



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 20<sup>TH</sup>, 2023, 9:35 AM**

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M GOING TO  
5 ASK IF WE MAY START. ALL RIGHT. WE ARE IN A DIFFERENT ROOM SO  
6 WE'RE A LITTLE BIT OUT OF SYNC OR WE'RE GOING TO GET BACK ON  
7 TRACK. AND I HOPE EVERYONE IS ENJOYING THE RAIN. IT DEFINITELY  
8 MADE FOR A DIFFERENT DRIVING IN EXPERIENCE. IT IS. ALL RIGHT.  
9 GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR OF  
10 THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ALONG WITH NICK  
11 JOSEFOWITZ, OUR VICE CHAIR. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCASTED AS  
12 WE NORMALLY DO FOR TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES, YOU ALREADY KNOW  
13 WHAT TO DO IF YOU WISH TO PARTICIPATE. BUT I WILL SAY ALONG  
14 WITH ANTICIPATION, ENJOY THE HOLIDAY SEASON. WE ARE REMINDED  
15 THAT THE CYCLE OF LIFE CONTINUES. WE WILL ADJOURN TODAY'S  
16 MEETING IN MEMORY OF THE BAY AREA NEWS COLUMNIST MR. ROADSHOW.  
17 SADLY GARY'S LIFE CAME TO AN END THIS PAST WEEKEND. OVER THE  
18 COURSE OF HIS MORE THAN 30 YEARS AS MR. ROADSHOW, GARY WAS  
19 HONORED WITH MTC TRANSPORTATION AWARD, THE FIRST IN 1994. I  
20 WON'T TELL YOU HOW OLD COMMISSIONER WAS BACK THEN. FOR 30  
21 YEARS, GARY HELPED PUBLIC OFFICIALS LIKE US REMIND US WHO WE  
22 WORK FOR AND WHY WE DO IT. SO AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO  
23 PROCEED TO ITEM ONE. ROLL CALL, PLEASE. BEFORE WE DO THAT,  
24 BECAUSE I KNOW OUR CLERK WAS WORKING ON CLOSING THE DOOR SO WE  
25 CAN PROBABLY HAVE THE RIGHT ACOUSTICS. I KNOW WE DO HAVE SOME



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 COMMISSIONERS THAT MIGHT HAVE TO READ SOME DISCLOSURES AND I'M  
2 HELPING THEM BUY TIME. IF WE CAN PLEASE DO ROLL CALL.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** GOOD MORNING. CHAIR PEDROZA. VICE CHAIR  
5 JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HE'S IN THE BUILDING.

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. COMMISSIONER AHN.  
10 COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

11

12 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** DO I NEED TO SAY WHERE I AM FROM 100 SANTA  
13 ROSA AVENUE, SANTA ROSA, CALIFORNIA.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER. -- COMMISSIONER  
16 GIACOPINI. COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY IS  
17 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER NOACK.  
18 COMMISSIONER PAPAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

19

20 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

21

22 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER SCHAAF IS ABSENT.  
23 COMMISSIONER SPERING. COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS  
24 PRESENT.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE DO HAVE NO PARTICIPATION UNDER JUST  
2 CAUSE FOR COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND COMMISSIONER RONEN.  
3 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY BECAUSE  
6 OF A CONTAGIOUS ILLNESS, COVID. THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE  
7 ROOM OVER 18. AND THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER  
10 CHAVEZ.

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** RHYME' WISHING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY BECAUSE  
13 I DISLOCATED MY KNEECAP AND CAN'T WALK RIGHT NOW. THERE'S NO  
14 ONE ELSE PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER 18.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. UNFORTUNATE TO HEAR BOTH OF  
17 THAT BUT THANK YOU, BOTH, FOR BEING PRESENT. SO YOUR REQUEST  
18 IS NOTED AND WE'RE ADDING COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND RONEN FOR  
19 THIS MEETING. COMMISSIONER PAPAN IS HERE. ITEM TWO. PLEDGE OF  
20 ALLEGIANCE. I PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED  
21 STATES OF AMERICA AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE  
22 NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, FOR LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR  
23 ALL.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** EACH MEMBER WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER  
2 MEETING ATTENDANCE UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500. EACH MEETING IS  
3 ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM FOUR.  
6 A BIT OF REPORTS. FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE COMMISSION AND  
7 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, I'D LIKE TO SHARE A FEW REMARKS ABOUT  
8 THE ONGOING NEXTGEN RATION BARRIER FREEWAYS STUDIES,  
9 ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF THE RECENT PRESS COVERAGE. NEXTGEN  
10 RATION FREEWAYS IS AN EARLY STAGE PLANNING STUDY THAT IS  
11 EXPLORING THE POTENTIAL OF ROAD CONGESTION TO ADVANCE  
12 MOBILITY, CLIMATE, AND EQUITY GOALS, ALL GOALS THAT WE TALKED  
13 ABOUT AS A COMMISSION. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT IS CENTRAL TO WORK AT  
14 MTC AND WE WANT TO HEAR FROM THE MANY VOICES THROUGHOUT THE  
15 NINE BAY AREA REGION AS WE MAKE CHALLENGING DECISION ABOUT THE  
16 BAY'S FUTURE. WE HAVE A FUTURE OF OUR FREEWAY NETWORK,  
17 SIMULTANEOUS WORKING TO MANAGE CONGESTION, REINVEST IN TRANSIT  
18 ALTERNATIVES AND OTHER COMMUNITY PRIORITIES AND REDUCE CLIMATE  
19 EMISSIONS. THAT'S WHY WE'RE DOING THIS STUDY. SO THIS HAS BEEN  
20 DISCUSSED. WE TALKED ABOUT IT. SO I JUST APPRECIATE THE PUBLIC  
21 FOR YOUR ENGAGEMENT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO MEETING YOU IN YOUR  
22 COMMUNITY TO GATHER MORE FEEDBACK. AT THIS POINT, WAS THERE  
23 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED OUT WITH THIS REPORT, KIMBERLY?  
24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I HAVE NO ONE IN PUBLIC AND NO ONE WITH  
2 THE HAND RAISED.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THIS RESOLUTION, BECAUSE WE DON'T LIKE  
5 DOING RESOLUTIONS WHEN PEOPLE RETIRE AND LEAVE US BUT CAROL  
6 KUESTER ON THE OCCASION OF HER RETIREMENT FROM MTC. I BELIEVE  
7 SHE'S HERE. SO I AM GOING TO READ SOME WONDERFUL THINGS AND  
8 WE'LL GIVE YOU A NICE PROCLAMATION, CAROL. CAROL IS RETIRING  
9 AS DIRECTOR OF ELECTRONICS AFTER MORE THAN 25 YEARS OF SERVICE  
10 TO THE COMMISSION. WE DON'T HAVE THE TIME TO TALK ABOUT HER  
11 TIME AS INTERN IN THE EARLY 1990'S. COMMISSIONER SPERING WAS  
12 HERE AT THAT TIME, THOUGH. I DO WANT TO SHARE A FEW PASSAGES.  
13 WHEREAS RECOGNIZING THERE'S NO PLACE LIKE HOME, CAROL RETURNED  
14 TO MTC AFTER SOME TIME WORKING IN GERMANY TO PROVIDE A  
15 DIRECTION -- TO PROVIDE DIRECTION FOR OPERATIONS LIKE 511.  
16 WHEREAS, HAVING DEMONSTRATED OUTSTANDING -- PILOT -- DIFFERENT  
17 TEAMS OF PLANNERS, ENGINEERS, WEB DESIGNERS, COMMUNICATORS AS  
18 WELL AS WORK THE INTERPLAY OF TEAM MEMBERS' RESPONSIBILITY,  
19 CAROL IN 2014 WAS NAMED MTC'S FIRST-EVER DIRECTOR OF  
20 ELECTRONIC PAYMENTS. WHERE SHE GUIDED A STAFF OF MORE THAN  
21 THREE DOZEN TO DELIVER NEW TECHNICAL PROGRAMS SUCH AS MOBILE  
22 CLIPPER CARD, TO COORDINATE, EXPAND, ADAPT, IMPROVE THE MYRIAD  
23 OF OPERATIONAL INITIATIVES. WHEREAS, IN ADDITION TO THE  
24 DIRECTOR, CAROL SERVED AS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE BOARD,  
25 WHICH WE TALK ABOUT. SHE NOT ONLY REPORTED TO GENERAL MANAGER



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OF THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AREA AGENCIES BUT ALSO SWEARS SHE  
2 ENJOYED THE EXPERIENCE. I'M ASSUMING THERE WILL BE SOME  
3 COMMENTS ON THAT. WHEREAS, CAROL KUESTER ENABLED HER TO  
4 ADDRESS 600 MEMBERS OF THE ASSOCIATION OF GERMAN TRANSIT  
5 COMPANIES IN THEIR OWN LANGUAGE. THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED  
6 THAT THE STAFF AND COMMISSION OF MTC REALLY CONGRATULATE CAROL  
7 FOR ALL HER YEARS OF SERVICE AT THE AGENCY, HER HIGH  
8 PERFORMING TEAM, EXTEND TO CAROL, HER HUSBAND, AND THEIR SONS,  
9 AND WE WISH YOU THE VERY BEST. HAPPY HOLIDAYS AND WELL-  
10 TRAVELED FUTURE. WHETHER VALIDATING THE NEXTGEN RATION CLIPPER  
11 SYSTEM ON TRANSIT TRAVELS AROUND THE BAY OR VENTURING INTO THE  
12 FAR, FLUNG DESTINATION AROUND THE GLOBE, WE WISH HER A HAPPY  
13 BIRTHDAY. SO CAROL, WE SAID A LOT. THERE'S MORE. BUT THE FLOOR  
14 IS YOURS.

15

16 **CAROL KUESTER:** I THINK I HAVE FORGOTTEN HOW TO OPERATE THIS.  
17 THANK YOU SO MUCH. I'M VERY GRATEFUL FOR THIS RESOLUTION. IT  
18 REALLY MEANS A LOT TO ME. AND IT HAS REALLY BEEN EXTREMELY  
19 REWARDING TO WORK FOR THIS COMMISSION OVER MORE THAN TWO  
20 DECADES. I APPRECIATE THE DEDICATION AND THE VISION THAT EACH  
21 OF YOU BRING. I KNOW IT CAN BE A REAL CHALLENGE COMING FROM  
22 YOUR HOME JURISDICTION TO SIT HERE AT THIS REGIONAL BODY. BUT  
23 IT'S BEEN A REAL PRIVILEGE TO DELIVER THE IMPORTANT REGIONAL  
24 WORK THAT WE DO HERE. AND TO DELIVER PROGRAMS THAT INCREASE  
25 MOBILITY TO THE PUBLIC. SO I'M EXTREMELY GRATEFUL FOR THAT. MY



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 APPRECIATION GOES OUT TO THE MANY MTC LEADERS THAT I HAD THE  
2 PRIVILEGE OF WORKING FOR AND MOST RECENTLY IS ANDY AND ALIX.  
3 AND MELANIE AND ANN AND THERESA OVER THE YEARS FOR THEIR  
4 GUIDANCE AND SUPPORT AND COLLABORATION AND I REALLY HAVE  
5 GREATLY APPRECIATED WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCY GENERAL  
6 MANAGERS, IN PARTICULAR, THE CHAIRS, BOB POWERS. I HAVE TO SAY  
7 I'M VERY PROUD OF THE COLLABORATIVE WORK ENVIRONMENT WE HAVE  
8 WITHIN THIS AGENCY BUT ALSO WE HAVE EXTENDED TO THE  
9 PARTNERSHIPS WE FOSTER WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND OUR  
10 CONTRACTORS, SOME OF WHOM ARE HERE TODAY, TO DELIVER FAST  
11 TRACK IN CLIPPER. IT'S THE ONLY WAY TO KEEP THOSE PROGRAMS ON  
12 TRACK. AND THEN FINALLY, I GIVE WHOLEHEARTED THANKS AND  
13 APPRECIATION TO MY CO-DIRECTORS AND TO THE ELECTRONIC PAYMENTS  
14 TEAM. I WILL JUST SAY DELIVERING CLIPPER AND FAST TRACK IS  
15 EXTREMELY REWARDING WORK BECAUSE WE SERVE MILLIONS OF PEOPLE  
16 DIRECTLY. IT IS ALSO VERY, VERY TOUGH ON A DAY-TO-DAY BASIS  
17 BUT BEING IN THE TRENCHES FOSTERS A VERY SPECIAL KIND OF  
18 FRIENDSHIP, A LOT OF LAUGHTER AND SOME TEAM CAMARADERIE THAT  
19 IS VERY UNIQUE AND MAKES IT ALL WORTHWHILE. AND I'M GRATEFUL  
20 TO JASON AND LYNN TO CONTINUE THE WORK OF OUR SECTION SO THANK  
21 YOU, AGAIN. YOUR ACKNOWLEDGMENT MEANS THE WORLD TO ME. AND  
22 THOUGH I'M STEPPING AWAY FROM MTC, I PLAN TO CONTINUE WORKING  
23 IN THE CONSULTING CAPACITY, HOPEFULLY, TO IMPROVE MOBILITY AND  
24 I'VE LEARNED A LOT. I'LL MAKE A LOT OF GOOD USE OF THE  
25 EXPERIENCE GAINED HERE TO HOPEFULLY MEET -- CONTINUE TO MEET





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES HERE IN THIS REGION AND  
2 ELSEWHERE. SO THANK YOU. IT'S BEEN AN AMAZING RIDE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, CAROL, THANK YOU.

5 [APPLAUSE]

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I'M THE ONE COMMISSIONER THAT SEES THESE PEOPLE HIRED  
8 AND RETIRED WHILE I AM ON COMMISSION. I LOOK BACK AND, YOU  
9 KNOW, ELECTED OFFICIALS AND PEOPLE THAT SERVE IN GOVERNMENT,  
10 YOU KNOW, THE WAY I EVALUATE OR JUDGE THEIR SUCCESS IS THE  
11 NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT THEY'VE TOUCHED IN A POSITIVE AND  
12 MEANINGFUL WAY AND CAROL, I DON'T KNOW OF ANYONE THAT HAS  
13 TOUCHED SO MANY LIVES YOU HAVE WITH THE WORK YOU DID WITH  
14 CLIPPER.

15

16 **JAMES SPERING:** AS I LOOK AT ALL THE YEARS I SERVED ON THIS  
17 COMMISSION, I DON'T KNOW OF ONE THING THAT DID MORE FOR  
18 TRANSIT THAN CLIPPER. WHEN WE HAD THE GREAT SUCCESS. THE  
19 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR IS OUT FRONT. THE ONE THAT MADE THAT HAPPEN  
20 IS THE PERSON STANDING BEHIND THEM AND THAT WAS CAROL. WHEN WE  
21 STARTED CLIPPER, WE GOT SO MUCH PUSHBACK. IT WAS JUST -- I  
22 MEAN, A REAL BATTLE GOING FORWARD. BUT WE PUT THE RIGHT PERSON  
23 IN CHARGE. TO GET THE RESPECT OF THE OPERATORS AT THAT TIME, I  
24 THINK WAS A TREMENDOUS ACCOMPLISHMENT IN ITSELF. AND THE WORK  
25 YOU HAVE DONE, I MEAN, IT JUST -- I FEEL VERY STRONGLY ABOUT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE STAFF WE HAVE HERE AT MTC. THEY DO SUCH TREMENDOUS WORK  
2 AND IMPROVE THE LIVES OF A LOT OF PEOPLE AND DON'T GET A LOT  
3 OF THAT RECOGNITION BUT THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE AND THE RESPECT  
4 THAT YOU'VE HAD AND YOU MENTION THOSE GREAT LEADERS. GO RIGHT  
5 DOWN THE LIST. WELL, YOU'RE ONE OF THOSE GREAT LEADERS. YOU  
6 REALLY ARE ONE OF THEM. FOR ME AS A COMMISSIONER, YOU KNOW,  
7 YOU MADE THE COMMISSION'S LIFE REAL EASY. YOU TOOK THE BRUNT  
8 OF ALL THAT PUSHBACK YOU HAD AND ALL THOSE TOUGH NEGOTIATIONS  
9 AND I DON'T KNOW THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE REALLY APPRECIATE HOW  
10 HARD THAT WAS TO DO. IT REALLY WAS. I MEAN, IT WAS ONE OF  
11 THOSE LEADING PROJECTS NATIONALLY, I MEAN, TO GET THAT  
12 NATIONAL RECOGNITION FOR THE WORK THAT YOU DID. SO I WAS REAL  
13 PROUD TO BE PART OF THAT. SO I CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH. ON  
14 BEHALF OF THIS COMMISSION, YOU -- AND NOT ONLY COMPETENT BUT  
15 YOU'RE JUST A GREAT PERSON. AND SO -- SO CAROL, IT'S BEEN AN  
16 HONOR FOR ME. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SPERING.  
19 COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

20

21 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU. CAROL, I HAVEN'T HAD AN OPPORTUNITY  
22 TO REALLY WORK THAT CLOSE WITH YOU OVER THE YEARS BUT JUST  
23 HAVE A GREAT -- AS ONE OF THE LONGER STANDING MEMBERS HERE,  
24 JUST HAVE A GREAT APPRECIATION FOR THE WORK THAT ALL THE FOLKS  
25 WITH MTC HAS DONE THROUGHOUT THE YEARS. AND YOUR ABILITY TO GO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OUT THERE AND GET GREAT WORK DONE THAT WE DON'T KNOW HOW IT  
2 HAPPENS A LOT OF TIMES AS A COMMISSIONER AND JUST WANT TO  
3 THANK YOU FOR YOUR DEDICATED YEARS OF SERVICE AND WISH YOU AND  
4 YOUR FAMILY WELL IN YOUR RETIREMENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** REALLY, AS COMMISSIONER SPERING'S REMARKS  
9 AS FAR AS YOU TAKING ALL THE FLACK WHEN NEW PROGRAMS ARE BEING  
10 ROLLED OUT BECAUSE AS ELECTED OFFICIALS WE GET A LOT OF FLACK  
11 SO IT'S NICE TO HAVE SOMEBODY TO DEFLECT. AGAIN, THANK YOU SO  
12 MUCH FOR YOUR YEARS OF SERVICE.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER  
15 COMMISSIONERS. SO AT THIS POINT WE DO, UNFORTUNATELY, HAVE TO  
16 ACCEPT THIS RESOLUTION. SO --

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I DO HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** BEFORE WE ACCEPT THE RESOLUTION, LET'S  
21 DO PUBLIC COMMENT.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. RANDY.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** RANDY, YOU GET 30 SECONDS. I ALWAYS  
2 WANTED TO DO THAT TO RANDY.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** DO I GET FIVE MINUTES? IT'S WONDERFUL TO BE BACK HERE  
5 IN FRONT OF THE MTC FAMILY. AND CAROL KUESTER WAS ONE OF OUR  
6 BEST FAMILY MEMBERS SO THANK YOU, CAROL.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'VE NEVER SEEN RANDY BE SO SUCCINCT.  
9 BUT TO SEE THAT TYPE OF CAMARADERIE AND APPRECIATION OF FORMER  
10 EMPLOYEES NOW I THINK SPEAKS SO MUCH ABOUT THIS ORGANIZATION.  
11 SO WE DO HAVE A RESOLUTION 4627. I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION.

12

13 **JAMES SPERING:** I WILL BE HONORED TO MAKE THAT MOTION.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY SPERING. SECOND BY GLOVER.  
16 ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? IF NOT, WE DO HAVE TO DO ROLL CALL  
17 VOTE.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** ALL RIGHT. CHAIR PEDROZA.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER AHN. COMMISSIONER CANEPA.  
24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. COMMISSIONER  
25 GLOVER.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** YES.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.

5 COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS.

6 COMMISSIONER NOACK. COMMISSIONER PAPAN. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

7

8 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER RONEN. COMMISSIONER SCHAAF.

11 COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. THE MOTION PASSES.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. CAROL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

14 ALL RIGHT. SO LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM FIVE, POLICY ADVISORY

15 COUNCIL REPORT. RANDY.

16

17 **RANDY KINMAN:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. WE HAVE THREE

18 MONTHS OF REPORT HERE BECAUSE OF MULTIPLE SITUATIONS SO WE'LL

19 START WITH OUR OCTOBER 27 MEETING. THE COUNCIL MET AND SET A

20 BAY AREA 2050. THE ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS. DRAFT 2024 MTC AND

21 ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM AND THE DRAFT 2023 TO 2026 MTC

22 CAPITAL PROGRAM. LOTS OF INFORMATION. THE ONE THING I DO WANT

23 TO POINT OUT IS THE COUNCIL PROVIDED A LOT OF FEEDBACK ON PLAY

24 BAY AREA 2050 AND TYING INTO CHAIR PEDROZA'S COMMENTS ABOUT

25 NEXTGEN FREEWAY PROJECT. WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THAT PARTICULAR



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 PROJECT FOR US IS THAT WE KNOW IT'S PART OF A SUITE OF ISSUES.  
2 THE ISSUE THAT WE HAVE IS THAT WE CAN'T SEE WHERE IT TIES INTO  
3 THE OTHER SUITES, THE OTHER PIECES OF THIS SUITE, AND I THINK  
4 THAT'S THE PROBLEM THAT THE COMMUNITY'S HAVING RIGHT NOW. AND  
5 I KNOW THAT THAT'S THE PROBLEM THAT THE PRESS IS HAVING SINCE  
6 THEY HAVE NO IDEA WHAT THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT HALF THE TIME. SO  
7 IF WE COULD -- AND WE TALKED TO STAFF ABOUT THIS AS BEING MORE  
8 PROACTIVE ABOUT PRESENTING THIS AS JUST ONE PART OF A SUITE OF  
9 PROGRAMS THAT ARE MOVING FORWARD. AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO COME  
10 TAKE AWAY YOUR CARS OR ANYTHING ELSE IN THE NEXT TWO YEARS. IN  
11 ADDITION TO THAT, WE HAD THE FIRST MEETING OF THE REGIONAL  
12 NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP. THIS CAME OUT OF  
13 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. THEY ARE ORGANIZING AND THEY ARE  
14 SPEEDING UP THEIR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. WHAT THEY WILL BE  
15 DOING IS ROTATING CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR RESPONSIBILITIES SO  
16 WHOEVER IS ELECTED THIS YEAR, IF IT'S THE PERSON THAT  
17 REPRESENTS OUR BODY, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, THEN THE  
18 VICE CHAIR WILL REPRESENT THE OUTSIDE REPRESENTATIVES BECAUSE  
19 IT'S A DIVIDED -- IT'S A DIVIDED COMMITTEE WHERE HALF OF THEM  
20 COME FROM OUTSIDE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS WAY WE CAN  
21 SWITCH AND FLIP BACK AND MAKE SURE THAT THE TOP OF THE LIST  
22 THERE IS BEING RUN ON AN EQUITABLE MANNER. THAT TAKES CARE OF  
23 OCTOBER. NOVEMBER'S CANCELED. WAS CANCELED BECAUSE OF APEC.  
24 THAT WAS QUITE A SURPRISE FOR ALL OF US. BUT DECEMBER, WE MET  
25 TO RECEIVE PLAN BAY AREA DRAFT 2050 BLUEPRINT AGAIN. THAT WILL



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 ALWAYS BE A STANDING ITEM ON OUR AGENDA SO YOU HEAR THAT  
2 AGAIN. I WAS ASKED THE LAST TIME I SPOKE HOW DO WE KNOW WHEN  
3 OUR COMPLAINTS ARE ACTUALLY TAKEN CARE OF AND I CAN TELL YOU  
4 THIS ROUND, OUR COUNCILMEMBERS HAD GREAT THINGS TO SAY ABOUT  
5 THE STAFF AT THE END OF THE YEAR ABOUT HOW THEY SAW THEIR  
6 WORDS IN THE ACTUAL DOCUMENTS, HOW THEY COULD SEE DOCUMENTS  
7 CHANGE, HOW THEY SAW THE EQUITY MEASURES WITHIN THE DOCUMENTS  
8 CHANGE, THE LANGUAGE WITHIN THE DOCUMENTS CHANGED, AND THEY  
9 COULD SEE THAT THE TECHNICAL WAY THAT THE DOCUMENTS ARE  
10 PRESENTED RELATE EASIER TO PEOPLE ON THE STREET WHICH IS A BIG  
11 DEAL. YOU GUYS KNOW THAT IT DOESN'T MATTER WHAT KIND OF  
12 TECHNICAL MATERIAL WE HAVE, IF PEOPLE ON THE STREET DON'T  
13 UNDERSTAND IT OR IF ELECTED OFFICIALS DON'T UNDERSTAND IT,  
14 IT'S GOING TO BE VERY HARD TO MAKE THAT A POSITIVE  
15 PRESENTATION TO PEOPLE WHEN WE COME DOWN THE LINE ASKING FOR  
16 MONEY. WE WANT TO BE VERY CLEAR THAT OUR CONCERN THAT LOSING  
17 FINANCIAL SUPPORT RIGHT NOW, WHICH IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE DOING  
18 AND THE TERM BASELINE NEEDS WERE USED FOR 2050, WE USE THAT IN  
19 TERMS OF CONSOLIDATING SOME OF THE GOOD IDEAS THAT CAME OUT OF  
20 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THE UNFORTUNATE ISSUES WITH COVID  
21 THAT CAME ABOUT AND WE ARE NOT GOING BACK TO BUSINESS AS USUAL  
22 BUT THAT WE ARE ACTUALLY BEING CREATIVE WITH THE MONEY THAT WE  
23 HAVE. THAT IS GOING TO BE SO IMPORTANT FOR THE COMMUNITY,  
24 ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU'RE LOOKING AT PASSING ANY TYPE OF A  
25 REVENUE MEASURE. FINALLY AFTER THAT WE HAD THIS MONTH THE ONE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 SPEED PILOT PROGRAM WHICH IS PART OF THE ACTION PLAN AND THERE  
2 IS -- I HAD TO STEP OUT EARLY FOR THAT ONE BUT THE COMMITTEE  
3 DID RECEIVE THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE RECEIVED REPORT  
4 ON THE COUNTY THAT HAS DECIDED TO TAKE ON A ONE SEAT PILOT  
5 RIDE PROGRAM ALL ON ITS OWN AND I WILL TELL YOU THAT OUR  
6 DISABLED COMMUNITY CONSIDER THIS A HIGH PRIORITY ACROSS THE  
7 BOARD. IT'S EXTREMELY DIFFICULT TO HAVE A NORMAL LIFE AND TO  
8 GO SHOPPING OR TO ENJOY ENRICHMENT PROGRAMS OR GET TO MEDICAL  
9 APPOINTMENTS WHEN YOU HAVE TO SWITCH COUNTIES. I'M SORRY NOT  
10 TO SEE RANDY TODAY BECAUSE IT'S BEEN A LONG TIME BUT THIS WILL  
11 BE MY LAST REPORT BECAUSE WE ARE AT THE MIDDLE SECTION OF THIS  
12 COHORT. WE HAVE A FOUR-YEAR COHORT. AND WE ARE TAKING  
13 NOMINATIONS FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. SO NEXT MONTH, YOU WILL  
14 HAVE A NEW CHAIR MAKING THE PRESENTATIONS. AND I WILL FINALLY  
15 GET TO STEP DOWN AS CHAIR OF THIS COMMISSION -- THIS COUNCIL.  
16 SO I THANK YOU ALL FOR BEING SO PATIENT WITH ME OVER THE  
17 YEARS. AND THAT ENDS MY REPORT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, RANDI. AND YOU'VE  
20 PUT IN A LOT OF TIME SO I'LL MAKE SURE WE DO SOMETHING PROPER  
21 TO ACKNOWLEDGE YOUR YEARS OF SERVICE. AND YOU DEFINITELY WERE  
22 PASSIONATE AND COMMITTED AND ALWAYS SHOWED YOUR REPORTS SO  
23 THANK YOU FOR THAT. COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS ON RANDI'S  
24 REPORT? I DO SEE ONE VIRTUALLY BUT NO ONE IN THE BOARD  
25 CHAMBERS. LET'S GO TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I JUST REALLY WANTED TO SAY, RANDI,  
3 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR AMAZING SERVICE. YOU'RE REALLY  
4 ONE OF A KIND AND ANYBODY THAT KNOWS YOU WELL KNOWS THAT TO BE  
5 MORE TRUE THAN -- WELL, VERY TRUE. I REALLY APPRECIATED THE  
6 PART OF YOUR REPORT, TOO, WHERE YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS --  
7 THE COMMISSION ACTUALLY SEEING THEIR WORDS IN THE WORK THAT  
8 THE STAFF IS PRODUCING. I THINK THAT'S BOTH A HIGH COMPLIMENT  
9 TO YOUR MISSION AND TO THE STAFF IN TERMS OF REALLY DIGGING IN  
10 AND LISTENING. SO THANK YOU. I KNOW A LOT OF THAT IS -- HAS  
11 RANDI WRITTEN ALL OVER IT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN:** IF I MIGHT RESPOND TO THAT THROUGH THE CHAIR. IT  
16 REMINDS ME BACK IN SAN JOSE WHEN WE HAD THE STRONG  
17 NEIGHBORHOODS INITIATIVE WHEN STAFF WAS TRAINED TO WORK WITH  
18 THEIR COUNTERPARTS IN THE COMMUNITIES SO I REALLY -- I CAN'T  
19 HEAP ENOUGH PRAISE ON THE STAFF WE HAVE HERE.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, RANDI. COMMISSIONER  
22 GIACOPINI.

23



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **DORENE GIACOPINI:** I APOLOGIZE, I WANT TO APOLOGIZE FOR BEING  
2 INTERRUPTED BECAUSE THERE IS A MTC STAFF HERE TO SEE ME. BUT  
3 RANDI, DID I UNDERSTAND CORRECTLY THAT YOU'RE LEAVING?

4

5 **RANDY KINMAN:** I'M STEPPING DOWN AS CHAIR. I HAVE TWO MORE  
6 YEARS TO SERVE.

7

8 **DORENE GIACOPINI:** OK. I WILL RESERVE COMMENTS, THEN. AT THIS  
9 POINT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI.

