

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1                   **TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE**

2                               **MONDAY, OCTOBER 21<sup>ST</sup>, 2024, 9:00 AM**

3  
4

5   **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. THANK YOU FOR  
6 ATTENDING OUR MEETING TODAY. IT'S GOING TO BE OUR FINAL  
7 MEETING AND WE HOPE TO MOVE SOME CONSIDERATIONS TO THE LEG  
8 COMMITTEE AT MTC AND THEN ON TO THE FULL COMMISSION. I WOULD  
9 LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE TRANSPORTATION  
10 REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS MEETING  
11 JOINTLY WITH THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS  
12 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS,  
13 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND MEMBERS OF PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM  
14 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL  
15 STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU OR STAFF WILL.  
16 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR  
17 DIGITS MUCH THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN  
18 FOR ACTION ITEMS DUE TO THE REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER  
19 PARTICIPATION TODAY. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE CLERK TO CALL  
20 ROLL OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

21

22   **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** SPERING?

23

24   **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HERE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** BAPTIST?

2

3 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. LAWRENCE?

6

7 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LEONE? LEVIN?

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEVIN IS --

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE. MEMBER LINDSAY?

14

15 **JAMES LINDSAY:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MAHAN? IS IN THE HALLWAY? MEMBER

18 MILEY? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MOHTASHEMI?

19

20 **RAAYAN MOHTASHEMI:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER NOACK? RABBITT?

2

3 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WU? IS ABSENT. MEMBER WUNDERMAN?

6

7 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** WE DO HAVE AN IN-PERSON QUORUM. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A REQUEST FOR REMOTE  
10 PARTICIPATION UNDER AB2449 JUST CAUSE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBER  
11 CINDY CHAVEZ. CINDY, DO YOU WANT TO CHECK IN?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. I'M AT 70 WEST HEDDING, ON THE 10th FLOOR.  
14 AND I HAVE NOBODY PARTICIPATING WITH ME HERE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU CINDY. REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR  
17 ATTENDING. CINDY IS GOING TO BE LEAVING US HERE IN THE REGION  
18 AND WE'RE GOING TO BE LOSING A STRONG ADVOCATE FOR  
19 TRANSPORTATION IN THE REGION. SO CINDY THANK YOU FOR ALL THE  
20 WORK YOU HAVE DONE OVER THE YEARS.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU, JIM.

23



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NEXT WE HAVE ALFREDO PEDROZA, REQUESTING  
2 PARTICIPATION UNDER AB2449 JUST CAUSE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBER  
3 PEDROZA.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I DO REQUEST REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER THIS  
6 RULE NO ONE IS HERE WITH ME UNDER 18. AND MY REASONS ARE FOR  
7 BUSINESS TRAVEL.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU, CHAIR. WILL THE CLERK  
10 CALL THE ROLL OF THE COMMISSIONERS, PLEASE?

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT.  
17 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN? IS ABSENT.  
18 COMMISSIONER CANEPA? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI? IS  
23 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER  
24 FLEMING? ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI? IS ABSENT.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.

2 COMMISSIONER MILEY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

3

4 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** COMMISSIONER NOACK? COMMISSIONER

7 PAPAN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT.

12 SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING?

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THAO IS ABSENT. AND LET THE RECORD

17 REFLECT THAT VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE DO NOT HAVE A QUORUM WITH THE

22 COMMISSION, CHAIR. I'M SORRY.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WOULD WANT TO START BY THANKING ALL THE

25 MEMBERS OF THIS COMMITTEE FOR YOUR TIME OVER THE PAST FIVE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MONTHS. TOGETHER WE HAVE MADE PROGRESS AND EACH OF YOU HAVE  
2 MADE VALUABLE CONTRIBUTIONS BETWEEN MYSELF AND STAFF WE HAVE A  
3 LOT OF AFTER MEETING AND TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION, JUST ABOUT  
4 EVERYTHING THAT WE HEAR AT THESE MEETINGS. EVEN IF WE HAVEN'T  
5 QUITE MET OUR GOAL OF CONSENSUS AGREEMENT ON A SINGLE  
6 PREFERRED OPTION FOR A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE  
7 MEASURE, WE HAVE MOVED THE BALL A LONG WAYS DOWN THE FIELD AND  
8 I FEEL BETTER NOW THAT I -- BETTER THAN I DID BACK IN JUNE  
9 ABOUT THE CHANCE OF SUCCESS AT GETTING A BILL INTRODUCED IN  
10 SACRAMENTO THAT WILL NOT ONLY WIN THE SUPPORT OF THE  
11 LEGISLATORS BUT ALSO LEAD TO THE REGIONAL MEASURE THAT WE CAN  
12 WIN THE SUPPORT OF THE BAY AREA VOTERS. AS WE CONTINUE TO WORK  
13 ON THIS CHALLENGE, I WANT TO REITERATE THE THREE THINGS THE  
14 MEASURE MUST EVENTUALLY DO. AND WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO KEEP  
15 FAITH TO THESE THREE ISSUES. FIRST IS IT NEEDS TO GENERATE  
16 ENOUGH REVENUE TO ADDRESS OUR MOST IMMEDIATE TRANSIT  
17 SHORTFALL. TWO IS IT NEEDS TO INTRODUCE TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGES  
18 TO OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS HAVE BEEN  
19 ASKING FOR, AND, THREE, IT NEEDS TO BE A MEASURE THAT VOTERS  
20 WILL SUPPORT WITH COORDINATION AND VISION. WE MUST FIND THAT  
21 BALANCE OF THOSE THREE. THE IMPORTANT ISSUES. MAYBE THE  
22 BIGGEST PART OF WHAT WE HAVE DONE TOGETHER IS TO ACKNOWLEDGE  
23 THE INTERCONNECTEDNESS AND IMPORTANCE OF OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT  
24 SYSTEM, FROM OUR RAIL OPERATORS, BART AND CALTRAIN, TO THE  
25 REGION'S HIGHEST RIDERSHIP BUS SYSTEMS, SFMTA AND AC TRANSIT.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM HAS BEEN BUILT ON A NEW OUTDATED  
2 BUSINESS MODEL THAT ASSUMED THE VAST MAJORITY OF OPERATING  
3 COSTS WOULD BE COVERED BY MOVING LARGE NUMBERS OF COMMUTERS  
4 INTO SAN FRANCISCO IN THE MORNING AND RETURNING THEM HOME IN  
5 THE EVENING THE END THATCH BUSINESS MOLD AFFECTS THE ENTIRE  
6 REGION AND FIGURING OUT WHAT TO PUT IN PLACE REQUIRES A  
7 REGIONAL EFFORT. THE COMMISSION HAS DONE SINCE MARCH 2020 WITH  
8 YOUR SUPPORT AND ENGAGEMENT TO ADVOCATE FOR THE EXPEDITED  
9 ALLOCATIONS FOR CRITICAL FEDERAL COVID RELIEF FUNDS TO SUSTAIN  
10 PUBLIC TRANSIT. I WAS CHAIR OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT  
11 RECOVERY EFFORT AND THAT CENTERED OUR WORK ON WHAT MATTERS,  
12 THE TRANSIT RIDERS. SINCE THAT TIME WE HAVE DOUBLED DOWN ON  
13 OUR EFFORTS TO DELIVER CUSTOMER OUTCOMES THROUGH REGIONAL  
14 NETWORK MANAGEMENT MTC ALSO CHAMPIONS EFFORTS TO EXTEND RELIEF  
15 FUNDS THROUGH THE STATE BUDGET. AS PART OF THAT ADVOCACY MTC  
16 ALSO COMMITTED TO THIS IMPORTANT WORK, FORGING COMMON GROUND  
17 ON THE IMPORTANCE OF PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR OUR REGIONAL --  
18 REGION'S MOST VULNERABLE RESIDENTS, FOR OUR CLIMATE GOALS AND  
19 FOR OUR ECONOMIC FUTURE. SO WHILE WE STILL HAVE WORK AHEAD TO  
20 RAISE NEW REVENUE, MTC REMAINS COMMITTED TO THE VALUE AND  
21 NECESSITY OF THIS UNDERTAKING. WE'RE GOING TO TALK MORE TODAY  
22 ABOUT SOME NEW APPROACHES TO FUNDING TRANSIT OPERATIONS FOR AC  
23 TRANSIT, BART, CALTRAIN, AND SFMTA, AND THE SMALLER TRANSIT  
24 AGENCIES. YOUR INPUT, ANALYSIS, AND VALUATION WILL BE  
25 EXTREMELY HOSPITAL AND TO BOTH MYSELF AND TO MTC COMMISSION





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 COLLEAGUES AS WE TAKE THE BATON FROM THIS COMMITTEE AND WORK  
2 SENATOR WIENER, CORTESE AND WAHAB IN PURSUIT OF ENABLING  
3 LEGISLATION IN SACRAMENTO. AS WE DIVE INTO THE AGENDA FOR THIS  
4 LAST MEETING OF OUR COMMITTEE I WANT TO SAY AGAIN WHAT AN  
5 HONOR IT HAS BEEN TO CHAIR THIS COMMITTEE AND TO WORK WITH ALL  
6 OF YOU. YOUR KNOWLEDGE, TIME, PERSPECTIVES AND WILLINGNESS TO  
7 REALLY LISTEN TO OTHER'S POINTS OF VIEW ARE DEEP APPRECIATED  
8 BY ME AND MTC STAFF. THROUGH THIS PROCESS IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
9 HAD ARE FROM AS MANY INDIVIDUALS AND AGENCIES AS POSSIBLE WE  
10 MAY NOT AGREE ON A SOLUTION BUT REST ASSURED WE HAVE HEARD  
11 YOU. BEFORE TURNING TODAY'S AGENDA OVER, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK  
12 MTC'S EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ANDY PREMIER, TO SPEAK ABOUT A FEW  
13 ITEMS WE HAVE BRUISED OR INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENTS TO MY CHAIR'S  
14 REPORT. AND RESPONSE TO THE CONVERSATION AT THE LAST SELECT  
15 COMMITTEE MEETING. FURTHER I'M ANY TO ASK ANDY TOW PROVIDE A  
16 REPORT ON THE EXECUTIVE GROUP HE CONVENEED LAST THUDS AND  
17 LASTLY I HAVE ASKED HIM TO REVIEW NEXT STEPS ONCE WE CONCLUDE  
18 OUR FINAL SELECT COMMITTEE MEETING. AND I JUST WANT TO THANK  
19 OUR STAFF, ANDY, ALIX, AND STUART, THE NUMBER OF MEETINGS WE  
20 HAVE BEEN ATTENDING ON THE PHONE, LATE AT NIGHT, TALKING ABOUT  
21 A LOT OF THE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED. BUT I THINK WE HAVE  
22 BEEN FORTUNATE TO HAVE THAT TEAM WITH ALL THE SUPPORT THEY  
23 HAVE AT MTC. SO I JUST WANTED TO THANK THEM FOR JUST A LOT OF  
24 HARD WORK. AND I'M SURE THEY'RE KIND OF LIKE ME, WILL BE GLAD  
25 WHEN WE'RE DONE WITH THIS. SO, WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO TURN IT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OVER TO ANDY. WHEN YOU'RE DONE, TURN IT OVER TO STUART SO WE  
2 CAN KEEP GOING.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** SURE CHAIR SPERING. AND I NOTICED YOU'RE NOW  
5 DELEGATING WORK. THAT'S A GOOD SIGN. GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY,  
6 HOPE EVERYONE IS STRAPPED IN FOR A LONG DAY WE HAVE COFFEE  
7 OVER HERE IF YOU NEED IT. WE HAVE A YOU COUPLE OF SLIDES  
8 ATTACHED TO CHAIR SPERRY'S LETTER BECAUSE THEY'RE IMPORTANT TO  
9 REFLECT ON AS GOOD INFORMATION. AS A REMINDER, CALIFORNIA IS  
10 ONE OF THE STATES THAT DOES NOT PROVIDE A LOT OF FUNDING TO  
11 THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS WHEN COMPARED TO THEIR PEERS AROUND THE  
12 UNITED STATES. BUT WE GET MONEY FROM THE STATE, THERE IS SALES  
13 TAX ON THE TDA, DIESEL TAX STA AND VEHICLE TAX THAT COMES TO  
14 THE BAY AREA. THOSE DOLLARS ARE AT RISK AS THE YEARS GO BY AND  
15 WE CONVERT TO A CLEANER FLEET. WE DID GET ASSISTANCE IN SB25  
16 RELATIVE TO THE BAY AREA TRANSIT SHORTFALLS, AND ALSO THE CAP-  
17 AND-TRADE MONEY THAT HAS BEEN BROUGHT FORWARD. SO, THERE IS  
18 SOME WORK THERE, BUT WE WANT TO ALSO CONTINUE TO REFLECT ON  
19 THE FACT THAT WE DO THINK THAT WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO PARTNER  
20 WITH THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA TO BRING ADDITIONAL FUNDS INTO  
21 THE PROGRAM TO REALLY MEET OUR CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS. NEXT  
22 SLIDE. WE ALSO WANTED TO RECOGNIZE HOW MUCH LOCAL SELF-HELP  
23 THERE IS, AND SO WHAT THIS CHART REALLY DOES OUTLINE IS HOW  
24 THE NINE COUNTIES REALLY DO SUPPORT TRANSIT AND OTHER MEASURES  
25 THROUGH SALES TAX. YOU CAN SEE THE VARYING RATES IN SALES TAX



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ON THE TWO LEFT COLUMNS. THE MIDDLE STARTS TO TALK ABOUT HOW  
2 MUCH OF THAT GOES TO TRANSPORTATION, ITSELF. AND THEN AT THE  
3 END, ON THE FAR RIGHT, WE TALK ABOUT WHEN THESE TAXES START TO  
4 SUNSET, WHICH HAS ALSO BEEN A REAL IMPORTANT PART OF THE  
5 DISCUSSION. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WAS IN FRONT OF YOU.  
6 BECAUSE THESE QUESTIONS DO COME FROM UP OUR STAKEHOLDERS AND  
7 THE POLICY MAKERS THROUGHOUT THE REGION. WE WANT THIS  
8 INFORMATION DIRECTLY IN FRONT OF YOU FOR REFERENCE, AND ALSO  
9 FOR TRANSPARENCY. IN TERMS OF THE NEXT ASSIGNMENT, WHICH IS  
10 REPORTING ON THE EXECUTIVE GROUP, I WANT TO THANK OUR FRIENDS  
11 IN THE TRANSIT OPERATION GENERAL MANAGER REALM, AS WELL AS THE  
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. THEY HAVE  
13 PUT IN QUITE A BIT OF TIME INTO THE EFFORT THAT'S BEEN VERY  
14 HELPFUL IN TERMS OF TALKING TO THIS TEAM AS WELL AS CHAIR  
15 SPERING WHO HAS SHOWN UP AT THE LAST THREE MEETINGS AND THEY  
16 HAVE BEEN VERY REFLECTIVE. LAST THURSDAY WE DID DISCUSS  
17 POTENTIAL POLICY ITEMS THAT WE'LL TALK ABOUT TODAY TO  
18 INCORPORATE INTO THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND THAT'S ITEM FIVE  
19 ON THE AGENDA TODAY. A FEW KEY THEMES THAT WERE MENTIONED OVER  
20 AND OVER AGAIN WERE STARTING WITH TO KEEP IT SIMPLE AND, ALSO,  
21 TO SUPPORT ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS. AND I THINK THOSE ARE  
22 THINGS THAT WE HAVE HEARD FROM MANY FOLKS. ACCOUNTABILITY IS  
23 THE NUMBER ONE CHALLENGE THAT WE NEED GOAT IN FRONT OF THE  
24 VOTERS AND SIMPLICITY IS ALSO IMPORTANT AS WE DO HAVE TO  
25 EXPLAIN A COMPLICATED LANDSCAPE TO THE PUBLIC AND TO THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 VOTERS. THAT SUPPORT FOR ACCOUNTABILITY DID COME FROM SEVERAL  
2 OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY GENERAL MANAGERS DIRECTLY AS WELL AS THE  
3 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, RECOGNIZING, I  
4 THINK, HOW IMPORTANT THOSE ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS ARE FOR  
5 THE POLICY MAKERS AND THE VOTERS ALIKE. WE ALSO HEARD SUPPORT  
6 FOR FLEXIBILITY WHEN IT COMES TO PROJECT ELIGIBILITY FOR  
7 COUNTY FLEX ON PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
8 MANAGEMENT. EXPRESSED VIEWS THAT MULTI-LAYERS FRAMEWORK THAT  
9 WAS FORMALIZED VOLUNTARY BY THE COMMISSION IN THE REGION IN  
10 2023 IS NEW AND DOES REPRESENT INPUT FROM A BROAD ARRAY OF  
11 TECHNICAL EXPERTS AND IT'S WORKING QUITE WELL THEREFORE IT'S  
12 PREMATURE TO MAKE ANY CHANGES TO THE LAW TODAY. CONSISTENT  
13 WITH KEEPING IT SIMPLE A MEMBER RAISED COMPONENTS RELATED TO  
14 CONSOLIDATION WOULD DISTRACT FROM THE PRIMARY PURPOSE OF THE  
15 GOAL OF THE MEASURE. AC TRANSIT SHARED THEY CONTINUE TO HAVE  
16 CONCERNS ABOUT THE FUNDING TARGETS FOR SCENARIO ONE BEING  
17 FOCUSED ON LOST FARE REVENUE AND WOULD LIKE TO SEE FUNDING  
18 DISTRIBUTION IN A WAY THAT TAKES EQUITY AND RIDERSHIP INTO  
19 ACCOUNT. THE EXECUTIVE GROUP RECEIVED AND DISCUSSED  
20 PRESENTATIONS YOU WILL HEAR TODAY FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO MTA  
21 STAFF REGARDING A PORTABLE ALTERNATIVE FRAMEWORK WITH A  
22 VARIABLE RATE PARCEL TAX THAT ALLOWS FOR FINANCING AND UPDATES  
23 TO THE SEPTEMBER SELECT COMMITTEE SCENARIOS THAT STUART WILL  
24 PRESENT. BART STAFF EXPRESSED SOME SUPPORT FOR A SHORTER TEN  
25 YEAR MEASURE, AS PROPOSED IN SCENARIO 1A. AND SO MOVING ON TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE NEXT STEPS, I WANTED TO ADD DETAILS ON THE NEXT STEPS.  
2 FIRST, STAFF WILL SUMMARIZE THE WORK AND OUTCOME OF THE SELECT  
3 COMMITTEE, WHICH HELLO BE PRESENTED TO THE JOINT MTC ABAG  
4 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ON NOVEMBER 8TH, HERE IN THIS BUILDING.  
5 THEN ON NOVEMBER 9TH -- I'M SORRY -- DECEMBER 9TH, WE'RE  
6 HOLDING A SPECIAL COMMISSION MEETING HERE DEDICATED TO THIS  
7 TOPIC WHERE WE ANTICIPATE THE COMMISSION WILL ACT ON WHETHER  
8 TO SPONSOR A REVENUE TRANSPORTATION BILL IN 2025 AND IF SO  
9 WHAT ARE THE KEY COMPONENTS OF THAT LEGISLATION. GIVEN THAT WE  
10 DON'T ANTICIPATE COMPLETING POLLING UNTIL MID-JANUARY, WE  
11 WOULD EXPECT THE COMMISSION TO FURTHER REFINE THE SCOPE OF ANY  
12 SPONSORED LEGISLATION AFTER REVIEWING RESULTS OF THE POLLS IN  
13 THE NEW YEAR. SO, FINALLY, I JUST WANTED TO ECHO, CHAIR  
14 SPERING'S APPRECIATION FOR EVERYONE'S PARTICIPATION IN THIS  
15 WORK AND ESPECIALLY FOR DEDICATING MORE THAN HALF OF TODAY TO  
16 REALLY DISCUSS THIS CRITICAL SUBJECT. THE LAST MEETING IS FAR  
17 FROM CEREMONIAL WE HAVE ROBUST CONTENT TO DISCUSS AND AS  
18 DIMPLE IT IS TO REACH AGREEMENT ACROSS OUR DIVERSE REGION  
19 THERE IS NO BETTER FORUM THAN THIS ONE FOR FIGURING OUT THE  
20 PATH TO SUCCESS ON THIS TOPIC. I'M HOPEFUL WE'LL END TODAY  
21 WITH A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING AS TO WHERE EVERYONE STANDS AND  
22 WHAT THE NEXT STEPS ARE. SO WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO TURN  
23 THIS OVER TO STUART COHEN FROM SC STRATEGIES TO OUTLINE GOALS.  
24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** THANK YOU ANDY FREMIER WE COULD PUT ON THE GOALS  
2 MEETING SLIDE THAT WOULD BE GREAT. GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY AND  
3 THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING FOR TAKING US THROUGH THIS OVER THE  
4 LAST FOUR AND A HALF MONTHS. IT'S A LONG AND IMPORTANT MEETING  
5 TODAY. SO, I REALLY WANT TO GET CLEAR ON OUR GOALS FOR THE  
6 DAY. AND WE'RE GOING TO START KIND OF THE SUBSTANTIVE PART  
7 WILL BE ITEM 4A. WE'RE GOING HEAR ABOUT A NEW SCENARIO FROM  
8 SFMTA ON BEHALF OF SEVERAL TRANSIT OPERATORS, WE'LL THEN HAVE  
9 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT ITEM. ON ITEM 4B WE'LL REVIEW SCENARIO  
10 ONE IN HYBRID SCENARIO. YOU WILL ALSO LEARN ABOUT SOME NEW  
11 VARIATIONS DEVELOPED BASED ON YOUR FEEDBACK AND SINCE OUR LAST  
12 MEETING. THEN WE'LL DIVE DEEPER DURING THIS PRESENTATION INTO  
13 THE PROPOSED TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM. WE GOT A LOT OF  
14 QUERIES ABOUT THAT. SO, AFTER CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THAT,  
15 WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH A  
16 RATING EXERCISE, LIKE WE DID LAST TIME USING GRADIENTS OF  
17 AGREEMENT AND THIS TIME THOUGH WE'RE GOING TO BE GRADING ON  
18 ELEMENTS SUCH AS FUNDING MECHANISMS AND GEOGRAPHY, RATHER THAN  
19 JUST ON THE SCENARIOS THEMSELVES. WE'LL THEN HAVE A SHORT  
20 BREAK. WE'LL BE ABLE TO SEE WHAT THE RESULTS WERE, IN  
21 AGGREGATE, AND BE ABLE TO CONSIDER A RESOLUTION BASED ON THE  
22 CONVERSATION AND THOSE RESULTS. FINALLY, IN ITEM 4C, WE'LL  
23 REVIEW THE POLICY PROVISIONS THAT COULD BE CONSIDERED AS PART  
24 OF THE ENABLING LEGISLATION. AND AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT,  
25 YOU MIGHT CONSIDER A MOTION RECOMMENDING OR ADVISING AGAINST



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CERTAIN OF THESE POLICIES WE DISCUSS. SO, IF THERE ARE ANY  
2 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THE MEETING GOALS AND OTHERWISE I'LL  
3 HAND IT BACK TO CHAIR SPERING.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU STUART. I'LL SEE IF COMMITTEE  
6 MEMBERS HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THE OPENING  
7 COMMENTS. OKAY. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE, YOU KNOW, IF YOU  
8 HAVE A MINORITY POSITION OR IF YOU FEEL YOUR ISSUE NEEDS TO BE  
9 EXPLORED FURTHER, PLEASE GIVE US YOUR WHITE PAPER, AND WE'LL  
10 SUBMIT IT WITH OUR REPORT TO THE COMMISSION AND ALSO TO THE  
11 LEGISLATURE, SO WE'LL INCLUDE THOSE POSITION PAPERS. SO,  
12 PLEASE INCLUDE THOSE SO EVERYONE KNOW WHAT IS YOUR POSITION IS  
13 OR HOW YOU THINK WE SHOULD PROCEED. AT THIS TIME, IS THERE ANY  
14 PUBLIC SPEAKERS ON CONVERSATION THAT WE HAVE MADE OR ANY  
15 WRITTEN COMMENTS?

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING  
18 FOR THIS ITEM BUT WE DO HAVE TWO SPEAKERS IN THE ZOOM SPACE AS  
19 WELL AS ONE PERSON IN THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE  
20 PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GIVE THEM TWO MINUTES, PLEASE. THERE ARE  
23 ONLY A COUPLE PEOPLE.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WHO IS THE FIRST SPEAKER? 37 LAUREL  
2 PAGEANT SEKINS. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. MAKE SURE YOU TURN THE  
3 MIC ON.

4  
5 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. DOES THAT WORK? LAUREL, PUBLIC ADVOCATES,  
6 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I WILL BE QUICK HERE I WANT  
7 TO POINT YOUR ATTENTION TO A FEW LETTERS THAT CAME IN THAT ARE  
8 IN THE PACKET PARTICULARLY HIGHLIGHTING THE LETTERS FROM NORTH  
9 BAY RIDERS AND ORGANIZATION. THERE IS A GROUP LETTER FROM A  
10 NUMBER OF NORTH BAY ORGANIZATIONS INCLUDING FRIENDS OF SMART,  
11 FRIENDS OF PETALUMA, [INDISCERNIBLE] LEGAL CENTER, GENESIS,  
12 SEAMLESS, SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION CALLING ATTENTION TO  
13 THE NEEDS OF TRANSIT NEEDS IN THE NORTH BAY HOPING THEY'RE NOT  
14 LEFT OUT OF THE CONVERSATION HOPE YOU LOOK AT THAT LETTER AND  
15 CONSIDER THE NEEDS OF THE NORTH BAY AS WELL IN THE REGIONAL  
16 FUNDING COORDINATION THANK YOU.

17  
18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY THANK YOU.

19  
20 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR FIRST CALLER IN THE  
21 ZOOM SPACE WILL BE OLGA VITALINA. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
22 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. OLGA, ARE YOU THERE? OKAY  
23 WE'LL MOVE ON TO 350 SAN FRANCISCO. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
24 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

2

3 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE CAN.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SARAH GREENWALD HERE WITH 350 BAY AREA  
6 TRANSPORTATION TEAM. TO ENCOURAGE YOU AND SET CONTEXT, LET ME  
7 SHARE THIS FROM THE 2024 STATE OF THE CLIMATE REPORT IN BIO  
8 SCIENCE, AS FOLLOWS: WE FIND OURSELVES AMID AN ABRUPT CLIMATE  
9 UPHEAVAL, A DIRE SITUATION, NEVER BEFORE ENCOUNTERED IN THE AN  
10 ALES OF HUMAN EXISTENCE. WE HAVE NOW BROUGHT THE PLANET INTO  
11 CLIMATIC CONDITIONS NEVER WITNESSED. END QUOTE. I EMPHASIZE  
12 NEVER WITNESSED BY HOMO SAPIENS. YOU CAN HELP AT THIS DIRE  
13 MOMENT. PUBLIC TRANSIT IS ONE OF OUR BEST HOPES FOR THE  
14 CLIMATE. WE NEED STRONG INVESTMENT HERE IN OUR NINE-COUNTY BAY  
15 AREA -- PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS TO HELP CUT EMISSION  
16 TRENDS, SHORE UP FINANCES OF EXISTING SERVICES LIKE BART, SF  
17 MUNI AND AC TRANSIT AND INVEST EXPANSION INTO SERVICES AND  
18 AREAS LIKE THE NORTH BAY WHERE LOCAL SERVICE AND REGIONAL  
19 CONNECTIONS STRONGLY NEED IMPROVEMENT. YOU, AS MTC, AND  
20 REGIONAL COUNTY LEADERS NEED TO MAKE SURE THIS CAN HAPPEN. SO,  
21 I WISH YOU ALL SPEED.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND THAT CONCLUDES  
24 PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. LET'S MOVE ON INTO OUR  
2 AGENDA. THIS IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THESE ARE ITEMS FROM OUR  
3 SEPTEMBER 23RD MEETING. I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE  
4 THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. IS THERE  
11 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT BUSINESS? OR ANYONE IN THE ROOM WISHING TO  
12 SPEAK?

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS  
15 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH  
16 PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH  
17 RAISED HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. TAKE THE ROLL PLEASE.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MOTION BY MEMBER NOACK.  
22 SECOND RABBITT. SPERING?

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ORANTES?

2

3 **JOHN ARANTES:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CANEPA? CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

10

11 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** JOSEFOWITZ?

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LEONE? LEVIN?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LINDSAY? MAHAN? MILEY? MOULTON-

22 PETERS? NOACK? RABBITT?

23

24 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WU IS ABSENT. AND WUNDERMAN?

2

3 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW MOVE INTO ITEM  
8 4A. THIS IS THE OPERATOR COORDINATED SCENARIOS. JONATHON  
9 REWERS WITH SFMTA, CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER, WILL INTRODUCE THE  
10 INFORMATION ITEM WITH ADDITIONAL INPUT FROM TRANSPORTATION  
11 AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES. YOU KNOW, THIS ITEM IS NOT BEFORE THE  
12 COMMITTEE FOR ANY DECISION. IT'S AN INFORMATION ITEM AND WE  
13 FELT THE SELECT COMMITTEE WOULD BENEFIT FROM HEARING FROM THE  
14 OPERATORS. SO, WITH THAT, JONATHON, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.

15

16 **JONATHON REWERS:** CAN YOU PUT UP THE SLIDES? THANK YOU. GOOD  
17 MORNING CHAIR SPERING, COMMISSIONERS AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS.  
18 JONATHON REWERS WITH SFMTA. JUST TO INTRODUCE THIS ITEM, WHAT  
19 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ATTEMPTED TO DO WAS REVIEW ALL THE  
20 VARIOUS CONCERNS THAT MEMBERS OF THIS COMMITTEE, THE  
21 LEGISLATURE, AND PARTNERS HAD IN THE OVERALL PROCESS. AND FROM  
22 LEARNING ABOUT THOSE INDIVIDUAL CONCERNS, REVERSE ENGINEER A  
23 MEASURE THAT COULD POTENTIALLY WORK. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHAT I  
24 WANT TO STRESS IS THIS WAS MEANT TO BE A COMPROMISE WITH THE  
25 INTENT THAT WHATEVER THE RESULT WOULD BE WOULD NOT BE PERFECT.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WHAT WE DID WAS HAVING A SERIES OF DISCUSSIONS WITH OPERATORS  
2 AND PARTNERS THROUGHOUT THE REGION ABOUT WHAT THEIR SPECIFIC  
3 RED LINES WOULD BE AROUND A REGIONAL MEASURE. SO, THAT WOULD  
4 BE SALES TAX VERSUS PARCEL TAX, REAUTHORIZATION DATES, LOCAL  
5 FUNDING PRIORITIES, AMOUNT REQUIRED FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO  
6 BE SUSTAINED WITHIN THE REGION. SO, WE SLOWLY BUT SURELY TOOK  
7 EACH OF THOSE RED LINES TO DESIGN A COMPROMISE THAT IN THEORY  
8 MANY COULD SUPPORT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHEN WE LOOKED AT THE  
9 COMPROMISE, THREE ELEMENTS EMERGED. FIRST THAT YOU NEEDED A  
10 VERY CLEAR PRIORITIZED REGIONAL PROGRAM, MEANING WHAT WOULD  
11 THIS COMMITTEE, THE LEGISLATURE, THE PUBLIC WITHIN THE BAY  
12 AREA, WHAT WOULD WE ALL AGREE WITHIN THE BAY AREA IS A  
13 REGIONAL PROGRAM, A REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT EVERYONE  
14 NEEDS TO SUPPORT. SECOND, WHAT FUNDING STRATEGIES COULD BE  
15 EMPLOYED TO SUPPORT THAT REGIONAL SYSTEM, AND LOCAL OPERATORS  
16 AND, ALSO SUPPORT LOCAL COUNTIES AND LOCAL CITIES WITH  
17 PROJECTS AND REAUTHORIZATION MEASURES THAT THEY MIGHT HAVE,  
18 AND THEN LASTLY WHEN CONSIDERING BOTH THE REGIONAL PROGRAM AND  
19 POTENTIAL FUNDING STRATEGIES, WHAT WOULD LEGISLATION LOOK LIKE  
20 THAT WOULD ALLOW FOR THIS FLEXIBILITY. THE PROPOSAL INCLUDES  
21 BOTH TOOLS AND TIME, MEANING VARIOUS TOOLS TO CRAFT A MEASURE  
22 THAT WOULD BE SUCCESSFUL, AND ASSUMES TIME TO COME TO A MORE  
23 PERFECT AND PERMANENT REGIONAL MEASURE TO FUND THE PRIORITIES  
24 THAT EXIST ACROSS THE NINE COUNTIES. IT DID RECOGNIZE THE NEED  
25 TO PROTECT LOCAL PRIORITIES, AGAIN, THAT'S REAUTHORIZATIONS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 POTENTIALLY ON THE BALLOT, SALES TAX CAPACITY WITHIN DIFFERENT  
2 PARTS OF THE REGION, PARCEL TAX CAPACITY, MEANING THE VALUE OF  
3 PARCELS WITHIN DIFFERENT COUNTIES, AND PROJECTS THAT DIFFERENT  
4 COUNTIES AND/OR TRANSIT AGENCIES WANTED TO PURSUE. IT DOES  
5 PROVIDE TEN YEARS OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. THE AMOUNT OF TIME,  
6 AS CHAIR SPERING NOTED, AND OTHERS, FOR THE TRANSIT INDUSTRY  
7 TO ADJUST TO THE NEW FORMS OF MOBILITY, IN A NEW FUNDING  
8 STRUCTURE, WILL TAKE THAT AMOUNT OF TIME. OPERATORS AND  
9 COUNTIES HAVE OPTION, THAT WAS IMPORTANT. SO THE ABILITY TO  
10 CRAFT, ESPECIALLY LOCALLY, I'LL TALK ABOUT THE VARIABLE TAX  
11 RATE AND THE ABILITY TO DO THAT. AND LASTLY WHILE THERE ARE  
12 REGIONAL PRIORITIES, AGAIN THINGS THAT WE ALL AGREE NEED TO BE  
13 FUNDED, THERE IS FLEXIBILITY, AGAIN, FOR LOCAL COUNTIES,  
14 TRANSIT AGENCIES, TO GET DOLLARS TO THE THINGS THAT THEY HAVE,  
15 THAT THEY NEED FUNDED OVER THE PERIOD OF TIME. NEXT SLIDE. SO  
16 TO COVER THOSE POTENTIAL FUNDING STRATEGIES, WHAT WE DESIGNED  
17 IS KIND OF A TWO PART. A SHORT-TERM MEASURE FOCUSED  
18 SPECIFICALLY ON THE EMERGENCY, THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE  
19 FACING WITHIN THE REGION. WE MODELED BOTH A FIVE COUNTY AND A  
20 NINE COUNTY MEASURE, ASSUMING A 10-YEAR EXPENDITURE PLAN WHICH  
21 I'LL COVER IN THE NEXT SLIDE AND A TAX THAT WILL LAST THROUGH  
22 JUNE 2038 CONSISTENT WITH FISCAL YEARS FOR GOVERNMENT ENTITY,  
23 AGAIN CONSIDERING A RANGE OF TOOLS BASED ON FEEDBACK THROUGH  
24 THIS PROCESS, A VARIABLE RATE PARCEL TAX WAS USED THESE WOULD  
25 BE BASED ON DEVELOPED SQUARE FOOT WITHIN A PARCEL AND THE RATE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WOULD VARY FROM \$0.11 PER SQUARE FOOT UP TO \$0.28 PER SQUARE  
2 FOOT APPLYING TO SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY BASED ON THE FACT THAT  
3 TAX RATES AND FUNDING RAISED BY COUNTY WOULD SUPPORT THOSE  
4 LOCAL NEEDS AND OVERALL REGIONAL PROGRAMS SIMULTANEOUSLY,  
5 FUNDS WOULD SUPPORT IN A WATERFALL, A REGIONAL PROGRAM, THEN  
6 MOVING DOWN TO THE NEEDS OF LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THEN  
7 LASTLY TO COUNTY FLEX, AS YOU HAVE HEARD THROUGH THE THIS  
8 PROCESS, AND THEN FINALLY NOTING THE NEED FOR ACCOUNTABILITY,  
9 RECOMMENDATION THAT INDEPENDENT AUDITOR BE PART OF THE  
10 LEGISLATION TO SUPPORT AGAIN THOSE ACCOUNTABILITY PROGRAMS AND  
11 INTENT OF THE LEGISLATION. SIMULTANEOUSLY IT DOES MEAN YOU CAN  
12 WORK ON LONG-TERM MEASURES WITHIN THE REAUTHORIZATION WITHIN  
13 THE UPON WINDOW OF TIME FOR FUTURE TRANSPORTATION CONSIDERING  
14 SETTLING OF TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THEIR ABILITY TO SUSTAINABLE  
15 LONG-TERM FUNDING AND PROJECTS AND PROJECTS THAT OVER A LONGER  
16 PERIOD OF TIME SOMETHING AROUND NOVEMBER 2036 THAT'S ALWAYS  
17 THE BEST TIME TO ATTEMPT SOMETHING LIKE THIS PROGRAMS ALLOWED  
18 FOR FINANCING OVER THE PERIOD OF TIME TO MEET CASH FLOW NEEDS  
19 FOR VARIOUS ENTITY ACROSS THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. WHEN YOU  
20 LOOK AT THIS SLIDE THE LEFT IS THE DESIGN ITSELF OF THE  
21 MEASURE. SO, OVER TEN YEARS, THE AMOUNT GENERATED IN REVENUE  
22 WOULD BE ABOUT 9.5 BILLION. THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IS TEN YEARS.  
23 IT ALLOWS FOR MTC TO FINANCE TO THE CASH FLOW NEEDS OF BOTH  
24 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND COUNTIES, DEPENDING ON THEIR INDIVIDUAL  
25 NEEDS. SO, AGAIN, THE TAX IS 11.5 YEARS THE REASON FOR THAT IS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 FIRST TO ALLOW DOLLARS TO BE FINANCED FROM THE END OF THE  
2 PROGRAM TO WHAT I CALL YEAR ZERO MOST OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES  
3 ARE FACING THEIR DEFICITS IN FISCAL YEAR '27 THAT'S THE SAME  
4 YEAR THAT THIS INITIATIVE WOULD BE ON THE BALLOT IN NOVEMBER  
5 2026 SO THOSE DOLLARS ARE IMMEDIATE AND SOME CASES AGENCIES  
6 CAN'T WAIT. THIS IS OPTION FOR OPT IN THIS SCENARIO SANTA  
7 CLARA COUNTY LOWEST TAX RATE \$0.11 PER SQUARE FOOT SAN  
8 FRANCISCO COUNTY HIGHEST TAX RATE AT \$0.28 PER SQUARE FOOT AND  
9 USING THIS BOTH CONTRIBUTION TO THE REGIONAL PROGRAM WHICH IS  
10 LARGELY BASED ON AM BOARDINGS, FOR THOSE INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT  
11 AGENCIES, AND THE COUNTY FLEX, WE GOT GENERALLY TO A 95% PLUS  
12 RETURN TO SOURCE. ON THE PROGRAM ON THE UPPER SIDE, BOTH BART  
13 AND CALTRAIN AT THE RECOGNIZED REGIONAL SYSTEM FOR THE BAY  
14 AREA ARE FUNDED, GAPS LARGELY BUT NOT PERFECTLY CLOSED  
15 ESPECIALLY IN THE CASE OF BART. SECOND CONSIDERING THE BUS  
16 NETWORK, THAT IS IMPORTANT TO BRING PEOPLE TO THAT REGIONAL  
17 NETWORK THROUGH FEEDER AND OTHER MAJOR SERVICES WITHIN THE  
18 REGION. LARGE OPERATORS, INCLUDING AC TRANSIT, VTA, SAMTRANS,  
19 THE SMALL OPERATORS, ARE ALSO INCLUDED, AND THERE IS \$95  
20 MILLION REGIONAL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FOCUSED LARGELY ON  
21 MODERNIZING OUR FARE STRUCTURES AND CLEANLINESS AND SAFETY OF  
22 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. LOCAL DOLLARS THEN FLOW TO THE NEXT LEVEL  
23 OF THE WATERFALL WITH MUNI GETTING \$1 BILLION, BEING FROM SAN  
24 FRANCISCO, MTA, THAT DOES NOT FULLY CLOSE THE GAP BUT THROUGH  
25 CASH FLOW WOULD MEET THE NEEDS OF SAN FRANCISCO IN A TIMELY





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NEED, VTA 700 MILLION AC TRANSIT 428 MILLION AND BELOW DOLLARS  
2 THAT REMAIN COUNTY FLEX. IN THE CASE OF COUNTY FLEX THAT CAN  
3 BE USED FOR LOCAL PROJECTS, DEFERRING REAUTHORIZATIONS OR  
4 REDUCING THE TAX RATE WITHIN THE COUNTY. IF THE DOLLARS AREN'T  
5 NEEDED VARIABLE RATE COULD BE REDUCED WITHIN THAT SPECIFIC  
6 COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE. IN ORDER TO DO SOMETHING LIKE THIS, THIS  
7 IS THE PROPOSED FRAMEWORK. SO, THIS ASSUMES A SHORTER NEAR-  
8 TERM MEASURE, IT AGAIN CAN BE SALES OR PARCEL TAX WITH A  
9 VARIABLE RATE BY COUNTY. SO THAT'S AN IMPORTANT THING TO  
10 REMEMBER. REVENUE NEEDS NEED TO BE SUFFICIENT FOR TRANSIT  
11 NEEDS OVER A DECADE THERE SHOULD BE AGREED UPON SPECIFIED  
12 REGIONAL PROGRAM THAT IS FUNDED FIRST AND AGAIN ALLOWS FOR THE  
13 DESIGN OF A LONGER TERM REAUTHORIZATION MEASURE AFTER THAT  
14 DECADE PERIOD. THE RECOMMENDED REGIONAL PROGRAM, AGAIN SI OUR  
15 REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEM IN THE FORM OF BART AND CALTRAIN, YOU  
16 WILL SEE BART TO SILICON VALLEY THERE CLOSING THE LOOP AROUND  
17 THE BAY AREA, WHICH NECESSITATES THE NEED FOR REGIONAL TRANSIT  
18 SERVICE, BUS FEEDERS AND OTHER MAJOR BUS OPERATORS THAT FEED  
19 THE REGION'S RAIL SYSTEM IN TURN SUPPORT THE RIDERSHIP AND  
20 SUPPORT REVENUE MOVING TOWARDS SUSTAINABILITY LASTLY TRANSIT  
21 TRANSFORMATION CLEANLINESS SAFETY AGAIN SPECIFICALLY DESIGNED  
22 TO DRIVE RIDERS BACK TO THE SYSTEMS. LASTLY ON THE LEGISLATIVE  
23 POLICY, AGAIN, AUTHORIZATION FOR A RELATE TRANSACTION'S USE  
24 TAX OTHERWISE KNOWN AS SALES TAX, PARCEL TAX ASSUMING VARIABLE  
25 RATE METHOD BY CAN'T WITHIN A DISTRICT, AUTHORIZING QUALIFIED



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 VOTER INITIATIVE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE REGION AND A HALF  
2 PROGRAM SPECIFIED THEN INDEPENDENT AUDITOR FOR ACCOUNTABILITY.  
3 THAT'S IT. THANK YOU

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE  
6 MEMBERS? I FELT IT WAS IMPORTANT THAT YOU SAW THIS. BECAUSE  
7 I'M SURE THIS IS GOING TO BE BEFORE THE COMMISSION, THE LEG  
8 COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSIONS. AND, JONATHON, HAS THERE BEEN  
9 ANY DISCUSSION ABOUT CUTS THAT -- OR CHANGES THAT THE  
10 OPERATORS ARE GOING TO BE MAKING IN THE MEANTIME? I DOUBT VERY  
11 MUCH THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE IS GOING TO BE AN APPETITE OF THE  
12 VOTERS TO FULLY FUND THAT SHORTFALL. I JUST DON'T SEE THAT  
13 HAPPENING. SO, WHAT HAS THAT DISCUSSION BEEN LIKE? BOTH A  
14 REVENUE STRATEGY AND NEW BUSINESS MODELS? WHAT ARE THOSE  
15 CONVERSATIONS LIKE AMONG THE OPERATORS?

16

17 **JONATHON REWERS:** AS NOTED IN THIS PARTICULAR OPTION AND ARE IN  
18 DISCUSSIONS, THIS IN ITSELF DOESN'T CLOSE THE GAP FOR LARGE  
19 OPERATORS IT FOCUSES ON REGIONAL RAIL OPERATORS. ONE, BECAUSE  
20 THEY ARE FARE DEPENDENT, THEIR LARGEST SOURCE OF FUNDING AND  
21 SECOND THEY HAVE A HIGH-LEVEL OF FIXED COST. WE DON'T WANT TO  
22 HAVE A SCENARIO WHERE WE SENDING OUR MAJOR RAIL SYSTEMS BART  
23 AND CALTRAIN INTO WHAT'S REFERRED TO AS TRANSIT DEATH SPIRAL  
24 CURRENT BUSINESS MODEL ORGANIZATIONS WITHOUT SOME SOURCE TO  
25 STAND THEM UP TO ALLOW THEM TO TRANSFORM TO GET RIDERSHIP AND



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MODERNIZE FUNDING SOURCES THEY WON'T MAKE IT IN THE NEXT TEN  
2 YEARS THE BUS OPERATORS A LOT OF INVESTING IN RELIABILITY OF  
3 THEIR SYSTEM BOTH AC TRANSIT AND MUNI, CERTAINLY WE HAVE BEEN  
4 DOING THAT IN SAN FRANCISCO BUT THIS DOESN'T COMPLETELY CLOSE  
5 THE GAP FOR EITHER ORGANIZATION AND NO MEASURE WILL. IN SAN  
6 FRANCISCO WE PUT TOGETHER A MUNI FUNDING WORKING GROUP KNOWING  
7 WE WILL NEED SOMETHING ELSE ON TOP OF THIS OR AS WE HAVE LAID  
8 OUT TO THAT SPECIFIC GROUP THERE WILL BE SERVICE REDUCTIONS  
9 NECESSARY AND I THINK MOST ORGANIZATIONS ARE PREPARING FOR  
10 POTENTIAL SERVICE REDUCTIONS IF NECESSARY.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SUE?

13

14 **SUE NOACK:** I JUST HAD A QUESTION. YOU LAID OUT THE VARIABLE  
15 RATES FOR THE PARCEL TAX. I APPRECIATE THAT. YOU INDICATED IT  
16 COULD BE SALES OR PARCEL TAX. DID YOU MAP OUT THE VARIABLE  
17 SALES TAX NEEDED?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** IT'S A QUESTION WE GOT FROM THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE  
20 LAST WEEK. PART OF THE REASON WE FOCUSED ON PARCEL TAX AND  
21 VARIABLE RATE HAS TO DO WITH VALUABLE OF PROPERTIES ACROSS THE  
22 BAY AREA AND SIZE. ONE OF THE CONCERNS WAS THAT SAN FRANCISCO  
23 HAS HUGE NEED BUT DOESN'T GENERATE ENOUGH SALES TAX WHICH IS  
24 DEFINITELY TRUE IN A SALES TAX SCENARIO IN PARCEL TAX SAN  
25 FRANCISCO IS STRONGER DUE TO DENSITY AND VALUE OF ITS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 PROPERTIES WITHIN SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY. AGAIN IF THAT WAS A  
2 SPECIFIC CONCERN THEN YOU PIVOT TO PARCEL TAX BUT WE WILL LOOK  
3 AT A VARIABLE SALES TAX RATE TO SEE IF WE CAN GET TO THE SAME  
4 PROGRAM YOU SAW.

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** JIM, I HAVE A QUESTION.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OH SORRY.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS IS INTRIGUING AND  
13 THANK YOU FOR BRINGING IT FORWARD. YOU HAD TALKED A LITTLE BIT  
14 ABOUT FUNDING FOR TEN YEARS. WOULD FIVE YEARS WORK? AND WHY  
15 WOULDN'T IT WORK?

16

17 **JONATHON REWERS:** THE REASON I BRING UP 10 AND 5 YEARS WE  
18 LOOKED AT BOTH HAS TO DO WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES, LET'S USE  
19 SFMTA AS AN EXAMPLE, MUNI WITHIN THE REGION, SFMTA AND MUNI  
20 PROBABLY HAS ONE OF THE MOST VARIED SOURCES OF ANY TRANSIT  
21 AGENCY WITHIN THE BAY AREA BUT THE ABILITY TO TRANSFORM THOSE  
22 GET A SECOND BALLOT MEASURE ON THE BALLOT LOOKING TO OTHER  
23 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES TO PARKING AND DIFFERENT TRANSPORTATION  
24 SOURCES. THE CONVINCING, THE DEVELOPING, THE COLLECTING OF  
25 THOSE SOURCES WILL TAKE FIVE YEARS. SO, YOU WILL START SEEING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DIVIDENDS AT YEAR FIVE BUT THOSE REVENUES WILL NOT GENERATE  
2 ENOUGH DOLLARS TO CLOSE OPERATING GAPS THAT THE TRANSIT  
3 AGENCIES ARE FACING. I WOULD SAY THAT'S TRUE OF SAN FRANCISCO  
4 HAVING THAT STRENGTH. IT'S NOT NECESSARILY TRUE OF AC TRANSIT.  
5 IT DEFINITELY IS NOT TRUE FOR THE RAIL OPERATORS BOTH BART AND  
6 CALTRAIN.

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** THIS IS DIFFERENT THAN IN THE PAST I'M CURIOUS,  
9 ALL FIVE COUNTIES ARE INCLUDED IN THIS MEASURE? IF YOU COULD  
10 OUTLINE THE DIFFERENCES THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

11

12 **JONATHON REWERS:** ALL OF THE OPERATORS HAVE LOOKED AT DIFFERENT  
13 OPTIONS FROM A THREE COUNTY TO FIVE COUNTY NEEDS OF THE  
14 REGIONAL SYSTEM ALMOST ALWAYS WATERFALL AT FIVE COUNTIES WHEN  
15 YOU CONSIDER COUNTIES THAT PARTICIPATE LARGELY IN BART AND  
16 CALTRAIN YOU ALMOST ALSO END UP AT FIVE COUNTY WHEN YOU  
17 CONSIDER A LAYER ON THE MAJOR BUS OPERATORS ON TOP OF THAT  
18 RAIL SYSTEM, AC TRANSIT, MUNI, VTA, YOU END UP WITH FIVE  
19 COUNTY MEASURE. WHEN YOU NEED TO GENERATE DOLLARS TO SUSTAIN  
20 ORGANIZATIONS OVER THE NEXT DECADE.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL CLOSE WITH THIS. YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S  
23 GREAT, I'M TRYING TO FIGURE OUT, AND YOU KNOW, I'M JUST  
24 PUTTING ALL MY CARDS OUT THERE, A FIVE-YEAR -- FIVE YEARS  
25 THERE IS NO WAY IT COULD WORK OUT AT FIVE-YEAR MARK, IT HAS TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BE TEN YEARS OF FUNDING. IS THERE CREATIVITY OR THOUGHT TO  
2 THAT MAYBE YOU CAN COME BACK?

3

4 **JONATHON REWERS:** YOU COULD DEFINITELY LOOK AT A FIVE-YEAR  
5 MEASURE BUT THAT WOULD START THE PROCESS OF CONSIDERING GOING  
6 BACK TO THE BALLOT IN 18 TO 24 MONTHS. SO, YOU COULD DO THAT  
7 YOU WOULD JUST END UP HAVING THE SAME PROCESS OCCUR 24 MONTHS  
8 FROM NOW TO FIGURE OUT WHAT REAUTHORIZATION IS GOING TO BE.

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** IS THERE ANY THOUGHT TO -- WHAT YEAR WOULD YOU  
11 RECEIVE, IF LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WANTED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH  
12 CAPITAL WHAT YEAR IS THAT IN TERMS OF FLEX?

