

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2025, 9:25 AM

CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE REMOTE PARTICIPANTS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME TO SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. ITEM ONE IS ROLL CALL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: GOOD MORNING. CHAIR NOACK?

CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS?

V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

6

7 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

10

11 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

14

15 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

18

19 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE GIACOPINI?

24

25 **DOREEN M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE? ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN?
3 MANFREE?

4

5 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND YOU'RE AT THE REMOTE LOCATION AT?

8

9 **AMBER MANFREE:** 1195 THIRD STREET NAPA. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MELGAR? IS ABSENT. MILEY? IS ABSENT.
12 PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

17

18 **BELIA RAMOS:** PRESENT FROM 1195 THIRD STREET NAPA.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANKS SO MUCH. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS
21 ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL THOSE ABLE PLEASE STAND AND JOIN ME FOR
24 THE PLEDGE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO
25 THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH
2 LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL." THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE
3 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
6 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
7 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
8 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
9 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
10 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ITEM FOUR IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT.
13 BEFORE WE GET INTO THE BUSINESS OF THE DAY, SADLY, IT'S MY
14 DUTY TO ANNOUNCE THAT TODAY'S MEETING WILL BE ADJOURNED IN
15 HONOR AND IN MEMORY OF PETER LEE, A BELOVED MTC STAFF VETERAN
16 OF ALMOST 28 YEARS WHO PASSED AWAY NOVEMBER 21ST. PETER WAS A
17 TALENTED ENGINEER WHO CONTRIBUTED TO DOZENS OF PROJECTS ALL
18 AROUND THE BAY AREA INCLUDING THE NEW BAY BRIDGE EAST SPAN AND
19 CARQUINEZ AND BENICIA MARTINEZ BRIDGES CURRENT MEMBERS OF THE
20 COMMISSION MAY BEST REMEMBER PETER IF HIS PRESENTATIONS ON THE
21 TOLL BRIDGE MAINTENANCE AND REHABILITATION AND TOLL
22 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS PETER IS SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE
23 ASHLEY WYNN WHO WAS HONORED BY THE COMMISSION EARLIER THIS
24 FALL WITH RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION UPON HER RETIREMENT FROM
25 MTC STAFF AND BY THEIR CHILDREN MATTHEW AND OLIVIA WE WILL



