

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JUNE 14, 2023

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 14TH, 2023, 9:45 AM

1

2

3

4

CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO
CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE.
MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I
WILL CALL UPON THEM -- ACTUALLY, I WON'T -- KIMBERLY WILL.

10

TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. WELCOME ALL. WHAT I WOULD LIKE
TO DO NOW IS ASK KIMBERLY IF SHE IS CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM
QUORUM?

14

15

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. GOOD MORNING. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

16

17

CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.

18

19

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR MILEY?

20

21

NATHAN MILEY: HERE.

22

23

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

24

25

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
3 COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF IS
16 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER THAO?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO BE ADDING EXTRA
23 CAFFEINE TO THE COFFEE IN THE BACK. NEXT ITEM ON THE CALENDAR
24 IS ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2K FIRST I'LL ASK FOR QUESTIONS AND



JUNE 14, 2023

1 COMMENTS FROM MY COLLEAGUES ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. ARE THERE
2 ANY PUBLIC SPEAKERS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. SEEING NO QUESTIONS OR
9 COMMENTS CAN I GET A MOTION?

10

11 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOTION AND SECOND ON THE FLOOR. SEEING NO
16 OTHER COMMENTS OR FOLKS WANTING TO WEIGH IN, MAY I ASK FOR A
17 ROLL CALL VOTE?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. MOTION BY GLOVER SECOND BY PAPAN.
20 CHAVEZ? EXCUSE ME, CHAIR CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. THAO?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

20 PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO OUR

23 REGULAR AGENDA ITEM 3.A MTC RESOLUTION 4320 REVISED CLIPPER

24 START PILOT UPDATE AND EXTENSION. SO I THINK MELANIE AND MR. -

25 - MELANIE, YOU'RE STARTING US?



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **JUDIS SANTOS:** I'M JUDIS.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** OH, JUDIS. IS MELANIE JOINING YOU? WE'RE
5 GOING TO HEAR FROM STAFF AND THEN GO TO MY COLLEAGUES.

6

7 **JUDIS SANTOS:** GOOD MORNING. I'M JUDIS SANTOS ASSISTANT
8 DIRECTOR MTC ABAG CO-LEADING THE EVALUATION OF THE CLIPPER
9 START PILOT WITH TRACY MCMILLAN WITH NELSON NYGAARD WHO IS
10 WITH US VIRTUALLY, AND MELANIE CHOY WITH MTC FUNDING POLICY
11 AND PROGRAMS AND LYSA HALE PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE OPERATIONS
12 OF CLIPPER START. WE'RE HERE TO SHARE KEY FINDINGS FROM THE
13 EVALUATION AND EXTENSION OF THE PILOT PROGRAM UNTIL JUNE 30,
14 2025. NEXT SLIDE. MTC AND COMMUNITY PARTNERS ARE WORKING TO
15 BUILD A TRANSIT FARE SYSTEM THAT SUPPORTS THE BAY AREA BY
16 REMOVING BARRIERS TO USE PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR EVERYONE TO GET TO
17 WHERE THEY NEED TO GO. THESE BARRIERS ARE SYSTEMIC IN REACHING
18 THE FINALLY BURDENED LIKE GETTING FUNDING INTO THE HANDS OF
19 PEOPLE WHO NEED IT. DESIGNING A PROGRAM TO BE EASY, SIMPLE,
20 STRAIGHT FORWARD AS POSSIBLE SETTING MONEY AND TIME FOR RIDERS
21 AND OFFERING THE BENEFIT OR TRANSIT DISCOUNT TO TRANSIT
22 SERVICE THAT IS ENTICING ENOUGH TO THE CUSTOMER WHILE
23 FINANCIALLY VIABLE TO THE REGION AND TRANSIT OPERATORS. MTC
24 TOGETHER WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AND COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS
25 IMPLEMENTED THE PILOT LAUNCHING DURING THE LOCKDOWN PERIOD OF



JUNE 14, 2023

1 THE PANDEMIC IN JULY 2020. WE LEARNED MUCH ABOUT THE BARRIERS,
2 WHO WAS USING THE SYSTEM DURING THIS DIFFICULT TIME, AND TO
3 IMPROVE THE PROGRAM EVEN MORE WHILE KEEPING IN CHECK IT'S NOT
4 JUST ABOUT IMPROVING ONE STRATEGY LIKE MARKETING OUTREACH BUT
5 ALSO EXPLORING OTHER STRATEGIES IN PROGRAM DESIGN TO INCREASE
6 UPTAKE WHILE ALWAYS KEEPING IN CHECK FINANCIAL VIABILITY AND
7 OUR BUDGETARY ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE PILOT IS A
8 THREE YEAR PROGRAM WITH GOALS BELOW WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS
9 OFFERING 20 OR 50% DISCOUNT MIRRORS'S GOAL IS 100%
10 PARTICIPATION FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS ON THE CLIPPER SYSTEM
11 WHILE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY HAS ITS OWN LOW-INCOME DISCOUNT
12 PROGRAM MTC STAFF USE VALUE FOR VTA AND ITS CUSTOMERS TO HAVE
13 AGENCY PARTICIPATE IN CLIPPER'S START AS IT ALLOWS DISCOUNTS
14 ON CONNECTING SYSTEMS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. MELANIE WILL
15 PROVIDE PROGRESS UPDATE LATER IN THE PRESENTATION. AN
16 EVALUATION OF THE PILOT WAS A REQUIREMENT OF THE ORIGINAL
17 FRAMEWORK MTC RESOLUTION 4320 TO UNDERSTAND AND LEARN AND
18 FURTHER IMPROVE UPON THE PROJECT GOALS KEY FINDINGS AND
19 LEARNINGS ARE SUMMARIZED IN ATTACHMENT C IN YOUR PACKET AND
20 THE DRAFT TECHNICAL REPORT ON MTC'S WEB SITE SIX OUTCOMES WERE
21 IDENTIFIED BY MTC AND CLIPPER START WORKING GROUP WHICH
22 INCLUDE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION OUTCOMES AWARENESS AND
23 MARKETING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FINANCIAL VIABILITY
24 ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY CUSTOMER IMPACT OUTCOMES LIKE
25 AFFORDABILITY AND IMPROVE ACCESS AND MOBILITY. THESE OUTCOMES



JUNE 14, 2023

1 WERE MEASURED AND BY A MULTITUDE OF DATA SOURCES TO INCLUDE
2 CHIP DATA APPLICATION SURVEY PROGRAM USER SURVEY FOCUS GROUPS
3 AND GENERAL AWARENESS SURVEY THIS INCLUDES APPLICATION
4 SUBMITTED PROGRAM ENROLLEES, AND MEMBER NUMBER OF TRIPS AND
5 TRANSFERS. THE ESSENCE OF THIS TABLE IS THAT THE PILOT AS FAR
6 AS OPERATIONALLY DESIGNED IS WORKING ONCE THE USER GETS THE
7 BENEFIT WITH PARTICIPATION GETTING BETTER. AND THERE IS MUCH
8 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE IT EVEN BETTER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. KEY
9 LEARNINGS INCLUDE THE PROGRAM IS REACHING CRITICAL
10 POPULATIONS. PEOPLE WITH HOUSEHOLD INCOMES LESS THAN 20K WHICH
11 IS 57% WOMEN, 59% PEOPLE IDENTIFYING AS ASIAN OR HISPANIC,
12 62%, ARE THE MAJORITY OF ENROLLEES. GREATER PROPORTION OF
13 APPLICANTS ARE BETWEEN 19 TO 35 WITH ENROLLMENT INCREASING FOR
14 THE 19 TO 25 RANGE IN Q4 AND BEYOND. FOR INCREASED MOBILITY
15 MOST RIDERS ARE TAKING TRIPS THAN AT THE START OF THE TWO YEAR
16 PILOT WITH AVERAGE PARTICIPANT TRIP FREQUENCY UP TO 5.6 TRIPS
17 PER WEEK. FOR INCREASED AFFORDABILITY THE TRIP RATE IS HIGHER
18 THAN APPLICATION RATE FOR THE HOUSEHOLD INCOMES EARNING
19 BETWEEN 5,000 TO 30K YEARLY. AND LASTLY, UPTAKE, UPTAKE,
20 UPTAKE CONTINUES TO BE A CHALLENGE. THERE IS MUCH DETAIL ON
21 THIS PARTICULAR REBOUND OF DEMOGRAPHICS AND THE TECHNICAL
22 REPORT. I'LL HIGHLIGHT A FEW OF THE LEARNINGS. THE MAP ON THE
23 RIGHT DEMONSTRATES NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS BY ZIP CODE AND
24 DARKER AREA SIGNIFYING MORE THAN 100 APPROVED APPLICATIONS IN
25 THE AREA ZIP CODE AND LIGHTER SHADE VARIATIONS WITH LESS THAN



