

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 10, 2023

1 **BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

2 **WEDNESDAY, MAY 10th, 2023, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER
6 THE MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT
7 COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST TO THE MTC WEB SITE.
8 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
9 SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I
10 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
11 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
12 PHONE NUMBER. AT THIS TIME I WOULD ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE
13 ROLL.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOOD MORNING, CHAIR GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

24

25 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.



MAY 10, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. FLEMMING IS ABSENT.
3 MILEY?

4

5 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

10

11 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A
14 QUORUM.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. THANK YOU. FIRST ITEM TODAY IS
17 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH INCLUDES ITEM 2A THROUGH 2B. IS
18 THERE ANY COMMISSIONERS LOOKING TO PULL AN ITEM. SEEING NONE.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** MOVE APPROVAL, PAPAN.

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION AND SECOND FROM PAPAN AND ABE-
25 KOGA. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC WRITTEN COMMENTS?



MAY 10, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
3 WRITING AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
4 RAISED AT THIS TIME.

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR GLOVER?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

17

18 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION
4 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OUR NEXT ITEM ON THE
7 AGENDA IS 3A WHICH IS BATA RESOLUTION NUMBER 52 REVISED,
8 UPDATES ON LOW-INCOME PAYMENT PLAN AND FASTRAK POLICY CHANGES.
9 THIS IS LOOKED TO BE REFERRED TO THE AUTHORITY. FIRST OFF, I
10 WOULD LIKE TO ASK OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR IF YOU HAVE ANY
11 INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR GLOVER AND MEMBERS OF THE
14 COMMITTEE ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I WANT TO GIVE A
15 PREAMBLE BEFORE LISA'S PRESENTATION. THIS ITEM IS ASKING FOR
16 THE COMMITTEE APPROVAL TO GO TO THE FULL AUTHORITY AT THE END
17 OF THE MONTH BUT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE STICK TO THE SCHEDULE
18 IN ORDER TO KEEP PACE WITH THE LEGISLATIVE REQUIREMENTS OF
19 SETTING UP A PAYMENT PLAN. I'M RECOMMENDING THAT WE REMEMBER
20 THAT FASTRAK IS A LOT LIKE TRANSIT IN TERMS OF IT HAVING TO
21 RECOVER AT A VERY SLOW PACE AT TIMES, TO THE PANDEMIC, AND AS
22 A BIT OF MEMORY IN MARCH 2020 TOLL COLLECTORS WERE TAKEN OUT
23 OF BOOTHS AND NEVER RETURNED. AT THAT TIME WE SET UP A PROCESS
24 TO MOVE INVOICES AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE AND IMPROVED THE
25 PROCESS OVER TIME. THE CONTRACTOR STOOD UP A NEW FACILITY IN



MAY 10, 2023

1 BAKERSFIELD FOR CALLS AND SPECIFIED IN OUR CONTRACT GETTING TO
2 THAT POINT. ACROSS THE BOARD REDUCTION IN PENALTIES MAKES IT
3 EASIER FOR FOLKS TO STANDING UP AND PAY THE TOLL AS
4 APPROPRIATELY. WE KNOW WE HAVE TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON MAKING
5 SPECIFIC TIMELINES AND IMPROVEMENT ON A SCHEDULE THAT YOU
6 WOULD LIKE. WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO MAKE IMPROVEMENTS ONCE
7 THE PAYMENT PLAN IS STOOD UP AND WE WILL ALSO DEVELOP
8 MEASUREMENTS THAT DETERMINE HOW SUCCESSFUL THESE PROGRAMS ARE,
9 STARTING WITH COLLECTING THE \$110 MILLION IN OUTSTANDING TOLL
10 REVENUE THAT DEREK MENTIONED BEFORE. SECONDARILY OVER THE
11 SUMMER WE WANT TO COME FORWARD WITH IDEAS OF HOW TO IMPROVE
12 FASTRAK CUSTOMER JOINING AND REALLY BECOMING PART OF THE
13 EASIEST WAY TO COLLECT. AND THEN THIRD A MEASUREMENT WHICH IS
14 MAYBE RELATED TO WHAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ SAID IS WE DON'T
15 WANT DMV HOLDS SO WE'LL MEASURE HOW WE'RE DOING IN THAT SPACE
16 AND HOPEFULLY SETTING UP PROCEDURES AND POLICIES THAT MAKE IT
17 MUCH EASIER TO PAY YOUR TOLL AND MOVE ON FROM THAT POINT
18 WITHOUT EVEN GETTING TO THE DMV HOLD. WE'LL CONTINUE TO SHOW
19 IMPROVEMENTS IN THOSE AREAS AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO LISA TO
20 PRESENT THE ITEM. HEAL.

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GOOD MORNING LYSA.

23

24 **LYSA HALE:** LYSA HALE BATA STAFF I HAVE BEEN HERE MANY TIMES
25 OVER THE LAST YEAR TO TALK ABOUT OUR EQUITY ACTION PLAN AND



MAY 10, 2023

1 THE WAYS THAT WE'RE LEVELLING THE PLAYING FIELD FOR ALL
2 DRIVERS IN THE BAY AREA WE HAVE TAKEN STEPS TO SIGNIFICANTLY
3 LOWER VIOLATION FEES AND MAKE IT EASY TO GET A FASTRAK
4 ACCOUNT. I'M SO HAPPY TO BE HERE TODAY TO SEE YOU ALL AND
5 UPDATE ON NEXT STEPS IN OUR ACTION PLAN, THE REGION'S LOW-
6 INCOME PAYMENT PLAN AND THE PROPOSE THE ONE TIME WAIVER. I'LL
7 BE WALKING YOU THROUGH THE PAYMENT PLAN AND WAIVER, UPDATE OUR
8 PLANS TO PLACE VEHICLES ON DMV REGISTRATION HOLD REMIND YOU
9 ABOUT OUR PLANNED COMMUNICATIONS CAMPAIGN AND PROVIDE
10 INFORMATION HOW WE WILL EVALUATE THE PAYMENT PLAN AS ANDY
11 DISCUSSED. I'LL BE REQUESTING YOUR APPROVAL THAT THE TWO
12 RELATED FASTRAK POLICY CHANGES BE INCORPORATED INTO RESOLUTION
13 52. NEXT SLIDE. FIRST I WOULD BE TALK BY THE TIME PAYMENT PLAN
14 AND THE ONE-TIME WAIVER. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU ARE AWARE,
15 ASSEMBLY BILL 2594 BY ASSEMBLYMAN TING LAST YEAR CREATED
16 STATUTE REQUIRING DEVELOPMENT OF A LOW-INCOME PAYMENT PLAN.
17 BATA OTHER AND BRIDGES ARE REQUIRED TO LAUNCH A PLAN BY JULY
18 1ST OF THIS YEAR. ALTHOUGH THEY'RE NOT REQUIRED TO LAUNCH A
19 PLAN UNTIL JULY 1ST OF 2024, THE EXPRESS LANES IN THE BAY AREA
20 DECIDED TO JOIN BATA IN GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT IN
21 OFFERING A REGIONAL PAYMENT PLAN STARTING IN JULY 1ST. IN A
22 REGION WHERE MESSAGING ABOUT TOLLING CAN SOMETIMES BE
23 CONFUSING, THIS WILL BE OF TREMENDOUS BENEFIT TO BAY AREA
24 DRIVERS WHO WILL RECEIVE CONSISTENT MESSAGING ACROSS THE
25 BOARD. AND AS WE PRESENTED TO THIS BODY IN OCTOBER, 2022, THE



MAY 10, 2023

1 PAYMENT PLAN WILL BE OPEN TO THOSE WHO HAVE A HOUSEHOLD INCOME
2 OF UP TO 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL. YOU WILL NEED TO
3 OWE AS LEAST \$100 IN TOLLS, PENALTIES AND DMV FEES COMBINED.
4 THERE IS NO MAXIMUM. YOUR MINIMUM FIRST PAYMENT MUST BE 50% OF
5 TOLLS OWED OR \$100, WHICHEVER IS LOWER. CONCURRENT PLANS WILL
6 NOT BE ALLOWED BUT YOU CAN HAVE UP TO TWO PLANS IN FOUR YEARS.
7 AS MENTIONED LATER IN THE PRESENTATION I WILL BE ASKING YOU TO
8 APPROVE THESE RULES AS PART OF OUR AMENDMENTS TO RESOLUTION 52
9 REVISED. PROCESSING APPLICATIONS WILL BE RELATIVELY QUICK AND
10 MOST WILL ONLY TAKE A FEW DAYS OR LESS. YOU MAY KNOW THAT
11 WE'RE BASING THOSE ON TWO EXISTING PROGRAMS, CLIPPER START AND
12 EXPRESS LANES START. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SET UP TIME TO WALK
13 ANY OF YOU THROUGH THE CLIPPER START APPLICATION SITE. JUST
14 REACH OUT TO KIMBERLY OR REACH OUT TO ME DIRECTLY AND LET ME
15 KNOW IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN THAT. WHILE WE'RE HOPING TO
16 OFFER A SELF-SERVICE OPTION IN THE FUTURE THIS COULD BE
17 COMPLEX TO SET UP BECAUSE OF THE DIVERSITY WAIVER POLICIES FOR
18 THE VARIOUS TOLL COLLECTION AGENCIES FOR BRIDGES AND EXPRESS
19 LANES. NEXT SLIDE. WE WANT PEOPLE TO CLEAR THE DECK, TO GET
20 OUT FASTER. AT THE SAME TIME, DATA NEEDS TO COLLECT TOLLS TO
21 FUND IMPORTANT WORK IN THE REGION TO ACCOMPANY THE PAYMENT
22 PLAN AND HELP PEOPLE GET OUT OF DEBT AND TO HELP US COLLECT
23 THE OUTSTANDING TOLLS SOONER WE'RE PROPOSING A TIME LIMITED
24 ONE TIME BATA WAIVER. IT WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO ALL AND WOULD
25 WAIVE PENALTIES FOR VIOLATIONS ON BATA BRIDGES IF YOU PAY ALL