13

14 **JONATHON REWERS:** IN THEORY WITH THIS PROGRAM THE ONE VALUE  
15 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO STRESS, THE VALUE OF MTC AND A COLLECTIVE  
16 TAX BASE FOR A PROGRAM LIKE THIS IS THE ABILITY TO FINANCE  
17 ACROSS ALL THE COUNTIES FOR INDIVIDUAL NEEDS BASED ON CASH  
18 FLOW FOR EITHER CAPITAL PROJECTS OR IN THE CASE OF THE SFMTA,  
19 WE HAVE A LARGER DEFER SIT UP FRONT AS WE GENERATE ADDITIONAL  
20 REVENUES, HOPEFUL THEY DEFICIT WILL GO DOWN IN THE OUT-YEARS  
21 SO MANAGING CASH FLOW AND FINANCING IS IMPORTANT. IN THIS  
22 SCENARIO, THIS IS JUST A SCENARIO, IF YOU HAVE AN 11 AND A  
23 HALF YEAR TAX IN A TEN YEAR PROGRAM, THAT LAST YEAR CAN BE  
24 FINANCED INTO YEAR ONE, SO THAT WOULD BE FISCAL YEAR '27, YOU  
25 KNOW, IN THEORY FISCAL YEAR '27 STARTS IN JUNE OF 2026. SECOND



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 HALF YEAR WAS MEANT TO MOVE FROM CALENDAR TO FISCAL YEAR BASIS  
2 THEN ALSO PROVIDE EXTRA DOLLARS TO ALLOW FOR THAT FINANCING  
3 BASED ON WHAT COUNTY NEEDS ARE.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ADINA THEN ALAN, THEN CINDY.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, THANKS VERY MUCH FOR PRESENTING THIS, AND,  
8 ALSO, FOR DISCLOSURE, YOUR TEAM EXPLANATION OF SOME OF THE  
9 DETAILS ON FRIDAY THE -- THIS IS PRETTY INTRIGUING IN TERMS OF  
10 HOW THIS PROPOSED SOLUTION ADDRESSES A NUMBER OF THE  
11 UNDERLYING CONCERNS AND GOALS. SO, FIRST OF ALL, IT DOES FOCUS  
12 ON PROVIDING THE FUNDING FOR, YOU KNOW, FOR TRANSIT TO BE ABLE  
13 TO KEEP SERVICE RUNNING, AND THE -- YOU KNOW, TRANSIT  
14 TRANSFORMATION TO IMPROVE THE SERVICE. AND THOSE ARE REALLY,  
15 LIKE, VERY FUNDAMENTAL TO, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE NEEDS ARE, TO  
16 CHIEF ANOTHER IMPORTANT THING, WHICH IS NOT FULLY WORKED OUT  
17 AND WILL REQUIRE MORE WORK INSIDE SAN FRANCISCO IS OPENING UP  
18 A SPACE TO BOTH ADDRESSING MUNI'S REALLY SUBSTANTIAL NEEDS,  
19 BUT NOT ASKING SAN FRANCISCO TO DO THE IMPOSSIBLE WITH THREE  
20 OR FOUR BALLOT MEASURES IN A SINGLE YEAR WHICH IS -- WHICH  
21 EMPLOYS A LOT OF RISK NOT ONLY FOR SAN FRANCISCO BUT FOR ALL  
22 OF THE REGIONAL AGENCIES SERVING SAN FRANCISCO, AS WELL AS THE  
23 NEIGHBORS DEPENDING ON A FUNCTIONING UNIT. SO, THE ONE, AND  
24 HAVING THAT COORDINATED REGIONAL APPROACH, WHICH IS A RISK  
25 REDUCTION FOR EVERYONE, THE ONE QUESTION AND CONCERN IS ABOUT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WHICH IN THIS PROPOSAL IS AT THE,  
2 AT A 1% LEVEL WHICH IS SIGNIFICANTLY SMALLER AND NARROWER THAN  
3 WHAT IS IN THE MTC PROPOSAL. THE TEAM HAD RESPONDED THAT THAT  
4 WAS, YOU KNOW, DUE TO SOME EARLIER CONCERNS ABOUT GETTING TO A  
5 HIGHER LEVEL OF RETURN TO SOURCE. HOWEVER, IN THE PUSH BACK  
6 AGAINST THE BIG CHUNK OF FUNDING, BIGGER CHUNK OF FUNDING FOR  
7 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, THERE WERE ALSO SOME REALLY BIG  
8 QUESTIONS ABOUT TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY, WHICH MTC HAS  
9 STARTED TO ADDRESS. AND THOSE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ITEMS ARE  
10 THINGS THAT INCREASE RIDERSHIP, THEY'RE VERY POPULAR, AND THEY  
11 ARE SOME THINGS THAT SOME OF THEM ARE LOCATED IN AN INDIVIDUAL  
12 LOCATION, LIKE A WAYFINDING SIGNAGE IN ONE LOCATION, SO YOU  
13 COULD ALLOCATE THE FUNDING IN A WAY WHICH IS VERY CLEAR AT  
14 GEOGRAPHICAL RETURN SOME ARE WIN-WIN SO GOOD COMMUNICATION  
15 ABOUT HOW IT'S DONE IS SOMETHING THAT COULD ADDRESS THOSE  
16 CONCERNS. AND PARTICULARLY I WANT TO CALL OUT ESPECIALLY THE  
17 ACCESSIBLE TRANSPORTATION, PARATRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS FOR A  
18 DISABLED PERSON TO GET FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY IS, LIKE, NEARLY  
19 IMPOSSIBLE AND FOR THE WAYFINDING MAKING THAT ACCESSIBLE IS  
20 ALSO VERY IMPORTANT. SO, WOULD ENCOURAGE, AS A FEEDBACK TO  
21 LOOK AT HAVING A MORE ROBUST APPROACH TO TRANSIT  
22 TRANSFORMATION FOR ALL OF THOSE REASONS.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. ELLEN AND CINDY.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **ELLEN WU:** I WANT TO SECOND WHAT CINDY SAID ABOUT THE  
2 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND HAVING ENOUGH FUND FOR IT  
3 ESPECIALLY FOR ACCESS TO MOBILITY IMPROVEMENTS FOR SENIORS AND  
4 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. AND THE SECOND IS THAT -- THANKS FOR  
5 DOING, THIS I AM SURE YOU ALL CRAMMED IT -- [LAUGHTER] LIKE,  
6 WE HAVE BEEN DOING THIS FOR MONTHS. THERE IS ENOUGH  
7 FLEXIBILITY WITHIN THE PLAN. I THINK THE THEME OF TODAY MIGHT  
8 BE THAT THERE -- WE NEED A FRAMEWORK THAT ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY  
9 WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK, BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING TO  
10 HAPPEN. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN IN NOVEMBER NEXT  
11 MONTH. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN IN HOPEFULLY FUTURE  
12 FUNDING THAT IF IT HAPPENS THAT RAIL IS FUNDED SOMEHOW FROM A  
13 DIFFERENT SOURCE, THAT THERE IS ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY WITHIN THAT  
14 PROPOSAL THAT FUNDS THEN GO TO BUS, RIGHT? THAT MIGHT NEED IT,  
15 THAT MIGHT NOT BE GETTING MONEY FROM THE STATE OR THE FEDS,  
16 FOR EXAMPLE, JUST AS AN EXAMPLE.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CINDY?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WANT TO START BY SAYING JUST REALLY HOW  
21 HELPFUL THIS IS AND HOW GRATEFUL I AM THAT YOU DID ALL OF THIS  
22 WORK. I WONDER IF YOU COULD TALK TO US FOR A MOMENT ABOUT THE  
23 IMPLICATIONS OF THIS TYPE OF PLAN IN A 30 YEAR SCENARIO.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **JONATHON REWERS:** SO, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE TOOK INTO  
2 CONSIDERATION IS THE MOOD OF THE VOTERS. THIS, BECAUSE THIS  
3 WAS DESIGNED BY THE OPERATORS BASED ON CONCERNS THAT WE HAVE  
4 RECEIVED, AND, ALSO, POLLING, WHICH CONSISTENTLY IS ACTUALLY  
5 SHOWING THE NUMBERS GOING DOWN FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS IN THE  
6 CURRENT POLITICAL ENVIRONMENT. THE FOCUS ON A SHORTER MEASURE  
7 WAS LARGELY TO DEAL WITH THE EMERGENCY THAT BAY AREA TRANSIT  
8 IS DEALING WITH. IT DOESN'T MEAN THIS A 30-YEAR MEASURE IS NOT  
9 POSSIBLE IT'S JUST FROM A POLITICAL STANDPOINT, FOR THE  
10 VOTERS, YOU WOULD HAVE TO MESSAGE A TRANSFORMATIONAL MORE  
11 PERMANENT FUNDING SCENARIO AND EXPENDITURE PROGRAM, WHICH IN  
12 THIS ENVIRONMENT, IF YOU'RE NOT AS SPECIFIC AS YOU NEED TO  
13 COULD GET RISKS WHEN CONSIDERING CONCERNS AROUND THE VOTERS  
14 AND POLLING NUMBERS WE WENT WITH SHORT-TERM BECAUSE VOTERS DO  
15 UNDERSTAND SHORT-TERM EMERGENCY. WE HAVE BEEN CHECKING WITH  
16 VOTERS IN SAN FRANCISCO WE DID A FOCUS GROUP RECENTLY, AND THE  
17 MESSAGE AROUND THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S DOLLARS ARE GOING TO  
18 GO AND STATE RELIEF IS ONLY FOR TWO YEARS, DOES PLAY VERY WELL  
19 WITH VOTERS. THEY DO UNDERSTAND THAT THE BAY AREA NEEDS TO  
20 STEP IN AND FILL THE GAP THAT THE STATE WILL BE LEAVING IN TWO  
21 YEARS. WE COULD CERTAINLY MODEL A 30-YEAR PROGRAM. THE  
22 EXPENDITURE PLAN WOULD LIKELY CHANGE HOW WE WOULD FUND THE  
23 TRANSIT AGENCIES WOULD CHANGE IT. IS NOT IMPOSSIBLE, THOUGH,  
24 AGAIN, TO HAVE A VARIABLE RATE TAX BASE, TO HAVE AN



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT IS A WATERFALL WITH A FOCUSED REGIONAL  
2 PROGRAM. IT'S NOT IMPOSSIBLE.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** LET ME SHARE MY PERSPECTIVE ON THE CHALLENGE  
5 THAT YOU HAVE JUST LAID OUT. I DON'T THINK WE REALLY KNOW  
6 ENOUGH ABOUT WHAT VOTERS WILL OR WON'T SUPPORT AND ONE OF MY  
7 CONCERNS ALL ALONG HAS BEEN THAT WE ARE TRYING TO REALLY  
8 DEVELOP ONE PIE, INSTEAD OF A PIE MUFFIN AND ZUCCHINI BREAD,  
9 OPTION FOR VOTERS AND WHAT I MEAN ABOUT THAT IS I WORRY MORE  
10 ABOUT THE LACK OF CUSTOMIZATION COUNTY BY COUNTY RELATIVE TO  
11 WHAT WE'RE ASKING PEOPLE TO INVEST IN AND WHY BECAUSE I THINK  
12 WE'RE GOING TO NEED THIS RIGOROUS AND DETAILED LEVEL TO ENGAGE  
13 VOTERS IN OUR DISTRICTS. AND THE REASON I'M CONCERNED ABOUT  
14 THE SHORT-TERM MEASURE IS THAT I THINK IF SOME -- IF SOME  
15 PARTS OF THE NINE-BAY AREA COUNTIES WANT TO BORROW MONEY FOR  
16 EITHER CONSTRUCTION ACTIVITIES OR ANY OTHER ACTIVITIES, THAT,  
17 THAT SHORT TIME FRAME IS MUCH RISKIER THAN THE LONGER 30 YEAR  
18 PERIOD. AND THEN LASTLY, COLLEAGUES, I THINK MOST IMPORTANT  
19 THING IS THAT WE'RE DOING SOMETHING THAT IS MEANINGFUL CHANGE.  
20 THE SECOND IS THAT VOTERS, THERE IS ENOUGH VOTER ENGAGEMENT  
21 THAT WE CAN CONCUR WITH THAT, BUT THE THIRD IS THAT WE -- WE  
22 ACTUALLY HAVE PLANS, WHETHER COUNTY BY COUNTY, OR ALL OF US  
23 ACTING IN CONCERT. AND BY THE WAY, I THINK WE CAN ACT IN  
24 CONCERT WITHOUT HAVING ONE MEASURE IN THE NINE BAY AREA  
25 COUNTY. AND MATTER OF FACT, I THINK LEAN BEING IN THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DIRECTION PUTS US MORE AT RISK FOR SUCCESS THAN IF WE CAN  
2 FIGURE OUT A WAY TO DO SOMETHING THAT'S CUSTOMIZED BUT  
3 COLLECTIVE. AND I THINK ACTUALLY THE FRAMEWORK YOU HAVE LAID  
4 OUT HERE IS VERY SO SOPHISTICATED AND VERY THOUGHTFUL AND  
5 WOULD GIVE US A FRAMEWORK TO BE ABLE TO WORK FROM. SO, THOSE  
6 ARE SOME OF MY INITIAL THOUGHTS. I HAVE MORE TO SHARE LATER.  
7 BUT I REALLY WANT TO SAY THANK YOU. I THOUGHT THIS WAS VERY  
8 THOUGHT PROVOKING AND REALLY HELPED ME BETTER UNDERSTAND HOW  
9 WE COULD WORK TOGETHER. AND I WILL SAY, THIS HAS BEEN THE MOST  
10 EMPATHETIC PLAN I HAVE SEEN REALLY RECOGNIZING THE NEEDS OF  
11 EACH OF OUR REGIONS AND YOU KNOW THAT'S NOT JUST THE GOOD WORK  
12 OF POLICY AND ANALYSIS, IT'S ALSO PROBABLY GOOD WORK IN  
13 THERAPY. SO, THANK YOU FOR BEING THERE WITH ALL OF US.

14 [LAUGHTER]

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** CLERK, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON  
17 THIS ITEM? ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS?

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE DIDN'T RECEIVE ANYTHING IN  
20 WRITING ON THIS ITEM. BUT WE HAVE THREE PEOPLE IN THE  
21 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND TWO IN THE ZOOM SPACE. TWO  
22 MINUTES?

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MINUTE AND A HALF. KEEP IT MOVING ON.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** FIRST SPEAKER LAUREL PADGETT.

2

3 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** CAN YOU READ OFF THE SPEAKERS SO THEY CAN  
4 LINE UP.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** WARREN CUSHMAN FOLLOWED BY GREG  
7 RICHARDSON FOR AGENDA ITEM 5A.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. PUBLIC ADVOCATES VOICES FOR PUBLIC  
10 TRANSPORTATION. I APPRECIATE THE WORK OF SFMTA TO BRING THIS  
11 FORWARD AND FOR MEETING WITH US ON FRIDAY AT THE LAST MINUTE  
12 TO ANSWER QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW IT WOULD WORK. ECHO CONCERNS  
13 AROUND MAKING SURE THAT THERE IS FUNDING FOR TRANSFORMATION  
14 THAT ARE GOING TO RESONATE WITH VOTERS AND MAKE SURE THAT THE  
15 MEASURE SERVES THE NEEDS OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND IN  
16 THAT BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT OF MOBILITY AND  
17 ACCESS OF THE COMPONENT OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. I ALSO  
18 WANT TO EXPRESS CONCERNS AROUND THE FRAMEWORK OF PRIORITIZING  
19 REGIONAL RAIL OVER LOCAL BUS SERVICE ALSO RAISING EQUITY  
20 CONCERNS WITH ME AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE ANALYSIS TO MAKE  
21 SURE WE'RE GOING TO BE SERVING THE NEEDS OF LOW-INCOME AND  
22 COMMUNITIES OF COLOR WITH THE FUNDING AND NOT ENDING UP IN A  
23 SITUATION WHERE WE HAVE SERVICE CUTS ON LOCAL ROUTES WHILE  
24 CONTINUING TO SERVE COMMUTERS. LOOKS LIKE WE'RE IN A POINT  
25 COMING UP HERE. SO, I WILL END THERE.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND AS WARREN MAKES HIS  
5 WAY UP, THE NEXT SPEAKER AFTER HIM WILL BE GREG RICHARDSON, IF  
6 YOU WOULD LIKE TO COME UP, AS WELL.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE, WARREN CUSHMAN  
9 COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING IN HAYWARD. I JUST  
10 WANT TO SAY THAT SUPPORTING PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND  
11 SENIORS IS VITAL IN OUR REGION AND I'M LOOKING FOR ANY MEASURE  
12 WHERE, WHATEVER WE'RE GOING TO END UP CALLING THIS, TO SUPPORT  
13 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND THAT INCLUDES PARATRANSIT, AND  
14 ALSO I'M VERY CONCERNED WITH THE IDEA OF THE AC TRANSIT PIECE,  
15 AND I HAPPY TO WE WILL FULLY FUND AC TRANSIT. THANK YOU VERY  
16 MUCH.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST BOARDROOM  
19 SPEAKER WILL BE GREG RICHARDSON. GREG GO AHEAD YOU HAVE A  
20 MINUTE AND 30 SECONDS.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS GREG  
23 RICHARDSON ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER AT CFO, SANTA CLARA  
24 VALIDITY TRANSPORTATION AUTHOR. MAIN POINTS I WOULD LIKE TO  
25 BRING FORWARD, OUR SUCCESS AND SUCCESS OF REGIONAL PARTNERS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ARE SUCCESSFUL TO THE CONCEPT OF REGIONAL CONNECTIVITY. EACH  
2 PLAYING A RESULT IN CRITICAL NEEDS ENSURING FUTURE SUCCESS AND  
3 VTA RECOGNIZES THE ROLE SANTA CLARA COUNTY MUST PLAY IN  
4 SOLVING FISCAL DEMANDS FACED BY US AND REGIONAL PARTNERS.  
5 SECOND, ANY DISCUSSION AS TO TYPE AND LENGTH OF A MEASURE  
6 WOULD GREATLY INFORM VOTER FEEDBACK. VTA BELIEVES THE BEST  
7 PATH TO THE SUCCESS OF THE REGION AND THE 30 YEAR SALES TAX  
8 MEASURE FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS PROVIDING NECESSARY SHORT-  
9 TERM RELIEF DEDICATED FUNDING SOURCE PROVIDES CERTAINTY FOR  
10 OPERATORS. FOR VTA AND OTHERS SHORT-TERM MEASURE CREATES  
11 GREATER RISK CERTAIN MEASURES NEEDING RENEWAL WILL NOT  
12 SUCCEED. A 30 YEAR MEASURE WILL ELIMINATE THAT CONCERN FOR VTA  
13 AND PERHAPS IMPORTANTLY 30 YEAR MEASURE CREATES OPPORTUNITY  
14 FOR VTA TO PROVIDE SUPPORT TO REGIONAL PARTNERS IN FIRST 8 TO  
15 10 YEARS TO ADDRESS CRITICAL CONCERNS WHILE ENSURING NECESSARY  
16 SUPPORT TO THE PEOPLE OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY. QUICK TAKEAWAY,  
17 VTA WANTS AND NEEDS ITS REGIONAL PARTNERS TO SUCCEED AND  
18 BELIEVES A 30 YEAR SALES TAX MEASURE PROVIDES BEST OPPORTUNITY  
19 TO PROVIDE MEANINGFUL RELIEF TO PARTNERS.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** TIME PLEASE --

22

23 **SPEAKER:** IN THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY. THANK YOU.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MOVING TO OUR ZOOM  
2 CALLERS. FIRST SPEAKER WILL BE ALETA DUPREE FOLLOWED BY  
3 ANTHONY CAMPAGNA. YOU HAVE A MINUTE AND A HALF.

4  
5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR JIM SPERING AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
6 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. THANK YOU  
7 FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT'S VERY MEANINGFUL AND CREDIBLE  
8 INFORMATION. I'M IN SUPPORT OF THE PARCEL TAX IDEA. IT'S  
9 REALLY IN YOUR MEETINGS THAT I HAVE LEARNED A LOT ABOUT PARCEL  
10 TAXES, ESPECIALLY PARCEL TAXES COMPARED TO PROPERTY TAXES. AND  
11 A PARCEL TAX IS PRETTY CLEAR AND SIMPLE. BASED ON SQUARE  
12 FOOTAGE. SO, THAT, I HOPE, THE PUBLIC WILL EASILY UNDERSTAND.  
13 HAVE TO SELL IT TO RENTERS. CERTAINLY THEY'RE PAYING INTO THAT  
14 THROUGH THEIR RENT. IT'S BROAD BASED. WHICH ANY, WHAT I CALL  
15 NON-EXEMPT PROPERTY, WOULD BE SUBJECT TO IT I THINK A MEASURE  
16 LIKE THIS HAS TO BE AT LEAST TEN YEARS. BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT  
17 TO HAVE TO BE REVISITING THIS ON A FREQUENT BASIS. WE DON'T  
18 KNOW WHAT THE FUTURE WILL HOLD, BUT THIS WILL BUY US SOME TIME  
19 AS WE LOOK TOWARD HOPEFULLY FARE REVENUE WILL RISE AND OTHER  
20 STREAMS OF FUNDING WILL COME ALONG. SO, I THINK THIS IS  
21 REASONABLE. AND IT DOES EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF THE  
22 REGION. WE DON'T WANT TO BUILD SILOS WITH THIS FUNDING BUT  
23 EMPHASIZE THIS IS AN ENTER CONNECTED SYSTEM AND  
24 [INDISCERNIBLE] DISTRIBUTION.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** TIME. NEXT UP WE'LL HAVE HOWARD  
2 WONG.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I AM CALLING IN SUPPORT I BELIEVE THE  
5 OPERATOR I HOPE THE COMMITTEE WILL ADVANCE IT TO MTC AND THIS  
6 TENDS TO HAVE MORE FOCUS ON OPERATIONS RATHER THAN CAPITAL.  
7 THE CONCERNS THERE APPEARS TO BE 700 MILLION IN THIS FOR  
8 SILICON VALLEY BART OPERATION IS SOMETHING WE CAN ALL SUPPORT  
9 IT'S EFFICIENT IT HAS A CLEAR OUTCOME BUT THE SILICON VALLEY  
10 BART PROJECT IS ALBATROSS OF COST MANAGEMENT THAT CAN BRING  
11 THIS MEASURE DOWN. I HOPE THIS STAYS IN OPERATION MEASURES,  
12 FUND EVERYBODY ALL AGENCIES REGARDLESS OF SHORT FALL THERE IS  
13 A LOT OF AGENCIES THAT DON'T HAVE SHORTFALL THAT NEED SERVICE  
14 REGARDLESS I THINK THAT SHOULD BE THE FOCUS OF THIS MEASURE  
15 PLEASE MOVE FORWARD THIS MTA OPERATOR FORWARD SCENARIO.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. HOWARD WONG FOLLOWED BY  
18 WINDY K.

19

20 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG. THE REGIONAL PROGRAM SHOULD BE MORE  
21 OF A REGIONAL VISION MORE THAN TRANSIT STATUS WE NEED TO  
22 INSPIRE VOTERS AND CITIZENS THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTIES. SOME  
23 COMPONENTS OF THE VISION, ONE, TIE FUNDING TO SIGNIFICANT NEW  
24 RIDERSHIP. TWO, TIE FUNDING TO GROWTH OF REGIONAL TRANSIT MODE  
25 SHARE. THREE, TIE FUNDING TO GROWTH OF REGIONAL MOBILITY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OPTIONS. [INDISCERNIBLE] DECREASE WITH MOBILITY COST AND  
2 TRAFFIC CONGESTION. FOUR, TIE FUNDING TO VISION OF TRANSIT  
3 TRANSFORMATION OF WORLD CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM, PROVIDING CASE  
4 STUDIES, LIKE ZURICH SWITZERLAND. AND FIVE TIE ALL OF THESE TO  
5 INDEPENDENT AUDITS FOR COMPLIANCE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS  
8 WENDI KALLINS FOLLOWED BY BRIAN CULBERTSON.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS FROM SUSTAINABLE MARIN  
11 MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR MTC. COUPLE OF  
12 CONCERNS I HAVE, ONE ECHOING MANY OF THE OTHER SPEAKERS ABOUT  
13 THE NEED FOR TRANSFORMATION. THE ABILITY TO HAVE A SUSTAINED  
14 AND EFFICIENT NETWORK BETWEEN AGENCIES SO THAT THERE'S A  
15 SMOOTH RIDE FOR PEOPLE. MOST IMPORTANT BEING FOR MARIN COUNTY.  
16 NORTH BAY REALLY NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE OVERALL PICTURE. WE  
17 DON'T JUST STAY WITHIN OUR COUNTIES, WE NEED COMMUTING OPTION  
18 TO THE EAST BAY. WE NEED -- GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT OF COURSE HAS  
19 ITS OWN FISCAL CLIFF THEY'RE FACING. I REALIZE THEY HAVE A  
20 FUNDING SOURCE THAT NOBODY ELSE HAS BUT THERE IS STILL A GREAT  
21 NEED AND OF COURSE COMMUTING IN BETWEEN SONOMA COUNTY, MARIN  
22 COUNTY, AND SOLANO COUNTY IS ALSO A MAJOR CORRIDOR ON HIGHWAY  
23 37 THAT NEEDS IMPROVED TRANSIT. SO, THERE IS A LOT OF NEEDS  
24 THAT ARE REGIONAL. WE CAN'T JUST GO ON OUR OWN. WE NEED TO BE  
25 PART OF THE LARGER PICTURE. THANK YOU.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS  
3 BRIAN CULBERTSON FOLLOWED BY GABRIELA ORANTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS BRIAN CULBERTSON FULL-TIME TRANSIT  
6 RIDER IN OAKLAND. COMMENTING TO SAY THANK YOU FOR CONSIDERING  
7 A MEASURE THAT HAS A BURIED RATES BY COUNTY DEFINITELY HELPS  
8 BECAUSE SAN FRANCISCO HAS HIGHEST NEED AND HAD LOW FUNDING  
9 BEFOREHAND AND THIS DEFINITELY HELPS ADJUST THAT FOR WHAT THE  
10 CORRECT ELEMENTS ARE SO THAT'S A GOOD PART OF THE PLAN. I'M  
11 DISAPPOINTED THAT PAYROLL IS NOT PART OF THIS OPTION. A  
12 PAYROLL TAX WOULD ALLOW US TO ADD A MORE TRANSFORMATIONAL  
13 ELEMENT TO THIS PLAN. WE'RE NOT FULLY COVERING OPERATOR  
14 SHORTFALL. SO SOME -- [ AUDIO DISTORTION ] SO, IT WOULD BE --  
15 AN ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCE LIKE PAYROLL WAS CONSIDERED SOME  
16 OF THE COUNTIES COULD ADD TO IF THAT I WANTED TO ADD A  
17 TRANSFORMATIONAL COMPONENT. WHY THIS IS IMPORTANT, FOR  
18 EXAMPLE, BART IS THE MOST EFFICIENT TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE  
19 NATION AND HAS ABOVE AVERAGE FARE RECOVERY. SO, THEY'RE  
20 ALREADY IN THAT POSITION OF NOT BEING ABLE TO CUT ANYMORE  
21 SERVICE. SO, WE NEED TO BE LOOKING AT HOW TO EXPAND SERVICE BY  
22 PROVIDING MORE FUNDING FOR THE REGION, LIKE NEW YORK CITY.

23

24 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT GABRIELA ORANTES,  
25 FOLLOWED BY VALERIE LANCY.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS GABRIELA ORANTES, I'M A  
3 MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR MTC AND ALSO WORK  
4 FOR NORTH BAY ORGANIZING PROJECT IN SONOMA COUNTY. THANK YOU  
5 SPECIAL COMMITTEE MEMBERS FOR YOUR TIME AND DEDICATION TO  
6 POTENTIAL SCENARIOS AND SOLUTIONS FOR THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT  
7 OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCY ECOSYSTEM IS FACING. SPEAKING IN  
8 SUPPORT OF A TRANSIT MEASURE THAT WILL BE A SOLUTION FOR ALL  
9 BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERS A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT TAKES INTO  
10 ACCOUNT LOCAL CONDITIONS ESPECIALLY CONSIDERING THAT THE NORTH  
11 BAY WILL BE POTENTIALLY LOOKING AT SMART SALES TAX IN 2026.  
12 BEING THAT WE ARE HOME TO MANY COMMUTERS, AS STATED, IT WOULD  
13 BE IN ALL OF OUR INTEREST TO ENSURE THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT BE  
14 MORE ACCESSIBLE, MORE FREQUENT, AND AFFORDABLE FOR ALL. WE  
15 HAVE BEEN SEEING LANE EXPANSION FOR WHAT SEEMS LIKE DECADES  
16 NOW AND TRAFFIC CONTINUES TO BE A REALITY IN THE NOVATO  
17 NARROWS, COTATI GRADE AREAS WHERE THERE ARE THREE OR MORE  
18 LANES LIKE THE STRAWBERRY AREA, INYO VALLEY, LUCKY DRIVE,  
19 CIVIC CENTER GRADE ARE ALL EXAMPLES OF THIS AND WE STILL HAVE  
20 SO MUCH TRAFFIC. FOR THAT REASON I DO NOT SUPPORT A MEASURE  
21 THAT WOULD EXPAND HIGHWAYS. INSTEAD I WANT TO SEE A MEASURE  
22 THAT SUPPORTS CARBON NEUTRAL PROJECTS AND SUPPORTS THE  
23 PRIORITY OF UNION JOB RETENTION AND KEEPING CONSOLIDATION OF  
24 TRANSIT AGENCIES OUTSIDE OF THIS PROCESS. THE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** TIME.

2

3 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** TIME PLEASE.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. HOW MANY MORE SPEAKERS DO WE  
6 HAVE.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** TWO.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** NEXT VALERIE LANCY FOLLOWED BY LAST  
13 RAISED HAND JT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING BOARD. THIS IS MY FIRST TIME ATTENDING  
16 ONE OF THESE MEETINGS BECAUSE LIKE MANY PEOPLE WHO RELY ON  
17 TRANSIT I HAVE A JOB AND IT'S HARD TO SHOW UP FOR GOVERNMENT  
18 ZOOMS DURING A WORK DAY. WHAT I HAVE SEEN FROM THIS COMMITTEE,  
19 THE PRESENTATION FROM JONATHON HAD A COMPEL OPTION AVAILABLE  
20 IT SEEMED LIKE THE COMMITTEE HAS BEEN ERRING CONSERVATIVELY  
21 AND MINIMALLY WITH THE OPTIONS PRESENTED. I WOULD REMIND THE  
22 COMMITTEE THAT THE COMPELLING DIVISION IS EASIER TO GET  
23 VOTERS, ESPECIALLY IN MULTI-COUNTY SCENARIO LIKE SAN FRANCISCO  
24 WITH A FAIRLY TRANSIT DEPENDENT AREA. DON'T NECESSARILY VOTE  
25 JUST BASED ON SMALLEST TAX MEASURE AVAILABLE. REMEMBER PEOPLE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DITCH TRANSIT WHEN TRANSIT BECOMES HARDER TO TAKE, AND IT'S  
2 HARDER TO WIN RIDERS BACK IN THE FUTURE. THE BETTER WE BRIDGE  
3 THIS GAP, THE BETTER. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND THEN LAST ZOOM SPEAKER WILL BE  
6 JT MAC.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. MAK WITH NPH WE REPRESENT NON-PROFIT  
9 AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS ACROSS THE NINE COUNTIES.  
10 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITIONS.  
11 TRANSIT DEPENDENT HOUSING SECURE ARE THE SAME BAY AREA  
12 RESIDENTS. WE NEED TO SERVE REPORTS MOST IN NEED SUPPORTIVE OF  
13 THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AND RECOGNIZE NEED FOR BOTH  
14 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING MEASURE OVER THE NEXT FEW  
15 YEARS. WE NEED TO FIND A VIABLE PATH FOR BOTH TO WORK AND WANT  
16 TO ENSURE MEASURES ARE NOT IN COMPETITION REGARDING TIMING AND  
17 REVENUE SOURCE BY STAYING IN COMMUNICATION. RECOGNIZING  
18 REMOVAL OF RM4 FROM THE BALLOT REQUIRES RECALIBRATION TO  
19 ENSURE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION NEEDS ARE MET FOR THE  
20 REGION. WE WILL KNOW A LOT MORE ABOUT THE PATH FORWARD FOR  
21 HOUSING IN THE NEXT MONTH. ENGAGEMENT IN THE LEGISLATIVE  
22 PROCESS TO ENSURE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF SILOING  
23 DISCUSSIONS. CALLING FOR PROCESS TO WORK TOGETHER TO FIGURE  
24 OUT A VIABLE PATH FOR BOTH. THANK YOU.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. CHAIR, WE DO HAVE ONE  
2 FINAL RAISED HAND.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THIS WILL BE THE LAST SPEAKER.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** SHERIDAN, YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE AND  
7 30 SECONDS. AND THEIR HAND IS DOWN. THIS CONCLUDES PUBLIC  
8 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, LET'S MOVE ON TO ITEM 4D, THIS  
11 IS THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SCENARIO. I WANT TO TURN  
12 IT OVER TO STUART COHEN, SC STRATEGIES TO INTRODUCE THIS ITEM.  
13 BUT FIRST I THOUGHT WE WOULD HAVE A REALITY CHECK. AND AS  
14 JONATHON SAID, THE MOOD OF THE VOTERS. I WANTED TO MENTION  
15 THIS LAST FRIDAY BART SHARED POLL RESULTS THAT WILL BE  
16 DISCUSSED AT THEIR BOARD MEETING THIS WEEK. THE RESULTS ARE A  
17 REMINDER OF THE CHALLENGE BEFORE US. BART POLLED HALF CENT  
18 SALES TAX IN THE FIVE COUNTIES THAT HAVE BART SERVICE ALONG  
19 WITH A \$524 PARCEL TAX. THE BALLOT QUESTION ASKED ABOUT  
20 SUPPORT FOR BART TRANSIT SYSTEMS FOR ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA SAN  
21 FRANCISCO SAN MATEO SANTA CLARA COUNTIES POLL DIDN'T FORCE  
22 ANSWER AND 5 TO 10% OF RESPONDENTS UNDECIDED AND SALES TAX  
23 RECEIVED 51% SUPPORT WHILE PARCEL TAX WAS SUPPORTED BY 32%.  
24 THERE IS NUANCE TO POLLING AND I URGE YOU TO TUNE INTO THE  
25 BART MEETING PACKET. GET A COPY OF THE POLL IT'S VERY TELLING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE FACING IN THE FUTURE AND REFLECTS THE  
2 MOOD OF THE VOTERS RIGHT NOW AND WHETHER THEY THINK WE'RE  
3 GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. WITH THAT STEWARD I'LL ASK TO  
4 YOU INTRODUCE THE NEXT ITEM.

5

6 **STUART COHEN:** THAT UPBEAT ASSESSMENT. ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE GOT  
7 OUR WORK CUT OUT FOR US AND I'M GOING TO GO OVER MODIFICATIONS  
8 TO THE SCENARIOS IN SEPTEMBER AND THEN DURING THIS  
9 PRESENTATION, MELANIE CHOY, DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL NETWORK  
10 MANAGEMENT, WILL GO IN-DEPTH ON THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
11 PORTION. AND LET'S START BY LOOKING AT THE TIMELINE FOR  
12 DEVELOPING, ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR THE REVENUE MEASURE. NEXT  
13 SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO START BY DRAWING YOUR ATTENTION TO THE  
14 RED DOT ON THE LOW RIGHT. THIS IS OUR TARGET FOR WHEN  
15 LEGISLATION MUST PASS BY MID-SEPTEMBER 2025. WE HAVE GOT LESS  
16 THAN 11 MONTHS TO COME TOGETHER AROUND A MEASURE. THE GOVERNOR  
17 WOULD THEN HAVE 30 DAYS WITHIN WHICH TO SIGN IT. NOW, IDEALLY,  
18 THE REGION HAS COLEAD AROUND A DETAILED FRAMEWORK, REVENUE  
19 SOURCE, EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK. A FEW MONTHS BEFORE THIS. AND  
20 DOING SO WOULDN'T JUST INCREASE THE CHANCE THAT THE MEASURE  
21 PASSES THE LEGISLATURE, IT WOULD ALLOW STAKEHOLDERS THAT MAY  
22 BE CONSIDERING A CITIZEN INITIATIVE TO START PLANNING FOR IT  
23 LET'S TAKE A LOOK AT THE REMAINDER OF THE YEAR. AFTER TODAY  
24 WE'RE IN THE UPPER LEFT DOT THERE, OCTOBER 21ST. WE'LL BE  
25 CONSIDERING THESE RATINGS TODAY ON THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENTS





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OF DIFFERENT COMPONENTS. WE'LL ALSO HAVE SOME RESOLUTIONS AND  
2 THOSE WILL BE COMPILED AND THE NEXT STEP WILL BE FORWARDING TO  
3 THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE JOINT MTC ABAG COMMITTEE THAT MEETS  
4 NOVEMBER 8TH. THEN MTC WILL HAVE A SPECIAL MEETING ON DECEMBER  
5 9TH AT 2:00 P.M. THIS WILL BE AN IMPORTANT TIME TO START  
6 NARROWING DOWN THE OPTIONS. POLLING FROM MTC, AC TRANSIT, AND  
7 CALTRAIN, YOU CAN SEE ON THAT BOTTOM ROW, THAT WILL START  
8 COMING IN, IN OF IT IN DECEMBER, SOME OF IT IN JANUARY. SO, AS  
9 WE ABSORB THIS INFORMATION, IT'S QUITE POSSIBLE THAT THERE  
10 WON'T BE JUST ONE SCENARIO MOVING FORWARD AFTER DECEMBER 9TH.  
11 THERE STILL MIGHT BE SOME OPTIONS. BUT AS NEW INFORMATION  
12 COMES IN FROM ONGOING STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND THESE KIND OF  
13 CONVERSATIONS, DISCUSSIONS WITH LEGISLATORS AND THE POLLING,  
14 WE'LL REALLY NEED TO BE NARROWING DOWN IN EARLY 2025 SO THAT  
15 LEGISLATION CAN BE INTRODUCED. I ALSO JUST WANT TO POINT OUT  
16 THE VERY UPPER BLUE LINE THERE. IF SCENARIO ONE IS STILL A  
17 POSSIBILITY IN LATE DECEMBER AND JANUARY, THEN SANTA CLARA --  
18 OR NORTH BAY COUNTIES WOULD START DELIBERATIONS ON WHETHER TO  
19 OPT IN. IDEALLY, THAT DECISION OF OPTING THIS IS MADE BY THE  
20 FIRST LEGISLATIVE POLICY COMMITTEE HEARING A MEETING WHICH  
21 WOULD BE IN LATE FEBRUARY BUT NO LATER THAN THE FIRST POLICY  
22 COMMITTEE HEARING ON THE BILL AND THAT PROBABLY LIKELY IN  
23 APRIL. SO, WITH THAT TIMELINE, LET'S TAKE A LOOK AT THE  
24 SCENARIOS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ON THE LEFT, YOU WILL SEE WHAT  
25 WE HAVE REVIEWED IN SEPTEMBER. THIS INCLUDES SCENARIO ONE,



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WHICH LASTS FOR 30 YEARS, AS WELL AS A HYBRID SCENARIO THAT  
2 WAS FUNDED BY A PAYROLL TAX PLUS SALES TAX. ON THE RIGHT ON  
3 THE NEW VARIATIONS WE'LL LOOK AT TODAY THIS INCLUDES A 10-YEAR  
4 VERSION OF SCENARIO ONE. IN ADDITION WE'RE ADDING A VERSION OF  
5 HYBRID THAT HAS A PARCEL TAX AND WE'LL GET INTO MORE DETAIL  
6 ABOUT ALL OF THESE. NEXT SLIDE. BUT WE WANT TO START WITH  
7 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. WE HEARD FROM SOME OF THE SPEAKERS AND  
8 SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS TODAY HOW IMPORTANT THAT IS, BOTH TO  
9 IMPROVE TRANSIT AND TO APPEAL TO VOTERS FOR THIS MEASURE. AND  
10 ACROSS ALL OF THE MTC SCENARIOS, WE ARE STILL PROPOSING 10% OF  
11 THE FUNDS GENERATED BY THE SALES TAX ARE INVESTED INTO TRANSIT  
12 TRANSFORMATION. BUT BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM YOU AND FROM THE  
13 AGENCIES, WE ARE COMING UP WITH A PROPOSAL THAT COMMITS HALF  
14 OF THE TRANSFORMATION FUNDS TO LOCAL PRIORITIES WITH EACH  
15 COUNTY BENEFITTING A PROPORTION OF THE SHARE OF SALES TAX  
16 GENERATED. THERE ARE VARIOUS WAYS TO STRUCTURE THIS. WE WOULD  
17 LIKE YOUR FEEDBACK ON THOSE THAT WILL BE AN AREA OF MORE  
18 DISCUSSION. PEOPLE HAVE ASKED HOW THIS HELPED MILLION DOLLARS  
19 PER YEAR MIGHT BE INVESTED THAT WOULD BE AT THE NINE CAN'T  
20 LEVEL, 100 MILLION TO TRANSFORM THE USER EXPERIENCE. AND HERE  
21 TO ANSWER THAT IS NONE OTHER THAN THE FIRST EVER DIRECTOR OF  
22 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. MELANIE CHOY.

23

24 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU STUART. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WHAT WE  
25 HAVE DEVELOPED IS A SET OF PROPOSED TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 INVESTMENTS AND THESE ARE GROUPED IN THE FOUR KEY AREAS. IN  
2 THE NEXT SEVERAL SLIDES I'LL HIGHLIGHT EACH OF THESE FOUR  
3 AREAS. IMPORTANTLY EACH INITIATIVE REPRESENTS A BUILDING BLOCK  
4 TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND ALSO THE SUITE OF  
5 INITIATIVES WORK IN TANDEM TO CREATE A COORDINATE THE CUSTOMER  
6 CENTRIC EXPERIENCE FOR RIDERS. WHILE I'M HERE BEFORE YOU TODAY  
7 PRESENTING THIS, THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE PROGRAMS HAS  
8 REALLY BEEN A COLLABORATIVE EFFORT AND THE COLLECTIVE WORK OF  
9 THE RNM IS A SHARED RESPONSIBILITY AND REALLY DEPENDENT ON  
10 MTC'S COPARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND NOT ONLY ARE  
11 LEVERAGING THE EXPERTISE AND STAFF RESOURCES IN THIS  
12 PARTNERSHIP AND ALL SIDES OF THE TABLE, BUT THIS ALSO BRINGS  
13 IN DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES AND IDEAS EARLY ON IN THE PROCESS.  
14 AND JUST NOT EARLY ON, BUT THROUGHOUT THE PROJECTS THEMSELVES.  
15 IN THE END OUR PROGRAMS ARE BETTER AND STRONGER FOR THIS. ON  
16 THIS SLIDE WE'RE FOCUSING ON TRANSIT FARES. FIRST KEY  
17 INITIATIVE IS FOCUSED ON PAYING FOR TRANSIT -- PAYING FOR  
18 TRANSIT SIMPLER AND MORE AFFORDABLE. LOOKING TO REMOVE A  
19 POTENTIAL BARRIER FOR CHOOSE ONE'S TRANSIT JOURNEY IN THE  
20 CLIPPER BAY PASS, FIRST ALL OPERATOR ALL YOU CAN USE TRANSIT  
21 PASS TO EMPLOYERS AND CONSTITUTIONS CURRENT DATA INDICATES  
22 CLIPPER BAY PASS RIDERS TAKE 40% MORE TRIPS THAN THOSE WHO DO  
23 NOT HAVE A CLIPPER BAY PASS. IN THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM  
24 WE'RE FINDING IT'S OUR INCOME-BASED TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNT  
25 PROGRAM. WITH WE'RE FINDING IN THIS PROGRAM BASED ON RESPONSE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OF CLIPPER START USERS IS THAT 64% OF THESE CLIPPER START  
2 RIDER USING CLIPPER START ARE TAKING MORE TRANSIT TRIPS.  
3 LOOKING FORWARD TO NEXT YEAR LAUNCHING THE NEXT GENERATION  
4 CLIPPER SYSTEM WE'LL BE ROLLING OUT A TRANSFER DISCOUNT  
5 PROGRAM. WHERE USERS WILL RECEIVE A FREE OR DISCOUNTED FARE ON  
6 TRANSFERRING FROM ONE SYSTEM TO ANOTHER SYSTEM. LESS COSTLY  
7 FOR THE RIDER TO TAKE TWO SYSTEMS TO GET TO A DESTINATION.  
8 LASTLY IN TERMS OF LOOKING FORWARD BEGINNING A STUDY THAT WILL  
9 LOOK AT COMMON FARE STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL RAIL PROGRAMS --  
10 SYSTEMS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE SECOND INITIATIVE WE HAVE  
11 UNDERWAY IS THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT  
12 FOCUSES ON MAKING IT EASIER FOR RIDERS TO NAVIGATE AROUND THE  
13 BAY AREA USING PUBLIC TRANSIT CONNECTING SERVICES. ENTAILS  
14 REGIONAL DEPLOYMENT OF HARMONIZED VISUAL IDENTITY NAVIGATION  
15 STANDARDS AT RAIL STATION FERRY TERMINALS AND BUS STOPS AND  
16 HUBS AROUND THE BAY AREA THE TEAM UNVEILED UNIFIED VISION OF  
17 TRANSIT SIGNAGE, WE'RE LOOKING AT VISITORS TO SHARE THOUGHTS  
18 ABOUT OUR SIGNAGE AT TEST LOCATIONS IN SANTA ROSA AND EL  
19 CERRITO DEL NORTE STATION. WE HAVE A SMALLER SCALE TEST  
20 STATION AT POWELL STREET STATION. IN BEGINNING 2025 WE PLAN TO  
21 CONTINUE INSTALLATION OF THESE TEST PILOT REFINING LOCATIONS  
22 AT A TOTAL OF NINE PILOT TRANSIT HUB LOCATIONS. INCLUDED IN  
23 THIS WORK IS END TO END JOURNEY SIGNAGE INSTALLATIONS IN  
24 SONOMA AND SOLANO COUNTIES. NEXT SLIDE. THIRD AREA WE HAVE  
25 HIGHLIGHTED IN OUR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS TRANSIT PRIORITY.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BASED ON FEEDBACK TO OPERATORS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT  
2 ISSUES FOR RIDERS IS HAVING FAST AND RELIABLE SERVICE. TRANSIT  
3 PRIORITY INVESTMENTS ARE AIMED AT DOING THAT. GETTING BUSES  
4 OUT OF TRAFFIC TO MOVE MORE PEOPLE AND REDUCE TRANSIT  
5 OPERATING COST DUE TO TRAVEL TIME DELAYS. THIS IS NOT A NEW  
6 CONCEPT AND THE REGION HAS A LONG HISTORY OF INVESTING IN  
7 THIS. WE HAVE INVESTED PLANNING, POLICY SUPPORT, FUNDING  
8 PROGRAMS, TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, AND, ALSO, DELIVERING PROJECTS  
9 SUCH AS THE INITIATIVES IN THE KEY BRIDGE CORRIDORS, THE  
10 COMMUTE INITIATIVES, FORWARD COMMUTE INITIATIVES. BUT THERE IS  
11 STILL A LOT MORE TO DO. SO TO GIVE YOU A SENSE OF THE WIDE  
12 RANGE OF TRANSIT PRIORITY INVESTMENTS WE COULD MAKE WITH THIS  
13 INVESTMENT AND IN ROUGH ORDER OF MAGNITUDE SHOWCASE THREE  
14 CATEGORIES 50 CATEGORY IS SMALLER HOTSPOT TREATMENTS THAT COST  
15 \$500,000 PER MILE AND TAKE A COUPLE OF YEARS TO COMPLETE.  
16 SECOND CATEGORY IS CORRIDOR WIDE IMPROVEMENTS THAT INCLUDES  
17 TRANSIT SUPPORTIVE ELEMENTS RED LANES CUBE OUTS JUMP LANES  
18 OPTIMIZED BUS STOP STATIONS SIGNALIZATION PRIORITIZATION  
19 UPGRADES AND THIS LEVEL OF BUS TRANSIT PRIORITY TREATMENTS IS  
20 10 MILLION PER MILE AND CAN TAKE AROUND FOUR YEARS. THIRD  
21 CATEGORY DEDICATED BRT LANE WHERE BUSES HAVE DEDICATED RIGHT  
22 OF WAY PROJECTS IN THIS CATEGORY, THE LARGEST CATEGORY COST  
23 APPROXIMATELY 20 PLUS MILLION DOLLARS PER MILE AND GENERALLY  
24 TAKES OVER TEN YEARS TO DELIVER. NEXT SLIDE. LAST CATEGORY  
25 ACCESSIBILITY, ACCESSIBILITY AND MOBILITY ARE EMBEDDED IN THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 INITIATIVES IN THE ACTION PLAN THIS KEY AREA FOCUSES ON  
2 ACTIONS TO IMPROVE TRANSPORTATION ACCESS FOR PEOPLE WITH  
3 DISABILITIES, OLDER ADULTS AND THOSE WITH LOW-INCOMES AND  
4 GIVES THEM THE FREEDOM TO GET AROUND THE REGION INDEPENDENTLY.  
5 WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING ON PILOTING ONE SEE THE RIDES FOR  
6 PARATRANSIT USER WHICH IS REDUCES NEED TO TRANSFER BETWEEN  
7 PARATRANSIT VEHICLES ALSO LOOKING AT STANDARDIZING PRACTICES  
8 AROUND PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY WHICH INCLUDES THINGS LIKE  
9 APPLICATION FORMS PROCESSES ON APPLYING THE APPEALS PROCESS  
10 AND LASTLY SUPPORTING INTEGRATION OF PARATRANSIT WITH NEXT  
11 GENERATION OF CLIPPER SO RIDERS CAN PAY FOR PARATRANSIT  
12 THROUGH CLIPPER. IN THE FUTURE WE PLAN TO TACKLE TWO PROGRAMS  
13 WITHIN THIS CATEGORY MOBILITY MANAGEMENT WHICH IS FOCUSED ON  
14 HELPING COORDINATE RIDES AND NAVIGATE TRAVEL JOURNEYS. SECOND  
15 PROGRAM LOOKING FORWARD, LOOKING AT OTHER WAYS TO IMPROVE  
16 PARATRANSIT SERVICE. SO WE'RE JUST IN THE BEGINNING STAGES OF  
17 UNDER TAKING THIS IMPORTANT WORK AND WE'RE EXCITED TO ENGAGE  
18 WITH THE COMMUNITY ON THESE EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO  
19 STUART INDICATED WE HAVE DEVELOPED AN ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLE OF  
20 HOW WE COULD SPREAD FUNDING ACROSS FOUR KEY TRANSFORMATION  
21 AREAS. WE USED A \$100 MILLION ANNUAL INVESTMENT OVER A FIVE-  
22 YEAR SNAPSHOT TOTALING 500 MILLION OVER THIS TIME PERIOD.  
23 FERRIES WITH SUSTAINED \$25 MILLION INVESTMENT WE COULD MAKE  
24 LONGER TERM COMMITMENTS TOWARDS SEVERAL PILOT PROGRAMS  
25 INCLUDES DISCOUNT TRANSFER PILOTS CONTINUATION OF THE CLIPPER



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 START PROGRAM AS WELL AS GROWING AND EXPANDING THE CLIPPER BAY  
2 PASS PROJECT. FUNDING IN THIS CATEGORY IS TO OFFSET REVENUE  
3 LOSSES FROM FARES AND IS REALLY DIRECTLY TOWARDS OPERATOR  
4 FARES. THE SECOND CATEGORY IS MAPPING AND WAYFINDING WITH \$20  
5 MILLION INVESTMENT THIS WOULD ALLOW FOR REGION-WIDE DEPLOYMENT  
6 OF THE HARMONIZED VISUAL IDENTITY THAT YOU SAW EARLIER AT RAIL  
7 STATIONS, FOR TERMINALS, BUS STOPS AND HUBS AROUND THE BAY  
8 AREA. AROUND TRANSIT PRIORITY SUSTAINED \$40 MILLION ANNUAL  
9 INVESTMENT OVER FIVE YEARS COULD FURTHER IMPROVE TRANSIT  
10 SERVICE THIS LEVEL OF INVESTMENT COULD DELIVER THREE CORRIDOR  
11 WIDE BUS RELIABILITY PROJECTS SIMILAR TO SFMTA AND GEARY  
12 BOULEVARD AS WELL AS APPROXIMATELY 100 TARGETED HOTSPOT  
13 INVESTMENTS TO IMPROVE BUS RELIABILITY POINTS AROUND THE  
14 REGION. LAST CATEGORY SUSTAINED \$15 MILLION INVESTMENT IN  
15 ACCESSIBILITY COULD SUPPORT CONTINUED INVESTMENT IN THE ONE-  
16 SEAT RIDE PILOTS AND PROGRAMS ALSO SUPPORT OPERATION OF  
17 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT SERVICES AT THE COUNTY LEVEL. THIS IS A  
18 SNAPSHOT HOW YOU CAN SPEND INVESTMENTS AND WE ARE SEEKING YOUR  
19 FEEDBACK LATER TODAY.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? JUST WANT THE  
22 RECORD TO REFLECT THAT WE DO HAVE A QUORUM OF THE COMMISSION  
23 IT WAS ESTABLISHED AT 10:23 WITH THE ARRIVE OF COMMISSIONER  
24 PAPAN.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **STUART COHEN:** NOW ON TO THE SCENARIOS. THANK YOU MELANIE. AS A  
4 REMINDER HERE, SCENARIO ONE IS A 30-YEAR HALF CENT SALES TAX  
5 WITH FOUR COUNTIES IN THE BASELINE THESE ARE SHOWN IN BLUE.  
6 AND IT'S ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN MATEO.  
7 AND IT WOULD BE OPT IN FOR THE OTHER COUNTIES WITH REQUIRED  
8 10% CONTRIBUTION TO TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. IT ALSO WOULD HAVE  
9 TO FILL THE FUNDING GAPS FOR TRANSIT OPERATING FOR ANY  
10 OPERATORS THAT ARE IN THEIR COUNTY. AND THE REMAINDER FOR  
11 THOSE OPT IN COUNTIES WOULD BE FOR COUNTY FLEX FUNDS. WE HEARD  
12 MANY COMMENTS ESPECIALLY FROM COUNTIES WITH SALES TAX RENEWALS  
13 THAT ARE COMING UP TO CONSIDER A TEN YEAR MEASURE. WE  
14 DEVELOPED SCENARIO 1A. NEXT SLIDE. SO, LET'S QUICKLY REVIEW,  
15 THOUGH, BEFORE WE GET INTO 1A. BECAUSE IT'S A CONTINUATION OF  
16 THE SPENDING PLAN REALLY FOR SCENARIO ONE, WHICH IS SHOWN  
17 HERE. NOW, THIS IS A SPENDING PLAN FOR THE FOUR COUNTIES, AND  
18 IT HAS, THE BLUE LINE ON TOP, 10% FOR THE TRANSFORMATION  
19 PROGRAM. FOR THE FIRST EIGHT YEARS YOU CAN SEE THE GREEN LINE  
20 -- THE GREEN BOX, REALLY, THE REMAINING 90% OF THE FUNDS  
21 DURING THIS TIME, \$490 MILLION IS USED FOR TRANSIT OPERATING.  
22 AND WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR WITH THESE DOLLARS IS TO OFFSET THE  
23 PANDEMIC DRIVEN FARE LOSSES FOR THE OPERATORS IN THESE FOUR  
24 COUNTIES, INCLUDING BART, CALTRAIN, AC TRANSIT, AND MUNI. SO,  
25 WE CALL THIS SHORTFALL THE ADJUSTED FARE LOSS, SINCE IT WAS





