

An aerial photograph of a city street grid, viewed from a high angle. The streets form a complex network of lines, with some major thoroughfares and many smaller local streets. The entire image is overlaid with a semi-transparent blue filter, giving it a monochromatic, official appearance.

ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

EXECUTIVE BOARD

THURSDAY, MAY 18th, 2023, 5:10 PM

FRED CASTRO, CLERK: BEFORE WE BEGIN, THERE ARE FEW
HOUSEKEEPING ITEMS. JUST ABOVE THE CONTROL ROOM YOU WILL SEE
AN ON AIR SIGN. WHEN THE SIGN IS ILLUMINATED, WE ARE IN
SESSION. THE ON AIR SIGN WILL TURN OFF WHEN WE TRANSITION
BETWEEN MEETINGS. FOR MEMBERS AT THE DAIS, WHENEVER YOUR
MICROPHONE IS NOT IN USE, PLEASE BE SURE TO TURN YOUR
MICROPHONE OFF AS WELL AS YOUR OTHER ELECTRONIC DEVICES. FOR
MEMBERS PARTICIPATING FROM TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, THE ZOOM
WEBINAR IS NOW LIVE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE ABAG
WEBSITE. MEMBERS PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK,
SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU
WILL BE CALLED TO SPEAK. DURING PUBLIC COMMENT, MEMBERS OF THE
PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE TO
RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL *9. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL
BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THE PHONE NUMBER. IN
PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE
PODIUM AND WE'LL CALL ON PUBLIC MEMBERS TO SPEAK BECAUSE THERE
IS A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION, THE ROLL CALL FORUM AND FOR
VOTING ON MOTIONS WILL BE TAKEN. THANK YOU.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. I SEE WE ARE
2 BROADCASTING. GOOD EVENING I'M BERKELEY MAYOR JESSE ARREQUIN,
3 PRESIDENT OF THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS EXECUTIVE
4 BOARD. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE
5 BOARD TO ORDER AND ASK THE CLERK, FRED CASTRO TO CONDUCT ROLL
6 CALL ASK CONFIRM QUORUM PRESENCE?

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** YES, SIR. SUPERVISOR ANDERSON?

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** HERE.

11

12 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN?

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** PRESENT.

15

16 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** FORTUNATO BAS?

17

18 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** PRESENT.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MAYOR BREED? IS ABSENT.

21 SUPERVISOR CARLSON?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG? IS ABSENT. FIFE IS ABSENT.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FLIGOR?

6

7 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** HERE.

8

9 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MAYOR GARCIA?

10

11 **LEON GARCIA:** HERE.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DIRECTOR HILLIS? IS ABSENT. MAYOR HUDSON?

14 IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR KAMEI?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** SUPERVISOR LEE? IS ABSENT. MANDELMAN? IS

19 ABSENT. MARQUEZ?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BELTRAN? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MELGAR?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. ORTIZ?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

5

6 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS? IS ABSENT.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REID?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO IS WITH US, BUT NOT

12 AT A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. SUPERVISOR SACKETT? IS ABSENT.

13 MAYOR SILVA?

14

15 **CINDY SILVA:** PRESENT AT 1601 CIVIC DRIVE AT WALNUT CREEK

16 CENTER FOR THE ARTS AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

17 WITH ME.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MAYOR TIEDEMANN?

20

21 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** HERE.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** YOUNG IS ABSENT. COUNCIL MEMBER JIMINEZ
3 FROM SAN JOSE?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

6

7 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** LOPEZ? CAMPBELL?

8

9 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** HERE.

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** AND COUNCIL MEMBER ZOLMAN FROM SEBASTOPOL?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M HERE LOCATED AT MADISON AVENUE IN NOVATO.

14

15 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH WE HAVE 20
18 MEMBERS PRESENT FOR QUORUM. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IS
19 THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM OR
20 TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS THAT WISH TO MAKE COMMENT? SEEING
21 NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER IN ATTENDEES WITH A
24 HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER --

25

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** COUNCIL MEMBER REID?

2

3 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** YES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I'M THE ALTERNATE, AND I JUST WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW
6 THAT I'M AT FRANCO GALLOW PLAZA.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THAT'S MAYOR MOTOYAMA FROM EL
9 CERRITO.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THAT IS THE MAYOR -- ALTERNATE.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ALL REPS ARE HERE? YES. MAYOR, I
14 THINK ALL THE APPOINTED CITY REPS FOR CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES
15 ARE HERE, BUT IF YOU WANT TO PARTICIPATE IN THE DISCUSSION WE
16 WELCOME YOUR PARTICIPATION. THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. SHE SAID THAT'S GREAT.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** EXCELLENT. WE'LL GO TO THE SPEAKER
21 ON ZOOM.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** OUR SPEAKER IN ATTENDEES PAUL SOTO. YOU
24 HAVE TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** PAUL SOTO FROM THE BARRIO HORSESHOE IN SAN JOSE.
2 AGAIN, RACIAL EQUITY, IT'S NOT SOMETHING TO TALK ABOUT
3 SUBJECTIVELY OR VIA INTERPRETATION OR ASPIRATIONALLY. FOR
4 RACIAL EQUITY TO BE BINDING WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF ANY
5 GOVERNMENT, IT MUST BE INSTITUTIONALIZED, AND IT MUST BE,
6 ALSO, LEGALLY BINDING. AND WE HAVE AS A PROBLEM BOTH IN THE
7 CITY OF SAN JOSE AND THE COUNTIES OF SANTA CLARA, IS THE
8 DECLARATION IS ASPIRATIONAL NOT LEGALLY BINDING. IT'S VAGUE
9 YOU CAN TELL A BUNCH OF LAWYERS WROTE IT BECAUSE THAT I WANTED
10 AS MUCH SPACE SO TEA KOONTZ BE NAILED DOWN TO AN EXACT
11 DEFINITION AND SECONDLY THE COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA IS OPERATING
12 AROUND NO DEFINITION. THEESHZ ALL LEGAL DOCUMENTS WHEN YOU
13 LOOK IT'S THE DOCUMENTS IT SAYS RACIAL EQUITY WAS APPLIED BUT
14 YET NO LEGALLY BINDING DEFINITION OF WHAT THAT MEANS THAT IS
15 FRAUD ON THE PUBLIC. WE CAN'T BE THINKING THAT RACIAL -- AND
16 THE REASON I'M PUSHING THIS IS BECAUSE I HAVE BEEN A VICTIM, A
17 STRAIGHT VICTIM OF THE RED LINING POLICIES THAT HAPPENED IN
18 SAN JOSE IN 1939 AND ALL THE GENERATIONAL MACS OF IT AND SO
19 HAS THE ENTIRE REGION. YOU LOOK AT EVERY CITY IN THE NINE
20 COUNTY AREAS EVERY ONE EVER THESE CITIES AND COUNTIES HAS A
21 REDS LINE DISTRICT IN IT. WHEN YOU PUT THAT AND COMPARE THAT
22 WITH CRIME DATA, THE RED LINE DISTRICTS ARE THE ONES WITH THE
23 MOST CRIME. THAT'S NOT BY COINCIDENCE PEOPLE THAT IS BY
24 DESIGN, WE NEED TO GET TO THE POINT AND I'LL HELP YOU GET
25 THERE. I WILL HELP YOU GET THERE.

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENT ON ITEMS THAT ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA?

4

5 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
6 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT
7 SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. AND FROM TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS
8 SEEING NONE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ITEM THREE EXECUTIVE BOARD
11 ANNOUNCEMENTS INFORMATION ITEM ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS
12 FROM MEMBERS OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD? ANYONE HERE IN THE
13 ROOM? ANYONE ON ZOOM? I DO NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. SO WE'LL
14 ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. ANYONE HERE IN THE
15 BOARDROOM PLEASE COME FORWARD IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THIS
16 ITEM OR ON ZOOM OR AT TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS?

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
20 ON THIS ITEM. AND FOR THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I SEE AND
21 HEAR THAT THERE ARE NONE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR
24 THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT. INFORMATION ITEM, MY REPORT FOR MAY
25 18TH, 2023. I WANT TO THANK AND WELCOME COLLEAGUES HERE AT THE

MAY 18, 2023

1 METRO CENTER FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS EVENING'S ABAG
2 EXECUTIVE BOARD REGULAR MEETING AND THOSE PARTICIPATING
3 THROUGH VIDEO CONFERENCE. I WANT TO FIRST ALSO WELCOME SOME
4 NEW MEMBERS JOINING US TODAY, NEWLY APPOINTED ALAMEDA COUNTIES
5 SUPERVISOR, ALYSSA MARQUEZ, THANK YOU FOR JOINING US TONIGHT,
6 AND WE HAVE THE ALTERNATE FOR VICE MAYOR ADAMS, COUNCIL MEMBER
7 STEVEN ZOLLMAN FROM SEBASTOPOL. THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HAPPY TO BE HERE.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** UNDER THE CONSENT CALENDAR A NUMBER
12 OF BILLS THAT WERE REFERRED FROM THE JOINTS MTC ABAG
13 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE OR WERE REPORTED DIRECTLY BECAUSE WE HAD
14 TO CANCEL OUR MEETING LAST WEEK AND WE'LL GET TO THAT TONIGHT.
15 STATE HOUSING COMMUNITIES DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT'S WORK ISSUE
16 RELATED TO THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION AND THE
17 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION CONTINUATION OF DISCUSSION
18 WE HEARD LAST YEAR FOLLOWING UP ON THE RHNA PROCESS THAT WE
19 CONDUCTED OVER THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS HERE IN THE SAN
20 FRANCISCO BAY AREA. I ALSO WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO AN E-MAIL
21 THAT I RESPONSIBILITY RECENTLY ENCOURAGING ALL OF THE
22 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS TO SERVE AS YOUR JURISDICTIONS
23 OFFICIAL GENERAL ASSEMBLY DELEGATE, FOR THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY
24 WE'LL BE HAVING ON JUNE 18TH. I BELIEVE HAVING EXECUTIVE BOARD
25 PARTICIPATION AT THE GA WILL NOT ONLY HELP US ACHIEVE QUORUM,

MAY 18, 2023

1 BUT WILL HELP INCREASE OF THE INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE IN THE
2 ROOM WHEN WE DISCUSS THE BUDGET AND DUE STRUCTURE MANY OF US
3 PARTICIPATED IN THE WORKSHOP AND SEVERAL EXECUTIVE BOARD
4 DISCUSSIONS ON THE BUDGET AND EFFORTS TO ADDRESS OUR
5 STRUCTURAL DEFICIT AND I THINK THAT INFORMATION WILL BE
6 HELPFUL TO SHARE WITH THE ASSEMBLY. THAT IS A SUGGESTION FOR
7 YOUR CONSIDERATION. AND WITH THAT, THIS CONCLUDES MY REPORTS.
8 ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES, JESSE?

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** COUNCIL MEMBER EKLUND?

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR ARREGUIN. ON THE
15 GENERAL ASSEMBLY DELEGATE, WHO DO WE JUST SAY THAT -- WHO --
16 DO WE HAVE TO SEND AN E-MAIL TO FRED SAYING I'M THE DELEGATE
17 FOR NOVATO?

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THIS IS FRED, CLERK, FRED CASTRO, I E-
20 MAILED ALL THE CLERKS OF THE CITIES ASKING FOR CONFIRMATION OF
21 THEIR RESPECTIVE DELEGATES AND ALTERNATES I'LL HAVE THAT LIST
22 COMPLETED. THANK YOU.

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION OR COMMENTS?
2 IF NOT I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT? SEEING NONE RAISED HANDS.
3 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

4

5 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT
6 RECEIVED, WE HAVE ONE HANDS RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE
7 BOARDROOM, I'LL GO TO TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS. WE HAVE NO
8 MEMBER THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE
9 TO ALLOW?

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** PAUL SOTO YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** PAUL HORSESHOE BARRIO. I'M LOOKING FOR ITEM EIGHT.
16 YOU'RE GOING REALLY, REALLY FAST.

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** WE'RE NOT THERE YET.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANYONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON
23 ITEM FOUR? SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. THAT COMPLETES PUBLIC
24 COMMENT PROCEEDING TO ITEM FIVE, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S

MAY 18, 2023

1 REPORT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. I'LL BE QUICK.
5 ONE ITEM TO NOTE OUR OWN KATE HARTLEY WHO IS IN THE ROOM IS
6 MAKE THE ROUNDS AROUND THE REGION TALK BY THE TIME BAY AREA
7 HEADQUARTERS FINANCING AUTHORITY AND THE GENERAL OBLIGATION
8 HOUSING BOND. IN APRIL SHE WAS IN SONOMA COUNTY SUPERVISED BY
9 DIRECTOR RABBITT AND IN MAY, SHE -- YEAH, IN MAY, SHE WILL BE
10 IN SOLANO COUNTIES SUPERVISED BY MTC COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING,
11 AND THEN ALSO I WOULD LIKE TO REMIND FOLKS THAT THE
12 REGISTRATION FOR THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY BUSINESS MEETING ON JUNE
13 16TH IS AVAILABLE ON EVEN BRIGHT, AND THERE IS A LINK FOR YOU
14 ALL IN THE PACKET. THE IN-PERSON MEETING INCLUDES THE BUSINESS
15 MEETING AND THAT'S FROM 10 TO 11:30 AND AS THE PRESIDENT
16 MENTIONED WE REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE FOLKS TO SHOW UP FOR --
17 BECAUSE WE DO REQUIRE A QUORUM FOR THAT MEETING. AND WITH THAT
18 I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
21 QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** JUST ONE QUESTION. BECAUSE QUORUM IS OFTEN AN ISSUE,
24 IS THERE THE REMOTE POSSIBILITY THAT PEOPLE NOTICE
25 APPROPRIATELY? I KNOW TYPICALLY WE HAVE HAD SUCH LARGE GENERAL

MAY 18, 2023

1 ASSEMBLIES WE HAVE NEVER ATTEMPTED IT BUT I'M CURIOUS IF THAT
2 IS AN OPTION SHOULD PEOPLE WISH TO POST A NOTICE IN LOCATIONS?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YES, MISS BOCKELMAN?

5

6 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. PRESIDENT
7 ARREGUIN, I THINK WE HAD REACHED OUT AND I THINK AT THIS POINT
8 WE WERE GOING TO MAKE IT AN IN-PERSON MEETING AND CERTAINLY IF
9 THE PRESIDENT WANTS TO EXPLORE SOMETHING ELSE LATER WE CAN
10 TALK ABOUT THAT BUT I THINK AT THIS POINT WE'RE PLANNING ON AN
11 IN-PERSON MEETING.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THIS IS GOING TO BE REALLY
16 DIFFICULT TO MANAGE WITH, LIKE, 80, 90S --

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** NO, IT COMPLETELY WOULD. I ALWAYS WISH ABOUT
19 THE QUORUM ISSUE. ABSOLUTELY I THINK IN-PERSON IS BETTER.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** I THINK WE CAN ASSESS THE POSTING
22 REQUIREMENTS IN THE AGENDA IS 72 HOURS PER BROWN ACT. IF WE
23 GET A SENSE LEADING UP TO THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY THAT WE MAY
24 HAVE DIFFICULTY ACHIEVING IN-PERSON QUORUM THEN WE MAY WANT TO

MAY 18, 2023

1 ENTERTAIN ALLOWING A ZOOM OPTION, BUT AT THE PRESENT TIME
2 WE'RE REQUESTING IN-PERSON.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE'LL HAVE A POLL.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** WE'LL HAVE A DAY OF PROGRAMMING
7 THAT WE ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO ATTEND AND LISTEN AND PARTICIPATE
8 IN WE'LL HAVE BREAKFAST AND LUNCH AND HOPEFULLY MAYBE
9 OPPORTUNITY FOR MANY OF US TO SEE OUR COLLEAGUES WE HAVEN'T
10 SEEN IN SOMETIME. FOR NOW, IN-PERSON, BUT IF WE NEED TO
11 EVALUATE THAT WE CAN.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO ASK THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR IF YOU COULD
14 PLEASE REPEAT WHAT YOU HAD MENTIONED THAT'S COMING TAKING
15 PLACE EXCUSE ME IN SOLANO COUNTY, COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING
16 WOULD BE PRESENT FROM MTC?

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH, THE BAY AREA HEADQUARTERS FINANCING
19 AUTHORITIES HAS AN INFORMATIONAL MEETING IN MAY IT'S A
20 PRESENTATION TO THE COMMUNITIES ACTION PARTNERSHIP IN SOLANO,
21 A JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY UP THERE AND WE ANTICIPATE THAT
22 COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING AND COUNTY SUPERVISOR NASH BYRNE WILL
23 BE THERE.

24

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AND COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS IS ALSO
2 WELCOME TO ATTEND, AS WELL.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** ABSOLUTELY.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON
7 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT? ANYONE ON ZOOM? OKAY. IF NOT,
8 I'LL ASK IF ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
9 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM ARE? ANY MEMBERS OF
10 THE PUBLIC ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK? WE'RE ON ITEM FIVE OF THE
11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. MR. SOTO?

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15 ON THIS ITEM. LET ME CHECK ON THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS IF
16 THERE ARE ANY PUBLIC PUBLICITY MEMBERS THERE. I SEE NONE. MR.
17 SOTO HAS JUST DROPPED --

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** I THINK HE WANTS TO SPEAK ON ITEM
20 EIGHT. OKAY SEEING NO PUBLIC COMMENTS WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM
21 SIX THE EXECUTIVE BOARD CONSENT CALENDAR. LET ME READ THE
22 ITEMS VERY QUICKLY AS I'M REQUIRED TO DO SO. 6A APPROVAL OF
23 MINUTES OF APRIL 2023, 6 B AUTHORIZATION CONTRACT WITH
24 DIALECTICS INCORPORATED NOT TO EXCEED \$900,000 BE, DATABASE
25 SERVICES AUTHORIZATION AMEND FUNDING PG&E, SIX D SEEK

MAY 18, 2023

1 AMENDMENT -- SIX F10 FAMILY MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING PROGRAM
2 CONSTRUCTION LOAN SUPPORT. SIX G AUTHORIZATION TO ACCEPT FROM
3 US CPA IMPLEMENTING SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY BLUEPRINT AND
4 ASSEMBLY BILL 1335 FORECASTING FOR LONG RANGE PLANS. I WOULD
5 LIKE TO ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER WHO WISHES TO PULL AN ITEM
6 FOR DISCUSSION?

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

9

10 **MARK NAGALES:** SECOND.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** MOTION AND SECOND. COUNCILMEMBER
13 FORTUNATO-BAS?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I -- I JUST WANTED TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF
16 ASSEMBLY BILL 645, THE FRIEDMAN SPEED SAFETY PILOT PROGRAM.
17 OAKLAND IS ONE OF THE PILOT CITIES. WE ARE SUPPORTIVE, AND
18 WE'RE GLAD TO BE INCLUDED. WE SEE THIS AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO
19 DECREASE SPEEDING AND CREATE SAFETY IN OUR HIGH INJURY NETWORK
20 AS WELL AS AROUND SCHOOLS. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF EQUITY
21 CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE ARE -- THAT WE WOULD BUILD INTO OUR
22 PLAN AND AS YOU KNOW IT WOULD BE A COMMUNITIES DRIVEN PROCESS.
23 GLAD TO SEE THAT ABAG IS POTENTIALLY IN SUPPORT OF THIS
24 LEGISLATION AGAIN. THANK YOU.

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO ADD THAT AT
2 THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE WE ALSO ASK IN THE PROCESS OF
3 TRANSMITTING OUR JOINTS POSITION WE ENCOURAGE THE AUTHOR TO
4 CONSIDER ADDING MORE CITY. WE UNDERSTAND THAT MAY NOT BE
5 POSSIBLE BUT MANY OF US WOULD LOVE TO BE PART OF THIS PROGRAM.
6 I ASSUME ALL BILLS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ARE MADE OUT OF APROPS
7 TODAY? THEY WENT TO APROPS? THAT ONE DID? OKAY. THAT'S GREAT.
8 ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENT ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR FROM
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS? SEEING NONE. ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM
10 WISHING TO SPEAK? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT. ITEM SIX,
11 CONSENT CALENDAR?

