METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11, 2023 9:45 AM

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WELCOME TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE FOR JANUARY 11TH, 2023. I'M DAVID RABBITT, CHAIR ALONG WITH GINA PAPAN VICE CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND IF THE BROADCASTING TEAM COULD ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO FOLLOW ADDITIONAL ANNOUNCEMENTS IN OUR TRANSITION BACK TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS. AS YOU ALL KNOW, THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGENCY COVID PROTOCOLS WILL BE SUNSETTING FEBRUARY 28TH, 2023, WHICH MEANS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WILL RETURN TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC STARTING WITH THE MARCH 8TH, 2023 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETINGS WILL BE IN-PERSON. AS WAS THE CASE BEFORE COMMISSIONERS WILL BE COMPENSATED FOR TRAVEL COSTS AND REFRESHMENTS WILL BE PROVIDED. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO ARE CONSIDERING A.B. 2449, THE LIMITATIONS ARE AS FOLLOWS: ONE: AT LEAST A QUORUM FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATIVE BODY MUST PARTICIPATE IN-PERSON FROM A SINGULAR PHYSICAL LOCATION IDENTIFIED ON THE AGENDA, WHICH LOCATION WILL BE OPEN TO THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PUBLIC AND WITHIN THE BOUNDARIES OF THE LOCAL AGENCY. TWO: A MEMBER MAY ONLY TELECONFERENCE FOR PUBLICLY FOR PUBLICLY DISCLOSED JUST CAUSE OR AN EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCE APPROVED BY THE LEGISLATIVE BODY. THREE: A MEMBER MAY ONLY TELECONFERENCE FOR A LIMITED NUMBER OF MEETINGS. JUST CAUSE IS LIMITED TO ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: A CHILD CARE OR CHILD GIVING NEED OF A CHILD, A PARENT, GRANDPARENT, GRANDCHILD, SPOUSE OR DOMESTIC PARTNER THAT REQUIRES THEM TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY, A CONTAGIOUS ILLNESS THAT PREVENTS THE MEMBER FROM ATTENDING IN-PERSON, AND IN THE CASE OF RELATED PHYSICAL OR MENTAL DISABILITY DEFINED BY STATUTE OR DURING TRAVEL WHILE ON OFFICIAL BUSINESS OF THE LEGISLATIVE BODY OR ANOTHER STATE OR LOCAL AGENCY. EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCES MEANS A PHYSICAL OR FAMILY MISDEMEANOR EMERGENCY THAT PREVENTS A MEMBER FROM ATTENDING IN-PERSON SIDES AS ALWAYS THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY AS WE WILL BE KEEPING THE HYBRID FORMAT IT IS CLEAR THAT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION HAS ONLY BENEFITTED AND INCREASED SINCE GOING TO THE VIRTUAL FORMAT THEREBY MAKING OUR MEETINGS MORE ACCESSIBLE, TRANSPARENT AND MORE OPEN. THE PUBLIC WILL STILL BE ABLE TO SUBMIT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE MEETING TO THE E-MAIL ADDRESS PROVIDED ON THE WEB SITE, INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. 375 BEALE STREET IS OUR HEADQUARTERS WE DO NOT PROVIDE ALTERNATIVE LOCATIONS WE CAN PROVIDE GUIDANCE ON THIS POINT AT OUR NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING IN FEBRUARY. THANK YOU IN ADVANCE AND SERVING ON THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE AS WE COMPLY WITH GOVERNANCE RULES WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING YOU IN-PERSON AFTER SUCH A LONG TIME APART OR SOME CASES FOR THE FIRST TIME. MASKS ARE STRONGLY RECOMMENDED FOR EMPLOYEES AND EMPLOYEES AND VISITORS TO OUR SAN FRANCISCO HEADQUARTERS. AND NOW ON TO THE REGULAR BUSINESS OF THE DAY. AND WITH THAT, KIMBERLY CAN WE HAVE ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM OUR QUORUM?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. AND I DO SEE THE CHAIR'S HAND IS RAISED. BUT I'LL GO AHEAD AND PROCEED WITH THE ROLL CALL. CHAIR RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. GLOVER? IS ABSENT.

DAVID RABBITT: I'LL GO TO CHAIR PEDROZA.

ALFREDO PEDROZA: I WANT TO ASSURE EVERYONE LEADERSHIP WILL GET TOGETHER WE'LL TRY TO MAKE THIS AS EASY AND SEAMLESS AS POSSIBLE. FOR THOSE WHO HAVE QUESTIONS E-MAIL NICK AND I AND WE'LL MAKE SURE TO ADDRESS THOUGH AS WE TALK TO STAFF. WE'RE ROLLING THIS OUT QUICKLY BUT WANTED TO GIVE EVERYONE AS MUCH NOTICE AS POSSIBLE BUT WE WILL TROUBLESHOOT ANY REQUESTS THAT COME THROUGH. THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBITT: MOVING TO OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, FOUR ITEMS, 2A THROUGH 2D. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. NOT SEEING HAND RAISED. I'LL SCHEDULE FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY?

CINDY CHAVEZ: SO MOVED, CHAVEZ.

GINA PAPAN: SECOND, PAPAN.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, SECOND BY OUR VICE CHAIR PAPAN. AND I'LL ASK THE CLERK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE ASSOCIATED WITH ITEM 2D OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR FROM LOUISE MARANTE OF THE BAY AREA COUNCIL. AND I SEE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH A HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME.

GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL FOR APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES MOTION BY PAP CHAVEZ, SECOND PAPAN. ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3A, MTC RESOLUTION 4487 REVISED AND 4505 REVISED. THE ADOPTION OF THE 2023 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM OR ATP, CYCLE SIX PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND REVISIONS INTO THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT OBAG THREE PROGRAM AND WE HAVE KARL ANDERSEN AND THOMAS ARNDT TO PRESENT THE PROGRAM. I'M NOT SURE WHO IS STARTING OFF, BUT I'LL GO TO EITHER OF THEM. THOMAS OR KARL.

KENNETH KAO: ACTUALLY CHAIR RABBITT, IF I MAY, ACTUALLY INTRODUCE THE ITEM BRIEFLY BEFORE KARL OR THOMAS. I'M KENNETH KAO, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR IN THE PROGRAMS AND ALLOCATIONS FUNDING SECTION OF MTC. THIS ITEM IS SPLIT INTO TWO FOR THE ATP TEAM AND THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM THESE ARE PRETTY LARGE REGIONAL PROGRAMS AND I WANT TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION BEFORE THEY GET STARTED FOR MY TEAM. THIS IS A CULMINATION OF OVER A YEAR OF WORK FOR BOTH PROGRAMS AND WE'RE REALLY EXCITED AND I'M HAPPY TO PRESENT THIS. IT'S ALMOST $450 MILLION THAT WE'RE PROGRAMMING AS RECOMMENDATION TODAY. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OVER TO KARL WHO WILL COVER ATP AND THOMAS WILL COVER THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU KENNETH. THANK YOU KENNY AND THANK YOU CHAIR RABBITT. I'M KARL ANDERSON MTC FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF. 3A IS AN ACTION ITEM FOR THE ADOPTION OF THE 2023 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM KNOWN AS ATP CYCLE SIX FOR THE ADOPTION OF THE GRANT COUNTY LOCAL PROGRAM. THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IS A STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM ESTABLISHED IN 2013 WITH THE GOAL OF PROMOTING ACTIVE FORMS OF TRANSPORTATION LIKE WALKING AND BIKING THE PROGRAM IS DIVIDED INTO STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM, REGIONAL COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS FOR THE TEN LARGEST MPOS AND COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS FOR THE SMALL AND URBAN AND RURAL COUNTIES 320 MILLION AVAILABLE PER YEAR STATEWIDE AND THE PROGRAM IS ADOPTED EVERY TWO YEARS RECENTLY THE PROGRAM HAS RECEIVED NOTABLE AUGMENTATIONS IN 2017 SENATE BILL ONE ADDED 100 MILLION ANNUALLY TO THE PROGRAM, AND THE SUMMER FEDERAL IRA LEGISLATION ADDED 50 MILLION ANNUALLY AND THE 2023 STATE BUDGET ADDED ONE TIME $1 BILLION AUGMENTATION FOR ATP. THE ATP REMAINS A HIGHLY COMPETITIVE GRANT PROGRAM ATP CYCLE SIX THE STATE RECEIVED 434 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING OVER $3.1 BILLION IN FUNDING THE AVERAGE REQUEST FOR THE CYCLE HAS INCREASED FROM 7.1 MILLION FROM 5 MILLION IN ATP CYCLE FIVE FOR THE MTC REGIONAL PROGRAM STAFF RECEIVED 63 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

