METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11, 2023 9:35 AM

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: GOOD MORNING AND HAPPY NEW YEAR TO EVERYONE. I HOPE YOU HAD A GREAT HOLIDAY AND A GREAT START TO 2023. WELCOME TO THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MEETING. I AM MARGARET ABE-KOGA, VICE CHAIR FOR THE COMMITTEE. UNFORTUNATELY, OUR CHAIR IS NO LONGER WITH US, DUE TO TERM LIMITS, I BELIEVE. SO, I WILL BE FILLING IN TODAY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AT 9:36 A.M. AND IF THE BROADCAST TEAM COULD ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT TAPE, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. AND I HAVE SOME FURTHER ANNOUNCEMENTS AS WE MOVE INTO THE NEW YEAR AND OUR MEETING PROCEDURES. IT'S A BIT LONG, SO PLEASE BEAR WITH ME. THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGENCY COVID PROTOCOLS WILL BE SUNSETTING ON FEBRUARY 28TH, 2023, WHICH MEANS THE BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE WILL RETURN TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. STARTING WITH THE MARCH 8TH, 2023 MEETING, BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MEETINGS WILL BE IN-PERSON. AS WAS THE CASE BEFORE, COMMISSIONERS WILL BE COMPENSATED FOR TRAVEL COSTS AND REFRESHMENTS WILL BE PROVIDED. FOR THOSE CONSIDERING A.B. 2449, THE LIMITATIONS ARE AS FOLLOWS. ONE, AT LEAST A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

QUORUM OF THE MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATIVE BODY MUST PARTICIPATE IN-PERSON FROM A SINGULAR PHYSICAL LOCATION IDENTIFIED ON THE AGENDA, WHICH LOCATION WILL BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC AND WITHIN THE BOUNDARIES OF THE LOCAL AGENCY. A MEMBER MAY ONLY TELECONFERENCE FOR PUBLICLY DISCLOSED JUST CAUSE OR EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCES APPROVED BY THE LEGISLATIVE BODY, AND A MEMBER MAY ONLY TELECONFERENCE FOR A LIMITED NUMBER OF MEETINGS CAUSE LIMITED TO FOLLOWING: ONE, A CHILD CARE OR CARE GIVING NEED OF A CHILD CARE GRANDPARENT SIBLINGS DOMESTIC PARTNER THAT REQUIRES THEM TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY. TWO, A CONTAGIOUS ILLNESS THAT PREVENTS THEM FROM PARTICIPATE IN-PERSON. THREE, A NEED RELATED TO A MENTAL OR PHYSICAL DISABILITY, TRAVEL WHILE ON OFFICIAL BUSINESS AS A LEGISLATIVE BODY FOR ANOTHER STATE OR LOCAL AGENCY. EMERGENCY CIRCUMSTANCES MEANS A PHYSICAL OR FAMILY MEDICAL EMERGENCY THAT PREVENTS A MEMBER FROM ATTENDING IN-PERSON. KEY POINTS THE PUBLIC CAN STILL PARTICIPATE REMOTELY AS WE WILL BE KEEPING THE HYBRID FORMAT. IT HAS BEEN CLEAR THAT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION HAS ONLY BENEFITTED AND INCREASED SINCE GOING TO A VIRTUAL FORMAT. THEREBY MAKING OUR MEETINGS MORE ACCESSIBLE, TRANSPARENT, AND OPEN. THE PUBLIC WILL STILL BE ABLE TO SUBMIT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE MEETING TO THE E-MAIL ADDRESS PROVIDED ON THE WEB SITE. INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. 375 BEALE STREET HEARD QUARTER IS NO LONGER ALTERNATIVE LOCATION. THANK YOU FOR SERVING ON THE BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AS WE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMPLY WITH PUBLIC TRANSPARENCY RULES AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING IN-PERSON AFTER SUCH A LONG TIME APART OR IN SOME CASES FOR THE FIRST TIME. THAT WOULD BE INCLUDING ME. STRONGLY RECOMMENDED FOR EMPLOYEES AT SAN FRANCISCO HEADQUARTERS. NOW WE'LL CONTINUE WITH REGULAR BUSINESS OF THE DAY. AND WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: GOOD MORNING. VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GINA PAPAN: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

HILLARY RONEN: SORRY. I'M HERE. I'M HERE. SORRY.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU, CLERK. WHILE GO TO AGENDA ITEM TWO, WHICH IS THE PLEDGE. PLEASE STAND IF YOU ARE ABLE, AND JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: LET'S GO TO AGENDA ITEM THREE, THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT BY OUR CLERK. IF THE CLERK IS READY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SORRY ABOUT THAT. MULTI-TASKING. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE $100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF $500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. AND BEFORE I TURN THE REINS BACK OVER TO YOU VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA, COMMISSIONER GLOVER HAD TO STEP AWAY, AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WILL STAND IN FOR HIM FOR THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. JUST WANTED TO GIVE YOU ALL THAT HEADS UP.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU'RE WELCOME.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AGENDA ITEM FOUR, LET'S MOVE ON TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO PULL ANY ITEMS ON CONSENT? I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS. SO, I CAN TAKE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR. IS THERE A MOTION, PLEASE?

GINA PAPAN: PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL. PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID RABBITT: RABBITT SECOND.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: I'LL OPEN UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO SPEAK ON AN ITEM, IN-PERSON? OR HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY CORRESPONDENCE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE. IF THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION, CAN WE GET A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE, CLERK?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR:

CLERK OF THE BOARD: AYE. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY? PAPAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GINA PAPAN: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: UNANIMOUS.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 5A BATA RESOLUTION NUMBER 161 ADOPTING UNMITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION MITIGATION MONITORS AND REPORTING PROGRAM AND APPROVING THE WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT. WE HAVE MR. GAVIN LOHRY WHO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. MR. LOHRY, WELCOME.