12

13 **DORENE GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING THAT YOU DO.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I DON'T SEE ANY OUR COMMISSIONERS.  
16 WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM SIX, THIS IS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S  
17 REPORT.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. AS USUAL WE OPEN WITH OUR  
20 COMINGS AND GOES AND FOR ANOTHER MONTH WE HAVE MORE PEOPLE  
21 COMING IN THAN ARE LEAVING WHICH WE FIND TO BE VERY POSITIVE  
22 FOR MOVING THE MISSION FORWARD. OF COURSE, I, TOO, AM GOING TO  
23 MISS CAROL GREATLY. SHE WAS EXTREMELY SUPPORTIVE FOR THE WORK  
24 WE DID AND I THINK I OFTEN TOLD HER WITH THE JOB SHE DID WITH



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 CLIPPER AND FAST TRACK AND REALLY GLAD SHE TOOK ON THAT  
2 CHALLENGE.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** AND THE OTHER RETIREMENT, GILBERT MINGMING, HE  
5 HAS BEEN WITH US A LONG TIME. IT'S ONE OF THE FOLKS BEHIND THE  
6 SCENES YOU NEVER SEE THAT REALLY HAS BEEN WORKING ON  
7 APPLICATION DEVELOPMENT FOR A LOT OF TOOLS THAT WE PUT ON THE  
8 STREET FOR THE PUBLIC, FOR THE OPERATORS, AND FOR OURSELVES  
9 INTERNALLY. AND WE'RE CERTAINLY GOING TO MISS GILBERT AND HIS  
10 WORK. IN TERMS OF SOME AWARDS WE RECEIVED RELATIVE TO FUNDING  
11 GRANTS, WE DID GET A \$10 MILLION GRANT, ONE OF THE LARGEST  
12 ONES FROM THE DOT'S SAFE STREETS PROGRAM. THAT'S USED FOR  
13 IMPROVEMENTS AROUND THE REGION. WE CAN ALL AGREE THAT  
14 PEDESTRIAN SAFETY IS STILL A BIG CHALLENGE FOR US ALL  
15 WITNESSED' LOOK FORWARD TO PUTTING THAT WORK IN YOUR  
16 COMMUNITIES. IN ADDITION, THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION  
17 COMMISSION APPROVED A \$50 MILLION FOR STATE ROUTE 37. WE DON'T  
18 HAVE A VERY GOOD BATTING AVERAGE ON THAT CORRIDOR BUT IT'S A  
19 BIG ONE AND IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF THE INVESTMENT  
20 FOR SOME ENVIRONMENTAL IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE ACTUALLY PART OF  
21 THE COMMITMENT TO MAKE SURE THIS IS A LOT MORE THAN  
22 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT. IT REALLY IS DEALING WITH CLIMATE  
23 RESISTANCE AND ALSO ENVIRONMENTAL STEWARDSHIP. SO THAT WORK  
24 WILL GO INTO IMPROVING THE STRIP MARSH EAST AS IT'S CALLED IN  
25 SOLANO COUNTY AND LENGTHENING THE BRIDGE WHICH REALLY OPENS UP



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OPPORTUNITIES FOR BAYLANDS IMPROVEMENTS. THIS IS A WHOLE BUNCH  
2 OF SERIES OF ITEMS HERE ON OUR TRANSIT RECOVERY EFFORTS. START  
3 WITH THE BLUE RIBBON PANEL. SO WE HAVE OUR FIRST TWO EMPLOYERS  
4 BY PRINT TIME WE ONLY HAD ONE BUT WE HAVE TWO. USFF AND THE  
5 CITY HAVE SIGNED UP FOR PHASE TWO OF THE CLIPPER PASS PROGRAM.  
6 SO WE'RE REALLY EXCITED TO SEE THAT UP AND ROLLING. THE STATE  
7 HAS SET UP A TASK FORCE SIMILAR TO BLUE RIBBON ON TRANSIT  
8 RECOVERY. AND IT'S OUR HONOR TO ACKNOWLEDGE ON DECEMBER 10,  
9 THE CALIFORNIA STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY WILL HAVE ALIX PART  
10 OF THAT GROUP. SHE IS A WELL REPRESENTED BAY AREA CONTINGENT  
11 AND WE HAVE BOTH SEVERAL OPERATORS AND ADVOCACY GROUPS THAT  
12 HAVE HELPED SO MUCH WITH THE DISCUSSION AND CHALLENGE. ALSO ON  
13 DECEMBER 12 IN OAKLAND, ACTUALLY IN A BUILDING THAT WAS ALMOST  
14 OUR HEADQUARTERS, THE UBER BUILDING DOWN ON 19TH AND BROADWAY,  
15 IT'S A BEAUTIFUL BUILDING, WE HOSTED ALONG WITH AC TRANSIT,  
16 TRANSIT PRIORITY WORKSHOP THAT REALLY WAS WELL-ATTENDED, NOT  
17 ONLY BY THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND OPERATORS BUT BY THE CITIES,  
18 CAL TRANS AND OTHER INTEREST GROUPS TO IMPROVE TRANSIT  
19 PRIORITY ON THE ARTERIAL FRONT. WE ALSO ENGAGED IN REGIONAL  
20 NETWORK MANAGEMENT SPACE SO WE STOOD UP THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
21 MANAGEMENT COUNCIL WHICH YOU RECALL IT'S ME AND 10 OTHER  
22 GENERAL MANAGERS. AND WE'RE WORKING HARD WITH MELANIE CHOY AND  
23 HER TEAM TO REALLY ADVANCE EFFORTS ON THE TRANSPORTATION  
24 RECOVERY IN TRANSIT. AND THEN FINALLY, I JUST WANTED TO  
25 MENTION HOW IMPORTANT THIS BUILDING IS FOR REALLY PUBLIC



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 INVOLVEMENT. SO WE'VE HAD IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE AIR DISTRICT  
2 METRO TALKS HERE WHERE WE'VE BEEN HAVING DISCUSSION AROUND  
3 BOOKS THAT ARE PUBLISHED IN OUR SPACE. AND THE MOST RECENT ONE  
4 WAS HELD BY SOMEONE THAT'S VERY FAMILIAR TO US, KING, A DESIGN  
5 CRITIC AND WRITTEN A BOOK THAWS CALLED "PORTAL: SAN FRANCISCO  
6 FERRY BUILDING AND THE REINVENTION OF THE AMERICAN CITIES."  
7 AND SO HIS BOOK IS OUT ON THE STREET AND WE HOSTED A BOOK  
8 SIGNING HERE. AND THAT'S THE END OF MY REPORT.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, MR. PREMIER.  
11 COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY. ANY  
12 PUBLIC COMMENT?

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS IN ZOOM AND I  
15 RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM NUMBER  
18 SEVEN. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. DON'T SEE ANY. WE'LL PROVIDE TO  
19 ITEM 8, CONSENT ITEM. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** PULL 8-H.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS? IF NOT I LOOK  
24 FOR MOTION TO APPROVE THE BALANCE AND CONSENT REMOVING 8-H.  
25 PRO BOWLERS ASSOCIATION MOVE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY PAPAN. SECOND BY GLOVER. ROLL  
3 CALL, PLEASE. FOR THE --

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** WE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND  
6 THERE'S NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. OK.  
7 WITH THAT, CHAIR PEDROZA.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

12

13 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, COMMISSIONER AHN.  
14 COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER MAHAN. COMMISSIONER MILEY IS  
15 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER NOACK.

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** EXCUSE ME. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

20

21 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

24

25 **JAMES SPERING:** AYE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. THE MOTION  
3 PALS FOR THE BALANCE OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR FOR ALL MEMBERS  
4 PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND THIS IS RESOLUTION 4505, ITEM 8-H.  
7 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I WAS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM. I THOUGHT  
10 I MADE THE MOTION. IT LOOKS LIKE COMMISSIONER CANEPA MADE THE  
11 MOTION. I THINK WE NEED TO BE CLEAR HERE, THE STAFF REPORT  
12 SUGGESTS THAT THAT WE NEED TO REAFFIRM THE GRACE PERIOD, THE  
13 EXTENSION TO DECEMBER 31, 2024, AND I DON'T BELIEVE THAT WAS  
14 THE INTENT OF THE COMMISSIONERS AT THAT TIME. SO SOME LANGUAGE  
15 HAS BEEN PROPOSED HERE AND I THINK I TALKED TO ONE OR TWO  
16 COMMISSIONERS RELATED TO THIS. THE OVERALL EXTENT WAS TO  
17 EXTEND IT TO DECEMBER 31, 2024. THERE WAS A DISCUSSION ABOUT  
18 BRINGING THE ITEM BACK TO SEE HOW THE CERTIFICATION PROCESS  
19 WAS GOING. I DON'T BELIEVE -- I THINK THAT WAS A MATTER OF  
20 INTEREST TO US ALL. BUT I DON'T BELIEVE WE NEEDED TO AFFIRM OR  
21 MODIFY THE EXTENSION PERIOD SO I WOULD LIKE THE LANGUAGE THAT  
22 WAS PRESENTED BY STAFF TO CHANGE SO THAT WE ARE NOT REQUIRED  
23 TO MODIFY THE DATE. SO I THINK REBECCA HANDED ME SOMETHING  
24 HERE. SOME SUGGESTED LANGUAGE WAS FOLLOWING A REVIEW OF THE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 BAY AREA JURISDICTION HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFICATION PROCESS IN  
2 JUNE.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN. WHY DON'T WE ASK  
5 STAFF TO CLARIFY AND THEN WE CAN TALK WHETHER OR NOT WE NEED  
6 TO MODIFY THE RECOMMENDED ACTION.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. AGAIN, ON 8-H, WE WERE  
9 ACTUALLY PROPOSING DIFFERENT CHANGES BUT IT'S TO A RESOLUTION  
10 THAT ALSO APPEARS IN ITEM 11. SO I GUESS SINCE YOU PULLED THIS  
11 FROM CONSENT, I WOULD RECOMMEND YOU TAKE IT UP AS PART OF ITEM  
12 11. THIS CONVERSATION JUST TO MAKE SURE THE PUBLIC AND OTHERS  
13 HAVE THE FULL OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT. BECAUSE I THINK WHAT  
14 YOU'RE SPEAKING TO IS PART OF 11. IT'S CONFUSING BECAUSE WE  
15 HAVE THE RESOLUTION AND ANOTHER ITEM.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** MY UNDERSTANDING IN SORT OF GOING THROUGH THE PACKET  
18 IS ITEM 11, THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE ALLUDING TO, ALIX, IS PROBABLY  
19 THE MOST APPROPRIATE PLACE TO HEAR THAT ITEM. THAT'S OK. WHAT  
20 WE CAN DO, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, WE CAN LOOK AT, YOU KNOW, YOUR  
21 POTENTIAL AMENDMENT IF YOU'RE OK WITH IT.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I SHOULD SAY 11-C, THE HOUSING INCENTIVE POOL AND  
24 HOUSING ELEMENT AND I THINK YOU'RE REFERRING TO RESOLUTION





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 NUMBER 4505 IN PARTICULAR THAT ALSO -- REVISED UNDER 8-H, I  
2 BELIEVE.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET ME GO TO COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
5 VERNACI.

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANKS, ALIX, FOR CLARIFYING IT'S C.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ARE YOU SATISFIED WE CAN HAVE THIS  
10 DISCUSSION UNDER 11?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** I AM. I'M CONCERNED THAT THIS DOCUMENTATION IN 8-H  
13 PROCEEDS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YOU CAN ACT AT THE SAME TIME.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** AS LONG AS WE'RE CLEAR FOR THE MINUTES IN THE RECORD  
18 WHEN WE GET TO 11-C WE'RE FINE.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE WON'T PROCEED FOR THE BALANCE FOR  
21 AGENDA WHEN WE GET TO 11-C, WE'LL POTENTIALLY COME BACK. OK.  
22 AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO DELAY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM  
23 TO FULLY DISCUSS IT SO PROCEED TO COMMITTEE REPORTS. THIS IS  
24 JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION. COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1   **DAVID CANEPA:** YEAH. WE REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION AS  
2   AN INFORMATION ITEM. AGENDA ITEM 9-A, THE REGIONAL  
3   TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE UPDATE PROVIDES AN UPDATE ON  
4   THE POTENTIAL 2026 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE,  
5   INCLUDING RESULTS OF ENGAGEMENT AND POLLING, REVENUE SOURCE  
6   OPTIONS, AND POTENTIAL REFORM CONCEPTS THAT COULD ACCOMPANY  
7   ENABLING LEGISLATION. I'LL TURN IT TO ANDREW FREMIER, OUR  
8   EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, TO SAY A FEW WORDS BEFORE HEADING TO  
9   REBECCA LONG ON STAFF'S PROPOSED CONCEPT FOR THE LEGISLATION  
10   TO AUTHORIZE MTC TO PLACE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ON  
11   THE BALLOT. ALONG WITH THE SUMMARY OF THE LEGISLATION,  
12   COMMITTEE'S DISCUSSION ON DECEMBER 8 REGARDING POTENTIAL  
13   REFORM, CONCEPTS THAT COULD BE INCORPORATED INTO THE BILL OR  
14   COMPANION LEGISLATION. MR. FREMIER.

15

16   **ANDREW FREMIER:** EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. JUST AS A LITTLE BIT OF  
17   PREAMBLE, THE WORK THAT WE STARTED HERE THAT'S GOING TO BE  
18   REPORTED ON, REBECCA, REALLY STARTED WITH THE WORK YOU  
19   ASSIGNED US BACK IN NAPA AT THE WORKSHOPS AND WE'VE BEEN  
20   WORKING DILIGENTLY, KEEPING A LEDGER COMMITTEE UPDATE ON OUR  
21   PROGRESS. BEEN ADJUSTING BASED ON THE ADVICE WE'VE GOTTEN BUT  
22   WE DID THINK IT WAS VERY IMPORTANT TO BRING IT TO THE FULL  
23   COMMISSION SO EVERYBODY WAS ON THE SAME PAINING AND HAD AN  
24   OPPORTUNITY TO GUIDE THE DISCUSSION THROUGH ITS NEXT STEPS. AS  
25   WE'VE TALKED ABOUT, WE ARE MAKING SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS ON ALL



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OF THE ITEMS THAT WERE IDENTIFIED IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
2 FIND, BUS PRIORITY PROJECTS, ETC., BUT ONE OF THE THINGS WE  
3 HAVE DEFINITELY RECEIVED AS DIRECTION FROM THE LEDGER  
4 COMMITTEE IS TO GET MORE BOLD, TO A NEXT WORKSHOP, AS WE MOVE  
5 INTO THE SPACE OF REAL TRANSIT RECOVERY AND TRANSIT REFORM AND  
6 I THINK THAT'S THE CHALLENGE THAT'S IN FRONT OF ALL OF US,  
7 INCLUDING THE OPERATORS TODAY. SO WE FOLLOWED THAT DIRECTION  
8 AND WE'VE UPDATED THE INFORMATION. YOU'LL SEE SOME OF IT IN  
9 THE PRESENTATION. BUT WE DO BELIEVE EVERYTHING IS ON THE TABLE  
10 IN THIS DISCUSSION IN ORDER TO REALLY IMPROVE THE TRANSIT  
11 SYSTEM AND THAT INCLUDES STRENGTHENING THE ROLE OF THE  
12 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORTS AS WELL AS POTENTIALLY  
13 LOOKING AT THE GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES OF SOME OF THE OPERATIONS  
14 THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS DO TODAY. AND WE DO THINK IT'S A  
15 WORTHWHILE CONVERSATION TO HAVE AND WE BELIEVE IT'S IMPORTANT  
16 TO HELP US NAVIGATE THE NEXT STEPS AND TO BE SUCCESSFUL IN THE  
17 LONG RUN. SO REBECCA, YOU'RE UP.

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** IF WE CAN HAVE THE TECH TEAM PULL UP THE  
20 PRESENTATION, PLEASE. AND AS ANDY MENTIONED, THIS IS AN  
21 INFORMATION ITEM TODAY. WE HAVE BEEN TALKING TO THE  
22 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE QUITE A BIT OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS AND  
23 THEN NEXT MONTH WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING TO THE LEGISLATION  
24 COMMITTEE WITH A RECOMMENDATION FOR THE OUTLINE OF THE  
25 LEGISLATION AND COMING TO THE COMMISSION FOR ACTION. SO IT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WILL BE GREAT TO HEAR FEEDBACK TODAY BECAUSE THAT WILL THEN  
2 INFORM OUR RECOMMENDATION IN A FEW WEEKS. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHY  
3 ARE WE TALKING A NEW MEASURE? PLAY BAY AREA 2050 WHICH IS THE  
4 CURRENT PLAN, IT IDENTIFIED \$110 BILLION FUNDING GAP TO  
5 REALIZE THAT PLAN'S VISION. AND SINCE THEN WE'VE HAD THE  
6 PANDEMIC. WHICH HAS REALLY DRAWN A SPOTLIGHT ON TRANSIT'S  
7 FUNDING CHALLENGES AND WE KNOW THAT SIGNIFICANT NEW RELIABLE  
8 FUNDS ARE NEEDED TO SUSTAIN AND IMPROVE THE TRANSIT EXPERIENCE  
9 IN THE BAY AREA. SO YOU REALLY HAVE TWO CORE FACTORS DRIVING  
10 THE NEED FOR NEW FUNDING. AND JUST THE RECOGNITION THAT WE  
11 DON'T THINK WE CAN OBTAIN THE LEVEL OF FUNDING THAT THE REGION  
12 NEEDS TO ACHIEVE OUR VISIONS FROM SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON,  
13 D.C., ALONE. AND THEN LASTLY I THINK AS THIS COMMISSION WELL  
14 KNOWS, REGIONAL FUNDS ARE MORE VALUABLE THAN JUST THE MONETARY  
15 VALUE IN AND OF THEMSELVES BECAUSE THEY CAN REALLY HELP  
16 DELIVER ON POLICY GOALS AS AN INCENTIVE AND WE SEE THAT WITH  
17 OUR WORK WITH TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY PROGRAMS AND OTHERS.  
18 NEXT SLIDE. SO DURING 2023, AT THE COMMISSION'S DIRECTION,  
19 WE'VE DONE A LOT OF STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. WANT TO -- A SHOUT  
20 OUT TO DAVE AND OUR PLANNING TEAM AND GEORGIA IN OUR LEG TEAM  
21 FOR REALLY TAKING THE LEAD ON THAT. WE DID TWO OR THREE ROUNDS  
22 OF STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WITH REGIONAL PARTNERS, BUSINESS  
23 ORGANIZATIONS, LABOR, AND THEN A LOT OF DIFFERENT ADVOCACY  
24 ORGANIZATIONS. SO THAT WORK HAS REALLY INFORMED STAFF'S  
25 RECOMMENDATION AND THEY'VE BEEN SEEING KIND OF THE EVOLUTION



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OF OUR RECOMMENDATION AS WE'VE GONE. AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO  
2 JUST MENTION THAT WE HAVE SINCE SET UP A WORKING GROUP THAT  
3 INCLUDES EVERY COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY, STAFF IS  
4 PARTICIPATING IN THAT, A NUMBER OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT  
5 EXPRESSED INTEREST AS WELL AS MANY OF THESE OTHER  
6 ORGANIZATIONS AND WE'RE CONTINUOUSLY ADDING TO THAT GROUP TO  
7 REALLY HAVE VOICES GOING FORWARD INTO THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS.  
8 WE'VE DONE POLLS AND I'LL SPEAK TO THAT IN A MOMENT. POP-UP  
9 WORKSHOPS WHERE WE ENGAGE DIRECTLY IN PERSON WITH BAY AREA  
10 RESIDENTS AS PART OF THE PLAN BAY POP-UPS BUT WE HAVE THIS AS  
11 A SEPARATE TOPIC OF CONVERSATION AND WE HAVE FEEDBACK FROM  
12 THAT WHICH HAS SUMMARIZED I THINK IT'S ATTACHMENT A IN THE  
13 PACKET. AND I DID WANT TO MENTION THAT THE POLLING  
14 INFORMATION, WE HAD INCLUDED TO INCLUDE AS AN ATTACHMENT TO  
15 THIS ITEM, IT'S INCLUDED IN THE LEG COMMITTEE MATERIALS FROM  
16 EARLIER THIS MONTH. SO ALL OF THE TOP LINE AND THE  
17 PRESENTATION IS THERE. AND SO KEY THEMES EMERGING FROM THIS  
18 ARE THAT STAKEHOLDERS AND THE PUBLIC WANT TO MAINTAIN AND  
19 IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSIT BUT THEY ALSO DO WANT TO SEE  
20 INVESTMENTS IN OTHER MODES AS WELL. SO WE REALLY TRIED TO ASK  
21 VOTERS, WHAT ARE YOU MOST INTERESTED IN? HOW MUCH DO YOU CARE  
22 ABOUT TRANSIT VERSUS OTHER THINGS? AND THEY DEFINITELY DO WANT  
23 TO SEE INVESTMENTS IN LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS, MAKING OUR  
24 STREETS SAFER FOR BIKING AND WALKING AND OTHERS. THERE'S ALSO  
25 A RECOGNITION THAT IT'S IMPORTANT WE HAVE FLEXIBILITY. THERE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 HAS BEEN A CONVENTIONAL WISDOM WITH ANY KIND OF BALLOT MEASURE  
2 THAT YOU WANT TO GIVE THEM CERTAINTY, A VERY PRECISE  
3 EXPENDITURE PLAN. WE ASKED THE PUBLIC THROUGH POLLS AND OTHERS  
4 HOW MUCH -- DO YOU THINK IT'S ADVISABLE TO HAVE SOME ABILITY  
5 TO MAKE CHANGE, TO ADDRESS UNCERTAINTY? AND THE VOTERS GET  
6 THAT. SO I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT CHANGE THAT WE NEED TO  
7 INCORPORATE INTO THE LEGISLATION. AND THEN JUST LASTLY, YOU  
8 KNOW, MAINTAINING THE STATUS QUO IS NOT SUFFICIENT. AGAIN,  
9 VOTERS REALLY WANT TO SEE IMPROVEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. I DO JUST  
10 WANT TO PROVIDE A HIGH LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE MOST RECENT  
11 POLLING RESULTS. THIS IS A QUITE ROBUST POLL. IT WAS 2700  
12 VOTERS BECAUSE WE WERE TESTING SEVERAL DIFFERENT REVENUE  
13 MEASURES, REVENUE OPTIONS AND WE DID A SPLIT SAMPLE AND WANTED  
14 TO HAVE THE PRETTY LOW MARGIN OF ERROR. WE'LL GET TO THE  
15 SPECIFIC REVENUE MECHANISMS FURTHER IN THE PRESENTATION. BUT  
16 OVERALL I THINK NOT A SURPRISE, VOTERS ARE NOT FEELING VERY  
17 HAPPY IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW. 62% SAY THE BAY AREA IS ON  
18 THE WRONG TRACK. THAT CLEARLY IMPACTS THEIR SUPPORT FOR ANY  
19 KIND OF TAXES. THIS POLL WAS NOT TO TEST THE VIABILITY OF, YOU  
20 KNOW, SHOULD WE DO A -- IS THIS MEASURE GOING TO PASS IN 2026?  
21 IT WAS TO ENGAGE HOW THEY FELT ABOUT DIFFERENT TYPES OF TAXES  
22 RELATIVE TO ONE ANOTHER AND ALSO JUST WHAT ARE THEIR  
23 PRIORITIES. AND WHAT WE SAW ON THE TYPES OF INVESTMENTS,  
24 REPAIRING POTHOLES, IMPROVING SIDEWALKS, MAKING BIKE LANES  
25 BETTER, ETC., 81% THINK THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT NEED, MEASURE,



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 FOLLOWED BY MAKING TRANSIT SAFER, MORE RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE  
2 AND CONNECTED WAS 80%. THOSE WERE KIND OF NECK IN NECK. THAT  
3 WAS SIMILAR IN OUR POP-UPS WITH THE SAFE STREETS BEING A TOP  
4 PRIORITY FOLLOWED BY TRANSIT CLOSE BEHIND. IMPROVING SAFETY  
5 AND CLEANLINESS ON BART WAS ALSO VERY HIGH PRIORITY AND  
6 AVOIDING CUTS TO MAKE SURE TRANSIT IS AVAILABLE TO THOSE WHO  
7 DEPEND ON IT WAS REALLY HIGHLY VALUED. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE'VE  
8 BEEN HAVING THESE CONVERSATIONS AND ALSO IN THE MOST RECENT  
9 SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE HEARING, THERE HAS BEEN A VISION OF  
10 WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN THIS MEASURE AND WE TALKED  
11 ABOUT IN OUR -- OUR OUTREACH AND PRESENTATIONS TO THE LEG  
12 COMMITTEE, PART OF THE VISION IS PLAN BAY AREA WHICH IS THIS  
13 BROAD VISION. BUT THIS MEASURE, ALSO SHOULD HAVE ITS OWN  
14 VISION. SO WE'VE DRAFTED SOMETHING HERE. I'LL READ IT THROUGH  
15 QUICKLY. BUT THE VISION IS, THE DRAFT VISION IS THAT THE BAY  
16 AREA HAS A WORLD-CLASS, RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE, AND CONNECTED  
17 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT MEETS THE NEEDS OF BAY AREA  
18 RESIDENTS, BUSINESSES AND VISITORS AND COMBATS THE CLIMATE  
19 CRISIS. THAT THE PUBLIC TRANSIT NETWORK IS ACCESSIBLE, EASY TO  
20 NAVIGATE, AFFORDABLE, AND GETS RIDERS WHERE THEY WANT AND NEED  
21 TO GO. SERVICE, FARES, SCHEDULES, CUSTOMER INFORMATION AND  
22 TRANSIT IDENTITY ARE COORDINATED AND CONSISTENT ACROSS TRANSIT  
23 SYSTEMS. AND BEAR WITH ME, TRANSIT, BIKING AND WALKING ARE  
24 RELIABLE AND SAFE ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING, RESULTING IN  
25 INCREASED RIDERSHIP, BIKING AND WALKING AND REDUCED GROWTH



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. THE BAY AREA HAS THE RESOURCES  
2 NEEDED TO SUSTAIN AND ENHANCE MULTI-MODAL TRANSPORTATION  
3 OPTIONS INCLUDING ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENT AND TO  
4 ENSURE THE REGION'S INFRASTRUCTURE AND SERVICES ARE  
5 DEPENDABLE, EFFICIENT, AND SAFE. WE CAN PROBABLY WORK ON  
6 MAKING IT MORE CONCISE BUT THAT'S OUR PROPOSED DRAFT VISION.  
7 SO LOOKING FORWARD TO YOUR FEEDBACK ON THAT. NEXT, TO  
8 HIGHLIGHT THE GOALS AND FOCUSED AREAS OF THE PROPOSED  
9 LEGISLATION ARE REALLY THREE CORE GOALS IN ADDITION TO THIS  
10 TOP ONE, CREATING A CLIMATE-FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, IS  
11 PROTECTING AND ENHANCING TRANSIT SERVICE. MAKING TRANSIT  
12 FASTER, SAFER, AND EASIER TO USE. AND THEN LASTLY, ENHANCING  
13 MOBILITY AND ACCESS FOR ALL. AND UNDER THAT LAST ONE, THIS IS  
14 WHERE WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT SAFE STREETS, YOU KNOW, TRAFFIC  
15 CALMING, IMPROVING THE CONDITION OF LOCAL STREETS. SO POT HOLE  
16 REPAIRS. AND GENERALLY, JUST MAKING IT EASIER TO USE OUR LOCAL  
17 STREETS, WHETHER YOU'RE WALKING, BIKING, WHEELING, OR DRIVING.  
18 NEXT SLIDE. SO THE WAY WE'VE BEEN APPROACHING THE EXPENDITURE  
19 PLAN FOR THIS MEASURE SO FAR IS NOT SO MUCH WHAT WE'VE DONE  
20 OFTEN IN THE PAST, SUCH AS REGIONAL MEASURE 3 OR REGIONAL  
21 MEASURE 2 WHICH IS A LONG LIST OF CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS  
22 THAT WOULD RECEIVE, YOU KNOW, SOME PORTION OF FUNDING FOR A  
23 SPECIFIC PROJECT, YOU KNOW, THAT HAS BEEN KIND OF THE APPROACH  
24 THAT WE'VE TAKEN WITH BRIDGE TOLLS AND THE COUNTIES HAVE TAKEN  
25 TO SOME EXTENT WITH SALES TAX MEASURES BUT THINKING IT MORE





