

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD**

3 **MONDAY, NOVEMBER 21, 2022 1:30 PM**

4

5 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANK YOU. BROADCASTING TEAM. WHY DON'T WE CALL
6 THAT MEETING TO ORDER AND CAN WE DO A CALL, MADAME CLERK.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

9

10 **CHAIR POWERS:** ROLL CALL.

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES. CHAIR POWERS.

13

14 **ELIZABETH YURA:**

15

16 **CHAIR POWERS:** HERE.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** BOARD MEMBER MAU.

19

20 **VICE CHAIR MAU:** HERE.

21

22 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER HURSH IS ABSENT. MEMBER KRANDA.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **BETH KRANDA:** HERE.

2

3 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** HERE.

4

5 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

6

7 **JESS THOMAS:** HERE.

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WE HAVE A QUORUM. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR POWERS:** CAN WE GET THE BROADCASTING TEAM TO PLAY THE
12 MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT, MADAME CLERK. [RECORDED MEETING
13 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT]

14

15 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, BROADCASTING TEAM. ALL RIGHT.

16 MADAME CLERK, I MIGHT HAVE THE WENT OUT OF ORDER THERE BUT WE

17 DID THE MEETING INVITE OR THE MEETING --

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** A TANNED EVER ATTENDANCE.

20

21 **CHAIR POWERS:** QUORUM AND WE DO HAVE A QUORUM ON 1 AND 2. LET'S

22 GO TO CONSENT I'M 2A. THIS IS A CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS AN

23 ACTION ITEM. AND THIS IS THE MEETING MINUTES FROM THE OCTOBER

24 17 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE MEETING, AND AGAIN THIS IS AN ACTION



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION ON THIS TO APPROVE THE MEETING
2 MINUTES?

3

4 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SO MOVED, TUMLIN.

5

6 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** SECOND MCMILLAN.

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** WE HAVE A MOTION FROM TUMLIN AND A
9 SECOND FROM MCMILAN. MADAME CLERK, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT, EITHER
10 RECEIVED AHEAD OF THIS TIME OR ARE RAISING THEIR HAND NOW?

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE'S NO PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR THIS
13 ITEM.

14

15 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANK YOU. ANY DISCUSSIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE
16 MEMBERS ON THIS? OKAY. SEEING NONE, MADAME CLERK, CAN WE GO TO
17 A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** CHAIR POWERS.

20

21 **CHAIR POWERS:** YES.

22

23 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MAU.

24

25 **VICE CHAIR MAU:** YES.



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER CHURCHILL.

3

4 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER GONOT.

7

8 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** AYE.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER BAIG.

11

12 **AHSAN BAIG:** YES.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER KRANDA.

15

16 **BETH KRANDA:** YES.

17

18 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** YES.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER MULLIGAN:

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** AYE.

23

24 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER TUMLIN.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES.

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
4 MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANK YOU, MADAME CLERK. THAT MOVES US TO ON
7 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 3, AND THIS AGAIN IS AN ACTION ITEM AND
8 THIS IS A CHANGE ORDER FOR CLIPPER CARDS TO THE CLIPPER
9 CONTRACT FOR THE PURCHASE OF CARDS FOR CUBIC. AND SO,
10 JENNIFER, ARE YOU GOING TO LEAD US IN A BRIEF PRESENTATION ON
11 THIS DATA SET?

12

13 **JENNIFER LARGAESPADA:** YES, I WILL. GOOD AFTERNOON.

14

15 **CHAIR POWERS:** GOOD AFTERNOON, MA'AM.

16

17 **JENNIFER LARGAESPADA:** ALL RIGHT. SO WE ACTUALLY DID BRING AN
18 ITEM IDENTICAL TO THIS LAST MONTH. THIS IS A SEPARATE AND NEW
19 REQUEST, AND AS CONTEXT FOR THE REQUEST, WITH THE UPDATED
20 SCHEDULE FOR C2 THAT WILL BE DISCUSSED LATER IN THIS AGENDA,
21 STAFF IS ANTICIPATING THAT ADDITIONAL CARDS WILL BE NEEDED
22 PRIOR TO THE TRANSITION TO C2 CARDS. DEMAND CONTINUES TO
23 REMAIN HIGH WITH THE PROGRAM ISSUING ABOUT 175 NEW ADULT CARDS
24 EACH MONTH. SO THIS CHANGE ORDER AMENDMENT IS INTENDED TO
25 PURCHASE APPROXIMATELY 750,000 CARDS AND SHOULD BRIDGE THE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 ADDITIONAL MONTHS UNTIL THE SYSTEMS WHICH IS OVER TO THE C2
2 FARE MEDIA. SO THE FUNDS IN THIS CHANGE ORDER AMENDMENT WERE
3 CONTEMPLATED IN THE TWO-YEAR BUDGET AND WORK PLAN, WHICH WAS
4 APPROVED IN MAY 2022, AND THE FUNDS FOR THE PROPOSED CHANGE
5 ORDER AMENDMENT ARE CURRENTLY AVAILABLE IN THE CLIPPER CARD
6 FEE ACCOUNT. SO STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE BOARD APPROVE A
7 CLIPPER CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER AMENDMENT WITH CUBIC NAN IN AN
8 AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$2 MILLION TO PRODUCE CLIPPER CARDS FOR
9 DISTRIBUTION.

10

11 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, JENNIFER. MADAME
12 CLERK, HOW ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER RECEIVED OR RAISING
13 THEIR HAND NOW?

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS ONE PUBLIC COMMENT THAT RAISED
16 A HAND. THERE IS NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE ITEM.

17

18 **CHAIR POWERS:** WHY DON'T WE PROCEED TO PUBLIC COMMENT, AND
19 LET'S GO TWO MINUTES, MADAME CLERK.

20

21 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** OKAY. ALITA DUPREE, AND I'M GOING TO
22 SHARE SCREEN FOR THE TIMER. ALITA, ARE YOU READY TO SPEAK?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** YES, I AM. THANK YOU, CHAIR. FOR THE RECORD MY
25 PRONOUNS ARE SHE AND HER. THIS IS A VERY, VERY IMPORTANT



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 POINT, AND I HOPE THAT WE CAN GET AHEAD OF THE SUPPLY CHAIN
2 ISSUES. YES, WE CAN DO THE DIRECT DEPOSIT AND SEND IN THE
3 MONEY. I THINK WE DO HAVE TO LOOK AT WHEN THESE CARDS ARE
4 GOING TO ARRIVE SO WE CAN MAKE SURE WE FILL THE GAP, AND AS
5 MUCH AS I LIKE MOBILE TICKETING, NOT EVERYBODY HAS PHONES.
6 SOME PEOPLE DON'T WANT TO USE THEIR PHONES. MAYBE THEY'RE
7 AFRAID THAT THEIR PHONE IS GOING TO RUN OUT OF BATTERY. I GET
8 IT. AND THE CARDS ARE PART OF MOVING FORWARD IN THE WORK OF
9 CLIPPER BECAUSE THEY STILL ALLOW THE PUBLIC TO TAKE ADVANTAGE
10 OF THE FULL SUITE OF PROGRAMS THAT CLIPPER OFFERS, ESPECIALLY
11 PAPER TICKETING ON BART THAT'S HAPPENING AT THE SAN FRANCISCO
12 AIRPORT STATION WHICH INVOLVES A SURCHARGE THAT IS CHARGED TO
13 ANYBODY WHO USES THESE PAPER TICKETS. SO I'M IN SUPPORT OF
14 THIS AND I HOPE THAT THIS CONTRACT WILL GET THE CARDS QUICKLY
15 SO WE CAN REACH OUT TO MORE PEOPLE AND THAT ALL OF OUR SYSTEMS
16 CAN MOVE TOWARD 100% CLIPPER SYSTEM. LET'S MAKE IT HAPPEN AND
17 GET THE CARDS IN OUR HONDAS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
20 COMMENTS. MORE RAISED HANDS.

21

22 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANKS, MADAME CLERK. LET US GO TO
23 COMMENTARY FROM THE MEMBERSHIP. WHY DON'T WE START WITH MEMBER
24 MULLIGAN.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I'M SUPPORTIVE ITEM.
2 I JUST HAD ONE QUESTION. THE STAFF REPORT AND JENNIFER, YOUR
3 PRESENTATION REFERRED TO THIS WILL GET US THROUGH THE CLIPPER
4 2.0. AND MY QUESTION IS WILL THE SAME FARE MEDIA WORK IN
5 CLIPPER 2.0 OR WILL PEOPLE HAVE TO SWITCH?

6

7 **JENNIFER LARGAESPADA:** IT WILL WORK IN CLIPPER 2.0 BUT
8 EVENTUALLY WE WILL BE SWITCHING TO A DIFFERENT CHIP, SO -- BUT
9 EVERYTHING CAN BE BROUGHT FORWARD INTO THE NEW SYSTEM.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. OTHER COMMENTARY, OBSERVATIONS FROM
14 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. NOT SEEING ANY, IS THERE A MOTION? AGAIN,
15 THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO MOVE
16 FORWARD?

17

18 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MOVED BY MULLIGAN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR POWERS:** WE HAVE THE MOTION BY MULLIGAN AND A SECOND BY
23 KRANDA. ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION? MADAME CLERK, I AM NOT SEEING
24 ANY, SO WHY DON'T WE GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO THE ROLL CALL VOTE,
25 PLEASE.



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** OKAY. CHAIR POWERS.

3

4 **CHAIR POWERS:** YES.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MAU FOR CHAN.

7

8 **VICE CHAIR MAU:** YES.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER CHURCHILL.

11

12 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER GONOT.

15

16 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YES.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER KRANDA.

19

20 **BETH KRANDA:** YES.

21

22 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** YES.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** AYE.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** AYE.

