



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN**

2 **SUBCOMMITTEE**

3 **MONDAY, MARCH 13TH, 2023, 1:00 PM**

4

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON, ONE AND ALL, INCLUDING THE
7 POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO ARE HERE IN THE ROOM,
8 PEOPLE WHO HAVE, WITH GREAT FORTITUDE, FOLLOWED THE CURRENT
9 INSTRUCTIONS TO BE ABLE TO DIAL IN REMOTELY. AND TO STAFF,
10 THIS MEETING IS BEING CALLED TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS BEING
11 WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO
12 SPEAK SHOULD DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
13 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
14 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. STAFF WILL BE
15 [INDISCERNIBLE] MEMBERS OF THIS BODY REMOTELY. WILL THE CLERK
16 CONDUCT ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS PRESENT?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR LEVIN?

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR KALLINS IS EXCUSED. MEMBER
23 ALLEN IS ABSENT. MEMBER CUSHMAN?

24

25 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES. I'M HERE.



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER DEUTSCHE GROSS IS EXCUSED. AND
3 GLASER?

4

5 **GERRY GLASER:** I AM HERE.

6

7 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** I AM HERE MARTHA.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT WASN'T NOTICED. GOYAL IS EXCUSED.
10 GRIFFITHS?

11

12 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER HANKERSON?

15

16 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LIEU?

19

20 **CARINA LIEU:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER LOPER IS EXCUSED. MR. PETTY?

23

24 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** HERE.

25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE? IS EXCUSE. STANKE?

2

3 **BRIAN STANKE:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALTERNATE ELDRED?

6

7 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'M HERE, MARTHA.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** ALTERNATE, KASS? IS NOT HERE. AND ALTERNATE SCOTT?

10

11 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM WITHOUT

14 ALTERNATES NEEDED TO VOTE.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM TWO, APPROVAL OF

17 THE JANUARY 9TH, 2023 MINUTES. ANY MOTION AND SECOND TO

18 APPROVE THE MINUTES OF JANUARY 9TH, 2023?

19

20 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GRIFFITHS MOVED.

21

22 **GERRY GLASER:** AND GLASER WILL SECOND.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AND DOES THE CLERK HAVE ANY COMMENTS

25 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
4 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO COMMENT
5 ON THIS ITEM.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. CAN WE NOW VOTE?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. CHAIR LEVIN?

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS IS EXCUSED. ALLEN? ABSENT.
14 CUSHMAN?

15

16 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. DEUTSCHE GROSS? IS EXCUSED.
19 GLASER?

20

21 **GERRY GLASER:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER GOYAL IS EXCUSED. MEMBER
24 GRIFFITHS?

25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

4

5 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU?

8

9 **CARINA LIEU:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LOPER IS EXCUSED. MALLON? IS ABSENT.

12 PIERCE?

13

14 **PHILIPPE PIERCE:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** STANKE.

17

18 **BRIAN STANKE:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

21 PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** MOVING TO THE NEXT ITEM OVERVIEW OF THE

24 TRANSFER DISCOUNT PILOT AND UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER BAY PASS

25 UPDATE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FREE AND REDUCED COST



MARCH 13, 2023

1 TRANSFER PILOT PROGRAM AND SECOND UPCOMING PHASE OF THE BAY
2 PASS PILOT FOR EMPLOYERS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS. THIS IS AN
3 INFORMATION ITEM AND WILL BE PRESENTED BY WILLIAM BACON, OF
4 MTC, AND MICE MICHAEL EISEMAN OF BART.

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU. WILLIAM BACON, MTC STAFF, JOINED BY
7 RYAN REEFS FROM THE TEAM. THE TWO OF US WILL GO THROUGHOUT
8 SLIDE DECK F YOU HAVE QUESTIONS SPEAK UP OTHERWISE WE'LL LOOK
9 FORWARD TO ANSWERING QUESTIONS AT THE END OF THE PRESENTATION.
10 THIS IS ITEM FOUR IN YOUR PACKET. THIS AFTERNOON THE PROJECT
11 TEAMED LIKE TO SHARE WITH THE PROJECT COMMITTEE UPDATED
12 PROPOSAL FOR HOW TO DELIVER THE PILOT FOR NO-COST REDUCED COST
13 TRANSFER PILOT, UPDATE TO THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT PROGRAM
14 FIRST PHASE WHICH HAS BEEN UNDERWAY SINCE AUGUST OF LAST YEAR
15 WHICH THE PROJECT TEAM IS CURRENTLY FOCUSED ON STANDING UP AND
16 SECOND PHASE OF THE PILOT FOCUSING ON EMPLOYERS AND
17 ORGANIZATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. MOST OF YOU WILL RECALL IN NOVEMBER
18 2021 THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ENDORSED THE BAY AREA
19 TRANSIT FARE POLICY VISION STATEMENT. SINCE THEN THE PROJECT
20 TEAM HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON WORKING ON ADVANCING THE FARE POLICY
21 INITIATIVES IDENTIFIED FOR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT IN THE VISION
22 STATEMENT. THE FIRST IDENTIFIED INITIATIVES FOR CLIPPER BAY
23 PASS PILOT PROGRAM WHICH IS UNDERWAY AND SECOND WAS TO
24 IMPLEMENT NO-COST AND REDUCED COST TRANSFERS FOR TRANSIT USERS
25 TRANSFERRING BETWEEN DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES BEGINNING IN



MARCH 13, 2023

1 2023 COINCIDING WITH THE ROLL OUT OF THE NEXT GENERATION
2 CLIPPER SYSTEM. GIVEN THAT THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM
3 IS EXPECTED TO ROLL OUT IN THE SUMMER OF 2024 RATHER THAN 2023
4 THE PROJECT TEAM AND CLIPPER STAFF HAVE INVESTIGATED WHAT
5 OPTIONS MIGHT BE AVAILABLE TO IMPLEMENT THE TRANSFER POLICY
6 CHANGE AS ENVISIONED IN THE POLICY VISION STATEMENT SOONER
7 THAN IN THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM. THE PROJECT TEAM HAS
8 RECOMMENDED TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE THAT OUR
9 CONTINUED FOCUS BE ON ROLLING OUT THE INTER-AGENCY TRANSFER
10 CHANGES IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM
11 NEXT YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. LAST FALL, AT AN EARLIER SUBCOMMITTEE
12 MEETING, THE PROJECT TEAM PRESENTED A DETAILED TRANSFER POLICY
13 PROPOSAL DOCUMENT THAT'S BEEN DEVELOPED BASED ON INPUT OF THE
14 TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF WORKING GROUP MEETING THE LAST FOUR
15 YEARS TO ENHANCE COORDINATION ACTIVITIES. THE PROPOSAL CAN BE
16 SUMMED UP IN THE TWO SENTENCES ON THE SLIDE. WHEN YOU MAKE A
17 TRIP THAT REQUIRES TRANSFERRING BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES, PAY
18 THE FULL FARE FOR JUST THE FIRST AGENCY YOU USE. ANY TRANSFER
19 TO ANOTHER AGENCY WITHIN TWO HOURS OF THE FIRST BOARDING IS
20 DISCOUNTED UP TO A LIMIT OF \$2.50 PER TRANSFER. THIS PROPOSAL
21 REPRESENTS A BIT OF EVOLUTION FROM WHAT WAS MODELLED IN THE
22 FARE COORDINATION INTEGRATION STUDY IN 2020 AND 2021 AS THE
23 PROJECT TEAM WORKED TO MAKE THE PROPOSAL AS CUSTOMER FRIENDLY
24 AND EASY TO UNDERSTAND AS POSSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN
25 WORKING TO DEVELOP THE TRANSFER POLICY PILOT PROPOSAL BEING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 DISCUSSED TODAY THE PROJECT TEAM HAS BEEN GUIDED BY THE
2 FOLLOWING PRINCIPLES YOU SEE ON THIS SLIDE FIRST AND AS
3 MENTIONED THE BUILDINGS WILL BE DEPLOYED ONCE THE NEXT-
4 GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM BECOMES AVAILABLE EXPECTED TO BE IN
5 SUMMER OF 2024. NEXT, THAT A PROGRAM WOULD BE LAUNCHED
6 INITIALLY AS A PILOT WITH GOAL OF 18 MONTH DEPLOYMENT FOR ALL
7 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE SYSTEM WITH AUTOMATIC EXTENSION FOR
8 24 MONTHS IF SUFFICIENT FUNDING IS AVAILABLE TO COVER 24
9 MONTHS WITH POTENTIAL REVENUE IMPACTS. THE FINANCIAL MODEL THE
10 PROJECT TEAM IS USING ASSUMES THAT WE WILL BE ABLE TO MITIGATE
11 OAR ELIMINATE ALL FINANCIAL RISK TO TRANSIT OPERATORS DURING
12 THE 18 TO 24 MONTH PILOT PERIOD BY USING THE \$22 MILLION
13 THAT'S BEEN SET ASIDE IN THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION
14 PLAN FUNDING STRATEGY ADOPTED BY MTC. NEXT THE TITLE SIX
15 ANALYSIS WHICH SAY FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION REQUIREMENT
16 FOR FARE POLICY CHANGES WILL BE COMPLETED AND THAT ANY
17 FINDINGS FROM THAT TITLE SIX EQUITY ANALYSIS WILL SHAPE THE
18 FINAL DETAILS OF HOW THE PILOT WILL LAUNCH THEN FINALLY THE
19 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE AND EACH TRANSIT AGENCY GOVERNING
20 BOARD ALONG WITH THE MTC COMMISSION WILL LIKELY NEED TO
21 PROVIDE THEIR CONSENT AND APPROVAL IN ORDER FOR THE PILOT
22 PROGRAM TO PROCEED AND LAUNCH WITH THE GENERATION SYSTEM. NEXT
23 SLIDE. RIGHT NOW WE'RE ON THE LEFT SIDE OF THE SLIDE, IN THE
24 WINTER AND EARLY SPRING OF 2023. THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK
25 FORCE IS SAID TO CONSIDER ENDORSEMENT OF A TRANSFER POLICY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PILOT PROPOSAL AT ITS MARCH 27TH MEETING IN A COUPLE OF WEEKS
2 SHOULD THAT OCCUR OVER THE COURSE OF THE SPRING THE PROJECT
3 TEAM WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE CLIPPER TEAM TO ENSURE
4 THAT ALL OF THE DETAILS OF THE PILOT ARE READY FOR FINAL
5 INCLUSION IN THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM SO WHEN IT
6 LAUNCHES AGAIN IN SUMMER OF NEXT YEAR IT WILL BE A SEAMLESS
7 EXPERIENCE FOR USERS. THE PROJECT TEAM WILL BE WORKING TO
8 DRAFT A INTER-AGENCY MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING TO ESTABLISH
9 THE PILOT AS WELL AS STARTING WORK ON THE TITLE SIX EQUITY
10 ANALYSIS. THIS WOULD LEAD INTO SUMMER OF THIS YEAR WHERE THE
11 INTER-AGENCY MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WOULD BE READY FOR
12 REVIEW AND MTC COMMISSION COULD ACT TO FORMALLY ALLOCATE THE
13 \$22 MILLION OF FUND THAT'S BEEN SET ASIDE FOR THIS INITIATIVE.
14 OVER THE COURSE OF FALL AND EARLY WINTER WE WOULD EXPECT
15 INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCY GOVERNING BOARDS TO BEGIN THE
16 PROCESS OF CONSIDERING THAT MOU. THE TITLE SIX EQUITY ANALYSIS
17 AND FORMAL FARE POLICY CHANGES THAT INDIVIDUAL AGENCY
18 GOVERNING BOARDS WOULD NEED TO PROVIDE IN ORDER FOR THE PILOT
19 TO LAUNCH. THEN NEXT SPRING LEADING UP TO THE ROLL OUT OF THE
20 NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM THERE WOULD BE A CUSTOMER
21 INFORMATION AND EDUCATION CAMPAIGN AND THEN THE POLICY WOULD
22 OFFICIALLY LAUNCH WHEN THE NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM GOES LIVE.
23 GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. JUST A LITTLE BIT MORE CONTEXT ABOUT
24 THE IMPLEMENTATION APPROACH. AS I MENTIONED A MOMENT AGO THE
25 INTENT IS TO LAUNCH THE PILOT AS AN 18 MONTH PILOT WITH THAT



MARCH 13, 2023

1 AUTOMATIC EXTENSION TO 24 MONTHS. AND OUR INTENTION IS THAT
2 DURING THAT TIME, WHICH I DO RECOGNIZE OVERLAPS WITH THE
3 PENDING TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CLIFF FOR A NUMBER OF OUR
4 TRANSIT OPERATORS, THE INTENT WOULD BE THAT THERE WOULD BE A
5 BROADER STRATEGY TO HELP ENSURE THAT THIS PILOT WOULD CONTINUE
6 IN THE LONGER TERM AS AGENCIES ENTER THAT FISCAL CLIFF PERIOD.
7 THE SECOND POINT HERE THAT I'LL JUST HIGHLIGHT IS THAT GIVEN
8 SIGNIFICANT UNCERTAINTY AROUND TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUES FOR
9 A NUMBER OF OUR OPERATORS THE INTENT IS THERE WOULD BE A
10 CHECKPOINT AFTER THE FIRST YEAR TO ASSESS THE STATUS OF
11 FUNDING, AND IF NECESSARY, OFF-RAMP FROM THE PILOT SHOULD
12 THERE BE A SIGNIFICANT OR EXISTENTIAL TRANSIT OPERATING
13 FUNDING CRISIS. THIRD, THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC WILL
14 CONTINUE TO SEEK TO IDENTIFY ADDITIONAL FUNDING, SUSTAIN THE
15 PILOT, FOR A FULL 24 MONTHS AND TO SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS
16 MORE GENERALLY, IS A KEY PRIORITY FOR MTC AND OUR TRANSIT
17 AGENCY PARTNERS THAT WORK AT THE STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL. GO
18 ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. I'M NOW GOING TO TURN THE PRESENTATION
19 OVER TO RYAN REEFS THE CLIPPER BAY PASS MANAGER BASED AT BART
20 WHOLE SHARE THE UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PROGRAM AND AS
21 MENTIONED THE NEXT STEP FOR THE TRANSFORMATION POLICY PILOT
22 PIECE OF WORK WILL BE THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
23 CONSIDERING APPROVAL OF THE TRANSFER POLICY PILOT APPROACH.
24 I'LL TURN IT OVER TO RYAN.
25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THANKS BILL. NEXT SLIDE. GREAT I'LL SHARE AN UPDATE
2 TODAY ON THE CLIPPER BAY PASS WHICH IS THE BAY AREA'S FIRST
3 UNLIMITED REGIONAL TRANSIT PASS FOR RIDES ON ALL BUS, RAIL,
4 AND FERRY IN THE BAY AREA. THIS IS A NINE COUNTY BAY AREA PASS
5 DEVELOPED IN COORDINATION WITH MORE THAN TWO DOZEN OPERATORS
6 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE TWO PHASES. THE FIRST LAUNCHED
7 LAST YEAR WITH UNIVERSITY STUDENTS AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING
8 RESIDENTS AND SECOND PHASE ROLLING OUT THIS YEAR WITH
9 EMPLOYERS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS. GOALS ARE SIMILAR FOR THE
10 TWO PHASES IN TERMS OF INCREASING RIDERSHIP AND PILOTING A NEW
11 MODEL OF FUNDING BUT THERE ARE KEY DIFFERENCES IN TERMS OF
12 BOTH THE PILOT FUNDING AND PROGRAM DESIGN THAT I'LL SHARE AS
13 WE GET INTO THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR PHASE ONE
14 OVER 50,000 STUDENTS AND RESIDENTS ARE ELIGIBLE FOR BAY PASS
15 ACROSS FOUR UNIVERSITIES AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROPERTIES.
16 LOCATIONS WERE SELECTED FOR THEIR GEOGRAPHIC DIVERSITY AS WELL
17 AS THE REQUIREMENT OF HAVING AN EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL PASS
18 PROGRAM. THIS PHASE IS FUNDED PARTIALLY BY THE SINGLE AGENCY
19 PASS PRODUCTS THAT INSTITUTIONS ALREADY PURCHASED AS WELL AS
20 FUNDING REGIONAL FUNDING FROM MTC THIS PHASE WAS ALSO
21 RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL OF 25% OF STUDENTS WERE RANDOMLY
22 SELECTED TO RECEIVE UPGRADED BAY PASS WHILE ALL OTHER STUDENTS
23 WILL KEEP THEIR EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL PASS AND THE DESIGN
24 ALLOWS US TO COMPARE TRENDS ACROSS WITH STUDENTS AND EXISTING
25 PASSES WITH THE UPGRADED BAY PASS. NEXT SLIDE. EXCITED TO SEE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 IN THE FIRST SIX MONTHS OF THE PILOT STUDENTS AND RESIDENTS
2 HAVE TAKEN OVER 1 MILLION TRIPS WITH THE BAY PASS LARGE SHARE
3 OF TRIPS ARE ON AC TRANSIT, MUNI -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WE'RE
4 EXCITED TO SEE OUR INITIAL DATA HAS SHOWN THAT PEOPLE WITH BAY
5 PASS ARE TAKING SIGNIFICANTLY MORE TRIPS THAN THOSE WITH JUST
6 AN INSTITUTIONAL PASS IN THE RANGE OF ABOUT 40% MORE TRIPS
7 AGAIN THIS IS PRELIMINARY DATA AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO BRING OUR
8 FINDINGS TO THIS COMMITTEE AS THEY'RE AVAILABLE. WE'RE IN THE
9 PROCESS OF ANALYZING SURVEY DATA FROM MORE THAN 10,000 SURVEYS
10 THAT WERE COMPLETED BY BOTH BAY PASS USERS AND STUDENTS WITH
11 THE EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL PASSES, AND, ALSO, ANALYZING
12 CLIPPER DATA TO REALLY UNDERSTAND THE TYPES OF NEW TRIPS THAT
13 ARE OCCURRING, AND THE RIDERSHIP TRENDS AND HOW THESE HAVE
14 BEEN IMPACTED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE HAVE CONTINUED TO
15 RECEIVE REALLY POSITIVE FEEDBACK FROM STUDENTS AS WELL AS THE
16 AFFORDABLE HOUSING RESIDENTS WHO HAVE RECEIVED THIS PASS THAT
17 IT'S MADE A REALLY BIG DIFFERENCE IN THEIR ABILITY TO GET TO
18 AND FROM WORK AND SCHOOL. ADMINISTRATORS HAVE COMMUNICATED AS
19 WELL THIS HAS BEEN A REALLY IMPACTFUL BENEFIT TO OFFER
20 ESPECIALLY DURING TIMES OF RISING COSTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
21 SO, WE'RE HEADED NOW INTO PHASE TWO, WHICH EXPANDS THE PASS TO
22 A LARGER SET OF EMPLOYERS THAT WILL BE ABLE TO PURCHASE THE
23 PASS FOR THEIR EMPLOYEES. SIMILAR TO PHASE ONE WE'RE LOOKING
24 TO MEASURE HOW THIS TYPE OF PASS WOULD IMPACT TRAVEL BEHAVIOR
25 AND RIDERSHIP AND WE'RE FOCUSED ON UNDERSTANDING HOW WE CAN



