

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



APRIL 12, 2023

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
APRIL 12<sup>TH</sup>, 2023, 1:30 PM**

**CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS BEING CALLED TO ORDER AND THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

**CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR ESUF IS EXCUSED. BALDINI?

**SPEAKER:** HERE.

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

**PAMELA CAMPOS:** PRESENT.

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS? ELDRED?



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** PRESENT.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** -- FLOREZ? GLASER?

5

6 **GERRY GLASER:** I'M HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN IS EXCUSED. PIMPLE? WELTE?

9 HANKERSON? KALLINS?

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] IS EXCUSED. LODIN IS

14 EXCUSED. MARKHAM? NICKENS?

15

16 **RODNEY NICKENS:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HERE. [ROLL CALL] PIERCE? IS EXCUSED. PIMPLE? SCOTT?

21 WELTE? WILSON? WONG? AND ZACK? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY

24 FOR MAKING IT IN. I KNOW THAT THIS IS NEW AND HARD TO FIGURE

25 OUT SOMETIMES. BUT WE ARE HERE. AND IT'S GOOD TO SEE FACES,



APRIL 12, 2023

1 AND, LIKE, ATTACH THEM TO REAL LIFE PEOPLE SO I LOOK FORWARD  
2 TO SEEING MORE OF YOU. THIS IS THE TIME FOR OUR WELCOME AND  
3 WITH THAT SAID I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME AND ASK IF HE WOULD  
4 LIKE TO SAY A FEW WORDS TO US.

5

6 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WELCOME EVERYBODY YEAH MY NAME IS ANDREW  
7 FREMIER. I'M NOW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC NOW AND ABAG. I'M  
8 FAMILIAR TO SOME OF YOU THOUGH BECAUSE I HAVE BEEN HERE FOR  
9 QUITE A WHILE. I WAS THE DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF  
10 OPERATIONS FOR THE LAST 18 YEARS. SO ONE OF MY PROJECTS IS  
11 THIS WONDERFUL SPACE WE'RE IN, THAT IS HARD TO GET TO  
12 SOMETIMES, I UNDERSTAND. BUT MAYBE I SHOULD TELL YOU JUST A  
13 LITTLE BIT ABOUT ME BESIDES THAT. I WAS AT CALTRANS FOR 20  
14 YEARS BEFORE THAT. I WORKED IN THE OAKLAND OFFICE, PRIMARILY  
15 AS A BRIDGE ENGINEER MOST OF MY CAREER. AND I ACTUALLY GOT  
16 HIRED BY MTC TO DELIVER ON THE SEISMIC PROGRAM THAT BUILT MOST  
17 OF THE BRIDGES IN THE REGION AND KIND OF EVOLVED FROM THERE. I  
18 AM A CALIFORNIA BOY. I HAVE BEEN HERE FOR FIVE -- MY FAMILY  
19 HAS BEEN HERE FOR FIVE OR SIX GENERATIONS. I WENT TO SCHOOL  
20 DOWN AT SAN LUIS OBISPO AT CAL POLY. GRADUATED WITH A CIVIL  
21 ENGINEERING DEGREE. I HAVE A CIVIL ENGINEER WIFE AND TWO KIDS  
22 THAT ARE WORKING IN THE INDUSTRY SO DIDN'T FALL TOO FAR FROM  
23 THE TREE. I WANT TO SPENT A COUPLE OF MINUTES RECOGNIZING HOW  
24 IMPORTANT THIS GROUP IS AND HOW COMMITTED I AM TO MAINTAINING  
25 THE RELATIONSHIP, WE'RE TAKING ADVANTAGE OF ALL OF THE HARD



APRIL 12, 2023

1 WORK YOU DO AND REACHING OUT TO THE COMMUNITY IN A LOT OF  
2 AREAS THAT SOMETIMES GET MISUNDERSTOOD IN PLACES THAT THE WORD  
3 DOESN'T TRICKLE THROUGH, SORT OF, THE SYSTEM. SO I WANT TO  
4 THANK YOU ALL FOR THE LEVEL OF EFFORT YOU PUT IN. I WORKED  
5 CLOSELY WITH MARTHA AND HER TEAM, AND KY-NAM OF COURSE REBECCA  
6 IN TERMS OF POPULATING THE WORK THAT WE DO AND I CERTAINLY PAY  
7 ATTENTION TO THE REPORTS THAT RANDI BRINGS FORWARD TO US AS  
8 WELL AS THE ITEMS THAT YOU DISCUSS ON A REGULAR BASIS. SO I  
9 JUST WANTED TO INTRODUCE MYSELF, SPEND A COUPLE OF MINUTES  
10 WITH YOU THIS MORNING, OR THIS AFTERNOON AND JUST ASSURE YOU  
11 THAT I AM PAYING ATTENTION AND REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO THE  
12 INPUT THAT YOU ALL PRODUCE. BECAUSE IT IS VERY VALUABLE TO THE  
13 WORK THAT WE DO AND IT REALLY DOES HELP, SORT OF, SEASON THE  
14 EFFORT SO THAT WE'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO ALL KINDS OF DETAILS  
15 IN THE WORK THAT WE DO FOR THE CUSTOMER, FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE  
16 REGION. SO, THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND DOES ANYBODY HAVE ANY  
19 QUESTIONS FOR ANDY.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** WELCOME. REALLY EXCITED TO CONGRATULATE YOU ON YOUR  
22 NEW APPOINTMENT AND WE'RE VERY MUCH LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING  
23 WITH YOU ANDY. WE HAVE BEEN LONG TIME FANS OF YOUR WORK AND  
24 WE'RE EXCITED FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND YOUR VISION.

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU. AND PLEASE REACH OUT TO ME  
2 PERSONALLY ANY TIME YOU NEED TO. I'M VERY REACHABLE AND  
3 ACCESSIBLE.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AND IF YOU EVER WANT TO HEAR THE SAGA OF  
6 HOW THIS BUILDING WAS CAPTURED AND RENOVATED, IT IS QUITE A  
7 STORY -- DO WE HAVE A VIDEO OF THAT SOMEWHERE?

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I DON'T KNOW. I THINK WE HAVE BITS AND PIECES.  
10 I KNOW MARK JONES DID QUITE A BIT OF WORK FOR US ALONG THE  
11 WAY. WE SHOULD ACTUALLY PUT SOMETHING TOGETHER. WE HAVE GOT  
12 SOME STORY BOARDS, I KNOW, BUT YEAH IT WAS QUITE AN ADVENTURE.  
13 STEVE ALWAYS TALKED ABOUT THIS BUILDING BEING AN EXPERIMENT IN  
14 GOOD GOVERNMENT AND IT REALLY HAS TURNED OUT THAT WAY. IT'S  
15 BEEN A WONDERFUL MEETING PLACE. I LOVE THE FACT THAT WE'RE  
16 PART OF THE COMMUNITY, WE DO BLOOD DRIVES HERE, WE DO  
17 ELECTIONS HERE. WE PROVIDE A LOT OF OUR SERVICES TO THE  
18 PUBLIC, ESPECIALLY THE FOLKS WHO HAVE A HARD TIME PAYING FOR  
19 SPACE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND THE FACT THAT THE FOUR AGENCIES AND  
20 MORE ARE WORKING WITHOUT DEMISING WALLS IS GOOD GOVERNMENT FOR  
21 THE PEOPLE. I THINK WE'RE ALL PRETTY PROUD OF THIS BUILDING.  
22 IT'S A PRETTY ADAPTIVE REUSE OF OLD MATERIAL TOO. IT'S GOT A  
23 GOOD HISTORY.

24



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YEAH. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE YOU DO A VIDEO  
2 OF THE WHOLE THING FROM START TO FINISH. BECAUSE IT TOOK A  
3 WHILE. BUT IT WAS AN AMAZING PROCESS TO SEE. THIS BUILDING,  
4 YOU CAN'T APPRECIATE IT UNTIL YOU HEAR THE STORY BEHIND IT  
5 LIKE THIS WOOD THAT'S IN FRONT OF US RIGHT NOW AND SOME OF THE  
6 OTHER THINGS, LIKE THE ROOF. THANK YOU, ANDY FOR JOINING US  
7 TODAY, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO HAVING YOU HERE MORE OFTEN W  
8 THAT WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER THREE, CHAIR'S  
9 REPORT. AND I'M GOING TO TURN MY FIRST PORTION OF THE CHAIR'S  
10 REPORT OVER TO FRANK WELTE.

11

12 **FRANK WELTE:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. AND I'M DELIGHTED TO BE  
13 HERE. I HAVE BEEN HERE ON THE COUNCIL FOR ALMOST TWO YEARS AND  
14 I'M DELIGHTED THAT I HAVE BEEN HERE LONG ENOUGH TO ACTUALLY BE  
15 HERE IN PERSON THAT'S COOL. UNFORTUNATELY DUE TO CHANGES IN MY  
16 WORK ASSIGNMENT I'M GOING TO BE NEEDING TO STEP BACK AFTER MAY  
17 1ST AND I JUST WANTED YOU ALL TO KNOW THAT I HAVE THOROUGHLY  
18 ENJOYED MY PARTICIPATION ON THE COUNCIL AND I HOPE THAT WE  
19 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO EXCHANGE SOME USEFUL IDEAS AND LEARN A LOT  
20 BETWEEN EACH OTHER, AND I AM HOPING THAT A PERSON WITH A  
21 DISABILITY WILL BE IN A POSITION TO TAKE MY POSITION ON THE  
22 COUNCIL SOON. THANK YOU FOR GIVING ME THIS OPPORTUNITY TO  
23 PARTICIPATE WITH YOU. I HAVE LEARNED A LOT. THANK YOU VERY  
24 MUCH.

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND YOUR CONTRIBUTIONS HAVE  
2 BEEN WONDERFUL. I WAS GLAD TO HAVE YOU ON AND AM SAD TO SEE  
3 YOU GO. EVERYBODY STOP BY AND SAY GOODBYE TO FRANK BEFORE WE  
4 ALL LEAVE TODAY. I HAVE ONE OTHER ANNOUNCEMENT THAT I'M GOING  
5 READ AND IT IS FROM ILAF. IT'S BEEN AN HONOR TO ICE IS CHAIR  
6 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND SHARE EQUITY ACCESS  
7 SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THE LAST YEAR I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO  
8 ADVANCE TRANSPORTATION EQUITY AND IMPROVE THE SYSTEMS SO MANY  
9 OF US RELY ON WHILE I'M EXCITED TO CONTINUE THIS AS A MEMBER  
10 OF THE COUNSEL I WILL UNFORTUNATELY HAVE TO STEP DOWN FROM MY  
11 CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR POSITIONS TO AVOID POTENTIAL CONFLICTS OF  
12 INTEREST AS I EXPAND MY CAREER IN GOVERNMENT. EXCITED TO  
13 CONTINUE WORKING WITH YOU ALL. SO SHE'S NOT LEAVING US, BUT AS  
14 YOU SAW ON THE AGENDA THERE ARE ADJUSTMENTS GOING ON SO WE  
15 WILL BE FILLING SOME SPACES. WITH THAT, I HAVE ALSO BEEN  
16 NOTIFIED BY GENAY THAT SHE, WITH BACK TO IN-PERSON WILL NOT BE  
17 ATTENDING THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEES. SO WITH THAT  
18 SAID, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS MOVE PAM CAMPOS FROM AN  
19 ALTERNATE TO A STANDING MEMBER OF THE COMMITTEE TO BACKFILL  
20 ONE OF THOSE SPOTS I'M GOING APPOINTMENT MYSELF AS INTERIM  
21 CHAIR OF THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE SO THAT WE CAN GET  
22 THE COMMITTEE BACK ORGANIZED AND BRING NUMBERS BACK UP TO  
23 WHERE THEY NEED TO BE. THAT'S ALL THAT PARTICULAR COMMITTEES.  
24 OTHER THAN THAT I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING ELSE FOR THE CHAIR'S  
25 REPORT. SO WE'LL MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER FOUR, APPROVAL OF THE





APRIL 12, 2023

1 MARCH 8TH, 2023 MEETING -- I ALMOST SAID 2013, MEETING  
2 MINUTES. CAN I HAVE A MOTION TO APPROVE, PLEASE?

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** MOVED MEMBER ELDRED.

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI SECONDS.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** MOTION BY ELDRED, SECOND BY BALDINI. IS  
9 THERE ANY DISCUSSION? WITH THAT, I DO NEED -- IS THERE ANY  
10 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE MOTION? IF YOU ARE A MEMBER OF THE  
11 PUBLIC AND WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR  
12 DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS CAN STEP UP TO THE PODIUM  
13 AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU. WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
14 COMMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND AS WE HAVE ONE MEMBER  
21 ATTENDING REMOTE, WE WILL HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR KINMAN?

24

25 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF IS ABSENT. BALDINI?

3

4 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

7

8 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALSO IF YOU ARE NOT ACTUALLY SPEAKING

11 PLEASE DO NOT TURN ON YOUR MICROPHONE. THANK YOU. DEUTSCHE

12 GROSS?

13

14 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

17

18 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD IS ABSENT. GLASER?

21

22 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN IS EXCUSED? HANKERSON?

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** ABSTAIN.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LODEN IS EXCUSED. MARKHAM?

12

13 **RODNEY NICKENS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER.

20

21 **JOHNNY PARKER:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE IS EXCUSED. SCOTT?

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

3

4 **FRANK WELTE:** NO.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON IS ABSENT. WONG? THANK YOU. ZACK?

7 ZACK IS ABSENT. IT PASSES WITH 16 AYES, ONE NO, AND ONE

8 ABSTENTION.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ARE WE COUNTING LOVRY, HE WAS NOT

11 APPOINTED YET.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES BECAUSE HE WAS SWORN IN BY THE

14 COMMISSION.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WITH THAT AGENDA ITEM FIVE PUBLIC COMMENT

17 ON OTHER BUSINESS. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO READ NAMES OR

18 ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS AT

19 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD.

20 I WOULD ALSO ASK THAT ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING

21 BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM

22 ON TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL

23 STAR NINE. YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON TO SPEAK, WHEN YOU ARE

24 CALLED UPON UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL STAR SIX. DO WE HAVE ANY

25 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO SPEAK?



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
3 THEIR HAND RAISED. VEDA FLOREZ.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VEDA, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. VEDA  
8 IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK, YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOUR PHONE. MAYBE SHE  
9 PRESSED IT ON ACCIDENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THEN WE WILL GO ON TO  
12 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX, THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF ADVOCACY  
13 EFFORTS UPDATE. AND REBECCA LONG WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. AND  
14 THIS ITEM IS PRESENTED AS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND NO ACTION  
15 IS TAKEN.

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD AFTERNOON REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF  
18 LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. I ASKED STAFF TO BRING DOWN  
19 THIS BEAUTIFUL BROCHURE THAT IS ALL ABOUT THE BUILDING. WHEN  
20 CHAIR KINMAN ASKED ABOUT DO WE HAVE A VIDEO, I WAS REMINDED  
21 THAT WE HAVE THIS BEAUTIFUL BOOK THAT GIVES A LITTLE BIT OF  
22 THE HISTORY SOME OF IT IS SADLY OUTDATED WE NO LONGER HAVE A  
23 HUB WHERE YOU CAN GET INFORMATION ON THE FIRST FLOOR, BUT  
24 CERTAINLY THE HISTORY IS ACCURATE SO YOU MIGHT ENJOY PICKING  
25 THAT UP ON YOUR WAY OUT. THIS AGENDA ITEM IS TO GIVE YOU AN



APRIL 12, 2023

1 UPDATE ON THE FISCAL CLIFF ADVOCACY THAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING IN  
2 PARTNERSHIP WITH SOME OF YOU ON THIS COMMITTEE. WE HAVE BEEN  
3 WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS IN THE REGION  
4 AS WELL AS OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS OF COURSE, AND IF THE TECH  
5 TEAM COULD PULL UP THE PRESENTATION THAT WOULD BE GREAT. WHILE  
6 THEY'RE DOING THAT JUST TO KIND OF GIVE YOU A SENSE OF THE  
7 TIMING, WE ARE KIND OF IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BUDGET PROCESS IN  
8 SACRAMENTO. THE GOVERNOR INTRODUCES THE BUDGET IN JANUARY AND  
9 I WOULD NOTE THAT THE GOVERNOR DID NOT PROPOSE ANY FUNDING TO  
10 ADDRESS THE TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CLIFF, AND, ACTUALLY  
11 PROPOSED TO CUT FUNDING THAT WAS INCLUDED IN LAST YEAR'S  
12 BUDGET AS A KIND OF POTENTIAL OR A PROMISE, IF YOU WILL, TO GO  
13 IN THE NEXT YEAR'S BUDGET TO THE TUNE OF \$2 BILLION FOR  
14 TRANSIT CAPITAL. THE GOVERNOR PROPOSED TO REDUCE THAT TO 1  
15 BILLION NEXT YEAR WE HAVE GONE ON THE RECORD OPPOSING THAT  
16 ALONG WITH OTHERS. SO WE HAVE BEEN WORKING UPHILL TO GAIN  
17 TRACTION AROUND THE IMPORTANCE FOR INCLUDING SOME FUNDING FOR  
18 TRANSIT IN THE OPERATING BUDGET SINCE IT BASICALLY WAS NOT  
19 PROPOSED. AND I WOULD SAY THE JOINT ADVOCACY THAT WE HAVE BEEN  
20 DOING, AS WELL AS THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION AND  
21 OTHERS HAS REALLY BEEN EFFECTIVE IN GETTING THIS ISSUE  
22 RECOGNIZED. SO IT'S BEEN ON THE AGENDA OF THE BUDGET COMMITTEE  
23 HEARINGS. SO THERE HAS BEEN A FORUM TO TALK ABOUT IT AND THE  
24 BUDGET COMMITTEE CHAIRS HAVE ALL ACKNOWLEDGED THAT THIS IS A  
25 SERIOUS PROBLEM IN THOSE HEARINGS. SO, I THINK WHAT WE HAVE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 REALLY ACCOMPLISHED OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS IS THAT ISSUE  
2 AWARENESS RECOGNITION, BUT NOW, WE'RE IN MID-APRIL, AND IT'S  
3 REALLY CRUNCH TIME. THE BUDGET HAS TO BE ADOPTED BY MID-JUNE,  
4 AND SO WHAT WE HAVE BEEN REALLY FOCUSING ON IN PARTNERSHIP  
5 WITH THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION, AS WELL AS OUR BAY  
6 AREA PARTNERS IS LOOKING AT, YOU KNOW, HOW -- HOW IS THE  
7 LEGISLATIVE GOING TO SOLVE THIS PROBLEM. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW,  
8 WHILE -- IT'S TEMPTING TO, SORT OF, ASK THEM TO FIX IT I THINK  
9 THAT'S NOT WHAT THEY WANT FROM US, AND I THINK WE HAVE HEARD  
10 DIRECTLY FROM CHAIR TING FROM SAN FRANCISCO CHAIR OF THE  
11 ASSEMBLY BUDGET COMMITTEE HE'S LIKE, TELL ME WHAT TO CUT, YOU  
12 KNOW, HOW -- WHAT DO YOU WANT ME TO DO. YOU ARE BRINGING ME A  
13 BIG FROM BE AND WHAT'S YOUR SOLUTION. THAT'S KIND OF WHAT  
14 WE'RE WORKING ON NOW. AND IF YOU COULD GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE?  
15 SO THIS PRESENTATION IS KIND OF REPURPOSED FROM ONE THAT WE  
16 HAVE GIVEN TO THE COMMISSION AND THAT WE HAVE GIVEN IN VARIOUS  
17 FORMS INCLUDING TO THE BART BOARD FOR EXAMPLE, SO I'M GOING TO  
18 GO THROUGH THIS FAIRLY QUICKLY BUT I WANTED TO ORIENT YOU TO  
19 WHAT IS THE PROBLEM AND WHAT IS THE FUNDING CHALLENGE THAT  
20 WE'RE TRYING TO CLOSE AND THEN TOWARDS THE END WE'LL GET INTO  
21 WHAT THE POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES ARE AND GET FEEDBACK FROM  
22 YOU. ALSO JUST CONTEXT ON THE TIMING. WE ARE PLANNING TO GO  
23 DIRECTLY TO THE COMMISSION THIS MONTH WITH A RECOMMENDATION.  
24 SO, WE AREN'T GOING TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE THIS FRIDAY  
25 BUT JUST IN THE INTEREST OF TIME WE'RE GOING TO GO STRAIGHT TO



