11 THIS VMT ISSUE RESOLVED TO THE EXTENT THAT I SEE IT AS AN
12 EQUITY ISSUE. A LOT OF VOTERS PERCEIVE PEOPLE THAT OWN
13 ELECTRIC VEHICLES AS WEALTHY. AND PEOPLE WHO DRIVE GASOLINE
14 VEHICLES AS NOT. SO, HOW IS IT WE'RE GOING TO BE DELIVERING
15 VALUE TO -- IN AN EQUITABLE WAY, SO THAT FOLKS THAT ARE
16 DRIVING HYBRIDS AND EVS ARE CONTRIBUTING IN LIEU OF THEIR GAS
17 TAXES? I'M VERY MUCH CONCERNED. AT THIS POINT, I DON'T BELIEVE
18 THIS INITIATIVE WILL PASS. I THINK IT WILL FAIL, DRAMATICALLY,
19 UNLESS WE ADDRESS THESE ISSUES. AND ANOTHER THING THAT I'M
20 CONCERNED ABOUT IS THIS NOTION OF, DO WE TAX BUSINESSES? DO WE
21 TAKE PAYROLL TAX? DO WE TAX BUSINESSES? ARE WE GOING TO MAKE
22 OUR CENTER CITIES EVEN LESS COMPETITIVE BY CHOOSING TO DO SO
23 AND DRIVING DOWN TRANSIT USE IN THE PROCESS. THESE ARE
24 COMMENTS, THEY'RE NOT PARTICULARLY SPECIFIC QUESTIONS THAT CAN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BE ANSWERED HERE, BUT AT THIS POINT, I HAVE VERY DEEP CONCERNS
2 THAT WE'RE GOING TO SUCCEED UNLESS WE ADDRESS THESE ISSUES.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** REBECCA?

5

6 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. THANK YOU, COUNCIL MEMBER RHOADS. THOSE
7 WERE REALLY GREAT COMMENTS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A MINUTE
8 TO RESPOND TO A FEW OF THEM. AND SOME OF THEM, I THINK WERE
9 ECHOED BY A NUMBER OF COUNCIL MEMBERS. JUST ON THE ISSUE OF A
10 BALANCED PLAN AND HOW IMPORTANT BICYCLE PEDESTRIAN SAFETY IS
11 TO BAY AREA VOTERS, AND JUST LOCAL STREET AND ROAD REPAIRS, WE
12 HAVE A COMPONENT IN THIS COMMISSION ADOPTED PROPOSAL THAT
13 ABSOLUTELY RECOGNIZES THAT AND THAT IS INFORMED BY POLLING.
14 RIGHT? SO, WE HAVE DONE A NUMBER OF POLLS TO ASK PEOPLE WHAT
15 TYPES OF INVESTMENTS THEY WANT TO SEE IN A MEASURE, AND THE
16 MOST POPULAR OPTION, BASIC LIKELY 81% PRIORITY I'M GOING TO
17 READ IT QUICKLY, REPAVING ROADS, REPAIRING POTHOLES IMPROVING
18 SIDEWALKS BIKE LANES AND GETTING AROUND EASIER AND SAFER FOR
19 DRIVERS AND BICYCLISTS AND PEDESTRIAN, AND AGAIN 81% THAT'S A
20 PRIORITY. SO, WE HAVE CREATED A PROGRAM SAFE STREETS AND ARE
21 INTENDING TO PUT A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF THE REVENUE INTO
22 THAT AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WOULD BENEFIT EVERY COUNTY AND
23 CITY IN THE REGION SO WE RECOGNIZE HOW IMPORTANT THAT IS. AND
24 I WANT TO RESPOND TO SOME OF THE COMMENTS THAT COLONEL MEMBER
25 KINMAN MADE AND A NUMBER OF OTHERS RELATED TO THE CONCERN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BASED ON OUR RECENT POLLING, HALF OF THE BAY AREA VOTERS USE
2 TRANSIT OCCASIONALLY OR FREQUENTLY AND ABOUT HALF RARELY USE
3 IT, DESPITE THAT, 78% OF BAY AREA VOTERS SAY THAT TRANSIT IS
4 VERY IMPORTANT AND WHETHER THEY JUST BECAUSE THEY'RE GENEROUS
5 AND WANT OTHER PEOPLE TO USE OR TO COUNCIL MEMBER KINMAN'S
6 POINT THEY'RE HAPPY TO HAVE A ROBUST TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT OTHER
7 PEOPLE USE AND THERE IS FEWER CARS ON THE ROAD. I THINK THERE
8 IS A LONG-STANDING AWARENESS OF THAT DYNAMIC IN THE BAY AREA
9 BECAUSE WE HAVE HAD HUGE SUCCESS AT BALLOT MEASURES IN THE
10 PAST FUNDING TRANSIT SO REALLY IS THE CASE THAT BAY AREA
11 VOTERS THEY VALUE TRANSIT THEY WANT TO SEE TRANSIT INVESTED
12 EVEN IF THEY DON'T USE IT, AND WE'RE HAPPY TO BRING BACK
13 AROUND, FOR THOSE WHO USE TRANSIT, EVEN FOR THOSE WHO NEVER
14 USE TRANSIT THEY WANT TO USE IT, WHETHER THAT'S, SORT OF, LIKE
15 THE DOCTOR AND YOU FRIEND THAT YOU'RE REALLY HEALTHY
16 (LAUGHTER) YOU KNOW, WHO KNOWS BUT THAT IS AT LEAST WHAT
17 PEOPLE ARE SAYING. THEY WANT TO USE TRANSIT. THEY CARE ABOUT
18 TRANSIT. SO WE HAVE FEW PEOPLE IN THE REGION WHO ARE JUST,
19 LIKE, TRANSIT IS A DISASTER, DON'T CARE ABOUT IT, NEVER GOING
20 TO RIDE IT. THAT IS NOT THE MAJORITY SENTIMENT AT ALL. SO, I
21 THINK IN OUR MIND, THE KEY POINTS THAT A NUMBER OF YOU HAVE
22 MADE ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THE POLITICAL CLIMATE, THE ECONOMIC
23 CLIMATE, IT IS A VERY, VERY HARD MOMENT TO BE THINKING ABOUT
24 ASKING THE VOTERS TO TAX THEMSELVES TO THE EXTENT THAT THIS
25 MEASURE IS PROPOSING. YOU KNOW? WE HOPE THAT TWO PLUS YEARS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 FROM NOW THAT CLIMATE IS DIFFERENT. BUT WE DO BELIEVE THAT THE
2 OUTLINE, THE STRUCTURE THAT WE ARE PUTTING TOGETHER HERE, IT
3 REALLY IS ATTEMPTING TO BE BALANCED. IT REALLY IS ATTEMPTING
4 TO LEAN INTO THOSE THINGS THAT BOTH ARE CONSISTENT WITH
5 PLANNED BAY AREA AND THE REGION'S PRIORITY, AND THAT VOTERS
6 REALLY CARE ABOUT, AND WE JUST, WE'RE VERY MINDFUL OF THE NEED
7 TO HAVE A BALANCED PLAN AND MINDFUL OF HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO
8 GET SOME SELF-SUSTAINING ONGOING REVENUES FOR TRANSIT. LET'S
9 SEE. I THINK I HIT ON MY KEY POINTS. AGAIN, JUST -- YES, THE
10 POLLING, YOU KNOW, DOES SUGGEST THAT IT'S THE ATTITUDE AROUND
11 TAXES CHANGES A BIT IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS, WE THINK THE
12 PRIORITIES LAID OUT HERE ARE ALIGNED WITH WHAT VOTERS CARE
13 ABOUT.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. MARTHA D WE HAVE ANYONE ELSE
16 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED ONLINE?

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER BALDINI.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** RANDI?

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO ADD SOMETHING THAT WAS
25 REASONABLY POSITIVE IN THE ONLINE DISCUSSIONS AND THERE WAS AN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 EXTENSIVE THREAD THAT WE WENT THROUGH WHERE PEOPLE HAD THE NEW
2 CLIPPER ALL PASS, AND EVERYBODY WAS EXPLAINING IT AND IT'S
3 AMAZING -- IT'S NOT AMAZING TO ME, BECAUSE I KNOW THAT PEOPLE
4 DON'T READ THESE THINGS, AND THAT THOSE OF US WHO WERE
5 INVOLVED IN IT UNDERSTAND IT, BUT TO HEAR CITIZENS EXPLAINING,
6 NO, I HAVE THIS PASS, I HAVE THIS CLIPPER CARD, AND I CAN GO
7 ANYWHERE I WANT, AND I GET AN AUTOMATIC DISCOUNT ON IT AND THE
8 ONLY COMPLAINT I HEARD WAS THIS WOMAN WHO TRIED TO GET A
9 CLIPPER CARD FOR HER NEPHEW WHO IS LIVING WITH HER AND THERE
10 IS NONE AVAILABLE IN THE SOUTH BAY. SHE WENT TO EVERY SINGLE
11 LOCATION, AND THERE ARE NONE TO BE HAD. AND I WAS, LIKE, I
12 THINK THE PROGRAM WAS A LITTLE TOO SUCCESSFUL, AND IF I
13 REMEMBER CORRECTLY, FOR A WHILE WE DIDN'T HAVE CARDS, BUT I'LL
14 CHECK INTO IT FOR YOU, SINCE I'M GOING TO BE UP THERE. BUT I
15 THINK THAT WAS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY OPENED MY EYES
16 THAT IT REALLY TOOK PEOPLE WHO ARE USING THE SERVICE TO TALK -
17 - PEOPLE HAD NO IDEA. I MEAN, THEY WERE JUST GOB SMACKED THAT
18 THEY COULD USE ONE CARD TO GET THEMSELVES ANYWHERE THEY WANTED
19 AND TAKE ANY FORM OF TRANSIT. WE WOULD START PINGING OFF EACH
20 OTHER, OH YEAH YOU CAN TAKE THE FERRY, YOU CAN TAKE THIS, AND
21 IT KNOWS, BECAUSE IT'S YOUR CARD, WHAT KIND OF DISCOUNTS YOU
22 GET. SO THAT WAS A REALLY POSITIVE THING.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WAS THAT VICE CHAIR BALDINI
25 WITH HIS HAND RAISED?



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES. THANKS VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MICHAEL, YOU HAVE TO MUTE YOUR OTHER
5 COMPUTER.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** OKAY.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** JUST MUTE YOUR COMPUTER YOU AUDIO. YOUR
10 LAPTOP AUDIO, OR YOUR PHONE. GOOD TO GO? VICE-VERSA. TURN THE
11 VOLUME ON YOUR PHONE DOWN. AND TALK INTO YOUR PHONE. I'M GOING
12 COME BACK TO HIM? YEAH.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I'M HAPPY TO SHARE MY REMARKS IF WE'RE
15 WAITING FOR VICE CHAIR BALDINI. THERE WAS A LOT OF VERY VALID
16 CONCERN, CONVERSATIONS, AND COMMENTS MADE. AND ONE OF THE
17 THINGS THAT I PICKED UP ON IS THAT COMMUNICATION IS SO
18 IMPORTANT. VOTERS VALUE TRANSPARENCIES. I THINK OUR COMMUNITY
19 CAN AGREE THAT WE JUST VALUE KNOWING WHAT IT IS THAT OUR
20 GOVERNMENTS ARE DOING WITH OUR HARD EARNED DOLLARS. AND PEOPLE
21 WANT TO SEE TANGIBLE LOCAL CHANGES TO THEIR TRANSPORTATION
22 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT WE CAN AGREE THAT
23 THAT LOOKS -- THAT CAN LACK LIKE A LOT OF DIFFERENT KINDS OF
24 PROJECTS. BUT I THINK WE DO NEED TO REALLY EMPHASIZE UNIFYING
25 OUR SYSTEM AND THROUGH THAT, OUR COMMUNITIES, CLIPPER BAY PASS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 IS A WONDERFUL TUNED FOR THAT. AND OUR -- I THINK AT THE HEART
2 OF THIS, WHAT I DON'T WANT US TO FORGET, AS WE'RE SHAPING THIS
3 LEGISLATION, IS THAT TRANSPORTATION DOESN'T WORK IN A SILO.
4 IT'S PART OF OUR NEIGHBORS. IT'S PART OF OUR COMMUNITY
5 INFRASTRUCTURE. IT'S A CORE PART OF OUR ECONOMY, WE NEED IT
6 FOR US SO WE CAN GET TO SCHOOL, GET TO WORK, WE CAN GO
7 RECREATE NOT JUST IN OUR BACKYARDS BUT IN THIS BEAUTIFUL
8 REGIONAL LANDSCAPE AND PLAYGROUND THAT WE ARE SO FORTUNATE TO
9 LIVE IN AND BE A PART OF. I WANT TO SHARE JUST A COUPLE OF
10 QUICK EXAMPLES OF HOW I HAVE BEEN LOOKING AT TRANSPORTATION,
11 JUST IN MY OWN PERSONAL LIFE. I WAS TRAVELING IN ANOTHER STATE
12 THAT HAS GREAT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE, BUT EVEN
13 WITH A GROUP OF FOUR PEOPLE, WE STILL CHOSE RIDE-SHARE OVER
14 PUBLIC TRANSIT, BECAUSE WHEN IT CAME TO COST, WHEN IT CAME TO
15 TIME, RIDE-SHARE WAS JUST A BETTER OPTION FOR US. AND WHEN I
16 THINK ABOUT WHAT'S COMING DOWN THE PIKE FOR US, 2026 IS GOING
17 TO BE A BIG YEAR, NOT JUST BECAUSE OF AN OPPORTUNITY WITH A
18 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ON THE BALLOT, BUT WE ALSO
19 HAVE A HUGE EVENT THAT'S GOING TO BRING IN PEOPLE FROM ACROSS
20 THE GLOBE TO NOT JUST SOUTH BAY, BUT THE BAY AREA REGION. AND,
21 SO, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING WHAT WE CAN DO TO
22 MAKE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE A PART OF THAT
23 CONVERSATION, AND I'M TALKING ABOUT THE PEOPLE WORLD CUP. I
24 KNOW THAT'S GOING TO BE A HUGE ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY TO BOOST
25 THE BAY AREA REGION AND AS SOMEONE WHO LIVES IN SOUTH BAY AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 WANTS TO TRAVEL TO SONOMA IN MAY FOR YOUR SISTER'S BIRTHDAY,
2 THEY'RE LEAVING AT 7:00 A.M. AND I HAVE TO BE IN SOUTH BAY
3 UNTIL NOON SO I THOUGHT WHAT WOULD IT TAKE FOR ME TO COMMUTE
4 UP VIA TO SONOMA. IT'S A FOUR-HOUR TRANSIT JOURNEY ON NO LESS
5 THAN FOUR DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND FIVE DIFFERENT
6 LINES. AND, SO, IT'S -- IT'S ABOUT MORE THAN JUST GETTING
7 PEOPLE TO WORK AND SCHOOL IT'S ABOUT USING TRANSIT AS AN
8 OPPORTUNITY TO BOOST LOCAL ECONOMIES. AND I THINK THAT'S PART
9 OF THE CONVERSATION AND PART OF THE COMMUNICATION STRATEGY
10 THAT WE NEED TO HAVE TO ENSURE THAT VOTERS, WHETHER IT'S
11 EVERYDAY WORKERS, SENIORS, AND OUR COMMUNITY LEADERS THAT
12 WE'RE ALL SEEING THE NECESSITY AND THE URGENCY, BECAUSE THIS
13 IS NOT A NICE TO HAVE, IT'S A SOLUTION THAT WE CAN'T AFFORD TO
14 LOSE. AND I WILL JUST SHARE MY THOUGHTS ABOUT THE REVENUE
15 SOURCE. BECAUSE I AM CONCERNED ABOUT A REGRESSIVE SALES TAX
16 MEASURE THAT IS GONNA REALLY HURT EVERYDAY WORKING PEOPLE WHO
17 REALLY DO MAKE UP THE MAJORITY OF OUR COMMUNITY AND OUR
18 POPULATION, AND OUR VOTER BASE. SO, I HOPE THAT WE CAN
19 CONTINUE LOOKING AT THE MORE PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES, LIKE
20 A PAYROLL TAX, LIKE AN INCOME TAX, AND FIND WAYS TO
21 COMMUNICATE HOW THAT IS GOING TO, YOU KNOW, MAKE IT EASIER FOR
22 US TO HAVE THE THINGS THAT WE SHOULD ALREADY HAVE IN PLACE,
23 BUT WE'RE GONNA CONTINUE TO GO TO OUR COMMUNITY, CONTINUE TO
24 ASK FOR SUPPORT TO MAKE SURE WE GET WHERE WE WANT TO BE. AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 SO MY QUESTION IS, IN THE RECENT POLLING, WHAT WERE THE
2 VOTER'S THOUGHTS ABOUT THE POTENTIAL SOURCES OF FUNDING?