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE ATTENDEES FOR
14 PUBLIC COMMENT AND LET ME CHECK WITH THE TELECONFERENCE
15 LOCATIONS. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS AT THE TELECONFERENCE
16 LOCATIONS. WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER IN THE ATTENDEE ROOM. PAUL SOTO
17 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES PLEASE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** PAUL SOTO FROM THE HORSESHOE. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK IF
20 YOU CAN RECONSIDER ON THE POPULATION. I'M SPEAKING ON 6H. SAN
21 JOSE FORECASTS FOUR HUNDREDS THOUSAND PEOPLE TO COME TO SAN
22 JOSE BY 2040. NOW THIS IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE WHAT THEY'RE DOING
23 IS BUILDING AN INFRASTRUCTURE NOW TO ACCOMMODATE THOSE 400,000
24 PEOPLE THAT AREN'T EVEN CITIZENS OF OUR CITY YET. SO THIS
25 MEANS, THIS IS A FRAUD ON THE PUBLIC. THEY'RE LITERALLY LYING

MAY 18, 2023

1 TO THE PUBLIC. SO, WHAT MY CONCERN IS, IS THAT OTHER COUNTIES
2 ARE ALSO AWARE THAT THEY ARE CREATING THIS INFRASTRUCTURE TO
3 ACCOMMODATE CITIZENS THAT AREN'T EVEN THERE YET BUT THEY'RE
4 USING THE TAX DOLLARS OF THE CURRENT CITIZENS IN ORDER TO
5 FORTIFY THAT. I MEAN, THIS IS ACTUALLY DISGUSTING. BECAUSE
6 WHAT IT IS, IS GENOCIDE WITH MANNERS. THAT'S ALL IT IS. IT'S
7 GENOCIDE WITH MANNERS. BECAUSE IN ORDER TO ACCOMMODATE THAT
8 INFLUX OF 400,000 PEOPLE YOU ARE GOING TO NECESSARY EASTERLY
9 HAVE TO REMOVE AT LEAST 200,000 PEOPLE AND THIS IS BY
10 INTENTION AND THE CITY OF SAN JOSE IS LYING TO THE PUBLIC.
11 THEY'RE LYING. BECAUSE THIS IS DOCUMENTED THAT THERE IS
12 400,000 PEOPLE THAT THEY ARE PLANNING. WHAT I'M LOOKING FOR IS
13 THAT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT TRANSPARENCY TALK ABOUT IT BE ABOUT IT
14 WHEN WE PUT THAT ON THE TABLE DISCUSSING WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF
15 THE POLICY, JUST TALK ABOUT OPENLY ABOUT WHAT YOU HAVE PLANNED
16 FOR THIS REGION AND WHY THE PUBLIC DOESN'T HAVE A SAY IN THAT
17 BECAUSE IT AFFECTS OUR TAX DOLLARS BECAUSE IT'S USING TO
18 FORTIFY AN INFRASTRUCTURE FOR PEOPLE THAT AREN'T EVEN HERE
19 YET. THANK YOU.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. IS THERE ANYONE
22 ELSE ON ZOOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON ITEM SIX? I DON'T SEE
23 ANY OTHER HANDS RAISED. ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED MR.
24 CASTRO?

25

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FOR THIS
2 ITEM.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. UNLESS THERE IS
5 FURTHER DISCUSSION ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR, I'LL ASK THE CLERK
6 TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ON THE MOTION BY EKLUND, SECOND BY NA
9 GALS. SUPERVISOR ANDERSON?

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN?

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AYE.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** FORTUNATO BAS?

18

19 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** AYE.

20

21 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BREED IS ABSENT. CARLSON?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG IS ABSENT. FIFE IS ABSENT.

5 FLIGOR?

6

7 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

8

9 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MAYOR GARCIA?

10

11 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DIRECTOR HILLIS? IS ABSENT. MAYOR HUDSON?

14 IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR KAMEI?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** SUPERVISOR LEE? IS ABSENT. MANDELMAN IS

19 ABSENT. MARQUEZ?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MELGAR?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MUELLER IS ABSENT. NA
3 GALS?

4

5 **MARK NAGALES:** AYE.

6

7 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ORTIZ?

8

9 **PETER ORTIZ:** AYE.

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS? IS ABSENT.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER REID?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

15

16 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO IS NOT AT
17 A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. SACKETT? SILVA?

18

19 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

20

21 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** TIEDEMANN?

22

23 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** YES.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

21

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YES.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MAYOR YOUNG IS ABSENT. JIMINEZ?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HE IS -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

11

12 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** AYE.

13

14 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. AND COUNCIL MEMBER ZOLMAN?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DID I MISS ANYBODY? MOTION PASSES

19 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. THAT MOTION DOES CARRY.

22 NEXT ITEM ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE REPORT FROM OUR

23 MEETING OF APRIL 14TH, 2023 SINCE WE DIDN'T HAVE THE MAY 12TH,

24 2023 MEETING. I'LL GIVE THE REPORT. THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE

25 COMMITTEE MET JOINTLY WITH THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ON

MAY 18, 2023

1 APRIL 14TH, 2023 AND APPROVED THE FOLLOWING UNDER THE CONSENT
2 CALENDAR AN ITEM AUTHORIZING ENTERING INTO A SUBAWARD WITH THE
3 CITY OF ALAMEDA FOR THE SAN LEANDRO OPERATIONAL LANDSCAPE UNIT
4 ADAPTATION PROJECT FOR \$300,000, BETWEEN MARCH 2023 AND
5 OCTOBER 31st 2025. THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE RECEIVED
6 AND APPROVED THE FOLLOWING REPORTS PROPOSED TRANSPORTATION
7 ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED
8 TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVES AS PART OF THE OBAG
9 3 CLIMATE PROGRAM INVESTMENTS TO ADVANCE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
10 IMPLEMENTATION. AND WE ALSO RECEIVED A PRESENTATION ON THE SEA
11 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING AND INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK, FINAL
12 FINDINGS AND NEXT STEPS. AND THIS IS A SUMMARY OF THE
13 CONCLUSION OF THE SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING AND
14 INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK INCLUDING HIGH-LEVEL ANALYSIS AND
15 FINDINGS. AS NOTED THE MAY 27th MEETING WAS CANCELED. THIS
16 CONCLUDES THE COMMITTEE REPORT. ANY QUESTIONS? SEEING NONE. IS
17 THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENT? PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
21 ON THIS ITEM. CHECKING WITH THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS. I
22 SEE AND HEAR NO PUBLIC COMMENT THERE IS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM EIGHT. 8A IS
25 A REPORT FROM THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG

MAY 18, 2023

1 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE OF APRIL 14TH, 2023. GIVEN THAT THE
2 MEETING ON MAY 12TH WAS CANCELED DUE TO LACK OF QUORUM, I WILL
3 ALSO GIVE THAT REPORT.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** CHAIR, DO YOU NEED A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REPORT
6 FROM THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE?

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** NO. IT'S FOR INFORMATION PURPOSES.
9 NO ACTION NEEDED. THANK YOU, THOUGH. SO, THE ABAG -- JOINT MTC
10 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET APRIL
11 14TH, 2023, AND THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG
12 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MEETING ORIGINALLY SCHEDULED FOR MAY
13 12TH, 2023 WAS CANCELED. THE FOLLOWING BILLS WERE REFERS OR
14 REPORTED DIRECTLY TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD INCLUDED IN THE
15 CONSENT CALENDAR, A.B. 1489 CROSSWALK AND A.B. 645 FRIEDMAN,
16 A.B. 1435, POPULATION FORECASTING FOR LONG RANGE PLANS.
17 FOLLOWING BILLS AND REPORTS WILL BE TAKEN BY THE EXECUTIVE
18 BOARD NEXT ON THE AGENDA SENATE BILL 532 LOCAL BALLOT MEASURE
19 LABELS, AB 817 PACHECO, BROWN ACT TELECONFERENCING AND REFORM
20 AND WE'LL RECEIVED UPDATE ON THE FY 2023, 2024 STATE BUDGET.
21 CONCLUDES THE COMMITTEE REPORT. I'LL ASK FOR DISCUSSION OR
22 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE COMMITTEE REPORT?
23 SEEING NONE.

24

MAY 18, 2023

1 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED. ONE SPEAKER
2 IN THE ROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. PAUL SOTO. YOU HAVE TWO
3 MINUTES.

4
5 **SPEAKER:** PAUL SOTO HORSESHOE THANK YOU ASSEMBLYMEMBER PACHECO
6 FOR PUTTING THIS IN. THE REASON THIS IS IMPORTANT IS THAT ZOOM
7 DEMOCRATIZED OUR SYSTEM IN THIS TECHNOLOGICAL AGE AND I'M
8 APPRECIATIVE OF THAT IT EMPOWERED THE PEOPLE, NECESSARILY HAVE
9 NOT EXERCISED POWER WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF GOVERNMENT. THESE
10 SUBCOMMITTEES, THEY INFORM PUBLIC POLICY BECAUSE THEY ARE THE
11 ONES THAT HAVE THE MEETING AND THEN THEY SUBMIT THEIR
12 PAPERWORK TO EITHER THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OR THE CITY
13 COUNCILS AND THEN THEY USE THAT AS A MEASURE BY WHICH TO
14 GOVERN THEIR CONVERSATIONS. AND, SO, THERE IS A VERY CLEAR
15 DISTINCT RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE TWO. AND SO SAN JOSE HAS
16 DONE AN EXCELLENT JOB OF MAINTAINING THAT. BUT IF THEY CAN
17 EXCLUDE IT, THEY WOULD AND THIS IS AN EQUITY ISSUE THIS IS
18 WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT, ABOUT RACIAL EQUITY BEING LEGALLY
19 BINDING IT MUST BE IN EVERY ELEMENT OF GOVERNMENT. AND RACIAL
20 EQUITY IS AN ISSUE HERE. BECAUSE WE CAN'T BE DRIVING ALL OVER
21 THE PLACE. I DON'T WANT TO BE DRIVING IN THE WINTER TIME TO
22 THESE MEETINGS I CAN'T GOT NO MONEY TO DO THAT. I'M TOO POOR
23 TO HAVE A CAR. THIS DEMOCRATIZES THE SYSTEM AND ALLOWS
24 PARTICIPATION IN THESE MEETINGS SO WE CAN INFORM THE
25 SUBCOMMITTEES AND THEY IN TURN INFORM THE CITY COUNCILS AND

MAY 18, 2023

1 THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. IT'S ABSOLUTELY AN ISSUE. I DON'T
2 WANT EQUITY ONLY TALKED ABOUT WHEN IT'S A GRANT ALLOCATION FOR
3 A NON-PROFIT. THAT'S NOT EQUITY. THAT'S HUSH MONEY IS THAT
4 WHAT THAT IS. I WANT EQUITY INSTALLED IN THESE KINDS OF ISSUES
5 BECAUSE THIS'S PRECISELY WHAT IT IS. IT DEMOCRATIZES OUR
6 SYSTEM AND THE TECHNOLOGICAL AGE. THANK YOU.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** AT THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS I SEE NO
9 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AT THOSE LOCATIONS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
10 THANK YOU.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. INFORMATION ITEM. NO
13 ACTION. PROCEEDING TO NEXT AGENDA ITEM 8B WIENER LOCAL BALLOT
14 MEASURES. WE HAVE JULIE SNYDER HERE IF WE HAVE QUESTIONS WE
15 COULD DIRECT TO MISS SNYDER. I'LL PROVIDE A SUMMARY OF THE
16 BILL IT'S INCLUDED IN THE PACKET. SENATE BILL 532 WOULD AMEND
17 THE WHAT'S CALLED THE OBERNOLTE REQUIREMENTS OF PROVIDING VERY
18 SPECIFIC FINANCIAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TAX RATE OF PROPOSED
19 BOND MEASURES AND TAXES. THIS MEASURE PROVIDES FOR THE OPTION
20 FOR LOCAL BONDS AND TAX -- AND OTHER TAX MEASURES TO PROVIDE
21 DETAILS VIA THE VOTER GUIDE INSTEAD OF ON THE BALLOT LABEL
22 WITH TRANSPARENCY SAFEGUARDS. THE JOINTS MTC ABAG LEGISLATION
23 COMMITTEE STAFF REPORT IS INCLUDED IN THE AGENDA PACKET AND
24 THE COMMITTEE DID RECOMMEND THAT WE TAKE SUPPORT POSITION. SO,
25 WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THAT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD

MAY 18, 2023

1 TAKE A SUPPORT POSITION ON SENATE BILL 532, WIENER LOCAL
2 BALLOT MEASURE LABELS. IS THERE A SECOND? SUPERVISOR MELGAR
3 SECONDS. THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM
4 MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD? ANYONE ON ZOOM? OKAY. IF NOT
5 WE CAN PROCEED TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON 8B, SB532. IS THERE ANY
6 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THAT ITEM?

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON
9 THIS ITEM NO MEMBERS OF THE -- SORRY -- IT'S NOT MY DAY -- NO
10 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT NO
11 MEMBERS IN THE ATTENDEE ROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND AT
12 TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AT
13 THOSE LOCATIONS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER DISCUSSION
16 WE CAN PROCEED TO ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION TO TAKE A
17 SUPPORT POSITION FOR SENATE BILL 532.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** AND IF I COULD GET -- WE HAVE ALREADY MADE
20 THE MOTION.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** SUPERVISOR MELGAR MADE THE SECOND.
23 AND VICE MAYOR NAGALES THIRDED. [LAUGHTER]

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ON THE MOTION, SUPERVISOR ANDERSON?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN?

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** CARLSON?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

11

12 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** CORZO?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES.

15

16 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG IS ABSENT. FIFE? IS ABSENT.

21 FLIGOR?

22

23 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** GARCIA?

28

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** HILLIS IS ABSENT. MAYOR HUDSON? IS ABSENT.

5 VICE MAYOR KAMEI?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES.

8

9 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** LEE IS ABSENT. MANDELMAN?

10

11 **RAFAEL MANDELMAN:** YES.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MARQUEZ?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MELGAR?

18

19 **MYRNA MELGAR:** YES.

20

21 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. NAGALES?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ORTIZ IS ABSENT. REID?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ROMERO IS NOT AT A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION

5 ALTHOUGH HE IS HERE. SUPERVISOR SACKETT? IS ABSENT. MAYOR

6 SILVA?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

9

10 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** TIEDEMANN?

11

12 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

13

14 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** JIMINEZ?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YES.

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** LOPEZ?

19

20 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** YES.

21

22 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ZOLMAN?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

25

30

MAY 18, 2023

1 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DID I MISS ANYONE? MOTION PASSES

2 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO IT GOES WITHOUT SAYING IF YOU WOULD LIKE

6 TO JUMP INTO THE DISCUSSION AT ANY POINT PLEASE DO SO. GOING

7 TO 8C ASSEMBLY BILL 817 PACHECO BROWN ACT. STAFF IS PRESENT TO

8 ANSWER QUESTIONS. A.B. 817 WOULD EXPAND REMOTE MEETING OPTIONS

9 FOR NON-DECISION-MAKING LOCAL LEGISLATIVE BODIES INCLUDING

10 ADVISORY BOARDS THAT DO NOT TAKE FINAL ACTION ON LEGISLATION,

11 REGULATIONS CONTRACTS LICENSE PERMITS OR OTHER ENTITLEMENTS.

12 THE JOINTS MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE STAFF REPORT IS

13 INCLUDED IN THE PACKET AND CALL TO ATTENTION THE MTC ADVISORY

14 COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED MTC ABAG SUPPORT THIS BILL BECAUSE IT

15 WOULD ENABLE BROADER PARTICIPATION IN OUR COMMUNITY

16 REPRESENTATIVES ON OUR ADVISORY BOARD. STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS

17 TO SUPPORT A.B. 817. I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THAT THE ABAG

18 EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVE A SUPPORT POSITION ON AB 817.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND. CARLSON.

21

22 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL SECOND THE MOTION.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CARLSON. THIRDED

25 BY EKLUND. ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS ON THE MOTION? EKLUND?

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M SHOCKED THAT THE STATE LEGISLATURE, WHO MOST
3 OF THEM HAVE SERVED A LOCAL CITY, DIDN'T INCLUDE THE SITTING
4 BODIES OF OUR CITY AND COUNTY ORGANIZATIONS. I TOTALLY SUPPORT
5 THIS, AND I THINK THE OPTION ALSO SHOULD BE PROVIDED FOR CITY
6 COUNCILS AS WELL AS BOARD OF SUPERVISORS BECAUSE IT WILL
7 DEFINITELY ENCOURAGE MORE PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN GOVERNMENT
8 WHO MAY NOT BE ABLE TO COME BECAUSE OF OTHER RESPONSIBILITIES.
9 BUT ANYWAY, I TOTALLY SUPPORT THE MOTION.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THIS IS A LIMITED CHANGE TO THE
12 BROWN ACT. THERE HAVE BEEN NUMEROUS ATTEMPTS TO BROADEN REMOTE
13 PARTICIPATION THAT HAVE NOT MOVED FORWARD. I DON'T BELIEVE
14 THEY'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS SESSION BUT THIS BILL IS
15 STILL MOVING FORWARD. OUR JOINT ADVOCACY PLATFORM DOES ASK FOR
16 BROWN ACT REFORM TO ENABLE BROADER PARTICIPATION OF REGIONAL
17 BODIES IN, THROUGH VIDEO CONFERENCING, TELECONFERENCING. BUT
18 I'M GRATEFUL FOR ALL THE PEOPLE HERE AND THOSE ON ZOOM, AS
19 WELL. IS THERE ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION TO SUPPORT
20 A.B. 817? SEEING NO ONE HERE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO ONE ON
21 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
22 ITEM? AND WERE THERE WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

23

24 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
25 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 ON THIS ITEM. AND CHECKING AT THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I
2 SEE AND HEAR NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE FOR PUBLIC
3 COMMENT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. WITH THAT WE CAN CALL THE
6 ROLL ON THE MOTION TO SUPPORT ASSEMBLY BILL 817.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ON THE MOTION ARREGUIN, SECOND CARLSON.
9 ANDERSON?

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN?

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AYE.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** FORTUNATO BAS?

18

19 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** AYE.

20

21 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BREED IS ABSENT. CARLSON?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** CORZO?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YES.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

5

6 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG IS ABSENT. FIFE IS ABSENT.

9 FLIGOR?

10

11 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MAYOR GARCIA?

14

15 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DIRECTOR HILLIS? IS ABSENT. MAYOR HUDSON?

18 IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR KAMEI?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE? IS ABSENT.

23 SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MARQUEZ?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

5

6 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MUELLER IS ABSENT. VICE
7 MAYOR NAGALES?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ORTIZ?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

14

15 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS? IS ABSENT.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER REID?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ROMERO IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR SACKETT? IS
21 ABSENT. MAYOR SILVA?