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THE COMMISSION. AGAIN, WITH A RECOMMENDATION THAT THESE ARE  
2 THE FUNDING SOURCES THAT WE SHOULD BE RECOMMEND THE  
3 LEGISLATURE TO LOOK TO DO ADDRESS THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF AND  
4 PRINCIPLES AROUND HOW SHOULD THE FUNDS BE DISTRIBUTED, ET  
5 CETERA. THE PANDEMIC WAS A SHOCK TO THE WORLDWIDE AND BAY AREA  
6 WAS FORTUNATE TO GET FOUR AND A HALF BILLION DOLLARS FROM  
7 CONGRESS TO KEEP OUR SYSTEMS RUNNING THAT'S A HUGE AMOUNT OF  
8 MONEY BUT IT GIVES US SOME UNDERSTANDING OF WHY WE ARE IN A  
9 NEED OF SIGNIFICANT FUNDS BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY RIDERSHIP HASN'T  
10 RECOVERED TO THE COMMENT THAT YOU WOULD PROBABLY HAVE IMAGINED  
11 AND LET'S SAY LATE 2020. SO THOSE FUNDS HAVE NOT QUITE DRIED  
12 UP BUT THEY WILL BE FULLY EXHAUSTED FOR THE LARGEST OPERATORS  
13 IN '24, '25. FISCAL YEAR '24, '25. SO THERE IS, SORT OF, A  
14 GRADUAL INCREASE IN THE RATE OF THE PROBLEM AND THE SIZE OF  
15 THE DEFICIT OVER THE YEARS AS THOSE FUNDS GET SPENT DOWN. NEXT  
16 SLIDE. SO THIS IS A BIG PICTURE VIEW OF RIDERSHIP. YOU CAN SEE  
17 IT IS ON A STEADY TRAJECTORY UPWARDS WITH A FEW LITTLE  
18 VARIATIONS HERE AND THERE. I THINK THOSE WERE KIND OF WHEN WE  
19 HAD SURGES AND NOW VARIANTS, BUT IT IS MOVING IN THE RIGHT  
20 DIRECTION AND WE'RE NOW AROUND 53% OF PRECOVID LEVELS. NEXT  
21 SLIDE. THE RATE OF RECOVERY IS DIFFERENT BY OPERATOR, AND SO  
22 WHAT THIS SHOWS IS ON A PERCENTAGE BASIS WHAT THE DIFFERENT  
23 RATES OF RECOVERY ARE, SO 100%, OBVIOUSLY IT'S BACK TO WHERE  
24 YOU WERE IN, I THINK IT WAS LOOKING AT NOVEMBER 2019, IN THIS  
25 CASE. AND SO YOU CAN SEE THE DIFFERENT BARS HERE ARE COLORED





APRIL 12, 2023

1 ACCORDING TO THE RATE OF RECOVERY AND WE ONLY HAVE ONE  
2 OPERATOR AND THAT'S MARIN TRANSIT THAT IS OVER 80% OF THEIR  
3 PRECOVID RIDERSHIP, AND, YOU KNOW, I'LL GET INTO THIS A LITTLE  
4 BIT. BUT SOME OF THE DIFFERENCES REALLY HAVE TO DO WITH THE  
5 NATURE OF THE TRIPS THAT ARE BEING PROVIDED. THOSE OPERATORS  
6 THAT ARE SERVING MORE LOCAL TRIPS HAVE HAD STRONGER RECOVERY  
7 THAN THOSE THAT ARE SERVING THE MORE COMMUTE TRIPS. AND  
8 PARTICULARLY THOSE OPERATORS THAT WERE SERVING MORE COMMUTE  
9 TRIPS INTO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO ARE SOME OF THOSE THAT HAVE  
10 BEEN HIT THE HARDEST. SO, WHAT ELSE TO JUST POINT OUT HERE? IN  
11 GENERAL, THE BUS OPERATORS HAVE HIGHER RECOVERY THAN THE RAIL  
12 SYSTEMS, AND WHAT'S ALSO IMPORTANT TO KIND OF UNDERSTAND IS  
13 THAT THOSE SYSTEMS THAT HAD HIGHER FARES AND THEREFORE HIGHER  
14 SHARE OF THEIR OPERATING COST COVERED BY FARES, WHICH IS  
15 REFERRED TO AS KIND OF THE FARE BOX RATIO, ARE THE ONES THAT  
16 HAVE ALSO HAD THE SLOWEST RECOVERY. SO BART AND CALTRAIN, FOR  
17 EXAMPLE, HAD VERY HIGH FARE BOX IN THE 70% RANGE, AND YOU CAN  
18 IMAGINE THAT SOUNDED REALLY GOOD BEFORE. WE DON'T NEED AS  
19 NEARLY AS MUCH SUBSIDIES AS OTHER SYSTEMS DO WE'RE COVERING  
20 70% OF OUR COST NOW THOSE SYSTEMS ARE ONLY ABOUT 40%, AND 30%  
21 RIDERSHIP RECOVERY AND SO THEY FACE SOME OF THE MOST  
22 SIGNIFICANT SHORTFALLS. WHEREAS SOME SYSTEMS IN OTHER PARTS OF  
23 THE STATE MAY HAVE HIGHER RIDERSHIP RECOVERY, BUT THEY ALSO  
24 HAVE MUCH LOWER AMOUNT OF THEIR OPERATING COST COVERED BY  
25 FARES, AND SO THEY DON'T FACE THE SAME LEVEL OF SHORTFALL.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE KIND OF REINFORCES THE DIFFERENCES  
2 BETWEEN THE DIFFERENT OPERATORS. AND SO THAT YOU CAN KIND OF  
3 BETTER UNDERSTAND WHY SOME ARE IN A MORE DIFFICULT PLACE THAN  
4 OTHERS. SO, I HAVE TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE DIFFERENT  
5 NATURE OF THE SERVICE THAT'S PROVIDED, COMMUTE ORIENTED  
6 SERVICE VERSUS LOCAL SERVICE, SERVICE INTO DOWNTOWN SAN  
7 FRANCISCO, WHICH TO JUST KIND OF STATE THE POINT THERE, I  
8 MEAN, OBVIOUSLY THE WORK-FROM-HOME INCREASE INTO DOWNTOWN SAN  
9 FRANCISCO IS A HUGE FACTOR DRIVING THIS FISCAL CLIFF. SO, WHAT  
10 WE HAVE HERE ARE SOME OF THE DIFFERENT MODELS OF THE FUNDING  
11 SYSTEM FOR DIFFERENT OPERATORS. SALES TAX IS IN THE TOP RIGHT  
12 CORNER. NUMBER OF OUR OPERATORS ARE SIGNIFICANTLY DEPENDENT ON  
13 SALES TAX. SO VTA AND SAMTRANS, THEY HAVE VOTER DEDICATED  
14 REVENUE THAT SUPPORTS THEIR SYSTEMS WHEN THE ECONOMY, YOU  
15 KNOW, HAS A DOWNTURN. THAT'S PROBLEMATIC, BUT IN THE PANDEMIC,  
16 THAT REALLY -- SALES TAX HAS STAYED QUITE ROBUST SO THEY'RE  
17 NOT -- A LARGE PORTION OF THEIR BUDGET HAS CONTINUED TO GROW.  
18 USER FEE FOCUS, SO THAT WOULD BE, AGAIN, FARES, TOLLS, GOLDEN  
19 GATE BRIDGE, YOU WILL SEE IN SOME OF THE NEXT SLIDE, THEY'RE  
20 ACTUALLY IN ONE OF THE WORST CONDITIONS IN TERMS OF THEIR  
21 FISCAL CLIFF BECAUSE SO MUCH OF THEIR REVENUE WAS DEPENDENT ON  
22 BRING TOLLS. AND WHEN BRIDGE TOLLS GO DOWN THEY DON'T  
23 PROPORTIONATELY REDUCE HOW MUCH IS GOING TO THE BRIDGE AND HOW  
24 MUCH IS GOING TO TRANSIT THEY PROTECT THE BRIDGE BECAUSE  
25 THAT'S THEIR FOREMOST FUNCTION SO TRANSIT SEES A



APRIL 12, 2023

1 DISPROPORTIONATE HIT THERE. SAN FRANCISCO MUNI DOESN'T HAVE  
2 THE HIGHEST FARE BOX RECOVERY RATIO BUT THEY HAD A SIGNIFICANT  
3 AMOUNT OF THEIR REVENUE COMING FROM PARKING SO WITH THE CITY'S  
4 ECONOMIC ACTIVITY REALLY DIMINISHED, THEIR REVENUE IS ALSO  
5 REALLY IMPACTED. AND THEN YOU HAVE SOME SYSTEMS THAT HAVE KIND  
6 OF A DIVERSITY OF SOURCES. AC TRANSIT, MARIN TRANSIT, PARCEL  
7 TAXES, AS WELL AS SALES TAXES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHAT THIS SLIDE  
8 IS ABOUT, WHICH IS FAIRLY COMPLEX, I'M NOT GOING TO TRY TO  
9 DESCRIBE IT IN A TON OF DETAIL, BUT, REALLY, IT'S TRYING TO  
10 REINFORCE THE POINT THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS, YOU KNOW, OF ALL  
11 THE CITIES IN NORTH AMERICA, IT IS HAVING SOME OF THE SLOWEST  
12 RECOVERY IN TERMS OF ECONOMIC ACTIVITY AND THIS IS, YOU KNOW,  
13 REALLY DRIVEN BY THE EMBRACE OF REMOTE WORK. WE HAVE BEEN  
14 LOOKING AT SOME CENSUS DATA AND WHAT'S INTERESTING AND  
15 INTUITIVE WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT IT IS THAT THE GREATER THE  
16 SHARE OF PROFESSIONS IN THE BUSINESS SECTOR IN MANAGEMENT, IN  
17 PROFESSIONAL TYPES OF PROFESSIONS, THE GREATER LIKELIHOOD  
18 YOU'RE WORKING FROM HOME. AND THAT WAS PRE-PANDEMIC MAYBE 10%  
19 AND IS NOW UPWARDS OF 50%, AND SAN FRANCISCO REALLY HAS A  
20 DISPROPORTIONATE SHARE OF THOSE TYPES OF JOBS COMPARED TO  
21 OTHER CITIES AND THAT'S JUST A BIG FACTOR AND THAT'S REALLY  
22 WHY THE REGION IS HAVING SOME OF THE SLOWEST RECOVERY IN TERMS  
23 OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. AND WE ALSO HAD A LARGER SHARE OF  
24 COMMUTERS USING TRANSIT THAN DID OTHER CITIES. YOU KNOW, WE  
25 HAD SOME OF THE HIGHEST IN THE NATIONS. WE HAD ABOUT 15%, 14%



APRIL 12, 2023

1 OF COMMUTE TRIPS WERE ON TRANSIT, PRE-PANDEMIC, WHEREAS IF YOU  
2 WERE TO LOOK AT LA, OR A LOT OF OTHER CITIES, IT WOULD HAVE  
3 BEEN MUCH LOWER. NEXT SLIDE. SO, HERE ARE SOME BAR CHARTS  
4 SHOWING THE COMMENT OF THE SHORTFALLS. THE OVERALL NEED, OVER  
5 5 YEARS IS BETWEEN 2.5 TO 2.9 BILLION. THAT RANGE INCLUDES,  
6 FOR EXAMPLE, IN SOME CASES, SOME OF THE RESPONSES THAT WERE  
7 PROVIDED FOR THIS INFORMATION DID INCLUDE SOME SERVICE  
8 ENHANCEMENTS. THE 2.5 BILLION IS MUCH MORE JUST MAINTAINING  
9 THE SERVICE THAT WE HAVE TODAY. I WOULD NOTE THAT WE'RE  
10 CONTINUING TO GET UPDATES FROM OPERATORS. THEY ARE CERTAINLY  
11 FEELING THE PRESSURE FROM SACRAMENTO TO DO WHAT THEY CAN TO  
12 RIGHT-SIZE THEIR SERVICE. AND I EVEN EXPECT OVER THE NEXT WEEK  
13 OR TWO THAT THESE NUMBERS COULD COME DOWN. I HOPE THEY COME  
14 DOWN BECAUSE IT MAKES IT A LOT EASIER TO ADDRESS THE NEED. SO,  
15 YOU KNOW, DON'T GET TOO WEDDED TO THESE EXACT NUMBERS. BUT IN  
16 THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR WHICH THE LEGISLATURE IS WORKING ON A  
17 BUDGET FOR RIGHT NOW THE NEED IS NOT SEVERE IT'S LESS THAN 100  
18 MILLION BUT IT JUMPS CLOSE TO 400 MILLION THE FOLLOWING YEAR  
19 AND OVER 700 MILLION FOR THE NEXT YEAR, AND OBVIOUSLY THAT  
20 FISCAL CLIFF IS NOT GOING TO GO AWAY FOR FISCAL YEAR '27, '28  
21 BUT WE HAVE BEEN FRAMING OUR ADVOCACY THAT WE WANT THE  
22 LEGISLATURE TO PROVIDE CERTAINLY FOR THE NEXT FIVE YEARS WHILE  
23 AS AN INDUSTRY AS A REGION WORK TO COME UP WITH A MORE  
24 SUITABLE FUNDING MODEL THAT WILL INCLUDE HOPEFULLY SOME VOTER  
25 APPROVED NEW REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT



APRIL 12, 2023

1 SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. [LAUGHTER] SO, JUST TO KIND OF HIGHLIGHT --  
2 I THINK YOU HAVE PROBABLY SEEN A SLIDE SIMILAR TO THIS. YOU  
3 HAVE CERTAINLY HEARD PRESENTATIONS ABOUT THE BLUE RIBBON  
4 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE THAT WE FORMED IN THE WAKE OF THE  
5 PANDEMIC AND RECOGNITION THAT THIS CRISIS FOR THE TRANSIT  
6 INDUSTRY WAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY DO BETTER BY THE TRANSIT  
7 RIDER AND MAKE SOME IMPROVEMENTS THAT MAKE THE SYSTEM MORE  
8 SEAMLESS, MORE USER FRIENDLY, AND, SO, THESE ARE SOME OF THE  
9 INITIATIVES THAT ARE UNDERWAY, AND IN OUR PRESENTATIONS ABOUT  
10 THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF WE'RE TRYING TO ENSURE THAT OUR  
11 LEGISLATORS UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE NOT JUST TRYING TO DO  
12 BUSINESS AS USUAL, WE ARE REALLY WORKING TO MAKE IMPROVEMENTS  
13 SO THAT WE CAN ATTRACT MORE RIDERS AND IN SO DOING REDUCE WHAT  
14 THAT DEFICIT IS. SO, ON THE FARE PAYMENT SIDE, I THINK YOU  
15 HAVE HEARD ABOUT CLIPPER BAY PASS WHICH IS A REALLY EXCITING  
16 NEW PILOT. IT'S A REGION-WIDE TRANSIT PASS. OBVIOUSLY, YOU  
17 KNOW ABOUT CLIPPER. WHAT THIS DOES IS IT ACTUALLY IS A KIND OF  
18 PREPAYMENT OF YOUR FARES FOR A MONTH. OR WHATEVER THE MODEL  
19 WILL BE, BUT IT GIVES YOU ACCESS TO ANY TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE  
20 REGION AND IT'S THE FIRST TIME WE HAVE DONE THAT. AND THEN  
21 CLIPPER START IS OF COURSE THE MEANS BASED CLIPPER CARD ON  
22 CUSTOMER INFORMATION, WE'RE MAKING SOME HEADWAY ON A MAPPING  
23 AND WAYFINDING SYSTEM SO THAT EVERYTHING DOESN'T LOOK AS  
24 CONFUSING AS IT LOOKS IN THOSE IMAGINES. IT'S KIND OF A  
25 HARMONIOUS, YOU KNOW, COMMON MAP STYLE SO THAT PEOPLE USE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 ANYTHING SYSTEM KNOW HOW TO UNDERSTAND THAT, AND THAT THEY CAN  
2 JUST MORE READILY FIGURE OUT HOW TO NAVIGATE PARTICULARLY IN  
3 TRANSIT HUBS THAT HAVE MORE THAN ONE OPERATOR. SO I WON'T GO  
4 THROUGH ALL OF THESE, BUT POINT BEING WE'RE WORKING HARD TO  
5 IMPROVE THE SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE. AND SO I MENTIONED THAT WE ARE  
6 DOING A LOT OF ADVOCACY AND PARTNERSHIP WITH OPERATORS,  
7 ADVOCATES IN THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY, AND THE WAY THAT WE HAVE  
8 BEEN FRAMING THIS IS THAT IT IS ABOUT SURVIVING, BUT ALSO  
9 THRIVING. AND WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO COORDINATE WITH THE REST  
10 OF THE STATE BECAUSE WE KNOW ANY KIND OF STATE ADVOCACY CAN'T  
11 BE SUCCESSFUL IF IT'S ONLY THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. SO, JUST,  
12 YOU KNOW, AN OVERVIEW OF SOME OF THE ADVOCACY WORK WE HAVE  
13 BEEN DOING. THIS VERY BUSY LETTER ON THE RIGHT SHOWS ABOUT 100  
14 LOGOS THAT JUST IS A VISUAL REPRESENTATION OF THE STRENGTH OF  
15 THIS COALITION, AND, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE GOT BAY AREA  
16 ORGANIZATIONS, AS WELL AS ALL OVER CALIFORNIA IN TERMS OF BIKE  
17 PED ADVOCATES, ENVIRONMENTAL ADVOCATES, ALL MAKING THE CASE  
18 THAT TRANSIT IS ESSENTIAL TO OUR STATE'S GOALS AND KEY THEMES  
19 AROUND EQUITY AND CLIMATE CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
20 I THINK THIS IS JUST THE POINT I MADE REALLY AT THE OUTSET,  
21 THAT THE LEGISLATURE IS VERY MUCH ENGAGED. THESE ARE TWO  
22 LETTERS, ONE WAS SPEARHEADED BY SENATOR WIENER, THE OTHER BY  
23 SENATOR CORTESE E SIGNATORIES FROM MAINLY THE BAY AREA BUT  
24 THERE WERE SOME SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA MEMBERS AS WELL BASICALLY  
25 MAKING THE CASE THAT THIS YEAR'S BUDGET NEEDS TO ADDRESS THIS



APRIL 12, 2023

1 PROBLEM AND THEY EACH HIGHLIGHTED DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES  
2 THAT COULD BE LOOKED TOWARDS ADDRESS IT. THIS IS WHERE WE ARE,  
3 TRYING TO SHAPE THIS ASK. AS I MENTIONED WE BELIEVE IT NEEDS  
4 TO BE A MULTI-YEAR PACKAGE SO THAT OPERATORS HAVE CERTAINTY  
5 ABOUT THE LEVEL OF STAFFING THEY NEED, THE LEVEL OF SERVICE  
6 THEY CAN PUT ON THE STREET, AND THAT WE NEED TO HAVE MULTIPLE  
7 DIFFERENT REVENUE OPTIONS FOR THE LEGISLATURE TO CONSIDER.  
8 BECAUSE THE NEED, IF YOU CAN IMAGINE, RIGHT, IF THE BAY AREA'S  
9 NEED IS AROUND TWO AND A HALF BILLION, STATEWIDE WE'RE LOOKING  
10 AT A VERY BIG NUMBER FOR OVER FIVE YEARS. IT LOOKS LIKE IT'S  
11 AROUND 6 BILLION AND NO SINGLE FUND SOURCE CAN COVER THAT  
12 ENTIRE AMOUNT SO WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING AS YOU WILL SEE IN A  
13 MINUTE SAY VARIETY OF FUNDING SOURCES. QUESTIONS OF, YOU KNOW,  
14 ACCOUNTABILITY ARE ARISING AS WE WOULD EXPECT. THE LEGISLATURE  
15 WANTS TO KNOW, YOU KNOW, IF WE'RE GOING TO GIVE YOU THIS  
16 MONEY, HOW DO WE KNOW YOU'RE GOING TO USE IT WELL. HOW DO WE  
17 KNOW THAT YOU'RE GOING TO BE DOING THE THINGS THAT RIDERS WANT  
18 TO SEE AND THAT THOSE WHO AREN'T RIDING YET WANT TO SEE THAT  
19 THEY MIGHT CONSIDER RIDING. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF  
20 CONVERSATION AROUND SAFETY, A LOT OF CONVERSATION AROUND  
21 HOMELESSNESS ON TRANSIT AND THOSE ARE ALL REALLY DIFFICULT  
22 ISSUES, BUT THEY'RE IN THE FOREFRONT OF THE MINDS OF  
23 LEGISLATORS. THERE ARE DEFINITELY SOME TRADEOFFS IN THE  
24 FUNDING SOURCES THAT ARE BEING TALKED ABOUT PARTICULARLY THE  
25 IDEA OF SHIFTING TRANSIT CAPITAL DOLLARS TO OPERATING. I



