



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



MAY 22, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
MONDAY, MAY 22nd, 2023, 1:30 PM

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: MADAM CLERK, WILL YOU READ THE
ANNOUNCEMENT AND CONDUCT ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM OUR QUORUM,
PLEASE?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC
WEB SITE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE.
MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE
RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND THEY WILL BE CALLED
ON AT THE APPROPRIATED TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
CALLED ON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. IF
ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK
ON ANY ITEM PLEASE FILL OUT A BLUE SPEAKER CARD AND HAND IT
OVER TO THE CLERK. THANK YOU. I WILL DO A ROLL CALL NOW. JUST
GOING TO GIVE IT A MINUTE. CHAIR POWERS?

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR CHAN?

V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: HERE.



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHURCHILL?

3

4 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR CUMINS?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PREMIER IS ABSENT. RICHARDSON FOR MEMBER
11 GONOT?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR MEMBER HURSCH?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

20

21 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN IS ABSENT, BUT WILL ATTEND SOON.

24 THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. OKAY.
2 MOVING RIGHT ALONG AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO IS THE NEXT IN FRONT
3 OF US. WILL THIS IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THERE IS TWO ITEMS,
4 2A AND 2B. FIRST, DO I HAVE A MOTION TO -- THIS IS AN ACTION
5 ITEM HERE, TO MOVE THE CONSENT?

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** SO MOVED, MULLIGAN.

8

9 **BILL CHURCHILL:** CHURCHILL, SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. MULLIGAN AS A MOTION, CHURCHILL AS
12 A SECOND. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENTS EITHER VIRTUAL OR IN-
13 PERSON ON THIS ITEM.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NOBODY -- THERE IS NONE WITH A
16 HAND RAISED, AND THERE IS NOBODY IN THE ROOM FOR PUBLIC
17 COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** COPY THAT. OKAY. BOARD MEMBERS, ANY
20 DISCUSSION? NOT SEEING ANY HERE. MADAM CLERK, WE'LL TURN IT
21 BACK TO YOU FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** OKAY. CHAIR POWERS?

24

25 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YES.



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CHURCHILL?

7

8 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR MEMBER CUMINS?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RICHARDSON FOR GONOT?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR HURSH?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

23 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. OKAY. SO
2 THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
3 THREE IS ALSO -- THERE ARE TWO PIECES TO AGENDA ITEM THREE.
4 IT'S 3A AND 3B, THEY'RE BOTH ACTION ITEMS HERE. SO, LET'S
5 START WITH 3A, AND THIS IS CONTRACT ACTIONS TO OUR CLIPPER IN-
6 PERSON CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTERS. AND KELLY ARE YOU LEADING THE
7 DISCUSSION?

8

9 **KELLEY JACKSON:** YES, I AM. STAFF IS REQUESTING APPROVAL A
10 CONTRACT AMENDMENT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$520,000 FOR TTEC
11 GOVERNMENT SOLUTIONS TO OPERATE THE CLIPPER CUSTOMER SERVICE
12 CENTER AT EMBARCADERO BART MUNI METRO STATION, A CONTRACT
13 AMENDMENT TO THE AMOUNT OF \$300,000 FOR NEMATODE HOLDINGS TO
14 OFFER CLIPPER SERVICES AT THE BAY CROSSING STORE AT THE SAN
15 FRANCISCO FERRY BUILDING, AND THE FUNDING AGREEMENT AMENDMENT
16 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$245,000 AC TRANSIT TO PROVIDE CLIPPER
17 SERVICES TO OAKLAND HEADQUARTERS. LOCATED NEAR RAIL BUS FERRY
18 HUBS SERVICE CENTERS REGULARLY HANDLE 5,000 CLIPPER SALES
19 TRANSACTIONS EACH MONTH REPLACING 25% OF CARDS, ACCESS TO FARE
20 DISCOUNTS AND BENEFITS AVAILABLE TO CLIPPER CUSTOMERS MORE
21 THAN 25% OF SENIOR CLIPPER CARDS ISSUED EACH MONTH ORIGINATE
22 AT THE SAN FRANCISCO LOCATIONS ALONE WHICH IS AN IMPRESSIVE
23 NUMBER ADDITIONALLY THREE LOCATIONS ACCEPT CASH PAYMENT FOR
24 CARD REPLACEMENT FEES DISTRIBUTE CLIPPER START MATERIALS AND
25 PROVIDE INFORMATION ABOUT OBTAINING AND USING CLIPPER MOBILE



MAY 22, 2023

1 CARDS. ALL CONTRACTS AND FUNDING ACTIONS WERE CONTEMPLATED IN
2 THE TWO YEAR CLIPPER BUDGET WORK PLAN THAT EDWARD WILL BE
3 PRESENTING IN THE NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA AND IN THE MEANTIME
4 STAFF IS RECOMMENDING APPROVAL FOR THE THREE CONTRACT ACTIONS
5 TO CONTINUE PROVIDE TRANSIT RIDERS WITH IN-PERSON CUSTOMER
6 SUPPORT IN FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MISS JACKSON.
9 MADAM CLERK, AS THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM HERE, LET ME SEE FIRST
10 IF I HAVE A MOTION HERE ON THIS ITEM IN FRONT OF US?

11

12 **BILL CHURCHILL:** CHURCHILL. I'LL MOVE IT.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** CHURCHILL AND?

15

16 **RICHARDSON:** SECOND.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** RICHARDSON HAS THE SECOND, MADAM CLERK.
19 LET'S GO TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT VIRTUAL OR IN-PERSON.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE AND NO
22 ONE IN THE ROOM WITH A --

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** BEING OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT.
25 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, ADVISE FROM THE BOARD? MR. RICHARDSON.



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** JUST A QUESTION NEW TO THIS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, ARE
3 THESE THE ONLY INSERVICE PHYSICAL SITES THAT EXIST AND THEY
4 WERE SELECTED FOR THAT REASON OR ARE THERE OTHERS THAT ARE NOT
5 PART OF THIS?

6

7 **KELLEY JACKSON:** SO JUST ABOUT EVERY PARTICIPATING TRANSIT
8 OPERATOR HAS A PARTICULATE OFFICE TERMINAL TO PROVIDE THE
9 ISSUANCE OF ADULT YOUTH AND SENIOR CARDS AND ADDING VALUE TO
10 CARDS. WHAT'S SPECIAL ABOUT THESE LOCATIONS IS WE ENTERED INTO
11 CHANGE ORDERS WITH CUBIC TO GET THEM SET UP WITH THE ABILITY
12 TO REPLACE CARDS WHICH MEANS HAVING ACCESS TO THE CUSTOMER
13 SERVICE DATABASE AS WELL WHICH REQUIRES ADDITIONAL PRIVACY
14 TRAINING AND PII REQUIREMENTS AND FOR THAT REASON, THEY HAVE
15 THE ADDED LEVEL OF SERVICE. BUT THERE'S, GENERALLY, PEOPLE CAN
16 PURCHASE THE REGULAR CARDS AND ADD VALUE, AND WE TRACK THAT
17 ACTIVITY AND EVERYONE DOES CONTRIBUTE THROUGHOUT THE REGION.
18 VTA ACTUALLY, WE WERE EXCITED WHEN YOU REOPENED --

