



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 16, 2022 9:35 AM**

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS NICK JOSEFOWITZ. I'M THE VICE CHAIR OF MTC, DEPUTIZING FOR CHAIR PEDROZA WHO IS AT A CSAC MEETING. AND I'M GOING TO CALL THE SPECIAL JOINT MEETING OF MTC AND BAHFA TO ORDER. IF WE COULD PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP  
2 TO DATE.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. KIMBERLY, CALL  
5 AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR  
8 JOSEFOWITZ?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY? IS ABSENT.

25 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER EL -- I'M SORRY. I'M GOING  
5 TO MUTE WHO I THINK IT IS THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY  
6 IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING? COMMISSIONER FLEMING WAS IN  
7 THE ATTENDEES. SHE IS CALLING IN BY PHONE. COMMISSIONER  
8 GIACOPINI?

9

10 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT.  
13 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

14

15 **SAM LICCARDO:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

18

19 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?  
22 IS CONNECTING TO AUDIO. I SEE THAT SHE IS HERE. COMMISSIONER  
23 RABBIT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

3

4 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE. SORRY. I WAS ON THE BUS.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING IS ABSENT?

7 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

8

9 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GREAT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. I THINK WE SHOULD GIVE TWO

14 VOTES IF THEY'RE ON A BUS DURING A MEETING.

15

16 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** DO WE WANT TO MOVE THE COMMISSIONER

19 OVER TO PANELIST?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** IF SHE WANTS TO SPEAK I WILL UNMUTE HER.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** THANKS. AGENDA ITEM TWO,

24 COMMISSIONER WORTH, IF YOU WILL LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE OF

25 ALLEGIANCE?





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** THAT WOULD BE AN HONOR, MR. CHAIR. ALL RIGHT. [  
3 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE  
4 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT  
5 STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND  
6 JUSTICE FOR ALL."

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH,  
9 COMMISSIONER WORTH. KIMBERLY, COULD YOU READ THE COMPENSATION  
10 ANNOUNCEMENT?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SURE. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM  
13 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD  
14 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING  
15 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS  
16 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR  
17 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO  
20 AGENDA ITEM FOUR. THE JOINT MTC AND BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR.  
21 KATHLEEN, CAN WE DO THESE TOGETHER?

22

23 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I WAS HAVING TROUBLE UNMUTING. YES YOU CAN.

24





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOTION FOR APPROVE FOR MTC AND  
2 BAHFA CONSENT CALENDARS TOGETHER?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THEY BE CONSIDERED  
5 TOGETHER.

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND THAT. COMMISSIONED ARE WORTH.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES AND  
10 WORTH SECONDS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR  
19 JOSEFOWITZ?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT.  
24 COMMISSIONER AHN?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY? IS ABSENT.

12 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? AND I DON'T SEE

17 HER ON THE ATTENDEE SIDE. I'M GOING MARK HER ABSENT.

18 COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

23

24 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

10

11 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT.

14 COMMISSIONER SPERING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

15

16 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

19 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM

22 FIVE, THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER

23 SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SO I'M GOING TO -- THE REPORT IS THAT THE

24 BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MET OCTOBER 13TH AND REFERS THE

25 FOLLOWING FOR APPROVAL BAHFA RESOLUTION NUMBER 20 APPOINTMENT





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 OF NINE MEMBERS TO SERVE ON THE BAHFA ADVISORY COMMITTEE. AND  
2 SO I MOVE APPROVAL OF THAT RESOLUTION. AND DO I HAVE A SECOND?

3

4 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND, WORTH.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, COMMISSIONER  
7 WORTH. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
11 ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR  
16 JOSEFOWITZ?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. AHN?

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1     **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

2

3     **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

4

5     **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

6

7     **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
8     VERNACI?

9

10    **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

11

12    **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT.  
13    COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

14

15    **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

16

17    **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

18

19    **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

20

21    **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

22

23    **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25    **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

5

6 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT.