MAY 10, 2023

1 THE TOLLS AND DMV FEES YOU OWE. IF YOU MEET THE REQUIREMENTS
2 AND STILL HAVE NEED YOU CAN THEN ENTER A PAYMENT PLAN. YOU
3 MUST CONTACT THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER TO GET THE
4 WAIVER, AND OUR CALL AGENTS WILL PROVIDE INFORMATION ABOUT,
5 AND STRONGLY ENCOURAGE CUSTOMERS TO OPEN A FASTRAK ACCOUNT.
6 ONCE THE WAIVER HAS BEEN GRANTED, WHETHER ALL TOLLS AND FEES
7 ARE PAID, OR WHETHER THE CUSTOMER ENDS UP IN A PAYMENT PLAN,
8 ALL DMV REGISTRATION HOLDS WILL BE RELEASED. THIS WAIVER WOULD
9 BE AVAILABLE STARTING JULY 1ST AND RUN THROUGH SEPTEMBER 30TH,
10 2024. AS A SIDE NOTE, GETTING PEOPLE INTO FASTRAK IS A HIGH
11 PRIORITY FOR US. AND WE ARE WORKING ON OTHER WAYS TO
12 INCENTIVIZE PEOPLE TO SIGN UP. THAT'S WHY WE DO INCLUDE IT
13 AMONG OUR PERFORMANCE METRICS FOR THE PLAN WHICH I'LL THANK
14 YOU VERY MUCH ON LATER IN THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE.
15 OFFERING THE WAIVER IS IMPORTANT FOR SEVERAL REASONS. BUT
16 ESPECIALLY FOR DEALING WITH THE EXPECTED INCREASE IN CALLS OF
17 THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. JUST A REMINDER THAT WE PAUSED
18 PLACING VEHICLES ON REGISTRATION HOLD STARTING IN JANUARY 2021
19 AS WE SWITCHED TO ALL-ELECTRIC TOLLING AND AS PEOPLE WERE
20 STILL DEALING WITH THE IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC. IN THE TWO
21 YEARS FOLLOWING THAT \$110 MILLION OF OUTSTANDING TOLLS HAS
22 GONE UNCOLLECTED. THAT FIGURE REPRESENTS 1.3 MILLION VEHICLES
23 AND ROUGHLY 15 MILLION OUTSTANDING VIOLATIONS THAT HAVE NOT
24 GONE TO DMV HOLD OR COLLECTIONS THERE. IS NO MINIMUM AMOUNT OF
25 DEBT REQUIRED TO PLACE A VEHICLE ON REGISTRATION HOLD. WE



MAY 10, 2023

1 UNDERSTAND INTRODUCING A LOW-INCOME PAYMENT PLAN AND ONE TIME
2 WAIVER ALONG WITH THE REMINDER TO PAY TOLLS AND VIOLATIONS IS
3 AN AMBITIOUS UNDERTAKE THAT'S WHY WE CAME TO YOU IN DECEMBER
4 OF LAST YEAR WITH OUR PLANNED COMPREHENSIVE COMMUNICATION
5 STRATEGY. BLANKETING THE REGION WITH OUR MESSAGING COMBINED
6 WITH FOCUSED OUTREACH TO LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES. THE
7 FOUNDATIONAL MESSAGE GUIDING THE CAMPAIGN IS WHAT YOU SEE ON
8 THE SCREEN. DRIVERS WITH OVERDUE UNPAID TOLLS WILL NOT BE ABLE
9 TO RENEW THEIR VEHICLE REGISTRATION UNTIL ALL OUTSTANDING
10 BALANCES ARE PAID. ACT NOW TO AVOID AHOLD ON YOUR CERTAINLY
11 REGISTRATION. PAYMENT ASSISTANCE IS AVAILABLE. VISIT BAY AREA
12 FASTRAK.ORG OR CALL THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER AT
13 877-BAYTOLL. THIS MESSAGE WILL SERVE AS THE BASIS FOR ALL
14 OTHER ADVERTISING. ALL CAMPAIGN COPY WILL BUILD OFF THIS
15 MESSAGE. NEXT SLIDE. AS DESCRIBED IN DECEMBER THE CAMPAIGN
16 WILL CAST A WIDE NET WITH MESSAGING TO THE BROADER REGION
17 INCLUDING ADVERTISING TACTICS MENTIONED HERE BILLBOARDS, TV,
18 AND RADIO, WE WILL ACCOMPANY THIS BROAD BASED APPROACH WITH
19 THE FOCUSED APPROACH SPECIFICALLY TARGETED AT EQUITY PRIORITY
20 COMMUNITIES. WE WILL BE IN THE FIELD PLACING POSTERS IN PLACES
21 WHERE PEOPLE ACTUALLY GO SUCH AS MARKETS AND LAUNDROMATS AS
22 WELL AS WORKING THROUGH CHURCHES AND COMMUNITY-BASED
23 ORGANIZATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. PREPARING FOR AND OPERATING LOW-
24 INCOME PAYMENT PLANS IS A SIGNIFICANT UNDERTAKING. WE NEED TO
25 SET UP A WEB SITE WHERE PEOPLE CAN APPLY AND WE NEED TO BE



MAY 10, 2023

1 READY AT THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, TOO. ONCE
2 SOMEONE IS APPROVED AS ELIGIBLE, OUR CALL AGENTS WILL NEED TO
3 BE ON TAP TO SET UP DETAILS OF EACH PAYMENT PLAN. THIS WILL
4 INVOLVE DEVELOPING TRAINING MATERIALS, HIRING NEW CALL AGENTS
5 AND TRAINING MORE THAN 300 STAFF IN HOW TO SET UP PLANS AND WE
6 WILL ALSO NEED TO TRAIN THEM TO ANSWER THE QUESTIONS THAT
7 PEOPLE MAY HAVE. OUR HIGH-LEVEL SCHEDULE HAS US DEVELOPING THE
8 PAYMENT PLAN AND PREPARING FOR JULY 1ST OPERATIONS, RIGHT NOW.
9 WE ARE IN THE THROWS OF DEVELOPMENT, AND HAVE COMPLETED THE
10 BULK OF WORK TO STAND UP THE APPLICATION WEB SITE. THIS IS SET
11 UP IN SALESFORCE AND WE NEED TO ENSURE THAT THE APPLICATION
12 WEB SITE CAN TALK TO THE FASTRAK BACK OFFICE. IT'S A LOT OF
13 WORK ON BOTH SIDES. RIGHT AFTER WE LAUNCH, THE COMMUNICATIONS
14 CAMPAIGN WILL START. WE WILL BEGIN PLACING VEHICLES ON DMV
15 HOLD STARTING IN SEPTEMBER. THIS WILL BE A ROLLING PROCESS
16 STARTING WITH THE OLDEST VIOLATIONS FIRST. REMEMBER, WE HAVE
17 MORE THAN 15 MILLION VIOLATIONS TO SEND, AND WE ANTICIPATE
18 THIS WILL TAKE A YEAR TO COMPLETE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS BODY ASKED
19 US TO COME BACK AND EXPLAIN HOW WE WOULD EVALUATE THE PLAN,
20 AND ANDY HAS MENTIONED A COUPLE OF FACTORS ALREADY. NEXT
21 SLIDE. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO IDENTIFY KEY METRICS AND
22 ESTABLISH TIMELINE FOR EVALUATION. THIS MEANS BUILDING ON DATA
23 THAT WE ALREADY HAVE IN OUR BACK OFFICE. ONE OF OUR GOALS IS
24 TO USE AVAILABLE AND CONSISTENT DATA. WE WILL REPORT OUR FIRST
25 EVALUATION AT THE THREE MONTH MARK AND THEN REPORT ON AN



MAY 10, 2023

1 ONGOING BASIS EVERY 12 MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE. THE METRICS USE A
2 COMBINATION OF PROGRAM STATISTICS SUCH AS NUMBER OF PAYMENT
3 PLANS, APPLICANTS AND QUALIFYING PARTICIPANTS, COMPLIANCE
4 RATES, COMPLETION AND SO ON. WITH OTHER RELATED KEY INDICATORS
5 SUCH AS VOLUME OF REGISTRATION HOLDS. WE RECOGNIZE WE SHOULD
6 HAVE TARGETS FOR EACH OF THESE METRICS AND WE'RE WORKING ON
7 THOSE RIGHT NOW. NEXT SLIDE. NOW LET'S TURN TO TODAY'S
8 COMMITTEE ACTION. NEXT SLIDE. INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET TODAY IS
9 A COPY OF BATA RESOLUTION 52 REVISED, WITH THE POLICIES FOR
10 THE PAYMENT PLAN AND THE ONE TIME WAIVER AS WELL AS UPDATES TO
11 VIOLATION PENALTIES, ADOPTED BY EXPRESS LANE OPERATORS FOR
12 TRANSACTIONS OCCURRING ON OR AFTER OCTOBER 3RD, 2022. STAFF
13 RECOMMENDS THAT THIS COMMITTEE APPROVE THE CHANGES TO BATA
14 RESOLUTION 52 REVISED AND SEND THE PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE
15 FULL AUTHORITY. NEXT SLIDE. THANK YOU. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER
16 ANY QUESTIONS.

17

18 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU, LYSA, FOR THE REPORT.
19 CERTAINLY, THIS IS AN AGGRESSIVE PLAN GOING FORWARD. BUT I DO
20 APPRECIATE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDREW FREMIER'S EARLY
21 COMMENTS ABOUT THE FACT THAT THIS IS AN ONGOING PROGRAM, AND
22 THAT IT'S ALONG THE WAY THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT A
23 NUMBER OF CHANGES THAT MAY HAVE TO BE MADE AS WE CONTINUE TO
24 IMPROVE THE PROGRAM THAT'S OUTLINED HERE TODAY. SO, AT THIS



MAY 10, 2023

1 TIME, I'LL OPEN IT UP TO COMMISSIONERS QUESTIONS OR COMMENT.

2 YES, COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. SORRY I MISSED YOUR OPENING
5 COMMENTS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY WE HAVE
6 TAKEN A LOT OF -- MANY STEPS FORWARD WITH REGARDS TO MAKING
7 OUR TOLLING SYSTEM MORE EQUITABLE, THE REDUCING FINES FROM \$70
8 TO A LOWER NUMBER IS, SORT OF, I THINK, THE MOST IMPORTANT
9 ONE. AND THIS IMPLEMENTING PAYMENT PLANS FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE
10 STRUGGLING TO PAY, I THINK IS GOING TO BE THE NEXT ONE. YOU
11 KNOW? I THINK -- I'M REALLY HOPEFUL THAT WHEN WE DO THIS
12 EVALUATION, WHEN WE IMPLEMENT THIS AND DO THIS EVALUATION, ONE
13 OF THE THINGS WE LOOK AT IS WHETHER IT STILL MAKES SENSE TO
14 HAVE AN INCOME THRESHOLD OF 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL.
15 BECAUSE THAT'S A REALLY, REALLY LOW-INCOME THRESHOLD. YOU CAN
16 BE WORKING MINIMUM WAGE IN THIS REGION AND EXCEED THE INCOME
17 THRESHOLD. AND I DON'T THINK THAT ANYBODY THINKS THAT SOMEONE
18 WORKING MINIMUM WAGE, SORT OF, IS -- IS, SORT OF, FINANCIALLY
19 SECURE. AND I KNOW THAT ONE OF THE CONCERNS ABOUT -- AND ONE
20 OF THE REASONS WE HAVE PUT IN THIS INCOME THRESHOLD IS THERE
21 WAS CONCERNS AROUND POTENTIAL REVENUE LOSS. AND I HOPE THAT IS
22 SOMETHING WE CAN REALLY, SORT OF, THINK ABOUT GOING -- YOU
23 KNOW, ONCE WE HAVE DONE THE EVALUATION OF THIS PROGRAM,
24 WHETHER, GIVEN THOSE -- WHETHER THOSE CONCERNS MATERIALIZED
25 AND WHETHER WE CAN MAKE IT A LOT EASIER FOR PEOPLE TO APPLY BY