JUNE 14, 2023

1 100 APPLICATIONS. LARGE CONCENTRATION OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS
2 LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO, 52%, MEANWHILE THE PROPORTION OF
3 APPLICANTS INCLUDE SAN JOSE, OAKLAND, SAN LEANDRO AND BERKELEY
4 AND DALY CITY IS HAVE INCREASED. APPLICATION RATES RELATIVELY
5 LOW IN SOME OF MTC'S EQUITY COMMUNITIES INCLUDING SANTA ROSA
6 FAIRFIELD VALLEJO AND CITIES WITHIN CALTRAIN AND SAMTRANS
7 SERVICE AREA 40% OF ALL CLIPPER START TRIPS HAVE BEEN TAKEN ON
8 BART FOLLOWED BY 38 ON MUNI, BETWEEN Q ONE AND Q EIGHT
9 PROPORTION OF TRIPS TAKEN ON BART DECREASED FROM 61% TO 40% IN
10 THE SAME TIME PERIOD. THE PROPORTION OF TRIP TICKET ON MUNI
11 INCREASED FROM 32 TO 38. AGENCIES JOINED LATER ON SUCH AS AC
12 TRANSIT SAMTRANS SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY AND SMART AND EAST
13 BAY AGENCIES BUT VINE INCREASED THROUGHOUT THE PILOT PERIOD
14 ACROSS THE AGENCY ALL OPERATORS HAD MORE THAN FIRST% OF THEIR
15 SUPER START RIDES TAKING RIDERS EARNING LESS THAN 20K PER YEAR
16 PETALUMA SANTA ROSA, AND NAPA VINE 73% SONOMA COUNTY TRANSIT
17 73% HAD THE SAME PROPORTION OF RIDERS EARNING LESS THAN 20K
18 WITH BART HAVING THE HIGHEST PROPORTION OF RIDERS EARNING MORE
19 THAN 20K IN A NUTSHELL MULTIPLE STRATEGIES CAN BE UTILIZED TO
20 INCREASE PARTICIPATION RATES. THE TABLE ILLUSTRATES STRATEGIES
21 EVALUATION THROUGH IMPROVED PROGRAM ALONG WITH MTC STAFF
22 RESPONSE TO THE STRATEGIES FALL WITHIN THREE CATEGORIES
23 MARKETING ELIGIBILITY, FARE POLICY TO ADDRESS DIFFERENT
24 OUTCOMES SUCH AS INCREASING PROGRAM UPTAKE AND IMPROVING THE
25 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND DECREASING PROGRAM COSTS AND SEVEN



JUNE 14, 2023

1 STRATEGIES ARE LISTED ON THE LEFT WHICH WILL BE DESCRIBED BY
2 MELANIE IN REVIEW. STAFF ASSESSMENT RESPONSE TO STRATEGIES
3 FIRST ONE ON AUTO ENROLLMENT MODELS, LIKE WITH EBT CARDS AT
4 STATION TICKET MACHINES OR LYFT KING COUNTY METRO MODEL OF
5 AUTOMATICALLY MAILING CLIPPER START CARD TO ADULTS THAT
6 QUALIFY FOR SOCIAL SERVICE BENEFITS SUCH AS CAL-FRESH. SECOND
7 STRATEGY IS VERIFICATION OF ELIGIBILITY WHICH WOULD ELIMINATE
8 THE BURDEN OF PROVIDING DOCUMENTATION DURING THE APPLICATION
9 PROCESS. THIS STRATEGY WAS INCLUDED BECAUSE IT WAS IDENTIFIED
10 AS AN EXPLORATORY AREA. INCREASING ELIGIBILITY TO 200% FEDERAL
11 POVERTY LEVEL TO REFLECT THE COST OF LIVING IN THE BAY AREA.
12 INCREASING THRESHOLD WOULD INCREASE THE NUMBER OF RIDERS
13 ELIGIBLE FOR CLIPPER START WOULD INCREASE THE NUMBER OF
14 CLIPPER RIDERS ALTHOUGH THIS STRATEGY WOULD INCREASE THE POOL
15 OF ELIGIBLE RIDERS IT WOULD NOT INCREASE PERCENTAGE OF LOW-
16 INCOME INDIVIDUALS ENROLLED IN THE PROGRAM. UNLESS OTHER
17 STRATEGIES LIKE OUTREACH ARE DEPLOYED. CONSISTENT DISCOUNTS IS
18 THE NEXT STRATEGY ACROSS AGENCIES WOULD OFFER SAME DISCOUNT,
19 CONSISTENT DISCOUNT WOULD BE SIMPLER CREATING GREATER CUSTOMER
20 UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROGRAM. AND SEAMLESS. CURRENTLY TRANSIT
21 AGENCIES CAN CHOOSE 20% OR 50% DISCOUNT. FARE -- THE NEXT
22 STRATEGY IS FARE CAP ACCUMULATORS ALTERNATIVES TO FIXED PRICE
23 PRODUCTS. CAP FARES PROVIDE BONUS TRIPS BASED ON THRESHOLD.
24 THE NEXT IS A CUSTOMER FOCUSED APPROACH THREE ES WHICH ARE
25 ENGAGEMENT, EDUCATION, EQUITY PARTNERSHIPS. CALLS FOR AMPING



JUNE 14, 2023

1 UP COLLECTIVE MTC TRANSIT OPERATOR REACH AND ENGAGEMENT
2 APPROACHES WITH CUSTOMER CULTURAL SPECIFIC DEMOGRAPHICS
3 PREFERENCES GEOGRAPHY EDUCATION NOT ONLY THE TARGETED CUSTOMER
4 BASE BUT ALSO TRANSIT EMPLOYEES AND SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES
5 COE BASED AND SERVING TARGETED POPULATION. CALLS FOR 11INGING
6 WHAT HAS BEEN ALREADY BEEN SUCCESSFUL WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES
7 AND COUNTIES AND OTHER SECTORS LIKE PUBLIC HEALTH SOCIAL
8 SERVICE AGENCIES AND REACHING THIS CUSTOMER BASE. THE LAST
9 STRATEGY MARKETING STRATEGY MATERIALS REVIEW INVOLVES APPLYING
10 WHAT WAS LEARNED THROUGH EVALUATION TRANSFORMING COURSE
11 CORRECTING AND GROUND CHECKING OF CLARITY AND MESSAGING TO BE
12 MORE RECEPTIVE AND CLEAR AND CONCISE. I'LL HAND IT OVER TO
13 MELANIE TO REVIEW MTC RESPONSE.

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** MELANIE CHOY MTC FUNDING PROGRAM AND POLICY
16 SECTION. BASED ON THESE FINDINGS INPUTS RECEIVED FROM THE FARE
17 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AND POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
18 SUBCOMMITTEES WE ARE MAKING THREE RECOMMENDATIONS, ACROSS
19 THREE CATEGORIES, REJECT, ACCEPT, AND FURTHER ASSESS.
20 STRATEGIES TOWARD CONSISTENT DISCOUNT CUSTOMER FOCUSED
21 COLLECTIVE APPROACH MARKETING STRATEGY AND MATERIALS REVIEW
22 STAFF COULD WORK TOWARDS CARRYING OUT THESE STRATEGIES WITHOUT
23 ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT. UNDER CONSISTENT DISCOUNT WE HAVE MADE
24 STEPS TOWARD ADVANCING A CONSISTENT DISCOUNT AND IN
25 DISCUSSIONS WITH VTA STAFF THEY HAVE INDICATED PLANS TO JOIN