APRIL 12, 2023

1 MENTIONED AT THE OUTSET THAT IN THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET, HE  
2 PROPOSED CUTTING BACK FUNDING FOR TRANSIT CAPITAL FROM 2  
3 BILLION TO 1 BILLION THIS YEAR, AND CUTTING IT ANOTHER BILLION  
4 IN OUT YEARS. ONE OF THE IDEAS THAT BEEN PUT ON THE TABLE EVEN  
5 BY THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION ITSELF IS TO SHIFT SOME  
6 OF THOSE FUNDS TO OPERATING. AND SO WE CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT  
7 ABOUT THAT. SO, YEAH, JUST TO WRAP THIS UP. WE ARE MAKING THE  
8 CASE THAT WE NEED A NEW MULTI-YEAR TRANSIT OPERATING PACKAGE  
9 AND THAT IT INCLUDE MULTIPLE FUND SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE. THESE  
10 ARE SOME OF THE FUND SOURCES THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING, AND WE  
11 EXPECT SOME OF THESE PERHAPS NOT ALL SHOW UP IN THE  
12 RECOMMENDATION THAT WE'LL BE MAKING TO THE COMMISSION. EAGER  
13 TO HEAR YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY ON ALL OF THESE. AND THESE HAVE  
14 BEEN DISCUSSED AT THAT CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION  
15 SUBCOMMITTEE THAT WE HAVE BEEN PARTICIPATING IN, THAT THAT  
16 COMMITTEE HAS NOT ENDORSED ALL OF THESE, AND I CAN SPEAK TO  
17 THAT MAYBE IN THE Q&A. SO, CAP-AND-TRADE IS THE STATE'S CARBON  
18 TRADING PROGRAM. IT'S BEEN AROUND FOR QUITE SOMETIME, AND IT  
19 GENERATES ABOUT ONE AND A HALF BILLION DOLLARS EVERY YEAR IN  
20 FUNDS THAT ARE REALLY AVAILABLE TO THE LEGISLATURE TO PROGRAM.  
21 THEY TYPICALLY GO TOWARDS ZERO-EMISSIONS VEHICLE IMPROVEMENTS.  
22 IN RECENT YEARS THERE HAS BEEN A PORTION GOING TO FIRE  
23 PREVENTION. BUT GENERALLY IT'S AIMED AT REDUCING GREENHOUSE  
24 GAS EMISSIONS AND ALSO MITIGATING FOR CLIMATE CHANGE. THERE'S  
25 A PORTION OF THE SALES TAX THAT DOES NOT GO TO TRANSIT. MOST





APRIL 12, 2023

1 OF IT DOES, BUT THERE IS A SMALL PORTION THAT GOES TO THE  
2 GENERAL FUND SO THAT'S WHAT THAT DIESEL SALES TAX IS WE COULD  
3 MAKE THE CASE THAT ALL GOES TO TRANSIT. THERE IS A  
4 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT FEE. IT'S BASICALLY A VEHICLE  
5 REGISTRATION SURCHARGE THAT IS GRADUATED DEPENDING ON THE  
6 VALUE OF THE VEHICLE THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE RAISED TO  
7 PROVIDE SOME NEW REVENUE. THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF NEW  
8 FEDERAL FUNDING THAT CAME IN FROM THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL FOR  
9 THE HIGHWAY PROGRAM. ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS OF THAT GOES  
10 RIGHT TO THE STATE TO GO INTO THE SHOP, WHICH IS BASICALLY THE  
11 STATE'S HIGHWAY REHAB PROGRAM. THOSE FUNDS HAVE NOT YET BEEN  
12 PROGRAMMED TO PROJECT. SO WE THINK THE LEGISLATURE MIGHT WANT  
13 TO LOOK TOWARDS THAT TO SHIFT SOME OF THOSE ON A TEMPORARY  
14 BASIS TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF. AND THEN LASTLY, I  
15 MENTIONED THIS IDEA OF SHIFTING SOME OF THE TRANSIT CAPITAL  
16 DOLLARS OVER TO OPERATING. THESE ARE SOME OF THE PROGRAMS THAT  
17 POTENTIALLY COULD BE SHIFTED. THE TRANSIT AND INNER CITY RAIL  
18 CAPITAL PROGRAM OR TIRCP IS A PROGRAM THAT MTC HAS ALREADY  
19 ADOPTED SPECIFIC POLICY AROUND WHAT PROJECTS WE WANT TO GET  
20 FUNDING THERE. BART TO SILICON VALLEY, BART CORE CAPACITY ARE  
21 FIRST IN LINE IN TERMS OF THE PRIORITY AND THEN IN OUT YEARS,  
22 THERE IS THE PORTAL, SAN FRANCISCO DOWNTOWN EXTENSION AND  
23 VALLEY LINK AS REALLY BIG RECIPIENTS OF THOSE FUNDS, AS WELL  
24 AS SAN FRANCISCO, MUNI VEHICLE REPLACEMENT, ZERO-EMISSIONS  
25 BUS, ET CETERA. SO, WE HAVE ALREADY DONE A LOT OF WORK TO



APRIL 12, 2023

1 PRIORITIZE HOW THOSE FUNDS SHOULD BE USED. SO SHIFTING THOSE  
2 TO OPERATING WOULD CERTAINLY COME AT A COST THERE. SO THAT  
3 CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. I KNOW THAT WAS A LOT. MAYBE WE  
4 COULD JUST LEAVE THIS UP. IT'S JUST A SNAPSHOT OF WHAT'S  
5 COMING UP, AND HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS. THAT YOU MAY HAVE.  
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO TO THE COUNCIL  
9 QUESTIONS, I NEED TO ASK IF THERE IS ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC  
10 WHO WISHES TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE  
11 OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM  
12 A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU TO  
13 SPEAK. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT  
14 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED  
17 ON THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE THREE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
18 THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE THEM?

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** TWO MINUTES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FIRST IS GOING TO BE VEDA FLOREZ. YOU  
23 HAVE TWO MINUTES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR RECOGNIZING ME. THANK YOU FOR THE  
5 PRESENTATION. I HAVE SEEN THIS PRESENTATION --

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VEDA, PAUSE, YOUR VOLUME WENT OUT. HOLD  
8 ON.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE SEEN THIS PRESENTATION IN OTHER MEETINGS, AND  
11 I APPRECIATE YOU COMING TO THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COUNCIL TO  
12 SPEAK TO US DIRECTLY. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I NOTICED THAT  
13 THERE ARE MANY PROVIDERS WHO HAVE RETURNED A HIGHER LEVEL OF  
14 RIDERSHIP, ESPECIALLY SINCE THEY HAVE NOT LEANED INTO FARE  
15 BOX. THAT IS IMPORTANT. WE NEED COMMUNITIES TO UNDERSTAND THE  
16 IMPORTANCE OF INVESTING INTO OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THAT'S  
17 VERY IMPORTANT ESPECIALLY TO LEAN INTO THIS AND CREATING  
18 LOOKING AT THE HOLISTIC PERSON AS A RIDER, AS A HOMEOWNER, AS  
19 A RESIDENT IN THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. ONE OF THE THINGS  
20 THAT I WOULD LIKE YOU TO DO, AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE THIS  
21 PLAN, IS TO ALSO GIVE THIS PRESENTATION TO ABAG. SO IF WE CAN  
22 GET THE BUY-IN FROM THE CITY COUNCIL, AND THE SPECIFICALLY THE  
23 LOCAL COMMUNITY LEADERS, LEADERSHIP, IT'S HELPFUL IN THE LONG  
24 RUN ESPECIALLY IF WE'RE LOOKING TO LEADERS IN SACRAMENTO WE  
25 CAN ASK THEM TO USE THEIR LEVERAGE TO COMMUNICATE OUR MESSAGE.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 SO I PARTICULARLY LIKE THE DIRECTION IN WHICH YOU ARE LEANING.  
2 AND I'M WONDERING IF YOU COULD HOLD OFF ON SOME OF THE RAIL  
3 FUNDING. BECAUSE FOR THE SMART TRAIN IN MY NECK OF THE WOODS,  
4 I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT ANY FUNDS THAT COULD BE HELPFUL TO  
5 CONNECTING, YOU KNOW, THE LAST MILE INTO COMPLETING THE ENTIRE  
6 LINE ALL THE WAY UP TO CLOVERDALE WOULD BE HELPFUL IN THE LONG  
7 RUN, AND I WOULD HATE TO SEE LIMITED FUNDS IN THAT DIRECTION.  
8 AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M PART OF THE MTC ADVISORY COUNCIL,  
9 BUT PARTICIPATING AT HOME TODAY.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE CHRIS  
12 FITZGERALD, FOLLOWED BY WARREN CUSHMAN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
13 YOURSELF.

14

15 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. I DID THANK YOU. HELLO ALL. SORRY  
16 I'M NOT THERE. LONG STORY SHORT. SO REALLY GOOD PRESENTATION.  
17 I DO HAVE A QUICK, QUICK QUESTION REGARDING THE WAYFINDING  
18 PROCESS AND FROM THE SLIDES, THE -- IT APPEARS THAT THERE ARE  
19 COMMONALITY US THAT ARE TRYING TO DRAW AS TO HOW THINGS LOOK.  
20 MY CONCERN, ONE OF MY BIGGEST CONCERNS ARE FOLKS WHO ARE  
21 VISUALLY IMPAIRED HAVING TACTILE AND EVEN DIFFERENT COLORED  
22 AISLES IF YOU WILL THAT WILL NOTE WHERE THINGS ARE WOULD BE  
23 GREAT, BUT ALSO REALLY PAYING ATTENTION TO THE NEEDS -- WE  
24 HAVE SO MANY PEOPLE WHO SOMETIMES CLASH AND SOMETIMES DON'T --



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THEY BENEFIT ALL, AND I THINK WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE THAT.

2 THANKS.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. AND NEXT UP IS WARREN  
5 CUSHMAN. WARREN, GO AHEAD UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YOU SHOULD BE ABLE TO HEAR ME.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE CAN.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I'M CALLING FROM MY OFFICE. I WANT TO OBSERVE A  
12 COUPLE OF THINGS. FIRST OF ALL, MY INITIAL THOUGHTS AROUND  
13 THIS PACKAGE -- FIRST OF ALL IT'S THE FIRST TIME I HAVE HEARD  
14 THIS PACKAGE -- AND MY INITIAL THOUGHTS ARE THERE ARE GOING TO  
15 BE TRADE-OFFS, AND WE WILL HAVE TO DIGEST JUST THINKING  
16 THROUGH WHICH OPTIONS OF FUNDING SOURCES THAT WERE EXPRESSED  
17 WILL GIVE YOU THE MOST FOR WHAT YOU WANT AND HOW, WHAT KINDS  
18 OF TRADEOFFS WE'RE LOOKING AT. OBVIOUSLY THE LEGISLATURE IS  
19 GOING TO HAVE A MEETING ABOUT THAT, BUT ALSO IN THE COMMUNITY  
20 NEED TO START THINKING ABOUT WHAT FUNDING OPTIONS MAKE SENSE  
21 AND WHAT THE TRADEOFFS ARE, WHAT THE COSTS AND BENEFITS ARE  
22 EACH OPTION ARE OUT THERE, AND WHAT IT WILL GIVE US, WHAT WE  
23 NEED, WITH THE LEAST PAIN TO THE CONSUMER. AND THE ONLY OTHER  
24 THING I WOULD SAY IS THAT I WANT TO SAY I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT  
25 NONE OF THE OPTIONS THAT WERE EXPRESSED PUT US IN A POSITION



APRIL 12, 2023

1 OF HAVING TO CHOOSE FOOD OR MEDICINE OR SOME OTHER GREAT NEED  
2 OVER TRANSIT. THAT WOULD HAVE CONCERNED ME, BUT I DIDN'T HEAR  
3 THAT, AND I'M VERY HAPPY THAT I DIDN'T HEAR THAT. AND THE  
4 OTHER THING I WOULD SAY IS I'M VERY INTERESTED IN THIS  
5 PROCESS, AND I PLAN TO BE MUCH MORE ACTIVE IN THE FUTURE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU WARREN. AND THERE ARE NO OTHER  
8 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IF YOU ALL WILL RAISE YOUR HANDS, I'M  
11 GOING TO CALL ON WHOEVER HAS QUESTIONS. SO, I SEE -- LET ME  
12 WRITE THINGS DOWN. IT'S GOING TO TAKE ME A WHILE. I SHOULD GO  
13 AROUND THE CIRCLE. HERE IS WHAT I'M GOING TO DO. I'M GOING TO  
14 GO AROUND THE CIRCLE. AND LET'S SEE, WE'RE GOING TO START WITH  
15 WENDI AND WE'RE WORKING OUR WAY THIS WAY.

16

17 **WENDI KALLINS:** ALL RIGHT. SO, FIRSTS OF ALL, THANK YOU FOR  
18 DOING ALL THIS HARD WORK TO TRY TO KEEP OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS  
19 RUNNING. THIS IS NOT AN EASY TASK, AND THE THINGS YOU'RE  
20 JUGGLING ARE NOT EASY TO DECIDE. TOP OF THE LIST, IT SEEMS  
21 LIKE THE T-TAPS NEEDS TO BE ACCELERATED. IT'S BEEN DRAGGING ON  
22 FOR QUITE A FEW YEARS AND IT SEEMS LIKE ONCE WE GET TO THE END  
23 OF THE PROCESS, THE END RESULT IS TO CREATE A NEW COMMITTEE  
24 AND KEEP DELIBERATING, AND I THINK IT'S TIME THAT WE START  
25 MAKING SOME OF THE HARD DECISIONS, AND I WOULD THINK THAT'S



APRIL 12, 2023

1 OPERATORS WHO ARE PARTICIPATING, AT THIS POINT, ARE PROBABLY  
2 VERY MOTIVATED TO LOOK AT HOW WE NEED TO REORIENT OUR TRANSIT  
3 SYSTEM TO, A, SERVE EXISTING CUSTOMERS, PEOPLE WHO ARE TRANSIT  
4 DEPENDENT, AND REALLY LOOK AT HOW DO WE ATTRACT NEW RIDERS IF  
5 WE DON'T HAVE COMMUTERS ANYMORE. AND WHAT ARE THE ALTERNATIVES  
6 TO GET PEOPLE TO USE TRANSIT. AND EVERYTHING THAT YOU READ IS  
7 FREQUENCY, FREQUENCY. YOU'RE COMPETING AGAINST, YOU KNOW,  
8 WHETHER YOU TAKE TRANSIT OR DRIVE. AND IF IT'S NOT FREQUENT  
9 AND IT'S NOT CONVENIENT, YOU'RE NOT GOING TO ATTRACT NEW  
10 RIDERS. SO, I THINK THAT THAT'S -- NEEDS TO START RISING TO  
11 THE TOP WHEN WE START TALKING ABOUT T-TAPS. LOOKING AT  
12 SHIFTING SOME OF THE FUNDING. I LIKE THE IDEA OF A SHIFTING  
13 STATE HIGHWAY FUNDING, AS LONG AS IT'S HIGHWAYS. SOME OF THAT  
14 HIGHWAY FUNDING ALSO GOES FOR BICYCLE AND PED. AND I WANT TO  
15 MAKE SURE THAT NOTHING IS BEING TAKEN AWAY FROM THE BICYCLE  
16 PED BECAUSE THAT'S INTEGRAL TO THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. I WANT TO  
17 PUT AN EXCLAMATION POINT ON SHIFTING AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE TO  
18 OPERATING SYSTEMS. EVEN AS AN ENVIRONMENTAL ADVOCATE WHO WANTS  
19 TO SEE US, YOU KNOW, HAVE A CLEAN BUS FLEET, I ALSO WANT TO  
20 HAVE PEOPLE TO PUT IN THOSE BUSES AND IF WE HAVE TO HAVE AN  
21 OFF YEAR IN ORDER TO MAKE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM WORK I'M PROBABLY  
22 ONE OF THE FEW ENVIRONMENTAL KIDS WHO WOULD ACTUALLY SUPPORT  
23 THAT. THANK YOU.  
24



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. GENAY DID YOU HAVE QUESTIONS?  
2 MICHAEL?

3

4 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU REBECCA. A COUPLE OF THINGS COME TO  
5 MIND, PARTICULARLY WHAT MY COLLEAGUE HAS MENTIONED BEFORE, BUT  
6 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR PREMIER MENTIONED BLOOD DRIVE, SHORT OF  
7 THAT, FUNDING AS A STREAM, HAVE WE LOOKED UP, OR IN THIS  
8 COLLABORATION PROCESS, HAVE WE LOOKED AT WHAT SMART IS DOING  
9 CORRECTLY, WHAT MARIN TRANSIT IS DOING CORRECTLY AND LEARN  
10 FROM THAT? ALSO W THAT IS THERE A ROLL UP PLAN? THAT THIS IS  
11 HOW WE OPERATE IF THESE FUNDS DON'T MIRACULOUSLY MATERIALIZE?  
12 AND I THINK THAT TAP HAS TO HAVE -- AS A TACTIC PERHAPS, BUT  
13 SAFETY AS A COMMON THREAD THROUGH ALL OF THOSE CATEGORIES TO  
14 MEET THIS. SO, YOU KNOW, WITH THE CONNECTIVITY AND EQUITY  
15 LENS, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME, SORT OF, ROLL UP PLAN IF THESE  
16 DON'T WORK OUT. AND SOME, SORT OF, RUBRIC TO OVERLAY TO MEET  
17 THAT ENDS OF MAINTAINING THE CONNECTIVITY ON THE SYSTEM FOR  
18 THE REGION. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. DWAYNE? NO. GABRIELA? GAB

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I WAS WONDERING IF THIS IMPACTS THE STRATEGY AROUND  
23 THE HOUSING MEASURE THAT WE HAVE TALK ABOUT IN THE PAST?

24

25 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT SEEMS LIKE A QUESTION THROUGH THE CHAIR.





APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD.

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. THANK YOU FOR THAT. THIS HAS DEFINITELY  
5 COME UP IN CONVERSATIONS IN SACRAMENTO, AS WELL. SO, THE  
6 BEHAVIOR HOUSING FINISH AUTHORITY, RIGHT, WHICH HAS THE SAME  
7 BOARD AS MTC AND ABAG HAVE BOTH DIRECTED STAFF TO PROCEED FOR  
8 A 2024 MEASURE FOR HOUSING. YOU KNOW, WE ALSO HAVE BEEN  
9 DIRECTED TO START WORKING ON THE ENABLING LEGISLATION TO PUT A  
10 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ON THE BALLOT, BUT WE DON'T HAVE THAT  
11 TODAY. RIGHT? AND SO IN ORDER TO PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT  
12 WE HAVE TO GO TO SACRAMENTO AND RUN A BILL. SO WE PLAN TO DO  
13 THAT NEXT YEAR, BUT THAT DOESN'T CREATE AN OPPORTUNITY TO PUT  
14 A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT NEXT YEAR. WE ALSO DO THINK THAT WE'LL  
15 BE MOST SUCCESSFUL WITH VOTERS SINCE IT'S A CHALLENGING TWO  
16 THIRD'S VOTE IF WE CAN'T DEMONSTRATE SOME OF THE PROGRESS WE  
17 HAVE MADE ON THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WHICH COUNCIL  
18 MEMBER KALLINS NOTED HAS BEEN, YOU KNOW, NOT VERY FAST. AND SO  
19 HAVING A LITTLE BIT MORE TIME TO BE ABLE TO POINT TO THOSE  
20 SUCCESSES AND THAT PROGRESS, WE THINK WE'LL JUST CREATE MORE  
21 FAITH AMONG THE VOTERS THAT THIS IS WORTH TAXING THEMSELVES TO  
22 PROVIDE ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. THAT'S ALL TO SAY THAT  
23 THE CURRENT PLAN IS TO PUT A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ON THE  
24 BALLOT IN 2026, BUT WE ARE DOING SOME POLLING, JUST TO GAUGE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 WHERE THE VOTERS ARE AND SHOULD BE RELEASING THAT WITHIN THE  
2 NEXT COUPLE OF WEEKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. HOWARD?