MARCH 13, 2023

1 BEST SERVE TRANSIT DEPENDENT WORKERS LOOKING BEYOND
2 TRADITIONAL OFFICE SETTINGS AS WELL AS REACHING ORGANIZATIONS
3 THAT MAY NOT HAVE BEEN WELL SERVED BY EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL
4 PASS PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WE'RE TAKING AN
5 INCREMENTAL APPROACH TO RECRUITING AND SELECTING EMPLOYERS FOR
6 THIS PHASE. WE HAVE BEGUN TARGETED OUTREACH TO EMPLOYERS WITH
7 A FOCUS ON EQUITY IN TERMS OF REACHING LOWER WAGEWORKERS AND
8 WORKERS IN SHIFT WORKING OUTSIDE OF TRADITIONAL OFFICE
9 SETTINGS INCLUDING HOSPITALITY TOURISM AS HOLE INDUSTRY AND
10 HEALTH CARE MANUFACTURING AND RETAIL WE LAUNCHED A WEB SITE
11 RIVERBAYPASS.COM WHICH HAS AN INTEREST FOR EMPLOYERS AND
12 EMPLOYEES WHO WANT TO EXPRESS INTEREST IN LEARNING MORE ABOUT
13 THE PILOT WE'RE PLANNING OUTREACH IN COMING MONTHS TO ENSURE
14 WE HAVE REACHED A DIVERSE RANGE OF TYPES AND SIZES OF
15 EMPLOYERS AND INDUSTRIES AND LOCATIONS AGAIN FOCUSING ON
16 PRIORITIZING EQUITY BEYOND TRADITIONAL OFFICE SETTINGS. IN
17 TERMS OF PRICING, THIS PHASE IS DIFFERENT FROM PHASE ONE IN
18 THAT EMPLOYERS WILL BE YOU PURCHASING THE PASS WITH EMPLOYEES
19 WITHOUT ADDITIONAL FUNDING FROM MTC AND ALSO A DISTINCTION
20 THAT THIS IS NOT A RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL LIKE PHASE ONE AND
21 IN FACT EMPLOYERS HAVE TO PURCHASE THE PASS FOR ALL EMPLOYEES
22 AS PART PARTICIPATING JUST LIKE ANY OTHER HEALTH MEDICAL
23 BENEFITS THAT EMPLOYERS RECEIVE FOR THEIR EMPLOYERS WILL
24 PURCHASE THIS FOR ALL OF THEIR EMPLOYEES SOME PEOPLE WILL USE
25 IT A LOT MORE AND SOME LESS THAT'S REALLY HOW WE'RE ABLE TO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 OFFER THIS KIND OF PRICE FOR EMPLOYERS TO PURCHASE AS WITHOUT
2 REACH APPROACH AND PRICING APPROACHES TAKING AN INCREMENTAL
3 PHASED APPROACH WE'RE AIMING TO SET A TIME LIMITED PRICE FOR
4 FIRST FEW PARTNERS AS WE GATHER DATA AND LEARN AND REFINE
5 PRICING WE'RE ALSO PLANNING TO OFFER FLEXIBLE OFFERINGS
6 INCLUDING FLAT FEE AS WELL AS PAY BY TRIP DEPENDING ON THE
7 EMPLOYER INTEREST OVERALL OUR GOAL IS TO BE RIDERSHIP POSITIVE
8 AND REVENUE NEUTRAL. IN TERMS OF TIMELINE WE'RE ON TRACK TO
9 BRING ON OUR FIRST PARTNER THIS SUMMER AND WE'LL BE CONTINUING
10 TO ENROLL PARTNERS ON A ROLLING BASIS ABOUT EIGHT ADDITIONAL
11 PARTNERS OVER THE COURSE OF THE YEAR AGAIN THIS IS REMAINS A
12 ROLLING ENROLLMENT PROCESS WE'LL CONTINUE TO REACH OUT TO
13 EMPLOYERS AND CONTINUE TO ENGAGE AND MAKE SURE WE HAVE A WIDE
14 RANGE AND USE CASES TO TEST THE PILOT WITH A VARIETY OF TYPES
15 OF EMPLOYERS AND LOCATIONS SO WE'RE WORKING ON CONTRACTS AND
16 DATA REQUIREMENTS SOLIDIFYING OPERATOR APPROVALS AND GETTING
17 OTHER IMPLEMENTATION REQUIRES IN PLACE IN ORDER TO LAUNCH BY
18 THIS SUMMER. THAT'S OUR FINAL SLIDE AND WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE
19 QUESTIONS.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ANY QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS
22 BODY? AND CAN STAFF HELP WITH QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE
23 BODY WHO ARE PARTICIPATING REMOTELY? AND AM I ALSO -- ARE WE
24 ALSO ALLOWED TO CALL ON MEMBERS OF THE BODY WHO ARE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PARTICIPATING REMOTELY WHO DID NOT YET DO THE NOTICING? GREAT.
2 FANTASTIC. SO, GERRY?
3
4 **GERRY GLASER:** I HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. ONE IS, I'M LATE TO THE
5 GAME ON ALL OF THIS. THE FARE REDUCTION SOUNDS REALLY GOOD BUT
6 THE ULTIMATE GOAL IS, YOU KNOW, IF I THOUGHT ABOUT IT IN
7 CLIPPER TERMS, WHEN I GET WHERE I'M GOING, I'M WAND ON AND
8 WAND OFF AND IT'S A SINGLE FARE ALL THE WAY ACROSS. SO ANY
9 COMMENTS I MAKE ARE LEADING TOWARDS THAT SEAMLESS INTEGRATION,
10 ULTIMATELY. ONE QUESTION, PROBABLY FOR RYAN, THE DATA THAT
11 YOU'RE COLLECTING. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT OCCURRED TO ME, CAN
12 THAT DATA BE USED LATER ON TO FIGURE OUT WHAT END TO END MIGHT
13 LOOK LIKE AS A RESULT OF THE DIFFERENT ADVANCES THAT PEOPLE
14 TAKE AND WHAT IT MIGHT LOOK LIKE AS FAR AS THE COST AND HOW WE
15 MIGHT TRANSFER COST OR VALUE BACK TO THE VARIOUS CARRIERS.
16 SECOND QUESTION. I'LL GIVE YOU A FEW. SECOND IS I SAW A NUMBER
17 OF AGENCIES ON THE SONOMA CAN'T TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY CAC,
18 AND I DIDN'T SEE SONOMA TRANSIT, PETALUMA SANTA ROSA, AND
19 THERE IS ONE OTHER. THAT'S THERE. ARE THEY INCLUDED IN PART OF
20 THE PROGRAM, AS WELL? THAT'S ONE QUESTION. AND THEN THE LAST
21 QUESTION, IT PROBABLY IS NOT FOR YOU GUYS. IT HAS TO DO WITH
22 THE CLIPPER TWO, ITSELF. I USED MY -- THERE IS REALLY VERY
23 LITTLE VALUE ABOUT GETTING OLD, EXCEPT GETTING THE DISCOUNTS.
24 AND, SO, I HAVE MY CLIPPER CARD, AND I HAVE A SENIOR CARD, BUT
25 I CAN'T HAVE A SENIOR RATE ON MY TELEPHONE AS WELL. SO I HAVE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 GOT \$25 SITTING ON MY TELEPHONE THAT'S NEVER GOING TO BE USED
2 BECAUSE IT'S A FULL FARE. AND I DO NOT QUITE UNDERSTAND WHY
3 CLIPPER TWO COULDN'T FIGURE OUT HOW TO SOLVE A PROBLEM LIKE
4 THAT. THE MENTION TO US WAS, WE WANT TO AVOID CHEATS. I USED
5 TO USE A LOT OF TRANSIT IN THE 1970S. I HAD TO STAND ON THE
6 BUS, AND I HOPED I COULD GET ON THE FERRY BECAUSE IT WAS TOO
7 FULL. I CAME OUT ON THE FERRY TODAY AND TOOK THE TRAIN AS
8 WELL, AND BOTH WERE FAIRLY EMPTY. I TEND TO THINK THAT WE CAN
9 AFFORD TO HAVE A BUNCH OF CHEATS, WE WOULD GET A WHOLE BUNCH
10 MORE RIDERS ON OUR TRANSIT. THOSE ARE BASIC QUESTIONS I HAVE.
11 TWO QUESTIONS, ACTUALLY, THAT OTHER ONE IS JUST AN OPINION.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** SURE. FOR YOUR FIRST QUESTION, WE ARE GATHERING DATA
14 IN PART TO BE ABLE TO UNDERSTAND THE PRICE PRODUCT FOR THE
15 PHASE ONE AFFORDABLE HOUSING RESIDENTS AND STUDENTS TO BE ABLE
16 TO UNDERSTAND WHAT A PRICE WOULD LOOK LIKE TO UPGRADE ALL OF
17 THE STUDENTS TO THAT PASS PRODUCT. SO THAT'S PART OF WHAT
18 WE'RE CONSIDERING. AND THEN THE SECOND QUESTION, IS ANY AGENCY
19 THAT TAKES CLIPPER, IS PARTICIPATING IN THIS PILOT. SO, THERE
20 ARE MORE THAN TWO DOZEN OPERATORS PARTICIPATING. THE ONE
21 EXTENSION ARE MUNI CABLE CAR TRIPS ARE NOT COVERED. EVERYTHING
22 ELSE IS.

23

24 **GERRY GLASER:** CLARIFYING THE FIRST QUESTION. THE QUESTION IS
25 CAN THE DATA THAT'S BEING COLLECTED BE USED IN ANALYSIS OF



MARCH 13, 2023

1 WHAT IT WOULD TAKE AND LOOK LIKE IF WE HAD END TO END FOR
2 EVERYBODY? NOT JUST THE DISCOUNT FOR PARTICULAR PEOPLE IN THE
3 PROGRAM TODAY? I SEE THIS AS AN EXPERIENCE THAT FIND OUT WHAT
4 IT LOOKS LIKE IF WE START THINKING ABOUT OUR 27 TRANSIT
5 DISTRICTS AS ONE TRANSIT AGENCY THAT GIVES YOU A FARE FROM
6 POINT A TO POINT B REGARDLESS OF HOW MANY TRANSFERS YOU HAVE.

7

8 **RYAN REEVES:** I'LL TRY TO START. THE FOCUS OF THE BAY PASS
9 PILOT RIGHT NOW IS PRIMALLY FOCUSED ON INSTITUTIONS AS A
10 MODEL. IF I'M UNDERSTANDING YOUR QUESTION CORRECTLY IT WOULD
11 BE TO EXPAND IT SO THAT ANYBODY COULD PURCHASE THE PASS
12 REGARDLESS OF THEIR AFFILIATION? IS THAT YOUR QUESTION?

13

14 **GERRY GLASER:** YOU'RE USING A BODY OF DATA CAN THAT BODY OF
15 DATA BE USED FOR A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT ANALYSIS TO SEE IF WE
16 CAN FUNDAMENTALLY CHANGE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM SO IT BECOMES A
17 LOT MORE USEFUL FOR EVERYBODY?

18

19 **WILLIAM BACON:** CLIPPER BAY PASS DATA IS REALLY A FASCINATING
20 SET OF INFORMATION THAT WE'VE NEVER BEEN ABLE TO CONDUCT YOU
21 KNOW STATISTICALLY SIGNIFICANT VALID SAMPLE OF THIS SIZE,
22 50,000 PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA WE ARE LEARNING A LOT ABOUT HOW
23 PEOPLE PREFER TO USE THE SYSTEM THAT'S KEY TO TRYING TO
24 UNDERSTAND, IF YOU REMOVE BARRIERS BETWEEN AGENCIES HOW WOULD
25 CUSTOMERS PREFER TO USE TRANSIT? WOULD THEY MAYBE TAKE A TRIP



MARCH 13, 2023

1 WITH AN OPERATOR THAT HAS A FASTER SPEED WOULD THEY USE BUS TO
2 CONNECT TO MORE LONGER DISTANCE REGIONAL RAIL OR AREA SERVICES
3 FOR EXPRESS BUS SERVICES THAT WAY HE DIDN'T HAVE TO PAY
4 MULTIPLE FARES. WE'RE LEARNING A LOT ALREADY IN THE FIRST 6 TO
5 7 MONTHS OF DATA THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. LONGER TERM THE FARE
6 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE -- AS ONE OF ITS INITIATIVES FOR
7 FURTHER DEVELOPMENT, CREATING A SINGLE REGIONAL FARE STRUCTURE
8 FOR REGIONAL RAIL SERVICES, FERRIES, AND EXPRESS BUSES. BUT
9 NOT FOR LOCAL BUS SERVICE.

10

11 **GERRY GLASER:** THANKS. THAT MAKES IT CLEAR.

12

13 **WILLIAM BACON:** I WAS GOING TO RESPOND TO YOUR QUESTION ABOUT
14 THE SENIOR CARD ON CLIPPER A COUPLE OF THINGS, WE'RE NOT IN
15 NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER YET WE WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE
16 KNOWS WE HAVE NOT TRANSITIONED YET THERE'S SOME EQUIPMENT
17 THAT'S BEEN DEPLOYED THAT WILL BE PART OF THE NEXT GENERATION
18 SYSTEM WE'RE NOT THERE YET. YOU CAN HAVE SENIOR CARD ON YOUR
19 IPHONE OR ANDROID DEVICE.

20

21 **GERRY GLASER:** BUT YOU CAN'T HAVE IT ON BOTH.

22

23 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT'S CORRECT. PHYSICAL CARD FOR ONLY ONE
24 PLACE.

25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **GERRY GLASER:** THAT'S PART OF WHAT ADS ARE SAYING, SAYS YOU
2 SHOULDN'T CARE AS LONG AS IT'S ASSOCIATED WITH ME IT'LL GIVE
3 ME THE SAME FARE. AND IT DOESN'T.

4

5 **WILLIAM BACON:** OUR CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM IS A COUPLE OF
6 DECADES OLD IT'S CALLED A CARD-BASED CLIPPER SYSTEM ALL
7 INFORMATION ABOUT YOUR BALANCE EVERYTHING LIVES IN ONE PLACE
8 THERE ISN'T A DATABASE THERE IS A DIFFERENCE ABOUT THE NEXT
9 GENERATION SYSTEM. I THINK THE PROBLEM YOU'RE EXPERIENCING
10 GOES AWAY IN OUR NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** UNFORTUNATELY THE CURRENT PROPOSED
13 IMPLEMENTATION IS NOT ANTICIPATED TO GO AWAY AND I'LL COMMENT
14 ON THAT WHEN I GET TO MYSELF AND I'LL GET ON THE END. DO WE
15 HAVE OTHER MEMBERS OF THE BODY WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT AT
16 THE OTHER ROW. WHOSE NAME I CANNOT READ.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SO, MY THOUGHTS ARE AROUND PEOPLE WITH
19 DISABILITIES. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHERE -- FIRST OF ALL, IF -
20 - BUT, WHERE, ASSUMING IF WORKS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES ARE
21 INCLUDED IN THIS WHOLE MOSAIC HERE, I DID NOT HEAR ANY
22 SPECIFIC REFERENCES TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. AND I WILL
23 SAY THAT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES HAVE A NUMBER OF CHALLENGES,
24 AND A NUMBER OF SPECIFIC CHALLENGES THAT RELATE TO THIS
25 PARTICULAR PROPOSAL AROUND FARES. I ALSO DIDN'T HEAR ANYTHING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 AROUND PARATRANSIT, WHICH A LOT OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES
2 USE PARATRANSIT AND NEED PARATRANSIT, AND I AM DISTURBED THAT
3 I DIDN'T HEAR ANYTHING AROUND PARATRANSIT. I ALSO FEEL THAT
4 WHEN WE TALK ABOUT EMPLOYERS IS.

5

6 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** I DIDN'T HEAR ANYTHING ABOUT PEOPLE WITH
7 DISABILITIES WITH REGARD TO EMPLOYERS, IN TERMS OF
8 DISABILITIES RELATING TO THE PROPOSAL AND I'M HOPING THAT
9 THERE IS SOME TIME TO HAVE DISCUSSION, MAYBE DOWN THE ROAD, I
10 DO WANT TO WORK WITH STAFF TO BUILD IN PEOPLE WITH
11 DISABILITIES AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN STAFF SPEAK TO THAT?

14

15 **WILLIAM BACON:** SURE. THANK YOU. THANK YOU. I DO THINK IT'S
16 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE POLICIES THAT WE DISCUSS
17 TODAY BENEFIT A WIDE CROSS SECTION OF TRANSIT USERS SO FOR
18 EXAMPLE, THE TRANSFER POLICY PROPOSAL THAT WAS DETAILED WOULD
19 PROVIDE FREE AND REDUCED COST TRANSFERS TO ALL TRANSIT USERS
20 SO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES WOULD BE INCLUDED IN BENEFIT
21 SIGNIFICANTLY FROM THE ENHANCED ACCESS THAT FREE TRANSFERS
22 WOULD PROVIDE FOR USERS TO USE THE SYSTEM. IN REGARDS TO THE
23 CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT AS RYAN MENTIONED THE PARTICIPATING
24 INSTITUTIONS IN PHASE ONE, UC BERKELEY, SAN FRANCISCO STATE
25 UNIVERSITY, SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY, SANTA ROSA JUNIOR



MARCH 13, 2023

1 COLLEGE, IT IS A WIDE CROSS SECTION OF PEOPLE, 50,000
2 PARTICIPANTS AS RYAN MENTIONED AT EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS OF
3 THE THREE LARGER ONES TWO STATE UNIVERSITIES AND UC BERKELEY
4 WAS A RANDOM SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS AS PART OF A TRIAL
5 EXPERIMENT ESSENTIALLY THE PROGRAM WASN'T A SPECIFIC COMPONENT
6 OR OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE A DEDICATED PROGRAM SPECIFICALLY FOR
7 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES BUT WE'RE FOCUSED ON PHASE TWO OF THE
8 PROGRAM, PARTNERING WITH ORGANIZATIONS THAT REACH A BROAD
9 CROSS SECTION OF PEOPLE AND WE'RE TRYING TO EXPLORE
10 OPPORTUNITIES TO HAVE AN ORGANIZATION THAT IS CLOSELY
11 CONNECTED WORKING WITH PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES BE A PART OF
12 THAT PROGRAM. BUT WE'RE NOT AT THE PHASE OR STAGE YET OF BEING
13 ABLE TO ANNOUNCE WHO THE PARTICIPANTS ARE FOR PHASE TWO, IF
14 YOU HAVE SUGGESTIONS MR. CUSHMAN ABOUT ORGANIZATIONS THAT WE
15 CAN REACH OUT TO FOR PHASE TWO OF THE BAY PASS PILOT WE WOULD
16 LOVE TO SPEAK OFFLINE AND WE CAN HAVE A DETAILED CONVERSATION
17 WITH THOSE ORGANIZATIONS.

