



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Meeting Transcript



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WORKSHOP DAY 1**

2 **WEDNESDAY, APRIL 26TH, 2023, 1:30 PM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU TO EVERYONE WHO MADE THE
6 TRIP FROM SAN FRANCISCO AND TO THE STAFF OF SERRANO RESORT,
7 THANK YOU FOR HELPING US SET UP AND SHOWCASE THE BEAUTIFUL
8 NAPA COUNTY. COMMISSIONER FLEMING ENJOYED THE TRIP FROM SONOMA
9 TO NAPA. WE LIKE THOSE COMPLIMENTS. OUR VICE CHAIR IS HERE.
10 HE'LL BE COMING MOMENTARILY. WELCOME TO FORMER COMMISSIONER
11 HAGGERTY. WELCOME ABOARD. [APPLAUSE] HE WAS PLAYING GOLF
12 EARLIER TODAY, I HEARD. BUT I WILL SAY, YOU KNOW, TRANSITION
13 TO THE BUSINESS MEETING. REALLY APPRECIATE ALL THE
14 COMMISSIONERS FOR JOINING US. WE'VE HAD SOME TRANSITION AT THE
15 COMMISSION. WE'VE HAD SOME TRANSITION AT THE, YOU KNOW,
16 EXECUTIVE LEVEL, AND I REALLY HOPE TODAY WE CHALLENGE
17 OURSELVES TO RECOMMIT TO THE PRIORITIES WE HAVE BEEN TALKING
18 ABOUT, BUT IF THERE IS DIFFERENCES, THIS IS OUR MOMENT TO TALK
19 ABOUT THEM YOU KNOW, WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO SOME
20 COURAGEOUS THINGS. THE HOUSING SIDE WE'LL TALK ABOUT TODAY AND
21 TRANSPORTATION TOMORROW. WE'RE BEING COMMITTED. I THINK
22 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ TALKED ABOUT A TEAM. THIS IS A TEAM
23 COMMITMENT TO THE OBJECTIVES WANT TO ACHIEVE. IT'S OUTCOMES
24 WE'RE TRYING TO DRIVE FOR THE REGION. THEY WON'T HAPPEN BY
25 ACCIDENT. IF THEY WERE EASY, WE WOULD HAVE DONE THEM



APRIL 26, 2023

1 YESTERDAY. WE HAVE GOOD DISCUSSION ITEMS TODAY. I APPRECIATE
2 YOU TAKING TIME TO COME. I KNOW OUR SCHEDULES ARE BUSY. IT
3 SETS MTC APART WHEN WE TAKE TIME TO CHALLENGE OURSELVES TO
4 HAVE THESE CONVERSATIONS. ON BEHALF OF MYSELF AND VICE CHAIR
5 JOES JOES FOR TAKING TIME. THE FIRST ITEM IS ADVANCING THE
6 PLAN IMPLEMENTATION TO REACH REGIONAL OUTCOMES. THIS IS KICKED
7 OFF BY ANDY FREMIER AND MATT MALONEY. THE GOAL IS TO TALK
8 ABOUT HOW WE GOT HERE AND PROVIDING THE COMMISSIONERS TO PAINT
9 THE PICTURE OF WHAT WE HAVE BEEN COMMITTED TO, BUT ALSO
10 ENGAGING IN THAT DIALOGUE. SO AT THIS POINT, I'LL TURN IT OVER
11 TO ANDREW FREMIER.

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. THE GOLF COURSE
14 LOOKS PRETTY APPEALING, TOO. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK I'VE BEEN
15 IN THE POSITION NOW ABOUT TWO MONTHS AND FOUR DAYS, IF I COUNT
16 IT CORRECTLY. I'M REALLY GLAD WE'RE HERE TALKING ABOUT THE
17 ITEMS WE PUT ON. I TALK TO YOU ALL IN SORT OF THE INTERVIEW
18 PROCESS ABOUT REALLY WHAT IT IS WE WERE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH.
19 I THINK AS A COMMISSION YOU SET THE TABLE REALLY NICELY FOR US
20 AS STAFF, AND I AM PROUD OF THE LEVEL OF EFFORT THAT GOT PUT
21 INTO THIS WORKSHOP. SO QUICKLY. THE FIRST DAY REALLY IS A
22 LITTLE BIT OF A REFLECTION FOR SOME OF THE NEW COMMISSIONERS
23 ON ALL THE HARD WORK YOU DID WITH GETTING UNANIMOUS APPROVAL,
24 PLAN BAY AREA 2050, OF THE RENO ELEMENTS, ET. CETERA. AND, OF
25 COURSE, ALL THE HARD WORK THAT HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR THE LAST



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SEVERAL YEARS IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. WE HAVE A
2 CHALLENGE AHEAD OF US. TODAY IS TABLE SETTING. I THINK
3 TOMORROW WILL BE A LIBEL MORE CHALLENGING IN TERMS OF HOW WE
4 MEET THE COMMITMENTS THAT WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT TODAY. BUT
5 I JUST WANT TO THANK THE STAFF FOR PUTTING TOGETHER SUCH A
6 NICE PRESENTATION OF INFORMATION. ALSO, TO THE STAFF, THE
7 TECHNICAL STAFF THAT CAME UP AND SET THE PLACE UP. IT'S, YOU
8 KNOW, A LOT OF EFFORT GOES INTO THESE THINGS. I WANT TO START
9 OUT WITH THAT. ONE PIECE OF ADVICE YOU GAVE ME AT THE START
10 WAS TO GO OUT INTO THE REGION AND TALK TO FOLKS. SO I'VE HAD
11 AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO QUITE A BIT OF THAT WITH PARTS MY TEAM,
12 MYSELF INDIVIDUALLY. I THINK THAT THE INFORMATION SHARING THAT
13 HAPPENS IN THOSE EXPERIENCES IS VERY VALUABLE. I'VE HAD THE
14 OPPORTUNITY ALREADY TO GO DOWN TO SANTA CLARA AND SPEND SOME
15 TIME IN THE FACILITY. AND TALK TO THE PEOPLE THAT ARE WORKING
16 ON THAT. VERY CHALLENGING PART OF OUR PORTFOLIO. I'VE HAD THE
17 OPPORTUNITY TO TALK TO MUCH OF THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY. SO I'VE
18 HAD A COUPLE OF SESSIONS WITH BAY AREA COUNCIL, EAST BAY
19 LEADERSHIP, THE NORTH BAY LEADERSHIP GROUP, AS WELL, AND I
20 THINK IN ALL CASES, IN PRESENTING THE INFORMATION THAT WE'RE
21 GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT TODAY IT'S VERY WELL RECEIVED, BUT
22 IT'S ALSO VERY WELL RECOGNIZED THAT WE ALL NEED TO DO IT
23 TOGETHER. THAT TEAM, I THINK THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WAS
24 TALKING ABOUT, REALLY IS BROADER THAN JUST THE PEOPLE AROUND
25 THIS ROOM. IT INVOLVES SORT OF EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA THAT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 HAS A STAKE IN WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. SO IT'S BEEN, I THINK,
2 A GOOD COUPLE OF MONTHS IN TERMS OF LEARNING SOME THINGS. AND
3 I THINK THAT TODAY'S PRESENTATIONS WILL REALLY SET OUT AN
4 OPPORTUNITY TO SET SOME OUTCOMES. BUT ALSO TO RECOGNIZE SOME
5 EXPECTATIONS. SO ONE OF THE THINGS I THINK WE'RE TRYING TO GET
6 FROM THIS TODAY IS REAFFIRMATION OF WHAT THE PLAN AND THE WORK
7 WE'VE DONE SINCE THEN TELLS US. TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE STILL
8 WORKING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, AND FOLLOWING THE COMMISSION'S
9 DESIRES. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING QUITE A BIT WITH THE TRANSIT
10 AGENCIES TO DEAL WITH WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT THIS MORNING, THE
11 TRANSIT FINANCIAL CLIFF, AND THEN, ALSO, WAYS TO ACTUALLY
12 IMPROVE THE SYSTEM. AGAIN, I THINK THOSE ARE GOING TO BE
13 CHALLENGES FOR US GOING FORWARD. I THINK WE'VE BEEN RELATIVELY
14 SUCCESSFUL AT KEEPING EVERYBODY IN A FORM OF UNANIMITY, BUT I
15 THINK AS THINGS GET HARDER, IT'LL BE EVEN MORE CHALLENGING.
16 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT DIRECTION FROM YOU. SO THANK YOU
17 FOR COMING! MY JOB IS PRETTY SIMPLE TODAY. I'M GOING TO KICK
18 OFF THE PRESENTATION. REALLY, AS I MENTIONED, TO KIND OF
19 REFOCUS OUR ATTENTION ON THE REGIONAL OUTCOMES WE AIM TO
20 ACHIEVE. THE STUFF DIRECTLY IN THE IMPLEMENTATION AREA FROM
21 PLAN BAY AREA 2050. WE WANT YOU, ALSO, TO KNOW WHAT IS
22 REQUIRED TO MEET THE REGIONAL STRATEGIES. THEY WILL TAKE QUITE
23 A BIT OF EFFORT, AND THEY WILL CHALLENGE US IN THAT REGARD. WE
24 HAVE ACHIEVED SOME LEVEL OF KEY WINS OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS,
25 AND WHILE WE SHOULD CELEBRATE THOSE THINGS, WE ALSO SHOULD BE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 MINDFUL THEY'RE ACTUALLY KIND OF LOW-HANGING FRUIT. WE HAVE
2 HARDER WORK AHEAD OF US. WE WANT TO FRAME THE CONVERSATION
3 OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF DAYS, AND THEN COME OUT OF HERE,
4 AGAIN, TO REITERATE, WITH SOME DECISIONS ON HOW TO MOVE
5 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO PLAN BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED
6 ABOUT A YEAR AND A HALF AGO. AS I MENTIONED, IT WAS A
7 COMPREHENSIVE BLUEPRINT FOR THE RENAL AND UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED
8 BY BOTH BOARDS. AND IT DOES, I THINK, ALLOW US TO RECALL BACK
9 TO SEVERAL YEARS AGO WHEN COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY, I HEARD WAS
10 IN THE ROOM, HOSTED US OUT IN DUBLIN, AND I THINK, IF I
11 RECALL, THERE WAS MORE THAN ONE COMMISSIONER THAT PUT A BOLD
12 AND UNFLINCHING GOAL IN FRONT OF OUR CHALLENGE. I THINK WE'RE
13 TRYING TO STILL MEET THAT. [LAUGHTER] BUT, YOU KNOW, UNLIKE
14 A LOT OF EFFORTS IN THE PAST, PLAN BAY AREA 2050, FOCUSED ON
15 HOW TO MOVE THE NEEDLE AND HOW TO CHANGE THE TRAJECTORY WE'RE
16 ON. I THINK WE REALIZE WITH THE TRANSIT CHALLENGES, CLIMATE
17 CHANGE, HOUSING CONUNDRUMS WE HAVE, WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH
18 RESOURCES TO DO ALL THE THING BS WE WANT TO DO, AND WE SEE
19 WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE BUT REALLY, REALLY AREN'T QUITE CLEAR
20 YET ON WHAT THE PATH IS TO GET THERE. THE PLAN DOES HAVE 35
21 STRATEGIES IN IT THAT REALLY DO LAY OUT WHAT IT MEANS TO GO
22 BIG. AND WHAT IS OUR DIRECTION OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS. THEN
23 THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ITSELF DOES LAY OUT A THREE TO FIVE
24 YEAR GOAL. I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT ASPECT OF TRYING TO MOVE
25 SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE, I THINK. YEAH.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THERE'S A LOT OF INFORMATION IN THE 35 STRATEGIES, IT DOES
2 COVER, REALLY, THE BROAD GOALS OF THE AFFORDABILITY, SHIFTING
3 MODE, AND THEN MAKING IMPROVEMENTS TO THE CLIMATE. WE DO WANT
4 TO FOCUS OUR ATTENTION ON THOSE THREE AREAS, AND MAKE SURE THE
5 THINGS WE DO DEAL WITH SOLUTIONS THAT ARE EFFECTIVE IN THAT
6 WAY. SO AFFORDABILITY, WHICH IS CLEARLY A TOP ISSUE, I KNOW
7 FROM EXPERIENCE IN HAVING A PUBLIC HEARING ON STATE ROUTE 37
8 THE OTHER NIGHT THAT AFFORDABILITY IS A BIG DEAL TO THE FOLKS
9 THAT ARE DRIVING OUR ROADS AND WORKING IN PARTS OF THE REGION
10 AND LIVING IN A DIFFERENT PART OF THE REGION. SO REALLY MAKING
11 SURE OUR HOUSING STRATEGIES ENCAPSULATE THE THREE P'S OF
12 PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION, AND PRODUCTION. IT'S FUNDAMENTAL TO
13 WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. MODE SHIFT IS SO, OBVIOUSLY, CRITICAL
14 TO MAKING SURE THE ECONOMY STAYS STRONG, AND PEOPLE ARE
15 FINDING INCENTIVES AND WE'RE FINDING INCENTIVES FOR THEM TO
16 CHANGE THEIR BEHAVIOR AND GET OUT OF SINGLE-OCCUPANCY
17 VEHICLES, WHICH, AS WE CAN SEE THROUGH THE REBOUND OF TRAFFIC
18 AFTER COVID IS EVEN MORE DIFFICULT AND ONE OF THE MOST
19 IMPORTANT ELEMENTS OF WHAT WE'RE DOING TODAY. THE THIRD THING
20 IS DO SOME CROSS-CUTTING ATTENTION. PAY ATTENTION TO CLIMATE.
21 PRIMARILY AS IT DEALS WITH REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS.
22 BUT THEN, ALSO, DEALS WITH SOLUTIONS THAT REALLY IMPROVE THE
23 RESILIENCY OF THE REGION AT THE SAME TIME. SO, AGAIN, FOCUSING
24 ON A LOT OF OUR TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS THAT ARE AT SEA
25 LEVEL, AND OUR AT-RISK. WE WANT TO FIND SOLUTIONS THAT HELP



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WORK ON IMPROVEMENTS IN THAT AREA. SO WITH THAT AS AN
2 INTRODUCTION, I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO MATT MALONEY,
3 THE DIRECTOR OF OUR REGIONAL PLANNING SESSION TO KIND OF WALK
4 US THROUGH THE REST OF THE PRESENTATION.

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** I'M GOING TO MOVE THROUGH THE THREE OUTCOMES
7 THAT ANDY DISCUSSED. KIND OF, IN TURN, STARTING, FIRST, WITH
8 STRATEGIES FOR A MORE AFFORDABLE BAY AREA. SO AS THE SLIDE
9 STATES, THE BAY AREA REMAINS ONE OF THE MOST EXPENSIVE PLACES
10 TO LIVE IN THE UNITED STATES. THE PANDEMIC EXACERBATED THE
11 SITUATION. AND MARKET RATE HOUSING IS CERTAINLY PART OF THE
12 SOLUTION. [SPEAKING OFF MICROPHONE] MARKET RATE HOUSING IS
13 PART OF THAT SOLUTION. SIGNIFICANT PUBLIC INVESTMENT IN DEED
14 RESTRICTED -- TO CREATE A MORE EQUITABLE AND AFFORDABLE
15 REGION. THE BAR CHARTS UP ON THE SLIDE DISPLAY THE CHANGES IN
16 THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING STOCK BROUGHT ABOUT BY THE STRATEGIES
17 WE INCLUDED IN PLAN BAY AREA 2050. SO THE TOP CHART SHOWS
18 NUMBERS BACK IN 2015. SO WE HAD ROUGHLY 700,000 HOUSEHOLDS IN
19 THE REGION WITH LOW-INCOMES. BUT WE HAD ONLY ABOUT 120,000
20 UNITS IN EXISTING DEED-RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOUSING.
21 THEREFORE, THAT'S A GAP OF ABOUT 590,000 HOMES. THE BOTTOM
22 CHART SHOWS THAT BY 2050, WE'RE FORECAST TO HAVE 1.1 MILLION
23 HOUSE HOLDS WITH LOW-INCOME. BUT THANKS TO THE THREE
24 STRATEGIES, AND MORE THAN THREE STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN,
25 PRESERVATION, PRODUCTION, AND MORE INCLUSIONARY HOUSING WHICH



APRIL 26, 2023

1 INTEGRATES AFFORDABLE HOUSING INTO ALL MAJOR HOUSING PROJECTS.
2 WE WOULD HAVE 1.2 MILLION DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE HOMES OUT
3 THERE. PLAN BAY AREA 2050 DOES SHOW WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO
4 ELIMINATE THAT GAP. AND, OF COURSE, IT FOLLOWS THESE TYPES OF
5 STRATEGIES ON THE SLIDE WOULD HAVE A MAJOR IMPACT ON
6 AFFORDABILITY. I'M NOT SHOWING THE NUMBERS HERE, IN 2015, LOW-
7 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS SPENT 68% OF THEIR INCOME ON HOUSING. IN
8 2050, THAT NUMBER WOULD FALL TO 29%. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE
9 HAVE MADE SOME PROGRESS IN THIS REGARD SINCE THE ADOPTION OF
10 THE PLAN. THIS IS SIX CYCLE IS UPON US. 441,000 HOUSING UNITS
11 ACROSS THE REGION, 180,000 FOR LOW AND VERY LOW-INCOME
12 HOUSEHOLDS. SO, YOU KNOW, THIS CYCLE ALONE IS NOT GOING TO
13 SOLVE THE HOUSING PROBLEM, BUT IT CAN MAKE A MEANINGFUL DENT.
14 SO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE, OBVIOUSLY, HARD AT WORK WITH THE
15 HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE AS STAFF HAVE BEEN ON THE GROUND
16 ASSISTING JURISDICTIONS. THIS WAS FUNDED, IN PART, THROUGH
17 GRANTS, FROM REEP. THE FIRST ROUND OF THE FLEMING WHICH WAS
18 ABOUT \$20 MILLION FLOWED THROUGH -- BUT THE SECOND \$100
19 MILLION FLOWED -- IT'S BAY AREA FINANCE AUTHORITY WITH AN
20 INFUSION OF CAPITAL MONEY. IT ALLOWS US, FOR THE FIRST TIME AS
21 AN AGENCY, TO ALLOCATE FLEMING TO PRIORITY SITES. THESE ARE
22 UNDERUTILIZED MALLS, PUBLIC LANDS, AND OTHER STRATEGIC SITES
23 AROUND THE AREA. THAT'S A BIG PUSH LATER THIS YEAR. AND THE
24 BIG THING THAT IS NEXT IN 2023 AND 2024 WILL BE PREPARATION
25 FOR THE HOUSING BALLOT MEASURE, AND WE'LL HAVE AN ITEM ABOUT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THAT LATER ON TODAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO SHIFTING GEARS NOW
2 TOWARD BOLD STRATEGIES FOR A MULTIMODAL BAY AREA. AND AS THE
3 SLIDE STATES, EVEN AS THE PANDEMIC CREATED NEW OPPORTUNITIES
4 FOR SOME BAY AREA RESIDENTS TO WORK FROM HOME, SEVERE TRAFFIC
5 CONGESTION RETURNED FOR THOSE WITHOUT ALTERNATIVES. GIVEN THE
6 PLAN'S \$100 BILLION PLUS WILL TAKE DECADES TO DELIVER. THEY
7 NEED TO PRIORITIZE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE AS WELL AS
8 FASTER AND LOWER-COST STRATEGIES TO TACKLE URGENT CHALLENGES.
9 LIKE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THE PLAN MAKES SERIOUS HEADWAY ON THE
10 ISSUE OF CHANGING -- IN 2015 WE LOOKED AT COMMUTE MO CHAIR.
11 71% BY AUTO, 13% BY TRANSIT, 5% WALK BIKE, ABOUT 11% WORK-
12 FROM-HOME. BY 2050, THOSE NUMBERS WOULD BE PROJECTED TO
13 CHANGE, AGAIN, ASSUMING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PLAN. AUTO
14 IS 50% OF THE COMMUTE. TRANSIT WOULD RISE TO 19%, 9%
15 WALK/BIKE, ABOUT 22% WORKING FROM HOME. WHAT DRIVES THE CHANGE
16 IS A NUMEROUS SET OF STRATEGIES ON THE RIGHT SIDE. AS MOST
17 KNOW WHO HAVE BEEN ON THE COMMISSION FOR SOME TIME, LISTENING
18 TO PLANNING PRESENTATIONS, IT'S NOT JUST TRANSPORTATION
19 PROJECTS THAT DRIVE MODE SHIFT. IT'S ALSO DRIVEN BY LAND USE.
20 LOCATING MORE HOUSING AND JOBS CLOSE TO TRANSIT. SO, OF
21 COURSE, THAT'S IN ADDITION TO A SUITE OF MOBILITY-FOCUSED
22 PIECES, INCLUDING MOVES TOWARD MOBILITY, FERRY FORM, FREEWAY
23 TOLLING, COMPLETE STREETS, AND MORE INVESTMENTS IN TRANSIT.
24 NEXT SLIDE. SINCE PLAN ADOPTION WE'VE HAD KEY WINS ON THIS
25 FRONT. THE FIRST IS WE HAVE THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION



APRIL 26, 2023

1 PLAN IMPLEMENTATION UNDERWAY. INCLUDING THE REGIONAL NETWORK
2 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE. WE WILL TALK ABOUT THIS ON THE
3 SECOND DAY. THE SECOND IS THAT DURING THE PANDEMIC, THE REGION
4 SECURED SIGNIFICANT FEDERAL MONIES TO KEEP TRANSIT MOVING. AND
5 THAT TOOK SIGNIFICANT EFFORTS BY OUR STAFF AND YOU TO MAKE IT
6 HAPPEN AND GET THE MONEY TO THE OPERATORS WHERE IT WAS NEEDED.
7 HOWEVER, WE HAVE A LOT ON DECK AS WE MOVE FORWARD. THE FIRST
8 MOST TIME CRITICAL EFFORT FOR US TO WORK TO SECURE FUNDS FROM
9 THE STATE. TO KEEP TRANSIT MOVING IN THIS REGION, OF COURSE,
10 THE CHALLENGE IS MOST ACUTE ON THE OPERATING SIDE. SECOND,
11 WE'LL CONTINUE TO WORK TO ADVANCE OUR MAJOR PROJECT
12 ADVANCEMENT POLICY, THE SO-CALLED MAP. AND IT'S ALSO A BIG
13 PART IS DELIVERING ON REGIONAL MEASURE 3, WHICH IS FINALLY
14 UNLOCKED. AND WE'RE READY TO START ALLOCATING THOSE FUNDS.
15 THIRD, LAUNCHING CLIPPER 2.0. WHICH WE'VE BEEN HARD AT WORK ON
16 FOR MANY YEARS. IN 2018, THE REGION MADE SIGNIFICANT
17 INVESTMENT TO MODERNIZE THE CLIPPER SYSTEM AND WE'RE ON THE
18 VERGE OF BENEFITING TO THE TRAVELING PUBLIC. CLIPPER IS
19 PROBABLY THE STRONGEST EVIDENCE OF REGIONAL COORDINATION
20 SYSTEM. THE NEXT GENERATION IS BRINGING A FARE SYSTEM THAT
21 SUPPORTS FARE CAPPING AND OTHER DISCOUNT PROGRAMS AND MORE.
22 THE C2 PROGRAM IS CURRENTLY REPLACING ALL OF THE HARDWARE.
23 IT'S A HUGE EFFORT. ALL THE CARD READERS AND DRIVER UNITS ON
24 THE BUSES AND PLATFORMS. AND THE BACK END SOFTWARE SYSTEM.
25 NEXT SLIDE. THE FINAL OUTCOME TO TOUCH ON THIS AFTERNOON IS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 OUR CLIMATE STRATEGIES. SO THE SLIDE REFERS TO THESE ARE BOLD
2 STRATEGIES FOR A GREENER BAY AREA. OUR PLAN IS REQUIRED TO
3 REDUCE PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE GASES FROM CARS AND LIGHT-DUTY
4 TRUCKS. THE TARGET IS 19%. OUR PLAN ACHIEVES THAT TARGET.
5 THAT'S SHOWN ON THE FIRST BLUE BAR WITH THE ARROW. AND, YOU
6 KNOW AGAIN, IF YOU'RE IN THE WEEDS ON THE PLANNING STUFF, YOU
7 PROBABLY KNOW OUR PLAN DOESN'T GET TO TAKE CREDIT FOR A LOT OF
8 THINGS. LIKE THE EFFICIENCY GAINS IN THE FLEET FROM MOVING
9 TOWARDS A MORE ELECTRIFIED FLEET. SO, YOU KNOW, THE STATE OF
10 CALIFORNIA TAKES CREDIT FOR MOST OF THOSE GAINS, NOT OUR PLAN.
11 HOWEVER, WE CAN CALCULATE THAT FIGURE ANYWAY. WHEN WE INCLUDE
12 FLEET EFFICIENCY GAINS INTO THE MIX, OUR PLAN WOULD ACHIEVE A
13 48% REDUCTION ON A PER CAPITA BASIS. WHAT I WANT TO THE POINT
14 OUT ABOUT CLIMATE IS SIMPLY THAT ALL OF OUR PLAN STRATEGIES
15 ARE WORKING TOGETHER ARE REQUIRED TO GET US THERE. WE SHOW
16 EIGHT OF THOSE STRATEGIES UP ON THE SLIDE. BUT I PROBABLY
17 COULD HAVE INCLUDED CLOSE TO ALL 35 OF THEM. THIS RANGES FROM
18 DENSIFICATION OF HOUSING AND COMMERCIAL, WHICH IS PROBABLY,
19 AGAIN, THE SINGLE BIGGEST DRIVER OF REDUCING GHG BUT ALSO
20 MOVING TOWARD AN EQUITABLE SYSTEM OF ROADWAY PRICING, WE'RE
21 STUDYING THAT. A SAFER ENVIRONMENT FOR WALKING AND BIKING.
22 INVESTMENTS LIKE CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE, BIKE SHARE, MOBILITY
23 HUBS THAT HELP TO CLEANER VEHICLES AND MANAGING TRANSPORTATION
24 DEMAND. AGAIN, PUSHING TOWARD THAT MODE SHIFT THAT WE JUST
25 DISCUSSED EARLIER. NEXT SLIDE. OVER THE LAST YEAR, WE'VE HAD



