

**ASSOCIATION OF BAY
AREA GOVERNMENTS
Meeting Transcript**

MARCH 13, 2024

1

HOUSING COMMITTEE

2

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 13TH, 2024, 12:00 PM

3

4

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC: OKAY. WE HAVE ESTABLISHED

5

QUORUM ON MTC AND ABAG SIDE.

6

7

KATHLEEN KANE: THROUGH THE CHAIR, WE, UNFORTUNATELY, CANNOT

8

CONVENE ABAG UNTIL WE HAVE THE NOTICED LOCATION, BUT WE CAN GO

9

AHEAD AND CONTINUE.

10

11

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC: I'LL REMIND IT'S NOT THE

12

FIRST TIME WE HAVE ENCOUNTERED THIS SITUATION. I'M ASSUMING

13

MORE COMMUNICATION WITH THE RESPECTIVE LOCATION, THE COUNCIL

14

WAS NOTIFIED AND THE CLERK AND SO FORTH. TO MEMBERS OF THE

15

PUBLIC THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE WHILE WE GET STARTED HERE.

16

I DID GET WITH MY COLLEAGUE CARLOS ROMERO WHILE WE WAIT FOR

17

QUORUM TO BE ESTABLISHED FOR THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATION.

18

19

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC: YES, SIR.

20

21

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC: THANK YOU, CHAIR.

22

23

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC: MY NAME IS ALFREDO

24

PEDROZA, CHAIR OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY

MARCH 13, 2024

1 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. I'M GOING TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER.

2 PROCEEDING TO ITEM ONE, WHICH IS ROLL CALL.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. ABE-KOGA?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER? JOSEFOWITZ IS

13 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF, NON-VOTING?

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS HERE BUT SHE STEPPED
5 AWAY.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** CORRECT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT? WE DO HAVE A QUORUM.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE
12 SPECIAL REQUEST FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FOR
13 EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCES FROM COMMISSIONER RONEN. THOSE ARE NOT
14 PROPS IN THE BACK AND IS PART OF THE REASON SHE IS NOT
15 PARTICIPATING. COMMISSIONER RONEN.

16

17 **HILLARY RONEN:** I AM REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER
18 AB 2449 BECAUSE I'M RECOVERING FROM KNEE RECONSTRUCTION
19 SURGERY THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER 18.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER
22 RONEN. WE'RE ADDING YOU TO THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AS PRESENT
23 ALL RIGHT WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM TWO, PUBLIC COMMENT
24 FOR ITEMS NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA. I'LL ASK STAFF IF WE HAVE ANY
25 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
3 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
4 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
5 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU. I DO
8 ANTICIPATE MEMBERS ARE GOING TO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE
9 AGENDA ITEMS THERE ARE SPEAKER CARDS, IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK
10 GRAB ONE OF THOSE. ANY COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS? I DON'T
11 SEE ANY FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS. PROCEEDING TO OUR NEXT ITEM.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IF WE CAN NOTE FOR THE RECORD NO PUBLIC
14 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
15 BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE NO
16 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.
19 PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT
20 AND I DO HAVE A REPORT-OUT. SINCE WE'LL HAVE THE FULL REPORT-
21 OUT ON THE POTENTIAL LABOR STANDARDS INCLUDED IN BAHFA'S
22 REGIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN I'LL FOREGO MY CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT
23 AND I'LL ASK IF CHAIR ROMERO HAS ANYTHING TO REPORT AS WELL.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** I THINK THE ONLY THING TO
2 REPORT IS WE HAD SUCCESSFUL SET OF LOBBYING DISCUSSIONS UP IN
3 SACRAMENTO WHICH WE TALKED ABOUT, THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND
4 MANY OF US WERE THERE. THANK YOU TO ALL WHO WENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** THANK YOU CHAIR ROMERO.
7 SOME OF US ON DAY THREE OR FOUR OF MTC ABAG. THANK YOU FOR
8 BEING THERE. AND THANK YOU TO COLLEAGUES WHO PARTICIPATE WE
9 TRIED TO BRING SOME OF THE NEWER COMMISSIONERS WITH THE OLDER
10 COMMISSIONERS, JUST BASED OFF EXPERIENCE, AND IT WAS WELL-
11 RECEIVED AND I APPRECIATE OUR LEGISLATORS UNDERSTANDING THE
12 WORK WE DO AND IT WAS VERY WELL-RECEIVED. AT THIS POINT WE'RE
13 GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM FIVE. THIS IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. SO
14 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM SIX WHEN WE COME BACK TO ABAG'S
15 CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT CONSENT
16 CALENDAR. COMMISSIONERS WE HAVE AN ITEM ON CONSENT. IS THERE
17 ANY QUESTIONS? CONCERNS? COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY FROM
18 COMMISSIONERS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR CONSENT
19 CALENDAR?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVE ON THIS ITEM
22 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
23 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL. SECOND.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** MOTION AND SECOND.

3 COUNSEL?

4

5 **KATHLEEN KANE:** FOR THE RECORD THE CHAIR SAID AN ITEM THERE ARE

6 TWO ITEMS AS PART OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR HERE 6A AND 6B.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** MY PAPERS ARE OUT OF

9 ORDER. I'M DOING THE BEST I CAN. THANK YOU FOR THAT COUNSEL.

10 FIRST BY PAPAN SECOND BY GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST BY PAPAN SECOND GLOVER. ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IMPLEMENT SUGGEST ABSENT. GLOVER?

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

12

13 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE -- I MEAN YES. SORRY.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO? AND COMMISSIONER

16 RABBITT IS NOT HERE. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU ALL. PROCEEDING

19 TO THE MAIN EVENT. I'M GOING TO CLARIFY WITH COUNSEL. WHILE

20 ABAG HAS NOT CONVENED, I HOPE WE CAN TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ALL

21 AT ONE TIME. THIS ITEM, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. SO TO

22 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC DEMAND EXPECTATIONS, IF YOU WANT TO

23 COMMENT ON THE LABOR STANDARDS THIS IS THE MOMENT IN TIME?

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT'S CORRECT. THIS IS THE ENTIRETY OF THE
2 HEARING ON THE INFORMATIONAL ITEM, AND THE PUBLIC WILL HAVE
3 ONE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK ON IT.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** CONFIRM WE HAVE NOT
6 ESTABLISHED THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATION FOR OAKLAND?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** THIS IS ITEM SEVEN.
11 REGIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN LABOR STANDARDS. THIS IS AN ABAG
12 HOUSING COMMITTEE THAT HASN'T CONVENED YET. BUT IT'S THE BAHFA
13 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. FOLLOWING OUR
14 DIRECTION AT THE FEBRUARY 14TH MEETING FOR STAFF RETURN WITH
15 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON POTENTIAL LABOR STANDARDS, I BELIEVE
16 OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ANDY FREMIER WILL INTRODUCE THE ITEM.

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE.
19 WE HAVE BEEN MEETING REGULARLY WITH A LOT OF THE BROAD LANE OR
20 REPRESENTATION. AND WHILE I DON'T LIKE TO JINX DISCUSSIONS WE
21 THINK THEY'RE GOING VERY WELL, BUT WE HAVE SEVERAL MORE
22 PLANNED IN COMING WEEKS BUT BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT CONCLUDED
23 THOSE DISCUSSIONS TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS REALLY JUST
24 INFORMATION. AND OUR GOAL FOR TODAY IS TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE
25 COMMON VOCABULARY AS WE TALK ABOUT LABOR STANDARD OPTIONS AND

MARCH 13, 2024

1 WHAT TRADE-OFFS THERE ARE FOR DIFFERENT STANDARDS. WE EXPECT
2 TO RETURN TO THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON APRIL 10TH TO THE JOINT
3 COMMITTEE, FROM OUR DISCUSSIONS AS WELL WITH LABOR
4 REPRESENTATIVES AND STAKEHOLDERS AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE
5 I THINK IT'S SAFE TO SAY THERE IS REAL COMMON INTEREST IN
6 ENSURING THAT STRONG PROTECTIONS FOR LABOR ARE INCLUDED IN OUR
7 DIRECTION AND THAT THEY'RE EFFECTIVE IN EVERY COUNTY
8 ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THERE IS A LOT OF DIVERSITY IN THE COUNTIES
9 AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO PRESENTING THESE
10 STANDARDS THAT STRIKE A BALANCE FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION IN THE
11 NEXT MONTH AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO KATE HARTLEY WHO WILL WALK
12 US THROUGH THE PRESENTATION.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE
15 STAFF'S COMMITMENT TO HAVING AN HONEST AND ROBUST
16 CONVERSATION, THIS IS A FRAGILE DISCUSSION. WE'RE UNITED IN
17 THE OUTCOME OF HOUSING WE'RE TRYING TO CHIEF AND WHETHER
18 WALKING THE HALLS OF SACRAMENTO, WE ARE U INDICT. BUT WE CAN'T
19 LET PERFECT GET IN THE WAY OF PROGRESS. PERFECT WOULD BE IDEAL
20 BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE PROGRESS AND WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY AROUND
21 THIS TO GALVANIZE TOGETHER TO CREATE MEANINGFUL RESOURCES FOR
22 OUR REGION BUT IT'S GOING TAKE US ALL LEANING IN AND NOT
23 TRYING TO BE PERFECT IN THIS MOMENT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE
24 TRYING TO ACHIEVE. SO I WANT TO THANK ALL PARTNERS AND
25 STAKEHOLDERS. WE HAVE ALL HAD COUNTLESS MEETINGS, COUNTLESS

MARCH 13, 2024

1 PHONE CALLS AND E-MAILS WITH ALL SIDES OF THIS SITUATION. BUT
2 I WANT TO THANK STAFF. SO I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO KATE.

3

4 **KATE HARTLEY:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE
5 MEMBERS. AS YOU HAVE HEARD, DISCUSSIONS ARE ONGOING WITH OUR
6 PARTNERS, OUR LABOR PARTNERS AND DEVELOPERS AND STAKEHOLDERS.
7 WE WANT TO TAKE TODAY, USE TODAY AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE
8 SOME BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND CONTEXT TO HELP YOU AND OUR
9 BOARDS GO THROUGH YOUR DECISION-MAKING PROCESS ON THIS ISSUE.
10 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND AS A REFRESHER, AND I THINK WE WANT TO
11 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE TOO. THANK YOU. AS A REFRESHER, BAHFA'S
12 AUTHORITIES ARE LOCATED IN OUR ENABLING STATUTE, IT'S THE SAN
13 FRANCISCO BAY AREA REGIONAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING ACT. THE ACT
14 DOES NOT ALLOW US TO IMPOSE LABOR STANDARDS ON THE
15 JURISDICTIONS. OUR STATUTE COULD BE AMENDED, HOWEVER, TO SAY
16 THAT BAHFA MAY IMPOSE LABOR STANDARDS, BUT NOT ALL LABOR
17 STANDARDS ARE ACCESSIBLE IN THAT WAY. OUR GENERAL COUNSEL HAS
18 ADVISED THAT EVEN IF OUR ACT IS AMENDED, WE CANNOT REQUIRE
19 CITIES AND COUNTIES TO USE A PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENT, FOR
20 EXAMPLE, DUE TO FEDERAL LEGAL REQUIREMENTS THAT APPLIED FOR
21 PLAS AND I'LL SAY MORE ABOUT THAT IN A MINUTE. NEXT SLIDE
22 PLEASE. TO DETERMINE WHAT COULD BE AN ALLOWABLE AND
23 APPROPRIATE STANDARD FOR BAHFA AND POTENTIALLY THE WHOLE
24 REGION THROUGH AN AMENDMENT TO OUR ENABLING STATUTE, WE WANT
25 TO GIVE A SHORT SUMMARY OF DIFFERENT LABOR STANDARD FRAMEWORKS

MARCH 13, 2024

1 THAT ARE CURRENTLY IN USE IN CALIFORNIA. SO, FIRST UP IS THE
2 CALIFORNIA LABOR CODE, AND THAT SAYS THAT PROJECTS THAT USE
3 PUBLIC FUNDS MUST PAY PREVAILING WAGES. HOWEVER THERE IS A
4 SECTION IN THE CODE IT'S 1720C FIVE THAT EXEMPTS PRIVATELY
5 OWNED RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION IF THE PUBLIC FUNDS USED FOR
6 THAT MEET CERTAIN CRITERIA. AND IT'S VERY, VERY EASY FOR AN
7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT TO MEET THOSE TERMS. SO, IT'S
8 SIMPLY APPLYING THE LABOR CODE DOES NOT GUARANTEE A PAYMENT
9 STANDARD FOR WORKERS UNLIKE OTHER PUBLIC WORKS PROJECTS, LIKE
10 INFRASTRUCTURE INSTALLATIONS, THAT ARE OWNED BY A PUBLIC
11 ENTITY. THERE ARE MANY WAYS THAT WE DO APPLY AN ENFORCEABLE
12 PREVAILING WAGE HOWEVER. FEDERAL FUNDS THAT FLOW THROUGH
13 CITIES AND COUNTIES LIKE CDBG AND HUONG PROVIDE PREVAILING
14 WAGES SOME CITIES IN OUR REGION ATTACH A PREVAILING WAGE
15 REQUIREMENT TO ALL FUNDS THEY PROVIDE REGARDLESS OF SOURCE OF
16 FUNDS, AND CERTAIN PROGRAMS BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF
17 HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT REQUIRE PREVAILING WAGES.
18 THE NEXT STANDARD WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT TODAY CONSISTS OF THREE
19 MAIN REQUIREMENTS, AN ENFORCEABLE PREVAILING WAGE STANDARD,
20 CARE PAYMENTS FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE 50 UNITS AND OVER, AND USE
21 OF APPROVED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS FOR BUILDINGS THAT ARE 50
22 UNITS AND MORE THIS STANDARD IS INCLUDED IN RECENTLY PASSED
23 STATE STREAMLINING LEGISLATION A.B. 2011 WHICH IS BUFFY WICKS
24 BILL AND IT ALSO APPLIES TO SB FOUR ALSO KNOWN AS YES IN GOD'S
25 BACKYARD AND IS STREAMLINING AS WELL ALSO IN MODIFIED FORM