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ADJUSTED SLIGHTLY TO ACCOUNT FOR INFLATION. SO FARE LOSS,  
2 SLIGHTLY ADJUSTED. AND TRANSIT FUNDING DECLINES, THEN AS YOU  
3 CAN SEE IN YEAR NINE. IT DOES THIS BECAUSE IT IS BASED ON A  
4 SALES TAX, AND SEVERAL COUNTIES HAVE SALES TAXES THAT START  
5 EXPIRING AROUND THAT TIME. AND THIS ALLOWS FOR FLEXIBLE COUNTY  
6 FUNDS TO START IN 2035. NOW, I'M JUST GOING TO REMIND YOU,  
7 BECAUSE WE CREATED THIS CONTINGENT APPROACH TOWARDS TRANSIT  
8 OPERATIONS AND YEARS 9 TO 15 IMPORTANT COMPONENT BECAUSE IT  
9 MEANS IT HAS A GOOD AMOUNT OF FUNDING FOR THE FIRST 15 YEARS  
10 AND IT GUARANTEES MINIMUM OF \$380 MILLION PER YEAR DURING  
11 YEARS 9 TO 15 AND THAT 380 WOULD COME FROM A COMBINATION.  
12 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AS WELL AS NEW NON-LOCAL  
13 FUNDING SOURCES SUCH AS FATE AND FEDERAL SOURCES. NOW HOW MUCH  
14 WOULD COME FROM THE MEASURE IS CONTINGENT ON THE AMOUNT FROM  
15 OUTSIDE SOURCES SO THE LIGHT GREEN BOX YOU SEE HAS FLEXIBILITY  
16 IN IT TO BE EITHER FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS OR COUNTY FLEX OR  
17 SOMEWHERE IN THE MIDDLE AND THE EASIEST WAY TO UNDERSTAND THIS  
18 IS WITH THE THREE EXAMPLES I GAVE LAST TIME. AND, SO, DURING  
19 THESE YEARS, 9 TO 15, IF THERE ARE NO NEW NON-LOCAL SOURCES OF  
20 FUNDS, THE MEASURE WOULD ALLOCATE 380 MILLION FOR TRANSIT  
21 OPERATIONS. IF 100 MILLION IS OBTAINED FROM OUTSIDE SOURCES,  
22 THE MEASURE WOULD ALLOCATE 280 MILLION TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE  
23 GETTING TO THAT TOTAL OF 380. IF SIGNIFICANT NEW NON-LOCAL  
24 FUNDS ARE OBTAINED, LET'S JUST SAY \$300 MILLION ARE OBTAINED  
25 FROM OUTSIDE SOURCES, THE MEASURE HAS THIS MINIMUM GUARANTEE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THAT IT WOULD PROVIDE AT LEAST 220 MILLION. SO IN THAT  
2 SCENARIO, A TOTAL OF 520 MILLION WOULD BE PROVIDED IN ANY  
3 GIVEN YEAR DURING YEARS 9 TO 15. SO, NOW ONE OF THE CONCERNS  
4 WITH THIS SCENARIO IS THAT MUNI WOULD STILL BE LEFT WITH A  
5 SIGNIFICANT GAP. MTC HAS COMMITTED AT AN EARLIER MEETING TO  
6 WORK WITH MTA TO FILL THIS GAP. BUT I ALSO WANTED MEMBERS TO  
7 KNOW THAT SOME OF THE INNOVATIVE IDEAS THAT YOU HEARD TODAY  
8 FROM MTA'S JONATHON REWERS, SUCH AS FRONT LOADING FUNDS  
9 THROUGH FINANCING OR BY HAVING SOME COUNTY RECEIVE MORE  
10 FUNDING EARLY WHILE OTHERS -- COUNTIES GET MORE LATER. COULD  
11 POTENTIALLY BE INTRODUCED INTO SCENARIO ONE TO HELP MUNI CLOSE  
12 THEIR NEAR-TERM GAP. NOW, IN YEARS 16 TO 30, 90% OF THE FUNDS  
13 THEN SHIFT TO COUNTY FLEX. YOU CAN SEE THAT IN THE GOLD  
14 COMPONENT TO THE RIGHT. THESE CAN BE SPENT ON ANY COUNTY  
15 PRIORITY IN THE ADOPTED, IN THEIR ADOPTED REGIONAL  
16 TRANSPORTATION PLAN, PLANNED BAY AREA. SO HAD TO SPENDING PLAN  
17 ACKNOWLEDGES, AS YOU CAN SEE ON THE LEFT SIDE, THE IMMEDIATE  
18 AND URGENT NEEDS TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT, AND ON THE RIGHT SIDE  
19 LONGER TERM NEEDS TO SUPPORT COUNTY PRIORITY, ESPECIALLY IF  
20 THEY DON'T RENEW THEIR SALES TAXES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, NOW OUR  
21 NEW SCENARIO 1A IS REALLY A TEN YEAR VERSION OF SCENARIO ONE.  
22 AND IT WOULD TAKE THE SPENDING PLAN THAT YOU SAW ON THE LEFT,  
23 YEARS 1 TO 8, AND IT WOULD EXTEND THOSE FOR ANOTHER TWO YEARS.  
24 SO IT WOULD BE VERY SIMPLE, VERY CLEAR TO EXPLAIN TO VOTERS.  
25 10% FOR TRANSFORMATION, 90% TO SUPPORT TRANSIT SERVICES THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ARE ON THE VERGE OF SERIOUS CUTS. THERE IS ANOTHER BIG CHANGE,  
2 THOUGH, GIVEN THE SHORTER TERM OF THE MEASURE TO FOCUS ON  
3 OFFSETTING THE FARE LOSS OF BART, CALTRAIN, AC TRANSIT, AND  
4 MUNI, WE'RE PROPOSING THAT ONLY SANTA CLARA WOULD HAVE THE  
5 OPPORTUNITY TO OPT IN. GOING TO TEN YEARS IS A BIG STEP, AND  
6 THERE ARE SOME CLEAR PROS AND CONS THAT I WANTED TO POINT OUT.  
7 NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS TEN YEAR MEASURE FOCUSED SOLELY ON URGENT  
8 TRANSIT NEEDS COULD, FIRST OF ALL, REDUCE CONFLICT WITH COUNTY  
9 SALES TAXES, AND THE RENEWALS OF THEM, THAT WOULDN'T FULLY  
10 ELIMINATE THAT CONFLICT AS THEY ARE ATTEMPTING RENEWALS DURING  
11 THIS PERIOD. SO MIGHT GO IN 2028, 2032, ET CETERA, IT WOULD  
12 CERTAINLY SIMPLIFY MESSAGING AND IT WOULD KEEP PRESSURE ON  
13 FINDING OTHER FUNDING SOLUTIONS OVER THE LONG RUN. BUT, WHICH  
14 WE SEE AS A POSITIVE, BUT A 10-YEAR MEASURE HAS LESS TIME FOR  
15 OPERATORS TO ADAPT TO A NEW BUSINESS MODEL. IT'S ALSO LESS  
16 OPPORTUNITY TO FUND OTHER TRANSPORTATION NEEDS WITH COUNTY  
17 FLEX, THINGS LIKE LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS AND BIKE PED  
18 INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH ARE BOTH NEEDED AND APPRECIATED BY THE  
19 VOTERS AND HAVING A SHORT MEASURE THAT FOCUSES ONLY ON PUBLIC  
20 TRANSIT MAY ALSO MAKE IT MORE DIFFICULT TO GARNER SUPPORT  
21 NECESSARY TO RUN AN EXPENSE AND I HAVE SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGN.  
22 NEXT SLIDE. NOW, MOVING ON TO THE HYBRID SCENARIO. THIS IS  
23 WHERE WE LEFT OFF IN SEPTEMBER, A PROPOSAL FOR A NINE COUNTY  
24 MEASURE THAT SEEKS TO SUSTAIN CURRENT SERVICE LEVELS BY  
25 FUNDING OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. I THINK, LIKE WITH THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MTA PROPOSAL IT DOESN'T GET FULLY THERE BUT GETS MOST OF THE  
2 WAY TO FUNDING THOSE. IT COMBINES HALF CENT SALES TAX WITH  
3 PAYROLL TAX ON \$0.18 OF EVERY \$100 OF PAYROLL. ONE CHANGE  
4 PROPOSED IS NOW INSTEAD OF 40% OF PAYROLL TAX OR 200 MILLION  
5 ANNUALLY GOING TOWARDS EMPLOYEE COMMUTE BENEFIT PROGRAM THAT  
6 FUNDING WOULD STAY TO GO TO COUNTY FLEX DISTRIBUTED TO AND  
7 PROPORTION TO PAYROLL TAX GENERATED. WE HEARD AT THE LAST  
8 MEETING PAYROLL TAX SHOULD NOT BE THE ONLY OPTION FOR HYBRID  
9 SINCE IT MAY FACE SIGNIFICANT FUNDED OPPOSITION. NEXT SLIDE.  
10 WE'RE NOW INCLUDING ANOTHER FUNDING OPTION WHICH WOULD RAISE  
11 FIVE HELPED MILLION DOLLARS PER YEAR THROUGH A \$0.09 PER  
12 BUILDING SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX THAT WOULD BE ADDED ON TO THE  
13 SALES TAX. PLAN WOULD BE THE SAME WITH THE PAYROLL OR PARCEL  
14 TAX. LET'S TAKE A LOOK AT THAT HERE. NEXT SLIDE. THAT PLAN IS  
15 ILLUSTRATED. HERE YOU CAN SEE THE 10% OF THE SALES TAX FOR  
16 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS STILL THERE ACROSS THE TOP. FOR  
17 TRANSIT, THE PARCEL OR PAYROLL TAX ADDS THIS LAYER OF LIGHT  
18 GREEN ALONG THE BOTTOM, REPRESENTING \$300 MILLION PER YEAR TO  
19 SCENARIO ONE FOR ALL 30 YEARS. THIS ALLOWS 90% OF OPERATOR  
20 SHORTFALLS TO BE FUNDED IN THOSE FIRST EIGHT YEARS AND 65% IN  
21 YEARS 9 TO 15. YOU COULD ALSO SEE THERE IS QUITE A BIT OF  
22 COUNTY FLEX, IT TOTALS 61% OF THIS MEASURE. AND FOR THE FIRST  
23 TIME THEN THE FOUR BASELINE COUNTIES WOULD BE GETTING SOME  
24 EXTRA COUNTY FLEX FROM THE VERY BEGINNING OF THE MEASURE. YOU  
25 CAN SEE THAT IN THE DARKER GOLD BANDS. THAT EQUALS 40% OF THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 PARCEL OR PAYROLL TAX, THAT COUNTY FLEX. SO, AS PART OF THE  
2 PACKET TODAY, WE INCLUDED A SCENARIO EXPLAINER DOCUMENT IT HAS  
3 AN APPENDIX WITH ALL OF THE DETAILS THAT ARE BROADLY BRUSHED  
4 HERE, BROKEN DOWN BY COUNTY AND TRANSIT OPERATOR. NEXT SLIDE.  
5 NOW, AS MENTIONED, YOU WILL SOON HAVE THE CHANCE TO RATE  
6 COMPONENTS OF THE MEASURES, ALONG GRADIENTS OF THE AGREEMENT.  
7 WE'LL HAVE THIS CHART AVAILABLE TO YOU AS WE GO THROUGH THESE  
8 QUESTIONS. AND AS YOU CAN SEE, IT IS A ONE FOR STRONGLY AGREE,  
9 TWO TO DEGREE WITH RESERVATION, THREE IS NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN,  
10 FOUR IS DISAGREE BUT WILL GO ALONG, AND FIVE IS STRONGLY  
11 DISAGREE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, BEFORE WE MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT, I  
12 WANTED TO ASK IF THERE ARE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. AFTER  
13 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS, WE'LL DO THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT, AS  
14 WELL AS CONSIDER A MOTION WITH COMPONENTS THAT SHOULD BE  
15 ADVANCED TO THE COMMISSION. BUT LET'S JUST START WITH THAT  
16 FIRST QUESTION RIGHT NOW, CLARIFYING QUESTIONS.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** OKAY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE ONE.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. A LOT OF INFORMATION. MELANIE, THANK  
23 YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION ON THE TRANSFORMATION TRANSIT THERE  
24 HAS BEEN A LOT OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT AND VERY LITTLE  
25 DESCRIPTION. SO, I APPRECIATE THE GOOD WORK THAT YOU'RE DOING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 IN MOVING THAT FORWARD. DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION. WE'LL  
2 SEE WHAT'S THERE AND WE'LL GO TO DISCUSSION. CINDY YOU HAVE  
3 YOUR HAND UP. WE'LL START WU.

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THE  
6 PRESENTATIONS. COULD YOU TALK A BIT ABOUT THE CURRENT --  
7 WHAT'S THE CURRENT BEEN FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND WHAT'S  
8 THE SOURCE OF FUNDS?

9

10 **MELANIE CHOY:** THE CURRENT BUDGET FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
11 IS, WE HAD -- WE HAD SOME FEDERAL FUNDS FROM ERP, SO WE HAVE  
12 ABOUT 85 MILLION FROM THAT, THAT WAS APPROVED AS THE INITIAL  
13 INFUSION OF FUNDS FOR THAT PROMPT ADDITIONALLY WHAT WE HAVE  
14 DONE SINCE THEN IS WE HAVE ADDED SOME OBAG THREE FUNDS TO THE  
15 PROGRAM SO AS WE PROCEED AND WORK ON THESE PROGRAMS, WHAT  
16 WE'RE TRYING TO DO IS LEVERAGE OTHER FUND SOURCES AND LOOK AT  
17 OTHER SOURCES TO INCREASE THE FUND SOURCES. AND, SO, I THINK  
18 IN TOTAL, CURRENTLY, WE HAVE ABOUT, I BELIEVE IT'S ABOUT 150  
19 MILLION INCLUDING THOSE OBAG THREE FUNDS, PLUS WE HAVE  
20 EXISTING FUNDS THAT SOME OF THE PROJECTS CAME IN WITH SOME  
21 FUNDING ON THE THIRD SOURCE THAT WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ACCESS  
22 IS OUR REAP FUNDS, REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLAN -- PROGRAM  
23 FUNDS, AND AS IS STATE FUNDING. SO WE HAVE PULLED IN SOME  
24 FUNDS TO DO THAT AND THAT IS REALLY FOCUSED ON THE TRANSFER  
25 PROGRAM DISCOUNT PROGRAM.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND IS -- AND I APOLOGIZE, I PROBABLY SHOULD  
3 HAVE SEEN THIS -- DO WE HAVE A, AS PART OF OUR BUDGET PROCESS,  
4 DO WE HAVE A ONE-SHEETER HERE IS WHAT WE HAVE AND WHAT WE'RE  
5 SPEND IT -- ARE WE USING ONE TIME FUNDING FOR CAPITAL  
6 IMPROVEMENTS PRIMARILY, ONGOING SERVICES? HOW IS THAT BEING  
7 INFUSED? AND IT WOULD HELP ME UNDERSTAND THE 10% NUMBER VERSUS  
8 ANOTHER MECHANISM FOR DETERMINING HOW MUCH MONEY SHOULD BE  
9 INVESTED OVER WHAT NUMBER OF YEARS.

10

11 **MELANIE CHOY:** CURRENTLY IT IS ONE TIME INFUSION OF FUNDS, ALL  
12 FUNDING APPROVALS HAVE BEEN SPECIFIC TIME PERIOD AND FUNDING  
13 GOING TOWARDS CAPITAL PROJECTS AS WELL AS PAYING FOR PILOT  
14 PROGRAMS HENCE THAT'S WHY THEY'RE PILOT PROGRAMS WE'RE  
15 INFUSING SOME FUNDS IN TO DEMONSTRATE AND LOOK AT SUCCESSES OF  
16 THE PROGRAMS SEE WHAT WORKS DOESN'T WORK BUT WE WILL NEED  
17 ONGOING PROGRAM FUNDS TO DO THINGS LIKE FARE INTEGRATION PILOT  
18 PROGRAMS THAT WILL NEED TO CONTINUE FUNDS AS INDICATED WE HAVE  
19 FUNDS FOR THE PROGRAM ONCE THOSE FUNDS ARE EXPEND -- EXPECTED  
20 TO LAST 18 TO 24 MONTHS WE WILL NEED TO LOOK FOR THE CONTINUED  
21 RESOURCES FOR PROGRAMS PERMANENCY.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** MELANIE, I WOULD JUST FOR THIS COMMITTEE, BUT  
24 FOR THE BOARD THERE IS ONE PAGER SOURCE OF FUNDS, WHAT THAT'S  
25 SPENT ON. YOU HAVE PRESENTED -- I HAVE SEEN A PRESENTATION --



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE SECOND QUESTION I HAVE IS GIVEN THE NEW PROPOSAL THAT  
2 STUART HAS RAISED IF IT'S ABOUT 10% YOU KNOW 50% GOING IN ONE  
3 BUCKET AND 50% GOING IN ANOTHER IF YOU COULD MAYBE EXPLAIN  
4 WHAT WOULD BE IN BUCKET ONE AND WHAT WOULD BE IN THE LOCAL --  
5 WITHIN THE LOCAL JURISDICTION, WITH A LITTLE MORE SPECIFICITY  
6 IT WOULD BE HELPFUL OF THE PART OF THE REASON I'M ASKING  
7 COLLEAGUES, I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW WE'RE FUNDING  
8 PROJECTS COLLECTIVE PROJECTS APPROPRIATELY WHAT'S THE  
9 APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF FUNDING OVER 5, 10, 15 YEARS.

10

11 **MELANIE CHOY:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, I DID FORGET TO INDICATE  
12 THAT WE HAVE A RESOLUTION THAT GOES TO THE PROGRAMMING AND  
13 ALLOCATIONS THAT SUMMARIZES INFUSION OF FUNDS AND THAT'S WHY  
14 ACTIONS ON THESE FUND SOURCES THAT I MENTIONED, THE THREE  
15 SOURCES ARE TAKEN THOSE ACTIONS HAVE BEEN COMING OUT OF THE  
16 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IN TERMS OF PROGRAM  
17 UPDATES ON PROGRAMS THEMSELVES AND ANY CONTRACT AWARDS AND  
18 PROGRESS WE MAKE ON THE PROMISE WE TAKE TO THE RNM COMMITTEE  
19 SO THERE IS THIS INFORMATION BETWEEN WEDNESDAY AND FRIDAY  
20 GROUPS.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH.

23

24 **MELANIE CHOY:** AND WE CAN WORK ON THAT AND PULL THAT TOGETHER.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANKS MELANIE. THAT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. COY  
2 CHOY I'M GOING TO TURN TO ALIX OR STUART.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF DEPUTY  
5 DIRECTOR ON YOUR QUESTION ABOUT 50% REGIONAL VERSUS INVESTED  
6 BY COUNTY. WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC PROPOSAL FOR THAT I THINK  
7 THAT WOULD BE OPEN FOR MORE REFINEMENT. I THINK THE TRANSIT  
8 PRIORITY PROJECTS IN PARTICULAR PROBABLY LEND THEMSELVES A LOT  
9 TO KIND OF THE LOCAL DEVELOPING, SORT OF, THE LOCAL CAN'T  
10 PRIORITIES. BUT I THINK THAT THERE IS SOME AREAS OF THE OTHER  
11 FOUR KEY, THAT COULD ALSO LENDS THEMSELVES. BUT I THINK THAT  
12 ONE IN PARTICULAR, THE FARES, THERE COULD BE SPECIFIC THINGS  
13 ON FARES, BUT MORE GENERALLY IT'S SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO  
14 CONTRIBUTION TO A SEAMLESS EXPERIENCE. I THINK YOU LIKE TO  
15 THINK OF IT AS ONE TICKET. SO, I THINK THERE COULD BE  
16 CONTRIBUTIONS FROM THE COUNTY BASE, BUT I THINK THAT ONE MAYBE  
17 IS A LITTLE MORE TRICKY. SO, I THINK THAT CAN -- WE CAN  
18 CERTAINLY HAVE MORE CONVERSATION AND REFINEMENT ON THAT.

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND WE HEARD, YOU KNOW, WE TALKED TO THE  
23 VARIOUS COUNTIES, WE HEARD THEY WERE CONCERNED THAT THAT 10%  
24 STAYED AT MTC THEY MAY NOT GET SOME OF THE LOCAL PROGRAMS FOR  
25 THAT TRANSFORMATION THAT'S WHY WE SAID 50% SO THEY KNOW THEIR



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NEEDS BETTER THAN WE DO. AND SO WE WOULD BE ABLE TO TAKE OUR  
2 PART, MATCH THAT AND HELP MOVE FORWARD THE REGIONAL ISSUES. IT  
3 WAS REALLY TO ADDRESS THE CONCERNS THAT WE WERE HEARING FROM  
4 THE VARIOUS COUNTIES THAT THEIR LOCAL PRIORITIES MAY NOT GET  
5 FUNDED THROUGH THIS PROGRAM. ADINA?

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, I HAVE TWO QUESTIONS. ONE IS, I DON'T THINK I  
8 UNDERSTOOD THE RESPONSE TO WHY THE EXCLUSION OF THE NORTH BAY  
9 COUNTIES FROM OPTING IN IN THE OPT-IN OPTION, AND YOU KNOW,  
10 YOU HEARD IN SOME OF THE PUBLIC APPROXIMATE COMMENTS THAT, YOU  
11 KNOW, TRANSIT USERS IN THE NORTH BAY, ARE LOOKING GOT ONLY AT  
12 THE SMART NEED, BUT, ALSO, THE, YOU KNOW, OTHER NEEDS FROM THE  
13 NORTH BAY TO EAST BAY TRANSPORTATION AND THE NEEDS FOR LOCAL  
14 SERVICE AND SO ON, AND THAT -- AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT  
15 TRANSFORMATION COORDINATION NEEDS, WHICH ARE ALSO NEEDS OF THE  
16 NORTH BAY. SO, LIKE, WHY IS THAT EXCLUDED? [INDISCERNIBLE]  
17 QUESTION --

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** STUART, I WANT TO TOUCH ON -- ONE OF THE  
20 CONCERNS WE HAD IS YOU MIGHT NOT HAVE SUPPORT OF NORTH BAY  
21 COUNTIES SO BY INCLUDING THEM, WE GET NOTHING. SO, YOU KNOW,  
22 THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES HAVE VERY SPECIFIC NEEDS AND THEY'RE  
23 GOING TO HAVE TO DETERMINE -- AND THIS DOESN'T PRECLUDE THEM  
24 FROM HAVING THEIR OWN MEASURE, BUT THE CONCERN WE HAD IS WE  
25 WANTED TO BRING SOMETHING FORWARD THAT HAS BEST OPPORTUNITY TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 PASS WITH THE VOTERS. AND IF YOU GET LOW POLL NUMBERS FROM  
2 SOLANO OR NAPA AND THEY CAN DRAWDOWN THIS MEASURE, WE'RE  
3 CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. THAT'S ONE THING. STUART?

4

5 **STUART COHEN:** ONE OF THE BIGGEST BENEFITS IS THE CLARITY AND  
6 MESSAGING AND SIMPLICITY THAT WE'RE ABOUT TO GO THROUGH A  
7 MAJOR CRISIS AND WE'RE GOING TO AVERT IT. GOLDEN GATE HAS A  
8 VERY LARGE SHORTFALL SO THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. BUT SOME  
9 OF THOSE COUNTIES UP THERE, SONOMA ONLY TAKES A LITTLE BIT OF  
10 THAT, SO THREE OF THOSE COUNTIES DON'T. HONESTLY THOSE VOTERS  
11 UP THERE WOULD WANT SOME COUNTY FLEX WITH LOCAL STREETS AND  
12 ROADS AND THINGS SO SUDDENLY YOU'RE GETTING INTO A MESS WHERE  
13 ONE OF THE BIGGEST BENEFITS IS THE SIMPLICITY.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU KNOW, NUMBER THREE IS REALLY WHAT WE  
16 WANT TO FOCUS ON IS, YOU KNOW, IN OUR MEETINGS AND AS WE LOOK  
17 AT THE INPUT, WE HAVE, YOU KNOW, FOR ME, I FELT THAT WE  
18 WEREN'T GOING TO COME OUT OF THIS WITH A REAL CONSENSUS ON ANY  
19 ONE OF THESE PROPOSALS BUT WE THOUGHT IT WAS IMPORTANT IF WE  
20 COULD AGREE ON SOME OF THE COMPONENTS IT WOULD BE HELPFUL AS  
21 WE MOVE FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION. SO IF THERE IS ANY COMMENTS  
22 WHAT YOU HAVE SEEN. AND STUART ARE YOU GOING TO CARRY US  
23 THROUGH SOME PROCESS?

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** YES BEFORE WE GET INTO THE COMMENTS WE THOUGHT  
2 WE WOULD TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** ONE MORE QUESTION.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH AND STEW HAS GOT ONE OVER THERE TOO.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** AND FIRST OF ALL, I WANTED TO START WITH  
9 GRATITUDE TOWARDS MELANIE AND THE TEAM TO START WITH CLARITY  
10 TO PUT THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BECAUSE THAT WAS SOMETHING  
11 THAT, YOU KNOW IN THIS BODY AND AT THE COMMISSION AND  
12 DEFINITELY BRINGING IT DOWN TO THE TRANSIT BOARD, THERE WAS A  
13 LOT OF LACK OF UNDERSTANDING LEADING TO SKEPTICISM SO  
14 PROVIDING THAT INFORMATION IS EXTREMELY HELPFUL. AND, SO, THE  
15 QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT IS, YOU MENTIONED BRINGING IT FORWARD,  
16 NOT JUST FROM THE WEDNESDAY TO THE FRIDAY COMMISSION, I THINK  
17 IT WOULD BE HELPFUL, CAN THIS BE BROUGHT TO THE TRANSIT  
18 BOARDS? WHERE THERE WAS SOME -- YOU KNOW, A LOT OF QUESTIONS  
19 ABOUT THAT, AS WELL. AND THEN, ALSO, IN TERMS OF THE LOCAL  
20 VERSUS THE REGIONAL, WOULD IT BE POSSIBLE TO EVEN PROVIDE A  
21 LITTLE BIT MORE CLARITY ON THE WIN-WIN NATURE OF THE REGIONAL  
22 BUCKET, LIKE, JUST ONE PIECE OF INFORMATION I WAS ABLE TO  
23 DISCOVER FROM THE FARE INTEGRATION IS THAT THE CITY OF MENLO  
24 PARK IS PARTICIPATING IN THE BAY PASS, AND THEY HAVE 40% OF  
25 THEIR TRIPS ON AGENCIES NOT CALTRAIN AND NOT SAMTRANS. SO, BY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 HAVING ALL OF THAT TOGETHER IN THE BAY PASS, THEY'RE ABLE TO  
2 GET A LOT MORE CARS OFF THE ROAD AND A LOT MORE EMPLOYEE  
3 SATISFACTION. AND IF YOU TRY TO SAY WELL HOW MUCH IS THIS  
4 BENEFITTING SAN MATEO COUNTIES VERSUS OTHER COUNTIES, LIKE  
5 THAT'S NOT A LOGICAL QUESTION. IT'S A WIN-WIN, EVERYBODY  
6 BENEFITTING. SO, CAN A LITTLE BIT MORE OF THE WIN-WIN BE KIND  
7 OF TEASED OUT, AND THEN -- [INDISCERNIBLE] TRANSIT --

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE'RE GOING HAVE GINA THEN SUE AND THEN  
10 NICK.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SUE WAS BEFORE ME.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. YOU CAN CLARIFY [LAUGHTER]

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** CAN YOU CLARIFY FOR ME HOW CALTRAIN WILL BE  
17 OPERATIONALLY FUNDED BY THE PARTNER AGENCIES UNDER ALL OF  
18 THESE SCENARIOS?

19

20 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH. THE WAY WE WORK THE SCENARIOS IS THAT THE  
21 -- EACH OF THE FOUR BASELINE COUNTIES WOULD BE CONTRIBUTING  
22 THE SALES TAX OF THE SALES TAX PLUS ONE OF THE OTHERS, AND  
23 THEN CALTRAIN WOULD BE GETTING IN THE FIRST YEAR OF 1 TO 8, 37  
24 MILLION, AND THAT DECREASES SOMEWHAT YEAR 9 TO 15. AND WE  
25 WOULD BE ANTICIPATING A CONTRIBUTION FROM SANTA CLARA, EXACTLY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WHAT THAT IS STILL TO BE DETERMINED BY THE JVP COUNTIES. BUT  
2 IN TOTAL WE WOULD EXPECT CALTRAIN TO BE GETTING 67 MILLION  
3 WHICH IS THEIR ADJUSTED FARE SHORTFALL? SCENARIO ONE OR 70  
4 MILLION IN SCENARIO TWO. WE DON'T HAVE EXACTLY RETURN TO  
5 SOURCE MECHANISM, YOU KNOW IF THAT'S IMPLICIT IN THE QUESTION,  
6 WITHIN THIS -- WITHIN OUR FRAMEWORK.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** IT'S STILL UNSETTLING. BECAUSE WE HAVE THREE  
9 COUNTIES AND -- [INDISCERNIBLE] EXISTING AGREEMENT. SO,  
10 FURTHER CLARIFICATION WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU GINA. SUE?

13

14 **SUE NOACK:** JUST A CLARIFYING QUESTION. SO, THE HYBRID EXAMPLES  
15 ARE ONLY FOR THE 30-YEAR SCENARIO, NOT THE TEN?

16

17 **STUART COHEN:** THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. WE DID NOT DO ONE FOR -  
18 - A HYBRID FOR THE TEN. NO. I MEAN, IT COULD BE CONSIDERED.

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT COULD BE  
21 CONSIDERED FOR THAT AS WELL. THANKS.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY NICK THEN DAVID.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COULD YOU JUST CLARIFY WHAT PROPORTION OF  
2 MUNI SHORTFALL WOULD BE ADDRESSED IN SCENARIO -- IN THE  
3 SCENARIOS ONE, VERSUS IN THE KIND OF OPERATOR MEASURE? BECAUSE  
4 THAT -- I MEAN THAT, SEEMS LIKE A MASSIVE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN  
5 THOSE TWO MEASURES, BETWEEN KIND OF THE ONE RATE, JUST, SORT  
6 OF, RULE THEM ALL AND, SORT OF, LIKE THE ABILITY -- SORT OF,  
7 THE MULTI-RATE MEASURE?

8

9 **STUART COHEN:** IT'S A VERY LARGE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE TWO.  
10 THANK YOU FOR POINTING THAT OUT, NICK. IN SCENARIO ONE, MUNI  
11 WOULD BE GETTING 88 MILLION AND THEIR SHORTFALL, THEY GAVE US  
12 A RANGE OF 240 TO 320. SO WE'RE JUST THINKING OF IT AS 280  
13 NOW, MIDPOINT, SO THAT COMES OUT TO ABOUT 31% OF THEIR  
14 SHORTFALL. AND THEN IT GOES DOWN SIGNIFICANTLY TO 30 MILLION  
15 DURING YEARS 9 TO 15 IN SCENARIO ONE, WHICH IS, YOU KNOW,  
16 HOVERS AROUND 10%, 11% OF IT. NOW, IT DOES MUCH BETTER IN THE  
17 HYBRID, BECAUSE THAT 300 MILLION THAT COMES IN FROM EITHER  
18 PARCEL OR PAYROLL IS THOUGHT OF AS A REGIONAL FUNDING POT. AND  
19 THAT BRINGS ALL OF THE OPERATORS UP TO 90%. SO THEY WOULD BE  
20 GETTING 90% OF THAT 280, IT'S THE 250 IS WHAT IT COMES OUT TO.  
21 AND THEN THAT GOES DOWN TO ABOUT 65% OF IT IN THE LATER YEARS.  
22 SO IT'S A VERY BIG DIFFERENCE BETWEEN MUNI AND THESE. I WILL  
23 SAY THAT, YOU KNOW, THE REALLY INNOVATIVE THINGS THAT THEY  
24 BROUGHT FORWARD AND HAVE BEEN SOCIALIZING AMONGST THE AGENCIES  
25 IS INCREDIBLY USEFUL AND POWERFUL. AND I MENTIONED THEM DURING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MY PRESENTATION. BUT, YOU KNOW, IN THEIR SCENARIO, THERE WAS  
2 SOME FINANCING IN THE VERY FIRST YEAR TO FILL THAT GAP  
3 IMMEDIATELY. THAT CAN BE A DISCUSSION. THERE IS COST TO IT,  
4 OBVIOUSLY THERE IS BENEFITS TO IT, GIVEN THE SITUATION ON A  
5 VERY, VERY SHORT-TERM BASIS AND THE OTHER ONE IS FRONT  
6 LOADING. WE HEARD RESISTANCE TO THIS, SOME COUNTIES GET MORE  
7 EARLY AND OTHER COUNTIES GET MORE LATER WHEN WE FIRST STARTED  
8 THE PROCESS WE'RE HEARING COUNTIES WARMING UP TO THAT. THAT  
9 CAN MAKE A TREMENDOUS DIFFERENCE IF IMMUNE WAS GETTING LESS IN  
10 YEARS 20 TO 30 AS AN EXAMPLE. THE 30-YEAR HORIZON, I'LL JUST  
11 SAY, DOES A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT IF WE INTRODUCE FLEXIBILITY TO  
12 THAT, WHERE THERE IS A TEN YEAR MEASURE, EVEN WITH THE  
13 FLEXIBILITY, YOU'RE GOING OUT FOR MORE FUNDING AGAIN IN A FEW  
14 YEARS. SO, I THINK WE CAN HAVE A LOT OF CONVERSATIONS THAT DO  
15 A MIX AND MATCH ON THE SCENARIOS. AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE EXCITED  
16 TO GET TO THE COMPONENTS OF THE GRADIENTS OF THE AGREEMENT  
17 BECAUSE WE WANT TO KNOW WHICH OF THESE COMPONENTS PEOPLE THINK  
18 SHOULD MOVE FORWARD.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** BUT THE OPERATOR SCENARIO ABLE TO HAVE  
21 DIFFERENT RATES IN DIFFERENT COUNTIES ALLOWS SAN FRANCISCO TO  
22 HAVE A MUCH HIGHER RATE THEN HAVE ITS DEFICIT MORE FUNDED. IS  
23 THAT RIGHT?

24





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** YES VERY BOTH BECAUSE VARIABLE RATE AND OF  
2 COURSE PARCEL I HAVE TO SAY ONE THING WHICH IS THAT VARIABLE  
3 RATE INTRODUCES RISK AND COMPLICATION. AND IF IT COULD WORK,  
4 LIKE, WONDERFUL. BUT BOTH THE LEGISLATURE MAY BE HESITANT  
5 ESPECIALLY WITH A VERY COMPLICATED ONE, LIKE WAS INTRODUCED --  
6 THAT WOULDN'T FIT IN A BALLOT QUESTION, THREE OR FOUR  
7 DIFFERENT RATES. IT WOULD HAVE TO BE IN THE BALLOT BOOK AND  
8 YOU WOULD HAVE TO HAVE THE LEGISLATURE KIND OF MAKE THAT  
9 ALLOWANCE A VERY BIG LIFT. THE OTHER CONCERN IS THE LEGAL  
10 CHALLENGES THAT WE THINK WOULD COME, JUST LIKE THEY DID WITH  
11 RM3, AND ESPECIALLY IF IT'S NOT IN THE BALLOT QUESTION, I  
12 THINK REALLY OPENS IT UP TO SOME RISK. AND, SO, I THINK THERE  
13 IS A LOT TO THINK ABOUT WITH THE VARIABLE RATE BEFORE WE GO  
14 DOWN THAT ROAD.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I JUST  
17 ALSO WANTED TO POINT OUT THAT FOR THOSE ON THE COMMITTEE WHO  
18 MAY NOT TRACK MUNI AS CLOSELY AS SAN FRANCISCANS, THAT, LIKE,  
19 RIDERSHIP CONTINUES TO REBOUND WHICH I THINK IS A REAL  
20 TESTAMENT TO THE, SORT OF -- MUNI'S, SORT OF, RETHINKING ITS  
21 APPROACH POST-PANDEMIC TO SERVE RIDERSHIP, YOU'RE NOW AT WHAT?  
22 74%, RIGHT? AND MUNI'S FARE LOSSES ARE MUCH MORE DRIVEN BY  
23 PEOPLE NOT COMING INTO SAN FRANCISCO TO PARK THAN THEY ARE IN  
24 PEOPLE NOT RIDING THE BUS. SO, NOT THAT I WOULD ENCOURAGE  
25 ANYBODY TO DRIVE INTO SAN FRANCISCO TO PARK, AND I AM SURE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NONE OF YOU DID TODAY, BUT I THOUGHT THAT WAS SO INTERESTING,  
2 SORT OF, IMPORTANT CONTEXT. SO, THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, NICK. DAVID THEN ELLEN.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. STUART, I HAVE A QUESTION FOR PEOPLE  
7 TRYING TO CATCH OCCUPY THIS ISSUE, WHAT COUNTIES WOULD BE  
8 GETTING TAXED AND WHAT COUNTIES WOULD NOT BE GETTING TAXED AND  
9 WHAT'S PROPOSED?

10

11 **STUART COHEN:** IN SCENARIO ONE, IT WOULD BE MINIMUM OF FOUR  
12 COUNTIES --

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** WHAT COUNTIES ARE THEY?

15

16 **STUART COHEN:** ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN  
17 MATEO, AND POTENTIALLY ANY OF THE OTHER FIVE COUNTIES THAT  
18 WOULD OPT IN.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** YOU CAN TALK TO US ABOUT THAT BECAUSE THEY WOULD  
21 HAVE THE ABLE TO OPT IN. IS THAT CORRECT? SO, WHAT DOES THAT  
22 LOOK LIKE? SO THEY WOULD, IF THE MEASURE COMES BEFORE, THEY  
23 WOULD REACH OUT TO US AND THE COUNTY WOULD SAY HEY LOOK I WANT  
24 TO OPT INTO THIS MEASURE. HOW DOES THAT WORK? IF YOU COULD  
25 EXPLAIN TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **STUART COHEN:** IT'S ACTUALLY A VERY GOOD QUESTION, BUT THAT IS  
3 THE IDEA, AND I BELIEVE IT WOULD BE THE TRANSPORTATION  
4 AGENCY'S AUTHORITY THAT WOULD BE LOOKING TO GUIDANCE FOR.  
5 CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG?

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THIS'S CORRECT.

8

9 **STUART COHEN:** AND, YOU KNOW, THAT DELIBERATION WOULD HAPPEN  
10 WHETHER PUBLIC PROCESS AT THEIR CTA AND AS I MENTIONED THE  
11 TIMELINE WOULD BE FEBRUARY BUT NO LATER THAN APRIL.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** SAN FRANCISCO, CON COST, ALAMEDA COUNTY WHAT  
14 WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH TODAY IS BASICALLY LOOKING AT TAXING  
15 THOSE COUNTIES, CORRECT?

16

17 **STUART COHEN:** CORRECT IN SCENARIO ONE.

18

19 **DAVID CANEPA:** AND STAFF, YOU HAVE BEEN HAVING CONVERSATIONS  
20 WITH OTHER COUNTIES OUTSIDE OF THE A FOUR MENTIONED, HOW MANY  
21 OF THOSE COUNTIES ARE INTERESTED IN TAXING THEMSELVES? DO WE  
22 HAVE TEMPERATURE READ ON THE OTHER COUNTIES AND WHERE THEY'RE  
23 AT?

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE  
2 DIRECTOR. I WOULD SAY THAT IT'S VARIED. YOU KNOW, SANTA CLARA,  
3 IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHAIR SPERING'S LETTER HAS SAID THEY'RE  
4 COMMITTED IT'S A FORM OF OPTING IN WITHOUT ACTUALLY -- SONOMA  
5 HAS EXPRESSED INTEREST ESPECIALLY IF THEY CAN SUPPORT THE  
6 OPERATIONS OF SMART AND MARIN HAS INDICATED A SIMILAR  
7 POTENTIAL FEELING AND NAPA IS INTERESTED TO SUPPORT. AND I  
8 WOULD DEFER TO CHAIR SPERING ABOUT SOLANO'S INTEREST BUT THEY  
9 HAVE BEEN INTERESTED IN SAFE STREETS INVESTMENTS MAKING SURE  
10 THEIR TRANSIT STAYS OPERATIONAL IT'S IMPORTANT TO THE  
11 COMMUNITY BUT NOBODY HAS OFFICIALLY ONE WAY OR THE OTHER.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** WHAT ARE THE CONSEQUENCES STAFF HAS MEASURED IN  
14 TERMS OF IF THEY DON'T OPT IN? HAVE WE DONE ANALYSIS? HAVE WE  
15 DONE A STUDY? WHAT'S THE BENEFIT IF THEY OPT IN AND WHAT'S THE  
16 BENEFIT IF THEY DON'T OPT IN? I REALLY NEED TO KIND OF  
17 UNDERSTAND THAT.

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WELL WE'RE CERTAINLY HOPING THAT THE COMMIT OF  
20 TRANSFORMATION HAPPENS REGARDLESS. THAT'S BEEN A PRIORITY OF  
21 THE CHAIR'S REQUEST. SO THAT'S COVERED AS HAPPENING  
22 REGARDLESS. BUT I DO THINK YOU FACE SOME REAL CHALLENGES IN  
23 SOME OF THE BENEFITS OF THESE OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE  
24 SMALL COUNTIES. AND THE DIRECT QUESTION IS THEN WE HAVE NOT  
25 ANALYZED WHAT THE EFFECT WOULD BE, WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 REALLY ON THE CORE TRANSIT FACILITIES WITHIN THE FIVE  
2 COUNTIES.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. AND YOU MENTIONED A BIT ABOUT THE TRANSIT  
5 TRANSFORMATION WORK. HAVE WE BEEN ABLE TO IDENTIFY WHAT THAT  
6 LOOKS LIKE IN TERMS OF A MONETARY NUMBER FOR EACH COUNTY? IF  
7 WE HAD -- WHAT IS THAT NUMBER? WHAT DO THOSE NUMBERS LOOK  
8 LIKE?

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** MAYBE ALIX OR MELANIE COULD -- WE PRESENTED A  
11 FEW TIMES, IT'S BREAKING DOWN THE ONE HUNDRED MILLION IT'S  
12 DIFFERENCE IN EACH COUNTY.

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** IT'S IN THE ATTACHMENT, I DON'T HAVE IT  
15 MEMORIZED IT WOULD BE KIND OF 10% OF WHATEVER, SALES TAX, 10%  
16 OF THE SALES TAX GENERATION BY COUNTY. SO IT IS IN THE  
17 ATTACHMENT. [LAUGHTER]

18

19 **SPEAKER:** IT WOULD BE FOR SAN MATEO IT WOULD BE WE HAVE IT AS  
20 11 MILLION PER YEAR OVER THE LIFE.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** AND HOW ABOUT THE COUNTIES OUTSIDE OF THE FOUR  
23 COUNTIES?

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** WELL IT BECOMES TEN -- IT WOULD BE 10% OF THEIR  
2 SALES TAX GENERATION. IT VARIES GREATLY, FROM AS LOW AS 2  
3 MILLION A YEAR IN NAPA TO 29 MILLION A YEAR IN NAPA.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** I APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU FOR HAVING THOSE  
6 QUESTIONS. OKAY. I APPRECIATE IT.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DAVID, I WANT TO ADD, YOU KNOW, MY MEETING  
9 CAN FOUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES, THEY'RE ALL GOING TO GO THROUGH  
10 AN ANALYSIS AND REALLY LOOK AT, YOU KNOW, IS THERE AN  
11 ADVANTAGE. SOME OF THEM HAVE MEASURES COMING UP. I KNOW SONOMA  
12 AND DAVID RABBITT CAN TALK ABOUT IT, THEY'RE ALL KIND OF  
13 ANALYZING WHAT WOULD BE THE BENEFITS OF THOSE COUNTIES THAT  
14 ARE OUT. SO THEY'RE ALL KIND OF GOING THROUGH THAT PROCESS.  
15 AND WHATEVER THE COMMISSION ENDS UP ON IT'S GOING TO  
16 ACCELERATE THAT DISCUSSION. DAVID?

17

18 **DAVID RABBITT:** I THOUGHT I HEARD SOMEONE SAY IT WOULD BE UP TO  
19 THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES OF EACH COUNTY TO PLACE  
20 SOMETHING ON THE BALLOT. THAT'S NOT TRUE. RIGHT? IT WILL COME  
21 BACK TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **DAVID RABBITT:** -- THE ULTIMATE AUTHORITY. WANT TO MAKE SURE  
2 THAT WAS CLEAR AND THE MASCOTS HAVE BEEN MEETING AND GOING  
3 OVER THE COORDINATION. I BELIEVE THE 50 STEP OF THE TRANSIT  
4 TRANSFORMATION ALONG THE 101 CORRIDOR THAT'S BEEN GOING GREAT  
5 WE'RE NOT QUITE THERE YET. I BELIEVE THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES AS  
6 YOU MENTIONED EARLIER, ARE CONCERNED, WHAT I HEAR, RETURN TO  
7 SOURCE. AND JUST WANTING TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE IS THE MOST  
8 FLEXIBILITY AND OF COURSE WE HAVE THE SMART CONUNDRUM WHICH  
9 WE'LL HAVE NO FUNDING WHATSOEVER WHEN THE TAX EXPIRES.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. AL ELLEN, THEN JIM WUNDERMAN.

12

13 **ELLEN WU:** I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY SCENARIO THAT USES THE  
14 ASSUMPTION OF FAREBOX DECREASE VERSUS OPERATOR SHORTFALL WILL  
15 BE EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTED BECAUSE IT WILL BENEFIT RAIL MORE  
16 THAN LOCAL BUS WHICH IS WE KNOW IS RELIED UPON BY LOCATION  
17 PEOPLE OF COLOR AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT. I THINK THAT THEME  
18 RUNNING ACROSS ANY SCENARIO NEEDS TO BE TAKEN INTO  
19 CONSIDERATION.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** JIM WUNDERMAN?

22

23 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANK YOU. QUICK QUESTION. IN ADDITION TO  
24 WEARING THE HAT REPRESENTING THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY, I AM THE  
25 CHAIRMAN OF THE SF BAY FERRY, WHICH IS THE REGIONAL



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT'S PROBABLY THE ONLY GROWING  
2 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IN THE REGION. AND IT SERVES THE FOUR  
3 COUNTIES TODAY, WITH, PERHAPS, PLANS TO GO FARTHER. AND I WAS  
4 -- I DIDN'T SEE FERRIES MENTIONED IN ANY SCENARIO. SO, I WAS  
5 WONDERING WHETHER THERE IS FUNDING AVAILABLE. BY OUR  
6 ESTIMATES, WETA HITS A FISCAL CLIFF SOMETIME IN THE EARLY  
7 2030S. WE DON'T KNOW EXACTLY WHEN, MAYBE 2032, BUT IT'S NOT  
8 THAT FAR OFF. AND, BUT I DIDN'T SEE ANY MENTION OF THAT.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DOES STAFF WANT TO COMMENT ON THAT?

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH. IN MOST OF THE -- YOU KNOW, MOST OF THE  
13 NUMBERS THAT WERE FOCUSED ON THOSE THAT HAVE THE LARGE FISCAL  
14 CLIFFS IMMEDIATELY. I THINK IN THE 30 YEARS COUNTY FLEX LATER  
15 THERE CAN BE INVESTED IN FERRIES HYBRID SCENARIO THERE IS MORE  
16 MONEY FOR OTHER TRANSIT TO INVEST IN TRANSIT. REGIONAL MEASURE  
17 THREE THANKFULLY HAS QUITE A BIT OF SUPPORT FOR FERRY. SO  
18 THEY'RE NOT FACING THE FISCAL CLIFF GIVEN THE STABLE OPERATING  
19 FUNDING.

20

21 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** WELL IT COMES SOONER THAN YOU THINK AND IT'S  
22 NOT THAT MANY YEARS. WE'RE LOOKING AT CHALLENGES IN THE  
23 FUTURE, IF WE WERE TO MEET THE BUSINESS PLAN THAT WE HAVE, WE  
24 HAVE PLAN OF EXPANSIONS TO REDWOOD CITY, TO BERKELEY. SO, TO  
25 OTHER AREAS, PERHAPS CONTRA COSTA COUNTY AND CARQUINEZ. SO,





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, ARE, GIVEN THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT FUNDING THE  
2 REGIONAL SYSTEMS. I'M NOT TRYING TO ARGUE FOR ANYTHING HERE  
3 PARTICULARLY I'M JUST QUESTIONING THE CIRCUMSTANCE. I THINK  
4 YOU ANSWERED THE QUESTION.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY, STUART, HOW DO YOU WANT TO PROCEED?  
7 OH NO. I'M SORRY. NICK? I DIDN'T SEE YOU.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** NO. I DON'T REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW THIS OPT IN  
10 PROCESS WORKS. IF WE'RE GOING TO ALSO BE PROVIDING THE OPTION  
11 FOR A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE. TO HAPPEN. CAN -- LIKE, THE  
12 CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE NEEDS A DEFINED DISTRICT IS MINDING TO GO  
13 COLLECT -- YOU KNOW, FOR THE CITIZENS -- THE OPTION TO COLLECT  
14 SIGNATURES. SO IS IT THE COUNTIES OPT IN AND THEN THE DISTRICT  
15 SHIFTS. YOU CAN CLARIFY THAT? IT FEELS IF WE'RE TALKING ABOUT  
16 BIG LEGAL RISKS THIS STRIKES ME AS A, YOU KNOW, POTENTIALLY  
17 EVEN GREATER LEGAL RISK THAN THE MULTI-RATE RISK, WHICH HAS  
18 BEEN DONE IN MANY OTHER INSTANCES. I CAN'T IMAGINE THIS THIS  
19 PARTICULAR THING HASN'T BEEN DONE IN OTHER INSTANCE THERE IS  
20 PLENTY OF MULTI-RATE PARCEL TAXES AND THINGS LIKE THAT.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MY UNDERSTANDING AND STAFF CAN RESPOND IS  
23 IF THERE IS A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DO  
24 AN EVALUATION OF EACH ONE OF THE COUNTIES. BECAUSE SOME OF  
25 THEM COULD DEFINITELY DRAWDOWN THE MEASURE SO YOU WOULDN'T



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 INCLUDE IT. SO, IT'S JUST GOING TO HAVE TO BE SOME TRUTHING  
2 PROCESS BEFORE YOU START COLLECTING THOSE SIGNATURES. GO AHEAD  
3 STAFF IF YOU WANT TO ADD TO THAT?

4

5 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH THAT WHY WE HAVE THE TIMELINE FOR THE OPT  
6 IN COUNTIES TO TELL US EARLY. IT WOULD BASICALLY HAVE TO  
7 SPECIFY WHATEVER CONGLOMERATION OF COUNTIES IT IS AS A  
8 DISTRICT IN THE LEGISLATION.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** BEFORE LEGISLATION PASSES.

11

12 **STUART COHEN:** BEFORE LEGISLATION PASSES IT WOULD HAVE TO BE  
13 SPECIFIED IN THE LEGISLATION.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY, STUART. LET'S --

16

17

18

19 **>>SPEAKER:** STUART COHEN: SO, WE WOULD LIKE TO TAKE PUBLIC  
20 COMMENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU KNOW, I WOULD RATHER WE GO INTO THE  
23 GRADIENTS THEN TAKE PUBLIC COMMENTS SO WE HAVE AN IDEA WHERE  
24 WE ARE THAT WOULD SPEED UP THINGS.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM THE PUBLIC BEFORE WE  
2 EXPRESS OUR VOTES.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THAT'S FINE. I'M ALREADY WITH THAT. HOW  
5 MANY SPEAKERS DO YOU HAVE?

