METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, APRIL 24 TH , 2024, 9:35 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE MY NAME IS
6	ALFREDO PEDROZA CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
7	COMMISSION ALONG WITH NICK JOSEFOWITZ, OUR VICE CHAIR. I WOULD
8	LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER. LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM ONE,
9	ROLL CALL, PLEASE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GOOD MORNING. CHAIR PEDROZA.
12	
13	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
16	
17	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?
20	
21	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA? COMMISSIONER
24	CHAVEZ?
25	



1	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE .
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI? EL-TAWANSY IS
4	ABSENT. FLEMING?
5	
6	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: REMOTE PARTICIPATION REQUEST SHORTLY.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. GLOVER?
9	
10	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT.
13	COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT. MOULTON-PETERS?
14	
15	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOACK?
18	
19	SUE NOACK: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
22	
23	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
24	



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? IS ABSENT AT THE
2	MOMENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SPERING?
3	COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU EVERYONE. WE DO
6	HAVE A REQUEST FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B. 2449 JUST
7	CAUSE FROM COMMISSIONER FLEMING AND MAHAN. HOWEVER WE
8	ANTICIPATE COMMISSIONER MAHAN WILL JOIN US CLOSER TO 10:00
9	A.M. I SEE COMMISSIONER FLEMING. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.
10	
11	VICTORIA FLEMING: GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS, I'M REQUESTING
12	TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449, JUST CAUSE, BECAUSE
13	OF AN ILLNESS. THERE IS NOBODY PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER THE
14	AGE OF 18. THANK YOU.
15	
16	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
17	FLEMING, YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED AND WE'RE ADDING YOU AS PRESENT
18	TO THE BUILDING. WHEN COMMISSIONER MAHAN ARRIVES, LET US KNOW
19	SO WE CAN MAKE SURE HE CAN PARTICIPATE. AT THIS POINT LET'S
20	MOVE TO ITEM TWO. IF YOU CAN JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF
21	ALLEGIANCE, PLEASE? [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE
22	ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO
23	THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
24	INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS WE'RE GOING TO 1 2 MOVE TO ITEM THREE, COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING 4 5 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP 6 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A 7 8 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. 9 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, FOR THAT. WE'RE 11 GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR, CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. I'M EAGER

- 12
- TO SEE MANY OF YOU HERE TODAY. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE OUR 13
- COMMISSION WORKSHOP IN SAN JOSE LATER TODAY AND TOMORROW 14
- AFTERNOON. WE HAVE A FULL AGENDA COVERING TOPICS THAT HAVE 15
- 16 BEEN ON THE FOREFRONT OF RECENT POLICY CONVERSATIONS. EVEN
- LATE LAST NIGHT AND CAN BENEFIT FROM A DEEPER DIVE AFFORDED BY 17
- THIS WORKSHOP. WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLORE HOW SB1031 18
- RELATES TO THE CURRENT FUNDING LANDSCAPE. I LOOK FORWARD TO 19
- OUR LIVELY DISCUSSIONS. I LOOK FORWARD TO SPENDING TIME IN SAN 20
- 21 JOSE CITY THAT WE HAVE ALL SPENT A LOT OF TIME IN FOR VERY
- GOOD REASONS. COMMISSIONERS, THESE WORKSHOPS ARE WHAT WE MAKE 22
- IT AND I ENCOURAGE YOU TO KEEP AN OPEN MIND AND DIVE INTO THE 23
- DISCUSSIONS WE'RE ABOUT TO HAVE. I THINK AS REGIONAL BODIES 24
- WORKSHOPS GIVE US A PLATFORM TO ENGAGE IN THOUGHTFUL 25



8

11

13

APRIL 24, 2024

- 1 CONVERSATION. SO, I KNOW THIS WILL BE NO DIFFERENT THAN OUR
 2 PAST WORKSHOPS. SO, NEXT, I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO INVITE YOU ALL,
- 3 AND YOU SHOULD HAVE RECEIVED AN INVITATION TO THE CELEBRATION
- 4 OF LIFE FOR ANNE FLEMER, WHO -- IT WILL BE TAKING PLACE MAY
- 5 23RD HERE AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER IF YOU WOULD LIKE MORE
- 6 INFORMATION REACH OUT TO KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO
- 7 ITEM FIVE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORTS. PAMELA?

9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAMELA IS NOT, MICHAEL BALDINI, VICE CHAIR

10 WILL STEP IN, IN HER PLACE.

12 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MICHAEL BALDINI FROM NAPA VALLEY.

14 MICHAEL BALDINI: GOOD MORNING CHAIR PEDROZA AND COMMISSIONERS

15 IN HER ABSENCE I'LL READ HER REPORT. THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MET

- 16 UPON MARCH 22nd 2021 THE COUNCIL RECEIVED A VERBAL UPDATE ON
- 17 THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE SENATE BILL SB1031
- 18 SUGGESTIONS MADE BY THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TO DEVELOP A
- 19 STRONGER COMMUNICATIONS PLAN TO ADDRESS THE URGENCY FOR THIS
- 20 SOLUTION DEMONSTRATING THE PAST AND FUTURE TANGIBLE LOCALITY
- 21 CHANGES TO THE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE AND BLUEPRINT FOR
- 22 UNIFIED COMMUNITIES TRANSIT SYSTEMS ADDITIONALLY ANY NEW
- 23 REVENUE STREAM MUST HAVE THE TRUST AND SUPPORT OF VOTERS WHICH
- 24 WILL REQUIRE FULL TRANSPARENCY COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT THE
- 25 COUNSELING RECEIVED A PRESENTATION HIGHLIGHTING RELEVANT



- 1 FINDINGS FROM VARIOUS MTC INITIATIVES RELATED TO THE FUTURE
- 2 HIGHWAY INVESTMENT INCLUDING KEY POLICY TRADE OFFS RELATED TO
- 3 RELIABILITY, MOBILITY, EMPLOYMENT AND TRANSIT AND
- 4 AFFORDABILITY. TO SUMMARIZE RESPONSES FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
- 5 COUNCIL NEAR-TERM INVESTMENTS IN THE HIGHWAY SYSTEM SHOULD
- 6 PRIORITIZE COMMUNITY SAFETY AND FOCUS ON CLIMATE RESILIENCE.
- 7 THE NEED FOR COMMUNITY-BASED [INDISCERNIBLE] WAS EMPHASIZED
- 8 ENSURING MOST PHYSICALLY RESPONSIBLE USE OF TAXPAYER FUNDS ON
- 9 VOTER APPROVED PROJECTS. FINALLY EITHER/OR APPROACH TO
- 10 ARTERIALS VERSUS EXPRESS BUS CONVERSATION WAS NOT SUPPORTED.
- 11 AND, INSTEAD, WE RECOMMEND INVESTING IN BOTH AS THEY'RE
- 12 EQUALLY NEEDED BY COMMUNITY MEMBERS GOING TO WORK, SCHOOL,
- 13 APPOINTMENTS AND OTHER PLACES. THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
- 14 SUBCOMMITTEE RECEIVED A TRANSPORT ON THE TRENDS EMERGING FROM
- 15 THE BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY'S LOW-INCOME
- 16 DISCOUNT PILOT ON THE INTERSTATE 880 EXPRESS LANES AFTER SIX
- 17 MONTHS OF OPERATION FEEDBACK FROM THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
- 18 SUBCOMMITTEE WAS POSITIVE RESULTS LOOK PROMISING AND THERE WAS
- 19 INTEREST IN EXPANDING THIS PROGRAM TO OTHER COMMUNITIES
- 20 TRANSIT CORRIDORS. THIS IS ALSO AN UPDATED MTC CARE CYCLE ONE
- 21 POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM. PROPOSED APPROACH FOR
- 22 FISCAL YEAR 2022, 2023, THROUGH 2025, 2026, THE UPDATE WAS
- 23 WELL-RECEIVED BY THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WITH
- 24 STRONG INTEREST IN ENSURING THERE IS FUNDING OPPORTUNITY FOR



COMMUNITY PROJECTS AND INVESTMENTS. THAT'S FROM CHAIR CAMPOS. 1 2 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU MR. BALDINI, DO WE HAVE ANY 4 QUESTIONS FOR MICHAEL? I DO NOT SEE ANY. HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY 5 6 PUBLIC COMMENT? 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I 9 SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH KIMBERLY. MICHAEL 11 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PRESENTATION AND FILLING IN FOR 12 PAMELA. JOB WELL DONE. 13 14 15 MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU. 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ITEM SIX OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S 17 18 REPORT. 19 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA AND COMMISSION IS 20 21 ANDREW FREMIER EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I'LL BE BRIEF TO GET ON 22 WITH THE DAY WE CONTINUE TO BRING NEW FOLKS INTO THE BUILDING 23 COVERING ALL ASPECTS OF WORK HERE PEOPLE COMING INTO THE BAYREN PROGRAM KATHLEEN FULL STRENGTH NOW LAWYER SKILLS AND 24

REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WORK IS BEING SUPPORTED. GOOD TO



- 1 SEE PEOPLE COMING INTO THE BUILDING THE BIGGEST UPDATE HERE
- 2 HAS TO DO WITH ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD ACTION THEY TOOK THURSDAY
- 3 EVENING WHERE THEY ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY A RESOLUTION THAT
- 4 APPROVES BAHFA'S PLACEMENT OF A MEASURE THAT COULD RAISE UP TO
- 5 \$20 BILLION THROUGH THE ISSUANCE OF GENERAL OBLIGATION PONDS
- 6 TO PRODUCE AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS THAT WAS VERY EXCITING AND
- 7 WAS WELL-RECEIVED. I'LL ALSO MENTION THAT ALIX AND I WERE
- 8 JOINED BY ABAG VIP AND BERKELEY MAYOR JESSE ARREQUIN ALONG
- 9 WITH EMERYVILLE COUNCIL MEMBER COURTNEY WELSH AND B.A.R.T.
- 10 DIRECTOR REBECCA SALTZ MAN TO CELEBRATE THE OPENING OF 24 NEW
- 11 DOCKING STATIONS AND 565 NEXT GENERATION DOCK E-BIKES IN THE
- 12 EAST BAY THAT WILL COVER OAKLAND, EMERYVILLE AND EVENTUALLY
- 13 BERKELEY STILL WORKING ON THE FINAL PIECES OF APPROVAL. WE'RE
- 14 GOING TO BE DOWN LATER THIS MONTH IN SAN MATEO COUNTY TO DO
- 15 THE SAME THING AROUND SAN BRUNO AND DALY CITY. PRETTY EXCITING
- 16 PROGRESS THERE. STATE ROUTE 37 RECEIVED A FEDERAL HIGHWAY
- 17 ADMINISTRATION GRANT THAT ALLOWS US TO DO GOOD WORK ON THE
- 18 SEARS POINT TO MARE ISLAND PIECE RESILIENCY WORK ON THE
- 19 CORRIDOR. THAT WAS WELL-RECEIVED IT'S BEEN A LONG TIME COMING,
- 20 AND HAS BEEN A SUCCESSFUL GRANT FOR 37 AND SO A LITTLE STEP
- 21 ALONG THE WAY. FINALLY I WANT TO MENTION WE'RE GETTING READY
- 22 TO GO TO WASHINGTON DC WITH COMMISSIONERS AND SOME ABAG
- 23 MEMBERS THE TRIP IS SCHEDULED FOR MAY 13TH THROUGH 16th WE
- 24 LOOK FORWARD TO A SUCCESSFUL RUN IN WASHINGTON. THAT'S MY
- 25 REPORT HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.



1 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ANY QUESTIONS FOR MR. FREMIER OUR 2 3 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR 6 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR 7 8 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH ANDY. PROCEEDING 10 TO ITEM SEVEN, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? 11 12 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I WANT TO SAY I'M VERY SORRY I 13 WON'T BE ABLE TO MAKE IT TO THIS AFTERNOON'S COMMISSION 14 15 WORKSHOP, UNFORTUNATELY I'LL NEED TO BE BACK IN SAN FRANCISCO 16 FOR A PASSOVER DINNER AND TIMING DIDN'T WORK OUT. I TRUST YOU ALL TO MAKE ALL THE DECISIONS I WOULD ON THE REGIONAL MEASURE. 17 18 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. WE KNOW WHERE YOU STAND. 19 ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 20 21 GINA PAPAN: YEAH, REAL QUICK, I ATTENDED A HUMAN TRAFFICKING 22 ROTARY, YESTERDAY, AT SFO. SO, SADLY THIS IS STILL GOING ON 23 AND IT DOES DEAL WITH TRANSPORTATION AND IT'S SOMETHING WE 24



1	SHOULD ALL BE AWARE OF, AND I AM SURE WE'LL HAVE MORE
2	EDUCATION ON THAT FRONT. THANK YOU.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I'LL
5	GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO SONOMA COUNTY MY SON IS TRAVELING ALL OVER
6	THE STATE FOR SOCCER SO WE GET TO TRAVEL ALL OVER THE STATE,
7	BEING UP IN SONOMA COUNTY AND SEEING SMART BUT THE AMOUNT OF
8	HOUSING BUILT ON THAT CORRIDOR IS EYE OPENING. IT'S GREAT TO
9	SEE PEOPLE MAKING INTERSECTION WITH HOUSING. JOB WELL DONE
10	SONOMA COUNTY. DON'T SEE ANYTHING ELSE ON. CONSENT CALENDAR
11	ITEMS 8A THROUGH J. DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS
12	SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
15	THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
16	AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
17	PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.
18	
19	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: BACK FOR A MOTION.
20	
21	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: MOVE APPROVAL GLOVER.
22	
23	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND?
24	

25

SUE NOACK: SECOND.



1	
2	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA.
5	
6	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
9	
10	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
11	
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?
13	WARGAREE ARE WOOD A AVE
14	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA? CHAVEZ?
17	CLIMA OF THE BOARD. CANDIA. CHAVEZ.
	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
21	
22	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING? COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT
25	AT THE MOMENT. EXCUSE ME. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?



1	
2	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
5	MILEY?
6	
7	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?
10	
11	SUE NOACK: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
14	
15	GINA PAPAN: YES.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING?
18	
19	JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
22	UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO
2	PROCEED TO COMMITTEE REPORTS. FIRST STEP IS ADMINISTRATION
3	COMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
4	
5	GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE ADMIN COMMITTEE MET APRIL
6	10TH, 2024 AND REFERRED THREE ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR
7	APPROVAL OF WHICH ONE WAS ON TODAY'S CONSENT. SO WE'RE ALREADY
8	ON A ROLL HERE. AGENDA ITEM 9A, MTC RESOLUTION 4637 FISCAL
9	YEAR 20 2024, 2025 OVERALL WORK PROGRAM GUIDELINES THAT
10	COLLABORATIVE METROPOLITAN PLANNING PROCESS INVOLVING MTC ABAG
11	THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION AND FEDERAL TRANSIT
12	ADMINISTRATION, CALTRANS, AND OTHER LOCAL TRANSPORTATION
13	PARTNERS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THE REQUEST INCLUDES
14	AUTHORIZATION FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AND
15	EXECUTE COURT REQUIRED CERTIFICATION AND OVERALL PLAN
16	AGREEMENT FOR FEDERAL AND STATE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING GRANTS
17	I MOVE APPROVAL OF RESOLUTION 4637.
18	
19	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY PAPAN.
20	
21	CINDY CHAVEZ: SECOND CHAVEZ.
22	
23	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
24	ITEM?



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOTHING IN WRITING, NO RAISED HANDS.
2	
3	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST PAPAN SECOND CHAVEZ. ROLL CALL.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA.
6	
7	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
10	
11	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?
14	
15	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA? CHAVEZ?
18	
19	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
22	
23	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE PHLEGM.
24	
25	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING? I SEE YES. GLOVER?



1	
2	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
5	
6	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOACK?
9	
10	SUE NOACK: YES.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
13	
14	GINA PAPAN: YES.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING?
17	
18	JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
21	BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
22	
23	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. THANK YOU,
24	COMMISSIONER PAPAN. NOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM



11. THIS IS -- NO. TEN. I'M JUST JUMPING AHEAD ALL RIGHT. 1 2 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS. COMMISSIONER 3 CINDY CHAVEZ: CHAVEZ THANK YOU, CHAIR. THE PROGRAMMING AND 4 5 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET APRIL 10TH, 2024 AND REFERRED SEVEN ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL OF WHICH FIVE ARE ON 6 TODAY'S CONSENT CALENDAR. I WANTED TO THANK STAFF FOR 7 8 CAPTURING THE DIRECTION OF THE DISCUSSIONS OF THE BOARD I 9 THINK THAT'S REFLECTIVE DEMONSTRATING LISTENING APPRECIATE THAT. AGENDA ITEM 10A MTC RESOLUTION 4607 REVISED AND 4637 10 11 ALLOCATES 500 MILLION AND RM3 CAPITAL FUNDS TO SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT AND ALLOCATION AMENDMENT FOR 12 5.6 MILLION IN REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDS CAPITAL FUNDS 37 13 SEARS POINT MARE ISLAND IMPROVEMENT PROJECT MOVE APPROVAL OF 14 15 BOTH OF THEM. 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ. 17 18 19 CINDY CHAVEZ: WE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSION. IF ANYBODY HAS ONE LAST, LET IT OUT. 20

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS

ITEM?

24

23

21



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO MEMBER OF
2	THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MOTION AND SECONDS. ROLL CALL THE
5	VOTE.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PEDROZA.
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
12	
13	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA.
16	
17	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN IS ABSENT. CHAVEZ?
20	
21	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
24	
25	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES.