MARCH 13, 2024

1 SENATOR BILL 423 ANOTHER STREAMLINING PIECE OF LEGISLATION AT
2 THE STATE AND SB 423 THE WAGES HEALTHCARE AND APPRENTICESHIP
3 REQUIREMENT IS JOINED WITH REQUIREMENT TO USE SKILLED TRAINED
4 LABOR FOR ANY MARKET RATE MIXED INCOME BUILDING THAT IS OVER
5 85 FOOT HOWEVER 100 AFFORDABLE DEVELOPMENTS THAT ARE EXEMPT,
6 BRINGS US TO FRAMEWORK WHICH IS GENERAL SPEAKING RESTRICTIVE
7 STANDARD THAT REQUIRES WORKFORCE TO BE SKILLED JOURNEY PERSONS
8 AND GRADUATES OF AN APPROVED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM IT WAS
9 RECENTLY INCLUDED IN SB SENATE BILL SIX, SB SIX, WHICH IS A
10 BILL THAT ALLOWS RESIDENTIAL USE ON COMMERCIAL ZONED
11 PROPERTY WITHOUT REZONING BUT IF YOU USE SKILLED AND TRAINED
12 WORKFORCE. FINALLY OUR LAST FRAMEWORK TO PRESENT TODAY IS
13 PROJECT LABOR AGREEMENTS, PLAS AND AS MENTIONED OUR OFFICE OF
14 GENERAL COUNSEL HAS ADVISE THAT FEDERAL LEGAL REQUIREMENTS
15 PREEMPTING STATE AND LOCAL LAWS PREVENT BAHFA FROM IMPOSING
16 PLA ON ALL JURISDICTIONS REGARDLESS OF THE LANGUAGE IN OUR
17 STATUTE. WE COULD IMPOSE, WE COULD ADOPT A PLA FOR BAHFA'S OWN
18 FUNDS, 20% OF FUNDS IF WE WERE TO MAKE CERTAIN FINDINGS ABOUT
19 BAHFA'S ROLE AS A MARKET PARTICIPANT PROCURING LABOR SERVICES
20 BUT GIVEN THE STATUTORILY REQUIRED DISTRIBUTION OF BOND
21 FUNDING TO NINE COUNTIES THOSE MARKET PARTICIPANT FINDINGS FOR
22 BAHFA WOULD NOT EXTEND TO ALL THE COUNTIES BECAUSE BAHFA WOULD
23 HAVE NO ROLE IN THE PROCUREMENT OF SERVICES AT THE CITY AND
24 COUNTY LEVEL. SO, THIS PUTS US IN A VERY DIFFERENT POSITION
25 FROM AREAS THAT RECENTLY HAVE EMPLOYED A PLA, SUCH AS ALAMEDA

MARCH 13, 2024

1 COUNTY, THAT'S THE ONE-COUNTY STANDARD, AS WELL AS IN LOS
2 ANGELES, THE LACOSTA LEGISLATION RECENTLY PASSED THAT REQUIRES
3 A PLA, AGAIN THAT'S FOR ONE COUNTY ONLY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
4 SO, AS THE BOARDS CONSIDER THESE COMPETING FRAMEWORKS WHICH
5 HAVE COMPLEXITY WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT THEIR APPLICATION
6 THROUGHOUT THE REGION, WE WANT TO PROVIDE FURTHER CONTEXT FOR
7 DECISION-MAKING, DRAWING ON FEEDBACK FROM THIS COMMITTEE, AS
8 WELL AS BAHFA'S GUIDING PRINCIPLES SET FORTH IN OUR BUSINESS
9 PLAN. THESE INCLUDE THE GOALS OF EXPANDING THE PROTECTION OF
10 WORKERS IN THE BAY AREA'S AFFORDABLE HOUSING CONSTRUCTION
11 INDUSTRY, BUILDING AND PRESERVING HOUSING AT SCALE TO ADDRESS
12 THE REGION'S LONG-TERM HOUSING SHORTAGE, AND IN ORDER TO MEET
13 OUR GOALS PURSUING NEW STRATEGIES FOR CONTROLLING COST AND
14 DELIVERING HOUSING IN QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE. REGARDING THE
15 QUESTION OF WORKER PROTECTIONS, IT'S HELPFUL TO FIRST
16 UNDERSTAND WHO'S DEVELOPING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA
17 AND HOW LABOR STANDARDS ARE APPLIED IN DIFFERENT CONTEXT. THIS
18 IS A VERY HIGH-LEVEL DISCUSSION. AND I'M VERY MUCH
19 GENERALIZING HERE, BUT, GENERALLY SPEAKING, IF YOU LOOK AT THE
20 DATA FROM THE LAST FEW YEARS OF ALLOCATIONS OF TAX CREDITS AND
21 TAX EXEMPT BONDS, WHICH, AS YOU KNOW ARE THE MAIN WAYS THAT
22 PEOPLE BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TWO DIFFERENT DEVELOPER TYPES
23 EMERGE. FIRST OUR DEVELOPERS ARE THAT USE LOCAL FUNDS, FROM
24 CITY AND COUNTIES WHICH THEY'RE LOCATED AND THEY'RE USUALLY
25 THOUGH NOT ALWAYS NON-PROFIT CORPORATIONS, THEY ALMOST ALWAYS

MARCH 13, 2024

1 PAY PREVAILING WAGES, AND SINCE 2022 WHEN A.B. 2011 PASSED, WE
2 HAVE NOT SEEN ANY PROJECTS IN THE WHOLE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,
3 ACTUALLY, MOVE FORWARD USING THAT WAGE'S HEALTH CARE TRAINING
4 STANDARD. SO, THE APPLICATION OF THAT STANDARD WOULD ADD
5 HEALTH CARE AND TRAINING REQUIREMENTS TO AN ENFORCEABLE
6 PREVAILING WAGE STANDARD THAT THIS COHORT OF DEVELOPERS IS
7 ALREADY USING ALMOST ALL THE TIME. THE PROJECTS THAT THIS
8 COHORT BUILD ARE ALSO TYPICALLY SUBJECT TO ADDITIONAL
9 REGULATORY OBLIGATIONS THAT OFTEN COME WITH LOCAL FUNDS. SO
10 TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COSTS TEND TO BE CORRESPONDINGLY HIGH. THE
11 SECOND GROUP OF DEVELOPERS DOES GOT TAKE LOCAL FUNDS. THEY ARE
12 OFTEN, THOUGH NOT ALWAYS, FOR-PROFIT COMPANIES. THEY USUALLY
13 FINANCE THEIR PROJECTS WITH THREE SOURCES OF FUNDS, TAX
14 CREDITS, TAX EXEMPT DEBT, AND A VERY HIGH-LEVEL OF DEFERRED
15 DEVELOPER FEES. THEY ARE NOT SUBJECT TO THE REGULATORY
16 REQUIREMENTS THAT OFTEN ATTACH TO LOCAL FUNDING. THEIR
17 DEVELOPMENT COSTS ARE USUALLY QUITE LOW, AND BECAUSE TAX
18 CREDITS DO NOT REQUIRE PREVAILING WAGES, PREVAILING WAGE
19 COMPLIANCE IS NOT TYPICAL ON THESE JOBS. THE APPLICATION OF
20 LABOR STANDARDS TO THESE PROJECTS WOULD PROVIDE ENFORCEABLE
21 WORKER PROTECTIONS WHERE THEY DO NOT NOW EXIST FOR THE MOST
22 PART. NOT IN ALL CASES, AGAIN, BUT IN THE MAJORITY OF THE
23 PROJECTS BUILD BY THAT PARTICULAR COHORT OF DEVELOPERS. AND TO
24 GIVE YOU A SENSE OF SCALE ABOUT THESE TWO DEVELOPER TYPES, WE
25 LOOKED AT SIDLAC AND TCAC PROJECTS, PROJECTS THAT GOT AWARDED

MARCH 13, 2024

1 FUNDS BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023. THERE WERE 90 PROJECTS. THEY
2 BUILT ABOUT 12,000 HOMES, AND OF THESE 55 INCLUDED LOCAL FUNDS
3 FOR THEIR PROJECTS. AND OVER 90% OF THOSE PROJECTS PAID
4 PREVAILING WAGES FOR THEIR PROJECTS. 35 OF THE TOTAL 90
5 PROJECTS DID NOT USE LOCAL FUNDS, AND APPROXIMATELY 80 PERCENT
6 OF THOSE DEVELOPMENTS DID NOT INDICATE ANY ATTENTION TO PAY
7 PREVAILING WAGES. SO, OF THE 12,000 APARTMENTS THAT WERE
8 FUNDED BETWEEN '21 AND 2023 IN THE BAY AREA, ABOUT 7,000 WERE
9 BUILT BY -- OR IN PROCESS WITH DEVELOPERS USING LOCAL FUNDS
10 AND MOST PAYING PREVAILING WAGES. 5,000 BUILT WITH JUST CREDIT
11 BONDS DEFERRED DEVELOPER FEE AND 80% OF THOSE NOT PAYING
12 PREVAILING WAGES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SHIFTING NOW TO HOUSING
13 NEEDS, WE ALL KNOW THE CONSEQUENCES OF THE REGION'S LACK OF
14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE SEE IT EVERY DAY. AND IT'S ESPECIALLY
15 ALARMING TO KNOW THAT HOMELESSNESS CONTINUES TO RISE IN MOST
16 COUNTIES. THE NEED TO BUILD AT SCALE AND BETTER MEET OUR
17 REGION'S AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDS IS IN STARK RELIEF ON THESE
18 SLIDES SHOWING OUR ACHIEVEMENT OF THE FIFTH RHNA CYCLE,
19 ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU COMPARE IT TO THE SIXTH RHNA CYCLE TARGET.
20 BETWEEN 2015 AND 2023 PRODUCTION OF MARKET RATE HOUSING WAS
21 TWICE THAT WHICH IT EXCEEDED THE TARGET BY 100%. AND
22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING LAGGED SIGNIFICANTLY BELOW THE TARGETS. THE
23 HIGH COST OF HOUSING AND THE LACK OF SUFFICIENT RESOURCES TO
24 BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING ARE MAJOR FACTORS IN THIS FAILURE TO
25 REACH THE TARGETS THAT WE SEE IN THE FIFTH CYCLE. NEXT SLIDE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 PLEASE. MEETING OUR SIXTH CYCLE RHNA TARGETS WILL PROVE MORE
2 CHALLENGING AT EVERY SINGLE LEVEL. THE 441,000 HOMES NEEDED
3 FOR THE BAY AREA IS 235% OF WHAT THE FIFTH CYCLE TARGET WAS.
4 AND THE HIGH-LEVEL OF AFFORDABLE HOMES NEEDED IS ESPECIALLY
5 DAUNTING. TO MEET THESE NEW GOALS AND TO FULFILL ITS MISSION,
6 BAHFA, THE CITIES, THE COUNTIES, THE ENTIRE HOUSING INDUSTRY
7 HAS TO BUILD SIGNIFICANTLY MORE UNITS AND TO DO THAT WE HAVE
8 TO CHANGE THE WAY THAT WE'RE DOING THINGS NOW. NEXT SLIDE. AS
9 I STATED, ONE ISSUE THAT MAKES OUR GOALS ESPECIALLY DIFFICULT
10 IS THE HIGH COST TO BUILD IN THE BAY AREA. THE DEVELOPMENT
11 COST YOU SEE COME, AGAIN, FROM THE PROJECTS THAT WE ANALYZED
12 BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023 THAT GOT SIDLAC AWARDS. WE KNOW THAT
13 LOCALLY FINISHED PROJECTS COST SIGNIFICANTLY MORE THAN
14 PROJECTS THAT DO NOT USE LOCAL FUNDS AND USUALLY DON'T PAY
15 PREVAILING WAGES. THE COST OF THOSE PROJECTS FUNDED BETWEEN
16 2021 AND '23, IN THE SECOND COLUMN, THOSE THAT DID NOT TAKE
17 LOCAL FUNDS IS IN THE THIRD COLUMN, AND THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
18 THOSE DEVELOPMENT TYPES IN EACH COUNTY IS SHOWN IN THE LAST
19 COLUMN. THESE COST DIFFERENCES TELL US THAT MUCH MORE IS GOING
20 ON BEYOND JUST THE PAYMENT OF PREVAILING WAGES. THIS
21 INFORMATION GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY TO WORK TOGETHER TO
22 UNDERSTAND EXACTLY WHAT IS GOING ON, WHAT ARE NON-ESSENTIAL
23 REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS THAT WE COULD REDUCE, HOW COULD WE
24 WORK TOGETHER TO BETTER EXPEDITE FINANCING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL
25 TO FINANCE MORE EFFICIENTLY OUR PROJECTS, TO MOVE FASTER,

MARCH 13, 2024

1 THAT'S THE BEST WAY TO SAVE MONEY ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING
2 DEVELOPMENT, TO PRIORITIZE PROJECTS THAT CAN USE STREAMLINING
3 LEGISLATION SO THAT THEY DON'T WAIT YEARS FOR ENTITLEMENT, AND
4 FACE THOSE YEARS OF COST ESCALATIONS WHICH BRING US INTO THAT
5 \$900,000 RANGE. AND WE CAN PRIORITIZE REFOCUSING ON OUR DESIGN
6 STANDARDS WITH THE GOAL OF BUILDING SAFE, DECENT, AND COST
7 EFFECTIVE HOUSING. ALL OF THIS TAKES MORE RESEARCH BUT WE KNOW
8 THAT THERE IS SIGNIFICANT OPPORTUNITY IN THIS DATA TO WORK
9 TOGETHER TO HELP BRING COST DOWN SO THAT WE CAN USE OUR
10 PRECIOUS RESOURCES TO BUILD MORE. NEXT SLIDE. THE COST TRENDS
11 ARE WORSENING, BUT WITH A SUCCESSFUL BOND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
12 THE RESOURCES WE NEED TO START IMPLEMENTING THIS BETTER
13 FINANCING SYSTEM AND THESE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES THAT CAN
14 HELP US REVERSE THIS TREND. NEXT SLIDE. SO, TO SUMMARIZE, WE
15 KNOW THAT A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF TAX CREDIT FUNDED HOUSING
16 BUILT NOW APPLYING ZERO LABOR STANDARDS AND IN THIS SETTING
17 WORKERS CAN BE VULNERABLE. BUT WE ALSO KNOW THAT ESTABLISHING
18 RIGID AND RESTRICTIVE STANDARDS ALONG WITH OTHER REGULATORY
19 BURDENS CAN DRIVE COSTS UP AND THAT WILL MAKE IT VERY
20 DIFFICULT TO REACH OUR GOALS. WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY, WITH
21 OUR REGIONAL HOUSING BOND, TO EXPAND WORKER PROTECTIONS,
22 CREATE MORE JOBS, AND BUILD THE HOUSING THAT WE NEED. SO,
23 CREATING A BALANCED AND INCLUSIVE LABOR STANDARD THAT CAN WORK
24 IN EVERY COUNTY IS CRITICAL TO ACHIEVING OUR VISION AND
25 CREATING THE SYSTEMS CHANGE THAT WILL BE NECESSARY TO MEET

MARCH 13, 2024

1 THESE RHNA TARGETS AND OUR OVERALL HOUSING GOALS. NEXT SLIDE.
2 NEXT STEP TIMELINE WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THE DISCUSSIONS
3 WITH LABOR REPRESENTATIVES AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS WE WILL BE
4 HAVING AN INFORMATIONAL MEETING IN MARCH FOR THE ABAG
5 EXECUTIVE BOARD. WE HOPE THAT ALL THE BOARD MEMBERS CAN MAKE
6 IT. IN APRIL WE'LL BE RETURNING TO YOU ON APRIL 10TH WITH
7 WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS ON LABOR STANDARDS AND AT THE END OF
8 THE MONTH IN APRIL, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL HAVE BEFORE
9 IT SOME REALLY CRITICAL DECISIONS MOVING FORWARD OUR BUSINESS
10 PLAN, OUR EXPENDITURE PLAN WITH LABOR STANDARDS AND THE
11 INITIATING RESOLUTION FOR THE BOND MEASURE. THEN WE HAVE A
12 REQUIRED INFORMATIONAL MEETING AT THE BAHFA BOARD IN MAY, WITH
13 THE FINAL VOTE ON THE BOND MEASURE. ADVANCING IT TO THE
14 NOVEMBER BALLOT IN JUNE. AND THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION,
15 AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** ALL RIGHT. MISS HARTLEY,
18 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR ROMERO
19 WHO I BELIEVE NOW HAS ESTABLISHED PROPER QUORUM WITH ALL THE
20 LOCATIONS PROPERLY NOTICED.