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. SO, WE -- WE DID WHAT'S
5 CALLED A SPLIT SAMPLE IN THE MOST RECENT POLL WHERE, YOU KNOW,
6 OUR POLLSTER ADVISED YOU DON'T WANT TO ASK SOMEBODY
7 SUCCESSIVELY, DO YOU LIKE THIS TYPE OF TAX OPTION, DO YOU LIKE
8 THIS ONE. SO EACH VOTER HEARD ABOUT A DIFFERENT BALLOT
9 QUESTION WITH A DIFFERENT REVENUE OPTION, SO WE POLLED PAYROLL
10 TAX, INCOME TAX, BECAUSE THOSE FELT LIKE THE ONES THAT HAD THE
11 LOWEST TAX RATE AND POTENTIAL TO GENERATE THE LARGEST AMOUNT
12 OF REVENUE AND THEY WERE ALL AROUND THE SAME. AND ACTUALLY
13 AFTER SOME PRO AND CON ARGUMENTS, THE INCOME TAX FELL TO THE
14 LOWEST WHICH WAS SURPRISING. AND I SHOULD CLARIFY THAT UNLIKE
15 A RECENT POLL, THAT WAS A VERY SMALL SAMPLE SIZE, BUT
16 CONDUCTED BY SEAMLESS BAY AREA WHICH WAS EXPLICIT, THAT IT WAS
17 A HIGHER INCOME EARNER INCOME TAX THIS WAS ACROSS THE BOARD
18 SPECIFIED A CERTAIN RATE SO IT'S A FLAT TAX A SMALL 17% OR
19 SOMETHING. LOWEST, THEY CAME CLOSE TO 50%, NONE WERE ANYTHING
20 CLOSE TO 2/3. AND, AGAIN, PAYROLL AND SALES TAX WERE ABOUT THE
21 SAME.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND I DO RECALL SEEING
24 SOMEWHERE ON THE INTERNET ABOUT A HIGH POLLING, HIGH INCOME
25 TAX, AND I WAS VERY OPTIMISTIC ABOUT THAT. SO, I JUST HOPE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THAT WE CAN LEAN INTO REVENUE SOURCES THAT AREN'T GOING TO TAX
2 OUR VERY HARDWORKING INDIVIDUALS WHO ARE ALREADY STRUGGLING TO
3 PAY FOR HOUSING, STRUGGLING TO PAY FOR FOOD. AND SOMETIMES NOT
4 EVEN HAVING A LITTLE EXTRA FOR RECREATION. AND, YOU KNOW, THE
5 THINGS THAT MAKE LIFE TRULY JOYFUL. SO, I HOPE THAT WE CAN SEE
6 THOSE THOUGHTS REFLECTED IN THE REVENUE OPTIONS, AND I LISTEN
7 TO WHAT I HEARD OTHER COLLEAGUES ON THE COUNCIL MENTION THAT'S
8 IMPORTANT TO THEM, THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING INTO OUR
9 COMMUNITIES AND ASKING FOR THEIR SUPPORT. AND I WILL SEE IF
10 VICE CHAIR BALDINI, ARE YOU ABLE TO SHARE YOUR COMMENTS NOW?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** I HAVE SHUT EVERYTHING DOWN. SO --

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** IT SOUNDS GOOD. YEAH. GO AHEAD.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** WELL -- [AUDIO DISTORTION]
17 [INDISCERNIBLE] IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD -- IT JUST DOESN'T MAKE
18 SENSE FOR CREDIT CARD INTEREST RATES IN 40 YEARS RIGHT NOW --
19 WORKING CLASS AND AT 20% THAT'S A -- THAT'S NOT GOING TO GO
20 AWAY. SO WE HAVE TO TIGHTEN UP OUR BELT, AND WE HAVEN'T SEEN
21 THAT IN THE -- AND THAT HASN'T BEEN DEMONSTRATED TO THE
22 VOTERS, AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO SEE A RETURN TO SOURCE A
23 LITTLE DIFFERENT. BECAUSE THE NORTH BAY, SOLANO, NAPA, SONOMA,
24 MARIN COUNTY WILL ALWAYS BE IN THE BACK WATERS OF THE REST OF
25 THE BAY AREA. WE NEED TO BE A PART OF THIS NINE COUNTY BAY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 AREA. WE NEED TO BE INTEGRATED INTO A HUGE DEGREE. IN MY
2 FRUSTRATION, COUNCIL MEMBERS POINTED OUT, IT TAKES US FOREVER
3 TO DO ANYTHING. THEY JUST WENT TEN MILES IN TWO YEARS AND NINE
4 MONTHS OVER THE UK, THEY BUILT THE EM BUYER STATE BUILDING IN
5 A YEAR AND HOOVER DAM IN FIVE YEARS AND WE CAN'T DO ANYTHING
6 OVER THE COURSE OF A GENERATION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WILL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE
9 WERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH
10 THIS ITEM AND IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON
11 THIS ITEM PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR
12 NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR
13 THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN-
17 PERSON AND IN ZOOM WHO WISHES TO SPEAK I'M GOING TO GO WITH
18 ALETA DUPREE FIRST. GO AHEAD YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CAMPOS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR
21 THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. LET'S OF IMPORTANT
22 THINGS. I'M WITH YOU. I WOULD LIKE THIS TO PASS. I CAN'T VOTE
23 FOR IT BECAUSE I DON'T LIVE HERE ALL THE TIME. I LIVE
24 SOMEWHERE ELSE. BUT YES I WANT TRANSIT TO BE HERE FOR ME WHEN
25 I AM HERE. AND I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE BEST WAY TO CAPTURE THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 REVENUE IS. I MEAN, THE GROUP THAT BROUGHT THE CALTRAIN
2 MEASURE FORWARD HAD A REALLY GOOD PLAYBOOK. AND WE'RE ABLE TO
3 GET THE 1/8 CENT CALTRAIN TAX PASSED. AND I SUPPORTED THAT AND
4 I WENT TO MEETING AFTER MEETING TALK BY THE TIME CALTRAIN
5 MEASURE. WE DON'T HAVE THE HIGHEST SALES TAX IN AMERICA. I
6 THINK IN CHICAGO IT'S 11%. WE HAVE SOME ROOM. AND CHICAGO
7 REALLY DOES FUND THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEM, ESPECIALLY THE L. I'M
8 NOT A BIG FAN OF AN INCOME TAX. I'M NOT KEEN THAT NEW YORK
9 CITY HAS ITS OWN INCOME TAX. IT'S VERY EXPENSIVE TO LIVE IN
10 NEW YORK CITY. SO, I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE RIGHT PLAYBOOK IS.
11 WE'RE TRYING TO GET SUGGESTION PRICING OVER THE LINE IN NEW
12 YORK CITY. THAT MIGHT BE AN OPTION SOME DAY HERE, BUT IT'S A
13 LONG WAY OFF. I KNOW PEOPLE ARE TIRED OF SALES TAX. MAYBE WE
14 SHOULD THINK ABOUT A HOTEL TAX. WE DON'T TAX FOOD. SO, WE
15 CAN'T REALLY CAPTURE THAT AND I'M NOT SAYING THAT WE SHOULD
16 TAX FOOD. WE COULD HAVE A WHOLE BUNCH OF DIFFERENT ITEMS, BUT
17 IF ALL THOSE ITEMS DON'T BRING YOU VERY MUCH, THEN WE'RE NOT
18 REALLY CAPTURING THE DEEP BASE OF MONEY THAT WE HOPE IS OUT
19 THERE, OR TRYING TO GET THE BRIDGE TOLL OVER THE LINE TOO. BUT
20 IT'S GOING TO COME DOWN TO MESSAGING AND CONVINCING PEOPLE
21 THAT TRANSIT NON-USERS CAN BENEFIT TOO. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND THEN THERE IS ONE SPEAKER IN ZOOM.
24 WARREN CUSHMAN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO
25 MINUTES.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COUNCIL MEMBERS. THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN NOT
3 SPEAKING IN-PERSON TODAY. WITH REGARD TO THE MEASURE, THE
4 FIRST THING IS I THINK WE NEED TO FOCUS ON A TRANSIT ORIENTED
5 MEASURE. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON A TRANSIT ORIENTED MEASURE THAT
6 EMPHASIZES NOT ONLY THE RAIL OPTIONS LIKE BART AND MUNI AND
7 VTA, BUT, ALSO BUSES. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON MORE SUPPORT FOR
8 BUSES. WE NEED MORE SUPPORT FOR PARATRANSIT. WE NEED MORE
9 SUPPORT FOR PEDESTRIAN ACCESS AND PEDESTRIAN FEATURES, LIKE
10 AUDIBLE PEDESTRIAN SIGNALS DETECT BE ABLE WARNINGS FOR FOLKS
11 WHO ARE BLIND, CURB CUTS, ALL OF THESE ISSUE UNDER TRANSIT
12 PUBLIC TRANSIT REALM SO I'M GOING TO STRONGLY ENCOURAGE
13 COUNCIL MEMBERS TO THINK OF THIS TRANSIT IN A TRANSIT WAY, I
14 UNDERSTAND THERE ARE PIECES AROUND ROADWAY MAINTENANCE AND
15 HIGHWAY WIDENINGS AND ALL THIS STUFF THAT FOLKS ARE TALKING
16 ABOUT, I DON'T DRIVE, MOST BLIND FOLKS DON'T DRIVE SO PUBLIC
17 TRANSIT IS IN BIG TROUBLE AFTER COVID WE'RE STILL NOWHERE NEAR
18 WHERE WE NEED TO BE AND I'M GOING TO SUPPORT BOTH TRANSIT
19 AGENCIES NEEDS AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION
20 PLAN PIECE WHICH COVERS PARATRANSIT WAYFINDING AND OTHER
21 DISABILITY FEATURES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF
24 THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION
2 AND WE ARE MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 7A EXPLORING PAST PROBLEM AND
3 FUTURE OF HIGHWAYS. WE HAVE DAVE VAUTIN TO PRESENT THIS ITEM
4 FOR INFORMATION TO THE COUNCIL.

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD MORNING. I'M DAVE VAUTIN, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR
7 OF MAJOR PLANS HERE AT MTC AND ABAG. WE'RE HAPPY TO BE HERE TO
8 SHARE A BIT MORE ON THE PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE OF OUR
9 LIMITED ACCESS HIGHWAY NETWORK, ALSO REFERRED TO AS OUR
10 FREEWAY NETWORK. BEFORE WE GET INTO THE SLIDE I WANT TO
11 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT NUMEROUS INTERNAL STAFF CONTRIBUTED TO THE
12 PRESENTATION, INCLUDING MY COLLEAGUES, BARBARA LOREN SON,
13 STEPHEN WOLF, ANUP TAPASE AND CHIRAG RABARI AND ADAM NOELTING.
14 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WHEN IT COMES TO REGIONAL MOBILITY MORE
15 THAN 70 MILLION VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED THAT OCCUR ON THE
16 VARIOUS HIGHWAY SYSTEMS EVERY DAY WHICH IS ABOUT HALF OF ALL
17 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED IN OUR REGION OUR HIGHWAY SYSTEM
18 CONNECTS COMMUNITIES LARGE AND SMALL TO THE URBAN WORLD.
19 HIGHWAY NETWORK MOVES SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE \$1.6 TRILLION
20 IN GOODS STATEWIDE WITHIN AND BEYOND OUR REGION THE BAY AREA
21 HIGHWAY WAS BUILT DURING WORLD WAR II IN TANDEM WITH EMERGING
22 SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES AND MADE HIGHWAY NETWORK FOR BETTER OR
23 WORSE THE FUNDAMENTAL BACKBONE OF THE REGION'S TRANSPORTATION
24 SYSTEM. THE QUESTION IS PONDERING INVESTMENT IN OUR HIGHWAY
25 SYSTEM AND WHAT SHARE IS APPROPRIATE AND HOW BEST TO ALIGN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS WITH THE POLICY PRIORITIES OF TODAY AND
2 TOMORROW. IF WE COULD GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO FROM THE
3 2021 EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC PLAN TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050'S
4 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT, TOPIC OF HOW WE INVEST IN
5 HIGHWAYS IS NOT A NEW ONE TO THE COMMISSION OR TO MANY OF YOU.
6 IN THE LAST FEW YEARS WE HAVE DELVED INTO THIS THROUGH THE
7 ONGOING NEXT GENERATION BAY AREA FREEWAY STUDY IN PARTNERSHIP
8 WITH CALTRANS, COUNTY PARTNERS AND OTHERS THROUGHOUT THE
9 REGION SPARKING DIALOGUE ABOUT EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES TO
10 BETTER MANAGE OUR HIGHWAY DEMANDS AND MAKE HIGHWAYS MORE
11 SUSTAINABLE. TODAY'S PRESENTATION SEEKS TO WEAVE THESE THREADS
12 TOGETHER NOT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF A SINGLE PLAN PROJECT OR
13 INITIATIVE BUT FROM THE 30,000 FOOT LEVEL. HIGHWAYS ARE A
14 FOCUS THROUGH THE THIS YEAR WITH KEY DECISIONS RELATED TO
15 CONNECT BAY AREA, THE 2026 MEASURE, THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
16 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING PRIORITIES AND THE NEXT GENERATION
17 FREEWAYS STUDIES 10-YEAR IMPLEMENTATION ROADMAP ALL SLATED FOR
18 THE MONTH AHEAD. BUT FIRST WE WANT TO ZOOM OUT AND TALK ABOUT
19 THE PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE OF BAY AREA HIGHWAYS. NEXT SLIDE
20 PLEASE. STARTING WITH THE PAST, IT IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO
21 ACKNOWLEDGE THE LEGACY OF 20th CENTURY HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS
22 THAT ARE STILL BEING FELT TODAY. HIGHWAYS ACROSS THIS COUNTRY
23 -- AND THE BAY AREA IS NO EXCEPTION TO THIS -- DEEP AND SOCIAL
24 INEQUITIES AND DISPROPORTIONATELY BURDENED PLAQUE AND BROWN
25 COMMUNITIES LIKE THOSE SHOWN HERE IN WEST OAKLAND WITH THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 ADVERSE IMPACTS OF EMISSIONS NOISE AND TRAFFIC. DESPITE
2 HIGHWAY'S AIM OF BETTER CONNECTING CITIES, SUBURBS AND REGIONS
3 TO ENABLE ECONOMIC GROWTH, THRIVING URBAN NEIGHBORHOODS WERE
4 DIVIDED AND HOLLOVED OUT BY THESE INVESTMENTS. IN THE DECADES
5 SINCE THE CONTINUED BUILD-OUT OF GENERAL PURPOSE LANES HAS
6 PROVIDED TEMPORARY CONGESTION RELIEF, WITH BAY AREA COMMUTE
7 TIMES HOLDING OR STEADY OR GROWING DESPITE THOSE INVESTMENTS.
8 IN THE MEANTIME EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS WERE HAND OR
9 CONTINUE TO BE HARMED BY EXTERNALITIES OF OUR HIGHWAY SYSTEM
10 AND OUR OFTEN SIMULTANEOUSLY DEPOSIT ON TODAY GIVEN DISPERSED
11 LAP USE PATTERNS SELECT SITUATIONS LIKE INTERSTATE 980 OAKLAND
12 US 101 SAN FRANCISCO THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO REMEDIATE THOSE
13 FORMS BY REMOVING HIGHWAY ITSELF BUT ACKNOWLEDGE PARTS OF THE
14 HIGHWAYS ARE LIKELY TO REMAIN IN PLACE. DOESN'T MEAN WE DON'T
15 HAVE CHOICES TO MAKE IT WORK BETTER FOR TRAVELERS AS WELL AS
16 MODES IN COMMUNITIES THAT THEY PASS THROUGH TODAY.
17 CONSTRUCTION AND GENERAL PURPOSE WIDENING OF HIGHWAYS FIND 20
18 CENTURY WE HAVE A NEW REGIONAL VISION FOR THE 21st CENTURY. IN
19 THE LAST FEW DECADES THE BAY AREA HAS PIVOTED AWAY FROM
20 GENERAL PERMANENT HIGHWAY WIDENING AND HAS DIVERSE
21 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. FOR EXAMPLE, PROJECTS LIKE SONOMA
22 NARROWS WHICH LEANED INTO CARPOOL LANES, RAPID TRANSIT LINES
23 EAST OAKLAND AND SAN FRANCISCO OR BART EXTENSIONS. BACK TO
24 2009 A PLAN KNOWN AS TRANSPORTATION 2035 WAS ADOPTED BY MTC
25 FOLLOWED BY CTC AUTHORIZATION THAT BUILT ON LEGACY OF CARPOOL



