

1	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
2	FRIDAY, MARCH $22^{ND}$ , $2024$ , $11:00$ AM
3	
4	
5	V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS
6	MEETING OF THE MTC EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. THIS
7	MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
8	PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED
9	HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT
10	THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
11	UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. REMOTE
12	SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS PARTICIPATING TODAY ROLL CALL VOTE WILL
13	BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. OKAY. WILL THE CLERK CALL THE
14	ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR FITZGERALD WE'LL LOOP BACK. PARKER?
17	
18	V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CAMPOS?
21	
22	PAMELA CAMPOS: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ESUF IS EXCUSED. ORANTES IS EXCUSED.
25	PIMPLE?



1 2 VINAY PIMPLE: YES HERE. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER SCOTT? 4 5 TERRY SCOTT: PRESENT. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HOWARD WONG? 9 HOWARD WONG: HERE. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROLAND WONG? 12 13 RONALD WONG: HERE. 14 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE A QUORUM. 17 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: WE HAVE A REQUEST FOR REMOTE 18 19 PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B. 2449, COMMITTEE CHAIR, FITZGERALD. CHAIR FITZGERALD? 20 21 22 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. I'M REQUESTING TO 23 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449. JUST CAUSE BECAUSE OF A NEED RELATED TO A DISABILITY, DEFINED IN SECTION 2026 AND 12 -24 - 12926.1 INCLUDING, IN OTHER WORDS ACCOMMODATED BY SECTION G. 25



THERE IS NO ONE ELSE IN THE ROOM UNDER 18. THERE IS NO ONE
 HERE AT ALL.

3

V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: OKAY. YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED. WE'RE
ADDING SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIR CHRISTINE FITZGERALD AS PRESENT. I'M
HANDING THE MEETING OVER TO YOU NOW. JUST BE AWARE, WE DO HAVE
TWO PARTICIPANTS WHO ARE BEING EXCUSED.

8

9 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU, SIR. I HAVE NO REPORT
10 TO PROVIDE AT THIS TIME. ALTHOUGH, I WOULD LIKE TO SAY I'M
11 VERY PLEASED TO WORK WITH ALL OF YOU ON THIS COMMITTEE. CLERK,
12 WERE THERE ANY ITEMS SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM?

13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
15 THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO
16 SPEAK.

17

18 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU MA'AM. OKAY. MOVING ON
19 ONE MINUTE WHILE A MOVE THE PAGE. THERE WE GO. MOVING TO ITEM
20 NUMBER THREE, WE'RE LOOKING FOR APPROVAL, 3A, RATHER, AND
21 WE'RE LOOKING FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING,
22 DECEMBER 15TH MEETING. SO, IF WE COULD DO A ROLL CALL VOTE,
23 PARDON ME. A MOTION AND SECOND. SORRY ABOUT THAT.

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** SO MOVED.



1 2 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: WHO WAS THAT? 3 TERRY SCOTT: TERRY SCOTT. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AND HOWARD WONG. 6 7 8 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU SO MUCH EVERYONE. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AND FOR THE RECORD, THE NAMES HAVE BEEN 10 11 UPDATED AND WILL BE UPDATED ON THE MINUTES TO REFLECT EVERYONE'S FULL FIRST AND LAST NAME. BECAUSE WE HAVE TWO WONGS 12 ON THE COUNCIL AND SUBCOMMITTEE NOW. WITH THAT GOING TO ROLL 13 14 CALL VOTE. CHAIR FITZGERALD? 15 16 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: AYE. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR PARKER? 19 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: AYE. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER CAMPOS? 23 PAMELA CAMPOS: YES. 24 25



CLERK OF THE BOARD: ESUF IS EXCUSED. ORANTES IS EXCUSED. 1 2 PIMPLE? 3 VINAY PIMPLE: YES . 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SCOTT? 6 7 8 TERRY SCOTT: AYE. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: HOWARD WONG? 10 11 HOWARD WONG: AYE. 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ROLAND WONG? 14 15 16 RONALD WONG: APPROVED. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 19 PRESENT. 20 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE 21 22 AUDIENCE THAT WISH TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 23

1

MARCH 22, 2024

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU FOR CATCHING THAT. THERE WAS NO

2 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FOR AGENDA ITEM 3A NO ONE IN 3 THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN ZOOM. 4 5 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. AND NOW 4A? CORRECT, 6 CLERK? 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CORRECT. 9 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU, MA'AM. OKAY. SO, WE'RE 10 LOOKING AT THE EXPRESS LANES PILOT. 11 12 PIERCE GOULD: THAT'S CORRECT. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY. MY 13 NAME IS PIERCE GOULD, AND I AM THE OVERALL PROGRAM COOPERATOR 14 15 FOR THE EXPRESS LANES START PILOT AND I'M HERE WITH MY 16 COLLEAGUE BARBARA LAURENSON WHO IS LEADING OUR PILOT EVALUATION WORK. FIRST, SINCE WE MAY HAVE SOME NEW 17 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS, I'M GOING TO GIVE SOME BACKGROUND ON THE 18 PILOT ITSELF AND THEN BARBARA WILL SHARE SOME OBSERVATIONS ON 19 THIS FIRST SIX MONTHS OF DATA WE HAVE COLLECTED FROM THE 20 PILOT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, MTC HAS THREE MAIN EQUITY 21 INITIATIVES THAT AFFECT OUR OPERATIONS PROJECTS. THERE IS THE 22 CLIPPER START PILOT, WHICH IS A MEANS BASED FARE DISCOUNT 23 PROGRAM. THERE IS THE EQUITY ACTION PILOT THAT BATA HAS GOING 24 WHICH IS DESIGNED TO TRY TO MAKE THE TOLLING EXPERIENCE MORE 25

MARCH 22, 2024

CUSTOMER FRIENDLY, THEN THERE IS THE EXPRESS LANES START PILOT 1 THAT WE'RE HERE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT TODAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE 2 3 THIS GRAPHIC SHOWS THE FOUR PILLARS OF MTC'S EQUITY PLATFORM. THEY ARE DEFINED IN MEASURE, LISTEN AND LEARN, AND TRAIN 4 5 TRAINING AND GROW. AND WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE FOCUS AND DELIVER PHASE THAT'S WHY EAR HERE TO TALK ABOUT OUR PROGRAM 6 EVALUATION SO WE CAN DETERMINE WHAT'S GOING WELL AND WHAT MAY 7 8 NEED IMPROVEMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO PAUSE FOR A MOMENT TO SHARE THE FACT THAT WE HAVE A LONG HISTORY WITH THIS 9 SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING THIS IS ACTUALLY OUR 8TH MEETING SINCE 10 JUNE OF 2020 WHEN WE FIRST PROPOSED THIS PILOT WE HAVE SHARED 11 PLANS AND SOUGHT YOUR FEEDBACK ON MANY DIFFERENT SPECK SPECKS 12 OF THE PILOT ITSELF, INCLUDING CONCEPTS FOR PILOT DELIVERY 13 WHICH CORRIDORS WE SELECTED TO DO OUR PILOT, OUR CUSTOMER 14 ENGAGEMENT AND RESEARCH AND COMPONENT OF THE WORK OUR OUTREACH 15 16 PLANS AND PLANS TO PROMOTE THE PILOT AND EVALUATION PLAN WHICH INCLUDES GOALS FOR THE PILOT WE ALSO HAVE CREATED AN ADVISORY 17 GROUP FOR THIS PILOT EXPRESSLY OPERATORS AND SOME ADVOCACY 18 ORGANIZATIONS BUT THAT GROUP ALSO INCLUDED A REPRESENTATIVE 19 FROM THIS SUBCOMMITTEE ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, WHO WAS VERY 20 21 HELPFUL OVER THE YEARS SO I WANTED TO SHARE THAT WE HAVE SOME 22 HISTORY WITH YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN TERMS OF THE SCOPE OUR 23 REGION HAS BEEN BUILDING EXPRESS LANES FOR A WHILE NOW TO PROVIDE A FASTER TRIP AND TO IMPROVE RELIABLE PRIMARILY FOR 24 CARPOOLS AND BUSES BUT ALSO AS WELL FOR SOLO DRIVERS WHO ARE 25

MARCH 22, 2024

WILLING TO PAY FOR A FASTER TRIP WHEN THEY REALLY NEED IT. AS 1 YOU KNOW THE BAY AREA IS AN EXPENSIVE PLACE TO LIVE ESPECIALLY 2 3 POWER LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND PUBLIC TRANSIT IS NOT ALWAYS A GOOD OPTION FOR SOME TRIPS AND SO WITH THIS PILOT WE'RE AIMING 4 5 TO EXPAND MOBILITY AND ACCESS OPPORTUNITY FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS THAT HAVE TO DRIVE INCLUDING IN OUR EXPRESS LANES. 6 WE LAUNCHED THIS 18 MONTH PILOT WHICH IS CALLED EXPRESS LANES 7 8 START TO THE PUBLIC IN APRIL OF 2023 AND THE PILOT GIVES APPROVED CUSTOMERS AT LEAST A 50% OFF TOLL IN THE 880 EXPRESS 9 10 LANES, WHICH ARE SHOWN IN THIS MAP HERE ON THE RIGHT, AND RUN FROM APPROXIMATELY OAKLAND DOWN TO MILPITAS. ELIGIBILITY 11 REOUIREMENTS ARE THE SAME FOR CLIPPER START, AND THE DATA THAT 12 WE'RE GOING TO BE SHARING WITH YOU TODAY COVER THE FIRST SIX 13 MONTHS OF THE PILOT FROM APRIL THROUGH SEPTEMBER OF 2023. NEXT 14 15 SLIDE PLEASE TO PUT A FINER POINT ON ELIGIBILITY, AN APPLICANT 16 MUST BE VERIFIED AS ELIGIBLE AND NEED TO PROVIDE PROOF OF IDENTITY, PROOF OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME AT OR BELOW 200% OF THE 17 FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL AND HAVE A BAY AREA MAILING ADDRESS AND 18 BROWSE THESE ARE EXPRESS LANES THEY NEED TO HAVE A FASTER 19 ACCOUNT LIKE ANYBODY ELSE THAT'S GOING TO BE DRIVING IN THE 20 21 EXPRESS LANES AND IF APPROVED FOR THE PROGRAM THEY RECEIVE 50% OR MORE OFF TOLLS AND I IF A PERSON IS DRIVING IN TWO PERSON 22 CARPOOL THEY GET 50% OFF AND CLEAN AIR VEHICLE THEY GET 50% 23 OFF AND ANY THREE PERSON VEHICLE ISN'T TOLLED AT ALL. WITH THE 24 EXPRESS LANES START DISCOUNT DRIVING ALONE IS 50% OFF AND A 25

MARCH 22, 2024

TWO PERSON CARPOOL OR CLEAN AIR VEHICLE IS 75% OFF. AND OF 1 COURSE THREE PERSON TRIPS ARE STILL TOLL-FREE. NEXT SLIDE 2 3 PLEASE ENROLLING IS MEANT TO BE EASY MODELED AFTER CLIPPER START THE CUSTOMER APPLIES FOR THE VIA COMPUTER OR MOBILE 4 5 PHONE OR THE WEB SITE OR APPLY IN WRITING USING THE BROCHURE ALTHOUGH RARELY DONE, IF THE PERSON MEETS ELIGIBILITY 6 REQUIREMENTS THE PERSON IS APPROVED FOR THE PROGRAM, THE 7 8 DISCOUNT IS APPLIED TO THE FASTRAK ACCOUNT IMMEDIATELY AND IF THE PERSON DOESN'T HAVE A FASTRAK ACCOUNT WHEN THEY APPLY THEY 9 ARE GIVEN AN APPROVAL CODE TO REDEEM WITH FASTRAK WHEN THEY 10 OPEN THEIR ACCOUNT, SO THE DISCOUNT PLAN IS APPLIED. NEXT 11 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS A MAP OF LOW-INCOME CENSUS 12 TRACTS IN THE 880 CORRIDOR OVERLAID ON AREAS WITH LIMITED 13 ENGLISH SPEAKING POPULATIONS AND LANGUAGE SPOKEN AT HOME WHICH 14 IS PREDOMINANTLY CHINESE, SPANISH, OR VIETNAMESE. BEFORE 15 16 LAUNCHING THE PILOT WE DESIGNED A PUBLIC OUTREACH PLAN FOCUSED ON CREATING CAMPAIGN MATERIALS IN THESE LANGUAGES AND 17 DEPLOYING THEM IN AREAS WHERE LOW-INCOME PEOPLE LIVE. ON THE 18 MAP SHOWN WE PAID FOUR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO SERVE 19 WALK IN HELP CENTERS AND TO POST PROGRAM INFORMATION IN NEARBY 20 21 HIGH TRAFFIC AREAS AND BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM THIS SUBCOMMITTEE WE MADE A SPECIAL EFFORT TO REACH BLACK RESIDENTS 22 IN EAST OAKLAND THROUGH COMMUNITY OUTREACH WORK DONE BY ROOTS 23 WHICH IS ONE OF THE LOCAL COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. SORRY 24 THAT'S A MOUTHFUL. WE'RE ALSO WORKING WITH COMMUNITY COLLEGE 25

