

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**
3 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11, 2023 1:30 PM**

4
5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL PLEASE?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SURE. I APOLOGIZE IF I LOSE INTERNET
9 CONNECTION. LAST NAME, BALDINI?

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS? IS EXCUSED. DEUTSCHE GROSS.

14

15 **ZACH GROSS:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

18

19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ISUF IS EXCUSED. FLOREZ?

22

23 **VEDA FLOREZ:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HEDGES?

5

6 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LODEN?

25



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NICKENS? ORANTES? PARKER?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE? PIMPLE?

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. SCOTT?

16

17 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE? FRANK WELTE? WILSON? WONG?

20

21 **HOWARD WONG:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ZACK. RACHEL ZACK? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU AGAIN, AND WELCOME TO OUR FIRST
2 MEETING OF 2023 WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I'M RANDI
3 KINMAN, OUR VICE CHAIR ILAF ESUF IS OUT OF THE COUNTRY RIGHT
4 NOW. AND I NEED TO WARN EVERYBODY YOU MAY SEE DIFFERENT PEOPLE
5 POPPING UP AS WE DO OR DO NOT LOSE POWER OR INTERNET AS WE GO
6 ON. SO, I HAVE NOTIFIED BACK UP PEOPLE TO JUMP IN AND TAKE
7 OVER THE MEETING IF I DISAPPEAR. AND WITH THAT, WE'RE MOVING
8 INTO, ON THE CHAIR'S REPORT, ITEM THREE, AND I WILL READ THIS
9 TO YOU AS DIRECTED. THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGENCY PROTOCOLS WILL BE
10 SUNSETTING ON FEBRUARY 28TH, 2023. WHICH MEANS THE POLICY
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL RETURN TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE
12 PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. STARTING MARCH 8TH, 2023,
13 COUNCIL MEETINGS WILL BE IN-PERSON. AS BEFORE, YOU WILL BE
14 COMPENSATED FOR YOUR TRAVEL COSTS AND REFRESHMENTS WILL BE
15 PROVIDED. THE PUBLIC CAN STILL PARTICIPATE REMOTELY AS WE WILL
16 BE KEEPING THE HYBRID FORMAT. IT HAS BEEN CLEAR THAT THE
17 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION HAS ONLY BENEFITTED AND INCREASED SINCE
18 GOING INTO A VIRTUAL FORMAT. THEREBY MAKING OUR MEETINGS MORE
19 ACCESSIBLE, TRANSPARENT, AND OPEN. THE PUBLIC WILL STILL BE
20 ABLE TO SUBMIT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY
21 BEFORE THE MEETING TO THE E-MAIL ADDRESS PROVIDED ON THE WEB
22 SITE, INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. 375 BEALE STREET IS THE AGENCY'S
23 HEADQUARTERS. WE CURRENTLY DO NOT OFFER ANY ALTERNATIVE IN-
24 PERSON COUNCIL LOCATIONS. WE CAN PROVIDE GUIDANCE ON THIS
25 POINT AND A.B. 2449 PROVISIONS AT YOUR NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 IN FEBRUARY. THANK YOU IN ADVANCE FOR MAKING THE ADDITIONAL
2 EFFORT TO SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AS WE COMPLY
3 WITH PUBLIC TRANSPARENCY RULES, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING
4 YOU IN-PERSON AFTER SUCH A LONG TIME, OR IN SOME CASES, FOR
5 THE FIRST TIME. MASKS ARE STRONGLY RECOMMENDED FOR EMPLOYEES
6 AND VISITORS TO OUR SAN FRANCISCO HEADQUARTERS. SO, THAT DOES
7 INCLUDE OUR COMMITTEE MEETINGS THAT ARE BROWN ACT ALSO. I
8 THINK THAT THE LAST WEEK OR SO OF STORMS IS A GOOD REASON TO
9 POINT OUT THAT THE BROWN ACT IS WAY LONG PAST DUE FOR SOME
10 MODIFICATIONS AND REVISIONS, AND I DO NOT EXPECT PEOPLE TO
11 TRAVEL THROUGH FLOODED AREAS OR ACROSS RICKETY BRIDGES OR TRY
12 TO BYPASS SLIDES TO GET TO MEETINGS. THAT THE IS ONE THING.
13 BUT IF YOU KNOW YOU AREN'T GOING TO BE ABLE TO ATTEND MEETINGS
14 WE DO NEED TO MAKE AN IN-PERSON FORUM. SO WHAT I ASK OF ALL OF
15 YOU IS THAT WHEN YOU DO THIS, THAT WHEN YOU KNOW YOU'RE NOT
16 GOING TO BE ABLE TO ATTEND A MEETING, LET MARTHA KNOW AS SOON
17 AS POSSIBLE. IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT FOR US. I KNOW THAT NOBODY
18 IN MY SOUTH COUNTY WOULD BE ABLE TO MAKE THE MEETINGS BECAUSE
19 IT'S LIKE A THREE HOUR COMMUTE. SO, JUST KEEP MARTHA APPRISED
20 SO THAT WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT I WE HAVE QUORUMS AND WE WILL
21 WORK ON THIS. AND I WILL TAKE COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL
22 MEMBERS. ADINA, YOU'RE UP FIRST.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO IN THE REGIME WITH THE CURRENT LAW, IS THERE
25 ANY EXCEPTION IN CASE OF AN EMERGENCY? SO, LET'S SAY, IN



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 FEBRUARY, WE HAD OTHER WAVES OF STORMS, AND IS THERE ANY WAY
2 OF SAYING, HERE IS AN EMERGENCY WEATHER SITUATION THAT PEOPLE
3 CAN DIAL IN FROM HOME? OR WOULD THAT NO LONGER BE POSSIBLE,
4 AND IF ENOUGH PEOPLE CAN'T GET IN, WE NEED TO CANCEL THE
5 MEETING?

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE HAVE RUN MEETINGS IN THE PAST WITHOUT
8 A QUORUM THERE CANNOT BE A VOTE OR ACTIONS TAKEN IN THE
9 MEETINGS. AS I SAID, PERSONALLY, I DON'T EXPECT PEOPLE TO RISK
10 LIFE AND LIMB TO ATTEND THESE MEETINGS. THIS IS SOMETHING
11 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PLAY BY EAR. WE HAVE BEEN GIVEN MORE
12 DIRECTION AND WE HAVE DISCUSSED THIS IN THE PAST AS TO HOW YOU
13 CAN SET UP A MEETING USING YOUR OWN HOME OR PUBLIC SPOT. AND
14 WE'RE JUST GOING TO HAVE TO SEE HOW THIS ROLLS OUT. I CAN'T
15 CONTROL WEATHER, AND I EXPECT FIRE SEASON WILL BRING US THE
16 SAME ISSUES. SO I KNOW THAT'S NOT A WHOLE ANSWER, BUT THAT'S
17 WHERE WE'RE GOING WITH IT.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** IF STAFF COULD HELP US WITH A LITTLE BIT OF
20 GUIDANCE ABOUT WHAT TO DO IF THERE IS SOME OTHER KIND OF
21 EMERGENCY, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. IF IT'S TOO MUCH TIME NOW TO
22 EXPLAIN THAT LATER, THAT WOULD BE WELCOME.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I SEE OUR ATTORNEY ONLINE, IF ANYBODY
25 ELSE'S HANDS ARE RAISED I'M GOING TO LET THEM GO AFTER.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE WILL HAVE THIS TALKING POINT TO GET IT ON
3 THE RADAR FOR MARCH. BECAUSE IT'S NOT A LOT OF TIME TO PLAN,
4 FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVEN'T BEEN USED TO HAVING TO DRIVE IN TO SAN
5 FRANCISCO FOR THESE MEETINGS. AND WE APPRECIATE THAT'S
6 DIFFICULT TO DO. WE WANTED TO RAISE THE ISSUE. THERE WILL BE
7 SUBSTANTIVE GUIDANCE COMING ONCE WE HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO
8 COORDINATE INTERNALLY AND WORKING WITH IT FOLKS AND THAT, SORT
9 OF, THING. IN GENERAL, FOR THOSE OF WHO YOU HAVE BEEN SERVING
10 ON THESE BODIES FOR A WHILE, AND COUNCILMEMBER LEVIN, I
11 BELIEVE THAT'S YOUR FAMILIARITY WITH THE BROWN ACT X ANTI-
12 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC WE'RE BASICALLY REVERTING BACK TO THE OLD
13 REGIME WHICH MEANS THERE ISN'T MUCH ACCOMMODATIONS FOR THINGS
14 LIKE OTHER EMERGENCIES, THERE IS SOME WIGGLE ROOM AROUND
15 DECLARED EMERGENCIES WE HAVE SOME OPTIONS AROUND THINGS LIKE
16 REPOSTING MEETINGS WITH 24 HOURS, FOR EXAMPLE, IF ANOTHER BOMB
17 CYCLONE COMES IN, TO ACCOMMODATE MORE REMOTE LOCATIONS. THE
18 BROWN ACT IS INFLEXIBLE AROUND THESE THINGS NOT BUILT FOR
19 EITHER REGIONAL AGENCIES FOR THE KIND OF EVOLVING
20 PARTICIPATION. WE'RE PLANNING HOW WE DEAL WITH THESE MEETINGS
21 COPYING UP SHORTLY. IT SAY POSSIBILITY TO NOTICE REMOTE
22 LOCATIONS BUT IT HAS TO BE ON THE MAIN AGENDA AND THEY HAVE TO
23 BE OPEN AND ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC WHICH CAN BE REALLY TOUGH
24 IF IT'S YOUR HOME. I HAVE HAD A NUMBER OF FOLKS WHO DO THAT,
25 BUT IT CAN BE AWKWARD FOR OBVIOUS REASONS. THINGS LIKE STUDY



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 ROOMS AND LOCAL PUBLIC LIBRARIES CAN ALSO BE USED FOR REMOTE
2 LOCATIONS. THAT'S ALL THE KIND OF SUBSTANTIVE GUIDANCE THAT
3 WE'LL BE ISSUING OVER THE NEXT MONTHS BUT JUST TO GET THAT
4 KIND OF STUFF ON YOUR HORIZON THAT'S WHERE WE'RE GOING AND WE
5 WISH THERE WERE MORE FLEXIBILITY IN THE BROWN ACT, BUT
6 UNFORTUNATELY OUR HANDS ARE A BIT TIED IN THIS REGARD.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE HANDS RAISED. LET'S KEEP
9 THIS TO WHAT WE CAN, YOU KNOW, RESOLVE RIGHT NOW. BUT I WANT
10 TO LET YOU KNOW, WE HAVE DONE THIS BEFORE. WE MANAGED TO MAKE
11 IT WORK, AND I HAVE BEEN RUNNING HYBRID IN MY SCHOOL DISTRICT
12 SINCE PRETTY MUCH THE ENTIRE PANDEMIC. SO IT DOES WORK REALLY
13 WELL MY SCHOOL DISTRICT REQUIRES US TO BE IN-PERSON FROM THAT
14 WAY SO I DON'T WANT EVERYBODY TO PANIC YET. VEDA AND THEN
15 RICH. VEDA?

16

17 **VEDA FLOREZ:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. I WAS GETTING A PHONE CALL AT
18 THE VERY SAME TIME. I'M ON MY CELL PHONE RIGHT NOW. WE HAVE
19 HAD PUBLIC LOCATIONS IN MARIN COUNTY DURING THE PLANNING
20 SESSIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND WE USE THE CIVIC CENTER
21 IN MARIN COUNTY. SO, THERE ARE OPTIONS, WE JUST HAVE TO WORK A
22 LITTLE HARDER TO MAKE THOSE HAPPEN. ESPECIALLY IF WE HAVE ANY
23 HEAT EVENTS IN THE SUMMER TIME, WE MAY HAVE TO LOOK FOR THESE
24 ALTERNATE LOCATIONS. I AM SURE MTC AND STAFF WILL FIGURE THIS



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 OUT, AND I JUST WANT TO GIVE MY SUPPORT TO CREATING ALTERNATE
2 LOCATIONS OR JUST NOT HAVING A FORUM FOR THAT DAY. THANK YOU.
3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I WANT TO POINT OUT TO
5 THOSE OF YOU THAT ARE GOING INTO OFFICES THAT YOU CAN CREATE
6 AN OPEN PUBLIC SPACE IN YOUR OFFICE. THAT'S ONE OPTION, ALSO.
7 RICH, AND THEN WENDI.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. JUST A COUPLE OF POINTS. ONE TO
10 FOLLOW UP ON THE POINT OF POSTING YOUR LOCATION. IT ALSO HAS
11 TO BE POSTED AT THE LOCATION YOU'RE AT WITH ENOUGH TIME FOR
12 THE PUBLIC TO SEE IT. BUT I, IN HAWAII, WHEN I WAS THERE
13 RUNNING A PUBLIC MEETING HAD SOMEBODY SHOW UP FOR THE MEETING,
14 EVEN HAWAII. YOU CAN'T COUNT THE PEOPLE THAT ARE REMOTE FOR
15 THE QUORUM SO THAT COULD LIMIT OUR QUORUM. THAT'S ALL.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RIGHT. AND WE WILL BE GETTING FURTHER
18 DIRECTIONS FROM STAFF THAT ARE EXPLICIT TO THIS. WENDY AND
19 THEN CHRISTINA FITZGERALD.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** UNDERSTANDING THERE ARE THINGS IN THE WORKS I
22 UNDERSTAND IT WILL TAKE STATE LEGISLATION IN ORDER TO CHANGE
23 THIS?

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YEAH, AND IF YOU CAN FIND A LEGISLATOR TO
2 CARRY THAT, AWESOME, AND I'LL GO WORK FOR THEM FOR FREE. THERE
3 IS NOTHING THAT'S GOING TO BAIL US OUT. HERE WE ARE.

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY THANKS.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CHRIS AND ANNE OLIVIA.

8

9 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** I'M CERTAINLY ONE OF THOSE FOLKS WHO
10 WOULD HAVE TO HIKE THREE HOURS IN EACH DIRECTION. BUT MORE TO
11 THE POINT, THIS HAS TO CHANGE FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE WITH
12 DISABILITIES. THANK YOU.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU. AND CHRIS, MAKE SURE YOU
15 CONNECT WITH MARTHA ON AVAILABILITY. BECAUSE I WANT TO MAKE
16 SURE THAT WE'RE NOT SHORT CHANGING YOUR ATTENDANCE. ANNE
17 OLIVIA AND THEN TERRY SCOTT.

18

19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU CHAIR AND STAFF. I HAD A
20 DIFFERENT JOB WHEN I STARTED DOING THIS. I HAD ONE JOB AND THE
21 REALITY NOW IS I HAVE 2 AND 1 OF WHICH I TRAVEL FREQUENTLY OUT
22 OF STATE FOR AND THE OTHER ONE IT WOULD BE HARD FOR ME TO TAKE
23 THE TIME OFF THAT IT WOULD TAKE TO GO INTO A MEETING. AND I
24 DON'T WANT TO STEP DOWN BECAUSE COMMUTING IS ANNOYING. SO, ON
25 REAL PRACTICAL QUESTIONS, IS THERE A LIMIT TO A NUMBER OF



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 MEETINGS THAT AN INDIVIDUAL CAN DO REMOTELY? IS SOUNDS LIKE
2 POSTING CAN BE DONE OUT OF STATE FROM WHAT RICH WAS JUST
3 SAYING, AND, I DO HAVE A POTENTIAL IDEA ON A LEGISLATOR WHO
4 COULD CARRY A BILL, BUT ARE THERE OTHER THINGS THAT WE COULD
5 DO TO HELP SUPPORT UPDATING THE BROWN ACT TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT
6 A NEW REALITY AND ALL OF THE EMISSIONS THAT ARE ASSOCIATED
7 WITH LONG TRAVEL?

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SO THAT WILL -- AND I AM SURE STAFF IS
10 TAKING NOTES HERE, AND WE'LL HEAR THAT COME BACK AS YOUR
11 QUESTIONS ABOUT THE TECHNICALITY OF IT, AND MISSING MEETINGS,
12 AND WE WILL GET THAT AS PART OF THE UPDATE, AND THE MISSING --
13 DID I MISS ANYTHING IN THAT? I DON'T THINK SO.

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** IT'S NOT NECESSARILY MISSING BUT HOW MANY
16 INDIVIDUALS ALLOWED TO DO THIS VOTE.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RIGHT. ON THEIR LIST TO THEM. RIGHT.
19 THANK YOU. TERRY SCOTT?

20

21 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY QUESTION RELATES TO THE IN-PERSON REQUIREMENTS
22 DOES THAT APPLY EQUALLY TO ALL OF THE SUBCOMMITTEES THAT YOU
23 ARE A MEMBER OF?

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IT APPLIES TO ALL OF THE BROWN ACT
2 SUBCOMMITTEES. SO THE ONES THAT ARE PART OF OUR OFFICIAL
3 SUBCOMMITTEES, LIKE EQUITY AND ACCESS AND TAP SUBCOMMITTEE,
4 YES, THOSE ARE MANDATORY BROWN ACT ONES. SO, WE'RE GOING TO BE
5 DISCUSSING THE SUBCOMMITTEES LATER ON AT THE END OF THE
6 AGENDA. AND WE'LL GO THROUGH SOME OF THAT, BECAUSE -- I'LL
7 CATCH UP TO THAT AS SOON AS WE'RE DONE WITH THIS PORTION. BUT,
8 THE ANSWER IS, YES. JOHNNY?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** JUST TO VERIFY IF WE CANDIDATE MAKE IT TO A MEETING,
11 WE NOTIFY MARTHA AND THEN WOULD SHE SEND US AN INVITE FOR THE
12 ZOOM MEETING? SO THAT WE COULD ATTEND BY ZOOM?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IT'S STILL YOUR SAME ZOOM, IT'S JUST THAT
15 THERE ARE STEPS THAT YOU WILL HAVE TO GO THROUGH, AND YOU WILL
16 GET EXPLICIT DIRECTIONS BEFORE NEXT MONTH'S MEETING WHICH
17 GIVES YOU AN ADDITIONAL MONTH BEFORE THE FIRST MEETING AFFECTS
18 US. SO IT'S STILL YOUR SAME ZOOM CONNECT.