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THERE WAS NO AGENDA IN THAT QUESTION I WAS CURIOUS
21 ABOUT THE ENTIRE SYSTEM WERE THESE THE ONLY PHYSICAL ONES THAT
22 WERE, SORT OF, GRANDFATHERS INTO THE PROCESS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MR. RICHARDSON. ANY COMMENTARY
25 FROM COMMISSIONERS AT THE DAIS UP HERE? I HAD ONE. KELLY, MISS



MAY 22, 2023

1 JACKSON, DO ALL THE ADDENDUMS LINE UP AS FAR AS THE TIMELINE
2 GOES, THE ADDENDUMS ARE ALL THROUGH THE SAME DURATION POINT
3 AND THAT POINT IS WHAT'S ON THE CALENDAR YEAR. DON'T CONFUSE
4 ME WITH FISCAL YEAR BUT ON THE CALENDAR YEAR WHEN WOULD THEY
5 END.

6

7 **KELLEY JACKSON:** THIS IS EXTENDED THROUGH JUNE OF 2024 FOR ALL
8 THREE LOCATIONS.

9

10 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THIS'S CLIPPER TWO AS WE'RE ROLLING INTO
11 CLIPPER TWO, RIGHT?

12

13 **KELLEY JACKSON:** YES.

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER DISCUSSION
16 POINTS UP HIRE MADAM CLERK, WHY DON'T WE GO TO ROLL CALL VOTE
17 PLEASE

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAIR POWERS?

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

24

25 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** YES.



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CHURCHILL?

3

4 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MCKILLOP FOR MEMBER CUMINS?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PREMIER IS ABSENT. RICHARDSON FOR GONOT?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR MEMBER HURSH?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU FOR THAT MADAM
5 CLERK. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3B AND 3B IS THE -- THIS
6 IS THE CLIPPER TWO YEAR BUDGET AND WORK PLAN. AND EDWARD IS
7 GOING TO WALK THE COMMISSIONERS THROUGH THIS ITEM HERE. I
8 WOULD REMIND EVERYBODY AT THE BOARD HERE, AT THE LAST CLIPPER
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD EDWARD WALKED THROUGH THE SAME MATERIALS THAT
10 HE'S GOING TO WALK THROUGH NOW, AS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM, SO
11 THAT WE COULD ALL GET FAMILIAR WITH SCOPE, SCHEDULE, BUDGET ON
12 THE TWO-YEAR WORK PLAN. SO WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU
13 EDWARD TO WALK THE PANEL THROUGH THE TWO YEAR WORK PLAN,
14 THAT'S UP FOR AN ACTION ITEM FOR APPROVAL.

15

16 **EDWARD MENG:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. AS CHAIR POWERS
17 MENTIONED, THIS WAS PRESENTED TO THE BOARD LAST MONTH, AS AN
18 INFORMATION ITEM, AND IT'S BROUGHT TO YOU THIS MONTH FOR YOUR
19 REVIEW AND APPROVAL PER COMMITMENTS MADE IN THE MOU. AS THE
20 CHAIR MENTIONED, I WENT INTO DETAIL ON MOST OF THE POINTS AND
21 THESE POINTS WERE REVIEWED WITH THE BOARD LAST MONTH, AND WE
22 INCLUDED THEM IN THE MEMO. I DID WANT TO NOTE SOME UPDATES AND
23 CHANGES LAST MONTH THAT WERE MADE FROM THE COMMENTS FROM THE
24 BOARD LAST MONTH. AT THE BOARD'S REQUEST -- EXCUSE ME -- WE
25 PROVIDED AN ATTACHMENT C, ESTIMATED C1 AND C2, O&M COSTS THE



MAY 22, 2023

1 C1 COSTS ARE ACTUALLY BASED ON ACTUAL C1 INVOICES PAID FROM
2 JANUARY 2023 MARCH 2023 AND THE PROJECTED C2 COSTS ARE
3 ESTIMATED BASED ON CLIPPER RIDERSHIP FROM JANUARY 2023 AND TO
4 MARCH 2023 AND PROJECTED OUT. THAT'S INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENT C
5 TO THIS AGENDA ITEM. I DID WANT TO POINT OUT, AS WELL, I
6 MENTIONED THIS LAST MONTH THAT, WE HAVE ASSUMED ADDITIONAL
7 CAPITAL WORK, AND EQUIPMENT PURCHASE AFTER THE SYSTEM
8 COMPLETION OF AROUND 6 TO 7 MILLION ANNUALLY, THAT IS NOTED IN
9 THE CAPITAL BUDGET, AND WE HAVE NOTED THAT THESE PROJECTS HAVE
10 YET TO BE FUNDED, AS WE DON'T QUITE YET KNOW WHAT THE SCOPE OF
11 THAT WORK WILL BE, BUT WE ARE PLANNING FOR IT, AND WE DO KNOW
12 THAT WE NEED ON FIND A FUND SOURCE TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THE
13 PROGRAM IN THAT WAY. REGARDING A QUESTION, THAT YOU HAD MR.
14 CHAIR ON THE PARATRANSIT INTEGRATION COST, WE HAVE BEEN ABLE
15 TO CONFIRM THAT THERE IS APPROXIMATELY AROUND 1 MILLION
16 INCLUDED IN THE FUNDING FOR PARATRANSIT INTEGRATION COST FOR
17 STRATEGY AND EAST BAY PARATRANSIT. SO, WITH THAT, I THINK WE
18 REQUEST THE CLIPPER BOARD TO APPROVE THIS TWO YEAR OPERATING
19 CAPITAL WORK PLAN AND BUDGET. WE PLAN TO RETURN TO THIS BOARD
20 AND WE'LL MAKE A COMMITMENT TO RETURN IN SIX MONTHS WITH AN
21 UPDATE ON OUR BUDGET TO CONFIRM HOPEFULLY WHAT YOU APPROVE
22 TODAY WITH ACTUALS WITHIN THE NEXT SIX MONTHS. I'M HAPPY TO
23 TAKE ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY HAVE.
24



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ONE SECOND HEATHER, LET ME SEE IF I CAN
2 GET A MOTION AND SECOND ON THIS HEATHER, THEN WE'LL GO TO
3 PUBLIC COMMENT UNLESS THERE IS A CLARIFYING QUESTION THAT YOU
4 HAD HERE? OKAY. SO, AN ACTION ITEM IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION
5 HERE. WE HEARD THIS ITEM FROM EDWARD WE HAD GOOD DISCUSSION
6 LAST MEETING HE UPDATED US HERE TODAY. DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND
7 SECOND ON THIS?

8

9 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION. THIS IS MULLIGAN.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I'LL SECOND, THIS IS MCKILLOP.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND, MADAM
14 CLERK. HOW ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT VIRTUALLY OR IN-PERSON IN THE
15 BOARDROOM.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT WITH A HAND
18 RAISED AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ROOM WITH A SPEAKER CARD. SO
19 THERE IS ONE PUBLIC COMMENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. WE'LL GO PUBLIC COMMENT, MA'AM,
22 TWO MINUTES.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALETA DUPREE, YOU CAN UNMUTE YOURSELF?