MAY 10, 2023

1 NOT HAVING TO VERIFY THEIR INCOME. IN THE MEANTIME, WHAT WE
2 STILL ARE ASKING PEOPLE TO VERIFY THEIR INCOME, I REALLY HOPE
3 THAT WE CAN MAKE A HUGE EFFORT TO MAKE THAT INCOME
4 VERIFICATION AS STRAIGHT FORWARD AS POSSIBLE. MY UNDERSTANDING
5 IS, NOW, IT'S LARGE, FOR MOST PEOPLE GOING TO BE A THREE STEP
6 PROCESS. THEY'RE GOING TO CALL THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER,
7 THEY'RE GOING TO BE REFERRED TO AN ONLINE WEB SITE, UPLOAD
8 THEIR INFORMATION ONLINE, GOING TO HAVE TO CALL BACK THE
9 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. IT'S NOT LIKE THE SUPER SEAMLESS
10 PROCESS. AND I KNOW THERE ARE REASONS WE CAN'T DEPLOY THAT DAY
11 ONE BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US HAVE A COMMITMENT FOR WHEN
12 WE'RE GOING TO DEPLOY THAT, AND HOPEFULLY WORKING WITH OUR
13 CONTRACTORS WE CAN DO THAT AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. I ALSO HOPE
14 THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE'LL BE ABLE TO EVALUATE IS ONE
15 OF THE DISCUSSIONS WE HAD IN SETTING THIS UP, IS WHETHER WE'LL
16 BE HAVE, WHETHER THE PAYMENT PLAN WILL BE, SORT OF, VERY
17 STRUCTURED OR WHETHER WE WOULD HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN THAT ALLOWS
18 PEOPLE TO, SORT OF, STRUCTURE THEIR PAYMENTS IN A MORE -- IN A
19 WAY THAT SUITS THEM MORE, THAT THEY'RE MORE ABLE TO DO IT, SO
20 THEY COULD PAY WEEKLY, THEY COULD PAY MONTHLY, THEY COULD PAY
21 -- YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON HOW THEIR INCOME -- HOW THEY RECEIVE
22 THEIR INCOME AND HOPE THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN CONTINUE ON
23 EVALUATE AND SEE IF THE DIRECTION WE HAVE TAKEN WITH THE RIGID
24 PAYMENT PLAN ARE SERVING OUR PRIVILEGE TOLL USERS. AND I THINK
25 THIS IS, YOU KNOW, I THINK AS THINKING ABOUT THE EVALUATION



MAY 10, 2023

1 GLAD WE'RE DOING EVALUATION OBVIOUSLY KPIS BUT NO NUMBERS
2 ASSOCIATED WITH THE KPIS SAYING THIS IS HOW WE'RE GOING TO
3 EVALUATE THE PROGRAM BUT NOT SAYING THIS IS WHAT SUCCESS IS
4 GOING TO LOOK LIKE. I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS THE FINAL
5 COMMISSION -- THIS IS BODY THAT'S GOING TO BE ADOPTED IT OR
6 THIS IS GOING TO BE FORWARDED ON TO -- I DIDN'T QUITE CATCH
7 THE LAST SLIDE, BUT I HOPE WE CAN KIND OF ADDRESS THAT, YOU
8 KNOW, QUICKLY, SO THAT WE HAVE A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING OF, LIKE,
9 WHAT SUCCESS LOOKS LIKE IN THIS PROGRAM SO THAT IF IT WOULD
10 NOT HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL, WE CAN QUICKLY, SORT OF, TRY AND
11 MODIFY IT I THINK WE HAVE TO TAKE A PEOPLE CENTERED APPROACH I
12 THINK, TO SUCCESS, AND ONE OF THE THINGS I'M GOING LOOK FIGURE
13 FOR IS AVOIDING PEOPLE HAVING BE PUT ON DMV HOLD. BECAUSE I
14 THINK THAT'S THE CORE OF PEOPLE STRUGGLING TO PAY WE CAN'T PUT
15 THEM IN A POSITION WHERE IT WOULD BE ILLEGAL FOR THEM TO DRIVE
16 TO WORK BECAUSE THEY COULDN'T MANAGE TO PAY THEIR BRIDGE TOLLS
17 WE PUT THEIR CARS ON HOLD IT'S ILLEGAL FOR THEM TO DRIVE TO
18 WORK IF THEY GET CAUGHT DRIVING WITH THEIR VEHICLE ON HOLD IT
19 BECOMES A CRIMINAL PROBLEM, THEY THEN HAVE FURTHER FINES AND
20 FEES, THEY CAN GET THEIR, YOU KNOW, ET CETERA, ET CETERA, AND
21 IT'S, SORT OF -- A LITTLE -- SORT OF, A MISTAKE, OR SOMETHING
22 OF WHICH THEY ARE IN THE MOMENT UNABLE TO DO, BECOME SOMETHING
23 WHICH HAS RUINOUS CONSEQUENCES FOR THEMSELVES AND THEIR
24 FAMILIES AND THEIR LIVES. I HOPE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN



MAY 10, 2023

1 SET OURSELVES A TARGET A NUMERICAL TARGET FOR WHAT THIS SET OF
2 EFFORTS IS HOPING TO ACHIEVE.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, I DID ADDRESS A LOT OF THE
5 THINGS YOU SPOKE ABOUT IN THE BEGINNING COMMENTS. I'M NOT SURE
6 WE CAN COME BACK IN TWO WEEKS THAT'S THE COMMISSION ACTION TO
7 MOVE THE POLICY MY SUGGESTION IS LET US KEEP PACE AND COME
8 BACK OVER THE SUMMER WITH SOME SPECIFIC METRICS. I THINK WE
9 CAN DO SO AND DO SO IN AREAS THAT YOU JUST DESCRIBED.

10 REMEMBERING THAT THE HOLISTIC PROBLEM IS REMEMBERING WE'RE
11 TRYING TO COLLECT BRIDGE TOLLS IN A TIMELY BASIS SO WE CAN
12 INVEST BACK IN THE SYSTEM. WE'RE NOT INTERESTED IN THE DMV
13 HOLDS AS BEING A POSITIVE MARKER OF ANY KIND BUT TO FIND WAYS
14 TO MAKE IT MORE WE NEED TO PAY THE TOLLS BUT WOULD ASK YOU
15 GIVE US TIME.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THIS ISN'T NEW. YOU CAN'T COME UP WITH THE
18 NUMBERS IN TWO WEEKS BUT IT'S FRUSTRATING TO ME THAT WE
19 HAVEN'T -- THAT WE'RE IN THIS SITUATION AND WOULD APPRECIATE
20 WE NEED TIME TO DO THE WORK.

21

22 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

23

24 **HILARY RONEN:** I HAVE A QUESTION. YOU MIGHT HAVE PRESENTED ON
25 THIS. I'M SORRY IF I MISSED IT. BUT IF YOU ARE UNDER THE



MAY 10, 2023

1 FEDERAL POVERTY LINE, 200%, DOES THAT MEAN YOU ALSO HAVE TO
2 PAY ALL YOUR OUTSTANDING TOLLS IN ORDER TO GET THE PENALTY
3 WAIVER?

4

5 **LYSA HALE:** YES. I BELIEVE THAT IT DOES. NO. IT DOESN'T. OKAY.
6 SORRY. YEAH. IT'S THE SAME AS THE PAYMENT PLAN, 50% OF TOTALS
7 OWED. \$400.

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** AND I WANT TO SECOND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S
10 COMMENTS AND PROVIDE A LITTLE BIT MORE COLOR TO THEM. SO, IF
11 YOU LIVE IN THE BAY AREA, YOUR MEDIAN RENTAL COST, IT'S
12 \$3,750. IF YOU ARE PAYING THAT MUCH RENT, YOU ARE PAYING
13 \$45,000 A YEAR, WHICH MEANS, IF YOU'RE A FAMILY OF FOUR, IN
14 ORDER TO QUALIFY FOR THIS PROGRAM, YOU WOULD HAVE TO EARN
15 \$60,000 OR UNDER. THAT'S -- THAT WOULD MEAN 75% OF THEIR
16 INCOME IS PAID FOR RENT. LIKE, THAT'S HOW LOW 200% OF THE
17 POVERTY LEVEL IS IN THE BAY AREA. YOU KNOW, THINK ABOUT THIS.
18 SO, EVEN IF, YOU KNOW, MOST PEOPLE OBVIOUSLY CAN'T AFFORD
19 THAT, SO THEY FIND SUBSTANDARD HOUSING, OR THEY'RE ONE OF THE
20 LUCKY FAMILIES TO BE IN THE LOW MARKET RATE HOUSING. EVEN IF
21 YOU REDUCE THAT TO \$2,500 A MONTH, THAT'S STILL HALF OF THEIR
22 INCOME FOR A FAMILY OF FOUR ON HOUSING THAT THEY'RE PAYING
23 FOR, FOR A YEAR. SO WE'RE BASICALLY SAYING THAT THE ONLY
24 PEOPLE THAT WILL QUALIFY FOR THESE PROGRAMS ARE WOMEN THAT
25 COULDN'T ACTUALLY LIVE IN THE BAY AREA BECAUSE THEY CAN'T PAY