$544 MILLION DOLLARS [INDISCERNIBLE] TOTAL PROJECT COST RECEIVED FEWEST APPLICATIONS FROM NAPA AND SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY AT TWO EACH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOW I WOULD LIKE TO SHARE RESULTS OF THE STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM. LAST MONTH THE CTC ADOPTED THE STATEWIDE PROGRAM OF PROJECTS ADOPTED PROGRAM INCLUDED 67 STATEWIDE PROJECTS FOR A TOTAL OF $853 MILLION, IN THE BAY AREA CTC FUNDED SIX PROJECTS FOR A TOTAL OF 88 MILLION OR 10% TOTAL. WHILE 10% MARK IS A BIT LOWER THAN ANTICIPATE CTC SELECTED GREAT PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE REGION THE FULL PROJECT LIST ON THIS SLIDE INCLUDES NEARLY $40 MILLION IN GRANT PROJECTS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. MTC HAD $143 MILLION AVAILABLE POWER PROGRAMMING MTC RECEIVED 63 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING $544 MILLION IN RESPONSE TO THE CALL FOR PROJECTS. TO ESCORT PROJECTS MTC STAFF ENLISTED A 25 PERSON EVALUATION COMMITTEE TO SCORE AND RANK REMAINING APPLICATIONS. THE REVIEW COMMITTEE USED SAME FORM SCORING CRITERIA AS THE STATEWIDE ATP FOR A MAXIMUM SCORE OF 110 POINTS. STAFF RANKED THE APPLICATIONS FROM HIGHEST TO LOWEST BASED ON THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE'S CONSENSUS SCORE. USING THE SCORE STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING 14 PROJECTS AND PARTIALLY FUNDING ONE PROJECT FOR A TOTAL $143 MILLION, 100% OF FUNDING PROPOSED WILL BENEFIT EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, AND ALL PROJECTS SUPPORT MTC INITIATIVES TO REDUCE GHG EMISSIONS AND TO EXPAND THE REGIONAL BIKE NETWORK STAFF RECOMMENDS ADOPTING A LIST OF CONTINGENCY PROJECTS TOTALING $53 MILLION. THESE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PROJECTS ARE ALL DETAILED IN ATTACHMENT TWO OF THE MEMO. STAFF RECOMMENDS PARTIAL FUNDING THE SAN JOSE KEYS PROJECT WHICH WILL BE DISCUSSED FURTHER IN THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE REGIONAL ATP AND OBAG THREE PROGRAMS SHARE TIMELINES STAFF REVIEWED BOTH LISTS THAT INCLUDED OVERLAPPING SCOPE BOTH TEAMS COORDINATED TO ENSURE RECOMMENDATIONS DID NOT CONFLICT IN EITHER PROGRAM FOR HIGHLY SCORES PROJECTS WITH OVERLAPPING ELEMENTS STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING ATP REQUEST FIRST AND ANY REMAINING BALANCE AS PART OF THE OBAG THREE PROJECTS. IN ALAMEDA COUNTY SAN LORENZO CREEK WAY PROJECT INCLUDED EXPANDED SCOPE IN THE ATP APPLICATION THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING THE BASE PROJECT IN THE OPEC THREE PROGRAM AND THE ADDED SCOPE OF THE ATP PROGRAM. STAFF RECOMMENDS PARTIALLY FUNDING SAN JOSE STORY KEYS PROJECT WITH THE REMAINING ATP FUNDING SAN JOSE REQUESTS $36 MILLION IN THE ATP FUNDS FOR THE STORY KEYS PROJECT COMPLETING STREETS PROJECTS HOWEVER ONLY $4 MILLION OF ATP REMAINED AFTER FUNDING HIGHER SCORING PROJECTS. THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDING PARTIALLY FUNDING THE PROJECT WITH $4 MILLION IN ATP FUNDS AND SAN JOSE SUBMITTED THE SAME. MTC STAFF EXPECTS FULL PROJECT BENEFITS TO BE DELIVERED AS PART OF THE PLAN COMPLETED BETWEEN THE RECOMMENDED FUNDING AND RENAL NAT ATP AND OBAG THREE PROGRAMS. NEXT OVERVIEW OF THE ATP FUNDING HISTORY SINCE UPON $2,014,555,000,000 HAS BEEN AWARDED TO PROJECTS IN THE MTC REGION THROUGH AWARDED PROJECTS. CONSIDERING BOTH PROGRAMS MOST COUNTIES HAVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RECEIVED A COMPARABLE AMOUNT OF FUNDS TO THE POPULATION SHARE WITHIN THEIR REGION TWO OUTLIERS, ALAMEDA COUNTY RECEIVES MORE GRANT FUNDING THAN ITS POPULATION SHARE AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY RECEIVES LESS CONTRIBUTABLE TO MAIN REASONS ONE THE ATP PROGRAM PRIORITIZES DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND IN ALAMEDA COUNTY HIGHER PERCENTAGE OF CONSENSUS TRACKS THAT QUALIFY UNDER THE DEFINITIONS THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE IN THE AMOUNT OF FUNDS AND NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS REQUESTED BY THE COUNTIES. ALAMEDA COUNTY HAS REQUESTED 32% OF THE TOTAL FUNDS THROUGH HUNDRED 47 APPLICATIONS OVER ALL OF OUR CYCLES WHERE SANTA CLARA COUNTY REQUESTED 16% OF THE FUNDING REQUESTS THROUGH 63 APPLICATIONS. NOTABLY SANTA CLARA COUNTY AGENCY SUBMITTED EIGHT APPLICATIONS PER CYCLE WHERE ALAMEDA AGENCIES SUBMITTED DOUBLE THAT AT 16 STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH SPONSORS TO IMPROVE APPLICATIONS TO INCREASE THE REGION'S GRANT SUCCESS RATE. FURTHER DISCUSSION IN SLIDES. NEXT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT MTC ATP APPLICATION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. AS A CONTINUATION FROM ATP CYCLE FIVE MTC EXTENDED THE APPLICATION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY AND OVERALL COMPETITIVENESS OF APPLICATIONS FROM THE REGION MTC STAFF LEAD THE PROJECT IN SUPPORT, AND REVIEWED SEVEN APPLICATIONS IN ASSESSING QUALITY ELIGIBILITY CONSISTENCY AND TECHNICAL DETAILS SEVEN APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING TO THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. STAFF PROPOSES TO AUGMENT FUNDING AND REFINE THE TECHNICAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ASSISTANCE PROGRAM OBAG THREE INCLUDES 300,000 FOR AUGMENTED SUPPORT. ADDITIONAL SCOPE OF THE PROGRAM COULD INCLUDE SCOPE DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT AND MTC OR CTC LEAD APPLICATION PRIORITIZATION PROCESSES FURTHER DISCUSSION IN THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM PROVIDED IN ATTACHMENT ONE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS CONCLUDES THE ATP HALF OF THE ITEM'S PRESENTATION. I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO THE CHAIR, CHAIR RABBITT IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO ENTERTAIN QUESTIONS NOW OR WAIT UNTIL AFTER THE PRESENTATION ON THE OBAG THREE RECOMMENDATIONS.

DAVID RABBITT: I SEE ONE HAND RAISED. IF WE COULD ROLL ON FORWARD AND TAKE ALL QUESTIONS AT ONCE?

GINA PAPAN: ACTUALLY, I HAVE QUESTIONS RELATED TO EACH GROUP.

DAVID RABBITT: OKAY. WHY DON'T YOU GO AHEAD, GINA, AND ASK YOUR QUESTION NOW.