1 2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING?
3	
4	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
7	
8	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
11	
12	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?
15	
16	SUE NOACK: YES.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? COMMISSIONER
19	SPERING?
20	
21	JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
24	BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. BEFORE I MOVE TO 10B THE REQUEST I 1 WOULD MAKE TO STAFF IS IF WE COULD AGENDAIZE THE DISCUSSION IN 2 3 THE NEXT MONTH WHEN IT COMES BACK TO THE PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE THAT WAS REQUESTED BY THE BOARD AROUND THE CORE CAPACITY 4 5 ISSUES THAT WOULD BE GREAT. 6 ANDREW FREMIER: WE HAVE INVITED BART TO THE JUNE MEETING. THEY 7 8 HAVE BEEN INVITED. BOB POWERS HAS OUR INVITATION AND WE EXPECT 9 HIM TO AT LEAST SEND SOMEBODY IMPORTANT THAT KNOWS BUSINESS. 10 CINDY CHAVEZ: YEAH. THAT WOULD BE A POSITIVE MOVE. LET'S JUST 11 SAY THAT. BUT, ALSO, I THINK IT'S A REALLY EXCITING PROJECT 12 PEOPLE HAVE A LOT OF QUESTIONS ABOUT IT. THANK YOU FOR SENDING 13 THE INVITATION ANYBODY WHO SEES HIM MAY REMEMBER HIM. ALL 14 15 RIGHT. 10B REGIONAL APPROACH PRIORITIZATION PRINCIPLES FOR THE 16 VARIOUS SENATE BILL ONE COMETS TIF PROGRAM NOMINATIONS APPROVES REGIONAL APPROACH PRIORITIZATION SB -- COMPETITIVE 17 GRANT NOMINATIONS INCLUDING SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDORS 18 TRADE CORRIDOR AND ENHANCEMENT LOCAL PROGRAM PARTNERSHIP. I 19 MOVE APPROVAL. 20 21 22 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST CHAVEZ SECOND CANEPA. PUBLIC 23 COMMENT.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOTHING IN WRITING NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
2	WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONERS ANY DISCUSSION? FIRST BY
5	CHAVEZ SECOND CANEPA. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.
12	
13	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AYE.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA.
16	
17	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA? CHAVEZ?
20	
21	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
24	
25	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE FLEMING?



1	
2	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
5	
6	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
9	
10	NATHAN MILEY: WHERE IS.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?
13	
14	SUE NOACK: YES.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
17	
18	GINA PAPAN: YES.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING?
21	
22	JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
25	BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



1	
2	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND THANK YOU
3	COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ FOR CHAIRING A COMMITTEE THAT GETS A LOT
4	OF ACTION AND A LOT OF DISCUSSION. SO WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON
5	TO ANOTHER COMMITTEE THAT GETS A LOT OF ACTION AND DISCUSSION
6	AS WELL, OF THE MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE REPORT BY
7	COMMISSIONER CANEPA.
8	
9	DAVID CANEPA: UNDERSTATEMENT. THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION
10	COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE COMMITTEE MET APRIL
11	12TH, 2024 REFERRED THREE ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL
12	ONE OF WHICH WAS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR: AGENDA ITEM 11 A
13	ASSEMBLY BILL 2485 CARRILLO REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
14	DETERMINATION INCREASES TRANSPARENCY AND USE OF OUTSIDE
15	EXPERTS IN THE STATE DEPARTMENT AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
16	PROCESS FOR DETERMINING REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS. I MOVE
17	SUPPORTED OF 2485.
18	
19	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT FIRST BY CANEPA. AND CHAVEZ.
20	DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EXCUSE ME. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
23	WRITING. I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS
24	RAISED.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT BACK TO THE COMMISSION. 1 2 SEEING NO FURTHER --3 CINDY CHAVEZ: MAY I JUST -- I WANT TO ASK A QUESTION ON THE 4 5 BILL AND MAYBE ASK FOR STAFF'S THOUGHTS ON THIS. I FEEL LIKE ONE CHALLENGE FOR MTC IS THAT YOU GET IN THE MIDDLE OF LAND 6 FUSED BETWEEN ALL OF OUR COUNTIES AND OUR CITIES. AND I WONDER 7 8 IF THERE HAS BEEN ANY MOVEMENT ON BILLS THAT WOULD CLEAR UP YOUR ROLE AND YOUR ABILITY TO -- I'M PARTICULARLY THINKING 9 ABOUT COUNTY VERSUS CITY YOU HAVE SEEN LEGISLATION LIKE THAT 10 ON THE HORIZON OR SOMETHING THAT STAFF WOULD THINK ABOUT 11 MONITORING IN THE FUTURE. 12 13 REBECCA LONG: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, WITH RHNA ABAG IS 14 15 RESPONSIBLE FOR ADOPTING THE ALLOCATION TO CITIES AND 16 COUNTIES. IN THE PROCESS -- IN THE LAST RHNA PROCESS, WE DID HAVE A NUMBER -- I FORGET THE EXACT TERM, BUT, ESSENTIALLY, 17 PROTEST, AS TO WHAT THE ALLOCATION WAS. AND THERE WAS A FORMAL 18 HEARING MECHANISM THAT ABAG HOLDS TO CONSIDER, RIGHT, HOW THIS 19 DISTRIBUTION IS BEING DEVELOPED AND THERE WAS RIGOROUS PROCESS 20 21 FOR ADOPTING THE METHODOLOGY SO THAT'S JUST KIND OF TO SHARE THE CURRENT PROCESS FOR RESOLVING THE CONFLICT. 22 23 CINDY CHAVEZ: YEAH I'M SPEAKING OF SOMETHING ELSE. FIRST OF 24

ALL, I THINK RHNA -- THE STATE COMMITTEE HAVING MORE INPUT IS



- 1 REALLY HELPFUL. BECAUSE WE HAVE A LOT OF NEW PEOPLE. MOST OF
- 2 THEM HAVEN'T BEEN ON PLANNING STAFF MOST HAVEN'T DEVELOPED
- 3 PROPERTY SO UNDERSTANDING THE MECHANICS OF THAT IS VERY
- 4 CHALLENGING. BUT I WAS ACTUALLY SPEAKING ABOUT ONCE ADOPTED,
- 5 THOSE NUMBERS REFLECT THE PROPERTIES THAT ARE DEVELOPABLE IN
- 6 CITIES AND COUNTIES AND UNINCORPORATED AREAS AND INCORPORATED
- 7 AREAS. MOST OF US BECAUSE OF LAFCO AS SOON AS SOMETHING GETS
- 8 DEVELOPED MOVE IT INTO THE CITY THAT'S PROXIMATE TO WHAT WE
- 9 WANT BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT GREENFIELD DEVELOPMENT THE PROBLEM
- 10 IS THE NUMBERS HAVE BEEN ASSIGNED WITH ASSUMPTION. THE
- 11 IMPLICATION IS WE'LL HAVE SOME ENTITY UNDERPERFORMING BASED ON
- 12 ALTERNATIVE LAND USES AND/OR DISTRIBUTES OVER WHO COUNTS THOSE
- 13 ALLOCATIONS. WHAT I'M REOUESTING IS STAFF COULD CONSIDER NOT
- 14 NECESSARY FOR THIS SESSION BUT AN EVALUATION OF WHERE CITIES
- 15 AND COUNTIES ARE HAVING TROUBLE WITH THE CURRENT PROCESS SO
- 16 THAT WILL ALLOW IF APPROPRIATE TO RESPOND TO BILLS THAT WILL
- 17 ALLOW CLARITY. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT MTC BEING CAUGHT IN THE
- 18 CROSSFIRE AND HAVING TO DISPOSE OR ARBITRATE THESE AGREEMENTS.
- 19 AND I THINK IF RHNA IS GOING TO USE A PARTICULAR METHODOLOGY
- 20 THEN THE ASSIGNED RESPONSIBILITY SHOULD STAY IN THAT
- 21 FRAMEWORK. IF THAT'S NOT THE CASE AND MAYBE THERE IS GOOD
- 22 REASON NOT TO BE, I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO TAKE A LOOK AT THAT
- 23 AND ANY CONCERN THAT YOU HAVE SO WE'RE LEADING ON WHAT KIND OF
- 24 CHANGES WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN LEGISLATION INSTEAD OF BEING



RECIPIENT. WHEN RHNA IS ATTACHED. THAT'S WHAT MY REQUEST WOULD 1 2 BE. 3 ANDREW FREMIER: WE'LL CONTINUE OUR GOOD LISTENING SKILLS AND 4 5 GET BACK TO YOU WITH SOME GOOD RESPONSE. [LAUGHTER] 6 7 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 8 9 GINA PAPAN: I THINK WHAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS SAYING IS VERY IMPORTANT HERE AND EVERY JURISDICTION IS NOT THE SAME. AND 10 CLARIFICATION HELPS US ALL DO WHAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO DO HERE. 11 YOU REFER TO THINGS AS A PROTEST. WE REFER TO IT AS 12 CLARIFICATION. [LAUGHTER] YES. MISUNDERSTANDING. CHAVEZ. 13 14 CINDY CHAVEZ: KERFUFFLE. 15 16 GINA PAPAN: YES. MY FAVORITE, OF COURSE, IS COLMA BEING THE 17 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE SO LET'S BE CAREFUL HOW WE EVALUATE 18 19 THINGS OPEN PARTNERSHIP COMMUNICATION IS IMPORTANT HELPING US REALLY ACHIEVE WHAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE HERE SO I AGREE WITH 20 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. CANNOT HAVE ONE SIZE FITS ALL. MOVING 22 AHEAD LEGISLATION WOULD HELP US TO CLARIFY.