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ADJOURN TODAY'S MEETING IN MEMORY OF PETER. TURNING OVER TO
2 DIRECTOR FREMIER.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE
5 OPPORTUNITY TO SAY A FEW WORDS ABOUT MY FRIEND AND COLLEAGUE
6 AS MENTIONED IN THE CHAIR'S NOTES PETER REPRESENTED MTC AND
7 BATA FOR NEARLY THREE DECADES ALMOST AS LONG AS BATA EXISTED
8 HE WELCOMED ME INTO THE BUILDING WHEN I WAS HIRED TO DELIVER
9 THE BRIDGE PROGRAM AND WAS HERE ALL THE WAY THROUGH. I WANT TO
10 SAY THREE THINGS ABOUT PETER I HOPE YOU'RE PATIENT BECAUSE AS
11 YOU CAN SEE IT'S A BIT HARD. FIRST AND FOREMOST PETER WAS A
12 FAMILY MAN FOR THE PAST DECADE HAS BEEN MANAGING A VARIETY OF
13 FAMILY HEALTH ISSUES AND ENSURED HIS FAMILY WAS ABLE TO GET
14 WHEREVER THEY NEEDED TO GET AND ALL THE CARE THEY NEEDED ALSO
15 WAS MENTIONED BY CHAIR NOACK, RAISING TWO WONDERFUL KIDS
16 MATTHEW ANNE OLIVIA ATTENDING ALL THEIR EVENTS AND ACTIVITIES.
17 SECOND FOR THOSE THAT FOLLOW THE BIG-TIME SPORTS YOU HEAR OF
18 THE COACHING TREES, THE CONCEPT REFLECTS A LEADER'S ABILITY TO
19 GENERATE NEW TALENT AND GROWS INTO THE NEXT GENERATION OF
20 LEADERS PETER WAS BEHIND MOST OF THE HIRINGS IN BOTH BATA AND
21 SAFE AND THAT NEW TALENT YOU HAVE SEEN OVER THE YEARS HAS
22 GROWN TO BE STRONG AND DEPENDABLE FOSTERED AND DEVELOPED
23 RELATIONSHIPS FOR THE PRIVILEGE PROGRAM AND ALSO SAFE PROGRAMS
24 THAT KEEP OUR RESIDENTS SAFE'S THEY MOVE AROUND THE REGION
25 WE'RE IN GOOD SHAPE WITH THE FOLKS THAT HE BROUGHT INTO THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 AGENCY. FINALLY THE BATA BRIDGE PROGRAM YOU KNOW I ALWAYS
2 REFERRED TO THE BRIDGE PROGRAM AS JOINT VENTURE WITH STATE OF
3 CALIFORNIA PETER UNDERSTOOD THAT FROM THE BEGINNING IN FACT
4 HIS PRESENTATIONS ON THE BRIDGES ALSO LEAD WITH WE AND NOT
5 THEM I THINK ONLY COMMISSIONER JAKE GIACOPINI WAS WITH US AT
6 THE TIME BUT PETER LED A PROGRAM THAT WAS OVER \$1 BILLION OF
7 IMPROVEMENT OVER 15 YEARS INCLUDING THE SEISMIC PROGRAM IN THE
8 BENICIA MARTINEZ BRIDGE AND MANY OTHER PROGRAMS ASSOCIATED
9 WITH THE REGIONAL MEASURE ONE THEY WERE EXTREMELY CHALLENGING
10 AND IT WAS A PERIOD THAT WAS UNPARALLELED IN THE BAY AREA
11 HISTORY EXCEPT FOR PROBABLY THE BUILDING OF THE GOLDEN GATE
12 BRIDGE AND THE BAY BRIDGE IN THE '30S PETER WAS ALSO CALTRANS
13 WHISPERER HE WAS ALLOWED BEHIND THE CURTAIN THAT GAVE BATA A
14 REAL OPPORTUNITY TO BE AT THE TABLE AND MAKE HARD DECISIONS ON
15 THE PROGRAM WITH THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND NOT JUST FULL THE
16 STATE'S RECORD HE REALLY BUILT CREDIBILITY AROUND THE DELIVERY
17 CHALLENGES THAT OCCURRED WHEN THE BRIDGE PROJECT WAS STALLED
18 THAT REALLY LED TO AB 144 AND BATA AS NEW INVOLVEMENT FAILED
19 ON THE EXISTING BAY BRIDGE DURING CONSTRUCTION ONE LABOR DAY
20 AND OF COURSE THE BOLT FAILURE THAT ALMOST DELAYED THE OPENING
21 OF THE NEW BAY BRIDGE I'M SURE THAT WITHOUT PETER THE SEISMIC
22 PROGRAM UNDER BATA'S WATCH WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN DELIVERED ON
23 TIME OR UNDER BUDGET AS IT WAS AND I NOTE AS I NOTE IN THE
24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT WE WILL PAY TRIBUTE TO PETER IN
25 THE NEW YEAR AND THANK YOU FROM THE BOTTOM OF MY HEART FOR



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ALLOWING US TO CLOSE THE MEETING IN HONOR OF OUR FRIEND PETER.

2 BACK TO YOU CHAIR NOACK.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU DIFFICULT TIME FOR EVERYONE. THANK

5 YOU FOR THOSE LOVELY REMARKS. ALL RIGHT WE'LL MOVE ON TO

6 AGENDA ITEM FIVE WHICH IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. IS THERE

7 ANYBODY THAT HIS COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? CAN I HAVE A MOTION?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WANTED TO ASK TO PULL AN ITEM, 3B.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. EXCLUDING 3B DO WE HAVE A MOTION

14 FOR THE REST OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

17

18 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** SECOND.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOTION AND SECOND FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR

21 EXCLUDING 3B.

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR IS IT 5B?