9 COMMISSIONER SPERING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

10

11 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

14 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM

17 SIX, PUBLIC COMMENT FOR BAHFA. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT

18 FOR BAHFA?

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

22 ON THIS ITEM.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AND IN THE BOARDROOM?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NOTHING HERE. CHAIR.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM  
4 SEVEN. WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN BAHFA AND THE BAHFA AUTHORITY IS  
5 NOW ADJOURNED. AND WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE WITH THE MTC  
6 AGENDA. AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, VICE CHAIR'S REPORT. STAFF HAS  
7 IDENTIFIED THE NEED TO HAVE SPECIAL MEETINGS ON WEDNESDAY  
8 DECEMBER 14TH BEFORE THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED COMMITTEE  
9 MEETINGS TO ADOPT A.B. 361 RESOLUTIONS. IF YOU HAVE NOT  
10 ALREADY RESPONDED TO THE COMMISSION SECRETARY, KIMBERLY,  
11 PLEASE DO SO AS SOON AS POSSIBLE SO WE CAN ESTABLISH WHETHER A  
12 QUORUM OF THE COMMISSION, AND THE AUTHORITY, WILL BE PRESENT.  
13 THE 2023 STANDING COMMITTEE SCHEDULE WAS DISTRIBUTED BY THE  
14 COMMISSION SECRETARY AS A HANDOUT PRESUMABLY ALSO E-MAIL, AND  
15 PLEASE REVIEW THE SCHEDULE, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING YOU  
16 IN 2023. IT WAS SENT OUT IN AN E-MAIL, KIMBERLY? I TOTALLY  
17 MISSED IT. 2457 IS CORRECT.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MAYBE YOU COULD SEND IT OUT AGAIN.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I MOST CERTAINLY WILL.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NINE. IS  
24 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE CHAIR'S REPORT?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO HAND RAISED FOR THE CHAIR'S  
2 REPORT. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, AND WITH  
3 REGARDS TO ITEM NUMBER NINE, RANDI KINMAN HIS LET US KNOW THAT  
4 SHE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO GIVE THE REPORT, BUT MAY STEP IN LATER  
5 IN THE MEETING. HOWEVER, SHE DID SEND IN A LETTER OF  
6 CORRESPONDENCE THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND  
7 WAS DISTRIBUTED BY E-MAIL TO THE COMMISSION LAST NIGHT.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. ANY PUBLIC  
10 COMMENT ON THAT?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO HANDS RAISED AND NO ADDITIONAL  
13 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TERRIFIC. MOVING ON TO ITEM TEN,  
16 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT. DIRECTOR MCMILLAN?

17

18 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, VICE CHAIR. I ALSO WANT  
19 TO THANK KIMBERLY. JUST BECAUSE SHE IS AMAZING AND ALWAYS ON  
20 TOP OF KEEPING US IN LINE. SO THAT'S A GOOD THING.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IN TERMS OF WHAT HAS BEEN HAPPENING, I WAS A  
25 MEMBER OF A PANEL ON NOVEMBER 1ST, THE TRANSPORTATION





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 EMERGENCY DISASTER PREPAREDNESS AND RECOVERY ASSEMBLY HEARING  
2 -- A LONG TITLE -- WHERE IT WAS CHAIRED BY ASSEMBLYWOMAN LORI  
3 WILSON, WHOM MANY OF YOU KNOW WAS A MEMBER OF OUR ABAG HOUSING  
4 COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR A LONG TIME, AND  
5 ALSO ASSEMBLYWOMAN MIA BANTA WAS PRESENT, AND IT WAS A REVIEW  
6 OF HOW WE ARE PREPARED TO DEAL WITH DISASTERS ON LAND, SEA,  
7 AND IN THE AIR, BASICALLY. AND I WAS HONORED TO BE ABLE TO  
8 PRESENT WHAT THE BAY AREA HAS DONE IN THIS SPACE. CERTAINLY, A  
9 LONG LEGACY, LARGELY BEGINNING AFTER LOMA PRIETA, AS YOU ALL  
10 WELL KNOW, BUT REFINED OVER MANY DECADES AND INCLUDING MOST  
11 RECENTLY A LOT OF LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE FIRES THAT HAD  
12 RAVAGED OUR REGION AND MUCH OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. SO, WE --  
13 IT WAS AN INFORMATIONAL HEARING, AND I WANT TO THANK, ALSO,  
14 MTC'S EMERGENCY RESPONSE LEAD, STEVEN TARIN WHOEVER'S ALSO  
15 PRESENT TO ADDRESS QUESTIONS. SO THAT WAS A NICE OPPORTUNITY  
16 TO SHOWCASE WHAT WE HAVE DONE IN THAT ARENA. ALSO, YOU KNOW,  
17 MOVING QUICKLY, WE'LL BE HEARING ABOUT REAP 2.0. WE WILL  
18 REQUEST APPROVAL TO APPLY FOR NEARLY \$103 MILLION IN FORMULA  
19 BASED STATE FUNDING THROUGH THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING  
20 GRANTS OF 2021. AND, AGAIN, MANY THANKS TO THE GOVERNOR AND  
21 THE LEGISLATURE FOR, YOU KNOW, ALLOWING US TO HAVE, YET, MORE  
22 CRITICAL PLANNING FUNDING BOTH FOR HOUSING AND FOR  
23 TRANSPORTATION. SO, YOU WILL HEAR MORE ABOUT THAT. THAT WAS  
24 PRESENTED, I BELIEVE, AT OUR PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE. CLIPPER  
25 BAY PASS PROGRAM, WE HAVE EXPANDED THE ELIGIBILITY OF THE