GINA PAPAN: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK EFFORT AND THAT WENT INTO THESE. THERE IS KIND OF A NEGATIVE OPTICS AS YOU POINTED OUT. WE'RE TRYING TO INVEST IN VMTS AND REDUCTION IN GREENHOUSE GAS PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, BUT THE RESULTS AGAIN WERE POINTED OUT SEEM LOPSIDED. 72% OF RECOMMENDED FUNDING, THE QUESTION IS WE WANT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO PARTICIPATE IN LEARNING FROM WHAT WE DID WRONG OR HOW WE CAN BETTER IMPROVE. I HAVE THREE QUESTIONS HERE. FIRST OFF HOW DID ONE COUNTY GET ALL THAT? BUT I THINK YOU EXPLAINED THAT IN THE PRESENTATION. THAT'S BEEN ANSWERED. WHAT RULE DID REGIONAL DISTRIBUTION PLAY IN THESE REGIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND WERE THERE REPRESENTATIONS ON THIS REVIEW COMMITTEE FROM EACH COUNTY ON THE EVALUATION PANEL? AND WE WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHO THOSE -- IF THEY WERE, WHO THEY WERE FROM EACH COUNTY SO THAT WE CAN JUST SEE WHERE THE OPINIONS ARE COMING FROM, SHALL WE SAY?

KARL ANDERSON: HAPPY TO TAKE THOSE QUESTIONS. ON THE LAST ONE YOU MENTIONED REGARDING THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE IN THE ATTACHMENT TO THE MEMO THERE IS A FULL LIST OF THE AGENCIES AND THE TYPE OF AGENCY THAT PARTICIPATED IN THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE AND WE DID HAVE REPRESENTATION FROM ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES ON THAT PANEL.

GINA PAPAN: WHERE IS THAT AGAIN? I'M SORRY KARL.

KARL ANDERSON: ATTACHMENT THREE TO THE STAFF MEMO IT LISTS ALL 22 MEMBERS IT DOESN'T LIST THE NAME JUST THE AGENCY THEY'RE AFFILIATED WITH AND THE TYPE OF AGENCY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GINA PAPAN: I'LL LOOK IN MORE DETAIL THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE REFERENCE. THIS MAY BE SOMETHING WE WANT TO DISCUSS IN THE FUTURE BECAUSE SOMETIMES WITH MTC STAFF THINGS REPRESENT COUNTIES THAT DON'T NECESSARILY DO THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GO AHEAD. KARL.

KARL ANDERSON: ON YOUR QUESTION OF GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE WE ARE BOUND BY STATEWIDE GUIDANCE SO WE AREN'T ALLOWED TO INTRODUCE ANY, SORT OF, METRICS OR SCOPING PRIORITIZATION TO ACCOUNT FOR GEOGRAPHIC EQUITY THE PROGRAM HAS TO REMAIN COMPETITIVE AND WE HAVE TO ABIDE BY THE PROCESS GUIDELINES.

GINA PAPAN: LOOK FORWARD TO MORE DISCUSSION.

KARL ANDERSON: THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBITT: ANY MORE QUESTIONS ON THIS PIECE?

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I HAVE ONE.

DAVID RABBITT: GO AHEAD.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SAN FRANCISCO SUBMITTED A PROJECT ON HOWARD STREET, THAT JUST MISSED OUT ON THE STATE FUNDS SCORED 90 OUT OF 100 -- 89 OUT OF 100 ON THE STATE SCORING. IT SCORED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER ON THE REGIONAL SCORING, 81% ON THE REGIONAL SCORING. SO, I WOULD LIKE -- NOT NOW, BUT OFFLINE, MAYBE YOU CAN EXPLAIN TO ME WHY THERE WAS SUCH A DISCREPANCY ON THE SCORING FOR THIS PROJECT? AND IT'S PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE WE HAVE A $23 MILLION RAISE GRANT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS PROJECT. AND THE MAPS THAT WE WERE PLANNING FOR IT WERE THROUGH DEVELOPER FEES WHICH MANY OF YOU KNOW THERE IS NOT OF DEVELOPMENT GOING ON IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, NOT BECAUSE OF REALLY ANYTHING THAT WE HAD TO DO WITH WORK-FROM-HOME AND COVID AND ALL THAT STUFF. SO WE ARE IN -- FACING DOWN A REAL POSSIBILITY OF POTENTIALLY NOT BEING ABLE TO MAP, PROVIDE THE LOCAL REGIONAL MATCH NECESSARY FOR THIS RAISED GRANT, AND I THINK IT WOULD BE A REAL SHAME NOT JUST FOR SAN FRANCISCO BUT FOR THE REGION TO, SORT OF, HAVE TO GIVE THIS MONEY BACK TO THE FEDS. SO, IF YOU COULD HELP US BETTER UNDERSTAND, OFFLINE, WHAT THE SCORING CRITERIA IS, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO ASK YOU, ALSO TO SEE IF THERE ARE, HOW WE CAN -- YOU KNOW, WHAT MTC CAN TRY AND DO TO KIND OF FUND THIS IMPORTANT -- AND I THINK, WHAT SHOULD BE A VERY HIGH SCORING PROJECT.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU SO MUCH. I JUST WANTED TO PIGGYBACK ON COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS. MY UNDERSTANDING IS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS WAS A MAJOR ASPECT OF THIS FUNDING REQUIREMENTS. AND THE HOWARD PROJECT, THAT'S THE ENTIRE POINT OF IT. AND SO IT DOES FEEL CONFUSING TO ME WHY IT SCORED LESS THAN IT DID AT THE STATE. SO, AGAIN, WE CAN HAVE THIS CONVERSATION OFFLINE, BUT IT IS CONCERNING TO ME.

KARL ANDERSON: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RONEN AND COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. YES THERE IS SOME DIFFERENCES IN THE WAY THAT THE SCORE TOTALS ARE CALCULATED BETWEEN THE REGIONAL AND STATE PROGRAM. I HAVE CONNECTED WITH SFMTA STAFF TO DO A DEBRIEF ON THEIR APPLICATION QUESTION BY QUESTION SCORE BY SCORE. SO HAPPY TO COMMUNICATE ANY INFORMATION THAT COMES FROM THOSE MEETINGS TO YOU.