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT SEEING NO FURTHER
2	DISCUSSION. WE ALREADY TOOK PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS.
3	COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
4	
5	DAVID CANEPA: OKAY THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND. RIGHT?
6	
7	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD:
10	
11	DAVID CANEPA: ROLL CALL PLEASE? DID WE APPROVE IT?
12	
13	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GO AHEAD. PROCEED.
14	
15	DAVID CANEPA: OKAY.
16	
17	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: OH YOU [LAUGHTER]
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR PEDROZA? IS YES. JOSEFOWITZ.
20	
21	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?
24	

25

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA?
3	
4	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ? THAT WAS A YES FOR CHAVEZ. DUTRA-
7	VERNACI?
8	
9	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING?
12	
13	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
16	
17	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
18	
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
20	
21	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?
24	CHE NOTOR MEG
25	SUE NOACK: YES.



1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN? 3 GINA PAPAN: YES. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING? 6 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: YES. 9 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 11 12 DAVID CANEPA: THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM B REGIONAL 13 14 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION SB1031 WIENER 15 WAHAB, MEASURE AUTHORIZING A BILL -- BEFORE WE GET TO REBECCA 16 LONG, I WANT TO RECOGNIZE MAYOR SCHAFF. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF HAS JOINED US. THANK YOU FOR JOINING US. REBECCA? 17 18 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA, COMMISSIONERS. 19 THANK YOU. THE TECH TEAM IS OUICK ON THE DRAW. SO, I'LL BE 20 21 BRIEF HERE. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF ACTIVITY ON THIS BILL 22 INCLUDING THE FIRST HEARING YESTERDAY IN THE SENATE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE I'M GOING TO PRESENT THE RECOMMENDED 23 AMENDMENTS THAT THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE ENDORSED ABOUT A 24

WEEK AGO AND THEY'RE NOW IN PRINT. I'M GOING TO QUICKLY WALK



- 1 THROUGH THAT AND COMPARE IT TO WHAT THE COMMISSION DIRECTED
- 2 STAFF TO PURSUE IN JANUARY. AND WE'LL GO FROM THERE. NEXT
- 3 SLIDE. SO, JUST A RECAP OF THE COMMISSION'S CORE OBJECTIVES IN
- 4 SPONSORING THIS BILL. AND THOSE WERE TO SUSTAIN AND IMPROVE
- 5 TRANSIT AND ADDRESS THE TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CLIFF AND
- 6 ALSO IMPROVE TRANSIT ACROSS THE REGION TO FOCUS ON THE RIDERS
- 7 AND ACCELERATE THE BAY AREA TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
- 8 BY STRENGTHENING OUR NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY IN THE
- 9 ENABLING LEGISLATION IN ADVANCE OF A MEASURE AND THEN FINALLY
- 10 TO IMPROVE MOBILITY FOR ALL USERS, AND THE IMPORTANCE OF THERE
- 11 BEING A BALANCED EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT ALSO ADDRESSES LOCAL
- 12 ROAD REPAIRS, ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION AND MOBILITY IMPROVEMENTS
- 13 AND TO ACHIEVE SOME FORM OF GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE. NEXT SLIDE SO,
- 14 THIS IS A CHART THAT'S BEEN COMPARING, AGAIN, WHAT THE
- 15 COMMISSION'S JANUARY FRAMEWORK DOES WITH WHAT'S NOW IN THE
- 16 CURRENT VERSION WAS THE BILL. IT WAS AMENDED A WEEK AGO
- 17 YESTERDAY. JUST TO REALLY SHOW THAT THERE IS A LOT OF
- 18 CONSISTENCY BETWEEN THE COMMISSION'S JANUARY ACTION AND NOW
- 19 CERTAINLY WITH WHAT WAS ADOPTED BY THE LEG COMMITTEE AND
- 20 WHAT'S IN THE BILL. SO, ON THE GOALS, THE EXPENDITURE
- 21 PRIORITIES, EXCUSE ME -- THOSE ARE CONSISTENT. THE FUNDING
- 22 DISTRIBUTION, IN JANUARY, WE RECOMMENDED THAT, YOU KNOW, WE
- 23 TAKE MORE TIME TO THINK ABOUT WHAT ARE THE MINIMUM PERCENTAGES
- 24 IN THE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES, THE JANUARY -- EXCUSE ME -- THE
- 25 LEG COMMITTEE TOOK ACTION ON AN EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK THAT'S



- 1 NOW IN THE BILL AND THAT'S WHAT I'M GOING TO WALK THROUGH IN
- 2 THE MOMENT. THE MOST SIGNIFICANT COMPONENT OF THE BILL THAT
- 3 WAS NOT ENDORSED BY THE COMMISSION IS THE CONSOLIDATION
- 4 ASSESSMENT AND REPORT AND I WOULD NOTE THAT THE BILL MADE SOME
- 5 AMENDMENTS LAST WEEK. THEY ARE SOMEWHAT REFLECTIVE OF THE
- 6 AMENDMENTS THAT THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED, BUT NOT
- 7 ENTIRELY. SO, WE DO THINK THAT THERE IS FURTHER WORK TO DO
- 8 THERE. AND THEN, THE LANGUAGE RELATED TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT,
- 9 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT AND REVENUE OPTIONS IS
- 10 LARGELY CONSISTENT WITH THE COMMISSION'S JANUARY ACTION.
- 11 HOWEVER, ON THE REVENUE OPTIONS, IT IS IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT
- 12 THE INCOME TAX, WAS REMOVED AS WELL AS THE VEHICLE MILES
- 13 TRAVELED CHARGE. THOSE WERE BOTH NOT INCLUDED IN THE
- 14 LEGISLATION, ESSENTIALLY, FOR CONCERNS ABOUT POLITICAL
- 15 VIABILITY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES THAT ARE
- 16 NOW IN THE BILL AND AGAIN WERE ENDORSED BY THE LEG COMMITTEE
- 17 ARE THREE CORE CATEGORIES, TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WHICH
- 18 INCLUDES TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF, AS
- 19 WELL AS FUNDING TO IMPROVE TRANSIT, INCLUDING ZERO-EMISSIONS
- 20 TRANSIT TRANSITION. STATE STREETS WHICH IS PROPOSED SUBVENTION
- 21 PROGRAM THAT GOES BACK TO COUNTIES PROPORTION TO THE TAX
- 22 AMOUNT GENERATED THAT'S FOR LOCAL STREETS AND ROAD REPAIRS ET
- 23 CETERA IMPROVING BIKE SAFETY THEN THERE WAS THE CONNECTIVITY
- 24 PROGRAM MULTI-MODAL INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM DEVELOPED BY MTC IN
- 25 PARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WITH EACH COUNTY