JUNE 14, 2023

1 AND PARTICIPATE IN CLIPPER START DURING THE PILOT EXTENSION.
2 ADDITIONALLY MANY OF THE OPERATORS THAT CURRENTLY ARE OFFERING
3 20% DISCOUNT THEY HAVE INDICATED THERE IS INTEREST IN MOVING
4 TOWARDS THE 50% DISCOUNT PENDING THEIR BOARD APPROVALS. FOR
5 ITEMS IN PURPLE NO RECOMMENDATIONS THAT FALL UNDER THE REJECT
6 CATEGORY FROM STAFF RECOMMENDATION. FOR ITEMS IN PURPLE LISTED
7 AUTO ENROLL SELF-VERIFICATION, INCREASING INCOME ELIGIBILITY
8 AND FARE CAP ACCUMULATOR WE BELIEVE THESE ARE WORTH TAKING A
9 DEEPER DIVE LOOKING INTO AND UNDERSTANDING THESE STRATEGIES
10 BETTER. FOR THESE WE ENGAGE WITH THE OPERATORS LOOK AT
11 ANALYSIS, BENEFITS AND RISKS ALSO FEASIBILITY STEPS FOR
12 IMPLEMENTING CONCEPTS. WE PROPOSE EMBARKING ON FOCUSED
13 TECHNICAL ASSESSMENTS ON THESE TOPICS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
14 OVERALL WE SEE OPPORTUNITIES FOR MAKING THE PROGRAM BETTER
15 BEFORE WE MOVE TO A PERMANENT PROGRAM. AND THE PROGRAM IS OFF
16 TO A GREAT START. THE ROLL OUT WAS SMOOTH. WE HAVE A SOLID
17 FOUNDATION TO BUILD THE PROGRAM ON. WE STOOD UP A CENTRALIZED
18 SYSTEM AND IT'S WORKING WELL. THE PROGRAM HAS ACHIEVED
19 OVERWHELMING AND WIDE RANGING SUPPORT AND WE ALSO NAVIGATED
20 THE FIRST SEVERAL YEARS IN THE MIDST OF THE PANDEMIC. AS WE
21 ADVANCE TO THE NEXT PHASE OF THE PILOT, STAND UPPING THE
22 PROGRAM THE FUTURE SUCCESS WE DO BELIEVE IS DEPENDENT ON
23 LEARNING CONTINUAL IMPROVEMENTS AND MAKING THINGS BETTER. AND
24 WE HAVE STRUGGLED GETTING THE PRODUCT IN HAND TO USE IT. OUR
25 CHALLENGE IS HOW TO GET MORE PEOPLE TO USE THE SYSTEM. FOR



JUNE 14, 2023

1 THESE REASONS AS WE APPROACH THE SUNSET DATE OF THE THREE YEAR
2 PILOT PERIOD WE RECOMMEND EXTENDING THE PILOT FOR ANOTHER TWO
3 YEARS. AND THERE ARE A NUMBER OF FRAMEWORK COMPONENTS THAT
4 WE'RE GOING TO RETAIN AS WE CONTINUE, AND THESE INCLUDE
5 PROGRAM PARTICIPATION, THE DISCOUNT OPTIONS AND CENTRAL
6 ADMINISTRATION. WHAT WE ALL ARE PROPOSING ARE SOME CHANGES. WE
7 ARE LOOKING TO EXTEND, AGAIN, THE PILOT BY TWO YEARS, WHICH
8 WOULD THEN HAVE A SUNSET DATE OF JUNE 30TH OF 2025. AND, ALSO,
9 WITH THIS RESOLUTION WE'RE PROPOSING TO REVISE A SUBSIDY
10 APPROACH WITH THE OPERATORS WE ARE PROPOSING UP FRONT ONE TIME
11 PAYMENT THAT WOULD COVER TWO YEARS OF THE PILOT EXTENSION AND
12 I CAN GO INTO THAT ON THE NEXT SLIDE, AS WELL. AND THE THIRD,
13 LAST THING, IS WHILE WE'RE NOT CHANGING, PER SE, ON TITLE SIX,
14 IT STILL REMAINS A TRANSIT AGENCY RESPONSIBILITY. MTC IS
15 SEEKING RESOURCES TO PROVIDE TECHNICAL SUPPORT FOR OPERATORS
16 AS THEY PROCEED WITH THEIR TITLE SIX EVALUATIONS AND ANALYSIS.
17 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM IS A
18 REIMBURSEMENT BASED PROGRAM, AS I MENTIONED THIS IS THE ONE
19 THING WE'RE PROPOSING TO CHANGE HOW WE PROVIDE SUBSIDY
20 REIMBURSEMENTS TO THE OPERATORS. OPERATORS ARE CURRENTLY
21 REIMBURSED ON A PORTION OF THEIR LOST REVENUE FROM CLIPPER
22 START TRIPS. MTC HAS SET A SIDE LOW CARBON TRANSIT OPERATIONS
23 PROGRAM AND STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE FUNDS TO FUND BOTH THE
24 SUBSIDY OFFSETS AS WELL AS DIRECT ADMINISTRATION COST FOR THIS
25 PROGRAM. CURRENT ESTIMATE OF SUBSIDY REIMBURSEMENT IS TOTAL OF



JUNE 14, 2023

1 700,000 SINCE INCEPTION AND IN TERMS OF ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS
2 APPROXIMATELY 1 MILLION PER YEAR IN DIRECT ADMINISTRATIVE
3 COST. FOR THE PILOT EXTENSION PERIOD WE'RE PROPOSING A CHANGE.
4 WHEN THE ORIGINAL PROGRAM WAS ADOPTED THERE WAS A CONCERN THAT
5 THE FUNDING THAT WE SET A SIDE WOULD DRY UP QUICKLY AND WHILE
6 AT THE TIME THERE WERE ONLY A FEW PROGRAMS SUCH AS THIS AROUND
7 THE NATION SO WE DIDN'T HAVE MUCH COMPARISONS AND LEARNED
8 EXPERIENCE. BUT WITH THREE YEARS OF EXPERIENCE UNDER OUR BELTS
9 THIS INFORMATION, WE'RE USING THIS INFORMATION ON DEVELOP A
10 FORMULA TO DO A ONE TIME UPFRONT PAYMENT FOR THE ONE TIME
11 EXTENSION PERIODS OF TWO YEARS FOR OPERATORS. GOALS MOVING
12 INTO THE MODEL ARE INCENTIVIZING PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM
13 AND CONSISTENCY IN DISCOUNTS OFFERED AND SECONDLY LOOKING TO
14 MINIMIZE FINANCIAL RISK TO OPERATORS AND ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN
15 FOR BOTH OPERATORS AND MTC STAFF, AND PROCESSING
16 REIMBURSEMENTS. AND THE FUNDING DISTRIBUTION STILL NEEDS TO BE
17 WORKED OUT WE WILL BE WORKING ON THIS WITH OPERATORS DURING
18 THE SUMMER TO FINALIZE ONCE WE HAVE KEY COMPONENTS OF FORMULA
19 MTC WOULD COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION WITH FUNDING APPROVALS
20 AND DISTRIBUTION AMOUNTS AND THERE ARE FUNDING COMPONENTS
21 UNDER THIS APPROVAL THAT INCLUDE FUNDING CREDITS FOR EARLY
22 ADOPTERS OF THE 50% GUARANTEED MINIMUMS IN THE FORM LOOKS AND
23 SO THESE ARE A FEW ASPECTS OF THE FORMULA THAT WE WOULD LIKE
24 TO INCLUDE IN MOVING FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IN TERMS
25 OF SUMMARIZING, STAFF RECOMMENDS EXTENDING THE PILOT PROGRAM



JUNE 14, 2023

1 FOR AN ADDITIONAL TWO YEARS TO JUNE 2025. AND DURING THE TWO
2 YEAR EXTENSION PERIOD MTC STAFF IN PARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSIT
3 AGENCY STAFF WOULD IMPLEMENT MARKETING OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT
4 STRATEGIES TO INCREASE PROGRAM USAGE. WE WOULD ALSO ACCESS
5 STRATEGIES TO SIMPLIFY AND POTENTIALLY EXPAND ACCESS TO THE
6 BENEFIT. AND LASTLY, INNOVATE AND DEPLOY DIFFERENT STRATEGIES
7 TO INCREASE REACH AND REMOVE BARRIERS TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR
8 PARTICIPANTS TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PILOT PROGRAM AND TO ALSO
9 MEET OUR PROGRAM GOALS. AND THEN LASTLY, THE FINAL
10 RECOMMENDATION IS ON THE FARE SUBSIDY MODIFICATIONS. AND
11 SUPPORT THE APPROACH OF A ONE TIME ESTIMATED PAYMENT WITH A
12 MINIMUM GUARANTEE, AND MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF WOULD FINALIZE
13 THE FORMULAS FOR THE FALL OF -- OR IN THE SUMMER OF 2023. NEXT
14 SLIDE, PLEASE. AND WITH THAT RECOMMENDATION, OUR OVERALL
15 SCHEDULE THIS HIGHLIGHTS OUR OVERALL SCHEDULE, WE HAVE DONE --
16 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF AND ALSO HAVE
17 SOLICITED FEEDBACK FROM THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AS
18 WELL AS THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SUBCOMMITTEES. WE'RE ALSO
19 PRESENTING THE RECOMMENDATION TO YOU TODAY FOR CONSIDERATION
20 AND IF APPROVED, WE WOULD TAKE STEPS TOWARDS EXTENDING THE
21 PILOT AND ALSO INITIATING THE PROGRAM IMPROVEMENTS AND
22 ASSESSING OPPORTUNITIES FOR CHANGES. AND, LASTLY, FOR AGENCIES
23 THAT ARE PLANNING TO OPT IN OR INCREASE TO 50%, INCREASE THEIR
24 DISCOUNT TO 50%, WE'RE SETTING A GOAL DATE FOR ALL THE
25 MIGRATION TO HAPPEN IN JANUARY OF 2024. SO THAT HAPPENS AT ONE



