



**BAY AREA REGIONAL
COLLABORATIVE**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE**

2 **FRIDAY, MARCH 17, 2023 10:00 AM**

3

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GOOD DAY, BOARD MEMBERS IF YOU ARE
6 SIGNED INTO YOUR ZOOM ON YOUR PERSONAL DEVICE AT THE DAIS AND
7 ENSURE YOU'RE SPEAKERS ARE MUTED AND THE MICROPHONE AND CAMERA
8 ARE DISABLED CLICK THE CORRESPONDING ICON IN THE LOWER LEFT
9 SIDE OF THE ZOOM WINDOW UNTIL YOU SEE THE RED LINE THROUGH
10 EACH ICON REMEMBER TO USE THE MICROPHONE ON THE DAIS TO SPEAK
11 INSTEAD OF YOUR LAPTOP OR TABLET WHEN YOUR MICROPHONE IS NOT
12 IN USE PLEASE BE SURE TO TURN YOUR MICROPHONE OFF ABOVE THE
13 CONTROL ROOM YOU WILL SEE THE ON AIR SIGN THE SIGN IS
14 ILLUMINATED WE ARE IN SESSION THE ON AIR SIGN WILL TURN OFF
15 ADDS WE TRANSITION IN BETWEEN MEETINGS.

16

17 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GOOD MORNING. I AM JESSE ARREGUIN CHAIR
18 OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE I WOULD LIKE TO CALL
19 THIS MEETING TO ORDER FOR FRIDAY MARCH 17TH, 2023. AND WE DO
20 NOT NEED TO PLAY THE COVID-19 MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT RECORDING.
21 I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO CONDUCT ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM WHETHER
22 QUORUM OF THE GOVERNING BOARD IS PRESENT.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ARREGUIN?

25



MARCH 17, 2023

1 CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: HERE.

2

3 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: GIOIA?

4

5 JOHN GIOIA: HERE.

6

7 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: BAUTERS IS ABSENT. HAUBERT? IS ABSENT.

8 HUDSON? IS ABSENT. PEDROZA? IS ABSENT. PINE IS ABSENT. RABBITT

9 IS ABSENT, AS WELL. RAMOS?

10

11 BELIA RAMOS: HERE FROM 1195 THIRD STREET IN NAPA CALIFORNIA,

12 SUITE 310.

13

14 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU FOR LISTING YOUR LOCATION.

15 ROSS?

16

17 MARK ROSS: I'M HERE WITH JOHN.

18

19 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. I SEE YOU THERE. [LAUGHTER]

20 EISEN?

21

22 REBECCA EISEN: HERE.

23

24 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. WASSERMAN?

25



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SPERING? THANK YOU. WE HAVE ACHIEVED
4 QUORUM.

5

6 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
7 ITEM TWO, GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS. THIS IS AN
8 INFORMATION ITEM. ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF
9 THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD HERE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM? I
10 DO NOT --

11

12 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** VERY QUICKLY, I WENT TO A VERY LOVELY CEREMONY
13 YESTERDAY AT SPUR NAMING THEIR PUBLIC MEETING ROOM THE ANNE
14 HALSTED HALL. SHE IS WELL REMEMBERED.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU FOR SHARING THAT. WE ALL
17 REMEMBER OUR LATE COLLEAGUE ANNE HALSTED AND ALL SHE DID FOR
18 THE REGION. ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS HERE IN THE BOARDROOM
19 OR ON ZOOM? I'LL ASK IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
20 ANY WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS OR WRITTEN
23 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

24



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
2 ITEM THREE, THE CHAIR'S REPORT. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. I
3 WOULD LIKE TO THANK EVERYONE FOR JOINING US IN-PERSON AND ON
4 ZOOM. TODAY WE WILL NOT ONLY BE RECEIVING THE REPORT ON THE
5 FINAL WORK OF THE SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK
6 THAT'S BEEN A JOINT PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN BCDC, AND MTC WHICH IS
7 A GOOD TABLE SETTING CONVERSATION FOR THE WORK BAY ADAPT WORK
8 CONSIDERED FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN THE BAY AREA TO ADDRESS
9 SEA LEVEL RISE AND ALSO WE'LL BE RECEIVING A PRESENTATION ON
10 THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND A REGIONAL HOUSING
11 MEASURE WHICH I THINK ALIGNS PERFECTLY WITH THE PREVIOUS
12 CONVERSATION GIVEN A POTENTIAL BALLOT MEASURE IN 2024 AND THE
13 NEED TO ALIGN RESILIENCE IN THE WORK WE'LL BE DOING WITH THE
14 BALLOT MEASURE. AND I HAVE NO OTHER ANNOUNCEMENTS. SO IF ARE
15 THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNING
16 BOARD ON MY REPORT? ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. IS THERE ANY
17 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS
18 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I SEE NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AND
21 THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

22

23 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM FOUR,
24 THE CONSENT CALENDAR CONSISTS OF 4A APPROVAL OF THE BARC
25 GOVERNING BOARD MINUTES OF JANUARY 17TH, 2023. THIS IS AN



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ACTION ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE
2 MINUTES? I'LL MOVE APPROVAL FOR THE PURPOSES OF DISCUSSION.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. SECONDED. ANY DISCUSSION ON THE
7 MOTION? SEEING NONE RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS HERE IN THE
8 BOARDROOM AND ASSUMING THERE ARE NO MEMBERS ON ZOOM WISHING TO
9 SPEAK, I'LL NOW ASK IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
10 AND ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT OR WRITTEN COMMENTS ON
13 THIS ITEM. CAN YOU REPEAT WHO HAD THE SECOND?

14

15 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I BELIEVE IT WAS JACK WASSERMAN, AND --
16 [INDISCERNIBLE] BY JIM SPERING.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** UNLESS THERE IS ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION,
21 WE CAN PROCEED TO A ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION TO APPROVE
22 THE MINUTES.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. ARREGUIN?

25



MARCH 17, 2023

1 CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: YES.

2

3 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: BAUTERS IS ABSENT. EISEN?

4

5 REBECCA EISEN: YES.

6

7 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. GIOIA?

8

9 JOHN GIOIA: YES.

10

11 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. HAUBERT IS ABSENT. HUDSON IS
12 ABSENT. PEDROZA IS ABSENT. PINE IS ABSENT. RABBITT IS ABSENT.
13 RAMOS?

14

15 BELIA RAMOS: YES.

16

17 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. ROSS?

18

19 MARK ROSS: YES.

20

21 CLERK, SARINA SEATON: THANK YOU. SPERING? THANK YOU.
22 WASSERMAN?

23

24 ZACK WASSERMAN: YES.

25



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. MOTION CARRIES.

2

3 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THAT BRINGS US TO
4 OUR NEXT ORDER OF BUSINESS. ITEM FIVE IS THE APPOINTMENT OF
5 THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD CHAIR FOR 2023 TO 2025. THIS IS AN
6 ACTION ITEM. AND I WOULD LIKE TO RECOGNIZE SUPERVISOR RAMOS ON
7 THIS ITEM.

8

9 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. SUPER SPERING -- SUPERVISOR
10 EMERITUS SPERING AND I SERVED AS THE NOMINATION COMMITTEE AND
11 AS THE COMMITTEE WILL RECALL, WE MADE A RECOMMENDATION FOR THE
12 CHAIR POSITION TO BE MAYOR ARREGUIN, BUT WE WANTED TO WAIT FOR
13 THE VICE CHAIR POSITION UNTIL OUR MEMBER AGENCIES HAD AN
14 OPPORTUNITY TO APPOINT THEIR REPRESENTATIVES, AS IS CUSTOMARY
15 FOR BARC, WE HAVE A ROTATION AS TO LEADERSHIP POSITIONS AND IN
16 THAT ROTATION THIS NEXT TERM FOR VICE CHAIR WOULD CUSTOMARILY
17 FALL TO BCDC, AND IT IS THE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION, AND
18 I'M HAPPY TO MOVE THE NOMINATION OF COMMITTEE MEMBER ZACK
19 WASSERMAN WHO IS THE BCDC REP FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION AS VICE
20 CHAIR.

21

22 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU TO BCDC
23 ZACK WASSERMAN FOR AGREEING TO SERVE AS OUR VICE CHAIR. IS
24 THERE ANY DISCUSSION FROM MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNING BOARD ON
25 THE MOTION? COMMISSIONER WASSERMAN, WANT TO SAY A FEW WORDS?



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** TECH STAFF, I AM ON THE ZOOM SO IF YOU
5 COULD MOVE ME OVER TO PANELIST SO I CAN MONITOR THE ZOOM TOO,
6 I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. AND ARE THERE ANY GOVERNING BOARD
7 MEMBERS ON ZOOM WHO WISH TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? I DON'T SEE
8 ANY RAISED HANDS. OKAY WE'LL PROCEED TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM
9 FIVE, WHICH IS THE MOTION TO APPOINT BCDC CHAIR ZACK WASSERMAN
10 AS THE VICE CHAIR OF THE GOVERNING BOARD. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC
11 MEMBERS WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NONE PRESENT IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO
14 HANDS RAISED ONLINE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WITH THAT LET'S PROCEED TO A ROLL CALL
17 VOTE ON THE MOTION.

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ARREGUIN?

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BAUTERS IS ABSENT. EISEN?

24

25 **REBECCA EISEN:** YES.



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

3

4 **JOHN GIOIA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT? IS ABSENT. HUDSON? IS ABSENT.

7 PEDROZA IS ABSENT. PINE IS ABSENT. RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

8

9 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ROSS?

12

13 **MARK ROSS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SPERING?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

20

21 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES.

24



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
2 CONGRATULATIONS. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU IN THIS
3 NEW CAPACITY AND THANK YOU FOR STEPPING UP AND SERVING BARC.
4 OKAY. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM FIVE WHICH ARE THE BARC
5 AGENCY EXECUTIVE MEMBER UPDATES AND FIFE A IS THE REPORT FROM
6 THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, AND WE'RE JOINED
7 THIS MORNING BY THE NEW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DR. PHILIPPE FINE
8 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR JOINING US TODAY. IT WAS A BIG WEEK
9 FOR THE AIR DISTRICT. LOOKING FORWARD TO YOUR REPORT.

10

11 **PHILIPP FINE:** THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. I'LL USE THIS TIME TO
12 INTRODUCE MYSELF THEN TALK ABOUT THE BIG DAY YESTERDAY. MY
13 NAME IS PHILIPPE FINE THIS IS THE END OF MY FOURTH WEEK IN THE
14 JOB AS THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER. I HAVE SPENT MY WHOLE CAREER IN
15 ENVIRONMENT AIR QUALITY SCIENCE POLICY STARTING AS AN
16 ACADEMIC, WAS A PROFESSOR AT USC FOR A WHILE AND SPENT 15
17 YEARS AT THE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA VERSION OF THE BAY AREA AQMD
18 AND THE SOUTH COAST AQMD WHICH IS ABOUT OVER TWICE THE SIZE AS
19 THE BAY AREA AQMD. I GREW UP IN THE BAY AREA AND WORKED TWO
20 YEARS IN DC AS AN APPOINTEE FOR THE BIDEN ADMINISTRATION AT US
21 EPA AND WAS DOING MOST OF MY PORTFOLIO IN ENVIRONMENTAL
22 JUSTICE ISSUES. I'M HAPPY TO BE HERE, GETTING TO KNOW STAFF
23 AND BOARD MEMBERS, IT'S GOOD TO MEET YOU. I COULD SHARE MORE
24 BUT I DON'T WANT TO TAKE TOO MUCH TIME TODAY. YESTERDAY WAS A
25 BIG DAY FOR THE AIR DISTRICT. OUR BOARD PASSED 20 TO ZERO WITH



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ONE ABSTENTION RULE BEGINNING TO PHASE OUT NITROGEN OXIDE
2 EMITTING WATER HEATERS AND FURNACES NOT UNTIL 2027 AND 2029
3 WITH DIFFERENT COMPLIANCE DATES UPON REPLACEMENT OF YOUR
4 EQUIPMENT NEW SALES AND INSTALLATION BENEFITS WILL BE FELT
5 OVER TIME. IT WAS A BIG DAY NOW THE HARD WORK BEGINS WE HAVE
6 AN IMPLEMENTATION WORKING GROUP TO ADDRESS A NUMBER OF ISSUES,
7 ONE OF THE BIGGEST ONES IS MAKING SURE THIS GETS IMPLEMENTED
8 EQUITABLY AND THE COST OF THIS UPGRADE WHICH COULD HAPPEN IN
9 MANY CASES IS WE'RE ABLE TO HELP WITH COSTS WITH INCENTIVE
10 PROGRAMS TAX CREDITS AND OTHER ESPECIALLY FOR LOW-INCOME
11 RESIDENTS ON FIXED INCOME RESIDENTS FIRST DEADLINES IN 2027
12 YEARS PRIOR TO THAT REPORTING BACK TO THE BOARD ON
13 IMPLEMENTATION TRYING TO POOL AND MAKE INCENTIVES EASIER TO
14 ACCESS MAKING SURE THEY'RE FOCUSED ON THE RESIDENTS WHO NEED
15 IT MOST. YOU WILL HEAR MORE AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN THE
16 IMPLEMENTATION WORKING GROUP THIS IS GOING TO MAKE A
17 DIFFERENCE IN THE PUBLIC HEALTH IN THE BAY AREA. THAT'S ALL I
18 HAVE TODAY. I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL IN THE
19 FUTURE.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WELCOME BACK TO
22 THE BAY AREA. THIS IS FIRST IN THE NATION. AND IT'S REALLY A
23 MOMENTOUS STEP FOR THE REGION AND JUST VERY GRATEFUL FOR THE
24 LEADERSHIP OF THE AIR DISTRICT AND THE AIR DISTRICT BOARD FOR
25 ADOPTING THIS NEW REGULATION.



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **PHILIPP FINE:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR
5 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNING BOARD? SEEING NO
6 COMMENTS ON ZOOM AS WELL. NEXT IS THE REPORT FROM THE BAY AREA
7 REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD AND I'LL TURN THE FLOOR
8 OVER TO EILEEN WHITE EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF THE WATER BOARD.

9

10 **EILEEN WHITE:** LAST WEEK WE PRESENTED AND I SAW OPPORTUNITY TO
11 DEVELOP A DOCUMENT THAT COMMUNICATES THE PUBLIC WORK THE WATER
12 BOARD TEAM DOES EVERY DAY TO PROTECT WATER QUALITY I REALIZE
13 IN PUBLICLY MEETINGS PEOPLE AREN'T SURE WHAT THE WATER BOARD
14 DOES, EPA, OR THE STATE AND COUNTY SO A WORK PLAN WAS
15 DEVELOPED TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF THE WORK WE DO TO CREATE
16 TRANSPARENCY OF THE WORK WE DO AND DESCRIBES OVERARCHING
17 ORGANIZATIONAL PRIORITIES AND WATER QUALITIES TO IMPLEMENT
18 EVERY DAY WE ACHIEVE TO PROTECT PRESERVE AND ENHANCE WATER
19 QUALITY OF THE BAY AREA RESOURCES WILL BE USED FOR EDUCATIONAL
20 PURPOSES WHEN WE GO OUT INTO THE PUBLIC ESPECIALLY AS WE MEET
21 WITH COMMUNITIES ORGANIZATIONS TO ENHANCE RELATIONSHIPS, WE
22 USE IT TO RETAIN AND ENGAGE A WORKFORCE THAT REFLECTS THE
23 COMMUNITY WE SERVE. I WANT TO TOUCH ON OUR ORGANIZATIONAL
24 PRIORITIES I DON'T NEED TO GO INTO THE WATER QUALITY PROGRAMS
25 BUT TWO IN PARTICULAR THAT TIE INTO TODAY'S MEETING IS CLIMATE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ACTION AND OUR ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND RACIAL EQUITY. THE
2 WATER BOARD WANTS TO BE ABLE TO EXECUTE TO THE PUBLIC THE
3 STRATEGIC WORK PLAN THAT WE INCORPORATE CLIMATE ACTION INTO
4 ALL PROGRAM ACTIVITIES AND UTILIZE OUR AUTHORITY TO ADVANCE
5 CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING, COORDINATION, TECHNICAL
6 ASSISTANCE AND PERMITTING AND WE RECOGNIZE THAT ADDRESSING
7 CLIMATE CHANGE IS CRITICAL FOR THE LONG-TERM PROTECTION OF
8 WATER QUALITY AND THAT WE NEED TO WORK COLLABORATIVELY WITH
9 ALL STAKEHOLDERS HERE IN THE BAY AREA AND OTHER AGENCIES AND
10 THAT'S ONE OF THE BEAUTIES OF THE BARC ROUTE. AND THE SECOND
11 ORGANIZATIONAL PRIORITY IS OUR ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND
12 RACIAL EQUITY AND WE'RE NOW PRIZING OUR WATER QUALITY PROGRAMS
13 TO PROTECT THE WATER QUALITY AND BENEFICIAL USES IN
14 COMMUNITIES THAT EXPERIENCED HISTORIC RACISM AND ENVIRONMENTAL
15 JUSTICE. WE'RE PARTICULARLY LOOKING AT OUR GROUNDWATER PROGRAM
16 AND HOW CONTAMINANTS CAN BE MOBILIZED WITH SEA LEVEL RISE SO
17 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THIS PRESENTATION LATER TODAY. AND
18 THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, EILEEN. ARE THERE
21 ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNING BOARD
22 ON THE REPORT FROM THE REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD?
23 OKAY SEEING NO RAISED HANDS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM. THANK
24 YOU VERY MUCH FOR JOINING US THIS MORNING AND I AM SURE YOU
25 WILL FIND THE DISCUSSION AROUND THE SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION



MARCH 17, 2023

1 FUNDING RELEVANT TO THE WORK THAT YOUR BOARD IS ENGAGED IN.
2 WE'LL PROCEED NOW TO THE NEXT REPORT WHICH IS FROM THE
3 ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
4 COMMISSION. I BELIEVE BRAD PAUL WILL BE GIVING THIS REPORT.

