METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
2	WEDNESDAY, MARCH 13 TH , 2024, 12:00 PM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: OKAY. WE HAVE ESTABLISHED
6	QUORUM ON MTC AND ABAG SIDE.
7	
8	KATHLEEN KANE: THROUGH THE CHAIR, WE, UNFORTUNATELY, CANNOT
9	CONVENE ABAG UNTIL WE HAVE THE NOTICED LOCATION, BUT WE CAN GO
10	AHEAD AND CONTINUE.
11	
12	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: I'LL REMIND IT'S NOT THE
13	FIRST TIME WE HAVE ENCOUNTERED THIS SITUATION. I'M ASSUMING
14	MORE COMMUNICATION WITH THE RESPECTIVE LOCATION, THE COUNCIL
15	WAS NOTIFIED AND THE CLERK AND SO FORTH. TO MEMBERS OF THE
16	PUBLIC THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE WHALE WE GET STARTED HERE.
17	I DID GET WITH MY COLLEAGUE CARLOS ROMERO WHILE WE WAIT FOR
18	QUORUM TO BE ESTABLISHED FOR THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATION.
19	
20	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: YES, SIR.
21	
22	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU, CHAIR.
23	
24	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: MY NAME IS ALFREDO
25	PEDROZA, CHAIR OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY



1	OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. I'M GOING TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER.
2	PROCEEDING TO ITEM ONE, WHICH IS ROLL CALL.
3	
4	CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU, CHAIR. ABE-KOGA?
5	
6	V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ?
9	
10	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER? JOSEFOWITZ IS
13	ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?
14	
15	NATHAN MILEY: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
18	
19	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA?
22	
23	ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
24	
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCHAFF, NON-VOTING?



1 2 LIBBY SCHAAF: HERE. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER THAO IS HERE BUT SHE STEPPED 4 5 AWAY. 6 7 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: CORRECT. 8 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RABBITT? WE DO HAVE A QUORUM. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE 11 SPECIAL REQUEST FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FOR 12 EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCES FROM COMMISSIONER RONEN. THOSE ARE NOT 13 PROPS IN THE BACK AND IS PART OF THE REASON SHE IS NOT 14 PARTICIPATING. COMMISSIONER RONEN. 15 16 HILLARY RONEN: I AM REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER 17 AB 2449 BECAUSE I'M RECOVERING FROM KNEE RECONSTRUCTION 18 SURGERY THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER 18. 19 20 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER 21 22 RONEN. WE'RE ADDING YOU TO THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AS PRESENT ALL RIGHT WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM TWO, PUBLIC COMMENT 23 FOR ITEMS NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA. I'LL ASK STAFF IF WE HAVE ANY 24 25 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
3	THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
4	AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
5	PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.
6	
7	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU. I DO
8	ANTICIPATE MEMBERS ARE GOING TO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE
9	AGENDA ITEMS THERE ARE SPEAKER CARDS, IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK
10	GRAB ONE OF THOSE. ANY COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS? I DON'T
11	SEE ANY FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS. PROCEEDING TO OUR NEXT ITEM.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: IF WE CAN NOTE FOR THE RECORD NO PUBLIC
14	COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
15	BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE NO
16	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
17	
18	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.
19	PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT
20	AND I DO HAVE A REPORT-OUT. SINCE WE'LL HAVE THE FULL REPORT-
21	OUT ON THE POTENTIAL LABOR STANDARDS INCLUDED IN BAHFA'S
22	REGIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN I'LL FOREGO MY CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT
23	AND I'LL ASK IF CHAIR ROMERO HAS ANYTHING TO REPORT AS WELL.
24	



- 1 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: I THINK THE ONLY THING TO
- 2 REPORT IS WE HAD SUCCESSFUL SET OF LOBBYING DISCUSSIONS UP IN
- 3 SACRAMENTO WHICH WE TALKED ABOUT, THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND
- 4 MANY OF US WERE THERE. THANK YOU TO ALL WHO WENT.

5

- 6 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU CHAIR ROMERO.
- 7 SOME OF US ON DAY THREE OR FOUR OF MTC ABAG. THANK YOU FOR
- 8 BEING THERE. AND THANK YOU TO COLLEAGUES WHO PARTICIPATE WE
- 9 TRIED TO BRING SOME OF THE NEWER COMMISSIONERS WITH THE OLDER
- 10 COMMISSIONERS, JUST BASED OFF EXPERIENCE, AND IT WAS WELL-
- 11 RECEIVED AND I APPRECIATE OUR LEGISLATORS UNDERSTANDING THE
- 12 WORK WE DO AND IT WAS VERY WELL-RECEIVED. AT THIS POINT WE'RE
- 13 GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM FIVE. THIS IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. SO
- 14 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM SIX WHEN WE COME BACK TO ABAG'S
- 15 CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT CONSENT
- 16 CALENDAR. COMMISSIONERS WE HAVE AN ITEM ON CONSENT. IS THERE
- 17 ANY QUESTIONS? CONCERNS? COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY FROM
- 18 COMMISSIONERS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR CONSENT
- 19 CALENDAR?

20

- 21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVE ON THIS ITEM
- 22 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
- 23 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

24

25 SPEAKER: MOVE APPROVAL. SECOND.



1	
2	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: MOTION AND SECOND.
3	COUNSEL?
4	
5	KATHLEEN KANE: FOR THE RECORD THE CHAIR SAID AN ITEM THERE ARE
6	TWO ITEMS AS PART OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR HERE 6A AND 6B.
7	
8	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: MY PAPERS ARE OUT OF
9	ORDER. I'M DOING THE BEST I CAN. THANK YOU FOR THAT COUNSEL.
10	FIRST BY PAPAN SECOND BY GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST BY PAPAN SECOND GLOVER. ABE-KOGA?
13	
14	V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ?
17	
18	CINDY CHAVEZ: AYE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: IMPLEMENT SUGGEST ABSENT. GLOVER?
21	
22	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY?
25	



1	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
4	
5	GINA PAPAN: YES.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA?
8	
9	ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?
12	
13	HILLARY RONEN: HERE I MEAN YES. SORRY.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER THAO? AND COMMISSIONER
16	RABBITT IS NOT HERE. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.
17	
18	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU ALL. PROCEEDING
19	TO THE MAIN EVENT. I'M GOING TO CLARIFY WITH COUNSEL. WHILE
20	ABAG HAS NOT CONVENED, I HOPE WE CAN TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ALL
21	AT ONE TIME. THIS ITEM, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. SO TO
22	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC DEMAND EXPECTATIONS, IF YOU WANT TO
23	COMMENT ON THE LABOR STANDARDS THIS IS THE MOMENT IN TIME?



KATHLEEN KANE: THAT'S CORRECT. THIS IS THE ENTIRETY OF THE 1 HEARING ON THE INFORMATIONAL ITEM, AND THE PUBLIC WILL HAVE 2 3 ONE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK ON IT. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: CONFIRM WE HAVE NOT 6 ESTABLISHED THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATION FOR OAKLAND? 7 8 SPEAKER: CORRECT. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THIS IS ITEM SEVEN. 10 11 REGIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN LABOR STANDARDS. THIS IS AN ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE THAT HASN'T CONVENED YET. BUT IT'S THE BAHFA 12 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. FOLLOWING OUR 13 DIRECTION AT THE FEBRUARY 14TH MEETING FOR STAFF RETURN WITH 14 15 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON POTENTIAL LABOR STANDARDS, I BELIEVE OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ANDY FREMIER WILL INTRODUCE THE ITEM. 16 17 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU, CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. 18 WE HAVE BEEN MEETING REGULARLY WITH A LOT OF THE BROAD LANE OR 19 REPRESENTATION. AND WHILE I DON'T LIKE TO JINX DISCUSSIONS WE 20 21 THINK THEY'RE GOING VERY WELL, BUT WE HAVE SEVERAL MORE 22 PLANNED IN COMING WEEKS BUT BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT CONCLUDED 23 THOSE DISCUSSIONS TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS REALLY JUST INFORMATION. AND OUR GOAL FOR TODAY IS TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE 24 COMMON VOCABULARY AS WE TALK ABOUT LABOR STANDARD OPTIONS AND 25



- 1 WHAT TRADE-OFFS THERE ARE FOR DIFFERENT STANDARDS. WE EXPECT
- 2 TO RETURN TO THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON APRIL 10TH TO THE JOINT
- 3 COMMITTEE, FROM OUR DISCUSSIONS AS WELL WITH LABOR
- 4 REPRESENTATIVES AND STAKEHOLDERS AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE
- 5 I THINK IT'S SAFE TO SAY THERE IS REAL COMMON INTEREST IN
- 6 ENSURING THAT STRONG PROTECTIONS FOR LABOR ARE INCLUDED IN OUR
- 7 DIRECTION AND THAT THEY'RE EFFECTIVE IN EVERY COUNTY
- 8 ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THERE IS A LOT OF DIVERSITY IN THE COUNTIES
- 9 AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO PRESENTING THESE
- 10 STANDARDS THAT STRIKE A BALANCE FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION IN THE
- 11 NEXT MONTH AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO KATE HARTLEY WHO WILL WALK
- 12 US THROUGH THE PRESENTATION.
- 14 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE
- 15 STAFF'S COMMITMENT TO HAVING AN HONEST AND ROBUST
- 16 CONVERSATION, THIS IS A FRAGILE DISCUSSION. WE'RE UNITED IN
- 17 THE OUTCOME OF HOUSING WE'RE TRYING TO CHIEF AND WHETHER
- 18 WALKING THE HALLS OF SACRAMENTO, WE ARE U INDICT. BUT WE CAN'T
- 19 LET PERFECT GET IN THE WAY OF PROGRESS. PERFECT WOULD BE IDEAL
- 20 BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE PROGRESS AND WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY AROUND
- 21 THIS TO GALVANIZE TOGETHER TO CREATE MEANINGFUL RESOURCES FOR
- 22 OUR REGION BUT IT'S GOING TAKE US ALL LEANING IN AND NOT
- 23 TRYING TO BE PERFECT IN THIS MOMENT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE
- 24 TRYING TO ACHIEVE. SO I WANT TO THANK ALL PARTNERS AND
- 25 STAKEHOLDERS. WE HAVE ALL HAD COUNTLESS MEETINGS, COUNTLESS



PHONE CALLS AND E-MAILS WITH ALL SIDES OF THIS SITUATION. BUT 1 I WANT TO THANK STAFF. SO I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO KATE. 2 3 KATE HARTLEY: THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE 4 5 MEMBERS. AS YOU HAVE HEARD, DISCUSSIONS ARE ONGOING WITH OUR PARTNERS, OUR LABOR PARTNERS AND DEVELOPERS AND STAKEHOLDERS. 6 WE WANT TO TAKE TODAY, USE TODAY AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE 7 8 SOME BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND CONTEXT TO HELP YOU AND OUR BOARDS GO THROUGH YOUR DECISION-MAKING PROCESS ON THIS ISSUE. 9 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND AS A REFRESHER, AND I THINK WE WANT TO 10 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE TOO. THANK YOU. AS A REFRESHER, BAHFA'S 11 AUTHORITIES ARE LOCATED IN OUR ENABLING STATUTE, IT'S THE SAN 12 FRANCISCO BAY AREA REGIONAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING ACT. THE ACT 13 DOES NOT ALLOW US TO IMPOSE LABOR STANDARDS ON THE 14 15 JURISDICTIONS. OUR STATUTE COULD BE AMENDED, HOWEVER, TO SAY 16 THAT BAHFA MAY IMPOSE LABOR STANDARDS, BUT NOT ALL LABOR STANDARDS ARE ACCESSIBLE IN THAT WAY. OUR GENERAL COUNSEL HAS 17 ADVISED THAT EVEN IF OUR ACT IS AMENDED, WE CANNOT REQUIRE 18 CITIES AND COUNTIES TO USE A PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENT, FOR 19 EXAMPLE, DUE TO FEDERAL LEGAL REQUIREMENTS THAT APPLIED FOR 20

23 APPROPRIATE STANDARD FOR BAHFA AND POTENTIALLY THE WHOLE

PLEASE. TO DETERMINE WHAT COULD BE AN ALLOWABLE AND

24 REGION THROUGH AN AMENDMENT TO OUR ENABLING STATUTE, WE WANT

PLAS AND I'LL SAY MORE ABOUT THAT IN A MINUTE. NEXT SLIDE

25 TO GIVE A SHORT SUMMARY OF DIFFERENT LABOR STANDARD FRAMEWORKS

21



- 1 THAT ARE CURRENTLY IN USE IN CALIFORNIA. SO, FIRST UP IS THE 2 CALIFORNIA LABOR CODE, AND THAT SAYS THAT PROJECTS THAT USE
- 3 PUBLIC FUNDS MUST PAY PREVAILING WAGES. HOWEVER THERE IS A
- 4 SECTION IN THE CODE IT'S 1720C FIVE THAT EXEMPTS PRIVATELY
- 5 OWNED RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION IF THE PUBLIC FUNDS USED FOR
- 6 THAT MEET CERTAIN CRITERIA. AND IT'S VERY, VERY EASY FOR AN
- 7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT TO MEET THOSE TERMS. SO, IT'S
- 8 SIMPLY APPLYING THE LABOR CODE DOES NOT GUARANTEE A PAYMENT
- 9 STANDARD FOR WORKERS UNLIKE OTHER PUBLIC WORKS PROJECTS, LIKE
- 10 INFRASTRUCTURE INSTALLATIONS, THAT ARE OWNED BY A PUBLIC
- 11 ENTITY. THERE ARE MANY WAYS THAT WE DO APPLY AN ENFORCEABLE
- 12 PREVAILING WAGE HOWEVER. FEDERAL FUNDS THAT FLOW THROUGH
- 13 CITIES AND COUNTIES LIKE CDBG AND HUONG PROVIDE PREVAILING
- 14 WAGES SOME CITIES IN OUR REGION ATTACH A PREVAILING WAGE
- 15 REOUIREMENT TO ALL FUNDS THEY PROVIDE REGARDLESS OF SOURCE OF
- 16 FUNDS, AND CERTAIN PROGRAMS BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF
- 17 HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT REQUIRE PREVAILING WAGES.
- 18 THE NEXT STANDARD WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT TODAY CONSISTS OF THREE
- 19 MAIN REOUIREMENTS, AN ENFORCEABLE PREVAILING WAGE STANDARD,
- 20 CARE PAYMENTS FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE 50 UNITS AND OVER, AND USE
- 21 OF APPROVED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS FOR BUILDINGS THAT ARE 50
- 22 UNITS AND MORE THIS STANDARD IS INCLUDED IN RECENTLY PASSED
- 23 STATE STREAMLINING LEGISLATION A.B. 2011 WHICH IS BUFFY WICKS
- 24 BILL AND IT ALSO APPLIES TO SB FOUR ALSO KNOWN AS YES IN GOD'S
- 25 BACKYARD AND IS STREAMLINING AS WELL ALSO IN MODIFIED FORM