22

23 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** TIEDEMANN?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MAYOR YOUNG IS ABSENT. COUNCIL MEMBER

9 JIMINEZ?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ?

14

15 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** AYE.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER ZOLMAN?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

22 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THAT BRINGS US TO 8D, UPDATE

25 ON THE FY 2023, 2024 STATE BUDGET. CALLING TO ATTENTION THE

MAY 18, 2023

1 REVISED VERSION OF THE MEMO WAS PROVIDED TO THE MEMBERS THIS
2 MORNING AND IS AVAILABLE ON MTC LEDGE STARR PARTICULARLY GOING
3 OVER THE GOVERNOR'S MAY REVISE. AND REBECCA, ARE YOU HERE FOR
4 QUESTIONS? OKAY. SO WE HAVE THE REPORT AND THIS IS INTENDED
5 FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES BUT AT HIGH-LEVEL I CAN SUMMARIZE
6 THAT THE STATE PARTICIPATED BUDGET DEFICITS AT 31.5 BILLION UP
7 FROM THE 20 OR SO BILLION IN THE JANUARY BUDGET PROPOSAL AND
8 THAT THE GOVERNOR IS STILL PROPOSING TO REALLOCATE THE TRANSIT
9 INNER CITY RAIL AND CAPITAL PROGRAM FUNDS, AS WAS PROPOSED
10 PREVIOUSLY. THE GOVERNOR DID INDICATE -- AND THERE WAS SOME
11 SUPPORTING INFORMATION INCLUDED IN THE PACKET, YOU KNOW,
12 WILLINGNESS TO ENGAGE WITH LEGISLATURE ON FINDING A SOLUTION
13 TOWARDS THE -- I GUESS, THE DEFICIT THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
14 FACING IN CALIFORNIA AND OPERATING FUNDS, AND THIS IS I THINK
15 ONE OF THE HIGHEST PRIORITIES AT MTC WORKING TO SECURE FUNDS,
16 BILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF FUNDING FROM THE STATE LEGISLATURE TO
17 PROVIDE A BRIDGE FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE STATE OF
18 CALIFORNIA WHILE WE'RE WORKING ON LONG-TERM SOLUTIONS. I'LL BE
19 GOING TO SACRAMENTO THIS MONDAY TO JOIN CHAIR PEDROZA TO MEET
20 OUR LEGISLATION DELEGATION ABOUT THIS VERY IMPORTANT ISSUE. I
21 THINK THE PROPOSED ALLOCATIONS FOR 500 MILLION FOR THE STATE
22 LOW-INCOME TAX CREDIT PROGRAM, THE 400 MILLION FOR ENCAMPMENT
23 RESOLUTION GRANTS, THE 225 MILLION FOR THE MHP, PROGRAM AND
24 INFILL INFRASTRUCTURE GRANT PROGRAM, AS WELL AS OTHER HOUSING
25 PROGRAMS, THOSE ARE INTACT. BUT THE GOVERNOR HAS PROPOSED TO

MAY 18, 2023

1 CLAW BACK THE FORECLOSURE INTERVENTION HOUSING PREVENTION
2 PROGRAM. IS THAT'S MONEY THAT WAS ALLOCATED PREVIOUSLY,
3 REBECCA, FOR HELPING ACQUIRE FORE CLOSED PROPERTIES? YES. I
4 THINK SENATOR SKINNER INTRODUCED LEGISLATION TO HELPED MAKE IT
5 EASIER TO ACQUIRE FORECLOSED PROPERTIES. PROPOSING CLAW BACK
6 OF 295 MILLION THAT THE PREVIOUSLY ALLOCATED. THEN REBOUND
7 PROGRAM 17.5 MILLION. OTHER HOUSING PROGRAMS ARE INTACT. AND
8 UNFORTUNATELY, WITH RESPECT TO RESILIENCE, THE MAY REVISE
9 RETAINS PROPOSED ELIMINATION OF 10.4 MILLION IN FUNDS TO
10 IMPROVE SAN FRANCISCO BAY'S WETLANDS AND MAJOR CUTS TO STATE
11 COASTAL CONSERVE AGENCY PROGRAMS. THERE IS MORE DETAIL IN THE
12 REPORT BUT THE OUTSTANDING ISSUE WE NEED TO ADDRESS IS THE
13 FISCAL CLIFF AND SECURING CRITICAL STATE FUNDS TO HELP PROVIDE
14 A BRIDGE WHILE WE WORK OUT A LONG-TERM REGIONAL SOLUTION TO
15 STATEWIDE SOLUTION TO THE FISCAL CLIFF. THIS IS INTENDED FOR
16 INFORMATION PURPOSES. OPEN FOR QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? IS THERE
17 ANYONES IN THE BOARDROOM WHO HAS QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THIS
18 ITEM? SEEING NONE. ANYONE ON ZOOM? NOT SEEING ANYONE WISHING
19 TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM ON ZOOM? YES, COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO.

20

21 **CARLOS ROMERO:** IS THE FORECLOSURE MONEY OFF THE TABLE OR IS IT
22 POSSIBLE TO GET SOME OF IT BACK? GIVEN THERE ARE SOME CITIES
23 THAT MIGHT BE CONSIDERING PRESERVATION, TOPA COPA ORDINANCES
24 THAT COULD BE SOURCES OF FUNDS. IS THAT COMPLETELY OFF THE
25 TABLE?

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
3 AFFAIRS. THE GOVERNOR'S MAY REVISE IS PART OF THE PROPOSAL IN
4 THE BUDGET PROCESS. IT'S ALL IN NEGOTIATION WITH THE
5 LEGISLATURE. I HAVEN'T BEEN TRACKING THIS ISSUE CLOSELY TO
6 TELL YOU WHERE ASSEMBLY OR SENATE ARE ON THAT. THIS IS NOT THE
7 END OF BUDGET NEGOTIATION.

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** PROCEEDING TO PUBLIC COMMENT.
10 ANYONE IN THE BOARDROOM TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE.
11 ANYONE ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WE HAVE ONE HAND ZOOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
14 GOING TO TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS? SEEING NONES. IN ATTENDEES
15 TWO MINUTES FOR PAUL SOTO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. PAUL SOTO FROM HORSESHOE THIS IS AN
18 OPPORTUNITY TIME TO START DISCUSSIONS REVISIONS TO PROP 13. IN
19 SANTA CLARA COUNTY YOU HAVE ROSE GARDEN AND WILLOW GLEN THE
20 MOST RACIALLY SEGREGATED AREAS PROBABLY IN THE COUNTRY. AND
21 THOSE AREAS ARE COLLECTING EQUITY ON HOMES THAT WERE
22 DESIGNATED BY RACIST POLICIES. SO WE'RE ACTUALLY ALLOWING
23 THESE HOMES TO COLLECT EQUITY BECAUSE THEY'RE RACIST, THEY'RE
24 RACIALLY SEGREGATED. WE CAN'T DO THAT MAN. IF WE BUST A DRUG
25 DEALER WE DON'T LET HIM KEEP THE PROCEEDS. IT'S WRONG. I'M NOT

MAY 18, 2023

1 SAYING KEEP THE PROCEEDS BUT AMEND PROP 13 THAT'S TAX REVENUE
2 THAT WE CAN GET THESE PROPERTIES ARE NOT PAYING, NUMBER TWO
3 TAX EQUITY OVER \$100,000. OVER \$100,000 OF EVERY SINGLE RED
4 LINE HOME, THE COUNTIES HAVE THE RED LINE DISTRICT MAPS YOU
5 TAX 1% OVER \$100,000 FOR EVERY HOME IN THESE RED LINE
6 DISTRICTS IF YOU DON'T LIKE IT TOUGH. YOU KNEW YOU BOUGHT A
7 HOME IN A RACIST AREA AND IF YOU DIDN'T WELL NOW IS THE TIME
8 TO LEARN THE TRUTH ABOUT YOUR AREA. BECAUSE WE CANNOT CONTINUE
9 TO ABUSE THIS WORDS OF RACIAL EQUITY. WE CAN'T ABUSE IT
10 ANYMORE WE NEED TO START INSTITUTIONALIZING IT YOU TAX THE
11 HOMES THAT ARE PROFITING FROM THAT. WHAT KIND OF SOCIETY ARE
12 WE, IF WE'RE ALLOWING AREAS IN RED LINE DISTRICTS TO PROFIT
13 FROM RACISM SITTING THERE AND SMILING AND CIRCUMVENT TAXES
14 THEY PAY ON THAT PROPERTY THROUGH PROP 13. NO. I THINK WE NEED
15 TO START RECESSING HOW WE TAX PROPERTIES.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER SPEAKERS ON THE
18 ITEM? SEEING NONE. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. UNLESS
23 THERE ARE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. THE NEXT FEW WEEKS ARE
24 CRITICAL, THE LEGISLATURE HAS TO APPROVE THE BUDGET BY JUNE
25 15TH WE'LL BE WORKING HARD TO DRIVE HOME THE IMPORTANCE OF

MAY 18, 2023

1 PRIORITIZING FUNDING FROM THE STATE TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL
2 CLIFF AND REPORT BACK NEXT MONTH. HOPEFULLY SUCCESSFULLY. NEXT
3 ITEM REPORT FROM THE ABAG FINANCE COMMITTEE I'LL READ THAT
4 REPORT. DOING TRIPLE DUTY TODAY. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. VERY SHORT.
5 ABAG FINANCE COMMITTEE MET TODAY MAY 18TH, 2023 AND RECEIVED
6 AND ACCEPTED THE FOLLOWING REPORT RECEIVED REPORT ON BAG
7 INVESTMENTS FOR THE PERIOD ENDING FEBRUARY 2023 TOTAL FUNDS
8 AROUND ABAG MANAGEMENT ARE APPROXIMATELY 112.7 MILLION AND A
9 DETAILED STAFF REPORT IS AVAILABLE ONLINE AT LEGISTAR. THIS
10 CONCLUDES THE COMMITTEE REPORT. ARE THERE QUESTIONS OR
11 COMMENTS ON THE COMMITTEE REPORT? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT
12 ON THIS ITEM?

13

14 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
16 ON THIS ITEM. AT THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I SEE AND HEAR
17 NO PUBLIC MEMBERS THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO THAT COMPLETES
20 ITEM NINE THE REPORT FROM THE ABAG FINANCE COMMITTEE. WE'LL
21 PROCEED TO ITEM TEN, THE REPORT FROM THE ABAG HOUSING
22 COMMITTEE. AND COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO OR VICE CHAIR FLIGOR ARE
23 EITHER ONE OF YOU PREPARED TO GIVE THE REPORT?

24

MAY 18, 2023

1 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** I AM, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. AND CHAIR ROMERO WAS
2 ON TOP OF IT AND REACHED OUT TODAY TO ASK ME TO GIVE THE
3 REPORT. BEFORE I GIVE THE REPORT WE HAVE A NON-VOTING BOARD
4 MEMBER IN THE SAN JOSE REMOTE LOCATION AND WE WEREN'T SURE IF
5 THEY NEED TO INTRODUCE THEMSELVES FOR THE RECORD.

6

7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** HE CAN IF HE WOULD LIKE TO.
8 WELCOME.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** DONALD YOUNG, SAN FRANCISCO.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** WELCOME. HE CITIZEN NON-VOTING
13 REPRESENTATIVE FROM THE REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD.

14

15 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** EXACTLY.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU FOR JOINING US. OKAY I'LL
18 TURN IT BACK OVER TO YOU.

19

20 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** THANK YOU. THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE MET
21 JOINTLY WITH THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE ON APRIL 13TH,
22 2023. THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE RECEIVED THE FOLLOWING REPORT
23 ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. SUMMARY UPDATE OF THE SYMBIAM SANCHEZ
24 SOFTWARE PILOT FUNDING BY THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING
25 GRANT COMMITTEE RECEIVED FOLLOWING REPORTS OVERVIEW OF GENERAL

MAY 18, 2023

1 REQUIREMENTS AND FUNDING ALLOCATION RULES CONTAINED IN THE BAY
2 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, BAHFA, ASSEMBLY BILL 1487
3 ENABLING LEGISLATION. THE SECOND REPORT WAS AN UPDATE ON THE
4 STATUS OF THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANTS
5 SUBALLOCATIONS TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND A REQUEST FOR
6 DIRECTION TO ESTABLISH A DEADLINE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO
7 CLAIM FUNDING IN ORDER TO ENSURE TIMELINE EXPENDITURE
8 [INDISCERNIBLE] THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE MET JOINTLY WITH
9 THE BAHFA WAS ON OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE ON MAY 11TH, 2023.
10 COMMITTEES RECEIVED THE FOLLOWING REPORTS RECOMMENDATION OF
11 THE APPROVAL OF THE BAHFA BUSINESS FUND EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND
12 FUNDING PROGRAMS BY THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND
13 RECOMMENDATION OF APPROVAL OF UPDATED PROGRAM BUDGET FOR THE
14 REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT AND PROPOSED
15 REPROGRAMMING OF CERTAIN FUNDS TO ENSURE FULL EXPENDITURE BY
16 THE DEADLINE. THIS CONCLUDES THE COMMITTEE REPORT.

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THIS IS AN
19 INFORMATION ITEM. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THE
20 REPORT FROM THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE FROM EXECUTIVE BOARD
21 MEMBERS? OKAY. SEEING NONE IN THE BOARDROOM. ANYONE ON ZOOM?
22 OKAY. SEEING NO RAISED HANDS FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM WITH
23 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE
24 REPORT FROM THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE?

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM. AND FROM TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, SEEING AND
4 HEARING NONE FROM EITHER. THANK YOU.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER
7 ROMERO?

8

9 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES. I JUST WANTED TO NOTE THAT ALL OF THE
10 CITIES WITHIN THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA AND THE COUNTIES,
11 ACTUALLY DID SUBMIT THEIR REQUESTS FOR UTILIZATION OF THAT
12 REAP FUNDING, WHICH IS IMPORTANT, BECAUSE IF WE'RE GOING TO GO
13 BACK TO THE STATE, EVENTUALLY AND GET MORE MONEY, WE NEED TO
14 SHOW THAT INDEED WE'RE USING IT. SO TO ALL OF THE CITIES IN
15 THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA, CONGRATULATIONS ON ACTUALLY -- AND
16 TO OUR STAFF -- ON ACTUALLY GETTING ALL OF US TO SUBMIT A WORK
17 PLAN FOR THAT MONEY SO GREAT WORK STAFF AND GREAT WORK CITIES.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. OKAY. LET'S NOW MOVE TO
20 ITEM 10B APPROVAL OF THE BAHFA BUSINESS PLAN EQUITY FRAMEWORK
21 AND FUNDING PROGRAMS. AND JUST FIRST WANT TO NOTE THIS WAS
22 LISTED AS AN ACTION ITEM BUT IN CONSULTATION WITH STAFF, I
23 HAVE ASKED THAT WE TAKE COMMENTS THIS EVENING AND BRING THIS
24 BACK FOR ACTION THIS SUMMER IN TANDEM WITH THE BUSINESS PLAN.
25 SO, WHILE WE ORIGINAL INTENDED TO TAKE ACTION, WE WILL

MAY 18, 2023

1 POSTPONE TAKING ACTION TONIGHT. I KNOW STAFF WOULD VERY MUCH
2 WELCOME YOUR COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS. KATE HARTLEY, BAHFA
3 DIRECTOR IS PRESENT. MISS HARTLEY, WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE THE
4 REPORT.

5

6 **KATE HARTLEY:** 60 SECOND REPORT. TO STRESS AND REITERATE TO ALL
7 BOARD MEMBERS THAT THE DOCUMENTS YOU SEE BEFORE YOU, FIRST OF
8 ALL, ONLY APPLIES TO THE BAHFA'S REGIONAL FUNDING, THE 20% OF
9 FUNDS THAT DOESN'T IMPACT THE COUNTIES AND CITIES FUNDING. THE
10 DOCS SET FORTH GUIDING PRINCIPLES. WHAT THE DOCUMENTS DO NOT
11 DO IS DIRECT WHERE THE FUNDING SHOULD ACTUALLY GO ONCE WE HAVE
12 THE PROCEEDS, AND/OR -- CERTAINLY NOT INTO ANY SPECIFIC
13 PROJECTS. THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES THAT THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK LAY
14 OUT ARE THAT WE SHOULD SERVE PEOPLE WITH GREATEST NEED AND WE
15 SHOULD AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING THAT WE SHOULD MEET
16 OUR CLIMATE GOALS BY BUILDING CLOSE TO TRANSIT. THE FUNDING
17 PROGRAMS HAVE ESSENTIALLY ELEMENTS FOR OUR INVESTMENT
18 STRATEGIES INCLUDING BUILDING AT SCALE GIVEN THE NEED TO BE
19 FLEXIBLE AND CREATIVE SINCE WE KNOW OUR STATE FUNDING PROCEEDS
20 ARE SO OVERSUBSCRIBED TO FOCUS ON COST EFFECTIVENESS AND
21 STREAMLINING AND TO STRUCTURE OUR LOANS SO THAT WE CAN RECEIVE
22 INCOME THAT WE REINVEST BACK INTO TENANT PROTECTIONS. SO WE
23 WILL BE BACK BEFORE YOU THIS SUMMER WITH THE PROPOSED
24 EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. AND WE WILL BE GOING
25 THROUGH OUR ADVISORY COMMITTEE, ET CETERA. THERE IS LOTS OF

MAY 18, 2023

1 OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THIS AND TALK ABOUT IT, AND WE WELCOME
2 YOUR INPUT NOW. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, WE'LL OPEN UP
5 FOR QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM. YES, VICE MAYOR
6 NAGALES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** REALLY QUICK IN TERMS OF COMMENT. I AM EXCITED ABOUT
9 THIS PLAN. WHEN THE STATE LOOKED AWAY FROM REDEVELOPMENT FUNDS
10 MADE IT DIFFICULT TO FUND AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS AND SO
11 SOMETHING LIKE THIS REALLY IS A GAME CHANGE FOR A LOT OF OUR
12 LOCAL MUNICIPALITIES. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE CONTINUING
13 CONVERSATION.

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?
16 MAYOR TIEDEMANN?

17

18 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** WE SAW THIS IN HOUSING, I'M HAPPY WITH THIS
19 PLAN. IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO BEFORE WE HAVE THE PROGRAMS.
20 THAT'S HOW GOVERNMENT SHOULD WORK, LAYING OUT EQUITY GOALS.
21 TRYING TO PITCH PEOPLE TO ENDORSE THE BAHFA BOND, THIS IS A
22 USEFUL TOOL FOR SHOWING PEOPLE THERE IS SOMETHING OUT THERE
23 FOR PLANNING EVEN IF DETAILS AREN'T OUT THERE, THERE IS
24 PLANNING GOING ON OF HOW IT'S GOING TO BE SPENT AND WHAT IT'S

MAY 18, 2023

1 GOING TO BE USED FOR. THIS IS USEFUL FOR US AND PARTNERS WHO
2 ARE TRYING TO GET SUPPORT BEHIND IT.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
5 COMMENTS? ANYONE ON ZOOM? ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM? I
6 ACTUALLY HAVE A QUESTION MISS HARTLEY. COULD YOU MAYBE UPDATE
7 US ON WHAT'S NEXT IN TERMS OF WHAT COMPONENTS WILL BE COMING
8 TO ABAG AND TO THE BAHFA BOARD? WORK ON THE BUSINESS PLAN,
9 WORK ON THE EXPENDITURE PLAN?

10

11 **KATE HARTLEY:** YES THE BUSINESS PLAN HAS THREE COMPONENTS
12 EQUITY WORK, FUNDING PROGRAMS WHICH YOU HAVE SEEN AND THEN
13 OPERATIONAL SUSTAINABILITY PLAN FOR BAHFA WHICH WE'RE NOT
14 GOING TO BRING TO YOU UNTIL PROBABLY THIRD OR FOURTH QUARTER
15 OF 2023. BUT SEPARATE FROM THAT, WE NEED TO BE WORKING ON
16 BALLOT DOCUMENTS AND THAT WILL INCLUDE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN
17 THAT BAHFA WILL CREATE AND PRESENT TO YOU FOR CONSIDERATION.
18 IN ADDITION, WE WILL PRESENT TO YOU PROPOSED INVESTMENT
19 STRATEGIES FOR BAHFA'S REGIONAL MONEY. AND THAT'S THE 20% OF
20 PROCEEDS. SO WE'LL BRING TO YOU A RECOMMENDED PRIORITIES FOR
21 HOW WE SHOULD STRUCTURE OUR NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITIES,
22 WHAT PRIORITIES, FOR EXAMPLE, SUCH AS PRIORITIZING PERMANENT
23 SUPPORTIVE HOUSING FOR HOMELESS HOUSEHOLDS, AND HOW THAT --
24 HOW OUR FUNDS, BAHFA'S FUNDS SHOULD BE DISTRIBUTED ACROSS THE
25 REGION TO PROMOTE EQUITY AND TO ENSURE THAT THERE IS FAIRNESS,

MAY 18, 2023

1 THERE IS BROAD -- THERE IS BROAD APPLICABILITY, THERE IS BROAD
2 DISTRIBUTION SO THAT ALL THE COUNTIES CAN REALLY BE TOGETHER,
3 COLLABORATE. IT'S THE PROMOTION OF REGIONALISM. BUT THAT WILL
4 BE YOUR DECISION FOR FINAL CONSIDERATION AND WILL BRING YOU
5 OPTIONS.

6

7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MORE TO COME.
8 ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD ON THIS ITEM? I'LL
9 ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 10B BAHFA'S
10 BUSINESS PLAN EQUITY FRAMEWORK. BEFORE WE GO TO THE PUBLIC,
11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?

12

13 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I GUESS I'M KIND OF THE PUBLIC TODAY I WANT TO
14 MAKE SURE THAT WE UNDERSTOOD THE FUNDING PROGRAMS THAT WILL
15 COME BEFORE US ARE INDEED THE FUNDING PROGRAMS FOR THE 20% OF
16 POTENTIAL --

17

18 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THAT'S CORRECT.

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** 80% OF THE MONEY GOING BACK TO THE COUNTIES AND
21 CITIES SO THEY CAN DETERMINE HOW TO SPENT IT. IS THAT CORRECT?

22

23 **KATE HARTLEY:** THAT IS CORRECT. COUNTIES AND CITIES HAVE FULL
24 CONTROL OVER THEIR FUNDS FOLLOWING A.B. 1487, REQUIREMENTS OF
25 A.B. 1487 ARE MINIMALIST SO COUNTIES AND CITIES ARE GOING TO

MAY 18, 2023

1 BE ABLE TO TAYLOR THEIR FUNDING PROGRAMS TO WHAT MAKES SENSE
2 FOR THEM.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. THAT IS IMPORTANT TO
5 CLARIFY AND IS A TOPIC OF CONVERSATION AT THE JOINTS HOUSING
6 COMMITTEES THIS IS JUST THE REGIONAL DOLLARS NOT THE COUNTY
7 DOLLARS THAT WOULD BE GUIDED BY THE DECISIONS OF THE COUNTIES
8 AND THE CITIES ON THEIR LOCAL EXPENDITURE FUNDS. HART THAT IS
9 RIGHT'S RIGHT.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** NOW GOING TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM
12 10B. IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR COME
13 FORWARD IN THE BOARDROOM.