MAY 10, 2023

1 FOR HOUSING. SO, THIS IS MY WORRY ABOUT WHY THIS PROGRAM IS
2 NOT GOING TO WORK AND WHY I ADVOCATED SO STRONGLY NOT TO HAVE
3 INCOME LIMITS. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S SO EXPENSIVE TO LIVE IN
4 THE BAY AREA, THAT YOU HAVE LIMITS SO HIGH TO MAKE IT ACTUALLY
5 USEFUL TO PEOPLE THAT COULD BENEFIT FROM THE PROGRAM THAT IT
6 JUST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE TO HAVE AN INCOME LIMIT AT ALL. AND,
7 SO, I'M JUST REALLY SKEPTICAL OF THIS PROGRAM. I ALMOST FEEL
8 LIKE WE DESIGNED THE PROGRAM TO FAIL, INSTEAD OF SUPPORTING
9 PEOPLE. BECAUSE WE PUT THE INCOME CAP SO LOW THAT IT'S -- IT
10 DOESN'T EVEN MAKE SENSE. AND OF COURSE WE KNOW THAT THE
11 POOREST PEOPLE LIVE THE FARTHEST AWAY FROM THEIR JOBS BECAUSE
12 THEY CAN'T AFFORD THE HOMES CLOSE TO THEIR JOBS. RIGHT? THAT'S
13 WHY WE'RE WORKING SO HARD WITH BAIFA, ET CETERA, TO BUILD MORE
14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AROUND THE REGION. BUT WE'RE NOT THERE YET.
15 NOT EVEN CLOSE. NO COUNTY MEETS THEIR RHNA GOALS FOR LOW AND
16 VERY LOW-INCOME HOUSING. SO, I JUST, ONCE AGAIN, HAVE TO SAY
17 THAT I THINK WE MADE A MAJOR MISTAKE, AND I HOPE WE'LL LOOK AT
18 THE DATA IN THE SUMMER AND SEE IF WE HAVE SUCCESSFULLY -- THE
19 PEOPLE ARE SUCCESSFULLY USING THIS PROGRAM. BUT I THINK WE
20 MADE A MAJOR MISTAKE PUTTING AN INCOME LIMIT ON IT. AND SECOND
21 HE, YOU KNOW, STUDY AFTER STUDY SHOW THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE
22 OFTEN DO NOT SIGN UP FOR BENEFITS TO WHICH THEY'RE ENTITLED
23 TO, NOT BECAUSE THEY HAVE SHAME ABOUT SIGNING UP FOR THOSE
24 PROGRAMS NOT BECAUSE THEY DON'T KNOW THE PROGRAMS EXIST, BUT
25 BECAUSE THE BURDEN OF SIGNING UP FOR THEM IS SO COMPLICATED,



MAY 10, 2023

1 THAT THEY FOREGO BILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN ADDITIONALLY IN
2 WELFARE AID ALL OVER THE COUNTRY IN EVERY CITY IN THE COUNTRY.
3 THE SIGN UM PROGRAM SOUNDS ALIGN LIKE KNOW INCREDIBLE BURDEN
4 PEOPLE DON'T HAVE SCANNERS TO SCAN DOCUMENTS AND UPLOAD THEM
5 TO COMPUTER I MEAN IT'S SO EXPENSIVE TO BE POOR. THE BURDEN
6 IT'S SO MUCH HIGHER ON YOU WHEN YOU DON'T HAVE ACCESS TO
7 THINGS LIKE SCANNERS AND COMPUTERS AND EASY WAYS TO UPLOAD
8 DOCUMENTS. SO, AGAIN, I HAVE FEARS THAT THIS PROGRAM IS NOT
9 GOING TO BE VERY BENEFICIAL, AND THAT WE JUST, DESPITE ALL THE
10 RESEARCH, DESPITE WHAT WE KNOW TO BE TRUE EVERYWHERE IN THE
11 COUNTRY, WE'RE NOT BUILDING A PROGRAM FROM SCRATCH. WE HAVE
12 DECADES OF DATA ABOUT SIMILAR PROGRAMS THAT OCCUR ALL OVER THE
13 COUNTRY. WE KNOW BEST PRACTICES AND WE CHOSE TO SET UP A
14 PROGRAM NOT USING ANY OF THOSE BEST PRACTICES. BUT, YOU KNOW,
15 I DON'T KNOW HOW MUCH MORE I CAN PROTEST ABOUT THIS. I GUESS
16 I'LL JUST SAY WE'LL LOOK AT THE DATA OVER THE SUMMER AND
17 HOPEFULLY MAKE THE CHANGES THEN.

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU. PEDROZA?

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I HEAR THE CONCERNS COMMISSIONER RONEN. I WAS
24 IN MY DISTRICT BERRYESSA TALK ABOUT WATER FEES INCREASING BY
25 25% AND THE RHETORIC COMMENTS I HEARD PEOPLE ARE BEING FORCED



MAY 10, 2023

1 OUT OF CALIFORNIA AND IT HURTS. AND THE REALITY IS, IT'S NOT
2 JUST THIS PROGRAM, IT'S THE TOTALITY OF WHAT'S HAPPENING IN
3 OUR STATE THAT'S PUTTING A LOT OF PRESSURE ON WORKING
4 FAMILIES. AND TO ME, THAT'S A RESPONSIBILITY THAT THIS
5 COMMISSION HAS AND EVERYONE ELSE THAT'S A PARTNER THIS REGION.
6 BUT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE DOING, WE WERE WORKING WITH
7 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING ON THIS. WE'RE MOVING IT FORWARD. IF WE
8 CAN MAKE IT BETTER, I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH CONCERNS RAISED,
9 AND WE SHOULD HAVE THAT DATA. WE WANT THAT DATA. SO PLEASE
10 COME BACK WITH THAT, BUT WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD TO UNDERSTAND
11 WHO WE'RE HELPING. WE KNOW WHO WE WANT TO HELP AND WHO WE
12 DON'T WANT TO HELP. WE NEED SAFEGUARD TO PROTECT THE
13 INSTITUTION. WE HAD A PRESENTATION ABOUT BUDGET. WE HAVE THE
14 FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY NOT TO SAY IT OUTWEIGHS SOCIAL PRESSURES
15 WE FACE AS A COMMUNITY AND REGION BUT GETTING THIS ROLLING OUT
16 IT'S GOING TO SERVE US WELL. REALLY INTERESTED IN GETTING THAT
17 DATA IF WE CAN MAKE THOSE CHANGES ABSOLUTELY INTERESTED IN
18 THAT. AGAIN, I KNOW STAFF PUT A LOT OF WORK IN THIS. IT'S NOT
19 PERFECT. IT'S NOT INTENDED TO BE PERFECT, CAN IT BE BETTER?
20 YES, AND WE CAN GET THERE. THAT'S THE PATH I SEE MOVING
21 FORWARD. I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS AND I APPRECIATE WANTING TO
22 MOVE FORWARD. BECAUSE THIS WAS INTENDED TO BE A GOOD THING TO
23 HELP PEOPLE AND I THINK WE ARE GOING TO DO THAT. SO, THANK
24 YOU, CHAIR.

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IF I MAY, QUICKLY, ON A COUPLE OF ITEMS.
2 NUMBER ONE, THE QUESTION ON 200% IS A FAIR QUESTION FOR US TO
3 START TALKING ABOUT STATE ROUTE 37. WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING
4 ABOUT IT RELATIVE TO TOLLING FACILITIES WE LEARNED MORE FROM
5 THAT WORK DONE ON IT. IMA ISLAND. IN TERMS OF JOINING THE
6 PROGRAM WE ARE MAKING IT EASY TO JOIN THE PROGRAM THE HARD
7 PART IS ATTACHING TO ACTUAL TRANSACTIONS IN FASTRAK. GETTING
8 INTO THE PROGRAM YOU GET INTO THE PROGRAMS ACROSS THE BOARD
9 FOR CLIPPER START ET CETERA WE ARE IMPROVING AND WILL IMPROVE
10 TO ELIMINATE THE STEPS THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ MENTIONED
11 OVER TIME BUT THAT'S A MUCH MORE COMPLICATED PROCESS RELATED
12 TO THE EXISTING STRUCTURE OF FASTRAK AND HOW YOU ACTUALLY
13 ATTACH IT TO VARIOUS VIOLATIONS. SO THAT'S THE CHALLENGE. IT'S
14 NOT THE -- IT WE REALLY THEN FOCUS ON SIMPLE JOINT PROGRAM,
15 NOW ATTACHING TO FASTRAK IS THE HARD PART.

16

17 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN FOLLOWED BY CHAVEZ?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE SAID A LOT OF IMPORTANT THINGS
20 HERE. I DO AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES HERE AS WELL. I WOULD LIKE
21 TO FOCUS ON THE MESSAGING. BECAUSE WE NEED TO GET THIS MESSAGE
22 OUT. I MEAN, I'M DOING NON-PROFIT, SCHOLARSHIPS NOW. I HAVE
23 FAMILIES MAKING UNDER 15,000 A YEAR. I NEED TO MAKE SURE THEY
24 CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS IF THEY'RE IN THAT SITUATION. SO, I
25 WOULD LIKE TO -- AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THIS ADDED TO THE



MAY 10, 2023

1 PRESENTATION BEFORE IT MOVES ON HERE. ARE WE REACHING OUT TO
2 COMMUNITY COLLEGES? YES? IT WASN'T ON THERE.

3

4 **LYSA HALE:** WE HAVE A LONG LIST THAT WE PRESENTED IN DECEMBER
5 ABOUT ALL THE DIFFERENT WAYS THAT WE'RE GOING TO REACH OUT.
6 AND, SO, YOU HAD MADE THAT COMMENT THERE, AND I HAVE
7 INCORPORATED THAT INTO OUR PLANNING. WE HAVE A VERY LARGE
8 SPREADSHEET THAT SHOWS ALL THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF MEDIA THAT
9 WE'RE GOING TO BUY AND ALL THE DIFFERENT ORGANIZATIONS THAT
10 WE'RE GOING TO BE REACHING OUT TO, AND THAT HAS INCLUDED.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** I BELIEVE THAT'S IMPORTANT TO OUR SUCCESS HERE.
13 ALSO THE MULTILINGUAL.

