

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL

SEPTEMBER 22ND, 2023, 10:00 AM

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE AND CONSISTS OF SIMULTANEOUS TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS AS INDICATED ON THE AGENDA MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK BY ZOOM SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN ON ALL ACTION ITEMS TODAY DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION. WE DON'T DO AN ANNOUNCEMENT ANYMORE? OKAY. THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM ONE, CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER. ROLL CALL. CAN WE PLEASE CONFIRM QUORUM.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WILL DO. PLEASE DO NOT TURN ON YOUR MICS UNTIL CALLED. KINMAN?

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ORANTES?

GABRIELA ORANTES: HERE.



1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

2

3 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED IS EXCUSED. FITZGERALD?

6

7 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLOREZ?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

14

15 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

22

23 **WELTON JORDAN:** PRESENT.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY? IS EXCUSED. LEVIN? LIEU? LODIN?



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **ZELLY LODIN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:**

5

6 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

9

10 **PHILIPPE PIERCE:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER IS EXCUSED. AND PIMPLE?

13

14 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO WELCOME
19 AND CHAIR'S REPORT WELCOME EVERYBODY. IT'S GOOD TO SEE PEOPLE
20 HERE IN THE AUDIENCE. ALSO SINCE OUR LAST MEETING IN JUNE 2023
21 THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS HAVE STEPPED DOWN, MARKHAM, NICKENS,
22 WILSON AND ZACK. I WANT TO THANK THEM FOR CONTRIBUTING TO THE
23 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND WISH THEM ALL THE BEST. THERE WILL
24 BE MORE CHANGES IN THE COMING MONTHS. STAY TUNED. THE POLICY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 SUBCOMMITTEE WILL TRANSITION TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK
2 MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP. THERE WILL BE CHANGES
3 REPORTED TO THE RECENTLY FORMED REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
4 COMMITTEE. MUCH CONTINUITY REGARDING THE MEMBERSHIP, INCLUDING
5 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER APPOINTMENTS WILL REMAIN
6 PRIMARILY IN PLACE. THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP IS SLATED TO
7 HAVE ITS FIRST MEETING ON FRIDAY OCTOBER 27TH. AFTER THE
8 COUNCIL MEETING. STAFF WILL PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF THE NEW
9 BODY, ITS ROLE, AND PURVIEW WHICH WILL BE A GOOD REFRESHER FOR
10 VETERANS AND NEW MEMBERS. CONTACT KEY NAN M AND MELANIE CHOY
11 WITH QUESTIONS. THERE WILL BE MORE MOVING AROUND OF BODIES AND
12 ASSIGNMENTS AS WE GO. ANNE OLIVIA IT'S BEEN SO LONG SINCE I
13 HAVE SEEN YOU IN-PERSON -- IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. THAT'S KIND
14 OF DURING OUR TRANSITION MIDPOINT IT'S LIKE HALFTIME GAME AT
15 THE GAMES. STAY TUNED FOR MORE MOVEMENT AROUND. AND I WANT TO
16 -- I HOPE SOME OF YOU GOT TO ATTEND THE POP-UPS THAT WERE HELD
17 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. I MANAGED TO CATCH OUR TEAM AT THE POP-
18 UP IN SAN JOSE AND I WAS EXTREMELY IMPRESSED WITH THE AMOUNT
19 OF PEOPLE THAT WERE TENDING THE BOOTHS AND THE DYNAMICS OF HOW
20 STAFF WERE INTERACTING. EVERYBODY WAS JUST HAVING A GREAT
21 TIME. AND I HAD A NICE CHAT WITH LAURA -- AND I JUST WANT TO
22 REASSURE PEOPLE SHE'S AWARE OF THE NOOKS AND CRANNIES THAT
23 NEED TO BE FILLED AND SHE AND I HAD A GOOD CONVERSATION ABOUT
24 THAT, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT SHE HAS BEEN



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 DOING. WITH THAT, THAT ENDS MY CHAIR REPORT. ARE THERE ANY
2 PUBLIC COMMENTS THAT CAME TO THE CHAIR'S REPORT?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
5 ON THIS ITEM. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM
6 WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN ZOOM WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. I
7 WOULD LIKE TO ADD, IF YOU DID ATTEND THE POP-UP, YOU CAN CLAIM
8 IT ON YOUR STIPEND.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVEN'T FILLED
11 OUT THAT MONTH'S FORM, PLEASE DO, OR FUTURE FORMS. ANY
12 COMMENTS FROM THE COUNCIL? NO LIGHTS ON. NO HAND RAISED. WITH
13 THAT WE'LL GO INTO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE, APPROVAL OF THE
14 JUNE 14TH, 2023 MEETING MINUTES. AND I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE,
15 WE DID NOT HAVE A JULY MEETING CONVENED DUE TO LACK OF QUORUM.
16 DO I HAVE A MOTION TO APPROVE?

17

18 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** MOTION TO APPROVE. ELDRED.

19

20 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI, SECOND.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ELDRED AND BALDINI. THANK YOU. IS THERE
23 ANY DISCUSSION? PUBLIC COMMENT?

24



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
2 ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM
3 WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN ZOOM WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE MOVE TO ITEM
6 NUMBER -- VOTE. OH I'M SORRY. WE NEED TO VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. READY?

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SORRY.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT'S OKAY. IT'S FRIDAY.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M RUSHING. I WAS LATE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

25



1 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS IS EXCUSED. ELDRED?

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

8

9 **ILAF ESUF:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

12

13 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FLOREZ?

16

17 **VEDA FLOREZ:** ABSTAIN.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER GLASER?

20

21 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

24

25 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** ABSTAIN.



1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

3

4 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KALLINS?

7

8 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER LAVERY? IS EXCUSED. MEMBER LEVIN?

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU IS ABSENT. LODIN?

15

16 **ZELLY LODIN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

19

20 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

23

24 **JOHNNY PARKER:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

2

3 **PHILIPPE PIERCE:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE IS EXCUSED. MEMBER SCOTT?

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND MEMBER WONG?

10

11 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PASSES WITH 16 AYES AND TWO ABSTENTIONS.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TURN THAT BACK ON. THANK YOU. DID WE --

16 SORRY. WE WILL GO INTO ITEM NUMBER FIVE. 5A IS THE REGIONAL

17 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE DRAFT GOALS GUIDING PRINCIPLES

18 EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES AND REVENUE OPTIONS. REBECCA LONG AND

19 DAVE VAUTIN. GOOD MORNING.

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR KINMAN POLICY ADVISERS GREAT

22 TO SEE YOU ALL IN-PERSON. REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION

23 AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. I'LL GIVE CONTEXT ON THIS ITEM THEN HAND

24 IT OVER TO MY COLLEAGUE DAVE VAUTIN. WE HAVE BROUGHT THIS

25 CONCEPT TO YOU A FEW TIMES WHERE WE ARE TODAY IS TO PRESENT



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 THE NEXT ROUND OF MATERIALS FOR YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE CONCEPT
2 OF ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
3 MEASURE. WE HAVE BEEN TALKING WITH A LOT OF STAKEHOLDERS AND
4 YOU GUYS ARE A VERY IMPORTANT ONE. WE'RE GOING TO SHARE KIND
5 OF RECAP OF SOME OF THE KEY GOALS AND PRINCIPLES FOR A FUTURE
6 REGIONAL MEASURE THEN I'M GOING TO PRESENT REVENUE OPTIONS WE
7 HAVE BEEN ANALYZING AND WE HAVE OUR CONSULTANT BRIAN JENKINS
8 WITH SPERRY CONSULTING ON THE LINE AS WELL IF YOU HAVE
9 QUESTIONS I CAN'T ANSWER ON THE REVENUE ANALYSIS. WE HAVE MORE
10 DETAILED IDEAS ABOUT EXPENDITURES AND ABOUT HOW THE
11 LEGISLATION MIGHT BE STRUCTURED IN TERMS OF HOW WE WOULD SPEND
12 THIS ANTICIPATED FUNDING. WITH THAT, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
13 DAVE.

14

15 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD MORNING. DAVE VAUTIN, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF
16 MAJOR PLANS. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE SLIDES AND TURN TO SLIDE
17 TWO? ALL RIGHT. AS REBECCA WAS MENTIONING WE SHARED UPDATES
18 WITH THIS COUNCIL OVER THE PAST YEAR INCLUDING ON THE INITIAL
19 ROUND OF STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AS WELL AS FINDINGS FROM
20 PUBLIC POLLING AND DRAFT GOALS FOR A POTENTIAL 2026 REGIONAL
21 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. THESE ACTIVITIES ARE EARLY STEPS
22 TOWARDS THE MEASURE, WHICH IS DESIGNED TO COMPLEMENT THE
23 ONGOING WORK ON THE 2024 REGIONAL HOUSING BOND THAT THE BAY
24 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY OR BAHFA IS WORKING ON. WHILE
25 ACTION AT THE STATE LEVEL THIS SUMMER PROVIDED NEAR-TERM



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 TRANSIT OPERATING ASSISTANCE, WHICH IS A CRITICAL FIRST STEP,
2 SIGNIFICANT ADDITIONAL FINANCIAL RESOURCES WILL BE REQUIRED
3 OVER THE MEDIUM TO LONG-TERM. AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
4 IDENTIFIED \$110 BILLION FUNDING NEED JUST FOR TRANSPORTATION
5 ALONE. AND WITH OUR TRANSIT RIDERSHIP RECOVERING PROCEEDING A
6 SLOWER RATE THAN ANTICIPATED IN 2021 THIS NEED HAS GROWN.
7 FUNDAMENTALLY THE NEW REGIONAL MONEYS SUCH AS A 2026 BALLOT
8 MEASURE CAN INCENTIVIZE POLICY GOALS AND IMPROVE ACCESS AND
9 MOBILITY OUTCOMES ACROSS OUR NINE COUNTY REGION. OVER THE
10 SUMMER WE HAVE CONTINUED TO REFINE OUR DRAFT GOALS, GUIDING
11 PRINCIPLES EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES AND A MENU OF REVENUE
12 OPTIONS WHICH ARE ANY OF THE FUNDING BUILDING BLOCKS OF A
13 POTENTIAL MEASURE AND WE'RE WORKING AS REBECCA SAID
14 SOLIDIFYING A CONCEPTUAL BALLOT MEASURE AT THE END OF THIS
15 YEAR TOWARDS AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. NEXT SLIDE. OUR EFFORTS
16 HAVE ACCELERATED ON THE STAKEHOLDER AND PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
17 FRONT IN THE PAST FEW MONTH THERE IS A LIST OF ORGANIZATIONS
18 AND EVENTS INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET AND WE RECOGNIZE THAT
19 FURTHER ENGAGEMENT WILL BE REQUIRED IN MONTHS AHEAD ESPECIALLY
20 TO BUILD PUBLIC BUY-IN ON THE NEW MEASURE FEEDBACK SO FAR HAS
21 BEEN CRITICAL IN HELPING REFINE GOALS AND EXPENDITURE
22 PRIORITIES. ON THE RIGHT SIDE, SOME EMERGING THEMES HAVE
23 RESONATED WITH STAKEHOLDERS AND THE PUBLIC. FIRST MANY
24 STAKEHOLDERS AND THE PUBLIC AT-LARGE WANT TO SEE OUR TRANSIT
25 SYSTEMS MAINTAINS AND IMPROVED BUT ALSO WANT TO SEE OTHER



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 INVESTMENTS IN OTHER MODES OF TRANSPORTATION. SECOND THERE IS
2 A BROAD RECOGNITION THAT OUR REGION'S FUTURE IS UNCERTAIN AND
3 EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES MAY NEED TO SHIFT IN ORDER TO MEET THE
4 MOMENT. AND THIRD THAT MAINTAINING THE STATUS QUO IS NOT
5 FIREFIGHTER AND THAT FOLKS WANT TO SEE MONEYS USED TO
6 TRANSFORM THE SYSTEM MORE BROADLY. NEXT SLIDE. WE PRESENTED TO
7 YOU IN JULY AND SHARED SOME OF THIS CONTENT. I'M GOING BREEZE
8 THROUGH THIS QUICKLY. THE CORE THINGS ON THIS SLIDE TO
9 UNDERSCORE IS THAT WE'RE THINKING OF THREE PRIMARY FOCUS AREAS
10 ALL OF WHICH ARE DESIGNED TO ADVANCE THE BROADER PLANNED BAY
11 AREA 2050 VISION OF A MORE AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE,
12 HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FUTURE FOR ALL INCLUDING STABILIZING
13 TRANSIT FUNDING MAKING TRANSIT FASTER AND SAFER, EASIER TO USE
14 ENHANCING MOBILE AND ACCESS FOR ALL LOOKING TO COST EFFECTIVE
15 RESILIENT SOLUTIONS BEYOND TRANSPORTATION. NEXT SLIDE. EQUALLY
16 IMPORTANT ARE THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES WE HAVE ESTABLISHED FOR
17 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN WHICH ARE DESIGNED TO SHAPE THE SPECIFICS
18 OF THE LINE ITEMS INCLUDED WITHIN THERE RELATIVELY BROAD
19 SUPPORT FOR BOTH GOALS AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES MAKING SURE
20 EXPENDITURES ARE ADVANCING EQUITY, CLIMATE FRIENDLY, AND
21 ADAPTING EXPENDITURE PLAN TO CHANGING FUTURE CIRCUMSTANCES AND
22 HAS A COHESIVE VISION FOR THE FUTURE THAT WORKS TOGETHER AND
23 CAN BE CLEARLY COMMUNICATED. NEXT SLIDE. WE SHARED IN OUR LAST
24 MEETING THE FIVE POTENTIAL EXPENDITURE PRIORITY CATEGORIES,
25 TRANSIT OPERATIONS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, MAIN STREETS,



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 CLIMATE RESILIENCE, AND PRIORITY PROJECTS. AND SINCE THEN WE
2 HAVE DEVELOPED ADDITIONAL DETAILS ABOUT THE TYPE OF -- TYPES
3 OF ELIGIBLE PROJECTS AND INVESTMENTS THAT FALL INTO EACH OF
4 THE FIVE CATEGORIES, AS WELL AS THE NEXUS US WITH CLIMATE AND
5 WITH EQUITY GOALS FOR EACH OF THESE CATEGORIES. NEXT SLIDE.
6 SO, MOVING ON TO THE NEW MATERIAL TODAY. AS WAS MENTIONED IN
7 CHAIR KINMAN'S OPENING REMARKS ABOUT THE POP-UPS, WE HAVE HAD
8 AN OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGE THE PUBLIC, NOT ONLY ON OUR LONG
9 RANGE PLAN, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS BUT ALSO ON THIS
10 MEASURE, SPECIFICALLY, IN THE TRANSPORTATION SPACE. WHAT WE
11 SAW HERE IS, AS PARTICIPANTS VOTED ON THEIR VARIOUS PRIORITIES
12 FOR THE FUTURE OF THE REGION AND EXPENDITURES CRITICALITY, WE
13 SAW MAIN STREETS FOLLOWED CLOSELY BY TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
14 RANKING 1 AND 2. ON THE OTHER END OF THE SPECTRUM PRIORITY
15 PROJECTS GENERATED LEAST OF THE LOWEST LEVEL OF INTEREST OF
16 THE FIVE CATEGORIES WHICH IS NOTABLE GIVEN THE MEGA PROJECTS
17 SUCH AS RAIL EXTENSIONS AND EXPRESS LANES THAT OFTEN HAVE BEEN
18 CENTER OF PAST REGIONAL MEASURES HAD LESSER INTEREST IF OUR
19 ENGAGEMENT THIS SUMMER. THIS IS NOT A STATISTICALLY VALID POLL
20 BY ANY SENSE BUT GIVES US A SENSE OF WHAT THE PUBLIC ARE
21 THINKING. WE WILL HAVE MORE DATA ON OUR SUMMER PUBLIC
22 ENGAGEMENT LATER THIS FALL WE LAN ON RETURNING IN OCTOBER TO
23 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TO SHARE SOME OF THAT INCLUDING
24 ONLINE SURVEY RESULTS THAT WERE CONDUCTED IN PARALLEL WITH THE
25 AUGUST POP-UP WORKSHOPS. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT WE WANTED TO SHARE A



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 FEW CONCEPTUAL EXPENDITURE PLANS THAT LOOK AT THE RELATIVE
2 LEVELS OF INVESTMENT FOR THESE VARIOUS CATEGORIES. I WANT TO
3 UNDERSCORE THESE ARE REALLY CONCEPTS DESIGNED TO SPARK
4 DISCUSSION AND ENGAGEMENT. WE'RE NOT FIXATED ON ANY PARTICULAR
5 SHARES OF MONEY AT THIS POINT. WE ARE TRYING TO TO UNDERSTAND
6 THE RELATIVELY LEVEL INVESTMENT ACROSS THE FIVE CATEGORIES.
7 NOW AS WE ENGAGE WITH OUR STAKEHOLDERS THIS SUMMER WE FOUND
8 OUT THAT DESPITE RELATIVE CONSENSUS ON THINGS LIKE GOALS AND
9 GUIDING PRINCIPLES, THAT THERE WERE DIVERGING OPINIONS ON HOW
10 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN SHOULD BE SHAPED. TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND
11 OPERATORS WANTED TO SEE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT LEANED
12 SIGNIFICANTLY INTO TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND TRANSIT
13 TRANSFORMATION. WHILE STAKEHOLDERS WANTED A DIVERSE MULTI-
14 MODAL EXPENDITURE PLAN. AS WE SEEK TO BRIDGE THE DIVIDE WE'RE
15 EXPLORING TWO EXPENDITURE PLAN CONCEPTS TO PLAY WITH THE IDEA
16 OF EXPENDITURE PLANS THAT SHIFT AND CHANGE OVER TIME THAT
17 MEETS THE IMMEDIATE TRANSIT OPERATING NEED IN THE MOMENT WHILE
18 MOVING TOWARD A MULTI-MODAL EXPENDITURE PLAN AS TIME
19 PROGRESSES. WE'RE GOING TO SHOW TWO OF THOSE CONCEPTS FOR YOUR
20 FEEDBACK TODAY. THE FIRST CONCEPT ARE THE TRANSITION CONCEPT,
21 CONCEPT A. LEANS INTO THE IDEA OF PRIORITIZING THOSE TRANSIT
22 MONEYS EARLY ON, AND WORKING TO, AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE FULLY
23 FUND THE TRANSIT OPERATING GAP. AND TO REALLY LEAN INTO
24 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION INVESTMENTS BUT ESTABLISHING A
25 COMMITMENT OVER TIME TO TRANSITION THE SHARES OF MONEY TOWARDS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 A MORE MULTI-MODAL APPROACH, INCREASING OUR INVESTMENT IN MAIN
2 STREETS AND RESILIENCE PROJECTS. OF COURSE, THIS WOULD HINGE
3 ON INCREASED FARE REVENUE, STATED LOCAL FUNDING STARTING TO
4 MATCH THE REGIONAL MEASURE IN THE TRANSIT OPERATING SPACE AND
5 THAT WOULD ALLOW FOR THE FUNDING OF THESE OTHER CRITICAL
6 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS TO EXPAND. NEXT SLIDE. CONCEPT B, OR THE
7 FLEX CONCEPT, WE TRY A DIFFERENT APPROACH. IN THIS APPROACH
8 THE GRAPH ON THE RIGHT SIDE IS A BIT MORE SIMPLE SHOWING A
9 CONCEPTUAL MINIMUM OF 60% ANNUALLY FOR TRANSIT CATEGORIES,
10 MINIMUM OF 20% ANNUALLY FOR MAIN STREETS PRIORITY PROJECTS AND
11 CLIMATE RESILIENCE CATEGORIES, AND A REMAINING CHUNK OF MONEY
12 THAT WOULD BE FLEXIBLE AND COULD BE ALLOCATED, SAY, ANNUALLY,
13 OR EVERY TWO YEARS TO FUND PRIORITIES FLEXING BETWEEN TRANSIT
14 AND MAIN STREETS, BASED ON BOTH THE NEEDS THAT EXIST IN THAT
15 MOMENT, AS WELL AS THE ADVANCEMENT AND ADHERENCE TO REGIONAL
16 AND STATE POLICY GOALS. THIS APPROACH -- WITH THIS APPROACH,
17 WE WOULD REALLY HAVE -- WE WOULD HAVE A LOWER SHARED GUARANTEE
18 TO TRANSIT, BUT AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE FUNDING LEVEL FOR
19 TRANSIT TO FLUCTUATE AND MATCH THE NEEDS THAT EXIST IN THE
20 MOMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO THESE TWO APPROACHES, OF COURSE, HAVE
21 PROS AND CONS, AND THOSE ARE REALLY DESIGNED TO SPARK
22 DISCUSSION. THERE ARE A FEW STRAINS WE SEE WITH EACH OF THE
23 DIFFERENT CONCEPTS. CONCEPT A, THE TRANSITION CONCEPT, THERE
24 IS A GREATER ABILITY TO COMMIT TO THE VOTERS THAT WE'RE ABLE
25 TO PRESERVE EXISTING SERVICE LEVELS ESPECIALLY IN THE EARLY



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 YEARS OF THE MEASURE. IT WOULD HELP IT MAKE THE CASE FOR
2 INCREASED STATE AND OUR LOCAL TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDS TO MATCH
3 THE REGION AND FOR AGENCIES TO CONTINUE WORKING TO ATTRACT NEW
4 RIDERS. AND TO ESTABLISH A CLEAR PATHWAY TOWARDS A MORE MULTI-
5 MODAL INVESTMENT PLAN AS POST-PANDEMIC EFFECTS DIMINISH.
6 CONCEPT B, OR FLEX, THE TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING LEVEL WOULD
7 BE MORE PREDICTABLE ESTABLISHING THAT MINIMUM SHARE THAT WOULD
8 BE CONSISTENT OVER TIME AND PROVIDE GREATER BUDGET CERTAINTY
9 TO OPERATORS. IT WOULD ALSO HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO HAVE MORE
10 FUNDING FOR NON-TRANSIT USES, AND, YOU KNOW, FOR USERS OF THE
11 SYSTEM WHO MIGHT BE BIKING, WALKING, OR DRIVING, TO SEE MORE
12 GREATER NEAR-TERM DIRECT BENEFITS AND THE FLEX CATEGORY WOULD
13 PROVIDE CUSHION TO PROVIDE FOR CIRCUMSTANCES CHANGING IN
14 ECONOMIC CONDITIONS LOOKING FORWARD TO FEEDBACK ON THIS
15 MATERIAL ESPECIALLY WHERE WE'RE AT ON THE EXPENDITURE PLAN
16 FRONT. BUT BEFORE I GO TO Q&A I'LL TURN IT TO REBECCA TO DIVE
17 INTO THE REVENUE SIDE.

