



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

Meeting Agenda

Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee

Veda Florez, Chair

Anne Olivia Eldred, Vice Chair

Members

*Richard Burnett, Rick Coates, Christina Gotuaco,
Richard Hedges, Michelle Hernandez, Michael Lopez,
Rahmon Momoh, and Daisy Ozim*

Alternates

Jim Blacksten, Randi Kinman, and Terry Scott

Thursday, July 30, 2020

1:05 PM

Yerba Buena - 1st Floor (REMOTE)

In light of Governor Newsom's State of Emergency declaration regarding the COVID-19 outbreak and in accordance with Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Newsom on March 17, 2020 and the Guidance for Gatherings issued by the California Department of Public Health, the meeting will be conducted via webcast, teleconference, and Zoom for Equity and Access Subcommittee members who will participate in the meeting from individual remote locations. A Zoom panelist link for meeting participants will be sent separately to Equity and Access Subcommittee members.

The meeting webcast will be available at <http://mtc.ca.gov/whats-happening/meetings>. Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely via Zoom at the following link or phone number. Equity and Access Subcommittee Members and members of the public participating by Zoom wishing to speak should use the "raise hand" feature or dial *9. In order to get the full Zoom experience, please make sure your application is up to date.

Attendee Link: <https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/99138036384>

Join by Telephone: 888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free)

Webinar ID: 991 3803 6384

International numbers available: <https://bayareametro.zoom.us/u/aAGm2dw7Y>

Detailed instructions on participating via Zoom are available at:

<https://mtc.ca.gov/how-provide-public-comment-board-meeting-zoom>

Members of the public may participate by phone or Zoom or may submit comments by email at info@bayareametro.gov by 5:00 p.m. the day before the scheduled meeting date. Please include the committee or board meeting name and agenda item number in the subject line. Due to the current circumstances there may be limited opportunity to address comments during the meeting. All comments received will be submitted into the record.

The Policy Advisory Council advises the Metropolitan Transportation Commission on transportation policies in the San Francisco Bay Area, incorporating diverse perspectives relating to the environment, the economy, and social equity.

1. Welcome

Veda Florez, Equity & Access Subcommittee Chair

2. Roll Call / Confirm Quorum

Quorum: A quorum of this committee shall be a majority of its regular non-ex-officio voting members (6).

3. [20-1157](#) Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Work Plan

Discussion of the Equity & Access Subcommittee 2020-2021 work plan.
Information

Action:

Presenter:

Kỳ-Nam Miller and Marti Paschal

Attachments:

[03_2020-2021_Equity and Access_Work_Plan.pdf](#)

[03i_Correspondence Received_1_Workplan item request, equity and access su](#)

4. New Business

Members of the subcommittee may bring up new business for discussion or addition to a future agenda.

5. Public Comments / Other Business

Note: The subcommittee will not take action on items not listed on today's agenda.

*Equity and Access Subcommittee Members and members of the public participating by Zoom wishing to speak should use the "raise hand" feature or dial *9.*

[20-1158](#) Public Comment Received

Attachments:

[05_Public Comment Received_Jim Stallman.pdf](#)

6. Adjournment / Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Policy Advisory Council Equity and Access Subcommittee will be held at a time and place to be duly noticed.

Public Comment: The public is encouraged to comment on agenda items at Committee meetings by completing a request-to-speak card (available from staff) and passing it to the Committee secretary. Public comment may be limited by any of the procedures set forth in Section 3.09 of MTC's Procedures Manual (Resolution No. 1058, Revised) if, in the chair's judgment, it is necessary to maintain the orderly flow of business.

Meeting Conduct: If this meeting is willfully interrupted or disrupted by one or more persons rendering orderly conduct of the meeting unfeasible, the Chair may order the removal of individuals who are willfully disrupting the meeting. Such individuals may be arrested. If order cannot be restored by such removal, the members of the Committee may direct that the meeting room be cleared (except for representatives of the press or other news media not participating in the disturbance), and the session may continue.

Record of Meeting: Committee meetings are recorded. Copies of recordings are available at a nominal charge, or recordings may be listened to at MTC offices by appointment. Audiocasts are maintained on MTC's Web site (mtc.ca.gov) for public review for at least one year.