18

19 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES. I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THE WHOLE
20 ASPECT OF THIS THERE IS SOME MISSING PIECES, ALSO WHAT ABOUT
21 PARATRANSIT? WHERE IS PARATRANSIT IN THIS?

22

23 **WILLIAM BACON:** THE ORIGINAL SCOPE OF WORK OF THE FARE
24 INTEGRATION STUDY ADOPTED BY THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
25 BACK IN LATE 2018 AND EARLY 2020 EXPLICITLY SAID THAT THE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PROJECT SHOULD FOCUS ON FIXED ROUTE AND MAIN LINE TRANSIT
2 SERVICES AND NOT TRY TO ADDRESS PARATRANSIT FARES IN THE
3 PROJECT STUDY. IT WAS VERY MUCH ACKNOWLEDGED FROM THE GET-GO
4 THAT WAS A RESULT OF CONSTRAINTS IN PROJECT BUDGET AND
5 CAPACITY TO TAKE ON THAT WORK AT THE SAME TIME AND RECOGNIZING
6 THERE WAS AND REMAINS A SIGNIFICANT NEED, BETTER COORDINATE
7 TRANSIT FARES. ONE THING THAT'S WORTHWHILE ACKNOWLEDGING FOR
8 THE MOST PART PARATRANSIT FARES ARE SET IN THE BAY AREA AT
9 DOUBLE THE COST OF ASSOCIATED FIXED ROUTE TRIP. SO CHANGES TO
10 FARE POLICY FIXED ROUTE TRIPS OR MAIN LINE SERVICE WOULD HAVE
11 A CASCADING BENEFIT TO PARATRANSIT FARES. THERE ARE SOME
12 EXCEPTIONS TO THAT I'LL ACKNOWLEDGE BUT FOR THE MOST PART
13 THAT'S THE CASE. AS AN EXAMPLE IF WE WERE TO DEPLOY LOW COST
14 AND REDUCED COST TRANSFERS THE EXPECTATION IS THERE WOULD THEN
15 BE A PARALLEL BENEFIT TO PARATRANSIT USERS WHO HAVE TO MAKE
16 TRANSFERS BETWEEN PARATRANSIT SERVICES. AND THE PROJECT TEAM -
17 - I WAS ACTUALLY IF A MEETING THIS MORNING WITH PARATRANSIT
18 STAFF FROM ACROSS BAY AREA OPERATORS TALKING ABOUT THIS EXACT
19 ISSUE. SO THIS REMAINS FRONT AND CENTER FOR US IN TERMS OF
20 MOVING FORWARD OF TRYING TO DEPLOY THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE
21 STUDY.

22

23 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** THANK YOU. AND I'M LOOKING FORD WORKING WITH
24 YOUR STAFF AROUND THE STUDY.

25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** REALLY SHORT QUESTION TO WHAT WARREN
2 CUSHMAN ASKED WHICH IS THAT IN THE ANALYSIS OF THE RESULTS,
3 WHILE THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE PARTICIPANTS ARE NOT SELECTED
4 BASED ON PEOPLE WITH S DISABILITIES THERE ARE SURELY A VARIETY
5 OF PEOPLE AND OTHER DEMOGRAPHICS CHARACTERS WITHIN THE STUDY
6 POPULATION WILL THAT BE ASSESSED AS PART OF THE BENEFITS, LIKE
7 THE 40% INCREASE, LIKE WHAT'S THE DIFFERENTIAL BENEFIT BY
8 DEMOGRAPHIC?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** WE SURVEYED COLLECTING SOME DEMOGRAPHIC DATA I DON'T
11 BELIEVE DISABILITY STATUS IS INCLUDED BUT THERE ARE QUESTIONS
12 ABOUT HOW WELL TRANSIT ACCESSIBILITY IS MET SO WE'RE IN THE
13 PROCESS OF UPDATING THE SURVEY THAT WE'RE GOING TO RELEASE IN
14 THE NEXT ROUND OF SURVEYS HOPEFULLY NEXT MONTH AND WE CAN LOOK
15 TO MAKE SURE THE SURVEY IS UPDATED TO REFLECT SOME OF THOSE
16 DEMOGRAPHIC.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** FIRST OF ALL, CONGRATULATIONS ON THE CLIPPER
21 BAY PASS PILOT. THIS IS REALLY EXCITING DATA THAT'S BEING
22 COLLECTED. IT'S A BIG LIFT GETTING THAT OUT, REALLY PLEASED TO
23 SEE THAT. SO, I GUESS THE FIRST TWO COMMENTS ONE ON THE FREE
24 TRANSFERS AND THEN I'LL GO BACK TO THE BAY PASS PILOT WITH A
25 QUESTION. REGARDING WITH THE FREE TRANSFERS, I HAVE TO EXPRESS



MARCH 13, 2023

1 MY DISAPPOINTMENT THAT WE'RE NOW LOOKING AT SUMMER OF 2024 FOR
2 PROCEEDING WITH THE STRATEGY THAT WAS AGREED UPON BY THE BLUE
3 RIBBON TASK FORCE AS, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE ACCELERATED
4 PRIORITIES. AND I UNDERSTAND ALL OF THE DIFFERENT FACTORS THAT
5 HAVE CONTRIBUTED TO THAT, BUT I JUST WANT TO, FROM THE
6 PERSPECTIVE OF THE PUBLIC HERE, WE'RE NOW OVER THREE YEARS
7 INTO THE PANDEMIC AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO SEE THIS RIDERSHIP
8 REBUILDING STRATEGY DEPLOYED FOR STILL ANOTHER 18 MONTHS OF
9 THE SO IT'S REALLY NOT A RIDERSHIP -- IT'S NOT A BACK TO
10 TRANSIT STRATEGY ANYMORE. WE HAVE HIT THE NEW NORMAL. WE HAVE
11 KIND OF MISSED THE OPPORTUNITY TO USE PEOPLE'S DISRUPTED
12 PATTERNS AND TO INTRODUCE AND ROLL OUT A NEW PRICING STRUCTURE
13 TO TRY TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO CHANGE THEIR BEHAVIOR, AND I
14 THINK THAT'S A FAILURE OF THE STRUCTURE THAT WE HAVE. I DON'T
15 THINK THAT'S ANY INDIVIDUAL'S FAILURE, BUT I DO THINK THIS IS
16 A REALLY IMPORTANT EXAMPLE FOR US TO REFLECT UPON AS WE
17 EVALUATE THIS NEW NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE THAT'S GOING TO
18 BE SET UP. THIS IS WHAT WE'RE SETTING UP, AND IS THAT GOING TO
19 SOLVE FOR THE ISSUE THAT WE HAVE JUST GONE THROUGH IN TERMS OF
20 THE TIME IT'S TAKING TO PROCEED WITH US? AND I THINK,
21 INDEPENDENT OF CLIPPER DELAYS, I'M STILL LOOKING AT THE 18
22 MONTHS THAT WE HAVE, ALL OF THE BACK AND FORTH THAT'S GOING TO
23 BE NEEDED IN THAT TIMELINE TO GO TO THE GENERAL MANAGERS AND
24 APPROVE THE POLICY AND GET THE GENERAL BOARDS TO SIGN OFF ON
25 IT. THIS IS A POLICY THAT'S FUNDED -- IT'S '22 -- THERE IS NO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 FUNDING AVAILABLE. IT'S ALREADY RECEIVED BLESSINGS FROM MANY
2 LEADERS MANY TIMES. I HAVE TO EXPRESS AS A MEMBER OF THE
3 PUBLIC. I DON'T THINK MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC UNDERSTAND WHY
4 THIS TAKES SO LONG AND I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPERILING OF THE
5 PUBLIC TRUST ESPECIALLY AS WE TALK ABOUT A REGIONAL FUNDING
6 MEASURE AND NEED TO GO BACK TO THE VOTERS. SO, THAT'S, I THINK
7 THE COMMENT THAT I HAVE TO MAKE, WELL -- SORRY -- I HAVE ONE
8 SUGGESTION ASSOCIATED WITH THAT WHICH IS THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU
9 HAD MENTIONED THAT, ON SLIDE SIX THAT AGENCY GOVERNING BOARD
10 APPROVAL WILL BE NEEDED IN ORDER TO PROCEED. MY UNDERSTANDING
11 IS THAT MTC ACTUALLY HAS THE AUTHORITY TO SET, YOU KNOW, THIS
12 IS A POLICY THAT WOULD FALL WITHIN MTC'S MANDATE TO SAY, YOU
13 KNOW, FREE TRANSFERS ARE, IT'S AN AGREED UPON POLICY, THERE
14 HAS BEEN SUFFICIENT DISCUSSION, MTC IS FUNDING IT. I WOULD
15 ENCOURAGE AN UPDATE TO RESOLUTION 3636 AS HAS BEEN DISCUSSED
16 IN THE PAST TO HAVE MTC BE ABLE TO PROCEED WITH THIS PILOT.
17 BECAUSE I THINK IT'S A HUGE RISK THAT ONE AGENCY DECIDES THEY
18 DON'T WANT TO, YOU KNOW, APPROVE THIS POLICY FOR WHATEVER
19 REASON, EVEN THOUGH IT'S FULLY PAID FOR, AND THAT COULD SET US
20 BACK EVEN FURTHER. SO I THINK WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT WHAT WE
21 CAN DO WHAT'S RIGHT FOR THE CUSTOMER AND DELIVER ON THIS
22 IMPORTANT FUNDED POLICY AND I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT MTC
23 SHOULD CONSIDER. IN ORDER TO MOVE FORWARD. SO, MY QUESTION ON
24 THE BAY PASS PILOT IS, YEAH, I WAS JUST WONDERING -- IT'S
25 GREAT THAT 40% OF TRIPS ARE BEING GENERATED. I'M WONDERING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 DOES THIS SUGGEST -- ARE WE GOING TO HAVE THE DATA TO LEARN
2 WHETHER THIS IS ACTUALLY REVENUE POSITIVE AT THE END OF THE
3 DAY? SO, IT -- IT'S ADJUSTED IF YOU ARE PROVIDING -- IF THERE
4 WAS NO MONEY FOR THIS PILOT, OTHER THAN THE STAFFING THAT'S
5 INVOLVED, BUT IN TERMS OF IF AGENCIES WERE NOT BEING
6 COMPENSATED, I THINK THEY'RE GIVEN, YOU KNOW, SOME MONEY EACH
7 TIME SOMEONE TAKES A TRIP -- I'M NOT EXACTLY SURE WHAT THE
8 FUNDING MODEL S BUT RIGHT NOW, IS THERE ANY INDICATION, ARE WE
9 GOING TO KNOW WITH FURTHER DATA WHETHER, AT THE END OF THE
10 DAY, ESSENTIALLY, IF EACH AGENCY WITH NO NEW MONEY WAS TO MAKE
11 THEIR LOYALTY PASS GOOD FOR ALL AGENCIES DOES THAT GENERATE
12 NET RIDERSHIP? AND DOES IT ACTUALLY COST A NET COST TO
13 AGENCIES OR DOES THAT KIND OF PAY FOR ITSELF?

14

15 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTION. AS RYAN
16 MENTIONED ONE OF THE CRITERIA IS THAT EACH OF THE EXISTING
17 PROGRAMS HAVE A TRANSIT PASS PROGRAM IF YOU ARE A STUDENT AT
18 SAN FRANCISCO STATE YOU RECEIVED A PASS FOR SFMTA, AND
19 SAMTRANS FOR DISCOUNTED TRIPS AND THAT IS FUNDED THROUGH A
20 STUDENT FEE THAT EACH OF THE STUDENTS AT SAN FRANCISCO STATE
21 AND THERE'S A SIMILAR ONE AT OTHER PARTICIPATING INSTITUTIONS
22 PAY TO THE TRANSIT OPERATOR. AND WHAT WE WILL HAVE, GOOD
23 INFORMATION THROUGH PHASE ONE OF THE PILOT IS, WE WILL
24 UNDERSTAND, SORT OF, HOW MUCH USAGE THERE WAS OF THESE SERVICE
25 THAT IS NOT COVERED BY THE EXISTING AGREEMENTS. WE'LL ALSO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 UNDERSTAND IF YOU NEEDED TO ADJUST THE PRICE OF WHAT THE
2 INSTITUTION IS PAYING FOR THEIR TRANSIT PASS, WHAT MIGHT YOU
3 NEED TO ADJUST THAT PRICE TO BE TO COVER ALL SERVICES, OR,
4 I'LL ALSO SAY MAYBE THAT SAME PRICE THAT'S ALREADY BEING PAID
5 IS ACTUALLY SUFFICIENT TO COVER ALL THE USAGE BUT WE NEED A
6 PORTION OF REVENUE INSTEAD OF JUST WITH THE OPERATOR THAT HAS
7 IS INFORMATION THAT WILL HAVE A MUCH BETTER HANDLE THROUGH
8 PHASE ONE AND I THINK PHASE TWO IT'S A SEPARATE, SORT OF, PART
9 OF THE PROJECT BUT WILL ALSO VERY MUCH INFORM THE QUESTION OR
10 A CERTAIN PRICE THAT WE'LL BE SELLING THE PRODUCT TO
11 ORGANIZATIONS DOES THAT COVER THE FULL USAGE OF THE PRODUCT?
12 OUR GOAL IS TO BE REVENUE NEUTRAL OR IDEALLY THROUGH THIS
13 WORK.

14

15 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** IF THIS IS NOT PROPOSING FINANCIAL RISK TO
16 AGENCIES, WE SHOULD JUST BE DOING -- IF WE'RE PAYING THE SAME
17 AMOUNT FOR THESE PASSES AND GETTING 40% HIGHER RIDERSHIP WE
18 SHOULD JUST BE DOING IT RATHER THAN THE EXPECTATION THAT THE
19 AGENCIES WANT TO BE COMPENSATE FOR EACH ADDITIONAL TRIP, IN
20 THE PEOPLE WE NEED TO STRUCTURE IT THAT WAY BUT IF IT'S
21 POSITIVE AT THE END OF THE DAY WE'RE NOT JUST DOING THE THING
22 THAT'S GOING TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP THE MOST.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SEBASTIAN?

25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** BILL AND RYAN, THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION
2 AND THE WORK ON THESE PROGRAMS. AS IAN SAID IT'S VERY EXCITING
3 TO SEE THESE MOVING FORWARD. MY COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ARE A
4 LITTLE BIT OF FOLLOW UP ON WHAT IAN WAS SAYING, AND I THINK
5 THIS REALLY GOES FOR BOTH FREE AND DISCOUNTED FARES AS WELL AS
6 THE BAY PASS. I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE IMPORTANCE FROM MY
7 PERSPECTIVE AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THESE OF HAVING AS MUCH,
8 SORT OF, UNDERLYING AND FINANCIAL DATA AND METRIC COME TO BEAR
9 OVER TIME BECAUSE I DO THINK THAT -- WE'RE REALLY MOVING INTO
10 A VERY DIFFERENT BUSINESS MODEL WITH THIS APPROACH OF HAVING,
11 SORT OF, REGIONAL BACKSTOPPING TO WHAT HAS PREVIOUSLY BEEN AN
12 AGENCY BY AGENCY SET OF DECISIONS. I THINK THERE IS TREMENDOUS
13 POTENTIAL THERE BUT I DO THINK THERE ARE SUBSTANTIAL FINANCIAL
14 RISKS THAT ARE DISTRIBUTED BETWEEN AGENCIES, AND I THINK
15 CRITICALLY THEY'RE UNEVENLY DISTRIBUTED BETWEEN AGENCIES SO I
16 THINK HAVING THE NUMBERS COME OUT AROUND THAT IS PARTICULARLY
17 CRITICAL. I ALSO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR BOTH PROGRAMS TO BE
18 THINKING AHEAD OF TIME AROUND WHAT SUCCESS LOOKS LIKE AND HOW
19 WE MIGHT MEASURE THAT, WHETHER THAT'S, AGAIN, WE, SORT OF, USE
20 THE GENERAL FRAMING OF REVENUE NEUTRAL, RIDERSHIP POSITIVE.
21 BUT AGAIN STARTING TO LOOK AT WHAT IS THE NET COST FOR A RIDER
22 AND AGAIN COMPARING THESE KINDS OF PROGRAMS WITH OTHER SORTS
23 OF INVESTMENTS IN THE REGION THAT GENERATE RIDERSHIP. IT WOULD
24 BE PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT TO SEE THAT AS WELL. ALSO, AND JUST
25 TO KIND OF FURTHER EMPHASIZE THAT POINT, I THINK, YOU KNOW,



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PART OF THE REASON I WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE THOSE NUMBERS TO
2 BE BROUGHT FORWARD IN A VERY CLEAR WAY AS I THINK THEY
3 SOMETIMES GET LOST IN THE CONVERSATION, AND I THINK IT WILL BE
4 PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF BRINGING AGENCIES ALONG TO
5 CONTINUE AND HOPEFULLY EXPAND THESE PROGRAMS GOING FORWARD.
6 THE LAST POINT I WOULD WANT TO MAKE IS, I HOPE AS WE'RE
7 ENROLLING IN THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PLATFORM THAT WE DON'T LOSE
8 OPPORTUNITY TO DO IN DEPTH WORK WITH THOSE INSTITUTIONS IN
9 PARTICULAR THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING THE UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT
10 IS THE ADDITIONAL VALUE THAT THESE INSTITUTIONS RECEIVE OUT OF
11 THESE KINDS OF PROGRAMS RATHER THAN TO THE PUBLIC AS A WHOLE
12 OR INDIVIDUAL RIDERS TO START TO ARTICULATE WHAT IS THE
13 INSTITUTIONAL VALUE PROPOSITION AND TRY TO CAPTURE THAT IT'S
14 IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THE LABOR INSTITUTIONS THEMSELVES, IN
15 TERMS OF DISTRIBUTING PASSES AND ADMINISTRATIVE LABOR AND
16 ESSENTIALLY WORKING AS MARKETING AGENTS FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES
17 AND HOW THESE PROGRAMS SCALE OVER TIME.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. CARINA.