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** GREAT, THANK YOU, DAVE. THROUGH THE CHAIR WOULD
20 YOU LIKE US TO TAKE SOME FEEDBACK QUESTIONS ON THE NEXT ITEM
21 THE NEXT PIECE IS DIFFERENT WHILE IT'S FRESH IN PEOPLE'S
22 MINDS. IT'S UP TO YOU.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GOOD IDEA. MARTHA ARE THERE ANY HAND
25 RAISED OR ANYBODY IN THE PUBLIC?



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO ONE WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO CARDS
3 WERE SUBMITTED.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL? I SEE VEDA. I SEE
6 GABRIELLE, WENDI. WILLIAM. OKAY WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO IS GO
7 AROUND, START WITH GABRIELA AND BRING IT AROUND THIS WAY AND
8 ASK EVERYBODY IF THEY WANT TO SPEAK. GABRIELA, GO AHEAD.

9

10 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** HOW LONG IS THE PROCESS FOR GETTING FEEDBACK
11 BEFORE IT GOES TO VOTE TO THE COMMISSIONERS?

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** GREAT QUESTION. SO, RIGHT NOW, OUR SCHEDULE IS
14 TO BRING, SORT OF, OUTLINED CONCEPT TO THE JOINT LEGISLATION
15 COMMITTEE IN EARLY NOVEMBER, AND THEN HAVE THEM ADOPT A
16 CONCEPT THAT WE WOULD BRING TO THE LEGISLATURE IN JANUARY.
17 EXCUSE ME -- IN DECEMBER, THE COMMISSION WOULD ACT AND THEN WE
18 WOULD BE PURSUING LEGISLATION IN JANUARY. ALL OF THIS IS GOING
19 TO BE QUITE FLUID, RIGHT, BASED ON FEEDBACK OF, YOU KNOW, THE
20 REGION, LEGISLATORS. SO, I THINK NOTHING IS GOING TO BE HARD
21 AND FAST. BUT OUR CURRENT TIMELINE IS TO HAVE A CONCEPT IN
22 EARLY NOVEMBER.

23



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. AND WILL THERE BE ADDITIONAL -- THERE
2 ARE POP-UPS THAT HAPPEN, THE SURVEY THAT HAPPENED, OTHER
3 PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER OPPORTUNITIES TO CONTRIBUTE?

4

5 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. SO WE ARE PLANNING TO DO SOME POLLING IN
6 OCTOBER, SO, GET SOME REAL ROBUST RANDOMIZED FEEDBACK FROM BAY
7 AREA VOTERS, AND THEN LIKELY, I THINK WHAT WE'RE THINKING
8 ABOUT NOW IS MAYBE IN NOVEMBER, THE MONTH OF NOVEMBER, DOING
9 SOME PUBLIC WEBINARS. SO ONCE WE HAVE SOMETHING MORE CONCRETE
10 TO SHARE AND GET FEEDBACK ON.

11

12 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** ONE LAST QUESTION ON THAT. THE WEBINARS WILL
13 THEY BE IN OTHER LANGUAGES OR INTERPRETED INTO OTHER
14 LANGUAGES?

15

16 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. I THINK WE HAVE THE
17 CAPABILITY OF OFFERING IT IN LIVE TRANSLATION, AS WE GO. SO
18 YES, WE WILL BE DOING THAT.

19

20 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL GO START OVER THIS WAY.
23 MICHAEL?

24



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES, THANK YOU. ONE, I SEE COVID AS A
2 DISRUPTOR, AS -- YOU KNOW, AND MY FEAR IS, BUSINESS AS USUAL,
3 WHEN HERE IS OUR OPPORTUNITY FOR SUCCESS OF A PROJECT SUCH AS
4 THIS TO PLAY THE CARROT ROLE. SO, HOW IS THIS MONEY ALLOCATED
5 AND DISTRIBUTED AMONG ALL THE PARTICIPATING TRANSIT AGENCIES
6 IN THE END?

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER BALDINI. AGAIN, NONE OF
9 THIS IS DEFINED YET, RIGHT? WE'RE STARTING THE CONVERSATIONS
10 ABOUT KEY ROLES, POTENTIAL CATEGORIES OF INVESTMENT. THERE ARE
11 MANY DIFFERENT WAYS OF DETERMINING HOW IT WOULD BE
12 DISTRIBUTED. ONE EXTREME WOULD BE THAT THE LEGISLATURE
13 AUTHORIZES MTC TO PUT SOMETHING ON THE BALLOT AND THEN PRIOR
14 TO A BALLOT MEASURE, WE WOULD WORK WITH, YOU KNOW, THE
15 COMMUNITY AND DETERMINE HOW THAT WOULD WORK. IT COULD BE
16 COMPLETELY COMPETITIVE, RIGHT? WOULD BE ONE APPROACH THAT
17 WOULD REALLY EMPOWER MTC, CREATE A LOT OF INCENTIVE ABILITY TO
18 DRIVE POLICY CHANGE. ANOTHER STREAM WOULD BE THE LEGISLATURE
19 WOULD IDENTIFY FORMULA AND EVERY OPERATOR WOULD KNOW EXACTLY
20 HOW MUCH THEY'RE GOING TO GET, RIGHT, THAT WOULD PROVIDE A LOT
21 OF CERTAINTY. BUT A ROAD, THE ABILITY TO KIND OF DRIVE POLICY
22 CHANGES, I THINK IT'S REALLY TOO EARLY TO TELL BUT WE WOULD
23 LOVE YOUR FEEDBACK ON WHAT APPROACH YOU THINK MIGHT MAKE
24 SENSE.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDI?

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH, I AM VERY TORN. [LAUGHTER] I REALLY -- I
6 REALLY LIKE THE IDEA OF A MULTI-MODAL APPROACH BECAUSE I THINK
7 THAT HAS A LOT TO DO WITH FIRST AND LAST MILE. AND AS SAFE
8 ROUTES TO SCHOOL, AND AS A BICYCLE ADVOCATE, OF COURSE, I WANT
9 MORE MAIN STREET, MORE BIKE, MORE PED. I DON'T WANT TO SEE
10 INCREASED FARES. I THINK WE NEED TO GO IN THE OPPOSITE
11 DIRECTION. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IF WE WANT TO ATTRACT
12 NEW RIDERSHIP, I THINK WE NEED TO KEEP FARES STABLE, AND IF
13 ANYTHING, REDUCE FARES. BUT I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT THING,
14 IT IS CONVENIENCE AND FREQUENCY. SO THE MORE WE CAN CREATE
15 FREQUENCY AND CONVENIENCE FOR THE CUSTOMER, THE MORE WE
16 ATTRACT NEW RIDERS. AND I AM CURIOUS IN YOUR MODELING, YOU
17 LOOK AT THE INCREASED FARE REVENUES FROM INCREASED RIDERSHIP,
18 AND HOW MUCH THAT WOULD APPLY, IF AT ALL, TO YOUR FORMULAS. I
19 ALSO LIKE THE IDEA OF SOME STABILITY FOR THE TRANSIT
20 OPERATORS. AT THE SAME TIME IT MAY NOT BE THAT THE SUB-DEES
21 WOULD NOT BE AS NEEDED IF THE MODELING SHOWS THAT INCREASE
22 RIDERSHIP WOULD PROVIDE THE REVENUE NEEDED. AND GOING INTO
23 LOCAL FUNDING A LOT OF THAT WOULD MEAN THAT THOSE OF US WHO
24 LIVE IN THE WEALTHY COMMUNITIES MIGHT HAVE A BETTER
25 OPPORTUNITY FOR FUNDING THAT THOSE IN LESS WEALTHY COMMUNITIES



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 AND WE DON'T KNOW IF THE STATE IS GOING TO STEP UP OR NOT. SO
2 THAT'S AN UNKNOWN. I DO LIKE HAVING THE FLEXIBILITY, THAT GRAY
3 AREA FLEXIBILITY AND THE MORE STABLE MODEL AND THAT YOU CAN
4 RESPOND TO WHATEVER IS HAPPENING IN THE FUTURE AND I WONDER
5 HOW MANY IN YOUR MODELING YOU'RE LOOKING AT TRANSPORTATION
6 DEMAND MANAGEMENT HOW MUCH OF THAT IS GOING TO BE PART OF THE
7 WHOLE FORMULA AND WHILE WE'RE GOT GETTING DOWN TO DETAIL
8 LEVELS OF WHAT MAIN STREET MEANS I HAVE SAID THIS BEFORE BUT
9 ONE OF THE THINGS WE HAVE LEARNED WITH THE SAFE ROUTES TO
10 SCHOOLS BY PROVIDING CROSSING GUARDS THAT INCREASES THE
11 ABILITY OF CHILDREN TO BE ABLE TO WALK AND BIKE TO SCHOOL
12 WHICH REDUCES MORNING TRAFFIC AND I DON'T KNOW IF THAT CAN BE
13 INCLUDED IN THE REVENUE BUT IT DOES ATTRACT PARENTS WHO MIGHT
14 NOT BE PAYING ATTENTION OTHERWISE VOTE FOR THE MEASURE. I'M
15 HAVING A TECHNICAL PROBLEM HERE MY SCREEN KEEPS FLICKERING ON
16 AND OFF. I DON'T KNOW IF ANYBODY CAN HELP ME WITH THAT?

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WILLIAM? DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

19

20 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** YOUR PUBLIC FEEDBACK SHOWED THAT THERE WAS
21 LESS INTEREST IN PRIORITY PROJECTS AM I CORRECT IN THINKING
22 THAT PRIORITY PROJECTS BENEFIT EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
23 MORE?

24



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I THINK IT DEPENDS ON THE PRIORITY PROJECT IN
2 QUESTION, RIGHT? SOME OF OUR PRIORITY PROJECTS IN THE REGION,
3 LIKE, YOU KNOW, BUS RAPID TRANSIT LINES THAT SERVE EQUITY
4 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, ABSOLUTELY ADVANCE THAT FURTHER. OTHERS,
5 YOU KNOW, MANY OF OUR LARGEST RAIL EXTENSION OR RAIL
6 IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS HAVE HISTORICALLY BENEFITTED WEALTHIER
7 AND WHITER RESIDENTS IN THE REGION. RIGHT? SO I THINK IT IS
8 VERY MUCH PROJECT DEPENDENT.

9

10 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** ALSO -- THANK YOU FOR THAT. IN THE GOOD
11 GUIDING PRINCIPLE IT IS READS THAT ONE OF THE PRIORITIES IS
12 THAT IT SHOULD ADVANCE EQUITY BUT THEN WHEN I WENT THROUGH THE
13 EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES UNDER CONSIDERATIONS IT SAID PRIORITY
14 COULD BENEFIT AND THERE IS A BIG DIFFERENCE BETWEEN SHOULD AND
15 COULD, AND THE INTENTIONALITY OF IF IT'S A WISH OR COULD.
16 COULD YOU CLARIFY?

17

18 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD POINT. WE'RE IN THE VERY EARLY STAGES OF
19 THIS, SO THE BOX ON EQUITY AND CLIMATE CONSIDERATIONS IS
20 BASICALLY ACKNOWLEDGING THAT IF THE MEASURE PASSES, THE
21 COMMISSION WOULD NEED TO, YOU KNOW, ALLOCATE OUT MONEYS. AND
22 IN THOSE PROCEDURES, RIGHT, THEY COULD ESTABLISH A PRIORITY
23 TOWARDS THESE CATEGORIES THAT WE HAVE SUGGESTED HERE. SO THIS
24 IS KIND OF AROUND INITIAL STAFF SUGGESTION OF HOW THAT COULD
25 BE STRUCTURED IN A WAY THAT ADVANCE THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES OF



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 THE MEASURE. SO, I THINK THE LANGUAGE THERE IS REALLY JUST
2 INDICATING THAT THIS IS KIND OF INITIAL STAFF SUGGESTION OF,
3 YOU KNOW, THIS IS HOW THIS PARTICULAR FUNDING PROGRAM COULD BE
4 STRUCTURED TO BEST MAXIMIZE THAT. BUT I APPRECIATE THE
5 FEEDBACK ON THE WORDING.

6

7 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** COULD WE CHANGE THAT LANGUAGE, JUST TO KEEP
8 IT CONSISTENT?

9

10 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I THINK AS WE GO FORWARD, WE WOULD BE ABLE TO
11 CLARIFY THAT LANGUAGE. THERE ARE MULTIPLE WAYS THAT WE COULD
12 ADVANCE THAT GUIDING PRINCIPLE. SO, I THINK ALL THIS WE'RE
13 TRYING TO SUGGEST HERE IS THAT THIS IS ONE WAY TO DO SO. AND
14 THERE MIGHT BE OTHER WAYS, AS WE KEEP WORKING ON THE EXTEND
15 TUSH PLAN, TO ADVANCE THAT GOAL, AS WELL.

16

17 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANNE OLIVIA?

20

21 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION.
22 THERE IS CLEARLY A LOT OF WORK AND THOUGHT THAT'S GONE INTO
23 THIS. IT'S COOL TO SEE THE EVOLUTION OVER TIME. I HAVE BEEN
24 SITTING IN THE BAHFA REGIONAL HOUSING BOND MEETINGS AND HAVE
25 SOME QUESTIONS THAT MAYBE I HAVE MISSED. BUT I'M CURIOUS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 ABOUT. SO, WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT THE DISTRIBUTION OF BENEFITS
2 FROM THE REVENUES THAT ARE RAISED BY THIS, I KNOW THAT SOME OF
3 THIS IS GOING TO OUR TRANSPORTATION, AND YOU GUYS WILL HAVE
4 FORMULA TO FIGURE THAT OUT BECAUSE SOME ARE MORE REGIONAL THAN
5 OTHERS AND ALL THAT, BUT INVESTMENTS HOW ARE YOU LOOKING AT
6 FORMULA TO RETURN THOSE TO THE COMMUNITIES IS THERE RETURN TO
7 SOURCE OR CERTAIN AMOUNT PER SEA OR COUNTY IS ANY PART OF IT
8 COMPETITIVE AND HOW ARE YOU MAKING SURE THAT WEALTHIER
9 COMMUNITIES THAT MAYBE HAVE MORE TAX DOLLARS PUT IN ARE
10 BENEFITTING BUT ARE ALSO -- YOU KNOW WHERE I'M GOING WITH
11 THIS. YOU CAN CLARIFY THAT?

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** ALL THOSE ARE GREAT QUESTIONS. RIGHT NOW WE'RE
14 NOT PROPOSING ANY FORMULA WE'RE JUST GETTING FEEDBACK ON THESE
15 COMPONENTS BUT I DEFINITELY ANTICIPATE, AS WE GO THROUGH THE
16 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS, AND BRING THIS FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION,
17 THAT WE'LL GET MORE OF THAT FEEDBACK. I THINK THE GREATER THE
18 MEASURE GOES TOWARDS, YOU KNOW, JUST RETURN TO SOURCE FORMULA,
19 THE LESS TRANSFORMATIVE IT LIKELY WILL BE. YOU HAVE MORE OF
20 THAT KIND OF SPREADING THE PEANUT BUTTER EFFECT. AND I THINK
21 THERE IS A CHALLENGE WITH THE MEASURE THAT'S FOCUSED ON
22 ADDRESSING THE TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS WHICH ARE
23 CONCENTRATED WITH CERTAIN OF OUR LARGE OPERATORS SERVING MORE
24 OF THE URBAN CORE, AND ONE POSSIBILITY IS WE MIGHT TAKE SOME
25 OF THE CATEGORIES LIKE MAIN STREETS WHICH YOU COULD ARGUE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 EVERY COMMUNITY NEEDS TO HAVE, YOU KNOW, SAFE, ACCESSIBLE
2 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN ACCESS ON ALL OF THEIR ROADS SO THAT
3 WOULD LEND ITSELF TOWARDS A FORMULA DISTRIBUTION.
4 TRADITIONALLY POPULATION IS ONE THAT WORKS WELL, ANOTHER
5 APPROACH WITH THE BAHFA MEASURE, THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE
6 IS A RETURN TO SOURCE, RIGHT, ON THE BASIS OF WHO IS PAYING. I
7 THINK THOSE ARE SOME INITIAL IDEAS, BUT WE REALLY HAVEN'T MADE
8 ANY DECISIONS ON THAT YET.

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. THE ONE OF THE THINGS
11 WE HAVE LEARNED WITH SUPERVISOR OUR INCOUNTY BONDS WAS WHEN WE
12 STRUCTURED THINGS SO THAT DIFFERENT CITIES, OR THE
13 UNINCORPORATED AREAS COULD COMPETE BASED ON HOW READY A
14 PROJECT WAS TO GO, IT ENDED UP REALLY BENEFITTING CITIES THAT
15 WERE LARGE ENOUGH TO HAVE PLAN COMMISSION SUPERVISOR THOSE
16 KINDS OF THINGS IN PLACE SO OUR RURAL COMMUNITIES REALLY
17 DIDN'T BENEFIT AS MUCH AS THEY NEEDED TO, EVEN THOUGH THEY
18 HAVE GREAT NEED. SO, YOU KNOW, JUST FOR THOSE THINGS TO TAKE
19 INTO CONSIDERATION. AND THEN MY OTHER QUESTION WAS AROUND THE
20 POP-UPS. I'M CORRECT IN THAT ALL OF THOSE HAPPENED IN, LIKE,
21 FARMERS MARKETS, AND PEDESTRIAN SETTINGS?

22

23 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH MOSTLY IN OUTDOOR SETTINGS. NOT ALL FARMERS
24 MARKETS WE WERE AT AMERICAN CANYON WAL-MART, AT COMMUNITY



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 COLLEGE CAMPUS BUT YEAH KIND OF OUTDOOR WALKABLE TYPE
2 SETTINGS.

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** IN MY HEAD IT WOULD BE LOGICAL THAT PEOPLE
5 IN A PEDESTRIAN SETTING WOULD VOTE WITH THEIR DOTS FOR
6 PEDESTRIAN IMPROVEMENTS BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT WAS AROUND THEM.
7 IT MAY BE INTERESTING TO PUT UP ANNOUNCEMENTS ON PUBLIC
8 TRANSPORTATION, LIKE WHAT ARE YOUR TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES,
9 BLAH, BLAH, HERE SAY QR CODE GO HERE, AND IF THERE IS A WAY TO
10 CATCH FOLKS AFTER TRAFFIC LIKE BILLBOARDS LIKE TRYING TO CATCH
11 PEOPLE WHEN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THEIR BRAIN ARE ENGAGED IN
12 THEIR COMMUTE MIGHT GIVE A FULLER UNDERSTANDING. THAT'S ALL.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DWAYNE DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT? ADINA?