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE A NUMBER IN THE BOARDROOM,  
8 THREE ONLINE AND WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE IF I MAY. PUBLIC  
9 COMMENTS RECEIVED AS OF THE 5:00 P.M. DEADLINE YESTERDAY  
10 EVENING AND ATTACHED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA PACKET AS WELL AS  
11 PROVIDED IN HANDOUTS IN TODAY'S MEETING. WRITTEN  
12 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FROM SOPHIA DEWITT WITH THE EAST BAY  
13 HOUSING COALITION, MICHAEL HURSH AC TRANSIT, MARY SHENG THAO  
14 CITY OF OAK, MICHAEL QUIGLEY WITH CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR  
15 JOBS, CAROL TAYLOR, KENNY BAUERS COLLIN WITH DISABILITY  
16 SERVICES LEGAL CENTER JOINT LETTER FROM NORTH BAY COALITION,  
17 INCLUDES FRIENDS OF SMART SUSTAINABLE MARIN, SAFE STREETS  
18 PETALUMA CANAL ALLIANCE GENESIS DISABILITY SERVICES LEGAL  
19 CENTER FOR COMMUTER TRANSPORTATION NORTHERN CAL --  
20 [INDISCERNIBLE] LAND COALITION.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANYBODY ONLINE PLEASE IDENTIFY IF YOU WANT  
23 TO SPEAK WITHIN THE NEXT MINUTE SO WE HAVE AN IDEA OF HOW MANY  
24 WE HAVE, I'LL GIVE A MINUTE AND A HALF.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MINUTE AND A HALF. OKAY. OUR FIRST  
2 SPEAKER IN THE BOARDROOM WILL BE TIM, FOLLOWED BY DIEGO  
3 HERNANDEZ AND PLEASE FORGIVE ME IF I MISPRONOUNCE ANYONE'S  
4 NAME. YOU CAN START LINING UP HERE AT THE PODIUM.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS TIM, I'M A  
7 FIELD REPRESENTATIVE WITH CARPENTERS LEVEL 22. IT HAS ALWAYS  
8 BEEN A CHALLENGE TO SECURE FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT  
9 ESPECIALLY AS RIDERSHIP HAS DROPPED DURING AND AFTER THE  
10 PANDEMIC BUT NONE OF THESE PROPOSALS APPEAR TO HAVE ANY CHANCE  
11 OF WINNING APPROVAL BECAUSE THEY AREN'T BALANCED BETWEEN WHAT  
12 TRANSIT AGENCIES WANT AND WHAT THE VOTERS WILL PAY FOR. WE  
13 MISSED A HUGE OPPORTUNITY TO WIN VOTER APPROVED BY INVESTING  
14 IN VITAL JOB GENERATING TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH WE  
15 ALL KNOW IS THE ONLINE WAY TO PASS BALLOT MEASURES LIKE THIS.  
16 AS IT STANDS I CAN'T SUPPORT ANY OF THESE SCENARIOS. THANK YOU  
17 FOR YOUR TIME.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE DIEGO  
20 HERNANDEZ FOLLOWED BY JESUS MENDOZA.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** DIEGO HERNANDEZ MEMBER OF LABOR LOCAL 261 HERE IN SAN  
23 FRANCISCO CONSTRUCTIONERS ARE AMONG THE 96% OF BAY AREA  
24 COMMUTERS WHO DO NOT RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK YET  
25 YOU'RE ASKING FOR PEOPLE LIKE ME AND MY FELLOW WORKERS BACK



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THERE AND OUR FAMILIES TO TAX OURSELVES PAY FOR SERVICES THAT  
2 WE DON'T USE. WE'RE NOT OPPOSED TO IT IF IT'S REASONABLE AND  
3 MAKES SENSE BUT YOU NEED TO DO BETTER TO MAKE THE CASE TO US  
4 FOR ME AND MY FELLOW MEMBERS FOR ALL THE BAY AREA WORKER WHO  
5 IS ARE DRIVING TO WORK AS TO HOW THIS BENEFITS US. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. JOSE MENDOZA FOLLOWED BY  
8 CHARLIE LAVERY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HELLO GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS JESUS MENDOZA NORCAL  
11 CARP TERSE UNION SAN FRANCISCO. FIRST THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME  
12 AND OPPORTUNITY TO ALLOWING ME TO SPEAK. WE ALL BELIEVE THAT  
13 TRANSIT FUNDING IS CRITICAL BUT NONE OF THESE PROPOSALS HAVE A  
14 CHANCE AT THE BALLOT UNLESS THEY BALANCE NEEDS WITH TRANSIT  
15 AGENCIES AND REALITY WHAT IS VOTERS WILL APPROVE. NONE HAVE  
16 THE CONSENSUS NECESSARY AMONG EAST BAY STAKEHOLDERS TO MAKE IT  
17 OUT OF LEGISLATION MUCH LESS PASS THE BALLOT.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS CHARLIE LAVERY.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** CHARLIE LAVERY POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ALSO A  
22 PACIFICA RESIDENT. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR EFFORTS TO  
23 ADDRESS THE COMPLEX AND CHANGING TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF THE  
24 BAY AREA. TRANSPORTATION BUILDS EQUITY AND IT'S IMPERATIVE  
25 THAT WE FIND A SOLUTION. REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE MUST



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BE ATTRACTIVE ENOUGH TO VOTERS TO MAKE THEM WILLING TO FURTHER  
2 TAX THEMSELVES. WE DO NOT SEE A SCENARIO IN THE CURRENT  
3 PRESENTATION THAT ADEQUATELY CONSIDERS THAT OVER 90% OF BAY  
4 AREA RESIDENTS ARE MOTORISTS AND 40% OF COMMUTERS RELY ON  
5 TRANSIT. SUCCESSFUL MEASURE MUST HAVE A MULTI-MODAL  
6 EXPENDITURE PLAN TO WIN VOTER SUPPORT. THE OVERWHELMING  
7 MAJORITY OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS RELY ON THEIR CARS FOR  
8 TRANSPORTATION. A SUCCESSFUL REVENUE MEASURE WILL NEED TO  
9 BALANCE ANY BUDGET ASSISTANCE FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES WITH  
10 FUNDING FOR NECESSARY IMPROVEMENTS AND TRANSFORMATIVE  
11 INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WILL WIN OVER VOTERS. BEST CHANCE FOR  
12 SUCCESS THE MEASURE SHOULD USE TRIED AND TRUSTED MEASURE FOR  
13 REVENUE WHICH IS SALES TAX. I URGE THE COMMITTEE AND  
14 COMMISSION TO CONTINUE DELIBERATIONS GIVING PROPORTIONAL  
15 CONSIDERATION TO THE CURRENT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF BAY AREA  
16 RESIDENTS AND TO ENVISION THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OF THE  
17 FUTURE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE MEGAN  
20 PRIOR FOLLOWED BY BRAD PERRY.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'M BRAD PERRIS WITH OPERATING ENGINEERS SAN MATEO  
23 RESIDENT. I THANK YOU FOR YOUR EFFORTS TO ADDRESS THE  
24 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF THE BAY AREA AND THROUGH THE REGIONAL  
25 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. A SUCCESSFUL MEASURE MUST HAVE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MULTI-MODAL EXPENDITURE MAN TO WIN SUPPORT THAT BENEFIT  
2 OVERWHELMING MAJORITY OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS WHO RELY ON CARS  
3 FOR TRANSPORTATION. SUCCESSFUL REVENUE MEASURE WILL NEED TO  
4 BALANCE ANY BUDGET ASSISTANCE FOR TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WITH  
5 FUNDING FOR NECESSARY IMPROVEMENTS AND TRANSFORMATIONAL  
6 INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WILL WIN OVER VOTERS. NONE OF THESE  
7 SCENARIOS ARE CURRENTLY BE CONSIDERED TO MEET THESE CRITERIA  
8 AND I URGE COMMITTEE AND COMMISSION NOT TO RUSH BUT TO  
9 CONTINUE DELIBERATION AND TO INCLUDE NEW PERSPECTIVES TO GET  
10 PROPORTIONAL CONSIDERATION TO CURRENT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS FOR  
11 THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND TO START TO BUILD A BAY AREA  
12 TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS  
15 CAMERON ROBINS FOLLOWED BY ARMY MORGAN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS CAMDEN ROBINS OPERATOR  
18 ENGINEERS SONOMA COUNTY ROHNERT PARK I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR  
19 YOUR COMPLEX CHANGING TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF THE BAY AREA  
20 THROUGH THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TRANSPORTATION  
21 BUILDS EQUITY AND IT'S IMPERATIVE THAT WE FIND A SOLUTION. A  
22 SUCCESSFUL MEASURE MUST HAVE A MULTI-MODAL EXPENDITURE PLAN TO  
23 WIN VOTER SUPPORT PROVIDES BENEFIT TO THE OVERWHELMING  
24 MAJORITY OF THE BAY AREA RESIDENT WHO IS RELY ON THEIR CARS  
25 FOR TRANSPORTATION. SUCCESSFUL REVENUE MEASURE WILL NEED TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BALANCE ANY BUDGET ASSISTANCE FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES WITH  
2 FUNDING FOR NECESSARY IMPROVEMENTS AND TRANSFORMATIVE  
3 INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WILL WIN OVER VOTERS. NONE OF THESE  
4 SCENARIOS CURRENTLY BEING CONSIDERED MEET THESE CRITERIA AND I  
5 URGE THE COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION NOT TO RUSH BUT TO  
6 CONTINUE DELIBERATIONS AND INCLUDE THEIR PERSPECTIVES TO GIVE  
7 MORE PROPORTIONAL CONSIDERATION TO THE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF  
8 THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS AND TO START TO BUILD THE BAY AREA  
9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OF THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE ARMY  
12 MORGAN FOLLOWED BY ETHAN LESSLER.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** ARMY MORGAN WITH OPERATING ENGINEERS. I'M SAN  
15 FRANCISCO RESIDENT. WE DON'T HAVE A CURRENT SCENARIO IN THE  
16 PRESENTATION THAT SUFFICIENTLY ADDRESSES THE PRIORITIES WE  
17 HAVE REPEATEDLY CONVEYED IN PREVIOUS HEARINGS NONE OF THEM  
18 ADEQUATELY CONSIDER THAT OVER 80% OF THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS  
19 ARE MOTORISTS AND 4% OF COMMUTERS RELY ON TRANSIT RIGHT NOW.  
20 SO, YOU KNOW, AND I THINK THEY'RE BUILDING THE ROAD  
21 IMPROVEMENTS AND INFRASTRUCTURE AND PUTTING A LOT MORE PEOPLE  
22 TO WORK AS WELL. JUST MY OPINION. AND A SUCCESSFUL REVENUE  
23 MEASURE WILL NEED TO BALANCE ANY BUDGET ASSISTANCE FOR TRANSIT  
24 AGENCIES WITH FUNDING FOR NECESSARY IMPROVEMENTS AND  
25 TRANSFORMATIVE INFRASTRUCTURE THAT IT WILL WITHIN OVER VOTERS.





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NONE OF THE SCENARIOS CURRENTLY BEING CONSIDERED MEET THESE  
2 CRITERIA. AND I URGE THE COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION NOT TO  
3 RUSH, BUT TO CONTINUE DELIBERATIONS AND INCLUDE NEW  
4 PERSPECTIVES TO GIVE MORE PROPORTIONAL AND CONSIDERATION TO  
5 THE CURRENT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OF THE BAY AREA. I KNOW I'M  
6 TIRED OF RUNNING OVER POTHOLES AND TO START TO BUILD IN THE  
7 BAY AREA, THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OF THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE LESSLER  
10 FOLLOWED BY JONATHON COAL.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS ETHAN LESSLER, OPERATING  
13 ENGINEERS, SAN MATEO RESIDENT. ALL THESE SCENARIOS FEEL LIKE  
14 THEY HAVE BEEN PIECED TOGETHER SO THAT SOMETHING CAN BE PASSED  
15 TODAY. EVEN IF IT HAS NO CHANCE OF WINNING VOTER APPROVAL.  
16 THERE IS TALK OF A PARCEL TAX WHICH WILL COMPETE WITH OTHER  
17 EFFORTS TO PASS A REGIONAL HOUSING BOND. THERE IS NO MONEY FOR  
18 JOB GENERATING TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE. THAT'S THE BEST  
19 WAY TO WIN OVER VOTERS IN THE AREA APPROVAL FOR BALLOT  
20 MEASURES LIKE THIS. AND THERE IS WIDESPREAD OPPOSITION TO ALL  
21 THESE SCENARIOS. IT FEELS LIKE YOU HAVE A LOT MORE WORK TO DO  
22 BEFORE YOU CAN PASS ANYTHING LIKE THIS. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT JONATHON COLE  
25 FOLLOWED BY LAUREL PAGEANT.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** JONATHON COLE WITH CLIMATE ACTION CALIFORNIA. AND I  
3 WANT TO THANK CHAIR SPERING, THE COMMITTEE, AND THE COMMISSION  
4 FOR TAKING ON THIS HERCULEAN TASK. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY A LOT OF  
5 DIFFERENT INTEREST THAT YOU NEED TO BALANCE. BUT ONE OF THOSE  
6 IS THAT WE'RE FACING CLIMATE CHANGE, AS WAS POINTED OUT BY AN  
7 EARLIER SPEAKER, AT BOTH SCALE AND PACE THAT'S UNPRECEDENTED  
8 IN HUMAN HISTORY AND WE NEED TO REDUCE OUR EMISSIONS AS SOON  
9 AS POSSIBLE. AND LOCAL AND REGIONAL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS  
10 VITAL TO EQUITABLY INCREASING MOBILITY IN THE BAY AREA WHILE  
11 SIMULTANEOUSLY REDUCING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND EMISSIONS.  
12 WE CAN'T MEET OUR CLIMATE GOALS WITHOUT THESE MEASURES. AND,  
13 SO, I WOULD URGE YOU TO KEEP THAT IN MIND, NOT JUST FOR THE  
14 BAY AREA, BUT AS A MODEL FOR THE STATE AND THE NATION AS YOU  
15 CONTINUE DELIBERATIONS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE LAUREL  
18 PAGEANT, FOLLOWED BY LAST SPEAKER.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HELLO LAUREN, PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC  
21 TRANSPORTATION. TWO MAIN POINTS. I THINK YOU ALL KNOW OUR  
22 POSITION, BUT JUST ABOUT THE SCENARIOS. 1 AND 1A THINKING  
23 ABOUT WHAT WILL PASS, THIS MEASURE NEEDS TO GET A SIGNIFICANT  
24 NUMBER OF VOTES IN ALAMEDA COUNTY TO PASS. I THINK WE CAN ALL  
25 AGREE ON THAT. A MEASURE THIS'S GOING TO REQUIRE MAJOR SERVICE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CUTS AT AC TRANSIT CAN'T PASS ALAMEDA COUNTY ESPECIALLY GIVEN  
2 SALES TAX ALAMEDA COUNTY HAS THE HIGHEST SALES TAX IN THE  
3 STATE OF CALIFORNIA. IT'S EXTREMELY INEQUITABLE TABLE TO THIS  
4 FUNDING MECHANISM BUT ALSO PRIZING THIS FARE REVENUE LOSS  
5 INSTEAD OF OPERATOR NEED BUT IT'S EXTREMELY HARD TO IMAGINE  
6 THIS MEASURE CAN PASS. THE OTHER, I'M THINKING ABOUT WHO  
7 RELIES ON PUBLIC TRANSIT IT I RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. BUT I  
8 ALSO WANT EVERYONE WHO DRIVES TO IMAGINE WHAT HAPPENS WITH  
9 EVERYONE WHO TAKES A BUS OR TAKES A TRAIN ACROSS THE BRIDGE,  
10 WAS DRIVING. EVERYONE RELIES ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, CLIMATE  
11 EMISSIONS CLIMATE GOALS RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, ALL RELY AS  
12 WELL AS THOSE OF US WHO TAKE TRANSIT EVERY DAY TO DO  
13 EVERYTHING WE NEED TO DO. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER WILL BE  
16 DILLON, FOLLOWED BY WARREN CUSHMAN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I'M DYLAN, I AT THE NON-PROFIT SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT  
19 RIDERS AND A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
20 COALITION. SCENARIO 1A GENERATES ENOUGH FUNDING TO ADDRESS  
21 NEEDS OF HOLE AGENCIES LIKE AC TRANSIT AND MUNI WHICH WILL  
22 LEAD TO SERIOUS SERVICE CUTS. MUNI SERVES TENS OF THOUSANDS OF  
23 RIDERS FROM OUTSIDE SAN FRANCISCO EVERY DAY SO WE NEED TO BE  
24 WORKING TOGETHER REGIONALLY AS WE ALL HAVE TO ENSURE ALL PARTS  
25 OF OUR REGIONAL SYSTEM CAN WORK TOGETHER. BECAUSE IT ONE LINK



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BREAKS, THE WHOLE CHAIN CAN FALL APART. WE ALSO NEED TO OFFER  
2 VOTERS SOMETHING THEY ARE WILLING TO GET BEHIND BART'S RECENT  
3 POLLING SHOWED VOTER TRANSFORMATION NINE COUNTY MEASURE  
4 PROVIDE REVENUE WE NEED TO ADDRESS AGENCY SHORTFALLS, WITHOUT  
5 INTRODUCING MULTIPLE COMPETING MEASURES ON THE SAME BALLOT  
6 PLEASE SUPPORT COMPONENTS THAT WILL FULLY FUND TRANSIT  
7 OPERATIONS AND TRANSFORMATION OUR REGION NEEDS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST BOARDROOM  
10 SPEAKER WILL BE WARREN CUSHMAN.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** IS THE MIC ON? HELLO. OKAY. HI. WARREN CUSHMAN  
13 COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING. FIRST OF ALL,  
14 PLEASE TAKE A STRONG LOOK AT TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
15 PLAN, ESPECIALLY THE WAYFINDING AND PARATRANSIT PIECES. PEOPLE  
16 WITH DISABILITIES NEED BOTH OF THOSE. SO, AS YOU DELIBERATE,  
17 CONSIDER THOSE. AND TRY AND SUPPORT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. IN  
18 TERMS OF OUR SPEAKERS THAT HAD TO DO WITH DRIVING, I CAN  
19 APPRECIATE THOSE NEEDS. WE ALSO NEED TO CONSIDER THAT NOBODY  
20 WANTS TO BE ON THE ROAD. [LAUGHTER] SO, WE DEFINITELY NEED TO  
21 MAKE SURE WE DO BOTH. WE WANT TO SUPPORT FOLKS WHO DRIVE. WE  
22 ALSO NEED TO SUPPORT FOLKS WHO HAVE ZERO OTHER CHOICES BUT TO  
23 USE TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND MOVING ON TO OUR  
2 ONLINE RAISED HANDS. ANTHONY CAMPAGNA, YOU HAVE A MINUTE AND A  
3 HALF FOLLOWED BY ALETA DUPREE.

4  
5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANTHONY, I AM A BERKELEY  
6 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDER WHO HAS BEEN FOLLOWING THIS PROCESS  
7 FROM THE BEGINNING, SINCE IT WAS AT THE STATE SENATE AND  
8 THROUGHOUT THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS IT LOOKS TO ME IN THE AGENDA  
9 THAT THE COMMITTEE IS ABOUT TO RESOLVE BY SENDING A SET OF  
10 GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT ON TO MTC WITHOUT A FINAL PLAN  
11 RECOMMENDATION. IT'S CONCERNING THAT WE'RE AT THIS PLACE OF NO  
12 CONSENSUS I HOPE THE COMMITTEE WILL SUPPORT SCENARIOS THAT  
13 FULLY FUND TRANSIT AND THAT DON'T EVOLVE INTO A COUNTY FLEX  
14 SLUSH FUND WITHIN EIGHT YEARS. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT  
15 THAT THE GRADIENTS AGREEMENT INCLUDE OPERATOR COORDINATED  
16 SCENARIO AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT RANKED FIRST. I THINK  
17 SCENARIO 1A COMES CLOSE BUT IT'S IN THE LARGE ENOUGH TO AVOID  
18 MAJOR SHORTFALLS. THE BEST PART WE HAVE THERE AT LEAST IS TEN  
19 YEARS OF TAX ARE DEDICATED TO TRANSIT. HYBRID SCENARIO TWO IS  
20 THIRD BEST AND SCENARIO 1, 30 YEARS, WITH HARDLY ANY TRANSIT  
21 FUNDING IS JUST NOT IT. PLEASE CONSIDER OPERATOR SCENARIO IN  
22 YOUR GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THOSE WHO  
23 SUPPORT TRANSIT RANK THAT FIRST.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE ALETA  
2 DUPREE FOLLOWED BY WENDI KALLINS.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR JIM SPERING AND MEMBERS. ALETA  
5 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER CAN TEAM FOLDS. I WANT TO  
6 SEE CONSENSUS, AND I THINK I SUPPORT THE STRAIGHT SALES TAX  
7 MEASURE FIRST AND FOREMOST. IT'S SIMPLE. HYBRID POSSIBILITIES  
8 ARE MORE COMPLICATED. I DO LIKE THE TRANSFORMATIONAL WORK THAT  
9 WE'RE GOING TO DO WITH THE WAYFINDING AND CLIPPER START. AND I  
10 PROBABLY SPEAK MORE ON THAT THAN ANYBODY. TRANSIT DOES HELP  
11 DRIVERS. I HAVE OWNED CARS FOR THE PAST 25 YEARS AND I STILL  
12 DO HAVE A DRIVER'S LICENSE. BUT I DON'T WANT TO BE STUCK IN  
13 TRAFFIC IF I DO DECIDE TO RENT-A-CAR, HOPEFULLY AN ELECTRIC  
14 CAR. AND IT IS BECOMING MORE EXPENSIVE TO ENSURE PERSONAL  
15 VEHICLES IN THIS DAY AND AGE, WHICH I'M NOT HAPPY ABOUT THAT,  
16 BUT THAT MIGHT BE ANOTHER REASON FOR PEOPLE TO MOVE ON FROM  
17 CAR OWNERSHIP AND TO TAKE TRANSIT. SO, WE NEED TO HAVE A  
18 TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS THERE FOR THOSE CHANGES. BECAUSE I HAVE  
19 LIVED THAT MYSELF IN MOVING AWAY FROM CAR OWNERSHIP. ALL THIS  
20 HAS TO COME TOGETHER. AND I DO USE RIDE SHARES, WHICH USE  
21 ROADS, TRANSIT WILL HELP RIDE SHARES SO I'M NOT SITTING IN  
22 TRAFFIC. I HOPE YOU CAN COME TO CONSENSUS TODAY AND PASS  
23 SOMETHING BUT I'M MOST HE IN FAVOR OF CLEAN SALES TAX  
24 PROPOSAL.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER WENDI  
2 KALLINS FOLLOWED BY HOWARD WONG.

3

4 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS, SUSTAINABLE MARIN AND  
5 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO  
6 SPEAK ON THIS MEASURE. I WILL REITERATE AGAIN THE NEED FOR THE  
7 NORTH BAY TO BE INCLUDED. WE HAVE MANY DIFFERENCE REGIONAL  
8 NEEDS IN THE NORTH BAY AND I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE  
9 INCLUDE US IN THE OVERALL PICTURE. I NOTICED IN PRESENTING THE  
10 VARIOUS PROGRAMS THAT MTC WAS SHOWING YOU, ONE OF THE THINGS  
11 THAT WAS MISSING IS THE TRANSIT 2050 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN.  
12 NOW, THAT'S NOT A PILOT PROGRAM. THAT'S PROBABLY WHY IT WASN'T  
13 PRESENTED. BUT TO ME, THE CONNECTED NETWORK IS PROBABLY THE  
14 MOST IMPORTANT PIECE OF CREATING A REALLY SEAMLESS BAY AREA  
15 TRANSIT SYSTEM. WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO ARRIVE AT A STATION AND  
16 BE ABLE TO NOT HAVE TO WAIT A HALF HOUR FOR THE TRAIN OR THE  
17 BUS THAT WE NEED TO CONTINUE ON IN OUR -- IN OUR TRAVELS. SO,  
18 THAT IS PROBABLY THE MOST COMPLICATED. AND POTENTIAL AN  
19 EXPENSIVE THING TO ADD INTO THE MIX. BUT I WOULD REALLY HIKE  
20 TO HEAR HOW THE COMMISSIONERS FEEL ABOUT THAT PARTICULAR  
21 ISSUE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE HOWARD  
24 WONG FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY  
2 COUNCIL SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. THINKING A LITTLE BIT OUT-  
3 OF-THE-BOX, I'M WONDERING IF FUNDING SOURCES COULD BE THOUGHT  
4 OF AS A PACKAGE RATHER THAN A ONE OR TWO TYPES OF TAXES OR  
5 FEES. EACH POSSIBLE FUNDING SOURCE HAS DETRACTORS THAT ARE  
6 PERCEIVED AS HARMFUL BY SPECIFIC GROUPS. SO WHAT IF WE WERE TO  
7 LOOK AT A WAY OF SPREADING THE IMPACTS BY A WIDER RANGE OF  
8 FUNDING SOURCES AND THUS GAIN WIDER SUPPORT. FOR EXAMPLE, WHAT  
9 IF WE HAVE A COMBINATION OF MANY TAXES AND FEES, A SMALL SALES  
10 TAX, A SMALL PARCEL TAX, A SMALL PAYROLL TAX, A SMALL VEHICLE  
11 MILES TRAVELED TAX? A SMALL BRIDGE AND ROAD TOLLS, SMALL  
12 PARKING FEES, SHIFTING SOME CAPITAL FUND THROUGH OPERATING  
13 BUDGETS, SOME SMALL STATE AND FEDERAL SUBSIDY SO THE END  
14 RESULT WOULD BE THE COMP INVASION A PACKAGE OF MANY FEES, AND  
15 TAXES AND NOT OVERALL BURDENED THAT MUST BE MORE SUPPORTIVE.  
16 THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS VINAY  
19 PIMPLE FOLLOWED BY VALERIE LANCY.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL.  
22 FIRST OF ALL, I'M GLAD TO SEE THE TAX -- BECAUSE IT --  
23 PARTICULARLY HARD. I'M ALSO HAPPY TO SEE THAT YOU'RE MOVING  
24 TOWARDS A SHORT-TERM MEASURE. BECAUSE YOU KNOW, DISCUSSIONS  
25 FOCUSED ON TECHNOLOGY, TRYING TO FIX CURRENT PROGRAMS RIGHT UP





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 UNTIL 2056 THINK ABOUT WHAT THE TECHNOLOGY WAS IN 1992. THE  
2 OTHER THING PARTICULARLY ON COST OF TECHNOLOGY LIKE AUTONOMOUS  
3 VEHICLES ALSO WHAT'S HAM WITH SAN FRANCISCO CENTER OF JOBS WE  
4 DON'T KNOW WHAT BART IS GOING TO BE 15 YEARS FROM NOW SO TEN  
5 YEAR MEASURES, THE OTHER THING I WANT TO SAY FOLKS CAN, YOU  
6 FOLKS ON MTC, IS MAKE THE BUSES RUN ON TIME. PROBABLY WHY  
7 PEOPLE DON'T USE TRANSIT TO GO TO WORK. BECAUSE THEY CAN'T  
8 SHOW UP ON TIME. I HAVE NEVER SEEN AN ITEM ON HERE. SO, TAKE  
9 CARE OF THAT. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS  
12 VALERIE LANCY FOLLOWED BY HARE NEIL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HELLO BOARD. FIRST OFF I THINK IT'S WILD THE  
15 COMMITTEE DISAPPOINT HAVE SOME CONSENSUS HOW TO APPROACH THIS.  
16 IT FEELS LIKE THIS IS A CATASTROPHIC ISSUE FOR THE BAY AREA  
17 THAT KEEPS GETTING KICKED FURTHER AND FURTHER DOWN THE ROAD IN  
18 THE EVENTUALLY IT LANDS ON SOMEONE ELSE'S LAP AND BECOMES  
19 SOMEONE ELSE'S PROBLEM. AS FAR AS SPECIFIC OPINIONS AND  
20 PROPOSALS GO I'M NOT A POLICY EXPERT BUT OPERATOR CENTRIC  
21 PROPOSAL SEEMS TO BE THE MOST APPEALING FOR KEEPING TRANSIT  
22 RUNNING AT A USABLE LEVEL FOLLOWED BY 1A DEFINITELY RANKING  
23 SCENARIO ONE THE LAST. I WOULD ENCOURAGE THE COMMITTEE TO  
24 CONTROL THE AMOUNT OF HIGHWAY SLUSH FUNDS THAT ARE GOING TO BE  
25 POTENTIAL PROPOSED OBVIOUSLY THAT'S SOMETHING THAT CAN ATTRACT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF VOTES BUT IT'S NOT SUBSTANTIALLY GOING TO  
2 HELP CONGESTION IN THE REGION AND HELP TRANSIT GET FUNDED.  
3 PARTICULARLY, A REMINDER THAT VOTERS NEED A REMINDER ABOUT THE  
4 IMPACT OF TRANSIT ON CONGESTION. WE HAVE BART HAVING EXIST  
5 CAPACITY TO THE BAY BRIDGE LOOKING AT A BAD SCENARIO IF WE'RE  
6 PUSHING MORE AND MORE PEOPLE OFF DUE DECREASING SERVICE  
7 GETTING MORE PEOPLE ON THE ROADS THAT'S EXPENSE AND I HAVE  
8 HARD TO SOLVE. ALSO IN THE SCENARIO TEMPORARY BECAUSE DOWNTOWN  
9 COMMUTING HAS SHRINK IT WOULD BE PRETTY DIFFICULT TO BET  
10 AGAINST THAT COMING BACK IN MY OPINION. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** NEXT SPEAKER IS HARRY, FOLLOWED BY  
13 BRIAN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COMMITTEE MY NAME IS HARRY NEIL I'M A SAN JOSE  
16 TRANSIT ADVOCATE. I'M REALLY CONCERNED OF THE DIRECTION THAT  
17 THIS IS CONTINUED TO HEAD IN I BELIEVE THAT THE OPERATOR  
18 SCENARIO WITH THE PARCEL TAX OF FIVE COUNTIES I THINK IS BY  
19 FAR THE BEST PRESENTED AND CLEAR BEST COMPROMISE THAT WE HAVE.  
20 TO THOSE EARLIER WHO MENTIONED THAT VERY FEW PEOPLE IN THE BAY  
21 AREA TAKE TRANSIT COMPARED TO DRIVING, THAT IS NOT A  
22 REFLECTION OF THE INHERENT NEEDS OF PEOPLE. THAT IS A  
23 REFLECTION OF THE LACK OF COMPETITIVENESS OF TRANSIT TODAY  
24 REFLECTING LACK OF FUNDING. THE -- ONE OF THE ONLY TRANSIT  
25 OPERATORS IN REALLY THE ENTIRE STATE THAT HAS ENOUGH FUNDING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 IS MUNI AND YOU CAN SEE THAT BECAUSE THAT MUNI HAS AN ENORMOUS  
2 NUMBER OF RIDERS AND A MUCH HIGHER PROPORTION OF TRANSIT  
3 RIDERS COMPARED TO DRIVERS THAN ANYWHERE ELSE IN THE STATE. IF  
4 WE'RE ABLE TO BRING EVERYONE ELSE UP TO THE LEVEL AS MUNI.  
5 MUCH MORE PEOPLE WOULD BE TAKING TRANSIT IT'S NOT A REFLECTION  
6 THAT PEOPLE DISLIKE TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** BRIAN CULBERTSON. YOU HAVE A MINUTE  
9 AND A HALF.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** BRIAN CULBERTSON, RIDER IN OAKLAND I WANT TO  
12 ENCOURAGE THE COMMITTEE TO COME TO CONSENSUS AROUND A MEASURE  
13 THAT SUPPORTS TRANSIT OPERATOR FUNDING AND NOT HIGHWAY FUNDING  
14 OR ANY OTHER THINGS WE HAVE A TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING  
15 CRISIS THAT'S THE MAIN FOCUS OF THIS MEASURE. THE AREA THAT  
16 HELPS THAT THE MOST IS THE OPERATOR SCENARIO. I ENCOURAGE  
17 MOVING FORWARD WITH THAT OPTION AND FOCUS ON SOLVING HAD TO  
18 CORE ISSUE OF FINDING SUSTAINABLE PROVIDING SUSTAINABLE  
19 TRANSPORTATION. I ENCOURAGE YOU TO DO POLLING ON A SQUARE FOOT  
20 PARCEL TAX. BART POLLING WAS ON FLAT PARCEL TAX. I ENCOURAGE  
21 SQUARE FOOT, I BELIEVE PAYROLL TAX WOULD BE POPULAR TRANSIT IS  
22 FUNDED IN CITIES LIKE NEW YORK CITY WHERE TRANSIT IS USED A  
23 LOT BY THE POPULATION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC  
2 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY STUART, ARE YOU READY TO GO INTO  
5 YOUR.

6

7 **STUART COHEN:** THANK YOU FOR THAT PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU  
8 EVERYBODY. I DID WANT TO POINT OUT IN RESPONSE TO PUBLIC  
9 COMMENT, THIS HAS BEEN A BIG FOCUS ON TRANSIT AND THIS FISCAL  
10 CLIFF THAT AGENCIES ARE FACING, AS WELL AS HAD IMPROVED  
11 TRANSIT, BUT IN THE SCENARIOS WE HAVE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF  
12 FUNDING THAT WOULD BE DEDICATED TOWARDS COUNTY FLEX. WE DIDN'T  
13 REALLY EXPLAIN THAT TODAY. BUT THAT'S COUNTIES WOULD -- THE  
14 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES THERE WOULD HAVE THE ABILITY TO SPEND  
15 THAT ON MOST ANY EXPENDITURE, AS LONG AS IT'S ALREADY IN THE  
16 APPROVED REGIONAL PLAN THAT MIGHT INCLUDE LOCAL STREETS AND  
17 ROADS AND ANY KIND OF CAPITAL EXPANSION AND THOSE PLANS WOULD  
18 PROBABLY START BEING DEVELOPED KIND OF LATE IN 2025 OR EARLY  
19 2026 SO THAT WHEN FOLKS WENT TO THE BALLOT, THEY COULD GET TO  
20 SEE WHAT WOULD BE IN THE PLAN, YOU KNOW, AND THAT WOULD BE  
21 MORE THAN TRANSIT. ONLY ONE THAT'S TRANSIT ONLY WAS THE 1A,  
22 THE 10-YEAR VERSION OF OUR PLAN. SO, I DO THANK YOU FOR THE  
23 COMMENTS. AND I THINK A LOT OF THEM ARE REALLY RIGHT ON, THAT  
24 THE VOTERS WANT TO SEE A REALLY GOOD BALANCED MEASURE THAT HAS  
25 VARIOUS MODES IN IT. AND, SO, WITH THAT WE ARE GOING TO GET TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT RANKING. NOW, IF YOU CAN PULL UP  
2 THE GOALS, THE GRADIENT OF AGREEMENT SLIDE DECK, THAT WOULD  
3 BEING GREAT. AND AT OUR LAST MEETING, WE HAD THESE SCENARIOS.  
4 WE, THOSE SCENARIOS HAD A WIDE RANGE OF COMPONENTS TO THEM,  
5 THOUGH, THINGS LIKE THE REVENUE MECHANISM, DURING, INVESTMENT  
6 FOCUS. AND SO TODAY'S GOAL IS TO HELP TEASE APART THE LEVEL OF  
7 SUPPORT FOR EACH COMPONENT OF IT. SINCE YOU COULDN'T REALLY DO  
8 THAT WHEN IT'S ALL GROUPED TOGETHER AS A SCENARIO. AND, SO,  
9 WE'RE GOING TO RATE SOME OF THOSE COMPONENTS TODAY. ONE IS  
10 STRONGLY AGREE, FIVE STRONGLY DISAGREE, THE COLUMN SAYS  
11 VERBALIZED NUANCE LOOKING FOR VOTES TODAY TO GET A SENSE OF  
12 THE GROUP WE'RE GOING TO USE TWO METHODS WE HAVE A LINK IN  
13 YOUR E-MAIL THIS IS SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS INCLUDING EX-  
14 OFFICIO MEMBERS THAT WILL ALLOW YOU TO ACCESS THE SURVEY TOOL  
15 ON YOUR PHONE OR ON YOUR COMPUTER. WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH  
16 THE FIRST QUESTIONS ALL OF THEM KIND OF QUICKLY SO THAT YOU  
17 CAN SEE THE QUESTIONS TOGETHER AND THEN YOU SHOULD FILL OUT  
18 THE SURVEY AND IN THE MEANTIME, SECOND THING IS THE PAPER FORM  
19 IN FRONT YOU IN CASE YOU WANT TO MARK UP THE PAPER AS WE GO  
20 ALONG AND THIS WAY AT THE END WHEN YOU WANT TO FILL OUT THE  
21 ELECTRONIC SURVEY, YOU HAVE ALREADY, YOU KNOW, CAN LOOK AT THE  
22 PAPER. SO, HOWEVER YOU LIKE TO DO THINGS, THAT WORKS. AND, SO,  
23 I'LL GO THROUGH THEM AND AFTER SOME CLARIFYING QUESTIONS,  
24 AFTER I TALK THROUGH THE QUESTIONS, THAT'S WHEN WE REALLY WANT  
25 YOU TO DO THE ELECTRONIC COMPONENT. AND WE'LL GIVE YOU FIVE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MINUTES FOR THAT. SO, THERE WILL BE TIME. ONCE EVERYONE HAS  
2 SUBMITTED THEIR RATINGS, WE'LL GET TO SEE THE RESULTS ON THE  
3 SCREEN WE'LL SEE AGGREGATE THROUGH BAR GRAPHS WHAT THE SENSE  
4 OF THE ROOM IS. AND SO THE PUBLIC AND FOR ALL OF YOUR SAKE,  
5 YOU WILL BE ASKED TO RAISE YOUR HANDS TO BASICALLY SHOW WHAT  
6 ANSWER YOU HAD GIVEN FOR THE PARTICULAR QUESTION. SO, THE  
7 OTHER REASON YOU MAY WANT TO WRITE DOWN ON PAPER TO BE ABLE TO  
8 GO BACK AND REMEMBER WHAT YOU WROTE BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT OF  
9 QUESTIONS. AFTER WE GET TO SEE THE BAR GRAPHS AND GET TO HAVE  
10 MORE CONVERSATION ABOUT THE SCENARIOS INCLUDING HOW YOU MIGHT  
11 WANT TO IMPROVE THEM WE'RE GOING TO TAKE A SLIGHTLY LONGER  
12 BREAK COULD BE A SHORT LUNCH BREAK BECAUSE IT'S A REALLY LONG  
13 MEETING, COMMISSIONER SPERING WILL DETERMINE THE LENGTH MAYBE  
14 AROUND 15 MINUTES. WHEN WE RETURN FROM THAT BREAK, WE'LL BE  
15 ABLE TO CONSIDER A MOTION THAT RECOMMENDS THE SPECIFIC  
16 ELEMENTS TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND THAT  
17 WOULD BE FORWARDED TO THE MTC COMMISSION. AND THEN JUST SO  
18 EVERYBODY KNOWS, IN THE AUDIENCE, AND FOR YOURSELVES, WE WILL  
19 PUBLISH THE BAR GRAPHS, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE VOTE WAS, AS WELL  
20 AS THE VERY SPECIFIC VOTE THAT EACH YOU MADE ON EACH OF THESE  
21 QUESTIONS. SO THAT WILL BE ON THE WEB SITE AND FORWARDED TO  
22 THE COMMISSION, AS WELL. SO, LOOKS LIKE A LOT OF YOU HAVE BEEN  
23 LOGGING ON. I CAN GIVE YOU ANOTHER MINUTE. BUT, AGAIN, YOU  
24 WILL HAVE TIME AFTER WE GO THROUGH THESE QUESTIONS. AND IF YOU  
25 ARE HAVING ANY PROBLEMS AT THAT POINT, ONCE WE GO THROUGH THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 QUESTIONS, WE'LL HAVE KAREN WHO WILL HERE TO RUN AROUND AND  
2 HELP WITH THE TECHNOLOGY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE FIRST  
3 QUESTION THAT WE'LL BE CONSIDERING -- NO. IT'S A DIFFERENT  
4 DECK. IT SHOULD BE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT DECK. ANYBODY ABLE  
5 TO GET THE SURVEY IN THE -- YEAH IT'S AN E-MAIL THAT CAME FROM  
6 BRITTANY THIS MORNING CALLED GRADIENT DECK, OCTOBER 21ST, AND  
7 IN THE MEANTIME I'LL START TALKING THROUGH IT A LITTLE BIT.  
8 THE FIRST QUESTION THAT WE WILL CONSIDER IS GEOGRAPHIC SCOPE.  
9 AND THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS HAVE THIS IN THAT HANDOUT THAT THE  
10 GIVEN WHILE WE WAIT FOR THE SLIDES. SPECIFICALLY WE WOULD LIKE  
11 TO YOU RATE YOUR LEVEL OF AGREEMENT WITH WHETHER THIS SHOULD  
12 BE AT LEAST A FOUR COUNTY MEASURE, WITH ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA,  
13 SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN MATEO AUTOMATICALLY INCLUDED AND WITH  
14 AN OPT IN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE OTHER FIVE COUNTIES. YOU COULD  
15 TAKE DOWN THAT DECK. THAT IS NOT THE ONE. ALTHOUGH THAT IS A  
16 VERY INTERESTING SLIDE. THE SECOND PART OF THE QUESTION IS  
17 RANKING YOUR SUPPORT FOR A NINE-COUNTY MEASURE. NOW, REMEMBER,  
18 THESE VARIABLES ARE NOT SUPPOSED TO BE SHORTHAND, AS WE DO THE  
19 FOUR COUNTY AND THE NINE COUNTY, FOR SCENARIOS ONE, HYBRID, OR  
20 MTA, OR ANY OTHER. WE'RE REALLY JUST TRYING TO GET YOUR INPUT  
21 ON HOW MUCH YOU AGREE WITH OR SUPPORT A POTENTIAL MEASURE AT  
22 THESE GEOGRAPHIES. IF THERE IS ANYBODY -- YEAH, I COULD PAUSE.  
23 BUT DOES ANYBODY HAVE -- I WON'T GO INTO THE NEXT QUESTION  
24 UNTIL I HAVE THEM, CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THE --  
25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** STUART I'M LOOKING AT THESE WE'RE SEPARATING  
2 OURSELVES FROM THE SCENARIOS THAT WERE PRESENTED TODAY, AND  
3 IT'S COMPONENTS OF A MEASURE STRIP OF THE SCENARIOS WE'RE  
4 TALKING -- WE WERE TALKING ABOUT IN THOSE ELEMENTS? OKAY.

5

6 **STUART COHEN:** THAT'S CORRECT. CLARIFYING. YES, COMMISSIONER  
7 CHAVEZ?

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THIS IS THE -- I JUST. TO MAKE SURE  
10 I'M ON THE RIGHT SURVEY MONKEY. THIS IS SIX QUESTIONS,  
11 CORRECT?

12

13 **STUART COHEN:** YES. STARTS WITH YOUR NAME IS NUMBER ONE THEN  
14 SECOND IS GEOGRAPHY QUESTION.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONLY BECAUSE YOU SAID THERE WAS A LOT OF  
17 QUESTIONS I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE.

18

19 **STUART COHEN:** OH THEY'RE ALL BROKEN DOWN IN SUBQUESTIONS.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND THE SECOND IS THERE IS NO WAY TO ADD IN ANY  
22 KIND OF COMMENT ON THESE. SO, IF THERE IS SOMETHING THAT IS  
23 JUST NOT AGREEABLE, WE CAN -- I MEAN THERE IS NO WAY TO TALK  
24 IT THROUGH, DO WE JUST LEAVE IT BLANK?

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** YOU ACTUAL CLIENT LEAVE ANYTHING BLANK. OR IT  
2 WON'T BE SUBMITTED. BUT WE'LL HAVE TIME FOR CLARIFYING  
3 QUESTIONS NOW. AND THANK YOU, THAT IS THE CORRECT SLIDE.  
4 APPRECIATE THAT. AND, SO, NOW WOULD BE THE TIME, IF YOU HAD --  
5 YOU KNOW, SOMETHING THAT WAS EITHER CLARIFYING THAT YOU WANT  
6 TO GET ON THE RECORD AND NUMBER THREE IS NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN OR  
7 SOMETHING MIGHT BE THE BEST PLAY TO GO WITH SOMETHING THAT YOU  
8 WANT TO STAY OFF.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AS AN EXAMPLE, ONE SAYS DO YOU AGREE WITH THE  
11 FOLLOWING DURATIONS AND INVESTMENT UNDER TEN YEARS IT HAS  
12 TRANSIT ONLY UNDER 30 YEARS IT HAS COUNTY FLEX AND TO BE FRANK  
13 WITH YOU, I KNOW WE DESCRIBED COUNTY FLEX, TO ME, THAT ONE IS  
14 STILL A LITTLE AMORPHOUS, RIGHT? ARE WE SAYING EACH  
15 JURISDICTION HAS ULTIMATE FLEXIBILITY TO DECIDE? OR IS THAT  
16 ONE WHERE YOU HAVE SOME RULES AND GUIDELINES AS TO HOW EACH  
17 INDEPENDENT ORGANIZATION --

18

19 **STUART COHEN:** OH EXCELLENT QUESTION. THEY NOW HAVE THE SLIDES  
20 UP. SO IF WE CAN, I'LL ANSWER THAT QUESTION WHEN WE GET TO  
21 THAT SLIDE. GREAT. IF THERE IS NO CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THIS  
22 ONE, NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SECOND QUESTION IS HOW MUCH DO YOU  
23 AGREE WITH AN INVESTMENT LEVEL EQUIVALENT TO THE FOLLOWING AND  
24 FIRST LEVEL IS WE ASK FOR ADJUSTED FARES. TO POINT OUT THE  
25 FARES ARE SHOWN IN GREEN HERE AND AS YOU RECALL REMEMBER THIS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 IS THE TARGET INVESTMENT LEVEL FOR SCENARIO 1 AND 1A AND THE  
2 REASON ADJUSTED FARES WAS PROPOSED IS IT'S THE BEST MEASURE OF  
3 THE IMPACT OF LOSS OF RIDERSHIP AND FARE REVENUE AS A RESULT  
4 OF THE PANDEMIC IT'S THE MEASURE AND VERIFY I WANT TO POINT  
5 OUT FOR PEOPLE IN THE AUDIENCE WE HAVE THE PACKET OF QUESTIONS  
6 PRINTED OUT IT'S ON THE TABLE UP FRONT IF YOU WANT TO SEE THE  
7 SMALL PRINT. THE OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS ARE THE BLUE  
8 BARS AND THEY ARE AS THEY SOUND FORECAST OF OPERATING  
9 DEFICITS. THESE INCLUDE THE BLUE BARS JUST TO BE CLEAR, A  
10 COMBINATION OF THE OPERATOR'S REVENUES, ALL OF THE REVENUES  
11 THAT THEY USE FOR OPERATIONS AND ALL OF THEIR COST INCLUDING  
12 OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE COSTS. SO IT'S A VERY DIFFERENT  
13 NUMBER FOR SOME OF THE OPERATORS. AND YOU KNOW, AS WE CAN SEE,  
14 SFMTA HAS KIND OF A VERY BIG VARIANCE BETWEEN THEM. SO DOES  
15 GOLDEN GATE. ARE THERE CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON YOUR LEVEL OF  
16 AGREEMENT 1 TO 5 WITH THESE TWO.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** QUICK QUESTION WHAT IF YOU, SORT OF, AGREE WITH THE  
19 FOLKS FROM THE LABOR UNIONS WHO TESTIFIED ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE  
20 OF A MULTIMODAL MEASURE? SO THAT'S NOT AN OPTION HERE. WE'RE  
21 ONLY FOCUSED HERE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. SO THOSE ARE OUR TWO  
22 OPTIONS?

23

24 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH TWO QUESTIONS LATER YOU WILL HAVE THAT. WE  
25 KIND OF TALK ABOUT KIND OF A 30-YEAR BEING A MULTIMODAL.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** I WAS ALONG THE SAME LINES HERE THIS IS JUST AS TO  
3 THE ONE AND.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** JUST TRYING TO SEPARATE OUT DO YOU FEEL PASSIONATELY  
6 TO SEPARATE OUT ONE OR THE OTHER AND TAKE INTO CONSIDERATIONS  
7 WHAT YOU WANT SO YOU MIGHT THINK WELL OPERATOR REPORTED ARE,  
8 YOU KNOW, FILL MORE THE GAP, THEY'RE ALSO HARD TO REACH AND  
9 REQUIRE HIGHER TAX LEVELS GENERALLY BUT THERE IS JUST LOTS OF  
10 THINGS YOU CAN THINK ABOUT. WE'RE TRYING TO SEPARATE OUT THE  
11 COMPONENTS.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANKS CHAIR STUART I DIDN'T FOLLOW YOU SAID THE  
14 GREEN BAR ADJUSTED FARE LOSS IS THE ESTIMATE OF FAREBOX LOSSES  
15 THAT'S, SORT OF, PANDEMIC EFFECT OR CHANGE IN RIDER BEHAVIOR  
16 AND THE BLUE WHAT ACCOUNTS FOR THE DELTA WHAT'S DRIVING?

17

18 **STUART COHEN:** THE BLUE BAR IS JUST THE OPERATOR REPORTED FOR  
19 FY2627, COMPREHENSIVE INCLUSIVE OF ALL OPERATING REVENUES FROM  
20 DIFFERENT SOURCES AS WELL AS OPERATING COST A DIFFERENT METRIC  
21 THAT WAY.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU HAVE EXAMPLES OF WHAT WOULD BE DRIVERS OF  
24 THAT?

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ALIX BOCKELMAN, FOR EXAMPLE, FOR SFMTA WE HAVE  
2 TALKED ABOUT THEIR UNIQUE SITUATION THEY RELIED A LOT ON  
3 PARKING REVENUE SAN FRANCISCO IN GENERAL FUNDS WHILE MAY NOT  
4 HAVE LOST AS MANY RIDERS DURING THE PANDEMIC, HAD THE EFFECT  
5 ON SAN FRANCISCO AND THEIR CONTRIBUTIONS CPI INCREASES HAVE  
6 BEEN REAL THERE HAS BEEN INCREASES IN COST THERE WE DID ADJUST  
7 THE FARE LOSS BY 2% BUT OBVIOUSLY INFLATION HAS BEEN HIRING  
8 THAN THAT IN RECENT YEARS. THERE ARE EXAMPLES EACH OPERATOR  
9 HAS UNIQUE COST PRESSURES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOT IT. THAT'S HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THIS QUESTION HAS BEEN ASKED I APOLOGIZE IF  
14 YOU ALREADY ANSWERED IT BUT WHAT I'M HEARING PEOPLE ASK IS  
15 WITH THIS QUESTION OF TEN YEARS VERSUS 30 YEARS, THERE ARE  
16 ACTUALLY TWO DIFFERENT QUESTIONS EMBEDDED IN THAT, LENGTH OF  
17 TIME THEN THERE IS ALSO IS IT TRANSIT ONLY OR IS IT TRANSIT  
18 PLUS? SO, IDEALLY, WEEKEND ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS SEPARATELY.  
19 HOW WOULD YOU LIKE US TO APPROACH THIS?

20

21 **STUART COHEN:** I WOULD SAY LET'S SAVE THAT DISCUSSION FOR TWO  
22 QUESTIONS FROM NOW SO THE AUDIENCE CAN UNDERSTAND IT THEY WILL  
23 SEE THOSE TWO QUESTIONS TOGETHER. FOR THIS ONE REALLY JUST TRY  
24 -- I KNOW IT'S KIND OF HARD TO SEGMENT IT OUT BUT WE'RE GOING  
25 TO TRY TO LOOK AT WHICH TARGET LEVEL OF SHORTFALL YOU WOULD



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WANT TO FUND NO MATTER OF LENGTH OF TIME, NO MATTER COUNTY  
2 FLEX.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE A QUESTION. FOR CLARITY.

5

6 **STUART COHEN:** LET'S WAIT UNTIL WE GET TO THAT SLIDE. THERE IS  
7 A SLIDE COMING UP ON IT. YEAH. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THERE IS NO OPPORTUNITY TO SAY NO OPT IN? NO.  
10 THERE ISN'T, OBVIOUSLY.

11

12 **STUART COHEN:** NO. WE JUST WANTED TO LIMIT -- OKAY. NEXT SLIDE,  
13 PLEASE. SO, THIS IS THE ONE I WANT TO ADDRESS THOSE TWO  
14 COMMENTS. AND THIS ONE IS HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH THE  
15 FOLLOWING DURATIONS AND INVESTMENT LEVELS. AND WE DECIDED TO  
16 LINK THE DURATION AND INVESTMENT TOGETHER BECAUSE THE 10-YEAR  
17 MEASURE MAKE MORE YOU SENSE TO PUCKS ON THE IMMEDIATE AND  
18 URGENT TRANSIT NEEDS. THAT WAS LIKE THE RESPONSE I GAVE TO  
19 ADINA THAT KIND OF STARTING, IF THERE IS NOT ENOUGH FUNDING  
20 REALLY FOR MULTI-MODAL IN A TEN YEAR MEASURE BECAUSE THE NEEDS  
21 ARE SO URGENT SOON AND IT WOULD KIND OF MAKE IT MORE  
22 COMPLICATED IF THAT WAS ONLY THE CASE IN SOME COUNTIES THAT  
23 THEY HAD IT. WHILE A 30 YEAR MEASURE GENERALLY MAKES MORE  
24 SENSE TO INCLUDE A MULTI-MODAL PACKAGE WITH BROADER BENEFITS  
25 THAT SUPPORT COUNTY PRIORITIES AND MAY APPEAL TO A WIDE RANGE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OF VOTERS. THEORETICALLY IT'S POSSIBLE TO DO MULTIMODAL OR TEN  
2 YEAR TRANSIT ONLY SEEMED UNLIKELY ENOUGH THAT WE JUST THOUGHT  
3 WE WOULD BUNDLE THESE TWO TOGETHER

4

5 **SPEAKER:** BUT IF YOU LOOK AT THE MTA PROPOSAL IT IS BASICALLY  
6 TRANSIT PLUS BUT IN A TEN YEAR PACKAGE.