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR BOB POWERS, AND
2 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I NEED MY
3 CLOCK HERE.

4
5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TWO MINUTES.

6
7 **SPEAKER:** THIS BUDGET LOOKS REASONABLE. I'M SEEING THAT IT'S
8 BALANCED, AT LEAST FOR THE NEXT FEW YEARS, WHICH IS A GOOD
9 THING. I'M NOT SEEING A BREAKDOWN OVER WHAT OUR OPERATING FEE
10 PRESIDENCY ARE GOING TO BE WITHIN THE LINE ITEM, WE HAVE GOT
11 TO PAY THOSE AND THAT'S JUST PART OF DOING BUSINESS PAYING
12 BANK FEES AND MTC IS VERY GOOD AT NEGOTIATING THAT. CLIPPER
13 TWO IS THE REALLY BIG ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM, COMING UP. LOOKS
14 LIKE WE HAVE OUR MONEY AVAILABLE FOR THAT. BUT, OVERALL, THE
15 BUDGET LOOKS CLEAR. IT MAKES PROVISIONS AS FAR AS THE RTC
16 PROGRAM, OF WHICH I AM A MEMBER OF. AND WITH VARIOUS
17 CLARIFYING VARIOUS MOBILE APP FEES, BECAUSE IT DOES TAKE
18 FUNDS, IT DOES COST MONEY TO CREATE TO PAY MOBILE CARDS. EVEN
19 THOUGH THERE ISN'T A PIECE OF PLASTIC, THERE IS TILL MONEY IN
20 THERE. WE'RE FUNDING THAT, AND HOPEFUL WE CAN TRY TO KEEP THE
21 MOBILE CARDS FREE TO THE USER AS LONG AS POSSIBLE. BUT I HAVE
22 SEEN THESE BUDGETS BEFORE. I THINK WE HAVE A GOOD BUDGET AND
23 WE SHOULD GO FORWARD WITH THIS SO WE CAN GET OUR WORK DONE.
24 THANK YOU.

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER HANDS
2 RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. OKAY. NOW,
5 HEATHER, BACK TO YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. FIRST OF ALL, THANKS FOR PROVIDING THAT
8 BREAK OUT BY ENTITY, WE'RE DOING OUR BUDGET NOW THAT'S ALWAYS
9 HELPFUL. THE SECOND QUESTION I HAD WAS JUST ABOUT THE PROCESS
10 ON THE -- AS YOU MENTIONED BOTH ON THE OPERATING AND THE
11 CAPITAL SIDE IN THE OUT YEARS THERE IS SHORTFALLS, OUT THERE,
12 AND JUST DOING OUR TRANSIT BUDGETS WE, TYPICALLY, DON'T ALLOW
13 -- WE'RE NOT ALLOWED TO SHOW A SHORTFALL WHEN WE GO TO
14 ADOPTING THE BUDGET. RIGHT? I KNOW WE'RE ONLY ADOPTING THE TWO
15 YEARS. BUT WHAT IS YOUR NORMAL PROCESS IN TRYING TO RESOLVE
16 THOSE SHORTFALLS BEFORE THAT COMES? IS IT YOU JUST DON'T DO
17 THE WORK, OR YOU PURSUE OTHER FUNDING SOURCES BECAUSE A LOT OF
18 THESE FUNDING SOURCES I KNOW ARE ALSO FUNDING SOURCES THAT
19 AGENCIES COMPETE FOR. I WAS JUST CURIOUS WHAT THAT PROCESS S.

20

21 **EDWARD MENG:** YES. THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. WE MEET
22 REGULARLY WITH OUR FUNDING, FPP FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM
23 STAFF AT MTC, IN ORDER TO IDENTIFY POTENTIAL FUNDS, POTENTIAL
24 GRANT OPPORTUNITIES, OTHER KIND OF ALTERNATE SOURCES THAT WE
25 MIGHT BE ABLE TO USE, TO RELY ON FOR FUNDING THAT WE KNOW WE



MAY 22, 2023

1 NEED IN THE FUTURE. I THINK WE ARE SHOWING, IN THE OUTER
2 YEARS, A NEED, BECAUSE WE -- I THINK IT WOULD BE -- I THINK
3 ITS RESPONSIBLE TO KNOW THAT WE KNOW WE DON'T HAVE IDENTIFIED
4 SOURCE BUT WE KNOW WE NEED TO HAVE ONE FOR YOU, FOR US, AND
5 FOR YOU, TOO, TO APPROVE THE BUDGET.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I CAN ADD ONE THING TO THAT. ON THE CAPITAL
10 SIDE WE'RE TRYING TO BE FORWARD THINK IF WE DON'T HAVE THE
11 MONEY IN THE OUT YEARS WE CERTAINLY WOULD BE FINE WITH THE
12 PROJECT THAT WE'RE PUTTING OUT THERE BUT WE END THAT THERE
13 MIGHT BE THINGS OPERATORS OR OTHERS WANT JOINTLY WE WANT TO DO
14 WE'RE TRYING TO BE FORWARD THINKING ABOUT THAT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OTHER COMMENTS.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR PUTTING TOGETHER A
21 DETAILED BUDGET THAT'S VERY EASY TO FOLLOW AS WELL AS THE
22 STAFF REPORT HIGHLIGHTS ALL OF THE ISSUES. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OTHERS?

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER WE REQUESTED THIS
2 INFORMATION FOR THE LAST MEETING AND THAT HELPS TREMENDOUSLY
3 TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE DIFFERENCE IS BETWEEN CLIPPER ONE AND
4 CLIPPER TWO OPERATING EXPENSES LOOKING AT ATTACHMENT A, JUST A
5 QUESTION ON RULE NUMBER 12, CURRENT CLIPPER OPERATING COST,
6 TRANSIT AGENCIES, I THINK IT'S SHOWING FISCAL YEAR '27, '28 AT
7 \$1 MILLION. MY UNDERSTANDING ONCE WE TRANSITION, COMPLETELY,
8 THERE IS NOT GOING TO BE ANY COST, RIGHT. I HOPE IT'S A
9 MISTAKE IN ERROR, RIGHT?