MARCH 22, 2024

1 LANE CONSTRUCTION IN EARLIER DECADES TO ADVANCE NETWORK OF
2 EXPRESS LANES INTO THE MIX LANE CONVERSIONS AND PRICED
3 CAPACITY THE SHIFT AWAY FROM HIGHWAY CAPACITY ACCELERATED UPON
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ADOPTED IN 2021 AND SHOWN HERE ON THE
5 SCREEN. THIS WAS INFLUENCED BY AMBITIOUS CLIMATE TARGETS SET
6 BY THE STATE. THIS CHART SHOWS HOW THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT
7 OF THE PLAN TALLING NEARLY \$6 BILLION WAS DIVIDED BETWEEN
8 DIFFERENT INVESTMENTS AND INE INVESTMENT PORTFOLIO DESIGNED TO
9 BE HIGHLY MULTI-MODAL ACHIEVED A GOAL OF 50% NON-AUTO COMMUTE
10 MODE SHARE BY 2050 EXPANSION PROJECTS LIKE EXPRESS LANES
11 INCLUDE WIDENING COMPONENTS AS WELL AS ARTERIAL WIDENING AND
12 THE LIKE ACCOUNT FOR 3% OF ALL FORECASTED FUTURE
13 TRANSPORTATION SPENDING GROWING THE ROAD NETWORK BY A MERE 2%
14 OVER THE NEXT THREE DECADES. REMAINING 97% OF TRANSPORTATION
15 EXPENDITURES WERE ENVISIONED TO GO TOWARDS CLIMATE NEUTRAL OR
16 CLIMATE FRIENDLY INVESTMENTS INCLUDING 19% TOWARD JUST
17 OPERATING AND MAINTAINING OUR EXISTING HIGHWAYS AND ARTERIALS,
18 AND A SUBSTANTIAL 70% TO OPERATE AND EXPAND OUR TRANSIT
19 SYSTEM. THE PLAN ENVISIONED A SERVICE EXPANSION OF TRANSIT
20 THAT WOULD DOUBLE PRECOVID TRANSIT LEVELS AND QUADRUPLE THE
21 AMOUNT OF BICYCLE INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE REGION. OF COURSE, ALL
22 OF THIS IS CONTINGENT ON NEW MONEYS INCLUDING SUCCESS AT THE
23 BALLOT BOX FOR OUR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, AS WELL AS
24 IMPLEMENTATION OF ROBUST PRICING STRATEGIES IT'S THE LOCAL,
25 REGIONAL, AND STATE LEVELS, MULTIPLE PRICING STRATEGIES ALL BY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 2035. SO, ULTIMATELY, THIS SETS A NORTH STAR FOR OUR REGION'S
2 TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES, BUT A PLAN IS JUST THAT. IT IS A
3 PLAN AND IT COMES DOWN TO DECISIONS EVERY YEAR FUNDING
4 PROGRAMS OLD AND NEW, LARGE AND SMALL TO MAKE SURE WE'RE
5 ALIGNING THOSE NEAR-TERM DECISIONS WITH THE LONG RANGE VISION.
6 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, LET'S DIG INTO THE DETAILS AND JUST
7 EXPLORE BRIEFLY WHAT TYPE OF HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS ARE BEING
8 ADVANCED IN THE BAY AREA TODAY. THE BULK OF THE INVESTMENTS
9 REALLY ARE FOCUSED ON CLIMATE NEUTRAL MAINTENANCE,
10 MODERNIZATION, AND SAFETY PROJECTS AS WE GRAPPLE WITH AN AGING
11 HIGHWAY SYSTEM PRIMARILY BUILT OUT IN THE POSTWAR DECADES. BUT
12 AS WE ACKNOWLEDGED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE THERE IS SOME NEW
13 CAPACITY AS WELL. CAPACITY INCREASES ON OUR HIGHWAY NETWORK
14 TODAY ARE PRIMARILY IN THE FORM OF EXPRESS LANES WHICH
15 CONSTITUTE HALF OF THE REGION'S NEAR-TERM ROAD EXPANSION
16 PROJECT PORTFOLIO IN TERMS OF DOLLARS. IN ADDITION, A NEW
17 GENERATION OF HIGHWAY PROJECTS HAS EMERGED IN RECENT YEARS
18 FROM RESILIENT 37 IN THE NORTH BAY TO INNOVATE 680 IN THE EAST
19 BAY. THESE PROJECTS OFTEN HAVE MULTI-MODAL COMPONENTS THAN IN
20 DECADES PAST AND INTEGRATE EMERGING POLICY GOALS LIKE
21 RESILIENCE AND EQUITY. THERE ARE CHALLENGES IN THIS HIGHWAY
22 SPACE. DECADES OF HIGHWAY AND ROAD PROJECTS REMAIN PARTIALLY
23 FUNDED, INCLUDING THROUGH VOTER APPROVED SALES TAX MEASURES.
24 PUBLIC AGENCIES OFTEN FEEL THE PRESSURE TO FOLLOW-THROUGH WITH
25 PAST VOTER COMMITMENTS DESPITE CHANGING PRIORITIES ON THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 LOCAL, REGIONAL, AND STATE LEVELS IN THE YEARS SINCE.
2 FURTHERMORE, STATE POLICIES HAVE CHANGED, AS WELL. SENATE BILL
3 743 REQUIRES PROJECTS TO MITIGATE THEIR ADVERSE IMPACTS FROM
4 ADDITIONAL DRIVING, AND THERE ARE NEW FUNDING FORMULA INFORMED
5 BY THE CAPTII PROGRAM AND ATTACHED TO SENATE BILL \$1 AND THIS
6 HAS CHANGED THE LANDSCAPE FOR THESE HIGHWAY PROJECTS
7 MITIGATIONS FOR HIGHWAY CAPACITY CAN ADD MILLIONS OR EVEN
8 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO PROJECT COST FOR EXAMPLE,
9 THE INNOVATE 680 PROJECT IN THE EAST BAY, THE VMT MITIGATION
10 STRATEGIES COST AS MUCH AS THE PROJECT ITSELF, DOUBLING THE
11 PRICE TAG. THIS IS A NEW PLANNING PARADIGM THAT HAS, AND I
12 THINK RIGHTFULLY SHOULD SPARK VALUABLE CONVERSATIONS ABOUT
13 HIGHWAY CAPACITY AND WHETHER TO PRIORITIZE STRATEGIES THAT MAY
14 EEK OUT MORE BEST BENEFITS FROM THE HIGHWAY CAPACITY THAT ARE
15 ALREADY ON THE GROUND TODAY. LOOKING TO THE FUTURE 2035 AND
16 BEYOND THE BAY AREA IS NOT ALONE LOS ANGELES BOSTON AND NEW
17 YORK CITY HAVE BEEN EXPLORING EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES THAT
18 TRY TO MOVE THE NEEDLE BEYOND WHAT'S POSSIBLE WITH EITHER
19 CAPACITY INCREASING OR CONVERSION TYPE EXPRESS LANES TO MAKE
20 MORE HEADWAY TOWARDS GOALS LIKE CONGESTION MANAGEMENT CLIMATE
21 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS THIS HAS BEEN CENTRAL TO THE WORKS IN THE
22 NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY OVERBROAD THE PAST TWO YEARS
23 SERVED CRITICAL TO COMMITMENT TO CARB AS PRIORITY STRATEGIES
24 ALLOWING THE REGION TO CONTINUE BEING ELIGIBLE FOR KEY SENATE
25 BILL ONE MONEYS THAT HAVE HELPED FUND IMPORTANT PROJECTS IN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THE REGION ONGOING WITH INTENT TO RELEASE FINAL REPORT LATER
2 THIS YEAR INCLUDING TEN YEAR IMPLEMENTATION ROADMAP
3 DELINEATING CRITICAL INTERMITTENT MILESTONES THAT WOULD BE
4 NECESSARY BEFORE ANY IMPLEMENTATION OF EXPANDED PRICING ON BAY
5 AREA HIGHWAYS. SO WE TALKED ABOUT THE HIGH-LEVEL OF PAST
6 PRESENT AND FUTURE HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS SPANNING QUITE A LARGE
7 CONTINUUM WE WANT TO FOCUS ON THE GENERAL SPECTRUM OF SIMPLE
8 PROJECT TYPES. OF COURSE, GENERAL LANE NEW CAPACITY PROJECTS
9 WERE COMMON THROUGHOUT THE 20th CENTURY. TODAY WE HAVE A MIX
10 OF EXPRESS LANE NEW CAPACITY AND EXPRESS LANE CONVERSION
11 PROJECTS. AND WE CONTINUE TO EXPLORE ALL LANE TOLLING AND
12 EQUIVALENT EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES OVER THE LONG-TERM.
13 WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED ABOUT THESE FOUR TYPES OF PROJECTS OVER
14 THE YEARS THROUGH OBSERVED EXPERIENCE, AS WELL AS THROUGH
15 PLANNING STUDIES? FIRST, IT'S IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
16 EVERY CORRIDOR IS UNIQUE, LAND USE CONTEXT FERRIES, TRAFFIC
17 PATTERNS FERRIES, AND ALL OF THAT. BUT IT'S POSSIBLE TO LOOK
18 AT THIS EXAMPLE OF A CONGESTED FREEWAY WITH THREE LANES TODAY
19 CREEPING ALONG AT RUSH HOUR. THESE PROJECT TYPES HELP
20 UNDERSTAND THE CHOICES THAT POLICY MAKERS FACE, WIDEN TO ADD
21 NEW CAPACITY OR USE EXISTING CAPACITY DIFFERENTLY. SO WE'RE
22 GOING TO DIG INTO OF FOUR TYPOLOGIES THROUGH KEY PLANNING
23 LENSES. NEXT SLIDE. WE RECOGNIZE THAT THIS IS NOT AN
24 EXHAUSTIVE LIST OF PLANNING OBJECTIVES BUT IT CAPTURES AN
25 INTERESTING SPECTRUM OF TOPICS IN THE MORE TRADITIONAL



MARCH 22, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION FOCUS AREAS OF RELIABILITY AND MOBILITY TO
2 NEWER PRIORITIES LIKE CLIMATE, TRANSIT, AND AFFORDABILITY, AS
3 WELL. WE'RE GOING TO LOOK AT THESE FIVE QUESTIONS FOR THE
4 DIFFERENCE PROJECT TYPES. RELIABLE TRAVEL TIMES WHEN TRAVELERS
5 NEED IT MOST, DOES THE CORRIDOR HELP MAXIMIZE THE NUMBER OF
6 PEOPLE WHO CAN GET TO THEIR DESTINATIONS. DOES IT ALIGN WITH
7 STATE CLIMATE GOALS THAT REQUIRES REDUCTIONS IN MILES DRIVEN
8 DOES IT REGROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP WHILE PROVIDING EQUITABLE
9 ACCESS? SO TRAVELERS CAN GET TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO
10 AFFORDABLY. NEXT SLIDE. STARTING WITH RELIABLE, IT'S THE AREA
11 WHERE ONE OF THE MORE COMPELLING ARGUMENTS FOR THE EXPRESS
12 LANE NETWORK AS BUILT OUT TODAY. BECAUSE GENERAL PURPOSE
13 WIDENING TENDS TO PROVIDE FASTER SPEED AND TRAVEL TIMES ONLY
14 OVER SHORT TO MEDIUM TERM THOSE RELIABLE GAINS FROM GENERAL
15 PURPOSE CAPACITY ARE OFTEN MERELY TEMPORARY. CONVERSELY,
16 MANAGING ONE OR MORE LANES ALLOWS US TO SET A PRICE. THAT
17 PRICE HELPS TO ENSURE A CONSISTENT TRAVEL SPEED OF 45 MILES
18 PER HOUR OR BETTER FOR TRAVELERS IN THOSE LANES. AND THAT'S AN
19 INCENTIVE TO USE MODAL OPTIONS THAT CAN LEVERAGE THAT
20 FACILITY. FOR EXAMPLE, IN 2023, THE BAIFA CORRIDOR'S 880 AND
21 680, THEY HAVE 16 TOTAL TOLL ZONES. 14 OF THOSE ZONES MET THIS
22 RELIABILITY STANDARD 100% OF THE TIME WHICH IS AN EXAMPLE OF
23 THE SUCCESS OF THOSE LANES ACHIEVING RELIABILITY GOALS. WITH
24 EXPANDED PRICING, SUCH AS ALL LANE TOLLING, THERE IS POTENTIAL
25 TO PROVIDE THAT SAME RELIABILITY BENEFIT TO ALL HIGHWAY USERS.



MARCH 22, 2024

1 NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY FOUND WE COULD BRING DOWN TRAVEL
2 TIMES 10% REGION-WIDE AND ALLOW US TO PRESERVE TIME SAVINGS
3 OVER LONG-TERM, INCLUDING GOODS MOVEMENT, WHICH FOR MANY
4 TRUCKS, TIME EQUALS MONEY. NEXT SLIDE. TURNING TO MOBILITY.
5 THROUGHOUT THE 20th CENTURY HIGHWAY TRAFFIC ENGINEERS FOCUS ON
6 VEHICLE THROUGHPUT. THE GAUGE OF CORRIDOR CAPACITY. BUT WE
7 KNOW TODAY THAT THAT'S NOT THE RIGHT METRIC. THE SHARE OF
8 FOLKS USING CARPOOL OR TAKING TRANSIT CAN ALWAYS IMPROVE
9 MOBILITY IN A CORRIDOR THUS WE FOCUS ON PERSON THROUGHPUT IN
10 TODAY'S PRESENTATION. IN THROUGHPUT OF MANAGED LANES IS
11 SIGNIFICANT. JUST TO GIVE A ROUGH SENSE OF STATISTICS WE TAKE
12 THE CONCEPTUAL CORRIDOR. WITHOUT ANY OF THESE TREATMENT IT IS
13 MOVES ABOUT 4,000 PEOPLE AN HOUR. IF WE LOOK AT DIFFERENT
14 TYPES OF IMPROVEMENTS PROJECTS ON THE CORRIDOR WE FIND THAT A
15 GENERAL LANE OF NEW CAPACITY HAS THE SAME THROUGHPUT AS SIMPLY
16 CONVERTING AN EXISTING LANE TO AN EXPRESS LANE. FURTHER A NEW
17 CAPACITY EXPRESS LANE WHICH DOES ADD MORE POWER THROUGHPUT
18 POTENTIAL THAN A CONVERSION HAS ABOUT THE SAME BENEFIT AS JUST
19 TOLLING THE EXISTING LANES THAT ARE THERE TODAY. THE BOTTOM
20 LINE OF THIS SIMPLE GRAPHIC IS REALLY TO UNDERSCORE THAT IT'S
21 POSSIBLE TO ADVANCE MOBILITY GOALS WITHOUT ADDING ANY ASPHALT
22 TO THE ROAD. BUT THERE ARE REAL HEADWINDS TO ACHIEVING THESE
23 THEORETICAL GAINS, RANGING FROM INSUFFICIENT ENFORCEMENT, TO
24 PREFERENCE SHIFTS AWAY FROM CARPOOLING, AND AWAY FROM TRANSIT
25 IN RECENT YEARS AND DECADES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE EARLIER



MARCH 22, 2024

1 SLIDES HAVE REALLY SHOWN THAT EXPRESS LANES HAVE ACHIEVED SOME
2 NOTABLE SUCCESSES IN TRADITIONAL TRANSPORTATION ISSUE AREAS
3 LIKE RELIABILITY AND MOBILE. BUT WHEN WE TURN TO NEWER ISSUES
4 INCLUDING CLIMATE MAC IMPACTS THAT'S WHERE CHALLENGES BEGIN TO
5 EMERGE COMPARED TO COMPANIONING PRICING STRATEGIES LIKE ALL-
6 LANE TOLLING. WE HAVE LONG KNOW AND IDENTIFIED CAPACITY
7 INCREASING PROJECTS TEND TO INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED
8 AND IN TURN GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS AS FEATURED IN PAST ROUNDS OF
9 OUR PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT FOR NOW THREE DIFFERENT
10 CYCLES OF PLANNED BAY AREA. GIVEN STATE MANDATES TO DRIVE DOWN
11 GHG AND VMT WE RELEASED ANALYSIS IN FEBRUARY OF 2020 AS PART
12 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT INCLUDED DATA ON THE PROJECT
13 SCALE. THIS GRAPHIC HERE SHOWS THAT THE AUTHORIZED EXPRESS
14 LANES IN OUR REGION COULD INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED BY
15 OVER 1 MILLION MILES DAILY. THIS IS EQUIVALENT JUST ON A BROAD
16 HIGH-LEVEL SCALE TO THE COMBINED VMT REDUCTIONS FROM BART CORE
17 CAPACITY, BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO, CALTRAIN PORTAL,
18 VALLEY LINK, AND DUMBARTON RAIL COMBINED WHILE TRANSIT
19 INVESTMENT LANES CAN WORK TOGETHER ON OTHER SORTS OF MOBILITY
20 TRANSPORTATION GOALS LIKE MOBILITY, THEY ARE DIRECTLY AT ODDS
21 WHEN IT COMES TO VMT AND GHG SPACE. WE HAVE ALSO FOUND IN OUR
22 ANALYSIS THAT CONVERTING LANES TO EXPRESS LANES STILL YIELD
23 SOME INCREASE IN VMT, BUT TO A SMALLER DEGREE THAN AN
24 EXPANSION PROJECT. ONLY THROUGH EXPANSIVE PRICING STRATEGIES
25 LIKE ALL-LANE TOLLING DO WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO



MARCH 22, 2024

1 SIGNIFICANTLY SHIFT BEHAVIOR AND YIELD SUBSTANTIVE VMT
2 REDUCTIONS AND THAT STUDY HAS BEEN ONGOING OVER THE PAST FEW
3 YEARS. NEXT SLIDE. PRESENTING WITH THE DATA POINT, THE TOPIC
4 OF TRANSIT OFTEN COMES UP. IN CONTRAST TO GENERAL PURPOSE
5 WIDENING THAT OFTEN RISKS ENTICING EXISTING TRANSIT RIDERS
6 AWAY FROM BUSES AND TRAINS, EXPRESS LANES HAVE BEEN PITCHED,
7 SOMETIMES, AS CREATING OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. MOST
8 NOTABLY BY CREATING PRIORITY TREATMENT FOR EXPRESS BUSES THAT
9 MAY OR MAY NOT EXIST TODAY. HOWEVER, CHALLENGES EXIST HERE,
10 BOTH IN TERMS OF SUPPLY AND DEMAND. IN MANY EXPRESS LANE
11 CORRIDORS, EXISTING EXPRESS BUS SERVICES ARE LIMITED OR NON-
12 EXISTENT, RESULT -- YOU KNOW, TODAY EXPRESS BUS RIDERSHIP ON
13 OUR HIGHWAY SYSTEM BEINGS FOR LESS THAN 3% OF ALL TRANSIT
14 BOARDINGS IN THE REGION AS IDENTIFIED IN OUR TRANSIT 2050+
15 INITIATIVE. AND IN TERMS OF DEMAND PAST ANALYSIS INCLUDING THE
16 REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS NETWORK AS PROPOSED DURING THE PLANNED
17 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS PROCESS INDICATED THAT ROBUST FREQUENT
18 EXPRESS BUS SERVICES ON MANY OF THE EXPRESS LANE CORRIDORS
19 WOULD STRUGGLE TO GENERATE SUBSTANTIVE RIDERSHIP. THE OVERALL
20 EXPRESS BUS NETWORK HAD BENEFIT-COST RATIO OF LESS THAN 0.5.
21 WHY IS THIS? DUE TO GEOGRAPHY, HIGHWAY CORRIDORS TEND TO BE
22 FULL OF AUTO ORIENTED PEDESTRIAN HOSTILE LAND USES AND MANY OF
23 OUR HIGHWAY CORRIDORS THAT DO HAVE THE RIGHT INGREDIENTS FOR
24 EXPRESS BUS ALREADY SEE HEAVY INVESTMENT IN RELIABLE RAIL
25 ALTERNATIVES BART RUNNING THROUGH THE LINE MEDIAN OR CALTRAIN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 SERVICE JUST A FEW MILES AWAY AND MANY OF THOSE SERVICES,
2 INSTEAD OF SERVING THE AUTO ORIENTED LAND USE GO DIRECT INTO
3 THE DOWNTOWN MORE WALKABLE PARTS OF THOSE COMMUNITIES.
4 FURTHERMORE THIS IS COMPOUNDED BY THE FACT THAT THE EXPRESS
5 LANES DESIGN DOES NOT ALWAYS HAVE TRANSIT PRIORITY FEATURES
6 THAT ARE CRITICAL. UNLESS PRICEY DIRECT ACCESS TRANSFER ARE
7 ADDED TO THE SCOPE ONLY LONG DISTANCE NON-STOP EXPRESS
8 SERVICES ARE ABLE TO MAKE THEIR WAY OVER THE LEFT MOST LANE
9 LEVERAGE THOSE BENEFITS AND THEN MOVE BACK OVER TO EXIT THE
10 OTHER OPPORTUNITIES LEARN FROM OTHER METRO AREAS THAT HAVE
11 EXPRESS BUS SPACE SUCH AS L.A. METRO, J LINE SHOWN HERE
12 IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER IS IN THESE CORRIDORS MANY PEOPLE DON'T
13 WANT TO START THEIR JOURNEY OR END AT A PLACE THEY ARE TRYING
14 TO GET TO A PLACE. WHEN EXPRESS LANES START TO GENERATE
15 MEANINGFUL NET REVENUE THERE MAY BE OPPORTUNITIES TO REINVEST
16 IN TRANSIT NOW THAT'S AN EXCITING OPPORTUNITIES THAT COULD BE
17 EXPANDED IN PRICING COVERED MORE LANES WHICH GENERATE
18 SUBSTANTIVE SIGNIFICANTLY MORE REVENUE. SO, WHILE EXPRESS BUS
19 EXPANSION IS OFTEN ELEVATED AS SILVER BULLET TO EXPRESS LANE
20 SYSTEMS ADVERSE CLIMATE IMPACTS, IT'S IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER
21 WHETHER THIS IS THE HIGHER AND BEST USE OF TRANSIT DOLLARS. IN
22 OTHER WORDS, ARE WE TRYING TO MITIGATE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS
23 INSIDE THE HIGHWAY CORRIDOR OR IN THE BROADER COMMUNITY THAT
24 IT SERVES? NEXT SLIDE. LAST BUT NOT LEAST, GO TO THE NEXT
25 SLIDE, PLEASE. LAST BUT NOT LEAST, AFFORDABILITY HAS BEEN VERY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CENTRAL TO THE CONCERNS ELEVATED BY BAY AREA RESIDENTS TODAY,
2 ALONG WITH CRIME AND HOMELESSNESS, WE SEE THIS IN THE POLLING.
3 NONE OF THESE HIGHWAY INVESTMENT TYPES DO ANYTHING TO MAKE
4 HEADWAY ON THAT CHALLENGE AS INDICATED BY SCORES ON THE RIGHT
5 SIDE. WE CAN MINIMIZE BURDENS, WE HAVE EXPLORED THINGS LIKE
6 TOLL DISCOUNTS AND CAPS. WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS CONCERN
7 THAT'S CENTRAL TO WHAT OUR REGION IS FACING TODAY IS IMPACTING
8 PUBLIC PERCEPTION OF ANY OF THESE HIGHWAY INVESTMENT TYPES.
9 THERE ARE NEAR-TERM EFFORTS LIKE THE I-880 EXPRESS LANES START
10 PROGRAM AS WELL AS AFFORDABILITY PILOTS ALONG 101 IN SAN MATEO
11 COUNTY THESE ARE CRITICAL FIRST STEPS BUT IT IS IMPORTANT TO
12 REALLY THINK THROUGH HOW THIS CENTRAL ISSUE CAN BE INTEGRATED
13 AND WOVEN IN, AND WILL CONTINUE TO BE A KEY AREA OF FOCUS IN
14 THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD. NEXT SLIDE. SO JUST TO CLOSE
15 THINGS OUT, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES SOME OF THE KEY TAKEAWAYS OF
16 TODAY'S PRESENTATION. AND AT THE END OF THE DAY WE RECOGNIZE
17 THAT WHEN IT COMES TO THESE POLICY TRADEOFF THERE IS NO SINGLE
18 RIGHT ANSWER ABOUT HOW TO BEST INVEST IN THE HIGHWAY SYSTEM
19 IT'S ABOUT TRADEOFFS AND PRIORITIZATION THAT ARE CORE. THE
20 CAPACITY PROJECTS CAN ADVANCE MOBILITY AND RELIABILITY GOALS
21 BUT THEY COME AT HIGH CAPITAL COST AS WELL AS SIGNIFICANT
22 CLIMATE IMPACT. AT THE OTHER END OF THE SPECTRUM WE HAVE
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO LEVERAGE EXISTING CAPACITY TO BOOST PERSON
24 THROUGHPUT TO BETTER ADVANCE CLIMATE AND TRANSIT GOALS AT A
25 LOWER COST, BUT IT RISKS CREATING NEW COST BURDENS FOR



MARCH 22, 2024

1 DRIVERS. THIS ANALYSIS IS HIGH-LEVEL AND THERE ARE MANY UNIQUE
2 CIRCUMSTANCES WITHIN THE REGION BUT HOPEFULLY IT ILLUSTRATES
3 MORE WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED TO DATE ON THIS TOPIC BUT WE WANT TO
4 RECOGNIZE THAT FURTHER QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS ARE COMING IN THE
5 MONTH AHEAD BOTH IN NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS ROUND TWO WORK AS
6 WELL AS THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. THIS WILL DOLLARS
7 ADDITIONAL DATA AT THE CORRIDOR SCALE. NEXT SLIDE. TO WRAP
8 THINGS UP TODAY I WANT TO SHARE A COUPLE OF FINAL OBSERVATIONS
9 AS THIS PRESENTED ITSELF INDICATES THE STATE IS PUSHING
10 REGIONS TO GRAPPLE WITH HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS TRADEOFFS AND
11 MITIGATING THE ADVERSE IMPACTS OF LEGACY PROJECTS THIS ISN'T
12 SO SIMPLE WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT FINANCIAL CONSTRAINTS IF WE HAD
13 INFINITE MONEY ANY OF THOSE CHARGES CAN BE MITIGATED BUT
14 THAT'S NOT THE WORLD WE LIVE IN THERE ARE REAL OPPORTUNITY
15 COSTS, INVESTING IN TRANSIT ALONG THE HIGHWAY CORRIDORS OUR
16 ANALYSIS IS FINE THAT FOUND THAT THIS DOES NOT GUARANTEE MODE
17 SHIFT WILL OCCUR. BUT THE MORE EXPANSIVE THE PRICING STRATEGY
18 IS, THE OPPORTUNITY WHERE REINVESTMENT. THIRD, OPTIMIZING
19 EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE RATHER THAN BUILDING NEW CAPACITY HELP
20 NEAR TERM GOALS CAN REMAIN RELEVANT IN THE FUTURE. FINALLY,
21 REDUCE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE FORECASTS IN PLANNED BAY AREA
22 2050+ COMPOUND OUR CHALLENGES HERE. IT WILL REQUIRE MORE
23 CHALLENGING TRADE-OFFS THAN PAST PLANNING CYCLES, INCLUDING
24 FOR HIGHWAY PROJECTS WHICH ARE NO EXCEPTION. SO AS WE FACE A
25 MORE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED WORLD THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO THINK



MARCH 22, 2024

1 ABOUT RELATIVE PRIORITIES IN THIS SPACE AND OTHERS. NEXT
2 SLIDE. SO, THANKS FOR YOUR TIME THIS MORNING AND GIVEN THE
3 LENGTH OF THIS PRESENTATION WE LAID OUT THREE DISCUSSION
4 QUESTIONS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION, INCLUDING THIS QUESTION OF
5 PRIORITIZATION, NEAR-TERM VERSUS LONG-TERM; THOUGHTS ON BEST
6 WAY TO RECONCILE THE LEGACY PIPELINE OF PROJECTS, AN OPTION
7 WHICH MAY REQUIRE COSTLY MITIGATIONS; AND THE QUESTION OF
8 REALLY HOW BEST TO MITIGATE THESE HIGHWAY PROJECTS IN TERMS OF
9 OUR MODAL OPTIONS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME THIS MORNING AND
10 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS OR THOUGHTS.

11

12 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE YOU
13 LAYING OUT THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE FOR US TO ANSWER IN THE
14 SPECIFIC ELEMENTS YOU WOULD LIKE OUR COMMENTS ON. SO, COUNCIL,
15 WHEN WE ARE READY TO START OUR COMMENTS, I'M GOING TO START ON
16 MY LEFT-HAND SIDE WITH GABRIEL AND THEN VINAY.

17

18 **GABRIEL GORDO:** THANK YOU. GREAT PRESENTATION. THANK YOU. AND
19 LIKE THE CHAIR SAID, APPRECIATE THE QUESTIONS AT THE END. I
20 HOPE THAT MORE PRESENTATIONS WILL KIND OF INCLUDE THOSE
21 DISCUSSION QUESTIONS. THAT WAS GREAT. I JUST WANT TO NOTE THAT
22 ON THE RELIABILITY SLIDE, IT WAS NOTED WITH THE ALL-LANE
23 TOLLING THERE WAS 10% GAIN IN REDUCED TRAVEL TIME. WHILE
24 THAT'S NOTHING TO SCOFF AT IT DOESN'T STRIKE ME AS A
25 CONVINCING SLAM DUNK IN FAVOR OF ALL-LANE TOLLING, ESPECIALLY



MARCH 22, 2024

1 FOR HOW POLITICALLY CHALLENGING, POTENTIALLY REGRESSIVE, AND
2 INEQUITABLE AND DIVISIVE ALL-LANE TOLLING COULD BE. IT SEEMS
3 TO ME THAT BASED ON THE SLIDE THE INITIAL ASSESSMENT THAT
4 EXPRESS LANE CONVERSION SEEMS TO BE THE BEST OR AT LEAST
5 CONSISTENTLY LEAST BAD OPTION IT SEEMS COST EFFECTIVE SEEMS TO
6 GENERATE RELIABILITY AND DOESN'T COMPLETELY RUIN US
7 ENVIRONMENTALLY. ON YOUR DISCUSSION QUESTIONS IN TERMS OF
8 MANAGING TRADE-OFFS IT SEEMS LIKE SCORING BASED ON THE METRICS
9 PROPOSED IN THE SLIDES, RELIABILITY, CLIMATE, ET CETERA, SEEMS
10 LIKE A GOOD WAY TO GO, AND POSSIBLY CONSIDERING EQUITY AS A
11 MEASURE. I THINK THAT AFFORDABILITY WAS KIND OF TYING INTO
12 THAT A LITTLE BIT. USING EQUITY, LIKE AS ITS OWN MEASURE SEEMS
13 TO BE PRUDENT. ON RECONCILING PARTIALLY FUNDED PROJECTS,
14 DESPITE COSTLY MITIGATION, PRIORITIZING VOTER APPROVED
15 PROJECTS BASED ON COST EFFECTIVENESS, HOW MUCH BANG WE'RE
16 GETTING FOR OUR BUCK, I'M NOT NECESSARILY OPPOSED TO EXPENSIVE
17 MITIGATIONS IF THE IMPACT WOULD BE TREMENDOUS. AND THEN,
18 LASTLY, ON WHERE MITIGATIONS ARE REQUIRED, PREFERENCES FOR
19 HIGHWAY INVESTING, VERSUS INVESTING IN NEARBY COMMUNITIES,
20 PERSONALLY, IT'S -- I WOULD SAY THAT A PREFERENCE FOR
21 INVESTING IN NEARBY COMMUNITIES, ESPECIALLY IF THEY'RE IN
22 EQUITY PRIORITY AREAS WOULD BE PRUDENT OTHERWISE INVESTING IN
23 OUR HIGHWAYS, AS WE HAD THE DISCUSSION PREVIOUSLY ON THE
24 PREVIOUS ITEM, THERE IS A LOT OF DESIRE TO CONTINUE INVESTING



MARCH 22, 2024

1 IN OUR HIGHWAYS, AND WE CAN'T IGNORE THOSE DESIRES EITHER.

2 THAT'S THE EXTENT OF MY COMMENTS.

3

4 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES, SO, I JUST WANT TO POINT OUT ONE OR TWO
5 THINGS. SO, YOU DO POINT OUT ABOUT THE TIME THAT IT TAKES FOR
6 PEOPLE TO GET TO WORK AND GET BACK AND THAT SAVING THIS TIME
7 IS IMPORTANT. ONE OF THE THINGS I FIND IS SOMEWHAT A LITTLE
8 DISSATISFYING, SOMETIMES IS THAT THE VALUE OF THAT TIME IS
9 NEVER REALLY MONETIZED WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT IT. AND SO WHAT
10 HAPPENS IS, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE JUST HAVE THIS IDEA, FOR EXAMPLE,
11 WHEN YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT THE NEXGEN FREEWAY SYSTEM AND THE
12 POSSIBILITY OF TOLLING, PEOPLE JUST SEE THAT AS, OH, I'M GOING
13 TO SPEND TWO BUCKS EXTRA, AND I DON'T WANT TO SPEND THAT EXTRA
14 TWO BUCKS. YOU DON'T WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE FACT THAT, WELL,
15 AT THIS EXISTING RATE, IF YOU PUT IN TWO HOURS A DAY GOING
16 FROM HERE TO THERE AND AN HOUR OF THAT IS WASTED TIME, YOU ARE
17 BASICALLY TALKING ABOUT 250 HOURS A YEAR, EVEN AT A REALLY
18 MODEST RATE OF 20 BUCKS AN HOUR IS 5,000 BUCKS A YEAR THAT WE
19 ARE BASICALLY TAXING THEM BECAUSE OF OUR INEFFICIENCIES. AND
20 IF YOU REMOVE THOSE INEFFICIENCIES WITH TWO BUCKS, OR EVEN ARE
21 200 BUCKS, THAT'S A PRETTY GOOD DEAL. AND I JUST DON'T SEE
22 THAT ANGLE BEING PUSHED. AND IF YOU DON'T PUSH THE ANGLE, IT'S
23 JUST GOING TO BE HARD TO MARKET SOME OF THESE THINGS. I THINK
24 WE NEED TO REALLY MONETIZE THE VALUE OF THAT TIME. AND THE
25 SECOND THING I WANT TO SAY IS, YOU KNOW, THIS IS ME, OKAY, BUT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 -- AND I USED TO BE A SOFTWARE ENGINEER, AND, SO, THE THING
2 IS, FOR ME, IN THE FUTURE IS NOT REALLY -- I THINK BUSES ARE
3 GOING TO BE OBSOLETE, I THINK THE TRAINS WILL BE AROUND, BUT
4 WHAT WE'RE GOING TO GET IN THE FUTURE IS MAINLY VEHICLES THAT
5 ARE GOING TO HAVE ANYWHERE FROM 5 TO 15 OR 20 PEOPLE, AND WHO
6 ARE NOT GOING TO HAVE A DRIVER, AND THESE ARE GOING TO BE
7 BUSES. YOU KNOW, THE VEHICLES THAT ARE GOING TO BE LIKE UBER,
8 THEY'RE GOING TO GIVE YOU DOOR-TO-DOOR SERVICE. AND FOR
9 SOMETHING LIKE THAT, WE ARE GOING TO NEED GOOD ROADS. I MEAN,
10 THE ROADS -- THE KEY THING ABOUT THE ROADS IS THE MOST
11 DEVELOPED INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WE HAVE, IS THAT RIGHT NOW, IT'S
12 BEING USED INEFFICIENTLY BECAUSE WE HAVE SINGLE PERSON
13 VEHICLES, FOR THE MOST PART. ONCE WE SWITCH THAT TO, SAY, TEN
14 PERSON VEHICLE, 15% VEHICLES, THE ROADS ARE GOING TO BE A HUGE
15 ASSET, AND IT'S GOING TO MAKE WAY MORE SENSE. AND I'LL GIVE A
16 SIMPLE EXAMPLE AND THEN STOP. IF I NEED TO GO TO WHERE MY WIFE
17 GOES TO IN PLEASANT HILL, SOMEWHERE I LIVE, IF I GO PUBLIC
18 TRANSIT, IT'S GOING TO TAKE ME AT LEAST AN HOUR AND A HALF TO
19 TWO HOURS. SHE JUST GETS THERE IN OVER HALF HOUR BY CAR AND
20 THE POINT IS IT'S NEVER GOING TO BE WORTH IT TO HAVE A FIXED
21 SYSTEM GOING FROM WHERE I LIVE TO PLEASANT HILL BECAUSE THERE
22 IS JUST NOT GOING TO BE THE MARKET TO MAKE THAT ANYWHERE EVEN
23 REMOTELY VIABLE. WE HAVE THIS GREAT INFRASTRUCTURE, WE JUST
24 NEED TO USE IT BETTER. AND I THINK WE REALLY HAVE TO KEEP IN
25 MIND AND EMPHASIZE THAT THIS IS ACTUALLY GOING TO BE THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 INFRASTRUCTURE OF THE FUTURE. THIS IS WHAT'S GOING TO TAKE US
2 DOOR-TO-DOOR, IN AN ENVIRONMENTALLY EFFICIENT WAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY AND THEN GERRY.