GAVIN LOHRY: THANK YOU. WE HAVE A PRESENTATION. THANK YOU MY NAME IS GAVIN L, PROJECT MANAGER WITH BAY AREA AUTHORITY WORKING ON BAY BRIDGE PROJECTS AND BIKE PED PROJECTS. TALKING ABOUT WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESS. WEST OAKLAND ON THE TOP RIGHT IS PART OF THE BAY SKYWAY, THE PATH THAT WE'RE WORKING ON BETWEEN THE EAST BAY AND SAN FRANCISCO. THIS PATH IS BUILDING OFF THE SIGNIFICANT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INVESTMENT THAT WAS MADE IN THE EAST SPAN PATH ALMOST TEN YEARS AGO AND IT'S PART OF WHAT WE'RE CALLING THE CURRENT PHASE OR PHASE ONE WHICH WILL CONNECT WEST OAKLAND AND DOWNTOWN OAKLAND TO THE EXISTING BAY, EAST SPAN PATH, WEST OAKLAND, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO HAVE ACCESS TO THE ISLAND MULTI-USE PATH DOWN TO TREASURE ISLAND TO FREQUENT TRANSIT ELECTRIC FERRY SAN FRANCISCO THIS IS WHAT WE'RE CALLING PHASE ONE OF THE BAY SKY WAYS, PHASE TWO COMPLETING BIKE PED PATH ON THE WEST BAND OF THE BAY BRIDGE. THAT'S A LATER PHASE. RIGHT NOW OUR FOCUS IS GETTING PHASE ONE AND ALLOWING TRIPS DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO AND WEST OAKLAND. JUST THIS YEAR INCLUDED AS PART OF THE BAY TRAIL IS A SEPARATED LOW STRESS CONNECTION BETWEEN BICYCLISTS AND PEDESTRIAN FOR TRAVEL BETWEEN THE WEST OAKLAND AND THE BAY BRIDGE TRAIL. THIS WILL BE A FAMILY FRIENDLY CONNECTION FOR PEOPLE OF ALL AGES THAT WILL ALLOW PEOPLE TO TRAVEL BETWEEN OAKLAND, TREASURE ISLAND, AND EVENTUALLY DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. IT WILL ALSO IMPROVE SHORELINE AND RECREATIONAL ACCESS FOR WEST OAKLAND RESIDENTS. NEXT SLIDE. THE CURRENT CONDITIONS ON WEST -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THE CURRENT CONDITIONS ON WEST GRAND AVENUE. THE PROJECT LOOKS TO IMPROVE THE EXISTING CONDITIONS. THERE IS CURRENTLY NO BIKE LANES SO THE PROJECT LOOKS TO ADD BICYCLE INFRASTRUCTURE, THE SIDEWALK LOOKS TO SEPARATE BOTH CYCLISTS AND PEDESTRIAN FROM THE FAST MOVING TRUCK TRAFFIC THAT'S ON THE CORRIDOR, AND PROVIDES THE BARRIER AND SENSE OF COMFORT THAT IS CURRENTLY NOT THERE. NEXT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SLIDE. SO THIS IS A DIAGRAM OF THE PROJECT, AND WHEN IT WILL RUN. I'M GOING TO WALK YOU THROUGH IT. SO PLEASE STICK WU ME. SECTION A IN ORANGE, AND SECTION C IN BROWN, THOSE ARE SHOWN IN THE DIAGRAM ON THE LEFT. THESE SECTIONS ARE GOING TO BE AN ELEVATED, SEPARATED PATH FOR THE PEDESTRIAN AND CYCLISTS THAT WILL BE SEPARATE FROM THE ROADWAY. THIS WILL ALLOW A SEPARATION FOR NOISE AND AIR POLLUTION AND THINGS LIKE THAT. AND THEN THE PATH WILL JOIN FOR CERTAIN SECTIONS WITH THE EXISTING ROADWAY. SO SECTION B THAT GOES OVER THE RAILROAD TRACK, THIS WILL JOIN, OR AT LEAST THE CURRENT PLAN IS FOR IT TO JOIN THE EXISTING ROADWAY BUT STILL BE A SEPARATED SAFE FACILITY. AND SECTION D ONCE IT COMES DOWN TOWARDS MANDELA AND INTO THE WEST OAKLAND NEIGHBORHOOD IT WILL JOIN THE ONGOING CONDITIONS. NEXT SLIDE. AS PART OF THE CEQA PROCESS, WE ENGAGED THE COMMUNITY. WE RELEASED THE DRAFT INITIAL STUDY UNMITIGATED DECLARATION JUNE 15TH FROM THERE WE HELD A 30 DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. DURING THAT PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD WE RECEIVED 30 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC 29 WERE SUPPORTIVE OF THE PROJECT AND WE DID NOT RECEIVE ANY COMMENTS THAT WOULD IMPACT REALLOCATED TELEPHONE CONDITIONS WE HOSTED A COMMUNITY EVENT WHERE MEMBERS WERE ALLOWED TO HEAR ABOUT THE PROJECT JUNE 29TH, AND WE HOSTED COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS THAT SPOKE AT THEIR MONTHLY MEETING, AND THE WEST OAKLAND ENVIRONMENTAL INDICATOR PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE. THE FINAL RESPONSE COMMENTS RECEIVED DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD NO SIGNIFICANT NEW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INFORMATION OR SIGNIFICANT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS WERE ADDED THAT WOULD TRIGGER RECIRCULATION UNDER CEQA. THE PROJECT WILL AVOID OR MITIGATE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS TO THE POINT WHERE NO SIGNIFICANT IMPACTS ON THE ENVIRONMENT WOULD OCCUR. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF TIMELINE, THIS IS PART OF THE PROCESS OF FINISHING THE ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTS, NUMBER THREE THERE. WE HOPE TO BEGIN LATER THIS YEAR THE DETAILED DESIGN AND RIGHT OF WAY FOR THE PROJECT, AND WE ARE CURRENTLY ACTIVELY APPLYING FOR DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES SO WE CAN PAY FOR CONSTRUCTION OF THE WEST OAKLAND LINK. NEXT SLIDE. SO THAT INCLUDES MY SLIDES. STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMITTEE REFER MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 161 TO THE AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL TO ADOPT THE MITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION AND ADOPT THE MITIGATION MONITORING PRESENTING PROGRAM FOR THE WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT. I'LL TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU MR. LOHRY. THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? I SEE -- YES, VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. I THINK THIS IS A REALLY IMPORTANT AND GOOD PROJECT, AND I'M GLAD THAT WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH IT. BUT I DO HAVE A PROBLEM WITH THE, SORT OF, IMPLICATION THAT WE ARE COMMITTED TO WHAT YOU'RE DESCRIBING AS PHASE TWO, WHICH IS A BIKE LANE ON THE WEST SPAN OF THE BRIDGE. I THINK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT IS AN INCREDIBLY EXPENSIVE PROJECT IN THE HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS AND I THINK WE NEED TO, SORT OF, AS A COMMISSION, FULLY GRAPPLE WITH WHETHER THIS IS WHETHER THAT PHASE TWO IS THE TYPE OF PROJECT THAT WE WANT TO BE SPENDING, THE ATP PROJECT IF WE WANT TO BE PUTTING HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS INTO AND I WONDER WITH THE MANY MORE PRESENTATIONS WE HAVE THAT BECOMES PHASE TWO, IT WILL BE OH PHASE TWO, AND NO ONE'S EVER REALLY GRAPPLED AND MADE A DECISION ABOUT IT. I HOPE WHEN WE MAKE THE PRESENTATION SAYS IN THE FUTURE THAT WE MAKE IT CLEAR THAT PHASE TWO HAS NOT BEEN DECIDED ON, AND IT DOESN'T BECOME JUST A, SORT OF, A, BY DEFAULT, IT'S HAPPENING.