2

3 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THE MOTION UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
4 PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR POWERS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAME CLERK.
7 MOVING RIGHT ALONG TO ITEM NUMBER 3B, AND THIS IS AGAIN AN
8 ACTION ITEM AND THIS IS A CONTRACT AMENDMENT. IT'S WITH THE
9 IBI GROUP AND THEY ARE THE SYSTEM ADVISER, NOT ONLY TO MTC BUT
10 TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AS WELL, AND THIS IS AN AMOUNTED TO
11 THEIR CONTRACT, AND, JASON, ARE YOU GOING TO WALK US THROUGH
12 THIS SHORT PRESENTATION?

13

14 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YES, I AM. JASON WEINSTEIN, CLIPPER STAFF.
15 THE CONTRACT AWARDED TO IBI IN 2015 ORIGINALLY PROVIDED FOR A
16 CONTRACT PERIOD THROUGH JUNE OF 2020 WITH OPTIONS TO EXTEND
17 THAT CONTRACT TO AN ADDITIONAL TEN YEARS. THIS FLEXIBLE
18 CONTRACT TERM WAS SET UP TO ALLOW MTC AND THE OPERATORS THE
19 OPPORTUNITY TO PERIODICALLY EVALUATE UPCOMING MEANS FOR
20 TECHNICAL ADVISER SUPPORTER FOLLOWING KEY PROCUREMENT, SYSTEM
21 DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION MILESTONES. THE CURRENT CONTRACT HAS
22 BEEN EXTENDED OVER THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS FROM JUNE OF 2020 TO
23 JUNE OF 2023. MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF CONTINUE TO BE SATISFIED
24 WITH IBI'S WORK AND THE IBI TEAM ARE REALLY AN INTEGRAL PART
25 OF THE OVERALL TEAM THAT HELPS DELIVER CLIPPER OR THE NEXT



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 GENERATION CLIPPER. THE PROPOSED CONTRACT AMENDMENT WOULD AOD
2 ROOT YEAR TO IBI'S CONTRACT PERIOD DESCENDING THE PERIOD
3 PERFORMANCE TO JUNE 20 -- 2023 AND WOULD ADD \$1,800,000 FOR
4 IBI SUPPORT THROUGH THAT DATE. THE AMENDMENT WOULD NOT ULTRA
5 THE SCOPE OF IBI SERVICES BUT IS A CONTINUATION OF THEIR
6 CURRENT SCOPE OF WORK. THIS CONTRACT AMENDMENT IS CONTEMPLATED
7 AND INCLUDED IN THE TWO-YEAR CLIPPER BUDGET AND WORK PLAN THIS
8 BOARD APPROVED THIS PAST JUNE AND STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE
9 BOARD APPROVE A CONTRACT AMENDMENT WITH IBI IN AN AMOUNT NOT
10 TO EXCEED \$1,800,000 TO PROVIDE NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM
11 TECHNICAL ADVISORY SUPPORT.

12

13 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, JASON, FOR THAT DATA. LET'S
14 DROP BACK TO MADAME CLERK. PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, ITEM
15 NUMBER 3B?

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT. NOBODY HAS
18 THEIR HAND RAISED AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN WRITING.

19

20 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAME CLERK. WHY DON'T WE GO
21 TO THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS. COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, OBSERVATIONS?
22 WHY DON'T WE START WITH COMMITTEE MEMBER GONOT. CAROLYN.

23

24 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THANK YOU. JASON, I HAD A QUESTION REGARDING
25 SORT OF THE -- IT SEEMS LIKE ALTHOUGH IT'S A CONTINUATION OF



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 THE CURRENT SCOPE FOR THE SAME LEVEL AND SCOPE OF SERVICES, IT
2 SEEMS HIGHER IN THE 1.8 VERSUS THE 1.1 WHICH WE DID IN THE
3 LAST AMENDMENT, SO CAN YOU DETAIL THAT OUT A LITTLE BIT MORE
4 BECAUSE THAT'S ABOUT 50% HIGHER. I'M NOT SURE IT'S THE SAME
5 TIME FRAME OR NOT. THANKS.

6

7 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** IT'S A LITTLE BIT LONGER TIME FRAME BECAUSE
8 WE'RE GOING TO START FROM KIND OF THE BEGINNING OF IT SO IT'S
9 REALLY A YEAR AND A HALF WORTH OF WORK, SO, RIGHT, IF YOU
10 CONSIDER JANUARY OF 2023 ALL THE WAY THROUGH JUNE OF 2024 IS
11 ABOUT AN 18-MONTH PERIOD, BUT THERE IS PLENTY OF WORK THAT'S
12 GOING ON. AND SO WE'RE KIND OF AT A CRITICAL POINT WHERE
13 THERE'S A TON OF THINGS HAPPENING TO GET US TO THAT FINISH
14 LINE WHICH WE'LL BE TALKING MORE ABOUT IN AN INFORMATIONAL
15 ITEM SOON, BUT, I MEAN, I COULD COME --

16

17 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** IT EASY THE MOST RECENT AMENDMENT TO THE
18 CONTRACT IS EFFECTIVE JULY 1, 2021, ADDED \$1.1 MILLION AND
19 THEN IT SAID IT EXTENDED THE PERIOD OF PERFORMANCE TO JUNE 30,
20 2023, BUT NOW YOU'RE SAYING 1.1 ONLY LASTED FOR 18 MONTHS AND
21 NOW WE'RE GOING TO START JANUARY AND GO ANOTHER 18 MONTHS.

22

23 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SAY THE 1.1 LASTED FOR A YEAR AND THE 1.8
24 SHOULD LAST US FOR 18 MONTHS, BUT WE'RE CONSTANTLY HAVING TO
25 JUGGLE IF THAT'S THE EXACT RIGHT AMOUNT OF MONEY. MANY OF THE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 WORK PRODUCTS THAT WE DO WITH IBI, WE TRY TO DO IN A
2 DELIVERABLE-BASED WAY SO THAT WE'RE NOT NECESSARILY CONTINGENT
3 UPON TIME AND MATERIALS, SO THAT REALLY HELPS US CONTROL, BUT,
4 YOU KNOW, NOT EVERYTHING IS COMPLETELY KNOWN, JUST LIKE THE
5 CONTRACT ITSELF, SO WE'RE WORKING THROUGH THIS AS WE GO.

6

7 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** OKAY. THANKS. MAYBE NEXT TIME WE COULD HAVE
8 A LITTLE BIT NOR ON THE DELIVERABLES.

9

10 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE. WE CAN CERTAINLY DO THAT.

11

12 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** BECAUSE IT MAKES IT DIFFICULT TO UNDERSTAND.
13 IT SOUNDS LIKE THEY HAVE TWO YEARS AND IT'S NOT. IT'S A YEAR
14 AND A HALF, WHATEVER, THEN ANOTHER 18 MONTHS. I DON'T KNOW. IF
15 YOU COULD BE A LITTLE MORE CLEAR.

16

17 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE.

18

19 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** DIRECTOR GONOT, THAT \$1.1 MILLION WAS
20 APPROVED ON JULY 1, 2021 WAS INTENDED TO LAST UNTIL JUNE 30,
21 2022. WE'VE MANAGED TO MAKE THAT AMOUNT STRETCH OUT TO LAST
22 AND HAVE US COVERED UNTIL THIS CALENDAR YEAR, AND SO WHEN
23 JASON IS SAYING UP TO 2024, WE EXPECT THAT \$1.8 MILLION TO --
24 IT'S BASICALLY 1.1 AND 1.8 WILL LAST FOR AN ENTIRE THREE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 YEARS. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE? SO WE WERE ABLE TO STRETCH IT OUT
2 TO FULLY BETTER ESTIMATE THE NEXT COMING 18 MONTHS.

3

4 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YEAH. I JUST GOT A LITTLE CONFUSED BECAUSE
5 YOU THE SAID I HAD EXTENDS THE PERIOD OF PERFORMANCE TO JUNE
6 30, 2023. I APPRECIATE THAT.

7

8 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** NO, THE CHALLENGE COMPARING PERFORMANCE CAN
9 BE THERE, BUT IF WE DON'T HAVE ANY MONEY TO SPEND, THEN
10 THERE'S NO MONEY TO SPEND, RIGHT.

11

12 **CHAIR POWERS:** HOLD UP, JASON. GOOD COMMENTS, CAROLYN AND YOUR
13 POINT, THE HIGHER LEVEL POINT BEING A LITTLE BIT MORE ON
14 DELIVERABLES IS IF SOMETHING SIMILAR COMES IN THE FUTURE IS
15 RESONATING WITH ME AS THE CHAIRPERSON, SO I APPRECIATE THAT.
16 CAROL, YOU HAD YOUR HAND RAISED AND THEN DOWN. DO YOU WANT TO
17 WEIGH IN ON THIS OR NO?

18

19 **CAROL KUESTER:** WE CAN CERTAINLY BRING BACK INFORMATION ABOUT
20 THE SPECIFIC DELIVERABLES, ABSOLUTELY. JUST ALSO A PLUG, I
21 JUST WANT TO SAY THAT THE ASSISTANT PROJECT MANAGER IN
22 PARTICULAR FOR IBI HAS JUST BEEN A TREMENDOUS ASSET TO THIS
23 TEAM, SO IT'S JUST A QUALITATIVE ATTAPOY FOR THE STRENGTH OF
24 THE IBI TEAM AND HOW PLEASED WE'VE BEEN WITH THEIR SERVICES.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **CHAIR POWERS:** COPY NAP AGAIN, MEMBER GONOT, GOOD COMMENTS. ANY
2 OTHER MEMBERS WANT TO MAKE COMMENTS, OBSERVATIONS ON THIS
3 ITEM? OKAY. NOT SEEING ANY, MADAME CLERK, WE'RE GOING TO DROP
4 BACK TO YOU, AND IF YOU COULD DO A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

5

6 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** DO YOU NEED A MOTION? I'M MAKE A MOTION.

