



**BAY AREA REGIONAL
COLLABORATIVE**
Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE**
2 **FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2022 10:05 AM**
3
4 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING. I'M AMY WORTH. CHAIR OF THE
5 BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE. IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL TO
6 ORDER THE MEETING FOR FRIDAY NOVEMBER 18TH. AND MAY WE PLEASE
7 BEGIN WITH THE COVID ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING
8 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE
9 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
10 ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE
11 BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE BAY AREA
12 REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
13 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
14 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
15 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
16 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
17 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
18 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
19 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
20 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
21 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
22 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
23 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
24 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
25 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
2 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
3 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
4 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
5 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
6 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
7 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
8 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** MAY WE PLEASE HAVE ROLL CALL?

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ARREGUIN?

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT?

17

18 **TERESA BARRETT:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BAUTERS? IS ABSENT. GIOIA IS ABSENT.

21 HAUBERT?

22

23 **DAVID HAUBERT:** PRESENT.

24

25 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. HUDSON?



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1

2 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? PINE?

5

6 **DAVE PINE:** PRESENT.

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. RAMOS?

9

10 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

13

14 **MARK ROSS:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. SPERING?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

21

22 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN? AND WORTH?

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE QUORUM.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. THANK YOU SO MUCH. OUR NEXT ITEM,
6 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO THE GOVERNING MEMBER BOARD
7 ANNOUNCEMENTS. ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS THAT MY COLLEAGUES
8 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AT THE MEETING NOW? OKAY. SARINA, I'M GOING
9 TO ASK IF YOU SEE ANY HAND UP. I DON'T SEE ANY.

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I DON'T SEE ANY.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** NEXT MOVING ON TO THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I HAVE
14 THREE ITEMS. FIRST I WANT TO TURN THE FIRST PART, MY REPORT,
15 INFORMATION, OVER TO ALLISON BROOKS WHO IS GOING TO GIVE US AN
16 UPDATE ON AN EVENT WHICH SHE JUST ATTENDED WHICH IS VERY CLOSE
17 TO OUR HEARTS, AND SO CONNECTED WITH THE WORK WE'RE ALL TRYING
18 TO DO. ALLISON MAY I TURN IT OVER TO YOU.

19

20 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANKS CHAIR WORTH. I THOUGHT I WOULD SHARE A
21 RECENT TRIP I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO GO ON. FIRST WAS IN
22 BALTIMORE AT THE NATIONAL ADAPTATION FORUM, AND THEN I WAS
23 INVITED TO ATTEND AN EVENT WITH THE 10th ANNIVERSARY OF SUPER
24 STORM SANDY IN NEW YORK CITY. AND PARTLY WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO
25 DO THIS -- I HAVE BEEN MAINTAINING RELATIONSHIPS WITH THE



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 FOLKS IN NEW YORK AND THE NEW YORK REGION FROM REBUILD BY
2 DESIGN. YOU MAY REMEMBER WE HOSTED A YEAR-LONG SIMILAR EVENT
3 HERE CALLED RESILIENT BY DESIGN, THE BAY AREA CHALLENGE, WHICH
4 BROUGHT DESIGNERS, LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS, AND COMMUNITY MEMBERS
5 TO CRAFT CONCEPTS FOR MAKING OUR COMMUNITIES MORE RESILIENT.
6 THIS WAS THE TEN YEAR ANNIVERSARY OF SUPERVISOR STORM SANDY
7 AND AN ORGANIZATION CALLED THE WATER ALLIANCE TOOK US ON TOUR
8 OF THE MOST HEAVILY HIT LOCATIONS AROUND NEW YORK HARBOR,
9 INCLUDING HOBOKEN, RED HOOK, THE LOWER EAST SIDE, BATTERY PARK
10 CITY, THE SEA PORT, STATEN ISLAND. AND I THOUGHT I WOULD
11 SHARE, IT'S TEN YEARS LATER, AT THE TIME, HUD, THE U.S.
12 DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT HAD DEDICATED A
13 BILLION DOLLARS TO THESE COMMUNITIES WHO ARE HEAVILY HIT FROM
14 THE STORM TO INVEST IN RISK MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES, AND,
15 REALLY, AT TEN YEARS LATER, SOME OF THEM ARE JUST GETTING
16 STARTED. AND I THINK IT WAS JUST A KIND OF TELLING FOR ME
17 HEARING THE STORIES FROM PEOPLE WHO WERE THERE AT THE TIME OF
18 THE FLOODING IN SOME OF THE MOST HEAVILY HIT AREAS, AND
19 BASICALLY SAYING IF THEY WERE HIT BY THE SAME STORM TODAY,
20 THEY ARE NO MORE PREPARED NOW THAN THEY WERE TEN YEARS AGO.
21 SOME OF THE THINGS THEY HAVE DONE, YOU KNOW, THE SUBWAY HAS
22 BEEN HARDENED, AND THEY HAVE RAISED IN CERTAIN AREAS, IN
23 BUILDINGS, THEY HAVE RAISED THE ELECTRICAL UP A COUPLE OF
24 FLOORS FOR THE FLOODING, BUT A LOT OF THE BIG PROJECTS, A LOT
25 OF THE KIND OF INVESTMENTS THAT THEY NEED TO START MAKING ARE,



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 YOU KNOW, REALLY HAVE BEEN HELD UP THROUGH A LOT OF PROCESS IN
2 TERMS OF DECIDING. AND I THINK THIS IS REALLY INTERESTING,
3 JUST DECIDING THE KINDS OF INTERVENTIONS EVERYBODY CAN AGREE
4 ON IN THESE LOCATIONS. HO BOKEN, FOR EXAMPLE, ONE OF THE IDEAS
5 THEY PUT FORWARD WAS TO BUILD A SEA WALL BUT A LOT OF PEOPLE
6 IN HOBOKEN LIVING NEAR THAT SHORELINE DIDN'T WANT A WALL
7 BLOCKING THEIR VIEW OF THE HARBOR AND THEIR EXPERIENCE IN
8 THEIR COMMUNITY. SO THEY HAD TO GO BACK TO THE DRAWING BOARD
9 AND COME UP WITH ANOTHER PLAN, AND SIMILAR STORIES OCCURRING
10 IN OTHER PLACES AS WELL. I DID HEAR A LOT OF GREAT STORIES
11 FROM COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND PEOPLE COMING TOGETHER, A LOT OF
12 RESILIENCY IN TERMS OF SOCIAL CONNECTIONS THAT WERE MADE AS A
13 RESULT OF THAT, BUT THEY'RE NOW RECOGNIZING THE CHALLENGES OF
14 GETTING THESE KINDS OF RISK MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES IN THE
15 GROUND OR IN PLACE, WITH THE ANTICIPATION THAT A STORM VERY
16 WELL MAY HIT AT ANY POINT. I THOUGHT AS WE'RE WORKING TOGETHER
17 TRYING TO THINK ABOUT THE STRATEGIES WE NEED TO PUT FORWARD IN
18 OUR OWN COMMUNITIES, YOU KNOW, I JUST THOUGHT I WOULD RAISE
19 THAT UP. SO, EVEN A PLACE THAT'S ALREADY EXPERIENCED A
20 DISASTER, IS HAVING A HARD TIME GETTING THINGS GOING. AND I
21 JUST HOPE WE CAN CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER TO KIND OF ADVANCE
22 THE STRATEGIES WE NEED TO PUT IN PLACE TO PROTECT OUR
23 COMMUNITIES. AND FIGURE OUT HOW TO INVEST THESE RESOURCES IN
24 SUCH A WAY THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO SEE THE KIND OF IMPACTS
25 THAT THEY EXPERIENCE THERE. AND THEN ONE LAST POINT, I THOUGHT



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 IT WAS REALLY INTERESTING, THE LAST SPEAKER ON THIS, ON THIS
2 TOUR, WAS A GENTLEMAN FROM STATEN ISLAND IN A COMMUNITY, ONE
3 OF THE HARDEST HIT AND ONE THAT HAD PREVIOUS EXPERIENCES, HE
4 BROUGHT TOGETHER ALL THE RESIDENTS IN THIS COMMUNITY, ROUGHLY
5 200 HOMES, AND GOT THEM ALL TO GET BUY-OUTS FROM HUD. AND IT
6 TOOK THEM BANDING TOGETHER TO GET THE KIND OF INVESTMENT FROM
7 HUD WHERE THEY WERE ABLE TO GET THE WORTH OF THEIR PROPERTIES
8 AND MOVE AND FIND ANOTHER PLACE TO LIVE. AND IN THE MEANTIME,
9 THEY TOOK -- YOU KNOW, TORE DOWN ALL THE HOMES AND RETURNED
10 THAT PLACE TO MARSH, WETLANDS, WHAT IT WAS PROBABLY MEANT TO
11 BE. SO, I THOUGHT THAT WAS REALLY INSTRUCTIVE, BECAUSE YOU
12 DON'T HEAR ABOUT THESE BUYOUTS, NECESSARILY, I THINK IT'S HARD
13 FOR CITIES TO LOSE THOSE RESIDENTS AND THOSE PROPERTIES, BUT I
14 THOUGHT THAT WAS REALLY INTERESTING AND SOMETHING WE CAN LEARN
15 FROM. SO JUST WANTED TO SHARE THAT, AND HOPEFULLY, YOU KNOW,
16 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. BUT JUST WANT -- I THOUGHT THAT
17 WAS INSTRUCTIVE. SO, CHANGES CHAIR WORTH FOR GIVING ME THAT
18 TIME.

19

20 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALLISON, THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH FOR THAT
21 INSIGHT -- EXCUSE ME -- ON THE TRIP AND I THINK THIS POINTS
22 OUT THE VALUE OF OUR NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL CONNECTIONS IN
23 TERMS OF LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES AND GAIN FROM THIS
24 EXPERIENCE OF OTHER COMMUNITIES THAT ARE FACING THESE
25 DISASTERS. AND, SO, THANK YOU FOR DOING THAT. LET ME JUST ASK



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS OF THE BOARD. OKAY. SERENA, DO WE
2 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? EITHER IN WRITING OR IN
3 PERSON?