5

6 **HOWARD WONG:** I THINK THIS IS A VERY GOOD OPPORTUNITY FOR MTC  
7 TO REALLY EXPERT ITS REGIONAL PLANNING ROLE. THE -- IF I WERE  
8 IN STATE OR FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, I WOULD BE ASKING, WELL, IF WE  
9 FILL THIS FUNDING NEED, IS OWN THEM A CONTINUING NEED? IS IT -  
10 - IS THE FUNDING THAT WE'RE GIVING YOU AN INVESTMENT IN A WAY  
11 THAT WOULD CREATE OR START THE PATH TOWARD A MORE SUSTAINABLE  
12 FUNDING MECHANISM? IS THERE A -- IS THE MTC REALLY STUDYING  
13 HOW COMMUTE TRAVEL WORK PATTERNS ARE CHANGING IN OUR SOCIETY?  
14 AND I THINK WE ARE ALL STARTING TO RECOGNIZE THAT WORK AT HOME  
15 IS A PERMANENT CHANGE IN OUR WORK SITUATIONS. COMMUTE PATTERNS  
16 WILL BE CHANGING. OFFICE VACANCIES, DEFINITELY, WILL PROBABLY  
17 BE, YOU KNOW, CONTINUING. WE ARE SEEING TRENDS TOWARD FOUR DAY  
18 WORK WEEKS, EVEN MORE WORKING AT HOME, WORKING IN  
19 NEIGHBORHOODS, RATHER THAN IN CENTRAL CORES. WE ARE SEEING  
20 ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE CREATING NEW WORK APPLICATIONS THAT  
21 MAY ENCOURAGE EVEN MORE WORKING AT HOME, OR WORKING REMOTELY.  
22 PEOPLE ARE STARTING TO MOVE TO FOREIGN COUNTRIES TO WORK.  
23 [LAUGHTER] IT'S VERY INTERESTING, NEW LIFESTYLE THAT'S BEING  
24 CREATED. SO, MTC HAS TO TAKE A REALLY DATA-DRIVEN LOOK AT  
25 WHERE TRAVEL PATTERNS ARE GOING, AND WHERE JUST FILLING A GAP



APRIL 12, 2023

1 FOR THE NEXT TWO OR FIVE YEARS ISN'T SUSTAINABLE, BECAUSE IT  
2 DOES SEEM TO REQUIRE A WHOLE NEW LOOK AT TRANSIT WORK AND  
3 OTHER PATTERNS. SO THERE ARE TRENDS THAT I WOULD SEE ONE WOULD  
4 START EMPHASIZING. AND I AGREE THAT THE FIRST, THE INTEGRATION  
5 OF REGIONAL TRANSIT AGENCIES IS VERY, VERY IMPORTANT. THE COST  
6 EFFICIENCIES, THE CREATION OF COORDINATED TRANSIT, ELIMINATING  
7 OVERLAPPING LINES, EASE OF MOVEMENT THROUGH ALL MODES OF  
8 TRANSIT, SHARING RESOURCES, COMBINING PURCHASING PERSON  
9 PERSONNEL, ALL OF THOSE THINGS WOULD BE HUGE COST SAVINGS AND  
10 EFFICIENCIES. THE SECOND THING I THINK ONE COULD DO TO KIND OF  
11 CREATE CREDIBILITY, AND WHAT EVERYONE DOES IS TO TAKE A LOOK  
12 AT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AROUND THE WORLD AND HOW THEY'RE  
13 FUNDED. RECENTLY THERE WAS A POLL, A SURVEY THAT LISTED THE  
14 TOP TRANSIT CITIES IN THE WORLD AND THEY DID IT IN KIND OF AN  
15 UNUSUAL WAY. THEY DIDN'T LOOK AT DATA. THEY ASKED THE RIDERS  
16 OF ALL THE CITIES AND THEY ASKED ARE YOU HAPPY WITH YOUR  
17 TRANSIT. AND SO THE TOP, THE PEOPLE -- CITIES WITH 70%, OR 80%  
18 FAVORABLE, YOU KNOW, POLL RESULTS ROSE TO THE TOP. SO THE  
19 CITIES LIKE BERLIN WAS NUMBER ONE, AND TOKYO, OR SHANGHAI. SO  
20 CITIES WERE RANKED BY CUSTOMER SATISFACTION. SO, I THINK THOSE  
21 CITIES, IF YOU WERE TO LOOK AT THEM ON, THEY PROBABLY ALL HAVE  
22 A REGIONAL INTEGRATED TRANSIT. SO, I THINK ONE SHOULD START  
23 TAKING A POLL LIKE THAT, SURVEY LIKE THAT. TAKE THOSE TOP  
24 CITIES. LOOK AT THEIR FUNDING AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES, AND



APRIL 12, 2023

1 USE THAT AS AN ARGUMENT FOR HOW WE SHOULD IMPLEMENT OUR OWN  
2 REGIONAL NETWORK. SO, THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ADINA?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S SEE. SO, THE PRESENTATION  
7 MENTIONED SOME HEARINGS. WHAT ARE SOME OF THE NEXT ON HEARINGS  
8 UP IN SACRAMENTO?

9

10 **REBECCA LONG:** ONE OF THOSE, COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN IS AT THE  
11 SENATE SUBCOMMITTEE NUMBER TWO, I BELIEVE, IS TOMORROW THAT  
12 DEALS WITH CAP-AND-TRADE. THAT'S THE ONLY OTHER IMMEDIATELY  
13 ONE I'M AWARE OF.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO IN TERMS OF THE TRANSIT NETWORK AND THE NEED  
16 TO BASICALLY RECONFIGURE SERVICE AS TO HOW PEOPLE ARE  
17 TRAVELING. SO, ONE LITTLE SHIM OF A COMMENT IS THAT IT'S NOT  
18 LIKE COMMUTING HAS GONE TO ZERO, BUT COMMUTING IT TO THE  
19 CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT IS LESS, BUT COMMUTING HAS ALWAYS  
20 BEEN MINORITY OF TRIPS, BUT IT WAS ALSO HISTORICALLY TRUE THAT  
21 THE SERVICE PATTERN HAD -- WITH IT -- I'LL MAKE THIS -- AS AN  
22 OPINION STATEMENT, HAD OVERSERVED THE WHITE COLLAR COMMUNITY  
23 AND HAD RELATIVELY UNDERSERVED SOME OTHER TRAVEL NEEDS. SO,  
24 ONE OF THE NEEDS IS TO ADAPT TO HOW PEOPLE ARE TRAVELING NOW,  
25 INCLUDING SOME TRAVEL PATTERNS THAT HAD BEEN UNDERSERVED IN



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THE PAST. AND THIS LEADS ME TO A QUESTION THAT I WILL ALSO  
2 WANT TO BE, YOU KNOW, TAKING UP AT THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
3 PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE AND POTENTIAL PREVIEW WITH STAFF IS, IT'S  
4 REALLY GOOD THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN  
5 AS PART OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, AS PART OF PLANNED  
6 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. SO, THE GOOD NEWS IS THAT ALIGNS OUR  
7 POTENTIAL LONG-TERM INVESTMENTS WITH A FOCUS, INCLUDING  
8 OPERATIONS, WHICH DIDN'T DO REALLY SO MUCH BEFORE, AND MAKING  
9 SURE THAT THE CAPITAL INVESTMENTS ARE ALIGNED WITH THE SERVICE  
10 NEEDS. BUT WHAT IT'S NOT CLEAR ABOUT, THAT THAT WOULD DO,  
11 WOULD BE TO ALSO TO HELP AGENCIES BEING NIMBLE IN TERMS OF  
12 ADJUSTING SERVICE PATTERN, GOT ONLY AGENCY BY AGENCY, BUT  
13 ADJUSTING SERVICE PATTERN IN TERMS OF TRAVEL PATTERNS ACROSS  
14 AGENCIES AND THAT IS A SHORT-TERM NEED NOT JUST A LONG-TERM  
15 NEED, SO WANT TO BE TAKING UP THAT TOPIC IN -- BECAUSE THE  
16 LEGISLATORS ARE SAYING HEY WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IF WE  
17 PROVIDE FUNDING, THE SYSTEM IS ADAPTING IS AND THAT'S ONE WAY  
18 THAT WE'RE WORKING ON ADAPTING, BUT ARE WE ADAPTING FAST  
19 ENOUGH? SO ON THE TOPIC OF EFFICIENCY THAT'S BEEN RAISED BY  
20 SEVERAL DIFFERENT COUNCIL MEMBERS, THE -- LIKE, WATCHING  
21 CALTRAIN'S BOARD BUDGET WORKSHOP LAST WEEK, CINDY CHAVEZ, WHO  
22 IS, OBVIOUSLY, ON THE CALTRAIN BOARD, SANTA CLARA COUNTIES  
23 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, AND THE MTC HAD MENTIONED THAT ONE OF  
24 CALTRAIN'S NEED, WHEN THEY GO ELECTRIC, IS GOING TO HAVE  
25 PEOPLE MAINTAINING THE ELECTRIC POLES AND WIRES GOING FORWARD.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 AND THIS IS OTHERS AGENCIES THAT ALREADY DO THAT. SO ARE THERE  
2 WAYS TO HAVE A CONSOLIDATED STAFFING TO DO THAT KIND OF  
3 SPECIALIZED SKILL, LIKE, WHERE ARE THOSE OPPORTUNITIES FOR  
4 CONSOLIDATED FUNCTIONS. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY A LOT OF -- THAT'S  
5 AN UNEMPLOYMENT CONVERSATION IN, POSSIBLY, SOME WAYS. BUT  
6 WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE THINGS TO BE LOOKED AT IN TERMS OF THE  
7 NEED FOR EFFICIENCY GOING FORWARD. ONE THING IN TERMS OF  
8 SETTING UP TRANSIT FOR FUNDING IN THE LONG-TERM, I THINK, YOU  
9 KNOW, DOING A REGIONAL MEASURE IS A GOOD AND IMPORTANT THING.  
10 THIS IS ALSO CONSIDERATIONS BEING DONE AT THE STATE LEVEL  
11 WHERE THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA HAS HISTORICALLY FUNDING MORE  
12 CAPITAL AND LESS OPERATIONS, SPURS SOME INTERESTING RESEARCH  
13 SHOWING THAT THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA ACTUALLY UNDERFUNDS  
14 OPERATIONS COMPARED TO OTHER REGIONS IN THE U.S. THAT HAVE  
15 MORE RIDERSHIP. THERE IS A BILL THAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER FRIEDMAN  
16 IS BRINGING FORWARD THAT'S LOOKING AT THE LONGER TERM  
17 OPERATING FUNDING AND ACCOUNTABILITY OF TRANSIT. SO WOULD  
18 WELCOME A RESPONSE AT THE END ABOUT WHETHER MTC IS CONSIDERING  
19 SUPPORT FOR THAT LEGISLATION. A COUPLE MORE THINGS AND  
20 COMMENTS ON FUNDING SOURCES. IN TERMS OF HOMELESSNESS AND  
21 PEOPLE HAVE NOWHERE TO LIVE, VERY SADLY LIVING ON BUSES AND  
22 TRAINS IN STATIONS. LIKE, THE -- THAT IS A CHALLENGE, AND THE  
23 FUNDING -- THE SOCIAL SERVICE FUNDING GOES TO COUNTIES. IT  
24 DOESN'T GO TO TRANSIT AGENCIES AND TRANSIT AGENCIES DON'T HAVE  
25 SOCIAL SERVICE FUNCTIONS SO WELCOME A RESPONSE ON WHAT'S BEING



APRIL 12, 2023

1 DONE TO PAIR UP THE AGENCIES WITH THE FUNDING AND -- AND WHERE  
2 SOME OF THE NEED IS LOCATED IN TERMS OF POTENTIALLY DEFERRING  
3 THE 0-EMISSIONS BUSES IN ORDER MAKE SURE THE BUS RUNS. I'M  
4 SURE -- LIKE, ENVIRONMENTALISTS WHO WANT TO REDUCE EMISSIONS  
5 DON'T WANT TO HAVE A BEAUTIFUL BUS MUSEUM WITH A BEAUTIFUL  
6 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS THAT NEVER RUNS. SO, I THINK THAT SEEMS  
7 LIKE A POTENTIALLY REASONABLE THING TO DO. OKAY. AS FOR THE  
8 FUNDING SOURCES. THERE ARE ALL KINDS OF CHALLENGING CHOICES,  
9 USING SOME OF THE HIGHWAY FUNDING ESPECIALLY SINCE THE OVERALL  
10 NUMBER IS GOING UP. AND SO SHIFTING SOME OF THAT MONEY WILL  
11 RESULT IN LESS HIGHWAY FUNDING. IT WILL RESULT IN A, YOU KNOW,  
12 SOMEWHAT SMALLER DECREASE IT SEEMED LIKE THAT WAS A VERY GOOD  
13 IDEA. SHIFTING SOME OF THE CAP-AND-TRADE FUNDING UNALLOCATED  
14 THAT HAS HISTORICALLY GONE TO ELECTRIC VEHICLES, ELECTRIC  
15 VEHICLES ARE GOOD, BUT THE STATE'S DATA SHOWS THAT WE CAN'T  
16 GET TO EMISSIONS GOALS AND CARBON VEHICLES ONLY WITH ELECTRIC  
17 VEHICLES AND WE NEED TO HAVE A SOLID PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
18 SYSTEM. AND THERE IS PLENTY OF FEDERAL FUNDING GOING TO  
19 SUPPORT ELECTRIC VEHICLES AS WELL. SO I HOPE THAT FOR WHOM  
20 THAT IS A DIFFICULT CHOICE THAT WE CONSIDER THAT AMONGST THE  
21 CHOICES. LET ME SEE. WHAT ELSE? DO I HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO SAY  
22 ABOUT THAT? I THINK THAT IS ABOUT IT. THANKS. AND ANY OF THE  
23 RESPONSES TO THE A.B. 761 AND HELPING ADDRESS THE PROBLEMS OF  
24 HOMELESS PEOPLE WHO HAVE, UNFORTUNATELY, NO PLACE ELSE TO  
25 LIVE, BUT ON BUSES AND TRAINS.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN. ON A.B. 761 WE  
3 DON'T HAVE IT ON THE LEG COMMITTEE AGENDA FOR THIS WEEK. BUT  
4 WE ARE CONSIDERING PUTTING IT ON IN MAY. AND JUST LISTENING TO  
5 YOU NOW YOU KNOW, MAYBE WE EVEN CONSIDER IT TO INCORPORATING  
6 IN THE APRIL COMMISSION ITEM IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ALWAYS  
7 HAVING THE RECOMMENDATION ON THE FUNDING SOURCES COULD BE GOOD  
8 TIMING TO DO THAT. FUNDING FOR TO ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS ON  
9 TRANSIT WE REALLY HAVEN'T DELVED INTO THAT ISSUE, IT'S  
10 SOMETHING THAT BART AND LA METRO HAVE OVER THE YEARS MADE THE  
11 CASE THAT THEY WANT TO BE ABLE TO RECEIVE HOMELESSNESS RELATED  
12 FUNDING DIRECTLY TO LEGISLATURE SEEMS QUITE SKEPTICAL CLEARLY  
13 THEY'RE NOT EXPERTS AND YOU KNOW ANYTHING RELATED TO  
14 HOMELESSNESS AND THE SAME I THINK IT'S BEEN CHALLENGING FOR  
15 TRANSIT AGENCIES TO GET SOCIAL AGENCIES AND NON-PROFIT  
16 PROVIDERS AND THOSE WHO DO HAVE THAT EXPERTISE TO COME INTO  
17 THEIR SYSTEMS AND PROVIDE SUPPORT SO I THINK IT'S A DIFFICULT  
18 ISSUE I SEE IT STANDING KIND OF SEPARATE AS A VERY IMPORTANT  
19 TOPIC THAT SHOULD BE ADDRESSED BUT IT'S SEPARATE FROM THE  
20 IMMEDIATE, SORT OF, FISCAL CLIFF AND TRANSPORTATION FUNDING  
21 ASK.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** AND I'M WONDERING WHETHER GIVEN MTC'S REGIONAL  
24 FOOTPRINT, WHETHER IT MIGHT BE POSSIBLE TO USE SOME  
25 COMBINATION -- LIKE MAYBE IT'S MORAL AUTHORITY BUT TO DO SOME





APRIL 12, 2023

1 CONVENING AROUND THAT, BECAUSE I'M SEEING A BUNCH OF THAT AND  
2 SO HAVING REGIONAL ENTITY SAYING OKAY LET US IN A ROOM AND  
3 TALK ABOUT HOW TO DO THIS IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL WITH A REGIONAL  
4 BODY AND I ALSO THINK THAT I DO HAVE SOME THINGS TO SHARE IN  
5 TERMS OF WAYS THAT SOME OF OUR COMMUNITY GROUPS CAN GET  
6 INVOLVED IN THE CAMPAIGN BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I DO  
7 WITH TRANSIT ADVOCACY HAT I'M GOING BRING THAT UP AT THE END  
8 OF THE MEETING IN THE MEMBER SECTION WITH THINGS THAT PEOPLE'S  
9 LOCAL COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS CAN DO.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. RODNEY?

12

13 **RODNEY NICKENS:** PERFORM TIMING. THIS PRESENTATION WAS SUPER  
14 INFORMATIVE AND COMPREHENSIVE AND THOUGHTFUL I WANT TO THANK  
15 YOU AND YOUR STAFF FOR THE WORK ON THIS EFFORT AND PUTTING  
16 TOGETHER THIS IMPRESSIVE COALITION. THIS IS A CRITICAL ISSUE  
17 TO OUR REGION AND OUR STATE. UNFORTUNATELY I DON'T THINK OUR  
18 ELECTED LEADERS ARE TAKING THIS AS SERIOUSLY AS THEY SHOULD. I  
19 WANT TO ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH THE COMMENTS OF LEVIN AND WONG,  
20 ABOUT THE FUTURE OF OUR REGION AS WE'RE THINKING ABOUT PLANNED  
21 BAY AREA ADDRESSING CLIMATE GOALS ADDRESSING HOUSING GOALS  
22 REALLY LOOKING TO THE FUTURE ABOUT HOW WE THINK ABOUT A  
23 DIFFERENT WAY OF LIVING FOR OUR REGION. BECAUSE THE PANDEMIC  
24 UPENDED SO MUCH OF WHAT WE THINK WAS NORMAL AND WHAT WE  
25 THOUGHT WAS THE STATUS QUO BUT WE ALSO KNOW WASN'T WORKING.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 SO, I THINK -- I REALLY APPRECIATED MISS LEVIN'S COMMENT ABOUT  
2 THINKING COMPREHENSIVELY ABOUT NOT ONLY IMPROVING EXPERIENCE  
3 OF TRANSIT FOR COMMUTERS AND RIDERS BUT ALSO THINKING ABOUT  
4 PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS WHO TRADITIONALLY DON'T TALK TO EACH  
5 OTHER PUBLIC SAFETY STAKEHOLDERS, HOUSING AND HOMELESS SERVICE  
6 PROVIDERS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING STAKEHOLDERS I THINK IT'S GOING  
7 TO TAKE AN ALL HANDS APPROACH TO ADDRESSING THESE ISSUES  
8 COMPREHENSIVELY HOLISTICALLY AND IMPROVING OUR COMMUNITIES AND  
9 IMPROVING THE WELL-BEING OF OUR NEIGHBORS ARE IN ORDER TO PUT  
10 A PATH AND VISION FORWARD THAT WILL MAKE THE REGION A SAFE AND  
11 EQUITABLE PLACE FOR US ALL TO LIVE AND CALL HOME. I WANT TO  
12 QUICKLY MENTION THAT I THINK THE PIECE ABOUT THE CONSOLIDATION  
13 AND EFFICIENCY PIECE IS DEFINITELY SOMETHING THAT I WANT TO  
14 ENCOURAGE FURTHER RESEARCH INTO. I THINK THERE IS A LOT OF  
15 WASTE AND INEFFICIENCY IN A LOT OF OUR SYSTEMS AND IN A LOT OF  
16 OUR PROCESSES AND I THINK THAT'S ANOTHER ISSUE, I THINK OUR  
17 STATE LEADERS, ESPECIALLY, YOU COULD TAKE MORE SERIOUSLY,  
18 THERE HAS BEEN OBVIOUSLY A LOT OF CORRUPTION, A LOT OF MISUSE  
19 OF PUBLIC FUNDS. SO I THINK WHILE I PERSONALLY AM AN ADVOCATE  
20 OF PUBLIC TRANSIT, AND WE NEED PUBLIC TRANSIT, AND A THRIVING  
21 PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM THERE ARE WAYS TO IMPROVES FORE AND  
22 IMPROVE USE OF FUNDS AND TO ENSURE TAXPAYER DOLLARS AREN'T  
23 WASTED AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT ISSUE THAT NEEDS TO BE  
24 CONSIDERED. THANK YOU.

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE TO  
2 TALK THIS CLOSE TO THE MIC. PUT IT ALMOST DOWN YOUR THROAT, OR  
3 AT LEAST CLOSE TO YOUR TEETH, BECAUSE THEY'RE HAVING TROUBLE -  
4 - IT'S NOT GOING TO COME THROUGH AS WE RUN THE TAKE PLACE ON  
5 IT. SO, WITH THAT, TERRY.

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. REGARDING THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF  
8 THAT WE'RE APPROACHING, I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR MORE FROM STAFF  
9 ABOUT THE CONNECTIVITY WITH TRANSIT SYSTEMS WITH THE  
10 DEVELOPMENT OF LOW-INCOME AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. MUCH OF THE  
11 NEW HOUSING NEEDS TO BE PROVIDED NEAR TRANSIT CENTERS, AND  
12 THAT'S -- I BELIEVE THAT'S WHERE MOST OF IT IS PROPOSED. BUT,  
13 I ALSO AM AWARE THAT NEW RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT FOR, FRANKLY,  
14 FOR RELATIVELY AFFORDABLE UNITS OF CONDOMINIUMS AND APARTMENTS  
15 AND SO FORTH, DEVELOPMENT, IS AVERAGING ABOUT \$875,000 PER  
16 UNIT. WHICH IS CONSIDERABLY HIGHER THAN IT HAS BEEN IN THE  
17 RECENT PAST. SINGLE-FAMILY DEVELOPMENT, I KNOW IS COSTING AT  
18 OR IN EXCESS OF \$1,000 A SQUARE FOOT THESE ARE NUMBERS THAT WE  
19 HAVE NOT FACED IN THE BAY AREA IN PREVIOUS GENERATIONS, AND I  
20 THINK THIS'S WHY WE'RE TALKING ABOUT 8, 10, 11 STORY BUILDINGS  
21 CLOSE BY TRANSIT HUBS. AND THAT SEEMS TO BE A NECESSITY GOING  
22 FORWARD. BUT -- AND IT PUTS A LOT OF PRESSURE ON THE LARGER  
23 CITIES WHO HAVE THE HIGHER, YOU KNOW, THE HIGHER NUMBER OF  
24 RESIDENTS, AS WELL AS THOSE LARGER TRANSIT SYSTEMS. AND COMING  
25 FROM AN OUTLYING COUNTY, VIRTUALLY EVERY COUNTY OF THE NINE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 BAY AREA COUNTIES, EXCEPT MINE, NAPA, HAVE MORE PEOPLE IN A  
2 SINGLE CITY OR TOWN THAN WE HAVE IN OUR ENTIRE COUNTY. WE'RE  
3 TALKING ABOUT 138,000 RESIDENTS COUNTY-WIDE. AND IT'S -- WE'RE  
4 EVEN SLIGHTLY MORE RURAL THAN SONOMA COUNTY, WHICH WOULD BE  
5 THE CLOSEST TO US. AND, ANYHOW, THOSE NUMBERS ARE PRETTY  
6 STRIKING. AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, DO WE HAVE A -- AN  
7 APPROACH, OR A PROPOSED PLAN TO ADDRESS THAT KIND OF  
8 DEVELOPMENT AND HOW MUCH DO WE NEED TO IMPROVE THE LOCAL  
9 TRANSIT SYSTEMS TO HANDLE IT ONCE IT IS UP AND RUNNING. THANK  
10 YOU.