Accessibility and Title VI: MTC provides services/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited-English proficient who wish to address Commission matters. For accommodations or translations assistance, please call 415.778.6757 or 415.778.6769 for TDD/TTY. We require three working days' notice to accommodate your request.

可及性和法令第六章: MTC 根據要求向希望來委員會討論有關事宜的殘疾人士及英語有限者提供服務/方便。需要便利設施或翻譯協助者，請致電 415.778.6757 或 415.778.6769 TDD / TTY。我們要求您在三個工作日前告知，以滿足您的要求。

Acceso y el Titulo VI: La MTC puede proveer asistencia/facilitar la comunicación a las personas discapacitadas y los individuos con conocimiento limitado del inglés quienes quieran dirigirse a la Comisión. Para solicitar asistencia, por favor llame al número 415.778.6757 o al 415.778.6769 para TDD/TTY. Requerimos que solicite asistencia con tres días hábiles de anticipación para poderle proveer asistencia.

Attachments are sent to Committee members, key staff and others as appropriate. Copies will be available at the meeting.

All items on the agenda are subject to action and/or change by the Committee. Actions recommended by staff are subject to change by the Committee.

MTC's Chair and Vice-Chair are ex-officio voting members of all standing Committees.



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 20-1157 **Version:** 1 **Name:**
Type: Report **Status:** Informational
File created: 7/23/2020 **In control:** Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee
On agenda: 7/30/2020 **Final action:**
Title: Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Work Plan

Discussion of the Equity & Access Subcommittee 2020-2021 work plan.

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: [03_2020-2021_Equity_and_Access_Work_Plan.pdf](#)
[03i_Correspondence_Received_1_Workplan_item_request_equity_and_access_subcommittee.pdf](#)

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Subject:

Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Work Plan

Discussion of the Equity & Access Subcommittee 2020-2021 work plan.

Presenter:

Kỳ-Nam Miller and Marti Paschal

Recommended Action:

Information

Attachments:

Metropolitan Transportation Commission
Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee

July 30, 2020

Agenda Item 3

Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Work Plan

Subject: Discussion of the Equity & Access Subcommittee 2020-2021 work plan.

Background: The Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee is an ad hoc working group established to assist the Policy Advisory Council in implementing its work plan by providing in-depth analyses of the equity and access issues to be considered in the development of MTC's transportation policy.

All Council members are invited to attend the Subcommittee meetings and participate in the discussions. However, only Subcommittee members can vote on motions of the Subcommittee. The Subcommittee membership will reflect the geographic and subject matter diversity of the Council, to the greatest extent possible.

Voting members of the 2020-2021 Equity and Access Subcommittee include:

1. Veda Florez, Chair (representing the minority community, Marin County)
2. Ann Olivia Eldred, Vice-Chair (representing the environment, at-large)
3. Richard Burnett (representing the disabled community, Solano County)
4. Michelle Hernandez (representing the disabled community, Contra Costa County)
5. Rahmon Momoh (representing the minority community, Contra Costa County)
6. Rick Coates (representing the senior community, Sonoma County)
7. Michael Lopez (representing the senior community, Santa Clara County)
8. Daisy Ozim (representing the minority community, San Francisco)
9. Christina Gotuaco (representing the economy, at-large)
10. Rich Hedges (representing the senior community, San Mateo County)
11. Alternate: Randi Kinman (representing the low-income community, Santa Clara County)
12. Alternate: Jim Blacksten (representing the disabled community, San Francisco)
13. Alternate: Terry Scott (representing the senior community, Napa County)

Work Plan Recommendations

As MTC advances equity in intentional and ongoing processes, actions, and outcomes, the 2020-2021 Equity and Access Subcommittee will focus on discussing and supporting current equity-related issues, including the following topics:

1. Plan Bay Area 2050
2. Efforts to improve public transit, including transit sustainability and connectivity (such as Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force reports, Clipper 2.0, Clipper START, Express lanes means-based toll discount pilot, last-mile issues, signage projects), and impacts on transportation from new upcoming technologies

