

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, MARCH 25, 2026, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE  
6 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS MEETING IS BEING  
7 WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. REMOTE PARTICIPANTS WISHING TO  
8 SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND  
9 YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON TO SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES  
10 WILL BE CALLED UPON BY LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.  
11 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. ITEM ONE IS  
12 ROLL CALL. WILL THE CLERK CALL ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM? READY?

13 [LAUGHTER]

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR NOACK?

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

24

25 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AMBUEHL? IS ABSENT. ANDERSEN?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

7

8 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

11

12 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO? IS ABSENT. FLEMING? ABSENT.

15 GIACOPINI NON-VOTING?

16

17 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

20

21 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE? IS ABSENT. MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

24

25 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MASHBURN?

3

4 **MITCH MASHBURN:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MELGAR? MILEY? IS ABSENT. PAPAN? IS HERE.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

11

12 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. AND QUORUM  
15 IS PRESENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. AGENDA ITEM TWO IS PLEDGE  
18 OF ALLEGIANCE. EVERYBODY THAT IS ABLE, PLEASE STAND AND JOIN  
19 ME FOR PLEDGE. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE  
20 TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE  
21 REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,  
22 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION  
25 ANNOUNCEMENT?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING  
3 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE  
4 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP  
5 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
6 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
7 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM FOUR IS CHAIR'S  
10 REPORT. I JUST WANTED TO INDICATE THAT WE HAD OUR FIRST  
11 MEETING OF THE FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE FOR THE NEW  
12 SPECIAL DISTRICT UNDER SB63. IT WAS REALLY JUST AN  
13 INTRODUCTORY MEETING. SO, WE'LL BE MEETING AGAIN IN APRIL. SO,  
14 HOPEFULLY NEXT MONTH WE'LL HAVE MORE TO TALK ABOUT. AGENDA  
15 ITEM 5A IS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
16 FREMIER, PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD MORNING, CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS.  
19 I'LL GO THROUGH A COUPLE OF THESE ITEMS LAST SUNDAY MARCH 22nd  
20 COMMISSIONERS BURT, ABE-KOGA, AND MELGAR HAD OPPORTUNITY TO  
21 CELEBRATE NAMING OF THE NEW CALTRAIN ELECTRIC TRAIN FOR  
22 SPEAKER EMERITA NANCY PELOSI. IT WAS REALLY, SORT OF, KICKOFF  
23 OF WOMEN'S HISTORY MONTH AND DEDICATION REALLY RECOGNIZED AS  
24 THE GREAT RELATIONSHIP WE HAVE ALL HAD WITH HER DURING HER 38  
25 YEARS. THAT WAS FESTIVE. I SAW THE NEWS CLIPS ON IT. THE NEXT



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ITEM IS PRETTY SIGNIFICANT IT'S ABOUT THE CALENVIROSCREEN,  
2 WHICH IS A STATEWIDE TOOL USED TO IDENTIFY DISADVANTAGED  
3 COMMUNITIES, AND BASED ON THE CUMULATIVE ENVIRONMENTAL AND  
4 POPULATION BURDENS IT DETERMINES ELIGIBILITY, INCORPORATES  
5 UPDATED CENSUS DATA AND IT HAS A NEW UPDATE, VERSION FIVE THAT  
6 HAS CHANGED, SORT OF, THE DEFINITION AND WHERE SOME OF THESE  
7 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE IDENTIFIED. IN THE BAY AREA, IT  
8 INCREASED THE NUMBER OF TRACKS WE HAVE, THE DISADVANTAGED  
9 COMMUNITY TRACKS FROM 113 TO 122. BUT IT REALLY DOESN'T DO  
10 WELL IN TERMS OF ITS EVALUATION STATE REPRESENTATION. SO THERE  
11 IS JUST A SMALL NUMBER OF BAY AREA TRACKS THAT QUALIFY IN THIS  
12 CURRENT VERSION COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS VERSION. SO, WE'RE  
13 WORKING CURRENTLY ON A COMMENT LETTER FOR SUBMITTAL TO THE  
14 CALIFORNIA OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENTS  
15 IN ADVANCE OF THE APRIL 1ST DEADLINE. WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE  
16 TO MONITOR AND UPDATE HOW THE PROCESS IS GOING AND CONTINUE TO  
17 WORK ON TRYING TO FIND A WAY TO GET A BETTER REFLECTION OF HOW  
18 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ARE IDENTIFIED IN THE REGION. SO,  
19 WE'LL BE GIVING A MORE COMPLETE UPDATE NEXT MONTH AT THE  
20 PLANNING AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEES. AND I BELIEVE  
21 COMMISSIONER AHN MIGHT HAVE A FEW ADDITIONAL WORDS TO SAY WHEN  
22 I FINISH UP THESE LAST COUPLE OF ITEMS. ONE MORE THING TO  
23 NOTE. ON MARCH 17th AND 18TH, A WHOLE BUNCH OF US WENT TO  
24 SACRAMENTO ALONG WITH COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG MEMBERS WE HAD  
25 THREE FOCUSED DISCUSSIONS WITH OUR LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES, I



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THOUGHT IT WAS VERY SUCCESSFUL. WE TALKED ABOUT PROTECTING  
2 TRANSIT AND HOUSING INVESTMENTS FOR NEXT YEAR'S BUDGET SEEKING  
3 \$15 MILLION AS ONE TIME FUNDS TO CEMETERY THE WORK WE'RE DOING  
4 WITH BAHFA AND THEN ALSO SUPPORTING CABALDON'S BILL SB1087  
5 THAT'S SPONSORED BY MTC AND ABAG AND DESIGNED TO UPDATE AND  
6 MODERNIZE SB 375 THAT TALKS ABOUT HOW WE MANAGE IN THE  
7 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES ENVIRONMENT. THE LAST THING I WANT TO  
8 MENTION IS ANOTHER CELEBRATION ON MARCH 5TH, CHAIR NOACK,  
9 ALONG WITH VICE CHAIR ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE VICE CHAIR LISA  
10 MOTOYAMA, HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK AT A RIBBON CUTTING, OR  
11 GROUNDBREAKING FOR SOME AFFORDABLE HOUSING BEING BUILT AND  
12 SUPPORTED BY BAHFA IN THE EL CERRITO PLAZA BART STATION. SO,  
13 THAT WAS REALLY EXCITING AND WELL SERVED. AND I THINK AT THAT  
14 POINT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER AHN, MAYBE.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. JUST TWO BRIEF POINTS ON  
19 CALENVIROSCREEN WHICH IS NOW A 10-YEAR STRUGGLE FOR THIS  
20 COMMISSION AS WELL AS THE AIR DISTRICT. IN CASE YOU DON'T --  
21 I'LL JUST OUTLINE WHAT IT DOES AND WHY IT MATTERS. WHAT IT  
22 DOES IS ESSENTIALLY FAILS TO MAP THE BAY AREA AND DIRECTOR  
23 FREMIER HAS MENTIONED THE PERCENTAGES BUT I THINK IT'S  
24 IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THE STORY OF COMMUNITIES AND HOW THIS  
25 COMPLEX 21 FACTOR TOOL ESSENTIALLY DOESN'T INCLUDE THE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 COMMUNITIES THAT MANY COMMISSIONERS CARE ABOUT EVEN FROM MY  
2 EARLIEST DAYS AS A NON-PROFIT ADVOCATE BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT  
3 IT WAS HARD TO GET THAT COMMUNITY INCLUDED AND THE REACTION  
4 FROM SCIENTIFIC UNIT CREATED THIS TOOL ALWAYS STUCK WITH ME  
5 SINCE WHICH WAS HEARD THERE IS A CONDO BEING BUILT IN BAYVIEW-  
6 HUNTERS POINT IS THAT REALLY DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY IN MANY  
7 WAYS AN EXAMPLE WHERE ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE FAILS TO MEET  
8 POLICY NEEDS COMMUNITY NEEDS AROUND THIS THAT LEADS ME TO THE  
9 SECOND POINT WHY IT MATTERS SHAPES OVER \$12.8 BILLION OF CAP  
10 AND INVEST FUNDING SO 70% FULL ALONE IS CHANNELLED THROUGH  
11 THIS TOOL THROUGH DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES DEFINITION WHICH  
12 IS ROUGHLY \$9 BILLION FOR TRANSIT HOUSING ENERGY SO MUCH MORE  
13 IN THE STATE BUT FAR BEYOND THAT DE FACTO DEFINITION FOR  
14 EQUITY AS COMMISSIONERS HERE TALK ABOUT EQUITY I WANT TO THINK  
15 ABOUT THE COMMUNITIES THAT YOU THINK SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN OUR  
16 UPCOMING APRIL 1ST LETTER ANYWHERE FROM EAST PALO ALTO IN THE  
17 CITY CANAL AREA IN SAN RAFAEL ALVISO SAN JOSE ALL COMMUNITIES  
18 WHICH ARE NOT INCLUDED IN CURRENT VERSION OF CALENVIROSCREEN.  
19 AND KEEP IN MIND THIS DEFINITION WILL SHAPE THE NEXT 5 TO 10  
20 YEARS WORTH OF WORK, GIVEN THE WAY THE STATE LEGISLATURE  
21 WORKS. AND THE WAY THE STATE AGENCIES GRAPPLE WITH THIS TOOL.  
22 I THANK MTC FOR THE ATTENTION TO UPCOMING, WOULD LOVE TO SEE  
23 THE PUBLIC COMMENT LETTER. SHOUT OUT TO THE COMMUNITIES THAT  
24 WE CARE ABOUT.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER AHN. APPRECIATE  
2 THAT. PUBLIC COMMENTS? NO COMMISSIONER COMMENTS FIRST.  
3 COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

4

5 **MYRNA MELGAR:** I SHARE YOUR FRUSTRATION AND WOULD LOVE TO LEARN  
6 MORE FROM YOU ABOUT HOW EXACTLY WE CAN, SORT OF, HELP RECTIFY  
7 THE PROCESS. SO, I THIS YEAR HAD, SORT OF, THE OPPOSITE, BUT  
8 SAME -- [LAUGHTER] -- EXPERIENCE WITH THE CALENVIROSCREEN  
9 TOOL, BECAUSE WE, OF COURSE, USED IT TO DETERMINE OUR PRIORITY  
10 EQUITY COMMUNITIES IN OUR UPZONING PLAN THAT WE WERE REQUIRED  
11 TO DO BY STATE LAW. AND, YOU KNOW, IN MY DISTRICT, WHICH IS A  
12 FAIRLY WEALTHY DISTRICT, THE CALENVIROSCREEN TOOL IDENTIFY A  
13 BUNCH OF PARCELS AS, YOU KNOW, BEING DISADVANTAGED  
14 COMMUNITIES, WHICH WE'RE DEFINITELY NOT, INCLUDING THE SAN  
15 FRANCISCO GOLF COURSE WHICH IS A PRIVATE GOLF COURSE THAT  
16 REQUIRES A VERY HIGH ENTRY FEE TO BE A MEMBER OF, FOR EXAMPLE.  
17 SO, YOU KNOW, ON ONE HAND COMMUNITIES THAT SHOULD BE INCLUDED  
18 ARE NOT, AND ON THE OTHER HAND, YOU KNOW, THERE IS SOMETHING  
19 WRONG WITH THE SCREENING TOOL IF WE HAVE THE SAN FRANCISCO  
20 GOLF COURSE INCLUDED AS A PRIORITY -- YOU KNOW, AS A  
21 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY UNTO THE CALIFORNIA SCREENING TOOLS. I  
22 REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO DOING THAT. IT'S FOUNDATIONAL TO A LOT  
23 OF THE PLANNING THAT WE DO AND IT NEEDS TO BE MORE TARGETED.  
24 AND REFLECT BETTER DATA SETS. SO, THANK YOU.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH, NO, PLEASE.

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** THANK YOU. I KNOW THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT FOR  
4 INSTANCE HAS USED CALENVIROSCREEN UNDER SB1,000 IN EASTERN SAN  
5 FRANCISCO ALONE IT'S NOT JUST BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT THAT  
6 STRUGGLE TO BE MAPPED CHINATOWN, SOUTH OF MARKET, TENDERLOIN,  
7 MISSION DISTRICT OF COURSE EX-CELLS YOUR VISITATION VALLEY  
8 SOME OTHER COMMUNITIES, SO OTHER WORDS STILL MISSES A LOT I  
9 THINK IT WILL BE GREAT APRIL 1ST COMMENT DEADLINE BUT THIS IS  
10 IN SOME WAYS WILL BE GRINDING 3, 6 MONTH STRUGGLE HOW TO  
11 IMPROVE THIS TOOL THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? NO.  
14 EDDIE, I'M SURE, WILL KEEP US INFORMED AS TO WHAT WE CAN DO.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SUE, I WANTED TO THANK OUR  
17 STAFF FOR THE SACRAMENTO TRIP PLANNING. IT WAS WORTHWHILE, I  
18 HOPE MORE OF YOU CAN JOIN US NEXT TIME. WE HAD THREE TEAMS  
19 RED, BLUE, AND GREEN TEAMS THAT WENT AROUND AND VISITED OUR  
20 LOCAL LEGISLATURES IT WAS WELL ORGANIZED. IT WAS WELL  
21 EXECUTED. I THINK IT WAS VALUABLE TO HAVE US IN FRONT OF OUR  
22 LEGISLATORS MAKING THE MESSAGE POINTS THAT ANDY DESCRIBES. SO,  
23 THANK TO EVERYONE, AND SPECIAL THANKS TO SANDY GUERRERA WHO  
24 QUARTERBACKED THE WHOLE THING.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES, I WOULD ADD MY THANKS TO THE GROUP. IT  
2 WAS, I THINK, A VERY PRODUCTIVE MEETINGS, SO A LOT OF GOOD  
3 ONES WITH A LOT OF OUR REPRESENTATIVES. SO I AGREE THANK YOU  
4 SANDY WHEREVER YOU ARE. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. I SEE ROLAND  
7 LEBRUN'S HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD  
8 YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** TWO MINUTES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. LEBRUN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.  
13 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. I CANNOT TELL YOU HOW EXCITED I AM  
16 ABOUT CALENVIROSCREEN, AND I HOPE WHEN THIS IS COMING TO THE  
17 PLANNING COMMISSION, YOU'RE GOING TO SEE THIS GREAT BIG HUGE  
18 BLOB IN SOUTH BAY CALLED GILROY AND FRANKLY IF WE HAD THAT 25  
19 YEARS AGO WE WOULD HAVE HAD VIABLE SERVICE TO GILROY. THANK  
20 YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ADDITIONAL HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM  
23 SPACE.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT ITEM SIX COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. ANY



MARCH 25, 2026

1 COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO GIVE COMMENTS OR MAKE  
2 ANNOUNCEMENTS? NO? ITEM SEVEN CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS 7A  
3 THROUGH 7H.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO PULL ITEM 7D PLEASE.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** D. OKAY. SO WE'LL PULL 7D. ANYONE ELSE?

8 OKAY. CAN I HAVE A MOTION FOR 7A THROUGH SEVEN --

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** I'LL MOVE WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE ITEM  
11 BEING PULLED.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CAN I HAVE A SECOND? THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY  
14 PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. NO ONE  
17 RAISED THEIR HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED  
18 THE PODIUM.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. CAN WE -- DO WE NEED TO CONDUCT A  
21 ROLL CALL?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SO WITH THE MOTION BY COMMISSIONER  
3 ANDERSEN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMOS. CHAIR NOACK?

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

8

9 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES .

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. EXCUSE ME JUST A  
12 MOMENT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **PAT BURT:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT. JOHN-BAPTISTE?

4

5 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

6

7 **BOARD CLERK:** LEE? ABSENT. MAHAN? ABSENT. MANFREE? MASHBURN?

8 MELGAR? MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** YES .

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS? MOTION PASSES

13 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, YOU

16 WANTED 7D PULLED?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH, CAN I GET SOME FURTHER EXPLANATION ON THIS?

19 LOOKS LIKE WE'RE PASSING OFF THE AUTHORITY OF THE COMMISSION

20 TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND IF SOMEBODY COULD EXPLAIN THAT

21 FURTHER, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

22

23 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I WOULD BE GLAD TO. ALIX

24 BOCKELMAN CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. THIS ITEM, AND WE

25 HAVE LEGAL COUNSEL HERE, BUT AGAIN IT'S VERY NARROW, IT'S



MARCH 25, 2026

1 BASICALLY PROVIDING THE AUTHORITY TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO  
2 TRANSMIT A REPORT THAT IS REQUIRED AROUND SB63, WHICH  
3 BASICALLY LOOKS AT FORECASTED RIDERSHIP IMPACTS ON VARIOUS  
4 OPERATORS AS A RESULT OF CERTAIN RAIL CONNECTIVITY PROJECTS.  
5 SO, THAT ANALYSIS IS ATTACHED AND IS BASICALLY TAKEN FROM  
6 PLANNED BAY AREA, WHICH IS BEFORE YOU TODAY. I GUESS, YOU  
7 KNOW, IT'S BASED ON THAT. AND, SO, THAT IS ONE OF THE FEATURES  
8 OF THIS ITEM, AND I'LL SEE IF OUR LEGAL COUNSEL WANTS TO ADD  
9 ANYTHING ELSE?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SURE SCOTT STANSEL OFFICE OF GENERAL COUNSEL THIS  
12 ITEM IS RELATED TO A BUNCH OF THE SHORT TIMELINE APPROXIMATE  
13 TASKS THAT ARE PUT INTO SB63 BUT WHAT MUST BE TRANSMITTED FROM  
14 THE COMMISSION TO VARIOUS ACTORS INCLUDING THE STATE  
15 LEGISLATURE THIS WE'RE AUTHORIZING THAT SINCE THE COMMISSION  
16 HAS TO TRANSMIT THE RIDERSHIP REPORT THERE IS NOT GOING TO BE  
17 ANOTHER COMMISSION MEETING IN TIME THAT IT'S FINALIZED TO BE  
18 ABLE DO THAT SO WE'RE ESSENTIALLY JUST PASSING THAT  
19 RESPONSIBILITY OF TRANSMITTING THE REPORT ITSELF WHICH IS  
20 ATTACHED TO THIS LEGISLATURE THROUGH THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY I SEE BUT THE LEG -- THAT'S WHY I'M ASKING  
23 HERE, SO THE LEGISLATION ITSELF DECLARED FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY  
24 AND TRANSPARENCY ARE IMPERATIVE TO BUILD PUBLIC CONFIDENCE AND  
25 TRUST AND SUPPORT OF. THE REPORT THAT'S BEING PASSED FORWARD



MARCH 25, 2026

1 IS A LOVELY WAY OF REITERATING THE TRANSFORMATION PLAN, I WILL  
2 CONCEDE THAT BUT THE TRANSFORMATION PLAN IS FIVE YEARS OLD  
3 NOW, THIS REPORT SAYS AUTO GOING TO TAKE ANOTHER FIVE YEARS TO  
4 ACHIEVE THE THINGS IN THERE WHICH IS CONCERNING TO ME AND  
5 SHOULD BE CONCERNING TO THIS COMMISSION OVERALL. AND AN  
6 ADDITIONAL QUESTION, THIS IS REALLY WHERE I NEED CLARIFICATION  
7 HERE, PHASE ONE OF THE LEGISLATION SAYS THAT THE FINANCIAL --  
8 EFFICIENCY REVIEW, I THINK THE CHAIR JUST MENTIONED THERE WAS  
9 A FIRST MEETING, COST SAVING MEASURES IMPLEMENTED SINCE  
10 JANUARY 21ST -- OR JANUARY 1ST, 2020, SUBJECT OPERATIONS EARLY  
11 ACTION. THAT'S NOT THE SAME --

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THAT'S NOT THIS.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THAT'S WHAT I'M TRYING TO GET CLARIFICATION.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR APRIL 17TH FOR THE  
18 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW TO HAVE ANOTHER LOOK AT THOSE  
19 EARLY ACTION STRATEGIES OTHER AND ITEMS THAT ARE IN THE  
20 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REPORT COMPLETELY SEPARATE ITEM THIS IS A  
21 SEPARATE LINE ITEM IN SB63 ITSELF THAT THE COMMISSION WAS  
22 GOING TO MAKE RIDERSHIP REPORTS THAT ESSENTIALLY EXPLAINS A  
23 LOT OF THE THINGS THAT THE COMMISSION IS DOING AND FORECAST  
24 THAT'S BEEN PUT FORWARD TO YOU LATER TODAY AS WELL.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **GINA PAPAN:** BUT THE SECOND PART HERE COMING BACK TO THE  
2 COMMISSION AS A WHOLE? IS THAT CORRECT?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THE FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THAT WILL BE GOING THROUGH THE FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY  
9 REVIEW INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** AND WILL THIS - I WOULD REQUEST THAT THIS  
12 COMMISSION BE ABLE TO SEE THAT BECAUSE IT IMPACTS US ALL HERE.  
13 ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO HAVE SALES TAX ON OUR -- MAYBE AFFECTING  
14 OUR VOTERS.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE GET FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE WILL  
17 GET A REPORT IN APRIL. THEN THERE WILL BE A SERIES OF FOUR  
18 OTHER MEETINGS DISCUSSING WHAT OUR OUTSIDE CONSULTANT HAS PUT  
19 TOGETHER FROM THAT. THEN THERE WILL BE PHASE TWO IF THE  
20 MEASURE PASSES. IT GOES INTO MORE DETAILS ON SUGGESTED  
21 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REQUIREMENTS IN THE PHASE TWO PIECE OF  
22 IT.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** SO AS FAR AS PHASE ONE, IF I COULD GO STEP-BY-STEP  
25 HERE, PLEASE. BECAUSE THE TRANSPARENCY IS IMPORTANT HERE WILL



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THOSE MEETINGS THAT THE CHAIR MENTIONED BE PUBLIC?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THEY WILL BE THERE.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** WILL YOU BE NOTIFIED OF THEM AS A COMMISSION?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY. YES, THOSE WILL BE -- IT'S A BROWN ACTED  
8 BODY, SO IT WILL BE TAKING PLACE IN THIS BUILDING. AND WE'LL  
9 MAKE SURE THAT WE --

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** AND I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL THAT WHENEVER  
16 PHASE ONE IS COMPLETE THAT IN THE COMMISSION IN THE FUTURE  
17 WILL BE VOTING ON ASPECTS OF THIS THAT SOMEHOW WILL COME BACK  
18 TO THE COMMISSION? IS THAT POSSIBLE, MADAM CHAIR, SO THAT WE  
19 KNOW AS A BODY WHAT THE RESULTS WERE?