- 1 GUARANTEED A SHARE IN PROPORTION TO THEIR CONTRIBUTIONS IN
- 2 TERMS OF BENEFITS. AND THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH THE PLANNED BAY
- 3 AREA 2050+. I'LL HIGHLIGHT REFERENCED IN TODAY'S AND
- 4 TOMORROW'S ITEM WORKSHOP THIS IS THE PROGRAM WHERE ANY KIND OF
- 5 HIGHWAY PROJECT WOULD BE ELIGIBLE THEN LASTLY FLEXIBLE PROGRAM
- 6 THIS IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO ACHIEVING THE GOALS THAT I
- 7 MENTIONED IN THE LAST SLIDE TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF TO
- 8 ENSURE GEOGRAPHICAL BALANCE RETURN TO SOURCE. THE FLEX
- 9 PROGRAM, WE MAKE SURE WE ACHIEVE MINIMUM 70% RETURN TO SOURCE
- 10 IN TERMS OF BENEFIT BACK TO COUNTY AND SO IN SOME CASES,
- 11 RIGHT, A COUNTY IS GOING TO RECEIVE A LOT MORE TRANSIT
- 12 TRANSFORMATION FUNDS BECAUSE OF THEIR SHARE OF ANY FISCAL
- 13 CLIFF IN OTHER CASES, THE COUNTY IS GOING TO RECEIVE A LOT
- 14 MORE FLEXIBLE FUNDING TO BRING THEM UP TO THAT MINIMUM 70%.
- 15 NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK THAT IS NOW
- 16 INCORPORATE UNDERSTAND IN THE BILL AND WAS APPROVED BY THE LEG
- 17 COMMITTEE IS, YOU KNOW, IS ILLUSTRATED HERE IN TERMS OF THE
- 18 PROGRAM. AND, ESSENTIALLY, THERE IS A 45% MINIMUM FROM THE
- 19 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION CATEGORY, AND IT'S PROPOSED TO BE SPLIT
- 20 40% BY FORMULA AND THE FORMULA THERE IS GOING BACK TO THE
- 21 COUNTIES IN PROPORTION TO THE SHARE GENERATED. SO, BASICALLY
- 22 RETURN TO SOURCE. AND THEN 60% DISCRETIONARY. I'LL JUST
- 23 CLARIFY, WHEN WE SAY BACK TO THE COUNTIES, THIS ISN'T A
- 24 DIRECT, THIS IS ESSENTIALLY A POT OF FUNDS THAT HAS THE
- 25 COUNTY'S NAME ON IT SIMILAR TO TDA, WHERE THAT PORTION OF THE



- 1 FUNDING WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO THAT COUNTY, BUT IT COULD BE
- 2 USED ON DIFFERENT OPERATORS WITHIN THAT COUNTY THEN THE
- 3 DISCRETIONARY PORTION IS ESSENTIAL TO GETTING US TO ADDRESS
- 4 THOSE TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS. SO, THAT WOULD BE
- 5 ALLOCATED BY MTC RELATIVE TO THE NEED, AS WELL AS ADDRESSING
- 6 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, ASSUMING FUNDING IS LEFT OVER. SAFE
- 7 STREETS 25% FOR THAT AND 15% FOR CONNECTIVITY AND 15% FOR THE
- 8 FLEX PROGRAM. THE LAST ITEM TDM MANDATE IS THE ESTIMATE
- 9 REVENUE THAT WOULD BE GENERATED FOR TRANSIT FROM MANDATE ON
- 10 EMPLOYERS THAT ARE LOCATED NEAR TRANSIT THAT THEY PROVIDE A
- 11 SUBSIDY PER EMPLOYEE AND THAT THOSE FUNDS WOULD ESSENTIALLY
- 12 FUND A TRANSIT PASS FOR THOSE EMPLOYEES IF THAT ISN'T USED THE
- 13 FUNDS WOULD ROLLOVER AND BE AVAILABLE TO MTC FOR PROGRAMMING
- 14 FOR TRANSIT PURPOSES. YOU CAN SEE THAT WE HAVE TWO COLUMNS
- 15 HERE, ONE AT 1.5 BILLION, 1 AT 1 BILLION, SO, ESSENTIALLY IT'S
- 16 EASY MATH THERE. THE CHALLENGE, THOUGH, IS THAT WE'RE TRYING
- 17 TO SOLVE FOR SOME VERY SPECIFIC NEEDS THAT DON'T CHANGE IN THE
- 18 TWO SCENARIOS, AND SO WHAT YOU ENDS UP WITH IS A LOT LESS
- 19 DISCRETION FOR THE COMMISSION. BECAUSE IN ORDER TO REACH THOSE
- 20 70% RETURN TO SOURCE, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE FEWER FUNDS
- 21 AVAILABLE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS REALLY GETS AT THAT LAST
- 22 POINT. I THINK JUST LOOKING AT THE TOP BAR THERE, THAT'S THE
- 23 1.5 BILLION, YOU CAN SEE THE RED REGIONAL FLEX, THAT'S THE
- 24 PORTION OF FUNDS THAT THE COMMISSION WOULD HAVE TO
- 25 REDISTRIBUTE ACCORDING TO REGIONAL PRIORITY. IT'S PRETTY MUCH



1	GONE INTO A \$1 BILLION SCENARIO BECAUSE YOU NEED TO USE THAT
2	ORANGE CATEGORY, THE FLEX THAT'S GOING BACK TO COUNTIES TO
3	GUARANTEE THAT MINIMUM 70% RETURN TO SOURCE. BUT YOU CAN SEE,
4	AGAIN, THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATING GAP, THAT BLUE BAR, THAT'S
5	THE SAME UNDER BOTH SCENARIOS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, CONSISTENT WITH
6	THE LEG COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION, THAT'S WHAT WAS ADOPTED AND
7	COMMUNICATED, USING OUR URGENCY PROCEDURES TO THE AUTHOR. SO,
8	THAT WAS TO ENDORSE THE CONSOLIDATION STUDY AMENDMENTS. AGAIN,
9	THE BILL HAS BEEN AMENDED TO ADDRESS THIS, BUT WAS NOT
10	ENTIRELY CONSISTENT WITH OUR RECOMMENDATION. ENDORSE THE
11	EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK AND ENDORSE SOME GUARDRAILS THAT WERE
12	DEVELOPED TO ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATOR CONCERNS WHERE THE BILL
13	DOES STRENGTHEN THE COMMISSION'S NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY.
14	THIS WAS DEVELOPED IN COORDINATION WITH THE OPERATORS TO
15	REASSURE THEM, YOU KNOW, THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE TOTAL
16	CONTROL OF THEIR SERVICE PLANNING OR THEIR BUDGET. AND WITH
17	THAT, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR
18	
19	DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. CHAIR PEDROZA?
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. SO, IN
22	LIGHT OF WHAT WE HAVE SEEN AND HOW THIS HAS PROGRESSED AND
23	IT'S PROGRESSED QUICKLY, EVEN AS LATE AS LAST NIGHT. I WANT TO
24	RECOMMEND THAT WE DEFER TO TAKE ACTION AS WE CONTINUE TO WORK

WITH AUTHORS AND WE CONTINUE TO HEAR CONCERNS FROM



- 1 COMMISSIONERS AROUND WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. I THINK
- 2 THIS ALLOWS US TO CONTINUE TO HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS I KNOW
- 3 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE MORE CONVERSATIONS IT'S THE WORKSHOP SO
- 4 THIS PRESERVES THAT OPPORTUNITY. I WANT TO THANK SENATOR
- 5 WIENER WHO HAS BEEN A STAUNCH SUPPORTER OF TRANSIT, ALONG WITH
- 6 OTHER LEGISLATORS BUT HE'S SOMEONE WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
- 7 CLOSELY WITH. I WAS TALKING LAST NIGHT AROUND THIS AS WELL, WE
- 8 HAVE AS AMENDMENTS COME UP WITH URGENCY ALLEGE THE LEG
- 9 COMMITTEE MAKING SURE WE CONTINUE TO HEAR FROM COMMISSIONERS.
- 10 THIS ALLOWS US TO LEVEL SET THE DISCUSSION. THAT'S SOMETHING I
- 11 WOULD PUT ON THE TABLE BUT HAPPY TO HEAR FROM COMMISSIONERS.

12

- 13 GINA PAPAN: I COMPLETELY AGREE. I'M SORRY. [LAUGHTER] I
- 14 COMPLETELY AGREE WITH THE CHAIR. CERTAIN AMENDMENTS WERE MADE
- 15 LAST NIGHT THAT ARE CONCERNING. AND I THINK GO AWAY FROM WHAT
- 16 WE TRIED TO EMPHASIZE HERE, AS FAR AS COORDINATION AND, YOU
- 17 KNOW, JUST SAYING CONSOLIDATION AND THROWING COORDINATION
- 18 UNDER THERE, IS, SO -- WE'RE GETTING ALL THE DETAILS HERE BUT
- 19 I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH THE CHAIR, THIS IS PREMATURE AND WE
- 20 NEED TO TALK THIS OUT FURTHER.

21

- 22 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
- 23 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA THEN COMMISSIONER MILEY.



- 1 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU CHAIR, AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR
- 2 RECOMMENDATION. I AGREE I WANTED TO UNDERSTAND THE PROCESS
- 3 MOVING FORWARD YOU MENTIONED THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. I'M
- 4 NOT ON THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, SO WE DO USE THE WHOLE --
- 5 IT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE WHOLE COMMISSION, I BELIEVE, TO DISCUSS
- 6 THIS AND TAKE A POSITION, AS NECESSARY. SO, JUST LOOKING FOR
- 7 THAT TIMELINE. I KNOW THIS IS MAKING IT -- MADE IT THROUGH
- 8 COMMITTEE YESTERDAY, THE OTHER COMMITTEE IS HAPPENING NOW. SO,
- 9 I DON'T KNOW HOW WE'RE GOING TO SCHEDULE THIS.