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY. NOT 3B. SORRY. 5B. I'M LOOKING AT



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 PAGE THREE. SORRY. FIVE. THANK YOU FOR THAT CORRECTION. 5B AND
2 FIRST PUBLIC COMMENT. RIGHT?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND BEFORE WE DO THAT, I GOT THE SECOND AS
5 EZZY ASHCRAFT. WHO WAS THE FIRST?

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CANDACE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING SEE NO
10 HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CORRECT ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

19

20 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

23

24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

6

7 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

10

11 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

14

15 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE? ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LEE?

22

23 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? PARDON. MANFREE?



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MELGAR IS ABSENT. MILEY? ABSENT. PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** YES RAMOS?

7

8 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
11 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA YOU WANT TO DISCUSS
14 5B?

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR, THIS CAME AS --
17 I BROUGHT IT UP LAST WEEK AT OUR COMMITTEE MEETING, AS WELL,
18 WE RECEIVED A LETTER FROM VTA'S GENERAL MANAGER CAROLYN GONOT
19 ABOUT IT, BUT THERE SEEMS TO BE A DISCREPANCY AROUND THE
20 EXPECTATION AND COMMITMENT FOR THE REMAINING \$6 MILLION IN
21 EXPRESS LANE FUNDS. THIS WAS A CHART ON A SIX CHART IN THE
22 REPORT, AS MENTIONED, GENERAL MANAGER GONOT SENT A LETTER
23 QUESTIONING THE LISTED PRIORITIZATION OF THE UNALLOCATED \$60
24 MILLION OF THE RM3 FUNDS EXPRESS LANES TOTAL OF 316 MILLION. I
25 KNOW THE CHAIR MENTIONED THAT YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF THE ENTIRE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 16 MILLION WAS PRIORITIZED TO CONTRA COSTA, BUT BECAUSE OF THE
2 DISCREPANCY AND EXPECTATIONS, I ASK THAT WE HAVE A REPORT-OUT
3 EITHER TODAY OR NEXT MONTH OF THE WHOLE PROGRAM ON THE
4 ALLOCATIONS OF THE EXPRESS LANE FUNDS TO DATE, AND A
5 DISCUSSION OF THE REMAINING \$60 MILLION. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO
6 MAKE AN ALTERNATE MOTION. I CAN SUPPORT SUBMITTING THE REPORT
7 TO THE STATE IF IT CLEARLY STATES THAT THE PRIORITIZATION OF
8 THE REMAINING \$60 MILLION REMAINS UNRESOLVED. AND, SO, MY
9 MOTION WOULD BE TO SUPPORT SUBMITTING THE REQUIRED REPORT TO
10 THE STATE WITH A CLEAR NOTE TO THE STATE THAT THE
11 PRIORITIZATION OF THE REMAINING \$60 MILLION REMAINS UNRESOLVED
12 AND A COMMITMENT FROM MR. PREMIER TO DISCUSS THIS NEXT MONTH.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANDY, OR ALIX, YOU BOTH HAVE FINGERS ON YOUR
16 --

17

18 **ANDREW PREMIER:** YEAH, LOOK, I'M HAPPY, WE DID COMMIT TO COMING
19 BACK IN JANUARY, SO, ABSOLUTELY, COMMISSIONER -- CHAIR ABE-
20 KOGA. I WANT TO POINT OUT THOUGH THAT WE BELIEVE THAT THE
21 ANNUAL REPORT AS WRITTEN IS CONSISTENT WITH MTC RESOLUTION
22 4411, AND ITS EXCERPT BASICALLY SAYS THAT THE RESERVES GIVES
23 PRIORITY TO THE I-680 NORTHBOUND IN CONTRA COSTA WHICH HAS
24 SECURED ALL FULL FUNDING INCLUDING \$116 MILLION IN MEGA FUNDS
25 AND IS ON TRACK TO MEET THOSE CONDITIONS. OBVIOUSLY THAT'S A