JUNE 14, 2023

1 TIME. AND AT THE TOP OF THIS TIMELINE IS COMPLEMENTARY TRANSIT
2 AGENCY BOARD ACTIONS. SO GIVEN THIS WOULD BE A FARE CHANGE,
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES WOULD ALSO NEED TO TAKE A MEASURE IT CHANGES
4 AND ACTIONS AT THEIR BOARDS TO IMPLEMENT ANY CONTINUATION OF
5 THE PROGRAM AND CHANGES IN THE PROGRAM THEY MAKE. IN
6 CONCLUSION STAFF RECOMMENDS FORWARDING RESOLUTION 4320 THE
7 REGIONAL MEANS BASED FARE PROGRAM FRAMEWORK TO THE COMMISSION
8 FOR APPROVAL. WITH THAT JUDIS AND LISA AND MYSELF ARE HAPPY TO
9 ANSWER QUESTIONS

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I FIRST
12 AM GOING SEE IF THERE ARE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. I'LL START
13 WITH VICTORIA?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS GOING TO MEET YOUR
16 STANDARD.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WE'LL SEE.

19

20 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** JUST CUT ME OFF IF IT DOESN'T PASS THE TEST.
21 I'M JUST CURIOUS COULD YOU ADD A BIT MORE INFORMATION AROUND
22 THE AUTO ENROLLMENT DETERMINATION WAS THERE -- TO GET MORE
23 INFORMATION VERSUS NOT RECOMMENDED AT THIS TIME?

24



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SURE. THE AUTO ENROLLMENT STRATEGY WAS
2 IDENTIFIED THROUGH THE FOCUS GROUPS AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT
3 OPERATORS AND IT'S ONE OF THE STRATEGIES THAT WE'RE
4 RECOMMENDING TO BE ASSESSED SO IT'S NOT FOR APPROVAL FOR THIS
5 ITEM, MORE INFORMATION AS ONE OF THE STRATEGIES TO BE ASSESSED
6 AND POTENTIALLY PILOTED.

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** IF THERE WAS ANY RATIONALITY YOU COULD OFFER
9 SO WE COULD BETTER UNDERSTAND WHY THAT DETERMINATION WAS MADE?

10

11 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WHY AUTO ENROLLMENT WAS SELECTED AS A STRATEGY.

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** WHY IT WAS NOT RECOMMENDED TO MOVE FORWARD
14 AS A RECOMMENDATION AT THIS TIME REQUIRES FURTHER ASSESSMENT.

15

16 **JUDIS SANTOS:** DURING THIS PHASE, WE'RE IDENTIFYING STRATEGIES
17 THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE ADDRESSED TO INCREASE PROGRAM UPTAKE
18 AND THERE IS ADDITIONALLY OTHER STRATEGIES THAT WE WANT TO
19 LOOK AT AND ASSESS BECAUSE THOSE STRATEGIES CAN BE INDEPENDENT
20 OR AFFECT OTHERS THAT'S WHY IT'S NOT BEING RECOMMENDED TO MOVE
21 FORWARD AS A RECOMMENDATION FOR TODAY BUT IT'S ONE OF THE
22 STRATEGIES THAT'S GOING TO BE ASSESSED AS WELL AS POTENTIALLY
23 PILOTED DURING THE PILOT EXTENSION.

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION:



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GINA?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANT CLARIFICATION. YOU MENTIONED WORKING WITH
5 OPERATORS AND SOME OPERATORS WERE MENTIONED THEN WE KNOW
6 OPERATORS LIKE CALTRAIN HAVE DIFFERENT FORMULAS SO IS THERE
7 ONGOING PROCESS WHERE YOU'RE WORKING WITH THOSE OTHER
8 OPERATORS TO DEVELOP THE DISTRIBUTION FORMULA? IS THIS
9 ONGOING?

10

11 **MELANIE CHOY:** IN TERMS OF DISCUSSION TO WORK OUT THE FORMULA
12 IT IS WITH ALL OPERATORS WE WOULD DEVELOP ONE FORMULA THAT
13 WOULD APPLY TO THE REGION AND ALL THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES.
14 THERE ARE DIFFERENCES IN TERMS OF THE AMOUNTS EACH OPERATOR
15 WILL RECEIVE AND DEPENDING ON THE DISCOUNT THEY'RE OFFERING,
16 BUT THE SAME FORMULA, THE SAME RULES WILL APPLY TO ALL
17 OPERATORS AND WE WILL COLLECTIVELY BRING THIS TO ALL OF THEM
18 FOR DISCUSSION. AND THIS IS JUST ON CLIPPER START. I DO WANT
19 TO CLARIFY THAT THIS IS REGARDING THE CLIPPER START FUNDING
20 FARE SUBSIDIES.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE IT.

23

24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO SEE IF
25 THERE ARE ANY SPEAKERS IN THE ROOM OR ONLINE THAT WOULD LIKE



JUNE 14, 2023

1 TO WEIGH IN ON THIS BEFORE WE GO BACK FOR ACTION OR MORE
2 DISCUSSION?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SO ME TO RAISED HANDS ONLINE AND NO ONE
5 AT THE PODIUM. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'LL GO TO MEMBERS FOR DISCUSSION?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I REALLY STRUGGLE WITH UNDERSTANDING WITH WHY WHEN WE
10 KNOW THE POPULATION OVERLAPS WITH CAL-FRESH BENEFITS WHY WE
11 WOULDN'T INCORPORATE THAT. AND I WANT TO GET INTO -- YOU SAID
12 AND OF THESE STRATEGIES AFFECT OTHERS ARE THERE MORE
13 STRATEGIES THAT ARE GOING TO CAPTURE THAT POPULATION OR IS IT
14 THAT WE CAN'T AFFORD TO AUTOMATICALLY INCLUDE THAT POPULATION
15 OR THAT IT WOULD BE DIFFICULT BECAUSE OF HEALTH OR FINANCIAL
16 LAWS AROUND ACCESSING THAT INFORMATION THAT WE'RE NOT
17 INCLUDING IT? WHAT'S THE BARRIER? YOU HAVE TO BE VERY, VERY
18 LOW-INCOME, ESPECIALLY WITH THE FEDERAL ROLL BACK OF AUTO
19 ENROLLMENT AND CAL-FRESH BENEFITS THEY HAVE GONE DOWN SO
20 SIGNIFICANTLY. I WANT TO SEE IF WE CAN GET SOME MORE TEETH
21 INTO THAT EXPLANATION AND CHANGE THAT FROM AN EXPLORE FURTHER
22 TO RECOMMEND.

23

24 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WE HAVE IDENTIFIED, IN ADDITION TO AUTO
25 ENROLLMENT, ASSESSING INCOME ELIGIBLE THRESHOLD THAT IS ABOVE



JUNE 14, 2023

1 200%. SO, THE AUTO ENROLLMENT, THERE ARE DIFFERENT FACTORS
2 THAT IMPACT AND ADDRESS DIFFERENT GOALS, WHETHER IT'S TO
3 INCREASE UPTAKE OR ADDRESS ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY. SO,
4 IT'S -- IN LOOKING AT ONE STRATEGY, IT ALSO AFFECTS OTHER
5 ELEMENTS OF THE PROGRAM, PARTICULARLY LOOKING AT INCOME
6 ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD AND HOW AUTO ENROLLMENT WOULD WORK.

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AGO OKAY. SO WHAT WOULD BE THE WORST-CASE
9 SCENARIO IF WE SAID YOU QUALIFY FOR CAL-FRESH, YOU ARE
10 AUTOMATICALLY ENROLLED. WHAT WOULD THE OPERATIONAL
11 ADMINISTRATIVE DOWNSIDE COST BE?