7

8 **CHAIR POWERS:** WHOA. THAT'S HARSH. WAS THAT THE MTC EXECUTIVE
9 THAT CORRECTED ME I NEED A MOTION? ALL RIGHT. WE NEED A MOTION
10 AND A SECOND.

11

12 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

13

14 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANK YOU, THERESE. SECOND.

15

16 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I'LL SECOND IT. GONOT.

17

18 **CHAIR POWERS:** CAROLYN WILL SENDING IT. THANK YOU, THERESE, FOR
19 KEEPING ME ON POINT HERE. APOLOGIZE FOR THAT. MADAME CLERK,
20 NOW I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. COULD WE GO TO A ROLL CALL
21 VOTE, PLEASE.

22

23 **CLERK:** YES. CHAIR POWERS.

24

25 **CHAIR POWERS:** YES.



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1

2 **CLERK:** MAU FOR MEMBER CHAN.

3

4 **CARTER MAU:** YES.

5

6 **BILL CHURCHILL:** AYE.

7

8 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** AYE.

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** YES.

11

12 **BETH KRANDA:** YES.

13

14 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** YES.

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** AYE.

17

18 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** AYE.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
21 MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR POWERS:** WUI FOR THAT, MADAME CLERK. OKAY. LET US GO TO
24 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 4, AND THERE'S TWO ITEMS HERE. THE FIRST
25 ONE IS 4A, AND THIS IS A -- THIS IS AN UPDATE, THIS IS AN



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 INFORMATIONAL UPDATE AND JASON IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH AND
2 THIS IS AN UPDATE ON KEY DEVELOPMENTS RELATED TO C2, THE NEXT
3 GENERATION CLIPPER 2, AND SO JASON, WHY DON'T YOU WALK THE
4 COMMITTEE THROUGH AN UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER SCHEDULE.

5

6 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. BROADCASTING, COULD
7 WE BRING UP ATTACHMENT A AT THIS TIME. PERFECT. THANK YOU VERY
8 MUCH. ALL RIGHT. SO AS WE NOTED AT OUR LAST MEETING WE SAID
9 WE'D COME BACK TO THIS BOARD WITH AN UPDATED SCHEDULE. AS YOU
10 CAN SEE IN FIGURE 2 HERE WE'RE SHOWING FOR THE FIRST TIME OUR
11 SCHEDULE PROJECTED OUT TO THE START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION IN
12 THE SUMMER OF 2024. THIS TRANSITION DATE REPRESENTS THE MOMENT
13 AT WHICH WE EXPECT TO HAVE THE NEW CLIPPER SYSTEM FULLY
14 OPERATIONAL AND EQUIPMENT INSTALLED ACROSS ALL 23 OPERATORS IN
15 THE BAY AREA. UNFORTUNATELY, THE PROGRAM CONTINUE TO BE
16 HAMPERED BY THE AFTER EFFECTS OF THE PANDEMIC. OUR SYSTEM
17 INTEGRATOR HAS THE SAME MATERIAL AND LABOR ISSUES AS BEING
18 EXPERIENCED GLOBALLY, WHICH HAS RESULTED IN THIS UPDATED
19 SCHEDULE WE'RE SHOWING YOU TODAY. YOU CAN SEE HERE IN FIGURE 1
20 THE SCHEDULE I SHARED WITH BOARD IN AUGUST OF 2022 SHOWING
21 COMPLETION OF THE ACCOUNT BASED SYSTEM TRANSITION IN LATE
22 2023. FIGURE 2 IS A REVISED SCHEDULE INCORPORATING THE
23 CHALLENGES I JUST NOTED THAT SHOWS OUR PROJECTED PATH TO THE
24 CUSTOMER TRANSITION. I WANTED TO DESCRIBE HOW WE GOT FROM
25 FIGURE 1 TO FIGURE 2. NOTE IN FIGURE 1, THE TOP DARK BLUE LINE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 L A B E L E D I N S T A L L I S N O W M O R E D E T A I L E D A N D C A L L E D " E Q U I P M E N T
2 I N S T A L L A T I O N " I N F I G U R E 2 B E L O W . T H E S E C O N D D A R K B L U E L I N E I N
3 F I G U R E 1 U N F O R T U N A T E L Y A L S O L A B E L E D " I N S T A L L " I S N O W M O R E
4 D E T A I L E D A N D B R O K E N D O W N I N T O A C C O U N T - B A S E D S Y S T E M T E S T I N G ,
5 T R A N S I T I O N P I L O T T E S T S , A N D C U S T O M E R T R A N S I T I O N I N F I G U R E 2 .
6 A T T H E S T A R T O F C U S T O M E R T R A N S I T I O N , P A T R O N S W I L L C O N V E R T A L L
7 I N T H E B A C K G R O U N D T O T H E N E W S Y S T E M , E V E N O N T H E I R E X I S T I N G
8 C L I P P E R C A R D S , A S W E M E N T I O N E D E A R L I E R . T H E R E W I L L A L S O B E A
9 N E W M O B I L E A P P , N E W W E B S I T E A N D A L L N E W C U S T O M E R S E R V I C E
10 C E N T E R . C U S T O M E R S C A N E X P E C T F E A T U R E S L I K E F U N D S O N T H E I R
11 C L I P P E R C A R D S A V A I L A B L E I M M E D I A T E L Y , A L L T Y P E S O F C L I P P E R
12 C A R D S , H A V I N G Y O U R C R E D I T C A R D T O P A Y , M A N A G I N G Y O U R F A M I L Y ' S
13 C A R D S I N A S I N G L E A C C O U N T , M O R E C O N V E N I E N T G R O U P T R A V E L , A N D
14 P R O M O T I O N A L O P P O R T U N I T I E S A T P A R T I C I P A T I N G T R A N S I T O P E R A T O R S .
15 S O B E T W E E N N O W A N D C U S T O M E R T R A N S I T I O N W I L L C O N T I N U E T O F O C U S
16 O N I N S T A L L A T I O N O F N E W D E V I C E S , T E S T I N G O F N E W D E V I C E S I N T H E
17 C U R R E N T S Y S T E M , A N D L A B T E S T I N G O F T H E N E W S Y S T E M . L E T M E G I V E
18 Y O U S O M E D E T A I L S O F W H E R E W E A R E A N D T H E T H I N G S -- W H E N T H I N G S
19 W I L L O C C U R . S O S Y S T E M T E S T I N G I S U N D E R W A Y A N D B E I N G V I R T U A L L Y
20 W I T N E S S E D B Y B O T H M T C A N D O P E R A T O R S T A F F . E Q U I P M E N T
21 I N S T A L L A T I O N A R E O N G O I N G I N T H E F I E L D A T M U L T I P L E A G E N C I E S .
22 W E ' V E R E P L A C E D 8 5 P E R C E N T O F T H E C U R R E N T P L A T F O R M D E V I C E S A T
23 R A I L A N D F E R R Y S T A T I O N S A N D E X P E C T T O C O M P L E T E R E P L A C E M E N T O F
24 T H E S E D E V I C E S B Y T H E E N D O F T H I S Y E A R . W E ' V E R E P L A C E D A B O U T
25 1 2 % O F T H E O V E R 8 , 0 0 0 V E H I C L E D E V I C E S I N T H E S Y S T E M A N D T H E S E



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 WILL CONTINUE INTO EARLY 2024. TRANSITION PILOT TEST WILL
2 START IN THE FALL OF 2023. AND COMMERCE TRANSITION, AS I NOTED
3 EARLIER, WILL START IN THE SUMMER OF 2024 A WHICH POINT ALL
4 BUS, RAIL, FERRY AND SALES EQUIPMENT INSTALLED AND TESTED. THE
5 CT BACK OFFICE ACCOUNTS ARE CREATED AND FINANCIAL FUNCTIONS
6 ARE WORKING. THE NEW C2 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER IS
7 OPERATIONAL. NEW C2 CLIPPER CARDS ARE BEING DISTRIBUTED.
8 DISCOUNT PROMS SUCH AS CLIPPER START AND RTC ARE TRANSITIONED.
9 OPEN PAYMENTS IS FUNCTIONAL ACROSS ALL OPERATORS, AND ALL
10 TRAINING IS COMPLETE. SO WE'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH ALL THE
11 CONTRACTORS TO AT A MINIMUM PRESERVE COST OF THE PROGRAMS AS
12 ISSUES ARISE, AND DEVOTING A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF STAFF TIME
13 TRACKING SCHEDULES AND CONSTANTLY COORDINATING CONSTANTLY
14 CHANGING SITUATIONS. AS I STATED IN THE PAST, OUR NUMBER ONE
15 GOAL IS TO MAKE THE ROLL-OUT OF C2 AS SEAMLESS AS POSSIBLE FOR
16 RIDERS. SO I'LL PAUSE THERE FOR A MOMENT.

17

18 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. JASON, THANK YOU FOR THAT. MADAME CLERK,
19 JASON, WE MAY NEED TO CALL THAT BACK UP A SECOND BUT HOLD OFF
20 ON A SECOND WHOEVER IS DRIVER THAT. MADAME CLERK, ON PUBLIC
21 COMMENT, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT AHEAD OF THE
22 MEETING OR ANYBODY RAISED THEIR HAND?

23



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE ARE TWO PUBLIC -- SPEAKERS OF THE
2 PUBLIC THAT HAVE RAISED THEIR HAND AND THERE ARE NO WRITTEN
3 PUBLIC COMMENTS.