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH, I EXPECT NEXT MONTH TO GIVE YOU A JUST  
22 BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE FIRST -- SO, THE REPORT IS DUE TO THE  
23 COMMITTEE APRIL 1ST. WE WILL BE MEETING, I BELIEVE IT'S  
24 SCHEDULED APRIL 17TH, RIGHT NOW, TO GO OVER THAT REPORT. THAT  
25 IS A PUBLIC MEETING. AND THEN I HOPE TO GIVE, SORT OF, A



MARCH 25, 2026

1    RUNDOWN OF THAT AT APRIL'S MEETING, AS WELL. AND SO, AND THEN  
2    WE'LL HAVE SEVERAL MEETINGS AFTER THAT. SO WE'LL KEEP YOU  
3    INFORMED AND THEN THE FINAL REPORT I'M ASSUMING WILL COME BACK  
4    TO US.

5

6    **GINA PAPAN:** LOOKING FOR BIT MORE CLARIFICATION HERE. SO IN THE  
7    FIRST PHASE HERE, WE HAVE OUR NEW CONSULTANT; IS THAT CORRECT,  
8    MADAM CHAIR.

9

10   **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE A NEW CONSULTANT.

11

12   **GINA PAPAN:** NEW CONSULTANT WHICH WILL BE WORKING WITH THE  
13    CHAIR AND THE --

14

15   **SPEAKER:** THE OPERATORS.

16

17   **GINA PAPAN:** AND THE OPERATORS -- THE OPERATORS THEMSELVES  
18    HERE, AND SO THEY WILL BE REPORTING OUT AS THE LEGISLATION  
19    SAYS, I ASSUME, WHAT THEY HAVE DONE SINCE JANUARY 2020.

20

21   **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, YES. AND ALSO TO GO TO YOUR POINT  
22    ABOUT TRANSPARENCY, THE PLAN IS TO HAVE THAT REPORT NOT ONLY  
23    TRANSMITTED TO THE FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW, INDEPENDENT  
24    OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE, BUT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC BY APRIL 1ST.  
25    SO, THEY HAVE A CHANCE TO COMMENT AND SHARE THAT THEY'RE AWARE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THAT A MEETING WILL TAKE PLACE THEY CAN PROVIDE COMMENT ON THE  
2 DRAFT REPORT. IT WON'T BE FINAL REPORT AT THAT TIME THEN APRIL  
3 17TH THE COMMITTEE WILL THEN PROVIDE WE ANTICIPATE FAIRLY  
4 SUBSTANTIVE FEEDBACK TO ENSURE THAT THE REPORT IS WELL  
5 REVIEWED, THAT INDEPENDENT EXPERTS ON THE COMMISSIONER ABLE TO  
6 LOOK AT IT, ENSURE THAT EVERYTHING AS THEY BELIEVE IT SHOULD  
7 BE BEFORE IT'S FINALLY ADOPTED. HOPEFULLY AT A FOLLOW-ON  
8 MEETING NEXT MONTH.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** AND AS I UNDERSTAND WHATEVER HAPPENS IN THAT  
11 PROCESS RECOMMENDATIONS WILL BE MADE TO THE OPERATORS THAT  
12 THEY WILL THEN TAKE TO THEIR BOARD.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES. THE EARLY ACTION STRATEGIES ARE THINGS THAT HAVE  
15 TO BE ADOPTED THROUGH THE STATUTE SB63 TALKS ABOUT THE REPORT  
16 WHICH IS GOING TO INFORM A LOT OF WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THAT.  
17 BUT THE EARLY ACTION STRATEGIES ARE GOING TO BE RECOMMENDED  
18 AND THE OPERATORS HAVE TO ADOPT ACTION STRATEGIES. AT LEAST  
19 THEY CAN CHOOSE FROM A MENU, BUT THEY ADOPT CERTAIN EARLY  
20 ACTION STRATEGIES AT THEIR OWN BOARDS. THEN PHASE TWO SHOULD  
21 BE APPROVED BY VOTERS IN NOVEMBER, THERE WILL BE MORE IN-DEPTH  
22 LOOK AT WHAT'S HAPPENING IN EXTRA ACCOUNTABILITY.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. I  
25 GREATLY APPRECIATE IT. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE PROCESS AND THE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TRANSPARENCY AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. AND I'M SURE THERE IS  
2 OTHER QUESTIONS, BUT I WOULD VOTE TO APPROVE THIS ITEM. THANK  
3 YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO YOU'RE MAKING A MOTION?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD, BUT I THINK THERE WAS ANOTHER QUESTION  
8 THAT WAY. I DIDN'T WANT TO JUMP THE GUN. NO?

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MAYBE JUST MY RED LIGHT.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. I WILL VOTE APPROVE ITEM 7D.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION. SECOND BY  
15 MELGAR IN CASE WE MISSED THAT ONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT  
16 ON 7D?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE  
19 ARE NO HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE  
20 PODIUM.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN, SECONDED BY  
25 COMMISSIONER MELGAR. CHAIR NOACK?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.**

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?**

5

6 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.**

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?**

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.**

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?**

13

14 **EDDIE AHN: AYE.**

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: ANDERSEN?**

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.**

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: EZZY ASHCRAFT?**

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: AYE.**

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: BURT?**

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **PAT BURT:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO IS ABSENT. FLEMING IS ABSENT. JOHN-  
4 BAPTISTE?

5

6 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?  
9 MASHBURN? MELGAR? COMMISSIONER MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS? THANK YOU. MOTION  
14 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. I'LL ALSO NOTE THAT  
15 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS -- HAS ARRIVED AND COUNTED TOWARDS THE  
16 ROLL.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER] THAT WAS  
19 ANNOUNCING ITEM EIGHT, WHICH IS THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE  
20 REPORT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE ADMIN COMMITTEE MET MARCH  
23 11th 2026 AND REFERRED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL OF WHAT  
24 IS IDENTIFIED AS -- WELL IT SAYS HERE 7E. IS THAT CORRECT? OR  
25 -- OKAY. FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR, THE FOLLOWING ITEM, WHICH



MARCH 25, 2026

1 IS RESOLUTION 4751 AUTHORIZING MTC OPERATING RESERVE POLICY I  
2 WILL NOTE FOR COMMISSIONERS WHO WEREN'T THERE, SO THIS IS A  
3 NEW RESERVE POLICY THAT WE ARE IMPLEMENTING SETTING UP A 50%  
4 RESERVE, WHICH I KNOW SOUNDS UNUSUAL, BUT IT'S EVERY SIX  
5 MONTHS, AND I WOULD LIKE TO THANK MY COMMITTEE MEMBERS,  
6 BECAUSE THIS POLICY ALSO INCLUDES AN ITEM NOTIFYING THE  
7 COMMISSION IF THE FOLLOWING RESERVES HAVE TO BE USED. WHICH I  
8 THINK WILL BE BENEFICIAL TO US ALL. THERE HAS BEEN MINOR USAGE  
9 OF FUNDS PREVIOUSLY, BUT THIS FORMALIZES EVERYTHING. SO, I  
10 WOULD LIKE TO MOVE AUTHORIZATION OF RESOLUTION 4751 TO THE  
11 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I DON'T BELIEVE WE HAD A RESERVE  
14 POLICY BEFORE. SO --

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** NO, WE DID NOT BUT WE'RE KIND OF CLEAR DURING --

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I JUST WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT WE DIDN'T HAVE  
19 SOMETHING -- A RESERVE THAT WE WERE USING BEFORE.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES. THANK YOU.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK WE HAVE --



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT AND TELL THE  
5 COMMISSION WE HAD A LENGTHY CONVERSATION ABOUT REALLY THE  
6 REASONS WHY, THIS WAS STARTED OFF BASED UPON THE FEDERAL  
7 FUNDING AND SECURITIES THAT WE WERE STARTING TO FEEL LAST  
8 YEAR, AND WE CERTAINLY HAVE EXPERIENCED ON THE OTHER SIDE OF  
9 THE HOUSE FROM GRANT FUNDING AND WORK UNDERWAY, SO IT REALLY  
10 JUST PUTS US IN A FAR MORE SECURE PLACE AND THERE WAS A VERY  
11 ROBUST CONVERSATION, AND I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR BRINGING  
12 THIS BACK. I THINK IT'S PRUDENT AND CERTAINLY POLICY OF THE  
13 COMMISSION THAT CAN BE CHANGED SHOULD WE FIND OURSELVES IN  
14 MORE FEDERALLY SUPPORTED SITUATIONS.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO ADD ALSO IN  
17 THAT RESOLUTION INCLUDES THE PROCESS FOR REFILLING THOSE  
18 RESERVES AS WELL. SO THAT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE NOT ONLY THE  
19 NOTIFICATION OF USE, BUT ALSO PROCESS FOR REFILLING THE  
20 RESERVES. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? NO? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS  
21 ON THIS?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING NO HANDS  
24 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PAPAN SECOND RAMOS. NOACK?

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

8

9 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

16

17 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

20

21 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

24

25 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO IS ABSENT. FLEMING ABSENT. JOHN-  
3 BAPTISTE?

4

5 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN? ABSENT. MANFREE?  
8 MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY? PAPAN? IS.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

13

14 **BELIA RAMOS:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
17 MEMBERS PRESENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU MOVING TO ITEM NINE PROGRAMMING  
20 AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS OUT  
21 ILL. SO WHO IS OUR VICE CHAIR? OH, THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER  
22 MELGAR. I FORGOT FOR A MINUTE. SPACED. [LAUGHTER]

23

24 **MYRNA MELGAR:** NO WORRIES.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT?

2

3 **MYRNA MELGAR:** SURE.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET  
8 MARCH 11th 2026 AND REFERRED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL  
9 ITEMS 7F THROUGH 7H ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND FOLLOWING ITEM  
10 AGENDA NINE MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4743 WHICH IS ADOPTION OF  
11 THE FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PLAN  
12 OTHERWISE KNOWN AS PIP, THIS ITEM ADOPTS FISCAL YEAR 2025,  
13 2026PIP PROVIDES FINAL UPDATE ON OPERATOR PROGRESS TOWARDS  
14 SENATE BILL 125 THE REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES SO I MOVE  
15 APPROVAL OF THE MTC RESOLUTION 4743.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY DO WE HAVE COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? OKAY  
18 DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'LL SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANKS WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.  
23 THE THERE ARE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. NO HANDS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WONDERFUL. MAY WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE  
4 PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WITH MOTION BY COMMISSIONER MELGAR,  
7 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT. CHAIR NOACK?

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

12

13 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

24

25 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AYE.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

3

4 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

7

8 **PAT BURT:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO ABSENT. FLEMING? IS ABSENT. JOHN-  
11 BAPTISTE?

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MANFREE?  
16 MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
25 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. WE'LL MOVE TO THE BIG ITEM FOR THE  
3 DAY AGENDA ITEM TEN PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT COMMISSIONER AHN  
4 WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** YES, SO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE MET JOINTLY WITH  
7 THE ABAG ADMINISTRATION -- ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MARCH 13th  
8 AND REFERRED ITEMS 10A THROUGH 10E, THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA  
9 2050+ TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. SO, BEFORE YOU IS AGENDA  
10 ITEM 10A. JUST TO GIVE SOME CONTEXT FOR THREE YEARS STAFF HAVE  
11 BEEN WORKING AN UPDATE TO THE REGION'S LONG RANGE PLAN FOR  
12 TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ENVIRONMENTAL  
13 RESILIENCE KNOWN AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, PLANNED BAY AREA  
14 2050+ IS A FOCUSED UPDATE TO THE REGIONAL VISION THAT SOUGHT  
15 TO REFLECT POST-PANDEMIC PLANNING REALITIES TIGHTER FISCAL  
16 CONSTRAINTS WHILE ENGAGING THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND  
17 STAKEHOLDER ORGANIZATIONS. AS NOTICED PREVIOUSLY MARCH 13th  
18 THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE  
19 MET AND REFERRED TODAY'S ITEMS TO THE RESPECTIVE BOARDS AND  
20 LAST THURSDAY THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD VOTED UNANIMOUSLY TO  
21 CERTIFY THE FINAL EIR AND APPROVE THE LONG RANGE PLANNED BAY  
22 AREA STAFF TODAY ARE BRINGING FORWARD THE PROPOSED FINAL  
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ WITH SIMILAR RECOMMENDATIONS FOR  
24 COMMISSION APPROVAL SO STAFF WILL PROVIDE THE CONSOLIDATED  
25 PRESENTATION ON FOUR ACTION ITEMS BEFORE THE COMMISSION TODAY



MARCH 25, 2026

1 FOCUSING ON REVISIONS MADE BASED ON FEEDBACK FINAL ROUND OF  
2 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WE ALSO HAVE NEXT STEPS LOOKING FORWARD TO  
3 MAJOR UPDATE TO PLANNED BAY AREA STARTING LATE 2026. DAVE  
4 VAUTIN.

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD MORNING DAVE VAUTIN PLANNING DIRECTOR I'M  
7 EXCITED TO BE HERE TO PRESENT THE PROPOSED FINAL PLANNED BAY  
8 AREA 2050+ FOR POTENTIAL ADOPTION BY THE COMMISSION FOLLOWING  
9 LAST WEEK'S APPROVAL BY ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AS YOU ALL KNOW  
10 AWARE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IS OUR LONG RANGE PLAN FOR BAY  
11 AREA CONNECTING TRANSPORTATION HOUSING ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT  
12 WHILE FULFILLING A RANGE OF STATE AND FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS  
13 BEFORE WE GET GOING I WANT TO RECOGNIZE AND APPRECIATE THE  
14 ENGAGEMENT FROM PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS THROUGHOUT THE  
15 REGION AS WELL AS MANY THOUSANDS OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO  
16 SHARED THEIR THOUGHTS ON THE REGION'S FUTURE AS WELL AS OUR  
17 PLANNING TEAM THAT HELPED TO GET TO TODAY'S MILESTONE. NEXT  
18 SLIDE. AS MENTIONED WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS PLAN UPDATE  
19 FOR THE PAST THREE YEARS AND BEEN TRACKING PROGRESS WITH THIS  
20 DIAGRAM SHOWING THE KEY MILESTONES FOR LIMITED AND FOCUSED  
21 UPDATE TO PRIOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT WAS ADOPTED IN  
22 2021, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ HAS SOUGHT TO RECOGNIZE POST-  
23 PANDEMIC HEAD WIND AND TIGHTER FISCAL CONSTRAINTS THAT THEY  
24 MEAN FOR LOCAL AND REGIONAL POLICY PRIORITIES AND IN JANUARY  
25 2025 SHOWN ON THE DIAGRAM THE COMMISSION AND BOARD APPROVED



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGY IN SUMMER 2025 ADVANCED THE FINAL  
2 BLUEPRINT INTO THE CEQA PROCESS SINCE THEN OUR TEAM HAS BEEN  
3 WORKING HARD TO CONDUCT STATE-MANDATED ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS  
4 CRAFT THE PLAN DOCUMENT AND ASSOCIATED REPORTS AND MOST  
5 IMPORTANTLY TRANSLATING THE VISIONARY LONG RANGE STRATEGIES  
6 INTO DISCRETE NEAR-TERM ACTIONS THAT MTC ABAG CAN ADVANCE BY  
7 2030 THROUGH THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. IN NOVEMBER 2025 STAFF  
8 PRESENTED THE DRAFT PLAN AND EIR TO PLANNING AND ADMIN  
9 COMMITTEES AS WE WORKED TO CONDUCT A FINAL ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT  
10 WHEN THE COMMENT WINDOW CLOSED DECEMBER 18TH. FIRST AT THE  
11 FEBRUARY 2026 MEETING WHERE WE SUMMARIZED AND SYNTHESIZED  
12 COMMENTS FROM THE FOURTH AND FINAL ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT AS WELL  
13 AS DEEPER DIVE ON THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST THAT WAS  
14 PREVIOUSLY INCLUDED IN THE JANUARY 2025 ACTION ITEM.  
15 FURTHERMORE, EARLIER THIS MONTH THE PLANNING AND ADMIN  
16 COMMITTEES RECOMMENDED ADVANCING THE FINAL PLAN TO THE  
17 COMMISSION AND BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. PLANNED BAY AREA ATTEMPTS TO  
18 ANSWER THE NOT SO SIMPLE QUESTION OF WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO  
19 ENSURE THAT THE BAY AREA IS AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE,  
20 HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL BY THE YEAR KNOW 2050. WHILE THE  
21 PLAN'S STRATEGIES -- SORRY -- WHILE THE PLAN'S THEMES WERE  
22 RETAINED FROM THE PRIOR CYCLE AND WHILE WE CONTINUE TO HAVE 35  
23 STRATEGIES IN TOTAL, THE COMMISSION AND BOARD APPROVED  
24 CRITICAL PIVOTS TO A RANGE OF STRATEGIES FROM WEAVING IN  
25 APPROACHES TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO REIMAGINING TRANSIT VISION



MARCH 25, 2026

1 POST-PANDEMIC WITH FOCUS ON FREQUENCY SPEED AND SAFETY AND  
2 MORE AS WELL AS CLEARLY DELINEATING THE INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDS  
3 ASSOCIATED WITH RISING SEA LEVELS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
4 UNDERSCORE THAT PLANNED BAY AREA IS A VISION AND NORTH STAR  
5 BUT IT DOES NOT ALLOCATE MONEY, IT DOES NOT OVERRIDE LOCAL  
6 LAND USE AUTHORITY DOESN'T IMPOSE MANDATES OR PROPOSE ANY NEW  
7 LEGISLATION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA  
8 CONTINUES THE REGION'S LONG-STANDING FOCUS ON FOCUSED GROWTH.  
9 WITH THE VAST MAJORITY OF HOUSING AND JOBS ANTICIPATED TO  
10 OCCUR IN LOCALLY NOMINATED AND REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED PLACES  
11 WITH NEARLY ALL DEVELOPMENT OCCURRING WITHIN TODAY'S URBAN  
12 GROWTH BOUNDARIES. NEXT SLIDE. IF IMPLEMENTED, THE PLAN WOULD  
13 SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION COSTS, WITH  
14 EVEN GREATER IMPROVEMENTS FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. IT WOULD  
15 SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASE THE SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS WITHIN A SHORT  
16 WALK OF FREQUENT TRANSIT, WHILE CREATING MORE HOMEOWNERSHIP  
17 OPPORTUNITIES FOR ALL. IT WOULD MORE THAN DOUBLE THE SHARE OF  
18 PEOPLE COMMUTING BY FOOT, BIKE, BUS, TRAIN, AND FERRY, AND  
19 THROUGH EXPANSIVE PARKS AND CONSERVATION STRATEGIES IT WOULD  
20 EXPAND OPEN SPACE FOR ALL. FINALLY, BY INVESTING IN  
21 INFRASTRUCTURE AND HOMES AND TACKLING THE REGION'S CHALLENGES,  
22 IT WOULD HELP TO SUPPORT ROBUST AND INCLUSIVE ECONOMIC GROWTH.  
23 AND, OF COURSE, THE PLAN ACHIEVES THE STATUTORY GREENHOUSE GAS  
24 TARGETS SET BY THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD OF, A 19% PER CAPITA  
25 REDUCTION BY 2035 THROUGH RANGE OF PRICING LAND USE AND



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TRANSIT STRATEGIES FULFILLING THAT ESSENTIAL STATE  
2 REQUIREMENT. AS MENTIONED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IDENTIFIES  
3 LONG RANGE STRATEGIES TO MAKE THE BAY AREA A BETTER PLACE TO  
4 LIVE, WORK, AND PLAY, BUT THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN TRANSLATES  
5 THOSE IDEAS INTO DISCRETE NEAR-TERM ACTIONS FOR THE NEXT FIVE  
6 YEARS IDENTIFYING 65 ACTIONS IN TOTAL THESE INCLUDE LONG-  
7 STANDING PRIORITIES LIKE PREPARING FOR POTENTIAL NEW REVENUES  
8 AND SUPPORTING REFORM OF STATE PLANNING LAWS AS WELL AS NEWER  
9 UPDATES LIKE UPDATING CAPITAL PROJECT PRIORITIZATION,  
10 INCREASING ENGAGEMENT, AND EXPANDING RESILIENCE TECHNICAL  
11 ASSISTANCE. WE HAVE SEEN NOTABLE SUCCESS WITH THE  
12 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FRAMEWORK FROM THE PRIOR PLAN WITH VAST  
13 MAJORITY OF 80 PLUS ACTIONS IDENTIFIED BEING COMPLETE OR IN  
14 PROGRESS AND THIS IMPLEMENTATION BUILDS ON THAT MODEL. THE  
15 PLAN INCLUDES COMMITMENT TO DOUBLE DOWN ON ONGOING MONITORING  
16 THROUGH ANNUAL COMMITTEE UPDATES WITH PROGRESS ON EACH OF THE  
17 65 ACTIONS AS WELL AS AUGMENTATION AND ACCELERATION OF OUR  
18 VITAL SIGNS PERFORMANCE MONITORING WORK THROUGH OUR BROADER  
19 DATA PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS MENTIONED EARLIER, THE  
20 STRATEGIC CHANGES TO THE LONG RANGE PLAN WERE INFORMED BY  
21 ROBUST COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT TOUCHING ALL CORNERS OF THE REGION  
22 IN-PERSON THROUGH DIGITAL MEANS AND ONLINE WEBINARS AND  
23 SURVEYS MORE THAN 17,500 RESIDENTS PARTICIPATED IN THE GUIDED  
24 PROCESS WITH 41 POP-UP WORKSHOPS 22 COMMUNITY BASED  
25 ORGANIZATION PARTNERSHIPS NUMEROUS WEBINARS HEARINGS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THROUGHOUT THE REGION EVEN THOUGH THIS IS MORE FOCUSED UPDATE  
2 THAN OUR PRIOR CYCLE ENGAGEMENT APPROACH REMAINED ROBUST AND  
3 EXPANSIVE SPANNING GUERVILLE TO GILROY CONNECTING PLACES LIKE  
4 MOUNTAIN VIEW AND MARIN. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT RECAP I WANT TO  
5 BRING US TO TODAY MARCH 2026. NEXT SLIDE. ALL RIGHT. AS  
6 MENTIONED, THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD TOOK TWO ACTIONS LAST WEEK  
7 ON THE EIR AND PLAN DOCUMENT AS SHOWN IN THIS DIAGRAM AND  
8 TODAY THERE ARE FOUR ACTION ITEMS BEFORE YOU 10B WHICH IS  
9 RELATED TO THE AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS 10C RELATED TO  
10 THE CERTIFICATION OF THE FINAL EIR, 10D RELATED TO THE  
11 APPROVAL OF THE FINAL PLAN AND 10E RELATED TO THE  
12 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM SYNCING THAT UP WITH THE  
13 NEW REGIONAL PLAN. OUR TEAM HAS BEEN FOCUSED ON MAKING  
14 THOUGHTFUL REVISIONS TO THE VARIOUS PLANNED DOCUMENTS IN  
15 RESPONSE TO PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK AND I'LL WALK  
16 THROUGH EACH OF THESE TODAY INCLUDING WHAT'S CHANGED SINCE THE  
17 OCTOBER 2025 DRAFT. NEXT SLIDE. AS PART OF THE ROUND FOUR  
18 ENGAGEMENT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, WE HELD WEBINARS,  
19 HEARINGS, PRESENTED TO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARDS AND  
20 PROVIDED OPPORTUNITIES FOR ONLINE INPUT. IN TOTAL, WE RECEIVED  
21 MORE THAN 300 COMMENTS ACROSS THE PLAN AND EIR ALL OF WHICH  
22 ARE POSTED ON PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG. RESIDENTS UNDERSCORED THE  
23 NEED TO BUILD CONFIDENCE BY FOCUSING ON IMPLEMENTATION, RAISED  
24 QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PLAN'S REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST,  
25 UNDERSCORED THE IMPORTANCE OF AFFORDABILITY, TRANSIT SERVICE,



