

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION 1 BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE 2 THURSDAY, JANUARY 12, 2023 1:00 PM 3 4 5 6 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MEETING TO ORDER, TEMPORARY SERVING IN 7 PLACE OF CHAIR PEDROZA. I'LL CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER OF THE 8 9 JOINT MEETING OF THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE. 10 11 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: CAN WE PLEASE PLACE THE COVID 12 ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE 13 14 TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS 15 16 CERTAIN REOUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. AND ABAG WEB SITES. THE CHAIR WILL 17 CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER 18 19 SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE 20 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS 21 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO 22 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION 23 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE 24 25 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE

> APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON 1 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED 2 3 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC 4 5 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED 6 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF 7 8 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL 9 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE 10 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD 11 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE 12 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP 13 14 TO DATE.

JANUARY 12, 2023

15

16 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO DUTIFULLY
17 GOING TO HAND IT OVER TO CHAIR PEDROZA OF THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT
18 COMMITTEE.

19

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU. AND I APOLOGIZE NOT BEING
ABLE TO PARTICIPATE WITH MY SCREEN ON. I'M GOING TO ASK
COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA TO TAKE OVER THE MEETING, PLEASE?
COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

JANUARY 12, 2023

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: ACTUALLY, I THINK IT MAY BE ME. 1 I'M SUPPOSED TO DO THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE. I'LL ASK, WILL 2 3 THE CLERK OF THE BOARD, PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL FOR THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE? 4 5 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, SIR. THIS IS THE ROLL CALL FOR 6 7 ATTENDANCE FOR THE HOUSING COMMITTEE, ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE. 8 MAYOR ARREGUIN? 9 10 JESSE ARREGUIN: PRESENT. 11 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO BAS? IS ABSENT. 12 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND? 13 14 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT. 15 16 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR? 17 18 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: HERE. 19 20 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR RAMOS? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER 21 22 ROMERO? 23 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: PRESENT. 24 25



```
CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR RABBIT? IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS
1
2
    PRESENT WITH FOUR MEMBERS.
3
    CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. MARGARET, IT'S ALL YOURS. I
4
5
    PROMISE TO SHUT UP. I'M SORRY.
6
   MARGARET ABE-KOGA: WILL THE SECRETARY PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL
7
8
    AND CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS PRESENT.
9
10
    CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COMMISSIONER PEDROZA TO BE DEPUTIZED?
11
   ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: YES.
12
13
    CLERK, FRED CASTRO: ABE-KOGA?
14
15
16
   MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
17
    CLERK, FRED CASTRO: GLOVER IS ABSENT. RABBIT IS ABSENT. RONEN?
18
19
    IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR PEDROZA?
20
21
   ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: HERE. DIRECTOR JOSEFOWITZ? WE HAVE TWO
22
   MEMBERS. A QUORUM IS NOT PRESENT FOR THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT
23
    COMMITTEE.
24
   MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU.
25
```

JANUARY 12, 2023

1 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: MARTHA THIS IS ALFREDO, I BELIEVE 2 3 COMMISSIONER -- MIGHT BE IN THE BUILDING. 4 5 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: KATHLEEN, IF YOU COULD GIVE US SOME 6 GUIDANCE? 7 8 KATHLEEN KANE: I WOULD SUGGEST WE PROCEED WITH THE ABAG SIDE OF THE HOUSE WHILE WE'RE TRYING TO COMPLETE OUR OUORUM ON THE 9 BAHFA PORTION. IF WE COULD TAKE THINGS IN THAT ORDER, FRED, 10 FOR [INDISCERNIBLE] PURPOSES, THAT WOULD WORK. 11 12 13 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES. CHAIR ROMERO? 14 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES. WILL THE CLERK NOW PLEASE 15 16 GIVE THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, 17 PLEASE? 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, SIR. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG 20 BOARD IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE 21 22 PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$150 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK 23 YOU. 24

25



CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. MARGARET, I'LL HAND IT BACK 1 2 OVER TO YOU. 3 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: CHAIR, ROMERO IF WE CAN CONTINUE THE 4 5 ACTION ON ABAG ON ITEM 2, WE CAN COME BACK? 6 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: WE'LL DO THAT. ITEM TWO IS AN ABAG 7 8 HOUSING COMMITTEE ELECTION OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR ITEM. PRESENTLY, I AM CHAIR AND NEYSA FLIGOR ARE VICE CHAIR. -- IS 9 THE VICE CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE. THESE ARE ONE-YEAR TERMS. AND 10 IS THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO -- WELL, I SHOULD SAY, THE 11 FLOOR IS OPEN FOR NOMINATIONS, FIRST OF ALL, AND THEN, ARE 12 THERE ANY NOMINATIONS FROM YOU ALL FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 13 14 FOR THIS YEAR? 15 16 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: CHAIR ROMERO, I SEE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN 17 WITH HIS HAND RAISED. 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. YES, RECOGNIZE YOU, SIR. 19 20 JESSE ARREGUIN: THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR 21 22 LEADERSHIP OVER THIS PAST YEAR AND THAT OF COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR, SO I WAS GOING TO TAKE LIBERTY TO MAKE A MOTION TO 23 RENOMINATE AS CHAIR OF THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE, 24



COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO AS CHAIR, AND COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR AS 1 2 VICE CHAIR FOR THE COUNCIL FOR 2023? IF YOU ACCEPT. 3 PAT ECKLUND: I'LL SECOND THE MOTION. 4 5 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: I SEE, AND THE IMPLIED NODDING OF 6 7 HER HEAD FROM NEYSA. 8 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: THANK YOU. 9 10 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU. 11 12 JESSE ARREGUIN: IS IT ME? OR DID CARLOS'S VIDEO FREEZE? 13 14 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: IT LOOKS LIKE CHAIR ROMERO'S SCREEN HAS 15 16 FROZEN. IF WE GIVE HIM A MOMENT MAYBE HE'LL COME BACK ON. IF I CAN ASK KATHLEEN KANE COUNSEL, IF I COULD ASK VICE CHAIR 17 FLIGOR TO TAKE OVER? 18 19 KATHLEEN KANE: I WAS GOING TO MENTION BAD TIMING, AND IF VICE 20 21 CHAIR FLIGOR COULD TAKE OVER. 22 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: I THINK WE HAVE A MOTION MADE BY 23 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN AND SECOND BY COMMISSIONER EKLUND. FRED DO 24 25 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

JANUARY 12, 2023

JANUARY 12, 2023

1 2 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. 4 5 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: THANK YOU. SO, I'LL BRING IT 6 BACK TO THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE TO SEE IF WE HAVE ANY 7 8 FURTHER QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION? IF NOT, I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE VOTE. I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS, FRED, SO LET'S GO AHEAD 9 AND CALL THE VOTE. 10 11 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MOTION BY ARREGUIN, SECOND BY EKLUND FOR 12 CHAIR ROMERO VICE CHAIR FLIGOR? MAYOR ARREGUIN? 13 14 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES [INDISCERNIBLE] IS ABSENT. FLIGOR? 15 16 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: YES. 17 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: RAMOS? ABSENT. ROMERO? 20 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES. FORGIVE MY TECHNICAL 21 22 DIFFICULTIES. 23 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MOTION PASSES WITH FOUR AYES. 24 25



1

JANUARY 12, 2023

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: AM I STILL CHAIRING FOR THE BAHFA

2 SIDE OF THE HOUSE? 3 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I THINK WE SHOULD CONTINUE ABAG UNTIL WE 4 5 CAN CONFIRM QUORUM FOR THE OTHER SIDE. 6 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: SHOULD WE MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT? 7 8 IS CONSIDERED GENERAL? FRED, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM, IF THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS THE 9 BOARD ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA, PLEASE NOW INFORM US IF 10 ANYONE IN THE PUBLIC IS INTERESTED IN ADDRESSING US? 11 12 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED 13 FOR THIS ITEM THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE ATTENDEES WITH A HAND 14 15 RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. IF YOU WILL GIVE ME A MOMENT, I 16 WILL SHARE THE TIMER. OUR SPEAKER WILL BE ANTHONY CARROSCO. PLEASE GO AHEAD. 17 18 SPEAKER: HI THERE. MY NAME IS ANTHONY CARROSCO, I AM A 19 RESEARCHER OVER AT BERKELEY LAW, AND WHEN I'M NOT SERVING ON 20 21 THE REGIONAL IMPACT COUNCIL FOR ALL HOME, I KNOW, YOU KNOW, WAS VERY HONORED TO HELP BE A PART OF THE CONSTRUCTION EQUITY 22 METRIC, AND I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK. AND AS FAR 23 AS GETTING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING ONLINE. AND I JUST WANTED 24 TO PROMOTE TO YOU SOME READING. THERE IS A BOOK THAT JUST CAME 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

OUT OF UC PRESS CALLED HOMELESSNESS IS A HOUSING PROBLEM. AND 1 I'LL SAVE YOU 230 PAGES OF READING BY TELLING YOU WHAT THE 2 BOOK FOUND, WHICH IS THAT WHEN YOU LOOK AT HOMELESSNESS RATES 3 ACROSS EVERY MAJOR CITY IN AMERICA, AND ALSO THE SMALL CITIES 4 5 TOO, AND SMALL TOWNS, THE ONLY WAY TO EMPIRICALLY UNDERSTAND AND PREDICT VARIANCE ACROSS THESE MUNICIPALITIES WHEN IT COMES 6 TO HOMELESSNESS RATES IS HOW MUCH AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS THERE 7 8 IN THESE VARIOUS CITIES. IT'S THE ONLY WAY TO PREDICT IT. AND IF I COULD USE MY CAM REMARKS I WOULD SHOW YOU A GRAPH THAT 9 Shows that generosity welfare benefits has a 0.01 $\ensuremath{\$}$ 10 CORRELATION, WHICH IS BASICALLY NOTHING. SO, THE MORE WELFARE 11 BENEFITS A CITY GIVES DOES NOT BRING MORE PEOPLE SEEKING THAT 12 WELFARE, ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES TO PEOPLE SEEKING SECURE 13 HOUSING. ANYWAY, IT'S A VERY GOOD BOOK. IT JUST CAME OUT IN 14 15 2022, BY GREG COLBURN, SO I STRONGLY RECOMMEND IT. THANK YOU 16 FOR YOUR WORK, I APPRECIATE YOUR CONSIDERATION AND METRIC. THE 17 QUESTION IS, REALLY HOW MUCH HOMELESSNESS DO YOU WANT TO REDUCE? BECAUSE YOU'RE ON THE RIGHT TRACK, IF YOU WANT TO USE 18 THE METRIC, YOU'RE ON THE RIGHT TRACK, SO THE QUESTION IS HOW 19 MUCH IMPACT YOU WANT TO MAKE. THANK YOU. 20

21

22 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU.

23

24 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO OTHER ATTENDEES WITH PUBLIC
25 COMMENT. SO I WILL STOP SHARING MY SCREEN.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 12, 2023

1 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 2 3 INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH, THIS IS NOT A VERY LENGTHY OPINION PIECE OR ARTICLE IN THE -- IT WAS THE ATLANTIC, ACTUALLY, THIS 4 5 MONTH, THAT DISCUSSED THE EXACT SAME ITEM, IN A VERY SUCCINCT WAY. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. CARROSCO. MOVING TO ITEM FOUR, 6 COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. 7 8 THERE ARE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM ANY MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? 9 JESSE ARREGUIN: MR. CHAIR, I HAVE AN ANNOUNCEMENT TO MAKE. 10 11 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES? PLEASE. 12 13 JESSE ARREGUIN: GIVEN RETIREMENTS THERE ARE SEVERAL VACANCIES 14 15 ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE THAT WE WILL BE FILLING OVER THE 16 NEXT FEW MONTHS I WANT TO ANNOUNCE THAT HOPEFULLY TONIGHT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL BE APPOINTING OAKLAND CITY 17 COUNCILMEMBER CAROL FIVE TO SERVE ON THE COUNCIL, SHE WAS VERY 18 ACTIVE ON THE HOUSING MOVEMENT AND WILL BRING A LOT OF 19 EXPERIENCE AND APRIL TO THE WORK WE'RE DOING AND BRING OTHER 20 21 APPOINTMENTS AS WELL IN THE COMING WEEKS. 22 23 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU MAYOR ARREGUIN. I'M

25 ENOUGH BANDWIDTH HERE. I DID NOT HEAR THE FULL ANNOUNCEMENT,

GOING TO TURN OFF MY VIDEO. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK I HAVE

11

JANUARY 12, 2023

BUT I THINK THE REST OF THE BODY HAS. SO, FOR THE GOOD OF THE
ORDER, ARE THERE ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS THAT HAVE ANY
REPORTS? OR ANYTHING TO ADD? THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS
OF THE PUBLIC, AT THIS POINT IN TIME, THAT WISH TO GIVE PUBLIC
COMMENT AT THIS TIME?

6

7 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
8 THIS TIME, COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS AND I SEE NO HAND
9 RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME. THANK YOU.

10

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO TURN OFF 11 MY VIDEO HERE. SO, WITH THAT, WE ARE NOW AT THE CHAIR'S 12 REPORT. ITEM -- THIS IS AN ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE AND BAHFA 13 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE'S CHAIR REPORT. THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR 14 15 EITHER CHAIR TO PROVIDE SOME PERSPECTIVE ON HOUSING ACTIVITIES 16 OVER THE LAST MONTH. I MERELY WANTED TO MENTION, QUITE 17 IMPORTANTLY, THAT WE SHOULD ALL REMEMBER THAT HOUSING ELEMENTS ARE DUE AT THE END OF THIS MONTH. I KNOW ABAG HAS BEEN 18 PREPARING ITS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WITH AN IMPRESSIVE ARRAY OF 19 RESOURCES, AS WELL AS CONSULTANT BENCH. WE'RE VERY MUCH HOPING 20 THAT ALL OF OUR 101 CITIES GET THESE ELEMENTS IN ON TIME. AND 21 I THINK MOST OF US ARE RECEIVING RESPONSES, SO THAT INDEED WE 22 CAN AVOID ANY OF THE PENALTIES THAT MIGHT BE AFFLICTING 23 COMMUNITIES THAT DO NOT SUBMIT THESE ON TIME. SO, JUST 24 REMINDING US ALL THAT, ONE, THERE IS GREAT WORK THAT'S BEEN 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

DONE ON THE ABAG AND MTC HOUSING SIDE, AND HOPEFULLY ALL OF US HAVE AVAILED OURSELVES GET THOSE HOUSING ELEMENTS IN ON TIME AND AVOID SOME OF THE REPERCUSSIONS FOR NOT DOING SO, AND POSSIBLE POSSIBILITY OF A BUILDERS REMEDY. WITH THAT, IT'S THE END OF MY REPORT FOR NOW. AND WHERE ARE WE ON THE BAHFA SIDE, FRED?

7

8 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: WE'RE STILL -- WE STILL NEED TO COMPLETE
9 THE ROLL CALL FOR QUORUM. BUT --

10

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I DO HAVE AN ANNOUNCEMENT THAT I WANTED TO MAKE. IT'S ABOUT MEETING PROCEDURES MOVING FORWARD. SO, IF I COULD DO THAT?

14

15 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: PLEASE.

16

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGENCY COVID PROTOCOLS 17 WILL BE SUNSETTING FEBRUARY 28TH, 2023, WHICH MEANS THE ABAG 18 HOUSING COMMITTEE AND BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE WILL RETURN TO 19 IN-PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. 20 STARTING WITH THE MARCH 9TH, 2023 MEETING WITH THE ABAG 21 HOUSING COMMITTEE AND BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE JOINT MEETINGS 22 WILL BE IN-PERSON. AS BEFORE, YOU WILL BE COMPENSATED FOR YOUR 23 TRAVEL COSTS AND REFRESHMENTS WILL BE PROVIDED. FOR THOSE OF 24 YOU WHO ARE CONSIDERING A.B. 2449, MORE GUIDANCE WILL FOLLOW 25

> AT FEBRUARY'S MEETING, BUT THE KEY POINTS ARE: ONE, THE PUBLIC 1 CAN STILL PARTICIPATE REMOTELY, AS WE WILL CONTINUE TO USE THE 2 3 HYBRID FORMAT. TWO, MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY SUBMIT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT BY 5 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE MEETING TO THE 4 5 ADDRESS PROVIDED ON THE WEBSITE AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. THREE, 375 BEALE STREET IS OUR HEADQUARTERS. WE CURRENTLY DO 6 NOT OFFER ANY ALTERNATE OR SATELLITE LOCATIONS FOR CONDUCTING 7 8 BUSINESS. FOUR, THANK YOU IN ADVANCE FOR MAKING ADDITIONAL EFFORT TO SERVE ON OUR COMMITTEES AS WE COMPLY WITH PUBLIC 9 10 TRANSPARENCY RULES, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING YOU IN-PERSON AFTER SUCH A LONG TIME APART THAT'S CERTAINLY TRUE. 11 MASKS ARE STRONGLY RECOMMENDED FOR EMPLOYEES AND VISITORS TO 12 OUR SAN FRANCISCO HEADQUARTERS. THAT CONCLUDES THE 13 14 ANNOUNCEMENT AND OUR REPORT. THANK YOU.

JANUARY 12, 2023

15

16 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MARGARET. IT 17 WILL BE GOOD TO BACK IN-PERSON MEETINGS BUT I KNOW IT WILL BE 18 A CHALLENGE. WE HAVE ALL BECOME QUITE ACCUSTOMED TO REMOTE. 19 WITH THAT, ANY DISCUSSION FROM MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE ON 20 THIS ITEM?

21

22 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: CHAIR ROMERO THIS, IS FRED, I SEE GENERAL
23 COUNSEL'S KANE'S HAND IS RAISED.

24

25 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES, PLEASE?