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SOME KEY POLICY WINS HERE. YOU APPROVED A TRANSIT ORIENTED
2 COMMUNITY POLICY. OR THE TOC POLICY. AND, OF COURSE, THAT'S
3 BOTH THE HOUSING POLICY AND TRANSPORTATION POLICY. PROBABLY
4 COULD HAVE BEEN ON ANY SLIDE. WE WANTED TO SITUATE IT HERE AS
5 A CLIMATE STRATEGY. JUST AS A REMINDER TO ALL THE COBENEFITS
6 THAT BRINGS IN TERMS OF GHG REDUCTION. WE'VE CONTINUED TO LEAN
7 INTO SUPPORTING BAY WHEELS, THE REGIONAL BIKE SHARE SYSTEM.
8 AND THIS SUPPLIES E BIKES IN PARTICULAR. RECENTLY THE
9 COMMISSION APPROVED THE PROGRAMMING OF ADDITIONAL \$20 MILLION
10 TO HELP MODERNIZE THAT SYSTEM, AND ADD MORE E BIKES AND
11 POTENTIALLY EXPAND IT TO ADJACENT CITIES. WHAT IS COMING UP IN
12 2023 AND 2024? WE'RE CONTINUING TO STUDY THE POTENTIAL OF
13 EXPANDED PRICING WAY TO MOVE THE NEEDLE ON MODE SHARE. MORE TO
14 COME ON THAT AT THE NEXT PLANNING COMMITTEE IN MAY. SECOND
15 WILL BE AWARDING IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD OF \$60 MILLION OR SO TO
16 MOVE THE PDA AHEAD. SO LOTS MORE INVESTMENT TO HAPPEN. LASTLY,
17 MORE ON THE RESILIENCE SIDE OF THE CLIMATE ISSUE. WE CONTINUE
18 TO WORK ON PRIORITIZING INVESTMENTS IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE
19 SPACE. INCLUDING THE HARD WORK WE'RE DOING ON THE 37 CORRIDOR.
20 NEXT SLIDE. SO CLEARLY WE HAVE A BOLD PLAN. WE HAVE MANY BOLD
21 POLICIES AND PLANNING EFFORTS. BUT THESE CAN ONLY GO SO FAR
22 UNLESS THEY'RE PAIRED WITH RESOURCES. IF WE WANT TO GET TO
23 SOME OF THESE OUTCOMES. AS I LAID OUT A FEW THERE IN TERMS OF
24 AFFORDABILITY, MODE SHIFT, AND GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION. THE
25 UNMET NEEDS AS A REGION ARE SIGNIFICANT. OVER THE NEXT 30



APRIL 26, 2023

1 YEARS, WE NEED SIGNIFICANT NEW REVENUES FOR BOTH HOUSING AND
2 TRANSPORTATION. AND THESE ARE DISPLAYED IN THE PIE CHARTS ON
3 THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE OF THE SLIDE. IT'S EASY TO GET OVERWHELMED
4 BY THE NUMBERS. \$346 BILLION FOR HOUSING. \$110 BILLION FOR
5 TRANSPORTATION OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS. THEY DO REFLECT OUR
6 BEST ASSESSMENT OF WHAT IT WILL TAKE, AGAIN, CONSISTENT WITH
7 THE BOLD AND UNFLINCHING DIRECTION YOU GAVE TO US A FEW YEARS
8 AGO. AT THE SAME TIME, IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT WE
9 DON'T NEED ALL THE INVESTMENT AT ONCE. IT CAN BE INCREMENTAL,
10 BUT WE NEED TO BE MOVING FORWARD AND SHOWING PROGRESS. WE
11 THINK THAT INCLUDES CONTINUING TO WORK WITH OUR DELEGATION IN
12 SACRAMENTO, AND IN D.C., BUT ALSO PREPARING REGIONALLY FOR A
13 2024 AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND, AND, PERHAPS FUTURE
14 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE TO START FILLING SOME OF THE
15 FLEMING GAPS. NEXT SLIDE. AND THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION.
16 AND OPEN IT UP FOR DISCUSSION OR ANY QUESTIONS YOU MIGHT HAVE.
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU FOR THAT SUMMARY. IT'S A
20 GREAT REFRESHER OF HOW WE GOT HERE. AND THAT'S A PURPOSE OF
21 THIS SIDE BEFORE WE JUMP INTO REGIONAL POLLING WE DID. LET ME
22 KICK IT OFF WITH A QUESTION. AS YOU WERE GOING THROUGH THE
23 PRESENTATION, MATT YOU KNOW, THERE'S A LOT CHANGE BUT THE
24 GOALS AND PRIORITIES AND OUTCOMES HAVEN'T FOR ME PERSONALLY.
25 THE ONE THING THAT COMES TO MIND, YOU KNOW, IS THIS NEED FOR



APRIL 26, 2023

1 INFRASTRUCTURE, TOO, IT WASN'T SO TOP OF MIND WHEN WE WERE
2 WORKING ON THE PLAN. FOR EXAMPLE, I DRIVE AN ELECTRIC CAR AND
3 IT'S WELL KNOWN. I STRUGGLE TO CHARGE MY CAR. BUT I'M NOT THE
4 ONLY ONE. AS WE TRY TO TRANSITION TO THESE, AND WE TALK ABOUT
5 MUNICIPALITIES TRYING TO GO GREEN, WE TALK ABOUT, YOU KNOW,
6 CORE SERVICE PROVIDERS, WHETHER IT'S, YOU KNOW, WASTE HAULERS,
7 SERVICE DELIVERERS, THEY'RE ALL TRYING TO DO THE SAME THING.
8 TO BE PART OF THE OUTCOME. BUT WHO IS GOING TO OWN THE SPACE
9 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE INFRASTRUCTURE CAN SUPPORT THOSE
10 OUTCOMES? AND IT'S ALMOST LIKE LET'S GO TO THAT OUTCOME, BUT
11 WE MAY NOT BE READY FOR THAT. SO THAT'S THE ONLY THING I
12 HAVEN'T SEEN IN TERMS OF WHO WILL OWN THAT. SO CAN YOU PROVIDE
13 A LITTLE COLOR ON THAT INITIALLY.

14

15 **MATT MALONEY:** YEAH. WE THINK ABOUT THAT. ONE OF THE OTHER
16 OPPORTUNITY IN THE CHARGING SPACE THAT WE SEE IS PERHAPS
17 WORKING WITH SOME OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND SOME OF THEIR
18 PARKING LOTS AND TRYING TO WORK ON THOSE AREAS FOR CHARGING.
19 WHAT WE'VE DISCOVERED IS THAT THERE MAYBE IS NOT A LOT GOING
20 ON THERE. WE CAN POTENTIALLY FILL A GAP THAT OTHERS AREN'T
21 FILLING. BUT AT THE SAME TIME, I THINK IT'S PARTNERSHIPS, TOO.
22 IT'S ALSO A VERY CROWDED SPACE. THERE'S QUITE A FEW AGENCIES
23 IN THE MIX. AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL I'VE TALKED ABOUT TRYING TO
24 GET A BETTER PARTNERSHIP TOGETHER WITH THE AIR DISTRICT. TO
25 TRY TO PUT, YOU KNOW, PROGRAMS OUT TOGETHER CONSOLIDATED AT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE SAME TIME TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR, YOU KNOW, PROPOSERS AND,
2 ULTIMATELY, FOR THE, YOU KNOW, THE PUBLIC OUT THERE.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY I APPRECIATE IT. AND I'M NOT
5 SAYING WE NEED TO BE A LEADER IN THIS SPACE. IT MIGHT BE A
6 CONVENER. IF WE'RE TIED TO THE PLAN, WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT THE
7 BARRIERS ARE IN TERMS OF HAVING THE SUPPORTING INFRASTRUCTURE
8 TO DO THAT. TO ME, THERE'S A LOT OF PARTNERS, NOT JUST TRANSIT
9 OPERATORS, OUR UTILITY PROVIDERS. DO WE KNOW WHAT THE CAPACITY
10 GRID IS? IF WE'RE CHARGING FROM 8:00 P.M. TO 5:00 A.M., IS
11 THERE ENOUGH ENERGY IN THE GRID TO SUPPORT MUNICIPALITIES
12 GOING GREEN? OR BUSES GOING GREEN? BECAUSE IF WE CAN'T CHARGE
13 OUR BUS, IT MEANS RIDERS WILL NOT BE RIDING POTENTIALLY.
14 THAT'S ONE THING. AND I DO WANT TO MAKE LIGHT OF WE'VE MADE
15 PROGRESS. THE PILOT PROGRAMS, THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THAT'S
16 IN MOTION. THESE ARE SOME OF THE THINGS THAT ROSE TO THE TOP.
17 AND MY FINAL QUESTION, BEFORE I OPEN IT UP FOR OTHERS IS THE
18 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT BOTH --
19 WE DID AFTER THE PANDEMIC, I BELIEVE, WE DID ON THE LISTENING
20 TOUR. WE HEARD THERE'S A LOT OF FOLKS THAT WANT TO BUILD
21 HOUSING. THERE'S A LOT OF MUNICIPALITIES TRYING TO PROCESS,
22 BUT THERE'S A CHALLENGE SOMETIMES WITH THE READINESS OF THE
23 APPROVING PLANS AND TRYING TO GET OUTSIDE CONSULTANTS TO COME
24 IN AND DO PLAN CHECK REVIEW. TO ME, THERE'S AN INTEREST. IT
25 SEEMS LIKE THERE'S A LACK OF PEOPLE AND RESOURCES. WHAT ARE WE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 DOING TO INCREASE IT? I THINK THAT'S VALUABLE TECHNICAL
2 RESOURCE AT MTC.

3

4 **MATT MALONEY:** YOU'RE RIGHT ON THE MARK. I THINK LOCAL
5 JURISDICTIONS ACROSS THE BOARD ARE STRAPPED. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
6 FINDING. THERE'S JUST TOO MUCH WORK AND THE DEADLINES ARE
7 SUPERTIGHT. WE'RE WORKING BOTH TRYING TO PUT REGION-WIDE
8 PRODUCTS OUT THERE, YOU KNOW, ON HOUSING ELEMENTS. SO ASSIST
9 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WITH THE DATA THEY NEED TO MAKE THE
10 PROCESS SMOOTHER AND MORE EFFICIENT. BUT A LOT OF THIS COMES
11 DOWN TO MONEY GOING DIRECTLY TO THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS FOR
12 SUPPORT. I THINK THAT MORE STAFFING SUPPORT AT THE LOCAL LEVEL
13 COULD GO A LONG WAY. IT IS DIFFICULT, AS YOU'VE SAID, WE'VE
14 SEEN IT FOR CONSULTANTS TO GET BIDS FOR THE WORK. WE'VE TRIED
15 TO MAKE THAT EASIER BY PUTTING TOGETHER SORT OF A REGIONAL
16 BENCH OF CONSULT ASSISTANTS AND TRYING TO MAKE THE PROCESS
17 MORE EFFICIENT YOU KNOW, BUT I THINK MOVING FROM REAP TO REAP
18 2, OBVIOUSLY, WE'VE INCREASED THOSE RESOURCES FIVE TIMES FROM
19 \$20 MILLION TO \$100 MILLION. BUT I THINK WE OUGHT TO KEEP
20 ENCOURAGING THE STATE TO GO BIGGER ON THAT. THE REGIONAL ROLE
21 IN TERMS OF SUPPORTING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON THE ISSUES.
22 THERE'S A NEED OUT THERE.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND I APPRECIATE THAT. WE'RE SITTING
25 IN AN AREA THAT IN 2017 JUST IN THIS AREA, THIS IS MY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 DISTRICT, WE LOST 14-1 HOMES IN THIS NEIGHBORHOOD. WE WERE NOT
2 READY FOR THE COUNTY PERSPECTIVE TO RESPOND TO THE PLAN
3 CHECKS. WE CONTRACTED OUT. AS YOU KNOW, YOU LOSE A LITTLE
4 CONTROL AND LEADS TO MULTIPLE ROUNDS OF COMMENTS AND IT'S
5 DELAYING IT. I THINK THAT'S WHAT MUNICIPALITIES ARE FACING
6 WITH. THERE'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE A BETTER PARTNER WITH LOCAL
7 MUNICIPALITIES. IT'S HELPING TO PRODUCE GETTING HOUSING BUILT
8 QUICKER. THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT MAYBE IN A DIFFERENT
9 DISCUSSION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR RESPONSES PER COMMISSIONER --

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I OWN AN ELECTRIC VEHICLE. AND HAVE BEEN FORTUNATE
12 ENOUGH TO DRIVE ACROSS COUNTRY AND BACK IN MY ELECTRIC
13 VEHICLE. BUT IT'S A TESLA. AND SO, YOU KNOW, THEY HAVE PUT A
14 LOT OF MONEY INTO THE INFRASTRUCTURE, SO YOU CAN DO THAT. AND
15 I CAN'T TELL YOU HOW MANY PEOPLE STOP ME AND SAID, "HOW DID
16 YOU GET YOUR CAR HERE?" IT WAS IN YOSEMITE. I SAID "I DROVE
17 IT" A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE HESITANT TO BUY ELECTRIC CARS BECAUSE
18 THEY DON'T HAVE THE PLACES TO STOP. WE TALK ABOUT REQUIRING
19 NEW DEVELOPMENT WITH CHARGING STATIONS, THINGS LIKE THAT, BUT
20 IT'S THE INFRASTRUCTURE ON THE ROAD. PEOPLE CAN'T BE AFRAID OF
21 DRIVING AND GETTING SOMEWHERE WITHOUT STOPPING. I THINK WE
22 KNOW WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THE INFRASTRUCTURE FROM A, YOU KNOW,
23 WHERE PEOPLE LIVE, BUT WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO, AS WELL. SO I
24 JUST WANTED TO BRING THAT PIECE UP. THE SECOND PIECE ON THE
25 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING, I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS FROM A



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LOCAL PERSPECTIVE, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I KEPT ASKING FOR
2 WITH RENO PROCESS IS WITH ALL THE DENSITY, HOW DO WE DEAL WITH
3 THE TRANSPORTATION? RIGHT. SO, YOU KNOW, WE'RE FACING REDOING
4 OUR HOUSING ELEMENT AND HAVING TO PUT MORE DENSE HOUSING IN
5 AREAS OF NO TRANSIT. AND SO, YOU KNOW, IT'S HARD FOR US TO
6 KEEP SAYING, "WELL, WE'RE WORKING ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE
7 OF THINGS." I THINK ALL THE LOCAL MUNICIPALITIES NEED HELP IN
8 TRYING TO COMMUNICATE WHAT PLANS ARE BEING PUT IN PLACE TO
9 ADDRESS SOME OF THE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS THAT OUR COMMUNITIES
10 ARE GOING TO BE FACING WITH MUCH DENSER HOUSING. I THINK
11 THAT'S AN IMPORTANT ROLE FOR MTC AND, ALSO, THE CCTAS TO PLAY
12 A ROLE IN. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
15 PAPAN.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE ONE OF THOSE CARS, BATTERY
18 ANXIETY, I THINK, IS THE TERM. AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND WE
19 ABSOLUTELY HAVE TO HAVE THIS, PLEASE KEEP IN MIND WHAT THE
20 CONSUMERS IS LOOKING FOR IS SPEED AND CONVENIENCE AND STORAGE.
21 WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT PEAK HOURS AND STUFF, AS WE GO FOR THE
22 PUTTING IN ALL THE INFRASTRUCTURE, IT CAN'T BE AT, LIKE, FIVE
23 MINUTE YOU GET TWO MILES FROM A CHARGE. JUST BECAUSE SOMEBODY
24 GOT FREE ADVERTISING. WE NEED TO TRY TO EMPHASIZE WE'RE GOING
25 TO TRY TO GET EVERYBODY IN ELECTRIC CARS THAT CONVENIENCE HAS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TO BE THERE, TOO. SECONDARILY, ON THE IMPACT OF THE HOUSING,
2 AND WHAT TOUCHED ME IS THAT, YOU KNOW, GOING TO SACRAMENTO, I
3 THINK WHAT WE'RE MISSING HERE IS REALLY THE IMPACT OF THE
4 LEGISLATION. IS IT WORKING? SOME WORKS IN SOME JURISDICTIONS.
5 SOME DOESN'T. I'M DESPERATELY TRYING TO GET THE LOW AND EXTRA
6 LOW HOUSING BUT SB35 IS GIVING A HUGE BONUS TO SOMEBODY. IN MY
7 AREA, IT'S VERY ROUGH WITH THE DENSITY BONUS. I DON'T GET
8 ANYTHING ELSE, AS FAR AS AFFORDABILITY. THE ORIGINAL PROPOSAL
9 OF AFFORDABILITY. SOMEBODY CAME IN 50 UNITS AND SAID WE'RE
10 GOING TO BE AFFORDABLE. THEY STARTED WITH 100 AND WENT TO 10.
11 THEN THEY GOT AN ADDITIONAL 25 ON TOP OF THAT. SO ALL I'M
12 ASKING HERE IS THAT LET'S LOOK AT THE IMPACT OF LOCAL
13 JURISDICTIONS RIGHT NOW. AND A LOT OF CRITICISM COMES FROM WE
14 WHO ARE THROWING OUT THESE REQUIREMENTS, THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
15 DOING THAT DON'T HAVE LOCAL EXPERIENCE. DON'T KNOW WHAT IT
16 TAKES FOR A LOCAL MUNICIPALITY TO PUT THOSE PIECES TOGETHER
17 HERE. IT'S ALMOST LIKE WE SHOULD BE DOING INTERNSHIPS. HCD
18 SHOULD BE WORKING IN THE CITY OR A COUNTY, MTC, AS WELL. BUT,
19 YOU KNOW, PLEASE. EVERYTHING IS GREAT, BUT WORK AS A TEAM!
20 LET'S ALL TRY TO GET THERE TOGETHER WITHOUT BOMBARDING. WE
21 CAN'T GET CONSULTANTS. WE HAVE A JURISDICTION THAT COULD NOT
22 GET THE CONSULTANTS TO FINISH OFF THEIR ELEMENT. IT'S A
23 REALITY. PLEASE, LET'S LOOK AT THE REALITY. LET'S LOOK AT THE
24 EXPERIENCES. LET'S TRY TO EXPAND OUR EXPERIENCES WHEN WE DO
25 ALL OF THESE THINGS. THANK YOU.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I'M OF
3 CONCERN ABOUT THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN OUR REGION AND HCD
4 HAVING DONE THE HOUSING ELEMENT AND UPDATES AND HOW IT'S HARD
5 TO COMMUNICATE TO OUR PUBLIC WHAT THAT PROCESS IS LIKE. IT'S
6 NOT VERY TRANSPARENT. WE'RE THE ONES LEFT WITH A LOCAL IMPACTS
7 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS. GO AHEAD, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** YES, QUICK. A NEW LEGISLATOR MET WITH THE GOVERNOR
10 AND THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICER. HDC, AGAIN, REALITY WISE, THEY'RE
11 CHANGING RULES. AND THE GOVERNOR IS, LIKE, "HEY, THEY DID IT
12 TO ME WHEN I WAS A SUPERVISOR, TOO." SOME OF WHAT THEY'RE
13 DOING IS NOT NECESSARILY BEEN APPROVED BY THE HIERARCHY IN THE
14 GOVERNOR'S OFFICE. AGAIN, WE WANT THIS TO WORK. IT DOESN'T
15 HELP OUR JURISDICTIONS IF YOU CHANGE THE RULES ALONG THE WAY
16 AND KEEP SENDING THESE ELEMENTS BACK. SO IT IS A CONCERN. THE
17 GOVERNOR NOW IS AWARE OF THAT. WE WANT TO WORK TOGETHER. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI.

21

22 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** SO WE HAD ON THE AGENDA A PROJECT AROUND
23 OUR BART STATION 874 UNITS IS WHAT THEY CAME TO US A COUPLE OF
24 YEARS AGO ABOUT. THEY SHOWED UP LAST NIGHT SAYING THEY NEED TO
25 KNOCK OUT 80 UNITS BECAUSE THEY COULDN'T MAKE THE 874 PENCIL.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AS FAR AS THE AFFORDABLE COMPONENT, STARTED AS 24 UNITS
2 DROPPED TO 12 UNITS, THE WAY IT WAS DESIGNED. SO I JUST BRING
3 THAT TO LIGHT BECAUSE WE HAD A RESIDENT GET UP AND SAY, "WHY
4 ARE YOU BUILDING THAT IN? IT'S RIDICULOUS." I HAD TO EXPLAIN,
5 I SAID, "HEY, WE'VE GOT THE RENO NUMBERS TO MEET AND AROUND
6 THE B.A.R.T. STATION IS THE PRIME LOCATION." IT'S AN EXAMPLE
7 OF WHAT WE'RE FACING. WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THE PROJECT
8 BUT I'M SAD IT'S 80 UNITS LESS THAN WE WERE ORIGINALLY
9 ENVISIONING AT THAT PARTICULAR LOCATION. THANK YOU.

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** IT WAS A TEAM EFFORT TO FIGURE OUT HOW IT
12 WORKS. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. AND, YOU KNOW, JUST
13 KIND OF ECHO AND ADD ON TO WHAT FOLKS ARE SAYING. I HEAR A LOT
14 AROUND THE ELECTRIC VEHICLES YOU HAVE. THEY'RE SO COOL. THERE
15 ARE THOSE WHO LIVE IN, YOU KNOW, MORE, YOU KNOW, 15-20 MINUTE
16 COUNTIES. IT'S PRETTY RARE FOR ME TO GET IN THE CAR. MANY OF
17 MY CONSTITUENTS DON'T WANT TO GET IN THEIR CARS, AND SO WE HAD
18 A MEETING LAST WEEK, AND THE ILLUSTRIOUS KATE MILLER MENTIONED
19 KEEPING TRANSIT RELEVANT. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT AS
20 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT DENSIFYING, WHETHER OR NOT, YOU KNOW, YOUR
21 COMMUNITY WANTS IT. THAT SEEMS TO BE WHERE WE'RE GOING. RIGHT.
22 SO THE POINT THAT I'M TRYING TO GET AT HERE IS WE'VE GOT TO DO
23 BOTH. WE HAVE TO WALK AND CHEW GUM AT THE SAME TIME. MAKE SURE
24 THAT THE INFRASTRUCTURE IS THERE FOR THE ELECTRIC VEHICLES, SO
25 YOU CAN GO FROM COAST TO COAST WITH NO PROBLEM WHETHER OR NOT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 YOU HAVE A TESLA. AND YOU CAN GET THERE, WHETHER OR NOT YOU'VE
2 GOT A VEHICLE. AND IT'S GOT TO BE SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE WANT
3 TO DO. I PERSONALLY DON'T WANT TO GET IN MY CAR. AS MUCH AS
4 ALFREDO SAID I WOULD HAVE LOVED THE RIDE OVER. I WOULD HAVE
5 LOVED TO TAKE A BUS. THERE'S PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE A CHOICE.
6 PEOPLE WHO SIMPLY CANNOT MAKE THE CAR WORK FOR THEIR OWN
7 NEEDS. AND SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE FRONT AND CENTER.
8 BECAUSE IT'S NOT, YOU KNOW, THE MAJORITY OF THE PEOPLE ARE --
9 CANNOT DRIVE. CHILDREN, ELDERLY PEOPLE, PEOPLE WITH
10 DISABILITIES NEED US TO MAKE SURE THAT THE TRANSIT IS
11 FOLLOWING ALONG. WE NEED TO BE ADVOCATING IN SACRAMENTO AND
12 BEYOND TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE FUNDING. THAT'S ONE OF THE BIGGEST
13 CONCERNS I HAVE MOVING FORWARD.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER FLEMING. AND I
16 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENT ABOUT THE TRANSIT-DEPENDENT RIDERS. A
17 LOT WE CAN TALK ABOUT RIDERS AND THOSE WHO HAVE AN ABILITY TO
18 USE THOSE. THOSE THAT DON'T IS REAL AND AT THE CORE OF WHAT
19 WE'RE TRYING TO DO. THAT IS TRUE. SO VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.
20 THANKS. THE PLAN WAS LARGELY BUILT IN A PRE AND BEGINNING IN
21 THE COVID AND, OBVIOUSLY, EMERGING FROM COVID, BUT FEELING A
22 LOT OF IMPACT. AND I WAS WONDERING, MATT, WHAT YOU FELT WAS
23 SOME OF THE STRATEGIES THAT WOULD NOW, LIKE EVEN MORE RELEVANT
24 THAT ROSE TO THE TOP OF THINGS THAT YOU THINK WE NEED TO BE
25 FOCUSING OVER IN THE IMMEDIATE TERM TO KIND OF ADDRESS SOME OF



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THESE EMERGING CHALLENGES, BUT WHICH MAYBE, LIKE YOU KNOW,
2 ACCELERATING TRENDS LIKE WE SAW BEFORE LIKE THE FISCAL CLIFF
3 OR OTHER THINGS. I THINK THERE'S A MOMENT TO FOCUS ON THE
4 HIGHEST PRIORITY THINGS WE NEED TO BE FOCUSED ON.