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** A FEW THINGS. ONE CHALLENGE WITH ASKING QUESTIONS
17 TO LAY PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE A LOT OF KNOWLEDGE ABOUT, YOU
18 KNOW, TRANSPORTATION BUDGETS, IS THAT IF YOU ASK SOMEONE, YOU
19 KNOW, WOULD YOU LIKE A NICE BALANCED APPROACH, ABSOLUTELY. I
20 WANT TO EAT A BALANCED DIET IT SEEMS COMPLETELY COMMON
21 SENSICAL, AND PEOPLE ARE NOT SO AWARE OF THE BUDGETARY ISSUES
22 RESULTING FROM COVID. AND, YOU KNOW, SO, IF SOMEONE, LIKE,
23 OKAY, I WANT A BALANCE, AND THEN THE OUTCOME OF THE BALANCE IS
24 OH, WE REALLY DON'T REALLY HAVE BART SERVICE ON WEEKENDS AND
25 NIGHT ANYMORE, AND IT COMES EVERY TWO HOURS, PEOPLE WOULD BE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 VERY SURPRISED AND DISAPPOINTED AND THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND WHAT
2 THE IMPACT IS OF THEIR COMMON SENSE, BUT NOT FULLY INFORMED,
3 YOU KNOW, ADJUSTMENT WITHOUT HAVING THE INFORMATION. SO I
4 THINK WE SHOULD REALLY KEEP THAT IN MIND. AND WHEN GOING OUT
5 AGAIN WITH MORE INFORMATION, GIVE PEOPLE INFORMATION ABOUT
6 WHAT THE CONSEQUENCES AND OUTCOMES WOULD BE OF THE DIFFERENT
7 KIND OF CHOICES. A RELATED POINT IS THAT PEOPLE, TRANSIT
8 TRANSFORMATION RANKED REALLY HIGHLY, AND PEOPLE, LAY PEOPLE
9 MAY OR MAY NOT KNOW THAT SUSTAINING SERVICE AND MORE FREQUENT
10 SERVICE IS A PREREQUISITE FOR TRANSFORMATION. YOU CAN'T
11 SPRINKLE TRANSFORMATION ON TOP OF A BUS THAT RUNS EVERY OTHER
12 HOUR. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, LIKEWISE, HOPEFULLY MTC STAFF WILL
13 USE THEIR EXPERTISE IN COMING UP WITH VERSIONS OF QUESTIONS
14 THAT GIVE PEOPLE MORE INFORMATION TO WEIGH IN THAT USE THIS
15 INFORMATION THAT THEY MAY NOT ALREADY KNOW. LET'S SEE. IN
16 TERMS OF THE CONCEPT A, VERSUS CONCEPT B, I'M A LITTLE BIT
17 CONFUSED BY THEM, TO BE HONEST. BUT I DO THINK THAT HAVING,
18 YOU KNOW, A PREDICTABILITY IN TERMS OF REVENUE IS REALLY
19 IMPORTANT TO HAVE CONSISTENT SERVICE IF A -- TRANSIT AGENCIES
20 DON'T KNOW THAT THEY'RE GOING HAVE THE MONEY NEXT YEAR OR THE
21 YEAR AFTER THAT, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE GOING TO BE MORE RESTRAINED
22 IN PROVIDING SERVICE THAT WILL BENEFIT PEOPLE AND WILL
23 INCREASE RIDERSHIP THAN IF THEY HAVE SOME PREDICTABILITY. I
24 THINK ADDING -- GIVEN THE UNCERTAINTY POTENTIAL FROM
25 ADDITIONAL FUNDING FROM THE STATE, AND EVEN THE FEDERAL LEVEL,



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 WHERE THERE IS A FEDERAL BILL FOR OPERATING FUNDING BEING
2 PROPOSED AS A MESSAGE BILL FOR POTENTIALLY 20 -- AT ANY RATE,
3 THERE IS POTENTIAL FOR THE STATE FEDERAL SO HAVING THAT
4 ABILITY AND ABILITY TO CHANGE BALANCE OF ADDITIONAL SOURCES OF
5 FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS GOOD. I THINK A LOT OF
6 THE QUESTIONS THAT ARE COMING FROM MEMBERS OF THIS COUNCIL
7 HAVE MORE -- HAVE A LOT TO DO WITH THE POLICIES AND THE
8 DECISION-MAKING AND OVERSIGHT PROCESS OF THE FUNDING. SO, AS
9 THINGS MOVE FORWARD AND GETS CLOSER TO AUTHORIZING
10 LEGISLATION, IT WOULD BE USEFUL TO HAVE SOME ELEMENTS OF THAT.
11 BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT IF PEOPLE ARE WANTING TO SAY,
12 WELL, I WANT THESE RESULTS, AND I WANT TO KNOW THAT THIS
13 MEASURE WILL ACTUALLY DELIVER THOSE RESULTS, HAVING PROVISIONS
14 THAT DO THAT ARE REALLY HELPFUL. LET'S SEE. AND, YOU KNOW,
15 CERTAINLY, IN TERMS OF -- YOU KNOW, TO SPEAK TO THAT QUESTION,
16 WHICH I KNOW ISN'T DIRECTLY ON THE AGENDA RIGHT NOW, BUT THE
17 MTC IS WORKING ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 CONNECTED NETWORK
18 PLAN AND THAT WILL HAVE, YOU KNOW, SOME, LIKE, MODELING AND
19 PLANNING FOR WHAT LEVELS OF SERVICE WILL DELIVER WHAT
20 LEVELLING OF OUTCOMES. AND I THINK THAT COULD BE HELPFUL IN
21 TERMS OF HAVING SPENDING PLANS TIED TO DELIVERING THAT
22 SERVICE. SO NOT JUST GIVE THE MONEY HERE, AND GIVE THE MONEY
23 THERE, BASED ON THIS, YOU KNOW, TOP DOWN GEOGRAPHY, BUT MORE
24 BASED ON, YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE THAT PEOPLE HAVE HIGH QUALITY
25 AND PREDICTABLE SERVICE. WENDI MENTIONED TRANSPORTATION DEMAND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MANAGEMENT, THAT IS A -- GENERALLY, A GOOD IDEA, AND I KNOW
2 THERE ARE IDEAS FLOATING AROUND IN TERMS OF HAVING
3 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT, YOU KNOW, POLICIES, OR EVEN
4 REVENUE COMPONENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THE MEASURE. SO I WANT TO
5 COMMENT I THINK THAT IS A GOOD IDEA. AND THEN LASTLY, LIKE, AS
6 WE HAVE SEEN IN SOME RECENT MEASURES HAVING A FAIR AMOUNT OF
7 FLEXIBILITY BUT WITH GOALS AND A DECISION MAKING PROCESS IS
8 EXTREMELY HEALTHY. YOU KNOW, THINGS CHANGE. WE SAW WITH COVID
9 THAT THINGS CHANGE A LOT, AND SO BEING BOXED INTO, WELL, WE
10 SAID WE WERE GOING TO INVEST IN X, Y, Z, 30 YEARS AGO SO WE
11 NEED TO DO IT IN, LIKE, ZOMBIE PROJECTS, IS, LIKE, SOMETHING
12 TO AVOID, SO HAVING THE FLEXIBILITY WHERE IT'S REALLY CLEAR
13 AND DECISIONS ARE GOING TO BE MADE SO PEOPLE FEEL IT'S FAIR IS
14 GOOD. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. PHILIPPE, DO YOU HAVE ANY
17 COMMENTS? VEDA?

18

19 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU. IT'S GOOD TO SEE YOU. BEEN SO LONG
20 SINCE I TURNED ON MY MIC. THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION AND I
21 THINK IT'S REALLY SMART FOR US TO FOCUS ON THE 2026 ELECTIONS.
22 IT'S A PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION MORE PEOPLE VOTE AND YOU GET
23 GREATER TURN OUT AND MORE CONVERSATION ABOUT THE BOND IN
24 GENERAL. SO AS I LOOK AT THE TWO PLANS, PLAN A, AND THE PLAN
25 B, IT ALMOST SEEMS AS IF CONCEPT A, AND CONCEPT B COULD BE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MUSHED TOGETHER IN SOME WAY. AND I THINK THERE IS GREATER
2 OPPORTUNITY FOR THAT. ESPECIALLY IN CONCEPT A WHERE IT SAYS
3 CLEAR PATHWAYS TOWARDS A MORE MULTI-MODAL INVESTMENT. WHICH
4 WOULD ALSO AGREE WITH THE MAIN STREETS. YOU KNOW, THE
5 DIRECTIVE, SO MORE PEOPLE WERE INTERESTED IN HAVING MAIN
6 STREETS. BUT IN CONCEPT B, IT, SORT OF, WORKS HAND-IN-HAND
7 WITH THE NON-TRANSIT RIDERS WILL SEE GREATER NEAR-TERM DIRECT
8 BENEFITS. SO I'M JUST WONDERING HOW WE CAN COMBINE THOSE TWO
9 SO WE CAN SEE DIRECT BENEFITS AND WE CAN SEE THE MAIN STREETS
10 TAKEN CARE OF, ESPECIALLY IF WE LOOK TO FUNDING TOWARDS
11 COMPLETE STREETS. AND I THINK COMPLETE STREETS, IF I'M NOT
12 WRONG, IS PDA BASED. IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THERE ARE INVESTMENTS IN COMPLETE STREETS IN
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, IF THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE REFERRING TO.

16

17 **VEDA FLOREZ:** AND TAKING SOME OF THE FUNDING FROM THIS BOND TO
18 WORK WITH THE COMPLETE STREETS. SO, I'M NOT SURE IF WE CAN ADD
19 MONEY TO THE COMPLETE STREETS, YOU KNOW, TO COMPLETE MORE
20 STREETS? OR IF WE CAN -- OR IF IT'S GOING TO BE DIRECTED IN
21 SOME OTHER WAY TO ANOTHER AREA. AND THEN, AFTER YOUR POP-UP
22 EVENTS, I REALLY THINK IT'S A GREAT IDEA TO HAVE THE PUBLIC
23 WEBINARS AND MAKE SURE THEY ARE IN MULTI-LANGUAGES, ESPECIALLY
24 THE TOP THREE HERE IN THE BAY AREA. YOU KNOW, AND YOU CAN LOOK
25 TO THOSE DEMOGRAPHIC, SPANISH, OF COURSE.



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** COULD YOU SAY THOSE AGAIN --

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** IT'S MY WATCH TALKING. IT HAS AN OPINION AS WELL.
5 IT SEEMS IF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS COULD BE IN COMPETITION WITH
6 WHAT THE RIDERS WANT BECAUSE IT'S WONDERFUL TO GUARANTEE A
7 CERTAIN AMOUNT OF FUNDING FOR MULTIPLE YEARS OR HOWEVER THE
8 MAJOR PUBLIC OR THOSE RIDERS WOULD BE MORE INTERESTED IN MAIN
9 STREETS, COMPLETE STREETS, SAFE BIKING LANES, YOU KNOW,
10 PROTECTED BIKE LANES, AND LOOKING IN THAT DIRECTION. SO THAT'S
11 SOMETHING THAT I WANTED TO SEE HOW -- AND TALK TO YOU ABOUT
12 HOW YOU WOULD BALANCE THOSE TWO OF WHAT THE RIDER WANTS, AND
13 WHAT THE OPERATOR WANTS, WHOSE VOICE IS MORE IMPORTANT TO
14 THESE CONVERSATIONS. AND THEN AS WE GET INTO THESE EQUITY
15 ISSUES, YOU KNOW, HOW CAN WE FOCUS THAT THE FUNDING IN THESE
16 PROGRAMS WILL DEFINITELY GO TO THE PDA PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
17 AREAS. SO THAT'S MY MAIN FOCUS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD?

20

21 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK, LIKE
22 THEY SAY, ALL POLITICS IS LOCAL. AND I THINK ALL NEEDS ARE
23 LOCAL. AND I THINK THAT THIS PUBLIC EXERCISE IS REALLY A GREAT
24 OPPORTUNITY, NOT ONLY TO GAUGE GENERAL SENTIMENT AND
25 PRIORITIES, BUT TO START LOOKING AT THE FIRESTONE GRAIN OF THE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 BAY AREA IN TERMS OF VERY LOCALIZED, AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE.
2 PRIORITIES, NEEDS, SENTIMENTS. AND THAT PROBABLY REQUIRES A
3 MUCH BROADER INPUT, NOT ONLY WITH THE PUBLIC MEETINGS, POP-
4 UPS, SURVEYS, POLLING, TALKING TO STAKEHOLDERS, YOU KNOW, A
5 MAJOR USER GROUP, WHETHER IT BE CAR, BIKE, TRANSIT, WHATEVER.
6 I THINK THIS SOUND LIKE A GREAT OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT THAT
7 BAY AREA AND START PICKING, KIND OF A CROSS SECTION OF VERY
8 SMALL PARTS OF THE BAY AREA AS POSSIBLE. BECAUSE, OBVIOUSLY,
9 IF YOU LIVE IN A CITY, LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, WITH 24, 25%
10 TRANSIT MODAL SHARE VERSUS A FARTHER REACH SUBURB, WHICH HAS
11 5% MODAL SHARE, YOUR PERCEPTION IS VERY DIFFERENT. AND, SO
12 WHEN YOU LOOK AT A GENERAL PRIORITY, THE THINGS HAVE RISED TO
13 THE TOP, LIKE MAIN STREET, ARE THINGS THAT GENERALLY APPLY
14 ACROSS THOSE WIDE INTERESTS. SO, I THINK IT WOULD BE GREAT IF
15 YOU CAN START DOING THAT, LOOKING AT THIS EXERCISE, PUBLIC
16 OUTREACH, TO NOT ONLY GAIN A SENTIMENT OF HOW A REGIONAL
17 MEASURE MIGHT FAIR, AND WHAT PEOPLE'S PRIORITIES AND NEEDS
18 ARE, BUT START LOOKING AT KIND OF THE REVERSE AND HOW YOU USE
19 THE DATA TO SHAPE THE PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS THAT HELP EACH
20 INDIVIDUAL FOCUS AREA. THANK YOU.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY, DO YOU HAVE COMMENTS?

23

24 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY COMMEND IS I DO HAVE CONCERNS WITH WHAT VEDA
25 EXPRESSED EARLIER, REGARDING A MELDING OF THESE TWO CONCEPTS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 TO THE DEGREE POSSIBLE. THINGS ARE VERY LOCAL IN EACH
2 COMMUNITY, AND THE NEEDS ARE DIFFERENT IN EACH COMMUNITY.
3 WHEREAS THE MAINSTREAM, EVERYBODY HAS A MAINSTREAM. EVERYBODY
4 HAS THE NEED TO UTILIZE MAJOR TRANSPORTATION. AND,
5 PARTICULARLY, THE HIGHWAY SYSTEMS. ALTHOUGH WE WOULD LIKE TO
6 SEE THAT REDUCED TO SOME DEGREE, THERE NEEDS TO BE CONNECTION
7 AND AN APPROACH THAT IS FLEXIBLE ENOUGH TO ADJUST TO EACH OF
8 THOSE REQUIREMENTS AND PRIORITIES, DEPEND BOTH ON THE
9 COMMUNITY AND ALSO THE MAJORITY OF TRANSIT RIDERS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY, DO YOU HAVE COMMENTS?
12 THANK YOU. GERRY?

13

14 **GERRY GLASER:** OF COURSE. LET ME START, IN THE FIRST PLACE,
15 VEDA BROUGHT IT UP AND I HAD IT AT THE TOP OF MY LIST, CONCEPT
16 A VERSUS CONCEPT B, AND THE POINT ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATORS WANT
17 TO KNOW WHAT DO I HAVE. SO, I THINK MERGING THE TWO WOULD
18 ACTUALLY BE LIKE THIS: THREE YEARS OF B, A YEAR OF A, THREE
19 YEARS OF B, A YEAR OF A, THREE YEARS OF B. THE BUDGETS YOU SAY
20 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE IN THIS DIRECTION, TELL AHEAD OF TIME
21 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE IN THIS DIRECTION AND GO ABOUT THAT, IN
22 PART, ONE OF MY CONCERNS HAS BEEN THIS, MAKING OUR TRANSIT
23 ECONOMICAL, AS A BUSINESS, IT SUCKS. IS THAT A TECHNICAL WORD?
24 WHEN I DID A SHORT ANALYSIS IN THE COUNTY THAT I LIVE IN, ONE
25 OF THE BUS TRANSIT DISTRICTS PER RIDE, PER PASSENGER, COST \$33



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 TO RIDE. PARATRANSIT COSTS \$54 TO RIDE. WE CHARGE A DOLLAR 50.
2 SO, WE'RE FUNDING ALL OF THIS. IT'S THAT THE OPERATION ITSELF,
3 AND GOING BACK TO GUIDING PRINCIPLES IN THIS POINT AS WELL, IF
4 YOU WANT TO SAY TO SOMEBODY I'M GOING TO CHANGE HOW I DO
5 THINGS AND HOW I'M GOING TO START GETTING TO THAT POINT THAT'S
6 AFFORDABLE TRANSIT TO DO WITH THE COST WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO
7 PAY, AND AT THE AFFORDABLE LEVEL WE'RE SUBSIDIZING ALL ALMOST
8 ALL OF OUR TRANSIT AND WE SHOULD BY THE WAY, BUT AT THE LEVEL
9 WHAT WE'RE DOING IT'S A LITTLE OVER THE TOP. GUIDING
10 PRINCIPLES, I THOUGHT THAT WAS A GREAT IDEA BUT NOW I FORGOT -
11 - I THINK ADINA SAID IT, HAVING A NUMBER, EXPLAINING WHAT THE
12 DIFFERENCE WILL BE IS WHAT A VOTER WOULD LOOK AT. HEY, BY THE
13 WAY, YOU KNOW, IN THE COUNTY OF SONOMA, THE SHORTEST HEADWAY
14 IS 30 MINUTES OF ANY TRANSIT DISTRICT THAT OPERATES IN THE
15 COUNTY OF SONOMA. ALL RIGHT. CAN I DESCRIBE TO YOU THEN WE'RE
16 GOING TO WORK ON THIS AND WE'RE FUNDING THIS SO WE CAN GET THE
17 HEADWAY TO BE TEN MINUTES THAT MIGHT MEAN SOMETHING TO
18 SOMEBODY THAT CAN ACTUALLY USE THE TRANSIT. THE OTHER PART OF
19 THIS, AND I THINK IT WAS ANNE OLIVIA THAT SAID THIS, SHE SAID
20 I HAVE TOO MUCH MONEY. TRANSIT, FOR ME, SHOULD BE AVAILABLE TO
21 EVERYBODY, AND WE WANT EVERYBODY TO VOTE FOR IT. THERE ARE
22 LARGE BODIES, PEOPLE FROM THE BAY AREA, WHO RELY ON TRANSIT.
23 THEY DON'T HAVE AN OPTION. I HAVE AN OPTION. I HAVE LOTS OF
24 OPTIONS. BUT WHEN WE GO ASK FOR MONEY, MOST OF THE PEOPLE
25 WE'RE GOING TO ASK FOR MONEY FROM ARE THE ONES WHO HAVE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 OPTIONS. SO WE HAVE TO DESCRIBE A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT SAYS,
2 HEY, I WANT TO DO THAT INSTEAD. THAT'S THE KEY THING THAT WE
3 WANT TO GET ACROSS AS WE'RE SELLING THE IDEA. SO AS WE'RE
4 ASKING PEOPLE THE QUESTIONS OF WHAT DO YOU WANT OUT OF OUR
5 SYSTEM, WE'RE ON TO FOLKS TO FIND OUT WHAT THE KEY PORTION OF
6 THAT IS. SO THAT WE CAN GET THOSE RIDERS WHO HAVE OPTIONS AND
7 SAY, DO YOU REALLY WANT TO DO THIS INSTEAD? BY WAY, IF THEY
8 HADN'T INCREASED THE WIDTH OF HIGHWAY 101 WE PROBABLY WOULD
9 HAVE HAD A LOT MORE TRANSIT RIDERS IN SONOMA AND MARIN COUNTY
10 BECAUSE THE TRAIN GOES 80 MILES AN HOUR AND I WAS DOING TWO
11 MILES AN HOUR THE OTHER DAY GOING DOWN HIGHWAY 101 EVEN WITH
12 IT EXPANDED. I HAVE A QUESTION IN A PARTED OF THE WRITE UP,
13 TALKED ABOUT CARPOOL EXPRESS, I THINK I KNOW WHAT THAT MEANS,
14 AND I THINK I WOULD BE IN FAVOR OF. AS FAR AS STAKEHOLDER, ONE
15 STAKEHOLDER, READING THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PLAN THAT
16 SONOMA COUNTY PROBABLY IS NOT OPERATING AGAINST ONE OF THE
17 THINGS THAT STOPS US FROM MERGING OUR DIFFERENT TRANSIT GROUPS
18 IS THE UNIONS THAT REPRESENT THE TRANSIT WORKERS AND I DIDN'T
19 SEE IN ANY PLACE IN HERE FOR US TO TALK TO AND FIND OUT HEY
20 ARE YOU DOING WHAT YOU THINK YOU SHOULD BE DOING BECAUSE
21 THEY'RE TOUCHING IT EVERY DAY. AND THEY TALKED ABOUT DIFFERENT
22 TRANSIT MODES. AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO -- WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
23 DIFFERENT TRANSIT MODES, ARE WE JUST TALKING ABOUT SCOOTERS
24 AND BIKES? OR WE HAVE OTHER MODES THAT ARE REVOLUTIONARY THAT
25 WE'RE THINKING ABOUT? AS SOMEBODY VOTING, I WOULD LIKE TO



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT WOULD BE. AND THE REST OF MY QUESTIONS
2 HAVE TO DO WITH FUNDING AND HOW WE RAISE FUNDS. SO I'LL WAIT
3 UNTIL LATER ON THAT. BUT, THANKS. YOU GAVE ME A LOT TO THINK
4 ABOUT.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ZELLY?