1

JANUARY 12, 2023

2	KATHLEEN KANE: I WANT TO ADD, THAT WE APPRECIATE THIS COULD BE
3	A DIFFICULT TRANSITION FOR FOLKS AND WE WILL BE ISSUING
4	SUBSTANTIVE GUIDANCE ON THE, SORT OF, MECHANICS OF THINGS IN
5	FEBRUARY SO I WANTED TO REASSURE YOU THAT THIS ISN'T THE ONLY
6	WORD YOU WILL HEAR ON IT FOR FOLKS WHO HAVE SPECIAL CONCERNS
7	PLEASE REACH OUT TO MYSELF DIRECT AND MEMBERS OF MY OFFICE AND
8	WE CAN HELP FACILITATE DECISIONS ABOUT HOW TO ACCOMMODATE
9	VARIOUS SPECIFIC CIRCUMSTANCES AS WE KNOW THE BROWN ACT IS
10	NOWHERE NEAR AS FLEXIBLE PARTICULARLY FOR REGIONAL BODIES AS
11	WE WOULD LIKE IT TO BE BUT WE'LL DO OUR BEST TO HELP YOU
12	THROUGH IT.
13	
14	PAT ECKLUND: QUESTION?
15	
16	CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES PLEASE.
17	
18	PAT ECKLUND: IS THERE ANYTHING TO BE ACCOMMODATIONS MADE FOR
19	THOSE WHO ARE IMMUNIZED CHALLENGED OR WHATEVER THE TERM IS,
20	HAVE IMMUNIZATION ISSUES?
21	
22	KATHLEEN KANE: WE'LL ISSUE GUIDANCE FOR THE A.B. 2449
23	PROVISIONS WHICH ALLOW PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN A, SORT OF,
24	PLANNED WAY REMOTELY WITHOUT HAVING THE NOTICE TO THEIR HOMES
25	AS A SITE FOR THE PUBLIC TO COME. ANYBODY WHO HAS SPECIFIC

CONCERNS LIKE THAT KIND OF ACCOMMODATIONS WE CERTAINLY WANT TO 1 WORK WITH, WE'LL HAVE A ONE-ON-ONE CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT HOW 2 3 BEST TO ACCOMMODATE. 2449 IS NOT A GREAT SAFETY VALVE IT'S LIMITED BUT WE WANT TO MAKE THE BEST ACCOMMODATIONS WE CAN SO 4 5 EVERYBODY CAN PARTICIPATE FULLY. 6 7 PAT ECKLUND: SO WE SHOULD CALL YOU? 8 9 KATHLEEN KANE: YES. 10 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FROM THE 11 COMMITTEE? HEARING NONE ON THIS ITEM. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF 12 THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? FRED? 13 14 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 15 16 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM. 17 18 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NEXT ITEM IS 19 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. AND THIS IS AN INFORMATION 20 21 ITEM. AND I HAND THIS OVER TO THE DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. 22 BRAD, WILL YOU BE DOING THIS? OR IS IT GOING TO BE THERESE? 23 BRAD PAUL: I BELIEVE THERESE IS HERE. 24 25

JANUARY 12, 2023



1 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THERESE, I SEE YOU.

2

3 THERESE MCMILLAN: BUT BRAD HAS NOTES, CORRECT? HELLO EVERYONE. LET ME JUST SAY THAT BY WAY THIS IS MY LAST MEETING WITH YOU. 4 AND I AM GLAD WE HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO GATHER ONE MORE TIME, 5 THAT I HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE WITH YOU ONE MORE TIME. YOU 6 KNOW, WITH THAT, I THINK WE'LL CONTINUE TO GO FORWARD, BECAUSE 7 8 THE MAJOR THINGS WE WANTED TO ANNOUNCE, I THINK, WAS THE PROGRESS MADE ON THE ITEMS THAT YOU WILL BE HEARING ABOUT, 9 10 WHICH IS OUR BUSINESS PLAN AND EQUITY PLAN, WHICH REALLY, I THINK, ADVANCES BOTH THESE COMMITTEES FORWARD IN A REALLY 11 SUBSTANTIVE AND IMPORTANT WAY FOR 2023. SO, WITH THAT, MR. 12 VICE CHAIR, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU. 13

14

15 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION 16 ON THIS MATTER FROM MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? OKAY. ARE THERE 17 ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS 18 ITEM?

19

20 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 22 ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU.

23

24 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. I WILL TAKE THIS
25 OPPORTUNITY, MS. MCMILLAN, THERESE, I CONSIDER YOU A FRIEND --

JANUARY 12, 2023

AND I HAVE SAID THIS BEFORE -- TO THANK YOU, FOR ONE, JUMPING 1 IN TO TAKE THE REINS OF MTC AND ABAG IN A VERY STALWART AND 2 DIRECT WAY PUTTING EQUITY FRONT AND CENTER. AND, CERTAINLY, 3 INTEGRATING HOUSING IN A SIGNIFICANT AND FULL WAY, AND TO THE 4 5 MTC AND ABAG WAY. AND I KNOW THAT WHEN YOU FIRST CAME ON, IT WAS, LIKE, WHAT? WHAT HAS HAPPENED TO MY MTC? AND YOU EMBRACED 6 IT COMPLETELY, AND I DON'T THINK WE WOULD BE HERE TODAY, IN 7 8 THIS MEETING, DEALING WITH THE WEIGHTY FINANCIAL AND HOUSING AND POLICY ISSUES HAD WE NOT HAD YOUR GUIDANCE, SUPPORT, AND 9 10 WISDOM. SO, I, FOR ONE, WILL TRULY MISS YOU, THERESE. THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR SERVICE. 11

12

13 THERESE MCMILLAN: THANKS.

14

15 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: LET'S SEE. WITH THAT, LET US MOVE 16 ON TO THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEM NUMBER 17 SEVEN THIS, IS AN ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE ACTION ITEM. LET'S 18 SEE, DO WE ACTUALLY HAVE ANY ITEMS ON THIS?

19

20 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES. IT'S THE MINUTES FROM OCTOBER 13TH.
21

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: IT'S THE MINUTES. OKAY. UNLESS
THERE IS KNOW ITEM THAT AN ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE MEMBER WOULD
LIKE TO TAKE SEPARATELY, THE CONSENT CALENDAR WILL BE APPROVED
IN ONE MOTION. IT IS ONLY ONE MOTION. SO, IS THERE A MOTION



AND A SECOND FROM THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE TO APPROVE THE --1 THIS PARTICULAR ITEM, AND THE MINUTES OF THE LAST -- OUR LAST 2 3 MEETING? DO I HEAR A MOTION? 4 5 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: THANKS CHAIR ROMERO. WE APPROVED THE ABAG COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR WITH THE ONLY ITEM WHICH 6 7 IS OUR MINUTES OF OCTOBER 13TH, 2022. 8 PAT ECKLUND: AND I'LL SECOND THE MOTION. 9 10 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR, AND THANK 11 YOU MEMBER EKLUND. WITH THAT, LET'S SEE. LET US CALL FOR A 12 VOTE. ACTUALLY, BEFORE WE DO THAT, SO, IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION 13 FROM THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE ON THIS MOTION? SEEING NONE. 14 THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO WEIGH 15 16 IN ON THIS ITEM? 17 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 19 ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU. 20 21 22 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. THANK YOU. I'LL NOW CALL FOR 23 THE VOTE FOR THIS ITEM. FRED, COULD YOU DO ROLL CALL? 24



CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES MOTION BY FLIGOR, SECOND BY EKLUND. 1 2 MAYOR ARREGUIN? 3 JESSE ARREGUIN: YES. 4 5 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO BAS? IS ABSENT. 6 7 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND? 8 9 PAT ECKLUND: AYE. 10 11 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR? 12 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: YES. 13 14 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR RAMOS? 15 16 BELIA RAMOS: YES. 17 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: ROMERO? 20 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YES. 21 22 23 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: RABBIT? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT 24 25



CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. 1 2 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: CHAIR ROMERO, I BELIEVE ONE OF OUR MEMBERS IS HERE. HE'S IN THE ATTENDEE BOX. MEMBER GLOVER UNDER BRANDON 4 5 CRANE'S NAME. IF YOU WANT TO MOVE HIM OVER TO THE PANELIST 6 SIDE? 7 8 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I WILL MOVE BRANDON CRANE TO THE PANELIST. 9 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I BELIEVE THAT WILL GIVE US THE THIRD 10 MEMBER FOR A QUORUM. THANK YOU. 11 12 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. LET ME KNOW WHEN HE'S IN, 13 14 AND I WILL HAND THE REINS OVER TO YOU, MARGARET. 15 16 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR GLOVER, ARE YOU WITH US HERE? 17 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME? 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, SIR. 20 21 22 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: OKAY. I'M IN. 23 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: WITH THAT DO WE DO ROLL CALL? 24 25



CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES WE CONTINUE ROLL CALL FOR THE BAHFA 1 2 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: YES, PLEASE, THANK YOU. 4 5 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SO, FEDERAL D. GLOVER IS HERE. 6 7 COUNCILMEMBER ABE-KOGA IS HERE. AND SUPERVISOR PEDROZA IS 8 HERE. 9 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES. 10 11 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR RABBIT? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR 12 RONEN? IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT WITH THREE MEMBERS. THANK 13 14 YOU. 15 16 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. SO, THEN IF WE GO BACK TO THE BEGINNING OF THE AGENDA, WOULD YOU, CLERK, PLEASE GIVE THE --17 18 19 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: I COULD HEAR YOU. 20 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OH, CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW? 21 22 23 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, I WILL --24



MARGARET ABE-KOGA: WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT 1 2 COMMITTEE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, CLERK? 3 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, MA'AM. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I 4 5 AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING 6 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS 7 8 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR 9 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. 10 11 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. AND I BELIEVE WE WILL GO BACK TO ITEM EIGHT, NOW, THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CONSENT 12 CALENDAR. ARE THERE ANY ITEMS THAT MEMBERS WOULD LIKE TO PULL 13 14 OR COMMENT ON? 15 16 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: HAPPY TO MAKE A MOTION. THIS IS 17 PEDROZA. 18 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU, CHAIR. THERE IS A MOTION FROM 19 CHAIR PEDROZA. IS THERE A SECOND? 20 21 22 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: GLOVER. 23

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 12, 2023

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. WE'LL ASK IF THERE IS COMMENT 1 FROM THE PUBLIC? IF YOU COULD MUTE IF YOU ARE ON THE CALL? ANY 2 3 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 4 5 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 6 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 7 ON THIS ITEM. 8 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND 9 10 BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. IF YOU COULD DO ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE? 11 12 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MOTION BY PEDROZA, SECOND BY GLOVER. ABE-13 14 KOGA? 15 16 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. 17 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: COUNCILMEMBER GLOVER? 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I SEE YOU SAID YES. 20 21 22 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE. CAN YOU HEAR ME? 23 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: I GOT YOU. THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR RABBIT IS 24 ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RONEN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR PEDROZA? 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: YES. 2 3 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 4 5 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 6 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: GREAT. THANK YOU. SHOULD I HAND THIS BACK 7 8 TO YOU, VICE CHAIR? 9 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: NO. I BELIEVE IT WAS BAHFA'S TURN 10 TO CHAIR. SO, THE CHAIR OF THE HOUSING COMMITTEE HANDS IT BACK 11 TO THE VICE CHAIR OF THE BAHFA COMMITTEE. 12 13 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. AND I WOULD BE FILLING IN FOR 14 15 CHAIR PEDROZA. SO, I BELIEVE WE'RE ON ITEM NINE, THE DRAFT 16 BUSINESS PLAN EQUITY FRAMEWORK. AND WE HAVE A PRESENTATION. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND MR. DANIEL SAVER IN THE 17 OTHERING AND BELONGING INSTITUTE OF UC BERKELEY WILL ISSUE THE 18 REPORT. WELCOME TO ALL OF YOU. WHENEVER YOU ARE READY. 19 20 DANIEL SAVER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. MY 21 NAME IS DANIEL SAVER, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR HOUSING AND LOCAL 22 PLANNING AT MTC AND ABAG I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO DIRECTOR 23 KATE HARTLEY TO PROVIDE INTRODUCTORY REMARKS ON BOTH OF THE 24 NEXT TWO ITEMS COMING BEFORE AND YOU THEN SHE CAN TURN IT OVER 25



3

JANUARY 12, 2023

TO THE BELONGING AND OTHERING INSTITUTE TEAM FOR A
 PRESENTATION ON THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK.

KATE HARTLEY: THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON MEMBERS I AM KATE 4 5 HARTLEY, BAHFA PLEASED TO BE HERE TODAY WITH DANIEL SAVER AND OUR CONSULTANTS OTHERS AND BELONGING INSTITUTE FORSYTHE STREET 6 ADVISERS TO PRESENT DRAFTS OF THE COMPONENTS OF THE BAHFA 7 8 BUSINESS PLAN EQUITY FIRST-DEGREE MURDER WORK AND FUNDING PROGRAMS. WE HAVE BEEN WORK ON OTHER BUSINESS PLAN FOR ABOUT A 9 YEAR THIS MARKS A MAJOR MILESTONE AND DURING THAT TIME WE AND 10 OUR BUSINESS PLANNING TEAM CONDUCTING AN EXTENSIVE OUTREACH 11 AND RESEARCH THAT INFORMS THESE DRAFT ELEMENTS. WE ARE LOOKING 12 FOR YOUR FEEDBACK TO INFORM THE NEXT VERSION, AND WE HOPE TO 13 BRING THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK FORWARD FOR FINAL APPROVAL THIS 14 15 SPRING. WE HOPE TO PRESENT THE FULL BUSINESS PLAN FOR YOUR 16 APPROVAL BY THE END OF THE YEAR. AND THE FINAL COMPREHENSIVE BUSINESS PLAN WILL WEAVE TOGETHER THE FOUNDATIONAL PIECES, THE 17 EQUITY FRAMEWORK, THE FUNDING PROGRAMS, AND A THIRD PIECE 18 WHICH IS OUR LONG-TERM OPERATIONS AND SUSTAINABILITY PLAN. SO, 19 OVER THE PAST YEAR, IN ADDITION TO OUR OTHER -- TO OUR 20 21 BUSINESS PLANNING EFFORTS, WE HAVE BEEN HARD AT WORK ON OUR 22 FIVE PILOT PROGRAMS WHICH WE HAVE PRESENTED TO YOU IN THE PAST. AND WE HAVE BEEN USING ALL OUR EXISTING RESOURCES AND 23 TRYING TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF EVERY OPPORTUNITY THAT ARISES TO 24 ADVANCE OUR MISSION TO THE GREATEST EXTENT POSSIBLE. THE 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 12, 2023

BUSINESS PLAN REFLECTS THE NEED FOR ONGOING OPPORTUNITY AP 1 OPPORTUNISTIC ACTIONS, RECENTLY APPLICATIONS FOR STATE FUNDS 2 3 TO PROVIDE PRESERVATION AND PREDEVELOPMENT LOANS FOR NEW AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PRESERVATION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE 4 5 BUSINESS PLAN ALSO REFLECTS HOWEVER AND MORE IMPORTANTLY PERHAPS BAHFA'S LONG-TERM VISION FOR THE WAYS IN WHICH WE CAN 6 IMPROVE THE BAY AREA'S HOUSING AND TENANT PROTECTIONS 7 8 INFRASTRUCTURE, HOW WE CAN BRING NEW IDEAS FORWARD, AND HOW WE CAN SUSTAIN BAHFA AS A SUCCESSFUL OPERATION OVER THE LONG-9 10 TERM. SO, WITH THE BUSINESS PLAN IN PLACE, AND BUILDING FROM THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE OVER THE LAST YEAR, AND THAT WE'LL 11 CONTINUE TO DO THROUGH 2023 AND 2024, WE BELIEVE WE'LL BE VERY 12 WELL POSITIONED TO IMPLEMENT A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE AND 13 HIT THE GROUND RUNNING, IF IT IS SUCCESSFUL. AND IF WE DON'T 14 HAVE THE SUCCESS WE'RE HOPING FOR IN 2024, WE BELIEVE THAT WE 15 16 WILL STILL BE WELL POSITIONED WITH THESE GREAT BUSINESS PLANNING ELEMENTS AND THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE TO CONTINUE 17 THIS WORK, THOUGH AT A SMALLER SCALE, BUT BE ABLE TO PIVOT TO 18 OTHER OPTIONS. SO, WITH THAT, I AM, AGAIN, VERY PLEASED TO 19 TURN OVER THE DISCUSSION TO THE OTHERING AND BELONGING 20 21 INSTITUTE TO TALK ABOUT THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK. SO, THANK YOU. 22

NICOLE MONTOJO: HI, EVERYONE. I BELIEVE WE HAVE SOME SLIDES.
COULD WE PLEASE PULL THOSE UP? THANK YOU. HELLO. MY NAME IS
NICOLE MONTOJO, AND I AM A STAFF RESEARCHER AT THE OTHERING

JANUARY 12, 2023

AND BELONGING INSTITUTE. I'M HERE TODAY WITH MY COLLEAGUE ELI 1 2 MOORE AND AS PART OF THE CONSULTING TEAM, WE LED DEVELOPMENT 3 OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK IN CLOSE COLLABORATION BAHFA STAFF AND ALSO SUPPORT FROM NATALIE BONNEWIT, FORSYTHE STREET ADVISERS 4 5 THE TURNER CENTER FOR HOUSING INNOVATION AND [INDISCERNIBLE]. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. FOR TODAY'S PRESENTATION, WE'LL PROVIDE AN 6 OVERVIEW OF THE PURPOSE OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND PROCESS 7 8 FOR DEVELOPING THE DRAFT THAT'S IN FRONT OF YOU TODAY DISCUSS THE COMPONENTS OF FRAMEWORK INCLUDING DRAFT EOUITY OBJECTIVES 9 10 METRICS AND GOALS TALK ABOUT HOW THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK WILL BE APPLIED AND DISCUSS NEXT STEPS FOR GETTING TO THE FINAL 11 VERSION OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK. LET'S JUMP IN. NEXT SLIDE, 12 PLEASE. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. GREAT. SO, TO START, THE 13 PURPOSE OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK IS REALLY TO BE THE FOUNDATION 14 15 OF THE BAHFA BUSINESS PLAN AND THE INTENT IS TO BUILD SOCIAL 16 EQUITY INTO BAHFA'S WORK FROM THE VERY START. SO, THE PURPOSE 17 IS TO ARTICULATE BAHFA'S COMMITMENT TO ADVANCING EQUITY, TO SET OBJECTIVES FOR BAHFA'S IMPACT ON EQUITY THROUGH ITS 18 PROGRAMS GUIDED BY OVERARCHING GOALS, THIRD TO DEFINE METRICS 19 FOR MEASURING THE IMPACT OF PROGRAMS, AND FOURTH, TO PROVIDE A 20 21 REGIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. AND THIS POINT ABOUT AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING, 22 AFFH FOR SHORT, IS TO SET BAHFA UP NOT JUST TO MEET ITS 23 MANDATE UNDER 1487 BUT ALSO TO BE ALIGNED WITH THE MTC AND 24 25 ABAG EQUITY PLATFORM AS WELL AS EFFORTS OF THE LOCAL, STATE,

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 12, 2023

AND FEDERAL LEVELS TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHER FAIR HOUSING WHICH 1 IS A MAJOR FOCUS OF GOVERNMENT AGENCIES AS WELL AS THE HOUSING 2 3 FIELD OVERALL. AND WHEN IT COMES TO FAIR HOUSING WE'RE TALKING ABOUT REGION-WIDE ISSUES, AS YOU KNOW, OF SEGREGATION, AND 4 5 HOUSING MARKET AND POLICY IMPACTS THAT CROSS CITY BOUNDARIES, CITY AND COUNT BOUNDARIES, AND BECAUSE THESE DYNAMICS ARE MUCH 6 BROADER THAN ANY ONE OF THE BAY AREA'S 109 LOCAL 7 8 JURISDICTIONS, AFFH CALLS FOR A REGIONAL APPROACH. SO BAHFA HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO PLAY A CRITICALLY ROLE IN THIS REGARD BY 9 ADVANCING A REGION-WIDE FAIR HOUSING FRAMEWORK THAT 10 COMPLEMENTS ALL OF THE WORK THAT LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE DOING 11 AND LEADING, ESPECIALLY RIGHT NOW THROUGH THE ADOPTION OF 12 LOCAL HOUSING ELEMENTS. AND, SO, ZOOM BEING BACK OUT. AS THE 13 BUSINESS PLAN GETS FURTHER DEVELOPED THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK 14 15 OBJECTIVES WILL FEED INTO THE DESIGN OF FUNDING PROGRAMS AND 16 REVENUE GENERATION STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WE EMBARKED ON THIS PROCESS ABOUT A YEAR AGO, AND IT WAS IMPORTANT TO US THAT 17 THE PROCESS WE FACILITATE TO DEVELOP THE FRAMEWORK, ITSELF, IS 18 EQUITABLE. AND THAT IT LIVES UP TO THE DEFINITION OF AN 19 EOUITABLE AND PRINCIPLED PRACTICE THAT WE HOPE THAT BAHFA WILL 20 21 CARRY FORWARD AS ITS WORK CONTINUES. SO STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WAS CENTRAL TO THE ENTIRE PROCESS. OUR GOAL WAS TO FACILITATE 22 ACCOUNTABLE REPRESENTATION OF BIPOC AND SYSTEMATICALLY 23 MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES, AND TO BE INCLUSIVE OF VOICES FROM 24 25 ACROSS THE THREE PS, AS WELL AS DIFFERENT SUBREGIONS WITHIN