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** SURE. I THINK THE INTERESTING THING ABOUT THE
7 PANDEMIC, IT DIDN'T NECESSARILY CREATE A WHOLE NEW BUNCH OF
8 STRATEGIES THAT WE HADN'T THOUGHT ABOUT BEFORE. SOME THINGS
9 WERE DIFFERENT. I THINK WE'RE THINKING A LOT DIFFERENTLY ABOUT
10 HOW WE DEAL WITH POLICIES AROUND TELECOMMUTING NOW. BUT, YOU
11 KNOW, THINGS LIKE THE PRIORITY SITES PROGRAM AND, YOU KNOW,
12 ACCELERATING THINGS WITH UNDERUTILIZED SITES. THOSE ARE THINGS
13 WE'VE BEEN TALKING ABOUT IN THE PLANNING FIELD FOR DECADES.
14 NOW GIVEN THE PANDEMIC AND THE SHIFTS THAT HAVE OCCURRED, I
15 FEEL LIKE THE CONVERSATION HAS ACCELERATED. AND THERE'S A BIT
16 MORE OF A SENSE OF URGENCY TO GET GOING. AND I THINK THAT'S,
17 YOU KNOW, IT'S ONE EXAMPLE WHERE I THINK WE'RE KIND OF PUTTING
18 SOME MONEY IN INVESTMENT TO THAT. I THINK THAT'S ONE SUPER
19 PROMISING AREA. BECAUSE THERE ARE SOME OF THESE AREAS AROUND
20 THE REGION WHERE, YOU KNOW, PERHAPS WE CAN DO AT LOT OF
21 HOUSING VERY QUICKLY. ONE OF THE OTHER THINGS WE SAW DURING
22 THE PANDEMIC ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE IS THE SHIFT TOWARD
23 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. WE SAW THAT IN A LOT OF OUR
24 COMMUNITIES. FOLKS WERE DOING SLOW STREETS, CHANGING THE USE
25 OF THE CURB, AND FAMILIES WERE GETTING OUT THERE FOR HEALTH



APRIL 26, 2023

1 REASONS OR WHATEVER. AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE, YOU KNOW,
2 A LASTING CHANGE, AS WELL YOU KNOW, I THINK I ANNOY MY STAFF.
3 I'M A BIG BELIEVER IN E BIKES. I THINK WE HAVE SOMETHING THERE
4 WE CAN ACCELERATE. I'M SEEING THEM JUST ANECDOTALLY I'M
5 STARTING TO SEE THEM EVERYWHERE. I THINK, YOU KNOW, INVESTING
6 IN SOME OF THOSE NEW MODES IS IMPORTANT FOR THE COMMISSION.
7 SO, I MEAN, THOSE ARE A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES OF SOME SHIFTS THAT
8 I THINK WE'VE SEEN IN THE PANDEMIC WE CAN DOUBLE DOWN ON
9 MOVING FORWARD IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS. THANKS. I HOPE WE CAN
10 STRATEGIC AND EXPLICIT ABOUT THAT. THERE'S A LOT OF THINGS THE
11 REGION NEEDED. WE PROVIDED A LOT OF, YOU KNOW, MANY STRATEGIES
12 IN PLAN BAY AREA. I THINK THE ATTENTION WE WERE GOING TO
13 DELIVER THEM IN A SHORT PERIOD OF TIME. AND WE KIND OF DECIDED
14 WHAT WE WERE GOING TO WORK ON. AND I HOPE WE CAN KIND OF --
15 YOU CAN HELP US KIND OF UNDERSTAND MAYBE WITH THE SOME DEGREE
16 OF ANTIDOTE AND A CERTAIN DEGREE OF DATA. OKAY, NOW THE
17 SITUATION GIVEN THE CHANGES WE'VE SEEN, ACCELERATION OF SOME
18 OF THE CHANGES, THESE ARE SOME OF THE THINGS WE ACTUALLY RISE
19 UP THE PRIORITY LIST. SORT AS OPPORTUNITIES OR ADDRESS SOME OF
20 THE MAJOR CHALLENGES THAT ARE EMERGING OR GREATER THAN THEY
21 WERE BEFORE.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. DO
24 WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO PROVIDE ANY
25 PUBLIC COMMENT? I DON'T SEE ANY. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 KIMBERLY. WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM TWO ON THE AGENDA. IT'S
2 TRANSPORTATION POLLING RESULTS FOR EMC RESEARCH AND REBECCA
3 LONG WILL PRESENT THE ITEM. IT WAS POLLING CONDUCTED IN LATE
4 MARCH ABOUT GENERAL ISSUES OF TRANSIT, TRANSPORTATION
5 PERSPECTIVES, AS WELL AS INITIAL PUBLIC REACTION TO A
6 POTENTIAL FUNDING MEASURE. AT THIS POINT, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
7 REBECCA LONG.

8

9 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
10 RUTH BERNSTEIN. I'M GUESSING SHE DOESN'T NEED AN INTRODUCTION.
11 SHE AND HER TEAM HAVE DONE POLLING FOR MTC FOR MANY YEARS.
12 POLLING THAT INFORMED REGIONAL MEASURE THREE, AND OTHER
13 MEASURES. THEY HAVE AN AMAZING TRACK RECORD AND LIKELY DONE
14 POLLING FOR MANY OF YOUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND COUNTY
15 MEASURES. I WANTED TO PROVIDE SOME VERY QUICK CONTEXT BEFORE
16 RUTH WALKS THROUGH THIS PRESENTATION. AS YOU CAN SEE, THE
17 TITLE IS THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION SURVEY. AND
18 YOU WILL SEE SOME INFORMATION RELATED TO THE HOUSING BOND
19 HERE. AND PRIMARILY IT WAS FOCUSED ON UNDERSTANDING WHAT
20 VOTERS' PRIORITIES ARE WITH RESPECT TO TRANSPORTATION TO HELP
21 US CONSTRUCT A WINNING MEASURE FOR A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE.
22 WE INTEND TO GO TO THE LEGISLATURE NEXT YEAR TO PURSUE THE
23 ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A FUTURE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, VERY
24 LIKELY, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT OPERATIONS IS, OBVIOUSLY, FRONT AND
25 CENTER. BUT WE DID WANT TO PROBE A BIT MORE AND LEARN ABOUT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 OTHER PRIORITIES. AND REALLY LEARN ABOUT WHAT BAY AREA VOTERS
2 FEEL ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT RIGHT NOW. SO A LOT OF QUESTIONS ARE
3 REALLY ABOUT THAT. HAVING SAID THAT, IT WAS A FAIRLY ROBUST
4 POLL. WE WANTED TO TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY TO GAME WHERE OUR
5 VOTERS ARE AT ON HOUSING BOND, AS WELL. BUT IT'S NOT AN
6 ELECTION VIABILITY POLL. A LOT MORE TO BE DONE ON THAT FRONT.
7 WITH THAT, OVER TO RUTH.

8

9 **RUTH BERNSTEIN:** THANK YOU FOR HAVING US, THANK YOU, REBECCA.
10 I'LL JUMP IN. ALL RIGHT. YOU CAN CHANGE SLIDES. AS REBECCA
11 SAID, WE CONDUCTED A POLL. THIS IS FAIRLY FRESH DATA. IT WAS
12 JUST DONE LAST MARCH -- LAST MONTH, RIGHT, THE END OF MARCH.
13 WE DID 1800 TOTAL RESPONSES. SO IT'S GOT A NICE LOW MARGIN
14 ERROR OVERALL OF 2.3. AS YOU LOOK AT SUB POPULATIONS, IT'S A
15 HIGHER MARGIN OF ERROR. IT WAS REGISTERED VOTERS THROUGHOUT
16 THE NINE COUNTIES. IT'S REPRESENTING THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA
17 AND IT WAS MULTILINGUAL, MULTIMODAL, PRETTY STANDARD AND
18 EXPANSIVE SURVEY. ON THE NEXT SLIDE, SO AS REBECCA SAID, JUST
19 TO NOTE, WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT WE DID HAVE TWO QUESTIONS
20 IN THIS SURVEY FOR -- ABOUT THE TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING,
21 BUT TO EMPHASIS, IT WAS NOT AN IN-DEPTH VIABILITY POLL. WE
22 DIDN'T GO INTO MESSAGING OR WHAT MIGHT HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE.
23 THEY JUST HEARD ONE VERSION OF A HOUSING MEASURE. ONE VERSION
24 OF TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. THOSE WERE RANDOMIZED. AND TO
25 REMIND YOU, IT'S REFLECTIVE OF ATTITUDES TODAY. IT'S 18 MONTHS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 BEFORE ANY ELECTION. YEARS BEFORE POTENTIALLY 2026. AND AS I
2 THINK YOU KNOW, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF FACTORS THAT MIGHT
3 INFLUENCE WHAT COULD HAPPEN, OF COURSE, JUST THE GENERAL
4 ECONOMY, AND WHAT IS HAPPENING IN THE WORLD AND THE ELECTOR
5 REALLY A CLIMATE CAN CHANGE THINGS. ALSO I THINK YOU KNOW
6 THERE IS SOME MOVE TOWARD POTENTIALLY CHANGING AV195 THE
7 LANGUAGE REQUIRED IN A MEASURE. THE TAXPAYER PROTECTION
8 MEASURE THAT MIGHT BE ON THE BALLOT IN 2024, AND THEN THERE'S
9 POTENTIAL MEASURE TO LOWER THE THRESHOLD FOR HOUSING BONDS. SO
10 JUST, YOU KNOW, PUTTING IN THAT CONTEXT. SO THEN STEPPING BACK
11 THE NEXT SLIDE OVERALL WHAT DID WE LEARN FROM THE POLL? WE
12 LEARNED A LOT OF USE -- INTERESTING THINGS ABOUT WHERE VOTERS
13 ARE RIGHT NOW. ONE OVERALL MOOD FAIRLY PESSIMISTIC. NOT
14 FEELING SO GREAT. PROBABLY NOT SURPRISED TO ALL OF YOU IN THE
15 COMMUNITIES AND HEARING FROM THE VOTERS. HOMELESSNESS AND
16 AFFORDABILITY OF HOUSING AND SAFETY IS TOP CONCERNS. THERE'S
17 AWARENESS OF NEED TO ADDRESS HOUSING WITH MORE FUNDING. WE DID
18 SEE THE MEASURES WE TESTED FELL SHORT OF TWO-THIRDS THRESHOLD.
19 OVERWHELMINGLY THE BIG TAKE AWAYS IS THAT CLEARLY PEOPLE
20 BELIEVE THAT TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT FOR THE BAY AREA. THEY'RE
21 NOT ALL TAKING IT BUT THEY BELIEVE IT'S IMPORTANT. BUT THE
22 CURRENT SYSTEM DOESN'T GET GREAT RATINGS. RIGHT. SOME OF THE
23 REASONS PEOPLE AREN'T TAKING IT IS BECAUSE THEY DON'T THINK
24 IT'S CONVENIENT. THEY DON'T THINK IT'S FAST ENOUGH, AND THEY
25 DON'T THINK -- THEY DON'T FEEL SAFE. WE'LL SHOW YOU ALL OF



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THOSE NUMBERS. AND BUT, YOU KNOW, SOME PEOPLE ARE COMMUTING.
2 THEY MIGHT NOT BE COMMUTING EVERY DAY. 6% ARE COMMUTING ON
3 RIDING TRANSIT DAILY. AND WE HAVE ANOTHER 21% TOTAL SAY
4 THEY'RE TAKING TRANSIT AT LEAST ONCE A WEEK. BUT AS YOU'LL
5 SEE, THERE'S DEFINITELY BEEN PEOPLE ARE REPORTING THEY'VE
6 DECLINED -- THEY'VE CUT DOWN ON HOW MUCH THEY'RE TAKING IT
7 SINCE COVID. ON THE NEXT PAGE, GO FORWARD TWO PAGES. THE
8 OVERALL ATTITUDE IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW HOW ARE THINGS
9 GOING? DO YOU THINK THINGS ARE GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION OR
10 ON THE WRONG TRACK? OVER HALF, 54% THINK THE BAY AREA IS OFF
11 ON THE WRONG TRACK. WE DO SEE OPTIMISM MIGHT BE UP A LITTLE AT
12 39% SAYING RIGHT DIRECTION. WE STILL HAVE MORE PEOPLE FEELING
13 PESSIMISTIC THAN OPTIMISTIC. ON THE NEXT PAGE, "WHAT IS THE
14 MOST IMPORTANT PROBLEM IN THE BAY AREA TODAY" HOMELESSNESS
15 COMES TO THE TOP. 24% MENTIONING HOMELESSNESS. AGAIN, I DON'T
16 THINK THAT'S A SURPRISE TO ANY OF YOU IN THIS ROOM. AND THEN
17 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY IS RIGHT UNDERNEATH THAT AT 20%. CRIME
18 16%. THEN WE SEE INFLATION, JOBS IN THE ECONOMY, TRAFFIC, AND
19 TRAFFIC ONLY 5%. IF YOU LOOK AT WE'VE PUT A LITTLE BOX THERE
20 COMPARISON TO 2019. BEFORE COVID, A POLL WE DID FOR THE BAY
21 AREA COUNCIL, YOU'LL NOTICE THERE THAT TRAFFIC AND ROADS WAS
22 THE NUMBER TWO RESPONSE AT 18%. NOW IT'S ONLY 5%. THAT IS A
23 BIG DIFFERENCE. AND AT THE TIME, ONLY 2% WERE MENTIONING
24 CRIME. NOW IT'S 16%. SO DEFINITELY A DIFFERENCE THERE. THE
25 PREVIOUS QUESTION WAS OPEN-ENDED AND WE ASKED SPECIFIC



APRIL 26, 2023

1 QUESTIONS AND HOW CONCERNED YOU ARE ABOUT EACH OF THE ISSUES.
2 WE SEE A LOT OF CONCERN ABOUT EVERYTHING. HOMELESSNESS WITH
3 60% AT THE TOP EXTREMELY CONCERNED. AFFORDABILITY HOUSING UP
4 THERE. PUBLIC SAFETY VERY HIGH, AS WELL, AND THEN WE SEE
5 DEFINITELY CONCERN BUT THE INTENSITY DROP OFF FOR STREETS AND
6 ROADS, CLIMATE CHANGE, THE ECONOMY, TRAFFIC, AND WE SEE THE
7 OVERALL QUALITY OF THE PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE HAVE A MAJORITY THAT
8 SAY THEY'RE SOMEWHAT CONCERNED BUT THE INTENSITY IS VERY LOW
9 THERE. ON THE NEXT PAGE, BRIEFLY ON HOUSING -- GO AHEAD TO THE
10 NEXT ONE. WE ASKED ABOUT THE AWARENESS OF NEEDS. DO YOU THINK
11 THERE'S A NEED FOR MORE MONEY TO ADDRESS HOUSING
12 AFFORDABILITY? WE HAVE 69% SAY THERE'S AT LEAST SOME NEED. AND
13 NOTED THAT THE INTENSITY HERE, 49% SAYING THERE'S A GREAT NEED
14 FOR MORE MONEY TO ADDRESS HOUSING AFFORDABILITY. AND THEN ON
15 THE NEXT PAGE, THIS IS WHERE WE DID ASK A BALLOT QUESTION. WE
16 DIVIDED 900 OF THE RESPONDENTS HEARD ONE VERSION OF A
17 QUESTION. THE FULL DETAILS IS ON THE LEFT. THAT INCLUDED ALL
18 THE REQUIREMENTS THAT AV195 REQUIRES, INCLUDING THE AMOUNT OF
19 THE LEVY. ON THE OTHER SIDE, WE DON'T INCLUDE ALL THAT DETAIL.
20 WE DON'T INCLUDE THE AMOUNT. YOU CAN SEE HERE ON THE FULL
21 DETAIL, THE SUPPORT IS AT 58%. IT'S ABOVE 55 BUT NOT AT TWO-
22 THIRDS. THEN NOT INCLUDING ALL THE DETAIL, IT GETS, ACTUALLY
23 ALMOST TO TWO-THIRDS AT 65%. DEPENDING ON HOW IT'S WORDED,
24 SUPPORT IS ABOVE A MAJORITY BUT NOT QUITE AT THAT TWO-THIRDS.
25 ON THE NEXT PAGE, SHOWING SOME POLLING THAT HAS BEEN DONE BY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE ADVOCACY GROUPS. OVER THE YEARS ASKING ABOUT A HOUSING
2 BOND MEASURE. WE'VE SEEN DEPENDING ON HOW IT'S BEEN WORDED.
3 DEPENDING ON THE TIME OF THE POLL, IT HAS FLUCTUATED IN THAT
4 SAME LEVEL OF ABOVE 55%, BUT SOMETIMES GETTING PRETTY CLOSE TO
5 TWO-THIRDS, BUT KIND OF IN THAT WINDOW BETWEEN 55% AND TWO-
6 THIRDS. SIMILAR TO WHERE THE MEASURE OF SUPPORT IS TODAY AND
7 KIND OF NOT SOLIDLY AT TWO-THIRDS BUT DEFINITELY ABOVE A
8 MAJORITY. [INAUDIBLE] THEY DID. WE DID SEE THAT SUPPORT WAS
9 HIGHER PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC. ALL RIGHT. QUICKLY AND YOU HAVE
10 THIS IN YOUR PACKET. I'M NOT GOING TO READ ALL THE NUMBERS.
11 IT'S SOME OF THE DEMOGRAPHICS ON THE TWO POLL QUESTIONS ABOUT
12 HOUSING BOND. WE SEE SUPPORT AMONG WOMEN A LITTLE HIGHER THAN
13 SUPPORT AMONG MEN, REGARDLESS OF WHICH VERSION THEY HEARD.
14 YOUNGER PEOPLE MORE SUPPORTIVE THAN THOSE WHO ARE OLDER. ON
15 THE NEXT PAGE, DEMOCRATS MORE SUPPORTIVE THAN REPUBLICANS. AND
16 RENTERS MORE SUPPORTIVE OF A MEASURE THAN HOMEOWNERS. THAT'S
17 PRETTY CONSISTENT, VERY, VERY CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE'VE BEEN
18 SEEING IN POLLING ON HOUSING MEASURES. ON THE NEXT PAGE BY
19 GEOGRAPHY, REMEMBER, THERE IS A MARGIN OF ERROR ON THESE THAT
20 RANGES UP TO 11.5% FOR THE SMALLEST JURISDICTIONS. BUT WE SEE
21 INCONSISTENT DEPENDING ON THE AREA AND, ALSO, THE LANGUAGE OF
22 WHAT THEY HEARD. SO, YOU KNOW, A REAL DIFFERENCE IN CONTRA
23 COSTA, DEPENDING ON WHICH VERSION THEY HEARD. PRETTY
24 CONSISTENT IN SAN FRANCISCO. HIGHER SUPPORT, HIGHER MARIN,
25 SONOMA A LITTLE HIGHER. MOVING INTO TRANSPORTATION. LET'S STEP



APRIL 26, 2023

1 BACK AND THINK ABOUT HOW ARE PEOPLE USING TRANSIT AND
2 TRANSPORTATION. SO WE ASKED ABOUT USE OF PUBLIC TRANSIT. ABOUT
3 HOW FREQUENTLY THEY'RE RIDING TRANSIT. ARE THEY RIDING FIVE OR
4 MORE TIMES A WEEK? AT LEAST ONCE A WEEK, ONCE A MONTH? WHAT
5 WE SEE IS SELF-REPORTED THAT 6% SAY THEY'RE TAKING TRANSIT,
6 SOME FORM OF PUBLIC TRANSIT FIVE OR MORE DAYS A WEEK
7 REGULARLY. WE HAVE 15% THAT SAID THEY'RE TAKING IT AT LEAST
8 ONCE A WEEK. WE'RE CALLING THOSE FREQUENT THE WEEKLY RIDERS
9 21%. THE OCCASIONAL RIDERS, MONTHLY, LESS THAN MONTHLY, THAT'S
10 OVER HALF. AND THEN 20% PUT THEMSELVES IN THE "I NEVER TAKE
11 TRANSIT." SO AS WE GO FORWARD, YOU'LL SEE SOME OF THE CROSS
12 TABS. ON THE NEXT PAGE, WE ASK, WELL, ALL RIGHT, WHAT
13 TRANSPORTATION DO YOU USE? AT LEAST ONCE A WEEK. THEY COULD
14 HAVE SAID ALL OF THEM. DRIVE AND TAKE B.A.R.T. WE SEE 79% AT
15 LEAST ONCE A WEEK ARE DRIVING ALONE IN A CAR. 47% DO SAY
16 THEY'RE DRIVING WITH OTHER PEOPLE IN A CAR. IT MIGHT MEAN
17 TAKING YOUR KIDS TO SCHOOL. IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY MEAN CAR
18 POOLING OFFICIALLY TO WORK. AND WALKING 16% SAID THEY'RE
19 TAKING BUS OR LIGHT RAIL. 13% SAID THEY'RE TAKING B.A.R.T. AT
20 LEAST ONCE A WEEK. AND YOU CAN SEE HOW IT SPREADS OUT. AND
21 THEN WE ALSO DID A FOLLOW UP QUESTION ASKING "WHAT IS YOUR
22 PRIMARY MODE OF TRANSPORTATION?" OVERWHELMINGLY IT'S DRIVING.
23 80% IS THE PRIMARY MODE OF TRANSPORTATION. ONLY 5% SAYING BUS
24 OR LIGHT RAIL. 2% B.A.R.T. IS THE PRIMARY MODE OF
25 TRANSPORTATION. THE NEXT PAGE GETTING A LITTLE INTO -- IT'S