7

8 **ZELLY LODIN:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK ON THIS. IT'S GREAT. AS
9 SOMEONE WHO IS BASED IN SAN FRANCISCO, MY FAMILY IS BASED IN
10 EAST BAY, JUST LOOKING AT CONCEPT A HAS KIND OF, AGAIN, ON A
11 MICROCOSM LEVEL IT EASES MY INSECURITY, LIKE, IS MUNI GOING TO
12 BE RUNNING, IS BART GOING TO BE RUNNING. MY MOM IS RETIRED SHE
13 IS A WORKING CLASS PERSON DOESN'T HAVE HER DRIVER'S LICENSE,
14 SHE WORKS IN THE EAST BAY AND RELIES ON COUNTY CONNECTION TO
15 BART TO MUNI TO SIMI. RIGHT? SO THE FACT THAT -- AS SOMEONE
16 BORN AND RAISED HERE MY BIGGEST FEAR IS THAT WE WOULD LOSE
17 PUBLIC TRANSIT AND WOULD AFFECT ME PERSONALLY.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:**

20

21 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION I AGREE
22 WITH RANDI KINMAN, JUST EXCELLENT JOB WELL DONE THE POP-UP
23 THAT I GOT TO ATTEND IN SAN JOSE, I WANTED TO MAKE A COMMENT
24 RELATING TO WANTING TO SEE MORE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT BECAUSE
25 THERE WAS A \$5 COST ASSOCIATED TO ENTERING THAT SPACE, AND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 JUST REALLY BEING ABLE TO THINK THROUGH HOW WE CAN DO OUR DO
2 DILIGENCE IN OUTREACHING TO COMMUNITIES. PARTNERING WITH CBOS
3 IN COUNTIES AND CITIES MAKING SURE THE INFORMATION IS GETTING
4 ACROSS TO RESIDENTS. AND THE TO THAT POINT, I AGREE WITH ADINA
5 AND GERRY TALKING ABOUT THE POTENTIAL OF EDUCATING FOLKS
6 BEFORE MAKING THE ASK. BECAUSE ALL -- SAY, FOR EXAMPLE, I WAS
7 IN A NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION MEETING WHERE THE CONCERN WAS
8 SPEEDING ON THE STREETS. AND THE NEIGHBORS ACTUALLY VOTED TO
9 HAVE LAW-ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS AT TWO STOP SIGNS TO ENFORCE THE
10 SPEEDING REGULATIONS THROUGH TICKETING AND CITATIONS, WHICH IS
11 A FINANCIAL BURDEN ON COMMUNITY MEMBERS, AND I WONDER IF
12 COMMUNITY MEMBERS REALIZE THE POWER OF STREET DESIGN IN
13 CURBING SPEEDING, COULD THAT HAVE BEEN A DIFFERENT SOLUTION
14 THAT THEY WERE EXPLORING. AND, SO, I THINK THERE IS A HUGE
15 DISCONNECT BETWEEN COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND THE WAY THAT
16 TRANSPORTATION, WHETHER IT'S OUR COMPLETE STREETS OR PUBLIC
17 TRANSPORTATION HEADWAYS, WE'RE NOT MAKING THAT CONNECTION
18 BETWEEN HOW IT IMPACTS US IN OUR DAILY LIVES AND OUR CHOICES
19 TO CHOOSE TRANSIT OR NOT. SO, I THINK THAT DEFINITELY MAKING
20 SURE THAT WE ARE DOING EDUCATION TO THE COMMUNITY AND NOT JUST
21 -- YEAH, NOT JUST SOLICITING THE INFORMATION WITHOUT PROVIDING
22 ENOUGH CONTEXT ABOUT HOW IT'S GOING TO IMPACT THEIR DAILY
23 LIVES NOW AND WHAT IT MIGHT LOOK LIKE IN THE FUTURE, OF A
24 BETTER FUTURE. THANK YOU.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO -- IF ANY EITHER OF OUR
2 OFFSITE COUNCIL MEMBERS WANT TO SPEAK, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHRIS HAS HER HAND RAISED.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHRIS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

9

10 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE -- THANK YOU. SO, A
11 COUPLE OF THOUGHTS. I COULDN'T AGREE MORE WITH SOMEBODY
12 COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE AROUND THE TABLE, FANTASTIC
13 COMMENTS, ONE AND ALL. I WOULD LIKE TO STRONGLY, STRONGLY
14 SUGGEST THAT IN YOUR OUTREACH EFFORTS, AS YOU DO SO, THAT YOU
15 NOT ONLY RELY ON WRITTEN CONTENT, WHICH CAN BE AT TIMES VERY
16 INTENSE FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE, MAKING SURE THAT WHATEVER YOU'RE
17 PUTTING OUT IN PRINT IS UNDERSTANDABLE AND IN PLAIN LANGUAGE,
18 LOOKING AT MAYBE FIFTH OR SIXTH GRADE LEVEL READING LEVEL, TO
19 START OUT WITH. THE OTHER THING THAT I WOULD STRONGLY SUGGEST
20 AS WE GO, IS THAT THERE ARE FOLKS THAT MAY NOT BE ABLE TO
21 QUITE GRASP CONCEPTS. IT'S READING. SOME PEOPLE ARE VERY
22 VISUAL. SO, PROVIDING FOLKS WITH ALTERNATIVE PICTORIAL VIEWS
23 OF WHAT YOU ARE TRYING TO GET ACROSS. SO, LIKE IT'S BEEN SAID,
24 FOLKS KNOW THAT THEY NEED TRANSPORTATION, AND THEY APPRECIATE
25 HAVING THE BUSES. BUT THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND -- THEY MAY, WELL,



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 I CAN'T SAY EVERYBODY, BUT THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT MAY
2 NOT UNDERSTAND WHAT GOES ON BEHIND THE DRIVER'S SEAT, IF YOU
3 WILL. AND HOW MUCH IT COSTS TO GET ONE SINGLE BUS ON THE ROAD,
4 OR ONE PARATRANSIT VEHICLE ON THE ROAD. AND HOW CHANGES IN HOW
5 YOU SUBSIDIZE, HOW YOU SUPPORT, HOW YOU MONETIZE, ALL OF IT,
6 HOW THIS AFFECTS THEIR ABILITY TO GET AROUND. I WOULD REALLY
7 STRONGLY SUGGEST, AS YOU CONSIDER COMBINING A AND B, WHICH I
8 AGREE, WOULD BE A GREAT THING TO DO. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW, THERE
9 IS A LOT TO TAKE IN. YOU ALL -- YOU ALSO CONSIDER DRAWING UP
10 PICTORIAL IDEAS OF WHAT THIS REALLY NEEDS. A GOES INTO B, B
11 GOES INTO C, AND C GOES INTO D IN ORDER TO HAVE A COMPLETE
12 TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS GOOD FOR NOW AND IN THE FUTURE.
13 BECAUSE, AGAIN, WITHOUT IT, WE'RE IN DEEP SOUP. THANK YOU SO
14 MUCH.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I THINK THAT WAS A LOT OF
17 INPUT. I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE WE HAVE ANOTHER WHOLE ITEM. WE
18 STILL HAVE TO FINISH THIS ITEM. SO, WE NEED TO SPEED THINGS UP
19 AND BE CONCISE. I'M NOT PUSHING ANYBODY. BUT WITH THAT WE'RE
20 GOING TO GO INTO -- AND I ALSO SKIPPED -- EXCUSE ME?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE'RE NOT DONE WITH THE ITEM YET.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** OH I SEE. I FORGOT ABOUT PART B.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. SO, I, ALSO,
4 HAVE BYPASSED THE GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT SO WE'LL COME BACK TO
5 THAT AFTER THE TWO MAIN ITEMS ARE DONE, BUT WE NEED TO GO TO
6 REBECCA WITH HER PRESENTATION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR ALL THOSE GREAT QUESTIONS
9 AND COMMENTS. REALLY APPRECIATE IT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY.
10 SO, NOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO THE DISCUSSION OF POTENTIAL
11 REVENUE SOURCES TO PAY FOR ALL THIS GOOD STUFF. WE HAVE, YOU
12 KNOW, DEFINITELY HEARD THE VOTERS AND KEY STAKEHOLDERS
13 CONCERNED ABOUT LIMITING THE DISCUSSION AS REVENUE OPTIONS TO
14 A SALES TAX WHICH IS WHAT HAD BEEN CONSIDERED A FEW YEARS AGO.
15 AND SO WE HIRED A CONSULTANT, WHO, AGAIN, IS ON THE LINE TO
16 HELP US THINK THROUGH AND CRUNCH THE NUMBERS ON WHAT ARE SOME
17 DIFFERENT OPTIONS TO RAISE A BILLION DOLLARS A YEAR. THAT IS
18 NOT THE TARGET AMOUNT THAT WE HAVE SETTLED ON. WE NEED TO HAVE
19 A LOT MORE CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT, SEE WHAT THE POLLING SAYS
20 AT THESE RATES, BUT JUST TO HAVE APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON,
21 THAT WAS THE TARGET REVENUE, AND THEN AS YOU WILL SEE, THAT
22 LEADS TO DIFFERENT RATES, OF COURSE, DEPENDING ON THE TAX
23 MEASURE. SOME PRELIMINARY CRITERIA THAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT
24 INCLUDE REVENUE VOLATILITY. IDEALLY WE HAVE SOMETHING THAT IS
25 STABLE, ESPECIALLY SINCE WE WANT TO USE SOME OF THESE FUNDS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. EQUITY IMPACTS OF THE TAX, ITSELF.
2 ECONOMIC IMPACTS. THE ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN OF COLLECTING THE
3 REVENUE SOURCE, AND THEN WHAT ARE POTENTIAL COBENEFITS OR
4 DISBENEFITS, MEANING DOES THE TAX CHANGE BEHAVIOR IN ANY WAY
5 THAT IS BENEFICIAL TO OUR OVERALL REGIONAL GOALS, OR HARMFUL.
6 BUT, ULTIMATELY PRACTICAL CONSIDERATIONS ARE GOING TO BE THE
7 KEY DRIVER OF WHAT WE'RE ULTIMATELY AUTHORIZED TO DO AND PUT
8 TO THE VOTERS. WE NEED TO GET LEGISLATIVE AUTHORIZATION ON
9 THIS, AND THEN WE ALSO NEED TO, AGAIN, SEEK VOTER APPROVAL.
10 ONE PERSONALITY POINT TO KEEP IN MIND, WHICH IS THE LAST
11 BULLET THERE IS WITH THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR THE BAY
12 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, WE WERE ABLE TO GET PERMISSION
13 TO PUT A RANGE OF REVENUE OPTIONS TO -- ON THE BALLOT. WITH
14 THE POTENTIAL TO DO SEQUENTIAL BALLOT MEASURES. AND SO WE
15 DON'T NECESSARILY NEED TO IDENTIFY ONE SOURCE, POTENTIALLY WE
16 COULD PERSUADE THE LEGISLATURE THAT WE WANT TO HAVE A FEW
17 DIFFERENT TOOLS IN THE TOOLKIT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS
18 IS JUST A SUMMARY SLIDE. YOU CAN SEE WE LOOKED AT AN INCOME
19 TAX. PAYROLL TAX, A CORPORATE HEAD TAX, A PARCEL TAX, AND,
20 ALSO, A ROAD USAGE CHARGE, AND THIS IS JUST A SUMMARY OF THE
21 TAX RATE ASSOCIATED WITH RAISING A BILLION DOLLARS. NEXT
22 SLIDE. SO, THE SALES TAX, YOU COULD CALL IT KIND OF THE TRIED
23 AND TRUE METHOD OF SUPPLEMENTING STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS HERE
24 IN CALIFORNIA FOR TRANSPORTATION. WE HAVE A TRANSPORTATION
25 SALES TAX IN EVERY COUNTY IN THE BAY AREA, EXCEPT FOR SOLANO



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 COUNTY, AND THAT'S NOT FOR LACK OF TRYING. YOU CAN SEE THAT
2 THE SHADED ROWS THERE, ALAMEDA COUNTY AND SAN MATEO COUNTY
3 EXCEED WHAT'S KNOWN AS THE CAP FOR A SALES TAX MEASURE IN
4 CALIFORNIA. THE UNIFORM RATE -- SO, NO COUNTY IN CALIFORNIA
5 HAS LESS THAN 7.25%, AND THEN THE LEGISLATURE HAS AUTHORIZED
6 LOCALS TO GO UP TO 2% ABOVE THAT. IN THE CASE OF ALAMEDA AND
7 SAN MATEO COUNTY THEY HAD TO GET LEGISLATURE SPECIAL
8 PERMISSION TO GO ABOVE THAT YET AGAIN. CLEARLY IF WE WERE TO
9 PURSUE ANOTHER SALES TAX WE WOULD HAVE TO GET EXCEPTION, AND I
10 THINK JUST NOTEWORTHY ALAMEDA COUNTY IS OVER 10% NOW THAT'S
11 VERY HIGH EVERY PURCHASE THAT'S SUBJECT TO SALES TAX OF OVER
12 10%. HOW DOES THAT AFFECT BEHAVIOR? WHERE YOU BUY THINGS? AT A
13 CERTAIN POINT, MAYBE YOU WANT TO BUY YOUR CAR IN NAPA INSTEAD
14 OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. [LAUGHTER] SO, LET'S SEE WHAT ELSE TO SAY
15 HERE. THE PROS ARE EASIER TO ADMINISTER, RELATIVELY LOW TAX
16 RATE. SO THAT'S MORE OF A, LIKE, POLITICAL CONSIDERATION,
17 ASKING VOTERS DO YOU SUPPORT A HALF CENT SALES TAX COMPARED TO
18 A TAX THAT MIGHT BE HUNDREDS OF DOLLARS A YEAR, JUST, SORT OF,
19 THE TERMINOLOGY MAKES IT, YOU KNOW, AN EASIER CAMPAIGN TO WIN.
20 AND THEN, THE CONS WOULD BE THE EQUITY IMPACT, YOU KNOW, ON
21 ALL CONSUMERS, WOULD PAY THIS, REGARDLESS OF THEIR HOUSEHOLD
22 INCOME, SAME RATE. SO, THAT'S KIND OF THE DEFINITION OF A
23 REGRESSIVE TAX IS THAT, REGARDLESS OF, YOU KNOW, YOUR ABILITY
24 TO PAY, YOU'RE PAYING THE SAME THING. IMPACT ON RETAIL SALES,
25 AND JUST INCREASED RELIANCE UPON A SINGLE REVENUE SOURCE. SO



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 WHEN WE HIT A RECESSION, HAVING ANOTHER SALES TAX THAT'S, YOU
2 KNOW, VERY CRITICAL TO THE TRANSPORTATION SECTOR, YOU'RE NOT
3 INCREASING ANY KIND OF SENSE OF BALANCE AND DIVERSIFICATION.
4 WE WOULD REALLY BE DOUBLING DOWN ON THAT ONE SOURCE. NEXT
5 SLIDE. SO THIS IS ONE OF THE MORE UNUSUAL TAXES THAT WE WANTED
6 TO TAKE A LOOK AT, PARTLY, YOU KNOW, THINKING OF SOMETHING
7 THAT PERHAPS IS OPPOSITE OF REGRESSIVE IS LOOKING AT INCOME
8 TAX. I WOULD NOTE THAT FOR SIMPLICITY'S SAKE THE CONSULTANT
9 IDENTIFIED A FLAT PERCENTAGE, WHICH IS NOT NECESSARILY
10 CONSIDERED PROGRESSIVE, BUT IT IS A PERCENTAGE BASIS. SO OF
11 COURSE THE AMOUNT THAT YOU WOULD PAY WOULD DEPEND ON YOUR
12 INCOME. CALIFORNIA DOES HAVE A VERY PROGRESSIVE GRADUATED
13 INCOME TAX STRUCTURE SO THE RATE ITSELF IS GOING UP, THE
14 HIGHER YOUR HOUSEHOLD INCOME, AND SO WE COULD LOOK AT
15 SOMETHING LIKE THAT. THERE ARE INCOME TAXES IN OTHER STATES
16 THAT ARE IMPOSED AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. NEW YORK CITY IS PROBABLY
17 THE MOST SIGNIFICANT EXAMPLE. THEY HAVE AN INCOME TAX
18 SURCHARGE OF ABOUT 3%. IT DOES VARY BASED ON HOUSEHOLD INCOME.
19 SOME OF THE PROS HERE WOULD BE THAT IT IS A VERY LOW RATE IN
20 TERMS OF, AGAIN, YOU KNOW, HOW DOES THAT SOUND TO VOTERS,
21 0.17% WHEN YOU CONSIDER WHAT PEOPLE ARE TYPICALLY PAYING IN
22 THERE INCOME TAX, YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT A VERY SIGNIFICANT
23 INCREASE. AND IT CERTAINLY WOULD DIVERSIFY THE REVENUE
24 PORTFOLIO. I THINK ON THE CON SIDE, YOU KNOW, THIS WOULD
25 REALLY BE BREAKING NEW GROUND. THERE WOULD POTENTIAL BE SOME



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MAJOR CONCERNS LEGISLATIVELY IN SACRAMENTO TO OPENING THAT
2 DOOR TO LOCAL INCOME TAXES. SO BY NO MEANS DO WE CONSIDER THIS
3 AN EASY SELL IN SACRAMENTO. PAYROLL TAX IS ANOTHER IDEA THAT
4 IS DONE IN A NUMBER OF OTHER STATES AND SPECIFICALLY FOR
5 TRANSPORTATION. A PAYROLL TAX, AS YOU THINK YOU ALL KNOW, IS
6 IMPOSED THROUGH THE EMPLOYER, SO IT SHOWS UP ON YOUR PAY STUB,
7 TYPICALLY IT'S SHARED BETWEEN THE EMPLOYER WHO PAYS IT AND THE
8 EMPLOYEE. THAT'S HOW IT WORKS WITH SOCIAL SECURITY AND A
9 NUMBER OF OTHER PAYROLL TAXES. I FORGOT TO MENTION THIS IN
10 CONTEXT OF INCOME TAX, BUT BOTH INCOME TAX AND PAYROLL TAX
11 COULD PIGGYBACK UPON THE STATE TAX COLLECTION SYSTEM SO
12 ADMINISTRATIVELY WOULD BE SOMETHING NEW THAT WE WOULD DEVELOP
13 TO HAVING A REGIONAL TAX AND IN THEORY WOULD PICKY BACK ON
14 THAT EXISTING TAX AND HAVE THE LAYER ON THE REGIONAL TAX.
15 PROCESS HERE WOULD BE DIVERSIFYING REVENUE MIX BY TAXING
16 BUSINESSES TO SUPPORT THE REGION'S TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
17 AVOIDING FURTHER DIRECT TAX ON CONSUMERS OF COURSE IF IT WERE
18 SHARED TAX YOU WOULD BE TAXING EMPLOYEES, BUT THERE'S
19 SOMETHING VERY DIFFERENT AND COMPELLING TO MAKE THE CASE TO
20 VOTERS THE PRIVATE SECTOR IS GOING TO BE CONTRIBUTING AS WELL.
21 ON THE CON SIDE, COULD HURT JOB GROWTH AND THE BUSINESS
22 CLIMATE EXACERBATING SYSTEMS LEAVING THE REGION AND THERE'S NO
23 PRECEDENT FOR LOCAL REGIONAL PAYROLL TAX IN CALIFORNIA, AGAIN
24 MAKING IT POLITICALLY CHALLENGING THE THIRD BULLET THERE NOTES
25 THE VARIANT THIS COULD BE SOME KIND OF TRANSPORTATION DEMAND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MANAGEMENT OR TDM MANDATE SOMETHING THAT WAS TALKED ABOUT A
2 FEW YEARS AGO IN CONTEXT OF FASTER LEGISLATION WHERE INSTEAD
3 OF A TAX IT COULD REQUIRE THE BAY AREA EMPLOYERS OF A CERTAIN
4 SIZE PURCHASE REGIONAL TRANSIT PASS FOR THEIR EMPLOYEES, WHEN
5 YOU TALK TO PRIVATE SECTOR THEY'RE A BIT MORE ENTHUSIASTIC
6 ABOUT HAVING TO PUT SOME KIND OF OUTLAY SOME KIND OF FINANCIAL
7 COST THAT WOULD BENEFIT THEIR WORKFORCE DIRECTLY THAT COULD BE
8 A WAY TO PROVIDE MORE RESOURCES AND INCENTIVE FOR BAY AREA
9 WORKERS TO USE TRANSIT WHILE MAKING IT MORE PALATABLE WITH THE
10 PRIVATE SECTOR. NEXT SLIDE. ANOTHER CONCEPT WE LOOK AT IS
11 CORPORATE HEAD TAX, TAX PER EMPLOYEE. THERE IS NO PRECEDENT
12 FOR THIS WITHIN CALIFORNIA THAT WE COULD PIGGYBACK ON SO THIS
13 WOULD HAVE HIGH ADMINISTRATIVE COST TO SET UP MECHANISM
14 REGULARLY HAVING REPORTING OF HOW MANY EMPLOYEES YOU HAVE
15 REQUIRING THAT EVERY BUSINESS SUBMIT SUCH TAX, AND SO THAT IS
16 DEFINITELY ONE SIGNIFICANT CON TO THIS, WOULD HAVE SIMILAR
17 NEGATIVE BUSINESS IMPACTS JOB GROWTH IMPACTS AND LIKELY BE
18 OPPOSED BY MANY IN THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY MAKING IT
19 POLITICALLY CHALLENGING BUT IT WOULD DIVERSIFY THE REVENUE MIX
20 AND AGAIN AVOID FURTHER DIRECT TAXES ON CONSUMERS. NEXT SLIDE.
21 ANOTHER OPTION THAT WAS EXPLORED IS A PARCEL TAX. THIS WOULD
22 BE BASED ON ALL PROPERTY OWNED IN THE REGION BOTH RESIDENTIAL
23 AND COMMERCIAL. YOU CAN SEE THE TAX RATE HERE JUST LOOKING AT
24 A FLAT TAX WOULD BE 467 PER PARCEL WHICH IS QUITE HIGH. IT IS
25 POSSIBLE TO DO A PARCEL TAX ON A PER SQUARE FOOT BASIS WHICH