- 1 SENATOR BILL 423 ANOTHER STREAMLINING PIECE OF LEGISLATION AT
- 2 THE STATE AND SB 423 THE WAGES HEALTHCARE AND APPRENTICESHIP
- 3 REQUIREMENT IS JOINED WITH REQUIREMENT TO USE SKILLED TRAINED
- 4 LABOR FOR ANY MARKET RATE MIXED INCOME BUILDING THAT IS OVER
- 5 85 FOOT HOWEVER 100 AFFORDABLE DEVELOPMENTS THAT ARE EXEMPT,
- 6 BRINGS US TO FRAMEWORK WHICH IS GENERAL SPEAKING RESTRICTIVE
- 7 STANDARD THAT REQUIRES WORKFORCE TO BE SKILLED JOURNEY PERSONS
- 8 AND GRADUATES OF AN APPROVED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM IT WAS
- 9 RECENTLY INCLUDED IN SB SENATE BILL SIX, SB SIX, WHICH IS A
- 10 BILL THAT ALLOWS RESIDENTIAL USE ON COMMERCIALLY ZONED
- 11 PROPERTY WITHOUT REZONING BUT IF YOU USE SKILLED AND TRAINED
- 12 WORKFORCE. FINALLY OUR LAST FRAMEWORK TO PRESENT TODAY IS
- 13 PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENTS, PLAS AND AS MENTIONED OUR OFFICE OF
- 14 GENERAL COUNSEL HAS ADVISE THAT FEDERAL LEGAL REQUIREMENTS
- 15 PREEMPTING STATE AND LOCAL LAWS PREVENT BAHFA FROM IMPOSING
- 16 PLA ON ALL JURISDICTIONS REGARDLESS OF THE LANGUAGE IN OUR
- 17 STATUTE. WE COULD IMPOSE, WE COULD ADOPT A PLA FOR BAHFA'S OWN
- 18 FUNDS, 20% OF FUNDS IF WE WERE TO MAKE CERTAIN FINDINGS ABOUT
- 19 BAHFA'S ROLE AS A MARKET PARTICIPANT PROCURING LABOR SERVICES
- 20 BUT GIVEN THE STATUTORILY REQUIRED DISTRIBUTION OF BOND
- 21 FUNDING TO NINE COUNTIES THOSE MARKET PARTICIPANT FINDINGS FOR
- 22 BAHFA WOULD NOT EXTEND TO ALL THE COUNTIES BECAUSE BAHFA WOULD
- 23 HAVE NO ROLE IN THE PROCUREMENT OF SERVICES AT THE CITY AND
- 24 COUNTY LEVEL. SO, THIS PUTS US IN A VERY DIFFERENT POSITION
- 25 FROM AREAS THAT RECENTLY HAVE EMPLOYED A PLA, SUCH AS ALAMEDA



- 1 COUNTY, THAT'S THE ONE-COUNTY STANDARD, AS WELL AS IN LOS
- 2 ANGELES, THE LACOSTA LEGISLATION RECENTLY PASSED THAT REQUIRES
- 3 A PLA, AGAIN THAT'S FOR ONE COUNTY ONLY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 4 SO, AS THE BOARDS CONSIDER THESE COMPETING FRAMEWORKS WHICH
- 5 HAVE COMPLEXITY WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT THEIR APPLICATION
- 6 THROUGHOUT THE REGION, WE WANT TO PROVIDE FURTHER CONTEXT FOR
- 7 DECISION-MAKING, DRAWING ON FEEDBACK FROM THIS COMMITTEE, AS
- 8 WELL AS BAHFA'S GUIDING PRINCIPLES SET FORTH IN OUR BUSINESS
- 9 PLAN. THESE INCLUDE THE GOALS OF EXPANDING THE PROTECTION OF
- 10 WORKERS IN THE BAY AREA'S AFFORDABLE HOUSING CONSTRUCTION
- 11 INDUSTRY, BUILDING AND PRESERVING HOUSING AT SCALE TO ADDRESS
- 12 THE REGION'S LONG-TERM HOUSING SHORTAGE, AND IN ORDER TO MEET
- 13 OUR GOALS PURSUING NEW STRATEGIES FOR CONTROLLING COST AND
- 14 DELIVERING HOUSING IN QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE. REGARDING THE
- 15 OUESTION OF WORKER PROTECTIONS, IT'S HELPFUL TO FIRST
- 16 UNDERSTAND WHO'S DEVELOPING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA
- 17 AND HOW LABOR STANDARDS ARE APPLIED IN DIFFERENT CONTEXT. THIS
- 18 IS A VERY HIGH-LEVEL DISCUSSION. AND I'M VERY MUCH
- 19 GENERALIZING HERE, BUT, GENERALLY SPEAKING, IF YOU LOOK AT THE
- 20 DATA FROM THE LAST FEW YEARS OF ALLOCATIONS OF TAX CREDITS AND
- 21 TAX EXEMPT BONDS, WHICH, AS YOU KNOW ARE THE MAIN WAYS THAT
- 22 PEOPLE BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TWO DIFFERENT DEVELOPER TYPES
- 23 EMERGE. FIRST OUR DEVELOPERS ARE THAT USE LOCAL FUNDS, FROM
- 24 CITY AND COUNTIES WHICH THEY'RE LOCATED AND THEY'RE USUALLY
- 25 THOUGH NOT ALWAYS NON-PROFIT CORPORATIONS, THEY ALMOST ALWAYS



- 1 PAY PREVAILING WAGES, AND SINCE 2022 WHEN A.B. 2011 PASSED, WE
- 2 HAVE NOT SEEN ANY PROJECTS IN THE WHOLE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,
- 3 ACTUALLY, MOVE FORWARD USING THAT WAGE'S HEALTH CARE TRAINING
- 4 STANDARD. SO, THE APPLICATION OF THAT STANDARD WOULD ADD
- 5 HEALTH CARE AND TRAINING REQUIREMENTS TO AN ENFORCEABLE
- 6 PREVAILING WAGE STANDARD THAT THIS COHORT OF DEVELOPERS IS
- 7 ALREADY USING ALMOST ALL THE TIME. THE PROJECTS THAT THIS
- 8 COHORT BUILD ARE ALSO TYPICALLY SUBJECT TO ADDITIONAL
- 9 REGULATORY OBLIGATIONS THAT OFTEN COME WITH LOCAL FUNDS. SO
- 10 TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COSTS TEND TO BE CORRESPONDINGLY HIGH. THE
- 11 SECOND GROUP OF DEVELOPERS DOES GOT TAKE LOCAL FUNDS. THEY ARE
- 12 OFTEN, THOUGH NOT ALWAYS, FOR-PROFIT COMPANIES. THEY USUALLY
- 13 FINANCE THEIR PROJECTS WITH THREE SOURCES OF FUNDS, TAX
- 14 CREDITS, TAX EXEMPT DEBT, AND A VERY HIGH-LEVEL OF DEFERRED
- 15 DEVELOPER FEES. THEY ARE NOT SUBJECT TO THE REGULATORY
- 16 REQUIREMENTS THAT OFTEN ATTACH TO LOCAL FUNDING. THEIR
- 17 DEVELOPMENT COSTS ARE USUALLY QUITE LOW, AND BECAUSE TAX
- 18 CREDITS DO NOT REOUIRE PREVAILING WAGES, PREVAILING WAGE
- 19 COMPLIANCE IS NOT TYPICAL ON THESE JOBS. THE APPLICATION OF
- 20 LABOR STANDARDS TO THESE PROJECTS WOULD PROVIDE ENFORCEABLE
- 21 WORKER PROTECTIONS WHERE THEY DO NOT NOW EXIST FOR THE MOST
- 22 PART. NOT IN ALL CASES, AGAIN, BUT IN THE MAJORITY OF THE
- 23 PROJECTS BUILD BY THAT PARTICULAR COHORT OF DEVELOPERS. AND TO
- 24 GIVE YOU A SENSE OF SCALE ABOUT THESE TWO DEVELOPER TYPES, WE
- 25 LOOKED AT SIDLAC AND TCAC PROJECTS, PROJECTS THAT GOT AWARDED



- 1 FUNDS BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023. THERE WERE 90 PROJECTS. THEY
- 2 BUILT ABOUT 12,000 HOMES, AND OF THESE 55 INCLUDED LOCAL FUNDS
- 3 FOR THEIR PROJECTS. AND OVER 90% OF THOSE PROJECTS PAID
- 4 PREVAILING WAGES FOR THEIR PROJECTS. 35 OF THE TOTAL 90
- 5 PROJECTS DID NOT USE LOCAL FUNDS, AND APPROXIMATELY 80 PERCENT
- 6 OF THOSE DEVELOPMENTS DID NOT INDICATE ANY ATTENTION TO PAY
- 7 PREVAILING WAGES. SO, OF THE 12,000 APARTMENTS THAT WERE
- 8 FUNDED BETWEEN '21 AND 2023 IN THE BAY AREA, ABOUT 7,000 WERE
- 9 BUILT BY -- OR IN PROCESS WITH DEVELOPERS USING LOCAL FUNDS
- 10 AND MOST PAYING PREVAILING WAGES. 5,000 BUILT WITH JUST CREDIT
- 11 BONDS DEFERRED DEVELOPER FEE AND 80% OF THOSE NOT PAYING
- 12 PREVAILING WAGES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SHIFTING NOW TO HOUSING
- 13 NEEDS, WE ALL KNOW THE CONSEQUENCES OF THE REGION'S LACK OF
- 14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE SEE IT EVERY DAY. AND IT'S ESPECIALLY
- 15 ALARMING TO KNOW THAT HOMELESSNESS CONTINUES TO RISE IN MOST
- 16 COUNTIES. THE NEED TO BUILD AT SCALE AND BETTER MEET OUR
- 17 REGION'S AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDS IS IN STARK RELIEF ON THESE
- 18 SLIDES SHOWING OUR ACHIEVEMENT OF THE FIFTH RHNA CYCLE,
- 19 ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU COMPARE IT TO THE SIXTH RHNA CYCLE TARGET.
- 20 BETWEEN 2015 AND 2023 PRODUCTION OF MARKET RATE HOUSING WAS
- 21 TWICE THAT WHICH IT EXCEEDED THE TARGET BY 100%. AND
- 22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING LAGGED SIGNIFICANTLY BELOW THE TARGETS. THE
- 23 HIGH COST OF HOUSING AND THE LACK OF SUFFICIENT RESOURCES TO
- 24 BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING ARE MAJOR FACTORS IN THIS FAILURE TO
- 25 REACH THE TARGETS THAT WE SEE IN THE FIFTH CYCLE. NEXT SLIDE



- 1 PLEASE. MEETING OUR SIXTH CYCLE RHNA TARGETS WILL PROVE MORE
- 2 CHALLENGING AT EVERY SINGLE LEVEL. THE 441,000 HOMES NEEDED
- 3 FOR THE BAY AREA IS 235% OF WHAT THE FIFTH CYCLE TARGET WAS.
- 4 AND THE HIGH-LEVEL OF AFFORDABLE HOMES NEEDED IS ESPECIALLY
- 5 DAUNTING. TO MEET THESE NEW GOALS AND TO FULFILL ITS MISSION,
- 6 BAHFA, THE CITIES, THE COUNTIES, THE ENTIRE HOUSING INDUSTRY
- 7 HAS TO BUILD SIGNIFICANTLY MORE UNITS AND TO DO THAT WE HAVE
- 8 TO CHANGE THE WAY THAT WE'RE DOING THINGS NOW. NEXT SLIDE. AS
- 9 I STATED, ONE ISSUE THAT MAKES OUR GOALS ESPECIALLY DIFFICULT
- 10 IS THE HIGH COST TO BUILD IN THE BAY AREA. THE DEVELOPMENT
- 11 COST YOU SEE COME, AGAIN, FROM THE PROJECTS THAT WE ANALYZED
- 12 BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023 THAT GOT SIDLAC AWARDS. WE KNOW THAT
- 13 LOCALLY FINISHED PROJECTS COST SIGNIFICANTLY MORE THAN
- 14 PROJECTS THAT DO NOT USE LOCAL FUNDS AND USUALLY DON'T PAY
- 15 PREVAILING WAGES. THE COST OF THOSE PROJECTS FUNDED BETWEEN
- 16 2021 AND '23, IN THE SECOND COLUMN, THOSE THAT DID NOT TAKE
- 17 LOCAL FUNDS IS IN THE THIRD COLUMN, AND THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
- 18 THOSE DEVELOPMENT TYPES IN EACH COUNTY IS SHOWN IN THE LAST
- 19 COLUMN. THESE COST DIFFERENCES TELL US THAT MUCH MORE IS GOING
- 20 ON BEYOND JUST THE PAYMENT OF PREVAILING WAGES. THIS
- 21 INFORMATION GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO WORK TOGETHER TO
- 22 UNDERSTAND EXACTLY WHAT IS GOING ON, WHAT ARE NON-ESSENTIAL
- 23 REGULATORY REOUIREMENTS THAT WE COULD REDUCE, HOW COULD WE
- 24 WORK TOGETHER TO BETTER EXPEDITE FINANCING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL
- 25 TO FINANCE MORE EFFICIENTLY OUR PROJECTS, TO MOVE FASTER,



- 1 THAT'S THE BEST WAY TO SAVE MONEY ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 2 DEVELOPMENT, TO PRIORITIZE PROJECTS THAT CAN USE STREAMLINING
- 3 LEGISLATION SO THAT THEY DON'T WAIT YEARS FOR ENTITLEMENT, AND
- 4 FACE THOSE YEARS OF COST ESCALATIONS WHICH BRING US INTO THAT
- 5 \$900,000 RANGE. AND WE CAN PRIORITIZE REFOCUSING ON OUR DESIGN
- 6 STANDARDS WITH THE GOAL OF BUILDING SAFE, DECENT, AND COST
- 7 EFFECTIVE HOUSING. ALL OF THIS TAKES MORE RESEARCH BUT WE KNOW
- 8 THAT THERE IS SIGNIFICANT OPPORTUNITY IN THIS DATA TO WORK
- 9 TOGETHER TO HELP BRING COST DOWN SO THAT WE CAN USE OUR
- 10 PRECIOUS RESOURCES TO BUILD MORE. NEXT SLIDE. THE COST TRENDS
- 11 ARE WORSENING, BUT WITH A SUCCESSFUL BOND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
- 12 THE RESOURCES WE NEED TO START IMPLEMENTING THIS BETTER
- 13 FINANCING SYSTEM AND THESE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES THAT CAN
- 14 HELP US REVERSE THIS TREND. NEXT SLIDE. SO, TO SUMMARIZE, WE
- 15 KNOW THAT A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF TAX CREDIT FUNDED HOUSING
- 16 BUILT NOW APPLYING ZERO LABOR STANDARDS AND IN THIS SETTING
- 17 WORKERS CAN BE VULNERABLE. BUT WE ALSO KNOW THAT ESTABLISHING
- 18 RIGID AND RESTRICTIVE STANDARDS ALONG WITH OTHER REGULATORY
- 19 BURDENS CAN DRIVE COSTS UP AND THAT WILL MAKE IT VERY
- 20 DIFFICULT TO REACH OUR GOALS. WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY, WITH
- 21 OUR REGIONAL HOUSING BOND, TO EXPAND WORKER PROTECTIONS,
- 22 CREATE MORE JOBS, AND BUILD THE HOUSING THAT WE NEED. SO,
- 23 CREATING A BALANCED AND INCLUSIVE LABOR STANDARD THAT CAN WORK
- 24 IN EVERY COUNTY IS CRITICAL TO ACHIEVING OUR VISION AND
- 25 CREATING THE SYSTEMS CHANGE THAT WILL BE NECESSARY TO MEET