APRIL 26, 2023

1 ASKING HOW FREQUENTLY DO THEY GO ANYWHERE? BECAUSE SOME OF THE
2 REASON WE THINK TRANSIT USE IS DOWN BECAUSE PEOPLE AREN'T
3 GOING ANYWHERE. ASKING HOW FREQUENTLY DO YOU MAKE A PHYSICAL
4 COMMUTE TO WORK, SCHOOL, OR OTHER REGULAR DESTINATION? ONLY
5 54% SAID THEY'RE DOING IT THREE OR MORE TIMES A WEEK. THAT'S A
6 LOT. THAT'S HALF OF THE BAY AREA. BUT 54% ARE DOING IT THREE
7 OR MORE TIMES A WEEK. 17% DOING IT ONE OR TWO DAYS A WEEK.
8 THEY'RE GOING ANYWHERE REGULARLY. AND THE REST IT'S EVEN MORE
9 INFREQUENT THAN THAT. AND A THIRD SAID THEY ARE WORKING OR
10 ATTENDING SCHOOL REMOTELY THREE OR MORE DAYS A WEEK. SO SOME
11 OF THIS IS JUST NOT PEOPLE AREN'T MOVING AROUND AS MUCH. AND
12 TRAVELING, WE ASKED HOW OFTEN DO YOU GO TO, LIKE, A SPORT
13 EVENT OR OCCASION. YOU CAN SEE MOST PEOPLE ARE NOT DOING IT
14 VERY FREQUENTLY. WE ASKED ABOUT WHAT THEY'RE DOING COMPARED
15 PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC. THIS IS MARE MEMORY. WE ASKED "BEFORE
16 THE PANDEMIC, ARE YOU MAKING PHYSICAL COMMUTE TRIPS? ABOUT THE
17 SAME, LESS FREQUENTLY, OR MORE FREQUENTLY THAN BEFORE." AND
18 39% SAID THEY ARE COMMUTING REGULAR COMMUTING LESS OFTEN THAN
19 BEFORE. WE THEN ASKED EVERYONE A FOLLOW UP QUESTION, "DO YOU
20 THINK WHAT YOU'RE DOING RIGHT NOW IS GOING TO CHANGE IN THE
21 NEXT FEW MONTHS?" 72% SAID IT'S NOT GOING TO CHANGE. THEY'RE
22 ALREADY THE NEW NORMAL IS NOW. IT IS NORMAL FOR THEM. 19% SAY
23 THEY WILL LIKELY DO THINGS MORE -- WILL COMMUTE MORE
24 FREQUENTLY. 8% SAID LESS FREQUENTLY. SO THE NET IS SOME
25 INCREASE IN MORE MOVEMENT BUT MOST PEOPLE ARE ALREADY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 OPERATING IN THEIR NEW NORMAL. THIS IS WHAT THEY'RE DOING. ALL
2 RIGHT. ON THE NEXT MOVING FORWARD. THANK YOU. ON THE
3 IMPORTANCE OF PUBLIC TRANSIT. ATTITUDES ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT.
4 WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN THE NEXT PAGES IS THE NUMBERS THAT SHOW
5 HOW IMPORTANT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS TO BAY AREA VOTERS. SO HOW
6 IMPORTANT IS TRANSIT FOR THE BAY AREA? 51% RATED A 7 ON A 1-
7 TO-7 SCALE. 81% SAID IT'S IMPORTANT. THAT'S TRUE FOR THOSE WHO
8 RIDE TRANSIT AND THOSE WHO DON'T. SO EVEN NONRIDERS, THE
9 PEOPLE WHO DON'T RIDE AT ALL, 69% SAID THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS
10 IMPORTANT FOR THE BAY AREA. FOR THOSE WHO RIDE WEEKLY, NO
11 SURPRISE 96% SAID IT'S IMPORTANT. PEOPLE WANT TRANSIT. ON THE
12 NEXT PAGE, THIS IS WE MAPPED THE RESPONSES IN THE SURVEY. HOW
13 IMPORTANT IS IT AND JUST PUT ON A SCALE AND YOU CAN SEE HERE A
14 LOT -- IT'S GREEN EVERYWHERE. RIGHT. SO THIS ISN'T JUST SAN
15 FRANCISCO SAYING THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT OR THE
16 B.A.R.T. CORRIDOR. IT'S ALL OVER THE BAY AREA SAYING THAT
17 TRANSIT IS PUBLIC TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT. ON THE NEXT PAGE,
18 THESE WERE FORCED CHOICES. SO PAIRS. WHICH IS CLOSER TO
19 OPINION. WE NEED TO MAINTAIN THE PUBLIC TRANSIT SERVICE TO
20 MAKE SURE IT'S THERE FOR PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON IT OR REDUCE
21 PUBLIC TRANSIT NOW THAT FEWER PEOPLE ARE TAKING IT. 87% SAID
22 WE NEED TO MAINTAIN IT. ON THE NEXT ONE, HAVING HIGH QUALITY,
23 RELIABLE PUBLIC TRANSIT BENEFITS EVERYONE. EVEN PEOPLE WHO
24 DON'T RIDE IT 79% VERSUS 18% SAYING IT'S ONLY BENEFITING THOSE
25 THAT RIDE IT. AND THEN 74% SAYING WE NEED TO INVEST IN REAL



APRIL 26, 2023

1 IMPROVEMENTS IN PUBLIC TRANSIT TO MAKE IT A BETTER OPTION FOR
2 MORE PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA INSTEAD OF DRIVING. 74% BELIEVE
3 THAT VERSUS 22% SAYING WE SHOULD JUST GIVE UP. WE SHOULD STOP
4 TRYING TO IMPROVE OUR SYSTEM. AS YOU SEE ON THE NEXT PAGE,
5 DESPITE THAT EVERYONE BELIEVES THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS
6 IMPORTANT, THEY DON'T LOVE PUBLIC TRANSIT HERE. SO JUST FIRST
7 QUESTION, DO YOU HAVE A FAVORABLE OR UNFAVORABLE OPINION OF
8 PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. 43% UNFAVORABLE. 55%
9 FAVORABLE. IT'S A MAJORITY BUT QUITE A LOT OF DISSATISFACTION.
10 AND AMONG THOSE WHO RIDE, PRETTY STRONG. 73% FAVORABLE. ALL
11 THOUGH IT'S NOT INTENSE. IT'S 33% STRONGLY FAVORABLE.
12 OCCASIONAL RIDERS VERY DIVIDED. 52/47 AND NONRIDERS NEGATIVE
13 50% SAYING THEY'RE UNFAVORABLE. ON THE NEXT PAGE, WE BREAK IT
14 DOWN AND SEE THE SPECIFIC AREAS. THE BLUE IS DO YOU THINK THIS
15 DESCRIBES PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA? THE RED IS DOESN'T
16 DESCRIBE IT. THE TOP EASY TO USE. THAT'S WHERE WE GET ALMOST A
17 MAJORITY 49% SAYING EASY TO USE DESCRIBES PUBLIC TRANSIT IN
18 THE BAY AREA. 29% DON'T DESCRIBE. IT'S POSITIVE BUT IT'S STILL
19 NOT OVERWHELMING. RELIABLE, 47% SAID IT'S AT LEAST SOMEWHAT
20 RELIABLE. AFFORDABLE AND CONVENIENT. NOW 40% SAYING IT'S NOT
21 CONVENIENT COMPARED TO 37% SAY IT IS. FAST IS AT NEGATIVE. AND
22 SAFE 30% SAYING IT'S SAFE. 48% SAYING IT'S NOT. YOU CAN SEE
23 BROKEN DOWN THE AREAS WHERE WE SEE THERE'S CONCERN. THE NEXT
24 PAGE WE DID MAPPING FUN WITH THE DATA. THIS IS THE NUMBERS ON
25 THE PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA IS CONVENIENT. WE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 DEFINITELY SEE HIGHER GREEN, WHICH IS THE CONVENIENT RATINGS
2 IN THE MORE URBAN AREAS WHERE THERE IS MORE TRANSIT. SO SAN
3 FRANCISCO YOU KNOW, OAKLAND, BERKLEY, CORRIDOR. A LOT OF AREAS
4 WHERE NOW IT'S SAYING IT'S NOT AS CONVENIENT. ON THE NEXT
5 PAGE, THIS IS THE BREAK DOWN OF THE ATTRIBUTES. EASY TO USE,
6 RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE. AMONG THOSE WHO ARE THE FREQUENT RIDERS,
7 OCCASIONAL RIDERS, AND NONRIDERS. WE DO SEE HIGHER RATINGS
8 AMONG THOSE TAKING TRANSIT MORE FREQUENTLY AND LOWER RATINGS
9 AMONG THOSE WHO ARE NONRIDERS, AND SOME OF THE NONRIDERS GIVE
10 A LOT OF "DON'T KNOW" HERE BUT EVEN AMONG THOSE WHO ARE
11 FREQUENT RIDERS, THE "EASY TO USE" IS PRETTY GOOD. "RELIABLE"
12 IS 69%. ON THE NEXT PAGE CONVENIENT IS WHERE WE SEE NOW THOSE
13 WHO ARE NOT RIDING, ESPECIALLY EVEN THOSE OCCASIONALLY RIDING
14 WE SEE HIGHER ON "DOES NOT DESCRIBE" CONVENIENCE. FAST, WE SEE
15 QUITE A FEW DISAGREE. SAFE WE ALSO SEE FAIRLY HIGH "DOES NOT
16 DESCRIBE" ON SAFE. EVEN AMONG THOSE WHO RIDE FREQUENTLY. 40%
17 SAYING THEY'RE SAFE AND 38% THINKING THAT TRANSIT IS NOT SAFE.
18 YOU CAN SEE THE AREAS WHERE PEOPLE ARE LOOKING FOR
19 IMPROVEMENT, CONVENIENCE, SPEED, SAFETY. ON PERCEPTION OF
20 NEED. WE ASKED ABOUT HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. SO ABOUT
21 TRANSPORTATION, DO YOU THINK THERE'S A NEED FOR MORE MONEY TO
22 ADDRESS TRANSIT? WE SEE 62% SAYING THERE IS AT LEAST SOME
23 NEED. ONLY 31% SAYING THERE'S A GREAT NEED. AND THEN
24 TRANSPORTATION 65% SAYING THERE'S A NEED. ONLY 29% GREAT NEED.
25 SO REMEMBER THAT HOUSING IT WAS AT 51% GREAT NEED. SO HIGHER



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AWARENESS ON HOUSING THAN ON TRANSPORTATION. ON THE NEXT PAGE,
2 JUST BREAKING IT DOWN BY THOSE WHO USE TRANSPORTATION OR USE
3 TRANSIT VERSUS THOSE WHO DON'T. THOSE WHO TAKE TRANSIT ARE
4 MORE AWARE OF THE NEED FOR MORE FLEMING. THOSE WHO DON'T TAKE
5 TRANSITION SIT ARE LESS AWARE OF THE NEED. ON THE NEXT PAGE,
6 ALL RIGHT. MOVING FORWARD. A TRANSPORTATION HOUSING MEASURE.
7 WE SPLIT IT SO 900 HEARD ONE VERSION AND THE00 HEARD THE OTHER
8 VERSION. HALF INCLUDED TRANSIT ONLY. AND THE OTHER HALF HEARD
9 TRANSIT AND OTHER PROJECTS LIKE POTHOLE REPAIR. SO BEING A BIG
10 ONE RIGHT NOW. POTHOLE REPAIR, ADDING CAR POOL LANES WAS IN
11 THE TRANSIT PLUS TRANSPORTATION. AS YOU CAN SEE HERE, 59% FOR
12 SUPPORT FOR THE TRANSIT ONLY. 63% FOR TRANSIT PLUS
13 TRANSPORTATION. AGAIN, BOTH OVER 50%. BUT NOT AT THE TWO-
14 THIRDS LEVEL THAT WOULD BE NEEDED RIGHT NOW FOR APPROVAL. NEXT
15 PAGE SHOWING YOU PRIOR TO COVID IN 2019, IN THE OTHER WORLD WE
16 LIVED IN, WE DID -- THERE WAS A POLL THAT WAS DONE BY THE
17 SALES TAX AND AT THAT POINT IT WAS 67%. IT DOESN'T MEAN WILL
18 OR WON'T NECESSARILY IN THE FUTURE. IT SHOWS, AS WE KNOW, WERE
19 DIFFERENT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. AND THE DEMOGRAPHICS HERE.
20 THOSE WHO RIDE FREQUENTLY THAN THOSE WHO ARE NOT RIDING
21 FREQUENTLY. ON THE NEXT PAGE, NOT A HUGE DIFFERENCE ON GENDER,
22 BUT DEFINITELY ON AGE. YOUNGER VOTERS ARE MORE SUPPORTIVE OF A
23 MEASURE THAN THOSE OLDER. DEMOCRATS MORE SUPPORTIVE THAN
24 REPUBLICANS. RENTERS MORE SUPPORTIVE THAN HOMEOWNERS. PRETTY
25 FAIRLY STANDARD TO WHAT WE'VE SEEN IN OTHER POLLING. BY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 GEOGRAPHY, AGAIN, DIFFERENT SUPPORT LEVELS IN DIFFERENT PARTS
2 OF THE BAY AREA WITH HIGHER SUPPORT IN THE SMALLER COUNTIES OF
3 MARIN. HIGHER SUPPORT IN SAN FRANCISCO WITH A LOT OF TRANSIT
4 USERS. ALAMEDA, AS WELL, AND LOWER SUPPORT IN SOME OF THE
5 OTHER REGIONS. WE ASKED ABOUT A NUMBER OF TRANSPORTATION
6 IMPROVEMENTS. SO THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT POTENTIAL
7 PRIORITIES FOR FUTURE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT. SO EVEN
8 THOUGH VOTERS ARE SAYING "I'M NOT SO KEEN -- A LOT OF VOTERS
9 ARE SAYING I'M NOT SURE I WANT TO RAISE TAXES." THEY THING
10 EVERYTHING IS IMPORTANT TO INVEST IN. ALL THE INVESTMENTS ARE
11 IMPORTANT. ESPECIALLY WE SEE, WELL, POTHOLES COMES TO THE TOP.
12 MAINTAINING LOCAL ROADS AND FIXING POTHOLES 76% VERY
13 IMPORTANT. AND THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT ALWAYS IS TRUE. AFTER SIX
14 MONTHS OF HEAVY RAIN YOU KNOW, IT'S REALLY NOT SURPRISING. AND
15 THEN WHAT WE SEE NEXT IS IMPROVEMENTS IS KIND OF WHAT REALLY
16 RISES TO THE TOP. MAKING B.A.R.T., TRAINS, FERRIES, BUSES,
17 RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE, AND CONNECTED. 66% SAID VERY IMPORTANT.
18 IMPROVED PUBLIC TRANSIT A SEAMLESS TRANSIT NETWORK WITH
19 COORDINATING ROUTES AND SCHEDULES, AND IMPROVED PUBLIC TRANSIT
20 CONNECTING THOSE ARE TO THE TOP. ALL ARE A LITTLE BIT HIGHER
21 THAN AVOIDING CUTS. SO AVOIDING CUTS DOESN'T GET ME SOMETHING
22 NEW. AND WE ALREADY SEE THAT VOTERS ARE SAYING I'M NOT SO
23 SATISFIED WITH WHAT I HAVE NOW. SO WHAT THEY WANT IS SOMETHING
24 THAT IS IMPROVED. AND BETTER. AND THEN WE DO SEE MORE FREQUENT
25 PUBLIC TRANSIT WAIT TIMES, EXPANDING B.A.R.T., BUILDING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SIDEWALKS, BIKE LANES, PROTECTING OUR TRANSPORTATION NETWORK
2 FROM SEA LEVEL RISE, IMPROVE TRANSIT FOR EVERYDAY TRIPS. ALL
3 OF THOSE HAVE, YOU KNOW, AT LEAST -- ALMOST HALF SAYING
4 THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT. ONLY THE LAST ONE CONVERTING SELECT
5 VEHICLE LANES INTO DEDICATED LANES FOR BUSES AND CAR POOLS,
6 EVEN THAT GETS A MAJORITY SAYING IT'S IMPORTANT JUST LESS
7 INTENSITY. THAT'S FAIRLY SPECIFIC. WE SPENT SOME TIME LOOKING
8 AHEAD AT PEOPLE'S ATTITUDES ABOUT TRANSIT AND WHEN THEY MIGHT
9 TAKE IT. WE SEE, ACTUALLY, A LOT OF RECEPTIVITY TO TAKING
10 PUBLIC TRANSIT AT SOME POINT. WE ASKED "DO YOU CONSIDER PUBLIC
11 TRANSIT AN OPTION IN EACH OF THESE INSTANCES?" 84% SAID THEY
12 CONSIDER TRANSIT OR WOULD CONSIDER TRANSIT TO A SUPPORTING
13 EVENT OR CONCERT. GOING SOMEWHERE WITH LIMITED PARKING 84%
14 WOULD CONSIDER TRANSIT TO BE AN OPTION. COMMUTING 55% SAID
15 THEY WOULD CONSIDER IT. MAKING TRIPS DURING THE DAYTIME, 60%
16 SAID THEY WOULD CONSIDER. THEN YOU GO TO THE BOTTOM, MAKING
17 TRIPS AT NIGHT, ONLY 32% SAID THEY WOULD CONSIDER
18 TRANSPORTATION. WE ALREADY SAW THAT SAFETY IS A CONCERN. SO WE
19 DO SEE DEFINITELY INTEREST IN TAKING TRANSIT, BUT NOT IN ALL
20 CASES. AND THEN ON THE NEXT PAGES, I'M NOT GOING TO READ ALL
21 THIS. WE DID NOTICE A LITTLE BIT OF TYPO HERE. JUST ON THE
22 OCCASIONAL RIDERS. ALL THE BLUE IS CORRECT. WHAT WE SEE IS
23 THAT IF TRANSIT SERVICE WERE IMPROVED, I CAN SEE MYSELF TAKING
24 PUBLIC TRANSIT MORE OFTEN IN THE FUTURE. HIGH AGREEMENT WITH
25 THAT. I WOULD RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT MORE IF IT WAS CLEANER AND



APRIL 26, 2023

1 FELT SAFER TO RIDE. ALSO HIGH AGREEMENT WITH THAT. AND THEN
2 THE HESITANCY WHERE WE'RE SEEING HESITANCY IS TAKING PUBLIC
3 TRANSIT IS LESS CONVENIENT THAN DRIVING FOR MOST OF MY
4 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS. HIGH AGREEMENT WITH THAT. WE SEE
5 DISAGREEMENT WITH NOTHING WILL MAKE ME WANT TO TAKE PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT MORE THAN I DO. MOST PEOPLE DISAGREE. THERE'S
7 RECEPTIVITY TO THE IDEA OF PUBLIC TRANSIT, RIGHT NOW PEOPLE
8 ARE FEELING LIKE EITHER THEY'RE NOT GOING ANYWHERE OR IT'S NOT
9 CONVENIENT, SAFE, OR FAST ENOUGH. AND THE LAST PAGE HERE
10 OVERALL BARRIERS, WE DID SAY WHAT KEEPS YOU FROM TAKE, PUBLIC
11 TRANSIT MORE OFTEN. CONVENIENCE IS THE MOST COMMON RESPONSE.
12 WITH 20% BUT 18% SAY SOMETHING ABOUT CRIME OR FEELING SAFETY
13 ISSUES. AND THEN SERVICE, COMMUTE TIMES, PREFERENCE,
14 RELIABILITY OF SERVICE YOU KNOW, RELIABILITY AND SPEED AND
15 THOSE ARE RELATED TO CONVENIENCE. SO A NUMBER OF RESPONSES
16 HERE ABOUT WHY THEY'RE NOT. IT'S CONSISTENT WITH THE OTHER
17 QUESTIONS IN THIS SURVEY. I THINK THAT IS THE END. I CAN
18 ANSWER QUESTIONS.

19
20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT'S A LOT OF INFORMATION TO DIGEST.
21 YEAH. [APPLAUSE]

22
23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND, COMMISSIONERS, YOU KNOW, WE'LL
24 HAVE AN ITEM AFTER THIS THAT WE'LL TALK ABOUT 2024 FOR HOUSING
25 AND BEYOND. SO KIND OF THINK ABOUT THAT SIDE FOR A SECOND.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TOMORROW WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT TRANSPORTATION AND SOME OF
2 THE QUICK THINGS WE CAN DO BUT SOME OF THE LONGER TERM
3 OBJECTIVES. SO KIND OF HOLD THAT THOUGHT, AS WELL. BUT FOR
4 TODAY, YOU KNOW, JUST SOME OF MY INITIAL THOUGHTS. IT WOULD BE
5 GREAT IF WE CAN DO IT ALL. I THINK THE FACT IS, WE'RE SEEING
6 SOME DATA THAT SHOWS WE CANNOT DO IT ALL. FOR THAT REASON, YOU
7 KNOW, I DO SEE THIS REAFFIRMING THE COMMITMENT WE'VE HAD AT
8 LOOKING AT 2024 AS IT RELATES FOR HOUSING AND WHEN IT MEANS.
9 WE'LL TALK ABOUT THAT IN A MINUTE. BUT THAT JUST REAFFIRMED
10 FOR ME IN TERMS OF THE ISSUES WE SEE WITH HOMELESSNESS, ISSUES
11 WE SEE WITH HOUSING. I'M NOT SURPRISED POTHOLES ARE WHERE THEY
12 ARE AND BEFORE THE RAINS. SO IT DOES CONCERN ME FOR ALL OF US.
13 SOME OF THE INITIAL THOUGHTS IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, NICK AND I
14 WERE TALKING ABOUT, THE INTERESTING FACT OF THOSE THAT ARE
15 USING TRANSIT HAVE A BETTER OPINION THAN THOSE NOT USING
16 TRANSIT. AND WE CAN TALK ABOUT THAT FOR HOURS. RIGHT. WHICH
17 WE'RE NOT. THAT WAS AN INTERESTING THING. AND, YOU KNOW, NICK
18 SAID WAS, LIKE, HOW DO YOU PENETRATE THOSE WHO ARE USING IT
19 THAT HAVE A GOOD UTILITY TO GET MORE UTILITY OUT OF IT. THAT'S
20 AN INTERESTING COMMENT. I'M ALSO THINKING ABOUT THOSE THAT ARE
21 NOT USING TRANSIT THAT HAVE THE PERCEPTION OF WHY THEY'RE NOT
22 USING IT. AND IT MAY NOT BE A FUNCTION OF MONEY. WE NEED TO
23 TRY TO UNCOVER THAT. AND I'M INTERESTED IN THAT. AND, YOU
24 KNOW, JIM AND I WERE COMMUTING THIS MORNING TO SAN FRANCISCO
25 AND GOT TRAFFIC. I WAS WONDERING HOW MANY OF THOSE FOLKS IN



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THOSE CARS ARE USING PUBLIC TRANSIT BEFORE. WHY ARE THEY NOT?
2 SO THERE'S SO MANY THINGS THAT WE HAVE TO REALLY UNPACK, WHICH
3 I THINK TOMORROW WE'LL TAKE A DEEPER DIVE INTO. BUT JUST SORT
4 OF THINKING ABOUT SOME OF THOSE POINTS. THAT'S WHAT I'M
5 GLEANING FROM THE POLL. THERE'S A LOT THERE. RIGHT. BUT
6 THERE'S THINGS WE NEED TO FOCUS ON TODAY AND FOR ME, JUST THE
7 FACT THAT WE'VE WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT HOUSING. IT IS A CRISIS.
8 POLLING SHOWS THERE'S A PATHWAY FORWARD. IT'S NOT EASY. IT
9 WON'T BE EASY. THAT WAS REASSURING TO SEE. THOSE ARE SOME OF
10 MY INITIAL REACTIONS. BUT ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE, THIS WAS
11 NOT INTENDED TO TAKE A DEEP DIVE TO IDENTIFY HOW TO DO THAT.
12 THERE'S SOME INTERESTING TAKE AWAYS, PERSONALLY, FROM WHAT I
13 SAW. YOU TEND TO DO A GREAT JOB. THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR. THANK
14 YOU. THANK YOU. I THINK THIS IS VERY, VERY HELPFUL. AND, YOU
15 KNOW, I THINK I HAD -- I INTERPRETED THE RESULTS IN A SIMILAR
16 WAY TO CHAIR PEDROZA. I THINK IT REAFFIRMS OUR COMMITMENT TO
17 MOVE FORWARD WITH THE HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024. IT'S CLEARLY
18 MASSIVELY TOP OF MIND FOR VOTERS IN TERMS OF THE PRIORITIES
19 THAT THEY HAVE. ON BOTH HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS. MORE SO THAN
20 EVER. AND THERE'S A REAL DESIRE BY VOTERS TO SEE MORE
21 INVESTMENT. NOW AS CHAIR SAID, THE POLL DOESN'T SHOW IT'S
22 GOING TO BE A SLAM DUNK, BUT -- YOU MUST NOT EXPECT IT TO BE
23 THE CASE. AND, YOU KNOW, AS A SMALL JEWISH GUY, I USUALLY
24 DON'T DO SLAM DUNKS. [LAUGHTER] SO MAYBE SOME OF YOU FEEL
25 SIMILARLY. I DO THINK IT IS, YOU KNOW, IT DOES SORT OF MAKE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 REAFFIRM MY COMMITMENT TO WANTING TO MOVE FORWARD ON THAT. AND
2 TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE IN 2026.
3 SIMILARLY UNDERSTANDING THE CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE GOING TO
4 HAVE TO KIND OF, YOU KNOW, PUT TOGETHER A REALLY COMPELLING
5 VISION AND PLAN AND GO OUT AND CONVINCE THE VOTERS ABOUT THAT.
6 I THINK THAT'S DEFINITELY SCOPE TO DO THAT. I THINK, YOU KNOW,
7 I THINK THIS ALSO IS A GREAT INITIAL SORT OF GUIDE TO HELP US
8 THINK ABOUT WHAT WE NEED TO DO. ASIDE FROM REVENUE RAISING
9 AROUND KIND OF SOME OF THE THINGS WE NEED TO FOCUS ON AROUND
10 TRANSIT AND TRANSIT RECOVERY. IT REMINDS ME EVERYBODY WHO
11 LIVES OUTSIDE OF SAN FRANCISCO THINKS SAN FRANCISCO IS MUCH
12 WORST THAN IT IS. THE FURTHER YOU GET AWAY FROM SAN FRANCISCO,
13 THE MORE PEOPLE THINK IT'S HELL HOLE. AND I DON'T KNOW I'M
14 DOING FINE. NOT QUITE DOING FINE BUT BETTER THAN SOME MIGHT
15 THINK. AND SO I DO THINK WE NEED TO REALLY SORT OF USE THIS TO
16 INFORM HOW WE THINK ABOUT TRANSIT RECOVERY. AND, ALSO, KIND OF
17 GO ONE STEP DEEPER AND MATCH THIS UP WITH WHO WE THINK ARE THE
18 POTENTIAL NEW TRANSIT RIDERS. BECAUSE OUR GOAL IS EVEN IN OUR
19 MOST ASPIRATIONAL PLAN BAY AREA DOCUMENT, THE GOAL IS NOT TO
20 GET EVERYBODY RIDING TRANSIT ALL THE TIME. IT'S TO GET, YOU
21 KNOW, 50 -- 20 -- ABOUT 25% OF THE REGION RIDING TRANSIT. AND
22 SO IF WE CAN KIND OF REALLY UNDERSTAND WHO WE THINK ARE THE
23 PEOPLE WHO ARE MOST LIKELY TO BE THE NEXT MILLION RIDERS,
24 LET'S SAY, TO GENERATE THE NEXT MILLION TRIPS UNDERSTAND WHAT
25 THEIR MAIN CONCERNS ARE. WHAT WOULD GET THEM ON TRANSIT. I