14

15 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
16 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
17 ON THIS ITEM. AND AT TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS I SEE AND HEAR
18 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. WE HAVE ONE
19 MEMBER IN THE ATTENDEE ROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. PAUL SOTO. TWO
20 MINUTES PLEASE GO AHEAD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** PAUL SOTO FROM THE HORSESHOE I'M ASKING IF YOU COULD
23 REVISE THE POSITION ON EQUITY. IT'S NOT A GUIDING PRINCIPLE
24 AND HERE IS WHY. RACIAL INEQUITY WAS LEGAL. IT WAS LEGALIZED.
25 SO IN OTHER WORDS TO COMBAT AND TO COUNTER THE GENERATIONAL

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 IMPACTS OF RACIAL INEQUITY, YOU MUST HAVE A LEGALLY BINDING
2 DEFINITION OF WHAT EQUITY MEANS. BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T, HERE IS
3 WHAT HAPPENS. IT BECOMES ASPIRATIONAL AND EXPLOITIVE. THE
4 1960s CHICAGO MOVEMENT CHALLENGED THIS, THEY ACT AS A MEMBER
5 OF THE COMMUNITY NON-PROFITS SAYING OH WE'LL HELP YOU DEAL
6 WITH ISSUES IN THE COMMUNITY BUT YOU GIVE US THE MONEY YOU
7 LOOK AT HOUSING OF SOME OF THESE EXECUTIVES THAT ARE NON-
8 PROFITS THAT ARE PROFITING FROM THE POVERTY THESE EXECS ARE
9 GETTING \$200,000 A YEAR OFF OF POVERTY. THIS IS SICKENING HOW
10 DO YOU PROFIT OFF OF POVERTY. CITY GOVERNMENT DOES IT COUNTY
11 GOVERNMENT DOES IT AND IT NEEDS TO STOP WE HAVE TO HAVE A
12 LEGALLY BINDING DEFINITION AND METRIC NOT A GUIDING PRINCIPLE.
13 I DON'T TRUST MY GOVERNMENT. THEY MAKE SURE -- I DON'T SPEAK
14 SPANISH TODAY BECAUSE OF THE RACIAL SEGREGATION AND THE
15 TREATMENT MY PARENTS RECEIVED INSIDE THE SCHOOL DISTRICT THEY
16 TOOK LANGUAGE FROM THEM. I DON'T TRUST THEM. I NEED A LEGALLY
17 BINDING DEFINITION AND IT'S GOING TO BE BECAUSE YOU'RE GOING
18 TO HEAR MY VOICE EVERY TIME YOU HAVE ONE OF THESE MEETINGS
19 YOU'RE GOING TO BE HEARING MY VOICE RACIAL EQUITY NEEDS TO BE
20 LEGALLY BINDING OR QUIT USING IT AS A DEFINITION TO PIT THE
21 POVERTY THAT'S INSIDE OF MY COMMUNITY. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY
24 OTHER ATTENDEES WHO WOULD IS LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? I DO
25 NOT SEE ANY HAND RAISED. THAT COMPLETES PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS

MAY 18, 2023

1 IS INFORMATIONAL. COMES BACK TO US THIS SUMMER. PROCEEDING TO
2 10C ACTION ITEM APPROVAL OF THE UPDATED PROGRAM BUDGET FOR THE
3 REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT REAP 1.0 PROPOSED
4 REPROGRAMMING AND AUTHORIZATION FOR THE FOR THE EXECUTIVE
5 DIRECTOR OR DESIGNEE TO REALLOCATE EXPAND UNSPENT GRANT FUNDS,
6 STAFF COSTS AND ACCUMULATIVE AMOUNT UP TO \$500,000, FUNDS
7 REMAINING AFTER DECEMBER 31ST, 2025 WITHIN THREE MONTHS.
8 THAT'S A MOUTHFUL. DANIEL SAVER.

9

10 **DANIEL SAVER:** I'LL BE BRIEF THIS IS A HOUSING KEEPING ITEM FOR
11 ABAG REAP 1.0 REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANTS, THE
12 EXECUTIVE BOARD IN JUNE OF 2021 APPROVED THE CONSOLIDATED
13 THREE YEAR BUDGET FOR THE \$24 MILLION GRANT IN THE INTERIM WE
14 HAVE BEEN MONITORING SPENDS DOWN OF THE GRANT BASED ON ACTUAL
15 EXPENSE AND WE NEED TO SHIFT SOME OF THE MONEY BETWEEN
16 CONSULTANT BUDGET AND STAFF BUDGET IT'S \$500,000 SHIFT THERE
17 IS ADDITIONAL INFORMATION IN YOUR PACKET. WE'RE PLEASED TO
18 NOTE THAT ALL LOCAL SUBALLOCATIONS AT THIS POINT HAVE BEEN
19 CLAIMED THIS IMMUNE IS CONSULTANTS BUDGET AND STAFF BUDGET THE
20 AMOUNT OF FUNDING THAT GOES DIRECTLY TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS.
21 THAT'S MY REPORT HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS.

22

23 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** IF THERE IS ANY LEFT OVER FUND WE
24 CAN ALLOCATE THEM FOR STAFF COSTS AND WE FULLY EXTEND THE
25 GRANT AMOUNT AND I THINK WE WANT TO DEMONSTRATE TO THE STATE

MAY 18, 2023

1 WE DID USE THESE FUNDS EFFECTIVELY. I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO
2 APPROVE THE UPDATED BUDGET FOR THE REAP 1.0 PROGRAM AND
3 PROPOSED REPROGRAMMING AUTHORIZATION FOR THE EXECUTIVE
4 DIRECTOR OR DESIGNEE TO REALLOCATE UNSPENT REAP 1.0 FUNDS.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AND THERE ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION OR
9 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT?

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
13 ON THIS ITEM. AT THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I SEE AND HEAR
14 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. UNLESS THERE IS ANY FURTHER
17 DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM, THIS IS A HOUSEKEEPING ITEM. WE'LL
18 PROCEED TO A ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MOTION ARREGUIN, SECOND TIEDEMANN.
21 SUPERVISOR ANDERSON?

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YES.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** FORTUNATO BAS?

5

6 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BREED IS ABSENT. CARLSON?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YES.

11

12 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** CORZO?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES.

15

16 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG IS ABSENT. FIFE IS ABSENT.

21 FLIGOR?

22

23 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

24

25 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** GARCIA?

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

3

4 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** HILLIS IS ABSENT. HUDSON? IS ABSENT.

5 KAMAI?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

8

9 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** LEE IS ABSENT. MANDELMAN? IS ABSENT.

10 MARQUEZ?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

13

14 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MELGAR?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MUELLER? IS

19 ABSENT. VICE MAYOR NAGALES?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ORTIZ?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS? IS ABSENT.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER REID?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

6

7 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO IS NOT AT
8 A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. SUPERVISOR SACKETT? IS ABSENT.
9 MAYOR SILVA?

10

11 **CINDY SILVA:**

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

14

15 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. TIEDEMANN?

16

17 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** YES.

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. LOPEZ?

3

4 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** YES.

5

6 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ZOLMAN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES.

9

10 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
11 PRESENT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THAT BRINGS US
14 TO ITEM 11, LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES 11A AUTHORIZATION TO
15 AMEND A BAY AREA REGIONAL ENERGY NETWORK FUNDING AGREEMENT
16 WITH PG&E IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 157 MILLION. IS THAT
17 CORRECT? THAT'S A LOT.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** [LAUGHTER]

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** NOW I KNOW WHY WE'RE HAVING A
22 PRESENTATION, FOR SERVICES FOR BAYREN IMPLEMENTATION THROUGH
23 DECEMBER 31ST, 2027. WE'LL ALSO RECEIVE AN UPDATE ON BAYREN'S
24 CURRENT AND FUTURE PROGRAMS AND I WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO
25 JENNY BERG. THANK YOU.

MAY 18, 2023

1

2 **JENNY BERG:** THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN. AND OVER 11 YEARS AGO WE

3 APPEARED BEFORE THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD TO SEEK APPROVAL FOR

4 THIS IDEA OF A REGIONAL ENERGY NETWORK. SO I THINK IT'S A

5 TESTAMENT TO THIS AGENCY FOR TAKING A CHANCE AS WELL AS THAT

6 TESTAMENT TO THIS AGENCY FOR TAKING A CHANCE AS WELL AS THE

7 PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION FOR TAKING A CHANCE AS WE RECENTLY

8 CELEBRATED OUR TEN YEAR ANNIVERSARY AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT

9 FOR SUCH A LARGE AMOUNT. WE ANTICIPATE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES

10 COMMISSION ISSUING A PROPOSED DECISION ON OUR BUSINESS PLAN

11 AND ASSOCIATED BUDGET, AND WE WANTED THE AUTHORITY TO START

12 NEGOTIATIONS WITH PG&E TO ENTER INTO THE CONTRACT. CAN YOU

13 BRING UP THE POWERPOINT, PLEASE? NEXT SLIDE A LITTLE BIT

14 BAYREN. I KNOW I'M HERE SEVERAL TIMES A YEAR TO PROVIDE AN

15 UPDATE BUT IT IS IN COLLABORATION WITH THE NINE BAY AREA

16 COUNTIES, IMPLEMENTING A PORTFOLIO OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY

17 PROGRAMS ACROSS THE REGION. WE ARE ONE OF NOW FOUR REGIONAL

18 ENERGY NETWORKS WITH A FIFTH APPLICATION PENDING BEFORE THE

19 PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THE VISION

20 OF BAYREN, AS WELL AS ALL REGIONAL ENERGY NETWORKS IS THAT WE

21 HELP JURISDICTIONS MEET LOCAL REGIONAL AND STATE CLIMATE

22 RELATED GOALS BY HAVING A REGIONAL STRUCTURE, WE ARE ABLE TO

23 PROVIDE A MORE HOLISTIC OFFERING TO OUR JURISDICTIONS. NEXT

24 SLIDE PLEASE. HERE ARE SOME DATA-DRIVEN ACCOMPLISHMENTS OVER

25 THE PAST TEN YEARS IN ADDITION TO THOSE THAT YOU CAN SEE ON

MAY 18, 2023

1 THIS SLIDE WE HAVE BEEN RECOGNIZED BY NATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS
2 AS WELL AS FEDERAL AGENCIES FOR OUR PROGRAM DESIGN AND OUR
3 EFFECTIVENESS. SO, WE HAVE -- WE HAVE MADE A LOT OF IMPACT IN
4 THE REGION AND ALSO HAVE A LOT OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT FOR OUR
5 PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS -- HERE IS A BREAK DOWN OF SOME
6 OF OUR PROJECT IMPACTS, BROKEN DOWN BY COUNTY. SOME OF THE
7 NUMBERS VARY BASED ON THE CONTRACTOR AND WORKFORCE IN A COUNTY
8 AS WELL AS THE TARGETED BUILDING STOCK OF OUR PROGRAMS. I AM
9 HAPPY TO PROVIDE A MORE DETAILED ANALYSIS OF PROJECTS IN ANY
10 OF YOUR JURISDICTIONS, IF YOU WOULD LIKE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
11 SO, IN MARCH OF LAST YEAR, WE SUBMITTED AN EIGHT-YEAR BUSINESS
12 PLAN, AS DIRECTED BY THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION AND
13 CONCURRENTLY WE SUBMITTED A FOUR-YEAR PORTFOLIO APPLICATION
14 WHICH WAS A MORE DETAILED PROPOSAL, AND THE PORTFOLIO
15 APPLICATION IS THE BUDGET THAT I'M HERE BEFORE YOU THIS
16 EVENING. THE BUSINESS PLAN WAS REALLY GUIDED BY EXTENSIVE
17 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT THAT WE DID THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND
18 TAKING THAT INPUT, WE SUBMITTED OUR BUSINESS PLAN AND THERE IS
19 KIND OF THREE FOCUS AREAS. THE FIRST IS WE HAVE A GREATER
20 FOCUS ON EQUITY. THAT'S BOTH WITHIN OUR ORGANIZATIONAL
21 STRUCTURE, AS WELL AS IN OUR PROGRAMS. AND EQUITY TO BAYREN IS
22 CONSISTENT WITH THE CPUC DEFINITION, AS WELL AS ITS ESJ SOCIAL
23 ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL JUSTICE ACTION PLAN AS WELL AS THE
24 ABAG AND MTC EQUITY DEFINITION. SECOND WE HAVE AN INCREASED
25 FOCUS ON SUPPORT FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS BASED ON LOCAL NEEDS.

MAY 18, 2023

1 WHAT WE HEARD IN A LOT OF OUR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WAS A LOT
2 OF NEED PARTICULARLY A NEED IN MUNICIPAL BUILDINGS. I'LL GET
3 INTO A SECOND, WE HAVE TWO NEW PROGRAMS THAT DIRECTLY WILL
4 WORK WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO HELP WITH THE ENERGY NEEDS OF
5 THEIR FACILITIES AND FINALLY THE BUSINESS PLAN IS PROPOSE
6 PROGRAMS THAT CAN TIMELY RESPOND TO EVOLVING STATE AND LOCAL
7 POLICY TRENDS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, OUR CURRENT PROGRAMS AND
8 BUDGET, CURRENT ANNUAL BUDGET IS ABOUT \$23 MILLION. WE WILL
9 CONTINUE WITH ALL OF OUR EXISTING PROGRAMS. WE WILL BE MAKING
10 SOME TWEAKS TO SOME OF THE PROGRAMS TO BETTER ALIGN WITH THE
11 THEMES OF OUR BUSINESS PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. AND IF THERE IS -- I
12 THINK THERE IS SOME, IF YOU CAN KEEP GOING, THERE SHOULD BE
13 SOME MORE ON THIS SLIDE. OKAY. SO, WE HAVE PROPOSED TO MOVE
14 INTO TWO BRAND-NEW SECTORS, WORKFORCE AND THE PUBLIC SECTOR.
15 SO THE WORKFORCE PROGRAM IS AN EXPANSION OF OUR GREENHOUSE
16 CALLS PROGRAM, IT'S A PARTNERSHIP WITH RISING SUN CENTER FOR
17 OPPORTUNITY. I ALWAYS GET SMILES FROM BOARD MEMBERS WHEN I
18 MENTION THAT. AND, SO, I ALWAYS WAS A LITTLE FRUSTRATED THAT
19 THE PROGRAM ENDED AT THE END OF THE SUMMER. SO WHAT THE
20 CLIMATE CAREERS PROGRAM IS GOING TO DO IS TO PROVIDE
21 ADDITIONAL TRAINING AND THEN PLACE THE YOUTH INTO GOOD PAYING
22 JOBS IN A GREEN ECONOMY. SO THAT IS OUR NEW WORKFORCE PROGRAM.
23 IF YOU CAN JUST CLICK THROUGH. SO -- THANK YOU. AND AS I
24 MENTIONED WE'RE MOVING INTO THE PUBLIC SECTOR. THIS IS VERY
25 FOCUSED ON PROVIDING LOCAL GOVERNMENT SUPPORT FOR INCREASING

MAY 18, 2023

1 BOTH ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND ELECTRIFICATION AND MUNICIPAL
2 FACILITIES AND FINALLY, NEXT SLIDE. OUR ANIMATION IS A
3 COMMERCIAL PROGRAM, WHICH IS GOING TO FOCUS ON SMALL, CORNER
4 GROCERY STORES, REPLACING VERY HIGH GHG EMITTING REFRIGERANTS.
5 AS YOU CAN SEE OUR ANNUAL BUDGET REQUESTS IS INCREASED TO
6 ABOUT \$28 MILLION PER YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. I WANTED TO DO A BREAK
7 DOWN OF WHERE ALL OF THIS MONEY GOES, AS I THINK YOU CAN SEE
8 THAT IT IS GOING DIRECTLY BACK INTO THE REGION IN THE FORM OF
9 REBATES, WHICH REPRESENTS 43% OF OUR BUDGET. THAT'S MONEY THAT
10 GOES DIRECTLY TO CONTRACTORS, TO HOMEOWNERS, AND TO MULTI-
11 FAMILY PROPERTY OWNERS, THE MAJORITY OF WHOM ARE AFFORDABLE
12 PROPERTY OWNERS. AND 27% IS THE ABAG REGIONAL BUDGET. SO, ALL
13 OF THE STAFF, TIME FOR EVERYBODY THAT WORKS ON MY TEAM BAYREN
14 IS 100% FUNDING, THROUGH OUR REGIONAL, WE HAVE CONSULTANTS
15 THAT WORK ON ACTIVITIES THAT ARE FOR THE OVERALL PORTFOLIO,
16 AND I WOULD NOTE THAT WE'RE VERY PROUD TO BE IN ALIGNMENT WITH
17 THE EQUITY PLATFORM AND THAT THE MAJORITY OF OUR CONSULTANTS
18 ARE LOCAL, SMALL, MANY WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESSES. AND THEN
19 FINALLY, 30% OF OUR BUDGET GOES DIRECTLY TO THE COUNTY, BAYREN
20 MEMBER AGENCIES, AND WE HAVE FORMAL, AS YOU ALL KNOW -- FORMAL
21 CONTRACTS WITH THE BAYREN MEMBER AGENCIES. WE HAVE DEFINED
22 SCOPES OF WORK, AND MOST IMPORTANTLY, IS THAT THEY ARE
23 CONTRACTUALLY OBLIGATED TO DO OUTREACH TO ALL JURISDICTIONS
24 WITHIN THE COUNTY SO THAT STAFF, AS WELL AS ALL CONSTITUENTS

MAY 18, 2023

1 ARE AWARE OF AND CAN PARTICIPATE IN BAYREN PROGRAMS. AND THAT
2 CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. ANY QUESTIONS?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** I THANK YOU SO MUCH, JENNY FOR ALL
5 YOUR WORK, AND, SORT OF, HELPING LAUNCH AND GUIDE BAYREN OVER
6 THE PAST 11 YEARS.

7

8 **JENNY BERG:** TEN. TEN AND COUNTING.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YEAH. AND WAS VERY HONORED TO
11 PARTICIPATE IN THE CEREMONY RECENTLY RECOGNIZING THIS
12 IMPORTANT MILESTONE. AND COULD YOU MAYBE TALK ABOUT THE
13 INTEGRATION WITH BAHFA AND BAYREN? BECAUSE I KNOW THAT'S
14 SOMETHING THAT WE HAD TALKED ABOUT IN PLANNED BAY AREA,
15 LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN LEVERAGE THE WORK THAT BAYREN IS DOING
16 WITH MAKING OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING THAT WE'RE FUNDING MORE
17 GREEN AND MORE ENERGY EFFICIENT.

18

19 **JENNY BERG:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. WE HAVE HAD SEVERAL TALKS
20 WHICH ARE ONGOING GIVEN THAT WE WORK WITH MANY OF THE SAME
21 AFFORDABLE PROPERTY DEVELOPERS THAT BAHFA IS WORKING WITH AND
22 WILL LIKELY WORK WITH IN THE FUTURE. AND WE WOULD LIKE THERE
23 TO BE AN INTEGRATION OF THE ENERGY EFFICIENCY WORK WITH MAKING
24 IT REQUIREMENT, OR -- I DON'T KNOW -- WE DON'T WANT IT TO BE A
25 BARRIER, BUT STRONGLY ENCOURAGE THAT ANYONE THAT RECEIVES

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 FUNDING WILL DO AN ENERGY EFFICIENCY UPGRADE. IT'S BETTER FOR
2 TENANTS. IT REDUCES THE OPERATING COST. IT PROVIDING CLEANER
3 HEALTH SO THERE IS A LOT OF COBENEFITS WITH FINANCING. SO IT'S
4 SOMETHING THAT THEY -- THERE IS A LOT GOING ON THERE, BUT THE
5 CONVERSATIONS ARE ONGOING.

6

7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BEFORE
8 I MAKE A MOTION, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS
9 FROM BOARD MEMBERS? ANYONE ON -- JUDGES, COUNCIL MEMBER
10 EKLUND?