7

8 **STUART COHEN:** YOU MEAN MULTI-MODAL? IT HAS SOME CAPITAL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** IT HAS A LITTLE FLEX. IT HAS -- I MEAN NOT EVERY  
11 COUNTY SAN FRANCISCO WOULDN'T GET FLEX IT WOULD ONLY SPEND IT  
12 ON --

13

14 **STUART COHEN:** I GUESS YOU WOULD HAVE WHAT WOULD BE TOKEN FLEX  
15 SO THAT YOU CAN APPEAL TO VOTERS. SO, WE COULD TAKE THAT,  
16 AGAIN, FEEL FREE TO GIVE COMMENTS THAT THAT SHOULD BE  
17 CONSIDERED. WE'RE JUST TRYING TO NARROW IT DOWN. BUT THANK  
18 YOU. YOU ARE CORRECT. IT COULD BE DONE THAT WAY. ANY OTHER  
19 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THIS ONE? OTHERWISE WE'LL MOVE ON.  
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS IS GOING TO BE AN INTERESTING ONE  
21 TO SEE THE RESULTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. BUT IT'S HOW MUCH DO  
22 YOU AGREE WITH THE USE OF THESE REVENUE MECHANISMS. REALLY,  
23 THE QUESTION HERE IS HOW MUCH, YOU KNOW, SHOULD WE CONTINUE TO  
24 EXPLORE THESE MECHANISMS. BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY THERE IS A LOT OF  
25 EXPLORATION AND POLLING THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE BEFORE A FINAL



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MECHANISM IS DETERMINED. IF YOU REALLY THINK THEY SHOULD BE  
2 TAKEN OFF THE TABLE, YOU MIGHT WANT TO THINK ABOUT A FIVE OR  
3 FOUR, BUT THAT'S THE WAY TO THINK ABOUT THIS QUESTION. ANY  
4 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THIS NUMBER FIVE HERE? NEXT SLIDE. THE  
5 FINAL QUESTION IS HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH THESE TAX  
6 STRUCTURES OR FUNDING FRAMEWORKS. AND WE WANT YOU TO RATE FOUR  
7 OF THEM. FIRST IS A SIMPLE SINGLE TAX THAT HAS ONE RATE ACROSS  
8 COUNTIES. SECOND WOULD INCLUDE MULTIPLE TAX SOURCES AND THAT  
9 IS TWO SOURCES OR MORE LIKE THE HYBRID SCENARIO THIRD IS  
10 VARIABLE RATE WHERE THE RATES WOULD BE DIFFERENT IN DIFFERENT  
11 COUNTIES THIS WAS THE IDEA BROUGHT FORWARD TODAY IN THE MTA  
12 PROPOSAL FINALLY SHOULD THE MEASURE ALLOW FOR FINANCING OR  
13 LOANS TO MEET DIFFERENT CASH FLOW NEEDS BY COUNTIES AND THIS  
14 WAS AN INNOVATIVE AND KEY FEATURE OF MTA'S PROPOSAL AND I WANT  
15 TO BRING UP ONE CLARIFICATION OF A COMMENT MADE BEFORE ABOUT  
16 THE VARIABLE RATES I HAD SAID IF IT GOT LONG WOULD NEED TO BE  
17 IN THE BALLOT BOOK THAT WOULD MIGHT BE HARD TO GET THROUGH THE  
18 LEGISLATURE IF YOU STILL TRY TO GET LEGISLATION THAT WOULD  
19 EXPAND THE ALLOWABLE BALLOT QUESTION SIZE TO 150 WORDS INSTEAD  
20 OF 75 HOPE THAT YOU DIDN'T COME UP WITH SO MANY RATES THAT  
21 WOULD FIT IN THERE SO WANT TO BRING THAT UP IT'S A SECOND  
22 OPPORTUNITY I THINK WITH LESS LEGAL RISK BECAUSE AT LEAST  
23 WOULD ALL BE IN THE BALLOT QUESTION. DOES ANYBODY HAVE  
24 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS ON THIS?  
25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **GINA PAPAN:** COULD YOU, SORRY, A CAME LATE, COULD YOU EXPLAIN  
2 MORE ON THIS ABOUT FINANCING OR LOANS TO MEET DIFFERENTLY CASH  
3 FLOW NEEDS WHERE WOULD THOSE FINANCING AND LOANS COME FROM?  
4

5 **STUART COHEN:** THIS WAS THE MTA PROPOSAL FOR THE FIRST TIME  
6 REALLY THEY SAID IF THE FUNDING STARTS TO FLOW IN JANUARY 2027  
7 ALREADY IN THE MIDDLE OF THE FISCAL YEAR THAT WE'RE EXPECTING  
8 FISCAL CLIFFS TO HIT AND THEY WOULD WANT IMMEDIATE INFUSION OF  
9 FUNDS SO THE WAY TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN WOULD BE TO FINANCE OFF  
10 OF FUTURE YEARS AND THE WAY THEY DO IT IS THEY HAVE AN 11 AND  
11 A HALF YEAR MEASURE BUT TEN YEAR EXPENDITURE PLAN BASICALLY  
12 BORROWING FROM THOSE LATTER YEARS. IN A 30 YEAR MEASURE YOU  
13 COULD JUST BRING FORWARD FINANCE FOR FUNDS THAT COULD BE PAID  
14 OFF OVER A LONGER DURATION. FINANCING FOR OPERATIONS, I THINK,  
15 AS FOLKS KNOW, IS NOT TYPICALLY DONE AND THEREFORE COMES AT A  
16 HIGH FINANCIAL COST. BUT, THIS IS A ONCE IN A CENTURY PANDEMIC  
17 THAT HAS CAUSED THIS AND TO GET OVER A COUPLE OF YEARS THAT'S  
18 SOMETHING THAT COULD BE A DISCUSSION AMONGST COMMUNITY MEMBERS  
19 AND THE COMMISSION.  
20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY SECOND QUESTION. SORRY. THE MULTI-TAX SOURCE  
22 IN A SINGLE MEASURE. SO YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE ONE ABOVE, SO,  
23 LIKE, OF THE COMBINATION OF SALES, PARCEL, OR -- INTERESTING.  
24

25 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH.





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** OH, SUNSHINE, HAD YOUR HAND UP?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** JUST CLARIFYING MULTIPLE TAX SOURCES THAT'S WOULD BE  
7 JUST WHAT YOU GUYS HAVE POSTED IT WOULDN'T BE ADDING IN  
8 ADDITIONAL TAX SOURCES THAT ARE WE HAVEN'T DISCUSSED IN THIS  
9 POWERPOINT?

10

11 **STUART COHEN:** EXCELLENT QUESTION. NO. I THINK THIS IS MEANT TO  
12 BE OPEN-ENDED. HONESTLY, IF A TAX SOURCE WAS FOUND THAT WAS  
13 POPULAR AND WOULD PASS AND THAT WAS, YOU KNOW, ACCEPTABLE TO  
14 THE COMMISSION, I THINK THEY WOULD BE ALL EARS. SO, NO THIS  
15 COULD BE ANY -- JUST MULTIPLE TAX SOURCES IN A SINGLE MEASURE  
16 FOR ANY TAX SOURCE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** WOULD IT BE DEFINED BEFORE WE PUT IT INTO A BILL?  
19 LAST TIME IT WASN'T DEFINED AND IT CAUSED A LOT OF PROBLEMS.

20

21 **STUART COHEN:** GREAT QUESTION. THIS IS REALLY IMAGINING THE  
22 FINAL MEASURE. THE NEXT STEP IS I THINK WITH THIS QUESTION IS  
23 WHAT DO WE POLL ON AND DO WE, YOU KNOW, TAKE THE ENERGY AND,  
24 YOU KNOW, RESOURCES, TO PUT OUT SOMETHING LIKE OUR HYBRID  
25 SCENARIO INTO A POLL. I THINK THAT QUESTION OF WHETHER THIS IS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 STRUCTURED LIKE SB1031, WITH MULTIPLE SOURCES POSSIBLE, AND  
2 KEEPING IT FLEXIBLE IS NOT MEANT TO BE CAPTURED IN THIS  
3 QUESTION.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO HAS EVERYBODY -- CAN WE GO AHEAD AND  
8 TAKE A BREAK AND YOU GATHER --

9

10 **STUART COHEN:** YES. SO, NOW, IF EVERYBODY COULD FILL -- YOU  
11 COULD FILL OUT THE SURVEY ELECTRICALLY.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. IS 15 MINUTES ENOUGH TIME FOR YOU TO  
14 TOTAL UP ALL YOUR SCORES?

15

16 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH. SO WE COULD DO THIS TWO-WAYS. IF PEOPLE  
17 WANT TO, THEY COULD DO IT NOW. IT LOOKS LIKE MOST PEOPLE ARE  
18 FILLING IT OUT, THEN WE WOULD HAVE THE BAR GRAPHS INSTANTLY,  
19 WE'RE ACTUALLY ABLE TO SEE SOME OF THE RESULTS, AND WEEKEND  
20 HAVE THE CONVERSATION NOW. AND THEN TAKE A BREAK. AND I THINK  
21 THAT COULD BE BEST SINCE THE RESULTS SEEM TO BE COMING IN  
22 ALREADY.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY HAS VOTED OR  
25 WILL VOTE WITHIN THE NEXT MINUTE OR SO.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **STUART COHEN:** IF YOU NEED HELP, RAISE YOUR HAND. OKAY. KAREN  
3 IS GOING TO COME OVER AND HELP YOU DO THAT.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO STUART, WHY -- WHY WOULDN'T WE TAKE THE  
6 BREAK RIGHT NOW?

7

8 **STUART COHEN:** SO, WE COULD MAYBE JUST QUICKLY SHOW THE RESULTS  
9 AND THEN TAKE A BREAK SO EVERYBODY CAN THINK ABOUT THEM.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THEY'RE GOING TO SHOW THE RESULTS  
12 THEN WE'LL TAKE A BREAK. THERE ARE SANDWICHES AND FOOD OVER  
13 THERE SO EVERYBODY CAN GET SOMETHING TO EAT.

14

15 **STUART COHEN:** THAT SOUNDS GOOD. COULD WE HAVE IT ON THE  
16 SCREEN?

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** LET'S JUST WAIT.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** IS THERE ANYONE THAT NEEDS ASSISTANCE?  
21 OKAY. IT LOOKS LIKE YOU SHOULD HAVE EVERYTHING. DO YOU?

22

23 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH. WE'RE JUST WAITING FOR COMMISSIONER MILEY,  
24 AND THEN WE WILL HAVE IT ON THE SCREEN.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY.

2

3 **STUART COHEN:** ALL RIGHT. LOOKS LIKE WE'RE IN BUSINESS. WE HAVE  
4 THE RESULTS. SOME OF THE --

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. HANG ON. STUART, COULD WE GET  
7 EVERYONE'S ATTENTION SO WE CAN GO THROUGH THESE AND THEN WE'LL  
8 TAKE THE BREAK. OH

9

10 **STUART COHEN:** OH, YOU DIDN'T GET THEM IN YET? ALL RIGHT.  
11 HOPEFULLY YOU -- HOPEFULLY YOU CAN UNSEE THAT. [LAUGHTER]

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AND WE'LL BE POSTING RESULTS FOR THOSE WHO CAN'T  
14 REMEMBER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ALL TOGETHER.

15

16 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH, DURING A BREAK, WE COULD POTENTIALLY PRINT  
17 THEM, YEAH. OKAY.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO, TELL US WHEN YOU HAVE SUBMITTED. ALL  
20 RIGHT. WHAT ORGANIZATION DO YOU REPRESENT? [LAUGHTER] THANK  
21 YOU MANNY.

22

23 **STUART COHEN:** ALL RIGHT. THANKS TO TECHNOLOGY, WE HAVE MANNY'S  
24 VOTE. AND, SO, THIS IS A REALLY INTERESTING ONE. I'LL READ IT  
25 OUT SINCE IT'S KIND OF SMALL OF THE BUT THE TOP BAR SAYS THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE GEOGRAPHIC SCOPE, THOSE ARE RANKINGS FOR AT LATEST A FOUR-  
2 COUNTY MEASURE. THE DARK GREEN ON THE LEFT IS STRONGLY AGREE,  
3 THE LIGHT GREEN IS AGREE, YELLOW IS NEUTRAL, ORANGE DISAGREE,  
4 AND RED IS STRONGLY DISAGREE. AND THE LOWER BAR IS FOR THE  
5 NINE-COUNTY MEASURE. AND WHAT WE SEE IS STRONG SUPPORT FOR  
6 FOUR COUNTY, PLUS OPT IN. I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT NOT A LOT  
7 OF WORDS FIT TO THE LEFT THERE, SO THAT WAS CUT OUT. BUT VERY  
8 IMPORTANTLY, THAT INCLUDES THE POTENTIAL TO OPT IN. AND THE  
9 NINE COUNTY MEASURE LOOKS LIKE IT HAS 50%, OR TEN VOTES, ON  
10 THE STRONGLY DISAGREE. VERY INTERESTING. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE. ALL  
11 RIGHT. SO, THIS WAS THE TARGET INVESTMENT LEVEL. AND THE UPPER  
12 BAR IS ADJUSTED FARE. THERE IS IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAD SEVEN  
13 STRONGLY DISAGREE, AND ONE DISAGREE. AND I THINK YOU CAN SEE  
14 THE REST. ABOUT EIGHT THAT, TO SOME EXTENT, AGREE WITH THIS.  
15 AND THE OPERATOR SHORTFALLS HAD MORE SUPPORT THAN THAT, THAT'S  
16 THE LOWER BAR. NEXT. ALL RIGHT. AND HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH  
17 THE FOLLOWING DURATIONS AND INVESTMENTS. THERE IS PRETTY  
18 STRONG SUPPORT FOR THE 10-YEAR TRANSIT ONLY. THE TWO GREEN  
19 BARS TOGETHER MADE UP 13 OUT OF 20 OF THE MEASURE WITH A FEW  
20 THAT STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH THIS. AND THEN THE 30-YEAR MULTI-  
21 MODAL HAD GOOD SUPPORT BUT IT LOOKS LIKE A LITTLE MORE  
22 LUKEWARM WITH THE LIGHT GREEN AGREE, AND THEN A NUMBER THAT  
23 ARE MUTUAL OR ABSTAIN ON THAT ONE. NEXT SLIDE. THE REVENUE  
24 MECHANISMS, VERY INTERESTING SALES TAX SEEMS TO, BY FAR, HAVE  
25 THE MOST SUPPORT WITH 13 THAT ARE GREEN, PAYROLL AND PARCEL



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BOTH HAVE SEVEN THAT ARE EITHER STRONGLY AGREE OR AGREE. THOSE  
2 ARE -- WHAT'S INTERESTING IS PAYROLL AND PARCEL SEEM TO BE  
3 EXACT VOTES, WHICH I DID NOT EXPECT. AND BOTH OF THEM HAVE  
4 SEVEN THAT ARE STRONGLY DISAGREE. ALL RIGHT. THE FINAL ONE IS  
5 HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH THESE TAX INFRASTRUCTURES OR  
6 FUNDING FRAMEWORKS. A SINGLE TAX, WHICH IS KIND OF SPLIT RIGHT  
7 DOWN THE MIDDLE ALMOST, BUT ABOUT NINE AGREE AND A LOT OF  
8 NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN THAT'S KIND OF THE PLAIN VANILLA SCENARIO.  
9 AND THEN MULTIPLE TAX SOURCES HAD A LOT OF SUPPORT. AND SO  
10 THAT REALLY SEEMS LIKE PEOPLE WANT TO EXPLORE AND IF WE CAN  
11 RAISE ENOUGH MONEY THIS WAY, THAT THERE WOULD BE SUPPORT FOR  
12 IT, THERE IS 14 OUT OF 20 MEMBERS SUPPORTING THAT. THAT SEEMS  
13 TO BE ONE OF THE MOST POPULAR OPTIONS OF ANYTHING WE HAVE  
14 DISCUSSED SO FAR. VARIABLE RATE BROUGHT IN BY THE MTA PROPOSAL  
15 ALSO HAS A LOT OF STRONG SUPPORT FOR EXPLORATION WITH 13 IF  
16 TOTAL AND SOME AMOUNT OF AGREEMENT. AND ALLOWING FOR FINANCING  
17 OR LOANS A LITTLE MORE CONSERVATIVE THERE, AT NINE THAT AGREED  
18 AND A FEW STRONGLY DISAGREED WITH FOUR STRONGLY DISAGREES AND  
19 THREE DISAGREEING. SO, WE HAD A REQUEST, WE'LL PURSUANT THESE  
20 OUT QUICKLY FOR THE SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS. THIS WILL BE  
21 AVAILABLE, AS I MENTIONED, ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE WEB SITE  
22 AFTERWARDS WITH HOW EACH OF YOU VOTED. AND THEN WHEN WE COME  
23 BACK FROM OUR QUICK LUNCH BREAK, WE'LL BE ASKING YOU TO RAISE  
24 YOUR HANDS ON EACH OF THESE QUESTIONS AS WE HAVE THE  
25 DISCUSSION, AND ONES AND TWOS WILL VOTE TOGETHER, THE YELLOWS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AGREES AND FOURS AND FIVES CAN RAISE THEIR HAND TOGETHER. AND  
2 BACK TO YOU CHAIR SPERING

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU IF Y'ALL CAN BE THINKING  
5 ABOUT THIS WHILE YOU'RE HAVING LUNCH, SO WE CAN HAVE CONSENSUS  
6 WHAT THE COMMISSION SHOULD CONSIDER. WITH THAT, A 15 MINUTE  
7 LUNCH BREAK THERE ARE SANDWICHES AND FOOD HERE, DRINKS. AND  
8 SO. [BREAK].

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ABOUT THREE MINUTES. [MEETING WILL RESUME  
11 SHORTLY]

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ABOUT THEE MINUTES. THREE MINUTES. WE HAVE  
14 A HANDOUT THAT'S BEING PRINTED. AND IT SHOULD BE DOWN HERE A  
15 COUPLE OF MINUTES. AS SOON AS WE GET THE HANDOUT AND EVERYBODY  
16 HAS A COPY WE'LL GO AHEAD AND GET STARTED.

17

18 **STUART COHEN:** WE COULD START AND GET IT BACK ON THE SCREEN BUT  
19 WE COULD HAVE DISCUSSION. WE WERE GOING TO SHOW THE BAR GRAPHS  
20 AGAIN. WHATEVER YOU WOULD LIKE.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** LOOKS LIKE MOST PEOPLE ARE SEATED.

23

24 **STUART COHEN:** WE WANTED TO PUT THE BAR GRAPHS BACK ON THE  
25 SCREEN AND HAVE SOME CONVERSATION BEFORE WE CONSIDER A MOTION



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ON THIS ITEM. AND I KNOW WE HAVE HAD SOME OF THIS CONVERSATION  
2 BEFORE. BUT THIS IS OUR LAST MEETING AND WE WOULD LIKE TO  
3 ALLOW PEOPLE TO GET, ESPECIALLY, I THINK, WHERE YOU FEEL  
4 STRONGLY ABOUT A PARTICULAR TOPIC, TO MAKE SURE WE REALLY HAVE  
5 THOSE FINAL UNDERSTANDINGS, AND GROUP UNDERSTANDINGS TOGETHER.  
6 SO, WHAT I'M GOING TO DO IS, SO, FOR EACH OTHER AND FOR THE  
7 PEOPLE IN THE ROOM, WE CAN SEE WHAT THE VOTES WERE. I'M GOING  
8 TO ASK YOU TO RAISE YOUR HANDS AS WE GO THROUGH THIS AND THEN  
9 WE'LL HAVE COORDINATION ON IT. AND AS I MENTIONED, I'M GOING  
10 TO ASK FOR THE ONES AND TWOS, AND THREES, AND THEN THE FOURS  
11 AND FIVES. AND THEN WE'LL TAKE QUESTIONS TOPIC BY TOP FOR  
12 DISCUSSION AND THOSE WILL LEAD TO THIS MOTION THAT YOU WILL BE  
13 RECEIVING. SO EVERYBODY IS NOT BACK. ANDY IS NOT BACK, BUT I  
14 THINK WE SHOULD JUST START. ALL OF THIS WILL BE RELEASED AND  
15 MADE PUBLIC OF HOW FOLKS VOTED. SO, ON THIS QUESTION OF  
16 GEOGRAPHIC SCOPE OF THE MEASURE, THIS WAS ONE OF THE ONES THAT  
17 HAD REALLY JUST TREMENDOUS AGREEMENT ON THE FOUR-COUNTY PLUS  
18 OPT IN APPROACH THE WITH PROBABLY DIFFERENT REASONS AND THEN A  
19 COUPLE THAT STRONGLY DISAGREED WITH IT. IF WE COULD SEE A  
20 RAISE OF HANDS OF FOLKS ON THE FOUR-COUNTY MEASURE THAT WERE  
21 AGREEING OR STRONGLY AGREEING. COULD YOU RAISE YOUR HAND?  
22 CHAIR SPERING, YOU PROBABLY WANT TO RAISE YOUR HAND ON THIS  
23 ONE IF YOU VOTED.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH. YEAH, I DO.





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **STUART COHEN:** [LAUGHTER]

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND THANK YOU STUART, YOU CAN REMIND ME  
5 HOW I VOTED ON ALL OF THEM.

6

7 **STUART COHEN:** JUST INTUITIVE. [LAUGHTER]

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WAS LOOKING FOR MY CHEAT SHEET. I CAN'T  
10 FIND IT.

11

12 **STUART COHEN:** AND WE HAVE ONE NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN ON THAT, IF  
13 YOU ARE IN THE ROOM? WE'RE MISSING A COUPLE. AND THEN FINALLY  
14 FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE, IF YOU  
15 COULD RAISE YOUR HAND. OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU. NOW THIS WAS  
16 OUR LAST TIME TO DISCUSS GEOGRAPHY OF THE MEASURE. IF ANYBODY  
17 WANTED TO, YOU KNOW, MAKE A -- MAKE A COMMENT, MAKE A POINT  
18 ABOUT IT, THIS WOULD BE THE TIME.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GO AHEAD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO PUT OUT THERE, 30-YEAR IS THE RIGHT  
23 SOLUTION, ALL RIGHT. FOR THE FUTURE, FOR THE BAY AREA. BUT THE  
24 CONCERN IS WE MIGHT END UP WITH NOTHING IF IT FAILS. SO,  
25 PATCHWORK MIGHT GET US CLOSE TO, IN THE TEN YEARS, EVALUATE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WHERE WE ARE, AND WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE TO MAYBE EXPENDITURE  
2 IT FOR ANOTHER 20 YEARS INTO THE FUTURE. SO THAT'S THE BIGGEST  
3 CONCERN, AND LABOR AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS ARE VERY  
4 SUPPORTIVE OF THE 30-YEAR, BUT UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGES THAT  
5 WE FACE.

6

7 **STUART COHEN:** THANK YOU, JOHN. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** IT'S JUST THE LACK OF CLARITY WITH CALTRAIN AND  
10 I'M NOT SURE 30 YEARS IS SELLABLE TO THE PUBLIC, PARTICULARLY  
11 IN MY JURISDICTION. YES WE WANT TO BE HELPFUL HERE, BUT WE  
12 CAN'T -- IT'S A LITTLE UNDERBAKED AT THIS POINT.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NICK?

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TALKING ABOUT WHY WE SUPPORT THE FOUR-COUNTY  
17 MEASURE?

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK THIS IS REALLY COMPLICATED AND IT'S  
22 REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP IT AS SIMPLE AS WE CAN WHILE  
23 MEETING OUR GOALS AND SOMETIMES BY ADDING COMPLEXITY IN A  
24 POLITICAL OR POLICY CONTEXT YOU CAN GET MORE PEOPLE AROUND THE  
25 TABLE, YOU CAN KIND OF EXPAND YOUR COALITION AND DEAL WITH



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 PEOPLE'S CONCERNS. HERE, I FEEL THAT AS WE EXPAND  
2 GEOGRAPHICALLY, WE GENERATE OPPOSITION, WE GENERATE CONCERNS,  
3 WE MAKE IT, LIKE, MORE DIFFICULT TO PULL THIS OFF. AND, YOU  
4 KNOW, I THINK FUNDAMENTALLY, IT WILL JUST COST A LOT MORE TO  
5 RUN A BIG NINE COUNTY CAMPAIGN. AND WE, AS MUCH AS THE VOTERS  
6 ARE, LIKE, KIND OF, OKAY, MAYBE, IF WE -- I FEEL THAT THE  
7 INTEREST GROUPS ARE KIND OF, HIKE, KIND OF, OKAY, MAYBE. AND  
8 WE'RE GOT SEEING, YOU KNOWINGS WE'RE NOT HAVING THIS, SORT OF,  
9 LIKE WATERFALL OF ENTHUSIASM COMING ON BOARD GOING YEAH WE GOT  
10 TO GET THIS PASSED WHATEVER IT COSTS WHATEVER IT IT TAKES.  
11 I'M, LIKE, A COMPANY THAT CAN SPEND BILLIONS I'M A LABOR UNION  
12 THAT CAN SPEND -- WE'RE JUST NOT FEELING IT WE NEED TO KEEP IT  
13 AS SIMPLE AS POSSIBLE. I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD BE AT LEAST A  
14 FOUR COUNTY MEASURE, I THINK WE SHOULD JUST BE LIKE LOOK I  
15 THINK IT MAKES IT WAY MORE COMPLICATED AND DISTRACTS US FROM  
16 WHAT OUR CORE ABSOLUTE MISSION IS WHICH IS FOR OUR LARGEST  
17 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THIS REGION YOU KNOW BART, MUNI, AC  
18 TRANSIT, ET CETERA, THAT WE CAN KIND OF GET, THAT WE DO WHAT  
19 WE CAN, WHICH HAS THE HIGHEST CHANCE OF SUCCESS OF SAVING  
20 THEM. AND FOUR OR FIVE COUNTIES, SORT OF -- AGNOSTIC --

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** I STRONG HE AGREE. ONLY BECAUSE I THINK IT  
23 SHOULD BE REGION-WIDE AS OPPOSED TO JUST FOUR COUNTIES. ONCE  
24 AGAIN, GETS BACK TO SOMETHING I SAID EARLIER, I THINK THE  
25 ELECTED OFFICIALS BACK IN THE DAY WHEN BART WAS COMING ONLINE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 HAD VOTED BEFORE THE NINE CAN'T REGION, WE WOULDN'T BE FACING  
2 THIS ISSUE NOW. BUT THEY DIDN'T SO WE HAVE THE CONSEQUENCES.  
3 AND HAVING TO MAKE UP FOR A FAILURE IN LEADERSHIP BACK IN  
4 THOSE DAYS. BUT I'M NOT GOING TO DIE ON THAT HILL. IF WE HAVE  
5 TO GO WITH FOUR COUNTIES, FIVE COUNTIES WOULD PROBABLY DO IT,  
6 BUT I THINK A REGIONAL MEASURE WOULD BE MUCH BETTER. NOW IF WE  
7 DO GO FOUR COUNTY MEASURE, THERE IS SOME ASPECT TO THAT I'LL  
8 TALK TO LATER. BUT FOR NOW, I JUST WANT TO PUT UP MY STRONG  
9 BELIEF ON THIS.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OTHER?

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** VARIANT MORE IS BETTER LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING  
14 MORE OF THE POLLING THAT'S GOING TO BE AVAILABLE EARLY NEXT  
15 YEAR BECAUSE I THINK THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT PEOPLE THAT HAVE  
16 DIFFERENT HYPOTHESIS WOULD DO WORSE OR MORE WOULD DO BETTER  
17 BUT I THINK THAT IF SOMETHING IS TOO SMALL I THINK THERE'S A  
18 DIFFERENT HYPOTHESIS THAT IF VOTERS HAVE TO VOTE TO TAX  
19 THEMSELVES FOR SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO WIND UP WITH SERVICE  
20 CUTS AND LESS COORDINATION THIS'S GOING TO BE HARD TO PASS  
21 THAN SOMETHING THAT DOES THAT IMPROVES THE SYSTEM SO THAT'S  
22 UNDERLYING HYPOTHESIS AND LOOKING FORWARD TO MORE TESTING OF  
23 THAT HYPOTHESIS.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OTHER COMMENTS? JIM?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1  
2 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SAY THE QUESTIONS ASKED WERE HIGHLY  
3 CONSTRAINED. SO I FOUND IT VERY DIFFICULT TO ANSWER THEM  
4 BECAUSE THERE WERE OTHER QUESTIONS THAT WEREN'T ASKED. SO, YOU  
5 ASKED US TO SUBMIT A LETTER, AND WE DID. SO THAT'S, YOU KNOW,  
6 FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD. AND WE'LL END UP VOTING -- WE'LL BE  
7 OPPOSED TO WHATEVER IS PRESENTED HERE IN TERMS OF A MOTION.  
8 AND I THINK, YOU KNOW, THE FOLKS WHO TESTIFIED FROM LABOR  
9 ABOUT A MULTI-MODAL APPROACH IS, YOU KNOW, I THINK, WE'RE  
10 LITERALLY KIND OF KIDDING OURSELVES HERE. I MEAN, I REALLY  
11 APPRECIATE THE PEOPLE AROUND THE TABLE, AND OF THE DIFFICULTY  
12 AS TO WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE AND THE IMPORTANCE OF DOING  
13 IT. BUT, I THINK WE ALSO HAVE TO BE REALISTIC ABOUT WHEN  
14 WHAT'S HAPPENED IN OUR REGION AND A FEW YEARS AGO WE WERE  
15 PUSHING FOR A \$100 BILLION MEASURE CALLED FASTER AND WE WERE  
16 GETTING CLOSES TO 2/3 STUART AND OTHERS, THERE WERE SOME  
17 DISAGREEMENT, AND IT WAS EXCITING AND THE PUBLIC WAS  
18 RESPONSIVE TO IT AND WE WERE BASING OUR APPROACH ON THE NOTION  
19 THAT PEOPLE WANTED MORE AND WERE WILLING TO PAY MORE TO GET  
20 MORE AND WE WERE REALLY GOING TO CHANGE -- YOU KNOW, TO SUPER  
21 MILEY'S POINT, YOU KNOW, WE WERE GOING HAVE A REAL REGIONAL  
22 APPROACH THAT WAS GOING HAVE A MATERIAL IMPACT ON THE WAY  
23 PEOPLE EXPERIENCED THEIR LIVES, WHETHER IT WAS FOR MASS  
24 TRANSIT OR WHETHER IT WAS FOR PEOPLE WHO USE STREETS, ROADS,  
25 HIGHWAYS, WHETHER THEY BIKED, WHETHER THEY WALKED, WHATEVER



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THEY DID. THERE WAS GOING TO BE FUNDING TO HANDLE ALL THOSE  
2 DIFFERENT THINGS, AND IT WAS GOING TO CREATE A LOT OF NEW JOB  
3 OPPORTUNITIES IN THE REGION, YOU KNOW, DURING THE CONSTRUCTION  
4 PHASE, AND IT WAS GOING TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE ECONOMY BECAUSE  
5 IT WAS GOING TO MAKE IT BETTER FOR THE TO BE HERE. AND I THINK  
6 NOW WE'RE IN THIS ENTRENCHMENT, THE PANDEMIC CHANGED  
7 EVERYTHING. DIFFERENT REALITY I KNOW THAT THE COMPANIES AND  
8 THE ORGANIZATIONS NOT JUST COMPANIES, BUT PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS  
9 THAT ARE PART OF OUR BAY AREA COUNCIL EXPERIENCING THINGS VERY  
10 DIFFERENT THEY WANT TO SEE SAVINGS, COST CONTROL, WE'RE HAVE  
11 HAD NO DISCUSSION ONLY TALKING ABOUT INCREASING REVENUES THERE  
12 IS NOTHING ON THE ABLE TO GET COSTS AROUND CONTROL YET PEOPLE  
13 ARE EXPERIENCING IN SOCIETY THIS INCREDIBLE INCREASE IN PRICE  
14 EVERY TIME THEY GO ANYWHERE, DO ANYTHING, GO TO THE MARKET AND  
15 SO FORTH. I SAW THE BART POLL IT'S THE SAME POLL THAT ENC  
16 PRESENTED EARLY ON IN THE TASK FORCE. THE PUBLIC IS GOING TO  
17 BE EXTREMELY RETICENT ABOUT THIS. I THINK WE HAVE TO, YOU  
18 KNOW, GET REAL ABOUT WHAT THE WORLD OF THE POSSIBLE LOOKS  
19 LIKE. AND WE NEED TO DELIVER A WAY BETTER TRANSPORTATION  
20 EXPERIENCE. I WAS ENCOURAGED BY SOME OF THE THINGS THAT I  
21 HEARD ABOUT SOME OF THE STUFF THAT'S GOING ON, ON A REGIONAL  
22 SCALE TO IMPROVE WAYFINDING IMPROVE PASSENGER EXPERIENCE AND  
23 ALL THOSE THINGS. BUT I THINK THE WORK IS KIND OF AHEAD OF US.  
24 AND I THINK, A COUPLE OF PEOPLE WHO CALLED IN YOU KNOW, TALKED  
25 ABOUT HIT THE RESTART BUTTON, DON'T JUST GO FORWARD BECAUSE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THERE IS A TIMELINE THAT SAYS WE NEED TO HAVE LEGISLATION BY  
2 SUCH AND SUCH A DATE SO WE'RE GOING TO, SORT OF, KID OURSELVES  
3 TO THINK WE HAVE SUPPORT FOR SOMETHING. I DON'T THINK THAT WE  
4 DO. I REGRET SAYING THAT BECAUSE I WANT US TO COME UP WITH A  
5 SOLUTION BUT I REALLY WANT US TO COME UP WITH A SOLUTION THAT  
6 WHERE PEOPLE CAN VOTE AFFIRMATIVELY AND AUTHORITATIVELY FOR  
7 SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO MAKE THE REGION BETTER AND I'M JUST  
8 NOT SEEING IT COMING OUT OF THIS PROCESS. I JUST NEED TO SAY  
9 THAT. AND I'LL JUST SAY FINALLY, FERRIES ARE GOOD TOO. SO,  
10 EXCEPT FOR OUR MTC VICE CHAIR WHO SEEMS TO HAVE A DIFFERENT  
11 POINT OF VIEW ON THOSE THINGS. YOU KNOW, FERRIES CAN BE  
12 DEVELOPED WITH A FAIRLY LOW CAPITAL COST, UNLIKE OTHER FORMS  
13 OF TRANSPORTATION, AND THEY BRING PEOPLE TO THE WATERFRONT.  
14 AND THEY CREATE A BETTER DEVELOPMENT ENVIRONMENT, IN A, YOU  
15 KNOW, SORT OF, REGION FOR THE FUTURE, AND CAN BE BUILT AT A  
16 FAIRLY MODERATE COST, BUT THEIR OPERATIONS COSTS ARE VERY  
17 REAL. IT'S SOMETHING THAT MTC SHOULD REALLY BE BEHIND AND NOT  
18 STOP. YOU KNOW, TAKE THE GAINS THAT WE HAVE MADE AND THE  
19 THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING AND MAKE SURE IT'S INCLUDED IF WE'RE  
20 REALLY GOING TO DO A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT, SHOULD BE PART OF  
21 IT.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANY OTHER? I DON'T SEE ANY WITH LIGHTS ON.

24

25 **STUART COHEN:** WE CAN GO ON.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OH CINDY. I'M SORRY.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. JUST A FEW THINGS I WANTED  
5 TO ACKNOWLEDGE ON THIS SLIDE. FIRST, I FIRMLY BELIEVE THAT ONE  
6 OF THE TENANTS OF THIS GROUP HAS TO BEGIN WITH UNDERSTANDING  
7 WHAT THE VOTERS ARE INTERESTED IN. AND I DON'T MEAN TO BE  
8 CAPTAIN OBSTACLE ABOUT THAT BUT I DO THINK WE'RE SPEAKING  
9 MAYBE IN BAIT OF A BUBBLE AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT.  
10 SECOND, I THINK IT'S IMPERATIVE THAT THERE BE A MECHANISM FOR  
11 CUSTOMIZATION BY COUNTY IN ORDER IT MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE THE  
12 RESOURCES NEEDED TO SUCCEED. MEANING THAT IT'S REALLY  
13 IMPORTANT THAT IF COUNTIES NEED TO STRUCTURE THEIR SALES TAX  
14 IN A WAY THAT ALLOWS IT TO PASS THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. AND I  
15 THINK -- AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT THIS WHEN WE GET TO MULTIMODAL,  
16 BUT I THINK IT ALSO MEANS THAT THE GOVERNING COALITION NEEDS  
17 TO HAVE A DEEP AND MEANINGFUL PARTNERSHIP WITH THE ELECTRICAL  
18 COALITION, OR THAT DISCONNECT IS GOING TO IMPEDE OUR ABILITY  
19 TO WIN. LASTLY, JUST ON THIS POINT, I DO THINK THAT WE HAVE TO  
20 BE VERY CLEAR ABOUT OUR OBLIGATIONS TO OUR SISTER  
21 ORGANIZATION. AND THE ONE THING I THINK CUSTOMIZATION ALLOWS  
22 FOR US TO MAKE COMMITMENTS AND HAVE MUTUALLY ACCOUNTABLE TO  
23 EACH OTHER IN A PUBLIC WAY, AND STILL GIVE US THE FLEXIBILITY  
24 TO WIN AT A LOCAL LEVEL. AND AN EXAMPLE OF THAT IN MY OPINION,  
25 WE, AS AN EXAMPLE, HAVE AN OBLIGATION TO BOTH PROTECT THE





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BREAST AND VITALITY AND HEALTH OF CALTRAIN AND BART. LIKE  
2 THOSE AREN'T OPTIONAL. WE HAVE A JPA THAT GOVERNS OUR CURRENT  
3 PRACTICES WITH CALTRAIN AND A CONTRACT THAT GOVERNS OUR  
4 CURRENT PRACTICES WITH BART. HOLDING US ACCOUNTABLE MAKING  
5 SURE THAT THOSE PARTNERSHIPS ARE HEALTHY AND VIBRANT IS FINE,  
6 BUT PUTTING -- AND I THINK THIS COULD BE CHALLENGING, BUT NOT  
7 GIVING US FLEXIBILITY TO DETERMINE HOW BEST TO DO THAT COULD  
8 IMPEDE OUR ABILITY TO HELP OUR PARTNERS AND THAT'S REALLY WHY  
9 I THOUGHT THIS QUESTION WAS SUCH AN IMPORTANT ONE AND WHY --  
10 WHY I WAS REALLY INTERESTED IN CREATING FLEXIBILITY FOR OPT  
11 IN. AND I THINK, JIM, THE POINT YOU RAISED ABOUT WHO SHOULD BE  
12 IN AND WHO SHOULD BE OUT BASED ON WHAT VOTERS ARE INTERESTED  
13 IN, IS REALLY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE IMPORTANTLY WHAT WE'RE  
14 ACCOUNTABLE TO IS EACH OTHER AND REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION  
15 AGENCY BUT TO THE VOTERS OF EACH OF COMMUNITIES WHO INVEST A  
16 LOT OF MONEY IN TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION. AND I WANT TO MAKE  
17 SURE THE COUNTY AND VTA CAN BE ACCOUNTABLE TO THE VOTERS HERE  
18 AS WELL AS TO OUR PARTNERS REGIONALLY AND I THINK THIS MODEL  
19 GIVES US THE MOST OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU CINDY FOR THOSE COMMENTS. GO  
22 AHEAD.

23

24 **STUART COHEN:** NEXT QUESTION. WE HAVE SEVERAL TO GET THROUGH  
25 STILL WE HAVE POLICY AND MOTIONS. HAPPY TO MOVE THROUGH THIS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AT A GOOD CLIP WE'RE ARE ON TIME JUST SO EVERYBODY KNOWS,  
2 WHICH IS GREAT. NEXT QUESTION IS HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE THE  
3 MEASURE SHOULD TARGET AN INVESTMENT LEVEL EQUAL TO EITHER  
4 ADJUSTED FARES, WHICH IS THE UPPER BAR OR THE OPERATOR  
5 REPORTED SHORTFALLS. AND I THINK THE BIGGEST DIFFERENCE IN  
6 THESE IS THAT WE SEE KIND OF STRONG SUPPORT FOR SEVEN FOLKS  
7 FOR THE OPERATOR SHORTFALLS WHERE ADJUSTED FARES ONLY GOT  
8 FOUR. AND THEN THERE WAS ALSO CORRESPONDINGLY, A LARGER  
9 STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH ADJUSTED FARES. AND THIS WAS ABOUT  
10 SEVEN PEOPLE STRONGLY DISAGREES WITH THAT. AND WE HAVE HEARD  
11 SOME OF THOSE PEOPLE TALK ALREADY TODAY. I THINK SOME OF IT IS  
12 SOME, LIKE, AC TRANSIT, THAT HAS A POPULATION THAT REALLY  
13 DEPENDS ON THEM, BUT FARE LOSS WASN'T THEIR ONLY PROBLEM. BUT  
14 IF FOLKS WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ANY EXTENSIVE ON EITHER OF THESE,  
15 PLEASE. DO WE HAVE HEARD PREVIOUS COMMENTS TOO. SO ANYTHING  
16 THAT'S ADDITIONAL ON WHY YOU MIGHT HAVE FELT STRONGLY ONE WAY  
17 OR THE OTHER ON THESE AND WE'LL HAVE YOU RAISE YOUR HANDS JUST  
18 SO PEOPLE KNOW AND WE'LL START WITH THE ADJUSTED FARE. IF YOU  
19 COULD RAISE YOUR HAND ON WHEN YOU ARE A ONE OR TWO ON THE  
20 ADJUSTS FARES, PLEASE DO. WE SHOULD HAVE ABOUT EIGHT HANDS UP.  
21 IF YOU ARE NEUTRAL ON IT, IN THE YELLOW, MUTUAL OR ABSTAIN.  
22 THEN AND FINALLY THE DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE. UNADJUSTED  
23 FARES. LOOKING AT OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS, ONE OR TWO IN  
24 THE GREEN KIND OF STRONGLY AGREEING OR AGREEING. PLEASE RAISE  
25 YOUR HAND. WE SHOULD HAVE ABOUT TEN HANDS UP. AND IF YOU ARE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MUTUAL OR ABSTAIN, YELLOW. AND THEN FINALLY IF YOU STRONGLY  
2 DISAGREE OR DISAGREE WITH OPERATOR SHORTFALLS. AND WE HAVE A  
3 FEW HANDS UP. GREAT. IF FOLKS CAN RAISE HANDS HIGHER SO FOLKS  
4 CAN SEE. ANY OTHER COMMENTS BEFORE WE GO TO THE NEXT QUESTION?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** I'LL MAKE A QUICK COMMENT FROM. MY PERSPECTIVE,  
7 RAISED MY HAND I HAD ONE STRONGLY AGREE AND AGREE WITH  
8 RESERVATION. SO I WASN'T A STRONG NO. FOR ME JUST THINKING  
9 ABOUT THE PUBLIC AND WHAT THEY WOULD BE UNDERSTANDING FOR IS A  
10 PANDEMIC IMPACT. I THINK FROM AN OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALL,  
11 I THINK THOSE WOULD HAVE OCCURRED PROBABLY REGARDLESS OF THE  
12 PANDEMIC. AND ALL THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE TO ADJUST FOR THAT  
13 OVER TIME. DIESEL COST, THINGS LIKE THAT, WE HAVE ALL HAD TO  
14 ADJUST THAT IT'S NOT ALWAYS FUNDED. SO THAT'S -- I MEAN, I HAD  
15 TO AGREE ON BOTH. I HAD MY LEANING TOWARD ADJUSTED FARES WAS  
16 UNDERSTANDING FROM THE PUBLIC PERSPECTIVE.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NICK?

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK THE PANDEMIC RELATED STUFF IS  
21 IMPORTANT BUT I WANT TO AGAIN MUNI IS THE BIGGEST IMPACT THAT  
22 MINE HAS FELT DURING THE PANDEMIC AT THIS POINT IS LOST  
23 PARKING REVENUE WHICH WAS GOING STRAIGHT INTO SERVICE AND  
24 THAT'S PANDEMIC RELATED. SO I THINK IT'S SUPER IMPORTANT TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TAKE THOSE AND OTHER PANDEMIC RELATED KIND OF ISSUES INTO  
2 ACCOUNT.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** NOT TO CHALLENGE BUT POINT OF ORDER. WE HAVE MADE SAN  
7 FRANCISCO SO HORRENDOUSLY DIFFICULT FOR CARS TO COME TO SO  
8 THAT NO 1 WILL DRIVE SO WE HAVE DRIVEN PARKING REVENUES DOWN  
9 AND THAT'S NOT THE ONLY REASON. LOOK AT THE CITY TODAY. WHO  
10 THE HECK WOULD WANT TO COME INTO SAN FRANCISCO AND GO SHOPPING  
11 OR BE ENTERTAINED IF IT REQUIRES THAT THEY USE THEIR CAR? FOR  
12 A LOT OF PEOPLE AND A LOT OF FAMILIES THAT'S THE WAY TO GET IN  
13 AND SO YES WE SHOULD MAKE TRANSIT BETTER FOR PEOPLE TO COME  
14 INTO SAN FRANCISCO BUT WE SHOULD ALSO MAKE IT POSSIBLE FOR  
15 PEOPLE TO DRIVE IN AND IF WE MAKE IT IMPOSSIBLE FOR THEM TO  
16 DRIVE IN SO THAT THEY DON'T PARK AND WE DON'T GET PARKING  
17 REVENUE OR SALES TAX REVENUE THEN WE SHOULDN'T COMPLAIN ABOUT  
18 IT.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANY OTHER COMMENTARY?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** YES I THINK THAT GOES ALONG THE LINES OF WHAT MR.  
23 WUNDERMAN SAID HERE AND WHAT SUE SAID HERE IT DOESN'T REALLY  
24 APPROACH WHAT THE VOTERS WOULD BE LOOKING FOR HERE. THERE IS A  
25 LACK OF WHAT ARE THEY GOING TO GET FROM THIS. WHAT ARE WE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DOING DIFFERENTLY. HOW ARE YOU GOING TO CHANGE THINGS. IT'S  
2 JUST NOT -- IT'S LIKE, HERE IS OUR BIG DEBT AND YOU GOT TO  
3 TAKE CARE OF IT. AND, SO, THAT REALLY IS SOMETHING THE VOTERS  
4 ARE NOT GOING TO -- WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT THE TRANSFORMATION  
5 MEASURE, BUT IT IS NOT IN WHAT'S BEING PRESENTED. AND THAT  
6 MAKES IT VERY DIFFICULT FOR ME AND I THINK EVERYONE ELSE. IF  
7 WE'RE TRYING TO SEND SOMETHING TO SACRAMENTO AND THEN TO THE  
8 VOTERS, THIS IS JUST SUICIDE. WE GET IT BUT DON'T SEE CHANGES  
9 BUILT IN. SAN FRANCISCO PARKING IS EXPENSIVE. COUNTER  
10 INTUITIVE. THIS IS NOT ENCOURAGING AT ALL. THIS IS WHY I HAVE  
11 A BIG PROBLEM WITH HOW THIS IS PRESENTED. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE THAT THERE  
14 IS GOING TO BE A CONSIDERABLE AMOUNT OF POLLING IN SO WE'RE  
15 NOT GOING TO BE OUT OF SYNC WHY WOULD WE PUT SOMETHING ON THE  
16 BALLOT THAT NOBODY SUPPORTS. WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO THAT. YOU  
17 ARE MTC, YOU HAVE SEEN BART'S POLL. A LOT OF DIFFERENT  
18 ORGANIZATIONS, I THINK JIM ORGANIZATION IS POLLING. WE'RE  
19 GOING TO HAVE TO FIND WHAT IS THE TEMPERATURE OF THE VOTERS  
20 AND IF YOU REMEMBER CORRECTLY THAT WAS THE GOAL THAT WE HAD  
21 HERE PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT THAT VOTERS WILL SUPPORT  
22 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE SOME TO HAVE SOME GOOD DATA TO BRING  
23 SOMETHING FORWARD THAT MIGHT PASS IF WE DON'T FIND A SOLUTION  
24 THERE IS GOING TO BE FALL OUT IN THE REGION IT'S GOING HURT  
25 THE ENVIRONMENT, ECONOMY, IT'S GOING AFFECT THOUSANDS OF JOBS,



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BUSINESSES WON'T WANT TO LOCATE HERE. YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE A  
2 METROPOLITAN AREA WITH FAILING TRANSIT SYSTEM. YOU HEAR THE  
3 CONSTRUCTION PEOPLE GOING WE WANT THIS BALLOT -- IF WE DON'T  
4 FIND A SOLUTION, SOME OF THE CAPITAL MONEY, AND A LOT GOING  
5 INTO CONSTRUCTION A LOT OF THAT IS GOING TO MOVED SOMEWHERE  
6 ELSE. DO NOT LOSE SIGHT OF WHAT THE FALL OUT IS GOING TO BE IF  
7 WE DON'T FIND A SOLUTION BUT POLLING IS GOING TO TELL US WHAT  
8 THE VOTERS ARE GOING TO SUPPORT THERE IS A LOT OF RESENTMENT  
9 TO THE OPERATORS. IF WE PUT ANY MEASURE FORWARD THEN WE DON'T  
10 CONDITION THAT MONEY. WE HAVE FAILED. WE CANNOT PAY YOU KNOW  
11 ALLOCATE THESE RESOURCES WITHOUT THE CHANGES THAT THE PUBLIC  
12 IS DEMANDING.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** FOLLOW UP ON THAT REAL QUICK HERE. WE'RE TALKING  
15 ABOUT THE SAME THING HERE. BUT IT'S NOT BEING PRESENTED IN  
16 THESE QUESTIONS. AND THAT'S THE PROBLEM HERE. AND I AGREE WITH  
17 YOU JIM. I KNOW IT'S A POLLING WE HAVE TO CHANGE THE SEQUENCE  
18 RIGHT NOW BECAUSE YOU'RE ASKING FOR OUR INPUT AND WE'RE  
19 PRESENTING SOMETHING YOU CAN'T GET SO FAR AHEAD IT CAN'T BE  
20 DONE LATER IT HAS TO BE PART OF THIS SHAPING DISCUSSION.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GINA EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS ARE BEING  
23 RECORDED AND WE HAVE MADE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR ANYBODY WHO HAS  
24 MINORITY POSITION OR DIFFERENT PROPOSAL FOR THIS SUBMIT IT TO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 US AND IT'S GOING GO TO THE COMMISSION AND IT'S GOING TO GO TO  
2 THE LEGISLATURE. THOSE COMMENTS WILL BE INCLUDED.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** SURE. WE HAVE, AND I JUST DON'T SEE THE CHANGES  
5 HAPPENING.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WELL THAT'S TO COME.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO ADD ON TO SOMETHING THAT WAS SAID  
10 WHICH IS ABOUT THE VOTER VOTERS THAT THEY DON'T WANT TO BE  
11 FUNDING SHORTFALLS, THIS WAS SAID FROM TIME TO TIME, VTA HAS  
12 DEVELOPED NOT ABOUT RESTORING CUTS, PROVIDING SERVICE ARGUABLY  
13 OUT ON THE STREET THAT REFLECTS GOOD NEWS APPROXIMATE  
14 PLANNING. AND GOOD NEEDS. SO THAT'S THE BIT I AGREE WITH THERE  
15 IN TERMS OF WHAT TO FUND SHOULD INCLUDE THE SERVICE THAT  
16 PEOPLE WANT AND NEED AND AGENCIES HAVE PLANNED FOR.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND I SAID AT THE BEGINNING THIS IS NOT  
19 THE END OF THIS JOURNEY IT'S THE FIRST STEP WE HAVE A LONG WAY  
20 TO GO TO GET TO SOMETHING THAT MEETS THE THREE OBJECTIVES.

21 JOHN?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO PUT OUT THERE CHAIR SPERING WHAT YOU SAID  
24 YOU HIT THE NAIL ON THE HEAD, YOU COULD HAVE DROPPED THE MIC  
25 AFTER WHAT YOU SAID. PRETTY MUCH DONE. ALL RIGHT. BUT ONE OF



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE THINGS, FIND FRUSTRATING REPRESENTING WORKERS WHO WORK FOR  
2 BART RAPID TRANSIT AND HOW TRANSIT AGENCIES IS THIS IS NOT THE  
3 FAULT OF TRANSIT AGENCIES IT'S NOT THE FAULT OF THE WORKERS  
4 THIS IS THE FAULT OF PEOPLE DON'T WANT TO COME TO WORK. AND  
5 BUSINESSES FAILURE TO MAKE THEM COME TO WORK. OKAY. YOU HAVE  
6 DESTROYED SOCIETY IN A LOT OF WAYS. AND IT'S GOING TO TAKE  
7 DECADES TO RECOVER. OKAY? STOP POINTING THE FINGER AT THE  
8 TRANSIT AGENCIES. WE DON'T HAVE TO CHANGE. IT'S KIND OF LIKE -  
9 - I DON'T NEED TO ATTACK ANY GENERAL MANAGER, WHEN YOU HIRE A  
10 GENERAL MANAGER, THEY COME IN AND FLIP, WHAT THE HELL ARE THEY  
11 DOING, THEY'RE JUST CHANGING TO SAY THANK YOU FOR PAYING ME  
12 EXTRA MONEY AND HIRING. NO LET'S TAKE THE MONEY GET IT TO MAKE  
13 THINGS BETTER AND SERVE THE CUSTOMER. DOESN'T MEAN CUTTING  
14 SERVICE DISAPPOINT MEAN GIVING RAISES AND A FAIR LIVING WAGE  
15 TO TRANSIT WORKERS AND THAT KIND OF THE STUFF I'M HEARING IS  
16 IN A DIFFERENT WAY IS CONTROL YOUR COST WHAT DOES CONTROL YOUR  
17 COST MEAN NOT PAYING A FAIR WAGE TO WORKERS? OKAY. BECAUSE  
18 THERE IS NOT ANOTHER WAY TO CONTROL IT AIN'T GOING TO BE  
19 DIESEL, ELECTRICITY, REDUCING COST IT'S NOT GOING TO BE  
20 MAINTENANCE MAKING UNSAFE HOW DO WE MAKE THINGS BETTER LET'S  
21 NOT USE THIS AS AN AS WAY TO OPPRESS THE WORKFORCE IN THE BAY  
22 AREA  
23  
24 **SPEAKER:** WHY DON'T WE OPEN UP THE BART CONTRACT AND DISTRIBUTE  
25 IT AROUND THE TABLE AND SEE IF ANYONE HAS SUGGESTIONS ON ANY





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WAY WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO IMPROVE SERVICE WITHOUT CUTTING  
2 PEOPLE'S WAGES. YOU SAID IT YOURSELF MY FRIEND YOU KNOW WHY  
3 SHOULD WE CHANGE I THINK THERE'S SOME REASONS WHERE YOU MIGHT  
4 WANT TO CONSIDER IT.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DAVID?