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THINK WE CAN DEVELOP A POWERFUL STRATEGY AROUND THAT. AND I
2 THINK THIS POLL DOESN'T TELL US THAT, BUT IT POINTS US INTO
3 SORT OF THE DIRECTION OF WHAT ARE THE QUESTIONS WE NEED TO BE
4 ASKING. EVEN ON SOMETHING AS, LIKE, SAFETY, I'M SURE -- WE'VE
5 TALKED A LITTLE ABOUT THAT IN OTHER CONTEXTS, I'M SURE IF WE
6 WENT AROUND THE TABLE, EVERYBODY WOULD HAVE A DIFFERENT VISION
7 OF WHAT IT MEANS TO BE SAFE. AND WOULD HAVE DIFFERENT SORT OF
8 INTERVENTIONS THEY WOULD HOPE FROM PUT ASKING OTHER PEOPLE TO
9 PUT ON A MASK, LIGHTS TO THE BUS STOPS AT NIGHT, TO, ET.
10 CETERA, ET. CETERA. SO I THINK THIS KIND OF POINTS US IN A
11 BUNCH OF REALLY INTERESTING DIRECTIONS THAT WE NEED TO KIND OF
12 DRILL DOWN ON FURTHER. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER --

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THE DEEPER DIVE IS CONVENIENCE. I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S
17 FIRST MILE OR LAST MILE ISSUE OR TIMING ISSUE. THERE SEEMS, I
18 MEAN, SAFETY IS PUT YOUR HANDS AROUND VASE ASPECTS OF SAFETY
19 BUT CONVENIENCE, I THINK, IS ONE THAT IS HARDER TO IDENTIFY
20 WHAT THAT CONVENIENCE PROBLEM IS. SO THAT'S SOMETHING BEING
21 THE TOP OF THE LIST THAT CONCERNS. TAKE A DEEPER DIVE INTO
22 THAT TO UNDERSTAND THAT BETTER. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. TO THE VICE CHAIR'S POINT, THIS IS NOT
25 A VIABILITY POLL. AND I THINK WE HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO ON THAT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 FRONT. AND SAFETY AROUND THE ROOM. WE HAVE A LOT OF WOMEN
2 HERE. WE CAN DEFINE THAT QUITE EASILY FOR YOU. IT'S VERY
3 IMPORTANT. AND I THINK WE NEED TO POINT OUT THE NEXT ELECTION
4 IS LESS THAN A YEAR AWAY. NOT 18 MONTHS. WE'VE GOT A MARCH
5 PRIMARY COMING UP. SO SOME OF US ARE VERY INTERESTED IN ALL OF
6 THIS. BUT I THINK THIS REALLY POINTS OUT WHAT WE'VE BEEN
7 SAYING FOR A LONG TIME AS FAR AS ABSOLUTELY THE NEED FOR
8 HOUSING AND THE NEED FOR TRANSPORTATION. AND I REALLY HOPE
9 THAT TODAY WE CAN DEFINE WHAT THAT MEANS AND SEND A CLEAR
10 MESSAGE OUT THERE AS TO WE UNDERSTAND WHAT THE EXPECTATIONS
11 ARE. WE ARE GOING TO HELP OUR OPERATORS GET THERE. BECAUSE
12 THAT'S WHAT IS GOING TO TAKE TO GET PEOPLE BACK ON TRANSIT.
13 AND EVERY OPERATOR IS DIFFERENT. I KNOW CALTRAIN, THEY'RE
14 HURTING ON THEIR OPERATIONAL COSTS, BUT TO RAISE COSTS AND
15 LOWER SERVICE IS NOT THE WAY TO GO. REALLY LOWERING JUST
16 ALMOST MAKING AS LOW AS YOU CAN TO GET PEOPLE BACK ON TRANSIT,
17 I THINK IT'S THINKING OUTSIDE THE BOX HERE. WE DON'T HAVE ALL
18 THAT. I'M SURE WE'LL GET INTO THAT FUN STUFF, BUT THIS IS
19 EXTREMELY INTERESTING, AS WE GUIDE FORWARD HERE. I DON'T THINK
20 IT'S, YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT A CONCLUSION HERE. WE HAVE AT LOT OF
21 THINGS TO STUDY AND GO FORWARD. I'M A LITTLE CONFUSED, TOO, I
22 THOUGHT SENATOR WEINER NOW HAS TRANSPORTATION BILL. SO WE CAN
23 CLEAR ALL THIS UP. IS IT GOING TO BE TRANSPORTATION FIRST?
24 HOUSING FIRST? I'M HEARING ALL DIFFERENT ELEMENTS HERE. I LOOK
25 FORWARD TO GETTING ALL THE INFORMATION. THANK YOU.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. WE HAVE
3 TO DECIDE AS A COMMISSION WHAT WE'RE SUPPORTING. THERE ARE
4 OTHER FOLKS THAT MIGHT DECIDE TO DO OTHER THINGS. IN TERMS OF
5 OUR PRIORITIES, I THINK FINDING CONSENSUS AMONG OUR OURSELVES
6 IS PRIORITY NUMBER ONE. YOU BRING UP A GREAT POINT, I THINK
7 TOMORROW WE'LL TAKE A DEEPER DIVE ON THE INITIATIVES WE'RE
8 TAKING ON. IT MAY SEEM LIKE THERE'S NO REAL OUTCOMES JUST YET,
9 BUT THEY ARE IN MOTION. IT'S TO YOUR POINT OF GRAPPLING THE
10 QUICK WINS. WHAT CAN WE DO NOW? AND TOMORROW, I THINK, WILL BE
11 VERY POIGNANT TO THAT DISCUSSION. THAT THINGS ARE IN MOTION,
12 BUT WHAT ELSE CAN WE DO, AS WELL. NOT EVERYTHING CAN WAIT.
13 THERE HAS TO BE SOME QUICKER WINS. I LOOK FORWARD TO
14 TOMORROW'S DISCUSSION. SO THAT MIC IS IN THE MIDDLE BETWEEN
15 VICTORIA. ALL RIGHT. A TEAM APPROACH. I LIKE IT. COMMISSIONER
16 FLEMING.

17

18 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU. MAY NOT MAKING LAY-UPS, I DID
19 VICE CHAIR, YOU CAN BALANCE YOUR CELL PHONE ON A BANANA. [
20 LAUGHTER] THAT'S A WIN. ANYTHING IS POSSIBLE IN NAPA. HE
21 MIGHT SURPRISE YOU.

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** SO I PUT MY LIGHT ON BECAUSE THE THING, AS,
24 YOU KNOW, I'M A SOCIAL SCIENTIST. AND THE THING THAT WE LEARN
25 IS THAT BEHAVIOR PROCEEDS ATTITUDES. PEOPLE WHO LIKE RUNNING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 ARE MORE LIKELY TO SAY THEY LIKE IT AND IN SUPPORT OF IT. I
2 DON'T RUN AND IT SOUNDS AWFUL. BUT OTHER PEOPLE FEEL
3 DIFFERENTLY. AND SO WHAT I WANT TO KNOW, AND DRILL DOWN ON,
4 ARE THE FOLKS WHO ARE IN SUPPORT OF TRANSIT RIDERS HAVING GOOD
5 EXPERIENCE OF FINDING IT CONVENIENT, ARE THE FOLKS LIVING IN
6 AREAS WHERE IT'S TRANSIT RICH? OR ARE THEY PEOPLE WHO ARE JUST
7 DIE HARD PHILOSOPHICALLY COMMITTED TO THE EXPERIENCE? AND THEN
8 I WANT TO TAG ON TO WHAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN MENTIONED AROUND
9 NOT DECREASING RIDERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES. IN THE NORTH BAY WE
10 SAW THE BIGGEST DAY EVER, WE HAD A FREE RIDERSHIP DAY. I
11 BELIEVE IT WAS AROUND ROSA PARKS. I'M SURE MANY OF Y'ALL HAD A
12 SIMILAR EXPERIENCE. IF YOU MAKE IT FREE AND FREQUENT YOU KNOW,
13 PEOPLE ARE COMING BACK. AND DRASTICALLY LOWERED THE COST. I'M
14 NOT TRYING TO GET INTO SOLUTIONS. THERE'S A CORRELATION, FOR
15 SURE ON THAT. I WANT TO KNOW WHAT IS ENTICING TO PEOPLE WHO
16 ARE DOING IT TO SAY THEY LIKE TO DO IT. WHAT IS THAT
17 RELATIONSHIP ABOUT? CONVENIENCE? RIDERSHIP DENSITY AND
18 DIFFERENT OPTIONS OF CONNECTIVITY? OR IS THERE SOME OTHER
19 FACTOR GOING ON?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I ALSO WAS ENCOURAGED BY THE HOUSING NUMBER. NOT
22 DISCOURAGED IT'S NOT AT TWO-THIRDS. IN OAKLAND WE HAD THE
23 EXPERIENCE WHERE RIGHT AT THE NO-GO LEVEL WHEN VOTERS WERE
24 GRUMPIER AT OUR LAST ELECTION, OUR HOUSING AND INFRASTRUCTURE
25 BOND MEASURE WAS POLLING ONLY AT 62%. AND THE VERY BRAVE CITY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 COUNCIL DECIDED TO PUT IT ON THE BALLOT ANYWAY. IT PASSED WITH
2 75.33% OF THE VOTE! SO A GOOD CAMPAIGN CAN DEFINITELY OVERCOME
3 WHAT FEELS LIKE A LITTLE BIT OF A SCARY OR ON THE BUBBLE
4 PREPOLLING. SO THAT IS CERTAINLY SOMETHING WE'VE EXPERIENCED.
5 AND I KNOW THERE IS SOME OTHER EXAMPLES, AS WELL. I'M NOT
6 GOING TO BE HERE TOMORROW, BUT I'LL PUT THIS IN THE HOPPER
7 WHEN I LOOK AT THE TRANSIT POLLING. I'M LOOKING AT SLIDE -- 18
8 ON MY ATTACHMENT. AND I'M CURIOUS IF ANYONE IN THE RESEARCH
9 WORLD HAS DUG INTO WHY THERE IS NOW A LARGER SHARE OF PEOPLE
10 WHO TAKE RIDESHARE THAN TAKE BUSES OR B.A.R.T. OR TRAINS OR
11 FERRIES. IF THERE ISN'T, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT QUALITY AND SAFETY
12 AND CONVENIENCE, BECAUSE CLEARLY THIS IS NOT A COST ISSUE.
13 RIGHT. IT'S LIKELY MORE EXPENSIVE. WHAT IS THERE FOR US TO
14 LEARN FROM THAT STATISTIC? BECAUSE THAT ACTUALLY SURPRISED ME.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GREAT COMMENTS. COMMISSIONERS, LET ME
17 GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I'M JERRY GLAZER. I'M ON YOUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
20 NOW FOR ONE YEAR. RELATIVELY NEW PERSON. AND I'M A SENIOR REP.
21 YOU CAN TELL. BUT MY REAL INTEREST IS IN ENVIRONMENTAL. THAT
22 WAS THE REASON I VOLUNTEERED, IN THE FIRST PLACE. TO WORK ON
23 ENVIRONMENTAL IN SONOMA COUNTY NOW. I USED TO BE IN SANTA
24 CLARA COUNTY. 70% OF OUR EMISSIONS ARE TRANSPORTATION. SO I
25 KEEP LOOKING AT ALL THE DIFFERENT PIECES WE HAVE HERE. IF



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WE'RE GOING TO ASK FOR MONEY FOR OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, THEN WE
2 HAVE TO TELL PEOPLE THIS IS WHERE WE'RE GOING. THIS IS HOW
3 WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE. THE DETAILS DO MAKE A DIFFERENCE. I
4 WAS TOLD FOR MEASURE M IN SNOW THAT COUNTY, A LOT OF DETAILS
5 WERE PUT IN PLACE. IT HELPED SELL MEASURE M. I CAME BACK FROM
6 NEW YORK, EVERYBODY IS ON TRANSIT IN NEW YORK. I GOT MY METRO
7 CARD AND WENT FROM POINT A TO POINT B. AND I WAS THERE ON THE
8 WEEKEND. SO I HAD TO WAIT 10 FULL MINUTES FOR A SUBWAY TO COME
9 BY. IN SONOMA COUNTY, I HAVE ONE HOUR HEADWAY ON SMART. ON THE
10 BUS THE EXPRESS, I HAD A HALF HOUR IN THE MORNING, AND FOUR-
11 HOUR HEADWAY IF I WANT TO COME BACK. STARTING IN THE MORNING.
12 BECAUSE I CAN'T GO BACKWARDS. OUR MAJOR PROBLEM IS
13 CONVENIENCE. AND YOU SEE IT IN THE SURVEY. AND, ACTUALLY, I
14 THINK -- I ONLY HAVE TWO MINUTES. ONE SOLUTION THAT I WOULD
15 LOOK AT IS THIS, WE HAVE 27 TRANSIT DISTRICTS. YOU CAN'T SOLVE
16 A PROBLEM -- I WAS SYSTEM DESIGNER FOR MOST OF MY CAREER. YOU
17 CAN'T SOLVE A PROBLEM WITH 27 DIFFERENT ELEMENTS. THE THING WE
18 SHOULD BE DOING BETWEEN NOW AND 2026, IS IDENTIFYING HOW WE
19 WILL GET OUR 27 TRANSIT DISTRICTS TO FUNCTION LIKE ONE OR TO
20 BECOME JUST ONE. MERGE THE MARKETING, MERGE THE
21 ADMINISTRATION, MERGE MAINTENANCE. THAT'S GOING TO BE
22 IMPORTANT WITH EVS. I'VE BEEN AN EV DRIVER SINCE 1998. I ALSO
23 BUILT ELECT BUSES FOR PART OF MY CAREER. THESE ARE THE KIND OF
24 THINGS. DON'T WORRY ABOUT THE ELECTRICITY. PG & E AND THE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 D.O.T., ET. CETERA, ARE GOING TO TAKE CARE OF THAT. [LAUGHTER
2]

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I'M THRILLED TO HEAR THAT HEAR. I'M COFOUNDER FOR
5 VOICES FOR FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHICH IS A REGIONAL
6 ORGANIZATION. 100 PLUS MEMBERS MADE UP OF LABOR, ENVIRONMENT,
7 DISABLED ADVOCATES, STUDENTS, YOU NAME IT. I'M THRILLED TO SEE
8 THIS POLL. I'M THRILLED -- I'M VERY OPTIMISTIC WITH IT. I
9 THOUGHT IT WOULD BE WORSE, TO BE HONEST. AS A TRANSIT
10 ADVOCATE, AND I HAVE A COUPLE OF POINTS ON THE ACTUAL POLL.
11 AND THE FIRST IS I THINK SOMEONE BROUGHT UP, THE 69% WHO DON'T
12 RIDE TRANSIT AND SAY IT'S IMPORTANT. I WOULD LIKE TO DELVE
13 INTO THAT. I THINK IT'S AN INTERESTING DATA POINT THAT I WOULD
14 LIKE TO UNDERSTAND BETTER. THE SECOND THING, AND SEVERAL OF
15 YOU BROUGHT IT UP BEFORE ME. AND I APPRECIATE THAT. THE
16 FAVORABILITY. I HAD MY CHILDREN IN PUBLIC SCHOOL. MAYBE YOU
17 DID, TOO. AND I FOUND THE PEOPLE WHO DID NOT HAVE THEIR
18 CHILDREN IN PUBLIC SCHOOL DID NOT LIKE PUBLIC SCHOOL! AND SO I
19 THINK THERE'S A REAL, YOU KNOW, AS SOME OF YOU HAVE POINTED
20 OUT BEFORE, THOSE WHO KNOW IT, ARE LESS AFRAID OF IT AND HAVE
21 A HIGHER, YOU KNOW, ABILITY TO UNDERSTAND IT. HOW DO WE
22 OVERCOME THAT, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT VERY
23 INTERESTED IN THIS FRAMING OF CONVENIENCE. IT'S NOT GENERALLY
24 HOW WE TALK ABOUT TRANSIT. I WOULD LOVE TO UNDERSTAND HOW YOU
25 DEFINED IT TO THE FOLKS YOU WENT OUT AND POLLED. AND, ALSO,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 UNDERSTAND HOW IT FITS SERVICE AND FREQUENCY AND ALL THESE
2 THINGS THAT WE CARE. FIRST AND LAST MILE, ALL THE THINGS WE
3 CARE DEEPLY ABOUT. SO MAYBE THAT'S A SIDE BAR CONVERSATION I
4 WOULD LOVE TO HAVE WITH YOU. SIMILARLY TRANSIT AND
5 TRANSPORTATION, MOST NONTRANSIT FOLKS DON'T KNOW THE
6 DIFFERENCE. I'M CURIOUS HOW YOU DEFINED IT TO NONTRANSIT
7 FOLKS. AND THEN LOOKING FORWARD TO TALKING TO YOU ABOUT
8 FRAMING THINGS IN TERMS OF THE RIDER FIRST. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS. I SERVE ON THE POLICY
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPRESENTING HERE MYSELF AND, ALSO, SEAMLESS
12 BAY AREA AMONGST A NUMBER OF GROUPS THAT SENT IN A LETTER WITH
13 SEVERAL GROUPS THAT PARTICIPATE IN VOICES FOR TRANSPORTATION -
14 - AND, ALSO, FEELING BOLSTERED HERE BY THE FACT THAT SO MANY
15 PEOPLE SUPPORT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND, ALSO, GETTING THAT
16 STRONG MESSAGE THAT PEOPLE WANT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION TO BE
17 BETTER. THIS WAS SOMETHING THAT REALLY THE COMMISSIONERS FROM
18 THE CONVERSATION THIS MORNING IN TALKING ABOUT THE STATE
19 FUNDING CAMPAIGN, WANTING TO HAVE MTC AND THE AGENCIES WORK
20 TOGETHER TO MAKE THE IMPROVEMENTS BECAUSE PEOPLE -- THE POLL
21 SHOWS THAT PEOPLE WHO DON'T USE TRANSIT WANT TO USE IT MORE,
22 AND THE PEOPLE WHO USE IT MORE SUPPORT IT MORE. SO THERE IS A
23 VIRTUOUS CYCLE FROM DOING ALL THE THINGS THAT ARE IN THE
24 CURRENT PLANS AND COULD BUILD ON THE CURRENT PLANS TO MAKE
25 TRANSIT BETTER. SPEAKING OF PLANS, GIVEN THE -- POLLING AND



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE HIGH VALUE THAT PEOPLE ARE PUTTING ON HOUSING, AND THE
2 NEED FOR THAT CAMPAIGN FOR THE STATE FUNDING, I THINK IT WOULD
3 BE VERY IMPORTANT FOR THE PEOPLE IN THIS ROOM WHO HAVE
4 RELATIONSHIPS WITH OUR STATE LEGISLATORS TO PUSH AND ADVOCATE
5 FOR THE STATE FUNDING THAT CAN HELP CARRY THROUGH THE
6 DEVELOPING THE PLAN AND THE CAMPAIGN. THAT INVESTING IN
7 TRANSIT WILL MAKE IT BETTER SO WE CAN HAVE A PLAN, PASS A
8 CAMPAIGN, PASS A MEASURE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS ZACK, I'M THE POLICY
11 DIRECTOR AT TRANSFORM AND MEMBER OF MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY
12 COUNCIL. IT'S A PLEASURE TO BE IN PERSON WITH YOU IN NAPA THIS
13 AFTERNOON. I WOULD BE REMISS IF I DIDN'T MENTION THE CONCERNS
14 OF CHRISTINE FITZGERALD WHO VOICED THIS IS NOT ADEQUATELY
15 ASSESSABLE FOR THOSE WHO WANT TO PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC
16 PROCESS. TRANSFORM PROMOTES LIVABLE, WALKABLE, AND ASSESSABLE
17 COMMUNITIES WITH AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION FOR ALL.
18 WE'RE A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR UNPUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AS WELL
19 AS BAHA, THE BAY AREA HOUSING COALITION WORKING ON A REGIONAL
20 HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024. WE WERE THRILLED TO SEE 80% OF THE
21 RESPONDENTS UNDERSTAND THE SUPPORT OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
22 AND NOT SURPRISED TO SEE THAT HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS REMAINS
23 A TOP CONCERN. GIVEN THE RESULTS OF THIS POLL, AND
24 CONVERSATIONS WE'VE HAD WITH OUR PARTNERS, WE AGREE WITH IT
25 AND SUPPORT THE DIRECTION MTC IS CURRENTLY TAKING TOWARDS A



APRIL 26, 2023

1 2024 HOUSING MEASURE. AND 2026 OR 2028 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
2 MEASURE. PURSUING AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION AROUND
3 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE NEXT YEAR, AND LOOKING TOWARDS 2026 AND
4 BEYOND ALLOWS US TO BUILD FURTHER CONFIDENCE WITH VOTERS, AND
5 SAFETY AND CONVENIENCE THAT WE SAW ARE IMPORTANT TO BUILDING
6 PUBLIC SUPPORT. AND ALLOWS US TO BUILD CONSENSUS AMONG
7 OPERATORS AND ADVOCATES ON THE FUNDING SOURCES AND
8 EXPENDITURES OF SUCH A REGIONAL MEASURE. PARTICULARLY
9 TRANSFORM WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE PROGRESSIVE SOURCES BEING
10 PROPOSED RATHER THAN THE SALES TAX PROFFERED IN THE POLL. BUT,
11 ALSO, OPERATIONS EXPENDITURES THAT PRIORITIZE THE NEEDS OF
12 SAFETY AND COMMUNITY OF RIDERS AS WELL AS TRANSIT PRIORITY. WE
13 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING YOU BOTH ON PASSING HOUSING AND
14 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE IN THE COMING YEARS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THE LETTER HAS BEEN POSTED TO ONLINE AGENDA.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. I DON'T SEE ANY MEMBERS OF
19 THE PUBLIC. ANY FINAL THOUGHTS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS?
20 QUESTIONS? AND THE NEXT ITEM, WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT, YOU
21 KNOW, WHAT THE HORIZON LOOKS LIKE FOR 2024. COMMISSIONER
22 GIACOPII.

23

24 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I WAS WONDERING WHAT EXTENT PEOPLE ARE
25 STILL CONCERNED ABOUT COVID.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** WE DID NOT ASK THAT SPECIFICALLY IN THIS POLL.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. SO, ALL RIGHT.

5

6 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT'S SOMETHING
7 TO CONSIDER, ESPECIALLY AMONG THE ELDERLY AND DISABLED
8 POPULATION. I DON'T THINK THAT IT'S OVER FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE.
9 AND I THINK THAT THERE'S A GREATER AWARENESS OF GERMS AND HOW
10 TO KEEP YOURSELF SAFE. AND I THINK THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO
11 HAVE SPECIAL NEEDS AND ELDERLY ARE PERMANENTLY MAYBE CHANGING
12 THEIR BEHAVIORS.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. AND I KNOW
15 THE NEXT ITEM WE'LL TALK ABOUT 2024 MEASURE. ONE THING YOU
16 KNOW, AS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HOUSING, I THINK ABOUT OUR
17 PARTNERS AND WHAT THE PARTNERS ARE DOING. I THINK IT'S GOING
18 TO BE -- WE TALK ABOUT THE PARTNERS WITH ALL THESE OTHER
19 HOUSING DOING A LOT OF WORK ON THE GROUND LEVEL. BUT IN TERMS
20 OF TRANSPORTATION, WE'RE NOT WALKING BACK FROM A COMMITMENT. I
21 WANT TO CLEAR. WE TALK ABOUT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,
22 NETWORK MANAGEMENT. WE'RE ALL IN ON MAKING THOSE IMPROVEMENTS
23 WE NEED TO MAKE. THE QUESTION IS HOW DO WE DO THAT IN AN
24 ORDERLY WAY WITH THE RESOURCES WE HAVE AND NEW OPPORTUNITIES
25 PRESENTED BEFORE US. WE'LL GET INTO THE SPECIFICS TOMORROW, IN



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TERMS OF HOW DO WE MAKE SURE WE MOVE FORWARD ON THE THINGS
2 WE'VE BEEN TALKING ABOUT. SO, AT THIS POINT, RUTH, THANK YOU
3 FOR PROVIDING US WITH SO MUCH INFORMATION RIGHT AFTER LUNCH.
4 NOT THAT WE'RE PARALYZED BY INFORMATION. THERE'S SO MUCH DATA
5 THAT CAN GO IN SO MANY DIFFERENT WAYS. COMMISSIONERS, AGAIN,
6 THE NEXT ITEM IS PREPARING FOR 2024 REGIONAL AFFORDABLE
7 HOUSING BOND. WE'RE A LITTLE BIT AHEAD OF SCHEDULE. WE'LL TAKE
8 A QUICK BREAK. STRETCH OUR LEGS. WE'LL COME BACK AT 3:30. THEN
9 WE'LL COMMENCE OUR NEXT ITEM. ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE'RE READY
10 TO GET STARTED AGAIN. I FEEL THE FOLKS ON THIS SIDE HAVE A
11 BETTER VIEW THAN THE FOLKS ON THIS SIDE. THERE MIGHT BE SOME
12 TRADING. I DIDN'T SEE THE SPECIFIC DETAILS. I LOOKED THROUGH
13 THE WINDOWS AND SEE SOME GREAT GREENERY OVER THERE. YEAH. ALL
14 RIGHT. I APPRECIATE EVERYONE HERE FROM THE PUBLIC. WE HAVE ONE
15 MORE ITEM BEFORE WE HEAD INTO THE RECEPTION. IT'S BEEN
16 PROMISED SUPPORTING GREAT WINES TO SHARE WITH YOU ALL. ON ITEM
17 THREE, PREPARING FOR 2024 REGIONAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND.
18 THE NEXT ITEM KATE HARTLEY WILL REVIEW THE RECENT ACTIVITIES
19 TO PREPARE FOR HOUSING BALLOT MEASURE, INCLUDING THE PREVIOUS
20 DISCUSSION WE TALKED ABOUT. AND I'LL SAY, KATE, THANK YOU FOR
21 EVERYTHING YOU'VE DONE. YOU'VE PROVIDED SOME GREAT
22 PRESENTATIONS ON SOME OF THE THINGS WE'RE DOING. WE NEED TO DO
23 MORE. IT'S ALSO TO ACKNOWLEDGMENT WE'RE DOING A LOT ALREADY.
24 BUT THE NEED IS SO GREAT THAT IT'S CHALLENGING US TO DO MORE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LOOKING AHEAD. SO, AT THIS POINT, I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO
2 KATE AND PROVIDE A PRESENTATION ON THE BOND OF 2024.