14

15 **LYSA HALE:** YES.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** I HOPE THAT WE'RE TRACKING HOW THAT IS PENETRATING
18 WHO WE'RE REACHING IN THAT REALM BECAUSE I THINK THIS'S
19 IMPORTANT. AND I DON'T KNOW IF THERE'S A WAY THAT IF PEOPLE
20 APPLY THEY'RE REJECTED BECAUSE THEY'RE OVER 200%. IS THERE A
21 WAY TO SEE WHY THEY WERE REJECTED OR WHATEVER IS THERE A WAY
22 OF EVALUATING THAT NUMBER? I DON'T KNOW. I WANT TO PUT THAT
23 OUT THERE. I WILL AGREE WITH OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, IT'S
24 NEVER EASY TO APPLY TO ANY OF OUR PROGRAMS. I MEAN, I HAVE
25 TRIED TO TRANSFER OVER, JUST MY CLIPPER TO MY PHONE, AND THAT



MAY 10, 2023

1 HASN'T HAPPENED YET. SO, WE NEED TO BE VERY CONCERNED THESE
2 PROGRAMS ARE NOT SIMPLE AND WE WANT TO SEE THEM SUCCEED. WE
3 CAN DO BETTER. AND IF WE CAN, I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS
4 POSSIBLE, IF, DURING THE PROCESS, YOU START PROCESS, YOU GET A
5 TEXT MESSAGE THAT SAYS YOUR APPLICATION IS IN, OR SOMETHING
6 LIKE THAT? BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE WORKING SO HARD JUST TO SURVIVE
7 HERE. TO TAKE AN HOUR ON THE PHONE HERE, AN HOUR ON THE PHONE
8 THERE, JUST DURING WORKING HOURS IS EXTREMELY DISRUPTIVE AND
9 WILL DETER PEOPLE FROM TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT WE'RE TRYING
10 TO DO AND TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS. SO IF WE CAN INCORPORATE
11 SOMETHING THAT SIMPLIFIES IT FOR PEOPLE THAT THEY ARE, AGAIN,
12 NOT ON THE PHONE FOR HOURS AT A TIME, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.
13 I'M SO GLAD THAT WE ARE IMPROVING OUR REAL LIFE, YOU CAN TALK
14 TO SOMEBODY ASPECTS OF THIS. BECAUSE THAT'S IMPORTANT. I HAVE
15 A QUESTION HERE. I'M NOT SURE HOW THE EXPRESS LANE OPERATORS
16 HAVE RESPONDED TO THE PROPOSED ONE TIME WAIVER REGARDLESS OF
17 INCOME?

18

19 **STEPHEN WOLF:** STEPHEN WOLF ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR THE EXPRESS
20 LANES PROGRAM FOR THE BAIFA EXPRESS LANES PROGRAM WE HAVE BEEN
21 WORKING WITH OTHER EXPRESS LANES OPERATORS ON REACHING A
22 CONSENSUS TO ADOPT A PAYMENT PLAN WITH SIMILAR POLICIES AND
23 SAME TIME FRAME AS BATA THAT IS FOR PEOPLE AT THE FEDERAL
24 POVERTY LEVEL OF TWO HUNDRED% OR BELOW. IN AGREEING TO DO THAT
25 WAIVING PENALTIES FOR PEOPLE AT THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL OF



MAY 10, 2023

1 200% BELOW WHICH IS NOT A REQUIREMENT OF THE BILL SO THEY'RE
2 GOING BEYOND WHAT'S REQUIRED OF THE BILL FOR EXPRESS LANES IN
3 TERMS OF ABOVE THE FEDERAL POVERTY LIMIT NEAR EXPRESS LANES
4 OPERATORS ARE STILL DISCUSSING HOW TO HANDLE THAT GROUP. THERE
5 IS STILL A CONSCIENCE YOU ON ELIMINATING PENALTIES ON A ONE
6 TIME BASIS AT THIS POINT. FOR BAIFA WE'RE WORKING ON A
7 RECOMMENDATION THAT WE WILL BRING TO BAIFA IN A COUPLE OF
8 WEEKS ON HOW WE DEAL WITH THE DMV HOLDS THAT WE HAVE COLLECTED
9 SINCE MARCH 2020. THE OTHER EXPRESS LANES OPERATORS ARE NOT
10 HOLDING THEIR DMV HOLDS AT THIS POINT SO THEY DON'T HAVE THAT
11 CHALLENGE. BUT THE BAIFA EXPRESS LANES ARE WORKING ON A POLICY
12 THAT WILL MAKE IT EASY TO SEND THEM OUT AND TRY TO BE
13 CONSISTENT AS WE CAN WITH BATA.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. 15 MILLION PEOPLE WHO HAVEN'T PAID HERE. I
16 DO HOPE WE CAN MAKE, AT LEAST SOME, SORT OF, MOVEMENT IN
17 BRINGING THAT NUMBER DOWN. SO, THE DATA IS SO IMPORTANT, TO
18 MANY OF US HERE, IN HOW THIS SUCCEEDS, AND YOU HAVE METRICS
19 THERE. DO WE HAVE A TIMELINE ON WHEN WE WILL SEE THE METRICS,
20 AT ALL, SO THAT WE CAN -- I MEAN, OUR INTEREST IS SUCCESS. SO,

21

22 **LYSA HALE:** WE ARE PLANNING ON DEVELOPING THOSE KPIS, AS THE
23 COMMISSIONER MENTIONED, PRIOR TO THE LAUNCH OF THE PAYMENT
24 PLAN. SO WE CAN COME BACK, YOU KNOW, AFTER THAT TIME, AND
25 SHARE THOSE WITH YOU.



MAY 10, 2023

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT. BECAUSE IF WE NEED TO PIVOT
3 IN ONE WAY OR ANOTHER, LET'S DO IT AT THE BEGINNING SO WE CAN
4 HOPEFULLY BE AS SUCCESSFUL AS POSSIBLE.

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** ABSOLUTELY.

7

8 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK THE STAFF. I
11 DO WANT TO JUST ACKNOWLEDGE THAT, I THINK FROM THE BEGINNING
12 THAT COMMISSIONER RONEN'S POINTS ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT WE'RE
13 LOOKING AT DATA AS WE SHAPE PROGRAMS AND LOOKING AT PAST
14 STRATEGIES WAS SOMETHING WE DIDN'T DO. AND I THINK IT HAD TO
15 DO PHILOSOPHICALLY WITH BOTH A DECIDE IN THE BOARD AND A
16 DECIDE IN STAFF. AND I THINK WE PUT A LEADERSHIP ROLE IN
17 SHAPING THE TING BILL BECAUSE WE HAD SOME OPINIONS ABOUT HOW
18 TO PROCEED. AND I SAY ALL OF THAT MORE JUST TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE
19 SITUATION WE'RE IN TODAY BECAUSE THERE ISN'T ENOUGH, I THINK,
20 UNANIMITY OF BOTH ABOUT WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO REVOLVE AND THE
21 VERY BEST WAYS TO DO IT. SO WHAT THAT MEANS FROM MY
22 PERSPECTIVE IS THE EVALUATION HAS TO BE INCREDIBLY RIGOROUS SO
23 THAT THE STAFF IS SATISFIED AND THE BOARD IS SATISFIED THAT WE
24 REALLY ARE USING OUR BEST -- OUR BEST THINKING, RELATIVE TO
25 BOTH WHAT WE LEARN AND RESEARCH THAT ALREADY EXISTS AS IT



MAY 10, 2023

1 RELATES TO HOW WE PROCEED. SO, I DON'T EVEN SAY THAT
2 CRITICALLY. I JUST THINK THAT'S WHAT HAPPENED AND I WANT TO
3 REINFORCE THE POINTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE BY MY COLLEAGUES BOTH
4 ABOUT OUTREACH AND MEASUREMENT. BUT IN PARTICULAR HILARY, I
5 THOUGHT YOUR COMMENTS WERE VERY POIGNANT. THANK YOU, STAFF.

6

7 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. ANY OTHER
8 COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
9 SLIDE?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE HAVE. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
12 WRITING. FIRST IS ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
13 I'LL START THE CLOCK.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR GLOVER. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
16 RECORD, SHE AND HER. I SPEAK TO YOU AS SIMPLY AN ORDINARY USER
17 OF THESE BRIDGE SYSTEMS. AND I THINK WE CAN MAKE THIS HAPPEN.
18 THIS PLAN IS DEVELOPED BY PEOPLE WHO HAVE DEEP KNOWLEDGE.
19 CERTAINLY MORE THAN I DO. AND I CONSIDER IT A LIVING DOCUMENT
20 THAT WE CAN FINE TUNE ALONG THE WAY AND BUILD THE BEST PLAN
21 THAT WE CAN. I AM JUST AN ORDINARY PERSON IN THE WORLD. I'M IN
22 AN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY. I OFTEN HAVE TO MAKE HARD
23 DECISIONS. I DID LOOK AT THE FASTRAK WEB SITE, AND IT LOOKS
24 RELATIVELY SIMPLE TO USE. IF I DIDN'T HAVE A DEVICE IN FRONT
25 OF ME, I COULD GO TO A LIBRARY. I COULD GO TO A RESOURCE



MAY 10, 2023

1 CENTER. I HAVE HAD SOME EXPERIENCE WITH BENEFITS, AND THEIR
2 RESOURCE CENTERS THAT HAVE HELPED ME NAVIGATE THE PROCESS. I
3 HAVE NOT REALLY HAD ANY PROBLEM SIGNING UP FOR MTC PROGRAMS OF
4 MY OWN. I DID TRANSFER MY CLIPPER CARD TO MY PHONE, AND IT WAS
5 ACTUALLY FAIRLY EASY. ANYONE WANT TO ASK ME ABOUT IT, I WOULD
6 TRY TO HELP, BUT I WOULD CALL THE CLIPPER DEPARTMENT, AND
7 THEY'RE REALLY HELPFUL. BECAUSE THEY HELPED ME. BUT, REALLY,
8 WE HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND THE OVERARCHING GOAL IN THAT THE BILLS
9 FOR THE BRIDGES HAVE TO BE PAID AND THAT OPERATING A VEHICLE
10 ON A PUBLIC HIGHWAY IS NOT A RIGHT, BUT IT IS A PRIVILEGE. I
11 SPEAK FROM PERSONALLY, PERSONAL EXPERIENCE. HOW AM I ABLE TO
12 OPERATE A VEHICLE ON A PUBLIC HIGHWAY? IT'S BECAUSE I HAVE A
13 DRIVER'S LICENSE. AS I AM SURE MANY OF YOU DO. I GOT IT BY
14 TAKING A ROAD TEST AND A WRITTEN TEST. OKAY. THANK YOU VERY
15 MUCH.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ILIYANA
18 BINDER FOLLOWED BY OCEAN MOTLEY. ILIYANA ARE YOU THERE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS ILIYANA BINDER AND I AM
21 THE POLICY ASSOCIATE FOR GLIDE. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION
22 AND FOR RECONSIDERING THE MTC FINANCIAL PENALTY SYSTEM
23 OVERALL. BUT MANY COMMUNITY CONCERNS HAVE GONE UNADDRESSED AND
24 THEY'RE NOT INCLUDED IN THIS PROPOSAL. THE COMMITTEE SHOULD
25 ASK STAFF TO REVISE THIS PROPOSAL DUE TO THE FOLLOWING