MARCH 22, 2024

IN THE CORRIDOR TO PROMOTE THE PILOT TO STUDENTS. NEXT SLIDE 1 PLEASE. HERE, ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THIS SLIDE IS SHOWN SOME 2 ARTWORK FOR AN ELECTRONIC BILLBOARD THAT WAS DISPLAYED IN THE 3 CORRIDOR OVER VARIOUS DATES AND LOCATIONS AND IT'S IN MULTIPLE 4 5 LANGUAGES TO ADVERTISE THE PROGRAM BROADLY TO PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT LIVE OR WORK IN THE CORRIDOR ITSELF. SO, PEOPLE -- YOU 6 KNOW, ANYBODY CAN -- AS LONG AS THEY'RE A BAY AREA RESIDENT 7 8 CAN APPLY FOR THIS PILOT AND THE LEFT SHOWS SOME PAID MEDIA WE HAVE USED TO ADVERTISE. ASIDE FROM BILLBOARDS, PRINT ADS, 9 10 NEWSPAPERS, WE HAVE SENT DIRECT MAIL ADVERTISED ON WEB SITES, FACEBOOK, AND ALSO INSTAGRAM AND RUN TV ADS AT DMV OFFICES AND 11 RECENTLY ADVERTISING ON GAS PUMP HANDLES. SO I'M GOING TO TURN 12 IT OVER TO BARBARA TO SHARE SOME OF THE INDIVIDUAL 13 OBSERVATIONS BASED ON EARLY PILOT DATA 14

15

16 BARBARA LAURENSON: THANK YOU. BARBARA LAURENSON MTC STAFF I'LL SHARE THINGS WE HAVE SHARED WITH THIS COMMITTEE IN THE PAST 17 BUT WITH SOME REVIEW OF PRIOR INFORMATION SO THERE IS THREE 18 PRIMARY GOALS OF EXPRESS LANE START PILOT WE WANT TO IMPROVE 19 ACCESS TO THE 180 EXPRESS LANES TO LOW-INCOME DRIVERS WE WANT 20 TO GIVE THEM A GOOD EXPERIENCE AND WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE 21 EFFECT OF THE PILOT ON EXPRESS LANE OPERATIONS. NEXT SLIDE 22 PLEASE. THERE ARE SEVEN PILOT EVALUATION TOPICS THAT ARE VERY 23 SIMILAR TO THE EVALUATION TOPICS OF CLIPPER START. WE'RE 24 25 LOOKING AT IS THE PILOT IMPROVING THEIR ACCESS AND MOBILITY,

MARCH 22, 2024

ARE CUSTOMER PRESIDENCY AWARE OF THE PILOT, THE EXPERIENCE 1 2 THEY'RE HAVING, IS THEIR EXPERIENCE CONTINUING TO MAKE THINGS 3 AFFORDABLE FOR THEM OR MAYBE ARE THEY GETTING IN SOME KIND OF FINANCIAL TROUBLE WITH THIS PILOT. WE'RE LOOKING AT THE 4 5 ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY OF THE PILOT, THE FINANCIAL VIABILITY, AND THEN, FINALLY, THE IMPACT ON THE EXPRESS LANE 6 PERFORMANCE AND THE MOBILITY OF EXPRESS LANE ITSELF. NEXT 7 8 SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. SO, IN THE NEXT SEVERAL SLIDES, NOW I'M TALKING ABOUT OUR EXPERIENCES THAT WE HAVE SEEN IN THE FIRST 9 SIX MONTHS WITH THE FIRST SIX MONTHS OF DATA SHOWING US, THIS 10 IS ALL NEW INFORMATION THIS GROUP HAS NOT HEARD BEFORE. SO IN 11 LOOKING AT IF THE PILOT IS IMPROVING ACCESS AND MOBILITY OF 12 THE CUSTOMERS IN IT, IN THE PROGRAM, WE HAVE OVER A THOUSAND 13 ENROLLEES. SO THESE ARE PEOPLE WHO HAVE APPLIED FOR THE 14 PROGRAM. THEY HAVE BEEN APPROVED, AND THEY HAVE ADDED THE 15 16 DISCOUNT PLAN TO THEIR FASTRAK ACCOUNT. SO, THEY ARE READY TO GO. IF THEY USE THAT EXPRESS LANE, THEY'RE GOING TO GET THE 17 DISCOUNT. THOSE THOUSAND ENROLLEES, A LITTLE MORE THAN HALF IN 18 THE FIRST SIX MONTHS MADE AT LEAST ONE PAID TRIP ON THE I-880 19 EXPRESS LANES. ANOTHER, ABOUT 200, ALSO MADE SOME TRIPS, JUST 20 AS AN HOV THREE PLUS TRIPS NEVER MADE PAID TRIPS. WE LOOKED AT 21 THEIR PAID TRIP EXPERIENCE TO SEE IF WITH THE DISCOUNT PROGRAM 22 ARE THEY MAKING MORE TRIPS. SO WE, AS PIERCE EXPLAINED, WE --23 IF YOU APPLY, IF YOU ALREADY HAVE FASTRAK, THEN YOU DON'T HAVE 24 TO APPLY FOR A FASTRAK. SO, ON THE FAR LEFT -- ON THE LEFT 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SIDE OF THIS SLIDE, THERE IS A TABLE -- A GRAPH HERE. ON THE 1 FAR LEFT THERE, IS TWO BARS, AND WE'RE COMPARING FOR PEOPLE 2 3 THAT ALREADY HAVE FASTRAK, HOW OFTEN THEY WERE USING THE I ACOUIT EXPRESS LANES BEFORE THEY ENROLLED IN THE PILOT AND HOW 4 5 AFTERNOON AFTER. AND WE'RE SEEING THEY'RE MAKING ABOUT 50% MORE MEDIAN PAID TRIPS PER QUARTER. SO IT IS INCREASING THEIR 6 USE OF THE EXPRESS LANES. THEN FOR NEW CUSTOMERS PEOPLE WHO 7 8 DIDN'T HAVE FASTRAK BEFORE THEY'RE ALSO MAKING ABOUT 4.5 MEDIAN PAID TRANSCRIPT IN THE CORRIDOR PER OUARTER, AND THAT'S 9 A HIGHER RATE THAN ACTUALLY YOUR AVERAGE I-880 EXPRESS LANE 10 CUSTOMER. THE AVERAGE I-880 EXPRESS LANE CUSTOMER IS SHOWN BY 11 THE PINK BAR ON THE RIGHT OF THE GRAPH SHOWING THESE PEOPLE 12 MAKE ONLY ONE AND A HALF MEDIAN PAID TRIPS PER QUARTER. SO 13 THAT'S INDICATING THE EARLY ADOPT EARS OF THIS PROGRAM ARE 14 15 FINDING IT VALUABLE TO THEIR TRAVEL NEEDS ALSO ASKED THROUGH 16 SURVEYS WHAT THEIR TRIP PURPOSE IS FOR USING THE EXPRESS LANES AND ABOUT 50 -- ABOUT HALF HAVE SAID IT'S FOR WORK AND THEN 17 WE'RE ALSO SEEING 51% OF THE TRIPS MADE BY OUR GROUP ARE 18 OCCURRING IN THE PEAK PERIODS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. EACH TWO 19 MONTHS, WE DO A ROLLING SURVEY OF THE PEOPLE THAT HAVE BEEN 20 APPROVED FOR THE PILOT TO CAPTURE THEIR FIRST TWO MONTHS OF 21 22 EXPERIENCE. AND WE HAVE -- THIS SLIDE REPRESENTS DATA FROM THE FIRST TWO ITERATIONS OF THAT ROLLING SURVEY, AND WE ASKED 23 PARTICIPANTS, THESE ARE PEOPLE THAT HAVE MADE TRIPS IN THE 24 EXPRESS LANE, HOW THEY HAVE BENEFITTED FROM USING THE EXPRESS 25

MARCH 22, 2024

LANE, AND THE NUMBER ONE RESPONSE IS THAT PEOPLE SAVED TIME. 1 2 THE SECOND MOST COMMON RESPONSE IS THAT THEY ARE MORE 3 CONFIDENT ABOUT HOW LONG THEIR TRIP WOULD TAKE. AND ONE OF THE PURPOSES OF EXPRESS LANES IS TO IMPROVE TRAVEL TIME 4 5 RELIABILITY. THAT IDEA THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, I HAVE TO LEAVE WORK GET HOME IS IT GOING TO TAKE ME AN HOUR, OR AN HOUR 6 AND A HALF THAT'S ONE OF THE KEY FUNCTIONS OF THE EXPRESS 7 8 LANES IS THAT IT'S PROBABLY GOING TO TAKE YOU PLUS OR MINUS FIVE MINUTES INSTEAD OF PLUS OR MINUS 20 MINUTES. WE'RE SEEING 9 THE BENEFIT THAT PEOPLE ARE GETTING BECAUSE THEY'RE SAYING HOW 10 THEY'RE MORE CONFIDENT THEIR TRIP IS GOING TO TAKE, LESS 11 STRESS PER TRIP AND THE TRAVELING FASTER. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE 12 ENGAGED IF APPLICANTS AND PARTICIPANTS ARE HAVING A POSITIVE 13 EXPERIENCE. THE APPLICATION ASKS PEOPLE HOW EASY IT WAS TO 14 APPLY FOR THE PROGRAM AND ON A SCALE OF 1 TO 5 WHERE FIVE IS 15 16 VERY EASY, OUR AVERAGE SCORE IF THE FIRST SIX MONTHS WAS 4.1 AND OUR GOAL THERE WAS TO AT LEAST GET A FOUR. WE DID ONE 17 FOCUS GROUP SO FAR OF PEOPLE IN THE PROGRAM. THEY EXPRESSED 18 DEEP GRATITUDE FOR THE PROGRAM AND EXPRESSED THAT FOR THEM IT 19 WAS VERY HIGH VALUE, THAT THEY REALLY VALUED THE COST SAVINGS 20 21 AND THE ABILITY TO MAKE THE FASTER MORE RELIABLE TRIP. AGAIN, THE FACT THAT THEIR MEDIAN USE OF EXPRESS LANES IS GREATER 22 THAN THE OVERALL MEDIAN USE INDICATION TO US THEY'RE HAVING A 23 GOOD EXPERIENCE WE HAVE LOOKED AT THE RATE WHICH CUSTOMERS ARE 24 CALLING THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER WITH ISSUES OR PROBLEMS TO 25

MARCH 22, 2024

KNOW WHETHER THERE IS SOMETHING UNIQUE ABOUT THIS PROGRAM, 1 THEN FINDING THEIR NEED TO CALL THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER IS 2 3 IN LINE WITH THAT OF THE TYPICAL FASTRAK CUSTOMER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE LOOKING AT OUR APPROVED APPLICANT POPULATION AND 4 5 HOW THEIR RATES AND ETHNICITY COMPARES TO THAT OF THE I-880 CORRIDOR IN GENERAL. THIS IS A WAY OF ASSESSING WHETHER WE'RE 6 REACHING THE RIGHT POPULATION F WE'RE REACHING A BROAD VARIETY 7 8 OF POPULATIONS AND THE TARGETED AUDIENCE. AND SO THE PINK BARS ON THIS SLIDE ARE SHOWING THE RACE AND ETHNICITY OF THE I-880 9 CORRIDOR IN GENERAL AND THE GRAY BARS ARE SHOWING THOSE THAT 10 HAVE BEEN APPROVED FOR THE PILOT. SO, IN, FOR WHITE DELIBERATE 11 WHITE POPULATION, FEWER PEOPLE HAVE BEEN APPROVED FOR THE 12 PILOT THAN REFLECTIVE OF THE CORRIDOR AND HISPANIC IS ABOUT 3% 13 LESS, BUT FOR ALL OTHER RACE AND ETHNICITY GROUPS, THE PILOT 14 15 PARTICIPATION IS HIGHER THAN THE CORRIDOR DIVERSITY WE HAVE 16 ASKED PEOPLE HOW THEY'RE LEARNING ABOUT THE PROGRAM AND THE MARKETING TEAM AND HAS USED A LARGE VARIETY OF STRATEGIES TO 17 GET THE MESSAGE OUT AND FINDING PRETTY MUCH ALL OF THOSE 18 STRATEGIES DIFFERENT PEOPLE ARE USING TO FIND OUT ABOUT THE 19 PROGRAM WITH THE FASTRAK WEB SITE BEING PROBABLY AT THE TOP 20 21 THEN SOCIAL MEDIA THEN FINDING OUT FROM SOCIAL SERVICES AGENCIES WORKING WITH PARTNERS. THE FIRST SIX MONTHS 15,000 22 UNIQUE INDIVIDUALS VISITED THE EXPRESS LANE START WEB SITE. SO 23 WE KNOW THE MESSAGE IS GETTING OUT. NEXT SLIDE. THE 24 PARTICIPATION IN THE PILOT IS INFLUENCED BY A VARIETY OF 25