3

4 **KATE HARTLEY:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. GOOD AFTERNOON,
5 COMMISSIONERS. I'M PLEASED TO BE HERE TO TALK ABOUT HOUSING
6 AND TALK ABOUT OUR PREPARATIONS FOR 2024 REGIONAL BOND. AND
7 ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF EVERYTHING WE'VE HEARD TODAY, AND THE
8 IMPORTANCE OF HOUSING TO OUR REGION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I
9 DON'T THINK ANYONE IN THE MEETING NEEDS A REMINDER OR ANY
10 GUIDANCE ON WHY HOUSING IS SO IMPORTANT. FIRST OF ALL,
11 HOMELESSNESS. OUR HOMELESS COUNT BETWEEN 2019 AND 2022 WENT
12 UP. IT'S A DEFINING FEATURE OF OUR TIME. A DEFINING ISSUE OF
13 OUR TIME FOR AN AFFLUENT COUNTRY AND AFFLUENT STATE. IN
14 ADDITION TO THE 37,000 UNHOUSED PEOPLE IN OUR REGION, THERE'S
15 HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF MORE AT RISK HOMELESSNESS, 2 MILLION
16 BAY AREA RENTERS ARE RENT BURDENED, AND WE HAVE TO ACKNOWLEDGE
17 THAT HOMELESSNESS IS A HOUSING PROBLEM. WE HAVEN'T BUILT
18 ENOUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR A VERY LONG TIME. NEXT SLIDE,
19 PLEASE. THE RECENT POLLING RESULTS, AS RUTH SHOWED US ALL,
20 CONFIRMED THAT VOTERS CARE MOST ABOUT HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY
21 AND HOMELESSNESS. NEXT SLIDE. AND WE, AS A REGION, HAVE NOT
22 DONE A GOOD JOB MEETING THE NEEDS OF OUR RESIDENTS, THEIR
23 HOUSING NEEDS IN ISOLATION. THAT'S COUNTY BY COUNTY, OR CITY
24 BY CITY. WITH A REGIONAL BOND, WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO
25 SOMETHING DIFFERENT. WITH A REGIONAL BOND MEASURE, EVERY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SINGLE PART OF THE REGION GETS RESOURCES THAT THEY NEED. IN
2 ADDITION WITH REGIONAL FUNDING, WE CAN START TO IMPLEMENT
3 PROGRAMS THAT REDUCE SOME OF THE REGULATORY BURDEN THAT DRIVES
4 COSTS UP, AND SLOWS DOWN OUR HOUSING DELIVERY. AND WE, AS A
5 REGION TOGETHER, COMING TOGETHER, CAN CREATE PARTNERSHIPS AND
6 COLLABORATIONS WHERE WE DELIVER HOUSING BETTER AND MORE
7 EFFICIENTLY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WHAT IS IN PLACE? WE'RE IN
8 GREAT SHAPE. WE HAVE THE ENABLING LEGISLATION. PLANNING FOR
9 THIS MEASURE HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR MANY YEARS NOW. SINCE
10 BEFORE 2019, ACTUALLY. AND SO THERE IS STRONG SUPPORT OUT
11 THERE. THERE'S A STRONG COALITION OF PEOPLE WHO WANT THIS TO
12 HAPPEN. THERE'S A STRONG CAMPAIGN SYSTEM IN PLACE. WE HAVE
13 VOTER SUPPORT. AGAIN, IT'S THE TOP MOST CONCERN OF OUR VOTERS.
14 AND WE HAVE AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING PIPELINE OF ABOUT 33,000
15 AFFORDABLE HOMES THAT WITH FUNDING ARE READY TO GO. SO WE CAN
16 TAKE FUNDING THAT WE HAVE AND DEPLOY IT EFFECTIVELY. AND,
17 ALSO, VERY IMPORTANTLY FOR THIS CONVERSATION, THERE IS AN
18 IMPORTANT COMPLIMENTARY EFFORT UNDERWAY BY HOUSING
19 STAKEHOLDERS UP-AND-DOWN THE STATE, AND THAT IS TO AMEND THE
20 STATE CONSTITUTION TO LOWER THE VOTER THRESHOLD FOR BONDS, FOR
21 AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO MAJORITY FROM TWO-THIRDS. THAT EFFORT IS
22 CRITICAL AND THAT EFFORT COULD MAKE A HUGE DIFFERENCE FOR US
23 AND FOR EVERY OTHER COMMUNITY IN THE STATE THAT NEEDS MORE
24 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND MOST COMMUNITIES DO. NEXT SLIDE. SO,
25 AGAIN, THIS IS SOMETHING DIFFERENT. THIS IS SOMETHING NEW.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 NEVER BEFORE HAVE WE COME TOGETHER AS A REGION IN THIS WAY
2 WHERE EVERY SINGLE COMMUNITY HAS AN UNPRECEDENTED AMOUNT OF
3 FUNDS. WE CAN DO THIS TOGETHER, IF WE HAVE THE RESOURCES ALL
4 OF US. NOT JUST SOME CITIES AND SOME COUNTIES. SO THIS GIVES A
5 BRIEF SNAPSHOT OF WHAT IS NEXT. WE WILL BE BEFORE YOU BRINGING
6 OUR FUNDING PROGRAM AND EQUITY FRAMEWORK FOR APPROVALS. BUT
7 THIS SUMMER WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO YOU FOR GUIDANCE ABOUT
8 SOME OF THE KEY POLICY ISSUES THAT WE NEED TO DECIDE. SO
9 BEGINNING IN THE FALL, AND IN THE FOURTH QUARTER OF THIS YEAR,
10 WE CAN START WRITING OUR REGIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN. WE CAN
11 START PUTTING THE BALLOT DOCUMENTS WE NEED TOGETHER, AND THEN
12 IN THE STARTING IN JANUARY OF 2024, WE WILL BEGIN THE FORMAL
13 APPROVAL PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE GIVES A LITTLE MORE
14 DETAIL ABOUT HOW THE FORMAL APPROVAL PROCESS WORKS. SO, FIRST
15 OFF, IS OUR ADVISORY COMMITTEE. THE NINE-MEMBER PANEL OF
16 EXPERTS WHO WILL BE PROVIDING GUIDANCE TO US AND YOU. THEN TO
17 THE JOINT HOUSING COMMITTEES, THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
18 AND THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE. THEN THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
19 ASKING FOR A RESOLUTION TO SUPPORT THE ISSUE CHANCE OF THE GO
20 BONDS THAT WILL HAPPEN IN APRIL OR MAY OF 2024. AND THEN,
21 FINALLY, BACK TO YOU AS THE BAHFA BOARD IN MAY OR JUNE ASKING
22 FOR THE INITIATION OF PROCEEDINGS TO ISSUE THE G.O BONDS. THAT
23 APPROVAL WILL MEAN THAT COUNTIES WILL HOLD HEARINGS IN JUNE TO
24 PLACE THE MEASURE AND CONSOLIDATED WAY ON THEIR BALLOTS. NEXT
25 SLIDE. SO THAT'S WHY IT'S CRITICAL THAT WE START THIS PLANNING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 PROCESS IN DETAIL NOW. WE NEED GUIDANCE FROM YOU ON THING, FOR
2 EXAMPLE, LIKE HOW CAN BAHFA TAKE THE FUNDS DISTRIBUTED AROUND
3 THE REGION TO MAXIMIZE EQUITY AND MAXIMIZE IMPACT? HOW SHOULD
4 WE USE OUR FLEXIBLE FUNDS? WHAT IS THE MOST EFFICACIOUS WAY TO
5 DELIVER WHAT OUR RESIDENTS NEED? AND WHAT SHOULD THE LOCAL
6 INCENTIVE GRANT FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS LOOK LIKE? THAT'S 10% OF
7 BAHFA'S FUNDING. THERE'S GREAT IDEAS. IT'S HOUSING-RELATED
8 USES THAT CAN BE PART OF THAT FUNDING. PARKS, INFRASTRUCTURE,
9 UTILITIES. SO WE ARE GOING TO LOOK FOR GUIDANCE ON THAT, AS
10 WELL. IN ADDITION TO OTHER THINGS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THE
11 MEANTIME, WE'RE OUT IN COMMUNITIES. WE'RE MAKING PRESENTATIONS
12 TO ELECTED OFFICIALS. WE ARE MEETING WITH COMMUNITY GROUPS. WE
13 ARE WORKING WITH COUNTY AND CITY STAFF. WE'RE ACTUALLY HOLDING
14 A CONVENING OF ALL COUNTY STAFF AND DIRECT ALLOCATION CITY
15 STAFF ON JUNE 1st, TO BRING EVERYONE TOGETHER WHO WILL BE
16 WORKING ON THIS ON THE DETAILS, THE EXPENDITURE PLANS, ET.
17 CETERA. WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT THAT! BUT WE'LL BE OUT PRESENTING
18 TO A WIDE VARIETY OF ORGANIZATIONS AND GROUPS. SO THAT WE CAN
19 CONTINUE TO BUILD ON THE MOMENTUM THAT IS ALREADY THERE. AND
20 BUILD -- CONTINUE TO BUILD THE STRONG SUPPORT THAT ALREADY
21 EXISTS. NEXT SLIDE. AND THAT IS IT. I'M HAPPY TO DISCUSS MORE.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
24 PRESENTATION. AT THIS POINT, I'LL SEE IF THERE'S ANY INITIAL



APRIL 26, 2023

1 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS. I KNOW -- GO AHEAD,
2 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** A QUICK QUESTION HERE ON THE FUNDING IN EVERY
5 COMMUNITY -- CITIES WERE SEPARATED OUT YOU HAVE ALAMEDA
6 EXCLUDING -- HOW DID THAT WORK?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AV1487, THE RULES OF THE ROAD FOR THE BOND SPENDING
9 STATES THAT THE THREE BIG CITIES WILL GET THEIR OWN
10 ALLOCATIONS. THAT'S WHY SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO IS A
11 COUNTY, AS WELL, GET THEIR OWN ALLOCATION. AND THEN THERE ARE
12 CITIES WHO CARRY 30% OR MORE VERY LOW. SO THE CITY OF NAPA AND
13 SANTA ROSA HAVE THEIR OWN OBLIGATION. THEY GET THEIR OWN
14 ALLOCATION, AS WELL.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IN TERMS OF THE PARTNERS THAT HAVE
19 BEEN DOING SOME OF THE GROUNDWORK, JUST REMIND WHERE THEY ARE
20 AND THE CONVERSATIONS WE'VE HAD WITH KEY PARTNERS.

21

22 **KATE HARTLEY:** -- IT'S COMPRISED OF OVER 30 ORGANIZATIONS. THEY
23 HAVE CREATED A CAMPAIGN STRUCTURE. THEY ARE ABSOLUTELY IN
24 STRONG SUPPORT, AND THEY AND ALL THEIR MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS
25 ARE WORKING HARD ON THIS RIGHT NOW. THEY ALSO ARE TAKING A



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LEAD ON THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT, BUT ALSO WORKING
2 STATEWIDE. WE JUST HAVE BEEN TALKING WITH PART OF BAY AREA
3 HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. THEY HAVE MADE THE REGIONAL BOND A
4 CENTRAL PART OF THEIR OVERALL STRATEGY TO REDUCE HOMELESSNESS
5 BY 75%, AND TO PREVENT HOMELESSNESS. WE ALSO ARE WORKING WITH
6 OTHER ORGANIZATIONS WHO ARE PUTTING THE REGIONAL BOND AT THE
7 CENTER OF THEIR OVERALL ADVOCACY STRATEGY. THE CITY OF SAN
8 FRANCISCO JUST PASSED A RESOLUTION UNANIMOUSLY AT THE BOARD
9 THAT SUPPORTS THE REGIONAL BOND. SO THERE'S PIECES LIKE THAT
10 THAT WAS PART OF AN ADVOCACY EFFORT ON THE PART OF HOUSING
11 STAKEHOLDERS TO GET THAT RESOLUTION PASSED IN SAN FRANCISCO.
12 SO THE OVERALL STRUCTURE IS REALLY STRONG, AND WE HAVE A LOT
13 OF GREAT CAMPAIGN INFRASTRUCTURE IN PLACE.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOT IT. AND JUST FOLLOW UP QUESTION
16 BEFORE COMMISSIONER CANEPA. HOW DO WE WORK WITH LOCAL
17 MUNICIPALITIES THAT MIGHT BE DOING THEIR OWN MEASURE. IN THIS
18 CASE, IT COULD BE COMPETING. SO HAVE WE BEEN REACHING OUT TO
19 COUNTIES PROACTIVELY?

20

21 **KATE HARTLEY:** YES. WE'VE BEEN IN CLOSE TOUCH -- FOR EXAMPLE,
22 SAN FRANCISCO'S RESOLUTION WHILE SUPPORTING THE REGIONAL BOND,
23 ALSO DIRECTED THE COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE TO INVESTIGATE A LOCAL
24 MEASURE. BUT NOT ON THE CITY BALLOT. WE ARE REALLY OUT THERE
25 TALKING TO ALL THE JURISDICTIONS AND SEEING HOW WE CAN WE CAN



APRIL 26, 2023

1 HELP EACH OTHER, ESSENTIALLY. FOR EXAMPLE, OAKLAND'S RECENT
2 MEASURE THAT JUST PASSED FOR HOUSING IS -- WE'VE BEEN WORKING
3 WITH THE OAKLAND STAFF. THEY'RE DOING GREAT WORK WITH THAT
4 MONEY. IT'S REALLY VITALLY IMPORTANT. WE DON'T THINK THAT WILL
5 AT ALL DIMINISH THE REGIONAL MEASURE IN 2024'S CHANCES. SO
6 IT'S REALLY DIALOGUE. IT'S UNDERSTANDING WHAT THAT PARTICULAR
7 JURISDICTION NEEDS, AND IT'S SEEING IF WE CAN CREATE AN
8 ALLIANCE AND HELP EACH OTHER. THE REGIONAL ASPECT OF OUR WORK
9 IS REALLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE, AGAIN, HAVING US ALL WORKING THE
10 ENTIRE REGION WORKING TOGETHER AND HAVING RESOURCES IS WHAT
11 SEEMS TO BE A NEW APPROACH THAT -- AND WE KNOW THAT
12 HOMELESSNESS, FOR EXAMPLE, NEEDS A NEW APPROACH. WE JUST
13 HAVEN'T DONE A GOOD JOB SO FAR IN FIGURING OUT THE BEST WAYS
14 TO ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS. SO BY PROMOTING REGIONAL SOLUTIONS,
15 WE BELIEVE THAT WE CAN TRY NEW THINGS THAT WILL MAKE A
16 DIFFERENCE.

17
18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

19
20 **DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK MOVING FORWARD ON THE HOUSING MEASURE IS
21 CRITICALLY IMPORTANT. AND I WANT TO ADD THAT I THINK IN TERMS
22 OF THE POLLING, AND I'VE SEEN OTHER POLLING -- HOUSING IS
23 PROBABLY THE BIGGEST ISSUE IN THE BAY AREA YOU KNOW, IN SAN
24 MATEO COUNTY WE OPENED A NAVIGATION CENTER LAST WEEK. WE WERE
25 THE FIRST COUNTY TO GET PROJECT HOME KEY DOLLARS. OUR GOAL IS,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AND THE SLIDES INDICATE WE MAY BE GOING BACKWARDS. OUR GOAL IS
2 TO TRY TO GET TO FUNCTIONAL ZERO. I THINK WITH THE PIPELINE OF
3 MONEY IT ALIGNS US WITH PLAN BAY AREA 2050. BUT I DO THINK --
4 I THINK THERE'S AN APPETITE AMONGST VOTERS TO MOVE FORWARD
5 WITH THIS. AND I THINK THE MOVE FORWARD BECAUSE I'VE HEARD
6 FROM MY CONSTITUENTS WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING, THAT SOME OF
7 THEM HAVE BEEN DISPLAYED, WHETHER IT'S BECAUSE OF, YOU KNOW,
8 THEIR INCOMES, SOME OF THEM MOVED OUT OF THE BAY AREA AND
9 TOTALITY. MY HOPE IS THAT WE ADDRESS THE ISSUES OF THE THREE
10 P'S. RIGHT. I REALLY AM HOPEFUL THERE'S A HUGE CARVE OUT. AND
11 I KNOW THERE IS, FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW
12 THERE'S A SIGNIFICANT DEFICIT. THERE'S MARKET RATE HOUSING,
13 AND WE NEED THAT SUPPLY BUT THAT AFFORDABLE HOUSING PIECE IS
14 CRITICAL. AND I THINK THIS MEASURE MOVING FORWARD, AND, KAY,
15 LET ME THANK YOU FOR YOUR EFFORTS AROUND OUTREACH. I THINK
16 OUTREACH IS GOING TO BE CRITICALLY, CRITICALLY IMPORTANT TO
17 THE CITIES AND THE COUNTIES. AND I THINK ONE THING I'M
18 ENCOURAGED ABOUT, AND WANT TO THANK YOU, IS BRINGING THIS
19 BEFORE OUR BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. I THINK OUR BOARD OF
20 SUPERVISORS IS UNITED WHEN IT COMES AROUND HOUSING. AND NOT TO
21 SPEAK FOR THE REST OF THE BOARD, BUT I DO BELIEVE, YOU KNOW,
22 WE WOULD BE SUPPORTIVE OF IT -- OF THIS MEASURE AND ITS
23 TOTALITY. MY QUESTION IS, YOU TALKED ABOUT SUPPLEMENTAL
24 DOLLARS. I THINK IT WAS THE GO BOND YOU TALKED ABOUT. I'M
25 TRYING TO FIGURE OUT OUTSIDE OF THE -- I'M TRYING TO COLLECT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE THOUGHTS HERE. OUTSIDE OF THE ACTUAL BOND. YOU SAID THE
2 STATE MAY DO SOMETHING. IS THAT CORRECT?

3

4 **KATE HARTLEY:** OH, THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT? IS THAT --

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** IT CORRECT.

7

8 **KATE HARTLEY:** OUR PROPOSED MEASURE IS A GO BOND THAT REQUIRES
9 A TWO-THIRDS VOTE. THE AMENDMENT WOULD LOWER THAT VOTER
10 THRESHOLD TO A MAJORITY. BUT IT ALSO WILL, AND THIS HASN'T
11 BEEN FULLY DEFINED YET, BUT CONSTITUTIONAL -- THE PROPOSED
12 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT WOULD ALSO MODERATELY EXPAND THE
13 ELIGIBLE USES OF G.O BONDS. THIS IS REALLY, REALLY IMPORTANT
14 FOR US AS A REGION TO GRAPPLING WITH HOMELESSNESS. BECAUSE
15 RIGHT NOW YOU CAN ONLY SPEND G.O BONDS ON BRICKS AND MORTAR.
16 NO SOFT SERVICES, NO HOMELESSNESS INTERVENTIONS THAT AREN'T
17 HOUSE. AND IT'S TOO HARD TO ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS WITHOUT A
18 RESOURCE THAT'S NOT JUST CAPITAL. SO THE AMENDMENT WOULD
19 EXPAND OUR ABILITY TO USE THOSE FUNDS. WE COULD PROVIDE RENTAL
20 ASSISTANCE FOR PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS. WE COULD DO A
21 VARIETY OF THINGS THAT ARE ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL. SO THAT WOULD
22 BE A TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGE.

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I'M IN FULL SUPPORT OF THIS.

25 AND I WANT TO THANK YOU, MATT, REALLY THIS PLAN BAY AREA



APRIL 26, 2023

1 DOCUMENT IS REALLY PUTTING THINGS THAT WERE THESE IDEAS BUT
2 THEY'RE REALLY THROUGH CAPITAL AND THROUGH RESOURCES MAKING
3 THINGS HAPPEN. THANK YOU. IT'S INTERESTING. WE TALK ABOUT THE
4 HOUSING CRISIS. THIS BOARD WE'RE FINDING REAL SOLUTIONS! WE'RE
5 DOING IT THROUGH RESOURCES THAT ARE DESPERATELY NEEDED. SO
6 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MOULTON
9 PETERS. FOLLOW UP QUESTION ABOUT THE GO BONDS. CAN YOU SAY
10 MORE ABOUT THE TIMING AND PROCESS?

11

12 **KATE HARTLEY:** SO WE HAVE TO PRODUCE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN, AND
13 OTHER BALLOT DOCUMENTS. WE WOULD BEGIN DRAFTING THOSE AT THE
14 END OF THIS YEAR. SORRY, KATE. FOR THE CONSTITUTIONAL
15 AMENDMENT.

16

17 **KATE HARTLEY:** THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT. THAT WOULD BE
18 NOVEMBER 2024 SO WE CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF IT. AND THE HOUSING
19 ADVOCATES ARE PURSUING THAT NOW. IT WOULD BE -- I DON'T HAVE
20 THE DATE -- REBECCA, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU DO.

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** I WAS TALKING TO ONE OF THE PEOPLE WORKING ON
23 THIS THAT WAS HERE EARLIER. WITH THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT
24 GOING THROUGH THE INITIATIVE PROCESS, RIGHT, THEY HAVE TO
25 GATHER SIGNATURES. I BELIEVE THE DEADLINE FOR THAT IS ACTUALLY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SOMETIME EARLY NEXT SPRING. AND I THINK WHAT THEY ARE
2 PURSUING, THE FOLKS WHO ARE LEADING ON THIS IS WORKING THROUGH
3 THE LEGISLATURE INITIALLY. RIGHT. IT WOULD BE A LOT MORE COST
4 EFFECTIVE TO HAVE THE LEGISLATURE PUT THIS ON THE BALLOT. IF
5 THAT FAILS, SO THEY'RE GOING TO MAKE THAT CALL THIS FALL, THEN
6 GOING THE SIGNATURE GATHERING ROUTE WHICH WILL BE A
7 SIGNIFICANT FUNDRAISING EFFORT, BUT, AGAIN, THE FORMAL
8 SUBMITTAL ISN'T UNTIL FEBRUARY OR MARCH OF NEXT YEAR. THANK
9 YOU. TO FOLLOW UP, KATE, IF MARIN COUNTY DOESN'T HAVE A DATE
10 ON THE CALENDAR FOR YOU TO PRESENT TO THE BOARD, I WOULD LIKE
11 TO WORK WITH YOU TO GET THE DATE.