11

12 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COUNCIL MEMBER, SCOTT. SO, JUST IN  
13 TERMS OF THE, YOU KNOW, NEED FOR ADDITIONAL HOUSING, OBVIOUSLY  
14 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT MTC AND ABAG HAVE BEEN VERY OUTSPOKEN ON  
15 THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND THEN THE RECENT ABAG, RHNA  
16 ALLOCATION THAT'S BEEN APPROVED, CLEARLY PUTS THE MAJORITY OF  
17 NEW UNITS, YOU KNOW, SITES THEM, AS FAR AS WHAT LOCAL  
18 JURISDICTIONS NEED TO DO WITH THEIR PLANNING PROCESS AND  
19 ZONING IN THOSE AREAS THAT HAVE THE MOST ROBUST TRANSIT, YOU  
20 KNOW, SO AS YOU MENTIONED YOU KNOW, IN THE LARGEST CITIES  
21 THEY'RE GOING TO BE TAKING ON THE DISPROPORTIONATE SHARE OF  
22 NEW HOUSING. ON THE QUESTION HOW ARE WE THINKING ABOUT  
23 IMPROVING TRANSIT IN THOSE AREAS THAT ARE TAKING MORE OF THE  
24 GROWTH I MEAN QUITE HONESTLY WE'RE TRYING TO HOLD ON RIGHT NOW  
25 TO THE SYSTEM WE HAVE SO WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT MAKING



APRIL 12, 2023

1 IMPROVEMENTS RIGHT NOW TO TRANSIT WE ARE EXTENSION, SORT OF,  
2 SITUATION RIGHT NOW WE'RE WE REALLY COULD BE LOSING THE MOST  
3 ROBUST SYSTEMS WE HAVE PARTICULARLY BART MUNI IT'S SOME ASSIST  
4 SMALLER BUS OPERATORS AS BAD SHAPE AS THESE LARGER SYSTEMS,  
5 WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING THE TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY KIND OF  
6 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN THERE, WHAT IS THE OPTIMAL TRANSIT  
7 SYSTEM WE HAVE REGION-WIDE AND WHAT IS THE BAY AREA MINIMUM  
8 YOU KNOW, ASPIRATIONAL VERSIONS OF THAT SO PROBABLY WE'RE KIND  
9 OF WORK HAPPENS IN THE SPACE LIKE ADVOCACY LOOKING FOR FUNDING  
10 RIGHT NOW WE'RE REALLY PLAYING DEFENSE MORE SO THAN OFFENSE.

11

12 **TERRY SCOTT:** I SEE THE DOWNTOWN CITY BUSES IN THE CITY OF NAPA  
13 40 PASSENGER BUSES WITH WITHIN OR TWO PEOPLE ON THEM SO HAS  
14 THERE BEEN A STUDY AS TO THE POSSIBILITY OF USING A DIFFERENT  
15 FORM OF TRANSIT, A SHUTTLE BUS OR SMALLER VEHICLES THAT DON'T  
16 COST AS MUCH TO OPERATE. AND PARTICULAR HE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT  
17 REPLACING ALL OF THE DIESEL FLEETS THAT EXIST OUT THERE, THE  
18 MAJORITY OF THEM ARE DIESEL FLEETS SO THAT NEEDS TO BE GIVEN  
19 CONSIDERATION GOING FORWARD IF WE'RE GOING TO HAVE AFFORDABLE  
20 OPERATING SYSTEMS FOR TRANSIT FOR MANY OF OUR COMMUNITIES NOT  
21 ALL OF THEM OF COURSE, AND THAT DOESN'T APPLY TO THE LARGER  
22 COUNTIES WITH THE LARGER CITIES IN IT. SO IT'S KIND OF A -- WE  
23 NEED A MULTI-PHASED APPROACH THAT DEALS WITH THE INDIVIDUAL  
24 SYSTEMS AND EXISTING HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION, PER COUNTY,  
25 WHICH IS VERY DIFFERENT. THANK YOU.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ZACK?

3

4 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, REBECCA FOR LEADING  
5 ON THIS ISSUE. CLOSE ENOUGH? [LAUGHTER] I JUST WANT TO  
6 REITERATE FOR THE RECORD HOW IMPORTANT TRANSIT IS TO OUR  
7 EQUITY AND CLIMATE GOALS P REBECCA, AS YOU CALLED OUT ON THE  
8 SLIDE, RIDERS ARE DISPROPORTIONATE LOW-INCOME AND PEOPLE OF  
9 COLOR EVEN MORE SO TODAY THAN PRECOVID AND IT PROVIDES VITAL  
10 SERVICE AND THANKFUL THAT MTC IS TAKING THIS ON THIS ISSUE AND  
11 UNDERSTANDING HOW IMPORTANT IT IS. IT IS INCREDIBLY DEPRESSING  
12 THAT WE'RE FIGHTING TOOTH AND NAIL TO HOLD ON TO THIS VITAL  
13 SERVICE. I THINK EVERYONE HERE REALLY BELIEVES THAT WE SHOULD  
14 HAVE A TRANSIT SERVICE THAT EVERYONE CAN RELY ON AND THAT WE  
15 ARE NOT DEPENDENT ON CARS. EVEN IN THE NORTH BAY, ESPECIALLY  
16 IN THE NORTH BAY. SO ON WHERE WE'RE AT TODAY IS VITALLY  
17 IMPORTANT. IT'S ALSO NOT WHERE WE NEED TO GO. IT'S IMPORTANT  
18 TO NAME THAT AS WE'RE PUSHING FOR ALL OF THESE REVENUE SOURCES  
19 IN THE 2026 MEASURE THAT WE FEED TO ASPIRATIONAL WHILE  
20 UNDERSTANDING WHERE THE REALITY IS RIGHT NOW. IN TERMS OF  
21 SPECIFIC KIND OF COMMENTS, I THINK THAT WHILE THE FIRST  
22 PRIORITY IS TO PREVENT SERVICE CUTS AND THE TRANSIT DEATH  
23 SPIRAL, I DO HOPE MTC CAN CONTINUE TO ADVOCATE FOR ADDITIONAL  
24 MONEY TO SUPPORT RIDERSHIP RECOVERY, PRIMARILY SAFETY AND  
25 ACCESS, AS MENTIONED IN THE TRANSPORTATION TRANSFORMATIVE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 ACTION PLAN. AND THEN THE SOURCES REALLY DO AGREE TO APPROACH  
2 TO KEEP EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE THIS IS MONEY WE'RE ASKING FOR  
3 BUT AS POSSIBLE TO PRIORITIZE REVENUE SOURCES THAT DON'T  
4 DETRACT FROM OTHER PROGRAMS. OBVIOUSLY I THINK STATE HIGHWAY  
5 MONEY THAT WOULD REDUCE MORE DRIVING POLLUTION EMISSIONS WOULD  
6 BE A GREAT PLACE TO REALLOCATE MONEY FOR. THANK YOU

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. PAM?

9

10 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. EXCELLENT PRESENTATION, AND THANK  
11 YOU TO REBECCA AND THE MTC STAFF WHO IS DOING AN INCREDIBLE  
12 JOB OF ADVOCATING AND MAKING US AWARE OF WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH  
13 THIS. I -- I'M CURIOUS TO KNOW, KNOWING THAT THERE IS A  
14 COALITION OF SUPPORT OF ADVOCATES FIGHTING FOR TRANSIT  
15 FUNDING, HOW CENTERED THE VOICES OF, AS ZACK MENTIONED, THE  
16 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OF COLOR WHO ARE -- HAVE BEEN RIDING TRANSIT  
17 SINCE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, DURING THE PANDEMIC AND NOW, AND SO  
18 MAKING SURE THEIR VOICES ARE CENTERED, THEIR EXPERIENCE IS  
19 CENTERED IN OUR RECOVERY AND WHAT SERVICES ARE GOING TO LOOK  
20 LIKE TO BEST SUIT THEM, I'M CURIOUS TO KNOW ON ONE OF THE  
21 PAGES, PAGE 11 OF THE TRANSIT PLANS, IT NOTES OPERATOR  
22 RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION AS BEING A SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE. SO  
23 I'M CURIOUS AS TO WHAT ATTENTION IS BEING BROUGHT TO THAT  
24 ISSUE AND WHETHER OR NOT THERE IS ANYTHING THAT MTC CAN DO TO  
25 ENSURE THAT MORE BIPOC COMMUNITIES ARE AWARE OF THESE JOBS,



APRIL 12, 2023

1 ARE EXCITED ABOUT THESE JOBS AND APPLYING TO THESE JOBS TO  
2 MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN HAVE, NOT JUST PEOPLE RIDING TRANSIT,  
3 BUT PEOPLE OPERATING TRANSIT, AS WELL. AND MY LAST NOTE IS ON  
4 THE FUNDING. I BELIEVE SOMEONE MENTIONED THIS AS WELL, IF ALL  
5 OF THE STATE FUNDING RECEIVED WHAT ARE THE PROGRESSIVE FISCAL  
6 SOLUTIONS THAT WE'RE LOOKING INTO WILL NOT ONLY STABILIZE BUT  
7 ALLOW SPACE TO IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSIT. WHEN I HAVE HAD  
8 OPPORTUNITY TO RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT AND SPEAK TO THE PEOPLE  
9 RIDING PUBLIC TRANSIT THEY ALWAYS HAVE SUGGESTIONS ON WHAT WE  
10 CAN DO TO IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THE TOUGH PART IS IT  
11 REQUIRES MONEY WHICH WE DON'T V AND SO MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE  
12 NOT JUST TRYING TO SURVIVE BUT REALLY THRIVE SHOULD BE THE  
13 PRINCIPLE OF OUR FUTURE FOR TRANSIT. AND A LOT OF THE  
14 SOLUTIONS THAT WERE PROVIDED RIGHT NOW, SO TO SPEAK IS ROB  
15 PETER TO PAY PAUL, AND SO IS THERE A WAY OF SUSTAINABLE  
16 FUNDING, WITH THE SOLUTIONS THAT WE HAVE PROVIDED RIGHT NOW, I  
17 THINK THE ONE THAT MAKES THE MOST SENSE TO ME IS SHIFTING  
18 HIGHWAY FUNDING TO TRANSIT. AND, SO, I WOULD SUPPORT THAT, AS  
19 WELL AS THE CAP-AND-TRADE FUNDING. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY, DID YOU HAVE ANY --

22

23 **JOHNNY PARKER:** I DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, JUST A COMMENT THAT  
24 THIS IS SOME INFORMATIVE INFORMATION, AND I AGREE WITH WHAT  
25 EVERYONE ELSE SAID, IN REGARDS TO THE POTENTIAL FUNDING THAT





APRIL 12, 2023

1 YOU HAVE SUGGESTED. THE THIRD OPTION THERE SEEMS TO BE MORE  
2 FORMATIVE FOR US AND FOR THE ENTIRE BAY AREA. SO MAKING SURE  
3 THAT WE KIND OF SHIFT SOME OF THE HIGHWAY FUNDING AROUND.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. GERRY?

6

7 **GERRY GLASER:** A FEW THINGS. I WANT TO COME BACK TO SLIDE  
8 NUMBER TEN EVENTUALLY. I DON'T UNDERSTAND THE GROWTH AND MAYBE  
9 YOU CAN EXPLAIN THAT TO US. BUT IN GENERAL, I HAVE TO AGREE  
10 WITH WHERE WENDI STARTED AND ADINA PICKED UP, HOWARD PICKED  
11 UP. I HAPPEN TO THINK THAT PART OF OUR JOB IS TO LOOK AT THE  
12 27 AGENCIES THAT WE HAVE AND FIND OUT HOW WE TAKE PURCHASING  
13 AND MAINTENANCE AND MARKETING AND ADMINISTRATION AND TRAINING  
14 AND COLLAPSE THOSE AND PITCH THAT TO THE STATE SAYING, THIS IS  
15 HOW WE CAN REDUCE AND IMPROVE OUR SERVICES AT THE SAME TIME. I  
16 ALSO THINK THAT A PITCH THAT TALKS ABOUT PERFORMANCE, FUND US  
17 BASED ON THE PERFORMANCE WE HAVE. OUR PERFORMANCE WE MEASURE  
18 BY THE RIDERSHIP THAT WE HAVE. AND THIS IS WHAT WE THINK THE  
19 NUMBERS SHOULD BE PER PERSON, AND NEXT YEAR WHEN WE COME TO  
20 YOU, AND WE HAVE IMPROVED OUR NUMBERS, THIS IS HOW MUCH MORE  
21 MONEY WE WANT TO SEE FROM YOU. IN GENERAL, WHERE I THINK THE  
22 MONEY SOME COME FROM IS OFF OF OUR HIGHWAYS, OFF OF THE CARS.  
23 I'M AN EV DRIVER. I HAVE BEEN DRIVING AN EV DRIVER SINCE '98.  
24 WE DON'T GIVE MONEY TO PEOPLE TO GET EV CARS. 27% OF NEW CAR  
25 SALES LAST YEAR IN THE BAY AREA ARE ELECTRIC VEHICLES THAT'S



APRIL 12, 2023

1 LIKELY TO HIT 40% THIS YEAR. I AGREE WITH BUSES AND OUR  
2 TRANSIT MOVING OFF OF DIESEL AND GOING ELECTRIC. THAT USED TO  
3 BE EXPENSIVE I USED TO MAKE ELECTRIC BUSES AND TRUCKS THEY  
4 WERE VERY EXPENSIVE THAT'S CHANGING BECAUSE THEY'RE BECOMING  
5 MORE COMMONPLACE JUST LIKE VEHICLES ARE. I WOULDN'T HAVE THAT  
6 ON THE PLATE NECESSARILY AS I WOULD TRY TO KEEP THAT IF  
7 POSSIBLE. ONE OF THE COMMENTS WENDI MADE I WOULD HAVE TO  
8 TOTALLY AGREE WITH. WE INCREASE OUR RIDERSHIP IF WE DECREASE  
9 OUR HEADWAY. BASICALLY, TODAY I CAME IN, I KEEP TRYING  
10 DIFFERENT TRANSIT. TODAY I USED CALTRAIN'S. I DON'T WANT TO  
11 TELL YOU HOW I GOT TO CALTRAIN'S, BECAUSE EVERYBODY WILL SAY  
12 WHAT THE HECK ARE YOU DOING. BUT THEN I WALKED FROM WHERE I  
13 LANDED AND THEN CAUGHT THE TRAIN. I HAD TO JOG. BECAUSE IF I  
14 DIDN'T JOG, IT WOULD TAKE ANOTHER HOUR BEFORE I CAUGHT THE  
15 TRAIN AT THE STATION THAT IS THERE. HAVING 27 TRANSIT  
16 DISTRICTS IS THE THING THAT'S CAUSING US A PROBLEM. THAT'S THE  
17 FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM THAT WE HAVE. THE DIFFICULT PART IS THIS,  
18 AND TERRY BROUGHT UP PART OF IT -- I LIVE IN SONOMA COUNTY. WE  
19 HAVE HALF A MILLION PEOPLE IN THE COUNTY OF SONOMA A WE HAVE A  
20 REALLY NICE TRAIN. I HAVE TAKEN THAT TRAIN. IT'S A GREAT  
21 TRAIN. HOW DO YOU GET TO IT? HOW DO YOU GET FROM IT TO SOME  
22 PLACE ELSE? IF I GO TO TAKE GOLDEN GATE I JUMP ON THE BUS.  
23 THEY'RE NOT IN THE SAME PLACE. WELL, WHY IS IT I DON'T HAVE A  
24 BUS THAT TAKES ME FROM WHEREVER I AM TO THE TRAIN THAT TAKES  
25 ME SOME PLACE. WHY DOESN'T THE SYSTEM WORK TOGETHER? AND



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THAT'S WHERE I THINK IT WAS RODNEY MADE THAT POINT. THE SYSTEM  
2 NEEDS TO WORK TOGETHER. WE DON'T HAVE A SYSTEM. MTC IS THE  
3 AGENCY THAT WE HAVE THAT CAN FORCE A SYSTEM TO BE CREATED, AND  
4 THAT'S WHY TAP IS NOT SOMETHING WE SHOULD BE DOING. IT'S  
5 SOMETHING WE SHOULD HAVE DONE. IT'S SOMETHING WE SHOULD BE  
6 DOING CONSTANTLY. AND GOING TO THE STATE AND SAYING WE HAVE  
7 GROWN UP IN THIS, WITH THESE MULTIPLE AGENCIES. WE WANT TO  
8 INCORPORATE ALL OF THEM. WE WANT TO INTEGRATE THEM AND WE WANT  
9 TO CHANGE FUNDAMENTALLY AND GET POEM TO GO FROM WHERE THEY ARE  
10 TO WHERE THEY WANT TO GO TO, WHICH MAY BE CHANGING, AND WE  
11 WANT TO DO THAT IN A HOLISTIC FASHION. BUT YOU NEED TO FUND  
12 THIS SO THAT WE CAN DO THAT. THAT'S WHAT OUR GOAL IS WE'RE NOT  
13 TRYING TO SUSTAIN WHAT WE'RE DOING. WE'RE TRYING TO TRANSFORM  
14 WHAT WE'RE DOING AND IF YOU CUT FUNDING THERE IS NO WAY THAT  
15 WE CAN BEGIN DOING THAT. AND NEXT YEAR WE'RE GOING TO ASK YOU  
16 FOR EVEN MORE BECAUSE. OF THE COST OF OPERATING IT THIS WAY.  
17 IT'S A HARD PUSH. BUT I WANT TO INCORPORATE -- THIS IS THE  
18 FIRST TIME I HAVE WAITED UNTIL THE END, THANKS FOR GOING THIS  
19 DIRECTION USUALLY I MAKE THE COMMENTS IN THE FROND AND I JUST  
20 REALIZED ALL OF US ARE THINKING ABOUT THINGS IN THE SAME WAY  
21 WE HAVE ONE PROBLEM AND RECOGNIZE WHAT THE PROBLEM IS SO LET'S  
22 DO SOMETHING ABOUT IT AND LET'S TELL THE STATE WE'RE GOING TO  
23 ON SOMETHING INTO IT AND YOU BETTER FUN US. SO WE CAN DO IT. I  
24 THINK THAT WAS ENOUGH. COULD YOU ANSWER SLIDE NUMBER TEN I  
25 DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY THE GROWTH AND GAP WHY THE OPERATIONAL



APRIL 12, 2023

1 COSTS ARE GOING UP BY THE WAY WE NEED CAPITAL FOR PROJECTS BUT  
2 WE NEED OPERATIONS TO THE HEADWAY CHANGES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS THANK YOU FOR  
5 PUTTING UP THE SLIDE ON THE SCREEN I ASSUME YOU'RE TALKING  
6 ABOUT THE 2023, 2024, TO 2025 ET CETERA, SO BASICALLY WHAT  
7 THAT SEW SHOWING IS THE SPEND DOWN OF THE COVID RELIEF FUNDING  
8 FROM OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** FRANK?