ANDREW FREMIER: ANDREW FREMIER, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, WE UNDERSTAND THAT. WE HAVE REQUESTED ENVIRONMENTAL WORK ON THAT PHASE TWO. SO THERE IS AN ESTABLISHED HISTORY, TO DATE, BUT WE HAVE NOT MADE ANY RECOGNITION OF CONDITIONS THAT COMMIT THE AUTHORITY TO ANY WORK THERE, AND FRANKLY, WE HAVE ALWAYS SAID, PUBLICLY, WE THINK IT'S GOING TO HAVE TO BE SOME PUBLIC PRIVATE PART TO EVER BE SUCCESSFUL BECAUSE OF THE PUBLIC PRIVATE COSTS ON ASSOCIATED WITH IT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID RABBITT: I WAS GOING TO FOLLOW UP, CAN YOU REMIND US WHAT THE TOTAL ANTICIPATED PROJECT COST WOULD BE? OR DO WE HAVE THAT AT THIS POINT?

GAVIN LOHRY: FOR THE WEST OAKLAND LINK?

DAVID RABBITT: YES.

GAVIN LOHRY: WE ARE DOING ANOTHER COST UPDATE RIGHT NOW. BUT THE LAST -- I THINK IT'S GOING TO COME AROUND $100 MILLION, IT'S RIGHT AROUND $100 MILLION, SO GIVE OR TAKE A FEW MILLION, BUT WE'RE FINISHING THE LATEST COST UPDATE.

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: COMMITTEE MEMBER PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO SEPARATE WHAT VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ MENTIONED, WE DO GET AUTO A LOT OF THESE PRESENTATIONS, AND THANK YOU ANDY FOR LETTING US KNOW, WE ANTICIPATED IT BEING A PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP AND THAT SHOULD BE IN THE REPORT IN THE FUTURE. WE HAVE NEW MEMBERS COMING FORWARD AND THINGS BECOME JUST ALMOST AUTOMATIC HERE. GOOD PROJECT, DEFINITELY, BUT WE DO NEED TO BE CLEAR AS WE PROGRESS, PLEASE, THANK YOU SO MUCH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANDREW FREMIER: COMPLETELY FAIR. I THINK WE SHOULD ALSO ADD WHAT'S IN THE DOCUMENTATION WE'RE PARTNERING CLOSELY WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ON THIS PARTICULAR WEST LINK. THIS IS ANTICIPATED TO BE A PUBLIC PROJECT BUT THE PHASE TWO THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ MENTIONED, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THAT'S A DIFFERENT STORY, FOR SURE.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. IF I COULD JUST CLARIFY. I'M STILL ONE OF THE NEWER ONES ON THIS. YOU MENTIONED THE WEST OAKLAND LINK, THAT'S THE YELLOW ON PAGE TWO OF THE PRESENTATION, SO, THAT IS WHAT WE'RE DISCUSSING TODAY, IS THAT RIGHT? AND IS THAT, YOU MENTIONED A $100 MILLION SEGMENT? OR ARE WE TALKING ABOUT THE PHASE TWO, ALSO AS PART OF THAT BUDGET?

GAVIN LOHRY: SO, IT'S THE -- I DON'T KNOW IF WE CAN PULL BACK UP THE MAP, IT'S NOT THE YELLOW SECTION, BUT IT'S THE RED SECTION THAT WAS CONNECTED TO THE INVESTMENT THAT WAS MADE ON THE EAST SPAN PATH. I THINK IT'S SLIDE TWO. IT'S THE AREA CIRCLED. SO, THE YELLOW IS -- HAS ALREADY BEEN COMPLETED. AND SO THIS IS FEEDING IN AND CREATING A CONNECTION TO OAKLAND, BETWEEN THE EXISTING PATH AND WEST OAKLAND. AND I GUESS -- AND THERE WILL BE SEPARATED BIKE LANE TO DOWNTOWN WEST OAKLAND.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: IS THAT BUDGETED $100 MILLION YOU MENTIONED IS THAT FOR THE JUST THAT SEGMENT OR THE ENTIRE PROJECT TO SAN FRANCISCO?