12

13 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THAT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO FURTHER LOOK AT WITH
14 THE WAYS WE DO AUTO ENROLLMENT WE HAVE SEEN TRANSIT OPERATORS
15 LIKE METROLINK LA MODEL AS WELL AS THE MODEL IN KING COUNTY SO
16 THAT'S SOMETHING WE WOULD LIKE TO LOOK AT WHAT CAN BE APPLIED
17 HERE.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** IT IS FEASIBLE TO IMPLEMENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WHAT'S CONCERNING ME, AND I THINK I'M
22 GETTING THIS FROM MY COLLEAGUE IS OF THE NEXT STEPS WE KNOW
23 WE'RE GOING TO TAKE, WE HAVE THIS IN THE ASSESSED CATEGORY
24 THAT GOES INTO THE ARE YOU KIDDING ME? WE'RE NOT DOING IT
25 CATEGORY. SO I THINK IT NEEDS TO MOVE INTO THE GREEN WHAT'S



JUNE 14, 2023

1 BEING SAID HERE AND THIS IS A QUESTION FOR STAFF, ALIX OR
2 ANDY. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT WE'RE DOING AN OVERALL
3 ASSESSMENT OF THE CLIPPER CARD USAGE AS OUR TOOL. AND IF WE
4 ARE, DOES THIS TWO YEARS IMPEDE YOUR OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF THE
5 TOOL AS A WHOLE? AND IF WE'RE NOT, WHY AREN'T WE?

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WELL, I THINK WE MIGHT NEED TO GET BACK TO YOU
8 ON THAT UNLESS LYSA HALE HAS A COMMENT.

9

10 **LYSA HALE:** BEING CALLED ON AT LAST SECOND. WE DO TRACK
11 PARTICIPATION AND USAGE OF THE CLIPPER PROGRAM SO WE HAVE A
12 LOT OF AVAILABLE DATA FOR THAT. WE DON'T SEE THERE IS ANY CON
13 FFLICT. WE WANT TO MOVE SOME OF THE PEOPLE INTO THIS CLIPPER
14 CATEGORY.

15

16 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'LL BE CLEAR. ARE WE DOING -- I'M SURE
17 WE ARE -- AN OVERALL ASSESSMENT WHETHER OR NOT THE CLIPPER
18 CARD TOOL IS ONE WE WANT TO KEEP USING. WHAT I'M INTERESTED IN
19 UNDERSTANDING IS ARE WE DOING AN ASSESSMENT OF THAT TOOL THAT
20 THE BOARD WILL AT SOME POINT HEAR B AND IF SO, HOW DOES THIS
21 OTHER BODY OF WORK JUST FOLD INTO IT?

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE
24 DIRECTOR. JUST ONE REMINDER, WE MADE A LONG-TERM INVESTMENT IN
25 CLIPPER SO IT'S DEFINITELY GOING TO BE THE TOOL THAT CONTINUES



JUNE 14, 2023

1 TO MOVE FORWARD. AND I DO THINK IT'S AS LISA MENTIONED
2 SOMETHING WE HAVE A LOT OF MEASUREMENTS ON AND THE IDEA OF
3 PROGRAMS LIKE THIS IS TO MAKE THEM COMPATIBLE AND CONNECTED TO
4 THE CLIPPER SYSTEM SO THAT CLIPPER PROVIDES, SORT OF, THE
5 WHOLE SPECTRUM OF SUPPORT FOR YOUR TRANSPORTATION MOVEMENT.
6 RIGHT? STARTING MOSTLY WITH TRANSIT. SO, I DON'T THINK ANY OF
7 THIS WORK IS, AT ALL, AT ODDS WITH THE WORK WE'RE DOING AT
8 CLIPPER. AND IT'S INTENDED TO BE CONTINUALLY INCORPORATED INTO
9 THE TOOL, AS DIRECTLY AS POSSIBLE. REMEMBERING THAT CLIPPER,
10 THE NEXT GENERATION OF CLIPPER, EVERYTHING WE'RE DOING RIGHT
11 NOW IS KIND OF ATTACHED TO THE EXISTING CLIPPER SYSTEM, BUT AS
12 WE MOVE INTO THE NEXT GENERATION OF CLIPPER NEXT YEAR, A LOT
13 OF THESE TOOLS BECOME MUCH MORE INTEGRATED IN THAT SYSTEM.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO THE REASON I'M ASKING THE QUESTION,
16 COLLEAGUES IS I'M ACTUALLY WONDERING ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT
17 TECHNOLOGY IS MOVING FAST ENOUGH THAT WE COULD BE LOOKING AT
18 ANOTHER TOOL THAT'S MORE EFFECTIVE. AND UNDERSTAND UNDER WHAT
19 CIRCUMSTANCES WE DO THAT. I'M NOT SAYING NECESSARILY IT MEANS
20 THAT WE WOULDN'T USE SOME FORM OF CLIPPER I'M ASKING THERESA,
21 I THINK THIS IS A LITTLE BIT OF A TOUCH OF VISITING
22 SWITZERLAND THAT'S MAKING ME CONCERNED THAT THE TOOLS WE'RE
23 USING MAY BE TOO CONSTRAINED FOR EASE OF OUR MOBILITY WITH A
24 NUMBER OF OUR CLIENTS AND I'M ASKING THE QUESTION BECAUSE AT



JUNE 14, 2023

1 SOME POINT WE'RE ASKING ABOUT HOW CLIPPER IS DOING AND WHERE
2 CLIPPER IS GOING.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR MORE ABOUT YOUR TRIP.

5

6 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WOULD LOVE EVERYONE IN OUR REGION AND
7 THE GM, TO GET A CHANCE NOT JUST THERE BUT I THINK THERE'S
8 MUCH TO BE LEARNED IN PART BECAUSE SOME FOLKS ARE AHEAD OF US,
9 THERE ARE TECHNOLOGY AVAILABLE TO US, INCLUDING SOME COUNTRIES
10 DON'T MAKE A BUY A CLIPPER CARD YOU JUST USE YOUR CREDIT CARD.

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YOU DESERVE AN UPDATE ON CLIPPER. CLIPPER WILL
13 HAVE THOSE KINDS OF FUNCTIONS IN IT AND I'LL SURMISE WHAT I
14 KNOW ABOUT THE INDUSTRY INTERNATIONALLY AND OTHERWISE THAT WE
15 ARE IN GOOD SHAPE WITH SAFE ONCE IT'S THOUGHT OF AND HAVE A
16 LOT OF FLEXIBILITY IN THE NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM ONCE IT'S
17 OPERATING BUT SHOULD COME BACK TO GIVE THE GROUP A GOOD UPDATE
18 ON WHERE WE ARE WITH THE CLIPPER PROGRAM.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I KNOW ANDY. I'M SORRY. [LAUGHTER]
21 KIDDING. THAT WOULD BE GREAT VALUE FOR ME. I REALLY LOOK
22 FORWARD TO THAT. IF THERE IS INFORMATION ON THE WEB SITE SAY
23 CINDY GO LOOK AT IT IF THAT MAKES YOU FEEL LIKE WE'RE AHEAD OF
24 THE GAME, I'M ALL IN. OTHER COMMENTS?

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANT TO SIDE WITH MY COLLEAGUES WITH
2 PUTTING THE IMPORTANCE OF AUTO ENROLL IN THE GREEN COLUMN.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALIX?

5

6 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ON THAT POINT OF PUTTING IT IN THE GREEN WHAT
7 I WOULD ASK FOR YOU TO CONSIDER IS LET US COME BACK IN A FEW
8 MONTHS WITH A LITTLE MORE INFORMATION BEFORE FULLY MOVING INTO
9 THE GREEN. WE ARE SPENDING MUCH MORE ON THE ADMINISTRATION OF
10 THIS PROGRAM THAN WE ARE GETTING INTO THE HAPPENED OF PEOPLE.
11 WE'RE WITH YOU ON FINDING WAYS TO GET IT INTO THE HANDS OF
12 PEOPLE. BUT ALSO NEED TO GIVE YOU MORE INFORMATIONS ON THE
13 COST OF AUTO ENROLL AND HOW MANY PEOPLE WILL REACH THAT WAY IF
14 WE COULD COME BACK IN A FEW MONTHS WITH MORE INFORMATION JUST
15 TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE GOOD INFORMATION ON THAT BEFORE FULLY
16 MOVING INTO THE GREEN I THINK THAT WILL MAKE US AS STAFF FEEL
17 BETTER, THAT YOU HAVE MORE INFORMATION ON THAT. I WOULD LIKE
18 TO SEE MORE INFORMATION ON THAT AS WELL.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GOT IT. I THINK, IF MY COLLEAGUES ARE
21 COMFORTABLE WITH MAYBE A THREE MONTH REPORT BACK. AND IF I
22 COULD ALIGN THAT WITH, ALSO, JUST AN UPDATE ON CLIPPER,
23 OVERALL. IS THAT ALL RIGHT WITH MY COLLEAGUES? BECAUSE THAT
24 MIGHT BE A BETTER WAY TO UNDERSTAND THAT?