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 PRIORITY AND IF THAT DOESN'T SHAKE OUT, WE HAVE A DIFFERENT
2 DECISION THAT THE COMMISSION WOULD ASK -- WE WOULD ASK OF THE
3 COMMISSION BUT WE BELIEVE THE REPORT IS CONSISTENT WITH THE
4 RESOLUTION.

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES, THANK YOU. SO, MY OFFICE, WE DID SOME
7 RESEARCH, AND I REMEMBER PARTS OF THIS WHOLE ISSUE, AND I KNOW
8 WE TOOK SOME VOTES, BUT IT TURNS OUT THAT THOSE THAT WE TOOK
9 HAD TO DO WITH THE BAY SURPLUS FUNDING THAT WOULD HAVE
10 SUPPLEMENTED THE CONTRA COSTA PROJECT SO THE 60 MILLION WAS
11 NOT GOING TO COVER THE ENTIRE PROJECT AT THAT TIME. SO THERE
12 WOULD BE SURPLUS FUNDS I BELIEVE OF 20 MILLION THAT WAS WHAT
13 THE VOTE WAS ON AND WE NEVER APPARENTLY TOOK A VOTE ON THE \$60
14 MILLION ALLOCATION. PRIOR TO MY TIME, IN 2020, THERE WAS A
15 VOTE TAKEN ON THE OTHER PROJECTS BUT FROM THEN ON WE ACTUALLY
16 NEVER TOOK A VOTE ON THE 60 MILLION FOR THIS MONEY. SO, IT WAS
17 THE FIFA FUNDS THAT WE TOOK TO VOTE ON. SO THAT WAS -- I WOULD
18 JUST ASK STAFF TO, YOU KNOW, LOOK BACK AND CONFIRM THAT, THAT
19 THAT IS OUR UNDERSTANDING FROM LOOKING BACK AT OUR RECORDS.

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, AGAIN, WE'RE COMMITTED TO
22 COMING BACK AND TALKING TO THE COMMISSION. I JUST WANT TO BE
23 CLEAR AND WHAT'S ATTACHED TO THE REPORT IS AN ADOPTED
24 RESOLUTION. IT'S RESOLUTION 4411 WHICH WAS ADOPTED ON MARCH OF
25 2020, AND IT WAS THEN REVISED, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 TIMES. SO, WHAT



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 IS INCLUDED TO THE LEGISLATURE IS A -- ANNE ADOPTED RESOLUTION
2 BY THE COMMISSION. AND, AGAIN, I THINK THERE IS CERTAINLY
3 OPPORTUNITIES TO REVISE THAT. BUT I JUST WANTED TO BE CAUTIOUS
4 IN THE DIRECTION THAT YOU GIVE US, YOU KNOW, WE WERE ATTACHING
5 AN ADOPTED RESOLUTION BY THE COMMISSION. SO, I JUST WANTED TO
6 MAKE SURE THAT WAS CLEAR. IT'S NOT ALLOCATION, AGAIN, IT WAS
7 AN ADOPTED RESOLUTION THAT HAD A FOOTNOTE AROUND THE 60
8 MILLION, AND OBVIOUSLY, STILL FOR FUTURE CONSIDERATION BY THIS
9 COMMISSION HOW YOU WANT TO ADDRESS, BUT, AGAIN, I JUST WANTED
10 TO BE CLEAR THAT THIS WAS AN ADOPTED RESOLUTION RIGHT NOW
11 THAT'S ATTACHED.