4

5 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. MADAME CLERK, THANK YOU FOR THAT. WHY
6 DON'T WE GIVE EACH OF THEM TWO MINUTES.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** OKAY. THAT'S ALITA DUPREE AND THEN ADENA
9 LEVIN AND RAUL MALDENADO.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALITA DUPREE FOR
12 THE RECORD, SHE/HER. THERE'S MY CLOCK. I SPEAK TO YOU SIMPLY
13 AS AN ORDINARY USER OF THE SYSTEMS OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION,
14 AND THANK YOU FOR PUTTING UP THE PHOTOS OF THE NEW READERS,
15 AND I HAVE USED THE NEW READERS ON SOME UNIBUSES. I BELIEVE IT
16 WAS ON THE GARY 38. I MAINTAIN TO YOU THAT THESE NEW READERS
17 GIVE A BETTER VISUAL REPRESENTATION OF THE STATUS OF ONE'S
18 CLIPPER CARD, AND I BELIEVE THAT THE INSTALLATION OF THESE
19 READERS SHOULD BE PRIORITIZED TO THE AC TRANSIT, TRANS BAY
20 ROUTES. BECAUSE THESE ROUTES OF WHICH I USE THE F LINE, F AS
21 IN FRANK, QUITE OFTEN, HAVE A BIFURCATED FARE STRUCTURE A
22 TRANS BAY FARE AND A LOCAL FARE AND BECAUSE THE READERS ON THE
23 TRANS BAY BUSES ARE QUITE OLD, IT IS HARD TO SEE THE STATUS OF
24 THE PRICE THAT IS AVAILABLE FOR THAT FARE WHEN MAKING A TRIP
25 THAT'S EITHER LOCAL OR TRANS BAY. AND THE DRIVER ACTIVATES A



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 SWITCH TO TOGGLE BETWEEN TRANS BAY AND LOCAL FARE, AND IT CAN
2 TAKE SEVERAL SECONDS FOR THAT TO ACTIVATE. AND SO IF ONE IS
3 NOT LOOKING OR A BIG ATTENTION TO THAT, IT COULD RESULT IN AN
4 INCORRECT FARE BEING CHARGED. SO WE SHOULD GET THESE READERS
5 ON ANY ROUTES THAT HAVE BIFURCATED FAIR SYSTEMS SO THAT WAY WE
6 ELIMINATE -- FARE SYSTEMS SO THAT WE CERTAINLY REDUCE THE SORE
7 POINT THAT COMES FROM INCORRECTLY CHARGED FARES. I LOOK
8 FORWARD TO THAT BEING DONE SOON. THANK YOU.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. ADENA LEVIN.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS AND
13 STAFF. A DINA LEVIN. I SHARE THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
14 SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND SPEAKING
15 FOR MYSELF BUT REPORTING ON THINGS THAT THE POLICY ADVISORY
16 COUNCIL AND TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE HAVE SAID
17 OVER TIME THAT RELATE TO THE ITEM THAT IS BEFORE YOU AT THIS
18 TIME, SO FIRST OF ALL, I'M GLAD TO -- SORRY TO SEE THE DELAY
19 AND GLAD TO SEE STAFF WORK ON STRATEGIES TO HAVE THE ROLL-OUT
20 DELIVER FEATURES TO CUSTOMERS AND IDEALLY IN A SMOOTH WAY. SO
21 THE TWO PIECES OF FEEDBACK INCLUDE ENCOURAGING THAT THE ROLL-
22 OUT DO USER TESTING IN A STRUCTURED WAY BECAUSE THE NEW
23 CLIPPER SYSTEM, PARTICULARLY WITH THE PROPOSED ROLL-OUT PATH,
24 WILL BE BEHAVING DIFFERENTLY THAN IT DID BEFORE FOR CUSTOMERS,
25 SO GOING TO DIFFERENT KINDS OF CUSTOMERS AND MAKING SURE THAT



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 PEOPLE UNDERSTAND HOW IT WILL WORK AND THE TEAM CAN FIGURE OUT
2 HOW TO EXPLAIN HOW IT WILL WORK IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT FOR A
3 SMOOTH ROLLING-OUT. LASTLY, IN TERMS OF MOVING FORWARD WITH
4 THE FREE AND REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS AND THE POTENTIAL TO DO
5 THAT UNDER CLIPPER 1, IF POSSIBLE, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
6 WAS EXTREMELY ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THE RIDERSHIP GROWTH AND
7 REGROWTH OPPORTUNITIES FOR THAT FEATURE AND WOULD HAVE THAT BE
8 DELIVERED SOONER RATHER THAN LATER WOULD BE A GOOD THING.

9

10 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RAVEL
11 MALDONADO AND AFTER THAT DAVE SORRELL.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS RAUL MALDONADO. I JUST WANT TO PROVIDE
14 FEEDBACK ON GREAT STRATEGY AND THINKING WITH THE DELAYED
15 CHANGE MANAGEMENT BETWEEN THE EXISTING CLIPPER SYSTEM AND THE
16 NEXT VERSION OF THE CLIPPER SYSTEM 2.0. I WOULD BASICALLY LIKE
17 TO ENCOURAGE Y'ALL, IF YOU COULD ALL FIND AVENUES OR
18 OPPORTUNITIES TO STREAMLINE, MAKE A LOT MORE BENEFITS COME
19 RELEASED IN A SEAMLESS WAY FOR RIDERS, THAT WOULD BE GREAT
20 BECAUSE RIGHT NOW THERE'S UNCERTAINTY WITH RIDERS AT THE
21 MOMENT. RIDERSHIP IS INCREASING DUE TO PEOPLE COMING BACK AT
22 WORK OR, YOU KNOW, JUST COMMUTING BY TRANSIT. WE NEED TO
23 FURTHER PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES FOR THEM TO SAY, YES, WE
24 CERTAINLY SHOULD TAKE TRANSIT BECAUSE IT IS A WIDELY IMPACTFUL
25 AND ADDED NEW FEATURES SUCH AS, YOU KNOW, REDUCED OR FREE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 TRANSFERS. THAT'S AMAZING. IT'S A MAJOR IMPACT RIGHT THERE.
2 AND HAVING THAT IN THE NEAR FUTURE RIGHT NOW WHERE THERE IS
3 THIS UNCERTAINTY IN PEOPLE'S MINDS AND CREATING UNCERTAINTY IS
4 TRULY IMPORTANT -- CREATING THAT CERTAINTY IS TRULY IMPORTANT.
5 AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR PROVIDING A STRATEGIC TIMELINE AND, YOU
6 KNOW, HOPE FOR THE BEST GOING FORWARD. THANKS.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, DAVE SORRELL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THANK YOU. HAPPY HOLIDAYS TO THE
11 COMMITTEE. DAVID SORRELL WITH UC BERKELEY, AND THE ASSOCIATED
12 COMMUTERS FOR TRANSPORTATION. JUST NOTICING 1, ONE, THANK YOU
13 VERY MUCH FOR PROVIDING THIS UPDATE AT LEAST WITH THE CHANGE
14 PLANS IN ORDER. I THINK THE OPPORTUNITIES ARE AVAILABLE THAT
15 WE SHOULD USE EVER AVENUE POSSIBLE TO START THESE
16 OPPORTUNITIES MUCH SOUTHERN RATHER THAN LATER ONLY BECAUSE OF
17 THE OPPORTUNITIES FOR RIDERSHIP GROWTH BUT ALSO ACKNOWLEDGING,
18 TOO, THAT WE NEED TO CONTINUE THE EFFORTS SET FORTH BOTH BY
19 THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN BUT ALSO BEING A LITTLE BIT
20 PROACTIVE HEADING INTO THE NEXT TWO CALENDAR YEARS, ESPECIALLY
21 WITH FUNDING BEING A HOT BUTTON ITEM. UTILIZED 10 FARE MEDIA
22 IN FRONT OF US, IT NIGHT NECESSARILY -- NOT NECESSARY WILL BE
23 THE MOST PERFECT SYSTEM NOW. I'M A LITTLE WORRIED IN TERMS OF
24 LAUNCH WHEN C2 IS COMPLETED, HAVING TO GO THROUGH THE VENTURE
25 SYSTEM A DECADE AGO, AND THAT PROCESS WAS INCREDIBLY PAINFUL



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 FROM AN ADMINISTRATIVE SIDE. I DO WORRY ABOUT THE
2 OPPORTUNITIES THAT WOULD BE SQUANDERED IF WE DON'T CROSS OUR
3 IS OR CROSS OUR T, DOT OUR IS AND THINGS OF THAT NATURE. AND
4 FROM AN EMPLOYER STANDPOINT ALSO WE DO WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
5 WE HAVE EVERY OPPORTUNITY TO LEVERAGE THE FIRST MILE AND LAST
6 MILE OPPORTUNITIES FROM THE REGIONAL SPINES OF FERRIES, BART
7 AND CALTRANS. AND SO WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO ACTUALLY LEVERAGE
8 BOTH OPPORTUNITIES AND PROGRAMMING SO THAT FOLKS CANNOT
9 ACTUALLY HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT THE ACCOUNTING OR DOUBLE PAYING
10 TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO, WHETHER IT BE FOR WORK, SCHOOL OR
11 PLAY HAPPY HOLIDAYS. THANK YOU AND I YIELD.

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
14 SPEAKERS.

15

16 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAME CLERK. AND
17 LET'S TURN OUR ATTENTION TO THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS. COMMENTS,
18 OBSERVATIONS? WHY DON'T WE START WITH MEMBER MCMILLAN.
19 THERESE.