MARCH 22, 2024

FACTORS. FIRST EXPRESS LANES ARE A CHOICE THERE IS ALWAYS 1 GOING TO BE A FREE OPTION. IT'S THE LANE RIGHT NEXT DOOR. SO, 2 AND EVEN AT A 50% DISCOUNT, PEOPLE DO HAVE -- IF YOU ARE 3 DRIVING SOLO, PEOPLE WILL HAVE TO PAY TO USE THE EXPRESS LANE. 4 5 AND THEN THEY CAN ALWAYS STILL USE IT FREE AS A CARPOOL. SO, THAT'S SOME OF THE REASONS WHY, YOU KNOW, FROM THE AMOUNT OF 6 FOLKS THAT WE HAVE THAT LOOK AT THE WEB SITE THAT EVENTUALLY 7 8 GET THROUGH THE WHOLE PROCESS AND ARE USING IT, THOSE ARE SOME OF THE EXPLANATORY FACTORS OF WHY THERE IS FEWER AND FEWER 9 FOLKS AT EACH STAGE. SO IF THE FIRST SIX MONTHS WE HAD 1650 10 COMPLETED APPLICATIONS THE VAST MAJORITY OF THOSE WERE 11 APPROVED AND THEN FROM APPROVAL ABOUT 500 PEOPLE, SO, A THIRD, 12 DID NOT END UP APPLYING THEIR FASTRAK CODE TO AN ACCOUNT, 13 MEANING THEY NEVER GOT AROUND TO THE LAST STEP OF OPENING THE 14 ACCOUNT. SO, WE, AFTER SIX MONTHS, THERE WERE A LITTLE OVER A 15 THOUSAND PEOPLE FULLY, WHAT WE CALL FULLY ENROLLED IN THE 16 PROGRAM AND READY TO MAKE THOSE DISCOUNTED TRIPS. SO, 17 PARTICIPATING IS ALSO AFFECTED BY THE FACT THAT THEY NEED 18 FASTRAK, AND THEN, FINALLY, FOR THAT -- THE ATTRITION FROM THE 19 -- AS WE LOOK AT WHERE PEOPLE START AN APPLICATION, TO WHETHER 20 21 THEY COMPLETE IT, WE CAN TELL THAT THE INCOME AND IDENTIFICATION REQUIREMENTS ARE A STOPPING POINT. PROBABLY 22 THEE QUARTERS WHO START AN APPLICATION AND DON'T COMPLETE IT, 23 THEY STOP AT EITHER QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT THEIR INCOME IS, OR 24 WHEN THEY HAVE TO PROVIDE THE PAPERWORK FOR THEIR INCOME. SO, 25

MARCH 22, 2024

THAT PROBABLY INDICATES THAT AS THEY READ MORE CLOSELY, THEY 1 REALIZE THAT THEY DON'T QUALIFY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE THIS SLIDE 2 3 SHOWS THE TOLL DISTRIBUTION OF THE COST OF THE TRIP FOR THE WHATEVER THE PARTICIPANTS ARE MAKING. THIS IS BEFORE THE 4 5 DISCOUNT. SO WE CAN COMPARE THEIR COST AT FACE VALUE TO WHAT THE AVERAGE EXPRESS LANE USERS PAY FOR TRIPS. AND, SO, WHAT WE 6 SEE IS THAT OUR PARTICIPANTS, THEY ARE USING THE EXPRESS LANES 7 8 AT ALL -- AT MANY DIFFERENT LEVELS OF TOLLS. SO, WHEN TOLLS ARE FAIRLY LOW, AT LESS THAN \$3 31% OF TRIPS ARE MADE AT THAT 9 PRICE. HIGHER END 19% OF TRIPS AT \$12 OR MORE PRIOR TO THE 10 DISCOUNT. SO, THIS IS INTERESTING, BECAUSE PRIOR RESEARCH HAS 11 SHOWN THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OFTEN USE EXPRESS LANES MORE 12 FREQUENTLY WHEN THE TOLLS ARE HIGHER BECAUSE IT INDICATES THAT 13 TRAFFIC IS WORSE AND PERHAPS THEY HAVE A MORE GREATER NEED TO 14 15 BE ON TIME IN SOME CASES THAN MAYBE PEOPLE THAT ARE HIRING 16 INCOME. YOU KNOW, SOMETIMES WHEN YOU YOU'RE A SHIFT WORKER, IF YOU'RE NOT THERE AT THE RIGHT TIME AS A BIG DOCK ON THE 17 OUALITY OF YOUR WORK LIFE THAN FOR SOMEONE THAT CAN MAYBE ROLL 18 IN AT NINE OR TEN OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. OVERALL PARTICIPANTS 19 HAVE MADE 7500 PAID TRIPS AND COLLECTIVELY HAVE SAVED OVER 20 \$26,000 IN TOLLS AND AS I SAID, THEY VALUE USING THE LANES 21 WHEN TRAFFIC CAUSES LOW AS WELL AS HIGH TOLLS. NEXT SLIDE. 22 OKAY. SO, LOOKING AT SOME OF THE CHALLENGES OF MTC'S MEANS 23 BASED PROGRAMS. RIGHT NOW, WE HAVE SEVERAL MEANS BASED 24 PROGRAMS ALL AT DIFFERENT PHASES SO MTC IS LEARNING DIFFERENT 25

MARCH 22, 2024

THINGS FROM EACH OF THESE PROGRAMS ON A DIFFERENT TIMELINE AND 1 SCALE. WE -- YOU KNOW, THE EXPRESS LANES START PILOT IT'S BEEN 2 3 OPERATING FOR JUST ABOUT A YEAR. THE BAY TOLL PAYMENT PLAN HAS BEEN OPERATING FOR LESS THAN A YEAR BUT CLIPPER START PILOT 4 5 HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR FOUR YEARS. MTC IS LOOKING COLLECTIVELY WHAT WE'RE LEARNING FROM ALL THESE PILOTS AND WE'RE FINDING 6 COMMONALITIES AND ESPECIALLY COMMONALITIES AND SOME OF THE 7 8 CHALLENGES. SO, MTC IS GOING TO -- IS UNDERTAKING AN INTERNAL ANALYSIS OF STRATEGY OPERATIONS THAT CAN OPERATE ACROSS ALL 9 THESE DIFFERENT PILOTS SO IN ORDER TO REACH MORE -- TO BE ABLE 10 TO REACH MORE ELIGIBLE RESIDENTS, IDEAS LIKE AUTO ENROLLMENT, 11 SELF-VERIFICATION, AND UNIFIED BENEFITS PORTAL AND BEING 12 LOOKING AT WAYS TO EXPAND ACCESS TALKING TO DIFFERENT 13 COMMUNITIES IN DESIRE TO CHANGE ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLDS SO 14 15 ACROSS ALL OF OUR PILOTS COLLECTIVE LIE LOOKING AT THESE 16 THINGS. NEXT SLIDE. OUR NEXT STEP SPECIFIC TO THE EXPRESS LANES START PILOT ARE THAT 12 FULL MONTHS OF PEOPLE USING THE 17 PROGRAM WILL CONCLUDES AT THE END OF THIS MONTH WE'LL HAVE OUR 18 FULL 12 MONTHS OF DATA, WE'LL TAKE SOMETHING THAT WE DID IN 19 SIX MONTHS IN-DEPTH AND LOOK AT HOW DIFFERENT TARGETS AND 20 21 METRICS HAVE BEEN ACHIEVED THEN WE'LL START SHARING PILOT RESULTS WITH STAKEHOLDERS THROUGH SUMMER AND FALL OF 2024, 22 THEN WORK WITH OTHER PROGRAMS ON THE INTERNAL MEANS BASED 23 TECHNICAL ANALYSIS, THAT SHOULD CONCLUDE SOMETIME IN THE FALL 24 AND WITH THESE DIFFERENT METHODS WE'LL BE ABLE TO RECOMMEND 25

MARCH 22, 2024

WHAT IS GOING HAPPEN WITH THIS PILOT, WHETHER IT SHOULD BE 1 PERHAPS CHANGED, DESIGN SHOULD BE CHANGED IN SOME WAY TO 2 BEFORE THE TARGET OUR AUDIENCE, SHOULD IT BE CONTINUED AS IS 3 AND EXPANDED TO MORE EXPRESS LANES. ONE THING THAT'S IMPORTANT 4 5 IS WE WORK WITH PARTNER AGENCIES WHO OPERATE EXPRESS LANES THAT ARE NOT MTC, AND, SO, WE'LL HAVE TO PUT ALL THAT 6 INFORMATION TOGETHER TO RECOMMEND THE FUTURE OF THIS PILOT. 7 8 NEXT SLIDE. OH THERE IS NOTHING. ALL RIGHT. THAT IS THE END. I THOUGHT THERE WAS A OUESTION SLIDE AT THE END. SO NOW PIERCE 9 10 AND I ARE HAPPY TO TAKE YOUR QUESTIONS. 11 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR YOUR 12 PRESENTATION. ALLEGING, DO WE HAVE QUESTIONS? 13 14 TERRY SCOTT: I HAVE ONE. 15 16 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: AND JOHNNY ARE YOU GOING TO --17 18 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: SO, WE HAVE WONG FIRST, FOLLOWED BY 19

20 TERRY SCOTT. HOWARD WONG.

21

HOWARD WONG: THANKS. THIS IS A GREAT PROGRAM. I THINK IT KIND
OF TIES INTO OUR DISCUSSION ABOUT THE REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE
-- TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, AND THAT ONE NEEDS TO CONTINUOUSLY
GIVE INFORMATION TO THE PUBLIC OF HOW MTC AND THE REGION IS

MARCH 22, 2024

TRYING TO BE FAIR ABOUT HOW BENEFITS ARE DISTRIBUTED, THAT 1 EXPRESS LANES ARE NOT ONLY FOR THE WELL TO DO, BUT FOR AVERAGE 2 3 PEOPLE. PEOPLE WHO HAVE, AS YOU MENTIONED, NEEDS TO GET TO WORK, PERHAPS IN A MUCH MORE RAPID WAY THAN SOME OF THE MORE 4 5 AFFLUENT OFFICE WORKERS THAT MANY WORKING PEOPLE HAVE TO HIT THAT TIME CLOCK ON A CERTAIN TIME, OR THEY MAY HAVE PAY 6 DEDUCTED, FOR INSTANCE. SO, I THINK IT'S GOOD TO CONTINUE TO 7 8 LET PEOPLE KNOW ABOUT THESE PROGRAMS AND THEIR BENEFITS. ONE OF THE THOUGHTS I HAD, THAT YOU MENTIONED THE SAVINGS ARE 9 SOMEWHAT GRADUATED, THAT TWO OR MORE PASSENGERS IS 75% OFF. IS 10 THAT CORRECT? OKAY. I WAS WONDERING, WHY WEREN'T THERE PERHAPS 11 BE MORE GRADIENTS SO THAT YOU MIGHT HAVE TWO PEOPLE IN THE 12 CAR, THREE PEOPLE IN A CAR, FOUR PEOPLE IN A CAR AND PERHAPS 13 IF YOU HAD FIVE PEOPLE IN A CAR, IT'S 100% OFF, THE DISCOUNT 14 THAT'S FREE THAT YOU START USING THIS PROGRAM AS INCENTIVE TO 15 16 DECREASE OVERALL CAR TRIPS.

17

**PIERCE GOULD:** THANKS FOR THE OUESTION. THE PARTICULAR 18 CORRIDOR, WE DEMONSTRATED THIS CON EXPRESS LANE CORRIDOR RIGHT 19 NOW, IF THREE OR MORE IN A CAR DON'T PAY TO USE THE LANE, SO 20 21 THAT'S, YOU KNOW, I'M JUST TRYING TO SHOW THAT'S BETTER THAN FIVE. WE'RE ALREADY TRYING TO INCENTIVIZE THROUGH THE EXISTING 22 TOLL STRUCTURE AND THEN THIS DISCOUNT PROGRAM PIVOTS OFF OF 23 THE STRUCTURE WE HAVE FOR EVERYBODY BECAUSE WE'RE TRYING TO --24 PUBLIC INFORMATION-WISE WE'RE TRYING TO KEEP THE INFORMATION 25

MARCH 22, 2024

THAT WE PUT OUT THERE EASY TO UNDERSTAND AND CONSISTENT WITH
 HOW THE LANE WORKS TODAY, BUT ALSO STILL INCENTIVIZE PEOPLE TO
 GET MORE PEOPLE IN THEIR CAR. HOPEFULLY THAT ANSWERS YOUR
 QUESTION.

5

6 TERRY SCOTT: MY QUESTION IS A RATHER SIMPLE ONE. BUT, OFTEN -7 IN YOUR PREVIOUS SLIDE YOU HAVE A PICTURE OF A HIGHWAY SIGN
8 AND IT TALKED ABOUT HTV FLEX, AND I HAVE SEEN THAT ON A NUMBER
9 OF THE COMMUTE LANE PASSAGES, BUT I NEVER REALLY KNEW WHAT HTP
10 FLEX STOOD FOR. WHAT DOES IT MEAN?

11

12 LAURA HOFFMEISTER: FT FLEX? YEAH. THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION.
13 VARIABLE TOLL MESSAGING SIGNS WE HAVE 20 CHARACTERISTICS TO
14 WORK WITH FT FLEX IS ABBREVIATION FOR FASTRAK FLEX.

15

16 TERRY SCOTT: THE NEXT QUESTION OR PART WOULD BE, I NOTICED 17 THAT ON SUNDAYS THAT OFTEN THE COMMUTE LANE SAYS, YOU KNOW, 18 OPEN TO EVERYONE AND WHAT IS -- DO WE HAVE ANY STATISTICS THAT 19 INDICATE HOW MANY PEOPLE WOULD USE THAT? OR WHAT BENEFIT IT 20 IS? IN OTHER WORDS, OBVIOUSLY ON A SUNDAY, YOU PROBABLY HAVE 21 FEWER TRAVELERS THAN YOU DO DURING THE WEEK, AND COMMUTERS AND 22 SO FORTH. BUT, ANYHOW, I WAS JUST CURIOUS.

23

24 BARBARA LAURENSON: I DON'T THINK THAT WE COLLECT LANE VOLUME 25 DATA ON THE WEEKENDS. SO WHEN IT'S OPEN TO ALL, THE CONCEPT IS

MARCH 22, 2024

1 THAT SINCE THE TRAFFIC IS NOT AS BAD AS IT IS ON THE WEEKDAYS, 2 PARTICULARLY THE COMMUTE, THAT THERE IS NO REASON TO TOLL 3 PEOPLE IN THAT LANE. THERE IS NOT MUCH TO SELL. THERE IS NO 4 REAL BENEFIT TO SELL. SO THAT'S WHY IT'S JUST OPEN TO ALL. NOT 5 EVEN WORKING, FUNCTIONING AS A CARPOOL LANE AT THAT POINT.