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SO, YES, I THINK IT'S JUST ADDING THAT THE
14 REMAINING 60 MILLION REMAINS TO BE RESOLVED. SO, YOU KNOW,
15 THAT COULD GO WITH ALL OF THIS, BUT THE OTHER PIECE TO IT IS,
16 I THINK WE HAVE TO ACTUALLY RESOLVE THAT, AND BECAUSE THERE
17 ARE, YOU KNOW, OTHER PROJECTS, I REMEMBER THE WHOLE DISCUSSION
18 ABOUT SURPLUS AND WOULD LIKE TO GET AN UPDATE ON THAT TOO
19 BECAUSE SINCE THAT FUNDING WAS GOING TO CONTRA COSTA AND WE
20 WERE TOLD THAT VTA IS NOT PART OF BAIFA SO WE COULDN'T QUALIFY
21 FOR THAT FUNDING SO THEN WONDERING COULD WE BE USING BAIFA
22 FUND TO PAY FOR MORE CONTRA COSTA SO THAT'S WHY I WOULD ALSO
23 INCLUDE ANOTHER PROJECT SO THAT'S WHY I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
24 THIS ITEM BROUGHT BACK. IF THE MOTION COULD INCLUDE DISH KNOW
25 IT'S IN THERE BUT REALLY CLARIFY THAT 60 MILLION IS STILL YET



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 TO THE DETERMINED.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK ALIX'S COMMENT IS THAT WE'RE JUST
4 SENDING AN EARLIER APPROVED RESOLUTION. SO THERE IS NOT --
5 THERE IS NOTHING -- BUT THAT'S THE ATTACHMENT TO THE
6 RESOLUTION. SO, IT'S NOT A SEPARATE PIECE, IT'S JUST THE
7 ATTACHMENT TO THE RESOLUTION THAT WE'RE FORWARDING. SO.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** BRING BRINGING THIS BACK
10 AS A SEPARATE ITEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** BRINGING IT BACK IN JANUARY TO DISCUSS AS
13 MENTIONED AT THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS THAT ALEX AND ANDY
14 COMMITTED TO BRING BACK THE PROJECTS, ALLOCATIONS, FUNDING
15 ALREADY IN JANUARY. SO, THIS IS JUST A REPORT -- THIS IS JUST
16 A FORWARDING ON AN APPROVED RESOLUTION TO THE LEGISLATURE AS
17 TO WHAT'S IN -- AND THAT JUST HAPPENS TO BE AN ATTACHMENT. SO,
18 WE WOULD BE CHANGING AN APPROVED RESOLUTION THIS'S ALREADY IN
19 PLACE. NOT CHANGING --

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I DO THINK THE OPPORTUNITY, COMMISSIONER ABE-
22 KOGA, TO TALK ABOUT IT AS WE GET CLOSER TO IT ALLOCATION. THE
23 RESOLUTION AS PRESENTED TALKED ABOUT PRIORITIES WHICH THE
24 COMMISSION APPROVED BUT IT HASN'T GOTTEN TO THE ALLOCATION
25 POINT. SO, I THINK ROBUST DISCUSSION IN JANUARY IS HEALTHY



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 THEN THERE IS OPPORTUNITY AS THE CONTRA COSTA PROJECT MOVES OR
2 DOESN'T MOVE TO HAVE A CONVERSATIONS ABOUT THE ALLOCATION. I
3 JUST DON'T THINK THE AMENDMENT IS NECESSARY WAY THIS IS
4 PROPOSED. BUT I WILL FOLLOW THE DIRECTION OF THE CHAIR AND THE
5 COMMISSION.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YOU'RE LOOKING AT ME? I HEARD A CALL FOR THE QUESTION
10 WHICH I'M HAPPY WITH IF EVERYBODY ELSE IS.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER]

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I WANT HERE BACK WHEN WE WERE TALKING ABOUT RM3 IN
15 2018 SO I WOULD LOVE CLARITY BUT IT LOOKS LIKE IN JANUARY
16 WE'LL BE ABLE TO COME BACK AND DISCUSS ALLOCATION OF THOSE
17 FUNDS AND HOPEFULLY GET UPDATE ON HISTORY AROUND RM3 AND SOME
18 OF THESE OTHER FUNDING SOURCES AND WHAT, SORT OF, INTENTION OF
19 THE PEOPLE WHO PUT IT TOGETHER AND VOTERS AT THE TIME WAS. I
20 KNOW VTA SENT THIS LETTER HAS MTC CLARIFIED KIND OF YOUR
21 INTERPRETATION AND SENT THAT BACK GIVEN THEM A RESPONSE YET?