MARCH 25, 2026

1 AND EQUITY, AND NOTED THAT LOCAL CAPACITY IS STRETCHED THIN.  
2 STAFF HAVE WORKED TO ENHANCE THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN BASED ON  
3 THIS FEEDBACK AND HAVE ADDED ADDITIONAL CONTEXT OF THE PLAN  
4 DOCUMENT AND ASSOCIATED REPORTS AS WELL. IN ADDITION TO  
5 POSTING ALL THE COMMENTS, ALL COMMENTS THAT WERE RECEIVED WERE  
6 RESPONDED TO BY E-MAIL, LETTER, OR THE FINAL EIR AND WE ALSO  
7 POSTED AN FAQ ON THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST AS WELL. NEW  
8 COMMENTS RECEIVED SINCE THE PROPOSED FINAL PLAN AND EIR WERE  
9 POSTED PUBLICLY ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET AS WELL AS THROUGH  
10 HANDOUTS TODAY. I'LL QUICKLY TALK ABOUT SOME REVISIONS  
11 STARTING WITH THE PLAN DOCUMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO ALL THE  
12 STRATEGIES, GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND STRUCTURE OF THE PLAN  
13 REMAIN CONSISTENT WITH 2025 COMMISSION AND BOARD ACTIONS. WE  
14 HAVE MADE TARGETED REFINEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE DOCUMENT AND  
15 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS, BRINGING ENHANCED CLARITY. THESE INCLUDE  
16 REFRESHED ENGAGEMENT METRICS AND MAP REFINEMENTS, ADDITIONAL  
17 CONTEXT ON THE PLAN VISION AND THE PATH TO IMPLEMENTATION  
18 THROUGH A NEW EXECUTIVE LETTER. MORE CONTENT ON AUTONOMOUS  
19 VEHICLES, SEA LEVEL RISE AND GROWTH FORECASTS, AND WE ADDED A  
20 NEW RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST REPORT THAT BRIDGES ALL OF THE  
21 CONTENT ON SEA LEVEL RISE THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SPRINKLED  
22 THROUGHOUT THE PLAN DOCUMENTS INTO, SORT OF, ONE-STOP-SHOP FOR  
23 TO IMPROVE READABILITY. ATTACHMENT A OF ITEM 10C INCLUDES LIST  
24 OF CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE. NOW, THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WAS  
25 UPDATED AS WELL, AND STAFF RECOMMENDED ADDING IMPLEMENTATION



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ACTION 61 WHICH COMMITTED TO -- AND I SHOULD NOTE THE SLIDE  
2 HERE SHOWS 63, BUT WITH DIRECTION THERE IS ACTION 61, THAT  
3 ACTION COMMITS TO A ROBUST TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO  
4 REVIEW AND UPDATE THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST METHODOLOGY  
5 LATER THIS YEAR. FURTHERMORE, STAFF REFINED LANGUAGE ON NINE  
6 ADDITIONAL ACTIONS AND NOTABLY MERGED TOGETHER PREVIOUSLY  
7 SEPARATE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AND VISION ZERO ACTIONS INTO A  
8 SINGLE COHESIVE PATH FORWARD IN THAT SPACE. NEXT SLIDE. THE  
9 FINAL EIR INCLUDES RESPONSES TO PUBLIC COMMENTS, AS WELL AS  
10 MINOR REVISIONS TO THE DRAFT THIS. DOCUMENT IS NOW  
11 COMPLEMENTED BY THE MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PLAN,  
12 OR MMRP, AS WELL AS THE FINDINGS AND INFORMED BY DISCUSSIONS  
13 AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL OVER THE COURSE OF THE PLANNING  
14 PROCESS. YOU WILL NOTE THAT THE FINAL EIR INCLUDES A RANGE OF  
15 MASTER RESPONSES DESIGNED TO RESPOND TO COMMON QUESTIONS AND  
16 TOPICS RAISED AS WELL AS INDIVIDUAL RESPONSES TO SPECIFIC  
17 POINTS. NEXT SLIDE. A FEW QUICK NOTES ON THE FINAL EIR, THERE  
18 WAS NO NEW SIGNIFICANT NEW INFORMATION THAT WAS ADDED THAT  
19 WOULD WARRANT RECIRCULATION, DIDN'T IDENTIFY ANY NEW  
20 SIGNIFICANT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS RELATIVE TO THE DRAFT, AND  
21 THE FINAL EIR, ITSELF DOES NOT MAKE A RECOMMENDATION ON WHICH  
22 ALTERNATIVE TO ADVANCE, BUT THAT RECOMMENDATION IS INCLUDED IN  
23 THE CEQA FINDINGS. NEXT SLIDE. FOR THE OTHER ASPECTS OF TODD'S  
24 APPROVAL ITEMS FIRST ON AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY FRONT. THAT  
25 ANALYSIS WAS RELEASED FOR A 30-DAY PUBLIC REVIEW PERIOD THAT



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ENDED JANUARY 21ST. IT DEMONSTRATES THAT REGIONAL EMISSIONS  
2 ARE WELL WITHIN ALLOWABLE LIMITS FOR OZONE PM2.5, WHICH IS  
3 GOOD NEWS STORY. AND FINDING THERE WE FULLY MEET FEDERAL  
4 CONFORMITY REQUIREMENTS. WITH REGARDS TO THE TRANSPORTATION  
5 IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM, ON THIS PROGRAM'S TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS  
6 HELPS IMPLEMENT OUR LONG RANGE PLAN AND THIS AMENDMENT REALLY  
7 SERVES TO CONFORM THE EXISTING 2025 TIP TO ALIGN WITH PLANNED  
8 BAY AREA 2050+. NEXT SLIDE. A COUPLE NOTABLE CONSIDERATIONS TO  
9 SHARE THERE ARE SEVERAL RISKS OF NOT ADOPTING THE PLAN ONE IS  
10 RELATED TO OUR CURRENT AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY LAPSE GRACE  
11 PERIOD IT'S BEEN MORE THAN FOUR YEARS SINCE THE PLANNED BAY  
12 AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED AND FURTHER EXTENSIONS MAY LIMIT THE  
13 FEDERAL APPROVALS FOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND IMPACT  
14 PROJECT DELIVERY FURTHERMORE ADOPTING REGIONAL PLAN THAT MEETS  
15 THE GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET IS A REQUIREMENT TO RECEIVE FUNDING  
16 FROM SENATE BILL ONE COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS IN THE LATEST CYCLE  
17 THAT IS JUST KICKING OFF WITH CTC ADOPTING THE FINAL PLAN WILL  
18 ALLOW US TO PIVOT TOWARD IMPLEMENTING THE LONG RANGE VISION  
19 THAT HAS BEEN UNDER DEVELOPMENT FOR THE PAST THREE YEARS  
20 INCLUDING EFFORTS TO ADVANCE AND DELIVER PROJECTS IN CLOSE  
21 PARTNERSHIP WITH ORGANIZATIONS THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NEXT  
22 SLIDE. WHILE WE'RE INTERESTED IN PIVOTING TO IMPLEMENTATION I  
23 WOULD NOTE THAT LONG RANGE PLANNING PROCESS IS NOT A ONE TIME  
24 ACTIVITY IT'S INFORMED BY CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES AND EMERGING  
25 POLICY PRIORITIES. UNDER FEDERAL AND STATE LAW THESE PLANS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 MUST BE UPDATED EVERY FOUR YEARS WHICH MEANS WE'RE ALREADY  
2 STARTING TO THINK ABOUT THE NEXT CYCLE OUR FIRST MAJOR UPDATE  
3 SINCE 2021. LATER THIS YEAR WE ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO YOU ALL  
4 WITH A SCOPE AND FRAMEWORK FOR A NEXT GENERATION PLAN UPDATE  
5 AND WE HAVE HEARD FROM MANY OF YOU NOW THAT WOULD BE A GOOD  
6 TIME TO THINK ABOUT ALTERNATIVE SCENARIOS FOR THE REGION'S  
7 FUTURE AND HELP OUR POLICY MAKERS AT ALL LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT  
8 TO THINK ABOUT HOW WE NAVIGATE THIS UNCERTAINTY WE INTEND TO  
9 LOOK AT ALTERNATIVE POLICY FUNDING ASSUMPTIONS EXAMINE  
10 TRANSFORMATIVE FORCES SHAPING OUR REGION FROM NEW TECHNOLOGIES  
11 AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES DEMOGRAPHIC SHIFTS FUNDING UNCERTAINTIES  
12 AND MORE WE'RE EXCITED TO DELVE INTO ALL THIS WORK WITH ALL OF  
13 YOU AND OUR PARTNERS BETWEEN NOW AND 2030. THE ADOPTION  
14 TIMELINE FOR THE NEXT PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. BUT FOR NOW LET'S TURN  
15 BACK TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ CONSISTENT WITH THE ACTION AT  
16 THE COMMITTEE LEVEL STAFF RECOMMENDATION BEFORE YOU TODAY IS  
17 TO APPROVE THE FOLLOWING FOUR ITEMS, FIRST MTC RESOLUTION 4748  
18 WOULD ADOPT THE FINAL TRANSPORTATION AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY  
19 ANALYSIS DEMONSTRATING FULFILLMENT OF THOSE FEDERAL AIR  
20 QUALITY REQUIREMENTS MTC RESOLUTION 4749 WOULD CERTIFY THE  
21 FINAL EIR ADOPT THE CEQA FINDINGS STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING  
22 CONSIDERATIONS AND THAT MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING  
23 PROGRAM MTC RESOLUTION 4750 WOULD ADOPT THE PLAN ITSELF  
24 ASSOCIATED WITH SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS INCLUDING IMPLEMENTATION  
25 PLAN AND MTC RESOLUTION 46 REVISED ALIGN CONFORM THE TIP WITH



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THIS NEW REGIONAL PLAN FOLLOWING POTENTIAL ACTION BY THE  
2 COMMISSION TODAY, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ WOULD THEN BECOME  
3 EFFECTIVE AS THE REGION'S NEW LONG RANGE PLAN, GIVEN THAT  
4 RECENT APPROVAL BY ABAG, AND IT WOULD SUPERSEDE PLANNED BAY  
5 AREA 2050, WHICH HAS BEEN OUR PLAN SINCE 2021. NEXT SLIDE.  
6 THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE WITH THIS LENGTHY ITEM THIS  
7 MORNING. WE RECOGNIZE THIS IS A MAJOR MILESTONE. HAPPY TO TAKE  
8 ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE TODAY.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, DAVE. AND THANK YOU TO YOUR TEAM  
11 FOR ALL THE HARD WORK ON THIS. I KNOW WE HAVE LIVED A LOT OF  
12 IT WITH YOU; BUT I KNOW YOU AND YOUR TEAM HAVE DONE TREMENDOUS  
13 AMOUNT OF WORK BEHIND THE SCENES AND APPRECIATE ALL THE PUBLIC  
14 OUTREACH AS WELL. LET'S GO FIRST TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. DO WE  
15 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED TWO LETTERS OF  
18 CORRESPONDENCE, IN ADDITION TO WHAT WAS ALREADY POSTED. THE  
19 FIRST IS FROM THE LAW OFFICE OF JASON BAETZ ON BEHALF OF  
20 TRANSDEF. AND SECOND WAS FROM BILL MABON, PASSED OUT TO YOU  
21 THIS MORNING. AND WITH THAT IN THE ZOOM SPACE WE HAVE ROLAND  
22 LEBRUN WITH HIS HAND RAISED. MR. LEBRON GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
23 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I VERY BRIEFLY WANT TO TAKE THIS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 OPPORTUNITY TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION FOR THIS PRESENTATION,  
2 WHICH IS QUITE TRANSFORMATIVE BASED ON ALL THE VARIOUS PLANNED  
3 BAY AREA PRESENTATIONS I WATCHED OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS. AND  
4 IT'S ESSENTIALLY CAPTURED EVERYTHING THAT I AND OTHERS HAVE  
5 BEEN, YOU KNOW, CONCERNED ABOUT. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE  
6 REST OF THE CONVERSATION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
9 HANDS.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK  
12 TO ANY COMMISSIONERS FOR THEIR COMMENTS. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR ALL THE HARD WORK EFFORT AND  
15 HERE. SO, SINCE WE WERE LOBBYING, AND WE'RE TRYING TO ACTUALLY  
16 MODIFY CERTAIN ASPECTS OF THIS, AND HOPEFULLY WE ARE  
17 SUCCESSFUL IN THOSE [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE IT WOULD BE A LOT MORE  
18 EFFICIENT AND, ACTUALLY, PROVIDE MORE MONEY FOR LOCAL  
19 DISTRIBUTION. AND SO I GUESS I'LL CLARIFY FOR THE PUBLIC HERE.  
20 THESE REPORTS GENERALLY RUN ABOUT \$50 MILLION WHEN WE HAVE TO  
21 DO THEM. SO, WE ARE SEEKING LEGISLATION TO KIND OF EXTEND THAT  
22 PROCESS EIGHT YEARS TO COORDINATE WITH THE RHNA NUMBERS, AS  
23 WELL. SO THAT WOULD BE MUCH MORE EFFICIENT FOR EVERYONE. SO  
24 HOPEFULLY WE WILL BE SUCCESSFUL. SO, WHAT WILL BE THE IMPACT  
25 IF WE GET THIS LEGISLATION PASSED ON THIS REPORT, HOW WOULD



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THAT AFFECT THE TIMELINES? IF WE WOULD KNOW? BECAUSE I AM  
2 GOING TO BE OPTIMISTIC.

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO THE LEGISLATION, IF PASSED, WOULD AFFECT  
5 FUTURE PSYCH EMS OF PLANNED BAY AREA, BECAUSE, OBVIOUSLY, THIS  
6 IS THE FINAL MILESTONE FOR THIS PLAN. WE DO ANTICIPATE, YOU  
7 KNOW, OUR NEXT CYCLE IS LIKELY TO BE A MAJOR UPDATE, BUT IF  
8 THE LEGISLATION PASSES, WE WOULD THEN HAVE EIGHT YEARS BEFORE  
9 DOING A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE FOR WHEN WE CALLED THE  
10 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES STRATEGY, THE SCS COMPONENT OF THE  
11 PLAN. IT WOULD REALLY BE TRANSFORMATIVE AS WE MOVE FORWARD  
12 TOWARDS 2030 AND BEYOND IN TERMS OF OUR FUTURE PLANS WE WOULD  
13 BE ABLE TO REALLY FOCUS ON POLICEMEN AS OPPOSED TO JUST  
14 CONSTANT PLANNING.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY IT WOULD BE GREAT AND I THINK IT MIGHT BE  
17 HELPFUL TO OUR EFFORTS HERE IF THE COMMISSIONERS RECEIVED,  
18 LIKE, A MEMO ON THAT, AND MAYBE WOULD LIKE TO SUPPORT THE --  
19 OUR EFFORTS IN THE LEGISLATURE, AS INDIVIDUAL CITIES MOVING  
20 FORWARD. BECAUSE, AGAIN, WE STAND TO SAVE \$50 MILLION.  
21 [LAUGHTER] THAT, HOPEFULLY, CAN BE REINVESTED IN, ACTUALLY,  
22 ALL THE EFFORTS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE HERE. SO, THANK  
23 YOU VERY MUCH MADAM CHAIR.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? COMMISSIONER ABE-



MARCH 25, 2026

1 KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT AND THE  
4 PRESENTATION I AM JUST -- AND I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS THE NEXT  
5 ITERATION WHERE THIS WILL BE EXPLORED MORE -- IT SOUNDED LIKE  
6 IT -- YOU KNOW, I WAS ACTUALLY STRUCK BY THE CHANGE IN THE  
7 PREDICTIONS OF POPULATION GROWTH, LIKE 750,000 PEOPLE IS QUITE  
8 SIGNIFICANT WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT 8 TO 10 MILLION. AND ALMOST  
9 10%. AND, SO, I WAS THINKING ABOUT THAT AND HOW THAT CAN  
10 REALLY -- DOES CHANGE, RIGHT, IN A SENSE, OUR TRAJECTORY IN  
11 TERMS OF -- WELL, THE HOUSING ELEMENT, YOU KNOW, RHNA NUMBERS,  
12 YOU KNOW -- OR IT COULD -- AND IN ALSO WITH TRANSIT, YOU  
13 MENTIONED THAT, YOU KNOW, WORK-FROM-HOME IS A BIG FACTOR NOW,  
14 AND IT'S HERE TO STAY. IT'S 30%. THAT AFFECTS, LIKE, WHAT KIND  
15 OF TRANSIT WE OFFER, WEEKEND VERSUS WEEKDAYS COMMUTE VERSUS  
16 JUST FREQUENT REGULAR GETTING YOUR BUSINESS DONE TYPE OF  
17 TRANSIT. SO WHEN DO WE START TO PLOT ALL THAT OUT AND READJUST  
18 FOR THIS DIFFERENCE?

19

20 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, ONE OF THE BENEFITS OF UPDATING THESE PLANS  
21 AT OUR REGULAR CADENCE IS WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO READJUST  
22 EVERY CYCLE. I WOULD NOTE THAT, A COUPLE THINGS, ONE IS THIS  
23 PLAN BECAUSE OF THE SLOWER GROWTH IN THE CORPORATE IN THIS  
24 PLAN THERE IS A LOT LESS MONEY IN THIS PLAN WE HAD TO MAKE  
25 SHOULD REALLY TOUGH CUTS TO THE TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES AS A



MARCH 25, 2026

1 RESULT AND TRIED TO FOCUS ON SOME OF THE HIGHEST IMPACT TRENDS  
2 INVESTMENTS DURING THAT PROCESS. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY AN  
3 OPPORTUNITY AS WE GO INTO 2060 TO DO EVEN MORE OF THAT WE ARE  
4 GOING TO EXPLORE AS MENTIONED DIFFERENT TRAJECTORIES FOR THE  
5 REGION WE'LL BE ABLE TO DIVE INTO SOME OF THE NEW TECHNOLOGIES  
6 STUFF THAT YOU MENTIONED AS WELL SO THAT WILL BE ONE OF THE  
7 EARLY ACTION ITEMS GOING INTO 2060 I DID WANT TO TOUCH AS YOU  
8 MENTIONED ON THE RHNA PROCESS, UNDER SCORE THAT THE GROWTH  
9 FORECAST IN THIS PLAN TOTAL GROWTH FOR THE REGION DOES NOT  
10 DRIVE THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED DETERMINATION THAT IS  
11 CALCULATED BY THE STATE USING DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE DATA NOT  
12 PLANNED BAY AREA SO I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT REGARDLESS OF  
13 THE FORECAST FROM THIS PLAN OR NEXT PLAN ON CALCULATION FOR  
14 THAT HOW THAT DRIVES HOUSING ELEMENTS COMES FROM HCD.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SO HOW DO YOU RECONCILE THAT? A LOT OF THIS  
17 IS DRIVEN BY WHAT THE STATE WANTS THE ECONOMY TO BE AND FOR  
18 THE ECONOMY TO GROW WE HAVE TO HAVE HOUSING AND XYZ, BUT IF  
19 THE REALITY IS THE POPULATION IS GOING DOWN, THERE IS LIKE A  
20 DISCONNECT THERE, I THINK, RIGHT?

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SOME OF THIS GETS INTO THE RHNA PROCESS, AND I AM  
23 SURE THE ABAG BOARD IS MAYBE LOOKING -- MAYBE NOT LOOKING  
24 FORWARD TO DELVING INTO, BUT CERTAINLY SOMETHING IN THE  
25 PIPELINE [LAUGHTER] FOR THE NEXT FEW YEARS, BUT THE RHNA



MARCH 25, 2026

1 PROCESS, WHEN HCD CALCULATES THOSE NUMBERS, AND IT DOES LOOK  
2 AT BOTH EXISTING AND FUTURE NEEDS, SO, YOU'RE CORRECT THAT  
3 POPULATION IS STABILIZED IN THE REGION IN THE PAST FEW YEARS,  
4 IT MAY GROW AGAIN IN THE FUTURE. WE HAVE HAD PEAKS AND TROUGHS  
5 IN OUR GROWTH TRAJECTORY OVER TIME, BUT MOST OF THE REGIONAL  
6 HOUSING NEED DETERMINATION THAT AFFECTS THE BAY AREA COMES  
7 FROM THAT EXISTING NEED, OVERCROWDING, HOMELESSNESS. THESE  
8 SORTS OF ISSUES THAT DRIVE THAT CALCULATION, NOT FUTURE  
9 GROWTH. SO, JUST -- THAT'S -- I'M SURE THAT WILL PROVIDE A LOT  
10 MORE CONTEXT TO ABAG THAT'S GRAPPLING WITH THAT, THAT WON'T  
11 HAPPEN UNTIL 2027 BUT THAT'S COMING SOON.