20

21 **CARINA LIEU:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. YOU MY QUESTION
22 IS WITH THE PILOT PHASE WHETHER OR NOT IT WOULD EVER BE
23 POSSIBLE YOU HAVE CONSIDERED THE POSSIBILITY OF PARTNERS WITH
24 SCHOOL DISTRICTS TO HAVE THE STUDY FOR HIGH SCHOOL AGE
25 STUDENTS WHO COULD POTENTIALLY BENEFIT FROM THE ADDED MOBILITY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 AND UNDERSTANDING THAT SCHOOL DISTRICTS ARE NOT REVENUE
2 GENERATING INSTITUTIONS, WHAT TYPES OF SUBSIDIES COULD BE
3 BROUGHT ON OR WHAT TYPES OF PARTNERS COULD BE BROUGHT ON TO
4 ENABLE A STUDY LIKE THAT TO TAKE PLACE. I HAVE WORKED WITH THE
5 OAKLAND YOUTH COMMISSION AND I HAVE HEARD YOUNG PEOPLE MENTION
6 THAT FOR THEM TO GET TO A JOB AND TO GO TO SCHOOL, YOU KNOW,
7 THAT CAN BE -- THAT CAN KIND OF COST THEM A WHOLE PAYCHECK AND
8 IT'S NOT WORTH IT FOR THEM TO TAKE TRANSIT TO GO TO WORK. AND
9 I THINK THIS IS, SORT OF, AN UNDER-- PERHAPS AN UNDERSTUDIED
10 POPULATION WHERE IF THEY HAD MORE OPPORTUNITY TO USE TRANSIT
11 IF A WAY THAT WAS AFFORDABLE FOR THEM AND SEAMLESS, THAT MAYBE
12 IT COULD INCREASE RIDERSHIP, POTENTIALLY, AND EVEN INCREASE
13 THEIR LITERALLY WITH OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS. AND, SO, JUST
14 WANTING TO HEAR IF YOU HAPPEN TO DO THAT, I THINK IF YOU COULD
15 IT WOULD BE REALLY GREAT FOR OUR POPULATION.

16

17 **RYAN REEFS:** I CAN SPEAK TO IT. WE HAVE HAD SCHOOL DISTRICTS
18 REACH OUT TO US WITH INTEREST IN THIS TYPE A PROGRAM. AND FROM
19 MY UNDERSTANDING THERE ARE SOME SCHOOL DISTRICT THAT IS
20 PURCHASING TRANSIT PASSES FOR SOME STUDENTS. THE MODEL IS A
21 LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN WHAT WE'RE WORKING WITH IN THAT
22 PASSES HAVE TO BE PURCHASED FOR EVERYONE REGARDLESS OF THE USE
23 OF THE PASS IN ORDER TO BRING THE COST DOWN SO MUCH. I THINK
24 THAT FOR THE MODEL WE'RE ALSO WORKING WITH, WE'RE TRYING TO
25 TEST A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT USE CASES. RIGHT? SO, FOR EXAMPLE,



MARCH 13, 2023

1 A SCHOOL DISTRICT IS GOT -- LIKE, CURRENTLY IN THE -- LIKE,
2 THE IMMEDIATE, I THINK, NEXT STEPS FOR TESTING THIS MODEL WITH
3 DIFFERENT EMPLOYERS, BUT I THINK IT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT USE
4 CASE TO CONSIDER ONCE WE HAVE OUR, SORT OF, PROCESS AND
5 IMPLEMENTATION PLANS IN PLACE A LITTLE BIT MORE TO DELIVER
6 SOMETHING LIKE THIS I THINK IT'S A NEXT ITERATION OF THIS TO
7 REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW THIS WORKS. BILL DO YOU HAVE THOUGHTS TO
8 ADD?

9

10 **WILLIAM BACON:** CLIPPER BAY PASS IS A PILOT THERE ARE TWO
11 PHASES WE'RE WORKING TOWARDS FULLY STANDING UP. OUR GOAL
12 EXPLICITLY IS TO CREATE A SUCCESSFUL PROGRAM THAT CAN BE A
13 PERMANENT PROGRAM FOR THE BAY AREA, SUCH AS AN ALL AGENCY PASS
14 AND AT THAT TIME WE WOULD LIKE TO WORK WITH ANY ORGANIZATION,
15 ANY SCHOOL DISTRICT OR ANY PEOPLE WHO ARE INTERESTED IN HAVING
16 THIS PRODUCT BE AVAILABLE TO THEIR COMMUNITY. SO WE'RE TRYING
17 TO GET FROM A TO B AND WE'RE STILL IN THE FIRST PHASE. BUT
18 VERY MUCH DO. WE DIDN'T FOCUS ON K12 EDUCATION IN OUR FIRST
19 PHASE OF OUR PILOT BECAUSE OF THE COMPLEXITIES AND WORKING
20 WITH DIFFERENT SCHOOL DISTRICTS, BUT WE ARE TRYING TO LEARN A
21 LOT FROM, SORT OF, THAT COMMUNITY COLLEGE AND STATE UNIVERSITY
22 EXPERIENCE, I THINK WILL FURTHER THE EDUCATIONAL SETTING.

23

24 **CARINA LIEU:** REACHING OUT TO LOW-WAGE WORKER WHO IS HAVE NON-
25 TRADITIONAL SCHEDULES AND I THINK WITHIN THE SCHOOL DISTRICT



MARCH 13, 2023

1 CONVERSATION THERE ARE SCHOOL DISTRICTS THAT SERVE LOW-INCOME
2 YOU KNOW STUDENTS WHO HAVE BEEN DISPLACED BY GENTRIFICATION.
3 SO, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT IS A DEMOGRAPHIC THAT I
4 WOULD LOVE FOR YOU ALL TO PUT SOME ENERGY INTO THINKING ABOUT
5 WHEN YOU DO THAT PHASE OF THINKING ABOUT SCHOOL DISTRICT
6 OUTREACH.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** BRIAN?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD LIKE TO THANK BRIAN AND BILL FOR THE
11 PRESENTATION AND ECHOING THE EXCITEMENT ABOUT THE BAY PASS
12 PILOT AND CONTINUING GOING ON TO PHASE TWO, I HAD A COUPLE OF
13 QUESTIONS KIND OF BUILDING ON SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT CAME
14 FROM IAN AND SEBASTIAN IT WORKS IN THE PHASE ONE PILOT SHOWING
15 INCREASE WHEN DISCUSSING THE REDUCE DUES COST TRAPS FOR AND
16 THE FINANCIAL MODEL WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THIS IS COST ON
17 AGENCIES THAT MTC IS REIMBURSING? I'M WONDERING HOW WE ARE
18 LOOKING AT MEASURING THE IMPACT OF THAT PROGRAM BECAUSE IT
19 COULD BE A TOTAL LOSS TO AGENCIES OF REVENUE, I DON'T TAKE THE
20 LOCAL BUS TO CONNECT TO IT BECAUSE I'M NOT GOING TO PAY BUT IF
21 THAT'S FREE OR MINIMAL COST THERE ARE RIDERS BEING ADDED TO
22 THE SYSTEM THERE THAT ARE RIDING ANYWAY SO IT'S IMPORTANT TO
23 PLAN AHEAD OF TIME HOW WE EVALUATE THAT BECAUSE WE MAY BE
24 UNIQUE IN THE WORLD BUT EVERYWHERE ELSE IN THE WORLD WHO HAS
25 DONE REGIONAL INTEGRATED TICKETING HAS SEEN FARE REVENUE GO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 UP. SO, WE CAN ASSUME THE REST OF THE WORLD IS DIFFERENT BUT
2 THAT'S MOST LIKELY NOT TRUE. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE MEASURE
3 THAT SO WE KNOW.

4

5 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTIONS ABOUT METRICS. IT
6 GUIDES OUR WORK. ON THE TRANSFER POLICY PIECE, THAT'S
7 IMPORTANT HOW THE FINANCIAL MODEL WOULD WORK WITH THE DOLLARS
8 AND INTENT, CLOSELY TRACKING CHANGES IN TRANSFERS RELATIVE TO
9 CHANGES OVERALL RIDERSHIP IF YOU THINK ABOUT OVERALL RIDERSHIP
10 OVER 12 MONTH PERIOD INCREASE BY 10% OF THE AREA TRANSFERS
11 INCREASED BY 20% YOU KNOW THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING TO LOOK AT
12 TO UNDERSTAND TRANSFER AND POLICY CHANGE ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO
13 BE TRANSFERRED MORE, THERE ARE SPECIAL CASES WHERE THERE ARE
14 STRONG TRANSFER OPPORTUNITIES BETWEEN SYSTEMS THIS IS TAKING
15 PLACE IN THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM WE WILL HAVE
16 BETTER LOCATION SPECIFIC DATA ABOUT WHERE TAPS OF CLIPPER
17 CARDS ARE TAKING PLACE AND BEING ABLE TO UNDERSTAND HOW
18 CUSTOMERS ARE MAKING THEIR TRANSFERS. THOSE ARE KEY THINGS WE
19 HAVE ALREADY IDENTIFIED TO FOCUS CLOSELY O BUT I THINK WE CAN
20 COMMIT TO KEEPING THIS SUBCOMMITTEE INFORMED OVER THE COURSE
21 OF THIS WORK ABOUT WHAT THOSE PERFORMANCE METRICS ARE, AND
22 WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO YOU A NUMBER OF TIMES OVER THE NEXT
23 COUPLE OF YEARS BOTH ON THE TRANSFER POLICY PIECE BUT ALSO ON
24 CLIPPER BAY PASS TO SHARE RESULTS. THERE IS EXCITING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 INFORMATION IN PHASE ONE WE'RE ALREADY STARTING TO SEE ONCE
2 WE'RE BETTER READY TO REFINE WE'LL COME BACK AND SHARE.

3

4 **BRIAN STANKE:** FOLLOW UP QUESTION. IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE
5 HAVE SEVERAL REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT ARE NOT ON
6 CLIPPER AND WON'T BE ON CLIPPER. ONE OF THOSE, CAPITAL
7 CORRIDORS IS CURRENTLY DOING A PILOT OF THE CALIFORNIA
8 INTEGRATED REGIONAL -- INTEGRATED TRANSIT PAYMENT SYSTEM CAL
9 ITP, I'M WONDERING AS YOU GO THROUGH THESE BAY PASS PROGRAMS
10 AND REDUCED FARE, WHAT, SORT OF -- IS MTC WORKING WITH CAL ITP
11 ON INTEGRATING THOSE TWO? WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE? WHAT'S THE
12 TIMELINE?

13

14 **WILLIAM BACON:** MTC IS WORKING WITH CALIFORNIA STATE
15 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY AND CALTRANS ON THE CALIFORNIA TRAVEL
16 PROJECT AND FARE POLICY MORE BROADLY. I'LL PROBABLY LEAVE IT
17 AT THAT. BUT ONE OF THE OTHER THINGS YOU SAID WAS IN SANTA
18 CLARA COUNTY THERE ARE A NUMBER OF OPERATORS THAT AREN'T ON
19 CLIPPER. I THINK THAT IS IMPORTANT FOR US TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
20 SERVICES LIKE ACE, THE ROUTE 17 EXPRESS BUS SERVICE TO SANTA
21 CRUZ COUNTY THOSE ARE SERVICES THAT ARE NOT AVAILABLE ON
22 CLIPPER. AND I THINK IT'S HONESTLY A BLIND SPOT IN OUR
23 REGIONAL COORDINATION. SO JUST ACKNOWLEDGING THAT, I DON'T
24 HAVE A SOLUTION RIGHT NOW, BUT AS I THINK SOLUTIONS BECOME
25 POSSIBLE IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE VERY MUCH AWARE OF AND ARE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 TRYING TO WORK CLOSELY WITH THOSE PARTNERS. IS THERE ANYBODY
2 IN THE ROOM THAT HAS A HAND RAISED?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS ON ZOOM WITH THEIR
5 HAND RAISED NOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE PUBLIC IN HERE OR
6 ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, I THINK TO ADD, AND THEN TAKE
9 ANY RUINED TWO. SO, THANKS TO THE PEOPLE WHO ASKED THE
10 QUESTIONS ABOUT THE SUCCESS METRICS FROM THE PILOT, AND IT
11 WOULD BE HELPFUL TO, AS YOU WILL BE COMING BACK TO US TO TALK
12 A LITTLE BIT MORE EXPLICITLY AND MAYBE TO SEND US WHAT YOU
13 MIGHT HAVE IN WRITING ABOUT WHAT THE METRICS YOU HAVE FOR THE
14 PILOT. I LOVE THAT 40% NUMBER ON THE SLIDE. THAT'S A VERY NICE
15 NUMBER. AND AS SOMEONE WITH NON-PROFIT HATS WORKING ON THE
16 SURVIVE AND THRIVE CAMPAIGN TO SEEK FUNDING FROM THE STATE AND
17 ALSO WORKING ON OUR OTHER REGION'S FUNDING STRATEGIES THE FACT
18 THAT WE HAVE AN INITIATIVE THAT IS INCREASING TRANSIT
19 RIDERSHIP THAT'S SOMETHING THAT LEGISLATORS AND THE PUBLIC
20 REALLY WANT TO KNOW. SO, ANY, AS THE ANALYSIS STARTS TO
21 GENERATE MORE DATA THAT'S EXTREMELY VALUABLE IN TERMS OF THE
22 CONFIDENCE AND SUPPORT OF LEGISLATORS AND THE PUBLIC. SPEAKING
23 OF FUNDING SOURCES, I HAVE A QUESTION. I KNOW THAT THERE WAS
24 SOME KIND OF INITIATIVE AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL TO TRY TO CREATE,
25 I THINK, FLEXIBILITY FROM EXISTING SOURCES OF FUNDING TO BE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 ABLE TO SUPPORT FARE INTEGRATION. DOES ANYBODY HAVE ANY
2 UPDATES ON HOW THAT MIGHT BE GOING AS A POTENTIAL FUNDING
3 SOURCE GOING FORWARD? IT'S INTERESTING THE COMMENT ABOUT THE
4 FACT THAT THE DATA ANALYSIS WILL BE REVEALING THE HUBS WHERE
5 PEOPLE ARE TRANSFERRING AND I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS A --
6 GIVEN THE NEXT PRESENTATION WE HAVE ON THIS AGENDA ITEM AND
7 THE PRESENCE OF THAT STAFF WILL THERE BE DATA MOVING FROM
8 OFFICE A TO OFFICE B IN TERMS OF THE LIVE DISCOVERY OF HUBS
9 AND THE WORK ON THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING? YEAH. KARA
10 VUICICH, REGIONAL PRINCIPLE PLANNER WITH THE PLANNING PROGRAM,
11 BILL WILL BE BACK REGARDING THAT AND WE'LL BE CLOSELY
12 COORDINATING SHARING WHATEVER INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ON THE POINT THAT WAS BEING MADE
15 ABOUT -- LIKE, ADDITIONAL GROUPS AND ADDITIONAL GEOGRAPHIES,
16 THANKS TO STAFF FOR POINTING OUT THAT THIS IS A PILOT AND
17 THERE IS A GOAL FOR A BROADER ROLL OUT AND ALSO IN TERMS OF
18 THE GLOBAL EXAMPLES OF, YOU KNOW, FARE INTEGRATION AND OTHER
19 SERVICE INTEGRATION SET UPS, IS WHEN THEY ARE IN PLACE AND
20 THEY ARE SUCCESSFUL, THE TENDENCY IS FOR THEM TO GROW TO BRING
21 IN ADDITIONAL CONSTITUENTS AND ADDITIONAL GEOGRAPHIES. SO,
22 WHILE I THINK DOING THIS INCREMENTAL, DO A PILOT, SHOW THAT
23 IT'S SUCCESSFUL AND THEN EXPAND IT IS GOOD, I THINK HAVING A -
24 - YOU KNOW, GOALS AND INTENTIONS FOR BROADER ROLL OUT IS GOOD,
25 AND I THINK REALLY VERY REALISTIC. LET'S SEE. ON THE POINT, I



MARCH 13, 2023

1 HAVE ONE QUESTION ABOUT THE HOUSING. SO, I KNOW THAT THE
2 HOUSING ROLLED OUT WAS IN, LIKE, OCTOBER, NOVEMBER, DO YOU
3 HAVE ANY DATA ABOUT THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT ARE
4 PARTICIPATING OR ANY MORE DATA ON THE OUTCOMES OF THAT? I KNOW
5 IT HASN'T BEEN MUCH TIME.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SURE. IT'S JUST UNDER A THOUSAND PEOPLE THAT ARE
8 PARTICIPATING. I COULD CIRCLE BACK AFTER I CONFIRM, AND THEN
9 YOU WERE ASKING JUST OTHER DATA, OR HOW IS IT GOING.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH. ANY OTHER DATA THAT YOU HAVE WOULD
12 BE WELCOME OR ONCE YOU HAVE IT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** ONCE WE GET ALL OF THE DATA ANALYZED WE'LL HAVE A LOT
15 MORE TO SAY ABOUT BOTH RIDERSHIP AND TRENDS AND TYPES OF TRIPS
16 THAT ARE BEING TAKEN AND TYPES OF LOCATIONS AND PEOPLE'S
17 FEEDBACK ABOUT HOW PEOPLE ARE FEELING ABOUT THE PAST THAT WILL
18 BE AVAILABLE AS WE AGGREGATE LEVELS FOR HOUSING AFFORDABLE
19 HOUSING RESIDENTS AND STUDENTS.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AN ACADEMIC QUESTION WITHIN THE TIMELINE
22 THAT WE HAVE IN TERMS OF GETTING FUNDING TO SUPPORT THESE
23 PROGRAMS?

