

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 24, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, MAY 24TH, 2023, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE I'M CALLING TO
6 ORDER THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, MY NAME IS
7 ALFREDO PEDROZA, ALONG WITH OUR VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ.
8 I'M GOING TO CONFIRM WE HAVE QUORUM. QUORUM IS PRESENT. I WILL
9 NOTE FIRST TIME WE'RE DOING THIS WE HAVE TWO REQUESTS UNDER
10 FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BEFORE WE DO THAT WE'LL CALL ROLL FIRST
13 THEN YOU WILL INVOKE THAT.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ? IS ABSENT. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.

9 FLEMING? GIACOPINI IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT.

10 MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS IS ABSENT. NOACK IS

15 ABSENT. PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

18 IS ABSENT. SPERING?

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO? IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT, MR.

23 CHAIR.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. I WILL NOTE
2 COMMISSIONER RABBITT NOTED HE IS EN ROUTE AND WILL BE RUNNING
3 LATE. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH THE NEW
4 PROCEDURES. WE DO HAVE TO REQUEST FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION
5 UNDER A.B. 2449. I'M GOING TO ASK COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

6

7 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. MY APOLOGIES. MY VOICE IS
8 SHOT. MISS WARD DID SEND ME THE LANGUAGE WHICH I DON'T HAVE
9 BEFORE ME DUE TO TECHNICAL ERROR UNDER 2449 I'M REQUESTING TO
10 BE PRESENT REMOTELY DUE TO ILLNESS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** CYNTHIA SEGAL GENERAL COUNSEL, COULD YOU STATE
13 WHETHER THERE ARE INDIVIDUALS 18 YEARS OR OLDER WITH YOU IN
14 THE ROOM AT THE TIME?

15

16 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THERE IS NOBODY 18 YEARS OR OLDER IN THE
17 ROOM, I WILL LET THE COMMISSION KNOW.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I THINK THAT'S RAISING MANY QUESTIONS
22 WHY THAT HAS TO BE DISCLOSED BUT THAT'S PART OF A.B. 2449.
23 WE'RE GOING TO ASK COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WHO ALSO HAD A REQUEST.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** IT'S IN THE STATUTE.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SORRY MR. CHAIR I DON'T SEE SHE'S JOINT
3 YET.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO
6 ACCEPT COMMISSIONER FLEMING'S REQUEST AS NOTED AND WE'RE GOING
7 TO BE ADDING COMMISSIONER FLEMING AS PRESENT. IS THAT CORRECT
8 COUNSEL?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S CORRECT.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST TIME FOR EVERYTHING,
13 COMMISSIONER FLEMING THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING UNDER THE
14 CIRCUMSTANCES. APPRECIATE IT. COMMISSIONERS AT THIS POINT
15 WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH THE BALANCE OF OUR AGENDA. ITEM
16 ONE WE HAVE DONE ROLL CALL. IF WE COULD ALL JOIN COMMISSIONER
17 RONEN IN THE PLEDGE? [LAUGHTER] [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I
18 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
19 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
20 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN. THAT
23 CONFIRMS YOUR PRESENCE. ITEM THREE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING
2 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
3 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
4 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
5 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
6 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. AND LET THE RECORD
7 REFLECT THAT COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS HAS JOINED US.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WELCOME
10 COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS. NEXT ITEM CHAIR'S REPORT
11 COMMITTEE NOMINATIONS WERE ANNOUNCED AND ASSIGNMENTS
12 APPOINTED, REPLACING COMMISSIONER PAPAN I HAD A CONVERSATION
13 WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN APPRECIATE YOUR UNDERSTANDING FOR
14 COMMISSIONER MILE TOW SERVE ON THE MEGA REGION. THERE IS
15 ADDITIONAL CHANGES. I WOULD LIKE TO POINT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF
16 AS A NON-VOTING MEMBER TO THE WEDNESDAY COMMITTEES WITH THE
17 INCLUSION OF THE BAHFA WAS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND HOUSING
18 COMMITTEE CURRENTLY MEETS ON THURSDAY BUT WILL BE MEETING ON
19 WEDNESDAY IN JULY. REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
20 CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER RABBITT WE APPRECIATE YOUR SERVICE IN
21 JULY WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS INVITES TO THE AC TRANSIT PRESIDENT
22 BART PRESIDENT COUNCIL SECRETARY DESIGNATE AS THE
23 REPRESENTATIVE TO SERVE AS EX OFFICIO MEMBER ON THE REGIONAL
24 NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE FOR THE DURATION OF COMMITTEE
25 TERMS. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:**

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER IS ABSENT. EXCUSE ME.

9 COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
2 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I WILL NOTE COMMISSIONERS I HAVE SENT
5 COMMISSIONERS AN E-MAIL TALKING ABOUT ATTENDANCE AND I
6 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF MEETINGS LATELY. WE'RE
7 TRYING TO SYNCHRONIZE CALENDARS AS MUCH AS WE CAN, AND ALSO
8 ACKNOWLEDGE THIS CAN BE ANOTHER FULL-TIME JOB IN ITSELF. BUT I
9 APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S COMMITMENT TO TRY TO ATTEND IN-PERSON.
10 THERE IS SO MUCH ON OUR WORK PLATE THAT WHILE WE DO NEED TO
11 FACILITATE ZOOM BEING ABLE TO HAVE THESE RELATIONSHIPS, TALK
12 ABOUT REGIONAL ISSUES, COMING IN-PERSON IS CRITICAL TO THE
13 WORK AT HAND. I ACKNOWLEDGE CHALLENGES WE FACE BACK AT HOME
14 BUT JUST KNOW IT IS APPRECIATED IF THERE ARE ANY CHALLENGES I
15 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT COMMISSIONERS KNOW THEY CAN REACH OUT
16 AND WE'LL TRY TO ACCOMMODATE AS MUCH AS WE CAN BUT WE
17 APPRECIATE ATTENDANCE IN-PERSON AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. WE HAD TO
18 CANCEL SOME MEETINGS FIRST TIME IN MTC HISTORY NOT PART OF THE
19 HISTORY BOOKS WE WANT TO BE PART OF BUT STAFF DOES A LOT TO
20 TRY TO FACILITATE THESE MEETINGS WE'LL CONTINUE TO LOOK AT
21 AGENDAS TO STREAMLINE MEETINGS TO MAKE THEM SHORTER YET
22 PRODUCTIVE. MY COMMITMENT ON THAT, AS WELL. MOVING TO ITEM
23 FIVE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. RANDI, TAKE IT AWAY.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO START OUR
2 COUNCIL REPORT WITH A REPORT FROM OUR SUBCOMMITTEES. IF THE
3 CLERK COULD UNMUTE ADINA LEVIN, PLEASE? ADINA WILL BE GIVING A
4 REPORT HER SUBCOMMITTEE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ADINA IS UNMUTED.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** DO YOU WANT ME TO START OR YOU START AND I'LL
11 PICK UP?

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN:** PLEASE.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE MET
16 AND DISCUSSED THE TRANSITION TO THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
17 COMMITTEE AND HOW WE'LL BE INCLUDING WORKING WITH THE EXTERNAL
18 STAKEHOLDERS ON THAT COMMITTEE AS WELL AND ARE LOOKING FORWARD
19 TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE TAKING THE NEXT STEP THIS
20 YEAR. WE, ALSO TALKED ABOUT CLIPPER START AND.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ADINA, WE LOST YOU.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN:** ADINA, ARE YOU STILL THERE?

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WOULD YOU LIKE TO JUMP IN RANDI, WHILE
2 WE TRY TO GET ADINA BACK?

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN:** YEAH. I WILL GO AHEAD AND GO ON WITH THE REST OF
5 THE REPORT. THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE TRIED TO MEET
6 LAST MONTH. THEY COULD NOT CALL TOGETHER A MEETING BECAUSE OF
7 A -- THERE WAS A QUORUM ISSUE. THEY WILL BE MEETING AGAIN ON
8 FRIDAY AT WHICH POINT THEY WILL BE NOMINATING CHAIRS AND VICE
9 CHAIRS. SO, I WILL BE CHAIRING THE EQUITY ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
10 FOR THE NEXT TWO MONTHS WHILE THEY GET A CHAIR AND A VICE
11 CHAIR. THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL DID MEET AND ELECTED A VICE
12 CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE YOU TO WELCOME PAM CAMPOS TO THE MIX OF
13 CHAIRS AND VICE CHAIRS THAT WE WILL HAVE. PAM WILL BE MY VICE
14 CHAIR FOR THE DURATION OF THIS TERM. THE POLICY ADVISORY
15 COUNCIL ALSO HEARD MTC'S DRAFT 2023 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN.
16 A LOT OF CONVERSATION ON THAT, AND A LOT OF INPUT FROM MEMBERS
17 OF OUR BODY THE ONE THING THAT WAS TELLING ABOUT THIS, IS IT'S
18 OBVIOUS THAT WE HAVE NEW PEOPLE, THAT THIS WAS NOT AN UPDATE -
19 - IT WAS NOT A NEW THING, THAT IT WAS AN UPDATE. BUT THE
20 CONVERSATION WAS GREAT. THE SECOND ITEM WE HAD ON OUR AGENDA
21 WAS THE PUBLIC OPINION POLL RESEARCH FINDINGS WHICH WERE
22 RATHER DISMAYING FOR ALL OF US REGARDING ANY POTENTIAL SUPPORT
23 FOR BALLOT INITIATIVES. I HOPE WE CAN MAKE THOSE NUMBERS COME
24 BACK UP BECAUSE OUR BODY STRONGLY FEELS THAT WE ARE IN NEED OF
25 GOVERNING OURSELVES BY RAISING OUR OWN MONEY FOR OUR



MAY 24, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS IN THE BAY AREA. ALONG WITH THAT, THE
2 STAFF HAS CONDUCTED A SURVEY TO FIGURE OUT WHICH DAY OUR
3 SUBCOMMITTEES AND OUR COUNCIL WILL BE MEETING, SO THAT WE CAN
4 BUNDLE OUR MEETINGS TOGETHER. WE HAVE LANDED ON FRIDAYS, WHICH
5 IS GOING TO BE INTERESTING, BECAUSE I HAVE ALREADY HEARD FROM
6 SEVERAL PEOPLE THAT FRIDAYS WILL BE A NO GO POWER THEM. SO I
7 EXPECT TO LOSE A FEW MEMBERS THAT WAY. STAFF HAS ALSO SENT OUT
8 A MEMO BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN HAVING TROUBLE GETTING COMPLIANCE
9 WITH THE BROWN ACT AND RESOLUTION 3931 REVISED ON ATTENDANCE,
10 REMINDING PEOPLE OF THEIR ATTENDANCE REQUIREMENTS IN-PERSON,
11 AND THEY'LL BE COMPILING A LIST OF ATTENDANCE RECORDS AND I
12 HOPE THAT BETWEEN NOW AND NEXT MONTH SOMETIME, WE CAN FIND
13 TIME TO CARVE OUT WITH MY, WITH STAFF, MY VICE CHAIR, AND THE
14 CHAIR AND THE VICE CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION, TIME TO GO OVER
15 THAT REPORT. BECAUSE WE'RE HAVING REALLY BIG ISSUES. THAT ENDS
16 MY REPORT.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU RANDI FOR YOUR REPORT.
19 COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? I DON'T SEE ANY. DO WE HAVE ANY
20 PUBLIC COMMENT?