12

13 **KATE HARTLEY:** WE HAVE A MEETING SET.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES, WE DO. THAT'S RIGHT. WE'LL SET
16 THE DATE THEN.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER --

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I THINK IT GOES BACK TO THE FLEXIBILITY OF
21 USING THE DOLLARS. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT HOUSING, WE HAVE TO BE
22 COGNIZANT AND TALK ABOUT THE MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES. AND
23 SOMETIMES PEOPLE SUFFERING FROM SUBSTANCE ABUSE, AS WELL, TOO.
24 AND UNDERSTANDING, LIKE, HOW DO WE ACTUALLY HOUSE THAT
25 POPULATION? RIGHT. IS IT FACILITIES? IS IT GOVERNMENT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 FACILITIES? IS IT MORE SECTION 8 VOUCHERS WHERE WE'RE
2 DELIVERING PROGRAMS TO THE FRONT DOORSTEPS OF PEOPLE WHO ARE
3 SUFFERING? THESE DIFFERENT THINGS. I DON'T KNOW IF WOULD FALL
4 UNDER THIS BALLOT MEASURE BUT TALKING ABOUT THE CONSTITUTIONAL
5 AMENDMENT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY IS SO
6 IMPORTANT. I THINK THAT SO MANY OF OUR POPULATION WHO ARE
7 UNHOUSED RIGHT NOW, IF THEY DIDN'T HAVE MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES
8 OR ILLNESS GOING ON TO THE STREETS, THEY NOW DO. AND SO WITH
9 THAT BEING SAID, YOU CAN'T GET RIGHT INTO A JOB FORCE OR WHAT
10 HAVE YOU AND NOT JUST THAT, BUT YOU MAY BE IN A LONG LINE OF
11 THE VOUCHER. EVEN THEN WITH OUR VOUCHER SYSTEM, WE KNOW
12 THERE'S NOT A LINK TO HOUSING. RIGHT. IF WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
13 THE BAY AREA AND MAKING SURE PEOPLE ARE CLOSE TO THE RESOURCES
14 THEY KNOW. BUT, YOU KNOW, THAT INCLUDES THE HUMAN RESOURCE,
15 TOO. SOCIETAL RESOURCES THEY KNOW IS THERE'S NOT A LINK TO
16 HOUSING. SO I THINK THAT AS WE'RE MOVING FORWARD AND THINKING
17 ABOUT HOW WE SOLVE HOMELESSNESS AND, YOU KNOW, THAT WE HAVE TO
18 BE MORE COMPREHENSIVE. IT'S JUST NOT ABOUT PUTTING PEOPLE INTO
19 STRUCTURES. BUT IT'S ALSO MAKING SURE PEOPLE HAVE THE
20 CAPABILITIES, THE MENTAL CAPABILITIES TO BE IN THESE ACTUAL
21 HOMES. SO WE DON'T SEE, YOU KNOW, A CYCLE OF FOLKS ENDING UP
22 ON THE STREETS.

23

24 **KATE HARTLEY:** I AGREE. I WOULD SAY WE NEED MORE RESOURCES
25 ACROSS THE BOARD. WE HAVE THESE CONSTRAINTS THAT WE'RE TRYING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TO PUSH BACK AGAINST. THAT IS THE VERY STRICT ELIGIBILITY USES
2 FOR G.O BONDS RIGHT NOW. THERE IS RECOGNITION OF THIS NEED IN
3 OUR STATE. IT'S NOT UNCOMPLICATED BUT GOVERNOR NEWSOME HAS
4 FLOATED THIS IDEA OF \$5 BILLION MEASURE TO ADDRESS EXACTLY
5 WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. HOUSING AND SERVICES FOR SEVERELY
6 MENTALLY ILL PEOPLE WHO ARE HOMELESS. AND WE MUST HAVE THAT.
7 WE JUST MUST. SO I AGREE COMPLETELY.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR. THANK YOU. THIS
10 IS EXCITING AND EXCITING TO HEAR ABOUT THE PROGRESS YOU'RE
11 MAKING ON THIS. I WAS WONDERING FOR YOU HAD ANY THOUGHTS ABOUT
12 HOW WE CAN USE THIS MASSIVE INFUSION OF NEW REVENUE TO HELP
13 REDUCE THE COST OF BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND I KNOW
14 THIS IS A PROBLEM IN NOT JUST IN OUR REGION, BUT AROUND THE
15 STATE AND LIMITS THE NUMBER OF UNITS WE CAN BUILD, AND
16 ULTIMATELY THE NUMBER OF FAMILIES WE CAN SERVE. I KNOW, FOR
17 INSTANCE, L.A. ESTABLISHED WHEN THEY DID HHH, THEY HAD MORE
18 LETTERS THAN MEASURES. IT DOESN'T MAKE THEM BETTER. BUT WHEN
19 THEY DID HHH, THEY WERE FACING A SIMILAR PROBLEM. THEY
20 LAUNCHED SORT OF A HOUSING CHALLENGE WHICH SET ASIDE A PORTION
21 OF ABOUT 10% OF THEIR MEASURE TO SUPPOSEDLY IDENTIFY HOUSING
22 TYPES AND ALTERNATIVE FUNDING STRATEGIES TO REDUCE THE COSTS
23 AND COMPLETE PROJECTS QUICKER. AND I WOULD LOVE TO KIND OF
24 HEAR YOUR THOUGHTS ON HOW WE CAN KIND OF USE THIS UNIQUE
25 OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT HERE.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **KATE HARTLEY:** WE'RE TOTALLY DEDICATED TO IMPLEMENTING PROGRAMS
3 THAT REDUCE THE COST OF HOUSING AND DELIVER HOUSING FASTER.
4 WE'VE STUDIED THE HHH HOUSING INNOVATION CHALLENGE. WHEN THEY
5 WENT OUT WITH IT, THERE WERE 19 PROJECTS SELECTED. THE AVERAGE
6 WAS \$431,000 A DOOR, WHICH IS VERY LOW COMPARED TO WHAT IS
7 COMMON IN THE BAY AREA. AND THE CITY OF L.A. HAS CLEANED UP ON
8 THE COMPETITIVE FUNDING APPLICATION AT THE STATE FOR LOW-
9 INCOME HOUSING TAX CREDITS AND BONDS BECAUSE THEY HAVE FIGURED
10 OUT HOW TO DELIVER HOUSING AT A LOWER PRICE POINT, WHICH IS
11 IMPORTANT IN THE COMPETITION FOR THOSE RESOURCES, AND TO
12 DELIVER IT FASTER AND IT'S FOR HOMELESS HOUSEHOLDS. NOW THEIR
13 DELIVERY ISN'T PERFECT, AND THERE'S AN AUDIT FOR L.A. RIGHT
14 NOW THAT FINDS SOME -- A LOT OF ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT, BUT THAT
15 -- THEY -- THEY'RE LIGHT YEARS AHEAD OF US AT THE MOMENT. THE
16 OTHER THING TO THINK ABOUT IS WE DO HAVE A BOTTLE NECK AT THE
17 STATE IN TERMS OF ACCESSING RESOURCES. A HUGE BOTTLENECK. AND
18 SO BAHFA AND YOU'LL SEE IT IN THE BUSINESS PLANNING DOCUMENTS,
19 BAHFA WANTS TO CREATE AN OFFRAMP TO THE STATE CREDIT
20 APPLICATION PROCESS OF WHICH RIGHT NOW BAY AREA PROJECTS HAVE
21 ABOUT A 40% CHANCE OF SUCCESS THE FIRST TIME THAT WE APPLY FOR
22 BONDS AND CREDITS. VERY LOW SUCCESS RATE. SO WE WANT TO REWARD
23 PROJECTS THAT CAN COME IN AND NOT HAVE TO COMPETE FOR THOSE
24 FUNDS, DELIVER THE HOUSING IN THREE YEARS, AND AT A PRICE
25 POINT THAT IS LOWER THAN THE INDUSTRY STANDARD, SO WE'RE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LOOKING AT THAT \$450,000-PER-UNIT NUMBER. THAT'S GOING TO BE
2 PART OF OUR PROPOSAL TO YOU FOR HOW WE WILL GO OUT WITH A
3 NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY FOR OUR PRODUCTION FUNDS. WE
4 HAVE TO DO THAT BECAUSE WE HAVE TO THINK OF DIFFERENT WAYS,
5 BETTER WAYS TO GET THE HOUSING OUT THERE FOR OUR RESIDENTS BUT
6 GIVEN THE CONSTRAINTS WE HAVE AT THE STATE FUNDING LEVEL. SO
7 WE'RE DEDICATED TO IT. YOU'LL BE HAPPY TO KNOW THAT WE WERE A
8 COAPPLICANT TO THE STATE TO STAND UP A HOUSING INCUBATOR LAB
9 TO ADVANCE NEW CONSTRUCTION TECHNOLOGIES TO REDUCE THE COST OF
10 HOUSING, AND WE'RE NOW A FINALIST. WE MIGHT HAVE SOME GOOD
11 NEWS THERE, TOO. BUT WE'RE COMPLETELY DEDICATED TO THAT
12 PROCESS! THAT'S REALLY TERRIFIC TO HEAR THAT. THAT'S
13 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR HOW WE GO FROM THE
14 AMOUNT OF MONEY NOW TO THE AMOUNT MUCH MONEY IN THE FUTURE.
15 THERE'S PROBABLY DIFFERENT STRATEGIES WE CAN APPLY TO THE
16 FUTURE PART. I THINK IT WOULD BE APPEALING TO, YOU KNOW, NOT -
17 - BUT APPEALING TO VOTERS TO SHOW THEM, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE ARE
18 GOING TO BE DOING TO USE THESE RESOURCES MOST EFFECTIVELY.
19 BECAUSE I KNOW SOME OF THE SKEPTICISM TO THE TYPE OF
20 AFFORDABLE HOUSING WE'RE GOING TO BE PRODUCING IS JUST HOW
21 MUCH IT COSTS. COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU. I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO ATTEND
24 AN ADDITIONAL PRESENTATION FROM A COUPLE OF GENTLEMEN, I
25 THINK, WERE RUNNING THE POLLING OR THE MEASURE IN SANTA ROSA,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AND I THINK THE RECEPTION WAS WARM. I THINK IT'LL GET A WARM
2 WELCOME IN SONOMA COUNTY. IT'S PRETTY EXCITING. A COUPLE OF
3 QUESTIONS COME UP FOR ME. ONE, WHAT WAS MENTIONED AROUND
4 OPERATIONAL FUNDING. WE HAVE A LOT OF NEW SUPPORTIVE HOUSING.
5 WE DON'T HAVE THE FUNDING EXCEPT FOR A LOCAL SELF-HELP MEASURE
6 -- WORK IN THE EMERGENCY ROOM, PSYCHIATRIC EMERGENCY ROOM ARE
7 CYCLING IN AND OUT AND NOT HAVING ENOUGH STAFF. SO THEY HAVE A
8 ROOF OVER THEIR HEAD BUT IT'S NOT ENOUGH IN THAT SITUATION. SO
9 THAT'S ONE CONCERN I HAVE. LET ME KNOW IF THIS HAS CHANGED --
10 MAYBE A MONTH OR TWO AGO -- SIX WEEKS AGO I HEARD THE
11 PRESENTATION. THERE'S AN 80% RETURN TO SOURCE FOR -- YEAH.
12 RIGHT. EXACTLY. USE IT OR LOSE IT SITUATION. ALL OF OUR
13 JURISDICTIONS ARE BURDENED WITH PLANNING, RESOURCES. I'M
14 CURIOUS TO KNOW, IS THERE ANY FUNDING OR COULD THERE BE
15 FUNDING WRITTEN INTO IT TO HELP JURISDICTIONS MEET THAT BARF
16 ACTUALLY SPENDING THE MONEY? IT'S ONE THING TO GET IT. IT'S
17 ANOTHER THING TO SPEND IT. I CAN SEE SOME JURISDICTIONS NOT AS
18 EXCITED TO BUILD HOUSING AS OTHERS. SAYING IT'S NOT WORTH IT
19 BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE REPORTS OR THE POLITICAL WILLINGNESS
20 TO DO IT. -- ALONG THE STATE ROUTE 37 CORRIDOR.

21

22 **KATE HARTLEY:** THE 1847 RULES ON THE EXPENDITURE TIMELINE
23 PROVIDE THREE-YEARS FOR INCOME FUNDS AT THE COUNTY LEVEL. AND
24 THEN IF THERE'S PROGRESS DEMONSTRATED, AND IT'S PRETTY LOOSE
25 ABOUT HOW TO DEFINE PROGRESS DEMONSTRATED, THERE CAN BE AN



APRIL 26, 2023

1 EXTENSION. IT'S REALLY UP TO THE BAHFA BOARD AND THE ABAG
2 EXECUTIVE BOARD TO ENFORCE A RETRACTION OF FUNDS. SO I THINK
3 THE LIKELIHOOD OF ACTUALLY LOSING FUNDS FOR COMMUNITIES THAT
4 ARE REALLY WORKING HARD TO PUT THOSE FUNDS INTO PLACE IS LOW.
5 AND FOR DIRECT ALLOCATION CITIES, SANTA ROSA, THE TIMELINE IS
6 EVEN LONGER. YOU NEED TO COMMIT WITHIN FIVE YEARS, AND THEN
7 BEGIN THE EXPENDITURE PROCESS IN FIVE YEARS. WE WANT EVERYONE
8 -- AB1487 WAS WRITTEN IN A WAY WE WANT EVERYONE TO SUCCEED.

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YEAH. I'M NOT SO WORRIED ABOUT, YOU KNOW, I
11 THINK MOST CITIES WILL WANT THE MONEY. I THINK SOME CITIES
12 WILL STRUGGLE TO SPEND THE MONEY. WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS
13 THE CITIES THAT WILL WANT TO SPEND THE MONEY AND CREATE
14 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE. I'M HOPEFUL THERE'S SOME THOUGHT THAT
15 GOES INTO HOW TO PREVENT THAT FROM HAPPENING WITH THE FUNDING.

16

17 **KATE HARTLEY:** IT'S ONE REASON WE'RE BRINGING ALL THE COUNTY
18 STAFF AND CITY STAFF TOGETHER RIGHT NOW. BECAUSE WE WANT TO
19 WORK TOGETHER AS A REGION TO CREATE COMMUNICATION PLANS, AND
20 WE KNOW WE HAVE THE 33,000-UNIT PIPELINE, SO THOSE ARE IN A
21 GOOD STATE OF READINESS. THEY SHOULD GO FIRST. THEY'RE ALL
22 OVER THE BAY! EVERY SINGLE COUNTY HAS THOSE READY TO GO. BUT
23 WE DON'T WANT ANYBODY TO -- ANY CITY TO GET LEFT BEHIND. WE
24 WANT TO PROVIDE THE ASSISTANCE, EVEN IF IT'S TECHNICAL
25 ASSISTANCE OR ANY KIND OF ASSISTANCE TO ENSURE THAT EVERYONE,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 EVERY CITY, THERE'S OUTREACH TO EVERY CITY. AND THAT WE CAN
2 WORK TOGETHER TO MAKE SURE THAT GOOD HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES ARE
3 ACCESSED AND PURSUED.

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. 1487 WE A COMMUNICATION
8 ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED. IT'S A HARD ONE. YOU WANT EVERYONE TO
9 STEP UP INTO THE MOMENT. BUT IT'S ALSO TRYING TO SAY, LOOK,
10 FOR THOSE WILLING WE'RE BILLING A COALITION OF THE WILLING. IF
11 YOU'RE THE COALITION WITH THE NOT, IT WILL COME UP TO YOU AT
12 SOME POINT. RIGHT. I THINK THAT'S THE GRAPPLING NATURE WE
13 HAVE. SO IT WAS ABOUT CLAWING BACK AND SPREADING IT IN THE
14 COMMUNITIES WILLING TO. I THINK WE'RE IN A MOMENT WHERE WE
15 HAVE TO INCENTIVIZE GOOD OUTCOMES. IT'LL BE HARD IF WE KEEP
16 WAITING FOR EVERYONE TO MEET US IN THAT MOMENT. IT'S A HARD
17 DISCUSSION WE HAD, COMMISSIONER, FLEMING. IT CAME BACK WHEN
18 YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT THAT. COMMISSIONER --

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SINCE WE CREATED BAHFA, IT CREATED A LARGER COMMUNITY
21 OF THE WILLING. OR AT LEAST HAVE TO. I JUST WANTED TO JUST
22 REVEL IN THE AMAZING WORK THAT YOU HAVE DONE. THE MTC HAS
23 DONE, YOU KNOW, REMEMBERING WHEN THE IDEA OF A REGIONAL
24 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY WAS THE CONCEPT THAT NO ONE HAD EVEN
25 HEARD OF TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY. IT'S JUST TRULY AMAZING! AND I



APRIL 26, 2023

1 JUST WANT TO CELEBRATE THAT. YEAH. YEAH. YOU CAN CLAP. [
2 APPLAUSE] I CAN TELL YOU EVERYBODY I KNOW IS REARING TO GO ON
3 THIS CAMPAIGN. IT'S GOING TO BE A GREAT CAMPAIGN! IT'S GOING
4 TO WIN YOU KNOW, THERE'S PENT UP ENERGY FROM BACK IN 2019 THAT
5 IS READY TO GET THIS DONE. I'M CURIOUS IF ARE THE GOVERNOR'S
6 ANNOUNCEMENT ABOUT A STATE HOUSING BOND SPECIFICALLY AROUND
7 HOMELESSNESS, YOU KNOW, HOMELESS HOUSING. I KNOW IT HOUSES THE
8 SERVICES COMPONENT WITH THE MHSA MONEY, AS WELL. BUT HAS THAT
9 CHANGED THE STRATEGY AT ALL? DOES IT NOT AFFECT ANYTHING? LORD
10 KNOWS, THERE'S MORE ME THAN HIS PLUS R IS GOING TO MEET. I'M
11 CURIOUS IF IT HAS CHANGED ANYTHING.

12

13 **KATE HARTLEY:** IT HASN'T. IT IS NEEDED. AND AS WE'VE ALL, I
14 THINK, AGREED. WE NEED MORE RESOURCES ACROSS THE BOARD. IT'S A
15 FIVE BILLION DOLLAR BOND. SO IT'S ACTUALLY A FUNDING LEVEL
16 THAT IS IMPORTANT, BUT IT'S NOT SO BIG THAT WE'RE FEELING
17 OVERWHELMED AT ALL. SO I THINK IT'S VERY COMPLIMENTARY.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AND, KATE, I WANT TO SAY HOW MUCH I
20 APPRECIATED HEARING FROM YOU TODAY. BUT, ALSO, HAVING A
21 MEETING WITH YOU. I HAVE TO BE HONEST, I'M A LITTLE SKEPTICAL
22 WHEN I TALK ABOUT WITH HOUSING. I WANT FOLKS TO SAY HERE IS
23 WHEN IT'S GOING TO BE BUILT, HERE'S WHERE IT'S OPENING. YOU
24 DID A BRILLIANT JOB OF HELPING ME UNDERSTAND THE REGIONAL
25 VISION THAT WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT BUT HELP ME



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THINK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE LOCAL LEVEL AND REGIONAL LEVEL
2 ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS OF THIS MEASURE. AND SO, COLLEAGUES,
3 ONE OF THE TWO THINGS I WANTED TO TOUCH ON. SO IN 2016, WHEN
4 WE PASSED OUR BOND. WE HAVE THE \$950 MILLION HOUSING BOND IN
5 SANTA CLARA COUNTY. WE HAVE ALMOST ALL OF THE MONEY DEDICATED
6 NOW. WE HAVE 3,000 PEOPLE LIVING IN NEW MEASURE A HOMES THAT
7 WEREN'T IN EXISTENCE BEFORE 2016. WE HAVE, I THINK TO THE
8 MAYOR'S POINT, WE HAVE QUARTER CENT SALES TAX WE'RE USING
9 SOLELY TO PROVIDE THE SERVICES. WE'RE BUILDING HOUSES,
10 PROVIDING SERVICES. WE HAVE A GREAT RELATIONSHIP WITH THE
11 HOUSING AUTHORITY. -- SO I SHARE THAT BECAUSE WHAT ONE OF THE
12 REASONS OUR COUNTY STILL LOOKING AT, WHETHER OR NOT WE SHOULD
13 DO A LOCAL MEASURE, IS BECAUSE WE'VE GOT A PIPELINE THAT IS
14 BURSTING, AND WE FINALLY GOT PEOPLE MOVING. OF THE 15 CITIES
15 IN OUR COUNTY, ALMOST ALL OF THEM ARE BUILDING HOUSING AS PART
16 OF THE MEASURE A PROGRAMMING. I SHARE THAT BOTH TO SHARE WITH
17 MY COLLEAGUES AND AS A COUNTY WE'RE EXPLORING IT. I'M NERVOUS
18 WE PUSHED SO MUCH TO GET THE PIPELINE MOVING THAT WE HAVE AN
19 OBLIGATION, I THINK, TO MAKE SURE WE CAN MEET THAT. AND SECOND
20 OF ALL, AGAIN, JUST TO A POINT THAT I THINK BOTH THE MAYORS
21 RAISED IS THIS, I THINK AT AT STATEWIDE LEVEL, OR AT LEAST A A
22 REGIONAL LEVEL, THE NEEDS PEOPLE HAVE FOR HOUSING IS DIFFERENT
23 THAN WHEN I FIRST STARTED BEING AN ADVOCATE FOR HOUSING 20
24 YEARS AGO. WE'VE SEEN WE'RE PUTTING IN PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE
25 HOUSING AND STAYING IN IT AFTER THREE YEARS AT ABOUT 98% RATE.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE SERVICE IS THAT WE HAVE TO WRAP AROUND ARE NOT WHAT WE
2 ANTICIPATED. AND THE OTHER THING IS, I THINK THAT THERE ARE A
3 NUMBER OF NEW KINDS OF HOMELESSNESS. I DON'T THINK WE HAVE AN
4 APPROPRIATE WAY TO RESPOND AT A LOCAL LEVEL YET. I SAY THAT TO
5 THE POINT YOU RAISED ABOUT HOW COMPLICATED IT IS, HOW MANY
6 DIFFERENT NEEDS THERE ARE, THE PLACEMENTS, AND APPROPRIATE
7 SERVICES TO HELP PEOPLE STAY HOUSED. WHAT I'M MOST WORRIED
8 ABOUT, ULTIMATELY, IS WHEN WE WERE DEBATING THIS INITIATIVE, I
9 WAS CONCERNED THAT WE WERE NOT PUTTING ENOUGH MONEY JUST TO
10 HOUSING. LIKE, JUST TO GET IT BUILT. I THINK IT WOULD TERRIFY
11 PEOPLE TO HAVE US SPEND A LOT OF MONEY ON PLANS AND THINKING
12 ABOUT IT AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND ALL THOSE OTHER THINGS,
13 IF PEOPLE DON'T SEE HOUSING COMING OUT OF THE GROUND. AND SO I
14 SAY THAT BECAUSE I THINK THE BALANCE BETWEEN SERVICES AND THE
15 PARTNERSHIPS WE HAVE AT THE COUNTY AND THE STATE, YOU KNOW, AS
16 IT RELATES TO WHETHER IT'S MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES MONEY, THAT
17 THE BEST PRACTICES THAT WE AS A GROUP REALLY CAN SHARE WITH
18 EACH OTHER IS HOW WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO UNLOCK EVEN MORE
19 RESOURCES AND STRETCH DOLLARS FURTHER. AND ALLOWING US TO POUR
20 MORE MONEY INTO THE ARE CONSTRUCTION OF HOUSING. AND, YOU
21 KNOW, I SHARE THAT BECAUSE I THINK THAT -- I WORRY ABOUT THE
22 FLEXIBILITY OF THE BILL. NOT JUST BECAUSE I DON'T RECOGNIZE WE
23 HAVE ALL THE SERVICES WE NEED, BUT MORE BECAUSE I THINK IT HAS
24 TO BE A COALITION OF THE WILLING. AND I'LL JUST WRAP UP WITH
25 THIS COMMENT. IN OUR COUNTY, THE WAY THE COUNTY IS ACTING WITH



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THIS MONEY IS WE'RE THE BANK. WE'RE NOT. WE'RE NOT HOLDING
2 PEOPLE UP. SOMEONE COMES, THEY HAVE LAND, THEY'VE GOT A
3 DEVELOPER WE'VE ALREADY PRESCREENED, WE ARE WRITING THEM A
4 CHECK AND HELPING THEM MOVE OUT THE DOOR. AND I, AGAIN, THE
5 IDEA OF HAVING ONE MORE PLACE TO APPLY FOR MONEY MAKES ME WANT
6 TO RIP OUT SOMEBODY'S EYE LASHES. NOT MY OWN. BUT SOMEBODY
7 ELSE'S. I SAY THAT BECAUSE WE CAN'T BE WHAT WE MOST ARE
8 CONCERNED ABOUT. SO ANYWAY AS WE MOVE FORWARD, WHAT I'M
9 INTERESTED IN SEEING IS HOW THE PLAN INCENTIVIZES A COALITION
10 OF THE WILLING TO, I THINK, VICTORIA, THE POINT YOU RAISED WAS
11 RIGHT ON. AND WE CAN QUANTIFY THE NUMBER OF DOORS WE HAVE
12 BUILT. SO I'M HOPING THAT AS WE GET FURTHER INTO THIS, WE'LL
13 SEE THAT AND WHAT THAT PIPELINE AND WHAT ARE WE DOING WITH THE
14 PIPELINES? THE OTHER THING, I CAN'T REMEMBER WHO TOLD ME THIS,
15 THEY SAID, WE'LL BE LOOKING AT THE MOST WORTHY PROJECTS. I
16 NEED EVALUATION OF WORTHINESS. WE NEED SOMEONE, YOU KNOW, WE
17 NEED TO MOVE BECAUSE THE LONGER RETAKE, WE ADD MORE COSTS.