21

22 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** THAT IS CORRECT. AND I WILL FLY
23 THROUGH THIS. LET'S SEE. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL ROLL CALL
24 FOR THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE, PLEASE?

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. MAYOR ARREGUIN?

2

3 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO-BAS?

6

7 **NIKKI FORTUNATO-BAS:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

10

11 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIFE?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLIGOR?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG HC:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTOYAMA? RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

22

23 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** PRESENT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN?

5

6 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR WILLIAMS IS ON ZOOM BUT IS NOT AT A
9 TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** THANK YOU. WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE
12 THE ABAG HOUSING COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
15 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN
16 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
17 AMOUNT OF \$150 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
18 EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST ITEM IS WE
21 HAVE ONE CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM. APPROVAL OF THE ABAG HOUSING
22 COMMITTEE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 14TH. WHAT IS THE ABAG
23 COMMITTEE ASK -- PREFERENCE WITH THIS?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MOVE CONSENT.

20

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** SECOND, RAMOS.

5

6 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** MOTION AND SECOND. DO WE HAVE
7 ANY COMMENTERS?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
10 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC
11 COMMENT, AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, I SEE TWO HANDS RAISED. I
12 CAN CALL TO ASK WHETHER THEY ARE ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** I THINK SO, YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOE MADICAL, ARE YOU SPEAKING ON THE ABAG
17 HOUSING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES, I AM.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. WHAT IS THE TIME
22 LIMIT, PLEASE?

23

24 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** LET'S DO ONE MINUTE ON THIS
25 [INDISCERNIBLE]

21

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I 'M SORRY?

3

4 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** ONE MINUTE IS FINE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE MINUTE, YES. ONE MOMENT PLEASE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I CAN BEAT ONE MINUTE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS IS THE ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE
11 CONSENT CALENDAR. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS JOE
14 MADICAL WITH TEAMSTERS LOCAL 665. THANKS FOR HELPING TO
15 PROVIDE SAFE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND GOOD JOBS FOR BAY AREA
16 RESIDENTS. ANY BALLOT MEASURE THAT YOU APPROVE --

17

18 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** I'M SORRY. THIS MAY NOT BE --
19 THIS IS PROBABLY APPROPRIATE FOR THE NEXT ITEM. THIS IS THE
20 CONSENT CALENDAR. SO, COULD WE -- IF YOU WOULD PLEASE HOLD OFF
21 UNTIL WE GET TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I THOUGHT WE WERE TALKING -- OKAY.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** I'M SORRY FOR THE CONFUSION.

2 THANK YOU. AND HOLD ON.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IF I CAN ASK THE NAPA SOLANO COUNTY LAB,

5 IF YOU ARE SPEAKING ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE CONSENT OR

6 ON THE BAHFA ITEM? THERE ARE NO HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

7 ON THIS ITEM

8

9 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** CALL THE MOTION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARREGUIN?

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BAS?

16

17 **NIKKI FORTUNATO-BAS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. FIFE?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** YES.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLIGOR?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG HC:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTOYAMA?

7

8 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ORTIZ?

11

12 **JULIETH ORTIZ:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBITT? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
15 RAMOS?

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

20

21 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN?

24

25 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** YES.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS IS NOT AT A
3 TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
4 MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** BACK TO CHAIR PEDROZA.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
9 WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS AND
10 MEMBERS. YOU DON'T ALL HAVE TO JUMP OUT AT ONE TIME. I KNOW
11 THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. IF I DON'T SEE ANY LET'S GO
12 TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THEN COME BACK TO THE BOARD. LET'S
13 START WITH THOSE HERE IN-PERSON. BECAUSE I APPRECIATE THEM
14 COMING IN. LET'S PROCEED WITH THAT THEN GO TO THE VIRTUAL ROOM
15 AS WELL.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS I CALL YOU PLEASE LINE UP AT THE
18 PODIUM. ANTHONY MODEL FOLLOWED BY RON BROWN.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** AND HOW MANY -- BEFORE WE
21 DO THAT, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE 11 AND 2 -- THREE, AND COUNTING,
24 IN THE ZOOM.

25

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ONE MINUTE, PLEASE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ONE MOMENT PLEASE. ANTHONY
4 MADDEN?

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** AND AS WE DO I JUST WANT
7 TO REMIND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, YOU CAN ALWAYS COMMUNICATE
8 WITH THE BOARD THROUGH E-MAIL AND THROUGH MULTIPLE OTHER FORMS
9 THAT WE HAVE SO JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I'M ANTHONY MADDEN. I'M FROM THE HOMELESS JUSTICE
12 LEAGUE FROM ST. MARY'S. AND HOW DID I GET IN THIS? MY PLACE
13 CAUGHT ON FIRE, AND I DID HAVE A WAY TO GET OUT. SO, I WENT TO
14 JUSTICE LEAGUE AT ST. MARYS, AND THEY HELPED US GET OUT OF
15 THIS, BUT WE DO NEED IT, AND WE GOT TO HAVE IT, BECAUSE THERE
16 IS A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT ARE HOMELESS RIGHT NOW AND THAT PUT ME
17 OUT OF WORK TOO, WHEN MY PLACE CAUGHT FIRE, BECAUSE I LOST
18 EVERYTHING. SO, THAT'S THE WAY IT IS, AND THAT'S THE WAY IT'S
19 GOING TO BE. SO, IT'S MY FIRST TIME SPEAKING. SO, EXCUSE ME A
20 LITTLE BIT (LAUGHTER) BUT, THAT'S, YOU KNOW, WE -- WE'RE GLAD
21 TO YOU HAVE GUYS HERE TO HELP US. SO, THAT'S WHAT WE NEED.
22 OKAY?

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** YOU DID GREAT. AND
25 WELCOME.

26

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** PARDON?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** YOU DID GREAT. AND

5 WELCOME.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RON BROWN FOLLOWED BY

10 KEITH.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS RON BROWN. I AM A MEMBER OF

13 THE MARIN ORGANIZING COMMITTEE A COALITION OF 24 SYNAGOGUES

14 AND OTHER NON-PROFIT INSTITUTIONS THAT ARE PART OF THE BAY

15 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION THAT ARE HERE TO PROVIDE

16 SUPPORT FOR THE BAHFA BOND MEASURE SUPPORT MOVING THE PLAN

17 FORWARD WITH STRONG LANGUAGE LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE WE

18 STRONGLY ENCOURAGE STAFF OUR FRIENDS AND LABOR MOVEMENT

19 COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE QUICKLY TO AN AGREEMENT

20 ON THE FINAL PLAN ORGANIZING COMMITTEE BEGINNING INTENSIVE

21 PROGRAM TO EDUCATE THE 16,000 MEMBERS OF OUR INSTITUTIONS, AND

22 APPROPRIATE TO CARRY OUT THE CAMPAIGN TO ENSURE WE GET AS MANY

23 MARIN VOTES TO THE POLLS AS POSSIBLE. MEMBERS OF ELECTION WILL

24 ARRIVE ALL TOO SOON THE BOND MEASURE WILL REQUIRE ALL OF US TO

MARCH 13, 2024

1 BE ON BOARD TO MOVE FORWARD AS EXPEDITIOUSLY AS POSSIBLE.

2 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. KEITH FOLLOWED BY ANNE BADLY.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO EVERYONE MY NAME IS KEITH, I'M THE PRESIDENT OF
7 COUNCIL OF ELDERS AT ST. MARY'S CENTER IN OAK AND I'M HERE TO
8 SUPPORT THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND AND ASK YOU TO SOFTEN YOUR
9 HEART AND YOURSELF IN POSITION OF A SENIOR ON FIXED INCOME AND
10 IMAGINE GETTING \$1,228 A MONTH BUT YOUR RENT IS 1600 SO YOU
11 SEE IT'S IMPOSSIBLE FOR A SENIOR ON FIXED INCOME TO LIVE A
12 HEALTHY NORMAL PRODUCTIVE LIFESTYLE WITHOUT SOME TYPE OF
13 SUBSIDY OR SECTION EIGHT VOUCHER SO DON'T DO IT JUST FOR ME DO
14 IT FOR YOURSELF LIVING ON FIXED ITEM MY NAME IS KEITH AND
15 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ANNE BRADLEY FOLLOWED BY KEITH
18 BROWN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON AND THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING US TO
21 PARTICIPATE TODAY. MY NAME IS ANNE BRADLEY. I AM VICE
22 PRESIDENT ON THE COUNCIL OF ELDERS AT ST. MARY'S CENTER I'M
23 ALSO ON THE STEERING COMMITTEE FOR THE RESIDENTS UNITED
24 NETWORK. WE WORK TO GET LEGISLATION PASSED STATEWIDE TO HELP
25 THE HOMELESS INCLUDING NEW HOUSING CONSTRUCTION. HOUSING IS A

MARCH 13, 2024

1 HUMAN RIGHT. AND I THINK WE NEED TO KEEP THE HOMELESS AT THE
2 CENTER OF THIS BILL. I LIVE IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THANKFULLY
3 I LIVE IN A PROJECT BASED VOUCHER BUILDING, SO I PAY 30% OF MY
4 INCOME, NOT 30% OF AMI. THE AMI IN OAKLAND IS \$158,000. THAT'S
5 A LOT OF MONEY. WHAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO DO TODAY IS, INSTEAD
6 OF GIVING MONEY TO THE ZERO TO 50% GROUP OF AMI, WE WANT YOU
7 TO DROP THAT TO 22% OF AMI, WHICH AMOUNTS TO ABOUT \$35,000 A
8 YEAR. PEOPLE WHO MAKE 50% OF AMI CAN AFFORD A ONE BEDROOM
9 APARTMENT. THEY CAN ALSO AFFORD FOOD TO PUT ON THE TABLE. SO,
10 PLEASE HELP THE ACUTELY LOW-INCOME. THAT'S WHO IS AT THE HEART
11 OF THE MATTER HERE, AND HOMELESSNESS.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS KEITH BROWN FOLLOWED
20 BY SYBIL CARPENTER WILL GOOD AFTERNOON I'M KEITH BROWN AND I
21 REPRESENT 135,000 WORK NURSE ALAMEDA COUNTY AS EXECUTIVE
22 SECRETARY TREASURER OF THE ALAMEDA LABOR COUNCIL. THANK YOU
23 COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF FOR THE PRESENTATION AND I ALSO THANK
24 YOU FOR THE WORK YOU'RE ALL DOING TO SOLVE THE URGENT AND
25 COMPLEX ISSUES THAT WE HAVE TO PROVIDE SAFE, AFFORDABLE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 HOUSING, AND GOOD JOBS FOR THE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY AREA. AND
2 THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT WORK, AND VITAL FOR WORKING FAMILIES IN
3 OUR REGION. AND I'M HERE REPRESENTING LABOR JUST TO STATE THAT
4 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE BOND MEASURE HAS STRONG LABOR
5 STANDARDS THAT APPLIES TO ALL OF THE BOND REVENUE, JUST -- NOT
6 JUST SOME, AND, ALSO, THAT IS IMPORTANT FOR CONSENSUS OF ALL
7 STAKEHOLDERS TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD TO GUIDE THE
8 SUCCESS OF OUR MEASURE, LABOR WE'RE GOING TO BE THROWING DOWN
9 AND MAKING SURE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** -- MAKING SURE THAT THIS IS SUPPORTED. BUT WE
14 DEFINITELY NEED TO BE A PART OF THE TABLE AND THE DISCUSSIONS.
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SYBIL
18 CARPENTER, FOLLOWED BY IRVING. SYBIL CARPENTER.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** IF YOU CAN A FEW OTHERS
21 SO THEY CAN GET READY.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FOLLOWED BY IRVING AND GITA RAO.

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU, MR. CASTRO.