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO RIGHT-HAND SIDE HANDS FROM
23 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
24 FOR THIS ITEM.

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU, RANDI, FOR YOUR REPORT.
2 PROCEEDING TO ITEM SEVEN, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE
3 ANY COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONER -- COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** REALLY QUICK IF WE COULD SEND A MESSAGE TO
6 SACRAMENTO THE DIFFICULTIES OF THE BROWN ACT BECAUSE SEVERAL
7 LEGISLATORS ARE TRYING TO MAKE ACCOMMODATIONS TO HELP AND I
8 KNOW IF THEY GET MESSAGES THAT COMMITTEES ARE BEING CANCELED
9 PEOPLE ARE DROPPING OFF THAT WOULD HELP.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE'RE GOING TO BE SPENDING MORE TIME
12 IN SACRAMENTO FOR THE THIS REASON. CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS 8A
13 THROUGH EIGHT K COMMISSIONERS ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THE
14 CONSENT CALENDAR?

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL MOVE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IS THERE A SECOND?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CONSENT
23 CALENDAR.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY CANEPA SECOND BY -- ROLL CALL
5 VOTE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SORRY. I MEANT TO TELL YOU, COMMISSIONER
20 CHAVEZ HAS JOINED US AND SHE'LL NEED TO READ HER STATEMENT.

21 I'M GOING TO FINISH WITH ROLL CALL AND IF WE COULD DO THAT?

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT.

9 MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT? IS ABSENT. RONEN?

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
5 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. AND I WILL NOTE WE MISSED
6 ITEM SIX ON THE AGENDA, MR. CHAIR

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE'LL GO BACK TO THAT. I DID MISS THAT
9 NOT INTENTIONAL, TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. WE NEED TO GO TO
10 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ TO READ HER STATEMENT.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I APOLOGIZE -- THANK YOU. AND COLLEAGUES, I VERY
13 MUCH APOLOGIZE FOR NOT BEING WITH YOU TODAY I'M JOINING
14 BECAUSE I'M NOT FEELING VERY WELL, SO I CHOSE TO PARTICIPATE
15 REMOTELY. KIMBERLY, I APOLOGIZE THAT I DIDN'T RECEIVE THE
16 STATEMENT.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I WILL VEND IT TO YOU. BASICALLY YOU'RE
19 GOING TO STATE THAT YOU ARE INVOKING A.B. 2449 BECAUSE YOU ARE
20 ILL, AND YOU WILL STATE WHETHER OR NOT THERE IS SOMEONE 18 OR
21 OLDER IN THE ROOM.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I AM INVOKING 2449 AND THERE IS NOBODY WITH ME
24 AT ALL.

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT'S 2449. AND COMMISSIONER, CHAVEZ,
2 WE'RE ALL WONDERING WHY THAT DISCLOSURE HAS TO BE MADE. THANK
3 YOU FOR JOINING US. COMMISSIONERS, WE HAVE HEARD FROM
4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ; HER REQUEST IS NOTED, AND SHE WILL BE
5 PARTICIPATING BECAUSE WE DO HAVE QUORUM IN-PERSON WE'RE GOING
6 TO JUMP BACK TO AGENDA ITEM SIX, I APOLOGIZE TO THE EXECUTIVE
7 DIRECTOR, WE HAVE BEEN SPENDING SO MUCH TIME TOGETHER ANDY.
8 TAKE IT AWAY.

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA AND MEMBERS OF THE
11 COMMISSION. GOOD MORNING. I'LL TAKE THE ADVICE AND BE BRIEF.
12 WE'RE TREADING WATER WE HAVE FOUR NEW PEOPLE COMING IN THE
13 BUILDING A COUPLE IN FINANCE AND COUPLE IN OPERATIONS BUT
14 WE'RE ALSO SEEING FOUR LONG TIME EMPLOYEES LEAVE THE BUILDING
15 AND I DID WANT TO MENTION ABOUT THE FOUR THAT ARE LEAVING. WE
16 ALL, SORT OF, CAME OVER ABOUT THE SAME TIME. AND SO WE HAVE
17 MADE SURE TO INCLUDE THEIR PUBLIC SERVICE AT CALTRANS IN THE
18 NOTICE. SO, THIS ALL HAPPENED WHEN A.B. 144 GAVE THE BAY AREA
19 TOLL AUTHORITY A LOT MORE RESPONSIBILITY IN THE TOLL BRIDGE
20 SEISMIC PROGRAM AND FUNDING OF THAT. IT'S OUR FIRST EFFORT
21 INTO STAFF CONSOLIDATION, ABOUT 20 EMPLOYEES CAME OVER FROM
22 CALTRANS AND SUCCESSFULLY BECAME PART OF OUR FAMILY AND
23 CONTINUE TO WORK FOR A COUPLE OF DECADES HERE. SO WE WANTED TO
24 SAY GOODBYE TO THEM. MOVING TO KEY UPDATES THIS BUILDING HAS
25 HOSTED QUITE A LOT OF ACTIVITY IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS, JUST TO



MAY 24, 2023

1 MENTION A COUPLE OF THEM, SECRETARY TOKES OMOSHAKIN FROM THE
2 STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY WAS HERE FOR A TRANSIT LISTENING
3 SESSION INCLUDED ALL THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA OPERATORS AS WELL
4 AS THE ONES IN THE BAY AREA HE BROUGHT HIS ENTIRE EXEC STAFF
5 AND SOME FROM CALTRANS HEADQUARTERS. CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION
6 HAD A TWO DAY WORKSHOP AND MEETING IN THE BUILDING I'LL
7 MENTION THE PARTICULARS THEY APPROVED FOR US NEXT. WE HAD THE
8 OWNER'S NIGHT BY THE CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION THAT
9 BROUGHT IN A BUNCH OF OUR PUBLIC WORKS OWNERS LIKE BART,
10 CALTRANS, VTA REALLY FROM ALL OVER THE REGION AND HAD A NICE
11 SHOWING WITH THAT ASSOCIATION. WE ALSO HAD AN EVENT SPONSORED
12 BY THE WOMEN'S TRANSPORTATION SEMINAR WHERE THEY HOSTED THE
13 CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IN THE BUILDING AND
14 YESTERDAY WE HAD A NICE WARM CELEBRATION OF LIFE FOR JAY OUR
15 EMPLOYEE WHO PASSED AWAY A LITTLE WHILE AGO IN. WE HAD THE
16 HONOR OF HAVING THERESE MCMILLAN BACK IN THE BUILDING IT WAS
17 REALLY NICE. THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION APPROVED
18 OUR APPLICATION TO PROVIDE TOLLING ON STATE ROUTE 37 I WANT TO
19 THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR COMMENTS AT THE PUBLIC MEETING
20 AND ALSO COMMISSIONER DINA EL-TAWANSY FOR HAVING MY BACK
21 THROUGH A LONG PROCESS BUT IT WAS SUCCESSFUL IN THE END WE'RE
22 GOING TO SEE A LOT MORE ABOUT STATE ROUTE 37 IN FRONT OF THIS
23 COMMISSION OVER TIME. I DID MENTION THE LISTENING SESSION IT'S
24 HELPFUL FOR THE SECRETARY TO HEAR FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS. IT
25 CLEARLY IS A STATEWIDE PROBLEM THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS,



MAY 24, 2023

1 AND HE COMMITTED TO GOING BACK TO SACRAMENTO AND HELPING US,
2 ALTHOUGH WE'RE STRUGGLING TO SEE WHAT THAT HELP IS GOING TO BE
3 AT THIS POINT. THE WTS EVENT DID, ALSO, GIVE THERESE MCMILLAN
4 THE 2023 MAYOR PETERS INSPIRATIONAL LEADER AWARD. SO THAT WAS
5 NICE TO SEE. AND THEN, FINALLY, JUST A MENTION THAT WE WERE UP
6 IN SACRAMENTO LED BY CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA, AND VICE CHAIR
7 NICK JOSEFOWITZ IN SACRAMENTO TRYING TO BEAT THE BUSHES ON
8 GETTING SOME REALLY SOME FINANCIAL HELP FROM SACRAMENTO. WE
9 HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO IN ORDER TO BE SUCCESSFUL OF THE SO
10 MORE WILL BE COMING IN THAT WAY, I AM SURE. AND THAT'S MY
11 REPORT. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU DIRECTOR PREMIER. AND I'LL
14 SAY A SPECIAL THANKS TO STAFF. THIS FISCAL CLIFF IT'S A HUGE
15 PRIORITY TO OUR REGION AND THE RIDERS. AND MTC HAS BEEN
16 PUTTING IN A LOT OF TIME TO GET THIS RIGHT TO THE STAFF BOTH
17 OF YOU IN PARTICULAR I KNOW WITH REBECCA WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE
18 TEAM AND WE HAVE SPENT A LOT OF TIME TRYING TO DO THE RIGHT
19 THING FOR THE REGION AND THIS IS GOING TO BE A PARTNERSHIP AND
20 I WANT THE PUBLIC TO KNOW THAT WE'RE TRYING TO WORK WITH
21 PARTNERS TO GET THIS RIGHT.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ARE WE GOING TO THE PROPOSAL?