GAVIN LOHRY: FOR JUST THAT SEGMENT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? IF NOT, I WILL OPEN THIS UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. AND, CLERK, I SEE SOME HANDS. IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND GOING THROUGH THOSE, AND IF WE HAVE ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE PLEASE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE. MADAM CHAIR, WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE TWO MINUTES FOR THIS ITEM?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: YOU GOT IT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MS. DUPREE PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF, AND I WILL START THE CLOCK.

SPEAKER: THANKS VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I ALWAYS LOVE A GOOD PRESENTATION. I NEED MY CLOCK HERE IT SURE HELPS. IT CERTAINLY IS ASPIRATIONAL, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CERTAINLY THIS ISSUE IN WEST OAKLAND HAS TO BE RESOLVED, ESPECIALLY IN SEEING THAT PICTURE OF THE TRUCKS ON THE ROAD AND NOT MUCH ROOM FOR BICYCLES, BICYCLES AND TRUCKS DON'T MIX VERY WELL. AND I AM LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT ELECTRIC FERRY. THAT'S THE FUTURE OF FERRIES. FERRIES, A LOT OF FERRIES IN AMERICA STILL BURNING A LOT OF THAT NUMBER TWO DIESEL FUEL, I THINK IT IS AND IT'S TIME TO MOVE AWAY FROM THAT. AND I WOULD DEFINITELY USE THAT FERRY TO GET TO AND FROM THE ISLAND. IN LOOKING AT SOME OF THE RED LINES, I WANT US TO REALLY REMEMBER, ALSO, THE PIECE OF THE HILL CLIMB BETWEEN THE BRIDGE AND THE FLAT PART OF THE ISLAND. IT'S QUITE STEEP. AND HOW CAN WE HAVE A GOOD SEAMLESS ROUTE FOR BICYCLES TO BE ABLE TO TRAVERSE THAT. AND ELECTRIC BIKES ARE MAKING IT EASIER. BECAUSE IT IS A HARD CLIMB THAT REALLY ONLY THE MOST ABLE TO DO AND WANT TO HAVE THE EQUITY OF THE ELECTRIC BIKES TO HELP. IT MIGHT BE SOME KIND OF AN EASIER BIKE ROUTE TO GET THROUGH THAT PART OF IT. AND I DO THINK SOME DAY WE NEED TO PUT A BIKE LANE ON THE WEST SPAN. I THINK IN MY DAYS GROWING UP IN NEW YORK, THAT THERE IS NO GOOD BIKE CONNECTION BETWEEN BROOKLYN AND STATEN ISLAND BECAUSE OF THE WAY THE VERRAZANO BRIDGE WAS BUILT. I THINK THIS IS A REASONABLE PROJECT THAT DESERVES YOUR VOTE. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAR IS WARREN WELLS. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: HI. WARREN RELEASE I WORK FOR THE MARIN COUNTY BICYCLE COALITION I'M ACTUALLY SPEAKING AS A RESIDENT OF THE EAST BAY. I WANT TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF THE PROJECT. I'M CAR FREE RESIDENT TO THE EAST BAY AND I GET AROUND PRETTY MUCH ENTIRELY BY BICYCLE AND PUBLIC TRANSIT. I AM SUPPORTIVE OF THIS PROJECT. I GO TO WEST OAKLAND A LOT, IT'S DIFFICULT TO GET FROM WEST OAKLAND TO THE BRIDGE AND TREASURE ISLAND WE'RE TRYING TO BUILD A NETWORK FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE TRYING TO GET AROUND OUTSIDE OF CARS. WE HAVE HAD A CENTURY OF ESSENTIALLY CAR ONLY INVESTMENT AND IF YOU'RE TRYING TO GET AROUND BY BIKE OR FOOT WHICH I OFTEN DO YOU FIND YOURSELF ON A GOOD SEPARATED PATH THEN DUMPED OUT INTO HEAVY TRUCK TRAFFIC WHICH PEOPLE DON'T DO BY CHOICE. THIS IS A GOOD PROJECT AND WORTH ADVANCING. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED, MADAM VICE CHAIR.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU, CLERK. I WILL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT THEN. AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE IF THERE IS ANY OTHER DISCUSSION. IF NOT, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND SECOND.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CINDY CHAVEZ: MOVE APPROVAL, CHAVEZ.

DAVID RABBITT: SECOND, RABBITT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. SO A MOTION BY MEMBER CHAVEZ, SECOND BY MEMBER RABBITT. AND COULD WE GET A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 5B WHICH IS THE FUNDING AGREEMENT FOR THE WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT, AND WE HAVE MR. LOHRY AGAIN. WELCOME BACK.

GAVIN LOHRY: THANK YOU. I SHOULD HAVE MENTIONED I HAVE TWO ITEMS WHEN I INITIALLY SPOKE. SO THIS IS THE FUNDING AGREEMENT, WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION FOR $3 MILLION. NEGOTIATING AND ENTERING INTO THE FUNDING AGREEMENT WITH ACTC FOR THE FUNDING OF PS AND E, THE DETAILED DESIGN WOULD BE THE FIRST DISCRETIONARY ACTION TAKEN THE PROJECT AS SUCH PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE SECTION 21080 SUBDIVISION AND CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT GUIDELINES SECTION 15352

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUBDIVISION A AUTHORITY MUST APPROVE THIS ACTION SUBJECT TO BATA ADOPTING THE MITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION AND MITIGATION MONITORING REPORTING PROJECT FOR THE PROJECT, BATA RESOLUTION 161. STAFF RECOMMENDS THE COMMITTEE REFER THIS ACTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OR DESIGNEE TO ENTER INTO A FUNDING AGREEMENT WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION TO RECEIVE $3 MILLION IN FUND FOR FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2023, PSE DETAILED DESIGN PROJECT TO THE AUTHORITY SUBJECT TO THE BATA APPROVAL RESOLUTION NUMBER 161 AND ADOPTING THE MND AND MMRP FOR THE PROJECT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? I HAVE ONE. SO, THIS IS THE 3 MILLION FOR THE PROJECT. IS THIS THE FIRST SOURCE OF FUNDING SPENDING OR RECEIVING TO DATE?