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR ARREGUIN. JENNY, I
13 FIRST OF ALL WANT TO SAY I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE TOUR
14 THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE TAKING IN JUNE, AND JUST WANTED TO SAY
15 THAT I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT LEARNING MORE ABOUT WHAT YOU'RE
16 DOING IN THE CITY. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **JENNY BERG:** THANK YOU. AND I WAS REMISS AT NOT MENTIONING OUR
19 LIBRARY PILOT. SO WE HAVE A SMALL PILOT WITH SIX PARTICIPATING
20 LIBRARIES THAT WILL -- WE PROVIDE TECHNICAL AND ENGINEERING
21 SUPPORT SO THAT THEY CAN SEE HOW THEIR LIBRARY CAN BE A MICRO
22 GRID TYPE FACILITY. ALSO HELPING THEM WITH FUNDING. SO, THE
23 IDEA IS THAT THERE IS A PLACE, WHEN THERE IS A CLIMATE EVENT
24 WHERE THE COMMUNITY CAN GO. SO WE'RE STARTING OUR FIELD TRIPS

MAY 18, 2023

1 WHERE WE WILL INVITE BOARD MEMBERS WHO HAVE A LIBRARY IN THEIR
2 JURISDICTION AND THE FIRST ONE IS IN NOVATO IN JUNE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M EXCITED ABOUT BEING THE
5 FIRST ONE TOO. [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL JUST SAY
8 THAT ONE OF OUR ROLES AS A REGIONAL COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS IS
9 TO PROVIDE DIRECT SERVICES TO LOCAL GOVERNMENT JURISDICTIONS.
10 SO 100 CITIES AND TOWNS AND NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. AND I
11 THINK BAYREN IS ONE OF OUR MOST POPULAR AND SUCCESSFUL
12 PROGRAMS. WHEN I SPEAK TO LOCAL GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS IN
13 ALAMEDA COUNTY AND THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND STAFF I THINK
14 EVERYONE IS GRATEFUL THAT BAYREN EXISTS AND I THINK IT'S A
15 CRITICAL PART OF THE WORK WE'RE DOING IN THIS REGION TO NOT
16 JUST MAKE OUR BUILDINGS ENERGY EFFICIENT BUT TO HELP GET OFF
17 OF GAS IN ADVANCE OF OUR CLIMATE GOALS. THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR
18 WORK. COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO DO YOU WISH TO SPEAK?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SORRY TO TAKE UP MORE AIR HERE BUT I'M CURIOUS
21 ABOUT THE WORKFORCE PIECE, MAYBE DEVELOPMENT PIECE THAT YOU
22 HIGHLIGHTED. I THINK THIS IS AN AREA WHERE, I MEAN, WHERE
23 THERE COULD BE SIGNIFICANT IMPACT IN TERMS OF MOVING FOLKS
24 INTO VERY GOOD PAYING JOBS PARTICULARLY RELATED TO THE

MAY 18, 2023

1 ELECTRIFICATION PIECE. YOU CAN JUST EXPLAIN, QUICKLY, HOW THAT
2 IS GETTING ROLLED OUT? OR HOW YOU ARE IMPLEMENTING THAT?

3

4 **JENNY BERG:** SURE. THIS IS A PRETTY SMALL PROGRAM BUT RISING
5 SUN CENTER FOR OPPORTUNITY WORKS WITH -- AND THEY HAVE SEVERAL
6 PROGRAMS BUT THERE IS AN ADULT PROGRAM AND AN ADULT UNION
7 APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM THAT WE'RE NOT INVOLVED WITH BUT IT'S A
8 PROGRAM THAT STARTS TARGETING YOUTH AT ABOUT 15 TO 23 YEARS
9 OLD AND IN THE SUMMER PROGRAM THEY LEARN ABOUT ENERGY
10 EFFICIENCY AND HOW TO DO DIRECT INSTALL PROJECTS GOING INTO A
11 HOME. AND THE MODEL IS THAT THE YOUTH WILL THEN GO INTO THEIR
12 OWN COMMUNITIES THAT THEY HAVE THAT TRUST, IF IT'S IN
13 LANGUAGE, OR THEY KNOW THE NEIGHBORS, OR THERE IS THAT TRUST
14 THAT PEOPLE WILL GO BACK INTO THEIR COMMUNITIES TO START
15 TEACHING THEM ABOUT ENERGY EFFICIENCY. SO THE WORKFORCE
16 COMPONENT IS TO CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE OLDER YOUTH THAT ARE
17 NOT IN HIGH SCHOOL WHERE THEY GET PROFESSIONAL AND TECHNICAL
18 TRAINING THAT WILL ALLOW THEM TO APPLY FOR JOBS IN THE
19 INDUSTRY AND TO HELP WITH THAT WHOLE PROCESS. DOES THAT ANSWER
20 YOUR QUESTION?

21

22 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES AND TO THE EXTENT THAT THIS IS A PROGRAM
23 THAT COULD GROW, OR PERHAPS BE APPLIED IN OTHER AREAS OF THE
24 COUNTIES, THAT WOULD BE FABULOUS. I THINK THIS IS, INDEED, YOU
25 KNOW, AN OPPORTUNITY FOR LOW-INCOME, WORKING CLASS PEOPLE OF

MAY 18, 2023

1 COLOR, TO ACTUALLY ENTER INTO A FIELD THAT IS BURGEONING AND
2 THAT ACTUALLY PAYS FAIRLY WELL AND HAS THOSE UNION
3 APPRENTICESHIPS. I'M GLAD YOU GUYS ARE INVOLVED AND IT'S GOOD
4 TO HEAR. I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS IN THIS AREA
5 IF YOU COULD THINK OF SOME WAY OF BOLSTERING IT. THANK YOU ALL
6 FOR THE GREAT WORK.

7

8 **JENNY BERG:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** COUNCIL MEMBER ZOLMAN.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I AM EXCITED ABOUT THE YOUTH PROGRAM. HOW WILL
13 OUTREACH BE CONDUCTED? IS IT THROUGH SCHOOLS? OR HOW ARE YOU
14 DOING THE OUTREACH?

15

16 **JENNY BERG:** THEY HAVE A LOT OF COMMUNITY CONNECTIONS IN
17 SCHOOLS. THE GREENHOUSE CALLS PROGRAM HAS BEEN IN EXISTENCE
18 FOR YEARS PRIOR TO THAT UNDER BAYREN FOR ABOUT FOUR YEARS
19 PRIOR TO THAT PG&E THEY HAVE WELL ESTABLISHED OUTREACH
20 CHANNELS DEFINITELY THROUGH SCHOOLS AND COMMUNITY-BASED
21 ORGANIZATIONS.

22

23 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** MAYOR GARCIA?

24

MAY 18, 2023

1 **LEON GARCIA:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. VERY EXCITING IN
2 TERMS OF FUTURE WORK. I'M THINKING A LOT OF RETROFITTING OF
3 EXISTING HOUSES WILL BE INVOLVED WITH THAT. COULD YOU SPEAK
4 MORE ON WORK TRAINING PROGRAMS, ARE LOCATED RIGHT NOW, WHAT'S
5 THE PLAN FOR EXPANSION?

6

7 **JENNY BERG:** SO OUR CURRENT WORKFORCE ACTIVITIES ARE PRIMARILY
8 IN OUR SINGLE-FAMILY PROGRAM WHERE WE BRING IN NEW CONTRACTORS
9 TO PARTICIPATE AND OUR REBATE PROGRAM. WE PROVIDE TRAINING
10 AROUND ELECTRIFICATION. WE'RE WORKING WITH A LOT OF
11 DISTRIBUTORS AND MANUFACTURES TO OFFER THEM THAT TRAINING IN
12 THAT TYPE OF TECHNOLOGY. BUT WE DON'T HAVE -- WE DON'T HAVE A
13 STRICT WORKFORCE PROGRAM. THAT'S BEEN -- THE CLIMATE CAREERS
14 PROGRAM IS WHAT WE PROPOSED IN OUR BUSINESS PLAN.

15

16 **LEON GARCIA:** WHAT ABOUT HIGH SCHOOL AGE WE'RE TRYING TO REACH
17 IN TERMS OF CAREER PATH AND APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM. CAN YOU
18 SPEAK TO THAT.

19

20 **JENNY BERG:** YES, THAT'S THE CLIMATE CAREERS PROGRAM. THAT'S A
21 CONTINUATION OF THE CURRENT GREENHOUSE PROGRAM AND IT'S ALL OF
22 OUR PROGRAMS REGIONALLY THERE IS CONNECTIONS IN ALL OF THE
23 HIGH SCHOOLS AND OTHER POTENTIAL ORGANIZATIONS THROUGHOUT THE
24 REGION.

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **LEON GARCIA:** THANK YOU. NAPA COUNTY, HOW DO WE GET IN TOUCH?

2

3 **JENNY BERG:** WHO DO WE GET IN TOUCH WITH?

4

5 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

6

7 **JENNY BERG:** THE BAYREN MEMBER IS RYAN. WHO IS NEW TO THE
8 COUNTY. HE WORKED AT THE COUNTY. BUT IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN
9 THE WORKFORCE I CAN CONNECT TO RISING SUN.

10

11 **LEON GARCIA:** APPRECIATE IT. WE CONNECT WITH MARK, WHO DEALS
12 WITH A LOT OF THE CLIMATE EMERGENCY STUFF WE HAVE TO DEAL
13 WITH. THANK YOU FOR THE TREMENDOUS OPPORTUNITY HERE. WITH THE
14 CHANGEOVER FROM GASOLINE POWERED CARS, I THINK I READS
15 SOMETHING LIKE 35,000 MECHANICS IN THE BAY AREA WILL BE OUT OF
16 WORK. THERE HAS TO BE TRANSITION TO SOMETHING THAT'S ALSO
17 ECONOMICALLY SUSTAINABLE FOR THEM AS WELL. THANK YOU. I LOOK
18 FORWARD TO MORE ON THIS.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
21 COMMENTS? OKAY IF NOT, I WILL MAKE A MOTION THAT THE EXECUTIVE
22 BOARD AUTHORIZES THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC OR DESIGNEE ON
23 BEHALF OF ABAG AND BAYREN TO AMEND A FUNDING AGREEMENT WITH
24 PG&E IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 157 MILLION FOR TOTAL CONTRACT

MAY 18, 2023

1 25,720,097,636 TO PROVIDE SERVICES FOR BAYREN IMPLEMENTATION
2 THROUGH DECEMBER 31ST, 2027.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER DISCUSSION
7 I'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY MEMBERS. PUBLIC THAT WISH TO
8 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

9

10 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
12 ON THIS ITEM. AT TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I SEE AND HEAR NO
13 PUBLIC MEMBERS THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO,
16 UNLESS THERE IS ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION, I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO
17 PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ON THE MOTION ARREGUIN SECOND ZOLMAN.
20 ANDERSON?

21

22 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.

23

24 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ARREGUIN.

25

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** AYE.

2

3 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BAS?

4

5 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** AYE.

6

7 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** BREED IS ABSENT. CARLSON?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YES.

10

11 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** CORZO?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES.

14

15 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** EKLUND?

16

17 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

18

19 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ELLENBERG? IS ABSENT. COUNCIL MEMBER FIFE?

20 IS ABSENT. COUNCIL MEMBER FLIGOR?

21

22 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

23

24 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MAYOR GARCIA?

25

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

2

3 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** HILLIS IS ABSENT. HUDSON? IS ABSENT. VICE
4 MAYOR KAMEI?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE? IS ABSENT.
9 SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MARQUEZ?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

12

13 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** SUPERVISOR MELGAR?

14

15 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

16

17 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MUELLER IS ABSENT.
18 NAGALES?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** ORTIZ?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

25

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS IS ABSENT.
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REID? COUNCIL MEMBER REID? IS ABSENT. COUNCIL
3 MEMBER ROMERO IS NOT AT A TELECONFERENCE LOCATION. SUPERVISOR
4 SACKETT? IS ABSENT. MAYOR SILVA?

5

6 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

7

8 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. MAYOR TIEDEMANN?

9

10 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

11

12 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

15

16 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** YOUNG IS ABSENT. JIMINEZ?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES.

19

20 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ?

21

22 **SERGIO LOPEZ:** AYE.

23

24 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER ZOLMAN?

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

2

3 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** DID I MISS ANYBODY? MOTION PASSES
4 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT THANK YOU.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OUR LAST ITEM 12, CALIFORNIA'S
7 HOUSING FUTURE 2040 THE NEXT REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION
8 DISCUSSION OF ISSUES RELATED TO REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
9 DETERMINATION AND REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION PROCESSES
10 TO INFORM THE ANALYSIS BEING CONDUCTED BY THE STATE FOR THE
11 7TH RHNA CYCLE THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM BUT WE WANTED TO
12 CALENDAR THIS FOR A PRESENTATION DISCUSSION SO YOU CAN PROVIDE
13 SOME INPUT TO STAFF AND HCD. AND GILLIAN ADAMS BACK BEFORE US
14 AGAIN ON RHNA TO GIVE THE REPORT.

15

16 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GILLIAN ADAMS, I'M THE
17 PRINCIPLE PLANNER HERE AT ABAG MTC AND WAS THE PROJECT MANAGER
18 OF THE SIXTH CYCLE RHNA. PULL UP THE SLIDES, PLEASE? NEXT
19 SLIDE. IN MY PRESENTATION TONIGHT, I'M GOING TO SET THE STAGE,
20 SPENDING A FEW MINUTES LOOKING AT ABAG'S RECENTLY COMPLETED
21 RHNA PROCESS SHARING WHAT WE KNOW ABOUT HCD'S RHNA EVALUATION
22 PROCESS INCLUDING REVIEW OF THE PUBLIC SURVEY THEY HAD OUT AND
23 TO HIGHLIGHT TOPICS THEY'RE SEEKING FEEDBACK ABOUT, AND WE'LL
24 LEAVE TIME FOR DISCUSSION OR QUESTIONS AT THE END. NEXT SLIDE.
25 AS YOU KNOW STATES LAW REQUIRES ALL JURISDICTIONS TO PLAN TO

MAY 18, 2023

1 MEET THE HOUSING NEEDS OF EVERYONE IN THEIR COMMUNITY. AS PART
2 OF THE RHNA PROCESS, HCD PRODUCES THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED
3 DETERMINATION THAT IDENTIFIES THE TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS BY
4 INCOME GROUP THAT EACH REGION MUST PLAN FOR. ABAG MUST THEN
5 DEVELOP A METHODOLOGY TO ALLOCATE A SHARE OF THAT REGION'S
6 HOUSING NEED BY INCOME TO EACH JURISDICTION IN THE BAY AREA.
7 THEN EACH JURISDICTION MUST UPDATE THE HOUSING ELEMENT OF ITS
8 GENERAL PLAN AND ITS ZONING TO SHOW HOW IT CAN ACCOMMODATE ITS
9 SHARE OF THE REGION'S HOUSING NEED. THERE WERE SIGNIFICANT
10 CHANGES MADE TO HOUSING ELEMENT LAW THAT IMPACTED THE RHNA
11 PROCESS FOR THIS RECENT CYCLE INCLUDING TOTAL NUMBER OF UNITS
12 IN THE SIGNED, WAS HIGHER THAN PREVIOUS CYCLES MORE FACTORS
13 THAT HAD TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE RHNA METHODOLOGY AS WELL AS
14 EXPANDED ROLE FOR HCD IN TERMS OF OVERSIGHT ON THE ALLOCATION
15 METHODOLOGY AND RESULTING ALLOCATIONS. AND NEW REQUIREMENTS
16 THAT MADE IT MORE CHALLENGING FOR JURISDICTIONS TO I'VE
17 ELIGIBLE SITES IN THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
18 LOOKING SPECIFICALLY AT THE BAY AREA RHNA PROCESS, AT 441,000
19 UNITS THE NEED DETERMINATION FROM HCD WAS MORE THAN DOUBLE
20 WHAT IT WAS IN THE PREVIOUS CYCLE. AND AS IT HAS IN PREVIOUS
21 RHNA CYCLES, ABAG CONVENED THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMPLETED
22 THAT MET ALMOST MONTHLY FOR A YEAR TO DEVELOP THE METHODOLOGY
23 FOR ALLOCATING A SHARE OF THE HOUSING NEED TO EACH
24 JURISDICTION. THE FINAL METHODOLOGY IDENTIFIED BY HMC
25 INCORPORATED THE TOTAL NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS IN THE YEAR 2050

MAY 18, 2023

1 FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THE REGION'S LONG RANGE LANDS USE
2 AND TRANSPORTATION PLAN AS WELL AS FACTORS THAT EMPHASIZE
3 ACCESS TO HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS AND PROXIMITY TO JOBS FOR
4 THOSE TRAVELING BY BOTH AUTOMOBILE AND TRANSIT. IN THE LAST
5 PHASE OF THIS RHNA PROCESS, THERE WERE 28 APPEALS OF THE DRAFT
6 ALLOCATIONS TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. AND ABAG PARTIALLY GRANTED
7 ONE OF THE APPEALS THAT RESULTED IN THE TRANSFER OF 35 UNITS
8 FROM CONTRA COSTA TO PITTSBURGH. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
9 REFLECTING ON EXPERIENCE WITH CYCLE SIX SOME THINGS WORKED
10 WELL ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS AND STAKEHOLDERS
11 PARTICULARLY DURING THE HMC PROCESS ALSO IN ONGOING COMMITTEE
12 MEETINGS AND DURING THE APPEALS HEARING ONLINE VISUALIZATION
13 TOOL THAT STAFF DEVELOPED TO HELP MEMBERS AND OTHERS EXPLORE
14 IMPACTS AND DIFFERENT COMBINATION WAS FACTORS AND WEIGHTS
15 DURING THE METHODOLOGY DEVELOPMENT PROCESS. GREAT EVIDENT
16 CHALLENGES WERE HAVING TO CONDUCT RHNA DURING COVID ESPECIALLY
17 WITH TIGHT STATUTORY DEADLINES PARTICULARLY TIMING BETWEEN
18 COMPLETING THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT AND THE
19 RHNA METHODOLOGY. TRYING TO NAVIGATE THE MANY NEW STATE
20 REQUIREMENTS SUCH AS AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING
21 WITHOUT PRECEDENCE OR GUIDANCE FROM HCD AND THE APPEALS
22 PROCESS WAS RESOURCE INTENSIVE FOR BOTH ABAG STAFF AND LOCAL
23 JURISDICTION STAFF. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO TURNING NOW TO AN
24 OVERVIEW OF HCD'S PROCESS FURTHER INITIATIVE, CALIFORNIA'S
25 FUTURE 2040 THE NEXT RHNA. ASSEMBLY BILL 101 FROM 2019 DIRECTS

MAY 18, 2023

1 HCD AND THE OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH TO DEVELOP
2 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE RHNA PROCESS AND METHODOLOGY
3 THAT PROMOTE AND STREAMLINE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AND
4 SUBSTANTIALLY ADDRESS CALIFORNIA'S HOUSING SHORTAGE. HCD MUST
5 REPORT ON ITS FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE LEGISLATURE
6 BY THE END OF THIS CALENDAR YEAR. AND THE INITIATIVE IS
7 LIMITED TO RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE HOUSING NEED
8 DETERMINATION FROM HCD AND THE RHNA PROCESS. NOT THE
9 GUIDELINES FOR DEVELOPMENT OR REVIEW OF HOUSING ELEMENTS. NEXT
10 SLIDE, PLEASE. HCD HAS IDENTIFIED THE FOLLOWING GUIDING
11 PRINCIPLES FOR THE CALIFORNIA HOUSING FUTURE 2040 INITIATIVE.
12 ENSURE RHNA IS FAIR, TRANSPARENT, OBJECTIVE, AND STREAMLINED
13 PROCESS FOR IDENTIFYING HOUSING NEED. FAIR IN TERMS OF
14 ADVANCING EQUITY, RACIAL JUSTICE, AND INCLUSION, AND
15 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE IN A MANNER THAT ENSURES ALL
16 JURISDICTIONS PLAN FOR THEIR FAIR SHARE OF THE REGION'S
17 HOUSING NEED. TRANSPARENT IN TERMS OF OPEN AND ACCESSIBLE
18 PARTICIPATION, PROACTIVE ENGAGEMENT AND MAKING MATERIALS
19 AVAILABLE ONLINE. OBJECTIVE IN TERMS OF MAINTAINING A DATA-
20 DRIVEN PROCESS AND ENSURING LOGICAL FLOW OF STEPS WITHIN
21 EFFICIENT PROCESS AVAILABLE TO ACCOMPLISH MEANINGFUL OUTCOMES
22 STRATEGICALLY PLAN FOR NEEDS OF HOUSING HOUSEHOLDS AT ALL
23 INCOME LEVELS PROMOTING INFIELD DEVELOPMENT FOR PROTECTION OF
24 NATURAL RESOURCES EFFICIENT DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS ACCOUNTING
25 FOR FUTURE CLIMATE RISK WITH GOAL OF ENSURING COMMUNITIES AND