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THE STATE BUDGET THERE'S REPORT UNDER
2 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO WE WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO
5 VOICE OUR FRUSTRATION.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** I WANT TO THANK YOU CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR FOR
10 ALL THE TREMENDOUS WORK YOU'RE DOING. THIS IS SO IMPORTANT TO
11 ALL OF US, AND I KNOW YOU HAVE FULL-TIME JOBS. SO, THANK YOU
12 FOR BEING OUR VOICE IN SACRAMENTO AND FIGHTING SO HARD FOR US.
13 REALLY APPRECIATE YOU BOTH.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN. AND
16 WHILE I KNOW WE HAVE THE HONOR OF BEING CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR,
17 THERE ARE MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS DOING THEIR PART MAKING CALLS
18 TO TRY TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CONTINUE ON THIS INITIATIVE TO
19 MOVE TRANSIT FORWARD FOR EVERYONE NO MATTER WHAT COUNTY YOU
20 ARE PART OF. THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONER RONEN. ALL
21 RIGHT. SO, ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS FOR OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? I
22 DO NOT SEE ANY. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
25 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO JUMP BACK
3 OVER TO AGENDA ITEM NINE, COMMITTEE REPORTS. FIRST UP IS
4 COMMISSIONER PAPAN CHAIR OF THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. TAKE
5 IT AWAY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. OUR LAST COMMITTEE MEETING
8 MET ON MAY 10TH, 2023 AND REFERS TO THE FOLLOWING TO THE
9 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AGENDA ITEM 9A MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS
10 3989 REVISED AND 4578, TRANSIT ORIENTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING
11 FUND REPROGRAMMING. I ASK -- DO YOU NEED TO READ THE -- I
12 WILL. REPROGRAMMING, \$10 MILLION OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED
13 AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDS, AS FOLLOWS: FIRST, 5 MILLION TO
14 CONTINUE TO FUND THE TRANSIT ORIENTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING
15 PROGRAM WITH MINOR PROGRAM REVISIONS. PART TWO: 5 MILLION TO
16 BE GRANTED TO THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. I MOVE
17 APPROVAL MTC RESOLUTIONS 3989 AND REVISED 4578.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. DO WE
20 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN SECOND BY
2 RONEN. ROLL CALL VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** UPON ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT.

12 MILEY?

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

17

18 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER RONEN?

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO? MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
8 MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** MOVING ON AGENDA 9B MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4581
11 AND 4582 APPROVES MEMORANDUMS OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN MTC AND
12 THE COMMITTEE FOR STAFF REPRESENTATION CONFIDENTIAL SPECIFIC
13 EXECUTIVE EMPLOYEES ADOPTION OF SALARY SCHEDULE FOR FINANCIAL
14 YEAR 2023, 2024 EFFECTIVE JULY 1, 2023 THROUGH AND INCLUDING
15 JUNE 30TH, 2027. ADOPTION OF THE SALARY SCHEDULE FOR FISCAL
16 YEAR 2023 THROUGH 2024. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MIRRORS RESOLUTIONS
17 4581 AND 4582.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. DO WE
20 HAVE A SECOND? COMMISSIONER RONEN AGAIN. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT
21 COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS? COMMENTS? KIMBERLY, PUBLIC COMMENT
22 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
25 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PERFECT. ALL RIGHT. LET'S -- FIRST BY
3 PAPAN SECOND RONEN. ROLL CALL VOTE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANN?

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT.

13 MILEY?

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

18

19 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
13 PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PROCEED TO ITEM TEN PROGRAMMING AND
16 ALLOCATIONS CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER
17 CHAVEZ DO YOU WISH TO GIVE YOUR REPORT?

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I DO. THANK YOU. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
20 MET ON MAY 10TH AND REFERRED SEVEN ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR
21 APPROVAL, SIX OF WHICH WERE ON CONSENT TODAY. BUT THE -- BUT
22 FOR BOARD ITEM 10A MTC RESOLUTION 4404 REVISED 4579 AND 4580
23 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE POLICY AND PROCEDURE REVISIONS RM3
24 POLICIES AND PROCEDURES TO INTRODUCE GUIDANCE FOR THE RM3
25 OPERATING PROGRAM AND REVISED GUIDANCE FOR THE CAPITAL PROGRAM



MAY 24, 2023

1 ALLOCATION OF THE 2022, 2023 RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM FUNDS. I
2 WOULD LIKE TO ASK MY COLLEAGUES TO SUPPORT THIS. THE COMMITTEE
3 WAS SUPPORTIVE. I WANT TO MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTIONS
4 440, REVISED 4579 AND 4580.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** APPROVED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. I'LL
7 LOOK FOR A SECOND.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I HEARD COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, BUT I
12 SAW COMMISSIONER RONEN. SHE'S BATTING A THOUSAND. FIRST BY
13 CHAVEZ, SECOND BY RONEN. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC
14 COMMENT WITH THIS ITEM?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT LET'S PROCEED
20 WITH THE ROLL CALL VOTE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES UPON ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

8

9 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT.

3 COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

4

5 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

8

9 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

24 PRESENT.

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. PROCEEDING TO
2 ITEM 11 JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION
3 COMMITTEE CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER CANEPA. TAKE IT AWAY.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION
6 COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE COMMITTEE WAS
7 SCHEDULED TO MEET MAY 12TH, 2023 HOWEVER DUE TO UNFORESEEN
8 CIRCUMSTANCES THE MEETING WAS CANCELED FOUR ITEMS FOR
9 CONSIDERATION TWO OF WHICH WERE ON CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY AND
10 FOLLOWING TWO ITEMS I'LL TURN TO THE CHAIR TO GUIDE US
11 THROUGH.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I BELIEVE THE FIRST ONE IS 11 A. OKAY.
14 THIS IS ASSEMBLY BILL 17 PACHECO BROWN ACT. I BELIEVE WE'RE
15 GOING TO HAVE A BRIEF PRESENTATION.

16

17 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** HI EVERYONE. GOOD MORNING. GANN
18 DOHRMANN, MTC STAFF. SO AB 817 IS A BROWN ACT BILL THIS YEAR
19 HAS BEEN, SORT OF, VIEWED AS A COMPROMISED PIECE OF
20 LEGISLATION THAT IS THE MOST POLITICALLY VIABLE. DOING
21 ANYTHING IN SACRAMENTO RELATED TO BROWN ACT REFORM IS
22 INCREDIBLY CHALLENGING. THERE WERE SEVERAL LEGISLATIVE
23 PROPOSALS THAT COULD EXTEND REMOTE MEETINGS FOR BOARDS
24 COMMISSIONERS AND ADVISORY BOARDS ET CETERA THAT WOULD
25 ESSENTIALLY EXTEND WHAT WAS ALLOWED DURING THE STATE



MAY 24, 2023

1 EMERGENCIES TO EXTEND PAST STATE EMERGENCIES AND YOU KNOW
2 UNFORTUNATELY THOSE PIECE OF LEGISLATION HAVE JUST NOT BEEN
3 ABLE TO SECURE THE VOTES REALLY TO MOVE THROUGH ANY COMMITTEE,
4 SORT OF, THE WATER AND PARKS ASSOCIATIONS AND REALLY THE RURAL
5 COUNTIES SO FOLKS THAT ARE FROM KNOW AROUND THE STATE THAT ARE
6 REALLY REPRESENTING VAST MAJORITY OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS HAVE
7 COLEAD BEHIND THIS COMPROMISED PROPOSAL WHICH IS REFLECTED IN
8 8817 WHICH WOULD ALLOW FOR THOSE PUBLIC BODIES THAT DO NOT
9 MAKE FINAL DECISIONS TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE TO MEET REMOTELY,
10 AND THE COMPROMISE PIECE OF THIS IS THAT IT ALLOWS FOR, SORT
11 OF, EASIER ACCESS AND MORE PARTICIPATION FOR BODIES, AS
12 THEY'RE DISCUSSING ITEMS THAT THEY'RE PLANNING ON SENDING TO A
13 BOARD THAT MAKES A FINAL DECISION, BUT IT STILL RETAINS THE
14 TRANSPARENCY AND PUBLIC ACCESSIBILITY ELEMENT THAT IS REALLY
15 IMPORTANT TO FOLKS UP IN SACRAMENTO. AND I WOULD SAY REALLY
16 IMPORTANT HERE AS WELL. SO IF THE BOARD IS GOING TO MAKE A
17 FINAL DECISION THAT THOSE BOARDS ALL NEED TO MEET IN-PERSON OR
18 FOLLOW THE EXISTING BROWN ACT TELECONFERENCE LAWS WHICH SAY
19 THAT YOU NEED TO BE POSTING YOUR MEETING LOCATION EVEN IF IT'S
20 AT YOUR HOME AND IT NEEDS TO BE PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE. THAT'S
21 WHAT THIS BILL WOULD DO. SOMETHING THAT'S PRESIDENT ET UNIQUE
22 ABOUT WHY WE'RE BRINGING IT TO YOU RIGHT NOW, THE BILL HAS
23 ACTUALLY BEEN HELD IN A COMMITTEE SO IT HAS BECOME A TWO-YEAR
24 BILL. WE TYPICALLY AT MTC DO NOT BRING YOU TWO YEAR BILLS TO
25 TAKE POSITIONS ON. THE REASON WHY IS THAT NORMALLY IF



MAY 24, 2023

1 SOMETHING BECOMES A TWO-YEAR BILL IT MEANS THAT MORE
2 NEGOTIATION ON LANGUAGE IS GOING TO BE NEEDED BEFORE IT MOVES
3 FORWARD. AND IN THIS CASE, THE IDEA WITH WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
4 CLOSELY WITH THE SPONSORS THE IDEA IS NOT NECESSARILY TO
5 CHANGE THE LANGUAGE IT'S TO DO MORE ADVOCACY TO CHANGE THE
6 HEARTS AND MIND UP IN SACRAMENTO AND PROCEED WITH THE SAME
7 PROPOSAL NEXT YEAR. SO WE WOULD LIKE THE COMMITTEE'S -- THE
8 COMMISSION'S APPROVAL FOR US TO SUPPORT THIS BILL SO WE CAN,
9 SORT OF, REALLY GEAR UP ON THAT ADVOCACY.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU GEORGIA FOR THAT
12 UPDATE. COMMISSIONERS ANY QUESTIONS? I DON'T SEE ANY. KIMBERLY
13 DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON 11 A?

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO RIGHT-HAND SIDE HANDS FROM
16 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
17 FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONERS DO
20 WE HAVE A MOTION FOR APPROVAL?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MOVE IT.

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** SECOND.

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY SPERING SECOND BY CANEPA.

2 ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE FLEMING?

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER'S INTENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

6

7 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?

18

19 **HILARY RONEN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
5 PRESENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NEXT UP 11B FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024
8 STATE BUDGET. REBECCA LONG WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM AND OUR VICE
9 CHAIR IS READY WITH QUESTIONS.