MAY 10, 2023

1 REASONS: THE PROPOSED INCOME LIMITS ARE TOO LOW, AS WAS
2 DISCUSSED. THE PROPOSED CAP OF 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY
3 LEVEL DOES NOT REFLECT THE REALITY OF THOSE WHO ARE STRUGGLING
4 TO MAKE ENDS MEET IN THE BAY AREA. IDEALLY, THE PROPOSAL WOULD
5 NOT INCLUDE ANY INCOME LIMITS, BUT IF THERE MUST BE INCOME
6 LIMITS, THEY SHOULD USE 50% OF BAY AREA MEDIAN INCOME AS A
7 MORE REASONABLE CAP. ADDITIONALLY THE PLAN SHOULD NOT REQUIRE
8 ANY UP FRONT PAYMENTS TO START A PAYMENT PLAN. IF PEOPLE DO
9 NOT HAVE ACCESS TO THE MONEY NECESSARY TO BEGIN PARTICIPATION
10 IN THE PROGRAM, MTC WILL LOSE PEOPLE WHO WOULD OTHERWISE
11 BENEFIT FROM THE PAYMENT PLAN PARTICIPATION. AND THE PROPOSAL
12 ALSO LACKS PERSONAL INFORMATION ON HOW PEOPLE CAN SIGN UP,
13 VERIFYING INCOME, WHAT PAYMENT LOOKS LIKE, FLEXIBILITY PAYMENT
14 PLAN METHODS AND IMPORTANT ASPECTS OF THE PAYMENT PLAN LACKING
15 DETAILS MAKES IT HARD TO VAULT THE PROPOSAL. ALSO RETURN TO
16 USE OF DMV HOLD AND COLLECTION AGENCIES IS TOO PUNITIVE
17 CAUSING DISPROPORTIONATE HARM TO LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND PEOPLE
18 OF COLOR. COMMISSIONERS SHOULD PUSH FOR A POLICY THAT PROVIDES
19 PAYMENT PLANS TO EVERYONE WHO NEEDS THEM. AND THEY SHOULD BE
20 FLEXIBLE PLANS THAT ARE AFFORDABLE TO PEOPLE. AND, SO, WE
21 REALLY THINK IF WE ALL WORK TOGETHER WE CAN MAKE THIS HAPPEN,
22 BUT THERE NEEDS TO BE REVISIONS TO THIS PLAN. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MISS BINDER. NEXT UP IS OCEAN
25 MOTLEY.



MAY 10, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD MORNING. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. OCEAN MOTLEY FROM BAY AREA LEGAL
7 AID. I HAVE COME TO SPEAK BEFORE YOU SEVERAL TIMES BEFORE.
8 APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT YOU HAVE DONE. ALTHOUGH I AM
9 CONCERNED WITH SOME OF WHAT THE PROPOSALS HAVE ENDED UP. ONE
10 OF THE BIGGEST ONES ARE THE DMV HOLDS. THE DMV HOLDS ARE
11 REALLY JUST ABSOLUTELY DEVASTATING TO LOW-INCOME AND PEOPLE OF
12 COLOR IN COMMUNITY. MANY PEOPLE ARE LIVING IN THEIR VEHICLES.
13 MANY PEOPLE ARE USING THEIR VEHICLES TO SUSTAIN THEMSELVES AND
14 THE LOSS OF A VEHICLE COULD MEAN THE LOSS OF THEIR JOBS AND/OR
15 THEIR HOUSING. ALSO, YOU SHOULDN'T REQUIRE MONEY UP FRONT FOR
16 A PAYMENT PLAN IF WE CAN GET SOMEBODY ONTO A PAYMENT PLAN,
17 LET'S DO THAT. THAT HELPS EVERYBODY. BUT REQUIRING A HURDLE OR
18 BARRIER OF THEM HAVING TO COME UP WITH A PAYMENT UP FRONT TO
19 GET INTO THE PLAN IS GOING TO BE SELF-DEFEATING. ALSO THE
20 PROPOSE THE INCOME LIMITS ARE WAY TOO LOW. PARTICULARLY IN THE
21 BAY AREA. 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL DOES NOT REFLECT
22 THE REALITY OF STRUGGLING PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA IT SHOULD BE
23 50% OF THE BAY AREA MEDIAN INCOME. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE ALL
24 FINES AND DEBT FEES FORGIVEN FOR PEOPLE UNDER 50% OF BAY AREA
25 MEDIAN INCOME LEVEL. AND TO OFFER PENALTY WAIVERS AND DEBT



MAY 10, 2023

1 FORGIVENESS FOR EVERYONE INCLUDING THOSE WHO HAVE DMV HOLDS OR
2 DEBT COLLECTION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME. I PASS.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
5 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

6

7 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I WOULD ENTERTAIN A
8 MOTION TO MOVE THIS FORWARD. I LOOK AT THIS AS CONSTRUCTION
9 AND OPEN, IN WHICH THERE IS GONNA NEED TO BE CHANGES ALONG THE
10 WAY, BUT I THINK THIS IS THE FIRST STEP. SO, I WOULD ENTERTAIN
11 A MOTION TO MOVE THIS TO THE COMMISSION.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

14

15 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** ABE-KOGA, SECOND.

18

19 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** MOTION BY PAPAN, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA.
20 ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR GLOVER?

23

24 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** YES.

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT.

10 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN? COMMISSIONER THAO IS

19 ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO OUR NEXT

22 ITEM ON THE AGENDA, WHICH IS AN UPDATE ON THE OPEN ROAD

23 TOLLING PROGRAM AND POTENTIAL FUTURE CHANGE TO HIGH-OCCUPANCY

24 VEHICLE POLICIES AT BATA BRIDGES.

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **PETER LEE:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. PETER LEE BATA STAFF. I
2 UNDERSTAND YOU HAVE QUITE A BIT OF BUSINESS TODAY SO I'LL BE
3 FAST IN MY PRESENTATION, IF POSSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE. SO TODAY I'M
4 PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON OUR OPEN ROAD TOLLING PROGRAM AS WELL
5 AS POTENTIAL CHANGES THAT WE'LL BE DOING WITH OUR HOV POLICY
6 ON OUR BRIDGES. UPDATE OPEN ROAD TOLLING ON BRIDGES IS TAKING
7 OUT THE BOOTHS AT THE PLAZA AS AND UPDATING OUR TOLLING SYSTEM
8 WITH A MORE LIKELY A GANTRY SYSTEM LIKE THIS. WHERE YOU WILL
9 BE ABLE TO DRIVE UNDERNEATH A GANTRY AT HIGH SPEEDS AND HAVE
10 YOUR TOLLS COLLECTED EITHER THROUGH FASTRAK OR INVOICES WITH
11 CAMERAS THAT ARE IN PAVEMENT DETECTION DEVICES, ENHANCED
12 SAFETY AND IMPROVED MOBILITY THROUGH TOLL PLAZAS. NEXT SLIDE.
13 SO, JUST A QUICK LOOK AT WHAT IT WOULD LOOK LIKE. THIS IS A
14 PICTURE OF THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE. ON THE UPPER LEFT
15 HAND CORNER IS WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE TODAY WITH SEVEN TOLL BOOTHS
16 DRIVING AT 25 MILES PER HOUR THROUGH BOOTHS FOR TOLL
17 COLLECTION AND WHAT IS ONE OF OUR PROPOSALS HERE IS A DOUBLE
18 GANTRY HERE. WITH OPEN ROAD TOLLING. TO THE LEFT EXIT TO THE
19 TOLL PLAZA. RIGHT HAND SIDE IS OUR PAID LANE. SO YOU HAVE A
20 DIAMOND LANE FOR HOVS AS WELL AS TWO APPROACH LANES TO THE
21 BRIDGES. A REDUCTION OF NUMBER OF LANES GOING ON TO THE
22 BRIDGE. ROT WILL BE ABLE TO HANDLE A LOT MORE TRAFFIC GOING ON
23 TO THE BRIDGE AS WELL AS IMPROVED INCREASE THRUWAY ON THE
24 LANES. CURRENT ROLL OUT SCHEDULE IS ANTIOCH LATE 2025 AND
25 ROLLING OUT IN THE OTHER BRIDGES AND SEVERAL YEARS ENDING AT



MAY 10, 2023

1 BAY BRIDGE IN 2028. WE'LL STILL IN PROCESS OF FINISHING OUR
2 DESIGNS AS WELL AS SECURING A NEW TOLL SYSTEM INTEGRATOR THIS
3 WE PLAN FOR JULY SELECTION. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE'RE GOING THROUGH
4 DESIGNS FOR PLAZA NOT ONLY IMPROVING TOLLING AS WELL AS SAFETY
5 WE ALSO SEE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS HOV OPERATIONS THROUGH THE
6 PLAZAS AND WE WANT TO PRESENT THIS INFORMATION. OUR HOV POLICY
7 IS PART OF OUR TOLL SCHEDULE SO WE WOULD COME TO THE BOARD FOR
8 A FUTURE APPROVAL SO WE GET APPROVED TO GET INFORMATION TO OUR
9 CURRENT POLICY. EACH ONE EVER OF OUR PRIVILEGES TODAY HAVE
10 DEDICATED HOV LANE TO PROVIDE TIME AND SAVINGS AND TRANSIT
11 PRIORITY THROUGH THE PLAZA. BATA ALSO GRANTS HOV PLUS DISCOUNT
12 AT MOST BRIDGES BUT FOR DUNBAR AND SAN MATEO OFFERS TOTAL
13 DISCOUNT FOR HOV TWO PLUS VEHICLES. NEXT SLIDE. PROPOSED
14 POLICY CHANGES IMPLEMENTING RTO A FEW YEARS OUT OPEN UP HOV
15 LANES AT ALL THE BAY BRIDGES, TWO PLUS VEHICLES ALLOWING MORE
16 CAPACITY THERE AND CONSISTENT HOV DISCOUNT ACROSS ALL BRIDGES.
17 WE SEE THIS CHANGE FOR REASONS TO IMPROVE SAFETY GIVEN
18 LIMITATION SPACE AT THE TOLL PLAZA AS WE WANT TO INCREASE
19 PERSON THROUGHPUT AND ENHANCE REGIONAL CONSISTENCY IN OUR TOLL
20 POLICY. NEXT SLIDE. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE HAVE WITH ORT,
21 WE'RE GOING TO OFFER MORE THROUGHPUT AT HIGHER SPEEDS, THERE
22 IS LIMITATION OF SPACE, PARTICULARLY HERE AT THE ANTIOCH
23 BRIDGE WHERE THE BRING IS A SINGLE LANE. WE NEED TO BRING 3 TO
24 2 LANES ON THE BRIDGE ON THE APPROACH AS WELL AS WILBUR STREET
25 ON-RAMP IN A SHORT SPACE ON TO THE BRIDGE AT HIGHWAY SPEED. SO