5

6 **JOHNNY PARKER:** WE HAVE SOME CHALLENGES AHEAD OF US. I THINK
7 IT'S FRUSTRATING THAT WE, YOU KNOW, SOME ITEMS HAVE BEEN
8 BROUGHT FORWARD FOR VOTING, IT'S BEEN APPROVED, BUT IT'S
9 PARTIALLY FUNDED. THAT DOESN'T MAKE ANY SENSE. WHY IS IT
10 PARTIALLY FUNDED? IT SHOULD BE FULLY FUNDED. SO IT SEEMS LIKE
11 SOMETHING THAT, I GUESS IN THE FUTURE, WE WILL NEED TO
12 PROBABLY VOTE ON IT AGAIN. MAKE SURE IT'S THE RIGHT AMOUNT OF
13 FUNDING. ALSO QUESTION ABOUT HOW CRITICAL DO YOU BELIEVE IT IS
14 TO INVEST IN HIGHWAY VERSUS INVESTING IN NEARBY COMMUNITIES. L
15 GOT TO REMEMBER WE'RE A VERY UNIQUE AREA. YOU KNOW? SOME AREAS
16 ARE RURAL AND NEED ONE CONCENTRATION VERSUS THE OTHER. SO,
17 WHAT'S CRITICAL, BOTH ARE CRITICAL. IT SHOULDN'T BE A VERSUS.
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **GERRY GLASER:** DAVE ONE OF YOUR FIRST IMAGES WAS ONE OF THE
21 COMMUNITIES WE JUST PUT THE HIGHWAYS THROUGH. THE TUNNEL PARK
22 SEEMS LIKE THE ONE SOLUTION THAT ACTUALLY SEEMS TO MITIGATE
23 THAT KIND OF IMPACT. I HAVE NEVER SEEN ANYTHING ELSE THAT WAS
24 QUITE SO SUCCESSFUL. YOU ALSO MADE REFERENCE TO THE J LINE.
25 PARTICIPATE FAMILIAR WITH IT. I WENT ON THE WEB LOOKED FOR IT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 AND FOUND A ONE AND A HALF HOUR VIDEO. SO I TRAVELED THE J
2 LINE. AND ONE OF THE THINGS I NOTICED IN THE J LINE WAS THEY
3 DIDN'T NECESSARILY USE THE LEFT LANE AS THEIR TRANSIT LANE.
4 THEY USED THE RIGHT LANE AS THEIR TRANSIT LANE. SO WE COULD
5 BUILD ON OUR HIGHWAYS A LOWER COST A WAY TO CREATE SOMETHING
6 KIND OF LIKE BRT. THE ONE COMMENT YOU MADE ABOUT MAKING THE
7 HIGHWAYS OR ROADWAYS LARGER. I WAS A PLANNING COMMISSIONER IN
8 SUNNYVALE YEARS AGO, AND THAT'S WHEN WE CLASSIFIED A, B, C, D,
9 AS FAR AS INTERSECTIONS AND WE HAD ONE INTERSECTION AND PUBLIC
10 WORKS CAME IN AND SAID WE NEED TO ADD A LANE. AS A
11 COMMISSIONER I SAID HEY DON'T ADD A LANE WHY DON'T WE REDUCE
12 THE LANES. AND THEN ROAD DIETS, GIVE US A BETTER FLOW AND YOU
13 HAVE A SOLUTION AND ARE SHOWING PART OF THAT WITH THIS
14 PRESENTATION. BUT YOU ALSO TALKED ABOUT IF WE ADDED THE LANES
15 WHAT HAPPENS? OKAY. YEAH, OKAY IT'S GOOD. FOR ABOUT THREE
16 MONTHS THEN AFTER THAT IT SLOWS DOWN BECAUSE PEOPLE FOUND THE
17 EXTRA LANES. AND I BELIEVE THE SAME THING WILL HAPPEN WITH
18 FEES. THE FEE IS THERE. TODAY GEORGE WASHINGTON BRIDGE WENT
19 FROM \$17 TO GO ACROSS TO \$25. I THINK THE TRAFFIC ON THE
20 GEORGE WASHINGTON BRIDGE HAS NOT CHANGED. PEOPLE ARE GOING TO
21 GO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO. SO, I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO GET
22 THE SOLUTION ON VMT THAT WE WANT. I'LL GO ALONG WITH WHAT
23 GABRIEL SAYS, AND I SAID THAT IN OUR NEXT GENERATION HIGHWAY
24 MEETINGS, AS WELL. THE AMOUNT OF CHANGE THAT WE'RE TALKING
25 ABOUT, AS FAR AS HOW WE HANDLE THINGS, THE INVESTMENT THAT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 WE'LL PUT IN PLACE TO DO THOSE THINGS, THE AMOUNT OF FUNDS
2 THAT WE RAISE, AND THE REDUCTION IN VMT, IF IT WAS
3 ACCOMPLISHED AT THAT LEVEL, SEEMS TOO SMALL. FOR SOMEBODY TO
4 SAY, YEAH, WE'LL SIGN UP FOR THOSE THINGS. FINALLY ON THE
5 PRESENTATION, ITSELF, IT WAS REALLY AN EYE OPENER. BUT I WANT
6 TO KNOW SOMETHING. ON THE ANALYSIS OF PLUSES AND MINUSES, IS
7 THIS THE RESULT OF SUPPOSITION, THEORETICAL MODEL, OR
8 EMPIRICAL STUDY THAT SHOWS THESE THINGS?

9

10 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THE SOURCES ARE LISTED ON EACH SLIDE. IN CASES
11 WHERE WE HAVE DATA ABOUT THE EXISTING NETWORK WE HAVE CITED
12 THOSE LOOKING AT FUTURE FOCUSED THINGS, WE'RE USING MODEL DATA
13 AND SOURCES CITED. ONE THING WE'RE WORKING ON NOW WITH NEXGEN
14 TWO WORK WE'RE TAKING THESE THROUGH DIFFERENT TYPOLOGY
15 INVESTMENT RUNNING THEM THROUGH CONSISTENT MODEL SO WE HAVE
16 DATA AVAILABLE TO HELP COMPARE DIFFERENT TYPES OF EXPRESS LANE
17 INVESTMENTS AS WELL AS DIFFERENT TYPES OF EXPANSIVE PRICING
18 LIKE ALL-LANE TOLLING OR REGIONAL AUGMENTATION OF THE STATE
19 MILEAGE FEE. SO BASICALLY TODAY'S PRESENTATION PULLS TOGETHER
20 A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT THREADS, BUT WE HAVE ANALYSIS ON THE WAY
21 FOR APPLES TO APPLES ANALYSIS.

22

23 **GERRY GLASER:** HAVE WE INVESTIGATED WAYS, WORKING AT THE MODEL
24 LEVEL, TO TEST THE MODEL BEFORE WE INVEST IN CHANGES.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** ABSOLUTELY. OUR MODELS GO THROUGH MANY MONTHS OF
2 CALIBRATION AND VALIDATION TO ENSURE ACCURACY. IN THE REGIONAL
3 ACTIVITY BASED TRAVEL DEMAND MODEL, IT'S GONE THROUGH PEER
4 REVIEW, IT GOES THROUGH REGULAR UPDATES THAT INVOLVE
5 CALIBRATION AND VALIDATION. SO, YES.

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** I AGREE WITH SEVERAL OF THE COMMENTS MADE BY THE
8 PREVIOUS MEMBERS, BUT I THINK TO SIMPLIFY IT, FROM MY
9 PERSPECTIVE, WE NEED TO LOOK AT, DETERMINE, AND UTILIZE THE
10 BEST WAYS TO IMPROVE THE EFFICIENCY OF THE USE OF THE EXISTING
11 HIGHWAYS SYSTEMS, AS THEY ARE, AS OPPOSED TO ADDING NEW LANES,
12 ET CETERA. AND THAT COULD -- THERE ARE OTHER IMPACTS THAT
13 COULD BE CONSIDERED, THE TIME OF DAY, WHEN TALKING ABOUT
14 EVENINGS, EARLY MORNINGS, ET CETERA. AND OUR PHILOSOPHY AND
15 OUR APPROACH SHOULD CONSIDER THOSE IMPACTS AND DETERMINE WHAT
16 WORKS BEST. AND IT -- SOMETIMES IT TAKES A LONG TIME FOR
17 PEOPLE TO REALIZE THAT THE FAR LEFT LANE IS NOT ALWAYS THE
18 FASTEST. IT DEPENDS ON WHERE YOU'RE GOING, AND EDUCATION OF
19 DRIVERS, I THINK WOULD BE HELPFUL IN THAT PROCESS, AS WELL.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. RANDI, AND THEN ADINA.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ON THE ANALYSIS OF COST BETWEEN ALL-
25 LANE TOLLING AND EXPRESS LANE WHERE YOU HAVE THE INITIAL



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CAPITAL COST LAID OUT, DOES THAT TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE BUY
2 BACK THAT WE WOULD HAVE TO DO WITH THE AGENCIES THAT BUILT THE
3 TOLL LANES, THAT HAVE BUILT THE EXISTING LANES THAT ARE THERE?
4

5 **DAVE VAUTIN:** NO. THE INITIAL CAPITAL COST DOES NOT INCLUDE
6 THAT BUT WE RECOGNIZE THAT WOULD BE A COST. OUR COST ESTIMATES
7 FOR ALL-LANE TOLLING ARE ON ORDER OF MAGNITUDE ANYTHING
8 GREATER THAN EXISTING EXPRESS LANE REVENUES. WHILE THERE WOULD
9 NEED TO BE FURTHER WORK IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT HOW THAT WOULD
10 PLAY OUT IN PART OF THE IMPLEMENTATION ROADMAP IT SHOULD BE
11 VIABLE TO HANDLE ANY DEBT FOR EXISTING FACILITIES IS AS WELL
12 AS ANTICIPATED REVENUE BECAUSE REVENUE POTENTIAL OF THE
13 EXPANDED PRICING WOULD COVER IT.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN:** I HAVE TO PUSH BACK A LITTLE BIT BECAUSE VTA WAS
16 FIRST OUT TO COMPLETE THEIR ROUTES AND THEY PUT THEIR MONEY
17 OUT THERE AND SAN MATEO ARE THE ONES THAT JUST DID IT, AND SO
18 ONE OF THE COMMITTEES THAT I SIT ON, WHEN THIS CAME UP, THE
19 REPRESENTATIVE WAS GREAT, WE JUST SPENT A BILLION DOLLARS ON
20 THAT AND WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE THAT MONEY BACK IF YOU'RE GOING
21 TO BE TAKING THE REVENUE THAT WE'RE GETTING THAT, WE BUILT IT
22 AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PAY US BACK SO WE HAVE NEVER HAD
23 IN OUR MEETINGS ANY UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THAT COST IS AND I
24 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S INCLUDED IN THIS BECAUSE THESE
25 NUMBERS DON'T MEAN ANY -- THESE LITTLE DOLLAR SIGNS DON'T MEAN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 ANYTHING WITHOUT THAT TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION. BECAUSE MTC
2 DOESN'T OWN MOST OF THE -- I MEAN -- THE OTHER AGENCIES BUILT
3 THIS STUFF, AND THEY OWN THAT, AND THEY'RE TAKING THE REVENUE
4 FROM IT. SO, THAT'S A BIG CHUNK OF ANY OF THIS ANALYSIS. AND
5 WE HAVE BEEN ASKING FOR THAT FOR A WHILE. SO I REALLY
6 APPRECIATE THAT. ON THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU ASKED, ON THE FIRST
7 QUESTION, TRADE-OFFS AND POLICY GOALS, IT'S REALLY HARD TO
8 DETERMINE THAT WITHOUT HAVING A LIST -- YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE WE
9 TRADING OFF WITH, WHAT ARE OUR POLICY GOALS, EITHER WAY. SO,
10 AND THE SAME WITHOUT -- WITH THE WAY TO RECONCILE PIPELINE OF
11 PARTIALLY FUNDED AND VOTER APPROVED ROAD PROJECTS, I DON'T
12 KNOW WHAT THE LIST LOOKS LIKE. SO IT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL
13 BEFORE I COULD ANSWER THAT QUESTION OF, YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE WE
14 LOOKING AT. ARE WE LOOKING AT SOMETHING THAT WAS -- MAYBE
15 NEVER SHOULD HAVE BEEN VOTED ON AND FUNDED? OR ARE WE LOOKING
16 AT SOMETHING THAT'S DISPARATELY NEEDED AND NEEDS THE REST OF
17 ITS FUNDING. BECAUSE I KNOW A LOT OF OUR PROJECTS, WE'RE
18 COUNTING ON FEDERAL MONEY SOMETIMES, OR JUST STATE MONEY, THAT
19 JUST NEVER SHOWED UP. SO THOSE TWO QUESTIONS. AND THEN THE
20 MITIGATIONS BETWEEN ARTERIAL AND EXPRESS BUSES, I THINK THAT'S
21 GONNA COUNT -- THAT'S GOING TO DEPEND ON THE AREA. BECAUSE THE
22 EXPRESS BUSES, YOU'RE LOOKING AT TWO DIFFERENT THINGS. YOU'RE
23 LOOKING AT -- YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE COMMUTE HOUR BUS USE,
24 VERSUS THE MAJORITY OF THE BUS USE, WHICH IS DURING THE DAY
25 THAT'S OUTSIDE THE COMMUTE HOURS. AND FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 TRYING TO MAKE MANY, MANY, MANY TRIPS DURING THE DAY, GETTING
2 TO GROCERY STORES, HOSPITALS, SCHOOLS, APPOINTMENTS, VISITING
3 THEIR FAMILY, OR DOING WHATEVER THEY NEED TO DO, THAT'S GONNA
4 MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE. AND EVEN JUST THE COMMUTE THAT'S NOT
5 REQUIRING YOU TO GET ON THE FREEWAY. SO, I THINK THAT WE HAVE
6 TO LOOK AT THAT IN A DIFFERENT LIGHT. AND I THAN THAT'S GOING
7 TO BE DIFFERENT, LIKE ON THE 101 CORRIDOR, WHICH WE NEEDED
8 EVERYWHERE, AND WE NEED EL CAMINO REAL, WE NEED ALL OF THAT
9 DONE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT BROKEN OUT BEFORE I WEIGH IN AN
10 OPINION ON THAT. THANKS.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. AND BEFORE ADDRESSING THE QUESTIONS AND
13 OTHERS THANKS VERY MUCH FOR PUTTING IN THE DISCUSSION
14 QUESTIONS IT'S REALLY HELPFUL AND AS WELL AS THE OVERVIEW
15 INCLUDING THE REALLY CLEAR OVERVIEW ABOUT THE RELATIVE
16 BENEFITS AND POTENTIAL DRAWBACKS OF THE DIFFERENT APPROACHES
17 INCLUDING THE SCIENCE OF DEMAND. THANKS. THE QUESTION -- MAYBE
18 THIS WAS INCLUDED IN THE FOOTNOTES OF THE SLIDES OR IN THE
19 ANSWER TO GERRY'S QUESTION. THE ASSESSMENTS OF THE VMT
20 IMPACTS, IN PARTICULAR, YOU HAVE LOOKED AT THE HISTORY, LIKE,
21 OVER THE LAST, YOU KNOW, DECADE OR SO, ABOUT THE PROJECTS THAT
22 HAVE GONE IN AND WHAT WAS FORECASTED VERSUS, LIKE, WHAT THE
23 ACTUALS ARE, INCLUDING THE ONES THAT ARE MTCS, AND THE ONES
24 THAT ARE BUILT BY VTA, AND SAN MATEO COUNTY AND OTHER
25 LOCALITY, BUT TO THESE MODELS? DO YOU HAVE ANY OF THE CURRENT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 DATA? OR IN THIS PROCESS, ARE YOU GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THE
2 CURRENT DATA?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO WE DIDN'T DO CASE STUDIES AS PAST PROJECTS AS
5 PART OF TODAY PRESENTATION. I I'LL SAY THAT IT'S OFTEN VERY
6 HARD TO DISENTANGLE THE PROJECT EFFECTS FROM THE OVERALL
7 REGIONAL EFFECTS. YOU KNOW, SOME OF THOSE, SORT OF, PREPOST
8 STUDIES FOR PROJECTS ARE REQUIRED FOR BIG TRANSIT MEGA
9 PROJECTS UNDER AS PART OF FTA'S REQUIREMENTS BUT IN GENERAL
10 THEY'RE OFTEN FEW AND FAR BETWEEN KIND OF ACROSS THE STATE AND
11 ACROSS THE COUNTRY BECAUSE OF THOSE EXTERNAL FORCES THAT ARE
12 BEYOND THE PROJECT CONTROL, THINKING ABOUT THE PANDEMIC AND
13 HOW IT'S AFFECTED PROJECTIONS. WHAT WE HAVE SEEN CITIZEN BAY
14 AREA HASN'T -- YOU KNOW, IT'S A NEW AMOUNT OF HIGHWAY LANE-
15 MILEAGE IT HAS MOSTLY STABILIZED IN RECENT YEARS THERE HASN'T
16 BEEN AS MUCH NEW CAPACITY BUILT YET WE STILL HAVE A LOT OF
17 CHALLENGES IN TERMS OF REDUCING VMT IN THE REGION.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD URGE TO YOU LOOK AT AREAS WHERE THOSE
20 CASE STUDIES MIGHT BE, THE DATA IS USEFUL ONE EXAMPLE THE 101
21 MANAGED LANE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY THERE WAS PREDICTION THAT IT
22 WOULD HAVE NEGLIGIBLE ADDITIONAL VMT IMPACTS FROM CALTRANS
23 THEY'RE BASICALLY SAYING USE DEMAND IS NOT A THING SO I THINK
24 IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO LOOK AT PLACES WHERE THE FACTS MIGHT
25 ILLUSTRATIVE. THEN THE 50 QUESTION, LIKE, THAT'S REALLY,