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 PROGRAMMATICALLY BUT PART OF IT IS DRIVEN BY THE NEED. WE KNOW  
2 TRANSIT OPERATIONS IS A HUGE PIECE OF THE NEED. SO IT WOULD BE  
3 A CATEGORY. WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN INTO FORMULAS OR ANYTHING OF  
4 THAT NATURE AT THIS TIME. THE NEXT CATEGORY WOULD BE SAFE  
5 STREETS. TALKED ABOUT THAT. THAT ONE MIGHT LEND ITSELF QUITE  
6 WELL TO A RETURN TO SOURCE FORMULA BECAUSE EVERY JURISDICTION  
7 NEEDS SAFE STREETS, RIGHT? EVERY JURISDICTION WANTS TO HAVE A  
8 ROAD NETWORK THAT'S EASY TO WALK AND BIKE AND THAT IS NOT  
9 FILLED WITH POTHOLES. CONNECTIVITY RIGHT NOW IS SOME OF A  
10 CATCH-ALL FOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS IN A MULTI-MODAL SENSE. WE  
11 HIGHLIGHT SOME PROJECT EXAMPLES HERE. AND THEN CLIMATE  
12 RESILIENCE IS ONE THAT, YOU KNOW, STAFF THINKS IS REALLY  
13 IMPORTANT THAT WE INCLUDE AT LEAST PROVISIONALLY AS WE PROPOSE  
14 LEGISLATION BECAUSE OUR CLIMATE RESILIENCE NEEDS ARE ENORMOUS  
15 AND IT SEEMS IRRESPONSIBLE TO PUT FORWARD A VERY ROBUST  
16 FUNDING MEASURE WITHOUT AT LEAST BUILDING A SHELF OF THOSE  
17 PROJECTS, DOING THE PLANNING AND DESIGN WORK FOR WHAT WE DID  
18 ESTIMATE EARLIER THIS YEAR IS \$100 BILLION NEED TO PROTECT OUR  
19 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE FROM SEA LEVEL RISE IN  
20 PARTICULAR. NEXT SLIDE. SO I WON'T GO THROUGH THIS IN TOO MUCH  
21 DETAIL. I KNOW THIS IS A LONG PRESENTATION BUT, YOU KNOW,  
22 LOOKING AT THE LEFT COLUMN HERE, THESE ARE CORE THEMES THAT WE  
23 WOULD IMAGINE WOULD HAVE KIND OF LIKE THEIR OWN SECTIONS IN  
24 THE LEGISLATION. WHAT IS THE GEOGRAPHIC AREA OF THE TAX? WHAT  
25 IS THE TIMING? REVENUE AMOUNT AND OPTIONS OF THE REVENUE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 MECHANISMS, THE EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES. THAT WOULD BE WHAT WE  
2 TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF THOSE CATEGORIES. FUNDING  
3 DISTRIBUTION. AND THEN IMPORTANTLY, ACCOUNTABILITY. AND WE DO  
4 LIST SOME STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE RIGHT THERE. NEXT  
5 SLIDE. IN TERMS OF OUR INITIAL THINKING ON THE EXPENDITURE  
6 PLAN, HOW YOU DISTRIBUTE ACROSS THESE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES,  
7 YOU KNOW, WE DO THINK THE LEGISLATURE, STAKEHOLDERS ARE GOING  
8 TO WANT TO HAVE SOME SENSE OF, WHAT'S GETTING -- WHAT AMOUNT  
9 OF MONEY IS GOING TO ANY OF THESE GIVEN CATEGORIES? AS I  
10 MENTIONED EARLIER, FLEXIBILITY IS ALSO IMPORTANT. THIS IS  
11 SOMETHING THAT EMERGED THROUGH OUR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT IS  
12 HAVING A MINIMUM SET OF SHARES FOR THESE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES.  
13 THIS IS VERY ILLUSTRATIVE. YOU CAN SEE THE ORDER OF MAGNITUDE.  
14 AND THEN THIS IDEA OF HAVING SOME PORTION, MAYBE 20% THAT  
15 WOULD BE FLEXIBLE. AND SO JUST TO GIVE AN EXAMPLE HERE, YOU  
16 KNOW, LET'S SAY THE SAFE STREETS CATEGORY IS 10%, RIGHT, THAT  
17 WOULD PROVIDE THE OPPORTUNITY TO THE COMMISSION, YOU KNOW,  
18 POTENTIALLY IT WOULD SAY EVERY FIVE YEARS YOU WOULD REVISIT  
19 THESE SHARES TO ADJUST SO MAYBE THERE IS A PERIOD OF TIME  
20 WHERE SAFE STREETS IS GETTING 30%, YOU KNOW, IF TRANSIT NEEDED  
21 MORE FUNDING IN THE NEAR TERM, MAYBE IT WOULD BE GETTING  
22 SOMETHING CLOSER TO 70% AND THAT MIGHT CHANGE OVER TIME. SO  
23 THAT'S THE CONCEPT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT. AGAIN, IT'S IMPORTANT  
24 TO DISTINGUISH WHAT THE ENABLING LEGISLATION SAYS AND HOW MUCH  
25 KIND OF RIGIDITY IT HAS AND WHAT WE ARE PUTTING ON THE BALLOT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THAT MIGHT BE MORE SPECIFIC AND WE CAN PURSUE LANGUAGE IN THE  
2 ENABLING LEGISLATION THAT GIVES THE COMMISSION THE DISCRETION  
3 TO MAKE THOSE DECISIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO ON THE FUNDING  
4 SOURCES, WE HIRED A CONSULTANT TO HELP US THINK ABOUT A WIDE  
5 RANGE OF DIFFERENT FUNDING MECHANISMS, SALES TAX HAS BEEN THE  
6 TRIED AND TRUE MECHANISM IN THE BAY AREA AT THE LOCAL AREA. OF  
7 COURSE, BRIDGE TOLLS HAS BEEN AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. WE KNEW  
8 THERE WERE CONCERNS ABOUT -- BOTH OF THOSE. WE DID KEEP SALES  
9 TAX ON THE MENU AND WHAT WE ASK THE CONSULTANT TO DO WAS TO  
10 BASICALLY LOOK AT -- WHAT WOULD THE RATE BE UNDER A FEW  
11 DIFFERENT OPTIONS TO GENERATE \$1 BILLION A YEAR? AND GIVE US  
12 SOME FEEDBACK ON THESE DIFFERENT CRITERIA. REVENUE VOLATILITY,  
13 EQUITY, ECONOMIC IMPACTS, ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN AND CO-  
14 BENEFITS. THE MODEL HERE POTENTIALLY IS TO PURSUE A MENU  
15 APPROACH AS WE DID IN AB 1487 WHERE THE REGION WOULD HAVE  
16 SEVERAL DIFFERENT OPTIONS. WE CAN DO POLLING CLOSER TO AN  
17 ELECTION AND ASSESS WHAT IS MOST SUPPORTABLE BY THE VOTERS, BY  
18 STAKEHOLDERS, ETC. BECAUSE ULTIMATELY, WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO  
19 PURSUE SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE PASSED BY THE VOTERS. NEXT  
20 SLIDE. SO THESE ARE THE OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE ANALYZED AND THEN  
21 THERE'S A COUPLE OR ONE MORE THAT I'LL TOUCH ON THAT CAME UP  
22 THROUGH THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. BUT FOR HALF CENT SALES  
23 TAX, THAT RAISES APPROXIMATELY \$1 BILLION ACROSS THE NINE  
24 COUNTIES. THAT IS ASSUMING THE NINE COUNTIES. WE LOOKED AT AN  
25 INCOME TAX AND PAYROLL TAX WHICH ARE DEFINITELY NEW TERRAIN



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 FOR CALIFORNIA AND FOR THE BAY AREA WITH RESPECT TO  
2 TRANSPORTATION. BUT THERE ARE A LOT OF SUBREGIONS, CITIES,  
3 METROPOLITAN AREAS THAT DO HAVE INCOME TAXES. NEW YORK CITY  
4 BEING A VERY NOTABLE ONE WITH A PRETTY SUBSTANTIAL TAX. IN THE  
5 BAY AREA, A .17% INCOME TAX COULD GENERATE \$1 BILLION A YEAR.  
6 FOR A PAYROLL TAX, THIS COULD BE JUST AT THE EMPLOYER LEVEL.  
7 IT COULD BE PAID BY THE EMPLOYER AND THE EMPLOYEE. LIKE SOCIAL  
8 SECURITY. AND THAT WOULD BE .36% TAX. CORPORATE HEAD TAX AND  
9 PARCEL TAX YOU CAN SEE HERE ARE QUITE HIGH ON A PER UNIT  
10 BASIS. AND SO WE'RE ACTUALLY RECOMMENDING TO PULL OFF THE  
11 CORPORATE HEAD TAX. IN OUR CONVERSATIONS WITH THE BUSINESS  
12 COMMUNITY, I THINK THIS WAS VIEWED AS MORE ONEROUS AND LET  
13 EQUITABLE THAN A PAYROLL TAX. AND THEN A PARCEL TAX, YOU KNOW,  
14 YOU CAN SEE THIS IS A VERY HIGH AMOUNT. \$467. WE DON'T THINK  
15 THAT WOULD PASS. YOU KNOW, EVEN AT A MAJORITY THRESHOLD. AND  
16 SO WHAT WE'RE PURSUING NOW IS SOME FURTHER ANALYSIS TO SEE  
17 WHAT THE RATE WOULD BE AT A PER SQUARE FOOT BASIS. AND THEN  
18 LASTLY, A ROAD USAGE CHARGE. THIS IS ONE THAT WE'RE NOT  
19 PROPOSING THAT WE COULD DO IN 2026 BUT POTENTIALLY IF THE  
20 LEGISLATURE AND THE COMMISSION WANTED TO PURSUE THE OPTION TO  
21 DO MULTIPLE MEASURES OVER TIME. SO PURSUE SOMETHING IN 2026.  
22 MAYBE 10 YEARS LATER PURSUE SOMETHING ELSE. IF THE STATE DOES  
23 DEVELOP A ROAD USAGE CHARGE TO REPLACE THE GAS TAX, PERHAPS WE  
24 COULD HAVE A REGIONAL ADD-ON. SO THAT'S THE IDEA THERE. NEXT  
25 SLIDE. SO OUR RECOMMENDATION HERE, AGAIN, IS TO REVISE THE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 PARCEL TAX TO PER SQUARE FOOT, REMOVE THE CORPORATE HEAD TAX,  
2 AND THEN A NUMBER OF STAKEHOLDERS SUGGESTED LOOKING AT A  
3 VEHICLE REGISTRATION SURCHARGE THAT WOULD BE ASSOCIATED WITH  
4 THE VALUE OF THE VEHICLE WHICH IS SIMILAR TO WHAT WAS PASSED  
5 IN SB 1 A FEW YEARS AGO WHERE FOR THE MOST HIGHEST COST  
6 VEHICLES, IT'S A HIGH RATE. LOWEST COST, IT'S LOWER. SO IT'S  
7 MORE EQUITABLE IN THAT SENSE. A CONCERN THERE, IT WOULD STILL  
8 BE -- YOU COULD NOT LIKELY PASS THE MEASURE THAT WOULD  
9 GENERATE \$1 BILLION A YEAR WITH A VEHICLE REGISTRATION  
10 SURCHARGE. THE AMOUNT WOULD BE VERY HIGH. SO THIS COULD,  
11 AGAIN, SIMILAR TO THE ROAD USAGE CHARGE, MAYBE IT'S SOMETHING  
12 WE HAVE IN OUR TOOL KIT FOR DOWN THE LINE BUT IT WOULDN'T MEET  
13 OUR NEEDS IN THE NEAR TERM. NEXT SLIDE. SO ONE OF THE PIECES  
14 OF FEEDBACK WE GOT FROM THE LEG COMMITTEE OVER THE LAST FEW  
15 MONTHS, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THE MONEY. WHAT ABOUT POLICIES?  
16 HOW ARE WE GOING TO MAKE SURE WE'RE DRIVING TOWARDS THE  
17 OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO SEE. AND SO NEXT, I'LL TALK A LITTLE  
18 BIT MORE ABOUT THAT. UNDER THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, THEY  
19 IDENTIFIED FIVE TRANSFORMATIONAL OUTCOMES THAT WERE REALLY,  
20 YOU KNOW, THE FOCUS OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND  
21 THERE IS A GRAPHIC HERE THAT ILLUSTRATES THOSE. FARES AND  
22 PAYMENT. CUSTOMER INFORMATION SO SIGNAGE, REAL-TIME SCHEDULE  
23 INFORMATION. DELIVERING A BETTER AND FASTER NETWORK. SO  
24 TRANSIT PRIORITY. ACCESSIBILITY. MAKING SURE THE TRANSIT  
25 SYSTEM IS ACCESSIBLE FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES. AND THEN



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 LASTLY, FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE. WE DID POLL ON THIS AS WELL. SO  
2 WE ASKED VOTERS, YOU KNOW, IF THERE WERE TRANSPORTATION  
3 MEASURE, HOW IMPORTANT THAT IT INCLUDE THESE PROVISIONS? AND  
4 THE MOST POPULAR POLICY PROVISION WAS THAT IT HAS STRONG  
5 OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY TO ENSURE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT  
6 MANAGEMENT OF TRANSIT AT 80% FELT THAT WAS VERY IMPORTANT OR  
7 IMPORTANT. NEXT, CREATING A SEAMLESS NETWORK WITH COORDINATED  
8 FARES, ROUTES, AND SCHEDULES. 73% THOUGHT THAT WAS IMPORTANT.  
9 AND LASTLY, 61% SUPPORT THE IDEA OF BEING ONE REGIONAL AGENCY  
10 RESPONSIBLE FOR SETTING FARES, COORDINATING DIFFERENT SERVICE  
11 SCHEDULES, AND CREATING CONSISTENT MAPS AND SIGNAGE, WHICH WAS  
12 REALLY THE CHARGE OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. NEXT  
13 SLIDE. NOW WE COME TO THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON THE POLICY  
14 SIDE AND THAT IS ENABLING LEGISLATION INCLUDES PROVISIONS TO  
15 STRENGTHEN MTC'S ROLE AS A TRANSIT NETWORK MANAGER, INCLUDING  
16 THROUGH STATUTORY CHANGE TO ACCELERATE IMPLEMENTATION OF KEY  
17 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN -- EXCUSE ME -- ITEMS. AND WE ARE  
18 SEEKING COMMISSION DIRECTION ON THIS TODAY AS WE WORK TO  
19 DEVELOP OUR JANUARY PROPOSAL. AND THEN NEXT, OTHER TOPIC  
20 RELATED TO REFORM IS AROUND GOVERNANCE. IN OUR PRESENTATION TO  
21 THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE -- SORRY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
22 THANKS, ALEX. AT OUR PRESENTATION A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO TO THE  
23 LEG COMMITTEE, WE PROVIDED AN OVERVIEW OF STUDIES THAT THE  
24 COMMISSION HAS DONE OVER THE LAST 15 YEARS OF GOVERNANCE.  
25 LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATION AROUND POTENTIAL BUS OPERATORS.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 CONSTITUTIONAL CONSOLIDATION OR FUNCTIONAL CONSOLIDATION OF  
2 THE RAIL SYSTEM. WITH THE FOCUS OF BOTH CUSTOMER ENHANCEMENTS.  
3 WHAT WE'VE BEEN FOCUSING ON IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
4 AS WELL AS POTENTIAL COST SAVINGS WHICH WAS THE FOCUS OF THE  
5 TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY PROJECT. AND THEN MOST RECENTLY, THE  
6 RAIL PARTNERSHIP STUDY WHICH LOOKED ALSO AT MEGA-PROJECTS  
7 DELIVERY. WE HAVE I THINK IT'S OVER \$50 BILLION WORTH OF RAIL  
8 CAPITAL INVESTMENT THAT'S INCLUDED IN THE PLAN. AND WE ALL  
9 KNOW THAT DELIVERING MEGA-PROJECTS IS A SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE.  
10 AND SO IS THERE A WAY TO COORDINATE AND HAVE DIFFERENT TYPE OF  
11 GOVERNANCE AND OVERSIGHT TO HELP WITH THAT CAPITAL PROJECT  
12 DELIVERY? WE'RE NOT MAKING A RECOMMENDATION ON THESE ITEMS  
13 HERE TODAY. WE REALLY WOULD LIKE YOUR FEEDBACK ON WHETHER  
14 STAFF SHOULD BE UNDERTAKING FURTHER ANALYSIS AND DEVELOPMENT  
15 TO DEVELOP THESE IDEAS FURTHER. NEXT YEAR AND ALSO SEPARATELY  
16 WHETHER ANY OF THESE TOPICS SHOULD BE CONSIDERED FOR POTENTIAL  
17 INCLUSION IN THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION.  
18 AND THEN I'LL JUST NOTE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE SEEN WHEN IT COMES  
19 TO DRIVING STUDIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE RELATED TO ANY  
20 KIND OF GOVERNANCE CHANGES, IT SEEMS TO BE QUITE HELPFUL TO  
21 HAVE THE LEGISLATURE PROVIDE THAT DIRECTION. SO THAT'S  
22 SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. WHETHER THAT'S A RECOMMENDATION IN  
23 LEGISLATION TO STUDY AND DEVELOP A PLAN OR ACTUALLY TO  
24 IMPLEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. AND SO JUST WITH A PREVIEW OF WHAT'S  
25 NEXT. AGAIN, WE'RE COMING BACK TO THE LEG COMMITTEE JANUARY



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 12. SEEKING APPROVAL OF A PROPOSED OUTLINE OF THE LEGISLATION.  
2 COMING TO THE COMMISSION, JANUARY 24. AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO  
3 BE CONTINUING OUR ENGAGEMENT WITH BAY AREA LEGISLATORS. AS  
4 NOTED IN THE MEMO, SENATOR WIENER SAID HE'S COMMITTED TO  
5 AUTHORIZING THIS LEGISLATION WITH AN UNDERSTANDING THAT MTC  
6 WOULD BE THE SPONSOR OF IT. IF THE COMMISSION APPROVES THAT.  
7 AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO BE CONTINUING OUR STAKEHOLDER  
8 ENGAGEMENT THROUGHOUT. AND WITH THAT I WILL CLOSE AND LOOK  
9 FORWARD TO YOUR FEEDBACK AND DISCUSSION.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, STAFF. DETAILED  
12 REPORT. WE'VE SEEN THIS MULTIPLE TIMES NOW. BUT I DON'T WANT  
13 TO UNDERScore THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS COMMISSION. I THINK WE  
14 HAD A VERY ROBUST CONVERSATION AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL WHEN  
15 THIS CAME BEFORE US WITH CHAIR CANEPA. I SUPPORT THIS  
16 DIRECTION. I STILL REMAIN CONFIDENT THAT EVERYTHING HAS TO  
17 STAY ON THE TABLE. I ALSO EX-KNOWLEDGE THERE ARE SOME PRESSING  
18 CONCERNS AROUND THE BAY AREA AROUND THE FISCAL CLIFF BUT I  
19 THINK THIS IS A MOMENT WHERE WE HAVE TO WALK AND CHEW GUM AT  
20 THE SAME TIME AND PART IS LOOKING AT THIS REGIONAL MEASURE  
21 HOLISTICALLY. WHAT OUTCOMES DO WE WANT TO ACHIEVE THAT ARE  
22 MEANINGFUL THAT MAKE A REAL DIFFERENCE? AND PART OF IS GIVING  
23 MTC THE AUTHORITY TO EFFECTUATE THOSE OUTCOMES. PART IS  
24 LOOKING AT THE GOVERNANCE SYSTEM AND THE RIGHT NUMBER OF  
25 OPERATORS THAT WE HAVE FOR THE BETTERMENT OF THE RIDERS. I





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 ACKNOWLEDGE THERE ARE CONCERNS AROUND THE FISCAL CLIFF AND  
2 HAVING -- NEEDING TIME TO PLAN APPROPRIATELY. SO I THINK WE  
3 HAVE TO LOOK AT WHAT REVENUE MEASURES, WHAT CAN WE DO NOW TO  
4 ADDRESS THAT CONCERN AROUND THE FISCAL CLIFF. THAT CAN INCLUDE  
5 BRIDGE TOLLS. WE HAVE TO TALK ABOUT THE REHAB CONCERNS AROUND  
6 THE BRIDGE. FOR ME PERSONALLY, I THINK I'D LIKE TO SEE ALL OF  
7 THE ABOVE. NOT TO PRIORITIZE ONE OR THE OTHER, BUT I THINK WE  
8 HAVE TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY RIGHT NOW FOR  
9 THIS REGIONAL MEASURE AND THAT NEEDS OUR ATTENTION AND OUR  
10 COMMITMENT TO EXPLORE. WE HAVE LEGISLATORS SUPPORTING THAT AS  
11 WELL. WE ALSO HAVE TO SAME TIME LOOK AT WHAT ARE THE OTHER  
12 REVENUE MEASURES TO ADDRESS THE CONCERNS OUR REGION IS FACING  
13 TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THAT SEAMLESS TRANSIT NETWORK? THOSE ARE  
14 SOME OF MY INITIAL COMMENTS. I'LL SEE IF ANY COMMISSIONERS  
15 HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS RIGHT NOW. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. A HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK  
18 HAS GONE INTO THIS. I WANTED TO THANK THE CHAIR FOR HIS  
19 COMMENTS. THE POLLING ON THIS DOES NOT LOOK GOOD. WE NEED TO  
20 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. WHEN YOU HAVE A MORE THAN 10% GAP IN SORT OF  
21 SUPPORT, TO BE ABLE TO PAR SOMETHING AND FUNDAMENTALS,  
22 CONCERNS ABOUT TRANSPORTATION AND THEY'RE FEELINGS OF THE BAY  
23 AREA BEING ON THE WRONG TRACK AND THEY'RE FEELING OVERTAXED  
24 AND THINGS LIKE THAT, THE FUNDAMENTALS FOR THIS MEASURE ARE  
25 ALSO NOT GOOD. IT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE WE TAKE THE BALLOT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 QUESTION AND GET A 10% POP OR IF WE ADDED OH, A LITTLE BIT OF,  
2 YOU KNOW, POTHOLES WE WOULD SEE A 10% POP. IT FEELS LIKE THE  
3 FUNDAMENTALS ARE BAD NOW. THE MEASURE IS COMING IN 2026 OR THE  
4 PLAN WOULD BE TO PUT THE MEASURE ON IN 2026. AND OBVIOUSLY IF  
5 WE LOOK BACK AT THREE YEARS, THE FUNDAMENTALS WOULD HAVE BEEN  
6 REALLY DIFFERENT. LOOKING FORWARD THREE YEARS, THE  
7 FUNDAMENTALS MAY CHANGE AS WELL. VOTER SENTIMENT MAY CHANGE.  
8 BUT IN CONVERSATIONS I HAD WITH THE CHAIR AND WITH OUR  
9 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, I'VE BEEN REALLY, REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT  
10 OUR REGION PUTTING ALL OUR EGGS IN THIS BASKET. WE KNOW THAT  
11 THE FISCAL CLIFF IS GOING TO TURN IN 2026 MOST LIKELY FOR OUR  
12 LARGEST OPERATORS AND WE'RE GOING TO BE FACED WITH THE SAME  
13 CRISIS THAT WE WERE FACED WITH LAST YEAR WITH SORT OF THE  
14 POTENTIAL FOR MASSIVE SERVICE CUTS THAT ARE REALLY  
15 DEBILITATING, NOT ONLY FOR THE RIDERS BUT FOR THE WHOLE  
16 REGION. AND SO I AM AS MUCH AS ANYBODY EXCITED IF WE COULD  
17 PASS THIS MEASURE BUT I FEEL IT IS IRRESPONSIBLE FOR US TO  
18 ONLY WORK ON THIS MEASURE. AND SO I REALLY APPRECIATE THE  
19 COMMENTS THAT THE CHAIR MADE, WHILE WE ARE GOING TO MOVE  
20 FORWARD TO SEE IF WE CAN GET THE LEGISLATIVE AUTHORIZATION FOR  
21 THIS, TRY AND PUT IT ON THE BALLOT, IF THE SITUATION DOES NOT  
22 CHANGE WITH THE VOTERS THAT WE WILL AT THE SAME TIME BE  
23 ENGAGING IN A DISCUSSION WITH THE COMMISSION AND OTHER  
24 STAKEHOLDERS ABOUT WHAT WOULD BE -- LET'S CALL IT A PLAN B --  
25 AND WHAT HAPPENS IF WE CAN'T GET THIS MEASURE ON THE BALLOT,



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IF WE PUT THIS MEASURE ON THE BALLOT AND IT FAILS AND WHAT  
2 WE'LL BE ABLE TO DO -- WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE SITTING THERE  
3 NOVEMBER 7 OR WHENEVER IT'S GOING TO BE 2026 AND JUST SORT OF  
4 WITHOUT ANY OTHER OPTIONS AND OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES GOING  
5 BANKRUPT LIKE THEY WERE BEFORE. SO IS THAT AN ACCURATE SORT OF  
6 --

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YEAH. WHAT I WOULD SAY, VICE CHAIR  
9 JOSEFOWITZ. WE SEE PROMISE. WE SEE HOPE. AND WE HAVE TO  
10 CONTINUE TO EVALUATE THAT HOPE AND PROMISE AND WE'RE GOING TO  
11 LET THE DATA MAKE DECISIONS AT THE SAME TIME. I THINK THE  
12 LEGISLATION PROVIDING MTC AUTHORITY IS ALSO A CRITICAL  
13 OBJECTIVE GOAL THAT WE WISH TO ACHIEVE. I THINK WHAT WE'RE  
14 SAYING THE SAME THING. COMMISSIONER NOACK AND THEN GLOVER.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** I WANT TO ADD ON TO THAT DISCUSSION ABOUT HOPE AND  
17 WHAT HAS TO HAPPEN IN ORDER TO GET A MEASURE PASSED BY 2026.  
18 BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS SOME MOVEMENTS IN SMALL AREAS OF  
19 IMPROVEMENTS. IN ORDER TO GET A MEASURE PASSED, I THINK PEOPLE  
20 REALLY WANT TO SEE SOME OF THE IMPROVEMENTS BEFORE THE MEASURE  
21 PASSES. NOT VOTING FOR A MEASURE AND THEN HOPING THE  
22 TRANSFORMATION OCCURS. I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY  
23 IMPORTANT THAT WE SEE SOME OF THOSE AREAS THAT PEOPLE ARE  
24 REALLY LOOKING FOR NOW. IT'S INTERESTING BECAUSE I HAVE SEEN A  
25 COUPLE OF THE COMMENTS. I ACTUALLY CAME IN -- I CAN'T REMEMBER



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WHY I WAS IN HERE. ON BART THE OTHER WAY -- OH, YEAH. TO SEE  
2 "THE NUTCRACKER." THE TRAIN WAS CLEAN. WE WERE MET BY THE  
3 FRIENDLY AMBASSADOR. WE HAD TWO BART POLICE GO THROUGH. FRIEND  
4 I WAS WITH IS IN THE GARBAGE BUSINESS, NOT IN THE TRANSIT  
5 BUSINESS. SHE SAID, THAT WAS A GREAT EXPERIENCE. I SAID, OH,  
6 THAT'S GOOD NEWS. I'M THINKING, A LOT MORE PEOPLE HAVE TO SEE  
7 THOSE KINDS OF THINGS NOW IN ORDER FOR US TO GET A MEASURE  
8 PASSED. AND SO SOME OF THE AUTHORITY, MY UNDERSTANDING,  
9 WHATEVER AUTHORITY GETS PASSED SORT OF STARTS PRIOR TO A BILL  
10 BEING PASSED. SO I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP THAT IN  
11 MIND, WHAT AUTHORITY WE'RE LOOKING FOR, TO MAKE SOME CHANGES  
12 SO THAT PEOPLE START BELIEVING WE'RE ON THE RIGHT TRACK WHEN  
13 IT COMES DOWN TO DO A MEASURE. SO I THINK THAT'S SUPER  
14 IMPORTANT. AND TWO THINGS I WOULD SAY FOCUSING ON THAT. IT'S  
15 REALLY GOT TO BE CUSTOMER FOCUSED. WHETHER THAT BE, YOU KNOW,  
16 POTHOLES IN THE ROADS OR SOME OF THESE TRANSIT EXPERIENCE, BUT  
17 IT'S ALSO GOT TO BE -- SHUT ME DOWN. SORRY. DID YOU DO THAT TO  
18 ME? YEAH, OK. BUT IT'S REALLY GOT TO BE FOCUSED, YOU KNOW,  
19 FINANCIALLY AS WELL ON BEING EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT. I THINK  
20 EVERYTHING WE DO WE HAVE TO KEEP BOTH OF THOSE LENSES IN MIND.  
21 THANKS.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU. I THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT TODAY ON  
2 THIS INFORMATIONAL ITEM BECAUSE I THINK IT'S REALLY GOT TO BE  
3 IMPORTANT, AS STARTED BY VICE CHAIR THAT THIS MEASURE ISN'T  
4 LOOKING GOOD AND POLLING WELL. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S REALLY  
5 GOING TO HAVE TO HAPPEN IS TO BE ABLE TO GO OUT TO THE  
6 SUBREGIONS AND UNDERSTAND WHAT THE NEEDS ARE AND TRY TO MAKE  
7 SURE THAT THOSE ARE ACCOMMODATED. AND PARTICULAR, I WOULD JUST  
8 SAY WHEN WE TALK ABOUT CONSOLIDATION OF SERVICES, WE NEED TO  
9 REALLY DEFINE WHAT THAT MEANS. AND HOW THAT'S GOING TO IMPACT  
10 COMMUNITIES. SO I HOPE BEFORE THE 12TH, WE WOULD HAVE GONE OUT  
11 AND DONE OUR HOMEWORK WITH THE SUBREGIONAL AUTHORITIES TO JUST  
12 UNDERSTAND WHAT THE NEEDS ARE AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO BEST  
13 ACCOMMODATE THOSE. BECAUSE I'M REALLY CONCERNED IN TERMS OF  
14 THE BUS TRANSIT.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER GLOVER.  
17 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND THEN SPERING.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I AGREE. I AGREE, TOO, I DON'T THINK IT  
20 REALLY LOOKS GOOD GOING OUT FOR A MEASURE, EVEN 2026 SEEMS A  
21 LITTLE TOO SOON. AND I WOULD JUST ASK THAT WE DO REACH OUT TO  
22 THE SUBREGION -- THE COUNTIES, THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. NOT TO BE  
23 PAROCHIAL, BUT I WILL BE. I HAVE SOME GRAVE CONCERNS HOW THIS  
24 WILL AFFECT SOUTH COUNTY. WE HAVE MEASURES OF OUR OWN. WE HAVE  
25 SALES TAX THAT ARE HELPING TO FUND OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND SOME



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OF THEM ARE SET TO EXPIRE IN THE NEAR TERM. AND SO THIS CAN  
2 SEVERELY IMPACT WHAT WE CAN DO IN OUR COUNTY. AND SO I THINK  
3 WE REALLY NEED TO HAVE THOSE DEEPER CONVERSATIONS. I DON'T  
4 REALLY FEEL COMFORTABLE SAYING, YEAH, WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD  
5 ON THIS. AND I ALSO WILL SAY, I DON'T AGREE, I DON'T THINK  
6 FRANKLY, EVERYTHING -- EVERYTHING COULD BE ON THE TABLE BUT  
7 HONESTLY, I DON'T REALISTICALLY IT SHOULD BE BECAUSE FROM MY  
8 UNDERSTANDING HOW THESE THINGS HAVE BEEN STUDIED IN THE PAST,  
9 THERE HASN'T BEEN A LOT OF MOVEMENT, IF YOU ASK ME, ON SOME OF  
10 THESE STUDIES. AND SO I THINK THE FUNDING IS ACTUALLY NOT THAT  
11 MUCH, TO BE HONEST. SO WE CAN'T DO EVERYTHING. SO WE NEED TO  
12 BE VERY SPECIFIC ON WHAT WE CAN DO. AND FRANKLY, IF YOU ASK  
13 ME, WHAT WE HAVE WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND, YOU  
14 KNOW, THE THINGS WE'VE BEEN TALKING ABOUT, THAT'S PROBABLY  
15 ABOUT WHAT WE WOULD BE ABLE TO FUND, TO BE HONEST. SO I THINK  
16 THAT WE SHOULD ACTUALLY FOCUS NARROWLY ON WHAT WE REALLY WANT  
17 TO PRIORITIZE. AND I WILL JUST SAY THIS. I WILL PUT IT OUT ON  
18 THE TABLE. I KNOW OTHERS WILL CHIME IN IT. BUT THE BART  
19 CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATED IDEA, I DON'T KNOW WHERE IT CAME FROM.  
20 IF YOU ASK ANYBODY IN MY NECK OF THE WOODS, NO ONE IS  
21 SUPPORTING IF. YOU'VE SEEN ALL OF THE LETTERS THAT ARE AGAINST  
22 IT. WHEN YOU HAVE OUR FEDERAL LEGISLATORS AND OUR STATE  
23 LEGISLATORS SAYING THEY'RE AGAINST IT, I DON'T KNOW WHY WE'RE  
24 DISCUSSING THIS. ALL WE'RE DOING IS FUELING THE FIRE OF  
25 OPPOSITION FOR THE MEASURE SO I WOULD LIKE THAT TO BE TAKEN



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 OFF. FRANKLY, IT DIDN'T EVEN POLL VERY HIGH. IT WAS THE LAST  
2 ITEM. IF YOU REALLY WANT TO GO INTO CONSOLIDATION, THEN I  
3 THINK IT'S THE BUS OPERATOR CONSOLIDATION ITEM THAT POLLED  
4 HIGHER. SO THAT SHOULD BE DISCUSSED FIRST. SO I THINK IF WE'RE  
5 REALLY GOING TO GO DOWN THIS PATH, ONE, NARROW DOWN WHAT WE'RE  
6 TALKING ABOUT. TWO, TAKE OUT THE ITEMS THAT ARE CATCHING  
7 OPPOSITION. AND THREE, MAKE SURE THAT WE REALLY DISCUSS THIS  
8 WITH THE AGENCIES TO SEE WHAT THE IMPLICATIONS WOULD BE. THANK  
9 YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING AND  
12 THEN MOULTON-PETERS.