11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YEAH COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. THAT'S A

- 12 GREAT POINT. AND PART OF IT IS, I HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR FROM
- 13 MANY OF US WE DON'T WANT TO FEEL LIKE WE'RE HANGING OFF THE
- 14 BUMPER AND ARE TRYING TO GET AHEAD OF IT, THERE ARE THINGS WE
- 15 CONTROL IN TERMS OF WHAT HAPPENS WE ARE THE SPONSOR OF THIS
- 16 AND NEED TO MAKE SURE FOLKS UNDERSTAND THAT. THERE IS
- 17 OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE FULL DISCUSSION. WE OBVIOUSLY WANT TO HAVE
- 18 THAT AND MAYBE STAFF CAN TALK ABOUT THE TIMELINE. I THINK WHAT
- 19 I WOULD OFFER IS WHILE WE MAY BE THE NOT BE ON THE LEG
- 20 COMMITTEE YOU'RE INVITED. THERE IS OPPORTUNITY AND TIMELINES
- 21 WE CONTROL AND DON'T CONTROL. JUST KNOW THAT THOSE WE CONTROL
- 22 HAVING COMMISSION PARTICIPATE AND GET FEEDBACK.
- 24 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: WE HAVE A WORKSHOP COMING UP. CAN WE
- 25 ACTUALLY PUT OUT --

23



1 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING THAT AT THE 2 3 WORKSHOP. 4 5 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THESE ARE OUR CONDITIONS OR WHATEVER YOU WANT TO CALL THEM AND WE WILL SUPPORT IT -- IF THEY ALL 6 7 INCLUDED --8 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: TIMELINE -- I APPRECIATE IT. 10 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. 11 12 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: WE DON'T WANT TO NEGOTIATE AGAINST 13 OURSELVES AND WE WANT TO STRUCTURE THE WORKSHOP IN A WAY THAT 14 WE CAN ALL TALK ABOUT THESE ARE THE THINGS THAT WE WANT TO SEE 15 16 TO BE SUPPORTIVE. RIGHT? AND I HOPE THAT'S WHAT WE ACCOMPLISH AT THE WORKSHOP, AND I CONFER WITH STAFF. 17 18 KATHLEEN KANE: TO CLARIFY IT'S SET UP FOR DISCUSSION BUT WILL 19 NOT BE AN ACTION ITEM AT THE WORKSHOP. SO STAFF WILL BE ABLE 20 TO HEAR WHERE THE CONSENSUS IS DEVELOPING AND WORK ON THAT. 21 22 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: CORRECT.



ANDREW FREMIER: COMMISSIONER IF I COULD, WE HAVE A LOT OF 1 INFORMATION YOU HAVE ASKED FOR RELATIVE TO SET UP. SO THE 2 3 AFTERNOON STARTS WITH A DEEP DIVE INTO FUNDING DISCUSSIONS AND THERE IS PLENTY OF TIME TO ALSO ADDRESS OTHER CONCERNS IN 4 5 1021, SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO THAT. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ALL YOUR FEEDBACK, ESPECIALLY AFTER YOU GET TO THE FINISH LINE WHICH IS 6 ALSO UNDERSTANDING THE PRESSURES ON THE BRIDGE TOLL ENTERPRISE 7 8 AND THEN COME BACK AT THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE. REBECCA MIGHT BE ABLE TO ADD ABOUT THE SACRAMENTO 9 10 PROCESS, AS WELL. 11 REBECCA LONG: THANKS ANDY. I MEAN, AN IMPORTANT PIECE I WOULD 12 SHARE, YOU KNOW, AS THE SPONSORS OF THE BILL, WE HAVE MANY 13 OPPORTUNITIES TO COMMUNICATE OUR CONCERNS, AND I THINK, YOU 14 15 KNOW, IT WILL BE TAKEN VERY SERIOUSLY IF THE COMMISSION, YOU 16 KNOW, ASKS FOR CERTAIN THINGS, SUGGESTS THAT WE CAN'T LIVE WITH THE BILL IN CERTAIN FORMAT, JUST TO SHARE THE TIMELINE, 17 THE BILL DOES -- TODAY IT'S BEING HEARD IN THE REVENUE AND 18 TAXATION COMMITTEE WE ANTICIPATE IT WILL PASS THERE. THE IT'S 19 GOING TO THE APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE. IT NEEDS TO GET OUT OF 20 21 THAT BY MID-MAY AND NEEDS TO PASS THE SENATE FLOOR BY MAY 24TH. SO, YOU KNOW, IF IT MOVE IN ITS CURRENT FORMAT OR 22 SOMETHING THAT WE'RE NOT ENTIRELY COMFORTABLE WITHOUT OF THE 23 SENATE, THERE WILL BE A LOT OF DISCUSSION IN THE ASSEMBLY. SO 24

I WANT TO REASSURE THE COMMISSION THAT THERE IS NOT A DEADLINE



COMING UP IN THE NEXT WEEK WHERE WE HAVE NO ABILITY TO WEIGH 1 2 IN. 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MILEY THEN 4 5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. 6 7 NATHAN MILEY: SURE. WILL WE BE DISCUSSING THIS TODAY. 8 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES. 10 NATHAN MILEY: GREAT. I'LL BE AT THE WORKSHOP TODAY. I PROBABLY 11 CAN'T MAKE IT TOMORROW. FIRST THING. SECOND THING, I DO 12 APPRECIATE RETURN TO SOURCE THAT I'M HEARING. IN ALAMEDA, 13 WE'RE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. THIRDLY, THE -- I WOULD LIKE 14 15 TO GET SOME MORE INFORMATION, HOPEFULLY THIS AFTERNOON, ON THE 16 RATIONALE BETWEEN CONSOLIDATION AND COORDINATION. OKAY? AND THEN THE FOURTH THING IS, WHAT'S THE FOURTH THING? [LAUGHTER] 17 OH YES. THIS IS JUST FOR EXISTING TRANSIT. IT'S NOT FOR NEW 18 DEVELOPMENT TRANSIT, LIKE VALLEY LINK, RIGHT? 19 20 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER MILEY. SO, THE WAY THAT 21 THE STRUCTURE IS PROPOSED, SOME OF THE FUNDS WOULD FLOW BY 22 FORMULA TO A COUNTY, SUCH AS ALAMEDA COUNTY, THEN THERE WOULD 23 BE A DECISION MADE HOW TO DISTRIBUTE THOSE FUNDS. SO IT 24

DOESN'T HAVE THE NAME OF AN OPERATOR ON ANY OF THE FUNDING. SO



VALLEY LINK COULD POTENTIALLY BE ELIGIBLE, BUT IT WOULD BE 1 COMPETING AGAINST ALL THE OTHER SERVICES. 2 3 NATHAN MILEY: GOT YOU. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? 6 7 8 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. JUST A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS I WANT TO MAKE. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES -- I DID HAVE A CHANCE TO LOOK 9 10 AT THE MATERIALS FOR THIS AFTERNOON, AND I THINK THAT WE -- I THINK THERE ARE THREE AREAS THAT I WOULD REQUEST THAT THERE IS 11 MUCH MORE CLARITY ON. ONE IS THAT SOMETIME AGO, YOU GAVE US A 12 REALLY GOOD CHART THAT SHOWED THE FISCAL CLIFF, LIKE, HE'S 13 WHAT BART IS GOING TO NEED EACH YEAR, MUNI IS GOING TO NEED 14 15 EACH YEAR, CALTRAIN AND AC TRANSIT ARE GOING TO NEED IN 16 REVENUE. I WANT TO MAKE SURE, I DIDN'T SEE IT IN MY MATERIAL I WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S PRESENTED COLLEAGUES ONE OF THE THINGS 17 I'M CONCERNED ABOUT WITH THE BILL IS THE BILL IS TRYING TO 18 SOLVE MANY, MANY PROBLEMS AND I JUST WANT TO KNOW WHAT DO OUR 19 ALLIES NEED. BECAUSE, FRANKLY, I'M NOT COMFORTABLE WITH THE 20 BILL, EVEN A LITTLE. IF WE VOTE ON IT TODAY, I WOULD BE VOTING 21 NO, FOR A WHOLE BUNCH OF REASONS THAT I WILL BORE YOU WITH 22 THIS AFTERNOON. I THINK WE HAVE COME OFTEN THE MARK ON, WHAT'S 23 THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE. BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE THERE 24