24



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** SO WE ARE AIMING TO HAVE FINDINGS WITHIN A FEW MONTHS
2 AFTER EACH OF THE SURVEYS ARE RELEASED THERE HAS BEEN UPFRONT
3 WORK TO BE ABLE TO GET THE PROCESSES IN PLACE TO BE ABLE TO
4 SHARE AND ANALYZE THE DATA RESPECTING DIFFERENT PRIVACY
5 ARRANGEMENTS AND I EXPECT WE'LL HAVE THE FIRST SET OF FINDINGS
6 LATER THIS SUMMER FROM THE 50 SURVEY THEN SERVE ON A ROLLING
7 BASIS EVERY SIX MONTHS WE'LL DO ANOTHER SET OF SURVEYS AND HAVE
8 ADDITIONAL FINDINGS OUR GOAL IS TO HAVE INTERIM REPORTING
9 RATHER THAN WAITING UNTIL YOU HAVE THE TWO YEAR PILOT
10 COMPLETION TO BE ABLE TO HAVE FINDINGS TO BE ABLE TO
11 COMMUNICATE.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AFTER THE JUNE 15TH STATE BUDGET DEADLINE
14 AND ALSO DURING SOME OF THE STAKEHOLDER DISCUSSIONS OF A
15 REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING MEASURE, SO, I WOULD URGE YOU TO
16 CONSIDER THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT EXTERNAL DATES THAT RELATE TO
17 THE EFFORTS TO BRING IN MORE MONEY TO EXPAND THESE PROGRAMS.
18 LASTLY, IN TERMS OF WHAT

19

20 **GERRY GLASER:** SAID ABOUT THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. BASED ON WHAT I
21 UNDERSTAND FROM THE STAFF ON THE CLIPPER TEAM, THEY ARE, IN
22 FACT, THINKING ABOUT NOW ALLOWING SOMEONE TO USE, IF THEY HAVE
23 A SENIOR STATUS, YOU CANNOT USE A CARD AND A MOBILE ACCOUNT
24 WITH THE SAME ACCOUNT, AND THE CONCERN IS THAT A GIVEN SENIOR,
25 LIKE, THEY WOULD USE THEIR PHONE THEN GIVE THEIR CARD TO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 SOMEBODY ELSE AND THERE MIGHT BE CHEATING, AND THEREFORE MAKE
2 IT -- AND THE OUTCOME WOULD MAKE IT CONVENIENT FOR ONE SENIOR
3 THAT ACTUALLY WANTS TO USE TRANSIT AND PAY FOR IT. AND I DO
4 UNDERSTAND THE LOGICAL CONCERN ON BEHALF OF THE CLIPPER TEAM,
5 BUT I ALSO THINK THAT THE ACTUAL NEED THAT PEOPLE HAVE AND THE
6 PERCEIVED VALUE AND CONVENIENCE OUTWEIGHS THE DRAWBACK AND
7 WHILE I UNDERSTAND THIS IS THE FARE POLICY TEAM AND THERE IS
8 THE FARE PAYMENT TEAM, IN TERMS OF THE CUSTOMER, MOST PEOPLE
9 ARE NOT IN ANY WAY GOING TO UNDERSTAND THAT THERE IS DIFFERENT
10 GROUPS OF DEDICATED PUBLIC SERVANTS IN DIFFERENT ROOMS AND
11 BUILDINGS THAT ARE WORKING ON THESE SEPARATELY, THEY'RE GOING
12 TO BE SAYING, YOU KNOW, I HAVE THESE -- THIS IS HOW MUCH IT
13 COSTS AND THIS IS THE TECHNOLOGY THAT I'M USING FOR IT, AND I
14 WANT THIS TO WORK TOGETHER, AND IT IS COMMON SENSE TO ME AS
15 A USER THAT IT ALL WORKED TOGETHER. SO, PEOPLE, I THINK MORE
16 PEOPLE WILL HAVE THAT SAME ISSUE AND, SO, I WOULD REALLY URGE
17 THE MTC TEAMS TO WORK TOGETHER TO MAKE IT SEEM EASY TO USE FOR
18 GERRY GLASERS OF THE WORLD. AND LET'S SEE. IAN HAD ANOTHER
19 HAND. YEAH.

20

21 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I HAD A SHORT COMMENT ON THE METRICS OF THE
22 FREE TRANSFERS DISCUSSION. MY RESPONSE WAS YOU HAD MENTIONED
23 THAT THE PLAN WAS TO -- SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO A FUTURE
24 DISCUSSION ON METRICS BUT JUST TO INFORM THAT, THINKING
25 BROADLY ABOUT INCREASING IN TRANSFER OPPORTUNITY IS ONE METRIC



MARCH 13, 2023

1 BUT I THINK JUST LOOKING BROADLY LIKE BEFORE AND AFTER
2 RIDERSHIP PERIOD, WE CAN'T PREDICT SOMETIMES WHAT THE IMPACT
3 OF SIMPLIFICATION OF FARE POLICY CAN BE YES ONE IMPACT MIGHT
4 BE INCREASING TRANSFERS BUT I DON'T THINK TO ME THERE
5 SHOULDN'T NECESSARILY BE A GOAL THE GOAL IS NOT MORE PEOPLE
6 TRANSFERRING THE PUBLIC GOAL IS GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF CARS AND
7 ON TO TRANSIT AND COULD BE FREE TRANSFERS SOMEHOW INDIRECTLY
8 JUST REDUCES A BARRIER CALCULATION, GETTING MORE WHEN YOU IN A
9 HABIT, AND YOU MIGHT MISS AN IMPACT LIKE TRANSFERS AND AFTER
10 THE POLICY IS IMPLEMENTED, WHAT DID THEY DO? I LOOK FORWARD TO
11 THAT.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOING ALONG THE LINES OF THE METRICS CONVERSATION, I
14 HEARD EARLIER THAT THE SURVEYS DIDN'T HAVE DEMOGRAPHIC
15 INFORMATION. FIND THAT TO BE CONCERNING. I'M GOING TO ASK THE
16 QUESTION, HOW MUCH IS RACE EQUITY BEING BAKED INTO YOUR
17 METRICS? TYPICALLY WITH POLICIES BEING MADE WITHOUT RACE
18 EQUITY BEING A METRIC YOU END UP HAVING TO PAY FOR IT LATER ON
19 OR END OF DOING RACE EQUITY AT END. THAT'S USUALLY NOT
20 RECOMMENDED. IF YOU WANT TO DO RACE EQUITY WORK YOU HAVE GOT
21 TO START WITH THE RACE EQUITY IN THE PLANNING PROCESS. THAT'S
22 A QUESTION THAT AFTER YOU, WHERE YOU WERE WITH EQUITY IN THE
23 PLANNING PROCESS. WHEN YOU ARE ENROLLING EMPLOYMENT PARTNERS
24 DO YOU ALREADY HAVE THOSE LINED UP? WHO ARE THOSE EMPLOYMENT



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PARTNERS IS THERE ROOM FOR YOU TO STILL REIMAGINE WHAT TYPES
2 OF EMPLOYERS YOU WANT TO HAVE?

3

4 **RYAN REEVES:** WE DID COLLECT DEMOGRAPHIC DATA IN ALL OF THE
5 SURVEYS SPECIFIC QUESTIONS TO DISABILITY STATUS WAS NOT A
6 SPECIFIC QUESTION IN THAT SURVEY, WE WILL CERTAINLY BE
7 ANALYZING THE PHASE ONE DATA BY RACE ETHNICITY TO BETTER
8 UNDERSTAND WHO IS BEING SERVED WHO IS NOT BEING SERVED SO JUST
9 CLARIFYING THAT POINT IN THE SURVEY. AND EQUITY CERTAINLY IS A
10 KEY FOCUS OF THE PROGRAM AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE
11 SERVING LOW-INCOME WORKERS PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND THIS IS NOT
12 JUST A PASS IF EVER TRADITIONAL 9 TO 5 OFFICE JOBS AS WELL. IN
13 TERMS OF THE QUESTION ABOUT, IF THE EMPLOYERS ARE SET, THEY'RE
14 NOT. WE HAVE JUST STARTED THE -- WE HAVE DONE SOME TARGET
15 OUTREACH FOR SOME OF THOSE SECTORS THAT I MENTIONED AROUND
16 SERVICE INDUSTRY, LIKE HOTELS AND HOSPITALITY, HEALTH CARE
17 WORKERS, MANUFACTURING WORKERS, TO BRING ON OUR FIRST FEW
18 PARTNERS SO WE CAN TEST HOW PRICING WORKS AND WE'LL BE DOING
19 BROADER RECRUITMENT OUTREACH PROCESS TO BRING ON THE
20 ADDITIONAL PARTNERS SO IN SHORT THE EMPLOYERS HAVE NOT BEEN
21 SET IN ANY WAY.

22

23 **CARINA LIEU:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION.

24

25 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ONE FOLLOW UP QUESTION THEN.



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **GERRY GLASER:** THEN ANYBODY ELSE BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT
3 AGENDA ITEM. IN TERMS OF THE EMPLOYERS, IS THIS GOING TO BE
4 INCLUDING CONTRACTORS AT THE LOCATION? YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE
5 EQUITY CHALLENGES IN THE PREVIOUS GENERATIONS OF PASS PRODUCTS
6 IS THAT THEY WERE AVAILABLE TO FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES AND NOT FOR
7 EXAMPLE, SOMEONE WHO IS A FOOD SERVICE WORK AT THE LOCATION
8 WHO IS AN OUTSOURCED CONTRACTORS. SO ARE YOU LOOKING TO
9 INCLUDE ALL OF THE PEOPLE AT THE SITE.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S A CONVERSATION WE HAVE BEEN HAVING WITH
12 EMPLOYERS WHO ARE LOOKING TO BE ABLE TO OFFER IT TO THEIR
13 CONTRACTORS AS WELL AS TO PART-TIME EMPLOYEES. IT'S NOT
14 NECESSARILY A RETIREMENT THAT THEY MUST DO THAT BUT WE'RE
15 GOING TO WORK WITH EMPLOYERS ON ELIGIBILITY AND WE'RE
16 ENCOURAGING FOLKS TO BE ABLE TO EXPAND THIS TO PART-TIME
17 WORKERS AS WELL AS CONTRACTORS.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. GERRY?

20

21 **GERRY GLASER:** I WAS KIND OF EXCITED WHEN RANDI ASSIGNED ME TO
22 THIS COMMITTEE BECAUSE THE TITLE OF THIS COMMITTEE IS TRANSIT
23 TRANSFORMATION, NOT TRANSIT REVIEW. SO MOST OF THE POINTS THAT
24 I MAKE ARE HOW ARE WE GOING TO TRANSFORM. AND TO SEBASTIAN'S
25 QUESTION ABOUT PROVIDERS, HOW ARE WE HANDLING WHAT DOES THAT



MARCH 13, 2023

1 ELECTRIC LIKE WHEN WE START INTEGRATING ALL OF THE FARES SO
2 THAT FOR THE USER IT BECOMES -- AND THEN IAN DID A BETTER JOB
3 OF DESCRIBING ABOUT COMMITTEES THINKING ABOUT TRANSFORMATION.
4 TALKING ABOUT MARKETING TO KIDS, AT ONE OF MY LAST EMPLOYMENT
5 JOBS EVERYBODY I WORKED WITH WAS IN THEIR 20S AND WE WOULD
6 TRAVEL AROUND THE COUNTRY BUILDING ELECTRIC BUSES AND TRUCKS
7 AND I WAS THE ONLY ONE RENTING A CAR ALL OF THE FOLKS COMING
8 OUT OF COLLEGE STARTING TO WORK WERE SO USED TO USING UBER OR
9 PUBLIC TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY CAME FROM DIFFERENT PLACES IN THE
10 COUNTRY. AND THAT'S PART OF THE MARKETING WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
11 TRANSFORMATION AND SEAMLESS INTEGRATION THAT'S PART OF THE
12 ASPECT, AND I THINK YOU'RE RIGHT, GETTING TO THE YOUNGER
13 POPULATION IS IMPORTANT. GETTING INTO THE COLLEGES WAS THE
14 REASON TO START GETTING THEM USED TO IT. YOU'RE NOT GOING TO
15 CHANGE THE 60 AND 70 YEAR-OLDS, BUT WE CAN CHANGE THE 18 TO 20
16 YEAR OLS SO TRANSIT IS THE WAY WE WANT TO GET AROUND AND THAT
17 IS PART OF WHAT THIS PROGRAM IS ABOUT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS ONLINE?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
22 HAND RAISED. FIRST UP IS GOING TO BE DAVEED MANDELL. HOW MUCH
23 TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

24

25 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** TWO MINUTES.



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DAVEED GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF AND
3 I'LL LET YOU KNOW WHEN YOU HAVE 15 SECONDS LEFT. DID YOU WANT
4 TO SPEAK? HIT UNMUTE ONE MORE TIME.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** IT'S NOT LETTING ME. CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. I CAN HEAR YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** MY SCREEN WOULDN'T LET ME -- IT WAS RECALCITRANT.
11 QUESTION, I HAVEN'T HEARD ANYONE AT MTC TALK ABOUT MOBILITY AS
12 A POPULAR MODEL IN EUROPE IT CONSIDERS MOBILITY RATHER THAN
13 TRANSPORTATION IT DOESN'T TALK ABOUT PARTICULAR MODES AND IT
14 DOESN'T CARE. ALL IT CARES ABOUT ONE FARE FOR ONE TRIP. AND IT
15 DOESN'T TALK ABOUT TRANSFERS IT TALKS ABOUT DISTANCE FROM ONE
16 PLACE TO ANOTHER. AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHY YOU HAVE NOT
17 CONSIDERED MAS, IT'S POPULAR IN EUROPE AND HAS BEEN EXPLORED
18 HERE BY THE TRANSIT RESEARCH BOARD AND COMMITTEES SUCH AS THE
19 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE AND SOME AGENCIES ARE BEGINNING
20 TO USE IT AND I'M WONDERING WHY -- THIS IS A TRULY REGIONAL
21 MODEL AND I'M JUST WONDERING WHY YOU HAVEN'T EXAMINED IT.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** JUST AS THE CHAIR'S COMMENT TO STAFF,
24 WHILE THAT IS A GENERAL COMMENT, I THINK THAT THERE ARE
25 LOGICAL ISSUES ABOUT, FOR EXAMPLE, INCORPORATING, BIKESHARE,



MARCH 13, 2023

1 OR INCORPORATING OTHER MODES OF TRANSIT INTO INTEGRATIVE FARES
2 OTHER AND PIECES OF INTEGRATION, AND I THINK THINKING ABOUT
3 THIS AS FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS WOULD BE WELCOME. AND THERE IS
4 ANOTHER COMMENT. YEAH.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS RANDI KINMAN. GO AHEAD AND
7 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION THAT
10 WENT ON TODAY, AND AS A MEMBER OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE,
11 I WANT TO ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH IAN'S FRUSTRATION THAT THIS IS
12 TAKING A LONG TIME. AND WE NEED TO BE AWARE OF THAT, AND
13 PEOPLE EXPECTED MORE OF US. SO I KNOW WE CAN'T HEAR THINGS
14 ALONG BUT IT HELPS TO HAVE A SENSE OF URGENCY IN OUR COMMENTS.
15 AND I WANT TO ASSOCIATED MYSELF WITH WARREN'S COMMENTS ABOUT
16 THE LACK OF DISABILITY MENTIONED IN ANY AND ALL OF THIS, IT
17 WAS A PROBLEM IN OUR COMMITTEE MEETING TBD THING THAT CAME UP
18 THE EARLIER WE START THOSE CONSERVATIONS INCLUDING STARTING
19 WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE THE BETTER OFF WE'RE
20 GOING TO BE. DURING THE DATA GATHER OTHER I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW
21 WHEN AS WE GO OUT THERE, WE'RE GIVING PASSES TO PEOPLE OR
22 PEOPLE ARE PURCHASING PASSES IN BLOCKS FOR THIS BUSINESSES OR
23 IF WE'RE GOING TO CAMPUSES, THE ACTUAL CORRELATION BETWEEN THE
24 NUMBER OF STUDENTS THERE ARE OR THE NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES THERE
25 ARE OR THE NUMBER THAT ACTUALLY USE THESE THINGS. AND LASTLY,



MARCH 13, 2023

1 THE ISSUE ABOUT SENIORS THAT BUGGED DOES NEED TO BE DEBUGGED.
2 A LOT OF US ARE ON TRANSIT AND A LOT OF US WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
3 A BETTER COORDINATION WITH THIS. LASTLY, I THINK THE IDEA OF
4 US GROWING RIDERSHIP, IF I COULD PULL INTO DIRIDON STATION AND
5 NOT SEE UBERS AND TAXI LINED UP, I WOULD BE A MUCH HAPPIER
6 PERSON.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO FURTHER SPEAKERS.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM FIVE TRANSIT
11 2050 SCOPE AND SCHEDULE UPDATE. BEFORE ASKING KARA VUICICH TO
12 PRESENT, I'LL ASK FOR HELP FROM STAFF, IS THERE ANY MECHANISM,
13 OUR VICE CHAIR IS NOT HERE AND IS THERE ANY WAY TO FIELD
14 PROMOTE A TEMPORARY VICE CHAIR WHILE THE CHAIR USES THE
15 RESTROOM FOR A MINUTE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEAH. YOU CAN. YOU'RE GOOD.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. OR I CAN JUST -- I'LL -- HAVING READ
20 THE SLIDES, I'LL TURN IT OVER -- OH, IF ANYBODY ELSE WANTS A
21 TWO MINUTE BREAK, WE CAN COME BACK IN TWO MINUTES. FANTASTIC.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I'M BACK FOR ITEM FIVE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS
24 SCOPE AND SCHEDULE UPDATE. AND KARA VUICICH OF MTC WILL BE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PRESENTING THE ITEM, AND PLEASE CORRECT ME IF I'M FORGETTING
2 ANYTHING ABOUT YOUR NAME.

3

4 **KARA VUICICH:** THAT WAS A GREAT JOB. KARA VUICICH, PRINCIPLE
5 PLANNER WITH REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM AT MTC. I DON'T HAVE
6 ANY SLIDES FOR THIS ITEM. FOR AGENDA ITEM FIVE, I'M GOING TO
7 GIVE A FEW VERBAL REMARKS TO SUMMARIZE KEY THINGS THAT WERE
8 COVERED IN THE SUMMARY MEMO AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
9 QUESTIONS AND HEAR COMMENTS OR FEEDBACK THAT YOU ALL MAY HAVE.
10 GOOD AFTERNOON. I THINK SOME OF YOU MAY RECALL LAST OCTOBER WE
11 PROVIDED AN UPDATE ON THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING ACTION
12 ITEM NUMBER 18 FROM THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.
13 AND AT THAT TIME, BACK IN OCTOBER, WE PROPOSED INTEGRATING
14 CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING INTO THE FORTHCOMING PLANNED BAY
15 AREA UPDATE, WHICH IS TITLED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. WE
16 PRESENTED THIS PROPOSAL TO THE JOINT MTC PLANNING AND ABAG
17 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IN DECEMBER OF 2022, AND THE
18 COMMITTEE MEMBERS SUPPORTED MOVING FORWARD WITH THE
19 INTEGRATION SO WE'RE NOW CALLING THIS EFFORT TRANSIT 2050
20 PLUS. SO, SINCE PLANNED BAY AREA'S ADOPTION IN OCTOBER OF
21 2021, OUR FOCUS HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA.
22 AND THIS FORTHCOMING UPDATE WILL CONTINUE TO FOCUS ON
23 IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS WITH RELATIVELY MINOR UPDATES TO MOST
24 OF THE PLAN'S STRATEGIES. THAT SAID, WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF
25 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS, AND THIS IS, SORT OF, HOW WE'RE PROPOSING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 TO INTEGRATE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING INTO PLANNED BAY AREA,
2 THE FOCUS WILL BE ON TAKING A MORE COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH TO
3 UPDATING PLANNED BAY AREA'S SIX TRANSIT RELATED STRATEGIES.
4 AND SO THOSE ARE WITHIN THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE
5 PLAN. AND THOSE INCLUDE STRATEGY T1, WHICH IS RESTORE, OPERATE
6 AND MAINTAIN THE EXISTING SYSTEMS; STRATEGY T3 ENABLE THE
7 SEAMLESS MOBILITY EXPERIENCE; T4 REFORM REGIONAL TRANSIT FARE
8 POLICY. AND MORE TRANSIT FOCUSED STRATEGIES, MORE TRANSIT
9 FOCUSED STRATEGIES T10 LOCAL TRANSIT FREQUENCY CAPACITY AND
10 RELIABLE, AND T11 TO EXPAND MODERNIZE THE REGIONAL RAIL
11 NETWORK, AND T12 BUILD INTEGRATED REGIONAL EXPRESS LANES AND
12 EXPRESS BUS NETWORK. SO, THE SUMMARY MEMO WE PROVIDED IS AN
13 OVERVIEW OF THE TASK AND GENERAL SCHEDULE THAT ARE ENVISIONED
14 FOR TRANSIT 2050 PLUS PUBLIC OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT AS PART
15 OF TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WILL BE INCLUDED AS A COMPONENT OF THE
16 ROBUST OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT THAT WE HAVE PLANNED AS PART OF
17 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. AND TURNING TO THE TASKS
18 THEMSELVES, THE INITIAL TRANSIT 2050 PLUS TASK FOCUS ON
19 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT NETWORK, DEVELOPING DRAFT GOALS
20 AND OBJECTIVES FOR TRANSIT, AND ANALYSIS THAT DEFINE TRAVEL
21 NEEDS. FIRST HALF OF 2023- 2024 WE'LL FOCUS ON DEVELOPING
22 NETWORK CONCEPTS THAT WILL DEFINE SERVICE PARAMETERS BOTH NEAR
23 AND LONG-TERM, ORGANIZING FRAMEWORK FOR THE PLANS STRATEGIES
24 AND PROJECTS. BY PROJECTS, I MEAN USE THE TERM BROADLY
25 INCLUDING THINGS LIKE SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS, CAPITAL PROJECTS,