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. I KNOW IT WAS DRIVEN, YOU KNOW WE  
14 ALWAYS HEAR ABOUT THE JOBS/HOUSING RATIO, BUT AGAIN AN AFFECT  
15 OF -- IF THERE AREN'T AS MANY JOBS DOESN'T THAT AFFECT THAT  
16 RATIO AND THE FORMULA MAYBE THE FORMULA WOULD NEED TO BE  
17 RETWEAKED OR REDONE TO ACCOUNT FOR THE CHANGES THAT ARE  
18 HAPPENING. AND I THINK ABOUT JOBS AND AI, RIGHT, WHERE  
19 EXPECTED TO BE JOB LOSS TO HAPPEN HOW WILL THAT ALL BE  
20 CALCULATED? I GUESS THE QUESTION WE'LL LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING  
21 ANSWERS ON. BUT IN REGARDS TO -- AND I APPRECIATE OUR VISION,  
22 YOU KNOW, I HAVE BEEN THINKING A LOT LATELY, ABOUT, YOU KNOW,  
23 I OFTEN HEAR FOLKS SAY HOW CALIFORNIA, WE'RE THE FOURTH  
24 LARGEST ECONOMY IN THE WORLD WHICH, YOU KNOW, SOUNDS GREAT,  
25 BUT THEN I HAVE BEEN THINKING, WELL, WE SEE THIS HUGE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 AFFORDABILITY GAP INCREASING. AND, SO, I DON'T KNOW, LIKE, IF  
2 THE BENEFIT OF US BEING SUCH A LARGE ECONOMY, IF NOT EVERYBODY  
3 IS BEING ABLE TO ENJOY THE BENEFITS OF THAT. SO SHOULDN'T  
4 AFFORDABILITY BE MORE OUR FOCUS HERE? YOU KNOW, IT'S GREAT FOR  
5 THE HIGH EARNERS, THEIR EARNINGS WILL CONTINUE TO RISE, BUT WE  
6 SEE LOWER LEVEL, YOU KNOW, THE FOLKS EARNING LESS, THEIR  
7 INCOME DROPPING, SO AS AN ORGANIZATION AND AS AN AGENCY  
8 SHOULDN'T BE REALLY BE LOOKING AT HOW TO CLOSE THAT GAP AND  
9 BRING BACK THE MIDDLE CLASS? SO, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S FOR  
10 THE NEXT PLAN, BUT YOU KNOW, I WOULD HOPE THAT IS A FOCUS THAT  
11 WE COULD PUT MORE EMPHASIS ON. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

14

15 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** GREAT. I JUST WANT TO ADD MY ACCOLADES AND  
16 APPRECIATION FOR THE INCREDIBLE WORK THAT STAFF HAS DONE ON  
17 THIS AND CONTINUES TO DO. AND WHEN I LOOKED AT, PARTICULARLY,  
18 THE PUBLIC INPUT, IT IS JUST A REMINDER TO ALL OF US HOW OUR  
19 RESIDENTS SEE THIS REGION AS A VERY INTERCONNECTED PLACE, NOT  
20 AS OUR SEPARATE JURISDICTIONS, AND, AGAIN, TO HAVE A PLAN THAT  
21 SEES THAT INTEGRATED WHOLE, IS VERY POWERFUL. AND IT'S THE  
22 ONLY WAY ANY OF US IS GOING TO ACHIEVE ANYTHING. SO, I JUST TO  
23 MARK THAT MOMENT. I ALSO WANT TO ADD MY SUPPORT TO  
24 COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE  
25 PROPOSED LEGISLATION IN MAKING OUR WORK ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION -



MARCH 25, 2026

1 - A LITTLE MORE IMPLEMENTATION, A LITTLE LESS REPORT WRITING,  
2 PLEASE. AND I DID WANT TO JUST ASK A QUICK CLARIFYING  
3 QUESTION. WHEN I HAD MY BRIEFING, YOU KNOW, MY JOB DROPPED  
4 WHEN YOU TOLD ME THE COST JUST OF DOING THE EIR. AND THE IDEA  
5 THAT WE HAVE TO PREPARE AN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR A  
6 PLAN THAT IS TO MEET OUR OBLIGATIONS, TO MEET OUR CLIMATE  
7 REDUCTION -- OR, YOU KNOW, EMISSIONS REDUCTION MANDATES --  
8 [LAUGHTER] -- IS REALLY CUCKOO. YOU KNOW, THAT'S I CAN'T THINK  
9 OF A MORE SO SOPHISTICATED WORD FOR IT.

10

11 **CHAIR, NOACK:** BETTER TECHNICAL TERM. [LAUGHTER]

12

13 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** SO WITH RESPECT TO CEQA EXEMPTION PART OF THAT  
14 LEGISLATION OR ARE WE PURSUING THAT THROUGH A DIFFERENT PATH?  
15 I CANNOT REMEMBER. THANK YOU FOR -- I JUST WANTED TO LIFT UP  
16 THAT ISSUE AND ALSO CLARIFICATION ON THAT PARTICULAR PART.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT WAS PART OF OUR DISCUSSION IN SACRAMENTO  
19 WAS SEQA EXEMPTION AS WELL.

20

21 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** IS IT CURRENTLY IN THAT PIECE OF LEGISLATION.

22

23 **CHAIR, NOACK:** I BELIEVE IT IS.

24

25 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** IT IS? OKAY. GREAT. BECAUSE I RECALL THE PRICE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TAG WAS \$5 MILLION JUST FOR THE EIR.

2

3 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH, FOR ALL-IN, KIND OF, CONSULTANT AND STAFF  
4 TIME IT'S APPROXIMATELY \$4 MILLION PER EIR.

5

6 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** OKAY. JUST TO RAISE THAT PIECE OF -- ANYWAY,  
7 THANK YOU. AWESOME. I'M SURE WE ALL LOOK FORWARD TO BEING  
8 PARTNERS IN IMPLEMENTING THE PLAN. THANKS.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER BURT?

11

12 **PAT BURT:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO SHARE SOME OF THE ISSUES  
13 THAT I RAISED AT THE PLANNING COMMITTEE. I'M GOING TO BE  
14 SUPPORTING THE PLAN, REALLY NOT BECAUSE I'M CONVINCED THAT IT  
15 -- THE FLAWS IN IT AND ITS ASSUMPTIONS AND PREMISES AREN'T  
16 SIGNIFICANT, BUT THAT I'M REALLY FOCUSED ON THE 2060 UPDATE  
17 AND INCORPORATING THOSE. WE HAVE HAD THE STATE DEPARTMENT OF  
18 FINANCE AND DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION BOTH FORECAST FOR THE  
19 STATE AND THE REGION, WHICH RATHER THAN SHOWING MASSIVE GROWTH  
20 BY 2060 THEY'RE PROJECTING NO GROWTH ALTHOUGH THE ARGUMENT IS  
21 MADE THAT IF WE ACHIEVE GOALS OF REDUCING OR ADDRESSING OUR  
22 HOUSING SHORTAGE AND HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, AND OUR  
23 TRANSPORTATION ISSUES THERE WILL BE SOME INDUCED GROWTH AND I  
24 THINK THAT'S CORRECT ALTHOUGH WE HAVE ALSO HAD FACTORS THAT  
25 HAVE OCCURRED EVEN SINCE THOSE FORECASTS THAT MAY BE FURTHER



MARCH 25, 2026

1 DIMINISH POPULATION AND WORKER GROWTH THAT BEING THE ADVENT OF  
2 AI AND AUTOMATION IN PRODUCTIVITY THAT WOULD COME FROM THAT  
3 WHICH GOES TO ANOTHER POINT WHICH IS THAT WE HAVE TENDED TO  
4 CORRELATE JOB GROWTH AND POPULATION GROWTH WITH ECONOMIC  
5 GROWTH FOR THE REGION AND THEY DO NOT TRACK. WE HAVE FAR  
6 EXCEEDED OUR ECONOMIC GROWTH HAS FAR EXCEEDED OUR POPULATION  
7 AND JOB GROWTH FOR DECADES. BECAUSE THE VERY NATURE OF THE  
8 TECHNOLOGY ECONOMY IS ONE THAT IS HYPERPRODUCTIVE.  
9 PARTICULARLY IN THE IT SECTOR. AND THAT'S WHAT REALLY IS THE  
10 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN NORMAL ECONOMIC GROWTH THAT WOULD BE BASED  
11 UPON POPULATION AND WORKERS, AND WHAT WE FACE. AT THE SAME  
12 TIME AS COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA NOTED, WE HAVE THIS WORLD ENVY  
13 OF ECONOMIC GROWTH REGIONALLY, AND AN EVER INCREASING INCOME  
14 INEQUALITY, AND AFFORDABILITY GAP. AND SO, WE HAVE THESE  
15 PREMISES THAT I THINK ARE NOT WELL FOUNDED ABOUT WHAT THE  
16 FUTURE LOOKS LIKE, A QUESTION OF WHAT REALLY ARE OUR GOALS, OR  
17 SHOULD BE OUR GOALS, AND HOW WE ADDRESS THEM. I THINK WE DO  
18 HAVE A GREAT OPPORTUNITY IN THE COMING YEARS TO ACTUALLY  
19 ADDRESS OUR AFFORDABILITY ISSUES ON HOUSING AND  
20 TRANSPORTATION, WHEREAS WITH THE RAPID GROWTH THAT WAS  
21 PROJECTED, WHICH WAS 1.4 MILLION HOUSING UNITS BY 2060, AND  
22 NOW IT'S 1 MILLION, WHICH CORRELATES TO, STILL, TWO AND A HALF  
23 MILLION ADDITIONAL RESIDENTS, OR ABOUT 30% GROWTH IN THE  
24 REGION, WHEN WE ARE NOT SEEING ANY GROWTH, AND NOT PROJECTED  
25 TO BY THOSE AGENCIES TO SEE UNINDUCED GROWTH. THAT'S STILL A



MARCH 25, 2026

1 VERY RAPID GROWTH THAT WOULD, IF IT OCCURRED, VERY LIKELY,  
2 FURTHER EXACERBATE OUR VERY PROBLEMS. INSTEAD, WE HAVE GOT AN  
3 OPPORTUNITY, WITH A MORE MODERATE GRADE OF POPULATION OF  
4 WORKER GROWTH, STRONG ECONOMIC GROWTH, WE MAY BE ABLE TO  
5 ACTUALLY NARROW OUR GAPS THAT ARE SO SIGNIFICANT TO OUR  
6 REGION. I ALSO AM CONCERNED THAT WE NEED TO HAVE EVEN A  
7 GREATER FOCUS ON UNDERSTANDING HOW THE INITIATIVES WHAT WE ARE  
8 EMBRACING ARE WORKING AND WHETHER WE NEED TO MODIFY THEM. OUR  
9 TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT HAS BEEN A GREAT SUCCESS. AND,  
10 YET, IN THE SAME TIME PERIOD, IN PRECOVID, OUR USE OF TRANSIT  
11 SLIGHTLY DECLINED. I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT WHAT WE DO IN  
12 ADDITION TO TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT, NOT INSTEAD OF IT,  
13 BUT STRONGER EMPHASIS ON NETWORKS, STRONGER EMPHASIS ON  
14 AVAILABILITY OF TRANSIT PASSES, PARTICULARLY FOR LOW-INCOME  
15 WORKERS AND RESIDENTS. AND A GREATER RECOGNITION AND EMBRACING  
16 OF WHAT WAS DISCUSSED OF EMERGING TECHNOLOGIES, INCLUDING  
17 WHAT'S -- HOW MICRO-MOBILITY IS, TO SOME EXTENT, TRANSFORMED  
18 THE BOUNDARIES OF TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. AS WELL AS  
19 THEY AREN'T REALLY SUCCESSFUL IF THEY'RE JUST TRANSIT ORIENTED  
20 COMMUNITIES. THEY REALLY NEED TO BE PEDESTRIAN IN TRANSIT  
21 ORIENTED COMMUNITY WITH SERVICES BEING COLOCATED AND STUDIES  
22 REPEATEDLY SHOW THAT THE ADJACENCY OF THOSE SERVICES IS EVEN  
23 MORE IMPORTANT THAN TRIP REDUCTION THAN THE ADJACENCY TO  
24 TRANSIT, AND YET WE CALL IT TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES,  
25 RATHER THAN PEDESTRIAN AND TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. SO,



MARCH 25, 2026

1 I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT RANGE OF ISSUES REALLY BEING  
2 TACKLED IN THE 2060 PROGRAM SO THAT WE ACTUALLY HAVE AN  
3 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE REAL PROGRESS THAT WE'RE ALL HOPING FOR.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI? I SAW YOU  
6 HAD YOUR HAND RAISED. DO YOU STILL WANT TO SPEAK?

7

8 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** YES, I GUESS I JUST WANTED TO SAY, JUST  
9 ALONG THE LINES OF ELEVATING AN ISSUE, I THINK THAT WE REALLY  
10 NEED TO BE AWARE THAT IT'S BECOMING HARDER AND HARDER FOR  
11 PEOPLE WHO CANNOT GET INTO TAXIS OR UBERS, OR -- OR SELF-  
12 DRIVING TAXIS, TO GET AROUND. AND INCREASINGLY, IT'S LOOKING  
13 LIKE THE -- THE INDUSTRY THAT IS -- WE'RE BUILDING, SELF-  
14 DRIVING VEHICLES, FOR TAXIS FOR EXAMPLE, IS FOCUSING ON USING  
15 VEHICLES THAT LOOK LIKE OUR CURRENT DRIVABLE VEHICLES, AS  
16 OPPOSED TO ONES THAT OPEN FROM THE SIDE AND ALLOW PEOPLE IN  
17 WHEELCHAIRS TO ROLL IN, AND I THINK WE NEED TO BE AWARE THAT  
18 WE ARE -- HAVE GONE BACKWARDS IN TERMS OF ACCESSIBLE  
19 TRANSPORTATION FOR PEOPLE IN WHEELCHAIRS, SINCE THE '90S,  
20 BECAUSE OF THE FOCUS ON TNC'S, AND THAT IF WE DON'T MAKE  
21 EFFORTS TO CHANGE OF FOCUS OF WHAT DRIVERLESS VEHICLES ARE  
22 GOING TO LOOK LIKE IN THE FUTURE, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE AN EVEN  
23 GREATER PROBLEM. SO, I HOPE THAT THAT CAN BE ELEVATED TO  
24 SOMETHING THAT WE ADD TO OUR LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES AND IN  
25 WHATEVER AREAS THAT WE CAN, FROM OUR VANTAGE POINT, WORK



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TOWARD RESOLVING THOSE ISSUES. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS?

4 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

5

6 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES, I JUST HAD A QUESTION. THE SLIDE THAT YOU  
7 TALKED ABOUT, WHAT'S CHANGED, FINAL IMPLEMENTATION, IT WAS  
8 MENTIONED THAT MERGER OF TWO RELATED ACTION ITEMS ASSOCIATED  
9 WITH ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AND VISION ZERO, INTO A SINGLE  
10 COHESIVE ACTION, EITHER WHAT WAS THAT? OR -- WHAT I HAVE BEEN  
11 LOOKING FOR, WHERE IS IT?

12

13 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, I BELIEVE THAT'S ACTION 21. AND THERE IS MORE  
14 DETAIL ON THESE ACTIONS IN THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT THAT KIND  
15 OF BREAKS IT DOWN. BUT WHAT I WAS SPEAKING ABOUT IS, YOU KNOW,  
16 WE HAVE MULTIPLE PROGRAMS HERE AT MTC TO SUPPORT -- TO SUPPORT  
17 VISION ZERO AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. WE HAVE SECURED FEDERAL  
18 GRANTS IN THIS SPACE. WE HAVE ALSO HAD SOME LONG-STANDING  
19 PROGRAMS. AS WE MOVE FORWARD, WE WOULD LIKE TO CONTINUE TO  
20 BRING THOSE THINGS CLOSER TOGETHER. BECAUSE WE KNOW SOME OF  
21 OUR COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS RAISED CONCERNS THAT  
22 THERE WERE MULTIPLE OVERLAPPING OR DUPLICATE PROGRAMS SO WE  
23 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE THOSE ARE ALL KIND OF PULLING IN THE  
24 SAME DIRECTION. SO IN TERMS OF ADDITIONAL DETAIL ON ACTION 21,  
25 THERE IS AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN REPORT THAT BREAKS IT DOWN



MARCH 25, 2026

1 WITH SUBBULLETS OF SOME KIND OF HOW SOME OF THE DIFFERENT WAYS  
2 THAT WE ADVANCE SAFETY.

3

4 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU I'LL TAKE A LOOK AT IT NOW.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH, I'M SORRY. ONE MORE THING HERE WE HAVE  
9 INVESTED A LOT IN THIS PLAN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT LEGISLATION  
10 HELPED IMPROVE THAT I THINK WE ALSO NEED TO BE AWARE OF  
11 LEGISLATION WHICH DOESN'T HELP US IN ADVANCING THIS PLAN.  
12 YESTERDAY WE FOUND OUT THAT SENATOR WIENER IS NOT PURSUING  
13 CLEAN-UP ON ACTION OF SB79, WHICH PLAYING ON WHAT COMMISSIONER  
14 BURT SAID HERE, TO ACHIEVE OUR GOALS, REALISTICALLY, IN  
15 PUTTING JOBS AND HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT HERE, THE COMMERCIAL  
16 ASPECT IS VERY IMPORTANT TO SUSTAINABILITY IN LOCAL  
17 JURISDICTIONS. AND, SO, WITH SB79, I KNOW A LOT OF CITIES ARE  
18 HAVING MEETINGS REGARDING THAT. AND I'M JUST GOING TO TIDY  
19 THIS UP REAL QUICK, WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL IN WHAT LEGISLATION  
20 WE SUPPORT AND HOW WE NEED TO ADVANCE THIS PLAN HERE. SO, THAT  
21 IS NOT HELPFUL, HIS DROPPING THE CLEAN UP LANGUAGE AND  
22 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA IS LOOKING FOR THEIR OWN EXEMPTION TO  
23 THAT. SO I'M JUST GOING TO LEAVE IT THERE BUT PLEASE WE HAVE  
24 TO WORK TOGETHER TO ADVANCE THIS. THE THANK YOU.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? NO?  
2 OKAY. WITH THAT, WE'LL START WITH 10B, WHICH IS MOTION TO  
3 ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4748, TRANSPORTATION AIR QUALITY  
4 CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR BAY AREA -- PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND  
5 THE AMENDED 2025 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM. CAN I  
6 HAVE A MOTION? THANK YOU. CAN I HAVE A SECOND, PLEASE? DID I  
7 GET TWO OVER THERE. OH, THANK YOU. SORRY. SOME OF THE VOICES  
8 SOUND ALIKE OVER THERE. I WASN'T ABLE TO TELL. SO, WE HAVE A  
9 MOTION AND A SECOND. WE ALREADY TOOK PUBLIC COMMENT. SO --  
10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACTUALLY --

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU WANT TO GIVE THE PUBLIC A SECOND CHANCE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS CORRECT.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE'LL GIVE THEM A SECOND CHANCE. DO WE  
18 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO, ACTUALLY.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER]

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO HANDS RAISED --

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GIVING EVERYBODY A SECOND CHANCE AND I GET  
2 NONE. ALL RIGHT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE TRIED.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE TRIED. OKAY. WITH THAT CAN WE HAVE A ROLL  
7 CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES MOTION BY MELGAR, SECOND RAMOS. NOACK?

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

9

10 **PAT BURT:** YES UPON CORZO? ABSENT. FLEMING? ABSENT. JOHN-

11 BAPTISTE?

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE LEE? IS ABSENT. MAHAN? ABSENT.

14 MANFREE? MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

17

18 **BOARD CLERK:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS? THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

19 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU TAKE ACTION FOR AGENDA ITEM 10C DO

22 I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION 4749 FINAL

23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ CERTIFYING FINAL EIR AND ADOPTING CEQA

24 FINDINGS STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS AND MITIGATION

25 MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** SO MOVED. EZZY ASHCRAFT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION BY ANDERSEN. NOPE.  
5 MOTION BY EZZY ASHCRAFT -- SECOND FROM ANDERSEN. [LAUGHTER] AM  
6 I GIVING EVERYBODY A SECOND CHANCE ON THIS TOO?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE ARE. AND WITH THAT, IF THERE IS  
9 ANYONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND NOW FOR ITEM  
10 10C, OTHERWISE WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO ONE  
11 APPROACHED THE PODIUM NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE  
12 CURRENTLY.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY EZZY ASHCRAFT, SECOND  
17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN. NOACK?

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

13

14 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

17

18 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO? ABSENT. FLEMING? ABSENT. JOHN-

21 BAPTISTE?

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN ABSENT.

24 MANFREE? MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY? PAPAN?

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
8 MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU WE'LL NOW TAKE ACTION FOR ITEM 10D  
11 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER  
12 4750 FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** SECOND.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU THAT WAS MUCH QUICKER. THANK YOU.  
19 SECOND ROUND FOR PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ONE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M SORRY I DIDN'T CATCH THE SECONDER.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOULTON-PETERS IS ONE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. NOTHING RECEIVED IN THIS -- FOR



MARCH 25, 2026

1 WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM, NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM  
2 SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, AND ACTUALLY, JUST TO  
3 REITERATE, THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE THAT WAS RECEIVED IN  
4 REFERENCE ON ITEM 10A IS FROM JASON BASES FOR ITEM 10D AND  
5 WITH THAT I'LL TAKE ROLL CALL ON THIS ITEM.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PLEASE DO.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOT IT. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER  
10 MOULTON-PETERS SECOND AHN. NOACK?

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UPON ANDERSEN?