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE DON'T OWE THEM A RESPONSE IT'S COMMON
24 CONVERSATION THOUGH SO I THINK CAROLYN IS FAMILIAR WITH WHAT
25 OUR RESPONSE HAS BEEN BUT I ASSURE YOU WE SHOULD BE RESPONDING



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 IN SHORT.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** APPRECIATE IT.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. CHAIR PAPAN? I'M GOING AROUND.

6 ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY I CAN REMOVE THE

9 MOTION. AS LONG AS THE ITEM IS COMING BACK IN JANUARY.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** IF THIS IS APPROPRIATE WE COULD IN EARLY JULY GET

14 A BRIEFING, THE GOVERNOR'S LOAN THAT'S SUPPOSED TO GO THROUGH

15 MTC I KNOW THAT I'M JUST BRINGING IT UP BECAUSE IT'S

16 LEGISLATIVE THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL I'M SURE IT WILL BE ON THE

17 LEGISLATIVE SOME OF US ARE NOT ON THE FRIDAY COMMISSION. I

18 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO GET IT BEFORE THE WHOLE BODY.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY WE CAN CERTAINLY COMMIT TO --

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IT'S NOT BEEN DECIDED IT'S GOING TO GO THROUGH

23 MTC JUST TO BE CLEAR THOUGH THIS WAS PROPOSAL BY DO. IF WE ARE

24 WORKING WITH THE OPERATORS AND DOF TO PROTECT THE COMMISSION

25 AND PROTECT THE PROJECTS PROTECT THE OPERATING WE'RE COMMITTED



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 TO.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. MOTION ON 5B?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOTION FROM ANDERSON SECOND FROM MASHBURN.

10 BEFORE I GET TO MASHCRAFT, I HAVE GOT TO MOVE YOU TWO,

11 SEPARATE YOU TWO.

12

13 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** WE'RE JUST GOING TO CHANGE OUR NAMES.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. I APPRECIATE THAT.

16 ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. PARDON ME. CHAIR NOACK?

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

23

24 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

14

15 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

18

19 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LEE?

5 MAHAN? MANFREE?

6

7 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MASHBURN?

10

11 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MELGAR? IS ABSENT. MILEY? ABSENT. PAPAN.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

18

19 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

22 PRESENT. [LAUGHTER] I THINK WE BOTH MESSED OCCUPY -- UP ON

23 THAT ONE. IS THERE ANYONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE OR IN THE ROOM

24 THAT WOULD LIKE TO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 5B? I HAVE

25 RECEIVED NOTHING NO WRITING FOR THIS ITEM NO RAISED HANDS AND



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

4

5 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** CHAIR, IF YOU COULD PUT YOUR MIC ON,
6 PLEASE.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT KEEPS GOING OFF. I'M NOT USED TO THIS.

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

15 YOUR LIGHT ON? WE'LL GO TO ITEM SIX GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT DO

16 WE HAVE ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING NO WRITING, ON SEE

19 NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED

20 THE PODIUM.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WONDERFUL. ITEM SEVEN IS ADJOURNMENT. WE'LL

23 ADJOURN THIS MEETING IN MEMORY OF PETER LEE THE NEXT REGULAR

24 MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD

25 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO



DECEMBER 17, 2025

- 1 ON WEDNESDAY JANUARY 28TH, 2026. WE ARE ADJOURNED. PLEASE
- 2 STAND BY FOR THE BAHFA MEETING. [ADJOURNED]