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THE BAY AREA AND SECTORS THROUGHOUT THIS WHOLE PROCESS. SO, WE 1 HAD SEVERAL DIFFERENT METHODS OF ENGAGEMENT. WE RECEIVED 2 3 EXPERT INPUT FROM INTERVIEWS WITH A NUMBER OF THREE PS ADVOCATES, PRACTITIONERS AND RESEARCHERS, AND WE ALSO HAD 4 5 BROAD INPUT THROUGH THREE PUBLIC LISTENING SESSIONS WHICH WERE ATTENDED BY NEARLY 140 STAKEHOLDERS, VIRTUALLY, AND PARALLEL 6 TO THIS OUTREACH THAT WE AT OBI LED, MTC BAHFA STAFF ALSO MET 7 8 WITH STAFF FROM OVER THREE DOZEN LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ACROSS THE BAY PRESENTED AT 15 CONVENINGS OF PUBLIC SECTOR STAFF 9 ELECTED OFFICIALS AND ALSO MET WITH OVER 40 STAKEHOLDERS 10 ACROSS ALL THREE PS IN DIFFERENT SECTORS OF THE HOUSING FIELD. 11 IN ADDITION TO ALL OF THIS BROADER INPUT THE CORE PROCESS WAS 12 THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP THAT WE INFORMED FOR THE DEVELOPMENT 13 OF THIS EQUITY FRAMEWORK THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP IS A 14 COMMITTED GROUP OF 11 COMMUNITY LEADERS THAT WE CONVENED FOR 15 16 NUMEROUS MEETINGS WORKING SESSIONS AND REVIEWS OF DRAFTS OVER SIX MONTHS AND WE'RE ABOUT TO REPORT THE WORKING GROUP REACHED 17 CONSENSUS AND UNANIMOUS SUPPORT FOR THE CONTENT OF THE DRAFT 18 THAT YOU'RE REVIEWING TODAY, IT WAS OUITE A FEAT WITH SO MUCH 19 ENERGY AND INTEREST IN BOTH THE WORK WE RECEIVED A PLETHORA 20 21 AND FEEDBACK THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS WE WORKED TO FIND A WAY TO LEAD THIS TOGETHER COMING OUT OF NUMEROUS ROUNDS OF ITERATIONS 22 OF CONVERSATIONS THAT BY NATURE ARE OFTEN DIFFICULT. THIS SITE 23 IS A ROSTER OF THE 11 MEMBERS OF THE WORKING GROUP. YOU WILL 24 25 SEE WE HAD REPRESENTATION FROM DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION,

JANUARY 12, 2023

EACH OF THE THREE PS, AND EACH OF THE MEMBERS IN THE 1 2 ORGANIZATION HAVE A DIRECT CONNECTION TO DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES 3 WHO ARE MOST DEEPLY IMPACTED BY HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY. AND WE REALLY WANT TO THANK ALL OF THESE WORKING GROUP MEMBERS FOR 4 5 THEIR COMMITMENT TO THE PROCESS AND THE MANY HOURS THAT THEY PUT IN AND THE REALLY CRITICAL INSIGHTS THAT MADE THIS 6 DOCUMENT AS STRONG AS IT IS. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO ELI 7 8 TO TALK ABOUT THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK CONTENT.

9

ELI MOORE: HELLO VERY. THANK YOU FOR HAVING US. NEXT SLIDE 10 PLEASE. GETTING INTO WHAT IS IN THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND HOW 11 IT'S STRUCTURED, THERE ARE THREE PROGRAM TRACKS, ONE EACH FOR 12 EACH OF THE THREE PS, PRESENTATION, PRESERVATION, AND 13 PROTECTION. AND THEN THERE ARE CROSS CUTTING OBJECTIVES. SO 14 15 EACH PROGRAM HAS 4 TO 6 OBJECTIVES, WHICH ARE MEASURED BY A 16 SET OF METRICS TO TRACK PROGRESS ALONG THOSE OBJECTIVES. AND THESE ALL FEED INTO PROGRESS TOWARDS A SET OF LONG-TERM SOCIAL 17 EQUITY GOALS THAT ARTICULATE, REALLY, A LONG-TERM VISION FOR 18 WHAT AN EQUITABLE REGIONAL HOUSING SYSTEM CAN LOOK LIKE, WILL 19 LOOK LIKE. AND THESE GOALS ARE BROADER THAN WHAT BAHFA, ALONE, 20 CAN ACHIEVE. THE THEY REALLY WILL TAKE COLLECTIVE ACTION 21 ACROSS SECTORS IN THE REGION. SO THE OBJECTIVES AND METRICS 22 ARE ABOUT WHAT BAHFA IS DOING AND THE GOALS ARE, SORT OF, 23 ABOUT THE NORTH STAR FOR THE REGION OVERALL. NEXT SLIDE 24 PLEASE. SO WE'RE GOING TO REVIEW THE OBJECTIVES NOW. NEXT 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

SLIDE. AND BEFORE WE GET INTO THE SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES, WE 1 WANTED TO JUST LIFT UP A COUPLE OF THEMES ABOUT THE 2 3 OBJECTIVES, OVERALL. BECAUSE THEY'RE REALLY THE CORE OF THE FRAMEWORK. AND AT A HIGH-LEVEL, THE OBJECTIVES SPEAK TO HOW 4 5 BAHFA WILL TARGET ITS RESOURCES TO ACHIEVE SOCIAL EOUITY. SO, SPECIFIC POPULATIONS, SPECIFIC GEOGRAPHIES, AND HOW THE 6 STRATEGIES THAT BAHFA CARRIES OUT WILL MEET THE NEEDS IN THOSE 7 8 SPECIFIC AREAS. AND THEN THE OBJECTIVES ALSO ARTICULATE HOW BAHFA INTENDS TO SERVE AS A REGIONAL LEADER. SO EMBEDDED HERE 9 IS A, SORT OF, LEADERSHIP ROLE THAT STAKEHOLDERS HAVE REALLY 10 CONSISTENTLY CALLED FOR AS FAR AS WHAT BAHFA CAN DO IN THE 11 REGION. AND THIS IS KEY, BECAUSE THE HOUSING CRISIS SPANS MORE 12 THAN THE, UNDER MORE THAN 100 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IN THE 13 REGION, AND NONE OF THOSE JURISDICTIONS CAN ADDRESS THE 14 HOUSING CRISIS ALONE. SO, THIS REGIONAL STRATEGY AND THE 15 16 REGIONAL LEADERSHIP CAN PROVIDE A WAY TO LIFT UP COMMUNITY 17 PRIORITIES, A WAY TO ADVANCE LOCAL ALIGNMENT WITH REGIONAL STRATEGIES AND REGIONAL PRIORITIES BY OFFERING SUPPORT, ADDING 18 CAPACITY, AND PULLING TOGETHER AND REINFORCING WHAT LOCALS ARE 19 ALREADY DOING. AND THEN BY SHOWING A COMMITMENT TO ONGOING 20 21 EQUITABLE ENGAGEMENT FOCUSED ON THE MOST IMPACTED COMMUNITIES. AND ANOTHER THING WE WANTED TO LIFT UP IS JUST HOW THE 22 FRAMEWORK REALLY REFLECTS A BOTH AND APPROACH THAT THERE IS NO 23 SINGLE SOLUTION THAT THE HOUSING CRISIS IS MULTIFACETED AND 24 25 REQUIRES A MULTI-FACETED SET OF APPROACHES SO KEY WILL BE

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 12, 2023

DETERMINING THE RIGHT MIX AND ORDER AND BALANCE OF PRIORITIES 1 IN THOSE, BOTH END APPROACHES. SO WE'LL QUICKLY SHARE THE 2 3 OBJECTIVES UNDER EACH PROGRAM TRACK. THEY'RE EXPRESSED HERE IN REALLY CLEAR AND CONCISE BRIEF LANGUAGE. THESE ARE JUST THE 4 5 HEADLINES AND YOU WILL SEE THAT IN THE EOUITY FRAMEWORK FOR EACH OF THESE, THERE IS FURTHER DETAIL AND EXPLANATION OF WHAT 6 BAHFA WILL BE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. AND THERE IS EVEN MORE 7 8 DETAILS FROM STAKEHOLDER IMPACT -- SORRY -- STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK, AND EQUITY WORKING GROUP DISCUSSIONS IN THE 9 10 STAKEHOLDER REPORT, WHICH ACCOMPANIES THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK. AND YOU WILL ALSO SEE IN THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK, SOME OF THE 11 DETAILS IN THE OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES SECTIONS. NEXT 12 SLIDE, PLEASE. THESE ARE THE OBJECTIVES RELATED TO PRODUCTION. 13 14 FIRSTLY, TO PRODUCE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, ESPECIALLY FOR 15 EXTREMELY LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS, TO INVEST IN HISTORICALLY 16 DISINVESTED AREAS, TO CREATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES IN HISTORICALLY EXCLUSIONARY AREAS, TO CREATE PROGRAMS THAT 17 ADDRESS HOMELESSNESS. TO ACHIEVE REGIONAL CLIMATE AND 18 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE GOALS. THOSE ARE THE OBJECTIVES FOR 19 PRODUCTION. AND YOU CAN SEE THE BOTH AND APPROACH HERE WHERE 20 21 BAHFA WILL BE PRODUCING HOUSING IN HISTORICALLY DISINVESTED AREAS, AS WELL AS IN HISTORICALLY EXCLUSIONARY AREAS, WHICH 22 REFLECTS BAHFA'S REGIONAL APPROACH TO AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING 23 FAIR HOUSING. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO MOVING ON TO 24 PRESERVATION. OBJECTIVES ARE TO PRESERVE EXPIRING USE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO PREVENT DISPLACEMENT, TO PRESERVE 1 EXISTING UNSUBSIDIZED HOUSING AND CONVERT TO PERMANENTLY 2 3 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TO TARGET PRESERVATION INVESTMENT FOR MOST IMPACTED RESIDENTS, CREATE OPPORTUNITIES FOR COMMUNITY OWNED 4 5 HOUSING. AND FINANCING FOR PRESERVATION WAS FREQUENTLY IDENTIFIED AS A GAP IN THE REGIONAL -- IN THE RENAL'S HOUSING 6 SYSTEM. WITH SUPPORT FOR COMMUNITY OWNED HOUSING REALLY BEING 7 8 A PARTICULAR PRESSING NEED. SO, THAT'S REFLECTED HERE IN THESE OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE OBJECTIVES FOR 9 10 PROTECTION ARE, FIRSTLY, TO INCREASE ACCESS TO TENANT SERVICES, TO SUPPORT TENANT EDUCATION AND ADVOCACY, TO 11 PRIORITIZE PROTECTIONS AND INVESTMENTS IN HOUSEHOLDS AND 12 COMMUNITIES FACING THE GREATEST HOUSING PRECARITY. TO ENSURE 13 14 ADEQUATE FUNDING FOR TENANT PROTECTIONS AND TO ELEVATE THE 15 URGENCY OF TENANT PROTECTIONS THROUGH REGIONAL LEADERSHIP. AND 16 ADEOUATE FUNDING FOR TENANT PROTECTIONS FACES A SPECIFIC CHALLENGE BECAUSE OF THE LAWS LIMITING THE USE OF GENERAL 17 OBLIGATION BONDS, WHICH WE'LL COME BACK TO LATER. SO THIS 18 OBJECTIVE HERE IS DESIGNED TO ADDRESS THAT CHALLENGE HEAD ON 19 AND ENSURE THAT PROTECTION REMAINS ON EQUAL FOOTING WITH THE 20 21 OTHER TWO LEGS OF THE THREE PS STOOL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS THE SET OF OBJECTIVES THAT ARE CROSS-CUTTING. SO THEY APPLY 22 ACROSS PROTECTION, PRODUCTION, AND PRESERVATION STRATEGIES. 23 FIRSTLY TO SUPPORT COMMUNITY BASED AND COMMUNITY OWNED 24 ORGANIZATIONS AND DEVELOPERS. TO SUPPORT INDIVIDUAL AND 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

COMMUNITY WEALTH BUILDING, TO SERVE AS A REGIONAL LEADER ON 1 2 LOCAL EQUITABLE PROGRAMS AND PRACTICES, COMMIT TO ONGOING 3 MEANINGFUL AND EQUITABLE ENGAGEMENT. SECURE MORE FLEXIBLE AND UNRESTRICTED FUNDING, AND TO TARGET THE MOST FLEXIBLE BAHFA 4 5 FUNDING TO ACCELERATE AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING. YOU CAN SEE THE OBJECTIVES THAT BAHFA PREPARES TO EXPAND THE 6 REGION'S HOUSING SYSTEM NOT JUST BY INCREASING THE NUMBER OF U 7 8 AT THIS TIMES BUT ALSO BY EXPANDING THE NUMBER OF DIVERSITY OF HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS AND THIS CAN ADVANCE SOCIAL EQUITY IN 9 HOUSING AS WELL AS IN THE REGIONAL ECONOMY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 10 SO, TURNING TO THE METRICS, WE'RE NOT GOING TO LIST OUT ALL OF 11 THEM IN DETAIL. BUT WE WANTED TO JUST DESCRIBE WHAT TYPES OF 12 METRICS ARE IN THE FRAMEWORK AND WHAT TYPES OF THINGS THEY 13 MEASURE. SO, THEY'RE TIED TO EACH OF THE OBJECTIVES, AND THESE 14 15 ARE HOW BAHFA WILL MEASURE ITS PROGRESS AND SUCCESS IN 16 ACHIEVING EOUITY OBJECTIVES. THE PURPOSE IS BOTH RETROSPECTIVE AND PROSPECTIVE. RETROSPECTIVE BECAUSE THEY WILL BE ALLOWED --17 THE METRICS WILL ALLOW BAHFA TO LOOK BACK ON ITS IMPACT TO 18 TRACK PROGRESS AND TO DO ANALYSIS AND REPORTING ON HOW IT'S 19 DOING. AND PROSPECTIVE, BECAUSE MY NAME BEING THE METRICS AT 20 THE ONSET OF BAHFA'S WORK, THEY HELP GUIDE PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT 21 BY ILLUMINATING HOW DIFFERENT PROGRAM DESIGN OPTIONS WILL 22 POTENTIALLY ADVANCE EOUITY. FOR INSTANCE, BAHFA CAN USE THE 23 METRICS TO ANTICIPATE AND COMPARE HOW WELL A FEW DIFFERENT 24 PROGRAM MODELS WOULD MEET THE EQUITY OBJECTIVES. NEXT SLIDE, 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

PLEASE. SO THERE ARE METRICS FOR BAHFA'S ACTIVITIES AND 1 2 METRICS MEASURING OUTCOMES. SOME METRICS FOCUS ON HOW MUCH 3 FUNDING IS DISPERSED FOR EACH OF THE THREE PS ACROSS THE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS, OTHER METRICS FOCUS ON WHAT TYPES OF 4 5 ORGANIZATIONS GET FUNDED, TRACKING SUPPORT FOR COMMUNITY-BASED DEVELOPERS, BIPOC LED, EMERGING, COMMUNITY OWNED, TRACKING 6 SUPPORT FOR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS FOR ACTIVITIES NOT 7 8 RELATED TO DEVELOPMENT. OTHER METRICS FOCUS ON WHAT TYPES OF PROJECTS GET FUNDED, AFFORDABLE LEVEL, THE GEOGRAPHIC 9 10 LOCATION, UNITS DESIGNED FOR SPECIFIC POPULATIONS WITH SPECIFIC FEATURES, SUCH AS ACCESSIBILITY FEATURES FOR PEOPLE 11 WITH DISABILITY, PEOPLE WHO ARE FORMALLY HOMELESS, OR AT RISK 12 OF HOMELESSNESS. UNITS DESIGNED WITH SPECIFIC FEATURES, LIKE 13 HIGH-PERFORMANCE RATINGS FOR SUSTAINABLE BUILDING SYSTEMS, AND 14 15 THE 10-WE ARE TYPE, SO IS IT RENTAL, COMMUNITY OWNERSHIP, 16 INDIVIDUAL HOUSEHOLD OWNERSHIP, ET CETERA. AND THEN THERE ARE 17 METRICS ABOUT WHO ENDS UP LIVING IN THE UNITS, THE RESIDENT CHARACTERISTICS, THAT WOULD BE COLLECTED UPON LEASE UP THROUGH 18 HOUSING APPLICATIONS OR OTHER MEANS, AND INFORMATION LIKE RACE 19 AND DISABILITY STATUS WOULD BE VOLUNTARY, REQUESTED BUT NOT 20 REQUIRED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE GOALS, LIKE WE MENTIONED 21 EARLIER, ARE THIS LONG-TERM VISION IN, REALLY GO BEYOND WHAT 22 BAHFA ALONE CAN ACHIEVE BUT WHAT REALLY HELP GUIDE OVERALL THE 23 DIRECTION OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING SYSTEM. AND AS WITH THE 24 25 OBJECTIVES, THERE IS A LOT OF NUANCE IN THE FRAMEWORK, BUT

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

HERE WE'RE JUST GOING TO LIST THEM OUT IN VERY BRIEF TITLES. 1 SO, THE GOALS ARE CHOICE AND OPPORTUNITY, STABLE AFFORDABLE 2 3 HOUSING FOR ALL, SECURITY, SAFETY, AND BELONGING, NEIGHBORHOOD STABILIZATION, AND CULTURAL PLACE KEEPING, COMMUNITY SELF-4 5 DETERMINATION AND PARTICIPATION, REPAIR, ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH AND JUSTICE, AND PREVENTION. AND SO, THESE GOALS COMPRISE A 6 VISION COMING OUT OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK PROCESS FOR AN 7 8 EOUITABLE HOUSING SYSTEM IN THE REGION. THIS IS NOT WHAT BAHFA EXPECTS TO ACHIEVE ON ITS OWN BUT THE BIGGER PICTURE GOALS FOR 9 10 WHAT BAHFA AND ITS PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS WILL BE WORKING TOWARD. THIS NORTH STAR ILLUMINATES HOW DIVERSE HOUSING 11 EFFORTS ACROSS THE REGION CAN ALIGN AND ACHIEVE SOMETHING MUCH 12 GREATER THAN THE SUM OF THEIR PARTS. IT REFLECTS IT'S INDEED A 13 GOAL OF BAHFA TO ENSURE THAT EVERYONE HAS A STABLE AND 14 15 AFFORDABLE HOME BUT THE HOME FOUNDATION IS SO MUCH MORE ON FOR 16 HEALTH ACCESS EDUCATION JOBS AND FOR A SENSE EVER BELONGING IN COMMUNITY. AND WITH THAT, I'LL PASS IT BACK TO YOU, NICOLE. 17