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

6

7 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

10

11 **PAT BURT:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORZO? ABSENT. FLEMING ABSENT, JOHN-  
14 BAPTISTE?

15

16 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?  
19 MASHBURN? MELGAR? COMMISSIONER MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?  
20 COMMISSIONER RAMOS? THANK YOU. PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
21 MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE WILL NOW TAKE ACTION FOR AGENDA  
24 ITEM 10E. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC  
25 RESOLUTION 4646 REVISED, 2025TIP AMENDMENT, 2025/'28.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** SO MOVED, JOHN-BAPTISTE.

3

4 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** SECOND, EZZY ASHCRAFT.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AND SECOND CALL FOR PUBLIC  
7 COMMENT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SECOND CALL FOR ITEM 10E, NO HANDS RAISED  
10 IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND  
11 NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. I GAVE A LOT OF SECOND CHANCES. NO  
14 COMMENTS. OKAY GREAT. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WITH MOTION BY COMMISSIONER JOHN-  
17 BAPTISTE, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT. CHAIR NOACK?

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

13

14 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

17

18 **PAT BURT:** YES.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** CORZO IS ABSENT. FLEMING ABSENT. JOHN-BAPTISTE?

21

22 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

23

24 **BOARD CLERK:** LEE IS ABSENT. MAHAN ABSENT. MANFREE? MASHBURN?

25 MELGAR? MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
7 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE --  
10 CONGRATULATIONS ON FINALIZING 2050+. APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK.  
11 WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 11. THIS IS THE -- THE FOLLOWING  
12 ITEM IS COMING DIRECTLY TO THE COMMISSION FOR INFORMATION AND  
13 NO ACTION IS REQUIRED FROM THE COMMISSION AT THIS TIME. AGENDA  
14 ITEM 11 A NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER UPDATE. I BRIEFLY MENTIONED  
15 IN FEBRUARY THAT SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS AND I MET WITH PETER  
16 TORRELLAS PRESIDENT OF CUBIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS AND  
17 CYNTHIA ENG HERE THEY COME SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT GENERAL  
18 MANAGER WE UNDERScoreD IN CLEAR TERMS THAT CLIPPER'S  
19 PERFORMANCE IS CENTRAL TO THE REGION'S TRANSIT RECOVERY AND TO  
20 MAINTAINING PUBLIC CONFIDENCE CUBIC'S PRESIDENT AFFIRMED THEY  
21 HAVE MOBILIZED THE RESOURCES RIDERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE  
22 EXPERIENCING AND CONVEYED FULL UNDERSTANDING OF THE  
23 SIGNIFICANCE OF DELIVERING A SUCCESSFUL CLIPPER SYSTEM FOR THE  
24 BAY AREA MR. TORRELLAS IS IN ATTENDANCE TODAY TO REPORT ON THE  
25 PROGRESS. MTC STAFF JASON WEINSTEIN WILL PRESENT UPDATE ON



MARCH 25, 2026

1 NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM HIGHLIGHTING PROGRAM'S  
2 BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENT HISTORY AS WELL AS IMPLEMENTATION  
3 AND PROGRESS OF THE NEW ACCOUNT-BASED PLATFORM AND TRADITION  
4 CURRENT CLIPPER USERS I'LL TURN IT TURNOVER TO EXECUTIVE  
5 DIRECTOR FREMIER TO PROVIDE A FEW REMARKS FOLLOWED BY JASON'S  
6 PRESENTATION.

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND MEMBERS OF THE  
9 COMMISSION ANDREW FREMIER EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. SO AS YOU KNOW  
10 IN JANUARY THE COMMISSION MEETING GAVE US A WHOLE BUNCH OF  
11 INPUT IN TERMS OF THE SYSTEM PERFORMANCE AND OF COURSE THE  
12 IMPACTS IT HAS ON RIDERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS. I HAVE SINCE  
13 THEN HAD A LOT OF INDIVIDUAL CONVERSATIONS WITH SOME OF YOU TO  
14 GET SPECIFIC INPUT IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE PERFORMANCE ITEMS  
15 AND ALSO EDUCATION ON SOME OF THE BACKGROUND AND  
16 COMPLICATIONS. AND JUST TO REASSURE ALL OF YOU, WE ARE VERY  
17 MUCH INVOLVED IN TRYING TO MAKE THE SYSTEM OPERATE AS  
18 DESIGNED. IT'S AN EXTREMELY IMPORTANT PRIORITY FOR US, AND I  
19 THINK YOU WILL SEE FROM THIS PRESENTATION AND THE COMMENTS  
20 FROM THE CONTRACTOR CUBIC, THAT WE ARE ALL FOCUSED ON IT. SO,  
21 I ALSO HAVE BEEN IN DIRECT CONTACT WITH PETER MONTGOMERY  
22 TORRELLAS TO MAKE SURE OUR CONCERNS ARE CONVEYED AND WHAT THE  
23 COMMISSION'S EXPECTATIONS ARE FOR RAPID AND MEASURABLE  
24 PROGRESS. WE WERE HAVING THESE CONVERSATIONS A LONG TIME  
25 BEFORE LAUNCH AND WE CONTINUE THEM ON NOW MUCH MORE FOCUSED



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ON THE VARIOUS SPECIFIC DELIVERABLES FOR CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE.  
2 WE ALSO WORK VERY CLOSELY WITH THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD WE  
3 HAVE HAD SIGNIFICANT DISCUSSIONS SINCE JANUARY ON MOVING  
4 FORWARD. WE'RE GETTING THE TRANSIT OPERATORS DIRECT FEEDBACK  
5 TO CUBIC REGARDING ALL OF THE OPERATIONAL CHALLENGES THAT WE  
6 HAVE IDENTIFIED, IN PARTICULAR, CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE CONCERNS  
7 AND EXPECTATIONS FOR TIMELY RESOLUTION. WE DO KNOW, ALSO,  
8 THOUGH, THAT THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM DOES REPRESENT  
9 A SIZABLE INVESTMENT IN THE REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM. AND THERE  
10 IS A NUMBER OF REASONS WHY IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE GET IT  
11 RUNNING PROPERLY AND AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. THE FIRST, OF  
12 COURSE, IS THAT OUR CUSTOMERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS NEED IT TO  
13 WORK. AND A SECOND REASON IS THE NEW SYSTEM DOES PROVIDE THE  
14 TECHNOLOGY FOUNDATION FOR SEVERAL THINGS THAT WE CAN DO TO  
15 IMPROVE THE RIDER EXPERIENCE. SO, JASON IS GOING TO WALK  
16 THROUGH IT FOLLOWED BY MR. MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS.

17

18 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU ANDY JASON WEINSTEIN CLIPPER  
19 DIRECTOR TODAY I'M GOING TO PROVIDE UPDATE ON THE NEXT  
20 GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM WHERE WE ARE NOW WHAT'S WORKING WHAT  
21 WE'RE FIXING AND WHAT'S NEXT AS WE MOVE FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE.  
22 LET ME START BY OUR BROADER VISION TO UNIFY BAY AREA TRANSIT  
23 OPERATORS AS PART OF THIS VISION CLIPPER DELIVERS A SEAMLESS  
24 INTUITIVE FARE PAYMENT AND CONTRIBUTES TO THIS UNIFIED TRANSIT  
25 EXPERIENCE IN ONE OF THE MOST COMPLEX TRANSIT ECOSYSTEMS IN



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THE COUNTRY. THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD PROVIDES A GOVERNANCE  
2 STRUCTURE AND DIRECTION TO THE PROGRAM AND OVER THE PAST  
3 DECADE THE STRUCTURE HAS FACILITATED MEANINGFUL COLLABORATION  
4 AMONG THE REGION'S TRANSIT PARTNERS WITH MTC AND SHARED FOCUS  
5 ON DEVELOPMENT CUSTOMER CENTER ORDER POLICIES AND PRODUCTS.  
6 NEXT SLIDE. A QUICK REMINDER HOW WE GOT HERE, A PRETTY LONG  
7 HISTORY FOR FORMERLY TRANSLINK AND NOW CLIPPER IT LAUNCHED ON  
8 AC TRANSIT AND GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT IN 22006 IN 2010 REBRANDING  
9 WAS COMPLETE WHILE NEW TRANSIT OPERATORS WERE STILL BEING ON-  
10 BOARD EVEN BEFORE THE EXPANSION TO ALL 22 TRANSIT OPERATORS  
11 WAS COMPLETE PLANNING FOR NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM BEGAN AND IN  
12 2015 MTC AND TRANSIT OPERATORS BROUGHT IN TECHNICAL CONSULTANT  
13 TO HELP DEVELOP THE SCOPE OF WORK TO MODERNIZE THE REGION'S  
14 FARE SYSTEM. NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM IS DELIVERED  
15 THROUGH MULTIPLE CONTRACTS, LARGEST OF WHICH IS OUR SYSTEM  
16 INTEGRATOR CONTRACT WITH CUBIC THIS GRAPHIC ILLUSTRATES  
17 PROCUREMENT TIMELINE FOR THIS CONTRACT. IT TOOK OVER TWO YEARS  
18 STARTING WITH TWO ROUNDS OF INDUSTRY OUTREACH, WHICH PROVIDED  
19 VALUABLE INPUT INTO THE REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS THAT WAS  
20 ULTIMATELY RELEASED. THE GOAL HERE WAS TO INCREASE COMPETITION  
21 AND BASED ON INDUSTRY ENGAGEMENT WE ANTICIPATED SEVERAL FIRMS  
22 FOR THE BID, HOWEVER WE RECEIVED A SINGLE BID FROM CUBIC AND  
23 PROCEEDED THROUGH THE BEST AND FINAL OFFER PROCESS AT THAT  
24 TIME. NEXT SLIDE. SO JUST LITTLE BIT BEFORE I GO FURTHER INTO  
25 THE TIMELINE I WANT TO TALK ABOUT WHAT DOES NEXT GENERATION



MARCH 25, 2026

1 CLIPPER BRING? IT REALM BRINGS THE CAPABILITIES THAT RIDERS  
2 EXPECT TODAY SUCH AS ABILITY TO TAP AND RIDE WITH A PHONE, OR  
3 CONTACTLESS CREDIT CARD. IT ALSO SUPPORTS PROMOTIONAL REGIONAL  
4 DISCOUNTS AND ALL THE EXISTING EQUITY PROGRAMS THAT EXIST.  
5 MOST IMPORTANTLY, IT'S A MODERN PLATFORM AS DIRECTOR PREMIER  
6 POINTED OUT, THAT WE NEED TO GROW THE SYSTEM GOING FORWARD.  
7 NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE IMPLEMENTATION BEGAN IN 2018 AND  
8 CULMINATED IN SYSTEM LAUNCH THIS PAST DECEMBER 2019 AND 2024  
9 WE DEPLOYED CLIPPER CARDS TO APPLE AND GOOGLE WALLETS  
10 MANUFACTURED AND INSTALLED NEW EQUIPMENT SYSTEM WIDE AND  
11 COMPLETED LAB AND FIELD TESTING. AND IN AUGUST 2025, WE  
12 LAUNCHED CONTACTLESS CREDIT DEBIT ACCEPTANCE ALSO KNOWN AS TAP  
13 AND RIDE ON BART WHICH WAS A MAJOR MILESTONE AHEAD OF THE  
14 START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION. THE MILESTONE THAT REPRESENTED  
15 THE LAUNCH OF THE NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM WHICH OCCURRED IN  
16 DECEMBER 2025. NEXT SLIDE. WHERE WE ARE TODAY. THE SYSTEM  
17 LAUNCH ON DECEMBER 10TH, TODAY IT'S OPERATION IS OPERATING IN  
18 WHAT WE'RE CALLING STABILIZATION MODE. THIS SLIDE SAYS 1.2  
19 MILLION CARDS WE HAVE MIGRATED 1.3 SINCE PRODUCTION OF THIS  
20 MATERIALS, AND THAT'S HAPPENING THROUGH ON-DEMAND MIGRATION.  
21 YOU CAN TRIGGER THIS PROCESS 1 OF 3 WAYS LOGGING ON TO THE  
22 CLIPPER WEBSITE, CLIPPER APP OR REACHING OUT TO THE CUSTOMER  
23 SERVICE AGENT. ONCE THEY LOOK YOU UP, THEY YOU ON A LIST TO  
24 MIGRATE. SO FAR, 1.3 MILLION DIFFERENT CARDS HAVE HAD THAT  
25 OCCUR. HOWEVER THE LAUNCH HAS REVEALED MANY CUSTOMER IMPACTING



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ISSUES MORE THAN WE ANTICIPATED. EVERY DAY MTC, CUBIC, AND  
2 TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO IDENTIFY AND CLOSE  
3 THOSE GAPS. AS A RESULT, WE PAUSED WHAT WE'RE CALLING BULK  
4 MIGRATION WHICH IS THE LARGE-SCALE MIGRATION SO THAT WE CAN  
5 FOCUS ON RESOLVING THESE ISSUES TO AVOID INCREASING CUSTOMER-  
6 FACING ISSUES. NEXT SLIDE. DESPITE CHALLENGES, FEBRUARY WAS A  
7 STRONG MONTH, WITH OVER 4 MILLION ACCOUNT-BASED TRIPS BEING  
8 MADE. THAT IS APPROXIMATELY 31%, ALMOST A THIRD OF ALL TRIPS.  
9 22% CAME FROM ACCOUNT-BASED CARDS THAT'S OUR CLIPPER CARDS  
10 WHETHER THEY BE NEW CARDS PEOPLE GOT OR EXISTING ONES THAT  
11 HAVE BEEN MIGRATED AND OTHER 9% OF TRIPS CAME FROM CONTACTLESS  
12 CREDIT AND DEBIT CARDS. WE'RE SEEING GROWTH IN ACCOUNT-BASED  
13 CLIPPER CARD USAGE WHICH TELLS US THE SYSTEM IS MOVING IN THE  
14 RIGHT DIRECTION WHILE THE NUMBERS ARE ENCOURAGING THE SYSTEM  
15 HASN'T YET EXPERIENCED FULL GROWTH WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT  
16 WILL COME WHEN WE'RE READY TO SCALE UP MIGRATION. NEXT SLIDE.  
17 SOME CUSTOMERS EXPERIENCE MIGRATION ISSUES SUCH AS MISSING  
18 PASSES, AUTOLOAD PROBLEMS OR UNEXPECTED CHARGES FOR RIDERS  
19 THESE ISSUES CAN CREATE FINANCIAL STRAIN NOT JUST  
20 INCONVENIENCE. WE TAKE THAT VERY SERIOUSLY AND WE HAVE MADE  
21 THE AFFECTED CUSTOMERS WHOLE THROUGH INTERIM MEASURES WHILE  
22 CUBIC IS DELIVERING PERMANENT FIXES. THE GOOD NEWS HERE IS  
23 THAT FOR THE VAST MAJORITY OF CUSTOMERS WHO MIGRATE TODAY THE  
24 PROCESS WORKS CORRECTLY BUT WE WON'T BE SATISFIED UNTIL EVERY  
25 CUSTOMER HAS A RELIABLE MIGRATION EXPERIENCE. EARLY SYSTEM



MARCH 25, 2026

1 INSTABILITY RESULTED IN MULTIPLE OUTAGES THAT DISRUPTED  
2 CUSTOMER'S ABILITY TO CHECK BALANCES AND ADD VALUE AND SOME  
3 CASES PAY FARES. WHILE SYSTEM STABILITY HAS IMPROVED SINCE  
4 LAUNCH THERE ARE A COUPLE OF OUTAGES THIS MONTH AND SYSTEM  
5 STABILITY IS STILL NOT YET WHERE WE NEED IT TO BE. IN  
6 PARTICULAR CONVINCING MACHINES THEY REMAIN SLOWER LESS  
7 RELIABLE THAN WE NEED THE MAIN CHANGE HERE HAVE BEEN ON MUNI  
8 AND BART VENDING MACHINES IN ONE OF THE CASE CUSTOMERS  
9 ATTEMPTING TO PURCHASE CLIPPER CARDS OR ADD VALUE HAVE  
10 EXPERIENCED TRANSACTION FAILURES HOWEVER RECENT SOFTWARE  
11 HARDWARE UPDATES HAVE REDUCED FAILURES ON MACHINES, BUT  
12 CONSISTENT RELIABLE PERFORMANCE ACROSS ALL TVM'S HAS NOT YET  
13 BEEN ACHIEVED AND BART SPEED IMPROVEMENTS REMAIN PENDING  
14 DELIVERY ACTION FROM CUBIC. NEXT SLIDE. WE ARE ALSO ADDRESSING  
15 ISSUES WITH CUSTOMER SERVICE TERMINALS PLAYERS THAT YOU MIGHT  
16 GO TO AT EMBARCADERO CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER AC TRANSIT OR  
17 OTHER TRANSIT OPERATOR IN-PERSON LOCATIONS THESE ARE ESSENTIAL  
18 FOR RIDER WHO IS RELY ON IN-PERSON ASSISTANCE TO REPLACE LOST  
19 OR DAMAGED CARDS ADD VALUE TO THEIR ACCOUNTS OR RESOLVE  
20 ACCOUNT ISSUES SOME FIXES ARE ALREADY IN PLACE INCLUDING CARD  
21 REPLACEMENT WHILE OTHERS ARE STILL PENDING DEPLOYMENT FARE  
22 INSPECTION DEVICES REQUIRE FURTHER IMPROVEMENT SOFTWARE  
23 STABILITY RELIABILITY ACCURACY AND TIME TO INSPECT CARS REMAIN  
24 ISSUES CURRENT PERFORMANCE IS SLOW FOR HIGH VOLUME  
25 ENVIRONMENTS SUCH AS CALTRAIN LIMITING EFFECTIVE FARE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 INSPECTION CUBIC HAS PROPOSED DATABASE IMPROVEMENTS WITH AN  
2 APRIL TARGET SO THAT SHOULD HELP WITH THAT PERFORMANCE AND A  
3 NUMBER OF OTHER FIXES ARE GOING IN AS WE SPEAK TO FIX  
4 RELIABILITY. MTC AND CLIPPER FINANCE TEAMS ARE WORKING WITH  
5 CUBIC TO FINALIZE FINANCIAL RECONCILIATION AND REPORTING  
6 DOCUMENTATION REVIEW INTERNAL CONTROLS AND SUPPORT ON AUDIT  
7 READINESS THIS WORK IS CRITICAL TO MTC'S FIDUCIARY ROLE AND  
8 OPERATORS FINANCIAL CLOSING PROCESS FOR THEIR RECORDS. NEXT  
9 SLIDE. LET'S TALK ABOUT CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, CALL IN. OUR  
10 CALL IN CENTER CONTINUES TO EXPERIENCE HIGH VOLUMES ON AVERAGE  
11 2,000 CALLS PER WEEKDAY AND 500 CALLS ON SATURDAYS. WC THE  
12 CONTRACTOR RESPONSIBLE FOR CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER IS WORKING  
13 HARD AND HAVE REDUCED ANSWERING TIMES BY ABOUT FIVE MINUTES  
14 SINCE LATE JANUARY CALL HANDLING TIMES ALSO IMPROVED FROM 15  
15 MINUTES DOWN TO 13 MINUTES BUT STILL ABOVE WHERE WE NEED TO BE  
16 WE'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH WSP TO ADDRESS REDUCING ABANDONED  
17 CALLS AND SIMPLIFYING INTERACTION SO CUSTOMERS CAN GET ANSWERS  
18 THEY NEED FASTER. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE'RE MAKING SEVERAL  
19 SIGNIFICANT OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS IN FEBRUARY WE EXPANDED  
20 THE WEEKDAY HOURS, EARLIER IN THE MORNING AND LATER IN THE  
21 AFTERNOON AS CUSTOMERS -- AND AS CUSTOMERS CALL BEFORE 6:00  
22 WHEN WE CALL ON A WEEKDAY, FOR EXAMPLE, THEY WILL BE ABLE TO  
23 BE IN THE QUEUE AS LONG AS THEY GET IN THE QUEUE THERE, STAFF  
24 WILL STAY THERE UNTIL 6:30 OR WHENEVER ALL THOSE CALLS ARE  
25 ANSWERED. WSP IS HIRING ADDITIONAL FULL-TIME STAFF AND PART-



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TIME STAFF, INCLUDING STAFF THAT ALREADY HAVE CLIPPER  
2 EXPERIENCE AND EXPECT MORE HIRES THROUGH MARCH. JUST TO GIVE  
3 YOU AN IDEA BETWEEN DECEMBER AND MARCH, THE NUMBER OF TRAINED  
4 CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVES INCREASED FROM 49 TO 64. E-  
5 MAIL HANDLING HAS INCREASED TO REDUCE BACKLOG AND WE'RE  
6 EXPANDING THE CENTER'S ABILITY TO TRIAGE AND RESOLVE ISSUES BY  
7 E-MAIL WHERE APPROPRIATE WHILE MAINTAINING THE SECURITY OF  
8 PEOPLE'S PERSONALLY IDENTIFIABLE INFORMATION. WE'RE ALSO  
9 PREPARING TO REINTRODUCE THE CALL BACK FEATURE SO THAT DOESN'T  
10 OVERWHELM, YOU DON'T HAVE TO SIT ON HOLD THEY CALL YOU BACK SO  
11 YOU DON'T HAVE TO WAIT ON HOLD. FINALLY TARGETING STAFF  
12 DASHBOARDS AND IMPROVEMENT QUEUE MANAGEMENT TO HELP BRING DOWN  
13 HANDLING TIMES TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. NEXT SLIDE. A  
14 LOT OF PROGRESS HAS BEEN MADE AND THE SYSTEM IS MUCH STRONGER  
15 THAN TODAY -- OR MUCH STRONGER TODAY THAN IT WAS AT LAUNCH.  
16 THE BUT WE'RE NOT DONE. I WANT TO BE CLEAR ABOUT THE NATURE OF  
17 THIS WORK. THIS IS A COMPLEX SYSTEM, AND EACH FIX REQUIRES A  
18 RIGOROUS PROCESS. WE HAVE LEARNED THAT RUSHING FIXES WITHOUT  
19 PROPER VALIDATION CREATES NEW PROBLEMS. SO WE'RE INSISTING ON  
20 DISCIPLINE TESTING BEFORE EACH DEPLOYMENT. THAT SAID,  
21 COMPLEXITY IS NOT AN EXCUSE FOR MISS COMMITMENTS WE'RE  
22 IMPLEMENTING MORE RIGOROUS ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK TRACKING  
23 WHAT GETS COMMITTED TO WHEN IT'S DELIVERED AND IDENTIFYING  
24 PATTERNS SO WE CAN INTERVENE EARLIER WHEN TIMELINES SLIP.  
25 FINANCIAL PROCESS ARE IMPROVED BUT STILL NEED TO REACH NEXT



MARCH 25, 2026

1 DAY CONSISTENCY. CUSTOMER SERVICE CAPACITY AND AUTOMATION  
2 IMPROVEMENTS ARE UNDERWAY AND DEVICE LEVEL FIXES CONTINUE FOR  
3 MOBILE CARDS, FARE INSPECTION, CUSTOMER SERVICE TERMINALS AND  
4 TICKET VENDING MACHINES. WE STILL NEED TO VALIDATE THE SYSTEM  
5 UNDER FULL LOAD, INCLUDING BULK MIGRATION AS MENTIONED BEFORE,  
6 BEFORE WE CAN DECLARE FULL STABILITY. THERE HAS BEEN POSITIVE  
7 PROGRESS THIS MONTH BUT WE'RE JUST NOT FINISHED. NEXT SLIDE.  
8 AS MENTIONED EARLIER, PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS PRESIDENT OF  
9 CUBIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IS HERE TO SHARE HIS UPDATE.