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** FINE WITH US TOO.

2

3 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. IT WAS ACTUALLY
4 GO TO THE FREEZER, GET A BOX, AND GOOD TO GO. THAT'S AN OLD
5 COMMERCIAL. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE
6 THE THREE MONTH REPORT BACK TO THE AUTOMATIC ENROLLMENT ALONG
7 WITH THE OVERALL OF WHERE WE ARE WITH CLIPPER AND TECHNOLOGY
8 AND CONTRACTUAL RELATIONSHIP THERE. CAN A GET A MOTION?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** MOTION.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** KIMBERLY WAS THAT CLEAR TO YOU?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

12

13 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** YES RONEN IS ABSENT. THAO?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

22 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE

25 THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION AND STAFF, AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR ALL THAT



JUNE 14, 2023

1 DATA. ALL RIGHT. SO WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON NOW TO ITEM 3B.
2 THIS IS RESOLUTION 4570, 4 FAVOR 71, 4572, AND 4573. I THINK
3 YOU WANT TO KEEP US ON OUR TOES. TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT
4 ACT, TRANSPORTATION ASSISTANCE -- REGIONAL -- THAT'S A MOM
5 MOVE. SORRY TO DO THAT. REGIONAL MEASURE TWO, AND A.B. 1107
6 ALLOCATION ENTRY: THERESA I'M GOING TO YOU ON THIS ONE.

7

8 **THERESA ROMMELL:** BEFORE LOUIS BEGINS HIS PRESENTATION ON THIS
9 ITEM WE FELT IT MIGHT BE APPROPRIATE GIVEN THE INDEPENDENTLY
10 YOU'RE ABOUT TO HEAR ABOUT IS ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATIONS
11 FUNDING. WE FELT IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE TO PROVIDE A BRIEF
12 UPDATE ON THE STATE BUDGET AS THAT RELATES TO THE MUCH NEEDED
13 ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. THIS WILL BE A
14 BRIEF UPDATE IN OUR LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS SECTION
15 WILL BE SENDING OUT A MORE FORMAL UPDATE ON THE STATE BUDGET
16 TO THE COMMONLY COMMISSION HOPEFULLY LATER TODAY. BUT IN
17 SHORT, A FEW DAYS AGO THE LEGISLATURE ANNOUNCED ITS BUDGET
18 AGREEMENT BETWEEN ASSEMBLY AND SENATE RELATED TO TRANSIT
19 FUNDING. IT STILL HAS TO RECEIVE OFFICIAL SUPPORT OF GOVERNOR
20 NEWSOM, BUT THE SENATE ASSEMBLY AGREEMENT RELATED TO TRANSIT
21 FUNDING INCLUDES THE RESTORATION OF \$4 BILLION COMMITMENT OVER
22 TWO YEARS FOR THE TRANSIT AND INNER CITY RAIL CAPITAL FUNDING
23 THAT HAD BEEN PAIRED BACK IN THE GOVERNOR'S MAY REVISE. THOSE
24 FUNDS WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED REGIONS BY POPULATION BY OUR
25 UNDERSTANDING WITH OPTION TO FLEX THESE FUNDS TOWARDS TRANSIT



JUNE 14, 2023

1 OPERATIONS NEEDED. BAY AREA SHARE OF THIS IS FOUR TOTAL IS
2 ESTIMATED TO BE ABOUT \$800 MILLION AS A REMINDER THE
3 COMMISSION TOOK ACTION LAST YEAR TO DESIGNATE THE SPECIFIC
4 USES FOR THESE FUNDS THROUGH OUR MAJOR PROJECT INVOLVEMENT
5 POLICY WHICH WE PLAN TO BRING FORWARD TO THIS COMMITTEE IN
6 JULY. IN ADDITION TO THE RESTORATION OF TIRCP FUNDING THE
7 AGREEMENT PROPOSE \$1.17 BILLION IN FLEXIBILITY FUNDING BE MADE
8 AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT OPERATION EXPENSES OR CAPITAL EXPENSES
9 ASSOCIATED WITH THE TRANSITION TO 0-EMISSIONS. LEGISLATIVE
10 STAFF INVOLVED IN THE NEGOTIATIONS THE BAY AREA SHARE OF THESE
11 FUNDS WILL BE DISTRIBUTED BY FORMULA TO MTC HOWEVER THE
12 FORMULA TO CALCULATE THE REGION'S SHARE HAS YET TO BE
13 DETERMINED IF THE BAY AREA WERE TO RECEIVE ITS TRADITIONAL
14 FORMULA SHARE OF STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE WE WOULD RECEIVE 37%
15 OR \$425 MILLION WHICH WE ESTIMATE TO BE SUFFICIENT TO COVER
16 TRANSIT OPERATOR SHORTFALLS OVER THE NEXT TWO FISCAL YEARS
17 WOULD NOT BE ENOUGH TO COVER SHORTFALLS THE FOLLOWING YEAR
18 DEFICITS ARE EXPECTED TO REACH \$700 MILLION. THE \$1.17 BILLION
19 THAT IS PROPOSED TO BE AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AS
20 WELL AS 0-EMISSIONS RELATED CAPITAL EXPENDITURES IS MOSTLY
21 REDIRECTION OF FUNDING ALREADY ANTICIPATED FOR TO SUPPORT 0-
22 EMISSIONS TRANSIT. WE'RE AWARE OF TRADEOFFS IN OUR REGION AND
23 WILL BE WORKING WITH AGENCIES TO HELP MITIGATE THOSE TRADEOFFS
24 AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE RECEIVE SUPPORT OF THE GOVERNOR IN
25 ADDITION KEY PROVISIONS ARE TO BE IN PRESENT INCLUDING FULL



JUNE 14, 2023

1 SOURCES OF FUNDING AS WELL AS PROVISIONS REGARDING HOW FUNDS
2 WILL BE DISTRIBUTED. IN THE SUMMARY AS NOW EXPECTED TO CHANGE.
3 NEGOTIATIONS ARE EXPECTED TO OCCUR OVER THE NEXT TWO WEEKS ON
4 THE BUDGET AS WELL AS PROVISIONS THAT WILL BE INCLUDED ON
5 TRAILER BILLS SUCH AS FUNDING FORMULAS IN DISTRIBUTION. SOME
6 TRAILER BILLS ARE EXPECTED TO BE NEGOTIATED AND APPROVED BY
7 JULY 1ST BUT IT'S POSSIBLE THAT SOME ASPECTS OF THE TRANSIT
8 FUNDING DEAL WON'T BE RESOLVED UNTIL MUCH LATER. REBECCA AND
9 HER TEAM WILL BE SENDING DETAILED SUMMARIES OUT TO THE FULL
10 COMMISSION LATER TODAY. HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS. WITH THAT
11 I'LL ASK LOUIS ON TO GIVE HIS PRESENTATION.

12

13 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE LOUIS GIVE HIS
14 PRESENTATION. BUT I WANT TO MAKE A QUICK COMMENT THAT THE MTC
15 STAFF HAS BEEN PHENOMENAL IN ADVOCATING FOR THE AGENCY IF OUR
16 REGION. AND IN CASE I FORGET TO SAY THANK YOU LATER, WOW. NO
17 JOKE. I DON'T THINK ANY OF THEM HAVE SLEPT. LOUIS, YOUR TURN.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING THERESE. AND THANK YOU FOR THE
20 INTRODUCTION. LOUIS, MTC FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF TO
21 PRESENT THIS ITEM. THE ITEM PROPOSES ALLOCATION OF FOUR
22 DIFFERENT TYPES OF FUNDS TO FIVE DIFFERENT OPERATORS PLUS MTC
23 FOR A TOTAL OF \$482 MILLION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2024. THESE FUNDS
24 WILL SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE
25 REGION. AS THE 4.4 BILLION IN FEDERAL RECEIVE FUNDS RECEIVED



JUNE 14, 2023

1 BY BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE EXHAUSTED IN COMING YEARS,
2 MTC IS WORKING CLOSELY WITH OPERATORS TO DEVELOP CONSISTENT
3 AND RELIABLE ASSUMPTIONS TO PROJECT NEAR-TERM NEEDS. THERE
4 WILL BE AN UPDATE ON THESE OPERATING SHORTFALLS IN THE JULY
5 COMMITTEE MEETINGS.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING FIRST SEE IF THERE
8 ARE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC, EITHER IN WRITING, ONLINE,
9 OR IN THE BOARDROOM?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
12 WRITING AND I SEE NO PROBLEM OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS
13 RAISED VIRTUALLY. AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM IN THE
14 BOARDROOM.