10

11 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS REBECCA LONG
12 LEGISLATION STAFF YOU JOINED STAFF ON MONDAY IN THE LOBBY THE
13 LEGISLATURE ON TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF AND IT WAS A DIFFICULT DAY
14 WE HAVE BEEN HAMMERING AWAY AMBITIOUSLY IN COORDINATION WITH
15 STATEWIDE PARTNERS, THERE IS A LOT OF RETICENCE TO ADDRESS
16 THIS. THE SENATE SUBCOMMITTEE THAT HANDLES TRANSPORTATION TOOK
17 ACTION TO OPPOSE THE GOVERNOR'S CUTS TO THE TRANSIT INTERCITY
18 RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM WHICH IS POSITIVE AND CERTAINLY WE
19 SUPPORT RESTORATION OF THAT PROGRAM HOWEVER THERE IS NO
20 ADDITIONAL FUNDING PROPOSED BY THE SENATE OR THE
21 ADMINISTRATION YET TO ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATIONS SO WE ARE
22 ENCOURAGED BUT NOTED IN SOME OF YOUR MATERIALS THAT BOTH THE
23 MAY REVISE AND THE SENATE BUDGET PLAN ACKNOWLEDGE THE
24 IMPORTANCE OF THIS TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALL AND ACKNOWLEDGE
25 WANTING TO WORK WITH THE OTHER PARTIES TO ADDRESS IT SO THERE



MAY 24, 2023

1 IS STRONG AWARENESS AMONG THE LEADERSHIP, BUDGET COMMITTEES
2 AND GENERAL LEADERSHIP THIS IS AN URGENT CONCERN BUT WE HAVE
3 YET TO SEE HOW THEY PLAN TO ADDRESS IT. IT'S LIVE RIGHT NOW
4 AND THERE IS A LOT OF CONVERSATIONS HAPPENING WITH BOTH
5 ASSEMBLY AND SENATE. TOMORROW THE ASSEMBLY WILL BE TAKING
6 ACTION AND YOU KNOW WE HAVE STILL SEVERAL WEEKS BEFORE JUNE
7 15TH, AND I THINK THERE IS LIKELY TO BE SOME THINGS THAT ARE
8 DONE IN PUBLIC, IN FORMAL COMMITTEES, LIKE YESTERDAY WHERE IT
9 LOOKED LIKE THE SENATE WASN'T DOING ANYTHING, AND YET
10 CONVERSATIONS ARE STILL ONGOING. SO WE WILL CONTINUE TO KEEP
11 YOU APPRISED. IN OTHER BUDGET RELATED NEWS, YOU HAVE AN ITEM
12 IN YOUR PACKET THAT JUST SUMMARIZES THE MAY REVISE ON HOUSING
13 NO FURTHER CUTS WERE PROPOSED BEYOND WHAT WAS IN THE BUDGET IN
14 JANUARY. THERE WERE A COUPLE OF CHANGES PROPOSED BY THE
15 ADMINISTRATION THAT AFFECT SOME OF OUR PROPOSED SOLUTION FOR
16 THE FISCAL CLIFF. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, THE GOVERNOR PROPOSES TO
17 PUT MY CAP-AND-TRADE REVENUE TOWARDS ZERO EMISSION VEHICLES
18 RATHER THAN TRANSIT OPERATIONS, BRINGING THE TOTAL CAP-AND-
19 TRADE PROPOSAL FOR ZERO EMISSION VEHICLES TO 1.4 BILLION. WE
20 HAVE BEEN ASKING FOR JUST 500 MILLION TO ADDRESS TRANSIT
21 OPERATIONS. AND THEN THE GOVERNOR ALSO PROPOSES TO SHIFT SOME
22 FEDERAL HIGHWAY FUNDS TO BACKFILL OTHER GENERAL FUND NEEDS AND
23 THAT WAS ANOTHER PROGRAM THAT WE WERE HOPING TO TAP INTO TO
24 ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SO WE HAVE A WAYS TO GO, BUT AGAIN
25 VERY LIVE CONVERSATIONS AND JUST WANT TO THANK THE



MAY 24, 2023

1 COMMISSION'S LEADERSHIP AND ALL THE COMMISSIONERS THAT WERE
2 ABLE TO JOIN US ON MONDAY. AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
3 QUESTIONS.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, REBECCA. VICE CHAIR
6 JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANTED TO THANK OUR STAFF AND
9 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS FOR ALL OF THIS, ALL OF THE WORK THAT'S
10 BEEN GOING ON HERE. I KNOW THIS IS A, SORT OF -- NIGHTS AND A
11 FULL-TIME EFFORT AND, SORT OF, ALL HANDS ON DECK ESPECIALLY
12 GIVEN WHAT WE LEARNED ON MONDAY BOTH FROM CONVERSATIONS AND
13 THE STATE SENATE PROPOSAL WHICH WOULD REALLY DO VIRTUALLY
14 NOTHING TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT OUR OPERATORS ARE
15 FACING, ESPECIALLY AS SFMTA, BART, AC TRANSIT AND OTHERS. AND
16 SOME OF YOU MAY HAVE SEEN THAT IS. FMTA DIRECTOR JEFFREY
17 TUMLIN SAID THAT IF WE CAN'T ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF HE'S
18 GOING TO START, SORT OF, PUTTING IN PLACE A PLAN THAT WOULD
19 CUT ONE BUS LINE A MONTH FOR THE NEXT 20 MONTHS IN SAN
20 FRANCISCO OF THE BART HAS INDICATED THAT THEY MAY NOT BE ABLE
21 TO RUN LATE EVENING EARLY MORNING WEEKEND SERVICE IF THESE
22 CUTS COME INTO PLACE. AND I THINK WE WERE ALL VERY HOPEFUL
23 THAT THE STATE LEGISLATURE AND GOVERNOR WOULD DO WHAT THEY
24 TOLD US THEY WOULD DO WHICH IS THEY TOLD US THEY WOULD BE VERY
25 -- THEY CARED A LOT ABOUT TRANSIT, THEY KNOW THAT IT'S



MAY 24, 2023

1 ESSENTIAL TO THE STATE, AND THAT THEY WOULDN'T LET IT DIE, AND
2 UNFORTUNATELY, THE PROPOSAL THAT HAS COME OUT DOESN'T DO THAT
3 AT ALL, IT LET'S TRANSIT DIE AND IT'S LEAVING -- IT'S GOING TO
4 LEAVE HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE IN OUR REGION AND EVEN
5 MORE AROUND THE STATE WAITING AT BUS STOPS OR BUSES THAT ARE
6 NEVER GOING TO COME WAITING AT BART STATIONS FOR TRANSIT THAT
7 ARE NEVER GOING TO COME. I THINK THERE IS -- I THINK THAT
8 SINCE MONDAY THERE HAS BEEN A, WITH THIS REALIZATION, HAS COME
9 A NEW URGENCY FOR US ALL TO KIND OF STEP UP AND MAKE SURE THAT
10 THE LEGISLATURE AND GOVERNOR UNDERSTANDS THAT THIS IS
11 ABSOLUTELY NOT ACCEPTABLE. AND THAT EVEN KNOW THERE ARE MANY
12 PRIORITIES THAT THEY HAVE IN SACRAMENTO THAT THIS CAN'T BE ONE
13 THAT YOU JUST FALLS TO THE BOTTOM OF THE BARREL. AND IF THERE
14 IS -- THE FUTURE OF THE BAY AREA, AND THE FUTURE OF THIS
15 REGION IS A PLACE WHICH IS GOING TO ALLOW EVERYBODY TO THRIVE,
16 IS JUST INTIMATELY LINKED WITH THE ABILITY FOR STUDENTS WHO
17 ARE NOT OLD ENOUGH TO DRIVE, FOR SENIORS, FOR LOW-INCOME
18 PEOPLE WHO CAN'T AFFORD A CAR, TO ACTUALLY BE ABLE TO GET TO
19 SCHOOL, TO GET TO THE HOSPITAL, TO GET TO JOBS AND THAT'S WHAT
20 TRANSIT DOES. SO, IS I AM DEEPLY DISAPPOINTED AT THE STATUS
21 QUO, AND I KNOW WE'RE ALL GOING TO COME TOGETHER AND MAKE SURE
22 WE DO EVERYTHING WE CAN OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS TO MAKE SURE
23 THAT THE CURRENT PROPOSAL IS NOT THE FINAL PROPOSAL.
24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, SPERING
2 AND COMMISSIONER RONEN.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. I AGREE,
5 COMPLETELY, WITH THE PASSION HERE. AND I DO THINK THE
6 LEGISLATURE WANTS TO DO THE RIGHT THING. THE GOVERNOR WANTS TO
7 DO THE RIGHT THING, AND I THINK THEY'RE LOOKING TO US, TOO, TO
8 ACTUALLY ENSURE THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE BETTER THAN EVER
9 BEFORE, THE CUSTOMERS ARE PUT FORWARD HERE. AND IF WE CAN HELP
10 IN THAT PROCESS AND MAKE SURE THERE IS ACCOUNTABILITY, AND
11 THAT THERE -- FUNDING IS SPECIFICALLY FOCUSED -- FORGET THE
12 CLIFF, COMPLETELY, BUT ENSURING THEY'RE BETTER THAN EVER, I'M
13 SURE IS GOING TO SEND A MESSAGE OUT AND MTC REALLY NEEDS TO
14 SHOW A LEADERSHIP ROLE IN THAT ASPECT AND THAT WILL HELP THE
15 LEGISLATURE REALLY GET THE FUNDING THEY NEED. IT'S SO
16 IMPORTANT, AND I THINK WE HAVE HEARD THAT MULTIPLE TIMES FROM
17 LEGISLATORS THROUGHOUT THE REGION. THEY HAVE TO BE BETTER.
18 THEY -- I KNOW THEY WANT TO BE BETTER, SO MANY OF THEM. SO
19 LET'S PUT IT ALL UP THERE IN THE RIGHT MANNER SO THAT WE CAN
20 ALL BE VERY PROUD OF SAVING THIS, BECAUSE WE ABSOLUTELY NEED
21 TO DO THAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

