



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

Meeting Agenda

Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee

Jim Blacksten, Chair
Carlos Castellanos, Vice Chair

Wednesday, February 14, 2018

11:30 AM

Yerba Buena - 1st Floor

This meeting will be recorded. Copies of recordings may be requested at the Metropolitan Transportation Commissioner (MTC) at nominal charge, or recordings may be listened to at MTC offices by appointment.

The Policy Advisory Council advises the Metropolitan Transportation Commission on transportation policies in the San Francisco Bay Area, incorporating diverse perspectives relating to the environment, the economy and social equity.

1. Welcome

2. [18-0074](#) 2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Investment Analysis

Overview of the upcoming 2019 TIP Investment Analysis; including the purpose, timeline, and approaches used in previous analyses. Feedback from the subcommittee will be used to inform the approach and methodology for the 2019 TIP Investment Analysis.

Action: Discussion

Presenter: Mallory Atkinson

Attachments: [02 TIP Investment Analysis.pdf](#)

3. [18-0075](#) Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update

MTC initiated this study in 2015 to develop and analyze scenarios for funding and implementing a regional means-based transit fare program or programs in the nine-county Bay Area. The study has been completed; next steps will be discussed.

Action: Discussion

Presenter: Melanie Choy

Attachments: [03 Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update.pdf](#)

4. [18-0042](#) Nominations for 2018-2019 Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Chair and Vice Chair
- Nominations for 2018-2019 chair and vice chair of the Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee will be opened and will remain open until the election, scheduled for the March 14, 2018 meeting. Term will be through December 2019.
- Action:** Discussion
- Presenter:** Catalina Alvarado, Acting Staff Liaison
- Attachments:** [04i Nominations for Subcommittee Officers.pdf](#)

5. New Business

Members of the subcommittee may bring up new business for discussion or addition to a future agenda.

6. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

Note: The subcommittee will not take action on items not listed on today's agenda.

7. Adjournment / Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Policy Advisory Council Equity and Access Subcommittee will be held Wednesday, March 14, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. at the Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA.

Public Comment: The public is encouraged to comment on agenda items at Committee meetings by completing a request-to-speak card (available from staff) and passing it to the Committee secretary. Public comment may be limited by any of the procedures set forth in Section 3.09 of MTC's Procedures Manual (Resolution No. 1058, Revised) if, in the chair's judgment, it is necessary to maintain the orderly flow of business.

Meeting Conduct: If this meeting is willfully interrupted or disrupted by one or more persons rendering orderly conduct of the meeting unfeasible, the Chair may order the removal of individuals who are willfully disrupting the meeting. Such individuals may be arrested. If order cannot be restored by such removal, the members of the Committee may direct that the meeting room be cleared (except for representatives of the press or other news media not participating in the disturbance), and the session may continue.

Record of Meeting: Committee meetings are recorded. Copies of recordings are available at a nominal charge, or recordings may be listened to at MTC offices by appointment. Audiocasts are maintained on MTC's Web site (mtc.ca.gov) for public review for at least one year.

Accessibility and Title VI: MTC provides services/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited-English proficient who wish to address Commission matters. For accommodations or translations assistance, please call 415.778.6757 or 415.778.6769 for TDD/TTY. We require three working days' notice to accommodate your request.

可及性和法令第六章: MTC 根據要求向希望來委員會討論有關事宜的殘疾人士及英語有限者提供服務/方便。需要便利設施或翻譯協助者，請致電 415.778.6757 或 415.778.6769 TDD / TTY。我們要求您在三個工作日前告知，以滿足您的要求。

Acceso y el Titulo VI: La MTC puede proveer asistencia/facilitar la comunicación a las personas discapacitadas y los individuos con conocimiento limitado del inglés quienes quieran dirigirse a la Comisión. Para solicitar asistencia, por favor llame al número 415.778.6757 o al 415.778.6769 para TDD/TTY. Requerimos que solicite asistencia con tres días hábiles de anticipación para poderle proveer asistencia.

Attachments are sent to Committee members, key staff and others as appropriate. Copies will be available at the meeting.

All items on the agenda are subject to action and/or change by the Committee. Actions recommended by staff are subject to change by the Committee.