30

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE HERE. IT IS A PRIVILEGE TO
3 COME BEFORE YOU TO SPEAK. BUT MY WORDS MAY NOT BE AS SUNNY AS
4 YOU WANT TO HEAR. I DON'T REALLY BELIEVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS
5 WORKING. BECAUSE THERE NEEDS TO BE A LARGE AMOUNT OF
6 ACCOUNTABILITY ON HOW IT IS RUN, AND THAT IT HAS -- I HAVE
7 NEVER BEEN IMPACTED AS NEGATIVELY AS I'M BEING IMPACTED NOW. I
8 HAVE REACHED OUT TO COUNCILMAN FIFE, KAPLAN, AND THE MAYOR. NO
9 RESPONSE. SO, IN THEORY, AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A NICE PREMISE,
10 BUT IN REALITY, IT CAN BE VERY, VERY DIFFICULT FOR THE PEOPLE
11 WHO HAVE TO ACTUALLY LIVE THERE, AND THE PEOPLE WHO WANT TO
12 RUN IT THE WAY THEY FEEL IT SHOULD BE RUN. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. IRVING FOLLOWED BY SCOTT
15 LITTLEHALE THEN DAVINA.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
18 COMMENT. MY NAME IS IRVING TORRES. I'M WITH ALL HOME. ALL HOME
19 IS A REGIONAL ORGANIZATION THAT IS ADVANCING THE REGIONAL
20 SOLUTIONS THAT DISRUPT THE CYCLES OF HOMELESSNESS AND POVERTY
21 AROUND HERE IN THE BAY AREA, WE'RE A PROUD MEMBER OF THE BAY
22 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION AND WE'RE HERE IN STRONG
23 SUPPORT FOR THE BAHFA BOND, REGIONAL BOND MEASURE. WE SUPPORT
24 MOVING THE MEASURE FORWARD, AND WE SUPPORT THE LABOR STANDARDS
25 IN THE MEASURE. AND WE ENCOURAGE STAFF, FRIENDS AND LABOR AND

31

MARCH 13, 2024

1 COMMISSIONERS AT ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO A
2 COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT GETTING THIS MEASURE ACROSS THE FINISH
3 LINE AND TAKE WE IF WE'RE GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL. I WANT TO
4 THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE FOLLOWED
7 BY DAVINA FROM EAST BAY HOUSING ORGANIZATION THEN NOELANI
8 GREENBELT ALLIANCE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS SCOTT LITTLEHALE. I'M
11 EXECUTIVE RESEARCH ANALYST AT NORCAL CARPENTERS UNION. I'M
12 PLEASED TO BE HERE ON BEHALF OF 37,000 MEMBERS, 2/3 OF WHOM
13 RESIDE IN CENSUS TRACT COMMUNITIES THAT ARE EITHER
14 DISADVANTAGED OR LOW-INCOME AND WHAT I'M HEARING IN THE
15 PRESENTATION TODAY IS HOPE WE'RE CONVERGING UPON THE THREE
16 BASIC POLICY PRINCIPLES TO GO OUT AND BUILD HOUSING AND
17 PROTECT AND UPLIFT ALL OF THE WORKERS THAT ARE BUILDING THE
18 HOUSING PROVIDE LEVEL HIGH COMPETITIVE PLAYING FIELD UPON
19 WHICH UNIONS CAN GO OUT AND DO THEIR JOB AND GO OUT AND
20 ORGANIZE CONTRACTORS THAT ARE BUILDING THAT HOUSING I DRAW
21 YOUR ATTENTION TO THE LETTER IN YOUR PACKETS, ONE OF THE LABOR
22 STANDARDS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT IN THE LETTER, WERE SPONSORED
23 BY AN ORGANIZATION OF NON-PROFIT HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS AND
24 ADVOCATES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME I'LL BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
25 QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY HAVE.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVINA FOLLOWED
3 BY NOELANI.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS DAVINA HERE TODAY ON BEHALF OF EAST
6 BAY HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS A PROUD MEMBER OF BAY AREA HOUSING
7 FOR ALL COALITION TODAY I'M EXPRESSING SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA
8 BOND SUPPORTING OUR VITAL HOUSING NEEDS IN THE BAY AREA MUST
9 BE DONE IN SWIFT UNNECESSARY CONSIDERATION TO LABOR STANDARDS
10 WE URGE ALL INVOLVED TO MOVE IN URGENCY AND HASTE TOWARDS
11 COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT AND WHERE WE'RE UNITED WE WILL ACHIEVE
12 HOUSING JUSTICE FOR ALL. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS NOELANI, FOLLOWED BY KEN
15 CHAN AND CHARLES LAVERY.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS NOELANI HERE ON BEHALF
18 OF GREENBELT ALLIANCE IN STRONG ASSIST OF THE BAHFA BOND, THE
19 BOND IS CRITICAL FOR OUR REGION NOT JUST FOR AN AFFORDABLE
20 HOUSING POINT BUT ENVIRONMENTAL PERSPECTIVE AS WELL,
21 ACCELERATING CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE INFILL IN HOUSING IN
22 EXISTING CITY WILL LOWER VMT AND GHG ALLOWING US TO PRESERVE
23 OPEN SPACE AND LAND GROWING THE REGION THAT BENEFITS ALL
24 REPORTS PROTECT THE PLANET FOR GENERATIONS TO COME. THANK YOU.

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KEN CHAN, FOLLOWED BY CHARLES LAVERY THEN
2 BILL BARNES. KEN CHAN, ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS, MY NAME IS KEN
5 CHAN, AND I'M THE SENIOR ORGANIZER WITH THE HOUSING LEADERSHIP
6 COUNCIL OF SAN MATEO COUNTY. WE WORK WITH COMMUNITIES AND
7 LEADERS TO PRODUCE QUALITY AFFORDABLE HOMES. ON BEHALF OF HLC
8 AND AS A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, I'M
9 EXPRESSING SUPPORT FOR THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE AND
10 INCLUSION OF THE LABOR STANDARDS. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT
11 THE WORLD IS CHANGING RAPIDLY AND WE ARE FACING COMPLEX
12 CHALLENGES, FAR TOO MANY OF YOUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS ARE STILL
13 IN NEED OF STABLE AFFORDABLE PLACE TO CALL HOME TO ADDRESS IT
14 WE NEED OUR HOUSING SYSTEMS TO OPERATE BETTER. YOU CAN HELP
15 YOUR COMMUNITY BY MAKING INVESTMENTS IN SECURING AND FUNDING
16 CREATING PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOMES FOR YOUR MOST VULNERABLE
17 RESIDENTS AND THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND IS A GOOD STEP IN THE
18 RIGHT DIRECTION THIS IS YOUR OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AN IMPACT HOW
19 YOU CHOOSE TO RESPOND IN THIS MOMENT MATTERS.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WE ENCOURAGE TO YOU MOVE THIS MEASURE FORWARD AND
24 INCLUSION OF THE LABOR STANDARDS.

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLES LAVERY FOLLOWED BY
2 BILL BARNES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS, FOR YOUR CIVIC SERVICE,
5 CHARLIE LAVERY WITH OPERATING ENGINEERS UNION. THANK YOU KATE
6 FOR MAKING OUTREACH TO LABOR AND THE ROBUST CONVERSATIONS
7 YOU'RE HAVING THERE, WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO CONTINUE THOSE.
8 IT'S GREAT TO SEE A HOLISTIC APPROACH TO THIS AND ADDRESSING
9 SOME OF THE UNDERLYING CAUSES OF HOMELESSNESS, PROVIDING
10 LIVING WAGE JOBS FOR WORKERS AND WORK PROTECTIONS. I THINK
11 IT'S ESSENTIAL, AND IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SOME
12 STRUCTURAL CHANGES THAT ADDRESS THOSE DEFICIENCIES IN OUR
13 SYSTEM. SO, THANK YOU, ALL.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS BILL BARNES.
16 ONE MINUTE PLEASE

17

18 **SPEAKER:** BILL BARNES FROM MPH NON-PROFIT HOUSING IN NORTHERN
19 CALIFORNIA SUPPORTING THE EFFORT TO GET THE BOND TO THE BALLOT
20 PULLING OUT ALL THE STOPS TO MAKE SURE IT'S ENACTED WE HAVE
21 BEEN IF CONVERSATIONS WITH LABOR AND OFFICE STAFF HAPPY TO
22 CONTINUE OPEN-MINDED COLLABORATIVE DISCUSSION ABOUT THOSE
23 TOPICS, WITH DIVERSE COMMUNITIES AND WORKFORCE, MEETING
24 STANDARDS AS IT RELATES TO LEADERSHIP, WE BELIEVE WE CAN FIND
25 A SOLUTION THAT IMPOSES LABOR STANDARDS AND INVOLVES

MARCH 13, 2024

1 UNIQUENESS OF ALL LOCAL COMMUNITIES SO WE CAN HAVE STANDARDS
2 THAT CAN BE MET. IN CLOSING, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE COST
3 EFFECTIVE AND THOUGHTFUL AND MAKE SURE WE MEET STANDARDS THE
4 REGION EXPECTS. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
7 SPEAKERS IN THE BOARDROOM, CHAIR PEDROZA, BUT THERE ARE 18 --
8 21 IN THE ZOOM SPACE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I CAN CALL THEM
9 IN TURN.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** WE'RE GOING TO GO AHEAD
12 AND START NOW.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS VIVIAN WONG. GO AHEAD.
15 ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME ALL RIGHT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** VIVIAN WONG CEO OF ABODE SERVICES, WE PROVIDE HOUSING
22 SERVICES FOR FOLKS EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS IN SEVEN BAY AREA
23 COUNTIES SUPPORTING MORE THAN 15,000 PEOPLE WHO HAVE
24 EXPERIENCED HOMELESSNESS EACH YEAR. WE ARE IN STRONG SUPPORT
25 OF THE REGIONAL BOND, BUT IMPLORE YOU THAT TO ENSURE THAT WE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 HAVE SET ASIDE FOR THE VERY LOWEST INCOME LEVELS OF ZERO TO
2 20%, KATE MENTIONED AND WE ALL KNOW THAT IT'S THE INTENTION OF
3 THIS BOND TO IMPACT HOMELESSNESS BUT THAT'S NOT GOING TO
4 HAPPEN UNLESS WE TARGET AT LOWER LEVELS. WE KNOW WE'RE WORRIED
5 ABOUT SUBSIDY, BUT UNLESS WE TARGET IT, IT WILL NOT GET BUILT
6 AT THE LOWEST LEVEL. I IMPLORE YOU TO LOOK AT ENSURING THAT
7 THE BOND ACTUALLY MEETS THE NEED FOR THE GREATEST AT-RISK.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GRECIA. ONE
11 MINUTE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS GRECIA, I'M THE POLICY
14 HOUSING MANAGER FOR TRANSFORM HERE IN SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA
15 BOND SUPPORT THE MEASURE FORWARD AND LABOR STANDARDS. DURING
16 THE PANDEMIC I WAS PART OF A WAVE OF WOMEN WHO HAD TO LEAVE
17 THE WORKFORCE, DURING THIS TIME MY HUSBAND'S UNION AND THE
18 PROTECTIONS AFFORDED, KEPT US AFLOAT. HOWEVER I EXPERIENCED
19 HOUSING INSECURITY AS A CHILD SOMETHING NO CHILD SHOULD
20 EXPERIENCE BUT MANY CONTINUE TO RIGHT NOW IN THE BAY AREA. I
21 KNOW FIRST HAPPENED HOW IMPORTANT THOSE THINGS ARE THAT WE'RE
22 TALKING ABOUT TODAY AND IT'S CRITICAL THAT ALL DECISION MAKERS
23 INVOLVED MOVE QUICKLY TO COME TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT BECAUSE
24 WE ALL HAVE WAITED LONG ENOUGH. LET'S GET THIS DONE AND GET
25 THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT THIS NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS KIMBERLY
3 TAVAGLIONE. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. KIMBERLY? IF YOU CAN
4 UNMUTE PLEASE? ALL RIGHT. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS BART SAN MATEO
5 COUNTY BCTC. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS BART PANTOLA, I AM THE
8 SECRETARY TREASURER OF THE SAN MATEO COUNTY BUILDING AND
9 CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL REPRESENTING \$10,000 500 MEN AND
10 WOMEN LIVING AND WORKING IN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY OF THIS
11 COUNTY I WANT TO EXPRESS THE SUPPORT FOR COMMENTS MADE BY
12 FELLOW REPRESENTATIVES OF LABOR I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
13 HELPING TO SOLVE THIS COMPLEX AND URGENT ISSUE OF PROVIDING
14 SAFE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND GOOD JOBS FOR BAY AREA RESIDENTS.
15 AS ANY BALLOT MEASURE APPROVED MUST INCLUDE STRONG LABOR
16 STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL BOND REVENUE NOT JUST SOME. AND
17 FINALLY, DID YOU KNOW THAT IN THE RECENTLY RELEASED
18 INDEPENDENT 20 YEAR STUDY THAT 100% UNION CONSTRUCTION PROJECT
19 VERSUS NON-UNION CONSTRUCTION PROJECT HAS AVERAGED SAVINGS OF
20 4% TO BE CLEAR AVERAGE UNION CONSTRUCTION HAS SAVED MONEY.
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS GREG HARDIMAN.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON GREG, BUSINESS REP RECORDING SECRETARY
2 FOR THE ELEVATOR CONSTRUCTORS LOCAL EIGHT SAN FRANCISCO ECHO
3 LABOR COUNCIL'S BUILDING TRADES UNION WORKERS AND FAMILIES
4 ACROSS THE BAY AREA THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR WORKING TOGETHER TO
5 PROVIDE A SAFE AFFORDABLE AND GOOD JOBS FOR THE BAY AREA
6 RESIDENTS RESPECTFUL OF ASK THAT THE BALLOT MEASURE APPROVED
7 MUST INCLUDE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS TO APPLY ALL BOND MEASURES
8 NOT JUST -- AND ALSO NEEDS TO BE IN CONSENSUS WITH THE
9 STAKEHOLDERS OF ONE STANDARD VITAL FOR OUR SUCCESS. LASTLY
10 LABOR UNIONS AND THEIR MEMBERS ARE LOCAL TAXPAYERS AND VOTERS
11 WILL DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE BOND CAMPAIGN OF THE BALLOT
12 BOX LET'S ENSURE THAT THOSE FOLKS GETTING HIRED TO CONSTRUCT
13 THOSE BUILDINGS ARE GETTING A FAMILY SUSTAINING WAGE. THANK
14 YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA STRAUSS.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON I'M SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF UNITED WAY
19 BAY AREA JOINING PARTNERS IN SUPPORT OF MOVING THIS MEASURE
20 FORWARD AND ARE ALSO IN STRONG SUPPORT OF INCORPORATING
21 SIGNIFICANT LABOR STANDARDS INTO THIS MEASURE. WE APPRECIATE
22 ALL THE EFFORT THAT STAFF, COMMISSIONERS, AND ABAG MEMBERS AND
23 PARTNER IN LABOR PUT INTO THE CONVERSATION SO FAR AND WE LOOK
24 FORWARD TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT SOON. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
25 YOUR TIME AND YOUR PARTNERSHIP.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RUDY
3 GONZALEZ. ONE MINUTE PLEASE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE BOARD.
6 RUDY GONZALEZ, SAN FRANCISCO BUILDING TRADES I REPRESENT THE
7 CONSTRUCTION CRAFTS IN SAN FRANCISCO PROPER. LOOK, I WON'T
8 REPEAT EXACTLY WHAT EVERYBODY ELSE SAID. I THINK THAT
9 FUNDAMENTALLY WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO WORK THROUGH HERE IS, ARE
10 THERE EXISTING STANDARDS THAT CAN BE LOOKED TO AS A NORTH
11 STAR, IF YOU WILL, TO GUIDE US THROUGH THIS DISCUSSION? I
12 THINK THAT IN THE PRESENTATION PACKET THERE ARE A NUMBER OF
13 STANDARDS. I THINK WHAT WE NEED TO BE STRIVING FOR IS TO REACH
14 AN AGREEMENT THAT ENSURES WE'RE GOING TO HAVE THE MOST PEOPLE,
15 RIGHT, UNDER THE LARGEST TENTS, PUSHING AND ROWING IN THE SAME
16 DIRECTION TO ULTIMATELY WIN WHAT I THINK WE ALL WANT TO SEE A
17 SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGN LOOK LIKE. OUR MEMBERS VOTE, AND OUR
18 MEMBERS WORK ON THESE JOBS, AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO
19 PARTNERING WITH YOU. LET'S GET THIS THING DONE AND LET'S GET
20 ONE UNIFIED LABOR STANDARD. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS COURTNEY PAUL.
23 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** COURTNEY PAUL, POLICY MANAGER FOR RESOURCES FOR
2 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, OR RCD, AS WE'RE KNOWN IN THE FIELD
3 WE'RE A NON-PROFIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS WITH A
4 MISSION OF PROVIDING AFFORDABLE HOMES FOR PEOPLE IN THE BAY
5 AREA WITH THE FEWEST HOUSING OPTIONS AND ALSO A PROUD MEMBER
6 OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. WE SUPPORT
7 INCLUDING LABOR STANDARDS IN THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND MEASURE
8 AND WE ENCOURAGE STAFF, LABOR LEADERS COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG
9 MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT ON
10 WHAT STANDARDS LOOK LIKE COMMUNITIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA ARE
11 IN NEED OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IS
12 OUR BEST OPPORTUNITY FOR MOVING NEW HOMES FORWARD IN CONCEPT
13 TO CONSTRUCTION WE NEED TO DEVELOP A MEASURE THAT HAS
14 WIDESPREAD SUPPORT AND THAT WILL ALLOW US TO GET TO WORK
15 BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOMES OUR COMMUNITIES NEED THANK YOU FOR
16 YOUR CONSIDERATION TODAY.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS EJ SAWYER. ONE MINUTE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONVERSATIONS THAT HAVE
21 BEEN HAD THUS FAR I WANT TO POINT TO THE SLIDE KATE GAVE
22 EARLIER AND THE BALANCING GOAL SLIDE PRESERVING AFFORDABLE
23 HOUSING AT SCALE NECESSARY TO MEET THE NEEDS OF BAY AREA
24 RESIDENTS WE HAVE THE SAME GOAL AND WE HAVE THAT FOR MULTIPLE
25 REASONS ONE OF THOSE CITIZEN FACT THAT WE HAVE A LOT OF