10

11 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND  
12 COMMISSIONERS I WANT TO BEGIN BY ACKNOWLEDGING THAT WHILE NEXT  
13 GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM IS LIVE AND PROGRESS CONTINUES AS  
14 JASON MENTIONED RIDERS FRONTLINE STAFF AND TRANSIT OPERATORS  
15 HAVE NOT HAD THE EXPERIENCE THEY SHOULD EXPECT AND WE TAKE  
16 THAT SERIOUSLY OUR FOCUS REMAINS ON RESOLVING ISSUES IMPROVING  
17 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND SUPPORTING SEAMLESS TRANSITION AS  
18 MIGRATION CONTINUES AS MENTIONED WE HAVE HAD CLEAR SIGNS THAT  
19 THE SYSTEM IS MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION IN TERMS OF SYSTEM  
20 ADOPTION 1.3 MILLION CARDS HAVE BEEN MIGRATED TO THE NEW  
21 PLATFORM REVENUE PROCESS THROUGH NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER  
22 SYSTEM HAS GROWN 100% SINCE DECEMBER WHICH IS JUST OVER 30% OF  
23 REVENUE PROCESS ACROSS THE SYSTEM IN THE NEW C2 ACCOUNT-BASED  
24 SYSTEM AVERAGE WEEKDAY C2 RIDERSHIP WAS UP MORE THAN \$65,000,  
25 WHICH IS 350% FROM DECEMBER. TOGETHER THESE ARE CLEAR SIGNS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THAT MORE RIDERS ARE USING THE NEW SYSTEM AS THE TRANSITION  
2 CONTINUES. AT THE SAME TIME, SOME IMPORTANT ISSUES NEED TO BE  
3 RESOLVED. THEY INCLUDE SYSTEM PERFORMANCE IN CERTAIN AREAS  
4 FINANCIAL RECONCILIATION FARE INSPECTION DEVICES CUSTOMER  
5 SERVICE TERMINAL MOBILE CARD EXPERIENCE AND INSTITUTIONAL  
6 CLIENT MIGRATION. THESE REMAIN PRIORITY BECAUSE WHAT MATTERS  
7 MOST IS NOT ONLY THE SYSTEM IS LIVE AND GROWING, BUT THE  
8 RIDERS AND OPERATORS FEEL THOSE IMPROVEMENTS IN THEIR DAY-TO-  
9 DAY EXPERIENCE. THAT FOCUS IS REFLECTED IN THE WORK UNDER WAY  
10 ACROSS THE SYSTEM. THE MARCH 2026 SYSTEM UPGRADE IMPROVED  
11 PERFORMANCE IN KEY AREAS FINANCIAL RECONCILIATION LAG HAS BEEN  
12 REDUCED TO TWO DAYS, 78% OF FARE INSPECTION DEVICES HAVE BEEN  
13 UPDATED WITH THE REMAINDER EXPECTED TO BE UPDATED SHORTLY IN  
14 COORDINATION WITH OPERATORS. CRITICAL DEFECT LIST ALSO  
15 CONTINUES TO COME DOWN WITH PLAN TO RESOLVE ALL CRITICAL ITEMS  
16 IN MAY SO WE CAN MIGRATE LEGACY ONE C CARD TO THE NEW SYSTEM  
17 IN AN ACCELERATED RATE. THAT IS REAL PROGRESS EVEN WHILE WE  
18 HAVE IMPORTANT WORK STILL UNDER WAY THIS ALSO MATTERS FOR  
19 EMPLOYEES AND INSTITUTIONAL PARTNERS THAT DEPEND ON CLIPPER  
20 EVERY DAY MORE THAN 300 INSTITUTIONS ARE NOW ON C TWO AND MOST  
21 INSTITUTIONAL PROGRAMS ARE CURRENTLY OPERATING ACROSS C1 AND  
22 C2 SUCCESSFULLY WITH ISSUES BEING WORKED CASE BY CASE BASIS.  
23 THESE USERS ARE INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT AND WE CONTINUE TO WORK  
24 CLOSELY WITH MTC AND OUR PARTNERS TO MINIMIZE DISRUPTION  
25 DURING THE TRANSITION. PATH FORWARD IS STRAIGHTFORWARD FOR US.



MARCH 25, 2026

1 WE CONTINUE TO WORK EVERY DAY, MYSELF MEETING WITH ANDY AND  
2 THE TEAM EVERY MONDAY AND OUR TEAM IS WORKING TO MONITOR AND  
3 SUPPORT THE SYSTEM IN A 24 BY SEVEN OPERATION SERVICE.  
4 RESOLVING THE REMAINING KEY CUSTOMER-FACING ISSUES ADDRESS  
5 OPERATOR CONCERNS, CONTINUE IMPROVING SUPPORT AND SYSTEM  
6 PERFORMANCE MOVING TOWARDS A BROADER MIGRATION CAREFULLY AND  
7 RESPONSIBLY WITH THE FOCUS ON MAKING SURE THAT THE NEXT PHASE  
8 WHICH INCLUDES ACCELERATED MIGRATION IS SMOOTHER AND RELIABLE  
9 FOR RIDERS AND OPERATORS ALIKE. THAT REMAINS OUR FOCUS AND I  
10 REMAIN PERSONALLY CLOSELY ENGAGED AT THAT WORK IS DONE WITH  
11 OUR TEAMS WITH MTC THANK YOU I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS  
12 THAT YOU MAY HAVE. THE.

13

14 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** JUST ONE MORE SLIDE CHAIR NOACK IF THAT'S  
15 OKAY?

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEP.

18

19 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU PETER OUR NEXT STEPS ARE FOCUSED ON  
20 ENSURING THE FOLLOWING ITEMS ARE ADDRESSED BEFORE MOVING  
21 FORWARD WITH BULK MIGRATION MUCH OF WHICH PETER ALREADY  
22 MENTIONED SYSTEM STABILITY AND CAPACITY, CRITICAL ITEMS  
23 AFFECTING SYSTEM PERFORMANCE, STABLE PERFORMANCE OF FRONT LINE  
24 EQUIPMENT, CONFIDENCE IN FINANCIAL RECONCILIATION AND AUDIT  
25 READINESS. WE'RE TRACKING CUBIC'S COMMITMENTS AGAINST



MARCH 25, 2026

1 DELIVERY, AND IN PARALLEL ASSESSING HOW THE SCHEDULE COULD  
2 AFFECT OUR FISCAL YEAR '26/'27 BUDGET. AS WE LOOK AHEAD, OUR  
3 PRIORITY IS GETTING FUNDAMENTALS RIGHT BEFORE SCALING UP IN AN  
4 APPROACH THAT PROTECTS CUSTOMERS, TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND  
5 PUBLIC TRUST. THAT CONCLUDES OUR REPORT. I'M ALSO HAPPY TO  
6 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. BEFORE I GO TO OTHER  
9 QUESTIONS, SO, YOU MENTIONED MAY IS MAY NOW THE TARGET FOR THE  
10 BULK MIGRATION?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THIS'S WHAT WE'RE SHOOTING FOR IN TERMS OF THE BULK  
13 OF THE -- THERE IS A SERIES OF THINGS THAT WE WANT TO MAKE  
14 SURE ARE BEHIND US AND THAT THE SYSTEM, AS WE BEGIN TO HAVE  
15 HIGHER ADOPTION RATE IS IN A POSITION DO THAT. I THINK  
16 CURRENTLY ANTICIPATING MAY THOSE ISSUES SHOULD BE RESOLVED WE  
17 HAVE RESOLVED A PORTION OF THEM ALREADY AND SOME OF THEM ARE  
18 IN TESTING PRODUCTION BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE  
19 CONTINUE TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE BEST EXPERIENCE GOING  
20 FORWARD AND SO THAT TIMELINE WE'RE CURRENTLY FOCUSING ON.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY WSP, SORT OF, PREPARED WITH ITS CALL  
23 CENTER FOR BULK I MEAN I KNOW THEY'RE IN HIRING AND CATCHING  
24 UP RIGHT NOW BUT APPROXIMATELY THEY BE STAFFED APPROPRIATELY  
25 FOR BULK MIGRATION ASSUMING THERE MIGHT BE INCREASE IN CALLS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 IN EARLY STAGES?

2

3 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I THINK SO ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S DRIVING  
4 PEOPLE TO CALL THE CALL CENTER NOW IS BECAUSE THINGS AREN'T  
5 POTENTIALLY WORKING FOR THEM AND THAT'S THEIR ONLY RECOURSE AT  
6 THIS POINT. SO WHEN THOSE THINGS ARE BETTER FIXED OR BEHIND  
7 US, THEN THERE SHOULD BE LESS NEED FOR PEOPLE TO CALL.  
8 IDEALLY, WE WOULDN'T GET ANY MORE CALLS THAN WE GET TODAY BUT  
9 OF COURSE WE ARE AWARE THAT IT COULD BE THE CASE.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH JUST BULK ANYTHING ALWAYS ADDS SOME  
12 POTENTIAL PROBLEMS THAT YOU CAN'T ALWAYS ACCOUNT FOR. SO,  
13 COMMISSIONERS? ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

14

15 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I  
16 APPRECIATE IT. THERE ARE SEVEN PEOPLE IN MY OFFICE, FIVE STAFF  
17 AND TWO INTERNS, AND WE ACTUALLY HAD A SPREADSHEET WITH ALL  
18 THE PROBLEMS, BECAUSE ALL OF US ARE TRANSIT RIDERS. SO, I CAN  
19 TELL YOU THAT MOST OF THOSE PROBLEMS ACTUAL LIKELY HAVE BEEN  
20 SOLVED. SO THAT'S A GOOD THING IT HAD TO DO WITH THE  
21 MIGRATION, WITH LOADING AT COMMUTER CHECKS INTO THE NEW SYSTEM  
22 SO ALL ONE BY ONE THEY HAVE ALL BEEN RESOLVED. SO I HAVE A  
23 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FOR YOU FIRST OF ALL, I REALIZE IT'S A  
24 TWO-WAY RELATIONSHIP -- WELL, ACTUALLY 15-WAY -- [LAUGHTER] --  
25 RIGHT? IT'S ALL THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, THE, SORT OF, ENTITY



MARCH 25, 2026

1 YOU KNOW, THE GOVERNMENT ENTITIES, ALSO THE SYSTEM. I'M  
2 WONDERING YOU KNOW, YOU WENT THROUGH ALL OF THE CHALLENGES AND  
3 HOW YOU WOULD ADDRESS EACH OF THE THINGS, WHAT WOULD YOU SAY -  
4 - YOU KNOW, TECHNOLOGY ADVANCES SO FAST, AND WE AS A REGION  
5 ARE ALSO IN COMPETITION WITH OTHER REGIONS IN TERMS OF  
6 ECONOMIC GROWTH, ATTRACTING PEOPLE, TOURISM IS THE NUMBER ONE  
7 INDUSTRY IN SAN FRANCISCO, WHICH I REPRESENT, SO, YOU KNOW, AS  
8 WE LOOK AT TECHNOLOGY ADVANCING IN TERMS OF PAYMENT, FOR  
9 TRANSPORTATION IN OTHER AREAS, WE ARE IN COMPETITION WITH  
10 THOSE. SO IN TERMS OF LOOKING FORWARD, WHAT WOULD YOU SAY WE  
11 COULD FORESEE AS GOVERNMENT AGENCIES TO TRY TO ADDRESS THROUGH  
12 MTC TO STANDARDIZE OR, YOU KNOW, MAKE THE PROCESS OF  
13 CONTINUALLY UPDATING OUR TECHNOLOGY EASIER GOING FORWARD SO  
14 THAT'S THE FIRST QUESTION. THE SECOND QUESTION IS ONE OF  
15 TIMELINE. BECAUSE I THINK WHAT WAS MOST FRUSTRATING FOR THE  
16 PUBLIC, IT'S COMING, IT'S COMING THEN IT NEVER CAME THEN ONCE  
17 IT CAME THINGS DID NOT WORK AS WELL AS PEOPLE HAD EXPECTED  
18 ESPECIALLY BECAUSE THEY WAITED FOR SO LONG SO FOR THE FUTURE  
19 HOW CAN WE BETTER PREDICT TIMELINE AND DELIVERABLES SO WE'RE  
20 NOT IN THIS POSITION OF NOT MEETING PUBLIC EXPECTATIONS?

21

22 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** I WILL SHARE WITH ALL OF YOU THAT  
23 I HAVE BEEN DELIVERING LARGE-SCALE PUBLIC TECHNOLOGY IN  
24 TRANSIT AGENCIES MAJOR TRANSIT AGENCIES ALL OVER THE WORLD FOR  
25 OVER 20 YEARS. THE MIGRATION THAT HAPPENED, THE FIRST ONE, IS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 LIKE A ONCE IN A GENERATION TRANSITION. AND, SO, THE CLIPPER  
2 ONE SYSTEM TO THE CLIPPER2 SYSTEM, THE TECHNOLOGY INVOLVED, AS  
3 WELL AS THE LEGACY TECHNOLOGY THAT NEEDED TO BE MIGRATED,  
4 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT LIKELY WOULDN'T HAPPEN HERE FOR ANOTHER  
5 MAYBE CONTINUE OR 20 YEARS. YOU HAVE INVESTED IN A MODERN  
6 SYSTEM. AND SO THE UPGRADES THAT WOULD COME NOW, ARE THE  
7 INCREMENTAL FEATURE SETS OF THE PRODUCT, I THINK IT'S PROBABLY  
8 NOT ANALOGOUS OF THE EXPERIENCE THAT YOU HAVE HAD NOW, BECAUSE  
9 WE CONTINUE TO MODERNIZE THE SYSTEM SO THAT YOU CAN HAVE  
10 MODERN FEATURES, WHETHER IT BE MOBILE WALLET OR THE OTHER  
11 THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN DEPLOYED OR SEAMLESS CONTACTLESS  
12 FRICTIONLESS PAYMENT. SO I THINK YOU WILL SEE THE INDUSTRY  
13 EVOLVE BUT YOU PROBABLY WON'T HAVE ANOTHER EXPERIENCE LIKE  
14 THIS BECAUSE IT REALLY IS KIND OF ONCE IN A GENERATION SYSTEM.  
15 WE JUST RETIRED THE METRO CARD IN NEW YORK. I THINK THAT WAS  
16 FROM '93, OR '94 SO THEY PROBABLY WON'T BE DOING THAT FOR A  
17 LANGUAGE TIME. BUT IT'S HARD. AS FAR AS RELIABILITY, YOU KNOW,  
18 I TAKE RESPONSIBILITY FOR THAT. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE  
19 HAVE THE RIGHT RESOURCES AND THE RIGHT SCHEDULE AND THAT  
20 SCHEDULE HAS THE RIGHT RISK BUILT BOO IT THAT'S ONE OF THE  
21 REASONS WE'RE COMMUNICATING THE DATES. I THINK MAYBE WE CAN DO  
22 BETTER, BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE SETTING EXPECTATIONS  
23 CORRECTLY GOING FORWARD AND THAT WE HAVE A HIGH-LEVEL OF  
24 CONFIDENCE. AND WE DO THAT IN TWO PARTS BY WORKING IN OUR OWN  
25 ORGANIZATION MAKING SURE WE HAVE THE RIGHT FOLKS AND DIAGNOSIS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 IS CORRECT AND WE HAVE THE RIGHT RESOURCES AND PLANNING FOR  
2 EXECUTION IS CORRECT. BUT TWO, I HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH ANDY  
3 AND THE TEAM HERE FOR TWO YEARS, BEING GREAT PARTNERS AND  
4 MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE ALIGNED EXPECTATIONS ON THE PROCESS  
5 AND THE RIGOR THAT NEEDS TO GO INTO MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE  
6 BETTER VALIDATION OF THE TECHNOLOGY BEFORE IT GOES INTO ITS  
7 PRODUCTION PHASE, AND I THINK THIS'S SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE  
8 BEEN WORKING ON IMPROVING THAT'S PART OF OUR WEEKLY MEETINGS.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?

11

12 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. AND THANK YOU  
13 FOR THE PRESENTATIONS. SO, I REPRESENT THE 14 CITIES OF  
14 ALAMEDA COUNTY ON MTC. AND YESTERDAY AFTERNOON I GOT A LETTER  
15 FROM AC TRANSIT ABOUT THIS ISSUE. AND I'M NOT GOING TO READ  
16 THE WHOLE THING, BUT HERE IS EXCERPTS OF ONE PARAGRAPH, IT WAS  
17 NOTED IN THE BEGINNING OF THE PRESENTATION THAT MUNI AND BART  
18 ARE EXPERIENCING THE MOST ISSUES, HERE IS AC TRANSIT'S TAKE ON  
19 IT. "THE ROLL OUT OF THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM HAS  
20 ENCOUNTERED SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES THAT ARE AFFECTING SYSTEM  
21 PERFORMANCE FINANCIAL OPERATIONS AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE  
22 ACROSS PARTICIPATING TRANSIT AGENCIES PERSISTENT ISSUES WITH  
23 SYSTEM STABILITY CAPACITY AND SCALEABILITY HAVE RESULTED IN  
24 INTERMITTENT OUTAGES AND DEGRADE PERFORMANCE PARTICULARLY  
25 DURING PEAK PERIODS, THE INTRODUCED DATA INCONSISTENCY ADDED



MARCH 25, 2026

1 COMPLEXITY TO FINANCIAL RECONCILIATION LEADING TO DELAYS  
2 REDUCE TRANSPARENCY AND INCREASED ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN ON  
3 OPERATORS, NEGATIVELY IMPACTING RIDER TRUST IN OVERALL CLIPPER  
4 BRAND COLLECTIVE LEAVE THESE ISSUES ARE PLACING AN  
5 UNANTICIPATED FISCAL AND OPERATIONAL STRAIN ON TRANSIT  
6 AGENCIES AND UNDERSCORE THE URGENT NEED FOR SYSTEM  
7 STABILIZATION RESOURCES COMMITMENT AND STRONGER ACCOUNTABILITY  
8 TO MESH THE PROGRAM MEETS ITS REGIONAL OBJECTIVE." AND AC  
9 TRANSIT DOES NOTE THAT THEY'RE WORKING WITH CUBIC ENGINEERS ON  
10 A WEEKLY BASIS TO TROUBLESHOOT AND ADDRESS THESE ISSUES. AND  
11 THERE IS MORE, BUT ALL KNOW IT, BUT WHAT I ALSO WANT TO  
12 HIGHLIGHT, AND MY COLLEAGUE COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE RAISED  
13 THIS IN A MEETING THAT WE HAD WITH YOU PREVIOUSLY, THIS  
14 NOVEMBER, WE ARE HOPING TO HAVE A REGIONAL MEASURE ON THE  
15 BALLOT TO KEEP OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS FROM GOING OVER THAT  
16 FISCAL CLIFF, AS I ARRIVED AT THE MEETING TODAY, THERE ARE  
17 PETITION SIGNATURE GATHERERS OUT FRONT AND THAT'S A GOOD  
18 THING, BUT WHAT PASSAGE OF THAT MEASURE ASSUMING WE GET IT TO  
19 THE BALLOT REQUIRES CONSUMER CONFIDENCE AND THESE EXPERIENCES  
20 DO NOT CONTRIBUTE TO CONSUMER CONFIDENCE. IT'S THE OPPOSITE.  
21 SO, I BELIEVE I HEARD YOU SAY THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT A MAY  
22 TIMELINE FOR RESOLVING THESE ISSUES. YOU CAN TELL US MORE  
23 ABOUT THAT? AND HOW SURE YOU ARE THAT WILL HAPPEN AND WHAT  
24 THAT WILL LOOK LIKE? THANK YOU.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** THANK YOU YES LET ME START BY  
2 STAYING, I'M GOING TO QUOTE JASON HERE SPECIFICALLY, THE  
3 VENDING MACHINES WHICH IS ONE OF THE CRITICAL ITEMS WHERE MUNI  
4 AND BART WERE WHERE FOLKS WHO HAD GREATEST IMPACT OF THAT  
5 ISSUE NOT THAT THEY WERE THE OPERATOR THAT HAD THE LARGEST  
6 IMPACT NO ALL OF THE OPERATORS AND MANY OF THE -- HAVE  
7 SPECIFIC ISSUES THAT WOULD PROBABLY SOUND SIMILAR WHAT YOU  
8 SAID WHAT GIVES US CONFIDENCE IN TERMS OF THE TIMELINE THIS IS  
9 PROBABLY GOING TO BE AN UNSATISFYING ANSWER BUT IT'S ALSO TRUE  
10 IS ALL OF THESE ISSUES THAT WE'RE HAVING ARE SPECIFIC AND NEED  
11 TO BE TRIAGED INDIVIDUALLY SO WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT FINANCIAL  
12 RECONCILIATION THAT WAS AN ISSUE THAT WE REPORTED ON SEVERAL  
13 MONTHS AGO I BELIEVE THE LAST FOUR DAYS OF FINANCIAL  
14 RECONCILIATION FINALLY HAVE ALL THE NUMBERS TYING OUT AND  
15 EVERYTHING BEING STABLE NOT SAYING THERE IS NOT MORE FINANCIAL  
16 RECONCILIATION THINGS TO BE DONE THERE HAVE BEEN SIGNIFICANT  
17 IMPROVEMENTS IN SYSTEM PERFORMANCE BUT WE ALSO STILL HAVE WORK  
18 AHEAD OF US SO IF YOU GO THROUGH AT THE APPROACH OF ISSUE BY  
19 ISSUE FIGURING OUT WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN YOU WON'T HAVE TO  
20 WAIT UNTIL MAY FOR ALL OF THAT TO BE DONE SOME OF IT IS THE  
21 CUSTOMER SERVICE TERMINALS NEXT UPDATE IS GOING IN EITHER LATE  
22 THIS WEEK OR EARLY NEXT WEEK I THINK YOU WILL START TO SEE  
23 SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENTS IN THE OVERALL EXPERIENCE ACROSS ALL  
24 OF THE OPERATORS BUT WE KNOW THAT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE IN THE  
25 BEST POSITION TO BE SUCCESSFUL WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THE MAJOR



MARCH 25, 2026

1 ISSUES ACROSS THE BOARD ARE BEHIND US SO WE CAN FOCUS ON  
2 HAVING SEAMLESS EXPERIENCE FOR THE REMAINING USERS AND RIDERS  
3 THAT NEED TO BE MIGRATED AND IT'S BASED ON DETAILED ANALYSIS  
4 THAT WE HAVE COME UP WITH AND THEN OF COURSE WE ADDED SOME  
5 ADDITIONAL TIMELINE ANTICIPATING THAT SOMETHING WILL COME UP  
6 THAT WE DIDN'T ANTICIPATE THAT WE MAY NEED A COUPLE MORE  
7 CYCLES FOR.