10

11 **EDWARD MENG:** THAT IS. THANK YOU FOR CATCHING THAT.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. GOOD CATCH. OTHER COMMENTS? OKAY.
14 I HAD, EDWARD, I JUST WANTED TO PUT ON RECORD THE, YOUR
15 COMMENT ABOUT COMING BACK EVERY SIX MONTHS OR WHATEVER. I
16 THINK WE SHOULD BE MORE THOUGHTFUL IN THAT, BECAUSE WE'RE --
17 THIS BOARD IS APPROVING THIS TWO YEAR WORK PLAN, AND IT IS
18 ABSOLUTELY TIED TO THE ROLL OUT OF CLIPPER TWO. RIGHT? AND
19 THERE IS A LOT IN THE REGION THAT'S, YOU KNOW, 55ING ON THE
20 OFF OF CLIPPER TWO, YOU KNOW, IN THE SUMMER, LITERALLY FOR
21 ABOUT A YEAR NOW PLUS OR MINUS A LITTLE. SO, I WOULD ASK YOU
22 TO KEEP CLOSE WATCH ON JASON'S SCOPE, SCHEDULE, BUDGET ON
23 CLIPPER TWO, AND HOW THIS IMPACTS THIS BOARD'S APPROVAL OF THE
24 WORK PLAN. AND IF THERE IS CHANGES FROM JASON, THAT I
25 OBVIOUSLY ARE GOING TO RIPPLE INTO YOUR -- THIS WORK PLAN THAT



MAY 22, 2023

1 WE'RE ADOPTING RIGHT NOW AND WE MAY NEED TO REVISIT THAT. SO,
2 I WOULD, I GUESS THE SHORT VERSION IS, EVERY SIX MONTHS
3 CADENCE IS ONE THING, THE OTHER ELEMENT IS TO CROSSWALK IT TO
4 WHAT JASON HAS GOT GOING ON WITH CLIPPER TWO. OKAY. I WILL
5 TAKE THAT HEAD NODDING AS, THAT'S A GOOD IDEA, CHAIR.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** [LAUGHTER]

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EXCELLENT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** NOTED. GREAT IDEA, CHAIR.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MADAM CLERK NOT SEEING ANY OTHER PUBLIC
14 COMMENT I'M GOING TURN OVER TO YOU FOR ROLL CALL.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION BY MULLIGAN, SECOND BY --
17 [INDISCERNIBLE] POWERS?

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAN?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER BEG FOR HURSH?



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

5

6 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
9 PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, EDWARD. AND WELL DONE,
12 NICE PIECE OF WORK THERE. AND I LIKE THE CONCEPT OF COMING AS
13 AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM HAVING THAT DISCUSSION AND THEN AN
14 ACTION ITEM. IT'S VERY THOUGHTFUL OF YOU. SO THANK YOU FOR
15 THAT. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR.
16 THERE IS TWO PARTS TO THIS. THIS IS OUR STANDARD GENDER ITEM
17 FOUR JASON IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH THE SCHEDULE,
18 IMPLEMENTATION, AND DEPLOYMENT UPDATE FOR NEXT GENERATION
19 CLIPPER. JASON DO YOU WANT TO WALK US THROUGH THIS?

20

21 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU. JASON WEINSTEIN HERE CLIPPER
22 PROGRAM MANAGER. YOU WILL SEE ON THE SCREEN NOW, HOPEFULLY IN
23 A SECOND, THE SCHEDULE THAT IS, ALSO, AT THE ATTACHED -- AT
24 THE TOP OF ATTACHMENT A TO THE MEMO. THAT CONTINUES TO HOLD.
25 DO WE HAVE IT UP THERE? WELL THAT'S OKAY. WHEN THE SCHEDULE



MAY 22, 2023

1 SHOWS UP. IT'S IN YOUR PACKET. AND SO OUR SCHEDULE STILL SHOWS
2 MAKING THE PLANS SUMMER 2024, AS YOU MENTIONED CHAIR POWERS
3 START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION, AND THE TOPICS TO ACHIEVING OUR
4 CURRENT SCHEDULE ARE THE SAME AS LAST MONTH SO I WON'T BOAR
5 YOU BY GOING THROUGH THEM THEY'RE IN THE BODY OF YOUR MEMO,
6 THE SCHEDULE IS AT THE TOP WE PROVIDE THIS TO YOU IN ADDITION
7 TO THE SUMMARY OF ONGOING ACTIVITIES SO YOU CAN SEE WHAT'S
8 GOING ON. HIGH-LEVEL SCHEDULE IS RIGHT THERE AND WE'RE ON IT.
9 WE'RE MANAGING THE RISKS CAREFULLY AND HAVE IDENTIFIED
10 TRADEOFF OPTIONS FOR RISK MITIGATION, IN TERMS OF EQUIPMENT
11 DEPLOYMENT, I WANT TO GIVE AN UPDATE THERE. WE HAVE A FEW
12 REMAINING PLATFORM DEVICES TO REPLACE. SO, OF THE TOTAL 656,
13 THERE IS A SMALL HANDFUL LEFT AND WE EXPECT TO COMPLETE THOSE
14 SOON. WE HAVE REPLACED ABOUT 44% OF THE BUSES. JUST TO GIVE
15 YOU AN IDEA, THERE'S ABOUT 3,500 BUSES THROUGHOUT THE WHOLE
16 SYSTEM WILL ALL OF THE OPERATORS, AND WE HAVE REPLACED 1500.
17 I'M SURE THAT NUMBER HAS CHANGED FROM THE ONE I HAVE HERE.
18 THAT WILL CONTINUE INTO EARLY 2024. AND HAVE COMPLETED 62% OF
19 ON THE RETAIL LOCATIONS, WHICH THERE'S ABOUT 250 RIGHT NOW.
20 AND I THINK THAT'S ALL I'M GOING TO MENTION AT THIS POINT.
21 UNLESS ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY BEFORE WE GO TO BOARD MEMBERS,
24 LET'S CHECK IN WITH THE PUBLIC ON THIS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION
25 ITEM, IN-PERSON, OR VIRTUAL, MADAM CLERK?



MAY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS ONE PERSON WITH A HAND RAISED.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. LET'S HEAR FROM OUR PUBLIC, MA'AM.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ADINA LEVIN, ARE YOU READY TO SPEAK? YOU
7 WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
10 MEMBERS. ADINA LEVIN, A MEMBER OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,
11 SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, AND, ALSO, WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA,
12 LOOKING AT THE DETAILS OF THE -- AND THE FINE PRINT IN HERE,
13 IN TERMS OF THE SCHEDULE, IT DOES LOOK LIKE THERE ARE SOME
14 CONCERNS THAT THERE MIGHT BE UPDATED VERSIONS OF THE SCHEDULE
15 COMING FORWARD THAT MAY INCLUDE DELAYS. I DON'T KNOW HOW WELL
16 I'M DOING IN READING BETWEEN THE LINES. THE TIMING OF THE
17 RELEASE OF CLIPPER 2.0, FREE AND REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS,
18 BETTER EASE OF USE, INCLUDING OPEN PAYMENT THAT PROVIDES
19 CONVENIENCE TO PEOPLE TAKING SPONTANEOUS TRIPS. ALL OF THESE
20 WILL PROVIDE, REALLY MAJOR BENEFITS TO CUSTOMERS, AND AS THE
21 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS HAVE SEEN, THE POLLING THAT
22 MTC HAS CONDUCTED SHOWS THAT VOTERS SUPPORT TRANSIT GENERALLY,
23 AND REALLY WANT TO SEE IMPROVEMENTS CONVENIENCE AND
24 AFFORDABILITY IN ORDER TO PROVIDE FOR PUBLIC FINANCIAL SUPPORT
25 FOR TRANSIT. I WOULD URGE THE MTC STAFF AND CONSULTANTS TO DO



MAY 22, 2023

1 EVERYTHING IT TAKES TO KEEP THIS ROLLING OUT ON TIME, BECAUSE
2 SEEING THESE TANGIBLE GOOD IMPROVEMENTS ARE GOING TO BE REALLY
3 CRITICAL TO GETTING THE SUPPORT WE NEED, TO GET THE SYSTEM
4 FUNDED AND, YOU KNOW, TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUALLY MAKE
5 IMPROVEMENTS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
8 COMMENTS.