MAY 10, 2023

1 THERE IS REALLY NOT A LOT OF ROOM TO PROVIDE EXTRA DEDICATED
2 LANES SO WE'RE PROPOSING HERE OFFERING A SINGLE LANE AND
3 REQUIRE USERS TO SELF-DECLARE WITH THE FASTRAK FLEX TAG AND
4 ONE OF THE REQUIREMENTS FASTRAK FLEX JUST LIKE ON EXPRESS
5 LANES AND YOU DESIGNATE 1, 2, OR THREE AND DESIGNATE YOURSELF
6 THREE AND YOU RECEIVE THE TOTAL DISCOUNT THROUGH THAT LANE.
7 NEXT SLIDE. THE NEXT BENEFIT IS TRYING TO INCREASE PERSON
8 THROUGHPUT BY INCREASING CARPOOL UTILIZATION. IN THIS CHART IS
9 A PEAK HOURLY HOV USER ACROSS BRIDGES FROM BACK IN DECEMBER
10 2022. FAIRLY RECENT DATA. IT COMPARES THAT PEAK HOUR TO A
11 THEORETICAL MAXIMUM. BASICALLY, REACHING CONGESTION IN A LANE
12 BETWEEN 1900 CARS AN HOUR. WHAT YOU SEE ON THE BAY BRIDGE,
13 IT'S A BIT HIGH BUT WE HAVE FOUR LANES APPROACHING THE BRIDGE
14 AS WELL AS METERING LIGHTS WE PROVIDE HOV DISCOUNT THERE, THAT
15 BENEFITS THE BRIDGE THERE BUT YOU SEE WELL OVER 1900 VEHICLES
16 AN HOUR. WE WANT TO, WE THINK THERE IS SPACE AND THINK WE CAN
17 OFFER SPACE TO HOVS TO INCREASE CARPOOLS IN THE LANE. YOU SEE
18 IN THE GREEN LINE IN THE CHART WE ARE EXTENDING HOV FROM THE
19 TOLL PLAZA CENTER FIELD BRIDGE EAST ON 580 BACK TOWARDS THE
20 MARINA BAY PARKWAY. BASICALLY RECONVERSION EVER AN OLD HOV
21 LANE. WE LINK TO OPEN AS HOV LANE TODAY GIVEN THE LOW VALUE,
22 OPERATING AT HIGHER LEVEL HOV THREE BASICALLY COMING UP WITH
23 SOME OF THE GP LANES GENERAL PURPOSE LANES AND NOT PROVIDE
24 FULL ACCESS INTO THE HOV LANE. OVERALL IT WOULD BE BETTER
25 OPENED UP AT HOV TWO. NEXT SLIDE. THIRD BENEFIT TRYING TO GET



MAY 10, 2023

1 TO ENHANCED REGIONAL CONSISTENCY MAKING TOLL POLICY CONSISTENT
2 WITH SOME OF THE OTHER MANAGED LANES THAT WE HAVE, THAT THE
3 AUTHORITY LOOKS OVER. WE'RE PROPOSING TO INCREASE THE
4 OCCUPANCY REQUIREMENT FOR THE HOV DISCOUNT AT THE SAN MATEO
5 DUMBARTON BRIDGE TO THREE. IT IS CURRENTLY A TWO PLUS
6 BASICALLY DUE TO OLD STATUTES THAT ALLOW FOR IT TO BE TWO
7 PLUS. THOSE STATUS HAVE SINCE BEEN REPEALED SO THERE IS
8 OPPORTUNITY NOW TO MAKE IT CONSISTENT WITH ALL THE OTHER
9 BRIDGES. IT WOULD RESULT IF A SLIGHT TOLL INCREASE WITH THE
10 HOV TWO BUT STILL BE ACCESSING THE LANE AND RECEIVE THE TIME
11 SAVINGS. NEXT SLIDE. WE BELIEVE BY GOING TO THIS IT PUTS US IN
12 LINE WITH HOW WE'RE MANAGING ALL OUR OTHER MANAGED LANES BY
13 PROVIDING MAXIMUM BENEFIT TO THOSE WITH THE MAXIMUM AMOUNT OF
14 OCCUPANCY IN THE LANE. WE WOULD PROVIDE MAXIMUM BENEFIT TO
15 THREE PLUSES ON OUR BRIDGES FULL-TIME SAVINGS OF HOV LANE AS
16 WELL AS HALF PRICE DISCOUNT THAT COMPARES TO EXPRESS LANES NO
17 TIME SAVINGS AND NO TOLL, AND THEN GIVE PARTIAL BENEFIT TO
18 THOSE THAT HAVE LESSER AMOUNTS OF PEOPLE IN THEIR CAR. HOV TWO
19 WOULD RECEIVE TIME SAVINGS BUT CONTINUE TO PAY FULL TOLL
20 SIMILAR TO EXPRESS LANES. FOR LANE OCCUPANCY REQUIREMENT WHAT
21 YOU SEE IN THE MIDDLE, THERE ARE THE BRIDGES AND CURRENT
22 POLICY IN THE MIDDLE WHAT WE'RE CHANGING IT TO ON THE RIGHT.
23 IN ALL THE BRIDGES BUT THE BAY BRIDGE WE WOULD BE CONSISTENT
24 AT ALLOWING PEOPLE INTO THE LANES AT THREE PLUS, AS WELL AS
25 TWO PEOPLE -- PEOPLE WITH TWO, AND AT THE BAY BRIDGE WE WOULD



MAY 10, 2023

1 CONTINUE TO BE AT THREE PLUS. SO WE WOULD BE CONSISTENT THERE.
2 NEXT SLIDE. ON AS FAR AS THE TOLL DISCOUNT ALL HOV THREE PLUS
3 VEHICLES WOULD RECEIVE THE HALF TOLL DISCOUNT THAT WE
4 CURRENTLY HAVE, AND IT WOULD BE CONVERSION OF THE TWO PLUSES,
5 BUN BART AND SAN MATEO, STILL BE ALLOWED IN THE LANE BUT PAY
6 FULL TOLL OF \$7. LASTLY NEXT SLIDE PAYMENT PROCESS FASTRAK
7 REQUIREMENT ALL BRIDGES TO UTILIZE HOV LANES ALL VEHICLES
8 REQUIRED TO HAVE FASTRAK. CHANGE HERE IS WE WOULD REQUIRE IF
9 THE BRIMS WERE ALLOWING HOV TWOS INTO THE LANE REQUIRED TO
10 HAVE FASTRAK FLEX TAG SO THEY WOULD DESIGNATE THEMSELVES AS
11 THREE PLUS OR OTHERWISE TO RECEIVE THE DISCOUNT. ALL OUR TAGS
12 GOING INTO THE FUTURE ARE SWITCHABLE TAGS. AS WE SWITCH OUT
13 TAGS THAT WILL HAVE EVERYONE HAVE THESE TAGS AS WELL AS THOSE
14 THAT ARE UTILIZING THE EXPRESSWAY. NEXT SLIDE. STILL WORKING
15 THROUGH OUR ENVIRONMENT ON ALL ORT PROJECTS TRENDING TOWARDS
16 THAT OPTIMIZING TRANSIT PRIORITY, IMPROVE TOLLING SYSTEMS,
17 TRANSIT PRIORITY AS WELL AS OVERALL CONGESTION. WE'RE COMING
18 BACK TO THE BOARD TO REVISE THE TOLL SCHEDULE, BEFORE WE
19 IMPLEMENT ORT. WE WILL BE RETURNING TO THE BATA OVERSIGHT
20 COMMITTEE WITH ORT APPROVALS AS NECESSARY WITH CHECKING
21 ACCOUNT CHANGES AND SUCH. IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS I'M HERE.
22 IT'S A LISTENING SESSION FOR US. WE'RE JUST TRYING ON GET YOUR
23 INPUT AND WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO MEET WITH YOU TOO.
24



MAY 10, 2023

1 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. THIS IS
2 AN INFORMATION ITEM. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. IT CAME TO MY ATTENTION SINCE WE
5 HAD A CONVERSATION ABOUT THIS, ON THE BAY BRIDGE, I THINK WE
6 STILL ALLOW CARS THAT ONLY HAVE TWO SEATS TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF
7 THE THREE -- OF THE THREE PLUS LANES. IS THAT RIGHT?

8

9 **PETER LEE:** YES, IN CAV AND CLEANER AIR VEHICLES.

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THAT'S IN LEGISLATION, THOUGH.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO, IF WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING THIS, I WOULD
14 REALLY LIKE US TO TRY AND GET THAT STATE LEGISLATION CHANGED.
15 BECAUSE, LIKE, JUST BECAUSE YOU BOUGHT A REALLY EXPENSIVE
16 SPORTSER, DOESN'T MEAN YOU SHOULD HAVE PRIVILEGED ACCESS TO
17 THE HOV LANES. I MEAN, IT'S A BUNCH OF NONSENSE, IF I HAVE
18 EVER HEARD IT. SO, I THINK I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE THAT
19 INCLUDED AS PART OF THIS PROPOSAL EVEN THOUGH WE DON'T HAVE
20 DIRECT AUTHORITY OVER IT, BUT LIKE SOMETHING THAT WE COULD
21 WORK TOWARDS. I APPRECIATE WHY WE'RE MOVING IN THE RICHMOND
22 FORWARD PROJECT TO MOVE FROM THREE PLUS TO TWO PLUS ON THE HOV
23 LANES. AND I THINK THAT WILL BE A GREAT WAY TO SPEED UP BUS
24 TRAFFIC ACROSS THE BRIDGE IN PARTICULAR. I AM A LITTLE BIT
25 CONCERNED THOUGH, I THINK AS A REGION WE NEED TO BE MOVING



MAY 10, 2023

1 TOWARDS THREE PLUS HOV ACROSS OUR ENTIRE NETWORK BECAUSE
2 THAT'S GOING TO PROVIDE CONSISTENCY AND DELIVER TIME SAVINGS
3 AND CONGESTION REDUCTION AND CLIMATE BENEFITS AND ALL THAT
4 BUSINESS FOR THE TOTALITY OF OUR HOV AND HOT NETWORK. AND THIS
5 FEELS LIKE IF IT IS SOMETHING THAT WE INTEND TO BE PERMANENT
6 THAT IT WOULD BE, SORT OF, A STEP BACKWARDS FROM GOING IN THAT
7 DIRECTION. WHILE IF IT'S TEMPORARY FOR THE MOMENT UNTIL WE CAN
8 PUT IN PLACE PLANS TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE HOV THREE PLUS FOR
9 THE ENTIRE NETWORK I THINK FOR ME THAT WOULD BE MORE ALIGNED
10 WITH OUR VISION AROUND EXPRESS LANES AND REGIONAL CONSISTENCY
11 OWE THIS STUFF AND REALLY DELIVERING THE BENEFIT OF EXPRESS
12 LANES. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER, I KNOW
13 WE HAVE TALKED A LOT ABOUT EXPRESS LANES AND THREE PLUS AND
14 TWO PLUS, BUT IF THERE IS, YOU KNOW, HOW YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT
15 THIS, AND IF THAT KIND OF DIRECTION OF, LIKE, OKAY, WE'RE
16 DOING THIS NOW, BECAUSE THIS IS WHAT MAKES SENSE NOW, BUT AS
17 WE CONTINUE TO GROW, LIKE OUR MANAGED LANES, THE INTENTION IS
18 ACTUALLY TO SHIFT EVERYTHING TO THREE PLUS AND IF WE CAN KIND
19 OF CENTER THAT IN, IN THE DISCUSSION OF THIS.