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 PROGRAM TO STUDY THE IMPACT OF A SINGLE PASS THAT WILL PROVIDE  
2 UP TO 50,000 BAY AREA RESIDENTS FREE ACCESS TO NEARLY ALL BUS,  
3 RAIL, AND FERRY SERVICES IN THE NINE COUNTY REGION, AND WE  
4 HAVE RECENTLY WORKED, COMMISSIONER RABBIT, WITH THE SANTA ROSA  
5 COMMUNITY COLLEGE TO BE ABLE TO EXPAND THAT TO INCLUDE A  
6 LONGER TERM THERE FOR THE STUDENTS REGISTER. WE HAVE GOTTEN  
7 INITIALLY INCREDIBLY POSITIVE RESPONSES TO THIS PILOT. WE'RE  
8 COLLECTING DATA, AND WE'LL BE ABLE TO REPORT, YOU KNOW, THE  
9 OUTCOMES OF THAT. A VERY IMPORTANT PIECE OF OUR FARE  
10 INTEGRATION WORK BEING CONDUCTED UNDER OUR TRANSIT  
11 TRANSFORMATIVE ACTION PLAN. I'M TRYING TO AVOID ACRONYMS HERE.  
12 AND, AGAIN, SOMETHING THAT WE, OUR CUSTOMER BASE SEEMS TO,  
13 THOSE WHO ARE USING IT, REALLY VALUE. I WANT TO THANK  
14 COMMISSIONER DORENE M. GIACOPINI, WHO, OCTOBER 19TH WAS PART  
15 OF A METRO TALKS ACCESS FOR ALL WEBINAR. WE HOLD METRO TALKS  
16 PERIODICALLY ON A NUMBER OF EQUITY RELATED BUSINESS IS, AND WE  
17 DISCUSSED AT THAT TIME WHY EQUITY REQUIRES THAT PUBLIC  
18 AGENCIES DESIGN FOR PEOPLE WITH THE BIGGEST BARRIERS TO  
19 ACCESS, OUR MOBILITY IMPAIRED FELLOW TRAVELERS, AND, WHY, IN  
20 DOING THAT, YOU MAKE THE BETTER SYSTEM FOR EVERYONE. AGAIN,  
21 MANY THANKS TO COMMISSIONER JOCK PIN I FOR PARTICIPATING  
22 THERE. AND FINALLY WE HAVE BEEN PROVIDING INFORMATION TO YOU  
23 ALTHOUGH YOU ARE PROBABLY ON TOP OF THIS AS MUCH AS ANYONE, ON  
24 THE MID-TERM ELECTION RESULTS AND HOW THEY MANIFEST THEMSELVES





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 IN TERMS OF CHANGES WITHIN OUR REGION. SO, YOU KNOW, WITH  
2 THAT, MR. CHAIR, I WILL TURN IT BACK TO YOU. THANK YOU.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO WE HAVE ANY  
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
8 HANDS RAISED, BUT I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I DO SEE  
9 --

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** UH-HUH.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO MTC STAFF FOR WORKING  
16 THROUGH SENATOR ROSA JC ESPECIALLY ALIX BOCKELMAN AND WILLIAM  
17 BACON, I RECEIVED A NICE NOTE FROM FRANK CHONG PRESIDENT OF  
18 SANTA ROSA, I'LL READ THE NOTE IT'S SO REFRESHING TO WORK WITH  
19 A PUBLIC AGENCY THAT NOT ONLY LISTENS BUT IS ALSO RESPONSIVE  
20 TO ITS CONSTITUENTS. A BIG THANK YOU FOR WORKING THROUGH ON  
21 THAT, AND MAKING SURE THE PROGRAM IS GOING TO WORK BEST FOR  
22 THE INSTITUTIONS AS WELL. SO, THANK YOU.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** LET'S PUT THAT ON THE FRONT DOOR.

25 OKAY. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM 11. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. ARE





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1   THERE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. MOVING ON TO  
2   AGENDA ITEM 12, WHICH IS THE MTC ONLY CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH  
3   INCLUDES ITEMS 12A THROUGH 12E. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A  
4   SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR? SORRY. COMMISSIONER  
5   CHAVEZ?

6

7   **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M HAPPY TO MOVE APPROVAL OF THE  
8   CONSENT CALENDAR. I DO HAVE QUESTIONS ON ITEM 12A. AND SO I  
9   DIDN'T KNOW IF IT WOULD BE MORE APPROPRIATE TO PULL IT OFF, OR  
10   JUST ASK MY QUESTIONS AND THEN THE STAFF CAN LET ME KNOW IF  
11   IT'S A SHORT ANSWER OR A LONG ANSWER.

12

13   **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GO AHEAD. WHY DON'T YOU ASK YOUR  
14   QUESTIONS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

15

16   **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AS PART OF ITEM 12A, I WANT TO NOTE FOR THE  
17   RECORD THAT THE AMENDED COUNTY-WIDE TRANSPORTATION PLAN THERE  
18   IS SOME LANGUAGE IN IT THAT MAKES ME CONCERNED THAT WE, AS  
19   THOSE TRANSPORTATION PLANS ARE ADOPTED, AREN'T OBLIGATED TO  
20   LIMIT WHAT WE APPLY FOR AT A STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL. AND, I -  
21   - IF THE STAFF COULD LET ME KNOW. AND ON PAGE SIX UNDER  
22   SECTION FIVE THE GUIDELINES CALL IN EVALUATE STRATEGY  
23   ALIGNMENT WITH FEDERAL STATE REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAM  
24   OBJECTIVES IN ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS AND SECTION SEVEN  
25   COORDINATE WITH CITIES TRANSIT OPERATORS WITHIN THE COUNTY





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 PREPARE LIST OF TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AND THIS MAY BE  
2 STANDARD LANGUAGE, BUT I WANTED TO BE SURE ABOUT THE  
3 FLEXIBILITY TO BE OPPORTUNISTIC WHEN FUNDS WERE AVAILABLE.