MARCH 13, 2023

1 AS WELL AS TRANSIT PRIORITY INVESTMENTS THAT HELP GET BUSES
2 OUT OF TRAFFIC AND IMPROVE BUS SPEED AND RELIABILITY.
3 PREFERRED NETWORK CONCEPT RELATED STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS
4 WOULD THEN BE INCORPORATED INTO THE FINAL PLANNED AREA
5 BLUEPRINT IN THE LATTER HALF OF 2024 AND 2050 WE WILL FOCUS ON
6 DEVELOPING THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT WHILE
7 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS UNDERGOING ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
8 AND SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT WILL DOCUMENT THE DEVELOPMENT OF
9 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS AND ADDRESS THE ADDITIONAL THINGS LIKE
10 NEEDS, BARRIERS, POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS OR ACTIONS RELATED TO
11 IMPLEMENTATION. AND IN MAY OR JUNE RETURN TO SEEK FEEDBACK ON
12 THE INITIAL TASK OF THE DRAFT NETWORK GOALS AND OBJECTIVES
13 THEN PLANNING TO COME BACK TO YOU TO SEEK YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE
14 DELIVERABLES AND TASKS.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS
17 UPDATE IMPORTANT EXCITING PROJECT MOVING FORWARD THAT'S NOT AN
18 ISN'T THAT CORRECT THIS IS THE FIRST TRANSIT PLANNING IN THIS
19 WAY ACTUALLY EXCITING THING.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THINKING ABOUT EQUITY AND ACCESS AS CONNECTED AS
22 RELATED, I HEARD A DISCUSSION OF AN EQUITY LENS IN MOVING
23 FORWARD WITH BAY AREA 2050. NOW I HEARD FRANK WELTE WHO WAS ON
24 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TALK ABOUT BAY AREA 2050 AND THE
25 LACK OF VISION IN TERMS OF HOW PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES -- HE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 HAS RAISED IT MANY TIMES -- SO MY FIRST THOUGHT IS, AND MY
2 HOPE IS THAT AS WE CONSIDER USING AN EQUITY LENS, THAT WE ALSO
3 USE A LENS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES I HOPE THAT WILL
4 HAPPEN SOON AND HOPE WE MOVE FORWARD TOGETHER THAT'S MY FIRST
5 HOPE. AND I WOULD LIKE SAY THAT BECAUSE PLANNED BAY AREA
6 DIDN'T HAVE A DISABILITY LENS FROM THE BEGINNING WE'RE GOING
7 TO HAVE TO RETROFIT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO GO BACK AND RETHINK
8 SOME OF OUR POLICIES, AND SOME OF OUR IDEAS. AND THAT WILL
9 TAKE TIME. SO, THAT'S DISTURBING, BUT IT'S NECESSARY. SO THAT
10 WILL BE MY ENTIRE COMMENT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** BEFORE DOING THAT, I ASK STAFF TO TAKE
13 THAT AS A FOLLOW UP -- AS A QUESTION IN TERMS OF IS
14 ACCESSIBILITY BEING USED AS A LENS, AND BACK TO WARREN, ARE
15 THERE PARTICULAR SUGGESTIONS THAT YOU WOULD HAVE ABOUT HOW
16 ACCESSIBILITY WOULD BE USED AS A LENS AND A CONNECTED NETWORK
17 PLAN.

18

19 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** AS WITH THIS PARTICULAR PIECE AS WITH MANY
20 OTHER PIECES, I THINK WORKING WITH THIS COMMITTEE AND WORKING
21 WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE, DEPENDING ON THE
22 DETERMINATION OF THE CHAIRS AND APPROPRIATE STAFF, WE REALLY
23 NEED TO FACILITATE THIS DISCUSSION, BOTH IN THIS PROCESS WITH
24 BAY 2050 AND OTHER PROCESSES, TO WORK WITH FOLKS WHO ARE
25 KNOWLEDGEABLE, GOT ONLY IN THIS ROOM, BUT, ALSO ON THE POLICY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 ADVISORY COUNCIL UNDER THE CAPACITY TO REALLY LOOK AT HOW TO
2 BEGIN THIS STEP. IT'S GOING TO TAKE SOME TIME, AND WE NEED TO
3 HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS. SO, I WANT TO START THOSE
4 CONVERSATIONS NOW. SO I DO WANT TO HEAR FROM STAFF ABOUT THIS.
5 WHAT'S THE THOUGHT IN TERMS OF, HOW ARE WE MISSING EQUITY
6 CONNECTED TO ACCESS? WHY IS THAT NOT HAPPENING AND HOW DO WE
7 MAKE IT HAPPEN. THANK YOU.

8

9 **SPEAKER:**

10

11 **KARA VUICICH:** I CAN SPEAK TO THAT. THANK YOU MR. CUSHMAN FOR
12 BRINGING THAT UP. WE HEARD FROM YOU WHEN WE HAD A BRIEF UPDATE
13 IN OCTOBER. THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS WE WANT TO LOOK CLOSELY
14 AT LOOKING AT NEEDS TASKS AND OPPORTUNITIES IS GETTING A
15 BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT CAN WE DO THROUGH THIS WORK TO
16 ENABLE OUR FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT SYSTEM TO WORK MUCH BETTER AND
17 MORE EFFECTIVELY FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, PARTICULARLY
18 WHEN IT COMES TO LOOKING AT HUBS AND LOCATIONS WHERE PEOPLE
19 ARE POTENTIALLY TRANSFERRING BETWEEN DIFFERENT SERVICES AND
20 BEING ABLE TO EFFECTIVELY USE THE TRANSIT NETWORK AS A
21 COMPREHENSIVE WHOLE. WE WILL DEFINITELY TAKE TO HEART YOUR
22 REQUEST TO WORK CLOSELY WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE AND THE BE
23 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE AND I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE
24 CAN GO BACK AND TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT AND COME BACK TO YOU



MARCH 13, 2023

1 WITH SOME MORE CONCRETE -- A MORE CONCRETE PROPOSAL FOR HOW TO
2 DO THAT.

3

4 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** SO WHAT I HOPE HAPPENS IS THAT WE HAVE A DUAL
5 LENS, IF YOU WILL, SO THAT WE -- I HAVE HEARD, YOU KNOW,
6 EQUITY BEING A LENS, AND THAT WE ABSOLUTELY INCLUDE ACCESS TO
7 LENS SO THAT WE WORK TOGETHER AND COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER. I
8 HOPE THAT'S WHAT HAPPENS. I WILL AGAIN EXPRESS MY FRUSTRATION
9 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO RETURN -- IF YOU WILL -- OR RETREAD ON
10 SOME OF THIS DISCUSSION. BECAUSE IT IS SOMETHING WE HAVEN'T
11 DONE IN THE PAST AND IT'S FRUSTRATING TO HAVE TO DO THIS IN
12 THE MIDDLE. IT'S A REALITY THAT WE HAVE TO DO IT. BUT THIS IS
13 A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF FRUSTRATION FROM MY COMMUNITY ABOUT HOW WE
14 MISSED THE BOAT AND HAVE TO JUMP INTO THE MIDDLE OF A
15 CONVERSATION TO REENERGIZE THIS WHOLE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **GERRY GLASER:** DURING COVID WE OPENED UP AND HAD AN ONSITE
20 MEETING. I SHOWED UP FOR THE ONSITE MEETING. SO DID MARTHA.
21 THERE WERE ONLY TWO OF US IN THE ROOM FOR THAT MEETING. THE
22 REASON I MENTION IT -- WARREN I WAS GOING TO MENTION IT
23 BECAUSE FIRST THAT WAS THE FIRST TIME I USED TRANSIT IN MANY
24 YEARS SO I TOOK NOTES ALONG THE WAY SEEM TO ME WHAT WE COULD
25 DO WITH GAPS START TAKING TOURS, TAKE NOTES AT OUR LAST POLICY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING ANOTHER COLONEL MEMBER AND I WENT ON
2 BART TOGETHER AND HE IS HANDICAPPED. HE IS BLIND, AND IT
3 OCCURRED TO ME I JUST SAW HOW LONDON, WITH THEIR NEW SUBWAY,
4 AND YOU KNOW, YOU CAN'T FALL ON THE TRACKS IN LONDON, BUT BART
5 PULLS OUT OF STATION REALLY FAST, AND PEOPLE STANDING RIGHT
6 NEXT TO IT. THAT'S THE KIND OF GAB AS WELL AS THE SIGNS, AND
7 NOT JUST FARES. IDENTIFYING GAPS AS FAVORITE EFFORT IS REALLY
8 THE RIGHT THING TO DO, THAT YOU PUT DOWN ON YOUR LIST, A GOOD
9 EXAMPLE TODAY TOO WAS, WELL, I TRIED TO FIGURE OUT MY TRIP
10 HERE. LET ME TRY TO TAKE SMART AND I JUMP ON THE 580 THEN GO
11 OVER TO BART AND COME DOWN. SMART GETS TO THE STATION AT 10:30
12 THE 580 LEAVES AT 10:30 OKAY. I CAN'T MAKE THE TRANSFER. I
13 HAVE TO COME TWO HOURS EARLIER. THOSE ARE THE KINDS OF GAPS
14 DOCUMENTING OUGHT GAPS IS GOING TO BE QUITE AN IDENTIFYING
15 EFFORT AND HOW TO CLOSE THEM ALL UP. I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU
16 INTEGRATE THE VARIOUS SYSTEMS -- ACTUALLY ANOTHER MEETING --
17 STORY -- I WORK FROM STORIES. BUILDING WE SHOWED UP FOR BUT
18 WAS CLOSED, I SOMEHOW CAUGHT THE 172 ON GOLDEN GATE AND CAME
19 DOWN ON A DIRECT BUS, LEFT ME OFF TWO BLOCKS FROM HERE. BUT
20 THE MEETING WAS CANCELED. SO, I WANT TO GO HOME. I CAN'T GET
21 BACK TO WHERE I LEFT THE CAR BECAUSE I CAN'T TAKE ANOTHER
22 [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT TAKES LESS THAN FOUR HOURS TO GET BACK TO
23 THAT SPOT BECAUSE THEY DON'T RUN, EXCEPT DURING CERTAIN TIMES.
24 FREQUENCY IS IMPORTANT, SCHEDULE IS IMPORTANT. DOCUMENTING
25 THOSE AND COST. THAT TELLS THE PLAN FIRST, TRANSFORM A LOT IN



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PLANNING. I LIVE IN TOWN IT'S ACTUALLY A CITY OF 7800 PEOPLE,
2 AND THE LINE TO GET INTO TOWN IS TWO MILES LONG EVERY
3 AFTERNOON COMING INTO TOWN BECAUSE THE BUSES COME EVERY HOUR
4 AND A HALF, AND NOW I JUST MADE A LIST, I NEED SIX TRANSFERS.
5 SO, THAT'S THE KIND OF GAP WOOLZY START LOOKING AT POPULATIONS
6 MINE IS A SMALL POPULATION BUT WE LOOK AT CENTERS TO SEE HOW
7 TO GET FROM POINT A TO POINT B AS PART OF THE GAP ANALYSIS
8 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT BEGINNING PLACE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. HAPPY TO SEE THIS PROJECT START TO GET
11 UNDERWAY. I HAVE SEVERAL OPEN-ENDED QUESTIONS, NOT INTENDED TO
12 PROVOKE THOUGHTS NECESSARILY FOR ANSWER RIGHT NOW, THE FIRST
13 WOULD BE THINKING ABOUT A NUMBER OF PLACES IN SCOPE OF GOALS
14 AND OBJECTIVES OR PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT EITHER NETWORK OR
15 PROJECT MENTIONED, PUTTING OUT THERE IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT
16 RATHER THAN THINKING ABOUT WHAT'S THE NEW PERFORMANCE METRIC
17 WE CAN COME UP WITH, RATHER LOOK AT METRICS TO TRANSIT AGENCY
18 TRANSIT SYSTEM SUBJECT AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL AND LOCAL LEVEL
19 LOOKING AT PLANNING AND RECREATING ANOTHER NEW OBJECTIVE AND
20 I'M INCREASINGLY CONCERNED WE PUT A HUGE MULTITUDE OF
21 OBJECTIVES ON TRANSIT AGENCIES WE END UP CREATING A LOT OF
22 NOISE AND ACTUALLY DILUTING EFFECTIVENESS OF DIRECTIVES. I WAS
23 SURPRISED BY TASKS 3 AND 4 IN THE SCOPE BUT I THINK THIS'S
24 OKAY. IT'S IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT THAT RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN
25 THE PROJECT AND THE NETWORK AND THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF A



MARCH 13, 2023

1 CHICKEN AND AN EGG SITUATION THERE. AND I HOPE YOU AND YOUR
2 TEAM ARE ABLE TO EM GRACE THAT AND THINK ABOUT HOW WE THINK
3 ABOUT THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN THE PARTS AND THE WHOLE. MY -- I
4 GUESS THIRD COMMENT WOULD BE AROUND, SORT OF, THE FINANCIALS
5 BEHIND THIS PLAN AND I, AGAIN, I DON'T -- I, SORT OF, SEE THE
6 FINANCIAL DISCUSSION IS, SORT OF, TOWARD THE BACK OF THE
7 SCOPE. AGAIN, I THINK THAT COULD BE FINE. BUT I THINK IT'S
8 JUST IMPORTANT THAT, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT FINANCE IS SUCH A BIG
9 PART OF EVERYTHING WE CAN DO. IT'S A HUGE LOOMING ISSUE IN THE
10 NEAR-TERM AND LONG-TERM THE FUNDING SOURCES THAT TRANSIT
11 RELIES ON, THINGS THAT ARE TIED TO DIESEL TAX MAY NOT LOOK AT
12 SUSTAINABLE AS THEY DO NOW SO I THINK WHEREVER IT SITS IN THE
13 PLAN IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO HAVE THOSE ASSUMPTIONS COME OUT
14 CLEARLY MAYBE MORE EXPLICITLY THAN THEY ARE IN THE LAST
15 ITERATION OF THE RTP WHERE THEY'RE THERE BUT NOT FRONT AND
16 CENTER. MY LAST QUESTION IS WHO REALLY IS THIS PLAN FOR? WHEN
17 WE HAD IT TIED TO THE RTP IT FULFILLED A STATUTORY REQUIREMENT
18 SO THERE IS SOMEONE THAT'S MORE THERE, TRYING TO THINK ABOUT
19 IT AHEAD OF TIME HOW IS IT WE'RE EXPECTING TRANSIT AGENCIES TO
20 USE THIS PLAN, HOW WE'RE EXPECTING MTC COMMISSION TO MAKE
21 DECISIONS DIFFERENTLY BASED ON HAVING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN
22 WHERE WE DIDN'T HAVE ONE BEFORE. I THINK THE MORE YOU CAN KIND
23 OF THINK ABOUT THAT AHEAD OF TIME THE MORE THAT WILL HELP
24 SHAPE THE PLAN INTO A ROBUST AND USEFUL DOCUMENT. SO, ALL FOOD
25 FOR THOUGHT. THANK YOU.



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANYONE ELSE IN THE ROOM? IAN?

3

4 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH, SO, I WOULD LOVE SOME CLARIFICATION ON
5 THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN TASK ONE AND WHERE IT SAYS, YOU KNOW,
6 DRAFT NETWORK DEFINITION AND THEN, YEAH, TASK FOUR REALLY
7 WHICH IS DEVELOP NETWORK CON ACCEPTS IT SEEMS LIKE TASK ONE
8 WHEN YOU READ IT SOUNDS LIKE WE'RE -- A LOT OF THE WORK IS
9 BEING DONE BEFORE THE CONSULTANT GETS BROUGHT ON BOARD. COULD
10 YOU CLARIFY THE PROCESS OF THE NETWORK DEVELOPMENT?

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** WE IDENTIFY THE DRAFT SKELETON TO IDENTIFY THE
13 EXTENT OF REGIONAL NETWORK IN TERMS OF WHAT SOME OF THOSE
14 REGIONAL SERVICES ARE DEFINED WITH A LOT MORE DISCUSSION WITH
15 THE OPERATORS, WHAT SHOULD BE REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT AND
16 DEFINITION OF WHAT IT MEANS WHEN WE SAY REGIONAL TRANSIT
17 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT THEN THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE
18 NETWORK CONCEPTS AND DEFINITION ASSIGNING ADDITIONAL SERVICE
19 PARAMETERS AND ADDITION. SERVICE PARAMETERS AND HOW WE'RE
20 GOING TO ACHIEVE THOSE SERVICE PARAMETERS THAT WE'RE SAYING WE
21 WANTED TO ACHIEVE HOPE THAT HELPS.

22

23 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THAT HELPS. SEBASTIAN'S COMMENT ON THE
24 PLACEMENT OF 3 AND 4 TOGETHER I GUESS MY CONCERN THAT I HAVE
25 IT SEEMS LIKE WHEN I THINK OF THE LOGICAL STEPS INVOLVED IN



MARCH 13, 2023

1 THIS PROJECT, I WOULD THINK THAT WE WOULD WANT TO IDENTIFY THE
2 NETWORK, IDENTIFY THE OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE,
3 ESPECIALLY IN TERMS OF ACCESS, HOW LONG IT SHOULD TAKE TO GET
4 BETWEEN KEY HUBS, WHAT ARE THE HUBS, WHAT ARE THE CORRIDORS?
5 HOW LONG SHOULD IT TAKE TO GET BETWEEN THOSE KEY AREAS AND
6 THEN WE GET TO A PROJECT -- WE IDENTIFY WHAT ARE THE PROJECTS
7 NEEDED FOR DELIVERING THEM. TASK THREE SEEMS TO SUGGEST WE'RE
8 GOING TO INSERT A WHOLE BUNCH OF PROJECTS INTO THE FRAMEWORK
9 PRIOR TO FINDING OUT WHAT THE OUTCOME THAT WE WANTED MAYBE
10 THAT'S MISINTERPRETATION. MAYBE YOU CAN EXPLAIN.