19

20 **JOHNNY PARKER:** OKAY. UNDERSTOOD.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO IF THERE IS NO OTHER QUESTIONS
23 OF THAT PART OF THE CHAIR REPORT? AS MY COMPUTER TELLS ME I'M
24 UNSTABLE. OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY HAND RAISED IN THE PUBLIC. I'M
25 GOING TO CONTINUE MY CHAIR'S REPORT WITH THIS. IT'S JANUARY,



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 AND GENERALLY THIS IS A TIME TO RECESS OUR SUBCOMMITTEES. SO,
2 WITH ALL OF THIS INFORMATION IN MIND, AND WITH SOME CHANGES
3 GOING ON, I'M NOT PLANNING ON MOVING ANYBODY OUT OF A
4 SUBCOMMITTEE. SO WHAT STAFF IS GOING TO DO, THOUGH, IS SEND
5 YOU A LIST OF THE SUBCOMMITTEES, BECAUSE THERE WILL BE SOME
6 VACANCIES AS WE'RE MOVING ALONG AND IF YOU REALLY ARE NOT
7 GOING TO BE ABLE TO ATTEND OR YOU HAVE FOUND IN THE LAST YEAR
8 BEING ON A SUBCOMMITTEE THAT THAT'S NOT WORKING FOR YOU,
9 YOU'RE STILL GOING TO BE ASKED IF YOU WANT TO BE ON IT, AND
10 CONFIRM IT, AND WE REALLY NEED THAT TO HAPPEN, AND, ALSO, IF
11 YOU'RE NOT ON A SUBCOMMITTEE, WHAT YOU ARE INTERESTED IN. AND
12 ONE OF THE REASONS WE'RE DOING THAT, AND WE'LL TALK MORE ABOUT
13 THIS AT THE END OF THE AGENDA WHEN WE CAN DEVOTE THE TIME. IS
14 BECAUSE ONE OF MY DEAREST FRIENDS ON THIS COUNCIL IS GOING TO
15 BE LEAVING US AT THE END OF THE MONTH. RICH HEDGES HAS DECIDED
16 TO BECOME AN ELECTED OFFICIAL AND WAS APPOINTED TO THE SAN
17 MATEO COUNCIL. AND I COULD NOT THINK OF A BETTER PERSON TO BE
18 SITTING IN AN OFFICE. SO HIS SPOTS WILL BE COMING UP. AND I
19 WANT TO TAKE THE TIME AT THE BEGINNING TO CONGRATULATE RICH.
20 AND RICH WE'RE GOING TO LET YOU TALK ABOUT IT AT THE END AFTER
21 WE GET THROUGH ALL OF OUR STAFF REPORTS AND STUFF SO THAT WE
22 CAN TAKE THE TIME TO DO THAT. BUT CONGRATULATIONS, AND I AM
23 JUST -- I THINK SAN MATEO MADE THE RIGHT CHOICE THERE, AND BUT
24 I'M -- RICH HAS TECHNICALLY BEEN HERE FOR 20 YEARS, AND I
25 THINK THAT KIND OF SERVICE NEEDS TO BE NOTED AND APPLAUDED AND



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 I WANT TO TAKE THIS MOMENT JUST TO SAY THANK YOU FOR YOUR
2 SERVICE, BRAVO, RICH. SO WE'RE GOING TO MOVE OUT OF THE
3 CHAIR'S REPORT, AND I THINK I COVERED EVERYTHING THAT I WANTED
4 TO SAY. THERESE DOES HAVE HER HAND UP, THOUGH. GO AHEAD
5 THERESE.

6

7 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. I JUST WANTED TO SAY, WHILE THIS IS
8 THE 50 MEETING OF 2023, IT'S MY LAST MONTH HERE AS EXECUTIVE
9 DIRECTOR, I'M RETIRING AT THE END OF THE MONTH, AND I WANTED
10 TO MAKE SURE TO JOIN YOU AT THE TOP OF YOUR MEETING TO THANK
11 YOU FOR THE INCREDIBLE WORK THAT YOU HAVE DONE FOR THE
12 COMMISSION, FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA, SUPPORTING ME AND
13 THIS INCREDIBLE STAFF IN DOING THE WORK IN DELIVERING ALL
14 MANNER OF AND IMPROVEMENTS IN ADDRESSING CHALLENGES WHETHER
15 THEY ARE TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ENVIRONMENTAL, CLIMATE
16 RELATED ISSUES, YOU HAVE SEEN THEM ALL, AND THERE IS A LOT
17 AHEAD. BUT, I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE TO SAY I WISH YOU ALL
18 THE VERY, VERY BEST IN YOUR WORK, AND IT HAS BEEN A TRUE
19 PLEASURE HAVING YOU AS THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR THE
20 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND ALL OF ITS HATS.
21 SO, THANK YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THERESE, I JUST WANT TO SAY,
24 PERSONALLY, THAT I HAVE SO ENJOYED YOUR TERM OF SERVICE WITH
25 US. YOU HAVE MADE SOME RAPID CHANGES. YOU HAVE TURNED THE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 DIRECTION OF -- I WANT TO SAY MTC, YOU HAVE NUDGED THAT BIG
2 OLD BOAT INTO A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT DIRECTION, AND YOU HAVE
3 HELPED THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BECOME MORE RELEVANT. YOU
4 HAVE SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASED OUR FOCUS ON EQUITY, AND MANAGED
5 TO GET US THROUGH A PANDEMIC. WHICH NOBODY SAW BEING THROWN AT
6 YOU, NONE OF US D BUT YOU CARRIED IT WITH SUCH GRACE AND IT'S
7 BEEN A JOY. IT REALLY HAS, AND I AM SAD TO SEE YOU GO, BUT --
8 AND I WISH YOU NOTHING BUT THE BEST. NOTHING BUT THE BEST. AND
9 IF THERE IS ANY OTHER MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK AND SAY
10 A FAIR WELL TO THERESE, RAISE YOUR HANDS. WHERE DID I GO TO
11 HERE? HOWARD, GO AHEAD.

12

13 **HOWARD WONG:** AS A NEW MEMBER OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL, I WANT
14 TO SECOND RANDY'S SENTIMENTS. I THINK WHEN MANY OF US JOINED
15 MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL GROUP, WE PROBABLY THOUGHT IT
16 WOULD BE KIND OF A TYPICAL BUREAUCRATIC GOVERNMENTAL AGENCY
17 BUT I HAVE BEEN VERY PLEASANTLY SURPRISED BY ITS EMPHASIS ON
18 ACCESSIBILITY AND EQUITY, AND HAVING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
19 MCMILLAN, SPECIFICALLY, BEING SUCH A GREAT EDUCATOR OF HOW TO
20 DEAL WITH SO MANY DIVERSE PEOPLE IT'S IN ALL THESE REGIONS,
21 AND WHEN I HEAR OR WATCH COMMISSION MEETINGS AND OTHER
22 HEARINGS, WATCHING HER CALMLY EXPLAIN COMPLEX ISSUES TO THIS
23 DIVERSE GROUP OF POLITICALLY, OFTEN POLITICAL PEOPLE,
24 INCLUDING MAYORS, HAS BEEN VERY IMPRESSIVE, AND DEFINITELY
25 WILL BE MISSED. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA AND THEN RICH.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** HI THERESE. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL THE
5 WORK THAT YOU PUT IN OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. YOU HAVE
6 THE ABILITY TO DRILL DOWN DETAILS TO AN UNDERSTANDABLE WAY FOR
7 EVERYONE, NOT ONLY FOR US, PUBLIC MEMBERS OF THE POLICY
8 ADVISORY COUNCIL, BUT, ALSO, FOR THE POLITICAL COS ON THE
9 COMMISSION SO EVERYONE UNDERSTANDS AND EVERYONE CAN BE ON THE
10 SAME PAGE. AND I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR LISTENING
11 TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND PARTICIPATING IN OUR
12 PLANNING MEETINGS, AND BEING PART OF THE PUBLIC ADVISORY
13 COUNCIL. AND I WISH YOU WELL IN YOUR RETIREMENT. AND THANK YOU
14 FOR ALL YOU HAVE DONE.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** RICH AND THEN ADINA.

17

18 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES. THIS IS DIFFICULT FOR ME. THERESE IS
19 TRULY A GREAT PERSON. I SERVED ON THE ELDERLY AND DISABLED
20 COMMITTEE FOR MANY YEARS WHILE THERESE WAS HERE AS THE
21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT TO STEVE. I REMEMBER RIDING OUT TO CONTRA
22 COSTA COUNTY WITH HER AND SOME OF THE OTHER STAFF TO VIEW THE
23 CONTRA COSTA TRANSIT CENTER. AND SHE WAS ALWAYS VERY SERIOUS,
24 BUT EXTREMELY GIDDY THAT DAY. AND I ASKED ONE OF THE STAFF,
25 WHY IS THERESE SO UP TODAY. AND SO HAPPY. AND THEY SAID SHE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 JUST GOT APPOINTED TO THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION UNDER
2 OBAMA. WOW. WHAT A WAY TO GO. AND SHE BROUGHT THAT EXPERIENCE
3 BACK TO LA. SHE KNOWS HOW THE MONEY MOVES, AND WE WERE LUCKY
4 ENOUGH TO GET HER WHEN STEVE LEFT. AND WE'RE VERY UNLUCKY TO
5 LOSE HER. AND, QUITE FRANKLY, IF I WERE GOING TO LEAVE THIS
6 BODY, IT WOULD BE FITTING THAT I LEAVE WHEN SHE DOES. THANK
7 YOU THERESE.

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA AND THEN TERRY.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. I JUST WANT TO ECHO ALL OF THE GRATITUDE TO
14 THERESE FOR THE LEADERSHIP IN SOME CHALLENGING TIMES AND
15 ORIENTING THINGS FOR A MORE EQUITABLE AND BETTER FUTURE. SO,
16 WISHING YOU WELL ON THE FUTURE. AND, ALSO, TO RICH HEDGES, SAD
17 THAT YOU WILL NOT BE HERE, BUT GLAD THAT SAN MATEO CITY
18 COUNCIL WILL HAVE YOUR LEADERSHIP.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY, AND THEN ANNE OLIVIA.

21

22 **TERRY SCOTT:** AS ONE OF THE, I GUESS, NEWER MEMBERS OF THE
23 COUNCIL, I WOULD LIKE TO EXTEND MY APPRECIATION FOR THE
24 INSTINCTIVELY AND ORGANIZATIONALLY WELL DIRECTION AND PROGRAM
25 THAT YOU HAVE OVERSEEN AND IMPROVED IN SO MANY WAYS, IN A



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 BRIEF PERIOD OF TIME. AND, ALSO, THE WAY THAT YOU HAVE HANDLED
2 THE CHALLENGE FOR US, AS A RESULT OF COVID, AND CHANGE IN OUR
3 MEETINGS AND SO FORTH. IT'S ALL BEEN VERY SMOOTH. IT'S BEEN
4 WELL COMMUNICATED, AND EXPRESSED VERY SIMPLY FOR US TO ADAPT
5 TO. AND I AM APPRECIATIVE OF THAT, AS I AM SURE THE OTHER
6 MEMBERS ARE AS WELL. THANK YOU.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA.

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THERESE, YOU'RE AMAZING, AND I'M A FIRM
11 BELIEVER IN CIVIC ENGAGEMENT, AND I BELIEVE IN ENTHUSIASTIC,
12 WHOLEHEARTED PARTICIPATION, AND I BELIEVE IT IS OUR DUTY TO
13 EXPRESS DISSENT AND TO POINT OUT THE FLAWS AND WEAKNESSES THAT
14 ARE IN OUR COMMUNITY. AND THIS IS SOMETHING THAT I DO
15 CONSISTENTLY ON EVERY BODY THAT I'M IN, AND IT IS A RARE BODY
16 THAT EMBRACES IT AND SEES DISSENTING VOICES AS REALLY ADDITIVE
17 AND IN PLACES WHERE WE'RE POINTING OUT HOLES OR FLAWS OR GAPS,
18 OR UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES, AND THAT IS A DIRECT RESULT OF
19 REALLY SOLID LEADERSHIP. AND, SO, I HAVE SO MUCH RESPECT AND
20 GRATITUDE FOR THE WAY THAT YOU HAVE FORMED THIS BODY. THE
21 MASSIVE REFORMS THAT WERE HAPPENING WHEN I STARTED, AND, LIKE,
22 THE HUGE CONFUSION, AND, LIKE, OVER 60 SUBCOMMITTEES, IS THAT
23 RIGHT? LIKE, THERE WERE SO MANY THINGS HAPPENING, AND THE
24 GRACE THAT YOU HAVE SHOWN IN WHAT CAN OFTEN BE NOT VERY
25 FRIENDLY ATMOSPHERES, IT IS REMARKABLE LEADERSHIP, AND THERE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 IS SO MUCH GRATITUDE. AND TO HAVE ALL OF US, AND ALL OF OUR
2 VOICES AND ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT PEOPLE AND PLACES COME
3 TOGETHER AND ACTUALLY RESULT IN THINGS LIKE PLANNED BAY AREA
4 2050 AND ALL THESE KINDS OF THINGS, LIKE, YOU HAVE GUIDE US
5 ALL THROUGH THAT, AND YOU HAVE CREATED AN ENVIRONMENT WHERE WE
6 FEEL COMFORTABLE AND CONFIDENT, SPEAKING UP FROM OUR
7 PERSPECTIVE, AND THAT IS MAKING EVERYTHING BETTER. SO, JUST,
8 ABSOLUTE RESPECT AND GRATITUDE TOWARDS YOU. AND, RICH, I --
9 YOU HAVE BEEN SO HELPFUL IN HELPING EDUCATE ME AS AN
10 INDIVIDUAL IN AREAS THAT I DIDN'T HAVE KNOWLEDGE, AND I HADN'T
11 BEEN EXPOSED TO BEFORE AND SENDING RESOURCES AND JUST FIGHTING
12 TIRELESSLY FOR YOUR CONSTITUENTS AND A BETTER SYSTEM AND A
13 BETTER WORLD AS A WHOLE. AND THERE IS SO MUCH LOVE AND
14 GRATITUDE TOWARDS YOU AS WELL, SO IT'S SO MUCH AN HONOR TO BE
15 PART OF THIS, AND REALLY THE LOSS OF BOTH OF YOU IS A BIG
16 DEAL. THANK YOU, AND BEST OF LUCK.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THERESE, GO AHEAD.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** JUST TO SAY THAT, I AM INCREDIBLY HUMBLLED
21 AND TOUCHED BY YOUR THOUGHTS, YOUR EXPRESSIONS OF GRATITUDE,
22 AND I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT, YOU KNOW, THE GREAT THING ABOUT
23 THE OPPORTUNITIES I HAVE HAD IN BEING A LEADER HERE IS
24 EXTRAORDINARY TEAM THAT I HAVE BEHIND ME, BEHIND ME, BESIDES
25 ME, SOMETIMES IN FRONT OF ME, YOU KNOW, DOING THE WORK TO



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SERVE THIS INCREDIBLE REGION. AND, YOU KNOW, NO PERSON CAN DO
2 IT BY THEMSELVES. AND I HAVE BEEN INCREDIBLY LUCKY TO HAVE
3 THAT SUPPORT OF MY STAFF, YOU KNOW, OF YOU, OF THE BOARD. AND
4 IF I HAVE BEEN ABLE TO, YOU KNOW, CARRY A LIGHT THROUGH SOME
5 PRETTY DARK AND STORMY TIMES AND HELP US GET TO BETTER PLACES
6 WITH A LOT OF WORK AHEAD, THAT'S BEEN AN INCREDIBLY WONDERFUL
7 OUTCOME TO TAKE WITH ME AT THE CLOSE OF THIS CAREER. SO, THANK
8 YOU, ALL, SO MUCH, AND I WILL MISS YOU.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THERESE. FOR THOSE WHO ARE
11 GOING, WE'RE LOSING AMY WORTH, ALSO. SO IT FEELS LIKE JANUARY
12 2023 IS A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE FOR ALL OF US. I'M GOING TO ASK
13 IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I SEE NO
14 HANDS RAISED.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON
17 THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
18 HAND RAISED.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO, I WILL CLOSE OUT THIS
21 ITEM, AND I WANT TO ADVISE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IF THEY
22 WISH TO SPEAK ON AN ITEM TO DIAL STAR NINE OR TO USE THE
23 RAISED HAND FEATURE. WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE INTO THE ACTUAL
24 WORK OF THE DAY. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR. AND, PLEASE, ANYBODY
25 ATTENDING THE COMMISSION MEETING TO SAY GOODBYE TO PEOPLE WHO



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 ARE LEAVING, WE GET ONE MORE SHOT OF THAT. AGENDA ITEM FOR
2 APPROVAL OF THE DECEMBER 14TH, 2022 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE
3 A MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 14TH?

4

5 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI MOVES.

6

7 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SECOND.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** BALDINI MOVES. ELDRED SECONDS. ANY PUBLIC
10 COMMENT ON THIS?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY COUNCIL COMMENTS ON THIS?
17 SEEING NO HAND RAISED, MAY WE HAVE THE VOTE, PLEASE?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. BALDINI?

20

21 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS IS EXCUSED DEUTSCHE GROSS?

24

25 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** CAMPOS IS HERE. AYE.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

7

8 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLOREZ?

11

12 **VEDA FLOREZ:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

15

16 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON? Dwayne: YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

25



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LODEN?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NICKENS? ORANTES?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. PARKER?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE? PIMPLE?

24

25 **VINAY PIMPLE:** AYE.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

3

4 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

7

8 **FRANK WELTE:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OH OKAY. WILSON? WILSON? WONG?

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ZACK? IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
15 MEMBERS PRESENT.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVING INTO ITEM NUMBER FIVE.
18 PUBLIC COMMENT. AND OTHER BUSINESS. COUNCIL COMMENTS. IS THERE
19 ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH A COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
22 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
23 ON THIS ITEM.

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THEN WE WILL MOVE INTO ITEM
2 NUMBER SEVEN, THE BIKESHARE UPDATE. TOSHI AND LAURA WILL
3 PRESENT THIS ITEM. TOSHI, I KNOW YOU HAVE BEEN WAITING. GO
4 AHEAD.

5

6 **LAURA KRULL:** I AM LAURA KRULL, I WILL BE PRESENTING TODAY.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GOOD. I WAS GOING TO ASK THAT YOU
9 INTRODUCE YOURSELF.