- THESE RHNA TARGETS AND OUR OVERALL HOUSING GOALS. NEXT SLIDE. 1
- NEXT STEP TIMELINE WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THE DISCUSSIONS 2
- 3 WITH LABOR REPRESENTATIVES AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS WE WILL BE
- HAVING AN INFORMATIONAL MEETING IN MARCH FOR THE ABAG 4
- 5 EXECUTIVE BOARD. WE HOPE THAT ALL THE BOARD MEMBERS CAN MAKE
- IT. IN APRIL WE'LL BE RETURNING TO YOU ON APRIL 10TH WITH 6
- WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS ON LABOR STANDARDS AND AT THE END OF 7
- 8 THE MONTH IN APRIL, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL HAVE BEFORE
- IT SOME REALLY CRITICAL DECISIONS MOVING FORWARD OUR BUSINESS 9
- 10 PLAN, OUR EXPENDITURE PLAN WITH LABOR STANDARDS AND THE
- 11 INITIATING RESOLUTION FOR THE BOND MEASURE. THEN WE HAVE A
- REQUIRED INFORMATIONAL MEETING AT THE BAHFA BOARD IN MAY, WITH 12
- THE FINAL VOTE ON THE BOND MEASURE. ADVANCING IT TO THE 13
- NOVEMBER BALLOT IN JUNE. AND THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION, 14
- AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU. 15

17

- CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. MISS HARTLEY,
- 18 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR ROMERO
- WHO I BELIEVE NOW HAS ESTABLISHED PROPER QUORUM WITH ALL THE 19
- LOCATIONS PROPERLY NOTICED. 20

21

16

- 22 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THAT IS CORRECT. AND I WILL FLY
- 23 THROUGH THIS. LET'S SEE. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL ROLL CALL
- FOR THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE, PLEASE? 24



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES, SIR. MAYOR ARREGUIN?
2	
3	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: HERE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO-BAS?
6	
7	NIKKI FORTUNATO-BAS: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ECKLUND?
10	
11	PAT ECKLUND: PRESENT.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIFE?
14	
15	SPEAKER: PRESENT.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLIGOR?
18	
19	V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG HC: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTOYAMA? RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?
22	
23	BELIA RAMOS: HERE.
24	
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?



1	
2	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: PRESENT.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIEDEMANN?
5	
6	AARON TIEDEMANN: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAYOR WILLIAMS IS ON ZOOM BUT IS NOT AT A
9	TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. QUORUM IS PRESENT.
10	
11	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE
12	THE ABAG HOUSING COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
15	FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN
16	ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
17	AMOUNT OF \$150 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
18	EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.
19	
20	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. OUR LAST ITEM IS WE
21	HAVE ONE CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM. APPROVAL OF THE ABAG HOUSING
22	COMMITTEE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 14TH. WHAT IS THE ABAG
23	COMMITTEE ASK PREFERENCE WITH THIS?
24	
25	SPEAKER: I'LL MOVE CONSENT.



1	
2	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: DO WE HAVE A SECOND?
3	
4	BELIA RAMOS: SECOND, RAMOS.
5	
6	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: MOTION AND SECOND. DO WE HAVE
7	ANY COMMENTERS?
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
10	THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC
11	COMMENT, AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, I SEE TWO HANDS RAISED. I
12	CAN CALL TO ASK WHETHER THEY ARE ON THIS ITEM.
13	
14	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: I THINK SO, YES.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOE MADICAL, ARE YOU SPEAKING ON THE ABAG
17	HOUSING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR?
18	
19	SPEAKER: YES, I AM.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. WHAT IS THE TIME
22	LIMIT, PLEASE?
23	
24	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: LET'S DO ONE MINUTE ON THIS
25	[INDISCERNIBLE]



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: I'M SORRY?
3	
4	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: ONE MINUTE IS FINE.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ONE MINUTE, YES. ONE MOMENT PLEASE.
7	
8	SPEAKER: I CAN BEAT ONE MINUTE.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THIS IS THE ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE
11	CONSENT CALENDAR. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.
12	
13	SPEAKER: YES. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS JOE
14	MADICAL WITH TEAMSTERS LOCAL 665. THANKS FOR HELPING TO
15	PROVIDE SAFE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND GOOD JOBS FOR BAY AREA
16	RESIDENTS. ANY BALLOT MEASURE THAT YOU APPROVE
17	
18	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: I'M SORRY. THIS MAY NOT BE
19	THIS IS PROBABLY APPROPRIATE FOR THE NEXT ITEM. THIS IS THE
20	CONSENT CALENDAR. SO, COULD WE IF YOU WOULD PLEASE HOLD OFF
21	UNTIL WE GET TO PUBLIC COMMENT.
22	
23	SPEAKER: I THOUGHT WE WERE TALKING OKAY.



1	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: I'M SORRY FOR THE CONFUSION.
2	THANK YOU. AND HOLD ON.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: IF I CAN ASK THE NAPA SOLANO COUNTY LAB,
5	IF YOU ARE SPEAKING ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE CONSENT OR
6	ON THE BAHFA ITEM? THERE ARE NO HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
7	ON THIS ITEM
8	
9	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: CALL THE MOTION.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ARREGUIN?
12	
13	JESSE ARREGUIN: YES.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: BAS?
16	
17	NIKKI FORTUNATO-BAS: YES.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ECKLUND?
20	
21	PAT ECKLUND: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. FIFE?
24	
25	SPEAKER: YES.





1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLIGOR?
3	
4	V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG HC: YES.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTOYAMA?
7	
8	LISA MOTOYAMA: YES.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ORTIZ?
11	
12	JULIETH ORTIZ: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR RABBITT? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
15	RAMOS?
16	
17	BELIA RAMOS: YES.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROMERO?
20	
21	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIEDEMANN?
24	
25	AARON TIEDEMANN: YES.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS IS NOT AT A
3	TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
4	MEMBERS PRESENT.
5	
6	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: BACK TO CHAIR PEDROZA.
7	
8	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
9	WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS AND
10	MEMBERS. YOU DON'T ALL HAVE TO JUMP OUT AT ONE TIME. I KNOW
11	THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. IF I DON'T SEE ANY LET'S GO
12	TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THEN COME BACK TO THE BOARD. LET'S
13	START WITH THOSE HERE IN-PERSON. BECAUSE I APPRECIATE THEM
14	COMING IN. LET'S PROCEED WITH THAT THEN GO TO THE VIRTUAL ROOM
15	AS WELL.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AS I CALL YOU PLEASE LINE UP AT THE
18	PODIUM. ANTHONY MODEL FOLLOWED BY RON BROWN.
19	
20	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: AND HOW MANY BEFORE WE
21	DO THAT, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE 11 AND 2 THREE, AND COUNTING,
24	IN THE ZOOM.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ONE MINUTE, PLEASE. 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. ONE MOMENT PLEASE. ANTHONY MADDEN? 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: AND AS WE DO I JUST WANT 6 TO REMIND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, YOU CAN ALWAYS COMMUNICATE 7 8 WITH THE BOARD THROUGH E-MAIL AND THROUGH MULTIPLE OTHER FORMS THAT WE HAVE SO JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. THANK YOU. 9 10 SPEAKER: I'M ANTHONY MADDEN. I'M FROM THE HOMELESS JUSTICE 11 LEAGUE FROM ST. MARY'S. AND HOW DID I GET IN THIS? MY PLACE 12 CAUGHT ON FIRE, AND I DID HAVE A WAY TO GET OUT. SO, I WENT TO 13 JUSTICE LEAGUE AT ST. MARYS, AND THEY HELPED US GET OUT OF 14 15 THIS, BUT WE DO NEED IT, AND WE GOT TO HAVE IT, BECAUSE THERE 16 IS A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT ARE HOMELESS RIGHT NOW AND THAT PUT ME 17 OUT OF WORK TOO, WHEN MY PLACE CAUGHT FIRE, BECAUSE I LOST EVERYTHING. SO, THAT'S THE WAY IT IS, AND THAT'S THE WAY IT'S 18 GOING TO BE. SO, IT'S MY FIRST TIME SPEAKING. SO, EXCUSE ME A 19 LITTLE BIT (LAUGHTER) BUT, THAT'S, YOU KNOW, WE -- WE'RE GLAD 20 21 TO YOU HAVE GUYS HERE TO HELP US. SO, THAT'S WHAT WE NEED. 22 OKAY? 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: YOU DID GREAT. AND 24

25

WELCOME.



1 2 **SPEAKER: PARDON?** 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: YOU DID GREAT. AND 4 5 WELCOME. 6 7 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RON BROWN FOLLOWED BY 9 10 KEITH. 11 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS RON BROWN. I AM A MEMBER OF 12 THE MARIN ORGANIZING COMMITTEE A COALITION OF 24 SYNAGOGUES 13 AND OTHER NON-PROFIT INSTITUTIONS THAT ARE PART OF THE BAY 14 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION THAT ARE HERE TO PROVIDE 15 16 SUPPORT FOR THE BAHFA BOND MEASURE SUPPORT MOVING THE PLAN FORWARD WITH STRONG LANGUAGE LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE WE 17 STRONGLY ENCOURAGE STAFF OUR FRIENDS AND LABOR MOVEMENT 18 COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE OUICKLY TO AN AGREEMENT 19 ON THE FINAL PLAN ORGANIZING COMMITTEE BEGINNING INTENSIVE 20 PROGRAM TO EDUCATE THE 16,000 MEMBERS OF OUR INSTITUTIONS, AND 21 APPROPRIATE TO CARRY OUT THE CAMPAIGN TO ENSURE WE GET AS MANY 22 MARIN VOTES TO THE POLLS AS POSSIBLE. MEMBERS OF ELECTION WILL 23 ARRIVE ALL TOO SOON THE BOND MEASURE WILL REQUIRE ALL OF US TO 24



BE ON BOARD TO MOVE FORWARD AS EXPEDITIOUSLY AS POSSIBLE. 1 2 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. KEITH FOLLOWED BY ANNE BADLY. 4 5 SPEAKER: HELLO EVERYONE MY NAME IS KEITH, I'M THE PRESIDENT OF 6 COUNCIL OF ELDERS AT ST. MARY'S CENTER IN OAK AND I'M HERE TO 7 8 SUPPORT THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND AND ASK YOU TO SOFTEN YOUR HEART AND YOURSELF IN POSITION OF A SENIOR ON FIXED INCOME AND 9 10 IMAGINE GETTING \$1,228 A MONTH BUT YOUR RENT IS 1600 SO YOU 11 SEE IT'S IMPOSSIBLE FOR A SENIOR ON FIXED INCOME TO LIVE A HEALTHY NORMAL PRODUCTIVE LIFESTYLE WITHOUT SOME TYPE OF 12 SUBSIDY OR SECTION EIGHT VOUCHER SO DON'T DO IT JUST FOR ME DO 13 IT FOR YOURSELF LIVING ON FIXED ITEM MY NAME IS KEITH AND 14 15 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS ANNE BRADLEY FOLLOWED BY KEITH 17 18 BROWN. 19 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON AND THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING US TO 20 21 PARTICIPATE TODAY. MY NAME IS ANNE BRADLEY. I AM VICE

PRESIDENT ON THE COUNCIL OF ELDERS AT ST. MARY'S CENTER I'M

NETWORK. WE WORK TO GET LEGISLATION PASSED STATEWIDE TO HELP

THE HOMELESS INCLUDING NEW HOUSING CONSTRUCTION. HOUSING IS A

ALSO ON THE STEERING COMMITTEE FOR THE RESIDENTS UNITED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

22

23

24



1	HUMAN RIGHT. AND I THINK WE NEED TO KEEP THE HOMELESS AT THE
2	CENTER OF THIS BILL. I LIVE IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THANKFULLY
3	I LIVE IN A PROJECT BASED VOUCHER BUILDING, SO I PAY 30% OF MY
4	INCOME, NOT 30% OF AMI. THE AMI IN OAKLAND IS \$158,000. THAT'S
5	A LOT OF MONEY. WHAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO DO TODAY IS, INSTEAD
6	OF GIVING MONEY TO THE ZERO TO 50% GROUP OF AMI, WE WANT YOU
7	TO DROP THAT TO 22% OF AMI, WHICH AMOUNTS TO ABOUT \$35,000 A
8	YEAR. PEOPLE WHO MAKE 50% OF AMI CAN AFFORD A ONE BEDROOM
9	APARTMENT. THEY CAN ALSO AFFORD FOOD TO PUT ON THE TABLE. SO,
10	PLEASE HELP THE ACUTELY LOW-INCOME. THAT'S WHO IS AT THE HEART
11	OF THE MATTER HERE, AND HOMELESSNESS.
12	
13	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU.
14	
15	SPEAKER: THANK YOU.
16	
17	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS KEITH BROWN FOLLOWED
20	BY SYBIL CARPENTER WILL GOOD AFTERNOON I'M KEITH BROWN AND I
21	REPRESENT 135,000 WORK NURSE ALAMEDA COUNTY AS EXECUTIVE
22	SECRETARY TREASURER OF THE ALAMEDA LABOR COUNCIL. THANK YOU
23	COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF FOR THE PRESENTATION AND I ALSO THANK
24	YOU FOR THE WORK YOU'RE ALL DOING TO SOLVE THE URGENT AND

COMPLEX ISSUES THAT WE HAVE TO PROVIDE SAFE, AFFORDABLE



- 1 HOUSING, AND GOOD JOBS FOR THE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY AREA. AND
- 2 THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT WORK, AND VITAL FOR WORKING FAMILIES IN
- 3 OUR REGION. AND I'M HERE REPRESENTING LABOR JUST TO STATE THAT
- 4 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE BOND MEASURE HAS STRONG LABOR
- 5 STANDARDS THAT APPLIES TO ALL OF THE BOND REVENUE, JUST -- NOT
- 6 JUST SOME, AND, ALSO, THAT IS IMPORTANT FOR CONSENSUS OF ALL
- 7 STAKEHOLDERS TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD TO GUIDE THE
- 8 SUCCESS OF OUR MEASURE, LABOR WE'RE GOING TO BE THROWING DOWN
- 9 AND MAKING SURE.
- 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME.
- 13 SPEAKER: -- MAKING SURE THAT THIS IS SUPPORTED. BUT WE
- 14 DEFINITELY NEED TO BE A PART OF THE TABLE AND THE DISCUSSIONS.
- 15 THANK YOU.