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE DON'T HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
6 ITEM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALLISON FOR THAT.

9

10 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANKS TO THERESE FOR TELLING ME I SHOULD
11 SHARE THIS STORY. SHE'S, LIKE. [LAUGHTER] YOU SHOULD TALK
12 ABOUT THIS.

13

14 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** SHE'S RIGHT. WE'RE LOOKING AT WHAT'S
15 HAPPENING IN FLORIDA WITH THOSE STORMS. AND THIS IS SO
16 DRAMATIC AND THIS IS A COMMUNITY THAT FACED THE SAME THING TEN
17 YEARS AGO AND WHAT ARE THE LESSONS LEARNED AND WHAT ARE THE
18 LESSONS NOT LEARNED. THERESE, YOU WERE THERE?

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I WAS IN THE MIDDLE. I WAS AT THE FTA, AND I
21 STILL REMEMBER, AS IF IT WAS YESTERDAY, THAT WHOLE DISASTER.
22 AND, YOU KNOW, FROM WORKING WITH THE FEDERAL TRANSIT
23 ADMINISTRATION, OF COURSE, WE HAD OUR LARGEST TRANSIT AGENCY
24 IN THE ENTIRE COUNTRY, A THIRD OF WHICH WAS UNDER WATER. IT
25 WAS CRAZY: THAT'S WHY, WHEN I WAS LISTENING TO ALLISON, AND WE



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 WERE CHATTING, AT THE TIME, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE PREPAREDNESS,
2 YOU HAVE RESPONSE, AND YOU HAVE RECOVERY. AND AT THE TIME, IT
3 WAS REALLY INTERESTING BECAUSE FOLKS WERE SAYING AS MUCH AS
4 THE DISASTER WAS, OBVIOUSLY, YOU KNOW, A CRISIS OF GREAT
5 PROPORTIONS, THE THINKING AT THE TIME WAS, WELL, AT LEAST IT
6 WAS IN NEW YORK, WHICH, AS A REGION, WHICH WAS FAR BETTER
7 PREPARED IN TERMS OF THE RESPONSE LEVEL THAN NEW ORLEANS WAS
8 WITH HURRICANE KATRINA, WHICH RAPID, WHAT? I THINK, FIVE YEARS
9 BEFORE THAT. BUT THE RECOVERY PIECE, AS ALLISON JUST SAID,
10 PROVES THAT EVEN IN AN AREA THAT HAD PROBABLY BEEN AS
11 THOUGHTFUL AND PREPARED AS ANY PLACE, REALLY, IN THE COUNTRY,
12 TO DEAL WITH THIS, HAS STRUGGLED. HAS STRUGGLED TO ACTUALLY DO
13 THINGS DIFFERENTLY, HAVING EMERGED FROM A CRISIS EVEN A DECADE
14 LATER. SO, YEAH, I THINK IT SPEAKS A LOT TO JUST THE
15 CHALLENGES OF, YOU KNOW, FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL, LOCAL
16 RESPONSES, AND INTERDEPENDENCIES AND THE LIKE TO START
17 THINKING ABOUT.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ABSOLUTELY. AND THOSE PHOTOGRAPHS OF THE
20 WATER FALLS IN THE SUBWAY WERE JUST STAGGERING. YOU KNOW? IT'S
21 NOT -- IT'S JUST AMAZING, YOU'RE RIGHT THE COORDINATION OF
22 THOSE LEVEL OF GOVERNMENT AND I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE
23 IMPORTANT ROLES WE IN OUR REGIONAL GOVERNMENT PLAY TOO IN
24 DOING THAT. JUST AN UPDATE ON THE INFORMATIONAL ITEM ON THE
25 NOMINATING PROCESS. TIME FLIES SO QUICKLY AND WE'RE ALREADY AT



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 THE POINT WHERE WE NEED TO NOMINATE AND SELECT NEW LEADERSHIP.
2 I AM -- SO, WHAT I WANTED TO DO -- IT'S A PRETTY INFORMAL
3 PROCESS, I HAVE ASKED SUPERVISOR SPERING AND SUPERVISOR RAMOS
4 TO SERVE AS A MEMBER OF THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE, IS THEY WILL
5 BRING BACK FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION AT THE JANUARY MEETING. WE -
6 - THE NOMINATIONS FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. ALTHOUGH WE DO
7 HAVE A WONDERFUL TRADITION OF THE VICE CHAIR ACCEDING TO THE
8 CHAIRMANSHIPS AND BEING ABLY SERVED BY OUR VICE CHAIR, AND
9 JESSE ARREQUIN AND I WANT TO THANK YOU AGAIN FOR FILLING IN
10 DURING THAT TIME I COULDN'T BE HERE. WE WILL HAVE THAT REPORT
11 AND FORMAL REPORT COME BACK TO THE BOARD IN JANUARY AT OUR
12 NEXT MEETING. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SEEING NO PUBLIC COMMENT.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OUR NEXT
17 ITEM IS THE 2023 BARC GOVERNING BOARD MEETING SCHEDULE, AND
18 THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. ARREGUIN?

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** IT REFERENCES MEETINGS TO APPROVE
21 THE A.B. 361 FINDINGS BUT AFTER LATE FEBRUARY THE GOVERNOR'S
22 DECLARED STATE OF EMERGENCY WILL EXPIRE SO WE WILL NOT BE ABLE
23 TO INVOKE ASSEMBLY BILL 361. WE SHOULD NOTE THAT THE SCHEDULE
24 WILL REFLECT THOSE DATES AND OBVIOUSLY AFTER THE END OF
25 FEBRUARY WE WILL HAVE TO GO BACK TO MEETING IN PERSON OR



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 VIRTUALLY AT A POSTED LOCATION. AND I'LL MOVE THE SCHEDULE
2 WITH THAT CHANGE.

3

4 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** SECOND. HUDSON.

5

6 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MOTION IS MADE BY MAYOR
7 ARREGUIN, SECONDED MADE BY MAYOR HUDSON. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
8 COMMENT ON THIS? OKAY. AND, SEEING NONE. ANY FURTHER
9 DISCUSSION? ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION ON THE FLOOR. SARINA,
10 MAY WE PLEASE HAVE A ROLL CALL.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ARREGUIN?

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT?

17

18 **TERESA BARRETT:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BAUTERS IS ABSENT. GIOIA IS ABSENT.
21 HUDSON?

22

23 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1

2 **DAVID HAUBERT:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? IS ABSENT. PINE?

5

6 **DAVE PINE:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** RABBIT? IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

9

10 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

13

14 **MARK ROSS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SPERING?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

21

22 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN? ABSENT. AND WORTH?

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES.

4

5 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** JESSE, YOU WILL GET TO LEAD THIS GROUP, IN A
6 NEW ERA OF IN-PERSON MEETINGS AGAIN.

7

8 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** A AS UNACCUSTOMED AS HE IS.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** HE'S A PRO. THE NEXT ITEM IS THE CONSENT
11 CALENDAR. IF THERE ARE ANY CHANGES, TURNING TO THE STAFF, THE
12 COMMITTEE, OR THE PUBLIC, ANY CHANGES IN THE CONSENT CALENDAR?
13 OKAY. SEEING -- JESSE, YOUR HAND IS STILL UP. IS THAT JUST AN
14 OLD HAND? OKAY. IF THERE IS NO DISCUSSION I'LL ENTERTAIN A
15 MOTION TO ADOPT THE CONSENT CALENDAR

16

17 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** MOTION, HUDSON.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. MAYOR.

20

21 **BELIA RAMOS:** SECOND, RAMOS.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SECOND BY SUPERVISOR RAMOS AND
24 FIRST BY MAYOR HUDSON. MAY WE PLEASE HAVE THE ROLL CALL VOTE?

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** YES, MA'AM. ARREGUIN?

2

3 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BARRETT?

6

7 **JOHN BAUTERS:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BAUTERS IS ABSENT. GIOIA IS ABSENT.

10 HUDSON?

11

12 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?

15

16 **DAVID HAUBERT:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? IS ABSENT. PINE?

19

20 **DAVE PINE:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** RABBIT? IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

23

24 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

2

3 **MARK ROSS:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SPERING?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WAGENKNECHT?

10

11 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN? IS ABSENT. AND WORTH?

14

15 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MOTION PASSES. THANK YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** PERFECT. GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO OUR

20 NEXT ITEM IS THE BARC MEMBER AGENCY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

21 UPDATES. AND I WOULD LOVE IF I MIGHT BE ABLE TO MAKE A SLIGHT

22 CHANGE TO THE ORDER. AND I WOULD BE GRATEFUL IF SHARON LANDERS

23 MIGHT BE ABLE TO BEGIN?

24



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **SHARON LANDERS:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. THERE ARE A
2 NUMBER OF THINGS I WANT TO BRING YOU UP-TO-DATE O FIRST AND
3 FOREMOST WHICH IS OUR EXECUTIVE -- OUR SEARCH FOR OUR
4 PERMANENT EXECUTIVE OFFICER. WE ARE ON THE SCHEDULE THAT WE
5 INDICATED, WHICH MEANS THAT WE ARE READY FOR THE BOARD TO BE
6 MEETING WITH THE ELECTED CANDIDATES AND DECEMBER 21ST THEY
7 SHOULD BE MAKING THE DECISION PUBLICLY WHO WILL OUR EXECUTIVE
8 OFFICER. SO THAT'S REALLY GOOD NEWS. MY CONTRACT CONTINUES
9 UNTIL FEBRUARY 23RD. AND IT'S BEEN A LOT OF FUN. I HAVE SEEN A
10 LOT OF STUFF WHILE BEING HERE, I AM GOING TO BE ANXIOUS TO
11 HAND-IN-HAND THE ARRAIGNS OVER TO OUR PERMANENT EXECUTIVE
12 OFFICER. DAVE HUDSON, DON'T SMILE TOO MUCH.

13

14 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** WHAT YEAR SHARON?