MARCH 22, 2024

1 REALLY, REALLY ABSTRACT, AND LIKE OTHERS HAVE MENTIONED IT
2 WOULD BE HELPFUL TO HAVE SOME MORE EXAMPLES AND PARAMETERS ON
3 THAT FIRST QUESTION. FOR THE PARTIALLY FUNDED BUT VOTER
4 APPROVED, THIS IS SOMETHING THAT, FOR THE REGION, THERE'S A
5 DIFFICULT PRACTICE THAT IT WILL BE GOOD TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO
6 ADDRESS, WHETHER IT BE FOR HIGHWAYS OR FOR OTHER KINDS OF
7 PROJECTS WHERE YOU HAVE THINGS THAT MAYBE WERE APPROVED BY
8 VOTERS 40 YEARS AGO. AND ARE MOVED FORWARD BUT DON'T REALLY
9 MATCH CURRENT NEEDS. AND FIGURING OUT, LIKE, HOW DO WE
10 ACTUALLY, LIKE, GO BACK TO THE PUBLIC WITH THE CASE THAT,
11 LIKE, WHAT PEOPLE -- MANY OF WHOM AREN'T EVEN ALIVE ANYMORE
12 WANTED, LIKE, ISN'T MEETING THE CURRENT NEED, AND YOU KNOW,
13 WHAT KIND OF CHANGE SHOULD HAPPEN. AND IT'S REALLY DIFFICULT,
14 BECAUSE PEOPLE, THEY WERE, LIKE, WELL, WE VOTED FOR THIS BACK
15 IN 1985, LET'S CONTINUE ON THE PATH, BUT WOULD FIGURING OUT
16 HOW TO CHANGE FROM THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL? AND ON THE HIGHWAY
17 VERSUS ARTERIAL, FOLLOWING WHAT RANDI KINMAN SAID, IT REALLY
18 DEPENDS ON THE AREA AND THE CORRIDOR ABOUT WHETHER WE WANT
19 BOTH OR ONE OR THE OTHER. IT'S CONTEXT DEPENDENT. AND I GUESS
20 -- SORRY -- ONE OTHER QUESTION BACK ON THE FIRST ONE IS THE --
21 BECAUSE THE RELATIVE BENEFITS OF THE LANE CONVERSION -- SO,
22 THE ALLOW-LANE TOLLING IS GETTING A LOT OF PUSH BACK,
23 ESPECIALLY AS ANY KIND OF A NEAR-TERM THING, AND THE MANAGED
24 LANES ARE MOVING FORWARD, LOOKING TO ADVANCE WITH MANAGED
25 LANES AND GETTING TO BE ABLE TO DO MANAGE LANE WITH



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CONVERSION, ESPECIALLY IN CORRIDORS THAT HAVE VIABLE AND, YOU
2 KNOW, STRONG AND POTENTIALLY IMPROVED TRANSIT OPTIONS IS A
3 GOOD APPROACH IN THE SHORT TO MEDIUM TERM.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, ADINA. WE'RE GOING TO HOWARD
6 THEN ROLAND.

7

8 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE THOUGHT PROVOKING PRESENTATION.
9 IT KIND OF MAKES ME THINK A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT ROADS AND
10 HIGHWAYS. BUT TOUCHING BACK TO OUR LAST DISCUSSION ABOUT THE
11 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AND THE PUBLICIZING TO THE
12 PUBLIC TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND WE ALSO TALKED ABOUT THE
13 NEED TO GET ALL THE -- EVERY, YOU KNOW, EVERYONE IN THE AREA
14 THINKING ABOUT COMPREHENSIVE IMPROVEMENTS IN TRANSPORTATION,
15 THAT IF WE'RE EMPHASIZING TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, PERHAPS WHAT
16 WE NEED IS AN EQUIVALENT HIGHWAY TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM. SO
17 THAT WE LOOK AT ALL SIDES OF THE TRANSPORTATION REALM. THE
18 THIS MORNING I WAS LISTENING TO KCBS RADIO NEWS AS I USUALLY
19 DO WHEN I WAKE UP, AND THEY ALWAYS HAVE THE TRAFFIC REPORT AND
20 THIS MORNING THEY SAID, COMMUTERS DON'T WORRY, THERE IS VERY
21 LITTLE TRAFFIC TODAY. IT'S A FRIDAY, OBVIOUSLY, AND WE WORK AT
22 HOME, YOU PROBABLY SEE LESS TRAFFIC ON MONDAYS AND FRIDAYS,
23 BUT TODAY IT WAS VERY LIGHT TRAFFIC. AND WHAT IT KIND OF
24 TRIGGERED IN MY MIND WAS THAT WE SHOULDN'T MAKE ASSUMPTIONS
25 THAT COMMUTE PATTERNS, OR TRAVEL PATTERNS WILL ALSO STAY THE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 SAME. AS WORK AT HOME BECOMES MORE INSTITUTIONALIZED IT COULD
2 BE NOT JUST RANDOM THING IT COULD BE PLANNED STRATEGY WHERE
3 PERHAPS THERE ARE INCENTIVES AND COUNTRIES DO THIS ALREADY
4 WHERE YOU HAVE CERTAIN TYPES OF BUSINESSES COME TO WORK
5 EARLIER OR LATER, SO YOU STAGGER THE DRIVING HOURS. YOU COULD
6 EVEN, SOME PLACES I HAVE HEARD, HAVE AN EVEN NUMBER OF LICENSE
7 PLATES, ODD NUMBER OF LICENSE PLATES PLAN IS HOW THEY ENTER A
8 CITY. SO, I THINK HIGHWAY TRANSFORMATION SHOULD ALSO START
9 LOOKING AT TECHNOLOGY, THAT TRAFFIC AND ROAD MANAGEMENT IS NOW
10 BEING STUDIED AND IMPLEMENTED BY USING WAYS OF CONTROLLING
11 WHERE TRAFFIC GOES, WHERE THE ROADS ARE HEAVY, WHERE THEY'RE
12 LIGHT, DISTRIBUTING THE TRAFFIC. WE ALSO HAVE TECHNOLOGY
13 CHANGING TECHNOLOGY IN VEHICLES, MORE ELECTRIC VEHICLES,
14 SMALLER PERHAPS, HOPEFULLY. ABLE TO DEGREES GAPS, HEADWAYS,
15 BETWEEN VEHICLES. EVEN COMBINING VEHICLES AND TRAINS OF
16 VEHICLES, THROUGH ELECTRONIC MEANS SO THEY BECOME INDIVIDUAL
17 MOBILITY TRAINS, TIED TOGETHER ALL DIRECTED TO CERTAIN
18 OFFRAMPS ON CERTAIN LANES. SO, I THINK HIGHWAY TRANSFORMATION
19 WOULD BE SOMETHING, I THINK, MIGHT BE EQUIVALENT TO TRANSIT
20 TRANSFORMATION. AND I THINK IT HAS A LOT OF FUTURE
21 OPPORTUNITIES.

22

23 **RONALD WONG:** I HAVE NO COMMENTS AT THIS TIME.

24

25 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WENDI THEN CHARLIE.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** I THINK WE'RE LOOKING AT A CHICKEN AND EGG
3 SITUATION AND REFERRING BACK TO THE PREVIOUS DISCUSSION ABOUT
4 THE REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE. YOU KNOW, I LIKE THE IDEA OF NOT
5 HAVING AN EXPANSION, AND, YOU KNOW, THE OLD ALL-LANE TOLL IS
6 INTRIGUING BUT UNTIL YOU HAVE A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT REALLY
7 WORKS, IT'S NOT GOING TO BE VERY ATTRACTIVE TO GET PEOPLE OFF
8 THE ROADS. AND YOU CAN'T JUST LOOK AT TRANSIT ON THE HIGHWAY,
9 AS YOU EXPRESSED YOURSELF, PEOPLE AREN'T GOING TO GET OFF AT
10 THE OFFRAMP, THERE IS SOMEWHERE THEY WANT TO GO. SO IT HAS TO
11 LOOK AT THE COMPLETE SYSTEM. AGAIN WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT OUR
12 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS, IT'S VERY HARD TO DIVORCE ONE SYSTEM
13 FROM ANOTHER SYSTEM, BUT REALLY HOW THEY ALL INTEGRATE WITH
14 EACH OTHER. IF YOU HAVE ALL TOLLS -- ALL LANE TOLLS THERE IS A
15 GOOD POSSIBILITY YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE PEOPLE ON SURFACE
16 STREETS AND I WONDER IF YOU HAVE MEASURED HOW MUCH THAT'S
17 GOING TO HAPPEN. OF COURSE, YOU ALSO HAVE THE EQUITY ISSUE.
18 THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO, FOR INSTANCE, ARE CONSTRUCTION WORKERS,
19 AND MUST HAVE THEIR VEHICLE IN ORDER TO GO TO WORK, AND WHAT
20 DO WE DO ABOUT THAT. SO, YOU KNOW, AND THE QUESTIONS OF, YOU
21 KNOW, ARE WE LOOKING MORE AT THE HIGHWAY BUSES OR ARTERIAL
22 BUSES. I THINK YOU NEED YOUR TRUNK LINES ON THE HIGHWAYS, BUT
23 YOU ALSO NEED YOUR ARTERIAL BUSES ARE JUST AS IMPORTANT IF NOT
24 MORE IMPORTANT BECAUSE THAT'S REALLY WHERE PEOPLE ARE GOING



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THEN OF COURSE YOU HAVE GOT YOUR FIRST AND LAST MILE TO THINK
2 ABOUT. I THINK THIS'S WHAT I HAVE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** HI. THANKS FOR THAT PRESENTATION. IT WAS VERY
5 RELEVANT, SUCCINCT, ON POINT. I -- YEAH, REALLY, REALLY GREAT
6 INFORMATION FOR OUR DELIBERATIONS. AND IT SEEMS TO FOCUS ON
7 LANES. I KNOW THERE IS A MENTION OF INTERSECTIONS, BUT, YOU
8 KNOW, INTERSECTION IS SOMETIMES WHERE WE CAN MAKE BIG
9 IMPROVEMENTS TO TRAFFIC FLOW. AND, ALSO, I THINK SOMEBODY
10 MENTIONED, JUST THE EQUITY VALUES WOULD ADD, ADDING JUST TO
11 THE VALUE OF THE REPORT AND THE PRESENTATION AND THE
12 INFORMATION, HAVING THAT COMPONENT IN THERE WOULD BE HELPFUL.
13 BUT APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WILLIAM AND THEN DIANA.

16

17 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** YES. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND
18 FRAMING THESE QUESTIONS. SO, IN ANSWER TO THESE QUESTIONS, IT
19 SEEMS LIKE THE TRADE-OFFS ARE TO INCREASE LANES OR INCREASE
20 TOLLING. BUT WE STILL HAVEN'T ADDRESSED THE QUESTION OF
21 GREATER AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY. AND I GET IT. IT LOOKS LIKE
22 A STEADY DRUMBEAT TOWARDS ALL-LANE TOLLING WHICH DOES SEEM
23 ATTRACTIVE. BUT CHANGING PEOPLE'S BEHAVIOR TO DRIVE LESS BY
24 CHARGING MORE, BUT WHERE DO THEY GO WHEN THEY'RE NOT ON THE
25 FREEWAY? (LAUGHTER) THEY'RE PROBABLY ON THE STREETS. AND THERE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE TO USE TRANSIT MORE, BUT THERE IS
2 ALSO THE OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE WHO CAN AFFORD TO DRIVE, TO
3 DRIVE MORE. AND FOR COMMERCIAL DRIVING, BECAUSE THEY CAN
4 ALWAYS PASS THAT COST ON TO CONSUMERS. AND THEN, I GUESS,
5 LOOKING AT THE SECOND QUESTION OF, YOU KNOW, PROJECTS THAT ARE
6 PARTIALLY FUNDED, HOW DOES A PROJECT GET PARTIALLY FUNDED IF
7 IT'S VOTER APPROVED? (LAUGHTER) I DON'T GET THAT ONE.

8

9 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, MAY I ANSWER THAT QUESTION?
10 BECAUSE I THINK IT CAME UP FROM A FEW OTHERS.

11

12 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** PLEASE.

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** IT'S A REALLY PERSONALITY POINT THAT MANY PEOPLE
15 IN THE REGION AND PEOPLE IN THE TRANSPORTATION SPACE AREN'T
16 AWARE OF BUT A LOT OF THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURES ON THE
17 BALLOT ARE SPREADING THE MONEY TO A BROADER RAY OF FOLKS WITH
18 THE EXPECTATION AND OFTEN REASONABLE EXPECTATION THAT MATCHING
19 FUNDS WILL FLOW IN FROM FEDERAL AND STATE SOURCES BUT THE
20 RESULT IS OFTEN MONEYS ARE SPRINKLED ACROSS MANY DIFFERENT
21 PROJECTS WITH AMBITIOUS MATCH ASSUMPTIONS THAT IT RESULTS IN
22 THE LIST OF PROJECTS BEING OVEREXTENDED OVER A VERY LARGE
23 PORTFOLIO, RIGHT? SO YOU HAVE THESE PROJECTS THAT REMAIN ON
24 THE BOOKS THAT MIGHT HAVE A TEN OR 20% CONTRIBUTION BUT THEY
25 NEED A MATCH FROM ALL SORTS OF OTHER SOURCES OF 80 TO 90%, AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 IT CREATES A DISCONNECT FROM PROJECTS ON THE MAP AND WHAT'S
2 VIABLE GIVEN THE AVAILABLE FINANCIAL RESOURCES.

3

4 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** IT ALSO MAKES ME WONDER WHERE ARE THOSE
5 PROJECTS. LIKE, ARE THEY IN UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES, WHICH
6 OFTEN ARE THE ONES THAT GET, YOU KNOW, UNDER SOURCED AND
7 FUNDED. AND I GUESS I'LL JUST MOVE TO THE LAST ONE WHICH IS
8 BASICALLY THE SAME THING, WHICH IS LIKE WHICH UNDERSERVED
9 COMMUNITIES ARE THE ONES WE'RE TALKING ABOUT INVESTING? THOSE
10 ARE MY THOUGHTS. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR PROVIDING THIS
13 FRAMING. ON SLIDE 11 WHERE YOU LOOKED AT CLIMATE BENEFITS AND
14 IMPACTS YOU SAID EXPRESS LANES ARE GOING TO ADD UP TO 1.2
15 MILLION DAILY VM IT. SO I WAS WONDERING WHETHER THAT ANALYSIS
16 YOU'RE LOOKING AT BOTH NEW LANE VERSUS CONVERSION BECAUSE IN
17 THE PREVIOUS SLIDE THERE WAS ANALYSIS ABOUT EXPRESS LANE
18 CONVERSION 6,000 PERSON THROUGHPUT PER HOUR VERSUS 8,000 SO TO
19 ME IT WOULD SEEM TWO SEPARATE NUMBERS.

20

21 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THE VISUAL PULLED DATA POINT FOR AUTHORIZED
22 NETWORK THE AUTHORIZED NETWORK IS SPLIT IT HAS MIX OF NEW
23 CAPACITY AND CONVERSIONS WE TESTED ALL THAT SAME ANALYSIS WITH
24 THE NEW CAPACITY CORRIDORS WHERE CONVERSIONS SO IT WAS JUST
25 CONVERSION ONLY NETWORK RIGHT STILL YIELDED SIGNIFICANT VMT



MARCH 22, 2024

1 INCREASE BUT NOWHERE NEAR THE SAME NOT THE SAME LEVEL AS 1.2
2 MILLION STATISTICS BUT IT REQUIRES SUBSTANTIAL CHANGE THE
3 CAPACITY IN MANY CASES PROJECTS ON TRADE-OFFS ARE REQUIRED TO
4 CONVERT THEM TO SOMETHING ELSE.