9

10 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANKS MADAM CLERK. LET'S GO TO
11 THE COMMISSIONERS. BOARD MEMBERS, HERE, DENIS, WE WANT TO
12 START WITH YOU.

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** BUILDING UPON WHAT ADINA SAID, ACCORDING TO
15 THE HIGH-LEVEL SCHEDULE AT THE TOP OF THE PAGE IN ATTACHMENT A
16 IT SAYS ACCOUNT BASED TESTING WILL CONCLUDE BY THE END OF THE
17 YEAR.

18

19 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WE'RE ACHIEVING THAT MILESTONE BEFORE THE
20 FALL.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SAY LASER FOCUSED ON THE CONTRACTOR AS WELL
23 AS OUR STAFF ARE LASER FOCUSED GETTING TO THE MILESTONES.

24

25 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** TUMLIN.



MAY 22, 2023

1

JEFFREY TUMLIN: I HAVE BEEN ONE OF THE CRITICS OF THE SCHEDULE FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS PROJECT. AND I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR GETTING US BACK ON SCHEDULE AND HOLDING THERE. I WANT TO ECHO ADINA'S COMMENTS TO SAY WHILE WE'RE NOT NECESSARILY HAVING MAJOR FUNDING ITEM ON THE NOVEMBER '24 BALLOT, THERE ARE POLICY MAKERS UP FOR REELECTION OR COMPETING FOR ELECTION IN ALL NINE COUNTIES WHO HAVE BEEN FIGHTING OR WHO WANT TO FIGHT FOR TRANSIT RECOVERY, THEY WILL BE ON THE BALLOT, AND SO MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE CUSTOMER ORIENTED WINS WELL IN ADVANCE OF THAT ELECTION WILL STRONGLY HELP SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY IN ALL NINE COUNTIES.

13

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANKS JEFF. OTHER COMMENTS? I JUST HAD ONE, JASON, THAT MAYBE AS THE PURVIEW OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD CHAIRPERSON. YOU KNOW, I THINK, TO WHAT DENIS AND TUMLIN AND ADINA WERE TALKING ABOUT, MAYBE WE START -- AND YOU CAN THINK ABOUT THIS, YOU DON'T -- IF I PUT YOU IN AN UNCOMFORTABLE POSITION YOU DON'T EVEN HAVE TO ANSWER -- I THINK, AT THE NEXT MEETING, WE SHOULD DO A DEEP DIVE INTO SCHEDULE ON THIS. YOU KNOW? BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT RIDING ON THIS. AND THIS BOARD SHOULD GET A -- MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY ON THIS BOARD THOROUGHLY UNDERSTANDS THE CURRENT SCHEDULE, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE OPPORTUNITIES ARE, WHAT THE RINKS ARE, AND THE TIMELINES ASSOCIATED WITH THEM, AND I THINK YOU WALK US



MAY 22, 2023

1 THROUGH A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL THAN THE ROLLED UP SCHEDULE,
2 YOU KNOW, ONCE OR TWICE IS PROBABLY A GOOD IDEA, AND IT'S
3 PROBABLY APPROPRIATE TO DO THAT -- IT'S JUNE 26TH, ABOUT A
4 MONTH FROM NOW, COULD WE DO THAT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR?

5

6 **CAROL KUESTER:** I LIKE THAT A LOT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY IT'S GOING TO BE KIND OF A
9 WORKSHOP. GETTING THE DETAILED SCHEDULE AROUND PRERECS AND
10 WHAT'S HAPPENING AND THAT LEADS US UNTIL ONE YEAR FROM NOW,
11 THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. IT LOOKS LIKE EVERYBODY IS NODDING
12 THEIR HEADS THAT'S A HALFWAY DECENT IDEA, JASON, I'LL LEAVE IT
13 TO YOU TO POPULATE THE DATA SET THERE. EXCELLENT JOB JASON,
14 AND THANK YOU EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR ACCOMMODATING THAT
15 REQUEST. OKAY. INFORMATIONAL ITEM, MADAM CLERK, SO, NO VOTE ON
16 THAT ONE. WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE -- THIS IS THE EXISTING
17 CURRENT CLIPPER, THIS IS THE OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE
18 UPDATE, AND STANDARD IN OUR MEETINGS. AND JASON WALKS THE
19 BOARD MEMBERS THROUGH THIS, AS WELL. GO AHEAD JASON.

20

21 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** MEMO PROVIDES INFORMATION AND STATISTICS ON
22 TRANSACTIONS AND REVENUE, MOBILE CLIPPER CARD USAGE, CUSTOMER
23 SERVICE STAFFING LEVELS AND QUARTERLY FARE CHANGES. I WANT TO
24 GET INTO THE STATISTICS DATA AND TRANSACTIONS METRICS WE'RE
25 FOCUSING OUR DATA PRESENTATION ON SPECIFIC AREAS STARTING WITH



MAY 22, 2023

1 A DEEPER DIVE INTO CLIPPER USAGE ACROSS THE BAY AREA BUT LET'S
2 LOOK INTO WHAT WE GOT FOR TODAY. I HOPE. PERFECT. I JUST CAN'T
3 SEE IT. NOW WE CAN SEE IT. AWESOME. FIRST SLIDE. LET'S GO TO
4 THE NEXT SLIDE, GOSH. ALL RIGHT. SO THE FIRST SLIDE NOW HAS
5 TWO TABLES ON THIS, WHAT WE HAVE DONE IS COMBINED A COUPLE OF
6 SLIDES THAT WE USED TO HAVE BEFORE. ON THE LEFT YOU WILL SEE
7 CLIPPER TRANSACTIONS AND ON THE RIGHT CLIPPER REVENUE, BOTH
8 CHARTS GO BACK OVER THE SAME TIME PERIOD OVER THE LAST YEAR,
9 AND RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE HAVE REMAINED STEADY FROM LAST
10 MONTH, AS YOU CAN SEE THERE. I'LL PAUSE FOR A SECOND. OKAY.
11 LET'S MOVE ON. SLIDE TWO HERE REPRESENTS HOW MANY MOBILE CARDS
12 HAVE BEEN PROVISIONED IN THE LAST 12 MONTHS BOTH THOSE ON
13 PHONE AND THOSE CONVERTED FROM PHYSICAL CARD TO MOBILE CARD.
14 THE LIGHT BLUE LINE ON THE TOP IS THE NUMBER OF CARDS OBTAINED
15 DIRECTLY ON PHONES, IN WHICH THIS MONTH, THIS PAST MONTH,
16 APRIL 2023, WAS JUST OVER 70,000 CARDS. AND THE DARK BLUE LINE
17 THAT IS ON THE BOTTOM OF THIS CHART IS THE NUMBER OF CARDS
18 THAT WERE CONVERTED FROM PHYSICAL TO MOBILE CARDS AND THAT
19 REMAINS CONSTANT AT ALMOST 12,000 THIS MONTH, AND THE TOTAL
20 NUMBER OF MOBILE CARDS IN THE SYSTEM TODAY STANDS AT JUST
21 UNDER 1.6 MILLION. SO WE'RE MAKING -- WE'RE REALLY MOVING THE
22 NEEDLE THERE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SLIDE THREE HERE IS ALSO
23 NEW, BUT IT OVERLAYS THE CLIPPER MOBILE CARD USAGE ON TOP OF
24 MOBILE CARD PROVISIONS WHICH I JUST DISCUSSED BEFORE. THE GRAY
25 LINE HERE INDICATES MOBILE CARD USAGE AND THAT'S SLIGHTLY UP