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I BELIEVE THE FLEXIBILITY EXISTS WE WANT TO  
6 SEE PROJECTS IN THE COUNTY-WIDE PLAN WE WANT TO SEE  
7 COORDINATION BUT IT DOES NOT LIMIT THE ABILITY TO APPLY FOR  
8 PROJECTS IS MY UNDERSTANDING. SO, AND ADAM NOELTING IS HERE. I  
9 THINK HE CAN CONFIRM THAT.

10

11 **ADAM NOELTING:** IN TERMS OF THE COUNTY-WIDE TRANSPORTATION  
12 PLAN, THE MORE LOCAL PROCESS DOES IDENTIFY A LIST OF PROJECTS  
13 FOR US TO CONSIDER IN OUR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND  
14 ONCE THOSE PROJECTS ARE CONSIDERED ARE INCLUDED IN THE  
15 REGIONAL PLAN THEN THE REGION -- THEN THE AGENCY HAS  
16 OPPORTUNITY TO FUND THOSE PROJECTS. THAT'S ONE OF THE  
17 REQUIREMENTS FOR FUNDING FOR PROJECTS IN THE REGION IS  
18 INCLUSION IN THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** MEANING GETTING RESOURCES THROUGH MTC?

21

22 **ADAM NOELTING:** THAT'S CORRECT.

23





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** GOT IT. THIS IS IN RELATION TO AN ISSUE THAT  
2 MAYOR LICCARDO RAISED A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO. SO I WANTED TO  
3 MAKE SURE WE WERE BEING CONSISTENT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ,  
6 ARE YOU OKAY KEEPING IT IN -- OKAY. GREAT. COMMISSIONER  
7 LICCARDO?

8

9 **SAM LICCARDO:** I APPRECIATE SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ RAISING THAT  
10 ISSUE. I WANTED TO ACTUALLY RAISE A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT ONE ON  
11 THE SAME ITEM IF I COULD. REALLY A QUESTION FOR STAFF ABOUT  
12 THE OPPORTUNITY THAT THESE GUIDELINES MIGHT PRESENT FOR MTC TO  
13 TRY TO INDUCE A BETTER CONNECTION BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION AND  
14 USE PLANNING. AND, REALLY, JUST A QUESTION FOR STAFF ABOUT,  
15 YOU KNOW, IT SEEMS AS THOUGH THERE ARE LOTS OF BAD INCENTIVES  
16 OUT THERE FOR BAD PLANNING. WE KNOW THERE IS A LOT OF FISCAL  
17 INCENTIVES FOR JOBS HEAVY CITIES TO PRECLUDE HOUSING  
18 DEVELOPMENT FOR EXAMPLE, THE LACK OF ALIGNMENT BETWEEN  
19 DEVELOPMENT AND INCENTIVES IN GOOD PLANNING AND I THINK THERE  
20 IS FAR TOO GOOD EXPECTATION WHEN PROJECTS GET BUILT, FOR  
21 EXAMPLE, A LARGE JOB CENTER OF SOME KIND, OFFICE TOWERS, LARGE  
22 PUBLIC AMENITY OF SOME KIND THAT IF IT GETS BUILT THE TRANSIT  
23 WILL FOLLOW AND OF COURSE WE ALL CAN'T TAX OUR RESIDENTS AT  
24 THAT FAST ENOUGH RATE TO CHASE THE BAD PLANNING. I WONDER IF  
25 WE HAVE IN PLACE STATE REQUIREMENTS THAT EVERY JURISDICTION





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 MEASURE AND MITIGATE FOR VMT IMPACTS OF DEVELOPMENT. IS THERE  
2 ANY OPPORTUNITY, EITHER THROUGH THIS PROCESS, AND THESE  
3 GUIDELINES, OR IN ANOTHER MECHANISM FOR MTC TO START TO  
4 REQUIRE A COUNTY, A CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AGENCIES, TO  
5 ACTUALLY START TO CONDITION FUNDING, VARIOUS KINDS, ON  
6 ENSURING THAT NEW DEVELOPMENT DOESN'T EXACERBATE IMBALANCES IN  
7 JOBS OR HOUSING, OR EXACERBATE VMT. AND I GUESS THE QUESTION  
8 IS, IS THIS ONE OF THOSE OPPORTUNITIES, WITH THESE GUIDELINES?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WHO WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THAT?

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** I KNOW THAT'S A LOADED QUESTION. I'M SORRY.