MARCH 13, 2024

1 WORKFORCE ALREADY BUT WE HAVE EVEN MORE THAT WANT THE
2 OPPORTUNITY TO JOIN MIDDLE CLASS. METAL WORKERS LOCAL 1041
3 LOCAL HAS 1,938 APPLICANTS THAT ARE TRYING TO GET INTO THE
4 MIDDLE CLASS VIA LOCAL WE WANT TO BRING IN COMMUNITY MEMBERS
5 WHO HAVE THUS FAR HAVE BARRIERS TO BE THE MIDDLE CLASS TO BE
6 ABLE TO GET IN WE WANT TO JOIN THE RANG AND HELP BUILD
7 COMMUNITIES THEY LIVE IN ONE LABOR STANDARD IS GOING TO BE
8 ESSENTIAL TO HELPING THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE CURRENTLY ON
9 WAITING LISTS TO GET INTO LOCALS ALL OVER THE NINE BAY AREA
10 COUNTIES AND BEYOND. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS NAPA SOLANO CENTRAL LABOR
13 COUNCIL.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON GLEN, NAPA LABOR COUNCIL REPRESENTING
16 45 UNIONS COLLECTIVELY 50,000 WORKERS ACROSS NAPA COUNTIES. I
17 WANT TO ECHO UNION AND STAKEHOLDERS AND COMMUNITY ALLIES AND
18 STAKEHOLDERS WEIGHING IN SUPPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRONG
19 LABOR STANDARDS FOR THE BALLOT MEASURE LABOR STANDARDS
20 GOVERNING ENTIRETY OF THEIR FUNDS AND ONE STANDARD ESSENTIALLY
21 ESTABLISHED REGIONALLY I BELIEVE WE STAND HERE IN HISTORIC
22 OPPORTUNITY IN TERMS OF THE LARGE-SCALE INVESTMENT IF
23 AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHILE ALSO BEING ON THE CUTTING EDGE OF
24 CREATING AND SUPPORTING STRONG STANDARDS TO UPLIFT THE
25 WORKFORCE BEHIND IT, AND ALLOWING US TO BE ON THE CUTTING EDGE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 INTERSECTION OF SOCIAL EQUITY AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR WORKERS
2 ACROSS THE REGION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JULIAN. GO AHEAD.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JEWEL WAN WEAR I AM A
7 MEMBER OF IFPT LOCAL 21 AND MEMBER OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTIES
8 EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE FIRST OF ALL THANK YOU FOR HELPING US
9 SOLVE THE COMPLEX URGENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING GOOD JOBS FOR BAY
10 AREA RESIDENTS I WANT TO REITERATE, SUPPORT INCLUSION OF
11 STRONG LABOR STANDARDS, SECOND CONSENSUS AND COMPROMISE BY ALL
12 STAKEHOLDERS TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD IS IMPORTANT FOR
13 OUR SUCCESS AND FINALLY LABOR UNIONS AND MEMBERS AND VOTERS
14 PAY LOCAL TAXES AND WILL DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE BOND
15 CAMPAIGN AT THE BALLOT BOX LET'S MAKE SURE THERE ARE THE FOLKS
16 GETTING HIRED TO CONSTRUCT HOUSING AND EARN FAMILY SUSTAINING
17 WAGES. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ANDREAS. ONE MINUTE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** ANDREAS, ALAMEDA BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES
22 COUNCIL HERE IN STRONG SUPPORT OF THE BOND MEASURE IF IT HAS
23 THE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT I DO WANT TO
24 THANK THE STAFF AT BAHFA. WE HAVE HAD A NUMBER OF MEETINGS
25 AROUND THIS ISSUE AND WE'RE MAKING SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS AND

MARCH 13, 2024

1 ARE CONFIDENT WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS BODY WITH A LABOR
2 STANDARD THAT ALL PARTIES CAN AGREE TO BECAUSE IT WILL BE
3 ROOTED IN COMPROMISE. I WANT TO ALSO INDICATE THE IMPORTANCE
4 OF LABOR STANDARDS NOT FOR ONLY TO ENSURE THAT WORKERS ARE NOT
5 GOING TO BE EXPLOITED ON THESE JOBS BUT IT'S ALSO CRITICAL TO
6 ENSURE A LABOR SUPPLY OF SKILLED WORKERS FOR THE BUILD-OUT OF
7 THESE UNITS IN THE UPCOMING YEARS. AND FINALLY, I'M REALLY
8 ENCOURAGED BY THE CONSENSUS OF SPEAKERS AROUND THE IMPORTANCE
9 OF HIGH LABOR STANDARDS, BUT ALSO THE IMPORTANCE TO ENSURE
10 THAT LABOR STANDARDS WILL COVER 100% OF THE FUNDING THAT THIS
11 BOND MEASURE WILL GENERATE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JUDY
14 JACKSON. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. JUDY JACKSON.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I REPRESENT ST. MARY'S CENTER ON THE CALIFORNIA
17 ALLIANCE FOR RETIRED AMERICANS. I WOULD LIKE TO ALSO EMPHASIZE
18 THE NEED FOR A CUT-OUT FOR PEOPLE WITH 22% OF AMI AND THE
19 PEOPLE WHO CARE FOR THEM. BECAUSE MANY OF THEM ARE ON SSI,
20 LIKE I AM, AND THEY NEED NOT ONLY HOUSING FOR THEMSELVES, BUT
21 HOUSING FOR THOSE WHO CARE FOR THEM. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS DESTINATION
24 HOMES, SV. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
2 COMMENT. MY NAME IS ESMERELDA RAMIREZ, A MEMBER OF THE BAY
3 AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION WE SUPPORT MOVING THE PROPOSED
4 REGIONAL BOND MEASURE FORWARD AND HOPE YOU WILL TAKE STEPS TO
5 ENSURE THE BOND INCLUDES ROBUST LABOR STANDARD AND PROPERLY
6 PRIORITIZES THOSE WITH THE GREATEST NEEDS IN OUR COMMUNITY.
7 EXPANDING THE SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE AND SUPPORTIVE HOUSING IS
8 KEY TO ENDING HOMELESSNESS. IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH WITNESS
9 THE TRANSFORMATIVE EFFECT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING BONDS
10 RESULTING IN OVER 50 NEW DEVELOPMENTS AND 5,000 NEW AFFORDABLE
11 UNITS SINCE OUR 2016 INITIATIVE. HOWEVER, WITH OUR CURRENT
12 BOND FILL ALLOCATED WE MUST SECURE ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCES
13 TO MAINTAIN OUR MOMENTUM. THE BAHFA BOND WILL UNLOCK
14 DISPARATELY NEEDED FUNDS ENSURING OUR ENTIRE REGIONAL
15 COLLABORATIVE RATES EFFECTIVELY TO ADDRESS THE SEVERE CRISIS.
16 TOGETHER WE CAN MAKE HISTORIC EFFECT. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JULIE LYNN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** JULIE LYNN SAN MATEO LABOR COUNCIL REPRESENTING 100
21 AFFILIATES AND OVER 85,000 MEMBERS COUNTY-WIDE THANK YOU FOR
22 THE WORK YOU HAVE CONTINUED TO PUT INTO THE DISCUSSION AND THE
23 ISSUE OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND INCREASE THAT'S ACCESSIBLE TO
24 ALL. WE WANT TO SEE AFFORDABLE HOUSING BUILT AS WE BELIEVE
25 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A HUMAN RIGHT WE BELIEVE THE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 CONSTRUCTION UNDER BONDS NEEDS TO BE BUILT WITH STRONG LABOR
2 STANDARDS IN PLACE. WE ASK FOR A SUPPORT OF BOND OF THIS SIZE
3 AND NEW JOBS IF CREATED IF IT PASSES NEEDS TO BE DONE BY LOCAL
4 WORKERS EARNING FAMILY SUSTAINING WAGES AND BENEFITS WORKING
5 UNDER CONDITIONS THAT KEEP THEM SAFE AND RETURNING HOME AT
6 NIGHT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CALLUM WEEKS. ONE MINUTE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** CALLUM WEEKS, GENERATION HOUSING NORTH BAY HOUSING AT
11 SONOMA COUNTY THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE COMMENTS
12 ON THE TOPIC WE ARE A PROUD MEMBER OF BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL
13 COALITION LIKE THOSE WHO HAVE SPOKEN BEFORE ME WE TAKE TIME
14 TODAY TO ENCOURAGE STAFF FRIENDS AND LABOR COMMISSIONERS AND
15 ABAG MEMBERS TO CONTINUE WORKING TOWARDS THE PROCESS CROSSING
16 THE FINISH LINE AND REALIZE SUCCESS COME NOVEMBER. THE BOND IS
17 THE BEST OPPORTUNITY FOR SUBSTANTIAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING ACROSS
18 THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND LEADERSHIP. HAVE A
19 WONDERFUL DAY.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SHERYL PADDOQ. GO AHEAD PLEASE. YOU HAVE
22 ONE MINUTE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** CHERYL PADDOQ. I AM THE CEO OF NORTH MARIN COUNTY
25 COMMUNITY SERVICES NON-PROFIT NOVATO MARIN COUNTY PROVIDE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 SERVICES TO 10,000 PEOPLE A YEAR THE MAJORITY LOW-INCOME
2 HOUSEHOLDS STRUGGLING WITH HOUSING COSTS WE'RE PROUD MEMBER OF
3 BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, WE HAVE A HIGH COST OF
4 HOUSING, EVERYONE DOES IN THE BAY AREA HERE IN NOVATO. IT
5 TAKES ABOUT 2.2 FULL-TIME JOBS JUST TO AFFORD TWO BEDROOM RENT
6 COST WHICH IS AROUND \$3,200 A MONTH. 60% OF OUR RENTERS SPEND
7 MORE THAN A THIRD OF THEIR INCOME ON RENT AND CANNOT AFFORD
8 CHILD CARE, FOOD, AND OTHER FUNDAMENTAL NEEDS. WE'RE HERE IN
9 SUPPORT WE HOPE -- WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MARIN
10 ORGANIZING COMMITTEE AND ALL OF THE PARTNERS HERE IN MIC TO
11 HELP THIS BOND MEASURE PASS AND WE ALSO SUPPORT MOVING THE
12 MEASURE FORWARD AND THE LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE. WE
13 ENCOURAGE STAFF, OUR FRIENDS IN LABOR, AND THE COMMISSION --