10

12

16

19

22

- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SYBIL
- 18 CARPENTER, FOLLOWED BY IRVING. SYBIL CARPENTER.
- 20 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: IF YOU CAN A FEW OTHERS
- 21 SO THEY CAN GET READY.
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FOLLOWED BY IRVING AND GITA RAO.
- 25 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU, MR. CASTRO.



1

MARCH 13, 2024

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE HERE. IT IS A PRIVILEGE TO 2 3 COME BEFORE YOU TO SPEAK. BUT MY WORDS MAY NOT BE AS SUNNY AS YOU WANT TO HEAR. I DON'T REALLY BELIEVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS 4 5 WORKING. BECAUSE THERE NEEDS TO BE A LARGE AMOUNT OF ACCOUNTABILITY ON HOW IT IS RUN, AND THAT IT HAS -- I HAVE 6 NEVER BEEN IMPACTED AS NEGATIVELY AS I'M BEING IMPACTED NOW. I 7 8 HAVE REACHED OUT TO COUNCILMAN FIFE, KAPLAN, AND THE MAYOR. NO RESPONSE. SO, IN THEORY, AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A NICE PREMISE, 9 10 BUT IN REALITY, IT CAN BE VERY, VERY DIFFICULT FOR THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO ACTUALLY LIVE THERE, AND THE PEOPLE WHO WANT TO 11 RUN IT THE WAY THEY FEEL IT SHOULD BE RUN. THANK YOU. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. IRVING FOLLOWED BY SCOTT 14 15 LITTLEHALE THEN DAVINA. 16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE PUBLIC 17 COMMENT. MY NAME IS IRVING TORRES. I'M WITH ALL HOME. ALL HOME 18 IS A REGIONAL ORGANIZATION THAT IS ADVANCING THE REGIONAL 19 SOLUTIONS THAT DISRUPT THE CYCLES OF HOMELESSNESS AND POVERTY 20 21 AROUND HERE IN THE BAY AREA, WE'RE A PROUD MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION AND WE'RE HERE IN STRONG 22 SUPPORT FOR THE BAHFA BOND, REGIONAL BOND MEASURE. WE SUPPORT 23 MOVING THE MEASURE FORWARD, AND WE SUPPORT THE LABOR STANDARDS 24 25 IN THE MEASURE. AND WE ENCOURAGE STAFF, FRIENDS AND LABOR AND



COMMISSIONERS AT ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO A 1 COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT GETTING THIS MEASURE ACROSS THE FINISH 2 3 LINE AND TAKE WE IF WE'RE GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE FOLLOWED 6 BY DAVINA FROM EAST BAY HOUSING ORGANIZATION THEN NOELANI 7 8 GREENBELT ALLIANCE. 9 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE. I'M 10 EXECUTIVE RESEARCH ANALYST AT NORCAL CARPENTERS UNION. I'M 11 PLEASED TO BE HERE ON BEHALF OF 37,000 MEMBERS, 2/3 OF WHOM 12 RESIDE IN CENSUS TRACT COMMUNITIES THAT ARE EITHER 13 DISADVANTAGED OR LOW-INCOME AND WHAT I'M HEARING IN THE 14 PRESENTATION TODAY IS HOPE WE'RE CONVERGING UPON THE THREE 15 16 BASIC POLICY PRINCIPLES TO GO OUT AND BUILD HOUSING AND PROTECT AND UPLIFT ALL OF THE WORKERS THAT ARE BUILDING THE 17 HOUSING PROVIDE LEVEL HIGH COMPETITIVE PLAYING FIELD UPON 18 WHICH UNIONS CAN GO OUT AND DO THEIR JOB AND GO OUT AND 19 ORGANIZE CONTRACTORS THAT ARE BUILDING THAT HOUSING I DRAW 20 21 YOUR ATTENTION TO THE LETTER IN YOUR PACKETS, ONE OF THE LABOR 22 STANDARDS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN THE LETTER, WERE SPONSORED 23 BY AN ORGANIZATION OF NON-PROFIT HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS AND ADVOCATES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME I'LL BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY 24

25

QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY HAVE.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVINA FOLLOWED
3	BY NOELANI.
4	
5	SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS DAVINA HERE TODAY ON BEHALF OF EAST
6	BAY HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS A PROUD MEMBER OF BAY AREA HOUSING
7	FOR ALL COALITION TODAY I'M EXPRESSING SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA
8	BOND SUPPORTING OUR VITAL HOUSING NEEDS IN THE BAY AREA MUST
9	BE DONE IN SWIFT UNNECESSARY CONSIDERATION TO LABOR STANDARDS
10	WE URGE ALL INVOLVED TO MOVE IN URGENCY AND HASTE TOWARDS
11	COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT AND WHERE WE'RE UNITED WE WILL ACHIEVE
12	HOUSING JUSTICE FOR ALL. THANK YOU.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS NOELANI, FOLLOWED BY KEN
15	CHAN AND CHARLES LAVERY.
16	
17	SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS NOELANI HERE ON BEHALF
18	OF GREENBELT ALLIANCE IN STRONG ASSIST OF THE BAHFA BOND, THE
19	BOND IS CRITICAL FOR OUR REGION NOT JUST FOR AN AFFORDABLE
20	HOUSING POINT BUT ENVIRONMENTAL PERSPECTIVE AS WELL,
21	ACCELERATING CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE INFILL IN HOUSING IN
22	EXISTING CITY WILL LOWER VMT AND GHG ALLOWING US TO PRESERVE
23	OPEN SPACE AND LAND GROWING THE REGION THAT BENEFITS ALL
24	REPORTS PROTECT THE PLANET FOR GENERATIONS TO COME. THANK YOU.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: KEN CHAN, FOLLOWED BY CHARLES LAVERY THEN
2	BILL BARNES. KEN CHAN, ONE MINUTE.
3	
4	SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS, MY NAME IS KEN
5	CHAN, AND I'M THE SENIOR ORGANIZER WITH THE HOUSING LEADERSHIP
6	COUNCIL OF SAN MATEO COUNTY. WE WORK WITH COMMUNITIES AND
7	LEADERS TO PRODUCE QUALITY AFFORDABLE HOMES. ON BEHALF OF HLC
8	AND AS A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, I'M
9	EXPRESSING SUPPORT FOR THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE AND
10	INCLUSION OF THE LABOR STANDARDS. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT
11	THE WORLD IS CHANGING RAPIDLY AND WE ARE FACING COMPLEX
12	CHALLENGES, FAR TOO MANY OF YOUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS ARE STILL
13	IN NEED OF STABLE AFFORDABLE PLACE TO CALL HOME TO ADDRESS IT
14	WE NEED OUR HOUSING SYSTEMS TO OPERATE BETTER. YOU CAN HELP
15	YOUR COMMUNITY BY MAKING INVESTMENTS IN SECURING AND FUNDING
16	CREATING PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOMES FOR YOUR MOST VULNERABLE
17	RESIDENTS AND THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND IS A GOOD STEP IN THE
18	RIGHT DIRECTION THIS IS YOUR OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AN IMPACT HOW
19	YOU CHOOSE TO RESPOND IN THIS MOMENT MATTERS.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME.
22	
23	SPEAKER: WE ENCOURAGE TO YOU MOVE THIS MEASURE FORWARD AND

INCLUSION OF THE LABOR STANDARDS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

24



1

MARCH 13, 2024

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLES LAVERY FOLLOWED BY

2 BILL BARNS. 3 SPEAKER: THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS, FOR YOUR CIVIC SERVICE, 4 5 CHARLIE LAVERY WITH OPERATING ENGINEERS UNION. THANK YOU KATE FOR MAKING OUTREACH TO LABOR AND THE ROBUST CONVERSATIONS 6 YOU'RE HAVING THERE, WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO CONTINUE THOSE. 7 8 IT'S GREAT TO SEE A HOLISTIC APPROACH TO THIS AND ADDRESSING SOME OF THE UNDERLYING CAUSES OF HOMELESSNESS, PROVIDING 9 LIVING WAGE JOBS FOR WORKERS AND WORK PROTECTIONS. I THINK 10 IT'S ESSENTIAL, AND IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SOME 11 STRUCTURAL CHANGES THAT ADDRESS THOSE DEFICIENCIES IN OUR 12 SYSTEM. SO, THANK YOU, ALL. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS BILL BARNS. 15 16 ONE MINUTE PLEASE 17 SPEAKER: BILL BARNS FROM MPH NON-PROFIT HOUSING IN NORTHERN 18 CALIFORNIA SUPPORTING THE EFFORT TO GET THE BOND TO THE BALLOT 19 PULLING OUT ALL THE STOPS TO MAKE SURE IT'S ENACTED WE HAVE 20 21 BEEN IF CONVERSATIONS WITH LABOR AND OFFICE STAFF HAPPY TO 22 CONTINUE OPEN-MINDED COLLABORATIVE DISCUSSION ABOUT THOSE TOPICS, WITH DIVERSE COMMUNITIES AND WORKFORCE, MEETING 23 STANDARDS AS IT RELATES TO LEADERSHIP, WE BELIEVE WE CAN FIND 24 A SOLUTION THAT IMPOSES LABOR STANDARDS AND INVOLVES 25



- 1 UNIQUENESS OF ALL LOCAL COMMUNITIES SO WE CAN HAVE STANDARDS
- 2 THAT CAN BE MET. IN CLOSING, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE COST
- 3 EFFECTIVE AND THOUGHTFUL AND MAKE SURE WE MEET STANDARDS THE
- 4 REGION EXPECTS. THANK YOU.

5

- 6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
- 7 SPEAKERS IN THE BOARDROOM, CHAIR PEDROZA, BUT THERE ARE 18 --
- 8 21 IN THE ZOOM SPACE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I CAN CALL THEM
- 9 IN TURN.

10

- 11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: WE'RE GOING TO GO AHEAD
- 12 AND START NOW.

13

- 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS VIVIAN WONG. GO AHEAD.
- 15 ONE MINUTE.

16

17 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME ALL RIGHT.

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

- 21 SPEAKER: VIVIAN WONG CEO OF ABODE SERVICES, WE PROVIDE HOUSING
- 22 SERVICES FOR FOLKS EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS IN SEVEN BAY AREA
- 23 COUNTIES SUPPORTING MORE THAN 15,000 PEOPLE WHO HAVE
- 24 EXPERIENCED HOMELESSNESS EACH YEAR. WE ARE IN STRONG SUPPORT
- 25 OF THE REGIONAL BOND, BUT IMPLORE YOU THAT TO ENSURE THAT WE



- 1 HAVE SET ASIDE FOR THE VERY LOWEST INCOME LEVELS OF ZERO TO
- 2 20%, KATE MENTIONED AND WE ALL KNOW THAT IT'S THE INTENTION OF
- 3 THIS BOND TO IMPACT HOMELESSNESS BUT THAT'S NOT GOING TO
- 4 HAPPEN UNLESS WE TARGET AT LOWER LEVELS. WE KNOW WE'RE WORRIED
- 5 ABOUT SUBSIDY, BUT UNLESS WE TARGET IT, IT WILL NOT GET BUILT
- 6 AT THE LOWEST LEVEL. I IMPLORE YOU TO LOOK AT ENSURING THAT
- 7 THE BOND ACTUALLY MEETS THE NEED FOR THE GREATEST AT-RISK.
- 8 THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GRECIA. ONE
- 11 MINUTE.

- 13 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS GRECIA, I'M THE POLICY
- 14 HOUSING MANAGER FOR TRANSFORM HERE IN SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA
- 15 BOND SUPPORT THE MEASURE FORWARD AND LABOR STANDARDS. DURING
- 16 THE PANDEMIC I WAS PART OF A WAVE OF WOMEN WHO HAD TO LEAVE
- 17 THE WORKFORCE, DURING THIS TIME MY HUSBAND'S UNION AND THE
- 18 PROTECTIONS AFFORDED, KEPT US AFLOAT. HOWEVER I EXPERIENCED
- 19 HOUSING INSECURITY AS A CHILD SOMETHING NO CHILD SHOULD
- 20 EXPERIENCE BUT MANY CONTINUE TO RIGHT NOW IN THE BAY AREA. I
- 21 KNOW FIRST HAPPENED HOW IMPORTANT THOSE THINGS ARE THAT WE'RE
- 22 TALKING ABOUT TODAY AND IT'S CRITICAL THAT ALL DECISION MAKERS
- 23 INVOLVED MOVE QUICKLY TO COME TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT BECAUSE
- 24 WE ALL HAVE WAITED LONG ENOUGH. LET'S GET THIS DONE AND GET
- 25 THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT THIS NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS KIMBERLY
3	TAVAGLIONE. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. KIMBERLY? IF YOU CAN
4	UNMUTE PLEASE? ALL RIGHT. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS BART SAN MATEO
5	COUNTY BCTC. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.
6	
7	SPEAKER: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS BART PANTOLA, I AM THE
8	SECRETARY TREASURER OF THE SAN MATEO COUNTY BUILDING AND
9	CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL REPRESENTING \$10,000 500 MEN AND
10	WOMEN LIVING AND WORKING IN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY OF THIS
11	COUNTY I WANT TO EXPRESS THE SUPPORT FOR COMMENTS MADE BY
12	FELLOW REPRESENTATIVES OF LABOR I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
13	HELPING TO SOLVE THIS COMPLEX AND URGENT ISSUE OF PROVIDING
14	SAFE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND GOOD JOBS FOR BAY AREA RESIDENTS.
15	AS ANY BALLOT MEASURE APPROVED MUST INCLUDE STRONG LABOR
16	STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL BOND REVENUE NOT JUST SOME. AND
17	FINALLY, DID YOU KNOW THAT IN THE RECENTLY RELEASED
18	INDEPENDENT 20 YEAR STUDY THAT 100% UNION CONSTRUCTION PROJECT
19	VERSUS NON-UNION CONSTRUCTION PROJECT HAS AVERAGED SAVINGS OF
20	4% TO BE CLEAR AVERAGE UNION CONSTRUCTION HAS SAVED MONEY.
21	THANK YOU.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS GREG HARDIMAN.



SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON GREG, BUSINESS REP RECORDING SECRETARY 1 FOR THE ELEVATOR CONSTRUCTORS LOCAL EIGHT SAN FRANCISCO ECHO 2 3 LABOR COUNCIL'S BUILDING TRADES UNION WORKERS AND FAMILIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR WORKING TOGETHER TO 4 5 PROVIDE A SAFE AFFORDABLE AND GOOD JOBS FOR THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS RESPECTFUL OF ASK THAT THE BALLOT MEASURE APPROVED 6 MUST INCLUDE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS TO APPLY ALL BOND MEASURES 7 8 NOT JUST -- AND ALSO NEEDS TO BE IN CONSENSUS WITH THE STAKEHOLDERS OF ONE STANDARD VITAL FOR OUR SUCCESS. LASTLY 9 LABOR UNIONS AND THEIR MEMBERS ARE LOCAL TAXPAYERS AND VOTERS 10 WILL DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE BOND CAMPAIGN OF THE BALLOT 11 BOX LET'S ENSURE THAT THOSE FOLKS GETTING HIRED TO CONSTRUCT 12 THOSE BUILDINGS ARE GETTING A FAMILY SUSTAINING WAGE. THANK 13 YOU VERY MUCH. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA STRAUSS. 17 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON I'M SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF UNITED WAY 18 BAY AREA JOINING PARTNERS IN SUPPORT OF MOVING THIS MEASURE 19 FORWARD AND ARE ALSO IN STRONG SUPPORT OF INCORPORATING 20 21 SIGNIFICANT LABOR STANDARDS INTO THIS MEASURE. WE APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORT THAT STAFF, COMMISSIONERS, AND ABAG MEMBERS AND 22 PARTNER IN LABOR PUT INTO THE CONVERSATION SO FAR AND WE LOOK 23

FORWARD TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT SOON. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FUR

YOUR TIME AND YOUR PARTNERSHIP.