15

16 **SHARON LANDERS:** OUR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR JOHN BAUTERS, AND
17 DAVINA HURT -- JOHN ISN'T PRESENT TODAY BECAUSE HE'S AT COP 27
18 IN EGYPT FOR THE CLIMATE DISCUSSION. BUT WHAT WE DID THIS YEAR
19 WHICH IS REALLY GREAT, IS IN ADDITION TO SENDING BOTH OF OUR
20 BOARD MEMBERS, WE SENT THREE STAFF PEOPLE WHO ARE VERY, VERY
21 INVOLVED IN CLIMATE ISSUES, AND IT'S REALLY A VERY NICE WAY TO
22 CONTINUE TO INSTILL IN THEM A LOT OF INCENTIVES TO WORK IN
23 THIS REALLY IMPORTANT AREA. WE'RE REALLY DELIGHTED THAT WORKED
24 OUT WITH THE PRESS CONFERENCE IN EGYPT, AND THEY ALL
25 PARTICIPATED IN PANELS WHILE THEY WERE THERE. AND GREAT NEWS.



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 WE WERE 1 OF 132 GRANTS FROM ACROSS THE COUNTRY WHO WERE
2 AWARDED BY THE BIDEN ADMINISTRATION TO ENHANCE OUR AIR
3 MONITORING IN EAST OAKLAND. AND WE ARE PARTNERS WITH
4 COMMUNITIES FOR A BETTER ENVIRONMENT ON THAT PROJECT. THE
5 GRANT IS APPROXIMATELY \$300,000. AND IN THE LAST ITEM, IT'S
6 PRETTY IMPORTANT TO US, SO I'M GOING TO MENTION IT. AND PARTLY
7 BECAUSE THERE ARE TWO REFINERIES, P66, PHILLIPS 66, AND
8 MARATHON, THAT HAVE BEEN CONVERTING TO BIOFUELS. AND WE HAVE
9 HAD MASSIVE PERMIT CONVERSATIONS TO TRY TO MOVE THEM FORWARD.
10 MARATHON IS ALREADY, THEIR DRAFT PERMIT HAS ALREADY BEEN
11 RELEASED AND ON THE 15th OF THIS MONTH, WE WERE ABLE TO
12 RELEASE THE DRAFT FOR PHILLIPS 66, AND THE PUBLIC CAN NOW TAKE
13 A LOOK AT IT. AS DIFFICULT AS THAT PERMIT PROCESS IS, THE END
14 RESULT SHOULD BE LESS POLLUTION, BECAUSE THEY'RE USING
15 BIOFUELS. SO, AND WE HAVE A TOUGH PROCESS, BUT WE'RE REALLY
16 HAPPY TO SEE WHERE IT'S LEADING. AND THAT'S IT FOR ME. THANK
17 YOU.

18

19 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. SHARON, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THAT
20 REPORT, AND THE UPDATES AND THE INFORMATION. WE'RE ALL LOOKING
21 FORWARD TO OUR NEXT MEETING WHEN WE GET THE UPDATES FROM THE
22 EGYPT CONFERENCE. IT'S VERY EXCITING AND ALL OF THE WORK
23 THEY'RE DOING TOGETHER. I'LL TURN NOW TO OUR ABAG MTC
24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, THERESE MCMILLAN.

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BOARD MEMBERS, A LOT
2 HAPPENING IN THE FALL. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO TALK ABOUT THREE
3 MAJOR INITIATIVES OR FOCUS AREAS THAT MTC AND ABAG HAVE BEEN
4 INVOLVED WITH, AND LOOKING AT THE SCREEN, A NUMBER OF THANKS
5 TO THE POLICY MEMBERS WHO HELPED GET A NUMBER OF THESE OR ALL
6 OF THESE THINGS TO THE POINT OF EITHER CONCLUSION OR DESIGN,
7 BECAUSE THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT. I'LL START FIRST WITH THE
8 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES TOC POLICY THAT WAS ADOPTED IN
9 OCTOBER, BY THE COMMISSION. THIS HAS BEEN SOMETHING WE HAD
10 BEEN WORKING ON FOR TWO YEARS. AND IT WAS A REALLY
11 FOUNDATIONAL CHANGE IN ADVANCEMENT, IN A POLICY THAT WE HAVE
12 HAD ON THE BOOKS FOR SOMETIME, WHICH REALLY FOCUSES ON
13 INCREASING DENSITIES OF HOUSING AND COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN
14 AREAS WITH EXISTING OR PLANNED TRANSIT. AND SPECIFICALLY RAIL
15 -- FIXED GUIDEWAY TRANSIT. YOU KNOW, THE -- NOT SURPRISING
16 CORE IDEA HERE, IS THAT MORE PEOPLE WILL USE TRANSIT AS
17 ALTERNATIVE TO SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLE TRAVEL IF THEY CAN
18 LIVE AND/OR WORK CLOSER TO WHERE THE STATIONS ARE. AND THAT
19 ALSO PERMITS CONNECTING SERVICES AND OTHER THINGS THAT
20 FACILITATE, AGAIN, MOBILITY IN THAT SPACE. THIS WAS, AGAIN, A
21 FAR MORE DETAILED AND, I THINK, CUSTOM AND TAILORED APPROACH
22 UPDATE TO THE POLICY. IT WAS A TIERED APPROACH TO MATCH THE
23 TYPE AND FREQUENCY OF TRANSIT SERVICE THAT'S AVAILABLE, TO THE
24 EXPECTED DENSITIES THAT WOULD BE ASSOCIATED IN THE AREA AROUND
25 THE STATION. IT INTRODUCED A STRONG AND INTENTIONAL EQUITY



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 ELEMENT BY REQUIRING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, SUPPORTIVE POLICIES
2 FOR DEVELOPMENT IN THOSE CONSIDERED AREAS. AND THERE WAS
3 SUBSTANTIAL OUTREACH WITH OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO REALLY
4 PULL THIS TOGETHER. SO IT REFLECTED IN MANY WAYS HOW WE TAKE
5 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE INTEGRATIVE GOALS OF THAT, YOU
6 KNOW, MASTER PLAN, NORTH STAR WE HAVE, AND START PUTTING IT ON
7 THE GROUND IN TERMS OF SPECIFIC INITIATIVES. SO, A LOT OF
8 GREAT WORK AND COORDINATED EFFORTS WITH OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES,
9 AND OUR JURISDICTIONS TO GET THAT DONE. THE OTHER THING I
10 WOULD LIKE TO MENTION -- AND THERE WAS A REPORT JUST LAST
11 NIGHT, AND, SO, ABAG PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREQUIN, MAY WANT TO
12 JUMP IN AND SUPPLEMENT THIS. BUT WE HAD A REPORT ON HOW OUR
13 JURISDICTIONS ARE DOING IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING THE REGIONAL
14 HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENTS. THOSE HAVE TO BE DONE AND BASICALLY
15 APPROVED BY HCD BY JANUARY 31ST OF 2023, WHICH IS RIGHT AROUND
16 THE CORNER. THE 101 JURISDICTIONS IN THE BAY AREA, TWO, CITY
17 OF ALAMEDA AND CITY OF EMERYVILLE, WOOHOO, HAVE ACTUALLY BEEN
18 APPROVED IN TERMS OF SUBSTANTIAL COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIRED
19 GUIDELINES SUBMITTED BY HCD BUT THERE IS A LOT OF WORK AND
20 INCREDIBLE RUSHED TO THE DEADLINE TIME FRAME THAT THE REST OF
21 OUR JURISDICTIONS ARE HAVING TO FACE. ONE OF THE THINGS WE
22 STRESS LAST NIGHT THAT WE HAVE PROVIDED AS STAFF UNPRECEDENTED
23 LEVEL OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR JURISDICTIONS IN ORDER TO
24 HELP THEM MEET THE MUCH MORE DETAILED REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
25 RHNA, THIS CYCLE, AND QUITE FRANKLY, THE MUCH MORE HEIGHTENED



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 STATE SCRUTINY ON HOW THOSE PLANS ARE BEING PUT TOGETHER. SO,
2 A LOT OF WORK I KNOW IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS BUT ALSO A
3 LOT OF SUPPORT THAT WE'RE TRYING TO PROVIDE TO OUR LOCAL
4 JURISDICTIONS. THE THIRD THING I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT IS
5 THAT AT THE JOINT LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE OF MTC AND ABAG, WE
6 PUT TOGETHER, AS WE ALWAYS DO, A VERY COMPREHENSIVE DRAFT
7 LEGISLATIVE AGENDA THAT WILL BE MOVING FORWARD FOR ADOPTION IN
8 DECEMBER, WITH AN EYE TOWARD THE 2023 LEGISLATIVE SESSION.
9 IT'S A VERY -- BEFITTING OF THE TWO AGENCY PORTFOLIOS, IT'S A
10 VERY BROAD AGENDA COVERING TRANSPORTATION AND MOBILITY,
11 HOUSING, CLIMATE, YOU KNOW, IN PARTICULAR. BUT ONE LEADING
12 EFFORT I WOULD JUST LIKE TO LIFT UP IS PURSUING VERY
13 AGGRESSIVELY IS TRANSIT OPERATING GAP FUNDING STANCE FOR OUR
14 TRANSIT OPERATORS. AS I'M SURE YOU'RE ALL AWARE, OUR METRO
15 AREA HAS REBOUNDED FAR MORE SLOWLY THAN OTHER METRO AREAS IN
16 THE REST OF THE COUNTRY, AND CERTAINLY IN THE REST OF THE
17 STATE. AND OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE FEELING THAT IN TERMS OF
18 SUBSTANTIALLY STILL SUPPRESSED RIDERSHIP GAINS FROM THE
19 PANDEMIC PARTICULARLY, FROM MAJOR RAIL OPERATORS WHOSE DESIGN,
20 YOU KNOW, BART, CALTRAIN, WHAT ARE THE FERRY SYSTEM IN
21 PARTICULAR, WHO ARE DESIGNED FOR SERVING COMMUTES INTO OUR JOB
22 SHEDS, AND THOSE HAVE FOUNDATIONALLY CHANGED IN I POST-
23 PANDEMIC WORLD, AND THE RESULTS OF THAT ARE THAT WE SEE
24 SUBSTANTIAL FINANCIAL CLIFFS EMERGING FOR THOSE OPERATORS AS
25 THE MASSIVE AND SIGNIFICANT FEDERAL ASSISTANCE THAT WAS