GAVIN LOHRY: THIS IS FOR DETAILED DESIGN IT'S AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN BATA AND ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION PROJECT TO JOINTLY FUND THE DESIGN. SO THEY'RE PUTTING IN 3 MILLION, WE'RE PUTTING IN 3 MILLION, THIS SHOULD FULLY FUND THE DESIGN OF THE PROJECT. THERE HAS BEEN OTHER SOURCES SECURED. WE RECEIVED AN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM GRANT FOR THE WEST OAKLAND LINK IN DECEMBER. SO THERE IS SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDING THAT HAS BEEN SECURED FOR CONSTRUCTION, BUT THIS IS ONLY FOR THE DESIGN FEE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE CLARIFICATION. IF THERE ARE NO OTHER QUESTIONS, I WOULD LIKE TO OPEN THIS UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK, PLEASE PRESS YOUR STAR NINE BUTTON. AND, CLERK, IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND GOING THROUGH THAT, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: SURE. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. THEN WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE AND IF THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION WE'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND A SECOND.

CINDY CHAVEZ: MOVE, CHAVEZ.

GINA PAPAN: PAPAN, SECOND.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. MEMBER CHAVEZ MADE THE FIRST MOTION AND SECOND BY MEMBER PAPAN. COULD WE GET A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: YES.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO ITEM SIX, WE HAVE AN INFORMATION ITEM. THIS IS THE BAY LIGHTS PROJECT UPDATE. AND WE HAVE OUR DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF OPERATIONS, ANDY FREMIER, AND BEN DAVIS OF ILLUMINATE TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. WELCOME BOTH OF YOU.

ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU. ANDY FREMIER DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY. I THINK WE HAVE A PRESENTATION. WE'RE HERE TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE BAY LIGHTS ART INSTALLATION PROJECT ON THE WEST SPAN OF THE BAY BRIDGE. EVERY TIME I TALK ABOUT THIS PROJECT I THINK OF OUR GOOD FRIEND ANNIE HALSTED AND WHAT A GREAT PARTNER SHE WAS IN HELPING US DELIVER THIS PROJECT BETWEEN HER AND COMMISSIONER WORTH THEY DID A FANTASTIC JOB POINTING OUT WHAT A PUBLIC SUPPORT THERE IS BEFORE WE CONTINUE DOWN THE PATH. IN THE PRESENTATION I'M READY FOR SLIDE TWO. SO A LITTLE BIT OF HISTORY. THE WORK WAS ORIGINALLY COMMISSIONED IN 2013. IT WAS DESIGNED TO CELEBRATE THE 75th ANNIVERSARY OF THE BAY BRIDGE. IT'S A FANTASTIC PUBLIC PARTNERSHIP, PRIVATE PUBLIC PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRANS, ILLUMINATE, THE ARTIST LEO VILLAREAL, AND ILLUMINATE, THE CHIEF FUNDRAISER. AND IT REALLY DID TURN OUT TO BE A SPECTACULAR OPPORTUNITY. IT'S A UNIQUE RELATIONSHIP, AS I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MENTIONED, THE LIGHTS ARE ACTUALLY OWNED, THEY WERE GIFTED TO CALTRANS. BATA OVER THE YEARS HAS COMMITTED TO THE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE TO THE TUNE OF ABOUT $100,000 A YEAR, AND THEN OF COURSE, THE ARTIST IS IN CHARGE EVER MAINTAINING THE ART, WHICH HAS KIND OF LEAD US TO THE PLACE THAT WE'RE AT NOW. THE SYSTEM ISN'T OPERATING AS WAS ORIGINALLY INTENDED. SO THERE IS SOME MISSING LIGHTS IN THE FORMATIONS, AND IT'S REALLY TIME TO REFLECT ON REPLACING IT AND TRYING TO MAKE IT LAST BETTER AND LAST LONGER. NEXT SLIDE. SO, ALL OF THE MONEY THAT WE GENERATED TO PLACE THE LIGHTS IN THE ORIGINAL PURPOSE WERE PROVIDED BY PRIVATE FUNDING. THE GAME PLAN THIS TIME AROUND IS TO UPDATE THE ART INSTALLATION CONSIDERABLY. THE BAY LIGHTS 360 REFLECTS THE FACT THAT THE ENGINEERING IS NOW DESIGNED TO REFLECT THE LIGHT ON BOTH SIDES OF THE BRIDGE WHICH WAS A CONCERN THAT COMMISSIONER WORTH BROUGHT UP AND IT'S A TERM OF AESTHETIC EQUITY THAT THE EAST BAY WAS NOT GIVEN ARE OPPORTUNITY TO CELEBRATE ON THE ART. THIS NEXT GENERATION IS ANTICIPATED TO DO THAT. CALTRANS HAS BEEN VERY CLOSELY INVOLVED IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE NEXT GENERATION OF LIGHTS. WE HAVE COMMITTED TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL WORK ASSOCIATED APPROVING THE PROJECT AND THE HARD HEAVY LIFT IS WITH ILLUMINATE BEN DAVIS TO TRY TO GENERATE THE FUNDS NECESSARY TO BRING THE LIGHT INSTALLATION BACK TO LIFE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHERE WE ARE TODAY IS, WE WILL BE TURNING THE LIGHTS OFF MARCH 5TH, 2023. THE GAME PLAN IS TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON THE CONCEPT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF INSTALLATION WHILE ILLUMINATE WORKS ON GENERATING REVENUE TO BRING IT FORWARD. IF ALL GOES WELL, WE WOULD HOPE TO HAVE THE LIGHTS BACK UP IN SEPTEMBER OF 2023 AND OUR EXPECTATION IS THAT IF ILLUMINATE IS SUCCESSFUL, THEN WE'LL COME FORWARD AND ASK THE AUTHORITY TO, AGAIN, CONTINUE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS OF THE LIGHTS, WHICH WE EXPECT TO BE IN A SIMILAR AMOUNT OF MONEY GOING FORWARD. SO, THAT'S THE GAME PLAN. BEN DAVIS IS AVAILABLE IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS. BUT, WITH THAT, WE WERE JUST TRYING TO PROVIDE INFORMATION AND MAKE SURE THE AUTHORITY WAS AWARE OF THE LIGHTS GOING DARK, AND THE INTENTION OF GETTING THEM BACK UP AS SOON AS POSSIBLE TO, SORT OF, REIMAGINE, I THINK, A FUTURE WITH THOSE LIGHTS IN PLACE. SO, THANK YOU.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? YES, VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SORRY. I HAVE ALREADY SPOKEN TWICE TODAY. I THINK THIS PROJECT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT, AND IT'S INCREDIBLY -- YOU KNOW, IMPORTANT FOR THE REGION, AND, ALSO, FOR SAN FRANCISCO. AND I REALLY HOPE WE CAN FIND A WAY TO KIND OF GET THIS -- TO NOT MAKE IT GO DARK PERMANENTLY. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I WAS WONDERING ABOUT IS THAT IN MANY CAPITAL PROJECTS, YOU SET-ASIDE A PORTION OF THE CAPITAL BUDGET PROJECT FOR THE ARTS, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING TO ADAPT TO BEST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PRACTICE, I KNOW A NUMBER OF CITIES AND LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HAVE THAT, AND TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE THAT PRACTICE HERE. DO WE DO THAT HERE AT MTC OR BATA? AND IS THERE AN OPPORTUNITY TO THINK ABOUT HOW WE CAN CONTINUE IN THE MOLD OF THE PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP BUT BE ABLE TO FIND SOME FUNDING TO, SORT OF, SUPPORT THE MORE PERMANENT INSTALLATION?