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 COULD SUBSTANTIALLY REDUCE THE TAX PAID BY INDIVIDUAL
2 RESIDENTS AND HOMEOWNERS. HOWEVER, WE WERE NOT ABLE TO ANALYZE
3 THAT GIVEN JUST DATA LIMITATIONS. WE'RE EXAMINING THAT
4 FURTHER. DEFINITELY ONE OF THE PROS FOR A PARCEL TAX WOULD BE
5 A STABLE REVENUE SOURCE. NOT BASED ON ASSESSED VALUE, JUST
6 BASED ON THE FACT THAT THE PARCEL EXISTS. AND YOU KNOW, FROM A
7 REGRESSIVITY STANDPOINT, IT WOULD BE MORE PROGRESSIVE, ONLY
8 THOSE WHO OWN PROPERTY WOULD BE PAYING, THOUGH IT'S DIFFICULT
9 TO NOT HAVE THAT COST PASSED ON TO RENTERS. SO THERE LIKELY
10 WOULD BE SOME IMPACT THERE. I THINK THE CONS HERE REALLY ARE
11 THE TAX RATE MAKES IT SEEM QUITE DIFFICULT, AND YOU LIKELY
12 COULD GENERATE SOME OPPOSITION FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND
13 SCHOOL DISTRICTS WHO ARE FREQUENT USERS OF PARCEL TAXES. AND
14 IT ALSO RAISES CONCERN THAT IT WOULD BE DOUBLING DOWN ON
15 RELIANCE OF PROPERTY OWNERS GIVEN THAT WE'RE PROPOSING AN AD
16 VALOREM PROPERTY TAX RATE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEXT
17 NOVEMBER. NEXT SLIDE. AND LASTLY, WE WANTED TO SEE WHAT WOULD
18 ERODE USAGE CHARGE LOOK LIKE IN THE BAY AREA. THIS IS
19 SOMETHING THAT I THINK YOU KNOW THE STATE IS EXAMINING AT A
20 CERTAIN POINT, RIGHT, THE GAS TAX IS NOT GOING TO BE, YOU
21 KNOW, GENERATING THE SAME AMOUNT OF REVENUE AS IT HAS BEEN,
22 AND IT IS A VERY IMPORTANT PART OF THE STATE'S TRANSPORTATION
23 SYSTEM. SO, THE STATE IS LOOKING AT MOVING TO A VMT, OR
24 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED TAX TO REPLACE THE GAS TAX. THE SO, WE
25 WANTED TO SEE WHAT COULD A REGIONAL, KIND OF SUPPLEMENTARY



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 ROAD USAGE CHARGE LOOK LIKE, TO GENERATE ABOUT A BILLION
2 DOLLARS, AND IT WOULD BE ABOUT ONE AND A HALF CENTS PER MILE.
3 SOME BENEFITS HERE, OR PROS AGAIN WOULD BE A VERY STABLE
4 FINISHING SOURCE. MOST LIKELY, YOU KNOW, WHILE WE WOULD LIKE
5 TO SEE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED DROP A LOT, IT'S CERTAINLY NOT
6 GOING TO DROP PRECIPITOUSLY, ESPECIALLY IF THE REGION DOES
7 CONTINUE TO GROW, POPULATION WISE. SO, IT WOULD BE STABLE, IT
8 HAS A STRONG NEXUS TO OUR GOALS OF REDUCING VEHICLE MILES
9 TRAVELED. A COMMON ECONOMIC PRINCIPLE IS YOU SHOULD TAX THE
10 THINGS YOU DON'T LIKE, RIGHT, YOU CAN SEE THAT WITH HOW MUCH
11 WE TAX CIGARETTES, FOR EXAMPLE, RATHER THAN TAXING THINGS THAT
12 YOU WANT. IT'S GOOD FOR THAT STANDPOINT. ADMINISTRATIVE
13 CHALLENGES ARE SIGNIFICANT AND IT ALSO HAS A MISMATCH WITH THE
14 TYPING NEEDS. RIGHT? WE HAVE SOME URGENCY TO GENERATE NEW
15 REVENUE TO ADDRESS THE TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS OTHER AND
16 NEEDS. IT'S UNLIKELY WE WOULD BE ABLE TO STAND UP A ROAD USAGE
17 CHARGE WITHIN A YEAR OR TWO, BUT THIS MAY BE SOMETHING WE WANT
18 TO GET IN THAT TOOLKIT FROM THE LEGISLATURE SO THAT AFTER THE
19 STATE DEVELOPS ONE WE COULD BE AUTHORIZED TO HAVE A REGIONAL
20 ONE. SO, THAT IS THE SUMMARY. MAYBE IF WE COULD BACK UP TO THE
21 TABLE WITH ALL OF THE REVENUE OPTIONS? KEEP GOING. KEEP GOING.
22 KEEP GOING. ONE MORE. SO, YEAH, JUST TO KIND OF ILLUSTRATE THE
23 DIFFERENT RATES. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK I SPENT A LOT OF TIME
24 ON THAT. AGAIN, YOU CAN SEE THAT SOME OF THE LOWEST RATES,
25 PERCENTAGE WISE, WOULD BE THE INCOME TAX, PAYROLL TAX, AND THE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 ROAD USAGE CHARGE, WHEREAS THE HEAD TAX AND THE PARCEL TAX,
2 YOU KNOW, ARE, SORT OF, THE HIGH DOLLAR ITEM. THANK YOU FOR
3 GOING BACK TO THAT SUMMARY SLIDE. IF YOU COULD ADVANCE THE
4 SLIDES NOW? KEEP GOING, KEEP GOING. KEEP GOING. KEEP GOING.
5 GREAT. SO, WHAT'S NEXT IS FURTHER ANALYSIS OF THESE OPTIONS
6 AND OUTCOMES BASED ON GOOD QUESTIONS WE'RE GETTING FROM THE
7 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, CONTINUED STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AS
8 MENTIONED WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING POLLING, GOING TO BE
9 BRIEFING THE BAY AREA LEGISLATIVE DELEGATION TO GET SOME OF
10 THEIR FEEDBACK WHICH IS VERY IMPORTANT SINCE WE'RE GOING TO BE
11 GOING TO THE LEGISLATURE TO PURSUE THIS LEGISLATION. AND YES
12 DOING A POLL HOPEFUL ONE NEXT MONTH. SO, WITH THAT, I WILL
13 CLOSE AND TURN IT BACK TO YOU, CHAIR KINMAN.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO I'M GOING TO CALL FOR
16 COMMENT. FIRST, WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS
17 ITEM

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
20 ITEM NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO
21 SPEAK AND NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CALL ON COUNCIL
24 MEMBERS. THIS NEEDS TO BE SHORT AND SWEET. WE'RE WAY BEHIND
25 SCHEDULE. THINGS THAT JUMP OUT THAT YOU LOVE AND NOT



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 EDITORIALIZING FOR LENGTHY AMOUNTS OF TIME. WE'RE GOING START
2 AT THIS SIDE THIS TIME. AND SERIOUSLY, SHORT AND SWEET. ZELLY.

3

4 **ZELLY LODIN:** SHORT AND SWEET DON'T LOVE THE USAGE CHARGE I
5 THINK THAT HURTS PEOPLE WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO LIVE WHERE THEY
6 WORK AND I THINK IT WOULD BE A HARD SELL POLITICALLY. VERY
7 SHORT.

8

9 **GERRY GLASER:** THE TDM SEEMED LIKE A REASONABLE IDEA IF YOU
10 START SEEING EMPLOYEES PAYING FOR THE COST OF EMPLOYEES COMING
11 TO YOUR SITE AND IF THEY HAVE PROGRAMS YOU OFFSET THEIR COST
12 BECAUSE THEY HAVE A PROGRAM FOR ALL BUSES. PARCEL TAX, I HAVE
13 BEEN AN EV DRIVER SINCE 1998, A ROAD USER CHARGE SEEMS
14 REASONABLE AND THE STATE WILL LIKELY IMPOSE 2 TO 2 AND A HALF
15 CENTS SOMETHING ON TOP OF THAT SEEMS REASONABLE. AND OPENING
16 IT UP NOW SO THE STATE IS THINKING ABOUT THAT. THE PROGRAM AS
17 FAR AS ADMINISTRATION, FOR ME, I HAVE TALKED TO THE STAFF
18 WORKING ON THE PROGRAM, AND DONE SOME PILOTS, AND IT -- I
19 THINK THEY'RE MAKING IT MORE COMPLICATED THAN IT NEEDS TO BE.
20 SHOULD BE PART OF THE REGISTRATION PROCESS, SAY WHAT THE
21 MILEAGE WAS AND PUT IT IN EXTRA WORDS HAVE TO DO WITH THIS, IF
22 YOU ARE CHARGING FOR WHAT DON'T WANT PEOPLE TO DO THEY WILL
23 START GOING ON TRANSIT. IF THEY START GOING ON TRANSIT MORE
24 PEOPLE ARE TRANSIT AND COST DROPS FOR RIDES FOR TRANSIT AND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 THAT'S WHY I THINK ROAD USAGE CHARGE IS PROBABLY THE ONE TO
2 FOCUS ON.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** JOHNNY?

5

6 **JOHNNY PARKER:** ANALYSIS POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES ON THE
7 PRACTICAL CONSIDERATIONS IT SAYS ULTIMATELY WHAT'S MOST
8 POPULAR WITH VOTERS THAT'S CONSTANTLY CHANGING I'M SURE YOU
9 KNOW THAT.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY DO YOU HAVE COMMENTS?

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** NOTHING TO ADD. THANK YOU.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD?

16

17 **HOWARD WONG:** YES. VERY INTERESTING. IT'S NICE TO SEE EVERYBODY
18 ON A LIST. IT'S VERY EDUCATIONAL. ONE OF THE THINGS, MIGHT DO,
19 IS TO HAVE SOME CASE STUDIES, BECAUSE WHEN YOU ARE -- ANY TAX
20 MEASURE, THERE IS ALWAYS A CERTAIN PERCENTAGE THAT SAYS NO NEW
21 TAXES. SO, I THINK ONE HAS TO PROVIDE SOME EXAMPLES OF HOW
22 OTHER CITIES, HOW OTHER COUNTRIES FUND TRANSIT. TORONTO,
23 CANADA, FOR INSTANCE, HAS HAD VERY LITTLE SUPPORT, SO THEY
24 HAVE FUNDED TRANSIT ON DEMAND METERS AND ALL KIND OF REVENUE
25 GENERATING MEASURES, AND IF YOU IT'S CONSIDERED ONE OF THE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MOST RELIABLE TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN THE WORLD, ZURICH SWITZERLAND
2 WHICH IS ABOUT THE SIZE OF THE BAY AREA HAS 26% TRANSIT MODAL
3 SHARE, AND AS A REGION COMPARED TO THE BAY AREA'S 5% TRANSIT
4 MODAL SHARE, PROBABLY HAS FUNDING ON A NATIONAL LEVEL PROBABLY
5 THROUGH SOME SERIES OF TAXATION MEASURES OR WHATEVER SO I
6 THINK WE GIVE A VISION OF WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE AND WHAT YOU
7 GET IN RETURN I THINK THAT WOULD BE USEFUL.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. VEDA?

10

11 **VEDA FLOREZ:** THANK YOU. I AM VERY INTERESTED IN THIS AND
12 MAINLY TAXES HURT POOR PEOPLE BECAUSE THEY DON'T HAVE ENOUGH
13 MONEY, ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO ARE ULTRA POOR. YOU KNOW, 200%
14 BELOW POVERTY. THAT'S THE BASICS THERE. NOW FOR MILES TRAVELED
15 TAX, I WOULD BE HAPPY TO PAY MY OWN SHARE. MY COMPANY IS IN
16 THE SOUTH BAY. I LIVE IN THE NORTH BAY, I'M ON THE ROAD
17 FREQUENTLY. SO, I DON'T MIND PAYING MY SHARE, BUT I KNOW THAT
18 I LIVE IN MARIN COUNTY AND I KNOW THERE ARE PEOPLE FROM SOLANO
19 COUNTY WHO ARE DRIVING WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO LIVE THERE, BUT
20 STILL ARE AT BASIC WAGE. SO THAT'S GOING TO BE PROBLEMATIC, AS
21 WELL. SO, THOSE ARE BASICALLY, I THINK IT DEPENDS WHO YOU ARE
22 TALKING TO. AND, ESPECIALLY, PROPERTY TAXES, EVEN IN MARIN
23 COUNTY, THOSE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME ARE GOING TO HAVE DIFFICULTY
24 PAYING \$400. BUT THOSE WHO ARE -- HAVE MORE MONEY, OWN MORE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 HOMES ARE GOING TO BALK AT PAYING \$500. IN A NUTSHELL, I'LL
2 LEAVE IT THERE:

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** PHILIPPE?

5

6 **PHILIPPE PIERCE:** THIS IS GREAT TO SEE WHAT THE POLLING OUTCOME
7 WILL BE AND HOW THAT'S DRIVING DECISIONS. THE TABLE THAT HAS
8 DIFFERENT TAXES LAID OUT IT'S HARD FOR ME TO CONCEPTUALIZE
9 WHAT THAT MEANS IN TERMS OF A PARTICULAR PERSON, AS OPPOSED TO
10 LAYING OUT IF IT WERE X NUMBER OF DOLLARS THIS IS HOW MUCH YOU
11 WOULD EXPECT TO SPEND. INCLUDING THINGS PARCEL TAX, I STUDIED
12 PARCEL TAX IN-DEPTH, AND EQUITABILITY, AND SQUARE FOOTAGE, IN
13 TERMS OF LAND USES, COMPARING TO APARTMENTS AND PASSTHROUGHS
14 DIFFERENT THINGS TO CONSIDER THAT MIGHT BE HELPFUL IN THAT
15 POLLING AND IN FOCUS GROUPS UNDERSTAND WHO THIS AFFECTS THEM
16 PERSONALLY AND THAT'S WHAT'S GOING TO COME OUT IN THE CAMPAIGN
17 ANYWAY. SO, THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA?

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. A COUPLE OF POINTS. IN TERMS OF DOING THE
22 POLLING, WOULD RECOMMEND POLLING ON MULTIPLE OPTIONS,
23 INCLUDING OPTIONS THAT ARE BRINGING IN MORE REVENUE, HAVING A
24 BILLION DOLLARS AS A BASELINE WAS A GOOD, LIKE, APPLES TO
25 APPLES LOOKING TO WHICH SOURCES CAN RAISE ENOUGH MONEY, AND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 GIVEN WHAT IS ANTICIPATED TO BE THE NEED TO CONTINUE AND
2 IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO SEE IF
3 THERE WOULD BE ACCEPTANCE OF A HIGHER AMOUNT THAT WOULD BE
4 ABLE TO DELIVER THE TRANSFORMATION RESULTS THAT ARE VERY
5 POPULAR IN AND AMONGST THE PUBLIC. IN TERMS OF POSITIONS, YOU
6 KNOW, OBVIOUSLY STUDYING THE MOST BASIC OPTION IS A GOOD
7 BASELINE HAVING THE MORE PROGRESSIVE OPTION FOR EXAMPLE INCOME
8 TAX ON HIGHER EARNERS, AND IF THERE ARE BUSINESS TAXES
9 EXEMPTING SMALLER BUSINESSES THAT WINDS UP BEING POLITICALLY
10 NECESSARY WHEN THESE THINGS GO FORWARD LIKE TDM OPTION IS
11 REALLY INTERESTING AND WOULD NEED SOME THOUGHT ON EQUITABLE,
12 AND TAX AND CORPORATIONS, AND MAJOR CORPORATIONS AND
13 TRANSPORTATION BENEFITS SOMEBODY WHO IS WORK RETAIL AT A SMALL
14 COMPANY, PROBLEMS AND FIGURING OUT HOW TO SERVE ALL PEOPLE IF
15 WE HAVE THAT POLICY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DWAYNE?

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** REGARDING THE ROAD USAGE TO CHARGE IT
20 DOESN'T SEEM EQUITABLE FOR ME TO CHARGE PEOPLE TO USE ROADS
21 WHEN THEY'RE ALREADY FORCED TO LIVE IN AREAS FURTHER AWAY FROM
22 THEIR JOB. BECAUSE TO BE ABLE TO AFFORD A MORTGAGE OR RENT.
23 YOU'RE PUTTING MORE STRESS ON THAT HOUSEHOLD AND MAKING IT TO
24 WHERE PEOPLE CAN'T ACHIEVE THE AMERICAN DREAM. THAT'S MY
25 COMMENT ON THAT PART. NOW SPEAKING AS A FORMER UNION



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 NEGOTIATOR, AND MEMBER OF A UNION, I THINK THAT IDEAS LIKE
2 INCLUDING IN THE UNION CONTRACT, THAT THE EMPLOYER IS GOING TO
3 PAY FOR A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF THE TRANSPORTATION IF YOU USE THE
4 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, I THINK THAT'S ATTRACTING MORE USERS.
5 THAT WAS ACTUALLY -- WHEN I WAS LAST AT THE TABLE, THOSE ARE,
6 LIKE, THINGS WE'RE GOING FOR. LIKE WE WERE GOING FOR, LIKE,
7 YOU BUY ME A BART TICKET FOR \$50, AND I PAY \$50. I THINK THAT
8 ATTRACTS MORE RIDERS. THE AND I THINK THAT'S THE DIRECTION YOU
9 WANT TO GO IN. THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA?

12

13 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. THERE IS A TDM VARIANT THAT
14 WOULD BE COOL TO CONSIDER IF THERE WAS A TAX ON COMPANIES THAT
15 WERE REQUIRING WORKERS TO COME INTO THE OFFICE IF THEIR JOB
16 WAS DONE SUCCESSFULLY AS A REMOTE POSITION. THAT'S SOMETHING
17 WE'RE SEEING A LOT OF BUSINESSES BEING LIKE COME BACK EVEN
18 THOUGH THERE IS NO NEED TO DO THAT WE'RE STILL HOLDING ALL OF
19 OUR MEETINGS ON ZOOM EVEN FROM THE OFFICE. THAT WOULD BE
20 SOMETHING OF THE ALSO PROGRESSIVE, LIKE VACANT PROPERTY TAX
21 FOR MOBILE COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES, SOMETHING
22 THAT, LIKE, THE FIRST MONTH THAT IT'S EMPTY IS FREE BECAUSE OF
23 CLEANINGS AND REPAIRS AND STUFF BUT THEN IT GETS LARGER EACH
24 MONTH LARGE ENOUGH THAT IT ENCOURAGES PEOPLE TO ACTUALLY RENT
25 THOSE SPACES BECAUSE WE HAVE SO MANY VACANT HOUSING AND



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 BUSINESS UNITS THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY BE CREATING EMPLOYMENT
2 WHERE PEOPLE LIVE AND THE ROAD USAGE CHARGE VMT TAX IS SO
3 INSANELY REGRESSIVE IT'S THE MOST REGRESSIVE THING WE HAVE UP
4 THERE. THE AVERAGE HOUSE IN ALAMEDA COUNTY RIGHT NOW SAY
5 MILLION DOLLARS, YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO MAKE \$240,000 A YEAR TO
6 BUY A HOUSE. RENTS ARE INSANE. PEOPLE ARE ALREADY BEING FORCED
7 TO COMMUTE IT'S REALLY EXPENSE OF MANY CAN'T AFFORD AN
8 ELECTRIC VEHICLE LIKE WE'RE ALREADY GETTING RAPED TO LIVE
9 HERE. AND, LIKE, EVEN THE MODERATE INCOME FOLKS, SO JUST
10 HAVING THAT BELOW THE POVERTY LEVEL, LIKE, WE HAVE TO GO
11 FARTHER AND FARTHER. SO, REALLY, PLEASE DON'T DO THAT THE LAST
12 THING IS WHEN YOU PUT THINGS OUT, IF YOU HAVE PEOPLE FOCUS ON
13 OUTCOMES, LIKE, DO YOU WANT BART TO RUN EVERY 15 MINUTES AND
14 ON THE EVENINGS, OR WOULD YOU HAVE AN EXTRA LANE ON THE
15 FREEWAY RATHER THAN WOULD YOU INVEST IN THESE THINGS, I THINK
16 THAT COULD MAKE IT CLEAR FOR FOLKS. THAT'S ALL.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WILLIAM?