MAY 22, 2023

1 FROM LAST MONTH AND THE OVERWHELM AND BLUE BARS ARE JUST SAME
2 REPRESENTATION OF THE NUMBER OF PLASTIC AND MOBILE CARDS
3 ISSUED. YOU CAN SEE WHILE WE'RE NOT ISSUING AS MANY, USAGE IS
4 UP, WHICH IS GREAT. ALL RIGHT. LET'S MOVE ON. OKAY. SO THE
5 TABLES ON THIS SLIDE COMPARE NUMBER OF TRIPS MADE WITH MOBILE
6 CLIPPER CARDS VERSUS TOTAL NUMBER OF CLIPPER TRIPS BY
7 OPERATOR. TABLE ON THE LEFT SHOWS THAT SINCE APRIL 2021, SO
8 JUST ABOUT TWO YEARS AGO, ALMOST 36 MILLION TRIPS HAVE BEEN
9 TAKEN USING MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS AND THAT'S 17% OF THE CLIPPER
10 TRIPS DURING THIS TIME. AND THE PERCENTAGE IS LEVELLING OFF,
11 BUT IS UP SLIGHTLY FROM LAST MONTH JUST OVER 25% OF CLIPPER
12 TRIPS TAKEN IN APRIL, WITH MOBILE CARDS. SLIDE SIX IS ALSO NEW
13 THIS MONTH AND IT SHOWS THE VALUE ADDED TO CLIPPER CARDS BY
14 SALES CHANNEL OVER THE PAST YEAR. PARTICULATE VENDING MACHINES
15 ARE THE LARGEST FOLLOWED CLOSELY BY AUTOLOAD AND MOBILE, AND
16 FINALLY RETAILERS AND TASK OFFICES TICKET VENDING MACHINES
17 MOBILE AND AUTO LOADS REPRESENT CHANNELING THAT PEOPLE
18 RETURNING TO TRANSIT ARE GENERALLY USING TO ADD VALUE THAT
19 DOESN'T DIMINISH WORK WE'RE DOING IN OTHER LOCATIONS. IT'S
20 JUST INFORMATION. AND, FINALLY, WE HAVE OUR CLIPPER FACT OF
21 THE MONTH. THIS MONTH'S FACT IS NO SURPRISE, BUT I WANTED TO
22 HIGHLIGHT IT, AGAIN, THE PERCENTAGE OF RIDES TAKEN WITH MOBILE
23 CLIPPER CARDS CURRENTLY STANDS AT 25%. JUST A COUPLE OF
24 HOUSEKEEPING THINGS WITH REGARD TO FARE CHANGES, CUBIC HAS
25 REQUESTED QUARTERLY FARE CHANGE REQUEST TO HELP THEM MANAGE



MAY 22, 2023

1 THEIR WORK AND FOR SEPTEMBER 1ST FARE CHANGES DEADLINE TO MAKE
2 THESE REQUESTED CHANGES IS JUST IN A COUPLE OF WEEKS AT JUNE
3 1ST. ACTUALLY ABOUT A WEEK OR SO. AND THAT IS MY REPORT.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, JASON. MADAM CLERK,
6 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NO HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC
9 COMMENTS AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
12 COMMENTS, ADVICE, EPIPHANIES FOR JASON ON THE CURRENT
13 PERFORMANCE ON OPERATIONS OF CLIPPER? BILL?

14

15 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU. I HAD A QUESTION, I KNOW THAT
16 EARLIER IN THE YEAR AND CERTAINLY LATE LAST YEAR WE WERE
17 REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE SUPPLY OF CLIPPER CARDS SO WE ALL
18 MADE A VERY STRONG PUSH FOR THE MOBILE APP AND THE MOBILE
19 CLIPPER. THE QUESTION I HAVE IS, IS THERE A PROCESSING
20 DIFFERENTIAL BETWEEN THE PHYSICAL CARD AND THE MOBILE CARD? IN
21 OTHER WORDS, IS THE COST PER TRANSACTION LOWER USING THE
22 MOBILE? OR IS IT IDENTICAL? HAVE WE EVEN LOOKED AT IT?

23

24 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WELL, OKAY, I'LL SAY THE COSTS ARE DIFFERENT.
25 RIGHT? SO, FOR THE MOBILE CARDS, THERE ARE -- THERE ARE --



MAY 22, 2023

1 THERE'S A COST ASSOCIATED WITH THAT, THAT WE PAY TO THE MOBILE
2 PROVIDERS. AND, ALSO, THERE IS, FOR EVERY CLIPPER CARD, AT
3 LEAST IN THE CURRENT CLIPPER ITERATION, THE O&M IS BASED, IN
4 PART, ON THE NUMBER OF TRANSACTIONS. SO THAT WON'T BE THE CASE
5 IN C TWO. SO WE'LL HAVE A MUCH MORE STABLE, IT DOESN'T MATTER
6 HOW MANY USES THERE ARE, IN OUR O&M IS GOING TO BE FAIRLY
7 CONSISTENT THAT WAY, BUT YOU KNOW, SO FROM THAT PERSPECTIVE,
8 YOU HAVE TO OFFSET WHAT'S THE COST OF THE PLASTIC VERSUS WHAT
9 YOU PAY TO A MOBILE PROVIDER. BUT YOU KNOW, IT'S GENERALLY
10 KIND OF A WASH.