MTC's Chair and Vice-Chair are ex-officio voting members of all standing Committees.



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #:	18-0074	Version:	1	Name:	
Type:	Report	Status:		Informational	
File created:	1/18/2018	In control:		Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee	
On agenda:	2/14/2018	Final action:			
Title:	2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Investment Analysis				

Overview of the upcoming 2019 TIP Investment Analysis; including the purpose, timeline, and approaches used in previous analyses. Feedback from the subcommittee will be used to inform the approach and methodology for the 2019 TIP Investment Analysis.

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: [02 TIP Investment Analysis.pdf](#)

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Subject:

2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Investment Analysis

Overview of the upcoming 2019 TIP Investment Analysis; including the purpose, timeline, and approaches used in previous analyses. Feedback from the subcommittee will be used to inform the approach and methodology for the 2019 TIP Investment Analysis.

Presenter:

Mallory Atkinson

Recommended Action:

Discussion

Attachments:



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Agenda Item 2

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
TEL 415.778.6700
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Memorandum

TO: Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee DATE: February 7, 2018
FR: Mallory Atkinson, Programming and Allocations
RE: 2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Investment Analysis

What is the TIP?

The Transportation Improvement Program, or TIP, is a comprehensive four-year regional spending plan — required by federal law. A major milestone occurs when a highway, transit or other transportation project is added to the TIP. A project may not receive federal funds or receive other critical federal project approvals unless it is included in the TIP. The TIP signifies the start of implementation of the programs and policies approved in the Bay Area's long-range transportation plan. It does this by identifying specific projects over a four-year timeframe that will help move the region toward its transportation vision. Locally funded transit operations and pavement maintenance are generally not included in the TIP.

Investment Analysis Conducted on Each TIP

To address the equity implications of proposed investments, MTC conducts an investment analysis. The Investment Analysis focuses on the equity implications of transportation investments included in the regional TIP. The purpose of the analysis is to understand if low-income, minority, and other potentially disadvantaged populations are sharing equitably in the region's near-term financial investments, as included in the TIP. Information on the TIP as well as results of the Investment Analysis of the 2017 TIP can be viewed on MTC's website at: www.mtc.ca.gov/our-work/fund-invest/transportation-improvement-program

The Council Reviews and Comments on Proposed Approach & Methodology for the TIP Investment Analysis

This memo provides an overview of the upcoming 2019 TIP Investment Analysis approach and methodology. It includes a timeline for the work as well as a summary of the analytical approach used in the 2017 TIP. MTC staff is seeking feedback to further improve upon the approach and methodology for the 2019 TIP Investment Analysis.

Timeline

During the development of the previous TIP Investment Analysis, it was requested that staff engage members of the Policy Advisory Council earlier in the development of the analysis to provide sufficient opportunity to review and comment on the proposed approach and methodology. Staff has developed the following timeline to reflect that request.

Month	Committee / Council Meeting	Purpose
February	• Equity & Access Subcommittee	Present overview and seek feedback on the framework and analytical approach
April	• Equity & Access Subcommittee • Policy Advisory Council	Discuss feedback received and present proposed methodology
July	• Policy Advisory Council	Present the results of the draft 2019 TIP Investment Analysis

Background

As the federally-designated Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Bay Area, MTC is required to ensure that the region's long-range planning process complies with applicable equity and environmental justice requirements. The legal, regulatory, and policy framework for addressing those issues includes:

- Title VI of the Civil Rights Act: states that no person shall be subject to discrimination based on their race, color or national origin under any federally-funded program.
- Federal Guidance on Environmental Justice: requirement that federal programs and funds do not result in disproportionately high and adverse impacts on minority and low-income populations.
- MTC's Environmental Justice Principles: adopted principles that affirm MTC's ongoing commitments to:
 - Create an open and transparent public participation process that empowers disadvantaged communities to participate in decision making that affects them, and
 - Collect accurate and current data essential to defining and understanding the presence and extent of inequities, if any, in transportation funding based on race and income.