10

11 **LAURA KRULL:** LAURA KRULL WITH STAFF AT MTC. THANK YOU CHAIR
12 KINMAN. ARE WE ABLE TO BRING UP -- WONDERFUL. THANK YOU. OKAY.
13 GREAT. GOOD AFTERNOON COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS LAURA KRULL,
14 I AM STAFF AT MTC. AS CHAIR KINMAN MENTIONED, I'M ALSO JOINED
15 TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF SHARED MOBILITY AND
16 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. I WILL BE GIVING THE UPDATE ON
17 BIKESHARE PROGRAMS AT MTC AND FOR REFERENCE WE GAVE THE SAME
18 PRESENTATION AT THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE IN NOVEMBER. NEXT
19 SLIDE. MTC SUPPORTS TWO PROGRAMS IN THE REGION, BIKESHARE
20 CAPITAL GRANT PROGRAM AND BAY WHEELS. BAY WHEELS LAUNCHED IN
21 2017 AND OPERATES IN SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, OAKLAND,
22 BERKELEY, AND EMERYVILLE. MTC OFFERS A GRANT PROGRAM TO
23 SUPPORT BIKESHARE IN LESS DENSE AREAS. THREE GRANTS WERE
24 AWARDED. ONE IN SONOMA AND MARIN COUNTY ALONG THE SMART TRAIN
25 CORRIDOR ONE IN RICHMOND AND ONE IN FREMONT. WHILE THESE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 PROGRAMS RUN ON A SMALLER SCALE, 150 TO 300 BIKES VERSUS
2 AROUND 6,000 FOR BAY WHEELS IT'S VALUABLE TO UNDERSTAND HOW
3 BIKESHARE CAN WORK OUTSIDE OF THE DENSE URBAN CORE. IN
4 ADDITION CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE INTERESTED IN DEVELOPING
5 BIKESHARE PROGRAMS INCLUDING A VARIETY OF PUBLIC PRIVATE
6 PARTNERSHIPS CITIES SUCH AS OAKLAND, BERKELEY, AND EMERYVILLE
7 THAT DEVELOPED PERMIT PROGRAMS FOR E-BIKES SCOOTERS AS WELL AS
8 CITIES WORKING TO USE PUBLIC FUNDS TO SUBSIDIZE THROUGH
9 BIKESHARE AS WE HAVE SEEN THROUGH SONOMA COUNTY'S WORK. NEXT
10 SLIDE. WHILE BAY WHEELS LAUNCHED IN 2017, BIKESHARE IN THE BAY
11 AREA STARTED IN 2013. THE AIR DISTRICT LAUNCHED A TWO YEAR
12 PILOT PROGRAM IN SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, MOUNTAIN VIEW, PALO
13 ALTO, REDWOOD CITY, AS THE BAY AREA BIKESHARE. THE PROGRAM
14 USED \$8.7 MILLION IN PUBLIC SUBSIDY FOR THE PILOT. AFTER
15 BIKESHARE MOVED OVER TO MTC, THE COMMISSION APPROVED FUNDING
16 FOR BIKESHARE CAPITAL OPERATIONS. HOWEVER MTC -- EXCUSE ME --
17 MOTIVATE CAME FOR WITH AN OFFER TO OPERATE THE SYSTEM AT NO-
18 COST IN EXCHANGE FOR EXCLUSIVE RIGHTS. THUS THE SYSTEM WE HAVE
19 TODAY WAS BORN AS A TEN YEAR ZERO DOLLAR CONTRACT OPERATING IN
20 SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, OAKLAND, BERKELEY AND EMERYVILLE.
21 LYFT ACQUIRED MOTIVATE IN 2018 AND IN 2019 AFTER ATTEMPTS BY
22 MTC AT REGIONAL COORDINATION FOR E-BIKES FAILED, E-BIKES WERE
23 LAUNCHED ONLY IN SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE. SHOULD BE NOTED
24 THAT E-BIKES WERE BRIEFLY IN THE EAST BAY PLANS BUT FORMALLY
25 BRINGING E-BIKES ENDED AT THE ON SET OF PANDEMIC WE SAW



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SIMILAR TRANSIT ACROSS THE COUNTRY WITH 23% OF SYSTEM SHUT
2 DOWN. HIGH THEFT AND VANDALISM RATES ACROSS THE SYSTEM. NEXT
3 SLIDE. TO ZOOM IN ON THE BAY WHEELS PROGRAM, MTC MANAGES THE
4 TEN YEAR ZERO DOLLAR CONTRACT. THE CONTRACT ONLY PERTAINS TO
5 THE CLASSIC OR PEDAL BIKES WHERE E-BIKES ARE REGULATED THROUGH
6 SEPARATE AGREEMENTS BETWEEN INDIVIDUAL CITIES AND LYFT. THE
7 SYSTEM FULLY BUILT EXCEPT IN SAN FRANCISCO WHERE THEY HAVE 38
8 STATIONS REMAINING TO BE PERMITTED. AS MENTIONED MTC'S ROLE IS
9 CONTRACT MANAGEMENT INCLUDING ASSESSING LIQUIDATED DAMAGES IF
10 LYFT ISN'T MEETING PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AS WELL AS REGULAR
11 COORDINATION WITH LYFT IN THE CITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. COVID
12 HAS HAD A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP. FEWER PEOPLE ARE
13 COMMUTING TO WORK AND MUCH LIKE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP DROPPED. TO
14 UNDERSTAND HOW THE SYSTEM IS FARING, WE CAN COMPARE RIDERSHIP
15 2019 A PRE PANDEMIC YEAR. WHILE BAY WHEELS IS A SYSTEM THERE
16 TEND TO BE THREE SUBSYSTEMS DUE TO GEOGRAPHY IN SAN FRANCISCO
17 SAN JOSE AND THE THREE EAST BAY CITIES OVERALL THE SYSTEM HAD
18 A 9% DECREASES IN RIDERSHIP COMPARING 2020 TO 2019 WHILE THIS
19 MAY SEE RELATIVELY GOOD COMPARED TO TRANSIT WHICH IS DOWN
20 ABOUT 62% IN THE BAY AREA WAS LIKELY DUE TO E-BIKES HAVING
21 LARGE POSITIVE IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP SAN JOSE 61% INCREASE IN
22 RIDERSHIP SAN FRANCISCO ABOUT THE SAME RIDERSHIP ONLY A 1%
23 DECLINE IN 2023. 2% INCREASE OVERALL BUT WE LOOK AT EAST BAY
24 IN SAN JOSE RIDERSHIP STILL DOWN, RESPECTIVELY HIGHLIGHTS THE
25 FACT THAT SAN FRANCISCO HAS GROWN TO BE A LARGER ANCHOR WITH



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 91% OF TRIPS HAVING A LARGE IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP. SINCE
2 FORMALLY LAUNCHED IN LATE 2019E LIKES HAVE BECOME VERY POPULAR
3 AND NOW MAKE UP 65% OF TRIPS ACROSS THE SYSTEM. IN SAN
4 FRANCISCO E-BIKES MAKE UP HALF OF THE FLEET AND SAN FRANCISCO
5 AROUND 10%. METRICS USED TO DETERMINE MICROMOBILITY SYSTEMS
6 UTILIZATION IS MEASURED AS TRIPS PER BIKE PER DAY. E-BIKES
7 HAVE A HIGHER UTILIZATION THAN CLASSIC BIKES AT 2.5 COMPARED
8 TO 1.0 IN SAN FRANCISCO AND 1.3 COMPARED TO 0.1 IN EAST BAY.
9 IN THE EAST BAY WHICH DOESN'T HAVE E-BIKES UTILIZATION IS AT
10 1.4. NEXT SLIDE. TO UNDERSTAND HOW BIKESHARE FITS IN WITH THE
11 REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK WE COMPARE 2022 RIDERSHIP AMONG BAY
12 AREA OPERATORS. BAY WHEELS WOULD BE THE 8TH LARGEST TRANSIT
13 OPERATOR BEHIND MARIN TRANSIT EVEN THOUGH IT RECEIVES NO
14 PUBLIC SUBSIDY. IN ADDITION, BAY WHEELS HAS SERVED AS A KEY
15 FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECTION TO REGION FALL TRANSIT WITH
16 REGIONAL TRANSIT HUBS IN SAN FRANCISCO SUCH AS CALTRAIN BEING
17 THE HIGHEST RIDERSHIP STATIONS PRE PANDEMIC. TO FURTHER
18 BIKESHARE'S ROLE SUPPORTING TRANSIT WE LOOK FORWARD TO NEW
19 OPPORTUNITIES WITH THE LAUNCH OF CLIPPER 2.0. NEXT SLIDE
20 PLEASE. BAY WHEELS HAS HAD TWO EQUITY FOCUSED PROGRAMS. THE
21 FIRST IS ABOUT BIKESHARE FOR ALL, THE LOW-INCOME PROGRAM WHICH
22 OFFERS A HEAVILY DISCOUNTED ANNUAL MEMBERSHIP. CURRENTLY
23 BIKESHARE FOR ALL MEMBERS MAKE UP 10% OF TOTAL MEMBERS. IN
24 ADDITION SAN FRANCISCO SUCCESSFULLY NEGOTIATED LOWER E-BIKE
25 FEES AND CAPS FOR BIKESHARE FOR ALL MEMBERS WHICH IS ALSO IN



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 EFFECT IN SAN JOSE. THE SECOND WAS AN MTC SUPPORTED BIKESHARE
2 ACCESSIBILITY PILOT TO UNDERSTAND ACCESSIBILITY NEEDS WHICH
3 INCLUDED POP-UP BICYCLE LOCATIONS IN OAKLAND AND SAN FRANCISCO
4 AND WAS CARRIED OUT IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE BAY AREA OUTREACH
5 AND RECREATIONAL PROGRAM WORK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS WAS
6 MENTIONED, INITIALLY MTC OVERSEES THE BIKESHARE CAPITAL --
7 EXCUSE ME CAPITAL BIKESHARE PROGRAM WHICH PROVIDES CAPITAL
8 FUNDS FOR THREE PROGRAMS. WHILE THREE PROGRAMS RECEIVED OR ARE
9 RECEIVING FUNDING CURRENTLY, NONE OF THE PROGRAMS ARE ACTUALLY
10 OPERATING. IN FREMONT THE OPERATOR REMOVED ITS FLEET DUE TO
11 THEFT AND VANDALISM ISSUES AND IN RICHMOND AFTER ONE YEAR OF
12 OPERATING BELOW EXPECTED FLEET LEVELS THE OPERATOR ABRUPTLY
13 LEFT WITHOUT WARNING. THE CITY WAS ABLE TO RELAUNCH WITH A NEW
14 OPERATOR AND SUBSIDY IT'S AN EXAMPLE OF THE DIFFICULT
15 LANDSCAPE FOR OPERATORS WITHOUT ONGOING OPERATING FUNDING.
16 LASTLY THE PROGRAM ALONG THE SMART CORRIDOR HAD THE SAME
17 OPERATORS RICHMOND WHO ALSO LEFT ABRUPTLY SO TAM AND TA ARE
18 ASSESSING THE BEST PATH FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. WE WANT TO
19 HIGHLIGHT THREE KEY FINDINGS. BAY WHEELS HAS BEEN SUCCESSFUL
20 AT DEMONSTRATING POTENTIAL BIKESHARE CAN PLAY A ROLE IN THE
21 REGIONAL TREND IN THE REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK ESPECIALLY WITH
22 E-BIKES IN DENSE URBAN AREAS. SECOND BUSINESS MODEL CHARGES
23 HAVE BEEN EXACERBATED BY COVID DUE TO HIGH THEFT AND VANDALISM
24 RATES AND E-BIKES ARE MORE COSTLY TO OPERATE. THIRD, THERE IS
25 A BIG OPPORTUNITY TO SHAPE THE FUTURE OF REGIONAL BIKESHARE.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 WHILE MTC HAS BEEN SHIELDED FROM MUCH OF THE RISK DUE TO THE
2 NATURE OF THE ZERO THERE CONTRACT IT HAS BECOME MORE APPARENT
3 THAT PUBLIC INVESTMENT IS MORE LIKELY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN
4 REGIONAL BIKESHARE AND TRIPS TO REACH ITS FULL POTENTIAL. NEXT
5 SLIDE. AS WE LOOK TO NEW OPPORTUNITIES OUR CONTRACT FOR BAY
6 WHEELS ENDS JULY 2027. WE EXPECT TO NEED AROUND THREE YEARS TO
7 PLAN AND PROCURE THE NEXT PHASE OF BIKESHARE. WITH THAT IN
8 MIND, WE WANT TO THINK STRATEGICALLY ABOUT WAYS THAT PUBLIC
9 INVESTMENT CAN IMPROVE THE SYSTEM AND PREPARE FOR THE NEXT
10 CONTRACT AS WELL AS HOW BIKESHARE FITS IN WITH OTHER MTC GOALS
11 AROUND MTN, GHG REDUCTIONS TRANSIT RECOVERY, CLIMATE ISSUES
12 PROGRAM AND REGIONAL PLANNING EFFORTS SUCH AS REGIONAL ACTIVE
13 TRANSPORTATION PLAN. SINCE WE LAST PRESENTED WE COMMITTED AND
14 IDENTIFIED 15 TO \$20 MILLION AS PART OF THE CLIMATE
15 INITIATIVES PROGRAM TO FOCUS ON BIKESHARE ELECTRIFICATION
16 PROJECTS THAT WAS PRESENTED TO THE PARTNERSHIP BOARD AND
17 PLANNING COMMITTEE. WE ARE STILL DEVELOP CONCEPT FOCUS FOR THE
18 PUBLIC INVESTMENT AND EXPECT TO RETURN TO THE OPERATIONS
19 COMMITTEE WITH MORE DETAILS SOON WE WILL RECEIVE HELPFUL
20 FEEDBACK FROM THE OPS COMMITTEE IN NOVEMBER AND LOOK FORWARD
21 TO HEARING YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY. THANK YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BEFORE I START THE COMMENT
24 PORTION OF THIS, I'M GOING TO APOLOGIZE TO REBECCA LONG FOR
25 HOP SCOTCHING OVER HER ITEM. I DIDN'T EVEN MAKE IT AN HOUR



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 INTO THE YEAR AND MANAGED TO DO THE BAD THING. SO, WE WILL
2 START WITH COUNCILMEMBER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS. ADINA, AND
3 THEN WENDI, GO AHEAD.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. THANKS SO MUCH TO STAFF FOR THIS UPDATE
6 ABOUT THE OUTCOMES OF BIKESHARE IN THE REGION SINCE THE
7 PROGRAM GOT STARTED. IT'S REALLY IMPRESSIVE THAT BIKESHARE HAS
8 GROWN TO BECOME WHAT WOULD BE THE 8TH LARGEST TRANSIT SERVICE,
9 IF IT WERE CONSIDERED IN THAT FRAMEWORK AND, YOU KNOW,
10 EXCITING TO SEE HOW THIS HAS BECOME A VALUABLE SERVICE FOR
11 PEOPLE, INCLUDING FOR LOCAL TRIPS AND FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT,
12 FIRST AND LAST MILE. GLAD TO SEE THE INCLUSION ABOUT THE
13 IMPORTANCE OF THE POTENTIAL FOR PUBLIC FUNDING. YOU KNOW, SOME
14 OF THE LESSONS OF THE E-BIKES, FOR EXAMPLE, IN SAN JOSE THE
15 COST OF AN E-BIKE WAS INCREASED AND THE RIDERSHIP DECREASES
16 AND SAN JOSE EXPERIENCING DISPARITIES CAN USE E-BIKES BECAUSE
17 OF THE COST. SO THAT WOULD SUPPORT THAT DIRECTION TOWARDS
18 PUBLIC FUNDING FOR ACCESSIBILITY AND ANOTHER CONCLUSION IN
19 LOOKING AT THIS DATA IS SHOWING THAT THE FRAGILITY, WHEN THE
20 SYSTEM IS FRAGMENTED, THERE WERE SEVERAL DIFFERENT
21 JURISDICTIONS THAT WERE GOING WITH A NON-BAY WHEELS SYSTEM
22 THAT, YOU KNOW, SEEMS TO HAVE COME AND GONE, AND MEANWHILE,
23 ALSO, THE COUNTY OF SAN MATEO IS MOVING FORWARD WITH YET
24 ANOTHER BIKESHARE AND MICROMOBILITY SYSTEM. AND OVER THE LAST
25 FEW YEARS, THE REGION HAS MADE SO MUCH PROGRESS WITH THE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN LOOKING TO HAVE A MORE INTEGRATED
2 SYSTEM OF PUBLIC TRANSIT AND I WOULD HOPE TO SEE, AS THINGS
3 ARE LOOKING FORWARD TOWARDS THE NEXT GENERATION OF BIKESHARE,
4 TO LOOK AT THOSE LESSONS FOR HAVING A WELL INTEGRATED SYSTEM
5 FOR BIKESHARE AND MICROMOBILITY, AS WELL. AND I'LL SAY THAT AS
6 AN INDIVIDUAL USER WHOLE USE BIKESHARE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND
7 WILL USE BIKESHARE IN SAN JOSE, AND, YOU KNOW, IN -- AND, YOU
8 KNOW, IN THE EAST BAY, WHEN I GO THERE. AND I REALLY DON'T
9 WANT TO BE ABLE TO HAVE -- NEED TO HAVE MULTIPLE PROGRAMS IN
10 DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION FOR THE TRIPS AS AN INDIVIDUAL
11 USER. LASTLY, I REALLY -- IN TERMS OF THAT PUBLIC FUNDING, I'M
12 GLAD TO SEE THAT THE SHORT-TERM LOOK TO THE CLIMATE FUNDING TO
13 BE ABLE TO HAVE ADDITIONAL E-BIKES, AND WANT TO -- THE MOST,
14 STRONGEST POINT I WANT TO MAKE HERE, IS TO CONNECT THIS AGENDA
15 ITEM WITH THE UPCOMING NEXT AGENDA ITEM. BECAUSE WHILE THE
16 STAFF REPORT SAID THAT THERE IS THREE YEARS TO PLAN AND
17 PROCURE WHAT COMES NEXT, THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM IS TALKING ABOUT
18 THE GROUNDWORK FOR AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR A REGIONAL
19 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE. AND THE TIMELINE FOR
20 THAT IS ONE YEAR. SO, EVEN THOUGH THERE WOULD BE THREE YEARS
21 TO DO A CONTRACT AND ALL THE DETAILS, THE CONCEPT, IF WE WANT
22 TO HAVE THIS AS A PART OF OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM,
23 REALLY WOULD NEED TO BE CONSIDERED IN TERMS OF THAT ONE YEAR
24 TIME FRAME THAT THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WILL BE CONTEMPLATING.
25 SO, I WANTED TO REALLY SUPPORT THAT. AND LASTLY, THE THING