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, AND  
15 PERHAPS ALIX WOULD LIKE TO JUMP IN. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, I  
16 THINK WHAT YOU HAVE RAISED IS A MUCH BROADER CONCERN AND FOCUS  
17 FOR THE AGENCY JUST BEYOND THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION PLAN.  
18 JUST A NOTE IT'S ONE OF MANY PLACES WHERE WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO  
19 CONSIDER. AS YOU ALL WELL KNOW WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING AS BAY  
20 BODY, OBAG FOUR, AND YOU KNOW, AND THE TOC TRANSIT ORIENTED  
21 COMMUNITIES POLICY AND ITS ROLE, WHICH WAS INTENTIONALLY VERY  
22 MUCH DIRECTED IN THAT SPACE. SO, I THINK WHAT I WOULD SUGGEST  
23 IS WE BE ABLE TO TAKE YOUR QUESTION AND LOOK MORE BROADLY  
24 ACROSS THE PALATE OF THOSE TOUCH POINTS AND REALLY LOOK AT  
25 WHERE THE MOST OPPORTUNE AREAS ARE TO BE CONSISTENT AND





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 APPROACH IT IN AS THE COORDINATED FASHION AS WE CAN. AND I  
2 DON'T KNOW IF ALIX OR OTHERS WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THAT.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU THERESE. I WOULD ADD, WE  
5 SIGNIFICANTLY MODERNIZE THE GUIDELINES FOR THE COUNTY-WIDE  
6 TRANSPORTATION PLAN. I THINK IT WAS THE LAST UPDATE, AND WE  
7 CONTINUE TO REFINE IT, AND, REALLY, WE DO LEAN INS ON THE  
8 IMPORTANCE OF IMPROVING THE ALIGNMENT OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL  
9 LAND USE AND HOUSING PLANNING AS, SORT OF, A VERY IMPORTANT  
10 PART OF THE COUNTY-WIDE PLAN. SO WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO FOLLOW  
11 UP WITH YOU MORE. I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS YOU SAID MAYBE WAS  
12 DEFINITELY, AN ADDITIONAL STEP, WHICH THESE PLANS DO NOT  
13 CONTEMPLATE IN TERMS OF THE CONDITIONING OF FUNDS AT THE LOCAL  
14 LEVEL, BUT CERTAINLY WE ARE TRYING TO ADDRESS ALL OF THE  
15 CHALLENGES AROUND GETTING THE LAND USE CORRECT, REDUCING VMT,  
16 AND REALLY LEAN IN ON, SORT OF, THE IMPORTANT POLICIES THAT  
17 ARE IN THE STATE'S CLIMATE ACTION PLAN, ET CETERA. SO, THOSE  
18 ARE VERY IMPORTANT PARTS OF THE POLICIES.

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANKS ALIX. AND THANKS THERESE. AND I  
21 APPRECIATE IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S PRETTY BROAD AND SOMETHING  
22 HARD TO TAKE IN ONE BITE. I GUESS, YOU KNOW, ANTICIPATION  
23 ABOUT THIS MORE AND MORE, I JUST THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, CITIES  
24 HAVE CONTROL OVER OUR LAND USE. WE'RE TOUCHING A BIT ON THE  
25 THIRD RAIL. WE KNOW WHERE OUR TRAFFIC PROBLEMS CAME FROM, 99





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 CITIES AND TOWNS ALL MAKING UP THEIR OWN RULES AROUND  
2 DEVELOPMENT THAT DON'T NECESSARILY ALIGN WITH NOTIONS OF GOOD  
3 DEVELOPMENT, AND ALIGN WITH DEVELOPMENT OF TRANSPORTATION. I  
4 CAN'T HELP BUT THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE GREATER FINANCIAL FISK  
5 FISCAL INCENTIVES FOR CITIES TO DO. SINCE ALL THE OTHER FISCAL  
6 INCENTIVES SEEM TO BE IN ALIGNED THE OTHER WAY. RIGHT NOW.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THERE WAS COMMITMENT BY STAFF TO  
9 EXPLORE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PUT IN PLACE, HOW TO THINK ABOUT  
10 TRANSIT PRIORITY INVESTMENTS IN THE CONTEXT OF THESE  
11 GUIDELINES. ALIX, WOULD YOU LIKE TO ALSO, SORT OF, FOR THE  
12 COMMISSION'S INFORMATION, SHARE WHAT WAS -- WAS THE STAFF  
13 COMMITMENT ON THAT?