20

21 **THERESE W. MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I'D JUST
22 LIKE TO PICK UP A SUBJECT THAT A COUPLE OF OUR SPEAKERS
23 MENTIONED WHICH, YOU KNOW, I CERTAINLY AM KEENLY ATTUNED TO,
24 AS I KNOW YOU ARE AND I THINK THE REST OF THE MEMBERS, WHICH
25 IS THIS SYNCHRONIZATION THAT IS NEEDED BETWEEN THE FREE AND



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 REDUCED FARE PROGRAM THAT ALL OF US ARE WORKING ON AS PART OF
2 THE TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSIT ACTION PLAN, AND THE ROLL-OUT OF
3 C2, AND I THINK THE LAST SPEAKER, MR. SORRELL, PROBABLY
4 CAPTURED THAT TENSION BEST. IT IS CRITICAL THAT WE DO WHATEVER
5 WE CAN TO, YOU KNOW, ACHIEVE THE ROLL-OUT OF THIS PILOT, WHICH
6 I THINK IT WOULD BE FAIR TO SAY IS PROBABLY THE MARQUEE
7 ACTIVITY THAT WE ARE WORKING ON RIGHT NOW. UNDOUBTEDLY IT WILL
8 HAVE A HUGE IMPACT ON OUR CUSTOMER BASE. AND AS I SAID,
9 PROBABLY THE HIGHEST PROFILE ELEMENT OF THE TRANSFORMATIVE
10 ACTION PLAN IN TERMS OF A LOT OF THE TENSION AND ITS
11 POTENTIAL. AND WE ALL KNEW THAT SMOOTHLY INTEGRATING THAT WITH
12 C2 WAS A CRITICAL PART OF THE DESIGN AND THE IMPLEMENTATION.
13 THAT SAID, IT RAISES CONCERNS ABOUT DELAYS IN PUTTING THAT
14 PLATFORM FORWARD, AND I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT THE CUBIC
15 TEAM AND OTHERS ARE BEGINNING TO LOOK AT WHAT MIGHT BE IN THE
16 REALM OF THE POSSIBLE IN BRINGING SOME ELEMENTS FORWARD UNDER
17 C1 TO ENSURE THAT WE CAN MAXIMIZE ROLL-OUT OF THE REDUCED AND
18 FREE FARES. BUT I PICK UP THE CAUTION THAT IF WE RUSH IT AND
19 WE PUT OUT A SUBOPTIMAL PRODUCT TO MEET AN ARTIFICIAL MUST-
20 HAVE DEADLINE AS WELL, THAT COULD DO MORE TO HARM OR CERTAINLY
21 IMPEDE OUR PROGRESS IN IMPROVING AND BUILDING, YOU KNOW,
22 CUSTOMER APPRECIATION AND VALUE IN OUR SYSTEMS AS OPPOSED TO,
23 YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN FIND THAT SWEET SPOT OF
24 IMPLEMENTING THE CHANGE SMOOTHLY. SO I JUST WANTED TO PICK UP
25 THOSE THREADS FROM A PERSPECTIVE SOMEONE SITTING ON THE CEB



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 BOARD AND APPRECIATE STAFF AND CERTAINLY YOUR LEADERSHIP IN
2 MAKING SURE THAT WE MANEUVER AS WE CAN THROUGH THAT CHALLENGE.
3 THANKS.

4

5 **CHAIR POWERS:** EXCELLENT COMMENTS, THERESE. DENIS, CHAIRPERSON
6 MULLIGAN, YOUR THOUGHTS.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** YEAH, I HAD A QUESTION, ACTUALLY. CUBIC IS
9 INVOLVED IN LOTS OF ROLL-OUTS AND UPGRADES OF TRANSIT FARE
10 COLLECTION SYSTEMS SIMULTANEOUSLY. I WAS CURIOUS HOW DOES OUR
11 DELAY STACK UP WITH OTHER PROPERTIES THAT ARE ALSO ROLLING OUT
12 SYSTEMS. I KNOW WE'RE SMALLER THAN SOME OF THE OTHER SYSTEMS
13 AND I WOULD HOPE THAT WOULD NOT IMPACT US MORE THAN THE COURT
14 REPORTERS.

15

16 **CHAIR POWERS:** CAROL.

17

18 **CAROL KUESTER:** I CAN'T SAY WE HAVE DONE THAT DETAILED OF AN
19 ANALYSIS. I WOULD SAY WE HAVE REASSURANCE FROM CUBIC THAT THEY
20 HAVE DIFFERENT TEAMS THAT SERVE THE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS SO THAT
21 YOU'LL RECALL BACK IN THE DAY WHEN WE WERE GOING OUT TO BID,
22 AS WERE MANY OF OUR PEER AGENCIES, WE WERE QUITE CONCERNED
23 ABOUT THE CHALLENGE CUBIC WOULD FACE IN DELIVERING OUR PROGRAM
24 PLUS NEW YORK PLUS CHICAGO PLUS OTHERS. YOU KNOW, WE ARE
25 ASKING CUBIC TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY ARE HIRED AND STAFFED UP



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 TO DO THIS WORK, AND TO DATE THAT HAS BEEN A CHALLENGE,
2 STAFFING HAS BEEN A CHALLENGE FOR MANY FOLKS. JUST BASED ON
3 WHAT I RECENTLY SAW IN A PRESS RELEASE ABOUT NEW YORK, I
4 THOUGHT I SAW THE YEAR 2025 MENTIONED, BUT OUR PROGRAMS REALLY
5 ARE NOT APPLES TO APPLES. THEY ARE APPLES TO ORANGES. AND I'D
6 LIKE TO UNDERSCORE, AND JASON SAID IT A COUPLE TIMES, THIS
7 BOARD REALLY MADE A CHOICE ABOUT A TRANSITION STRATEGY THAT
8 PUTS THE COMPLEXITY OF MOVING FROM A FIRST GENERATION TO A
9 NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM SQUARELY IN OUR HANDS AND IN THE
10 CONTRACTOR'S HANDS WITH THE IDEA BEING THAT THAT TRANSITION
11 WOULD BE SEAMLESS TO RIDERS. SO, DENIS, AS YOU KNOW, THAT'S
12 VERY DIFFERENT THAN, SAY, NEW YORK'S SYSTEM WHERE THEY WERE
13 GOING FROM A PLASTIC METRO CARD STRAIGHT TO OPEN PAYMENTS AS
14 KIND OF A PRAY PRIMARY, AND NOW THEY'RE SORT OF BACKFILLING
15 WITH A CLOSED LOOP CARD FOR DISCOUNT NEEDS. I'D BE HAPPY TO
16 TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT THAT BUT I GUESS THE ASSURANCE I WANT TO
17 GIVE IS YOU WE ARE FAWNING TO CUBIC ABOUT KEEPING THEIR
18 STAFFING UP FOR THIS PROGRAM SO THAT WE CAN AVERT LAGS TO
19 GREATEST DEGREE POSSIBLE, AND I DON'T HAVE CONCERNS RIGHT NOW
20 THAT THEIR TEAM IS BEING KIND OF PULLED OFF ONTO OTHER
21 PROGRAMS.

22

23 **CHAIR POWERS:** I WOULD ADD AS THE CHAIR, I KNOW THAT
24 CHAIRPERSON -- YOU'RE NOT THE CHAIR. I'M THE CHAIR --
25 MULLIGAN, THAT CUBIC, IF I GET THIS RIGHT, CAROL, MAKE SURE I



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 GET IT, THEIR ATTRITION RATE THIS PAST MONTH HAS REALLY
2 REDUCED. IT WAS MUCH, MUCH HIGHER AND THEIR ATTRITION RATE,
3 MEANING THEY'RE KEEPING THEIR STAFF ON AND BRINGING MORE FOLKS
4 ONBOARD, HAS REALLY BEEN MINIMIZED OVER THE COURSE. I DON'T
5 KNOW WHAT IT WAS, A VERY LOW NUMBER, DENIS. SO I JUST WANT YOU
6 TO KNOW THAT IN MY DISCUSSIONS WITH THE PRESIDENT OF CUBIC,
7 THAT DID NOT THE GO UNNOTICED TO ME AS WELL. SO WHY DON'T WE
8 JUMP OVER TO COMMITTEE MEMBER GONOT AND THEN COMMITTEE MEMBER
9 CHURCHILL. CAROLYN.

10

11 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THANKS. THANK YOU. MY -- I HAVE A COUPLE
12 QUESTIONS. ONE IS ON THE CUSTOMER TRANSITION WHEN WE START
13 THAT IN THE SUMMER OF 2024, THAT'S WHEN WE -- THAT'S -- IS
14 THAT WHEN ALL EQUIPMENT IS -- IT'S ALREADY BEEN INSTALLED AND
15 TESTED, IS THAT CORRECT?

16

17 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THAT'S CORRECT.

18

19 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** OKAY. SORRY, JASON. AND THEN THERE A ROLL-
20 OUT SYSTEM TO EVERY AGENCY DIFFERENT?

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SO THE WAY IT WORKS IS I MEAN WE'RE STILL IN
23 THE PROCESS OF FORMULATING THIS BUT AT A HIGH LEVEL. WE HAVE A
24 CERTAIN NUMBER OF ACTIVE USERS THAT USE THE SYSTEM, LET'S SAY,
25 EVERY DAY OR SO AS MAYBE A MILLION OUT OF THE 10 MILLION OR SO



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 CARDS THAT EXIST IN THE SYSTEM. SO WE'LL BE ABLE TO TELL WHICH
2 CARD, YOU KNOW, WHICH CARDS TO FLIP TO THE NEXT SYSTEM AND
3 WE'LL PRIORITIZE THE ONES, AND THAT'S WHERE WE'RE STILL
4 WORKING ON WHAT THE TRANSITION PLAN LOOKS LIKE WITH INPUT FROM
5 OPERATOR STAFF AS WELL ABOUT WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE. BUT IT WILL
6 HAPPEN OVER A PERIOD OF WEEKS, MONTHS, HOPEFULLY IN THE TWO TO
7 THREE MONTHS PERIOD, IN TERMS OF GETTING FROM THE DAY THAT YOU
8 START TAKING INDIVIDUAL CUSTOMERS AND FLIPPING THEM, FOR LACK
9 OF A BETTER TERM, FROM THE CARD-BASED SYSTEM MOO THE ACCOUNT-
10 BASED SYSTEM.