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 THAT I SAID WHERE I WANTED TO REPORT THAT THOSE POINTS ABOUT
2 HAVING A PUBLICLY FUNDED SYSTEM THAT WAS WELL INTEGRATED,
3 THERE WAS A LETTER THAT WAS SENT BY A NUMBER OF ACTIVE
4 TRANSPORTATION GROUPS THAT WAS SENT TO THE OPERATIONS
5 COMMITTEE, AND I DO NOT THINK IT WAS COPIED TO POLICY ADVISORY
6 COUNCIL, BUT THOSE COMMENTS WERE MADE BY MULTIPLE ACTIVE
7 TRANSPORTATION GROUPS AROUND THE REGION. THANKS.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ADINA. WENDI, AND THEN DWAYNE.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** ADINA DID MAKE SOME OF THE POINTS I WANTED TO
12 MAKE, I WANT TO PUT AN EXCLAMATION POINT ABOUT SUBSIDIES AND
13 CONNECTIVITY, OBVIOUSLY WHEN PEOPLE TRY TO GO OUT AND USE A
14 DIFFERENT CARRIER THAT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE WORKING TOO WELL. SO
15 MAYBE SOME REAL REGIONAL COORDINATION NEEDS TO HAPPEN SO
16 PEOPLE DON'T SIGN UP FOR A CARRIER AND THEN LOSE THEM AT THE
17 LAST MINUTE LIKE WE DID IN MARIN AND SONOMA A I WANT TO POINT
18 OUT, MARIN SONOMA, I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE MAPS LOOK LIKE IN THE
19 OTHER AREAS BUT THE BIG PROBLEM I SEE FORTHCOMING, WITH THE
20 SMART CORRIDOR FIRST AND LAST MILE SITUATION, THAT'S NOT ALONG
21 THE CORRIDOR THAT'S PEOPLE GOING OUT AWAY FROM THE CORRIDOR
22 AND YET THERE AREN'T STATIONS TO BE ABLE TO TAKE PEOPLE TO AND
23 FROM THE EAST AND WEST. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S THE SAME WITH
24 PLACES LIKE WHERE YOU WEREN'T HAVING AS GOOD OF OUTCOMES IN
25 SAN FRANCISCO, BUT IT'S POSSIBLE THAT BECAUSE SAN FRANCISCO



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 REALLY WAS SPREAD OUT THROUGHOUT THE CITY THAT COULD BE KEY TO
2 WHY IT WAS SUCCESSFUL BECAUSE IT WAS ACCESSIBLE JUST ABOUT
3 ANYWHERE. EVERYWHERE IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND I HAVE BEEN TO
4 EUROPE, AND IN EUROPE THEY'RE EVERYWHERE. AND THAT'S WHAT
5 MAKES A SUCCESSFUL SYSTEM, AND POINTING OUT THE EXCLAMATION
6 POINT AGAINST THE SUBSIDIES AND HOW IMPORTANT THIS IS AS PART
7 OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IS, THE FIRST AND LAST MILE, THE SHORTER
8 TRIPS AND IT REALLY NEEDS TO BE FOLDED INTO THE TRANSIT
9 SUBSIDIES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DWAYNE AND THEN HOWARD?

12

13 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** MY COMMENT IS REGARDING SOME OF THE REASONS
14 THAT THE PROGRAM FAILED, AS FAR AS THE THEFT AND THE
15 VANDALISM. I PRESENTLY WORK IN RICHMOND, AND I THINK THIS CITY
16 NEEDS A BIG UPLIFT AND I THINK COULD THIS BE PART OF IT AS FAR
17 AS TRANSPORTATION. AND I WANTED TO KNOW, WHAT IS BEING DONE
18 ABOUT THE THEFT AND VANDALISM? IS IT, LIKE, YOU CAN PUT A
19 TRACKER ON THE BIKE, AND THEN AFTER SO MANY HOURS, YOU CAN
20 TRACK THE BIKE? BUT IS THERE A SOLUTION TO THE THEFT AND
21 VANDALISM? THANK YOU.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD AND THEN VEDA.

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **HOWARD WONG:** I, TOO, AM REALLY SURPRISED BY THAT STATISTICS OF
2 E-BIKE BEING THE EQUIVALENT OF THE 8TH LARGEST TRANSIT AT THE
3 AGENCY. I THINK THAT TYPE OF DATA AND INFORMATION REALLY
4 SHOULD BE DISTRIBUTED WIDELY. THERE SHOULD BE A VERY GOOD
5 EFFORT FOR A PUBLIC RELATIONS CAMPAIGN TO TALK ABOUT THE
6 POTENTIAL OF E-BIKES. AS WE HAVE BEEN READING THAT E-BIKES ARE
7 GROWING, MICROMOBILITY MODE IN EUROPE, IN OTHER COUNTRIES. AND
8 PART OF THE PUBLIC RELATIONS CAMPAIGN IS TO START GAINING
9 TRACTION FOR MORE DESIGN OF STREETScape OF HAVING MULTIPLE
10 MOBILITY MODES THOUGHT ABOUT IN HOW WE DESIGN OUR STREETS,
11 WHICH EUROPE IS DOING, AND PARTICULARLY PARIS, WITH ITS VERY
12 AGGRESSIVE BIKE LANES AND INTEGRATED TRANSIT AND DECREASED
13 AUTOMOTIVE INFLUENCES. SO IT SOUNDS LIKE A REALLY POSITIVE
14 MOVE. THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, HOWARD. VEDA AND THEN RICH.

17

18 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I APPRECIATED ALL
19 THE INFORMATION THAT YOU PROVIDED. IT WAS SAD, HERE IN THE
20 NORTH BAY, I AM PART OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL REPRESENTING
21 MARIN COUNTY, AND IT WAS VERY SAD TO SEE THAT THE CONTRACT
22 THAT WAS GIVEN TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE] MOBILITY WAS TERMINATED
23 AND I HOPE IN THE FUTURE WE CONSIDER INVESTING IN MORE MONEY
24 HERE IN NORTH BAY BECAUSE WE DO HAVE A BEAUTIFUL AREA IN WHICH
25 PEOPLE CAN RIDE AND ALSO WE CAN USE THE BIKES FOR SHORT TRIPS



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 AS WENDI KALLINS MENTIONED AND FOR THE FIRST AND LAST MILE
2 SITUATION. SO I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SEE MORE INVESTMENT HERE IN
3 MARIN COUNTY. AND I HOPE ALONG THOSE LINES IF WE HAVE SO MANY
4 INDIVIDUALS USING BIKES THAT WE CAN MOVE THE NEEDLE FORWARD
5 FOR OUR LOCAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES TO CONTINUE TO CONSIDER
6 PROTECTED BIKE LANES FOR THE COMMUNITY. AND AS WE LOOK TO
7 INVEST IN COMMUNITY FOR BIKESHARE OPPORTUNITY, I AM WONDERING
8 IF WE COULD FIND CONSIDERATION FOR THREE WHEEL BIKES SO THAT
9 THOSE WITH DISABILITIES CAN PARTICIPATE IN THE PROGRAM, AS
10 WELL. AND I LOOK FORWARD SEEING FUTURE PRESENTATIONS ALONG
11 THIS LINE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH, AND THEN ZACK.

14

15 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANKS. SAN MATEO HAD NOT AN E-BIKE PROGRAM,
16 BUT A BIKE PROGRAM, AND SOME OF MY COMMENTS ON THIS ARE GOING
17 TO BE BASED ON WE REALLY NEED TO PLAN HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO
18 THESE THINGS NOT ONLY JUST TO TRY TO STOP VANDALISM AND THEFT
19 BUT ALSO TO GET COMMUNITY BUY-IN WITH THE BIKE PROGRAM. WHEN
20 WE HAD THE BIKES THEY WERE ALLOWED TO LEAVE BIKES WHENEVER
21 THAT I WANTED TO LEAVE THEM, THERE WERE TREMENDOUS COMMUNITY
22 COMPLAINTS ABOUT BIKES BEING LEFT IN SIDEWALKS, AND IN LAWNS
23 AND OTHER AREAS, DOORWAYS AND THE PROGRAM FAILED PRETTY FAST,
24 AND I THINK THE REDWOOD CITY ONE FAILED TOO. I THINK THE
25 PROGRAM SHOWS IT CAN BE SUCCESSFUL WITH THE CITY OF SAN



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 FRANCISCO. BUT LIKE WITH THE PRESS WAY PROGRAM, WE NEED TO
2 HAVE A MORE UNIFIED WAY OF OPERATING IT. AN EXAMPLE WOULD BE
3 THE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS WE HAVE HAD IN THE DIFFERENT CITIES
4 WHICH CREATES SOME CONFUSION IN THE ABILITY ESPECIALLY WHEN
5 YOU ARE RIDING TRANSIT SOMEWHERE ELSE AND DOCKING THE BIKE,
6 AND VERY MUCH LIKE WITH THE EXPRESS LANE PROGRAM WHERE YOU
7 HAVE DIFFERENT EQUITY ISSUES LIKE WITH THE ONE IN SAN MATEO,
8 THE ONE IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, WE REALLY NEED TO HAVE AN AREA WIDE
9 EQUITY PROGRAM FOR ALL THESE DIFFERENT BIKESHARE PROGRAMS. SO,
10 I WOULD LEAVE IT AT THAT RIGHT NOW, BECAUSE I HAVE HEARD VERY
11 GRIT COMMENTS FROM OTHER PEOPLE. AND, THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ZACK AND THEN SCOTT.

14

15 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK
16 IT'S HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND WHERE WE HAVE BEEN AND ARE IN THIS
17 MOMENT TO UNDERSTAND HOW WE CAN MAINTAIN THE PROGRAM BUT HOW
18 WE MIGHT BE VISIONALLY IN THE BIKESHARE SYSTEM WE WANT TO SEE
19 IN THE BAY AREA. I HAVE ONE BIG QUESTION THAT MAY NOT BE
20 ANSWERED TODAY BUT WANT TO GET THE GEARS TURNING, IS WHAT
21 WOULD IT TAKE FOR A BAY AREA WIDE BIKESHARE PROGRAM WITH
22 STRONG EQUITY AND ACCESSIBILITY THAT IS COMPONENTS BUILT IN,
23 AND HOW DO WE GET THERE, AND SPECIFICALLY WHAT IT WOULD COST
24 TO OPERATE, AND SUBSIDIES, AND POTENTIAL COST AROUND
25 INFRASTRUCTURE AND VEHICLE, AND THE FLEETS, AND AT THE MTC



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 LEVEL, STAFF, EXPERTISE, AND CAPACITY. SO I WOULD LOVE TO SEE
2 KIND OF WHERE WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO GO WITH A PROGRAM LIKE THIS
3 AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND EXPAND IT. BECAUSE I DO AGREE WITH
4 ADINA'S POINT THAT A REGIONALLY FOCUSED AND INTEGRATED PROGRAM
5 WOULD PROBABLY YIELD BETTER BENEFITS THAN A VERY SEGMENTED
6 PROGRAM. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE WHAT THAT VISION MIGHT LOOK LIKE
7 WITH INCREASED ACCESSIBILITY AND MOBILITY MODES AND BENEFITS
8 AND CARBON EMISSIONS TYING INTO OUR GOALS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY AND THEN CHRIS
11 FITZGERALD.

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. MY QUESTION RELATES TO THE
14 EFFECTIVENESS OF THIS PROGRAM AND THE USAGE IN DIFFERENT KINDS
15 OF COMMUNITIES OTHER THAN IN CITIES WHERE IT MAKES SENSE. AND,
16 PARTICULARLY, THE LARGE CITIES WHERE SO MUCH IS GOING ON
17 INTERNATIONALLY WITHIN A PARTICULAR CITY OR EVEN A DISTRICT.
18 BEING IN A RURAL COUNTY WHERE OUR CITIES ARE RELATIVELY FAR
19 APART, AND, ALSO, THEY RANGE IN SIZE FROM 2500 TO 60,000,
20 WHICH IS SMALL COMPARED TO ALL OF THE OTHER COUNTIES. BUT OUR
21 ISSUES AND ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE WOULD FACE WOULD BE
22 WHAT ABOUT THE FOUR AND A HALF MILLION VISITORS THAT WE GET
23 EVERY YEAR COMING TO THE WINE COUNTRY. THAT, TO ME, OFFERS A
24 CHALLENGE, BECAUSE THEY MAY BE WILLING TO GO FROM CITY TO
25 CITY, BUT IT'S SUCH A SMALL BASE, AND THAT WE'RE DOING -- YOU



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 KNOW, HOW DO WE ARRANGE OR DETERMINE TO HAVE ENOUGH BIKES
2 AVAILABLE FOR VISITORS THAT WOULD NOT BE UTILIZED ON A NORMAL
3 BASIS BY RESIDENTS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MICHAEL BALDINI?

6

7 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WAIT --

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** MY QUESTION, AND ALSO, A NAPA COUNTY
12 RESIDENT, LIKE TERRY, THERE IS ABOUT A 5, 6, OR ABOUT A HALF
13 DOZEN RENTAL COMPANIES THAT RENT E-BIKES IN NAPA VALLEY, AND I
14 HAVE SEEN QUITE A FEW OF THEM IN MY TRAVELS, AND PLUS AT WORK.
15 ARE WE PARTNERING WITH THOSE? OR DOES THE CONTRACT WITH BAY
16 SHARE EXCLUDE WORKING WITH PRIVATE COMPANIES? SO THE EXAMPLE
17 OF TOURISM IS TO ASSIST THESE OPERATORS ON OUTREACH, AS WELL
18 AS UTILIZATION, AND PERHAPS LOWER THEIR RATES. THE RATES VARY
19 FROM RIGHT AROUND \$38 AN HOUR WHICH IS QUITE EXCESSIVE IN MY
20 VIEWPOINT, IF YOU'RE GOING TO ENCOURAGE BICYCLING. SO IS THERE
21 A POSSIBILITY TO WORK WITH EXISTING RENTAL COMPANIES IN AN
22 AREA PRESENTLY NOT SERVED BY BAY SHARE WHERE WE CONVERT FROM
23 AUTOMOBILE TO BICYCLES. THANK YOU.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHRIS FITZGERALD?



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THAT'S WHAT I WANTED. SO, A COUPLE OF
3 QUICK QUESTIONS. I'M NOT SURE WHERE THIS FITS INTO THE SCHEME
4 OF THINGS. BUT SOME THINGS TO THINK ABOUT, CERTAINLY, LOOKING
5 AT E-BIKES, WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT THE MAINTENANCE AND THE
6 REPLACEMENT OF SAID BATTERY. IF WE'RE LOOKING AT A SUSTAINABLE
7 AND CONTINUAL SOURCE OF ENERGY FOR THE BIKE IF WE'RE NOT DOING
8 STANDARD PEDAL POWER, AND, CERTAINLY, THAT'S UNDERSTANDABLE,
9 GIVEN THE DISTANCES, AND THE ABILITY OF PEOPLE TO RIDE BIKES
10 AND SUCH. WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT HOW TO REPLACE THE BATTERY TO
11 KEEP THAT, THOSE BATTERIES OUT OF THE LANDFILL. SO, WE'RE
12 REALLY LOOKING AT THE FOOD CHAIN, IF YOU WILL, OF REPLACING
13 THE BATTERY, BUT MORE TO THE POINT I THINK THAT IF WE'RE EVER
14 GOING TO GET -- PERHAPS WE NEED TO, THE BIKES BE RERACKED IN
15 THE CHARGING STATION SO THAT, YOU KNOW, IT'S OFF THE STREET,
16 OUT OF THE SIDEWALK, AND THE ONLY WAY TO GET YOUR DEPOSIT BACK
17 IS TO DO JUST THAT. OTHERWISE AFTER X NUMBER OF TIMES OF DOING
18 THIS, YOUR ABILITY AND RIGHT TO BORROW THE BIKE IS TAKEN AWAY.
19 . YOU KNOW, IF WE DON'T DO THOSE THINGS, THOSE VERY BASIC
20 THINGS, I THINK WE'RE KICKING THE CAN DOWN THE ROAD TOWARD
21 ECOLOGY TO, YOU KNOW, TO IMPROVE, TO LESSEN EMISSIONS, IMPROVE
22 QUALITY OF LIFE, AND THE HEALTH OF OUR PLANET. SO, THOSE ARE
23 MY THOUGHTS.

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. VINAY, AND THEN CAMPOS.
2 VINAY, GO AHEAD.

3

4 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. YES. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, JUST FOR THE
5 -- JUST FOR THE SENSE OF WHAT 8TH LARGEST MEANS, WHICH ARE
6 SIXTH AND 7TH, WHICH ARE 9TH AND 10th, WHICH ARE CURRENTLY THE
7 7TH AND 9TH, JUST SO WE GET A SENSE OF THE SCALE. ALSO, I
8 DON'T WANT TO GET INTO THE WEEDS OF THE REPORT, BUT I WOULD
9 LIKE TO KNOW WHAT OTHER INFORMATION THESE COMPANIES HAVE BEEN
10 COLLECTING. YOU KNOW, LIKE, SAY, FOR EXAMPLE, WHAT IS THE
11 LENGTH OF THE AVERAGE TRIP? ARE THERE PEOPLE WHO LIVE WITHIN
12 THE CITY BY AND LARGE, ARE THE E-BIKES CAUSING THEM TO FOREGO
13 THEIR CHOICE OF BUYING A CAR? SO, THAT KIND OF INFORMATION, I
14 WONDER HOW MUCH INFORMATION WAS ACTUALLY GATHERED BY THE
15 COMPANIES. BECAUSE THAT COULD BE INTERESTING. SO, AND, ALSO,
16 YEAH, SOME SENSE OF HOW MUCH MONEY, YOU KNOW, WHAT KIND OF
17 LOSSES ARE THESE COMPANIES TAKING RIGHT NOW? OR, YOU KNOW,
18 JUST TO GET A SENSE OF THE MONEY PICTURE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. PAM AND THEN GERRY.