5

6 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** GOT IT THANK YOU. EVEN THOUGH THE ALL-
7 LANE TOLLING SEEMS TO BE THE BEST OPTION IT STILL HAS
8 AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY CONCERNS AND THOSE ARE REGRESSIVE
9 CONCERNS AND SO MY COLLEAGUE SAID THE EXPRESS LANE CONVERSION
10 IS THE LEAST BAD OPTION WE HAVES ON THE TABLE AND DEFINITELY
11 HAVING THAT EQUITY CATEGORIZED AS A SEPARATE MEASURE FOR YOU
12 TO CONSIDER AND THEN THE OTHER THING I WANTED TO SAY FOR YOUR
13 LAST QUESTION IS THAT WE NEED TO PRIORITIZE INVESTING IN
14 NEARBY COMMUNITIES, PARTICULARLY WHEN THEY HAVE EXPERIENCED
15 PAST HISTORICAL HARMS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION I'M ON THE NEXGEN
18 ADVISORY COMMITTEE. I HAVE SHARED A LOT IN THOSE BODIES BUT I
19 HAVEN'T HEARD A LOT AROUND TRANSFORM HIGHWAYS TO BE THINKING
20 ABOUT BETTER SERVING EFFICIENT AND GOODS MOVEMENT INVESTMENTS
21 HIGHWAYS ARE CRITICAL IN OUR ECONOMY, SUPPLY CHAINS AND
22 GETTING GOODS AND SERVICE MOVED IS SUPER IMPORTANT BUT WE SAW
23 THAT THE CLIMATE METRIC DID NOT SCORE VERY HIGH AND I WONDER
24 IF THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO INVEST IN CLEANER ZERO-EMISSIONS
25 INVESTMENTS IN OUR MEDIUM AND HEAVY-DUTY BUS INFRASTRUCTURE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BECAUSE THEY CAN BE CLEANER WE HAVE THESE AMBITIOUS STATE
2 GOALS TO ELECTRIFY WHERE THERE IS MONEY FOR HYDROGEN. BUT
3 THERE ARE NO INFRASTRUCTURE CURRENTLY IN PLACE, THERE ARE
4 STARTUPS BUT THERE ARE BIG GAPS IN TERMS OF THE NEEDS AROUND
5 OUR HIGHWAYS TO SERVE AS THOSE INFRASTRUCTURE HUBS LIKE
6 HYDROGEN FUELING STATIONS AND BATTERY HUBS WHERE THESE TRUCKS
7 AND BUSES GOING TO FUEL. I THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR
8 HIGHWAYS TO BE -- SORT OF, THINKING ABOUT YOUR FIRST QUESTION
9 IN TERMS OF FUTURE INVESTMENTS HOW DID WE BALANCE THOSE NEEDS,
10 WE ALSO NOTE TRUCKS -- TRUCKS AND BUSES ARE HEAVY, AND YOU
11 KNOW, THEY DAMAGE ROADS AND THEY'RE NOT THE MOST
12 ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY. I WONDER IF THERE IS OPPORTUNITIES
13 FOR US TO INVEST IN CONCRETE ASPHALT INNOVATION TO BE MORE
14 RESILIENT AND TO BE ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY. ASPHALT AND
15 CONCRETE CONTRIBUTION TO HEAVILY POLLUTING OUR WATERS IN OUR
16 COMMUNITIES. I THINK THERE IS SOMETHING WE CAN DO AROUND
17 INNOVATION OF OUR HIGHWAYS AND THE INFRASTRUCTURE AROUND IT
18 AND THEN I JUST WANT TO ECHO EVERYONE'S POINTS AROUND MANAGED
19 LANES. YOU KNOW, DYNAMIC LANES BASED ON TRAFFIC FLOW. A LOT OF
20 WHAT WE DO AT EAST BAY ADA IS ADVANCE IN MEETINGS AND PLANNING
21 FOR THEM. AND THERE ARE CERTAIN PLACES WE KNOW TO AVOID
22 BECAUSE WE KNOW IT'S GOING TO OUR TURN OUT IS GOING TO BE BAD
23 YOU CAN'T PLAN AN EVENT IN THE TRI-VALLEY IN THE AFTERNOON
24 BECAUSE YOU KNOW IT'S GOING TO BE A NIGHTMARE HEADING EAST,
25 AND IN THE PM AND MORNING YOU CAN'T BE NEAR FREMONT AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 HAYWARD BECAUSE IT'S A NIGHTMARE THERE ARE IN TERMS OF
2 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT WE REALLY MISS OUT ON ECONOMIC
3 OPPORTUNITIES BECAUSE OF THE WAY TRAFFIC AND COMMUTE FLOWS ARE
4 HAPPENING FOR GOOD OR WORSE, BUT THERE IS A WAY TO, YEAH,
5 EARLIER COMMENTS ON UTILIZING EXISTING LANES INSTEAD OF
6 BUILDING ON NEW LANES AND YEAH THINKING ABOUT, YEAH, TRAFFIC
7 FLOWS, AND THE DI -- THE DYNAMIC PATTERNS OF TRAFFIC THESE
8 DAYS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY FOLKS ONLINE
11 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED TO GIVE COMMENT? I SEE VICE CHAIR
12 BALDINI.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MICHAEL, GO AHEAD. IT SEEMS HE STEPPED
15 AWAY, BUT THE REMOTE LOCATION IS STILL OPEN. MEMBER RHOADS HAS
16 THEIR HAND RAISED.

17

18 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** MEMBER RHOADS?

19

20 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I LEARNED A
21 LOT AND REALLY APPRECIATE IT. I'M GOING TO TRY TO RESPOND TO
22 THE THREE QUESTIONS. I GUESS THE FIRST QUESTION IT SEEMS
23 DEPEND ON TRADEOFFS AND THAT WOULD DEPEND ON ESTABLISHING
24 RATIONAL METRICS AND SUBJECTING INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS TO THOSE
25 METRICS THAT PROBABLY IS EASIER THAN IT SOUNDS. THE SECOND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 REGARDING VOTER APPROVED PROJECTS SEEMS THAT WE HAVE A KIND OF
2 RESPONSIBILITY OF DELIVERING WHAT WE PROMISED AND TO NOT DO SO
3 WOULD TEND TO ERODE TRUST. OBVIOUSLY THERE IS GOING TO BE SOME
4 CHALLENGES DELIVERING ON PROJECTS THAT ARE SERIOUSLY
5 UNDERFUNDED. BUT AT THE END OF THE DAY IT SEEMS WE NEED TO DO
6 WHAT WE PROMISED TO DO. AND REGARDING MITIGATIONS QUESTIONS
7 AGAIN IT FALLS BACK TO THIS NOTION OF WHAT, SORT OF, METRICS
8 ARE WE ESTABLISHING TO ANALYZE PROJECTS BY. AND, OBVIOUSLY,
9 COST AND BENEFITS IN A PERFECT WORLD SHOULD DETERMINE CHOICES.
10 AND REGARDING THE PRESENTATION, I THOUGHT THAT, IF, INDEED,
11 OUR 30,000 FOOT LOOK AT, AND THE MODELING PROVES TO BE CORRECT
12 OR ACCURATE, THE ALL-LANE TOLLING SEEMS TO BE MOST PROMISING
13 IF THERE IS A WAY TO OFFSET THE COST THAT WOULD BE A BURDEN TO
14 THOSE THAT ARE MOST UNABLE TO PAY THEM. THE SECOND THING IS
15 THAT 10% SAVINGS TAKEN IN THE LIFE OF A PERSON REALLY CAN BE
16 VERY MEANINGFUL IT MEANS MORE TIME WITH FAMILIES AND MORE TIME
17 TO DO OTHER THINGS. AND THEN FINALLY, AND ALSO, I GUESS THAT
18 IN ORDER TO LOOK AT INVESTMENTS IN ROADWAY PROJECTS, IT SEEMS
19 TO ME THAT YOU REALLY NEED TO UNDERSTAND SPECIFIC PROJECTS
20 IMPACTS ON VMT, AIR QUALITY, AND GREENHOUSE GAS AND SAFETY.
21 FOR EXAMPLE, IF ONE IS GOING TO MAKE AN INVESTMENT IN A MAJOR
22 ROADWAY INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENT. FOR EXAMPLE, 101, 580, AND
23 SAN RAFAEL. THESE KIND OF IMPROVEMENTS CAN TAKE TRIPS OFF
24 CONGESTED LOCAL STREETS SO YOU REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT ALL OF
25 THOSE THINGS BEFORE YOU DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT A PROJECT IS



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BENEFICIAL REGIONALLY AND LOCALLY. AND FINALLY IT SEEMS TO ME
2 THAT A MISSING LINK IN A LOT OF THESE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS
3 IS A TIE TO LAND USE DECISIONS AND LAND USE INVESTMENTS. AND,
4 REALLY, WE DON'T GET BENEFIT OUT OF A LOT OF THESE PROJECTS
5 UNLESS THERE IS A DIRECT LAND USE CONNECTION. THAT WOULD BE
6 PARTICULARLY TRUE WITH RESPECT TO TRANSIT PROJECTS THAT WE
7 DON'T GET RIDERSHIP UNLESS WE HAVE THE LAND USE TO SUPPORT
8 THAT RIDERSHIP. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE SEE YOU. DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK? YEAH.
13 WE -- WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. WE CAN TAKE ALETA FIRST THEN LOOP
14 BACK

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** CHARLIE.

17

18 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** I WANT TO COMMENT ON WHAT I HEARD FROM MEMBERS
19 HERE THAT WAS WHAT I THOUGHT WAS MISSING ALTHOUGH THERE IS
20 GREAT INFORMATION BUT I DIDN'T SEE INFORMATION ABOUT GOODS
21 MOVEMENT, SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES, THAT COMPONENT WAS MISSING,
22 WITH GOODS MOVEMENT WE HAVE EQUITY VALUE, WE HAVE ECONOMIC
23 VALUE FOR THE REGION AND THEN THE IMPACT OF THE TRANSITION TO
24 ALTERNATIVELY FUELED VEHICLES, WHETHER ELECTRIC OR HYDROGEN
25 POWERS, WHICH MAY NOT CHANGE ROAD USAGE, IT'S JUST GOING TO



MARCH 22, 2024

1 CHANGE THE TYPES OF VEHICLES THAT ARE USING THE ROADS. SO WE
2 COULD ADD TO THE DATA THAT YOU'RE PROVIDING THERE WITH THAT.
3 THANKS.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I HAD SOME COMMENTS AND THEN
6 SOME QUESTIONS THAT I'LL MAKE UNLESS VICE CHAIR BALDINI IS
7 READY? IF NOT, I'M HAPPY TO GO AHEAD AND EXPRESS MY GRATITUDE
8 FOR THIS PRESENTATION. THANK YOU, DAVE, FOR INCLUDING THE
9 HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF THE FREEWAYS AND OUR HIGHWAY SYSTEMS,
10 AND THE GRAPHICS THAT WERE REALLY, REALLY HELPFUL IN DIGESTING
11 THE PROS, THE CONS, AND THE TRADE-OFFS OF THIS POLICY. MY
12 FIRST QUESTION IS, IF THERE -- I HAVE HEARD PREVIOUSLY,
13 HOPEFUL THREE IS A PLAN FOR A TRANSPORTATION STUDY THAT'S
14 GOING TO MEASURE WHAT AVERAGE TRAVEL TIME FOLKS ARE
15 EXPERIENCING TO GET TO THE PLACES THEY NEED TO GO. I THINK
16 THIS WAS DONE TEN YEARS AGO. IS IT ON TRACK TO BE COMPLETED
17 THIS YEAR? NEXT YEAR? WHAT IS THE PLAN FOR THAT STUDY, IF YOU
18 HAPPEN TO KNOW?

19

20 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I'M NOT ENTIRELY WHAT STUDY YOU'RE REFERRING TO.
21 YOU MIGHT BE TALKING -- MAYBE YOU'RE REFERRING TO OUR TRAVEL
22 SURVEY EFFORTS THAT WERE PAUSED DURING COVID, THAT WE'RE
23 REMOVING THAT RIGHT NOW AND ACTUALLY MOVING TO A MORE
24 ITERATIVE APPROACH WHERE WE GET DATA MORE FREQUENTLY WHERE WE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 GET ONCE EVERY TEN YEARS AND THAT'S ANTICIPATED TO BECOME
2 AVAILABLE, DATA LATER THIS YEAR.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I THINK THAT'S WHAT I'M REFERRING TO,
5 BECAUSE A DECADE PLUS AGO FOR SOUTH BAY FOLKS THE DATA HELPED
6 US UNDERSTAND THIS WE NEEDED TO BRIDGE THE CONNECTION BETWEEN
7 TWO COMMUNITIES. AND SO THAT LED TO SOME INNOVATIVE THINKING
8 OF BUILDING OVER THE FREEWAY AND CREATING MORE LAND THAT COULD
9 THEN GENERATE REVENUE AND PROFIT THROUGH BUSINESSES, PARKS,
10 HOUSING, AND ALL OF THOSE THINGS, WHICH I THINK IS REALLY
11 IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP IN MIND. BECAUSE AS WAS MENTIONED, LAND
12 USE IS GONNA BE AN IMPORTANT PART OF THIS, AS WELL. IT'S NOT
13 JUST ABOUT PEOPLE USING THE FREEWAY MORE EFFICIENTLY, IT'S
14 GETTING PEOPLE TO USE SERVICES IN THEIR COMMUNITIES MORE
15 LOCALLY. I HAVE MENTIONED, IN THE PAST, I HAVE A FAMILY WHO
16 TRAVELS FROM GILROY TO SAN JOSE FOR HEALTH CARE SERVICES, AND
17 IS THE RIGHT SOLUTION TO MAKE A HIGHWAY MORE EFFICIENT TO FOR
18 THEM OR IS THE SOLUTION TO BUILD A HEALTH CARE CENTER IN
19 GILROY THAT'S EASIER FOR THEM TO GET TO SO THAT THEY'RE NOT
20 EVEN HAVING TO TAKE THE FREEWAY. SO THAT'S GOING TO BE
21 DIFFICULT TO CALCULATE AN EXACT NUMBER TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE
22 IN THE COMMUNICATIONS IF WE CAN INCLUDE HOW MUCH TIME PEOPLE
23 WILL HAVE BACK BECAUSE TIME POVERTY IS VERY REAL. I HAVE A
24 DAUGHTER, I'M A SUPER COMMUTER SPENDING A LOT OF TIME IN
25 VEHICLES SOMETIMES MORE OFTEN THAN A VEHICLE THAN IN MY OWN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 HOME SO WHEN PEOPLE CAN START TO HAVE A TANGIBLE IDEA WHAT
2 IT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE FOR THAT SUPPORT, IT MIGHT GET US
3 CLOSER TO WHERE WE WANT TO BE IN MOVING THIS POLICY FORWARD TO
4 ANSWER SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WERE ASKED INVESTMENTS IN
5 HIGHWAY SYSTEMS NEAR-TERM SHOULD ALWAYS PRIORITIZE COMMUNITIES
6 SAFETY, IN THE LONG-TERM FOCUSING STRATEGIES ON CLIMATE
7 RESILIENCY BECAUSE EVERY OPPORTUNITY WE HAVE TO ENVISION RAIL
8 AND ROBUST TRANSPORTATION AS PART OF OUR LONG-TERM VISION FOR
9 MEETING OUR CLIMATE GOALS THOSE ARE BOLD VISIONS THAT WE NEED
10 TO REMAIN STEADFAST IN ACCOMPLISHING AND REGARDING VOTER
11 APPROVED PROJECTS STILL MIGHT REQUIRE SOME COSTLY UNFUNDED
12 MITIGATIONS I THINK THAT COMMUNITY-LED CONVERSATIONS ARE GOING
13 TO BE ESSENTIAL TO MAKING THE MOST OUT OF THOSE PROJECTS AND
14 IN THE REMAINING DOLLARS TO BE SPENT TO BE INVESTED WE NEED TO
15 LOOK AT DATA, COST, AND BENEFITS AND PITFALLS OF CONTINUING
16 PROJECTS THAT MAY NO LONGER MEET NEEDS OF THOSE NEIGHBORS
17 BECAUSE PEOPLE MOVE AWAY PERSPECTIVES CHANGE. SO THE SAME WAY
18 WE'RE ALLOWING FOR FLEXIBILITY IN OUR TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
19 MEASURES WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT FLEXIBILITY IN HOW OUR CURRENT
20 DOLLARS ARE BEING USED IN THE MOST FISCALLY RESPONSIBLE WAY
21 AND I BELIEVE THAT BOTH ARTERIAL BUSES AND EXPRESS BUSES ARE
22 GOING TO BE IMPORTANT COMPONENTS OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
23 INFRASTRUCTURE ESPECIALLY AS YOU MENTIONED WE HAVE PEDESTRIAN
24 HAZARDOUS COMMUNITIES I THINK THAT'S WHAT YOU SAID THAT'S PART
25 OF THE ISSUES OF OUR COMMUNITIES THAT AREN'T WELL CONNECTED