11

12 **CAROL KUESTER:** LET ME JUST ADD TO THAT. BASICALLY, THE
13 TRANSITION STRATEGY IS AS FOLLOWS IF YOU'RE A CUSTOMER. YOU
14 DON'T NOTICE A TRANSITION, AT LEAST WITH RESPECT TO HOW YOU
15 USE YOUR CARD, AND THAT WAS AS A RESULT OF THIS TRANSITION
16 STRATEGY THAT I JUST KIND OF EXTOLLED THE VIRTUES OF BECAUSE I
17 THINK I, I PERSONALLY THINK WE ARE MAKING THE RIGHT CHOICE
18 HERE TO MAKE THIS EASY AND SEAMLESS TO CUSTOMERS. AND IN FACT,
19 PART OF OUR MESSAGE WILL BE YOU DO NOT HAVE TO CHANGE. IF YOU
20 LIKE HOW YOU'RE USING CLIPPER TODAY, YOU CAN KEEP DOING THAT.
21 I THINK WHAT JASON WAS REFERRING TO WAS KIND OF THE TRANSITION
22 ON THE BACK END WHERE WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK -- YOU KNOW, THERE
23 ARE A LOT OF HEAVY LIFTING TO BE DONE BUT FOR THE PATRON, A C1
24 CARD WILL MORPH INTO A C2 ACCOUNT WITHOUT ANY ACTION ON THEIR
25 PART, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO KNOW THAT WE WILL START



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 THAT TRANSITION IN BATCHES, AND IF IT GOES WELL, WE CAN
2 INCREASE THE SIZE OF THOSE BATCHES AND THE SPEED OF THAT
3 TRANSITION. SO THE TRANSITION MIGHT PILOT TEST THAT YOU SEE
4 HERE IS KIND OF FRIENDLY USERS, NOT SORT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE
5 CLOSE TO THE PROGRAM WHO CAN GIVE US FEEDBACK SO HA IT'S FULLY
6 TESTED, AND AT THE START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION, WE WILL START
7 TO TRANSITION CARDS TO ACCOUNTS AND WE'LL MANAGE THE PACE OF
8 THAT DEPENDING WHO HOW IT'S GOING. I HOPE THAT HELPS.

9

10 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YEAH. AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION I HAVE AND
11 I THINK IT GOES BACK TO FARE DISCOUNTS AND THAT BECAUSE -- AND
12 I THINK YOU JUST MENTIONED A SYSTEM THAT WENT OPEN, I THINK
13 OPEN PAYMENT BUT THEN TRANSITIONING BACK. I ALSO DON'T WANT TO
14 -- I'M NOT WORRIED SO MUCH -- WE MIGHT HAVE HICCUPS AND I KNOW
15 WE'VE BEEN PRETTY GOOD ABOUT THIS, ABOUT NOT ADDING -- NOT
16 ADDING. I DON'T MEAN IT THAT WAY. BUT I DON'T WANT TO STALL
17 THE PROCESS WE'RE MAKING TO MAKE SOMETHING MAYBE -- I HATE TO
18 SAY THIS -- PERFECT. YOU KNOW WHAT I MEAN? I KNOW WE MIGHT
19 HAVE I A GLITCH HERE OR THERE. BUT THE LONGER WE WAIT, THE
20 MORE NERVOUS I GET ABOUT THE TECHNOLOGY. THAT'S IT.

21

22 **CAROL KUESTER:** AND THOSE ARE DECISIONS WE CAN CERTAINLY BRING
23 BACK TO YOU IF WE ARE AT A FORK IN THE ROAD BECAUSE YOU'RE
24 RIGHT, THOSE ARE OFTEN A JUDGMENT CALL. IF IT'S SHOWING GREAT
25 RESULTS, THEN IT'S A GO. IF THE TESTING IS SHOWING MIXED



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 RESULTS, WE HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT IT, WE CAN CERTAINLY BRING
2 THAT BACK HERE FOR YOUR GUIDANCE.

3

4 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. COMMITTEE MEMBER CHURCHILL, BILL.

5

6 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. LET ME GET MY HAND
7 DOWN. CAROL, I THINK YOU MAY HAVE ANSWERED IT, AND SO AS WE
8 MOVE FORWARD AND TRANSITION, IT'S CLEAR, AND I THINK IT'S
9 CLEAR IN THE REPORT AS WELL, THAT THE C1 CARDS WILL WORK WITH
10 THE C2 SYSTEM, SO IT WILL BE BACKWARDS COMPATIBLE. WHAT ISN'T
11 100% CLEAR TO ME ON THE MOBILE APP, THOUGH, AND THE MOBILE
12 CARD, SO IS IT THE SAME THING? AS YOU MOVE FORWARD, IT WILL --
13 EVEN THOUGH THERE WILL BE A NEW MOBILE APP, IF A CUSTOMER
14 HASN'T UPGRADED THEIR MOBILE APP, WILL IT WORK WITH THE NEW
15 SYSTEM AS SEAMLESSLY AS THE CARDS?

16

17 **CAROL KUESTER:** GO AHEAD, JASON.

18

19 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WE'LL HAVE A NEW ACCOUNT-BASED VERSION OF THE
20 APP SEQUEL BUT THE CARDS WILL BE FLIPPED TO ACCOUNT-BASED
21 CARDS IN YOUR WALLET.

22

23 **BILL CHURCHILL:** SO ONCE AGAIN IT'S INVISIBLE ON THE BACK END
24 AND IF YOU HAD AN APP WITH A LOADED CARD, YOU WON'T KNOW THE
25 DIFFERENCE.



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1

2 **SCOTT WISE:** YEAH, YOU MIGHT BE PROMPTED WITH OTHER APPS TO
3 TELL YOU, HEY, IT'S TIME TO UPDATE OR WHATEVER, BUT IN TERMS
4 OF THE CARD ITSELF THAT IS ON YOUR PHONE, NO.

5

6 **BILL CHURCHILL:** PERFECT. THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE IT.

7

8 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION, COMMITTEE
9 MEMBER CHURCHILL. HOW ABOUT OTHER -- ANY OTHER COMMITTEE
10 MEMBERS' COMMENTS ON THIS ONE, OBSERVATIONS? OKAY. I'M NOT
11 SEEING ANY ON THIS ONE, SO WHY DON'T WE GO AHEAD AND CLOSE
12 ITEM NUMBER 4A AND GO TO I-4B. JASON, THIS IS ON YOU AGAIN AND
13 YOU'RE GOING TO WALK US THROUGH. THIS IS THE CURRENT SYSTEM
14 AND PERFORMANCE UPDATE ON HOW WE'RE DOING RIGHT NOW.

15

16 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YES. THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. COULD WE BRING
17 UP THE SLIDE FOR 4B, PLEASE COULD WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE,
18 PLEASE. SO BEFORE WE GET STARTED, THE MEMO THAT YOU HAVE IN
19 YOUR PACKET PROVIDES INFORMATION AND STATISTICS ON TRANSACTION
20 AND REVENUE, THE MOBILE CLIPPER CARD USAGE, CUSTOMER SERVICE,
21 STAFFING LEVELS AND QUARTERLY FARE CHANGE UPDATES. WE HAVE A
22 FEW CHARTS AND GRAPHS AS WE'VE SHOWN YOU IN PREVIOUS MONTHS TO
23 HELP ILLUSTRATE SOME OF THE DATA, AND I'LL START HERE ON THE
24 FIRST ONE. FIRST SLIDE PORTRAYS, AS WE HAVE SEEN IN THE PAST,
25 THE TOTAL CLIPPER TRANSACTIONS OVER THE LAST YEAR. IN OCTOBER



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 CLIPPER PROCESSED JUST OVER 12 MILLION TRANSACTIONS AND THE
2 TRANSACTION VOLUME, AS YOU CAN SEE, HAS INCREASED SLIGHTLY
3 SINCE LAST MONTH, SO THAT'S -- THAT IS POSITIVE. NEXT SLIDE,
4 PLEASE. SO NEXT SLIDE PORTRAYS A TOTAL REVENUE SETTLED BY THE
5 CLIPPER SYSTEM OVER THE SAME TIME PERIOD AS THE PREVIOUS SLIDE
6 WE JUST LOOKED AT. IN TERMS OF REVENUE, WE SETTLED JUST OVER
7 \$27 MILLION IN OCTOBER OF 2022, AND YOU CAN SEE THAT BOUNCE
8 BACK PROBABLY BECAUSE OF EVERYONE BEING BACK TO FULL, THEIR
9 NORMAL FARES. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND IT'S BEEN OVER A
10 YEAR, OF COURSE, SINCE WE INTRODUCED THE MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS
11 TO PHONE WALLETS AS WELL AS LAUNCHED THE CLIPPER APP, AND THE
12 THIRD SLIDE HERE REPRESENTS HOW MANY MOBILE CARDS HAVE BEEN
13 PROVISIONED SINCE APRIL OF 2021. BOTH THOSE THAT ARE NEWLY
14 OBTAINED ON PHONES AS WELL AS THOSE THAT WERE CONVERTED FROM
15 THE PHYSICAL CARD TO A MOBILE CARD. SO THE LIGHT BLUE LINE
16 REPRESENTS CARDS OBTAIN ON PHONES OF WHICH THIS MONTH THERE
17 WERE CLOSE TO 80,000, AND THE DARK BLUE LINE BELOW IT
18 REPRESENTS THE NUMBER OF CARDS CONVERTED FROM PHYSICAL TO
19 MOBILE CARDS, AND THAT WAS NEARLY 17,000, AND THAT'S BEEN
20 PRETTY STEADY, AS YOU CAN SEE, FOR THE, OH, PAST YEAR. THE
21 TOTAL NUMBER OF MOBILE CARDS IN THE CLIPPER SYSTEM NOW IS OVER
22 1.15 MILLION. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THIS CHART
23 ILLUSTRATES THE NUMBER OF TRIPS TAKEN USING MOBILE CARDS BY
24 TRANSIT OPERATORS SINCE THE MOBILE APP RELEASE, AND YOU CAN
25 SEE WE'RE KIND OF PRETTY MUCH AT A STEADY STATE THERE FROM THE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS. AND LAST SLIDE. SORRY. THANK YOU.
2 FINALLY, THE TABLES ON SLIDE COMPARE THE NUMBER OF TRIPS MADE
3 WITH CLIPPER CARD, MOBILE CLIPPER CARD, EXCUSE ME, VERSUS THE
4 TOTAL NUMBER OF CLIPPER TRIPS BY OPERATOR. SO YOU CAN SEE THE
5 TABLE ON THE LEFT SHOWS THAT SINCE APRIL OF 2021, OVER 21
6 MILLION TRIPS HAVE BEEN TAKEN USING CLIPPER MOBILE CARDS.
7 THAT'S ALMOST 15% OF CLIPPER TRIPS DURING THAT PERIOD OF TIME.
8 AND THIS PERCENTAGE, AS WE SAID, FOR MONTHS CONTINUES TO
9 INCREASE AND THE TABLE ON THE RIGHT ILLUSTRATES THAT ALMOST
10 22% OF CLIPPER TRIPS WERE TAKEN THIS PAST MONTH OF OCTOBER
11 WITH CLIPPER MOBILE CARDS. AND IN TERMS OF QUARTERLY FARE
12 CHANGES, CUBIC HAS REQUESTED THAT THE FARE CHANGES REQUEST TO
13 HELP MANAGE THEIR WORK AND FOR THE MARCH 31 FARE CHANGES THE
14 DEADLINE IS THIS COMING JANUARY 3RD. THAT IS MY REPORT. YOU
15 CAN TAKE THE SLIDES DOWN. THANK YOU. THAT'S MY REPORT, CHAIR
16 POWERS.