21

22 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE HISTORY AND CONTEXT
23 OF THIS PROGRAM. I REMEMBER WHEN I FIRST SAW THE BIKES POP-UP
24 OUTSIDE OF MY WORKSPACE, AND I REMEMBER BEING HESITANT TO
25 INTERACT WITH IT, BECAUSE YOU HAVE TO DOWNLOAD THE APP. SO, I



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 NOTICED ON THE PRESENTATION, THERE IS A POSSIBILITY FOR
2 CLIPPER 2.0 TO OFFER NEW OPPORTUNITIES AND TRANSIT PAY
3 INTEGRATION, AND I JUST WANT TO ELEVATE THAT AND SAY THAT IT'S
4 A REALLY GOOD IDEA FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE CONCERNS, LIKE ME, WHO
5 DON'T WANT TO HAVE TO DOWNLOAD APPS AND HAVE DATA AND PRIVACY
6 CONCERNS. I ALSO DIDN'T WANT TO LINK A CREDIT CARD TO THIS
7 SERVICE. AND I AM SURE THERE ARE MANY PEOPLE WHO MIGHT SHARE
8 THAT SAME CONCERN. SO, JUST REALLY WANT TO ELEVATE THE
9 POSSIBILITY OF INTEGRATING CLIPPER TO THE BIKESHARE PROGRAM.
10 BECAUSE I THINK THAT WILL ENABLE ACCESS TO A LOT MORE FOLKS
11 WHO ARE FAMILIAR WITH CLIPPER AND TRUST CLIPPER TO BUYING INTO
12 THIS PROGRAM, AS WELL. THANK YOU.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GERRY, GO AHEAD.

15

16 **GERRY GLASER:** I WANT GOING TO SAY MUCH, BUT A COUPLE OF POINTS
17 FROM ME THAT I THOUGHT WERE IMPORTANT. ONE IS, IF THIS IS
18 GOING TO BECOME A PUBLIC PROGRAM ULTIMATELY INSTEAD OF THE WAY
19 IT'S BEEN DONE KEEPS ME FROM RIDING A BIKE IN MOST AREAS WHERE
20 I WANT TO RIDE I NEED A BIKE LANE NEED TO PROTECT. I HAVE
21 RIDDEN A BIKE IN EUROPE ON VACATION YOU CAN GO ON THE TRAIL
22 AND ROADS AND EVEN THERE THE ROADS ARE PROTECTED AND THAT'S
23 NOT THE CASE HERE. THE BEST WE DO IN MOST CASES, WE PAINT A
24 NICE GREEN SECTION TELLING CARS DON'T RUN OVER THE PERSON WHO
25 IS IN THIS GREEN SECTION. THE NEW LEGISLATION IS GREAT. BUT



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 IT'S NOT THE SAME AS GETTING THE BIKES LANES IN THERE. SO MY
2 SUGGESTION IS TO LOOK AT THE PROGRAM DIFFERENTLY. LOOK AT THE
3 PROGRAM AS A BIKE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, NOT A BIKESHARE
4 PROGRAM. A BIKE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM. THE BIKESHARE IS PART
5 OF IT. THE OTHER PART IS, WHERE WILL THE BIKES GO. AND THAT
6 MEANS MORE FUNDS. SO TO ADINA'S POINT, AND OTHER'S POINTS,
7 ABOUT, FOR FUNDING, WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT THIS MORE
8 HOLISTICALLY, SO WE CAN GET IT DONE AS PART OF THE BOND.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CARINA?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. THANK YOU FOR THE
13 PRESENTATION. I USED TO BE A BIKE PLANNER ALMOST TEN YEARS
14 AGO, AND NOW I'M A PARENT OF A SMALL CHILD. ONE OF THE
15 CHALLENGES FOR ME AS A PARENT USING ANY FORM OF BIKESHARE IS
16 THERE ARE NO ATTACHMENTS FOR CHILDREN OR TRAILERS. THERE'S
17 JUST NO WAY TO GO ON BIKESHARE WITH CHILDREN. AND NOW THAT I'M
18 IN THIS PHASE OF PARENTING I'M ALSO THINKING ABOUT CHILDREN
19 AND THE AGE LIMIT TO USING BIKESHARE, AND SO PEOPLE WHO ARE
20 MAYBE UNDER 18 MAY NOT BE ABLE TO SIGN UP. SO I'M JUST
21 WONDERING WHERE HAS BIKESHARE GOTTEN TO IN THE LAST EIGHT
22 YEARS WITH ALL OF THAT WITH IN TERMS OF THINKING ABOUT
23 ACCESSIBILITY FOR FAMILIES AND CHILDREN USING BIKESHARE AND
24 KNOWING ABOUT CREATING A LIFE CYCLE USERS YOU START YOUNG AND
25 PEOPLE WHO ARE USING BIKESHARE AT A YOUNG AGE WILL PROBABLY



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 CONTINUE TO ADOPT THAT BEHAVIOR LONG-TERM. JUST CURIOUS TO
2 HEAR IF THERE ARE ANY PLANS IN THE FUTURE SUCH AS BUILD-OUT.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CARINA. LAURA I'M NOT GOING TO
5 ASK YOU TO ANSWER ALL OF THESE QUESTIONS. I'M ASSUMING YOU ARE
6 TAKING PRIMARILY FEEDBACK. BUT I WANTED TO GO THROUGH A COUPLE
7 OF POINTS, AND THE FIRST ONE IS HOW CAN WE HELP YOU? THERE'S A
8 HUGE INTEREST. WE HAVE A COMMITTEE THAT I THINK NEEDS TO BE
9 INVOLVED IN THIS. AND THAT WOULD BE THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION
10 PLAN COMMITTEE TO HELP FLESH OUT AN A LITTLE BIT MORE DEEPLY,
11 ALL OF THE COMMENTS THAT YOU HAVE BEEN RECEIVING. BECAUSE IT
12 DOES NEED TO BE SUPPORTED. IT IS A PUBLIC PROGRAM, AND IT
13 NEEDS TO BE A PUBLIC PROGRAM. SO, I'LL TALK WITH STAFF ABOUT
14 THAT, BUT I DO WANT YOU TO TAP INTO THAT. AND I'LL TALK TO THE
15 CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE AND THE SUBCHAIR, AND WE'LL SEE HOW WE
16 CAN -- BECAUSE ADINA IS RIGHT. WE HAVE A YEAR, YOU IF WE'RE
17 GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM, WE DON'T HAVE
18 THREE YEARS. AND TO THE POINT CARINA BROUGHT UP, WITH A FAMILY
19 NEXT DOOR WITH TWO ADULTS AND A CHILD, THE REASON THEY DON'T
20 TAKE THEIR CHILD ON EXTENSIVE TRIPS ON THE BIKE PATHS, OR USE
21 E-BIKES IS BECAUSE THERE IS NO AVAILABILITY FOR THEM TO DO
22 THAT. ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU ARE LIVING IN APARTMENTS OR
23 SOMETHING WHERE YOU CAN'T STORE BIKES AND YOU CAN'T, YOU KNOW,
24 THERE IS JUST NO WAY AROUND IT, IT WOULD BE GREAT IF WE ROLLED
25 IN, LOOKING DOWN THE FUTURE, HEALTHY GROWTH IS A TRUE TRANSIT



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SYSTEM. I DO WANT TO KNOW WHAT THE LESSONS ARE LEARNED ON
2 THEFT. BECAUSE I SEE BICYCLE PARTS HERE AND THERE. I LIVE NEAR
3 A FREEWAY SO IT'S NOT UNUSUAL, BUT I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE
4 THINGS WE NEED TO ADDRESS UP FRONT. AND I WOULD ENCOURAGE OUR
5 PROGRAM WORK NOT JUST WITH THE CMAS WHO LOOK AT THE BIG
6 PICTURE OF WHAT'S BEING DONE TO INSTALL PROTECTED LANES, BUT
7 THE INDIVIDUAL DEPARTMENTS OF TRANSPORTATION, WE HAVE OUR OWN
8 SCHEDULE THAT THEY WORK ON, SO WE COULD BE MISSING
9 OPPORTUNITIES TO INSTALL INFRASTRUCTURE AS THE INDIVIDUAL
10 ENTITIES BUILD-OUT THEIR SYSTEM. FOR INSTANCE, THE ROAD THAT
11 WAS JUST DONE TWO YEARS AGO, RIGHT DOWN THE STREET FROM ME.
12 WITH THAT, I AM GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. MARTHA WAS
13 THERE ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT?

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
16 ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE THREE MEMBERS WITH THEIR HANDS
17 RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO
18 GIVE?

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THREE MINUTES. AND I'LL REMIND THE PUBLIC
21 TO DIAL STAR NINE, OR RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU ARE ON ZOOM. GO
22 AHEAD. IF YOU WOULD CALL ON THEM, PLEASE?

23



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. FIRST UP IS GEORGE SPIES.

2 GEORGE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. GEORGE, ARE YOU WITH US?

3 OKAY. GOING TO THE NEXT SPEAKER. JUSTIN NGUYEN. JUSTIN?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES I CAN. GO AHEAD.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I AM JUSTIN HU-NGUYEN, DIRECTOR OF ADVOCACY FOR THE
10 BICYCLE COALITION, ENCOURAGE SUPPORT FOR INVESTMENTS PROVIDE A
11 PLATFORM AND IT SHOWS THAT ALL THE SYSTEMS, INCLUDING BAY
12 WHEELS SHOWS THAT IN ORDER TO AFFORDABLE EQUITABLE AND
13 EXPANSIVE, IT REQUIRES PUBLIC INVESTMENT TO MAKE THE PROGRAM
14 SUCCESSFUL. TO GROW THESE PROGRAMS AND SHARABLE BIKES IN LOW-
15 DENSITY NEIGHBORHOODS AND CITIES. IN SAN FRANCISCO, WITH E-
16 BIKES EVERYWHERE, THE SYSTEM IS UNEVEN AND UNEQUAL THROUGHOUT
17 THE CITY. IN ORDER TO EXPAND THE PROGRAM AND REACH DENSITY
18 LEVELS TO MAKE IT SUCCESSFUL IT REQUIRES MORE STATIONS MORE
19 BIKES, AND MORE PUBLIC SUPPORT. I'M ENCOURAGED BY THE
20 FINDINGS, IN SUPPORT AND FUNDING ELECTRIFICATION SYSTEMS. THIS
21 SHOWS TREMENDOUS DESIRE FOR E-BIKE MOBILITY IN SAN FRANCISCO.
22 E-BIKES ARE EXPENSIVE AND YOU WOULD BE ABLE TO STORY BOTH AT
23 HOME, AND IN TRANSIT AND AT WORK. E-BIKES ARE AFFORDABLE AND
24 WE NEED TO SUPPORT TO MAKE IT SUCCESSFUL. I ENCOURAGE
25 EXPLORATION OF FAMILY BIKESHARE AND SOCIAL BIKESHARE WE HAVE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SEEN IN SAN FRANCISCO GROWTH IN BOTH AND THE PILOTS ARE
2 SUCCESSFUL IF WE CAN INCORPORATE THESE SHAREABLE MODELS INTO A
3 REGIONAL BIKESHARE MODEL. I ALSO WANT TO THROW IN THAT,
4 REALLY, EFFORTS OF REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING INCLUDE ACTIVE --
5 [INDISCERNIBLE] BIKESHARE, AND VULNERABILITY PLAYS AN
6 ESSENTIAL ROLE IN SUPPORTING AND COMPLEMENTING PUBLIC TRANSIT
7 AND BIKESHARE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS ANTHONY.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THERE MY NAME IS ANTHONY MONTEZ, I AM AN
12 ORGANIZER WITH THE SILICON VALLEY BICYCLE COALITION. I WANTED
13 TO SAY THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO LAURA FOR AN EXCELLENT
14 PRESENTATION AND A LOT OF REALLY GOOD INFORMATION IN IT. I
15 FIND IT INTERESTING, YOU CAN LOOK AT IT AND HAVE DIFFERENT
16 TAKE-AWAY'S THERE WAS A DIFFERENT SPEAKER BEFORE THAT
17 MENTIONED INFRASTRUCTURE IS A HUGE PART OF MAKING FOLKS FEEL
18 COMFORTABLE TO RIDE FOR THE BIKESHARE PROGRAM. WHEN YOU LOOK
19 AT THE NUMBERS YOU SEE BIKESHARE RIDERSHIP HAS PLUMMETED IN
20 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE. I'M NOT GOING TO SAY AT THE BEST FACILITIES
21 IN THE SOUTH BAY BUT THEY'RE GOOD. WE CAN AGREE ON THE PUBLIC
22 INVESTMENTS HAVE TO BE ROBUST, CREATIVE AND THEY HAVE TO BE
23 STABLE. SO, THAT'S WHY, AGAIN, PUBLIC INVESTMENT IS REALLY
24 IMPORTANT IF YOU CAN TIE INTO ANY REGIONAL MEASURE IN THE
25 FUTURE, SO THAT THERE AREN'T THE RISK OF FISCAL CLIFFS THAT



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 COULD IMPAIR THE PROGRAM OR HURT PEOPLE'S ABILITY TO UTILIZE
2 IT IS GOING TO BE BETTER FOR COMMUNITIES BETTER FOR REDUCING
3 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. ALSO, WHEN WE THINK ABOUT A REGION
4 FALL BIKESHARE, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE BUILDING THIS
5 PLAN OUT OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS SO THAT PLACES LIKE SAN
6 MATEO COUNTY THAT'S DOING THEIR OWN SHARED MICROMOBILITY
7 PROGRAM NOW AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND VTA ARE ALL
8 COORDINATING SO THAT IT'S ONE UNIFORM SEAMLESS SYSTEM. SO A
9 LOT OF WORK TO DO. I THINK THIS IS A REALLY GOOD FRAMEWORK
10 WE'RE WORKING WITH NOW. WE JUST TO V TO FORGE THINGS UP AND
11 MAKE SURE THERE IS AN EQUITY FOCUS AND ALSO FOCUS ON ROBUST
12 FUNDING. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS GEORGE SPIES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** GEORGE, TRANSIT USER, I LIVE IN OAKLAND CALIFORNIA. I
17 USE BAY WHEELS AND I USE A NUMBER OF TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE
18 BAY AREA. SO, I HAVE FIRSTHAND EXPERIENCE OF THE IMPORTANCE OF
19 THAT FIRST MILE LAST MILE THAT MICROMOBILITY PROVIDES TO
20 USERS. AND I WOULD SAY THAT THE THING THAT IS GOING TO BE
21 CRITICAL IN THE FUTURE TO MAKE SURE THAT A REGIONAL
22 MICROMOBILITY SERVICE ACTUALLY WORKS IS THAT IT BE
23 COORDINATED, THAT IT BE REGIONALLY MANAGED AND PUBLICLY
24 GOVERNED SO THAT WE CAN REALLY PURSUE THE EQUITY AND BREADTH
25 OF SERVICE THAT WE NEED TO MAKE IT SUCCESSFUL. IS THAT GOING



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 DO REQUIRE PUBLIC SUBSIDY? I THINK THE PRESENTATION WAS CLEAR.
2 EXCELLENT PRESENTATION BY THE WAY, THAT THERE'S VALUE THAT
3 PUBLIC SUBSIDY IS LIKELY NECESSARY. SO I JUST WANT TO BE -- I
4 WANT TO ENCOURAGE MTC TO FOLLOW ADINA'S SUGGESTION OF PULLING
5 TOGETHER THESE TWO ITEMS TODAY. THIS ITEM, AND THE NEXT ITEM
6 AROUND THINKING THROUGH WHAT REGIONAL FUNDING IS GOING TO
7 REQUIRE SO THAT THAT CAN BE INCORPORATED IN A REGIONAL TRANSIT
8 FUNDING MEASURE BECAUSE MICRO MOBILE IS PART OF TRANSIT. ANY
9 USER LIKE MYSELF CAN TELL YOU THAT IT'S ALL ONE TRIP. RIGHT?
10 SO, I REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR TIME AND ATTENTION TO THIS, AND
11 THAT MTC IS BEING SO PROACTIVE. I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING THE
12 PROGRESS AND MAKING THE CONTRIBUTIONS I CAN TO DELIVER US A
13 REGIONALLY MANAGED PUBLICLY GOVERNED AND FUNDED SYSTEM. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
17 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT COMPLETES THE COUNCIL COMMENTS AND
20 THE PUBLIC INPUT. RICH HEDGES'S HAND IS UP. GO AHEAD, RICH.

21

22 **RICHARD HEDGES:** JUST QUICKLY, THE NEXT TO THE LAST SPEAKER
23 RAISED SOMETHING ABOUT SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO COUNTY
24 MICROMOBILITY THAT'S SOMETHING I DO NOT KNOW ABOUT. IF ONE OF
25 THE STAFF COULD TELL US, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LAURA, DID YOU HAVE ANY
3 CLOSING COMMENTS OR THOUGHTS?

4

5 **LAURA KRULL:** I DON'T THINK SO. I DON'T KNOW IF TOSHI WANTS TO
6 ADD ANYTHING?

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TOSHI?

9

10 **TOSHI SHEPARD-OHTA:** A LOT OF GREAT QUESTIONS TODAY.
11 UNFORTUNATELY NOT ENOUGH TIME TO GO THROUGH THEM TODAY BUT
12 APPRECIATE ALL OF THE FEEDBACK AND WE'LL SORT THROUGH AND
13 INCORPORATE AS WE MOVE FORWARD.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I HOPE WE CAN CIRCLE BACK TO
16 OUR SUBCOMMITTEE THIS IS AN EXCELLENT TIME TO GET YOUR GROUP
17 IN FRONT OF US, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CONTINUE TO
18 FOLLOW UP WITH YOU TO TRACK WHAT'S GOING ON AND TO SUPPORT YOU
19 IN ANY WAY THAT WE CAN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
20 PRESENTATION. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM NUMBER SIX. AND MY
21 ABJECT POLLING FOR HOP SCOTCHING OVER REBECCA LONG IN OUR
22 FIRST MEETING OF 2023. I'M SORRY. BUT REBECCA LONG, YOU ARE UP
23 NOW. THANK YOU.