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 PROVIDED DURING COVID STARTS TO RUN OUT. AND SO WE ARE TAKING
2 A VERY INTENTIONAL LOOK AT WHAT TYPE OF BRIDGING STRATEGY
3 COULD BE PURSUED WITH AN EYE TOWARD A COMMITMENT TO PURSUING A
4 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE IN THE FUTURE. THERE
5 HAS BEEN A CLEAR DECISION IN THE REGION TO THROW OUR ENERGIES
6 BEHIND A REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE FOR HOUSING IN 2024, BUT
7 THAT A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, WHICH WOULD INCLUDE AN ELEMENT,
8 CERTAINLY, FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT OPERATING, WOULD BE IN A
9 SUBSEQUENT ELECTORAL CYCLE DOWN THE ROAD IN THE MEANTIME WE
10 NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN BE LIFTED UP
11 AND SUSTAINED UNTIL WHICH TIME WE WOULD BE PREPARED AND
12 HOPEFULLY CAN SEE SUCCESSFULLY ENACTED VOTER APPROVED REGIONAL
13 MEASURES. THAT'S A LOT BUT IT'S A HUGE SIGNIFICANT OBJECTIVE
14 THAT WOULD REQUIRE A STRONG COALITION OF INTEREST ACROSS THE
15 REGION. PUBLIC TRANSIT AND ITS, BASICALLY SURVIVAL, IS
16 ESSENTIAL ON SO MANY LEVELS, WHETHER YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT
17 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS, BECAUSE OF MOVING PEOPLE OUT OF
18 THEIR CARS INTO A PUBLIC TRANSIT, OR REDUCTION OF VMT, WHICH
19 HAS ALL TYPES OF BENEFITS ASSOCIATED WITH THAT, FROM SAFETY ON
20 OUR ROADS TO PROVIDING MOBILITY OPTIONS FOR THOSE WHO NEED IT
21 MOST. EITHER WAY YOU CUT IT, A SUCCESSFUL HEALTHY REGION NEEDS
22 A SUCCESSFUL AND HEALTHY PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO, THAT'S
23 REALLY A FOCAL POINT THAT WE WILL BE SEEING IN OUR LEGISLATIVE
24 EFFORTS. SO, WITH THAT, I'LL CLOSE AND TURN IT BACK OVER TO
25 YOU MADAM CHAIR.



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1

2 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, THERESE, VERY MUCH FOR THAT
3 REPORT. AND I WILL ASK IF THERE ARE QUESTIONS. AND I SEE MAYOR
4 HUDSON HAS HIS HAND UP.

5

6 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** THERESE, GREAT REPORT. AND I NEVER SAY THAT.
7 NOT ABOUT YOU, I JUST NEVER SAY THAT. THE TOC COMPONENT THAT
8 YOU JUST SPOKE ABOUT, ONE THING THAT DOESN'T BOTHER ME, I JUST
9 WANT TO START HIGHLIGHTING IT A LITTLE BIT MORE. IT ISN'T SO
10 MUCH THAT WE DID DENSITY ON COMMERCIAL, AND DENSITY ON
11 HOUSING, BUT IT'S THE ESSENTIAL SERVICES COMPONENT THAT WE PUT
12 IN THAT HAS ALWAYS CAUGHT MY ATTENTION. THE EXAMPLES, DAYCARE,
13 AND MEDICAL, I KNOW I TRIED TO SLIP IN GROCERY STORES, BECAUSE
14 THE SIX FEET BETWEEN PEOPLE IF WE EVER HAVE A PANDEMIC, BUT I
15 FELT THAT WAS AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT OF IT THAT CITIES SHOULD
16 TAKE A LOOK AT. BECAUSE AS YOU JUST FINISHED THE VMT COMPONENT
17 OF THIS, DOESN'T ALWAYS SHOW THROUGH WHEN WE LOOKED AT OUR --
18 IT DIDN'T IN MY OPINION, WHEN WE THROUGH THE RHNA PROCESS, THE
19 GOVERNMENTAL PROCESS, THE VMT IS THE MAJOR COMPONENT OF THE
20 CLIMATE CHANGE, AND I THINK YOU EXPRESSED THAT VERY L SO WE'RE
21 GOING TO TAKE THAT AND TAPE IT AND SEND IT OUT TO EVERYBODY
22 ALL YOUR SIX MINUTE BLAST THERE.

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. LET ME SEE ARE
2 THERE ANY OTHER COMMENTS OF THE COMMITTEE? OR ANY QUESTIONS?
3 I'M GOING TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT AT THE END OF THE REPORT.
4 THERESE, THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND, YOU KNOW, WE'RE ALL GOING TO
5 NEED TO BE WORKING TOGETHER SO AGGRESSIVELY TO ENSURE THE
6 FUNDING SECURITY FOR OUR TRANSIT MOVING FORWARD. BECAUSE,
7 CLEARLY, A SITUATION WE ALL THOUGHT WOULD HAVE BEEN FINISHED
8 BY SPRING VACATION OF THAT FIRST YEAR IS CONTINUING AND, YOU
9 KNOW, ONE OF THE OTHER INTERESTING THINGS THAT WE FOUND TOO IS
10 THERE IS REAL OPPORTUNITY AND NEED FOR THE LOCAL TRANSIT, TOO,
11 THAT PEOPLE ARE ON OUR BUSES AND WE JUST HAVE TO KEEP THE
12 WHOLE SYSTEM MOVING. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. AND, SO, LET ME
13 JUST TURN NOW TO OUR NEXT PRESENTATION. THIS WILL BE FROM AMY
14 HUTZEL, CALIFORNIA STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY.

15

16 **AMY HUTZEL:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH AND MEMBERS OF THE BARC
17 BOARD. THE FIRST THING THAT I WANTED TO TALK ABOUT IS
18 BENEFICIAL USE OF DREDGE SEDIMENT IN SAN FRANCISCO BAY, WHICH
19 WE HAVE MADE SOME MAJOR PROGRESS ON IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS.
20 FOUR YEARS AGO, WE TEAMED UP WITH BCDC TO SUBMIT A PROPOSAL TO
21 THE CORP OF ENGINEERS FOR BENEFICIAL USE PILOT PROGRAM, IT WAS
22 UNDER A PREVIOUS WATER RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT ACT. AND WE WERE
23 1 OF 10 SELECTED PROJECTS NATIONALLY, OUT OF 94 APPLICATIONS
24 NATION-WIDE. AND IT WAS A \$51 MILLION PROPOSAL FOR DIRECT
25 PLACEMENT OF BENEFICIAL USE -- DIRECT PLACEMENT OF DREDGE



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 SEDIMENT -- SORRY -- AT BENEFICIAL USE SITES IN SAN FRANCISCO
2 BAY, FROM THE FEDERAL NAVIGATION CHANNELS IN THE BAY, AS WELL
3 AS A STRATEGIC AQUATIC PLACEMENT TEST, WHICH IS BASICALLY
4 TAKING SOME DREDGE SEDIMENT AND TRYING SOME NEW IN-BAY
5 DISPOSAL SITES, WHERE YOU DON'T HAVE TO PIPE THE MATERIAL, YOU
6 CAN -- YOU KNOW, THE BARGE CAN GET THERE, AND SEEING WHETHER
7 THAT MATERIAL ACTUALLY IS FEEDING OUR MARSHES AND MUD FLATS.
8 SO, REALLY FOCUSED ON RESILIENCE. SAN FRANCISCO BAY
9 SHORELINES. THE CORP OF ENGINEERS ACCEPTED OUR PROJECT BUT
10 ONLY MOVED FORWARD ON THE STRATEGIC AQUATIC PLACEMENT TEST
11 WHICH WAS A \$3.6 MILLION PORTION OF THE OVERALL PROJECT. THEY
12 SHOULD BE DOING THAT TEST NEXT YEAR, AND WE ARE VERY
13 SUPPORTIVE OF THAT, BUT WE ALSO, OBVIOUSLY, WANTED THE REST OF
14 THE PROJECT, THE DIRECT PLACEMENT, TO MOVE FORWARD. SO, AFTER
15 FOUR YEARS OF EFFORT -- AND I COMPARE THIS TO THOSE GIANT
16 CONTAINER SHIPS COMING INTO SAN FRANCISCO BAY, AND WE ARE JUST
17 ONE OF THOSE LITTLE BOATS TRYING TO PUSH THAT CONTAINER SHIP A
18 LITTLE DEGREE TO THE LEFT, AND WE FINALLY SUCCEEDED, WITH CORP
19 HEADQUARTERS, AND THE ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF THE ARMY'S
20 OFFICE. THE CORP HAS PUT \$19 MILLION TOWARDS OUR PILOT PROJECT
21 IN THEIR LAST INFRASTRUCTURE ACT WORK PLAN, AND THE ASSISTANT
22 SECRETARY OF THE ARMY'S OFFICE HAS DIRECTED THE CORP TO
23 IMPLEMENT THE FULL PROJECT. SO, THE DOOR IS ALSO OPEN TO, YOU
24 KNOW, GETTING ADDITIONAL FUNDING UP TO THE 51 MILLION. SO I AM
25 -- SORRY. MY TEAMS IS CALLING ME. SO, WE'RE VERY EXCITED. AND