6

7 TERRY SCOTT: OKAY. THANK YOU.

8

**PAMELA CAMPOS:** I REALLY APPRECIATE THIS PRESENTATION. I HOPE 9 THAT A LEARN LESSONED, AT LEAST WHAT STOOD OUT FOR ME, WAS 10 THAT HAVING SPECIFIC OUTREACH TO THE AFRICAN AMERICAN 11 COMMUNITY IN EAST OAKLAND LOOKED LIKE IT REALLY SHOWED, AND 12 WHO IS PARTICIPATING. SO, IF THERE THOUGHTS ABOUT EXPANDING 13 THIS PILOT TO OTHER GEOGRAPHIES, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING 14 IMPORTANT TO LEAN INTO IN TERMS OF EQUITY AND MAKING SURE THAT 15 16 WE'RE MEETING THE GOALS TO IMPROVE ACCESS FOR FOLKS WHO HAVE LOW-INCOME WAGES. MY QUESTION IS, WHAT ARE THE TRADE-OFFS WITH 17 THE LOST INCOME IF WE'RE PROVIDING THIS DISCOUNT? IS THAT --18 IS THERE A LOSS OF INCOME THAT'S BEING FELT BECAUSE OF THIS 19 PILOT? 20

21

22 BARBARA LAURENSON: DO YOU MEAN TO THE EXPRESS LANES? EXPRESS23 LANE REVENUE?

24

25 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YEAH.

BARBARA LAURENSON: THE SLIDE SHOWS THAT THE TRIPS THAT 2 3 PARTICIPANTS HAVE MADE COLLECTIVELY IN THE FIRST SIX MONTHS SAVED THEM \$26,500. SO SINCE IT'S HALF OFF THAT MEANS THAT 4 5 BAIFA HAS FOREGONE \$26,500 IN REVENUE, WHICH IS NOT A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF EXPRESS LANE REVENUE. THE 7TH TOPIC AREA 6 OF EVALUATION IS EXPRESS LANE PERFORMANCE AND THE MOBILITY OF 7 8 EXPRESS LANES AND PART OF EXPRESS LANES PERFORMANCE IS ALSO REVENUE. SO, THE FACT THAT, YOU KNOW, OVER TIME, IF MANY, 9 MANY, MANY MORE PEOPLE WERE TAKING ADVANTAGE OF THIS PROGRAM, 10 IT COULD POTENTIALLY START TO IMPACT EXPRESS LANE REVENUE IN 11 SOME WAY. HOWEVER, YOU ALSO HAVE TO THINK ABOUT IT IS THAT 12 PERHAPS THESE ARE PEOPLE THAT MIGHT NOT HAVE MADE THAT TRIP. 13 SO, IT'S 26,000 AND FOREGONE REVENUE, BUT IF THEY HADN'T HAVE 14 15 DECIDED TO USE THE EXPRESS LANE AT ALL WE WOULDN'T HAVE GOTTEN 16 EVEN THE \$26,500 THEY DID PAY SO THERE IS TWO-WAYS TO THINK ABOUT IT. AT THIS POINT IT'S CLEARLY AFFORDABLE FOR THE 17 EXPRESS LANES PROGRAM TO OFFER THIS PROGRAM. 18

19

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

20 PAMELA CAMPOS: THAT'S GREAT. I'M GLAD TO HEAR THERE IS NO
21 DETRIMENTAL NEGATIVE EFFECT TO THE REVENUE SOURCE. AND MY
22 OTHER QUESTION IS WHAT ARE THE POTENTIALS FOR EXPANDING? HAS
23 THERE BEEN ANY THOUGHT INTO WHAT THAT MIGHT LOOK LIKE? IS IT
24 GOING TO BE SELECTING ONE CORRIDOR IN EACH COUNTY? ONLY A
25 SELECT NUMBER OF COUNTIES? HAS THERE BEEN ANY THOUGHT TO THAT?

1

MARCH 22, 2024

PIERCE GOULD: SO, WHEN WE -- THIS IS ONE REASON THAT CREATED 2 3 THE ADVISORY GROUP THAT I WAS TALKING ABOUT, WAS TO INCLUDE OTHERS EXPRESS LANE OPERATORS STAKEHOLDERS IN OUR JOURNEY SO 4 5 THEY WOULD BE AWARE OF THE REASONS WE'RE MAKING OUR DECISIONS AND BE BROUGHT ALONG IN THAT PROCESS SO WE HAVE TRIED TO 6 CREATE A PROGRAM THAT COULD BE EASILY REPLICATED IN OTHER 7 8 PLACES BUT ULTIMATELY IT'S STILL THE DECISION OF OTHER BOARDS TO MAKE THOSE CALLS FOR THEIR OWN EXPRESS LANES. AS STAFF WHEN 9 WE LOOK AT THE DECISION ABOUT WHETHER TO EXPAND THE PILOT, 10 THERE IS CERTAINLY MTC'S LANES, 880, 680, AND SOLANO WHEN THEY 11 OPEN THAT, SO PARTNERS, THERE WILL BE DEFINITE CONVERSATIONS 12 WITH -- SORRY. I HAVE AN ALARM GOING ON SO THAT I MAKE MY NEXT 13 MEETING. THERE WILL BE DEFINITE CONVERSATIONS WITH OUR 14 15 PARTNERS ABOUT ANY KIND OF EXPANSION AND THAT WILL ALL BE IN 16 CONTEXT WITH THE FINAL EVALUATION THAT BARBARA IS LEADING. AND WHAT WE SHOW ABOUT THE RESULTS. PILOT. 17

18

19 PAMELA CAMPOS: THANK YOU. MY LAST COMMENT IS, I DIDN'T SEE THE 20 EXACT NUMBER FOR WHAT 200% BELOW THE POVERTY LINE IS, AND I 21 THINK THAT THAT'S USEFUL INFORMATION TO KNOW, FOR US, AND JUST 22 PUBLIC FACING. BECAUSE THESE PROGRAMS, THEY TEND TO RELY ON 23 DIFFERENT, YOU KNOW, ELIGIBILITY, SOMETIMES IT'S AMI, 24 SOMETIMES IT'S FEDERAL POVERTY LIMIT SO HAVING THAT EXACT 25 NUMBER, I'M SURE IT'S ON THE WEB SITE, BUT I THINK THAT MIGHT



BE HELPFUL TO MAKING IT CLEAR FOR FOLKS, LIKE, WHAT IS THAT
 NUMBER FOR INCOME ELIGIBILITY, AND THEN, ALSO TO PUT IT INTO
 PERSPECTIVE FOR US. WHAT'S THAT NUMBER.

4

5 **PIERCE GOULD:** WE DON'T ADVERTISE THE PROGRAM BASED ON 200%. DON'T WORRY ABOUT THAT (LAUGHTER) IT'S ON THE WEB SITE WE HAVE 6 A TABLE IT'S A GRADUATED TABLE BECAUSE IT DEPENDS ON HOUSEHOLD 7 8 SIZE FOR A ONE PERSON HOUSEHOLD IT'S I BELIEVE \$31,000 ON FOR FOUR PERSON HOUSEHOLD IT'S ABOUT \$60,000 AND THEN MORE PEOPLE, 9 10 MORE INCOME, MORE HOUSEHOLD INCOME WOULD QUALIFY. AND IT CHANGES ANNUALLY BASED ON THE REVISION OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY 11 LEVEL. BUT YOU'RE RIGHT. OTHER PROGRAMS HAVE DIFFERENT 12 THRESHOLDS BASED ON COUNTY OR OTHER KINDS OF DATA. 13

14

V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: I HAVE SOME COMMENTS AND OUESTIONS. 15 16 IT APPEARS THAT YOU HAVE SOME GREAT ADVERTISEMENT. ME WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT I'M USED TO IN A GOVERNMENT ORGANIZATION KIND 17 OF BEING CONSERVATIVE WITH ADVERTISING BUT IT SEEMS YOU USE 18 EVERY FORM OF ADVERTISEMENT AND I THINK THAT REALLY HELPED 19 PROMOTE THE PROGRAM. I NOTICED THAT, I GUESS, IF A CURRENT 20 21 FASTRAK MEMBER, WHEN THEY ENROLLED INTO THE PROGRAM, THERE WAS A HIGHER INCREASE OF THEM USING THE EXPRESS LANES, CORRECT? 22 THAT -- WERE YOU EXPECTING THAT? THAT'S KIND OF A SHOCK TO ME 23 THAT THEY -- I WOULD THINK THAT THEY WOULD BE MORE CAREFUL. 24

BARBARA LAURENSON: WELL, THAT -- IT WAS THE INTENTION, AND THE 1 2 INTENTION IS INCREASED -- THE GOAL IS TO INCREASE THEIR ACCESS 3 TO THAT FASTER MORE RELIABLE TRIP. SO TO US, THAT SHOWS SUCCESS. AND THAT INCREASED -- WHAT WAS INTERESTING TO ME WAS 4 5 EVEN IF THEY'RE BASELINE THEY'RE SELL IT A POPULATION THAT WAS USING IT MORE THAN YOUR AVERAGE PERSON. SO, YOU KNOW, YOU KIND 6 OF START READING INTO THIS DATA AND WHAT ELSE ARE WE SEEING IN 7 8 IT. YOU KNOW, THIS GROUP OF EARLY ADOPTERS, THEY'RE PRETTY AGGRESSIVE USERS OF THE EXPRESS LANES TO BEGIN WITH. THEY 9 CLEARLY HAVE THIS NEED. SO TO ME THAT WAS MORE SURPRISING THAN 10 THE FACT THAT IT INCREASED. 11

12

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: THANK YOU. AND THE DRIVERS WHO ARE IN
THE PROGRAM, THEY TRAVELED AT A HIGHER RATE ON 180, FROM WHAT
I UNDERSTAND, THAN A -- THAN, I GUESS, A STANDARD DRIVER. THE
NUMBER THAT I READ WAS, LIKE, 4.5 VERSUS 1.5. THAT'S
IMPRESSIVE. BUT WHAT DO YOU THINK THAT SAYS ABOUT THE LOW
NUMBER WITH STANDARD DRIVERS, YOU THINK MAYBE THE EXPRESS LANE
IS JUST TOO PRICEY FOR THEM TO TRAVEL?

20

21 BARBARA LAURENSON: I LOVE THAT DATA STATISTIC BUT IT'S ONLY
22 1.5. BECAUSE IT JUST ITERATES WHAT WE SAY ABOUT EXPRESS LANES
23 ALL THE TIME THAT THEY'RE THERE FOR YOU WHEN YOU NEED THEM.
24 BECAUSE IT IS THE LUXURY GOOD. IT'S A SPECIAL THING THAT
25 YOU'RE DOING TO GET TO DECIDE THAT TODAY, I NEED TO USE THAT

MARCH 22, 2024

EXPRESS LANE FOR THE RE RELIABILITY TO GET TO WHERE I NEED TO 1 GO. IN 1.5 SHOWS ACROSS HUNDREDS OF THOUSAND OF EXPRESS LANE 2 3 TRIPS THAT THERE ARE SO MANY DIFFERENT PEOPLE USING THOSE EXPRESS LANES ON DIFFERENT OCCASIONS. SO THAT TO ME IS WHAT 4 5 THE 1.5 SAYS IT DOESN'T NECESSARY HE SAY THAT PEOPLE DON'T WANT TO USE THEM. OUR VOLUME DATA SHOWS THAT ESPECIALLY THE I-6 880 EXPRESS LANE IS BEING VERY WELL USED. EVEN DURING COVID IT 7 8 WAS VERY WELL USED AND AS THE REGION EMERGES FROM COVID, EACH OUARTER WE'RE STILL SEEING UPTICK IN THE USE OF 180 EXPRESS 9 10 LANES.

11

12 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: THANK YOU. AND, CHAIR FITZGERALD
13 THOSE ARE ALL THE COMMENTS THAT ARE FROM THE COUNCIL MEMBERS.
14

CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I DO HAVE A COUPLE OF OUESTIONS, 15 16 MYSELF. THANK YOU. I WAS REALLY CURIOUS ABOUT SOMETHING. I NOTICED IN YOUR PRESENTATION YOU NOTE THAT THERE WAS A PORTION 17 OF THE APPLICANTS THAT DIDN'T COMPLETE THE PROCESS. AND I'M 18 WONDERING, AND YOU MIGHT THINK THAT IT WAS LIKE A THOUSAND 19 PEOPLE. I DIDN'T QUITE GET THAT. BUT, ANYWAY, I WAS CURIOUS TO 20 21 KNOW, DID YOU EXPLORE THE WHY? WHY DIDN'T THEY COMPLETE THE 22 APPLICATION AND TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS PROGRAM?