24



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR KINMAN, POLICY ADVISORS.
2 REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. NO
3 BIG DEAL. I DO HAVE A MEETING SCHEDULED AT 3:30 HOPEFULLY IT
4 WILL TAKE 30 MINUTES ALLOTTED ON THE AGENDA. I APPRECIATE THE
5 COUNCIL MEMBERS, HEDGES, I HAVE HAD THE OF PRESENTING TO IN MY
6 20 YEARS OR SO ON THE STAFF OF MTC. I WILL MISS YOU RICH.
7 CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR NEW ROLE. THIS ITEM IS ABOUT A
8 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AND IT'S REALLY A
9 FOLLOW UP TO THE PRESENTATION THAT YOU RECEIVED FROM MY
10 COLLEAGUES GEORGIA AND DAVE IN SEPTEMBER. RECAP, THE
11 COMMISSION HAS GIVEN US DIRECTION TO BE DOING OUTREACH ON A
12 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT WE WOULD BE PURSUING,
13 ENABLING LEGISLATION ON NEXT YEAR. SO, 2023 IS ALL ABOUT
14 GETTING FEEDBACK, YOU KNOW, DEVELOPING CLEAR GOALS THAT WE
15 WANT TO ACHIEVE IN A MEASURE. GETTING -- DOING SOME POLLING TO
16 BETTER UNDERSTAND WHAT THE BROAD SET OF VOTERS FEEL, AND,
17 ALSO, OF COURSE, LOOKING INTO THE REVENUE OPTIONS THAT WE
18 MIGHT PUT ON THE BALLOT. SO, DURING THE FALL, WE HAVE BEEN
19 BEGINNING THE OUTREACH AND CONDUCTED KIND OF STAKEHOLDER
20 ENGAGEMENT. WE'RE NOT DOING PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT QUITE YET. I
21 RECALL WE GOT SOME GOOD FEEDBACK FROM YOU ALL, AND THAT,
22 CERTAINLY, INFORMING OUR NEXT STEPS. BUT THIS ITEM JUST GOING
23 TO KIND OF GO OVER SOME OF THE FEEDBACK WE GOT FROM OTHER
24 STAKEHOLDERS. SO, AND THIS IS JUST, IF YOU ARE LOOKING AT YOUR
25 PACKET, I DO NOT HAVE A PRESENTATION, BUT IT'S AGENDA ITEM 3B.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 I'M SORRY. THAT'S THE LEG COMMITTEE ITEM. [LAUGHTER] YEAH, YOU
2 GUYS CAN FIGURE IT OUT. SO --

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ITEM SIX.

5

6 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. SO, THE -- LOOKING AT THE PAGE WITH
7 BOLT BULLETS, THERE IS A BROAD CONSENSUS THAT SUSTAINING AND
8 IMPROVING TRANSIT SERVICE IS A TOP PRIORITY. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE
9 BEEN TALKING A FAIR AMOUNT ABOUT THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF
10 THAT'S ON THE HORIZON, ADDRESSING THAT IS ONE OF MTC'S TOP
11 PRIORITIES IN SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR. WE KNOW IT'S GOING TO BE A
12 VERY HEAVY LIFT, PARTICULARLY IN LIGHT OF THE GOVERNOR'S
13 PROPOSED BUDGET. BUT IN THE LONG-TERM, WE DO THINK THAT -- YOU
14 KNOW, AND WE'RE HEARING FROM STAKEHOLDERS THAT SUSTAINING
15 TRANSIT SERVICE NEEDS TO BE A KEY PRIORITY AS PART OF THIS
16 REGIONAL MEASURE, WE ALSO HEARD FROM A LOT OF STAKEHOLDER THAT
17 IS WHEN WE THINK ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, YOU KNOW, WE
18 DON'T NEED TO -- WE SHOULDN'T LIMIT OURSELVES TO THINKING
19 ABOUT FIXED ROUTE PUBLIC TRANSIT. RIGHT? SO, CLEARLY, THERE IS
20 A LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES WITH NEW TECHNOLOGY TO THINK ABOUT ON
21 DEMAND TRANSIT, AND, ALSO, BUILDING ON THE PRESENTATION YOU
22 JUST HEARD ABOUT BIKESHARE, RIGHT? THAT IS A FORM OF PUBLIC
23 TRANSPORTATION, RIGHT? WHERE IT'S AVAILABLE IN THE COMMUNITY,
24 AND IT'S A WAY TO ADDRESS THE FIRST AND LAST MILE, ET CETERA,
25 SO THAT'S SOME FEEDBACK THAT WE GOT. WE ALSO RECEIVED FEEDBACK



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 THAT WE NEED TO BE REALLY THOUGHTFUL ABOUT WHAT ARE THE
2 VARIOUS TYPES OF INVESTMENTS THAT ARE MADE. YOU KNOW, SHOULD
3 IT REALLY BE A TRANSIT FOCUSED MEASURE, OR BROADER THAN THAT.
4 CLEARLY TRANSIT IS HUGEY IMPORTANT IN THE BAY AREA IT'S VITAL
5 TO OUR MOBILITY NEEDS ESPECIALLY FOR LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS, BUT
6 NOT EXCLUSIVELY. IT'S NOT THE PRIMARY MODE, AND SO DO WE NEED
7 TO BE THINKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, ADDITIONALLY, BIKE ACTIVE
8 TRANSPORTATION? DO WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT BENEFITS TO AUTO
9 USERS, FOR EXAMPLE? AND ALONG THOSE LINES WE GOT SOME FEEDBACK
10 FROM OUR COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS, SO THE
11 AGENCIES THAT HAVE THE ADOPTED HALF CENT SALES TAXES THAT, YOU
12 KNOW, HAVE QUITE OF BIT OF EXPERIENCE PUTTING MEASURES ON THE
13 BALLOT AND SECURING A TWO THIRD'S VOTE. THEY DEFINITELY
14 RECOMMENDED THAT WE GIVE SOME THOUGHT TO INCLUDING LOCAL
15 STREET AND ROAD REPAIRS AS A CATEGORY. YOU KNOW, JUST POTHOLE
16 REPAIRS ARE PRETTY MUCH SOMETHING THAT EVERY JURISDICTION IN
17 THE BAY AREA IS INTERESTED IN SEEING MORE OF. AND YOU KNOW IT
18 IS AN INVESTMENT TYPE THAT BENEFITS NOT JUST AUTO USERS, BUT,
19 ALSO, BICYCLES TO THE EXTENT THAT INCLUDES SIDEWALKS AS WELL,
20 IT CAN PROVIDE BENEFITS TO PEDESTRIAN, AND PERSONS USING
21 WHEELCHAIRS. I THINK THAT IS USEFUL FEEDBACK. AND BEYOND
22 THINKING ABOUT DIFFERENT MODES AND WHAT SHOULD WE BE
23 CONSIDERING ON THE EXPENDITURE SIDE. WE GOT SOME GOOD FEEDBACK
24 ABOUT THEMES THAT WE SHOULD BE CONSIDERING, AS FAR AS THE KEY
25 OBJECTIVES THAT THE MEASURE SHOULD BE ACHIEVING, YOU KNOW,



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 ACROSS, KIND OF TAKING THE EXPENDITURE PLAN AS A WHOLE, AND
2 THOSE INCLUDE CLEARLY SOCIAL EQUITY, ADVANCING EQUITY, CLIMATE
3 MITIGATION, AND RESILIENCE THAT, YOU KNOW, WE -- THAT SHOULD
4 BE SOMETHING THAT WE'RE TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION WITH ANY OF
5 THE EXPENDITURES BEING MADE, THAT ARE THEY CONSISTENT WITH,
6 YOU KNOW, THE FORECAST THAT WE HAVE AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE. ARE
7 THERE THINGS THAT CAN BE DONE POLICY WISE TO BUILT INTO THE
8 MEASURE TO MAKE THE REGION'S TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM MORE
9 RESILIENT, AND I THINK ALSO ADAPTABILITY TO MY MIND RAISES THE
10 IDEAL SCENARIO WHERE WE HAVE SOME FLEXIBILITY BUILT INTO THE
11 MEASURE. THERE IS ALWAYS A TENSION BETWEEN ACCOUNTABILITY AND
12 FLEXIBILITY. AND I THINK WE'RE SEEING RIGHT NOW WITH THE
13 TRANSIT AGENCY FISCAL CLIFF THAT A LOT THE FUNDING SOURCES
14 THAT WE RECEIVED FOR TRANSIT ARE EITHER DEDICATED TO CAPITAL
15 PURPOSES OR ARE ALREADY DEDICATED TO SPECIFIC PROJECTS. AND,
16 SO WHILE THE REGION HAS THIS HUGE AMOUNT OF FUNDING THAT'S
17 RECEIVED FOR TRANSPORTATION, OVERALL, WE DON'T HAVE THE AMOUNT
18 TO JUST MOVE MONEY AROUND. SO IF WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING TO
19 THE VOTERS TO PURSUE SIGNIFICANT ADDITIONAL FUNDING TRYING TO
20 SEE WHAT KIND OF FLEXIBILITY CAN BE BUILT IN SO WE CAN REACT
21 TO THINGS LIKE A PANDEMIC AND NOT JUST FIND OURSELVES WITHOUT
22 ANY FLEXIBLE FUNDS. WE GOT FEEDBACK THAT LOOKING AT DIFFERENT
23 POLICY PROVISIONS THAT MAYBE CAN BE BUILT INTO THE MEASURE
24 COULD BE HELPFUL IN THE SENSE THAT JUST MORE FUNDING ISN'T
25 ALWAYS THE ANSWER. MAYBE THERE ARE WAYS THAT WE CAN PURSUE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SOME STREAMLINING, AS PART OF THE LEGISLATION FOR CERTAIN
2 KINDS OF PROJECTS. WE'RE THINKING ABOUT HOW THE MEASURES,
3 PROJECTS CAN LEVERAGE AND EXPAND THE GOALS IN OUR TRANSIT
4 ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY. AND THEN JUST GENERALLY, NOT
5 SURPRISINGLY, WE GOT VERY POSITIVE FEEDBACK ABOUT THE IDEA
6 THAT THIS REALLY IS A MEASURE THIS'S BUILT FROM THE BOTTOM-UP
7 THROUGH ROBUST STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND INCLUSIVE PUBLIC
8 PROCESS THAT IS DIFFERENT FROM WHAT WE HAVE DONE WITH BRIDGE
9 TOLL MEASURES WHERE IT'S SOME VERY BIG MARQUEE PROJECTS THAT
10 WERE IDENTIFIED PRIMARILY THROUGH THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS
11 RATHER THAN THE BAY AREA COMING UP WITH SOMETHING AND
12 PRESENTING THAT TO SACRAMENTO. IN THE FINAL PAGE THE ITEM
13 INCLUDES A TIMELINE OVER THE NEXT FOUR QUARTER OF THIS YEAR
14 INCLUDING A POLL, IT'S A LITTLE BIT TRICKY TIMING FOR A POLL,
15 WE'RE NOT OBVIOUSLY PUTTING A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT ANY TIME
16 SOON SO GAUGING PEOPLE'S APPETITE FOR A PARTICULAR TAX
17 INCREASE IS GOT REALLY THE PURPOSE, IT'S MORE AROUND MAYBE A
18 RELATIVE PREFERENCE ACROSS THE DIFFERENTLY REVENUE MECHANISMS
19 BUT ALSO YOU KNOW, TYPES OF INVESTMENT THAT PEOPLE THINK ABOUT
20 THAT ARE IMPORTANT TRYING TO GAUGE THAT AND THEN WE'LL BE
21 REPORTING BACK TO YOU IN THE SPRING ON THOSE POLLING RESULTS
22 THEN DOING SOME FURTHER STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WE WANT TO
23 DEVELOP SOME GOALS THAT YOU CREATE SCAFFOLDING FOR THIS
24 MEASURE THIS WE WOULD BRING BACK TO YOU FOR FEEDBACK AND ALSO
25 TAKE TO JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION IN THE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SUMMER WE WANT TO GET INTO MORE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT ON THIS AS
2 WE ENVISION THE KIND OF LINKING TOGETHER THE ENGAGEMENT THIS'S
3 PLANNED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AS WELL AS TRANSIT 2015, THE
4 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN TRANSIT FOCUSED PLAN SIN THOSE ARE ALSO
5 GOING TO BE DOING THE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT STARTING TO REALLY
6 SHAPE A CONCEPT FOR LEGISLATION THAT WE WOULD BE CIRCULATING,
7 WITHIN THE REGION AND WITH OUR BAY AREA DELEGATION AND
8 INTRODUCING YOU TO FINDING A BEALE IN THE YEAR FOR
9 INTRODUCTION IN JANUARY 2024 SO IT'S KIND OF THE TIMELINE FOR
10 THE LATEST REPORT AND LOOKING FORWARD TO ANY QUESTIONS AND
11 FEEDBACK. THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I SEE HANDS HOPPING UP, HOWARD AND THEN
14 ZACK.

15

16 **HOWARD WONG:** IS THERE A REQUIREMENT, 60% OR 50% MAJORITY OF
17 ALL OF THE COUNTIES OR ALL OF THE POPULATION OF THE COUNTIES?

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** EXCELLENT QUESTION. IF IT'S A MEASURE THAT MTC
20 PUTS ON THE BALLOT IT WOULD BE A TWO THIRDS MEASURE. TYPICALLY
21 THE WAY IT'S BEEN DRAFTED IN PRIOR BRIDGE TOLLS MEASURES FOR
22 EXAMPLE, OR THE WAY THAT THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
23 AUTHORITY LEGISLATION HAS DRAFTED IT'S THAT THE VOTE IS
24 COLLECTIVE SO LOOKING AT A 2/3 VOTE OF ALL OF THOSE VOTERS
25 VOTING, NOT WITHIN EACH INDIVIDUAL COUNTY. WE, IN THE HOUSING



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION, WE PURSUED AN OPTION, AND THIS IS THE
2 SAME AS MTC'S REGIONAL FAST PASS, ENABLING LEGISLATION, WHICH
3 WE'VE NEVER USED BECAUSE IT LOOKED TO BE A PATH TO POTENTIALLY
4 GOING DOWN TO FOUR OR FIVE COUNTIES. AND THEN I WOULD JUST
5 NOTE THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE HAS BEEN IN INTERESTING LEGAL
6 DEVELOPMENTS IN THE LAST FEW YEARS WHERE IF THE VOTERS
7 THEMSELVES PLACE THE MEASURE THROUGHOUT SIGNATURE GATHERING
8 EFFORT ON THE BALLOT THEN IT IS SUBJECT TO A MAJORITY VOTE AND
9 IT'S POSSIBLE THAT THIS LEGISLATION COULD BE DRAFTED IN A WAY
10 TO FACILITATE A VOTER INITIATED MEASURE, BUT IF IT'S A MTC
11 PLACING IT ON THE BALLOT, THAT WOULD BE A 2/3 VOTE.

12

13 **HOWARD WONG:** IT COULD BE HIGH POLITICAL HURDLE WHICH MAKES
14 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT EVEN MORE IMPORTANT THERE COULD BE A
15 LOOMING ECONOMIC RECESSION POSSIBLY COMING, AND A WHOLE SLEW
16 OF COMPETING TAX MEASURES FROM CITIES AND COUNTIES ALSO BEING
17 CONSIDERED. WE HAD A POLITICAL SITUATION WHERE TAXPAYERS JUST
18 REVOLT, AND VOTE EVERYTHING DOWN. THIS MEASURE WOULD BE INN
19 EXCLUSIVE THAT IT WOULD BE FRAMED AS AN INVESTMENT IN MANY
20 AREAS, AND IT'S NOT JUST TRANSPORTATION, TRANSIT, WHETHER IT'S
21 ROADS, OR TRANSIT, BUT IT NEEDS TO BE FRAMED AS AN ECONOMIC
22 INVESTMENT IN THE REGION THAT STIMULATES GROWTH AND OUR
23 FUTURE. SO, I THINK EMPHASIS SHOULD BE PLACED ON THE OVERALL
24 ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS. THANK YOU.

25



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** JACK AND THEN PAM.

4

5 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION REBECCA. I
6 WANT TO ECHO HOWARD'S POINT. I WANT TO ENCOURAGE THE EMPHASIS
7 ON CLIMATE INVESTMENTS, YOU ARE BENEFITTING BY ADDRESSING GHG
8 EMISSIONS WHICH IS A PRIORITY FOR EVERYONE AND WILL IMPACT
9 EVERYONE. TWO OTHER QUICK COMMENTS, ONE SUPPORTING EMPHASIS ON
10 OPERATIONS FUNDING ON THIS MEASURE. I THINK THAT IS WHERE THE
11 DIRE NEED IS FOR THE BAY AREA AND ALSO IT INCREASES
12 FLEXIBILITY WHICH IS KIND OF MY LAST COMMENT, EMPHASIZING
13 FLEXIBILITY OF FUNDING IN THE MEASURE I THINK, IN MY
14 EXPERIENCE WITH MEASURE L IN SAN FRANCISCO, THE BROADER
15 BUCKETS OF MONEY ALLOWED US TO BE MORE ADAPTABLE TO A CHANGING
16 CLIMATE AND MAKING THE CASE TO VOTERS THAT WE DO NOT KNOW
17 EXACTLY WHAT THE FUTURE OF TRANSPORTATION NEEDS LOOK LIKE, BUT
18 WE HAVE A ROUND OF BUCKETS TO BE RESPONSIVE TO WHAT YOU NEED,
19 AND I THINK THAT'S VERY COMPELLING. AND LASTLY ON THE STREETS
20 AND ROADS PIECE, I WONDER IF THERE IS A POLICY OR STIPULATIONS
21 ON THERE TO MAKE IT A MORE OF A COMMITTEE STREETS ORIENTED
22 PIECE, WHERE THOSE ARE STILL COMMUNITY INVESTMENTS BUT WE'RE
23 ALSO TAKING A SPECIFIC SAFETY AND GHG RECONSTRUCTION MODE
24 BENEFITTING ADVANCE.

25



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** PAMELA

2

3 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** I HAVE A COMMENT ABOUT THE ENGAGEMENT WITH
4 INTEREST STAKEHOLDERS. COMMUNITIES THAT WERE ENGAGED WITH
5 INCLUDED EQUITY, LABOR BUSINESS, OLDER ADULTS AND COMMUNITIES
6 I DIDN'T SEE SPECIFICALLY FAMILIES AND CHILDREN. I THINK
7 THAT'S VALUABLE IN THE CONSIDERATIONS FOR THIS MEASURE,
8 ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU WANT TO CONSIDER SOCIAL EQUITY, CLIMATE,
9 AND RESILIENT COMMUNITIES. OUR COMMUNITIES CURRENTLY IN THE
10 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AREN'T BUILT FOR OUR FAMILIES. AS
11 CARINA MENTIONED EARLIER, WE NEED TO CONSIDER THEM AS WE
12 BUILD-OUT THESE PROGRAMS, AND, SO, I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE
13 THERE WAS SPACE TO INVOLVE PT PDAS OR PARENT CHOICES AND GROUP
14 VOICES THEY HAVE A LOT OF BAY AREA CHAPTERS AND YOU NEED THEIR
15 VOICE IT WOULD BE REALLY VALUABLE IN THE NEXT ENGAGEMENT.