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU FOR THE RESPONSE. WE'LL BE  
10 WATCHING.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU I DO APPRECIATE ALL THE INFORMATION AND  
15 RESPONSIBILITY HERE BECAUSE WE ARE RESPONSIBLE TO THE RIDERS  
16 AND WE DO HEAR, FREQUENTLY, AS TO ISSUES. GLAD TO KNOW YOUR  
17 WORLDWIDE EXPERIENCE. I THINK WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS  
18 BECAUSE WE'RE RESPONSIBLE TO THE RIDERS IS SOME, SORT OF, WAY  
19 TO TRACK WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE. SO, WE APPRECIATE THE NEXT  
20 STEPS, BUT WITHOUT DATES -- AND I'M UNDERSTANDING YOUR  
21 EXPLANATIONS HERE, BUT WE NEED TO BE KEPT INFORMED. WE NEED TO  
22 MAKE SURE THIS IS GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION HERE. YOU SAID  
23 2,000 CALLS A DAY BETWEEN 5 AND 13 MINUTES, THAT IS REALLY NOT  
24 ACCEPTABLE TO CONSUMERS HERE. I WOULD HOPE YOU GET MORE  
25 OPERATORS ON BOARD AND THEN CAN SCALE IT BACK AS THINGS



MARCH 25, 2026

1 PROGRESS HERE BUT ANYBODY WHO HAS THE FRUSTRATION THAT AFFECTS  
2 CUSTOMER SERVICE, IT AFFECTS OVERALL RIDERSHIP FOR EVERYBODY,  
3 AND WE NEED TO ENSURE THE OPERATOR SUSTAINABILITY SO WE DO  
4 WANT THAT CONVENIENCE, AND MANY OF US, THE BAY AREA IS ON  
5 WORLD VIEW HERE. WE HAVE THE WORLD CUP COMING WE JUST HAD THE  
6 SUPERBOWL AND WE ARE A TECH CAPITAL SO TO GET THIS FRUSTRATION  
7 IT'S SOMETHING WE TAKE VERY SERIOUSLY HERE AND IT'S TAKEN US A  
8 LONG TIME TO GET TO THIS POINT. I KNOW WE HAD DELAY LAST TIME  
9 BECAUSE OUR MEETING BUT WE DO NEED REGULAR UPDATES ON THIS AND  
10 I THINK YOU ALL NEED TO BE HERE BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO SEE  
11 YOU WORKING HERE BUT WE DO NEED A TIME SCHEDULE BECAUSE WE  
12 CANNOT GO SAY THEY'RE WORKING ON IT WE NEED TO KNOW THIS IS  
13 GOING TO BE ADDRESSED HERE THIS IS GOING TO BE ADDRESSED THERE  
14 SO GIVE US CHARTS GIVE US CHARTS ON YOUR CALLS GIVE US CHARTS  
15 ON RESPONSIBILITY YOUR SPREADSHEET ON NEXT STEPS SO WE KNOW  
16 THINGS ARE CONTINUING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. AGAIN, IT'S  
17 ALWAYS BEEN FRUSTRATING FOR SOME OF US BECAUSE WE ARE A TECH  
18 CAPITAL AND TO THINK WE COUNTY SIMPLY GO BOOP AND GET ON ANY  
19 FORM OF TRANSPORTATION IS FRUSTRATING. I KNOW YOU FEEL THAT. I  
20 GOT THAT HERE. BUT WE NEED THAT TRANSPARENCY. SO, I WOULD ASK  
21 THAT THIS COMMISSION DEVELOP SOME WAY, WHETHER WE GET AN  
22 UPDATE, REGULARLY, WE'RE NOT TRYING TO MAKE ANYONE DEFENSIVE  
23 HERE, WE'RE HEARING WHAT YOU'RE DOING HERE, BUT UNDERSTAND, WE  
24 ARE HEARING FROM THE PUBLIC. WE'RE HEARING FROM OPERATORS. AND  
25 WE NEED TO BE ASSURED THAT THIS FORWARD PROGRESS CONTINUES.



MARCH 25, 2026

1 SO, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THAT THESE NEXT STEPS HAVE SOME, SORT  
2 OF, A CALENDAR ATTACHED. AND THAT, AGAIN, WE GET REGULAR  
3 PROGRESS REPORTS SO THAT WE KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON HERE. AND I  
4 DON'T KNOW IF IT WAS YOUR COMPANY, OR THE OTHER COMPANY, BUT A  
5 RECENT DATA BREACH THAT I GOT A NOTIFICATION FOR -- I  
6 APOLOGIZE IF IT WASN'T YOU -- BUT, YEAH, IT'S KIND OF  
7 CRITICAL. SO, IF WE CAN WORK TOGETHER TO ASSURE THAT, IT WOULD  
8 MAKE US FEEL BETTER, AND ACTUALLY, HOPEFULLY SHOW OFF --  
9 [LAUGHTER] -- YOUR CAPABILITIES AND YOUR STRIVES FORWARD. SO,  
10 HOPEFULLY WE CAN DO THAT THANK YOU.

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, THROUGH THE CHAIR. ANDREW  
13 FREMIER. WE DO, AT THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD WHICH HAPPENS  
14 MONTHLY, JUST HAPPENS TO BE AFTER THIS COMMISSION MEETING,  
15 PROVIDES MUCH MORE DETAIL AND SCHEDULE COMMITMENT TO THE  
16 CHALLENGE DATES THAT INFORMATION THEN DOES ALSO SHOW UP  
17 REGULARLY AT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AS AN UPDATE ITEM AND  
18 WE'LL CONTINUE TO DO SO.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** AND AGAIN, I'M ASKING THAT THE FULL COMMISSION  
21 HEARS THAT, GETS A REPORT ON THAT, BECAUSE WE ARE NOT PART OF  
22 THOSE. THIS IS NOT A SEPARATE ENTITY HERE; CLIPPER AFFECTS US.

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE WILL CONTINUE TO SHARE THE INFORMATION  
25 BEFORE THE ENTIRE COMMISSION.



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** SO, PLEASE, THIS IS WHAT WE NEED TO KNOW. AND WE  
3 HAVE PUSHED THIS MEETING BEFORE, THE ENTIRE COMMISSION HAS  
4 TAKEN A LONG TIME TO GET TO THAT POINT. SO, SUBCOMMITTEES AND  
5 COMMISSIONS DOES NOT HELP THOSE OF US ARE -- I REPRESENT 20  
6 CITIES IN SAN MATEO COUNTY BIOTECH CAPITAL OF THE WORLD  
7 LARGEST INTERMODAL CENTER NEXT TO SFO HERE SO THERE IS A LOT  
8 AT STAKE HERE I HAVE HOPE AFTER HEARING THIS BUT WE NEED TO BE  
9 KEPT UP-TO-DATE NOT THROUGH OTHER COMMITTEES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** I'LL JUST ADD, WE'RE NOT THE  
12 COMPANY WITH THE DATA BREACH.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** I APOLOGIZE. I WASN'T. JUST THANK --

15

16 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** I WON'T MENTION THEIR NAME,  
17 RESPECTFULLY BUT IT WASN'T US.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** IT WASN'T YOU. GOOD THING. VERY GOOD.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU CHAIR I DO APPRECIATE THE  
24 PRESENTATION AS YOU KNOW I HAVE BEEN ASKING FOR IT FOR QUITE A  
25 WHILE AND THAT MY STAFF NOTED IT'S BEEN 105 DAYS SINCE LAUNCH



MARCH 25, 2026

1 OF CLIPPER. SO HERE WE ARE BUT YOU HAVE COVERED SOME OF THE  
2 ISSUES. I REPRESENT TWO TRANSIT AGENCIES IN MY AREA, I KNOW  
3 YOU TALKED ABOUT SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT ARE BEING ADDRESSED.  
4 I THINK I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE,  
5 FRANKLY, LIKE WHAT, JASON, YOU WENT THROUGH BUT MAYBE LIKE FOR  
6 ME I AM MORE VISUAL, BUT A CHECKLIST OF WHAT THE ISSUES ARE  
7 WHERE THEY ARE IN PROGRESS WHAT'S BEEN RESOLVED. FOR INSTANCE  
8 WITH CALTRAIN WE HAD THE ISSUE OF THE WEEKEND PASSES OR OVER  
9 CHARGES, MY STAFF HAVE BEEN TOLD THAT WILL BE CORRECTED BIND  
10 OF MARCH WHICH IS NEXT WEEK SO I WANT TO KNOW IF IT'S  
11 HAPPENING IS IT GOING TO HAPPEN BY NEXT WEEK OR NOT? THE OTHER  
12 ISSUE SOME PASSES ARE STILL INACCESSIBLE OR INCORRECTLY  
13 SUSPENDED THE 500 AFFECTED ACCOUNTS, 100 HAVE BEEN RESOLVED.  
14 WHEN WILL THE OTHER 400 BE RESOLVED? THE BIG ONE IS THE  
15 READERS. IS THAT GOING TO BE RESOLVED BY MAY? YOU KNOW WE'RE  
16 ALREADY GOING INTO GIANTS SEASON, IT'S STARTED. AND THAT'S A  
17 BIG PART OF OUR RIDERSHIP, AND I --

18

19 **DOREEN GIACOPINI:** TODAY.

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** -- BEING A FREQUENT RIDER -- YEAH, TODAY.  
22 YEAH, YOU'RE RIGHT. I TAKE CALTRAIN TO THE GAMES, AND WHEN  
23 IT'S LIKE FIVE SECONDS OR TEN SECONDS, IT MAKES A BIG  
24 DIFFERENCE. BECAUSE THE FOLKS HAVE TO GO -- THE EMPLOYEES HAVE  
25 TO GO UP AND DOWN TO TRY TO READ AS MANY CARDS AS THEY CAN. IF



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THEY CAN'T GET TO THEM BECAUSE IT TAKES SO LONG TO GET THROUGH  
2 ONE, YOU KNOW, WE'RE LOSING THAT OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SURE  
3 WE'RE GETTING FARES COLLECTED SO THAT'S A BIG ONE FOR  
4 CALTRAIN. THEN I WILL SAY FROM THE VTA SIDE, WE HAD TO DO A  
5 WORKAROUND FOR THE SUPERBOWL. SO WE USED TOKEN TRANSIT, HAVE  
6 THAT SET UP FOR FIFA TOO. BUT IS THIS GOING TO BE RESOLVED BY  
7 FIFA? AND THEN WHEN IS THE MIGRATION GOING TO HAPPEN? LIKE, I  
8 HOPE IT DOESN'T HAPPEN DURING FIFA BECAUSE THAT COULD BE A  
9 REAL ISSUE. SO, AS JUST, YEAH, US BEING A COMMISSION BEING  
10 APPRISED, WE OFTEN -- I OFTEN ALWAYS GET THE ANSWER, OH WELL  
11 IT'S ON THAT COMMITTEE OR ON THE FRIDAY COMMITTEES. I'M NOT ON  
12 FRIDAY COMMITTEES, TO BE HONEST IT'S A LOT TO EXPECT US TO  
13 FOLLOW EVERYTHING ELSE THAT WE'RE NOT A PART OF SO SHOULD BE  
14 SIMPLE TO SUPPLY THAT INFORMATION TO THE ENTIRE COMMISSION  
15 BECAUSE WE REPRESENT ALL OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THIS AREA.  
16 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE -- THE OTHER QUESTION I HAVE IS THAT IF  
17 ALL THE FARE COLLECTION AND RIDERSHIP MEASURES ULTIMATELY ARE  
18 RESOLVED THERE IS STILL A QUESTION OF WHETHER THEY WILL ALL BE  
19 RESOLVED AND ACCOUNTED FOR OR WILL THERE BE MISSING REVENUE  
20 AND RECORDED TRIPS EVEN AFTER EVERYTHING IS RESOLVED? HOW WILL  
21 MTC ADDRESS THIS DATA HOLE? CAN SOMEONE ANSWER THAT?

22

23 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WELL, I THINK THAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA,  
24 THAT'S PART OF THE RECONCILIATION PROCESS. RIGHT? THERE IS  
25 REPORTING THAT WE'LL GO THROUGH TO CONFIRM WHETHER OR NOT WE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 SEE DISCREPANCY TO FIND OUT IF THERE IS REVENUE LOSS. OF  
2 COURSE, THEIR PROVISIONS IN THE CONTRACT FOR LOST REVENUE  
3 WHICH THE CONTRACTORS ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR. BUT BEYOND THAT, WE  
4 EXPECT IT TO WORK LIKE WE EXPECT.

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. WELL THEN THIS WILL GO TO MY LAST  
7 POINT, THAT'S IN LIGHT OF EVERYTHING THAT'S HAPPENED, AND I  
8 UNDERSTAND IT'S A BIG EFFORT, BUT I ALSO BELIEVE -- ESPECIALLY  
9 THERE IS A LOT OF EXPECTATION HERE IN SILICON VALLEY THAT  
10 TECHNOLOGY SHOULD WORK AND WORK FASTER, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK  
11 FOR A PROCESS WHERE WE HAVE A FULL REVIEW OF HOW WE GOT TO  
12 POINT IN AND WITH THIS CONTRACT, AND WHAT WE NEED TO DO  
13 DIFFERENTLY TO HAVE SUCCESSFUL TECHNOLOGY PROCUREMENTS IN THE  
14 FUTURE, AND WHETHER IT'S AN AD-HOC, AND YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY, I  
15 WILL VOLUNTEER, BUT -- OR SOMETHING. BUT I REALLY THINK WE  
16 NEED TO BE LOOKING AT THIS IN MORE DETAIL, IT LOOK AT WHAT A -  
17 - WAYS TO AVOID THIS. AND I KNOW IF IT'S A ONCE IN A LIFETIME,  
18 THIS'S GREAT, BUT I SEE TECHNOLOGY CONTINUING TO ADVANCE IN  
19 OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD. YOU KNOW, TRANSIT PASSES ARE BEING  
20 USED FOR -- YOU CAN BUY DRINKS AT THE VENDING MACHINE, THERE  
21 IS A SELF-SERVE CONVENIENCE STORE IN JAPAN THAT YOU CAN BUY  
22 EVERYTHING AND OPEN AND GET IN WITH A TRANSIT PASS THEY'RE  
23 PUTTING HEALTH RECORD -- I DON'T KNOW IF OUR COUNTRY WOULD  
24 LIKE THAT, BUT THEY'RE PUTTING HEALTH RECORDS -- AND THERE IS  
25 OTHER WAYS OF ACCESSIBILITY THAT'S BEING INVENTED IN THE



MARCH 25, 2026

1 WORLD, AND I WANT US TO BE AT LEAST ON PAR WITH WHAT ELSE IS  
2 HAPPENING OUT THERE, AND THAT'S WHY I DO BELIEVE I'M VERY  
3 INTERESTED IN US CONTINUING LOOK AT THIS AND IN DETAIL TO MAKE  
4 SURE THIS WE ARE KEEPING UP WITH ADVANCES. SO I DON'T KNOW  
5 ABOUT WHAT COMMITTEE THAT FALLS UNDER OR IF IT'S AN AD-HOC BUT  
6 I THINK WE NEED TO DO A FULL DIVE REVIEW -- YOU KNOW, FULL  
7 REVIEW OF WHERE WE HAVE COME FROM, WHERE WE ARE, AND WHERE  
8 WE'RE GOING. SO I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THAT.

9

10 **PETER MONTGOMERY TORRELLAS:** JUST TO ANSWER TO QUESTIONS  
11 SPECIFICALLY, ONE IS RELEASE FOR THE SPEED AND OPERATIONAL  
12 IMPROVEMENT OF THE DEVICES OUTSIDE OF THE UPGRADES IS  
13 CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR APRIL 20TH. SO THERE IS A TABLE AND  
14 CHECKLIST, YOU KNOW, WHO, WHAT, WHEN, WHERE, THAT'S THE  
15 BIGGEST ONE. SO IT'S APRIL 20TH. THE SYSTEM IS CAPABLE OF MORE  
16 THAN ALL OF THE SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS IN THE CONTRACT. SO WE  
17 HAVE, SAY, ANOTHER CUSTOMER THAT HAS THE SAME SYSTEM, THEY DO  
18 WANT A PREPAID PRODUCT, WE JUST KIND OF A GRAB AND GO CASH  
19 PRODUCT, AND YOU CAN CONFIGURE THAT PRODUCT TO BE USED WITHIN  
20 A GEOFENCED PERIMETER, OR WHETHER IT'S JUST THAT ONE RETAILER  
21 OR ANOTHER RETAILER, THOSE KIND OF PRODUCTS EXIST, BUT THEY  
22 REALLY HAVE TO DO WITH KIND OF THE POLICY AND DIVISION THAT  
23 YOU HAVE, THE SYSTEM THAT YOU PROCURED IS CAPABLE OF PROVIDING  
24 THOSE KINDS OF FEATURES.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AND I APPRECIATE YOU SAYING THAT BECAUSE I  
2 DO THINK ANOTHER PIECE OF THIS IS THAT I UNDERSTAND THE  
3 COMPLEXITY WITH THE 22 AGENCIES AND ALL THE DIFFERENT PASS  
4 SAYS THAT WE HAVE. HONESTLY, I DON'T KNOW HOW ALL THOSE PASSES  
5 WORK ON TOP OF EACH OTHER AND I STARTED THINKING ABOUT  
6 WHETHER, LIKE, ON OUR END OR THE TRANSIT AGENCY'S END, WE  
7 SHOULD HAVE A SERIOUS CONVERSATION ABOUT HOWE WE CAN BE MORE  
8 UNIFORM ON SOME OF THESE THINGS. AND MAYBE THAT INCLUDES,  
9 LIKE, HAVING, YOU KNOW, ONE PLACE WHERE, RIGHT, ALL OF THE  
10 MONEY GOES, AND THEN DEPENDING ON WHAT PASS YOU HAVE, THE  
11 MONEY GETS DISTRIBUTED TO THOSE AGENCIES. BUT I DO THINK THAT  
12 THERE SHOULD BE WORK TO TALK, AND WORK DONE ABOUT HOW THE 27 -  
13 - 27 TOTAL AGENCIES COULD BE WORKING IN A UNIFIED STANDARDIZED  
14 FASHION. BECAUSE I DO SEE THAT BEING A CHALLENGE. BUT THAT  
15 SHOULDN'T BE INSURMOUNTABLE EITHER. SO, THAT'S WHAT I WOULD  
16 LIKE TO FOCUS ON IN THIS AREA REALLY PUT TIME INTO THINKING  
17 RETHINKING REALLY HOW WE DO ALL OF THE TRANSIT PAYMENTS. THANK  
18 YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** VICE CHAIR?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU BOTH FOR THE  
23 PRESENTATION. COUPLE QUESTIONS, THEN A COMMENT. YOU MENTIONED  
24 THAT WE HAVE MIGRATED 1.3 MILLION ACCOUNTS, AND I WONDERED  
25 WHAT THE TOTAL NUMBER OF ACCOUNTS ARE WE EXPECT TO MIGRATE?



MARCH 25, 2026

1

2 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SOMEWHERE ON THE ORDER OF 18 TO 20 MILLION  
3 CARDS OUT THERE. WE CURRENTLY, SO IN THIS ON-DEMAND WORLD  
4 WHERE AS MENTIONED EARLIER, WHEN YOU LOG INTO THE WEBSITE OR  
5 APP OR WHEN YOU CALL CSC IT PUTS YOU ON THE LIST, THERE IS  
6 ABOUT 8 TO 10,000 OF THOSE HAPPENING ON THE NATURAL EVERY DAY.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. THEN FOLLOWING  
9 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, I WAS GOING TO RAISE THE GLOBAL ISSUE  
10 OF HOW WE, THE COMPLEXITY THAT'S INHERENT IN THIS PROCESS WITH  
11 87 AGENCIES IS NOT LOST ON ALL OF US. SO SIMILAR TO MY  
12 COLLEAGUE, SO WAS IT THE CASE WHERE WE DECIDED TO GO IN AND  
13 WORK WITH THE 27 AGENCIES AND ALL THEIR SPECIAL PASSES AND  
14 ARRANGEMENTS, AS OPPOSED TO ASKING FOR STANDARDS AND TRYING TO  
15 MIGRATE WHAT WE DO, WHICH WOULD HAVE BEEN DIFFICULT TO DO,  
16 PROBABLY EASIER TO HAVE A CARROT, HERE IS THE NEW CARD THAT  
17 WOULD HAVE MADE IT INTERESTING FOR AGENCIES. BUT I MEAN, HAVE  
18 WE BEEN PART OF THE ISSUE WITH THE COMPLEXITY OF ALL OF OUR  
19 TRANSIT AGENCIES?