7

8 **DAVID RABBITT:** APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMENTS MADE. AND POINTS TO  
9 THE ISSUE WE HAVE IN FRONT OF US AND JIM YOU SAID IT WELL FOR  
10 ME PERSONALLY FROM A COUNTY TO THE NORTH OPT IN COUNTY, I WANT  
11 TO REMAIN THE MOST FLEXIBILITIES POSSIBLE FOR US AND TO ALLOW  
12 THE COUNTY ITSELF TO MAKE THE DECISION WHETHER OR NOT IT'S  
13 BENEFICIAL OBVIOUSLY FROM THE REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE I THINK  
14 SOME OF THIS GOES TO PUBLIC EXPECTATION AND AS YOU ANSWER  
15 THESE QUESTIONS PART OF ME IS THINKING ABOUT MAINTAINING  
16 FLEXIBILITY, THINKING ABOUT WHAT KIND OF MEASURE WOULD PASS  
17 AND I HOOK FORWARD TO POLL THAT'S GOING TO COME TO OUR FRIENDS  
18 FROM OE3 AND CARPENTERS AND LABORERS. THOSE ARE MEAT AND  
19 POTATOES KIND OF THINGS THAT VOTERS WILL BE ATTRACTED TO. I  
20 KNOW IN MY COUNTY THEY ARE. A LOT MORE SO THAN SAYING WE'RE  
21 GOING TO EXTEND ADDITIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE BECAUSE THAT'S THE  
22 TRUTH. WE ALL KNOW THAT BECAUSE WE HAVE SEEN THE POLLING BART  
23 HAS DONE THEIR POLLING AND IT REFLECTS SOME OF THE ISSUES FROM  
24 WHAT I UNDERSTAND AS WELL. AS CHAIR OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
25 MANAGEMENT AND I APPRECIATE MELANIE BEING HERE AND TALKING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ABOUT THE FOUR THINGS WE'RE WORKING ON. THOSE FOUR THINGS  
2 AREN'T NECESSARILY GOING TO DRIVE VOTERS TO PAY MORE MONEY FOR  
3 THAT. THOSE ARE THINGS THAT THE VOTERS OR TRANSIT RIDERS  
4 EXPECT TO BE IN LINE TODAY. MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. IT'S --  
5 YEAH, LET'S COORDINATE IT FARE INTEGRATION, COORDINATE IT. BUT  
6 THOSE AREN'T THINGS THAT YOU CAN GO OUT AND SAY WILL YOU PAY  
7 AN EXTRA KNOW HALF CENT SALES TAX SO WE DO THIS. NO. PART OF  
8 THIS IS WHAT WE'RE SELLING TO PEOPLE HOW WE'RE SELLING IT. FOR  
9 ME CAPITAL ALWAYS HAS TO GO ALONG WITH TRANSIT THAT'S FACT. WE  
10 CAN PRETEND IT'S NOT. BUT I'LL ALSO SAY THE LETTER THAT WE GOT  
11 ON THE NORTH BAY THERE, IS INTEGRATION COORDINATION GOING ON  
12 AND IN FACT THE OTHER DAY THOSE SAME FOLKS DIDN'T COME AND  
13 KNOCK DOWN A THREE AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS CUT TO ONE OF  
14 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT I VOTED AGAINST. SO THERE IS A LOT  
15 OF DISINGENUOUS LETTER WRITING GOING ON AS WELL. SO I THINK  
16 THAT WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD AND TO THE COMMISSION WITH AS  
17 MUCH FLEXIBILITY AS POSSIBLE. BECAUSE THIS IS AN EVER  
18 CHANGING. AND AS WE ALL KNOW THE POLLING IS GOING TO BE A  
19 SNAPSHOT IN TIME THAT'S GOING TO BE DIFFERENT THAN IT'S GOING  
20 TO BE EVENLY TO FOUR MONTHS FROM NOW AND ON AND ON WE NEED TO  
21 GET SOMETHING IN FRONT OF FOLKS THAT WE THINK HAS THE BEST  
22 CHANCE TO PASS.  
23  
24 **SPEAKER:** ALIGNING MY COMMENTS TO MR. WUNDERMAN IN THE INTEREST  
25 OF TIME.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THESE COMMENTS ARE IMPORTANT. HELPS US  
3 SHAPE THIS AS TO WHAT WILL COME FORWARD AND ALL COMMENTS WILL  
4 BE FORWARDED TO THE COMMISSION SO THEY KNOW WHAT WAS DISCUSSED  
5 HERE. OTHER COMMENTS? OKAY.

6

7 **STUART COHEN:** MOVING ON TO THE NEXT QUESTION. I ASKED FOR  
8 STRONG OPINIONS. AND WE'RE GETTING THEM, WHICH IS GREAT. SO,  
9 HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH THE FOLLOWING DURATIONS AND  
10 INVESTMENTS AND THE UPPER BAR IS FOR TEN YEARS TRANSIT ONLY.  
11 THAT ONE HAD A VERY HIGH AMOUNT OF AGREEMENT. AND THE THAT WAS  
12 REALLY EXPRESSED BY OUR SCENARIO 1A, NEW TODAY, AND, ALSO,  
13 MTA'S PROPOSAL. AND THE 30-YEAR, ALSO DOESN'T SUPPORT AT 11  
14 OUT 20 AND EYE NUMBER OF A NUMBER OF NEUTRAL AND ABSTAINING.  
15 IF YOU CAN RAISE THEM HIGHER SO THE PUBLIC CAN SEE THE UPPER  
16 BAR. TEN YEAR TRANSIT BETWEEN AND ONE OR TWO ALL RIGHT. SHOWS  
17 POPULARITY. YELLOW FOR NEUTRAL, THEN DISAGREE OR STRONGLY  
18 DISAGREE, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND FOR THE TEN YEAR. ALL RIGHT.  
19 AND FOR THE 30-YEAR, THOSE WHO VOTED ONE OR TWO, THE AGREE, OR  
20 STRONGLY, PLEASE RAISE. THANK YOU. AND THANK. THIS IS GOING  
21 NICE. IT'S ALSO GOOD FOR THE BLOOD FLOW AT THIS POINT IN THE  
22 MEETING. NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN 30 YEARS. THANK YOU. FINALLY  
23 DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE. THANK YOU. AND IF ANYBODY  
24 WANTED TO, I KNOW SOME OF THE CONVERSATION HAS BEEN YOU KNOW,



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NOT JUST ON THE QUESTION, BUT IF ANYBODY HAD A COMMENT ON THE  
2 QUESTION? COMMISSIONER MILEY?

3

4 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU. WELL, I DON'T THINK ALAMEDA COUNTY IS  
5 GOING TO SUPPORT A 30-YEAR MEASURE. I THINK A TEN YEAR MEASURE  
6 SPEAKS TO THE EMERGING EMERGENCY. AND QUITE FRANKLY, I LIKE  
7 THE OPERATORS PROPOSAL, THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, BUT I JUST  
8 DON'T THINK THE VOTERS ALLOW ME TO GET A SUPPORT FOR 30 YEARS.  
9 I HAVE BEEN ON THE BOARD AND COUNTY CITY COUNCIL, I LIVE IN  
10 THE COUNTY, I JUST DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO FLY.

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** I WOULD GREE WITH NATE ON CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. I  
13 THINK PEOPLE, OBVIOUSLY, WE'RE A BIG BART COUNTY AS IS  
14 ALAMEDA. AND WE UNDERSTAND THE EMERGENCY SITUATION, THE DIRE  
15 SITUATION, AND I COULD SEE VOTERS SUPPORTING, TRYING TO GET  
16 OUT FROM UNDERNEATH THAT EMERGENCY SITUATION, BUT A 30 YEAR  
17 MEASURE IS GOING TO NEED SOMETHING MORE TO IT THAN JUST THAT.  
18 AND I THINK THE COUNTY, SOME -- YOU KNOW, SOME PROMISE. COUNTY  
19 FLEX WAY OUT IN 20 YEARS I DON'T THINK IS -- NOT A LOT OF  
20 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO PUBLIC THAT, TO VOTE FOR THAT. SO THAT'S  
21 WHY, I MEAN, I HAD AGREED WITH BOTH VARIATIONS. BUT I THINK  
22 THE 10-YEAR, WOULD FLY BETTER IN CONTRA COSTA THAN 30-YEAR.

23

24 **SPEAKER:**

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH SIMILARLY IN MARIN COUNTY, TEN  
2 YEAR OPTION APPRECIATE THE OPERATORS BRINGING THAT FORWARD  
3 SEEMS TO BE STRAIGHT FORWARD TO ME BUT ALSO WAIT TO SEE  
4 POLLING BECAUSE THERE ARE PRIORITY PROJECTS IN MARIN ELSEWHERE  
5 THAT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL AS WELL, THAT'S WHAT I'M GOING WAY  
6 WAIT FOR IS THE POLLING.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK THE VOTERS ARE GOING HAVE AN EXTREMELY  
9 DIFFICULT TIME WITH 30 YEARS BECAUSE YOU DON'T SEE THE  
10 RESULTS. TEN YEARS, IT'S ALMOST LIKE YES YOU HAVE THAT  
11 OPPORTUNITY. YOU HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO SUCCEED IN THE VOTERS  
12 CAN SEE THAT. SO, I THINK THAT'S A LOT MORE PALATABLE. BECAUSE  
13 THEY WANT RESULTS. SO, YES, I WAS AGAINST BOTH ON THIS FRONT.  
14 I DO THINK IF IT'S 10-YEAR THOUGH, YOU HAVE TO ALLOW FOR SOME  
15 FLEXIBILITY WITHIN THE COUNTY. BECAUSE FOR MY COUNTY, MAYBE 9%  
16 OF BART'S OPERATIONS ARE REFLECTED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY. BUT  
17 YOU'RE ASKING THE WHOLE COUNTY TO PARTICIPATE HERE. AND SO  
18 THAT'S WHY SOME FLEXIBILITY BUILT IN THERE WOULD MAYBE BE  
19 PALATABLE FOR THIS COUNTY TO SUCCEED. WE HAVE HEARD FROM THE  
20 UNIONS HERE AND WE HAVE A LOT OF INFRASTRUCTURE. WE HAVE TO  
21 PAY FOR THE FARE GATES THERE, BUT WITH GRADE SEPARATION AND  
22 ALL THAT WE CAN DEFINITELY USE FUNDING ALONG THOSE LINES SO  
23 THE WAY IT WAS WRITTEN I HAD BEEN NO ON BOTH BUT TEN YEARS IS  
24 PALATABLE AND IF YOU BUILT IN SOME FLEXIBILITY FOR THE  
25 COUNTIES IT MIGHT BE SOMETHING WE COULD DO WITH. THANK YOU.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU GINA.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I MENTIONED THIS AT OUR LAST MEETING I'M VOTING  
5 NEUTRAL BECAUSE MY CONCERN IS THAT WE ACTUALLY REACH AGREEMENT  
6 IF WE DON'T FIND A SOLUTION CONSEQUENCES WILL BE DEVASTATING,  
7 ECONOMICALLY, SOCIALLY, ENVIRONMENTALLY, ACROSS THE BOARD. SO  
8 WE DO NEED TO REACH A SOLUTION HERE. WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF  
9 CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT HOW WE CAN IMPROVE TRANSIT THROUGH THIS  
10 PROCESS. I WOULD JUST GENTLY REMIND US WE WILL NOT IMPROVE  
11 TRANSIT IF TRANSIT GOES BROKE. IT'S JUST NOT GOING TO HAPPEN.  
12 FIRST THING THAT NEEDS TO HAPPEN IS WE ACTUALLY KEEP IT  
13 SUSTAINED AND THINK ABOUT WHAT THE IMPROVEMENTS LOOK LIKE. I  
14 WILL SAY MY EXPERIENCE -- AND I DO THINK WE'RE DOING A -- WE  
15 HAVE ACKNOWLEDGED THIS, BUT WE ARE, ALL OF US, HOLDING A LOT  
16 OF ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHAT WILL AND WILL NOT BE VIABLE AND  
17 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT A TIME PERIOD THAT'S TWO YEARS FROM NOW,  
18 AND WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN TWO WEEKS FROM NOW.  
19 SO WE HAVE REALLY -- REALLY HAVE TO GIVE OURSELVES FLEXIBILITY  
20 TO BE ADAPTIVE TO WHAT THE PUBLIC IS CONCERNED ABOUT AT THE WE  
21 ACTUALLY GO TO THE VOTERS. I THINK THAT'S ABSOLUTELY  
22 ESSENTIAL. AND ASSUMPTIONS THAT WE'RE HOLDING ABOUT WHAT WILL  
23 MAKE A MEASURE PASS, MAKE A MEASURE LOSE WE HAVE TO TEST THAT.  
24 AND ALSO PART OF ALSO WHY I WAS NEUTRAL ON TEN VERSUS 30 I WAS  
25 NEUTRAL ON AMOUNT OF MONEY WE RAISE IS BECAUSE MY PERSONAL



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 EXPERIENCE WITH TRANSPORTATION MEASURES, THE CONSTRAINING  
2 FACTOR IS VOTER SUPPORT. AND WE WILL GET TO THAT POINT. BUT  
3 WE'RE NOT THERE YET. BECAUSE THE POLLING THAT WE HAVE SEEN SO  
4 FAR I DON'T THINK CAN INFORM WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE GRAPPLING  
5 WITH IN 24 MONTHS. LAST THING I WILL SAY ABOUT THIS PARTICULAR  
6 ITEM IS THAT WE HAVE THE CONSTRUCT OF TEN YEARS OF TRANSIT  
7 ONLY, 30 YEARS OF MULTIMODAL. MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE IS WE  
8 DON'T PASS TRANSIT ONLY MEASURES WE PASS TRANSIT PLUS MEASURES  
9 AND I WOULD CONSIDER TEN YEARS ENCOURAGE US AGAIN TO BUILD THE  
10 FLEXIBILITY TO INCORPORATE SOME ADDITIONAL EXPENDITURE PLAN  
11 COMPONENTS AS A WAY THAT WE COULD POTENTIAL GENERATE  
12 ADDITIONAL SUPPORT.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. MAYOR?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** ALICIA SAID IT WELL. THOSE ARE MY POINTS. I WE SHOULD  
17 OFFER A PERSPECTIVE WHY WE SHOULD STAY OPEN TO 30 YEAR. FROM  
18 OUR PERSPECTIVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE NEED TO RENEW A 30  
19 YEAR SALES TAX MEASURE WITHIN THE NEXT DECADE I THINK WE HAVE  
20 BIAS TOWARD A LONGER TIME HORIZON TO ALICIA'S POINT WITHOUT  
21 MORE APOLOGY GETTING CLOSER IT'S HARD TO KNOW WHAT EXTENT  
22 DURATION IS GOING TO INFLUENCE VOTERS VERSUS MANY OTHER  
23 VARIABLES IN THIS I ADMISSION THINK THERE IS A LOT MORE TO  
24 OFFER FOLKS WITH LONGER TERM MEASURES IN TERMS OF THE  
25 POTENTIAL BENEFITS WHICH PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING FOR IF



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WE'RE GOING TO PUT IN ALL THE EFFORT TO RUN A MULTI-COUNTY  
2 MEASURE AND ALL THAT EXPENSE WE CAN GET MORE YEARS THAT'S  
3 PROBABLY A GOOD THING THEN GET CREATIVE AND HAVE COUNTIES LIKE  
4 SANTA CLARA FRONT LOAD COMMITMENTS WHILE OTHER COUNTIES FOCUS  
5 ON CORE OPERATIONS AND THEN LATER YEARS WE HAVE MORE  
6 FLEXIBILITY OVER 30 YEAR TIME HORIZON BING THE POLLING SHOULD  
7 GUIDE WHAT WE DO ON THIS QUESTION.

8

9 **STUART COHEN:** I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER LIGHTS. NEXT QUESTION  
10 DEALS WITH HOW MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH USE OF REVENUE  
11 MECHANISMS AND THIS WAS THE ONE THAT HAD THE INTERESTING  
12 RESULTS WHERE SALES TAX THAT SUPPORT OF 13 OUT OF 20 THEN  
13 STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH THOSE WHO WEREN'T AND THEN PAYROLL TAX  
14 PARCEL WERE KIND OF EXACTLY THE SAME WITH SEVEN AND SUPPORT  
15 TEN IN DISAGREEMENT AND OTHERS NEUTRAL. WE'LL DO QUICK RAISING  
16 OF HANDS STARTING WITH SALES TAX FOR THOSE WHO AGREE OR  
17 STRONGLY AGREE. RAISE YOUR HAND. GREAT. NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN ON  
18 SALES. THEN DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE ON SALES. THANK YOU.  
19 MOVE TO PAYROLL. RAISE YOUR HAND ONE OR TWO ON PAYROLL ON ALL  
20 RIGHT. NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN ON PAYROLL GREAT FINALLY DISAGREE OR  
21 STRONGLY DISAGREE ON PAYROLL. GREAT. WELL, IF MY MEMORY WAS  
22 GOOD, I WOULD SAY NOW IF EVERYBODY WAS EXACTLY THE SAME.  
23 PARCEL TAX. RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU WERE AGREE OR STRONGLY  
24 AGREE ON PARCEL THIS IS INCLUDING TO EXPLORE IT THANK YOU.  
25 ABSTAIN OR NEUTRAL. THEN FINALLY DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ON PARCEL. GREAT. WELL THANK YOU ON THAT. OF COURSE, WE HAVE  
2 HAD CONVERSATION ON THESE MECHANISMS BUT IF THERE WERE ANY  
3 ADDITIONAL INPUTS YOU WOULD LIKE TO OFFER ON THEM. POINT THAT  
4 HAVEN'T BEEN BROUGHT UP OR WHY YOU'RE SO STRONGLY FEELING THAT  
5 WAY. YEAH.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. YEAH, I MEAN, I HAVE A JURISDICTION, 20  
8 DIFFERENT CITIES HERE ALL DIFFERENT PARCEL TAXES, IT BECOMES  
9 EXCEPTIONALLY DIFFICULT. BECAUSE EVERYBODY IS GOING FOR  
10 DIFFERENT ITEMS AND DIFFERENT OBLIGATIONS SO IT BECOMES REALLY  
11 COMPLICATED IN MY JURISDICTION SO THAT'S WHY I DON'T THINK IT  
12 WOULD BE VERY DIFFICULT FOR THE VOTERS. BECAUSE EVERYBODY HAS  
13 GOT DIFFERING CONCERNS AND THEY'RE ALREADY PAYING SO MUCH IN  
14 THEIR VARIOUS CITIES.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. SUE?

17

18 **SUE NOACK:** TAKING A DIFFERENT APPROACH TO THE SAME CONCEPT. I  
19 JUST WANT TO BE AS FLEXIBLE AS POSSIBLE WITH ALL OF THEM STILL  
20 ON THE TABLE. AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN THE PREVIOUS ONES,  
21 HAVING THE VARIOUS OPTIONS AVAILABLE TO US TWO YEARS FROM NOW  
22 I THINK IS IMPORTANT. WE DON'T KNOW WHETHER BAHFA IS GOING TO  
23 GO FORWARD, PARCEL TAX ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND COULD AFFECT  
24 PARCEL TAXES. I MENTIONED BEFORE A LOT OF CITIES FACING AND  
25 COUNTIES FACING UNFUNDED PENSION LIABILITIES THAT THEY MAY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 NEED TO USE SALES TAX FOR THIS IS ONE OF THOSE THAT I THINK IS  
2 SUPER IMPORTANT TO BE A POLLING QUESTION MORE THAN ANYTHING  
3 ELSE. AND WE'LL HAVE A BETTER IDEA AS WE GO DOWN THE ROAD  
4 WHERE PEOPLE HAVE CAPACITY OR DON'T. THANKS.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** STEPHANIE?

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I'M GOING TO PLUS ONE THAT. I VOTED  
9 TO AGREE WITH ALL THESE FUNDING MEASURES BECAUSE EACH COUNTY  
10 NEEDS TO MAKE UP THEIR DECISION ON WHAT WORKS BEST FOR THEM  
11 AND WE'LL KNOW MORE WHEN THE POLLING HAPPENS.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OTHER? I DO NOT SEE ANY  
14 OTHER LIGHTS. OH JIM.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THERE IS A LOT -- THERE WAS A LOT OF SADNESS  
17 WHEN THE BAHFA MEASURE DIDN'T MAKE IT, AND THERE IS -- YOU  
18 KNOW, I KNOW WE WILL DO THE POLLING IN THE FUTURE BUT IF WE  
19 WERE TO DO IT YESTERDAY OR TODAY WE'LL FIND THAT HOUSING IS  
20 PROBABLY THE TOP ISSUE IN THE REGION BY A LOT, AFFORDABLE  
21 HOUSING. SO THAT GROUP REALLY FEELS STRONGLY THAT PARCEL TAX  
22 IS THEIR WAY FORWARD. AND THERE IS MAYBE A STRONGER NEXUS  
23 BETWEEN WHAT IS EFFECTIVELY REAL ESTATE TAX AND THE  
24 DEVELOPMENT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND, SO, I JUST THINK, YOU  
25 KNOW, MAYBE -- YOU KNOW, IT'S BEEN SAID WE'RE SERVING THE SAME



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CONSTITUENTS E TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE, PEOPLE WHO ARE BEING  
2 PUSHED OUT OF THE REGION AND SO FORTH. SO MAYBE THERE IS SOME  
3 COORDINATION THAT COULD ULTIMATELY BE DONE BETWEEN THOSE TWO  
4 EFFORTS BUT FOR US TO GO OFF ON OUR OWN I THINK IS NOT GOING  
5 TO BE -- IS NOT THE RIGHT THING TO DO.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MY MEETINGS AND DISCUSSIONS WITH THE  
8 HOUSING ADVOCATES, THEY'RE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF SOLVING THIS  
9 TRANSIT PROBLEM. BUT THEY ALSO WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THEIR  
10 OPPORTUNITIES ARE GOING TO BE AVAILABLE IN THE FUTURE. AND SO,  
11 YOU KNOW, EVERYBODY I HAVE TALKED TO FROM THAT COMMUNITY THEY  
12 WANT TO WORK TOGETHER THAT WE UNITE OUR EFFORTS. HOUSING IS  
13 CRITICAL. ESSENTIALLY FOR THE NEXT GENERATION. SO WE HAVE TO  
14 RESOLVE THAT. SO. OTHER? OKAY. ALICIA.

15

16 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** SO, WE STRONGLY DISAGREED WITH ALL THE  
17 MEASURES AND I WANT TO GIVE CONTEXT AS TO WHY. FOR US, ARE THE  
18 POLICY CONSIDERATIONS HAVE ALWAYS BEEN DEEPLY INTERTWINED WITH  
19 WHATEVER MOVES FORWARD. AND SO WHILE WE FEEL COMFORTABLE  
20 WEIGHING IN ON SOME OF THE PROVISIONS HERE IN REGARDS TO  
21 EXACTLY WHAT TYPE OF TAX, WE THINK WE SHOULD BE ASKING VOTERS  
22 TO SUPPORT, WE CAN'T ASK VOTERS TO SUPPORT SOMETHING IF WE  
23 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE POLICY CONSIDERATIONS ARE. AND I THINK  
24 EVERYONE KNOWS THAT OUR OFFICE INCLUDES GOVERNANCE REFORM AND  
25 SOME AMOUNT OF CONSOLIDATION.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. OKAY.

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** ALL RIGHT. THE VERY LAST ONE. LAST QUESTION. HOW  
5 MUCH DO YOU AGREE WITH THESE TAX STRUCTURES OR FUNDING  
6 FRAMEWORKS? AND THIS WAS THE SINGLE TAX, WHICH, YOU KNOW, HAD  
7 ABOUT TEN IN SUPPORT. SOME STRONGLY DISAGREEING. MULTIPLE TAX  
8 SOURCES. THERE WAS A LOT OF INTEREST IN CONTINUING TO EXPLORE,  
9 WE HAVE ABOUT 14 AGREEING. THE VARIABLE RATE, ALSO HAD A LOT  
10 OF INTEREST. AND THEN A LITTLE BIT MORE TREPIDATION ABOUT  
11 ALLOWING FOR FINANCING OR LOANS, BUT STILL EIGHT IN SUPPORT.  
12 AND SEVEN THAT DISAGREED WITH IT. I THINK, BECAUSE THAT'S NEW,  
13 THERE WAS ALSO A NUMBER OF NEUTRAL AND ABSTAIN. AND, SO, WE'RE  
14 GOING TO RUN THROUGH THESE QUICKLY WITH A RAISE OF HANDS. WE  
15 HAVE THE RESOLUTION, THEN WHAT WAS BROUGHT UP BY COMMISSIONER  
16 PAPAN, BY ALICIA, ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY AND OTHER GOVERNANCE  
17 ISSUES, OUR NEXT ITEM IS ON THOSE EXACT POLICY PROVISIONS. SO  
18 WE'LL MOVE THROUGH THIS AND HAVE A RESOLUTION BUT JUST KNOW  
19 THAT WE WILL BE GETTING TO THOSE WE'RE JUST SEQUENCING WITH  
20 FUNDING MEASURES FIRST. SO, IF YOU AGREED OR STRONGLY AGREED  
21 WITH THE SINGLE TAX, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I HAVE ABOUT TEN  
22 HANDS UP. GREAT. NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN. SUPER. AND THEN DISAGREE.  
23 AND IT LOOKS LIKE ONLY STRONG DISAGREE ON THAT ONE. OKAY. ON  
24 MULTIPLE TAX SOURCES THIS HAS 43 DEGREES OR STRONGLY  
25 DISAGREES. PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND ON AGREES, STRONGLY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DISAGREES. NEUTRAL, MULTIPLE TAX, WHO DISAGREES WITH MULTIPLE  
2 TAX? OKAY. THANK YOU. VARIABLE RATE. THIS WAS GOING TO BE MTA,  
3 IF YOU STRONGLY AGREE OR AGREE, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. THANK  
4 YOU. MUTUAL OR ABSTAIN? EXCELLENT. AND THEN JUST A FEW WHO  
5 DISAGREED WITH THIS. OR STRONGLY DISAGREED. THANK YOU. AND THE  
6 FINAL QUESTION, ALLOWING FOR FINANCING OR LOANS, WHO AGREES OR  
7 STRONGLY AGREED WITH THIS ONE IN THANK YOU. AND THEN WE HAVE  
8 NEUTRAL OR ABSTAIN SHOULD BE A FEW OF THESE. AND FINALLY  
9 DISAGREE AND STRONGLY DISAGREE. OKAY. THANK YOU. CHAIR  
10 SPERING, I'LL HAND IT BACK TO YOU FOR THE MOTION.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WHAT I HAVE ASKED STAFF TO DO, AND YOU ALL  
13 HAVE BEEN GIVEN A COPY. THE REASON I WANT TO TAKE THIS  
14 APPROACH IS TO SEE IF WE CAN AGREE ON SOME CORE PRINCIPLES OR  
15 ELEMENT THAT IS WHEN IT GOES TO THE COMMISSION THAT THESE ARE  
16 ADDRESSED AND INCLUDED. I DIDN'T SEE US VOTING AND GETTING  
17 CONSENSUS ANY OF THE OPTIONS OR NOTARY SCENARIOS BUT AT LEAST  
18 WILL HELP WITH THIS FRAMEWORK. A FRAMEWORK THAT CAN BE  
19 MODIFIED TO MEET WHATEVER THE POLLING IS. THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE  
20 TRIED DO. LOOKING AT IT THIS AGENDA ITEM 4B, THIS IS A HANDOUT  
21 IF YOU CAN LOOK AT THAT. THE FIRST BULLET IMPLEMENT TRANSIT  
22 TRANSFORMATION 10% IMPROVEMENTS THAT MEDICATE SYSTEM MORE  
23 CONNECTED AFFORDABLE AND RELIABLE AND ENSURE HALF OF THESE  
24 FUNDS ARE INVESTED IN PROPORTION TO EACH COUNTY'S



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CONTRIBUTION. IS THAT SOMETHING EVERYONE AGREES ON? OR DOES  
2 ANYONE DISAGREE?

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CHAIR SPERING, WHILE YOU'RE WAITING FOR PEOPLE  
5 TO RAISE THEIR HAND CAN WE PULL UP ITEM 4B MOTION I THINK IT'S  
6 CALLED IF THE TECH TEAM CAN PULL IT UP AND THERE SHOULD BE  
7 SOME EXTRA COPIES ON THE TABLE FOR THOSE IN THE PUBLIC.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES. DOES ANYONE WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS?  
10 SUE?

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** THE ONLY THING I WOULD CHANGE ON THIS IS ACTUALLY  
13 INVESTING BY 10%. BECAUSE WE WANT SOME FLEXIBILITY THERE, IF  
14 THERE IS SOME TRANSFORMATIONAL THINGS THAT COULD BENEFIT THE  
15 RIDERS, I WOULD WANT FLEXIBILITY THERE IN SAYING INVESTING AT  
16 LEAST 10%.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. NICK? WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS SHEET  
19 THAT WAS HANDED OUT TO EVERYONE. AT THE TOP IT SAYS AGENDA  
20 ITEM 4B AREAS OF AGREEMENT ON SCENARIOS. OKAY. I HAD STAFF PUT  
21 THIS TOGETHER SO EVERYBODY COULD SEE IT IN WRITING AND YOU CAN  
22 RESPOND. NICK THEN ALICIA.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IT STRIKES ME THIS IS THE ONLY TIME WE  
25 MENTIONED A PERCENTAGE HERE IN THIS WHOLE DOCUMENT. I THINK



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 IT'S APPROPRIATE TO CONTINUE TO CONSIDER TRANSFORMATIVE ARE  
2 TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. BUT I THINK PEGGING IT AT 10% OF ANY  
3 REVENUE MEASURE SEEMS OVERLY SPECIFIC AT THIS STAGE. AND THAT  
4 IT MIGHT BE MORE, YOU KNOW, IT MIGHT END UP BEING 5% BECAUSE  
5 OF THE WAY THE POLLING COMES OUT AND WE NEED TO PUT MORE OF  
6 THAT MONEY INTO THE OPERATIONS OR SOMETHING ELSE. SO, IT JUST  
7 FEELS LIKE THE -- IT JUST FEELS OVERLY SPECIFIC TO ME. SO, I  
8 WOULD INVESTING REVENUE IN KEY IMPROVEMENTS SEEMS MORE  
9 APPROPRIATE TO ME.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. ALICIA?

12

13 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** DITTO.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. GINA?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** YOU HAVE GOT NATE DOWN THERE. I WOULD AGREE. IF WE  
18 DON'T HAVE IT BUILT IN I DO NOT SEE THE PUBLIC BUYING IN AT  
19 ALL AND I THINK THE BART POLLING JUST SHOWED THAT. I THINK THE  
20 POLLING IS GOING TO BE VERY DETERMINATIVE OF WHAT THIS IS WE  
21 WERE RUNNING AROUND I DON'T THINK WE'RE KIND OF RUN BE AROUND  
22 BART POLLING SHOWED THAT UNLESS WE HAVE THIS BUILT IN I DO NOT  
23 THINK THERE IS ANY CHANCE OF ANYTHING PASSING. I WOULD AGREE  
24 WITH SUE 10% WE HAVE TO SHOW SOMETHING TRANSFORMATIVE AND THE  
25 OPERATORS HAVE ALREADY AGREED TO ALL OF THIS LET'S BE SPECIFIC



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 FIVE YEARS AGO THEY WERE PART OF THE TRANSFORMATION PLAN AND  
2 NOW IF YOU'RE GOING TO RECEIVE FUNDING, IT'S EXTREMELY  
3 IMPORTANT THAT THIS IS IN THE MEASURE.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. MAYOR?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** JUST QUICKLY, IF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ARE THE  
8 CATEGORIES WE SHOWED IN THE SLIDE DECK EARLIER WHICH I THINK  
9 THEY ARE, I AGREE WITH THE COMMENT EARLIER MADE THAT'S THE  
10 TABLE SIX THAT'S WHAT THE VOTERS EXPECT US TO ALREADY BE DOING  
11 WAY FINDING SCHEDULE COORDINATION AND COORDINATE THE FARE  
12 THAT'S ALL GOOD WORK WE SHOULD ALL BE COMMITTED TO IT I AGREE  
13 WITH NICK. NOW WE'RE AT 10% WE NEED TO PASS THIS TO GET SORT  
14 SUPPORT MAY NOT BE THE SPECIFIC CATEGORIES WE HAVE IDENTIFIED  
15 FOR THE NETWORK TRANSFORMATION WORK WE'RE DOING. FRANKLY, AND  
16 THIS IS WHERE NICK AND I PROBABLY DISAGREE, WE MIGHT HAVE TO  
17 MENTION POTHOLES. AND I THINK WE SHOULD LEAVE OURSELVES -- WE  
18 SHOULD BE COMMITTED TO INVESTING IN THIS WORK BUT NOT ASSIGN A  
19 SPECIFIC PERCENTAGE UNTIL WE HAVE BETTER VETTED THAT AND OTHER  
20 THINGS TO HELP GET THIS OVER THE LINE.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AS YOU READ THIS IT JUST SAYS KEY  
23 IMPROVEMENTS THAT MAKE THE SYSTEM MORE CONNECTED AFFORDABLE  
24 AND RELIABLE AND ENSURE HALF OF FUNDS ARE INVESTED IN  
25 PROPORTIONS OF EACH COUNTY SO IT DOESN'T SPECIFICALLY TALK





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 ABOUT THE NETWORK MANAGER. SO THIS IS FAIRLY BROAD AND WE'RE  
2 TRYING TO AGREE THERE SHOULD BE CARVE-OUT FOR THESE ISSUES.

3

4 **SUE NOACK:** AND ACTUALLY I WOULD HAVE SAID WE NEED TO DO MORE  
5 THAN THOSE FOUR THINGS THAT'S WHY I HAD AT LEAST 10%. BECAUSE  
6 -- NO, AND YOU KNOW, I WAS SO LONG DOING THAT WE NEED TO DO  
7 MORE OF THAT AND THEREFORE MORE THAN 10%.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE TRIED TO BROADEN IT JUST BECAUSE OF  
10 WHAT WE HAVE HEARD IN THE REGION. NATE?

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** I AGREE AT LEAST 10%. FOR THE LAST 30 YEARS, IN  
13 THE LAST TEN YEARS, A PRESIDENT OF AN ORGANIZATION WHO WORKS  
14 WITH OLDER ADULTS THROUGH THE ALAMEDA COUNTY WORKS WITH THE  
15 DISABLED AND AS WELL SPEAKS TO EQUITY AND I THINK AT LEAST 10%  
16 IT'S A DISSERVICE.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. MY TRAVELS AROUND, PEOPLE WANT TO  
19 SEE CHANGE AND WANT TO SEE VISION AND A BETTER SEAMLESS SYSTEM  
20 AND I THINK THIS ADDRESSES THAT. SO, IS THERE OPPOSITION TO  
21 SAYING AT LEAST 10%? DOES KNOB OPPOSE THAT? CINDY. I KEEP  
22 OVERLOOKING YOU. I APOLOGIZE.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NO PROBLEM. I APOLOGIZE TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR NOT  
25 BEING IN THE ROOM. I THINK 10% WHAT MAKES ME MINDFUL OF THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 DIFFERENT COUNTIES ARE USING PARCEL TAX OR SALES TAX THAT  
2 AMOUNT WILL HAVE DIFFERENT IMPACT TO EACH OF THE CANYONS AND  
3 POTENTIALLY EVEN TO THE BLOCKS OF COMMUNITIES THAT ARE VOTING  
4 ON CONCURRENTLY. SO, I AGREE WITH NICK THAT I DON'T THINK WE  
5 SHOULD HAVE A PERCENTAGE. I DON'T DISAGREE THESE SHOULD BE  
6 PRIORITIZED AND I DO THINK WE NEED TO SAY THERE NEEDS TO BE  
7 SET ASIDE FOR INVESTING IN THESE PARTICULAR ACTIVITIES BUT THE  
8 AMOUNT, I THINK MAYBE OVERLY PRESCRIPTIVE AT THIS TIME.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. OTHER COMMENTS THAT? OKAY. SO, SUE  
11 HAS TO INCLUDE AT LEAST 10%. IS THERE ANYBODY OPPOSED TO THAT?  
12 OKAY. AND THEN, YOU KNOW -- OKAY. THERE IS A HAND.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NOT SUPPORTIVE OF THAT. NO. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. AND YOU KNOW, THIS WILL TAKE ON A  
17 LOT OF DIFFERENT FORMS AS WE MOVE FORWARD BUT WHAT WE'RE  
18 TRYING TO DO IS SEND A MESSAGE TO BOTH THE COMMISSION AND  
19 LEGISLATURE THAT THERE HAS TO BE AT LEAST SOME COMMITMENT  
20 THAT'S WHY WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSING ON THAT 10%, 5% AT DISCRETION  
21 OF THESE COUNTIES 5% FOR REGIONAL SHARE. LET ME GET BACK TO AT  
22 LEAST 10%. HOW MANY PEOPLE SUPPORT THAT? OKAY. SO THOSE OF YOU  
23 THAT DIDN'T RAISE YOUR HAND, WHAT IS IT YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE  
24 CONSIDERED? ANYBODY? OKAY. DO YOU -- GO AHEAD, ALICIA. YOU ARE  
25 MISS NEUTRAL TODAY. [LAUGHTER]



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** FLEXIBILITY. FLEXIBILITY. MY PROPOSAL WOULD  
3 BE IMPLEMENT TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BY INVESTING IN KEY  
4 IMPROVEMENTS AND WOULD JUST BE SILENT ON THE PERCENTAGE AT  
5 THIS MOMENT IN TIME.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, HOW DOES EVERYONE FEEL ABOUT  
8 THAT? WE'RE SILENT ON IT AND IT'S TO BE DETERMINED IN THE  
9 FUTURE? IS THAT SOMETHING WE CAN MOVE FORWARD?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** NO.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OH YOU CAN'T?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** NO.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I WOULD STATE VISION PORTION IS IN  
18 SOME GUARANTEE MONEY WILL BE INVESTED IN IT AND THIS'S WHAT'S  
19 GOING TO MOVE THE VOTERS SO WE HAVEN'T AND NATE IS CORRECT WE  
20 HAVE TO MAKE SURE THOSE CHANGES ARE IN THERE. SO HOW ABOUT  
21 WITH THE ORIGINAL WORDING WHERE WE SAY BY INVESTING 10% THAT  
22 KIND OF FIND NEUTRAL GROUND? THAT -- WHEN IT GOES TO THE  
23 COMMISSION -- KEEP IN MIND THAT THIS IS GOING TO BE SOMETHING  
24 THAT'S GOING TO BE DEBATED AT THE COMMISSION FOR SURE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WAS GOING TO SAY MAYBE THE MOST IMPORTANT  
2 THING IS WE DELIVER THE IMPROVEMENTS RATHER THAN EXACTLY HOW  
3 MUCH MONEY WE SPEND ON THEM. AND YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON THE  
4 SIZE OF THE MEASURE, WE CAN, YOU KNOW, MAYBE DEVOTE SLIGHTLY  
5 LESS A PERCENTAGE TO DELIVER ON THE KEY IMPROVEMENTS AND IF  
6 IT'S A SMALLER MEASURE WE MIGHT NEED TO SPEND A LITTLE BIT  
7 MORE ON IT BUT I THINK RATHER THAN KEYING IT TO THE  
8 PERCENTAGE, SO, I MEAN, MAYBE IMPLEMENT TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
9 BY DELIVERING IN KEY IMPROVEMENTS TO MAKE THE SYSTEM MORE  
10 CONNECTED, AFFORDABLE, AND RELIABLE?

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** FUNDING AND DELIVERING, BECAUSE IF THERE IS NO  
13 FUNDING AT ALL YOU WIND UP WITH HISTORICAL IMPASSE WHERE YOU  
14 CAN'T DO FARE COORDINATION BECAUSE NOBODY'S AGREEING ON MONEY  
15 AND FUNDING BECAUSE WE'RE AGREEING THAT IT'S FUNDING BUT YOU  
16 DO NOT MAYBE AT 100% YOU KNOW THIS'S EXACTLY 10%.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** 44 COUNTY MEASURE HOW DO YOU MAKE THIS INTEGRATED. IN  
19 THE PREVIOUS TASK FORCE WE WERE TALKING ABOUT A NINE COUNTY  
20 SYSTEM IMPROVEMENT AND NOW WE'RE TALKING ABOUT FOUR COUNTY  
21 MEASURE AND IT SEEMS TO ME THEY DON'T FIT NEATLY TOGETHER.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I WAS GOING TO SAY IT SOUNDS LIKE THE MAIN  
24 DIFFERENCES ARE, IN GENERAL, THERE IS AGREEMENT THAT THERE IS  
25 A NEED TO DELIVER, FUND AND DELIVER THESE IMPROVEMENTS TO SOME



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 EXTENT THERE IS CONCERN ABOUT TRADEOFFS BETWEEN ABILITY TO  
2 FUND AND MAINTAIN SERVICE LEVELS AND GROW SERVICE VERSUS  
3 DELIVERING THESE TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVE PERMANENTS THERE'S  
4 CONTINGENT AND ABSOLUTELY WANT TO SEE A PERCENTAGE IN THERE SO  
5 MAYBE SOME WAY TO FORWARD AND INCLUDE SOME QUALIFYING LANGUAGE  
6 THAT MAINTAINS A PERCENTAGE OF INVESTMENT THAT'S ENUMERATED  
7 BUT ADDS IN THE LANGUAGE OF THE MOTION AND ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT  
8 COULD THIS COME WITH TRADEOFFS TO MAINTAINING OR EXPANDING  
9 SERVICE AND THAT WOULD NEED TO BE FURTHER DISCUSSED BY THE  
10 COMMISSION LEGISLATURE ET CETERA SO TRYING TO FIND GROUND  
11 WHERE YOU IDENTIFY BUT THE TRADEOFF EXISTS NEEDS TO BE  
12 DISCUSSED FURTHER THERE'S CONVERSATION FOR EXAMPLE, ABOUT 10%.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WANT TO CLARIFY HOW WE FOCUS ON THAT ALL  
15 THE INPUT WE'RE GETTING IS THE PUBLIC IS NOT GOING TO SUPPORT  
16 SOMETHING THAT YOU DON'T IDENTIFY YOU HAVE FUNDING FOR. SO,  
17 YOU HAVE TO TRUST THIS WILL BENEFIT IN THE FUTURE. WE'RE NOT  
18 HAVING PEOPLE SAY WE TRUST YOU WE'RE NOT, THAT THEY WANT  
19 DEFINITION ARE YOU GOING TO DELIVER THESE CHANGES AND HOW ARE  
20 YOU GOING TO FUND IT YOU CAN'T BE VAGUE ON THAT ISSUE IF YOU  
21 EXPECT VOTERS TO SUPPORT IT. JUST GIVING YOU A BACKGROUND.  
22 STEPHANIE.

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** PURPOSE OF THIS GROUP IS TO TEE UP  
25 THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DISCUSSION TO FULL MTC COMMISSION



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 I WOULD BE IN FAVOR OF LEAVING IT AT 10% THEN LETTING THE  
2 COMMISSION TALK ABOUT IT IN THE FULL BODY. LEAVE IT IN.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** CAN EVERYONE LIVE WITH LEAVING IT IN AND  
5 WE'LL FURTHER HAVE ANOTHER BITE AT THIS APPLE? THERE A  
6 CONSENSUS TO LEAVE 10% IN I SEE A LOT OF NODDINGS HEADS. I  
7 THOUGHT DOING IT THIS WAY WOULD BE REAL SIMPLE. [LAUGHTER]  
8 I'LL PROBABLY BE REPLACED OF THERE IS ANOTHER MEETING. SO OKAY  
9 YOU GOT SOME CONSENSUS THAT. THANK YOU ALL I APPRECIATE THE  
10 COMMENTS. FRAMEWORK CONSIDER SCENARIO 1, 1A, AND THE HYBRID  
11 BUT THE MEASURE SHOULD INCLUDE AT LEAST FOUR CORE COUNTIES  
12 FROM SCENARIO ONE, ALAMEDA, SAN FRANCISCO, CONTRA COSTA AND  
13 SAN MATEO. OPEN FOR DISCUSSIONS. NICK GO AHEAD.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE KEEPING IT OPEN BUT THINK IT'S  
16 IMPORTANT WE ALSO CONTINUE TO INCLUDE THE OPERATOR MEASURE.  
17 WHICH DOESN'T SEEM TO BE -- DID I --

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH. THE REASON WE HAD THE OPERATORS  
20 PRESENT TODAY SO THE COMMITTEE COULD SEE THAT AND WE DIDN'T  
21 WANT YOU TO BE SURPRISED WHEN THAT COMES FORWARD BUT THAT WILL  
22 BE CONSIDERED BY THE COMMISSION IF YOU WANT TO ADD THAT  
23 LANGUAGE IN THERE.

24

25 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WOULD -- YES.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO WE WOULD ADD THAT. THAT WAS OUR INTENT  
3 AND WHY WE SHOWED IT TO YOU TODAY. YES, MANNY?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANKS JIM. FROM MY OWN PERSONAL HISTORY IT'S THE  
6 EASIEST THINGS THAT ARE MOST DIFFICULT ONES THAT LOOK EASIER  
7 ARE ACTUALLY HARDEST. WE'RE NOT GOING TO SUPPORT THIS BULLET.  
8 WE'RE NOT GOING TO SUPPORT IT BECAUSE WE'RE NOT SUPPORT OF ANY  
9 OF THE SCENARIOS WE WANT TO BE CLEAR WE'RE A HARD NO ON THIS  
10 ONE.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. OTHER COMMENTS ON THIS  
13 ITEM? GINA?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANT TO THANK JONATHON FOR ALL THAT HARD WORK.  
16 THE DISCUSSION KEEPS GOING HERE BUT WE CAN'T BE SUPPORTIVE OF  
17 THIS EITHER AT THIS POINT IN TIME, OR I CAN'T. MR. TALKATIVE  
18 TO MY LEFT I'LL LET HIM SPEAK FOR HIMSELF.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** I GUESS I'LL SPEAK THANKS GINA, APPRECIATE IT.  
21 LOOK. I HAVE A BEVY OF ISSUES WITH WHEN'S MOVING FORWARD  
22 TODAY. WE'LL BE VOTING NO. BIGGEST ISSUE IS AROUND CONSENSUS  
23 BUILDING MY HOPE WAS AT THE END OF THIS PROCESS, THE SELECT  
24 COMMITTEE THAT WE COULD REALLY LAND ON SOMETHING. I DO NOT  
25 KNOW AND I'M HEARING THE COMMENTS TODAY FROM THE LABOR



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 COMMUNITY WE HAVE DONE THAT AND THAT'S A GREAT CONCERN. MR.  
2 CHAIR, I HAVE A QUESTION IN TERMS OF TIMELINE IS THERE  
3 ADDITIONAL TIME BEFORE THIS GOES TO THE COMMISSIONS TO HAVE  
4 POTENTIALLY ANOTHER MEETING? I DO LOOK AT POTENTIALLY ITEM --  
5 OR WAS IT 1A? THERE MAY BE A POTENTIAL PATHWAY THERE. SO, I'M  
6 NOT CLOSING THAT OFF. BUT I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND, BECAUSE  
7 THAT HAS BEEN BROUGHT FORWARD TO US TODAY, IF WE DO HAVE THE  
8 ABILITY ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE TO MAYBE TEASE THAT OUT A  
9 LITTLE BIT MORE?

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH, YOU KNOW, I HAVE RECOMMENDED TO  
12 STAFF THAT WE SHOULD NOT HAVE ANOTHER MEETING, THAT WE NEED TO  
13 ADVANCE THE COMMENTS WE'RE HEARING TODAY AND CONCERNS. IT'S  
14 GOING GO BEFORE THE LEG COMMITTEE AND THERE WILL BE PLENTY OF  
15 DISCUSSION THERE AT THE LEG COMMITTEE TO FINE TUNE SOME OF  
16 THESE THINGS. WE'RE TRYING TO BUILD CONSENSUS OR AT LEAST WHAT  
17 SHOULD BE FORWARDED FOR CONSIDERATION. IT DOESN'T MEAN THIS IS  
18 WHERE IT'S GOING TO END UP WE'RE JUST TRYING TO BUILD  
19 CONSENSUS TODAY OF MOVING THESE CORE ISSUES FORWARD. SO THAT  
20 WAS THE PURPOSE OF THIS AND THERE IS GOING TO BE PLENTY MORE  
21 BYTES AT THE APPLE AS WE SAID EARLIER IT'S GOING TO GO TO THE  
22 LEG COMMITTEE, COMMISSION, AND LEGISLATURE. AND EVERYBODY IS  
23 GOING TO WEIGH IN AT ALL THREE LEVELS AND THE TIMELINE THAT  
24 WE'RE UP AGAINST TO GET THIS BEFORE THE LEGISLATURE IS  
25 CRITICAL. AND SO WE CAN'T, YOU KNOW, FOR THIS TIMELINE WE JUST





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CAN'T FALL BEHIND THAT'S WHY IT'S SET UP THE WAY IT IS. BUT  
2 PLENTY OF OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** MR. CHAIR JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND IN TERMS OF  
5 THE LEGISLATIVE TIMELINE YOU WANT TO MOVE FORWARD BECAUSE WE  
6 DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME? OR -- I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THE  
7 LEGISLATIVE SESSION AND HOW THAT WORKS OUT RELATIVE TO US NOT  
8 HAVING AN ADDITIONAL MEETING.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH, NO. I JUST EXPLAINED WHY. IT'S  
11 BECAUSE WE WANT IT TO GO BEFORE THE LEG COMMITTEE AND BEFORE  
12 THE COMMISSION BEFORE THE END OF THE YEAR. SO IF WE HAVE --  
13 YOU KNOW, WE SAID THIS IS GOING TO BE OUR LAST MEETING. DO I  
14 NOT SUPPORT HAVING ANOTHER MEETING IF WE CAN FOLLOW-THROUGH ON  
15 THESE AND GET CONSCIENCE US THAT WE CAN ADVANCE TO THE  
16 COMMISSION.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** MR. CHAIR, I SUSPECT YOU'RE GOING TO ADD IN WHAT'S  
19 BEING CALLED THE OPERATOR PROPOSAL? IT'S SINGLE OPERATOR. SO  
20 GOING AHEAD HERE WE NEED TO SAY, WE -- I MEAN, BECAUSE THERE  
21 ARE OTHER BOARDS OUT THERE, A WHOLE BUNCH OF OTHER OPERATOR  
22 BOARDS OUT THERE THAT I DON'T THINK HAVE ACTUALLY AGREED TO  
23 ALL THIS. SO, IT'S GOING TO BE THE SFMTA PROPOSAL I THINK WE  
24 SHOULD BE SPECIFIC BECAUSE IT'S A BIT MISLEADING WHEN WE SAY  
25 OPERATOR PROPOSAL IT IS SINGLE OPERATOR.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO WE CAN BE SPECIFIC. AND, AGAIN IF  
3 SOMEBODY HAS ANOTHER PROPOSAL, WE'RE SAYING SUBMIT IT TO US IN  
4 WRITING AND WE WILL INCLUDE IT. WE'RE NOT PRECLUDING ANY OTHER  
5 OPTIONS OR PROPOSALS.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA, I THINK, AS THIS MOVES FORWARD,  
8 YOU KNOW, MAJORITY OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE OR COMMISSIONERS,  
9 AND, SO, FOR THE SAKE OF THIS SPEED THAT WE NEED TO GET TO  
10 NOW, TO BE ABLE TO HONE SOMETHING TO THE LEGISLATURE, TO HAVE  
11 THE NEXT VERY SUBSTANTIVE ON THIS TO BE OF THE FULL COMMISSION  
12 AS A SPECIAL COMMISSION MEETING THAT WAS SET UP JUST SO THAT  
13 THIS IS THE ONLY AGENDA ITEM WILL ALLOW IN-DEPTH DISCUSSION ON  
14 THIS. AND YOU KNOW, THE EXACT POLLING TIMELINE HASN'T BEEN  
15 WORKED OUT, BUT YOU KNOW, IDEALLY, I REALLY HEARD A LOT ABOUT  
16 WE NEED POLLING TO UNDERSTAND VOTER SENTIMENT, AND YOU KNOW,  
17 SO WE'LL KIND OF SEE ABOUT THAT. BUT I ALSO JUST WANTED TO,  
18 WHAT YOU ARE VOTING ON TODAY, YOU KNOW, WE JUST DO NEED TO  
19 START THE NARROWING PROCESS. SOMEBODY DESCRIBED THIS AS A  
20 FUNNEL. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, THAT FUNNEL, THAT'S KIND OF WHAT  
21 THIS RESOLUTION IS MEANT. THESE ARE THINGS THAT WILL BE POLLED  
22 AND EXPLORED.

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** IDEALLY IT WOULD HAVE BEEN HELPFUL FOR THE  
25 SELECT COMMITTEE IF WE HAD POLLING. RIGHT? SO, AS WE WORKED ON



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THIS FOR FIVE MONTHS AND AS WE'RE TEASING SCENARIOS OUT OR  
2 TALKING ABOUT DIFFERENT SCENARIOS, I THINK IT WOULD HAVE BEEN  
3 HELPFUL IN THE PROCESS IS IF WE HAD THE DATA POINT. WE'RE AT A  
4 POINT RIGHT NOW WHERE IT'S, LIKE, YOU KNOW, THE POLLING IS  
5 GOING TO COME LATER. AND I'M JUST CURIOUS, MAYBE ANDY CAN  
6 ANSWER THIS OR ALIX, WHY DIDN'T WE POLL DURING THIS POSSESS?  
7 I'M JUST CURIOUS.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ONE OF THE REASONS WE DIDN'T POLL IS  
10 BECAUSE WE DIDN'T THINK IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE BEFORE THE  
11 ELECTION. A LOT OF THIS IS GOING TO CHANGE AFTER THIS  
12 ELECTION. WE FELT ONCE WE KNOW THE RESULTS OF THE PRESIDENTIAL  
13 ELECTION WE'RE GOING TO KNOW WHETHER WE'RE IN A BETTER OR  
14 WORSE POSITION. BUT TO POLL RIGHT NOW, I THINK IT WILL BE VERY  
15 MISLEADING. BUT YOU DO HAVE THE BART'S POLL, SO THAT GIVES YOU  
16 PRETTY GOOD INDICATION WHERE WE'RE AT THIS POINT TIME.