24



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RUDY
3	GONZALEZ. ONE MINUTE PLEASE.
4	
5	SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE BOARD.
6	RUDY GONZALEZ, SAN FRANCISCO BUILDING TRADES I REPRESENT THE
7	CONSTRUCTION CRAFTS IN SAN FRANCISCO PROPER. LOOK, I WON'T
8	REPEAT EXACTLY WHAT EVERYBODY ELSE SAID. I THINK THAT
9	FUNDAMENTALLY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO WORK THROUGH HERE IS, ARE
10	THERE EXISTING STANDARDS THAT CAN BE LOOKED TO AS A NORTH
11	STAR, IF YOU WILL, TO GUIDE US THROUGH THIS DISCUSSION? I
12	THINK THAT IN THE PRESENTATION PACKET THERE ARE A NUMBER OF
13	STANDARDS. I THINK WHAT WE NEED TO BE STRIVING FOR IS TO REACH
14	AN AGREEMENT THAT ENSURES WE'RE GOING TO HAVE THE MOST PEOPLE,
15	RIGHT, UNDER THE LARGEST TENTS, PUSHING AND ROWING IN THE SAME
16	DIRECTION TO ULTIMATELY WIN WHAT I THINK WE ALL WANT TO SEE A
17	SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGN LOOK LIKE. OUR MEMBERS VOTE, AND OUR
18	MEMBERS WORK ON THESE JOBS, AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO
19	PARTNERING WITH YOU. LET'S GET THIS THING DONE AND LET'S GET
20	ONE UNIFIED LABOR STANDARD. THANK YOU.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS COURTNEY PAUL.
23	GO AHEAD, PLEASE.



1	SPEAKER: COURTNEY PAUL, POLICY MANAGER FOR RESOURCES FOR
2	COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, OR RCD, AS WE'RE KNOWN IN THE FIELD
3	WE'RE A NON-PROFIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS WITH A
4	MISSION OF PROVIDING AFFORDABLE HOMES FOR PEOPLE IN THE BAY
5	AREA WITH THE FEWEST HOUSING OPTIONS AND ALSO A PROUD MEMBER
6	OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. WE SUPPORT
7	INCLUDING LABOR STANDARDS IN THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND MEASURE
8	AND WE ENCOURAGE STAFF, LABOR LEADERS COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG
9	MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT ON
10	WHAT STANDARDS LOOK LIKE COMMUNITIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA ARE
11	IN NEED OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IS
12	OUR BEST OPPORTUNITY FOR MOVING NEW HOMES FORWARD IN CONCEPT
13	TO CONSTRUCTION WE NEED TO DEVELOP A MEASURE THAT HAS
14	WIDESPREAD SUPPORT AND THAT WILL ALLOW US TO GET TO WORK
15	BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOMES OUR COMMUNITIES NEED THANK YOU FOR
16	YOUR CONSIDERATION TODAY.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS EJ SAWYER. ONE MINUTE.
19	
20	SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONVERSATIONS THAT HAVE
21	BEEN HAD THUS FAR I WANT TO POINT TO THE SLIDE KATE GAVE
22	EARLIER AND THE BALANCING GOAL SLIDE PRESERVING AFFORDABLE
23	HOUSING AT SCALE NECESSARY TO MEET THE NEEDS OF BAY AREA
24	RESIDENTS WE HAVE THE SAME GOAL AND WE HAVE THAT FOR MULTIPLE
25	REASONS ONE OF THOSE CITIZEN FACT THAT WE HAVE A LOT OF



1

MARCH 13, 2024

WORKFORCE ALREADY BUT WE HAVE EVEN MORE THAT WANT THE

2	OPPORTUNITY TO JOINT MIDDLE CLASS. METAL WORKERS LOCAL 1041
3	LOCAL HAS 1,938 APPLICANTS THAT ARE TRYING TO GET INTO THE
4	MIDDLE CLASS VIA LOCAL WE THING TO BRING IN COMMUNITY MEMBERS
5	WHO HAVE THUS FAR HAVE BARRIERS TO BE THE MIDDLE CLASS TO BE
6	ABLE TO GET IN WE WANT TO JOIN THE RANG AND HELP BUILD
7	COMMUNITIES THEY LIVE IN ONE LABOR STANDARD IS GOING TO BE
8	ESSENTIAL TO HELPING THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE CURRENTLY ON
9	WAITING LISTS TO GET INTO LOCALS ALL OVER THE NINE BAY AREA
10	COUNTIES AND BEYOND. THANK YOU.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS NAPA SOLANO CENTRAL LABOR
13	COUNCIL.
14	
15	SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON GLEN, NAPA LABOR COUNCIL REPRESENTING
16	45 UNIONS COLLECTIVELY 50,000 WORKERS ACROSS NAPA COUNTIES. I
	45 UNIONS COLLECTIVELI 50,000 WORKERS ACROSS NAPA COUNTIES. I
17	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND
17 18	
	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND
18	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG
18 19	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG LABOR STANDARDS FOR THE BALLOT MEASURE LABOR STANDARDS
18 19 20	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG LABOR STANDARDS FOR THE BALLOT MEASURE LABOR STANDARDS GOVERNING ENTIRETY OF THEIR FUNDS AND ONE STANDARD ESSENTIALLY
18 19 20 21	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG LABOR STANDARDS FOR THE BALLOT MEASURE LABOR STANDARDS GOVERNING ENTIRETY OF THEIR FUNDS AND ONE STANDARD ESSENTIALLY ESTABLISHED REGIONALLY I BELIEVE WE STAND HERE IN HISTORIC
18 19 20 21 22	WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG LABOR STANDARDS FOR THE BALLOT MEASURE LABOR STANDARDS GOVERNING ENTIRETY OF THEIR FUNDS AND ONE STANDARD ESSENTIALLY ESTABLISHED REGIONALLY I BELIEVE WE STAND HERE IN HISTORIC OPPORTUNITY IN TERMS OF THE LARGE-SCALE INVESTMENT IF



INTERSECTION OF SOCIAL EQUITY AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR WORKERS 1 2 ACROSS THE REGION. THANK YOU. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JULIAN. GO AHEAD. 4 5 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JEWEL WAN WEAR I AM A 6 MEMBER OF IFPT LOCAL 21 AND MEMBER OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTIES 7 8 EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE FIRST OF ALL THANK YOU FOR HELPING US SOLVE THE COMPLEX URGENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING GOOD JOBS FOR BAY 9 10 AREA RESIDENTS I WANT TO REITERATE, SUPPORT INCLUSION OF STRONG LABOR STANDARDS, SECOND CONSENSUS AND COMPROMISE BY ALL 11 STAKEHOLDERS TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD IS IMPORTANT FOR 12 OUR SUCCESS AND FINALLY LABOR UNIONS AND MEMBERS AND VOTERS 13 PAY LOCAL TAXES AND WILL DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE BOND 14 CAMPAIGN AT THE BALLOT BOX LET'S MAKE SURE THERE ARE THE FOLKS 15 16 GETTING HIRED TO CONSTRUCT HOUSING AND EARN FAMILY SUSTAINING WAGES. THANK YOU. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS ANDREAS. ONE MINUTE. 19 20 SPEAKER: ANDREAS, ALAMEDA BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES 21 COUNCIL HERE IN STRONG SUPPORT OF THE BOND MEASURE IF IT HAS 22 23 THE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT I DO WANT TO THANK THE STAFF AT BAHFA. WE HAVE HAD A NUMBER OF MEETINGS 24

AROUND THIS ISSUE AND WE'RE MAKING SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS AND



- 1 ARE CONFIDENT WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS BODY WITH A LABOR
- 2 STANDARD THAT ALL PARTIES CAN AGREE TO BECAUSE IT WILL BE
- 3 ROOTED IN COMPROMISE. I WANT TO ALSO INDICATE THE IMPORTANCE
- 4 OF LABOR STANDARDS NOT FOR ONLY TO ENSURE THAT WORKERS ARE NOT
- 5 GOING TO BE EXPLOITED ON THESE JOBS BUT IT'S ALSO CRITICAL TO
- 6 ENSURE A LABOR SUPPLY OF SKILLED WORKERS FOR THE BUILD-OUT OF
- 7 THESE UNITS IN THE UPCOMING YEARS. AND FINALLY, I'M REALLY
- 8 ENCOURAGED BY THE CONSENSUS OF SPEAKERS AROUND THE IMPORTANCE
- 9 OF HIGH LABOR STANDARDS, BUT ALSO THE IMPORTANCE TO ENSURE
- 10 THAT LABOR STANDARDS WILL COVER 100% OF THE FUNDING THAT THIS
- 11 BOND MEASURE WILL GENERATE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JUDY

- 14 JACKSON. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. JUDY JACKSON.
- 16 SPEAKER: I REPRESENT ST. MARY'S CENTER ON THE CALIFORNIA
- 17 ALLIANCE FOR RETIRED AMERICANS. I WOULD LIKE TO ALSO EMPHASIZE
- 18 THE NEED FOR A CUT-OUT FOR PEOPLE WITH 22% OF AMI AND THE
- 19 PEOPLE WHO CARE FOR THEM. BECAUSE MANY OF THEM ARE ON SSI,
- 20 LIKE I AM, AND THEY NEED NOT ONLY HOUSING FOR THEMSELVES, BUT
- 21 HOUSING FOR THOSE WHO CARE FOR THEM. THANK YOU.
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS DESTINATION
- 24 HOMES, SV. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

25

22

12



- 1 SPEAKER: HI. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
- 2 COMMENT. MY NAME IS ESMERELDA RAMIREZ, A MEMBER OF THE BAY
- 3 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION WE SUPPORT MOVING THE PROPOSED
- 4 REGIONAL BOND MEASURE FORWARD AND HOPE YOU WILL TAKE STEPS TO
- 5 ENSURE THE BOND INCLUDES ROBUST LABOR STANDARD AND PROPERLY
- 6 PRIORITIZES THOSE WITH THE GREATEST NEEDS IN OUR COMMUNITY.
- 7 EXPANDING THE SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE AND SUPPORTIVE HOUSING IS
- 8 KEY TO ENDING HOMELESSNESS. IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH WITNESS
- 9 THE TRANSFORMATIVE EFFECT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING BONDS
- 10 RESULTING IN OVER 50 NEW DEVELOPMENTS AND 5,000 NEW AFFORDABLE
- 11 UNITS SINCE OUR 2016 INITIATIVE. HOWEVER, WITH OUR CURRENT
- 12 BOND FILL ALLOCATED WE MUST SECURE ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCES
- 13 TO MAINTAIN OUR MOMENTUM. THE BAHFA BOND WILL UNLOCK
- 14 DISPARATELY NEEDED FUNDS ENSURING OUR ENTIRE REGIONAL
- 15 COLLABORATIVE RATES EFFECTIVELY TO ADDRESS THE SEVERE CRISIS.
- 16 TOGETHER WE CAN MAKE HISTORIC EFFECT. THANK YOU.
- 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS JULIE LYNN.
- 20 SPEAKER: JULIE LYNN SAN MATEO LABOR COUNCIL REPRESENTING 100
- 21 AFFILIATES AND OVER 85,000 MEMBERS COUNTY-WIDE THANK YOU FOR
- 22 THE WORK YOU HAVE CONTINUED TO PUT INTO THE DISCUSSION AND THE
- 23 ISSUE OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND INCREASE THAT'S ACCESSIBLE TO
- 24 ALL. WE WANT TO SEE AFFORDABLE HOUSING BUILT AS WE BELIEVE
- 25 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A HUMAN RIGHT WE BELIEVE THE

17



- CONSTRUCTION UNDER BONDS NEEDS TO BE BUILT WITH STRONG LABOR 1 STANDARDS IN PLACE. WE ASK FOR A SUPPORT OF BOND OF THIS SIZE 2 3 AND NEW JOBS IF CREATED IF IT PASSES NEEDS TO BE DONE BY LOCAL WORKERS EARNING FAMILY SUSTAINING WAGES AND BENEFITS WORKING 4 5 UNDER CONDITIONS THAT KEEP THEM SAFE AND RETURNING HOME AT NIGHT. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CALLUM WEEKS. ONE MINUTE. 9 SPEAKER: CALLUM WEEKS, GENERATION HOUSING NORTH BAY HOUSING AT 10 SONOMA COUNTY THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE COMMENTS 11 ON THE TOPIC WE ARE A PROUD MEMBER OF BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL 12 COALITION LIKE THOSE WHO HAVE SPOKEN BEFORE ME WE TAKE TIME 13 TODAY TO ENCOURAGE STAFF FRIENDS AND LABOR COMMISSIONERS AND 14 ABAG MEMBERS TO CONTINUE WORKING TOWARDS THE PROCESS CROSSING 15 16 THE FINISH LINE AND REALIZE SUCCESS COME NOVEMBER. THE BOND IS THE BEST OPPORTUNITY FOR SUBSTANTIAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING ACROSS 17 THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND LEADERSHIP. HAVE A 18 WONDERFUL DAY. 19
- 20
- CLERK OF THE BOARD: SHERYL PADDOQ. GO AHEAD PLEASE. YOU HAVE 21
- 22 ONE MINUTE.
- 23
- SPEAKER: CHERYL PADDOQ. I AM THE CEO OF NORTH MARIN COUNTY 24
- COMMUNITY SERVICES NON-PROFIT NOVATO MARIN COUNTY PROVIDE 25



1	SERVICES TO 10,000 PEOPLE A YEAR THE MAJORITY LOW-INCOME
2	HOUSEHOLDS STRUGGLING WITH HOUSING COSTS WE'RE PROUD MEMBER OF
3	BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, WE HAVE A HIGH COST OF
4	HOUSING, EVERYONE DOES IN THE BAY AREA HERE IN NOVATO. IT
5	TAKES ABOUT 2.2 FULL-TIME JOBS JUST TO AFFORD TWO BEDROOM RENT
6	COST WHICH IS AROUND \$3,200 A MONTH. 60% OF OUR RENTERS SPEND
7	MORE THAN A THIRD OF THEIR INCOME ON RENT AND CANNOT AFFORD
8	CHILD CARE, FOOD, AND OTHER FUNDAMENTAL NEEDS. WE'RE HERE IN
9	SUPPORT WE HOPE WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MARIN
10	ORGANIZING COMMITTEE AND ALL OF THE PARTNERS HERE IN MIC TO
11	HELP THIS BOND MEASURE PASS AND WE ALSO SUPPORT MOVING THE
12	MEASURE FORWARD AND THE LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE. WE
13	ENCOURAGE STAFF, OUR FRIENDS IN LABOR, AND THE COMMISSION
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME, PLEASE. THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS
16	DAVID BENNY. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.
17	
18	SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON I'M DAVID BEANIE FOR THE SANTA CLARA
19	AND SAN BENITO COUNTY BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL
20	I'M JOINING COLLEAGUES IN THE LABOR MOVEMENT AND OUR ALLIES TO
21	EXPRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING STRONG CONSISTENT LABOR
22	STANDARDS ATTACHED TO ANY MONEYS THAT ARE DISTRIBUTED THROUGH
23	A BOND FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE WORKERS WITHIN RESIDENTIAL
24	CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY ARE SUBJECT TO SOME OF THE WORST

EXPLOITATION AND WE HAVE A DUTY TO PROTECT THIS VULNERABLE



- 1 POPULATION PREVAILING WAGE IS NOT ENOUGH. CUTTHROAT EMPLOYEES
- 2 HAVE FOUND DOZENS OF WAYS TO CHEAT WORKERS FROM CLASSIFICATION
- 3 TO PAYMENTS FALSIFICATION CERTIFIED PAYROLL SOME CASES BORDER
- 4 HUMAN TRAFFICKING SUCH AS SILVERY TOWERS PROJECT DUBBED
- 5 SLAVERY TOWERS HERE IN SAN JOSE WE CANNOT ASK OUR RESIDENTS TO
- 6 PAY FOR CONSTRUCTION IF WE'RE NOT WILLING TO PROTECTION OUR
- 7 COMMUNITIES FROM EXPLOITATION ON THOSE SAME HOUSING
- 8 CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DANI MANIGAN.
- 11 GO AHEAD, PLEASE. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. THANK YOU.