18

19 NICOLE MONTOJO: THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THAT WAS A 20 LOT. AS YOU HEARD THERE ARE MANY OBJECTIVES AND METRICS BUILT 21 INTO THE FRAMEWORK, SO WE'LL TAKE A BREATH THERE. AND WITH ALL 22 OF THAT, WE'RE SETTING THE BAR HIGH, AND AT THE SAME TIME THE 23 INTENT IS FOR THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK BE ACTIONABLE AND RELEVANT 24 AND TO DAILY PRACTICE AS WELL AS STRATEGIC DECISION-MAKING 25 OVER TIME TO STAY RELEVANT EVEN AS THE FIELD CHANGES. TO BE

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

CLEAR IN THE FRAMEWORK THE FINER GRAIN EVER DETAILS OF 1 IMPLEMENTATION ARE NOT DEFINED IN THE DOCUMENT ITSELF AND 2 3 THERE ARE STILL KEY DECISIONS TO BE MADE AT A LATER STAGE ABOUT HOW ALL OF THIS WILL BE APPLIED TO POLICY AND PRACTICE. 4 5 BUT WHERE WE ARE NOW, WE SEE THAT A BEST PRACTICE IN EQUITY WORK IS TO THINK BEYOND THE PRODUCT OF A PARTICULAR PLANNING 6 PROCESS OR POLICY ONWARD TO ITS IMPLEMENTATION. SO BUILDING IN 7 8 ONGOING ACCOUNTABILITY STRUCTURES TO ENSURE THAT THE INTENDED IMPACT IS ACHIEVED, AND IF IT'S NOT, TO ADJUST COURSE IN THE 9 10 FUTURE, AS NEEDED. AND THROUGH CONVERSATIONS WITH THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS, WE IDENTIFIED FIVE 11 ACCOUNTABILITY AND IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES THAT ARE LISTED 12 IN THE FRAMEWORK AND UP HERE ON THIS SLIDE. SO, FIRST, DATA 13 COLLECTION AND REPORTING ON PROGRAM OUTCOMES. SECOND, EQUITY 14 15 EVALUATION AS PART OF PROGRAM DESIGN FOR ALL FUTURE FUNDING 16 PROGRAMS, THIRD A COMMITMENT TO ENGAGING THE BAHFA ADVISORY 17 COMMITTEE STAKEHOLDERS AND EQUITY LEADERS. FOURTH, A PERIODIC REEVALUATION OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK, AND COORDINATION, 18 EVALUATION, AND COLLABORATION WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. AND AS 19 I SHARED EARLIER, THE INTENTION OF THE EOUITY FRAMEWORK IS TO 20 21 CENTER EQUITY IN BAHFA'S WORK AT THE VERY START. AND WE'RE STILL VERY MUCH AT THE START. SO THERE IS STILL A LOT TO BE 22 DETERMINED THROUGHOUT THE PROGRAM DESIGN PROCESS. AND WHILE 23 THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK WILL BE A TOUCH TONE THROUGHOUT THAT 24 PROCESS, IT STILL NEEDS TO BE DECIDED HOW THE FRAMEWORK WILL 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

ULTIMATELY SHAPE, PROGRAM, AND DESIGN FUNDING DECISIONS AS 1 WELL AS HOW AND BY WHOM THOSE DECISIONS WILL BE MADE. SO THOSE 2 3 PROCESS DECISIONS AND ENGAGEMENT PLANS AND ACTUAL PROGRAM DESIGN DECISIONS WILL TAKE PLACE IN PHASES AS BAHFA'S WORK 4 5 TAKES SHAPE INCLUDING THE PROCESS TO CONSIDER 2024 REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE. AND LASTLY, I WANT TO POINT OUT ANOTHER SET 6 OF ISSUES THAT BAHFA WILL NEED TO CONSIDER. THE EQUITY 7 8 FRAMEWORK ACKNOWLEDGES THAT PRACTICING AND ACHIEVING EQUITY IS NOT GOING TO BE EASY. SO IT NAMES SOME OF THOSE MOST SALIENT 9 CHANGES OR BARRIERS WITH EQUITY THAT BAHFA WILL NEED TO 10 GRAPPLE WITH. INCLUDING THINGS LIKE THE POTENTIAL NEED FOR 11 LEGISLATIVE CHANGES, FOR EXAMPLE, IF BAHFA WANTS TO USE ITS 12 REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE FOR HOMEOWNERSHIP PROGRAMS THAT WOULD 13 REQUIRE A CHANGE TO A.B. 1487. AND THERE ARE OTHER THINGS LIKE 14 15 THE LIMITS OF DIFFERENT REVENUE SOURCES, LIKE ELI MENTIONED 16 RELATED TO THE GENERAL OBLIGATIONS ON REVENUE. AND THIRD, LEGAL CONCERNS ABOUT RACE CONSCIOUS STRATEGIES FOR ADVANCING 17 RACIAL EOUITY. GIVEN CALIFORNIA'S PROP 209 AND OTHER FEDERAL 18 FAIR HOUSING AND EQUAL PROTECTION CONSIDERATIONS. SO THESE 19 CHALLENGES AND QUESTIONS WERE ALL HIGHLIGHTED BY STAKEHOLDERS 20 IN THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PROCESS. AND BECAUSE WE COULDN'T 21 22 COVER ALL DETAIL IN THE FEEDBACK THAT WE RECEIVED IN THIS PRESENTATION, OR IN THE MAIN REPORT, I JUST WANT TO NOTE ONCE 23 MORE, THAT THERE IS A SEPARATE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT REPORT 24 25 WHICH IS IN YOUR PACKET FOR THIS ITEM, ATTACHMENT TWO,

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 12, 2023

APPENDIX C, WHERE YOU IS READ MORE COMPREHENSIVE SUMMARY OF 1 2 THEMES FROM FEEDBACK WE RECEIVED WHICH ARE REFLECTIVE OF 3 ISSUES. ON ALL OF THESE FRONTS EQUITY FRAMEWORK SETS OFF TO TAKE ON THOSE CHALLENGES AS A PROCESS OF MATTER OF EQUITY 4 5 DEMONSTRATES HOW BAHFA CAN WALK THE WALK AND NOT JUST TALKING ABOUT EQUITY AS A GENERAL PRINCIPLE BUT MAKING EQUITABLE 6 PRACTICES INTO ACTIVITIES AND OPERATIONS IN ITS NORMAL COURSE 7 8 OF BUSINESS WE'RE REALLY PROUD TO SEE THE COMMITMENT NOT SHYING AWAY FROM THESE DIFFICULT ISSUES AND OUESTIONS BECAUSE 9 10 THAT'S WHAT EOUITY IS ALL ABOUT. ON THAT NOTE I'LL TURN IT BACK TO ELI TO TALK ABOUT NEXT STEPS. 11

12

ELI MOORE: NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHERE THE PROCESS GOES FROM HERE 13 IS THAT THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE NEWLY 14 15 FORMED BAHFA ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND IN FEBRUARY AND MARCH 16 THERE WILL BE ADDITIONAL PUBLIC WORKSHOPS. AND WE'LL BE REVISING THE DRAFT BASED ON THE FEEDBACK THAT WE HEAR FROM YOU 17 TODAY IN THE WORKSHOPS, AND THEN THAT VERSION WILL GO BACK TO 18 THE EOUITY WORKING GROUP FOR A VOTE FOLLOWED BY THE BAHFA 19 ADVISORY COMMITTEE, AND FINALLY COMING BACK TO YOU FOR 20 21 ADOPTION, WHICH IS CURRENTLY SLATED FOR MAY OF THIS YEAR. AND TO CLOSE, AT, FROM OBI'S PERSPECTIVE, WE JUST WANT TO COMMEND 22 BAHFA FOR A PLANNING PROCESS THAT REFLECTS SOCIAL EQUITY BY 23 DESIGN IT'S NOT EASY SHIFTING SYSTEMS AND PRACTICES THAT HAVE 24 BEEN BUILT OVER DECADES BUT THIS EEK TEE FRAMEWORK REALLY 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

GIVES HOPE THAT BAHFA WILL BREAK GROUND IN ACHIEVING HOUSING 1 EOUITY IN THE REGION AND WHILE THE FRAMEWORK IS NOT EXPECTED 2 3 TO CONCLUSIVELY RESOLVE EVERY QUESTION IT SETS FORTH VISION FOR CREATING BAHFA'S ROLE NO SHARING PROSPERITY IN THE REGION 4 5 AND ARTICULATES CORE EQUITY PRINCIPLES AND OBJECTIVES THAT CAN GUIDE BAHFA'S WORK AND STAY CLEAR-EYED IN THE CHALLENGES THAT 6 ARE FACED ALONG THAT PATH. ULTIMATELY OUR HOPE IS THAT IT CAN 7 8 SERVE AS A REGIONAL FRAMEWORK THROUGH WHICH THE KEY PLAYERS ACROSS THE REGION CAN CONTINUE TO COME TOGETHER TO LEVERAGE 9 THE DIVERSITY OF OUR EXPERIENCE AND EXPERTISE TO ACHIEVE OUR 10 SHARED VISION OF SAFE, AFFORDABLE, AND STABLE HOUSING FOR ALL 11 BAY AREA RESIDENTS. SO, THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION. AND WITH 12 THAT, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR. AND WE'RE AVAILABLE FOR 13 ANY QUESTIONS. 14

15

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, ELI, NICOLE, DANIEL, KATE, FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT WAS VERY INFORMATIVE. I REALLY APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT'S BEEN PUT INTO IT, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO GET THIS UP FRONT AND LOOK FORWARD TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MANY OF THESE GOALS. WITH THAT, ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENT, DISCUSSION ITEMS BY MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE? YES, VICE CHAIR ROMERO?

23

24 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: YEAH. I WAS JUST GOING TO COMMENT,
25 THAT, ONE, I APPRECIATE THE INTEGRATING -- HELPING US

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

INTEGRATE THIS INTO BAHFA AND HOW WE ROLL OUT FUNDING IN AN 1 EQUITABLE FASHION. I THINK IT'S PROBABLY GOING TO TAKE 2 3 REFINEMENT GOING BACK AND FORTH AS WE ACTUALLY ROLL OUT PROGRAMS ONCE WE AGREE FULLY ON THIS FRAMEWORK AND HOW IT 4 5 OVERLAYS ALL OUR PROGRAMS. I THINK THROUGH MAYBE CONSTANT 6 REVIEW OF HOW WE'RE DOING, GIVEN THESE GUIDELINES, GIVEN --AND, YOU KNOW, THE FRAMEWORK WE HAVE SET OUT, WE CAN, 7 8 CERTAINLY, IMPROVE ITS IMPLEMENTATION. BUT I -- THIS IS NOT EASY, AND IT'S NOT GOING TO BE EASY, BUT I THINK WE HAVE TO BE 9 10 DELIBERATE ABOUT TRYING TO INTEGRATE THIS INTO, YOU KNOW, A VAST AMOUNT OF FUND THAT'S GOING TO COME OUT, AND CERTAINLY 11 SERVE AS AN EXAMPLE FOR OTHER COMMUNITIES THAT MAY NOT HAVE 12 THE ABILITY OR THE CAPACITY TO THINK ABOUT THESE THINGS AND 13 ALLOW OTHER FOLKS TO LEARN FROM THIS ROBUST APPROACH THAT I 14 15 HOPE WE GET TO BY THE END OF MAY. SO, THANK YOU, ALL, FOR THIS 16 GREAT WORK, AND LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING THE COMMENTS THAT COME 17 FROM THE VARIOUS GROUPS BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN WE GET THIS BACK. 18

JANUARY 12, 2023

19 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: ANY OTHER COMMENTS? QUESTIONS FROM 20 COMMITTEE MEMBERS? I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. LET'S OPEN UP 21 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. MR. CLERK WOULD YOU MIND TAKING US THROUGH 22 PUBLIC COMMENT, PLEASE?

23

24 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, MA'AM. NO WRITTEN COMMENTS WERE
25 RECEIVED, AND JUST A MOMENT FOR MY TIMER TO GET STARTED, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



THEN I WILL CALL ON THE FIRST SPEAKER, GENAY AUBREY, FOR TWO
 MINUTES.

3

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON BAHFA HOUSING OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. 4 5 BAHA IS COMMITTED TO PURSUING A \$20 BILLION DOLLARS REGIONAL BOND IN 2024 TO HELP RAISE FUNDED NEEDED TO ADDRESS OUR 6 REGION'S HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS CRISIS I SPEAK TODAY IN 7 8 SUPPORT OF THE BAHFA EOUITY FRAMEWORK I WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK I KNOW 9 THIS IS NOT EASY THANK YOU FOR PROVIDING SEVERAL OPPORTUNITIES 10 FOR OUR ORGANIZATION AND MEMBERS OF OUR COMMUNITY FOR 11 PROVIDING FEEDBACK AND INCORPORATING A LOT OF THAT FEEDBACK 12 INTO THE LATEST DRAFT. WE APPRECIATE IT. WE BELIEVE THE 13 FRAMEWORK IS ESSENTIAL TO ENSURE THAT BAHFA FUNDING IS 14 INCLUDING FUND-RAISING THROUGH REGIONAL MEASURE 2024 AND 15 16 TARGETING LOW-INCOME AND BIPOC COMMUNITIES TO ENSURE ACCESS AND STABLE AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT AND 17 REALLY SPECIAL THAT IT INCLUDES SPECIFIC CRITERIA AND METRICS 18 19 FOR EVENT THREE PS TO GAUGE OUR PROGRESS AND TO HELP US KEEP OURSELVES ACCOUNTABLE. THAT'S WHY I'M EXCITED TO SUPPORT THE 20 DRAFTING AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK. WE LOOK 21 22 FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO PARTNER WITH YOU AND TO PURSUE 23 ADDITIONAL RESOURCES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP ON THIS ISSUE. 24



CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS CAPRI ROTH.
 2 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

3

SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS CAPRI ROTH, I AM EXECUTIVE 4 5 VICE PRESIDENT OF THE REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT AT EAST BAY ASIAN LOCAL DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION WE ARE A COMMUNITY 6 DEVELOPMENT ORGANIZATION BASED IN OAKLAND AND WORK IN ALAMEDA 7 8 AND CONTRA COSTA OUR CEO IS ANDY MADERA WE JOINT THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP, I AM HERE SPEAKING IN SUPPORT TODAY OF THE 9 DRAFT FRAMEWORK I WANT TO THANK STAFF AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM 10 FOR PROVIDING THE OPPORTUNITIES FOR OUR PARTNERS AND THE 11 BROADER COMMUNITY TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND INPUT INTO THE 12 FEEDBACK AND ALSO FOR INCORPORATING SO MUCH OF THE FEEDBACK AS 13 IT EVOLVES. AS YOU KNOW, BAY AREA HOUSING CRISIS 14 15 DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTS LOW-INCOME AND BIPOC COMMUNITIES 16 LIKE THE ONES THAT EVOLVE WORKS IN, SO WE THOUGHT IT'S IMPORTANT TO CREATE TARGETED PROGRAMS AND RESOURCES THAT WILL 17 ADDRESS DISPARITIES. THE COMMUNITIES IN THE EAST BAY WHERE 18 EVOLVE WORKS ARE IMPACTED BY THE LONG HISTORY OF RACIST 19 INVESTMENT IN THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS WE KNOW THAT ACHIEVING THE 20 21 EQUITY GOALS OF AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING REQUIRES 22 THE BOTH END APPROACH TO INVESTING IN THESE NEIGHBORHOODS AS WELL AS IMPROVING ACCESS TO RACIALLY EXCLUDED COMMUNITIES FOR 23 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. WE ENCOURAGE THAT THE BAHFA EQUITY 24 FRAMEWORK AIMS TO IMPROVE UPON EXISTING APPROACHES TO AFFH 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

THAT HAVE BEEN PREVIOUSLY CONSIDERED IN CALIFORNIA. WE BELIEVE 1 2 IN ANY POLICY WHERE A NEIGHBORHOOD SHOULD BE A COMMUNITY WHERE 3 PEOPLE THRIVE AND NOT INVESTING IN QUALITY AND SAFE AFFORDABLE HOUSING VIBRANT CULTURALLY URBAN CORE NEIGHBORHOODS IT'S AN 4 5 IMPORTANT COMPONENT OF CREATING HEALTHY NEIGHBORHOODS ACROSS THE REGION WE SEE FIRSTHAND EVERY DAY IN OUR WORK ABOUT HOW 6 THE IMPACTS OF DISINVESTMENT DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTS LOW-7 8 INCOME AND BIPOC COMMUNITIES.

9

10 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER BOB ALAN.

11

SPEAKER: BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT AND MEMBER OF SIX WINDS EQUITY 12 COALITION I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE WORK PUT INTO THIS WE 13 HAVE BEEN ENGAGED IN IT FOR QUITE A WHILE. A FEW SPECIFIC 14 15 COMMENTS. AND I APOLOGIZE I'M GOING TO BLURB INTO THE BUSINESS 16 PLAN AND THE FUNDING PROGRAM. BUT, BLUR -- APPRECIATE THE OVERALL ATTENTION PUTTING INTO THE METRICS AND MTC AND ABAG 17 HAVE WORKED ON THIS FOR 15 YEARS SO HAVING RESULT IN CHANGES 18 AND OUTCOMES IS CHALLENGING. I THINK THE APPROACH OBI HAS 19 DEVELOPED IS A GOOD ONE BUT IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE A LOT OF 20 21 WORK THAT DOESN'T DO THINGS LIKE PLANNED BAY AREA THAT BAKES IN ASSUMPTIONS AROUND DISPLACEMENT, AS A PART OF ACTUAL 22 PLANNING PROCESS. IT'S A GOOD FOUNDATION BUT GETTING CHANGE IN 23 THE OUTCOMES WILL BE A CHALLENGE. IN TERMS OF WHAT WE WOULD 24 LIKE TO SEE BE STRENGTHENED, CLARIFYING BAHFA'S ROLE ON HOW IT 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

CAN INFLUENCE THE 80% RETURN TO SOURCE FUNDS WE HAD EXAMPLES 1 WITH THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM OF THOSE FUNDS GOING TO 2 3 LOCAL LEVELS AND NOT BEING CONSISTENTLY IMPLEMENTED IN A WAY THAT WAS CONSISTENT WITH REGIONAL GOALS. AND, AGAIN, WE'LL 4 5 FOLLOW UP IN OUR LETTER TO SITE SOME OF THOSE EXAMPLES. UNDER THE PRODUCTION PROGRAM AND IN THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK, THE FIRST 6 OBJECT I WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE STRENGTHENED WOULD BE SPECIFY 7 8 AFFIRMATIVELY AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND AROUND CAPACITY BUILDING IN THE FIELD, OVERALL. AND IN PRESERVATION WE'LL FOLLOW UP 9 AGAIN WITH SPECIFIC COMMENTS. BECAUSE I KNOW I'M GOING TO RUN 10 OUT OF TIME. BUT WE WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE THE PRESERVATION, 11 THE FIRST OBJECTIVE, TO BE SPECIFIC ABOUT THE INTENDED 12 OUTCOMES OF ACQUISITION, AND REHAB OF EXPIRING AFFORDABLE 13 HOUSING. AFFORDABLE PROTECTIONS PROGRAM THERE IS A LOT TO 14 15 FIGURE OUT WITH FUNDING AND I'LL HAVE TO FOLLOW UP IN A 16 LETTER. BUT THANKS FOR EVERYONE.