MARCH 22, 2024

1 INTERNALLY AND REGIONALLY THEN IT'S GOING TO BE HARDER TO BE
2 ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD EQUITABLE POLICIES WHICH NEED TO BE AT
3 THE FOREFRONT OF BUILDING STRONG NEIGHBORHOODS SO I MENTIONED
4 IN THE BEGINNING OF MY COMMENTS, APPRECIATE THE WORK TO MAKE
5 HIGHWAY DRIVERS GO FASTER I THINK WE NEED TO FOCUS TIME AND
6 ENERGY ON RESOURCES AND THINKING ABOUT MODERNIZING OUR
7 COMMUNITIES I SAW INTERCHANGE MODERNIZATIONS, THOUGHT THAT
8 WOULD BE A GOOD PLACE TO START IN THE REALM OF BUILDING OVER
9 HIGHWAYS, RECONNECTING COMMUNITIES, CREATING WALKABLE BIKABLE
10 TRANSIT FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION PATHWAYS POCKET GARDENS, PARKS
11 LIKE THOSE ARE THINGS THAT PEOPLE SHOULD BE ABLE TO WALK IN
12 THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS AND I SEE A LOT OF CEMENT THAT COULD JUST
13 BE RADICALLY CHANGED TO GREEN OUR COMMUNITIES SO I'LL END MY
14 COMMENTS THERE. VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

15
16 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** DOES IT WORK? CAN YOU HEAR ME?
17 WONDERFUL. I'M SELF-TAUGHT ON THIS COMPLICATED CONSOLE HERE.
18 I'M THE ONLY PERSON HERE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE AND ON
19 THE PREVIOUS SOUND ISSUES. I WANTED TO KNOW IF WE HAD BREAK
20 DOWN ON THE ACTUAL VEHICLES AS WE ARE GOING FORWARD AS FAR AS
21 COMMERCIAL VEHICLES, PRIVATE BUSES AND PRIVATE RIDE-SHARE AND
22 FIXED LANES THAT WE DEMONSTRATED OR WENT THROUGH IN THE
23 SCENARIO DIFFERENT OPTIONS WITH AS WE LOOK FOR A BALANCED
24 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM TO SERVE THE GOODS AND SERVICES,
25 [INDISCERNIBLE] INDIVIDUALS WITH GOALS OF EQUITY AND



MARCH 22, 2024

1 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. YEARS AGO, THE FIXED RAIL AND
2 RAILROAD SIDE OF THAT, THEY STARTED -- THE TAXING AUTHORITY
3 STARTED TAXING SWITCHES, WHICH IF YOU DIDN'T USE IT, OF
4 COURSE, THE UNDERLYING CARRIER WOULD PULL IT OUT BECAUSE
5 THEY'RE SAVING MONEY ON TAXES, BUT WITH THAT THE SHIFT MODAL
6 SHIFT TO MORE FREIGHT OVER ROAD TRUCKS SO COULD ONE OF THOSE
7 MITIGATING FACTORS BE RELOOKING AT EXPANSION AND ACTUALLY
8 MAYBE A TAX BREAK OR SOMETHING WHICH WOULD BENEFIT TRANSIT
9 INNER CITY TRANSPORTATION AND HELP WITH MODAL SHIFT ON
10 EXPANSION PROJECTS AND ALSO PUTTING SWITCHES THAT WOULD
11 FACILITATE A MORE -- A GREATER SHIFT TO FIXED GUIDEWAY OR
12 RAIL. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** DID YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO THAT?

15

16 **DAVE VAUTIN:** HAPPY TO QUICKLY RESPOND THROUGH THE CHAIR.
17 CERTAINLY WE'RE HAPPY TO SHARE THE FLEET ASSUMPTIONS, THE
18 CALIFORNIA RESOURCES BOARD GIVES FORECAST FOR THE MIX OF FLEET
19 GOING FORWARD. IN TERMS OF DIFFERENT OPTIONS GOING ON SCREEN
20 JUST TO SPEAK TO DIFFERENT MODES ONE OF THE REASONS WE'RE
21 EXPLORING ALL-LANE TOLLING IS BECAUSE OF THOSE CURRENT FREEWAY
22 TYPOLOGIES THE ONLY ONE THAT PROVIDES FOR RELIABILITY FOR
23 TRUCKS IS TOLLING ALL THE LANES THAT THE TRUCKS ARE NOT ABLE
24 TO USE THE EXPRESS LANE IS ON THE LEFT SIDE OF THE ROAD ONLY
25 FOR CARPOOLS, PAYING SINGLE OCCUPANCY DRIVERS AND TRANSIT.



MARCH 22, 2024

1 THEN SIMILARLY THE TRANSIT FRONT WE ALSO KNOW THERE ARE
2 CORRIDORS FOR CARPOOL EXPRESS LANE, BUS LANE, THE NEXT FLOW
3 LANES BEING IMPACTED BY THE TRAFFIC AND SO CARPOOL LANE
4 EXPRESS LANES JUST REALLY AUTOMOBILES AND SO THERE ARE
5 INTERESTING TRADE-OFFS WHEN IT COMES TO THE MODAL USAGE OF
6 EACH DIFFERENT LANE.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO OPEN THE
9 CONVERSATION TO OUR PUBLIC COMMENT. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS
10 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AND IF
11 ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM PLEASE
12 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, IN-PERSON
13 SPEAKERS SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL
14 CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO ONE ONLINE THAT WISHES TO
17 SPEAK NO RAISED HANDS. AND ALETA DUPREE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD.
20 I GREW UP WITH THIS THE NEW JERSEY TURNPIKE IN THE NEW YORK
21 STATE THRUWAY ET CETERA THEY TOLLED ALL THE LANES BECAUSE YOU
22 HAVE TO GO THROUGH TOLL GATES TO GET ON AND OFF I AM VERY
23 AWARE OF THE LEFT LANE PROBLEM I HAVE BEEN ON HIGHWAYS WITH
24 HOV LANES WHERE I QUALIFY BECAUSE I'M RIDING IN A RIDE-SHARE
25 VEHICLE BUT YET IT'S HARD TO GET OVER AND IF WE DO GET OVER



MARCH 22, 2024

1 I'M WONDERING ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET BACK OVER AND NOT
2 MISS THE EXIT. AND I WISH WE HAD A BETTER NETWORK FOR MOVING
3 FREIGHT. WE DON'T HAVE A GOOD ELECTRIFIED RAIL NETWORK FOR
4 MOVING FREIGHT. LIKE WE HAVE IN EUROPE AND PARTS OF ASIA SO WE
5 HAVE A LOT OF TRUCKS ON THE ROAD AND WE HAVE A SHORTAGE OF
6 TRUCK DRIVERS AND HAVE A NATIONAL NIGHT TIME PARKING PROBLEM.
7 SO ROADS HAVE TO BE FIXED AND I AM LOOKING FORWARD TO MORE
8 ELECTRIC VEHICLES I USE MYSELF AND IT WILL BE A TRANSFORMATION
9 HOW WE PAY FOR ROADS WHERE MORE PEOPLE WILL BE DOING THE
10 CASHLESS TOLLING AND I SUPPORT THAT AND TOLL EVASION CAN BE A
11 PROBLEM. TOLL EVASION WAS A PROBLEM WHEN WE HAD TOLL GATES AND
12 GAS TAX EVASION IS A PROBLEM BECAUSE OF WHAT'S CALLED OFF
13 DRIVE OFFS AT GAS STATIONS SO THERE ARE CHALLENGES BUT I THINK
14 THEY'RE SOLVABLE AND AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES ARE ON THE WAY. I USE
15 THEM. I'LL PROBABLY USE ONE LATER TODAY A FEW TIMES. THEY
16 WORK. HIGHWAYS ARE IMPORTANT BUT WE CAN'T KEEP BUILDING NEW
17 LANES. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I BELIEVE THAT CONCLUDES ITEM
20 7A WE WILL MOVE TO ITEM 7B NALUNGO CONLEY, ACTING STAFF
21 LIAISON.

22

23 **NALUNGO CONLEY:** THANK YOU GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS I
24 WILL BE BRIEF MY NAME IS NALUNGO CONLEY I'M STEPPING IN FOR
25 KY-NAM MILLER THERE IS ACTUALLY ONE ITEM THAT I WOULD LIKE TO



MARCH 22, 2024

1 BRING FORWARD FOR YOUR ATTENTION THERE WAS A FLYER INCLUDED IN
2 YOUR PACKET AND IT'S FOR THE NORMAN MINETA BAY AREA SUMMER
3 PROGRAM THIS IS FOR 15 AND OVER AND WE HAVE COMPLETED 9TH
4 GRADE BY THE TIME THE PROGRAM STARTS IT'S AN EXCELLENT
5 OPPORTUNITY PAID FOR BY THEM TO COME TO IN-PERSON AND FOR
6 REMOTE MEETINGS FOR THEM TO LEARN ABOUT URBAN PLANNING AND
7 EQUITY, HOUSING RESILIENCY BASICALLY WHAT MTC DOES AND A LOT
8 OF OUR PARTNER AGENCIES AND THEY GET OPPORTUNITY TO LEARN AND
9 TALK ABOUT SOME OF THE SAME ISSUES THAT ARE PRESENTED TO YOU
10 HERE AND LEARN WHAT IT MEANS TO BE A PUBLIC EMPLOYEE THIS IS A
11 GREAT OPPORTUNITY FOR THEM IF YOU WOULD SPREAD THE WORD WE
12 WOULD APPRECIATE IT. THE DEADLINE IS APRIL 28TH. SO, THERE IS
13 A LINK ON THE FLYER BUT ALSO YOU CAN E-MAIL KY-NAM DIRECTLY.
14 PLEASE LET THE YOUTH KNOW. WE WOULD LOVE THEM TO COME WE HAD
15 GREAT PARTICIPATION LAST YEAR. IT HAS BEEN INCREASING EVERY
16 YEAR, I THINK WE HAD 110 OR 115 PARTICIPANTS LAST SUMMER SO WE
17 ARE HOPING TO MEET AND/OR EXCEED THAT. THANK YOU. THAT
18 CONCLUDES MY REPORT.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. I LOOK FORWARD TO
21 HELPING SPREAD THE WORD. AND I REMEMBER LAST YEAR WE GOT AN E-
22 MAIL WITH GREAT LANGUAGE TO PUT IN LINKEDIN, TWITTER.
23 HOPEFULLY FOLKS CAN SPREAD THE WORD WITH YOUR NETWORKS. ARE
24 THERE ANY ITEMS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS
25 ITEM? IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, PLEASE



MARCH 22, 2024

1 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. MEMBERS OF THE
2 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE TO SPEAK.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
5 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
6 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM WE HAVE CHRIS
9 FITZGERALD OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS
10 SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIR WHO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM FOR INFORMATION.
11 CHRIS, IF YOU ARE READY?

12

13 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR, I HAVE NOTHING
14 TO REPORT AT THIS TIME.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. CLERK, WERE THERE ANY ITEMS
17 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? AND
18 IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM,
19 PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND IN-
20 PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE
21 PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
24 ITEM NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 7D,
2 MEMBERS OF THE MTC COUNCIL MAY REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT
3 ISSUES OR EVENTS. THIS IS OUR COUNCIL MEMBER REPORTS. DOES
4 ANYONE HAVE ANYTHING THEY WOULD LIKE TO SHARE? I SEE WENDY AND
5 ADINA.

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS:** RECENTLY WE LEARNED IN MARIN COUNTY WE GOT
8 ALMOST \$2 MILLION FROM THE FEDERAL CONNECTING COMMUNITIES
9 EARMARKED PROGRAM FOR A PATHWAY PROJECT THAT CONNECTS
10 NEIGHBORHOODS AND THE NORTHERN SAN RAFAEL AREA TO THE CIVIC
11 CENTER AND SPECIFICALLY TO THE BENICIA SCHOOL THIS IS
12 DEDICATED TO A MEMBER OF THE COMMUNITY WHO LIVED IN THAT
13 NEIGHBORHOOD. UP UNTIL THEN CHILDREN WHO WERE GOING TO THAT
14 SCHOOL WOULD HAVE TO CROSS TWO MAJOR INTERCHANGES SPEAKING OF
15 INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENTS IN ORDER TO GET TO SCHOOL SO PEOPLE
16 WERE DRIVING TO SCHOOL. SO WE BROUGHT TOGETHER MEMBERS OF
17 VARIOUS DIFFERENT AGENCIES, CITY OF SAN RAFAEL, SMART,
18 CALTRANS, THE SCHOOL TO COME TOGETHER ON CONSENSUS THIS WAS A
19 MUCH NEEDED PATHWAY AND WE'RE EXCITED TO HAVE RECEIVED FUNDING
20 AND TO SEE THIS IMPROVEMENT IN ORDER TO GET TO SCHOOL. THANK
21 YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** ADINA.

24



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** THIS IS A REGIONAL THING, IN A PREVIOUS AGENDA
2 ITEM ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT THERE'S A SUBSTANTIVE UPDATE
3 ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT WORK PLAN KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
4 AND METRICS MONDAY AT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL
5 SO IF ANYONE IS INTERESTED IN THOSE IMPORTANT DEMONSTRATES
6 CHECK OUT THE MTC LEGISTAR FOR THE NEXT STEPS ON THAT.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY WHO I MAY HAVE MISSED
9 WITH A HAND UP? YES, HOWARD?

10

11 **HOWARD WONG:** I WANTED TO PIGGYBACK ON WENDI'S REPORT. IT
12 REMINDS ME THAT SAN FRANCISCO ALSO GOT A CONNECTING
13 COMMUNITIES FEDERAL GRANT, I THINK IT WAS SOMETHING LIKE \$2
14 MILLION TO STUDY RECONNECTING THE LOWER FILLMORE TO THE UPPER
15 FILLMORE. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU KNOW THE HISTORY OF
16 REDEVELOPMENT IN SAN FRANCISCO WHEN THE LOWER FILLMORE
17 DISTRICT PREDOMINANTLY, AFRO AMERICAN NEIGHBORHOOD WAS
18 DECIMATED BY THE DEMOLITION OF THE ENTIRE AREA FOR PURPOSES
19 OF, AS THEY CALL IT REMOVAL OF LIGHT THAT'S ACTUALLY ONE OF
20 THE -- WAS THE JAZZ DISTRICT OF SAN FRANCISCO DRIVING
21 COMMUNITY AND THE DIVISION OF THAT NEIGHBORHOOD RESULTED FROM
22 THE UNDERGROUND PASSAGE, UNDERGROUND ROAD UNDER FILLMORE
23 STREET, BUT AS A RESULT OF THAT WIDENING OF THE ROAD, DIVIDED
24 LOWER FILLMORE FROM MUCH OF THE OTHER PARTS OF THE CITY. SO,
25 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS DOING SOME REALLY GOOD THINGS IN



MARCH 22, 2024

1 INVESTING AND TRYING TO RERESURRECT THE WRONGS OF THE PAST.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. SEEING NO MORE HANDS, I WILL

5 MOVE US ON TO AGENDA ITEM 7E, WHICH IS -- YES?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

8 RECEIVED ON THAT ITEM. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO

9 SPEAK OR ON ZOOM.

10

11 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. CONTINUED BUSINESS ARE THERE

12 MEMBERS ON THE COUNCIL WHO WOULD LIKE TO BRING UP NEW BUSINESS

13 FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITIONS TO FUTURE AGENDA? NOW IS THE TIME?

14 I SEE JOHNNY.

15

16 **JOHNNY PARKER:** I APOLOGIZE. I DIDN'T PREPARE MY NOTES. BUT I

17 ATTENDED AND WROTE DOWN SOME GOOD NOTES FOR THE -- THERE WAS

18 AN UPDATE TO THE HIGHWAY 37 PROJECT. I KNOW THAT COUNCIL

19 MEMBER HANKERSON ALSO ATTENDED. SO, I WAS THINKING THAT MAYBE

20 HE WOULD HAVE SAID SOMETHING TODAY ON IT BUT HE'S NOT PRESENT.

21 SO, I WOULD LIKE TO, MAYBE AT THE NEXT MEETING, SHARE MY

22 NOTES. THERE WERE SOME VERY GOOD -- IT WAS VERY GOOD

23 DISCUSSION, AND SOMEWHAT OPTIMISTIC ABOUT WHAT'S COMING UP FOR

24 THE HIGHWAY 37 PROJECT.

25



MARCH 22, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. RANDI, DO YOU HAVE YOUR HAND
2 UP? OKAY. ANYBODY ELSE? NEW BUSINESS? SEEING NO HANDS. WE'RE -
3 -

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES, THANKS VERY MUCH MADAM CHAIR.
10 I WOULD JUST BE INTERESTED IN SOME, SORT OF, GOING FORWARD,
11 2050-STYLE VISION OF THE ELECTRICAL NEEDS OF THE MTC SERVING
12 AREA, GOING FORWARD, WITH THESE VARIOUS INITIATIVES, JUST, HOW
13 IS THAT PACING THE SWITCH, IF YOU WILL. OUR SHIFT. THANK YOU.
14 POWER SHIFT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED
17 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AND IF ANYONE
18 FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE ITEM, USE THE
19 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
20 SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
23 FOR THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC
24 COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED
25 HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.



MARCH 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. OUR FINAL ITEM IS
3 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY
4 COUNCIL WILL BE HELD ON FRIDAY APRIL 26TH, 2024 AT 10:00 A.M.
5 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO
6 CALIFORNIA. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED
7 TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR TIME. [ADJOURNED]

8



Broadcasting Government