5

6 **BRAD PAUL:** THAT'S CORRECT MR. PRESIDENT. BRAD PAUL DEPUTY
7 DIRECTOR OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES MTC AND ABAG I'LL START
8 OUT WITH THE RHNA HOUSE NEEDS ASSESSMENT, I DON'T HAVE TO TELL
9 YOU HOW IMPORTANT AND CRITICAL THAT IS AND HOW CONTROVERSIAL
10 IT'S BEEN IN THE SIXTH CYCLE RHNA, THE WE GET THAT ARE GUIDING
11 OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS IN EVERY CITY AND TOWN IN THE REGION.
12 A.B. 101 CREATED FRAMEWORK FOR DISCUSSION AROUND RHNA REFORM.
13 ABAG DID 28 HEARINGS OVER A NUMBER OF DAYS AND HEARD A LOT OF
14 COMPLAINTS ABOUT THE WAY RHNA IS SET UP AND HOW THEY HAVE TO
15 COMPLY WITH IT. SO THERE WILL BE A DISCUSSION STARTING NOW
16 ABOUT HOW TO REFORM RHNA TO IMPROVE IT FOR THE NEXT CYCLE,
17 CYCLE SEVEN. AND THE OFFICIAL TITLE, I WANT TO GET THIS RIGHT
18 IS THE CALIFORNIA'S HOUSING FUTURE 2040 THE NEXT RHNA
19 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS. WHICH THE OFFICE OF HOUSING
20 AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT IS BEGINNING TO WORK WITH THE
21 PUBLIC, ELECTED OFFICIALS, AND THE OFFICE OF PLANNING AND
22 RESEARCH TO REALLY LOOK AT OVER THE REST OF THE YEAR HOW WE
23 COULD IMPROVE THE PROCESS. AND OUR PRINCIPLE PLANNER, GILLIAN
24 ADAMS WHO LED ABAG'S RHNA WORK OVER THE PAST SEVERAL CYCLES
25 WILL SERVE ON THE STAKEHOLDER COMMITTEE ADVISER EFFORT TO KEEP



MARCH 17, 2023

1 AND YOU OUR BOARD APPRISED IN THE PROCESS OVER THE COMING
2 YEAR. SO STAY TUNED ON THAT. NEXT ITEM IS THE ABAG MTC
3 DELEGATION VISIT IN SACRAMENTO, FEBRUARY 28TH TO MARCH 1ST TO
4 MEET WITH STATE LEADERS AND ADVOCATE FOR MTC ABAG'S JOINT 2023
5 STATE ADVOCACY PRIORITIES. THE LEADERSHIP OF BOTH AGENCIES WAS
6 THERE IN SACRAMENTO WITH SENIOR STAFF AND THE TALKS INCLUDED A
7 REQUEST FOR STATE ASSISTANCE TO MITIGATE THE IMPENDING TRANSIT
8 OPERATIONS FISCAL CLIFF THAT YOU HAVE BEEN READING ABOUT IN
9 THE PRESS AND ALSO TO SUPPORT ASSEMBLY BILL -- I'M SORRY --
10 ASSEMBLY HOUSING COMMITTEE CHAIR BUFFY WICKS BILL A.B. 1319
11 WHICH IS THE BAHFA CLEAN UP BILL. YOU WILL BE HEARING MORE
12 ABOUT BAHFA LATER. APPLICATIONS ARE NOW BEING ACCEPTED FOR THE
13 2023 NORMAN MINETA BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY. AND THIS IS OPEN -
14 - SPONSORED BY MTC, ABAG, THE AIR DISTRICT AND BCDC AND WE'RE
15 PUTTING ON A PAID REMOTE LEARNING EXPERIENCE TO ENCOURAGE
16 YOUTH IN THE REGION PARTICULARLY THOSE FROM UNDERREPRESENTED
17 BACKGROUNDS TO LEARN ABOUT REGIONAL GOVERNMENT AND CONSIDER A
18 CAREER IN PUBLIC SERVICE. STUDENTS HAVE UNTIL APRIL 17TH TO
19 APPLY AND YOU CAN GO TO MTC OR YOUR OTHER WEB SITES TO SEE HOW
20 TO DO THAT AND WE WOULD ASK YOU TO SHARE THIS WITH YOUR
21 CONSTITUENTS AND NETWORKS. AND, FINALLY, LOOKING AHEAD, MTC
22 AND ABAG DELEGATION WILL VISIT WASHINGTON, D.C. MARCH 26TH
23 THROUGH 29th TO MEET WITH LEADERS AND ADVOCATE FOR MTC AND
24 ABAG'S JOINT 2023 FEDERAL ADVOCACY PRIORITIES AND THAT
25 CONCLUDES MY REPORT.



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, BRAD. ARE THERE
3 ANY QUESTIONS? YES, FORMER SUPERVISOR -- SUPERVISOR FOR LIFE,
4 SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** TALKING ABOUT BEING FORGOTTEN REAL QUICK.
7 [LAUGHTER] BRAD, CAN YOU TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE RHNA?
8 WHAT WAS THE MOST COMPLAINTS YOU WERE GETTING ABOUT IT FROM
9 JURISDICTIONS? AND WHY THE REFORM?

10

11 **BRAD PAUL:** I'LL TRY TO SUMMARIZE A COUPLE OF THEM ONE OF THEM
12 WAS THAT, I THINK JURISDICTIONS UNDERSTAND THEY HAVE TO DO
13 BETTER TO PRODUCE MORE HOUSING AND THE WAY THE RULES AND
14 SCHEDULE IS SET UP IS THERE IS A CRUNCH GOING ON RIGHT NOW TO
15 GET YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT INTO HCD AND GET IT APPROVED. SO
16 THERE IS A LOT OF COMPLAINT ABOUT THE SHORT AMOUNT OF TIME
17 PEOPLE HAD WHEN THE FINAL NUMBERS WERE GIVEN TO THEM AND THEY
18 HAD TO DO THE WORK. NOW ABAG AND MTC IS PROVIDED AS ONE OF OUR
19 BOARD MEMBERS LAST NIGHT AT ABAG SAID, AN UNPRECEDENTED AMOUNT
20 OF LOCAL SUPPORT THROUGH GRANTS, THROUGH TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE,
21 THROUGH DATA PACKETS THAT YOU CAN PLUG INTO YOUR COMPUTER TO
22 POPULATE PARTS OF YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT APPLICATION TO HCD BUT
23 EVEN WITH ALL THAT THERE HAS BEEN A BIG CRUNCH AT THE END.
24 THAT'S ONE COMPLAINT. ANOTHER CONCERN HAS BEEN ABOUT HOW TO
25 REACH THESE NUMBERS. SO IF YOU LOOK AT THE PAST FEW CYCLES, WE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 HAVE MET, OR EXCEEDED IN MOST JURISDICTIONS, THE REQUIREMENTS
2 FOR MARKET RATE HOUSING, WHERE JURISDICTIONS HAVE FELL SHORT
3 IS AROUND LOW, MODERATE AND VERY LOW-INCOME HOUSING. AND IN
4 ORDER TO BUILD THAT, YOU NEED A LOT OF SUPPORT, A LOT OF
5 SUBSIDY. AND THE STATE HAS PROVIDED SOME SUBSIDY BUT NOT
6 ENOUGH TO DO THAT. TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE AND YOU WILL HEAR
7 ABOUT THIS FROM BAHFA LATER. ONE OF THE PILOT PROGRAMS FUND BY
8 THE STATE TWO YEARS AGO LOOKED AT THE HOUSING PIPELINE FOR THE
9 REGION AND DISCOVERED THERE ARE 395 PROJECTS AT SOME STAGE OF
10 DEVELOPMENT IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW. AND THEY WILL CREATE
11 33,000 LOW-INCOME UNITS WHICH WILL GO A LONG WAY TOWARD
12 MEETING JURISDICTION'S AFFORDABLE RHNA REQUIREMENTS BUT IN
13 ORDER TO COMPLETE THOSE 33,000 UNITS WE NEED AN ADDITIONAL \$7
14 BILLION OF SUBSIDY. THE GOOD NEWS IS AND YOU WILL MORE ABOUT
15 THIS LATER BAHFA AND ABAG AND MTC BOARDS HAVE BEEN INSTRUCTED
16 TO BEGIN TO LOOK AT PUTTING SOMETHING ON THE BALLOT FOR THE
17 REGION THAT WOULD GENERATE 10 TO \$20 BILLION OVER THE NEXT TEN
18 YEAR WHICH WOULD BE A LONG WAY TOWARDS FUNDING THOSE 33,000
19 UNITS. THOSE ARE THE BIGGEST CONCERNS, TIMING, SCHEDULE, AND
20 LACK OF RESOURCES FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS THAT WANT TO BUILD
21 MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING BUT CAN'T ACCESS THE SUBSIDIES TO DO
22 IT.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I HOPE WE DON'T WATER DOWN THE REQUIREMENTS
25 AND WE HAVE JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE REALLY IGNORED, YOU KNOW,



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THIS SHORTAGE EVER HOUSING, ESPECIALLY IN CERTAIN COMMUNITIES.
2 WE'RE FORCING PEOPLE TO DO THESE LONG COMMUTES, AND I JUST AM
3 VERY CONCERNED THAT MTC OR ABAG SUPPORTS ANYTHING THAT TAKES
4 PRESSURE OFF THE COMMUNITIES THAT REALLY NEED TO STEP UP TO
5 START PRODUCING SOME AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THANK YOU BRAD. THANK
6 YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** COMMISSIONER SPERING ON THAT, I AGREE
9 WITH YOU BUT THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT HAVE ARISEN IN THE
10 PROCESS OF US DEVELOPING AND SUBMITTING AND WAITING FOR
11 CERTIFICATION FROM THE STATE FOR HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE
12 SUBMITTED OURS FOUR TIMES TO THE STATE AND WE GOT A LETTER THE
13 DAY BEFORE THE DEADLINE SAYING, EVEN THOUGH WE HAVE BEEN IN
14 COMMUNICATION WITH YOU FOR A YEAR AND A HALF ABOUT YOUR DRAFT
15 HOUSING ELEMENT YOU HAVE ALL THESE THINGS TO CORRECT AND IT
16 WAS TOO LATE TO DO IT BEFORE THE JANUARY 31ST DEADLINE. AND
17 THEY HAVE A HUGE STACK OF THESE HOUSING ELEMENTS THAT THEY'RE
18 GOING THROUGH RIGHT NOW. I THINK ONLY -- WHAT? PROBABLY LESS
19 THAN TEN JURISDICTIONS IN THE BAY AREA HAVE GOTTEN THEIRS
20 CERTIFIED, BUT THAT'S WAY BETTER THAN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA.
21 THAT'S A TESTAMENT TO THE FACT THAT CITIES AND COUNTIES IN THE
22 BAY AREA DO RECOGNIZE THE SIGNIFICANT SHORTAGE OF HOUSING AND
23 ARE STEPPING FORWARD TO MEET THE RESPONSIBILITY TO PLAN FOR
24 THAT HOUSING. AND I THINK IT'S REALLY A TESTAMENT TO THE
25 REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM THAT ABAG



MARCH 17, 2023

1 LAUNCHED, AND ALL THE RESOURCES THAT OUR STAFF HAVE PROVIDED
2 AND I REALLY JUST WANT TO COMMEND OUR STAFF WHO HAVE REALLY
3 WORKED VERY CLOSELY WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT, STAFF, AND
4 GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS TO HELP THEM DO THE WORK OF UPDATING
5 THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS BUT A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT CAME UP
6 LAST NIGHT WE HAD AN EXTENSIVE DISCUSSION AT THE ABAG
7 EXECUTIVE BOARD ABOUT THIS VERY ISSUE. ONE, THERE IS A LACK OF
8 CLARITY ABOUT WHEN THE BUILDERS REMEDY APPLIES AND STATUTE
9 SAYS THAT THE JURISDICTION CAN EITHER GET THEIR HOUSING
10 ELEMENTS CERTIFIED BY THE STATE OR ADOPT THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT
11 BY THE DEADLINE AND MAKE FINDINGS THAT IT'S SUBSTANTIALLY
12 COMPLIANT. SOME JURISDICTIONS HAVE DONE THAT. THEY HAVEN'T
13 GOTTEN IT CERTIFIED BUT ATTESTED THAT IT'S SUBSTANTIALLY
14 COMPLIANT THAT'S WHAT WE ADVISE JURISDICTIONS TO DO STAFF SAYS
15 ONE THING AND HCD IS APPLYING IT DIFFERENTLY THERE NEEDS TO BE
16 CLARIFICATION ON THAT. AND ALSO IN CASES OF GOOD FAITH
17 COMPLIANCE, THERE NEEDS TO BE A LITTLE BIT MORE FLEXIBILITY ON
18 THE TIMELINES. IF YOU ARE A BAD ACTOR AND HAVEN'T ADOPTED YOUR
19 HOUSING ELEMENT OR SUBMITTED FOR REVIEW, THEN HCD SHOULDN'T
20 GIVE LEEWAY BUT THERE IS NO FLEXIBILITY IN THE STATUTE AND
21 THAT'S ACTUALLY IN OUR ADVOCACY PLATFORM FOR MTC AND ABAG IS
22 LOOKING AT LEGISLATION AROUND GIVING DISCRETION AROUND
23 FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF THE TIMELINE. ULTIMATELY WHAT THIS
24 ILLUSTRATES IS WE NEED MORE RESOURCES. SO I HOPE THERE WILL BE
25 A REAP 3.0 AT SOME POINT SO WE CAN SUSTAIN THE TECHNICAL



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ASSISTANCE THAT WE PROVIDED LOCAL JURISDICTIONS BECAUSE
2 GETTING A HOUSING ELEMENT PASSED IS THE FIRST STEP. THEN YOU
3 HAVE TO APPROVE HOUSING AND DEMONSTRATE AND REPORT COMPLIANCE
4 TO THE STATE AND THE STATE IS AGGRESSIVELY GOING TO MONITOR
5 COMPLIANCE. THERE IS A ROLE FOR US TO PLAY AT ABAG AND MTC TO
6 HELP PROVIDE THAT ONGOING SUPPORT AND I THINK THERE IS A ROLE
7 FOR THE STATE TO HELP SUPPORT THE COGS TO CONTINUE TO PROVIDE
8 THOSE RESOURCES. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A DISCUSSION AT THE ABAG
9 EXECUTIVE BOARD ABOUT THIS OVERALL ISSUE ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED
10 THIS SIXTH CYCLE. BECAUSE WE KEPT EXTENSIVE NOTES WHEN WE HAD
11 THE 28 APPEAL HEARINGS AROUND THINGS THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE
12 CLARIFIED OR IMPROVEMENTS IN THE PROCESS BUT THE GOAL IS NOT
13 TO BACK AWAY FROM OUR COMMITMENT TO PLAN AND BUILD MORE
14 HOUSING. I APPRECIATE YOU ASKING ABOUT THIS. I WANTED TO SHARE
15 THIS BECAUSE IT'S FRESH ON MY MIND WE HAD AN HOUR AND A HALF
16 DISCUSSION.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I UNDERSTAND THE LANGUAGE AND THE CLEANING
19 UP THE PROCESS BUT I'M CONCERNED THAT JURISDICTIONS THAT
20 HAVEN'T BEEN BUILDING HOUSING THAT THEY GET A PASS ON THIS WE
21 HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT DOESN'T HAPPEN.