11

12 **CAROL KUESTER:** YEAH. YOU KNOW, I'M NOT AWARE THAT WE HAVE DONE
13 A DIRECT SIDE BY SIDE COMPARISON. SO, IF YOU -- I WOULD LIKE
14 TO TAKE THAT BACK AND LOOK AT IT. ONE REMINDER, WE'RE NOT
15 CHARGING A \$3 A CARD ACQUISITION FEE AT THIS POINT IN TIME.
16 BUT WE ARE CHARGING THAT FEE FOR PEOPLE WHO ACQUIRE A PHYSICAL
17 PLASTIC CARD, ADULT CARD, NOT A DISCOUNT CATEGORY CARD. AND WE
18 MAY WANT TO REVISIT THAT, AS WELL, AT SOME POINTS. SO, I THINK
19 IF WE COULD JUST TAKE THAT BACK AND DO A LITTLE BIT OF A SIDE
20 BY SIDE COMPARISON. I WILL SAY I CONTINUE TO ENCOUNTER RIDERS
21 WHO HAVE PREFERENCES, FOR WHATEVER REASON, FOR ONE OR THE
22 OTHER, AND PEOPLE ARE VERY ANIMATED WHEN THEY'RE TALKING ABOUT
23 THOSE PREFERENCES. I DO THINK IT'S THE RIGHT THING FOR THE
24 PROGRAM TO OFFER OPTIONS. SOME PEOPLE FEEL GREAT ABOUT HAVING
25 A CLIPPER CARD IN THEIR WALL ET, AND THEY KNOW, THEY MOVE



MAY 22, 2023

1 MONEY ON TO THAT CARD AND THEY KNOW THAT CARD IS DEDICATED TO
2 TRANSIT. SOME PEOPLE ARE THRILLED TO BE ABLE TO USE THEIR
3 PHONE TO PAY AND TO BE ABLE TO QUICKLY LOAD VALUE FROM THEIR
4 APPLE OR GOOGLE WALLET. THERE ARE A RANGE OF PREFERENCES,
5 THAT'S ANECDOTALLY TRUE, AND I WANT TO POINT OUT WHEN WE DO
6 OUR CUSTOMER RESEARCH, MEETING PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE AND
7 GIVING OPEN PAYMENT OPTIONS AS WELL, PROUD WE DO THAT. BUT
8 YOU'RE RIGHT WE NEED TO CONSIDER THE FULL COST OF THESE
9 ACTIVITIES.

10

11 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THE REASON I ASK, IS WE SPEND A LOT OF TIME
12 INTERNALLY WITH EACH OF OUR OPERATIONS, WHAT IS THE COST OF
13 MANAGING THE MONEY, SO MANAGING CASH IS EXPENSIVE, MANAGING
14 CLIPPER CARDS IS MUCH LESS EXPENSIVE. IS THERE YET ANOTHER
15 ITERATION DOWNWARD IF WE'RE GOING MOBILE? AND IT WOULD BE
16 INTERESTING TO KNOW. THERE IS CLEARLY ADVANTAGES TO OUR
17 CUSTOMERS GOING MOBILE, IF THEY HAVE THAT ADVANTAGE, BUT I
18 ALSO AGREE, YOU CANDIDATE ELIMINATE THE CARD NOR CAN YOU
19 ELIMINATE CASH FOR A HOST REASONS. APPRECIATE IT.

20

21 **CAROL KUESTER:** WE ARE CLOSELY MONITORING THE SUPPLY OF PLASTIC
22 CARDS. I GIVE A LOT OF CREDIT TO THESE FOLKS AND BART FOLKS
23 FOR MEETING EVERY WEEK ON FRIDAY I THINK WE'RE HOLDING STEADY.
24 BUT IT IS A SUPPLY ISSUE THAT REQUIRES CLOSE MONITORING
25 BECAUSE -- AND, REALLY, I LOOK TO BART STAFF FOR THAT BECAUSE



MAY 22, 2023

1 THEY'RE THE BIGGEST SUPPLIER OF CARDS VIA TDMS. THE OTHER NOTE
2 I WOULD MAKE IS I THINK IT'S GOOD THAT WE LOOK AT THE
3 PERCENTAGE OF TRIPS THAT ARE MADE ON THE MOBILE APP, I THINK
4 WE SHOULD ALSO TAKE A MINUTE TO LOOK AT THE USAGE OF CLIPPER
5 WITHIN AGENCIES. THAT'S REALLY MORE YOUR PURVIEW, AND BILL I
6 HEARD YOU SAY CASH IS EXPENSIVE, CLIPPER IS LESS EXPENSIVE. I
7 DON'T KNOW THAT WAS ALWAYS THE BELIEF THAT EVERYONE HAD. IN
8 ANY EVENT, WE ARE MAKING A BIG REGIONAL COMMITMENT TO THIS
9 PROGRAM, AND SO I THINK, YOU KNOW, WATCHING THAT, SORT OF,
10 MOVING MORE TRANSACTIONS TO CLIPPER JUST TAKES ADVANTAGE OF
11 THE INVESTMENT THAT WE'RE MAKING. AND, FINALLY, I KNOW THAT
12 SEVERAL AGENCIES HAVE THEIR OWN ADDITIONAL MOBILE APPS THAT,
13 AGAIN, MAYBE ONE ARGUMENT WOULD BE, ONE ARGUMENT MAY BE,
14 KUESTER, YOU SAID JUST LET'S MEET PEOPLE WHERE THEY'RE AT AND
15 GIVE THEM OPTIONS, I THINK THAT WAS MORE PALATABLE AND WHEN WE
16 DIDN'T HAVE A CLIPPER MOBILE APP OR CARD ON PHONE BUT WE HAVE
17 TALKED ABOUT PHASING OUT THOSE OTHER MOBILE APPS AND TRYING TO
18 GET PEOPLE INTO A CLIPPER ENVIRONMENT, I THINK THAT CALCULUS
19 IS GOING TO BE DIFFERENTLY FOR EACH AGENCY BUT MIGHT REPRESENT
20 A COST THAT AN AGENCY COULD DROP. I'LL LEAVE YOU WITH THAT.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THE RESPONSE, EXECUTIVE
23 DIRECTOR. OTHER COMMENTS FOR JASON ON HIS UPDATE? OKAY. THANKS
24 JASON. AS ALWAYS VERY THOROUGH, VERY KNOWLEDGEABLE. THANK YOU
25 FOR THAT. MADAM CLERK, I BELIEVE THAT CONCLUDES ITEM 4B AS AN



MAY 22, 2023

1 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM FIVE, AND
2 THAT'S OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT, FROM MISS KUESTER.

3

4 **CAROL KUESTER:** GREAT. ALL RIGHT. JUST VERY QUICKLY, I WANT TO
5 NOTE THAT OUR OWN JASON WEINSTEIN GAVE A PRESENTATION IN THIS
6 ROOM, IT WAS IN THIS ROOM? TO THE COMBINED BART AND AC TRANSIT
7 BOARDS -- OH RIGHT, AT THE INTER-AGENCY LIAISON COMMITTEE ON
8 THE MAY 10TH. THAT WAS WELL-RECEIVED AND WE HAVE MATERIALS
9 AVAILABLE FOR PRESENTATION OF THAT KIND AND FORTHCOMING
10 MOBILITY SERVICE CONFERENCE CALLED MOBILITY AS A SERVICE IN
11 THE UNITED STATES IS JUNE 22ND, AND 23rd. IF YOU'RE LIKE ME
12 YOUR GETTING A LOT OF NOTIFICATIONS ON THAT. WE DON'T HAVE A
13 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING TODAY, BUT WE WILL ALWAYS
14 HAVE CEB AND FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IN THE SAME LOCATION
15 FOR SCHEDULING AND TRAVELING WOES. WE HAVE BOTH THE MTC
16 BOARDROOM AND THIS BOARDROOM RESERVED FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE
17 YEAR. WE'RE LOOKING TO HAVE THE JUNE MEETING, FOR BOTH FARE
18 INTEGRATION AND CEB AT THE MTC LOCATION IN JUNE. BUT WE'RE
19 OPEN -- LET US KNOW ABOUT YOUR LOCATION PREFERENCES IF ANY AS
20 YOU KNOW IT'S BEEN A BIT OF A -- WE HAVE LOOKED TO ROTATE
21 LOCATIONS TO ACCOMMODATE SOME FOLKS. BUT NOT HAVING A TON OF
22 INPUT FOR NEXT MONTH WE'RE REVERTING BACK TO THE OTHER SIDE OF
23 THE BAY FOR THE JUNE MEETING. AND THAT'S ALL I HAVE FOR YOU
24 TODAY.