MTC satisfies its requirements for equity and environmental justice requirements and policies primarily through the Plan Bay Area 2040 Equity Analysis, Public Participation Plan, and MTC's broader Title VI program. To further build upon MTC's commitment to equity, the TIP Investment Analysis provides the public with an additional opportunity to assess the region's transportation investments, with a specific focus on the equity implications of near-term transportation investments, as included in the TIP.

TIP Investment Analysis

The TIP is a comprehensive list of near-term transportation projects, programs and investment priorities for the nine-county Bay Area. The TIP includes all transportation projects that are federally funded, require a federal action, or are considered regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes. In reviewing TIP investments as a whole, it is important to keep in mind that most transportation projects are local, in both scale and funding, and these projects are typically not reflected in the TIP. These projects include pavement maintenance, transit operations, planning efforts, and minor complete streets improvements.

The TIP Investment Analysis is an assessment of TIP investments through an equity lens, specifically focused on the Bay Area's disadvantaged populations. The analysis has been completed as part of the development of each new TIP since 2008. The TIP is generally updated every two years, and can also be amended in between updates to reflect project or funding changes.

Analytical Approach

The 2017 TIP Investment Analysis

(https://mtc.ca.gov/sites/default/files/Final_2017_TIP_Investment_Analysis.pdf), included the following components:

- ***Population Use-Based Analysis:*** This analysis compares the estimated percent of investments included in the TIP that benefit low-income and minority populations, as well as seniors, to the percent of these populations' relative usage of the transportation system, for both roadways and transit.
- ***Disparate Impact Analysis:*** This analysis compares TIP investments per capita for racial or ethnic minority populations, as a percentage of per capita investments identified for nonminority populations, to investigate whether disadvantaged persons in the region are receiving an equitable share of the benefits from TIP investments on a per capita basis.
- ***Mapped Projects Analysis:*** For the mapped projects analysis, projects in the TIP are mapped over the region's Communities of Concern and census tracts with concentrations of disadvantaged populations that are above the regional average. This analysis provides the public with an opportunity to visualize the distribution of projects planned in the near-term in relation to geographic concentrations of disadvantaged groups to identify any systemic exclusion of groups or imbalances in investments.
- ***Supplemental Information:*** Given the limitations of the data available, a quantitative analysis of TIP investments in relation to the transportation of persons with disabilities has not been included in this analysis in the past. However, the 2017 TIP Investment Analysis did provide a qualitative discussion of regional investments and planning initiatives that support transportation by seniors and persons with disabilities.

In previous analyses, a frequent topic of discussion has been the age of data itself. For the 2019 TIP, staff anticipates using the latest available travel and demographic data, including the 2013 Household Travel Survey, 2012-2017 Transit Passenger Surveys, and the 2016 American Community Survey.

MTC strives to employ best practices in metropolitan planning, and we constantly seek to refine and improve the analytical work that supports our various planning processes. In keeping with MTC's efforts, staff welcomes any additional feedback to further improve upon the approach and methodology for the 2019 TIP Investment Analysis.



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #:	18-0075	Version:	1	Name:	
Type:	Report	Status:		Informational	
File created:	1/19/2018	In control:		Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee	
On agenda:	2/14/2018	Final action:			
Title:	Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update				

MTC initiated this study in 2015 to develop and analyze scenarios for funding and implementing a regional means-based transit fare program or programs in the nine-county Bay Area. The study has been completed; next steps will be discussed.

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: [03_Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update.pdf](#)

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Subject:

Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update

MTC initiated this study in 2015 to develop and analyze scenarios for funding and implementing a regional means-based transit fare program or programs in the nine-county Bay Area. The study has been completed; next steps will be discussed.

Presenter:

Melanie Choy

Recommended Action:

Discussion

Attachments:



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Agenda Item 3

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
TEL 415.778.6700
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Memorandum

TO: Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee DATE: February 7, 2018
FR: Melanie Choy, Programming and Allocations
RE: Regional Means-Based Fare Proposal Update

As follow up to your January 10, 2018 meeting, staff will be presenting additional information on the Regional Means Based Fare proposal. Please see attached presentation for more details.

Staff is seeking your feedback and we welcome your comments.