17

18 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DEBRA19 BALLINGER. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

20

21 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS 22 DEBRA BALLINGER, SENIOR ADVISER WITH MONUMENT IMPACT. FOR 22 23 YEARS MONUMENT IMPACT HAS BEEN ADVANCING ECONOMIC AND RACIAL 24 EQUITY IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY BY INTEGRATING ADVOCACY WITH 25 LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES TO ENSURE THAT COMMUNITY MEMBERS WITH METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 12, 2023

LOW INCOMES CAN SECURE LIVING WAGE JOBS, STABLE HOUSING GOOD 1 HEALTH. I AM A MEMBER OF THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP TASKED WITH 2 3 HELPING THIS DRAFT BAHFA EQUITY FRAMEWORK. TODAY I'M HERE TO SUPPORT THE FRAME WORK I EXTEND GRATITUDE TO STAFF AND OBI FOR 4 5 PROVIDING OPPORTUNITIES FOR MONUMENT IMPACT TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND FOR INCORPORATING MUCH OF THAT FEEDBACK IN THE 6 LATEST DRAFT THE WORSENING HOUSING AFFORDABLE HOMELESSNESS 7 8 CRISIS DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTS LOW-INCOME AND BIPOC COMMUNITIES AND MONUMENT IMPACT EVERY DAY SEES TERRIBLE 9 IMPACTS FROM THE CRISIS OF HOMELESSNESS AND DISPLACEMENT AND 10 11 THE SHORTAGE OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. HOUSING INSTABILITY TRAUMATIZES FAMILIES AND DESTABILIZES COMMUNITIES WE MUST 12 ADDRESS THESE DISPARITIES THAT'S WHY CREATING A COMPREHENSIVE 13 FRAMEWORK IS SO IMPORTANT THIS FRAMEWORK IS A MODEL FOR HOW TO 14 APPROACH OUR HOUSING CRISIS LAYING OUT CLEAR GOALS AND 15 16 PROVIDING CRITERIA AND METRICS. AS OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IN CONTRA COSTA WORK TO COMPLETE THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS MANY 17 WOULD BENEFIT FROM A STRONGER EOUITY FRAMEWORK TO STRENGTHEN 18 19 THE APPLICATION OF THEIR AFFH TO MEET THEIR RHNA GOALS AND BREAK UP SYSTEMIC PATTERNS OF SEGREGATION. WE ARE HOPEFUL OF 20 21 THE FRAMEWORK FROM BAHFA CAN PROVIDE A FOUNDATION IT'S 22 DESPERATELY NEEDED IF RESIDENTS ARE TO HAVE A SAFE AFFORDABLE AND STABLE HOME. MONUMENT IMPACTS LOOKS FORWARD TO CONTINUING 23 TO PARTNER IN THE FRAMEWORK AND RAISE THE FUNDING NEEDED. 24 THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



2 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DEREK YOUNG. GO
3 AHEAD, PLEASE.

4

1

5 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS DARRIS YOUNG. AND I AM -- I AM WITH THE BAY AREA REGIONAL HEALTH AND EQUITY INITIATIVE, BETTER KNOWN 6 AS BARHI, AND I AM THE DIRECTOR OF ORGANIZING BLACK HEALTH AND 7 8 WE ARE ALSO A MEMBER OF THE EQUITY WORKING GROUP THAT HAS BEEN TASKED TO HELP WITH THE BAHFA FRAMEWORK OUR ORGANIZATION WE 9 10 ARE A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING COALITION, LEADING THE CHARGE TO PURSUE 10 TO \$20 BILLION DOLLARS REGIONAL BONDS. I 11 AM SPEAKING TODAY IN SUPPORT OF THE FRAMEWORK, SO I WOULD LIKE 12 TO THANK STAFF AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM FOR PROVIDING 13 OPPORTUNITIES FOR PARTNER ORGANIZATIONS IN THE COMMUNITY TO 14 15 PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND FOR INCORPORATING MUCH OF THAT FEEDBACK 16 INTO THE DRAFT. AS YOU KNOW THE BAY AREA IS EXPERIENCING A HOUSING CRISIS THAT DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTS LOW-INCOME AND 17 BIPOC COMMUNITIES THAT'S WHY IT'S SO IMPORTANT FOR YOU ALL TO 18 CREATE TARGETED PROGRAMS AND RESOURCES TO ADDRESS THESE 19 DISPARITIES. THAT IS WHY WE NEED A COMPREHENSIVE EQUITY 20 21 FRAMEWORK, IT'S SO IMPORTANT SO THAT COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE SUFFERED LONG-STANDING HARMS AND WRONGS IN TERMS OF AFFORDABLE 22 HOUSING WILL GET A FAIR SHARE AND BE ABLE TO GET INTO HOUSING 23 AND GET MOST OF OUR HOMELESS PEOPLE OFF OF THE STREET. SO, 24 THEREFORE, WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO PARTNER TO CREATE 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

A COMPREHENSIVE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND RAISE THE GOALS NEEDED TO 1 2 ACHIEVE OUR RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EQUITY GOALS AND AS FAR BARHI, 3 WE KNOW THAT RACIAL DISPARITIES OF HOUSING, AND ALL THOSE THINGS THAT IMPACT HEALTH FOR ALL PEOPLE, ESPECIALLY BIPOC 4 5 COMMUNITIES. SO, THEREFORE IT'S VERY IMPORTANT FOR YOU ALL TO IMPLEMENT METRICS IN HERE SO THAT THIS INITIATIVE WILL SUCCEED 6 7 IN HELPING THE LOWEST OF THE LOWEST. THANK YOU. 8 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: NEXT SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENS. GO AHEAD, 9 10 PLEASE. RODNEY NICKENS. GO AHEAD, PLEASE? 11 12 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW, FRED? 13 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, SIR. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. 14 15 16 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MR. NICKENS, WE STILL CAN'T HEAR YOU. MR. 17 NICKENS? 18 RODNEY NICKENS: GOOD AFTERNOON BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MY 19 NAME IS RODNEY NICKENS, AND I AM THE PROGRAM OFFICER FOR 20 POLICY INNOVATION AT THE SAN FRANCISCO FOUNDATION. I AM ALSO A 21 MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND SERVING AS THE BAHFA 22 LIAISON TO THE BAHFA ADVISORY COMMITTEE. I WANT TO THANK YOU. 23 I AM SPEAKING TODAY IN SUPPORT OF THE DRAFT FRAMEWORK, I WANT 24 TO CONGRATULATE STAFF AND THE CONSULTANT TEAM AND ALL OF YOU 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

FOR PROVIDING OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR ORGANIZATION AS WELL AS 1 PARTNERS IN THE BROADER COMMUNITY TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND ALSO 2 3 FOR INCORPORATING MUCH OF THAT FEEDBACK IN THE LATEST DRAFT. AS YOU ALL KNOW THE BAY AREA CONTINUES TO EXPERIENCE A HOUSING 4 5 CRISIS THAT IS DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTING COMMUNITIES THAT LOOK LIKE ME. BIPOC COMMUNITIES, AS WELL AS LOW-INCOME 6 COMMUNITIES, AND IT IS CRITICAL THAT WE CONTINUE TO CREATE 7 8 TARGETED PROGRAMS TO ADDRESS EQUITY AND TO ADDRESS THESE DISPARITIES. AND THAT'S WHY THIS FRAMEWORK, THIS EOUITY 9 FRAMEWORK IS SO CRITICAL TO MOVING US FORWARD. I WANT TO THANK 10 YOU AND LET YOU KNOW THAT OUR ORGANIZATION CONTINUES TO BE 11 COMMITTED TO IMPLEMENTING THE BAHFA EOUITY FRAMEWORK, AS WELL 12 AS TO ENSURING THAT BAHFA CAN LIVE UP TO THE PROMISE AND CAN 13 MEET THE MOMENT OF CRISIS THAT WE'RE CURRENTLY FACING. I ALSO 14 15 LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO PARTNER WITH YOU AS WELL AS WITH 16 ALL STAKEHOLDERS TO ENSURE THAT THE EOUITY FRAMEWORK IS COMPREHEND AND I HAVE REPRESENTATIVE OF OUR VALUES AND ALSO TO 17 CONTINUE TO DO RAISE FUNDING THAT'S GOING TO BE NECESSARY TO 18 ACHIEVE OUR SHARED RACIAL AND ECONOMIC EOUITY GOALS. WE HAVE A 19 ONCE IN A GENERATION MOMENT TO MEET THESE CHALLENGES HEAD ON 20 21 AND TO MEET THEM AT THE SCALE AND SCOPE IT'S REQUIRED AND I'M COMMITTED, AND THIS ORGANIZATION IS COMMITTED, AS WELL, TO 22 23 SEEING THAT THROUGH. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION AND ALL OF YOUR GREAT WORK. AND HAVE A GOOD 24 25 AFTERNOON.



1

JANUARY 12, 2023

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE IS NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC 2 3 WITH A HAND RAISED. THANK YOU. 4 5 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU FOR BRINGING IT BACK TO THE 6 COMMITTEE ARE THERE ANY OTHER COMMENTS? MEMBER FLIGOR? 7 8 V. CHAIR, NEYSA FLIGOR, ABAG: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. AND THANKS TO STAFF AND OBI FOR THIS GREAT WORK. I REALLY 9 APPLAUD THE INITIATIVE AND THE CONTENT OF THIS PROPOSED DRAFT 10 FRAMEWORK. MY QUESTION HAS TO DO WITH THE PUBLIC WORKSHOPS 11 THAT I THINK WILL KICKOFF NEXT MONTH, DO WE HAVE THE DATES AND 12 LOCATIONS FOR THESE PUBLIC WORKSHOPS. THE REASON I ASK IS I'M 13 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND SO IS VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA AND TO THE 14 EXTENT THAT YOU WILL HAVE IN-PERSON EVENTS THAT'S SOMETHING 15 16 THAT I THINK WOULD BE GREAT TO PUSH OUT TO OUR CITIES AND PLANNING DEPARTMENTS. THANK YOU. 17 18 DANIEL SAVER: THROUGHOUT CHAIR, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THAT 19 OUESTION. I APPRECIATE THAT. SO WE ARE, AFTER NEXT WEEK, 20 PROBABLY GOING TO BE CIRCLING THE WAGONS ON OUR SIDE TO 21 22 IDENTIFY DATES AND A PROPOSED APPROACH FOR THOSE WORKSHOPS. WE DON'T HAVE THOSE YET. BUT I APPRECIATE THAT FEEDBACK, AND 23

WE'LL ABSOLUTELY REACH OUT TO AWFUL YOU ONCE WE PIN THAT DOWN

51



SO YOU CAN HELP TO PROMOTE THOSE IN YOUR COMMUNITIES. WE
 REALLY LOVE TO SEE EXCELLENT PARTICIPATION.

3

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU FOR THAT SUGGESTION MEMBER FLY 4 5 GOOD MORNING REALLY APPRECIATE THAT INFORMATION, WHEN IT'S 6 AVAILABLE. ANYTHING ELSE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? OH, AND BY THE WAY, THANK YOU FOR THE PROMOTION BUT I'M NOT VICE CHAIR. 7 8 I'M JUST A COMMISSIONER FILLING IN FOR TODAY. I'M NOT SEEING ANY HANDS. SO THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM AGAIN THANK YOU VERY 9 MUCH TO THE PRESENTERS. WE'LL CLOSE THIS ITEM AND MOVE TO ITEM 10 TEN WHICH IS THE DRAFT FUNDING PROGRAMS FOR THE BAHFA BUSINESS 11 PLAN. AND ALSO, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. WE HAVE MS. 12 HARTLEY AND FORSYTHE STREET ADVISERS TO PRESENT. AND WELCOME 13 TO ALL OF YOU, THANK YOU. 14

15

16 KATE HARTLEY: THANK YOU SO MUCH. I'LL SAY A COUPLE OF THINGS 17 BEFORE I HAND IT OVER TO FORSYTHE STREET, AND I WANT TO REINFORCE WHAT THEY'LL BE TALKING TO YOU ABOUT AND THAT IS THE 18 EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND ADDRESSING RACIAL AND SOCIAL EQUITY ARE 19 FUNDAMENTAL TO OUR FUNDING PROGRAMS IMPLEMENTATION. IN 20 21 ADDITION, WE SEEK TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING CRISIS AT SCALE. WE, 22 OUR RHNA NUMBERS SHOW THAT WE HAVE A NEED OF 250,000 AFFORDABLE HOUSING I NITS ACROSS THE BAY AREA, AND WE WANT TO 23 HAVE MAXIMUM IMPACT, AND WE WANT TO DESIGN OUR FUNDING 24 PROGRAMS SO THAT WE CAN DO THAT. WE ARE DEFINED BY A.B. 1487. 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

THAT'S OUR GUIDE POST. THAT'S WHAT TELLS US WHAT WE CAN AND 1 2 CANNOT DO AND RAISING AND SPENDING MONEY, BUT IT GIVES US A LOT OF WAYS THAT WE CAN HAVE THE IMPACT THAT WE ARE SEEKING. 3 AND WE WANT TO ADDRESS SOMETHING THAT IS REALLY BECOME VERY 4 5 PROBLEMATIC TO ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING GOALS IN THE BAY AREA, AND THAT IS THE EVER INCREASING COST OF CONSTRUCTION, AND THE 6 COST OF HOUSING. SO, OUR GUIDING DESIRE IS TO CREATE NEW AND 7 8 INNOVATIVE FUNDING STRUCTURES TO STREAMLINE LENDING AND THE DEVELOPMENT PROCESS TO SUPPORT NEW IDEAS THAT WILL HELP US TO 9 BETTER DELIVER THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING OUR REGION NEEDS. WE 10 KNOW THAT IF WE CAN COMBINE STREAMLINING AND EFFICIENT LENDING 11 AND NEW IDEAS, WE CAN BRING THE COST OF HOUSING DOWN, AND WE 12 CAN DELIVER MORE HOUSING. SO, THOSE ARE KIND OF OUR GUIDING 13 MOTIVATIONS, AND I WILL TURN IT, NOW, OVER TO FORSYTHE STREET 14 15 TO FILL YOU IN ON THE DETAILS. THANK YOU.

16

DANIELA GREVILLE: IF SOMEONE COULD PULL UP THE PRESENTATION, 17 PLEASE? OKAY. HI EVERYONE MY NAME IS DANIELA GREVILLE, I AM 18 WITH FORSYTHE STREET ADVISERS HERE WITH MY COLLEAGUES OLIVIA. 19 WE'RE GOING TO PRESENT OUR DRAFT FINDING PROGRAMS WE ARE 20 21 WORKING IN ASSISTANCE FROM SUBCONSULTANTS NATALIE BONNEWIT, WE ARE WORKING IN COLLABORATION WITH OFFICE STAFF AS WELL AS 22 SIMULTANEOUSLY LEADING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EOUITY 23 FRAMEWORK. ALTHOUGH THE ORIENTATION IS AROUND FUNDING PROGRAMS 24 WE'RE GOING TO START WITH OVERVIEW OF LEGISLATION THAT CREATE 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

BAHFA THAT SETS THE FRAMEWORK FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE 1 FUNDING PROGRAMS AND WE'LL CONCLUDE WITH NEXT STEPS. NEXT 2 3 SLIDE. CAN YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT ONE: SO, AS YOU ALL KNOW, IN 2019, THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY OR BAHFA WAS 4 5 ESTABLISHED BY A.B. 1497 AS A REGIONAL FINANCE AUTHORITY. DESIGNED TO HELP MEET THE REGION'S NEED TO PRODUCE MORE 6 HOUSING, PRESERVE EXISTING HOUSING, AND PROTECT VULNERABLE 7 8 RESIDENTS. THESE ARE THE THREE PS THAT DEFINE BAHFA'S MISSION. BUT THE LEGISLATION DEFINE WHAT IS BAHFA CAN AND CANNOT DO IN 9 DEVELOPING ITS FUNDING PROGRAMS. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, BAHFA MUST 10 SPEND A MINIMUM OF 52% OF ITS REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE ON THE 11 PRODUCTION OR THE NEW CONSTRUCTION OF UNITS. BUT IT MUST BE 12 RENTAL HOUSING THAT IS DEED RESTRICTED TO STAY AFFORDABLE FOR 13 AT LEAST 55 YEARS AND IT CAN BE AVAILABLE TO HOUSEHOLDS WITH 14 15 INCOMES UP TO 80% OF THE AREA MEDIAN INCOME OR AMI. IT ALSO 16 MUST SPEND MINIMUM OF 15% OF PRESERVATION OF EXISTING UNITS THAT WILL STAY AFFORDABLE FOR AT LEAST 55 YEARS FOR HOUSEHOLDS 17 WITH INCOMES UP TO 120% OF AMI AND FINALLY SPEND MINIMUM OF 5% 18 ON PROTECTION MEASURES TO PROTECT HOUSEHOLDS WITH INCOMES UP 19 TO 120% OF AMI FROM EVICTION AND HOMELESSNESS AT THE COUNTY 20 21 LEVEL SIMILAR REQUIREMENTS WHEN DEVELOPING LOAN FUNDS PROGRAMS SLIGHTLY MORE FLEXIBLE FOR EXAMPLE, PRODUCTION MAY BE RENTAL 22 OR HOMEOWNERSHIP AND MAY SERVE HOUSEHOLDS UP TO 120% OF AMI. 23 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, HOW WILL BAHFA PAY FOR THE FUNDING 24 PROGRAMS IN THE BEGINNING? BESIDES THE ABILITY TO RECEIVE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