11

12 **FRANK WELTE:** ONCE AGAIN, BECAUSE OF ISSUES WITH BEING ABLE TO  
13 USE MY SCREEN READER TO READ THE DOCUMENT THERE ARE PIECES OF  
14 IT THAT I WAS NOT ABLE TO ACCESS ESPECIALLY WHEN IT CAME TO  
15 THE PART OF ALTERNATIVES IN TERMS OF LEGISLATIVE OPTIONS FOR  
16 US SO I'M NOT ABLE TO COMMENT ON THAT EXCEPT TO SAY THAT I  
17 AGREE WITH THOSE WHO SAY THE EMPHASIS NEEDS TO BE ON SHORT-  
18 TERM TO BE ON PROVIDING OPERATING FUNDS TO KEEP SERVICE AT  
19 REASONABLE LEVELS ONE OTHER OBSERVATION I WANT TO MAKE  
20 ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DRIVE MOSTLY IS THAT I WANT  
21 YOU ALL TO UNDERSTAND THAT WHEN A BUS ROUTE IS DROPPED BECAUSE  
22 LACK OF FUNDING IT'S THE MORAL EQUIVALENT OF BARRICADING A  
23 ROAD. IMAGINE IF YOUR CITY COUNCIL WAS A LITTLE SHORT ON ROAD  
24 MAINTENANCE FUNDS SO THEY DECIDED TO CLOSE THE ROAD INTO YOUR  
25 NEIGHBORHOOD BECAUSE THEY COULDN'T AFFORD TO FILL POT HOLES



APRIL 12, 2023

1 NEXT YEAR. WHAT WOULD THAT DO TO YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD? FOR THOSE  
2 OF US WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT WHEN A BUS ROUTE GOES AWAY  
3 IT'S THE EQUIVALENT OF BARRICADING A ROAD AND LOCKING US OUT  
4 OF THE SYSTEM SO THE HIGHEST PRIORITY BY FAR NEEDS TO BE  
5 MAINTAINING I BASIC SERVICE MAINTAINING RELIABLE SERVICE FOR  
6 THOSE OF US WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT BECAUSE WE BUILD OUR  
7 LIVES AROUND THAT AND WE DON'T HAVE OPTIONS TO JUST UP AND  
8 MOVE.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. VINAY, DO YOU HAVE ANY  
11 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS?

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YEAH. SO, IN TERMS OF WHERE THE MONEY SHOULD  
14 COME FROM, I WONDER HOW MUCH MONEY IS GOING INTO HIGH SPEED  
15 RAIL. BECAUSE I JUST FEEL LIKE THAT'S A HUMONGOUS WASTE OF  
16 MONEY. I DON'T THINK THAT GOING FROM HERE TO LA IN THREE HOURS  
17 DOESN'T SEEM LIKE A HIGH PRIORITY TO ME, OR THE NEED FOR  
18 PEOPLE TO COMMUTE FROM 200 MILES AWAY DOESN'T SEEM LIKE A VERY  
19 HIGH PRIORITY FOR ME EITHER. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW HOW MUCH  
20 MONEY GOES INTO THAT. THE OTHER THING IS, YEAH, I WOULD LIKE  
21 TO SEE THE WHOLE PERFORMANCE THING. LIKE, HOW DO YOU MEASURE  
22 PERFORMANCE. HOW CAN WE MAKE OUR CASE BASED ON PERFORMANCE.  
23 AND I ALSO WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE WHOLE T-TAP THING. AND OF  
24 COURSE WE CAN ALWAYS SAY WE HAVEN'T WASTED MUCH TIME WITH T-  
25 TAP, BECAUSE WE JUST SET IT UP IN SEPTEMBER, CHANGED THE NAME.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 BUT YEAH I THINK IT HAS BEEN TAKING TOO LONG. AND I WANT TO  
2 GIVE A SIMPLE EXAMPLE. A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO, DAVID MANTLE  
3 MADE A REALLY GOOD, I MEAN, I LIKE THE PRESENTATION A LOT  
4 ABOUT SETTING UP BEST PRACTICES, ET CETERA. AND THAT WOULD FIT  
5 INTO IT. TAP BUT I THINK THE WAY WE GO ABOUT IT IS, WELL,  
6 FIRST WE WANT TO DO ALL THE PLANNING BEFORE WE EVEN GET  
7 ANYTHING STARTED. SO, WHAT MY THING IS LET'S SAY WITH T-TAP,  
8 WE KNOW THERE ARE CERTAIN THINGS THAT WE ARE GOING TO DO. WHY  
9 NOT GET STARTED ON THEM BEFORE RATHER THAN JUST SAY, OH, WE  
10 WILL DO ALL THE REPORT, IT'S GOING TO TAKE FOURS YEARS, AND  
11 AFTER FOUR YEARS WE'RE GOING TO START TAKING IT THE FIRST  
12 STEP. IF YOU KNOW YOU ARE GOING TO DO SOMETHING WHY NOT TAKE  
13 THE FIRST STEP IN YEAR TWO INSTEAD OF WAITING AFTER YEAR FOUR.  
14 SO, I THINK THAT'S JUST A MANAGEMENT TYPE ISSUE. AND THEN ONE  
15 THING I JUST WANT TO -- THIS A BIT OUT OF LEFT FIELD, BUT, YOU  
16 KNOW, SINCE DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO RELATED THINGS ARE THE ONES  
17 THAT ARE DIFFICULT TO RECOVERY, I JUST WANT US TO THINK ABOUT  
18 THIS, TO WHAT EXTENT IS THIS FUNDING, IN EFFECT, A SUBSIDIZING  
19 OF A DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, AND SHOULD EVERYBODY ELSE BE  
20 DOING THAT SUBSIDIZING. AND, AGAIN, I'M NOT SAYING THAT IS THE  
21 ONLY WAY. OBVIOUSLY, OVER THE DECADES, BY BUILDING ALL THIS  
22 INFRASTRUCTURE, EVERYBODY HAS INVESTED A LOT OF RESOURCES INTO  
23 DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO AND THEY DON'T WANT TO SEE THOSE  
24 RESOURCES GO DOWN THE TUBES. HE DIDN'T WANT TO SEE THOSE  
25 INVESTMENTS GO DOWN TUBE, BUT IF THEY ARE GOING TO GO DOWN THE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 TUBES ANYWAY, WHY SHOULD DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO BE SUBSIDIZED  
2 BY EVERYBODY ELSE NOT SAYING WE SHOULDN'T SUPPORT BUT IF IT  
3 NEEDS TO COME TO THE FRONT.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** REBECCA DID YOU WANT TO ANSWER THE  
6 QUESTION ABOUT HIGH SPEED FUNDS?

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** APPROXIMATELY A BILLION DOLLARS A YEAR GOES FROM  
9 THE STATE'S CAP-AND-TRADE PROGRAM TO HIGH SPEED RAIL THAT'S IN  
10 STATUTE. AND MIRRORS STAFF IS NOT RECOMMENDING AT THIS TIME  
11 SHIFTING THAT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE SUPPORTED THE PROJECT, YOU  
12 KNOW, THE DELIVERY OF HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO THE BAY AREA IS  
13 REALLY CONNECTED TO A NUMBER OF OUR MAJOR PROJECTS OR I SHOULD  
14 SAY MEGA PROJECTS, INCLUDING THE PORTAL, THE CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN  
15 EXTENSION INTO THE SALESFORCE TRANSIT CENTER, THAT'S WHERE  
16 ALSO HIGH SPEED RAIL IS ENVISIONED TO COME, AS WELL AS DIRIDON  
17 STATION. SO, YEAH, THAT'S WHAT I'LL SAY ABOUT HIGH SPEED RAIL.  
18 AND I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS ABOUT SAN FRANCISCO IT'S JUST AN  
19 INTERESTING POINT AND HIGHLY ONE THAT WE'LL HEAR IN  
20 SACRAMENTO.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. KARIN A YOU ARE THE ONLY  
23 PERSON I HAVEN'T CALLED ON. DID YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR  
24 COMMENTS?

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CORINNE WINTERS:** ONE THING I WAS WONDERING IS, WHAT HAS BEEN  
2 THE ROLE OF ENGAGING WITH BUSINESSES? BECAUSE I KNOW SOME OF  
3 WHAT YOU MENTIONED AROUND FUNDING, SOME OF IT COMES FROM SALES  
4 TAX, AND YOU KNOW, THERE IS AN INCENTIVE FOR BUSINESSES TO  
5 PROMOTE THEMSELVES SO THAT PEOPLE CAN TAKE TRANSIT TO GO  
6 PATRONIZE BUSINESSES. SO I WAS JUST WONDERING WHAT THEIR ROLE  
7 HAS BEEN IN THE COALITION WORK. YOU ALSO MENTIONED IN MAY THAT  
8 THERE WOULD BE A THIRD COALITION MEETING OR THIRD COALITION  
9 LETTER AND I WAS JUST WONDERING WHAT THAT WOULD BE ABOUT.

10

11 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE QUESTIONS. SO, THERE, A  
12 BACKBONE COMMITTEE, I THINK WE REFERENCED IN THE PRESENTATION  
13 THAT IS MTC, A NUMBER OF THE LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS, SOME  
14 ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS, INCLUDING TRANSFORM, AND THE BAY AREA  
15 COUNCIL, AND THE SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP ARE INCLUDED  
16 IN THAT AND THEY HAVE BEEN PRETTY ACTIVE IN SACRAMENTO,  
17 TESTIFYING IN SUPPORT OF THIS ASK, AS WELL. SO, I THINK THE  
18 BUSINESS COMMUNITY IS DEFINITELY VERY ENGAGED AND VERY  
19 CONCERNED ABOUT, YOU KNOW, VERY MUCH RECOGNIZES HOW IMPORTANT  
20 TRANSIT IS TO THE ECONOMY, RIGHT? AND THEN AS FAR AS THE NEXT  
21 LETTER THAT WE'RE PLANNING, I THINK ONE OF THE REASONS WHY WE  
22 WANT TO GO TO THE COMMISSION THIS MONTH IS BECAUSE, AGAIN, THE  
23 BUDGET PROCESS IS REALLY GOING TO KICK INTO HIGH GEAR, WE WANT  
24 TO ARTICULATE THE POSITION THAT THE COMMISSION ADOPTS AS FAR  
25 AS REVENUE MEASURES TO INCLUDE AS WELL POTENTIALLY OTHER





APRIL 12, 2023

1 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO ACCOUNTABILITY AND  
2 EFFICIENCY AND SOME OF THE THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN MENTIONED  
3 TODAY.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** CHAIR?

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES THIS IS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** DO I HAVE A COMMENT. I APOLOGIZE FOR GOING OUT OF  
12 ORDER.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. BUT LISTENING TO MY  
17 CO-COUNCIL MEMBERS, ONE THING THAT'S CONCERNING ME IS THAT  
18 AFTER THE PANDEMIC, IT WAS MENTIONED THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE  
19 WORKING FROM HOME, AND THAT'S NOT GOING TO CHANGE. RIGHT? AND  
20 IT'S ALSO MENTIONED -- IT WAS LOOSELY MENTIONED THAT OUR  
21 ECONOMY IS CHANGING SO WE MIGHT ACTUALLY MOVE TO A FOUR DAY  
22 WORKWEEK. ARE THESE THINGS THAT ARE BEING INCLUDED AS PART OF  
23 THE BUDGET? BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THE RIDERSHIP IS EVER GOING  
24 TO COME BACK. I THINK IF IT COMES BACK, IT WON'T COME BACK AS



APRIL 12, 2023

1 STRONG AS IT WAS, BECAUSE THIS IS NOT THE SAME PLACE THAT IT  
2 WAS BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. AND THAT'S MY COMMENT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS  
5 THEN I WANT TO SUM UP BEFORE WE GO TO THE NEXT ITEM. MY  
6 QUESTION ON SLIDE SIX IS THAT IT SHOWS RIDERSHIP RECOVERY  
7 RATES, BUT DOES THAT TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THE SERVICE LEVELS, SO  
8 DOES THAT MEAN THE ROUTES THAT PREVIOUSLY EXISTED PRECOVID NOW  
9 ALL EXIST OR THESE RIDERSHIP -- OKAY. SO I SEE YOU SHAKING  
10 YOUR HEAD, AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE  
11 REALLY IMPORTANT FOR PEOPLE TO UNDERSTAND AS YOU ARE GOING  
12 THROUGH THIS. BECAUSE MINDING IS, I THINK VTA IS ONE OF THE  
13 FEW THAT HAVE COME BACK TO THE PREVIOUS LEVELS OF SERVICE; IS  
14 THAT CORRECT?

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** I SHOULD KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT. I DON'T  
17 BELIEVE THAT VTA HAS FULLY RESTORED THEIR SERVICE BUT I THINK  
18 IT'S A REALLY GOOD POINT AND MAYBE WE COULD THINK ABOUT  
19 ILLUSTRATING NEXT TO EACH PERCENTAGE RIDERSHIP RECOVERY WHAT  
20 THEIR RATE OF SERVICE HOURS INCREASE IS FOR EXAMPLE, MUNI  
21 DEFINITELY HAS NOT RESTORED 100%, WHEREAS I THINK BART HAS.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YEAH BECAUSE I THINK JUST SHOWING  
24 RIDERSHIP NUMBERS DOESN'T DO A GOOD JOB OF TELLING PEOPLE THAT  
25 THERE IS NOT A WAY FOR PEOPLE -- THE ROUTES NEAR ME WERE CUT.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 SO IF THEY DON'T COME BACK, I DO NOT RIDE. IT JUST BECOMES  
2 THAT SIMPLE. SO IF WE COULD INCLUDE THAT INFORMATION? BECAUSE  
3 THE BOTTOM LINE IS, I THINK WE HAVE REACHED THE NUMBER OF  
4 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS. WE HAVE MAXED OUT IN THAT ARENA. NOW  
5 WE NEED TO GET TRANSIT OPTIONAL, TRANSIT CURIOUS, YOU KNOW,  
6 TRANSIT RELUCTANT. HOWEVER WE CAN DO THAT. AND I THINK THAT WE  
7 HAVE A LOT OF THINGS IN THE TRANSIT RECOVERY PLAN THAT NEED TO  
8 BE IMPLEMENTED THAT WILL ANSWER THAT, AND THAT WILL ASSIST IN  
9 THAT AND THAT'S HOW WE'RE GOING TO GROW THE RIDERSHIP. RIGHT  
10 NOW WE CANNOT DEPEND ON THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT TO MAKE NUMBERS  
11 WORK IT JUST DOESN'T WORK THE OTHER THING THAT I WOULD  
12 RECOMMEND ON REVENUE OPTIONS TO CLOSE THE GAP IT WOULD HELP ME  
13 LOOKING AT THIS TO UNDERSTAND IF YOU HAVE NUMBERS THAT YOU CAN  
14 ATTACH TO THAT SO THE PERCENTAGE OF CAP-AND-TRADE WHAT DOES  
15 THAT ACTUALLY EQUAL IN DOLLARS AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO  
16 HELP THE COMMISSIONERS UNDERSTAND THAT TOO. WITH THAT SAID,  
17 WHAT I'M HEARING IS, TAKE MONEY FROM FREEWAYS. DON'T TAKE  
18 MONEY FROM BIKE AND PED. YOU KNOW, DON'T -- BE REALISTIC AND  
19 LIVE UP TO THE IDEA OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
20 WHICH IS TO BE ASPIRATIONAL AND GROW THE SYSTEM, WITH THE  
21 KNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE NOW. THAT'S THE WHOLE REASON, WE KNEW  
22 WE WERE GOING TO BE FACING BIG CHANGES AFTER COVID. WE DIDN'T  
23 KNOW WHAT THE CHANGES WERE, BUT WE HAVE A PLAN. AND AT LEAST  
24 WE'RE IN A POSITION TO DO THAT AND TO GET THAT PLAN ROLLING  
25 RATHER THAN NOT ROLLING THAT PLAN OUT, LET'S START MOVING.



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THAT AND THE CONSOLIDATION, AND A REALLY HARD CONVERSATION TO  
2 HAVE WITH AGENCIES. EACH AGENCY SHOULDN'T BE TRAINING BUS  
3 DRIVERS. THE BASIC -- I MEAN, MY SCHOOL RUNS THE ONLY BUS  
4 DRIVER ACCREDITED TRAINING PROGRAM THAT THERE IS, THAT -- AND  
5 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT CAN BE MODELED AND BE DONE ON A -- I  
6 MEAN, SONOMA AND SOLANO CERTAINLY DON'T NEED TO BE DOING THEIR  
7 OWN, OR NAPA. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT IS A BASIC CERTIFICATION  
8 THAT PEOPLE CAN GET. SAME WITH THE ELECTRIFICATION ISSUES THAT  
9 ADINA MENTIONED. THERE ARE CERTAIN COST SAVINGS THAT WE CAN  
10 START LOOKING AT. AND YOU WILL HAVE -- YOU HAVE COMMUNITY  
11 COLLEGES RIGHT NOW THAT ARE LOOKING TO BUILD THEIR STUDENT  
12 BASE AND BY PARCELLING OUT SOME OF THESE TRAINING PROGRAMS,  
13 WHICH I AM SURE UNIONS WOULD LOVE TO HAVE, TWO DIFFERENT  
14 COMMUNITY COLLEGES, YOU CAN HAVE INTRAREGIONAL NETWORKS OF  
15 TRAINING, YOU KNOW? AND THEN YOU HAVE A CADRE OF PEOPLE WHO  
16 CAN COMPETE FOR JOBS THAT ARE SITTING THERE AND NOT BEING --  
17 NOT BEING FILLED RIGHT NOW. BUT THIS WAS EXCELLENT. IT WAS  
18 SCARY. AND IT'S GOING TO BE SCARIER WHEN YOU ATTACH NUMBERS TO  
19 IT. SO I'M ALL FOR SCARING THE HELL OUT OF PEOPLE. IT'S ONE OF  
20 THE THINGS THAT WORKS BEST. AND WITH THAT, WE'RE GOING TO  
21 CLOSE OUT THIS ITEM AND GO INTO ANOTHER ITEM. AND WE'RE GOING  
22 TO HAVE TO BE A LITTLE QUICK ON THIS ONE. THIS IS ANOTHER  
23 IMPORTANT ONE TO US, BROWN ACT LEGISLATIVE LANDSCAPE ITEM  
24 NUMBER SEVEN. GEORGIA IS NOT HERE SO REBECCA IS GOING TO BE  
25 HANDLE THAT ONE ALSO.



APRIL 12, 2023

1  
2 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU CHAIR KINMAN THIS ONE IS GOING TO BE  
3 SHORTER. THERE IS A MEMO IN YOUR PACKET THAT PROVIDE A RUN  
4 DOWN WHAT THE BROWN ACT REFORM LANDSCAPE LOOKS LIKE, THERE IS  
5 AN ATTACHMENT, I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF  
6 BILLS, SIX BILLS BEING PROPOSED SOME OF THEM ARE BROADER  
7 TRYING TO PROVIDE FLEXIBILITY FOR ALL PUBLIC AGENCIES TO MEET  
8 REMOTELY SIMILAR TO THE FLEXIBILITY IN THE MIDST OF THE  
9 PANDEMIC WHILE OTHERS ARE GEARED TOWARDS WHAT MTC HAS, AND  
10 ABAG ENDORSE IN OUR ADVOCACY PLATFORM WHICH IS SPECIFICALLY  
11 FOR ADVISORY BODIES OR BODIES THAT DON'T TAKE FINAL ACTIONS  
12 YOU KNOW THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT SUBJECT IN SACRAMENTO  
13 THERE'S A LOT OF LAWMAKERS WHO ARE VERY OPPOSED TO THE NOTION  
14 OF BROADER FLEXIBILITY FOR ALL ELECTED BODIES BUT I THINK THE  
15 PIECE AROUND THE ADVISORY BODY HAS A CHANCE QUITE FRANKLY, THE  
16 PACHECO BILL, A.B. 817 IS ONE THEY THINK WE'RE LOOKING AT  
17 CLOSELY. IMPORTANTLY, IT'S SUPPORTED BY AND COSPONSORED BY THE  
18 LEAGUE OF CITIES, THE CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF RECREATION AND  
19 PARK DISTRICTS, THE CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF COUNTIES. SO,  
20 YOU KNOW, IT'S ALWAYS BETTER IF YOU HAVE A BILL THAT HAS A  
21 STRONG SET OF STAKEHOLDERS SUPPORTING IT. SO, I THINK THAT'S  
22 LIKELY ONE THAT WE ARE GOING TO RECOMMEND THE COMMISSION AND  
23 ABAG ENDORSE. BUT I WANTED TO JUST, YOU KNOW, GET ANY SPECIFIC  
24 FEEDBACK FROM YOU ABOUT THAT APPROACH. AND THEN JUST NOTE THAT  
25 TO THE COMMENT THAT YOU PERSONALLY ARE SUPPORTIVE OF IT, I



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THINK THAT SPEAKING AT COMMITTEES, YOU KNOW, FROM THE  
2 STANDPOINT OF BEING A MEMBER OF A POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND  
3 I KNOW FOR MANY OF YOU, YOU KNOW, IT'S HARD TO MAKE IT ALL THE  
4 WAY INTO SAN FRANCISCO, AND I APPRECIATE THAT MANY OF YOU ARE  
5 HERE TODAY. SOME OF YOU ARE HAVING TO CALL IN AS A MEMBER OF  
6 THE PUBLIC IN ORDER TO DO SO. SO, I JUST WOULD NOTE THAT  
7 HAVING YOUR VOICE ACTUALLY HEARD OR ALSO SENDING LETTERS I  
8 THINK WOULD BE IMPACTFUL. AND WITH THAT, I'LL JUST SEE IF  
9 THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I'M SEEING HANDS GO UP. WE'LL  
12 START AT THAT OTHER SIDE. FRANK?

13

14 **FRANK WELTE:** YEAH I WAS JUST CONFUSED IN THE DOCUMENT THERE IS  
15 GOING TO BE SO MANY BILLS ATTACKING THIS ISSUE FROM SO MANY  
16 DIFFERENT DIRECTIONS AND I WANT SOME CLARIFICATION. IS THERE A  
17 SPECIFIC BILL IF THAT YOU THINK OF IS THE BEST OF THE LOT THAT  
18 WE SHOULD BE SUPPORTING?