22

23 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THE STATE IS TAKING THIS VERY SERIOUSLY
24 BETWEEN THE HOUSING STRIKE FORCE, BETWEEN HCD'S VERY PROACTIVE
25 COMPLIANCE. THE GOVERNOR HAS MADE THIS A KEY PRIORITY AND I



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
2 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD ON THIS
3 ITEM? OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANYONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM. SO
4 WE CAN PROCEED TO THE LAST AGENCY REPORT, WHICH IS FROM THE
5 SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION. AND
6 JESSICA ARE YOU GIVING THE REPORT TODAY?

7

8 **JESSICA FAIN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND GOOD MORNING BOARD
9 MEMBERS. I'M JESSICA FAIN, BCDC'S PLANNING DIRECTOR FILLING IN
10 TODAY FOR LARRY GOLDZBAND WHO IS IN LOS ANGELES AT THE
11 CALIFORNIA NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCIES DIRECTORS MEETING TODAY,
12 SO CAN'T WITH BE US. BCDC HAS BEEN ADVANCING RISING SEA LEVEL
13 ADAPTATION THROUGH OUR BAY ADAPT INITIATIVE. IN JANUARY WE
14 KICKED OFF ONE PART OF THE IMPLEMENTATION DEVELOPING A
15 REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTATION PLAN WITH AN ELECTED OFFICIALS
16 TASK FORCE. AND I WANT TO PULL UP THE SLIDES TO SHOW THE
17 MEMBERS OF THIS NEW GROUP THAT'S GOING TO BE WORKING WITH US.
18 THE TASK FORCE IS COMPRISED OF TWO ELECTED OFFICIALS FROM EACH
19 COUNTY SELECTED BY BCDC COMMISSIONERS FROM EACH COUNTY,
20 CHAIRED BY JOHN GIOIA, THE FIRST SIX EXTENDING FROM ALL THE
21 WAY UP TO THE NAPA RIVER, SAN RAFAEL, EAST PALO ALTO, SANTA
22 CLARA, NEXT SLIDE. AMERICAN CANYON, TOLEDO, SONOMA, SAN
23 FRANCISCO, FAIRFIELD, SAN FRANCISCO, ONE MORE, HAYWARD,
24 SUNNYVALE, MENLO PARK, PETALUMA RICHMOND AND MARTINEZ. A GREAT
25 GROUP OF FOLKS WHO ARE GOING TO BE WORKING WITH US CLOSELY AS



MARCH 17, 2023

1 WE ADVANCE THIS WORK AND IT'S CRITICAL THAT WE'RE DOING SO IN
2 CLOSE PARTNERSHIP WITH CITIES AS WE MOVE FORWARD. WE LAUNCHED
3 A TECHNICAL ADVISORY GROUP TO SUPPORT THIS WORK, COMPRISED OF
4 STAFF FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, TECHNICAL EXPERTS, AND EJ
5 COMMUNITIES AND OTHERS WHO ARE GOING TO BE SUPPORTING US WE'RE
6 EXCITED TO LAUNCH THE WORK AND EXPECT TO HEAR MORE AS WE MOVE
7 FORWARD WITH IT THIS YEAR. ADDITIONALLY, THANKS TO FUNDING FOR
8 THE BAY ADAPT IMPLEMENTATION FROM THE STATE COASTAL
9 CONSERVANCY AND STATE OCEAN PROTECTION COUNCIL WE HAVE BEEN
10 ABLE TO HIRE SEVERAL NEW LEADERSHIP POSITIONS TO SUPPORT THE
11 WORK INCLUDES A BRAND-NEW POSITION INCLUDING ASSISTANT
12 PLANNING DIRECTOR FOR CLIMATE ADAPTATION; OUR VERY OWN DANA
13 BRECHWALD, A NEW ASSISTANT REGULATORY DIRECTOR FOR CLIMATE
14 ADAPTATION. THIS IS A NEW POSITION TO LOOK AT OUR REGULATORY
15 PROGRAM, HOW WE CAN ADAPT, FILLED BY ETHAN LEVINE, PREVIOUSLY
16 THE PERMITTING MANAGER OF THE SHORELINE DEVELOPMENT, AND
17 SENIOR MANAGER FOR CLIMATE EQUITY PHOENIX ARMENTA WHO RECENTLY
18 JOINED OUR STAFF FROM WEST OAKLAND ENVIRONMENTAL INDICATORS
19 PROJECT WHO WILL BE FILLING THAT POSITION AND AMONG OTHERS YOU
20 WILL BE HEARING FROM DANA AND RACHAEL FROM MTC ABOUT THE
21 PROJECT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TOGETHER ABOUT THE FUNDING
22 CLIMATE ADAPTATION AND SPECIFICALLY SHORELINE ADAPTATION AND
23 COLLABORATION EFFORT AND PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN BCDC, MTC AND
24 ABAG AND ONE THAT WE HOPE CAN SPUR DISCUSSION AND HOPEFULLY
25 MORE IMPORTANT ACTION AROUND THIS IMPORTANT TOPIC. THANK YOU.



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

3

4 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** I WANT TO EMPHASIZE ONE OF THE COMMENTS THAT
5 JESSICA REPORTED ON AND THAT'S OUR LOCAL ELECTED TASK FORCE.
6 THIS IS REALLY VERY IMPORTANT PART OF NOT ONLY ROLLING OUT BUT
7 MAKING SURE, AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE, THAT BAY ADAPT AND THE
8 REGIONAL SUSTAINABLE SHORELINE PLAN WHICH HAS MANY TITLES --
9 [LAUGHTER] SOME DAY WE'LL DECIDE ON THE REAL TITLE, TO THE
10 LOCAL ENTITIES TO MAKE SURE THAT, A, THEY KNOW WHAT'S GOING
11 ON, THAT, B, WE'RE HEARING THEIR VOICES. BECAUSE AT THAT LOCAL
12 LEVEL IS WHERE THESE PROJECTS ARE REALLY GOING TO BE DEVELOPED
13 AND APPROVED. AND IT IS A CRITICAL PART OF MOVING GOALS.

14

15 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON
16 THE REPORT FROM BCDC? I DON'T SEE ANY GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS
17 ON ZOOM WITH RAISED HANDS. OKAY. SO, THANK YOU, ONCE AGAIN,
18 JESSICA, THANK YOU BCDC FOR ALL THE WORK YOU'RE DOING TO
19 ADDRESS THE GROWING SEA LEVEL RISE AND THAT'S A GOOD
20 TRANSITION TO OUR CONVERSATION LATER. THAT COMPLETES ITEM
21 FIVE. WE CAN NOW PROCEED TO ITEM SIX WHICH IS THE BARC
22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR UPDATE. AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO

23

24 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN. MY UPDATE IS BRIEF
25 TODAY. I'LL HAVE MORE AT OUR MAY MEETING. AS YOU KNOW WE'RE IN



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THE MIDST OF A SYSTEMS MAPPING PROJECT TO LAY THE FOUNDATION
2 FOR WHAT'S IN OUR SHARED WORK PLAN WHICH IS THE DEVELOPMENT OF
3 A REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD ADAPTATION PLAN AS WELL AS A COMPANION
4 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM THAT OUR AGENCIES THAT ARE PART
5 OF BARC CAN WORK ON TOGETHER TO PROVIDE SUPPORT TO CITIES AND
6 COUNTIES MUCH LIKE WE HEARD FROM THE HOUSING TECHNICAL
7 ASSISTANCE THAT'S BEEN PROVIDED TO CITIES FROM THE HOUSING
8 ELEMENT PROCESS. SO, AS PART OF THAT, WE HAVE A NUMBER OF
9 THINGS GOING ON CURRENTLY. WE'RE KIND OF IN THE MIDDLE OF THIS
10 PROJECT. AND BUILDING OFF OF, ACTUALLY, WHAT EILEEN WHITE
11 SHARED. ONE OF THE THINGS WE HEARD WHEN WE WERE DOING THE
12 DEVELOPING AND GETTING INPUT ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SHARED
13 WORK PLAN WAS FROM STAKEHOLDERS SAYING, WOULDN'T IT BE NICE
14 JUST TO HAVE, IN ONE PLACE, A SENSE OF WHAT EACH OF THE
15 AGENCIES THAT ARE PART OF BARC, WHAT THEIR RESPONSIBILITIES
16 ARE AND WHAT THEIR DOING IN THE AREA OF CLIMATE ADAPTATION.
17 SO, AS PART OF THIS INFORMATION COLLECTING PROCESS, WE ARE IN
18 THE MIDST OF, THERE IS A SURVEY OUT CURRENTLY TO STAKEHOLDERS
19 TO PROVIDE INPUT ON THE KINDS OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THEY'RE
20 RECEIVING OR PROVIDING SO USING THAT TO INFORM GIVE US A LAY
21 OF THE LAND IN TERMS OF TYPES OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE BEING
22 PROVIDED BY THE REGIONAL AGENCIES. WE'RE WORKING WITH BAYCAN
23 ON THAT, THE BAY AREA REGIONAL -- WHAT IS IT? BAYCAN, CLIMATE
24 ACTION NETWORK, AND THEY'RE A MEMBERSHIP, PARTNERSHIP AMONG
25 CBOS, CITIES, COUNTIES, SPECIAL DISTRICTS. SO THERE IS A



MARCH 17, 2023

1 SURVEY OUT. WE'RE IN THE MIDST OF GETTING INPUT FROM THAT.
2 THERE IS FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
3 ORGANIZATIONS, THAT'S OCCURRING NEXT WEEK, AS WELL AS FOCUS
4 GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH CITIES AND COUNTIES, AS WELL, THAT ARE
5 SCHEDULED. WE HAVE SCHEDULED MEETINGS WITH STAFF TEAMS FROM
6 EACH OF YOUR AGENCIES TO PARTICIPATE IN INFORMATION GATHERING.
7 THE TEAM LED BY AECOM HAS ALREADY DONE A LOT OF RESEARCH
8 COLLECT HAD ALL THE WORK THAT'S HAPPENING WITH AGENCIES, AT
9 LEAST WHAT'S AVAILABLE THROUGH WEB SITE, THROUGH REPORTS AND
10 PLANNING DOCUMENTS THAT CAPTURE ADAPTATION PLANNING OR EFFORTS
11 UNDERWAY BY EACH OF THE MEMBER AGENCIES THIS IS UNDERWAY BY
12 STAFF SO WE'RE SCHEDULING THOSE. WE WILL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY
13 TO MEET WITH THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, DEPUTY DIRECTORS AND
14 PLANNING DIRECTORS TO GO THROUGH THIS INFORMATION THAT'S BEING
15 GATHERED, AND WE WOULD LIKE TO SCHEDULE MORE OF A WORKSHOP
16 FORMAT WITH YOU ALL AT OUR MAY MEETING TO REALLY DIG INTO THE
17 FINDINGS AND REALLY FACILITATE MORE OF A DISCUSSION AND GET
18 FEEDBACK. I THINK IT WILL BE REALLY INTERESTING, EVEN THE
19 PRELIMINARY INFORMATION. BECAUSE YOU'RE GOING TO SEE THESE
20 SYSTEM MAPS ARE REALLY CAPTURING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE
21 AGENCIES, THE RANGE OF EFFORTS UNDERWAY, WHERE THERE ARE GAPS
22 AND OVERLAPS. SO WE'LL REALLY BE ABLE TO DIG INTO THAT AND
23 RAISE FURTHER QUESTIONS THAT WILL LEAD TO KIND OF FURTHER
24 WORK. THIS IS REALLY AN ITERATIVE PROCESS AND AS BOARD MEMBER
25 GIOIA EXPRESSED AT OUR LAST MEETING, THERE IS A LOT OF PEOPLE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 WE NEED TO BE TALKING TO. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE -- AND WE
2 KNOW THAT, AND I THINK WE'RE GOING TO GATHER AS MUCH
3 INFORMATION AS WE CAN, AND KNOWING THIS IS AN ONGOING PROCESS
4 AND WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO KEEP REFINING IT. AND THERE IS JUST
5 WORK CONTINUING AND THERE IS ONGOING WORK AND EFFORTS UNDERWAY
6 AND WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM ONE OF THE FUNDING INVESTMENT
7 FRAMEWORK, WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM RACHAEL AND DANA IN A BIT
8 THAT DEMONSTRATES THAT THIS IS A -- I WON'T SAY A MOVING
9 TARGET, BUT WE'RE CONTINUING TO BUILD UPON THE WORK THROUGH
10 OUR PARTNERSHIPS AND COLLABORATION. SO THIS IS AN ONGOING WORK
11 FOR US TO CONTINUE TO REFINE OUR COLLABORATIVE WORK TO MAKE
12 SURE WE'RE DOING THE BEST WE CAN FOR ALL STAKEHOLDERS IN THE
13 REGION. SO, MORE TO COME. AND CHAIR, I HOPE WE CAN WORK
14 TOGETHER TO SCHEDULE THAT MEETING IN MAY AND REALLY MAKE IT A
15 GREAT WAY FOR EVERYONE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PROJECT. AND I
16 THINK THAT'S IT FOR MY UPDATE.

17

18 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. WE'LL BE IN TOUCH. YEAH, I -
19 - IT'S A REALLY EXCITING EFFORT, AND I THINK IT WILL BE
20 BENEFICIAL TO HAVE A MORE INTERACTIVE CONVERSATION TO KIND OF
21 CHART OUT NEXT STEPS. SO, WITH THAT, ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS
22 OR COMMENTS ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT? OKAY. I DON'T
23 SEE ANY SPEAKERS ON ZOOM WITH RAISED HANDS. I'LL ASK IF THERE
24 IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? OR WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN
25 COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE HAVE NO PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO WRITTEN
3 COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE CAN PROCEED TO
6 THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WHICH IS ITEM SEVEN AND THIS IS A
7 PRESENTATION ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT
8 FRAMEWORK. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM, AND ALLISON, DO YOU
9 WANT TO PROVIDE ANY INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS ON THIS ONE?

10

11 **ALLISON BROOKS:** I WANT TO COMMENT THIS HAS BEEN A TREMENDOUS
12 EFFORT, A COLLABORATIVE EFFORT BY MTC AND BCDC AND ABAG ON
13 THIS WORK AND IT'S DEMONSTRATIVE OF THE EFFORT THAT'S BEEN
14 GOING ON FOR MANY YEARS TO REALLY BUILD A KIND OF SHARED
15 KNOWLEDGE AND DEVELOPMENT OF WORK TOGETHER THAT'S EXCITING TO
16 SEE. SO, AND THIS IS -- THIS PROJECT IS PART OF A WHOLE SET OF
17 ACTIVITIES THAT ARE UNDERWAY RELATED TO CLIMATE ADAPTATION AND
18 SEA LEVEL RISE. SO WE CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER AND I THINK
19 THIS WILL BE ESSENTIAL INFORMATION TO INFORM US AS WE'RE
20 WORKING ON DEVELOPING KIND OF, AND BCDC TAKING THE LEAD ON THE
21 SHORELINE ADAPTATION PLAN AND ALSO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.
22 DAVE, ARE YOU GOING TO INTRODUCE THIS FURTHER? OR ARE YOU
23 GOING TO -- YOUR BACKUP? YOUR SUPPORT?