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** I CAN UNDERSTAND WHY IT'S NOT CLEAR ACTUALLY
13 IT'S AN ITERATIVE PROCESS AS OPPOSED TO SEQUENTIAL. WE DO HAVE
14 -- WE HAVE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS FOR PROJECT PERFORMANCE, AND
15 SOME OF THAT PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WORK WE KNOW WE'RE
16 GOING TO HAVE TO DO ANYWAY AND WE CAN START EARLIER ON IN
17 ORDER TO HELP US MEET OUR PLANNED BAY AREA TIMELINES BUT WHAT
18 WE'RE ENVISION SUGGEST THAT IT'S GOING TO BE -- INSTEAD OF
19 BEING COMPLETELY SEQUENTIAL IT WILL MORE OF AN ITERATIVE
20 PROCESS IT'S NOT THAT WE'RE, SORT OF, PREDETERMINING THE
21 PROJECTS THEN TRYING TO POPULATE MORE THERE ARE SOME PROJECTS
22 THAT WE KNOW WE'RE GOING TO DO THE UPDATED PROJECT PERFORMANCE
23 ASSESSMENT ON THOSE THAT WE'LL BE ABLE TO SEE HOW THOSE
24 PROJECTS PERFORM THEN BE ABLE TO DETERMINE WHAT FITS WITH



MARCH 13, 2023

1 DIFFERENT NETWORK CONCEPTS AND PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENTS ON
2 THOSE PACKAGES, DID I CAPTURE THAT?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DAVE VAUTIN, DIRECTOR OF PLANS. IT DOES TAKE US
5 MANY MONTHS TO CONDUCT INDIVIDUAL PROJECT ANALYSIS. QUITE A
6 BIT MORE MONTHS THAN REQUIRED TO STUDY THREE OR FOUR DIFFERENT
7 NETWORK CONCEPTS BECAUSE OF THE AMOUNT OF COMPUTING TIME
8 REQUIRED IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO GET STARTED EARLY ON THAT
9 PROCESS ROUGHLY A YEAR BEFORE IT NEEDS TO BE COMPUTED, BECAUSE
10 OF THE AMOUNT OF COMPUTING AND POWER AND THE WAY WE BUILD-OUT
11 NETWORKS IS BY ASSEMBLING TOGETHER PACKAGES OF PROJECTS. ONLY
12 WHEN YOU HAVE CODED EVERY SINGLE PROJECT CAN YOU STUDY THE
13 NETWORK OF PROJECTS TOGETHER IT'S A BUILDING BLOCKS APPROACH
14 FOR BUILDING PROJECTS ANALYZING THEM WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO
15 REASSEMBLE THEM INTO THE DIFFERENT PACKAGES AND STUDY THEM AS
16 NETWORKS AS WELL THAT'S CONTEXT ON THE SCHEDULE AGAIN AND THE
17 CONSTRAINTS ESPECIALLY IN THIS TIGHT 18 MONTH SCHEDULE.

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** OKAY. I THINK THAT THAT'S HELPFUL AND THAT
20 MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. I WOULD HOPE, TWO FINAL COMMENTS, IS, IN
21 THE GOALS STAGES, I GUESS THAT WOULD BE TASK ONE OR TWO --
22 WELL, MAYBE THIS IS A QUESTION. AT WHAT PHASE OF THIS DO WE
23 HONE IN ON A CLEAR STATEMENT OF WHAT THE OUTCOME IS AS FAR AS
24 ACCESS, THAT'S GOING TO BE, TO ME, THE PROMISE OF THIS
25 NETWORK. FOR EXAMPLE, 80% OF RESIDENTS IN THE BAY AREA ARE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 WITHIN 15 MINUTES OF RAPID TRANSIT THAT COMES EVERY 15 MINUTES
2 THAT'S THE FUTURE OF CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING WE DON'T HAVE
3 AS A GUIDING STAR FOR THE REGION. THE QUESTION IS WHEN IS THE
4 PROCESS WHEN WE WOULD DEFINE THAT AS AN OBJECTIVE WOULD THAT
5 BE IN TASK ONE? OR DO WE HAVE TO WAIT UNTIL WE HAVE TO MAYBE
6 THREE DIFFERENT NETWORK CONCEPTS DIFFERENT POTENTIAL VISIONS
7 OUTCOMES THAT WE WOULD BE PICKING BETWEEN. THEN MY SECOND
8 QUESTION OR COMMENT REALLY IS, I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE
9 BUILDING IN THIS PROCESS THE ABILITY TO DROP OR REEVALUATE
10 PROJECTS THAT ARE REDUNDANT OR DUPLICATIVE BASED ON A BETTER
11 DEFINITION OF A NETWORK OR COMBINED FOR EXAMPLE, THERE HAS
12 BEEN A DISCUSSION ABOUT CALTRAIN -- SORRY -- I'M NOT PROPOSING
13 DROPPING THESE MAJOR PROJECTS BUT THE CALTRAIN DOWNTOWN
14 EXTENSION AND SECOND PHASE TWO HAVE BEEN TALKED ABOUT AS LONG-
15 TERM PROJECTS WHEN THEY'RE THE SAME PROJECT THAT WHOLE
16 CORRIDOR NEEDS TO BE THOUGHT OF TOGETHER SO, LIKE -- I'M NOT
17 ASKING YOU TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION BUT I'M HOPING IN THIS
18 PROCESS WE'RE ALLOWING OURSELVES TO SAY THAT HUB WHERE THEY
19 ALL COME TOGETHER IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO NEEDS TO BE
20 DESIGNED TO SUPPORT BOTH OF THESE PROJECTS AND WE'RE ACTUALLY
21 GOING TO REDEFINE THAT ENTIRE PROJECT AS ONE PROJECT.

22

23 **KARA VUICICH:** I DON'T HAVE THE ANSWER TOTAL DEFINED BUT IN
24 SEEKING FEEDBACK ON THIS I THINK WHAT WE ARE ENVISIONING IS
25 THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES MIGHT BE BROADER THEN GETTING INTO



MARCH 13, 2023

1 SOMETHING LIKE SPECIFICS, LIKE X PERCENTAGE OF HOUSEHOLDS
2 WITHIN A DISTANCE FROM THE 15 EMPTY NETWORK WOULD BE
3 POTENTIALLY DIFFERENTIATING DIFFERENT NETWORK CONCEPTS THAT'S
4 WHAT OUR INITIAL THINKING HAS BEEN, THAT LEVEL OF DETAIL MORE
5 AT THE NETWORK CONCEPT AND GOALS AND OBJECTIVES THAT WOULD BE
6 MORE POTENTIALLY MORE GENERALIZED, IN TERMS OF INITIAL
7 THOUGHTS AND DISCUSSIONS WITH THE OPERATORS WE'RE PARTNERING
8 WITH IS THE SAME KIND OF THING REALLY WANTING TO TAKE A CLOSE
9 HARD LOOK AT THE PROJECTS AND THINKING ABOUT PROJECTS A
10 COMPREHENSIVE NETWORK LEVEL APPROACH AS OPPOSED TO KIND OF
11 ASSEMBLING PROJECTS INTO STRATEGIES.

12
13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** IN TERMS OF THE 50 QUESTION THAT YOU WERE
14 RESPONDING TO, I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IN THAT GOLD STAGE
15 TO ACTUALLY COME OUT WITH A PROPOSED OUTCOME METRIC THAT IS
16 CAPABLE OF MEETING THE STATE AND REGIONAL CLIMATE GOALS THAT
17 WE HAVE. SO, WHAT IS OUR BEST GUESS? AT WHAT PERCENTAGE OF
18 PEOPLE NEED TO HAVE ACCESS TO RAPID TRANSIT IN ORDER TO
19 ACHIEVE THE MODE SHIFT THAT WE ARE STRIVING FOR? I THINK WE
20 COULD PROBABLY TAKE A STAB, AND MAYBE THERE IS SLIGHT TWEAKING
21 OF THAT AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS BUT IF WE LOOK AT
22 REGIONS THAT HAVE THE TRANSIT MODE SHARE THAT WE'RE ASPIRING
23 FOR AND THE LEVEL OF ACCESS ASSOCIATED WITH THAT AND LEVEL OF
24 SERVICE HOURS ASSOCIATED WITH THAT I THINK WE COULD PROBABLY
25 DEFINE SOME OF THOSE HIGH-LEVEL PARAMETERS VERY EARLY ON IN



MARCH 13, 2023

1 THE PROCESS AND IT'S KIND OF WHAT FLAVOR, WHAT WE'RE DRILLING
2 DOWN ON LATER IN THE PROCESS BUT WE'RE NOT CONSIDERING, WE'RE
3 IN THE RIGHT BALLPARK AT LEAST FOR OUTCOMES WOULD BE MY
4 FEEDBACK ON THAT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. IS THERE ANYBODY ELSE? BRIAN STANKE.

7

8 **BRIAN STANKE:** TO IAN'S COMMENTS, I WOULD DEFINITELY AGREE THAT
9 THE MEASURABLE OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT THE NETWORK TO PERFORM
10 REALLY ARE BEST SET UP EARLIER IN THE PROCESS, THE TASK ONE OR
11 TASK TWO AREA. IT'S, SORT OF, WHAT YOU WERE DISCUSSING, KARA,
12 YOU DON'T CREATE A HIGH PERFORMING NETWORK BY WORKING ON
13 PROJECTS IN ISOLATION THEN PICKING THE TOP TEN IT NEEDS THAT
14 NETWORK LEVEL PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT BASED ON ACHIEVING
15 CERTAIN OUTCOMES. SO THE FURTHER AHEAD WE GET THOSE OUTCOMES
16 WE KNOW WHAT OUR NETWORK SHOULD BE DOING, WHETHER THIS'S
17 PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE WITH ACCESS TO TRANSIT EVERY 19S OR A
18 PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE THAT HAS TRIP TIME TO JOB CENTERS WITHIN
19 A CERTAIN TIME FRAME THOSE ARE, SORT OF, MEASURABLE OUTCOMES
20 OF THE NETWORK THAT POINT US TO WHAT, SORT OF, NETWORK WE NEED
21 TO BUILD. SO, THAT -- WHERE THAT FITS IN TASK 1, 2 -- THROUGH
22 FIVE, WE JUST NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT ARE THOSE TASKS AS
23 THEY'RE BEING DONE ARE POINTING IN THAT DIRECTION AND
24 INFORMING US WHAT THOSE OUTCOMES ARE. BUT DEFINITELY EXCITING
25 WORK AHEAD. THANK YOU.



MARCH 13, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANYBODY ELSE IN THE ROOM WHO HASN'T SPOKEN
3 YET? OR ANYONE CALLING IN WHO HIS REQUESTS OR COMMENTS FOR
4 STAFF?

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS ON ZOOM WITH THEIR
7 HANDS RAISED.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO I WOULD LIKE TO PUT MYSELF IN THE STACK
10 AND THEN WE'LL TAKE SECOND BYTES AT THE APPLE. SO, ONE
11 QUESTION THAT I HAVE IN TERMS OF REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT IS,
12 DOES THAT INCLUDE BUSES OR MAYBE LIGHT RAIL SERVICES THAT ARE
13 -- THAT HAVE IMPORTANT CONNECTIONS TO REGIONAL SERVICES, FOR
14 EXAMPLE, I THINK ABOUT IF I'M ON, I'M AT DE ANZA COLLEGE AND
15 WANT TO GET TO SOME PLACE ON THE CALTRAIN LINE AND THE 523
16 INTERSECTS WITH CALTRAIN, WOULD THE 523 BE CONSIDERED A
17 REGIONAL NETWORK?

18

19 **KARA VUICICH:** PEOPLE THINK ABOUT BART AND CALTRAIN AND THE
20 IMPORTANT CONNECTING CLASSIFICATION OF LOCAL SERVICES THAT
21 CONNECT REGIONAL DESTINATIONS TO THAT REGIONAL NETWORK.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. FANTASTIC. BECAUSE THERE IS EXAMPLES
24 OF THAT, THAT ARE SEVERAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS THAT
25 THAT FUNDING FROM AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR SUSTAINABLE



MARCH 13, 2023

1 COMMUNITIES, FUNDING WHERE IT'S ON A BUS LINE AND THAT BUS
2 LINE CONNECTS TO A REGIONAL RAIL LINE AND BEING ABLE TO, IN A
3 TIME EFFECTIVE WAY, AND ALSO WITH FARE STRATEGY, FAIR
4 EFFECTIVE WAY, PROVIDING ABILITY TO PEOPLE IS REALLY
5 DELIVERING ON OUR GOALS. SO, THANKS I'M GLAD TO HEAR THOSE
6 KINDS OF THE 96 TO CALTRAIN MIGHT BE AN EXAMPLE. I'M NOT
7 ASKING ABOUT THAT SPECIFIC THING I'M ASKING FOR THIS CATEGORY
8 OF THE THING. THE, IN TERMS OF THE TIMELINE AND, LIKE, THE
9 SUMMER AND FALL TIMELINE, I HAVE THE SAME THOUGHT PROCESS AS
10 IN THE PREVIOUS AGENDA ITEM AS OUR REGION IS WORKING ON THE
11 FEEDBACK FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE, AND THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO BE
12 PUBLIC FEEDBACK AND, YOU KNOW, US STARTING TO PUT TOGETHER,
13 LIKE, PACKAGES OF INVESTMENTS THAT PUBLIC FEEDBACK IS SUPPOSED
14 TO BE ACCELERATING OVER THE SUMMER. SO, I WOULD HOPE THAT AND
15 WOULD WELCOME AN ANSWER, WHERE THE ANSWER IS YES THERE, IS
16 GOING TO BE SOME INFORMATION FROM THIS THAT WILL BE ABLE TO
17 FEED INTO THAT PUBLIC DISCUSSION ABOUT WHAT WE AS A REGIONAL WANT
18 TO GET FUNDED.

19
20 **KARA VUICICH:** ESSENTIALLY YES, WE ARE HAVING INITIAL
21 CONVERSATIONS ABOUT THAT BUT I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING -- DAVE
22 MIGHT MORE.

23
24 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE FINDING SYNERGIES IN ENGAGEMENT OPPORTUNITIES
25 RELATED TO THE BROADER PLANNED BAY AREA WHICH IS OF COURSE A



MARCH 13, 2023

1 BROADER TRANSIT TRANSPORTATION WORK, WE DON'T ANTICIPATE THE
2 ANALYTICAL WORK WOULD BE AVAILABLE AT THAT TIME WE THINK THIS
3 IS WORK THAT'S GOING TO TAKE A YEAR AND A HALF AND WE'RE
4 MOVING AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE WE ANTICIPATE THE WORK COMING
5 OUT OF THIS STUDY WILL BE AVAILABLE IN 2024 THAT'S WHERE WE'RE
6 WORKING TOWARDS IN TERMS OF REAL DEEP DIVE UNDERSTANDING OF
7 NETWORKS AND PROJECTS.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD HOPE THERE WOULD BE SOMETHING THAT
10 COULD BE AVAILABLE IN THE TIME FRAME FOR THAT OUTREACH OF A
11 REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE BECAUSE SOME OF THE WORK THAT'S BEING
12 DONE IN THIS PROJECT IS WHAT WOULD BE INTERESTING, MOTIVATING,
13 MEANINGFUL, AND VALUABLE TO PEOPLE GIVING BACK TO WHAT WOULD
14 BE FUNDED. WHILE I UNDERSTAND IT'S AN ITERATIVE PROCESS AND
15 THERE ARE DETAILED THINGS THAT YOU WILL NOT HAVE AVAILABLE, I
16 THINK THAT BEING ABLE TO BE DISCUSS SOMETHING AT SOME LEVEL
17 WILL RESULT IN A MUCH MORE MEANINGFUL CONVERSATION WITH
18 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ABOUT WHAT THEY ARE INTERESTED IN SEE
19 SUGGEST FUNDED. IN TERMS OF THE STAFFING OF THE PROJECT IT WAS
20 EXCITING TO SEE THERE IS GOING TO BE JOINT MTC AND TRANSIT
21 AGENCY STAFF INCLUDING STAFF ON THIS PROJECT COULD YOU PROVIDE
22 UPDATE ON STAFFING?

23

24 **KARA VUICICH:** I DO HAVE -- I DO NOT HAVE DEFINITIVE TIMELINE
25 FOR THE TRANSIT PROJECT MANAGER AND I THINK YOU'RE REFERRING



MARCH 13, 2023

1 TO THE MTC PROJECT MANAGER THERE'S ALSO A TRANSIT
2 REPRESENTATIVE COPROJECT MANAGER SIMILAR TO WHATEVER DONE WITH
3 THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY, AC TRANSIT IN THE
4 PROCESS OF HIRING THAT PERSON I THINK THEY'RE CLOSE BUT I
5 DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC START DATE.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I DID NOT SEE IN THE MEMO HOUSING AND
8 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TRANSIT AND HOUSING IS BAKED INTO OUR
9 REGIONAL POLICIES AS WELL AS BAKED INTO SOME OF OUR STATE
10 POLICIES TOO. SO, I AM WONDERING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WHETHER, AND
11 HOW, PROVIDING FREQUENT AND HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT, THE -- LIKE,
12 HOW HOUSING GOALS AND METRICS WILL BE ASSESSED IN THIS PROJECT
13 GIVEN THAT A LOT OF OUR HOUSING POLICY OUTCOMES ARE KEY TO
14 TRANSIT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I IT TAKE THIS, TO PROVIDE MORE CLARITY BETWEEN THE
17 CONNECTION TO TRANSIT 2050 PLUS AND THE BROADER PLANNED BAY
18 AREA 2050 PLUS THE DECISIONS THAT GET MADE THROUGH TRANSIT 50
19 PLUS WILL INFLUENCE THE LAND USE PATTERN IN PLANNED BAY AREA
20 2050 PLUS. FOR EXAMPLE, NEW, YOU KNOW, BUS PRIORITY FEATURES
21 WITH MORE FREQUENCY THAT COULD CREATE NEW GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES
22 THROUGH TRANSIT-RICH AREAS IN THE BROADER PLAN. AT THE SAME
23 TIME, WE EXPECT THE FISCAL REALLY TO BE BLEAKER IN THIS
24 ITERATION AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS IF PROJECTS ARE
25 REMOVED INVESTMENTS ARE PRIORITIZED THAT RESULTS IN GEOGRAPHY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 LOCATIONS BEING REMOVED AND MIGHT RESULT IN A SHIFT IN TERMS
2 OF WHERE GROWTH OCCURS IN THE BAY AREA.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO THAT IS THE CONCLUSION, AND I GUESS
5 WHAT I WOULD WANT TO BE SEEING IS IN A DISCUSSION OF WHAT THE
6 METRICS ARE TO BE LOOKING AT METRICS AND OUTCOMES RELATING TO
7 ACHIEVING GOALS FOR RELATING TO HOUSING AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING
8 AND BEING AUDIBLE TO ASSESS THE CONSEQUENCES FOR HOUSING ARE
9 THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT CHOICES THAT ARE BEING EVALUATED. AND
10 GIVEN THE CALCULATION IS GOING TO BE GIVEN AS PART OF PLANNED
11 BAY AREA, I WOULD HOPE IT'S THE BENEFIT OF DOING THIS PART OF
12 PLANNED BAY AREA AND WOULD BE GOOD TO BE MAKING TRANSPARENT AS
13 PART OF THE PROCESS. OKAY. IS THAT A YES THAT MAKES LOGICAL
14 SENSE?