19

20 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER WELTE. YES. THE BILL  
21 THAT WE THINK HAS THE GREATEST CHANCE THAT WE'RE MOST LIKELY  
22 TO RECOMMEND SUPPORT IS A.B. 817.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GERRY?

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **GERRY GLASER:** AND I'M GLAD. BECAUSE I HAVE READ ALL THE BILLS  
2 AND 817 MAKES PERFECT SENSE. I'M ON ADVISORY BOARD IN OTHER  
3 PLACE, AS WELL. AND WE DON'T CHANGE THE POLICY. WE ADVISE ON  
4 THE POLICY. AND LIKE ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC WILL DO, AND WE  
5 SPEND MORE TIME STUDYING IT BUT THAT'S A MAJOR DIFFERENCE  
6 BETWEEN WHAT WE DO AND WHAT THE PUBLIC DOES. THAT MAKES SENSE  
7 AND THE TOTAL SALES PITCH ON THIS IS WE CAN REDUCE COST OF  
8 SOME OF THE ADMINISTRATION THROUGH THE OUR SYSTEM BY ALLOWING  
9 ADVISORY BODIES NOT HAVE TO BE IN-PERSON. I REALLY LIKE THAT  
10 BILL. IT'S A VERY SIMPLE BILL TOO.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ADINA, DID I SEE YOUR HAND GO  
13 UP BEFORE? MIC?

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. IS THIS GOOD NOW? ALL RIGHT. SO, A FEW  
16 THINGS. SOS ARE FIRST OF ALL, I KNOW, ANECDOTALLY, THAT A  
17 NUMBER OF OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND OUR  
18 MEMBERSHIP AND SOME OF THE SUBCOMMITTEES HAVE BEEN IMPACTED BY  
19 THIS. DO WE HAVE ANY SUMMARY OF HOW MANY PEOPLE WE HAVE LOST  
20 FROM SUBCOMMITTEES, THE OVERALL COUNCIL, AND ATTENDANCE, WHAT  
21 THE IMPACT HAS BEEN. DO WE HAVE THE ABILITY TO SUMMARIZE THAT?

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SOME OF THAT IS CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION.  
24 SO, BUT WHAT I CAN DO IS WORK UP SOMETHING THAT PROTECTS THE  
25 CONFIDENTIALITY OF PEOPLE AND GIVE YOU A VAGUE NOTION OF WE DO



APRIL 12, 2023

1 HAVE PEOPLE WHO CANNOT ATTEND IN-PERSON. PERIOD. AND THAT  
2 BECOMES AN ISSUE, AND WE CAN TRULY STATE THAT PEOPLE ARE  
3 HAVING EXTREME PROBLEMS IN SOME CASES ATTENDING IN-PERSON, AND  
4 THE COMMISSION IS AWARE OF THAT.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** BEFORE I MAKE A RECOMMENDATION THAT THE GROUP MAY  
7 BE INTERESTED IN I JUST WANT TO ASK A CLARIFYING QUESTION. IF  
8 STAFF MIGHT BE ABLE TO SUMMARIZE THE BECKER AND PAPAN BILLS  
9 THAT ARE, I THINK, BROADER, AND WHAT IT IS THAT THEY DO. YOU  
10 KNOW, I DID HEAR THE MESSAGE THAT THOSE ARE GOING TO HAVE A  
11 TOUGHER ROAD THIS SESSION, BUT JUST WOULD WELCOME A SUMMARY.

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. I BELIEVE THAT WHAT BOTH OF THOSE DO  
14 AS I MENTIONED IS JUST MORE BROADLY ALLOW FOR TELECOMMUTING BY  
15 THE MEMBERS OF ANY PUBLIC BODY, AND THAT THEY DON'T NEED TO  
16 IDENTIFY THE LOCATION FROM WHICH THEY'RE CALLING AND THAT THE  
17 NOTICE -- EXCUSE ME -- THE AGENDA DOES NOT NEED TO BE POSTED  
18 AT THAT REMOTE LOCATION EITHER. THOSE ARE IN ATTACHMENTS A.B.  
19 1379 FOR PAPAN AND SB 375 BECKER.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** AND SO WHILE I WOULD PERSONALLY SUPPORT GETTING  
22 TO THAT LIKE IF WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET THAT THERE YEAR AND WE  
23 CERTAINLY HAVE A PROBLEM IN TERMS OF LOSING PUBLIC  
24 PARTICIPATION WITH THE WAY THAT THE RULES CURRENTLY ARE, I  
25 WOULD WONDER IF THIS BODY WOULD BE INTERESTED IN MAKING A





APRIL 12, 2023

1 RECOMMENDATION TO THE COMMISSION TO SUPPORT THE PACHECO BILL  
2 WHICH I DIDN'T WRITE DOWN THE NAME OF. THE NUMBER OF -- 817  
3 AND SEND A LETTER OR MAKE A COMMENT SAYING WITH AS MUCH  
4 EVIDENCE AS WE CAN THAT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY  
5 NEGATIVELY IMPACTING THE ABILITY TO GET A DIVERSE  
6 PARTICIPATION INTO A REGIONAL ADVISORY BODY.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO AM I HEARING A MOTION THAT WOULD  
9 SUPPORT 817 WITH THE CAVEAT THAT WE WOULD PREFER THE NON-  
10 NOTICING CLAUSE FOR BODIES LIKE OURS? BUT WE CAN LIVE WITH 817  
11 IS THAT -- OR IS THAT --

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** THERE IS A NUANCE THAT I THINK I DON'T QUITE  
14 UNDERSTAND. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION. BUT IF OTHER PEOPLE  
15 HAVE MORE THOUGHTS MAYBE WE SHOULD GO ALL THE WAY AROUND AND  
16 MAKE THE MOTION.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GENERAL COUNSEL HAS THEIR HAND RAISED IN  
19 ZOOM.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KATHLEEN.

24



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I WANT TO NOTE THIS IS AGENDAIZED AS AN  
2 INFORMATION ITEM SO WE WANT TO BE CAREFUL ABOUT TAKING FORMAL  
3 ACTION HOWEVER IF YOU WANT TO GIVE GENERAL DIRECTION WE CAN  
4 BRING SOMETHING BACK THAT MEETS THAT. THE OTHER THING I WANT  
5 TO NOTE AS A PRACTICAL MATTER IS THAT IT IS ABSOLUTELY  
6 INDISPUTABLE THAT THE CURRENT STATE OF THE BROWN ACT CREATES  
7 PRESSURE ON PEOPLE, PARTICULARLY PEOPLE WITH DAY JOBS OR OTHER  
8 CONSTRAINTS TO PARTICIPATE IN ADVISORY COUNCIL-TYPE  
9 ACTIVITIES. BUT FOR OURSELVES, WE DO STILL ENCOURAGE, AT THE  
10 STAFF LEVEL, THAT IF ANY MEMBERS OF THIS COUNCIL NEED  
11 ASSISTANCE WITH REMOTE PARTICIPATION, WE DO STILL WANT TO TRY  
12 TO HELP DO YOU THAT. SO, THAT IS IN NO WAY TO UNDERMINE THE  
13 ADVOCACY THAT YOU ALL ARE CONSIDERING, WHICH IS, YOU KNOW,  
14 VERY ALIGNED WITH THE COMMISSION'S OVERALL APPROACH, BUT JUST,  
15 YOU KNOW, A FOOTNOTE THAT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IF THERE  
16 ARE PARTICULAR CONSTRAINTS THAT WE CAN STILL TRY TO WORK WITH  
17 PEOPLE TO ADDRESS THOSE. THANKS.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. AND I AM SEEING AT THE BOTTOM OF THE  
20 AGENDA THAT --

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** LET ME INTERRUPT YOU. ON PAGE FIVE OF OUR  
23 AGENDA IT SAYS ALL ITEMS ON THE AGENDA ARE SUBJECT TO ACTION  
24 AND/OR CHANGE BY THE COMMITTEE. ACTIONS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF  
25 ARE SUBJECT TO CHANGE BY THE COMMITTEE SO WE CAN AND HAVE MADE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 MOTIONS IN THE PAST AND HAVE TAKEN THESE ACTION ITEMS THAT'S  
2 MY FIRST POINT OR QUESTION IS THAT WHY WE WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO  
3 TAKE A MOTION. MY SECOND ISSUE IS IT'S NOT THE NOTICING  
4 ITSELF, AND I'LL GIVE YOU MY PERSONAL ISSUE WITH THE NOTICING.  
5 BECAUSE I HAVE SAID IT BEFORE PUBLICLY. I AM THE CARETAKER AND  
6 THE SOLE CARETAKER TO A CANCER PATIENT. I HAVE ZERO DESIRE TO  
7 NOTICE MY HOUSE FOR A PUBLIC MEETING. I DON'T FEEL THAT I AM -  
8 - AND I CAN'T DO PUBLIC MEETINGS IN -- I MEAN, I COULD GO TO  
9 THE LIBRARY DURING THE DAY, BUT AN EVENING MEETING, FOR  
10 INSTANCE, WOULDN'T WORK FOR ME, BECAUSE MY LIBRARIES CLOSE  
11 EARLY. SO I HAVE NO PUBLIC ACCESS SPACE IN WHICH TO DO THAT.  
12 AND I THINK THAT THAT IS -- AND I KNOW THAT IT IS A FACTOR FOR  
13 SOME OF THE PEOPLE WHO ARE HAVING DIFFICULTY ATTENDING  
14 MEETINGS. HAVING A REMOTE SET UP IS FINE, BUT IT HAS TO BE  
15 REMOTE AT YOUR HOUSE, AND IF IT'S REMOTE AT YOUR HOUSE, YOUR  
16 HOUSE HAS TO BE ACCESSIBLE AND YOU HAVE TO BE WILLING TO  
17 INVITE STRANGERS IN, AND THAT'S NOT ACCEPTABLE NOR IS IT SAFE  
18 FOR US. SO THAT'S KIND OF WHERE WE'RE GOING WITH THAT. BUT IF  
19 YOU COULD CORRECT ME OR ALLOW ME SOME CLARIFICATION ON THAT  
20 STATEMENT THAT ALL ITEMS ARE SUBJECT TO ACTION AND/OR CHANGE?

21

22 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YEAH. AND SO I UNDERSTAND THAT THAT'S BEEN THE  
23 PRACTICE HERE, AND I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY WE CAN  
24 TAKE THIS ITEM. I THINK THAT, AS I UNDERSTAND THAT LONG-  
25 STANDING LANGUAGE ON THE AGENDAS, IT'S MEANT TO SAY THAT, YOU



APRIL 12, 2023

1 KNOW, THE THINGS THAT ARE AGENDAIZED CAN BE ACTED ON IN THE  
2 WAY THAT THEY'RE AGENDAIZED. I UNDERSTAND THERE MAY HAVE BEEN  
3 DIVERGENCE FROM THAT. I WANT TO NOTE THAT MY COMMENT ABOUT  
4 WORKING WITH MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL IS NOT TO ERASE IN ANY WAY  
5 THE REMAINING LIMITATION SUPERVISOR HOW MUCH A CONSTRAINT THEY  
6 POSE PARTICULARLY FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE MEDICAL REASONS OR  
7 OTHERS, NOT TO BE ABLE TO MEET IN REMOTE LOCATIONS, BUT I JUST  
8 DON'T WANT TO DISCOURAGE MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL FROM REACHING  
9 OUT IF THERE ARE THANKS THAT WE CAN DO TO HELP THEM AS STAFF  
10 MEMBERS, WITH ALTERNATIVE MEANS TO CONTINUE TO PARTICIPATE.  
11 IT'S VERY IMPORTANT FOR US TO HAVE AS MANY PEOPLE AS WE CAN  
12 CONTINUE TO BE A VALUED PART OF THIS COUNCIL.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND WE CAN WORK ON CHANGING  
15 THE NOTICING IN OUR AGENDA TO SAY -- AND IF EVERYTHING HAS TO  
16 BE AN ACTION ITEM, SO BE IT. WE CAN CHOOSE TO NOT TAKE ACTION.  
17 BUT I WILL GO BACK TO ADINA ON THIS.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** IF OTHER PEOPLE HAD COMMENTS, I THINK IT WOULD BE  
20 APPROPRIATE TO HEAR EVERYBODY.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ANNE OLIVIA HAS HER HAND RAISED ON ZOOM.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY.

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ANNE OLIVIA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

2

3 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HI. JUST A COUPLE OF THINGS, WHETHER OR  
4 NOT WE CAN VOTE ON SOMETHING. I'M REALLY GLAD THIS IS COMING  
5 TOWARDS US, AND I AM REALLY INTERESTED IN FINDING WAYS TO  
6 SUPPORT SOME WAY TO ADDRESS THIS. I DO WANT TO SAY THANK YOU  
7 TO STAFF WHO HAVE BEEN REALLY EXCEPTIONALLY HELPFUL,  
8 ESPECIALLY MARTHA FOR HELPING ME NOTICE REMOTELY, BUT AS MY  
9 WORK SITUATION CHANGED TODAY, I ENDED UP HAVING TO TAKE A LOT  
10 OF TIME TO GET TO THE PLACE THAT WE NOTICED, WHICH WAS NO  
11 LONGER REMOTELY CONVENIENT, BUT THEY REALLY ARE AWESOME, AND  
12 I'M REALLY GRATEFUL SO IF THERE ARE THINGS THAT WE CAN DO  
13 WITHOUT BEING ABLE TO TAKE A VOTE TODAY, THEN I'M ALSO ONE OF  
14 THE PEOPLE VERY HEAVILY IMPACTED, AND I WOULD LIKE A WAY TO  
15 WORK IT OUT.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU ADINA MY FEELING IS THAT YOU  
18 CAN GO AHEAD AND MAKE A MOTION WE CAN HAVE DISCUSSION IF THE  
19 MOTION IS SECONDED.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION THAT THE POLICY  
22 ADVISORY COUNCIL RECOMMEND TO THE COMMISSION SUPPORT FOR A.B.  
23 817 WITH ANY CHANGE NEEDED TO REMOVE THE NOTICING REQUIREMENT  
24 AT A PRIVATE LOCATION, AS WELL, AND TO COMMUNICATE TO THE  
25 COMMISSION A STATEMENT THAT REFLECTS THE IMPACTS OF THE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 CURRENT STATE OF AFFAIRS ON THE ABILITY OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS  
2 TO PARTICIPATE IN THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ITS  
3 SUBCOMMITTEES.

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** I WOULD SECOND.

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. GREAT. MOTION AND SECOND IS. WE  
8 HAVE MULTIPLE SECTIONS. WENDI SECONDED. IS THERE ANY  
9 DISCUSSION? I'M SORRY -- IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION ON THE  
10 MOTION? DWAYNE?

11

12 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I JUST WANT TO MENTION THAT I TOTALLY AGREE  
13 WITH WHAT YOU SAID. AND I THINK THAT WHEN WE LOOK AROUND THIS  
14 ROOM, RIGHT HERE, AND WE LOOK AT THE LAST SIX MONTHS, THIS IS  
15 PROBABLY A LOT OF DIVERSITY THAT HAS NOT HAPPENED IN A LONG  
16 TIME. AND WE CAN'T TAKE THAT FOR GRANTED. WE NEED EVERYBODY IN  
17 OUR SOCIETY TO PARTICIPATE, AND IF WE DON'T GIVE PEOPLE  
18 OPPORTUNITY TO PARTICIPATE, AND WE START MAKING DECISIONS FOR  
19 PEOPLE THAT DON'T ACTUALLY WORK FOR PEOPLE. AND THIS IS  
20 SOMETHING THAT WE REALLY NEED TO THINK ABOUT. IT'S SOMETHING  
21 THAT, LIKE, I'M TOTALLY BEHIND IT. BECAUSE ANYTHING WHERE WE  
22 GET THE MAJORITY OF PEOPLE PARTICIPATING, THE MAJORITY OF  
23 GROUPS PARTICIPATING IS GOOD FOR EVERYBODY. THANK YOU.

24



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. BEFORE I CALL FOR THE VOTE,  
2 I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS.  
3 TERRY, DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

4

5 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY I'M GOING TO WAIT UNTIL AFTER WE DO  
8 PUBLIC COMMENT BECAUSE I FORGOT TO DO IT. IF ANY MEMBER OF THE  
9 PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM RAISE YOUR HAND OR  
10 DIAL STAR NINE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC NEAR THE PODIUM WILL  
11 BE CALLED UPON TO SPEAK. ANYTHING RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC  
12 COMMENT.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM  
15 WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.  
16 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

17

18 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU FOR ALL THIS GREAT  
19 INFORMATION. I'LL HAVE TO TAKE A LOOK AT 837. WE HAVE BEEN  
20 LOOKING AT SEVERAL DIFFERENT BILLS, 1369 SEEMS TO BE LEAST  
21 RESTRICTIVE FOR ALL OF THE PARTIES CONCERNED FOR BOTH MEMBERS  
22 OF THE BODY AND COMMUNITY MEMBERS. MY QUESTION TO NOT ONLY ALL  
23 OF US, BUT TO ELECTED OFFICIALS IS, WHY CAN'T WE HAVE ELECTED  
24 OFFICIALS AS REMOTE PARTICIPANTS, AS WELL, AND I FORGOT ABOUT  
25 WHAT THE PARTICULAR BILL WAS, BUT IT SEEMS TO ME IF WE'RE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 GOING TO TRY TO IMPROVE EQUITY FOR ALL, THAT WE HAVE TO LOOK  
2 AT PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT FIT THE STANDARD MOLD, AKA THOSE OF US  
3 WITH DISABILITIES, WHO MAY WANT TO BECOME ELECTED OFFICIALS,  
4 TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE FULLY, BUT, HERE AGAIN, BECAUSE OF  
5 CIRCUMSTANCE, BECAUSE OF HEALTH, BECAUSE OF DISTANCE. I'M HERE  
6 IN SAN JOSE, AND I LOVE YOU GUYS UP IN OAKLAND, BUT THE  
7 COMMUTE IS A PAIN IN THE REAR, PLUS ALL THE DIFFERENT THINGS  
8 I'M GOING TO HAVE TO GO THROUGH IN ORDER TO BE THERE  
9 PHYSICALLY. SO, THAT'S REALLY MY BIGGEST QUESTION, IS, YOU  
10 KNOW, A.B. -- [INDISCERNIBLE] 37 SOUNDS LIKE SOMETHING THAT'S  
11 A REALLY GOOD IDEA. I QUESTION WHY CAN'T WE ENDORSE OR SUPPORT  
12 THE ADDITION OF ELECTED'S?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. NEXT UP IS VEDA  
15 FLOREZ. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU FOR RECOGNIZING ME. I APPRECIATE BE A  
18 PARTICIPANT OF THE MEETING. I AM A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC  
19 ADVISORY COUNCIL HOWEVER ON THIS OCCASION AND AT THE LAST  
20 MEETING, I WAS UNABLE TO BE PHYSICALLY AT THE LOCATION AND I  
21 AM ONE OF THE LONGEST STANDING MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ADVISORY  
22 COUNCIL, AND I HAVE MISSED VERY FEW MEETINGS AND IT'S  
23 FRUSTRATING FOR ME TO NOT BE THERE IN-PERSON WITH ALL OF YOU.  
24 SO WHAT I'M FINDING IS THAT I DO SUPPORT THE DIRECTION IN  
25 WHICH THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COUNCIL IS GOING TO SUPPORT ANY





APRIL 12, 2023

1 MOVEMENT WITH ANY LEGISLATION. HOWEVER, I DO NOT WANT TO  
2 PARTICIPATE AND VOTE ON THAT WHICH ADINA LEVIN HAS SUGGESTED.  
3 I WOULD PREFER TO WRITE A LETTER TO THE COMMISSION WITH OUR  
4 SUPPORT FOR MOVEMENT IN THIS DIRECTION. I'M TRYING TO GET THE  
5 MARIN COUNTY CIVIC CENTER TO GIVE US A ROOM TO GRANT A SPACE  
6 FOR THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COUNCIL. FOR ANY MEMBER OF OUR COUNCIL  
7 IN THE NORTH BAY TO PARTICIPATE THERE. BUT ONE OF THEIR  
8 BIGGEST OPPOSITIONS IS, HE DIDN'T WANT TO BE RESPONSIBLE FOR  
9 POSTING AGENDAS OR RECEIVING COMMENTS FROM THE POSTED AGENDA.  
10 AND I HAVE ASKED STAFF TO REACH OUT TO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
11 NORTH BAY COUNCIL COMMUNITY, IF THEY WOULD BE INTERESTED IN  
12 HAVING A LOCATION. SO, I'M ALL FOR THIS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO  
13 HAVE LEGISLATION MOVE FORWARD. HOWEVER, I CANNOT SUPPORT THIS  
14 -- THIS MOTION THAT HAS BEEN SET FORWARD. AND I WOULD PREFER  
15 IF WE TOOK THE TIME TO PEN A LETTER TO SEND TO COMMISSION. I  
16 WOULD BE HAPPY TO WORK WITH ADINA LEVIN, OR WITH --

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
19 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** COMMENTS ON THE MOTION, TERRY?