GRANTS AND DONATIONS FROM GOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE ORGANIZATIONS 1 AND TO GENERATE REVENUE FROM FUTURE LENDING ACTIVITIES PER 2 3 LEGISLATION BAHFA HAS THE POWER TO PLACE FOUR TYPES OF BALLOT MEASURES BEFORE BAY AREA VOTERS TO RAISE REVENUE. AND THIS IS 4 5 REALLY UNPRECEDENTED AND SIGNIFICANT AS IT CAN RAISE LARGE AMOUNTS OF REVENUE TO FUND PROGRAMS ACROSS THE ENTIRE REGION. 6 SO, GENERALLY SPEAKING, FOR THREE OF THESE SOURCES, BAHFA 7 8 WOULD RECEIVE 20% OF THAT REVENUE WHICH IN THE LEGISLATION IS DEFINED AS REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE THAT WOULD FUND PROGRAMS 9 ACROSS THE REGION. AND THEN THE REMAINING 80% WOULD GO TO THE 10 COUNTIES OF ORIGIN AND DIRECTLY TO THE THREE LARGEST CITIES. 11 SO THE PROGRAMS WE ARE PRESENTING TODAY ARE SPECIFICALLY 12 RELATED TO THE 20% THAT GOES TO BAHFA. SO, IN DESIGNING THESE 13 14 FUNDING PROGRAMS, THEY ARE DESIGNED TO BE COMPATIBLE WITH 15 GENERAL OBLIGATION OR GO BOND RULES, AS THAT IS THE INITIAL 16 EXPECTED REVENUE SOURCE GIVEN CURRENT VOTER SENTIMENT FOR A 2020 BALLOT MEASURE AND ALSO GENERATE SIGNIFICANT REVENUE. THE 17 INITIAL PROPOSAL THAT HAS BEEN ADVANCED IS AT LEAST \$10 18 MILLION IN GO BONDS WHICH WOULD BE DRAWN OVER TIME. SO IT'S 19 IMPORTANT TO NOTE, THOUGH, THAT UNDER GO BOND RULES THESE 20 21 PROCEEDS CAN ONLY FLAG WHAT WE CALL BRICKS AND STICKS OR 22 CAPITAL TYPE COSTS RELATED TO BUILDINGS. AND THAT MEANS THEY'RE NOT ABLE TO FUND PROTECTION MEASURES OR OPERATING 23 RENTAL SUBSIDIES OR ANY OTHER NON-CAPITAL COSTS. HOWEVER 24 25 CHANGES TO THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTION AND A.B. 1487

JANUARY 12, 2023

LEGISLATION ARE BEING PURSUED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, IN 1 TERMS OF THESE POTENTIAL CHANGES, BAHFA IS COLLABORATING WITH 2 3 STAKEHOLDERS WHO ARE PURSUING A STATEWIDE INSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT IN 2024 THAT WOULD CHANGE THE VOTER THRESHOLD FROM 4 5 TWO THIRDS TO A MAJORITY, AND TO ALLOW YEO BOND PROCEEDS TO FUND PROTECTION MEASURES AND PAY FOR OPERATING OTHER 6 SUBSIDIES. IT IS ALSO PURSUING A CLEAN UP AMENDMENT FOR A.B. 7 8 1487 THAT WOULD ALLOW ANY OF THESE APPROVED CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENTS TO APPLY TO BAHFA AND TO JUST BETTER CLARIFY THE 9 FULL RANGE OF BAHFA'S LENDING AUTHORITIES. I CAN GO TO THE 10 NEXT SLIDE. AND I'M GOING TO PASS THIS ON TO OLIVIA WHO IS 11 GOING TO GIVE AN OVERVIEW OF THE INITIAL FUNDING PROGRAMS. 12 13

OLIVIA SPECK: THANK YOU DANIELA. IN THIS SECTION WE'LL PROVIDE 14 15 OVERVIEW OF BAHFA'S INITIAL FUNDING PROGRAMS INCLUDING INITIAL 16 BATCH PROGRAMS AND RELEVANT LENDING PRODUCTS WE'LL PRESENT THE FUNDING PROGRAMS THAT CORRESPOND TO EACH OF THE THREE PS, 17 PRESERVATION PRODUCTION AND PRESENT GOALS AND OBJECTIVES AS 18 WELL AS SPECIFIC FINANCING LOCAL PRODUCTS THAT BAHFA WILL SEEK 19 TO DELIVER TO ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IN 20 21 DESIGNING THESE PROGRAMS OUR TEAM WORKING IN COORDINATION WITH 22 BAHFA AND MTC STAFF TRIED TO HONE IN ON PROGRAMS THAT WOULD MEET BAHFA'S PROGRAMMATICALS WHILE ALSO WORKING WITHIN THE 23 LEGISLATIVE PARAMETERS AS SET FORTH IN A.B. 1487 AND THE STATE 24 CONSTITUTION AS WELL AS THE REQUIREMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH GO 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

BOND FUNDING PROCEEDS IN ADDITION EACH OF THE FUNDING PROGRAMS 1 WE WILL DISCUSS SERVE TO MEET CERTAIN SOCIAL AND RACIAL EQUITY 2 3 GOALS AS DESCRIBED IN THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND SEEK TO HAVE I BROAD APPLICABILITY IN ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS ACROSS 4 5 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. KEEP IN MIND THESE PROGRAMS ARE 6 TRULY INITIAL IN NATURE AND WHILE BAHFA CONTINUES TO BUILD A TRACK RECORD AND RAISE REVENUE AND COMBINED WITH CONTINUING 7 8 LEGISLATION EVOLVING BAHFA WILL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE NEW CHANGE TO ITS EXISTING FUNDING PROGRAMS TO BETTER SUIT CHANGE OVER 9 TIME. AS A REGIONAL ENTITY, WE WANT TO ENSURE BAHFA CONTINUES 10 11 TO BE ALIGNED WITH THE REGION AND STAYING NIMBLE AND READY TO RESPOND TO NEW OPPORTUNITIES AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO IF 12 WE ASSUME THAT BAHFA'S INITIAL SOURCE OF REGIONAL HOUSING 13 REVENUE IS GHEE OWE BOND PROCEEDS A.B. 1487 PROVIDES 14 15 PARAMETERS FOR BUFFERING SUPPORT AND DIFFERENT FUNDING 16 PROGRAMS ACROSS EACH OF THE THREE PS, ALLOCATION FUNDING SPECIFICALLY THESE DIVISIONS ASSUME THAT 5% OF THE TOTAL 17 AMOUNT OF GO BOND PROCEEDS RAISED HAS ALREADY BEEN REMOVED TO 18 SUPPORT BAHFA ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS ALSO YOU CAN SEE 19 PROTECTIONS IS INCLUDED AND ALLOCATED MINIMUM OF 5% OF GO BOND 20 21 PROCEEDS. AS DANIELA MENTIONED CURRENTLY STATE CONSTITUTION 22 DOES NOT ALLOW GO BOND PROCEEDS TO SUPPORT PROTECTIONS PROGRAMMING SO IN ORDER TO ALLOCATE THE MINIMUM OF 5% OF GO 23 BONDS THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT SHE DESCRIBED WOULD NEED TO 24 25 BE APPROVED BY VOTERS ALTERNATIVELY BAHFA MAY FUND PROTECTION

JANUARY 12, 2023

PROGRAMS FROM ITS PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION PROGRAMS WHICH
 WE'LL BE DESCRIBING ON THE FOLLOWING SLIDES. LASTLY FUNDING
 FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT INCENTIVE ARE GRANT PROGRAMS TO SUPPORT
 HOUSING AND HOUSING RELATE COST IS ALSO INCLUDED. I'M GOING TO
 TURN IT OVER TO ULIS ON OUR TEAM TO EXPLAIN THE FUNDING
 PROGRAM FOR PRODUCTION.

7

8 SPEAKER: AS DISCUSSED PRODUCTION REPRESENTS THE GREATEST SHARE OF LEGISLATIVE SPENDING REQUIREMENTS CONSISTENT WITH 9 LEGISLATION PRODUCTION IS REALLY ABOUT SUPPORTING CREATION OF 10 ADDITIONAL LARGE MULTI-FAMILY RENT AT BUILDINGS THAT EXPAND 11 THE REGION'S HOUSING STOCK IN DELIVERING FINANCING PRODUCTION 12 FOUR MAIN OBJECTIVES BAHFA WILL PURSUE ARE FIRST TO STREAMLINE 13 FINANCING FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION, BAHFA WILL ACT AS A 14 COORDINATED SOURCE BY ITSELF OR IN CONJUNCTION WITH LOCAL 15 16 JURISDICTIONS AND OTHER FINANCING PARTNERS FOR ALL OR A MAJORITY OF A PROJECT SUBSIDY NEEDS. BRINGING FINANCING 17 RESOURCES FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION AND ALSO SUPPORT NEW MORE 18 FORTUNATE EFFICIENT WAYS TO PRODUCE HOUSING. SECOND BAHFA 19 PROVIDING FUNDING FROM STATE AND FEDERAL SOURCES WHERE 20 POSSIBLE ESPECIALLY TAX CREDITS AND TAX EXEMPT BONDS MORE THAN 21 22 BAHFA COULD ACHIEVE WITH ONE OF ITS OWN RESOURCES ALONE THEY 23 NEED TO ACHIEVE SCALE CONSIDERATIONS TO CREATE OVER250,000 UNITS IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING ACROSS THE BAY AREA IN THE 24 UPCOMING RHNA CYCLE THIRD, ACHIEVING EQUITY FRAMEWORK. LASTLY 25

THE FUNDING PROGRAM WILL SUPPORT BAHFA'S LONG-TERM FINANCIAL 1 STABILITY AND PROTECTIONS PROGRAMMING BY GENERATING INTEREST 2 3 IN FEES AS IN PRIOR SLIDE THOSE REVENUES GENERATE FROM PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION CAN BE REINVESTED TO BUILD AND 4 5 SUSTAIN PROTECTIONS PROGRAMMING WHICH CURRENTLY CANNOT BE FUNDED FROM GO BOND PROCEEDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE 6 FINANCING SYSTEM IS INEFFICIENT AND BAHFA WILL MAKE IT BETTER. 7 8 OUR COMPARISON SHOW LARGE MULTI-FAMILY PROJECTS WITHIN THE TRADITIONAL SYSTEM COMPARED TO BAHFA DEVELOPERS HAVE TO APPLY 9 TO MULTIPLE FUNDING SOURCES IN WHAT'S REFERRED TO AS A LAYER 10 11 CAKE OF FINANCING. COMPLEXITY THAT ADDS TIME AND COST TO PROJECT DEVELOPMENT CYCLES. BAHFA WILL SIMPLIFY THE LAYER CAKE 12 BY ACTING AS A COORDINATED SOURCE FOR BOTH DEBT AND SUBSIDY 13 NEW HOUSING PRODUCTION REQUIRES. BAHFA WORKS IN CONJUNCTION 14 WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS OR OTHER FINANCING PARTNERS WILL 15 16 PROVIDE A SOFT OR SUBSIDY LOAN, AS WELL AS A MUST PAY MORTGAGE LOAN. THE STREAMLINING WILL LOWER COST AND ACCELERATE PROJECT 17 COMPLETION BY APPLYING MULTIPLE SOURCES. SUPPORTING PROJECT 18 AFFORDABILITY WHILE PAYING LOAN WILL GENERATE INTEREST AND 19 FEES TO SUDDEN BAHFA FOR LONG-TERM PROTECTIONS. NEXT SLIDE 20 21 PLEASE.

22

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

DANIELA GREVILLE: I'M GOING TO DISCUSS THE PRODUCTION PROGRAM
LEVERAGING EXTERNAL FUNDING SOURCES PARTICULARLY LOW-INCOME
HOUSING TAX CREDIT ENABLING BAHFA TO SPREAD ITS FUNDS ACROSS

JANUARY 12, 2023

MORE PROJECTS THE INNOVATION PROGRAM WILL ALLOW BAHFA TO 1 SUPPORT UNIVERSAL PROJECT TYPES CONSISTENTLY ADDRESSED THROUGH 2 3 EXISTING CHANNELS. THE MAJORITY INNOVATION FUNDING CAN BE USED TO SUPPORT PRODUCTION NEW CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS AND FUNDING 4 5 PRESERVATION PROJECTS THERE ARE TYPES, OFFICIAL DELIVERY, AFFORDABLE UNIT BUY DOWN AND ADAPTIVE REUSE. I'LL DESCRIBE 6 THESE IN THE NEXT SLIDE. THE GOALS ARE THREE FOLD FIRST TO 7 8 SUPPORT A WIDER UNIVERSE OF PROJECT TYPES THAT ARE NOT BEING CONSISTENTLY ADDRESSED AND IT'S REALLY IMPERATIVE THAT BAHFA 9 ADVANCE NEW WAYS OF FINANCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING BECAUSE OF 10 THE OVERSUBSCRIPTION OF TAX CREDITS AND BONDS IN CALIFORNIA. 11 THE SECOND GOAL IS TO SUPPORT PROJECTS THAT CAN ACHIEVE FASTER 12 MORE COST EFFECTIVE DELIVERY. WE HAVE A HOUSING CRISIS AND THE 13 REGION NEEDS TO BUILD OVER 250,000 AFFORDABLE UNITS. WE NEED 14 15 TO ENCOURAGE METHODS TO LOWER COST AND DELIVER UNITS OUICKER. 16 FINALLY, THIRD GOAL TO PILOT ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO DELIVERING HOUSING. NEXT SLIDE. THE FIRST PROJECT I'LL 17 DESCRIBE WHAT'S CALLED "EFFICIENT DELIVERY." UNDER THIS 18 19 PROGRAM BAHFA WILL PROVIDE SUBSIDY LOANS THAT HAVE A LOWER DEVELOPMENT COST THAN THEIR PEERS WHETHER THROUGH FASTER PACE 20 21 OF DEVELOPMENT, FREE OR LOW COST LAND OR INNOVATIVE 22 CONSTRUCTIONS. ALONGSIDE LOWER COST BAHFA WILL PRIORITIZE 23 UNITS IT CAN DELIVER FASTER UNDER THIS PROGRAM PROJECTS DO NOT NECESSARILY HAVE TO USE TAX CREDITS AND BY FOREGOING THE TAX 24 CREDIT PROGRAM THESE PROJECTS CAN SUPPORT THE PRODUCTION OF 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

UNITS AT WIDER RANGE OF INCOMES FROM EXTREMELY LOW-INCOME 1 PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE HOUSING ALL THE WAY UP TO HIGHER INCOME 2 3 UNITS UP TO 80% OF AMI WITHOUT BEING HELD TO TAX CREDIT REGULATIONS AND SCORING CRITERIA, AND ALSO DELIVER UNITS 4 5 FASTER BY NOT HAVING TO SEEK A MULTITUDE OF FINANCIAL SOURCES INCLUDING TAX [INDISCERNIBLE] AND BONDS, WHICH ARE CURRENTLY 6 OVERSUBSCRIBED. IF YOU LOOK AT THE CHART, ON THE COLUMN ON THE 7 8 LEFT IT SHOWS A TRADITIONAL FINANCING STRUCTURE WHERE COSTS ARE HIGHER AND TAX CREDITS PROVIDE OVER 30% OF A PROJECT'S 9 FINANCING NEEDS. ON THE RIGHT, THIS COLUMN REPRESENTS 10 EFFICIENT DELIVERY WHERE BAHFA WILL SUPPORT THE LOWER COST 11 PROJECTS WITHOUT THE USE OF TAX CREDITS. AND SO THERE ARE 12 TRADEOFFS AS TAX CREDITS DO PROVIDE A SIGNIFICANT SOURCE OF 13 FUNDS AND THAT IS WHY WE'RE PRIORITIZING BOTH THE CORE 14 15 PRODUCTION PROGRAM AND AN INNOVATION PROGRAM, AND BAHFA ALSO 16 WANTS TO WORK CLOSELY WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WHO WILL SUPPORT THESE SAME PROJECTS AND CAN CONTRIBUTE FUNDING VIA 17 SUBSIDY LOANS OR ANNUAL LEASE PAYMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, 18 THIS SLIDE DEPICTS ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY PROJECTS. SO, THIS 19 WILL PILOT NEW PROPOSE TO DELIVERING HOUSING. FIRST IS 20 21 AFFORDABLE UNIT BUY DOWN WHERE BAHFA WILL PAY DEVELOPERS FOR 22 THE COST OF ADDING AFFORDABLE RENTAL UNITS INTO MARKET RATE RENTAL PROJECTS IF YOU LOOK AT THE CHART IN THE COLUMN ON THE 23 LEFT THIS SHOWS WHERE BAHFA AND POSSIBLY LOCAL JURISDICTIONS 24 WOULD PAY FOR THE COST OF LOCAL AFFORDABLE UNITS WHILE THE 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

DEVELOPER RAISES TRADITIONAL FINANCES FOR THE MARKET RATE
 UNITS ON THE RIGHT THIS COLUMN REPRESENTS ADAPTIVE REUSE WHERE
 BAHFA AND LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WILL CONTRIBUTE A SUBSIDY LOAN
 TO HELP CONVERT COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS TO AFFORDABLE RENTAL
 HOUSING. YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE WHERE OLIVIA WILL
 DISCUSS PRESERVATION.