23

24 BARBARA LAURENSON: SO, I DIDN'T PUT UP THE NUMBER OF
25 APPLICATIONS STARTED COMPARED TO APPLICATIONS COMPLETE, AND I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARCH 22, 2024

APOLOGIZE, I DON'T REMEMBER OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD WHAT THE 1 DIFFERENCE IS. BUT WE DO LOOK AT WHERE PEOPLE DROP OUT OF THE 2 3 PROCESS, AND FOR THOSE THAT DROP OUT, 75% DROP OUT AT A POINT WHERE THEIR FINANCIAL INFORMATION IS REOUIRED. THERE IS TWO 4 5 SPOTS IN THE PROCESS WHERE THAT IS REQUIRED. THE FIRST IS JUST, I THINK, TO CHECK THE BOX ABOUT WHAT IT WOULD LIKE TO 6 STATE IT, AND THE SECOND POINT IS WHERE YOU ACTUALLY HAVE TO 7 8 PROVIDE YOUR PAPERS. SO 75 OF PEOPLE DROP OUT AT THOSE TWO POINTS. SO, OUR SUSPICION IS THAT, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE ARE -- YOU 9 KNOW, STILL HAVE THEIR FINGERS CROSSED, THAT OH, I AM GOING TO 10 QUALIFY, AND THEN THEY FIND OUT OH NO I DON'T, AND I CAN'T 11 FUDGE IT ANYMORE (LAUGHTER) SOMETHING LIKE THAT. GIVE THEM 12 CREDIT FOR TRYING. 13

14

15 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: NO THAT MAKES SENSE. THANKS SO
16 MUCH. ALL RIGHT. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE AUDIENCE, IN17 PERSON, OR ONLINE?

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
20 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, AND
21 THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HERE IN THE BOARDROOM THAT
22 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK. ADINA LEVIN, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. MIC IS
23 HOT.

24

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ADINA LEVIN: GOOD AFTERNOON EOUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE 1 MEMBERS. ADINA LEVIN, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER SPEAKING 2 3 FOR MYSELF. AND THANKS TO STAFF FOR THE UPDATE ON THE EXPRESS LANE EQUITY PROGRAM PILOT. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS THAT -4 5 - THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF IT'S APPROPRIATE FOR STAFF TO ANSWER ON THAT, IT WOULD BE WELCOME. AND ONE OF THEM IS IN TERMS OF 6 HAVING THE -- BOTH THE MULTIPLE PROJECTS. MY UNDERSTANDING IT 7 8 CORRECTLY, THERE IS BEING LOOKING AT OPPORTUNITIES TO CROSS OUALIFY, SO IF SOMEONE IS ELIGIBLE FOR MULTIPLE PROGRAMS, LET 9 10 THEM QUALIFY ONCE AND THEN, OKAY, YOU'RE NOW -- HERE IS ALL THE OTHER THINGS YOU QUALIFY FOR, AND THEN, EVEN OUTSIDE OF 11 MTC'S PROGRAMS, THERE IS WORK ON CROSS OUALIFICATION, LIKE, IF 12 YOU'RE ELIGIBLE FOR MEDICARE OR SOME OTHER INCOME-BASED 13 PROGRAM, CAN WE USE SOME OF THAT DATA TO HELP WITH THE 14 15 ELIGIBILITY. IN TERMS OF THE -- SOME OF THE QUESTIONS IN THERE, YOU MAY BE DOING SURVEYS TO FIND OUT, LIKE, WOULD YOU 16 HAVE TAKEN THESE TRIPS IF YOU DIDN'T HAVE ACCESS TO THIS 17 PROGRAM? THAT'S OUALITATIVE DATA YOU CAN'T GET FROM THE 18 OUANTITATIVE. IF THERE IS SURVEYING SOMEONE MIGHT ANSWER. THEN 19 LASTLY THERE ARE SOME OTHER TOLL LANES RUN BY OTHER AGENCIES 20 LIKE VTA AND SAN MATEO COUNTY HAVE MANAGED LANES AND SAN MATEO 21 HAS EQUITY PROGRAMS, SO I'M WONDERING IF YOU ARE LOOKING TO 22 CROSS LEARN FROM THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT EOUITY PROGRAMS, THE 23 ONES THAT MTC OWNS, AND THE ONES THAT MTC'S ALLIES THAT OWN 24 OTHER PARTS OF THE HIGHWAY SYSTEMS USE. THANK YOU. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

1

PIERCE GOULD: ON CROSS QUALIFICATION, WE DID ACTUALLY CREATE 2 3 THE OPTION FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN APPROVED FOR CLIPPER START TO JUST USE THAT APPROVAL TO BECOME APPROVED FOR THIS 4 5 PARTICULAR EXPRESS LANES PILOT, AND WE ALSO ARE, OUR 200% OF FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD IS CONSISTENT WITH 6 STATE PROGRAM SO ANYBODY WHO HAS CAL-FRESH OR MEDI-CAL OR 7 8 PROOF OF THAT PROGRAM WHETHER IT'S SENDING IN THAT CARD OR WHATEVER THAT IS THEY CAN USE TO PROVE, AND IT'S CONSISTENT 9 WITH OUR PROGRAM SO WE TRIED TO KEEP THOSE CONSISTENT TO 10 SUPPORT OUR QUALIFICATION BUT WE ARE NOW LOOKING AT OPTIONS TO 11 AS I OUR THRESHOLD WHICH WOULD REOUIRE DIFFERENT KINDS OF 12 DOCUMENTATION. I AM GOING TO SKIP TO THE THIRD QUESTION. 13 BECAUSE MAYBE YOU CAN ANSWER THE SECOND ONE. COMPOUND 14 OUESTIONS ARE NOT MY SPECIALIST. (LAUGHTER) I KNOW THE THIRD 15 16 ONE WAS ABOUT OTHER EXPRESS LANES BEING IN THE REGION AND HAVING PROGRAMS. THERE IS ONE OTHER PROGRAM ON THE SAN MATEO 17 101 EXPRESS LANES RIGHT NOW WHICH TAKES A DIFFERENT APPROACH 18 TO EQUITY. THEY OFFER THE SAN MATEO RESIDENTS, ONLY, AN OPTION 19 TO EITHER HAVE \$100 OF CLIPPER VALUE OR \$100 DOLLARS OF VALUE 20 PRELOADED ON TO A FASTRAK, WE'RE LOOKING AT DIFFERENT 21 22 APPROACHES AND ARE IN CONTACT WITH ABOUT THE PROGRAM LOOKING BACK AND FORTH WITH OUR ADVISORY GROUP AND THEIR EOUITY 23 PROGRAMS ARE INTERESTING AND THEY'RE GOING TO BE MAKING IT 24

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



CHANGES ON THAT IN THE FUTURE BASED ON THEIR BOARD APPROVAL. 1 2 SO YES COORDINATING, THE SECOND QUESTION. 3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE] 4 5 BARBARA LAURENSON: THANK YOU FOR THE REFRESHER. WE'RE GOING TO 6 AT THE END OF 12 MONTHS OF GETTING DATA WE'RE DOING A FINAL 7 8 SURVEY OF ALL OF THE PART APPROVED APPLICANTS IN THE PROGRAM AND THEY'RE GOING DEEPER INTO THE QUESTION ABOUT THEIR USE OF 9 EXPRESS LANES AND THE VALUE AND SPECIFICALLY WHAT YOU ARE 10 ASKING ABOUT. 11 12 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? THANK YOU 13 FOR THE PRESENTATION. NOW ON TO ITEM 4B. SO, WE'RE DOING 14 15 COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE AND EMPOWERMENT CARE PROGRAM. JUDIS 16 SANTOS IS GOING TO PRESENT. 17 JUDIS SANTOS: GOOD AFTERNOON SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS. JUDIS 18 SANTOS, DIRECTOR WITH MTC'S ACCESSIBILITY CULTURAL EQUITY 19 OFFICE THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON 20 THE COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM CARE FOR 21 22 SHORT AND IF STAFF COULD PLEASE PULL UP THE PRESENTATION? 23 THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. MTC'S CARE FUNDING PROGRAM IS AN EVOLUTION OF MTC'S LIFELINE PROGRAM DESIGNED TO ADVANCE 24 COMMUNITY LEVEL TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES BY INVESTING IN 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PEOPLE AND PROCESSES UP FRONT TO DELIVER EOUITABLE OUTCOMES 1 THROUGH FUNDING CATEGORY 1 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT CATEGORY 2 HIGH 2 3 PRIORITY NEIGHBOR LEVEL PROJECTS OR BUDGETING CATEGORY 3 POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT THE LAST TIME STAFF PRESENTED THIS ITEM 4 5 WAS NOVEMBER 2023 FOR APPROVAL OF RESOLUTION 4604 MTC'S CARE FUNDING GUIDELINES. TODAY A FOCUS IS ON ADVANCING CATEGORY 3, 6 CYCLE 1 POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM AND UPDATE ON 7 8 CATEGORIES 1 AND 2. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. MTC'S CARE PROGRAM IS THE UMBRELLA PROGRAM THAT RECEIVED A TOTAL OF 21.5 MILLION 9 THROUGH A MIX OF FEDERAL, 33 OPINION 5 MILLION THROUGH OBAG 10 11 FUNDS IN WHICH 1.5 MILLION ARE IN LOCAL FUNDS AND STATE FUNDS 8.8 MILLION IN REAP 2.0 FUNDS PENDING APPROVAL THESE FUNDS ARE 12 PROGRAMMED THROUGH COMPETITIVE APPLICATION PROCESS THAT MUST 13 SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS 14 MTC'S COORDINATED PLAN OR OTHER LOCAL PLANNING INITIATIVES AND 15 16 MUST ADDRESS AT LEAST ONE OBJECTIVE BELOW. FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING ACCELERATE INFILL HOUSING REDUCE VEHICLE MILES 17 18 TRAVELED REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THROUGH 19 THREE FUNDING CATEGORIES WORK ISN'T JUST ABOUT IMPLEMENTING PROJECTS BUT ABOUT COMMUNITY TRANSFORMATION AT THE CENTER OF 20 WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO DO DEEPENING RELATIONSHIPS AND DEVELOP 21 22 PROCESSES PLANS AND PROJECTS WE WILL START WITH CATEGORY 3 23 BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT WHAT WE MEAN BY POWER IS ABILITY UNABLE TO DEFINE REALITY FOR YOURSELF AND OTHERS THIS CATEGORY 24 INCLUDES 1.5 MILLION IN TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND CAPACITY 25

MARCH 22, 2024

BUILDING FROM COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND LOCAL 1 GOVERNMENT WE ARE FORGING AHEAD WITH THIS CATEGORY BEING 2 3 FUNDED THROUGH LOCAL FUNDS CATEGORIES 1 AND 2 ARE ON HOLD UNTIL WE LEARN MORE ABOUT THE STATUS OF REAP 2.0 FUNDS. 4 5 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ADVANCED COMMUNITIES BASED TRANSITION PLAN CONCEPT TO FUNDABLE VIABLE PROJECTS SUCH AS ACCESS 6 7 ACCESSIBILITY ENHANCEMENTS BUS STOP IMPROVEMENTS NON-TRANSIT 8 PROJECTS SUCH AS COMPLETE STREETS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE EXAMPLES INCLUDE FEASIBILITY STUDIES PRELIMINARY ENGINEERING 9 AND DESIGN ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW AND CATEGORY 2 IS HIGH 10 11 PRIORITY NEIGHBORHOOD IMPLEMENTATION OR PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROCESS AND PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION THIS INVOLVES 12 IMPLEMENTING CPB PROCESS TO LISTENING PLANNING AND PROJECT 13 IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION THIS CATEGORY FUNDS THE PROCESS AS 14 WELL AS PROJECT UPDATE ON THE ADVANCEMENT OF THESE TWO 15 16 CATEGORIES WILL BE PROVIDED THIS SUMMER. NEXT SLIDE. CATEGORY 3 POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT SEEKS TO, ONE, GROW COMMUNITY 17 18 LEADERSHIP AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT FOSTER INCLUSIVE MULTI-SECTOR 19 COLLABORATION BETWEEN PUBLIC AGENCIES AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND ENABLE INTERSECTIONAL LEADERSHIP TO 20 21 IMPLEMENT PROJECTS IMPACTING MOBILITY AND WELL-BEING IN A 22 NUTSHELL THIS IS ABOUT INVESTING IN PEOPLE AND COMMUNITY WELL-23 BEING. PUBLIC HEALTH DATA TELLS US THAT ZIP CODE IS MORE IMPORTANT OR A BETTER DETERMINANT IN PREDICTING YOUR HEALTH 24 THAN YOUR GENETIC CODE. WHERE YOU LIVE AND WHERE YOU GREW UP 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MARCH 22, 2024

DETERMINES YOUR HEALTH OUTCOMES. THIS PROGRAM RECOGNIZES 1 COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS AND INVESTMENTS AS 2 3 A FOUNDATIONAL ELEMENT OF THRIVING HEALTHY COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, HOW WILL POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT BE 4 5 DESIGNED AND WHAT IS THE PROGRAM'S FRAMEWORK. AS ILLUSTRATED IN THE GRAPHIC, THE PROGRAM CENTERS BELONGING AND CIVIC 6 ENGAGEMENT TO VALUE EVERYONE EQUALLY AND ENGAGE EQUITABLY. 7 8 WHEN WE TALK ABOUT HEARING RESIDENT VOICES IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT WHAT PEOPLE SAY IT'S MUCH MORE THAN THAT IT'S ABOUT RESIDENT'S 9 DECISIONS BEHAVIORS AND ACTIONS AND HOW THAT CAN LEAD TO 10 SHARED VISION COLLABORATION DECISION-MAKING LEADERSHIP AND 11 MOBILIZATION WITHIN COMMUNITIES. WORKING ON THE PREMISE THAT 12 PEOPLE WHO FEEL VALUED AND CARED FOR ARE MORE LIKELY TO 13 PARTICIPATE IN POLICY DECISION MAKING AND CIVIC LIFE AND 14 PEOPLE WHO PARTICIPATE FEEL CONNECTED AND TEND TO LIVE LONGER 15 16 HAPPIER LIVES. BELONGING AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT IS THE FOUNDATION OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS POWER TO IMPLEMENT A VISION 17 THAT A FUTURE IS HEALTHY AND EOUITABLE THIS IS A REFERENCE 18 19 FROM VITAL CONDITIONS AND NEIGHBOR INVESTMENT FRAMING PROGRAM SIX ACHIEVE THROUGH INVESTING IN COMMUNITY CIVIC LEADERSHIP 20 MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS INTERSECTIONAL ACTION TO RESULT IN 21 RESILIENTS AND EQUITABLE COMMUNITIES. ON THE LEFT ARE ELEMENTS 22 23 OF THE PROGRAM BEING PILOTED, DESIGN THROUGH PARTICIPATE STRUCTURE AND PROCESS WITH THE ADDITION OF A COMMUNITY 24 ADVISORY WORKING GROUP ADVANCING CAPACITY BUILDING 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARCH 22, 2024