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 I'M HOPING THE CORP CAN PUT -- START PUTTING THIS MONEY TO USE
2 WITH NEXT YEAR'S DREDGING CYCLE, AND THAT THIS WILL -- I MEAN,
3 THE CORP IS SAYING, THIS IS NOT PRECEDENT SETTING. BUT I'M
4 HOPING THAT IT'S PRECEDENT SETTING AND IT CHANGES HOW THE CORP
5 IS DOING BUSINESS IN SAN FRANCISCO BAY. JUST SO YOU KNOW, MUCH
6 OF THE MATERIAL RIGHT NOW THAT'S DREDGED IN THE SAN FRANCISCO
7 BAY GOES 50 MILES OFF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE TO THE DEEP OCEAN
8 DISPOSAL SITE, OR TO IN-BAY DISPOSAL SITES, LIKE NEAR ALCATRAZ
9 THAT REALLY DON'T BENEFIT THE SHORELINE OF SAN FRANCISCO BAY.
10 THEY'RE NOT SITES THAT ARE, YOU KNOW, FEEDING OUR SHORE LINES.
11 SO, I FEEL LIKE WE MADE HUGE PROGRESS IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS,
12 AND WE NEED TO STAY DILIGENT WITH THE CORP TO MAKE SURE THIS
13 IS ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTED, BUT WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT. AND THEN,
14 I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY, AS I HAVE
15 SAID BEFORE, WE RECEIVED SIGNIFICANT FUNDING, FY 2022, 2023
16 STATE BUDGET AS PART OF THE OVERALL CLIMATE PACKAGE ACTION. WE
17 ARE OPEN TO APPLICATIONS, GRANT APPLICATIONS, I'M GOING TO PUT
18 THE WEB SITE IN THE -- ACTUALLY THERE, IS NO CHAT -- I'M NOT
19 GOING TO PUT THE WEB SITE IN THE CHAT, BUT YOU CAN GO TO STATE
20 COASTAL CONSERVANCY GRANTS, IF YOU GOOGLE THAT, YOU SHOULD
21 FIND THE SITE, BUT WE ARE TAKING PREPROPOSALS AND THERE IS ALL
22 SORTS OF RESOURCES ON THE WEB SITE FOR THAT FUNDING. AND IT'S
23 VERY FOCUSED ON COASTAL RESILIENCE, SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION,
24 PARTICULARLY NATURE-BASED. AND THEN THERE IS SOME OTHER
25 SMALLER POTS OF FUNDING LIKE WILDFIRE RESILIENCE, AND SOME



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 FUNDING FOR SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND GEOGRAPHIC PROGRAMS WITHIN
2 OUR JURISDICTION ON THE COAST, AND IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY.
3 AND THEN, I REALLY APPRECIATED ALLISON'S DESCRIPTION OF THE
4 TRIP SHE TOOK. AND IT REALLY RESONATED WITH ME. WE HAVE BEEN
5 WORKING, FOR 20 YEARS, TO IMPLEMENT THE SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO
6 BAY SHORELINE PROJECT, BUILDING A FOUR-MILE LEVEE, AND 3,000
7 ACRES OF WETLANDS RESTORATION, AND THE HURDLES THAT GET FACED
8 IN THESE PROJECTS ARE IMMENSE. IT IS UNDER CONSTRUCTION NOW,
9 BUT WE HAVE SOME, YOU KNOW, MAJOR ISSUES THAT ARE, YOU KNOW,
10 THREATENING THE OVERALL ABILITY TO IMPLEMENT THAT PROJECT. AND
11 IT'S SUCH A GREAT PROJECT. IT KIND OF MAKES WONDER, LIKE, CAN
12 WE DO THIS. YOU KNOW, IN OTHER PARTS OF THE BAY AREA. BETWEEN
13 ISSUES WITH PG&E, AND THEIR POWER LINES THAT GO THROUGH THE
14 SITE. THE UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD, AND I DON'T WANT TO KNOCK ON
15 SAN JOSE, BUT COORDINATION WITH THE CITY OF SAN JOSE HAS NOT
16 BEEN EASY. AND, JUST, COST ESCALATION, AND TO THE CORP OF
17 ENGINEERS'S OWN INTERNAL PROCESSES WITH FUNDING FOR THESE
18 PROJECTS, IT IS EXTREMELY CHALLENGING. I MEAN, WE'RE DOING
19 EVERYTHING WE CAN TO GET THAT ENTIRE PROJECT IMPLEMENTED. BUT,
20 NOTHING IS EASY. SO, THANK YOU.

21

22 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OH L AMY, THANK YOU FOR THAT REPORT. AND I
23 AM SO PLEASED TO HEAR ABOUT THE ARMY CORP PROGRESS WITH THE
24 SOILS. BECAUSE WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO USE THOSE TO DO OUR
25 RESILIENCY WORK ON THE SHORELINE, AND YOU WORK MIRACLES. SO



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 WE'RE HERE TO KEEP SUPPORTING THAT HAPPEN. THANK YOU VERY
2 MUCH. LET ME JUST SEE IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS. I SEE MARK
3 ROSS HAS HIS HAND UP.

4

5 **MARK ROSS:** I'M VERY INTERESTED. WE ARE DRENCHING OUR MARINA
6 RIGHT NOW. AND I WISH THIS WAS PUT IN PLACE, BECAUSE IT'S A
7 SHAME TO SPOIL ALL OF THAT GOOD SPOILS, INTO A DRYING POND,
8 WHICH SPOILS THE BASIN WE HAVE. IT'S GREAT FOR THE SALT MARSH
9 PICK PELL WEED AND PERHAPS BUT OTHER THAN THAT PROBABLY BE
10 BETTER OFF USED IN THE MARSHES.

11

12 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS? ALLISON WAS THE
13 MODERATOR AND I PARTICIPATED IN THE BAY PLANNING CONFERENCES
14 THIS FALL, AND CLEARLY THE CHALLENGE OF THE MULTIAGENCY
15 ENGAGEMENT IN THESE PROJECTS JUST MAKES THEM LONG, HARD, AND
16 WITH INCREASING COSTS. AND THAT'S, I THINK, ONE OF OUR GOALS
17 HERE IS HOW DO WE CREATE COORDINATION SO WE CAN REDUCE SOME OF
18 THOSE BARRIERS TO GETTING THESE PROJECTS DONE. AND I KNOW THAT
19 WAS RAISED, DIRECTLY, AT THE PANEL, BOTH TIMES. AND, SO, THANK
20 YOU, VERY, VERY MUCH. OUR NEXT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT IS ON
21 BCDC, AND I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME JESSICA F FAIN WHO IS
22 PLANNING DIRECTOR WHO WILL PROVIDE THAT REPORT.

23

24 **JESSICA FAIN:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE.
25 I'M JESSICA FAIN. LARRY IS ON VACATION TODAY, SO I'M STANDING



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 IN. ALLISON, I APPRECIATE YOU STANDING IN ON THAT TEN YEAR
2 ANNIVERSARY. I STARTED MY CAREER AS A WATERFRONT PLANNER IN
3 NEW YORK CITY, AND EARLY ON HURRICANE SANDY HIT AND I JUST
4 REMEMBER BIKING AROUND CONEY ISLAND, RED HOOK THE DAY AFTER
5 THE STORM, AND JUST SEEING FIRSTHAND THE DEVASTATING IMPACTS
6 THAT THE STORM CAUSED. THOSE ARE JUST SEARED IN MY MEMORY. AND
7 ONE OF THE THINGS I VALUE ABOUT THE BAY AREA IS WE DO HAVE THE
8 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY PLAN AHEAD AND NOT HAVE THAT HAPPEN. AND
9 SO THAT ENCOURAGES ME THAT WE CAN NOT HAVE TO FACE THAT HERE
10 IF WE ARE BEING PROACTIVE. SO, HERE IN THE BAY, WE'RE
11 CONTINUING TO WORK, AND BCDC, CONTINUING TO ADVANCE OUR WORK
12 ON SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION. ONE OF THE PROJECTS THAT'S
13 ENGINEER COMPLETION IS A REALLY EXCITING INTER-AGENCY PROJECT
14 WITH MTC ABAG TO DEVELOP A FUNDING FRAMEWORK FOR SHORELINE
15 ADAPTATION. THIS WILL GIVE US BETTER COSTS FOR WHAT TYPES OF
16 REVENUES WE WILL NEED TO RAISE TO REALLY EQUITABLY FILL THAT
17 MAJOR FUNDING GAP. SO THAT'S BEEN A REALLY EXCITING INTER-
18 AGENCY EFFORT AND SETTING THE STAGE FOR WHAT COMES NEXT. BCDC
19 ALSO IS RECEIVING TWO MAJOR GRANTS TOTALING OVER \$5 MILLION TO
20 SUPPORT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BAY ADAPT JOINT PLATFORM,
21 WHICH YOU ALL HELPED SUPPORT AND DEVELOP. SPECIFICALLY, THIS
22 FUNDING WILL SUPPORT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A REGIONAL SHORELINE
23 ADAPTING A PLAN IN CLOSE COLLABORATION WITH CITIES AND
24 COUNTIES. AND WE'RE REALLY EXCITED TO KICK THAT OFF IN EARLY
25 2023. AS WELL AS SUPPORTING ABOUT. CDC'S ROLE AS SERVING AS