19

20 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** YES, JUST FROM AN ADMINISTRATIVE POINT IT
21 SEEMS LIKE THE PAYROLL TAX AND THE INCOME TAX WOULD BE MORE
22 FEASIBLE. BUT I WAS CURIOUS, IS THERE A SUNSET DATE ON ANY OF
23 THESE OPTIONS? I DIDN'T SEE A TIME FRAME, LIKE, HOW LONG WOULD
24 THESE OPTIONS BE IN EXISTENCE?

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** GREAT QUESTION. TYPICALLY THERE HAS BEEN A
2 SUNSET DATE ON THE COUNTY BASED TAXES, ALTHOUGH NOT ALL OF
3 THEM. SO, BART HAS A PERMANENT SALES TAX THAT SUPPORTS BART.
4 SAMTRANS ALSO HAS A PERMANENT TAX. I THINK, PARTICULARLY WHEN
5 WE THINK ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATIONS, RIGHT, THAT COST IS NOT
6 GOING TO DISAPPEAR, RIGHT, ANY TIME SOON. I THINK IT'S ONE
7 THING TO HAVE A SUNSET DATE ON A BALLOT MEASURE THAT'S REALLY
8 FOCUSED ON BUILDING CAPITAL PROJECTS, RIGHT? YOU HAVE X AMOUNT
9 OF DOLLARS, YOU'RE GOING TO BUILD THESE PROJECTS, YOU'RE GOING
10 TO BE DONE, MAYBE GO BACK. SO I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE
11 GOING TO HAVE TO NAVIGATE WITH THE COMMISSION AND THE
12 LEGISLATURE. BUT YOU KNOW, WELCOME FOLKS FEEDBACK ON THAT.
13 CERTAINLY, I THINK VOTERS HAVE MORE SUPPORT FOR SOMETHING THAT
14 DOES HAVE A SUN ASSET DATE. SO THAT ALSO WILL BE A FACTOR.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI?

17

18 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. I'M SURPRISED I HAVEN'T HEARD MORE PEOPLE
19 TALK ABOUT THE INCOME TAX BECAUSE THAT IS THE MOST EQUITABLE
20 OPTION OUT THERE AND WOULD COST THE LEAST PER PERSON. SO, FOR
21 ME, THAT WOULD BE THE FIRST ONE I WOULD LOOK AT. I RECOGNIZE
22 IT WOULD REQUIRE ENABLING LEGISLATION. BUT I THINK IN THE
23 TIMES WE LIVE IN, THAT COULD BE POSSIBLE. SO, THAT'S MY NUMBER
24 ONE. I LOVE ACTUALLY THE TDM MANDATE PART OF THE PAYROLL TAX,
25 INSTEAD OF A PAYROLL TAX GOING FOR SOMETHING THAT ACTUALLY



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 ENCOURAGES PEOPLE TO USE TRANSIT. THAT'S A GOOD OPTION. WITH
2 THE PERSONAL TAX, I THINK THAT HAS TO BE PER SQUARE FOOTAGE IF
3 YOU'RE GOING TO LOOK AT IT AT ALL OTHERWISE IT'S OFF THE TABLE
4 AND I HEAR WHAT PEOPLE ARE SAYING ABOUT THE USER ROAD FEE
5 EQUITY ISSUE BUT THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER IS THAT LONG-TERM
6 SOLUTION ULTIMATELY I THINK THE SALES TAX IS GOING TO BE
7 PROVIDING LESS REVENUE AND WE'RE GOING TO SEE THAT KIND OF
8 USER FEE REPLACING IT AND RIGHT NOW PEOPLE WHO ARE DRIVING
9 LONG DISTANCES ARE ALREADY PAYING TAX ON THEIR GAS AND THIS IS
10 REALLY REPLACING THAT SO IT'S APPLES TO APPLES IN MANY CASES
11 BUT ALSO IT HAS TO BE LOOKED AT IN THE LONG-TERM BECAUSE WE
12 NEED TO WAIT UNTIL EITHER STATE OR NATIONAL STARTS MAKING THAT
13 CHANGE AND THE ADMINISTRATION OPTIONS ARE IN PLACE. A COUPLE
14 OF QUESTIONS. DO ALL OF THESE REQUIRE A VOTE OF THE PUBLIC? OR
15 ARE THERE SOME THAT COULD BE LEGISLATIVE ONLY? AND I KNOW THAT
16 THERE IS LEGISLATION THAT'S BEING PROPOSED TO REDUCE
17 INFRASTRUCTURE TO 55%, WOULD THIS FALL UNDER THAT CATEGORY?

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. YES, ALL OF THE OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE
20 OUTLINED WOULD REQUIRE BOTH LEGISLATIVE AUTHORIZATION AND
21 VOTER APPROVAL UNDER THE WAY THAT WE'RE THINKING OF THIS. THE
22 TDM OPTION, I THINK WE WOULD NEED TO ANALYZE THAT A BIT MORE
23 TO DETERMINE WHETHER THAT WOULD BE CONSIDERED A TAX. ANY TYPE
24 OF TAX, IF IT IS A TAX, WOULD REQUIRE VOTER APPROVAL. ON THE
25 QUESTION ABOUT ACA ONE, WHICH IS THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 THAT THE LEGISLATURE DID APPROVE -- YAY -- OUR STAFF WAS VERY
2 ACTIVE ON THAT SO SHOUT OUT TO MY COLLEAGUE JULIE SCHNEIDER.
3 GLAD THAT GOT THROUGH THE LEGISLATURE IT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL
4 FOR THE HOUSING MEASURE AND ONE CONSIDERATION TO THE MEASURE
5 LIMITED TO INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH MEANS CONSTRUCTION CAPITAL AND
6 SINCE THIS MEASURE WOULD BE TARGETING A LOT OF FENCE OR
7 OPERATING IT WOULD NOT APPLY.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** MICHAEL?

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** SALES TAX. THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA? THANK YOU. PAM?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES, JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. AND
16 SECONDING THE MO ON THE REGRESSIVE MEASURES, ON THE PARCEL
17 TAX, ROAD USAGE AND MAKING SURE THE POLLING IS TALKING ABOUT
18 THE BENEFITS OF PROGRESSIVE TAXES LIKE INCOME CORPORATE
19 PAYROLL TAX AND I WANT TO EMPHASIZE ADAPTABILITY AND
20 FLEXIBILITY THAT'S BEEN CONSIDERED I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE
21 CRUCIAL IN ORDER TO HAVE THE OPTIONS FOR WHAT IS NEEDED AT THE
22 TIME, WHETHER IT'S OPERATIONS OR CONSTRUCTION, BUT JUST BEING
23 ABLE TO HAVE THOSE FLEXIBLE OPTIONS LIKE IN A.B. 1487 IS VERY
24 IMPORTANT. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT CONTINUED THROUGH THE
25 CONVERSATION. AND IN TERMS OF OUTREACH, I DID NOT SEE PARENT



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 SCHOOLS, PDA, YOUTH, OR LARGE BUSINESSES OR EMPLOYERS WHO
2 MIGHT BE AFFECTED BY SOME OF THE PROGRESSIVE TAXES I DID SEE
3 BUSINESS ASSOCIATIONS BUT HAVING CONVERSATIONS WITH LARGE
4 EMPLOYERS THEMSELVES TO GET THEM ON BOARD BEFORE THEY START TO
5 SEE CAMPAIGNS WOULD BE HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO SWING BACK TO OUR
8 PUBLIC OUTREACH DURING POP-UPS AND WEBINARS. AND MY
9 UNDERSTANDING IS THAT PUBLIC MEETINGS, WE DO PROVIDE
10 TRANSLATION SERVICES. CORRECT. SO, IN THAT CASE, THAT RESOLVES
11 THE, ARE THEY BEING -- ARE OUR WEBINARS BEING ACCESSED BY
12 MULTIPLE LANGUAGES. I WOULD JUST STRONGLY URGE THAT WE DID
13 THAT AS MUCH AS WE CAN MINIMAL POP-UPS THAT HAVE -- FOR FOCUS
14 GROUPS, FOR VIETNAMESE, FOR SPANISH, CHINESE, IF POSSIBLE,
15 LOOKING -- NOT POP-UPS, BUT JUST FOCUS GROUPS, SO I THINK THE
16 CONCERN WAS THAT PEOPLE PARTICIPATING WEREN'T GOING TO BE ABLE
17 TO UNDERSTAND A WEBINAR IN THEIR OWN LANGUAGE. I JUST WANTED
18 TO SWING BACK AROUND AND COVER THAT. ARE THERE ANY MORE
19 QUESTIONS? OH, ONLINE?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHRIS OR ESUF, DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK?
22 ILAF OR CHRIS? NO? OKAY.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. LAST CALL FOR COMMENTS. GERRY,
25 QUICK?



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **GERRY GLASER:** REALLY FAST. I WANT TO THANK WENDI FOR POINTING
3 OUT. WE ALREADY PAY THE MILEAGE TAX PAYING FOR IT IN GAS AND
4 IF YOU HAVE A CAR THAT'S NOT EFFICIENT YOU'RE PAYING MORE AND
5 THAT'S USUALLY FOR FOLKS WHO CAN'T AFFORD THE MORE EFFICIENT
6 CARS AS WELL. THE ROAD USAGE TAX ISN'T OFFSET IT'S JUST
7 CHANGING FROM ONE TO ANOTHER AND WE'RE GOING APPLY IT TO
8 TRANSIT INSTEAD OF APPLYING IT TO THE ROADS.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THIS HAS BEEN QUITE EXTENSIVE.
11 I APPRECIATE IT. AND WE'RE GOING TO GO TO OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM
12 WHICH IS THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY, ROUND ONE
13 ANALYSIS. ANUP, AS YOU CAN TELL, WE'RE RUNNING EXTREMELY LATE.
14 SO I'M GOING TO ASK TO BE BRIEF. AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS YOU
15 PROBABLY WANT INPUT ON SLIDE -- MY PAGES AREN'T NUMBERED. AND
16 THE ONE THAT IS THE FOUR MAIN CHALLENGES, OKAY? IS THAT WHERE
17 WE'RE GOING WITH THIS?

18

19 **ANUP TAPASE:** THAT IS RIGHT. YEAH.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, I'M GOING TO, AGAIN, TELL
22 EVERYBODY WE'RE RUNNING VERY LATE WE HAVE THIS, AND WE HAVE
23 ANOTHER WHOLE MEETING COMING UP. GO AHEAD ANUP, TAKE IT AWAY.

24



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **ANUP TAPASE:** OKAY. GOOD MORNING COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS
2 ANUP TAPASE, PRINCIPLE PLANNER PAGER PLANS TEAM PERCENTAGE
3 MANAGER NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY SOMETHING WE KICKED OFF
4 IN 2022 IN PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRANS TRYING TO REIMAGINE AN
5 ALTERNATIVE FUTURE FOR OUR FREEWAYS COLLABORATIVELY WITH
6 ADVISORY GROUPS STAFF AND EXECUTIVE LEVEL SOME OF YOU ARE PART
7 OF THOSE ADVISORY GROUPS, UPON IMPLEMENTATION ACTION AND
8 STRATEGY RECOMMENDATIONS. THIS UPDATE TO THE COUNCIL ON THIS
9 STUDY PRESENTED SIX MONTHS AGO SINCE COMPLETED THE ANALYSIS,
10 THIS IS THE MAIN FOCUS OF THE PRESENTATION TODAY. I WOULD LIKE
11 TO ASK TECH TO BRING UP THE SLIDES PLEASE. MOVE TO SLIDE TWO.
12 GOOD TO REMIND OURSELVES WHY WE'RE STUDYING PRICING. THIS IS A
13 COMPLEX AND CHALLENGING TOPIC NOT SHORT OF CONTROVERSY. SOME
14 OF YOU, THE MAJORITY OF THE PUBLIC MAY NOT BE ON BOARD WITH
15 THE STUDYING IDEA OF PRICING. WE NEED STRATEGIES AND AMBITIOUS
16 CLIMATE TARGETS. CONGESTION IS BACK AND IF WE WANT TO IMPROVE
17 TRAFFIC CONDITIONS FOR THOSE WHO DEPEND ON FREEWAYS FOR
18 DRIVING FOR A VARIETY OF REASONS, ROAD PRICING AS A STRATEGY
19 HAS MERIT AND WORTH EXPLORING. PRICING HAS POTENTIAL TO
20 ADVANCE EQUITY IF DONE RIGHT. THE STUDY HAS BEEN CENTERED ON
21 USING PRICING AS A TOOL TO ADVANCE EQUITY FROM THE ONSET. NEXT
22 PAGE. WE ESTABLISHED FIVE GOALS FOR THE STUDY WITH OVERARCHING
23 GOAL OF ADVANCING POSITIVE OUTCOMES FOR EQUITY PRIORITY
24 COMMUNITIES AND WE'RE STUDYING PATHWAYS, PACKAGES AND PRICING
25 COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES THAT WOULD BE FUNDING PARTLY BY



1 TOLLING REVENUES AS WELL AS OTHER SOURCES TO NOT JUST MITIGATE
2 COST BURDEN OF PRICING BUT TRYING TO REIMAGINE AN ALTERNATIVE
3 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. OF THE CRITICAL BACKGROUND ANALYSIS
4 BUILDING ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS NEAR-TERM PRIORITIES
5 THROUGH 2035. ON THE LEFT WHAT PRIORITIES ARE, INCLUDING
6 INCREASED HOUSING ECONOMIC DENSITIES MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS
7 AND WHAT THIS STUDY DOES IS LAYER THE COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES
8 AND PRICING STRATEGIES ABOVE THOSE NEAR-TERM PRIORITIES. ALL
9 THAT TO SAY THAT PRICING PATHWAYS IS BY NO MEANS A SILVER
10 BULLET IN ADDRESSING GOALS IT HAS TO RELY ON STRATEGIES BUT
11 FLIP SIDE OUTCOMES ARE HARD TO ACHIEVE WITH THE PRICING
12 STRATEGIES AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. REFRESHER ON THOSE SEVEN
13 PATHWAYS FIRST WAS A PATHWAY WITH NO NEW PRICING INITIATIVES.
14 FUTURE WHERE STILL A LOT HAPPENS WHERE ALTERNATIVE FUND
15 SOURCES SUCH AS REGIONAL MEASURES, AND OTHER FUNDING SOURCES
16 ENABLE A CORE PACKAGE OF STRATEGIES FOCUSED ON BUILDING OUT
17 CARPOOL LANES FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS TO TRUNK LINE TRANSIT AND
18 SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS AND STREETS. SO THAT PATHWAY ONE WAS THE
19 BASELINE FOR ANALYSIS. AND WE WANTED TO UNDERSTAND HOW -- WHAT
20 INCREMENTAL IMPACT PRICING PATHWAYS CAN HAVE. AND SO THOSE
21 PATHWAY 2, 3, AND 4, EACH WITH TWO VERSIONS ARE BASED ON THREE
22 DIFFERENT PRICING STRATEGIES. ACCORDANCE TOOLING AND
23 INFRASTRUCTURE TOLLING AND THOSE ARE STRATEGIES PAIRED WITH
24 LARGER SET OF COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGIES, CORE PACKAGE INCLUDES
25 TOLL DISCOUNTS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES FUNDING SET ASIDE



1 FOR INVESTMENT URBAN GREENING PEDESTRIAN CROSSINGS AND BEYOND
2 THAT BETTER OUTCOMES FOR FUNDING IMPROVING TRANSIT AND LARGER
3 TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNTS. ALL OF THESE STRATEGIES ARE GROUNDED
4 IN COMMUNITY CONCERNS WHERE WE HEARD IN ENGAGEMENT, SUPPORT
5 FOR LACK OF TRANSIT TRAFFIC ON FREEWAYS AND UNAFFORDABILITY IN
6 THE REGION. CONTEXT, WE SUBMIT THIS IN OUR TRAVEL MODEL, SAME
7 MODEL WE USED IN PLANNED BAY AREA, SIMULATING ACTIVITIES OF 9
8 MILLION PEOPLE IN 2035 GIVEN A SET OF OPTIONS THEY HAVE,
9 TRANSIT OPTIONS, AND TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY MIGHT DO.
10 LOOKING AT OUTCOMES WE'RE ABLE TO SHOW WHAT INCREMENTAL
11 IMPACTS PRICING CAN HAVE RELATIVE TO THE PATHWAY ONE. LET'S
12 TURN TO FINDINGS. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. WHAT DID WE LEARN ABOUT
13 THE PRICING STRATEGIES? THE PRICING STRATEGY YIELDING POSITIVE
14 OUTCOMES AT THE LOCAL JURISDICTION LEVEL, IN SAN FRANCISCO,
15 INCLUDING 6 TO 12% VMT REDUCTION FOR TRIPS IN AND OUT OF THE
16 CORDANCE BUT HAVE LIMITED EQUITIES AT THE REGIONAL SCALE.
17 THERE IS A REASON WHY I FOCUS LESS ON THIS PRICING STRATEGY IN
18 THE REMAINDER OF THIS PRESENTATION. ALL LANE TOLLING HAD
19 GREATER POTENTIAL TO ADVANCE REGIONAL GOALS. TO CLARIFY,
20 TOLLING ALL LANES FREEWAYS WHERE THERE ARE TRANSIT
21 ALTERNATIVES. THIS ALL LANE TOLLING YIELDED UP TO TWO OR 3%
22 REDUCTION IN REGIONAL VMT BUT HAS CHARGES REQUIRING
23 MITIGATIONS TO ADDRESS DIVERGENT LOCAL GROWTH INCREASING MODE
24 SHIFT TWO OR 3% IS SMALL NUMBER EVEN 2% REDUCTION IN VMT IS
25 SUBSTANTIAL IT'S EQUIVALENT TO TWO TIMES CALTRAIN'S PRE-



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 PANDEMIC DAILY BOARDINGS OR 2500 EXTRA BUSES OPERATING AT 80%
2 CAPACITY EVER EVERY DAY ON COMPLEMENTARY STRATEGY AT THE
3 BOTTOM OF THE PAGE WE FELT THERE WAS NO CLEAR FRONT-RUNNER
4 BETWEEN THOSE TWO VERSIONS EXPRESS BUS LINES ALONG FREEWAYS
5 AND EXPRESS BUS LINES INITIALLY SEEN PROMISING BUT WE SAW
6 MAYBE REINVESTING REVENUES IN LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICES COULD BE
7 GREATER MODE SHIFT, MITIGATING AFFORDABLE CONCERN AND ALSO
8 TRANSIT DISCOUNTS PROVIDING VIABLE ALTERNATIVE TO CAPITAL
9 OPERATING INVESTMENTS GROWTH IN RIDERSHIP NOT SAYING THAT ONE
10 IS BETTER THAN THE OTHER BUT BOTH CAN WORK EFFECTIVELY. NEXT
11 PAGE. IMPACT ON ALL LANE TOLLING PATHWAYS UNDER FIVE GOALS.
12 UNDER THE RELIABLE GOAL WHICH REDUCED TRAFFIC CONGESTION ON
13 FREEWAYS AND LOCAL STREETS WE SAW STRONG POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE
14 OUTCOMES HERE. FIRST FREEWAY TRAVEL TIMES AND TRAFFIC
15 CONGESTION SAW SIGNIFICANT REDUCTIONS FROM TOLLING. PEAK
16 PERIOD TRAVEL TIMES DECREASED BY UP TO 24% ON SOME OF THE
17 REGION'S BUSIEST FREEWAYS SUCH AS 101, I-880, THAT'S SAYING,
18 BEYOND EVERYTHING THAT INCREASED HOUSING DENSITIES OR MAJOR
19 TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS CARPOOL LANE REGIONAL TRANSIT
20 FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS BEYOND ALL LANE TOLLING COMPLEMENTARY
21 STRATEGIES WOULD DECREASE TRAVEL TIME BY ABOUT A QUARTER ON
22 THOSE BUSIEST FREEWAYS IN ADDITION VMT SOME OF THOSE FREEWAYS
23 OF DOWN BY 40% IN PEAK PERIOD THAT DECREASE IN VMT TRAVEL
24 TIMES ASSOCIATED WITH DIFFERENT AFFECTS DRIVERS SHIFTING TO
25 TRANSIT CARPOOLING SOME MAKING SHORTER TRIPS SMALL NUMBER OF