IS A WINDOW OF OPPORTUNITY AND EVERYBODY IS TRYING TO SHOVE



- 1 THEIR PARTICULAR GOALS, INITIATIVES, AND IT'S VERY CONFUSING.
- 2 SO THAT'S ONE ISSUE. THE SECOND ISSUE IS THAT, ANDY, YOU AND I
- 3 SPOKE, AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT YOU SAID THAT I THOUGHT WAS
- 4 REALLY CRITICAL WAS THAT SOME OF THE INFORMATION THAT CAME OUT
- 5 OF VTA, IN PARTICULAR, AROUND -- I THINK IT WAS AROUND A
- 6 SHIFTING OF ROLES OR CONTROL. CAN'T REMEMBER THE EXACT TOPIC,
- 7 BUT YOU WERE SAYING, LOOK THAT'S NOT REPRESENTING WHAT WE'RE
- 8 SAYING. AND I WOULD LOVE CLARITY ON WHAT WE LEGALLY -- WHAT
- 9 CAN WE LEGALLY DO TODAY VERSUS WHAT DOES THE BILL SAY. BECAUSE
- 10 FRANKLY, WHEN I HEARD REBECCA, AND I DID HEAR SOME OF THE
- 11 HEARING LAST NIGHT, ONE WAS THE FIRST THINGS REBECCA MENTIONED
- 12 WAS OVERSIGHT AND CONTROL AND IT STRUCK ME AS OPPOSITE OF THE
- 13 DISCUSSION AND FRANKLY WHAT VTA IS RAISING AS A CONCERN BUT
- 14 THERE MAY BE A NUANCE THERE I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE ALL
- 15 UNDERSTAND IT BEFORE WE DECIDE YEA OR NAY. BECAUSE I KNOW
- 16 COORDINATION IS IMPORTANT AND THE DEBATE AROUND CONSOLIDATION
- 17 I THINK HAS GOTTEN CONFLATED WITH THE DISCUSSION AROUND WHAT
- 18 WE WANT TO RESOLVE REGIONALLY RELATIVE TO THE NETWORK
- 19 MANAGEMENT. I THINK IF WE COULD BE REALLY DISCRETE ABOUT THOSE
- 20 TWO ISSUES ARE THAT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL. AND THEN THE LAST
- 21 THING THAT I DO JUST WANT TO SAY TO MY COLLEAGUES THAT -- THAT
- 22 I HAVE HAD A HARD TIME RECONCILING IS THE TIMELINE OF OUR
- 23 NEEDS OF OUR PARTNER AGENCIES WHICH ARE REALLY IMPORTANT TO ME
- 24 MAKING SURE OF THEIR NEEDS AND OBLIGATIONS TO EACH OF OUR
- 25 REGIONS HAVE IN TERMS OF UPPING TAXES LOCALLY. AND I HAVEN'T



- 1 SEEN A TIMELINE THAT HELPS ME UNDERSTAND, OH, LIKE, THIS IS
- 2 THIS, HOW WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO HANDLE ALL THE DIFFERENT
- 3 NEEDS. AND THE REASON I -- I'M JUST RAISING THAT, BECAUSE AS A
- 4 REGION, WE'RE RELATIVELY A SELF-HELP REGION COMPARED TO OTHER
- 5 PARTS OF THE COUNTRY, AND I DON'T WANT US TO WEAKEN THE
- 6 PARTNERSHIPS WE HAVE WITH THE VOTERS IN OUR OWN REGION WHILE
- 7 WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS THESE BIGGER NEEDS AND AGAIN THAT'S
- 8 WHY I WANT TO UNDERSTAND THIS AND, AT THE RISK OF RAISING AN
- 9 ISSUE THAT MAKES EVERYONE FREAK OUT WHENEVER I TALK ABOUT THE
- 10 HOUSING BOND -- I'LL JUST SAY IT, WHICH IS LINING YOU UP THE
- 11 HOUSING BONDS ABILITY TO GO TO THE VOTERS AND THE
- 12 TRANSPORTATION BOND FROM MTC, AND THEN HOW THAT IMPACT WHAT IS
- 13 WE'RE DOING AT A LOCAL LEVEL, I HAVE AN EVEN MORE DIFFICULT
- 14 TIME UNDERSTANDING. I MEAN, MORE PLANNING. IT'S NOT AN
- 15 UNDERSTANDING QUESTION. IT'S WHAT THEN DO WE DO AT A REGIONAL
- 16 LEVEL TO ALLOW FOR PLANNING. I RECOGNIZE THERE ARE TWO
- 17 DIFFERENT TOPICS BUT BECAUSE THEY PLAY A SIGNIFICANT ROLE IN
- 18 TERMS OF WHEN THOSE GO ON THE BALLOT THEY ALL HAVE
- 19 IMPLICATIONS FOR WHAT WE DO AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. SO APPROXIMATE
- 20 THOSE ARE ISSUES WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO DISCUSS THIS
- 21 AFTERNOON, I THINK THAT'S FINE. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DON'T
- 22 MISS AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE HONEST AS WE CAN BE AND WHERE THERE
- 23 IS A DIFFERENCE WHERE WE'RE ALL GOING TO BE TAKING A RISK I
- 24 WANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT TOO. THAT'S HELPFUL



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I HOPE WE ARE AS CANDID AND HONEST AS
2	WE ARE THIS AFTERNOON. WE NEED TO BE CANDID ON WHAT IS IT
3	GOING TO TAKE IF WE CAN GET THERE.
4	
5	CINDY CHAVEZ: ALFREDO, THANK YOU FOR SAYING THAT. I'LL TELL
6	YOU ONE THING THAT'S CONCERNED ME CULTURALLY ABOUT THIS BOARD
7	VERSUS OTHER BOARDS I SIT ON. I HAVE BEEN STRUCK BY HOW HOW
8	ASKING QUESTIONS IS SEEN AS SOMEHOW AN ACT OF AGGRESSION OR
9	BEING OFFENSIVE. I DON'T SIT ON ANOTHER BOARD THAT THAT
10	HAPPENS. AND WE NEED TO ASK QUESTIONS SO PEOPLE TRUST
11	GOVERNMENT AGAIN IT'S NOT MY INTENT TO DERAIL IT'S REALLY TO
12	UNDERSTAND AND I'M NOT ENTIRELY I SAY THIS MORE FOR THE
13	FUTURE LEADER WHO IS ARE GOING BE ON THIS BOARD HOW WE CREATE
14	AN ENVIRONMENT THAT CONVERSATION AND QUESTIONS ARE REGARDED AS
15	THE JOB AND THAT WE DO IT IN A WAY THAT SUPPORTS THE ENTITIES
16	AND TRUTHFULLY YOU HAVE A GREAT STAFF THIS ISN'T INTENDED TO
17	BE DISRESPECTFUL IT'S INTENDED TO RECOGNIZE RELATIONSHIPS WE
18	HAVE BETWEEN REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE COMP COMPLEX
19	AND THE MORE THAN WE CAN BE AROUND IT.
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: PAPAN.
22	
23	GINA PAPAN: TO THE DISCUSSION HERE CAN WE INCLUDE THE LETTERS
24	FROM LABOR WHICH BASICALLY OPPOSES THIS REASONS WHY. VTA,

CALTRAIN SAMTRANS OPPOSE UNLESS AMENDED. I THINK WE NEED TO



- 1 SHOW EVERYONE HERE WHAT THE PROCESS HAS BEEN WE ALL WANT TO
- 2 WORK WITH THE AUTHOR HERE AND WE NEED TO BE CLEAR BECAUSE IT
- 3 WAS MENTIONED SEVERAL TIMES AT THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE WE
- 4 ARE CURRENTLY SPONSORS BUT IF THIS TURNS INTO SOMETHING THAT
- 5 DOES NOT ADVANCE THE COMMISSION OR COMMISSIONERS, WE CAN PULL
- 6 THE SPONSORSHIP. SO WE NEED TO BE VERY CLEAR ON THAT. THIS IS
- 7 A WORK IN PROGRESS AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM
- 8 EVERYONE. BUT THAT IS A REALITY THAT HAS NOT BEEN DISCUSSED
- 9 BEFORE BUT IS ON THE TABLE. THANK YOU.