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH, COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, I THINK WE CAN
22 LIVE WITH THAT FOR SURE. WE DO PLAN ON THAT AS AN APPROACH.
23 REMEMBER, WE HAVE BEEN PRETTY SUCCESSFUL, RECENTLY, IN RINGING
24 THE BAY WITH THREE PLUS. AND WE THINK THAT THAT'S AN
25 INCREDIBLE SUCCESS, CHANGING I-880 FROM TWO PLUS TO THREE PLUS



MAY 10, 2023

1 IS THE FIRST TIME IN THIS REGION HAS DONE ANYTHING LIKE THAT.
2 THE URBAN CORE BIG CONGESTION THAT HAS BEEN OUR EFFORT. AGAIN,
3 AS A REMINDER CARPOOL HAS BEEN AFFECTED BY THE COVID PANDEMIC
4 WE'RE NOT SEEING CARPOOLS RETURN AT ANY GREAT RATE SO OUR
5 APPROACH HERE IS STILL TO ENCOURAGE THE TIME BENEFIT BY
6 GETTING INTO THE CARPOOL WITH ANY KIND BUT A PRICE BENEFIT IN
7 THE SHORT-TERM AGREEING CONSISTENCY AND PRICING WE HAVE THE
8 BETTER THESE LANES WORK. WE CONSIDER THAT CHALLENGE IN OUR
9 APPROACH.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I AGREE WITH THAT WE CAN INCLUDE THAT,
12 SPECIFICALLY, WHEN THIS COMES BACK. AND WE HAVE TO FIX
13 ENFORCEMENT IN THE HOV LANES ALL THIS STUFF IS GOING TO BE
14 COMPLETE NONSENSE AND MAKE NO DIFFERENCE TO ANYBODY IF PEOPLE
15 TREAT IT LIKE THEY TREAT NOW WHICH IS, OH, I GUESS SOMEONE
16 MIGHT -- YOU KNOW THERE IS NO CONSEQUENCES TO LYING ABOUT HOW
17 MANY PEOPLE ARE IN YOUR CAR, NO CONSEQUENCES TO, YOU KNOW,
18 FROM GOING INTO LANES YOU'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO BE IN. AND I KNOW
19 WUI GOT SOME PILOT PROGRAMS WORKING ON THIS, BUT I MEAN, THIS
20 IS ALL GOING TO BE FAIRLY MEANINGLESS UNLESS WE CAN INVEST AND
21 DELIVER ON THOSE.

22

23 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER
24 COMMENTS?

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YOU KNOW, ON THE TWO PEOPLE AND, YOU KNOW, A
2 SURVEY WE DID, THERE IS A LOT OF CONSTRUCTION WORKERS WITH
3 TRUCKS WITH ONLY TWO SEATS THEY TEAM UP WITH SOMEONE ELSE, A
4 LOT OF THEM COME INTO THE CITY. AND I DON'T WANT TO PENALIZE
5 THEM. SO THERE HAS TO BE SOME CONSIDERATION THERE. BECAUSE
6 THAT REALLY -- YOU KNOW, THEY WORK HARD TO GET THAT PERSON TO
7 RIDE WITH THEM. AND, SO, THAT TAKES THE CAR OFF THE ROAD.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I DON'T THINK HOW MANY OF THEM HAVE TRUCKS
10 WITH FOUR SEATS IN THEM BUT I THINK THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE
11 WHO -- ALL SORTS, WHO ARE DOING A LOT TO TRY AND BECOME
12 CARPOOLERS. I THINK WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO FIND A WAY FORWARD
13 THAT DOESN'T ALLOW THE DUDE WITH THE PORSCHE TO GO INTO THE
14 HOV 3 PLUS LANE. YOU KNOW? WHICH SEEMS -- WHICH FEELS LIKE THE
15 MAIN PROBLEM, I WOULD GUESS.

16

17 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE
18 PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS THIS?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITE. I HAVE
21 MISS ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE
22 TWO MINUTES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER.
25 THANK YOU FOR THIS PRESENTATION. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THIS



MAY 10, 2023

1 FORWARD, BECAUSE I ADVOCATE FOR US TO KEEP CURRENT IN THE NEWS
2 AND TRANSPARENCY. THIS IS VERY TRANSPARENT. I'M LOOKING
3 FORWARD TO JULY WHEN WE'LL CONSIDER A SYSTEM INTEGRATOR. I
4 THINK THAT CERTAINLY GIVES ME SOME INSIGHT AS TO WHY WE'RE NOT
5 GOING TO SEE THE FULL CONVERSIONS TAKING PLACE ABOUT TWO AND A
6 HALF YEARS FROM NOW. I'M CONCERNED WHY IT'S TAKING SO LONG AND
7 I THINK THAT'S CERTAINLY NEEDS TO BE DISCUSSED AND DISCLOSED
8 FOR THE RECORD. I CAN'T SPEAK FOR WHY SOME OTHER STATES HAVE
9 DONE IT MORE QUICKLY BUT AGAIN I DON'T KNOW IF IT HAS BEEN
10 DONE MORE QUICKLY BECAUSE OF ALL THE THINGS THOSE OTHER STATES
11 DID. SO I ONLY SAW THE CONVERSION IN THOSE STATES AT THE TAIL
12 END WHEN THEY FINALLY TOOK THE TOLL PLAZA AS DOWN. I SUPPORT
13 HOV LANES, AND I CARPOOL ALL THE TIME, I HAVE NOT DRIVEN A CAR
14 BY MYSELF IN EIGHT OR NINE YEARS. THAT'S MY CHOICE. I COULD
15 RENT-A-CAR. I HAVE A DRIVER'S LICENSE THAT'S IN GOOD STANDING.
16 AND WE BRING UP THE INTERESTING IDEALS ABOUT PICKUP TRUCKS. I
17 HAD A PICKUP TRUCK ONCE AND IT ONLY HAD THE TWO SEATS IN IT.
18 AND THERE ARE SOME PICKUP TRUCKS THAT HAVE MORE SEATS, BUT
19 MOST OF THEM DON'T HAVE THE EXTENSION OF THE CAB. I WANT MORE
20 CARPOOLING I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE HELP CARPOOL THOSE MOST
21 IN NEED. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
24 HANDS MR. CHAIR.

25



MAY 10, 2023

1 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS AN INFORMATION
2 ITEM. NO VOTE TO BE TAKEN. WE'LL MOVE TO OUR NEXT ITEM ON THE
3 AGENDA, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENTS.

4
5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
6 WRITING. I DO SEE ALETA DUPREE'S HAND IS RAISED. MISS DUPREE,
7 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8
9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, CHAIR FEDERAL GLOVER. TONGUE TIED
10 TODAY. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I SPEAK
11 GENERALLY. THINGS IN THE TOLLING WORLD SEEM TO GO IN WAVES.
12 YOU WILL SEE A FEW AGENCIES THAT WILL, ALL OF A SUDDEN, MAKE
13 POLICY CHANGES AND GO INTO CONSTRUCTION WITH PROJECTS, AND
14 THEN WE DON'T HEAR FOR A WHILE. THAT IS WHY IT IS SO IMPORTANT
15 FOR ALL AGENCIES, INCLUDING BATA, TO CONTINUE TO INFORM US
16 WITH A DASHBOARD AS TO OUR PROGRESS, WITH ALL OF THIS
17 DIFFERENT WORK, WHETHER IT BE THE TOLLING PROGRAM, AND NEW
18 TOLL FACILITIES, OR THE BRIDGE REPAIRS. WE HAD A STATE OF GOOD
19 REPAIR PRESENTATION A FEW MONTHS AGO, WHICH I THINK I GOT TO
20 SEE PART OF THAT, AND, OF COURSE, WE HAVE OUR BUDGET REPORTS
21 EVERY YEAR. BUT, INFORMATION IS KEY. AND YES, IT DOES TAKE A
22 LOT OF WORK TO PUT OUT INFORMATION. AND I'M NOT SAYING THAT WE
23 SHOULD BE TWEETING EVERY DAY ABOUT HOW WE'RE DOING THE TOLLING
24 PROJECTS. BUT, HOW CAN WE MAKE SURE THAT WE ENLIGHTEN THE
25 PUBLIC WITH THESE PRESENTATIONS MORE OFTEN? AND I THINK THAT



MAY 10, 2023

1 WE CAN MAKE THESE THINGS HAPPEN. HOW WE EMPHASIZE BEING ABLE
2 TO OPERATE AND MAINTAIN THE BEST BRIDGE NETWORK THAT WE CAN.
3 AND I THINK WE ALREADY ARE. BUT IT COMES FROM THE PUBLIC
4 BUYING INTO THE IDEA THAT THESE BRIDGES HAVE TO BE PAID FOR.
5 AND THAT OPERATING A VEHICLE ON A PUBLIC HIGHWAY IS A
6 RESPONSIBILITY. AND I HOPE THE PUBLIC WILL BUY INTO THAT.
7 THANK YOU, AND HAVE A GOOD DAY.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HAND
10 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

11

12 **CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER:** OKAY. THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR
13 PARTICIPATION IN THE MEETING TODAY. WE ARE ADJOURNED. OUR NEXT
14 MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR JUNE 14TH. [MEETING ADJOURNED]

15

16



NTT

Broadcasting Government