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WELCOME THAT CONNECTION.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDI.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR SETTING IT UP FOR ME.
22 WHEN WE NEEDED TO PASS A SALES TAX IN MARIN COUNTY, WE TRIED
23 MULTIPLE TIMES, AND I BELIEVE WHAT FINALLY PUT US OVER THE TWO
24 THIRDS WAS THE FACT THAT WE ADDED SCHOOL TRANSPORTATION AS
25 PART OF THE MEASURE. SPECIFICALLY WE ADDED SAFE ROUTES TO



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 SCHOOLS AND CROSSING GUARDS, AND A BIG ONE IS WHICH IS ALSO AN
2 EXPENSIVE ONE IS SCHOOL BUSSING, WHICH IS NO LONG FUNDED BY
3 THE STATE, AND IN MARIN WE CAN'T FULLY FUND THE BUSES BUT WE
4 CAN SUBSIDIZE THE BUSES SO IT'S NOT EXPENSIVE FOR THE PARENT
5 AND WE CAN CHECK WITH MARIN TRANSIT TO SEE HOW THIS'S WORKING.
6 I BELIEVE THAT WOULD GO EVEN FARTHER THAN ADDING THE POT HOLES
7 TO THE MEASURE. AND ANOTHER THING, I NOTICED TRANSPORTATION
8 MEASURE BUT YOU DON'T SAY WHAT. I'M ASSUMING IT'S NOT A SALES
9 TAX. BECAUSE EVERYONE IS SATURATED WITH SALES TAXES. SO WHAT
10 ARE THE DIFFERENT KINDS OF FUNDING MECHANISMS THAT YOU ARE
11 CONTEMPLATING?

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** SO, SHOULD I RESPOND TO THAT, THROUGH THE CHAIR?

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SURE.

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** WENDI, GREAT QUESTION. A SALES TAX IS ONE OF THE
18 THINGS WE WOULD LOOK AT. THERE'S CERTAINLY SOME CHALLENGES
19 THERE BECAUSE OF SOME OF OUR COUNTIES ARE CLOSE TO THE CAP.
20 IT'S OBVIOUSLY NOT AN OPTIMAL TAX CHOICE FROM A EQUITY
21 STANDPOINT, BUT ON THE PLUS SIDE GENERATING TREMENDOUS AMOUNT
22 OF REVENUE ON OTHER OPTIONS, PARCEL TAXES EMPLOYER TAXES,
23 EXAMINING ANALYSIS, WE WANTED TO REALLY DO THE FOCUS FIRST ON
24 WHY ARE WE PURSUING A MEASURE. BUT, WE DO UNDERSTAND THAT
25 THERE IS A TENSION THERE. BECAUSE, OBVIOUSLY ALL OF THE THINGS



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 THAT YOU WANT TO ACCOMPLISH CAN ONLY BE DONE WITHIN A CERTAIN
2 AMOUNT OF AVAILABLE REVENUE. SO.

3

4 **WENDI KALLINS:** I DO WANT TO ALSO ADD OF COURSE, I THINK THE
5 BIGGEST SELLING POINT WOULD BE THE OUTCOME OF THE
6 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING THAT'S GOING ON RIGHT NOW, THE TRANSIT
7 PLANNING DEMONSTRATING THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE A NEW SYSTEM,
8 A MORE SEAMLESS SYSTEM IN PLACE. I THINK THIS'S A GREAT
9 SELLING POINT. AND THEN FINALLY, SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOLS
10 PRACTITIONERS MEET WITH THE AIR DISTRICT EVERY QUARTER. I
11 THINK WE HAVE A MEETING COMING UP SOON. WE MIGHT CHECK WITH
12 THE AIR DISTRICT TO FIND OUT WHEN THAT IS, AND THAT IS A GREAT
13 GROUP TO CHECK IN WITH TO FIND OUT WHAT FUNDING IS NEEDED TO
14 SUPPORT SCHOOL BASED TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH AND THEN ADINA. HEDGE
17 THANK YOU. ACTUALLY, REBECCA, YOU AND WENDI BROUGHT UP SOME
18 THINGS I WANT TO TALK ABOUT I REALLY BELIEVE A SALES TAX
19 PROBABLY IS A NON-STARTER. I THINK THE PROPERTY TAX WOULD WORK
20 BETTER BECAUSE YOU HAVE A LARGE AMOUNT OF RENTERS WHO DON'T
21 THINK THEY'RE GOING TO BE PAYING IT AND IF WE COULD WEIGH
22 HEAVILY TOWARD COMMERCIAL AS WE HAVE DONE IN OTHER AREAS IN
23 THE PAST WITH PROPERTY TAX, I THINK IT WOULD RAISE A GOOD
24 AMOUNT OF MONEY. BUT YOU WILL HAVE TO BE THE JUDGE OF THAT.
25 AND I WANTED TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SAY, REBECCA, I'M



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 REALLY SAD ABOUT LEAVING. AND YOU ARE ONE OF THE PEOPLE I HAD
2 ON MY LIST TO THANK FOR HOW PATIENT YOU HAVE BEEN IN
3 EXPLAINING THINGS TO ME AND WORKING WITH ME ON THINGS. AND NOT
4 ONLY YOU BUT RANDY RENTSCHLER, BEFORE, AND I WAS HONORED THAT
5 RANDI CALLED ME BEFORE HE RETIRED AND TOLD ME HE WAS RETIRES
6 AND I SAID TO HIM, I HOPE REBECCA GETS YOUR SPOT. THAT CAME
7 THROUGH. I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING YOU DO.
8 FRANKLY I'LL SAY THIS AGAIN, PEOPLE WHO SIT HERE ON THE POLICY
9 ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND THE OTHER COMMITTEES I HAVE WORKED ON,
10 SOME HAVE PASS ON, I FEEL LIKE THEY'RE SO MANY FAMILY TO ME.
11 AND IT FEELS LIKE I'M LEAVING A FAMILY WHEN I LEAVE HERE. I'LL
12 STAY IN TOUCH. KIND OF LIKE MOVING TO ANOTHER PART OF THE
13 COUNTRY, YOU KEEP IN TOUCH THROUGH FACEBOOK AND TELEPHONE
14 CALLS.

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THROUGH THE CHAIR, ONE
17 QUICK COMMENT, RANDI CALLED ME BEFORE I STARTED THIS ITEM AND
18 I SAID OH I'M ABOUT TO GET ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND
19 DID YOU UPON RICH IS STEPPING DOWN AND HE WANTED ME TO SEND
20 HIS REGARDS. SO, THERE YOU GO. YOU'RE STILL IN HIS THOUGHTS.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA?

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS PRESENTATION.
25 AND IT'S REALLY EXCITING TO SEE MTC BEING, PICKING UP THE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 MANTLE FOR THE REGION IN LOOKING TO ADDRESS FUNDING FOR PUBLIC
2 TRANSPORTATION AND WORKING WITH THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND
3 ADDRESSING THIS REALLY AS A REGIONAL NEED. THE -- I WAS GLAD
4 TO SEE IN THE STAFF REPORT THAT THE NEEDS FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT
5 SERVICE FOR FREQUENT SERVICE, FOR SERVICE THAT SERVES THE
6 HOURS THAT PEOPLE NEED IT, YOU KNOW, NOT ONLY WHITE COLLAR
7 COMMUTERS, BUT PEOPLE WHO USE TRANSIT FOR DIFFERENT PURPOSES,
8 YOU KNOW, THAT WAS REALLY THE BASE IN THE STAFF REPORT. WANT
9 TO REALLY ENCOURAGE THAT AS THE BASELINE AND CORE OF A FUNDING
10 MEASURE FOR THE CLIMATE GOALS THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT
11 AND THE EQUITY GOALS THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT. ALSO,
12 AND THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IS WELCOME, AND THE FIRST AND
13 LAST MILE SOLUTIONS ARE WELCOME. BUT THAT REALLY SHOULD BE A
14 BASELINE. IT WOULD BE -- YOU KNOW, LIKE I -- IT WOULD NOT BE A
15 GOOD SOLUTION IF, YOU KNOW, IN THE INTEREST OF MAKING
16 COMPROMISES, WE WOUND UP WITH LESS THAN USEFUL PUBLIC
17 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND THEN, LIKE, IT IMPROVED ALL THE
18 ROADS. SO SUPPORT PUTTING THAT FRONT AND CENTER, AND ALSO
19 REALLY GLAD TO SEE IF THE STAFF REPORT THE CONNECTION BETWEEN
20 THE TRANSIT SERVICE AND THAT CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN THIS'S
21 GOING TO BE HAPPENING AT THE SAME TIME. BECAUSE THAT WOULD
22 REALLY BE LOOKING AT COMING UP WITH THOSE SERVICE GOALS AND
23 SERVICE OUTCOMES FOR RIDERS, AND THEN USING THIS AS THE BASE
24 FOR WHAT WOULD GET FUNDED. AND, ALSO, INCLUDING THOSE ELEMENTS
25 OF A WELL CONNECTED SYSTEM THAT HELPS MOVE RIDERS FROM POINT A



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 TO POINT B. YOU KNOW, EVEN IF THEY HAPPEN TO BE CROSSING
2 AGENCY BOUNDARIES OR CROSSING COUNTY LINES. YOU KNOW, BEING
3 ABLE TO DO THAT. WHICH BRINGS ME TO A CONNECTION TO AN ITEM
4 THAT I'LL BE BRIEFLY REPORTING ON, WHICH IS THE CONNECTION TO
5 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND NOT ONLY PROVIDING THE FUNDING TO BE
6 ABLE TO DELIVER THAT INTEGRATED SYSTEM, BUT TO LOOK AT, IN THE
7 CONTEXT OF THE LEGISLATION, ANY NEEDED REFINEMENTS TO NETWORK
8 MANAGEMENT THAT WOULD ENABLE CONSISTENT WELL INTEGRATED
9 SERVICE. SO IF WE RAISE NEW MONEY WITH THE GOAL OF HAVING
10 INTEGRATED SERVICE, BUT THEN DIVIDED IT UP AMONG AGENCIES IN
11 SUCH A WAY THAT ANY AGENT COULD SAY, WELL, NO, I DON'T WANT TO
12 MAKE THESE CONNECTIONS. I DON'T WANT TO HAVE INTEGRATED FARES.
13 IT'S 2027 TO O A TUESDAY AND I WOULD LIKE TO STOP INTEGRATING
14 FOR RIDERS. GOVERNANCE FOR THE FUNDING SHOULD SERVE THOSE
15 GOALS OF DELIVERING THAT CONVENIENT INTEGRATED AFFORDABLE
16 ACCESSIBLE SYSTEM FOR RIDERS. THANKS.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS
19 RAISED. BUT I JUST WANT TO SAY A BIG HALLELUJAH TO ADINA TO
20 TIE THIS INTO ALL OF OUR GOALS. AND CMAS ARE CORRECT IF WE
21 DON'T SHOW PEOPLE THAT WE'RE GOING CORRECT OR HELP THEIR LOCAL
22 ENTITY TO FIX THEIR STREETS OR SIDEWALKS AND DO THE REPAIRS
23 THAT'S NECESSARY AND ON THE BACK BURNER, DELAYS, ALONG WITH
24 EVERYTHING ELSE, WITH COMMUNITIES THAT RECEIVED AN MTC TLC
25 GRANT THEY GOT ROADS DONE SIDEWALKS CURBS AND GUTTERS,



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 LIGHTING, 18 YEARS BEFORE THE SAME PROJECT WHICH WAS, BECAUSE
2 IT WAS A COUNTY CITY JURISDICTION, MONTHS BEFORE THEY GET
3 THEIRS. THAT'S GOING TO BE TOP OF MIND FOR PEOPLE ESPECIALLY
4 GOING INTO POLLING AFTER THIS WINTER. WE HAVE TO CONSIDER ALL
5 THESE THINGS TOGETHER. CARINA, GO AHEAD.

6

7 **CARINA LIEU:** I JUST WANTED TO RESPOND TO SOMETHING THAT WAS
8 MENTIONED ABOUT NON-FIXED ROUTE BUSES. AND I THINK, I JUST
9 REALLY HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW, THROUGHOUT COMMITTEE THAT IT GETS
10 RESEARCH FOR FEASIBILITY HOW IT COULD BE IMPLEMENTED ABOUT HOW
11 TRANSIT AGENCIES COULD MODIFY THEIR SERVICE TO DELIVER ON
12 THAT. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S THE WAY WE NEED TO GO, ESPECIALLY
13 BECAUSE NOW WE'RE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE COMPETING WITH THINGS
14 LIKE UBER, AND LIFT, AND YOU KNOW, THOSE THINGS ARE KIND OF ON
15 DEMAND. THEY'RE -- THEY SERVE THE PASSENGER MUCH MORE QUICKLY
16 AND EASILY, AND REALLY HOPING THAT, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT AGENCIES
17 AND THIS FORTHCOMING POLICY CAN KIND OF SPEAK TO THAT IN ITS
18 RESEARCH, AND EVEN POTENTIALLY IN ITS EVENTUAL PRODUCT THAT
19 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE SHOULD REALLY BE EXPLORING FOR THE
20 FUTURE. YOU KNOW IN FLEXIBILITY BUS SERVICES THAT MEET PEOPLE
21 WHERE THEY'RE AT. BECAUSE I THINK EVEN OUR BUS STOPS ARE -- I
22 LOOK AT OUR BUS STOPS, AND I FEEL LIKE I WOULDN'T WANT TO
23 STAND AT THAT BUS STOP IT DOESN'T LOOK SAFE FOR ME AS A WOMAN.
24 FOR -- AND I THINK IF WE CAN ADDRESS THAT, WE CAN ADDRESS A
25 LOT OF CONCERNS AROUND MOBILE, ACCESSIBILITY, SAFETY, AND



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 PEOPLE'S DESIRE TO FEEL LIKE, YOU KNOW, THESE BUSES ARE
2 ACTUALLY SERVING ME, AND I CAN SEE MYSELF TAKING THEM. WE NEED
3 TO STEP INTO THAT 21st CENTURY MINDSET.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO OTHER HANDS RAISED.
6 IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
10 ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU REBECCA. WE GOT YOU
13 OUT IN YOUR 30 MINUTES. AND WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT THIS IN ARE
14 LATER ON.

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WITH THAT, I WANT TO GO INTO -- WANT TO
19 MAKE SURE I DON'T DO THE HOP SCOTCH THING AGAIN. ITEM EIGHT
20 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT IS
21 UP FIRST. ILAF ISN'T HERE. GENAY, ARE YOU ABLE TO DO IT

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WE DID NOT HAVE A POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND
24 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING IN DECEMBER. THE NEXT MEETING WILL
25 BE HELD JANUARY 27TH AT 9:00 A.M.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THEN THE NEXT UP IS
3 ADINA WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
4 ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE. ADINA?

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO WE MET ON A MONDAY AND HAD TWO AGENDA ITEMS,
7 ONE THAT PROVIDED A SUMMARY OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
8 RECOMMENDATION THAT IS BEING ALSO BROUGHT TO MTC'S EXECUTIVE
9 COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY, AND TO THE FULL COMMISSION AT THE MTC
10 MEETING FOR REVIEW AND THEN TO FEBRUARY FOR APPROVAL. AND SO
11 WE GOT THAT LAST REVIEW, INCLUDING THE POTENTIAL REPURPOSES OF
12 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE USING THAT AS AN
13 ADVISORY BODY DUBBED THE VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER COMMITTEE TO
14 CONTINUE TO FOLLOW AND GIVE ADVICE ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
15 TRANSIT COORDINATION INITIATIVES AND BE GIVING THAT ADVICE TO
16 A NEWLY CONSTITUTED POLICY BODY THAT IS AT THE LEVEL OF OTHER
17 MTC POLICY BODIES. AND, SO, THERE WAS A GENERAL SUPPORT AND
18 SUGGESTED DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW TO TWEAK AND REFINE THAT BUT
19 THE GENERAL SUPPORT POWER THAT CONCEPT AND OTHER THINGS ON OUR
20 AGENDA WAS GETTING AN UPDATE ON THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND
21 WAYFINDING IT WAS EXCITING TO SEE THAT PROJECT IS MOVING
22 FORWARD AND ALSO THERE WAS ALSO PLENTIFUL COMMENTARY FROM
23 MEMBERS OF THE BODY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SOME OF WHOM ARE
24 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BUT NOT THAT SUBCOMMITTEE,
25 RAISING UP THE ESSENTIAL NEED TO HAVE THAT PROJECT SERVE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 PEOPLE WITH A VARIETY OF DISABILITIES AND SENIORS. SO, IT
2 CAN'T JUST BE VISUAL MAPS THAT SERVE PEOPLE WHO CAN SEE, IT
3 NEEDS TO SERVE PEOPLE WITH A VARIETY OF ABILITIES AND THAT
4 NEEDS TO BE BAKED INTO THE PROJECT. SO, THAT IS A SUMMARY. IF
5 ANYONE ELSE WHO WAS ATTENDING MIGHT HAVE OTHER THINGS TO
6 COMPLEMENT WHAT I JUST SAID, THAT WOULD ALSO BE WELCOME.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ARE THEIR ANY COMMENTS ON EITHER OF
9 EQUITY AND ACCESS, OR THE TAP SUBCOMMITTEE? I SEE NO HANDS
10 GOING UP. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS AGENDA ITEM?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER NINE,
17 THE NEXGEN FREEWAY ADVISORY GROUP ACTION REPORT. ANNE OLIVIA?

18

19 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** IT APPEARS SHE IS OFF. I CAN READ HER
20 MARKS IF YOU DON'T MIND, CHAIR KINMAN?

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SURE.

23



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** SHE SAYS THE NEXGEN FREEWAY ADVISORY
2 GROUP IS GOING TO MEET FOR THE LAST TIME DECEMBER 2022. AND
3 THAT'S ALL IT SAYS.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OH IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THAT BODY THAT
6 WANTS TO COMMENT? OR -- GERRY, GO AHEAD.

7

8 **GERRY GLASER:** WELL, THE LAST THING THAT THE GROUP DID WAS A
9 SERIES OF EXERCISES, WHICH, TO BE HONEST, WHEN I WALKED IN THE
10 ROOM, THEY WERE IN-PERSON EXERCISES. I DIDN'T UNDERSTAND THE
11 EXERCISE. IT WAS A GAME TO FIGURE OUT SENSITIVITY TO VARIOUS
12 CHANGES THAT WOULD OCCUR. AND THAT WAS PRETTY INTERESTING. AND
13 I ASKED IF STAFF HAD, FROM THREE DIFFERENT GROUPS, ANY IDEAS,
14 ANY TAKE-AWAY'S, AND THEY SAID THEY WOULD BE REPORTING BACK,
15 EVENTUALLY, TO US ON WHAT THEIR TAKE-AWAY'S ARE. I HAVE A
16 COMMENT. IT OCCURRED TO ME THAT WE HAVE THIS COMMITTEE, AND I
17 ASKED THIS QUESTION DURING THE EXERCISE -- ARE WE TRYING TO
18 OPTIMIZE INCOME IN DOING THIS? OR ARE WE TRYING TO OPTIMIZE
19 THE FREEWAYS? AND THE ANSWER I GOT WAS WE'RE NOT TRYING TO
20 OPTIMIZE INCOME ON THIS WHICH IS A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN
21 THE PART OF THE MESSAGE THAT WAS GIVEN IN THE PRESENTATION
22 MESSAGE IN THE WEBINAR THAT OCCURRED, IT'S KIND OF FUNNY, I
23 BELIEVE THAT TRANSIT MINIMIZING CIRCULATION IS THE GOAL AND
24 THE FUTURE NOT HIGHWAYS WHY ARE WE TRYING TO IMPROVE THE
25 HIGHWAYS IN I THINK THAT SHOULD BE ANSWERING THAT QUESTION



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 BEFORE WE TRY TO FIGURE OUT IMPROVING THE HIGHWAYS. THAT'S MY
2 TAKE AWAY. ZACK, YOU WERE INVOLVED TOO, RIDE?