24



MAY 24, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH. I THINK THE VICE CHAIR SUMMED IT UP
2 QUITE WELL. YOU KNOW, WHEN WE WERE HAVING OUR MEETINGS IN
3 SACRAMENTO, IT WAS VERY DISAPPOINTING WHAT WE'RE HEARING FROM
4 BOTH LEGISLATORS AND ALL OF THE AGENCIES. THE ONE THING,
5 THOUGH, I JUST WANT TO ASK THAT WE DON'T OVERLOOK -- AND I WAS
6 LOOKING AT MY NOTES OF ALL THE MEETINGS THAT WE HAD -- AND
7 EVERY SINGLE AGENCY AND EVERY ELECTED OFFICIAL, LEGISLATOR
8 THAT WE TALKED WITH TALKED ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY AND
9 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING SAID HE WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME LANGUAGE
10 THAT THEY CAN PUT IN THEIR BILL. I THINK WE HAVE TO -- WE HAVE
11 GOT THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE BLUE RIBBON AND WE REALLY NEED
12 TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS OPPORTUNITY. YOU KNOW? IF WE'RE
13 SERIOUS ABOUT THOSE CHANGES, AND I'M NOT QUITE SURE, YOU KNOW,
14 WHERE THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE GOING TO BE ON SOME OF THIS --
15 THEY HAVE A CRISIS OF THEIR OWN. BUT I THINK WE NEED TO DECIDE
16 WHAT ARE THOSE ACCOUNTABILITY ISSUES THAT WE WANT THAT WE NEED
17 TO SEE IN WRITING AND GIVE THE LEGISLATOR OPPORTUNITY TO
18 INTRODUCE IT. SO THAT PIECE, I DON'T WANT TO SEE US SQUANDER
19 THAT OPPORTUNITY. I REALLY THINK THEY'RE GIVING US AN
20 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY BRING THOSE ISSUES THAT WE THINK ARE
21 REALLY IMPORTANT, AND THAT CHANGES THAT LINE -- ESPECIALLY ON
22 THE NETWORK MANAGER, YOU GUYS ALL KNOW THE LIST. I THINK WE
23 HAVE TO LEVERAGE THAT. AND THE OTHER THING I JUST WANT TO SAY,
24 I WAS REALLY DISAPPOINTED, AND I THINK TO THE VICE CHAIR'S
25 COMMENTS, HOW DISCONNECTED MANY OF THE LEGISLATORS ARE FROM



MAY 24, 2023

1 THE REALITY OF THE PROBLEM THAT WE'RE FACING, AND IF MUNI,
2 BART, ANY OF THEM START TO FAIL, THAT'S A CRISIS FOR
3 CALIFORNIA, NOT JUST THE BAY AREA. I MEAN, AND IT'S ANOTHER
4 REFLECTION ON THE DYSFUNCTION THAT WE HAVE. AND, SO, I DON'T
5 KNOW WHAT WE CAN DO TO GET LEGISLATORS TO UNDERSTAND THE
6 MAGNITUDE. BUT -- AND THE LAST THING I DO WANT TO SAY IS WE,
7 MTC IS PLAYING A REAL CRITICAL ROLE HERE. AND I HAD MENTIONED
8 THIS AT ONE OF OUR PREVIOUS MEETINGS, THESE ARE GOING TO BE
9 SOME DO YOU HAVE AND IMPORTANT DECISIONS THAT WE HAVE TO MAKE.
10 WE HAVE TO STAND UP AND CLARIFY WHAT WE CAN DO AND WHAT OUR
11 EXPECTATION IS FROM THE STATE. SO WE KNOW WHO HAS FAILED THE
12 TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA. AND SO, BUT, STAFF, I REALLY
13 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT, ON THIS ACCOUNTABILITY, THAT WE SHOULD
14 TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THAT TO PROVIDE WHAT WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN
15 LANGUAGE AND WHAT WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE, SORT OF,
16 INSTITUTIONALIZED. THANK YOU, CHAIRMAN.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

19

20 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. I AGREE WITH EVERYTHING THAT'S BEEN
21 SAID. I WANT TO ADD THAT IN ADDITION TO MUNI HAVING TO CUT A
22 LINE A MONTH, ONE WAY THAT MTA IS TRYING TO REMAIN AFLOAT IS
23 BY INCREASING PARKING METERS UNTIL 10:00 P.M. DURING THE WEEK
24 AND ON SUNDAYS. AND THE AMOUNT OF E-MAILS THAT WE HAVE ALL
25 RECEIVED RELATED TO THIS, I HAVE NEVER RECEIVED THIS AMOUNT OF



MAY 24, 2023

1 E-MAILS ON ANY TOPIC OR ANY ISSUE. AND I THINK THAT -- AND
2 IT'S FEBRUARY -- FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS, NOT ONLY TRANSIT
3 AGENCIES, BAY AREA RESIDENTS POCKET BOOKS ARE TIGHT RIGHT NOW
4 AND THE NICKEL AND DIMEING ON ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT ISSUES IS
5 GETTING HARD TO KEEP UP WITH. SO TO PEOPLE'S POCKET BOOK. BUT
6 NUMBER TWO IS THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY, THE SMALL BUSINESS
7 COMMUNITY THAT BARELY SURVIVED THE PANDEMIC, THAT ARE FINALLY
8 STARTING TO GET BACK TO, YOU KNOW, FULL FUNCTIONING AND
9 NORMALITY IS SAYING THIS IS GOING TO CRUSH US, ESPECIALLY
10 RESTAURANTS AND ENTERTAINMENT, THIS IS GOING TO CRUSH THEIR
11 BUSINESS BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE JUST NOT GOING TO COME OUT TO PAY
12 THAT EXTRA \$20 IN PARKING, RISK GETTING A PARTICULATE, ET
13 CETERA. AND SO THE RAMIFICATIONS, THEY'RE JUST -- THEY ARE SO
14 MUCH BROADER THAN JUST THOSE DEPENDENT ON PUBLIC
15 TRANSPORTATION NOT BEING ABLE TO GET TO WORK. THEY'RE GOING TO
16 HIT ALL OF US, EVERYONE, ACROSS INCOME, YOU KNOW, SPHERE,
17 ACROSS THE TYPE OF TRANSPORT THAT YOU USE. AND I THINK THAT WE
18 NEED TO DO A BETTER JOB WITH MESSAGING AND ORGANIZING. AND WE
19 NEED TO -- AND I WISH I HAD DONE THIS, JUST SENT AN FORM E-
20 MAIL BACK TO ALL OF THEM, SAYING E-MAIL, SCOTT WIENER, E-MAIL
21 GAVIN NEWSOM, ABOUT WHAT THIS MEANS FOR TRANSIT. BECAUSE WE --
22 THERE IS NOT A SINGLE PERSON IN THE BAY AREA THAT'S NOT GOING
23 TO BE HEAVILY IMPACTED IF THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES FAIL. AND I
24 COULDN'T AGREE MORE WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING. THEY SEEM TO
25 NOT GET IT. AND THERE SEEMS TO BE THIS BIG DISCONNECT. THIS IS



MAY 24, 2023

1 SO SERIOUS. I HAVEN'T SEEN SOMETHING SO SERIOUS SINCE THE
2 PANDEMIC IN TERMS OF OUR ECONOMY AND OUR ABILITY TO FINALLY
3 RECOVER FROM THE PANDEMIC. SO I THINK WE SHOULD -- I DON'T
4 KNOW IF SOME FORM E-MAILS THAT WE COULD SEND SO THAT WHEN OUR
5 CONSTITUENTS ARE E-MAILING US, WE COULD RESPOND, THAT MIGHT BE
6 HELPFUL, AND, YOU KNOW, IF WE'RE ALL DOING IT FROM OUR
7 DIFFERENT COUNTIES. BUT WE GOT TO GET THE WORD OUT THERE SO
8 PEOPLE UNDERSTAND WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I REALLY WANT TO THANK
13 STAFF FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER, ANDY, REBECCA, AND GEORGIA.
14 IT WASN'T THAT PRODUCTIVE, BUT WE REALLY, SORT OF, UNDERSTOOD
15 WHERE PEOPLE WERE, FROM THE TRANSPORTATION SECRETARY. ONE OF
16 THE THINGS WAS TALKED ABOUT WAS ACCOUNTABILITY. REBECCA, CAN
17 YOU WALK US THROUGH AFTER THAT FEEDBACK WHAT THE PLAN IS
18 MOVING FORWARD AND HOW DOES THAT TIE TO OUR PRIORITIES?

19

20 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. SO, I THINK WE ARE
21 STILL DETERMINING EXACTLY HOW WE WANT TO ADVOCATE ON THIS
22 POINT. THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION, THE STATEWIDE
23 TRANSIT ASSOCIATION HAS PUT FORWARD JUST AT THE END OF LAST
24 WEEK, AN ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK THAT LAYS OUT, YOU KNOW,
25 REPORTING, FIRST AND FOREMOST ON EXACTLY WHAT ARE YOUR



MAY 24, 2023

1 DEFICITS, BEING MORE TRANSPARENT THAN THAT, ONE THING
2 LEGISLATURE HAS BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT, BASELINES AND THAT
3 EVERYONE IS USING SAME ASSUMPTIONS, PROPOSING THAT, AND THAT
4 EVERYBODY TAKE ACTION THAT THEY WANT TO RECEIVE THIS FUNDING,
5 THERE IS THAT PIECE. THEN A REQUIREMENT THAT AGENCY SUBMIT
6 PROPOSALS AS TO WHAT THEY'RE DOING TO IMPROVE THEIR SERVICE.
7 IT'S VERY -- HOW WOULD I PUT IT? THERE IS A LOT OF DISCRETION
8 IN WHAT THE CTA HAS PROPOSED IN TERMS OF WHAT AGENCIES COULD
9 DO, AND WHAT -- WHICH MENU ITEM THEY'RE CHOOSING TO REPORT ON.
10 SO I THINK THERE COULD BE SOME PUSHBACK FROM THE LEGISLATURE
11 THAT IT'S NOT QUITE STRONG ENOUGH. SO, I THINK -- YOU KNOW,
12 WE'LL TAKE DIRECTION FROM YOU, BUT ONE OPTION FOR US TO REVIEW
13 THAT AND POTENTIALLY RECOMMEND SOMETHING STRONGER THAN WHAT'S
14 BEEN PUT ON THE TABLE. WE ARE WANTING TO STAY UNIFIED WITH THE
15 ENTIRE TRANSIT ADVOCACY COMMUNITY, SO, THERE'S CHALLENGES
16 THERE. THE OTHER PIECE TO COMMISSIONER SPERING AND PAPAN'S
17 POINT ABOUT ALL THE WORK WITH THE BLUE RIBBON IS WE COULD
18 RECOMMEND SOMETHING THAT IS BAY AREA SPECIFIC AND WE GOT
19 DIFFERENT MESSAGES ON THAT IN SACRAMENTO. SOME MEMBERS REALLY
20 WANT TO SEE THAT, OTHERS SAID JUST GIVE US A STATEWIDE
21 APPROACH. STAFF IS LOOKING TO THE COMMISSION FOR DIRECTION ON
22 THAT. THE OTHER KEY QUESTION IS, HOW DOES THIS ACCOUNTABILITY
23 APPLY? DOES IT APPLY TO EVERY OPERATOR IN THE BAY AREA, OR
24 EVERY OPERATOR STATEWIDE, OR IS IT ONLY A CONDITION IF YOU GET
25 THE ADDITIONAL MONEY. AND THAT'S SOMETHING THE LEGISLATURE IS



MAY 24, 2023

1 GRAPPLING WITH, IS DO WE WANT TO MANDATE THAT ALL TRANSIT
2 AGENCIES DO BETTER BECAUSE WE ALL WANT TO SEE BETTER TRANSIT
3 SYSTEMS OR IS THIS PART OF THE EXCHANGE FOR FUNDING. HOPEFULLY
4 THAT'S HELPFUL AS TO SOME OF THE CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE'RE
5 MAKING.