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YES. WE WERE GOING TO RETURN AND WORK WITH THE  
16 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES TO SEE IF WE COULD ADD MORE  
17 AROUND TRANSIT PRIORITY, BUT TRANSIT PRIORITY, AND, REALLY,  
18 HAVE MORE LINKS IN THESE COUNTY-WIDE TRANSPORTATION PLANS ON  
19 THAT IMPORTANT PRIORITY FOR THE REGION, FOR THE CUSTOMER. SO  
20 WE WERE GOING TO RETURN AND SEE IF THERE WERE SOME  
21 MODIFICATIONS AND AMENDMENTS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO PROPOSE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.  
24 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. CHAIR. OH, CAN YOU HEAR  
2 ME? OKAY. SORRY ABOUT THAT. YEAH. AND I JUST WANT TO, PLEASE,  
3 ACKNOWLEDGE, NOT EVERY JURISDICTION CITIZEN SAME HERE. FROM A  
4 JURISDICTION THAT HAS HIGH, HIGH TRANSIT, AND A HOUSING/JOBS  
5 IMBALANCE, WE CAN'T UNIVERSALLY DETERMINE. AND, YES, WE HAVE  
6 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE EXTREMELY HIGH JOBS AND NEED TO DO THE  
7 HOUSING AND WE'RE TRYING TO BRING ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER  
8 HERE. LET'S BE CAREFUL. WE DO WANT PEOPLE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT,  
9 AND THE PIECES HAVE TO FIT TOGETHER. IT'S NOT JUST ONE THING  
10 OR THE OTHER. IT'S REALLY PUTTING EVERYTHING TOGETHER SO THAT  
11 WE CAN MOVE PEOPLE TO AND FROM THEIR HOMES AND THEIR JOBS. AND  
12 JURISDICTIONS ARE UNIQUE. SO, LET'S KEEP THAT IN MIND AS WE  
13 PROGRESS. BECAUSE WE WANT ALL THIS TO WORK. WE REALLY, REALLY  
14 DO. AND IF YOU JUST BUILD HOUSING AND NOT, YOU KNOW, WORRY  
15 ABOUT THE ACCESS AND IN AND OUT AND ALL OF THAT, IT BECOMES  
16 VERY PROBLEMATIC. SO, JUST, PLEASE, LET'S BE CONSIDERATE AND  
17 GET ON THE SAME PAGE HERE. PUTTING THE PIECES TOGETHER IS THE  
18 MOST IMPORTANT ASPECT. THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. OKAY.  
21 DO I HAVE ANY -- IF THERE ARE NO OTHER COMMENTS, DO I HAVE A  
22 MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO MOVED, CHAVEZ.

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **HILLARY RONEN:** SECOND, RONEN.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOVED CHAVEZ. SECOND RONEN. IS  
4 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC.  
7 JAYNE KRAEMER IS IN THE BOARDROOM. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO GO TO  
8 THE PODIUM, I WILL START THE TIMER. 90 SECONDS, MR. CHAIR?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEP.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GOT IT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SO, LAST TIME I SAID, IN YOUR EFFORTS TO CREATE A  
15 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM REGION-WISE, THAT YOU WANTED TO LOOK FOR  
16 LOCAL PERSONS WHO WERE CREATIVE. AND I THOUGHT ABOUT THAT. AND  
17 I ADDED TWO OTHER THOUGHTS. THAT LOCAL PERSON SHOULD BE A  
18 GADFLY, IS PUTTING THOSE QUALITIES TOGETHER, YOU WANT TO ADD  
19 OR IMMERSE YOURSELF IN THAT DIALOGUE. BECAUSE PART OF, FROM MY  
20 PERSPECTIVE, PART OF YOUR JOB IS TO PRESENT A NEW PERSPECTIVE  
21 THAT THE COMMUNITY MAY NOT HAVE THOUGHT OF, BUT MIGHT VERY  
22 WELL BE WILLING TO INVESTIGATE. OR, IF NOT, YOU NEED TO THINK  
23 ABOUT HOW TO PRESENT A NEW THOUGHT, AND THEREFORE, NEW  
24 ALTERNATIVES TO THAT COMMUNITY, SO IT WOULD BE ACCEPTABLE TO  
25 THEM TO DISCUSS. THAT'S IT.





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, LET'S TAKE  
3 A ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SURE. CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE  
6 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT.  
11 COMMISSIONER AHN?

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY? IS ABSENT.

24 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

25





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT.

4 COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

5

6 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

9

10 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

21

22 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT.

25 COMMISSIONER SPERING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
5 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TERRIFIC. OKAY. LET'S MOVE ON TO  
8 AGENDA ITEM 13, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. AND  
9 CHAIR RABBIT, IF YOU WOULD GIVE US THE REPORT?

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND PUT UP WITH ME, I HAVE  
12 A LITTLE BIT OF A COLD. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS MET  
13 NOVEMBER 9TH, 2022 AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING TO THE COMMISSION  
14 FOR APPROVAL FIRST AGENDA ITEM 13A MTC RESOLUTION 4411 REVISED  
15 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE GOODS MOVEMENT AND MITIGATION PROGRAM  
16 AMENDMENT. THIS ADOPTS THE RM3 PROGRAMMING AMENDMENT WITHIN  
17 THE GOODS MOVEMENT AND MITIGATION PROGRAM CATEGORY. I SO MOVE  
18 APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4411 REVISED.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONER  
23 PAPAN. COMMENTS?

24





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M GOING TO SUPPORT THE MOTION, AND IN JULY I  
2 REQUESTED AN ANALYSIS FOR MTC'S EXPRESS LANE FOR RM3 POT UPON  
3 MONEY AND WANTED TO GET AN UPDATE ON WHEN THAT WOULD BE COMING  
4 FORWARD.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.  
7 HOPEFULLY STAFF WILL GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT. ANY PUBLIC  
8 COMMENT?

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
12 ON THIS ITEM. AND CONFIRMING WITH THE BOARDROOM, THERE ARE ANY  
13 RAISED HANDS THERE?

14

15 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NO, MADAM SECRETARY.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, MR. FREMIER.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** JOSEFOWITZ YES.

24





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT.

2 COMMISSIONER AHN?

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES .

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

19 IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

20

21 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

24

25 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING IS ABSENT.  
15 WORTH?

16

17 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
20 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT:** AGENDA ITEM 13B MTC RESOLUTION 4548 REGIONAL  
25 EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT OR REAP TWO, PROGRAM FULL





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 ALLOCATION REQUESTS THIS. ADOPTS RESOLUTION NUMBER 4548  
2 AUTHORIZING MTC TO SUBMIT ALLOCATION REQUEST TO CALIFORNIA  
3 DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FOR \$102.8  
4 MILLION IN REAP TWO FORMULA FUNDS. AND I SO MOVE APPROVAL OF  
5 MTC RESOLUTION 4548.

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL SECOND.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOVED BY RABBIT. SECONDED BY  
10 CANEPA. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, IS THAT A NEW HAND OR AN OLD  
11 HAND?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** JUST ONE SECOND. I WANTED TO MAKE SURE. ON THIS  
14 ITEM, REALLY, I WAS MORE CURIOUS ABOUT THIS BEING REALLOCATED  
15 -- IS THIS RELATIVELY NEW MONEY FOR US TO ACCESS THROUGH MTC  
16 AS THE LEAD AGENCY?

17

18 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES, IT IS.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NEW. AND SO WILL THIS BE THE FIRST TIME WE'RE  
21 DOING THIS? OR SECOND OR THIRD? I JUST CAN'T -- I'LL TELL YOU  
22 WHY I'M TRYING TO GET MY ARMS AROUND IT IN JUST A SEC.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I HAVE BEEN TRYING TO COME UP WITH  
25 A GOOD REAP AND SOW JOKE. BUT I HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO.





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE OF MY QUESTIONS IS JUST THAT, GIVEN THE  
3 URGENCY AROUND INFILL HOUSING, AND THE WAY MONEY IS BEING  
4 ALLOCATED, ONE OF THE THINGS I'M A LITTLE CONCERNED ABOUT IS  
5 HOW WE ACTUALLY MAKE SURE THAT HOUSING GETS IN THE GROUND AND  
6 HOW, AS A -- AS MTC, THAT WE'RE GOING TO -- WE'RE GOING TO BE  
7 ASSESSING THE INVESTMENTS THAT ARE MADE OUT OF POTS THAT WE  
8 ADVOCATE FOR.

9

10 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WHY DON'T WE FOLLOW UP, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ,  
11 AND BE ABLE TO PROVIDE YOU ONE-ON-ONE FEEDBACK ON THAT. ONE OF  
12 THE THINGS THAT I MAYBE WOULD JUST LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT HERE, AND  
13 IT WAS A BIG PART OF THE PRESENTATION THAT WAS MADE TO THE  
14 COMMITTEE IS, WE'RE LOOKING -- AND STAFF CAN CORRECT ME IF I  
15 AM WRONG -- BUT WE'RE LOOKING TO LEVERAGE THIS REAP 2.0  
16 AGAINST OTHER FUND SOURCES AND ACCOMPLISHING ACCOMMODATING  
17 REAL OUTCOMES, HOUSING RELATED, CLIMATE RELATES, MOBILITY  
18 RELATED, AND TRYING TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE FACT THAT IT IS  
19 RELATIVELY FLEXIBLE MONEY WE COULD PACKAGE TO RECEIVE CERTAIN  
20 OUTCOMES ALIX?

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YOU WERE PROBABLY REMEMBERING REAP 1.0 AND  
23 THIS IS REAP 2.0. REAP FUNDING WENT TO COUNCILS OF  
24 GOVERNMENTS, THE REAP 1.0 WAS A SMALLER AMOUNT, 24 MILLION  
25 WENT TO ABAG AND THAT WAS FUNDS USED FOR THE TECHNICAL





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM THOSE FUNDS WERE PLANNING ORIENTED AND THIS  
2 SECOND ROUND OF REAP FUNDS ACTUALLY GOES TO THE METROPOLITAN  
3 PLANNING ORGANIZATION, SO IT GOES TO MTC. IT IS A LARGER  
4 AMOUNT OF MONEY. IT'S SIX HUNDREDS MILLION STATEWIDE, 103  
5 MILLION FOR THIS REGION, AND IT DOES HAVE A BROADER  
6 ELIGIBILITY THAT CAN, INCLUDING COMPLETED -- INCLUDING HOUSING  
7 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND ALSO REDUCING VMT, AND REALLY LOOKING AT  
8 EQUITY, INCLUDING FAIR HOUSING. SO, IT'S A GREAT RESOURCE TO  
9 HAVE. BUT THIS IS THE FIRST TIME THAT WE HAVE THIS, WHAT IS  
10 ONE -- RIGHT NOW, ONE-TIME SOURCE OF FUNDING. HOPEFULLY IT CAN  
11 BECOME -- CAN BE REPEATED IN THE FUTURE.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** GOT IT. AND I GUESS -- THAT'S SUPER HELPFUL, AND  
14 YOU'RE RIGHT. DID I CONFUSE THE TWO, AND WEARING ANOTHER HAT,  
15 ALL TOGETHER. SO THANK YOU FOR REMINDING ME OF THAT. ONE  
16 THING, AND I APPRECIATE, ALSO, THE POINT THAT WAS MADE BY  
17 DIRECTOR MCMILLAN ABOUT THE MONEY BEING, HOPEFULLY SOMETHING  
18 THAT CAN BE LEVERAGED TO FURTHER OUTCOMES, AND THEN, ALIX, I  
19 THINK WE ALWAYS WANT THE ONE TIME TO BE ONGOING. WHAT WAS  
20 PARTICULARLY INTERESTING TO ME ABOUT THE -- THIS AVAILABLE  
21 FUNDING IS THAT IT -- I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE OVERALL AMOUNT  
22 OF MONEY THAT IS GETTING SET-ASIDE FOR PLANNING VERSUS US  
23 ACTUALLY HAVING SOME INFRASTRUCTURE IN OUR COMMUNITIES THAT  
24 PEOPLE CAN POINT TO AND SAY, WOW, THAT'S -- WE'RE SEEING  
25 HOUSING, OR WE'RE SEEING SOME OTHER RESOURCE FOR THE