ANDREW FREMIER: COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, I THINK IT'S A VERY GOOD QUESTION. WE DO NOT HAVE ANY INTENTIONAL POLICY THAT SAYS WE DO THAT. HOWEVER, I'M VERY PROUD OF THE FACT THAT WE HAVE CONTINUED TO FIND WAYS TO INVEST IN PUBLIC ART IN THE CORRIDOR, IN PARTICULAR. SO, I KNOW YOU'RE ALL FAMILIAR WITH THE BRIDGE YARD BUILDING WHICH WAS USED BY COMMISSIONER SHAW TO WAVE GOODBYE TO WEST OAKLAND. WE HAVE INVESTED IN A PEER INFRASTRUCTURE THAT IS THE SUPPORT TO THE PARK THAT THE EAST BAY REGIONAL PARKS WILL BE DOING IN THE FUTURE, I THINK THE INCREDIBLE PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRANS ILLUMINATE WAS A GREAT EXAMPLE OF COUNTING ON THE PRIVATE FOLKS TO INVEST IN IT. I THINK FROM A PRACTICAL POINT OF VIEW WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT THE PRESSURE ON THE BRIDGE TOLL AND INFRASTRUCTURE, WE HAVE MONEY AND THE BATA RECOVERY WORK WE HAVE DONE. REHAB REVENUE IS STRESSED. I BELIEVE THESE KINDS OF INVESTMENTS ARE WELL WORTH THE COMMISSION THINKING ABOUT TAKING SERIOUS CONSIDERATION, AESTHETICS IN CONSTRUCTION AND IMPORTANT AND BUILDING CONCRETE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WALLS REALLY WITH ATTENTION TO DETAIL I THINK IT WOULD BE A MISTAKE.

NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ANDY, I THINK IT WOULD BE WORTHWHILE FOR US TO SEE IF WE CAN PARTNER MORE DEEPLY TO MAKE THIS PERMANENT SO MAYBE THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE TALKING ABOUT THAT.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. MEMBER RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: I HAD TO RAISE MY HAND AFTER I HEARD AN ENGINEER TALK ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF AESTHETICS, AND AS ARCHITECT IT'S VITALLY IMPORTANT AND SHOULD BE A PART OF EVERY PROJECT WE DO. I LOVE THIS PROJECT, TOTAL SUPPORTIVE OF IT GOING FORWARD, WISH FUND-RAISING ALL THE BEST AND LOOK FORWARD TO PARTNERS FOR ANOTHER TEN PLUS YEARS GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU ANDY FOR RECOGNIZING THE IMPORTANCE OF AESTHETICS.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE? I WOULD AGREE REGARDING POLICIES. MOST OF OUR CITIES DO THIS. WE HAVE A 1% POLICY FOR ANY OF OUR CITY PROJECTS, CAPITAL PROJECTS TO -- BUT THEN 1% OF THE BUDGET ON PUBLIC ARTS. AND WE'RE ACTUALLY LOOKING AT INCREASING THAT TO 2%. SO VERY MUCH VALUE ARTS IN OUR COMMUNITIES. SO, IF THERE IS A WAY TO EXPLORE THAT BECOMING MORE OF A POLICY, I WOULD VERY MUCH WELCOME THAT. I APPRECIATE THE PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP PIECE. I THINK THAT'S

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ALWAYS A CHALLENGE. AND, SO, I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT YOU HAVE HAD THIS SUCCESSFUL PARTNERSHIP. IT'S DEFINITELY A BEAUTIFUL PROJECT, AND LOOK FORWARD TO IT CONTINUING. SO, WITH THAT, IF THERE ARE NO OTHER COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS, I'LL OPEN THIS UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENTS. AND IF THE CLERK COULD GO THROUGH OUR PUBLIC MEMBERS, THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU'RE WELCOME. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME. FIRST IS ALETA DUPREE, FOLLOWED BY VEDA FLOREZ.

SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I ALWAYS ENJOY A GOOD LIGHT SHOW, AND I HAVE SEEN THIS ON OCCASION WHEN I AM IN THE DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO IN THE EVENING, WHICH ISN'T VERY OFTEN. AND I'VE ALWAYS ENJOYED WALK IT, AND I THINK THIS PROJECT HAS ALWAYS RESPECTED THE BRIDGE AND TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT ITS LONG HISTORY. SO, I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THE VERSION TWO OF THIS BEING PUT INTO COMMISSION. HOPEFULLY WE CAN HAVE A TROUBLE FREE INSTALLATION. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A PRESENTATION OF TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO BE AN ISSUE HERE, I THINK WE HAVE ROOM FOR IT. I HOPE AS A STATEMENT LIVING OUR VALUES THAT WE CAN FOR THIS INSTALLATION, I PRESUME IT WILL BE L.E.D. LIT WITH RENEWABLE ENERGY, MAYBE CONTRACT TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVE SOME KIND OF A SOLAR FIELD AND BATTERY PUT IN TO HELP POWER THIS. SO THAT WAY WE'RE NOT, THAT'S JUST PART OF BATA BEING MORE SUSTAINABLE. BUT, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE PRESENTATIONS ABOUT THIS AND BRING IT TO A VOTE. SO I CAN SEE WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE. AND ENJOY IT IN THE FUTURE GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT SPEAKER IS VEDA FLOREZ. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

VEDA FLOREZ: I AGREE I'M EXCITED TO SEE THE PRESENTATION ON THE BAY LIGHTS IT'S AN AMAZING TOURIST DRAW FOR OUR COMMUNITY AND I'M SAD TO SEE IT GOING DOWN ALL THROUGH TOURIST SEASON FROM MARCH TO SEPTEMBER ESPECIALLY THIS YEAR AS WE'RE COMING BACK FROM COVID. MY QUESTION TO THE DESIGNERS IS IF FUNDING WERE NOT AVAILABLE TO DO THE ENTIRE PROJECT BOTH THE EAST SIDE AND THE WEST SIDE, WOULD IT BE POSSIBLE JUST TO CREATE THE DESIGN ON THE WEST SIDE AGAIN, AND THEN WHEN FUTURE FUNDING COMES IN, PROGRESS WITH THE EAST SIDE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES. HEDGE THANK YOU YES THIS IS A PERSONAL COMMENT SO BEAUTIFUL TO THE PUBLIC THAT COMES HERE AND I HAVE TO TELL YOU OF A PERSONAL EXPERIENCE I PICKED UP MY DAUGHTER WHO DOES BUSINESS HERE, BROUGHT THEM ALONG EMBARCADERO TO ONE OF THE HOTELS THEY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WERE STAYING AT AND THEY WERE SO IMPRESSED AND TALKED ABOUT HOW BEAUTIFUL THE LIGHTS WERE AND I WOULD HATE TO LOSE THAT FOR ANY PERIOD OF TIME BUT LOOKING FORWARD TO HAVE IT REFRESHED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS VINAY PIMPLE.