24



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I WILL TURN IT RIGHT OVER TO RACHAEL WHO WILL BE
2 KICKING OFF THE ITEM.

3

4 **RACHAEL HARTOFELIS:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE I'M RACHEL
5 HARTOFELIS, RESILIENCE PLANNER HERE AT MTC AND ABAG HERE WITH
6 DANA BRECHWALD FROM BCDC. WE HAVE SLIDES TO PULL UP. ALL
7 RIGHT. SO, WE'RE HERE TODAY TO DISCUSS THE CONCLUSION OF THE
8 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING AND INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK
9 WHICH IS A COLEAD EFFORT BY MTC BCDC AND ABAG AND THE
10 FRAMEWORK BUILDS OFF OF MAJOR REGIONAL PLANNING EFFORTS WHICH
11 CALL FOR PRIORITY ACTION TO FILL THE KNOWLEDGE GAPS IN THE
12 RESILIENCE SPACE WE KICKED OFF THE FRAMEWORK HERE AT THE BARC
13 GOVERNING BOARD IN DECEMBER OF 2021 AND ARE HERE WITH OUR
14 FINDINGS. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE INTRODUCE THE FINAL FINDINGS OF
15 THE FRAMEWORK IT'S IMPORTANT TO PUT THESE INTO CONTEXT AND THE
16 BAY AREA IS DEFINED BY ITS RELATIONSHIP TO WATER WITH ICONIC
17 BEACHES, AND THE OUTER COAST, WATERFRONT PARKS ACROSS THE
18 REGION WITH CLIFF SIDES, WETLANDS, PLAY GROUNDS AND MORE, VAST
19 WETLANDS DIVERSE HABITATS AND MARITIME AND CULTURE AND
20 COMMERCE. WE HAVE DIVERSE SHORELINE COMMUNITIES BENEFIT
21 LEVELLING DOWNTOWN, RESIDENTIAL NEIGHBORHOODS ON THE SHORE
22 COZY BEACH TOWNS AND INDUSTRIAL JOB CENTERS SPANNING ACROSS
23 THE DELTA BAY AND COAST. AND WINDING ACROSS THE REGION ARE
24 TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE NETWORKS WHICH LINE THE
25 SHORELINE BOTH CONNECTING US WITH ONE ANOTHER AND SUPPORTING



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THE REGION'S ECONOMIC VITALITY BUT RISING SEA LEVEL PUTS ALL
2 OF THIS AT RISK SO WE'LL BE SPOTLIGHTING FRAMEWORK FINDINGS ON
3 KEY FINANCIAL ESTIMATES TO TACKLE THE CHALLENGE TODAY AND IT'S
4 IMPORTANT TO KEEP IN MIND WHAT'S AT STAKE AND THEREFORE WHAT
5 ADAPTATION COULD MEAN FOR THE PEOPLE AND PLACING THAT WE CARE
6 ABOUT SO DEEPLY. NEXT SLIDE. WHEN LOOKING AT THE SIGNIFICANT
7 NEED IN FRONT OF US IT'S IMPORTANT TO PUT THIS INTO CONTEXT.
8 SO WHILE THE BAY AREA ACCOUNTS FOR 1/3 OF THE CALIFORNIA
9 SHORELINE, WE CAN EXPECT TO RECEIVE OVER 2/3 OF THE STATE SEA
10 LEVEL RISE IMPACTS IN THE FUTURE. WHILE IT'S NOT POSSIBLE TO
11 QUANTIFY EVERY BENEFIT OF ADAPTING OUR ICONIC SHORELINES AND
12 THE DIVERSE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE APPROXIMATE TO IT, BUT WE CAN
13 SPOTLIGHT SOME ELEMENTS OF WHAT'S AT RISK HERE AS THE WATERS
14 RISE. SO, IT'S ESTIMATED THAT 200,000 OF THE REGION'S JOBS AND
15 \$75,000 OF THE REGION'S HOMES, INCLUDING OVER 12,000 OF THE
16 MOST VULNERABLE HOMES AS DEFINED BY BCDC'S COMMUNITY
17 VULNERABILITY DATA, ARE IN THE REGION'S INUNDATION ZONE, AND,
18 AS SUCH, A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE CAN ENSURE THAT EVERYONE HAS
19 OPPORTUNITY TO ADAPT. IN ADDITION VULNERABLE ACRES ARE AT RISK
20 INCLUDING OVER 20,000 WE HAVE IDENTIFIED HERE WHICH INCLUDE
21 THE REGION'S RICH DIVERSE WETLANDS AND TIDAL MARSH HABITAT.
22 AND WHILE WE HAVE ESTIMATED \$85 BILLION ARE AT RISK IN TERMS
23 OF THE ASSESSED VALUE WITH THE MARKET VALUE NOT AVAILABLE, OUR
24 CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE WILL ALSO BE EXPOSED. WHILE THESE
25 ESTIMATES CAN BE MITIGATED WITH COORDINATION OR MULTI-BENEFIT



MARCH 17, 2023

1 SOLUTIONS, ADAPTING THE VULNERABLE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK WITH
2 ELEVATION OR REALIGNMENT COULD COST THE REGION UP TO \$150
3 BILLION. OTHER INFRASTRUCTURE SUCH AS WASTEWATER AND PUBLIC
4 UTILITIES WILL ALSO BE COSTLY TO ADAPT. NEXT SLIDE. AND AS A
5 QUICK REFRESHER ON THE FRAMEWORK, WE WOULD LIKE TO REVIEW
6 THREE KEY FOCUS AREAS OF THIS PROJECT. THE FIRST OF WHICH IS
7 TO UPDATE AND IMPROVE OUR REGIONAL ACCOUNTS OF SEA LEVEL RISE
8 ADAPTATION PROJECTS THROUGHOUT OUTCOMES OF THIS AREA ARE TO
9 UPDATE OUR PRIOR REGIONAL ANALYSIS WITH LOCAL PROJECTS FROM
10 RECENT PLANNING EFFORTS, AND TO ESTIMATE THE REGIONAL SEA
11 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION NEED THROUGH 2050. SECOND FOCUS AREA
12 UPDATE AND CHARACTERIZE OUR EXISTING REVENUE SOURCES FOR SEA
13 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION INCLUDING INVENTORY FORECASTING NEW
14 REVENUES FOR STATE AND FEDERAL PROGRAMS THAT HAVE BEEN
15 IDENTIFIED AND CHARACTERIZING HOW EXISTING ADAPTATION FUNDS
16 ARE DISBURSED AND FOR WHAT PURPOSE. FINALLY FOCUS ON HOW NEW
17 REVENUES FOR CIVIL RIGHTS ADAPTATION NEEDS CAN BE RAISED MOST
18 EQUITABLY WE HAVE ANALYZED THE RANGE OF POSSIBLE REVENUE
19 MEASURES AT DIFFERENT SCALES TO UNDERSTAND THE HIGH-LEVEL
20 EQUITY APPROACH TO CLOSING THE SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING GAP.
21 NEXT SLIDE. IN SUPPORT OF THIS FIRST FOCUS AREA WE HAVE
22 CREATED A REGIONAL INVENTORY OF ADAPTATION NEEDS, IDENTIFYING
23 LOCALLY DEVELOPED PROJECTS IN VARIOUS PLANNING STAGES. THIS
24 INVENTORY WAS SOURCED BY LOCAL PLANS, AS WELL AS BCDC'S
25 SHORELINE MAPPING ADAPTATION PROGRAM ALSO KNOWN AS THE SAP MAP



MARCH 17, 2023

1 WHICH IS AN EXTENSION OF ECO ATLAS. THIS INVENTORY WAS CREATED
2 TO DEVELOP A HIGH-LEVEL COST ESTIMATE FOR REGIONAL ADAPTATION
3 AS WELL AS IDENTIFYING AND PLANNING IMPLEMENTATION GAPS ACROSS
4 THE REGION. AND WE HAVE IDENTIFIED APPROXIMATELY 200 LOCALLY
5 IDENTIFIED PROJECTS AS WELL AS STUDY AREAS WHICH IS LESS
6 DEFINED ADAPTATION INTERVENTION AND MANY OF THESE HAVE
7 MULTIPLE SITES AMONG THEM TO. REVIEW THE INVENTORY IN THE FALL
8 WE SPOKE WITH LOCAL STAFF ACROSS NINE COUNTIES UPDATING OVER
9 2/3 OF THE INVENTORY AS WELL AS PROJECTS AND TO QUANTIFY THE
10 MAGNITUDE OF REGIONAL NEED THE INVENTORY NEEDED TO ACCOUNT FOR
11 COSTS IN AREAS WITH LESS ADVANCED ADAPTATION PLANNING OR
12 PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION. TO DO THIS VALUES WERE CREATED
13 ASSUMING PROTECTION OF SHORELINE IN PLACE INCLUDING AREAS THAT
14 HAVE NO KNOWN PLANS IN AREAS WHERE STUDIES HAVE YET DEFINED
15 SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND ALSO IN AREAS WHERE A PROJECT HAS NOT
16 CONFIRMED TO PROVIDE SUFFICIENT PROTECTION. IN FUTURE EFFORTS
17 WE ANTICIPATE MORE PLACE HOLDERS WILL BE REPLACED BY SPECIFIC
18 IDEAS GENERATED FROM FURTHER LOCAL ADAPTATION PLANNING AND
19 IMPLEMENTATION. WHILE THIS IS A HELPFUL SUMMARY IN THIS TIME
20 WE'LL BE MAKING AVAILABLE AS AN INTERACTIVE ONLINE MAP IN THE
21 SPRING IN THE LONG-TERM WE ENVISION BCDC SAP MAP AS THE TOOL
22 THROUGH WHICH THE REGION CAN CONTINUE TO TRACK ADAPTATION
23 PROJECTS INCLUDING DATA AND FRAMEWORK INTEGRATED DIRECTLY INTO
24 THE EFFORT THROUGH THE PROCESS WE CAN CONTINUE TO UPDATE PLANS
25 AND PROJECTS AS THEY DEVELOP IN THE NEAR-TERM TO INTEGRATE THE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 DATA INTO THE REGIONAL PLAN BEING EFFORTS SUCH AS PLANNED BAY
2 AREA 2050 PLUS AND BCDC'S REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTATION. THE
3 INVENTORY HAS HELPED US TO DEVELOP A REGIONAL COST ESTIMATE
4 FOR SHORELINE ADAPTATION AND FOR CONTEXT ALL ESTIMATES ARE
5 THAT WE'LL DISCUSS TODAY ARE PRESENTED IN YEAR OF EXPENDITURE.
6 AND THE FRAMEWORK BUILDS OFF OF PREVIOUS WORK DONE IN PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AS BCDC'S FUNDING WHITE PAPER WHICH
8 ESTIMATED THE REGIONAL NEED AT \$19 BILLION THROUGH 2050. TO
9 UPDATE THIS INFORMATION FOR THE FRAMEWORK WE HAVE MADE A
10 NUMBER OF DATA ASSUMPTIONS AS A FIRST STEP WE UPDATED COST
11 ESTIMATES FOR DIFFERENT PROJECT TYPES USING THE BEST AVAILABLE
12 DATA AND WITH THIS CHANGE ALONE THE SAME SET OF PROJECTS FROM
13 PREVIOUS WORK COULD BE PROJECTED TO BE JUST SHY OF \$40
14 BILLION. WE ALSO ACCOUNTED FOR INCREASED INFLATION OVER THE
15 LAST THREE YEARS. PREVIOUS ANALYSIS LOOKED AT AN INFLATION
16 RATE OF 2.2% INTO THE FUTURE WHILE THE FRAMEWORK HAS PURSUES
17 3.2% OVER THE STUDY PERIOD THE MEASURE PROTECTION THROUGH 4.9
18 FEET OF SEA LEVEL RISE TO ACCOUNT FOR BOTH THE PERMANENT OCEAN
19 CALIFORNIA PROTECTION COUNCIL THROUGH 2050, AS WELL AS FROM
20 THE 100-YEAR STORM, SURPASSING STATE GUIDANCE RECOMMENDATIONS
21 AND COINCIDING WITH STATE -- WITH LOCAL PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS
22 FOR MANY LOCAL EFFORTS. FINALLY, WHERE AN AREA WAS IDENTIFIED
23 WITH NO CURRENT ADAPTATION PLANS OR WITHOUT CONCEPTS, THE
24 FRAMEWORK ANALYSIS ASSUMED A DEFAULT ADAPTATION ACTION FOR
25 VULNERABLE SHORE LINES INCLUDING AREAS WITHOUT PLANNING AND IN



MARCH 17, 2023

1 NEED OF AUGMENTED PLANS. WHEN PEA PIECE ELEMENTS TOGETHER THE
2 ADAPTATION ESTIMATE THROUGH 2050 IS \$110 BILLION EXPRESSED IN
3 EXPENDITURE DOLLARS HALF OF THAT BASED ON LOCALLY IDENTIFIED
4 PROJECTS WITH THE REMAINDER ESTIMATED AS PLACE HOLDER VALUE
5 INCLUDING ESTIMATES FOR ADDITIONAL SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT NEEDS
6 PARTIAL PROJECT FUNDING WAS SUBTRACTED FROM THE TOTAL THOUGH
7 THERE MAY BE ADDITIONAL PROJECTS WITH PARTIAL FUNDING THAT
8 WERE NOT KNOWN AT THE TIME OF THE ASSESSMENT THE VALUE DOES
9 NOT NECESSARILY VALUE NEEDS TO BE RAISED BY GOVERNMENTS TO
10 ADAPT AS A REMINDER THIS ESTIMATE ACCOUNTS FOR CONSERVATIVE
11 APPROACH TO ASSUME ADAPTATION ACTION FOR VULNERABLE SHORE
12 LINES INCLUDING LOWDOWN CITY AREAS THE INVENTORY IS ALSO A
13 SNAPSHOT OF THE CURRENT MOMENT AND ADAPTATION EFFORTS WILL
14 CONTINUE TO DEVELOP ESPECIALLY FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE IN EARLY
15 PLANNING STAGES OR IN CONCEPTUAL STAGES AND ARE LIKELY TO
16 CHANGE AS MORE INFORMATION BECOMES AVAILABLE. STRATEGIES THAT
17 ARE NOT ESTIMATED OR ASSUMED WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK ANALYSIS
18 PLAY A ROLE IN THE FUTURE ADAPTATION WITHOUT PROTECTION
19 BUILDING CODE CHANGES AS WELL AS LOCAL POLICY ADJUSTMENTS IN
20 ADDITION THE FUTURE ANALYSIS WILL NEED TO INCLUDE RIVER INE
21 AND GROUNDWATER DATA WHEN IT BECOMES REGIONALLY AVAILABLE AND
22 WILL NEED TO INCLUDE ADAPTATION PLANS SUCH AS THOSE MADE BY
23 UTILITIES IN THE FUTURE. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE ADDITIONAL
24 FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS TO HIGHLIGHT THE DISTINCTION BETWEEN
25 COUNTIES AS WELL AS TO BREAK DOWN NUANCES IN TREMENDOUS OF