MAY 18, 2023

1 VULNERABLE POPULATIONS ARE NOT UNDULY EXPOSED TO CLIMATE RISK
2 INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO DROUGHT, FLOODING, SEA LEVEL
3 RISE, AND WILDFIRE. ENCOURAGED INCREASED DEVELOPMENT TO
4 SUBSTANTIALLY ADDRESS CALIFORNIA'S HOUSING SHORTAGE AND
5 AFFORDABILITY ISSUES AND IMPROVE COMPLIANCE AND OUTCOMES
6 THROUGH 95S AND ENFORCEMENT AND ENHANCE AND PROTECT RHNA'S
7 ROLE IN AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING SO ALL CITIES
8 PLAN FOR THEIR FAIR SHARE OF GROWTH AND FUTURE PLANNING DOES
9 NOT FURTHER ENTRENCH SEGREGATED LIVING PATTERNS. NEXT SLIDE
10 PLEASE. AT ITS KICKOFF WEBINAR IN EARLY MARCH HCD IDENTIFIED
11 THE FOLLOWING KEY QUESTIONS AS A FOCUS FOR THE INITIATIVE: HOW
12 CAN RHNA CYCLE SEVEN BETTER CAPTURE EXISTING AND PROJECTED
13 HOUSING NEEDS. WHAT POTENTIAL PROCESS CHANGES TO SAVE STAFF
14 TIME AND RESOURCES, INCREASE TRANSPARENCY, AND INCREASE
15 ACCOUNTABILITY COULD BE IMPLEMENTED AS PART OF RHNA CYCLE
16 SEVEN? AND WHAT STRATEGIES COULD BE PURSUED TO BUILD ON THE
17 IMPORTANT ADJUSTMENTS MADE FOR RHNA CYCLE SIX THAT CONTRIBUTED
18 TO A MORE EQUITABLE RHNA HCD IS CONDUCTING A VARIETY OF
19 ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES FOR THE INITIATIVE. INCLUDING A PUBLIC
20 SURVEY FOR A SOUNDING BOARD MEETINGS WITH TECHNICAL EXPERTS,
21 PARTNERING LISTENING SESSIONS AND STATEWIDE PRESENTATIONS.
22 THERE ARE TWO REMAINING SOUNDING BOARD MEETINGS. HCD IS
23 POSTING THE AGENDAS FOR MEETINGS ABOUT A WEEK IN ADVANCE AND
24 ANYONE IS INVITED TO PROVIDE WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THE AGENDA
25 TOPICS. THE PUBLIC SURVEY HAS CLOSED BUT YOU CAN SEND COMMENTS

MAY 18, 2023

1 TO HCD'S DEDICATED E-MAIL ADDRESS, CA HOUSING FUTURE 2040 AT
2 HCD.CA.GOV THROUGHOUT THE INITIATIVE PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE,
3 PLEASE. SO TURNING NOW TO REVIEW OF HCD'S SURVEY. THERE ARE
4 FIVE MAIN TOPIC AREAS. IN THE FIRST HCD IS EXPLORING WHETHER
5 TO INCLUDE POPULATIONS RESIDING IN GROUP CORRIDORS SUCH AS
6 UNIVERSITY STUDENTS OR PERSONS EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS AND
7 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION FOR CYCLE SEVEN IN
8 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS STAFF IDENTIFIED KEY CONSIDERATIONS.
9 TOTAL NEED FROM HCD ALREADY INCLUDES ADJUSTMENTS TO ADDRESS
10 THE SYMPTOMS OF OUR BROKEN HOUSING MARKET SUCH AS OVERCROWDING
11 COST BURDEN AND LOW VACANCY AND IT'S NOT CLEAR HOW THE NEEDS
12 OF PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS WOULD INTERACT WITH THESE
13 EXISTING ADJUSTMENT FACTORS. PEOPLE IN GROUP QUARTERS ARE
14 CURRENTLY EXCLUDED FROM THE NEED DETERMINATION SO A REGION'S
15 TOTAL HOUSING NEED FROM HCD WOULD INCREASE IF THEY ARE
16 INCLUDED. BUT THIS WOULD ALSO ENABLE JURISDICTIONS TO
17 COINCIDENT SPACING GROUP QUARTERS ON THEIR ANNUAL PROGRESS
18 REPORTS TO HCD. IMPORTANTLY THERE ARE DATA GAPS FOR THESE
19 DEMOGRAPHIC GROUPS THAT WOULD MAKE ANY CHANGES CHALLENGING TO
20 IMPLEMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN THE SECOND TOPIC IN THE
21 SURVEY HCD IS CONSIDERING OPPORTUNITIES TO IMPROVE A COGS RHNA
22 PROCESS INCLUDING HCD OFFERING GUIDANCE ON HOW TO FURTHER THE
23 RHNA STATUTORY OBJECTIVES, WEATHER JURISDICTIONS SHOULD BE
24 ABLE TO PROVIDE SELF-REPORTED LAND USE DATA FOR USE IN THE
25 REGIONAL HOUSING NEED DETERMINATION AND THE RHNA PROCESSES AND

MAY 18, 2023

1 STRATEGIES FOR IMPROVING THE RHNA APPEALS PROCESS. THE KEY
2 CONSIDERATIONS IDENTIFIED BY ABAG STAFF INCLUDE HCD COULD
3 PROVIDE GUIDANCE ABOUT IDENTIFYING POSSIBLE METRICS FOR EACH
4 RHNA OBJECTIVE, WHICH WOULD BUILD ON ABAG'S CYCLE SIX
5 APPROACH. RELYING ON PUBLICITY DATA SETS PROVIDES A LEVEL
6 PLAYING FIELD FOR ALL JURISDICTIONS RECOGNIZING THAT
7 JURISDICTIONS WITH FEWER RESOURCES ARE OFTEN EIGHT
8 DISADVANTAGE WHEN ASKED TO GATHER SELF-REPORTED DATA. AND THE
9 STATUTORY LANGUAGE FOR APPEALS COULD BE SIGNIFICANTLY CLEARERS
10 ABOUT THE NARROW GROUNDS FOR AN APPEAL PROVIDING MORE CLARITY
11 TO THE INTERESTED JURISDICTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THE
12 THIRD TOPIC, HCD ASKS FOR SUGGESTIONS ABOUT HOW TO STRENGTHEN
13 RHNA'S EFFECTIVENESS AT AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING
14 AND HOW RHNA CAN BE IMPROVED TO FURTHER COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
15 AND ANTI-DISPLACEMENT GOALS. IN RESPONSE, ABAG STAFF PROPOSES
16 THAT IN ADDITION TO MORE CLARITY ABOUT POTENTIAL METRICS, HCD
17 COULD PROVIDE BETTER GUIDANCE ON HOW TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER
18 FAIR HOUSING IN A CONTEXT OF RHNA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THE
19 FOURTH SURVEY TOPIC, HCD IS EXPLORING IMPROVEMENT TO THE
20 REGIONAL HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION PLANNING PROCESSES TO
21 BETTER ALIGN HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION PLANNING OUTCOMES. FOR
22 THIS, ABAG STAFF SUGGESTED ADJUSTING THE HOUSING ELEMENT DUE
23 DATE SO IT'S AT LEAST 24 MONTHS AFTER THE ADOPTION OF THE
24 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGY WHICH WOULD ALLOW THE TIME FOR
25 THE COMPLETION OF PLANNED BAY AREA TO USE IN THE RHNA

MAY 18, 2023

1 METHODOLOGY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THE LAST SURVEY TOPIC, HCD
2 IS SEEKING TO IDENTIFY WAYS THAT RHNA COULD BETTER CONSIDER
3 CLIMATE RELATED ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS, ASSESS WHICH AREAS HAVE
4 THE HIGHEST RISK EXPOSURE, AND HOW COMMUNITIES DEVELOP IN WAYS
5 THAT REDUCE ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARD EXPOSURE FOR RESIDENTS,
6 PARTICULARLY FOR DISADVANTAGED AND HISTORICALLY UNDERSERVED
7 FOR POPULATIONS. KEY CONSIDERATIONS ARE IDENTIFIED BY ABAG
8 STAFF ARE THAT HCD SHOULD RECOMMEND USE OF PUBLIC DATA SETS
9 THAT ARE CONSISTENT FOR ALL JURISDICTIONS ARE WHEN IDENTIFYING
10 AREAS OF CLIMATE RISK. RECENT LEGISLATION HAS ALREADY ADDED
11 IMPACTS CAUSED BY CLIMATE CHANGE TO THE ALLOCATION FACTOR FOR
12 EVALUATING HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES AND CONSTRAINTS. AND, AS ALL
13 JURISDICTIONS FACE SOME LEVEL OF CLIMATE RELATED HAZARDS, HCD
14 SHOULD FOCUS ITS EFFORTS ON PROVIDING DATA, GUIDANCE, AND
15 FINANCIAL RESOURCES TO HELP JURISDICTIONS MINIMIZE RISK WHILE
16 INCREASING HOUSING SUPPLY AT ALL INCOME LEVELS. NEXT SLIDE,
17 PLEASE SO IN ADDITION TO SHARING HIGH-LEVEL THOUGHTS FROM ABAG
18 STAFF ON HCD SURVEY QUESTIONS I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT SOME OF
19 THE POTENTIAL CHANGES TO RHNA THAT WERE IDENTIFIED BY ABAG
20 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS AT THE END OF RHNA CYCLE SIX DESCRIBED
21 MORE FULLY IN THE MEMO PACKET THAT STAFF DEVELOPED IN MARCH
22 2022 WHICH WAS THE LAST TIME THE BORT DISCUSSED, HIGHLIGHTING
23 IDEAS FROM PRIOR DISCUSSION THAT ALIGN WITH HCD'S FOCUS AND
24 NEED TO DETERMINATION ON RHNA CALIFORNIA FUTURE 2040
25 INITIATIVE, BOARD MEMBERS SUGGEST THAT POTENTIAL NEW

MAY 18, 2023

1 METHODOLOGY FACTORS COULD INCLUDE JURISDICTIONS WITH LOW
2 PROPERTY TAX RECEIPTS, HAZARDS OR IMPACTS FROM CLIMATE CHANGE,
3 AND WATER CAPACITY. THEY EXPRESSED CONCERN THAT THE STATE'S
4 DEFINITION OF HIGH OPPORTUNITY AREAS WHICH WAS USED AS A
5 FACTOR IN ABAG BAG'S RHNA METHODOLOGY DOES NOT CONSIDER
6 TRANSIT PROXIMITY REQUESTED GUIDANCE FROM THE STATE ABOUT THE
7 COGS ANALYSIS OF THE METHODOLOGY FACTOR RELATED TO AVAILABLE
8 LANDS SUITABLE FOR URBAN DEVELOPMENT. THEY WANTED TO ALLOW
9 CITY TO CITY RHNA TRANSFERS IN ADDITION TO THE TRANSFERS THAT
10 ARE CURRENTLY ALLOWED FROM A COUNTY TO A CITY OR TOWN. THEY
11 REQUESTED MORE OPTIONS FOR JURISDICTIONS TO RECEIVE CREDIT
12 TOWARD RHNA GOALS, INCLUDING MAKING IT EASIER TO GET CREDIT
13 FOR PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND ALLOWING CREDIT IN THE
14 CURRENT RHNA CYCLE FOR A JURISDICTION THAT ISSUED PERMITS IN
15 EXCESS OF ITS ALLOCATION FROM A PREVIOUS CYCLE. AND THEY
16 SUGGESTED THAT THE STATES SHOULD OFFER GREATER CLARITY ABOUT
17 POTENTIAL REMEDIES IF IT BECAME IMPOSSIBLE FOR A JURISDICTION
18 TO ACCOMMODATE ITS RHNA AS A RESULT OF DROUGHT. NEXT SLIDE
19 PLEASE. SO, IN CLOSING, I WANT TO REVIEW SOME OF THE KEY
20 MILESTONES THAT HCDS PROCESS FOR THE CALIFORNIA'S FUTURE 2040
21 THE NEXT RHNA INITIATIVE. AS I MENTIONED THE SOUNDING BOARD
22 HAS TWO MORE MEETINGS TAKING PLACE MAY 31ST AND JUNE 5TH. THE
23 SCHEDULED MEETINGS AND THE AGENDA TOPICS ARE AVAILABLE ON
24 HCD'S WEB SITE WITH A LINK THAT'S SHOWN HERE ON THE SLIDES.
25 THE MEETINGS ARE NOT OPEN TO THE PUBLIC, BUT YOU CAN SUBMIT

MAY 18, 2023

1 WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THE AGENDA ITEMS TO THE DEDICATED E-MAIL.
2 WHICH, AGAIN, IS CA HOUSING FUTURE 2040 AT HCD.CA.GOV. I
3 SHOULD NOTE THAT THE SOUNDING BOARD IS NOT A DECISION-MAKING
4 BODY SO IT'S ONLY ADVISING HCD STAFF. HCD WILL BE ACCEPTING
5 COMMENTS TO THAT E-MAIL ADDRESS THAT I MENTIONED, THROUGHOUT
6 THE ENTIRE PROCESS, ALTHOUGH THEY'RE ASKING PEOPLE TRY TO
7 PROVIDE COMMENTS PRIOR TO DECEMBER 17TH SO STAFF HAS TIME TO
8 INCORPORATE THE FEEDBACK INTO THEIR FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS. AND
9 THEN HCD WILL MAKE A PROGRESS REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE BY
10 JULY 1ST AND WILL REPORT ON ITS FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS BY
11 DECEMBER 31ST. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THAT'S IT. AND I WOULD
12 BE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK
15 YOU FOR THE EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. LET'S OPEN UP FOR
16 DISCUSSION. I'LL GO TO COUNCIL ZOLMAN FIRST. AND I HAVE SOME
17 THOUGHTS TO SHARE AS WELL.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. CAN WE MOVE
20 BACK UP TO SLIDE TEN? IS IT AVAILABLE TO BACK UP? IT WAS GOOD
21 AND FAST I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT I PUT MY QUESTION IN
22 THE CONTEXT OF THE SLIDES. SLIDE TEN. THERE WE GO. SO,
23 PARTICULARLY APPRECIATED THE ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF JURISDICTIONS
24 WITH VERY FEW RESOURCES, THAT WOULD BE MINE. AND I'M SURE
25 OTHER SMALLER JURISDICTIONS. WE HAVE A VERY LIGHTLY STAFFED

MAY 18, 2023

1 PLANNING DEPARTMENT. I APPRECIATE RECOGNITION IN THE FACT OF
2 DISPARITIES IN ORDER TO PROPERLY FUND IN ORDER TO BE AS FAST
3 AS THEY SEEM TO SIMULTANEOUSLY WANT THIS DATA PRESENTED. THANK
4 YOU.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS
7 OR COMMENTS AT THIS TIME?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OH YEAH. SUPERVISOR.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** AND I --

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, PAT. I WANTED TO ASK IN REFERENCE TO THE
18 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT FOR THE SOUNDING BOARD. YOU SAID IT
19 WASN'T OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. SO, I'M ASSUMING YOU'RE LOOKING FOR
20 US TO PARTICIPATE IN THAT. BUT WHO ARE THE OTHER STAKEHOLDERS
21 THAT CAN ACTUALLY TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS, AND BE A PART OF THE
22 SOUNDING BOARD? JILL.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I AM A MEMBER OF THE SOUNDING BOARD. THE BOARD IS
25 MADE UP OF PRIMARILY SOME DIFFERENT ACADEMICS FROM THROUGHOUT

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 THE STATE, THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF COG MEMBERS FROM
2 THROUGHOUT THE STATES. THERE'S DIFFERENT GROUPS REPRESENTING
3 FOR THE BUILDING INDUSTRY, EQUITY ADVOCACIES, AFFORDABLE
4 HOUSING ADVOCACIES, SO IT'S A BROAD MIX OF FOLKS REPRESENTING
5 KIND OF STATEWIDE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. DO WE HAVE ADVOCATE THERE IS THAT ARE ALSO --
8 WELL, I SHOULD SAY, UNHOUSED, FOR THE UNHOUSED -- WE HAVE SOME
9 ADVOCATES PARTICIPATING IN THAT AS WELL?

10

11 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** I DON'T KNOW IF THERE ARE ANY INDIVIDUALS.
12 THERE ARE ORGANIZATIONS THAT, SORT OF, WORK WITH PEOPLE THAT
13 ARE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS BUT IT'S NOT REALLY REFLECTING
14 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, I GUESS I WOULD SAY.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE WE HAD THE
17 DIFFERENTLY REPRESENTATION PRESENT, AS WE ARE LOOKING TO MAKE
18 THESE ADJUSTMENTS AND CHANGES GOING FORWARD. BUT, THANK YOU SO
19 MUCH FOR THE BEAUTIFUL PRESENTATION. THANK YOU.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** VICE MAYOR NAGALES? BEFORE THE
22 MEMBERS ON ZOOM?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN WE GO TO SLIDE 14? SO I CAN HAVE
25 CONTEXT AS I -- [LAUGHTER] 14. I APPRECIATE THAT. I WASN'T ON

MAY 18, 2023

1 THE EXECUTIVE BOARD, BUT A LOT OF THESE IDEAS THAT THE BOARD
2 HAS IN TERMS OF IMPROVING THE RHNA PROCESS ARE ABSOLUTELY
3 SPOT-ON. I REALLY DO THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE OPTIONS IN
4 TERMS OF CREDIT. LIKE PRESERVING UNITS. I THINK THAT'S ONE OF
5 THE THINGS THAT RHNA MISSED ON. I MEAN, IF WE REALLY WANTED TO
6 PRESERVE UNITS IT SHOULD COUNT TOWARDS OUR RHNA GOALS. AND I
7 SERVE SAN MATEO COUNTY AND A LOT OF OUR MEMBERSHIPS IN SAN
8 MATEO COUNTY TALKED ABOUT WE WANT TO PRESERVE UNITS BUT CAN'T
9 COUNT IT TOWARDS OUR RHNA GOALS. I THINK FOR THE NEXT CYCLE
10 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY, REALLY IMPORTANT. SOMETHING I
11 ALSO THOUGHT ABOUT IS FAMILY ORIENTATED UNITS IF WE ARE TRYING
12 TO HIT OUR HOUSING GOALS AND HOUSE UNHOUSED, A LOT OF
13 DEVELOPERS I SEE ARE FOCUSED ON ONE BEDROOM STUDIOS, WHICH
14 ISN'T GOING TO REALLY HIT OUR FAMILIES. AND, SO IF WE CAN GET
15 MORE RHNA CREDIT FOR BUILDINGS THAT HAVE MORE FAMILY
16 ORIENTATED UNITS, I THINK WE CAN REALLY SEE MAYBE A CHANGE IN
17 TERMS OF HOW DEVELOPMENT IS COMING IN. I, ALSO, AGREE WITH THE
18 IDEA OF SOMETHING HOW CITIES SEE TRANSFER DURING THE -- I
19 DON'T KNOW IF THEY AN OPTION BUT IF THERE IS SOME WAY OF
20 COORDINATING CITIES WHERE THEY'RE WILLING TO ACCEPT MORE I
21 THINK THAT'S ACTUALLY A GREAT CONVERSATION. AND THERE WAS
22 SOMETHING HERE ABOUT COLLEGE STUDENTS, I THINK IT WAS, THAT IS
23 SOMETHING THAT I KNOW A LOT OF CITIES ARE LOOKING AT IN TERMS
24 OF WHERE THEY HAVE BIG COLLEGE CAMPUSES AND THAT WE HAVE TO
25 MAKE SURE THAT STUDENT POPULATIONS ARE ALSO HOUSED. SO I THINK

MAY 18, 2023

1 THESE ARE GREAT CONVERSATIONS, GREAT IDEAS IN TERMS FOR THE
2 NEXT CYCLE, AND I'M REALLY EXCITED THAT SOME OF THESE IDEAS
3 ARE REALLY TALKED ABOUT BY THIS BOARD. SO, THANK YOU VERY
4 MUCH.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. BEFORE WE GO TO SPEAKERS ON
7 ZOOM, MAYOR GARCIA AND ANY OTHER BOARD MEMBERS? OH JAR GAR
8 THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION. TRYING TO FIND THE --
9 I THINK IT'S THE IDEAS FOR CHANGE, RHNA PROCESS. I DON'T KNOW
10 WHAT NUMBER IT IS. I JUST HAVE A HAND-OUT. IS IT 14?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES. SAME SLIDE.