22

23 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES. AS ONE OF THE SECONDS ON ADINA'S MOTION, I  
24 WOULD CERTAINLY SUPPORT THAT. THE TWO ISSUES THAT CONCERN ME  
25 IS THAT IF WE'RE -- IF WE'RE PARTICIPATING OFFSITE, EVEN IF A



APRIL 12, 2023

1 -- IN MY UNDERSTANDING WAS, EVEN IF IT WERE -- L PARTICULARLY,  
2 IF IT WERE AT A PUBLIC SETTING, WHERE, AT A COUNTY BUILDING OR  
3 A CITY BUILDING OR SO FORTH WE COULD DO SO. I DO NOT LIKE THE  
4 FACT THOUGH THAT IF WE'RE AT CURRENTLY AT A NON-PUBLIC SITE,  
5 OR HOME OR OFFICE OR WHAT HAVE YOU, THAT WE'RE NOT PART -- WE  
6 CANNOT BE PART OF THE QUORUM AND WE CANNOT VOTE ON THE ISSUES  
7 THAT COME BEFORE THE SUBCOMMITTEE OR THE POLICY ADVISORY  
8 COUNCIL. AND I THINK THAT THAT'S UNFORTUNATE. AND I DON'T  
9 THINK IT WORKS FOR SOME OF US.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YOU CAN BE A VOTING MEMBER IF YOU HAVE  
12 GIVEN ENOUGH NOTICE FOR MARTHA TO POST IT ON THE AGENDA AND IF  
13 YOU POST THE NOTICE AT YOUR HOME AND IF YOUR HOME IS  
14 ACCESSIBLE, AND YOU OPEN YOUR DOORS SO THAT PEOPLE CAN COME  
15 IN. SO, I THINK THAT -- YEAH. JUST TO CLEAR THAT UP.

16

17 **TERRY SCOTT:** YEAH, I, LIKE YOU, I DON'T THINK THAT IT'S -- IT  
18 DOESN'T WORK VERY WELL TO DO THAT IN A PRIVATE HOME,  
19 PARTICULARLY, WHEN YOU HAVE OTHER SPOUSES OR OTHERS GOING IN  
20 AND OUT.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GERRY?

23



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **GERRY GLASER:** I HEARD IT WAS SUPPORTING 817 WITH ALSO THE  
2 CHANGE THAT THE SITE WOULD NOT HAVE TO BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC.  
3 IS THAT CORRECT?

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** I'M LOOKING AT THE BILL AND READING IT RIGHT AND  
6 WOULD WELCOME HELP FROM STAFF. IT SAYS BY REMOVING THE  
7 REQUIREMENT FOR AGENDAS REPLACE LOCATION OF EACH PUBLIC  
8 OFFICIAL IT PREVENTS -- IT PROTECTS THE PERSONAL PRIVATE  
9 INFORMATION SO I THINK THE BILL ALREADY TAKES INTO ACCOUNT  
10 RANDY'S JUSTIFIED CONCERN.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I'M SORRY.

13

14 **GERRY GLASER:** NO, IT -- WHERE IT SAYS EACH TELECONFERENCE  
15 LOCATION BE ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC. THAT'S THE COPY OF THE  
16 BILL I HAVE IN FRONT OF ME, AND I THINK IF THAT IS WHAT IT  
17 SAYS THEN CHANGING THE BILL SO IT SAYS WEATHER THE LOCATION IS  
18 AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC THAT IT WOULD BE FINE BUT REQUIRING IT  
19 TO BE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC, I THINK IS THE PROBLEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO, I THINK I HEARD, THE MOTION TO  
22 SUPPORT 817, WITH THE WISH THAT WE ALSO SUPPORT THE IDEA OF  
23 BEING ABLE TO HOLD OR COMMIT TO MEETINGS. WE HAVE A MEMBER  
24 BEING KICKED OUT OF HER PUBLIC MEETINGS SITE SO WE CAN'T



APRIL 12, 2023

1 DEBATE TOO MUCH LONGER HERE, OR WE'RE WON'T HAVE -- WE WANT  
2 817 AT THE LEAST WE WANT THE OTHER ASPECTS AS A WISH LIST.

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S THE CLARIFICATION.

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. WE HAVE EVERYBODY AGREEING. CALL  
7 FOR THE VOTE, PLEASE?

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** I JUST WANT TO ADDRESS --

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE DON'T HAVE TIME, ADINA. SO, THE  
12 MOTION WAS BY LEVIN AND THE SECOND WAS BY WELTE. KINMAN?

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF IS EXCUSED. BALDINI?

17

18 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE .

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

21

22 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS?

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD IS ABSENT. FLOREZ IS ABSENT.

8 GLASER?

9

10 **GERRY GLASER:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN IS ABSENT. HANKERSON?

13

14 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

17

18 **WENDI KALLINS:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. [INDISCERNIBLE] IS EXCUSED.

21 LIEU?

22

23 **CARINA LIEU:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NICKENS?



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **RODNEY NICKENS:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

9

10 **JOHNNY PARKER:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE IS EXCUSED. PIMPLE?

13

14 **VINAY PIMPLE:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

17

18 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

21

22 **FRANK WELTE:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WONG?

25



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ZACK? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES  
4 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. SORRY TO RUSH THAT, BUT OUR  
7 ONE REMOTE MEMBER WAS LOSING HER REMOTE LOCATION. SO WE WOULD  
8 HAVE NOT HAD THE ABILITY TO VOTE.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** I ALSO THINK THAT, LIKE, I PERSONALLY SUPPORT THE  
11 BROADER BILLS AND HAVING MULTIPLES SPEAK AS INDIVIDUALS IS  
12 ALSO SOMETHING I THINK WE CAN DO.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES AND I WOULD STRONGLY SUGGEST THAT IF  
15 PEOPLE CAN'T ATTEND THE COMMISSION MEETING SEND THEM A NOTE  
16 AND SEND YOUR COMMISSIONERS NOTES. WITH THAT, THAT WRAPS UP  
17 ITEM SEVEN. ITEM NUMBER EIGHT. KY-NAM THIS WILL BE POLICY  
18 ADVISORY COUNCIL VICE CHAIR.

19

20 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I'LL KEEP THIS BRIEF BECAUSE OF OUR  
21 CONSTRAINTS. THAT IS WITH VICE CHAIR ILAF STEPPING DOWN, AND  
22 THE PROCESS IS YOU CAN EITHER SELF-NOMINATE OR NOMINATE ONE OF  
23 YOUR PEERS BY SIMPLY E-MAILING MARTHA OR MYSELF BY LETTING US  
24 KNOW BY THE MAY 13TH MEETING, AND YOU CAN EVEN MAKE A  
25 NOMINATION, A SELF-NOMINATION AT THAT MEETING. PEOPLE WHO ARE



APRIL 12, 2023

1 NOMINATED WILL HAVE A BRIEF MOMENT TO STATE A CASE AND THEN  
2 WE'LL VOTE ON IT.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND I RECEIVED AN E-MAIL,  
5 WHICH I WILL HAND TO YOU SO YOU HAVE A COPY OF IT FOR YOUR  
6 RECORDS FROM MR. GOODWIN WHO IS NOT HERE TODAY WHO SAID THAT  
7 HE WOULD LIKE TO NOMINATE PAMELA CAMPOS AS VICE CHAIR OF THE  
8 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON. AT OUR FIRST MEETING LAST MONTH I  
9 HAD A CHANCE TO SIT DOWN AND TALK WITH PAMELA THAT  
10 CONVERSATION LEAD TO AN INDELIBLE IMPRESSION ON ME PAMELA HAS  
11 BEEN A REFRESHING ADDITION TO THE COUNCIL SHE IS OUTSPOKEN AND  
12 CARES DEEPLY ABOUT TRANSIT AND NEEDS OF FAMILIES WITH CHILDREN  
13 SHE HAS AN EQUITY MINDSET WHEN IT COMES TO OPTIMIZING VOICES  
14 OF YOUNG PEOPLE I BELIEVE THAT SHE WILL MAKE AN EXCELLENT VICE  
15 CHAIR AND BRING UNIQUE PERSPECTIVE TO THE COUNCIL'S LEADERSHIP  
16 PLEASE ACCEPT MY NOMINATION FOR PAMELA CAMPOS. WILLIAM  
17 GOODWIN. ARE THERE ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS TODAY KEEPING IN MIND  
18 YOU CAN NOMINATE UP UNTIL THE FINAL DAY UNTIL NEXT MEETING.  
19 ANNE OLIVIA.

20

21 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THEY MOVED ME INTO THE TEEN ROOM FOR A  
22 MOMENT. JUST TO CLARIFY DOES THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR NEED TO  
23 BE THERE IN-PERSON THE WHOLE TIME.

24

25 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** FOR NOW YES IT SHOULD BE.





APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** OKAY. THAT'S GOOD. SO, AND ARE YOU LOOKING  
3 FOR NOMINATIONS FOR BOTH OF THEM?

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** NOT THE CHAIR, BECAUSE I'M STILL HERE.

6 [LAUGHTER]

7

8 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I THOUGHT IT WAS FOR --

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THIS IS FOR THE VICE -- WHAT HAPPENED  
11 THAT I DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT? [LAUGHTER] THIS IS FOR THE VICE  
12 CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. WE'LL DEAL WITH THE  
13 EQUITY AND ACCESS AT THEIR MEETING.

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** PERFECT. I WAS THINKING ABOUT EQUITY AND  
16 ACCESS. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WHAT DO YOU THINK. I'M GOING TO ASK IF  
19 THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD  
20 LIKE TO SPEAK USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE  
21 IN-PERSON MEMBERS SHOULD LINE UP BEHIND THE PODIUM AND THE  
22 CLERK WILL CALL MUCH YOU. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER  
23 PUBLIC COMMENT?

24



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** TERRY?

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** DID YOU ASK FOR NOMINATIONS?

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I ASKED FOR NOMINATIONS FOR VICE CHAIR.

10

11 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES. I WOULD LIKE TO NOMINATE COUNCIL MEMBER  
12 GLASER.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER  
15 NOMINATIONS TODAY? WITH THAT, KEEP IN MIND YOU CAN SEND KY-NAM  
16 NOMINATIONS VIA E-MAIL. YOU CAN NOMINATE THE DAY OF OUR NEXT  
17 MEETING WHICH IS MAY SOMETHING OR OTHER. MAY 10TH. MOVING ON  
18 TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER NINE, SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. EQUITY AND  
19 ACCESS, DID THEY MEET NO. SO THERE IS NO COMMITTEE REPORT  
20 THERE. THEN WHAT IS OUR OTHER ONE? I'M SORRY MARTHA?

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COUNCIL MEMBER REPORTS.

23



APRIL 12, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** WAIT A MINUTE. WE STILL NEED TO DO STAFF LIAISON.  
2 SINCE WE DON'T HAVE ANYTHING TO REPORT ABOUT ON ITEM NINE  
3 THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT IS THERE?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
6 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
7 ON THIS ITEM.

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

10

11 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** SHORT, THE ONLY UPDATE IS SUMMER ACADEMY  
12 APPLICANTS FOR HIGH SCHOOL CLOSES ON THE 17th WE HAVE 78  
13 APPLICANTS ZERO FROM NAPA OR SONOMA ONE FROM MARIN AND THREE  
14 FROM SOLANO. I APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT IN GETTING NOMINEES  
15 FROM THOSE NORTHERN COUNTIES.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
21 ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ANY COMMENT?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** NAPA REPRESENTATIVES ARE WORKING ON IT DILIGENTLY.



APRIL 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 11, COUNCIL MEMBER  
3 REPORTS COUNCIL MEMBERS MAY REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES  
4 OR EVENTS. ANYTHING?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. SO, WITH MY NON-PROFIT HATS WORKING ON THE  
7 SURVIVE AND THRIVE CAMPAIGN IN SUPPORT OF THE FIRST  
8 SUBSTANTIVE ITEM ON THE AGENDA, AND WHAT WE ARE DOING IS  
9 OFFERING, IF YOU HAVE A COMMUNITY GROUP OF ANY SORT, NON-  
10 PROFIT, CHURCH, BUSINESS GROUP OFFERING, PRESENTATIONS, AND  
11 ACTION OPPORTUNITIES, SO, FEEL FREE TO CONTACT ME IF YOU ARE  
12 INTERESTED IN HAVING A LOCAL PRESENTATION WITH ACTION  
13 OPPORTUNITIES ON THE FISCAL CLIFF AND ADDRESSING THAT. THANK  
14 YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COUNCIL  
17 MEMBER REPORTS? HOWARD?

18

19 **HOWARD WONG:** JUST WANTED TO MAKE NOTE THAT THE SAN FRANCISCO  
20 CHRONICLE, IN THEIR ARTICLE REGARDING THE NEXT GENERATION  
21 FREEWAY PLANNING, QUOTED SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THIS BODY. THE MTC  
22 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IN THE ARTICLE, WHICH OBVIOUSLY CAME  
23 FROM, PROBABLY THE RECORDS OF THE HEARING, OR THE RECORDING OF  
24 THE HEARING. SO THAT YOU MIGHT WANT TO TAKE A LOOK AT THAT SO



APRIL 12, 2023

1 THAT THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS MAKING SOME, YOU KNOW,  
2 WAVES, SO TO SPEAK, IN THE MEDIA.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE NEGLECTED THE NEXT  
5 GENERATION. IS THERE A REPORT FROM THEM? OR NOT? THEY HAVEN'T  
6 MET?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO. THEY HAVEN'T. IT WAS CANCELED. OH,  
9 THEY ENDED.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** DID THEY MEET ANNE OLIVIA?

12

13 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** DREAD YEAH WE HAD THE MEETING ON MARCH  
14 25TH AND I'M PREPARED TO GIVE A REPORT IF YOU WANT?

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** PLEASE.

17

18 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SO, THE 25th WAS THE 9TH MEETING OF THE  
19 NEXGEN FREEWAY STUDY ADVISORY GROUP. RIGHT NOW WE HAVE ENTERED  
20 PHASE THREE WHICH IS CALLED REFINING PATHWAYS AND WE'RE IN  
21 ROUND ONE OF TECHNICAL ANALYSIS AND HAVE BEGUN AN EXPLORATION  
22 OF OPERATIONAL DEVELOPMENT. SO, DUE TO TIME CONSTRAINTS I'M  
23 GOING TO FOCUS ON THE FIRST PORTION OF THE MEETING, WHICH WAS  
24 FEEDBACK FROM THE EXECUTIVE GROUP. THEIR FEEDBACK, THEY HAVE  
25 MANY SIMILARITIES THAT CAME FROM THE ADVISORY GROUP AND



APRIL 12, 2023

1 ACTUALLY CONCERNS THAT WERE RAISED BY THIS BODY. SPECIFICALLY  
2 LOOKING FOR CLARIFICATION ON HOW THE STUDY AND HOW ALL LANE  
3 TOLLING IN GENERAL FITS INTO BOTH THE LARGER REGIONAL PICTURE  
4 AND ALSO HOW IT AFFECTS THE LOCAL PICTURE. BUT THERE WERE SOME  
5 EDITS TO GOALS AND DISCUSSION AROUND MATRIX THOSE WERE ALL  
6 VERY GOOD AND VERY POSITIVE. AND EXEC ALSO WANTED A CLEAR  
7 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IS INCLUDED IN EACH PATHWAY SO STAFF  
8 PRESENTED THREE PRIMARY REASONS FOR STUDYING ALL LANE TOLLING  
9 AND FREEWAY LAWNS AND POTENTIALLY SIDE STREETS INCLUDING  
10 SOLVING TRANSPORTATION PROBLEMS AND MANDATE TO PLAN FOR FUTURE  
11 AND FEWER VEHICLE MILES THAT FUNDS FROM COLLECTED TOOLS CAN BE  
12 USED TO BENEFIT TRANSIT SAFETY AND AFFORDABLE. LARGER PICTURE  
13 -- THIS IS IMPORTANT. I DON'T WANT TO RUSH TOO MUCH. LARGER  
14 PICTURE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS ARE SERIOUSLY ALSO  
15 CONSIDERING THAT THE USE OF TOLLS ON ROADS, SO REGIONAL ALL  
16 LANE TOLLING STRATEGY WOULD BE IN ADDITION TO STATEWIDE ROAD  
17 USE CHARGES LOCALLY CONSIDERATIONS THEY'RE LOOKING AT  
18 INCLUDING THE OUTSTANDING DEBT EXISTS FROM EXISTING TOLL BASED  
19 EXPRESS LANES THAT STILL NEED TO BE PAID OFF AND TRAFFIC  
20 OVERFLOW ON SIDE STREETS FOR THOSE WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO PAY THE  
21 ROAD TOLLS AND HOW THOSE WOULD PROVIDE HEALTH AND SAFETY  
22 CHALLENGES FOR LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND THE NEED TO TAYLOR  
23 COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES TO LOCAL COMMUNITY NEEDS. STAFF  
24 COVERED FOUR OPTIONS BEING CONSIDERED ALL LANE TOLLING ON  
25 HIGHWAYS THAT HAVE TRANSIT-RICH CORRIDORS. TOLLING OF THE SAME



APRIL 12, 2023

1 TRANSIT-RICH CORRIDOR HIGHWAYS, BUT ALSO TOLLING ARTERIAL  
2 ROADS, THEN TOLLING OF ALL ROADS, FREEWAYS, MAJOR ARTERIAL  
3 ROADS TOLLING FREEWAYS AND SIDE STREETS WITHIN CERTAIN AREAS  
4 WITH HIGH TRAFFIC OR NOT USING TOLLS. STRATEGIES AS AN  
5 ASSOCIATED AMOUNT OF REVENUE THEY WOULD PRODUCE. FUNDING  
6 COVERED UNDER EACH STRATEGIES AND COST OF IMPLEMENT. REVENUES  
7 COULD BE USED TO IMPLEMENT COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES BEFORE  
8 TOLLING BEGINS ADDRESSING OUR CONCERNS FOR THE REST OF THE  
9 MEETING WE LOOKED AT STUDIES IN LA AND PORTLAND AND OREGON WHO  
10 ARE CONSIDERING ADDING TOLLS TO THEIR SCOPE OF PRICING AND  
11 OPERATIONAL CONSIDERATIONS AND CENT SPENT OF THE REST OF THE  
12 TIME FOCUSED ON OPERATIONAL NEEDS AND WHAT WE MAY NEED TO TAKE  
13 INTO CONSIDERATION TO ADEQUATELY SERVE FOLKS INCLUDING COSTS.  
14 SO THAT'S THE REPORT BACK.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER COUNCIL  
17 MEMBER REPORTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC DISCUSSION?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND  
20 RAISED FOR THIS ITEM. VEDA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU  
21 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

22

23 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU. AND CALIFORNIA YOUNG PEOPLE HAVE THE  
24 POTENTIAL TO BE A POWERFUL FORCE IN OUR ELECTION BUT ONLY IF  
25 THEY ARE INVOLVED IN MAKING VOTING A HABIT. AND THE LAST TWO



APRIL 12, 2023

1 WEEKS, IN APRIL, THE SECRETARY OF STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
2 ENCOURAGES YOUNG PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THEIR ELECTION  
3 EDUCATION. AND RIGHT NOW, THE LAST TWO WEEKS IN APRIL OF EVERY  
4 YEAR, IT'S IMPORTANT TO ENCOURAGE YOUNG PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE  
5 IN CIVIC EDUCATION AND EVEN ENCOURAGE THEM TO PREREGISTER TO  
6 VOTE FOR ANYONE UNDER 16 YEARS OLD, 16 TO 18, OR REGISTER TO  
7 VOTE FOR THOSE WHO ARE 18. AND I BRING THIS UP, BECAUSE I KNOW  
8 WE NEED TO CONNECT THE DOTS WITH A POTENTIAL REGIONAL BALLOT  
9 MEASURE. SO JUST KEEP THIS IN MIND AS WE MOVE FORWARD, AND I  
10 HOPE THAT NEXT YEAR WHEN IT COMES TO APRIL AND ALSO IN  
11 SEPTEMBER, THEY HAVE THE SAME TYPE OF THING HAPPENING, THAT WE  
12 ENCOURAGE YOUNG PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE VOTER VOTING  
13 PROCESS AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT SO THAT WE CAN ENCOURAGE THEM TO  
14 PASS ANY REGIONAL MEASURE THAT MAY BE COMING UP IN NOVEMBER  
15 2024. THANK YOU. THAT CLOSES OUT ITEM 11. ITEM NUMBER 12. NEW  
16 BUSINESS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON NEW BUSINESS?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
19 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
20 ON THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IS THERE ANY COMMENT FROM THE BODY? WITH  
23 THAT, THAT COMPLETES OUR DAY, AND WE CAN BE ADJOURNED. THE  
24 NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD ON  
25 WEDNESDAY MAY 10TH, 2023 AT 1:30 P.M. AT THE BAY AREA METRO





APRIL 12, 2023

1 CENTER 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA. ANY CHANGES  
2 TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS  
3 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ADJOURNED.

4 [ADJOURNED] [ ADJOURNED ]

5

6

7



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*