10

- 11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
- 12 COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

- 14 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK YOU,
- 15 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ FOR REALLY, SORT OF, CREATING A FRAMEWORK
- 16 OF HOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE INTO THIS WORKSHOP. THERE ARE A LOT
- 17 OF QUESTIONS THAT NEED TO BE ANSWERED. YOU KNOW, I DO WANT TO
- 18 TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY TO THANK OUR STAFF. YOU HAVE DONE A
- 19 TREMENDOUS, TREMENDOUS JOB. I KNOW WE HAVE BEEN COMMUNICATING,
- 20 AS LEG CHAIR, IT SEEMS LIKE IT CHANGES EVERY FIVE MINUTES. I
- 21 KNOW LAST NIGHT, YOU KNOW, I GOT A CALL FROM REBECCA AT ABOUT
- 22 10:30 IN REGARD TO SENATE TRANSPORTATION. SO, JUST REALLY WANT
- 23 TO RECOGNIZE THE WORK AND THEN I THINK, KIMBERLY, YOU DESERVE
- 24 A SHOUT OUT, AS WELL, SENDING E-MAILS OUT AT 11:00 P.M. WE'RE
- 25 VERY LUCKY TO HAVE THE STAFF THAT WE HAVE, AND I JUST WANT TO



- 1 THANK ALL OF YOU. YOU GUYS ARE VERY, VERY DILIGENT. I DO WANT
- 2 TO SAY THIS, I DO THINK IT'S NECESSARY TO DEFER THIS, THIS
- 3 ITEM TODAY. IN LIGHT OF WHAT HAPPENED IN SENATE TRANS
- 4 YESTERDAY, AND SPECIFICALLY SENATOR CORTESE HAD SOME CONCERNS.
- 5 I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO BE THOUGHTFUL. MY UNDERSTANDING IS
- 6 IT GOT OUT OF COMMITTEE 10 TO 3, BUT THERE ARE REALLY SOME
- 7 ISSUES THAT NEED TO BE ADDRESSED. I KNOW STAFF IS -- IS
- 8 WORKING ON THAT. ESPECIALLY AROUND THE AMENDS. I THINK WHAT'S
- 9 REALLY IMPORTANT AS WE MOVE FORWARD IS TO COMMUNICATE. AND I
- 10 WANT TO EXPRESS OUR GRATITUDE TO SENATOR WIENER. I THINK
- 11 SENATOR WIENER IS WORKING COLLABORATIVELY WITH SENATE LEADER
- 12 MIKE MCGUIRE, WORKING WITH CORTESE E WORKING WITH GLASER. THIS
- 13 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS, AS MANY OF YOU KNOW, IT'S A VERY FLEXIBLE
- 14 AND FUNGIBLE PROCESS, AND WE HAVE TO REALLY KEEP THAT IN MIND.
- 15 YOU KNOW, WHEN I ALWAYS THINK ABOUT WHAT ARE WE TRYING TO
- 16 ACCOMPLISH, I THINK WHAT WE'RE ALWAYS TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH,
- 17 AND I TRY TO BRING MYSELF BACK TO THIS, TRY TO BRING MYSELF
- 18 BACK TO THIS, AND THERE IS A LOT OF NOISE OUT THERE, AND WE
- 19 HAVE TO TAKE THAT NOISE INTO CONSIDERATION. IT'S NOT ONLY
- 20 NOISE BUT ACTUALLY NOISE THAT MAKES US BETTER. BUT I THINK
- 21 ABOUT THE END USER, AT THE END OF THE DAY WITH RESPECT TO ALL
- 22 THE 27 OPERATORS -- IT IS 27, CORRECT?

24 REBECCA LONG: THAT'S CORRECT.

25



- 1 DAVID CANEPA: I SAID -- I DON'T KNOW WHO SAID 37. [LAUGHTER] I
- 2 CAN'T SAY IT. BUT, THE BOTTOM LINE IS, WE NEED A SYSTEM THAT
- 3 WORKS FOR PEOPLE. SO, WHETHER YOU LIVE IN PALO ALTO, YOU'RE
- 4 TAKING CALTRAIN TO GET TO SONOMA COUNTY, THROUGH SMART, WE GOT
- 5 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE DOING IT. AND WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE
- 6 THAT WE HAVE -- AND THIS MAY BE OFFENSIVE, BUT THIS IS MY
- 7 OPINION, IF WE DO NOT HAVE THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PIECE, TO
- 8 ME, THIS LEGISLATION IS JUST HOLLOW. AND TO COMMISSIONER
- 9 PAPAN, YOU HAD SAID VERY, YOU KNOW, ELOOUENTLY, PERHAPS MAYBE
- 10 WE DON'T LOOK AT -- LOOK AT SPONSORING THIS, WE PUT IN A LOT
- 11 OF WORK IN TERMS OF THE WORK WE HAVE DONE. SO, I THINK WE ALL
- 12 HAVE DIFFERENT -- DIFFERENT ISSUES, CONSOLIDATION,
- 13 COORDINATION. I WISH THERE WAS ANOTHER -- ANOTHER C WORD WE
- 14 CAN USE. BUT THE BOTTOM LINE IS, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
- 15 KEEP FOCUS ON THE END USER. AND I KNOW WE ALL AS COMMISSIONERS
- 16 ARE GOING TO DO THAT H SO, I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THIS
- 17 ENTERTAINING ROBUST CONVERSATION, AS YOU MOVE FORWARD. BUT I
- 18 LOOK AT US AS A TEAM SEEING WHAT WE CAN DO TO SOLVE PROBLEMS
- 19 WITH SOLUTIONS. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.
- 21 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. I DON'T
- 22 SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, AT THIS POINT.
- 23 DO WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

24



- 1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF
- 2 CORRESPONDENCE FROM SAN JOSE MAYOR MATT MAHAN, AND I SEE ONE
- 3 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, HOWARD WONG. HOW
- 4 MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

5

6 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: TWO MINUTES.

7

- 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MR. WONG PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
- 9 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 11 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED, WE SHOULD TAKE A STEP BACK
- 12 AND REMIND OURSELVES OF ALL THE INCREDIBLE PROGRESS AND EFFORT
- 13 THAT THIS COMMISSION, LEGISLATORS, AND MANY ACTIVISTS HAVE
- 14 ACHIEVED, THAT WHAT HAS BEEN DONE HAS BEEN PRETTY REMARKABLE,
- 15 AND I THINK EVERYBODY INVOLVED SHOULD BE CONGRATULATING
- 16 THEMSELVES. RETURNING FUNDING TO SOURCES IS JUST ONE OF THE
- 17 COLLABORATIVE ELEMENTS OF THIS POTENTIAL LEGISLATION. BUT I
- 18 THINK THERE IS, ALSO, THE UNDERLYING RETURN SENSE OF SELF-
- 19 DETERMINATION TO EVERY PART OF THE BAY AREA. THAT'S -- I THINK
- 20 THAT'S ACHIEVABLE. WHEN ONE LOOKS AT A LOT OF THE MANY
- 21 REGIONAL COORDINATION, OR INTEGRATION, OR COLLABORATIVE
- 22 TRANSIT AGENCIES AROUND THE COUNTRY AND THE WORLD, THEY, TOO,
- 23 HAD A LOT OF, YOU KNOW, I GUESS YOU COULD CALL THEM CONFLICTS.
- 24 SO, YOU MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT THE HISTORY OF TORONTO'S
- 25 REGIONAL TRANSIT, NEW YORK CITY, WASHINGTON DC'S. THEY HAD



- 1 SIMILAR CONCERNS ABOUT THEIR LOSS OF SELF-DETERMINATION,
- 2 PERHAPS, CONTRACTS, POSITION MANAGEMENT POSITIONS. BUT IN THE
- 3 END, I THINK ONE HAS TO CONCENTRATE ON THE BENEFITS THAT WERE
- 4 ACHIEVED. SO, I THINK WE SHOULD ALL CONGRATULATE OURSELVES FOR
- 5 WHAT HAS BEEN ACHIEVED THUS FAR. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

- 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
- 8 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

9

- 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. I DON'T SEE ANY
- 11 FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT. BACK TO COMMISSIONERS. MY REQUESTED
- 12 ACTION WAS GOING TO BE THAT WE DEFER ACTION. DOES THAT GET
- 13 CODIFIED INTO MOTION, COUNSEL?

14

- 15 KATHLEEN KANE: NO. UNLESS WE WERE POSTPONING TO A PARTICULAR
- 16 TIME WE WOULD NEED A MOTION FOR THAT. BUT MY UNDERSTANDING
- 17 THIS WILL JUST BE A REAGENDAIZED AS AVAILABLE.

18

- 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: PERFECT. ALL RIGHT. I'LL LOOK AROUND
- 20 TO MAKE SURE THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH THE INTENT OF THE
- 21 COMMISSIONERS. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. WE'RE
- 22 GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 12, PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK AT THIS
- 23 TIME IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISHES TO
- 24 PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT?



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE *RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I SEE
2	NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. BEFORE WE ADJOURN, VICE
5	CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ HAS A COMMENT.
6	
7	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I WANTED TO SHARE WITH EVERYBODY
8	THAT ONE OF OUR HERE EVERYBODY HERE IS IMPRESSED OBVIOUSLY
9	BUT THERE IS ONE PERSON ON THE COMMISSION WHO ACTUALLY
10	ISN'T HERE. BECAUSE HE'S ON HIS NATIONAL BOOK TOUR,
11	COMMISSIONER AHN, JUST PUBLISHED A BOOK GRAPHIC NOVEL ABOUT
12	HIS FAMILY AND COMMUNITY AND HIS FIGHT FOR ENVIRONMENTAL
13	JUSTICE JUST CAME OUT AND IS AVAILABLE AT YOUR LOCAL
14	BOOKSTORE.
15	
16	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: NICE.
17	
18	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HE'S GOT TALENTS.
19	
20	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ABSOLUTELY, VICE CHAIR. WE ADJOURN TO
21	THE NEXT MEETING, NEXT MEETING WILL BE WEDNESDAY MAY 22ND SAME

PLACE SAME TIME. THANK YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]

22





Broadcasting Government