13

14 **JAMES SPERING:** WE'VE RECENTLY BEEN ACCUSED FOR NOT HAVING A  
15 VISION. I THINK THAT'S A VERY FAIR CRITICISM. CHANGE IS VERY  
16 DIFFICULT. AS A PAST ELECTED OFFICIAL, I KNOW HOW IT IS  
17 DIFFICULT TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE ISSUES. I THINK IT'S  
18 SHORTSIGHTED IF WE JUST TAKE THINGS OFF THE TABLE. I THINK  
19 MAYBE THE WORD ISN'T CONSOLIDATE. MAYBE THE WORD IS  
20 COORDINATE. TO AT LEAST LOOK AT HOW YOU CAN MAKE THESE SYSTEMS  
21 FUNCTION BETTER, I THINK WE HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO DO THAT.  
22 I REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF BRINGING THIS FORWARD AND FINALLY  
23 CHALLENGING THE COMMISSION. COMMISSION HAS TO START WEIGHING  
24 IN ON THESE ISSUES. UNTIL WE PUT VERY SPECIFIC -- YOU KNOW, WE  
25 HAD THE SKELETON IN HERE. WE NEED TO START PUTTING FLESH ON



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IT. WE NEED TO BE SPECIFIC WHAT OUR EXPECTATIONS ARE OR WHAT  
2 WE WANT. YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE EXAMPLES THAT SOMEONE USED IS  
3 LIKE THE SENIOR DISCOUNT. IT SHOULD BE THE SAME THROUGHOUT THE  
4 WHOLE REGION. WE SHOULD HAVE VERY SPECIFIC THINGS WE'RE  
5 RECOMMENDING. WE'RE NOT DOING THAT. WE'RE NOT PRESENTING THE  
6 VISION TO THE PUBLIC. AND THAT'S WHY THIS POLL IS AS BAD AS IT  
7 IS. I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE MOVE FORWARD ON THIS  
8 ISSUE BECAUSE COME '26, THE CLIMATE MAY BE RIGHT. THE  
9 REQUIREMENT MAY BE NEEDED. THERE'S A LOT OF THINGS THAT WILL  
10 CHANGE OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS AND I THINK WE GOT TO BE  
11 FLEXIBLE ENOUGH TO DEAL WITH THAT. IT'S REALLY I THINK  
12 SHORTSIGHTED TO THINK WE'RE GOING BACK TO PRE-COVID. I REALLY  
13 BELIEVE IT'S A BAD CALCULATION BECAUSE IT'S NOT GOING BACK  
14 THERE. AND SO WE HAVE GOT TO START LOOKING AT, YOU KNOW, WHAT  
15 IS THIS NEW SYSTEM? I HAVE A LITTLE EXCEPTION WITH YOUR NORTH  
16 STAR VISION STATEMENT WHERE YOU SAY THE BAY AREA HAS A WORLD-  
17 CLASS RELIABLE. WELL, THE POLL SHOWS US THE PUBLIC DON'T THINK  
18 WE HAVE A WORLD-CLASS SYSTEM. YOU KNOW, MAYBE THAT SHOULD SAY  
19 THE BAY AREA REQUIRES, YOU KNOW, A WORLD-CLASS SYSTEM. BUT WE  
20 HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO TO SHOW THE PUBLIC THIS VISION AND I  
21 THINK WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO SHOW THE LEGISLATURE THIS  
22 VISION WE HAVE AND BE VERY SPECIFIC ON WHAT IT IS. AND THEN  
23 HAVE THE DEBATE ON THOSE ISSUES. TO ME, I'D LIKE TO SEE WHERE  
24 WE SAY CONSOLIDATION, CONSOLIDATION/COORDINATE I THINK IS  
25 GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF THE ANGST AWAY FROM MANY OF THESE





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 SMALLER OPERATORS. SOME OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS, YOU MAY WANT  
2 TO KEEP THOSE BOARDS OR WHOEVER IS GOVERNING THOSE IN PLACE  
3 BUT THEY'RE PART OF THIS COORDINATED SYSTEM. BUT I JUST WOULD  
4 LIKE STAFF TO START REALLY ZOOMING IN MORE DETAILED. I CAN'T  
5 THANK YOU ENOUGH FOR BRINGING THIS DOCUMENT FORWARD AND  
6 ESPECIALLY THIS ITEM 9, THE ONE YOU PUT TOGETHER. IT'S ABOUT  
7 TIME THAT THIS COMMISSION STARTS TALKING ABOUT THESE ISSUES  
8 AND HAVING THIS DISCUSSION SO STAFF KNOWS HOW AGGRESSIVE WE  
9 WANT YOU TO BE. BUT IT WOULD BE SHORTSIGHTED FOR US NOT TO AT  
10 LEAST START LOOKING AT THESE THINGS AND DEVELOPING WHAT IS  
11 THAT WORLD-CLASS SYSTEM THAT WE WANT.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SPERING.  
14 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS.

15

16 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** WE ARE AT THE BEGINNING OF AN  
17 EXPLORATORY PROCESS RIGHT NOW. AS ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES,  
18 THEY'RE FOND OF SAYING, YOU DON'T FINISH A RACE YOU DON'T  
19 START. AND WE HAVE TO START. WE HAVE TO PUT THE FOCUS ON THIS.  
20 THINGS ARE GOING TO EVOLVE OVER TIME. TWO YEARS IS NOT A VERY  
21 LONG TIME. AND SO I THINK WE NEED TO BE COMPREHENSIVE IN OUR  
22 LOOK AND THEN WE NEED TO BE REALISTIC, TOO. DIRECTOR SPERING,  
23 IT'S RIGHT ON. TO ACCOMPLISH THAT IN TWO YEARS, WHETHER IT'S  
24 SMALL AGENCIES OR THE LARGE ONES, SO I THINK COORDINATION IS  
25 THE WAY TO LOOK AT IT. I ALSO THINK TAKING A SYSTEMS VIEW,



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WHICH IS IN THE PROPOSED BUCKET OF FUNDING, IT'S NOT JUST  
2 SOMETHING FOR EVERYBODY. I WANT TO SHARE A CONVERSATION I HAD  
3 WITH ALLEN BURNETT THAT I HAD IN SAN RAFAEL WHO I SPOKE TO  
4 RECENTLY. LOOK, WE OFFER TRANSIT BUT SOME OF OUR FOLKS WHO ARE  
5 TRANSIT DEPENDENT WANT GET TO THE TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY DON'T  
6 HAVE THE SIDEWALKS AND THE ABILITY TO GET THERE. SO IT'S NOT  
7 JUST ABOUT DOING POTHOLES AND SOMETHING FOR ALL USERS. WE HAVE  
8 TO HAVE A SYSTEM THAT PEOPLE CAN GET TO AND USE SO THAT'S WHY  
9 WE DO ALL THE DIFFERENT PARTS OF IT, I THINK. AND I THINK THE  
10 FLEXIBLE FUNDING MAKES A LOT OF SENSE BECAUSE THOSE NEEDS WILL  
11 BE DEFINED OVER TIME. SO WE NEED TO GO INTO IT THAT WE'RE  
12 GOING TO GET CLARITY OVER TIME IF WE STAY ON THIS. AND SO THEN  
13 I THINK I HAVE ALREADY COVERED. IN THE GOVERNANCE, I WOULD  
14 CERTAINLY LOOK FOR FLEXIBLE -- FOR FUNCTIONAL CONSOLIDATE --  
15 COORDINATION. BUT I THINK WHILE THESE AGENCIES ARE UNDER  
16 DURESS FINANCIALLY IS NOT THE TIME TO TRY TO TAKE ON  
17 STRUCTURAL CHANGE. THEY'LL CERTAINLY LOOK AT THAT, I'M SURE.  
18 ANYWAY, I'M GLAD WE'RE MOVING INTO THIS AND HAVING A PLAN B IS  
19 A GOOD IDEA. I AGREE WITH YOU. AND MORE SOURCES OF FUNDING. SO  
20 IT IS EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE. I THINK WE HAVE TO START.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, MOULTON-PETERS.  
23 COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1   **DAVID RABBITT:** I DO WANT TO ECHO THOSE THINGS GOING FORWARD. I  
2   DO THINK TWO YEARS, I BELIEVE WE NEED TO HAVE A FULL-COURT  
3   PRESS, NOT ONLY THE NEEDS OF TRANSIT BUT ALSO BE OPEN AND  
4   HONEST AS WE TALK TO PEOPLE ABOUT HOW WE ACTUALLY FUND, NOT  
5   JUST TRANSIT BUT EVERYTHING ELSE. IN MY COUNTY ALONE, WE'VE  
6   INCREASED SALES TAX -- I DON'T KNOW -- FIVE TIMES IN MY  
7   TENURE. AND IT'S AT 10%. AND WE HAVE A HALF CENT FOR FIRE. WE  
8   HAVE TWO TRANSPORTATION MEASURES NOW. HOW DO YOU GO INTO A  
9   COUNTY LIKE THAT OR ANY OTHER COUNTY IN THE BAY AREA AND SAY  
10   THIS ADDITIONAL HALF CENT WILL BRING HOME OR GET YOU SOMETHING  
11   BIGGER, BETTER, BRIGHTER? TO THE KIND OF GENERATIONAL CHANGE?  
12   I TALK TO PEOPLE. WE SUFFERED THROUGH MASSIVE WILDFIRES. WE  
13   WANT TO DO A HALF CENT FIRE TAX AND PEOPLE TELL ME, ISN'T THAT  
14   A CORE GOVERNMENT SERVICE THAT SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN THE MONEY  
15   THAT WE ALREADY SPENT? AND ONE COULD ACTUALLY SAY THE SAME  
16   THING ABOUT TRANSIT. AND THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER IS IN THE BAY  
17   AREA, AND TO THE CONSOLIDATION ISSUE, WE HAVE 27 AGENCIES  
18   BECAUSE OF ALL THE DIFFERENT MECHANISMS THAT PUT THEM IN  
19   PLACE, INCLUDING ALL THE DIFFERENT LOCAL SALES TAX MEASURES  
20   AND MONEYS FROM DIFFERENT POTS BECAUSE IT WASN'T HAPPENING AT  
21   THE STATE LEVEL AS IT WAS BACK EAST. AND SO THAT JUST CREATES  
22   A -- I DON'T MEAN TO BE CYNICAL, ESPECIALLY THIS TIME OF THE  
23   YEAR, BUT IT TAKES A BROADER CONVERSATION TO BE OPEN AND  
24   HONEST WITH PEOPLE ABOUT WHY ARE WE ASKING FOR THE SIGNIFICANT  
25   AMOUNT OF MONEY AND WHAT WILL IT ACTUALLY GET US AND WHAT WILL



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 I SEE -- AT THE END OF THE DAY, PEOPLE VOTE FOR THINGS THAT  
2 MAKE THEIR LIFE BETTER OR BELIEVE THAT SOME ARE ALTRUISTIC.  
3 IT'S A WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME KIND OF APPROACH AND HOW DO YOU  
4 ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS?

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND THEN DUTRA-  
7 VERNACI.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** AND I THINK WE'RE FORGETTING HERE WHAT THE POLLING  
10 IS AND WHAT OUR ELECTED PEOPLE ARE SENDING THE MESSAGE TO. I  
11 THINK MTC IS REALLY LOOKING AT A WAY -- WE HAVE A VISION.  
12 WE'VE ALREADY PUT THE VISION OUT THERE. WE DID THE  
13 TRANSFORMATION PLAN. THE PUBLIC WANTS THOSE RESULTS. WE'VE  
14 KNOWN THAT FOREVER. I THINK WE'RE STRUGGLING TO BE PUT IN A  
15 POSITION THAT WE HOLD THE OPERATORS ACCOUNTABLE. IT IS  
16 ABSOLUTELY LUDICROUS FOR BART TO HAVE LOST \$30 MILLION A YEAR  
17 AND THINK THAT'S OK. IT'S NOT. ESPECIALLY WHEN FINANCIAL  
18 CLIFFS ARE OUT THERE. WE NEED RESULTS. I THINK MTC IS LOOKING  
19 AT A WAY TO GET REALLY MORE OF THOSE RESULTS IN SUCH A WAY.  
20 WE'RE GOING ABOUT THIS THE WRONG WAY. WE HAVE LETTERS FROM  
21 LEGISLATORS WHO ARE GOING TO VOTE ON THE LEGISLATION WE'RE  
22 TRYING TO SEEK TO IMPLEMENT HERE. WE NEED THEM TO BE WORKING  
23 WITH US HERE. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND I KEEP POINTING OUT  
24 HERE THIS CONSOLIDATION OF BART AND CALTRAIN, IT'S JUST NOT A  
25 GOOD IDEA. IT WILL TEAR DOWN IN BOTH OF OUR COUNTIES HERE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 COORDINATION, ABSOLUTELY, POSITIVELY, YES. AND WHY CAN'T THEY  
2 DO IT? IF THEY NEED TO BE CALLED IN THE PRINCIPAL'S OFFICE  
3 HERE AT MTC TO COORDINATE SCHEDULES, THEN DO IT. FOR GOSH  
4 SAKES, WE HAVE SIMPLE RESULTS IN FRONT OF US THAT THE PUBLIC  
5 WANTS NOW. THEY WANT THAT NOW. BUT DO NOT IGNORE FEDERAL  
6 REPRESENTATIVES, LETTERS FROM FEDERAL REPRESENTATIVES, LETTERS  
7 FROM STATE REPRESENTATIVES, LETTERS FROM OPERATORS, EVEN. WE  
8 WANT TO MAKE THIS WORK. WE HAVE THE VISION IN FRONT OF US. I  
9 THINK THIS BODY IS LOOKING FOR, HOW DO WE MAKE THE OPERATORS  
10 DO WHAT THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO DO? YES, BART IS CLEANER. THAT'S  
11 WONDERFUL. THEY SHOULD HAVE BEEN DOING IT LONG AGO.  
12 COORDINATING SCHEDULES. WE PASSED RESOLUTIONS ON SIGNAGE. WE  
13 PASSED RESOLUTION ON WAY FINDING. HOW DO WE GET THOSE TO  
14 REALITY? THAT'S WHAT THE PUBLIC WANTS FROM US. THAT'S WHAT THE  
15 VOTERS WOULD LOOK FOR. REAL RESULTS, ACCOUNTABILITY,  
16 OVERSIGHT. WHAT WAS IT, 80%. THAT NEEDS TO BE THE FOCUS OF  
17 ANYTHING THAT'S PRESENTED TO THE LEGISLATURE AND GIVE THIS  
18 BODY THE ABILITY TO SAY, IF YOU DON'T DO IT, YOU'RE NOT  
19 GETTING THE FUNDING, PERIOD. SUFFER THE CONSEQUENCES. I THINK  
20 THAT IS THE DIRECTION WE NEED TO GO IN HERE. THAT'S WHAT THE  
21 POLLING SHOWS HERE. DO NOT, PLEASE, BE SIDETRACKED. WHEN YOU  
22 PUT THINGS IN HERE LIKE CONSOLIDATION OF BART AND CALTRAIN,  
23 YOU ARE REALLY ANNOYING PEOPLE. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON THE MEGA-  
24 PROJECTS. GRADE SEPARATION, A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS THAT WE  
25 HOPE TO GET FUNDING FOR. SO PLEASE, LET'S DIRECT OUR EFFORTS



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IN IT SUCH A WAY THAT WE GET THE PUBLIC THE RESULTS THEY HAVE  
2 ASKED FOR YEAR AFTER YEAR AFTER YEAR. I'M NOT SURE WHAT  
3 LEGISLATION CAN BE DONE IN THAT REALM. WE HAVE A LOT OF  
4 LEGISLATION ALREADY. BUT WE NEED SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO  
5 GIVE US THAT HAMMER, I GUESS YOU WANT TO CALL IT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.  
8 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS. IT HAS  
11 ME THINKING ABOUT PLAN B ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCES, DIFFERENT  
12 WAYS TO GENERATE MORE REVENUE. THE QUESTION IS -- HOW MANY  
13 MORE RIDERS DO WE NEED THROUGH FAIR BOX RECOVERY TO HAVE --  
14 FARE BOX RECOVERY TO HAVE THE SYSTEMS BE SELF-SUFFICIENT?  
15 BECAUSE TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S POINT ABOUT EVERYTHING WE'VE  
16 ALREADY SAID WE'RE GOING TO DO TO GET THINGS CLEANED UP, TO  
17 GET THEM TO FEEL SAFE, I DON'T RECALL IF IT WAS ONE OF THE  
18 POLLING QUESTIONS. BUT WAS THERE A QUESTION EVER SAYING, WOULD  
19 YOU RIDE YOUR TRANSIT IF ALL OF THE CONDITIONS WERE CORRECT?  
20 BECAUSE SOMEBODY MAY STILL SAY, NO, I NEED MY CAR BECAUSE OF  
21 A, B, AND C. SO REALLY, I THINK THE QUESTION WAS, WHAT IS OUR  
22 GOAL? AND THE GOAL, AS WE'VE BEEN TALKING THROUGH THE  
23 TRANSFORMATION WAY FINDING IS AN IMPROVED RIDER EXPERIENCE.  
24 AND THAT'S REALLY, AS BEEN POINTED OUT, WHERE WE NEED TO BE.  
25 REGARDLESS OF WHETHER OR NOT THERE'S GOING TO BE A REVENUE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 MEASURE, THAT'S OUR GOAL ANYWAY. WE WANT THOSE THAT ARE ON  
2 TRANSIT TO ENJOY IT AND TRY TO GENERATE ADDITIONAL REVENUE.  
3 NOW, TO THE POINTS ABOUT KEEP EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE, I DID  
4 SUPPORT THAT AT OUR COMMITTEE MEETINGS. WE AGREED THAT THAT  
5 SHOULD BE THE CASE. NOW, I LOVE COMMISSIONER SPERING COMING UP  
6 WITH COORDINATION, NOT NECESSARILY INSTEAD OF, BUT I'M  
7 THINKING OF INSTEAD OF IN A LOT OF CASES CONSOLIDATION,  
8 BECAUSE TO SAY, OH, WE, BART AND CALTRAIN ALONE. AND I'M JUST  
9 USING THAT AS AN EXAMPLE. WE BART AND CALTRAIN ALONE AND GO,  
10 CONSOLIDATE ALL BUS OPERATORS. THAT'S WRONG BECAUSE AS I  
11 POINTED OUT AT OUR LAST MEETING, EVEN FOR MY LITTLE UNION CITY  
12 TRANSIT AGENCY, TO CONSOLIDATE WITH AC TRANSIT WOULD NOT GIVE  
13 THE RIDER BETTER SERVICE AND IT WOULD COST MORE. AND I'M SURE  
14 -- AND I DON'T KNOW BUT THAT'S WHY THE POINT WAS THAT WE NEED  
15 TO ACTUALLY DO AN ANALYSIS AND FIGURE OUT WHAT DOES MAKE  
16 SENSE. AS WAS POINTED OUT AT THE LAST MEETING, I THINK, THERE  
17 ARE IN THE NORTH COUNTY SOME AGENCIES THAT ARE WILLING TO HAVE  
18 THE CONVERSATION AND CONSOLIDATE. SO IN ANY CASE, I APPRECIATE  
19 THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER  
22 RONEN.

23

24 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WOULD AGREE WITH  
25 COMMISSIONER SPERING THAT WE HAVEN'T CONVINCED -- RIGHT NOW WE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 DON'T HAVE THE WORLD-CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WE NEED AND  
2 DESERVE AND THAT WE HAVEN'T CONVINCED THE PUBLIC THAT WE HAVE  
3 THE VISION TO GET US THERE. AND MY WORRY, A LITTLE BIT  
4 DIFFERENT THAN EVERYONE ELSE, I JUST DON'T KNOW THAT A BILLION  
5 IS ENOUGH AND THAT WE CAN -- WE CAN CONVINCE THE VOTERS THAT A  
6 BILLION WILL TRULY TRANSFORM THEIR EXPERIENCE. WE HAVE A \$700  
7 MILLION DEFICIT, STRUCTURAL DEFICIT PER YEAR, WHICH WILL EAT  
8 UP THE MAJORITY OF THE MONEY. SO WE'RE -- JUST TO CONTINUE THE  
9 STATUS QUO, WE NEED TO RAISE THAT AMOUNT OF MONEY. IF WE WANT  
10 TO DO SOMETHING ABOVE AND BEYOND THAT, IF WE WANT TO CREATE  
11 WORLD-CLASS BIKE -- YOU KNOW, PROTECTED BIKE SYSTEMS AND FIX  
12 OUR SIDEWALKS SO PEOPLE CAN GET TO TRANSIT EASIER, AND THEN  
13 INCREASE SERVICE AND CONNECTIVITY, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, LIKE,  
14 A \$2 BILLION MEASURE. AND SO I JUST THINK WE HAVE TO THINK  
15 BIGGER IN OUR VISION AND WE HAVE TO HAVE THE HAVE THE MONEY  
16 BEHIND THAT VISION AND THEN CONVINCING THE PUBLIC. LIKE, THIS IS  
17 WHAT -- WHAT WILL BE DIFFERENT IN YOUR BAIL LIVES IF YOU PASS  
18 THIS MEASURE. SO I'M JUST WORRIED ABOUT THE AMOUNT RIGHT NOW.  
19 I KNOW WE HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO TO GET THE TYPE OF BUY-IN TO  
20 PASS ANYTHING AT ALL. BUT I THINK OUR VISION IS A LITTLE BIT  
21 TOO LIMITED AND ACTUALLY WILL END UP HURTING US, NOT HELPING  
22 US.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

25





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I HAD A QUESTION FOR STAFF. AND THIS  
2 RELATES TO THE TIMING AND THE PRESENTATION OF THE INFORMATION  
3 THAT WE HAVE TODAY. COULD YOU WALK THROUGH THE -- JUST ONE  
4 MORE TIME, THE PROCESS YOU SEE IT GOING TOWARD THE LEGISLATURE  
5 AND IN PARTICULAR, THE TIMING RELATIVE TO WHATEVER COMES BACK,  
6 WHEN IT COMES BACK, AND THEN WHEN IT IS HANDED OVER TO THE  
7 LEGISLATURE?

8

9 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. THE  
10 RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE TO PRESENT IT TO THE LEG COMMITTEE ON  
11 JANUARY 12 AND THEN BRING THAT FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION AT  
12 YOUR JANUARY MEETING FOR ADOPTION AND THEN WE WOULD TAKE THAT  
13 TO SENATOR WIENER FOR DEVELOPMENT, YOU KNOW, OF THE ACTUAL  
14 DRAFT LEGISLATION. OBVIOUSLY, THE LEGISLATION WILL CHANGE OVER  
15 TIME THROUGH AMENDMENTS, BUT THE INITIAL VERSION WOULD  
16 HOPEFULLY REFLECT THE DIRECTION THAT WE GET. NOT HOPEFULLY.  
17 WOULD REFLECT THE DIRECTION WE GET FROM THE COMMISSION IN  
18 JANUARY.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO THANK YOU. COLLEAGUES, THE REASON I'M ASKING  
21 THIS QUESTION IS WE HEARD A LOT OF DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS BEING  
22 VERY MUCH THE BEGINNING OF THE PROCESS. I WOULD ACTUALLY  
23 ARGUE, IT'S NOT THE BEGINNING. WE'RE LEANING PRETTY FAR INTO  
24 THE PROCESS IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ASKING IF THE STAFF IS GOING  
25 TO COME BACK TO US IN JANUARY AND THEN SOMETHING WILL BE GOING



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 TO THE -- TO SENATOR WIENER'S -- YOU KNOW, TO HIM TO BEGIN  
2 WORKING ON CRAFTING A BILL. AND BECAUSE OF THAT, I THINK A LOT  
3 OF ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED TODAY NEED A BIT MORE OF A  
4 DIVE. AND I WANT TO JUST SAY, IT'S INTERESTING. FOLKS HAVE  
5 COME AT THIS FROM MANY DIFFERENT ANGLES AND I CAN SAY A PIECE  
6 OF EVERYTHING PEOPLE SAID I AGREE WITH. AND THE PUBLIC, TOO. I  
7 WILL START WITH COMMISSIONER RONEN'S POINT ABOUT HOW IN FACT  
8 WE ARE -- HOW WE PROCEED ACTUALLY IS TRANSFORMATIONAL. I THINK  
9 THE POINTS THAT WERE RAISED BY MY COLLEAGUE FROM SANTA CLARA  
10 COUNTY, MARGARET ABE-KOGA, BOTH ABOUT THE CONSTERNATION ABOUT  
11 THE CONSOLIDATION AND STARTING, FRANKLY, WITH AN END RESULT  
12 INSTEAD OF AN END OUTCOME. IF THE OUTCOME IS WE WANT TO HAVE -  
13 - AND THIS WOULD BE MY REQUEST TO STAFF, I THINK THIS HAS TO  
14 BE MUCH SIMPLY. WE WANT COORDINATED SCHEDULES. WE WANT  
15 COORDINATED FARES. WE WANT PEOPLE TO BE ABLE TO GET FROM POINT  
16 A TO POINT B. TO ME, THAT'S A VERY -- IT'S A MUCH MORE SIMPLE  
17 KIND OF CLEAN APPROACH. AND THE ONE OTHER THING I'LL JUST ADD  
18 IS THAT I -- ONE OF THE THINGS I'M VERY INTERESTED IN, AND  
19 THIS SPEAKS TO WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING WAS TALKING ABOUT IS  
20 I THINK -- I HEAR THE URGENCY IN COMMISSIONER SPERING'S  
21 COMMENTS BECAUSE HE'S BEEN ON THIS BOARD FOR A LONG TIME.  
22 WHICH HAS BEEN REFERENCED MANY TIMES TODAY. AND I THINK HE HAS  
23 SEEN THE BOARD GO THROUGH UNDULATIONS OF WE'RE MOVING FORWARD,  
24 WE'RE STEPPING BACK, WE'RE MOVING FORWARD, WE'RE STEPPING  
25 BACK. SO I WANT TO HONOR HIS URGENCY. WHAT I WANT TO REQUEST



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 FROM STAFF IS WE'RE ENORMOUSLY FOCUSED ON THE OUTCOMES THAT WE  
2 WANT, THOSE THINGS WE REALLY CAN DELIVER AND THOSE THINGS THAT  
3 WILL FUNDAMENTALLY CHANGE THE DIRECTION OF THE WILL BE OF  
4 TRANSIT IN OUR AREA. AND I WANT TO AGREE, I DON'T THINK PEOPLE  
5 THINK THEY HAVE A WORLD-CLASS SYSTEM. I FUNDAMENTALLY BELIEVE  
6 WE GOT A LOT OF REALLY GREAT SERVICE PROVIDERS OUT THERE. AND  
7 I THINK THE TOOLS WE NEED TO GIVE THEM ARE REALLY GIVING THEM  
8 THE OPPORTUNITY TO CONNECT THEIR SERVICES AND GET TO THAT ONE  
9 TICKET. I THINK IF WE ARE FOCUSED ON THE OUTCOMES WE WANT, THE  
10 STRUCTURE WILL FOLLOW THE OUTCOMES AND WE'RE KIND OF DOING IT  
11 BACKWARDS, IS MY CONCERN. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING. AND  
14 THEN WE ARE GOING TO GO TO THE PUBLIC AND THEN WE'LL BRING IT  
15 BACK TO THE COMMISSION.

16

17 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THIS IS A REALLY CHALLENGING ONE. THERE'S  
18 NOBODY THAT SAID ANYTHING TODAY THAT I CAN DISAGREE WITH.  
19 WHILE THERE'S A BROAD SPECTRUM HERE. AND SO WHAT I'M GOING TO  
20 PUT FORWARD IS JUST A COUPLE OF REQUESTS FROM STAFF AS THIS  
21 MOVES FORWARD. ONE IS TO COMMISSIONER RONEN'S POINT, THIS GOES  
22 FORWARD WITH A REQUEST FOR THE ADEQUATE FUNDING TO ENACT  
23 SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE EFFECTIVE. BECAUSE WHAT WE NEED IS WE  
24 NEED TO GET PUBLIC BUY-IN SO THE PUBLIC BELIEVES THAT WE CAN  
25 OR WILL ACHIEVE A WORLD-CLASS SYSTEM. THE OTHER IS THAT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 COORDINATION I THINK IS A MORE FEASIBLE GOAL. AND IT'S ONE  
2 THAT HAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROTECT AND BRING ALONG MORE  
3 WORKERS AND MORE JOBS AS WE DO THIS. WE HAVE TO BE MINDFUL  
4 THERE ARE -- THESE ARE NOT JUST AGENCIES THAT SERVE THE PEOPLE  
5 BUT THESE ARE PEOPLE WHO SERVE THE AGENCIES AND THAT IT'S A  
6 TWO-WAY STREET. AND THE LAST THING IS REGIONALLY WE HAVE TO  
7 WORK TOGETHER TO GET TO THIS VISION. AND SO THIS IS A REALLY  
8 TOUGH ONE. I APPRECIATE EVERYTHING THAT STAFF HAS DONE AND THE  
9 QUALITY OF DISCOURSE FROM MY COLLEAGUES IS JUST FANTASTIC. SO  
10 THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR THOUGHTFULNESS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER FLEMING. LET'S  
13 GO TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT. KIMBERLY, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE  
14 HAVE?