HILLARY RONEN: THANK YOU.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. ANYONE ELSE? BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE OBAG THREE, I JUST WANT TO SAY, I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT STAFF HAS PROPOSED AN AUGMENTATION OF $300,000 GOING FORWARD TO REALLY MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE AS COMPETITIVE. I HAVE A FEELING THAT WE'RE IN A DIFFERENT PLACE THAN MANY OTHER PARTS OF THE STATE AND THAT WE HAVE BEEN MAKING COMMITMENTS TO ATP PROBABLY FOR A LONGER PERIOD OF TIME AND WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ARE GAP CLOSURES AND THINGS THAT MAY SCORE DIFFERENTLY THAN WHAT HAPPENS ELSEWHERE IN THE STATE. I KNOW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT WE'RE ALL VERY COMPETITIVE NOT ONLY FOR THE REGION TO MAKE SURE THAT WE BUNCH ABOVE OUR WEIGHT AND BRING THOSE DOLLARS HOME BUT ALSO FOR OUR JURISDICTIONS SO I DO APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE ON THEN IF THERE IS NO MORE QUESTIONS E COMMENTS, CONCERNS ON ATP, TO THE OBAG THREE PORTION OF THE PRESENTATION.

KARL ANDERSON: THANK YOU CHAIR RABBITT. AND I'LL BE ON FOR THE REST OF THE PRESENTATION SO IF ANY OTHER ATP QUESTIONS ARISE, I'LL NOW PASS IT ON TO THOMAS.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBITT AND KARL. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I'LL PRESENT ON THE PROPOSED PROJECTS SEEKING APPROVAL OF PROPOSED REVISION TO MTC RESOLUTION 4505 INCLUDING PROGRAMMING JUST OVER 300 MILLION FOR 55 PROJECTS ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE COMMISSION ADOPTED GUIDELINES TO THE OBAG THREE LOCAL AND COUNTY PROGRAM IN MARCH OF 2022 CARRYING FORWARD SUCCESSFUL PRINCIPLES FROM PREVIOUS CYCLES THE PROGRAM MAINTAINED EMPHASIS ON LOCAL PRIORITY PROJECTS THAT ADVANCE REGIONAL OBJECTIVES AND CONTINUE WITH INVESTMENTS IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS FOR PDA WITH ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS FOR NEW PLANNED AREAS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GEOGRAPHIES AND THE GUIDANCE MAINTAINED ELIGIBILITY FOR A VARIETY OF PROJECT TYPES INCLUDING COMPLIANCE WITH NEW AND STATE HOUSING LAWS. THE COMMISSION APPROVED A NUMBER OF POLICY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHANGES FOR THE CYCLE WHICH ENHANCE MTC PROJECT SELECTIONS IN RESPONSE TO MTC FEDERAL CORRECTIVE ACTION INCLUDING ESTABLISHMENT OF NOMINATION TARGETS FOR EACH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY OR CTA WHICH ARE ELIMINATE GUARANTEED PERCENTAGE SHARE FOR EACH COUNTY AND REGIONAL EVALUATION OF ALL NOMINATED PROJECTS CONSISTENT WITH THE PROJECT SELECTION GUIDELINES INCLUDING ASSESSING EMISSIONS REDUCTION BENEFITS FOR ALL PROJECTS ELIGIBLE FOR FEDERAL AIR QUALITY FUNDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HAVING COMPLETED THE CALL FOR PROJECTS PROCESS OVER THE PAST YEAR INCLUDING PRIORITIZATION OF PROJECTS LIKE CTAS AND REGIONAL EVALUATION OF NOMINATED PROJECTS STAFF ARE RECOMMENDING APPROVAL OF THE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROJECTS. I'LL HIGHLIGHT KEY FINDING OF THE PROPOSED PROGRAM. SIMILAR TO ATP, LARGER APPLICATION PROJECTS THIS CYCLE AND PROJECTS PROPOSED COST IS OVER $900 MILLION EFFECTIVELY USES LIMITED OBAG FUNDING FOR LOCAL AND STATE FUNDS. LOCAL AIR QUALITY FUNDS PRIORITIZING COST EFFECTIVE PROJECTS FOR THE FUNDING SOURCE FUNDS ARE ANTICIPATED TO GENERATE SUBSTANTIAL EMISSION REDUCTIONS AS DETAILED IN THE STAFF REPORT. OVERALL THE PROPOSED PROGRAM OUTPERFORMS EXPECTATIONS AND EXCEEDS AMBITIOUS TARGETS ESTABLISHED BY THE COMMISSION. STAFF BELIEVE SUCCESSES MAY BE DRIVEN IF PART TO THE COMPETITIVE NATURE OF THE PROCESS THIS CYCLE WHICH INCENTIVIZES PROJECTS. NEARLY ALL PROJECTS PROPOSED ARE WITHIN OR SUPPORTIVE OF PDA WITH EACH COUNTY EXCEEDING INDIVIDUAL PDA MINIMUM. MAJORITY OF PROPOSED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INVESTMENTS ARE IN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION WHICH EXCEEDS THE $200 MILLION TARGET. YOU CAN SEE THE PIE CHART TO THE RIGHT OF THE SLIDES FOR A BREAK DOWN OF PROPOSED INVESTMENTS BY MODE. PROPOSED INVESTMENTS IN SAFER ROUTES TO SCHOOL PROJECTS PROGRAMS ARE DOUBLE ESTABLISHMENT TARGETS AND OVER HALF AVAILABLE FUNDS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR PROJECTS IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS SUMMARY OF FUNDING RECOMMENDATION BY COUNTY AND RESULTING GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDING I'LL DIRECT TO AGENDA PACKET FOR DETAILED PROGRAMS INCLUDING PROJECT LISTS AND MAPS. SAMPLE TO THE RIGHT OF THE SLIDE SHOWS PROPOSED PROJECTS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY RECOMMENDED PROJECT AWARDS IN RED PDA SUPPORTED IN GREEN OR GOLD -- EXCUSE ME -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IN GREEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. REMINDER OF NEXT STEPS FROM PERCENTAGE SPONSORS SELECTED FOR OBAG FUNDING AWARDEES WILL NEED TO COMPLY WITH VARIOUS REQUIREMENTS. REQUIREMENTS SUMMARIZED IN THE GREEN BOX NOTABLY CITIES AND COUNTIES MUST HAVE HOUSING ELEMENTS APPROVED BY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT HCD PRIOR TO ACCESSING FUNDS. WE RECOGNIZE THE JURISDICTION STAFF ARE HARD AT WORK TO MEET THE STATEWIDE REQUIREMENT SPONSORS WILL HAVE UNTIL END OF YEAR TO COME INTO COMPLIANCE WITH REQUIREMENTS AND STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO COORDINATE WITH PROJECT SPONSORS REGARDING COMPLIANCE ON AN ONGOING BASIS TO ENSURE PROJECT FUNDS ARE MADE AVAILABLE ONCE ALL PROGRAM REQUIREMENTS HAVE BEEN MET. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO IN ADDITION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO THE RECOMMENDED PROGRAM OF PROJECTS PART OF THIS ITEM STAFF ARE PROPOSING CONTINGENCY PROJECT LIST FOR USE IN FUTURE PROGRAMMING SHOULD ADDITIONAL CAPACITY BECOME AVAILABLE DURING THE OBAG THREE PERIOD STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING PROJECTS FROM THIS LIST RATHER THAN ISSUING CALL FOR OTHER PROJECTS AND CONTRACTS WITH PROPOSED GRANT AWARDS ARE SELECTED BASED ON REGIONAL PARTICIPANTS DELIVERABILITY IN THE COMPLETION OF FULL FUNDING PLANS AND TOTAL PROJECT SCORE. CONTINGENCY RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD ESTABLISH PRIORITIES FOR FUTURE PROGRAMMING OF OBAG THREE FUNDING CAPACITY HOWEVER THE COMMISSION WOULD MAINTAIN THEIR DISCRETION TO SELECT ADDITIONAL PROJECTS BEYOND THIS LIST. STAFF ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION IN SPRING TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL CAPACITY RESULTING FROM MODEST INCREASES AND PROJECT FUNDING UNDER THE LATEST SURFACE TRANSPORTATION REAUTHORIZATION KNOWN AS IA OR BIL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL LEAVE YOU WITH RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ADOPTION OF THE ATP AND OBAG PROGRAM. FOR ATP THIS INCLUDES ADOPTION OF THE CYCLE SIX PROJECT LIST AND DIRECTION TO STAFF TO DIRECT THE LIST TO CTC AND OBAG THREE RECOMMENDATION INCLUDES PROGRAMMING COUNTY AND LOCAL FUNDS RECOMMENDED PROJECTS APPROVAL OF THE CONTINGENCY PRIVILEGES LIST AND PRIORITIES AND PROGRAMMING REGIONAL FUNDS FOR THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. NOTING IN THE AGENDA ITEM WE RELEASED UPDATED INFORMATION FROM PROJECT SPONSORS AND IF CHANGES ARE NEEDED BASED ON THE INFORMATION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE'LL BE BRINGING THOSE TO THE COMMISSION IN THE FUTURE MONTHS. AND FINALLY STAFF WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE NUMEROUS PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED REGARDING THIS ITEM COPIES OF WHICH ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR AGENDA PACKET COMMENTS RELATED TO A PROJECT APPLICATION FROM THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE WHICH IS RECOMMENDED FOR OBAG FUNDING CTA HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO ADDRESS CONCERNS AND MTC STAFF HAVE PROVIDED RESPONSE O RESPONSE LETTERS TO THE PUBLIC COMMENTERS. RECOMMENDATION FOR FUNDING COMMITTED TO CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION WITH THE PUBLIC REGARDING THIS PROJECT. WITH THAT, THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU THOMAS AND KARL. I SEE COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. I KNOW AN ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF WORK HAS GONE INTO THIS. I JUST LOOKED UP THE EVALUATOR LIST AND IT IS FAR FROM TRANSPARENT. REALLY GOING TO NEED SOME HELP ON THIS. BECAUSE ALL I SEE IS ALAMEDA COUNTY, ALAMEDA COUNTY, CALTRANS, CITY OF CONCORD, CITY OF DIXON, CITY OF FREMONT, NAPA, SAN RAFAEL, CONTRA COSTA TA, MARIN, MTC, SEVERAL LISTINGS, NAPA, NAPA, AND SILICON VALLEY. SO, AS YOU CAN UNDERSTAND, IT'S VERY DIFFICULT FOR SOME OF US TO UNDERSTAND WHO THESE EVALUATORS ARE. SO, IF YOU COULD PROVIDE US A SUPPLEMENTAL ANALYSIS THERE THAT WE CAN SEE MORE TRANSPARENTLY WHO THE EVALUATORS THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND WE'RE LOOK FORWARD TO MTC TO SEE HOW WE CAN LEARN AND ALL BE MORE COMPETITIVE HERE. ON THIS OBAG PRESENTATION, AND AGAIN I KNOW THIS HAS TAKEN A REALLY LONG TIME. I APPRECIATE ALL YOUR HARD WORK EFFORT AND. WILL THERE BE NEW FUNDING AVAILABLE BECAUSE OF THE FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE BILL? AND WOULD THAT BE USED TO FUND THE PROJECTS IN THE CONTINGENCY TABLE FIRST?