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK THAT WAS THE WHOLE IDEA BEHIND  
22 CLIPPER ONE WAS TO GET ALL THE AGENCIES ON CLIPPER ONE. BUT  
23 ANDY?

24

25 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THERE IS A LONG HISTORY THERE, VICE CHAIR



MARCH 25, 2026

1 MOULTON-PETERS. AND I THINK WE HAVE, THROUGH THE REGIONAL  
2 NETWORK MANAGEMENT WORK, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
3 COUNCIL, THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, WE HAVE ALL BEEN WORKING  
4 IN THAT LEVEL OF THE FOR A LONG TIME, BUT TO COMMISSIONER ABE-  
5 KOGA'S POINT, IT'S STILL A LONG WAYS TO PERFECTION. 22, 27,  
6 MAYBE 30, WHATEVER YOU WANT TO CALL THE NUMBER OF TRANSIT  
7 AGENCIES IS COMPLICATED THINGS DRAMATICALLY IN TERMS OF HOW  
8 THE SYSTEM INTERACTS. I WOULD SAY SOMETHING TO THE PRESIDENT  
9 SAID EARLIER YOU KNOW, THE BIG CHANGE FOR US IN THIS  
10 TRANSITION WAS TO GO FROM THE PLACE WHERE THE CARD HAD ALL THE  
11 ENERGY AND THE BRAINS TO NOW BE BEHIND THE SCENES, SO THE CARD  
12 IS REALLY JUST A TOKEN. AND THAT TRANSITION IS WHERE A LOT OF  
13 THE DIFFICULTY WAS. BUT WE HAVE ESTABLISHED RELATIONSHIPS WITH  
14 THE FOLKS THAT DO THE MOBILE PHONES. ON ONE OF JASON'S SLIDES  
15 HE TALKED ABOUT THE CONTACTLESS DEBIT AND CREDIT ACCEPTANCE  
16 THAT'S THE RELATIONSHIPS WITH VISA, MASTERCARD, ET CETERA,  
17 THAT REALLY OPENED UP THE DOOR TO SOME OF THE THINGS THAT  
18 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA WAS TALKING ABOUT, ABOUT OTHER  
19 OPPORTUNITIES TO USE THE SYSTEM FOR, SORT OF, CUSTOMER  
20 CONVENIENCE THINGS THOSE TOOLS ARE ALL EMBEDDED IN THIS  
21 PARTICULAR VERSION AND THERE ARE OPTIONS FOR US TO EVENTUALLY  
22 MANAGE BUT THEY ALL REQUIRE THEIR OWN CONTRACTS, THEIR OWN  
23 DEALS, THAT'S MORE VENDORS THAT WE THEN INTERACT WITH. SO IT  
24 IS QUITE CHALLENGING, BUT WE ARE VERY MUCH FOCUSED AS A REGION  
25 ON TRYING TO SIMPLIFY IT. BUT WE CREATE A LOT OF CHALLENGES



MARCH 25, 2026

1 OURSELVES BY HAVING SO MANY DIFFERENT SYSTEMS THAT WE'RE KIND  
2 OF TRYING TO NAVIGATE THROUGH.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH. THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
5 CANDOR. ALSO SUPPORT A REQUEST FOR JUST REGULAR REQUESTS TO  
6 THE FULL BOARD AND ALSO GOING TO CALL ON MY COLLEAGUES TO DO  
7 WHAT WE CAN TO CONSOLIDATE THE FARE SYSTEMS THAT WE HAVE OR  
8 LOOK FOR BEST PRACTICES I MEAN HAVE TO DO OUR PART TOO. AND  
9 THEN FINALLY I WANT JOIN YOU IN DEBRIEF AT THE END HOW CAN WE  
10 DO THIS BETTER AND DIFFERENTLY THE NEXT TIME I THINK CLEARLY  
11 WE HAD COMPLEXITY THAT HAS TAKEN A WHILE TO RESOLVE WE'RE  
12 FEELING THE EFFECTS OF THAT, SOUNDS LIKE WE'RE TURNING THE  
13 CORNER I WOULD JUST SAY FOR THE TWO SMALLER TRANSIT AGENCIES I  
14 REPRESENT GOLDEN GATE WE'RE IN TRANSIT WE HAVE DELAYS IN  
15 IMPLEMENTATION FOR A WHOLE NEW FAREBOX SYSTEM WE WANTED TO  
16 INSTALL AND WE'RE A YEAR BEHIND IT AFFECTS FARE COLLECTION ALL  
17 OF THAT SO EVERYBODY IS FEELING THE PAIN IN SOME WAY I HOPE WE  
18 CAN ALL WORK THROUGH IT AND GET OUT THE OTHER END AS QUICK  
19 ADDS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE. YOU WERE FIRST I  
22 GOT YOU.

23

24 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND DEEP  
25 DIVE THIS HAS OBVIOUSLY BEEN A SIGNIFICANT AREA OF CONCERN FOR



MARCH 25, 2026

1 MANY OF US ON THE COMMISSION. I WANT TO ADD MY VOICE IN  
2 SUPPORT TO THE RECOMMENDATION AND REQUEST FROM COMMISSIONER  
3 ABE-KOGA AND VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS LOOKING AT WHAT ARE WE  
4 LEARNING FROM THIS EXPERIENCE. I DO HAVE TO SAY FROM WHERE I  
5 SIT IT DOES SEEM TO ME THAT BROTH FROM MTC STANDPOINT AND FROM  
6 CUBIC STANDPOINT WE SHOULD HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ANTICIPATE THAT  
7 THIS WAS GOING TO BE COMPLICATED SO I HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT WHAT  
8 OUR, SORT OF, PLAN WAS AND HOW THAT MATCHED UP TO THE REALITY  
9 OF THE IMPLEMENTATION THAT I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND WHERE  
10 THE DIVERGENCE WAS. AND WHEN I HEAR YOU SAY, WELL, THIS IS A  
11 GENERATIONAL ISSUE, BECAUSE YOU KNOW, YOU PROBABLY WOULDN'T  
12 SEE SOMETHING LIKE THIS AGAIN FOR TEN OR 20 YEARS, IT MIGHT BE  
13 BECAUSE OF MY AGE, BUT TEN YEARS DOES NOT FEEL GENERATIONAL TO  
14 ME. I THINK GENERATIONAL IS LIKE ONCE IN 50 YEARS MAYBE. SO,  
15 IT'S -- BUT WHAT IS RAISES FOR ME MORE PRACTICALLY IS, AS PART  
16 OF OUR LOOKING INTO WHAT WAS OUR EXPERIENCE HERE OR WHAT COULD  
17 WE HAVE DONE DIFFERENTLY TO GET A DIFFERENT OUTCOME I WOULD  
18 LIKE TO UNDERSTAND THAT FROM THE VENDOR STANDPOINT AND ALSO  
19 FROM THE PREPAREDNESS STANDPOINT OF US AS AN ORGANIZATION  
20 TECHNOLOGY AS YOU ALL WERE NOTING CHANGES QUICKLY WE CAN'T  
21 ALWAYS ANTICIPATE WHAT'S GOING TO BE AVAILABLE TO US OR HOW  
22 THE ECOSYSTEM IN WHICH WE OPERATE IS GOING TO CHANGE OVER TIME  
23 SO THINKING ABOUT WHAT THAT MEANS IN TERMS OF THE KINDS OF  
24 CAPACITIES WE NEED TO HAVE IN-HOUSE, WHETHER THAT'S CONSULTANT  
25 SUPPORT OR STAFF SUPPORT, I THINK IS AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT TO



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THIS QUESTION. SO, WE'RE PUTTING OUR BEST FOOT FORWARD AS WE  
2 KIND OF EVOLVE. I ALSO WOULD BE INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING  
3 WHAT IS BEST PRACTICE IN TERMS OF UPGRADES TO A SYSTEM IF PART  
4 OF THE PROBLEM IS THAT WE DIDN'T UPGRADE FOR TOO LONG, HOW DO  
5 WE UPGRADE MORE OFTEN SO THAT WE'RE KEEPING PACE. SHOULD WE BE  
6 UPGRADING MORE OFTEN. I ALSO WAS STRUCK BY THE WORK THAT THE  
7 STAFF TEAM DID TO TRY TO BUILD COMPETITION INTO THE  
8 PROCUREMENT AT THE END OF THE TODAY THERE WAS ONE VENDOR. AND  
9 THAT'S JUST, YOU KNOW, WITH NO APPROXIMATE CRITICISM OF YOU  
10 ALL AS THE VENDOR, THAT'S THE SUBOPTIMAL SITUATION OFTENTIMES  
11 IN A PROCUREMENT TO NOT HAVE COMPETITION. SO LOOKING AT THE  
12 BROADER QUESTIONS HOW DO WE SUCCESSFULLY NAVIGATE AS A  
13 GOVERNMENT AGENCY THAT'S NOT A TECHNOLOGY FORWARD AGENCY AND  
14 IS WORKING WITH MANY PARTNERS IN A SUPER COMPLEX SPACE, HOW DO  
15 WE SUCCESSFULLY NAVIGATE THIS GOING FORWARD I THINK WOULD BE  
16 SUPER USEFUL AND SOMETHING THAT WOULD HELP ME AS A  
17 COMMISSIONER PROVIDE THE BEST GUIDANCE GOING FORWARD. THANKS.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER BURT?

20

21 **PAT BURT:** THANKS. SO, I WANT TO SUPPORT COMMENTS BY MY  
22 COLLEAGUES ON A NUMBER OF AREAS. BUT I DID WANT TO FIRST  
23 EMPHASIZE CALTRAIN ONGOING CONCERNS THAT ALIGN WITH A LOT OF  
24 WHAT'S BEEN IDENTIFIED, BUT FARE INSPECTION DEVICES ARE STILL  
25 HAVING PROBLEMS, OPERATION STRUGGLES WITH CUSTOMERS ACCESSING



MARCH 25, 2026

1 THEIR ACCOUNTS AND OPERATOR DELAYS THIS'S STILL PROBLEMATIC  
2 TODAY. BUT THE CONCEPT OF THE BOARD SEEING A CHECKLIST, I  
3 THINK IS OVERDUE. THE NOTION THAT WE EVERY MONTH OR SO HERE,  
4 GENERAL UPDATES VERSUS THE SERIOUSNESS OF THIS AND US HAVING  
5 VISIBILITY ON THE TRACKING OF HERE ARE ALL OF THE ISSUES  
6 HERE'S THE ANTICIPATED PROGRESS DATE, HERE IS THE ACTUAL  
7 PROGRESS DATE. WE NEED THAT TRANSPARENCY, WHETHER WEEKLY OR  
8 MONTHLY, I LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING THAT AS SOON AS POSSIBLE.  
9 THEN THE POST MORTEM, I KNOW WE'RE FOCUSING RIGHT NOW ON  
10 FIXING THE PROBLEMS BUT I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE REAL  
11 IMPORTANT. THANKS.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANYBODY ELSE? THANK YOU. APPRECIATE  
14 YOUR TIME BEING HERE PETER AND CYNTHIA, WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
15 UPDATES OBVIOUSLY AND GETTING A LOT OF THESE THINGS FIXED AND  
16 CLEANED UP AS SOMEBODY NOTED WE HAVE THIS VERY BIG IMPORTANT  
17 BALLOT MEASURE IN NOVEMBER SO WHATEVER WE CAN DO TO GET THIS  
18 CLEANED UP AS FAST AS POSSIBLE SO THAT OUR CUSTOMERS AND OUR  
19 CITIZENS TRUSTS AND YOU WHEN WE'RE DOING HERE, WOULD BE GREAT.  
20 SO, WITH THAT, THANK YOU.

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS:** CHAIR, IF I COULD JUST CLARIFY, IT'S NOT OUR -- I  
23 DON'T WANT IT TO BE PERCEIVED AS THE COMMISSION'S BALLOT  
24 MEASURE, IT'S THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH. THANK YOU.

2

3 **BELIA RAMOS:** I WANT US TO BE CAREFUL I KNOW THE IMPORTANCE IN  
4 MAKING SURE THERE IS CONFIDENCE IN THE TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR THE  
5 SUCCESS OF THAT MEASURE, BUT THAT IT IS NOT OUR OWN.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT IS NOT OUR MEASURE. I JUST SPENT TOO MUCH  
8 TIME IN SACRAMENTO ON IT. THAT'S WHAT I WAS THINKING ABOUT.  
9 BUT THANK YOU FOR THAT POINT. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE HAVE JASON BAKER IN THE BOARDROOM  
12 AND A COUPLE ON THE ZOOM SPACE.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** SORRY TO BE IN BETWEEN YOU ALL LEAVING JASON BAKER  
17 WITH CALTRAIN YOU'RE RIGHT THIS ISN'T JUST A BART OR MUNI  
18 ISSUE IT'S ALSO CALTRAIN ISSUE AND OF COURSE AC TRANSIT I HAVE  
19 COMMENTS BUT YOU ALL GET IT I APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMENTS AND  
20 YOUR COMMISSIONER PERSONAL OVERSIGHT OF ALL THIS, AS STAFF  
21 REPORT SIGNIFICANT OPERATIONAL CHALLENGES CONTINUE TO AFFECT  
22 CGO CUSTOMERS AND TRANSIT OPERATORS THERE ARE STILL PROBLEMS  
23 CALTRAIN IS SEEING THEM AND THE FACT IS IF CALTRAIN CAN'T  
24 RELIABLY CHECK FARES EVERY TIME WITH ACCEPTED BANK CARD AND DO  
25 IT VERY QUICKLY THAT HAS SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON CUSTOMER



MARCH 25, 2026

1 EXPERIENCE AND OUR ABILITY TO CHECK FARES I HAVE SAID BEFORE  
2 YOU'RE TRYING TO DECIDE HOW CRANKY YOU SHOULD BE AND IT'S HARD  
3 TO TELL RIGHT LIKE SHOULD I BE AT THIS LEVEL, I WILL GIVE YOU  
4 MAYBE ONE SIGN POST WHICH WAS ALMOST THE EXACT SAME  
5 PRESENTATION THAT WAS BUILT LAST MONTH LAST MONTH ON FARE  
6 INSPECTION DEVICES WHICH IS A BIG ISSUE IT SAID UPDATES ARE IN  
7 PROGRESS FOR CREDIT DEBT CARDS INSPECTION TO ADDRESS POST LOG  
8 IN CRASHES NEEDED FOR SLOW PERFORMANCE LOG IN FAILURES AND  
9 CARD READ ACCURACY THIS MONTH SAME, UPDATES FOR PROGRESS, AND  
10 FIXES IN DEVELOPMENT. YOU WOULD HAVE HEARD SIMILAR  
11 PRESENTATION FROM CUBIC I'M GLAD YOU'RE HERE I'M GLAD YOU WERE  
12 AT CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD LAST TIME BUT IT'S SIMILAR  
13 ASSURANCES THEN NOW YOU'RE HERE A MONTH LATER A LOT OF THE  
14 SAME ASSURANCE. BECAUSE THAT MATTERS A LOT TO USE YOU SIT IN  
15 LINE AS COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA SAID PAYING WITH CHANGE YOU KNOW  
16 IT'S HERE AND NOW WE HEAR IT'S GOING TO BE APRIL 21ST BEFORE  
17 THAT FIX HAPPENS SO I HOPE IT HAPPENS BEFORE THEN. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE'LL MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE WE HAVE  
20 SHANNON O'HALLORAN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HELLO.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **SPEAKER:** SO, I WORK WITH ONE OF THE UNIVERSITIES IN THE BAY  
2 AREA THAT HAS INSTITUTIONAL PASSES AND WE'RE HAVING, STILL,  
3 CONSTANT ONGOING PROBLEMS WITH OUR STUDENTS NOT GETTING THEIR  
4 PASSES BECAUSE OF THE C2 TRANSITION, WHICH IS A BIG CUSTOMER  
5 SERVICE HEADACHE ON OUR SIDE, BUT IT'S ALSO, A LOT OF THESE  
6 STUDENTS HAVE NEVER USED PUBLIC TRANSIT BEFORE, AND THIS IS  
7 THEIR FIRST EXPERIENCE USING PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND THE MESSAGE  
8 WE SEEM TO BE SENDING IS PUBLIC TRANSIT IS NOT RELIABLE. AND A  
9 LOT OF THESE STUDENTS ARE SAYING ARE SAYING I WANT TO GET A  
10 CAR AS SOON AS I CAN GET A CAR BECAUSE I DON'T LIKE HOW, YOU  
11 KNOW, I GOT THIS PASS THIS'S COME BEING PAID FOR BY MY STUDENT  
12 FEES AND THEN I COUNTY USE IT AND I'M PAYING FOR TRANSIT OUT  
13 OF MY POCKET, OR I'M GETTING KICKED OFF THE BUS BY FARE  
14 INSPECTOR EVEN THOUGH THERE IS NOT SUPPOSED TO BE A FARE  
15 ENFORCEMENT BECAUSE C2 TRANSITION FARE ENFORCEMENT IS STILL  
16 HAPPENING. SO WE DO NEED TO FIND A SOLUTION FOR THIS BUT I'M  
17 ALSO WORRIED ABOUT IF YOU DELAY THE TRANSITION INTO SUMMER  
18 THEN WE BULK UPDATE IN SUMMER WE'RE COMING INTO THE FALL  
19 SEMESTER WHERE WE HAVE THOUSANDS AND THOUSANDS OF CARDS  
20 POTENTIALLY WITH A TON MORE PROBLEMS, AND THAT'S GOING TO BE  
21 AN EVEN BIGGER HEADACHE THAT'S GOING TO CAUSE EVEN MORE CHAOS.  
22 SO I WOULD LIKE TO KEEP THAT FIND SINCE UNIVERSITIES ARE  
23 PROBABLY THE SINGLE BIGGEST INSTITUTIONAL PASS STAKEHOLDER.  
24 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MR. ROLAND LEBRUN PLEASE GO  
2 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. A FEW THINGS. FIRST OF ALL, HINDSIGHT IS  
5 ALWAYS 20/20 VISION. AND IN THIS CASE, I THINK IT'S VERY  
6 UNFORTUNATE THAT WE WERE UNABLE TO SOMEHOW SIMPLIFY OR  
7 CONSOLIDATE ALL THESE AREAS ACROSS ALL THE AGENCIES. AND THEN  
8 WE EMBARK INTO THIS MASSIVE RULEMAKING PROGRAMMING EXERCISE,  
9 WHICH, ULTIMATELY, DEGRADED THE OVERALL SYSTEM PERFORMANCE,  
10 AND UNTIL PROOF OF THE CONTRARY IS ALSO BEHIND THE PERFORMANCE  
11 ON THE SCANNERS BUT I'M GOING TO CLOSE OFF WITH MY PERSONAL  
12 BIGGEST ISSUE AS A CALTRAIN RIDER, SLIDE 13 IS TALKING ABOUT  
13 EQUIPMENT IMPROVEMENT, BUT I THINK THAT BEFORE WE START  
14 IMPROVING EQUIPMENT, THE TOP PRIORITY SHOULD BE TO RESTORE  
15 PRIOR FUNCTIONALITY, WHICH INDICATES CALTRAIN WHEN YOU TAP ON  
16 OR OFF, THE READER TELLS YOU WHAT HAPPENED WHETHER YOU TAP ON  
17 OR OFF, OR WHATEVER. BECAUSE THE BIGGEST PROBLEM THAT I HAVE  
18 RIGHT NOW IS THAT WHEN I TAP, I DON'T KNOW WHETHER THE TAPPED  
19 ON OR TAPPED OFF, WHICH I COULD BE EXPOSING MYSELF TO A \$75  
20 CITATION, IN THE CASE WHEN I ARRIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO I'M  
21 ACTUALLY AFRAID TO ATTACH OFF BECAUSE ACTUALLY I COULD BE  
22 BUYING A TICKET TO GILROY AND DON'T KNOW ABOUT IT SO THE  
23 SOONER THAT GETS ADDRESSED THE BETTER. IT'S BEEN MENTIONED  
24 MANY TIMES AT CALTRAIN CAC AND OTHER VENUES AND LAST TIME I  
25 USED IT, IT STILL WANT WORKING THAT SHOULD BE A TOP PRIORITY



MARCH 25, 2026

1 TO HELP CALTRAIN RIDERS USE THE SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
4 HANDS.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE'RE AT AGENDA ITEM  
7 13. ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING -- THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING  
8 OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION --

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MADAM CHAIR? DID WE -- DID YOU DO ITEM 12?

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH SORRY. ITEM 12 OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC  
13 COMMENT.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU KINDLY.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GETTING OFF PUBLIC COMMENT FORGOT SECOND  
18 ROUND.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE LOVE SECOND CHANCES. WE HAVE ROLAND  
21 LEBRUN IN THE ZOOM SPACE NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM IN  
22 THE ZOOM SPACE.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** EXCEPT FOR GINA PAPAN.

25



MARCH 25, 2026

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU WE'RE CELEBRATING GREBE INDEPENDENCE DAY  
2 TODAY.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS QUICK. ALL RIGHT WE'RE  
5 ON TO ROLAND.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLAND LEBRUN GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
8 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR SAVING THE DAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME? I'M  
11 NOT GETTING --

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I AM EXTREMELY DISAPPOINTED AND CONCERNED THAT  
16 SENATOR WIENER DOES NOT INTEND TO PURSUE SB79 CLEAN-UP. AND IN  
17 CLOSING, I'M REQUESTING THAT THE COMMISSION INTRODUCE  
18 EMERGENCY LEGISLATION AT THE APRIL LEG COMMITTEE TO EXEMPT ALL  
19 MOBILE HOME PARKS FROM SB79 IMPACTS IN THE NINE BAY AREA  
20 COUNTIES. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
23 HANDS.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. NOW WE'LL GO BACK AND START



MARCH 25, 2026

1 REPEATING WHAT I DID BEFORE. THE ITEM 13, THE NEXT REGULAR  
2 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS  
3 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE  
4 STREET SAN FRANCISCO ON PEDESTRIAN APRIL 22ND, 2026. ANY  
5 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE  
6 ARE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]