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. AND LET ME JUST SAY THIS, SUPERVISOR
8 RONEN BROUGHT UP A GOOD POINT. I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT
9 WOULD BE HELPFUL WOULD BE A LOT MORE STORYTELLING. I THINK WE
10 TALK ABOUT SERVICE CUTS, WE TALK ABOUT THOSE PEOPLE WHO NEED
11 US THE MOST. I THINK OUR LEGISLATIVE DELEGATION REALLY NEEDS
12 TO HEAR THAT. AND I KNOW, YOU KNOW, IT'S REALLY -- NOT REALLY
13 -- IT'S NOT REALLY FOCUSED ON POLICY, BUT I DO THINK WE NEED
14 TO REACH OUT TO DIFFERENT GROUPS AND THE TRANSIT SPACE WHO
15 ADVOCATE FOR RIDERS. THEY'RE A BIG PART OF THIS CONVERSATION.
16 AND THEN, I THINK THEIR INFLUENCE, YOU KNOW, RATHER THAN JUST
17 BEING AN MTC ISSUE, IT'S NOT MTC. I THINK THE CHAIR ALLUDED TO
18 IT EARLIER, IT'S ABOUT PARTNERSHIP, PARTNERS COME FROM VARIOUS
19 PLACES. I DO HOPE -- AND I AM ENCOURAGED. I KNOW IT'S NOT THE
20 BEST, SITUATION, BUT WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE STAFF, INCREDIBLE
21 STAKEHOLDERS. I DO THINK WE'LL FIND A SOLUTION BUT WE NEED
22 PARTNERSHIP FROM ALL THOSE ORGANIZATIONS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CANEPA. AND
25 AGAIN THANK YOU TO MY COLLEAGUES TO ALL SPOKE. REBECCA MY



MAY 24, 2023

1 COMMENTS, I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD IF YOU COULD SUMMARIZE AND
2 PROVIDE TO US SOMETHING AS WE HAVE QUESTIONS OF WHAT WE'RE
3 DOING GENERALLY THAT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE WE CAN HAVE
4 SOMETHING WE CAN RESPOND WITH. AND I'LL SAY THIS, IT'S BEEN
5 CHALLENGING THE PAST FEW DAYS UNDERSTANDING THE SEVERITY OF
6 THE SITUATION. WE KNOW WHEN'S AT RISK STATE LEGISLATORS ARE
7 TRYING TO RUN THE STATE, THERE IS MULTIPLE PRIORITIES ON THEIR
8 PLATE AS WELL. WE CAN'T LOOK BACK WE CAN ONLY LOOK FORWARD.
9 THEY KNOW NOW, WE KNOW NOW, AND WE KNOW WE HAVE TO FIND
10 SOMETHING THAT WORKS FOR ALL OF US. AND I THINK COMMISSIONERS
11 THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO AS COMMISSION LEADERSHIP
12 FINDING WHAT WORKS. THIS IS NOT GOING TO BE AN EASY DECISION
13 NO MATTER WHAT MONEY IS ON THE TABLE BUT WE'RE TRYING TO
14 BALANCE AND CONTINUE MOVING FORWARD, THE FACT RIDERS RIDING
15 TODAY ARE THE TRANSIT EXTENT. LETTING TRANSIT FAIL IS NOT AN
16 OPTION. WE AS COMMISSIONERS AND AS YOUR LEADERSHIP ARE TRYING
17 TO PUT SENSIBLE REASONABLE SOLUTIONS ON THE TABLE. OUR FRIENDS
18 IN THE STATE LEGISLATURE KNOW THAT AS WELL. I THINK THE NEXT
19 COUPLE OF DAYS ARE GOING TO BE KEY. WE'RE TRYING TO DO AS MUCH
20 AS WE CAN BECAUSE WE KNOW THE OUTCOMES THAT WE DON'T WANT AND
21 WE MADE THAT ABUNDANTLY CLEAR TO THE STATE LEGISLATORS THAT IF
22 WE TRY TO FIND TOO MUCH COMPROMISE IT'S NOT GOING TO PRODUCE
23 THE OUTCOMES THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. WE HAVE BEEN CLEAR
24 ON WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS? REBECCA ANY
25 FINAL COMMENTS?



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. I WANT TO SHARE
3 COMMENTS, IN TERMS OF WE HAVE GOT TO GET THE RIDERS AND THE
4 STORYTELLING IS AT THE FOREFRONT OF THE CONVERSATION AND I
5 WANT TO SHARI HAVE NEVER SEEN SUCH A STRONG COALITION ON
6 TRANSPORTATION ISSUES AS WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. OUR COALITION
7 LETTERS, WE HAVE WRITTEN THREE. WE HAVE OVER 100 ORGANIZATIONS
8 AND IT'S NOT JUST THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE CLIMATE ADVOCATES,
9 TRANSIT RIDERS, WE HAVE LABOR, BUSINESS COMMUNITY, HOUSING
10 COMMUNITY, ALL HOUSING KEY PARTNERS IN THE BAY AREA HAVE
11 SIGNED LETTERS IN SUPPORT OF THIS. AND AT THE HEARINGS,
12 INCLUDING YESTERDAY, THERE WAS ABOUT 45 MINUTES OF TESTIMONY
13 FROM REGULAR PEOPLE. A BLIND PERSON TALKED ABOUT HOW TRANSIT
14 IS HIS LIFELINE. PEOPLE TALKED ABOUT HOW THEY HAVE CARS, BUT
15 THEY DON'T LIKE USING THEIR CARS. THEY MUCH PREFER TO TAKE
16 TRANSIT. THEY USE BART EVERY DAY, SO THEY ARE HEARING THESE
17 STORIES FROM REGULAR PEOPLE AND I WANT YOU TO KNOW OUR
18 ADVOCACY IS AMPLIFIED BY PARTNERS OUT THERE SENDING ALERTS,
19 YOUNG PEOPLE AND STUDENTS, THEY'RE NOT JUST HEARING FROM THE
20 AGENCIES AND IT'S REALLY HEARTENING TO KNOW HOW IMPORTANT AND
21 PEOPLE ARE TAKING TIME OUT OF THEIR DAY TO MAKE THAT MESSAGE.
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU REBECCA LONG. KIMBERLY DO WE
25 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE THREE RAISED HANDS. HOW MUCH TIME
3 WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** TWO MINUTES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RANDI KINMAN, UNMUTE YOURSELF. AND I'LL
8 START THE CLOCK.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I'M JUST KIND OF STRUCK BY THE IDEA
11 THAT THIS IS LIKE A JOB PERFORMANCE REVIEW THAT YOU'RE GETTING
12 FROM SACRAMENTO. AND SACRAMENTO IS SAYING YOUR WHOLE DIVISION
13 ISN'T DOING A GOOD JOB, BUT THEY'RE NOT TELLING YOU WHAT THEY
14 WANT TO YOU DO BETTER. I JUST FIND THIS AS SOMEBODY WHO HAS
15 RUN BUSINESSES, THE MOST BIZARRE THING I HAVE EVER HEARD, AND
16 I REALLY APPRECIATE ALL OF THE WORK THAT HAS GONE INTO TRYING
17 TO EXPLAIN TO THE FOLKS IN SACRAMENTO WHAT WE'RE DOING. AND
18 TRYING TO WALK THE PATH OF WORKING AS A GROUP AND AS A UNIT
19 AND STILL TRYING TO DIFFERENTIATE BETWEEN DIFFERENT AGENCIES
20 THAT ARE HAVING DIFFERENT PROBLEMS. BECAUSE WE ALL RUN
21 DIFFERENTLY. AND THE ABSOLUTE REFUSAL OF SACRAMENTO TO
22 UNDERSTAND THAT VTA DOESN'T RUN THE SAME WAY AS BART. IT'S
23 JUST TWO DIFFERENT ANIMALS BUT WE'RE ALL IN ONE PLACE. SO, I
24 DO APPRECIATE -- I THINK I WOULD BE THROWING THINGS AT THIS
25 POINT IF I HAD TO TAKE THESE TRIPS UP THERE TO TRY AND EXPLAIN



MAY 24, 2023

1 THAT. I DO WANT TOUCH BASE ON THE TESTIMONIALS THAT WE MAY OR
2 MAY NOT BE ABLE TO DO, AND I THINK A REALLY EFFECTIVE WAY OF
3 DOING IT IS FILMING AND SENDING LINKS TO PEOPLE OR GETTING IT
4 ON THE AIRWAYS WHERE PEOPLE ARE IN SACRAMENTO DOING THEIR JOB,
5 SO THAT EVERY FEW HOURS THEY'RE SEEING PEOPLE FROM ACROSS THE
6 STATE WHO ARE GOING TO BE HEAVILY, HEAVILY, HEAVILY IMPACTED
7 BY THIS, AND IF WE CAN JOIN FORCES AND DO THAT, I WOULD LOVE
8 TO SEE THAT HAPPEN. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA
11 LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA.
14 BEHIND THE CURTAIN ON THE ADVOCACY SIDE, TO COMMISSIONER
15 RONEN, YES THERE ARE LETTER TOOLS AND CALL TOOLS THAT HAVE A
16 LINK TO LOOK UP YOUR LEGISLATOR WITH TALKING POINTS. HAPPY TO
17 GET THAT TO YOU AND TO ANY COMMISSIONER THAT IS INTERESTED IN
18 DISTRIBUTING TO THAT. THE WAY THAT WE GET THOSE DOZENS AND
19 DOZENS OF COMMENTS IS THAT THERE IS THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE WHO
20 SIGNED A PETITION AND ALL OF THE GROUPS THAT SIGNED THE JOINT
21 LETTER GET ACTION ALERTS WITH THE TESTIMONY OPPORTUNITIES, AND
22 THEN PEOPLE SIGN UP AND THEN SOMEBODY SENDS THEM A TEXT
23 MESSAGE WHEN IT'S TIME TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT. SO THERE ARE
24 ADVOCACY GROUPS THAT ARE WORKING BEHIND THE SCENES TO DO THE
25 INFRASTRUCTURE TO MAKE THAT TESTIMONY AND COMMENT AND FEEDBACK



MAY 24, 2023

1 HAPPEN, AND PLEASE CONTACT ME AND I'LL PROVIDE THOSE TOOLS
2 THAT YOU CAN SHARE. IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING SOURCES, YES, THE
3 LEGISLATORS ARE STARTING TO SAY THAT TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT BUT
4 IF THE SENATE SOLUTION REFLECTING IT. RCP HAPPENS WE WILL
5 EITHER WIND UP WITH KILLING DTX AND KILLING BART TO SILICON
6 VALLEY OR WE WILL HAVE A LIFE-SIZE SET OF STATUS THAT IS OUR
7 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THE BART TO SILICON VALLEY IS
8 GOING TO BE A MUSEUM BECAUSE IT WILL NOT HAVE BART TRAINS
9 RUNNING. AND THAT MESSAGE REALLY NEEDS TO GET THROUGH THAT WE
10 NEED MORE FUNDING SOURCES AND ENOUGH FUNDING TO BE ABLE TO
11 KEEP THE SYSTEM RUNNING, REGROW RIDERSHIP. THANKS SO MUCH TO
12 THE COMMISSIONERS WHO ARE SPEAKING ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY,
13 STRONGER ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES, AND IT NEEDS TO BE REGIONAL
14 NOT JUST AGENCY BY AGENCY. BAY PASS IS THE SHINING STAR AND SO
15 IF WE HAVE SOMETHING THAT IS AGENCY BY AGENCY THAT UNDOES BAY
16 PASS, LIKE, THAT'S AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT WE NEED. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS VINAY
19 PIMPLE. GO AHEAD YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. I'LL LET YOU KNOW WHEN
20 YOU ARE AT 15 SECONDS MR. PIMPLE.