SPEAKER: THROUGH THE CHAIR WE ARE EXPECTING MODEST INCREASES IN PROGRAM REVENUE DUE TO THE LATEST TRANSPORTATION AUTHORIZATION AND WE'RE EXPECTING TO BE BRINGING REPROGRAMMING AUTHORIZATIONS THIS SPRING THOSE WILL BE MODEST INCREASES, NOT ON THE LEVEL SEEN IN THE ATP PROGRAM.

GINA PAPAN: SO, YOU CAN ADDRESS THE CONTINGENCY LIST?

SPEAKER: I'M SORRY. YES. IT'S APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION. WE'LL BE USING THE CONTINGENCY FRAMEWORK INCLUDING THE CONTINGENCY LIST TO RECOMMEND THOSE PROJECTS FOR REPROGRAMMING. YES.

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU THOMAS. APPRECIATE IT.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING? JIM, YOU ARE MUTED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JAMES P. SPERING: I THOUGHT IT HAD COME OFF. FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF. AS I LOOK AT THE SOLANO COUNTY BUDGET, IT HELPS ADVANCE TRANSIT IN SOLANO COUNTY. BUT IF THERE IS ADDITIONAL MONEY AVAILABLE, WOULD THE GAP CLOSURE PROJECTS HAVE A PRIORITY? BECAUSE I THINK AS YOU LOOK THROUGH THIS LIST THERE, IS A LOT OF PROJECTS WITH A MODEST INVESTMENT THAT CAN MAKE A REAL DIFFERENCE, ESPECIALLY THE SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL AREAS.

SPEAKER: THROUGHOUT CHAIR, OUR PROPOSED CONTINGENCY PROJECT PRIORITIES ARE REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE. THAT FITS IN THERE, AND COMPLETION OF FULL PROJECT FUNDING PLANS AND TOTAL PROJECT SCORE WOULD HOPE TO REFLECT THE IMPORTANCE OF GAP CLOSURE PROJECTS.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU. ANYTHING ELSE COMMISSIONER? I'LL TAKE THAT AS A NO. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR STAFF BEFORE WE MOVE ON? I DO SEE SOME HANDS RAISED, AND I'LL TURN TO KIMBERLY BEFORE WE TAKE A MOTION AND SEE IF SHE CAN TELL US ABOUT THE COMMENTS RECEIVED AND LEAD US THROUGH PUBLIC COMMENT, PLEASE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. THERE WERE QUITE A NUMBER OF WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE, SO I'LL READ THOSE NAMES INTO THE RECORD. THE FIRST IS RICHARD HUGHES, ANNIE MENDEZ, [INDISCERNIBLE] TERRY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MILNIK, JAY HENNY, AND JAN AND JIM JOYCE, ANONYMOUS, CONNER BEGLEY, BOB AND IRENE LARUE, MICHAEL BALOG, GARY AND PATRICIA, GARY SKERRETT, TERRY, KARLA MCCORMACK, MIKE GARRIGAN, MIKE SNOW, BERT STRAGA, JEFF HUNT, ERIC STEVENS, AND PETER SCHUMACHER, AND JEFF FELLEDER. I SEE FOUR HANDS RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

DAVID RABBITT: A MINUTE AND A HALF.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST SPEAKER IS WARREN WELLS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS.

SPEAKER: THIS IS WARREN WELLS POLICY PLANNING DIRECTOR FOR THE MARIN COUNTY BICYCLE COALITION CALLING TO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THE ATP AND OBAG THREE FUNDING LIST. MARIN DIDN'T GET ANYTHING FOR THE STATEWIDE ALLOCATION SO WE ARE PLEASED TO SEE SOME REALLY IMPORTANT PROJECTS THAT WERE MISSED OUT ON THE STATEWIDE FUNDING COMING THROUGH IN THE ALLOCATIONS. COMING THROUGH FOR PLANNING DESIGN OF THE BRIDGE IN SAN RAFAEL, NEIGHBORHOOD IMPROVEMENTS AND TRAFFIC MOVEMENTS, FUNDING FOR A SEGMENT ON THE SMART PATHWAY. IT'S A SHORT GAP WHICH OBVIATE A NEED FOR RIDERS TO CROSS TWICE. THANK YOU FOR THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND HAPPY TO SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS TESS LYNGEL.

SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. TESS LYNGEL, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION THIS IS AN EXCITING CULMINATION OF SEVERAL YEARS AND COLLABORATIVE WORK ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM AND IT'S NICE TO SEE THE COORDINATION WITH THE ATP PROGRAM. I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE THIS IS CRITICAL FUNDING FOR COUNTIES LIKE ALAMEDA COUNTY WHO ARE PARTNERS WITH MTC AND DOING THE VERY SPECIFIC DIRECT PROJECT DELIVERY TO HELP ADVANCE THE GOALS OF PBA2050. I WOULD LIKE TO EXTEND OUR APPRECIATION TO MTC STAFF FOR THEIR COLLEGIAL COLLABORATIVE AND TRANSPARENT PROCESS FOR DEVELOPING AND NOMINATING PROGRAMMING RECOMMENDATIONS. IT'S AN EXAMPLE OF MAKING OUR COMMUNITIES AND TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS BETTER AND FOR PROJECTS RECOMMENDED IN NEED MOOD COUNTY WILL HELP ELIMINATE PORTIONS OF THE HIGH INJURY NETWORK CORRIDORS EXPAND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVE TRANSIT AND SUPPORT CLEAN TRANSPORTATION IN SOME OF OUR MOST IMPACTED EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. AND THESE ARE ALSO IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. ALAMEDA CTC HAS ALLOCATED SIGNIFICANT LOCAL FUNDS TO ADVANCE THESE PROJECTS. I WANT TO THANK STAFF AND YOU, COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION. AND ENCOURAGE YOUR APPROVAL OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TODAY. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER LAST FOUR DIGITS 6408. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS. CALLER WITH THE LAST FOUR DIGITS 6408, IF YOU ARE THERE? PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON -- OH