3. Federal Title VI/DBE updates
4. Regional Safety/Vision Zero policy
5. Public engagement activities
6. Legislative updates on equity and access issues

Attachments: None

From: [Martha Silver](#)
To: [Martha Silver](#)
Subject: Workplan item request, equity and access subcommittee
Date: Wednesday, July 29, 2020 3:34:06 PM

From: Adina Levin <alevin@alevin.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 29, 2020 3:18 PM
To: Martha Silver <MSilver@bayareametro.gov>
Cc: Kì-Nam Miller <kmiller@bayareametro.gov>; Marti Paschal <mpaschal@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: Workplan item request, equity and access subcommittee

External Email

Dear Equity and Access Subcommittee Chair, Vice-Chair and Staff,

Following is a request for an item to be considered for the Equity and Access workplan.

This item complements the topics of fare equity that the group is considering. There is a state initiative called CalITP that is working on providing “open payment” technology for fare payment.

Clipper is currently a “closed payment” system meaning that you can use a Clipper card only to pay for transit. Cash that is put on a Clipper card cannot be used for other things, which is difficult if you have put \$20 on a Clipper card but need money for food.

“Open Payments” means the ability to use multi-purpose cards to pay for transit. This could potentially be implemented in a way that is beneficial for low-income people in a few different ways:

- Use the same CalFresh card as used for food benefits to pay for transit
- Use a pre-paid debit card that you can buy at a e.g. a pharmacy to pay for transit as well as food and any other purposes, for people who are unbanked/underbanked, or use pre-paid cards to manage budgets
- Use an existing debit/credit card to pay for transit, for people who are low-income but have access to debit/credit cards, and do not want to have money locked up that can only be used for transit

MTC staff working on Clipper 2.0 have said that the implementation of Open Payments would need to wait until 2023 when Clipper 2.0 is first rolled out. This is understandable given the technical issues.

However, MTC staff said in a recent staff report at the Clipper Executive Board that Open Payments would primarily benefit tourists.

<https://mtc.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4597559&GUID=1CC43C16-B49A-4E08-B9BD-B912893993A1&Options=&Search=>

Given the examples that I provided above, I do think that there could be a variety of potentially significant benefits for low-income people with a variety of different needs. This could be a good issue for this group to request an agenda item to have staff to prepare and for the group to discuss.

Thank you for your consideration

Best,
Adina
Adina Levin
650-646-4344



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 20-1158 **Version:** 1 **Name:**

Type: Report **Status:** Informational

File created: 7/23/2020 **In control:** Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee

On agenda: 7/30/2020 **Final action:**

Title: Public Comment Received

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: [05 Public Comment Received Jim Stallman.pdf](#)

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Subject:
Public Comment Received

Attachments:

From: [Martha Silver](#)
To: [Martha Silver](#)
Subject: FW: For MTC Policy Advisory Council Access and Environment Subcommittee June 22 mtg. w/ copy to Equity & Compliance Office
Date: Wednesday, June 24, 2020 8:23:35 AM

From: Jim Stallman [<mailto:2jimstallman@gmail.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, June 23, 2020 12:45 PM
To: MTC Info <info@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: Re: For MTC Policy Advisory Council Access and Environment Subcommittee June 22 mtg. w/ copy to Equity & Compliance Office

External Email

On Thu, Jun 18, 2020 at 3:32 PM Jim Stallman <2jimstallman@gmail.com> wrote:

Jim Stallman. 408 621-2542

I am requesting guidance from MTC to get Santa Clara County to use freeway projects to fund counterpart bike ped mobility in compliance with MTC Resolution No. 3765.

A Community of Concern got nothing when VTA had close to \$100M for an 880 widening project and the CofC has been waiting more than a decade to see their Coyote Creek Trail in that same 880 corridor segment built. Now VTA plans to use bike ped money to build the Coyote Creek Trail in the 880 corridor in contempt of MTC Resolution No. 3765. By deciding to spend bike ped money instead of paying for it with funding for another upcoming fwy project there, it will mean that shovel ready bike & ped projects including SR2S ones - needing that bike ped money - will languish unfunded for another decade - including two Complete Streets projects in other Communities of Concern which will languish unfunded.