13

14 **LEON GARCIA:** WE HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL WITH THE COUNTY TO CITY
15 FOR OUR RHNA ALLOCATION, NOT THE CITY, WHERE I'M FROM, WE HAVE
16 BEEN ABLE TO BUILD A 70 UNIT HOUSING FOR 55 AND OLDER, MANY
17 WHO WERE FORMERLY HOMELESS, VETERANS WHO WERE HOMELESS, AND
18 IT'S BEEN VERY SUCCESSFUL. THE USUAL PUSH YOU GET WHEN
19 BUILDING IN NEIGHBORHOOD SOCIAL SECURITY WE DON'T WANT THAT
20 AROUND SO I GET ONE OF THOSE IT'S BEEN QUITE A SUCCESS STORY.
21 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE CITY TO CITY TYPE IF THAT'S POSSIBLE.
22 ONE THING THAT'S COME UP -- BY THE WAY, I THINK WE'RE AT ONE
23 HUNDRED 56% OF RHNA ALLOCATION FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSING. WE'RE
24 BUILDING A LOT BECAUSE WE HAVE THE ROOM TO BUILD IT IN. IN MY
25 APPROACH IS THAT I'M NOT OPPOSED TO BUILDING; BUILD IT RIGHT.

MAY 18, 2023

1 THESE ARE ALL BUILT FOLLOWING TERMS THAT COME FORWARD ON
2 CLIMATE CHANGE AND ELIMINATING GREENHOUSE GAS. ONE OF THE
3 ISSUES COMING UP IS COST OF BUILDING. ONE DEVELOPER CAME UP
4 WITH A CREATIVE IDEA, UNITS ARE BUILT ROBOTICALLY, HALF THE
5 COST OF STANDARD CONSTRUCTION, 50 BY 75 FOOT MODULE ONE OF
6 THEM IS A STUDIO APARTMENT COMES WITH ALL THE KITCHEN
7 AMENITIES, BATHROOM, JUST HAVE TO HOOK THEM UP, FIVE MINUTES
8 OFF LOADED, ABOUT AN HOUR TO HOOK UP, STACKED TOGETHER TWO OF
9 THEM ARE TWO BEDROOM ONE BATH THREE OF THEM ARE THREE BEDROOM
10 TWO BATH SOMETIMES REFERRED TO AS LEGO HOUSES, QUITE AN
11 IMPROVEMENT FOLLOWING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND NEIGHBORHOODS IF
12 YOU HAVE NEW CONSTRUCTION BUILDING FIRST FOLKS DON'T WANT
13 THAT, WHETHER THEY WANT TO BUY A HOUSE ACROSS THE STREET OR
14 NOT WHEN THEY COME IN. I WANTED TO SHARE THAT PIECE OF
15 INFORMATION. CLIMATE ISSUES, WONDERING HOW WE LOOK AT
16 ADDRESSING THAT, HELPING CITIES NAPA COUNTY DEVASTATING FIRE.
17 PRIOR YEAR SANTA ROSA AND SONOMA COUNTY. THERE'S A NEED TO
18 CLEAR UNDERBRUSH I'LL TURN IT THAT WAY AND IT WILL BE
19 INTERESTING IF THERE IS ANYTHING IN THIS PROCESS THAT ALLOWS
20 FOR FINANCING FOR THOSE TYPES OF ACTIVITY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. BEFORE I GO TO
23 THIS SIDE OF THE DAIS, ANYONE ELSE ON THIS SIDE OF THE DAIS AT
24 THIS TIME? OKAY. SUPERVISOR MARQUEZ?

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. THANK YOU FOR THE
2 PRESENTATION. AND IF YOU DISCUSSED THIS, I APOLOGIZE IF I
3 MISSED IT. BUT THIS FEEDBACK CYCLE IS THIS SOMETHING THEY
4 ALWAYS DO OR IS THIS A NEW APPROACH TO GET EARLY INPUT ON HOW
5 TO IMPROVE THE NEXT CYCLE?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T KNOW THAT THEY DO IT EVERY CYCLE BUT I HAVE
8 HEARD THEY HAVE DONE THIS IN THE PAST.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** IT'S VERY PRODUCTIVE. I AGREE WITH MANY OF THE
11 STATEMENTS MADE ON SLIDE 14. BUT JUST PART OF THIS DISCUSSION,
12 IS THERE EVER DISCUSSION WITH REGARD TO LOOKING AT HISTORICAL
13 RHNA NUMBERS, WHAT CITIES, WHAT COUNTIES HAVE BEEN DOING A
14 GOOD JOB AT GETTING CLOSE TO THEIR NUMBERS? IS THAT PART OF
15 THE CONVERSATION? COMPARING THAT TO, MAYBE, CITIES THAT
16 HAVEN'T BEEN AS AGGRESSIVE?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THAT HAS BEEN A CONVERSATION. SO I, WHEN THE
19 COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENT SOCIAL SECURITY WORKING ON ITS
20 METHODOLOGY, THAT USUALLY COMES UP AS A POTENTIAL IDEA IN
21 TERMS OF INCLUDING A FACTOR IN THE METHODOLOGY FOR, SORT OF,
22 GIVING CREDIT TO JURISDICTIONS FOR PAST PERFORMANCE. THE WAY
23 THAT RHNA WORKS, THE, SORT OF, LIST OF FACTORS AND OBJECT IS
24 THAT WE HAVE TO MEET REMAINS THE SAME, GENERALLY, WITH SOME
25 SMALL CHANGES SOMETIMES, BUT THE METHODOLOGY CAN BE CREATE

MAY 18, 2023

1 FROM SCRATCH EACH TIME. SO, IN THIS CASE, THERE WASN'T THAT
2 CONSIDERED AS PART OF THE METHODOLOGY BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT
3 COULD BE CONSIDERED IN THE FUTURE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. I DEFINITELY THINK IT NEEDS TO BE ANALYZED AND
6 I ALSO SUPPORT THE COMMENTS WITH RESPECT TO DOING AFFORDABLE
7 HOUSING UNITS THAT HAVE MORE THAN ONE BEDROOM WITH THEIR POINT
8 -- OUR COUNT, OUR POINT IN TIME COUNTS WE'RE SEEING THAT IT'S
9 FAMILIES THAT ARE UNSHELTERED SO DEFINITELY WANT TO ADDRESS
10 THE NEEDS OF THAT POPULATION, AND ALSO WANT TO SEE MORE
11 CREATIVITY WITH ZONING. WE HAVE A LOT OF COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE
12 DOWNTOWN DISTRICTS WHERE THERE IS POSSIBLY AN OPPORTUNITY TO
13 BUILD ABOVE COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS. I THINK WE JUST NEED TO BE A
14 LOT MORE FLEXIBLE IN THAT AREA, AS WELL. AND ANOTHER COMMENT.
15 SO, IS THERE, LIKE, FAQs TO GET THIS INFORMATION OUT FOR THE
16 E-MAIL BOX TO SEND INPUT? IS THERE A FAQ SHEET WHERE WE CAN
17 GET THIS INFORMATION OUT TO THE PUBLIC AND ENCOURAGE THEM TO
18 WEIGH IN AND HELP THEM FRAME THEIR POINTS?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** ALL OF THIS INFORMATION IN THE PROCESS IS ON HCD'S
21 WEB SITE. THEY HAVE A NICE LAY OUT OF SOUNDING BOARD FOR THEIR
22 MEETINGS AND THEIR AGENDAS AND CONTACT INFORMATION.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** AND THOSE ARE --

25

MAY 18, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THEY HAVE TO SUBMIT TO LEGISLATURE BY END OF THE
2 YEAR, THEY ASK BY MID-SEPTEMBER BUT THEY WOULD ACCEPT TO THE
3 END OF THE YEAR TOO.

4
5 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

6
7 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** MAYOR TIEDEMANN?

8
9 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. I
10 AGREE WITH SOME OF THE PREVIOUS COMMENTS BY OTHER MEMBERS OF
11 THE BOARD OF, YOU KNOW, PRESERVATION SHOULD BE -- COULD BE
12 USED TO COUNT TOWARDS RHNA AND LARGE FAMILY UNITS FOR BEING
13 INCENTIVIZED. TWO OTHER THOUGHTS, ONE OF MAKING SURE THAT THIS
14 TAKES ACCOUNT OF STUDENT POPULATIONS. ALBANY IF YOU LOOK AT IT
15 ON A MAP, BASICALLY A FIFTH OF THE CITY IS GRADUATE STUDENT
16 HOUSING FOR THE UNIVERSITY. AND THERE'S A HUGE HOUSING PROJECT
17 GOING UP THERE NOW BUT WE CANNOT COUNT IT TOWARDS OUR RHNA
18 WHICH IS INDICATIVE OF THE RHNA ACCOUNT NOT ACKNOWLEDGING
19 STUDENTS ARE PART OF THE SAME MARKET FOR HOUSING AS EVERYBODY
20 ELSE AND PROVIDING THEM HOUSING IS A VERY IMPORTANT PART OF
21 FULFILLING ALL OF THE RHNA OBLIGATIONS SO TAKING MORE
22 ATTENTION TO THE STUDENT POPULATION AND HOW THEY INTERACT WITH
23 THE LARGER MARKET AND THE RHNA NUMBERS I THINK WOULD BE VERY
24 GOOD. LASTLY, I JUST WOULD CAUTION ON THE IDEA OF LETTING
25 PREVIOUS DEVELOPMENT COUNT TOWARDS THE NEXT CYCLE TO SOME

MAY 18, 2023

1 EXTENT AS HAVING LOOKED AT THE SUMMARY DATA FOR THE FIFTH
2 CYCLE FOR AT LEAST THE EAST BAY. A LOT OF US INCLUDING ALBANY
3 ARE PRETTY GOOD AT MEETING OUR NUMBERS FOR THE MARKET RATE
4 UNITS AND NOT GOOD AT MEETING FOR THE AFFORDABLE UNITS. WE'RE
5 DEVELOPING 3 TO 1 MARKET RATE UNITS FOR EVERY AFFORDABLE OR 10
6 TO ONE OR MUCH MORE. IF WE LET PEOPLE COUNT -- LET
7 JURISDICTIONS COUNT ONE CYCLE TOWARDS THE NEXT, I JUST DON'T
8 WANT THAT TO END UP LOOKING LIKE WE'RE LETTING A HUGE AMOUNT
9 OF MARKET RATE HOUSING COUNT TOWARDS A RHNA ALLOCATION WHEN WE
10 ARE STILL NOT BUILDING ENOUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND VERY FEW
11 OF US ARE BUILDING ENOUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO I WANT TO BE
12 VERY CAREFUL ABOUT THAT.

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HERE
15 IN THE ROOM BEFORE WE GO TO SPEAKERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. COUNCIL
16 MEMBER EKLUND? AND THEN A SPEAKER AT THE SAN JOSE LOCATION.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. GILLIAN,
19 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR SERVING ON THIS. IT'S A -- I KNOW IT'S
20 A TOUGH JOB, BUT -- AND, REALLY, AN AGREE WITH ALL OF YOUR
21 SUGGESTIONS ON YOUR SLIDE, FOR WHAT WE SHOULD REALLY PUSH FOR.
22 I ESPECIALLY WANT TO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR REMEMBERING THE
23 LOW PROPERTY TAX CITIES. BECAUSE THE LOW PROPERTY TAX CITIES -
24 - AND THERE IS NOT VERY MANY OF THEM IN THE STATE OF
25 CALIFORNIA, IT'S LIKE 20 OR 30 -- BUT WE DON'T HAVE THE MONEY

MAY 18, 2023

1 TO BE ABLE TO BUY DOWN THE UNITS SO WE CAN GET MORE LOWER
2 INCOME UNITS THERE. SO, AND WE DON'T HAVE THE PROPERTY TAX TO
3 REALLY SERVICE THE PEOPLE WHEN THEY GET TO TOWN TOO. SO IT
4 REALLY AFFECTS OUR ABILITY TO SERVE. SO I REALLY APPRECIATE
5 THAT AND HOPE THAT THERE CAN BE SOME RECOGNITION FOR THAT. TO
6 WHAT EXTENT ARE YOU REACHING OUT TO PLANNERS AND CITY COUNCIL
7 MEMBERS, AS ISSUES COME UP? ARE YOU REACHING OUT TO FOLKS? OR
8 ARE YOU JUST DOING IT BASED ON ABAG STAFF AND WHAT YOUR
9 EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN?

10

11 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** WE HELD A WEBINAR IN EARLY MARCH THAT WAS KIND
12 OF OUR ATTEMPT TO REACH OUT TO LOCAL STAFF AND JUST TO MAKE
13 SURE TO YOUR POINT THAT THEY'RE AWARE OF THE PROCESS AND THEIR
14 OPPORTUNITIES TO ENGAGE. I GUESS THE SOUNDING BOARD MEETINGS
15 ARE VERY TECHNICAL AND SO FAR THEY HAVE BEEN REALLY ABOUT THE
16 FIRST PART WAS, SORT OF, ABOUT THE NEED DETERMINATION AND,
17 SORT OF, DEFINING SOME OF THE FACTORS THAT GO INTO THAT. SO
18 HOW HCD DOES ITS PART IN TERMS OF FOLLOWING THE STATUTORY
19 GUIDANCE AND GIVING REGION'S THEIR BIG NUMBER AND THEN A
20 LITTLE BIT ABOUT, I THINK THE EMPHASIS SO FAR FROM THE STATE
21 HAS REALLY BEEN ON AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING AND
22 HOMELESSNESS AND TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO BEST EMPHASIZE
23 THOSE IN THE METHODOLOGY. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, I GUESS I
24 WOULD -- I DON'T KNOW THAT I WOULD, SORT OF, COME ACROSS

MAY 18, 2023

1 SOMETHING LIKE REACHING OUT TO LOCAL STAFF MADE A LOT OF
2 SENSE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. I APPRECIATE THAT. BUT I HAVE TO TELL YOU,
5 I HAVE BEEN VERY FRUSTRATED WITH THE PROCESS OF THESE MEETINGS
6 NOT BEING OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. AND I DON'T KNOW HOW TO STATE TO
7 HAVE A COMMITTEE WITHOUT ALLOWING PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE. AND
8 THEY SHOULD BE SUBJECT TO THE BROWN ACT. AND BELIEVE ME, THIS
9 IS AN ISSUE THAT I'M NOT GOING TO KEEP SILENT ABOUT, WHEN THE
10 REPORT IS PRESENTED TO THE STATE LEGISLATURE. BECAUSE THIS
11 VIOLATES EVERY LAW, I THINK, THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA HAS. BUT
12 I THINK THERE ARE SOME OTHER THINGS THAT WE MIGHT WANT TO
13 CONSIDER TOO. THERE'S -- AS YOU KNOW, THE PANDEMIC REALLY HAS
14 CHANGED HOW PEOPLE WORK AND LIVE. AND, SO, I THINK THIS WHOLE
15 PROXIMITY TO JOBS AND THINGS LIKE THAT, ALL OF THAT HAS TO BE
16 REEXAMINED IN LIGHT OF THE PANDEMIC, ESPECIALLY SINCE THERE
17 HAS BEEN A MASS EXODUS OF PEOPLE THAT ARE LIVING AND WORKING
18 IN SAN FRANCISCO. BECAUSE YOU CAN NOW LIVE IN SEATTLE AND WORK
19 IN SAN FRANCISCO REMOTELY. SO, I THINK THAT REALLY NEEDS TO
20 HAVE SOME DISCUSSION AT SOME POINT. BECAUSE THAT WOULD
21 DEFINITELY CHANGE THE ATTITUDE OF HOW MUCH HOUSING DO WE NEED.
22 AND SO THE NUMBER OF JOBS MAY NOT NECESSARILY BE A GOOD
23 INDICATIVE OF WHAT IS NEEDED IN THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE THEY MAY
24 BE LIVING IN SEATTLE IF THE JOB IS IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND THERE
25 IS A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT ARE DOING THAT. I THINK THERE ARE SOME

MAY 18, 2023

1 OTHER THINGS, TOO, THAT WE MIGHT WANT TO ADVOCATE FOR IS THAT
2 WE HAD SOME DISCUSSION ABOUT ELIMINATING THE HIGH FIRE RISK
3 AREAS FROM CONSIDERATION FOR GROWTH. SAME THING WITH SEA LEVEL
4 RISE, BCDC AND OTHER AGENCIES ARE GETTING A BETTER AND MORE
5 ACCURATE ESTIMATE OF WHAT IMPACTS IT'S GOING TO HAVE AVAILABLE
6 PROPERTY AND, ALSO, IMPACT ON EXISTING HOUSING, TOO. THAT
7 NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED. AND FACTORED IN. AND I ALSO HAVE TO
8 URGE TO YOU BRING UP THE ISSUE OF WHAT DO YOU INTEND TO DO
9 WHEN A CITY OR TOWN LIKE BELVEDERE IS AN ISLAND ACTUALLY TWO
10 ISLANDS AND THEY CAN'T BUILD ANY MORE LAND, BCDC IS NOT GOING
11 TO ALLOW THEM TO FILL, AND SO YOU KNOW THERE ARE RULES ABOUT
12 GOING UP, YOU JUST CAN'T KEEP BUILDING UP. SO AT SOME POINT, I
13 THINK THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME CITIES BUILT OUT
14 GEOGRAPHICALLY AND I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED AND
15 THERE IS PROBABLY NOT THAT MANY OF US, BUT I'M THINKING OF
16 TIBURON OR BELVEDERE, THEY'RE LAND LOCKED. AND I, ALSO, HAVE -
17 - FILLED OUT THE SURVEY QUESTION. DID NOT FEEL THAT THEY WERE
18 GOOD QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PROCESS, AND THEY WERE REALLY FOCUSED
19 ON ISSUES THAT THEY WERE CONCERNED ABOUT, NOT NECESSARILY HOW
20 DO YOU FACTOR WHAT IS NEEDED IN CALIFORNIA OR IN THE REGION,
21 AND THEN WHAT IS ABLE TO BE BUILT. LASTLY, I THINK THAT CITIES
22 DO NOT HAVE CONTROL OVER DEVELOPERS THAT WILL ONLY DO THE
23 MINIMUM ON LOW-INCOME. SO, I THINK THAT WE REALLY DO NEED TO
24 MAKE SURE THAT ALL HOUSING, ESPECIALLY IF WE HAVE BUILT MORE
25 IN ONE HOUSING CYCLE, WE SHOULD GET CREDIT FOR THAT IN THE

MAY 18, 2023

1 FUTURE. BECAUSE THAT -- AND BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE CONTROL OVER
2 WHAT THE DEVELOPERS NECESSARILY BUILD. AND BUILDERS HAVE TOLD
3 ME, AND I AM SURE ALL OF US HAVE HEARD THIS, THAT THERE IS
4 ONLY SO MUCH THAT THEY CAN DO IN TERMS OF BUILDING LOW-INCOME
5 UNITS AS PART OF THEIR DEVELOPMENT. WE'RE FIGHTING A DEVELOPER
6 RIGHT NOW ON A MAJOR DEVELOPMENT THAT WAS COMMERCIAL. AND, SO,
7 I THINK THAT WE REALLY DO NEED TO GET MORE. AND THEN THIS
8 WHOLE ISSUE OF TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING, I THINK THAT WHOLE
9 ISSUE NEEDS TO BE REALLY LOOKED AT. THOSE ARE SOME OF MY
10 COMMENTS. AND REALLY OPPOSED TO THE WAY THAT THEY'RE
11 CONDUCTING THESE BECAUSE THESE ARE NOT BEING DONE IN A PUBLIC
12 FASHION. AND JUST IS THE -- IT VIOLATES EVERY RULE IN OUR BOOK
13 IN CALIFORNIA. AND I DON'T KNOW HOW HCD IS GETTING BY THAT.
14 BUT, I HOPE, JESSE, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, THAT WE CAN GET
15 UPDATES AS WE'RE GOING. BECAUSE I THINK THAT GETTING MORE
16 FEEDBACK FROM US ON SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT THEY'RE DEALING
17 WITH, OUR OWN MECHANISM TO PROVIDE INPUT IS THROUGH GILLIAN.
18 SO I SUGGEST THAT WE KEEP THIS ON EVERY ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
19 MEETING JUST SO WE CAN GET AN UPDATE AND PROVIDE INPUT ON
20 WHERE WE'RE GOING SO WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT OUR VOICE IS BEING
21 HEARD. SO, THANK YOU. AND DOING A GOOD JOB, GILLIAN.

22

23 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU.

24

MAY 18, 2023

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** I WILL CERTAINLY TAKE THAT REQUEST
2 INTO CONSIDERATION. I DO THINK GETTING UPDATES MONTH HE -- WE
3 MAY NOT MEET MONTHLY -- BUT MONTHLY MAY BE A LOT BUT GETTING
4 SOME PROGRESS REPORT MAYBE SOMEWHERE IN THE SUMMER OR FALL
5 WHERE WE'RE AT I THINK THAT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO THE
6 EXTENT THAT COULD BE ACCOMMODATED.