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 BACK BONES AGENCY TO COORDINATE AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE,
2 COMMUNICATE, EDUCATE, WORKING WITH COMMUNITIES AND AGENCIES TO
3 ENSURE WE'RE ALL MOVING FORWARD IN ONE DIRECTION. WE HAVE TWO
4 REQUESTS FOR PROPOSALS THAT ARE CURRENTLY OPEN RELATED TO
5 THESE TASKS AND HAVE ALSO BEEN BUSILY HIRING NEW STAFF. I
6 WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE WATER BOARD AND THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY
7 RESTORATION AUTHORITY. PARTICULARLY, THEY INVITE US RECENTLY
8 TO PRESENT ON SOME OF THIS WORK AND IT LED TO SOME REALLY
9 FRUITFUL CONVERSATIONS. BCDC IS WORKING ON TWO INITIATIVES
10 SIMULTANEOUSLY, WORKING ON OUR STRATEGIC PLAN AND OUR RACIAL
11 EQUITY ACTION PLAN WE HELD WORKSHOPS ON BOTH INITIATIVES IN
12 OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER, AND STAFF ARE WORKING ON INCORPORATING
13 FEEDBACK. THESE ALSO REPRESENT AN OPPORTUNITY TO INCORPORATE
14 THE RECENT GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER, N1622, ON EMBEDDING
15 EQUITY, WHICH REQUIRES THAT NEW STATE AGENCIES STRATEGIC PLANS
16 USE DATA AND INCLUSIVE PRACTICES TO MORE EFFECTIVELY ADVANCE
17 EQUITY IN RESPONSE TO DISPARITIES AND ENGAGE WITH HISTORICALLY
18 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. SO, THAT GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE
19 ORDER, REALLY IS JUST THAT EXTRA PUSH, I THINK, THAT WE NEED
20 TO KIND OF CONTINUE ADVANCING THIS WORK. AND, THEN, LASTLY,
21 YOU MAY RECALL THAT THIS PAST SUMMER, A GROUP LED BY THE EAST
22 OAKLAND STADIUM ALLIANCE, AS WELL AS OTHER INDUSTRY GROUPS,
23 FILED A LAWSUIT REGARDING BCDC'S APPROVAL OF BAY PLAN
24 AMENDMENT 219 WHICH REMOVED AN EXISTING PORT PRIORITY USE AREA
25 DECISION FOR HOWARD TERMINAL AT THE PORT OF OAKLAND. THE SUIT



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 BASED ON THREE CAUSES OF ACTION, CEQA, THE MACATER PETRIS ACT
2 AND COMMON LAW CONFLICT OF INTEREST. JUST AN UPDATE THE CASE
3 MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE HELD IN LATE SEPTEMBER NEXT ONE
4 SCHEDULED FOR MID-DECEMBER AND WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING ON
5 FINALIZING ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD FOR THE PETITIONERS REVIEW
6 NOW AND BRIEFING SHOULD BEGIN SHORTLY AFTER THE RECORD IS
7 CERTIFIED. SO, THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT.

8

9 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESSICA. ANY DISCUSSION OR
10 COMMENT? SEEING NONE. SARINA, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC
11 COMMENT?

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN
14 WRITING AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT HANDS RAISED.

15

16 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** I WANT TO THANK ALL THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS
17 BEING HERE TODAY AND FOR GIVING YOUR REPORTS. IT'S GREAT TO
18 HAVE THIS INFORMATION AND THE SUCCINCT MOMENT TOGETHER AND TO
19 SEE PROGRESS ON ALL THE WORK WE'RE DOING TOGETHER. SO, OUR
20 NEXT ITEM IS ITEM SIX, WHICH IS THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY REGIONAL
21 WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD. A DETAILED REPORT ON EFFORTS
22 FOCUSED ON ADDRESSING CLIMATE CHANGE. SO, MAY I PLEASE TURN
23 THE PODIUM OVER TO EILEEN WHITE FOR THAT PRESENTATION? I THINK
24 YOU'RE MUTED, EILEEN.

25



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 **E LINE WHITE:** THANK YOU CHAIR WORTH. LET ME PULL UP MY
2 PRESENTATION.

3

4 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THEY WILL BE ADVANCING SLIDES FOR YOU.

5

6 **EILEEN WHITE:** GREAT. LET ME START BY SAYING THANK YOU FOR
7 HAVING ME. AS WE ALL KNOW CLIMATE CHANGE IS A REGIONAL
8 PROBLEM, AND IT TAKES A REGIONAL SOLUTION, AND MEETINGS LIKE
9 THIS ARE REALLY GREAT OPPORTUNITIES TO JUST SHOW OFF THE GREAT
10 WORK EVERYONE IS DOING COMING TOGETHER AND COLLABORATING. AND
11 WE HAVE REALLY ENJOYED WORKING WITH ALL THE DIFFERENT ENTITIES
12 IN THE BAY AREA, AS WE ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE,
13 PLEASE. GREAT. SO, THE WATER BOARD HAS TAKEN A MULTI-PRONG
14 APPROACH TO ADDRESSING CLIMATE CHANGE, AND WE'RE DOING IT WITH
15 POLICIES AND PERMITTING TO THE PEOPLE WE REGULATE. I'LL BE
16 TALKING BRIEFLY ABOUT WHAT WE'RE DEALING WITH IN OUR STORM
17 WATER PROGRAM, OUR WETLANDS AND RIPARIAN PROTECTION AND
18 WORKING COLLABORATIVELY WITH A NUMBER OF OTHER STAKEHOLDERS IN
19 THE BAY AREA AND FINALLY TALK ABOUT THE REGIONAL BOARD WORK
20 WE'RE DOING TO SUPPORT THE STATE BOARD'S EFFORTS AS WE TRY TO
21 ADDRESS PREPARING FOR A DRYER HOTTER FUTURE AND THE GOVERNOR'S
22 SUSTAINABILITY PLAN FOR SUSTAINABLE WATER FOR THE FUTURE AND
23 WHAT WE'RE DOING REGARDING THE WATER RECYCLING SUSTAINABLE
24 GROUNDWATER MANAGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. THE WATER QUALITY CONTROL
25 PLAN FOR THE SAN FRANCISCO BASIN IS A PLAN FOR WATER BOARD'S



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 MASTER WATER QUALITY CONTROL PLANNING DOCUMENT AND THE BASIN
2 PLAN LACKS DESCRIPTION OF CLIMATE CHANGE AND IT'S RELEVANCE TO
3 THE WATER BOARD REGULATORY PROGRAMS PARTICULARLY DREDGING FILL
4 ACTIVITIES. THE AMENDMENT UPDATES THE BANK PLAN TO INCLUDE
5 INFORMATION ON HOW CLIMATE CHANGE IMPACTS WATER QUALITY AND
6 INCLUDES INFORMATION THAT SHOULD BE HELPFUL FOR THE PLANNING
7 AND PERMITTING OF DREDGE OR FILL PROJECTS AND THE COASTAL
8 WATERS WE'RE REALLY GLAD THAT WE FINALLY HAVE OUR MASTER WATER
9 POLICY DOCUMENT ADDRESSING CLIMATE CHANGE AND MAKING PEOPLE
10 APPLY FOR PERMITS TO THINK ABOUT CLIMATE CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE.
11 REGIONAL BOARD HAS CONTRIBUTED TO SEVERAL LONG-RANGE PLANNING
12 EFFORTS RELATED TO SHORELINE, CLIMATE RESILIENCE AND SEVERAL
13 PARTNERSHIPS, THE DEBATE AT CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT
14 COMMISSION, JESSICA FAIN CAME TO THE BOARD MEETING RECENTLY TO
15 PRESENT ON THAT, AND WE HAVE WORKED ON THE BAY AREA REGIONAL
16 COLLABORATIVE THESE PARTNERSHIPS HELP ADDRESS AND DEVELOPED
17 ROADMAP FOR HOW THE BAY AREA IS GOING TO ADAPT FASTER AND
18 BETTER AND MORE EQUITABLY FOR THE RISING BAY, AND WE'RE
19 LOOKING AT THROUGH THE LENS OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
20 ADDRESSING DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES, COMMUNITIES, BUSINESSES,
21 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND NATURAL HAD BEEN AT THAT AT THAT TIMES
22 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA PLANNING EFFORTS SUPPORT THE
23 FOUNDATION OF LOCAL COMMUNITIES IN THE BAY AREA TO IDENTIFY
24 AND SECURE FUNDING FOR PROJECTS THAT WILL ADDRESS AND PROTECT
25 FROM SEA LEVEL RISE AND OTHER CLIMATE IMPACTS. AND AS YOU



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 HEARD, SEVERAL OF THE AGENCIES HAVE BEEN SUCCESSFUL IN GETTING
2 FUNDING AND A LOT OF THOSE WHO APPLY FOR THESE GRANT
3 OPPORTUNITIES, THEY ARE LOOKING FOR THIS REGIONAL
4 COLLABORATION. WE ARE FORTUNATE TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE WITH
5 THESE VERY PROGRESSIVE GROUPS IN THE BAY AREA, BCDC, BARC, AND
6 THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP AND OTHERS TO HELP
7 ADVANCE THE CLIMATE CHANGE EFFORTS OF THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE
8 PLEASE. THE OTHERS THING THE REGIONAL BOARD HAS BEEN DOING IS
9 USING VARIOUS REGULATORY TOOLS TO REQUIRE VARIOUS FACILITIES
10 SUCH AS WASTEWATER PLANTS, BAY FILL, AND CLEAN UP SITES TO
11 CONDUCT VULNERABILITY ASSESSMENTS AND PREPARE ADAPTATION
12 PLANS. WE DON'T WANT TO KNOW THAT 37 WASTEWATER UTILITIES IN
13 THE BAY AREA BURYING THEIR HEADS IN THE SAND, FORTUNATELY THE
14 BAY AREA IS PROGRESSIVE WHEN IT COMES TO CLIMATE CHANGE, BUT
15 BY REQUIRING CONDUCT AND VULNERABILITY ASSESSMENTS AND MAKE
16 THEM AWARE OF TIME FRAME FOR 30 YEARS AS TIME TO START
17 PLANNING THE DESIGN, AND IMPROVEMENTS. THE BOARD IS REQUIRING
18 ALL THE WASTEWATER UTILITIES IN THE BAY AREA TO CONDUCT A
19 REGIONAL EVALUATION OF OPPORTUNITIES FOR RECYCLED WATER AND
20 INFORMING THE NEXT PLAN OF HOW MUCH RECYCLED WATER PROJECTS WE
21 CAN DEVELOP IN THE BAY AREA TO MEET THE NEEDS OF CALIFORNIA IN
22 THE BAY AREA WITH THE HOTTER DRYER CLIMATE BEGINNING TO THINK
23 ABOUT CLIMATE CHANGE AND TAKING ACTION AND WE'RE USING OUR
24 VARIOUS TOOLS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WITH REGARD TO OUR MUNICIPAL
25 STORM WATER PERMIT, WE ISSUE THAT EARLIER THIS YEAR AND IT