12

- 13 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. DANI MANIGAN, LOCAL 483, I APPRECIATE YOUR
- 14 WORK ON HELPING TO SOLVE, I ECHO POINTS YOU HAVE HEARD FROM
- 15 LABOR COUNCILS AND BUILDING TRADES COUNCIL I WOULD LOVE TO SEE
- 16 STRONG LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL THE MONEY AND ALL THE
- 17 BOND REVENUE AND NOT JUST SOME. I WON'T TAKE ALL THE TIME YOU
- 18 HAVE HEARD ALL THE POINTS FOR THE LABOR STANDARDS. THANK YOU
- 19 FOR YOUR TIME.

20

- 21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS JACK BUCKHORN. GO AHEAD PLEASE.
- 22 ONE MINUTE.

- 24 SPEAKER: JACK BUCKHORN, NORTH BAY LABOR COUNCIL. APPRECIATE
- 25 THE PRESENTATION AND ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF LACK OF WORKERS



PROTECTIONS THAT PREVAIL IN THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING SECTOR TO 1 BE CLEAR WE DON'T EXPECT A PERFECT SOLUTION TO THIS PROBLEM 2 3 BUT WE DEMAND PROGRESS IN ADDRESSING THE PROBLEM. A GOOD SOLUTION WOULD INCLUDE LABOR STANDARDS COVER 100% OF THE BOND 4 5 FOUNDING ANYTHING LES WOULD BE FLAWED. PREVAILING WAGES FOR ALL MONEY WOULD BE A GOOD AND NECESSARY STANDARD. ANYTHING 6 LESS THAN THAT WOULD BE FLAWED. ENFORCEMENT WITH A PRIVATE 7 8 RIGHT OF ACTION FOR LABOR MANAGEMENT COMMITTEES WOULD BE GOOD AND ANYTHING LESS THAN THAT WOULD BE FLAWED. THANK YOU FOR 9 10 YOUR CONTINUED MEETINGS ON THESE ISSUES. TOGETHER, WE CAN GET THIS DONE AND HELP MEET THE WELL DOCUMENTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING 11 NEEDS OF COMMUNITIES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JOE 14 15 METEKEL. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. 16 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON, AGAIN, THIS IS JOE MATEKEL WITH 17 18 TEAMSTERS LOCAL 665. ANY BALLOT MEASURE YOU APPROVE HAS GOT TO INCLUDE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL OF THE BOND 19 REVENUE. ALSO AGREEMENT IN COMPROMISE BY ALL DECISION MAKERS 20 TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD IS VERY IMPORTANT TO GUIDE NEXT 21 22 STEPS. ADDITIONALLY LABOR UNIONS AND MEMBERS ARE VOTERS AND 23 TAXPAYERS AND THEY'RE GOING TO DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE BOND CAMPAIGN AT THE BALLOT BOX WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE 24

THE ONES GETTING HIRED TO BUILD THE HOUSING AND WHILE DOING



1

MARCH 13, 2024

THAT THEY NEED TO EARN SUFFICIENT WAGES TO SUPPORT THEIR

2 FAMILIES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ELIZABETH 4 5 WAMPLER. GO AHEAD. 6 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I'M ELIZABETH WAMPLER I'M WITH LYFT BAY 7 8 AREA LIKE OTHERS WE'RE A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION IN STRONG SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA BOND AND DEEP 9 APPRECIATION FOR ALL WORK THAT'S COME BEFORE WE SUPPORT MOVING 10 THE MEASURE FORWARD AND SUPPORT LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE 11 12 AND JUST WANT TO ENCOURAGE EVERYONE, STAFF, LABOR FOLKS, COMMISSIONERS, ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO A 13 COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT ON THIS. WE REALLY NEED EVERYBODY TO COME 14 15 TOGETHER TO GET THIS MEASURE ACROSS THE FINISH LINE, AND ARE 16 EXCITED TO BE PART OF THIS GREAT COLLECTIVE. THANK YOU. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS COUNCIL OF 18 COMMUNITY HOUSING ORGANIZATION. GO AHEAD, PLEASE ONE MINUTE. 19 20 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JOHN AVALOS COUNCIL 21 COMMUNITY HOUSING ORGANIZATION IN SAN FRANCISCO. SAN FRANCISCO 22 JUST RECENTLY PASSED MARCH FIFTH A \$300 MILLION AFFORDABLE 23 HOUSING BOND. WE WERE ABLE TO DO SO BECAUSE WE ACHIEVED A 24 GREAT AMOUNT OF UNITY BETWEEN OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS, THE 25



- 1 MAYOR, AND THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS,
- 2 PRIVATE DEVELOPERS, LABOR, AND SO MANY OTHERS. SO WE PASSED AT
- 3 70%. WE ALSO PASSED THIS BOND AND WORKED ON THIS BOND IN
- 4 PREPARATION FOR THE REGIONAL BOND. AND PART OF THIS UNITY THAT
- 5 WE ACHIEVED WAS KNOWING THAT WHATEVER WAS ACHIEVED IN TERMS OF
- 6 LABOR STANDARDS WOULD BE HELPING US DECIDE HOW WE WOULD MOVE
- 7 FORWARD IN THE FUTURE. THIS PUBLIC COMMENT TODAY SHOWS THAT
- 8 THERE IS A GREAT DEAL OF UNITY JUST TO MAKE SURE WE GET THE
- 9 LABOR STANDARDS RIGHT. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE BAHFA TO CONTINUE
- 10 TO CONVENE AND WORK WITH US TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE SUCCESSFUL
- 11 REGIONAL BOND IN NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS SCOTT RIISE. ONE MINUTE.

15 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS SCOTT I'M A BUSINESS

- 16 REPRESENTATIVE FOR UA LOCAL 393. WE COVER SANTA CLARA, SAN
- 17 BENITO COUNTIES PLUMBERS AND PIPE FITTERS HVAC WORK WE
- 18 APPRECIATE YOUR CONSIDERATION INCLUDING SOME OF THE SOLID
- 19 LABOR STANDARDS APPLIED TO 100% OF THIS BOND REVENUE WE
- 20 BELIEVE THIS WILL BENEFIT BAY AREA RESIDENTS AS WELL AS
- 21 COMMUNITIES THEREIN. THANK YOU.
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS MICHAEL B. GO AHEAD. ONE
- 24 MINUTE.

25

22

12



- 1 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. MICHAEL B., REPRESENTING LOW-INCOME
- 2 RESIDENTS FOR NAPA COUNTY TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I AM
- 3 IN STRONG FAVOR OF LABOR STANDARDS THAT ARE NOT EXCLUSIONARY
- 4 TO SKILLED, HARDWORKING INDIVIDUALS THAT ARE NOT PRESENTLY
- 5 AFFILIATED WITH A LABOR ORGANIZATION OR COUNCIL. THANK YOU
- 6 VERY MUCH.

7

- 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RAMA
- 9 PETERSON. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS RAMA PETERSON. I'M A MEMBER OF THE IBEW
- 12 617 REPRESENTING SAN MATEO COUNTY. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO A
- 13 LOT OF WHAT YOU HAVE ALREADY HEARD AND JUST SAY THAT I'M IN
- 14 FAVOR OF THIS BOND MEASURE BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE STRONG
- 15 LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL OF THE REVENUE AND NOT JUST
- 16 SOME. AND I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU GUYS ARE DOING. THANK YOU VERY
- 17 MUCH.

18

- 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SOUTH BAY
- 20 LABOR COUNCIL. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

- 22 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS GENE COHEN I'M
- 23 THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF THE SOUTH BAY LABOR COUNCIL I WANT TO
- 24 AFFIRM THE STATEMENTS AND SHARED VALUES OF THE PREVIOUS
- 25 SPEAKERS. I REPRESENT OVER 100,000 WORKERS IN THE SOUTH BAY



- 1 AND WE KNOW THAT WITHOUT WORKFORCE STANDARDS HOUSING BOND
- 2 MEASURE MAY INCREASE SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE UNITS BUT MAY ALSO
- 3 INCREASE DEMAND FOR SUBSIDIZED SHELTERS FOR WORKERS AND
- 4 WORKERS WHO RECEIVE INADEQUATE COMPENSATION. THE NEED TO
- 5 PRODUCE OFFICIAL HOUSING AND FAMILY SUSTAINING CAREER HAS
- 6 NEVER BEEN MORE IMPORTANT AND WE'RE COMMITTED TO CONTINUE
- 7 WORKING WITH THE BAHFA STAFF AND IMPACTED STAKEHOLDERS TO
- 8 ENSURE THE MEASURE IS FAIR AND EFFECTIVE. WE MUST BE UNITED IN
- 9 OUR EFFORTS TO KEEP OUR FAMILIES OUT OF POVERTY, TO HAVE SAFE
- 10 AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ACCESS TO GOOD JOBS. AND WE
- 11 APPRECIATE THE LEADERSHIP AND PARTNERSHIP TO ENSURE THAT WE
- 12 ARE SUCCESSFUL IN NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RUDY

15 GONZALEZ. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. OKAY.

17 SPEAKER: I ALREADY SPOKE. THANK YOU.

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER, OUR LAST

20 SPEAKER IS JASON GUMATAOTAO. ONE MINUTE.

- 22 SPEAKER: GREETINGS. MY NAME IS JASON, WITH IBEW LOCAL 595 AND
- 23 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THOUSANDS OF ELECTRICIANS IN ALAMEDA
- 24 COUNTY, RISING IN SUPPORT OF ALL OTHER LABOR COMMENTS YOU
- 25 HEARD BEFORE, WE WOULD APPRECIATE CONSIDERATION TO INCLUDE ALL

13

16

18



FUNDING TO BE COVERED WITH LABOR STANDARDS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 1 2 TIME. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. CHAIR, THAT CONCLUDES ONLINE 4 5 PUBLIC COMMENT WE DID RECEIVE EIGHT LETTERS OF PUBLIC COMMENT 6 FROM AT INFO@BAYAREA.COM SUBMITTED PUBLIC COMMENT FROM ELLEN DEAN, LEWIS FLOREZ, ELLEN LONG, KATE, SCOTT LITTLEHALE, MARLA 7 8 MOORE, SENIIA RITZIY HERNANDEZ, JUDITH WEISMAN, POSTED TO MTC AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS. 9 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU. AGAIN WE HAVE 11 RECEIVED HUNDREDS OF E-MAILS. BACK TO KATE H. 12 13 KATE HARTLEY: THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE 14 15 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO COMMENTED ON THIS ITEM WE HEARD LOUD 16 AND CLEAR OVERWHELMING SUPPORT AND DESIRE FOR ONE STANDARD STRONG LABOR STANDARDS TO APPLY TO 100% OF THE FUNDS. WE WILL 17 TAKE THAT BACK INTO CONSIDERATION AS WE PREPARE A 18 RECOMMENDATION FOR APRIL 10TH. I THINK IT IS IN FULL ALIGNMENT 19 WITH WHAT OUR GOALS ARE. AND SO WE'RE, SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, 20 21 I'M VERY HEARTENED, AND WE HOPE TO CREATE THE GOALS THAT WERE ARTICULATED SO WELL BY THE SPEAKERS. SO, THANK YOU. 22 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU MISS HARTLEY. 24

AND, AGAIN, TO MEMBERS, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY,



AND I DO APPRECIATE ALL THE PUBLIC THAT PARTICIPATED IN THIS 1 2 DISCUSSION, AS WELL. TURNING OVER TO MEMBERS AND 3 COMMISSIONERS. CHAIR ROMERO, DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING? 4 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR 5 ENGAGING IN THESE DISCUSSIONS, AS WELL AS THE NON-PROFIT 6 DEVELOPERS. SEEMS LIKE WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS. I THINK THIS WAS 7 8 A MUCH LESS CONTENTIOUS. I GOT TO PRESIDE OVER THE LAST ONE. THIS WAS A MUCH LESS CONTENTIOUS PUBLIC DISCUSSION REALLY 9 APPRECIATE LABOR PUTTING OUT THERE ISSUES AND LOOKING FORWARD 10 TO NEXT MONTH TO HAVE A RESOLUTION TO THIS WHERE, INDEED, WE 11 CAN ELEVATE THE LABOR STANDARDS, GET LABOR ON BOARD AND MOVE 12 FORWARD. ONE QUESTION RELATED TO MAYBE A SERIES OF TEN E-MAILS 13 WE RECEIVED ABOUT ALL ELECTRIC STANDARDS. GIVEN, I WANT TO 14 15 UNDERSTAND WHAT, IF ANY, ABILITY WE HAVE TO PUT IN ELECTRIC 16 STANDARDS? I DON'T KNOW IF WE CAN DO ALL ELECTRIC BASED ON THE BERKELEY LAWSUIT, BUT, CERTAINLY (LAUGHTER) -- BUT, CERTAINLY, 17 I THINK IT'S PROBABLY POSSIBLE TO DO SOME, SORT OF, ELECTRIC 18 STANDARDS THAT MAYBE TALK ABOUT, IN NEW BUILDINGS, YOU KNOW, 19 RECHARGE -- ELECTRIC CAR CHARGING, OR AT LEAST BUILDINGS THAT 20 ARE READY TO RECEIVE THAT, I MEAN, THOSE UPGRADES, SO, YOU CAN 21

TELL ME WHERE THAT MIGHT GO? BECAUSE I DO -- I WANT TO BE

SOMEWHAT RESPONSIVE TO THAT SET OF INTEREST.