18

19 **KATE HARTLEY:** I COMPLETELY AGREE. THE RETURN TO SOURCE MONEY
20 WILL LOOK EXACTLY LIKE YOUR MEASURE A MONEY. IT'S TOTALLY IN
21 EVERY COUNTY'S CONTROL. HOW FAST THEY GO, AND SO THERE'S NO
22 ADDITIONAL OVERSIGHT BY BAHFA EXCEPT YOU COMMIT A EXPENDITURE
23 PLAN. IF IT MEETS THE 1487 MINIMAL OBLIGATIONS, IT'S GOOD TO
24 GO. THAT'S IT. FOR THE 20%, WE ARE COMPLETELY DEDICATED, AS I
25 SAID, TO WHAT YOU'VE JUST ARTICULATED, COMMISSIONER, WHICH IS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 REDUCE REGULATORY BURDEN, REDUCE TIMELINES, REDUCE COSTS, GET
2 THE MONEY OUT QUICKLY, LET THE MONEY GO WHERE IT WILL PRODUCE
3 HOUSING AS FAST AS POSSIBLE. BECAUSE WE NEED IT. SO TO THE
4 EXTENT WE CAN PARTNER IN THAT EFFICIENT WAY, WE WANT TO. WE'LL
5 BE LOOKING AT FUNDING INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS THAT MEET THOSE TIME
6 COST CONDITIONS. SO WE'RE IN ALIGNMENT, AND THE COUNTIES HAVE
7 EXTREME FLEXIBILITY WITH HOW THEY USE THEIR FUNDS. WE WANT TO
8 JUST ENHANCE THAT AND BE PRESENT IN THE REGION LEADING WAYS OF
9 INNOVATIVE FINANCING STRUCTURES AND BRINGING IN NEW
10 CONSTRUCTION TECHNOLOGIES. P

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE OTHER THING. I THINK THAT ON THE NEW
13 CONSTRUCTION TECHNOLOGIES THAT WE SHOULD BE WORKING MORE WITH
14 THE PRIVATE SECTOR. LIKE, I'M NOT AS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE DOING
15 THAT INNOVATIVE -- TOO. AND TO BE HONEST WITH YOU, TO ME IT'S
16 -- BY THE WAY, LET ME SAY THIS. IT WAS MY INITIATIVE. I'M NOT
17 EN BLOCKING YOU. I DO THIS! AND SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE EVEN
18 WITH THE 20%, THAT'S A LOT OF MONEY. AND I DO NOT WANT IT
19 SITTING SOMEWHERE. IF WE CAN SPEND IT IN THE COMMUNITIES WE'RE
20 IN. I WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S GETTING SPENT. THIS ISN'T YOU.
21 THIS IS US. WE HAVE TO DO THIS IN OUR OWN COMMUNITIES. THANK
22 YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.
25 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. IT'S EXCITING HERE. QUICK QUESTIONS,
3 I'M SORRY IF WE HAVEN'T DISCUSSED ALL THE DIFFERENT THINGS
4 HERE. I'M RESULTS ORIENTED AND VERY IMPATIENT. AND WE OWE IT
5 TO, I MEAN, THIS IS A MATTER OF HUMANITY TO GET RESULTS AS
6 QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE HERE. AS COMMISSIONER CANEPA POINTED OUT,
7 WE'RE HEADING IN THAT RIGHT DIRECTION. WHEN YOU SAY BRICK AND
8 MORTAR THANK YOU TAKEN AWAY REDEVELOPMENT MONEY AND WE DON'T
9 HAVE AT LOT OF LAND. NOT BY CHOICE HERE BUT 68% OF THE COUNTY
10 IS OPEN SPACE. SO RESULTS. SO CAN OUR COUNTY USE THE MONEY TO
11 BUY HOTELS? HOW QUICKLY CAN WE ADDRESS? AND I HAVE TO AGREE
12 WITH ERIC THAO HERE. YOU CAN'T HOUSE PEOPLE WITHOUT THE WRAP
13 AROUND SERVICES. IN ORDER TO SUCCEED. SO I THREW A BUNCH OUT
14 THERE REAL QUICK. I'M SORRY.

15

16 **KATE HARTLEY:** YOUR COUNTY CAN ACT AS QUICKLY AS IT WANTS. THE
17 ACQUISITION OF A HOTEL FOR HOMELESS HOUSING, FOR EXAMPLE, IS
18 PERFECTLY GREAT USE OF THE BOND FUNDS. RIGHT NOW, BECAUSE OF
19 THE CONSTITUTIONAL CONSTRAINTS, YOU COULD NOT USE BOND FUNDS
20 TO FUND THE SERVICES. IF THE PROPOSED CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT
21 PASSES, THEN THERE'S TWO THINGS YOU CAN DO WITH THAT HOTEL
22 THAT YOU CAN'T DO NOW. ONE, YOU COULD CAPITALIZE ON OPERATING
23 RESERVE, SO THAT YOU CAN PAY FOR THE OPERATIONS OF THE
24 BUILDING. NOW IT'S NOT A GREAT USE OF FUNDS, BUT IN THE
25 ABSENCE OF A FEDERAL SAFETY NET AND ADDITIONAL RESOURCES THAT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS BEST SUITED TO PROVIDE, LIKE MORE
2 SECTION 8, IT'S BETTER THAN NOTHING. ALSO, YOU COULD USE THOSE
3 BOND FUNDS TO PAY FOR SERVICES IN YOUR BUILDING. BUT WE NEED
4 THAT AMENDMENT. RIGHT NOW WE'RE CONSTRAINED BY THE
5 CONSTITUTION

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT'S WONDERFUL.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. IF WE'RE
10 PRIVILEGED TO BE IN THIS POSITION, I'M NOT INTERESTED IN US
11 MICROMANAGING THE PROCESS AND DELAYING IT. BUT I THINK IT IS
12 AN IMPORTANT OPPORTUNITY TO FIND OUT AND COLLECT DATA ON WHO
13 IS DOING THINGS MORE EFFICIENTLY. I'M REMINDED OF THE
14 MEGAPROJECT WORKSHOP. WE WERE LOOKING AT PROJECT COSTS AND
15 WHETHER IT WAS EFFICIENCIES. WE HAVE AN ABILITY TO DESIGN THE
16 SYSTEM ON THE FRONT END. IF THERE'S, FOR EXAMPLE, IF THERE'S A
17 MUNICIPALITY CHARGING MORE FEES, OUR DOLLAR WILL GO FARTHER
18 THAN THE MUNICIPALITY THAT IS NOT. WE'RE NOT BUILD FOR THAT
19 YET BUT I'M INTERESTED IN IT. JUST FOOD FOR THOUGHT AT THE
20 RIGHT TIME. ALL RIGHT. SO COMMISSIONER SPERING.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON MAYOR THAO'S POINT,
23 WHICH WE SEEMED TO OVERLOOK. AND THAT IS, YOU KNOW, THE
24 MENTALLY ILL AND THE DRUG-ADDICTED IS A PUBLIC HEALTH PROBLEM.
25 WE'VE HAD -- AND IF WE'RE GOING TO BUILD THE HOUSING, WE NEED



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TO PROTECT THAT ASSET. AND, YOU KNOW, PROJECT IN -- TOOK A
2 HOTEL AND TOTALLY TRASHED IT. DESTROYED IT. AND HAD TO MOVE
3 EVERYBODY OUT. COST OVER A MILLION DOLLARS TO RESTORE IT. BACK
4 TO WHAT IT WAS. AND SO THE -- WE CANNOT LEAVE OUT THIS MENTAL
5 HEALTH AND DRUG-ADDICTED. YOU CAN PASS THIS MEASURE. BUILD ALL
6 THE HOUSING YOU WANT. YOU WON'T SEE THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE ON
7 THE STREET REDUCED IF WE DON'T DEAL WITH THE PUBLIC HEALTH
8 PROBLEM. AND I THINK IN ALAMEDA AND SANTA CLARA, I THINK
9 THEY'RE SEEING THAT, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE BUILDING HOUSING BUT
10 THOSE MENTALLY ILL AND DRUG-ADDICTED, THEY'RE STILL ON THE
11 STREET. AND PEOPLE IN COUNTY GOVERNMENT DEAL WITH PUBLIC
12 HEALTH IN THE BIG CITIES, YOU KNOW YOU CAN'T TAKE SOMEBODY
13 WITHOUT INTERVENTION, PUT THEM IN A FACILITY, AND EXPECT THEM
14 TO STAY THERE. THEY DO NOT STAY THERE. THEY DO WHAT THEY --
15 THEY DO DRUGS AND DO WHAT THEY DO. AND MENTALLY ILL. PART OF
16 THIS EQUATION SHOULD BE SOME LEGISLATION THAT HELPS DEAL WITH
17 THAT PROBLEM. THE OTHER IS, PART OF THE FORMULA OUGHT TO BE
18 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS THEY CAN FLEX SOME OF THEIR MONEY. YOU CAN
19 SUPPLEMENT WITH THIS. THAT OUGHT TO BE PART OF THE STRATEGY.
20 BUT I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE VERY SHORTSIGHTED IF WE DON'T
21 ADDRESS THIS MENTALLY ILL AND DRUG-ADDICTED. IT'S DESTROYING
22 OUR COMMUNITIES. THE THEFT IN OUR STORES IS JUST -- IT IS
23 STARTING TO IMPACT THE ECONOMY, AND I THINK WE HAVE A
24 RESPONSIBILITY TO ADDRESS THAT ISSUE. AND IT ISN'T JUST
25 HOMELESS. IT'S A PUBLIC HEALTH ISSUE. AND I THINK THIS GROUP



APRIL 26, 2023

1 NEEDS TO RECOGNIZE THAT AND LOOK FOR WAYS THAT WE CAN DEAL
2 WITH THAT. BUT YOU CAN INVEST ALL THE MONEY IN THE HOUSING, IF
3 YOU DON'T DEAL -- IF YOU'RE PUTTING THOSE PEOPLE IN HOUSING
4 WITHOUT INTERVENTION, YOUR ASSETS ARE GOING TO BE DESTROYED I
5 MEAN, EXAMPLE AFTER EXAMPLE. SO INTERVENTION IS INCREDIBLE.
6 AND I THINK WE HAVE A MORAL OBLIGATION TO DO THAT. I REALLY
7 DO. SO I HOPE IT'S PART OF OUR CONVERSATION AS WE GO FORWARD,
8 KATE.

9

10 **KATE HARTLEY:** IT WILL BE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** BUT THIS IS GREAT WORK. VERY SUPPORTIVE AND
13 I THINK IT'S HEADING RIGHT. THAT'S NOT LOSE SIGHT OF WHY MOST
14 OF THESE PEOPLE ARE ON THE STREET.

15

16 **KATE HARTLEY:** ABSOLUTELY.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY THANK YOU.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I JUST WANTED TO TALK
21 THE POINT. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT THE WRAP
22 AROUND SERVICES THAT IS NEEDED IN ANY FACILITY YOU BUILD, IT
23 IS A CRISIS SITUATION, AND IT HAS TO BE DEALT WITH. WHAT WE'RE
24 DOING IN CONTRA COSTA, IN PARTICULAR, IN THE CITY OF
25 PITTSBURGH, WHERE I LIVE, WE TOOK ADVANTAGE OF THE PROGRAM. WE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 ALSO BROUGHT THOSE SERVICES TO THEM. SO THERE IS A FEE
2 PROGRAM. THERE IS A PROGRAM WHERE CLOTHING IS GIVEN OUT ON A
3 REGULAR BASIS. SO THOSE WRAP AROUND SERVICES THAT'S NEEDED TO
4 MOVE PEOPLE FROM HOMELESSNESS AND, YOU KNOW, AN ENVIRONMENT
5 WHERE THEY ARE TRACKING TO GET THE TYPE OF SUPPORT SERVICES SO
6 THEY CAN TRANSITION OUT OF THE HOMELESS SITUATION IS
7 IMPORTANT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER GLOVER. DO WE
10 HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
11 COMMENT AT THIS TIME? OKAY WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM
12 COMMISSIONER THAO.

13

14 **SHENG THAO:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR GREAT WORK. WE'RE LOOKING INTO
15 THE QUESTION AROUND THE SERVICES PART. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE
16 DATA AROUND HOSPITALS AND COUNTY JAILS. RIGHT. THE DE FACTO
17 UTILIZATION OF HOSPITALS AND COUNTY JAILS FOR BEDS, FOR THE
18 MENTALLY ILL AND FOR THOSE THAT ARE USING. BECAUSE AT THE END
19 OF THE DAY, THAT'S A COST, AS WELL, TOO. RIGHT. IF WE'RE
20 HOUSING THEM IN A DEFECT WAY IN OUR HOSPITALS OR COUNTY
21 HOSPITALS OR COUNTY JAILS, LIKE, THAT'S A COST TO TAXPAYERS. I
22 WOULD LOVE TO SEE WHAT THE COST IS RELATIVE TO WHAT IT COULD
23 BE IF WE ADDRESS THE ISSUE HEAD ON. AND, YOU KNOW, ESPECIALLY
24 WITH THE COUNTY JAILS, WE KNOW THAT, YOU KNOW, THE EMPLOYEES



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AT THE COUNTY JAILS, THEY'RE NOT EQUIPPED FOR MENTAL HEALTH
2 SERVICES.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. LET'S GO TO
5 PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN WE'LL CLOSE IT UP WITH COMMISSIONER
6 COMMENTS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I'M STILL JERRY GLAZER. IS IT WORKS NOW? OKAY CLOSE
9 ENOUGH. I HAVE A LOUD ENOUGH VOICE. I LIVE IN PROBABLY THE
10 SMALLEST CITY IN SONOMA COUNTY. AND ONE OUT OF 100 PEOPLE IN
11 OUR TOWN IS HOMELESS. IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD, WE HAVE PUT UP AN
12 AREA NOW FOR ALL OF THEIR RVs, ALONG HIGHWAY 12 WE HAD
13 HUNDREDS OF PEOPLE LIVING IN TENTS THROUGH THE WORST PART OF
14 THE WINTER. I WASN'T SURPRISED ABOUT THE NUMBERS THAT WE HAVE
15 AND THE PUSH PEOPLE HAVE CARING ABOUT HOMELESSNESS. I JUST
16 WANTED TO MENTION THAT IN PART, BUT, REALLY, THE REASON I GOT
17 UP TO SPEAK WAS TECHNICAL QUESTION WAS THE BREAKDOWN BETWEEN
18 SANTA ROSA, FOR INSTANCE, AND THE REST OF THE COUNTY. SANTA
19 ROSA HAS HOUSING WHICH IS AFFORDABLE. MOST OF THE OTHER TOWNS
20 DO NOT HAVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO A LOT OF PEOPLE MOVE THERE
21 IN THOSE COMMUNITIES. AND YET I THINK THE LARGEST EMPLOYERS WE
22 HAVE IN SONOMA COUNTY AT LEAST IN OUR AREA IS HEALTH CARE. THE
23 SECOND LARGEST IS AG. THERE'S NOT A LOT OF AG IN SANTA ROSA.
24 I'M WONDERING FROM THE RATIO POINT OF VIEW, FOR THE OTHER
25 CITIES, AS WELL, INSTEAD OF LOOKING WHAT AT THE NEED IS AT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THIS INSTANCE IN TIME, FIGURE OUT WHAT PEOPLE WANT TO DO. DO
2 THEY WANT TO LIVE SOMEPLACE ELSE? AND SOMEPLACE ELSE WOULD BE
3 CLOSER TO WORK, WHICH WOULD FIT WELL WITH OUR INITIATIVES FOR
4 TRANSPORTATION. IF QUESTION GET MORE PEOPLE TO MOVE
5 CLOVERDALE. WE HAVE AN 80-UNIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING GOING UP
6 THAT IS BEING FINANCED BY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, AS WELL.
7 IT'S GOING TO BE RENTALS SO PEOPLE CAN AFFORD TO LIVE CLOSER
8 TO WHERE THEY WORK. THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS TO LOOK AT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN. I'M GOING
11 TO SPEAK WITH SOME HATS I DON'T USUALLY USE IN THIS BODY. I DO
12 A LOT WITH TRANSPORTATION, BUT MY HOME PROJECT IS MENLO
13 TOGETHER, WHICH IS A LOCAL GROUP THAT FOCUSES ON HOUSING
14 AFFORDABILITY AND TRANSPORTATION AND SUSTAINABILITY AND
15 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE. AND I'LL ALSO SUB REGIONAL FOR EVERYONE
16 SUPPORTING HOUSING. AND REALLY SEE THE IMPORTANCE AND URGENT
17 NEED OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND. I SAW WITH DISAPPOINTMENT
18 THAT MY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO POLLED THE LOWEST ON THE HOUSING
19 BOND, OR AMONG THE LOWEST, AND, YOU KNOW, EAGER TO BE OUT
20 THERE WITH MY LOCAL COMMUNITY PROJECTS YOU KNOW, WALKING AND,
21 YOU KNOW, DOING WHAT IT TAKES TO HELP GET THIS PASSED. AND THE
22 THRESHOLD CHANGED. WITH THAT, IN ORDER FOR THAT TO HAPPEN, WE
23 NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS VIABLE BECAUSE
24 THE HOUSING HAVING THE HOUSING DEPENDS ON THE TRANSIT AND THE
25 HOUSING WON'T WORK UNLESS THE TRANSIT IS THERE. SO FOR



APRIL 26, 2023

1 EVERYONE WHO IS ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
2 BOND, PLEASE DO WHAT YOU CAN TO BE TALKING TO OUR STATE
3 LEGISLATORS TO GET THEM TO PROVIDE THAT OPERATING FUNDING, TO
4 PROVIDE THAT BREATHING ROOM, THAT PLANNING ROOM, THAT STRATEGY
5 ROOM SO WE CAN GET A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE PASSED IN A
6 DIFFERENT YEAR WITH IMPROVED TRANSIT AND HAVE THE TRANSIT THAT
7 IT TAKES TO SUPPORT THE NEEDED AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THAT CONCLUDES OUR PUBLIC
10 COMMENT. THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING. AGAIN, KATE, THANK YOU
11 FOR THE PRESENTATION. YOU DEFINITELY STIMULATED THE MOST
12 COMMISSIONER DIALOGUE SO FAR. WELL DONE. I AGREE WITH A LOT OF
13 COMMENTS SAID IN TERMS OF THE FLEXIBILITY THAT WE HEARD. THE
14 WRAP AROUND SERVICES THAT WE HEARD. AND I JUST WANTED TO MAKE
15 SURE WE'RE FOCUSED ON OUTCOMES. IF WE DON'T GET THIS RIGHT,
16 AND THE RESIDENTS DON'T SEE NOTABLE DIFFERENCES, I THINK WE'RE
17 GOING TO SET THE REGION BACK. THERE'S A LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES
18 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN RESTRUCTURE IT RIGHT TO ACHIEVE AT
19 THE LOCAL LEVEL. AND A LOT IS THOSE AROUND THE TABLE THAT ARE
20 PART OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THAT HAVE TO BE PART OF THE
21 SOLUTION. IT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
22 AGAIN, COMMISSIONERS FOR PARTICIPATING. GREAT THOUGHTS. AT
23 THIS POINT MOVE ON TO WRAP UP. COMMISSIONERS, I KNOW WE'VE HAD
24 A FULL DAY. WE'RE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND HERE NOW. I KNOW NO ONE
25 IS COMPLAINING ABOUT THE DRIVE. BUT TODAY WAS ABOUT PAINTING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE CANVAS OF HOW WE GOT HERE. TALKING ABOUT HOUSING IN 2024,
2 AND WE'VE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY ON THIS. THIS IS SOMETHING ABAG
3 FROM THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HAS BEEN KNEE DEEP INTO. MAKING SURE
4 WE WORK TOGETHER ON IT AND TRYING TO PROTECT 2024 AND BEING
5 THOUGHTFUL ON THAT BALLOT. IT SOUNDS LIKE THERE'S CONSENSUS ON
6 THAT PRIORITY. FOR TOMORROW, AS I SHARED WITH, YOU KNOW, WE
7 HAD A ROBUST CONVERSATION ABOUT FISCAL CLIFF. THAT COULD HAVE
8 GONE ON LONGER. I APPRECIATE YOUR MINDFULNESS. WE DO WANT TO
9 TALK MORE ABOUT THAT TOMORROW. AND, AGAIN, WHAT YOU'LL HEAR
10 TOMORROW, YOU SAW SOME OF THE POLLING THAT I THINK LEVEL SETS
11 THE DISCUSSION WHAT WE'VE BEEN DOING WITH THE TRANSFORMATION
12 ACTION PLAN. WHAT ARE SOME OF THE THINGS WE'VE BEEN DOING ON.
13 WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO SEE OUTCOMES. WHAT ARE SOME OF THE THINGS
14 WE WANT TO DO? AND I THINK OUR RESIDENTS, OUR USERS WANT
15 ACTION FROM US. BUT MY TAKE AWAY FROM THE POLLING THAT WE SAW
16 IS THERE'S SOME OPPORTUNITIES NOW. WE CAN START WORKING ON
17 THEM. THOSE THAT ARE USING TRANSIT NOW, THOSE ARE NOT USING IT
18 THAT SHOULD BE USING IT, THERE'S INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITIES FOR
19 US. I THINK THIS IS SOMETHING WE HAVE TO LEAN ON TO PREPARE
20 FOR US FOR 2026, IF THERE'S SOMETHING TO GO ON THE BALLOT IN
21 2026. BUSINESS AS USUAL CANNOT BE WHAT WE DO. I THINK WITH
22 NETWORK MANAGEMENT, IT'S SOMETHING I'M FULLY COMMITTED TO AS
23 CHAIR. HOW WE LAND THIS, I'M INTERESTED IN IT BEING A LITTLE
24 TURBULENT IF IT MEANS PROGRESS. IT MEANS WORKING WITH OUR
25 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO MAKE SURE IT'S NOT BUSINESS AS USUAL. WE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 CANNOT GO BACK TO BUSINESS AS USUAL. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO
2 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND WHAT IT MEANS TO THE USERS IN THE BAY
3 AREA. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT. I KNOW THERE MIGHT BE SOME
4 QUESTIONS WHEN THE RECEPTION IS. THERE ISN'T ANY CHANGES.
5 WE'RE DRINKING WINE. I'M NOT SURE ON THE TIMING. I'M TURN IT
6 OVER TO ANDY TO GIVE US CLARITY.

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH. CLARITY MAY NOT BE MY STRONG SUIT HERE
9 ON THE SUBJECT. ON THE SUBJECT, OKAY RIGHT NOW WE'RE STILL
10 PLANNING ON THIS ROOM TURNING INTO A RECEPTION. WITH LIGHT
11 APPETIZERS AND SOME SOUNDS LIKE NAPA AND SOLANO WINE. UNLESS
12 VICTORIA HAS SOMETHING FROM SONOMA FOR US. [LAUGHTER] SMALL
13 CAR, I GUESS, NO TRUNK. [LAUGHTER]

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET'S STAY ON COURSE.

16

17 **ANDREW FREMIER:** DINNER AT 6:30. WE'RE LOOKING TO SEE IF WE CAN
18 START A LITTLE BIT EARLIER ON THE TERRACE. IT'S NICE OUT
19 THERE. I DON'T HAVE ANY WORD ON THE ABILITY TO CHANGE IT

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IF NOT, THERE'S PUBLIC AREA OUTSIDE
22 THIS BUILDING THAT IS OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. I THINK THE PRIORITY
23 FOR THOSE WHO HAVEN'T CHECKED IN CHECK IN. SOME OF THE ROOMS
24 MIGHT BE A LITTLE BIT OF A WALKING DISTANCE, YOU CAN GET YOUR
25 STEPS IN, IF ANYONE WANTS TO WALK. THIS RECEPTION AREA IS OPEN



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TO THE PUBLIC, SO WE CAN KIND OF WORK FROM THERE. AT THIS
2 POINT, AGAIN -- 6:00 BACK HERE, CORRECT. FOR DINNER. AGAIN
3 TOMORROW WE'RE STARTING AT 9:30. MAKE SURE THAT YOU'RE READY
4 FOR A GREAT CONVERSATION! SO ANY FINAL THOUGHTS? ANDY OR ALIX?

5

6 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NO. 6:45 IS DINNER. 6:00 IS LIGHT APPETIZERS.
7 I THINK IT WAS HELPFUL. I DID DEFINITELY HEAR A FEW THINGS
8 THAT WERE RIGHT IN LINE WITH WHAT WE WERE ASKING I MEAN, THE
9 THEME IS CLEARLY STRONGER TOGETHER. IT'S GOOD FOR THE LAWYERS
10 TONIGHT MAYBE. A LOT OF SUPPORT FOR CONTINUING SORT OF THE
11 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE EFFORTS. THOSE COME WITH RESOURCE. THAT'S
12 A LOT OF HAND HOLDING BUT IT'S IMPORTANT. IT SOUNDS LIKE
13 THERE'S A REAL STRONG COMMITMENT TO STAY THE COURSE ON THE
14 HOUSING BOND AND CONSIDER WHAT IS NEXT FOR TRANSIT A COUPLE OF
15 YEARS LATER, I THINK IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON.
16 AND THEN, CLEARLY, MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE COMING UP WITH SOME
17 WAYS TO MEASURE OUR SUCCESS AND MOVING FORWARD. THAT'S THE
18 REPEATED THEME. SO I THINK THIS IS HELPFUL FOR ME. I'M
19 ASSUMING FOR US.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU TO THE TEAM,
22 AGAIN, FOR SETTING THIS UP. AND TO THE STAFF. WE GREATLY
23 APPRECIATE IT. AT THIS POINT, WE'LL SEE EVERYONE SHORTLY.
24 THANK YOU.

25



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript**

APRIL 26, 2023

1



Broadcasting Government