17

18 **CHAIR POWERS:** COPY THAT. THANKS, JASON. MADAME CLERK, HOW
19 ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 4B.

20

21 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS. NOBODY WITH
22 THEIR HANDS RAISED AND THERE WAS NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
23 FOR THIS ITEM.

24



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **CHAIR POWERS:** COPY THAT. THANK YOU, MA'AM. COMMITTEE MEMBERS,
2 WHY DON'T WE START WITH CHAIR MEMBER CHURCHILL.

3

4 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. JUST FOR THE SAKE OF
5 PUBLIC RECORD, I WANTED TO POINT OUT THAT COUNTY CONNECTION IN
6 CONJUNCTION WITH WEST CAP WAS ALSO FARE-FREE FOR THE MONTH OF
7 OCTOBER, AND JUST AS A POINT OF INTEREST, IF ANYBODY IS
8 CURIOUS, IT REPRESENTED A 40% INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP FROM THE
9 SAME TIME PERIOD LAST YEAR, SO ALL GOOD NEWS, AND I JUST
10 WANTED TO MAKE SURE I PUT THAT OUT THERE. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR POWERS:** NICE. GREAT, BILL. THANK YOU FOR THAT. THAT'S A
13 GOOD DATA SET TO HAVE. ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS?
14 THE ONLY COMMENT I HAD, JASON, IS I WOULD POINT YOU IN THE
15 DIRECTION OF AN EMAIL I SENT TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF
16 CLIPPER ON LOOKING AHEAD TO NEW YEAR'S EVE AND MAKING SURE
17 THAT THE CHARACTERISTICS ARE THERE FOR A LOT OF THE SAME
18 VARIABLES THAT WE HAVE FOR THE WARRIOR'S DAY PARADE, AND
19 HOPEFULLY YOU AND YOUR TEAM ARE TRACKING ON THAT IN THAT WE'RE
20 TAKING THE APPROPRIATE STEPS, SO THAT'S A GOOD EXPERIENCE FOR
21 EVERYBODY TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT THERE, AND I'M PRETTY SURE
22 THAT EMAIL, IF NOT ALREADY SHARED WITH YOU, WILL GET -- FIND
23 ITS WAY TO YOU LATER THIS AFTERNOON.

24



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANKS, CHAIR POWERS. I KNOW THAT WE'VE BEEN
2 WORKING WITH BART STAFF IN TERMS OF HAVING SOME PEOPLE,
3 PHYSICAL PEOPLE OUT TO SUPPORT DURING THE HOLIDAYS AND ALSO I
4 DON'T KNOW IF WE -- I THINK CAROL MENTIONED IT, MAYBE NOT, BUT
5 WE FEEL AS THOUGH WE ARE GOING TO HAVE APPROPRIATE LEVEL CARDS
6 TO SUPPORT WHOEVER NEEDS TO GET ONE THROUGH THE HOLIDAYS.

7

8 **CHAIR POWERS:** AND THEN ALL THE -- AGAIN, I'M NOT GOING TO GET
9 INTO IT ALL HERE, BUT YOU GUYS CAN, THE SERVERS AND THE
10 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER AND ALL OF THAT, THAT NEEDS TO BE --
11 ANYWAY, THAT'S FOR YOU AND CAROL TO FIGURE OUT. NEW YEAR'S IS
12 PROBABLY GOING TO BE BACK UP AND RUNNING THIS YEAR. SO ANYWAY,
13 YOU SHOULD JUST BE TRACKING ON THAT. OKAY. MADAME CLERK, WHY
14 DON'T WE MOVE ON TO ITEM NUMBER 4C, AND THIS IS AN UPDATE ON
15 THE APPROVED CLIPPER BUDGET AND WORK PLAN, AND THIS IS GOING
16 TO BE FOR FISCAL YEARS 23TH AND 24TH AND THIS IS FOR REVIEW.
17 IT'S AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. I THINK, EDWARD, ARE YOU GOING TO
18 WOK WALK US THROUGH THIS?

19

20 **EDWARD MENG:** YEAH, I'LL SPEAK PRETTY BRIEFLY. THANK YOU, CHAIR
21 POWERS. GOOD AFTERNOON TO THE BOARD. SO JUST TO REMIND YOU,
22 THIS BOARD APPROVED THE CLIPPER 2 TWO-YEAR BUDGET AND WORK
23 PLAN AT ITS JUNE 2022 MEETING. WITH ITS APPROVAL THE BOARD
24 MEMBERS REQUESTED AN UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER BUDGET, WHICH
25 HAPPENS TO BE THIS INFORMATION ITEM. SO ATTACHED ALONG WITH



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 THE MEMO IN YOUR PACKET IS THE CLIPPER OPERATING AND CAPITAL
2 BUDGET, BOTH UPDATED THIS MONTH BASED ON CUBIC'S MOST
3 CURRENTLY SCHEDULE, AND WE ALSO INCLUDED FOR YOUR REFERENCE AS
4 ATTACHMENT B IN THIS PACKET THE BUDGET THAT WAS APPROVED BY
5 THE BOARD IN JUNE. OVERALL, THE BUDGET HAS REMAINED RELATIVELY
6 STABLE AS THE CLIPPER PROGRAM CONTINUES TO GO FORWARD. I THINK
7 THE MAIN THINGS THAT WE WANTED TO POINT OUT FROM LAST UNSAYS
8 PUTTING TO THIS MONTH'S UPDATE, WE NOW HAVE MUCH BERTH MATS
9 FOR WHICH SPECIFIC MILESTONES WILL BE ACHIEVED BASED ON THE
10 PROJECT SCHEDULE THAT WAS SUBMITTED IN OCTOBER BY CUBIC. AND
11 THEN WE ALSO HAVE ALSO A BETTER IDEA OF HOW THESE ACHIEVED
12 MILESTONES IMPACT THE OTHER THREE CONTRACTS THAT WE ARE
13 MANAGING, WHICH IS THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, PAYMENT
14 SERVICES AND ULTIMATELY SEVERAL CONTRACTS FOR FARE MEDIA. AND
15 BECAUSE THE SYSTEM INTEGRATED CONTRACT IS MILESTONE-BASED,
16 EVEN WITH THE DELAYS THAT JASON HAD MENTIONED, THE PAYMENT
17 AMOUNTS OF AND OUR CAPITAL BUDGET DO NOT NECESSARILY INCREASE.
18 THEY CHANGED THE TIME OF WHEN THE PAYMENT MILESTONES ARE
19 ACCEPTED -- EXPECTED TO BE ACHIEVED, BUT THEY DO NOT CHANGE
20 THE AMOUNT OF THE PAYMENT. IN BOTH THE APPROVED JUNE OPERATING
21 BUDGET AND THE UPDATED OPERATING BUDGET THAT WE'RE SHOWING
22 YOU, WE HAVE ASSUMED THAT THE C1 OPERATIONS, C1 O&M IS NEEDED
23 UNTIL NOVEMBER 2024 WHICH IS WHEN THE ORIGINAL C1 O&M CONTRACT
24 EXTENSION ENDS. THAT HAS ACTUALLY ALWAYS BEEN THE ASSUMPTION,
25 THAT WE'VE BEEN MEETING THE WHOLE FIVE-YEAR EXTENSION. SO WE,



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 BEING BOTH THE OPERATORS AND MTC, ARE PAYING FOR TWO PARALLEL
2 SYSTEMS UNTIL WE'RE FINALLY ABLE TO SHUT OFF C1 IN NOVEMBER
3 2024. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK I WANT TO JUST SAY THAT IN GENERAL
4 THE CLIPPER OPERATING BUDGET CONTINUES TO BE RELATIVELY
5 STABLE. WE DEFINITELY PLAN TO RETURN TO THIS BOARD IN ROUGHLY
6 AROUND SIX MONTHS TO REQUEST AN APPROVAL OF THE NEXT TWO-YEAR
7 CLIPPER -- THE NEXT TWO-YEAR CLIPPER BUDGET, AND SO THOSE WILL
8 BE FOR FY23 AND FISCAL YEARS 24. BUT UNTIL THEN WE WELCOME ANY
9 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS OR CONCERNS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANKS, EDWARD, FOR THAT REPORT ON THE CLIPPER
12 BUDGET UPDATES. MADAME CLERK, LET'S CHECK IN WITH YOU ON
13 PUBLIC COMMENT, EITHER WRITTEN AHEAD OF TIME OR RAISED HAND
14 DURING THE MEETING.