MARCH 17, 2023

1 TYPES OF PROJECTS THAT ARE AVAILABLE HERE. THE ANALYSIS HAS
2 SHOWN THAT MOST OF THE PLANNED PROJECTS ARE HYBRID IN NATURE
3 REPRESENTING A REGIONAL FOCUS ON MULTI-BENEFIT ADAPTATION. AND
4 THIS INCLUDES LEVIES AS WELL AS MARSH RESTORATION AND OTHER
5 COMBINATIONS OF ADAPTATION FEATURES IN TERMS OF THE COUNTIES,
6 ALAMEDA AND MARIN COUNTIES HAVE THE HIGHEST COST ESTIMATES
7 WITH THE INFORMATION GATHERED ALIGNING WITH THE ANTICIPATED
8 SEA LEVEL RISE VULNERABILITY. NOTABLY ABOUT HALF OF THE
9 ESTIMATED VALUE COMES FROM PLACE HOLDERS WHICH WE CREATED TO
10 DEVELOP THE COST ESTIMATES WITH SIGNIFICANT IMPLEMENTATION
11 GAPS IDENTIFIED IN ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA AND MARIN COUNTIES.
12 HOWEVER, WHILE IDENTIFYING THIS IMPLEMENTATION GAP IS HELPFUL,
13 I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT A KEY NUANCE IN THESE COUNTIES
14 IS OBSCURED. FOR EXAMPLE, IN MARIN COUNTY WHILE IDENTIFYING
15 PACIFIC PROJECTS FOR VULNERABLE LOCATIONS THE COUNTY HAS
16 ALMOST NO PLANNING GAPS IN FACT HAS VERY ROBUST AND
17 COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING EFFORT. BY CONTRAST IN CONTRA COSTA
18 COUNTY THE PLACE HOLDER VALUE REPRESENTS A SIGNIFICANT
19 IMPLEMENTATION AND PLANNING GAP. WE ANTICIPATE THAT THESE
20 DISTINCTIONS WILL BECOME CLEARER THROUGH FUTURE EFFORTS SUCH
21 AS THROUGH THE DEVELOPING SEA LEVEL RISE PLANNING GUIDELINES
22 AND BCDC'S REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTATION PLAN AS WELL AS
23 UPDATING PROJECT INFORMATION AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AS
24 WELL AS EFFORTS BEYOND. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE ALSO DEVELOPED AN
25 EXISTING SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION REVENUE FORECAST TO



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ESTIMATE HOW MUCH REVENUE THE REGION CAN ANTICIPATE THROUGH
2 2050 FROM PUBLIC SOURCES THAT ALREADY EXIST. THE FRAMEWORK IS
3 IDENTIFIED NEW PUBLIC FUNDING SOURCES TO ADD TO PREVIOUS
4 ESTIMATES IN THIS SPACE, SUCH AS THE ONES IN PLANNED BAY AREA
5 2050 AND BCDC'S FUNDING WHITE PAPER ADDING 30 NEW ADAPTATION
6 GRANT PROGRAMS THAT WERE IDENTIFIED JUST FROM THE PAST FEW
7 YEARS OF STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES. HOWEVER,
8 DESPITE THE INFLUX OF NEW REVENUE OPPORTUNITIES, ONLY A MALL
9 SHARE OF THE BILLIONS IDENTIFIED IN NEW STATE AND FEDERAL
10 FUNDS ARE ESTIMATED TO BE AVAILABLE. WHAT THE BAY AREA IS
11 LIKELY TO RECEIVE WILL BE WHITTLED DOWN SIGNIFICANTLY WHEN WE
12 ASSUME A PORTION FOR STATEWIDE OR NATIONAL FUNDS. ADDITIONALLY
13 MOST OF THE NEW 30 FUNDING LINE ITEMS ARE NOT SPECIFIC TO SEA
14 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION BUT MAY REPRESENT A SEA LEVEL RISE
15 ADAPTATION NEED SUCH AS WILDFIRE SO THE REGION REVENUE MOTHER
16 BE FURTHER FILTERED DOWN, WHEN THESE LIMITATIONS ARE ACCOUNTED
17 FOR THE REGION CAN EXPECT ONLY A FRACTION OF THE NEW STATE AND
18 FEDERAL FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES IN ADDITION CUTS THAT ARE
19 PROPOSED IN THE GOVERNOR'S 2023 BUDGET MAY REDUCE THE BUDGET
20 EVEN MORE WITH ESTIMATED OF \$200 MILLION OR EVEN FURTHER WITH
21 THE EFFECTS TO THE REGION WITH THIS SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL
22 FUNDING GAP FOR CIVIL RIGHTS ADAPTATION THAT'S ANTICIPATED
23 MORE FUNDING WILL BE NEEDED TO COMPLEMENT THE NEAR-TERM
24 OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE HAVE SPOTLIGHTED AS WELL AS TO SUPPORT A
25 GROWING PIPELINE OF CIVIL RIGHTS ADAPTATION INVESTMENTS IN THE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 FUTURE. AND I'LL PASS IT TO DANA BRECHWALD WHOLE INTRODUCE THE
2 NEXT PART OF THE PRESENTATION.

3

4 **DANA BRECHWALD:** PART OF CLOSING THE GAP WILL BE TO CONTINUE
5 INCREASING AVAILABLE REVENUE SOURCES WHILE WE CAN WORK TO
6 ADVOCATE FOR INCREASED SHARES OF STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING
7 WE'LL NEED TO RAISE FUNDS LOCALLY AND REGIONALLY TO FUND
8 PROJECTS AND MEET MATCH REQUIREMENTS FOR STATE AND FEDERAL
9 OPPORTUNITIES. IN THIS CONTEXT WE LOOKED AT EXPLORING NEW
10 FUNDING SOURCES AS PART OF THE FRAMEWORK AND WE APPROACH THIS
11 AT A HIGH-LEVEL EXPLORATORY WAY INTENDED TO PROVIDE INITIAL
12 INSIGHTS TO HELP GUIDE FUTURE RESEARCH AND DISCUSSION IN THE
13 YEARS AHEAD. SO FAR WITH THIS MINDSET WE RESEARCHED THREE
14 POSSIBLE NEW REVENUE MEASURES AT THE LOCAL COUNTY AND REGIONAL
15 SCALES TO UNDERSTAND, FIRST, HOW MUCH FUNDING CAN BE RAISED
16 ANNUALLY, POTENTIALLY. WHAT IS THE BOND ISSUANCE POTENTIAL OR
17 HOW MUCH COULD DIFFERENTLY FUNDING MEASURES -- MEASURES
18 HYPOTHETICALLY RAISE FOR NEAR-TERM PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION.
19 AND, LASTLY, WHAT ARE THE INITIAL EQUITY -- IMPLICATIONS?
20 SPECIFICALLY, WHERE WOULD THE FINANCIAL BURDEN HIT MOST
21 HEAVILY. AND WHILE MANY FUNDING -- OPTIONS COULD POTENTIALLY
22 BE UTILIZED FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION SUCH AS SALES TAXES,
23 BUSINESS TAXES, AND DEVELOPMENT FEES, MANY OPTIONS WERE
24 FILTERED FOR OVERALL FEASIBILITY IN REGIONAL PRECEDENCE AND
25 THIS RESULTED IN OUR FOCUS ON PARCEL TAXES, AD VALOREM



MARCH 17, 2023

1 PROPERTY TAXES AND ASSESSMENT DISTRICTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
2 SO, OUR HIGH-LEVEL FINDINGS SHOW THAT, SURPRISE THERE, IS NO
3 SILVER BULLET, NO SINGLE REVENUE MEASURE IS EXPECTED TO BE
4 CAPABLE OF ADDRESSING THE FUNDING GAP SO AS EXPECTED STACKED
5 FUNDING APPROACH WILL BE NECESSARY BUT OF THE THREE REVENUE
6 TYPES WE REVIEWED PARCEL TAXES AND ADD VALOREM PROPERTY TAXES
7 WERE VIEWED AT THE COUNTY AND REGIONAL SCALES LOOKED AT
8 ASSESSMENT DISTRICT ON A SUBLOCAL BASIS. FOR EACH WE LOOKED AT
9 HIGH-LEVEL FINDINGS AND USED REGIONAL PRECEDENT TO DETERMINE
10 CASE STUDIES. PARCEL TAX ARE TYPICALLY FLAT RATE TAX THAT DOES
11 NOT ACCOUNT FOR THE VALUE OR SIZE OF THE PROPERTY AND ADD THE
12 PROPERTY TAX PROGRESSIVE TAX AT HIGHER ASSESS THE PROPERTY THE
13 PAYING MORE HOWEVER PERSPECTIVE 13 LIMITS IN PROGRESSIVE TAXES
14 CAN BE AN ASSESSMENT IN DISTRICTS TYPICALLY SPECIFIED WITH
15 BENEFITS THAT TAYLOR OR ACCOUNT FOR EQUITY DISPARITIES. CASE
16 STUDIES REGIONAL ESTIMATES ASSESSED DISTRICTS WITH CONSULTANT
17 SUPPORT WE LOOKED AT EXAMPLE RATES FOR WHAT TAXES COULD
18 SUPPORT IF RAISED AND BONDED AT SCALES YOU SEE HERE. YOU WILL
19 NOTICE FROM PARCEL TAXES TO ADD VALOREM TAXES POTENTIAL IS
20 DIFFERENCE DUE TO AD VALOREM TAXES BEING ABLE TO HAVE HIGHER
21 RATE FOR HIGHLY ASSESSED PARCELS AS WELL AS REGIONAL
22 PRECEDENCE AGAIN POINTING OUT THE INITIAL REVIEW CASE FOR
23 FUTURE RESEARCH AND DISCUSSION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE REVIEWED
24 INITIAL EQUITY FINDINGS FOCUSED ON WHO PAYS VERSUS WHO
25 BENEFITS USING BOTH A GEOGRAPHIC LENS AND A SOCIAL EQUITY



MARCH 17, 2023

1 LENS. THESE FINDINGS FOCUS ON AD VALOREM PARCEL TAXES AS
2 THEY'RE MORE LIKELY TO BE SCALED AT COUNTY AND REGIONAL LEVELS
3 WITH REGARDS TO GEOGRAPHIC EQUITY SANTA CLARA ALAMEDA AND SAN
4 FRANCISCO COUNTIES HAVE THE LARGEST PROPERTY TAX RATE MEANING
5 THEY WOULD CONTRIBUTE MOST SIGNIFICANTLY TO BOND REVENUES
6 WHILE SAN FRANCISCO AND MARIN COUNTIES HAVE A DISPROPORTIONATE
7 SHARE OF RISK OF SEA LEVEL RISE MEANING THEY WOULD BENEFIT
8 MOST GREATLY FROM REVENUES. HOWEVER THIS ASSESSMENT OBSCURED
9 ADDITIONAL NUANCES FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE CONTEXT OF A REGIONAL
10 MEASURE, THE PROTECTION OF KEY INFRASTRUCTURE SUCH AS US-101
11 AND SAN MATEO AND MARIN WOULD BENEFIT TRAVELERS REGION-WIDE
12 NOT JUST SAN MATEO AND MARIN COUNTIES TAKE AWAY HERE IS USING
13 FUNDING MEASURES THAT USE DIFFERENT MEANS OF ASSESSMENT SUCH
14 AS ADD AND PROPERTY TAXES WOULD HELP BALANCE THE OVERALL TAX
15 BURDEN FOR SOCIAL EQUITY WE IDENTIFIED SOCIALLY VULNERABLE
16 AREAS USING BCC'S COMMUNITY VULNERABILITY DATA USING SOCIO-
17 ECONOMIC VULNERABILITY INDICATOR, INCOME, RACE. WE FOUND AD
18 VALOREM AND PARCEL TAXES BOTH PROVIDE BENEFIT TO MORE SOCIALLY
19 VULNERABLE AREAS THAN A FINANCIAL BURDEN [INDISCERNIBLE]
20 POPULATIONS TAXES PROVIDE GREATER BENEFIT THAN PARCEL TAXES
21 HOWEVER AS PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED THESE ARE INITIAL HIGH-LEVEL
22 FINDINGS AND IF A COUNTY OR REGIONAL MEASURE WERE TO BE
23 CONSIDERED FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS
24 STEPS WOULD NEED TO BE TAKEN FIRST FOR EXAMPLE, IN ADDITION TO
25 FURTHER RESEARCH WE WOULD ESTABLISH GUIDING PRINCIPLES TO



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ENSURE MEASURES WOULD BE TRULY EQUITABLE FROM THE PERSPECTIVE
2 OF WHO PAYS AS WELL AS WHO PAYS AS WELL AS STRUCTURES AND
3 BENEFITS. FOR EXAMPLE, BAY ADAPT PLATFORM CREATING GUIDING
4 PRINCIPLES SUCH AS THESE THAT ALREADY HAVE SIGNIFICANT BUY-IN
5 FROM THE REGION COULD SERVE AS THE FOUNDATION FOR PRINCIPLES
6 LIKE THESE. NEXT SLIDE. SO AS WE CONCLUDE WE WOULD LIKE TO
7 ZOOM OUT AND REVIEW THE KEY FINDINGS FROM THIS PROJECT. THE
8 FRAMEWORK HAS IDENTIFIED A MIX OF GREEN AND GRAY PROJECTS WITH
9 MORE THAN HALF OF THE REGION'S KNOWN PROJECTS BASED ON HYBRID
10 OR MULTI-USE BENEFIT SOLUTIONS WE HAVE IDENTIFIED A
11 SIGNIFICANT FUNDING GAP OF OVER \$100 BILLION TO ADDRESS THIS.
12 INCREASING REVENUES, PRIORITIZING OR PHASING SHORELINE
13 PROTECTION, AND DISCOURAGING DEVELOPMENT IN HIGHLY VULNERABLE
14 AREAS SHOULD ALL BE CONSIDERED AS OPTIONS MOVING FORWARD. WE
15 HAVE IDENTIFIED KEY DIFFERENCES ACROSS THE REGION WITH A
16 DISPARATE IN TERMS OF BOTH ESTIMATED SEA LEVEL RISE COSTS AS
17 WELL AS THE LEVEL OF LOCAL PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION DUE TO
18 RESOURCE CONSTRAINTS. FINALLY TO FILL THE FUNDING GAP MULTIPLE
19 FUNDING SOURCES AND MULTIPLE SCALES WILL BE REQUIRED EVEN WITH
20 PRIORITIZING AND PHASING OF ADAPTATION PROJECTS. AND LASTLY
21 IT'S CRITICAL TO PRIORITIZE EQUITY AND FUNDING IN ADDITION TO
22 CONSIDERING FUNDING APPROACHES THAT REDUCE THE BURDEN ON
23 SOCIALLY VULNERABLE AREAS, WE CAN ALSO UTILIZE SHARED
24 PRINCIPLES TO ENSURE THAT OUR ADAPTATION DECISIONS ARE MADE
25 WITH EQUITY AT THE FOREFRONT. NEXT SLIDE. WHILE IT MAY IT MAY



MARCH 17, 2023

1 SEEM LIKE THE JOURNEY IS AHEAD OF US WE HAVE TAKEN STEPS THE
2 SR37 CORRIDOR ADAPTATION IS CURRENTLY IN PLANNING STAGES EAST
3 WEST ROUTE CRITICAL FOR THE INTERCONNECTEDNESS OF THE REGION
4 CONNECTING NORTH BAY COUNTIES THIS ADAPTATION OF THE CORRIDOR
5 IS A COLLABORATIVE EFFORT LED BY LEADERSHIP WITH MTC ACROSS
6 THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES CALTRANS IN ADDITION TO
7 STAKEHOLDER NETWORK REPRESENTING INTEREST FROM TRANSPORTATION
8 ECOLOGICAL RESILIENCE AND BEYOND THE MULTI-YEAR EFFORT WILL
9 START WITH THE NEAR-TERM INTERVENTIONS FOR PROTECTION AND SEEK
10 TO REDUCE CONGESTION AND THEN THE LONGER TERM, THE CORRIDOR IS
11 PROJECTED TO ADAPT SEA LEVEL RISE TO SUPPORT THE REGION'S
12 ECOLOGICAL RESILIENCE AND ENHANCE PUBLIC ACCESS. AND EQUITY IS
13 KEY HERE. UNLIKE OTHER REGIONAL CORRIDORS, THE MAJORITY OF THE
14 SURVEY DRIVERS ON THE ROUTE ARE LOW-INCOME WITH MANY IN THE
15 NORTH BAY USING THE CORRIDOR TO CONNECT JOBS IN MARIN COUNTY
16 NO TRANSIT OPTIONS HERE OR ROUTE ALTERNATIVES. IN THE EAST
17 BAY, THE NORTH RICHMOND SHORELINE LIVING LEVEE PROJECT SEEKS
18 TO PROVIDE PROTECTION FOR BOTH KEY REGIONAL INFRASTRUCTURE,
19 INCLUDING THE WEST COUNTY WASTEWATER DISTRICT WASTEWATER
20 TREATMENT PLANT, AS WELL AS THE SOCIALLY VULNERABLE
21 NEIGHBORING COMMUNITIES NEAR THE SHORELINE. THE PROJECT HAS
22 BEEN DEEPLY ENGAGED IN COMMUNITY SINCE ITS INCEPTION BUILDING
23 OFF THE NORTH RICHMOND SHORELINE COMMUNITY VISION CREATED IN
24 2017 WITH A DIVERSE STAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP SUPPORTING THE
25 PLANNING PROCESS DESIGN STAGES. THIS PROJECT IS ENVISIONED NOT