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 ALLOWS MULTI-BENEFIT DISTRICT OR REGIONAL SCALE PROJECTS
2 RECOGNIZING SUCH PROJECTS CAN REQUIRE MORE COORDINATION AND
3 PLANNING. THE PERMIT ALSO HAS FLEXIBILITY TO SUPPORT THOSE
4 PROJECTS INCLUDING ALLOWING ADDITIONAL TIME FOR THOSE TO BE
5 IMPLEMENTED UP TO FIVE YEARS. AND THESE PROJECTS INCLUDE STORM
6 WATER CAPTURE AND NON-POTABLE USE SUCH AS TAKING STORM WATER
7 AND USING FOR IRRIGATION OR TOILET FLUSH THAT DISPLACES
8 POTABLE USE AND ADDITIONAL CLIMATE RESILIENCE BENEFITS LIKE
9 REDUCING THE URBAN HEAT ISLAND EFFECT. WE ARE AWARE THAT
10 REGION TWO HAS CLAY SOILS SO WE HAVE LIMITED FILTRATION
11 CAPACITY COMPARED TO OTHER PARTS OF CALIFORNIA. MOST
12 FILTRATION GEOLOGY IN THE BAY AREA IS BEING USED BY WATER
13 DISTRICTS FOR AQUIFER RECHARGE TO GET WATER INTO THE GROUND WE
14 RECOGNIZE WE HAVE LIMITED OPPORTUNITY AND WANT TO CONVEY TO
15 THE PUBLIC. WE HEAR WHAT'S HAPPENING IN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
16 WITH STORM WATER CAPTURE AND WE NEED TO EXPLAIN THE
17 DIFFERENCES IN THE GEOGRAPHY HERE IN THE BAY AREA. OUR LONG-
18 TERM GREEN WATER STORM WATER INFRASTRUCTURE PLANNING REQUIRING
19 OUR PERMITTING TO FURTHER DEVELOP THE EXISTING GREEN STORM
20 WATER INFRASTRUCTURE PLAN AND DESCRIBES HOW THEY'RE SHIFTING
21 FROM DRAINAGE SYSTEMS FROM GRAY TO GREEN OVER THE COMING
22 DECADES AND OUR MRPP MUNICIPAL PERMIT THAT WE ISSUED INCLUDING
23 FLEXIBILITY FOR PERMITTEES TO COORDINATE WITH OTHER CLIMATE
24 RESILIENCE EFFORTS IN THE FIVE YEAR PERMIT TERM GOING TO BE
25 REQUIRED TO SUBMIT INFORMATION TO HELP ESTABLISH



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 IMPLEMENTATION REQUIREMENTS THAT WILL BE USED FOR FUTURE
2 IMPLEMENTATION PLANNING NOW IS THE TIME TO BE DOING THE
3 PLANNING AND ADDRESS FUNDING NEEDED TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES.
4 NEXT SLIDE. KEY ASPECTS OF OUR REGION'S CREEK AND WETLAND FILL
5 PROGRAM CLEAN WATER ACT SECTION 401 WATER QUALITY PROGRAM
6 INCLUDING ADAPTATION, ESTUARY RISING TIDES, USING APPROPRIATE
7 INFRASTRUCTURE SUCH AS TIDAL MARSH, SHALLOW SLOPED ECO TERM
8 LEVEES AND RESTORATION AND MAINTENANCE OF SAN FRANCISCO BAY
9 AREA WETLAND HAPPEN AT THAT TIME, URBANIZED AREA EXPERIENCE
10 WITH CLIMATE CHANGE, WATER BOARDS CALIFORNIA FISH AND WILDLIFE
11 CORP OF ENGINEERS U.S. WILDLIFE SERVICES CDC, US EPA AND
12 OTHERS TO FACILITATE SAN FRANCISCO BAY SHORELINE WETLAND
13 RESTORATION TO ADAPT PROJECTED SEA LEVEL RISE AND COORDINATING
14 ON A REGIONAL BASIS WITH THE BAY AREA FLOOD PROTECTION
15 AGENCIES AND COASTAL HAZARDS ADAPTATION RESILIENCE,
16 COORDINATING BENEFICIAL REUSE OF SEDIMENT TO RESTORE THE BAY
17 WETLANDS AND ADDRESS RISING TIDES AND HELP ESTABLISH THE
18 WETLAND REGIONAL MONITORING PROGRAM SO WE CAN TRACK HOW WE AS
19 A REGION ARE ACHIEVING OUR TIDAL RESTORATION GOALS. THAT'S
20 SOMETHING WE'RE WORKING ON. AS YOU CAN SEE HERE ON THE SLIDE
21 ALL THE DIFFERENT GROUPS WE'RE WORKING WITH IT'S GREAT IN THE
22 BAY AREA TO HAVE SUCH ENGAGED AGENCIES WORKING COLLABORATIVELY
23 TOGETHER TO ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE, RISING SEA LEVELS. SO,
24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND NOW, I WANT TO SWITCH MORE TO HOW WE AT
25 THE REGIONAL BOARD ARE TRYING TO SUPPORT THE GOVERNOR'S WATER



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 SUPPLY STRATEGY WITH CLIMATE CHANGE. SO WE'RE DOING IT THROUGH
2 OUR WATER RECYCLING PROGRAM, SUPPORTED OFF-CAMPUS AND DISTRICT
3 SCALE WATER RECYCLE PROJECTS. JUST TO GIVE PERSPECTIVE, ABOUT
4 10% OF WASTEWATER FLOWS ARE RECYCLED IN THE BAY AREA AND WE
5 SEE THAT INCREASING WITH TIME, ESPECIALLY AS WE CONTINUE WITH
6 MORE DROUGHTS. AND THEN WE'RE COORDINATING WITH THE STATE
7 DIVISION DRINKING WATER TO AUTHORIZE PROJECTS SUCH AS
8 MICROSOFT, GOOGLE, FACEBOOK, AND OTHERS WHICH ARE CAPTURING
9 AND TREATING GRAY WATER RUNOFF FOR NON-POTABLE USE USING FOR
10 IRRIGATION AND TOILET FLUSHING WHICH REDUCES THE NEED FOR
11 POTABLE WATER. AND WE'RE TRYING TO DO A LOT OF OUTREACH AND
12 COORDINATION AS SB 966 SHIFTS THE PERMITTING AUTHORITY FROM
13 THE STATE TO THE LOCAL AGENCIES BUT ALL THE LOCAL AGENCIES
14 AREN'T EVEN AWARE OF IT AND SO WE'RE TRYING TO DO OUTREACH AND
15 COORDINATION SO THE NEW PERMITTING PROCESS DOES NOT DELAY
16 IMPLEMENTATION OF RECYCLED WATER PROJECTS. BECAUSE WITH THE
17 GOVERNOR'S PLAN WE'RE TRYING TO BRING RECYCLED WATER PROJECTS
18 ON AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE KNOWING THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH A
19 WATER SUPPLY SHORTAGE IN CALIFORNIA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO,
20 THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY REGION IS HOME AS YOU KNOW, TO OVER 7
21 MILLION RESIDENTS AND THEY USE ABOUT 1.5 MIL, AN ACRE FOOT PER
22 YEAR, IN NORMAL WATER YEARS, AND THE WATER SUPPLY ABOUT 20%
23 COMES FROM GROUNDWATER BUT INCREASES SIGNIFICANTLY DURING
24 DROUGHT YEARS AND THERE IS 35 DIFFERENT GROUNDWATER BASINS IN
25 THE BAY AREA AND THERE IS 1200 SUPPLY WELLS. IS SO WE'RE



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 MAKING SURE THOSE SUPPLY WELLS ARE BEING PROTECTED AND LOOKING
2 AT IMPACTS OF WHAT WE CAN DO TO CONTINUE TO PROTECT THEM WITH
3 SEA LEVEL RISE AND POTENTIAL GROUNDWATER MOVEMENT AND
4 POTENTIAL MOBILITY OF CONTAMINANTS. SO, NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
5 SO, WHAT WE HAVE DONE IS WE HAVE DEVELOPED SUSTAINABLE
6 GROUNDWATER MANAGEMENT TEAM WE'RE ENGAGING WITH THE LOCAL
7 AGENCIES WE'RE HELPING THEM EVALUATE THE BASELINE CONDITIONS
8 OF THE GROUNDS WATER BASING AND DOCUMENTING THOSE FINDINGS AND
9 THEN DEVELOPING RECOMMENDATIONS SO EITHER TO PROTECT THE
10 GROUNDWATER BASIN OR IF WE NEED SOME, SORT OF, WATER SUPPLY
11 TREATMENT TO TREAT CONTAMINATED BASINS LOOKING AT THAT AND
12 IDENTIFYING THAT AND TRYING TO IDENTIFY FUNDING. AND THEN NEXT
13 SLIDE PLEASE. AND A LOT OF YOU ARE PROBABLY AWARE AT THE
14 SUSTAINABLE GROUNDWATER MANAGEMENT ACT WHICH SUPPLIES BASIC
15 PRIORITIZATION, GROUNDWATER USE CONTINUING GROUNDWATER
16 DROUGHTS WORSENING ASSOCIATED WITH CLIMATE CHANGE
17 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND FUTURE THREATS TO WATER SUPPLY
18 INFRASTRUCTURE ALL SUGGEST ADDITIONAL PRIORITIZATION LENS IS
19 NEEDED AND WE'RE CREATING FRAMEWORK TO SUPPORT LOOKING AT
20 EVERYTHING THROUGHOUT LENS OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND
21 FOCUSING AND PRIORITIZING THE GROUNDWATER BASINS IN AREAS
22 THAT NEED WORK IN DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND WE'RE WORKING
23 WITH TEAMS TO LOOK AT WHICH ONES NEED TO BE PROTECTED AS FAR
24 AS WATER SUPPLY WELLS WHERE CHEMICAL CONTAMINANT HAS EXCEEDED
25 A DRINKING WATER STANDARD. SO WE'RE WORKING COLLABORATIVELY TO