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS BY RAISED
17 HANDS AND THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. VERY GOOD, MADAME CLERK. HOW ABOUT
20 COMMITTEE MEMBERS? COMMENTS, OBSERVATIONS, QUESTIONS FOR
21 EDWARD AND/OR CAROL? OKAY. EDWARD, I AM NOT SEEING ANY
22 QUESTIONS OR OBSERVATIONS FROM ANYBODY HERE, SO THANK YOU FOR
23 THAT REPORT AGAIN. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 5, AND
24 THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS, CAROL. THIS IS THE EXECUTIVE
25 DIRECTOR'S REPORT.



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1
2 **CAROL KUESTER:** GREAT. THANKS, EVERYBODY. I'LL BE BRIEF. I
3 WANTED TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF EXECUTION OF THE
4 CLIPPER MOU. IT'S FULLY EXECUTED BY ALL BUT ONE AGENCY, SO WE
5 ARE FOLLOWING UP CLOSELY WITH THEM, BUT I THINK IT'S GREAT
6 NEWS THAT WE ARE SO CLOSE TO BEING ALL THE WAY DONE THERE.
7 LET'S SEE. A REMINDER -- WELL, JUST TO UNDERSCORE, WE ARE
8 STILL HANGING IN THERE WITH CLIPPER CARD SUPPLY, 230,000 CARDS
9 ARRIVED IN CONCORD LAST WEEK AND WE'RE DISTRIBUTING THOSE NOW.
10 A BIG THANK YOU, THOUGH, TO BART FOR CHANGING OUT THE SAN
11 FRANCISCO TICKET VEND MACHINES TO VEND MAX STRIPE AS THAT'S
12 REALLY HELPED STRETCHED THE SUPPLY OF CLIPPER CARDS THROUGHOUT
13 THE REGION AND HELPED US AVOID HAVING A SHORTAGE. I WANTED TO
14 SAY A BIG THANK YOU TO CARTER MAH WHO IS ON THE CALL TODAY AND
15 CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR NEXT STEPS. THANKS FOR BEING HERE AND
16 THANKS FOR YOUR SERVICE ON THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD. IT WAS
17 GREAT TO HAVE YOU, AND WE WISH YOU ABSOLUTELY ALL THE BEST.
18 AND I WILL BE REACHING OUT TO A COUPLE OF FOLKS ON THIS CALL
19 JUST TO FOLLOW UP ON SOME SPECIFICS ITEMS THAT YOU HAVE
20 RAISED. AND I'LL JUST CLOSE TO SAY PLEASE FEEL FREE IF YOU
21 HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT CLIPPER, REACH OUT TO ME AND I'LL POINT
22 YOU EITHER IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION OR HELP EXPLAIN. I KNOW
23 THERE'S SOME MULTIFACETED PROGRAM, AND WHEN WE THINK ABOUT IT
24 IN THIS POLICY CONTEXT, THAT'S ONE THING, AND THEN IN OUR
25 PERSONAL LIVES AS WE ADD A CARD TO WALLET OR GET QUESTIONS



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 FROM FRIENDS AND FAMILY, OTHER KINDS OF QUESTIONS MIGHT ARISE,
2 SO HAPPY TO COACH ALONG THE WAY AS NEEDED, AND I ENCOURAGE ALL
3 TO SHOW PEOPLE HOW TO GET A CLIPPER CARD IN WALLET THIS
4 THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY. I THINK IT STILL SURPRISES AND DELIGHTS
5 A LOT OF PEOPLE, HOW QUICK AND EASY THAT IS TO DO. AND THAT'S
6 IT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CHAIR POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE REMARKS AND COMMENTS, CAROL.
9 SO WHY DON'T WE GO TO THE PUBLIC FIRST. MADAME CLERK, DID WE
10 GET ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

11

12 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS, NOT IN
13 WRITING AND NOT BY RAISING HANDS.

14

15 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. AND SINCE CAROL BROUGHT IT UP, CARTER, I'M
16 GOING TO GIVE YOU THE FLOOR. DID YOU WANT TO SAY ANYTHING ON
17 THIS OCCASION HERE?

18

19 **VICE CHAIR MAU:** I CAN SAY THANK YOU, CAROL, FOR ACKNOWLEDGING
20 ME. I WAS WORK ON CLIPPER LONG BEFORE THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
21 BOARD WAS FORMED WHEN I WAS A STAFF. IT'S COME A LONG WAY AND
22 IT'S BEEN A LONG JOURNEY WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU ON GETTING
23 THE FIRST CLIPPER PROGRAM IN PLACE AND NOW TRANSITIONING TO
24 THE NEXT PROGRAM. I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE A HUGE UPGRADE FOR
25 THE REGION AND I'D LIKE TO THANK ALL OF THE OTHER GENERAL



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 MANAGERS, ALL OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD, IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE
2 WORKING WITH YOU. AND -- IS SHE IS GOING TO BE A GREAT
3 REPLACEMENT FOR ME. THANK YOU, CAROL. YOU GUYS ARE DOING A
4 GREAT JOB IN ROLLING THIS PROGRAM OUT. IT'S HAD A LOT OF
5 ISSUES ALONG THE WAY. THE PANDEMIC DIDN'T HELP AT ALL. THANK
6 YOU FOR HANGING IN THERE AND IT'S GOING TO BE GREAT FOR ALL
7 THE RIDERS OF THE BAY AREA.

8

9 **MODERATOR:** THANKS, CARTER, FOR THOSE COMMENTS. ANY OTHER BOARD
10 MEMBERS HAVE COMMENTS OR OBSERVATIONS ON THE EXECUTIVE
11 DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR THIS MEETING? OKAY. CAROL, I'M NOT
12 SEEING ANY, AND SO WHY DON'T WE GO TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 6,
13 MADAME CLERK. ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OTHER BUSINESS
14 THAT YOU WANTED TO REPORT OUT ON? 7 '67.

15

16 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THERE IS ONE HAND RAISED BY ALITA DUPREE
17 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS. AND MEMBERS. ALITA
22 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE/HER. AS I SPEAK GENERALLY, GOOD
23 MEETING TODAY. GOT A LOT OF WORK DONE. LIKE IT WHEN WE GET
24 WORK DONE, AND THE WORK CONTINUES. ABOUT TWO WEEKS AGO I WENT
25 AND CREATED A CLIPPER CARD IN MY PHONE AND USED IT ON THE



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 VARIOUS SYSTEMS THAT I TRAVELED A WEEK AGO, SO IT WORKS. I'M
2 ENJOYING IT. I WILL BE ABLE TO LOAD PASSES AND MONEY MORE
3 QUICKLY, NOT HAVING TO WORRY ABOUT SEVERAL DAYS THAT SOMETIMES
4 PASSES TAKE IN ORDER TO BE RECEIVED FROM A BUS VALIDATOR. SO I
5 SAID TO MYSELF, WELL, I'M ALREADY DOING THIS IN CHICAGO AND IN
6 NEW YORK AND LAS VEGAS AND IN DENVER. I COULD DO IT HERE IN
7 THE BAY AREA. AT 100 CARTS OUT THERE, I GUESS MAYBE I'M THE
8 FIRST ONE TO ACTUALLY TESTIFY ON IT. SO WHEN I COME BACK, I'LL
9 BE DOING THAT. AND HOW DO WE WANT TO GET THE WORK OF CLIPPER
10 GOING? I AM CONCERNED WHEN WE FALL BACK ON THE OLD WAYS. HOW
11 CAN WE EV SOME MORE CLIPPER PRODUCTS THAT COULD WORK FOR OUR
12 OCCASION USERS? IN CHICAGO THEY HAVE THESE VENTURE TICKETS
13 WHICH I GUESS HAVE THE SAME RFDI CHIPS IN THEM. THEY'RE JUST
14 SMALLER AND THINNER AND DON'T LAST AS LONG. AND WE HAVE TO ASK
15 HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE COMING INTO THE AIRPORT AND BUYING A
16 STRIPED TICKET, AND THEY BUY JUST I ENOUGH FOR ONE TRIP, THEY
17 GO TO THE NEXT STATION AND BUY A \$3 CLIPPER CARD, SO WE HAVE
18 TO ASK OURSELVES HOW MUCH IS THAT HELPING. WOULDN'T TO LOOK
19 FORWARD, NOT BACK, AND USE THIS AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADVANCE
20 THE CONVERSATION INSTEAD OF USING A FALLBACK. WE'VE GOT THINK
21 ABOUT NEW AND IMPROVED WAYS TO DO THIS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
24 COMMENTS.

25



NOVEMBER 21, 2022

1 **CHAIR POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAME CLERK. SO THAT BRINGS US
2 TO AGENDA ITEM 7, WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT AND THE NEXT MEETING.
3 AND IT LOOKS LIKE OUR NEXT MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR MONDAY,
4 DECEMBER 19TH AT 1:30. IS THAT CORRECT?

5

6 **CAROL KUESTER:** THAT'S CORRECT. AT THIS MOMENT WE HAVE A VERY
7 LIGHT AGENDA, SO MAYBE WE CAN CONFER -- ONCE WE GET PAST
8 TODAY, TO SEE IF THAT MEETING'S NOT TRULY NEEDED, THEN WE'LL
9 CERTAINLY DROP IT AND SAVE EVERYBODY THE TIME.

10

11 **CHAIR POWERS:** HAPPY TO WORK WITH YOU ON THAT, EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR, ON THE NEED FOR THAT. AND SO WITH THAT WE WILL
13 ADJOURN THIS MEETING, AND ALL THE BEST ON THE BEGINNING OF THE
14 HOLIDAY SEASON TO EVERYBODY. THANK YOU.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33



Broadcasting Government