24

23



PEOPLE WHO SUBMITTED THE LETTERS ON THE ALL-ELECTRIC STANDAY THIS WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT, AS OPPOSED TO LEGISLATION WE COULD PUT INTO OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON TO ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.		
THIS WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT, AS OPPOSED TO LEGISLATION WE COULD PUT INTO OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN THE CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	1	KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR. YES. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
4 COULD PUT INTO OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION 5 PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL 6 BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF 7 PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE 8 REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING 9 BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE 10 INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION 11 PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT 12 PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T 13 ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T 14 QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP 15 LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY 16 STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN 17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR.	2	PEOPLE WHO SUBMITTED THE LETTERS ON THE ALL-ELECTRIC STANDARD
5 PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL 6 BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF 7 PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE 8 REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING 9 BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE 10 INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION 11 PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT 12 PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON TO 13 ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T 14 QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP 15 LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY 16 STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN 17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR.	3	THIS WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT, AS OPPOSED TO LEGISLATION WE
6 BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON TELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR.	4	COULD PUT INTO OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION
PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	5	PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL
8 REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING 9 BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE 10 INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION 11 PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT 12 PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T 13 ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T 14 QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP 15 LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY 16 STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN 17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR.	6	BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF
9 BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE 10 INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION 11 PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT 12 PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T 13 ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T 14 QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP 15 LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY 16 STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN 17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR.	7	PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE
INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	8	REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING
PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON T ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	9	BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE
PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON TELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	10	INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION
ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	11	PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT
QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOP LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	12	PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON THE
LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	13	ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T
STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELIN CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR.	14	QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOPLE
17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR. 20	15	LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY
18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, 19 CHAIR. 20	16	STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELINES
19 CHAIR. 20	17	
20	18	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU,
	19	CHAIR.
21 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU. AND, AGAIN,	20	
	21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THANK YOU. AND, AGAIN, I

23 AND I DO BELIEVE WE'RE GOING TO REACH IT. I JUST WANT TO

24 UNDERSTAND, KATE THERE ARE THINGS HAPPENING WHERE LEGAL MINDS

APPRECIATE STAFF BEING OUT THERE TRYING TO FIND COMPROMISE,

25 ARE TALKING THAT'S ONE SET THAT ARE A BIGGER FIX THAT'S BEYOND



OUR CONTROL AT THIS TIME, SO IN TERMS OF OPPORTUNITY RIGHT NOW 1 2 WE KNOW IS AROUND 20%. 3 KATE HARTLEY: THAT'S CORRECT. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: WHILE I THINK THERE IS 6 BIGGER AND GREATER AMBITIONS AND WHILE WE'RE AFFORDED THAT 7 8 OPPORTUNITY WE SHOULD HAVE THAT DISCUSSION BUT IN TERMS OF GROUNDING THE COORDINATION ON WHAT WE CAN DO NOW THAT'S WITHIN 9 OUR CONTROL IS THE 20% AND I HOPE WE DO FIND COMPROMISE ON THE 10 LABOR STANDARDS THAT ADDRESS THE GOALS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO 11 REACH AND I BELIEVE WE CAN GET THERE. JUST MY COMMENTS. 12 TURNING IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND WORK OVER THAT WAY. 13 14 GINA PAPAN: GREAT. TRULY APPRECIATE THE WORK OF STAFF, LOOKING 15 16 AT A HOLISTIC APPROACH AND I THINK WE HAVE THE RIGHT PEOPLE AT THE ABLE TO GET TO THE RIGHT POSITION THAT WE ALL FEEL 17 STRONGLY ABOUT. I WANT US TO BE CAREFUL OF THE NARRATIVE WHEN 18 WE DO BRING LABOR STANDARDS INTO, ACTUALLY THE EXPENDITURE 19 REPORTS, REDUCED COSTS BECAUSE WE REDUCE RISK AS ONE SPEAKER 20 21 SAID 4% SAVINGS THE STUDIES HAVE SHOWN WE DO HAVE LABOR 22 STANDARDS SO THE DISCUSSION WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE OUR NARRATIVE IS CLEAR ON THAT, FOR EVERYBODY WHO IS HERE THAT'S 23 GREAT AND WONDERFUL WE WANT THIS TO HAPPEN BUT THERE'S PART 24

TWO HERE WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THE VOTER STANDARDS THRESHOLD



1

MARCH 13, 2024

WHAT'S THE BILL? ACA ONE ALSO PASSES TO LOWER THE VOTING

- APPROVAL TO 55% PLUS ONE, I GUESS, SO IT'S KIND OF A TWO PART 2 3 WE GOT YOUR SUPPORT HERE WE REALLY NEED IT OVER THERE TOO WE ARE REALLY HEADED IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION ONCE AGAIN THANK YOU 4 5 FOR YOUR EFFORTS IN SACRAMENTO WE HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE LOOKING AT THIS WANT WANTING TO HAPPEN THEN LOCAL CONTROL WE'RE GOING 6 TO DEBRIEF WHAT WE CAME BACK WITH HERE AND WE'RE JUST TRYING 7 8 TO MAKE EVERYTHING BETTER SO WE CAN GET THROUGH. THANK YOU 9 EVERYBODY. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: WORKING MY WAY THAT WAY. 11 NO ONE WANTS TO SPEAK? THAT'S OKAY. 12 13 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I HAVE A QUESTION. THERE IS 20%, 14 THEN THERE IS THE 80% MY UNDERSTANDING IS FOR THE 80% COVERED 15 16 WE HAVE TO SEEK STATE LEGISLATION. WHAT IS THE TIMELINE FOR 17 THAT?
- 18
- 19 KATE HARTLEY: WE COULD -- WELL, STATE -- OUR STATUTE COULD BE
- 20 AMENDED, AS LONG AS IT IS BEFORE THE FIRST ISSUANCE OF THE
- 21 BONDS, THEN WE WOULD APPLY THAT STANDARD TO THE USE OF THE
- 22 BONDS, AND WE EXPECT THE FIRST ISSUANCE OF THE BONDS TO BE NO
- 23 EARLIER THAN THE MID-2025.



- 1 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: MID-2025. SO, WE WOULD HAVE TO -2 DO WE HAVE SOME COMMITMENTS FROM LEGISLATORS ABOUT MAKING
- 3 THOSE AMENDMENTS? I THINK IS --

4

- 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA
- 6 WHAT I'LL TELL YOU JUST BEING FRESH FROM SACRAMENTO AND TOP OF
- 7 MIND, I THINK WE HAVE LEGISLATORS INTERESTED IN DOING THAT I
- 8 THINK THE FACT IS EVERYONE IS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHICH TRAIN
- 9 IS ON WHICH TRACK AND REALLY TO UNDERSTAND IF WE CAN DO IT ALL
- 10 BUT THERE IS CONCURRENT CONVERSATIONS BEING HAD. WE KNOW THE
- 11 CONVERSATION, WE KNOW WHAT'S NOW, IT DOESN'T MEAN THE
- 12 CONVERSATION AROUND THE 80% HAS TO STOP IT'S IDENTIFYING WHO
- 13 IS GOING TO DO THAT AND WE'RE HAVING ACTIVE CONVERSATIONS.
- 14 MISS LONG IS HERE AND SHE CAN ATTEST TO CONVERSATIONS WE HAD
- 15 WITH SENATOR CORTESE AND OTHERS TO ADDRESS THAT.

16

- 17 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I WANT TO MAKE SURE, SINCE WE'RE
- 18 LOOKING FOR THE 100%, AS WE HAVE HEARD, I THINK WE NEED TO
- 19 PROVIDE SOME ASSURANCE BEFORE WE CAN KEEP THING GOING.

20

- 21 SPEAKER: AND IF I MAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR, YOU MAY WANT TO
- 22 CLARIFY THE LIKELIHOOD OF THAT BEING RESOLVED PRIOR TO APRIL
- 23 18TH WHEN THE MEASURE HAS TO BE APPROVED. WHICH IS UNLIKELY.

24

25 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THAT'S CORRECT.



1 2 KATHLEEN KANE: IF I COULD JUST OFFER, THROUGH THE CHAIR, 3 QUICKLY. THE IDEA IS TO HAVE THE BALLOT MEASURE, ITSELF, BE CLEAN AND ALLOW FOR LATER CHANGES IN STATE LAW SHOULD THEY 4 5 HAPPEN. SO, THE IDEA IS TO BE ABLE TO ALLOW THE BALLOT MEASURE TO GO AND GET ON THE BALLOT IN DEFENSIBLE WAY, AND THEN IF 6 THERE ARE LATER CHANGES THEN THOSE CAN BE INCORPORATED AT THAT 7 8 POINT. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: I THINK IT'S A FUNCTION 10 OF TIME, COMMISSIONER. WHAT I WOULD SAY IS, THERE IS ACTIVE 11 CONVERSATIONS BEING HAD AROUND 80% AND WHEN AND HOW THAT COULD 12 GET DISCUSSED AND INTRODUCED. I DON'T KNOW IF MISS LONG WANTS 13 TO ADD ANYTHING TO ADD? 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. I THINK THE ONLY THING I WOULD ADD IS ASSUMING THAT 17 THIS BODY, BAHFA AND ABAG ARE COMFORTABLE WITH LABOR STANDARDS 18 THAT ARE AGREED UPON FOR THE 20%, WE DON'T ANTICIPATE THAT 19 THERE IS A TIMING CHALLENGE TO GETTING LEGISLATION THROUGH THE 20 21 PROCESS IN ORDER FOR IT TO APPLY TO THE 80%. SO, THERE IS, YOU KNOW, ACTIVE INTEREST IN SACRAMENTO IN DOING THAT, AND, AGAIN, 22 AS OUR GENERAL COUNSEL INDICATED, WE DON'T NEED THAT PIECE OF 23 IT. WE DON'T NEED THE LEGISLATION TO BE WRAPPED UP BEFORE THE 24

BODIES TAKE ACTION TO PUT THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT FOR US TO



- 1 HAVE THE ABILITY TO IMPOSE THE STANDARDS ON THE 80%. AS LONG
- 2 AS THE LEGISLATION TAKES EFFECT BEFORE THE FIRST BOND
- 3 ISSUANCE, WHICH ON THE NATURAL ANY BILL PASSES THIS YEAR,
- 4 WOULD TAKE EFFECT JANUARY 1ST, 2025.

5

- 6 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.
- 7 COMMISSIONER MILEY, IS THAT YOUR LIGHT?

8

- 9 NATHAN MILEY: YES. THANK YOU. YES, I JUST KIND OF WANT TO
- 10 WEIGH IN, THAT I'M VERY IMPRESSED WHAT I'M HEARING THROUGH
- 11 WITH THIS CONVERSATION. SO, I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS MY
- 12 GRATITUDE FOR THE WORK THUS FAR BECAUSE THIS IS A BIG DEAL,
- 13 AND I THINK EVERYBODY IS GOING IN THE SAME DIRECTION WANT TO
- 14 GET RESULTS AND WE WANT TO GET RESULTS AND HOW WE CAN MAKE
- 15 THIS HAPPEN. CLEARLY GETTING US ACROSS THE FINISH LINE WITH
- 16 THE 55% THRESHOLD I THINK ALL OF THAT IS IMPORTANT. AND PROP
- 17 ONE, IT LOOKS LIKE THAT WILL PASS. BUT PROP ONE IT'S GOING TO
- 18 PROVIDE \$6 BILLION. THIS IS GOING TO PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT
- 19 RESOURCES BEYOND PROP ONE, JUST FOR THE BAY AREA. THIS IS A
- 20 REAL BIG DEAL. AND IT'S A WIN-WIN ON ALL FRONTS. I JUST WANT
- 21 TO ACKNOWLEDGE EVERYONE'S WORK ON THIS. AND WHATEVER I CAN DO
- 22 AS A COUNTY SUPERVISOR, IN MY LITTLE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,
- 23 PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD, JUST KEEP ME INFORMED. THANK YOU.



1

MARCH 13, 2024

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: THERE IS GOING TO BE A

ROLE FOR ALL OF US. (LAUGHTER) ALL RIGHT. I'LL KEEP LOOKING. 2 3 JESSE ARREGUIN: I WANT TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION TO STAFF FOR 4 5 MEETING WITH LABOR STAKEHOLDERS AND WANT TO ENCOURAGE CONTINUED CONVERSATIONS AND I'M GLAD THAT IT SEEMS LIKES WE 6 ARE MAKING SOME PROGRESS ON AGREEMENT ON LABOR STANDARDS I 7 8 WANT TO EMPHASIZE HOW IMPORTANT IT IS THAT WE HAVE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS, FOR MANY OF THE REASONS STATED TODAY WE NEED 9 TO MAKE SURE WE INVEST PUBLIC DOLLARS TO ACHIEVE THE KINDS OF 10 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT THIS IN OUR REGION THAT INCLUDES MAKING 11 SURE WE ARE BUILDING A SKILLED AND TRAINED WORKFORCE THAT'S 12 GOING TO BE CRITICAL TO ENSURE THAT WE CAN BUILD HOUSING MUCH 13 FASTER AND MORE AFFORDABLE LONG-TERM PROVIDING GOOD MIDDLE 14 CLASS JOBS FOR PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES SO WE DON'T HAVE 15 16 THOSE OPPORTUNITIES INCLUDING KIDS IN OUR SCHOOLS WE TALK ABOUT PUBLIC SAFETY KEY TO ADDRESSING PUBLIC SAFETY IN OUR 17 REGION IS LIFTING UP ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE IN OUR 18 REGION AND LASTLY TO ADDRESS HAVING A PATH TO HIGH ROAD JOBS, 19 BUILDING HOUSING IN OUR COMMUNITIES, EXPLOITED WAGE THEFTS IN 20 21 THE WORKPLACE AND SAFETY VIOLATIONS PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE AFFORDABLE ACCESSIBLE HOUSING IN THE COMMUNITIES THAT THEY'RE 22 WORKING IN WHO WERE LIVING IN THEIR CARS. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE 23 WE'RE PROVIDING A PATH TO MIDDLE CLASS JOBS AND GOOD JOBS. I 24 25 APPRECIATE THE WORK BEING DONE I CALL ON STAKEHOLDERS TO