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 COMMUNITY. AND THAT'S REALLY, AS YOU ALL ARE THINKING ABOUT  
2 THE PROJECTS, I HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW IF WE HAVE THE GROUPS THAT  
3 ARE READY TO ROLL, OR ARE INTERESTED IN IMPLEMENTATION, THAT  
4 WE'RE TAKING A GOOD LOOK AT THAT. I RECOGNIZE FOR SOME CITIES  
5 THEY STILL DON'T HAVE ENOUGH OF THE PLANNING MONEY, AND THAT  
6 MAY BE WORTH US THINK THROUGH AND THAT GOES BACK TO THE POINT  
7 THAT MAYOR LICCARDO RAISED AROUND THE INCENTIVES. YOU KNOW?  
8 HOW WE HELP WITH THE INCENTIVES. BECAUSE I REALLY THINK IT IS  
9 ABOUT THAT FOR MOST OF OUR COMMUNITY. AND TO THE POINT EARLIER  
10 ABOUT EVERY CITY BEING SO UNIQUE. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. AND  
11 THAT'S REALLY, AS YOU ALL ARE THINKING ABOUT THE PROJECTS, I  
12 HOPE THAT, YOU KNOW, IF WE HAVE A GROUP THAT ARE READY TO  
13 ROLL, YOU KNOW, OR ARE INTERESTED IN --

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK RANDI KINMAN IS UNMUTED.

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I RECOGNIZE.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, ONE THING, WE DEFINITELY  
20 AGREE THIS MONEY, WE WANT INVESTED IN IMPLEMENTATION. SO THE  
21 PROPOSAL BEFORE YOU HAS ONLY 5 MILLION OUT OF THE 103 MILLION  
22 FOR PLANNING, AND REALLY, THE BULK, ALL OF THE FUNDING THAT'S  
23 GOING TO THE GROWTH FRAMEWORK IMPLEMENTATION WHICH IS 58  
24 MILLION. I KNOW KATE IS HERE AND A LOT OF THAT IS REALLY GOING  
25 TO HELP THROUGH MANY OF THE INITIATIVES THAT BAHFA IS LEADING,





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 AND REALLY THEY ARE VERY FOCUSED ON IMPLEMENTATION. SO, I JUST  
2 WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU HAD THAT INFORMATION.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. SO, I HAVE FORGOT WHO MADE A  
5 MOTION. WHO SECONDED THE MOTION.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA WAS THE SECONDS.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA. SO  
10 COMMISSIONER RABBIT MADE THE MOTION. COMMISSIONER CANEPA  
11 SECONDED IT. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
14 THEIR HANDS RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR  
15 THIS ITEM.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SURE. CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE  
20 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

23





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT.  
2 COMMISSIONER AHN? COMMISSIONER AHN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER  
3 CANEPA?

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY? IS ABSENT.

12 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT.

17 COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

9

10 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING IS ABSENT. SCHAFF IS ABSENT.

13 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

18 PRESENT.

19

20 **EDDIE AHN:** PLEASE RECORD MY AYE VOTE. SORRY FOR MISSING.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER AHN.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOVING TO ITEM 14, PUBLIC COMMENT

25 AND OTHER BUSINESS. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.





NOVEMBER 16, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I RECEIVED THREE LETTERS OF  
3 CORRESPONDENCE THAT HAVE BEEN POSTED ONLINE TO THE AGENDA AND  
4 DISTRIBUTED TO THE COMMISSIONERS LAST NIGHT, FIRST FROM SALLY  
5 WILKINSON MAYOR OF CITY OF BELVEDERE, AND ERIC, MAYOR CITY OF  
6 NOVATO, AND STEPHANIE HELL MAN MAYOR FROM FAIRFAX, AND I SEE  
7 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ANY IN THE  
8 BOARDROOM?

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NONE HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF MTC TO BE  
15 HELD WEDNESDAY DECEMBER 21ST, 2022 WITH SPECIAL MEETING ON  
16 DECEMBER 14TH ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED  
17 TO THE PUBLIC. [ADJOURNED]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31





*Broadcasting Government*