25



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE
2 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED
5 FOR PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM. AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE
6 ROOM ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. COMMENTS ON THE
9 ED'S REPORT? NOT SEEING ANY HERE, THANK YOU CAROL FOR THAT.
10 WHICH BRINGS US TO THE CLOSE OF AGENDA ITEM SIX. AGENDA ITEM
11 SEVEN IS OUR NEXT MEETING. SO, AGAIN, IT WILL BE MONDAY JUNE
12 26TH, AND IT WILL BE AT 1:30. ONE MORE TIME, THERE IS NO FARE
13 INTEGRATION OR THERE IS? THERE IS? SO THE FARE INTEGRATION IS
14 STARTING AT 12:30.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** 12:45.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WHATEVER IT IS YOU GUYS FIGURE IT OUT.
19 THIS MEETING STARTS AT 1:30 ON JUNE 26TH DOWN AT MTC'S
20 BOARDROOM, RIGHT?

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RIGHT.

23



MAY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THEIR WILL BE A FARE INTEGRATION ELEMENT
2 OF THAT TOO. WITH THAT THE MEETING OF THE CLIPPER BOARD IS
3 ADJOURNED.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TO DO THE PUBLIC COMMENT ITEM.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I MISSED THAT, MA'AM. I'M SO SORRY,
8 MADAM CLERK. WE ARE ON AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX. I'M SORRY,
9 MA'AM. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT'S NOT ON THE
10 AGENDA. MADAM CLERK, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE TWO PUBLIC
13 COMMENTERS. ALETA DUPREE, YOU ARE FIRST, AND THEN ADINA LEVIN.
14 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR
17 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER, AS I SPEAK GENERALLY. YOU KNOW, TIME
18 FLIES, DURING THIS MEETING, I REALIZED AT THE END OF JUNE,
19 ABOUT 40 DAYS OUT, THAT MY REDUCED FARE CLIPPER CARD, WHICH I
20 USE ON MY PHONE, IS GOING TO EXPIRE. SO, I NEED TO CALL
21 SOMEBODY ABOUT THAT. BECAUSE I DON'T WANT THAT TO GET
22 INTERRUPTED. EXCUSE ME. AND I HOPE TO BE SPENDING QUITE A BIT
23 OF TIME IN THE BAY AREA, AND I'M NOT ABLE TO BE WITH YOU
24 TODAY. I SEE THAT YOU ARE MEETING IN THE BART ROOM, WHICH I
25 HAVE BEEN IN. AND HOPEFULLY I'LL BE BACK IN THE BART ROOM



MAY 22, 2023

1 SOON. BUT, HOW DO WE MOVE THESE NEW THINGS FORWARD? AND HOW DO
2 WE GET PEOPLE INTERESTED IN CLIPPER? AS I MENTIONED BEFORE,
3 ABOUT HOW DO WE LOOK AT CLIPPER USAGE WITHIN EACH AGENCY AND
4 MAKE THE CASE FOR USING CLIPPER. I DON'T KNOW THAT I WOULD GO
5 AS FAR AS ELIMINATING CASH. BUT THEY HAVE DONE SO IN LONDON,
6 AND I BELIEVE IN SWEDEN, AND A COUPLE OF OTHER COUNTRIES
7 AROUND THE WORLD, AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHAT THEY'RE DOING
8 IN THOSE COUNTRIES. AND I DID WATCH A MEETING OF THE
9 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY IN NEW YORK THIS
10 MORNING. THEY HAD A TIDBIT ABOUT 25,000 PEOPLE, REDUCED FARE
11 USERS IN NEW YORK, INCLUDING MYSELF, HAVE REDUCED OR OMNI OPEN
12 PAYMENT, 1.2 MILLION WHO HAVE REDUCED METRO CARDS. A LOT OF
13 WORK TO DO. HOW DO WE GET TO THE LEVEL OF UNIVERSAL
14 ACCEPTANCE? HOPEFULLY IT WILL BE MOSTLY CARROTS AND NOT A LOT
15 OF STICK. I WANT US TO BUILD THE BEST CLIPPER WE HAVE. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ADINA LEVIN.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON. SO, I LISTENED
21 TO THE RECORDING OF THE BART AC INTER-AGENCY MEETING WITH THE
22 PRESENTATION ON CLIPPER 2 AND 1 OF THE AC TRANSIT DIRECTORS
23 ASKED A LOGICAL QUESTION ABOUT THE CLIPPER TWO SYSTEM WHICH IS
24 WHETHER IT'S GOING TO BE POSSIBLE TO BE ABLE TO ONCE THE
25 ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM ROLLED OUT TO BE ABLE TO USE MORE THAN



MAY 22, 2023

1 ONE DEVICE UNDER THE SAME ACCOUNT WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT IS
2 QUITE COMMON WITH MANY OTHER TYPES OF APPLICATIONS WHERE YOU
3 CAN HAVE FOR EXAMPLE, A PODCAST APP AND YOU USE IT BOTH ON
4 YOUR MOBILE PHONE AND YOUR TABLET AND THE ANSWER FROM STAFF
5 HAS BEEN THAT WILL NOT WORK FOR CLIPPER BECAUSE WHAT IT IF
6 SOMEONE IS USING THEIR MOBILE PHONE THEN THEY HAND OUT THEIR
7 CLIPPER CARD TO SOMEBODY ELSE AND THEN YOU HAVE TWO PEOPLE
8 USING THE SAME ACCOUNT AT THE SAME TIME IT WOULD BE A PROBLEM
9 WITH MISUSE. AND WHILE THAT IS TRUE THERE'S CERTAINLY
10 CIRCUMSTANCES WHERE FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN YOU HAVE A CREDIT CARD
11 YOU LIVE IN THE BAY AREA, AND SITE BANK NOTICES THAT CREDIT
12 CARD IS BEING USED, AND I'LL SEND AN E-MAIL ACCORDINGLY TO
13 STAFF SEEING IF THERE MIGHT BE WAYS OF LOOKING AT THIS AGAIN.
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. AT YOUR APPROVAL
19 I'M CLEAR TO GO TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN? I'M CLEAR TO DO THAT?
20 YES. WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN THIS MEETING AND WE'RE GOING TO
21 RECONVENE MONDAY JUNE 26TH AT MTC HEADQUARTERS IN THEIR
22 BOARDROOM. AND WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS BE ADJOURNED.

23 [ADJOURNED]

24

25



Broadcasting Government