15

16 **KARA VUICICH:** YES THAT MAKES LOGICAL SENSE THAT'S ONE OF THE
17 THINGS WE WOULD LOOK AT AS PART OF THE -- AND DAVE CORRECT ME
18 IF I AM WRONG, COME INTO PLAY AS PART OF BOTH THE PROJECT
19 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT
20 BECAUSE IT'S PART OF THE REGIONAL MODEL LOOKING AT WHERE THE
21 COMBINATION OR INTERPLAY BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS
22 AND TRANSIT INVESTMENTS PARTICULARLY THEN WHERE YOU KNOW BASED
23 ON OUR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN WHERE WE'RE EXPECTING FUTURE
24 HOUSING TO GO AND WHAT IMPLICATIONS ARE IN TERMS OF DIFFERENT
25 COST BURDENS ASSOCIATED WITH THE TYPES OF MODELS. I HEAR YOUR



MARCH 13, 2023

1 COMMENT CLEAR IN TERMS OF MAYBE THAT MUCH MORE CLEAR AND
2 TRANSPARENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IN TERMS OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND
5 STAKEHOLDERS INTERESTED IN THIS MAKING THAT EXPLICIT AND
6 HELPING WITH FEEDBACK AND PEOPLE UNDERSTANDING THE OUTCOMES OF
7 DIFFERENT CHOICES. OKAY. IS THERE ANYONE -- IS THERE ANYBODY
8 YET ON THE PHONE OR ANY SECOND ROUND HERE? I SEE THAT.

9

10 **GERRY GLASER:** HAS A HAND UP.

11

12 **GERRY GLASER:** I SHOULD LEARN TO GO LAST. I HAVE WORKED ON
13 GENERAL PLANS IN THE SOUTH BAY MULTIPLE TIMES AND DAVE COMMENT
14 IS RIGHT ON. FORTUNATELY WITH THE ROADWAYS, BUT THE ROADWAY
15 AND HOUSING SHOWS UP HOPEFULLY SAME THING WILL OCCUR WITH
16 TRANSIT. IAN SAID SOMETHING AND BRIAN LEVERAGE THAT AND IT
17 CRYSTALIZED SOMETHING FOR ME ABOUT THE PLAN ITSELF. IAN
18 MENTIONED HUBS. IDENTIFY THE HUBS. ONE OF THE THINGS I HAVE
19 LEARNED AS I START COMING TO MEETINGS AND TAKING TRANSIT. EACH
20 ONE OF THESE TRANSIT DISTRICTS THINKS THERE A HUB IN A
21 DIFFERENT PLACE IF YOU TRAVEL ON ONE THEY TAKE YOU TO THEIR
22 HUB WHICH PROBABLY IS NOT HUB FOR THE NEXT ONE YOU WANT TO GET
23 ON THERE'S A FEW EXCEPTIONS BUT IN MOST CASES PART OF THE
24 STUDY IN OF IDENTIFYING THE HUBS IDENTIFY WHERE THE HUBS
25 SHOULD BE. IN THE CASE OF LAND USE IN THE DESIGN OF THE CITY



MARCH 13, 2023

1 OF SUNNYVALE, THE LAND USE SAID WE WANT YOUR DAILY NEEDS TO BE
2 SATISFIED WITHIN ONE QUARTER A MILE FROM ANY HOME. YOU'RE
3 HEARING IT FROM A NUMBER OF FOLKS UP HERE, IF YOU HAVE THE
4 METRICS TO START WITH, AND THEY CAN BE VERY GENERAL, JUST PUT
5 THEM FORWARD, BRING THEM TO VARIOUS GROUPS AND SAY IS THAT THE
6 RIGHT METRIC. BECAUSE YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT THE GAPS ARE UNTIL
7 YOU KNOW WHAT THE METRICS ARE, BECAUSE THE METRICS ESTABLISH
8 WHERE THE GAPS ARE AND MAKES THE ANALYSIS EASIER TO DO, SAYING
9 GERRY'S TRAIN DOESN'T MAKE IT GERRY'S BUS. BUT INSTEAD OF
10 METRIC SAYS I SHOULD BE ABLE TO DO CERTAIN THINGS; I CANT. A
11 PERCENTAGE OF THE POPULATION CAN'T DO IT. YOU'RE NOT GOING TO
12 STOP THE SEBASTOPOL PROBLEM. WITH HIGHER DENSITY POPULATION
13 AND JOBS. WHAT YOU SAID IS IMPORTANT AND GOES CENTRAL TO THE
14 PLAN, WHICH IS IDENTIFY WITH THE METRICS SHOULD BE THEN
15 IDENTIFY WHAT THE GAPS ARE, BECAUSE YOU WANT TO IDENTIFY THE
16 GAPS AGAINST THE METRICS THAT WE AGREED THAT WE WANT TO V AND
17 I'M GOING TO THROW ONE OTHER THING IN BECAUSE I KEPT
18 MENTIONING IT IN EVERY MEETING. YOU TALKED ABOUT EXPRESS
19 BUSES. THAT THOUGHT WAS FOR ME, AN EPIPHANY, WHY DO EXPRESS
20 LANES TURN OFF AT SPECIFIC TIMES OF THE DAY, WHY DON'T WE RUN
21 BUSES DOWN THE EXPRESS LANES ON THE HIGHWAYS THAT WOULD BE ONE
22 OF THE THINGS WE'RE LOOKING AT AS WELL, MAKES LOGICAL SENSE
23 YOU DON'T NEED THEM DURING THE REST OF THE DAY. BUT, THANK YOU
24 GUYS, GREAT THOUGHTS.
25



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AND BUILDING ON THAT, I THINK THAT PARIS
2 WAS DOING A MAJOR NETWORK UPGRADE AND BUILD-OUT, AND THEY HAD
3 ONE OF THEIR GOALS, I THINK IT WAS NUMBER OF JOBS THAT WERE
4 ACCESSIBLE FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, AND THAT WAS AN EXPLICIT
5 GOAL OF VAULTING THEIR NETWORK OPTIONS. EVALUATING THEIR
6 NETWORK OPTION. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM PEOPLE IN
7 THE ROOM, FROM PEOPLE ON THE PHONE AND OVER ZOOM BEFORE WE
8 CLOSE OUT THIS ITEM?

9

10 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SORRY. I'M TRY TO KEEP MY THING THIS ONE ROUND
11 IN THE FUTURE. YOU MENTIONED CONSULTANT WAS GOING TO BE ON-
12 BOARDED AT SOME POINT. WHAT -- YOU CAN SHARE ANYTHING ABOUT,
13 IS THAT WHERE WE ARE IN THE PROCESS OF THAT RIGHT NOW? AND
14 I'LL JUST ADD, IN ADDITION TO THAT QUESTION, THE -- SORT OF,
15 MY THOUGHT, IF IT'S NOT ALREADY TOO LATE, THAT WE SHOULD BE
16 LOOKING FOR I THINK INTERNATIONAL EXPERTISE IN THIS AREA
17 BECAUSE THIS IS GOT A COMMON -- THIS HAS BEEN DONE BEFORE IN
18 THE U.S., AND SOME REGIONS, BUT IT'S FAR MORE COMMON IN OTHER
19 PARTS OF THE WORLD. SO JUST AN IMPORTANT -- SOMEONE WHO HAS
20 DONE THIS SOMEWHERE ELSE I THINK IS AN IMPORTANT CRITERIA,
21 DOMESTICALLY OR INTERNATIONALLY.

22

23 **KARA VUICICH:** THANK YOU FOR THE FEEDBACK. WE'RE HOPING TO GET
24 THE RFQ OUT WEAPON THE NEXT COUPLE OF WEEKS. WE'RE CLOSE.



MARCH 13, 2023

1 [LAUGHTER] YEAH. TRYING TO MOVE FORWARD ON THAT AS QUICKLY AS
2 WE CAN.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. AND THAT BRINGS US TO --

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. JUST A BRIEF COMMENT ON SOMETHING I NOTICED.

7 PEOPLE WHO PRESENTED TO THE MTC PACKAGE ABOUT THE CONGESTION

8 PRICING OUTREACH WAS THEY FOUND, ONE OF THE LESSONS THEY

9 SHARED WITH US, IS IN THEIR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PROCESS THEY

10 MADE SURE TO EDUCATE PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS. SO AS YOU

11 SELECTED YOUR CONSULTANTS TO DO THE OUTREACH WORK, WHICH I

12 ASSUME YOU WILL HIRE A CONSULTANT, THAT YOU ADD TO THE

13 SCOPE OF WORK THEY'RE ALSO DOING EDUCATION WITHIN THEIR

14 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT THAT THEY ARE TAKING TIME TO EDUCATE THE

15 PUBLIC AND BRING THEM ALONG. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I'M HOPING THAT BECAUSE OF THE TRANSIT

18 AGENCY STAFFING THAT SOME OF THAT PUBLIC OUTREACH WILL BE DONE

19 IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES SO THAT THERE ARE

20 THINGS IN LIKE ALAMEDA COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY THERE IS

21 A VTA PRESENCE AT AC TRANSIT PRESENCE THAT HAS LIKE, YOU KNOW

22 ONE PLAN WITH THAT AGENCY I THINK THAT WILL REALLY HELP WITH

23 THAT PUBLIC OUTREACH AND HELP WITH THE COMMUNITY MEMBERS

24 UNDERSTANDING THAT'S SOMETHING THAT RELATES TO ME IT'S NOT

25 SOMETHING ABSTRACT LIKE THING IN THE SKY THEN 30 YEARS FROM



MARCH 13, 2023

1 NOW BUT SOMETHING THAT MIGHT AFFECT MY BUS SERVICE. THANK YOU.
2 ANYBODY ELSE FROM THE ISLAND? OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO
3 KARA AND STAFF IN THIS. WHILE THE FINANCIAL CONDITIONS ARE
4 CHILLY, HAVING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN THAT PEOPLE CAN SEE
5 HOW THIS BENEFITS THEIR LIFE AND HOW IT WILL INCREASE ACCESS
6 AND CONVENIENCE IS SOMETHING THAT HAS THE POTENTIAL TO DELIVER
7 A LOT OF REALLY CLEAR BENEFITS FOR PEOPLE, AND DELIVER CLEAR
8 BENEFITS TO PEOPLE IN A WAY THAT IS JUST REALLY POWERFUL FOR
9 PEOPLE TO UNDERSTAND, PODIUM FOR PEOPLE TO SUPPORT AND
10 POWERFUL FOR THE DECISION MAKERS TO SUPPORT. THANK YOU VERY
11 MUCH FOR WORKING ON THIS. MOVING ON TO THE CLOSE OUT ITEMS IN
12 THIS AGENDA. THE NEXT ITEM IS AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX NEW
13 BUSINESS. MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE CAN BRING UP NEW
14 BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR IN ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA.
15 ANYONE OTHER THAN ME HAVE ITEMS? WARREN?

16

17 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YEAH, JUST -- I'M -- I AM NOT CLEAR AS TO
18 WHERE WE ARE WITH THE WHOLE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PIECE AND ALSO
19 WITH THE FUNDING MEASURE PIECE. IF I COULD GET A SENSE OF HOW
20 THOSE ARE COMING UP, WHEN THOSE ARE COMING UP AND WHERE WE ARE
21 WITH SOME OF IT. I MISSED SOME OF THE PIECES ON THAT IF I
22 COULD GET SOME CLARITY BOTH TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PIECE
23 AND THE PIECE OF -- ON THE TRANSIT MEASURES. THANK YOU.

24



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE, SINCE
2 THERE ARE THINGS THAT ARE WRITTEN DOWN, IF THAT CAN BE
3 CIRCULATED? YEAH. RESPONSES WELCOME, ALSO.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** IF I MAY ANSWER THE QUESTION.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SURE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** ON THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE WE DO
10 ANTICIPATE COMING BACK TO THIS GROUP, I THINK IF THE MONTH OF
11 MAY IS OUR CURRENT TIME FRAME FOR THAT. MAY, JUNE TIME FRAME,
12 I DON'T KNOW IF MELODY WANTED TO ADD ANYTHING ON THE NETWORK
13 MANAGEMENT SIDE.

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** CURRENTLY ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PROCESS OF
16 TRYING TO SCHEDULE OUT WHEN WE PLAN TO COME TO THE COMMISSION
17 THEN ALSO COME BACK FOR FUTURE MEETING MIGHT BE COINCIDING
18 WITH THE MAIN MEETING THAT WE WOULD BRING AN UPDATE.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. I'M SURE THAT YOU CAUGHT THE
21 REQUEST ABOUT THE MOBILITY AS A SERVICE AND POTENTIAL IN THE
22 LONGER TERM TO INCLUDE OTHER MODES IN ADDITION TO THE FIXED
23 ROUTE TRANSIT FOR SOMEWHERE IN THE QUEUE FOR FUTURE TOPICS, ON
24 THE OTHER THING RAISED THE IDEA THAT WE COULD HAVE FREE AND
25 REDUCED COST TRANSFERS THAT IMPLODES BECAUSE AN AGENCY DOESN'T



MARCH 13, 2023

1 WANT TO. IT'S UNHELPFUL IN TERMS OF INTEGRATED AFFORDABLE
2 FARES AND MOBILITY. THAT WAS MENTIONED AS NEXT STEPS. AN
3 UPDATE WOULD BE WELCOME. IN LOGISTICS AND OVERALL CHALLENGES
4 OF HAVING PEOPLE PARTICIPATE UNDER THE RESTORED AND NEW BROWN
5 ACT RULES, I KNOW THAT THERE ARE SOME LAWS, BILLS IN THE STATE
6 LEGISLATURE TO POTENTIALLY MAKE IT MORE CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE
7 ON ADVISORY BODIES TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY, AND MTC IS
8 CONSIDERING SUCH LEGISLATION AND AS A GROUP THAT IS IMPACTED
9 BY THE CURRENT INCONVENIENT AND DIFFICULT TO USE RULES WOULD
10 LOVE ANY UPDATES AS THEY'RE COMING FORWARD AND I THINK IT'S
11 PROBABLY OVERKILL FOR THIS BODY TO FORMALLY STATE THAT WE
12 WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT, BUT, PLEASE TAKE THAT FEEDBACK. ANY
13 OTHER NEW BUSINESS?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** JUST TO ADD TO THAT, A COMMENT, WHICH IS THAT I THINK
16 -- AND THAT, YOU KNOW, I KNOW THERE IS CERTAIN -- IN TERMS OF
17 -- I -- I THINK THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT IN TIME
18 INVOLVED IN BEING PART OF THIS, WHICH IS GREAT. YOU KNOW, I'M
19 HAPPY TO DO, BUT, YOU KNOW, ESPECIALLY NOW WITH THE NEED TO GO
20 TO EITHER PUBLIC LOCATION OR TO COME HERE, THAT ADDS
21 ADDITIONAL TIME, YOU KNOW, I THINK -- I THINK -- AND
22 CONSIDERING THIS IS THE FORUM THAT HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED AS THE
23 NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE AS THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER
24 COMMITTEE I BELIEVE I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S BEEN FORMALLY RENAMED
25 IT'S IMPORTANT WE'RE DELIVERING ON THE TRANSFORMATION I THINK



MARCH 13, 2023

1 IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE TO CONSIDER COMPENSATION FOR THE
2 PARTICIPANTS OF THIS COMMITTEE I KNOW SOME PEOPLE ARE ALREADY
3 RECEIVING COMPENSATION AS THEY PARTICIPATE IN THE ADVISORY
4 GROUP NOT ALL OF THOSE PEOPLE ANYWAY, SOMETHING TO CONSIDER,
5 IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE GIVEN HOW MANY ADDITIONAL -- FARE
6 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WAS SET UP TRANSFORMED AND EVOLVED MANY
7 GO THROUGH THE EFFORT SHOW UP, SO THAT THEY AT LEAST FEEL
8 COMPENSATED FOR THE TIME THEY'RE PUTTING IN.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WILL CHIME IN AND AGREE WITH THAT.
11 FEEDBACK I HEARD WITH THE DISCUSSION ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT
12 AND BUILDING ON THIS COMMITTEE IS MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE
13 DIVERSITY OF REPRESENTATION AND HAVING STIPENDS TO PARTICIPATE
14 DOES HELP WITH THE DIVERSITY FOR PEOPLE THAT DO NEED THAT
15 STIPEND SUPPORT IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE. ANYTHING
16 ELSE? ANYTHING ELSE? INCLUDING PEOPLE ON THE PHONE OR PEOPLE
17 ON THE LINE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC OR MEMBERS OF THE BODY.
18 WARREN GO AHEAD.

19

20 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** ARE WE NOT HAVING -- [INDISCERNIBLE] MEETINGS.
21 WHAT ARE WE DOING WITH THAT? I WANT -- I'M NOT CLEAR WHAT
22 WE'RE DOING.

23



MARCH 13, 2023

1 **MELANIE CHOY:** MELANIE CHOY WITH MTC. WE'RE CURRENTLY LOOKING
2 AT THE SCHEDULE AND WE'LL GET BACK TO YOU WHETHER OR NOT THERE
3 WILL BE ANY FULL MEETINGS. WE'RE STILL LOOKING INTO THAT.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SEEING PEOPLE PAC UP IS THERE ANY REMOTE
6 COMMENT ON HERE BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENTS AND OTHER
7 BUSINESS.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
11 ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON
14 ITEMS THAT ARE NOT ON THIS AGENDA?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND
17 RECEIVED UNDER AGENDA ITEM SEVEN GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO
18 MEMBERS OF THE ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO ONE IN
19 THE BOARD.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WE'LL MOVE TO NUMBER 8, ADJOURNMENT. THE
22 NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD AT A
23 TIME TO BE DULY NOTICED. SO, WE DO LOOK FORWARD TO INFORMATION
24 ABOUT WHEN OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE AND WHAT THE TOPICS WILL
25 BE FOR CONSIDERATION AT THAT TIME. THANKS EVERYBODY AND THANKS



MARCH 13, 2023

1 PARTICULARLY TO STAFF AND EVERYONE FOR PUTTING UP WITH OUR
2 RENEWED AND NEWLY COMPLICATED BROWN ACT LIFE. [ADJOURNED]
3
4
5



Broadcasting Government