1 DRIVERS MAKING FEWER TRIPS WHICH IS NOT CONCENTRATED IN ANY
2 PARTICULAR INCOME CLASS BUT ALSO DIVERGENT TO LOCAL STREETS
3 THAT'S PEOPLE SKIPPING FREEWAY TO AVOID TOLLS LOOKING AT THE
4 NUMBERS, CHANGE IN FREEWAY TRAVEL TIMES ABOUT MINUS 8 OR 10%
5 BUT MAJOR PARALLEL ARTERIALS LIKE SAN PABLO AVENUE EL CAMINO
6 REAL WE SEE INCREASE OF 8% AND TRAVEL TIMES THAT'S NOT A GOOD
7 OUTCOME. WE SAW IN PATHWAY INCLUDING TOWING THOSE MAJOR
8 ARTERIALS THERE WAS 0% CHANGE IN TRAVEL TIMES SHOWING
9 MITIGATION IMPACTS OF DIVERSION AND EFFECTS OF PRICING IN
10 CHANGING BEHAVIOR. LOOKING AT EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES NO
11 MAJOR DISPARITIES TRAVEL TIMES LIKELY SMALLER INCREASE ON
12 LOCAL ROADS. TRANSIT ALTERNATIVES DID GET FASTER BUT SO DID
13 DRIVING, 160,000 NEW TRANSIT BOARDINGS NOT SIGNIFICANT BUT
14 LOWER THAN HOPED OVERALL COMMUTE SHIFT 0.4 TO 0.7%. WE'RE
15 TRYING TO LEARN FROM FINDINGS AND LOOKING AT WHAT COULD BE
16 IMPROVED IN THE NEXT ANALYSIS LOOKING AT ALLOCATING TOLLING
17 REVENUE IS NOT DIFFERENT TRANSIT MODES, NOT OPTIMAL
18 OPPORTUNITY FOR IMPROVEMENT IN ROUND TWO, PARTICULARLY
19 THINKING LOCAL TRANSIT HAS MORE POTENTIAL FOR MODE SHIFT. NEXT
20 SLIDE PLEASE. MOVING TO THE GOAL ON AFFORDABLE. SO, BEFORE I
21 GET IN I WANT TO READ THE NOTE ON THE BOTTOM OF THE PAGE
22 BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT ALL LANE TOLLING BUT I
23 HAVEN'T TOLD YOU WHAT TOLL LEVELS ARE. CONTEXT TOLL RATES IN
24 ANALYSIS THEY RANGE FROM ZERO DOLLARS IN A FEW LOW CONGESTION
25 CORRIDORS IN MOST CORRIDORS AND MOST CORRIDORS IN OFF-PEAK



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 HOURS TO UP TO \$0.30 PER MILE IN THE BUSIEST CORRIDORS DURING
2 PEAK HOURS 20 MILE SEGMENT ON A BUSY CORRIDOR US101 ON THE
3 PENINSULA WOULD COST \$6 TO DRIVE NOT EVERYONE DRIVES MANY
4 DRIVE CLOSE TO WHERE THEY LIVE ON A REGULAR BASIS. SOME PEOPLE
5 USE TRANSIT SOME PEOPLE WALK AND BIKE TO WORK. SOME SHIFT TO
6 TRANSIT AS A RESULT OF PRICING. WHICH GETS ME TO OUR FINDING
7 THAT THE TOLLING SIGNIFICANTLY BURDENED THE SMALL SHARE OF BAY
8 AREA DRIVERS, ESPECIALLY WITH TOLL DISCOUNTS IN PLACE. SO,
9 OVER HALF OF HOUSEHOLDS, BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS DO NOT USE TOLL
10 FACILITIES ON ANY GIVEN AVERAGE WEEKDAY THAT INCREASE IN COST
11 BURDEN FROM TOLLING IS NEGLIGIBLE FOR OVER HALF BAY AREA
12 HOUSEHOLDS. SO WHO WOULD SEE A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN TOLLING
13 ON EXPENDITURES AND WE CAN ARGUE WHAT SIGNIFICANT MEANS BUT WE
14 SHOW TWO THRESHOLDS HERE \$300 AND \$1,000 FOR ANNUAL TOLL
15 EXPENDITURES. SO LOOKING AT THE BOX ON THE RIGHT AMONG VERY
16 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS WHO ARE UNDER 50% AMI, ONLY 4% OF THOSE
17 HOUSEHOLDS WOULD SEE AN ANNUAL COST INCREASE OF OVER \$300 AND
18 LESS THAN 1% WOULD SEE COST INCREASE OVER \$1,000. SOME MAY SEE
19 HIGH INCREASE OVER A THOUSAND DOLLARS, AS WELL. SO, JUST FOR
20 REFERENCE, 4% OF VERY LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS REPRESENTS 35,000
21 HOUSEHOLDS IN 2035: AMONG LOWER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS 50% AMI,
22 THOSE NUMBERS ARE 7 AND 2% AND SHARES GO HIGHER FOR HIGHER
23 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS, FREEWAYS ARE DISPROPORTIONATELY USED BY
24 HIGHER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. SO THESE SMALL NUMBER FOR LOW-INCOME
25 HOUSEHOLDS TELLS US TARGETED COST BURDEN RECEIVE COULD BE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 EXPANDED IN ROUND TWO ANALYSIS TO MAKE FURTHER HEADWAY ON THIS
2 GOAL. MOVING TO GOAL TWO. LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES AS A WHOLE
3 WOULD SEE GREATER BENEFITS THAN BURDENS. CONSIDERING THE VERY
4 LOW-INCOME POPULATION SHARE OF TOTAL TOLL REVENUES INCURRED
5 WAS 48% OF ALL TOLLING REVENUES. ON THE OTHER HAND SCHAFFER
6 REINVESTMENT THAT BENEFITTED THE GROUP INCLUDED FARE
7 DISCOUNTS, TOLL DISCOUNTS, TRANSIT AND SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS IN
8 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES REPAIRATIVE INVESTMENTS SUCH AS
9 PEDESTRIAN CROSSINGS WAS 32 TO 38%, A RATIO OF 4 SHOWING HOW
10 ROAD PRICING CAN BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO REDISTRIBUTE REVENUES
11 AND ADVANCE MORE EQUITABLE OUTCOMES. SO WE CERTAINLY WANT TO
12 CONTINUE TO SEE THOSE KIND OF POSITIVE OUTCOMES IN ROUND TWO
13 ANALYSIS. FINALLY ON THE SAFE GOAL, NOW, SUBSTANTIAL REVENUES,
14 ABOUT \$5 BILLION WAS PUT TOWARDS ROAD SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS LIKE
15 SPEED BUMPS, NARROW LANES BIKE LANES AND SAFER SIDEWALKS. WITH
16 THOSE KIND OF IMPROVEMENTS FATALITIES ARE ESTIMATED TO DECLINE
17 BY 30% RELATIVE TO CURRENT RATES THAT A SIGNIFICANT DECLINE
18 NOT ASSOCIATED WITH PRICING ITSELF BUT A WIDE RANGE OF
19 IMPROVEMENTS THAT TOLLING COULD FUND BUT THIS COULD ALSO COME
20 FROM OTHER SOURCES LIKE WHAT YOU HEARD IN THE PREVIOUS ITEM
21 THAT IS A SIGNIFICANT DECREASE THAT CAN BE RECEIVED FROM THOSE
22 KIND OF LARGE SCALE WIDE REGIONAL INVESTMENTS. NOTING HERE
23 DIVERSION TO LOCAL STREETS CONTINUES TO BE AN ISSUE AND NOTES
24 SAFETY RISK AS WELL AS ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ESPECIALLY IF THE
25 SPEEDS ARE LOWER ON LOCAL STREETS SOMETHING WE WANT TO ADDRESS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 IN THE NEXT ROUND WHICH BRINGS ME TO MY NEXT SLIDE WRAPPING UP
2 OUR FINDINGS. FOUR MAIN CHALLENGES WILL BE THE FOCUS OF OUR
3 NEXT ANALYSIS. WE ARE SEEKING SOLUTIONS. SOME IDEAS ARE SHOWN
4 ON THE RIGHT. THEY DON'T REPRESENT OUR RECOMMENDATIONS BUT
5 JUST IDEAS BEING EXPLORED AND WE WELCOME CRITIQUE OF THOSE
6 IDEAS AS WELL AS NEW IDEAS. FIRST CHALLENGE IS LIMITING
7 DIVERSION TO ARTERIALS AND LOCAL STREETS. WHAT STRATEGIES
8 COULD MIMIC THAT EFFECT OF TOLLING ON ARTERIALS WHILE STILL
9 HELPING GAIN MEANINGFUL REDUCTIONS IN CONGESTION AND HAVE. MT.
10 ONE IDEA PROPOSED IS DUAL EXPRESS LANES THROUGHOUT THE NETWORK
11 WHICH STILL MAINTAINS OPTIONS ON THE FREEWAYS IN PLACE OF ALL
12 LANE TOLLING. THAT MAY HELP LIMIT DIVERSION BUT THAT STRATEGY
13 DOES HAVE SERIOUS EQUITY ISSUES. SECOND WAS ABOUT INCREASING
14 MODE SHIFT. HOW CAN REVENUES BE ALLOCATED BETWEEN DIFFERENT
15 TRANSIT MODES SO WE GET INCREASED TRANSIT RIDERSHIP TO WHAT WE
16 SAW IN ROUND ONE. WE THINK THAT IS LESS BUS COMPARED TO LOCAL
17 TRANSIT. WHAT STRATEGIES ARE BEST SUITED TO IMPROVE
18 AFFORDABILITY OUTCOMES FOR HIGH FREQUENCY LOW-INCOME DRIVERS,
19 ADVANCE PAYMENTS TO THOSE LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS TO DEEPER
20 DISCOUNTS AND FOURTH GIVEN CHALLENGING CLIMATE GOALS WE'LL BE
21 TALKING ABOUT IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. HOW PRICING CAN BE
22 EXPANDED IDEAS ON THE TABLE ARE HIGHER TOLL LEVELS AND WHAT
23 YOU HEARD IN THE PREVIOUS ITEM REGIONAL SUPPLEMENT OVERSTATE
24 WIDE ROAD USER CHARGE. THAT BRINGS ME TO MY FIND SLIDE. NEXT
25 STEPS. THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR HEARING US OUT AND PROVIDING YOUR



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 FEEDBACK TODAY. OUR NEXT STEP IS OUR UPDATE WITH ELECTED
2 OFFICIALS INNING ON THE. WE ARE ALSO LOOKING TO ENGAGE
3 COMMUNITIES RIGHT AFTER THAT. SO WE'RE LOOKING TO HAVE SMALL
4 GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH VARIOUS DEMOGRAPHIC GROUPS AND ALSO
5 SOME PUBLIC WEBINARS AND STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS. AND THEN WE
6 REFINE OUR PATHWAYS AND DEVELOP INPUTS FOR THE SECOND ROUND OF
7 ANALYSIS AND THEN GO ON TO ANALYZING THEM IN WINTER OF 2024.
8 THAT'S ALL I HAVE TO SHARE. BACK TO YOU ALL.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO I HAVE QUESTIONS OR
11 COMMENTS? AND I -- AGAIN, CAN WE PUT SLIDE TEN BACK UP?
12 BECAUSE I THINK THIS IS WHERE YOU WANT THE MOST OF YOUR
13 FEEDBACK. IT IS MY UNDERSTANDING. IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT
14 ANY OF THE SLIDES, PLEASE ASK THEM. IF YOU HAVE COMMENTS, WE
15 DON'T NEED PARAGRAPH STATEMENTS SAYING AND EXPLAINING WHY IT'S
16 REGRESSIVE. IF YOU SAY IT'S REGRESSIVE, EVERYBODY UNDERSTANDS
17 WHAT YOU MEAN. SO, WHO WANTS TO MAKE COMMENTS? WE'RE GOING TO
18 START AT THAT END OF THE TABLE AGAIN. MR. BALDINI, DID YOU
19 HAVE ANY COMMENTS?

20

21 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI?

24



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** FIRST A QUESTION, SORRY. I DON'T KNOW WHAT
2 CORDON PRICING MEANS.

3

4 **ANUP TAPASE:** APOLOGIES. THAT WAS PART OF THE UPDATE WE SHARED
5 IN MARCH CORDON PRICING IS A BOUNDARY AROUND DOWNTOWN OR ANY
6 OTHER AREA THEN IT TOLLS PRICES ALL VEHICLES ENTERING DOWNTOWN
7 SAN FRANCISCO CONSIDERING CORDON IN THEIR DOWNTOWN AND ONE ON
8 THE PATHWAYS IN OUR ANALYSIS WAS CONSIDERING THREE CORDONS ONE
9 IN OAKLAND BE SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** I THINK MY FIRST COMMENT NOBODY IN THE PUBLIC
12 IS GOING TO LIKE THIS NOBODY LIKES TO START PAYING SOMETHING
13 THAT THEY THINK THEY ALREADY PAID FOR AND GET IT FOR FREE SO
14 PUBLIC FEEDBACK MAY NOT BE TERRIBLY INFORMATIVE WHEN YOU
15 BALANCE IT AGAINST THE NEED FOR DOING IT I THINK ULTIMATELY WE
16 NEED TO CHARGE FOR USERS IN VARIOUS DIFFERENT WAYS AND IT
17 WON'T BE POPULAR AND SO, BUT I THINK IT'S A CHICKEN AND EGG
18 THING BECAUSE YOU DO NEED TO PROVIDE TRANSIT ALTERNATIVE IN
19 ORDER TO MOVE, OR IS THAT EQUITABLE OPPORTUNITY AND ONLY
20 LOOKING AT THE TRUNK LINE WHICH IS REALLY WHAT THIS STUDYING
21 AND NOT LOOKING AT 50 AND LAST MILE IT'S NICE TO HAVE A
22 FREQUENT TRUNK LINE HOW DO PEOPLE GET TO IT WHAT'S THE WEIGHT
23 IN ORDER TO MAKE IT TRANSFER AND THIS GOES BACK TO HAVING A
24 CONNECTED NETWORK SO WE KNOW WE'RE JUGGLING CHANGES THAT NEED



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 TO BE MADE AND IT'S A MATTER OF WHICH COMES FIRST AND I THINK
2 THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S GOING TO BE HARD TO STUDY.

3

4 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WILLIAM DO YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS?

5

6 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** SO NO NEW PRICING IS NOT PART OF THE
7 STRATEGY?

8

9 **ANUP TAPASE:** IT'S AN OPTION STUDYING AS A PATHS WAY BUT WE
10 WERE TRYING TO SHOW ON THE INCREMENTAL IMPACTS OF THE PRICING.

11

12 **WILLIAM GOODWIIN:** OKAY.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ANNE OLIVIA.

15

16 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I AM PART OF THE WORKING GROUP AND I WANT
17 TO CLARIFY SOME OF THE THINGS THAT I HEARD TODAY THAT DON'T
18 MATCH WHAT WERE IN THERE. SO TODAY YOU SAID THERE IS NO MAJOR
19 DISPARATE ISSUES FOR LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES BUT IN THE WORKING
20 GROUP YOU ALSO SAID THAT THIS STUDY DOES NOT LOOK AT EFFECTS
21 OF INTERNAL DISPLACEMENT FOR PATHWAYS AND A BUNCH OF OTHER KEY
22 MEASURES THAT I CONSIDER TO BE IMPORTANT FOR EQUITY PRIORITY
23 COMMUNITIES, BECAUSE THAT'S NOT THE JOB OF THIS STUDY AND THAT
24 WILL BE THE JOB OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. BUT THIS STUDY WILL
25 GO INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THEY'RE NOT GOING TO RUN A



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 SEPARATE EQUITY STUDY ON IT FOR THOSE THINGS, BECAUSE WE
2 LOOKED AT SOME EQUITY MEASURES. SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
3 THIS COUNCIL IS AWARE OF THAT. AND I REQUESTED THE STUDY THAT
4 SHOWS THAT VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED WILL BE DECREASED BY
5 CHARGING PEOPLE TO DRIVE ON FREEWAYS. BECAUSE OTHER STUDY THAT
6 WE HAVE LOOKED AT ACTUALLY SHOWS THAT INCREASES IT A BIT
7 BECAUSE PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO DRIVE, HAVE TO GO ON ARTERIAL ROADS
8 AND WE SEE THAT NOW WHEN THE FREEWAY IS BACK UP AND THEY JUST
9 DRIVE ON SIDE STREETS. YOU ALSO SAID THAT OVER HALF OF
10 HOUSEHOLDS WON'T BE IMPACTED, AND THAT IN THE FIRST
11 PRESENTATION YOU GAVE US, YOU SAID THE PEOPLE WHO USE THE
12 FREEWAYS THE MOST ARE PEOPLE WHO LIVE CLOSEST TO THEM, SO THAT
13 WOULD MEAN THE PEOPLE WHO LIVE CLOSEST TO THE FREEWAYS ARE THE
14 PEOPLE WHO ARE IMPACTED THE MOST, AND THAT AT LEAST IN ALAMEDA
15 COUNTY, I'M NOT FAMILIAR WITH THE WHOLE REGIONAL AREA, IS
16 PREDOMINANTLY LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES, AND THERE IS ALSO RACIAL
17 DISPARITIES BETWEEN PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO LIVE CLOSE TO FREEWAYS
18 AND THOSE WHO DON'T. SO I'M JUST CURIOUS, THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT
19 YOU ARE MAKING, LIKE, ARE THOSE FOLKS GOING TO HAVE TO GO ON
20 TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION THAT WE KNOW DOESN'T WORK AT NIGHT?
21 OR WEEKENDS? OR ANY OF THE TIMES TO GET YOUR KIDS TO SCHOOL IN
22 POOR JOBS? OR THAT THEY'RE ENROLLING IN TOLL DISCOUNT PROGRAMS
23 I'M JUST CURIOUS ABOUT ASSUMPTIONS THERE. AND THERE IS ANOTHER
24 SENTENCE ABOUT IMPROVEMENTS THAT TOLLING COULD FUND BUT IN
25 OAKLAND I HAVEN'T SEEN PUBLIC FUNDS GO INTO LOW-INCOME AREAS



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 IDEALS THEY'RE GENTRIFYING IT LIKE THE IMPROVEMENTS THEY DID
2 AROUND THE LAKE EFFECT ON RENT SHOT THROUGH THE ROOF AND
3 MYSELF AND NEIGHBORS GOT DISPLACED AND I WOULD BE INTERESTED
4 TO SEE HOW ALL LANE TOLLING AND ARTERIAL TOLLING DOESN'T
5 AFFECT LOW-INCOME FOLKS NEGATIVELY ALSO THE MAP THAT YOU GAVE
6 US WITH THE DIFFERENT TOOLS BECAUSE IT WAS BASED ON
7 CONGESTION, THERE WAS DIFFERENT TOLLING RATES FOR DIFFERENT
8 ROADS AND THAT FOR 580 WAS ZERO OR VERY LOW, AND THAT FOR 880
9 WAS VERY HIGH. AND I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THE PROPOSED TOLLS
10 ARE ALSO HIGHER IN LOW-INCOME AREAS THAN IN HIGH INCOME AREAS.
11 AND THAT SEEMS BONKERS TO ME. THE OTHER STATEMENT THAT WAS
12 MADE WAS THAT IN THE WORKING GROUP WAS THAT PEOPLE VALUE THEIR
13 TIME AT ABOUT HALF THEIR HOURLY RATE AND THIS ASSUMPTION IS
14 REALLY UPSETTING BECAUSE IT'S ONLY ACCURATE FOR FOLKS IN
15 REGARDS TO EXTENDIBLE INCOME AFTER ALL THEIR NEEDS ARE MET AND
16 RIGHT NOW WE HAVE A WHOLE BUNCH OF PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE THIS
17 EXPENDABLE INCOME RIGHT NOW ALAMEDA COUNTY IS CARE FAIR AND
18 MEDICAL BASELINE ONE IN FIVE HOUSEHOLDS IS IN LEVEL OF POVERTY
19 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT RECOGNIZES WHICH IS WAY LOWER THAN THE
20 BAY AREA RECOGNIZES SO WE DON'T HAVE THAT KIND OF ENROLLMENT
21 IN ANY OF OUR SAFE PROGRAMS OR ANYTHING ELSE AND I WOULD LIKE
22 TO SEE HOW THAT REALITY IS BEING ACCOUNTED FOR IN ANY OF THIS.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WE'RE GOING TO HOLD. THANK YOU. DWAYNE?