SPEAKER: HI.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: HI.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. SORRY. I WAS HAVING CHALLENGES GETTING UNMUTED. MY NAME IS JEANNE, I AM CALLING REGARDING ISSUES RAISED TO MTC FROM MULTIPLE CONCERNED CITIZENS REGARDING THE INCLUSION OF TOPPER LANE IN THE LAFAYETTE OBAG GRANT APPLICATION. WE RECEIVED A RESPONSE BACK FROM MTC YESTERDAY THEIR RESPONSE FAILED TO ADDRESS OUR MAIN CONCERNS ONE WHICH IS THAT THIS GRANT APPLICATION DID NOT CONTAIN THE NECESSARY INFORMATION CRUCIAL TO ACTUALLY SCORE AND EVALUATE THIS PROJECT AS TOPPER LANE WAS INCLUDED IN THE GRANT REQUEST PRIMARILY FOCUSED ON SCHOOL STREET BENEFITS AND ALSO PROJECT REQUESTING FUNDING TO BUILD PATHWAY THAT WILL BENEFIT 6 TO 8 STUDENTS. WE HAVE NO CONCERNS WITH THE REQUEST FOR SCHOOL FUNDING BUT WE FIND IT DIFFICULT TO FATHOM HOW THE PROCESS WOULD RESULT IN ENDORSING INCLUSION OF TOPPER LANE WHEN SO MANY OTHER EFFORTS THAT DID GET PRIORITIZE SAID FUNDING HAVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MUCH BROADER PUBLIC APPEAL. NOT ONLY DID MTC RESPONSE DISREGARD OUR PRIMARY CONCERNS BUT IT CONTAINED A NUMBER OF POINTS BASED ON ASSUMPTIONS AND BROAD GENERALIZATION. THESE POINTS DIDN'T PROVIDE EXPLANATION AS TO WHY TOPPER LANE WOULD NOT HAVE SCORED FAVORABLY COMPARED TO OTHER GRANT REQUESTS. QUESTIONS WHY MTC WOULD RECOMMEND FUNDING MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO PROJECTS WITH SUCH LIMITED BENEFIT MARKETS. REGARDING MORE INFORMATION REGARDING SCORING PROCESS WE HAVE REQUESTS TO GO INTO DETAIL WITH MTC HOW THE PROJECT WAS SCORED AND TO DISCUSSION CONCERNS RAISED CLEAR AND TRANSPARENT DIALOGUE ON WHY TOPPER LANE WAS PRIORITIZED FOR FUNDING.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIME IS UP. THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MICHELLE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS.

SPEAKER: HI. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: HELLO.

SPEAKER: HI. HI. YES. MY NAME IS MICHELLE BAMER I AM A RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF LAFAYETTE AND I WANTED TO COMMENT ON THE SCHOOL STREET PROJECT. YES WE DID RECEIVE THE RESPONSE FROM MR. ARNDT ADDRESSING SOME OF OUR SPECIFIC CONCERNS REGARDING THE INCLUSION OF TOPPER LANE AND THANK YOU FOR THAT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND UNFORTUNATELY, THE RESPONSE DID NOT ADDRESS OUR MAJOR CONCERN, WHICH IS THE LEGITIMACY OF TOPPER LANE INCLUSION IN THE SCHOOL STREET PROJECT. HAD TOPPER LANE BEEN CONSIDERED SEPARATE FROM SCHOOL STREET IT WOULD HAVE SCORED LOW AND NOT MADE THE CUT AS A PRIORITY PROJECT. WE FEEL THE GRANT WAS MISREPRESENTED BECAUSE THE NEGATIVE ATTRIBUTED AT TOPPER LANE'S INCLUSION WERE NEVER CONSIDERED IN THE SCORING PROCESS. SO SCORING WAS BASED ON THE MERITS ATTRIBUTED TO SCHOOL STREET AND SCHOOL STREET ONLY THEREFORE WE QUESTION THE LEGITIMACY OF THE OVERALL SCORE. AND, AGAIN, WE WILL BE FOLLOWING UP WITH MORE DETAIL AND COUNTER POINTS WE RECEIVED IN RESPONSES TO THE CONCERNS NOTED IN ATTACHMENT C. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED M CHAIR.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU. SEEING NOR FURTHER QUESTIONS. I'LL TURN BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. WHAT WE HAVE BEFORE US ARE TWO RESOLUTIONS 4487, 4505 BOTH REVISED FOR ATP CYCLE SIX AND THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE.

CINDY CHAVEZ: MOTION TO APPROVE.

DAVID RABBITT: AND A SECOND BY?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HILLARY RONEN: RONEN.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THAT. KIMBERLY ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION BY CHAVEZ SECOND BY RONEN. CHAIR RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU ALL. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR, PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS COMMITTEE THAT CAME IN TO INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD AND IF THERE IS ANYONE FROM THE RECORD WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, AS WELL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM, MR. CHAIR, AND I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING ON TO ADJOURNMENT. OUR NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY THE 8TH OF FEBRUARY. AND ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU, MOST ESPECIALLY TO STAFF. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

Broadcasting Government