PARTICIPANTS AND COMMUNITY-LED ENGAGEMENT INITIATIVES TO 1 2 FULFILL KEY EQUITY STRATEGIES AND LASTLY DEVELOPING RANGE AND 3 DIFFERENT WAYS TO LEARN THROUGH DEMONSTRATED ACTION MODELS. I WILL GO THROUGH EACH OF THESE ELEMENT IN THE NEXT SLIDE IN 4 5 MORE DETAIL. FOR PARTICIPATORY GROUP STRUCTURE PROCESS PROPOSING HAVING INVOLVEMENT THROUGH PROGRAM PROJECT LIFE 6 7 CYCLE AND BEYOND OBJECTIVE BUILDING COMMUNITY FOCUSED 8 RELATIONAL ASPECTS FOR PEOPLE BUILDING NETWORKS FOR 9 TRANSACTIONAL SHARING INFORMATION AND OPPORTUNITIES TO ADDRESS INEOUITY IT IS PROPOSING NEW COMMUNITY ADVISORY WORKING GROUP 10 11 FOR POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT TO INFORM AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON THE PROGRAM'S DESIGN GOALS AND WORKING WITH MTC 12 STAFF AND COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES. THIS WILL AUGMENT 13 THE ALREADY EXISTING STRUCTURE SUPPORTING THE POLICY ADVISORY 14 15 COUNCIL EOUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE ADVISORY ROLE 16 COORDINATING WITH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WITH MTC MAKING THE FINAL DECISION-MAKING ACTION AND APPROVAL. IN 17 ADDITION, RESIDENTS, COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND 18 19 STAKEHOLDERS WILL BE INVOLVED DURING THE APPLICATION PROCESS IN IDENTIFYING CAPACITY BUILDING NEEDS AND GAPS AND AWARDEES 20 21 BOTH RECEIVING FUNDS WILL BE INVOLVED AT THE LAUNCH, 22 COMPLETION OF THE PROJECT AND AFTERWARDS BE PART OF A POWER 23 BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT COHORT OF COMMUNITY OF PRACTICE. WORKING CONCEPT FOR COMMUNITY ADVISORY WORKING GROUP FOR 24 BUILDING ENGAGEMENT IS COMPRISED OF 12 INDIVIDUALS FROM LOCAL 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS TIME LIMITED COMPENSATED 1 PARTICIPANTS OUR PARTICIPANTS ARE ELIGIBLE TO APPLY FOR 2 3 CATEGORY 3 FUNDING THERE ARE NO DECISION-MAKING OR EVALUATION RULE BECAUSE OF THE CONFLICT OF INTEREST THE ROLE IS MAINLY 4 5 INFORMING PROVIDING FEEDBACK CONSULTATION PREFERENCE WILL BE GIVEN TO COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS REPRESENTATIVES AND 6 7 SERVING EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES PROPOSED SELECTION OF 8 COMMUNITY ADVISORY WORKING GROUP AND INCLUDE A MIX OF THE POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM TWO EOUITY MEMBERS. ON 9 THE RIGHT IS POTENTIAL STRUCTURE OF THE MEETINGS. DETAILS OF 10 11 WHAT POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT WILL BE FUNDING STARTING WITH TACTIC OF CAPACITY BUILDING TO OPERATIONALIZE COMMUNITY AND 12 CIVIC LEADERSHIP KEY STRATEGY CAPACITY BUILDING IS A PROCESS 13 OF STRENGTHENING LOCAL COORDINATION LEADERSHIP KNOWLEDGE 14 SKILLS AND EXPERTISE ACCESS RESOURCES AND COMMUNITIES WITH 15 16 GOAL OF HELPING TO DEVELOP INCREASE IN ABILITY OF THAT COMMUNITY INDEPENDENTLY COMPETE FOR GRANTS IMPLEMENT PROJECTS 17 18 IN FUTURE AREAS INCLUDE EDUCATION AND AWARENESS RAISING 19 TRAINING SKILLS BUILDING COMMUNITIES ENGAGEMENT PARTNERSHIP DEVELOPMENT WORKING EXAMPLES INCLUDE HOW TO CONDUCT 20 PARTICIPATORY BUDGETS AND RESIDENT COMMUNITY PLANNING 21 22 LEADERSHIP DEVELOPING EQUITY AND KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS 23 AND COMMUNITY AGENCY READINESS PROJECTS AND PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT. NEXT SLIDE. PARTNERSHIPS IS SECOND TACTIC TO 24 OPERATIONALIZE MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS DEVELOPMENT MEANS TO 25

MARCH 22, 2024

BUILD MUTUALLY BENEFICIAL RELATIONSHIPS FOR MEANINGFUL 1 INCLUSIVE COLLABORATION INCLUDES OUTREACH EDUCATION BROAD 2 3 PARTNERSHIPS INCLUDE PUBLIC AGENCIES TRANSIT OPERATORS COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS RESIDENTS AND UNDERREPRESENTED 4 5 OVERBURDENED COMMUNITIES EXAMPLES INCLUDE HAVING MOBILITY MANAGEMENT WORKSHOPS MEANS BASED CROSS SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS 6 YOUTH OR OVERBURDENED GROUPS SAFETY AND TRANSIT TRANSPORTATION 7 8 HOUSING. NEXT SLIDE. PROJECTS IS THE LAST TACTIC OPERATIONALIZE INTERSECTIONAL ACTION MEANS FUNDING COMMUNITY 9 10 ENGAGEMENT PROJECTS LEVERAGE NEW OR EXISTING COMMUNITY GATHERING RESOURCES SITES TO IMPLEMENT MOBILITY, 11 AFFORDABILITY, SAFETY STRATEGIES, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO 12 MESSAGING, EDUCATION, ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES, LEADERSHIP 13 DEVELOPMENT, COMMUNITY ASSESSMENT, AND READINESS. WORKING 14 15 EXAMPLES INCLUDE COMMUNITY BICYCLE RIDES, WALK AUDITS, COMMUNITY ASSESSMENT, AND READINESS AUDITS, STORY TELLING 16 EFFORTS, OPEN STREETS EVENTS, OR MOBILITY SAFETY 17 DEMONSTRATIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE LAST POWER BUILDING 18 AND ENGAGEMENT ELEMENT DRAW AWARENESS THAT VARIOUS LEARNING 19 ACTION MODELS TO EXECUTE VARIOUS TACTICS WE JUST REVIEWED FOR 20 21 CAPACITY BUILDING, PARTNERSHIP PROJECTS, AND LASTLY 22 COMBINATION OF THREE. SEEKING INPUT TO OFFER SEPARATE 23 STANDALONE TRACKS TO COMPETITIVE TO APPLY FOR CAPACITY BUILDING OFFERING COMBINATION OF ALL THREE AND ACTION COHORT 24 MODEL FOR CAPACITY BUILDING HAVING A SET ASIDE DEPENDING ON 25

LEVEL OF NEED AND INTEREST PROVIDING BROADENED ACCESS TO 1 2 EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES FOR PARTNERSHIP HAVING TEARED LEVEL OF 3 FUNDING CONTINUE COLLABORATION AND LOCAL MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERS FOR PROJECT PROVIDE -- THE ANTICIPATED TIMELINE AND NEXT STEPS 4 5 DOLLARS LAUNCHING INVITATION FOR THE COG IN EARLY APRIL WITH COG OPERATIONAL IN MAY LAUNCHING PROJECTS IN JUNE WITH 6 INFORMATION SESSIONS CONDUCTED CALL FOR PROJECTS TO CLOSE AT 7 8 END OF JULY, AUGUST NOTICE OF CONDITIONAL AWARD SEPTEMBER HAVING MTC APPROVAL AND IN OCTOBER ON BOARD AND PROJECT 9 IMPLEMENTATION. STAFF PLANS TO COME BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE IN 10 THE SUMMER AND AGAIN THESE ARE ANTICIPATED TIMELINES AND NEXT 11 STEPS DEPENDING ON FEEDBACK AND WORKING WITH THIS SUBCOMMITTEE 12 AND THE COG. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THANK YOU FOR YOUR 13 ATTENTION AND CONSIDERATION OF THIS DEVELOPING POWER BUILDING 14 ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM. STAFF IS INTERESTED IN HEARING WHAT YOUR 15 16 OVERALL THOUGHTS AND FEELINGS ARE ON THE POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT APPROACH, HOW MIGHT WE CONDUCT OUTREACH TO INVITE 17 18 INDIVIDUALS TO PARTICIPATE IN THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY WORKING GROUP IS THE SUBCOMMITTEE INTERESTED WE ARE POTENTIALLY HAVING 19 TWO MEMBERS PARTICIPATING IN THE SELECTION OF THE MEMBERS AND 20 21 THEN LASTLY WHAT AREAS OF THE POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM ARE MOST INTERESTING TO YOU. SO, THANK YOU. 22

23

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

24 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANKS SO MUCH FOR YOUR
25 PRESENTATION. LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, DO YOU HAVE QUESTIONS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

MARCH 22, 2024

HOWARD WONG: HOWARD WONG. THERE ARE PLENTY OF EXAMPLES IN OUR 2 3 HISTORY ABOUT ATTEMPTS TO REVITALIZE OR EMPOWER OUR NEIGHBORHOODS AND A LOT OF THEM HAVE VERY BAD OUTCOMES IN 4 5 HISTORY. THAT'S WHAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT EARLIER, ABOUT THE REDEVELOPMENT IN SAN FRANCISCO, FOR INSTANCE WHEN MANY PEOPLE 6 WHO THOUGHT THEY KNEW BETTER, AND THAT INCLUDES PLANNERS, 7 8 PROFESSIONAL PLANNERS, ARCHITECTS, ENGINEERS, POLITICIANS, 9 THOUGHT THAT CERTAIN NEIGHBORHOODS WERE NOT DESIRABLE. SO, 10 THEY WERE ESSENTIALLY NOT JUST CHANGED, BUT DEMOLISHED AND REMOVED, BECAUSE THAT WAS GOOD FOR THE PEOPLE, THAT IT WAS --11 [INDISCERNIBLE] GAS CLUBS, MINORITY OWNED BUSINESSES, BOOK 12 STORES, BARBER SHOPS, CHURCHES, ALL THOSE THINGS WEREN'T 13 REALLY GOOD FOR THE CITY SO THEY JUST REMOVED THEM AND BUILD 14 15 MODERN THINGS, AND THEN THOSE MODERN BUILDINGS, ELIMINATING 16 THE CHARACTER SCALE NEIGHBORHOODS STARTED TO FAIL. SO MORE 17 PROJECTS WERE INTRODUCED TO EMPOWER THE COMMUNITY, AND THEY FAILED. AND, SO, IN FILLMORE, THEY BUILT A NEW HERITAGE JAZZ 18 CENTER WHICH HASN'T DONE WELL, THEY PUT MONEY INTO STREET 19 IMPROVEMENTS, THAT DIDN'T DO VERY WELL. WHAT HAS WORKED OVER 20 21 THE YEARS HAS BEEN HOLE PEOPLE WHO WERE EMPOWERED GRASSROOTS, WHO HAD A SENSE OF WHAT THEY WANTED, IT WASN'T TOP DOWN, IT 22 WAS KIND OF GRASSROOTS, AND I THINK THERE ARE ELEMENTS IN THIS 23 PROGRAM TO DO THAT. BUT I'M ALWAYS WARY WHEN A PROGRAM HAS 24 25 LANGUAGE THAT'S KIND OF WRITTEN BY, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE AND

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

UNIVERSITIES, PSYCHOLOGISTS, YOU KNOW, LIKE CAPACITY BUILDING, 1 THINGS LIKE THAT, THAT SOUND A LITTLE BIT INSTITUTIONALIZED, 2 3 THAT I THINK YOU NEED TO RELOOK AT YOUR PROGRAM AND PUT IT INTO MUCH MORE SIMPLER LANGUAGE, ENGLISH, AND MUCH MORE 4 5 PICTORIAL, MUCH MORE GRAPHIC, THAT IT DOESN'T SOUND LIKE A DISSERTATION, BUT WHAT REAL PEOPLE WOULD WANT. SO, I THINK 6 THERE ARE ELEMENTS IN HERE THAT I LIKE, BUT, ALSO, THERE ARE A 7 8 LOT OF EXISTING RESOURCES THAT COULD HELP IF THEY ARE REALLY CREATIVE AND ENLIGHTENED. GOOD PLANNING PROFESSIONALS. GOOD 9 DESIGN PROFESSIONALS. PEOPLE WHO REALLY WANT TO CREATE REAL 10 SPACE, REAL, YOU KNOW, NEIGHBORHOOD ACCORDS, NEIGHBOR HOOD 11 CIRCULATION SPINES, NEIGHBORHOOD REVITALIZATION THAT REALLY 12 BRING PEOPLE IN FROM THE GROUND UP. WE HAVE SEEN EXAMPLES OF 13 WHERE THAT WORKS. WE HAVE ALSO SEEN, AS I MENTIONED, MANY, 14 15 MANY THINGS DONE OVER DECADES THAT HAVE FAILED, BECAUSE 16 SOMEONE THOUGHT, THIS IS WHAT WE SHOULD SOMEWHAT IMPOSE, THAT IT HAS TO BE GROWN FROM THE GROUND UP, AND IT HAS TO BE DONE 17 BY REALLY GENUINE PEOPLE OF THE NEIGHBORHOOD, BY THE 18 NEIGHBORHOOD AND FOR THE NEIGHBORHOOD. THANK YOU 19 20 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: PAM? 21 22