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME, PLEASE. THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS
16 DAVID BENNY. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON I'M DAVID BEANIE FOR THE SANTA CLARA
19 AND SAN BENITO COUNTY BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES COUNCIL
20 I'M JOINING COLLEAGUES IN THE LABOR MOVEMENT AND OUR ALLIES TO
21 EXPRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING STRONG CONSISTENT LABOR
22 STANDARDS ATTACHED TO ANY MONEYS THAT ARE DISTRIBUTED THROUGH
23 A BOND FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE WORKERS WITHIN RESIDENTIAL
24 CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY ARE SUBJECT TO SOME OF THE WORST
25 EXPLOITATION AND WE HAVE A DUTY TO PROTECT THIS VULNERABLE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 POPULATION PREVAILING WAGE IS NOT ENOUGH. CUTTHROAT EMPLOYEES
2 HAVE FOUND DOZENS OF WAYS TO CHEAT WORKERS FROM CLASSIFICATION
3 TO PAYMENTS FALSIFICATION CERTIFIED PAYROLL SOME CASES BORDER
4 HUMAN TRAFFICKING SUCH AS SILVERY TOWERS PROJECT DUBBED
5 SLAVERY TOWERS HERE IN SAN JOSE WE CANNOT ASK OUR RESIDENTS TO
6 PAY FOR CONSTRUCTION IF WE'RE NOT WILLING TO PROTECTION OUR
7 COMMUNITIES FROM EXPLOITATION ON THOSE SAME HOUSING
8 CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DANI MANIGAN.
11 GO AHEAD, PLEASE. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. DANI MANIGAN, LOCAL 483, I APPRECIATE YOUR
14 WORK ON HELPING TO SOLVE, I ECHO POINTS YOU HAVE HEARD FROM
15 LABOR COUNCILS AND BUILDING TRADES COUNCIL I WOULD LOVE TO SEE
16 STRONG LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL THE MONEY AND ALL THE
17 BOND REVENUE AND NOT JUST SOME. I WON'T TAKE ALL THE TIME YOU
18 HAVE HEARD ALL THE POINTS FOR THE LABOR STANDARDS. THANK YOU
19 FOR YOUR TIME.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS JACK BUCKHORN. GO AHEAD PLEASE.
22 ONE MINUTE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** JACK BUCKHORN, NORTH BAY LABOR COUNCIL. APPRECIATE
25 THE PRESENTATION AND ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF LACK OF WORKERS

MARCH 13, 2024

1 PROTECTIONS THAT PREVAIL IN THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING SECTOR TO
2 BE CLEAR WE DON'T EXPECT A PERFECT SOLUTION TO THIS PROBLEM
3 BUT WE DEMAND PROGRESS IN ADDRESSING THE PROBLEM. A GOOD
4 SOLUTION WOULD INCLUDE LABOR STANDARDS COVER 100% OF THE BOND
5 FOUNGING ANYTHING LES WOULD BE FLAWED. PREVAILING WAGES FOR
6 ALL MONEY WOULD BE A GOOD AND NECESSARY STANDARD. ANYTHING
7 LESS THAN THAT WOULD BE FLAWED. ENFORCEMENT WITH A PRIVATE
8 RIGHT OF ACTION FOR LABOR MANAGEMENT COMMITTEES WOULD BE GOOD
9 AND ANYTHING LESS THAN THAT WOULD BE FLAWED. THANK YOU FOR
10 YOUR CONTINUED MEETINGS ON THESE ISSUES. TOGETHER, WE CAN GET
11 THIS DONE AND HELP MEET THE WELL DOCUMENTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING
12 NEEDS OF COMMUNITIES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JOE
15 METEKEL. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, AGAIN, THIS IS JOE MATEKEL WITH
18 TEAMSTERS LOCAL 665. ANY BALLOT MEASURE YOU APPROVE HAS GOT TO
19 INCLUDE STRONG LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL OF THE BOND
20 REVENUE. ALSO AGREEMENT IN COMPROMISE BY ALL DECISION MAKERS
21 TO IDENTIFY ONE LABOR STANDARD IS VERY IMPORTANT TO GUIDE NEXT
22 STEPS. ADDITIONALLY LABOR UNIONS AND MEMBERS ARE VOTERS AND
23 TAXPAYERS AND THEY'RE GOING TO DETERMINE THE SUCCESS OF THE
24 BOND CAMPAIGN AT THE BALLOT BOX WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE
25 THE ONES GETTING HIRED TO BUILD THE HOUSING AND WHILE DOING

MARCH 13, 2024

1 THAT THEY NEED TO EARN SUFFICIENT WAGES TO SUPPORT THEIR
2 FAMILIES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ELIZABETH
5 WAMPLER. GO AHEAD.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M ELIZABETH WAMPLER I'M WITH LYFT BAY
8 AREA LIKE OTHERS WE'RE A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR
9 ALL COALITION IN STRONG SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA BOND AND DEEP
10 APPRECIATION FOR ALL WORK THAT'S COME BEFORE WE SUPPORT MOVING
11 THE MEASURE FORWARD AND SUPPORT LABOR STANDARDS IN THE MEASURE
12 AND JUST WANT TO ENCOURAGE EVERYONE, STAFF, LABOR FOLKS,
13 COMMISSIONERS, ABAG MEMBERS TO MOVE SWIFTLY TO COME TO A
14 COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT ON THIS. WE REALLY NEED EVERYBODY TO COME
15 TOGETHER TO GET THIS MEASURE ACROSS THE FINISH LINE, AND ARE
16 EXCITED TO BE PART OF THIS GREAT COLLECTIVE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS COUNCIL OF
19 COMMUNITY HOUSING ORGANIZATION. GO AHEAD, PLEASE ONE MINUTE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JOHN AVALOS COUNCIL
22 COMMUNITY HOUSING ORGANIZATION IN SAN FRANCISCO. SAN FRANCISCO
23 JUST RECENTLY PASSED MARCH FIFTH A \$300 MILLION AFFORDABLE
24 HOUSING BOND. WE WERE ABLE TO DO SO BECAUSE WE ACHIEVED A
25 GREAT AMOUNT OF UNITY BETWEEN OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS, THE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 MAYOR, AND THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS,
2 PRIVATE DEVELOPERS, LABOR, AND SO MANY OTHERS. SO WE PASSED AT
3 70%. WE ALSO PASSED THIS BOND AND WORKED ON THIS BOND IN
4 PREPARATION FOR THE REGIONAL BOND. AND PART OF THIS UNITY THAT
5 WE ACHIEVED WAS KNOWING THAT WHATEVER WAS ACHIEVED IN TERMS OF
6 LABOR STANDARDS WOULD BE HELPING US DECIDE HOW WE WOULD MOVE
7 FORWARD IN THE FUTURE. THIS PUBLIC COMMENT TODAY SHOWS THAT
8 THERE IS A GREAT DEAL OF UNITY JUST TO MAKE SURE WE GET THE
9 LABOR STANDARDS RIGHT. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE BAHFA TO CONTINUE
10 TO CONVENE AND WORK WITH US TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE SUCCESSFUL
11 REGIONAL BOND IN NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS SCOTT RIISE. ONE MINUTE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS SCOTT I'M A BUSINESS
16 REPRESENTATIVE FOR UA LOCAL 393. WE COVER SANTA CLARA, SAN
17 BENITO COUNTIES PLUMBERS AND PIPE FITTERS HVAC WORK WE
18 APPRECIATE YOUR CONSIDERATION INCLUDING SOME OF THE SOLID
19 LABOR STANDARDS APPLIED TO 100% OF THIS BOND REVENUE WE
20 BELIEVE THIS WILL BENEFIT BAY AREA RESIDENTS AS WELL AS
21 COMMUNITIES THEREIN. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MICHAEL B. GO AHEAD. ONE
24 MINUTE.

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MICHAEL B., REPRESENTING LOW-INCOME
2 RESIDENTS FOR NAPA COUNTY TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I AM
3 IN STRONG FAVOR OF LABOR STANDARDS THAT ARE NOT EXCLUSIONARY
4 TO SKILLED, HARDWORKING INDIVIDUALS THAT ARE NOT PRESENTLY
5 AFFILIATED WITH A LABOR ORGANIZATION OR COUNCIL. THANK YOU
6 VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RAMA
9 PETERSON. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS RAMA PETERSON. I'M A MEMBER OF THE IBEW
12 617 REPRESENTING SAN MATEO COUNTY. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO A
13 LOT OF WHAT YOU HAVE ALREADY HEARD AND JUST SAY THAT I'M IN
14 FAVOR OF THIS BOND MEASURE BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE STRONG
15 LABOR STANDARDS THAT APPLY TO ALL OF THE REVENUE AND NOT JUST
16 SOME. AND I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU GUYS ARE DOING. THANK YOU VERY
17 MUCH.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SOUTH BAY
20 LABOR COUNCIL. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS GENE COHEN I'M
23 THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF THE SOUTH BAY LABOR COUNCIL I WANT TO
24 AFFIRM THE STATEMENTS AND SHARED VALUES OF THE PREVIOUS
25 SPEAKERS. I REPRESENT OVER 100,000 WORKERS IN THE SOUTH BAY

MARCH 13, 2024

1 AND WE KNOW THAT WITHOUT WORKFORCE STANDARDS HOUSING BOND
2 MEASURE MAY INCREASE SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE UNITS BUT MAY ALSO
3 INCREASE DEMAND FOR SUBSIDIZED SHELTERS FOR WORKERS AND
4 WORKERS WHO RECEIVE INADEQUATE COMPENSATION. THE NEED TO
5 PRODUCE OFFICIAL HOUSING AND FAMILY SUSTAINING CAREER HAS
6 NEVER BEEN MORE IMPORTANT AND WE'RE COMMITTED TO CONTINUE
7 WORKING WITH THE BAHFA STAFF AND IMPACTED STAKEHOLDERS TO
8 ENSURE THE MEASURE IS FAIR AND EFFECTIVE. WE MUST BE UNITED IN
9 OUR EFFORTS TO KEEP OUR FAMILIES OUT OF POVERTY, TO HAVE SAFE
10 AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ACCESS TO GOOD JOBS. AND WE
11 APPRECIATE THE LEADERSHIP AND PARTNERSHIP TO ENSURE THAT WE
12 ARE SUCCESSFUL IN NOVEMBER. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS RUDY
15 GONZALEZ. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. ONE MINUTE. OKAY.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I ALREADY SPOKE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER, OUR LAST
20 SPEAKER IS JASON GUMATAOTAO. ONE MINUTE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GREETINGS. MY NAME IS JASON, WITH IBEW LOCAL 595 AND
23 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THOUSANDS OF ELECTRICIANS IN ALAMEDA
24 COUNTY, RISING IN SUPPORT OF ALL OTHER LABOR COMMENTS YOU
25 HEARD BEFORE, WE WOULD APPRECIATE CONSIDERATION TO INCLUDE ALL

MARCH 13, 2024

1 FUNDING TO BE COVERED WITH LABOR STANDARDS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
2 TIME.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CHAIR, THAT CONCLUDES ONLINE
5 PUBLIC COMMENT WE DID RECEIVE EIGHT LETTERS OF PUBLIC COMMENT
6 FROM AT INFO@BAYAREA.COM SUBMITTED PUBLIC COMMENT FROM ELLEN
7 DEAN, LEWIS FLOREZ, ELLEN LONG, KATE, SCOTT LITTLEHALE, MARLA
8 MOORE, SENIIA RITZIY HERNANDEZ, JUDITH WEISMAN, POSTED TO MTC
9 AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU. AGAIN WE HAVE
12 RECEIVED HUNDREDS OF E-MAILS. BACK TO KATE H.

13

14 **KATE HARTLEY:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
15 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO COMMENTED ON THIS ITEM WE HEARD LOUD
16 AND CLEAR OVERWHELMING SUPPORT AND DESIRE FOR ONE STANDARD
17 STRONG LABOR STANDARDS TO APPLY TO 100% OF THE FUNDS. WE WILL
18 TAKE THAT BACK INTO CONSIDERATION AS WE PREPARE A
19 RECOMMENDATION FOR APRIL 10TH. I THINK IT IS IN FULL ALIGNMENT
20 WITH WHAT OUR GOALS ARE. AND SO WE'RE, SPEAKING FOR MYSELF,
21 I'M VERY HEARTENED, AND WE HOPE TO CREATE THE GOALS THAT WERE
22 ARTICULATED SO WELL BY THE SPEAKERS. SO, THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU MISS HARTLEY.
25 AND, AGAIN, TO MEMBERS, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY,

MARCH 13, 2024

1 AND I DO APPRECIATE ALL THE PUBLIC THAT PARTICIPATED IN THIS
2 DISCUSSION, AS WELL. TURNING OVER TO MEMBERS AND
3 COMMISSIONERS. CHAIR ROMERO, DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING?

4

5 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
6 ENGAGING IN THESE DISCUSSIONS, AS WELL AS THE NON-PROFIT
7 DEVELOPERS. SEEMS LIKE WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS. I THINK THIS WAS
8 A MUCH LESS CONTENTIOUS. I GOT TO PRESIDE OVER THE LAST ONE.
9 THIS WAS A MUCH LESS CONTENTIOUS PUBLIC DISCUSSION REALLY
10 APPRECIATE LABOR PUTTING OUT THERE ISSUES AND LOOKING FORWARD
11 TO NEXT MONTH TO HAVE A RESOLUTION TO THIS WHERE, INDEED, WE
12 CAN ELEVATE THE LABOR STANDARDS, GET LABOR ON BOARD AND MOVE
13 FORWARD. ONE QUESTION RELATED TO MAYBE A SERIES OF TEN E-MAILS
14 WE RECEIVED ABOUT ALL ELECTRIC STANDARDS. GIVEN, I WANT TO
15 UNDERSTAND WHAT, IF ANY, ABILITY WE HAVE TO PUT IN ELECTRIC
16 STANDARDS? I DON'T KNOW IF WE CAN DO ALL ELECTRIC BASED ON THE
17 BERKELEY LAWSUIT, BUT, CERTAINLY (LAUGHTER) -- BUT, CERTAINLY,
18 I THINK IT'S PROBABLY POSSIBLE TO DO SOME, SORT OF, ELECTRIC
19 STANDARDS THAT MAYBE TALK ABOUT, IN NEW BUILDINGS, YOU KNOW,
20 RECHARGE -- ELECTRIC CAR CHARGING, OR AT LEAST BUILDINGS THAT
21 ARE READY TO RECEIVE THAT, I MEAN, THOSE UPGRADES, SO, YOU CAN
22 TELL ME WHERE THAT MIGHT GO? BECAUSE I DO -- I WANT TO BE
23 SOMEWHAT RESPONSIVE TO THAT SET OF INTEREST.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **KATE HARTLEY:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. YES. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
2 PEOPLE WHO SUBMITTED THE LETTERS ON THE ALL-ELECTRIC STANDARD.
3 THIS WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT, AS OPPOSED TO LEGISLATION WE
4 COULD PUT INTO OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION
5 PROJECTS WE'LL BE CREATING FUNDING GUIDELINES GENERALLY WILL
6 BE TAKING THEM FOR YOUR APPROVAL THIS IS HIGH ON THE LIST OF
7 PRIORITIES IT MAKES TOTAL SENSE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION. THE
8 REQUESTS FOR ALL ELECTRIC HAVE BEEN FOR REHABS OF EXISTING
9 BUILDINGS, AS WELL, THAT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. WE
10 INTEND TO MAKE, RECOMMEND THOSE STANDARDS FOR PRESERVATION
11 PROJECTS ALSO. AND WE ARE REALLY FORTUNATE TO HAVE A GREAT
12 PARTNER IN THE ENERGY SECTION OF MTC WORKING, ALREADY, ON THE
13 ELECTRIFICATION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS. SO, THAT PIECE ISN'T
14 QUITE AS STRAIGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE YOU'RE WORKING WITH PEOPLE
15 LIVING IN THEIR HOMES. BUT THE NEW CONSTRUCTION IS PRETTY
16 STRAIGHT FORWARD. SO, WE WILL BE BACK WITH FUNDING GUIDELINES.