MARCH 17, 2023

1 JUST TO HAVE -- SERVE AS A PROTECTIVE ASSET WITH A TREAD --
2 TRANSITIONAL UPLAND HABITAT, BUT ALSO TO EMPHASIZE COMMUNITY
3 ENGAGEMENT AND COMMUNITY DECISION-MAKING. IT'S INTENDED TO
4 SUPPORT ONGOING EDUCATION AND ENGAGEMENT PROGRAMS AND
5 COMMUNITY VOLUNTEERS ALONG WITH PLANNED BAY TRAIL IMPROVEMENTS
6 INCREASING PUBLIC ACCESS. AND, LASTLY, ALONG THE PENINSULA
7 FOSTER CITY IS IN ITS FINAL YEAR OF CONSTRUCTION FOR ITS LEVY
8 IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM WHICH WILL PROTECT FOSTER CITY'S 30,000
9 RESIDENTS FROM SEA LEVEL RISE STORMS AND HIGH TIDES. THIS
10 PROGRAM INCLUDES REDEVELOPMENT AND WIDENING OF THE BAY TRAIL
11 RUNNING ALONG THE TOP OF THE LEVEE MAINTAINING PUBLIC
12 RECREATION FOR BIKERS, PEDESTRIAN, AND CONNECTING ITS BAY
13 FRONT PARKS. THIS PROJECT IS ESTIMATED FOR COMPLETION IN
14 JANUARY 2024. NEXT SLIDE. AS THE FRAMEWORK PROJECTS INCLUDING
15 IDENTIFIED ACTIONS AND FINDINGS MOVING FORWARD. FIRST TO
16 PRIORITIZE SEA LEVEL RISE INVESTMENTS IN UPCOMING PLANS, SUCH
17 AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND THE REGIONAL SHORELINE
18 ADAPTATION PLAN. TO USE PLANS HELP IDENTIFY WHICH PROJECTS
19 REQUIRE EARLY ACTION AND WHICH MIGHT BE APPROPRIATE FOR LOW
20 COST INTERVENTIONS SO WE CAN DO SOON. SECOND, MTC ABAG WILL
21 EXPLORE HOW TO INTEGRATE RESILIENCE INTO ENVISIONED REGIONAL
22 MEASURES ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. BCDC WILL
23 CONTINUE TO COMPLETE AND MAINTAIN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE
24 SHORELINE ADAPTATION PROJECT MAP TO ENSURE THAT THE REGION HAS
25 ACCESS TO THE BEST POSSIBLE INVENTORY -- DATA. IN LIGHT OF OUR



MARCH 17, 2023

1 INITIAL ANALYSIS AND LIMITATIONS OF RE -- REV -- NEW REVENUE
2 MEASURES, STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING WILL BE CRITICAL TO
3 ADDRESS THE FUNDING GAP. SO, WE NEED TO ACCELERATE OUR STATE
4 AND FEDERAL ADVOCACY TO IN -- TO SECURE A GREATER SHARE OF
5 FUNDING FOR THE BAY AREA. AND THEN, FINALLY, WE WILL SEEK
6 INPUT TO HELP IDENTIFY KEY LEAD ROLES IN THE SEA LEVEL RISE
7 SPACE BUILDING ON ALLISON'S INITIATIVE THAT'S UNDERGOING --
8 THAT WE'RE UNDERGOING RIGHT NOW. AND ENSURE THAT THE REGION IS
9 EMPOWERED TO SECURE ADAPTATION MONEYS AND DISTRIBUTE THEM
10 EQUALLY AND THAT WE'RE CLEAR ON WHO IS DOING THAT. CLARIFYING
11 THE GOVERNANCE ROLES FOR SEA LEVEL RISE WILL BE AN IMPORTANT
12 STEP TO -- FORWARD TO ENSURE THAT THE REGION CAN EFFECTIVELY
13 MITIGATE ITS CLIMATE IMPACTS. WITH THAT, WE WOULD LIKE TO
14 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND ATTENTION TODAY, AND WE'LL OPEN UP
15 NOW FOR ANY POTENTIAL QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION.

16

17 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I'LL LOOK TO
18 MY COLLEAGUES ON THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD FOR QUESTIONS OR
19 COMMENTS. YES, COMMISSIONER SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** JUST A COMMENT. YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S
22 IMPORTANT THAT WE DO PRESENTATIONS IN EACH ONE OF THE NINE BAY
23 AREA COUNTIES AND REALLY TALK ABOUT WHAT THE IMPACT IS GOING
24 TO BE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE. YOU KNOW, DON'T -- I DON'T THINK
25 THE FUNDING SHOULD BE THE FIRST PART OF THE DISCUSSION. I



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THINK WHAT'S AT RISK SHOULD BE THE EDUCATION PIECE. AND I
2 THINK WE NEED TO BUILD AN ADVOCACY FOR SOLVING A PROBLEM, OF
3 COURSE, AND THE FUNDING IS PART OF THAT. WE JUST HAVE ONE
4 MEASURE AFTER ANOTHER COMING IN FRONT OF US, TRANSPORTATION,
5 HOUSING, AND NOW SEA LEVEL RISE. AND I THINK THAT WE HAVE GOT
6 TO REALLY, CLEARLY IDENTIFY WHY THIS NEEDS TO BE DONE. AND THE
7 OTHER IS THAT, I WOULD HOPE THAT WE WOULD LOOK AT, YOU KNOW,
8 MAYBE BY COUNTY, OF COURSE YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME PROJECTS
9 THAT ARE MULTI-JURISDICTIONS. BUT, YOU KNOW, THAT -- BUILD
10 THOSE ADVOCATES IN EACH COUNTY AND SAY THIS IS SOLANO COUNTY'S
11 PROJECT AND THESE ARE THE CITIES THAT ARE INVOLVED IN THIS
12 PROJECT INSTEAD OF SAYING WE HAVE 20 PROJECTS. I BELIEVE YOU
13 SHOULD DO IT ON A COUNTY-WIDE BASIS THEN THE COUNTY STARTS TO
14 UNDERSTAND WHAT'S AT STAKE. BUT I THINK WE REALLY HAVE TO
15 EDUCATE OUR LOCAL RESIDENTS AND ELECTED OFFICIALS AS TO WHAT
16 REALLY IS THE ECONOMIC IMPACT. AND WHY IT'S IMPORTANT. THE
17 OTHER PIECE I HAVE ALWAYS BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT IS THAT YOU CAN
18 HAVE ONE JURISDICTION THAT HAS RESOURCES THAT DEAL WITH SOME
19 OF THE NEIGHBORING OR CONTIGUOUS TO IT, DOESN'T, AND IF THEY
20 DON'T DO IT, THE WORK THAT THE OTHER ONE DID, REALLY IS FOR
21 NOT. THAT'S WHY I THINK WE HAVE TO HAVE A REGIONAL PLAN THAT
22 SHOWS HOW ALL THESE LINK TOGETHER. AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT
23 YOU'RE SAYING HERE IN THE PRESENTATION. SO, YOU KNOW, I JUST
24 THINK ABOUT MY COUNTY, THAT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE SOLANO
25 IDENTIFY WHAT AREAS ARE REALLY AT STAKE AND WHAT THE COST IS



MARCH 17, 2023

1 AND, YOU KNOW, JUST MAKE SURE THAT WE GET THE SUPPORT AND
2 ADVOCACY. BUT IF WE DON'T MAKE THE CASE, I DON'T SEE YOU
3 PASSING ANY MEASURE. BECAUSE THIS -- THE PUBLIC JUST IS NOT IN
4 TUNE WITH THIS AS MOST OF US SITTING AROUND IN THE ROOM IS.
5 AND SO THOSE ARE MY -- THAT WAS A GREAT PRESENTATION. AND
6 THANK YOU. THIS IS VERY GOOD INFORMATION. VERY WELL PRESENTED.
7 THANK YOU BOTH OF YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS,
10 QUESTIONS, AND I KNOW THERE MAY BE OTHERS. YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY
11 SOME COMMUNITIES ARE WAY MORE IMPACTED, LIKE, ALAMEDA, FOR
12 EXAMPLE. LITERALLY, IS AN ISLAND THAT WILL FACE SIGNIFICANT
13 FLOODING UNLESS THERE ARE GRAY OR GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE
14 PROJECTS. AND SOME MAY HAVE LESS INTENSIVE IMPACTS. SOME ARE
15 FURTHER ALONG IN TERMS OF THEIR PLANNING AND SOME HAVEN'T DONE
16 ANY PLANNING. SO WE ASSESS WHERE WE'RE AT REGIONALLY IN TERMS
17 OF HOW MANY COMMUNITIES HAVE REALLY UNDERSTOOD WHAT THE
18 IMPACTS WILL BE, AND BEGUN TO TAKE STEPS TO PLAN, YOU KNOW,
19 FROM A LAND USE PERSPECTIVE, OR MITIGATION PERSPECTIVE.

20

21 **DANA BRECHWALD:** I THINK THERE IS A NUMBER OF LENSES THAT WE
22 HAVE ON THIS. I WOULDN'T SAY WE HAVE A SUPER COHESIVE
23 INVENTORY AT THIS TIME. BUT ONE THING THAT WE HAVE LEARNED
24 THROUGH THE FRAMEWORK IS THE IMPLEMENTATION GAP AND WE DO HAVE
25 A SENSE OF THAT BY COUNTY. IN SOME CASES, WE CAN PARSE OUT



MARCH 17, 2023

1 WEATHER THAT'S RELATED TO PLANNING OR NOT, FOR EXAMPLE, IN
2 MARIN BUT IN OTHER CASES, IT'S NOT CLEAR TO US EXACTLY HOW
3 MUCH PLANNING HAS BEEN DONE. JUST DUE TO THE METHODOLOGY THAT
4 WE USE AND THE RESOURCES THAT WE HAD. HOWEVER, SOME OF OUR
5 PREVIOUS WORK, I KNOW AT BCDC, STARTED TO INVENTORY WHO HAD
6 DONE ADAPTATION PLANNING, AND THIS EFFORT BUILT OFF OF PART OF
7 THAT. BUT, THERE WAS A LOT OF INFORMATION THAT CAME THROUGH
8 THAT PREVIOUS WORK THAT WAS HELPFUL. AND, SO, I THINK MORE
9 WORK LIKE THAT, I THINK, IN THE FUTURE, WILL BE NEEDED TO
10 REALLY GET A SENSE OF WHAT'S GOING ON AT THE FULL REGIONAL
11 SCALE.

12

13 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I THINK THAT TIES INTO WHAT WE'RE DOING
14 IN TERMS OF THE GRANTS, THE PLANNING GRANTS THAT HOPEFULLY WE
15 CAN LEVERAGE STATE RESOURCES TO PROVIDE. AND I THINK THAT DOVE
16 TAILS WITH WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING HAD SAID, WHICH IS REALLY
17 TALKING ABOUT THE PROBLEM AND, MEAN, THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF
18 DISCUSSION ABOUT STATE ROUTE 37 OBVIOUSLY, BUT THERE ARE
19 OTHER, YOU KNOW, MAJOR FREEWAYS, TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS THAT
20 WOULD BE DIRECTLY IMPACTED, AND OBVIOUSLY THAT'S PART OF THE
21 BROADER BAY ADAPT IMPLEMENTATION, BUT I DO THINK THAT'S REALLY
22 GOING TO BE KEY TO BUILDING THE AWARENESS AND SUPPORT FOR
23 SOME, SORT OF, FUTURE REGIONAL EFFORT IF WE HAVE TO PUT A
24 MEASURE TO THE BALLOT. I HAVE A QUESTION FOR MAYBE, IS KATE ON
25 THE CALL? KATE HARTLEY? AROUND HOW WE INTEGRATE THIS, OR



MARCH 17, 2023

1 BROADER RESILIENCE INTO THE BAHFA MEASURE? I KNOW IF THERE IS
2 A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE IN THE FUTURE IT MAKES COMPLETE SENSE
3 BECAUSE HOW ARE WE GOING TO FUND STATE ROUTE 37 OR OTHER
4 PROJECTS ON THE PENINSULA, OR IN SOLANO COUNTY, BUT I'M
5 CURIOUS ABOUT WHAT WHERE THERE MIGHT BE A NEXT TO US THIS, A
6 BROADER RESILIENCE IN THE HOUSING CONVERSATION.

7

8 **KATE HARTLEY:** MAYOR ARREGUIN, I AM GOING TO PROVIDE A
9 PRESENTATION IN A MINUTE AND TALK ABOUT THAT. I THINK, AS
10 COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID, WE DO NEED TO THINK ABOUT HOUSING
11 AND LOCATION OF HOUSING. AS A RESILIENCE EFFORT, AS A CLIMATE
12 CHANGE EFFORT. BECAUSE AS HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY DRIVES LOW-
13 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS FARTHER AND FARTHER AWAY FROM JOBS HUNTERS,
14 YOU ARE DOING DAMAGE TO THE ACHIEVEMENT OF OUR ENVIRONMENTAL
15 GOALS BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE IN THEIR CARS AND IT'S GENERATING
16 GREENHOUSE GASES. SO WITH RESPECT TO HOUSING, OUR INVESTMENTS
17 WILL BE VERY LOCATIONALLY SENSITIVE TO THE RESILIENCY GOALS.
18 WE WANT TO WORK WITH OUR COLLEAGUES TO ENSURE THAT WE
19 UNDERSTAND AREAS THAT ARE AT RISK, AND MAKE OUR INVESTMENTS
20 ACCORDINGLY. AND THEN ALL THE WORK THAT WE DO WILL BE TRANSIT
21 ORIENTED, AND WILL REQUIRE A CERTAIN ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS
22 IN THE BUILDING MATERIALS AND BUILDING DESIGN. SO, THERE IS
23 GREAT OVERLAP, BUT, ALSO, THE BULK OF OUR RESOURCES MUST GO TO
24 PROVIDING HOUSING THAT IS NEEDED, AS I'LL TALK ABOUT IN MY



MARCH 17, 2023

1 PRESENTATION. BUT THERE IS GREAT OPPORTUNITY FOR COLLABORATION
2 IN TERMS OF LOCATION AND TYPES OF HOUSING THAT WE BUILD.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. I'M GOING TO STOP THERE.

5 COMMISSIONER EISEN?

6

7 **REBECCA EISEN:** THANK YOU. I HAD A QUESTION, DANA, ABOUT THE
8 PROJECTS THAT YOU LISTED THAT ARE ONGOING, TWO OF WHICH ARE
9 LEVIES, AND FOLLOWING UP ON JIM'S COMMENT ABOUT CONTIGUOUS
10 MUNICIPALITIES. IF ONE SOLUTION IS TO BUILD A LEVY HERE, DOES
11 NOT IMPACT THE SEA LEVEL RISE IMPACTS ELSEWHERE? AND, IF SO,
12 HOW DOES THAT GET ACCOUNTED IN, WHEN YOU'RE TRYING TO
13 DETERMINE WHERE THE NEEDS ARE FOR THE -- WHERE THE REVENUES
14 ARE, ET CETERA?