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL PUSH BACK ON THOSE COMMENTS. THE IDEAL TIME  
19 TO POLL WOULD HAVE BEEN THIS YEAR. OBVIOUSLY, BECAUSE IT'S A  
20 PRESIDENTIAL YEAR IN THE SAMPLE OF VOTERS AND, SORT OF, YOU  
21 KNOW, IT WOULD HAVE GIVEN US A CLEAR PATHWAY. BUT NOW WE'RE AT  
22 A POINT RIGHT NOW WHERE IT'S LIKE WE'RE LOOKING AT OPTIONS AND  
23 BEING ASKED TO MAKE A DECISION WITHOUT ALL THE DATA. AND WITH  
24 THAT I TAKE ISSUE WITH THAT. I APPRECIATE YOU GIVING ME A  
25 CHANCE TO SPEAK MR. CHAIR.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU'RE NOT BEING ASKED TO MAKE A DECISION.  
3 YOU'RE BEING ASKED TO ADVANCE WHAT THE COMMISSION SHOULD BE  
4 CONSIDERING. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE SAYING. SO WHAT WE HAVE DONE IN  
5 THIS BULLET IS ADDED THE OPERATOR'S PROPOSAL. IS THERE  
6 ANYTHING ELSE ANYBODY WOULD LIKE TO ADD? JOHN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD JUST SAY IF WE HAD THE SFMTA PROPOSAL WOULD  
9 BE GOOD. THE COMMITTEE WOULD GET A SURVEIL OF THE OTHER  
10 OPERATORS IF THEY AGREE OR DISAGREE WITH THAT PROPOSAL.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH. WE CAN DEFINITELY PROVIDE THAT. GO  
13 THROUGH THAT PROCESS GET THAT BEFORE THE COMMISSION BEFORE THE  
14 LEG COMMITTEE. YEAH. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD SUGGESTION.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** CHAIR, WE SUBMITTED A LETTER AS TO OUR OPPOSITION. I  
17 DON'T WANT IT TO BE CONFUSED THAT WE JUST WANT TO, SORT OF, GO  
18 ALONG, YOU KNOW. THE FUNNEL NEEDS TO BE NARROWED MORE AND  
19 POINTED BETTER AND MAYBE, WE WOULD LIKE, AS WE SAY IN OUR  
20 LETTER, WE WOULD LIKE TO GET TO A PLACE WHERE WE WOULD BE  
21 SUPPORTIVE OF THIS AND I HOPE WE WILL, BUT AT THIS STAGE IT'S  
22 TOO BROAD AND INCLUDES THINGS WE'RE OPPOSED TO AND I WANT IT  
23 TO BE ON THE RECORD AND THERE ARE THINGS NOT INCLUDED IN IT  
24 THAT WE THINK SHOULD BE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. TRYING TO GET A CONSENSUS MOVING THE  
2 FRAMEWORK TO THE COMMITTEE AND TO THE LEDGE COMMITTEE. IS  
3 THERE SUPPORT TO ADVANCE THIS? WITH THE SFMTA PROPOSAL. SO, IS  
4 THERE ANY OPPOSITION TO IT? AT LEAST --

5

6 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. WE WERE OPPOSED TO IT BUT BY ALL MEANS DO WHAT  
7 YOU HAVE TO DO.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE'RE JUST ADVANCING THIS TO THE  
10 MAJORITIES OF THE PEOPLE I SEE NODDING THEIR HEADS TO ADVANCE  
11 THIS TO THE COMMISSION.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** MR. CHAIR I'M OPPOSED TO IT RIGHT NOW THAT MAY  
14 CHANGE. I DON'T KNOW. BUT I THINK WHAT'S IMPORTANT IS REALLY  
15 GETS TO THE DATA, UNDERSTANDING WHAT THAT POLLING IS SAYING.  
16 BUT RIGHT NOW WHAT'S BEFORE US IT'S VERY BROAD. I MEAN THIS,  
17 IN TERMS OF SPECIFICS, IT'S JUST REALLY NOT THERE YET. IT'S  
18 NOT BAKED. I KNOW THERE IS A PROCESS. BUT ALL THESE MULTIPLE  
19 OPTIONS WITHIN ONE MOTION, IT'S A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT FOR ME.  
20 I HAVE NEVER SEEN THAT IN THAT WAY. BUT, YOU KNOW, AT THE END  
21 OF THE DAY, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO MOVE THIS FORWARD AND I  
22 RESPECT THAT.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND DAVID, YOU'RE IN A UNIQUE COMMISSION.  
25 YOU'RE CHAIRING THAT PLACE COMMITTEE. SO, I THINK YOU'RE GOING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TO HAVE A SAY ON WHAT COMES BEFORE THAT COMMITTEE. SO WE'RE  
2 GOING TO GO AHEAD AND ADVANCE THAT WITH THE ADDITION OF THE  
3 SFMTA OPERATORS PROPOSE A MOVE ON TO NEXT. ALL REVENUE  
4 MECHANISMS DISCUSSED IN THE SELECT COMMITTEE SALES TAX PAYROLL  
5 TAX PARCEL TAX SHOULD BE EXPLORED. WE POLLED HERE WHAT THE  
6 PUBLIC HAS APPETITE FOR.

7

8 **SUE NOACK:** SHOULD WE BE HAVING SOMETHING ABOUT WHETHER WE WILL  
9 BE HAVING SOMETHING WHETHER WE DO HYBRID AS WELL AS POLLED NOT  
10 ONLY SING LATERAL BUT HYBRID MODE.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH WE COULD DO THAT DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING  
13 TO ADD? STAFF ARE YOU KEEPING TRACK? OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS  
14 ON THIS? I MEAN IF POLLING AND THE PUBLIC IS GOING TO DRIVE  
15 THIS SO OKAY. ANY STRONG OPPOSITION TO THIS?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** MR. SPERING YES WE'LL OPPOSE TO THIS BECAUSE OF THE  
18 ADDITIONAL SALES TAX MEASURE PROPOSED HERE BEYOND SALES TAX SO  
19 WE'RE OKAY WITH THE SALES TAX BUT THE OTHERS WE'RE NOT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY ALL THIS SAYS TO POLL IT. SO. ALL  
22 RIGHT. ANY OTHER? LET'S MOVE TO THE NEXT BULLET THE SELECT  
23 COMMITTEE RECOGNIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF SAN FRANCISCO MUNI TO  
24 THE REGION AS THE LARGEST OPERATOR BY RIDERSHIP AND CRITICAL  
25 SYSTEM FOR REGIONAL TRIPS INTO SAN FRANCISCO ANY REGIONAL



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MEASURE THAT DOESN'T COME CLOSE TO ADDRESSING MUNI'S DEFICIT  
2 WILL MEAN MUNI NEEDS ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN THE REGION MTC AND  
3 OTHER STAKEHOLDERS SHOULD ASSIST IMMUNE IN THE EFFORT TO  
4 SECURE THESE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS AND THE REASON I THINK THIS IS  
5 IMPORTANT IS WE CAN'T NEGLECT THE IMPORTANCE THAT MUNI PLAYS  
6 IN THIS REGION SO REALLY FELT THIS NEEDS TO BE AT LEAST  
7 HIGHLIGHTED AND BROUGHT FORTH TO THE COMMISSION TO HELP FIND  
8 SOLUTIONS FOR MUNI NOT ONLY THROUGH THIS MEASURE BUT OTHER  
9 OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE HAVE TO EXPLORE TO HELP ADDRESS MUNI'S  
10 CHARGES SO THAT WAS THE PURPOSE OF THIS.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GO AHEAD GINA.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I APPRECIATE SFMTA THOUGHT PROCESS ON THIS AND I  
17 THINK THEY ARE LOOKING AT WHAT THEY CAN DO FOR THEIR OWN  
18 DEFICIT HERE. BUT I THINK TO BRING THIS UP AT THIS POINT IN  
19 TIME IS NOT REALLY APPROPRIATE. BECAUSE YOU HAVE GOT BART HAS  
20 A SHORTFALL, CALTRAIN -- THE OTHER OPERATOR -- I THINK THIS  
21 TYPE OF FOCUS AT THIS POINT TIME FOR ONE CITY, I'M NOT SURE  
22 THIS IS APPROPRIATE. NOT TO SAY WE CAN'T BRING IT UP IN THE  
23 FUTURE, BUT, AGAIN, I THINK JONATHON HAD A GREAT PLAN. IF  
24 THEY'RE WILLING TO DO THAT BIG PARCEL TAX MORE POWER TO THEM.  
25 BUT I THINK TO COMMIT TO THAT I THINK THIS IS PREMATURE. I MAY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 BE THE ONLY ONE THINKING THIS, WE'RE TALKING REGIONAL THIS IS  
2 JUST ONE ASPECT OF THAT, AND I DON'T THINK TO COMMIT TO THIS  
3 AND BRING THE FULL COMMISSION TO THAT POINT I THINK IT'S  
4 PREMATURE.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I FELT THIS WAS CONSISTENT. WE HAVE  
7 SAID THIS FROM THE BEGINNING, BART, MUNI, AC, AND CALTRAIN.  
8 YOU KNOW, IF WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS WE JUST TOTALLY IGNORE  
9 SAN FRANCISCO OR MUNI'S NEEDS, THEY MOVE, A LOT OF PEOPLE IN  
10 THAT SYSTEM, THEY MOVE A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT TRAVEL INTO THAT  
11 REGION. IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO THE RECOVERY OF SAN  
12 FRANCISCO, WHICH I THINK AFFECTS ALL OF US. SO WE JUST DIDN'T  
13 WANT THIS ISSUE TO BE LOST SO THAT WAS THE PURPOSE OF THIS AND  
14 IT REALLY FORWARDS THE DISCUSSION. AND AS I SAID, THIS PROBLEM  
15 CAN BE SOLVED THROUGH MULTIPLE SOURCES AND I THINK THE  
16 COMMISSION SHOULD EXPLORE THAT. AND, SO, WAS THE PURPOSE OF  
17 IT.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** A DIFFERENT WAY OF MAKING A VERY SIMILAR POINT?

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SURE.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** THIS DOES CALL OUT ONE OF THE AGENCIES THAT'S  
24 FACING A FISCAL CLIFF BUT I THINK A DIFFERENT ANGLE ON THAT IS  
25 THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS SERVED BY ALL OF THE AGENCIES FACING THE





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 FISCAL CLIFF. MUNI, SAN FRANCISCO, MINE THROUGH SAN FRANCISCO,  
2 CALTRAIN THROUGH SAN FRANCISCO, AC TRANSIT SAN FRANCISCO, AND  
3 GOLDEN GATE SAN FRANCISCO. IF THERE ISN'T A SOLUTION THAT  
4 WORKS FOR SAN FRANCISCO, THEN THE ENTIRE SET OF REGIONAL  
5 SOURCES IMPLODES. SO, I THINK IN THE INTEREST OF HAVING A  
6 FUNCTIONAL SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA, I THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE  
7 SOLUTIONS THAT ARE VIABLE FOR SAN FRANCISCO IN OUR OWN SELF-  
8 INTEREST WE DON'T LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT  
9 THE REGIONAL SYSTEMS TO UP-- [INDISCERNIBLE] BECAUSE THEY'RE  
10 SERVING ALL THE OF THE AGENCIES WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT WE  
11 NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT SAN FRANCISCO WORKS FOR SAN FRANCISCO  
12 NO? OKAY.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** CINDY? GO AHEAD CINDY.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I DO THINK WE HAVE MULTIPLE SYSTEMS  
17 THAT NEED HELP AND THE REASON WE'RE HAVING THIS CONVERSATION  
18 IS NOT JUST FOR ONE SYSTEM. BUT I DO REALLY APPRECIATE THAT  
19 THIS IS A REALLY CRITICAL SYSTEM. BUT I DO WORRY THAT WHAT  
20 WE'RE ACTUALLY COMMITTING OURSELVES IS HELPING MUNI AND  
21 PERHAPS NOT OTHER ORGANIZATIONS. I KNOW THAT'S NOT THE INTENT.  
22 BUT IF WE WERE MORE ROBUST AND INCLUSIVE IT WOULD BE LESS  
23 TROUBLESOME. THE OTHER THING I HAVE BEEN INTERESTED IN DOING  
24 SOMETHING CUSTOMIZE PERIOD IS I THINK THERE'S A WAY FOR ALL OF  
25 US TO SUPPORT THE ENTIRE REGION BUT NEEDS TO BE DONE IN



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CONTEXT OF PARTNERSHIPS THAT WE HAVE ALREADY AS AN EXAMPLE IF  
2 SAN FRANCISCO WASN'T ABLE TO PICK UP ITS PORTION OF CALTRAIN  
3 FOR TWO YEARS AND THAT REQUIRED CALTRAIN FOR US TO DO IT BUT  
4 THERE WOULD BE SOME REMUNERATING BACK BUT NOT IF WE'RE ONLY  
5 LOOKING AT HELPING ONE ENTITY AND I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S NOT  
6 THE INTENT BUT THAT HOW IT READS.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD POINT CINDY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I AGREE IF WE WERE GOING TO NAME SPECIFIC OPERATORS  
11 WE SHOULD NAME ONES THAT ARE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT I HAVE ARGUED  
12 FROM THE BEGINNING TWO TRANSIT SYSTEMS OF REGIONAL  
13 SIGNIFICANCE THAT REALLY TOUCH MULTIPLE JURISDICTIONS ARE BART  
14 AND CALTRAIN AND PROBABLY FIRST AND FOREMOST NEED TO BE LOOKED  
15 AT THEN FIGURE OUT ALL THE OTHER SYSTEMS BUT NAMES OF FOUR OR  
16 5, 4 IN PARTICULAR IF WE WERE GOING TO NAME ONE, I WOULD NAME  
17 ALL OF THEM. I THINK PULLING ONE OUT IN THE LARGEST BULLET  
18 HERE IN THIS LIST FEELS LIKE MISPLACED EMPHASIS AND FEELS  
19 CONFUSING TO ME AT THIS POINT THE CONVERSATION.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD POINT. I THINK MAYBE WE DIDN'T  
22 PRESENT IT IN THE WAY WE WERE THINKING. YOU KNOW, AS THESE  
23 DISCUSSIONS HAVE GONE ON, MUNI HAS JUST KIND OF BEEN DROPPED  
24 OUT OF A LOT OF THE CONVERSATIONS. SO, WE FELT IT WAS VERY  
25 IMPORTANT THAT WE AT LEAST HIGHLIGHT. BUT YOU KNOW, I COULD



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 CERTAINLY AGREE TO ADDING -- WELL I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY -- WE  
2 COULD SAY THE FOUR OPERATORS, PLUS SMALL OPERATORS COULD BE  
3 PART OF DISCUSSION. RYAN?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** CONTEXT I HAVE BEEN GATHERING FROM DISCUSSION IS  
6 THERE IS JUDICIAL SUPPORT ACROSS THE REGION FOR STRATEGIES  
7 THAT HELP RESOLVE, THAT HELP ASSIST IN LOCAL AND THE REGION  
8 HELPING TO SOLVE TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS ACROSS THE  
9 REGION WHERE IF IT'S NOT NECESSARILY JUST -- IT'S DUE TO THE  
10 CONTEXT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND THE MTC MEASURES HAVING A SMALL  
11 PERCENTAGE OF SHORTFALL BEING COVERED IT SEEMS TO BE MOST  
12 SALIENT BUT IT'S PROBABLY A TRUE STATEMENT I WOULD GATHER THAT  
13 THERE IS A DESIRE TO REALLY PUSH FOR OVERALL HELPING  
14 SUPPORTING EFFORTS BY LOCAL ENTITIES TO SEEK SELF-HELP AND  
15 IMPROVE AND SEEK ADDITIONAL FUNDS TO ADDRESS THAT. SO, I THINK  
16 BASED ON THE CONTEXT IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL TO BROADEN THE  
17 LANGUAGE TO SUPPORT OPERATORS WHOSE NEEDS ARE NOT COMING CLOSE  
18 TO BEING MET NOT JUST MUNI BUT ANY POTENTIAL OPERATORS IN  
19 EFFORTS TO SECURE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS TO MEET THOSE NEEDS  
20 PERHAPS ENUMERATING ADDITIONAL SPECIFIC OPERATORS JUST  
21 REMOVING REFERENCE TO SPECIFIC OPERATORS JUST INSTEAD  
22 MENTIONING ALL IN GENERAL JUST ANY OPERATORS THAT BECAUSE WE  
23 HEARD OF ENTITY THAT HAVE NEEDS FOR EXAMPLE INCREASED SERVICE  
24 INVESTING IN CLIMATE RESILIENCY IMPROVEMENTS FOR THEIR  
25 OPERATIONS, I THINK WE CAN AGREE THAT WE SHOULD BE SUPPORTING



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AND TRYING TO IDENTIFYING AND SECURING SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS TO  
2 MEET THOSE NEEDS.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WOULD BE RECEPTIVE TO DROPPING THIS  
5 BULLET. WE ARE ALWAYS TALKING ABOUT BRINGING THOSE FOUR.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** IF I COULD INTERJECT THERE IS AN ADDITIONAL IMPORTANT  
8 POINT BEING MADE HERE THAT IT'S POSSIBLE THAT THE REGIONAL  
9 MEASURE MAY NOT SOLVE ALL NEEDS. IT IS A QUESTION OF WHAT TO  
10 DO ON TOP OF THAT AND I DO THINK THAT IF THIS BULLET WAS MADE  
11 AGENCY AGNOSTIC IT COULD HELP ADDRESS THAT PHILOSOPHICAL  
12 QUESTION OF WILL WE CONTINUE HELPING EACH OTHER TRYING TO  
13 SECURE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING IN ADDITION TO THAT.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. NICK?

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** FOR A MOMENT THERE I THOUGHT WE MIGHT BE ABLE  
18 TO, SORT OF, SAVE MUNI AND WE GOT REAL CLOSE. I APPRECIATE US  
19 GETTING CLOSE. [LAUGHTER] MAYBE AT THE NEXT MEETING.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO, MAYBE THAT SECOND PARAGRAPH THERE WAS  
22 ADDITIONAL MEASURE DOESN'T COME CLOSE TO ADDRESSING OPERATOR'S  
23 DEFICIT WILL MEAN ADDITIONAL FUNDING AND REGIONAL MTC OTHER  
24 AND STAKEHOLDERS SHOULD ASSIST OPERATORS IN OUR EFFORTS TO  
25 SECURE THESE SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS. SO WE JUST BROADEN IT?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** I LIKE YOUR OPTION OF DROPPING THE ENTIRE BULLET  
3 POINT.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU CAN DEFINITELY MAKE THAT MOTION.

6

7 **SUE NOACK:** BECAUSE I THINK, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE GOING HAVE,  
8 YOU'RE GOING HAVE AC TRANSIT THAT, YOU KNOW, IS IN A COUPLE OF  
9 COUNTIES, AS WELL, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE -- THERE IS A LOT --  
10 YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE SMALL OPERATORS THAT COULD BE IMPACTED. I  
11 THINK POINTING OUT ONE HERE IS GOING TO BE DIFFICULT. I  
12 UNDERSTAND THE UNIQUE ASPECTS OF MUNI. BUT I THINK THAT CAN BE  
13 ADDRESSED WHEN WE LOOK AT THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, THAT SHOULD BE  
14 ADDRESSED IN THE EXPENDITURE PLAN AND PROBABLY NOT IN THE  
15 MOTION AT THIS POINT.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** CAN I QUICKLY SPEAK?

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I DON'T HAVE I DON'T HAVE WITH CHALLENGE IS  
22 FOR MINE MTC OFFERED ALTERNATIVES TO COVER LIKE 30% OF MUNI'S  
23 NEEDS. FOR OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES THEY COVER MOST OF THEIR  
24 NEEDS YOU KNOW NO ONE'S GETTING EVERYTHING THEY WANT BUT BART,  
25 CALTRAIN AC GET MOST OF THEIR NEEDS COVERED BY THAT MEASURE.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 SO IRRESPECTIVE OF, LIKE, SAN FRANCISCO BEING THE MOST SPECIAL  
2 OF ALL THE SPECIAL PLACES THAT WE REPRESENT, I THINK IF BART  
3 IS GETTING 30% OF ITS NEEDS AND MUNI WAS GETTING 80% OF ITS  
4 NEED THIS WOULD BE APPROPRIATE FOR US TO SAY OKAY WE'RE NOT  
5 DOING ENOUGH IN THIS MEASURE TO FULL BAR SO WE KIND OF NEED TO  
6 PAY SPECIAL ATTENTION TO BART. I'M FINE MAKING IT OPERATOR  
7 AGNOSTIC BUT I DO THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD A BUNCH  
8 OF MEASURES WHICH ARE, SORT OF, SO -- SO UNDERFUND MUNI'S NEED  
9 AND LEAVE WITH SUCH A DEFICIT THEN WE NEED TO THINK CREATIVELY  
10 ABOUT HOW WE CAN -- YOU KNOW, ABOUT THE SCALE OF THAT  
11 CHALLENGE.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NATE AND THEN -- [INDISCERNIBLE]

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES. WE HAVE BEEN ALL OVER THE PLACE WITH THIS.  
16 AND THE THING IS, I'M NOT OPPOSED TO MUNI, BUT AC TRANSIT  
17 WOULD JUMP ALL OVER ME IF I DIDN'T POINT THEM OUT. I THINK  
18 OTHERS HAVE TALKED ABOUT IT. SO, I THINK WE SHOULD JUST DROP -  
19 - OR YEAH LET'S LIST THE OTHER FOUR OR FIVE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** IF I COULD, MUNI IS, YOU KNOW, MUNI IS REALLY  
22 IMPORTANT, OBVIOUSLY, FOR ALL THE REASONS YOU HAVE SAID. AND I  
23 UNDERSTAND THE ENTIRE TO POINT OUT TO THE MTC BOARD AND WHY  
24 IT'S RELEVANT TO CONSIDER. SAID THAT IT'S A WHOLLY OWNED  
25 DEPARTMENT BY THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO. THE CITY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 COULD HAVE OFFERED SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION TODAY AND FUNDED  
2 MUNI TO SOLVE ITS PROBLEM WITHOUT TALKING TO ANYBODY AT THIS  
3 TABLE. WHEREAS BART CAN'T DO THAT CALTRAIN CAN'T DO THAT AND  
4 IT'S MORE CHALLENGING FOR AC TRANSIT TO DO THAT. I THINK IT'S  
5 OUT OF CONTEXT TO HAVE IT IN THERE. MAYBE A FOOTNOTE THAT  
6 MENTIONED THE FACT THAT MUNI CARRIES SUCH A LARGE PORTION OF  
7 PASSENGERS IN THE REGION, BECAUSE IT DOES, AND HAD A REALLY  
8 IMPORTANT ROLE TO PLAY. BUT I THINK IT'S -- YOU KNOW, AS  
9 YOU'RE HEARING FOLKS SAY IT DOESN'T QUITE MAKE SENSE TO HAVE  
10 IT THERE THE WAY WE HAVE IT.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I AGREE. HERE IS THE SUGGESTED LANGUAGE.  
13 THE SELECT COMMITTEE IS SUPPORTIVE OF SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDING FOR  
14 ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MEET THEIR FULL SUITE OF NEEDS. IT'S  
15 PRETTY BROAD WHERE IT COVERS EVEN THE SMALLER OPERATORS AND  
16 LARGER ONES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** TURN YOUR MICA.

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** YEAH THAT SOUNDS LIKE WE'RE COVERING EVERY TRANSIT  
23 AGENCY'S EVERY PROBLEM. THAT WORRIES ME A LITTLE BIT SEEMS  
24 EXTREMELY BROAD.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** COVERING OPERATOR NEEDS.

2

3 **SUE NOACK:** AGAIN. IS IT REALLY NECESSARY TO HAVE IN HERE? I  
4 THINK -- YOU KNOW THAT'S GOING TO BE A FURTHER DISCUSSION ON  
5 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN. AND I THINK THAT'S THE APPROPRIATE TIME  
6 TO DO IT. WE DON'T KNOW THE SIZE OF THE MEASURE. WE DON'T KNOW  
7 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WHY DON'T WE LEAVE THAT TO THE EXPENDITURE  
8 MAN AND LET THEM HASH THAT OUT.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HOW MANY PEOPLE WANT TO REMOVE THIS  
11 COMPLETELY? LET ME SEE YOUR HANDS. OKAY. OKAY. SEVEN. AND LET  
12 ME ASK THIS QUESTION. HOW MANY WANT TO MAKE REFERENCE TO OTHER  
13 AGENCIES MEETING -- ADDRESSING THEIR SHORTFALLS. THAT WOULD  
14 INCLUDE BOTH THE LARGE AND SMALLER OPERATORS. ANYBODY  
15 COUNTING? YOU WANTED TO SPEAK?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING THAT WOULD ADVANCE THE  
20 CONVERSATION.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU ALICIA. MORE PEOPLE  
23 OUGHT TO TAKE YOUR APPROACH. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. SO, WE'LL HAVE  
24 THAT JUST MODIFIED LANGUAGE WHERE -- AND I AGREE, TAKE THE  
25 WORD SUITE OUT OF THERE SO WE DON'T BROADEN IT TOO. SO, I





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WOULD AGREE WITH THAT. IS THERE ANYBODY THAT -- IS THERE A  
2 MAJORITY THAT SAYS LET'S ADVANCE THAT CONVERSATION TO THE  
3 COMMISSION? OKAY. NOW, THE LAST ONE HOPEFULLY ISN'T GOING TO  
4 BE CONTROVERSIAL. THE COMMISSION SHOULD REVIEW THE GRADIENTS  
5 OF AGREEMENT SCORES OF ALL SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS TO GET A  
6 FULL UNDERSTANDING OF THE SENTIMENT OF THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS.  
7 SO, WE HAVE ALWAYS STRESSED TO DO THAT, THAT WE WANT TO BRING  
8 ALL YOUR COMMENTS AND HOW WE GRADED THESE VARIOUS COMPONENTS.  
9 SO IS THERE ANYBODY IN DISAGREEMENT OF THAT? OKAY. ALL RIGHT.  
10 GLAD WE GOT THROUGH THAT.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** MR. --

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OH I'M SORRY.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** IT'S MORE OF A QUESTION AS TO WHEN IT'S APPROPRIATE,  
17 JUST MAKES SENSE, THIS BULLET RIGHT HERE, BUT MORE SO IS IN  
18 THE SPIRIT OF WHAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT EARLIER AS TO  
19 CONSIDERING OTHERS COMPONENTS ON OF AN EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT  
20 MIGHT BE IN THE MEASURE FOR TALKING ABOUT PRINCIPLES OR  
21 FRAMEWORK HERE, WHEN WOULD BE THE APPROPRIATE TIME TO TALK  
22 ABOUT AN ADDITIONAL BULLET OR CONSIDERATION OF A BULLET THAT  
23 TALKS ABOUT.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** RIGHT NOW IS THE TUNE THE TO --



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GO AHEAD AND ADD --

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO. I'M NOT HEARING ANY DISAGREEMENT ON  
5 THIS BULLET. IT REFLECTS HOW EVERYBODY VOTED.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THAT MAKES SENSE.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GO AHEAD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT EARLIER  
12 WHERE SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE HAD TALKED ABOUT SPOKEN  
13 TO CONSIDERING WHAT VOTERS MAY WANT, WHAT THEY HISTORICALLY  
14 WANTED, WHAT THEY HISTORICALLY VOTED FOR, WHAT'S IMPORTANT TO  
15 MOVE FORWARD, WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE A BULLET THAT TALKS ABOUT -  
16 - I WAS JUST NOODLING SOME STUFF RIGHT HERE, BUT YOU KNOW,  
17 THAT ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF THE SHORTFALLS OF THE ENTIRE  
18 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT INCLUDES BOTH TRANSIT  
19 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE YOU KNOW NOTHING MOVES WITHOUT  
20 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE, WE WANT TO SEE SOMETHING THAT'S  
21 MORE ON THE INFRASTRUCTURE AND THAT'S FAIR AND BALANCED THAT  
22 COUNTIES CAN TAKE BACK HOME.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. DISCUSSION ON THAT? PROPOSED? SUE?

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **SUE NOACK:** MY CONCERN, WE HAD TWO OPTION THERE IS, WE HAD THE  
2 FOUR-COUNTY, AND NINE-COUNTY. NINE-COUNTY BEING MONTHLY MODAL,  
3 TO DO FOUR-COUNTY MULTIMODAL, I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT WORKS OUT,  
4 NUMBER ONE, WE WILL BE HAVING DIFFICULTY COVERING EVERYTHING  
5 AS IT IS TO ADD MULTI-MODAL INTO A FULL COUNTY MEASURE COULD  
6 BE DIFFICULT SO THAT'S MY CONCERN WITH ADDING MULTI-MODAL IN A  
7 NINE COUNTY MEASURE, NO PROBLEM. ABSOLUTELY AGREE. FOUR COUNTY  
8 ONE, I HAVE TROUBLE WITH THAT.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** COMMENT?

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANT TO ECHO COMMISSIONER NOACK'S CONCERN.  
13 BUT I THINK, LIKE, A SLIM DOWN, 10-YEAR, FOUR CANCEL MEASURE,  
14 WE'RE JUST TRYING TO MAKE IT AS SMALL AS POSSIBLE, AND AS  
15 SIMPLE AS POSSIBLE. AND, SO, THAT WAS -- YOU KNOW, I THINK  
16 THAT -- YOU KNOW, THAT'S IMPORTANT TO BE ABLE TO KIND OF MOVE  
17 FORWARD WORRY THAT TYPE OF OPTION ON THE TABLE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MAY I RESPOND TO THE VICE CHAIR REALLY QUICK. WITH  
20 ALL DUE RESPECT MR. VICE CHAIR THAT IS ONE OF MULTIPLE OPTIONS  
21 THAT ARE BEING TO CONSIDERED TO THEY WE SHOULDN'T LOOK AT  
22 MULTI-MODAL POST FOR TEN YEAR SPECIFIC THAT WASN'T MY  
23 UNDERSTANDING WHEN WE LOOKED AT SOME OF THE OTHER BULLETS  
24 SAYING WE'RE GOING TO HAVE MULTIPLE SCENARIOS EVALUATED BY THE  
25 COMMISSION.



1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WHAT WAS YOUR BULLET COMPARED TO THE FACT  
3 THAT WE'RE EVALUATING THESE MULTIPLE SCENARIOS THAT DO INCLUDE  
4 COUNTY FLEX AND HAVE MULTI-MODAL ASPECTS.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** WOULD BE EQUAL AMOUNTS THOSE SCENARIOS DO NOT COVER  
7 OR ARE NOT EQUALLY PROPORTIONAL EXPENDITURES THEY ARE TRANSIT  
8 HEAVY FOR LACK OF A BETTER TERM.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** INTERVENE I WOULD LOVE TO GET TO POLICY PROVISIONS  
11 TODAY I WOULD LOVE TO TENNESSEE YEAR AND 30 YEAR BULLET BUT IT  
12 WAS EMBEDDED LOOKING AT DIFFERENT SCENARIOS 1, AND 1A HYBRID,  
13 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS CORRECT IT'S EMBEDDED IN THERE ALL OF  
14 THOSE HAVE 50 AND 61% AS COUNTY FLEX THEY'RE TRENDED HEAVY  
15 EARLY BUT THE WHOLE ACTUALLY CAN'T FLEX HEAVY. SO IT'S  
16 COVERED.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** FLEXIBLE HAS TO BE BUILT IN MORE SPECIFICALLY  
19 PARTICULARLY IN MY COUNTY. WE HAVE BEEN CLEAR. IF WE'RE  
20 SENDING THINGS FORWARD FOR DISCUSSION THAT, HAS TO BE AN  
21 ELEMENT OF THE DISCUSSION THAT GOES TO THE FULL BOARD HERE.  
22 WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE, YOU KNOW, THREE COUNTIES TELLING A  
23 FOURTH COUNTY, THIS IS IT ALL THE MONEY IS GOING IN ONE  
24 DIRECTION HERE. WE NEED THAT FLEXIBLE IN ORDER TO GET IT PAST  
25 THE VOTERS. I'M ASKING THAT, CONVERSATION STAYS OPEN AND IT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 GOES TO THE FULL COMMITTEE WITH THAT ASPECT OF IT CAN'T JUST  
2 BE TEN YEARS AND TRANSIT ONLY. THAT'S JUST NOT GOING TO WORK.  
3

4 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO AGREE WITH THE MOTION THAT MANNY MADE ON  
5 THIS. I'M NOT A MEMBER OF MTC. BUT I WAS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I  
6 WOULD URGE MTC TO REMEMBER THAT IT REPRESENTS ALL THE PEOPLE  
7 WHO DEPEND ON TRANSPORTATION IN THE COMMUNITY NOT JUST THE  
8 PEOPLE WHO RELY ON MASS TRANSIT WHICH IS A SMALL SHARE  
9 OBVIOUSLY THERE'S GREAT NEED FOR MASS TRANSIT AND THAT HAS TO  
10 BE ADDRESSED.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MANNY RESTATE YOUR MOTION. LET'S SEE WHAT  
13 SUPPORT WE HAVE.

14

15 **MANNY LEON:** THIS IS WHAT I WAS NOODLING. TO ADD A BULLET TO  
16 THESE PRINCIPLES TO SOMETHING TO THE DISAGREE THAT A MEASURE  
17 SHOULD ADDRESS THE NEEDS/SHORTFALLS OF THE ENTIRE BAY AREA  
18 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND THAT CAN BE NOODLED AS A RESULT  
19 MEASURE SHOULD INCLUDE A BALANCED EXPENDITURE PLAN WITH FAIR  
20 AND EQUITABLE FAIR AND EQUITABLE ALLOCATIONS TO INFRASTRUCTURE  
21 AND TRANSIT NEEDS. THAT'S WHAT I WAS NOODLING.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. WHO SUPPORTS THAT MEASURE? I WAS IN  
24 SUPPORT. WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT ANYWAY WHETHER IT'S HERE OR  
25 NOT. OKAY. SO.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** IN THE OPERATOR OPTION INCLUDED BY REFERENCE  
3 THERE IS CAN'T FLEX IN THE DIFFERENT CUSTOM OPTIONS. I THINK  
4 WE HAVE INCLUDED THAT MORE NARROW VERSION BY A REFERENCE TO  
5 THE SFMTA CRAFTED OPERATOR OPTION. BUT IF IT SAID MORE BROADLY  
6 THAT WE SHOULD HAVE, LIKE, IF WE -- TO SAY IT IN THE STRONGER  
7 VERSION, IT WOULD REALLY WANT TO HAVE A CLIMATE STATEMENT. AND  
8 I THINK THE CLIMATE STATEMENT WE HAVE COMING UP IN THE  
9 POLICIES. SO, ANYWAY, I THINK WE -- IT'S ALREADY INCLUDED IN  
10 THE NARROW VERSION BY INCLUDING OPERATOR OPTION THAT SAYS  
11 COUNTY FLEX WITH LIMITED TEN YEARS.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SAME MAJORITY SUPPORTED MOTION. IS THERE  
14 ANY ISSUE AND MANNY, YOU CAN SUBMIT YOUR POSITION PAPER. ARE  
15 YOU WILL BE ABLE TO BRING THAT ISSUE FORWARD. SO THAT'S NOT  
16 FORGOTTEN FROM HERE ON. ANY OTHER BULLETS ANYBODY ELSE WOULD  
17 LIKE TO ADD? OKAY. ALL RIGHT. ARE YOU READY TO GO TO THE  
18 POLICY?

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** [INDISCERNIBLE] INCREASING --

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE DID.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THOUGHT WE WERE DOING THE WHOLE THING  
25 TOGETHER.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I THOUGHT --

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. WELL, ALL RIGHT. I WOULD MOVE THAT  
7 THE SELECT COMMITTEE ADOPT THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS TO  
8 THE COMMISSION RELATED TO THE FRAMEWORK FOR TRANSPORTATION  
9 REVENUE MEASURE. DOES ANYBODY NEED TO ME TO GO THROUGH THE  
10 ONES WE AGREED ON? IS THERE A SECOND?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE  
15 SUFFICIENT CLARITY THAT WE KNOW WHAT TO PUT IN THE MINUTES IN  
16 TERMS -- IS STAFF SATISFIED THAT THEY CAN TRANSMIT THIS? OKAY.  
17 THANKS.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, DISSENT ON THE MOTION?

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ROLL CALL VOTE?

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE DO. I'M GLAD YOU'RE SITTING HERE. MAN  
24 ALIVE. TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. CHAIR SPERING?

2

3 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MORE ORANTES?

6

7 **JOHN ARANTES:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** NO.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CHAVEZ, I BELIEVE WE LOST. IS

14 ABSENT. MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

15

16 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER JOSEFOWITZ?

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEON?

23

24 **MANNY LEON:** NO.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEVIN?

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LINDSAY? MEMBER MAHAN?

6

7 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WU?

22

23 **ELLEN WU:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND MEMBER WUNDERMAN?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** NO.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I HAVE 11 TO 3. 11 YESES AND THREE  
5 NOS.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THAT IS CORRECT. WITH ONE ABSENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE POLICY  
10 QUESTION. AND HOPEFULLY THIS WILL GO SMOOTH.

11

12 **STUART COHEN:** ALL RIGHT. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE POLICY DECK.  
13 AND I WILL TRY TO DO SOME SPEED TALKING HERE SO THAT WE CAN  
14 HAVE DISCUSSION. AND I'LL NOTE THAT THIS IS AGENDA ITEM IS  
15 PROVIDED AS AN ACTION ITEM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND THEN AGAIN, I GAVE EVERYBODY A COPY.  
18 THIS IS FRAMEWORK THAT WE CAN DISCUSS FROM AND THE SECOND  
19 WHITE PAPER YOU HAVE.

20

21 **STUART COHEN:** SO AS YOU CAN SEE WE'RE PRESENTING INFORMATION  
22 THAT CAME FROM THE EXECUTIVE GROUP AND POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
23 AND PUBLIC AND WE'RE GOING TO BE FOCUSING TODAY ON THE  
24 LEGISLATION THAT COULD BE EMBEDDED WITH THE ENABLING  
25 LEGISLATION FOR THE REVENUE MEASURE. AND KEEP IN MIND WE WANT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TO HELP MEASURES PASS AT LEGISLATURE WITH VOTERS WITH SOME OF  
2 THE POLICY PROVISIONS AS WELL AS KIND OF IMPROVING THE  
3 OUTCOMES. NEXT SLIDE. WORD CLOUD, WE'LL KEEP MOVING. LOOK AT  
4 IT VERY QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS HOW WE WITH  
5 GROUPED TOPIC, WE HAVE HEARD BY THEME, TRANSIT PRIORITY SHOWS  
6 UP TWICE BECAUSE THEY RELATE TO MULTIPLE ASPECTS OF THE  
7 MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE. NOW, THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION IS  
8 EXPECTED TO INCLUDE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE MEASURE TO BE  
9 PLACED ON THE BALLOT VIA A CITIZEN INITIATIVE WHICH WOULD MAKE  
10 THE TAX SUBJECT TO A SIMPLE MAJORITY VOTE. THE RESULTS FROM  
11 THE BART POLL THAT WE JUST HEARD ABOUT AS WELL AS THE POLL  
12 CONDUCTED BY MTC A YEAR AGO SHOW WHY THIS MAY BE IMPERATIVE.  
13 THE NEED FOR AN INITIATIVE IS ONE OF THE REASONS WE FEEL THE  
14 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION SHOULD BE VERY SPECIFIC ABOUT THINGS  
15 LIKE THE REVENUE MECHANISM, GEOGRAPHY AND EXPENDITURE PLAN.  
16 OTHERWISE IT MAY END UP WITH DUELING BALLOT MEASURES OR  
17 POTENTIALLY A MEASURE THAT DOESN'T ADEQUATELY ADDRESS THE  
18 PROBLEM THIS WE SAID WE WANTED TO SOLVE. NEXT SLIDE. VOICES  
19 FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, RECOMMENDS THE LEGISLATION RESTRICT  
20 THE USE OF COUNTY FLEX FUNDS TO CLIMATE NEUTRAL PROJECTS  
21 EITHER BY DESIGN OR THROUGH STRICT MITIGATION OF WHICH ARE  
22 INCLUDED VMT. THIS WAS TOPIC OF DISCUSSION LAST YEAR DURING  
23 SB1031 AND 1 THAT WAS NEVER RESOLVED GIVEN THE STRONG  
24 DIFFERENCES OF OPINION WE KNOW FROM THAT DISCUSSION THAT  
25 ALLIANCE FOR JOBS FAVORED LEAVING ELIGIBILITY MORE FLEXIBLE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THEN NOT SUPPORT A VMT APPROACH WHETHER THE MITIGATION  
2 APPROACH SHOULD HAVE STRICTER THRESHOLD OF CLIMATE NEUTRALITY  
3 OR WHETHER IT'S SUFFICIENTLY CLIMATE FRIENDLY THAT PROJECTS  
4 HAVE TO BE CONTAINED INSIDE A PLAN THAT IS REQUIRED TO CHIEF  
5 THE STATE'S GREENHOUSE GAS YOU REDUCTIONS WHICH PLANNED BAY  
6 AREA DOES. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE WRITTEN HERE THE SPUR  
7 RECOMMENDATIONS MEASURE CONDITION FUNDING TO TRANSIT HGS  
8 AGENCIES ON THEIR ACHIEVING SPECIAL MILESTONES AS SET THROUGH  
9 THE REGIONAL NETWORK STRUCTURE BUT HAVE HEARD FROM SPUR THAT  
10 WE SHOULD ADD A BIT OF NUANCE HERE THEIR RECOMMENDATION WAS  
11 REALLY SPECIFICALLY THAT THE MEASURE CONDITIONS FUNDING ON  
12 TRANSIT AGENCY'S ONGOING COMPLIANCE WITH RNM PROGRAMS AND  
13 POLICIES WHICH IS A BIT DIFFERENT THAN ACHIEVING MILESTONES  
14 SOME MILESTONES MAY BE OUT OF AN AGENCY'S CONTROL. MTC'S 2023  
15 POLLING FOUND THAT 80% OF VOTERS CONSIDERED REQUIRING  
16 OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY TO ENSURE EFFICIENT AND EFFECTIVE  
17 MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC TRANSIT TO BE A REAL PRIORITY. SO SHOULD  
18 THE ENABLING LEGISLATION STRENGTHEN FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT SHOULD  
19 IT CONDITION FUNDS FROM THE MEASURE ON MILESTONES OR  
20 COMPLIANCE WITH RNM PROGRAMS AND POLICIES. AND ARE THERE OTHER  
21 SPECIFIC ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS  
22 WOULD LIKE TO SEE GIVEN ITS IMPORTANCE TO THE VOTERS,  
23 ESPECIALLY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THERE IS A RELATED PROPOSAL HERE.  
24 AND THAT'S ABOUT THE RNM STRUCTURE. YOU COULD SEE WHAT'S ON



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THE SLIDE HERE BUT I WOULD ACTUALLY LIKE TO ASK RYAN TO SPEAK.  
2 HE WANTED TO SPEAK ON THIS. GO AHEAD JUST READ THE SLIDE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** APOLOGIES, IT MIGHT BE SLIGHTLY LONG WINDED.

5

6 **STUART COHEN:** THAT'S WHY I HANDED IT OVER TO YOU QUICKLY.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** SPEAKING TO THE ORIGINS OF THIS PROPOSAL EARLIER THIS  
9 YEAR THE HEADS OF VTA, CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS, AC TRANSIT, GOLDEN  
10 GATE TRANSIT, MUNI COUNTY CONNECTION SFA FERRY TRANSIT  
11 PETALUMA TRANSIT WEST CAD SONOMA TRANSPORTATION AUTHOR SENATOR  
12 WIENER SENT A LETTER CALLING FOR IMPROVEMENTS TO REGIONAL NET  
13 WOK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES, AND CONDITIONING NEW REVENUE  
14 MEASURE FUNDS ON COMPLIANCE WITH REGIONAL TRANSIT POLICIES  
15 THEY REQUESTED RECOGNIZING MTC'S ROLE AS A CONVENER OF  
16 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE INCLUDING REQUESTING TO  
17 CODIFY RNM COUNCIL OF TRANSIT OPERATORS AND REQUESTING MORE  
18 THAN ADVISORY ROLE BY BEING GRANTED TRANSIT OPERATOR VOTING  
19 REPRESENTATION ON RNM POLICY MAKING WE HAVE ALSO HEARD CALLS  
20 FROM TRANSIT ADVOCATES IN THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY FOR STRONGER  
21 NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO DELIVER ON IMPROVEMENTS IN THE TRANSIT  
22 SPACE AND ADVOCATES HAVE CALLED FOR RNM STRUCTURE THAT THE  
23 INCLUDES QUALIFIED INDEPENDENT EXPERTS WITH SUBSTANTIAL  
24 PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE IN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHO ARE NOT  
25 TIED TO ANY SPECIFIC REGIONAL TRANSIT AGENCY OR BAY AREA



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TRANSIT AGENCY OFFERING A MORE INDEPENDENT AND AN INDEPENDENT  
2 PERSPECTIVE, WE HEARD FROM THE COMMISSION, STATE, AND MANY  
3 MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATURES BAY AREA CAUCUS FROM THE REGION TO  
4 MORE EFFECTIVELY ADVANCE PRIORITIES. AND IN ORDER TO ALIGN AND  
5 REPRESENT THESE PERSPECTIVES WE DEVELOPED A PROPOSAL THAT  
6 ESTABLISHES A NETWORK MANAGEMENT EXECUTIVE STEERING COMMITTEE  
7 COMPOSED OF TRANSIT OPERATORS, INDEPENDENT EXPERTS WITH PUBLIC  
8 TRANSPORTATION EXPERTISE AND A STATE APPOINTEE. AND IN THAT  
9 STRUCTURE THE TRANSIT OPERATORS WOULD BE THE ONE APPOINTING  
10 THE TRANSIT OPERATOR REPRESENTATIVES TO THAT BODY AND ARE  
11 RESPONSIBLE FOR DEVELOPING A LIST OF QUALIFIED EXPERTS FOR THE  
12 COMMISSION TO THEN CHOOSE FROM WHEN APPOINTING TRANSIT EXPERT  
13 POSITIONS ON THAT BODY. AND THIS STEERING COMMITTEE BODY WOULD  
14 BE RESPONSIBLE FOR ISSUING THOSE RNM POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS TO  
15 THE COMMISSION WHICH CAN DIRECT THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS TO BE  
16 VETTED BY ANY COMMITTEES OF ITS CHOOSING. PRIOR TO FINAL  
17 ACTION ON THOSE POLICIES, AGAIN AT THE COMMISSION LEVEL. AND  
18 BY REQUIRING THAT ANY SPECIFIC RNM POLICIES ORIGINATE AS  
19 RECOMMENDATION FROM THAT NEW BODY, A BODY WITH FORMAL VOTING  
20 OPERATOR REPRESENTATION PER REQUEST FROM THE OPERATORS IN  
21 ADDITION TO INDEPENDENT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION PROFESSIONAL  
22 EXPERTISE THE PROPOSAL IS DESIGNED TO INCREASE CONFIDENCE AND  
23 EFFICACY IN THE DEVELOPED POLICIES AND DEVELOPED THROUGH THE  
24 NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE WHILE STILL RETAINING POLICY  
25 DISCRETION OVER THOSE FINAL POLICY ACTIONS AT THE COMMISSIONS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 LEVEL. WE BELIEVE THIS PROPOSAL FULFILLS KEY OPERATOR REQUESTS  
2 FOR RECOGNIZING EXISTING RNM STRUCTURE PROVIDING VOTING  
3 REPRESENTATION FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND PROVIDING INDEPENDENT  
4 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION EXPERTISE WHICH HAS SHOWN TO BE A MODEL  
5 THAT WORKS FOR OTHER TRANSIT AGENCY OR OTHER REGIONS ALL WHILE  
6 RETAINING THE FINAL POLITICAL POLICY MAKING DISCRETION AT THE  
7 COMMISSION LEVEL. IT IS NOBODY'S SILVER BULLET. BUT IT DOES  
8 MIRROR SOME EXISTING TRANSPORTATION GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES IN  
9 THE BAY AREA AND ELSEWHERE AND SENATOR WIENER IS OPEN TO  
10 CONTINUING TO WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS ON FURTHER DEVELOPMENT OF  
11 THE PROPOSE A I WANTED TO CLARIFY THE ORIGINS OF THE PROPOSAL  
12 AND PROVIDE A BIT OF ADDITIONAL SUBSTANCE.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU RYAN AND IN CONTEXT THERE ARE  
15 THREE SEPARATE BODIES THAT WERE SET UP A LITTLE OVER A YEAR  
16 AND A HALF AGO THAT LOOK AT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
17 NOW. THERE IS THE RNM COMMITTEE, A SUBCOMMITTEE OF MTC, BUT  
18 HAS NON-VOTING SEATS FOR BART AND AC TRANSIT. THERE IS ALSO  
19 THE RNM COUNCIL MADE UP OF GENERAL MANAGERS AND MTC'S ED, AND  
20 CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP MADE UP OF RESIDENTS WHO WERE REGULAR  
21 TRANSIT RIDERS. THIS COULD BE ENVISIONED AS ORIGINATOR OF  
22 PROPOSALS IT COULD ALSO BE THAT OTHER LAYER. OTHER PROPOSAL IS  
23 CONDITION MEASURE FUNDING ON LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ADOPTION EVER  
24 TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICIES WHICH IS A GENERAL TERM FOR POLICIES  
25 HELP IMPROVE BUS SPEED ON LOCAL ROADS AS SIMPLE AS TRAFFIC



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 SIGNAL PRIORITY FOR BUSES OR AS CHALLENGING AS BUS ONLY LANES  
2 DEFINITELY HELP FOR IMPROVING BUS SPEED BUT DEPENDING ON  
3 PROVISION IT CAN GENERATE OPPOSITION TO THE LEGISLATION FROM  
4 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ANOTHER PROPOSAL REQUIRE LARGE EMPLOYERS TO  
5 SUBSIDIZE NON-AUTO COMMUTES STRENGTHEN THE BAY AREA BENEFITS  
6 PROGRAM BOOST RIDERSHIP GENERATE REVENUE EITHER OR THROUGH  
7 INCREASED FARES RESULT OF EMPLOYEE SUBSIDIES ANY EMPLOYEE  
8 MANDATE ALSO COMES WITH POTENTIAL OPPOSITION FROM EMPLOYERS.  
9 FINAL SLIDE. SEIU AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
10 RECOMMENDATION LEGISLATION RESTRICT OR LIMIT OUTSOURCES OR  
11 AUTOMATING JOB FUNCTIONS OR DUTIES CURRENTLY PERFORMED BY  
12 TRANSIT AGENCY EMPLOYEES. TOPIC SHOULD BE ADDRESSED IN THE  
13 LEGISLATION EVEN THOUGH HOW WORK IS PERFORMED IS LABOR  
14 RELATIONS TYPICALLY HANDLED THROUGH NEGOTIATIONS BETWEEN LABOR  
15 PARTNERS AND OPERATOR PRESIDENCY. SO, I THINK WE COULD HAVE --  
16 NEXT SLIDE. AND SO THIS QUESTION OF TRANSIT AGENCY  
17 CONSOLIDATION, WE DID RECEIVE COMMENTS FROM SPUR, SEIU, AND  
18 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION THAT RECOMMENDED  
19 CONSOLIDATION STAYS OUTSIDE OF A REVENUE MEASURE. WE HAVE HAD  
20 SENATOR WAHAB AND ALISIA RECOMMEND THAT IT COULD BE CONSIDERED  
21 PART OF IT BUT CERTAINLY NEEDS TO HAPPEN IN THEIR OFFICE'S  
22 OPINION. SO FOR DISCUSSION HERE, GIVEN IS THIS TOPIC LED TO  
23 SIGNIFICANT OPPOSITION DURING SB1031 SHOULD IT BE LEFT OUT OF  
24 ENABLING LEGISLATION WHICH WOULD NOT PREVENT IT FROM BEING  
25 ADDRESSED IN A SEPARATE BILL. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT FEEDBACK DO





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 YOU HAVE ON THESE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS? AND ARE THIS THINGS  
2 NOT MENTIONED HERE THAT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED? AND I BELIEVE  
3 CHAIR SPERING, I'LL UNDERSTAND THAT OVER TO YOU, BECAUSE THEN  
4 WE WOULD LIKE HAVE, ULTIMATELY A MOTION ON THIS ITEM

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THE HANDOUT AGAIN TO HELP STIMULATE THE  
7 DISCUSSION OF THESE THREE AREAS THAT SHOULD COME FORWARD AND  
8 OTHERS THAT CAN BE ADDED SO FIRST ONE ENABLING LEGISLATION  
9 SHOULD INCLUDE NEW ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS TO PROVIDE  
10 GREATER OVERSIGHT FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES FINANCIAL INFORMATION.  
11 IS THERE ANY OBJECTION TO THAT PROVISION? WE HAVE HEARD  
12 THROUGHOUT THE REGION AS WE HAVE TALKED TO INDIVIDUALS THAT  
13 ACCOUNTABILITY AND OVERSIGHT IS ABSOLUTELY NECESSARY TO BUILD  
14 THAT TRUST. SO, ANY OPPOSITION TO THAT BULLET.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** NO BUT SHOULD WE HAVE SOMETHING BESIDES FINANCIAL  
17 LIKE OPERATING FINANCIAL INFORMATION RATHER THAN STRICTLY  
18 FINANCIAL?

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WELL IT'S FINANCIAL BECAUSE WE'RE RAISING  
21 THE MEASURE FOR RAISING FUNDING BUT COULD BE EXPANDED.

22

23 **SUE NOACK:** IF WE'RE CONDITIONING ON SOME OF THE  
24 TRANSFORMATIONAL STUFF THAT'S NOT STRICTLY RESULTING IN  
25 FINANCIAL RESULTS IT COULD BE AN OPERATING RESULT AS WELL? I



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MEAN IT'S A QUICK THOUGHT WHEN I READ IT, NOT JUST SOLELY  
2 FINANCIAL.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SECOND ONE IS IT SHOULD ALSO PROVIDE, TO  
5 BE ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING FROM THE MEASURE OPERATORS SHOULD BE  
6 REQUIRED TO KEEP SPECIFIC BENCHMARKS RELATED TO TRANSIT  
7 TRANSFORMATION THAT WOULD DEVELOP THROUGH THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
8 MANAGER FRAMEWORK.

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** THAT GOES TO THE COMMENT OF ONGOING INFORMATION OR  
11 WHETHER IT'S JUST PINT IN TIME YOU KNOW ACHIEVE OR NOT ACHIEVE  
12 BENCHMARKS PROGRESS TOWARD BENCHMARKS THAT'S PROBABLY THE PART  
13 THAT I'M -- YOU KNOW --

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DOES STAFF HAVE ANY RECOMMENDATION AS TO  
16 WHAT WE COULD ADD TO THAT FIRST BULLET TO EXPAND THE FINANCIAL  
17 INFORMATION OR DO YOU HAVE COMMENTS.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** FROM WHAT I'M HEARING IS MAYBE YOU WOULD  
20 CHANGE THE SECOND BULLET TO BE MORE, SORT OF, CONTINUOUS  
21 PROGRESS AND PARTICIPATION TOWARDS TRANSFORMATION.

22

23 **SUE NOACK:** ACHIEVING THOSE BENCHMARKS MAYBE THAT WOULD BE THE  
24 PLACE TO ACHIEVE IT TO CHANGE THE WORDING INSTEAD OF THE FIRST  
25 ONE?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ON THE FIRST ONE ENABLING LEGISLATION  
3 WE'RE GOING WEAR YOU ALL DOWN SO YOU WANT TO GET THE HELL OUT  
4 OF HERE.