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** MY QUESTION IS, OKAY, TO AVOID THE ALL LANE
2 TOLLING, YOU GO TO THE ARTERIAL ROADS, OR THE SIDE STREETS,
3 BUT THAT MEANS NOW THE POT HOLES ON THE SIDE STREETS, THEY'RE
4 GOING TO BE EVEN MORE INCREASED. SO IS THERE, LIKE, SOME KIND
5 OF PLAN THAT WE'RE GOING TO, LIKE, MAKE THE ROADS SAFER? AND,
6 LIKE, WHEN IT'S -- WHEN I'M ROLLING DOWN THE ROAD AND I'M
7 GOING LIKE THIS IN MY CAR, LIKE, IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S
8 GOING TO BE CONSIDERED OR MONEY IS GOING TO BE SET ASIDE
9 BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE TAKE FIX THE ROADS BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE
10 TAKING SIDE ROADS NOW SEEMS LIKE SOMETHING THAT'S GOING HAPPEN
11 LIKE IT OR NOT BUT THE OTHER PART FOR ME WHEN I'M ROLLING DOWN
12 OAKLAND AND IN MY CAR AND THE ROAD IS NEVER FIXED IT'S LIKE
13 THAT FOR 6 TO 8 MONTHS IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO BE
14 STANDARD OR SOMETHING WE'RE GOING TO CONSIDER IN THIS
15 PROPOSAL?

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ADINA?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** WHAT IS A DUAL PRICE LANE?

20

21 **ANUP TAPASE:** THAT IDEA IS MEANT TO BE TWO EXPRESS LANES ACROSS
22 THE FREEWAY NETWORK SO WOULD INVOLVE TAKING ANOTHER GENERAL
23 PURPOSE LANE AND CONVERTING TO AN EXPRESS LANE.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA?



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** CAN YOU REMIND ME, WILL THIS BE APPLIED TO
3 SONOMA COUNTY, SALON -- NAPA COUNTIES, AS WELL? OR IS THIS
4 JUST HERE?

5

6 **ANUP TAPASE:** SO THIS IS LOOKING AT THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA.
7 BUT IN ALL LANE TOLLING, THE TOLL RATES THAT WE HAD IN
8 CORRIDORS IN THE NORTH BAY WAS ZERO, INCLUDING EVEN IN PEAK
9 HOURS BECAUSE THERE WAS NO MAJOR CONGESTION REPEATEDLY.

10

11 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. BECAUSE ONE THING, WHEN YOU SAID --
12 THERE WAS SOMETHING TO THE EFFECT OF MAJORITY -- MAYBE I GOT
13 THIS WRONG -- MAJORITY OF HOUSEHOLDS -- THERE WAS SOMETHING
14 THAT MADE ME FEEL AS IF YOU WERE SAYING THAT THE MAJORITY OF
15 HOUSEHOLDS DON'T COMMUTE ACROSS COUNTIES. MAYBE I GOT THAT
16 WRONG? BUT IT MADE ME WONDER WHERE THOSE NUMBERS WERE COMING
17 FROM. BECAUSE ALL I CAN THINK OF ARE HOW THE PEOPLE I GREW UP
18 WITH, AND THE PEOPLE I WOULD SEE ON THE FREEWAY WHO IS GROW
19 FROM SONOMA COUNTY TO MARIN COUNTY, OR INTO SAN FRANCISCO, OR
20 FROM SOLANO, VALLEJO, INTO MARIN COUNTY. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF
21 THERE IS NUMBERS BEHIND -- I COULD GO BACK INTO THE RECORDING
22 WHEN IT WAS SAID, BUT, YEAH, AND IT JUST -- THAT SPARKED
23 SOMETHING FOR ME. THANK YOU.

24

25 **ANUP TAPASE:** IF I COULD JUST CLARIFY?



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE.

3

4 **ANUP TAPASE:** I DON'T BELIEVE I SAID MAJORITY OF HOUSEHOLDS DO
5 NOT COMMUTE ACROSS COUNTY, I MEANT TO SAY THERE ARE MANY FOLKS
6 THAT DO COMMUTE ONLY WITHIN THEIR COUNTY FOR CLOSE TO WHERE
7 THEY WORK AND LIVE AND DON'T USE FREEWAYS AS MUCH, AND SO THEY
8 WOULD NOT ENCOUNTER THOSE TOLLS AND TOO, TO EXACTLY WHAT YOU
9 SAID, IN NORTH BAY WE HAD CLOSE TO ZERO TOLLS IN MOST OF THOSE
10 FREEWAYS SO ALL THOSE FOLKS WORKING LIVING AND WORKING IN THE
11 NORTH BAY MOVING WITHIN THE NORTH BAY WOULD NOT ENCOUNTER ANY
12 TOLLS UNDER IT, WHEN WE ANALYZED.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE GOING FORWARD
15 WITH THIS PAGE WHAT WE DO OR DO NOT LIKE ON THIS PAGE OR WHAT
16 WE SUPPORT FOR THE ROUND TWO ANALYSIS ALSO. SO, I'M GOING TO -
17 - VEDA, DO YOU HAVE COMMENTS?

18

19 **VEDA FLOREZ:** I DO. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT'S GREAT
20 TO SEE THE CULMINATION OF ALL YOUR WORK COME TOGETHER. AND
21 IT'S INTERESTING, IN THE BAY AREA, WHERE \$110,000 A YEAR IS
22 STILL CONSIDERED LOW-INCOME HOUSING. LOW-INCOME FOR THE NINE
23 BAY AREA COUNTIES. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT MULTI-LANE TOLLING. I
24 THINK THAT THE VERY LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS WILL HAVE
25 DIFFICULTY. AND I KNOW I'M FROM THE NORTH BAY AND TALKED



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 CONTINUOUSLY TO PEOPLE COMING FROM SOLANO COUNTY TO MARIN
2 COUNTY. WE CURRENTLY DON'T HAVE ANY TOLLS ON OUR ROADS OUR
3 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS REALLY PUT AN KIBOSH ON THAT A FEW YEARS
4 BACK NOW WE'RE LOOKING IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO WE'RE
5 LOOKING INTO FUTURE AND ALSO HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE
6 TALKING ABOUT TOLLING ON HIGHWAY 37 SO THAT DEFINITELY WILL
7 IMPACT INDIVIDUALS COMING THIS WAY OR COMING WESTBOUND, I
8 SHOULD SAY. AND THE VERY LOW-INCOME \$3,000 A MONTH HOME PAY
9 AFTER TAXES SO IF YOU'RE PUTTING \$25 A MONTH CAN MAKE A BIG
10 DIFFERENCE ESPECIALLY LOOKING AT 8 TO \$10 DAILY COMING
11 WESTBOUND INTO MARIN COUNTY WILL BE HUGE SO JUST THAT ALONE, I
12 THINK IS SOMETHING TO LOOK AT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** HOWARD?

15

16 **HOWARD WONG:** YES, AS SOMEONE STATED EARLIER, I THINK THE
17 PRESENTATION OF THIS ANALYSIS NEEDS TO BE MUCH MORE PICTORIAL.
18 I THINK WHEN YOU PRESENT ANALYSIS, AND A LOT OF VERBIAGE AND
19 DATA, I THINK MOST PEOPLE JUST HEAR NEW TAX. AND THAT'S
20 PROBABLY ALL THEY HEAR FROM THE PRESENTATION. SO, THE IMAGERY
21 OF THE OUTCOME IS VERY IMPORTANT. CASE STUDIES OF, YOU KNOW,
22 EUROPEAN TOLL ROADS, AND THE HIGH GAS TAXES, HIGH VMT TAXES,
23 WHICH EUROPEANS HAVE PAID FOR DECADES, BUT THEN LOOK AT THE
24 OUTCOME, EVEN VIDEOS SHOWING VERY EFFICIENT ROADS, WHERE THERE
25 ACTUALLY ARE FEWER CARS, BECAUSE THE TOLLS PAY FOR MORE



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 TRANSIT. LESS CARS, LESS CONGESTION HELPS THE ENVIRONMENT. SO,
2 THE PICTORIAL APPROACH TO PRESENTING THE OUTCOME IS MORE
3 IMPORTANT THAN PRESENTING ALL THE DATA. SO, ANYWAY. THANK YOU.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY?

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** NO ADDITIONAL VERBIAGE AT THIS TIME.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY?

10

11 **JOHNNY PARKER:** FOR THE NEXT ROUND OF ANALYSIS, PLEASE TAKE
12 INTO CONSIDERATION THAT THE POOR DO NOT WANT TO BE POOR. THANK
13 YOU.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GERRY?

16

17 **GERRY GLASER:** I'M ALSO ON THE WORKING GROUP. AND I JOINED
18 THAT, WORKING GROUP SAYING I DIDN'T LIKE THE IDEA TO START W
19 SO MY COMMENTS CAN FIT IN THAT COLOR. TO GABRIELA, TWO WEEKS
20 AGO, ON WEDNESDAY AT 630 IN THE MORNING WITH NO ACCIDENTS, I
21 WAS ON HIGHWAY 101 COMING SOUTH IN THE NORTH BAY DOING FIVE
22 MILES AN HOUR. SO I'M NOT SURE -- WE DO HAVE TRAFFIC UP THERE
23 EVEN WITH THE EXPANDED ROAD. FOR THE GROUP HERE, NOT FOR
24 STAFF, I'M DISAPPOINTED IN WHAT WE HAVE GOTTEN SO FAR IN THE
25 STUDY. AND IT'S A GOOD STUDY, BUT THERE IS NO BREAK OUT IDEAS.



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 LOOKING AT THINGS PEOPLE HAVE DONE BEFORE, THEY WORK FOR A
2 WHILE BUT THEN STOP WORKING WE MAY RAISED FUNDS BUT IT'S NOT
3 GOING TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE REFINEMENTS.
4 WHAT I FOUND UNFORTUNATE ABOUT THE STUDY ITSELF AND THIS HAD
5 TO DO WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THE STUDY SAID LET'S LOOK AT
6 TOLLING THESE ROADS THAT'S NOT A SYSTEM'S APPROACH. THE
7 SYSTEMS APPROACH WOULD SAY WE'RE GOING TO DO THIS LOOK AT
8 OTHER THINGS. TO ANYBODY I TALK TO ABOUT THE STUDY, WHAT ARE
9 WE DOING FOR PEOPLE THAT AREN'T ON THE HIGHWAY? WHAT ARE WE
10 GIVING THEM? HOW ARE WE GOING TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN HOW IS THAT
11 GOING TO FIT TOGETHER. ANUP I KNOW YOU'RE BOUND BY WHAT IT IS
12 YOU'RE STUDYING, BUT IT'S FORTUNATE TO HAVE THE STUDY
13 STRUCTURED THIS WAY BECAUSE IT'S NOT GOING TO GIVE US THE
14 RESULT THAT IS GOING TO BE BREAK OUT.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ZELLY? THANK YOU. PAM?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YEAH. SO, I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THE
19 ADVANCED PAYMENT TO VERY LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS A POTENTIAL
20 SOLUTION TO EXPLORE. I WANT TO CIRCLE BACK ON THE USE OF AMI
21 TO IDENTIFY ELIGIBLE FOR THIS BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE THAT'S A
22 SYSTEM THAT HASN'T BEEN WORKING TO ACCURATELY PORTRAY FOLKS
23 WHO HAVE OR DO NOT HAVE INCOME LEVELS TO PAY FOR ADDITIONAL
24 EXPENSES AND I'LL PUT INTO EXAMPLE, OUR UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANT
25 COMMUNITY WHO HAVE VERY DIVERSE TRAVEL HABITS, AND LIMITED



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES. I BELIEVE A LOT OF FOLKS ARE SELF-
2 OWNED, SELF-EMPLOYED SMALL BUSINESS OWNERS. AND SO HAVING TO
3 HAVE THIS HIGH-LEVEL OF INCOME IN THE BAY AREA JUST TO MAKE IT
4 AND NOT BEING ABLE TO QUALIFY FOR LOW-INCOME SERVICES BECAUSE
5 YOU NEED TO MAKE MONEY TO HAVE A ROOF OVER YOUR HEAD AND HAVE
6 FOOD ON THE TABLE. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THINKING ABOUT SMALL
7 BUSINESS OWNERS, ESPECIALLY MINORITY AND WOMEN OWNED SMALL
8 BUSINESS AND IMMIGRANT SMALL BUSINESSES TO MAKE SURE THAT
9 THERE IS A SOLUTION FOR FOLKS WHO HAVE TO TAKE FREEWAYS, IF
10 YOU ARE A GARDENER, A PAINTER, YOU NEED TO MOVE YOUR MATERIALS
11 IN A VEHICLE ACROSS CITIES. AND, SO, I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE
12 THAT. AND THANK YOU.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MY COMMENTS ARE ONE OF THE
15 THINGS THAT I HEARD IN ANOTHER FORUM WAS LOOKING AT SOMETHING
16 LIKE THE FIRST 20 MILES FREE, NON-TOLLING ON FREEWAYS, SIMPLY
17 BECAUSE FOR THOSE OF US IN REALLY DENSELY PACKED URBAN AREAS,
18 IT IS ECONOMICALLY AND ECOLOGICALLY BETTER FOR ME TO JUMP ON A
19 FREEWAY AND NOT HAVE TO TRAVEL 30 MINUTES ACROSS NEIGHBORHOODS
20 TO GET TO MY DESTINATION. I CAN GET TO MY DOWNTOWN AREA IN
21 UNDER TEN MINUTES ON THE FREEWAY. IF I TAKE SURFACE STREETS
22 I'M LOOKING AT PROBABLY 30 MINUTES. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE
23 BALANCING SOME OF THAT. A NEXUS FOR WHATEVER IMPROVEMENTS
24 WE'RE LOOKING AT WITH THESE FUNDS I THINK YOU HEARD THAT,
25 ALSO, TODAY. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. ARE THERE ANY -- DID I



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS? AND IS ANYBODY THAT'S ONLINE,
2 ON THE COUNCIL, DO THEY HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO COUNCIL MEMBERS PARTICIPATING
5 REMOTELY HAVE THEIR HANDS RAISED IN ZOOM, NO MEMBERS OF THE
6 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM, NONE IN THE BOARDROOM
7 SUBMIT A SPEAKER CARD AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND WAS RECEIVED
8 ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT WAS AN
11 INFORMATIONAL ITEM WE'LL LOOK FORWARD TO IT COMING BACK. THANK
12 YOU ANUP. WE'RE GOING TO GO BACK TO ITEM FOUR WHICH I TOTALLY
13 SKIPPED WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT FOR OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS THAT
14 ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA, ANYBODY WHO IS FROM THE GENERAL PUBLIC
15 CAN WEIGH IN ON ANYTHING THAT IS NOT ON THE AGENDA. ARE THERE
16 ANY -- IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
19 ON THIS ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THIS
20 HANDS RAISED IN ZOOM AND NO ONE SUBMITTED A SPEAKER CARD IN
21 THE BOARDROOM.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU THAT TAKES US TO ITEM FIFE C
24 STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I'LL KEEP IT BRIEF. TWO THINGS, YOU MAY
2 ALL HAVE NOTICED THE GENTLEMAN IN THE YELLOW SWEATSHIRT SEATED
3 IN THE PUBLIC, THAT IS MR. ROWLAND WONG WHO IS A NOMINEE TO
4 REPLACE FRANK WELTE ON THIS BODY. IT'S PROVISIONAL. HE NEEDS
5 TO BE CONFIRMED BY THE COMMISSION THIS NEXT MONTH. DON'T
6 EXTEND CONGRATULATIONS YET BUT YOU MIGHT WANT TO INTRODUCE
7 YOURSELF AND SAY HELLO. IF ALL THINGS LINE UP HE'LL BE JOINING
8 YOU NEXT MONTH. OTHER THING IS -- THE OTHER HAT I WEAR AT THE
9 AGENCY, ON THE ACRE TEAM IS HIRING. IN A FEW MOMENTS, YOU WILL
10 HAVE AN E-MAIL IN YOUR INBOX WHICH I ENCOURAGE YOU TO SPREAD
11 TO YOUR NETWORKS FOR A NEW ASSOCIATE POSITION ON INDIGENOUS
12 AND ACCESSIBILITY OUTREACH. SO, I APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT ON
13 THAT.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS ITEM FIVE C WE'LL
16 MOVE TO 5D SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. CHRIS F, DO WE HAVE A REPORT
17 ON EQUITY AND ACCESS?

18

19 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** I'M GOING TO MAKE A VERY SIMPLE REPORT
20 THIS TIME. WE DID THE ELECTIONS, JOHNNY PARKER AND I ARE NOW
21 CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. I AM CHAIR, JOHNNY IS VICE CHAIR. WE DID
22 A LOT OF REVIEWING ITEMS. SORRY. MY WORLD IS GOING ALL OPEN.
23 MY BRAIN IS NOT WORKING. I'M SORRY. DOES SOMEBODY HAVE THE
24 AGENDA THERE? I'M SORRY RANDI.

25



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT'S OKAY. WE CAN JUST TAKE IT AS IS,
2 CHECK THE MINUTES OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.

3

4 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** ANY INFORMATION FOR THE MINUTES?

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** FINE. THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO
7 COUNCIL MEMBER REPORTS. FIVE E, MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL MAY NOW
8 REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. VEDA?

9

10 **VEDA FLOREZ:** WELL, IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE FOR ME TO BE HERE BACK
11 WITH YOU THIS -- TODAY. MY BROTHER PASSED AWAY THIS LAST YEAR,
12 SO I HAVE MISSED MANY MEETINGS AND THERE IS SAY RECOMMENDATION
13 FOR ME TO OFF-BOARD. SO I WANT TO SAY IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE THE
14 LAST 7, 8 YEARS, BEING HERE ON THE COUNCIL. THANK YOU VERY
15 MUCH FOR ALL YOUR INPUT. AND I HOPE THAT THE NEW COUNCIL, YOU
16 ALL, CAN CONTINUE IN MANY BIG FOOTSTEPS FROM THE PAST. SO,
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VEDA. IS THERE ANY ISSUE
20 MICHAEL?

21

22 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** REAL QUICK, I DROVE HERE FROM NAPA THIS
23 MORNING, AND TOOK INTERSTATE 80 FROM 29, 37 TO INTERSTATE 80.
24 THE CORE POOL LANE IS -- PEOPLE THAT ARE WILLING TO TAKE THAT
25 CHANCE ON A \$400 TICKET, I THINK SUPPORTS ALL LANE TOLLING. I



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 COUNTED OVER 100 CARS THAT DID NOT MEET THE QUALIFICATION AND
2 WERE NOT EV, AND PEOPLE JUST RANDOMLY, THAT'S PROBABLY WHY I
3 MADE IT HERE IN AN HOUR AND 15 MINUTES OR SO, JUST BECAUSE IT
4 WAS ALL LANES, ALL FREE-FOR-ALL. AND, SO, TRYING TO MONITOR OR
5 TRYING TO INSTALL A NEW, SORT OF, DISCIPLINE OTHER THAN WHAT I
6 SAW IN YOUR PREVIOUS PRESENTATION IS, I THINK IT'S THE ONLY
7 WAY TO GO. JUST HUNDREDS OF PEOPLE JUST WITHOUT REGARD TO
8 SAFETY OR ANYTHING ELSE, JUST CUTTING OVER, CUTTING BACK, AS
9 NEEDED. AND THAT'S MY COMMENT. THANK YOU.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER COUNCIL MEMBER
12 REPORTS? HOWARD?

13

14 **HOWARD WONG:** JUST WANTED TO BRING UP THIS WEEKEND IS MUNI
15 HERITAGE WEEK IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND IT'S A GOOD CHANCE TO RIDE
16 THE HISTORIC STREET CARS FOR FREE, INCLUDING THE VERY FAMOUS
17 OPEN TOP STREETCAR. AND IT STARTS AT, I THINK 10:00 A.M. TO
18 4:00 P.M. SATURDAY AND SUNDAY AT STUART, EMBARCADERO NEAR THE
19 FERRY BUILDING.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO ITEM
22 FIVE F, WHICH IS NEW BUSINESS. MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL MAY
23 BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO THE FUTURE
24 AGENDA ITEM IS THERE ANYBODY THAT HAS ANY NEW BUSINESS THEY



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 WANT TO ADD TO OUR CALENDAR. YOU CAN ALWAYS E-MAIL ME OR KY-
2 NAM WITH THAT. I SEE NO HAND RAISED.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OH, BEFORE THAT, THERE WAS NO WRITTEN
5 CORRESPONDENCE ON AGENDA ITEMS FIVE C THROUGH FIVE F.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SORRY. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M JUST TRYING TO BEAT THE CLOCK HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEAH. WE'RE ON A TIME CONSTRAINT. ARE
14 THERE ANY MEMBERS IN ZOOM THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON ANY ITEM
15 FROM FIVE C TO FIVE F? GOING ONCE, TWICE? NOBODY ON ZOOM
16 WISHING TO SPEAK. ANY MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO
17 SPEAK ON ANY ITEM FIVE C THROUGH FIVE F? THERE ARE NONE.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MARTHA.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT BRINGS US TO ADJOURNMENT. WE'RE
24 GOING TO TAKE A 15-MINUTE BREAK BETWEEN NOW AND THE EQUITY AND
25 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. WE'LL RECONVENE AT 12:40 P.M. THE NEXT



SEPTEMBER 22, 2023

1 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD FRIDAY
2 OCTOBER 27TH, 2023 AT 10:00 A.M., AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER
3 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE
4 WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED. THANK
5 YOU. [ADJOURNED]
6



NTT

Broadcasting Government