15

16 **DANA BRECHWALD:** IT CAN, YOU HAVE TO STUDY THE HYDRO DYNAMICS
17 OF THE LEVY AND HOW IT BASICALLY PUSHES WATER FROM ONE TO
18 ANOTHER. IT DEPENDS ON THE TYPE OF LEVY, IF IT'S A LIVING LEVY
19 AND IT REDUCED WAVE ACTION BECAUSE IT HAS ENOUGH OF A SLOPE
20 AND IT ATTENUATES THE WAVE ACTION THAT OBVIOUSLY HAS LESS OF
21 AN IMPACT THAN SOMETHING LIKE OBVIOUSLY, A SEA WALL. AND I
22 THINK THIS HAS TO DO, ALSO, WITH THE REGIONAL SHORELINE
23 ADAPTATION PLAN AND THE TYPES OF -- OF INTERVENTIONS THAT WE
24 WOULD LIKE TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO TAKE TO ACCOUNT FOR IN THEIR
25 ADAPTATION PLANNING, AS WELL AS THE TYPES OF STUDIES THAT WE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THINK ARE BEST PRACTICES TO ACCOUNT FOR IMPACTS TO NEIGHBORS.
2 THE ULTIMATE GOAL IS THAT WE SOMEHOW USE THE GUIDELINES THAT
3 ARE BEING DEVELOPED IN THE REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTING A PLAN
4 IN CONJUNCTION WITH WHATEVER FUNDING MEASURES WE END UP USING
5 SO THAT WE HAVE A SET OF CRITERIA THAT WE KNOW THAT THEY HAVE
6 MET THAT ENSURE THAT, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER PLANNING, WHATEVER
7 PROJECTS PEOPLE HAVE PLANNED ARE IN ALIGNMENT WITH THIS SET OF
8 REGIONAL VALUES AND GOALS, AND THEY FOLLOW, SORT OF, THE BEST
9 PRACTICES THAT ENSURE THAT THE PROJECTS MEET BOTH LOCAL NEEDS
10 AS WELL AS THESE CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE HAVE FOR THE REGION.
11 SO, THAT'S -- YOU KNOW, WHEN I SPOKE ABOUT GUIDING PRINCIPLES
12 OR SOME, SORT OF, A VALUE SET THAT WE THINK SHOULD BE ALIGNED
13 WITH WHAT -- IF WE DO END UP PROPOSING SOME, SORT OF, REGIONAL
14 FUNDING MEASURE, IT IS -- THAT'S PART OF THE SET OF PRINCIPLES
15 OR GUIDING VALUES THAT WE NEED TO DETERMINE ALONG WITH THE
16 FUNDING MEASURE, WHICH HOPEFULLY WE -- WE HAVE A GET SET THAT
17 WE HAVE THROUGH BAY ADAPT AND WE CONTINUE TO DEVELOP THOSE
18 THROUGH THE REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTATION PLAN GUIDELINES SO
19 WE WOULD HAVE THAT READY-MADE AND BE ABLE TO ALIGN THAT WITH
20 WHERE WE DIRECT FUNDING FIRST.

21

22 **REBECCA EISEN:** THAT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE, AND OBVIOUSLY ARGUES
23 FAIR REGIONAL APPROACH TO THESE PROBLEMS WHICH IS WHAT YOU'RE
24 UNDERTAKING.

25



MARCH 17, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** COMMISSIONER WASSERMAN?
2
3 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THANK YOU. EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. TO THE VERY
4 HONORABLE JIM SPERING'S COMMENTS, ABSOLUTELY IMPORTANT. WE
5 NEED TO CARRY THIS TO THE COUNTIES AND THE CITIES AND WE
6 ABSOLUTELY NEED TO FOCUS ON THE PROJECTS THAT ARE NEEDED. AND
7 THE DAMAGE THAT WILL OCCUR IF THOSE PROJECTS ARE NOT CREATED.
8 AND JUST TO DO A CONTRAST FROM THE SLIDES WE SAW, OR THAT
9 FLASHED ON OUR SCREEN, THERE IS AN ESTIMATED \$110 BILLION
10 COST. THERE IS AN ESTIMATED \$236 BILLION DAMAGE IF WE DON'T DO
11 THAT. IT'S OBVIOUSLY NOT ONE FOR ONE IN MANY WAYS, AND, OH, BY
12 THE WAY, THE 236 IS CLEARLY LOCAL, BECAUSE IT'S BASED ON
13 ASSESSED VALUES. AND AS WE ALL KNOW, IN A NUMBER OF
14 CIRCUMSTANCES, ASSESSED VALUES ARE MUCH LOWER THAN TRUE VALUES
15 AND REPLACEMENT VALUES. SO, THE -- AND THE ROLL OUT OF ALL
16 THIS, CONTINUING ROLL-OUT, IS OF CRITICAL IMPORTANCE, AND WE
17 HAVE ACTUALLY GOT A CALL LATER THIS AFTERNOON TO TALK ABOUT
18 HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT AND AS DEMONSTRATION OF FURTHER,
19 VERY IMPORTANT COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION, MTC IS, IN
20 ADDITION TO WHAT YOU HAVE SEEN IN COOPERATION, ALSO IS HELPING
21 US WITH SOME OF THEIR PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER RESOURCES,
22 WHICH WE DO NOT HAVE. [LAUGHTER] SO, YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT.
23 WE ARE WORKING ON IT. WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS. BUT WE HAVE GOT A
24 HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK TO DO. THANK YOU. AND THIS IS A VERY
25 IMPORTANT STEP FORWARD.



MARCH 17, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER
3 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS? YES, BOARD
4 MEMBER ROSS.

5

6 **MARK ROSS:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR GIOIA HAD TO GO TO ANOTHER
7 MEETING. AND SUPERVISOR SPERING, AGAIN, AS MANY TIMES HITS THE
8 NAIL ON THE HEAD, WE DO HAVE TO TALK ABOUT WHAT THIS IS ALL
9 FOR, BEFORE YOU HIT PEOPLE WITH THE MONEY. BUT I JUST WANT TO,
10 AFTER LISTENING TO MEMBER WASSERMAN'S COMMENTS, I'M IN REAL
11 LIFE, I'M A REAL ESTATE BROKER, AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I
12 WONDERED ABOUT AND FEAR IS THE DRIVER, BECAUSE IF WE CAN -- IN
13 THE ABSENCE OF DOING SOMETHING REGIONALLY, HERE IS WHAT'S
14 GOING HAPPEN SUBREGIONALLY, THE INSURANCE COMPANIES ARE GOING
15 TO START SEEING, AT SOME POINT, THE RISK. ONCE THE INSURANCE
16 COMPANY STARTS SEEING THE RISK, MUCH LIKE WE'RE SEEING IN THE
17 FIRE INSURANCE, HIGH FIRE SEVERITY ZONES, THEY'RE GOING TO
18 REACT. AND THE REACTION WILL THEN BECOME, THROUGH INSURANCE
19 COMPANIES OF, WE'RE NOT GOING TO ENSURE THAT ANYMORE. ONCE
20 THAT HAPPENS YOU HAVE PEOPLE SCRAMBLING FOR THEIR FEMA
21 INSURANCE OR WHATEVER VERSION IS AVAILABLE, WITHOUT FLOOD
22 INSURANCE OR INSURANCE THAT COVERS YOUR PROPERTY, MORTGAGE
23 COMPANIES WON'T WIN. SO PEOPLE CAN'T BUY A NEW HOME, OR CAN'T
24 REFINANCE THEIR HOME. BUT EVEN MORE SCARY IS, WITHOUT
25 INSURANCE, IN THEY FIND OUT AN EXISTING MORTGAGE DOES NOT HAVE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 INSURANCE, THEY CAN FORCE THE ISSUE AND TECHNICALLY RECLAIM,
2 FORE CLOSING THE PROPERTY. SO THIS IS NOT JUST AN ARCANE,
3 WELL, COULD THIS HAPPEN ISSUE, WHICH I KNOW NOBODY HERE THINKS
4 THAT, BUT THIS COULD HAPPEN SOONER THAN WE THINK. VERY SEVERE
5 FINANCIAL EFFECTS THAT I DON'T THINK HAVE BEEN MENTIONS OR
6 CONTEMPLATED YET. AND IT WILL HAPPEN SOONER RATHER THAN LATER.
7 AS WE'RE SEEING WITH THE FIRE INSURANCE ISSUES. THANK YOU. AND
8 THAT'S MY COMMENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. UNLESS THERE ARE OTHER
11 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS ON THE
12 PRESENTATION. WE CAN GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE ANY MEMBER
13 OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM OR WERE
14 THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS. I DO SEE
17 A HAND RAISED. JIM?

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** AND WE'LL GIVE THE SPEAKER TWO MINUTES.
20 AND IF ARE THERE ANY SPEAKERS AFTER THIS ONE PLEASE RAISE YOUR
21 HAND TO BE ADDED TO THE SPEAKER'S QUEUE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I BELIEVE I HAVE UNMUTED MYSELF. WILL.

24

25 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU NOW.



MARCH 17, 2023

1
2 **SPEAKER:** JIM HAASSER. I LIVE IN CASTRO VALLEY SO SEA LEVEL
3 RISE MIGHT NOT BE A SUPER THING. ON THE FINANCING PIECE I
4 WOULD ASK PEOPLE TO LOOK AT MEASURE AA AND ASK THEMSELVES WHAT
5 HAS IT DONE FOR ME, SEEING AS HOW THAT IS AN ASSESSMENT AND WE
6 ALL NEED TO BE TAKING A LOOK AT AS AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT HAS
7 HAPPENED IN THE PAST. I KNOW COMMISSIONER WASSERMAN HAS
8 COMMENTED AT BCDC MEETINGS THAT WE PROBABLY SHOULD ASK FOR
9 EVEN MORE MONEY OUT OF THE PEOPLE, AND I LOOK AT MY \$15 OR SO
10 A YEAR WHICH IS PEANUTS, WHICH I UNDERSTAND, AND GO WHAT HAS
11 IT DONE FOR THE COMMUNITY AND I HAVEN'T SEEN MUCH THERE. WANT
12 TO MAKE SURE WE GOING AFTER GREAT STATE SUPPORT FOR THE
13 HIGHWAYS THAT WERE MENTIONED 101 SAN MATEO COUNTY IN
14 PARTICULAR DON'T WANT TO SEE IT GOING TOWARDS TOLL ROADS AS
15 POSSIBLY IS GOING TO HAPPEN WITH HIGHWAY 37 OR AS WE ENDED UP
16 DOING WITH THE BAY BRIDGE AS THE BAY AREA REPRESENTATIVES
17 NEGOTIATED WITH THE SOUTH COUNTY OR SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
18 REPRESENTATIVES. ARE WE GOING TO GO WITH WALLS SUCH AS WHAT
19 FOSTER CITY DID OR TRY TO GO WITH AN ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY
20 ECO TONE WHICH IS WHAT THEY'RE WORKING ON IN NORTH RICHMOND AS
21 WE MOVE FORWARD. WHERE ARE WE GOING TO GET THE RAILROADS
22 INVOLVED IN THIS STUFF ONCE YOU TAKE THAT TRIP TO CAPITAL
23 CORRIDOR YOU REALIZE THE RAILROAD IS THE BARRIER FOR SEA LEVEL
24 RISE IN A LOT OF AREAS AND THEY'RE DISCOVERING SOUTHERN
25 CALIFORNIA RAILROADS HAVE SOME OF THE PROBLEMS IN TERMS OF



MARCH 17, 2023

1 DOING THAT. AND FIGURING OUT EXACTLY WHAT IS THE PROBABILITY
2 OF PROJECTED HEIGHTS PRESENTED. OPC DID SOME PROBABILITIES SO
3 WE KNOW WHAT THE PERCENTAGE BASIS IS; IS IT A 5% CHANCE OF
4 THAT SEA LEVEL RISE OR 20% CHANCE OF THAT SEA LEVEL RISE
5 THAT'S WORTHWHILE TO SHOW TO THE POSSIBLE AT THE SAME TIME.
6 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND THANKS FOR THE GREAT WORK.

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS
9 OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, IF SO
10 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER ATTENDEES WITH A
11 HAND RAISED. THANK YOU FOR THE PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU FOR
12 THE EXCELLENT WORK. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT TO KIND OF QUANTIFY
13 WHAT THE NEED IS, AND I AGREE, I THINK THIS IS GOING TO BE KEY
14 TO MAKING THE CASE TO ELECTED OFFICIALS IN COMMUNITIES OF THE
15 BAY AREA ABOUT WHY WE NEED TO ADDRESS THIS PROBLEM: SO, THANK
16 YOU ALL FOR YOUR WORK. OKAY. WE'LL PROCEED TO THE NEXT AGENDA
17 ITEM WHICH IS ITEM EIGHT, THIS IS A PRESENTATION ON THE BAY
18 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. AND A POTENTIAL REGIONAL
19 HOUSING FUNDING MEASURE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO TURN THE FLOOR
20 OVER TO OUR BAHFA DIRECTOR, KATE HARTLEY TO PRESENT ON THIS
21 ITEM.

22

23 **KATE HARTLEY:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND IF I COULD HAVE THE
24 PRESENTATION LOADED? GREAT. SO, THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME. IT IS
25 REALLY GREAT TO BE HERE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE BAY AREA



MARCH 17, 2023

1 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, OR BAHFA, ESPECIALLY IN THE CONTEXT
2 OF PLANNING FOR OUR REGIONAL NEEDS HOLISTICALLY, INCLUDING
3 HOUSING, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, AND SEA LEVEL RISE. MANY BARC
4 BOARD MEMBERS WERE INSTRUMENTAL IN CREATING BAHFA. SO, I WANT
5 TO THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR YOUR TREMENDOUS WORK. FOR THOSE OF
6 YOU WHO ARE NOT FAMILIAR WITH BAHFA, WE ARE THE STATE'S FIRST
7 REGIONAL HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. WE WERE CREATED IN 2019 BY
8 STATE LEGISLATION, AND WE HAVE THE POWER TO RAISE MONEY FOR
9 THE ENTIRE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA. THIS IS AN ANTIDOTE TO THE
10 FRAGMENTED WAY THAT WE CURRENTLY RAISE HOUSING -- AFFORDABLE
11 HOUSING FUNDS. AND OUR PURPOSE IS TO BETTER DELIVER THE
12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THAT THE BAY AREA NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE,
13 PLEASE. SO, WHAT EXACTLY IS AT ISSUE? FIRST OF ALL,
14 HOMELESSNESS. RIGHT NOW, THERE ARE, ON OUR STREETS AND IN OUR
15 SHELTERS, ALMOST 37,000 PEOPLE LIVING WITHOUT A HOME. AND
16 BETWEEN 2019 AND 2022, OUR HOMELESS COUNTS ROSE, ACROSS THE
17 REGION, APPROXIMATELY 10%. SOME COUNTIES SAW VERY DRAMATIC
18 INCREASES, AND ALAMEDA COUNTY IT WAS ABOUT 20%, CONTRA COSTA
19 COUNTY, ABOUT 35%. SECONDLY, WE HAVE DONE A VERY BAD JOB FOR A
20 VERY LONG TIME OF BUILDING THE HOUSING THAT OUR RESIDENTS NEED
21 IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. THIS, OBVIOUSLY, HAS A DAMAGING
22 ECONOMIC EFFECT REGARDING WORKFORCE ATTRACTION AND RETENTION.
23 IT DAMAGES OUR COMMUNITIES, WHICH IS DEMONSTRATED VERY STARKLY
24 IN RECENT YEARS BY THE STRUGGLE THAT OUR SCHOOL DISTRICTS HAVE
25 IN RETAINING THEIR TEACHERS. AND IT HAS SIGNIFICANT