21

22 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
23 COUNCIL. I WANT TO TALK FIRST ABOUT THE WHO ACCOUNTABILITY
24 ISSUE. YOU KNOW, I HAVE HEARD FROM MORE THAN ONE BUS TRANSIT
25 AGENCY MEASURE, BUS TRANSIT AGENCY PEOPLE THAT ON ANY ONE DAY



MAY 24, 2023

1 YOU CAN EXPECT ABOUT 30% OF BUS DRIVERS NOT TO SHOW UP. AND I
2 DON'T SEE ANY OF THOSE THINGS ADDRESSED AT THE MTC MEETINGS.
3 AND SO FOR FOLKS KNOW THAT EVERY PERSON THAT HAS TAKEN TEN
4 DAYS OFF WHILE IN THE YEAR SOMEBODY ELSE IS TAKING 150 DAYS
5 OFF IN THE YEAR. THE OTHER THING IS ABOUT BUS SERVICE HOW MANY
6 BUSES ACTUALLY SHOW UP ON TIME. I USED TO GO TO SAN FRANCISCO
7 A FEW YEARS AGO, BUS EVERY HALF HOUR, THEN ONCE THEY GET THE
8 7:35 BUS, IS REACH THERE AT 7:30 7:35 DIDN'T SHOW UP, 805, 835
9 AND 905 SHOWED UP AT 9:20. OF COURSE, I STOPPED TAKING THE BUS
10 AND STARTED TAKING AN UBER TO THE BART STATION. I TOOK THE L
11 BUS TO THE MTC BUILDING FIRST TIME I TOOK IT, IT WAS FINE,
12 SECOND TYPE I WAITED THERE 45 MINUTES AND IT DIDN'T SHOW UP.
13 IT'S AN HOURLY BUS. AGAIN, I STOPPED TAKING THE BUS. YOU KNOW,
14 IT'S AGAIN, TAKING TO BART AND BART OVER. BY AND LARGE BUSES
15 WHEN YOU NEED TO GET SOMEWHERE ON TIME UNLESS IT RUNS EVERY
16 TEN MINUTES IT'S NOT AN OPTION. PLEASE TAKE ACCOUNTABILITY BE
17 ON BOARD TRY TO GET A REPORT FROM THE OPERATORS AS TO WHAT IS
18 ACTUALLY HAPPENING. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MR. PIMPLE. THERE ARE NO
21 ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU KIMBERLY. THANK
24 YOU FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL COMMENTS. THIS IS A WORK IN PROGRESS.
25 THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES OUR ITEMS UNDER LEG. THANK YOU CHAIR



MAY 24, 2023

1 CANEPA. MOVING TO THE NEXT ITEM 12 A DRAFT MTC OPERATING AND
2 CAPITAL BUDGET EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR PEDROZA, IF YOU DON'T MIND? ANDREW
5 FREMIER, I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN THIS ITEM. WE ARE PRESENTING A
6 SERIES OF DRAFT BUDGETS TODAY THAT REPRESENTS ALL OF THE WORK
7 THAT THE COMMISSION DOES AND ALL THE DIFFERENT PARTS AND
8 PIECES. YOU WILL HAVE ANOTHER BITE AT THE APPLE IN JUNE. FINAL
9 APPROVE IS AT THE JUNE COMMISSION MEETING. I WANT TO THANK
10 DEREK, ALIX, BRAD, AND THE TEAM FOR THE WORK PUT TOGETHER ON
11 THE BUDGETS TO REPRESENT THE CHARGE THAT YOU HAVE ASKED US TO
12 TACKLE AND TAKE ON. THEY ARE A REFLECTION OF YOUR PRIORITIES
13 AND WE TOOK A DEEP LOOK AT HOW TO MEET THOSE COMMITMENTS, THE
14 DRAFT BUDGET IS CONSISTENT WITH MY MESSAGING AT THE WORKSHOP
15 THAT WE HAD IN NAPA IN TERMS OF THE, SORT OF, BOLD GOALS, WE
16 RECOGNIZE IN ORDER TO MEET THE SUPPORT LEVEL NEEDS TO BE AT
17 THE RIGHT LEVEL, AND ON-BOARDING AND SUPPORT AND CONTRACTING
18 AND LEGAL IN ORDER TO KEEP UP WITH ALL OF THE DIFFERENT
19 PROCUREMENTS THAT WE ARE PUTTING ON THE STREET AND WE HAVE
20 QUITE A FEW TECHNICAL PROCUREMENTS, SIGNIFICANT TO THE
21 COMMISSION AND WORK WITH TOLL PLAZAS ELECTRIC TOLLING AND OPEN
22 ROAD TOLLING OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS. WITH THAT I WANT TO TURN
23 IT TO DEREK TO GO THROUGH THE PRESENTATION AND AS A REMINDER
24 YOU'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH MANY BUDGETS THIS MORNING AND WE
25 LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR FEEDBACK.



MAY 24, 2023

1

2 **DEREK HANSEL:** GREAT. THANKS MR. FREMIER, AND IF WE COULD PULL
3 THE FIRSTS OF, AS ANDY SAID, SEVERAL PRESENTATIONS. ALL RIGHT.
4 FIRST AND FOREMOST, I WANT TO ECHO THE THANKS ANDY GAVE. BUT
5 I'LL THANK ALL OF THE FOLKS ACROSS THE AGENCY WHO LED THIS TO
6 BE A PRETTY GOOD PROCESS. YOU ARE SEEING A LOT MORE TODAY THAN
7 YOU WOULD HAVE SEEN THIS TIME LAST YEAR. WE ARE BRINGING BOTH
8 DRAFT AND PROPOSED BUDGETS TO YOU OVER THE NEXT FOUR WEEKS.
9 SO, FIVE WEEKS, I GUESS. SO, I WANT TO THANK, PARTICULARLY, ON
10 MY PART, ARLEICKA CONLEY, OUR DIRECTOR OF BUDGETS, AND HER
11 TEAM. THEY HAVE DONE JUST AN AMAZING AMOUNT OF WORK. THEY
12 APPARENTLY DID TAKE TO HEART MY ADVICE THAT SLEEP IS
13 OVERRATED. IF WE CAN TURN TO THE NEXT PAGE, PLEASE? AS ANDY
14 SAID, WE ARE BRINGING ALL OF THE DRAFT OPERATING AND CAPITAL
15 BUDGETS TO YOU TODAY. SO, IT WILL BE A LONG DAY. THAT'S THE
16 BAD NEWS. THE GOOD NEWS IS, WHEN WE BRING BACK PROPOSED
17 OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGETS ON THE 28th, HOPEFULLY THAT'S A
18 VERY MUCH SHORTER DISCUSSION THERE. WE'LL BE BRINGING BACK
19 CHANGES BASED ON YOUR ADVICE AND THE FEEDBACK TODAY, AS WELL
20 AS, I CAN PROMISE YOU THERE ARE TWEAKS THAT WE WILL STILL BE
21 MAKING OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS BUT THE CHANGES WILL BE
22 RELATIVELY MODEST. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO, ASSUMPTIONS
23 FOR AND, AGAIN, ALL OF THIS IS GOING TO BE MTC RELATED FOR
24 THIS PRESENTATION. THEY'RE REALLY UNCHANGED FROM THE BUDGET
25 WORKSHOP. AS ANDY SAID WE'RE RECOMMENDING ADDITION OF SEVERAL



MAY 24, 2023

1 CRITICAL POSITIONS THAT ADDRESS THOSE SPECIFIC NEEDS,
2 INCLUDING DEVELOPMENT OF SOME ADDITIONAL ORGANIZATIONAL
3 CAPACITY. AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT THOSE POSITIONS IN JUST A
4 MINUTE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE CONCERNS WE FACE ARE THE SAME
5 THAT WE DISCUSSED, AGAIN, A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO. THERE HAS
6 BEEN A LOT OF INFLATION, INTEREST RATES ARE HIGHER, THE
7 REGIONAL BANK FAILURE CRISIS AND CONFIDENCE CONTINUES THOUGH
8 IT SEEMS A LITTLE BIT ABATED WE TALKED ABOUT THE BATA FUNDS
9 OVERHEAD OPERATIONS OF MTC PROPER JUST SOMETHING TO BE
10 CONCERNED ABOUT KEEP AN EYE ON. THEN THE DEBT LIMIT CRISIS
11 COMING UP AT FEDERAL GOVERNMENT LEVEL WHICH IS CONTINUING TO
12 DEMONSTRATE THAT CONGRESS OPERATES IN A VERY RATIONAL WAY, AND
13 THAT'S PROBLEMATIC AND WE NEED TO SEE RESOLUTION OF THAT AND
14 THE CONSEQUENCES OF NON-RESOLUTION OF THAT OR LIKELY VERY BAD
15 BUT UNKNOWN SOMETHING WE ARE KEEPING AN EYE ON. VERY LITTLE WE
16 CAN DO BUT HOPE THAT FUNCTIONALITY RETURNS. NEXT SLIDE,
17 PLEASE. LET'S GET INTO THE BUDGET. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, YOU
18 HAVE IN FRONT OF YOU THE DRAFT BUDGET THAT WE HAVE PUT
19 TOGETHER IN YOUR PACKET. YOU HAVE GOT THE STAFF REPORT, ALONG
20 WITH DETAILED SCHEDULES HERE. PUSH IDENTIFYING KEY POINTS ON
21 THIS, FEDERAL FUNDS GRANT DECREASE IS A FUNCTION OF OUR
22 BUDGETING ONE YEAR OF GRANTS AS OPPOSED TO SHOWING MULTI-YEAR
23 GRANTS AND EXPENDITURES THAT'S REALLY AN ATTEMPT TO BETTER
24 IDENTIFY FOR YOU WHAT'S HAPPENING IN AN ACTUAL PERIOD. WE NOTE
25 STATE AND HOLE FUNDING ARE UP FROM BOTH REAP 2.0 AND FROM