7

8 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** JUST A NOTE THE SOUNDING BOARD MEETINGS ARE
9 GOING TO BE FINISHED ON JUNE 5TH. SO IT'S NOT CLEAR TO ME YET
10 EXACTLY WHAT FORM THE JULY 4TH -- SORRY -- JULY 1ST UPDATE TO
11 THE LEGISLATURE WILL TAKE. SO I THINK MY ROLE AS A SOUNDING
12 BOARD MEMBER IS DONE EARLY JUNE.

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YEAH. BUT THERE WILL BE SUBSEQUENT
15 TO THAT, THERE WILL BE SOME REPORT ON SOME THINGS THAT WILL BE
16 ADMINISTRATIVE AND SOME THINGS THAT MIGHT BE LEGISLATIVE. AND
17 I'LL GET TO THAT SHORTLY. OKAY. WE'LL GO TO THE SAN JOSE ROOM.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANKS SO MUCH. I APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK, HERE,
20 BY ABAG STAFF AND BY MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE. THERE
21 ARE A LOT OF GREAT SUGGESTIONS AND FEEDBACK. SO I'M NOT GOING
22 TO COMMENT ON EVERY ITEM, WHICH I FEEL MAKES A LOT OF SENSE.
23 BUT I WANT TO FIRST JUST ALSO EXPRESS MY AGREEMENT WITH THE
24 LAST MEMBER WHO COMMENTED IN-PERSON ABOUT THE CONCERNS -- AND
25 I'M SORRY -- I DIDN'T CATCH HIS NAME, BUT THE CONCERNS ABOUT

MAY 18, 2023

1 BEING ABLE TO TRANSFER UNITS FROM ONE CYCLE TO ANOTHER. I
2 WON'T DOUBLE DOWN ON THAT, BUT I THINK IT'S VERY PROBLEMATIC.
3 AND I WANT TO VOICE AN EXTREME AMOUNT OF CONCERN WITH THE
4 SUGGESTION TO HAVE -- TO POTENTIALLY ALLOW CITY TO CITY
5 TRANSFERS OF UNITS, INSTEAD OF JUST COUNTY TO CITY, IN A
6 LIMITED NUMBER OF CASES. AND AS FOR THE REASON THAT THAT HAS
7 THE POTENTIAL TO CREATE TWO DIFFERENT SETS OF RULES FOR THOSE
8 WHO HAVE FUNDING AND FOR THOSE WHO DON'T. AND I JUST DON'T
9 THINK WE CAN -- WITH THE SCOPE OF THE HOUSING CRISIS, WE CAN'T
10 ALLOW JURISDICTIONS TO BUY THEIR WAY OUT OF HAVING THE --
11 BEING ABLE TO ACHIEVE HOUSING JUSTICE. SO EXTREME AMOUNT OF
12 CONCERN WITH THAT SUGGESTION. AND I THINK ALSO WE HAVE ANOTHER
13 MEMBER HERE WHO WISHES TO --

14

15 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ. NEYSA FLIGOR,
16 SANTA CLARA COUNTY. I WANT TO ECHO THE THANKS TO GILLIAN, MISS
17 ADAMS, GREAT PRESENTATION, EXCELLENT AS USUAL. AND THANK YOU
18 FOR SERVING ON THE SOUNDING BOARD AND FOR COMING BACK TO THE
19 EXECUTIVE BOARD AND PROVIDING THIS UPDATE. VERY OF
20 APPRECIATED. A LOT OF WHAT I WANTED TO COMMENT ON HAS ALREADY
21 BEEN SAID, EXPANDING ON HOW WE IMPROVE ON OUTCOMES AND THE
22 INCENTIVE PIECE, GILLIAN. I KNOW, AS SOMEONE WHO WORKED ON THE
23 METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE, A LOT OF THAT WAS DONE AT THAT LEVEL
24 WHERE WE TRY TO DETERMINE, FOR EXAMPLE, IF A PARTICULAR
25 JURISDICTION MET ITS RHNA FIFTH CYCLE, HOW DO WE GIVE CREDIT

MAY 18, 2023

1 TO THAT JURISDICTION WITH THE NUMBER OF DISTRIBUTION. I THINK
2 AS WE LOOK TO THE SEVENTH CYCLE, IF JURISDICTIONS HAVE MET
3 THEIR RHNA NUMBERS, THEY SHOULD BE CREDITED THAT WOULD BE A
4 HUGE INCENTIVE TO REACH AND ACHIEVE THEIR RHNA NUMBERS IF THEY
5 WILL BE CREDITED IN THE 7TH CYCLE, IF THEY COME CLOSE TO
6 MEETING THEIR FULL ALLOCATION NUMBERS. I HOPE HCD AND
7 SACRAMENTO GIVES CONSIDERATION TO HOW WE INCENTIVIZE AND GET
8 HOUSING BUILT IN THESE DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS AND THE FUNDING
9 PIECE I AGREE 100% WE'RE GOING TO GET HOUSING BUILT WE NEED
10 OUR COMMUNITIES WE NEED FUNDING, HCD NEEDS TO MAKE SURE THAT
11 WE'RE A BIG PART OF THEIR REPORT BACK TO SACRAMENTO, AND
12 DEFINING UNITS. THERE IS THERE SHOULD BE A CLEAR DEFINITION
13 FOR UNITS, COULD BE ONE BEDROOM APARTMENT, WE NEED TO MAKE
14 SURE THERE IS FLEXIBILITY IN DEFINING A UNIT, ENCOURAGING TWO
15 OR THREE BEDROOM UNITS FOR FAMILIES WHATEVER WE CAN DO, TO
16 ENCOURAGE UNITS I THINK THAT WOULD HAVE MORE THAN ONE BEDROOM
17 I THINK THAT WILL SERVE OUR COMMUNITY AS WELL. AND LAST THING
18 I ECHO OTHERS ON THE FLEXIBILITY TOWARD RHNA ALLOCATION, AND
19 THE STUDENT HOUSING, I KNOW THERE WERE RESTRICTIONS AND
20 CONFUSION AT THE BEGINNING OF THIS CYCLE AND COUNT TOWARDS
21 THAT NUMBER SO I THINK THAT CLARITY AND FLEXIBILITY ON THAT
22 WOULD BE HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. NOT SEEING OTHER
25 SPEAKERS ON ZOOM. I'M GOING TO JUMP IN. I AGREE WITH MANY OF

MAY 18, 2023

1 THE CONSIDERATIONS OF STAFF, FIRST STARTING WITH THE IDEA OF
2 GROUP HOUSING I THINK THIS IS AN ISSUE THAT WARRANTS MORE
3 CONSIDERATION, THE MAYOR, BERKELEY HOME OF THE FLAGSHIP
4 UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA CAMPUS, FLAGSHIP UNIVERSITY OF
5 CALIFORNIA HOPEFULLY THE COURT WILL LET THEM BUILD ON PEOPLE'S
6 PARK BUT THAT'S AN ENTIRELY DIFFERENT MATTER, AND HOPEFULLY
7 HOST CITIES FOR UC CAMPUSES THAT HAVE RAISED AS WELL, AND IT
8 MAY BE CHALLENGING TO HAVE ADEQUATE DATA TO COUNT GROUP LIVING
9 ACCOMMODATIONS, THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WOULD HAVE TO BE LOOKED
10 AT IN THAT CONTEXT. THIS BECOMING MORE COMMON, STUDENT
11 HOUSING, PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE HOUSING, PEOPLE LIVING IN GROUP
12 OR COMMUNAL SITUATIONS BECAUSE IT'S AFFORDABLE, I THINK IT'S
13 SOMETHING WE HAVE TO LOOK AT NOT JUST BY UNIT BUT DIFFERENT
14 TYPES OF HOUSING SITUATIONS. I WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THAT
15 AND I APPRECIATE YOU FLAGGING THAT WITH RESPECT TO THE
16 PROCESS. WE SHOULD EMPHASIZE AS A COG THAT WE THE STATE TO
17 CREATE ANOTHER PROGRAM FOR THE 7th CYCLE THAT WAS EXTREMELY
18 IMPORTANT FOR THE STATE TO PROVIDE THE MONEY AGAIN THAT'S THE
19 ONLY WAY THIS IS GOING TO WORK EFFECTIVELY, CERTAINLY THE MORE
20 CLARITY THAT COULD BE PROVIDED ON AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING
21 FAIR HOUSING REQUIREMENTS, FOR PROVIDING DATA SETS I AGREE
22 WITH THE LANGUAGE REGARDING APPEALS THAT -- AND I'M JUST
23 TRYING TO FIND THAT HERE -- THAT WE SHOULD AMEND THE STATUTE
24 TO PROHIBIT JURISDICTIONS FROM APPEALING TO OVERALL
25 METHODOLOGY. THAT WAS AN ONGOING ISSUE THAT WE DEALT WITH.

MAY 18, 2023

1 MANY OF US HAVE PTSD FROM THE APPEALS, THE 28 APPEALS THAT WE
2 HAD TO HEAR. PEOPLE WERE APPEALING THE UNDERLYING METHODOLOGY
3 WHEN THE REALITY, THEY'RE ABILITY TO APPEAL IS LIMITED TO
4 THREE CRITERIA. SO I THINK REALLY MAKING THAT CLEAR, EITHER
5 YOU ALLOW PEOPLE TO APPEAL THE METHODOLOGY, OR YOU DON'T. BUT
6 I THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE CLEAR. AND I DO AGREE WITH THE
7 SUGGESTION OF MANY TO CLARIFY THE PROCEDURE IN THE CASE THAT
8 NO APPEALS WERE FILED, I DO NOT -- I DOUBT THAT'S GOING HAPPEN
9 IN THE 7TH CYCLE, BUT IN THE CASE IT DOES THAT MIGHT BE
10 HELPFUL. I THINK MORE CLARITY ABOUT WHAT ARE THE CIRCUMSTANCES
11 UNDER WHICH PEOPLE CAN APPEAL NEEDS TO BE CLARIFIED,
12 STATUTORILY, AND ALSO IN GUIDANCE FROM HCD AND THE GOINGS IS
13 EXTREMELY PERSONALITY BECAUSE THAT WILL SAVE EVERYONE LOTS OF
14 TIME. SOME PEOPLE APPEALED BECAUSE I THINK THEY THOUGHT THAT I
15 HAD THE OBLIGATION TO APPEAL KNOWING THEY WERE UNLIKELY TO BE
16 SUCCESSFUL IN APPEALING AND THEY CERTAINLY HAVE THE RIGHT TO
17 DO SO IF SO INCLINED. LET ME SEE HERE. I AGREE WITH PROVIDING
18 A BUFFER AROUND THE SCS, AND THE RHNA. THIS WAS AN ISSUE WHEN
19 WE WERE DOING OUR RHNA METHODOLOGY. BECAUSE WE HADN'T ACTUALLY
20 FINALIZED THE SCS. AND WE ACTUALLY DIDN'T HAVE A FINAL
21 BLUEPRINT AND THOSE REPRESENT SAN FRANCISCO MAY REMEMBER ALL
22 OF A SUDDEN THE NUMBERS CHANGED AND THAT WAS DIFFICULT. AND I
23 THINK IT UPSET A LOT OF CITIES. AND I THINK IF WE CAN ACTUALLY
24 HAVE A BUFFER BETWEEN WHEN THE SCS IS DONE, AND WHEN THE RHNA
25 IS DONE, THEN WE KNOW WHAT THE NUMBERS ARE, AND WE'RE NOT

MAY 18, 2023

1 GOING TO BE SURPRISED AND WE CAN ACTUALLY PLAN APPROPRIATELY.
2 SO, I THINK THAT'S -- I THINK THE SAN FRANCISCO SITUATION, AND
3 CONTRA COSTA'S WAS AFFECTED TOO, ARE PRIME EXAMPLES WE COULD
4 CITE IN THAT CASE. CLIMATE HAZARDS I KNOW THAT CLIMATE HAZARDS
5 ARE A FACTOR. BUT I DO THINK THAT SEA LEVEL RISE AND FIRE RISK
6 -- MAYBE IT'S SUSTAINABLE HIGH FIRE SEVERITY ZONE THAT NEEDS
7 TO BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION, WE NEED TO BE MORE SPECIFIC
8 RECOGNIZING DIFFERENTLY JURISDICTIONS HAVE DIFFERENT CLIMATE
9 RISKS THERE ARE SOME CALIFORNIA CITIES SPECIFICALLY THAT EXIST
10 THAT NEED TO BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION, AND THERE ARE CITIES
11 THAT ARE GOING TO BE FLOODED AND SOMETHING THAT BCDC IS HAVING
12 CONVERSATIONS AROUND IN TERMS OF BAY ADAPT AND PLANNING WE
13 WANT COMMUNITIES TO DO INTENTIONALLY IN TERMS OF HOW WE'RE
14 ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL RISE. MANY OF US LIVE IN AREAS WHERE
15 WE'RE ON THE WILDLAND URBAN INTERFACE OR DIRECTLY IN THE
16 WILDLAND, AND THOSE SUPERVISOR REPRESENTED COUNTIES AND WE
17 DON'T WANT TO PUT HOMES AND PLACES WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO
18 BURN. AND I THINK WE NEED TO BE INTENTIONAL AS A STATE
19 ENCOURAGING SUSTAINABLE TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT. AND I
20 THINK THIS DOES GET TO THE QUESTION OF FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF
21 UNIT TRANSFERS AND PEOPLE FORMING SUBREGIONS. AND I THINK WE
22 NEED TO ENCOURAGE MORE PEOPLE TO DO SUBREGIONS BECAUSE I THINK
23 T HAT PROVIDES MORE FLEXIBILITY FOR THE CITIES AND COUNTY TO
24 FIGURE HOW THEY WANT TO PLAN ALLOCATION OF THEIR UNITS IN
25 THEIR COUNTY. I HEAR THE CONCERN AROUND ENABLING CITY TO CITY

MAY 18, 2023

1 TRANSFERS BUT I WILL SAY THERE ARE CIRCUMSTANCES WHERE DUE TO
2 GEOGRAPHY AND LIMITED LAND IT ACTUALLY TECHNICALLY IS NOT
3 FEASIBLE FOR A CITY TO ACTUALLY MEET THEIR NUMBERS. SO HOW DO
4 WE ALLOW FOR FLEXIBILITY IN THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES FOR CITIES TO
5 TRANSFER THEIR UNITS. I'D SAY ONLY IF THEY PAY A PRETTY
6 SIGNIFICANT MONETARY PENALTY EITHER AT A REGIONAL FUND OR TO
7 THE STATE. I DON'T THINK YOU SHOULD ALLOW CITY TO CITY
8 TRANSFERRED WITHOUT BEING SOME CONTRIBUTION TOWARDS OF THE
9 OVERALL AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEED OF THE REGION. THAT'S MY
10 PERSPECTIVE SOME OF IT IS LEGISLATIVE AND ADMINISTRATIVE. AT
11 THE OUTCOME OF THE PROCESS, IDENTIFYING AND DISTINGUISHING
12 THOSE TYPES OF CHANGES. BUT SOME OF THIS, WE WOULD NEED TO, AS
13 AN AGENCY, INCLUDE IN OUR LEGISLATIVE PLATFORM, CORRECT, ABOUT
14 THINGS THAT WE WANT TO SEE CHANGED IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT
15 STATUTE.

16

17 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** I WOULD THINK SO, YEAH. IT'S UNCLEAR NOW WHICH
18 DIRECTION THEY'RE GOING TO GO IN TERMS OF PROCEDURAL
19 CHALLENGES VERSUS LEGISLATIVE CHANGES.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YEAH AND WHO KNOWS WHEN THE
22 LEGISLATIVE CHANGES WILL HAPPEN. WE DID RECOMMEND ONE CHANGE
23 WHICH IS GIVING FLEXIBILITY IN THE CASE OF COMPLIANCE TO BE
24 ABLE TO EXTEND THEIR TIMELINE EVEN IF PAST THE DEADLINE
25 BECAUSE BUILDERS REMEDY KICKS IN. AND WE SUBMITTED OUR HOUSING

MAY 18, 2023

1 ELEMENT THOUGHT WE WERE DONE THEN THE DAY BEFORE THE DEADLINE
2 HCD PROVIDED A NEW SET OF COMMENTS SO WE HAD TO THEN MAKE
3 ADJUSTMENTS AND WE GOT CERTIFIED TWO OR THREE WEEKS LATER BUT
4 THE WHOLE QUESTION OF BUILDERS REMEDY IT'S PROVIDED CONFUSION
5 BECAUSE OF STATUTE SAYS THAT THE CITY CAN'T MAKE DETERMINATION
6 OF HCD COMPLIANCE SAID WE'RE THE ONLY ONES WHO CAN DETERMINE
7 COMPLIANCE SO THERE NEEDS TO BE CLARIFICATION LEGISLATIVELY
8 BECAUSE WE HAVE THE LAW SAYING ONE THING AND THE STATE SAYING
9 ANOTHER THING AND THE STATE AGENCY IMPLEMENTING THE LAST THING
10 AND ANOTHER THING AND SOMEHOW WE NEED TO RECONCILE THAT. I
11 THINK THIS IS ALL GOOD FEEDBACK AND HOPEFULLY THESE COMMENTS
12 ARE HELPFUL I THINK AT THE CLON COLLUSION PROCESS I WOULD LIKE
13 FOR US TO HAVE ANOTHER CONVERSATION MAYBE GET A REPORT BACK
14 WHEN THE REAL REPORT IS FINAL ABOUT WHAT THEIR RECOMMENDATIONS
15 ARE AND THAT MAY GIVE US OPPORTUNITY AS THE BAY AREA'S COG,
16 COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENT TO TALK ABOUT WHAT THINGS WE WANT TO
17 RECOMMEND THAT SACRAMENTO SHOULD CHANGE TO THE STATUTE IF
18 THERE IS GOING TO BE LEGISLATIVE CHANGES IN THE FUTURE. I
19 THINK FACT ARES YOU WOULD HAVE TO CLARIFY THAT IN THE STATUTE.
20 TIMELINES YOU HAVE TO CLARIFY THAT IN THE STATUTE. ISSUES
21 AROUND BUILDERS REMEDY, YOU HAVE TO CLARIFY THAT IN THE
22 STATUTE. SO, SOME OF THESE THINGS CAN BE DONE JUST THROUGH
23 IMPLEMENTATION. SOME OF THESE THINGS HAVE TO BE CHANGED IN
24 LAW. AND I THINK THIS WAS -- I THINK WE DID -- WE DID AN
25 EXCELLENT JOB. WE HAD EXTENSIVE ENGAGEMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

MAY 18, 2023

1 OFFICIALS AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY THROUGHOUT THE BAY
2 AREA. I THINK OUR METHODOLOGY IS SOUND. THE FACT THAT THE BAY
3 AREA HAS SO MANY HOUSING ELEMENTS CERTIFIED, AND AT SOME POINT
4 WE COULD GET AN UPDATE ON THAT ACTUALLY HOW MANY HAVE BEEN
5 CERTIFIED COMPARED TO SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA OR SACRAMENTO'S
6 COUNCIL OF REGIONAL GOVERNMENTS, ADMINISTERS WHAT WE DID HERE
7 IN THE BAY AREA WITH THE REAP PROGRAM, WORK YOU DID WITH STAFF
8 AND I THINK WE SHOULD HIGHLIGHT THAT WORK TO THE STATE AS AN
9 EXAMPLE OF THE SUCCESS OF HOW WE SPENT THIS MONEY WHY THE
10 MONEY IS IMPORTANT AND HOW COULD THIS WORK REALLY WELL. I'LL
11 END THERE AND I HOPE THIS IS ALL GOOD FEEDBACK FOR YOUR
12 CONSIDERATION.

13

14 **GILLIAN ADAMS:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS? THANKS FOR
17 INDULGING. THIS WAS FOR INFORMATION PURPOSES. BEFORE WE TAKE
18 PUBLIC COMMENT I'LL ASK ARE THERE ANY OTHER BOARD MEMBERS THAT
19 WOULD IS LIKE TO SPEAK? OKAY. WE'LL MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON
20 THIS ITEM. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ON ZOOM WHO
21 WISHES TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS.

22

23 **FRED CASTRO, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

Meeting Transcript

MAY 18, 2023

1 ON THIS ITEM. AND AT THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, I SEE AND
2 HEAR NO PUBLIC COMMENTS THERE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO,
5 THANK YOU, MISS ADAMS, FOR ALL YOUR WORK. YOUR ONGOING WORK ON
6 RHNA, AND THIS WILL COME BACK TO US AT A FUTURE POINT FOR AN
7 UPDATE, AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OKAY. SO, THAT BRINGS US TO
8 ITEM 13, ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE ABAG
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD IS ON JULY 20TH, 2023. THANK YOU, ALL,
10 COLLEAGUES FOR BEING HERE, AND WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS NOW
11 ADJOURNED.

12

13



Broadcasting Government