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES, AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT A LOT.
2 HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY FORCES LOWER AND MODERATE INCOME
3 PEOPLE TO RELOCATE TO CITIES FARTHER AWAY FROM THEIR JOBS AND
4 THIS MEANS THEIR IN THEIR CARS. SO, THERE IS -- THERE IS GREAT
5 ENVIRONMENTAL INCENTIVE TO PROVIDE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
6 NEAR JOB CENTERS. OUR CURRENT RHNA IS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING
7 ONLY, IT IS AT ABOUT 180,000 UNITS NEEDED OVER THE NEXT EIGHT
8 YEARS. AND WE DO HAVE A START ON THIS GOAL. BAHFA COMMISSIONED
9 A PIPELINE REPORT ON WHAT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT
10 PIPELINE IS ACROSS THE REGION, AND THAT IS HOW MANY PROJECTS
11 ARE OUT THERE THAT ARE IN SOME STATE OF PREDEVELOPMENT, THAT
12 IS THEY HAVE MAYBE SECURED LAND STARTED THEIR ENTITLEMENTS BUT
13 HAVEN'T SECURED THEIR FUNDING YET AND THAT NUMBER STANDS AT
14 ABOUT 33,000 UNITS. IT'S A GOOD START. BUT OUR ABILITY TO
15 DELIVER THIS HOUSING WITHOUT FINANCIAL SYSTEMS CHANGED IS
16 SUSPECT GIVEN OUR LONG HISTORY OF UNDERPRODUCTION. NEXT SLIDE.
17 SO, BAHFA'S ROLE IS TO HELP FILL THAT FINANCING GAP AND TO
18 HELP CREATE SYSTEMS THAT CAN BUILD AND PRESERVE HOUSING FASTER
19 AND MORE COST EFFECTIVELY. WE CAN RAISE REVENUE ACROSS THE
20 NINE COUNTIES FOR THE THREE PS AS WE CALL THEM, PRODUCTION,
21 PRESERVATION, AND TENANT PROTECTIONS AND OUR MANDATE REQUIRES
22 US TO WORK COLLABORATIVELY WITH CITIES AND COUNTIES. PART OF
23 THE COLLABORATIVE EFFORT COMES IN OUR GOVERNING STRUCTURES,
24 THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE BAHFA BOARD, WHICH IS
25 COMPRISED OF THE SAME MEMBERS AS THE MTC COMMISSION, SHARE



MARCH 17, 2023

1 GOVERNING RESPONSIBILITIES FOR BAHFA'S ACTIONS. NEXT SLIDE
2 PLEASE. WHILE THE PRINCIPLE BENEFITS WE CAN PROVIDE THE BAY
3 AREA RESIDE IN OUR FUNDING POWERS, I'LL TAKE A MINUTE TO TALK
4 ABOUT WHAT WE HAVE BEEN ENGAGED IN OVER THE LAST YEAR FOR THE
5 REGION'S IMMEDIATE HOUSING NEEDS AND BENEFITS. WE HAVE
6 LAUNCHED FIVE PILOT PROGRAMS USING FUNDING THAT WE GOT FROM
7 THE STATE AT THE END OF 2021. THESE INCLUDE THE DOORWAY
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PORTAL. IT'S AN ONLINE HOUSING APPLICATION
9 PORTAL WHICH WILL ENABLE PEOPLE LOOKING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING
10 OPPORTUNITIES TO SEARCH FOR AND APPLY FOR HOUSING RIGHT FROM
11 THEIR PHONE OR THEIR PERSONAL COMPUTER. THIS IS -- THE HEART
12 OF THAT EFFORT IS REALLY TO MAKE LOOKING FOR HOUSING ACROSS
13 THE REGION A MORE EQUITABLE ACTIVITY. RIGHT NOW, IF YOU ARE
14 LOOKING FOR HOUSING, YOU BETTER HAVE TIME, PERSEVERANCE AND
15 ENERGY. AND NOT EVERYBODY HAS THAT TO SPARE. WE COMPLETED AN
16 AFFORDABLE HOUSING STUDY IT'S GREAT DATA WHICH WE ARE USING IN
17 OUR PLANNING ONE OF THE PS WE'RE PURSUING IS PRESERVATION AND
18 THIS IS THE PROCESS OF PROTECTING LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS IN
19 THEIR HOMES SO WE ASSIST COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO BUY
20 AND REHABILITATE EXISTING BUILDINGS AND THEN CONVERT THEM TO
21 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND AS ONE OF OUR FIRST EFFORTS, WE WILL
22 BE LAUNCHING A NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY IN THE SUMMER
23 WITH MONEY FROM THE STATE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING
24 GRANTS. AND, FINALLY, WE HAVE ANTI-DISPLACEMENT AND
25 HOMELESSNESS PILOTS WE'RE SEEKING TO COORDINATE RESOURCES



MARCH 17, 2023

1 ACROSS THE REGION AND IDENTIFY INEFFICIENCIES AND GAPS AND TRY
2 TO HELP BRING THE JURISDICTIONS TOGETHER IN THIS EFFORT TO
3 PREVENT HOMELESSNESS AND ADDRESSES HOMELESSNESS. THIS IS A
4 PARTICULARLY DIFFICULT ISSUE BECAUSE OF A LACK OF READILY
5 AVAILABLE OPERATING SERVICES FUNDING THAT LOW-INCOME,
6 EXTREMELY LOW-INCOME, HOUSEHOLDS NEED. RIGHT NOW, WE'RE
7 LAUNCHING DATA COLLECTION EFFORTS INCLUDING EVICTION STUDIES.
8 SURPRISINGLY THERE IS A HUGE VOID OF INFORMATION ABOUT THE
9 PRINCIPLE CAUSES OF EVICTION, AND WITHOUT THAT INFORMATION WE
10 CAN'T CRAFT THE BEST SOLUTIONS. SO WE'LL BE WORKING WITH
11 CONSULTANTS TO GO INTO THE COURTS TO UNDERSTAND THE DATA SO WE
12 CAN WORK TOGETHER WITH THE JURISDICTIONS TO TRY TO TAKE THE
13 ACTIONS THAT WILL HELP PREVENT EVICTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
14 BUT BACK TO OUR PRINCIPLE EFFORT THAT IS SECURING THE
15 RESOURCES WE NEED TO BUILD THE HOUSING THAT BAY AREA RESIDENTS
16 NEED. WE ARE WORKING TO PUT A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE ON THE
17 BALLOT IN 2024. NEXT SLIDE. THE PROJECTED VALUE OF THE
18 MEASURE, WHICH WOULD BE A GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND IS BETWEEN
19 10 AND 20 BILLION. AND WE ARE FORTUNATE THAT MUCH OF THE
20 GROUNDWORK FOR THIS EFFORT IS IN PLACE. WE HAVE OUR ENABLING
21 LEGISLATION, HOUSING ADVOCATES AND STAKEHOLDERS HAVE BEEN
22 WORKING ON THIS SENTENCE 2020. SO, THERE IS A STRONG CAMPAIGN
23 AND FUNDING RAISING EFFORT ALREADY UNDERWAY AND HOUSING
24 ADVOCATES ARE ALSO WORKING ON AN INSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT IN
25 PARALLEL WITH OUR REGIONAL FUNDING EFFORTS. THIS WOULD LOWER



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THE VOTER THRESHOLD FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING GENERAL OBLIGATION
2 BONDS FROM 2/3 TO A MAJORITY. WE ALSO HOPE IT WOULD SLIGHTLY
3 INCREASE THE ELIGIBLE USE OF GO BONDS SO THAT WE CAN BETTER
4 ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS AND IF WE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO PUT A
5 MEASURE ON THE BALLOT WITH A MAJORITY VOTER THRESHOLD, WE FEEL
6 THAT WE COULD DEFINITELY BE SUCCESSFUL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE
7 MEASURE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WOULD BE TRANSFORMATIVE, EACH
8 JURISDICTION WOULD RECEIVE AN UNPRECEDENTED AMOUNT OF FUNDING
9 AGAIN THIS IS A FULL REGIONAL VIEW OF WHAT WE MUST DO TO MEET
10 THE HOUSING NEEDS OF OUR RESIDENTS SOME COUNTIES LIKE ALAMEDA
11 AND SAN FRANCISCO AND SANTA CLARA HAVE PASSED SUCCESSFUL BOND
12 MEASURES IN THE LAST FIVE OR SEVEN YEARS BUT TO PROVIDE THIS
13 NEW LEVEL OF RESOURCES FOR ALL NINE COUNTIES WOULD CREATE A
14 BRAND-NEW PATHWAY FOR BETTER HOUSING. THIS GRAPHIC SHOWS A WAY
15 IN WHICH OUR ENABLING LEGISLATION, WHICH IS ASSEMBLY BILL 1487
16 DEFINES THE EXPENDITURE REQUIREMENTS AS I MENTIONED THIS IS IN
17 COLLABORATION WITH CITIES AND COUNTIES. 80% OF ALL THE FUNDS
18 THAT WE WOULD RAISE GO BACK TO THE COUNTY OF ORIGIN, ACCORDING
19 TO ASSESSED VALUE, BAHFA WOULD RETAIN 20%. THE RULES ARE THAT
20 THE MAJORITY OF THE MONEY MUST BE SPENT ON NEW PRODUCTION, OR
21 AT LEAST 52%. THERE IS ALSO PRESCRIBED EXPENDITURE LEVELS FOR
22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION AND PROTECTIONS. AND THEN,
23 FINALLY, A.B. 1487 SAYS THAT CITIES AND COUNTIES SHOULD
24 PRIORITIZE PROJECTS THAT ADDRESS THEIR EXTREMELY LOW, LOW-
25 INCOME, AND VERY LOW-INCOME RHNA OBLIGATIONS. AND SO WITHIN



MARCH 17, 2023

1 THOSE PARAMETERS, CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE IN CHARGE OF THEIR
2 MONEY. THEY RETAIN CONTROL OF THEIR PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS AND
3 CAN PRIORITIZE ON THAT LOCAL LEVEL. NEXT SLIDE. OUR WORK WILL
4 BE GUIDED BY OUR BUSINESS PLAN AND EQUITY FRAMEWORK THAT IS
5 INFORMING OUR BUSINESS PLAN. WE HAVE BEEN AT WORK ON THAT FOR
6 THE LAST YEAR. THERE HAS BEEN EXTENSIVE OUTREACH THAT WE
7 CONDUCTED AS PART OF THAT, AND WE ARE TAKING THE FINAL
8 VERSIONS TO OUR GOVERNING BOARDS FOR APPROVAL IN APRIL AND
9 MAY. NEXT SLIDE. AND AN IMPORTANT PART OF OUR EQUITY FRAMEWORK
10 IS ADDRESSING CLIMATE CHANGE AND ADDRESSING CLIMATE JUSTICE
11 NEEDS. SO THAT THIS MEANS THAT WE WILL BE FOCUSING ON
12 INVESTMENTS THAT ARE TRANSIT ORIENTED. WE WANT TO BUILD
13 HOUSING THAT IS CLOSE TO TRANSIT THAT REDUCES VEHICLE MILES
14 TRAVELED, REDUCES GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WE WILL REQUIRE
15 THE DEVELOPERS WITH WHOM WE WORK TO USE ENVIRONMENTALLY
16 SUSTAINABLE BUILDING METHODS AND DESIGN AND BUILD BUILDINGS
17 THAT EXCEED STRONG GREEN BUILDING STANDARDS AND WE, AS I
18 MENTIONED EARLIER, WE WILL BE WORKING WITH OUR COLLEAGUES AT
19 MTC TO ENSURE THAT WE UNDERSTAND WHAT AREAS ARE AT RISK FROM
20 SEA LEVEL RISE, AND SO THAT WE CAN HELP TO MEET THE RESILIENCY
21 OBJECTIVES THAT BARC IS WORKING ON. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OVER
22 THE NEXT YEAR AND A HALF WE'LL BE CONTINUING OUR OUTREACH TO
23 JURISDICTIONS, TO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND CITY COUNCILS WE'LL
24 HAVE PUBLIC TOWN HALL MEETINGS, WE'LL BE WORKING IN
25 COLLABORATION WITH STAKEHOLDERS WE'LL BE PREPARING OUR



MARCH 17, 2023

1 EXPENDITURE PLANS AND OTHER BALLOT REQUIREMENTS THAT WE'LL BE
2 TAKING TO OUR GOVERNING BOARDS FOR APPROVAL AND WE ALSO LOOK
3 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH BARC AND CREATING ENVIRONMENTALLY
4 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENTS THAT ADDRESS BOTH CRITICAL HOUSING
5 NEEDS AS WELL AS CLIMATE CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE. THAT CONCLUDES MY
6 PRESENTATION. HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KATE. ARE THERE
9 ANY QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD ON THE
10 PRESENTATION? COMMISSIONER SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SEEMS LIKE I HAVE BEEN GOING FIRST ALL DAY.
13 YOU KNOW, KATE, FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU, YOU KNOW, FOR THE
14 PLAN THAT YOU HAVE, FOR DOING THIS OUTREACH IN ALL NINE BAY
15 AREA COUNTIES. YOU KNOW? I MET WITH YOU, I GUESS, ABOUT A WEEK
16 AGO, AND SO IT'S A GREAT APPROACH. BUT, ONE THING THAT I
17 WANTED TO ASK IS THAT, IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION ABOUT THE
18 MEASURE WORKING WITH THE COUNTY'S SOCIAL SERVICES? YOU KNOW,
19 WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE NUMBER OF HOMELESS PEOPLE ON THE STREET,
20 A LOT OF DRUG ADDICTION AND A LOT OF MENTALLY ILL. THIS
21 BUILDING A HOUSING DOESN'T SOLVE THAT PROBLEM, I MEAN, AS A
22 SUPERVISOR, WE PUT PEOPLE IN HOUSING THEY DON'T STAY THERE
23 BECAUSE MENTALLY THEY'RE NOT CAPABLE OF UNDERSTANDING THAT AND
24 INTO DRUG ADDICTION SO YOU KNOW I THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO GET
25 PUBLIC SUPPORT THE MENTALLY ILL AND DRUG ADDICTION IS



MARCH 17, 2023

1 EVERYBODY EVERYBODY'S SEEING IT EVERY DAY IN OUR COMMUNITY
2 THERE HAS TO BE SOME LINKAGE THERE WITH THIS HOUSING AND
3 DEALING WITH THAT PROBLEM AT THE SAME TIME YOU KNOW WITHIN THE
4 COUNTIES IF YOU WOULD ADDRESS THAT PROBLEM AT THE SAME TIME.
5 BUT I HAVE A GREAT APPRECIATION FOR WHAT YOU'RE DOING, THE
6 APPROACH YOU'RE TAKING. AND I LIKE THE WAY YOU STARTED THE
7 PRESENTATION, YOU REALLY STARTED FOCUSING ON THE PROBLEM. AND
8 YOU KNOW, THIS GAP BETWEEN THE HAVES AND HAVE-NOTS IN
9 CALIFORNIA IS GROWING AT AN ACCELERATED RATE. AND IF WE DON'T
10 START ADDRESSING THAT, I DON'T THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE AN
11 EASY SOLUTION TO THIS. AND I THINK THIS IS A GOOD FIRST STEP
12 TOWARDS THAT. THAT SOCIAL SERVICE PIECE TO ME IS MISSING. AND
13 IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE TO PUT INTO THIS CONVERSATION. SO
14 THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS, MR. CHAIR. THANK YOU. AGAIN, THANKS
15 KATE, GOOD WORK.

16

17 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
18 ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE BARC
19 GOVERNING BOARD ON THIS ITEM? I'LL JUST SAY THAT I THINK THIS
20 IS HIGH PRIORITY FOR BOTH ABAG AND MTC OVER THE NEXT YEAR AND
21 CERTAINLY WE'LL BE PROVIDING UPDATES TO BARC ABOUT THIS AND I
22 THINK LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND AWARENESS AND ENGAGEMENT IS KEY
23 WHICH IS WHY I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT WE SCHEDULED THIS
24 PRESENTATION TODAY. UNLESS ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR



MARCH 17, 2023

1 COMMENTS, I'LL ASK IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

2 OR WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** CHAIR, I DON'T SEE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT

5 FOR THIS ITEM EITHER ON ZOOM OR IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO

6 WRITTEN COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED.

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THANK YOU KATE FOR

9 JOINING US THIS MORNING AND FOR ALL YOUR WORK. AND WITH THAT,

10 THAT COMPLETES OUR AGENDA FOR THIS MORNING. WE'LL PROCEED NOW

11 TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS. THIS IS AN

12 OPPORTUNITY FOR ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC TO SPEAK TO AN ITEM

13 THAT IS NOT ON THIS MORNING'S BARC GOVERNING BOARD AGENDA ARE

14 THERE MEMBERS HERE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM WHO WISH TO

15 SPEAK ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS? IF SO RAISE YOUR HAND. SEEING

16 NONE. WERE THERE WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON NON-AGENDA

17 MATTERS?

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'LL PROCEED TO ADJOURNMENT THE NEXT

22 MEETING OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD IS MAY 19TH, 2023 AT 10:00

23 A.M. AND THIS MEETING IS NOW ADJOURNED. THANK YOU ALL.

24 [ADJOURNED]

25



NTTT

Broadcasting Government