MAY 24, 2023

1 CLIMATE INITIATIVE PROGRAMS AND YOU WILL SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING
2 ON SOME OF THAT FUNDING AS WE TALK ABOUT EXPENSES. ON THE
3 EXPENSE SIDE, SALARIES AND BENEFITS UP A BIT, THAT'S REALLY
4 REFLECTING A FULL YEAR OF POSITIONS THAT WERE ADDED, A FULL
5 YEAR OF BUDGET POSITIONS THAT WERE ADDED, BUDGETED POSITIONS -
6 - EXCUSE ME -- THAT WERE ADDED IN FISCAL '23. SO, YOU WILL
7 REMEMBER THAT WE HEAD ADDED SIGNIFICANT ADDITIONAL POSITIONS
8 AT THE BEGINNING OF FISCAL '23. WE ALSO ADDED SOME IN THE MID-
9 YEAR PROCESS. SO MANY OF THOSE POSITIONS, OBVIOUSLY, FOR
10 FISCAL YEAR '23 WERE NOT FULL YEAR BUDGETED POSITIONS WE'RE
11 NOW BUDGETING THOSE ON A FULL YEAR BASIS. THERE ARE SOME
12 ADDITIONAL POSITIONS THAT DO HIT THE MTC BUDGET PROPER, AS
13 ANDY DISCUSSED, MANY OF THOSE NEW POSITIONS ARE GOING TO OTHER
14 ENTITIES, NOT MTC ENTITIES. SO THOSE, OBVIOUSLY, WOULD NOT HIT
15 THIS BUDGET. AND THEN THE COLA BASED IN THE MOUS THAT YOU JUST
16 APPROVED ARE ALSO IN THERE. SO, THAT'S ALL REFLECTED. AND THEN
17 THERE IS A RESERVE TRANSFER FOR MISCELLANEOUS CAPITAL PROJECTS
18 AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT THAT IN A SECOND. I WOULD NOTE, AND AGAIN
19 I'LL MAKE THIS POINT IN THE DISCUSSION OF CAPITAL PROJECTS,
20 BUT THERE IS NO FUNDING FOR THE NEW ERP SYSTEM ITSELF PROVIDED
21 IN THIS. THAT IS GOING TO BE A SUBSTANTIAL COST, WHETHER IT
22 HITS FISCAL '24, OR LATER. IT IS GOING TO BE A BIG COST AND
23 IT'S GOING TO BE ONE WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT BOTH HOW TO
24 IDENTIFY THAT COST, FUND IT, AND MANAGE THE ALLOCATION OF THAT
25 COST ACROSS THE AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. STAFFING, RIGHT



MAY 24, 2023

1 NOW WE'RE BRINGING FORWARD IN THE DRAFT BUDGET, 16 NEW
2 POSITIONS. AS ANDY SAID, SOME OF THOSE ARE TO ADDRESS
3 ADMINISTRATIVE NEEDS, INCLUDING IT PROCUREMENT FINANCE LEGAL
4 AND HR, SO ALL OF THOSE BACK OFFICE FUNCTION THAT IS CRITICAL
5 FOR OPERATING THE AGENCY ITSELF. POSITIONS TIED TO THE
6 IMPLEMENTATION OF RM3T REGIONAL FORECASTING FOR PLANNED BAY
7 AREA 2050 PLUS, IMPLEMENTATION OF R AND M AND AGAIN SOME
8 SIGNIFICANT STAFFING ADDS FOR ENTERPRISE OPERATIONS, OUR
9 EXPRESS LANES BATA AND CLIPPER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON THE
10 CAPITAL BUDGET, THIS INCLUDES 16 MILLION OF ADDITIONAL FUNDING
11 FOR THE FORWARDS. NOTABLY \$10 MILLION FOR SR37, AND 4.3 -- OH
12 -- SORRY. I APOLOGIZE. I'M A PAGE AHEAD HERE. AGAIN, ON THIS
13 PAGE, SORRY -- THERE IS NO ERP FUNDING. THE MAJOR PROJECT IN
14 THIS, YOU WILL SEE IN THE RIGHT HAND COLUMN, TWO AND A HALF
15 MILLION DOLLARS, THAT IS FOR AN AGENDA MANAGEMENT AND
16 COMMITTEE PACKET AUTOMATION SYSTEM THAT WILL LET US BE MUCH
17 MORE EFFECTIVE IN TRANSMITTING INFORMATION ARE TO YOU AND
18 ENSURING THAT YOU KNOW, KIND OF, WE'RE WORKING AS STAFF TO GET
19 ALL THAT STUFF PUT TOGETHER IN A TIMELY AND ACCURATE BASIS.
20 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. HERE ARE THE FORWARDS. WE'RE ADDING
21 A TOTAL OF \$16 MILLION FOR THE FORWARDS, NOTABLY \$10 MILLION
22 FOR SR37, AND \$4.3 MILLION FOR RICHMOND, SAN RISK, AGAIN, THE
23 FUNDING FOR THESE COMES FROM A VOLL VARIETY OF FEDERAL, STATE,
24 AND LOCAL SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON THE OPERATING BUDGET
25 COSTS FOR OPERATING CLIPPER ARE UP SIGNIFICANTLY RELATED TO



MAY 24, 2023

1 THE FACT WE'RE GOING TO BE OPERATING C1 AND C2 IN PARALLEL
2 UNTIL THERE IS FULL READINESS LAUNCH OF C2 ONLY AT WHICH POINT
3 THE COSTS WILL ROLL OFF SO HOPEFULLY FISCAL '25 WILL LOOK
4 NOTABLY DIFFERENT THAN THIS. NEXT SLIDE. AND THEN THE CLIPPER
5 TWO CAPITAL PROJECT, YOU WILL NOTE THAT THERE ARE SOME
6 ADDITIONS FOR FISCAL '24 THAT'S REALLY RELATED TO ADDITIONAL
7 STAFFING, SOME EQUIPMENT ON THE FARE CARDS FULFILLMENT AND
8 TICKET SUPPORT AND CONSULTANTS THAT REALLY HOPEFULLY THE LAST
9 ADD RELATED TO MAKING C2 OPERATIONAL. AND BUDGET PRESENTATION
10 ONE IS DONE. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, MR. HANSEL.
13 COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? WHILE WE THINK ABOUT IT, LET'S
14 SEE IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO ASK
15 QUESTIONS AT THIS TIME?

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
18 WITH A HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING
19 IN WRITING.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. LET ME BRING IT BACK TO THE
22 COMMISSION. COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? IF NOT, MR. HANSEL
23 WERE YOU REQUESTING AN ACTION ITEM OR THIS IS JUST
24 INFORMATIONAL ITEM.

25



MAY 24, 2023

1 **DEREK HANSEL:** JUST INFORMATIONAL. WE'LL BE BRINGING BACK THE
2 FINAL PROPOSED BUDGET TO YOU ON THE 28th OF JUNE.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT CONCLUDES THIS POINT. MR. HANSEL,
5 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT WAS 12A SORRY. I WAS STILL ON THE
6 STATE BUDGET. RIGHTFULLY SO. THAT CONCLUDES THAT ITEM WE'RE
7 GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 13, PUBLIC COMMENT. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE
8 PUBLIC COMMENT?

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. DO I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE
11 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. MR. VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

13

14 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HELLO. I JUST WANTED TO SAY, YOU KNOW, ABOUT
15 NEED OF MAINTAINING PUBLIC TRANSIT. AS A BLIND PERSON,
16 WHENEVER I HAVE HAD THE NEED TO MOVE, ONE OF THE THINGS I HAVE
17 ALWAYS CHECKED IS A PLACE CLOSE TO PUBLIC TRANSIT. DOES IT
18 HAVE SOME KIND OF BUS SERVICE, DOES IT HAVE SOME KIND OF TRAIN
19 SERVICE, AND AT THE VERY LEAST, THERE HAS GOT TO BE A BUS
20 SERVICE WITHIN A FEW BLOCKS OTHERWISE IT JUST MEANS THAT LARGE
21 PARTS OF THE AREA ARE ESSENTIALLY JUST RULED OUT. SO THAT JUST
22 GIVES YOU A SENSE OF HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO MAINTAIN OUR
23 PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM. I HAVE TO SAY, I WAS A BIT DISTURBED TO
24 HEAR THAT THE GOVERNOR THINKS THAT EV REBATES ARE MORE
25 IMPORTANT THAN MAINTAINING OF OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM. EVS



MAY 24, 2023

1 ARE TYPICALLY BOUGHT BY PEOPLE WITH HIGHER INCOMES. THE OTHER
2 ISSUE IS ALSO THAT -- I MEAN, I DON'T WANT TO SLAUGHTER THAT
3 HORSE, BUT I WISH FOLKS PRIORITIZE THE FISCAL CLIFF AWARDING A
4 BOND MEASURE FOR NEXT YEAR, INSTEAD OF MASSIVE HOUSING MEASURE
5 AT A TIME WHEN THE BAY AREA IS HEMORRHAGING POPULATION, AT A
6 TIME WHEN THE ECONOMY IS LIKELY -- NOT LIKELY -- BUT THE
7 ECONOMY MAY GO DOWN, AT A TIME WHEN INTEREST RATES ARE SO
8 HIGH, WHICH MEANS YOU WOULD BE PAYING A LOT OF THAT MONEY JUST
9 AS INTEREST.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** 15 SECONDS.

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** SO, I DON'T KNOW WHAT TO DO, I JUST THINK IT'S
14 REALLY IMPORTANT TO AVOID OF THE FISCAL CLIFF, AND I HOPE YOU
15 FOLKS DO EVERYTHING YOU CAN TO AVOID IT. GOOD LUCK. THANK YOU
16 VERY MUCH.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
19 RAISED.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU KIMBERLY. MOVING TO ITEM 14,
22 ADJOURNMENT. ADJOURNMENT TO THE NEXT MEETING WEDNESDAY JUNE
23 28TH, 2023 FOR THE MTC COMMISSION. MEETING ADJOURNED.

24 [ADJOURNED]

25



MAY 24, 2023

1

2



NTT

Broadcasting Government