15

16 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** WE HAVE FIVE IN HOUSE AND NOW 14 ONLINE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AS WE DID AT THE LEG COMMITTEE WE'LL  
19 DO ONE KNOWING THIS WILL BE A CONVERSATION WE CONTINUE TO  
20 HAVE. SO GO AHEAD.

21

22 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** WE'LL GO WITH OUR IN-HOUSE FOLKS FIRST.  
23 WE HAVE CHARLIE. GO AHEAD AND COME TO THE PODIUM. THERE YOU  
24 ARE. I'LL START THE CLOCK FOR YOU. ONE MINUTE. BEAR WITH ME  
25 JUST ONE MOMENT. THERE YOU GO.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. HAPPY HOLIDAYS. SO I'M  
3 SPEAKING TODAY AS A MEMBER OF THE OPERATORS ENGINEERS UNION  
4 AND THAT IS PART OF THE CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS. THAT'S  
5 AN ALLIANCE THAT REPRESENTS OVER 2,000 HEAVY CONSTRUCTION  
6 EMPLOYERS PLUS 80,000 UNION CONSTRUCTION WORKERS. SO THE  
7 LETTER THAT I SUBMITTED TO THE CLERK EXPRESSES THE ALLIANCE AS  
8 CONSIDERED AT THE POLLING NUMBERS AND ALSO AROUND THE  
9 EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES. WE BELIEVE THAT A MORE BALANCED  
10 APPROACH WHICH BALANCES, YOU KNOW, THE NEED TO MAINTAIN  
11 OPERATIONS WITH SIGNIFICANT CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS WILL POLL  
12 BETTER AND WILL IN TURN GIVE US IN THE BAY AREA THE SYSTEM WE  
13 NEED AND THE OPPORTUNITY FOR SUSTAINED ECONOMIC GROWTH IN THE  
14 REGION. SO WITH THAT, IF YOU DISTRIBUTE THE LETTERS, THANK  
15 YOU.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SAM SERGEANT  
18 FOLLOWED BY VAL.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. SAM SURGE. I SERVE AS  
21 DIRECTOR OF STRATEGY AT CALTRAIN. WE FIND OURSELVES AT AN  
22 INFLECTION POINT. FOR MOST OPERATORS, CALTRAIN IN PARTICULAR,  
23 FUTURE NEEDS ARE VERY GREAT. NETWORK IS RUNNING WITH TALENTED  
24 DIRECTOR AND STAFF. AND ACCEPTED TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
25 AND THE RESULTS THAT CAME OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1   HOWEVER, CALTRAIN REMAINS EXTREMELY CONCERNED ABOUT THE  
2   CONTINUED INCLUSION OF CALTRAIN-BART CONSOLIDATION IN BOTH  
3   POLLING, STAFF REPORTS, AND PRESENTATIONS RELATED TO THIS  
4   CRITICAL REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. THIS IS A COMPLEX,  
5   LARGELY UNKNOWN, AND A CHALLENGING SUGGESTION FOR TRANSIT  
6   OPERATORS WITH UNIQUE BOARDS, UNIQUE TAX BASES AND UNIQUE  
7   OPERATIONAL AND CAPITAL NEEDS, ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE TALKING  
8   ABOUT HOW TO IMPROVE MOBILITY IN THE TRANSIT CUSTOMER  
9   EXPERIENCE ACROSS THE REGION. WITH THAT WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
10  WORKING MORE WITHIN THE RNM FRAMEWORK.

11  
12  **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** NEXT IS VAL FOLLOWED BY SEBASTIAN.

13  
14  **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING AT BART. BART SUPPORTS THE 2026 REGIONAL  
15  TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT WILL PROVIDE LONG-TERM, SUSTAIN,  
16  OPERATING FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS AND TRANSFORM THE BAY AREA'S  
17  TRANSIT NETWORK. AT BART OUR EFFORTS TO IMPLEMENT A SAFE AND  
18  CLEAN PLAN ARE BEGINNING TO SHOW POSITIVE RESULTS FOR RIDERS  
19  AND WE CONTINUE TO DO MORE WITH OUR TRANSIT AGENCY PARTNERS TO  
20  DELIVER A RIDER-FOCUSED INITIATIVES. WE'RE THANKFUL TO MTC AND  
21  TO EFFORTS TO COORDINATE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AND  
22  SUPPORT THE CONTINUED LEADERSHIP. REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK  
23  WE'VE BEEN DOING WITH ANDY AND ALIX AND REBECCA. AROUND ALL  
24  THE WORK ENABLING LEGISLATION, REFORMS, EXPENDITURE  
25  PRIORITIES, AND POTENTIAL FUND SOURCES. SO THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS DAN -- EXCUSE ME --  
3 SEBASTIAN PETTY FOLLOWED BY DAN CECIL.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SPUR IS SUPPORTED FOR FUTURE REGIONAL REVENUE  
6 MEASURE. WE ALSO SUPPORT AND TAKE VERY SERIOUSLY THE  
7 COMMITMENT TO ENSURING ANY MEASURE IS CLIMATE FRIENDLY.  
8 HOWEVER, WE SHARE MANY OF THE PRACTICAL QUESTIONS THAT SOME  
9 COMMISSIONERS HAVE RAISED TODAY. FIRST, CURRENT POLLING FOR  
10 THE MEASURE IS BOTH DISCOURAGING AND ALSO CLEARLY DRIVEN BY  
11 LARGER SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC FACTORS OUTSIDE OF TRANSIT CONTROL.  
12 WHILE THE POLLING SHOWS VARYING DEGREES OF POPULARITY FOR  
13 TRANSIT REFORMS, IT DOES NOT SHOW A LINKAGE BETWEEN THOSE  
14 REFORMS AND AN ACTUAL WILLINGNESS ON THE PART OF VOTERS TO  
15 SUPPORT A TAX MEASURE. WE WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND THE  
16 COMMISSION'S FALLBACK PLAN TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT SERVICE IN A  
17 REGIONAL -- IT IS NOT BUYABLE. WE ARE HIGHLY SUPPORTIVE OF  
18 STRENGTHENING REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND FOCUSING ON  
19 QUICKLY DELIVERING TANGIBLE, NEAR-TERM CUSTOMER IMPROVEMENTS.  
20 WE'RE STRUGGLING TO UNDERSTAND THE LINKING THE IMPORTANT BUT  
21 ALSO COMPLEX CONCEPTS TO A CRITICAL REVENUE MEASURE. THANK YOU  
22 FOR YOUR TIME.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS DAN CECIL. AND  
25 THEN WE'LL GO TO OUR VIRTUAL CALLERS.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI, GOOD MORNING. SAM SEATA, WE JUST JOINED REBECCA  
3 LONG'S WORKING GROUP AND WE'RE HERE TO HELP. HOWEVER, WE  
4 STRONGLY OPPOSE TO INCLUDE CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION WITH BART OR  
5 ANY OTHER AGENCY. CONSOLIDATION IS YOUR WORD, MTC.  
6 COORDINATION IS THE NETWORK REGIONAL MANAGER. RIGHT NOW YOU  
7 SHOULD BE FOCUSED ON BUILDING A COORDINATION FOR 2026, NOT  
8 CREATING DIVISIVE OPPOSITION. I COUNT UPWARDS OF 50 ELECTED  
9 OFFICIALS IN THE LETTERS YOU RECEIVED WHO ARE CONCERNED ABOUT  
10 THIS ISSUE. IT WILL TAKE MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO PASS THIS  
11 MEASURE. ESPECIALLY WITH YOUR POLL NUMBERS. IT ONLY TAKES A  
12 HANDFUL OF LOCALLY ELECTED OFFICIALS WHO ARE RESPECTED TO KILL  
13 A TAX MEASURE ON ELECTION DAY WITH THEIR OPPOSITION. FORCING  
14 CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION INTO THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION IS A  
15 SELF-INFLICTED WOUND YOU SHOULD AVOID. PLEASE KEEP DIRECTION  
16 TO FOCUS ON COORDINATION AND REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER, NOT  
17 CONSOLIDATION. TALK OF CONSL DAGS PUTS THIS MEASURE AT RISKS.  
18 -- CONSOLIDATION PUTS THIS MEASURE AT RISK.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ON ZOOM, OUR FIRST OF 17  
21 SPEAKERS IS LAUREL PABET-SEEKINS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WE HAVE A VISION FOR THE BAY AREA AND IN PARALLEL TO  
24 THE MEASURE, WE ARE WORKING ON THE MTC CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN  
25 AND WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES TO CREATE VISIONARY NETWORKS SO WE





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 CAN -- MISSIONARY PLANS SO WE CAN ILLUSTRATE TO VOTERS WHAT  
2 THEY COULD GET WITH THIS FUNDING AND IT WILL REQUIRE RAISING  
3 OF THESE \$2 MILLION A YEAR. I WANT TO NOTE THE REFORM  
4 CONVERSATIONS AREN'T FOCUSING ON THE LARGEST SOURCE OF COST  
5 EFFICIENCY FOR RAIL WHICH IS TRAFFIC CONGESTION AND THE  
6 MEASURES, WHERE IT'S POLICIES OR -- NEEDS TO IMPROVE TRANSIT  
7 PRIORITY AS PART OF THE MEASURE. AND FINALLY, I APPRECIATE  
8 THAT SAFETY IS IMPORTANT TO RIDERS. WE WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE  
9 TRANSIT IS SAFER THAN RIDING AND WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO STRESS  
10 THIS. THANK YOU.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS PETER STRAUS FOLLOWED  
13 BY HALEEMA BHAROOCHA. PETER STRAUS, ARE YOU THERE? ONE MORE  
14 TIME FOR PETER STRAUS AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** PETER STRAUS, PART OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS  
17 AND ALSO PART OF VOICES. I DON'T DISAGREE WITH THE COMMENTS  
18 THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ OFFERED BUT WE NEED TO REMEMBER  
19 THIS IS ABOUT THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. IT IS ALSO NOT  
20 FUNDING LEGISLATION AND IS NOT THE BALLOT MEASURE ITSELF. IT  
21 IS THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. AND AS SUCH, NEEDS TO REMAIN  
22 BROAD AND FLEXIBLE. AND I DO WANT TO COMMEND REBECCA AND THE  
23 STAFF WHAT THEY PUT FORWARD YOU WHICH EMBODIES MANY OF THE  
24 ARGUMENTS WE HAVE BEEN ADVOCATING -- WE ARE PRESENTING AS  
25 ADVOCATES. I DO WANT TO COMMENT ON THE SCALE WHICH IS THE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 ISSUE THAT HILLARY RONEN RAISED. IF WE WANT SOMETHING THAT  
2 OFFERS AN ASPIRATIONAL PROGRAM, WE IT -- IT NEEDS TO BE ON THE  
3 ORDER OF A \$2 BILLION MEASURE NOT \$1 MILLION. SOMETHING ON THE  
4 ORDER OF \$1.5 BILLION IS AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS.  
5 LESS THAN THAT WILL ONLY SUSTAIN THE -- WHAT WE'RE OFFERING  
6 THE PEOPLE.

7

8 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** NEXT UP IS HALEEMA BHAROOCHA-JOBE  
9 FOLLOWED BY RYAN WILLIAMS. HALEEMA JOBE. OK. HALEEMA.

10

11 **HALEEMA BHAROOCHA-JOBE:** WORKING WITH VOICES FOR PUBLIC  
12 TRANSPORTATION AND IT IS VERY CRITICAL THAT THIS MEASURE IS  
13 MOVED FORWARD AND WITH THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF FUNDING WE CAN  
14 POSSIBLY GET, TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING STRUCTURAL DEFICITS  
15 UPWARDS OF \$6 MONDAY MILLION ANNUALLY. -- \$6 MILLION AN  
16 ACTUALLY. IT'S A CONCERN RIGHT NOW AND WE NEED SAFE AND  
17 AFFORDABLE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THAT THE PUBLIC WANTS AND  
18 REQUIRES. SO THAT REVENUE MEASURES THAT RAISE AT LEAST \$2  
19 BILLION -- CAN RAISE AT LEAST \$2 BILLION ANNUALLY. I ALSO WAS  
20 HAPPY TO SEE IN TERMS OF THE PRESENTATION THAT THERE IS A  
21 REVENUE MECHANISM THAT WILL LOOK AT PROGRESSIVE SOURCES. AND  
22 SO LOOKING AT INCOME TAX, PAYROLL TAX, PARCEL TAX. AS AN  
23 IMPORTANT ASPECT OF AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION THAT INCLUDES MANY  
24 OPTIONS FOR PROGRESSIVE SOURCES. THANK YOU.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS RYAN WILLIAMS  
2 FOLLOWED BY EMILY WHEELER.

3

4 **RYAN WILLIAMS:** HI. I'M RYAN WILLIAMS, A POLITICAL ORGANIZER  
5 WITH SEIU 1021. I WANT TO THANK THE BOARD FOR THEIR COMMENTS  
6 TODAY AND WORK ON THE 2026 REGIONAL MEASURE. I DO WANT TO FLAG  
7 THAT THE STAFF DID SAY THEY REACHED OUT TO LABOR ORGANIZATIONS  
8 AS PART OF THIS EFFORT. SEIU HAS NOT HEARD FROM STAFF AND WE  
9 WOULD APPRECIATE A CONVERSATION WITH MTC ON THIS '26 MEASURE  
10 THAT WE WOULD SUPPORT AND WE ARE VERY MUCH IN FAVOR OF. WE DO  
11 HAVE CONCERNS, ALONG WITH THE BOARD AND OTHER CALLERS, THE  
12 POLITICAL DIVISIVENESS OF A MERGER BETWEEN BART AND CALTRAIN.  
13 WE DO NOT SUPPORT SUCH EFFORT. WE WOULD LIKE THE FOCUS TO BE  
14 ON SUSTAINABLE AND LONG-TERM FUNDING FOR PART AND THE OTHER  
15 OPERATIONS AS AN ALTERNATIVE TO THE UNPREDICTABILITY OF FARE  
16 BOXES. WE NEED TO CREATE THAT WORLD-CLASS MASS TRANSIT SYSTEMS  
17 SO WE ASK \$2 BILLION ANNUALLY IN FUNDING FOR THIS MEASURE.  
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. EMILY WHEELER FOLLOWED BY  
21 SEAMLESS BAY AREA.

22

23 **EMILY WHEELER:** HI. I'M EMILY WHEELER AND WITH PUBLIC  
24 ADVOCATES. AND THE TRANSPORTATION FELLOWSHIP. I APPRECIATE  
25 STAFF'S WORK ON THIS, AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION, AND FOCUS ON



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IMPROVING TRANSIT WORKERS. I TAKE TRANSIT TO GO GROCERY  
2 SHOPPING, GO OUT TO DINNER AND EVEN GO TO WORK. I -- YOU KNOW,  
3 I REALLY WANT TO EMPHASIZE TO THE COMMISSION THAT IF WE ARE  
4 GOING TO ACHIEVE ABUNDANT TRANSPORTATION, THAT THE BAY AREA  
5 NEEDS AND WANTS, TRANSIT NEEDS TO BE FUNDED AND FUNDED WELL.  
6 THIS AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION -- IT NEEDS TO GO THROUGH. THAT  
7 PRIORITIZES TRANSIT OPERATIONS. IT NEEDS TO GET ENOUGH MONEY.  
8 IDEALLY OVER \$2 BILLION ANNUALLY. AND IT NEEDS PROGRESSIVE  
9 REVENUE SOURCES. THOSE ARE THINGS THAT WOULD MAKE, YOU KNOW,  
10 VOTERS HAPPY. AND MTC NEEDS TO DO THE WORK OF CONVINCING THE  
11 PUBLIC THAT THIS IS WHAT WE NEED BECAUSE IT IS -- THANK YOU SO  
12 MUCH. HAVE A GOOD DAY.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SEAMLESS BAY AREA  
15 FOLLOWED BY BRYAN CULBERTSON.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS, PROJECT DIRECTOR  
18 FOR SEAMLESS BAY AREA. THANK YOU, FIRST OF ALL, FOR THE  
19 VISION. I THINK IT'S GREAT THAT WE FINALLY HAVE THIS VISION.  
20 IT'S VERY HELPFUL. I THINK IT COULD BE STRENGTHENED AND  
21 TIGHTENED UP. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT, FIRST OF ALL, HAVING  
22 SUFFICIENT FUNDING MORE TOWARDS THE \$2 BILLION LEVEL. WE ARE  
23 PART OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT  
24 THE RECOMMENDATION TO STRENGTHEN NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY  
25 AND DOING SO IMMEDIATELY SO WE CAN DELIVER MORE RESULTS WITHIN



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS AND BE ABLE TO OFFER MORE EVIDENCE TO  
2 RIDERS THAT WE'RE MAKING CHANGE BEFORE WE ASK THEM FOR A  
3 REGIONAL MEASURE. AND ALSO, WE SUPPORT THE -- THE REFORM  
4 CONCEPT TO RECOMMENDATIONS TO ADVANCE THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT  
5 CAME OUT OF PAST STUDIES, INCLUDING THE RAIL PARTNERSHIP  
6 STUDIES. WE REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON CREATING THE REGIONAL  
7 DECISION-MAKING AND CAPACITY TO DELIVER ON THE LONG-TERM  
8 VISION OF OUR SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS BRYAN CULBERTSON  
11 FOLLOWED BY DARTON ITO.

12

13 **BRYAN CULBERTSON:** THANK YOU. I AM A FULL TIME RIDER IN  
14 OAKLAND. WE NEED TRANSIT TO ENFORCE CLIMATE CHANGE. INVESTING  
15 IN TRANSIT IS SUPPORTED AT 80% SO A LOT OF SUPPORT. BUT  
16 SUPPORT FOR THE TAX GOES DOWN BECAUSE FAMILIES ARE WORRIED  
17 ABOUT THEIR BUDGET. WE HAVE THE WEALTHIEST COUNTIES IN THE  
18 COUNTRY. PROGRESSIVE TAXATION CAN COLLECT THE \$2 BILLION IN  
19 FUNDS THAT WE NEED AND ALSO WIN THE SUPPORT OF THE VOTERS FOR  
20 A TAX. IN ADDITION, RIGHT NOW BRIDGE TOLLS ARE CHEAPER THAN  
21 TRANSIT FARES. WE HAVE SOME OF THE MOST EXPENSIVE TRANSIT IN  
22 THE COUNTRY. IF WE ARE GOING TO GET BROAD SUPPORT FOR TRANSIT,  
23 THEN WE NEED TO PROMISE AFFORDABLE TRANSIT ON PAR WITH CITIES  
24 LIKE L.A. VOTERS WILL VOTE FOR TRANSIT THEY SEE THEMSELVES  
25 BEING ABLE TO AFFORD TO USE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. DARTON ITO VOLUMED BY ZACK  
3 DEUTCH-GROSS.

4

5 **DARTON ITO:** GOOD MORNING. I'M DARTON ITO AND SPEAKING ON  
6 BEHALF OF SFMTA. TODAY NEARLY HALF A MILLION TRAPS -- TRIPS  
7 ARE BEING TAKEN ON UNI EACH DAY. DESPITE CHALLENGES, WE HAVE  
8 2/3 OF OUR VOTERS RATING THEM GOOD OR EXCELLENT. STATE AND  
9 FEDERAL FUNDING HAS BOUGHT US TIME. HOWEVER, THE FINANCIAL  
10 SITUATION FACING THE REGION REMAINS SERIOUS. IN 2026, THE  
11 REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALL IS ESTIMATED TO REACH  
12 OVER \$700 MILLION A YEAR. THE LONG-TERM SOLUTION IS NEEDED SO  
13 WE DON'T FIND OURSELVES MEETING DEVASTATING SERVICE CUTS IN A  
14 FEW SHORT YEARS THAT WILL HURT OUR MOST VULNERABLE POPULATIONS  
15 AND UNDERMINE THE REGION'S ECONOMIC GROWTH. WE NEED TO WORK  
16 TOGETHER TO SUPPORT A NEW STABLE ONGOING SOURCE OF FUNDING TO  
17 ACHIEVE THE VISION BEFORE YOU TODAY OF A THRIVING BAY AREA  
18 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. WE WOULD LIKE TO THANK MTC STAFF AND  
19 THE COMMISSION FOR YOUR ONGOING PARTNERSHIP AND LEADERSHIP AND  
20 WE STRONGLY URGE YOUR SUPPORT TO ADVANCE REGIONAL  
21 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ZACK FOLLOWED BY  
24 ELIZABETH ALEXIS.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1   **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** POLICY DIRECTOR AT TRANSFORM AND MEMBER OF  
2   VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WE SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD  
3   WITH THIS MEASURE CONCEPT AND WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF FOR ALL  
4   THEIR HARD WORK. WE ALSO WANT TO ECHO MANY OF THE COMMISSIONER  
5   POINTS. WE NEED A VISION AND SUFFICIENT REVENUE TO ACHIEVE IT.  
6   CLOSER TO THIS \$2 BILLION ANNUAL NUMBER. PARTICULARLY WHEN WE  
7   KNOW WE NEED TO INVEST SIGNIFICANTLY IN TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO  
8   AVOID THE FISCAL CLIFF. TRANSFORM SUPPORTS ENHANCED  
9   COORDINATION, SPECIFICALLY THROUGH CONTINUED IMPLEMENTATION OF  
10   THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WHICH WILL PROVIDE THE BEST  
11   EXPERIENCE -- USER EXPERIENCE FOR RIDERS AND WORKERS. WE ALSO  
12   APPRECIATE THE STAFF PROPOSAL THAT THE REVENUE MEASURE'S  
13   CENTRAL GOAL WILL BE A CLIMATE-FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM.  
14   TO SUPPORT THIS, WE'D LIKE TO SEE LANGUAGE IN THE MEASURE  
15   CONCEPT THAT ENSURES THAT ALL INVESTMENTS ACROSS EXPENDITURE  
16   CATEGORIES ARE VMT NEUTRAL OR REDUCING TO MEET OUR CLIMATE  
17   GOALS. THANK YOU.

18

19   **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ELIZABETH ALEXIS FOLLOWED BY  
20   GREG GREENWAY.

21

22   **ELIZABETH ALEXIS:** GOOD MORNING. I'M REPRESENTING CARRD. AGENCY  
23   CONSOLIDATION IS NO GUARANTEE OF SEAMLESS SERVICE. THERE ARE  
24   BAY AREA AGENCIES THAT TODAY CONTROL SCHEDULES FOR MULTIPLE  
25   TRANSIT MODES WHERE THERE'S NO COORDINATION OF EXPERIENCES. IT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WILL LEAVE MANY RIDERS WORSE OFF. THE NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF A  
2 MERGER WOULD DWARF BENEFITS, ESPECIALLY AS THE MOST IMPORTANT  
3 COORDINATION ISSUE IS BUSES AND LIGHT RAIL, NOT HEAVY RAIL  
4 WITH HEAVY RAIL. A FOCUS ON CONSOLIDATION WOULD DEFER THE  
5 ACTIONS THAT MTC COULD TAKE TODAY TO ENSURE AGENCIES WORK WELL  
6 TOGETHER. THEY HAVE ENORMOUS LEVERAGE THAT HAS BEEN USED  
7 SPARINGLY BUT REQUIRE TO MAKE CHANGES TO ALLOW THEM TO RUN ON  
8 TIME. THAT'S A PREREQUISITE FOR COORDINATED SERVICES. INSTEAD  
9 OF A DISTRACTING CONSOLIDATION PRACTICE, MTC SHOULD LEAN INTO  
10 THE WORK OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER TO SERVE AS THE  
11 CURRENT BARRIER TO COORDINATED SERVICE WHICH WILL REQUIRE  
12 INVESTMENTS IN INFRASTRUCTURE FOR A SUCCESSFUL REVENUE MEASURE  
13 IN THE FUTURE.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS GREG GREENWAY  
16 FOLLOWED BY MARJORIE ALVORD. GREG GREENWAY, ARE YOU THERE?

17

18 **GREG GREENWAY:** I AM. THANK YOU. SPEAKING FOR CHAMBER OF SAN  
19 MATEO COUNTY. THE CHAMBER STRONGLY SUPPORTS THE TASK FORCE.  
20 LIKE YOU HEARD FROM MANY OTHERS, WE URGE NOT TO MOVE FORWARD  
21 IN CONSIDERING CONSOLIDATION OF BART AND CALTRAIN GOVERNANCE.  
22 IT'S A NONSTARTER FOR LACK OF SUPPORT AS SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS  
23 POINTED OUT AND AS YOU HEARD FROM MANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.  
24 PUTTING A CONSOLIDATION POISON PILL ON THE BALLOT WOULD ONLY  
25 UNDERMINE THE CHANCE FOR SUCCESS. SECOND, THIS IS EXACTLY THE





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WRONG TIME TO CONSIDER CONSOLIDATION. CALTRAIN IS SUCCESSFULLY  
2 NAVIGATING A TRANSITION TO ELECTRIFIED SERVICE AND IT'S IN THE  
3 EARLY STAGES OF IMPLEMENTING ITS OWN GOVERNANCE REFORM.  
4 CONSOLIDATION WOULD INTERRUPT THAT PROCESS AND HAVE NO CLEAR  
5 BENEFIT TO CALTRAIN RIDERS AND THOSE OF THE REGION. WE WOULD  
6 URGE ANY DISCUSSION OF GOVERNANCE NEEDS TO HAVE MORE  
7 MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT OF CALTRAIN AND LEADERSHIP. LET'S TALK  
8 ABOUT COORDINATION AND NOT CONSOLIDATION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH  
9 FOR YOUR IMPORTANT WORK.

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS MARJORIE ALVORD  
12 FOLLOWED BY CODY VAUGHN.

13

14 **MARJORIE ALVORD:** HELLO. I'M MARJORIE ALVORD, ALAMEDA COUNTY  
15 RESIDENT, VOLUNTEER WITH 350 BAY AREA AND GENESIS, BOTH  
16 MEMBERS OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I THANK VERY MUCH  
17 MTC STAFF HARD WORK AND FOCUS ON IMPROVING TRANSIT ABOUT THE  
18 BAY. I LONG FAVORED PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR HELPING REDUCE CAR  
19 TRAVEL AND VMT OIS, TO IMPROVE STREET SAFETY AND -- VMT'S AND  
20 TO IMPROVE STREET SAFETY. AS I GET OLDER AND MY CHILDREN MOVE,  
21 I FIND I NEED WELL-OPERATING TRANSIT AND CONNECTED TRANSIT NOW  
22 MORE THAN EVER. IN TERMS OF REVENUE, I STRONGLY ENCOURAGE THAT  
23 ANY MEASURE INCLUDE PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES SUCH AS A  
24 SQUARE FOOTAGE PARCEL TAX. IT'S REGRETTABLE APPARENTLY THE  
25 PUBLIC SURVEY DID NOT ASK ABOUT ATTITUDES ON A SQUARE FOOTAGE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 PARCEL TAX. PEOPLE MAY BE SALES TAXED OUT AND MAYBE A SQUARE  
2 FOOTAGE PARCEL TAX WOULD FAIR BETTER. IT CERTAINLY DOES FOR  
3 ME. THANKS AGAIN FOR CONSIDERING THIS MEASURE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. CODY VAUGHN FOLLOWED BY MIKE  
6 C.

7

8 **CODY VAUGHN:** HELLO. HELLO. MY NAME IS CODY VAUGHN. I LIVE IN  
9 SAN FRANCISCO AND I REGULARLY COMMUTE USING BART AND I URGE  
10 THE MTC TO PRIORITIZE THE SEAMLESS TRANSIT SYSTEM AND ITS  
11 GOALS IN THE 2026 FUNDING MEASURE. FOR THIS BALLOT MEASURE TO  
12 TRULY DELIVER, WE NEED TWO ESSENTIAL THINGS. ADEQUATE FUNDING,  
13 NOT JUST LOCAL DOLLARS, BUT STRONG STATE SUPPORT, AND WE NEED  
14 ENOUGH RESOURCES TO PROVIDE FREQUENT, RELIABLE, AND MORE  
15 COORDINATED RESOURCES ACROSS THE REGION. SECONDLY, A STRONG  
16 NETWORK MANAGER. AN EMPOWERED ENTITY MUST OVERSEE THE 27  
17 TRANSIT AGENCIES ENSURING COORDINATED FARES, SERVICE, AND  
18 SCHEDULES. THIS WILL ELIMINATE THE FRUSTRATING SYSTEM WE FACE  
19 TODAY. I DO APPLAUD MTC'S RECOMMENDATION FOR NETWORK  
20 MANAGEMENT AND REGIONAL RAIL INTEGRATION BUT WE CAN'T STOP  
21 THERE. AND I URGE YOU TO GO FURTHER TO ANALYZE GOVERNMENT  
22 CHANGES. THANK YOU.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MIKE C FOLLOWED BY HOWARD  
25 WONG.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **MIKE C:** I'M MIKE, I'M A TRANSIT RIDER SENIOR CITIZEN. I THINK  
3 WE REALLY NEED TO GET, YOU KNOW, SERVICES, NOT BUREAUCRATIC  
4 STUFF LIKE -- NOT LIKE CONSOLIDATION, INCLUDING CONSOLIDATION  
5 AND BUS AGENCIES AND BUS AND RAIL BECAUSE BUS AND RAIL RIDERS  
6 HAVE VERY DIFFERENT NEEDS AND DIFFERENT FARE STRUCTURES SO WE  
7 NEED TO JUST, YOU KNOW, PROVIDE MORE SERVICE, THINGS THAT  
8 PEOPLE CAN SEE. MY OTHER OBSERVATION, I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE  
9 VERY HARD TO PASS A MEASURE WHAT PEOPLE SEE CONSTANTLY PEOPLE  
10 JUMPING AT THE FARE GATES OF BART AND THE EMPLOYEES DOING  
11 NOTHING. I THINK THAT'S -- THAT'S GOING TO HAVE TO CHANGE TO  
12 GET PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR THAT TAX MEASURE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS HOWARD WONG  
15 FOLLOWED BY BOB ALLEN.