7

8 **OLIVIA SPECK:** PRESERVATION RESIDENCES SECOND LARGEST ALLOCATION OF REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE WITH THIS PROGRAM 9 TRYING TO SUPPORT THE ACQUISITION REHABILITATION, AND 10 11 PRESERVATION OF AFFORDABLE RENT LEVELS WITHIN TWO TYPES OF HOUSING STOCK THESE ARE UNREGULATED PROPERTIES OR PROPERTIES 12 THAT ARE NATURALLY AFFORDABLE AND HAVE NO EXISTING REGULATORY 13 RESTRICTIONS AND EXPIRING USE PROPERTIES OR PROPERTIES THAT 14 15 HAVE CURRENT REGULATORY RESTRICTIONS BUT ARE AT RISK OF LOSING 16 THOSE AND CONVERTING TO MARKET RATE LEVELS. WITH THIS FUNDING PROGRAM BAHFA WILL AIM TO ACCOMPLISH SEVERAL GOALS FIRSTLY 17 18 PREVENTING DISPLACEMENT OF LOCATION AND MODERATE MECHANIC 19 TENANTS BY PROVIDING PRODUCTS TO HELP BORROWERS STABILIZE PROPERTIES AT AFFORDABLE LEVELS AND SECOND STREAMLINING 20 FINANCING AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT THESE PRESERVATION PROJECTS BY 21 ACTING AS COORDINATED SINGLE SOURCE OF FINANCING BAHFA INTENDS 22 23 TO IMPLEMENT THIS PROGRAM TO ALIGN WITH ITS EOUITY OBJECTIVE AS SPECIFIED IN THE EQUITY FRAMEWORK AND LASTLY PROVIDING BOTH 24 LONG-TERM AND SHORT-TERM OF NEEDED DEBT PRODUCTS BAHFA WILL BE 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

ABLE TO GENERATE REVENUE FROM INTEREST FEES THAT CAN HELP 1 SUPPORT SUSTAINABILITY OVERALL AND BEING E I KNOW VESTED OVER 2 3 TIME TO FUND PROTECTIONS PROGRAMS EVENTUALLY PROVIDING MORE SUBSIDY LOANS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. FIRST WE'LL LOOK AT 4 5 FINANCING BAHFA WILL PROVIDE FOR UNREGULATED BUILDINGS. IN THIS CASE BAHFA WILL PROVIDE MUST PAY FIRST MORTGAGE DEBT AND 6 SUBSIDY AND IF NEEDED FAST ACTING EARLY STAGE FUNDING 7 8 REDEVELOPMENT ACQUISITION AND REHABILITATION. THIS CHART SHOWS THESE PRODUCT SUPERVISOR THEIR POTENTIAL SOURCES AT TWO POINTS 9 IN THE DEVELOPMENT CYCLE. AND AS A REMINDER THESE PROPERTIES 10 11 TEND TO BE SMALLER AND THEY DON'T HAVE ANY AFFORDABILITY RESTRICTIONS. SO, INITIALLY, YOU WOULD HAVE THE FAST ACTING 12 ACOUISITION REHABILITATION FUNDING THAT BORROWERS ARE ABLE TO 13 ACCESS TO QUICKLY ACQUIRE PROPERTIES THAT ARE AT RISK OF BEING 14 SOLD TO MARKET RATE DEVELOPERS AND THIS TYPE OF FUNDING MAY 15 16 COME FROM BAHFA IF NEEDED OR IT MAY COME FROM A LOCAL FINANCING PARTNER AND THEN ONCE THE REHABILITATION ON THE 17 BUILDING IS COMPLETE, THEN THE PROJECT'S PERMANENT FINANCING 18 19 WOULD COME IN TO REPAY ACOUISITION AND REHABILITATION FINANCING WHILE ALSO ENSURING THAT THE BUILDING STAYS 20 21 AFFORDABLE. AND SO FOR THE PERMANENT FINANCING BAHFA CAN 22 PROVIDE THE TWO COOPERATE THE LOAN PRODUCTS A MUST PAY MORTGAGE LOAN AND A SOFTER SUBSIDY LOAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 23 NEXT WE I HAVE CHART THAT SHOWS THESE SAME TWO PHASES IN THE 24 DEVELOPMENT CYCLE BUT FOR EXPIRING USE PROPERTIES. THESE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 12, 2023

PROPERTIES TENDER TO BE LARGER BUILDINGS THAT HAVE SOME, SORT 1 OF, EXPIRING AFFORDABILITY RESTRICTIONS SUCH AS A TAX CREDIT 2 3 PROPERTY WHERE THE COMPLIANCE PERIOD IS ENDING, FOR THESE PROJECTS BAHFA WILL BE PROVIDING THE SAME PRODUCTS AT BOTH 4 5 PHASES SO THE ACCUSATION AND REHABILITATION FINANCING IF NEEDED AND THIRST MORTGAGE LOAN AND SUBSIDY LOAN BUT DIFFERENT 6 SCALES GIVEN THE FACT THAT THESE PROPERTIES CAN REAPPLY FOR 7 8 FEDERAL TAX CREDITS SO IF THESE PROPERTIES WERE TO SECURE TAX CREDITS THE FIRST MORTGAGE LOAN MAY NOT NEED TO BE AS LOW COST 9 AS THE ONE BAHFA WOULD BE PROVIDING FOR UNREGULATED PROPERTIES 10 11 ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE BECAUSE THE PROJECT IS RECEIVING BOTH A SUBSIDY LOAN FROM BAHFA AS WELL AS THE TAX CREDITS. NOW I'M 12 GOING TO TURN ON TURNOVER TO DANIELA TO DISCUSS BAHFA'S 13 FUNDING PROTECTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 14

15

16 DANIELA GREVILLE: THE LAST PROGRAM IS PROTECTIONS, THE PROTECTIONS PROGRAM ARE TO PROTECT TENANTS FROM DISPLACEMENT 17 AND PREVENT HOMELESSNESS INCLUDING EVICTION RELATED LEGAL 18 SERVICES COUNSELING RENTAL EDUCATION, CAN PROVIDE EMERGENCY 19 RENTAL ASSISTANCE RELOCATION FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE AND PROVIDE 20 FUNDING FOR COLLECTION AND TRACK OF DATA RELATED TO 21 22 DISPLACEMENT AND EVICTION THERE ARE CONSTITUTIONAL AND 23 LEGISLATIVE RESTRICTIONS RIGHT NOW THAT PREVENT BAHFA AND OTHER COUNTIES FROM USING REVENUE FROM GO BONDS FOR PROTECTION 24 MEASURES WHICH MAKES THE DEVELOPMENT OF THESE PROGRAMS 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT UNTIL WE HAVE A CONFIRMATION OF A 1 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT PASSING. BUT IN THE MEANTIME BAHFA IS 2 3 PURSUING FUNDING SOURCES FROM PRIVATE SECTOR PHILANTHROPY STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS AND FUTURE REVENUE THAT 4 5 GENERATES FROM PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION LENDING ACTIVITIES, BAHFA WILL WORK TO ADD VALUE TO EXISTING TENANT PROTECTIONS 6 THAT ARE UNDERWAY IN BAY AREA CITIES AND COUNTIES REALLY BY 7 8 FACILITATING REGIONAL COLLABORATION RESEARCH AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR EXAMPLE, BAHFA WILL CONVENE BEST PRACTICES AND 9 NEW PROGRAM IDEAS AND BAHFA EXPECTS TO HOST ITS FIRST MEETING 10 THIS MARCH ALSO AT THE REQUEST OF JURISDICTIONS IT CAN 11 COMMISSION SPECIFIC RESEARCH PROJECTS TO ASSIST THE REGION IN 12 PROGRAM AND IMPLEMENTATION. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, THE SCOPING OF A 13 STUDY FOR EVICTION PREVENTION, BEST PRACTICES IS CURRENTLY 14 15 UNDERWAY, AND FINALLY BAHFA WILL COORDINATE WITH MTC REGIONAL 16 PLANNINGS -- MTC'S REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM AND ITS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE INITIATIVES, SO FOR EXAMPLE, MTC'S RECENT TRANSIT 17 ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY INCLUDES IMPORTANT TENANT 18 PROTECTIONS THAT BAHFA CAN HELP FACILITATE SUCH AS JUST CAUSE 19 EVICTION LAWS FAIR HOUSING ENFORCEMENT AND FORECLOSURE AND 20 21 RENTAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS. AND THEN OVER TIME, AS BAHFA 22 GENERATES NEW REVENUE, IT WILL BE ABLE TO WORK WITH LOCAL 23 JURISDICTIONS TO SUPPORT THEIR PILOT PROGRAMS. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, FOR PROTECTIONS THIS MAY INCLUDE EVICTION DIVERSION 24 RIGHT TO COUNSEL AND EXPANDED TENANT EDUCATION PROGRAMS FOR 25

> HOMELESSNESS PREVENTION THIS COULD INCLUDE SUPPORTING PROGRAMS 1 2 THAT AIM TO BETTER INTEGRATE HEALTH, HOUSING, AND HOMELESSNESS 3 SERVICES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, FINALLY, LONGER TERM, IF A LARGER MORE CONSISTENT SOURCE OF PROTECTION FUNDING BECOMES AVAILABLE 4 5 VIA GO BONDS, COUPLED WITH BAHFA'S FUTURE REVENUE FROM LENDING 6 ACTIVITIES ADDITIONAL PROGRAMS COULD INCLUDE IMPROVING DATA SYSTEMS AND INFRASTRUCTURE TO IMPLEMENT AND EVALUATE 7 8 PROTECTIONS POLICIES, AS WELL AS PROVIDING DIRECT FUNDING FOR TENANT PROTECTION SERVICES SUCH AS LEGAL SERVICES AND 9 10 COUNSELING, AS WELL AS RENTAL AND RELOCATION FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE FOR RESIDENTS. SO THIS CONCLUDES THE FUNDING 11 PROGRAMS, AND I WILL HAND IT OFF TO JULISS TO DISCUSS NEXT 12 STEPS. 13

JANUARY 12, 2023

14

SPEAKER: GREAT. THANK YOU DANIELA. AND IF WE COULD ADVANCE A 15 16 COUPLE OF SLIDES? AND ONE MORE SLIDE. THANK YOU. THIS SLIDE HERE HIGHLIGHTS -- OH SORRY. BACK ONE. SO THE PRIOR SLIDE WITH 17 THE VISUAL REALLY HIGHLIGHTS SOME OF THE KEY DATES, SUMMARIZES 18 WHAT OUR TEAM WILL BE WORKING ON OVER THE COURSE OF THE YEAR. 19 IF WE COULD GO BACK ONE SLIDE. THERE WE GO. SO, WHEN THIS 20 21 TIMELINE SHOWS IS WE'RE WORKING OVER THE COURSE OF THE YEAR TARGETING ADOPTION OF THE BAHFA BUSINESS PLAN BY THE END OF 22 THE YEAR TO PURSUE A BALLOT MEASURE IN 2024 AND ALL OF THE 23 OUTREACH AND PREPARATION THAT NEEDS TO GO WITH THAT. ALONG THE 24 WAY WE'LL BE RETURNING TO THE BAHFA AND ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 12, 2023

AND BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE FOR ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION AND 1 APPROVALS OF INTERIM DELIVERABLES. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE 2 3 NOW. THIS ZOOMS IN ON KEY DATES OVER THE NEXT YEAR UPCOMING RETURNING WITH FURTHER REFINED FUNDING PROGRAMS EOUITY 4 5 FRAMEWORK REFLECTING FEEDBACK RECEIVED TODAY AS WELL AS DETAIL ON BAHFA OPERATIONS AND STRUCTURE, WITH FINALIZATION OF THE 6 BUSINESS PLAN AGAIN ANTICIPATED TO OCCUR BY THE END OF THIS 7 8 YEAR. THIS FUNDING PROGRAMS AND THE BUSINESS PLANNING PROCESS, IN GENERAL, WILL SET GENERAL PARAMETERS FOR HOW BAHFA WILL 9 10 OPERATE AS THE BUSINESS PLANNING PROCESS PROCEEDS THERE WILL BE AMP OPPORTUNITIES FOR FURTHER INPUT AND LOTS MORE DETAIL TO 11 BE EXPANDED ON AS BAHFA CONTINUES TO DEVELOP ITS PROGRAMMING 12 AND EXPENDITURE PLAN AS RELATED TO THE BOND MEASURE. ALL OF 13 THESE STEPS WILL BE SUBJECT TO FURTHER REVIEW AND APPROVAL, 14 AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING THOSE NEXT DELIVERABLES TO 15 DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL AT LATER DATES, AND THAT REALLY, THAT 16 CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION FOR TODAY. THANKS VERY MUCH. 17

18

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M BRINGING THIS BACK
TO THE COMMITTEE. THERE ARE ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO HAVE
COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? YES, CHAIR PEDROZA?

22

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MARGARET. YOU
KNOW, I THINK THIS IS A GREAT PRESENTATION. SO, THANK YOU FOR
DOING IT. YOU KNOW, JUST TWO QUESTIONS. ON THE CAPITAL

JANUARY 12, 2023

PARTICIPATION WE HAVE, OR, YOU KNOW, THE ROLE THAT WE COULD 1 PLAY, IS THERE ANY CONDITIONS THAT WE COULD PUT ON IT LIKE 2 3 DENSITY BONUSES? BECAUSE TO ME US PARTICIPATING THERE IS A LOT OF VALUE AND BENEFIT BUT I'M TRYING TO FIGURE HOW THE HOW TO 4 5 LEVERAGE THAT FOR THE GREATER GOOD WHICH IS TRYING TO PRODUCE MORE HOUSING. HAS THAN EVER BEEN CONSIDERED OR DISCUSSED OR IS 6 IT EVEN ARE POSSIBLE. SO THAT'S ONE OUESTION. THEN THE OTHER 7 8 QUESTION IS THE OPPORTUNITY -- DO WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO BUY LAND? DO WE HAVE THAT AUTHORITY? SO THAT'S THE SECOND 9 10 QUESTION.

11

12 KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER13 THOSE QUESTIONS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** PLEASE.

16

17 KATE HARTLEY: ON YOUR SECOND QUESTION, FIRST, SUPERVISOR
18 PEDROZA, THE 1487 DOES NOT PROHIBIT US FROM BUYING LAND, IT
19 ALSO DOES NOT ENUMERATE LAND ACQUISITION AS AN AFFIRMATIVE
20 POWER OF BAHFA, AND, SO, WE ARE CONSIDERING INCLUSION IN THE
21 1487 CLEAN-UP OF JUST CLARIFYING THAT BAHFA, INDEED, CAN BUY
22 LAND FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PURPOSES. SO, THAT MAY -- WE MAY
23 GET CLARITY ON THAT.

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR CLARIFYING THAT, AND I 1 LIKE HOW WE'RE TAKING THIS INTO THE AFFIRMATIVE THAT WE CAN. 2 3 PART OF WHAT I OFTEN HEAR IS THE LAND COST OR ACQUISITION COST IS SOMETIMES WHAT DRIVES HIGHER BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING 4 5 THERE IS STRATEGIC INVESTMENTS THAT WE CAN PAIR UP WITH TRANSPORTATION INCENTIVE THERE IS MAGIC THAT CAN HAPPEN IN 6 THAT SPACE THAT CAN BE GROUNDBREAKING SO FOR THAT REASON I 7 8 WOULD REALLY HOPE WE CAN DO THAT TO ENCOURAGE LAND 9 ACQUISITION.

10

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

KATE HARTLEY: ATTACHING REQUIREMENTS FOR DENSITY BONUSES AND 11 OTHER CONDITIONS FOR INVESTMENTS, FOR THE REGIONAL HOUSING WE 12 CAN CREATE FUNDING GUIDELINES FOR OUR INVESTMENTS FOR THE 13 REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE. SO WE WILL BE BRINGING THOSE TO THE 14 ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND TO THE BAHFA BOARD. SO YOU WILL SEE 15 16 THEM. BUT WE CAN, FOR EXAMPLE, PRIORITIZE CERTAIN USES OF FUNDS LIKE LOCATION IN A GEOGRAPHY THAT REDUCES VEHICLE MILES 17 TRAVELED AND GREENHOUSE GAS PRODUCTIONS THAT HAS CERTAIN 18 DENSITY BENEFITS THAT PROMOTE STREAMLINING AND CERTAIN 19 AFFORDABILITY RESTRICTIONS. I WOULD LOOK TO COUNSEL TO CONFIRM 20 21 BUT I THINK WE COULD ATTACH THOSE KINDS OF CONDITIONS ON 22 REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUES THROUGH OUR FUNDING GUIDELINES. 23

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: WHAT I AM INTERESTED IN FROM AN
OUTCOME PERSPECTIVE IS IF THERE IS A MUNICIPALITY OR PROJECT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 12, 2023

THAT HAS X UNITS TO THE ACRE AND NOW THEY'RE WILLING TO DO X 1 2 PLUS FIVE OR 10X, THAT'S PRODUCING MORE UNITS. RIGHT? SO 3 THAT'S AN OUTCOME THAT WE SHOULD BE INCENTIVIZING AND NOURISHING SO IT'S KIND OF THAT INCENTIVE PRODUCED TO THE 4 5 GREATER GOOD I DON'T WANT TO INVEST IN ANOTHER REASON BUT TO BE CAREFUL OF THE EQUITY IN THAT IN TERMS OF -- I WANT TO 6 7 SUPPORT AT A GREATER RATE IF POSSIBLE. 8 KATE HARTLEY: IN GUIDING PRINCIPLES ADDRESSING HOUSING NEEDS 9 AT SCALE WE CAN DO THAT THROUGH DENSITY. SO WE WILL BE WRITING 10 UP FUNDING GUIDELINES THAT REFLECT THOSE PRINCIPLES. 11 12 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 13 14 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. YES, MEMBER EKLUND? 15 16 PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IN SEVERAL OF YOUR SLIDES, 17 YOU REFERENCE THAT THE, EITHER --18 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: --20 21 22 PAT ECKLUND: PARDON ME? IN SOME OF YOUR SLIDES YOU REFERENCE BAHFA AND/OR THE LOCAL JURISDICTION. WHAT ABOUT NON-PROFIT? 23 LIKE, WITH NOVATO, WE DON'T NECESSARILY GIVE MONEY TO A 24 25 DEVELOPER, OR, WE MAY NOT -- WE WOULD PROBABLY NOT BE INCLINED

JANUARY 12, 2023

TO NOT NECESSARILY PURCHASE THE PROPERTY BUT WE COULD ENTER
 INTO A CONTRACT WITH EAH OR HOMEWARD BOUND OR HABITAT FOR
 HUMANITY OR WHATEVER THAT'S GOING TO BE DOING SOME AFFORDABLE
 HOUSING. SO, WHY COULDN'T WE USE NON-PROFITS DIRECTLY?

KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I CAN ANSWER THAT. WE DO PLAN 6 ON PARTNERING DIRECTLY WITH NON-PROFITS. SO, A VERY 7 8 TRADITIONAL MEANS OF BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHICH WE WILL BE DOING IS TO ISSUE A NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY, THE 9 NON-PROFITS RESPOND AND WE MAKE LOANS. AND WE MAKE LOANS TO 10 THE NON-PROFITS. AND THEY BUILD THE BUILDINGS. THEY HAVE THE 11 EXPERTISE AND CONSTRUCTION AND OPERATIONS AND PROPERTY 12 MANAGEMENT. AND IF WE CAN DO THAT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE 13 JURISDICTIONS SO THAT BAHFA'S MONEY GOES FARTHER, THAT IS 14 15 GREAT. AND, AGAIN, WE WANT TO PROMOTE OUR OVERARCHING GOALS OF 16 DENSITY AND EQUITY AND SCALE, AND AFFORDABILITY, AND WE KNOW THAT JURISDICTIONS DO TOO. AND THE NON-PROFITS DO TOO. SO 17 WE'RE EXPECTING TO BE ENTERING INTO SOME GREAT PARTNERSHIPS 18 WITH NON-PROFITS. 19

20

21 PAT ECKLUND: I JUST KNOW THAT I HAVE HEARD FROM SEVERAL NON22 PROFITS SAYING THAT SOME OF THE SMALLER ONES ARE REALLY NOT
23 THAT COMPETITIVE. AND, SO, THEY DON'T WANT TO EVEN SPEND THE
24 EFFORT TO TRY TO EVEN APPLY. AND GIVEN THAT THEY DON'T HAVE A
25 GOOD -- THEY SOMETIMES FEEL THAT THEY MAY NOT HAVE A GOOD



CHANCE, BUT THIS IS A NEW PROGRAM, SO MAYBE THEY'LL HAVE A
 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE. BUT I GUESS WE'LL SEE.

KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR, THERE'S A COUPLE OF WAYS FOR 4 5 EMERGING DEVELOPERS AND SMALLER DEVELOPERS TO PARTICIPATE IN BAHFA'S FUNDING PROGRAMS. THE FIRST IS THROUGH PRESERVATION. 6 BECAUSE THE SMALLER DEVELOPERS ARE REALLY GRIT AT SMALLER 7 8 SCALE PRESERVATION WORK. THEY'RE RIGHT IN THE COMMUNITIES. THEY KNOW THE COMMUNITIES, AND THEY TEND TO DO THE BEST JOB AT 9 THOSE DEVELOPMENTS. THERE IS ALSO, FOR THE LARGER NEW 10 CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS, YOU DO NEED A CERTAIN LEVEL OF 11 EXPERIENCE TO BE SUCCESSFUL IN THOSE, BUT WE EXPECT THAT THERE 12 SHOULD BE SOME JOINT VENTURE PARTNERSHIPS AVAILABLE FOR THE 13 EMERGING AND SMALL DEVELOPERS TO PARTICIPATE. 14

15

3

16 PAT ECKLUND: THANK YOU.

17

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO, I AM GOING TO BE HANDING BACK THE MEETING TO OUR CHAIR PEDROZA. IF YOU DON'T MIND, THOUGH, CHAIR, I ACTUALLY DO HAVE TO JUMP OFF THE CALL IN A FEW MINUTES, SO IF I COULD ASK A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS?