23 PAMELA CAMPOS: THANK YOU JUDIS. WAS THIS A REALLY GREAT
24 APPROXIMATE INSPIRING ITEM THAT WE GOT TO SEE. I SAN REALLY
25 WANT TO EMPHASIZE WHAT YOU SAID ABOUT PEOPLE WHO FEEL VALUED

MARCH 22, 2024

AND CARED FOR. CARED FOR ARE MORE LIKELY TO PARTICIPATE. I 1 DON'T THINK WE GET ENOUGH OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR GOVERNMENT 2 LEANING INTO THAT. AND, SO, I AM, FIRST AND FOREMOST, EXCITED 3 ABOUT THIS FUNDING OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY MEET THAT NEED, 4 5 BECAUSE OUR COMMUNITY NEEDS FUNDING LIKE THIS. I THINK PART OF THE DISTRUST IN GOVERNMENT COMES WHEN FOLKS DON'T SEE 6 THEMSELVES EYE TO EYE WITH OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS, ESPECIALLY 7 8 WHEN THEIR LIVES START TO LOOK LESS LIKE OURS WHEN WE DON'T SEE THEM RIDING TRANSIT WHEN WE DON'T SEE THEM LIVING ON TIGHT 9 BUDGETS LIKE WE ARE. SO MORE OPPORTUNITIES LIKE THIS WHEN WE 10 GET TO LEAN INTO COMMUNITY POWER, YOU KNOW, REALLY, LIKE, 11 NEIGHBORHOOD LEADERS, THAT IS MOVING US IN THE RIGHT 12 DIRECTION, I BELIEVE. AND ESPECIALLY GIVEN OUR HISTORY WITH 13 THE REDEVELOPMENT AGENCIES THAT MAY OR MAY NOT HAVE 14 15 APPROPRIATELY USED FUNDS AND LAND USE POLICY TO SUPPORT THE 16 BETTERMENT OF ALL COMMUNITIES, AND JUST A FEW SPECIAL INTEREST COMMUNITIES, I THINK THAT THAT'S WHAT -- IT APPEARS TO ME THAT 17 THIS IS WHAT IS TRYING TO LOOK DIFFERENT FROM THAT APPROACH. I 18 REALLY LEAN INTO, WHEN SAN JOSE HAD A STRONG NEIGHBORHOODS 19 INITIATIVE, AND WE WERE ABLE TO GROW A LOT OF REALLY STRONG 20 21 COMMUNITY LEADERS, INCLUDING FORMER CHAIR KINMAN FROM THAT PROGRAM. AND, SO, OPPORTUNITIES LIKE THIS, I -- I WANT TO KNOW 22 WHAT WE CAN DO TO SUPPORT THE ONGOING IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS 23 CARE PROGRAM. WHAT CAN WE DO TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS STAYS 24 FUNDED AND GETS MORE FUNDING? THAT WAS A QUESTION. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARCH 22, 2024

JUDIS SANTOS: SO, I THINK THE FIRST STEP IS CONSIDERING THE 2 3 PROPOSAL OF HAVING SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS INVOLVED IN THE SELECTION OF THE COGS. SO, THAT'S ONE WAY TO KEEP THIS WORK 4 5 MOVING FORWARD. AND THEN, SECONDLY, THE -- TO GET THIS PROGRAM FUNDED AND CONTINUING, THERE IS FUNDING BEING SET ASIDE 6 THROUGH OBAG FUNDS, AS WELL, THERE ARE FUNDS IN REAP 2.0. REAP 7 8 2.0, RIGHT NOW IS IN QUESTION. AND WE'LL LEARN MORE ABOUT THE STATUS OF THOSE FUNDS IN THE SUMMER. BUT OBAG HAS -- THIS IS 9 AN INAUGURAL PROGRAM. SO OBAG HAS COMMITTED FUNDS FOR THIS 10 CYCLE FOR CARE. 11

12

1

PAMELA CAMPOS: THANK YOU. I HAD ANOTHER QUESTION ABOUT THE 13 COHORT MODEL. HOW OFTEN IS THE COHORT MEETING? AND IS THERE A 14 15 PLAN FOR CONTINUING CONTACT AFTER THE COHORT TIME ENDS? I HAVE 16 PARTICIPATED IN MANY COHORTS MYSELF AND I FIND THAT WHEN YOU'RE IN THAT COHORT SPACE AND MODEL, THERE IS A BOND THAT 17 ALMOST CAN'T BE BROKEN. AND SO LEADING INTO THAT, IS THERE A 18 PLAN FOR MAKING SURE THAT EVEN IF PEOPLE RETIRE, CHANGE JOBS, 19 OR LEAVE THE AREA, THAT THERE ARE STILL GOING TO BE A GROUP OF 20 21 PEOPLE WHO HAVE THIS KNOWLEDGE AND ARE CONTINUING TO SEE IT 22 THROUGH?

23

JUDIS SANTOS: SO THE CURRENT CONCEPT IS THAT THOSE THAT WILL
BE RECEIVING THE AWARDS OR FUNDS WILL BE INVOLVED IN THE VERY

MARCH 22, 2024

BEGINNING, DURING LAUNCH, AND DURING THE EVALUATION OF THE 1 LEARNING PERIOD AS WELL AS AFTER THE PROJECT IS COMPLETE, THAT 2 3 GROUP OF INDIVIDUALS WILL FORM A POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT COMMITTEE OF PRACTICE, WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE AND HOW OFTEN THEY 4 5 WILL MEET, THOSE DETAILS NEED TO BE FLUSHED OUT THROUGH THE COG AND THROUGH THE COMMITTEE. THAT'S ONE REASON WE INTEGRATED 6 A COHORT LEARNING APPROACH SO IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT COMPLETING 7 8 YOUR PROJECT IT'S BUILDING COMMUNITIES OF PRACTICE, BUILDING NETWORKS, AS WELL AS STRENGTHENING BELONGING CIVIC ENGAGEMENT. 9 10

**PAMELA CAMPOS:** I AGREE 100%. BECAUSE I FEEL OPPORTUNITIES LIKE 11 THIS ARE SO VALUABLE AND IT FAR EXCEEDS JUST ONE PERSON AND 12 IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY AND GREAT IDEA FOR PEOPLE TO BE PLANTED, 13 FLOURISH, AND PEOPLE COME AND GO SO WE NEED TO UTILIZE OUR 14 15 GROUP KNOWLEDGE TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LAYING DOWN THE FOUNDATION 16 FOR BEST PRACTICES TO CONTINUE EVEN AS FOLKS CYCLE IN AND OUT 17 AS WE DO, ESPECIALLY BECAUSE SOMETIMES SOLUTIONS THAT 18 COMMUNITY MEMBERS COME UP WITH, AREN'T GOING TO COST TENS OF THOUSANDS OF DOLLARS. THERE ARE FIXES THAT IT JUST TAKES A 19 COUPLE OF VERY MOTIVATED AND PASSIONATE PEOPLE TO MAKE A 20 21 DIFFERENCE IN THE VIBRANCY OF OUR COMMUNITY. TWO EXAMPLES I CAN THINK OF ARE BIKE BUSES IF WE CAN GET A COMMUNITY LEADER 22 TO START UP A BIKE BUS SO THAT STUDENTS CAN RIDE IN GROUPS TO 23 THEIR SCHOOLS. THERE IS ALSO, LIKE, THE LITTLE LIBRARY 24 CONCEPT. I HAVE SEEN COMMUNITIES WHERE THEY HAVE LITTLE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARCH 22, 2024

NEIGHBORHOOD FARM TO TABLE BOXES WHERE NEIGHBORS WHO HAVE IN 1 EXCESS PRODUCE THAT THEY GROW IN THEIR GARDENS CAN HAVE SPACE 2 3 FOR OTHER NEIGHBORS TO BENEFIT FROM THE FRUITS OF THEIR LABOR. THINGS LIKE THAT CAN BE REVOLUTIONARY AT A LOW-COST. SO, I 4 5 THINK MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE SPACE TO SEE THOSE IDEAS, NOT JUST MAKE AN IMPACT IN ONE NEIGHBORHOOD, BUT SPREAD AND GROW 6 THE GREATNESS INTO OTHER COMMUNITIES, I THINK IS GOING TO BE 7 8 AN ESSENTIAL PART OF THE LONGEVITY OF THIS PROGRAM. AND TO THE EXTENT THAT WE CAN NOT KEEP THESE CONVERSATIONS LIMITED TO 9 JUST LIKE A GROUP OF PEOPLE IN A MEETING SPACE, BUT IF THERE 10 IS, LIKE, AN E-MAIL GROUP, OR, LIKE A -- I DON'T KNOW, 11 FACEBOOK GROUP, LIKE, THINGS LIKE THAT WHERE IT CAN CONTINUE 12 TO GROW AND BUILD AND FAR EXCEED THE GREAT SEEDS THAT WE HAVE 13 PLANTED, BUT REALLY ALLOW THIS PROGRAM TO FLOURISH TO ITS 14 LIMITLESS CAPACITY BECAUSE I FEEL THAT EVERY INDIVIDUAL IS 15 LIMITLESS IN THE POSSIBILITIES WE CAN ACHIEVE. SO, THANK YOU, 16 AGAIN, FOR THIS REALLY, REALLY GREAT PROGRAM. IMPORTANT ITEM. 17 I COMPLETELY AGREE THAT HAVING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PARTICIPATE 18 IN THE SELECTION PROCESS, I'M ALL FOR THAT. I HOPE THAT'S 19 SOMETHING WE CAN DO. AND REGARDING COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT TO THE 20 COMMUNITY ADVISORY WORKING GROUP, I THINK IT'S JUST REALLY 21 LEANING INTO COMMUNITY PARTNERS WHO KNOW THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS 22 BEST AND ALLOWING SPACE FOR FOLKS TO COME IN. AND, YEAH, I'M 23 JUST LOOKING FORWARD TO LEARNING MORE ABOUT THE OUTCOMES OF 24 25 THIS PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

1

MARCH 22, 2024

TERRY SCOTT: YES. THANK YOU. I WAS GOING TO SUGGEST IN TERMS 2 3 OF WORKING WITH GROUPS IN VARIOUS COMMUNITIES, ONE GROUP, ONE GROUP IN MY COMMUNITY THAT I WORK WITH CLOSELY IS FAIR 4 5 HOUSING. AND IT'S A LITTLE ASIDE FROM TRANSPORTATION AS A SUBJECT. BUT THESE ARE -- THIS PARTICULAR ORGANIZATION HAS 6 BEEN THERE MANY YEARS. IT HAS A FULL-TIME STAFF. IT HAS AN 7 8 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, AND THEY WORK WITH THE PEOPLE IN THE COMMUNITY THAT NEED THEIR ASSISTANCE. AND WE'RE -- IN MY RURAL 9 COMMUNITY, WE HAVE 30,000 CARS A DAY COMMUTING INTO OUR 10 COMMUNITY AND OUT. AND THE REASON THEY'RE DOING SO IS THEY 11 CAN'T AFFORD HOUSING. THE HOUSING DOESN'T EXIST, AND WE'RE A 12 VERY SMALL COUNTY IN TERMS OF POPULATION. WE ONLY HAVE 137,000 13 RESIDENTS, WHICH IS SMALLER THAN MANY OF THE CITIES IN THE 14 15 OTHER COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA. BUT, THE PEOPLE WHO WORK 16 PARTICULARLY IN THE HOSPITALITY INDUSTRIES, AND THERE ARE A 17 LOT OF THEM, WINERIES, BOUTIQUE RESTAURANTS ET CETERA HOTELS, IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO FIND ADEOUATE LOCAL HOUSING THAT'S 18 AFFORDABLE TO THEM, AND THAT ORGANIZATION I KNOW WOULD LOVE TO 19 WORK WITH A REGIONAL GROUP. THEIR FUNDING COMES FROM VARIOUS 20 21 SOURCES. MUCH OF IT COMES FROM HUD, THE FEDERAL PROGRAM. BUT IT WOULD BE VERY ADVANTAGEOUS FOR BOTH THE REGIONAL GROUP AND 22 FOR THEM TO WORK TOGETHER. AND THEY ALSO WORK WITH TOWN AND 23 GOVERNMENT AND THE CITY OF GOVERNMENTS, AS WELL. BUT PRIMARILY 24 IT JUST SEEMS LIKE A PERFECT MATCH. AND I WOULD RECOMMEND, IF 25



YOU WANT ANY INFORMATION AND CONTACT THERE, I CAN CERTAINLY
 PROVIDE THAT. THANK YOU.
 3

4 SPEAKER: I WANT TO COMMENT. I AGREE WITH PAMELA.

5

V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: I -- IS THAT ME? SORRY. I AGREE WITH 6 PAMELA. YOU KNOW, I HAVE PARTICIPATED IN COHORTS BEFORE. AND I 7 8 REMEMBER BEING VERY EXCITED, IN THE BEGINNING. BUT THEN ONCE I REALIZED THAT THE PERSON LEADING THE COHORT WAS NOT REALLY 9 10 DIRECTLY PART OF THE COMMUNITY, MY ENGAGEMENT KIND OF DECREASED. SO, I HOPE THIS PROGRAM IS GOING TO BE WELCOMING 11 AND ALL PARTIES ARE INVOLVED, EVEN YOU. SO WE'RE MOVING INTO A 12 NEW ERA. A LOT OF PEOPLE WANT TO GO BACK TO HOW IT USED TO BE, 13 YOU KNOW, BEING VERY ACTIVE IN YOUR COMMUNITY AND BEING THE 14 15 ONE WHO, INSTEAD OF YOU POINTING AND SAYING THIS PERSON SHOULD 16 DO THIS, YOU'RE ACTUALLY BEING INVOLVED, AND WHEN YOU HAVE IT SET UP THIS WAY WHERE THERE IS KIND OF A -- I DON'T WANT TO 17 SAY A SELECTION PROCESS, BUT WHEN YOU ARE INCLUDED, YOU KNOW 18 THAT YOU HAVE SOME TYPE OF RESPONSIBILITY. I THINK THAT'S WHEN 19 YOU ARE GOING TO FIND THE BEST TYPE OF ENGAGEMENT. SO, THANK 20 21 YOU. THAT'S ALL THE COMMENTS, CHAIR FITZGERALD.