16

17 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY  
18 COUNCIL. THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE CAN DEMONSTRATE THAT THEY  
19 CAN TOUCH THE LIVES OF ALL PEOPLE BY MAKING AN IMPACT ON ALL  
20 THE REGIONAL PRIORITIES. AFFORDABLE HOUSING, HOMELESSNESS,  
21 DOWNTOWN REVITALIZATION, TRANSIT DESERTS. AND WE CAN  
22 DEMONSTRATE THIS AND SHOW WE CAN USE MONEY EFFICIENTLY THROUGH  
23 INNOVATIVE WAYS OF THINKING. BY EXAMPLE, THE BEST USE OF  
24 PROPERTY RIGHTAWAYS, AIR RIDES. USING TRANSIT STATIONS AND BUS  
25 STOPS AND SHELTERS AS WELL AS SECURE ZONES. AND HAVING -- PUT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 IN SOME STATE DEDICATED ANNUAL FUNDING. SO RATHER THAN A NEW  
2 TAX, WE HAVE TO SHOW THAT THIS IS IMPACTING LIVES IN MANY,  
3 MANY WAYS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. BOB ALLEN FOLLOWED BY SARA  
6 GREENWALD.

7

8 **BOB ALLEN:** THANK YOU. URBAN HABITAT AND VOICE FOR  
9 TRANSPORTATION. THE QUESTION IS WHETHER WE'LL IMPROVE ENABLING  
10 LEGISLATION. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON WHAT THIS BODY HAS AUTHORITY  
11 OVER, TO IMPROVE ENABLING LEGISLATION. THE QUESTION OF WHEN IT  
12 GOES ON THE BALLOT AND SOME OF THE SPECIFICS AROUND THE  
13 INVESTMENT PACKAGE ARE GOING TO BE THINGS WE DETERMINE LATER.  
14 BUT IF WE TAKE OUR EYES KIND OF OFF THE BALL AND DON'T GET  
15 THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION MOVING FORWARD, NONE OF THE  
16 CONVERSATIONS WE HAVE ARE GOING TO BE IN ANY WAY MEANINGFUL  
17 BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO FUND THE SYSTEM THAT WE  
18 NEED. THAT MEANS A REVENUE MEASURE THAT'S PROGRESSIVE AND  
19 RAISES CLOSER TO THE \$2 BILLION FIGURE. WE HAVE LOTS OF IDEAS  
20 FOR TRANSFORMATION TO GET VOTER APPROVAL AND VOTER CONFIDENCE  
21 UP. WE'RE NOT PUTTING THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT OUT. IT WOULD  
22 BE GREAT AT SOME POINT TO HAVE A MORE NUANCED CONVERSATION  
23 ABOUT SAFETY GIVEN THAT 23,000 PEOPLE DIE ON THE HIGHWAYS EACH  
24 YEAR AND WE SEEM TO BE OBSESSED ABOUT.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SARA GREENWALD  
2 FOLLOWED BY CYRUS HALL.

3

4 **SARA GREENWALD:** HI. I'M WITH 350 BAY AREA, THE VOICES FOR  
5 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. FIRST, THANK YOU FOR STEPPING UP TO THE  
6 PLATE FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT AS ONE OF THE MOST EFFECTIVE CLIMATE  
7 SOLUTIONS WE HAVE. I AND MY NEIGHBORS IN THE BAY AREAS, WE  
8 NEED SAFE, CONVENIENT, RELIABLE TRANSIT SERVICE AND SAFE  
9 STREETS WHETHER WE RIDE, DRIVE, WALK, OR BICYCLE. NOW, THE  
10 MEASURE PROVIDES A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT GETS THERE ON TIME AND  
11 TAKES YOU WHERE YOU NEED TO GO, THAT'S WHAT PEOPLE ARE TALKING  
12 ABOUT. SO I REALLY SUPPORT THAT. I AM, HOWEVER, CONCERNED  
13 ABOUT THE AMOUNT YOU'RE ASKING FOR. COMMISSIONER RONEN'S  
14 RIGHT. PEOPLE WANT SOMETHING BETTER. THE MEASURE SHOULD RAISE  
15 AT LEAST \$2 BILLION A YEAR. HOWEVER, I'M DELIGHTED THAT YOU  
16 ARE CONSIDERING PROGRESSIVE OPTIONS FOR FUNDING, FOR FUNDING  
17 FOR \$2 BILLION A YEAR AT BEST. INCOME TAX, SQUARE FOOTAGE  
18 PARCEL TAX, PAYROLL TAX, THESE ARE PROGRESSIVE MEASURES THAT  
19 ARE THE WAY TO GO. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. CYRUS HALL FOLLOWED BY ALEA  
22 DUPREE.

23

24 **CYRUS HALL:** I AM A SUSTAINABLE ADVOCATE IN SAN FRANCISCO. ANY  
25 MEASURE NEEDS TO BE LARGE ENOUGH, NOT TO FUND THE STATUS QUO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 BUT TRANSPORTATION. WE NEED TO TRANSFORM TRANSIT INTO THE  
2 OBVIOUS CHOICE. AND THAT MEANS MORE COVERAGE. MOVING AROUND  
3 THE BAY SHOULD BE SEAMLESS AND WE NEED REGIONAL AUTHORITY.  
4 THAT MEANS REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGERS WHO CAN CREATE GUIDELINES  
5 AND GUIDE AGENCIES. FARES SHOULD BE CONSISTENT, AFFORDABLE,  
6 EASY TO UNDERSTAND WITHOUT HIDDEN FEES, MULTIPLE AGENCY BASE  
7 FEES AND CLEARLY CAPPED EVERY MONTH TO MAKE THE COST EASY TO  
8 BUDGET FOR. SUCH A TRANSFORMATION MEANS WE NEED TO LOOK IN THE  
9 RANGE OF \$2 BILLION, NOT \$1 MILLION. TO MAKE THAT -- \$1  
10 BILLION. TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN, MTC SHOULD HAVE MULTIPLE SOURCES  
11 OF FUNDING. IT WOULD BE MORE RESILIENT TO BOOM BUST CYCLES AND  
12 ONE OF THE FUNDING SOURCES SHOULD BE PROGRESSIVE. THAT WOULD  
13 HELP THE MEASURE PASS AND THAT IS EQUITABLE IN ONE OF THE MOST  
14 WEALTHY REGIONS OF THE WORLD. I ENCOURAGE YOU TO GET THIS DONE  
15 NEXT YEAR. KEEP THE ENABLING LEGISLATION FLEXIBLE AND LET'S  
16 FIGURE OUT HOW TO MAKE IT PASS AS WE MOVE TOWARDS THE BALLOT.  
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE.

20

21 **ALETA DUPREE:** THIS IS URGENT. AND IN ORDER TO BUILD A WORLD-  
22 CLASS TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, IT WILL TAKE A LOT OF MONEY. I  
23 THINK WE CERTAINLY HAVE TO DEFINE WHAT WORLD-CLASS MEANS. AND  
24 THAT CAN MEAN DIFFERENT THINGS TO DIFFERENT PEOPLE. I'M NOT  
25 KEEN ON THE BART-CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION. WE HAVE TWO VERY



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 HIGHLY ACCLAIMED AND EFFECTIVE LEADERS OF THOSE ORGANIZATIONS.  
2 AND THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO KEEP THEIR JOBS AS LONG AS THEY  
3 WANT. SO CONSOLIDATION COULD MEAN LETTING PEOPLE GO. I DON'T  
4 WANT THAT TO HAPPEN. BUT HOW DO WE BUILD THIS? I HOPE WE CAN  
5 SOLVE THE IDEA OF A TAX. I CAN'T VOTE FOR IT BECAUSE I DON'T  
6 LIVE IN THE NINE COUNTIES. BUT THE MESSAGING HAS TO START.  
7 THANK YOU.

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE  
10 FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN. MR. PIMPLE. WE'LL GO -- THERE WE ARE.  
11

12 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I AM A MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY  
13 COUNCIL. THE NUMBER THAT SCARED ME THE MOST WAS 80% WANTED  
14 OVERSIGHT. TO ME THAT SAYS 80% THINK THAT THINGS ARE BEING  
15 MISMANAGED. AND PERSONALLY, I THINK THAT THE -- IF I  
16 PERSONALLY THINK SOMETHING IS BEING MISMANAGED, I'M LIKELY TO  
17 BE LESS RESPONSIVE TO \$2 BILLION THAN I WOULD BE TO \$1  
18 BILLION. AND YOU KNOW, I DO WANT FOLKS TO THINK ABOUT THIS  
19 CAREFULLY. THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS, WE HAVEN'T REALLY HAD ANY  
20 PROGRESS ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT ISSUE. DO YOU REALLY THINK  
21 THIS IS BECAUSE OF THE LACK OF MONEY? SO PLEASE, JUST TRY TO  
22 DO THE THINGS THAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO DO, THAT PEOPLE WANT. NOT  
23 EVERYTHING REQUIRES MONEY. WE DO NEED THE MONEY. I HOPE THIS  
24 THING PASSES. BUT JUST LET'S JUST KEEP DOING OUR JOB WHICH IS  
25 TO MAKE SERVICES BETTER. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU, MR. PIMPLE. ADINA LEVIN  
3 FOLLOWED BY JORDAN GRIMES.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** WITH FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN AND TRANSBAY COALITION,  
6 PARTS OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SUPPORTING  
7 MODERNIZED AND WELL-COORDINATED RAIL AND REGIONAL TRANSIT AS  
8 PART OF AN AFFORDABLE AND WELL-CONNECTED AND ACCESSIBLE PUBLIC  
9 TRANSPORTATION THAT IS ACCESSIBLE TO ALL. I'M STRONGLY IN  
10 SUPPORT OF THIS AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. AND GLAD TO HEAR THAT  
11 THERE IS SUCH STRONG AND UNIVERSAL SUPPORT FOR A WELL-  
12 COORDINATED SYSTEM UNDER THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT THAT IS MOVING  
13 FORWARD. PARTICULARLY, WITH BART AND CALTRAIN, THERE'S SOME  
14 GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE PROGRESS IN THE COMING YEAR, SHOWING  
15 VOTERS TIGHTENING UP THAT CONNECTION AT MILBRAY AND THE  
16 TRANSIT PASS THAT CAN BE ROLLED OUT MORE BROADLY TO GENERATE  
17 RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JORDAN GRIMES  
20 FOLLOWED BY AUDREY LIU.

21

22 **JORDAN GRIMES:** GOOD MORNING, DIRECTORS. JORDAN GRIMES WITH  
23 GREENBELT ALLIANCE. WE'RE IN STRONG SUPPORT OF A FUNDING  
24 MEASURE AND URGE THE PURSUIT OF PROGRESSIVE TAXATION SOURCES  
25 TO FUND IT. MORE THAN HALF OF OUR STATE'S GHG EMISSIONS COMES





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 FROM THE TRANSPORTATION SECTOR. IN ORDER TO MEET OUR CLIMATE  
2 GOALS, WE NEED TO TRANSFORM OUR EXISTING SYSTEM INTO A WELL-  
3 FUNDED, WELL-RUN AND COMPREHENSIVE TRANSIT SYSTEM PROVIDING  
4 FREQUENT AND AFFORDABLE SERVICE. IN THAT VAIN, WE SUPPORT  
5 SUFFICIENT FUNDING CLOSER TO THE \$2 BILLION LEVEL AS WELL AS  
6 THE RECOMMENDATION TO STRENGTHEN NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY  
7 IN THE NEAR TERM. RIDERS NEED TO SEE A COMMITMENT TO RANGE, A  
8 COMMITMENT TO FARES AND SERVICES AND COMMITMENT TO EFFICIENT  
9 PROJECT DELIVERY. WITHOUT THESE THINGS WE WILL FAIL AND  
10 FAILURE IS NOT AN OPTION. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR YOUR TIME, FOR  
11 STAFF'S HARD WORK. WE APPRECIATE IT.

12  
13 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. AUDREY LIU FOLLOWED BY A  
14 CALLER WITH THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF 7888.

15  
16 **AUDREY LIU:** MEMBER OF VOICES FOR TRANSPORTATION COALITION.  
17 FIRST WANT TO THANK THE STAFF FOR THEIR TIRELESS WORK ON THE  
18 REVENUE MEASURE AND TOWARDS A BETTER PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM IN  
19 THE BAY AREA. LAST YEAR SAN FRANCISCO FACED THE WORST YEAR OF  
20 TRAFFIC DEATHS. TO ME FUNDING TRANSIT IS A KEY SOLUTION TO OUR  
21 FATALITIES AND TRAFFIC INJURIES ALONG WITH CLIMATE CHANGE AND  
22 RISING COST OF CAR OWNERSHIP IN AMERICA. I BELIEVE TO ACHIEVE  
23 THIS VISION OF A MORE EQUITABLE AND SAFER MOBILITY SYSTEM WE  
24 SHOULD IMPLEMENT PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES LIKE INCOME TAX -  
25 - TO CRITICALLY -- NOT UNBURDEN -- TO BURDEN LOW-INCOME



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 INDIVIDUALS AND FAMILIES. ALSO, WE SHOULD FOCUS ON  
2 PRIORITIZING TRANSIT OPERATION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CALLER 7888  
5 FOLLOWED BY MITCH MANKIN, JANE KRAMER AND JANE KRAMER WILL BE  
6 OUR FINAL SPEAKER.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN. GOOD MORNING,  
9 DIRECTORS. DAVID, TRANSPORTATION, BAY MANAGEMENT.  
10 ADMINISTRATOR FOR UC-BERKELEY. SERVING PART OF COMMUTER  
11 TRANSPORTATION WITH THE NORTH CAL CHAPTER. FIRST AND FOREMOST,  
12 I'D LIKE TO VOICE SUPPORT FOR A -- FOR THE NECESSARY REFORMS  
13 IN ORDER FOR US TO GET THE TRUST BACK INTO OUR RIDERS. WE  
14 DESERVE, AS BOTH IN THE BUSINESS AND IN OUR COMMUNITIES, AN  
15 EFFICIENT, FAST, AND CONNECTED NETWORK THAT'S GOING TO GET US  
16 TO WHERE WE NEED TO GO AND PROVIDE A SUITABLE IF NOT  
17 COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE TO DRIVING -- MOST CERTAINLY DRIVING  
18 ALONE. WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WHAT WE ARE DOING IN THE PAST  
19 IS NO LONGER APPLICABLE TO WHAT WE'RE DOING TODAY. IN  
20 ADDITION, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE NECESSARY  
21 GUARDRAILS AND REFORMS NEEDED TO MAKE THAT CHANGE AND MAKE  
22 THAT TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGE NECESSARY.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THAT IS YOUR TIME. THANK YOU.  
25 NEXT UP IS MITCH MANKIN FOLLOWED BY JANE KRAMER.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **MITCH MANKIN:** THANK YOU. SAN FRANCISCO RESIDENT.

3 COMMISSIONERS, TRANSIT IS MORE IMPORTANT THAN EVER. OVER HALF  
4 OF CALIFORNIA'S EMISSIONS IS TRANSPORTATION AND CARS. WE NEED  
5 TO GET CARS OFF FOR THE SAKE OF OUR CLIMATE. THE WAY TO BRING  
6 RIDERS BACK AND START MAKING THAT GROUND AT THE FARE BOX IS TO  
7 IMPROVE SERVICE. BRING BACK NIGHT SERVICE, MAKE WAIT TIMES  
8 SHORTER AND PEOPLE WILL RETURN FASTER. FOR EXAMPLE, I USED TO  
9 TAKE BART TO THE EAST BAY AND DON'T ANYMORE BECAUSE I CAN'T  
10 GET BACK HOME AT NIGHT. IF YOU WANT TO AVOID THAT SPIRAL, FUND  
11 TRANSIT NOT JUST ADEQUATELY BUT SUBSTANTIALLY. OTHERWISE,  
12 THERE WILL BE MORE FISCAL CLIFFS IN THE FUTURE. THE WAY TO DO  
13 THIS AND GET SUPPORT FROM VOTERS IS PROGRESSIVE REVENUE  
14 SOURCE. A MILLIONAIRE'S TAX WOULD BE BETTER THAN THE BLANKET  
15 TAX. THANKS FOR YOUR TIME.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. JANE KRAMER.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** COOPERATION GIVES THE PUBLIC ACCESSIBILITY TO --  
20 CONSOLIDATION WILL TURN THEM OFF. YOUR JOB IS IN THIS CASE  
21 BEING A VERY SAVVY MIDDLE MAN. YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REACH  
22 DOWN DEEP INTO THE COMMUNITY AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DO A  
23 LOT OF HARD WORK DO DO THAT. BUT IT WILL PROBABLY ALLOW YOU TO  
24 LEARN A LOT, AND YOU WILL, ALONG WITH THE COMMUNITY,  
25 ACCOMPLISH A LOT. WHAT YOU DON'T WANT TO DO IS TRY TO CONVINCE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE PUBLIC THAT THEY WANT TO BE CONNED INTO PASSING A BALLOT  
2 MEASURE.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MR. CHAIR, I DO NEED TO READ  
5 INTO THE RECORD THE LETTERS THAT WERE RECEIVED IN WRITING.  
6 SEBASTIAN PETTY OF SPUR. JIM WONDERMENT OF BAY AREA COUNCIL.  
7 CALTRAIN BOARD OF DIRECTORS, A JOINT LETTER FROM CARRD,  
8 CHAMBER OF -- EXCUSE ME -- CARRD, CHAMBER OF SAN MATEO COUNTY  
9 AND SAMCEDS. CCAG. JOSH OF SAMTRANS. COUNTY OF SAN MATEO  
10 SUPERVISOR. VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THAT IS ALL.  
11 THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK  
14 YOU TO ALL THE EXTENSIVE PUBLIC COMMENT TODAY AND ONES WE  
15 RECEIVED VIA EMAIL AS WELL. I'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE  
16 COMMISSION. COMMISSIONER SPERING AND THEN VICE CHAIR  
17 JOSEFOWITZ.

18

19 **JAMES SPERING:** I WANT TO ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO GO  
20 FORWARD AND ASK STAFF TO COME BACK WITH RECOMMENDATIONS. BUT I  
21 WANT TO MAKE ONE RECOMMENDATION. I DON'T THINK CONSOLIDATION  
22 SHOULD BE PART OF THE MEASURE AT ALL. I THINK WHAT WE SHOULD  
23 BE TALKING ABOUT IS COORDINATION AND GIVING THE NETWORK  
24 MANAGER THE AUTHORITY THAT IF -- NOT GETTING THE COORDINATION,  
25 THAT WE CAN WITHHOLD FUNDS. AND WE HAVE THE HAMMER THAT WE



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 NEED TO GET THAT COORDINATION. WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT -- THE  
2 MORE I THINK ABOUT CONSOLIDATION, WHAT IS IT I WANT TO  
3 CONSOLIDATE IS MORE -- LET'S GIVE THE COMMISSION TO FORCE THAT  
4 COOPERATION. AND I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE SPEAKERS. EVEN IF  
5 YOU SUPPORTED CONSOLIDATION, THAT'S ALL WE'RE GOING TO TALK  
6 ABOUT FOR THE NEXT TWO YEARS. AND I THINK IT'S GOING TO DIVERT  
7 A LOT OF ENERGY THAT WE COULD PUT INTO COMING UP WITH A WORLD-  
8 CLASS SYSTEM WITH REAL SOLID RECOMMENDATIONS AND A VISION THAT  
9 I THINK WILL INSPIRING THE VOTERS TO SUPPORT. AND SO THAT  
10 WOULD BE MY RECOMMENDATION IS THAT THERE'S NO REFERENCE TO  
11 CONSOLIDATION IN THE REGIONAL MEASURE AT ALL AND THAT WE  
12 REALLY STRENGTHEN A NETWORK MANAGER AND GIVE THEM THE  
13 AUTHORITY TO FORCE THE COORDINATION. AND SO THAT WOULD BE MY  
14 RECOMMENDATION.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SPERING. VICE  
17 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I WANTED  
20 TO -- IT WAS BROUGHT UP BY SOME OF THE COMMENTERS AND  
21 SOMETHING I ALSO BROUGHT UP AND I SAW IT IN THE DOCUMENTS THAT  
22 YOU CIRCULATED ABOUT WHETHER ANY OF THE INVESTMENTS WOULD  
23 INCREASE CARBON EMISSIONS. AND IT SEEMS LIKE THE -- IN THE  
24 DOCUMENTS YOU PUT FORWARD, THERE IS SORT OF LIKE A BUNCH OF  
25 SORT OF STATEMENTS I WOULD INTERPRET AS WISHY-WASHY. I DON'T



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 KNOW IF THEY WERE INTENDED THAT WAY THAT IS PROBABLY, LIKELY,  
2 MOSTLY, YOU KNOW, THESE PROJECTS WILL BE CARBON-NEUTRAL. AND I  
3 JUST WANTED TO KNOW IF THAT WISHY-WASHINESS IS INTENTIONAL OR  
4 A CLEAR STATEMENT, WE WILL NOT BE FUNDING PROJECTS THAT  
5 INCREASE CARBON EMISSIONS OUT OF THIS MEASURE.

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. SO IN ONE OF  
8 OUR PRINCIPLES WE DID NOT INCORPORATE IN THE PRESENTATION  
9 TODAY, THAT WAS A PRINCIPLE WE WERE KIND OF PROPOSING FOR  
10 FEEDBACK AS WE DEVELOP THE MEASURE, IT WAS, YOU KNOW, CLIMATE-  
11 FRIENDLY AND WE SAID, THE MEASURE SHOULD NOT FUND ANY  
12 CAPACITY, INCREASING PROJECTS. WE'VE ALREADY HEARD SOME  
13 PUSHBACK ON IT. NOT SURPRISINGLY. IT'S SOMETHING THAT MAYBE WE  
14 CAN HEAR A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT TODAY. AN EXAMPLE IF A  
15 CAPACITY INCREASING PROJECT OF WHICH WE HAVE QUITE A LOT IN  
16 OUR PLAN WOULD BE EXPRESS LANES. MANY OF OUR EXPRESS LANES DO  
17 INCLUDE WIDENING, NOT JUST CONVERSIONS. THIS IS GOING TO BE A  
18 PROCESS OF HAVING STAKEHOLDERS, YOU KNOW, ENGAGED AND HAVING A  
19 STRONG COALITION. I THINK IF THE COMMISSION WANTS, WE CAN HAVE  
20 THAT BE OUR RECOMMENDATION THAT WE BRING FORWARD TO SENATOR  
21 WIENER. WE REALLY JUST SEEK YOUR DIRECTION ON THAT BUT I SHARE  
22 WE HAVE GOTTEN SOME CONCERNS ABOUT THAT ALREADY.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK FROM MY  
25 PERSPECTIVE, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE ARE NOT FUNDING PROJECTS



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 WHICH MAKES THINGS WORSE. IT'S LIKE DO NO HARM. LET'S START  
2 WITH THAT. WE CAN'T BE USING THIS MONEY TO FUND PROJECTS WHICH  
3 MAKE CLIMATE CHANGE WORSE. AND I'VE SAID THIS BEFORE. I  
4 WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO SUPPORT A MEASURE WHICH IS GOING TO FUND  
5 PROJECTS WHICH MAKE CLIMATE CHANGE WORSE. OBVIOUSLY, MY  
6 COLLEAGUES MIGHT FEEL DIFFERENTLY. AND THERE'S PLENTY OF MONEY  
7 THAT EXISTS IN THE TRANSPORTATION WORLD FOR THOSE PROJECTS.  
8 NOT TO SAY THOSE PROJECTS WON'T EVER GET BUILT IN THIS REGION  
9 BUT WE GOT TO FOCUS THIS MEASURE ON WHAT IS REALLY IMPORTANT  
10 AND WHAT REALLY KIND OF REPRESENTS THE REGION WHICH WE WANT TO  
11 LIVE IN AND THE VALUES THAT WE HAVE AS A REGION. AND I DON'T  
12 THINK FOR THIS MEASURE WE SHOULD BE FUNDING PROJECTS WHICH  
13 MAKE CLIMATE CHANGE WORSE. I ALSO WANTED TO -- ONE OF THE  
14 THINGS THAT I THINK I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING  
15 MORE OF IS THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO -- TO SORT OF USE A TDM  
16 MEASURE TO ENCOURAGE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. I THINK THAT'S  
17 SOMETHING IN MANY COMMUNITIES HAVE BEEN INCREDIBLY SUCCESSFUL  
18 IN GETTING PEOPLE TO TAKE SUSTAINABLE MODES. WHETHER IT'S ON  
19 THE PENINSULA, IN SAN FRANCISCO, OR IN PARTICULAR, OFFICE  
20 DEVELOPMENTS ELSEWHERE AS WELL, AT UC-BERKELEY. SORT OF ALL  
21 AROUND THE REGION IT'S BEEN SUCCESSFUL. AND ONE OF THE THINGS  
22 THAT HAS SORT OF COME UP IN CONVERSATIONS THAT I'VE HAD IS,  
23 FOR INSTANCE, THE POSSIBILITY OF REQUIRING LARGE EMPLOYERS TO  
24 PURCHASE BAY PASSES FOR THEIR EMPLOYEES AND CONTRACTORS. SO  
25 THAT THE BENEFIT FROM THE WORK WE'VE DONE TO BE ABLE TO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 PROVIDE FREE TRANSIT PASSES FOR ALL -- THE WHOLE REGION, IT  
2 WOULD ALSO SERVE AS A WAY OF INCREASING -- BOTH INCREASE  
3 RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND I WAS  
4 WONDERING IF THAT'S SOMETHING YOU HAD CONSIDERED. AND I DON'T  
5 KNOW HOW MY COLLEAGUES FEEL ABOUT IN, OBVIOUSLY.

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, WE HAVE BEEN RESEARCHING  
8 THIS. IT'S SOMETHING THAT SENATOR WIENER'S OFFICE IS  
9 INTERESTED IN. ONE THING I CAN SAY FOR A REQUIREMENT THAT  
10 EMPLOYERS PROVIDE A SPECIFIC SUBSIDY FOR TRANSIT. LEGISLATIVE  
11 COUNSEL HAVE OPINED THAT WOULD ESSENTIALLY CONSTITUTE A TAX.  
12 SO THAT'S NOT TO SAY WE COULDN'T DO IT BUT IT WOULD HAVE TO BE  
13 PART OF -- IT WOULD BE SUBJECT TO VOTER APPROVAL. SO THE  
14 LEGISLATURE COULD MANDATE A THING STATEWIDE. IF IT'S A BAY  
15 AREA MANDATE, IT NEEDS TO BE SUBJECT TO A LOCAL TAX APPROVAL.  
16 SO I THINK THERE'S SOME THINGS TO SORT OUT THERE BECAUSE WITH  
17 THE BALLOT QUESTION, HOW MANY DIFFERENT THINGS CAN YOU BE  
18 INCLUDING, WE'RE DEFINITELY RESEARCHING THIS AND ANTICIPATE  
19 BRINGING THIS INTO THE RECOMMENDATION NEXT MONTH.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THAT'S GREAT. WHAT GOOD FORTUNE IF  
22 WE ARE TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING THAT NEEDS VOTER APPROVAL SINCE  
23 WE'RE GOING OUT TO THE VOTERS TO APPROVE SOMETHING. I DON'T  
24 KNOW -- I HAVE NO IDEA HOW IT WOULD POLL BUT I WONDER IF IT'S  
25 SOMETHING -- YOU ALREADY POLLED IT AND HOW DID IT POLL?





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** I HAVE TO CHECK EXACTLY. I THINK IT WAS AROUND  
3 65%, 70% THOUGHT IT WAS A GOOD IDEA. IT WASN'T SPECIFIC TO A  
4 TRANSIT PASS BUT IT SAID, SHOULD EMPLOYERS BE REQUIRED TO, YOU  
5 KNOW, BASICALLY TAKE ACTION TO REDUCE DRIVING?

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OK. WELL, I APPRECIATE. SO THAT'S  
8 SOMETHING WE'RE GOING TO GET MORE INFORMATION ON TO BE ABLE TO  
9 HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT. OK. I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT  
10 BECAUSE OTHERWISE I THINK THERE'S A RISK EVEN IF WE DO SUPPLY  
11 FOR TRANSIT SERVICE THAT ALONE WON'T BE SUFFICIENT TO GET THE  
12 KIND OF RIDERSHIP WE WOULD LIKE. WE KNOW IN OUR COMMUNITIES  
13 THERE ARE -- DESPITE US INVESTING IN TRANSIT, THERE IS STILL  
14 EMPTY BUSES RUNNING AROUND. IF WE CAN DO THE THINGS THAT ARE  
15 GOING TO FILL THOSE BUSES, I THINK THAT WILL BE ABSOLUTELY  
16 TERRIFIC. WELL, THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK. AND THAT'S ALL.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR  
21 ALL YOUR EFFORTS. ESPECIALLY I SAW WITHIN THE REPORT OUR  
22 OUTREACH EFFORTS. THE NUMBER WE WERE ABLE TO HIT, NUMBER OF  
23 PEOPLE WE WERE ABLE TO HIT IS PRETTY INCREDIBLE. YOU KNOW, WE  
24 HEARD FROM -- I HEARD FROM SOME OF MY COLLEAGUES. AS WELL AS I  
25 HEARD FROM THE PUBLIC, MY UNDERSTANDING ON THE DOLLAR FIGURE,



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE BILLION DOLLARS WE LANDED ON, THAT WAS SOMETHING THAT OUR  
2 CONSULTANT CAME UP WITH. CAN YOU SPEAK TO A LITTLE -- LITTLE  
3 BIT ABOUT THE \$1 BILLION? WHAT I'D LIKE TO DO IS SEE IF STAFF  
4 COULD COME BACK. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE RIGHT NUMBER IS. BUT I  
5 JUST LIKE TO GET A LITTLE FLAVOR FROM YOU ON YOUR THINKING ON  
6 THAT.