15

16 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GOING TO COLLEAGUES FOR COMMENTS OR
17 QUESTIONS. GINA?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** GREAT NEWS FROM THE STATE LEVEL. HOPEFULLY THE
20 GOVERNOR WILL BE SIGNING ON THERE. I WANT TO NOTE, AS WE
21 PROGRESS ALONG THESE LINES, IF THERE IS ANY RELOCATION OR
22 REALLOCATION, WE ARE VERY INTERESTED IN HOW THAT IS PROCESSED.
23 SO, IF WE COULD REALLY -- NOTHING IS ASSUMED, BUT WE WOULD
24 REALLY LIKE TO BE INFORMED. THANK YOU.

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? IF NOT,
2 I WANT TO SAY A VERY SINCERE THANK YOU TO STAFF. THEY HAVE
3 REALLY BEEN AMAZING. I THINK ONE QUESTION THAT I -- MAYBE I
4 DON'T NEED ANSWERED HERE, BUT I HAVE TALKED TO FOLKS WHO ARE
5 CONCERNED ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS OF CHANGES RELATIVE TO
6 RESOURCES THEY THINK THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE IN HAND OR
7 RESOURCES THEY WERE PLANNING ON. I KNOW YOU'RE HAVING
8 CONVERSATIONS WITH ALL OF THOSE AGENCIES. WHAT DO YOU THINK IS
9 THE BEST WAY TO INFORM THE BOARD IF THERE IS ANY ADVOCACY THAT
10 THEY NEED TO DO WITH THEIR LOCAL DELEGATIONS TO CLEAN UP
11 PIECES WHERE MAYBE THERE COULD BE CONFLICTS THAT COULD BE
12 IRONED OUT?

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK REBECCA LONG IS IN THE AUDIENCE. I
15 DON'T THINK SHE HAS ANYTHING TO ADD TO THAT. THERE ARE CERTAIN
16 THINGS THAT ARE GOING HAPPEN IN THE NEXT TWO WEEKS. I DON'T
17 KNOW IF YOU'RE SPEAKING TO THAT VERSUS ONCE THE BUDGET DEAL IS
18 DONE. I THINK THIS BODY WILL HAVE, CERTAINLY, A LOT OF ACTIONS
19 AHEAD OF YOU AS IT RELATES TO VARIOUS FUND SOURCES AND AS IT
20 RELATES TO MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE ADDRESSING THE TRANSIT
21 OPERATING NEEDS BUT ALSO ADDRESSING, SORT OF, THE CAPITAL
22 PROJECTS AND KEEPING THOSE MOVING AND MAKING SURE THAT THEY
23 STAY FULLY FUNDED.

24



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH, AND LET ME BE VERY SPECIFIC ABOUT
2 WHAT I MEAN. I APOLOGIZE I DIDN'T MEAN TO BE EUPHEMISTIC ABOUT
3 IT. BUT I THINK THERE MAY BE SOME UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES --
4 OR INTENDED CONSEQUENCES THAT WE'RE GOING TO MAKE SURE THE
5 BOARD IS INFORMED B BUT ALSO THAT REGIONAL AGENCIES IF THEY
6 START TO ADVOCATE THEY'RE DOING IT WITH YOU AND NOT KIND OF
7 SIDEWAYS OF YOU. AND ANY PHONE CALLS WE'RE GOING TO GET WE'RE
8 GOING TO GET TO YOU. ONE RECOMMENDATION I WOULD LIKE TO MY
9 COLLEAGUES IS THOSE CONCERNS GO RIGHT TO MTC STAFF AS QUICKLY
10 AS POSSIBLE SO WE CAN MAKE SURE LOCAL AGENCIES ARE TALKING TO
11 YOU ALL. THAT'S THE 50 THING WANT TO MAKE SURE OF. I DON'T
12 KNOW IF THERE IS ANY OTHER ADVICE?

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'LL LET REBECCA FINISH. BUT THERE IS STILL A
15 LOT OF STUFF IN PLAY WHILE IT'S GOOD NEWS IT'S GOOD NEWS WITH
16 A LOT OF STRING THAT WE DON'T QUITE UNDERSTAND SO WE
17 ANTICIPATED QUITE A LOT OF CONVERSATION IN THE COMING WEEKS TO
18 MAKE EVERYONE UNDERSTAND WHAT TRADEOFFS WE'RE GOING TO DECIDE
19 TO TAKE. IT'S GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE.

20

21 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GOT IT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. REBECCA LONG, MTC
24 STAFF. WE'RE GOING TO BE IN CLOSE DELEGATION COMMUNICATION
25 WITH OUR BAY AREA DELEGATION LEGISLATIVE STAFF FOLKS IN THE



JUNE 14, 2023

1 ADMINISTRATION TO REALLY UNDERSTAND THE KEY FINE PRINT, IT'S
2 NEGOTIATE OVER THE NEXT TWO WEEKS. SO THE BUDGET BILL IS GOING
3 TO BE VOTED ON TOMORROW, IT'S GOING TO BE FINALIZED BEFORE
4 JULY 1ST. IN THAT WORK THERE MAY BE OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE FUNDS
5 AROUND WE KNOW THE TOP LINE NUMBER HAS BEEN AGREED TO BY THE
6 ASSEMBLY AND SENATE BUT HOW YOU FILL UP THE TANK THERE MAY BE
7 OPPORTUNITIES TO MITIGATE THOSE NEGATIVE SIDE EFFECTS.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO IF OUR AGENCIES HAVE CONCERNS WE NEED
10 THEM TALKING TO YOU RIGHT AWAY.

11

12 **REBECCA LONG:** ABSOLUTELY.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND THAT YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE THE BOARD
15 IS AWARE SO YOU CAN SEND US INFORMATION THAT WE CAN ACT WITH
16 OUR LOCAL DELEGATION?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** IS THAT ACCURATE? WANT TO MAKE SURE.

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** YES.

23

24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL RIGHT. ITEM 3B SEEING NO OTHER
25 COMMENTS I WOULD LIKE TO GET A MOTION FOR APPROVAL.



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

5

6 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. MOTION AND SECONDS. ROLL CALL
7 VOTE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY FLEMING, SECOND BY GLOVER. CHAIR
10 CHAVEZ?

11

12 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

23

24 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

2

3 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. THAO?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
14 PRESENT.

15

16 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** EXCELLENT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM
17 3C, MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBERS 4583-4586, 4591-4595 ALLOCATION OF
18 271.6 MILLION IN REGIONAL MEASURE THREE CAPITAL FUNDS TO STA,
19 BAIFA, CTA, TAM, AND NVTA. CRAIG YOU'RE GOING TO WALK US
20 THROUGH THIS ITEM? THANK YOU.

21

22 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. CRAIG BOSMAN, MTC
23 STAFF. THIS ITEM RECOMMENDS THE FIRST SET OF CAPITAL FUNDING
24 ALLOCATIONS FOR REGIONAL MEASURE 3. NINE ALLOCATIONS ARE
25 RECOMMENDED TOTALING APPROXIMATELY 272 MILLION. LAST MONTH THE



JUNE 14, 2023

1 COMMISSION DIRECTED STAFF TO BEGIN COLLECTING ALLOCATION
2 REQUESTS STARTING WITH PROJECTS THAT HAVE RECEIVED LETTERS OF
3 NO PREJUDICE OR LON POWERS. I'LL BRIEFLY RUN THROUGH PROJECTS
4 RECOMMENDED WHICH HAVE ALL -- SO THE FIRST TRANCHE HAS
5 RECOMMENDED AS REQUESTED ALLOCATION AMOUNTS EQUAL TO THEIR
6 LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE. FIRST SOLANO TRANSPORTATION
7 AUTHORITY, \$70 MILLION FOR CONSTRUCTION ON THE I80 EXPRESS
8 LANES IN SOLANO COUNTY, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHOR OF MARIN
9 \$88 MILLION FOR RIDE IN CONSTRUCTION ON U.S. 101, MARIN SONOMA
10 NARROWS PROJECT NAPA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY 20
11 MILLION FOR CONSTRUCTION ON THE VINES AT MAINTENANCE FACILITY
12 WHICH IS UNDER THE NORTH BAY TRANSIT ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS
13 PROGRAM AND ALSO 20 MILLION FOR A CONSTRUCTION ON THE STATE
14 ROUTE 29 IMPROVEMENTS AT [INDISCERNIBLE] JUNCTION AND FINALLY
15 CONTRA COSTA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. \$13 MILLION FOR
16 CONSTRUCTION AT MCCALLUM BEACH 13 MILLION FOR CONSTRUCTION ON
17 THE COLONY BICYCLE PEDESTRIAN OVER CROSSING AT STATE ROUTE 4
18 WHICH IS UNDER THE EAST CONTRA COSTA COUNTY TRANSIT INTERMODAL
19 CENTER PROGRAM. WE HAVE TWO PROGRAMS, REQUESTING ALLOCATION,
20 LONP SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY \$1.9 MILLION FOR RIGHT OF
21 WAY AGAINST THE I80, I680 SR [INDISCERNIBLE] INTERCHANGE
22 PACKAGE NUMBER 2 AND BAIFA \$14.6 MILLION AGAINST THE LONP
23 TOWARDS CONSTRUCTION ON THE TOLL SYSTEMS COMPONENTS OF I80
24 EXPRESS LANES OF SOLONO COUNTY. THESE TWO PROJECTS ARE RELATED
25 AND AS ADDITIONAL COORDINATION REMAINING LONP AMOUNTS. FINALLY