J:\COMMITTEE\Policy Advisory Council\Subcommittees\Equity & Access Subcommittee\2018\02_2018-Feb\03i_Regional Means Based.docx

Regional Means Based Fare Proposal

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE

FEBRUARY 14, 2018

Proposed Framework from January 2018 MTC Programming and Allocations Committee Meeting

- All 7 large operators to participate
 - SFMTA and VTA continue or expand current programs; small operators may opt in
 - Operators select fare discount rate, minimum set at 20%
 - Focus on cash fares rather than passes
- Offered through Clipper®
- Funding:
 - MTC to invest \$8 M/year in SB 1 – STA Population-based funds to cover administrative cost and defray operator revenue loss.
 - Operators to cover remaining costs/revenue loss.
- Program subject to cancellation if SB1 repealed

Background – Sample of Existing Programs

- SFMTA (Lifeline)
 - 50% Discounted monthly pass
 - Purchase Monthly Stickers
- VTA (UPLIFT and TAP)
 - 2 Programs:
 1. Universal Pass for Life Improvement and Transportation (UPLIFT) - Focus on homeless residents
 2. Transit Assistance Program (TAP) – Focus on low-income residents
 - Discounted monthly passes and subsidized quarterly passes
- LA Metro
 - Discounted monthly pass or 20-ride benefit program
 - Distributed via bus tokens + vouchers
- Seattle – Orca Lift Program
 - 50% Discount
 - Multiple operators participating via Orca card

Clipper[®] Considerations

Why only single-rides and not passes?
Accumulator?

- Single ride program benefits all trips versus pass discount that benefits only frequent users
- BART does not have monthly/multi-ride passes
- Current Clipper[®] system does not support regional monthly accumulator pass

User Outreach

Seek input during the project development phase on how to implement program:

- Ease/ Methods of Access
- How to increase participation rate
- Eligibility Screening Process and Locations
- Title VI analysis likely required

Program Evaluation

Preliminary Suggested Metrics

Quantitative	Qualitative
Number of Sign-ups/Riders	Before/After Survey of Participants
Cost/revenue Impacts	Ease of Use for Riders
Participation Trends, Travel Data from Clipper®	Financial Impact for Riders
Effectiveness of Strategies to Increase Participation	Ease of Administration

Will require resources (staff and funding), and availability of Clipper® data for participants

Next Steps

- Continue soliciting input
 - E&A Subcommittee
 - Transit Operators
- MTC Programming and Allocations Committee
 - Return to Committee as early as March (as follow-up to January Programming and Allocations Committee presentation)



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 18-0042 **Version:** 1 **Name:**

Type: Report **Status:** Informational

File created: 1/11/2018 **In control:** Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee

On agenda: 2/14/2018 **Final action:**

Title: Nominations for 2018-2019 Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Chair and Vice Chair

Nominations for 2018-2019 chair and vice chair of the Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee will be opened and will remain open until the election, scheduled for the March 14, 2018 meeting. Term will be through December 2019.

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: [04i Nominations for Subcommittee Officers.pdf](#)

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Subject:

Nominations for 2018-2019 Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Chair and Vice Chair

Nominations for 2018-2019 chair and vice chair of the Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee will be opened and will remain open until the election, scheduled for the March 14, 2018 meeting. Term will be through December 2019.

Presenter:

Catalina Alvarado, Acting Staff Liaison

Recommended Action:

Discussion

Attachments:



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Agenda Item 4

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
TEL 415.778.6700
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Memorandum

TO: Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee DATE: February 7, 2018
FR: Catalina Alvarado, Acting Staff Liaison W.I. 1114
RE: Nominations for 2018-2019 Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee
Chair and Vice Chair

Nominations for the 2018-2019 Chair and Vice Chair of the Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee will be opened next week at your February 14, 2018 meeting. The nomination period will remain open until the election, which is currently scheduled for your March 14, 2018 meeting.

As a reminder, the Chair and Vice Chair positions are two-year terms (effective upon election) ending December 2019, and potential candidates are allowed to nominate themselves.

If you would like to make a nomination, you may make it in person at next week's meeting, or you may submit it to staff following that meeting any time before the election on March 14, 2018.

J:\COMMITTEE\Policy Advisory Council\Subcommittees\Equity & Access Subcommittee\2018\02_2018-Feb\04i_Nominations_for_Subcommittee_Officers.docx