SPEAKER: HI. I JUST WANTED TO RAISE A BIT OF CONCERN ABOUT ALWAYS TRYING TO ALLOCATE A CERTAIN PERCENTAGE OF MONEY WHEN IT COMES TO CAPITAL PROJECTS. BECAUSE, FOR ME, YOU KNOW, I ALWAYS THINK THAT THERE IS AN EQUITY CONSIDERATION THAT PEOPLE HAVE TO BEAR IN MIND. FOR EXAMPLE, IF THERE IS A $2 BILLION FANCY PROJECT IN AN AREA OF OUTSTANDING NATURAL BEAUTY, DOES THAT PLACE REALLY NEED, SAY, A 1% OR $20 MILLION IN A PROJECT? CAN THAT MONEY BE BETTER SPENT ELSEWHERE. SO, YOU KNOW, BECAUSE THIS KIND OF MANDATORY ALLOCATION, IT IS BECOMING POPULAR. I JUST WANT FOLKS TO BEAR THAT IN MIND, THAT IT CAN REALLY ACCENTUATE AN EQUITY THAT ALREADY EXISTS, AND WHY SHOULD A TWO BILLED VERY HIGH-END PROJECT GET SO MUCH MONEY IN ART, WHILE THERE ARE OTHER PLACES THAT JUST, WITH A LOW QUALITY OF LIFE TO BEGIN WITH, THEY DON'T HAVE ANYTHING. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HAND RAISED, MADAM CHAIR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU, CLERK. THEN WE'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE, AND I SEE MR. DAVIS. OH, YOUR HAND WAS UP. MR. DAVIS? BEN I'LL BE QUICK. THIS IS AN EXPRESSION OF GRATITUDE. THESE PROJECTS TAKE AN INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF COLLABORATION AND INTEGRITY. AND MTC AND BATA, ALONG WITH CALTRANS AND MANY OTHER GOVERNMENTAL AGENCIES HAVE DONE WHAT WAS IMPOSSIBLE. HOW DO YOU MAKE THIS PROJECT POSSIBLE IN THIS LIGHT OF INTERSTATE FREEWAY, ABOVE WATER AND TRAFFIC. COMING TOGETHER HISTORICALLY AND CURRENTLY WITH ALL OF THE ENERGY AND TALENT THAT IS REQUIRED IS REALLY BEAUTIFUL AND HUMBLING. AND I WANT TO TAKE A SPECIAL MOMENT TO HONOR THE MEMORY OF ANNE HALSTED WHO LOVED THIS PROJECT, AND I THINK OF HER OFTEN. SHE IS SUCH A SOURCE OF INSPIRATION, AND ALSO TO FORMER CHAIR AMY WHO CAME UP WITH THE BEAUTIFUL EXPRESSION, AESTHETIC EQUITY WHO HAS DRIVEN OUR TEAM IN THIS PROJECT. THE ONE CRITICISM THAT WE HAVE GOTTEN CONSISTENTLY WITH THE BAY LIGHTS IS I SEE YOU HAVE DIRECTED IT AT THE FANCY FOLKS IN THE PENTHOUSES IN SAN FRANCISCO BUT COULDN'T QUITE SHINE IT IN THE EAST BAY. SO WHILE I'M A LITTLE FRUSTRATED, THE NEED TO REPLACE THE BAY LIGHTS, A FEW YEARS SOONER THAN WE THOUGHT WE WOULD NEED TO WHILE ACKNOWLEDGING THE HARSH CONDITIONS FOR ELECTRONICS. WE ARE EXCITED, THE TEAM, IN THEIR APPROACH ARE CONFIDENT IN SOLUTIONS THIS TIME BUT ALSO INVITE THE ENTIRE BAY AREA INTO THE EXPERIENCE AS A MATTER OF AESTHETIC EQUITY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SOMETHING THAT THRILLS ME PERSONALLY AND WILL BE A FIRST IN THE BAY AREA IN TERMS OF HOW WE THINK ABOUT DELIVERING ART. THANK YOU FOR YOUR ONGOING SUPPORT. AND WISH US LUCK ON NOT JUST FUND-RAISING BUT DIRECT US TO FOLKS WHO CAN MAKE A DIFFERENCE, PLEASE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH I APPRECIATE YOU ALL.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. WE SHOULD BE THANKING YOU FOR THE GREAT PARTNERSHIP, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING THAT. SO, THANK YOU, MR. DAVIS. YES, MEMBER PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU MR. DAVIS FOR EXPLAINING ALL OF THE HISTORY HERE, AND ALL OF THE COLLABORATIONS AND ALL OF THE EFFORTS AND REALLY THE MEMORIES OF COMMISSIONER HALSTED. IT WAS GRIT. AND IN FACT, I REALLY LOVE WHAT FORMER COMMISSIONER WORTH SAID, ABOUT THE AESTHETIC EQUITY ISSUE HERE. BECAUSE I DO THINK THIS'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. AND, YOU KNOW, I HOPE WE CAN BRING LIGHT TO THIS SO THAT PEOPLE WILL PARTNER AND AID IN THIS EFFORT. AND I AM SURE EVERYBODY IS GOING TO GO OUT AND BUY THEIR MEGA MILLIONS RIGHT NOW. JUST IN CASE ANYBODY HERE HAS A FEW EXTRA DOLLARS. BUT I DO THINK THIS IS -- I MEAN, IT'S JUST BEAUTIFUL, AND I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE REST OF THE BAY BENEFIT FROM THIS, AS WELL. SO, FINGERS CROSSED HERE. AND LET'S LIGHT IT UP, AS FAR AS LETTING EVERYBODY KNOW. SO, I THINK THIS WILL BE GREAT. AND I DO THINK -- THANK YOU FOR LETTING US KNOW THIS. BECAUSE WHEN IT DOES GO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DARK, PEOPLE ARE GOING TO NOTICE. SO, LET'S GET THE WORD OUT WITHIN OUR COMMUNITIES AND SEE IF ANYBODY CAN HELP TOO. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? THIS WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM. SO NO VOTE NEEDED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. AND WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM SEVEN. PUBLIC COMMENT. IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK, CLERK, IF YOU WOULDN'T MIND GOING THROUGH THEM, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU'RE WELCOME. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I DO SEE ALETA DUPREE WITH HER HAND RAISED. MISS DUPREE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. NOT MUCH GOING ON IN THE TOLLING SPACE RIGHT NOW. BUT THE LINCOLN TUNNEL, BETWEEN NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY, IT'S THE LAST OF THE PORT AUTHORITY CROSSING TO IMPLEMENT ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING. IT REMAINS TO BE SEEN WHEN THE TOLL PLAZA COMES DOWN, CERTAINLY WHEN I GO TO NEW YORK AND STAY IN NEW JERSEY, I'LL GET TO EXPERIENCE THAT FOR THE FIRST TIME. AND OKLAHOMA IS DOING MORE WORK WITH THIS. THINK ABOUT HALF OF THEIR TOLL ROADS HAVE BEEN CONVERTED OVER. NOW I'M

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GOING TO REFRAME A LITTLE DIFFERENTLY. I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT AMY WORTH. AND I HAVE BEEN ENGAGING WITH YOU FOR ALMOST SIX YEARS, AND I THINK BATA OVERSIGHT MAY VERY WELL HAVE BEEN THE FIRST MTC MEETING THAT I ENGAGED IN, AND YOUR FORMER CHAIR, A.M. AMY WORTH WAS HEADING THE GROUP. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE WELCOME THAT AMY WORTH SHOWED ME. AND I WENT TO MANY MEETINGS AND AMY WORTH ALWAYS CAME OUT AND PUT FORWARD A WELCOME AT ANY MEETING THAT SHE WAS INVOLVED WITH. AND SHE ALWAYS SAID YOU'RE WELCOME HERE. AND I KNOW THAT MTC AND BATA IS ABOUT PEOPLE. AND AMY WORTH SHOWED THE WEALTH WITH A SENSE OF CLASS AND STYLE. I'M GOING TO MISS AMY WORTH VERY MUCH. AT THE MEETING TOMORROW WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A PRESENTATION ABOUT AMY WORTH AND THERESE MCMILLAN. I'LL JUST SAY I REALLY APPRECIATE ALL OF THE WONDERFUL WORK THAT AMY WORTH HAS DONE AND THE WELCOME SHE SHOWED ME. THANK YOU.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HAND RAISED, MADAM CHAIR.

MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU, CLERK. AND CONTINUING IN THE VEIN OF OUR FORMER CHAIR, AMY WORTH, I AGREE, SHE WAS VERY WARM AND WELCOMING. AND I HOPE THAT EVERYONE WILL CONTINUE TO FEEL WELCOMED AT THIS COMMITTEE. SO, WITH THAT, WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM EIGHT. WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT. AND OUR NEXT MEETING, THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY FEBRUARY 8TH, 2023. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

[ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

Broadcasting Government