22

23 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU, SIR. CLERK, DO YOU
24 HAVE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE COMMUNITY RECEIVED LAST NIGHT BY
25 5:00 P.M.?

1

MARCH 22, 2024

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT
WISH TO SPEAK. WARREN CUSHMAN IN ZOOM, AND ADINA LEVIN IN THE
BOARDROOM. GO AHEAD AND KICK IT OFF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

ADINA LEVIN: HELLO. SO, ADINA LEVIN, MEMBER OF POLICY ADVISORY 7 8 COUNCIL SPEAKING FOR MYSELF. AND WANTED TO ASK A QUESTION IN FRONT OF THE BODY THAT I ALSO ASKED TO JUDIS IN THE HALLWAY, 9 WHICH IS, IN TERMS OF THE THIRD CATEGORY AND WHAT WOULD 10 QUALIFY FOR IT, I JUST WANTED TO CONFIRM THAT THERE WAS 11 SOMETHING THAT WAS IN THE PREVIOUS DESCRIPTION THAT IS STILL 12 INCLUDED AND TALK ABOUT WHY I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. SO, THIS 13 IS EVOLVING OUT OF A PROGRAM THAT SUPPORTED COMMUNITY MEMBERS 14 15 PARTICIPATING IN A COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS, WHICH 16 ARE VERY IMPORTANT AND THE PREVIOUS DESCRIPTION ALSO TALKED ABOUT THE POTENTIAL TO APPLY TO REGIONAL INITIATIVES, OR EVEN 17 STATEWIDE INITIATIVES, AND I'LL GIVE A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES 18 ABOUT WHY THAT IS GOOD AND IMPORTANT TO CONTINUE TO HAVE IN. 19 SO, IT WAS REALLY STRIKING TO ME THAT I READ THE BAYVIEW-20 21 HUNTERS POINT COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN, AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT CAME OUT OF THE TOP PRIORITY FOR COMMUNITY 22 MEMBERS WAS ACCESS TO REGIONAL TRANSIT TO BART AND TO 23 CALTRAIN. BUT THE CBTP WAS BEING MANAGED BY THE CITY AND SFMTA 24 WHO HAD NO ABILITY TO DELIVER THINGS THAT WERE HIGH PRIORITY 25

MARCH 22, 2024

FOR COMMUNITY MEMBERS IN OUR COMMUNITY BUT IT WAS A DIFFERENT 1 AGENCY SO THEY COULDN'T DO IT. SO BY ENABLING COMMUNITY 2 3 MEMBERS TO ENGAGE IN THINGS LIKE CONNECT NETWORK PLAN TRANSIT 2050 AND BEING ABLE TO GROUND TRUTH THOSE PLANS FOR HOW THEY 4 5 WORK FOR THE LOCAL COMMUNITY AND PERTAINING TO THAT REGIONAL THERE'S EVEN STATEWIDE TASK FORCE ABOUT TRANSIT FUNDING AND 6 POLICIES THAT PEOPLE DON'T EVEN KNOW THAT'S GOING ON AT ALL SO 7 8 BEING ABLE TO CONNECT LOCAL GROUPS TO THESE POLICIES THAT AFFECT THEIR LOCAL, IT WOULD BE GREAT TO BE ABLE TO BE A PART 9 OF THIS. THE THANK YOU. 10 11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS WARREN CUSHMAN. YOU HAVE TWO 12 MINUTES. I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU A WARNING AT 15 SECONDS. 13 14 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES WE CAN. 17 18 SPEAKER: OKAY. HELLO CHAIR FITZGERALD AND EVERYONE ON THE 19 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. I WANT TO, FIRST OF ALL, SAY 20 THAT I'M PLEASED WITH THIS EFFORT THAT MTC IS MOVING FORWARD. 21 22 I SEE A LOT OF POTENTIAL FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IN THIS 23 SPACE. I'M VERY INTERESTED IN FUTURE DIALOGUE WITH THE MTC AROUND THIS. CAPACITY BUILDING IS SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE WITH 24 DISABILITIES REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON. WE ARE A DIVERSE 25

MARCH 22, 2024

POPULATION THAT EXISTS IN MANY DIFFERENT WAYS, WITH MANY 1 DIFFERENT ORGANIZATIONS. AND MANY DIFFERENT DISABILITY TYPES. 2 3 WHAT WE REALLY NEED IS SOME CAPACITY BUILDING AND SOME BRINGING TOGETHER AND ORGANIZING OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES 4 5 IN THE TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING ARENAS. THIS IS A WONDERFUL OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO. I'M EXCITED TO DO THIS. I WOULD LOVE TO 6 BE INVOLVED WITH THE COG AND/OR AT LEAST BE INVOLVED WITH THE 7 8 PROCESSES THAT MOVES FORWARD. I SEE A LOT OF POTENTIAL HERE. AND IT'S VITAL THAT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES BE A PART OF THIS 9 PROCESS. THANK YOU. 10 11

12 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU WARREN. ANYBODY ELSE? 13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO. WARREN WAS THE LAST ONE.

15

16 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, MA'AM. ON
17 TO FOUR C. NEW BUSINESS.

18

19 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: JUST WANTED TO MENTION, HOWARD WONG
20 HAD ONE MORE COMMENT.

21

22 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: OKAY HOWARD.

23

24 HOWARD WONG: ADINA MENTIONED BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT. AND

25 INTERESTINGLY SFMTA IS ABOUT TO INSTITUTE IN BAYVIEW-HUNTERS

MARCH 22, 2024

POINT A COMMUNITY BUS SHUTTLE. IT'S A FEDERAL GRANT. I THINK 1 THERE WERE -- I CAN'T RECALL WHAT THE ORIGIN WAS, BUT THERE 2 3 WERE COMMUNITY MEETINGS ABOUT WHAT THE NEIGHBORHOOD NEEDED, WHICH BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT IS UNDERSERVED LOW-INCOME 4 5 NEIGHBORHOOD IN THE SOUTHEAST CORNER OF SAN FRANCISCO. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THEY WANTED WAS MORE TRANSIT WITHIN THEIR 6 COMMUNITY AND THROUGH THIS GRANT, I THINK THEY'RE ACTUALLY 7 8 GOING TO START, I THINK IT'S THIS YEAR, A SHUTTLE BUS THAT'S CONSIDERED NOT ONLY A LAST MILE CONNECTOR TO OTHER TRANSIT 9 10 HUBS, BUT I THINK IT'S ACTUALLY GOING TO BE DOOR-TO-DOOR SERVICE. SO, THERE IS AN EXAMPLE OF A NEIGHBORHOOD ENGAGEMENT 11 PROCESS FOR TRANSIT, AND A RESULT THAT IS -- THAT LOOKS LIKE 12 IT'S GOING TO BE VERY BENEFICIAL. 13 14 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: OKAY. THANK YOU HOWARD. NOW ON TO 15 16 NEW BUSINESS. NO TAKERS. OKAY. 17 V. CHAIR, JOHNNY PARKER: HOWARD WONG. 18

19

20 HOWARD WONG: YEP.

21

22 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: OKAY.

23

24 HOWARD WONG: THERE WAS SOMETHING I READ IN THE NEWS THAT'S25 KIND OF DEMONSTRATES HOW GOVERNMENT AGENCIES CAN HAVE A

MARCH 22, 2024

TREMENDOUS BENEFIT TO MANY PEOPLE. THE DEPARTMENT OF 1 TRANSPORTATION SECRETARY BUTTIGIEG HAS ANNOUNCED THAT HE IS 2 3 AUGMENTING AN EXISTING FEDERAL LAW AND CREATING AN EXPANSION OF ACCESS FOR WHEELCHAIR USERS TO ALL AIRLINES, AND WHAT THIS 4 5 PROGRAM DOES IT ACTUALLY STATES, PROVIDES GUIDELINES, RULES, ACCESS FOR SOMETHING, LIKE, 5.5 MILLION AMERICANS IN 6 WHEELCHAIRS, ACCESS AIRLINES AND AS THEY SAID, WITH DIGNITIES. 7 8 THERE ARE AUTOMATIC PENALTIES TO AIRLINES THAT DO NOT PROVIDE WHEELCHAIR ACCESS AND STORAGE OF WHEELCHAIRS AND MANY, MANY 9 OTHER. THERE' AN EXAMPLE OF HOW PUBLIC AGENCIES HOW BY RULE 10 CHANGES CAN HELP A LOT OF PEOPLE. 11

12

13 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU, SIR. I ALSO WOULD LIKE
14 TO ADD, TOO, THAT JUST REALLY QUICKLY, THERE IS A MOVEMENT TO
15 MAKE IT POSSIBLE FOR THOSE OF US WHO USE CHAIRS TO USE OUR
16 CHAIRS WITHIN AIRPLANES. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
17 COMMENTS. HOWARD, THAT'S GREAT. ANYBODY ELSE? OKAY. ON TO
18 FIVE. ITEM --

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THAT ITEM. THERE 21 IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE --

22

23 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I'M SORRY.

## MARCH 22, 2024

CLERK OF THE BOARD: IT'S OKAY. YEP. WE'RE ALMOST THERE. THERE 1 IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. NO ONE IN 2 3 THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND WARREN C DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT? 4 5 WARREN? DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK UNDER THIS ITEM OR PUBLIC 6 COMMENT? 7 8 SPEAKER: I WANT TO ROLAND FOR BRINGING THIS UP, FOR PEOPLE IN WHEELCHAIRS WE FOUGHT REALLY HARD FOR THE INDEPENDENT LIVING 9 COMMUNITY FOR THIS IT GOES ALL THE WAY TO THE FEDERAL LEVEL 10 WITH NATIONAL INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTERS AND IT'S A HUGE 11 VICTORY FOR US. 12

13

14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU MEMBER WONG. THAT WAS THE ONLY15 PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER BUSINESS FOR
18 THE COMMUNITY? ANY ITEMS THAT FOLKS WANT TO COMMENT FROM THE
19 COMMUNITY?

20

21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. WARREN CUSHMAN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE 22 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. I'LL GIVE YOU A 15 SECOND 23 WARNING.

## MARCH 22, 2024

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. ACTUALLY, IT WAS REALLY A OUESTION. ISN'T 1 2 IT TRUE THAT WE GET AN UPDATE FROM DRENNEN SHELTON ON THE 3 TRANSIT PIECE? I WAS HOPING TO HEAR THAT TODAY. I'M JUST WONDERING WHAT'S GOING ON WITH OUR PARATRANSIT PIECE OF THE 4 5 PARATRANSIT PLAN. THANK YOU. 6 7 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THAT, I BELIEVE, IS COMING UP IN 8 THE NEXT ONE. BUT WE'LL HAVE TO CIRCLE BACK ON THIS ONE. 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THIS'S CORRECT. IT WILL BE PRESENTED AT 10 THE NEXT EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING. 11 12 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: PERFECT. ANYBODY ELSE? 13 14 15 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ADINA LEVIN. 16 ADINA LEVIN: YEAH. SPEAKING TO THAT. THERE IS A ROBUST UPDATE 17 ABOUT THE ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION 18 PLAN AT THE MONDAY REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL 19 MEETING. THAT IS A PUBLIC MEETING AND ANYBODY CAN ACCESS IT BY 20 ZOOM OR IN-PERSON. SO THAT'S WHERE THERE WILL BE SOME UPDATES 21 22 NEXT, ON MONDAY. THANK YOU. 23 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: ALL RIGHT. NO OTHER TAKERS? GOING 24 ONCE --25



1
2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOPE.
3
4 CHAIR, CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: -- GOING TWICE. OKAY. WE'RE ON TO
5 ADJOURNMENT. LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
6 YOUR PARTICIPATION, COMMENTS AND DEDICATION TO THIS COMMITTEE.
7 WE'RE ADJOURNED FOR TODAY. [ADJOURNED]
8

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