Attached is a screen print of MTC Resolution 3765 (*the file is titled 10 years ago which should now read 14 years ago*)

I have been appealing to VTA highlighting a strategy that will get more bike ped projects funded in Santa Clara County using a framework laid out by the MTC per the attached resolution 3765.

In the affluent part of the county, Stevens Creek Trail (SCT) is part of the fwy 85 corridor and the upcoming trail completion segments in Mt. View and Sunnyvale can and should be fully funded by the 85HOT project.

This may not happen, though, unless VTA complies with MTC Resolution 3765 as other Bay Area counties already do. SCC Measure B and SB1 call for this but executing on this is the key to a successful outcome. To have Stevens Creek Trail use bike ped funding when it is running directly in the 85HOT project ROW will mean that two Complete Streets projects in East San Jose Communities of Concern will miss out on funding.

The 85HOT project that needs to fund the Stevens Creek Trail segment has not yet been scoped out so the time to bring about compliance with MTC Resolution 3765 is now.

Jim 408 621-2542

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Jim Stallman** <2jimstallman@gmail.com>

Date: Monday, May 11, 2020

Dave Cortese responded with this:

Hello Jim,

Thank you for reaching out to me. Your advocacy on behalf of bike and pedestrian projects is appreciated and understood. I will use your input to help guide my future decisions.

Sincerely,

Dave

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Jim Stallman** <2jimstallman@gmail.com>

Date: Saturday, May 9, 2020

Subject: MTC Resolution 3765

To: "Hendrickscouncil@sunnyvale.ca.gov"

<Hendrickscouncil@sunnyvale.ca.gov>, dave.cortese@bos.sccgov.org

The Class 1 Bike Path on the bay side of 101 between Whipple & Holly - formerly a gap - was paid for by the freeway Aux Lane project built along there.
(San Mateo County)

By comparison, in Santa Clara County, VTA built 2 projects on 880 through the Brokaw interchange with the end result being that bike/peds lost their only way to cross Coyote Creek along there - the street bridge was commandeered and turned into a freeway off ramp. VTA Measure B bike ped funding is now going to be used by VTA for completion of the Coyote Creek Trail which will restore the crossing at Brokaw and also serve the Community of Concern (CoC) residing along the 880 corridor. This is not in compliance with MTC 3765, however. Note that the 2nd VTA project at Brokaw was so mismanaged that \$30M was returned to the State by VTA unspent while leaving the CoC with nothing (the \$93M project was recipient of a State Congestion Relief Proposition earmarking money to 2 NorCal and 2 SoCal projects outside of the normal STIP outlays). The Guadalupe River Trail (GRT) which serves the tech population got built out fully in N. San Jose at the same time. This all happened subsequent to MTC 3765 & Caltrans DD64.

The MTC resolution was the implementation of DD64 - a policy change by Caltrans to see that Caltrans projects included Bike Ped mobility elements and stipulating that bike ped money was not to be used for these elements. SB1 is the latest testament to what the rest of the Bay Area is doing to get CS elements of road projects funded. We can "do it all" when it comes to bike ped. Note that when a Bike Ped project becomes a VTA member agency SCC Measure B Bike Ped Fund submittal it has been highly developed and vetted. These are compelling needs - not just wish list items.

A clear example of where VTA could change business as usual is with the Stevens

Creek Trail. The 85HOT project in that corridor needs to fully fund the trail. Not using Measure B Bike Ped money for Stevens Creek and Coyote Creek trail buildout will make it possible to build out the Cross County Bike Plan and other ped safety projects that will otherwise have to wait 10 to 20 years for funding.

Thank you for your consideration of this appeal.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Library** <library@mtc.ca.gov>

Date: Wed, Jan 13, 2016 at 3:49 PM

Subject: Resolution 3765

To: "2jimstallman@gmail.com" <2jimstallman@gmail.com>

Hi Jim

The resolution is attached.

Best

Julie

MTC-ABAG Library

101 8th Street | Oakland, CA 94607

[510-817-5836](tel:510-817-5836) | www.mtc.ca.gov