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CANEPA. WE ASKED US FOR  
9 THE RATES FOR \$1 BILLION THAT'S NOT THE AMOUNT WE'RE  
10 RECOMMENDING AT THIS TIME THAT THE MEASURE SHOULD FUND. WHAT  
11 WE'LL BE BRINGING BACK IN JANUARY RIGHT NOW THE MEASURE SHOULD  
12 FUND AT LEAST \$1 BILLION. I THINK IT'S PREMATURE IT SHOULD \$2  
13 BILLION BUT I THINK WE'D LIKE TO GET MUCH FLEXIBILITY AS WE  
14 CAN FROM THE LEGISLATURE. I THINK THEY WOULD PROBABLY WANT TO  
15 PUT SOME KIND OF A CAP WHAT WE'RE AUTHORIZED TO ASK THE VOTERS  
16 AND THEN, OF COURSE, WHAT WE'RE -- ASSUMING THE LEGISLATION  
17 PASS, WHAT WE DO PUT BEFORE THE VOTERS. WE'RE IN AGREEMENT WE  
18 SHOULDN'T GO OUT THE GATE LIMITING IT TO \$1 BILLION.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. SECONDLY, WE HEARD FROM PEOPLE IN THE  
21 TRADES AND WE HEARD FROM SPEAKERS AROUND SCIU, WE'RE  
22 CONTINUING TO COMMUNICATE LIKE WE HAVE BEEN WITH LABOR,  
23 CORRECT?

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** YES. WE WILL BE REACHING OUT TO VARIOUS LABOR  
2 ORGANIZATIONS TO INVITE THEM INTO THE WORKING GROUP AS WELL.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THIS WORK IS REALLY IMPORTANT AND WE  
5 REALLY NEED TO ADVANCE THIS WORK. I NOW IT'S GOING TO GO  
6 BEFORE THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE. BUT THERE WAS SOMETHING THAT  
7 JIM SAID TO ME OR COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID TO ME THAT WAS  
8 REALLY, REALLY IMPORTANT. AS YOU MOVE THESE --

9

10 **JAMES SPERING:** I SAID SOMETHING IMPORTANT?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** FOR ONCE. WHAT HE SAID THAT WAS IMPORTANT WAS,  
13 YOU KNOW, REALLY FOCUSING ON COORDINATION, NOT CONSOLIDATION.  
14 LET'S NOT FOCUS -- LET'S NOT FOCUS OR BE DISTRACTIVE. LET'S  
15 FOCUS ON THE WORK THAT IS IMPORTANT. AND THAT'S STRENGTHENING  
16 THE REGIONAL MANAGEMENT POSITION. I DON'T THINK -- I WILL PUSH  
17 BACK RESPECTFULLY. I DON'T THINK WE HAVE WORLD-CLASS  
18 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OR SYSTEMS. I THINK WHAT WE REALLY NEED  
19 TO DO AND WHY THIS WORK IS SO IMPORTANT. AND I REMEMBER VERY  
20 VIVIDLY WHEN I HAVE GONE THROUGH SEVERAL FIRE CONSOLIDATIONS.  
21 WE MAKE DECISIONS, DECISIONS THAT ARE SORT OF -- THEY MAKE  
22 PEOPLE FEEL UNCOMFORTABLE. PEOPLE GET PAROCHIAL BECAUSE THEY  
23 WANT TO KEEP WHAT THEY HAVE IN PLACE. MY DECISION-MAKING  
24 PROGRESS IS NOT REALLY ABOUT TODAY. IT'S PART OF IT. BUT WHAT  
25 THE FUTURE OF ORGANIZATIONS LOOK LIKE. SO I WANT US TO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 CONTINUE TO STAY FOCUSED. I THINK SOME COMMENTS WERE REALLY  
2 HELPFUL. I WANT TO FOCUS WHAT'S BEST FOR THE END USER. THE  
3 SECOND THING I WANT TO FOCUS ON IS, WHERE ARE THE  
4 EFFICIENCIES? I THINK WE NEED TO REALLY UNDERSTAND WHERE THE  
5 EFFICIENCIES ARE. WHEN YOU HAVE 27 OPERATORS IN A REGION,  
6 THERE HAS TO BE SOME SYNERGY. THERE HAS TO BE SOME. I AM NOT A  
7 TRANSPORTATION EXPERT. NOR DO I PRETEND TO BE ONE. BUT HERE'S  
8 WHAT I DO KNOW. THAT THERE ARE OTHER PLACES IN THE UNITED  
9 STATES, THERE ARE OTHER PLACES AROUND THE WORLD THAT HAVE BEEN  
10 ABLE TO SORT OF BLEND AND WORK TOGETHER. AND TO WORK TOGETHER  
11 IN WAYS WHERE THEY'RE EFFICIENT AND THE SYSTEM IS ABLE TO  
12 WORK. I BELIEVE THAT WITH THE -- THAT WHAT THE POLL TAUGHT US,  
13 ACCESSIBILITY. PEOPLE WANT A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WORKS AND IS  
14 ACCESSIBLE. THEY WANT A SYSTEM THAT IS SAFE. ALL THESE THINGS  
15 THEY WANT. AND WE'RE CURRENTLY NOT MEETING THE BENCHMARK. I  
16 WOULD SAY THIS. POLLING IS ALWAYS SUBJECT TO CHANGE. THERE'S  
17 DIFFERENT TIMES WHERE POLLING TAKES PLACE. THERE'S DIFFERENT  
18 OTHER TIMES. SO LET'S NOT BASE ARGUMENTS JUST ON A POLL A  
19 MOMENT OF TIME -- IN A MOMENT OF TIME. I WILL CONTINUE TO SAY,  
20 LET'S ADVANCE THE WORK. I THINK STAFF IS MOVING IN THE RIGHT  
21 DIRECTION. LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING IT AT THE LEGISLATIVE  
22 COMMITTEE. ENCOURAGE MY COLLEAGUES. SOME OF THESE  
23 CONVERSATIONS ARE SO UNCOMFORTABLE, RIGHT? WE ALWAYS WANT TO  
24 SORT OF GET DEFENSIVE ABOUT CHANGE, RIGHT? I THINK WHAT WE  
25 SHOULD DO IS REALLY FIND WAYS TO EMBRACE CHANGE. I WOULD JUST



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 ENCOURAGE US TO KEEP AN OPEN MIND AND TO REALLY SEE WHAT WE  
2 CAN DO TO ADVANCE THIS WORK. AND WHAT'S AT STAKE? IF WE HAVE  
3 MEMBERS WHO ARE, YOU KNOW, REALLY NOT ALIGNED OR NOT  
4 SUPPORTIVE, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE ABLE TO GO TO  
5 SACRAMENTO WITH A COHERENT AND COHESIVE MESSAGE AND THAT'S  
6 REALLY GOING TO BE IMPORTANT. BECAUSE IF THEY DON'T SEE THAT  
7 FROM THIS BOARD, IT COULD BE EXTRAORDINARILY CHALLENGING. SO I  
8 THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER  
11 CANEPA. I THINK YOU SUMMARIZED IT VERY WELL. COMMISSIONER  
12 GLOVER, DO YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

13

14 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** FIRST, I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR THE ROBUST  
15 CONVERSATION THAT WE HAD AROUND THIS ISSUE. I THINK IT'S BEEN  
16 VERY IMPORTANT. AND I THINK THAT THE STAFF HAS HEARD QUITE A  
17 BIT IN TERMS OF WHAT'S GOING ON. BUT ONE OF THE MORE  
18 COMPELLING PIECES FOR ME WAS THE CHANGE OF THE LANGUAGE. WHEN  
19 YOU TALK ABOUT CONSOLIDATION. BECAUSE IT IS A SCARY WORD  
20 BECAUSE SOMEONE ASSUMING THEY WILL BE ELIMINATED AND MINIMIZED  
21 AND WHATEVER THAT PROCESS IS. AND I THINK THERE'S A LOT OF  
22 WORK TAKING PLACE NOW IN TERMS OF COLLABORATION AND TRYING TO  
23 MAKE SYSTEMS WORK TOGETHER. I AM VERY SUPPORTIVE FOR THE  
24 LANGUAGE CHANGE BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. IF YOUR COMMENTS WERE  
25 THAT OF A MOTION I WOULD SECOND THAT.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I DON'T THINK WE NEED A MOTION. THIS  
3 IS JUST INFORMATION.

4

5 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** AND ANOTHER THING, THE OTHER PIECE I THINK IS  
6 IMPORTANT, WE NEED TO CHECK IN WITH THE SUBREGIONS. WE NEED TO  
7 CHECK IN BECAUSE IF WE DON'T HAVE SUBREGIONS ON BOARD, THEN  
8 THIS MEASURE, YOU KNOW, WE CAN THROW IT DOWN THE DRAIN NOW.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER -- FINAL  
11 COMMENTS?

12

13 **SUE NOACK:** I WILL BE REALLY SHORT. I WILL BE. I AGREE WITH  
14 JIM'S COMMENTS ON STRENGTHENING THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
15 MANAGEMENT AND ALSO WITH COMMISSIONER GLOVER'S COMMENTS ON THE  
16 REGIONAL SUB AREAS. I KNOW CONTRA COSTA IS DOING AN INTEGRATED  
17 TRANSIT PLAN AND I KNOW SOME OTHER COUNTIES ARE DOING IT AS  
18 WELL. I THINK THE GENERAL PUBLIC ACTUALLY DOESN'T KNOW THERE  
19 ARE 27 AGENCIES. UNTIL YOU POLL THAT I KNOW NOBODY KNOWS THAT.  
20 THEY KNOW THEY'RE LOCAL ONE OR TWO BUT NOT 27. AND SO YOU  
21 KNOW, JUST A LITTLE BIT OF ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM. A LOT OF THE  
22 FOCUS IS ON BART. AND SO THAT'S WHERE PEOPLE WILL BE LOOKING  
23 FOR IMPROVEMENT IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS. IF THEY SEE THAT  
24 THEY WILL BE SUPPORTIVE. AGREE WITH JIM'S COMMENTS ON  
25 COORDINATION, STRENGTHENING REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. BUT



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 LET'S ALSO UNDERSTAND WHERE PEOPLE'S FOCUS ARE GOING TO BE IN  
2 ORDER TO GET A MEASURE DONE. THANKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. ALL RIGHT. WELL, STAFF, WE HEARD A  
5 LOT TODAY. I STILL REMAIN HOPEFUL. I THINK WHAT MAKES THIS  
6 REGION UNIQUE IS THE ABILITY TO DREAM AND HAVE THAT VISION AND  
7 THERE'S MORE DISCUSSION TO BE HAD BUT I THINK THIS IS GROUNDED  
8 ON MAKING IT BETTER FOR THE RIDERS. TODAY WAS A STEP IN THE  
9 RIGHT DIRECTION. AGAIN, THANK YOU TORE THE COMMISSION FOR AY -  
10 - FOR THE COMMISSION FOR A ROBUST DISCUSSION. NEXT MONTH WE  
11 WILL TALK ABOUT IT MORE REFINED. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER  
12 CANEPA, FOR THAT REPORT. ITEM 10, REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT.  
13 COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

14

15 **DAVID RABBITT:** WE MET ON DECEMBER 8, 2023, AND REFERRED ONE  
16 ITEM FOR THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THAT AS YOU SAID ITEM  
17 10-A. RESOLUTION 4622, DRAFT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
18 COUNCIL CHARTER. YOUR PACKAGE INCLUDES A MINOR CLARIFICATION  
19 THAT WAS MADE BETWEEN COMMITTEE AND COMMISSION MAILING. ALSO,  
20 THE RNM COUNCIL MET ON MONDAY AND UNANIMOUSLY ENDORSED THE  
21 CHARTER. AND WITH ALL OF THE ABOVE, I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC  
22 RESOLUTION 4622.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY RABBITT. SECOND BY NOACK. DO  
2 WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** YES, I DO SEE ONE RAISED HAND FROM  
5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, SORRY. AND  
6 NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITER.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES, THANK YOU. AND I'M HAPPY TO SUPPORT THE  
11 MOTION. I WANT TO ASK IF THE FULL COMMISSION CAN RECEIVE  
12 QUARTERLY REPORTS ON OUR PROGRESS.

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE WANT TO COME UP WITH A REGULAR CADENCE AND  
15 IF QUARTERLY IS WHAT THE COMMISSION WANTS WE CAN DO SO. WE  
16 SORT OF ESTABLISHED THE BEGINNING OF A WORK PLAN WITH THE  
17 COUNCIL AND ONE OF THEM IS VERY MEASURABLE PERFORMANCE  
18 INDICATORS OF WHICH REPORTING WOULD BE ONE OF THEM SO WE WOULD  
19 BE HAPPY TO DO SO.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** IF WE CAN START WITH QUARTERLY AND IF YOU THINK  
22 YOU NEED MORE OR LESS, THEN MAYBE WE CAN -- I THINK THIS IS  
23 SUCH AN IMPORTANT BODY OF WORK THAT I THINK, ONE, IT'S GOOD TO  
24 SUNSHINE IT WITH THE FULL COMMISSION BUT ALSO KEEP EVERYBODY  
25 CLOSER IN COMMUNICATION I THINK WILL MAKE THESE MEETINGS





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 SMOOTHER BY THE TIME THE ACTION MOVES FORWARD. THANK YOU. IF  
2 THAT COULD BE INCLUDED AS PART OF THE MOTION.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT, DOES  
5 YOUR MOTION REFLECT THAT?

6

7 **DAVID RABBITT:** IT DOES NOW.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND WHO SECONDED THAT?

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** I DID.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK, PERFECT. SO WE HAVE MOTION. WE  
18 HAVE NO PUBLIC COMMENT. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** SORRY. RYAN WILLIAMS ACTUALLY RAISED HIS  
21 HAND. OK. MR. WILLIAMS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE  
22 ONE MINUTE.

23

24 **RYAN WILLIAMS:** QUESTION FOR STAFF. AND COMMISSIONER RABBITT,  
25 SUPERVISOR RABBITT. RIGHT NOW IT LOOKS LIKE THE BOARD IS JUST



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 THE OPERATORS. MY QUESTION IS WHETHER THERE SHOULD BE A PUBLIC  
2 ADVOCACY ORGANIZATION AND A LABOR GROUP POTENTIALLY ALSO ON  
3 THIS BOARD TO, AS THESE ARE GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTING DIFFERENT  
4 POLICIES WITHIN THE AGENCIES, AND MAYBE BEST TO KIND OF FLAG  
5 ISSUES THAT -- ON THE IMPLEMENTATION SIDE WHERE A MEMBER OR A  
6 LABOR ORGANIZATION SUCH AS ATU COULD PROVIDE THAT EARLY INPUT  
7 AND FEEDBACK AS -- BEFORE IT GETS FURTHER DOWN THE PLANNING  
8 LINE. SO JUST WANTED TO FLAG THOSE ISSUES AND SEE WHAT THE  
9 PROCESS OR VISION OF THE COUNCIL WOULD BE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL  
12 RAISED HANDS.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST AND SECOND.

15

16 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** CHAIR PEDROZA. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.  
17 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. COMMISSIONER AHN IS ABSENT. EXCUSE ME  
18 FOR JUST A MOMENT, PLEASE. COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER  
19 CHAVEZ.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

24

25 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING HAS A TECHNICAL  
3 ISSUE AND SHE'S TRYING TO RECONNECT. SO WE'RE WAITING FOR  
4 THAT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

5

6 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** YES.

7

8 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.  
9 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

10

11 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

12

13 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER RONEN. I CAN SEE YOUR  
14 SCREEN. WE'LL COME BACK TO HER. COMMISSIONER SPERING.

15

16 **JAMES SPERING:** YES.

17

18 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. PASSES  
19 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS HERE.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK.

22

23 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** BEFORE WE MOVE ON, MR. CHAIR, WITH THE  
24 TECHNICAL DIFFICULTY FROM VICTORIA FLEMING, COMMISSIONER  
25 FLEMING, WE NEED TO SUSPEND THE MEETING.



1

2 **SPEAKER:** SHE'S IN A NOTICED LOCATION.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I AM IN TOUCH WITH HER. WE'LL SEE WHAT  
5 WE CAN GET.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SORRY.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS AND PUBLIC,  
12 WE ARE GOING TO TAKE A 10-MINUTE RECESS. WE'LL COME BACK  
13 AROUND 11:25, AND WE SHOULD BE RECONNECTED BY THEN. 12:25.  
14 12:25. AND BEFORE I CONFIRM, CAN ALL THE COMMISSIONERS STAY SO  
15 WE DON'T RUN INTO ANY QUORUM --

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE TO LEAVE AT 1:00.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. WE'LL RECONFIRM. [MEETING IN  
20 RECESS UNTIL 12:25]

21

22 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONERS, THE AUDIO FEED IS STILL  
23 LIVE. BE MINDFUL THAT IT IS LIVE. THANK YOU.

24

25 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** MR. CHAIR, WE'RE READY AT YOUR LEISURE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONERS, WE'RE GOING TO GET  
3 STARTED. IF YOU CAN MAKE YOUR WAY BACK, PLEASE. OK. I WILL  
4 START NAMING FOLKS. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. COMMISSIONER ABE-  
5 KOGA. COMMISSIONER CANEPA. AND I DO APPRECIATE YOU ALL HANGING  
6 AROUND, BY THE WAY. ALL RIGHT. WE'RE ALL SETTLED IN. COUNSEL.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS OUR EXTREME THANKS TO THE  
9 SANTA ROSA CLERKS WHO DID NOT KNOW THEY WOULD BE HELPING RUN  
10 THIS MEETING AND STEPPED IN AT A MOMENT'S NOTICE SO THANK YOU  
11 TO THE STAFF.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK, THANK YOU, COUNSEL. WE'LL CONTINUE  
14 ON WITH OUR AGENDA. 11. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE.  
15 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE PROGRAMMING AND  
18 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET AND WE REFERRED 11 ITEMS TO THE  
19 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. SEVEN WE ALREADY APPROVED ON TODAY'S  
20 CONSENT AGENDA. AND JUST FOR COLLEAGUES, WE'RE GOING TO GO  
21 THROUGH 11-A AND 11-B AND THEN WE WILL BE ABLE TO ADD 8.4 FOR  
22 CLARITY. 11-A IS APPROVAL OF THE REGIONAL SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL  
23 PLAN REQUIRED UNDER SENATE BILL 125 TO THE CALIFORNIA STATE  
24 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY IN EXCHANGE FOR THE RELEASE OF \$1.1  
25 BILLION IN TRANSIT AND INNER CITY CAPITAL PROGRAM AND ZERO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 EMISSION TRANSIT CAPITAL PROGRAM FUNDING BETWEEN MTC BETWEEN  
2 THE FISCAL YEARS OF 2023-2024 AND 2026-2027 AND ASSOCIATED  
3 REVISION TO MTC RESOLUTION 4619. I WANT TO MOVE APPROVAL OF  
4 THIS RESOLUTION 4619 REVISED.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** QUESTION.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS IN ZOOM. NO ONE  
11 HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** CHAIR PRESIDENT BIDEN. VICE CHAIR  
16 JOSEFOWITZ. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. COMMISSIONER AHN IS ABSENT.  
17 COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
18 VERNACI. COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT BUT LOCATION STILL  
19 OPEN. COMMISSIONER GLOVER. COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.  
20 COMMISSIONER MILEY. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER  
21 NOACK. COMMISSIONER RABBITT. COMMISSIONER RONEN. COMMISSIONER  
22 SPERING. COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. THE MOTION PASSES  
23 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** 11-B, MTC RESOLUTION 4603 REVISED. THIS ITEM  
2 UPDATES THE 2024 RTIP POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND PROGRAM OF  
3 PROJECTS FOR THE 2024 RTIP. \$226 MILLION. AND I MOVE APPROVAL  
4 OF 4603 REVISED.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAVEZ.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? DON'T SEE ANY.

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND DON'T  
13 SEE NOBODY WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM AND NO ONE  
14 APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR PEDROZA. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.  
19 COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
20 VERNACI. COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER.  
21 COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY. COMMISSIONER  
22 MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER PAPAN. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.  
23 COMMISSIONER RONEN. COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES  
24 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, COLLEAGUES. WE HAD ROBUST  
2 DISCUSSIONS. I DON'T WANT THIS TO FEEL EASY BECAUSE IT TOOK A  
3 WHILE AND I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO STAFF TO 11-C. MTC  
4 RESOLUTION 4505 REVISED, REVISES MTC'S ONE BAY AREA GRANT  
5 PROGRAM TO UPDATE THE HOUSING ELEMENT COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS  
6 AND MTC RESOLUTION 4202 REVISED AND 4348 REVISED. REVISES  
7 MTC'S HOUSING INITIATIVE POOL TO ADOPT ELIGIBILITY AND  
8 PROGRAMMING GUIDELINES AN UPDATE OF THE FINAL YEAR OF THE  
9 PROGRAM FROM 2022 AND THE PRELIMINARY LIST OF HIP PROGRAM  
10 STANDINGS BY JURISDICTION 2018-2022. AS OUTLINED IN THE MEMO  
11 IN YOUR PACKET, THE COMMITTEE REPORTED THE STAFF  
12 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WITH A SIX-  
13 MONTH STATUS UPDATE IN JUNE, 2024. AT THAT TIME THE COMMISSION  
14 WOULD RECEIVE UPDATES FROM STAFF ON THE JURISDICTIONS THAT DO  
15 NOT HAVE AN HCD CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENT. RECEIVE INFORMATION  
16 FROM STAFF ON ANY PROJECTS THAT RECEIVED EXCEPTIONS TO THE  
17 HOUSING ELEMENT GRACE PERIOD CONSISTENT WITH THE PROPOSED  
18 POLICY AND, THREE, HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO REAFFIRM THE HOUSING  
19 ELEMENT CERTIFICATION GRACE PERIOD OR MODIFY THE DEADLINE OR  
20 RELATED POLICIES FOR INDIVIDUAL PROGRAMS OR SPONSORS. THIS IS  
21 ALIGNED WITH THE OTHER ITEM THAT WE DID NOT VOTE ON YET. AND  
22 THAT WAS ITEM -- ALL UNDER ITEM H -- SORRY, 8-H. CHAIR, I'D  
23 LIKE TO RECOMMEND WE HEAR BOTH ITEMS CONCURRENTLY.  
24





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I WOULD SUPPORT THAT AND I JUST WANT  
2 TO MAKE SURE COUNSEL WOULD ACKNOWLEDGE THAT AND THEY ARE. SO  
3 THANK YOU FOR YOUR REPORT, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER  
4 PAPAN, DO YOU WANT TO START WITH YOUR QUESTION?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** YES, THANK YOU. I DON'T BELIEVE WE REALLY NEED TO  
7 PUT OUR PLACE -- PUT OUR -- THIS BODY IN PLACE OF THE HCD  
8 HERE. SO I THOUGHT THAT THE DISCUSSION PREVIOUSLY WAS MORE  
9 ALONG THE LINES OF EDUCATING US AS TO WHY CERTAIN HOUSING  
10 ELEMENTS MAY NOT HAVE BEEN MET. I DO KNOW THERE'S A GREAT DEAL  
11 OF LEGISLATIVE CONCERN AS TO HOW HCD IS PROCESSING SOME OF  
12 THESE AND IT'S CAUSING A GREAT AMOUNT OF DELAY SO I HAD NO  
13 PROBLEM COMING BACK IN JUNE TO REALLY UPDATE US ON THE  
14 EDUCATION AS TO WHAT'S HAPPENING AT THE STATE LEVEL AND THE  
15 LOCAL LEVEL BUT I DO NOT THINK WE NEED TO REAFFIRM OR MODIFY  
16 THE CURRENT EXTENSION OF THE GRACE PERIOD. SO I THINK IT WAS  
17 CLEAR WITH THE BODY THAT THE GRACE PERIOD WOULD BE EXTENDED TO  
18 DECEMBER 23, 2024. I JUST AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE CURRENT  
19 LANGUAGE IN THE REPORT AS TO REAFFIRMING AND MODIFYING. I  
20 DON'T THINK THAT'S HELPFUL IN ANY WAY, SHAPE, OR FORM. IF WE  
21 CAN REMOVE THAT I WOULD BE GRATEFUL.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. STAFF, DO YOU WANT TO  
24 RESPOND?

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** SURE. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. ALIX. WHAT WE PUT IN  
2 THE REPORT IS WHAT WE HEARD FROM THE PROGRAMMING AND  
3 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. AND THERE WAS LANGUAGE AROUND REAFFIRM.  
4 I RECOGNIZE THAT THERE MAY HAVE BEEN SOME CONFUSION IN THAT  
5 LANGUAGE SO WE JUST TRIED -- IT WAS A ROBUST CONVERSATION LIKE  
6 EARLIER BUT A DIFFERENT TOPIC AND SO WE TRIED TO CAPTURE AND  
7 WE DID LISTEN TO THE TAPE A FEW TIMES. WE TRIED TO CAPTURE  
8 WHAT THE MOTION WAS. IF THERE IS SOME -- IF SOME ADDITIONAL  
9 CLARITY IS NEEDED, THAT WE WANT TO REFINER THAT, I THINK THAT  
10 IS FINE, CERTAINLY FROM STAFF'S PERSPECTIVE. I DON'T KNOW IF  
11 YOU WANT TO MAKE A SUGGESTION OR JUST HAVE A CONVERSATION OR  
12 YOU WANT STAFF TO SUGGEST SOMETHING.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU, ALIX, FOR  
17 THE WORK. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I WANT TO KNOW IF YOU'RE OK WITH  
18 THE FOLLOWING LANGUAGE ON THE EXTENSION. SAYS, FOLLOWING  
19 REVIEW OF THE BAY AREA JURISDICTIONS, HOUSING ELIGIBILITY,  
20 JUNE, 2024, THE COMMISSION WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO  
21 REAFFIRM THE GRACE PERIOD EXTENSION OF DECEMBER 31, 2024. NO  
22 ACTION BY THE COMMISSION WILL BE NECESSARY TO MAINTAIN THE  
23 GRACE PERIOD OF DECEMBER 31, 2024. THAT SEEMS AS IF IT'S  
24 REASONABLE AND ADDRESSES YOUR CONCERNS BUT JUST WANT TO MAKE  
25 SURE IF YOU HAVE ANY ISSUES WITH THAT.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I AM STILL A TAD BIT CONFUSED HERE. I THINK THE  
5 DISCUSSION -- WE DON'T REALLY NEED TO REAFFIRM THE GRACE  
6 PERIOD. I THINK WHAT WE REALLY WANTED TO LEARN WAS, WHAT IS  
7 HAPPENING AS FAR AS THE PROCESS? AND IS THE PROCESS WORKING?  
8 SO I THOUGHT COMING BACK TO THE COMMITTEE AT THAT POINT IN  
9 TIME WE WOULD RECEIVE INFORMATION AS TO THE HCD PROCESS AND  
10 HOW IT IS WORKING. BECAUSE I CAN ASSURE YOU RIGHT NOW, IT'S  
11 NOT WORKING ON ANY LEVELS. IF MY COLLEAGUES WOULD AGREE WE  
12 COME BACK WITH A REPORT ON HOW THE CERTIFICATION PROCESS IS  
13 WORKING, THAT WOULD, I THINK, SATISFY ME. BUT I LOOK TO MY  
14 COLLEAGUES. I SEE SOME NODDING HEADS.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THAT MAY BE THE RIGHT APPROACH.  
17 SO I'M WILLING TO SUPPORT THAT.

18

19 **DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK YOUR COMMENTS MAKES SENSE. YOU KNOW, IF  
20 YOU WANT TO MOVE THE ITEM WITH THE LANGUAGE, I THINK -- YOU  
21 KNOW, I THINK IT MAKES SENSE.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET ME GO TO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WAS AT THE COMMITTEE  
2 MEETING AND I HEARD SIMILARLY WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I THINK  
3 WE ARE REALLY JUST LOOKING AT A CHECK-IN AND A REPORT OUT ON  
4 WHAT'S HAPPENING. THE CONCERN WAS ONLY I THINK 58 OUT OF THE  
5 101 CITIES HAVE BEEN CERTIFIED. SO THAT'S THE CONCERN.  
6 DEPENDING ON WHO YOU TALK TO, MY COMMUNITIES HAVE TOLD ME THEY  
7 JUST HAD A LOT OF CHALLENGES WITH HCD AND CHANGING THEIR RULES  
8 AND ADDING NEW THINGS AS THEY PROGRESS. AND SO I WAS THINKING  
9 WE KEEP THE GRACE PERIOD TO THE 12/31/24 BUT JUST GET A REPORT  
10 OUT ON WHAT'S HAPPENING. SO I WOULD SUPPORT COMMISSIONER  
11 PAPAN'S CHANGE.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND THEN  
14 GIACOPINI.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK INTO  
17 HCD HOUSING ELEMENT PROCESS. AND I HAD A QUESTION. I VOTED  
18 AGAINST THIS AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING. I HAD A QUESTION FOR  
19 STAFF. THEY PUT IN PLACE INDIVIDUAL -- HOW DOES HCD RUN ITS  
20 SORT OF DEADLINES, I GUESS? THEY HAVE DIFFERENT DEADLINES FOR  
21 DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS, RIGHT?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** NO.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AND THEY GRANT EXTENSIONS IN SOME  
2 CASES, RIGHT?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. NOT HOUSING STAFF. BUT I CAN TRY TO ADDRESS  
5 THIS. SO HCD HAS DEADLINES FOR EACH REGION IN CALIFORNIA. SO  
6 AS THE BAY AREA WE ALL HAVE SOME OF THE SORT OF SAME DEADLINES  
7 AND THAT FIRST DEADLINE THAT I BELIEVE IS THE FIRST DEADLINE  
8 WAS THE END OF JANUARY THIS YEAR AND THAT WAS JUST THE INITIAL  
9 DRAFT OF YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT. AND THEN THE WAY THE PROCESS  
10 WORKS IS THAT THERE'S SORT OF TIME FRAMES FOR EACH ITERATION,  
11 RIGHT? SO YOU SUBMIT YOUR INITIAL DRAFT. YOU HAVE -- THEY HAVE  
12 90 DAYS TO REVIEW AND GET BACK TO YOU. IF YOU NEED TO SUBMIT A  
13 REVISED DRAFT THAT THERE IS 60 DAYS. THAT CREATES A DIFFERENT  
14 TIME FRAME BASED ON WHERE THEY'RE AT. IN TERMS OF THE OTHER  
15 BLANKET STATE DEADLINES, THERE'S ONE, I THINK IT'S 120 DAYS  
16 AFTER THE INITIAL DRAFT. IT WAS THE MIDDLE OF THE YEAR,  
17 ESSENTIALLY. IF YOU DIDN'T SUBMIT YOUR INITIAL DRAFT BY -- IT  
18 GUESS JUNE OR JULY OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT, THEN THE REZONING  
19 DEADLINE COMES INTO EFFECT IN 2024 RATHER THAN 2026. SO  
20 ESSENTIALLY HAVE TWO FEWER YEARS TO COMPLETE THE REZONING  
21 THAT'S ASSOCIATED WITH YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT IF YOU DIDN'T  
22 SUBMIT YOUR INITIAL DRAFT ON TIME. SO THAT COULD CREATE  
23 DIFFERENT TIME FRAMES FOR DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS BASED ON IF  
24 THEY STARTED THE PROCESS ON TIME OR NOT.