CONTINUE THE WORK TOGETHER I THINK WE CAN WORK TOGETHER TO 1 REACH AGREEMENTS. IT'S GOING TO BE ALL HANDS ON DECK TO PASS 2 3 THIS THING IN NOVEMBER BUT IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT WE HAVE A UNIFIED STRONG LABOR STANDARD THAT APPLIES TO ALL PROJECTS 4 5 THAT ARE COVERED UNDER THIS MEASURE, AND IF SACRAMENTO DOES ENABLE IT TO APPLY TO THE 80%, YOU KNOW, OR WHETHER IT'S -- IF 6 THERE IS A PLA, THAT THAT WOULD BE APPLICABLE. I THINK THERE 7 8 IS FLEXIBILITY TO ACHIEVE LABOR STANDARDS THAT WOULD BENEFIT ALL STAKEHOLDERS, ALL LABOR STAKEHOLDERS IN THIS DISCUSSION. 9 SO, I HAVE AND CONTINUE TO BE VERY STRONGLY IN SUPPORT OF 10 THAT. AND HOPE THAT WHEN WE COME BACK IN APRIL THAT WE'LL BE 11 ABLE TO MOVE THAT FORWARD. THANK YOU. 12 13 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO ECHO WHAT SOME OF MY OTHER 14 15 COLLEAGUES HAVE SAID AND THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK YOU'RE 16 DOING TO NEGOTIATE AND EVERYONE WHO COMMENTED. 17 AARON TIEDEMANN: LIKE EVERYONE WHO HAS SAID WITH THE WINDOW OF 18 WHAT'S POSSIBLE RIGHT NOW PUTTING SOME LABOR STANDARDS ON OUR 19 20% MAKES SENSE. I THINK WE HAVE BROAD SUPPORT IF WE HAVE 20 21 LEGISLATIVE FIX FOR PUTTING ON THE REST OF THE MONEY THAT MAKES SENSE WHAT WE HAVE ENDED UP FROM BROAD OPTIONS WE HAVE 22 BEEN PRESENTED WITH TODAY IT'S GOING TO UPLIFT AND PUT A NEW 23 MINIMUM STANDARD THAT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT EVEN IF IT'S 24

JUST ON OUR MONEY, IT'S THE MOST AGGRESSIVE BENEFIT FOR HUGE



- 1 AMOUNT OF LABORS ACROSS THE BAY AREA. HAVING THIS CONVERSATION
- 2 FOCUS ON TWO OF THE PARTS THAT STAFF INCLUDED IN THE
- 3 PRESENTATION FOR OUR LEVEL SETTING, THERE ARE TWO THINGS THAT
- 4 I DON'T THINK SHOULD COME AS A SURPRISE FOR US THAT I THINK WE
- 5 SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT IN THIS CONVERSATION AND ALL
- 6 CONVERSATIONS GOING FORWARD, THE TABLE TWO OF THE RHNA CYCLE
- 7 FIVE PERFORMANCE, WHICH SHOWS THAT WE'RE ALL BUILDING A LOT OF
- 8 HOUSING, BUT WE'RE NOT BUILDING THE RIGHT BALANCE OF HOUSING.
- 9 AND I HAVE LOOKED AT THIS CHART IN A LOT OF DIFFERENT WAYS,
- 10 AND SEEN IT, AND IT SHOWS THAT WE JUST NEED A HUGE AMOUNT MORE
- 11 INVESTMENT BECAUSE WE'RE NOT BUILDING THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
- 12 THAT WE SO DISPARATELY NEED. WE ARE MAKING IT POSSIBLE TO
- 13 BUILD THE MARKET RATE AND THAT IS AN IMBALANCE THAT WE CAN'T
- 14 HAVE CONTINUING ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS. THE OTHER ONE I
- 15 WANT TO DRAW ATTENTION TO IS TABLE FOUR IN COMPARISON
- 16 DEVELOPMENT COST FOR PROJECTS THAT TAKE LOCAL FUNDS AND
- 17 PROJECTS THAT DON'T. AGAIN, I DON'T THINK THIS ANALYSIS WILL
- 18 COME AS A SURPRISE TO ANY OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS
- 19 WHO ARE DOING THIS WORK, ANYONE ON THE GROUND, ANYONE WHO IS
- 20 DOING THOSE APPROVALS, AND I THINK IT REQUIRES BOND FOR OUR
- 21 OWN POLICIES ON THE CITIES AND COUNTY AND LOCAL LEVEL OF WHAT
- 22 OUR POLICIES ARE THERE MAY BE IMPORTANT REASONS WHY THERE IS A
- 23 MORE EXPENSIVE COST PER UNIT FOR PROJECTS THAT TAKE LOCAL
- 24 FUNDS. BUT I'M NOT SURE FOR MY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA IF THERE ARE
- 25 ABOUT 400,000 OF THOSE REASONS, IF THAT'S HOW MUCH MORE



7

9

MARCH 13, 2024

- 1 EXPENSIVE IT SHOULD BE. SO, WE NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT WAYS
- 2 THAT WE CAN MAKE THAT CHEAPER AND MAKE THESE FUNDS GO AS FAR
- 3 AS THEY CAN, AS WELL AS JUST MAKE ANY FUNDS WE INVEST IN
- 4 AFFORDABLE HOUSING GO FARTHER IN OUR OWN COMMUNITIES AND THERE
- 5 IS WORK WE CAN ALL DO THERE BOTH ON THIS BOND AND IN OUR OWN
- 6 POLICIES. THANK YOU.

8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. I DON'T --

- 10 SPEAKER: THANKS SO MUCH FOR THE WORK THAT STAFF HAS DONE AND
- 11 THAT EVERYONE HAS BEEN DOING IN TERMS OF THE NEGOTIATION. THIS
- 12 PRESENTATION WAS VERY HELPFUL. IN OAKLAND, WE HAD THE
- 13 OPPORTUNITY TO BUILD A REALLY STRONG COALITION AMONG
- 14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS, LABOR PARTNERS AND OTHERS
- 15 THROUGH MEASURE U WHICH WE PASSED IN 2022. SO THAT'S 350
- 16 MILLION IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND WE ARE ALSO LOOKING TO THIS
- 17 PROCESS TO INFORM HOW WE POTENTIALLY MOVE FORWARD ON LABOR
- 18 STANDARDS. SO, FIRST I WANT TO APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT
- 19 EVERYONE HAS DONE, UNDERSCORE THE NEED TO BUILD A REALLY BROAD
- 20 COALITION IN ORDER TO PASS THIS TRANSFORMATIONAL BOND MEASURE.
- 21 AND WANTED TO, YOU KNOW, I AGREE WITH A LOT OF WHAT HAS
- 22 ALREADY BEEN SAID, AND ALSO WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE POINT OF
- 23 MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE GOOD DATA AS WE CONTINUE THE
- 24 NEGOTIATIONS AND LOOK AT WHAT WE CAN DO. YOU KNOW, THERE IS A
- 25 LOT OF INFORMATION THAT ALREADY EXISTS. I BELIEVE THE UC



BERKELEY LABOR CENTER IS ALSO PUTTING TOGETHER SOME RESEARCH 1 2 AND IN TERMS OF THE COST OF CONSTRUCTION, THE COST OF LABOR 3 STANDARDS, I REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LOOKING AT GOOD DATA SO THAT THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING AND THE PROPOSAL THAT 4 5 COMES TO US IS WELL INFORMED. AND THAT ALSO GOES ACROSS THE BOARD. WE HAD DISCUSSION AT OUR LAST MEETING ABOUT THE EQUITY 6 FRAMEWORK WITHIN BAHFA, WHICH I REALLY COMMEND, AND THAT'S 7 8 ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF AS WE DO OUR INFORMATIONAL MEETINGS AND WE'LL BE DOING SOME OF THOSE IN OAKLAND AND ALAMEDA COUNTY, 9 THAT WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT THE DATA AND WHAT'S NEEDED IN TERMS 10 OF THE TYPE OF HOUSING WE NEED TO BUILD, WE NEED TO ENSURE WHO 11 HAS ACCESS TO THAT HOUSING. SO, EOUITY, I BELIEVE, WHETHER 12 IT'S ECONOMIC, OR RACIAL EQUITY, OR EVEN LOOKING AT EQUITY IN 13 TERMS OF PROVIDING JOBS THROUGH THIS MEASURE, REALLY DOES NEED 14 15 TO BE GROUNDED IN DATA, AS WELL AS THE CONVERSATIONS THAT I 16 KNOW THAT STAFF WILL BE HAVING. AND IF THERE IS ANY WAY THAT 17 MYSELF OR OTHERS IN OAKLAND CAN HELP SUPPORT THE PROCESS BETWEEN NOW AND APRIL 7TH IS WHEN PERHAPS THE PROPOSAL WILL BE 18 PUBLISHED. PLEASE CALL ON US. THANK YOU. 19 20 LISA MOTOYAMA: THANK YOU STAFF, AND THE PUBLIC, FOR ALL THIS 21 WORK. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO ECHO WHAT CHAIR ROMERO SAID, 22 THE TENOR OF THIS MEETING IS VERY DIFFERENT. I DO HAVE A 23 QUESTION ABOUT THE TABLE FOUR ABOUT THE COST. AND I JUST 24 WANTED TO UNDERSTAND WHY THE CHOICE OF METRIC WAS THE USE OF 25



- 1 LOCAL FUNDS. SO, I THINK THAT THERE ARE MANY, MANY REASONS WHY
- 2 PROJECTS ARE EXPENSIVE, BUT IT SEEMS CALLING OUT THE USE OF
- 3 LOCAL FUNDS SEEMS LIKE KIND OF AN INTERESTING CHOICE AS
- 4 OPPOSED TO HIGHER SERVICES OR HIGHER COST OF LAND, OR LOTS OF
- 5 OTHER CHOICES THAT YOU COULD HAVE MADE. AND JUST KIND OF --
- 6 WHAT POINT ARE YOU DRIVING THIS TOWARDS WITH THAT?

- 8 KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR, WE WERE LOOKING AT THE DATA
- 9 IN A, SORT OF, AGNOSTIC WAY AND WE KEPT SEEING THOSE
- 10 DEVELOPMENTS COME IN THAT WERE SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER. AND SO WE
- 11 DUG INTO THEM AND WE REALIZED THERE IS THIS MODEL AVAILABLE --
- 12 THAT IS IN USE, YOU KNOW, OF 12,000 UNITS, 5,000 HAVE BEEN
- 13 PRODUCED IN THIS WAY BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023, WHERE DEVELOPERS
- 14 ONLY USE CREDITS, BONDS, AND DEFERRED DEVELOPER FEE, PROJECT
- 15 AFTER PROJECT, THAT WAS THE CAPITAL STACK, AND THEN WE DUG
- 16 DEEPER AND WE REALIZED THAT HIGHER COST DEVELOPMENTS ALL HAD
- 17 LOCAL FUNDS. NOW, THAT IS NO INDICTMENT OF THOSE PROJECTS, AT
- 18 ALL. MANY OF THOSE PROJECTS ARE URBAN INFILL, SPECIAL NEEDS,
- 19 100% HOMELESS. WE KNOW THAT CERTAIN DEVELOPMENTS HAVE HIGHER
- 20 COST. BUT WE ALSO KNOW THAT THERE'S SOME GRAY AREA THERE
- 21 BETWEEN THAT EXPENSIVE URBAN INFILL EIGHT STORY 100 SPECIAL
- 22 NEEDS DEVELOPMENT AND THE 60 -- THE DEVELOPMENT THAT IS, YOU
- 23 KNOW, FIVE STORIES, SURFACE PARKING, \$500,000 A DOOR. LOOKING
- 24 AT THE DATA, TOGETHER, IT WILL BE SOMETHING THAT WE'RE
- 25 UNDERTAKING AND WE NEED MORE RESEARCH. WE NEED TO DIG DOWN,



- 1 AND THERE IS OTHER PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE INDUSTRY WHO ARE ALSO
- 2 LOOKING AT THIS, IS ON OUR PLATES. BUT, WE -- THAT WAS THE
- 3 DISTINCTION THAT REALLY JUMPED OUT. IF YOU TOOK LOCAL FUNDS,
- 4 YOU WERE BRINGING YOUR PROJECTS AT A LOW COST. IT'S IMPORTANT
- 5 BECAUSE, ESPECIALLY FOR HOMELESSNESS, AS WE KNOW THAT IN MANY
- 6 COUNTIES, FOR EVERY PERSON WHO IS UNHOUSED THAT WE FIND --
- 7 THAT, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE -- THAT WE CAN CREATE PERMANENT
- 8 HOUSING FOR, ONE, OR TWO, OR EVENLY, ARE PUSHED INTO
- 9 HOMELESSNESS. IT REALLY MAKES START THE DEMAND FOR MORE
- 10 HOUSING. SO IT IMPLEMENTS SOME OF THE CHANGES THAT WE THINK
- 11 BAHFA CAN FACILITATE LIKE STREAMLINED FINANCING IF YOU DON'T -
- 12 THE FEWER SOURCES OF FUNDS THAT YOU HAVE TO PURSUE THE LOWER
- 13 YOUR COST STRUCTURE IS PRIORITIZING DEVELOPMENT ON PROJECTS
- 14 THAT HAVE BEEN STREAMLINE ENTITLEMENTS WE KNOW THAT WE CAN --
- 15 JUST IN THE NEWS TODAY WAS A PROJECT THAT EDEN HOUSING IS
- 16 DOING IN LIVERMORE THAT HAS BEEN IN LITIGATION FOR YEARS AND
- 17 YEARS. THOSE PROJECT COSTS GO UP MORE RATIONAL STATE FUNDING
- 18 SYSTEM. IF YOU HAVE TO GO YEAR AFTER YEAR IN APPLICATIONS AT
- 19 THE STATE, THAT'S GOING TO COST -- THAT'S GOING TO CREATE COST
- 20 ESCALATION. SO, ALL OF THOSE THINGS NEED TO COME INTO PLAY.
- 21 THE POINT BEING WE CAN HAVE RESOURCES TO DO MANY OF THOSE
- 22 THINGS WITH THIS BOND AND BRING COSTS DOWN TO SOME EXTENT. YOU
- 23 KNOW, UNDERSTANDING EXACTLY WHAT THE ISSUES ARE AND BUILD MORE
- 24 HOUSING BECAUSE WE KNOW WE NEED THAT.



1	LISA MOTOYAMA: THANK YOU FOR THAT REALLY GREAT ANSWER.
2	
3	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT SEEING NO ONE
4	ELSE. LET'S GO TO THE VIRTUAL PARTICIPANTS.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE WERE HANDS RAISED, BUT I DON'T SEE
7	NO HANDS RAISED FROM OUR COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT THE MOMENT.
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC: ALL RIGHT. I'LL BACK TO
10	THE BOARD. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. I DON'T HAVE
11	ANY OTHER PARTING WORDS. I DO APPRECIATE CHAIR ROMERO FOR
12	CHAIRING THE LAST MEETING. IT WAS A BIT MORE CONTENTIOUS.
13	THAT'S JUST THE DRAW SOMETIMES. (LAUGHTER) ON THAT NOTE. THANK
14	YOU TO THE STAFF AND THE PUBLIC FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT. WE'RE ALL
15	TRYING TO SHAPE SOMETHING HERE THAT IS GENERATIONAL FOR ALL OF
16	US. AT THIS POINT, PROCEEDING TO ITEM 8. THE NEXT MEETING
17	JOINT MEETING, WHICH CHAIR ROMERO WILL CHAIR, IS SCHEDULED FOR
18	WEDNESDAY APRIL 10TH ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK
19	YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.





Broadcasting Government