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** SO FAR IT DOESN'T SEEM TO BE WORKING.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I AM CONFUSED AND IT HAS BEEN A LONG MEETING. THESE  
9 BULLETS ARE ONE THING, STUART TOOK US THROUGH A WHOLE BUNCH OF  
10 RECOMMENDATIONS. ARE WE VOTING ON THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS RIGHT  
11 NOW? OR ARE WE JUST VOTING ON THESE BULLET POINTS?

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU'RE VOTING ON THESE BULLET POINTS. WE  
14 FELT THIS IS WHERE FORMER COMMENTS AND SO FORTH, WE FELT THESE  
15 WERE AREAS OF AGREEMENT THAT WE HAD, JIM. SO THAT'S WHY.

16

17 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** SO WE'RE NOT VOTING ON ANY OF THE THINGS THAT  
18 HE SAID.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO BUT NOT TO PREVENT SOMEONE FROM ADDING  
21 A BULLET.

22

23 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** NOT SAYING WE SHOULD OR SHOULDN'T I AGREE WITH  
24 SOME OF THE THINGS HE PUT FORWARD AND STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 OTHERS. YOU KNOW, I'M JUST ASKING THAT'S NOT -- THESE THINGS  
2 ARE NOT IN THOSE THINGS?

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO. THEY'RE NOT BUT THOSE THINGS WILL COME  
5 FORWARD WE'RE TRYING TO GET AREAS OF AGREEMENT FOR THIS  
6 FRAMEWORK.

7

8 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** WE'RE NOT ACTING ON THESE THINGS WE'RE ASKING.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THAT'S CORRECT.

11

12 **STUART COHEN:** WE HOPED FOR TIME TO WORK THROUGH DETAILS. WE'RE  
13 GOING TO HAVE TO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE THERE IS A VOTE ON  
14 ANY OF THIS. AND THEN I THINK IF ANY OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE  
15 MEMBERS HAVE KIND OF A -- YOU KNOW, OPINIONS THAT THEY WOULD  
16 LIKE TO EXPRESS ON THEM, THAT WE REALLY DON'T HAVE TIME FOR, I  
17 WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE A SEPARATE LETTER THAT CAN COME FORWARD  
18 AND THAT WE WILL TRANSMIT THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND THE  
19 FULL COMMISSION BECAUSE WE DIDN'T HAVE A FULL OPPORTUNITY  
20 TODAY.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I'LL GET BACK TO NUMBER ONE. ANY STRONG  
23 OPPOSITION TO THIS TODAY? OKAY. NUMBER TWO WITH THE ADD  
24 LANGUAGE, SUE, THAT YOU WANTED FOR THAT. ALIX YOU CAN  
25 SUMMARIZE WHAT WOULD BE ADDED?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** NOT SURE WHAT I SAID BUT I WROTE OPERATOR  
3 SHOULD BE REQUIRED TO MAKE PROGRESS TOWARD BENCHMARKS. MAYBE  
4 CUSTOMER-FACING OUTCOMES. I DON'T KNOW IF DO YOU WANT OUTCOMES  
5 IN THERE.

6

7 **SUE NOACK:** MAYBE REPORT OR SOMETHING REPORT ON ONGOING  
8 PROGRESS TOWARD MAKING, ACHIEVING BENCHMARKS.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HOW ABOUT CONTINUE -- CONTINUOUS PROGRESS  
11 TOWARDS SPECIFIED BENCHMARKS.

12

13 **SUE NOACK:** YEAH, REPORTING ON -- YOU KNOW, I DON'T KNOW IF  
14 THAT'S -- OBVIOUSLY IS TOUGH, BUT JUST REGULAR REPORTING ON  
15 PROGRESS MADE TOWARD ACHIEVING THOSE BENCHMARKS.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO ALIX, WHAT DO YOU HAVE?

18 [LAUGHTER]

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY. IT SHOULD ALSO -- OKAY. OPERATORS SHOULD  
21 BE REQUIRED TO REPORT AND MAKE PROGRESS TOWARDS ACHIEVING  
22 SPECIFIED BENCHMARKS RELATED TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I CAN OFFER? THIS WAS ONE WHERE WE FELT LIKE OUR  
25 LANGUAGE WAS INTERPRETED A LITTLE BIT TOO STRICTLY FIRST TIME



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AROUND. IF I COULD OFFER, OPERATOR SHOULD BE REQUIRED TO  
2 COMPLY WITH POLICIES AND PROGRAMS RELATED TO TRANSIT  
3 INFORMATION. AND YOU COULD ADD TO THAT, OPERATOR SHOULD BE  
4 REQUIRED TO REPORT ON PROGRESS TOWARD AND COMPLY WITH POLICIES  
5 AND PROGRAMS RELATED TO TRANSIT. I CAN WRITE IT DOWN FOR YOU  
6 IF THAT'S HELPFUL.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH, SUE DOES THAT -- YEAH, I THINK  
9 THAT'S A GOOD RECOMMENDATION. OKAY. ANY STRONG OPPOSITION TO  
10 THAT? OKAY. SO, YOU -- OKAY. THEN THE LAST ONE, THE COMMISSION  
11 SHOULD ALSO CONSIDER THAT TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION WORTHY OF  
12 FURTHER STUDY THAT SHOULD BE PURSUED SEPARATE FROM THE  
13 ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR ITS TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE.  
14 AND A LIB -- ALICIA DID YOU WANT TO WEIGH IN?

15

16 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** CAN SOMEONE DIRECT ME TO A POLL WHERE THE  
17 PUBLIC HAS SAID THEY ARE NOT SUPPORTIVE OF CONSOLIDATION.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** BECAUSE YOU STILL THE PUBLIC TO SUPPORT WHATEVER  
20 REVENUE MEASURE YOU HAVE PUTTING FORWARD AND IF YOU HAVEN'T  
21 POLLED THE PUBLIC ON WHETHER OR NOT THEY FEEL CONSOLIDATION IS  
22 AN APPROPRIATE THING TO GAIN THEIR TRUST AND FINANCE IN  
23 FINANCING TRANSIT IN THE REGION, YOU SHOULDN'T BE TAKING IT  
24 OFF THE TABLE. IT HAS TO BE PART OF THE DISCUSSION, PART OF  
25 THE DISCUSSION AND IT HAS TO BE POLLED TO THE PUBLIC TO SEE IF



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 IT EARNS THE OPPOSITION AND SWITCHES ENOUGH OF THEM TO SUPPORT  
2 WHAT YOU WANT TO SEE HAPPEN FINANCIALLY ACROSS THE REGION.  
3 THANK YOU.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** MR. CHAIR, WE WENT THROUGH 1031. CONSOLIDATION  
6 WAS FROWNED UPON OBVIOUSLY MY DISTRICT, CALTRAIN REALLY THERE  
7 WAS TALKS ABOUT HAVING A MERGER THERE WAS INFORMATION I'M  
8 REALLY CONCERNED THAT CONSOLIDATION IS NOT THE RAW -- IS THE  
9 WRONG WORD FOR MANY REASONS. OBVIOUSLY CALTRAIN IS WORKING  
10 THROUGH ITS ISSUES. BUT I REMEMBER AT THE THERE WAS A BIG  
11 ISSUE AND THERE WAS CONFUSION THAT THERE WAS GOING TO BE, YOU  
12 KNOW, POTENTIAL MERGER OF BART, CALTRAIN, I WOULD ASK THAT WE  
13 STRIKE ITEM THREE. WE HAVE BEEN DOWN THIS ROAD BEFORE. WE HAVE  
14 BEEN DOWN THIS ROAD BEFORE. AND I THINK IN TERMS OF  
15 CONSOLIDATION, AT THIS TIME, I'M JUST NOT SUPPORTIVE OF IT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SAY IN REGARDS TO CONSOLIDATION IT WAS THE  
18 MAIN REASON YET BILL WAS KILLED DIDN'T GET OUT TO THE  
19 GOVERNOR'S DESK FOR THAT MATTER. IN REGARDS FROM MY  
20 ORGANIZATION AND PROBABLY A LOT OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AROUND  
21 ANY MONEY THAT IS SPENT ON STUDYING IT WOULD BE BETTER SPENT  
22 GIVEN TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GINA.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **GINA PAPAN:** LEGISLATIVE THERE WAS DISCUSSION, COORDINATION,  
2 WAS A BETTER WORD, [LAUGHTER] AND REALLY PLAYED MORE OF THE  
3 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION POLICIES WE HAVE. AND I AGREE WU HERE.  
4 TO GO OFF -- WE HAVE ALWAYS TALKED ABOUT AND AGENCIES ARE  
5 TALKING ABOUT THAT AND WE APPLAUD THAT. BUT TO JUST DO IT AND  
6 ASSUME IT'S REGION-WIDE, I THINK IT'S DEFERRING RESOURCES THAT  
7 WE CAN USE NOW IN SUCH A WAY TO PURSUE EVERYTHING WE'RE TRYING  
8 TO GET HERE. SO, I AGREE THAT SHOULDN'T BE THERE.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. NATE, DID YOU WANT TO COMMENT?

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES. I DO THINK THAT'S THE ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM.  
13 AND I THINK CONSOLIDATION HAS BEEN BOUNCED AROUND FOR DECADES.  
14 AND I'M NOT SAYING IF WE PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT IT WON'T  
15 PASS IF WE HAVEN'T THOUGHT ABOUT CONSOLIDATION BUT I THINK IT  
16 WOULD BE WORTHY OF A POLL OR TAKING TEMPERATURE REGION-WIDE.  
17 BECAUSE IT HAS BEEN, AS FOR AS I KNOW, IT'S BEEN BOUNCED  
18 AROUND FOR DECADES. AND I DO THINK THE TRANSIT ORIENTED PUBLIC  
19 IS LOOKING FOR US TO PUT IN PLACE SOME SYSTEMIC CHANGES THAT  
20 ARE GOING TO BE FAR REACHING AND SERVE THE INTEREST OF THE  
21 CONSUMERS AS WELL AS THE TAXPAYERS.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANOTHER COMMENTS? DAVID AND THEN SUE. OF.

24





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS.  
2 I THINK IF YOU WE ALL AGREE THAT IF YOU WERE TO DESIGN A  
3 TRANSIT FOR THE BAY AREA WOULD NOT COME UP WITH 27 SEPARATE  
4 TRANSIT AGENCIES. YOU CAN HAVE CONSOLIDATION THROUGH FINANCIAL  
5 INCENTIVES. IT'S WORKED AT OUR COUNTY FOR FIRE DISTRICTS FOR  
6 INSTANCE WE WENT FROM 48 TO 15. IT COST SOME MONEY BUT THERE  
7 IS WAYS TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN. I THINK THE SAME THING COULD  
8 HAPPEN IF YOU DON'T DO IT NOW IN THIS CIRCUMSTANCE, I THINK  
9 YOU PASS UP THAT OPPORTUNITY. I'M NOT SAYING IT NEEDS TO BE --  
10 LIKE NATE, I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE MIX, PART OF THE  
11 POLLING. I THINK THE PUBLIC, IF GIVEN THE FACTS, WOULD  
12 PROBABLY SUPPORT IT. BUT I ALSO UNDERSTAND IT COMES AT COST  
13 AND WE WOULD HAVE TO BE ABLE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE SET THOSE  
14 FUNDS ASIDE AS WELL.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SUE?

17

18 **SUE NOACK:** WHEN I HEAR CONSOLIDATION, IN THE CORPORATE WORLD  
19 YOU CONSOLIDATE BECAUSE YOU REDUCE EXPENSES THINGS LIKE THAT  
20 MY CONCERN WITH CONSOLIDATION HERE IS WHAT'S THE PURPOSE OF  
21 CONSOLIDATION. I THINK IN SOME PEOPLE'S MINDS CONSOLIDATION  
22 MEANS I'M GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET ON ONE PIECE OF TRANSIT GET  
23 FROM POINT A TO D NOW WITHOUT MOVING. THAT'S NEVER GOING TO BE  
24 THE CASE. YOU HAVE TO TAKE A BUS, TRAIN, THEN BUS. I GUESS THE  
25 QUESTION IN CONSOLIDATION IS WHERE DOES THAT GET YOU? MOST



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 PEOPLE PROBABLY KNOW OF FOUR TRANSIT AGENCIES PROBABLY KNOW  
2 THE BUS THEY TAKE, BART, THE OTHER BUS THEY TAKE MUNI THEY  
3 DON'T KNOW THE 27 AGENCIES HONESTLY BECAUSE THE BAY AREA IS SO  
4 LARGE MOST PEOPLE IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY WOULDN'T KNOW VTA  
5 FROM A HOLE IN THE WALL. THEY JUST WOULDN'T. SO, YOU HAVE GOT  
6 TO HAVE A PURPOSE CONSOLIDATION. WHAT IS IT GETTING YOU? IS IT  
7 BECAUSE YOU ARE ADDRESSING SOME IMPROVEMENT TO THE RIDER?  
8 ADDRESSING COST SAVINGS? YOU CAN'T JUST SAY CONSOLIDATION AND  
9 SIMPLY SAY YES OR NO THERE HAS GOT TO BE EXPLANATION  
10 UNDERSTANDING WHAT CONSOLIDATION MEANS. IN CONTRA COSTA  
11 COUNTY, CHURCHILL LEFT, THREE SMALLER TRANSIT AGENCIES IN  
12 CONTRA COSTA SPEND A LOT OF TIME WE DO THE PARATRANSIT ONE-  
13 SEAT RIDE. THERE IS A LOT OF CONSOLIDATION ON THINGS LIKE  
14 SCHEDULES AND MEETINGS AND THINGS LIKE THAT. SO I DON'T THINK  
15 CONSOLIDATION NECESSARILY GETS TO ANYTHING. COULD YOU MERGE  
16 THE FINANCE DEPARTMENTS? MAYBE. BUT DO YOU HAVE UNION ISSUES  
17 AND OTHER THINGS THAT ARE GOING TO BE MORE COSTLY? IT'S NOT A  
18 SIMPLE CONCEPT OF JUST CONSOLIDATION AND THEREFORE IT'S NOT --  
19 IT'S NOT SOMETHING SO EASILY TACKLED THAT YOU JUST SAY YOU CAN  
20 CONSOLIDATE WITHOUT PURPOSE OR REASON OR EXPLANATION AND WHAT  
21 ARE THE BENEFITS OR DETRIMENTS ARE TO THE COMMUNITY. THAT'S MY  
22 COMMENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** JIM WUNDERMAN?

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I WANT TO THANK SENATOR WAHAB FOR HAVING THE  
2 COURAGE TO BRING UP THIS AND I APPRECIATE SUPERVISOR RABBITT'S  
3 POINTS ON IT. I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD BE OFF THE TABLE. IT MAY  
4 NEED TO BE OFFER THE TABLE FOR THIS DISCUSSION BECAUSE OF THE  
5 TIMELINESS OF TRYING GOAT A BALLOT ON THE MEASURE BUT THERE  
6 SHOULD BE SOME CONSIDERATION TO WHAT SUE NOACK IS SAYING IS TO  
7 ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS. WHAT IS THE VALUE. I WOULD URGE THE  
8 REGION, TO TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT THE GAINS FROM CONSOLIDATION OR  
9 NOT. THERE ARE COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH IT. AND ON THE OTHER  
10 HAND, I DON'T KNOW TOO MANY PEOPLE KNOW WHO IT'S A GREAT THING  
11 THAT THINK WE HAVE THIS MANY AGENCIES AND WE HAVE DENIS BACK  
12 THERE TO CONSOLIDATE THE TWO FERRY AGENCIES WE HAVE ONE MORE  
13 FERRY AGENCY THAN WE NEED AND SHOULD CONSOLIDATE THEM THAT  
14 MAKES SENSE TO THE PUBLIC. AND MAYBE IN THIS CASE HELP US PASS  
15 A MEASURE THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY DOING SOMETHING.

16

17 **DAVID RABBITT:** ADMIRAL MULLIGAN IS RIGHT BEHIND YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** STEPHANIE?

20

21 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** IT'S NOT POLITICAL CONSOLIDATION  
22 IT'S FUNCTIONAL CONSOLIDATION WHERE YOU SHARE BEST PRACTICES  
23 AND OPERATING OPERATORS AND CONTRACTING SO YOU DON'T GO FOR  
24 THE POLITICAL CHANGE OF ORGANIZATION BUT YOU DO GO FOR  
25 OPERATION EFFICIENCIES AND SIMILARITIES. THIS IS WHAT I WOULD



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 LIKE TO TALK AT ANOTHER TIME. NOT ALWAYS MONEY SAFER BUT  
2 FUNCTIONAL VALIDATION CAN BE A MONEY SAVER APPROACH THIS IS A  
3 LITTLE SIMPLE EARLY.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** EVERYTHING HERE IS IMPORTANT, YOU CANNOT JUST ASK  
6 THE PUBLIC HOW DO YOU FEEL ABOUT CONSOLIDATION THAT MEANS  
7 COORDINATION THAT MEANS A WHOLE BUNCH OF DIFFERENT ASPECTS  
8 HERE IT'S NOT APPROPRIATE TO JUST THROW THAT QUESTION OUT  
9 THERE IN POLLING BECAUSE I CAN TELL YOU POLLING CAN MESS  
10 THINGS UP, WHEN YOU WHEN I ASKED MY CONSTITUENTS HOW THEY FELT  
11 ABOUT BART TO SAN JOSE THEY DEPARTMENTS REALIZE YOU MEANT IT  
12 WAS IN THE EAST BAY SO DO NOT THINK THE CONVERSATION WE'RE  
13 HAVING HERE AS TO WHAT IT ACTUALLY MEANS IT'S IMPORTANT, IT'S  
14 NOT FAIR TO THE PUBLIC AND IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF WHAT WILL  
15 BENEFIT THEM. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I JUST WANT TO -- JOHN, YOU WANT TO  
18 COMMENT?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** JUST REAL QUICK. WE'RE ALL WORKING REALLY HARD TO  
21 WORK TOGETHER, FIND A GOOD SOLUTION. WE DON'T NEED ANYMORE  
22 POISON PILLS TO BE THROWN INTO THIS AND I THINK THIS WOULD BE  
23 A TOTAL POISON PILL TO TRY TO GET ALL THE UNIONS AND AGENCIES  
24 TO GATEWAY TO CONSOLIDATE. RIGHT? AND I TOTALLY AGREE. JUST  
25 ASKING THE QUESTIONS PEOPLE ARE GOING MISUNDERSTAND WHAT THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 QUESTIONS MEANS AND NOW YOU JUST LOST MORE VOTERS. ALL RIGHT.  
2 SO, I THINK IT SHOULD BE KEPT OUT, CREATE SOMETHING SEPARATE,  
3 AND WHOEVER IS PUSHING FOR IT IF THEY REALLY BELIEVE ON IT, IT  
4 SHOULD BE ABLE IT MOVE ON ITS OWN. IT DOES NOT NEED TO BE PART  
5 OF THIS MEASURE:

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. OTHER? GO AHEAD.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO, MAYBE WE CAN DO ONE CONSOLIDATION RIGHT  
10 HERE RIGHT NOW. DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT ON MOVING FORWARD WITH  
11 FERRY CONSOLIDATION?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** IF YOUR CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER WANTS TO GO HOME IF  
14 HE WANTS THE OFFICE TODAY -- [INDISCERNIBLE] [OFF-MIC  
15 INDISCERNIBLE] SO, WHAT WE OFFER --

16

17 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** YEAH JUST GRAB ONE OF THESE, RIGHT. WHAT WE  
18 OFFER IS WE MANAGE A CORRIDOR WITH OUR FERRIES AND BUSES IF IN  
19 THEORY IT DOESN'T WORK I OFFER A BUS BRIDGE SO MY FERRY'S NOT  
20 TURNING DONUTS IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BAY PEOPLE CAN GET HOME  
21 BECAUSE WE OPERATE EVERYTHING IN THE CORRIDOR THERE'S BENEFITS  
22 TO THAT AND WE MANAGE THE CORRIDOR TO REDUCE CONGESTION BY THE  
23 AMOUNT OF BUS AND FERRY SERVICE WE OPERATE AND WE SHIFT  
24 PASSENGERS BETWEEN THESE EFFICIENTLY SO YOU CAN LOOK AT  
25 CONSOLIDATION IN LOTS OF WAYS YOU CAN PUT OUT A PROPOSAL THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 YOU UNDERSTAND HOW IT AFFECTS CUSTOMER AND EFFICIENCIES. ON  
2 THE BAY BRIDGE CORRIDOR IF YOU'RE UNHAPPY WITH YOUR COMMUTE DO  
3 YOU CALL CALTRANS, ANDY, BOB POWERS, JIM WUNDERMAN? YOU CALL  
4 MIKE HURSH? BECAUSE IT'S ALL SCATTERED ON THE GOLDEN GATE  
5 CORRIDOR, YOU JUST CALL ONE PERSON.

6

7 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HOW COME I CAN'T GET FROM OAKLAND TO MARIN  
8 COUNTY. WE GOT NO TERMINALS NO BOATS. SHOW A LITTLE HUTZPA.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WANT TO BRING BACK TO THE MOTION, IT  
11 SAYS THE COMMISSION SHOULD ALSO CONSIDER TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION  
12 IS WORTHY OF FURTHER STUDY THE VERY ISSUES SO EVERYBODY'S  
13 RAISED IT NEEDS TO HAVE FURTHER STUDY. 27 TRANSIT OPERATORS  
14 IT'S BEEN 30 PLUS YEARS, WE KNOW HOW CONTROVERSIAL IT IS I  
15 AGREE IT SHOULDN'T BE INCLUDED IN THIS MEASURE AND THAT'S WHAT  
16 THIS SAYS AND THERE ARE PLACES IN THE REGION THAT THIS  
17 CONSOLIDATION SHOULD BE LOOKED AT. FIVE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN  
18 SOLANO COUNTY. WHY FIVE? THIS CAN BE REDUCED, AND FOR US TO  
19 SAY THAT'S NOT WORTHY OF CONSIDERING IN THE FUTURE I THINK  
20 WE'RE DOING A DISSERVICE. AND, SO, AS I SAID WHAT THIS SAYS IS  
21 THE COMMISSION SHOULD ALSO CONSIDER THAT TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION  
22 FOR FURTHER STUDY. THAT'S WHAT IT'S SAYING. AND SHOULD THAN  
23 PURSUED SEPARATE FROM ENABLING LEGISLATION. I THINK WE CAN ALL  
24 ON THAT, AND FURTHER STUDY IS GOING TO BE OUT THERE WHETHER WE  
25 AGREE OR NOT. I THINK TO THAT RESPECT SENATOR WAHAB WHO IS



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 TRYING TO ADDRESS THE ISSUE AND THERE'S APPROPRIATE PLACES  
2 THAT IT SHOULD TAKE PLACE OR SHOULD BE CONSIDERED. I WOULD  
3 HOPE WE CAN SUPPORT. DOES ANYBODY STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH THAT?

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** TO SPEAK IN FAVOR OF KEEPING THINGS SEPARATE LIKE  
6 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE DETAILS IS REALLY IMPORTANT ABOUT, LIKE,  
7 IS IT SOMETHING CUSTOMER-FACING. IS IT SOMETHING BACK OFFICE.  
8 ARE THERE PARTICULAR PLACES LIKE THE FERRIES THAT MAKE SENSE  
9 TO DO SOMETHING SPECIFIC OR PARTICULAR COUNTIES THAT HAVE LOTS  
10 OF BUS OPERATORS THERE'S MERIT TO MOVING THAT FORWARD BUT  
11 HAVING WATCHED 1031 DISCUSSION CLOSELY WHERE THERE WERE  
12 STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING UNIONS THAT WILL HAVE TERRIBLE PROBLEMS  
13 IF WE DON'T HAVE A FUNDING MEASURE AND DISCUSSION ABOUT  
14 CONSOLIDATION TO 95% OF THE ENERGY AND AGENCIES HAVING FISCAL  
15 CLIFFS THAT EXISTENTIALLY DEPEND ON FUNDING BUT WE'RE SPENDING  
16 95% OF THE TIME DISCUSSING THE TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION, IT SUCKS  
17 ALL THE OXYGEN BY TRYING TO MELD THEM. SO HAVING THEM SEPARATE  
18 IT SEEMS IMPORTANT FOR THE FUNDING WHICH IS ONE OF THE THINGS  
19 THAT WE LEARNED FROM THE 1031 EXPERIENCE AND CONSOLIDATION.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** IN CONSOLIDATION 1031, THAT'S REASONS WE  
22 HAVE GOT SO MUCH OPPOSITION. SO, I DON'T THINK WE CAN ROLL THE  
23 DICE AND HOPE THAT WE WOULD BE REALLY THE FOCUS OF ALL THE  
24 DISCUSSION. OPPOSITION SAYING THE COMMISSION CONSIDER TRANSIT  
25 CONSOLIDATION WORTHY OF FUTURE STUDY WHICH WOULD BE PURSUE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 SIDE SEPARATELY ENABLING LEGISLATION ON TRANSPORTATION REVENUE  
2 MEASURE. IS THERE SUPPORT FOR THAT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I APPRECIATE ALL THE INPUT TODAY I WISH WE HAD  
5 ANOTHER MEETING TO HAVE SLIGHTLY MORE ROBUST DISCUSSION ON  
6 THIS TOPIC AND I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT IN 1031, THERE WAS A  
7 STUDY THAT WOULD HAVE GOTTEN INTO THE DETAILS THAT YOU'RE ALL  
8 BRINGING UP NOW. SO, JUST END IT THERE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING COULD  
11 TAKE PLACE. SO, ALL RIGHT. SO, UNLESS THERE IS REAL STRONG  
12 OPPOSITION TO THE LANGUAGE THAT'S HERE, THIS IS WHAT WE WOULD  
13 MOVE FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I MOVE FORWARD THE RECOMMENDATION.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ELLEN, GO AHEAD.

18

19 **ELLEN WU:** I WOULD LIKE TO ADD A COUPLE OF THINGS FOR  
20 CONSIDERATION.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY IS IT ON THIS ISSUE?

23

24 **ELLEN WU:** NO.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NEW ISSUE?

2

3 **ELLEN WU:** NEW ISSUE.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I JUST WANTED TO GET THAT ISSUE BEHIND US.

6 GO AHEAD, ELLEN.

7

8 **ELLEN WU:** JUST FOR THE WHOLE MAXIMUM FLEXIBILITY, A PATH  
9 FORWARD TO ADD THE ABILITY TO HAVE A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE  
10 INCLUDED IN THE ENABLING LEGISLATION, I THINK IS REALLY  
11 IMPORTANT. ALL OPTIONS ON THE TABLE. AND THEN I THINK IT'S  
12 REALLY CRITICAL THAT THERE IS SOMETHING ABOUT ADDRESSING  
13 EMISSIONS OR CLIMATE THAT'S INCLUDED IN THE LEGISLATION TO  
14 SIGNAL TO THAT IS OUR ULTIMATE GOAL AND WE HAVE BOTH STATE AND  
15 REGIONAL GOALS AROUND THAT THAT WE NEED TO MEET, PARTICULARLY  
16 WITH THESE NEW DOLLARS.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THOSE TWO SEPARATE ISSUES. THE  
19 CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE. OKAY. LET'S TAKE THEM ONE AT A TIME AND  
20 I'M GLAD YOU RAISED THAT. BECAUSE I WROTE HERE CITIZEN'S  
21 INITIATIVE, SHOULD WE INCLUDE IT. SEE THAT?

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THAT'S WHAT IT SAYS.

24



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ELLEN THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THAT UP AND  
2 SAVED ME. IS THERE ANYONE WHO WOULD OPPOSE THAT INITIATIVE  
3 SHOULD BE PART OF THE PROCESS? MANNY?

4

5 **MANNY LEON:** QUICK CLASSIFICATION, DEFER TO STAFF WHEN WE SAY  
6 CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE, AND LEGISLATION, I FEEL LIKE I HAVE  
7 TALKED TO STAFF ABOUT THIS BEFORE, IS THERE TECHNICAL NUANCES  
8 THAT NEED TO HAPPEN IN LEGISLATION. FOR THE RECORD, THE  
9 ALLIANCE JOB IS THE ONLY AGENCY THAT'S AROUND US THAT SENDS  
10 TRANSPORTATION NICHE TESTIFY SACRAMENTO THERE IS NO  
11 INVOLVEMENT FROM PUBLIC AGENCY THAT'S DEVELOPED LEGISLATION  
12 FOR CITIZEN WHAT ARE WE TALKING ABOUT.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** TO ALLOW IT.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** THERE DOESN'T NEED TO BE ENTITY THAT CAN COLLECT  
17 TAX AND CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE CAN'T DO THAT? THE CITIZEN'S  
18 INITIATIVE WOULD DO EVERYTHING ELSE? DOES STAFF HAVE  
19 INFORMATION ABOUT THAT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** WELL, I CAN SPEAK TO A LITTLE BIT OF CONTEXT BUT FEEL  
22 FREE TO ADD, SPECIAL DISTRICTS CAN UNDER CALIFORNIA LAW  
23 CERTAIN SPECIAL DISTRICTS ARE CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE NATURALLY  
24 FOR VOTER INITIATIVE AND AUTHORITY CAN BE EXTENDED TO SPECIAL  
25 DISTRICTS LIKE MTC SUBJECT TO WHATEVER GUARDRAILS EXIST IN THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AUTHORIZING STATUTE FOR EXAMPLE, MTC DOES NOT HAVE FOR  
2 EXAMPLE, SALES TAX AUTHORITY AND CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE IS  
3 EXTENDED TO THE SPECIAL DISTRICT OF MTC WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO  
4 ENACT FOR EXAMPLE, SALES TAX MEASURE IN THE DISTRICT OF MTC IT  
5 CAN STILL HAPPEN AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, AT THE COUNTY LEVEL BUT  
6 NOT NECESSARILY ALLOWED TO HAPPEN AT SOME DISTRICT LEVEL IT  
7 COULD HAPPEN IF THAT AUTHORITY WAS EXTENDED TO MTC. AND IT IS  
8 POSSIBLE.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** FROM WHAT I UNDERSTOOD, ELLEN PROPOSES  
11 THAT WE INCLUDE THAT OPTION, COULD BE AVAILABLE. WE DON'T WANT  
12 TO DO ANYTHING THAT PRECLUDES IT. SO THAT WOULD REALLY BE --  
13 OKAY.

14

15 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** JIM, I DON'T KNOW ABOUT PRECLUDING IT, BUT YOU  
16 WILL PRECLUDING IT BUT YOU WILL RECALL THAT WE'RE NOT VOTING  
17 IN A COUPLE OF WEEKS ON A MEASURE TO THE CALIFORNIA SUPREME  
18 COURT REMOVED IT FROM THE BALLOT AND THE MEASURE INCLUDED A  
19 LOT OF STUFF THE SPROUT SAID IT WAS TOO MUCH TO HAVE IN ONE  
20 MEASURE TO SIMPLIFY. PEOPLE WHO PUT THAT MEASURE BEFORE  
21 COLLECTED MONEY AND COLLECTED SIGNATURES AS I UNDERSTAND HAVE  
22 THE INTENTION TO PUT BACK ON THE BALLOT IN A COUPLE OF YEARS.  
23 I WARN THAT WEEKEND END UP ON THE BALLOT WITH A CITIZEN'S  
24 MEASURE ON THE SAME BALLOT WITH A STATEWIDE MEASURE THAT  
25 PRECLUDES THE MEASURE WE GOT. SO IT'S A SLIPPERY SLOPE. THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 2/3 SEEMS ENORMOUS MOUNTAIN I DON'T THINK WE SHOULD PRECLUDE  
2 BUT CONSIDERATION THAT MAY NOT BE VIABLE.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ABSOLUTELY. ELLEN, IF YOU CAN CORRECT, YOU  
5 JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S NOT PRECLUDED.

6

7 **ELLEN WU:** THAT'S RIGHT.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, LET'S SEE. I DON'T SEE ANY  
10 NODDING HEADS. OKAY. WHAT WAS THE SECOND ISSUE YOU WANTED TO  
11 ADD? THE MORE CONTROVERSIAL ONE?

12

13 **ELLEN WU:** CLIMATE NEUTRAL OR REDUCED EMISSION WITH THE FUNDS  
14 TO ADDRESS OUR CLIMATE CHANGE DISASTER THAT WE'RE FEELING NOW.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MAYBE STAFF CAN RESPOND TO THAT. I WOULD  
17 ASSUME WE'RE UNDER THOSE CONDITIONS ANYWAY WITH PLANNED BAY  
18 AREA 2050.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'M TRYING TO THINK OF ANYTHING WE HAVE  
21 SPECIFICALLY THAT REFERENCES DISCUSSIONS.

22

23 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SO THE PLANNED BAY AREA IN TOTAL NEEDS TO  
24 REDUCE VEHICLE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS SO I THINK ELLEN WAS  
25 SPEAKING MAYBE TO PROJECT BY PROJECT MAYBE YOU CAN CLARIFY



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MAYBE I MISSED IT. BUT THE MAN REQUIRES THAT ALL OF THE  
2 PROJECTS TOGETHER WOULD NEED TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS  
3 EMISSIONS.

4

5 **ELLEN WU:** THE PLAN WILL BE REFERENCED IN THE ENABLING  
6 LEGISLATION.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. JUST THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IS -

9 -

10

11 **SPEAKER:** WAIT --

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HANG ON ONE SECOND.

14

15 **ELLEN WU:** THAT'S WHERE I'M GOING TO IS WE CAN REFERENCE THE  
16 ACHIEVING OUR GOALS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN ENABLING  
17 LEGISLATION TO MAKE SURE THERE IS SOMETHING IN THERE THAT  
18 PRIORITIZES.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY NICK?

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I MEAN, I WAS JUST GOING TO -- PLANNED BAY  
23 AREA INCLUDES ALL SORTS OF CRAZY WHACKY STUFF, YOU KNOW, LIKE  
24 CHARGING PEOPLE FOR PARKING IN ALL DOWNTOWNS AND TOLLING ALL  
25 THE ROADS AND ALL THIS STUFF WHICH OBVIOUSLY ISN'T PART OF



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 THIS MEASURE. SO I DON'T THINK REFERENCING PLANNED BAY AREA IN  
2 THE CONTEXT OF THIS MEASURE, WITH ALL DUE RESPECT TO ALIX,  
3 DOESN'T REALLY DO ANYTHING. I THINK IF WE WANT -- IF STAFF IS  
4 TELLING US THAT THIS MEASURE IS GOING TO BE -- IS GOING TO  
5 REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS, THEN WE SHOULD JUST PUT IT IN THE  
6 MEASURE THAT IT'S GOING TO REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND, LIKE  
7 IF IT'S ALREADY GOING TO HAPPEN, THEN IT'S NOT GOING TO HAVE -  
8 - THEN IT'S ALREADY GOING TO HAPPEN BUT AT LEAST WE'LL KNOW  
9 THAT IT'S GOING TO HAPPEN IF IT'S WRITTEN IN THE MEASURE IS  
10 THAT THE CASE STAFF? OR IS IT NOT GOING TO REDUCE CLIMATE  
11 EMISSIONS.

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THAT'S THE QUESTION. ARE YOU GOING TO ATTRACT  
14 RIDERSHIP AND KEEP TRAINS RUNNING THEN YOU HAVE A GOOD CHANCE  
15 OF GETTING PEOPLE TO MOVE.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO IT WILL REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS.

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IF SUCCESSFUL.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO WE CAN PUT IT IN THE LANGUAGE.

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I THINK IT'S WORTH PUTTING IT IN THE LANGUAGE  
24 I'M NERVOUS ABOUT WHAT THEY GOING TO BE PLANNED BAY AREA IS  
25 BROAD WU WE SHOULD ACKNOWLEDGE IT.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **ELLEN WU:** WE SHOULD ACKNOWLEDGE THE GOAL AND INTENTION TOO,  
3 RIGHT, BUT SOMEHOW WE'RE GOING TO TIE THE FUNDS AND THAT GOAL  
4 AND INTENTION TOGETHER.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I'M JUST CONCERNED THIS WE'RE JUST PUTTING  
7 ONE MORE CONSTRAINT ON THIS AND WE HAVE A LOT OF PROVISIONS  
8 THAT DEAL WITH THAT ISSUE THAT YOU'RE RAISING. AND IT'S KIND  
9 OF LIKE THE CONSOLIDATION ISSUE. I THINK WHEN YOU START  
10 PUTTING THOSE CONSTRAINTS THEN YOU'RE GOING TO GET A LOT MORE  
11 OPPOSITION. MAN EY COMMENTED?

12

13 **MANNY LEON:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, GOING OFF THE SLIDE. WE WOULD  
14 BE OPPOSED TO ANY FURTHER PROVISIONS THAT WOULD BE INCLUDED TO  
15 MAKE PROJECTS CLIMATE NEUTRAL, AS IT SAYS HERE, GOING OFF THE  
16 SLIDE, WE FEEL LIKE THERE IS ALREADY PROCESSES IN PLACE TO  
17 MITIGATE GHG REDUCTIONS THROUGH REGULATIONS AND LEGISLATION.  
18 SO, WE WOULDN'T WANT TO SEE ANYTHING ELSE PUT IN PLACE. THERE  
19 IS A PROCESS ALREADY THAT KIND OF MITIGATES WHAT ALREADY NEEDS  
20 TO BE MITIGATED.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO YOU WOULD FEEL COMPANY IF THIS MEASURE  
23 INCREASED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND COMPLIED WITH THE  
24 EXISTING PROCESS.

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **MANNY LEON:** NO WE'RE SAYING WE'RE CONSISTENT WITH PLANS THOSE  
2 REDUCED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND NEED TO BE CONSISTENT  
3 WITH APPROVAL FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND SCSS WHICH  
4 IN FACT REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AGREED THAT WE SHOULD THIS MEASURE SHOULD BE  
7 RE--

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THAT WAS ONE OF THE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS  
10 THAT WAS BROUGHT FORWARD THAT WE DID NOT REALLY DISCUSS BUT  
11 YOU INDICATED THOSE WOULD CONTINUE TO GO FORWARD FOR  
12 DISCUSSION IT'S ALREADY IN THERE SO MY THOUGHT WOULD BE IT'S  
13 ALREADY GOING TO BE DISCUSSED WITH THE COMMISSION AND THEY'RE  
14 GOING TO MAKE DECISIONS ON THE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS THAT  
15 CAME FROM VARIOUS SOURCES AND THAT WILL BE HANDLED ALMOST LIKE  
16 WE TALKED ABOUT EARLIER, THROUGH THE SUCCESSION AND NEXT  
17 STEPS. THAT WOULD BE MY THOUGHT.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. ELLEN, LET'S SEE WHO SUPPORTS ADDING  
20 THAT LANGUAGE TO THIS MEASURE? WHO WANTS THAT INCLUDED IN THE  
21 MEASURE.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THE MEASURE SHOWER REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS.

24





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HOLD YOU'RE HANDS UP IF YOU WANT TO  
2 INCLUDE THAT MEASURE. HAND COUNT. HOW MANY DON'T SUPPORT THAT  
3 MEASURE? SO, WHAT DID YOU HAVE?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OPPOSE EIGHT AND FOR WAS SIX. IT'S CLOSE.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE'LL NOTE THAT.

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** STUART HAD SIX OR SEVEN ARE THINGS THAT WOULD  
10 BE WORTHY OF TALKING ABOUT SOME MORE IN-DEPTH THIS WAS ONE OF  
11 THEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE'LL ADVANCE THAT TO THE COMMISSION FOR  
14 MORE DISCUSSION.

15

16 **STUART COHEN:** AS LONG AS THAT WASN'T OFFICIAL VOTE. WE HAVEN'T  
17 TAKEN PUBLIC COMMENT YET.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO. IT WAS GETTING CONSENSUS ON THAT  
20 ISSUE. DON'T MAKE IT MORE COMPLICATED STUART.

21

22 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? I'M SORRY. JUST TO  
23 CLARIFY FOR HOUSEKEEPING REASONS, WE HAD AN ATTEMPTED MOTION  
24 FROM MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS WAY BACK. AND I DON'T THINK WE GOT  
25 A SECOND ON IT, AND THERE'S CHANGES --



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** SECOND.

3

4 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** -- CHANGES TO THE DISCUSSION.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WHAT WAS THE MOTION?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** MOVING THE RECOMMENDATIONS AT THAT TIME.

9

10 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THEY HAVE SINCE BEEN AMENDED, AS I  
11 UNDERSTAND IT, WITH MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE LANGUAGE -- PROPOSED  
12 LANGUAGE. AND I DON'T KNOW. I'M JUST OBSERVING THAT PERHAPS WE  
13 HAVE TO LEAVE. SO, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A CLEAR  
14 RECORD HERE AND PEOPLE KNOW WHAT THEY'RE VOTING ON.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** SHE MOVED THE ITEM WITH THE CHANGED WORDING.

17

18 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** OKAY.

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** THE ONLY THING DIDN'T INCLUDE WAS THE CITIZEN'S  
21 INITIATIVE PIECE. THAT CAME AFTER HER MOTION.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WAS GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION ON ALL OF  
24 THESE CONSENSUS THAT I HAVE HEARD. I WAS GOING SAY MOVE THEM  
25 ALL. NOT ONE AT A TIME. STEPHANIE, IS THAT OKAY?



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO, WE HAVE ENABLING LEGISLATION,  
5 ACCOUNTABILITY AND SECOND ONE, ALSO PROVIDE -- ELIGIBILITY FOR  
6 FUNDING. YOU HAVE ADDITIONAL LANGUAGE? DO YOU WANT TO READ IT?  
7 DO YOU HAVE IT WRITTEN DOWN?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SHOULD ALSO PROVIDE THAT TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDING  
10 THE MEASURE OPERATOR SHOULD BE REQUIRED TO REPORT AND COMPLY  
11 WITH POLICIES AND PROGRAMS RELATED TO TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
12 THAT WOULD BE DEVELOPED THROUGH THE REGIONAL NETWORK  
13 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND THEN THREE COMMISSION SHOULD ALSO  
16 CONSIDER TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION WORTHY OF FURTHER STUDY SHOULD  
17 NOT BE PART OF THIS LEGISLATE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE  
18 AND FOURTH ONE IS ADD LANGUAGE THAT PERMITS CITIZEN'S  
19 INITIATIVE. THOSE WOULD BE THE FOUR. AND I WOULD MOVE THOSE  
20 FOUR.

21

22 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** AGAIN, FOR BROWN ACT PURPOSES WE  
23 ALREADY HAVE A MOTION ON THE FLOOR AND A SECOND. DOES THE  
24 MOTION INCLUDE ALL OF THAT LANGUAGE?

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** IT DIDN'T BUT WE CAN ASK.

2

3 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I WOULD ACCEPT THOSE CHANGES.

4

5 **SUE NOACK:** AND I WOULD ACCEPT AND SECOND.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. AND I'LL

8 LEAVE IT TO THE ATTORNEY TO PUSH THE MEETING LONGER.

9

10 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** TRYING TO BE EFFICIENT.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. SO HOW DO

13 YOU WANT TO TAKE -- ROLL CALL?

14

15 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** WE NEED TO DO PUBLIC COMMENT AS WELL.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. LET'S TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW MANY

18 SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?

19

20 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** I DIDN'T RECEIVE ANYTHING IN

21 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM BUT I HAVE ONE SPEAKER IN THE BOARDROOM.

22 JONATHON COLE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HOW MANY DO YOU HAVE ONLINE?

25



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** TWO.

2

3 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WE'RE NOT ADDING ANYMORE.

4

5 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR WE HAVE TO GIVE  
6 NOTICE TO RAISE THEIR HAND.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** RAISE YOUR HAND NOW AND WITHIN THE NEXT  
9 MINUTE.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO  
12 GIVE CHAIR SPERING?

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MINUTE AND A HALF. GO AHEAD, SIR. TURN THE  
15 MIC ON THERE, JONATHON.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** ON THE TOP.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** JONATHON COLE CLIMATE ACTION CALIFORNIA. ORIGINALLY I  
20 SIGNED UP TO EXPRESS MY DISAPPOINTMENT THAT EMISSIONS WERE NOT  
21 PART OF YOUR DISCUSSION. BUT I THANK THE COMMITTEE FOR THE  
22 ROBUST -- FOR INITIATING THAT ROBUST DISCUSSION. I STILL  
23 BELIEVE THAT IT'S THE INTENTION OF THIS COMMISSION THAT THIS  
24 MEASURE REDUCE EMISSIONS THAT YOU SHOULD BE WILLING TO SAY SO



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO ADVOCATE FOR THAT AS THIS MOVES  
2 FORWARD. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MOVING TO THE ZOOM  
7 SPACE. WE HAVE ANTHONY FOLLOWED BY BRIAN CULBERTSON.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ANTHONY AND OPPORTUNITY FOR  
10 MEANINGFUL PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM LIKE MANY OF THESE  
11 SELECT COMMITTEE MEETINGS HAS UNFORTUNATELY BEEN LIMITED AND  
12 CURTAILED BUT I'LL STILL GIVE MY 60 SECONDS OF COMMENTS  
13 BECAUSE I HAVE GOT OPINIONS AND I HAVE BEEN IN THIS MEETING  
14 WITH YOU HOPEFULLY NEXT TIME A MEETING LIKE THIS IS CHAIRED,  
15 SHOULD BE GIVEN LONGER PUBLIC COMMENT. ON THE SUBJECT ON MTC  
16 NETWORK MANAGER CONSOLIDATION LANGUAGE HAPPY WITH WHERE THE  
17 COMMITTEE HAS ENDED UP I THINK THAT CONSOLIDATION IS WORTHY OF  
18 FURTHER STUDIES SO WE CONDITIONED, PERHAPS MONEY COULD BE .2%  
19 OF EVEN THE SMALLEST ANNUAL REVENUE MEASURE TRANSIT  
20 TRANSFORMATION MONEY. ON THE SUBJECT OF CLIMATE ACTION I  
21 REALLY THINK THAT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE TALK ABOUT FINDING  
22 NEUTRALITY AS PART OF THIS, INTENTION OF THIS IS THE TRANSIT  
23 BILL IF POSSIBLE IN PLANNED BAY AREA WITH FUNDS WE'RE GOING TO  
24 RAISE TO FUND JUST ENTIRELY HIGHWAY, PLANNED BAY AREA IS SO  
25 COMPREHENSIVE I DON'T THINK THAT'S SUFFICIENT TO ENSURE THAT



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 WE'RE MEETING OUR CLIMATE GOALS. I THINK AS COMMISSIONER  
2 JOSEFOWITZ SAID IF EVERYONE ON THIS COMMITTEE AGREES THAT  
3 WE'RE GOING TO BE CLIMATE NEUTRAL LET'S GO AHEAD AND SAY IT IN  
4 THE MOTION THAT GOES TO MTC. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE BRIAN  
7 CULBERTSON FOLLOWED BY HARRIET NEIL.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** BRIAN CULBERTSON, A TRANSIT RIDER IN OAKLAND. I WANT  
10 TO TALK ABOUT TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION I THINK THE IMPORTANT PART  
11 ABOUT THAT IS THE TRANSIT COORDINATION PART AND I DEFINITELY  
12 AGREE THAT WE SHOULD BE STUDYING THAT BUT NOT INCLUDING IT IN  
13 THIS MEASURE SO THAT WE CAN FOCUS ON THE OPERATOR FUNDING THAT  
14 IS NEEDED. BUT AS A TRANSIT RIDER, THE THING, WHEN I THINK OF  
15 COORDINATION, CONSOLIDATION BENEFITS FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN I AM  
16 TRYING TO TAKE A FERRY OR A BUS I DON'T WANT TO HAVE TO THINK  
17 ABOUT TRANSIT AGENCY I SHOULD TAKE TO GET THERE I WANT TO  
18 THINK ABOUT WHAT MY LOCATION IS WHERE I WANT TO GO NOT WHAT  
19 AGENCY TO USE. SO CONSOLIDATION CAN HELP WITH COORDINATION.  
20 CLIMATE PART IT'S CRUCIAL TO BRING ON CLIMATE ADVOCATES AND  
21 ORGANIZATIONS AS PART OF GETTING THIS MEASURE PASSED. AND WE  
22 SHOULD MAKE THIS CLEAR IN THIS CLIMATE EMERGENCY THAT WE ARE  
23 DECREASING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BY MODE SHIFT TO TRANSIT.  
24 SO, I THINK IT IS CRUCIALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE PUT IT IN THE



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 MEASURE. ESPECIALLY IF IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE AGREE ON THAT  
2 THIS MEASURE WILL BE FOR GREENHOUSE GAS EMITTING PROJECTS.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE HARRY,  
5 FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO AGAIN THIS IS HARRY. I'M A TRANSIT ADVOCATE  
8 FROM SAN JOSE. ON THE TOPIC OF CONSOLIDATION, I THINK THAT  
9 STUDY IS ALWAYS WORTHY AND A MILLION DOLLARS TO DO A STUDY  
10 LIKE THAT, IT SOUNDS LIKE A LOT OF MONEY. BUT IT'S REALLY NOT  
11 ON THE SCALE OF A BODY LIKE MTC TO BE FRANK. I THINK WORTHY OF  
12 STUDY WE SHOULD BE DEBATING AFTER WE GET THE STUDY IS THIS  
13 RIGHT THING FOR RIDERS AND TO KEEP IN MIND CONSOLIDATION  
14 DOESN'T MEAN EVERYTHING IN ONE AGENCY IT COULD BE AS ONE OF  
15 THE OTHER -- ONE OF THE COMMISSIONER MENTIONED FIVE TRANSIT  
16 AGENCIES THAT COULD BE GOING 5 TO 1 OR FIVE GOING TO TWO THAT  
17 ON A REGIONAL SCALE RATHER THAN EVERYTHING INTO ONE. THERE IS  
18 IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER CONSOLIDATION OF USER EXPERIENCE RATHER  
19 THAN ON THE BACK END UNIFIED WAY OF FINDING OR UNIFIED  
20 BRANDING IS A FORM OF CONSOLIDATION FOR THE RIDERS BUT THE  
21 RIDER DIDN'T REALLY CARE WHAT GOES ON IN THE BACK END. AS PART  
22 OF ADVANCING ANYTHING WE DO NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT LAND USE IS  
23 IMPROVING TO SUPPORT TRANSIT PLEASE KEEP THAT IN MIND FOR  
24 COMMISSIONERS YOUR LOCAL BODIES. THANK YOU.

25





OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE.

2

3 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, I SERVE ON THE POLICY  
4 ADVISORY COUNCIL. I'M NOT SURE BUT I HOPE YOU GUYS AREN'T  
5 GOING TO DISCUSS THE ISSUE ABOUT NOT USING ANY FURTHER  
6 AUTOMATION BECAUSE IT MAY ENDS UP MAKING US LIKE A  
7 LAUGHINGSTOCK, BECAUSE IT WOULD HAVE A BAND SOFTWARE UPGRADE  
8 IN TERMS OF OTHER STUFF. PARTICULARLY THE CLIMATE EMISSIONS WE  
9 ALL BELIEVE THAT IT'S GOING TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES, BUT  
10 IN THE END I JUST WONDER HOW MUCH OF A PAPERWORK THAT'S GOING  
11 TO GENERATE AND REQUIRE, SAME THING GOES FOR TRANSIT  
12 TRANSFORMATION ASKING PEOPLE TO MAKE -- PROGRESS REPORT  
13 ONGOING COMPLIANCE IS BETTER. I OBVIOUSLY SUPPORT STRONGLY  
14 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BUT YOU KNOW, LIKE, THE WHY IMPROVE ALL  
15 THESE REPORTING AND PAPERWORK REQUIREMENTS THAT WE ALL AGREED  
16 ON THOSE ISSUES. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC  
19 COMMENT ON FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** TAKE THE ROLL ON THE MOTION.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MOTION BY MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS  
24 SECOND NOACK. CHAIR SPERING?

25



1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ORANTES?

4

5 **JOHN ARANTES:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. JAN BAPTIST?

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** JOSEFOWITZ? LEONE?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LINDSAY WE HAVE?

20

21 **JAMES LINDSAY:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

24

25 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK? RABBITT? WU?

3

4 **ELLEN WU:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** WINDER MAN?

7

8 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
11 MEMBERS PRESENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALL RIGHT. UNANIMOUS VOTE. I FEEL THIS HAS  
14 ALL BEEN WORTHWHILE. [LAUGHTER] I WANT TO THANK YOU. SO, WE  
15 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. DO WE HAVE ANY WRITTEN OR ANYONE WITH  
16 THEIR HAND RAISED?

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO ADDITIONAL  
19 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE IN  
20 THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BEFORE WE ADJOURN I WANT TO THANK  
23 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. THIS HAS BEEN A WORTHY PROCESS THAT'S GOING  
24 HELP GUIDE THE COMMISSION. THANK YOU FOR THE COMMITMENT AND  
25 COMING TO THIS MEETING AND STAYING LATE TODAY. I WANT TO THANK



OCTOBER 21, 2024

1 STUART AND STAFF. THANK YOU. RIGHT GUY AT THE RIGHT TIME.  
2 [APPLAUSE] PUTTING IN, BURNING THE CANDLE AT BOTH ENDS. THANK  
3 YOU GUYS. I APPRECIATE IT. AND ALLISON AND I WERE ON THE PHONE  
4 LAST NIGHT AT 11 TO GIVE YOU AN IDEA. AGAIN, I WANT TO THANK  
5 THE PUBLIC. GREAT COMMENT. IT GIVES A GOOD REFLECTION OF  
6 WHAT'S GOING ON IN THE REGION. SO THANK YOU PUBLIC SPEAKERS  
7 AND PEOPLE THAT CAME FORWARD. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE YOU  
8 CAN SUBMIT A MINORITY POSITION OR PAPER SOMETHING THAT YOU  
9 WANT THE COMMISSION IN THE LEGISLATURE TO CONSIDER THIS IS NOT  
10 THE END OF THE PROCESS THIS IS ONE MORE STEP IT'S GOING TO GO  
11 TO THE LEG COMMITTEE COMMISSION TO THE LEGISLATURE POLLING  
12 WILL DETERMINE THE PATH FORWARD. COMMISSIONERS, THANK YOU.  
13 CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH. GREAT PROCESS. THANK YOU, ALL. OKAY.  
14 WE'RE ADJOURNED. WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]  
15



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*