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** COULD I HELP YOU THERE, PLEASE?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SURE. I'M ALWAYS HAPPY TO GET YOUR  
4 HELP.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** TO THE VICE CHAIR, WHAT HAS BEEN HAPPENING IS NOT  
7 JUST A DEADLINE TYPE OF ISSUE. WHAT'S BEEN HAPPENING IS HCD  
8 HAS BEEN CHANGING THEIR STAFF AND THEN CITIES HAVE BEEN  
9 GETTING DIFFERENT COMMENTS BACK. THEY HAVE BEEN RUBBER  
10 STAMPING COMMENTS IN RESPONSE THAT WEREN'T IN THE  
11 CERTIFICATION. SO THE ISSUES HAVE BEEN NOT NECESSARILY TIME  
12 FRAME. IT'S ISSUE HAVE BEEN PROBLEMATIC AS TO THEIR PROCESS.  
13 SO I JUST WANTED TO TRY TO OFFER THAT TO YOU.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** NO, I APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK  
16 EVERY JURISDICTION NOT IN COMPLIANCE PROBABLY HAS A DIFFERENT  
17 REASON FOR NOT BEING IN COMPLIANCE. BUT HCD PUBLISHES A  
18 DASHBOARD ON WHEN JURISDICTIONS HAVE SUBMITTED THEIR INITIAL  
19 HOUSING ELEMENT. AND IT WAS INTERESTING TO NOTE THAT MOST OF  
20 THE JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE STILL OUT OF COMPLIANCE -- NOT ALL  
21 OF THEM. AS I SAID, MOST OF THE JURISDICTIONS THAT SUBMITTED  
22 THAT ARE OUT OF COMPLIANCE TODAY SUBMITTED THEIR HOUSING  
23 ELEMENTS WITHIN THE LAST TWO MONTHS WHICH IS LIKE 10 MONTHS  
24 LATE, AT LEAST. THERE WAS SOME JURISDICTIONS WHO ARE STILL  
25 SUBMITTING THEIR FIRST DRAFT LAST WEEK AS I UNDERSTAND IT. AND



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 SO I THINK I HAVE NOT -- I DON'T -- WE AS A COMMISSION HAD  
2 DECIDED IT WAS VERY IMPORTANT THAT OUR COMMUNITIES COME INTO  
3 COMPLIANCE WITH STATE HOUSING BOARD, THAT THEY MEET THEIR  
4 HOUSING OBLIGATIONS TO THEMSELVES AND TO EACH OTHER AND TO  
5 THIS REGION. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAD DONE TO DO THAT  
6 IS TO SAY, HEY, WE'RE GOING SUPPORT THE HOUSING ELEMENT  
7 PROCESS AND NOT GIVE -- AND SORT OF REQUIRE JURISDICTION TO  
8 COME IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE HOUSING ELEMENTS TO RESEARCH  
9 FUNDS. I AM TOTALLY SORT OF OPEN -- OPEN TO THOSE WHO MADE  
10 THEIR BEST EFFORTS AND ARE BEING SCREWED AROUND BY HCD. I HAVE  
11 A MASSIVE PROBLEM FOR JURISDICTIONS WHO SORT OF DIDN'T DO  
12 THEIR HOMEWORK ON TIME AND BLAMING THEIR TEACHER FOR NOT  
13 GETTING THE GRADES BACK.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THE BUILDING IS SCARY.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I KNOW. I'M NOT GOING TO VOTE FOR  
18 THIS, AGAIN, BECAUSE I THINK THAT THERE ARE -- THAT THE  
19 JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE SORT OF 11 MONTHS LATE OF GETTING IN  
20 THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT -- JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE NOT TINY  
21 COMMUNITIES. JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE LARGE HAVE PLENTY OF  
22 RESOURCES. MIGHT HAVE FACED CHALLENGES. CHALLENGES WHICH I'M  
23 NOT SURE WOULD BE VALID EXCUSES. AND SO I DON'T THINK WE  
24 SHOULD BE GIVING THEM AN EXTENSION. I THINK WE SHOULD BE  
25 SUPPORTING THE STATE HOUSING LAW WHICH IS DESIGNED FOR EACH



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 ONE OF OUR COMMUNITIES TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE PRODUCING  
2 ENOUGH HOUSING, NOT JUST FOR OURSELVES BUT FOR THE WHOLE  
3 REGION.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR.  
6 COMMISSIONER RABBITT AND THEN COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

7

8 **DAVID RABBITT:** I, TOO, RECOGNIZE, IF THERE IS A BLATANT  
9 SLOWING OF THE PROCESS FOR THE SAKE OF TURNING IT IN SLOW,  
10 THAT WOULD BE ONE THING. BUT I THINK EVEN THOSE THAT ARE LATE  
11 TO TURN IN, QUITE HONESTLY, HAVE THE SAME ISSUES THAT WE HAVE  
12 THE LAST DISCUSSION ITEM THAT WE HAD, A CONTROVERSIAL CHANGE  
13 THAT NEEDS TO BE VETTED IN THE PUBLIC AND WORK THROUGH A  
14 POLITICAL PROCESS WHICH JUST TAKES TIME. OUR COUNTY, WE CHOSE  
15 NOT TO CUT BACK ON THE PUBLIC OUTREACH. IN FACT, DID MORE  
16 PUBLIC OUTREACH WITH THE HOUSING ELEMENT. WE TURNED IT IN  
17 LATER THAN WE SHOULD HAVE. BUT WE FELT THAT WAS NOT -- IT  
18 WASN'T WORTH RUSHING AND CUTTING THAT PORTION OUT. YOU KNOW, I  
19 AM ANTICIPATING NOT SAYING 11 MONTHS BUT IF YOU HAVE A HOUSING  
20 ELEMENT THAT'S EVOLVING OVER THE COURSE OF THAT TIME AND STAFF  
21 WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE BEHIND IT, I THINK THAT'S  
22 UNDERSTANDABLE. AT THE END OF THE DAY, IF WE DON'T HAVE A  
23 JURISDICTION WITHIN THE BAY AREA THAT HAS NO HOUSING ELEMENT,  
24 THAT'S I THINK WHAT WE REALLY NEED TO CONCENTRATE ON. SO --





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 BUT THERE ARE LEGITIMATE REASONS IN PROCESS, IN POLITICS, THAT  
2 TAKES A WHILE TO MOVE EVERYONE IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES, THANK YOU. I WAS JUST GOING TO ADD  
7 WHAT WAS JUST MENTIONED THAT AFTER I HEARD ABOUT THIS, I WAS  
8 NOT AT THAT MEETING. I'M NOT ON THOSE COMMITTEES, BUT I DID  
9 CHECK WITH THE TWO CITIES IN MY COUNTY THAT HAVEN'T HAD THE  
10 APPROVED HOUSING ELEMENT AND THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT I WAS TOLD.  
11 THAT THEY KEPT SUBMITTING BUT IT KEPT GOING TO A DIFFERENT  
12 PERSON AND SO THE COMMENTS KEPT GETTING CHANGED AND ADDED TO  
13 AND IT'S JUST IMPOSSIBLE WHEN YOU'RE IN THAT KIND OF AN  
14 ENVIRONMENT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S SEE IF THERE'S PUBLIC  
17 COMMENT AND THEN I'LL BRING IT BACK TO MAYBE COMMISSIONER  
18 PAPAN THAT MAYBE HAD AN IDEA OF A --

19

20 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** I HAVE MY HAND RAISED.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** APOLOGIZE.

23

24 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** I HAD GUM SURGERY RECENTLY AND YOU WOULD NOT  
25 LIKE TO SEE MY FACE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO, THAT'S OK. WE CAN HEAR YOUR VOICE  
3 SO GO AHEAD.

4

5 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** YES, THANK YOU. AS THE PERSON WHO ORIGINALLY  
6 RAISED THIS ISSUE AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING, I WOULD LOVE THE  
7 OPPORTUNITY TO CLARIFY WHAT MY INTENTION WAS BECAUSE I DO HOPE  
8 THAT THE COMMISSION PRESERVES THE LANGUAGE THAT STAFF HAS PUT  
9 OR MAYBE WE COULD MODIFY IT A LITTLE TO BETTER REFLECT THE  
10 INTENTION. RIGHT NOW, THERE IS AN UNCONDITIONAL, ACROSS THE  
11 BOARD ONE-YEAR EXTENSION FOR EVERY SINGLE JURISDICTION TO COME  
12 INTO COMPLIANCE AND GET THEIR CERTIFICATION FOR THE HOUSING  
13 ELEMENT IN ORDER TO GET THEIR GRANT FUNDS. I AM CONCERNED THAT  
14 THIS BODY NEEDS TO CONTINUE TO STAY STRONG AND HOLD  
15 JURISDICTIONS' FEET TO THE FIRE TO DO THEIR FAIR SHARE IN  
16 ADDRESSING OUR REGION'S HOUSING CRISIS. AND WITH THE RECENT  
17 MODIFICATIONS TO THE TOC POLICY, WE ARE NOT SENDING A GOOD  
18 MESSAGE. THIS BODY ALSO DOES NOT HAVE A WAY FOR COMMISSIONERS  
19 TO REQUEST THINGS TO BE AGENDAIZED AND TO COME BEFORE BODY.  
20 AND SO MY SUGGESTION -- AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN, YOU MAY RECALL  
21 I RECENTLY SUGGESTED SHORTENING THE GRACE PERIOD TO SIX MONTHS  
22 AND OUT OF RESPECT FOR THE CONCERNS YOU RAISED, WE -- THIS WAS  
23 A MODIFIED PROPOSAL IN THE SPIRIT OF COMPROMISE. THE INTENTION  
24 IS NOT TO -- AND MAYBE IT WOULD FEEL BETTER IF AFTER SIX  
25 MONTHS OF INFORMATION, STAFF -- IF THEY DEEM NECESSARY, COULD



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 BRING SUGGESTIVE MODIFICATIONS TO THE PROPOSAL BECAUSE IT IS  
2 ABSOLUTELY TRUE THAT HCD IS MOVING SLOWLY AND DIFFERENT  
3 JURISDICTIONS HAVE THEIR OWN STAFFING ISSUES. THAT IS  
4 ABSOLUTELY TRUE. AND THERE MAY BE JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE NOT  
5 TAKING THEIR HOUSING RESPONSIBILITIES SERIOUSLY. WE ARE  
6 TREATING THOSE JURISDICTIONS THE SAME. WE ARE HOLDING UP THE  
7 DISBURSAL OF VALUABLE GRANT DOLLARS THAT COULD BE HELPING THE  
8 BAY AREA ADDRESS ITS HOUSING CRISIS, AND IT SEEMS THAT AFTER  
9 SIX MONTHS WE WILL HAVE MORE INFORMATION THAT ALLOWS US TO  
10 MAKE THAT ASSESSMENT. AND IF STAFF DEEMS APPROPRIATE, THEY  
11 COULD BRING FORWARD A POLICY ADJUSTMENT AT THAT TIME. I ALSO  
12 ASK -- AND A SENSE OF TRANSPARENCY AT THAT SIX-MONTH REPORTING  
13 PERIOD TO NOT ONLY PROVIDE US WITH AN UPDATE ON COMPLIANCE  
14 WITH OUR HOUSING REQUIREMENTS, BUT ALSO TO EXPLAIN WHICH  
15 EXCEPTIONS HAVE BEEN GRANTED. BECAUSE THAT IS ALSO PART OF THE  
16 POLICY AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE SAKE OF TRANSPARENCY  
17 FOR PEOPLE TO SEE WHAT EXCEPTIONS HAVE BEEN GRANTED AND WHY.  
18 SO I AM DISAPPOINTED TO HEAR WHAT I THOUGHT WAS A GOOD-FAITH  
19 COMPROMISE THAT TRIES TO ADDRESS US CONTINUING TO BE LEADERS  
20 IN HOLDING HOUSING AS A VALUE. AND I AM DISAPPOINTED THAT --  
21 IF I WERE ABLE TO VOTE I WOULD NOT VOTE FOR THESE CHANGES TO  
22 WHAT THE COMMITTEE HAD RECOMMENDED. THANK YOU, CHAIR. THANK  
23 YOU, COLLEAGUES.  
24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. AND FEEL BETTER,  
2 COMMISSIONER. ALL RIGHT. SO WE HAVE COMMISSIONER RONEN. GO  
3 AHEAD.

4  
5 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. I RAISED MY HAND A  
6 LITTLE LATE. SORRY ABOUT THAT. I JUST WANTED TO AGREE WITH  
7 COMMISSIONER SCHAAF. I THINK THAT THIS COMPROMISED PROPOSAL IS  
8 FAIR AND THOUGHTFUL ALL AROUND. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT,  
9 YOU KNOW, THAT WE -- THAT WE -- THAT THERE'S SOME  
10 ACCOUNTABILITY TO THE RULES AND ACROSS THE REGION. THIS IS  
11 COMPLETELY OUT OF THE BLUE BUT I JUST CANNOT NOT SAY THIS IN  
12 THIS PUBLIC FORUM BECAUSE AT THE SAME TIME HCD HAS BEEN  
13 DRIVING ME CRAZY IN THAT THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, WATCHING EVERY --  
14 YOU KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO HAS AN IMPROVED HOUSING ELEMENT.  
15 THEY'RE WATCHING EVERY LITTLE MOVE AND NITPICKING DECISION-  
16 MAKING THAT'S HAPPENING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. BUT NEVER, EVER  
17 HAVE THEY EVER SAID ANYTHING ABOUT MEETING OUR AFFORDABLE  
18 HOUSING GOALS. AND I JUST HAVE TO SAY THAT TO ME WHAT IS GOING  
19 TO TRANSFORM THIS REGION IS IF WE CAN ACTUALLY MEET THE  
20 AFFORDABLE HOUSING RULES IN OUR HOUSING ELEMENT. NONE OF US  
21 HAVE THE MONEY TO DO THAT. NOBODY -- OTHER THAN OUR VERY  
22 IMPORTANT REGIONAL HOUSING BOND THAT IS ESSENTIAL WE'RE GOING  
23 TO GET PASSED, YOU KNOW, THIS YEAR OR NEXT YEAR, THAT THERE'S  
24 VERY LITTLE TALK ABOUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO MEET THOSE AMBITIOUS  
25 GOALS IN EACH OF OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS. SO I SUGGEST HCD LOOK



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 AT LOOKING BARE INSTEAD OF NITPICKING LITTLE ELEMENTS OF  
2 DIFFERENT APPROVED HOUSING ELEMENTS IF THEY'RE, YOU KNOW, HAVE  
3 A SLIGHT DISAGREEMENT IN POLICY. I HAVE TO PUT IT OUT THERE  
4 BECAUSE IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S DRIVING ME NUTS. BUT I DO THINK  
5 THIS COMPROMISE SOLUTION THAT CAME OUT OF THE COMMITTEE IS THE  
6 RIGHT ONE AND I WILL BE SUPPORTING THAT AND NOT ANY CHANGES TO  
7 IT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER  
10 RONEN. I DON'T SEE ANY -- COMMISSIONER NOACK.

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** SO I'M A LITTLE -- I UNDERSTAND BOTH PROPOSALS  
13 HERE. I'M A LITTLE CONCERNED ABOUT US SORT OF EVALUATING  
14 CITIES OR COUNTIES' REASONS FOR THEIR PROCESS WITH HCD. IN  
15 PART BECAUSE -- AND I SAID THIS IN PREVIOUS MEETINGS. SOME OF  
16 THE HCD'S POLICIES ARE ABSOLUTELY COUNTER TO TOD AND TOC'S  
17 POLICIES. BECAUSE I KNOW IN MY CITY, WE PRESENTED ONE WHICH WE  
18 WOULD HAVE FOLLOWED ALONG THE TOC POLICIES BUT HCD HATED THEM.  
19 AND SO IT'S -- I THINK IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE DIFFICULT FOR  
20 US TO BE EVALUATING WHY ANYBODY'S DELAYED AND WHY ANYBODY'S  
21 NOT GETTING APPROVED AS PART OF OUR FUNDING REQUIREMENTS. THE  
22 TOC MAKES A LOT MORE SENSE TO ME IN TYING IT TO FUNDING, BUT I  
23 HATE TO BE A BODY EVALUATING WHETHER SOMEBODY HAS MET THEIR  
24 HCD. I MEAN, IF THEY HAVEN'T SUBMITTED AT ALL, TOTALLY  
25 UNDERSTAND THAT ISSUE. BUT, YOU KNOW, IF THEY ARE AROUND TWO



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 AND THREE, I -- I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD BE EVALUATING  
2 ANYBODY'S REASON WHY THEY'RE NOT CERTIFIED AT THAT POINT. SO I  
3 WOULD SUPPORT THE EXTENDING ONE TO DECEMBER.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER  
6 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. I'M GOING TO ASK TO BE REMINDED IF I'VE  
7 TAKEN PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T RECALL EITHER.

10

11 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE HAS BEEN  
12 RECEIVED. I SEE NO RAISED HANDS AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE  
13 PODIUM.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. SO I'M GOING TO LOOK TO THE  
16 COMMISSION. WE HEARD SOME DISCUSSION. WE STILL HAVE SOME OTHER  
17 ITEMS THAT DO NEED TO BE APPROVED SO I DON'T WANT TO LOSE  
18 QUORUM. BEING MINDFUL OF THAT. IF THERE'S CONSENSUS AROUND A  
19 PROPOSAL, LET'S MOVE THAT.

20

21 **JAMES SPERING:** MAKE A MOTION.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WE WANT HOUSING, AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE CAN'T MAKE IT  
24 MORE DIFFICULT THAN IT ALREADY IS. SO I AM SIMPLY ASKING THAT  
25 WE PASS THIS BUT WE REMOVE THE LANGUAGE THAT SUGGESTS



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 AFFIRMING THE GRACE PERIOD OR MODIFYING THE HOUSING  
2 CERTIFICATION DEADLINE.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** WE HAVE TO LEARN. SO BRING THIS BACK SO WE CAN  
5 LEARN WHAT THE HCD PROCESS IS AND HOW IT IS OR IS NOT WORKING.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION BY PAPAN.  
8 WE HAVE SECOND BY NOACK. ANY DISCUSSION?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAIR PEDROZA, I JUST WANT TO -- THIS IS CINDY.  
11 I'M SORRY. I'M JUST FOCUSED ON WE'RE HAVING -- WE'RE MOVING  
12 BOTH ITEMS FORWARD? AND IF SO, IF NOT, I CAN'T REMEMBER IF I  
13 PUT A MOTION ON EITHER, BUT IF WE'RE ONLY -- IF WE'RE ONLY  
14 VOTING ON 8-H, THAT MIGHT MAKE SENSE IF THERE'S CONFUSION OVER  
15 -- SORRY. NOT CONFUSION. I JUST AM TRYING TO BE CLEAR WHAT  
16 WE'RE VOTING ON.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE'RE DOING BOTH, I WANT TO CONFIRM.  
19 COUNSEL.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** SO WE ARE HAVING A QUICK PROCEDURAL HUDDLE OVER HERE.  
22 THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. YOU MADE A MOTION AND THEN THE  
23 ITEM WAS SUSPENDED AND BROUGHT FORWARD TO HEAR. SO WE WANT TO  
24 MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE CAPTURING ALL OF THE ITEMS THAT WERE IN  
25 8-H AS WELL AS 11-C.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SO WE HAVE A MOTION ON THE FLOOR.

3 COUNSEL, WE'VE POTENTIALLY HAD SOME REQUESTS TO SEPARATE THE

4 MOTIONS. WHAT PROCEDURALLY ARE THE REQUIREMENTS GOING FORWARD?

5 CAN WE MODIFY THE MOTION TO TAKE THEM INDIVIDUALLY?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES. IF -- OTHERWISE, WE HAVE AN OUTSTANDING MOTION

8 FROM BEFORE THAT WE WOULD NEED TO DO A SUBSTITUTE MOTION.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. DO I GO BACK TO THE MOTION ON THE

11 FLOOR OR DO WE SUSPEND THAT MOTION, DO WE NEED A MOTION TO

12 SUSPEND THAT MOTION?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** JUST CLARIFY THE SCOPE, I THINK IS PROBABLY THE

15 EASIEST.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. THE MAKER OF THE MOTION,

18 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, IT REFLECTS 11-C OR 8-H?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** MY INTERPRETATION AND THE COMMISSIONER CAN TELL ME

21 IF I'M WRONG THAT HER MOTION COVERS 11-C AND THAT PORTION OF

22 8-H WHICH RELATES TO THE RESOLUTION LANGUAGE. THAT'S EXACTLY

23 WHAT I MEANT.

24





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION ON THE  
2 FLOOR CLARIFYING WHAT ITS INTENTION AND SCOPE IS. A SECOND BY  
3 NOACK. THERE WAS -- WAS THERE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS ON THE  
4 MOTION ON THE FLOOR? THERE'S NOT. LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL.

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** IN THE MEANTIME, SINCE WE ARE BACK TO 8-  
7 H, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HAS RAISED THEIR HAND REGARDING THAT  
8 ITEM. SORRY.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** -- DIDN'T WE ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT?

11

12 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** WE THOUGHT WE WERE ON 11-C, UNDER THE  
13 IMPRESSION WE WERE GOING TO TALK ABOUT 8-H --

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE'LL TAKE 8-H AFTER THIS?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** IF I MAY IN ORDER THE PUBLIC GETS HEARD, LET'S TAKE  
18 PUBLIC COMMENT NOW.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** AND THEN WE CAN COME BACK TO VOTING ON THE MOTION.

23

24 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, JUSTINE, PLEASE  
25 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I. APOLOGIES. I HAD MY HAND UP BUT I THINK IT MIGHT  
3 NOT HAD BEEN SHOWING UP PRIOR. I JUST REALLY WANTED TO VOICE  
4 ENTERPRISES PARTNERS SUPPORT FOR THE PROPOSED SIX-MONTH KIND  
5 OF CHECK-IN COMPROMISE. A NUMBER OF THE COMMISSIONERS HAVE  
6 RAISED. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY WITH JURISDICTIONS AROUND  
7 THE REGION ON THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE DO UNDERSTAND THE  
8 VERY REAL BARRIERS THAT FOLKS ARE FACING WITH HCD. BUT THAT'S  
9 PART OF WHY WE THINK THE OPPORTUNITY FOR MORE TRANSPARENCY AND  
10 BETTER UNDERSTANDING AND AN OPPORTUNITY TO CHECK IN AND MAKE  
11 ANY NEEDED MODIFICATIONS AT SIX MONTHS IS SO IMPERATIVE. MTC  
12 HAS BEEN A LEADER HERE. AND WE WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE THAT  
13 COMPROMISE AT A MINIMUM MOVE FORWARD AND REALLY DO URGE YOU TO  
14 CONSIDER THAT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS,  
17 MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. SO THE MOTION ON THE FLOOR, I'M  
20 GOING TO ASK COUNSEL TO SUMMARIZE SO THERE'S NO CONFUSION  
21 AMONG THE COMMISSION, INCLUDING ME.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** MOTION ON THE FLOOR IS AS TO 11-C AND THAT PORTION OF  
24 8-H WHICH IS MODIFIED BY THE RESOLUTION LANGUAGE ADDRESSED IN  
25 THIS MOTION.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WILL WE REQUIRE A SEPARATE MOTION FOR  
3 8-C?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YES.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION ON THE FLOOR CLARIFIED BY  
8 COUNSEL. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** MAKING A NOTE TO MYSELF FOR THE MINUTES.  
11 CHAIR PEDROZA.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** NO.

16

17 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THAT WAS A NO. THANK YOU.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH.

20

21 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** MODIFY MY NOTES. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER  
2 CHAVEZ.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NO.

5

6 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT.  
11 COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

12

13 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** YES.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.  
16 COMMISSIONER MILEY.

17

18 **NATE MILEY:** YES.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS.  
21 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** NO.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** EXCUSE ME. COMMISSIONER SPERING.

5

6 **JAMES SPERING:** AYE.

7

8 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH 11

9 AYES AND THREE NOES.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, COMMISSION.

12 LET'S GO BACK TO THE ITEM THAT WAS PULLED IN CONSENT WHICH IS

13 8-H.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** AND I BELIEVE WE HAD THE MOTION PENDING. SO JUST TO

16 CLARIFY THE SCOPE OF THAT MOTION.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WHICH NOW INCLUDES AN AMENDMENT.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** WHICH NOW INCLUDES THAT MOMENT.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO MOVED, CHAVEZ. OH --

23



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO. SOMEONE MADE A MOTION. SHOULD WE -  
2 - IF NO ONE SECONDS, THE MOTION DIES, CORRECT? CAN  
3 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WITHDRAW THE MOTION?

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'LL WITHDRAW.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. THERE'S WAY TOO MUCH  
8 PROCEDURE TODAY.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SORRY.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SO WE HAVE MOTION WITHDRAWN FOR 8-H.  
13 LET ME SEE IF THERE'S ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON 8-H.

14

15 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF  
16 THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM. NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM. I  
17 RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. COMMISSIONERS, I LOOK FOR A MOTION  
20 ON 8-H.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'D LIKE TO MOVE 8-H WITH THE AMENDED LANGUAGE THAT  
23 WE PREVIOUSLY SET FORWARD IN ITEM 11-C.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY PAPAN. SECOND BY  
2 SPERING. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

3

4 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** CHAIR PEDROZA.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

19

20 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT.

21 COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

22

23 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** YES.

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.

2 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. COMMISSIONER NOACK.

3

4 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

5

6 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

7

8 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

9

10 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER SPERING.

11

12 **JAMES SPERING:** AYE.

13

14 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. PASSES BY

15 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE

18 GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 12. THIS CLOSED SESSION. 12-A. THIS IS A

19 CLOSED SESSION, PUBLIC COMMENT. KIMBERLY, DO YOU HAVE ANY

20 PUBLIC COMMENT?

21

22 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. I SEE NOTHING IN WRITING OR

23 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM AND NO ONE APPROACHING THE

24 PODIUM.

25





DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THIS IS CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL.

2 THE COMMISSION WILL --

3

4 **JAMES SPERING:** ARE WE STAYING HERE.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET ME PROVIDE THE PROPER DISCLOSURE.

7 NO ONE WANTED TO PROVIDE CLOSED GOVERNMENT. SECTION 5496.A

8 PARAGRAPH 2 SUBDIVISION D. TO CONFER WITH COUNSEL REGARDING

9 SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO LITIGATION. COUNSEL, IS THAT CORRECT?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT. WE WERE HAVING A QUICK HUDDLE ABOUT

12 LOCATION.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CAN WE CONFIRM LOCATION?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** IT'S REDWOOD CONFERENCE ROOM, FIFTH FLOOR HERE. WE

17 WILL HAVE AN ESCORT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CAN WE DO IT HERE? MY CONCERN IS WE

20 HAVE TWO, THREE OTHER COMMITTEES, AND I DON'T WANT TO LOSE

21 QUORUM. SO CAN WE HAVE AN ABILITY TO STAY HERE?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WE HAVE BEEN ADVISED THAT MAY BE A BAD IDEA FROM A

24 COMMUNICATIONS PERSPECTIVE OR CONFIDENTIALITY PERSPECTIVE?

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** BECAUSE WE HAVE POTENTIAL OF OPEN MICROPHONES AND  
2 LIVE WEBCAST, THERE'S SIGNIFICANT RISK IF WE STAY IN THIS  
3 ROOM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. ALL RIGHT. SO -- COMMISSIONERS,  
6 GIVE US A SECOND.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE THINKING ON OUR FEET. WE CAN ACTUALLY SUSPEND  
9 THIS MEETING DURING THE CLOSED SESSION. AND THEREFORE, CUT OFF  
10 THE WEB BROADCAST.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:**

13

14 **SPEAKER:** NO. SUSPEND THE COMMISSION MEETING. TO BAHAMAS MEETING -  
15 -

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AND THEN COME BACK.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SO. IF WE CAN SUSPEND THIS PORTION,  
22 CONTINUE WITH OTHER ITEMS, THAT WOULD BE -- THAT WOULD BE  
23 PREFERRED?

24



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** OK. WE CAN SUSPEND THIS AGENDA AND WE WILL RETURN TO  
2 IT AFTER THE OTHER MEETINGS SO WE CAN CONVENE THE SUBSEQUENT  
3 MEETINGS AND COME BACK FOR CLOSED SESSION. DO ASK WE DO NOT  
4 LOSE QUORUM FOR CLOSED SESSION.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MTC MEETING IS SUSPENDED. WE'RE GOING  
7 TO CONTINUE WITH THE BATA, BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY.

8

9 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** PLEASE LET ME CONFIRM WITH THE BROADCAST  
10 TEAM BECAUSE THEY ARE ACROSS THE HALL. AND I'LL THANK THE  
11 COMMISSIONERS IN ADVANCE YEAH, WE HAVE TO STAY. [CLOSED  
12 SESSION] [CLOSED SESSION CONTINUES]

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE ARE BACK TO OUR MTC  
15 COMMISSION MEETING THAT WAS SUSPENDED. BACK IN OPEN SESSION.  
16 12-C. COUNSEL, DO WE HAVE ANY REPORT OUT?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANT TO CONFIRM, WE TOOK PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
19 THIS ITEM PREVIOUS TO SUSPENDING THE AGENDA. SO WE DID MEET IN  
20 CLOSED SESSION. DIRECTION WAS GIVEN. NO REPORTABLE ACTION WAS  
21 GIVEN TODAY.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OK. AT THIS POINT, ITEM 13. PUBLIC  
24 COMMENT. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE THE COMMISSION?

25



DECEMBER 20, 2023

1   **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
2   WRITING, SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN  
3   ZOOM AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED TO PODIUM.

4

5   **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING WILL BE  
6   WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 24, IN THE NEW YEAR. AGAIN, WE ADJOURN  
7   TODAY IN MEMORY OF GARY RICHARDS. IT WAS DEFINITELY A JOURNEY  
8   BUT APPRECIATE YOUR SERVICE AND HAPPY HOLIDAYS TO EVERYONE.

9

10   **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** HAPPY HOLIDAYS TO YOU, REMOTE  
11   COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU.

12



*Broadcasting Government*