17

18 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG HC:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU,
19 CHAIR.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THANK YOU. AND, AGAIN, I
22 APPRECIATE STAFF BEING OUT THERE TRYING TO FIND COMPROMISE,
23 AND I DO BELIEVE WE'RE GOING TO REACH IT. I JUST WANT TO
24 UNDERSTAND, KATE THERE ARE THINGS HAPPENING WHERE LEGAL MINDS
25 ARE TALKING THAT'S ONE SET THAT ARE A BIGGER FIX THAT'S BEYOND

MARCH 13, 2024

1 OUR CONTROL AT THIS TIME, SO IN TERMS OF OPPORTUNITY RIGHT NOW
2 WE KNOW IS AROUND 20%.

3

4 **KATE HARTLEY:** THAT'S CORRECT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** WHILE I THINK THERE IS
7 BIGGER AND GREATER AMBITIONS AND WHILE WE'RE AFFORDED THAT
8 OPPORTUNITY WE SHOULD HAVE THAT DISCUSSION BUT IN TERMS OF
9 GROUNDING THE COORDINATION ON WHAT WE CAN DO NOW THAT'S WITHIN
10 OUR CONTROL IS THE 20% AND I HOPE WE DO FIND COMPROMISE ON THE
11 LABOR STANDARDS THAT ADDRESS THE GOALS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO
12 REACH AND I BELIEVE WE CAN GET THERE. JUST MY COMMENTS.
13 TURNING IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND WORK OVER THAT WAY.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** GREAT. TRULY APPRECIATE THE WORK OF STAFF, LOOKING
16 AT A HOLISTIC APPROACH AND I THINK WE HAVE THE RIGHT PEOPLE AT
17 THE ABLE TO GET TO THE RIGHT POSITION THAT WE ALL FEEL
18 STRONGLY ABOUT. I WANT US TO BE CAREFUL OF THE NARRATIVE WHEN
19 WE DO BRING LABOR STANDARDS INTO, ACTUALLY THE EXPENDITURE
20 REPORTS, REDUCED COSTS BECAUSE WE REDUCE RISK AS ONE SPEAKER
21 SAID 4% SAVINGS THE STUDIES HAVE SHOWN WE DO HAVE LABOR
22 STANDARDS SO THE DISCUSSION WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE OUR
23 NARRATIVE IS CLEAR ON THAT, FOR EVERYBODY WHO IS HERE THAT'S
24 GREAT AND WONDERFUL WE WANT THIS TO HAPPEN BUT THERE'S PART
25 TWO HERE WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THE VOTER STANDARDS THRESHOLD

MARCH 13, 2024

1 WHAT'S THE BILL? ACA ONE ALSO PASSES TO LOWER THE VOTING
2 APPROVAL TO 55% PLUS ONE, I GUESS, SO IT'S KIND OF A TWO PART
3 WE GOT YOUR SUPPORT HERE WE REALLY NEED IT OVER THERE TOO WE
4 ARE REALLY HEADED IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION ONCE AGAIN THANK YOU
5 FOR YOUR EFFORTS IN SACRAMENTO WE HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE LOOKING
6 AT THIS WANT WANTING TO HAPPEN THEN LOCAL CONTROL WE'RE GOING
7 TO DEBRIEF WHAT WE CAME BACK WITH HERE AND WE'RE JUST TRYING
8 TO MAKE EVERYTHING BETTER SO WE CAN GET THROUGH. THANK YOU
9 EVERYBODY.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** WORKING MY WAY THAT WAY.
12 NO ONE WANTS TO SPEAK? THAT'S OKAY.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I HAVE A QUESTION. THERE IS 20%,
15 THEN THERE IS THE 80% MY UNDERSTANDING IS FOR THE 80% COVERED
16 WE HAVE TO SEEK STATE LEGISLATION. WHAT IS THE TIMELINE FOR
17 THAT?

18

19 **KATE HARTLEY:** WE COULD -- WELL, STATE -- OUR STATUTE COULD BE
20 AMENDED, AS LONG AS IT IS BEFORE THE FIRST ISSUANCE OF THE
21 BONDS, THEN WE WOULD APPLY THAT STANDARD TO THE USE OF THE
22 BONDS, AND WE EXPECT THE FIRST ISSUANCE OF THE BONDS TO BE NO
23 EARLIER THAN THE MID-2025.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MID-2025. SO, WE WOULD HAVE TO --
2 DO WE HAVE SOME COMMITMENTS FROM LEGISLATORS ABOUT MAKING
3 THOSE AMENDMENTS? I THINK IS --

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA
6 WHAT I'LL TELL YOU JUST BEING FRESH FROM SACRAMENTO AND TOP OF
7 MIND, I THINK WE HAVE LEGISLATORS INTERESTED IN DOING THAT I
8 THINK THE FACT IS EVERYONE IS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHICH TRAIN
9 IS ON WHICH TRACK AND REALLY TO UNDERSTAND IF WE CAN DO IT ALL
10 BUT THERE IS CONCURRENT CONVERSATIONS BEING HAD. WE KNOW THE
11 CONVERSATION, WE KNOW WHAT'S NOW, IT DOESN'T MEAN THE
12 CONVERSATION AROUND THE 80% HAS TO STOP IT'S IDENTIFYING WHO
13 IS GOING TO DO THAT AND WE'RE HAVING ACTIVE CONVERSATIONS.
14 MISS LONG IS HERE AND SHE CAN ATTEST TO CONVERSATIONS WE HAD
15 WITH SENATOR CORTESE AND OTHERS TO ADDRESS THAT.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE, SINCE WE'RE
18 LOOKING FOR THE 100%, AS WE HAVE HEARD, I THINK WE NEED TO
19 PROVIDE SOME ASSURANCE BEFORE WE CAN KEEP THING GOING.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AND IF I MAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR, YOU MAY WANT TO
22 CLARIFY THE LIKELIHOOD OF THAT BEING RESOLVED PRIOR TO APRIL
23 18TH WHEN THE MEASURE HAS TO BE APPROVED. WHICH IS UNLIKELY.

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THAT'S CORRECT.

MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **KATHLEEN KANE:** IF I COULD JUST OFFER, THROUGH THE CHAIR,
3 QUICKLY. THE IDEA IS TO HAVE THE BALLOT MEASURE, ITSELF, BE
4 CLEAN AND ALLOW FOR LATER CHANGES IN STATE LAW SHOULD THEY
5 HAPPEN. SO, THE IDEA IS TO BE ABLE TO ALLOW THE BALLOT MEASURE
6 TO GO AND GET ON THE BALLOT IN DEFENSIBLE WAY, AND THEN IF
7 THERE ARE LATER CHANGES THEN THOSE CAN BE INCORPORATED AT THAT
8 POINT.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHFAOC:** I THINK IT'S A FUNCTION
11 OF TIME, COMMISSIONER. WHAT I WOULD SAY IS, THERE IS ACTIVE
12 CONVERSATIONS BEING HAD AROUND 80% AND WHEN AND HOW THAT COULD
13 GET DISCUSSED AND INTRODUCED. I DON'T KNOW IF MISS LONG WANTS
14 TO ADD ANYTHING TO ADD?

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
17 AFFAIRS. I THINK THE ONLY THING I WOULD ADD IS ASSUMING THAT
18 THIS BODY, BAHFA AND ABAG ARE COMFORTABLE WITH LABOR STANDARDS
19 THAT ARE AGREED UPON FOR THE 20%, WE DON'T ANTICIPATE THAT
20 THERE IS A TIMING CHALLENGE TO GETTING LEGISLATION THROUGH THE
21 PROCESS IN ORDER FOR IT TO APPLY TO THE 80%. SO, THERE IS, YOU
22 KNOW, ACTIVE INTEREST IN SACRAMENTO IN DOING THAT, AND, AGAIN,
23 AS OUR GENERAL COUNSEL INDICATED, WE DON'T NEED THAT PIECE OF
24 IT. WE DON'T NEED THE LEGISLATION TO BE WRAPPED UP BEFORE THE
25 BODIES TAKE ACTION TO PUT THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT FOR US TO

MARCH 13, 2024

1 HAVE THE ABILITY TO IMPOSE THE STANDARDS ON THE 80%. AS LONG
2 AS THE LEGISLATION TAKES EFFECT BEFORE THE FIRST BOND
3 ISSUANCE, WHICH ON THE NATURAL ANY BILL PASSES THIS YEAR,
4 WOULD TAKE EFFECT JANUARY 1ST, 2025.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.
7 COMMISSIONER MILEY, IS THAT YOUR LIGHT?

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES. THANK YOU. YES, I JUST KIND OF WANT TO
10 WEIGH IN, THAT I'M VERY IMPRESSED WHAT I'M HEARING THROUGH
11 WITH THIS CONVERSATION. SO, I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS MY
12 GRATITUDE FOR THE WORK THUS FAR BECAUSE THIS IS A BIG DEAL,
13 AND I THINK EVERYBODY IS GOING IN THE SAME DIRECTION WANT TO
14 GET RESULTS AND WE WANT TO GET RESULTS AND HOW WE CAN MAKE
15 THIS HAPPEN. CLEARLY GETTING US ACROSS THE FINISH LINE WITH
16 THE 55% THRESHOLD I THINK ALL OF THAT IS IMPORTANT. AND PROP
17 ONE, IT LOOKS LIKE THAT WILL PASS. BUT PROP ONE IT'S GOING TO
18 PROVIDE \$6 BILLION. THIS IS GOING TO PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT
19 RESOURCES BEYOND PROP ONE, JUST FOR THE BAY AREA. THIS IS A
20 REAL BIG DEAL. AND IT'S A WIN-WIN ON ALL FRONTS. I JUST WANT
21 TO ACKNOWLEDGE EVERYONE'S WORK ON THIS. AND WHATEVER I CAN DO
22 AS A COUNTY SUPERVISOR, IN MY LITTLE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,
23 PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD, JUST KEEP ME INFORMED. THANK YOU.

24

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** THERE IS GOING TO BE A
2 ROLE FOR ALL OF US. (LAUGHTER) ALL RIGHT. I'LL KEEP LOOKING.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** I WANT TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION TO STAFF FOR
5 MEETING WITH LABOR STAKEHOLDERS AND WANT TO ENCOURAGE
6 CONTINUED CONVERSATIONS AND I'M GLAD THAT IT SEEMS LIKE WE
7 ARE MAKING SOME PROGRESS ON AGREEMENT ON LABOR STANDARDS I
8 WANT TO EMPHASIZE HOW IMPORTANT IT IS THAT WE HAVE STRONG
9 LABOR STANDARDS, FOR MANY OF THE REASONS STATED TODAY WE NEED
10 TO MAKE SURE WE INVEST PUBLIC DOLLARS TO ACHIEVE THE KINDS OF
11 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT THIS IN OUR REGION THAT INCLUDES MAKING
12 SURE WE ARE BUILDING A SKILLED AND TRAINED WORKFORCE THAT'S
13 GOING TO BE CRITICAL TO ENSURE THAT WE CAN BUILD HOUSING MUCH
14 FASTER AND MORE AFFORDABLE LONG-TERM PROVIDING GOOD MIDDLE
15 CLASS JOBS FOR PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES SO WE DON'T HAVE
16 THOSE OPPORTUNITIES INCLUDING KIDS IN OUR SCHOOLS WE TALK
17 ABOUT PUBLIC SAFETY KEY TO ADDRESSING PUBLIC SAFETY IN OUR
18 REGION IS LIFTING UP ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY FOR PEOPLE IN OUR
19 REGION AND LASTLY TO ADDRESS HAVING A PATH TO HIGH ROAD JOBS,
20 BUILDING HOUSING IN OUR COMMUNITIES, EXPLOITED WAGE THEFTS IN
21 THE WORKPLACE AND SAFETY VIOLATIONS PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE
22 AFFORDABLE ACCESSIBLE HOUSING IN THE COMMUNITIES THAT THEY'RE
23 WORKING IN WHO WERE LIVING IN THEIR CARS. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE
24 WE'RE PROVIDING A PATH TO MIDDLE CLASS JOBS AND GOOD JOBS. I
25 APPRECIATE THE WORK BEING DONE I CALL ON STAKEHOLDERS TO

MARCH 13, 2024

1 CONTINUE THE WORK TOGETHER I THINK WE CAN WORK TOGETHER TO
2 REACH AGREEMENTS. IT'S GOING TO BE ALL HANDS ON DECK TO PASS
3 THIS THING IN NOVEMBER BUT IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT WE HAVE A
4 UNIFIED STRONG LABOR STANDARD THAT APPLIES TO ALL PROJECTS
5 THAT ARE COVERED UNDER THIS MEASURE, AND IF SACRAMENTO DOES
6 ENABLE IT TO APPLY TO THE 80%, YOU KNOW, OR WHETHER IT'S -- IF
7 THERE IS A PLA, THAT THAT WOULD BE APPLICABLE. I THINK THERE
8 IS FLEXIBILITY TO ACHIEVE LABOR STANDARDS THAT WOULD BENEFIT
9 ALL STAKEHOLDERS, ALL LABOR STAKEHOLDERS IN THIS DISCUSSION.
10 SO, I HAVE AND CONTINUE TO BE VERY STRONGLY IN SUPPORT OF
11 THAT. AND HOPE THAT WHEN WE COME BACK IN APRIL THAT WE'LL BE
12 ABLE TO MOVE THAT FORWARD. THANK YOU.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO ECHO WHAT SOME OF MY OTHER
15 COLLEAGUES HAVE SAID AND THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK YOU'RE
16 DOING TO NEGOTIATE AND EVERYONE WHO COMMENTED.