JUNE 14, 2023

1 TWO PROJECT SPONSORS HAVE REQUESTED ALLOCATION COVERING LONP
2 PLUS ADDITIONAL AMOUNT. SOLONO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AGAIN
3 FOR I80 WESTBOUND TRUCK SCALES WITH ALLOCATION TOTALING \$30.7
4 MILLION FOR DESIGN RIGHT OF WAY INCLUSIVE OF \$5.3 MILLION FOR
5 THE LONP DESIGN SCOPE AND CONTRA COSTA TRANSPORTATION
6 AUTHORITY FOR THE I680 INTERCHANGE. WHICH IS ALLOCATION
7 TOTALING \$13 MILLION FOR DESIGN AND RIGHT OF WAY INCLUSIVE OF
8 8 MILLION LONP DESIGN SCOPE. STAFF RECOMMENDATION REFER MTC
9 RESOLUTIONS 4383 THROUGH 4586 AND 4591 THROUGH 4595 TO THE
10 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WE ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO THIS
11 COMMITTEE WITH FURTHER ALLOCATION RECOMMENDATIONS. THANK YOU
12 AND I AND OTHER RM3 PROGRAM STAFF ARE AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY
13 QUESTIONS.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE IS
16 ANY PUBLIC WHO WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
20 ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC
23 HEARING AND GO TO MY COLLEAGUE. NICK?

24



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I COULDN'T HELP BUT NOTICE AS DID
2 OTHERS WHO CONTACTED ME THAT 90% OF THIS FUNDING IS GOING TO
3 HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS. INCREASED VMT AND GREENHOUSE GAS
4 EMISSIONS. I KNOW THOSE ARE OBVIOUSLY IN THE RNM THREE
5 EXPENDITURE PLAN AND WE'RE GOING TO FUNDS THEM. RIGHT OUT OF
6 THE GATE HELP ME UNDERSTAND WHY THE FIRST DISTRIBUTION OF
7 FUNDS SUGGEST GOING TO PROJECTS THAT ARE, SORT OF, GOING TO
8 EXACERBATE MANY OF OUR REGION'S PROBLEMS. EVEN THOUGH IT WILL
9 SOLVE SOME OTHERS.

10

11 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** I CAN TAKE A STAB AT THAT. COMMISSIONER WE SHOT
12 AT THAT. WE ISSUED QUITE A LOT OF LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE.
13 THIS IS A SUBSET OF THOSE. THEY TEND TO BE COUNTY
14 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES A LOT OF THEM HAD LOCAL SALES TAX
15 FUNDS THAT THEY WERE ABLE TO PUT UP AT RISK AGAINST THE
16 RM3LRNP THEY WERE ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROJECT IN
17 ADVANCE OF THE ALLOCATION. SORT OF WAY LONPS ARE INTENDED TO
18 WORK THIS IS A SUBSETS OF THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, WE EXPECT THE
19 EXPENDITURE PLAN TO ROUND OUT AND, SORT OF, PROPORTIONAL TO
20 THE BREAK DOWN OF TRANSIT HIGHWAYS AND SO FORTH.

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** COMMISSIONERS CAN I ADD TO THAT? I THINK
23 ANOTHER THING TO MENTION THAT'S IMPORTANT, ALIX BOCKELMAN,
24 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. TWO OF THE PROJECTS -- I THINK A
25 LOT OF THESE PROJECTS ALSO RECEIVE PRETTY BIG STATE AWARDS AS



JUNE 14, 2023

1 YOU WILL RECALL. TWO OF THEM RECEIVED SB1 AWARDS AND, IN FACT,
2 THIS COMMISSION TOOK AN ACTION TO ACTUALLY ADVANCE ONE --
3 SORRY -- OBAG FUNDS FOR THOSE PROJECTS TO KEEP THEM MOVING.
4 SO, IN TASK, SOME OF THESE LONPS ARE ACTUALLY RETURNING MONEY
5 INTO THE OBAG PROGRAM, WHICH I THINK IS REALLY GOOD NEWS THAT
6 WE'RE ABLE TO DELIVER THESE IMPROVEMENTS THAT RECEIVED STATE
7 AWARDS, BUT ALSO WERE ABLE TO REPLENISH OUR ONE BAY AREA GRANT
8 PROGRAM WHICH DOES A LOT OF GOOD, ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, A LOT
9 OF IMPROVEMENTS IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. JUST WANT TO
10 NOTE THAT.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE EXPLANATION I HOPE WE FIND
13 WAYS TO SUPPORT OUR PARTNER AGENCIES AND BRINGING FORWARD
14 THEIR TRANSIT PROJECTS AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE AND NOT JUST
15 FIND WAYS TO BUILD ALL THE HIGHWAYS AND THEN KIND OF WE'LL
16 DEAL WITH THE TRANSIT LATER. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND WHEN WILL YOU BE BACK WITH
19 THE OVERALL PROGRAM? YOU STATED THAT A MINUTE AGO. DO YOU
20 MIND?

21

22 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** WITH OUR RECOMMENDED ITEM NEXT MONTH WE'LL
23 DEFINITELY INCLUDE AN OVERALL LOOK AT THE PROGRAM AND WE'LL
24 INCLUDE THAT SEQUENTIAL EVERY MONTH GOING FORWARD. THAT JUST
25 SHOWS, YOU KNOW, THE PROGRAM AMOUNTS AND ALLOCATIONS.



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK THE POINT YOU RAISED NICK IS
3 IMPORTANT, AND WE'RE ALSO DEALING WITH PROJECT READINESS. SO
4 THIS MAY BE OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO REMIND OTHERS AROUND THE BAY
5 THAT HAVE -- THAT ARE EXPECTED TO GET REVENUE FOR THIS TO
6 MOVE. I KNOW FOR EXAMPLE, WE I HAVE LIGHT RAIL PROJECT IN OUR
7 AREA THAT WILL BE RECEIVING RM3 MONEY AND OBVIOUSLY WE'RE
8 HAVING TROUBLE WITH THE FAA TO GET SOME OF THE LAND WE NEED
9 AND IT'S SLOWING US DOWN. I APPRECIATE SOME OF OUR PROJECTS
10 ALSO HAVE A LEVEL OF COMPLEXITY THAT HIGHWAY PROJECTS DO NOT.
11 SO APPRECIATE THAT. ALL RIGHT. ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THIS
12 ITEM? SEEING NONE. MAY I GET A MOTION TO FORWARD STAFF'S
13 RECOMMENDATION TO THE FULL BOARD?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GOVERNOR MOVES APPROVAL.

16

17 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** FLEMING SECONDS.

20

21 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE HAVE A MOTION AND
22 SECOND. I'LL ASK FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH A MOTION BY GLOVER. SECOND BY
25 FLEMING. CHAIR CHAVEZ?



JUNE 14, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER IN.

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. THAO?

25



JUNE 14, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** AYE .

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
4 PRESENT .

5

6 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU COLLEAGUES WE'RE MOVING TO ITEM
7 FOUR WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT. THE IF THERE IS ANYBODY FROM THE
8 PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN ITEM THAT'S WITHIN THE
9 PURVIEW OF THIS COMMITTEE BUT NOT ON OUR AGENDA, THIS WOULD BE
10 THE TIME TO DO SO .

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
13 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED REMOTELY AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE
14 PODIUM IN THE BOARDROOM .

15

16 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. CLOSING PUBLIC HEARING. MOVING
17 TO ITEM FIVE WE'RE ADJOURNING TO OUR NEXT MEETING WEDNESDAY
18 JULY 12TH. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING YOU ALL HERE BRIGHT
19 EYES AND BUSHY-TAILED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]

20



NTT

Broadcasting Government