23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: GO AHEAD.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. I AGREE WITH THE CHAIR'S 1 COMMENTS, I AGREE HAVING LAND IS EXTREMELY VALUABLE. I GUESS 2 3 MAYBE IN COMPARISON OR CONTRAST, I WAS INTERESTED IN, ON PAGE 14, THE AFFORDABLE UNIT BUY DOWN APPROACH. I -- I GUESS THE 4 5 QUESTION THERE IS, IS, DEPENDING ON THE DEVELOPER, OR, IT'S VERY HARD JUST TO SEE THEIR PRO FORMA BECAUSE OFTENTIMES IT'S 6 PRIVATE INFORMATION ARE, IT'S OFTEN DEBATED IN TERMS OF HOW 7 8 MUCH PROFIT A DEVELOPER IS MAKING OR SHOULD BE MAKING, AND, SO, ARE WE LOOKING AT SOME KIND OF CAPS IN TERMS OF WHAT YOU 9 10 WOULD SPEND TO BUY DOWN A UNIT, FOR INSTANCE, AND I GUESS, AND THEN COMPARING THAT TO OTHER APPROACHES, LIKE LAND BANKING OR, 11 YOU KNOW, OTHER STRATEGIES THAT MIGHT COME -- RESULT IN A 12 HIGHER NUMBER OF AFFORDABLE UNITS, AS SIMILAR TO THE CHAIR'S 13 COMMENTS, THAT MY INTEREST IS, OF COURSE, AS MANY UNITS AS WE 14 15 CAN GET.

16

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR. YES, WE WANT TO TAKE 17 ADVANTAGE EVER ALL THE OPPORTUNITIES FOR A MORE AFFORDABLE 18 HOUSING THAT ARISE IN ALL KINDS OF DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS AND 19 DIFFERENT KINDS OF PROJECTS. SO, MANY JURISDICTIONS HAVE 20 INCLUSIONARY REQUIREMENTS, 15%, 20%. AND WE THINK THAT WE 21 COULD COME IN, AFTER CONSTRUCTION, HAVE AN AGREEMENT WITH THE 22 DEVELOPER AND PROVIDE A PER UNIT LOAN, BELOW MARKET RATE LOAN 23 WITH, YOU KNOW, DEFERRED INTEREST AND ALL OF THE ABOVE, JUST 24 25 TO KEEP OUR -- KEEP SOME KIND OF ENFORCEMENT MECHANISM, SO

JANUARY 12, 2023

THAT WE CAN INCREASE THAT INCLUSIONARY REOUIREMENT. SO THERE 1 WOULD ALREADY BE AN UNDER INCLUSIONARY ORDINANCE. AND IT'S NOT 2 3 THAT WE HAVE TO SEE EVERY BIT OF THEIR FINANCIAL PRO FORMA, BUT WE WILL HAVE TO COME TO AN AGREEMENT WITH THEM ON WHAT THE 4 5 PER UNIT COST IS, AND WE'LL HAVE SOME ESTIMATES THAT WE'LL DO OURSELVES ABOUT WHAT'S REASONABLE AND WHAT'S NOT. AND IF THEY 6 COME IN WITH AN UNREASONABLE COST OF COURSE WE WON'T BE DOING 7 8 THAT. BECAUSE OF COURSE, WE WANT TO INVEST IN COST EFFECTIVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING. SO WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT THAT BECAUSE WE 9 THINK THAT IS A REALLY GREAT OPPORTUNITY TO INCREASE 10 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ALL KINDS OF JURISDICTIONS AND WE'LL BE 11 -- WE'LL HAVE OUR FINANCIAL MODELS READY. SO WE KNOW WHAT'S A 12 GOOD DEAL AND WHAT'S NOT. 13

14

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. THANK YOU. YEAH. WE DO THAT DEBATE. 15 16 WE HAVE 15%, CAN WE PUSH IT TO 20? 25? AND YOU KNOW, THE 17 DEBATE THAT WE'RE HAVING RIGHT NOW. AND JUST A COMMENTARY, REGARDING THE LOCAL SIDE, FUNDING OF UNITS IS THERE CRITERIA 18 FOR PRIORITIZING WHERE FUNDS WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED? SO, WE --19 LIKE I WAS SAYING, NOW WE ACTUALLY REOUIRE INCLUSIONARY UNITS 20 21 TO BE BUILT, AND WE USED TO ALLOW FOR AN IN LIEU FEE. SO, WE USED TO BE ABLE TO HAVE A LOT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDS, BUT 22 THAT'S NOW DRYING UP BECAUSE OF LEGISLATIVE WORKING GROUP 23 AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDS BECAUSE THEY'RE NOW REQUIRING THE 24 UNITS TO BE BUILT. SO, I WOULD ASK FOR CONSIDERATION OF THOSE 25

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 12, 2023

1 TYPES OF SCENARIOS BECAUSE IN THE PAST WE DID FUND A LOT OF 2 PROJECTS THAT WE'RE MOVING INTO DIFFERENT TYPES OF SCENARIOS 3 NOW, SO THE LOCAL FUNDS MAY NOT BE AS AVAILABLE. THANK YOU. 4 THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONER FOR FILLING IN AS WELL.

5

ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR FILLING IN AS
WELL. COMMISSIONER ROMERO. FIRST ONE HAS TO DO WITH A
STATEMENT THAT WAS MADE EARLIER

9

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THAT REVENUE FROM PRODUCTION AND 10 11 PRESERVATION COULD BE USED FOR THE PROTECTIONS PIECE. AND I WANTED TO UNDERSTAND THAT BETTER SO IS THAT BASICALLY CAPITAL 12 THAT'S COMING OFF LET'S SAY A LOAN REPAYMENT? BUT IS IT THE 13 PRINCIPLE THAT MIGHT BE PAYABLE? IS IT THE INTEREST THAT'S 14 15 ONLY AVAILABLE? ARE WE TALKING ABOUT LOAN FEES. ARE WE 16 BASICALLY CLEANING THE MONEY BY HAVING IT COME BACK IN A PRINCIPLE INTEREST PAYMENT? COULD SOMEBODY EXPLAIN THAT 17 MECHANISM THAT ALLOWS THE MONEY TO BE USED FOR PROTECTION? 18

19

20 KATE HARTLEY: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I WOULDN'T CHARACTERIZE IT AS 21 CLEANING THE MONEY SIMPLY BAHFA INTENDS TO IN ADDITION TO 22 MAKING GAP FUNDS GAP LOANS WHICH DON'T HAVE A STRONG REPAYMENT 23 VOLUME, BUT AMORTIZING FIRST MORTGAGE LOANS DO. AND SO WE WILL 24 HAVE INTEREST AND PRINCIPLE REPAID, AND ALSO FEES. AND SO 25 WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO TAKE THOSE PROCEEDS AND SUSTAIN

JANUARY 12, 2023

BAHFA'S OPERATIONS AND ALSO REINVEST THEM IN THE COMMUNITIES
AND IN THE HARDER TO FUND ACTIVITIES LIKE TENANT PROTECTIONS.
THIS IS A LONGER TERM VISION FOR BAHFA. WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE
ABLE TO DO THAT IN YEAR 1, 2, OR THREE, BUT WE'LL GET STARTED
AND ANY FIRST MORTGAGE LOAN THAT WE HAVE THAT'S AMORTIZING
WILL BE A SOURCE OF THOSE PROCEEDS FOR US AND OVER TIME WILL
BUILD THAT FUNDING STREAM.

8

9 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: SO BOTH THE PRINCIPAL AND THE 10 INTEREST?

11

12 KATE HARTLEY: FOR FIRST MORTGAGE LOANS, YES.

13

14 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, IT 15 COULD BE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT WINDS UP IN THERE 16 --

17

18 KATE HARTLEY: YES.

19

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: ON SLIDE 11, I JUST WANTED TO
UNDERSTAND A LITTLE BIT. YOU'RE SHOWING THE TYPICAL CAPITAL
STACK THAT WE ALL USE WHEN WE'RE DEVELOPING AFFORDABLE
HOUSING, CLEARLY THERE ARE A PANOPLY OF SOURCES THAT WE NEED
TO COBBLE TOGETHER ALONG WITH TAX CREDITS TO MAKE THESE
DEVELOPMENTS WORK. THIS SLIDE THAT I'M LOOKING AT, 11,

ACTUALLY SHOWS THE SOURCES IN ORANGE AND YELLOW AND WHATEVER 1 COLORS THOSE ARE, THAT HUE, THE LOCAL SUBSIDIES, IT SHOWS THAT 2 BAHFA WILL BE REPLACING THOSE. DO WE ANTICIPATE THAT BAHFA 3 WOULD BE ABLE TO SUPPLANT, WHETHER IT'S AHP, OR WHETHER IT'S 4 5 ALL THE OTHER -- YOU KNOW, WISH, ALL THE OTHER PROGRAMS THAT ARE OUT THERE, DO YOU THINK THERE IS THAT MUCH CAPITAL TO 6 REPLACE -- THOSE OTHER SOURCE WHICH IS CLEARLY TAKE US A LONG 7 8 TIME TO GET AND WHY IT TAKES US SUCH A LONG TIME TO DEVELOP THESE THINGS. 9

10

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

KATE HARTLEY: CERTAINLY HP, DEFINITELY, HP IS AN ONEROUS 11 APPLICATION AND IT'S NOT VERY HIGH VOLUME SO WE COULD 12 DEFINITELY REPLACE THAT IF HCD FOR EXAMPLE, IS COMING IN WITH 13 \$200,000, THEN WE WOULD LIKE TO WORK IN CONJUNCTION WITH OTHER 14 15 LENDS LIKE THAT. BUT LOWER SCALE LENDERS LIKE HP AND SOME 16 JURISDICTIONS OF SMALLER CITIES ABLE TO MAKE VERY HIGH PER UNIT LOANS THEY JUST MAY ONLY HAVE CDBG AND HOME FUNDS TO WORK 17 WITH, AND IF WE COULD WORK WITH REPLACEMENT FUNDS FOR THOSE 18 LOWER LEVEL LOANS IT SAVES A LOT OF TIME AND THAT TIME SAVINGS 19 IS WHERE CONSTRUCTION COSTS SAVINGS COMES IN MY ANSWER TO YOU 20 21 IS YES WE CAN'T REPLACE EVERY ONE, LIKE HD LOANS THAT ARE HIGHER VALUE. 22

23

24 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: SO RIGHT INSTEAD OF HAVING 15
25 WE'LL MAYBE GET DOWN TO SIX.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1

JANUARY 12, 2023

KATE HARTLEY: THAT'S A BIG REDUCTION. 2 3 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: SLIDE 14 TALKS ABOUT ALTERNATIVE 4 5 DELIVERY. I ASSUME THAT IF WE'RE DOING LET ME MAKE SURE I'M ON THE RIGHT SLIDE HERE. SOURCE ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY. YES, ON 6 ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY, AND YOU PARTIALLY ANSWERED THIS 7 8 QUESTION, WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT DOING AN AFFORDABLE UNITS BUY DOWN ON EXISTING INCLUSIONARY OBLIGATIONS? 9 10 KATE HARTLEY: NO. 11 12 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: TO THE EXTENT THAT COULD BE MADE 13 CLEAR AND MAYBE I'M NOT READING THIS. BUT I THINK IT'S 14 15 IMPORTANT THAT ALL OF OUR JURISDICTIONS SHOULD HAVE AN 16 INCLUSIONARY ORDINANCE WHETHER 10, 15, OR 20 AND EAST PALO ALTO HAS 20 AND WE JUST APPROVED IT AT 30, 50, AND 60 SO IT'S 17 POSSIBLE TO DO. BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT JUST TO MAKE 18 SURE THAT PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE NOT, YOU KNOW, OFFERING 19 THESE FUNDS TO FOLKS WHO HAVE INCLUSIONARY OBLIGATIONS RATHER 20 21 IT'S ABOVE AND BEYOND THAT I THINK THAT'S WHAT YOU SAID, 22 CORRECT?

23

24 KATE HARTLEY: YES. AND I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON SOMETHING THAT
25 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA DID SAY SHE WAS TALKING ABOUT INDIVIDUAL

JANUARY 12, 2023

PROJECTS WHERE HER JURISDICTION IS NEGOTIATING. IS IT 15? IS 1 IT 20? IS IT 25%? HOW -- HOW MUCH CAN THAT DEVELOPMENT 2 ACCOMMODATE. WE WON'T BE A PART OF THOSE CONVERSATIONS BECAUSE 3 THAT WILL FALL UNDER LOCAL JURISDICTIONS'S OWN INCLUSIONARY 4 5 ORDINANCE AND THE NEGOTIATIONS BETWEEN THE CITY OR COUNTY AND THE DEVELOPER AND WE WANT TO PROVIDE ANY DEVELOPMENT THAT WE 6 CAN PROVIDE ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO GO HIGHER, SO THE VIEW IS 7 8 ABLE TO NEGOTIATE A 25% INCLUSIONARY PERHAPS COME IN AND TAKE THAT INCLUSIONARY UP TO 30 OR 35%. 9

10

CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: TO THE DISCUSSION THAT MARGARET 11 HAD, AM I MISUNDERSTANDING WHEN THERE IS LOCAL SUBSIDY IN THIS 12 CASE, IT WOULD BE A LOAN ON A DEVELOPMENT FROM A PUBLIC 13 ENTITY, THAT IS WHEN WE HAVE THE ABLE TO OPEN UP A DEVELOPERS 14 BOOKS. CORRECT? BECAUSE IF IT'S A COMPLETELY PRIVATE DEAL, 15 16 RIGHT, THEN I UNDERSTAND HOW IT'S MUCH MORE DIFFICULT IF NOT 17 IMPOSSIBLE TO SAY PLEASE GIVE US YOUR PERFORMANCE BUT ONCE WE ACTUALLY GET INTO THE BUSINESS OF POTENTIALLY PUTTING MONEY 18 INTO A PROJECT, VIA LOAN, SUBSIDIZED WHAT HAVE YOU, DO WE NOT 19 HAVE GREATER FLEXIBILITY AND OPPORTUNITY AND PERHAPS THIS A 20 21 COUNCIL QUESTION TO SAY IF YOU WANT TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS PROJECT WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT YOUR HURTLE RAISED ARE, 22 UNDERSTAND YOUR RATES OF RETURN SO INDEED WE KNOW YOU'RE NOT 23 TRYING TO PULL 3, 4, 5% OVER CURRENT RATES OF RETURN FOR A 24 PROJECT. SO, I -- IT WOULD SEEM TO ME THAT WE WOULD HAVE THAT 25



POSSIBILITY, BUT PERHAPS STAFF COULD COME BACK TO US LATER AND 1 LET US KNOW IF THAT IS THE CASE. UNLESS YOU KNOW NOW? 2 3 KATE HARTLEY: I WOULD SAY SETTING ASIDE COMPLETELY THE 4 5 REQUIREMENTS OF A LOCAL INCLUSIONARY ORDINANCE, THE 6 NEGOTIATIONS THAT A JURISDICTION DOES WITH A DEVELOPER PARTNER, HAVING THAT BE SETTLED, BAHFA CAN HAVE A TERM SHEET 7 8 NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY TO SAY ABOVE AND BEYOND YOUR INCLUSIONARY DEVELOPMENTS AND WITH THE APPROVAL OF THE 9 JURISDICTION, WE MAY OFFER, YOU KNOW, UP TO -- AND I'M JUST 10 PICKING A NUMBER NOW, \$200,000 OF SUBSIDY PER UNIT TO INCREASE 11 YOUR INCLUSIONARY AFFORDABLE LEVEL. AND, SO, IF THE 12 JURISDICTION IS SATISFIED THAT THAT'S SOMETHING THEY WANT, AND 13 THEY HAVE ALREADY NEGOTIATED THEIR BASELINE INCLUSIONARY WITH 14 15 THE DEVELOPER, AND WE CAN SUPPLEMENT IT AT A REASONABLE COST, 16 AND AT A COST THAT IS NOT A LOSS OF OPPORTUNITY TO INVEST IN ANOTHER KIND OF AFFORDABLE DEAL, THEN, I DON'T THINK WE NEED 17 TO REQUIRE THE FULL OPENING OF THE DEVELOPERS BOOKS. IT WILL 18 BE DETERMINED ON OUR PART THAT THIS IS IN FACT A VERY 19 WORTHWHILE INVESTMENT, AND THAT IT'S COST EFFECTIVE. AND SO, 20 21 IT WILL BE CASE BY CASE, FOR SURE. I CAN IMAGINE SOME OFFERS FROM DEVELOPERS THAT WE WOULD REJECT, BECAUSE THEY IT WOULD 22 WANT MORE MONEY THAN WE THINK IS COST EFFECTIVE, BUT WE CAN 23 WORK ON THAT LEVEL OF JURISDICTION BY JURISDICTION AND CASE BY 24 25 CASE.

JANUARY 12, 2023

1 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: THANK YOU. AND THEN MY FINAL 2 3 QUESTION -- PROMISE, CHAIR PEDROZA -- SLIDE 16, PRESERVATION, UNREGULATED PROPERTIES. I WOULD ASSUME THAT THESE ARE 4 5 UNREGULATED PROPERTIES WHEN COMING INTO THE FUNDING FUNNEL, BUT ULTIMATELY THEY WIND UP BEING DEED RESTRICTED IN SOME WAY 6 IF WE WIND UP FUNDING THESE PRESERVATION OF UNREGULATED 7 8 **PROPERTIES; CORRECT?** 9 10 KATE HARTLEY: ANYTHING THAT BAHFA INVESTMENT WILL REQUIRE A 55 YEAR DEED RESTRICTION. 11 12 CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. 13 14 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: OF COURSE. THANK YOU, MEMBER ROMERO. I 15 16 DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COLLEAGUES WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. AT THIS POINT I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY MEMBERS OF THE 17 PUBLIC THAT WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. 18 19 CLERK, FRED CASTRO: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH 20 21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED 22 ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU. 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR: WELL IT'S NOT BY LACK OF INTEREST 24 BECAUSE THIS IS VERY INTERESTING DISCUSSIONS THAT WE'RE HAVING 25

JANUARY 12, 2023

RIGHT NOW, MS. HARTLEY. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY, 1 CORRECT? ALL RIGHT. WELL, AGAIN TO THE MEMBERS AND DIRECTORS, 2 3 THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS DISCUSSION. AGAIN, I THINK THIS IS GROUNDBREAKING STUFF THAT WE'RE DOING. WE'RE GOING 4 5 LEARN ALONG THE WAY AND THAT'S PART OF IT, BUT I REALLY THINK IT'S CUTTING EDGE. SO I APPRECIATE LEADERSHIP FROM STAFF. WE 6 7 HAVE NO FURTHER BUSINESS BEFORE THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE SO 8 WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT MEETING THAT IS FOR 9 FEBRUARY 9, 2023. THANK YOU ALL. MEETING IS ADJOURNED. HAVE A GOOD ONE. [ADJOURNED] 10

11 R