3

4 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** I THOUGHT IT WAS TRANSFORMATIVE. I WAS
5 ABLE TO LOOK THROUGH THE PACKET, I BELIEVE IT WAS THOUGHT OUT
6 REALLY WELL AND DISPLAYED THE TRADEOFFS AND RELATIVE COSTS.

7

8 **GERRY GLASER:** LIKE I SAID THE GOAL IS NOT A GOAL THAT
9 EVERYBODY SIGNS UP FOR.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK THAT THE TOPIC CHANGED BACK AND
12 FORTH. THAT WAS MY IMPRESSION WAS WE STARTED OFF WITH ONE
13 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT IT WAS, AND IT KIND OF ROTATED TO
14 ANOTHER AND ROTATED BACK. BUT I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN SEEING
15 THE FINAL REPORT.

16

17 **GERRY GLASER:** ONE THING THAT WAS INTERESTING ABOUT THE
18 EXERCISE. PART OF THE EXERCISE WAS WE HAD A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF
19 FUNDS AND WE WOULD EXPEND THE FUNDS AND GET A CERTAIN NUMBER
20 OF CREDITS BACK BASED ON WHAT WE ACHIEVED IN THE COMMUNITY AND
21 WHEN WE WENT TO DIFFERENT STRATEGIES THE AMOUNT OF FUNDS
22 AVAILABLE WOULD CHANGED WHICH MIRRORED PRECISELY WHAT WOULD
23 HAPPEN IN THE BUDGET AND THAT WAS AN EYE OPENENER FOR ME, AND
24 I HOPE THAT STAFF WHEN THEY BRING IT BACK WILL BE ABLE TO TALK
25 ABOUT THAT IN TERMS OF THOSE TRADEOFFS.



JANUARY 11, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COUNCILMEMBER
3 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
4 ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
7 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
8 ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I BELIEVE THAT TAKES US TO
11 ITEM TEN THE STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

12

13 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** IF I COULD ADD MY GRATITUDE TO RICH
14 HEDGES FOR HIS SERVICE ON THE COUNCIL KNOWS BOTH AS A FELLOW
15 AND MEMBER OF THE COUNCIL I WANT TO SHARE MY APPRECIATION FOR
16 ALL THAT RICH BRINGS TO THE TABLE A PERSON WITH DEEP INTEGRITY
17 AND WORKING WITH PEOPLE. AND CHAIR KINMAN, WE HAVE COMMITTEE
18 ASSIGNMENTS I EXPECT TO BRING FORWARD IN THE COMING DAYS, AND
19 IN CASE YOU MISSED IT COUNCILMEMBER PAM CAMPOS WAS NAMED AS
20 URBAN HABITATS LATEST COHORT OF THE BOARD'S COMMISSION
21 LEADERSHIP INSTITUTE SO A ROUND OF APPLAUSE FOR THAT.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK IF THERE IS
24 ANY NEW BUSINESS UNDER ITEM 12? DOES ANYBODY HAVE NEW
25 BUSINESS? WE'LL COMPLETE ITEM 12. ITEM 11 COUNCILMEMBER



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 REPORTS. MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL MAY REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT
2 ISSUES OR EVENTS. AND IS THERE ANYTHING ANYBODY WANTS TO
3 REPORT ON BEFORE WE TALK TO RICH AND LET HIM TALK ABOUT HIS
4 NEW JOB? I SEE NO HAND RAISED. THEN I WILL KICKOFF THE FACT
5 AGAIN THAT WE ARE LOSING RICH HEDGES, THE LONGEST SERVING
6 MEMBER OF VOLUNTEERS WITH MTC, AND 20 YEARS IS A LONG TIME TO
7 SERVE WITH ANY BODY. AND HE'S GONE THROUGH ITERATIONS OF OUR
8 COMMITTEE STRUCTURE, AND HOW WE WORK, AND RICH IS JUST A
9 WEALTH OF INFORMATION THAT I'M GOING TO ABSOLUTELY MISS. RICH,
10 WOULD YOU LIKE TO TALK ABOUT WHERE YOU'RE GOING AND WHAT YOU
11 ARE DOING?

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES. I WOULD. I'M GOING TO BE ON THE CITY
14 COUNCIL OF SAN MATEO IF YOU HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THE NEWS, THE
15 CITY HAS BEEN DIVIDED. I HAVE HAD SEVERAL ARTICLES AND COLUMNS
16 THAT HAVE RAISED EXPECTATIONS FOR ME AND TRYING TO BRING THE
17 CITY BACK TOGETHER. I'M NOT SURE THAT'S POSSIBLE. MY
18 ESTIMATION OF WHAT'S HAPPENING IS WE HAVE A LOT OF YOUNG
19 PEOPLE THAT ARE STRUGGLING THAT HAVE GOTTEN THEIR POLITICAL
20 WINGS. THEY HAVE GOTTEN VERY ACTIVE, AND I REMEMBER BACK IN
21 THE 60s WHEN I WAS JUST LIKE THEM, SO THAT DOESN'T BOTHER ME
22 AT ALL. SOME OF US START PHASING OUT. I'M 80 YEARS OLD AND
23 SURPRISED I'M EVEN ON THE COUNCIL. SO, I WILL SAY THAT
24 BRINGING THOSE TWO GROUPS TOGETHER AND MAKING THEM UNDERSTAND
25 EACH OTHER I DON'T KNOW THAT IT'S POSSIBLE BECAUSE THERE ARE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 PEOPLE THAT ARE NOT VERY RESILIENT WITH CHANGE AND SOME ARE
2 RESILIENT BUT MAYBE THEY THINK IT'S GONE TOO FAR AND OTHERS
3 WHO CAN'T WAIT TO GET THEIR DAY IN THE SUN. SO WE'RE GOING TO
4 WORK WITH THAT, AND TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN ALL TALK
5 TO EACH OTHER. I'M VERY EXCITED ABOUT SOME OF THE THINGS THAT
6 ARE GOING ON. IT'S VERY BUSY RIGHT NOW TRYING TO FIGURE OUT
7 EVERYTHING I NEED TO DO. I'LL BE GOING UP ON THE 18th, AFTER A
8 LATE CITY COUNCIL MEETING, I'LL GO UP THAT NIGHT TO
9 SACRAMENTO. THEY HAVE A BOOT CAMP FOR NEW CITY COUNCIL PEOPLE
10 AT THE STATE, I THINK IT'S WISE. AND I'M FORTUNATE AS I
11 UNDERSTAND THE BROWN ACT, I DON'T THINK I'LL GET INTO TROUBLE
12 THERE. THIS IS A SAD TIME FOR ME. THIS IS MY LAST MONTH. AND I
13 WOULD JUST LIKE TO -- IF I START MENTIONING NAMES, I'M GOING
14 TO LEAVE PEOPLE OUT SO PLEASE EXCUSE ME. I WANT TO THANK ALIX
15 BOCKELMAN, SHE HAS BEEN HERE A LONG TIME AND HAS VERY HELPFUL
16 TO ME, AND I DON'T KNOW IF THERE HAS BEEN A DECISION ON WHO
17 GOING TO REPLACE THERESE. SHE'S BEEN SO HELPFUL TO ME AND SUCH
18 A NICE PERSON. I CALLED HER OFFICE IN LA THE DAY AFTER
19 THANKSGIVING BEFORE SHE WAS APPOINTED AND SHE ANSWERED THE
20 PHONE SO WE TALKED A LOT ABOUT HER COMING HERE. I WAS SO
21 EXCITED ABOUT HER COMING HERE. THE DECISION HADN'T BEEN MADE
22 BUT I HEARD BACK ROOM LEAKS THAT A DECISION WAS PROBABLY
23 ALREADY MADE, AND EARLY CONGRATULATIONS SHE MADE HEARD THE
24 SAME THINGS ALREADY BUT DIDN'T REVEAL IT. SHE'S GOING TO BE
25 VERY MISSED. WHEN SHE CAME HERE THERE WAS UPROAR SEVERAL



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 CHANGES TO THE COMMISSIONERS WERE A LOT OF CHANGES TO CASA.
2 HER FIRST MEETING, I FELT VERY SORRY FOR HER. THERE WAS A LOT
3 OF ANGER AND SHE HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT BUT SHE GOT THINGS
4 SETTLED DOWN PRETTY FAST AND THAT SHOWS HOW GOOD SHE IS. I AM
5 GOING TO MISS PAM LOOKS WE HAVE GOTTEN TOGETHER AND HAVE A LOT
6 OF SIMILAR ISSUES. SHE'S VERY TALENTED AND IS FROM SAN MATEO
7 COUNTY SHE'S GOING TO CARRY THE TORCH FORWARD I'M SURE. AND
8 MARTHA AND KY-NAM, I CAN'T TELL YA, MARTHA KEEPS ME ORGANIZED
9 I'M ALWAYS MAKING MISTAKES AND SHE POINTS IT OUT BEFORE IT
10 GETS TO THE NEWSPAPER. AND I APPRECIATE THE SAME WITH KY-NAM.
11 SHE IS A SPARK PLUG FOR THIS ORGANIZATION AND FOR ALL OF THE
12 COMMITTEES SHE IS A GODSEND FOR MTC. SHE IS SO TALENTED. AND
13 THE SAME WITH KY-NAM, AND SERVING WITH HIM ON ONE OF THE
14 COMMITTEES IN THE PAST AND HAVING INCOME A ROLE THAT HELPS ME
15 WITH THE COMMITTEE I'M ON NOW. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT. AND I WANT
16 TO MENTION URSULA VOGLER, SHE IS RETIRED NOW BUT HAS BEEN
17 HELPFUL OVER THE YEARS AND A SPARK PLUG THAT HAS HELPED ME
18 OUT. AND RICHARD BURNETT, HE HAS BEEN 16 YEARS REAPPOINTED AND
19 THIS TIME DIDN'T GET ON, AND IN SOLANO COUNTY HE'S ON THE
20 TRANSIT COMMITTEE THERE, AND I LIKE TO LISTEN TO HIM AND SAY
21 HI. AND MARSHALL LORING, I REMEMBER, RANDI WHO PASSED AWAY,
22 HAD AN IMPORTANT FALL AND BRAIN BLEED. HE WAS WORKING WITH OUR
23 BOY SCOUTS AT CHURCH AND FELL AND HIT HIS HEAD AFTER A VERY
24 LONG DAY. THERE IS SO MANY PEOPLE WHO HAVE DONE SO MUCH FOR
25 THIS ORGANIZATION, AND I HAVE BEEN A SMALL VERY MINISCULE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 PIECE OF IT. AND I AM HAPPY TO HAVE BEEN HERE. JUST A LITTLE
2 BIT OF HISTORY. I'M GOING TO CHOKE UP ON THIS. I WAS BORN AT
3 THE VERY END OF THE DEPRESSION. I WAS IN A VERY POOR WORKING
4 CLASS COMMUNITY. AND FOR THOSE OF YOU THAT LEARNED IN YOUR
5 SURVEYS OF THE AMERICAN HISTORY THAT THE DEPRESSION ENDED WHEN
6 WORLD WAR II STARTED, THAT WAS A LIE. IT DID NOT END THEN.
7 BECAUSE ANYBODY THAT GOT A JOB, AS MY DAD GOT A DECENT JOB, HE
8 ACTUALLY RODE FREIGHT TRAINS ALL OVER THE COUNTRY WHILE THE
9 HUMOR OF WAR SCORED THE WORK IN BEAUMONT TEXAS AND HE WOULD
10 TAKE A FREIGHT TRAIN TO NORTHERN TEXAS AND FOLLOW THE WHEAT
11 COMBINING ALL THE WAY UP THROUGH NORTH DAKOTA IN THE SUMMER
12 TIME, VERY HARD, HEAVY, DIRTY WORK. HE WAS IN A CC CAMP AND
13 LIED ABOUT BEING MARRIED BECAUSE YOU COULDN'T BE MARRIED, SO
14 HE COULD SEND MONEY HOME BEFORE MY MOTHER. AND THEY DELAYED
15 CHILDBIRTH UNTIL HE GOT A JOB. MY MOTHER WAS PREGNANT AND HAD
16 JUST GOTTEN THE NEWS WHEN PEARL HARBOR STARTED. EXCUSE ME. AND
17 I CAN'T IMAGINE THE STRESS BRINGING A LIFE INTO THE WORLD WITH
18 THE WORLD SO DISRUPTED, NOT UNLIKE WHAT'S GOING ON NOW, BUT A
19 LITTLE MORE INTENSE, BECAUSE OUR SURVIVAL AS A NATION WAS UP.
20 MOST OF YOU DON'T REMEMBER THAT WE HAD NO WAR MAKING CAPACITY,
21 AND ROOSEVELT MADE A VICTIM TO ALL MANUFACTURING. YOU COULDN'T
22 BUY AN AUTOMOBILE UNTIL 1947 AND THEY WERE VERY LIMITED
23 BECAUSE ALL OF THAT WORK WENT TO WAR PRODUCTION. SO I GREW UP
24 IN A NEIGHBORHOOD THAT HAD THREE GROCERY STORES, ONE MIDDLE
25 SIZE TWO SMALL ONES WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE FROM MY HOUSE. AND



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 WE HAD AN ICE BOX. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T KNOW WHAT AN ICE
2 BOX WAS, YOU GOT REGULAR DELIVERIES OF ICE, IN THE MIDDLE OF
3 THE WAR, MY DAD FOUND AN OLD DIRTY REFRIGERATOR THAT WAS VERY
4 SMALL, ONE OF THE HAPPIEST DAYS MY MOTHER I CAN REMEMBER IT
5 WAS VERY SMALL, WE HAD A STREETCAR HALF AN HOUR BLOCK FROM MY
6 HOUSE, AND I COULD GET ON IT AND RIDE 47 MILES TO A BIG ZOO
7 THAT WAS A BIG OUTING FOR THE FAMILY, AND THE INNER CITY
8 TRAINS THAT TOOK US TO VARIOUS CITIES AND OUTLYING AREAS OF
9 KANSAS CITY IT WAS ONE OF THE MOST COMPREHENSIVE STREETCAR
10 SYSTEMS TORN UP IN THE LATE 50'S, EFFECTIVELY WE HAD
11 EVERYTHING WITHIN WALKING DISTANCE PHARMACIES AND LIQUOR
12 STORES, EVERYTHING THAT WAS NECESSARY IN WORKING CLASS
13 NEIGHBORHOOD, FOUR TAVERNS, IT WAS A SAFE ENVIRONMENT AND A
14 POOR NEIGHBORHOOD FOR KIDS. SO YOU HAVE HEARD ENOUGH ABOUT ME
15 BUT THAT REALLY WAS ONE OF THE REASONS I APPLIED FOR MTC AND
16 WAS ONE OF THE FIRST, AT THAT TIME WE CALLED TRANSIT
17 DEVELOPMENT ON A SUBCOMMITTEE THAT WENT OVER THE RULES FOR IT.
18 OD. I GREW UP IN A TOD AND I DIDN'T UNDERSTAND HOW WE DIDN'T
19 NEED A CAR UNTIL I WAS EIGHT OR NINE YEARS OLD. WE DIDN'T HAVE
20 ONE. EVERYTHING WAS DONE BY TRANSIT OR WALKING ANYWAY THAT'S
21 MY HISTORY THAT WILL TAKE ME ON TO THIS AND TO THE CITY
22 COUNCIL ADVOCATING FOR BETTER TRANSIT AND ACCOUNTING ACTUALLY
23 BEEN APPOINTED TO TWO ABAG COMMITTEES, SO I'M NOT GOING TOO
24 FAR. AND I ALSO AM ON CCAG WHICH WILL DEAL WITH MANY OF THESE



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU GUYS FOR MUCH FOR LISTENING TO ME. THAT'S
2 ALL I HAVE GOT TO SAY AND IT'S A LOT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ARE THERE ANY MORE COMMENTS FROM THE
5 COUNCIL? THANK YOU RICH. IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE SERVING WITH
6 YOU. OUR DADS PROBABLY CROSSED PATHS IN THE 3CS BECAUSE MY DAD
7 WAS IN YELLOWSTONE.

8

9 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I HAVE A PHOTO OF MY DAD LEANING AGAINST THE
10 BUNK HOUSE IN MARYSVILLE MISSOURI. I HAVE A QUESTION. I STILL
11 HAVE MY DAD'S DISCHARGE FROM CCC, DO YOU KNOW WHO GAVE THE
12 DISCHARGES OUT?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** NO.

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THE U.S. ARMY. BECAUSE ROOSEVELT WAS BY THE
17 REPUBLICANS SAID HE WOULD DO IT AND THE CC CAN'T BE DEVELOPING
18 -- BECAUSE THEY HAD THE NETWORK TO DO IT, THE BROWN SHIRTS
19 LIKE HITLER, THAT WAS ONE OF THE CHARGES AGAINST ROOSEVELT.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WOW. THANK YOU, RICH. IT'S CERTAINLY BEEN
22 A PLEASURE SERVING WITH YOU. SAN MATEO CERTAINLY HAS GOTTEN
23 HOPEFULLY WHAT THEY NEED. NOT MAYBE WHAT THEY WANT, BUT WHAT
24 THEY NEED.

25



JANUARY 11, 2023

1 **RICH HEDGES:** THE JURY IS OUT ON THAT.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WITH THAT, THAT CLOSES OUT OUR MEETING

4 FOR THE DAY. AND EVERYBODY HAVE A SAFE WEEKEND. WE HAVE GOT

5 ANOTHER STORM COMING IN A FEW HOURS. THANK YOU EVERYBODY.

6 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

7



NTT

Broadcasting Government