17

18 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** LIKE EVERYONE WHO HAS SAID WITH THE WINDOW OF
19 WHAT'S POSSIBLE RIGHT NOW PUTTING SOME LABOR STANDARDS ON OUR
20 20% MAKES SENSE. I THINK WE HAVE BROAD SUPPORT IF WE HAVE
21 LEGISLATIVE FIX FOR PUTTING ON THE REST OF THE MONEY THAT
22 MAKES SENSE WHAT WE HAVE ENDED UP FROM BROAD OPTIONS WE HAVE
23 BEEN PRESENTED WITH TODAY IT'S GOING TO UPLIFT AND PUT A NEW
24 MINIMUM STANDARD THAT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT EVEN IF IT'S
25 JUST ON OUR MONEY, IT'S THE MOST AGGRESSIVE BENEFIT FOR HUGE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 AMOUNT OF LABORS ACROSS THE BAY AREA. HAVING THIS CONVERSATION
2 FOCUS ON TWO OF THE PARTS THAT STAFF INCLUDED IN THE
3 PRESENTATION FOR OUR LEVEL SETTING, THERE ARE TWO THINGS THAT
4 I DON'T THINK SHOULD COME AS A SURPRISE FOR US THAT I THINK WE
5 SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT IN THIS CONVERSATION AND ALL
6 CONVERSATIONS GOING FORWARD, THE TABLE TWO OF THE RHNA CYCLE
7 FIVE PERFORMANCE, WHICH SHOWS THAT WE'RE ALL BUILDING A LOT OF
8 HOUSING, BUT WE'RE NOT BUILDING THE RIGHT BALANCE OF HOUSING.
9 AND I HAVE LOOKED AT THIS CHART IN A LOT OF DIFFERENT WAYS,
10 AND SEEN IT, AND IT SHOWS THAT WE JUST NEED A HUGE AMOUNT MORE
11 INVESTMENT BECAUSE WE'RE NOT BUILDING THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
12 THAT WE SO DISPARATELY NEED. WE ARE MAKING IT POSSIBLE TO
13 BUILD THE MARKET RATE AND THAT IS AN IMBALANCE THAT WE CAN'T
14 HAVE CONTINUING ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS. THE OTHER ONE I
15 WANT TO DRAW ATTENTION TO IS TABLE FOUR IN COMPARISON
16 DEVELOPMENT COST FOR PROJECTS THAT TAKE LOCAL FUNDS AND
17 PROJECTS THAT DON'T. AGAIN, I DON'T THINK THIS ANALYSIS WILL
18 COME AS A SURPRISE TO ANY OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS
19 WHO ARE DOING THIS WORK, ANYONE ON THE GROUND, ANYONE WHO IS
20 DOING THOSE APPROVALS, AND I THINK IT REQUIRES BOND FOR OUR
21 OWN POLICIES ON THE CITIES AND COUNTY AND LOCAL LEVEL OF WHAT
22 OUR POLICIES ARE THERE MAY BE IMPORTANT REASONS WHY THERE IS A
23 MORE EXPENSIVE COST PER UNIT FOR PROJECTS THAT TAKE LOCAL
24 FUNDS. BUT I'M NOT SURE FOR MY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA IF THERE ARE
25 ABOUT 400,000 OF THOSE REASONS, IF THAT'S HOW MUCH MORE

MARCH 13, 2024

1 EXPENSIVE IT SHOULD BE. SO, WE NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT WAYS
2 THAT WE CAN MAKE THAT CHEAPER AND MAKE THESE FUNDS GO AS FAR
3 AS THEY CAN, AS WELL AS JUST MAKE ANY FUNDS WE INVEST IN
4 AFFORDABLE HOUSING GO FARTHER IN OUR OWN COMMUNITIES AND THERE
5 IS WORK WE CAN ALL DO THERE BOTH ON THIS BOND AND IN OUR OWN
6 POLICIES. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ALL RIGHT. I DON'T --

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANKS SO MUCH FOR THE WORK THAT STAFF HAS DONE AND
11 THAT EVERYONE HAS BEEN DOING IN TERMS OF THE NEGOTIATION. THIS
12 PRESENTATION WAS VERY HELPFUL. IN OAKLAND, WE HAD THE
13 OPPORTUNITY TO BUILD A REALLY STRONG COALITION AMONG
14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS, LABOR PARTNERS AND OTHERS
15 THROUGH MEASURE U WHICH WE PASSED IN 2022. SO THAT'S 350
16 MILLION IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND WE ARE ALSO LOOKING TO THIS
17 PROCESS TO INFORM HOW WE POTENTIALLY MOVE FORWARD ON LABOR
18 STANDARDS. SO, FIRST I WANT TO APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT
19 EVERYONE HAS DONE, UNDERSCORE THE NEED TO BUILD A REALLY BROAD
20 COALITION IN ORDER TO PASS THIS TRANSFORMATIONAL BOND MEASURE.
21 AND WANTED TO, YOU KNOW, I AGREE WITH A LOT OF WHAT HAS
22 ALREADY BEEN SAID, AND ALSO WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE POINT OF
23 MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE GOOD DATA AS WE CONTINUE THE
24 NEGOTIATIONS AND LOOK AT WHAT WE CAN DO. YOU KNOW, THERE IS A
25 LOT OF INFORMATION THAT ALREADY EXISTS. I BELIEVE THE UC

MARCH 13, 2024

1 BERKELEY LABOR CENTER IS ALSO PUTTING TOGETHER SOME RESEARCH
2 AND IN TERMS OF THE COST OF CONSTRUCTION, THE COST OF LABOR
3 STANDARDS, I REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LOOKING AT GOOD
4 DATA SO THAT THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING AND THE PROPOSAL THAT
5 COMES TO US IS WELL INFORMED. AND THAT ALSO GOES ACROSS THE
6 BOARD. WE HAD DISCUSSION AT OUR LAST MEETING ABOUT THE EQUITY
7 FRAMEWORK WITHIN BAHFA, WHICH I REALLY COMMEND, AND THAT'S
8 ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF AS WE DO OUR INFORMATIONAL MEETINGS AND
9 WE'LL BE DOING SOME OF THOSE IN OAKLAND AND ALAMEDA COUNTY,
10 THAT WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT THE DATA AND WHAT'S NEEDED IN TERMS
11 OF THE TYPE OF HOUSING WE NEED TO BUILD, WE NEED TO ENSURE WHO
12 HAS ACCESS TO THAT HOUSING. SO, EQUITY, I BELIEVE, WHETHER
13 IT'S ECONOMIC, OR RACIAL EQUITY, OR EVEN LOOKING AT EQUITY IN
14 TERMS OF PROVIDING JOBS THROUGH THIS MEASURE, REALLY DOES NEED
15 TO BE GROUNDED IN DATA, AS WELL AS THE CONVERSATIONS THAT I
16 KNOW THAT STAFF WILL BE HAVING. AND IF THERE IS ANY WAY THAT
17 MYSELF OR OTHERS IN OAKLAND CAN HELP SUPPORT THE PROCESS
18 BETWEEN NOW AND APRIL 7TH IS WHEN PERHAPS THE PROPOSAL WILL BE
19 PUBLISHED. PLEASE CALL ON US. THANK YOU.

20

21 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** THANK YOU STAFF, AND THE PUBLIC, FOR ALL THIS
22 WORK. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO ECHO WHAT CHAIR ROMERO SAID,
23 THE TENOR OF THIS MEETING IS VERY DIFFERENT. I DO HAVE A
24 QUESTION ABOUT THE TABLE FOUR ABOUT THE COST. AND I JUST
25 WANTED TO UNDERSTAND WHY THE CHOICE OF METRIC WAS THE USE OF

MARCH 13, 2024

1 LOCAL FUNDS. SO, I THINK THAT THERE ARE MANY, MANY REASONS WHY
2 PROJECTS ARE EXPENSIVE, BUT IT SEEMS CALLING OUT THE USE OF
3 LOCAL FUNDS SEEMS LIKE KIND OF AN INTERESTING CHOICE AS
4 OPPOSED TO HIGHER SERVICES OR HIGHER COST OF LAND, OR LOTS OF
5 OTHER CHOICES THAT YOU COULD HAVE MADE. AND JUST KIND OF --
6 WHAT POINT ARE YOU DRIVING THIS TOWARDS WITH THAT?

7

8 **KATE HARTLEY:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, WE WERE LOOKING AT THE DATA
9 IN A, SORT OF, AGNOSTIC WAY AND WE KEPT SEEING THOSE
10 DEVELOPMENTS COME IN THAT WERE SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER. AND SO WE
11 DUG INTO THEM AND WE REALIZED THERE IS THIS MODEL AVAILABLE --
12 THAT IS IN USE, YOU KNOW, OF 12,000 UNITS, 5,000 HAVE BEEN
13 PRODUCED IN THIS WAY BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023, WHERE DEVELOPERS
14 ONLY USE CREDITS, BONDS, AND DEFERRED DEVELOPER FEE, PROJECT
15 AFTER PROJECT, THAT WAS THE CAPITAL STACK, AND THEN WE DUG
16 DEEPER AND WE REALIZED THAT HIGHER COST DEVELOPMENTS ALL HAD
17 LOCAL FUNDS. NOW, THAT IS NO INDICTMENT OF THOSE PROJECTS, AT
18 ALL. MANY OF THOSE PROJECTS ARE URBAN INFILL, SPECIAL NEEDS,
19 100% HOMELESS. WE KNOW THAT CERTAIN DEVELOPMENTS HAVE HIGHER
20 COST. BUT WE ALSO KNOW THAT THERE'S SOME GRAY AREA THERE
21 BETWEEN THAT EXPENSIVE URBAN INFILL EIGHT STORY 100 SPECIAL
22 NEEDS DEVELOPMENT AND THE 60 -- THE DEVELOPMENT THAT IS, YOU
23 KNOW, FIVE STORIES, SURFACE PARKING, \$500,000 A DOOR. LOOKING
24 AT THE DATA, TOGETHER, IT WILL BE SOMETHING THAT WE'RE
25 UNDERTAKING AND WE NEED MORE RESEARCH. WE NEED TO DIG DOWN,

MARCH 13, 2024

1 AND THERE IS OTHER PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE INDUSTRY WHO ARE ALSO
2 LOOKING AT THIS, IS ON OUR PLATES. BUT, WE -- THAT WAS THE
3 DISTINCTION THAT REALLY JUMPED OUT. IF YOU TOOK LOCAL FUNDS,
4 YOU WERE BRINGING YOUR PROJECTS AT A LOW COST. IT'S IMPORTANT
5 BECAUSE, ESPECIALLY FOR HOMELESSNESS, AS WE KNOW THAT IN MANY
6 COUNTIES, FOR EVERY PERSON WHO IS UNHOUSED THAT WE FIND --
7 THAT, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE -- THAT WE CAN CREATE PERMANENT
8 HOUSING FOR, ONE, OR TWO, OR EVENLY, ARE PUSHED INTO
9 HOMELESSNESS. IT REALLY MAKES START THE DEMAND FOR MORE
10 HOUSING. SO IT IMPLEMENTS SOME OF THE CHANGES THAT WE THINK
11 BAHFA CAN FACILITATE LIKE STREAMLINED FINANCING IF YOU DON'T -
12 - THE FEWER SOURCES OF FUNDS THAT YOU HAVE TO PURSUE THE LOWER
13 YOUR COST STRUCTURE IS PRIORITIZING DEVELOPMENT ON PROJECTS
14 THAT HAVE BEEN STREAMLINE ENTITLEMENTS WE KNOW THAT WE CAN --
15 JUST IN THE NEWS TODAY WAS A PROJECT THAT EDEN HOUSING IS
16 DOING IN LIVERMORE THAT HAS BEEN IN LITIGATION FOR YEARS AND
17 YEARS. THOSE PROJECT COSTS GO UP MORE RATIONAL STATE FUNDING
18 SYSTEM. IF YOU HAVE TO GO YEAR AFTER YEAR IN APPLICATIONS AT
19 THE STATE, THAT'S GOING TO COST -- THAT'S GOING TO CREATE COST
20 ESCALATION. SO, ALL OF THOSE THINGS NEED TO COME INTO PLAY.
21 THE POINT BEING WE CAN HAVE RESOURCES TO DO MANY OF THOSE
22 THINGS WITH THIS BOND AND BRING COSTS DOWN TO SOME EXTENT. YOU
23 KNOW, UNDERSTANDING EXACTLY WHAT THE ISSUES ARE AND BUILD MORE
24 HOUSING BECAUSE WE KNOW WE NEED THAT.

25

MARCH 13, 2024

1 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** THANK YOU FOR THAT REALLY GREAT ANSWER.

2

3 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ALL RIGHT SEEING NO ONE
4 ELSE. LET'S GO TO THE VIRTUAL PARTICIPANTS.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WERE HANDS RAISED, BUT I DON'T SEE
7 NO HANDS RAISED FROM OUR COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT THE MOMENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, MTC BAHAOC:** ALL RIGHT. I'LL BACK TO
10 THE BOARD. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. I DON'T HAVE
11 ANY OTHER PARTING WORDS. I DO APPRECIATE CHAIR ROMERO FOR
12 CHAIRING THE LAST MEETING. IT WAS A BIT MORE CONTENTIOUS.
13 THAT'S JUST THE DRAW SOMETIMES. (LAUGHTER) ON THAT NOTE. THANK
14 YOU TO THE STAFF AND THE PUBLIC FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT. WE'RE ALL
15 TRYING TO SHAPE SOMETHING HERE THAT IS GENERATIONAL FOR ALL OF
16 US. AT THIS POINT, PROCEEDING TO ITEM 8. THE NEXT MEETING
17 JOINT MEETING, WHICH CHAIR ROMERO WILL CHAIR, IS SCHEDULED FOR
18 WEDNESDAY APRIL 10TH ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK
19 YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]

20



NTT

Broadcasting Government