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 PROTECT GROUNDWATER AS IT'S PART OF OUR SOLUTION AS MEETING
2 THE NEEDS OF WATER FOR CALIFORNIA IN THE FUTURE. AND THE OTHER
3 THING OUR TEAM IS DOING, MANAGING THE AQUIFER PERMITTING
4 PROJECTS, I'LL DISCUSS THAT IN THE NEXT SLIDE. AQUIFER
5 RECHARGE IS AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT SUSTAINABLE GROUNDWATER
6 MANAGEMENT AND TYPICALLY LOCAL ORGANIZATIONS USE PERCOLATION
7 PONDS SPREADING BASINS IN STREAM RECHARGE AND OCCASIONALLY
8 INJECTION WELLS TO RECHARGE, WE PERMIT THESE CHARGE PROJECTS
9 WHEN THE SOURCE WATER CONTAINS POTENTIAL CONTAMINANTS SUCH AS
10 TREATED WASTEWATER CAPTURED STORM WATER OR DISINFECTED TREATED
11 DRINKING WATER. AND THIS IS IMPORTANT PART OF OUR PORTFOLIO OF
12 DEMAND FOR WATER IN THE FUTURE MAKING SURE WE'RE PROTECTING
13 OUR GROUNDWATER BASINS AND PART OF A PLACE TO STORE WATER
14 [INDISCERNIBLE] MORE IN CALIFORNIA. AND AS WE LOOK IN THE
15 FUTURE FOR RECYCLED WATER, A LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES ARE TAKING
16 RECYCLED WATER, PUTTING IN [INDISCERNIBLE] AND SERVING IT AS
17 POTABLE WATER. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT A COUPLE OF
18 PROJECTS. PERMIT AQUIFER STORAGE RECOVERY PILOT PROJECT IN
19 SONOMA COUNTY A GREAT PILOT PROJECT ABLE TO DETERMINE FROM
20 THIS PILOT PROJECT ADEQUATE CAPACITY STORED WATER, CONFIRMING
21 WATER QUALITY NOW THEY'RE GOING TO EXPAND THIS GROUNDWATER
22 PROJECT WHICH WILL HELP PREPARE THEM TO BE BETTER AND MORE
23 RESILIENT TO DROUGHTS. AND ANOTHER PROJECT WE HAVE DONE IN THE
24 BAY AREA NEXT SLIDE PLEASE IS WITH EAST BAY MUNICIPAL UTILITY
25 DISTRICT AND IT'S A PERMANENT AQUIFER STORAGE AND RECOVERY



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 PROJECT WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO PUT EXTRA WATER INTO THE
2 GROUNDWATER BASIN IN WET YEARS AND IN THE DRY YEARS THEY'RE
3 GOING TO BE ABLE TO PULL THIS WATER OUT. RIGHT NOW PERMITTING
4 FOR EMERGENCY USE FOR DROUGHT SUPPLY GOAL IS TO EXPAND FROM 1
5 MILLION GALLONS PER DAY TO 10 MILLION GALLONS PER DAY WE'RE
6 WORKING WITH WATER UTILITIES TO HELP LOOK BEYOND TYPICAL WAYS
7 OF SERVING WATER AND LOOKING AT WHAT WE'RE DOING HERE IN THE
8 BAY AREA SO WE CAN HAVE A MORE RESILIENT WATER SUPPLY. I WANT
9 TO TALK ABOUT COLLABORATION, BEING KEY TO WHAT THIS MEETING IS
10 ABOUT. COLLABORATING, I ENJOYED HEARING UPDATES FROM THE
11 VARIOUS AGENCIES THIS MORNING AND REALLY AS WE ADDRESS CLIMATE
12 CHANGE PROTECTING SAN FRANCISCO BAY SHORELINES, DEALING WITH
13 RISING TIDES GROUNDWATER AND ALSO MAKING SURE CALIFORNIA HAS A
14 RESILIENT WATER SUPPLY FOR THE FUTURE IS REALLY COLLABORATION,
15 WORKING WITH THE SCIENTISTS, THE REGULATORS, THE NON-PROFITS
16 THE VARIOUS STATE AGENCIES, STORM WATER AGENCIES, DRINKING
17 WATER, WATER -- WASTEWATER AGENCIES. AND SO I'M HAPPY TO BE
18 PART OF THIS MEETING TODAY AND TO COLLABORATE WITH ALL OF US,
19 ESPECIALLY AS WE LOOK TO CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER TO ADDRESS
20 CLIMATE CHANGE. AND THEN, FINALLY MY LAST SLIDE. IS REALLY
21 ABOUT HOW CALIFORNIA IS GOING TO MEET THE NEEDS OF WATER IN
22 THE FUTURE. AND WITHOUT WATER, WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE OUR
23 WONDERFUL SAN FRANCISCO BAY. AND WE NEED TO HAVE A THRIVING
24 ECONOMY AND AS WE LOOK TO THE FUTURE AND THINK BIG, I THINK WE
25 NEED TO THINK ABOUT ONE WATER, INTEGRATED INCLUSIVE APPROACH



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 TO THE WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT WHERE ALL WATER HAS AN
2 INTRINSIC VALUE TO ENVIRONMENT. LOOKING AT THE WATER CYCLE
3 THAT WE LEARNED IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, DRINKING WATER,
4 WASTEWATER, STORM WATER, AND ENGINEERED WETLANDS ALL COME
5 TOGETHER IN HARMONY AS ENGINEERS, WILDLIFE, AND ENVIRONMENT
6 ARE COMMON GOALS SHARED BY THE COMMISSION WITH ONE WATER. I
7 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU AS WE ADDRESS CLIMATE
8 CHANGE IN THE NEXT SEVERAL DECADES. THANK YOU.

9

10 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** EILEEN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT SUPERB
11 PRESENTATION. AS YOU KNOW MARK TWAIN SAID IN CALIFORNIA WHISKY
12 YOU DRINK WATER, YOU WANT TO FIGHT OVER, AND I THINK YOU HAVE
13 BROUGHT A NEW LEVEL TO THAT QUOTE, AND SAY WATER, WE ARE GOING
14 TO COOPERATE OVER THAT I THINK YOUR KEY POINT IS WORKING WITH
15 OUR CONTRA COSTA COUNTY WITH THE CENTRAL CONTRA COSTA SANITARY
16 DISTRICT UTILIZING SOME EXISTING OLD PIPING STRUCTURE, AND
17 UTILITIES TO RECYCLE WATER, AQUIFERS WE HAVE TO KEEP THEM
18 ALIVE BECAUSE IF THEY LOSE WATER THOSE MEMBRANES ARE SO
19 DELICATE, WE LOSE THAT CAPACITY. THANK YOU. THIS GROUP HAS
20 REALLY DONE A LOT IN TERMS OF THOSE EFFORTS SO THANK YOU SO
21 MUCH FOR THAT REPORT. THERE WAS SO MUCH THERE. AND A LOT OF
22 GOOD WORK HERE. I HEAR THESE REPORTS, AND ALWAYS THINK, GOSH,
23 I WISH THERE WAS A WAY TO GET THESE KINDS OF REPORTS OUT TO
24 THE SCHOOL COMMUNITIES BECAUSE THIS IS THE KIND OF THING THAT
25 STUDENTS ARE SO INTERESTED AND CONCERNED ABOUT THE FUTURE OF



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 OUR WORLD AND ENVIRONMENT HEARING THE KIND OF WORK THAT THIS
2 REPORT REPRESENTS, I THINK COULD BE SO INSPIRING TO THEM. SO,
3 THANK YOU. WITH THAT, I WILL WANT TO TURN TO THE BOARD FOR ANY
4 QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE. AND I SEE DIRECTOR WAGENKNECHT WITH
5 HIS HAND UP. BRAD?

6

7 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** THANK YOU. YES I DO. ARE YOU GOING TO SEND
8 OUT THESE SLIDES? IT WAS A GOOD GRAPHIC PRESENTATION OF WHAT
9 THE WATER SITUATION IS.

10

11 **EILEEN WHITE:** SURE. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE THIS.

12

13 **BRAD WAGENKNECHT:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **EILEEN WHITE:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** GREAT. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
18 ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MADAM CHAIR, WE HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC
21 COMMENT. AND I'M NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. GREAT. OKAY. WELL, WITH THAT, WE WILL
24 COMPLETE THIS ITEM. AND, AGAIN, EILEEN, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR
25 THAT SUPERB PRESENTATION. YOU KNOW, IT HAD A LOT OF IMPORTANT



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 DETAIL IN T SO I'M GLAD THAT WE'RE GOING TO GET THE SLIDES.
2 BECAUSE THERE WAS A LOT OF FANTASTIC INFORMATION THAT YOU
3 PRESENTED, AND THAT I THINK SPEAKS TO, AS YOU POINTED OUT, THE
4 IMPORTANCE OF THE COLLABORATION OF ALL THE WORK WE'RE DOING
5 TOGETHER WITH REGARDS TO WATER AND RESILIENCY AND CLIMATE
6 CHANGE. SO, THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH. WITH THAT, WE HAVE THE
7 PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. AND DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE
8 PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT DURING THIS TIME, EITHER IN
9 PERSON, OR IN WRITING?

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I'M NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED.

12

13 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. WELL, THANK YOU, THEN. WITH THAT, I
14 WILL CLOSE THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. MOVING TO OUR NEXT ITEM
15 WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT. AND THAT MEETING WILL BE DECEMBER 21ST,
16 2022 AT 1005. AND EXPECT THAT THAT WILL BE A BRIEF MEETING TO
17 TAKE CARE OF THE RESOLUTIONS THAT WE NEED, TO AND THEN WE WILL
18 HAVE OUR NEXT MEETING IN JANUARY.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** MADAM CHAIR, JUST A CORRECTION. I HAD A
21 TYPO IN THERE. IT'S DECEMBER 16TH.

22

23 **AMY WORTH, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. DECEMBER 16TH, WE WILL SEE
24 YOU ALL THEN. HAVE A WONDERFUL THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY, AND THANK



NOVEMBER 18, 2022

1 YOU ALL FOR YOUR GREAT CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE REGION AND BEING
2 HERE TOGETHER TODAY. MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37



Broadcasting Government